

# UNIVERSITY OF CINCINNATI

**Date:** 5/16/2004

**I, Anthony T. Bonanno,**

**hereby submit this work as part of the requirements for the degree of:**

Masters of Community Planning (MCP)

---

**in:**

---

**It is entitled:**

Combating the Negative Image of the City

---

Using Marketing: The Case for Gary, Indiana

---

**This work and its defense approved by:**

**Chair:** David Varady  
Menelaos Triantafillou  
Kathy Schwab

**Combating the Negative Image of the City Using Marketing:  
The Case for Gary, Indiana**

A thesis proposal submitted to

David Varady, Ph.D  
at the University of Cincinnati

in fulfillment of the  
requirements for the degree of

MASTER OF COMMUNITY PLANNING

School of Planning  
College of Design, Architecture, Art, and Planning

5/16/2005

By

Anthony T. Bonanno  
B.S. Business Administration, Miami University, 1995

Thesis Committee

Chair: Dr. David Varady, Ph.D.

Member: Menelaos Triantafillou, M.L.A.

Reader: Kathy Schwab, Residential Development Advisor, DCI

## **ABSTRACT**

Cities, like brands, have images associated with them. Many cities suffer from negative images, and a myriad of issues can contribute to their poor image. These distressed cities often exhibit the attributes of economic disinvestment, high crime rates, population loss, and crumbling infrastructure. Gary, Indiana, has become one of these cities, as it suffers one of the worst images for cities in the United States. This study attempts to determine the importance of marketing in helping to shape a city's image. Is it possible for distressed cities like Gary to use marketing to help improve their image? A comparative city analysis of four cities (Camden, New Jersey, Chester, Pennsylvania, East Saint Louis, Illinois, and Compton, California) examines what these similarly distressed are doing to market themselves. The thesis reviews marketing materials used by public, private and non-profit organizations including websites, brochures or pamphlets, and comprehensive or strategic plans. Newspaper coverage is also analyzed using a simplified content analysis to determine how these cities are portrayed in their local media. Although the quality of marketing materials varies between the cities, there is little evidence that for this type of city, marketing makes a great difference. Small steps toward improvement may be all that can be reasonably expected.



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>I. INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>1</b>
A. Purpose of Study.....	3
B. History of Gary.....	4
C. Current State of Gary .....	7
D. Current Gary Marketing Efforts.....	8
E. Study Overview .....	11
<b>II. METHODOLOGY .....</b>	<b>13</b>
A. Determining Comparative Cities .....	13
B. Case Study and Content Analysis Methodologies .....	16
C. Analysis of Communicative Discourse .....	22
<b>III. LITERATURE REVIEW .....</b>	<b>24</b>
A. Marketing Cities as Brands .....	24
B. Problems of Marketing Cities .....	27
C. Dynamics of Marketing Post-Industrial Cities.....	28
D. Target Markets for Cities .....	31
E. Strategic Plans and Comprehensive Plans.....	41
F. Literature Summary .....	46
<b>IV. COMPARATIVE CITY MARKETING ANALYSIS.....</b>	<b>48</b>
A. Camden, New Jersey.....	48
B. Chester, Pennsylvania .....	57
C. East Saint Louis, Illinois .....	62
D. Compton, California.....	70
<b>V. CONCLUSIONS .....</b>	<b>78</b>
A. Assessment of Comparative City Marketing Efforts .....	78
B. Recommended Marketing Strategies for Gary.....	81
C. Future Considerations and Recommendations.....	92
<b>REFERENCES.....</b>	<b>94</b>

## **LIST OF FIGURES**

FIGURE 1.1 Gary Steel Mill.....	5
---------------------------------	---

## **LIST OF TABLES**

TABLE 2.1 Comparative City Demographic Data.....	15
TABLE 2.2 Comparative City Data Sources.....	21
TABLE 5.1 Summary of Comparative City Marketing Efforts.....	78

## **I. INTRODUCTION**

Cities, like products, tend to develop reputations over time. Unfortunately, not all cities can have a positive image associated with them. Many cities develop a host of problems and consequently become “branded” as places where no one wants to live or where no business wants to locate. They become trapped in a downward spiral that is extremely difficult to avoid. People often have associated negative images of these cities through bad press and word of mouth, and even though they may have never visited these cities, they have developed preconceived notions of what horrible places they must be.

So, just like consumer products, cities develop reputations that may help or hurt their image. Like products, cities use marketing to sell themselves to potential businesses, investors, and residents. But how does a city saddled with a poor reputation market itself, or is it an impossible endeavor? Many brands that have been in the doldrums have been revived by transforming the product itself. Or sometimes the product itself was fine and all that was needed was a marketing campaign that helped consumers understand the positive attributes of the product that were possibly not understood before. It seems as though cities can utilize these same strategies to revive themselves.

Cities that have developed poor personas have tremendous troubles reversing that trend to (re)attract people and jobs. Those people who have the financial means to leave the city will likely do so. Business investment migrates to areas that are growing and that offer a better labor force. These cities consequently have diminished tax bases, and providing essential public services is quite difficult when the budget is shrinking and

costs are not. Debt is often inevitable, and in the worst cases, bankruptcy is a strong possibility.

Cities may attempt to improve themselves physically—infrastructure may be improved and dilapidated buildings torn down. Planning projects and programs may be established to remedy various issues within the city. But these are not significant enough efforts for cities that have developed extremely negative images. Marketing cities in conjunction with these other efforts can help connect people with the positive information the city wants to convey about itself. Positive strides made by a city are not helpful if no one is aware of them. A better marketing message can convey these positive aspects of the city. This is an important point—there has to be something to market. Misleading marketing campaigns that do not accurately portray the city will likely lead to people to have an even worse opinion of the city.

Various organizations may be charged with promoting their city. And these organizations may have different roles varying by city. Most cities have a chamber of commerce that works directly with businesses and their issues. The chamber of commerce helps to safeguard business interests in their city, and in some cases, it may help to market the city to potential firms and businesses. Cities will often use a convention and visitor's bureau to promote tourism and also have an economic development office to promote business investment. In some cases, cities may have NGO's (Non-Governmental Organizations) in place to coordinate marketing efforts. These are sometimes consortiums of various organizations that have business interests in the city. There is also an increasing trend in cities to actually hire a marketing director with the primary responsibility of producing a positive image for the city. Denver is one



city that has recently hired a marketing director. Obviously, this is a more feasible option for larger cities with an ample budget.

Clearly, there is a vast array of ways a city can use to promote itself. But cities have many differences: in political dynamics, in the amount of their budgets that can be allocated toward marketing, and in their organizational structure and power. Therefore, the methods and organizations used to market cities will vary, sometimes dramatically, from city to city.

### **A. Purpose of Study**

This study will analyze and synthesize the various thoughts on strategic marketing initiatives and frameworks endorsed by academic and professional experts. This study will also review recent marketing efforts of American and some European cities, noting any trends that may be occurring in how cities market themselves. The final result will be a set of recommendations on how the City of Gary, Indiana, can market itself to combat one of the worst reputations of all American cities. Information will be collected and analyzed on cities similar to Gary as to their marketing strategies and results. All of this information will be synthesized to produce a usable marketing framework for the City of Gary.

Gary epitomizes the city that automatically conjures negative imagery, but it unfortunately has earned that reputation. It is irrefutably known as a dying steel town, a place that constantly smells awful, a place that is dirty, a place that is dangerous, and a place that is poor. It is connected to the Southeast side of Chicago, an area also notoriously defined by these attributes. Gary is only 25 minutes from the heart of

Chicago, an international hub of commerce, yet it is worlds away from sharing in the prosperity that Chicago could potentially provide. The following section provides a brief history of the City of Gary, indicating how it began as a steel company town to its current state.

## **B. History of Gary**

It is impossible to separate Gary from its roots in the steel industry. The city itself came into existence as a result of steel plants, specifically the U.S Steel Corporation, the first billion dollar American company. Even today, as U.S. steel manufacturing has taken a backseat to other nations, steel defines the skyline and images associated with the city.

As America expanded westward towards the end of the 19<sup>th</sup> century, the U.S. Steel Corporation decided to place a factory closer to customers in the west. The ideal location happened to be in Northwest Indiana just south of Chicago. Lake Michigan provided access by boat, nearby Chicago had become a major rail hub, there was plenty of available land, and the natural resources necessary to create steel were in nearby Minnesota. The state-of-the-art steel facility drew workers from all over the world, and in 1906 the City of Gary was born, named after Judge Elbert H. Gary, then Chairman of U.S. Steel (Teledynamics Inc.1999).

**Figure 1.1 Gary Steel Mill**



Source: Indiana Digital Library 2004

The U.S. Steel mill required approximately 10,000 workers, so a large amount of housing was needed quickly. Just south of the mill, Gary took shape in a gridiron pattern and housing sprouted up for the mill workers. The executive housing areas were a stark contrast from the unskilled labor housing areas, which were poorly planned, overcrowded, and without adequate utilities, resulting in slums nearly from the time of their creation.

A major issue for Gary during its development (and even still today) was the lack of a connection between the city's central business district and residential areas to the lakefront. The steel mills dominated the lakefront, cutting the city off from taking advantage of its best natural feature. U.S. Steel was adamantly opposed to any lakefront development in the city as it could thwart future possible expansion (Teledynamics Inc.1999).

African-Americans only made up a small percentage of the Gary population in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century but by 1950, 30% of the population was African-American. As would be expected from the times, they endured segregation and discrimination. But they had increased political influence and helped elect Gary's first Democratic mayor in 1951. Steel production was booming, as post World War II demand was high. But business interest and the new government did not get along well, and there was a massive "White flight" from the Gary as White-owned businesses flocked to suburban areas such as Merrillville. New housing construction practically came to standstill. Between the years of 1950 and 1960, Gary had a rate of new housing construction of less than 0.5%, and approximately 50,000 Whites evacuated the city in favor of the suburbs. While the city's population peaked in 1960 at 178,320 people, the majority of the population increase was Southern African-Americans who had moved to Gary for possible employment. Lack of investment and the outflow of Whites led to "problems of poverty, substandard housing, crime, and racial polarization" (Teledynamics Inc.1999, 8).

A comprehensive plan drawn up in 1964 went to waste as political leaders saw little use in planning efforts. The summary of efforts to revitalize the city from the late 1960's to the 1980's was the procurement of millions of dollars in federal aid through programs such as urban renewal, leading to some new public housing. Sadly, by around 1978, almost all retail and commercial business had moved out to the suburbs. And by the mid 1980's, the steel mills were producing the same amount of steel with considerably fewer employees. After that, the city's population began to move not only out to the suburbs, but increasingly to other cities and parts of the country (Teledynamics Inc.1999).

### **C. Current State of Gary**

As of 2000, Gary only had a population of 102,746, 42% lower than its peak in 1960. The vast majority of the population (86%) was African-American. Vacancy rates were extremely high—12.3% of the housing units were not occupied and rental vacancy rates stood at 8.3%. Unemployment existed at a high rate of 8.3%. The median household income was \$27,195, and over one-quarter of the population lived below the poverty level (U.S. Census Bureau 2000).

As indicated, the main industry of the economy in Gary is the steel industry. As was the case when the city began, it is still basically an undiversified, one-industry economy. There are a few other industries that do well in Gary. The State of Indiana allows riverboat gambling, so two casino riverboats are located in Gary to serve the greater Chicago region—The Majestic Star and the Trump Casino. These have been vital to improving the tax base of the City of Gary in recent years. Gary's location still makes it a transportation hub. It is at the crossroads of many highways, including several that go directly to Chicago, and has major rail lines that run through it. Also, the Chicago region was looking for a third airport after O'Hare and Midway; Gary has been chosen, at least for the time being, for this third airport – the Gary-Chicago International Airport – but there is still talk of a possible third airport in the Southern portion of the Chicago area in rural Counties (Gruszecki 2004). The multi-modal transportation network present in Gary allows for relatively strong trucking and warehousing industries (Bureau of Labor Statistics 2004).

The housing stock downtown is severely dilapidated. Practically no new buildings have been built downtown in the last decade, and the rampant disinvestment

from the city is obvious when driving through the downtown area. One major attraction that has recently been added to the city is a new baseball stadium for a minor league baseball team, the Gary Railcats. It has done little to spawn any economic redevelopment around it—the only new business to serve the district is a Bennigan’s restaurant (Author 2005). Crime remains a major problem; Gary has made myriad lists of the one of America’s most dangerous cities, recently being named the fifth most dangerous city in America (Morgan Quitno website 2005). The downtown lakefront, which could be a tremendous asset for the citizens of Gary, is still blocked by the steel mills. There is now a nice park to the east of the U.S. Steel Plant downtown that offers a view of the lakefront that stretches to Chicago in the west and Michigan to the east. But Gary’s image and reputation remains quite awful; the negative national press, such as landing perennially on the most dangerous city lists, and the famous smell that is associated with the city thanks to the sulphur emanating from the steel mills, help to maintain this national image of Gary.

#### **D. Current Gary Marketing Efforts**

As previously mentioned, it will not be possible to make proper marketing recommendations for Gary without knowing what efforts Gary is taking to market itself. The recommendations can be made in the context of the current marketing efforts so that there are no recommendations that repeat what the city is already doing. Also, the recommendations can modify the current marketing efforts, that is, to possibly propose expanding some efforts or scaling back others that are not working.

There are several agencies that are attempting to market Gary from various perspectives. Gary has its own Chamber of Commerce that works to retain businesses as well as help to attract new businesses; the Chamber also helps in various initiatives to train the workforce and connect employers to employees. The Gary Chamber of Commerce is well organized and has a wealth of information to promote to businesses. The primary marketing section on the website features information for a business (or a person) interested in relocating to Gary, including costs-of-living, public facilities (schools/education, health care, transportation), arts and museums, and economic data. The website even lists available properties (generally industrial) for a business looking for specific site requirements (Gary Chamber of Commerce website 2005).

The City of Gary has several departments interested in promoting to economic and business development. The Economic Development Department of the city coordinates the empowerment/enterprise zones in the city and helps attract businesses to these areas with the available tax breaks available through the federal funding of these programs. They also offer better low-interest loans and financing options that are available only within these zones. The Economic Development Department also works with several local organizations to run some workforce development programs and helps with business retention, expansion, and attraction. (City of Gary website 2005). It also works with various groups to make certain sites are available immediately to businesses. Some of these properties are listed on the City website. The director also runs a local television show called 'Panacea' that promotes positive happenings in Gary to not only the locals, but to the Chicago area as well (City of Gary website 2005).

The planning department, though very small, is also an integral part of marketing Gary. The planning department is spearheading Gary's new Master Plan; it is currently being written and has not yet been released to the public. When it is done, it will be the primary document to guide the future vision Gary, as well as the strategies necessary to achieve that vision. This is vital because the last comprehensive plan was created in 1985 and is not even being used anymore to help guide city development and strategy. So no plan is currently in place to provide a decision-making framework or to be used to those interested in developing in the City of Gary. The planning department is also focused on several plans to make Gary more a more attractive place to live. One of the most important initiatives is aimed at redeveloping various parts of the lakefront. The planning department is working with various other groups to try and revitalize the lakefront from its industrial past to vibrant neighborhoods (City of Gary website 2005).

Other than the lakefront and downtown core, there is one other City area that the is being heavily marketed: the Gary-Chicago International Airport. The Gary-Chicago Airport Authority is the primary organization promoting the airport, and it is touted as being "Chicago's Third Airport." The airport's website touts its prime proximity to various transportation options (highways, the railroad) and the Chicago metropolitan area. (Gary-Chicago Regional Airport website 2005). There are many properties that can used for industrial or warehousing use near the airport, and this a major economic opportunity touted by almost all of the aforementioned organizations.

Gary is not large enough or does not attract enough visitors to merit having its own City organization to promote tourism and visitors. Because Gary is located in Lake County, the Lake County Convention and Visitor's Bureau (LCCVB) helps to promote



tourism and visitors to Gary. Of course, since this is a County organization, it promotes many other areas other than Gary. But it is the best place to get any information on traveling to Gary and seeing the sights, including the casinos, the minor-league baseball park, or the other nightlife and attractions that are in the City (Lake County Convention and Visitor's Bureau website 2005).

There are no specific marketing campaigns currently in motion to help position or promote the city. Gary is still searching for various strategies and marketing possibilities to help sell the city to outside investment and reverse its negative image it has held for decades now.

## **E. Study Overview**

This thesis study attempts to identify marketing strategies that the City of Gary can utilize. The next chapter summarizes the relevant literature on marketing, both generally and as it particularly pertains to cities. Chapter Three, the methodology section, then describes how this study plans to collect data: from what sources, why certain data is selected, and the various techniques used to analyze the data. This study primarily uses a comparative case analysis to evaluate what other similar cities to Gary are doing to market themselves. Chapter Four analyses the data from these comparative cities, which include Camden, New Jersey, Chester, Pennsylvania, East St. Louis, Missouri, and Compton, California. The data analyzed mostly includes marketing materials, such as websites, brochures, and city plans. Chapter Five, the final chapter, begins with a summary of the data analysis. Then these results are combined with the current state of Gary's marketing efforts to offer some marketing recommendations that

are applicable to the case of Gary. The recommendations do not all specifically how to market Gary, but they suggest how Gary can continue to improve its image, which includes such things as economic development and planning efforts.

## **II. METHODOLOGY**

As described in the previous section, the purpose of this study is to determine how the City of Gary can possibly reverse, or at least diminish, its poor image and best market itself to potential economic interests. There is no easy answer to the question of how to fix distressed cities; this is a conundrum that a myriad of post-industrial cities are facing with no certain path existing that would return them back to prosperity. This study reviews what other cities, which are in similar situations, are doing to improve their image and to market themselves economically.

### **A. Determining Comparative Cities**

The first step in my methodology was to determine some comparative cities to evaluate Gary against. Various criteria were used to establish if which case study cities are analogous to Gary. Firstly, they should be a “secondary” city – Gary is dependant on the larger Chicago metropolitan area, so the case study cities selected should have been historically formed, at least partially, as a result of their relationship to a primary city. The notion of a “secondary city” necessitates strong economic linkages to the primary city. Secondly, the case study cities selected should also be of similar size in terms of population; ideally, at least one should be situated in the Midwest to have an example of another city within the same geographic region as Gary. Thirdly, the case study cities selected should have a similar historical arc as Gary – in other words, a city that grew from a strong manufacturing and industrial base, only to be left deteriorating when the economy shifted towards more service-oriented industries. Thus, these case study cities

would be suffering from the effects of post-industrialization: major economic disinvestment, abandoned and vacant real estate (including brownfields), a lack of economic diversification, and relatively high unemployment rates. Lastly, the case study cities selected should have a predominately African-American racial makeup, similar to Gary.

An initial list of potential comparative cities was created based on these general criteria:

- Newark, NJ
- Camden, NJ
- Jersey City, NJ
- East St. Louis, MO
- Canton, OH
- Scranton, PA
- Chester, PA
- Schenectady, NY
- Utica, NY
- Flint, MI
- Compton, CA

Four cities most closely matched the previously described criteria. The list of four, and the reasons each were chosen, are:

- **Camden, NJ:** high crime, similar economic issues with significant disinvestment, similar size, 2<sup>nd</sup> city to primary Philadelphia

- **Chester, PA:** smaller population but similar racial mix, past industrial economy now faced with lack of diversity, 2<sup>nd</sup> city to primary Philadelphia
- **East St. Louis, MO:** smaller population but similar racial mix, main economic industry is casinos which is one of the industries Gary is using to help fuel its economy, industrial past, high crime, 2<sup>nd</sup> city to St. Louis
- **Compton, CA:** lacks scale of past industrial economy but similar population size, high crime, had bad image and is undergoing a respectable revival, 2<sup>nd</sup> city to Los Angeles (close to suburb)

The table below summarizes Gary and the four comparative cities for various key statistics for population, economic and household characteristics:

**Table 2.1 Comparative City Demographic Data**

	<b>Gary</b>	<b>Camden</b>	<b>Chester</b>	<b>Compton</b>	<b>East St. Louis</b>
<b>Population Data</b>					
Population	102,746	79,904	36,854	93,493	31,542
% Population African-American	84.0	53.3	75.7	40.3	97.7
% Population Hispanic	4.9	5.4	75.7	56.8	0.7
<b>Employment/Income Data</b>					
Unemployment Rate	8.3	7.8	9.9	7.1	8.6
Median Household Income	27,195	23,421	25,703	31,819	21,324
Per Capita Income	14,383	9,815	13,052	10,389	11,169
% Below Poverty Rate	25.8	35.5	27.2	28.0	35.1
<b>Household/Housing Data</b>					
Average Household Size	2.7	3.1	2.6	4.1	2.8
% Vacant - Dwelling Units	12.3	18.8	14.4	6.2	13.3
Median Value - Specified Owner-Occupied Units	53,400	40,700	43,100	136,200*	41,800

Source: U.S. Census Bureau 2000

\* Higher median home value due to strength of L.A. real estate market

For readers not familiar with the locations of these cities, Camden is just across the Delaware River (in New Jersey) from Philadelphia, Chester is about fifteen (15) miles southwest of Philadelphia near the Delaware River, East Saint Louis is just across the Mississippi River (in Illinois) from Saint Louis, and Compton is just south of Los Angeles (Mapquest website 2005).

## **B. Case Study and Content Analysis Methodologies**

The process for gathering and analyzing the data from these comparative cities utilized two methods: case study research for the marketing efforts of the comparative cities, and content analysis of newspaper coverage for these cities.

### ***Case Study Analysis Methodology***

As previously mentioned, there are a varying number of organizations involved in marketing a city: some are associated with the city and have a formal responsibility to help market the city, such as a Convention and Tourist Bureau, and some are not associated with the city, but may still have vested interests in the city and are helping to market it. Examples include an economic development corporation or a consortium of local business interests. The groups that are marketing each of the comparative cities were identified, and a comparative analysis examines the content of their marketing messages. There are various mediums these organizations use to market their cities, and this study looks at several of these mediums. Any publications or marketing literature that was available from these organizations – generally literature that is given to prospective businesses that are considering relocations – was requested and reviewed.

Each of the organizations' websites was reviewed to determine their marketing messages. The city's website (if applicable) was also reviewed as it is certainly a form of marketing communication used by the city.

Also, any comprehensive plans that are in use by these cities were evaluated in the content analysis. Many cities may have other strategic plans in place, and these include any overarching plans that the cities have developed to guide decision-making and to provide a framework for the city's future. None of the comparative cities had a strategic plan in place, but three of the four cities did have a comprehensive plan for evaluation. The comprehensive plans should be viewed as marketing documents because they are used as a guide of how to promote and improve the city to residents, developers, and businesses. The word "marketing" doesn't need to be in a document to have marketing elements.

For each comparative city, the different categories were reviewed as to how the marketing message was shaped for that city. The following is a selected list of some of the categories that will be used in the comparative city marketing analysis:

- Is tourism being used as an economic development tool?
- How are businesses being recruited?
- What types of businesses is the city trying to lure?
- What types of residents is the city trying to attract?
- What are the primary target market(s)?
- Are city projects/initiatives are being promoted?
- What are the data/statistics being touted within the marketing?

### *Content Analysis of Newspaper Coverage*

A newspaper's content that discusses the events of a particular city is extremely pertinent to this study because it is, though indirectly, a form of marketing communication. These media messages ostensibly affect the general public's attitudes and feelings towards these cities. Newspaper articles – or indirect marketing communication – can be analyzed for their content in conjunction with traditional marketing communications a city may use – or direct marketing communication. A city has complete discretion and control over its direct marketing communications, while it does not have control over the indirect communications. A newspaper chooses the content of its pages, and the stories it publishes regarding a city is beyond the control of that city, unless perhaps a city official can be quoted within an article. It is quite possible that there are many positive efforts and movements happening in the city, yet the media is focusing only on negative issues. Surely, city officials are quoted and often release press releases in the hopes of putting a positive spin on any news story.

Content analysis is a research technique that analyzes the patterns or occurrences of words or concepts within various mediums. It is used extensively to analyze the content of marketing and advertising messages. Keywords are often searched for to determine if what types of messages are being included in media coverage, including print, television, or radio (Colorado State University Writing Guide 2004).

Content analysis can be utilized different ways depending on the needs of the analysis. It can be extremely quantitative, counting the number of times certain keywords are found within certain media during a given time period. It can also be more qualitative, placing media messages into predefined "buckets" based on keywords. For



example, Downtown Cincinnati Inc. (DCI) uses content analysis to determine how often each of its key marketing messages is being disseminated in the local media. Some of these key marketing messages include: Is (Cincinnati's) downtown safe; Is downtown's future bright?; Is downtown a good place for business?; and Is downtown accessible? DCI uses a clipping service that searches for keywords in the local newspaper and in television media (e.g. newscasts). DCI then determines how well their various key marketing messages are getting out to the public by making a scorecard indicating the number of times key words were found in the media (Mileham 2005).

It is more difficult to use content analysis to determine the qualitative aspects of media messages. For example, newspaper articles can be both positive and negative at the same time. Readers may have different reactions after reading the same article (Mileham 2005).

This study will analyze the newspaper coverage of the comparative city: both from the primary city of that comparative city, as well as nation coverage. For each of the comparative cities, the predominant newspaper is the major newspaper of the primary city; for example, Camden is covered by the *Philadelphia Inquirer* and Compton is covered by the *Los Angeles Times*. While these cities may have a smaller local newspaper covering the comparative city more specifically, these newspapers are too small to have website article access. The national press coverage analysis reviews the *New York Times* for articles written about these cities that have made a national story.

Various constraints made the content analysis quite difficult, so a simple form of content analysis was used. Articles written within the last year were reviewed. This provided a good understanding of current coverage. Databases of newspapers for the

comparative cities were searched, as well as was *The New York Times*. However, articles are generally only available free for one week, and older articles need to be purchased. Due to my own limited financial resources, I decided to not actually review the articles but rather the free synopses. I went through the synopses, recorded the subject matter, and summarized the coverage of the article as best I could. Future research of this kind should employ a more sophisticated form of content analysis, but this would require more funding than was available for this project. Therefore, the content analysis used in this study gives a general indication of the article's subject matter for each of the comparative cities within the last year.

The following table (on the next page) shows, for each comparative city, what data sources were available. Most of the data sources used in this study are listed in the table. Gary is included in this table because the data analysis results from the comparative cities will be combined with marketing efforts in Gary in the 'Conclusions and Findings' section of this report.

**Table 2.2 Comparative City Data Sources**

	<b>Camden</b>	<b>Chester</b>	<b>Compton</b>	<b>E. St Louis</b>
<b>Website</b>	<a href="http://www.ci.camden.nj.us">www.ci.camden.nj.us</a>	<a href="http://www.chestercity.com">www.chestercity.com</a>	<a href="http://www.comptoncity.org">www.comptoncity.org</a>	n/a
<b>Other Website</b>	n/a	<a href="http://www.oldchesterpa.com">www.oldchesterpa.com</a>	n/a	n/a
<b>Planning Department</b>	yes	no	yes	no
<b>Comprehensive Plan</b>	yes	no	yes	no
<b>Primary Newspaper</b>	Philadelphia Inquirer	Philadelphia Inquirer	Los Angeles Times	St. Louis Dispatch
<b>Chamber of Commerce</b>	<a href="http://www.chambersnj.com">www.chambersnj.com</a>	<a href="http://delcochamber.org">delcochamber.org</a>	Compton Chamber of Commerce (no website)	yes
<b>Economic Development Agencies</b>	<a href="http://www.ci.camden.nj.us/economic/busdevcenter.html">www.ci.camden.nj.us/economic/busdevcenter.html</a>	n/a	Compton Redevelopment Agency (no website)	n/a

Source: Author Research 2005

### **C. Analysis of Communicative Discourse**

Truthfulness is another important aspect of the marketing efforts of the comparative cities that needs to be evaluated. Analyzing the communicative discourse within the marketing literature (including comprehensive plans and strategic development plans) enables a basic assessment of whether or not these documents are being truthful to the audience.

Any text document creates a communication linkage between the author(s) and the reader(s), and this communication will often become disconnected between the two. A reader would like to trust the author of the material, but the author of the material is often not really known; for instance, a planning document written by a planning commission where there is no clear author who is accountable for charges made within the document. Reading invariably requires the reader to interpret a document's text, and what the reader thinks may not be what the author intended. Possibly authors may inadvertently (or purposefully) impose their biases, or they may leave out certain pieces of information, leaving the reader with falsified or incomplete information. Planning documents will often include words that lay citizens do not understand, and they are often broken into sections that cause readers to focus on those sections that would be pertinent to their specific interests so that different readers will not come away with the same message. The incomplete descriptions and lack of upfront truthfulness can severely limit a shared message for the reading audience (Mandelbaum 1990).

Any marketing, planning, or strategic document will have various audiences that the text is intended, and therefore multiple discourses would exist within a document. According to Patsy Healy, "plans are seen to perform multiple roles, sending quite

different messages to different ‘audiences.’ The plan, in turn, may mean different things to different groups” (Healy 1996). There should be concern as well that certain groups may be left out of the plan. A plan has many varying interests that are contending for survival to go into the final document. Not all interests will likely be there in the end. But a plan will still speak to many different groups, making the chances of it having one overarching and common message very unlikely (Healy 1996).

This study will view the comparative city’s comprehensive plans, and possibly some marketing materials, using communicative discourse. Most of the marketing materials will not be evaluated for discourse analysis. Marketing materials are generally made to promote the city and would not necessarily try to be completely truthful and objective in its messages; of course, only the positives would be accentuated. But the comprehensive plans are guiding documents for the city and need to be based in reality to succeed in helping to promote the city. This study will evaluate the general truthfulness of the comprehensive plans to determine if they are based in reality or are too overreaching.

### **III. LITERATURE REVIEW**

Since this study will be evaluating possible marketing and image strategies for Gary, the subject of marketing needs to be analyzed, both at a general level, and how it has been applied to other cities in the past. The following literature reviews how city efforts to market themselves and draws lessons for declining cities such as Gary.

#### **A. Marketing Cities as Brands**

Marketing has been around for a long time, but it is a tool that has been used much more extensively for consumer products, not cities. The basic goal of marketing is to understand people's mental conceptions of products or other things and to modify their attitudes towards in the hopes of modifying their behavior. For consumer products, this desired behavior would be to buy (or continue buying) a certain company's products. For cities, this desired behavior would be having people and companies and investments flow into the city (Holcombe 2001).

Most companies have their own marketing departments to help shape the communication conveyed to consumers about their products. A pioneer in marketing is certainly the Procter & Gamble Company. P&G's director of public affairs and marketing (U.K.), Gary Cunningham, sees the usefulness of marketing cities. In fact, P&G had formed a partnership with one of the British cities that it resides in – Newcastle – to help market the city. Cunningham is an expert in marketing products, but he can see the intricate differences between marketing products and cities. Where a company may have just a few people honing a marketing strategy, a city often asks for input from its

citizens to help market itself. As with anything involving public participation, it is a difficult undertaking. A marketing strategy generally conveys the values of the product or those who would want to use the product. But how do you define the values of a city? A city is comprised of many people who will possess different ideologies and value systems. So it is much more difficult to identify the values of a product than those of a city. Finally, a product or brand tends to develop a “one-dimensional” message for its target audience. A city needs to develop a “multi-faceted message that can appeal to different audiences with a different agenda” (Armstrong 1998, 41). Of course, products may have multiple target audiences, but a city will certainly have multiple target audiences. A city is too broad to appeal to one simple group. Therefore, different messages need to be shaped to relate to different groups. Compared to products, it is remarkably more complex to create a marketing strategy for cities (Armstrong 1998).

Cities often market themselves through the use of images, very often buildings or architectural features. The most obvious example is the Eiffel Tower of Paris, one of the most known images in the world. The examples are countless: the Golden Gate Bridge of San Francisco, the Empire State Building in New York, the Space Needle in Seattle, etc. These buildings signify and help create a unique place. They become a universal image for the city and also may become a tourist attraction as well. But the images a city markets may not only be physical structures, but also cognitive associations connected with the city. Paris is marketed not only with the Eiffel Tower, but also as a city for romance and shopping. Florence is marketed not only for its architecture, but also its culture. Rio de Janeiro is quite well known and marketed for its superb beaches and nightlife. Other cities may be marketed as ideal business and convention cities.

Promotional strategies may try to reinforce marketing slogans to visit a city. The “I Love New York” campaign is well-known and increased tourism to New York dramatically (Fainstein and Judd 1999). Cities may be known and marketed for activities possible within it, such as casino gambling or other specific types of entertainment. New Orleans certainly sells itself on the hedonistic French Quarter but it also sells its fantastic music scene and unique culinary offerings. A city may even be known for a certain sports team, such as Manchester United, a soccer team that is one of the most recognized sports teams in the world (Short and Kim 1998).

According to Andrew Laurence, managing director of the public relations firm Hill and Knowton, when cities market themselves, it provides a the populace of the city with increased optimism about the future. Many old industrial cities in the U.K. have recently begun a branding onslaught to help transform the negative of the town not only for outsiders, but for those living in the city. Glasgow, Scotland has been one of the prime British examples of a city that has transformed its image from an old industrial center towards a hip, culturally alive city. Glasgow created a marketing campaign called “Glasgow Miles Better” to help communicate to potential tourists and prospective migrants that it is no longer the dirty, dangerous city it once was. A comprehensive plan in for Glasgow was later devised, with one of its goals being to provide a positive image for the city (Glasgow City Plan 2001). Mr. Laurence believes that branding and marketing cities is a longer-term endeavor than marketing products. Cities tend to change more slowly over time, while products can be transformed much more quickly using marketing communications. And new products are constantly being introduced in the marketplace, while new cities are rarely formed today. Attitudes towards brands can



change much more quickly than attitudes for cities, which may take many years to transform. So the longevity of cities, combined with their generally slow development, should lead to marketing communications that have a long-run perspective (Armstrong 1998).

## **B. Problems of Marketing Cities**

Some academics are weary of place marketing – while it is apparent that it works on many levels, there are some potential issues to consider when marketing places. There is little scientific data available to determine the effectiveness of promotional efforts. While the promotional activity of cities has dramatically increased since the 1970s, it is hardly on the scale of commercial products (Hall and Hubbard 1998). And since local development organizations are generally involved in promoting the city rather than trained marketing experts, the results of the campaigns may not be as professional and effective as possible. Critics charge that there is often a major dichotomy between the marketed image and the reality of the city. Therefore, marketing efforts may simply try to mask the problems of the city rather than effectively try to solve them. There is also the issue of spending money to help attract money. If a city wants to promote itself for investment, then it inevitably needs to spend money to do so, and small amounts of money devoted to economic development and city promotion may not be enough to produce adequate results. In fact it is nearly impossible to clearly determine how much a city needs to spend to achieve the results it wants, or if it is even possible to achieve the results it desires. Some argue that creating a new image for a place often involves cleansing or modifying the history of that place to conform to the new image.

Complexities are removed and what is left are a few easy to remember marketing slogans or images, e.g. “Glasgow’s Miles Better” (Hall and Hubbard 1998).

One group that is particularly against marketing efforts for cities would be Marxist geographers, who believe that marketing efforts undertaken are unnecessary and likely exploitative to the underprivileged groups of a city. They believe the flow of capital is naturally cyclical; cities will invariably encounter periods of investment and disinvestment, and marketing cannot alter this economic cycle. They also believe that marketing would inevitably benefit those in the higher economic and social segments of society. Marketing would bring investments to those with business investments, leaving the underprivileged segments left out from receiving any potential benefits brought by the marketing campaigns (Harvey 2001).

### **C. Dynamics of Marketing Post-Industrial Cities**

Cities that have thrived in the past but have suffered massive economic disinvestment and population losses have to adopt entrepreneurial strategies to compete for economic investments – a view basically held by many Marxist geographers. This simply means that cities need to function more like a business in order to attract capital investment in the hopes of reverse their declining fortunes. It is no longer possible to focus on federal monies for urban regeneration; rather, it is necessary to define strategies that focus on private economic investments to regenerate the economy. An important characteristic of this entrepreneurialism is a strong partnership between the local public (government) and private interests. Fostering cooperation would ideally lead to increased civic pride and helping to create an identity for a city. A lack of cooperation between

regional public-private interests would lead to inter-urban competition that would not benefit the region as a whole (Hall and Hubbard 1998).

For industrialized cities that are in decline, attracting new investment may require a “conceptual reorientation” in how it positions or defines itself. Tim Hall, a British professor of urban studies, claims that “one of the most obvious manifestations of entrepreneurialism among city governments has been the attention devoted to the transformation, or at least enhancement, of the image of the city” (Hall and Hubbard 1998, 27). But what defines a city? How is it perceived? Certainly promotional materials and advertisements help to present an image for a city. Large-scale physical redevelopment, particularly used in the 1980’s real estate boom, can improve a city’s image and how it is perceived. A particularly successful redevelopment can easily become the symbol of a distressed city transitioning into a potential renaissance, e.g. Barcelona getting the Summer Olympics and its consequent revitalization (Hall and Hubbard 1998).

Cleveland is one American city that has strived to change its image from a dying industrial city to that of a revitalized city making a spectacular resurgence. A coalition of private and public entities joined forces to eventually create a plan call “Civic Vision 2000” that focused on redeveloping the downtown core area. This plan followed some horrific events for Cleveland that gave it an awful national (and international) image. In the 1970s, the Cuyahoga River, which flows through the downtown area, was so polluted that it caught fire. The city defaulted on loans, giving it the distinction of being the first large American city to do so. Downtown businesses began moving out and almost no new investments were being taking place downtown. But now, Cleveland’s downtown,

while not perfect, is stronger and has a better image. There are entertainment districts, several museums, new sports stadiums, and improved commercial and retail investment since the tumultuous decline of the 1970s and 1980s. The key to Cleveland's image comeback was public-private cooperation. A group called Cleveland Tomorrow (consisting of the largest fifty companies in Cleveland), in conjunction with the city government, commissioned studies and created a strategy for Cleveland to rebound. Cleveland's image has certainly improved and is quite different from its former image. While still known for its industrial roots, Cleveland has created many positive physical developments with which to promote itself that transcend the past primary image of it being a steel city (Burgess, Durack, and Hill 2001).

The aforementioned "Glasgow's Miles Better" public relations campaign was one of the first attempts by a British city to carry out a major image change. Glasgow was mired in post-industrial economic decline and was infamous for its rampant crime, lack of jobs, and poverty. The "Glasgow's Miles Better" campaign presented a bright picture of the city, presenting it as a wonderful place to live and to work, a sharp contrast to its reputation as a place of despair and desperation. This message was spread for many years using many advertising mediums – short films, posters (placed on London buses and in subways), international magazines, television, and even t-shirts. This campaign was supported by various other efforts by the City of Glasgow to shift it from a production city to a city of consumption, namely increasing the city's cultural and service amenities. The "Glasgow's Miles Better" campaign was a very successful example of an industrial city modifying its former image of decline to that of a city that has turned the corner into a cultural and service center. Many other cities that have endured

deindustrialization have made similar attempts to promote themselves as making spectacular comebacks; of course, the level of plausibility of these claims varied widely from city to city depending on the success that city was having transitioning from the negative effects of post-industrial economic decline (Ward 1998).

#### **D. Target Markets for Cities**

Any marketing strategy needs to reach potential target markets. Philip Kotler, Donald Haider, and Irving Rein (all professors at Northwestern University) believe a city needs to provide a marketing strategy to reach three primary target markets: visitors (including both business-related and tourist visitors), residents and workers, and businesses. (Asplund et. al. 1993).

#### ***Attracting Tourism***

When a tourist spends money on food, lodging, and possibly other local products, a multiplying effect is produced on local service employment, incomes, and the local tax base. Attracting visitors is generally the responsibility of the city's visitor and convention bureau. Of course, not all tourism provides positive results. Many cities deal with such an influx of visitors that locals lives are interrupted and city services are severely strained, e.g. road congestion. And local jobs provided by tourism are often service positions that are not well paying. A city needs to know what type of visitors it wants to attract before investing in the necessary infrastructure, as there is no guarantee they will show up. The groups that are targeted as potential visitors must be assessed before moving forward with any strategy to attract them (Asplund et. al. 1993).

Tourism has been a substantially growing business in the United States since World War II for several reasons. The most important is that wealth has increased dramatically and people have disposable incomes to spend on travel. People also have more free time to travel – many are retiring at earlier ages and those who work may have substantial paid vacation time. People are more educated and have a knowledge and desire to visit other places. Business travel has increased dramatically. And major improvements in transportation, specifically highways and airports, have made travel much more convenient (Inskeep 1991).

A city attempting to market itself to tourists may have several organizations that are helping to promote the city, both at the public and private level. Coordination is crucial to ensure that a focused message is being presented and that each organization is not using conflicting or unrelated messages. Of course, there is not one ideal organizational structure that will work for all cities – varying political structures and varying city characteristics ensure that this is not possible. But there are several groups to include in tourism planning to make sure all city interests are involved; these groups include residents, the local government, tourism groups, special interest groups in the community, and business/commercial interests (often the Chamber of Commerce). Those involved in promoting tourism need to have an intimate knowledge of the place they are marketing, they should be able to be objective and take a holistic view of the many interest and matters involved, and they need to be able to work fruitfully with the many groups that may be involved (Clarke and Godfrey 2000).

As federal monies for central cities dried up during the early 1980's, many cities began to engage in competition for tourist dollars. For many cities, promoting tourism

and culture became the backbone of their economic development strategy. Central cities had difficulty competing with the suburbs for residents and retail establishments.

Therefore, central cities often sought to create a downtown that possessed professional service businesses as well as amenities that could promote a cultural and tourist industry. This includes, among other things, hotels, historic buildings and museums, sports stadiums, convention centers, and performance art centers. Over \$10 billion were spent on these types of venues from 1976 to 1986. In recent years, many cities have had major debates regarding downtown sports stadiums or convention centers, and how positive their economic impact would be for the city. Regardless of the outcome, these major projects have substantially altered the physical, and sometimes economic, characteristics of their cities (Fainstein and Judd 1999).

Tourist areas of many American cities inhabit merely one small section of the city rather than the city itself. These tourist areas often serve a dual role as the entertainment or possibly shopping destinations for the local population as well. But they quite often result in the creation of a small section of the city that feels safe and protected from the other ills that the city may not want to display, such as distressed areas with dilapidated buildings and rampant crime. Baltimore exemplifies this fact: it has created a small tourist section in its downtown called Harborplace, which welcomes tens of millions of visitors every year. These visitors generally come to Baltimore just to visit Harborplace, avoiding the despairs of the “other” Baltimore. Many European cities, and some American cities such as New York, are more able to integrate tourism seamlessly with the city itself. In order to accomplish this, a city needs to have a strong, lively city center with little perceived crime problems (Fainstein and Judd 1999).

Some argue that cities with isolated tourism “bubbles” – or tourist parts of the city not integrated with the city itself – need to make tourism a controlled experience in order to maximize visitors’ enjoyment. Most places are visited by someone only once and therefore they want to get the best possible experience visiting it. The more mainstream the tourist attraction, the more commoditized and standardized it should be – in other words, it should be simple to visit with as little thought as possible. Mainstream attractions are not attracting certain tourist segments but any potential tourist. Cities that promote cultural tourism and history are not promoting mainstream attractions – these cultural attractions often require some knowledge of history or eagerness to learn to draw visitors. Many visitors would be ignorant of the cultural heritage of the attraction or perhaps have preconceived notions of what they are visiting. Therefore, promoting a city’s cultural heritage and history is much more difficult than promoting a more typical entertainment tourist attraction. Tourists are looking to relax from their normal everyday lives, and cultural attractions must be careful to not be intimidating to visit. People visiting cultural sites are seeking authenticity, not reality – in other words, they “are seeking a stereotypical image of the past” (Du Cros and McKercher 2002, 40). They want to enjoy a cultural attraction as they may think of it in an idealized sense, not in a realistic sense. They know the attraction is artificial but still enjoy the fact it may feel authentic. For example, Colonial Williamsburg in Virginia has many buildings that have been restored to recreate an atmosphere of a colonial American town. Actors dress up in historical costumes of the time period and enact various chores of what life was like then. Many of the items used are simply replicas of that era. Colonial Williamsburg is a very popular tourist destination that certainly feels like it is authentic, but it is still quite an



artificial environment. The tourists go there with notion of seeing colonial life in idealized way, not the harsh life that the colonists actually knew – that would likely take the fun out most of the tourists’ experience (Du Cros and McKercher 2002).

Britain tried to sell its history – specifically its industrial past – with its “Great English Cities” Promotion in the late 1980s. Old factories were renovated as tourist attractions. Some of the pottery ovens were reconstructed so that pottery with a link to history could be sold. Again, with any cultural heritage that is marketed, the tourist attraction is often created to invoke a romanticized version of the past (Holcomb 1999).

This same strategy of embracing an industrial past to create a tourist attraction was also executed by the City of Lowell, Massachusetts. Cotton mills were a dominant economic component of Lowell’s economy, but these jobs eventually moved out of Lowell to areas that provided newer mills and cheaper labor. Using some federal and local funding, some of the mills have been restored into a museum and are now part of a National Historic Park, which is protected from development and receives federal funding to help operations. Tourists come to enjoy the park and tour the mills to experience the magnificently restored buildings and to see what working there was like (National Park Service website 2005).

Cities may not promote tourism to all people, but may try to cater to a very specific segment of tourists. While heritage tourism certainly is an example of this, there are many other population segments a city may try to attract. Promoting to gay tourists has become a recent hot trend for several cities, including New York and Miami Beach. In this case, the target market they are trying to reach is wealthy and will tend to visit the same city many times in the future (Holcomb 1999).

### *Attracting Residents and Workers*

The second target market cities would want to attract is people – what type of residents and workers does the city want to draw? There may be a demand for skilled or unskilled labor in the city. One population segment has recently been described as vitally important for cities to retain and attract: the younger working population. In the past, this was hardly the case—cities thought of younger workers as “transients who contribute nothing to the bottom line” (Florida 2002, 294). As the economy has been transformed into being more dynamic and prone to constant shifting, it is necessary to have younger workers with updated skill sets. Top companies now recruit youth, and cities without well-educated younger workers will not be able to attract these top companies (Florida 2002). In order to attract the target residents, the city needs to provide the services and amenities that the new residents would seek; otherwise, they will choose a different location (Asplund et. al. 1993).

Not every city is going to try to attract the same types of residents. Of course, there are some ideal residents that cities want to try to attract or retain: skilled professionals, those with money, families, retirees, etc. These groups strengthen the tax base, provide skilled workers to companies, and help to create an overall positive image that the city is a safe place to live. Cities may use different strategies to obtain these residents. For example, the City of Clinton, New Jersey actually paid money to new workers to help overcome a scarcity of labor that existed there. Clinton is a small city that remained fairly rural by New Jersey standards. Most jobs remained a distance away from the city, but when some jobs came to Clinton, there was not enough labor to fill the positions. Thus, Clinton decided the policy to pay new workers some money to come to

work there. Also, many cities offer tax incentives, such as tax deferments, for those willing to buy or build a home in the city. These policies will vary from city to city but some cities are invariably better suited to promote themselves to these prime segments. Cities with warmer climates have a much better chance of successfully recruiting retirees (Asplund et.al. 1993).

Historically, cities have recruited workers that were needed to meet the demands of the companies there. As Northern industrialized cities expanded and needed a large amount of cheap labor, they recruited cheap black labor from the South or immigrants from abroad. Today, cheap labor is certainly still recruited, often from Mexico, by cities that have certain industries that require these workers who are willing to work in harsh conditions for not much money. Places that have an agricultural base need this labor. Cities that have meat-packing plants also need this labor. Many cities are often using this foreign labor for the growing service sectors, such as hotel maids and restaurant dish cleaners (Asplund et. al. 1993).

Immigrants are not only being sought for cheap labor – distressed cities are often promoting themselves to certain ethnic or national segments to help rebuild their vitality and population base. Business investment invariably follows the outward migration of a city's population, and keeping the population base stable can help to keep business investment rooted as well. The 2000 census has shown that the exceptional growth some cities (e.g. Las Vegas) are experiencing are due to immigrants. The 2000 census also shows these immigrant groups are often replacing people migrating from the older, urban neighborhoods of a city to the suburbs. Demographers insist there is great difficulty for a city to try and manipulate immigration patterns. Many argue that it is much easier to

attract immigrants if there is an already significant immigrant community that exists in the city. Still, various cities are helping to embrace immigrants in different ways.

Louisville created an Office of International and Cultural Affairs to help communicate with the 20,000 immigrants that have moved there from countries such as Vietnam and Somalia (Schmitt 2001).

One city that has witnessed urban decline and has attempted to attract immigrants to revitalize the local economy is Utica, New York. The particular immigrant group Utica has targeted is Bosnian refugees fleeing the war-torn Balkan region – it is now home to the largest number of Bosnians outside of Bosnia. The city has also seen a few other immigrant groups move to the city, including Vietnamese immigrants. But the large number of Bosnians that have moved there have created distinctive neighborhoods and are contributing strongly to the local economy. The Bosnian immigrants have adopted distressed neighborhoods that the local native population has shunned and let fall into disrepair. They tend to value property very highly and renovate housing that the locals have neglected. Also, Bosnians have opened up a substantial number of new businesses in the area. According to the Mayor Timothy Julian, “They’ve certainly helped to keep things from really declining further” (Gittler and Seely 2001, 1). While there have been significant cost incurred by the city in helping the refugees to adapt to their new home, studies have shown that the Bosnian immigrants are making a long-term positive contribution that outweighs what the community must provide for them (Gittler and Seely 2001).

### ***Attracting Business Investment***

The third target market for cities is businesses and economic investment. Specifically, cities want to attract businesses that pay well and that are poised to remain in the city for the long run. Businesses involved in the “new economy”—industries such as high-tech computing or biotechnology—are sought after by city after city. But in order to attract businesses, cities must understand how businesses decide where to locate. Several factors are considered by businesses before deciding on a location: quality of the labor force, regulatory environment, access to transportation, school quality and proximity, and, perhaps now most importantly, quality of life. Service-oriented companies that employ a highly-skilled workforce are competing for the very educated workers, and the quality of life of a city is a major factor for these workers to choose a certain place to live and work (Asplund et. al. 1993).

There have been major battle between cities for major corporations that have hinted they are looking to move to a new city. The number of economic development corporations has grown considerably to help lure “free agent” companies to their respective cities. This fierce competition has even created an “industry” that teaches regions how to market and sell themselves. Development Counselors International is one of these companies. Ted Levine, Chairman of Development Counselors International, claims that businesses are making location decisions not on intuition like in the past, but instead on data. Deals that were once made on the golf course are becoming passé; now decision makers are looking for hard facts to make informed location decisions. Things like transportation accessibility and access to cheap, available land can make or break deals. Marketing a city’s positive attributes and statistics to potential firms can help

promote a city's chances of landing some of these high quality firms. But some cities promote themselves in a different way. For example, Hampton Roads in Virginia lured companies desiring simple blue-collar labor by highlighting its inordinately high unemployment rate (Cho 2001).

Cities often use enormous tax breaks to lure companies. Often, a company will threaten to move unless given certain economic concessions by the city that perhaps another city is more than willing to offer. This happens at multiple levels – regionally, nationally, and internationally. Companies have become like free agents in a sports market – cities compete and offer more and more economic incentives in order to successfully attract companies. As previously mentioned, there are multiple factors a company uses when involved in site selection, but tax breaks and other economic incentives have become a prominent factor in where companies may choose to locate.

One city that has been successful in attracting new business after major industrial decline is Rockford, Illinois, a city that lies about seventy-five miles northwest of Chicago. Its reversal required it to substantially reinvent its image and strategy to attract businesses. Rockford did several things to achieve an economic recovery. It created an economic development office based in Chicago to market its relatively inexpensive land to businesses considering moving to the Chicago region. Along with the cheap real estate it had relatively low wages, lower cost of living, and a strong industrial base that made it desirable for certain business. Not all cities can attract the same types of industries, and Rockford made a firm decision that its niche is in low-tech industries. It created a development corporation to fund new business ventures and created a local technology center at the local college, Rockford College. This is only a brief summary of the city's

efforts, but they produced remarkable results – Rockford’s new companies produced \$140 million in exports from 1985 to 1992, and a significant number of companies invested in the city. While this didn’t completely reverse its economic troubles, it adapted successfully and it reversed the previous downward economic trend of the city (Asplund et. al. 1993).

### **E. Strategic Plans and Comprehensive Plans**

Up to this point, only marketing plans have been discussed. Marketing plans are generally created with a very specific objective in mind. They tend to not be comprehensive in nature and usually have a short-term perspective. Cities may create various strategic in order to provide a framework for rational decision-making, very similar to strategic plans that a business would create to guide its future growth. Strategic plans are also marketing tools – they provide vital frameworks that cities can use to make important decisions, including how the city seeks to market itself and how it wants to promote itself to various business interests and population. The word “marketing” does not need to be in a plan’s title to include marketing objectives. Some cities may also have comprehensive plans that would fall under this definition of a strategic plan.

In 1999, Philadelphia created an exemplary strategic plan within its Office of the Controller named “Philadelphia: A New Urban Direction.” The plan acknowledges the inevitability of change for a city and thus the need for the city to adapt and evolve in order to remain competitive. The plan states that the city cannot be defined and analyzed as its own entity anymore; rather, the city and its entire region constitute the true functioning unit of the economy and other related processes. But it declares that a strong

center core is vital to a prospering region. Also, the plan stresses the importance of public/private relationships in solving the city and region's problems. In order for the whole region to flourish, teamwork and cooperation must take precedence; the various municipalities and organizations functioning in the region have to take a regional perspective and make decisions not for what is best for them, but what is best for the region as well (Office of the City Controller, City of Philadelphia 1999).

Philadelphia's plan analyzes many aspects of the city using a wide variety of data sources and also using a model to project various scenarios. The model, called REMI – by Regional Economic Models Inc – can be used to test the effects of many different variables, such as population and fiscal policies (e.g. tax rates, levies, etc.). The model allowed the city to project population, output, employment, and personal income. Using the data from these projections, the plan offered recommendations regarding various dilemmas that Philadelphia will likely be facing. What are the infrastructure and housing needs? How is the economy shifting and how must the city react to those shifts? How is the population changing? These are only a few questions that need to be answered. Having the projection data from the model is the key to establishing a strategic framework that can meet future needs and create a competitive region. Philadelphia's plan evaluates many issues that are involved within the strategic framework, including:

- Government frameworks, including school districts/city relationships, service districts, and performance measurement
- Fiscal policies, including taxes, reducing government costs, and other revenue generating possibilities for the city



- Planning issues, including economic development (including tourism), housing, transportation, and infrastructure improvements
- Public issues, such as education and law enforcement
- Regional cooperation issues, such as incentives to produce better regional cooperation for economic opportunities and to minimize sprawl effects

The Philadelphia plan is an actionable plan – it offers recommendations for all of the issues just described within the strategic framework. These recommendations are based on supporting data and a regional viewpoint. It is an excellent example of a strategic plan for positioning a city to be competitive not just today, but in the long-run (Office of the City Controller, City of Philadelphia 1999).

Comprehensive plans are very similar to strategic plans, as they take a long-term holistic viewpoint and create a framework to achieve various goals. Comprehensive plans contrast with strategic plans as they tend to focus primarily on planning issues, which include land use (zoning), transportation, housing, economic development, and community development.

Glasgow, Scotland has recently devised a detailed comprehensive plan for itself that has been lauded. The Glasgow plan basically replaced forty neighborhood plans and created a framework for the entire city and all of its neighborhoods, again reinforcing the importance of cooperation and a holistic viewpoint. It has three sections: one that provides an overview of the plan (a simplified “user’s guide”), one that details all of the development guidelines, and one that summarizes all of the quantitative data used to make the recommendations. The plan stands on its own but also works with other existing plans and documents that are in place (Glasgow City Plan 2001).

The plan addresses several subjects: People, Jobs, Infrastructure, Environment, City Center, The River, and Neighborhoods. The first four are strategic topics and the last three are geographic areas within the city on which to focus planning efforts. The desired goals for each of these major areas are outlined in the plan, and the strategy of how to achieve these goals is defined. The goals and strategies of each area are summarized below:

- People: Achieve population growth and improve the city's housing stock through initiatives such as reclaiming brownfields and selectively releasing greenfields
- Jobs: Improve work availability for all economic and social segments of the population and further strengthen the international presence of the city's economy by provided the necessary lands for economic development
- Infrastructure: Establish the necessary infrastructure needed for future development, including transportation network improvements, schools, retail, water, and sewage capacities, by better linking land use to transportation needs
- Environment: Achieve urban sustainability, preserve the character of the built environment, and improve greenspace access by superior design standards and utilizing currently vacant land
- City Center: Sustain the City Center as the heart of Scotland and ensure it remains a major factor in the U.K. and Europe by making it the strategic focus of development efforts, particularly retail and commercial
- The River: Continue to improve the Clyde's River regeneration so to reach its development potential by improving its accessibility and vitality with better infrastructure and transportation linkages

- Neighborhoods: Improve the prospects of certain distressed neighborhoods by guiding various planning solutions and strategies, particularly at a local level

The plan assesses the current state of each of these areas, visualizes how each of these areas should be ideally functioning twenty years in the future, and provides a viable framework of how the city can achieve that vision (Glasgow City Plan 2001).

The second section is geared towards those who want to develop and do business with Glasgow. It contains the quality standards of different forms of development within the city. Developers can use this section to find guidelines and possibly determine if a development is likely to be acceptable or not (Glasgow City Plan 2001).

This third section contains quantitative data that supports the recommendations made in part one. It therefore is really an appendix of specific figures and details as to how and why the plan took the shape and direction that it did (Glasgow City Plan 2001).

The maps included in the plan provide an excellent visual device that incorporates all the components that pertain to the planning needs of the city. The built form map is especially useful, as it depicts the urban design elements of plan graphically. It displays each of the building form types in each district. The city of Glasgow is depicted as a whole – transportation routes, neighborhoods and districts, nodes, and many other features are shown in conjunction with one another. Also, it shows existing and recommended residential densities so that projected growth can be estimated and accommodated. The map is a vital graphical device the plan utilizes to address land use needs for the next twenty years. It will likely help to ensure an adequate supply of land for various uses and ensure that the land uses next to one another are compatible. It also helps to determine transportation linkages and infrastructure needs to optimize land uses.

The built form component of the plan enables the user to see the “big picture” of the city and the plan’s future vision for the city (Glasgow City Plan 2001).

So how are these strategic plans and comprehensive plans similar? They both use substantial amounts of data to support their recommendation. They both take a long-term comprehensive view of the city and develop a framework to benefit the region as a whole, not just a single part. And they both are really marketing tools for the city and region. For a city to remain competitive, it must have a vision for the future and goals and policies to meet that vision. These plans show how the city intends to position and market itself to meet these goals. The word “marketing” does not need to be in a plan’s title to include marketing objectives.

## **F. Literature Summary**

Marketing is a broad subject that has proven to be an important topic for brands and cities alike. Cities are competing just as companies and brands are competing; yet cities are just beginning to realize the importance of marketing messages as companies have used in order to compete. Marketing is by no means an exact science, and there is certainly no magic formula for distressed cities that to use in formulating a marketing strategy. Every city has its own strengths and weaknesses, and therefore, marketing strategies will differ city by city. There is obviously a wealth of material written on marketing and marketing cities, and it is important to have a firm grasp of the potential and caveats of marketing before embarking on a marketing campaign. However, the marketing literature is almost non-existent for distressed cities. But this doesn’t mean distressed cities are not using marketing to help promote themselves. The literature has

shown that some distressed cities have been able to turn weakness into strength:

Rockford, Illinois was able to take advantage of its relatively cheap real estate to attract manufacturing companies during a time of severe economic distress. And some cities have used their lack of a high-paying labor force to entice business that required that type of labor.

But the positives are generally few and far for distressed cities; they often have little positive characteristics to market, and they usually suffer from a poor image that makes marketing efforts very difficult. This study will attempt to determine what these distressed cities can do to counter these issues. Of course, any distressed city must also proactively pursue and invest in civic projects to remove its negative aspects in conjunction with its marketing efforts. Marketing is not a panacea for a city's problems – it is a tool for communicating and helping to attract investments in a highly competitive environment.

The next section reviews the four comparative cities' marketing efforts to determine how these cities are marketing themselves to potential residents and businesses, what organizations are marketing the cities, and what the general content of the marketing messages is. These cities are all very similar to Gary, yet they all have different dynamics and characteristics to use in their marketing messages. The comparative cities that will be discussed are Camden, NJ, Chester, PA, East Saint Louis, MO, and Compton CA.

#### **IV. COMPARATIVE CITY MARKETING ANALYSIS**

The content analysis of the marketing efforts are discussed in this section.

Various marketing mediums that are used to promote the city are analyzed for content and primary marketing messages. These mediums include the city's website, marketing materials from organizations that are promoting the city, comprehensive or strategic city plans, and press coverage from the last year.

##### **A. Camden, New Jersey**

###### ***City Website***

Camden's website is well-organized and contains a wealth of information. Residents can find information on city services and various neighborhood redevelopment projects. Forms are available for downloading, such as zoning permits, maps, and neighborhood plans which facilitates residents' interactions with the city. There are also housing and rental programs listed to help attract new residents; these include the HOME Investment Partnership Program (which provides federal funds for building low to moderate income housing), the Housing Assistance Program (which allows a tax abatement for updating one's home to meet local code standards), and the First Time Homebuyer's Program (which provides a substantial subsidy for qualified residents purchasing their first home in Camden). The residential target market is low to moderate income residents and developers/builders of low to middle income housing. Almost all the programs listed are for those with lower incomes who may need help in purchasing a home (City of Camden website 2005).

Businesses considering Camden can use the “Business Resources” link to find information on starting and locating a business in Camden. Information available online for businesses includes empowerment and enterprise zone boundaries, available tax incentives, and how to get various types of loans to start a business. Various links to economic development programs and redevelopment agencies are also listed. There is also a section that describes why Camden is an excellent place to locate a business. This section is really the only part of pure marketing dialogue on the business section. It sells Camden as being close to the Philadelphia market (and therefore having access to a strong retail market and labor pool), as being a transportation hub with a port, rail, and interstate freeway connections, and as being geographically centered in one the largest population regions in the United States. The target markets for attracting business primarily include smaller entrepreneurial companies, as the bulk of the information available includes business assistance for starting a business in Camden. The section that listed available tax incentives is not targeting any particularly sized company, but any company that may want to move into the city (City of Camden website 2005).

### ***Marketing Literature from Organizations Responsible for City Promotion***

Camden does not have any organization that markets the city to visitors or tourists. Camden also does not have a local Chamber of Commerce. The Southern New Jersey Chamber of Commerce, which covers a seven county area, is the chamber that includes Camden. They do not have any marketing packets for prospective businesses that may want to locate in the area.

The Economic Development department for the City of Camden is the primary marketing organization for promoting the city to businesses. It does not have any marketing packets available for selling the city to potential businesses.

### ***Comprehensive or Strategic Plans***

Camden has a well-organized comprehensive plan, created in 2002 by the city's planning department, called "*FutureCamden*," intended to guide city development for the next twenty or so years. The original report is quite long and detailed, but it is also available in a shorter, summary report version. The plan addresses many issues, including land use and zoning, Camden's role in the Philadelphia metropolitan region, housing and neighborhoods, economic development and revitalization, physical and historical assets, environmental issues, the transportation infrastructure, public facilities and education. The final part defines how each of the plan's recommendations for each of these issues can actually be put into action. This document is Camden's guide to future development and certainly works as a marketing tool; the *FutureCamden* plan shows that the City of Camden is working towards, and has a blueprint, towards a strong future, and those who are interested in development in the city can refer to the plan as a guide (*FutureCamden Summary Report 2002*).

The land use plan is a typical zoning map that designates what type and density of development should go in each part of the city. Regarding Camden's role in the Philadelphia metropolitan region, the plan sees Camden not only as feeding off of the Philadelphia market, but becoming it's own vital city itself in the Southern New Jersey area, with Camden being the urbanized center of that area. Making Camden an "urban



center requires marketing the City to its own residents as well as to potential visitors and businesses as part of a growing South Jersey region” (*FutureCamden Summary Report Part One 2002, SUM-18*). The building blocks to make Camden the urban center of the region, which is an important goal for Camden to have a strong future, include:

- Continuing to fund redevelopment of blighted areas and increasing not only the affordable housing stock, but housing for middle incomes as well.
- In term of economic development, continuing working with Philadelphia to “market ‘Two Cities – One Waterfront’ as a combined recreational, educational family entertainment center for the greater metropolitan region will help solidify Camden’s urban center role” (*FutureCamden Summary Report 2002, SUM-19*).

The plan also calls for a coordinated marketing effort from all the cities in the region to promote the arts and cultural tourism. Finally, the plan recommends improving the port’s infrastructure and to provide some incentives for private industrial development on spare port land.

- Working with employers and educational facilities to make Camden an educational center.
- Working with other cities in the region to regionalize public services to decrease costs. Improve the public transportation links at the Camden Transportation Center so that locals can easily get to suburban areas and Philadelphia (*FutureCamden Summary Report 2002*).

The portions of the plan describing ways to improve housing and neighborhoods and achieve a dynamic economy are the primary parts of the plan that describe the

programs that attempt to attract residents and businesses. The housing and neighborhood goals include creating a city-wide program for housing/community development, reclaim vacant/underutilized properties, retain and attract middle-income residents and neighborhoods, deconcentrate poverty, help reduce crime, and beautify the appearance of neighborhoods. The plan then makes recommendations on how to achieve these objectives, such as developing a demolition program to remove blighted homes that tend to attract crime and reinforce an image of disinvestment. Various programs can be construed as marketed efforts to attract residents. The plan recommends changing policies to increase the numbers of moderate and middle income residents, such as subsidies to rehabilitate currently vacant homes. There are various plans, though they are vague, on how to build the middle class proportion of the city. One is subsidizing certain household mortgages in the hopes first-time homebuyers in the city become stabilized and eventually “move up” the housing ladder. Another recommendation is for the city to locate and promote sites that are suitable for market-rate housing (*FutureCamden Summary Report 2002*).

As previously stated, the primary economic goal of Camden is to become the urban center of southern New Jersey. The specific goals to revitalize the local economy include:

- Take advantage of its strategic location, on the river and near Philadelphia, to become a major regional city
- Retain and attract businesses that provide substantial employment
- Make the CBD into a lively, mixed-use area with 24-hour activity
- Establish retail centers along major commercial corridors

- Support the expansion of the health care service (and related) industries
- Better train the local workforce and help connect them to employers

(*FutureCamden* Summary Report 2002)

The plan notes that Camden must attempt to reach these goals in the context of an increasingly global economy, requiring a firm understanding of the city's strengths to build upon in order to succeed. There a myriad of recommendations to achieve these economic goals and help market the city to business investment. The plan recognizes the importance of the Port of Camden as a means of promoting growth near the Delaware River, and the city needs to continue to collaborate and work in a more symbiotic manner to achieve the potential that the riverfront area could become. The waterfront near downtown has major tourist potential, and building upon the current partnership with Philadelphia (i.e. the 'Two Cities – One Waterfront' campaign) to provide ample transportation connections is vital. Making downtown a true urban center of the region is described in detail in the downtown improvement plan, which is part of the comprehensive plan. The keys to strengthening and marketing the CBD include seamlessly connecting the CBD and waterfront, taking advantage of the historic districts, and pursuing office development – especially back-office and service operations from higher-rent areas like Philadelphia) – utilizing the fiber-optic network in the city. Another important aspect of revitalizing the CBD is collaboration with local universities (e.g. Rutgers), medical and research centers, and government to produce some development synergy in making the city a regional service center. Ideally, as mentioned, the CBD would be a mixed-use 24-hour district. The plan recommends marketing

Camden in a regional context; in other words, the benefits southern New Jersey should be advertised with Camden playing the role of the urban service center of that region. The plan also recommends that Camden “direct its marketing efforts to its residents and businesses as well as to potential visitors and relocating companies” ((*FutureCamden Summary Report 2002*, SUM-41). Housing fairs could help sell the various positive attributes and improvements of Camden’s neighborhoods (*FutureCamden Summary Report 2002*).

The plan also defines various industrial clusters that are present in the city to focus on to attract a goal of 50,000 new jobs over the next few decades. The economic/industrial clusters in Camden described are some high-tech for the defense industry, health care and bio-medical research, higher education, cultural/entertainment facilities, shipping/warehousing/transportation, and government and private office support services. Building upon these clusters is important to growing the city’s job base. Also, the plan makes several other recommendations to increase employment opportunities: creating urban industrial parks (with necessary infrastructure), generating several mixed-use nodes (including transit-oriented), using brownfield initiatives to develop more industrial sites, adopting an aggressive approach to retaining the current businesses with projects such as expanding the business development center, and upgrading infrastructure and services by updating the capital improvements plan (*FutureCamden Summary Report 2002*).

### ***Press Coverage (Indirect Communications)***

The press coverage in the *Philadelphia Inquirer* regarding Camden generally falls into one of two categories: stories about crimes committed in Camden, and efforts to fight crime in Camden. Since Camden is a crime-ridden city, it is inevitable that local press coverage (metropolitan area coverage from the *Philadelphia Inquirer*) will have a large number of stories that relate crimes committed in Camden. Drug busts, carjackings, assaults, and murders are all listed in the metropolitan coverage, and of course there are a lot of these crimes. One notable crime included a rape in the central business district of Camden, which, according to the articles, is a fairly safe section of the city. Racial unrest that sparked three days of violence and forced an increased police presence in schools is highlighted as a major incident. But many articles describe serious efforts to combat crime. These articles describing Camden's effort to lower crime include increasing the salaries and staff of police and fire departments, moving a rehab center that is notorious for attracting crime, being one of only five American cities to receive federal money to fight violent crime, law enforcement agencies coordinating efforts, and a safety-advocacy group walking the streets called 'Men United'. These articles, especially the one that describes the 'Men United' group, show positive happenings in the city. Another article that describes the tree-planting project in Camden and a few residents' determination to make a difference there shows the grit and character of many in the city. But for the most part, the high degree of crime in the city reflects what is shown in the papers day after day (*Philadelphia Inquirer* archives website 2004-2005).

Looking at the *New York Times* press coverage, Camden again receives generally negative coverage. Being ranked as the most dangerous city in 2004 certainly does not

help the city's image or efforts to fight crime. One article mentions the South Jersey Tourism Corporation \$1.2 million efforts to attract some form of tourism there. A few articles mention redevelopment efforts that have been discussed but have not actually taken place yet (*New York Times* archives website 2004-2005).

### ***Discourse Analysis of Camden Comprehensive Plan***

The beginning of Camden's plan clearly lays out the reasons for the plan's creation, and it does not try to hide the fact that there are many issues plaguing the city. The plan describes urban disinvestment, such as vacant, board-up houses and empty lots. It is probable that the current population will continue to dwindle due to a significantly underperforming school system. The CBD shows no activity after business hours, and it, along with the various neighborhoods, is also displaying the effects of major disinvestment. Of course, one of the major issues in Camden is the crime issue. Crime is mentioned, but not as extensively as it probably should, given the fact that Camden has risen to be the supposed most dangerous city in America. The fact that the crime rate has dropped is mentioned, but this does not portray an accurate portrayal of the major crime issue facing Camden. The report does say that crime remains a top concern and priority though.

Throughout the plan, how these specific issues relate to the future vision for the city is reiterated. So the plan certainly does not shy away from painting an overly glossy picture of the city; it realizes the hardships the city is facing, and it is attempting to help rectify those issues. Those reading this plan with an interest in learning about Camden would get an accurate portrait of the city, but the crime issue is not discussed to the level

it is actually occurring. There are specific goals laid out for the city to reach that the plan's creators believe are attainable. The plan aims to offer recommendations to reach those goals, rather than offer recommendations with no explicit objectives and benchmarks (*FutureCamden Summary Report 2002*).

## **B. Chester, Pennsylvania**

### ***City Website***

Visitors to the Chester city website are greeted with a message from the mayor why Chester is a wonderful city to live and work. Most of the site is devoted to general information (history, meeting times) and city services, but the city website does have an “Economic and Community Development” link that has some information for potential residents and businesses. This link provides information on a few programs that may be of interest to people wanting to buy a home. The target market of homebuyers is low to moderate income residents for the housing programs. There are also links to business incentives and programs to locate in Chester. Some of the programs described are the opportunity and enterprise zones, a loan program for small businesses, a tax assistance act (from the LERTA program– Local Economic Revitalization Tax Assistance Act) that helps companies to expand by deferring taxes from increased real estate values, and a nonprofit organization that basically acts an incubator for smaller businesses. The target markets of these economic programs include any business from small to large-scale, depending on the program (Chester City website 2005).

There is also a small section that contains marketing dialogue on why Chester is good place to have a business. It touts Chester as a “prime location for businesses which

value superior access to the Philadelphia metropolitan market, a high capacity public utility infrastructure, a competitive tax environment, a business-friendly government and a skilled, available workforce” (Chester City website 2005). Top companies that are already located there are mentioned, such as Kimberly-Clark. It’s accessibility via various transportation links, notably highways and the Philadelphia International Airport, are also used as a selling point. It then goes into more detail on Chester’s superior tax structure compared to neighboring cities. The city claims it possesses an excellent reputation for helping to nurture commercial and industrial development. Various businesses that have recently located in Chester are mentioned, particularly the growth of a high-tech industrial component, and the City claims \$560 million in new business investment since 1996. The success is credited to the City of Chester working closely with county, state, and federal levels of government to achieve economically positive results. Finally, Chester’s historic value and diversity is touted as reason to work there. The target markets of this marketing literature are primarily mid-range size commercial, industrial, and high-tech businesses (Chester City website 2005).

### ***Marketing Literature from Organizations Responsible for City Promotion***

The Old Chester PA Heritage Foundation helps to promote Chester in a general sense, but it primarily helps to sell the historical value of Chester. They do not have any marketing materials but they do have a website with a vast array of local information for the Chester area. Their website is basically a scrapbook for the city. It offers a comprehensive local business directory, different accounts of Chester history, maps, civic information, and other things that would be relevant only to locals. It does not really



offer any sort of marketing effort; instead, it is a useful local resource (Old Chester PA Heritage Foundation website 2005).

Chester does not have a local chamber of commerce. The Delaware County Chamber of Commerce encompasses the City of Chester. They do not have a standard marketing packet for businesses, but they do have a relocation packet for people or businesses considering moving to the area. The Delaware County Chamber of Commerce also helps promote tourism in the area, and they have a visitor's packet available.

The relocation packet has a letter from the President of the Delaware County Chamber of Commerce that describes the area as having continuous activities for entertainment and having a high standard of education and healthcare. The letter describes the County as being business-friendly, as it has several Fortune 500 companies and thousands of smaller businesses. The historical value of the area is touted, and the proximity to Philadelphia and its many amenities (such as professional sports) are listed as reasons to come to Delaware County (Delaware County Chamber of Commerce Relocation Brochure 2005).

The relocation packet does not have any section that markets the City of Chester specifically. The packet sells living and working in the County in five broad categories:

- The historical significance of the area. Many revolutionary battles were fought in the area, and many historical structures stand from the past, including some log cabins built in the 17<sup>th</sup> century, and the old Chester courthouse, which was the first public building in Pennsylvania. This is the only historical site mentioned in the City of Chester.

- The strong educational opportunities available. Delaware County is home to good public high schools, many private and Catholic schools, and a vocational school as well. The metropolitan area boasts more than 80 colleges and universities; fifteen higher learning institutions (universities, community colleges, satellite campuses, etc.) are located right in Delaware County. The area – which includes the entire Philadelphia metropolitan area – therefore has the largest concentration of higher learning institutions than anywhere in the United States, many with continuing education programs. There are also services available for those with learning disabilities who need special assistance and help. Chester is home to one university: Widener University.
- A good environment for economic and business development. The local chamber is supportive in many ways, by providing: an international trade program (helping to find global customers and expedite the exporting process), a modern meeting and seminar facility, a foundation to help non-profit organizations and distressed areas of the County, and a Commerce Center that provides assistance ranging from financing to help with site selection. The local industries and companies that form the basis of the County's economies are mentioned, including Boeing. Various economic incentive and financing programs are discussed, and Chester is specifically mentioned here the only place in the County to have Keystone Opportunity Zones (a Pennsylvania program geared to increase investment in economically underdeveloped areas) and a significant Enterprise Zone. The benefits of locating a business to these zones, such as low-interest financing and tax abatements, are mentioned. Chester's Local Economic

Revitalization Tax Assistance Act (LERTA) is mentioned (this is described from the Chester website section). Chester's Microenterprise Partnership, an organization created to help small, entrepreneurial companies, is also discussed; it provides business support services to businesses with less than five employees and less than \$100,000 in annual sales. The County's strong transportation network is also discussed, including good public transportation and easy access to the Philadelphia International Airport.

- The high-quality health and social services available in the County. The many local hospital and health care options are discussed. Programs that are available for the handicapped/disabled, children, and seniors are mentioned. Chester is home to some of these, including a major medical center.
- A plethora of entertainment options available in the County and Philadelphia metropolitan region. Chester is not mentioned here (Delaware County Chamber of Commerce Relocation Brochure 2005).

The visitor and tourism brochure is a guide to traveling and visiting Delaware County and the Brandywine Valley, a larger region the County is a part of. This brochure is marketing a wide geographic area and Chester is hardly mentioned in the brochure; it is basically a map and listing of all of the attractions a visitor would want to see: museums, historical sites, parks, vineyards, theaters, etc. The only attraction listed for the City of Chester is the historic Old Chester Courthouse. Chester seems to have little tourist value from the contents of this brochure (Delaware County Chamber of Commerce Tourism Brochure 2005).

### ***Comprehensive or Strategic Plans***

Chester does not have any comprehensive or strategic plans that are used for marketing or guiding the city.

### ***Press Coverage (Indirect Communications)***

Chester is covered in the *Philadelphia Inquirer* but does not have the extent of coverage that Camden does. The articles regarding Chester can be broken down into three categories: crimes in Chester, efforts to revitalize the old central business district in Chester, and new business activity in Chester. Crime does not appear to be an overly significant issue from the articles reviewed. The old central business district is obviously downtrodden and many efforts are underway to try and spark activity back in the Chester core. Chester has some positive press coverage that describes new businesses that have moved into Chester. It would appear that Chester has a somewhat diversified and thriving business sector, and that it has successfully attracted some new business and investment recently (*Philadelphia Inquirer* archives website 2004-2005).

Looking at national press coverage from *The New York Times*, it appears that Chester is not significant enough to merit articles on a national level.

## **C. East Saint Louis, Illinois**

### ***City Website***

East Saint Louis does not have a city website available. This is remarkable because even cities of a much smaller size have websites available. East Saint Louis has

no way to communicate to residents online, and there is no way for businesses or any interested parties to learn about East Saint Louis on the internet.

### ***Marketing Literature from Organizations Responsible for City Promotion***

East Saint Louis has a chamber of commerce which promotes to businesses wanting to locate there. It does not have a standard marketing packet available, but it does have a wide variety of data and studies that they will customize and make available to businesses or developers. These include a demographic data summary, a city business history, and infrastructure and transportation studies. The business data overview and business/industrial history were the only materials available for this study.

The business data overview first displays a map of the St. Louis metropolitan area centered on East Saint Louis. A more specific map of just East Saint Louis and its surrounding municipalities is then displayed. A directory of the city officials and city departments is listed with responsibilities and phone numbers. Then pertinent community data is displayed, including:

- Population and labor force data (total labor force, unemployment data)
- Tax structure (but not how it compares to other metropolitan municipalities)
- Educational facilities, including technical and vocational schools
- Municipal services, community facilities, and health care information (hospitals, wastewater treatment, telecommunications, other utilities, golf courses, parks, etc.)
- Transportation data, such as distances to other major cities, flight data, and some port data (East Saint Louis Chamber of Commerce Data Overview 2005)

The fact that East Saint Louis has economic incentives, such as enterprise zones and TIF (tax-increment financing) districts are also highlighted, as is the strength of the transportation network and the city's proximity to St. Louis. The major employers in the city are also listed (with the largest including the casino, the school district, the hospital, and the city). Basic data is also provided for metropolitan area regarding the largest employers and employment trends (East Saint Louis Chamber of Commerce Data Overview 2005).

The business and industrial history chronicles East Saint Louis early origins to where it is today. It discusses the city's emergence as an industrial center and its industrial decline. The business history lists the companies that left and details the population losses that began around 1960. The loss of tax revenues and racial unrest during this period are both issues also mentioned. The final section heralds a turnaround that is happening for the city. The casino riverboat, new light rail link developments, enterprise and empowerment zone funding, and various multimillion dollar investments are cited as reasons the city is in the midst of a renaissance (East Saint Louis Chamber of Commerce Business and Industrial History 2005).

### ***Comprehensive or Strategic Plans***

East Saint Louis has a comprehensive plan that was created in 2004. It was not created by the city but by a consulting company for the city. This is the first city's first comprehensive plan in forty years. The plan states that it incorporates the community's desire "to reclaim the downtown and the riverfront through economic stimulation while

preserving its strong neighborhoods and promoting the rich cultural heritage that makes East Saint Louis unique” (East Saint Louis Comprehensive Plan 2004, 1). There are several guiding principles of the plan:

- Create a linkage between the riverfront and downtown area so that downtown plans are not created in isolation, but rather in synchronization with riverfront development plans
- Create a unique identity for the downtown area that meets the local commercial and housing needs
- Protect historic and cultural assets, especially downtown, and encourage adaptive re-use when necessary
- Update land use regulations so they accommodate the recommended development plans (East Saint Louis Comprehensive Plan 2004)

Five critical planning issues arose as needing to be addressed within the short-term (six to twelve months). These activities were to form a foundation for long-term planning efforts for East Saint Louis, and include:

- Update land use regulations
- Establish a development/redevelopment entity that would focus on the downtown and riverfront area developments
- Create a central business district strategy that includes identifying properties for development, performing a market analysis, finding sources of funding, establishing incentives for private investment, and marketing vacant properties and buildings to developers

- Get funding for a historic and cultural preservation plan, including creating a board
- Most importantly, creating a linkage between the downtown and riverfront through design and infrastructure (mostly roads) improvements (East Saint Louis Comprehensive Plan 2004)

The riverfront is addressed as being the catalyst for generating interest and marketing East Saint Louis to private investments and developers. It already has the casino development, and development here can take advantage of the wonderful views of downtown Saint Louis and the nearby parks and greenways. Successful past developments are described as the building blocks of the what the plan will use for future economic development recommendations; these include the Casino Queen gambling riverboat (which is slated for expansion), improved Metrolink (public transportation, including light rail and buses) access, and some other private developments in the city. Therefore, new development would likely be focused near these areas (with transit-oriented development being used as much as possible near the four Metrolink stations). The image of the city is also addressed at several points; the plan notes that the plans recommendations will eventually lead to an improved image for the city, but exactly how this will happen, or specific marketing efforts that would be needed are not included anywhere in the plan (East Saint Louis Comprehensive Plan 2004).

The plan looks at economic trends regionally, such as what industries are expanding (or shrinking), but it also looks very specifically at localized (just in the city) trends that place East Saint Louis at an advantage or disadvantage compared to the rest of



the metropolitan region.. The strengths for East Saint Louis include health care, social services, entertainment, and transportation, all possible industries from which to build an economic strategy (East Saint Louis Comprehensive Plan 2004).

One section discusses the various stakeholders (community leaders, citizens, members of various private and public organizations) thoughts on what positive attributes East Saint Louis has available to market itself. The marketable strengths of the city include the proximity of the Mississippi River, historical/cultural assets (such as its historic ties to Native Americans and being the home to various African-Americans, including Miles Davis and Jackie Joyner Kersee), and civic pride and the unwavering spirit of the local residents. The stakeholders also determined issues that lowered the marketability of East Saint Louis, including the need for a more responsible government, increased services for children and seniors, the tax structure (property taxes mostly), and a need for better social conditions (East Saint Louis Comprehensive Plan 2004).

The plan ultimately produces policy recommendations based on the trends and data analyzed. For example, the issue of downtown being vastly underutilized should be addressed by creating a “revitalization strategy that encompasses the downtown – targeting Collinsville Avenue along with the riverfront” (East Saint Louis Comprehensive Plan 2004, 48). Another example includes the issue of the lack of job creation and labor force skills. The plan recommends addressing this issue by creating a business incubator partnering with various organizations, including the local chamber of commerce, as well as establishing a micro-loan program in association with the small business development center. Policies are included for economic development, housing, open space, current land use, and future land use. The policies do not include the creation of any marketing

entities or programs to help sell the city to potential developers or residents (East Saint Louis Comprehensive Plan 2004).

### ***Press Coverage (Indirect Communications)***

East Saint Louis local coverage in the *St. Louis Dispatch* can be summarized into the following categories: articles about violent crime, articles about negative city issues (other than violent crime), and positive developments in the city. Violent crime is clearly a major issue, as murder articles are prevalent. There are myriad of other issues discussed in articles: bribery and corruption in the political sphere, possible voter fraud, and a declining population, forcing libraries to cut hours and churches to merge. A grocery store almost left the city, citing security costs and a lack of population needed to sustain business; East Saint Louis officials convinced it to stay (for the time being) as it struggles to devise a plan for it to survive. The tallest building in East Saint Louis was condemned and razed as redevelopment plans to revitalize it were not able to come to fruition. Certainly most of the stories were not encouraging, but some positive articles portrayed some good news for the city. The casino there was relocating (within the city limits) and the relocation included a \$150 million expansion. The local housing authority announced almost \$10 million in low-income tax credits, which will likely lead to at least five hundred new dwelling units within the city immediately. A waste transfer station is likely to locate in East Saint Louis, bringing needed tax revenues for the city. A new gas station on the riverfront at first seems like a positive development, but it understates past grandiose plans that failed for the riverfront , such as a \$25 million mixed-use project called ‘City Center’ (*St. Louis Dispatch* archives 2004-2005).

*New York Times* press coverage of East Saint Louis is fairly meager and mixed regarding its content. Articles include a controversial mayor retaking office and the hard luck of the city and its growing reliance on casino revenues for taxes. Although the city relies dramatically on the casinos tax revenues (which includes nearly 50% of the city's operation budget), these have been a boon to East Saint Louis, allowing some decline reversal: repairing infrastructure, increasing police and fire staffs, and helping some development (*New York Times* archives 2004-2005).

### ***Discourse Analysis East Saint Louis' Comprehensive Plan***

The executive summary of the East Saint Louis Comprehensive Plan's only includes the framework for developing the plan and the general recommendations made by the plan. There is no discussion of the city's woes. But the beginning of the actual text of the plan provides an overview of East Saint Louis' history and discusses how it was once an economically vibrant city, but has since fallen into a state of disinvestment and decline. The city relied heavily on manufacturing industries, as manufacturing companies and jobs began to decline, so did East Saint Louis. Blight and disinvestment are mentioned as major obstacles. But crime is never mentioned as an issue, and East Saint Louis is notorious for its crime problem. The plan does attempt to make its recommendations within a pragmatic framework, rather than making recommendations that will likely never be achieved. The plan states that "new development and a new image for East Saint Louis will not happen overnight. Plans must move forward in a realistic context, taking into account national and regional economic growth. Unemployment and underemployment are issues that will need to be addressed as the city

seeks to attract new middle class residents who will help it reach its development goals” (City of East Saint Louis Comprehensive Plan 2004, 8). So while crime is glossed over, the majority of the plan does acknowledge most of the issues that East Saint Louis is facing and it tries to offer recommendations that its creators believe are attainable, given the data trends that the plan is based upon (City of East Saint Louis Comprehensive Plan 2004).

The data furnished by the East Saint Louis Chamber of Commerce creates an accurate portrayal of the city. The short, but accurate, business history of the City does not skim over the major issues that the economic base of the community has faced. It describes the losses the city has incurred, and describes in simple terms how East Saint Louis is attempting to make an economic comeback. (East Saint Louis Chamber of Commerce data 2005).

#### **D. Compton, California**

##### ***City Website***

The Compton website home page begins with a welcome note that certainly works as a marketing piece. The welcome page describes Compton as being located strategically in the middle of Los Angeles County and being located on the Alameda Corridor, which carries 25% of all U.S. international trade on water. It sells Compton as an ideal place to live and work, and it describes Compton as an emergent industrial center of Los Angeles for various industries, including transportation/distribution, business service, high-tech, metals, financial service, and textiles (Compton City website 2005).

The 'About Compton' link provides data and efforts to sell Compton as a good place to live for potential residents. This link provides information on why someone would want to move to Compton, including quality city services and various amenities, such as parks and its proximity to the majority of the Los Angeles metropolitan area (especially with a major bus link, the Martin Luther King Transit Center). Attractions, like the Crystal Park Casino Hotel, the Aeronautical Museum, historical sites, and other smaller museums are described. There is even a section that notes some famous people that have called Compton home. One key piece of information missing is financial incentives for potential residents. Most of the programs that provide financial aid to low and moderate income people who are looking to rent or buy a home is linked from the economic development page. That is somewhat confusing and may confuse those trying to find financial assistance for housing and moving to Compton (Compton City website 2005).

The economic development link has a wealth of information for marketing Compton to potential businesses. The city aggressively defines itself as being willing to work with businesses in order to bring them to Compton. It again stresses Compton's strategic location to key transportation outlets such as the Alameda Corridor and five freeways. It touts Compton as being ranked second (by an independent economic study) in the Los Angeles market for the best place to start and expand a business. Basic market information and a community profile are provided. Development and permit information is summarized for those wanting to develop in the city. An entire section is devoted to business financial support, such as the Business Assistance Center, which provides financial and general assistance to new businesses, and the City's Commercial Loan

Program, which provides business financing for new businesses and expanding businesses. There is a link to workforce development centers so that employers and trained employees can more easily find one another (Compton City website 2005).

### ***Marketing Literature from Organizations Responsible for City Promotion***

Compton has a chamber of commerce which currently does not have a marketing packet available to prospective businesses. The economic development department of Compton also does not have any marketing packets for potential businesses.

### ***Comprehensive or Strategic Plans***

Compton has a comprehensive plan, called the General Plan: Vision 2010, which was developed in 1991. It is becoming outdated and the city planning department is currently working to update the plan. But the General Plan framework is still being used currently by the city.

The stated mission of the General Plan is “to revitalize Compton and create a safe, attractive, desirable community for residents and business...[and] to provide a wide range of business opportunities, and establish a strong commercial and industrial base” (Compton Comprehensive Plan 1991, 1). The General Plan is really a very basic comprehensive plan that includes a land use section, housing section, circulation section, open space and recreation section, public safety and noise sections, a public facilities section, an urban design section, and an economic development section. It does not really have any overarching strategic vision for the city, but it does provide goals and

policy recommendations for each of the plan's sections, such as economic development policy recommendations (Compton Comprehensive Plan 1991).

Each of the sections is important in its own way: land use recommendations attempt to tie city services/infrastructure to planned land uses, housing recommendations attempt to create housing for all income levels, urban design recommendations attempts to improve the city's aesthetic image, etc. Of course, the section that has the majority of potential strategies for revitalizing Compton is the economic development section. The plan states the goals of attracting businesses and high-income residents. The plan also stresses the importance of Compton's strategic location not only in the Los Angeles region, but also within various transportation corridors. The primary strategies the plan recommends to reach these goals include:

- Targeting specific industry groups for location in Compton, especially distribution and warehousing industry businesses
- Annexing adjacent properties that are currently unincorporated and that have potential to create new revenue for the city
- Redeveloping some land to attract light-industrial businesses
- Auditing the sales taxes to ensure the city is getting the necessary amount from taxable sales
- Evaluating the effectiveness of job training programs for the labor force
- Requiring that training contracts be only with firms that are located and operating in the city (Compton Comprehensive Plan 1991)

The plan states that the city wants to attract business and various segments of population, particularly higher income residents. So how does the plan propose ways to attract businesses and residents? From a land use standpoint, the plan notes that Compton is built-out with no vacant land large enough to allow for new residential development. New housing stock would have to be provided from redevelopment, changing lower density areas to allow for higher densities, and some infill development. So the primary housing goal in the plan is actually to revitalize distressed areas of the city that have dilapidated housing stocks. The city's goal of upgrading the existing housing stock is meant primarily to maintain the single-family homes in the city. This is Compton's way of increasing residents of middle to higher income levels. Home price levels are notoriously higher in many other Los Angeles jurisdictions, and by upgrading homes, the city hopes to attract more private investment and higher income residents. By having several housing initiatives run by the city to remove blight and upgrade dilapidated housing, the city also hopes to increase public safety, another obvious benefit in attracting new residents. The housing programs described in the plan are clearly geared towards meeting the needs of lower-income levels; the city has no specific mechanisms or marketing efforts to attract higher income residents other than the upgrading of its housing stock and hoping that private investment follows (Compton Comprehensive Plan 1991).

The plan notes the general economic decline in Compton and looks for opportunities for growth and attracting businesses. Unemployment is well above the county average. The city government of Compton has, in the past, not been able to provide the necessary public services needed to attract businesses that so often locate



based on the quality of the local public infrastructure. The lack of revenue sources to upgrade infrastructure has been a major inhibitor to attracting businesses. Another major issue is the fact that although there is currently a decent manufacturing base in the city, there really is no coordination between employers, the city, and the labor force to match the labor with the jobs and to properly train the workforce. And no city-wide economic plan is in place; the plan notes the need for “a city economic strategy that will attract new employers to the City” (Compton General Plan – Economic Development Element 1991, 5). The economic development portion of the plan attempts to craft some ideas of what should be the basis of the economic development strategic plan (Compton Comprehensive Plan 1991).

The plan recommends that the strategic location of Compton and its proximity to various modes of transportation make it a desirable area for industrial manufacturing, warehousing and distribution businesses. These are particularly the types of businesses Compton would like to attract in order to boost the revenue base. The plan recommends expansion of commercial and industrial land use in the city to increase employment and tax revenues. Since Compton is generally built-out, a land inventory would have to be undertaken to find possible sites that can be changed to commercial/industrial uses.

Another possibility is annexing land that is unincorporated and near the expanding I-105 highway. Also recommended is the creation of various business assistance centers that could offer financing and other assistance to smaller businesses. In particular, the plan states that the city must work with the Chamber of Commerce to create useful informational packets available to businesses on why they should choose Compton as a place move their business (Compton Comprehensive Plan 1991).

### ***Press Coverage (Indirect Communications)***

One recent incident in Compton has dominated local coverage – police beating a local African-American man with a flashlight. This was clearly an incident that caused a major controversy in the community and increased tensions between the city police and the predominantly black population. Abuses by the police and the distrust of the residents of them (notably by voting down a tax increase for increased police services) are the forefront of the media attention in Compton. Besides general metropolitan area coverage, the press articles can otherwise be broken into two general categories: articles about city issues and crime, and articles about a significant revitalization occurring in the city. Crime is still significant in parts of the city, this is issue is still widely presented. Other non-violent crime and issues are more prevalent, such as issues at the Compton Community College, government official corruption (including a past mayor), and school district financing problems. But a large number of articles discuss positive happenings in Compton. The first Starbucks opening there is lauded as a sign that the city is turning a corner. Compton was one of the cities that, though it ranks below the median metropolitan income, saw above median home price increases in 2004. Many middle class blacks and other middle class groups are increasingly moving to more affordable areas such as Compton, helping home prices rise. Some articles include some feel-good stories, such as locals cleaning up trash and local kids putting on plays. A for-profit housing developer is redeveloping housing that would otherwise stay vacant and selling them at market values in the city. Some articles continually mention the fact the famous

Williams sisters, highly-ranked professional tennis players, are originally from the Compton area (*Los Angeles Times* archives 2004-2005).

National coverage of Compton is not plentiful. The negative incident of the police beating of the man with the flashlight made national headlines, and some crime fighting measures used in Compton (a foul-smelling gel placed in abandoned buildings to keep criminals away) were really the only articles. Many articles mention the fact the Williams sisters hail from Compton as well (*New York Times* archives 2004-2005).

### ***Discourse Analysis of Compton's Comprehensive Plan***

Compton's General Plan is a massive document, certainly not very user-friendly, and the only discussion of the state of the city occurs briefly in the executive summary. The plan attributes Compton's decline to multifarious national and regional developments. The City apparently played no part in its economic decline according the plan's introduction. But the executive summary does describe the characteristics displayed by economic disinvestment: a lack of retail stores along the major transportation corridors, blight in many neighborhoods, and poor city infrastructure. The crime issue is not mentioned, however, some parts of the plan do state that there is a citizen safety issue (e.g. for city parks). There are no specific objectives, so the recommendations of the plan do not have any goals to use as a success benchmark. Generally though, the plan does address the issues along with the recommendations so that the recommendations are based in a context of reality (Compton Comprehensive Plan 1991).

## V. CONCLUSIONS

### A. Assessment of Comparative City Marketing Efforts

Before delving into making marketing recommendations for Gary, the following summarizes the extensive information that was presented in the data analysis chapter; this table gives a general overview of the marketing efforts of the comparative cities evaluated:

**Table 5.1 Summary of Comparative City Marketing Efforts**

	<b>Camden</b>	<b>Chester</b>	<b>East Saint Louis</b>	<b>Compton</b>
<b>Primary Residential Target Market</b>	lower to middle class	middle class	lower to middle class	middle class
<b>Primary Commercial Target Market</b>	office, industrial, lakefront business	mid-size commercial, industrial, high-tech	office, riverfront business	industrial, warehousing, transportation
<b>Primary Assets Promoted</b>	lakefront, CBD	current business base, history	riverfront, CBD	affordability, location
<b>City Website?</b>	yes	yes	no	yes
<b>Chamber of Commerce?</b>	yes	county level	yes	yes
<b>Tourism Promoted?</b>	yes, for attractions on riverfront	county level, Chester hardly mentioned	yes, mostly for casino on riverfront	no
<b>Comprehensive Plan?</b>	yes	no	yes	yes, but antiquated
<b>Media Focus Analysis</b>	crime, crime-fighting efforts, some feel good stories	old district revitalization issues and new businesses	crime, CBD issues, riverfront development advances	police incidents, crime
<b>Discourse Analysis</b>	fair	n/a	fair	fair

Source: Chapter 4 Analysis

Even though these cities have very similar histories and are currently suffering through similar difficulties, they are promoting themselves in varying ways. They are generally targeting lower to middle-class residents, but ideally would like to increase the

middle class base in their cities. The type(s) of businesses each city is trying to attract depend on the existing economic base of that city: for example, Compton has a strong industrial and warehousing base, and with its accessibility to various modes of transportation, it is naturally targeting companies that need sites with good transportation access. Therefore, it is seeking further economic development by methods such as acquiring unincorporated land near the highway to entice these types of companies. East Saint Louis and Camden are seeking to revitalize their CBDs, but development efforts are not confined to the central business districts; they are also actively pursuing development opportunities along their waterfronts. Chester is seeking development in industrial parks near the highway.

The key selling points differ by city: Camden promotes its CBD and waterfront, Chester uses its history and existing business base, East Saint Louis primarily promotes its waterfront, and Compton sells itself using affordability and location. One aspect is common for all of these cities: they are selling themselves as a part of a greater metropolitan region; for example, Compton as part of Los Angeles.

The tools used to promote these cities also varies quite a bit. East Saint Louis is the only city that does not have a city website. All of the other cities' websites have information for individuals or companies that may be interested in moving to their city. All of the cities have a chamber of commerce, but Chester is the only chamber that operates on a county level. Therefore, Chester's chamber does not function to promote Chester specifically, but it is the only chamber that has glossy promotional and relocation materials available. Only the East Saint Louis Chamber of Commerce has materials available to prospective businesses; these materials are really just data and are not slick

promotional packets. There are a number of economic development organizations operating for each city, but each city has its own economic development department (however small) that will work with companies interested in moving to their city.

Tourism is not highly promoted by these cities; East Saint Louis and Camden are really the only cities trying to attract tourists. East Saint Louis has a casino and some waterfront attractions; Camden has some waterfront attractions, such as an Aquarium, and a promotional campaign with Philadelphia to attract visitors to their common waterfront.

All of the cities but Chester have comprehensive plans in place to help promote the city. Compton's comprehensive plan is quite outdated though, and that city is currently creating a new plan. Camden's plan is thorough and has specific objectives (population, workers) that the city would like to meet. The plan gives recommendations on how to reach those objectives. East Saint Louis also has a nice, recently-created plan, though it does not define specific objectives for the city. All of the comprehensive plans fairly depict the condition of the city and do not try to paint an overly glossy portrait of the city, though the crime issues in some of these cities are probably not discussed to understand the severity of this issue. None of these cities has a strategic plan in place.

The newspaper coverage of these cities is generally fair, and does not seem to dwell on negative issues, though many of the stories focus on crime and crime prevention measures. Crime is a major issue and therefore it sees significant coverage. Also, as with any news coverage, negative stories tend to linger and dominate coverage, such as a police beating case in Compton. But overall, the media coverage is fairly balanced and has many articles focusing on some of the positive attributes of these cities.

## **B. Recommended Marketing Strategies for Gary**

The current marketing efforts of Gary were described in the first section. Keeping the current marketing efforts in mind, some recommendations to improve the marketing messages and image promotion for the City of Gary are described in this section. These recommendations were made using the data analysis of the comparative cities, as well as analyzing Gary's strengths and weaknesses to produce viable strategies to promote the city for increased investment. Not all of these recommendations would be completely considered "marketing" strategies, but they have some elements on how to improve the city's image. There is sometimes a fine line between planning and economic development efforts and purely marketing efforts. Most of these recommendations are interconnected and build from previous recommendations; although some are not purely marketing recommendations, they do incorporate marketing and image promotion on some level.

### ***Recommendation #1: Coordinate more efforts in partnership with the City of Chicago***

While Gary appears to be attempting to coordinate some projects with Chicago, it is vital that Gary continues to work to associate itself with the greater Chicago metro area. All of the comparative cities are strongly stressing the fact that they are part of a major, thriving metropolitan area; Camden and Chester as part of Philadelphia, East Saint Louis as part of Saint Louis, and Compton as part of Los Angeles. The depressed parts of a metropolitan area are easy to dismiss, and a perception may develop that these areas are not really part of these thriving metropolitan areas given the fact that they are not sharing in the economic prosperity that much of the regions enjoy. It is important to

make sure that these cities not only promote themselves as being a part of the metropolitan region, but that they reinforce this perception by coordinating various efforts with the primary metropolitan city.

Gary and Chicago have worked together primarily on transportation initiatives – most significantly, the Gary-Chicago International Airport, which has become Chicago’s unofficial third regional airport. This airport has been a huge boost for Gary, but it still has yet to reach the economic potential it possesses. Winning the regional airport, rather than it going to a rural Illinois County, is a giant step towards a strong association of Gary with the Chicago region. But there are still many other possibilities for working with Chicago in a more symbiotic fashion.

Camden and Philadelphia have worked together on a combined waterfront marketing effort called ‘Two Cities – One Waterfront.’ This marketing effort is trying to make sure that both sides of the river are receiving tourists and that the overall tourist number increases as a result. An example of these cities working together is the creation of a shuttle boat service allowing visitors to easily get to attractions on both sides of the river very easily. Gary should work with Chicago to set-up a similar service from Chicago’s waterfront, such as from a heavy tourist area such as Navy Pier. A ferry service could connect to Gary’s waterfront attractions, most notably the casino entertainment areas or the attractive dune park areas. This could begin as a simple, fairly low-cost service, but as Gary continues to develop various parts of its waterfront, this service could be expanded as necessary.

Otherwise, Gary needs to continue to have its voice heard in metropolitan matters, and it needs to associate itself with Chicago with every chance it is given. Being just



across the state border is a huge impediment to being considered part of Chicago; Gary needs to overcome this so that it is thought of, perhaps, as a large suburb of Chicago, mostly to attract businesses that are considering moving or relocating in the Chicago area but perhaps are not even considering Gary.

***Recommendation #2: Coordinate EDOs to create one unified marketing message.***

Many of the economic development organizations working to make a stronger Gary are working with each other at some level, but there is no central organization or entity that ties these groups together. Having a centralized entity charged with organizing economic development efforts would help improve efficiency, reduce any redundant efforts, and facilitate producing a single vision for what the City wants to create for the future.

There is currently a mixture of these economic development organizations working at different levels in Gary: some are public, some are private, some are city-level entities, some are county-level entities, and some are nonprofits. Some of these include the City of Gary's Economic Development and Planning Department, the Gary Chamber of Commerce, the Lake County Convention and Visitor's Bureau, the Gary-Chicago Airport Authority, the Northwest Indiana Regional Planning Commission (the local MPO), the Gary Urban Enterprise Association, the Gary New Century Company, etc. While the responsibilities of these organizations often differ, many of them are working on similar projects or areas of the city, and it would behoove economic development efforts to create a single entity that coordinated these varied efforts to maximize

efficiency and produce a coordinated vision. This is an entity that the comparative cities certainly lacked and the varied marketing messages conveyed by their EDOs were apparent.

A board should be formed with one representative of each of these organizations, headed by the mayor or an appropriate representative from Gary. The new comprehensive plan that will soon be created for Gary will provide a vital framework for future development efforts and the City of Gary should help steer the efforts of these organizations to be in line with the goals of the comprehensive plan. So not only would efforts be better organized, but they would be coordinated with the City of Gary's vision for the future. Another positive attribute of having this new board would be streamlining marketing and promotional messages by these organizations. Promotional communication can be unified to sell Gary using a common voice. One universal marketing campaign could be embraced and disseminated using these many organizations.

***Recommendation #3: Embrace steel-city image.***

Many of the comparative cities were attempting to leave their industrial and manufacturing images behind towards a brighter, cleaner image. The comparative cities continue to rely on industrial companies and are not shying away from continuing to attract them, but they have strategies in place to move beyond this image which defined their cities for decades.

Gary is not really in a position to move beyond its image as a manufacturing and steel city – U.S. Steel still dominates the lakefront of Gary and it is difficult to separate

the steel mill from the City of Gary. It is still such an integral and dominant part of the City that it impossible to disassociate it; therefore, the only option is to embrace and use the steel plant as a positive attribute.

Cities know their economic strengths, and they use these to build their economic bases. The comparative cities are all targeting companies that they already have some strength in – Camden is targeting office and industrial (near the waterfront), Chester is targeting industrial and technical companies with its industrial complexes near the highway, East Saint Louis is targeting industrial companies, and Compton is targeting industrial and warehousing/transportation companies. Gary's strength has been manufacturing, steel in particular, and it needs to continue ensure its economic base has some of these companies. Gary is what it is and it can most easily attract manufacturing companies, especially with the large available tracts of land near the Gary-Chicago Airport.

But Gary also needs to attempt to diversify its economy. One of the main reasons it is where it is economically is that the economy never diversified beyond steel and manufacturing; as steel-making became more efficient, the need for labor decreased dramatically. There were no other industries in the City to absorb the lost labor. So while Gary should focus on its manufacturing base, it needs to continue to diversify its economy, a point that will be expounded upon in some of the upcoming recommendations.

The image of Gary with its steel mills will persist; this is inevitable, especially when one of the largest steel mills is in production near the heart of the city. Gary can't shy away from this fact, but needs to create other economic directives to take some of the

dominance of the City as a steel center. Steel is inherently thought of as a dirty industry, and that is certainly true; the smell of sulphur is strong throughout Gary. So one way to detract from this not-so-endearing image of the steel industry is to continue to clean-up and improve the general aesthetics of the City, leading into the next recommendation.

***Recommendation #4: Make crime reduction and community development a top priority.***

Gary has perennially been at or near the top of the infamous most dangerous city rankings. It has developed a horrible reputation as a crime-ridden and dirty city. This image has made the city into a national joke, and the only way to reverse this is to begin a strong anti-crime plan in conjunction with some well-designed community development plans to strengthen the City's neighborhoods and housing stock. The perception of high-crime and blight are a reality that needs to be minimized in order to attract new investment. Gary has already made strong efforts to combat crime to some effect, but this effort needs to continue.

Camden has used a large amount of federal money to fight crime, but it still has achieved the dubious honor of being recently named America's most dangerous city. East Saint Louis and Compton also have being notorious crime spots. Crime is a difficult issue that is not really in the hands of planners, but Gary needs to continue the trend of lowering its still very high violent crime rate.

Of equal importance is continuing to clean-up neighborhoods and promote strong community development. Currently, the only neighborhoods that are gaining some investment are all located on the northeast portion of the City, such as the Miller Beach

neighborhood. The rest of Gary has seen little housing development in recent years. Dilapidated houses, vacant lots, and general blight litter the City's housing stock. Gary has done a commendable job in trying to board up vacant houses and obtaining properties that are delinquent. But there still is no market to rehab these homes and resell them at market rates. Therefore, the City's housing stock continues to dwindle without any investment or maintenance. Finally, the lack of new commercial or office developments in the downtown area has further diminished the demand for updated or new housing stock in that area.

Gary should attempt to disseminate positive economic efforts towards the other parts of the City. The popularity of the eastside neighborhoods should slowly be expanded westward, with some community development plans in place. Other parts of the waterfront would naturally be ideal places to create attractive new housing stock that can help to spark investment towards other parts of the city. Gary has already identified the waterfront as the ideal place to begin neighborhood revitalization, especially in the Buffington Harbor area and on the northeast portion of the City. The new comprehensive plan should detail the efforts of how to increase and improve the housing stock from these areas. One possibility is to mandate a housing unit requirement along with any new major waterfront developments. There is not enough mixed-use development in these areas and requiring some housing in these areas could help create the impetus needed to increase the City's housing stock.

***Recommendation #5: Improve waterfront development.***

As just mentioned, the waterfront should be a catalyst to improving Gary's neighborhoods and housing stock. But the waterfront can be so much more from an economic development standpoint. The waterfront has seen some good investment recently, especially at Buffington Harbor, which is home to the casinos. There are also some very nice public parks (on the east side of the City), and there have been a few other developments near the casinos. But the waterfront's potential has not nearly been reached, and it serves a key competitive advantage to the Gary suburbs; it needs to be fully utilized to attract investment away from the suburbs, such as Merrillville, and into Gary.

The casinos cannot be construed as a success story without other positive development spinning from them. They have contributed mightily to the tax base but more development needs to occur to make the waterfront a long-term success that can help revitalize the City. Gary has noted on its website that it has plans to move the waterfront from its industrial past towards a entertainment and neighborhood focus, but concrete plans need to be made to achieve this.

Camden and East Saint Louis are both vigorously promoting their waterfront. Camden is doing a good job of working with Philadelphia to promote a unified waterfront entertainment area; East Saint Louis has not done as well working with Saint Louis to promote a unified waterfront marketing scheme. As mentioned, Gary should work with Chicago to provide some shuttle service between these City's entertainment areas. Currently, Gary really just has the casinos, but these can serve as a starting point.

Gary's comprehensive plan needs to have a very detailed section for how to best develop the waterfront. It is a vital asset of the City that has been underserved for too long. The comprehensive plan should provide the necessary zoning so that the waterfront is ready to accommodate the desired development. And Gary currently does not have a Port Authority to help coordinate waterfront development efforts. The city may be too small to merit forming one, but an entity needs to be formed to spearhead the waterfront development efforts (or perhaps a State entity dealing with similar issues for all Indiana waterfront cities). This seems to be a languished effort within the City; it needs to be a focused effort that has a clear vision and someone or some group to lead efforts towards that vision. Some public money may need to go into spurring some development, and this will certainly be a long-term effort, but is a vital component of making Gary a more attractive place.

***Recommendation #6: Utilize the competitive advantage of the Gary-Chicago Airport.***

Other than the waterfront, Gary has another very important competitive advantage: it is home to the Gary-Chicago International Airport, or Chicago's third airport. The entire region has a very strong transportation and warehousing industry, and Gary certainly shares a part of this: it has the airport and several interstate highways and major railways running through it. The airport can help Gary build upon and attract more warehousing and transportation companies that are looking for relatively affordable land. There are huge parcels of land sitting idle around the Gary-Chicago Airport, and it doesn't appear the City has any sort of marketing effort to attract companies to this available land. Most of the parcels have all needed infrastructure in place. But some

certain companies and industries may require customizable building space that can be leased from the City; Gary may need to investigate what types of companies it can attract to the Airport area, determine the site requirements of these firms, and then pour some money into developing these sites to attract these companies. A market analysis should be done to assess the market potential of this area.

Also, Gary needs to market this area better. Currently, the Gary Chamber of Commerce has some of these available sites posted on their website, but only firms actively seeking Gary would notice these sites. Gary needs to be more proactive in attracting firms to this regional asset. One possibility is following the footsteps of the City of Rockford, IL (described in the Literature Review section), which made a real estate office in the Chicago area to sell firms looking to locate or relocate in the Chicago area on the benefits of moving to Rockford. One of the key selling points for Rockford was the affordability of real estate, an attribute Gary possesses.

***Recommendation #7: Market affordable commercial/industrial real estate.***

The Chicago market is desirable, but real estate prices are extremely high in Cook County and the northern and western Chicago suburbs. Gary has the benefit of having comparatively much cheaper land prices. This fact can definitely help to attract commercial and industrial firms looking to locate based on price.

This could also be a piece of the suggested market analysis. What types of industry Gary can attract would likely require low-costs and low-skill workers. As the warehousing and transportation industries were obvious possibilities for the Gary area, especially around the airport, Gary may be able to steal some back-office or



manufacturing companies away from the Chicago area if the City more proactively pursued these companies. The market analysis would give more insight into these companies, and a real estate office in Chicago, designed to promote Gary's affordability in the region, could at least be done for a year to determine if it could be a successfully way to attract businesses.

***Recommendation #8: Use new comprehensive plan as way of increasing development and investment.***

Probably the most important document which could be used to market Gary is the upcoming comprehensive plan. The last plan was finished in 1985, and twenty years later, Gary is producing a new blueprint for its future. And this document needs to be every bit of a marketing plan as well; its fine to guide development and modify zoning, but the comprehensive plan needs to incorporate strategies to provide the framework for future decision-making. The comprehensive plan also needs to contain very specific and ultimately attainable goals. There should be timelines so that Gary can determine if it is on track to meet these goals or not.

Camden is the only comparative city that stated its goals of total residents and workers in the City by a certain time. Bases on those goals, Camden's plans laid out directives on how it planned to reach those goals. Gary should follow Camden's plan and define what types of goals it would like to achieve, and it should also offer timelines for meeting these objectives. These objectives should be in line with reasonable expectations and should come from the recommendations laid out in the plan. The plan needs to be an actionable and living, working document; not a plan that sits on the shelf like the current version that was created in 1985. This plan should guide all development and planning

decisions and it should be used by all of the EDOs in crafting their strategies. The plan should help coordinate and unify promotional and development efforts in Gary; it needs to be a guide that is used by all of the organizations concerned with promoting investment in the City of Gary.

### **C. Future Considerations and Recommendations**

As the Gary website stresses, changing the City will have to be a long-term endeavor. But long-term doesn't mean simply waiting for things to happen and saying that they eventually will; Gary needs to take control of its own future and assume a strong, proactive role in doing so. Many of the proposed recommendations require some changes in how things are handled; Gary needs to shake things up a bit as the status quo has not proven to be effective. Gary needs to establish a unified vision and ways to reach that vision in its comprehensive plan. All of the major organizations in the City need to be on board with the plan and work together to promote Gary in a unified fashion.

The problems of city disinvestment and crime are significant ones, with no simple solutions or answers. The economy shifts rapidly and many cities are left in the wake of prosperity. But how those cities react will define how they prosper in the long-run. Many cities have battled back from negative images to become strong, vital cities. But in the case of Gary and the comparative cities, is this possible? Can these city's actions reverse the images of these cities? Or is other catalytic events needed to help them get back on a positive track? There is no answer for sure, nor is there an definite answer for if these cities can possibly change their image. How cities get back to economic recovery

and reclaim a positive image depends very much on the attributes of that city; cities need to emphasize their strengths and determine how to minimize their problems. It's much easier said than done, but one thing is for sure; these problems can only be fixed by strong government initiatives, teamwork between public and private organizations, and a supportive citizen base.

## REFERENCES

- Aguilar, Louis. 2003. "Denver Mayor Sees City's Economic Future in Nurturing Creativity." *Knight-Ridder Tribune Business News*. 2 November.
- Armstrong, Stephen. 1998. "This Little City Went to Market..." *The Guardian*. 19 January.
- Asplund, Christer, Haider, Donald H., Kotler, Philip, and Rein, Irving. *Marketing Places Europe*. Edinburgh Gate: Pearson Education Limited.
- Author. 2004. Driving tour of Gary, Indiana.
- Blanke, Bernhard and Smith, Randall, editors. 1999. *Cities in Transition: New Challenges, New Responsibilities*. New York: St. Martin's Press, Inc.
- Burgess, Patricia, Durack, Ruth, and Hill, Edward W. 2001. *Imaging the City: Continuing Struggles and New Directions*. Edited by Warner, Sam Bass Jr. and Vale, Lawrence J. New Brunswick: Center for Urban Policy Research.
- Bureau of Labor Statistics. Internet: <http://www.bls.gov>. Accessed November 2004.
- City of Camden website. Internet; <http://www.ci.camden.nj.us>. Accessed March 2004.
- City of Chester website. Internet; <http://www.chestercity.com>. Accessed March 2004.
- City of Compton website. Internet; <http://www.comptoncity.org>. Accessed March 2004.
- City of Gary website. Internet; <http://www.gary.in.us/home.asp>. Accessed October 2004.
- Cho, Eileen. 2001. "These Cheerleaders Say, 'It's Better Here.'" *The New York Times*. 3 June.
- Clarke, Jackie and Godfrey, Kerry. 2000. *The Tourism Development Handbook*. London: Continuum Publishing.
- Colorado State University writing guide website. Internet; <http://writing.colostate.edu/references/research/content/index.cfm>. Accessed November 2004.
- Compton Comprehensive Plan. 1991. "General Plan: Vision 2010." Provided by the City of Compton.

Delaware County Chamber of Commerce Relocation Brochure. 2004. "Life in Delaware County." Provided by the Delaware Chamber of Commerce.

Delaware County Chamber of Commerce Tourism Brochure. 2005. "Brandywine Country: Your Official Guide to Delaware County and the Brandywine Valley." Provided by the Delaware Chamber of Commerce.

Donze, Frank. 2003. "Nagin Plans to Pump Up New Orleans Pride; Marketing Campaign to Focus on Progress." *Times-Picayune*. 4 June.

Du Cros, Hilary and McKercher, Bob. 2002. *Cultural Tourism – The Partnership between Tourism and Cultural Heritage Management*. New York: Haxworth Hospitality Press.

Dwyer, Kelly Pate. 2003. "A Brand That Sizzles: Mayor Plans to Round-Up Area Leaders to Define Denver and Its Marketing Strategy." *Denver Post*. 29 September.

East Saint Louis Master Plan. 2004. "City of East Saint Louis Comprehensive Plan." Provided by the City of East Saint Louis.

East Saint Louis Chamber of Commerce Data Overview. 2005. No title. Provided by the East Saint Louis Chamber of Commerce.

East Saint Louis Chamber of Commerce Business and Industrial History. 2005. "East Saint Louis Business & Industrial History." Provided by the East Saint Louis Chamber of Commerce.

Fainstein, Susan S. and Judd, Dennis R., editors. 1999. *The Tourist City*. New Haven: Yale University Press.

Florida, Richard. 2002. *The Rise of the Creative Class*. New York: Basic Books Publishing.

FutureCamden Summary Report. 2002. Available from the Camden City website; [http://ci.camden.nj.us/economic/masterplan\\_main.html](http://ci.camden.nj.us/economic/masterplan_main.html). Accessed April 2005.

Gary Chamber of Commerce website. Internet; <http://www.garychamber.com>. Accessed November 2004.

Gary-Chicago International Airport website. Internet; <http://www.garychicagoairport.com>. Accessed April 2005.

Gittler, Juliana and Seely, Hart. 2001. "For Utica Refugees, It Is the Best of Times." *Syracuse Post-Standard*. 9 December.

Glasgow City Plan. 2001. Internet; Available from Glasgow City Website <http://www.glasgow.gov.uk/en/Business/City+Plan/>. Accessed May 2004.

Gruszecki, Debra. 2004. "Chicago Aviation Commissioner to Region: This Is Chicago's Third Airport." *Hammond Times*. 16 April.

Haider, Donald. H., Kotler, Philip, and Rein, Irving. 1993. *Marketing Places: Attracting Investment, Industry, and Tourism to Cities, States, and Nations*. New York: The Free Press.

Hall, Tim and Hubbard, Phil, eds. 1998. *The Entrepreneurial City: Geographies of Politics, Regime and Representation*. Hoboken: John Wiley and Sons Publishing.

Harvey, David. 2001. *Spaces of Capital: Towards a Critical Geography*. Oxford: Routledge.

Healey, Patsy. 1996. *Explorations in Planning Theory*. Edited by Burchell, Robert W., Mendelbaum, Seymour J., and Mazza, Luigi. New Brunswick: Center for Urban Policy Research.

Holcombe, Brian. 2001. *Imaging the City: Continuing Struggles and New Directions*. Edited by Warner, Sam Bass Jr. and Vale, Lawrence J. New Brunswick: Center for Urban Policy Research.

Holcomb, Brian. 1999. *The Tourist City*. Edited by Fainstein, Susan S. and Judd, Dennis R. New Haven: Yale University Press.

Indiana Digital Library. Internet; <http://www.dlib.indiana.edu/collections/steel/>. Accessed November 2004.

Inskip, Edward. 1991. *Tourism Planning: An Integrated and Sustainable Development Approach*. New York: Van Nostrand Reinhold Publishing.

Lake County Convention and Visitor's Bureau website. Internet; <http://www.alllake.org>. Accessed April 2005.

Los Angeles Times archives. 2004, 2005. Internet; <http://pqasb.pqarchiver.com/latimes/advancedsearch.html>. Accessed March 2005.

Lubove, Roy. 1996. *Twentieth-Century Pittsburgh: The Post-Steel Era (Volume II)*. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press.

Kaplan, David. 2004. "An Edgy Identity: Ad Campaign Promoting City in No-Spin Style." *Houston Chronicle*. 5 August.

- Krontoft, Margrethe and Testa, William. 2001. Chicago's Global Connections and Challenges. *Chicago Fed Letter* 166A: 1-3.
- Mandelbaum, Seymour. 1990. Reading Plans. *Journal of the American Planning Association* 56, no. 3: 350-356.
- Mapquest website. 2005. Internet; <http://www.mapquest.com>. Accessed May 2005.
- Mileham, Anastasia. 2005. Interview by Author. Cincinnati, 13 May.
- Morgan Quitno website. 2005. Rankings of Safest and Most Dangerous Cities. Internet; <http://www.morganquitno.com/cit05pop.htm#METRO>. Accessed May 2005.
- Nakamura, David. 2003. "Selling a Hipper Image; Marketing Campaign Seeks to Attract Upscale Residents." *The Washington Post*. 19 June.
- National Park Service: Links to the Past website. Internet; <http://www.cr.nps.gov/nr/twhp/wwwlps/lessons/21boott/21boott.htm>. Accessed March 2005.
- No author. 2003. Repairing a City's Image: Media Matters, But Don't Short Shrift the Community. *PR News* 59, no. 24: 1.
- Northwest Indiana Planning Commission. Internet; <http://www.census.gov>. Accessed November 2004.
- Office of the City Controller, City of Philadelphia. 1999. *Philadelphia: A New Urban Direction*. Philadelphia: St. Joseph's Press.
- Philadelphia Inquirer* archives. 2004, 2005. Internet; <http://www.philly.com/mld/philly/archives/>. Accessed March 2005.
- Romero, Simon. 2004. "Selling Houston, Warts and All, Especially Warts." *The New York Times*. 19 August.
- Rothenberg, Randall. 2004. Berlin Offers Sobering Lesson for 'Brand America' Ambition. *Advertising Age* 75, no. 19: 24.
- Scmitt, Erin. 2001. "To Fill in Gaps, Shrinking Cities Seek a New Wave of Foreigners." *The New York Times*. 30 May.
- Scott, Jennifer Y. 2003. Launching a New Brand Identity for Richmond, VA. *Public Relations Tactics* 10, no. 4: 18.

Sheffield, Michael. 2003. Marketing Campaigns Mold City's Image Here, Abroad. *Memphis Business Journal* 25, no. 7: 26.

Short, John Rennie and Kim, Yeong-Hyun. 1998. *The Entrepreneurial City: Geographies of Politics, Regime and Representation*. Edited by Hall, Tim and Hubbard, Phil. Hoboken: John Wiley and Sons Publishing.

*St. Louis Dispatch* archives. 2004, 2005. Internet; <http://www.stltoday.com/help/archives>. Accessed March 2005.

Teledynamics Inc. 1999. "Gary Indiana: A Brief History: 1905 - 1996." Available from the Internet; <http://www.teledynamics.com>. Accessed November 2004.

Trewyn, Phill. 2002. Selling the Virtues of Milwaukee. *The Business Journal* 19, 42: 4.

U.S. Census Bureau 2000. Gary City 2000. Internet; <http://www.census.gov>. Accessed November 2004.

Ward, Stephen. 1998. *The Entrepreneurial City: Geographies of Politics, Regime and Representation*. Edited by Hall, Tim and Hubbard, Phil. Hoboken: John Wiley and Sons Publishing.

Warner, Sam Bass Jr. and Vale, Lawrence J., eds. 2001. *Imaging the City: Continuing Struggles and New Directions*. New Brunswick: Center for Urban Policy Research.