A Dissertation

entitled

Awakening the Essence of Creative Teaching from the Perspectives of Counselor Educators

by

Carla Marie McGhee

Submitted to the Graduate Faculty as partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Doctor of Philosophy Degree in Counselor Education

_____
Dr. Laux, Committee Chair

_____
Dr. Baltrinic, Committee Member

_____
Dr. Harmening, Committee Member

_____
Dr. Liu, Committee Member

_____
Dr. Amanda Bryant-Friedrich, Dean
College of Graduate Studies

The University of Toledo
August 2017

An Abstract of

Awakening the Essence of Creative Teaching from the Perspectives of Counselor Educators

by

Carla Marie McGhee

Submitted to the Graduate Faculty as partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Doctor of Philosophy Degree in
Counselor Education

The University of Toledo

August 2017

Attention to instruction training methods are essential for counselor educators, however, more research is needed in this area (Marlott, Hill, Sheeley-Moore, Krell & Cardaciotto, 2014). Creative teaching strategies have been discussed in conceptual articles (Hayes, 2008; Henderson & Malone, 2012) however, creative teaching it is not currently acknowledged as a formal teaching framework in counselor education, even though a comprehensive definition for creative pedagogy (Lin, 2011) exists. Additionally, limited empirical research is available exploring the creative abilities of instructors, which is a central aspect of creative pedagogy (Lin, 2011).

To address this gap in the literature, the researcher conducted a qualitative phenomenological study investigating counselor educator's perceptions of creative teaching, and how they are creative as instructors. The researcher recruited seven counselor educators from CACREP masters and/or doctoral counseling programs, who were familiar with creative teaching methods, and who subscribe to a creative teaching approach. She conducted in-depth interviews that were rooted in phenomenological

inquiry, and applied Moustakas' (1994) adapted version of the transcendental data analysis method. The research question that guided the study was: *what are counselor educators' self-reported experiences of creative teaching in the classroom?*

First, and foremost, this research is dedicated to the creative counselor educators who participated in this study, whose wisdom I will forever be inspired by in my own creative teaching endeavors. Second, this is for every creative educator out there, especially those who are unaware of the extent to which they are creative. That includes you, John Laux, as I recall the theatrical script you brought to research seminar class, 'letters to grandmother' about our research, and of course, your psychological testing comparison of the painting, 'Sunday Afternoon on the Island of La Grande-Jatte.' Last, for those who may still be hesitant to shake things up in the classroom, as Agatha Christie once wrote: "may you experience second hand the delights and dangers of adventure" (in creative teaching).

Acknowledgements

The completion of this dissertation marks the close of yet another chapter in my life. While pursuing a doctorate has been a challenge, the experience and knowledge I have gained is invaluable. I am grateful, and I have many to thank.

John Laux, thank you for your support, and constant encouragement. You had a way of reminding me that I do not have to conform; that I can bring who I am into the field (i.e. when you called my dissertation idea in research class, "punk rock"). Eric Baltrinic, I am forever grateful to you for your support, transparency, and encouragement. While you were working with me from a distance, I felt like you were by my side every step of the way in the grit of this research. I also found inspiration and relief in our conversations about research, creativity, and life. Yanhong Liu, I am grateful and thankful for your mentorship, support and encouragement. Debra Harmening thank you for taking this study on, and supporting me. Maddie Clarke, thank you for the work you put in as external auditor, and for your support.

Finally, thank you to my family, my husband James, and friends for their love and support in my academic pursuits. I am grateful to my parents for instilling in me a strong work ethic, and my father for his wisdom, and stories. Special thanks to my colleagues at Zepf, who have rooted for me, especially Marty Nowak, the legendary 'Zepf dissertation support guy.' Finally, thank you to my dear friend and peer, Tahani Dari: we traveled together, cried together, laughed together, we did it!

Table of Contents

List of Tables

List of Abbreviations

AATA.....American Art Therapy Association

ACA .....American Counseling Association
ACC.....Association for Creativity in Counseling

ADTA.....American Dance Therapy Association
CACREP .....Council for Accreditation for Counseling and Related Educational Programs
CCE.....Creativity, Culture, & Education Association

NACCE .....National Alliance for Creativity, Culture & Education
NEA.....National Endowment for the Arts

Chapter 1

Introduction to the Problem

Laughlin (2000) asserts that "creativity is not something that one either does, or does not have, but something to which we learn to awaken ourselves" (Laughlin, 2000 p. 58). Thus, as authors have suggested, creative teaching initiates a path to enhance creativity in students (Heckner & Kottler, ;Laughlin, 2000). In this chapter, the researcher illustrates the deficits that exist in the literature in creative teaching. She presents how she addressed this gap by introducing her research study, and subsequent data analysis procedures.

Before proceeding, it is important to take note of the use of the term, *pedagogy*. While it has been brought to light that the term, *pedagogy*, more appropriately describes child led teaching (Knowles, 1973), the term continues to be used to describe theoretical approaches to teaching in higher education. Consequently, for the purposes of this study, the term pedagogy will continue to be used throughout the dissertation to avoid confusion. A detailed explanation is presented in chapter two.

Statement of the Problem

Counselor educators agree that more research focused on teaching pedagogy is needed (Marlott, Hill, Sheeley-Moore, Krell & Cardaciotto,2014). Teaching pedagogy should also reflect the values and habits of the profession (Gurung, Chick & Haynie, 2009). The counseling profession values creativity, which is evidenced in two ways. First, the development of the Association for Creativity in Counseling (ACC) was created in 2004 to bring a diverse group of mental health professionals together who have a vested interest in the development and promotion of creative and innovative therapies, and their inclusion in counseling. Second, contributions made in the literature devoted to creativity in counseling (Duffy & Kerl-McClain, 2006; Gladding, 2016), which are discussed in detail in chapter two, present members of the professions' intent to both demonstrate the effectiveness of creative approaches used in counseling, and advocate for their continued use. Samuel Gladding (2008), a leader of the creativity in counseling movement, asserted that counselors are and must be creative to ensure effectiveness in session, as well as to advance the field. Heckner and Kottler (2002) also argue that counselors must be creative in session to be effective, and that if members of the profession want to develop creative counselors, they need to get creative as teachers and supervisors. In other words, teachers and supervisors must model the qualities they expect and desire to see in thier students.

While it is evident that the counseling profession values creativity in counseling, it is not evident that the counseling profession is placing enough emphasis on creativity training for students. This is a problem, since the literature demonstrates that creative

teaching is a path to help teachers effectively influence creativity in students (Laughlin, 2000). The Association for Counselor Education and Supervision (ACES, 2016) task force discussed the importance of developing a teaching philosophy, and called attention to the lack of research supporting theories of instruction in counselor education. Additionally, the instructors approach to the classroom can either enhance or hinder student performance (Palmer, 2007). If the profession wants to develop creative counselors, attention should be placed on creativity training, and the creative ability of the instructor (Carson & Becker, 2004; Heckner & Kottler, 2002).

Educators in higher education institutes have emphasized that creative teaching, otherwise known as creative pedagogy, is essential for enhancing creativity in students (Lin, 2011). Additionally, there is evidence that there are instructors in the counseling field who recognize the benefits of using a creative training approach with counselors in training. Studies have demonstrated, for example, that creativity training in the counseling classroom, and in counseling supervision has enhanced student creativity, and their confidence in the ability to solve problems in session (Laughlin, 2000; Lawrence, 2015). Still, the use of creativity training in counselor education is currently minimal (Lawrence, Foster, Tieso, 2015). Furthermore, educators in higher education institutes, who primarily train school educators, have defined the term *creative pedagogy* (Lin, 2011), and acknowledged it as a theoretical teaching framework. Conversely, creative teaching has not been acknowledged as a formal teaching framework in the counselor education field. Lawrence (2015) argued that when creativity is mentioned in counselor education, it is referred to as a thing, rather than an approach that counseling students

should embody in their professional identity. It appears that the same is true for counselor educators' application of creativity as instructors. This is evidenced in the fact that much of the existing literature that refers to creative teaching describes the application of techniques that instructors can incorporate into their curriculum (Giardano, Stare & Clarke, 2015; Hayes, 2008; Henderson & Malone, 2012), rather than creative teaching as a theoretical approach to instruction. Currently, there is no research investigating the creative abilities of counselor educators who subscribe to a creative teaching approach. This is a problem, since research reveals that students learn how to enhance their creativity from instructors who are also creative (Bain, 2004; Milgram & Davidovich, 2010). It would be useful for counselor educators to increase their awareness and understanding of creative teaching, and learn from other counselor educator's perceptions of how they access their creative ability. This study will address this gap in the literature by investigating counselor educators' perceptions of creative teaching and their ability to be creative in the classroom.

Background of the Problem

The term creativity itself is multifaceted (Sternberg & Lubart, 1999). Consequently, misconceptions exist in society regarding the nature of creativity, and who is and who is not creative. For example, many individuals believe that creativity is a gift that only certain individuals possess. In the past, creativity was associated with genius. Hence individuals who were not identified as a genius were not identified as creative (Albert & Runco, 1999). Today, many individuals still perceive creativity as a gift bestowed upon unique individuals with exceptional artistic ability. This has resulted in

individual perceptions that creativity is merely associated with the arts. Research has determined that this perception is false, and that not only does everyone have creative ability (Csikszentmihalyi,1996), but that creativity can be enhanced (Nickerson, 1999). Still, creativity development studies have primarily focused on children (Starko, 2014; Sternberg & Williams, 1996). Hence, creative teaching methods are popular among elementary school educators (Lin, 2011; National Alliance on Creative & Cultural Education, 1999), even though adults can also benefit from creative teaching methods. Researchers of adult learning suggest that adults benefit from a teaching approach that places an emphasis on their creative potential (Knowles, Holton, & Swanson, 2005; Kolb, 2014).

Subsequently, counselors can enhance their ability to be creative. This idea is highlighted in the counseling field, as counselors have contributed to the literature by sharing information about the benefits of enhancing counselor's creative ability. Laughlin (2000), for example adapted a training method for counselors based on the improvisational methods of jazz musicians to enhance student's ability to access their creative ability quickly, in the moment. Creativity has also been associated with the development of relational competencies, such as empathy and cultural sensitivity (Lenes, Swank, & Nash, 2015). In addition, the use of creative interventions in counseling sessions has had a profound positive impact on client progress. Benefits have included improvements in mental, physical and emotional well-being (Milner, 2006). It is also important to note, that the counseling profession has advanced due to the creative efforts

of individuals, like Carl Rogers (1961) and Albert Ellis (2001) who have contributed to the development of counseling theory (Gladding, 2008).

Although it is evident that the counseling profession values creativity, and recognizes the benefits of creativity training for counselors in training, there is limited empirical research devoted to teaching pedagogy that reflects the profession's emphasis on creativity. Teaching pedagogy is an important aspect of training in all professions (Gurung, Chick & Haynie, 2009; Shulman, 2005). In most professions, educators rely on signature pedagogies applicable to their field of study (Gurung, Chick & Haynie, 2009; Shulman, 2005). Signature pedagogies refer to the teaching approaches and methods that train students to think and act in the way that experts in the field think and act (Shulman, 2005). Since creativity is not only of value, but considered a necessity by professionals in the counseling field, it would be beneficial to examine pedagogies that reflect that; such as creative pedagogy.

Since there is minimal research devoted to creative teaching in the field of counselor education, counselor educators, who have an interest in creative teaching methods and approaches, must refer to the literature that exists in other disciplines that have examined creative teaching. Creative teaching is recognized as a formal pedagogical framework among primary school educators (Cropley, 1997; Starko, 2014). Lin (2011) has developed a comprehensive definition for the term *creative pedagogy*. Still, this definition is not currently acknowledged in all fields. In the current literature, college educators refer to the term creative teaching (Gibson, 2010), or teaching for creativity (Livingston, 2010), but most do not clearly define either term. Many authors

describe the characteristics of creative teachers, or the environmental factors necessary for creativity to occur in students, rather than providing a clear definition for creative teaching, or acknowledging the term, creative pedagogy (Cardosa de Sousa, 2010).

Researchers determined that college students benefit from classroom curriculum and teaching styles where creativity is emphasized. For example, Matson (1991) developed a creative project that enhanced student's creativity by encouraging them to take risks and accept failure. Still, authors agree that creative teaching methods are not implemented enough in higher education institutes (Livingston, 2010; Phillip, 2015). Some believe that this is the result of barriers that impede the creative potential of instructors, thus leaving them reluctant to fully engage in creative teaching endeavors (Phillip, 2015). Carson and Becker (2004), for example, highlighted that deadlines to meet tenure often leave educators feeling constrained in their ability to meet the creative desires that they may envision for their courses. Phillip (2015) also discovered that some instructors are taking a creative approach to their teaching, however, are reluctant to call what they are doing creative because of the multiple interpretations that exist about creativity, which may lead to misconceptions about what they are doing. Additionally, authors argue that instructors feel ill equipped to use creative instruction because they have not been encouraged or trained on how to be creative in the classroom (Rinkevich, 2011; Widsom, 2006).

Despite the evidence that supports creative teaching methods, there is minimal empirical research devoted to the application of creative teaching methods in higher education overall. Yet, researchers found that instructor's creative ability was positively

linked to student's perceptions of their own ability to access their creativity (Milgram & Davidovich, 2010). In the counselor education field, there is one study that emphasized creativity in both students and counselor educators. Lawrence (2015) developed a creative curriculum that counselor educators were asked to apply to an introductory counseling course. Afterward, he interviewed both counselor educators and the students in the course regarding their perspectives about the training. Lawrence's (2015) study placed an emphasis on educator's perspectives of the training itself on student development. A study that emphasizes counselor educators' perceptions of their personal creative abilities as instructors does not currently exist.

To address this gap, the researcher conducted a qualitative phenomenological study investigating counselor educators self-reported experiences of creative teaching in the classroom. A phenomenological approach is best suited for gaining knowledge about a topic that is not fully understood (Van Manen, 1990) The researcher applied the transcendental method, adapted by Moustakas (1994), which includes meticulous methods for data analysis that emphasize the descriptive experiences of participants.

The researcher's interest in the study emerged during her doctoral assistantship when she gained experience teaching college students in counseling courses. She noticed that she was intrigued by creative teaching methods, which appeared to increase student engagement. As she began to wonder about her own creative ability as an instructor, she became curious about how other counselor educators perceive and approach creativity in the classroom.

Purpose of the Study

The primary purpose of the study was to increase understanding of counselor educators self-reported perceptions of creative teaching in the classroom. The researcher accomplished this by conducting in-depth interviews with counselor educators who are familiar with creative teaching, and approach the counseling classroom in a creative way. The study also addressed the following secondary purposes: (a) increasing awareness of how counselor educators define creative teaching; (b) increasing understanding of how counselor educators perceive themselves as being creative in the classroom, (c) increasing understanding of how counselor educators experience the act of creative teaching, and (d) identifying the overall essence of the experience of creative teaching by linking the common threads that exist among participants. The researcher also addressed the secondary purposes of the study by conducting in-depth interviews with counselor educators. The researcher purposefully sampled participants, some of whom she had met through previous networking events at conferences such as the Association for Counselor Education and Supervision (ACES). Participants were counselor educators with a minimum of two-years' experience teaching in CACREP counseling track program, who were familiar with creative teaching methods, and were using a creative teaching approach in their courses. Data analysis procedures assisted her in identifying common themes among participants that represent the core of counselor educators' perceptions of the structure and process of creative teaching.

Research Questions

The researcher sought to examine the lived experiences of counselor educators who utilize their creative ability, and apply creative methods in the classroom with counselors in training. The primary research question asked; *what are counselor educators' self-reported experiences of creative teaching in the classroom?* The following secondary research questions served as the basis for the development of the structured interview questions: (a) what do counselor educators notice as they engage in creative teaching endeavors; (b) how do they experience the act of creative teaching, and (c) how do they perceive themselves as being creative in their teaching?

Significance of the Study

The study will benefit the counselor education field by increasing our awareness and understanding of creative pedagogy, as it is perceived by counselor educators. Creative teaching has been misperceived as merely the inclusion of the arts in the curriculum (Lawrence, 2015). Creative teaching is not formally acknowledged as a pedagogical framework in counselor education, even though a comprehensive definition exists for creative pedagogy (Lin, 2011). Hence, the researcher sought to begin a dialogue about creative teaching, as a starting point for acknowledging creative teaching as a pedagogical approach. Additionally, the literature reveals that the profession values creativity, as evidenced by the contributions made by authors in the literature devoted to creativity in counseling. Creative pedagogy may be useful as a signature pedagogy that reflects the professions values and habits.

Furthermore, authors have argued that educators in higher education institutes may not feel adequately prepared to engage in creative instruction, because they have not been trained or encouraged to be creative (Rinkevich, 2011; Wisdom, 2006). The researcher sought to assist in breaking this barrier in counselor education by conducting this study. As a result, counselor educators may increase their understanding of how to enhance their own creativity in the classroom, by learning from other counselor educator's descriptions of how they have applied creative teaching methods, and accessed their own creative ability.

Definition of Terms

To proceed with the study, it is important to understand the following concepts and terms: creativity, creativity in counseling and creative teaching. The definitions described here are rooted in the literature currently available.

1. *Creativity* is a term that is multifaceted, however, the following definition encompasses the common descriptions used in the literature: innovation, originality, novelty, or the ability to create something new (Florida, 2002; Gibson, 2010; Gladding, 2016; Sternberg & Lubart, 1999).
2. *Creativity in Counseling* is a signature term, used by the ACC (2016), which refers to the use of creative, diverse, and relational approaches to counseling.
3. *Pedagogy* is defined by Murphy (1996) as, "the interactions between teachers, students and the learning environment and learning tasks" (p. 35).

4. *Creative pedagogy,* defined by Lin (2011), encompasses the following elements: *creative teaching, teaching for creativity, and creative learning*. Teaching creatively refers to the imaginative ways teachers capture student interest to make learning more exciting and effective (NACCE, 1999). Teaching for creativity refers to the exercises and curriculum utilized to facilitate creative thinking in students. Creative learning refers to how students learn (Lin, 2011), which includes the conditions that must be met for creative thinking to occur, such as teaching curriculum activities (Torrance, 1987).

Organization of Chapters

In chapter one the researcher introduced the problem being addressed and provided a rationale that sheds light on the significance of the study. In chapter two, the researcher examined applicable literature in support of the problems described in chapter one, as well as highlighted areas where more research is needed. In chapter three, the researcher presented the research methods used to conduct this study. In chapter four, the researcher presented the findings uncovered during the data collection and data analysis phases of research. In chapter five, the researcher discussed the findings and expanded on their significance.

Summary

Given that research demonstrates that students learn how to be creative from instructors who are also creative, it would benefit counselor educators to increase their

understanding of creative pedagogy, as well as learn from other counselor educators who are approaching the counseling classroom in a creative way. The profession values creativity and professionals in the field have asserted that without creativity, counseling would not be effective, and the field would not advance (Gladding, 2008; Carson & Becker, 2004). There is currently limited empirical research devoted to creative teaching in counselor education, and creative pedagogy is not formally acknowledged as a theoretical teaching framework. Moreover, there have been no studies investigating the creative abilities of counselor educators who utilize their own creative ability in their teaching.

The primary purpose of the study was to increase counselor educators' awareness and understanding of counselor educator's perceptions of creative teaching in the classroom. The researcher addressed this by conducting in-depth interviews with counselor educators who are familiar with creative teaching, and intentionally use their creative ability in the counseling classroom. She used a transcendental approach for data analysis to determine the common themes identified among participants that increase our understanding of the structure and process of creative teaching, as perceived by counselor educators.

Chapter 2

Literature Review

Introduction

Per the Council for Accreditation and Related Educational Programs (CACREP, 2016), core standards for counselor education programs should place an emphasis on effective teaching methods and pedagogy. *Pedagogy* is defined by Murphy (1996) as, "the interactions between teachers, students and the learning environment and learning tasks" (p. 35). Authors have brought to light that the term, pedagogy, more appropriately describes child led teaching (Knowles, 1973). Still, the term, pedagogy, endures in the literature to describe theoretical approaches to teaching in higher education. As previously mentioned, the term, pedagogy, will continue to be used to avoid confusion. A detailed explanation is presented later in this literature review.

Teaching pedagogy is an essential element of all professions, and doctoral students are expected to develop a teaching identity, with a solid understanding of their teaching philosophy (West, Bubenzer, & Hinkle, 2013). Educators in most professions subscribe to signature pedagogies that assist them in training future practitioners about the attitudes and dispositions of their subsequent professions (Shulman, 2005). Gurung,

Chick, and Haynie (2009) described signature pedagogies as the teaching practices that reflect the habits of the heart, mind, and hands in the profession, and thus should teach future practitioners how to behave, think and move like the experts in their field. For example, biology students must learn to be skeptical and draw conclusions based on evidence. Hence, an inductive pedagogy is appropriate; where instructors first present students with problems to solve, while waiting to discuss applicable principles and theories only after they have drawn their own conclusions (Chick, et al., 2012).

Constructivist pedagogy (McAuliffe & Erickson, 2002), and culturally-relevant pedagogy (Ladson-Billings, 2009), are examples of pedagogies that have been explored in counselor education, since they reflect important elements of counseling such as the counseling relationship, and the importance of cultural sensitivity. Still, there is a need for more research that places an emphasis on teaching pedagogy that effectively addresses the needs of counselors in training (Marlott, Hill, Sheeley-Moore, Krell & Cardaciotto, 2014). Recently, attention has been given to creative teaching styles and methods in counselor education. For example, the *Journal for Creativity in Mental Health* now includes a section devoted to creativity in the classroom. While creative teaching is not necessarily new to counselor educators, it is not currently addressed in the research as a formal theoretical teaching framework. Consequently, counselor educators may not recognize the extent to which they already engage in creative pedagogy.

The demand for creativity is ever present in the counseling field (Association for Creativity in Counseling, 2016). This is partially evidenced by the American Counseling Association's (ACA) promotion of the Association of Creativity in Counseling (ACC),

discussed later in this chapter. Samuel Gladding, an advocate and lead researcher for creativity in counseling also asserted, in an interview, that all effective psychotherapy is creative in nature (Rosenthal, 2002). Additionally, professionals certified in alternative therapies such as dance/movement therapy and art therapy view creativity as an essential element of their profession and training methods (American Association of Dance Therapy, 2016; American Association for Art Therapy, 2016).

Counselor educators have successfully used creative curriculum and creative teaching strategies to enhance creativity in counselor trainees (Lawrence, 2015; Lenes, Swank & Nash, 2015). While this fact may partially demonstrate why it may be beneficial to examine creative teaching in counselor education, it is apparent that more research is needed. In this chapter, the researcher examines current literature pertaining to creativity, creative teaching, and creative teaching in counselor education. Adult learning theory is also briefly addressed. Foremost, the researcher calls attention to areas where research is needed.

Creativity

Creativity has been an intriguing subject matter to a large pool of scholars and researchers, including scientists, neuroscientists, and educators. Each discipline has deciphered creativity in a variety of ways. Since this research project will focus on creativity in counselor education, the researcher will only briefly explore a diverse range of perceptions on creativity. Creativity in the counseling profession is discussed in greater depth later in this chapter.

Creativity is a concept often recognized as a mysterious phenomenon, since it is difficult to comprehend in a simplistic fashion. Consequently, a general theory of creativity does not exist (National Endowment for the Arts, 2015). While various authors generally refer to the phenomenon as innovation, originality, novelty, or the ability to create something new (Florida, 2002: Gibson, 2010; 2014; Gladding, 2016; Sternberg & Lubart, 1999), creativity is complex and multifaceted (National Endowment for the Arts, 2015; Sternberg & Lubart, 1999).

Historically, the way society has viewed creativity has changed over time. In the middle ages, creativity was not yet a concept, however, the general belief was that extraordinary talent, or unusual ability was a mystic force which occurred outside of the individual, who was channeling 'his' ability through a divine force (Albert & Runco, 1999). This line of thought was scarcely challenged until the mid-1700's when the invention of research emerged and scientists became more inclined to study human thought as a natural science. At that time, creativity was associated with genius, and speculations were made that there were special processes occurring in the minds of individuals who were considered 'genius' (Albert & Runco, 1999). In the 20th century, however, an abundance of literature related to the study of creativity emerged, dispelling this theory, as researchers began to recognize that creativity is not one type of behavior, or one dominant trait, but rather many mental processes working together (Albert & Runco, 1999).

The first major influential approach to the study of creativity occurred in the early 1900's, with Sigmund Freud, who applied his psychodynamic theories of the unconscious

to creativity. As Freud (1908/1959) suggested, artist's creative productions are an expression of unconscious desires for love, power, fame, or financial gain. Hence, Freud believed that the unconscious was the driving force behind their creativity, however, there was no empirical evidence to validate Freud's claim. Still, recent theorists continue to theorize that the unconscious is an important element of creativity (Sternberg & Lubart, 1999). In a national research meeting, sponsored by the National Endowment for the Arts and the Santa Fe Institute, creativity researchers proclaimed that humans utilize preconceived experiences stored in the subconscious in the process of acting creatively, which is evidenced by individuals' experiences of sudden creative insights while distracted from an initial problem (National Endowment for the Arts, 2015).

In a similar vein, Bohart (1999) hypothesized that sudden insights, or inspirations, that individuals described about 'being creative' are linked to elements of the unconscious that spark intuition. Bohart (1999) argued that, in this way, creativity emerges spontaneously in the moment, while individuals are not necessarily engaged in the deliberate act of solving a problem. He called attention to artists, who often work in this fashion, and who describe their creative process as a gut instinct, or something working through them that they cannot otherwise explain. Bohart (1999) viewed this not as a 'mystic force,' as previously assumed, but the result of felt, implicit, unconscious, and perceptual ways of knowing. Hence, in Bohart's view, creativity and intuition are inter-related.

Likewise, Csikszetmihaly (1996) was the first to describe *flow* as an important element involved in creativity. Csikszetmihaly (1996) began to associate flow with

creativity as he examined the way people described the process of discovery, or creating something new. He described this process as something that artists, scientists and athletes alike described in nearly identical ways. After examining these individuals' descriptions, Csikszetmihaly (1996) proclaimed that flow is occurring in the moment while individuals are engrossed in creative acts. The following description depicts his understanding of flow while individuals are engaged in a creative act: (a) we are clear about what needs to be done each step of the way: (b) we feel certain that we are doing well; (c) we feel our ability matches the available opportunity; (d) our actions and our awareness are merged; (e) distractions are absent from our conscious awareness; (f) we are too involved to worry of failure; (g) we are too involved to be self-conscious; (h) our sense of time is distorted; (i) there is enjoyment for no other reason than the experience itself.

Cognitive approaches to creativity research are also abundant in the literature. From a cognitive view, researchers strive to understand the mental processes involved in creative thought (Sternberg & Lubart, 1999). The first and most discussed thought process described in the literature associated with creative thought is *divergent thinking* (Sternberg & O'Hara, 1999). Divergent thinking is the ability to be open to, and perceive various possibilities. Researchers continue to correlate divergent thinking with creativity today (Fink, Benedek, Grabner, Staudt, Neubauer, 2006; Yoruk & Runco, 2014). Sternberg and O'Hara (1999) also point out that divergent thinking is one of the five operations identified in Joy Paul Guilford's (1967) *Structure of Intellect* model. In this way, creativity is a subdivision of intelligence (Sternberg & O'Hara, 1999). Sternberg

and O'Hara (1999) also drew attention to studies conducted by Howard Gardner (1983), who emphasized that individuals can be intelligent in multiple ways. They proclaim that because creativity is a subset of intelligence, individuals are also creative in multiple ways. For example, the dancer Martha Graham, whom Sternberg and O'Hara (1999) identified as kinesthetically aware, was creative with respect to space and the body, developing elaborate dances and a dance style that has remained popular among modern dance artists. Albert Einstein, on the other hand, whom Sternberg and O'Hara (1999) identified as mathematically logical was creative in the way he solved mathematical problems that remain difficult to comprehend today.

Also from a cognitive perspective, Graham Wallas (1926/2014) was the first to describe the creative thought process as one that involves several steps. In *The Art of Thought*, Wallas (1926/2014) identified four distinct steps involved in creative thought: (a) a *preparation* period of investigating and gathering all necessary information to solve a problem; (b) an *incubation* period where the mind is permitted to contemplate, wander, or work through a problem in the unconscious; (c) an *illumination* period, where a flood of insight emerges, and an idea, or various ideas arise, and (d) a *verification* period where an original idea becomes an innovative product or activity that is tested to determine if it solves the problem. Hence, while creativity is positively associated with spontaneity, it is not impulsive (Kipper, Green, & Prorak, 2010). Wallas's (2014) distinct steps are still referenced in current creativity research (Gladding, 2016; Runco & Sakamoto, 1999)

Another essential item addressed throughout the literature is that there are two varieties of creativity: everyday creativity and eminent creativity (Gladding, 2016; Kaufman & Beghetto, 2009; Runco1996). Everyday creativity, otherwise referred to as *little-c creativity* relates to the daily problem solving that occurs when we interact and engage in the world (Gladding, 2016; Kaufman & Beghetto, 2009; Runco, 1996). Eminent creativity is referred to as *Big-C creativity* and generally relates to the works of famous individuals who have created innovative works or products that have ultimately changed human life forever (Gladding, 2016; Kaufman & Beghetto, 2009; Runco, 1996).

Furthermore, researchers have also referred to the investment theory of creativity, which is that creative thinkers can be described as good investors in the sense that they "buy low and sell high," to generate a novel product (Sternberg & Lubart, 1995, p. 1). In other words, creative ideas are often rejected at first and considered bizarre. Hence, creative thinkers must work to convince the public of their value (Sternberg & Williams, 1996). Sternberg and Lubart (1999) refer to creative thinker's abilities as *analytic, synthetic, and practical*. Synthetic ability refers to the ability to make connections between objects and people that most do not recognize. Analytic ability is the creative thinker's critical thinking ability. Practical ability is the creative thinker's ability to recognize the potential of their idea, and turn the abstract idea into a finished product (Sternberg & Williams, 1996).

Many authors in the literature agree that although research in creativity is abundant, it is not yet fully understood, thus more research is needed (Runco, 1996; Sternberg & Lubart, 1999). What we do know for certain is that creative endeavors are

not limited to the arts, which is often a misconception in society. Art forms such as music, dance, and drama are labeled *the creative arts* because they have the potential to foster creativity (Kaimal, Drescha, Fairbank, Gonzaga & White, 2014; Nachomanovitch, 1990). Artists must also be in a creative mindset to create, so we can learn from them (Laughlin, 2000). As many authors acknowledge, everyone has the potential and ability to be creative (Duffy, 2008; Gladding, 2016; Lin, 2011).

Creativity in Counseling

Before delving into teaching to enhance creativity, it is important to pay attention to the creative counselor and research devoted to creativity in counseling. The first indication of the profession's devotion to creativity in counseling exists within early counseling literature that refers to the innovative theories developed, dating back to the 1950's. Authors argue that this is evidence that the counseling profession would not exist without creativity (Carson & Becker, 2004; Gladding, 2016; Hecker & Kottler, 2002). For example, Gladding (2008) referred to pioneers of counseling like Carl Rogers (1961), and Albert Ellis (2001), who developed new theories after recognizing that psychodynamic approaches did not work for all their clients. Carl Rogers (1961), became enlightened by the realization that when he was genuine, non-judgmental, and transparent, the therapeutic relationship improved, which in turn led the client to self-acceptance and personal growth (Gladding, 2008; Rogers, 1961). Rogers's (1961) insights led him to develop person-centered theory. In a similar vein, Gladding referred to Albert Ellis (2001) who was enlightened by the realization that humor can help individuals think in a different way, which led to his theory, Rational Emotive Behavior

Therapy (Gladding, 2008; Ellis, 2001). In his books, Ellis (2001), provides counselors with specific interventions to promote growth in clients, some of which can be described as dramatic and humorous. Gladding (2008) posited that creativity is what led these individuals to develop innovative theories.

Authors have also asserted that the development of new counseling theory is essential to meet the changing needs of society (Gladding, 2008; Lawrence, Foster & Tieso, 2015). In the last 30 years, for example, the counseling field has turned its attention to the cultural needs of individuals, and ways in which counselors can become more prepared to work with diverse populations (Arthur & Achenbach, 2002). The recent development of innovative theories like Narrative Therapy, and Internal Family Systems, has been useful in meeting the needs of individuals who are impacted by oppressive experiences (Miller, Cardona & Hardin, 2006). Narrative Therapy, for example, takes individuals natural tendency to tell stories, and assists them in identifying an alternate story that allows them to move toward empowerment. Internal Family Systems Theory, developed by Schwartz (1995) is a process that seeks to enlighten individuals by calling attention to the way an oppressive external experience has led to an internal oppressive cycle of self-punishment (Miller, Cardona & Hardin, 2006). Without creativity, however, forward movement in the counseling profession would not occur (Gladding, 2008, Lawrence, et al., 2015). To prevent the counseling field, and individual counselors from becoming stagnant, counselors should be encouraged to be creative (Gladding, 2008).

Still many authors, who promote creativity in counseling, agree that although creativity has also led to the development of innovative theories, creativity becomes most important in the counseling session. As authors proclaimed, counselors must be creative to be effective (Gladding, 2016, Kottler & Heckner, 2002; Rosenthal, 2004). When clients 'get stuck', they have difficulty moving forward in life. Yet, Kottler and Heckner (2002) argue that it is usually the counselor who is stuck that creates the problem. When counselors get stuck, they cannot guide their clients in the direction that leads to motivation to change. Hence, counselors must access their own creative abilities to help clients move out of 'stuck' phases (Kottler & Heckner, 2002). Kottler and Heckner, (2002) posited that creativity occurs out of frustration, when one needs a solution. Heckner (2002) for example, 'got creative' with a student who was so frustrated with her depressed client for not *doing* any of the suggestions the intern presented. Heckner (2002) took an unconventional approach to supervision, and intervened by sitting on the intern's lap; pressing the intern to move Heckner (2002) off her lap. In that moment, Heckner (2002) was attempting to find a way to assist the student in understanding what the client may be going through. Sitting on the student's lap was a metaphor for the client's experience: that the depression was a weight that she could not lift no matter how hard she tried. It was then that the intern realized that she needed to have empathy for what the client was experiencing (Kottler & Heckner, 2002).

Carson and Becker (2004) asserted that counselors' ability to be creative, both internally and relationally, ultimately assists clients in developing their own ability to be creative. For example, Kottler (2002) discussed an incident he had with a depressed client

whom he had attempted various interventions without success. He described how he was trying what he felt were his most innovative techniques, and presumed that it was the client whom was at fault. At one point, however, the client caught him off guard by telling him that it appeared he no longer cared about her. At that point, he realized that he had been so caught up with his 'creative' interventions that he had paid no attention to what was happening relationally and how she was responding (Kottler & Heckner, 2002). At that moment, he became transparent, and expressed his own feelings about the session. Hence, she changed a behavior in session for the first time in years (Kottler & Heckner, 2002). With respect to creativity research, and their own experiences, Kottler and Heckner (2002) concluded that creativity in counseling involves the "person, the process, and the product" (p. 5). The person includes both the client and counselor, the process is referring to the relational exchange, and the product is the components that lead to therapeutic change. Divergent and convergent thinking, in addition to intuition, are the underlying components of a creative process occurring in the counseling relationship. Hence creativity is not just a trait, but a skill that counselors utilize often (Kottler & Heckner, 2002).

Authors in the literature also emphasize that creativity in counseling is frequently about counselor's ability to be spontaneous, improvise, take risks, move quickly, or use traditional counseling methods in novel ways (Carson & Becker, 2004). Carson and Becker (2004) applied Csikszentmihalyi's (1996) theory of flow to the counseling process:

> Flow may occur, for example, when counselors help clients run with an idea or feeling in the moment, or when the clinician gets clients out of their chairs and moving, acts in a completely unexpected way, or interjects a critically timed comment or nonverbal behavior. Flow is that which happens when clients and counselor are completely enveloped in the moment (p. 113).

Laughlin (2000) also stressed the importance of counselors' ability to improvise in session, and emphasized that creativity is key in this process, since counselors must be prepared to tolerate uncertainty. She asserted that it is not enough to apply a theory to solve a client problem, as counselors will find that they must find creative ways to integrate theory into practice in ways that are more authentic to them (Laughlin, 2000).

In an interview with Rosenthal (2002), Samuel Gladding also emphasized that "counselors are catalysts" and are thus creative in sessions, helping clients change their thoughts, feelings, and behaviors so that they are "more aware, appropriate, and satisfied with life because they leave sessions with more choices than they began" (Rosenthal, 2002, p. 26). Gladding suggested that counselors can act creatively in a variety of ways. In other words, creativity in counseling can be as simple as rearranging words for clients, or adding stimuli to the counseling environment that was not initially there. He described moments where he asked clients to draw a line on a piece of paper to demonstrate how they are feeling (Rosenthal, 2002). Ultimately, such interventions are the counselor's ability to identify creative solutions that allow clients to see things from another perspective, and gain new insights. When Gladding responded to a question regarding how counselors can be creative, he responded with, "I think the only limits to creativity

in the therapeutic process are those that the clinician put on themselves" (Rosenthal, 2002, p. 30).

Mental Health and Creativity in Counseling

The literature reveals that mental health professionals have applied creative approaches to counseling and psychotherapy due to the array of positive outcomes that have been associated with creativity and well-being (Bradley, Whiting, Hendricks, Parr, Jones, 2008; Gladding, 2016). This literature supports the idea that creative endeavors used in counseling, and other forms of therapy, can promote healing. Studies have demonstrated, for example, that creativity can restore cognitive intellectual functioning, and emotional affect (Snyder, 1997), and that individuals engaged in creative endeavors, like the arts experience improved physical, mental, and emotional health (Milner, 2006). For example, in a study that examined the impact of an arts based program on aging adults, Milner (2006) reported that individuals participating in the program had fewer doctor's visits, increased involvement in social and community activities, and overall positive responses to mental health exams.

Moreover, mental health professionals, who subscribe to non-traditional, creative approaches to treatment, have long been familiar with their profound benefits. Dance/movement therapists, for example, are trained to look for symbolism in movement to assist clients in recalling, reenacting, and re-experiencing (Chaiklin & Schmais, 1993). For example, in a dance/movement therapy group at a hospital, a group of clients were observed clapping their hands. After the dance/movement therapist encouraged clients to identify the symbolic action behind their movement, it became a 'pizza making' session.

The therapist continued to encourage clients to identify what they put on the pizza, and eventually who would be invited to share the pizza. This led to a heightened awareness for group members, as the reality of their outside living circumstances came to light, which included limited support, since they had no one to invite to share their 'pizza.' Hence, the theme of loneliness and rejection was explored, with the dance/movement therapist's assistance (Sandel, 1993). The dance movement therapist responds to client's symbolic expressions, but also presents new content that may lead clients to insight or change. For example, to assist a client who is suppressing anger, a dance/movement therapist "may suggest the image of chopping down a tree" (p. 79). The direct, strong movement required by the individual to indulge in this movement may allow feelings of anger or opposition to emerge (Chaiklin & Schmais, 1993). Through the therapeutic relationship, new and corrective symbolic interactions are created (Chaiklin & Schmais).

Additionally, creative endeavors are often introduced into counseling when traditional verbal approaches do not seem to be enough. With trauma and grief, for example, the arts are used to assist clients in obtaining emotional release in a way that feels safe (Linnehan, 2013). For example, in a case study, Thompson's (2014) client used drawing to express the deeply rooted anger she felt related to a sexual trauma she experienced in childhood. While immersed in the act of drawing, her anger was released through her physical body, however, the finished drawing became the safe container where the intensity of her anger was held. Subsequently, she could process what she felt with greater clarity (Thompson, 2014). In another example, metaphors were applied to a reality therapy approach in grief counseling to assist clients in self-expression and self-

understanding. Thus, clients could think in a different way about their loss, find meaning in their experience and reported an increased ability to cope (Goldberg & Stephenson, 2015). Ultimately, expressive and creative techniques continue to be used in counseling because they assist individuals in increasing insight, recognizing new perspectives, and conveying emotion (Bradley, Whiting, Hendricks, Parr, & Jones, 2008).

The Association for Creativity in Counseling

The development of the Association for Creativity in Counseling (ACC) is another significant example that demonstrates the value that the counseling profession places on creativity. The Association for Creativity in Counseling (ACC), established in 2004, was developed for bringing mental health professionals, educators, and students from diverse backgrounds together who share an interest in creative, innovative, relational, and complimentary therapies (Duffy & Kerl-McClain, 2006). The ACC's vision has been to remain inclusive and work in a collaborative fashion. With respect to this vision, the term '*creativity*' in counseling was carefully chosen to encourage membership from a large pool of helping professionals. Subsequently, the ACC has welcomed EMDR certified therapists, hypnotherapists, psychologists, school counselors, art therapists, and many others (Duffy & Kerl-McClain, 2006). Thus, the ACC has provided counselors with a forum to share their passions. For example, topics of exploration have included media, storytelling, art, and theatre in counseling (Duffy & Kerl-McClain, 2006), in addition to the examination of relational cultural theory, which has been the foundation of the ACC's vision for Creativity in Counseling (Duffy, Habberstroh, Trepal, 2009). Relational cultural theory and its relationship to creativity in

counseling will be discussed later in this chapter. Hence, creativity in counseling, as defined by the ACC (2016), refers to the use of creative, diverse, and relational approaches to counseling.

Subsequently, the Journal of Creativity and Mental Health (JCMH) was launched (Duffy & Kerl-McClain, 2006) in 2006. This further demonstrated the ACA's commitment to creativity in counseling, placing an emphasis on the need for research in this area. The journal emphasizes both creative endeavors in clinical practice, as well as creative endeavors in counselor education. Staying true to the ACC spirit of collaboration, mental health professionals from various backgrounds are permitted to submit articles (Duffy & Kerl-McClain, 2006). With the development of the organization, and the subsequent journal, the ACC strives to foster growth among individuals in the counseling field, promote collaboration and inclusion, and encourage innovation (Duffy & Kerl-McClain, 2006).

Again, it is important to remember that creativity in counseling is not just about the use of the creative arts in counseling. Just as creativity researchers have attempted to learn more about brain processes during creative acts by studying artists at work, counselors have learned from expressive therapists who engage clients in creative arts activities to stimulate healing. The literature presented here emphasizes that there are many ways to be creative in counseling. As the ACC emphasizes, we can learn from a wide range of approaches and styles (Duffy & Kerl-McClain, 2006).

Enhancing Creativity

Per many theorists, creativity is a skill that can be enhanced over time with training (Csikszantmihaly, 1996; Lin, 2011, Runco, 1996, Nickerson, 1999, Sternberg & Williams, 1996). Osborne (1963) was the first to develop a structured process to assist individuals in their creative thinking ability. His technique, called brainstorming, is still used and taught today. Brainstorming evokes the imagination and offers a context in which individuals can generate a wide variety of ideas without judgment. It has been found to increase creativity by increasing the expression of ideas (Nickerson, 1999). Nickerson (1999) contended that the technique reduces self-criticism by lowering the standards for what is expressed, hence individuals feel less inhibited and free to express their thoughts (Nickerson, 1999). This thought also aligns with Sternberg and Williams' (1996) theory that building self-efficacy is an important element in enhancing creativity in individuals. Other researchers have also applied creative problem-solving techniques to enhance individual's creative thinking abilities (Ballile, 2006). Ballile (2006) described a problem-solving technique called *reversal*, as helpful in enhancing creative thought. Reversals involve re-formatting a question with an opposing viewpoint then the original problem posed. For example, instead of asking "how can we help students become motivated to learn?" the question changes to "how can we prevent students from learning" (Ballile, 2006, p. 271). In this way individuals are forced to access different perspectives, which enable them to generate new ideas to solve problems (Ballile, 2006). Many theorists believe that creativity is transmitted through learning (Csikszantmihaly, 1996; Lin, 2011; Runco, 1996; Sternberg & Williams, 1996). Subsequently, creative

teaching practices have been emphasized to assist teachers in building students' creative abilities. There is a variety of books written by educators providing other educators with ideas for building a creative curriculum. Sternberg and Williams (1996), for example, provided a detailed outline of specific techniques for developing creativity in students. Some of their suggestions include encouraging collaboration in the classroom, making the classroom environment stimulating, rewarding creative ideas and products, delaying gratification, using profiles of creative people to model creativity, and adding complex creative problem-solving techniques to assignments (Sternberg & Williams, 1996).

Adult Learning Theories

Before delving into creative teaching theory, it is important to spend some time exploring the adult learning theories that have impacted educators in higher education, with respect to their approach to teaching. This is an important area of research to understand if we are talking about applying teaching styles that are well suited for the adult learner, and their subsequent area of study. One of the individuals that has had a major influence on college educators is Malcolm Knowles (1973), who called attention to the fact that many educators approached adult teaching by trying to apply what they had learned from child learning theory to adults. Knowles (1973) asserted that this was a problem, since adult learning should be viewed as more complex, as they are developmentally more mature. An important suggestion that Knowles (1973) has offered to other adult educators is his use of the term *andragogy*, which he first learned from his colleagues in Yugoslavia to describe their adult teaching practices. Andragogy is a term that stems from Ancient Greece, meaning man-leading, and is used to refer to any

professional activity that is geared toward change and growth for adults (Knowles, Holton, & Swanson, 2005). Pedagogy means child-leading, and should technically be used to describe any activity that is geared toward the art of teaching children, however, continues to be used as a term to describe adult approaches to teaching in the literature (Knowles et al., 2005). Knowles (1984) proposed five assumptions of adult learners: (a) adults are self-directed and therefore need to have a role in the planning and evaluation process of their learning; (b) a majority of adult learning occurs through experience; (c) adult learning experiences should be relevant to their personal experience and career path; (d) adult learners want to apply what they have learned quickly, therefore adult learning should be problem-centered, rather than subject-centered, and (e) adults grow internally motivated to learn as they age and mature. Members of the Association for Counselor Education and Supervision (ACES, 2016) presented a task report that acknowledged the importance of our understanding of adult learning theory in Counselor Education. Within the report, it was acknowledged that there is currently a disconnect between teaching and research in the field, further asserting that there is minimal research available describing andragogic practices in Counselor Education (Association for Counselor Education & Supervision, 2016). While much of the literature continues to use the term *pedagogy* when referring to adult teaching practices in counselor education, the ACES (2016) team recognizes that we must continue to strive to address this gap in the literature.

Another individual who has made significant contributions toward the field of higher education is David Kolb (2014) who is credited with the development of the

modern version of experiential learning theory. His work is based on twentieth century scholars who focused on experience as a central element to human development and learning. Three of the individuals Kolb (2014) credits for inspiring his theories are pioneers of psychology and counseling theory: (a) Carl Rogers (1961) for his humanistic traditions that led to client centered therapy, which parallel a student-centered teaching approach; (b) Jean Piaget (1936) for his theories regarding human cognitive development, and (c) Abraham Maslow (1943) for his theories about adult developmental challenges and the stride toward self-actualization. Kolb's (2014) Experiential Learning Theory (ELT) is described as a holistic process of learning where knowledge is shaped through the evolution of experience. The basic tenets of ELT are that there are four learning styles (Kolb, 2014). The first is *diverging*, meaning feeling and watching. Individuals who learn through diverging prefer observing, gathering information, and then using their ingenuity to problem solve. Second is *assimilating*, meaning watching and thinking. Individuals who learn by assimilating tend to be inspired by abstract concepts and learn to solve problems through logic. Third is *converging*, meaning doing and thinking. Individuals who learn through converging tend to learn by experimenting with technical tasks and practical endeavors that do not require a great deal of interpersonal interactions. Fourth is *accommodating*, meaning doing and feeling. Individuals who learn through accommodating prefer to rely on their intuition and learn the most through hands on experience (Kolb, 2014).

Thus, Kolb (2014) asserted that for effective learning to occur, the learner must pass through a four-stage learning cycle that targets all styles of learning. These include;

(a) concrete experience where a new tangible, felt experience is introduced: (b) reflective observation, where observing and thinking occur; (c) abstract conceptualization where reflective observations give rise to new concepts or the reformation of an existing concept, and (d) active experimentation, where individuals apply what they have learned in their work environments. Kolb's (2014) Experiential Learning Theory has been utilized for career training purposes in various professions today (Kolb, 2014).

Another individual who has contributed to our understanding of adult learning theory is Lev Vygotsky, whom Kolb (2014) was also inspired by in his development of ELT. Vygotsky (1978) called attention to the importance of socialization cognitive development. Vygotsky (1978) stressed the importance of community, and asserted that human interactions in society influence our ability to establish meaning in our lives. Vygotsky's (1978) posed four primary assertions: (a) culture plays a principle role in shaping cognitive development; (b) a zone of proximal development means that when skills are too complex for an individual to grasp independently, s/he must learn from another's knowledge; (c) peer interactions are an important element of learning and development to enforce individuals ability to perceive the alternate viewpoints of others, and (d) social interactions between individuals leads to the co-creation of language, while the internalization of language promotes cognitive development. Vygotsky's contributions are the foundation of constructivist learning theory, in which the basic premise of all learning is that individuals construct meaning and knowledge through their experiences and social interactions (Fosnot,1996).

Finally, it is important to acknowledge Jerome Bruner (1957), whose theories have also influenced constructivist learning theory (Fosnot,1996). By researching the cognitive development of children, Bruner (1957) identified how individuals store knowledge and information in memory through modes of representation. He identified three different modes of representation: (a) enactive representations are action based, where individuals remember how to do things through muscle memory; (b) iconic representations are mental pictures or images, and (c) symbolic representations are codes or symbols, such as language. Bruner proposed that intellectual development occurs in all three stages for adults, as well as children, and thus curriculum should include all three: learning through action, learning using visuals, and learning by solving abstract concepts (Bruner, 1961). Bruner (1961) also asserted that instructors should create an autonomous environment for individuals, so that they may construct their own knowledge.

While these theories exist, they do not assist educators in understanding creative teaching and its application with adults. They are important to understand as creative teaching is examined to determine if a creative teaching approach targets adult learning goals. This notion is discussed further in chapter five of this study.

Identifying and Defining Creative Teaching

Finding a definition for *creative teaching*, also referred to as *creative pedago*gy, has been a challenge. Many authors write about creative teaching; however, they do so without defining the term. Cardosa de Sousa (2010) argued that rather than define creative teaching, authors favor listing the behaviors, approaches, and strategies that

characterize or illustrate teaching. For example, Mayer (1989) defined creative teaching as a set of "instructional techniques that are intended to help students learn new material in new says that will enable them to transfer what they learned to new problems" (p. 205). He followed this definition with a list of 'conditions' that are necessary for creative teaching to occur such as meaningful material, and instructional methods that require active learning (Mayer, 1989). Similarly, college educators, like Livingston (2010) and Bull, Montgomery and Baloche (1995), discuss creative approaches to teaching in the literature, but do not reference it as creative teaching. Instead, they refer to what they are doing as *teaching creativity,* which places an emphasis on what teachers can do to help students think creatively. Torrance (1987), who is often referenced in the literature, was one of the first authors to formally address teaching for creativity. He emphasized that to teach students to think creatively, both the environment and curriculum must be conducive to foster creative thinking. Hence, *creative learning* refers to the conditions that must be met for creative thinking to occur, such as teaching curriculum activities (Torrance, 1987). Torrance (1987) provided examples of the classroom conditions that should be met to encourage creative learning: (a) reading programs, creative arts, and media designed to allow students to practice creative thinking; (b) curriculum and exercises that involve creative problem solving procedures; (c) a supportive classroom climate with (d) an appropriate balance between motivation, reward and competition among peers; and (e) testing conditions that facilitate higher order creative thinking (Torrance, 1987).

Others have focused more on the relationship between teacher and student as a way of defining creative teaching. Rinkevich (2011), for example, described creative teaching as "a unique customized and meaningful exchange of knowledge among all individuals in a learning context," but did not go into depth to describe this process (p. 219). Sawyer (2004) described creative teaching as a collaborative process that is a "disciplined improvisation" (p. 12). He used the metaphor of creative teaching as improvisational performers on the stage. He asserted that they must use their presentation, voice, delivery, movement and timing to engage their audience, but also highlighted the fact that they must interact with their audience. In this way, he contended that creative teaching is a constructivist approach, because the teacher is adapting to the input s/he receives from students which reveals if students are engaged or not engaged. It is a *disciplined* improvisation, because it occurs within general structures (Sawyer, 2004).

Others have focused more on characteristics or behaviors of creative teachers as an important element of creative teaching (Bramwell, Reilly, Lilly, Kronish, & Chennebathni, 2011). Bramwell et al. (2005) found that creative teachers are motivated, hard-working, persistent, and passionate. Gibson (2010) also asserted that creativity requires boundary pushing, risk taking, and autonomy. Thus, teachers must challenge students by providing a learning environment that encourages these behaviors to foster creative thinkers (Gibson, 2010). Runco (2004) also posited that creativity may contribute to teacher effectiveness in influencing creativity in students. Additionally, Denmead (2011) conducted a case study asking primary educators who follow a creative pedagogical framework to report their perspectives about their practice. Participants

indicated that the following elements were important elements of their practice: (a) embracing "not knowing" and being open to various possibilities (p. 61); (b) "open-endedness" (p. 62); (c) the ability to be uninhibited and playful like a child, and (d) to encourage their students to *become* as much of their authentic selves as possible.

Although, a consensus for a general definition of creativity teaching has not been formally acknowledged in the literature, the association now known as Creativity, Culture and Education (CCE), founded in the United Kingdom in 1998, developed one of the most frequently referenced definitions for creative teaching (Denmead, 2011; Lin, 2011; NACCE, 1990). The organization is devoted to designing, developing and managing successful education programs in primary schools world-wide. The CCE partnered with countries around the world, and spent a great deal of time conducting research devoted to creative teaching approaches (CCE, 2016). The CCE is recognized as an international leader for its success in bringing culture, arts, and creative curriculum into the classroom (CCE, 2016). The CCE have defined creative teaching as a two-fold process: *teaching creatively* and *teaching for creativity* (CCE, 2016). Teaching creatively refers to the imaginative ways teachers capture student interest to make learning more exciting and effective (NACCE, 1999). Teaching for creativity refers to the exercises and curriculum utilized to facilitate creative thinking in students (NACCE, 1999). Still, in 2011 Lin challenged the CCE definition, stating that the NACCE is missing a third element in their definition for creativity, drawing attention to Torrance's (1987) earlier research on creative learning. Hence, Lin (2011) defined *creative pedagogy* as: *creative teaching, teaching for creativity, and creative learning*. Lin (2011)

asserted that creative learning, which refers to *how* students learn to think creatively, must be emphasized as an important pedagogical element. She stated that neglecting characteristics associated with creative learning, such as autonomy could result in difficulties facilitating student's creativity. Similarly, (Palmer, 2007) asserted that teachers have the power to either create conditions that empower students to learn, or create conditions that prevent them from learning at all.

Lin (2011) emphasized that teaching for creativity, creative teaching, and creative learning are inter-connected elements of creative teaching, each complementing the other. She emphasized this idea by highlighting that creative abilities and qualities are enhanced through the interaction of student and teacher, and thus a supportive environment and climate are essential in this exchange (Lin, 2011). The comprehensive and inclusive nature of Lin's (2011) definition complements the previous definitions of creative teaching.

Creative Teaching in Higher Education

Research on creative pedagogy as an approach in higher education is limited. More attention has been paid to enhancing creativity in young children in the classroom (Cropley, 1997, Lin, 2011, Starko, 2014). Consequently, creative teaching material and references to creative pedagogy are much more abundant within the literature devoted to primary education. The fact that many authors avoid defining creative teaching in the literature devoted to higher education is evidence that a gap exists. Although Lin's (2011) definition for creative pedagogy encompasses a comprehensive perspective of what we know to date based on previous literature about creativity training applications in

teaching, it is not currently referenced in most higher education literature referring to creative teaching.

Nevertheless, there is a small pool of educators and researchers talking openly about the need for educators to place a focus on creativity in higher education. They are not calling it creative pedagogy, but they are attending to the way creativity may be enhanced in students. For example, Livingston (2010) focused on research that demonstrates how collaboration among student's sparks creativity and creative thinking. He called attention to corporate life where individuals are placed in workplace environments where they must collaborate to solve problems. He argued that this will only become even more important as technology continues to advance in a society where fast paced networking and constant communication has already become the standard (Livingston, 2010). Livingston (2010) argued that college educators hold onto traditional methods of pedagogy which, while useful, only allow *dissemination* of information and not the *absorption* of information. He posited that designing curriculum that encourages a meaningful personal exchange among students will allow them to develop their creative instincts (Livingston, 2010). Similarly, Florida (2002) argued that curriculum in higher education should place an emphasis on student creativity if educators expect to develop innovative and creative thinkers who can assist a changing society in making technological and economic advancements and improvements. Gibson (2010) agreed with Florida's (2002) line of thought, and asserted that higher education institutes must nurture creativity in students if they hope to produce innovative thinkers and leaders in society.

Further, Phillip (2015) argued that the problem is not that teachers in higher education institutes do not value creative teaching, but that teachers contend that they do not have adequate support or conditions to apply their creative dreams to the classroom in their entirety. Limited resources and limited rewards for creativity in teaching for faculty who must adhere to a timeline to meet tenure were some of the barriers to creativity that teachers experienced (Phillip, 2015). Other authors have also argued that faculty are not encouraged to be creative in higher education (Rinkevich, 2011; Wisdom, 2006). Similarly, Carson and Becker (2004) stressed that academia and creativity are often in conflict with each other because the rigors of higher education demand self-restraint. After interviewing college instructors as part of his ongoing research studies, Phillip (2015) found that some college educators applied creative curriculum to their teaching methods, however, were reluctant to call it creativity or teaching creatively for fear of misconception because the term, *creativity*, is open to multiple interpretations. Phillip (2015) argued that faculty should acknowledge their own creativity and student's creativity. He posits that engaging in creativity discourse among students and colleagues is an appropriate place to start (Phillip, 2015). Comparably, Wisdom (2006) argued that faculty should not only be encouraged to be creative, but that they should receive creativity training as instructors.

Despite the arguments that more attention must be paid to creative instruction in higher education, there are limited studies examining the effectiveness of creative instruction methods. Those that have, however, have demonstrated positive results. For example, Matson (1991) tried rewarding failure as a teaching approach to stimulate

creative behavior among college students. His course curriculum was designed to encourage creativity and the tolerance of failure. For instance, one of the assignments included a "worst consumer product" design and the development of a resume that "was guaranteed to not make them employable" (p. 84). This assignment was followed by the design of an actual business with a goal of having actual customers by the end of the semester. Out of a total of 98 students, 94 met the goal of having a business with customers, with the average number of four attempts to start their businesses. Matson (1991) believed that this creative approach allowed students to increase their confidence in taking risks, thus permitting them to become more creative (Matson, 1991).

In another study, Milgram and Davidovich (2010) conducted a study on creative thinking and lecturer effectiveness in higher education. The first part of the study involved measuring the creative ability of university instructors by giving them a Tel Aviv Creativity Test (TACT), which measures creative thinking skills. The second part of the study involved student evaluations of lecturer effectiveness, including the following domains for creative thinking: (a) the lecturer encouraged students to use various approaches to solve problems; (b) the lecturer encouraged students to express their ideas openly and ask questions; (c) the lecturer used original ideas to rouse creative thinking in students, and (d) the lecturer posed questions that require students to react in a new way (Milgram & Davidovich, 2010). The results indicated that instructor's ability to think creatively was positively correlated with student's perceptions of instructor effectiveness and ability to foster creativity in students (Milgram & Davidovich, 2010).

This study demonstrated that it is not only important to focus on creative methods that enhance student creativity, but that the creative ability of teachers is also important.

Although there is limited research on creative teaching in higher education, educators recognize that something profound happens for students when the teachers get creative in the college classroom (Bain, 2004). In a fifteen-year study, Ken Bain (2004) sought to identify what the most successful college teachers do to engage students. His idea was sparked by his observations of a few colleagues whose students appeared so eager to enter their courses, that the instructors had substantial waiting lists of students attempting to enter the course. One colleague he named had students who were not even enrolled in his class piling in the aisle of a lecture hall. Upon questioning, these students reported that being there inspired them and stimulated their minds. Bain's (2004) study was not conducted specifically on creative teaching or teaching for creativity, or pedagogy of any sort. Still, much of what the results of his study indicate sound much like the creative teaching methods and approaches described in the literature. For example, Bain (2004) found that the best college teacher's focus on what they could do to provoke students thought process, or how they could assist students in learning to think in new ways. He also emphasized that the best college teachers "create diverse learning experiences" (p. 138), and create conditions in which students can recognize their highest potential to learn and create. Additionally, Bain (2004) emphasized that because the best teachers were constantly focused on how students learned, they constantly adapted their teaching approaches in inventive ways. He described one teacher who played games with

students to create a collaborative learning environment, and others who engaged students in their communities outside of the classroom (Bain, 2004).

Although Bain's (2004) study did not emphasize creative teaching as the pedagogical approach, the instructors he interviewed had been recognized for the innovative ways in which they engaged students in the classroom. His book is a reminder of the importance of focusing not just on the students in the college classroom, but the instructors' abilities. Comparably, Palmer (2007) argued that the difference between good teachers and bad teachers is that good teachers do not distance themselves from the subjects they are teaching, but rather approach them with a sense of connectedness; requiring them to model the qualities they want to foster in students. He asserted that "at every level of education, the selfhood of the teacher is key" (p. 7). In other words, good teachers share who they are in the classroom; they are authentic (Palmer, 2007).

Subsequently, advocates for creative teaching in higher education argue that more attention should be paid to teacher's creative abilities (Jackson & Sinclair, 2006; Wisdom, 2006). This is particularly important since the literature reveals that instructor creativity is positively correlated with student ability to be creative (Milgram & Davidovich, 2010). Wisdom (2006) argued that higher institutions should emphasize the development of creativity in their faculty. He asserted that it is important for instructors to understand and value their own creativity so they can work to enhance it over time. Likewise, Jackson and Sinclair (2006) contended that if we want to help students develop their own creativity, we must first understand what creativity means in the context of our

own teaching. Evidently, the limited amount of research available speaks to the need for more attention in this area.

Creativity Teaching in Counselor Education

With the ACC's development of the *Journal for Creativity in Mental Health*, counselors and counselor educators have access to literature devoted to creative clinical practice and counselor training. Regarding creative curriculum, there are a variety of conceptual articles devoted to providing counselor educators with creative strategies that teachers can apply in the classroom. For example, Henderson and Malone (2009) used fairy tales to illustrate ethical dilemmas in counseling. Their rationale for using this strategy was based on literature that suggests that using creative interventions with students can assist them in deepening their awareness and understanding (Henderson & Malone, 2009). In their article, Henderson and Malone (2009) provided educators with examples of adaptations to popular fairy tales that they created like *Little Bo Peep wants to Barter Her Sheep*, and 13-year-old *Little Red Riding Hood*, and her 17-year-old boyfriend (Henderson & Malone, 2009). They posited that the approach was also a way to offer alternate perspectives to ethical dilemmas in a non-traditional way (Henderson & Malone, 2009).

In another example, Hayes (2008) discussed the use of multimedia instruction as a creative teaching strategy. His rationale for using this strategy was based on the idea that students learning needs are changing from those of previous generations and that the use of computer assisted technology can assist in meeting those needs (Hayes, 2008). In his article, Hayes (2008) provides educators with specific computer based strategies to apply

such as computer-based simulation, where students interact with a computer program to practice applying therapeutic skills and receive immediate feedback. Cyber-supervision was also suggested and electronic learning was suggested for clinical training (Hayes, 2008).

Additionally, given the ACC's mission for furthering creative, diverse, and relational approaches to counseling, a priority for ACC has been to promote ways in which creativity can influence counselor trainee's relational competencies (Duffey, Haberstroh, & Trepal, 2009). Relational competencies are essential to growth fostering relationships in counseling, hence training in this area is essential (Duffey et. al., 2009; Duffy, 2006). Subsequently, the *JCMH* includes several articles devoted to the development of relational competencies in students with the implementation of creative teaching strategies. For example, Giordano, Clarke, and Stare (2015) discussed the application of experiential activities to assist counselor trainees in overcoming obstacles to empathy in the classroom. They suggested the use of live actors in the classroom to enable students to explore personal bias, unconscious assumptions, transference and countertransference issues in the comfort of the classroom. They also suggested the use of film and peer processing groups to explore similar issues (Giordano, et al, 2015).

In another article featured in the *JCMH*, Kress, Paylo, Adamson, and Baltrinic (2015) described the use of a guided imagery script as a technique to increase student cultural awareness in clinical assessment, diagnosis, and clinical supervision courses. Kress et al. (2014) asserted that guided imagery can promote students case conceptualization skills and self-awareness. Since self-awareness is key in increasing

cultural competence Kress et al. (2014) used the guided imagery script to evoke self-reflection in counseling students of personal bias, address gender and cultural stereotypes, and to promote empathy.

The use of the expressive arts as a creative vehicle in counselor training has also been a popular topic in the literature (Bradley, Whiting, Hendricks, Parr, Jones, 2008; Harrawood, Mcclure, Nelson, 2011). Harrawood McClure and Nelson (2011) described the use of experiential activities like music and dance to assist students in understanding the power of cravings for addicted clients. Harrawood et al. (2011) include the use of a dance video, for example, from the popular show *So You Think You Can Dance*, titled *Addiction Choreographed*. They call attention to the choreography of the duet, where the dancer attempts to fight her addiction, but it constantly calls her back as a way of to emphasize the power of cravings to students. The music intervention described by Harrawood et al. (2011) involves the use of Sarah McLaughlin's lyrics of the song *Angel*. After the song is played for students, they ask thought provoking questions about the song and how they might use it to understand addiction in clients.

Research Devoted to Creative Teaching in Counselor Education

Although there is an abundance of conceptual articles describing creative strategies to apply in counselor education, there are limited qualitative and quantitative studies devoted to creative teaching in counselor education. Those that have been conducted, however, have demonstrated that creative teaching methods do enhance student learning. Laughlin (2000) conducted a research study to understand the improvisational methods of jazz musicians so that she could apply them to counselor

trainees. Her work demonstrated that the method was transferrable and assisted student's improvisational abilities in the following ways in session: (a) the ability be self-reflexive; (b) the ability to remain in the conversation; (c) seeing themselves as relationally connected to clients, as opposed to non-central; (d) "avoiding pigeonholes" (p. 66), and (d) the ability to tolerate uncertainty.

In another qualitative study, Lenes, Swank, and Nash (2015) demonstrated that the use of music videos in a counselor education sexuality course benefited student participants in vital ways. Over the course of two three-hour class sessions, Lenes, Swank, and Nash (2015) used various music videos to illustrate diversity in sexual concepts, sexual orientations, and cultural identities related to sexuality. Students were then assigned various tasks to evoke self-reflection and assess their understanding of self and other with respect to personal values, beliefs, comfort levels, boundaries, and beliefs related to sex. They were also asked to create their own songs in response to the content, and share them with each other. Students were interviewed after the two-week period (Lenes et al., 2015). Results indicated that students described the ability to connect to strong emotions within themselves and peers. Students also experienced growth discomfort and vulnerability, in the sense that they felt they could relate to the vulnerable position client may be in during a session. Students also expressed increased awareness of the impact that power and oppression plays with respect to concerns of sexuality in clients and themselves (Lenes et al., 2015).

For a dissertation, Lawrence (2012) used creativity training research to design a creative curriculum, and conduct a qualitative study. He asked instructors to apply his

curriculum design in a masters level counseling skills course, and sought to answer the following research questions: (a) how would students and teachers experience the integration of creativity in the curriculum; (b) how would students who completed the training describe their counseling role; (c) how would students experience the process of becoming a counselor; (d) how would the instructors involved in the study describe the counselor role, and (e) how would instructors describe the students development (Lawrence, 2012). His results indicated that students could identify with essential elements in their role as counselor such as engagement, presence, a supportive environment and attention to the relational connection between client and counselor. The students reported that the relational building exercises built into the program were particularly helpful in this way. Self-development was also an important theme that emerged in Lawrence's study among participants. He wrote,

> Through the experiential role-taking experiences, students came to recognize the need to transcend their initial conceptualizations of a counselor, to remove the constraints inherent in their rigid preconceptions. By loosening those restrictions…by incorporating components of their personality into the realm of professional performance…students acknowledged they are better able to creatively engage the clients and, ultimately meet their needs. (p. 190).

Lawrence's (2012) study demonstrates that an emphasis on a comprehensive creative curriculum can have a positive impact on counseling students.

The Missing Pieces

Essentially authors agree that counselors in training should be taught and encouraged to be creative if they are to become effective counselors (Lawrence, Foster, Tieso, 2015; Lawrence, 2015; Heckner & Kottler, (2002). Subsequently, Carson and Becker (2002) wrote that counselors should be encouraged to find their "creative voices" from the moment they first step into the classroom (p. 82). Lawrence (2015) asserted that counselor educators should infuse creativity training into the curriculum because counselors need to view creativity as an orientation in counseling, rather than a series of interventions to apply in the counseling session (Lawrence, 2015).

Despite these assertions, there is a limited empirical research devoted to creative teaching in the classroom. Lawrence (2012) argued that when creativity is discussed in counselor education literature, that it is often referred to as a 'thing', rather than an approach that one should embody as a professional counselor. Likewise, much of the current literature on creative teaching in counselor education includes conceptual pieces about strategies and techniques that counselor educators can apply to the curriculum, rather than the counselor educator's ability to also be creative in their teaching. Yet, research demonstrates that students learn to be creative from instructors who model creativity (Milgram & Davidovich, 2010). Additionally, Bain (2004) emphasized that the best teachers create diverse learning opportunities that provoke student thought when they focus on their approach to the classroom, and then adapt their methods in creative ways. Similarly, Palmer (2007) proclaimed that it is not enough for the teacher to apply a method, but that good teaching requires the instructor to have a sense of connectedness to

the subject matter, and the qualities they are attempting to enhance in students. If this is the case, it is also important to focus our attention on the instructor's creative abilities.

As the literature, has uncovered, creative teaching is a pedagogical approach to instruction that is more than just teaching strategies to add to a curriculum. Authors have referred to creative teaching as interactive and collaborative, which they highlighted as important in influencing student creativity (Sawyer, 2004; Duffy, Habberstroh, Trepal, 2009). Duffy et al. (2009) emphasized that creativity is essential to a growth fostering relationship, such as the one between client and counselor. Subsequently, it would make sense to look more closely at the teacher's relationship to creativity and how s/he interacts with students in a creative manner both intra-personally and interpersonally in the classroom. While Lawrence (2015) studied the perspectives of both the instructors and counselors involved in his study, much of the focus of the study was devoted to how his creative curriculum influenced the development of counseling students. The other studies mentioned in the literature also placed an emphasis on the creative learning aspect of creative teaching with the focus placed on curriculum that fosters creative learning, and less emphasis on the creative teacher.

Moreover, creative pedagogy is not formally referred to as a pedagogical approach in counselor education, and the current definition is not discussed or acknowledged in the literature. Perhaps this is because a focus has not been placed on creative counselor educators themselves, or perhaps this is due to the misconceptions that exist with respect to creativity. As emphasized in this literature review, creativity is not exclusive to the arts and individuals can be creative in multiple ways. In Lawrence's

(2015) study, he recalled a student's initial impressions to the idea of becoming a 'creative' counselor: "they're going to make me paint," the student relayed (p. 194). After the student completed the curriculum, however, she understood that she could be creative in many ways (Lawrence, 2015). With the abundance of literature referring to the use of creative arts as a creative teaching strategy, it would not be a surprise that counselor educators have similar misconceptions. Again, although we can learn from the creative arts, there are plenty of teaching methods that do not include them. This idea only re-enforces the need for more research focused on the creative teaching abilities of the counselor educator.

To begin to address the gaps in the literature regarding the creative teacher in counselor education, the researcher focused her attention on the creative ability of counselor educators who are engaging in creative teaching. How are they creative? Is there a common thread that we can identify that would help other counselor educators become creative teachers?

To address the research question, the researcher conducted a phenomenological study with seven counselor educators who subscribe to a creative teaching approach. The primary research question that drove the study was, what are counselor educators' self-reported experiences of creative teaching in the classroom? While the researcher is aware that learning occurs outside of the classroom, she chose to place an emphasis on instructors lived experiences in the classroom to maintain a focal point that is within reason for data collection. A detailed description of the methods used in the study are presented in chapter three.

Chapter 3

Methodology

In this chapter, the methodological approach is described in detail. The researcher's rationale for using the approach, and accompanying procedures is also described. Additionally, participants are introduced, and procedures that assured trustworthiness and credibility are presented.

After reviewing the literature review, it is evident that the counseling profession values creativity (ACC, 2016; Gladding, 2016; Duffy, 2004). This was further evidenced by the development of the Association for Creativity in Counseling (ACC), in addition to research investigating the counselor's ability to approach counseling in creative ways (Gladding, 2016; Duffy, 2004). It is also apparent that counselor educators have witnessed successful outcomes after applying creative learning strategies to their curriculum with students, such as increased ability to connect (Lawrence, 2015), and empathize with clients (Lenes & Swank, & Nash, 2015). Researchers have asserted that because clients benefit from the counselor's ability to be creative in their counseling approach, students in the counseling profession may benefit from a teaching approach that inherently permits them to enhance their own ability to be creative (Heckner &

Kottler, 2002; Lawrence, Foster & Tieso, 2015). Despite these assertions there is limited research in counselor education investigating instructors who intentionally approach teaching in a creative way. Given that students in higher education settings reported that they learned how to be creative from teachers who modeled creativity (Milgram & Davidovich, 2010), more research is needed exploring the creative ability of instructors and how they use their creative ability in counselor education.

To date, there has been one research study that formally investigated counselor educator's personal responses to infusing a creative curriculum in the classroom (Lawrence, 2015). Lawrence's (2015) study, however, placed an emphasis on the perceptions of educators on the student's development after engaging in creative curriculum. There have been no research studies in counselor education that investigated the perspectives of counselor educator's creative ability in the classroom, or their personal perspectives of how they apply creative teaching in the classroom, otherwise known as creative pedagogy (Lin, 2011). The researcher addressed this gap by capturing the perspectives of counselor educators who report using creative approaches to teaching. Learning from counselor educators who believe they are creative, and who apply a creative teaching approach in the classroom may assist other counselor educators in uncovering their own ability to be creative, and work within a creative pedagogical (Lin, 2011) framework. Subsequently, the researcher chose a qualitative phenomenological method to conduct the study.

Describing Phenomenological Research and Rationale

Qualitative research is interpretive in nature as researchers seek to understand how individuals interpret and make sense of objects, events, and actions (Glesne, 2011). There are a wide variety of interpretive theoretical frameworks to choose from, however, the researcher chose to take a phenomenological approach. Phenomenological research is rooted in the social constructivist framework, with the ontological assumption that reality is socially constructed, complex, and constantly changing (Glesne, 2011). Phenomenology is not a theory that can be tested, but rather a tradition of research application that honors individual perspectives. Meaning is co-constructed between the researcher and the research participants (Creswell, 2013). Hence, research is aimed at deriving meaning from participants, rather than comparing participant data to an existing theoretical framework. The essence of the phenomenon is derived from research participants perceptions and 'acts of experience' (Yuksel & Yildrim, 2015). Since little is known about counselor educators' experiences applying a creative teaching approach to the classroom, a phenomenological approach was necessary, and an additional theoretical framework was not applied.

A phenomenological approach is an ideal option for researchers who seek to capture the essence of a phenomenon that is complex, or not easily understood (Van Manen, 1990). Researchers have determined that creativity itself is a complex phenomenon (National Endowment for the Arts, 2014; Sternberg & Lubart, 1999). Furthermore, creative teaching as a pedagogical approach is multifaceted, and not fully

understood, as evidenced by multiple perspectives regarding the characteristics and definitions of creative teaching discussed in the literature review.

Phenomenological researchers understand that individuals may have varied perspectives, however, there is a constant interplay between individuals' inner and outer worlds, in which social constructs emerge. Hence, examining the perspectives of several individuals within a group can shed light on the common cultural patterns, thoughts, and actions of the group (Glesne, 2011). Since the researcher was drawn to explore the art of creative teaching based on her personal experiences as a counselor educator in training, a constructivist approach was well suited for the study. In this way, the research is not one sided, since participants will be free to negotiate with the researcher to determine what information should be used to discern meaning.

Phenomenological research is designed to examine lived experiences, and individuals' attempts to make meaning of their lived experiences (Van Manen, 1990). Through interviews or other methods, phenomenological researchers seek to gain an in-depth understanding of the phenomenon as individuals consciously experience it, in the world in which they live (Van Manen, 1990). The goal is to set aside preconceived notions and become open to understand the core of the experience, as others have come to understand it. As Van Manen (2007) eloquently stated,

> Phenomenology is a project of sober reflection on the lived experience of human existence-sober in the sense that reflecting on experience must be thoughtful and as much as possible free from theoretical, prejudicial, and suppositional intoxications (p. 12).

In this study, the researcher sought to obtain an in-depth understanding of the phenomenon of creative teaching in the classroom, as perceived by counselor educators.

There are a few types of phenomenological research that inform data analysis. The researcher chose to use a transcendental approach, which involves meticulous methods for data analysis that emphasize the descriptive experiences of research participants, rather than the interpretation of the researcher (Creswell, 2007). The transcendental approach was originally conceptualized by Edmund Husserl (1931/2002), who developed the transcendental approach to defy the ego; since the ego can prevent individuals from seeing alternate perspectives. Ego perceptions stem from conscious memories that are based on personal experiences. Thus, to perceive new information, researchers must detach from what they know that is based in personal experience (Husserl 1931/2002). Husserl (1931/2002) called this "transcending consciousness" (p. 116). Consequently, he developed a reduction method for phenomenological research that assists the researcher in removing personal bias, and approaching research from a fresh perspective. Sheehan (2014) described Husserl's (1931/2002) approach as an attempt to perceive a phenomenon through "unclouded glasses" (Sheehan, 2014, p.10), Moustakas (1994) adapted Husserl's (1931/2002) transcendental approach to data analysis, which was used for this study.

Summary of the Research Question

The purpose of this research study was to gain an in-depth understanding of counselor educators' perceived experiences with creative teaching. The researcher sought to examine their lived experiences as creative teachers, and their lived experiences

applying creative teaching methods in the classroom. Thus, the primary research question that drove the study was, *what are counselor educators' self-reported experiences of creative teaching in the classroom?* While the researcher is aware that learning also takes place outside of the classroom, the she chose to place an emphasis on counselor educators' lived experiences in the classroom. This choice was made in part due to the theoretical framework used; phenomenological inquiry, in addition to helping the researcher maintain a focal point that is reasonable with respect to data collection and data analysis. Subsequent questions were examined to enhance the researchers understanding of counselor educators perceived experiences of creative teaching: (a) what do counselor educators notice as they engage in creative teaching endeavors; (b) how do they experience the act of creative teaching, and (c) how do they perceive themselves as being creative in their teaching? The researcher's subsequent questions were adapted and applied as interview questions during the data collection phase of this study.

Role of the Researcher

In this study, the researcher took on two roles: researcher and learner. In the role of researcher, was required to detach from her personal experience with the subject matter. This is often a difficult task for researchers, since they may have a personal investment in the subject matter, and may have developed the research question because of previous experience with the topic (Glesne, 2011). The researcher's interest in creative teaching occurred during her doctoral assistantship during her first experiences teaching counselors in training. The researcher noticed how much she was drawn to the

use of creative teaching and creative teaching strategies to engage students. The researcher wondered, is she drawn to creative teaching because she is also a dancer and thus drawn to use creative strategies to enhance learning, such as the arts? Is she creative or does she experience creativity differently than other instructors do? How do other instructors experience creativity in their teaching? Additionally, the researcher noticed that using creative strategies in the classroom seemed to grab the attention of students, when they were otherwise less engaged. She found herself bringing in more creative techniques to engage students, and found she had a much livelier group. Per Marshall and Rossman (2016), a personal biography is often a source of inspiration to explore a topic in qualitative research. Van Manen (1990) also asserted that personal experience is a starting point for researching lived experience. An advantage of phenomenological inquiry is that there is collaboration in the search for meaning, since an explicit focus on the researcher's personal experience in conjunction with those of the participants can exist (Marshall & Rossman, 2016).

Additionally, in the role of learner, the research question becomes a teacher (Van Manen, 1990). Glesne (2011) also asserted it is essential that the researcher have a sense of self as learner, because having this perspective leads researchers to reflect on all aspects of their procedures and results. At various points throughout this study, for example, the researcher immersed herself in data collection and data analysis procedures. In this role, she was required to remain open and curious to all possibilities and perspectives. Self-reflection and self-reflexivity was an essential element for addressing personal bias throughout the entire study. Thus, a research journal was used to assist the

researcher in addressing personal bias, and is discussed in further detail later in this chapter. Wolff (2002) asserted that self-reflection is vital, and that qualitative researchers must be sensitive, self-aware, and confident so they refrain from adhering excessively to their personal agenda, markedly during the data collection and data analysis stages of research.

Since the researcher took a transcendental approach, *epoche* was also conducted prior to data collection so that the researcher could reflect on her personal experiences and attachment to the subject matter prior to moving forward. Epoche is the process in which the researcher reflects on her personal experience with the phenomenon (Moustakas, 1994). During this process, the researcher increased her awareness of pre-judgements and bias (Moustakas, 1994) that could influence her interpretations. Increased awareness through the process of epoche allows the researcher to approach the subject matter from a fresh perspective (Moustakas, 1994). To conduct this process, the researcher outlined her personal bias in her research journal.

1. The researcher values creativity and thus assumes others also value creativity.
2. The researcher values creativity in teaching and thus assumes that others value creativity in teaching.
3. The researcher assumes that there is something exceptional about creative teachers and how they are being creative.

The researcher referred to the journal throughout data analysis to assist her in the process of *bracketing;* a term commonly used to describe the process in which the qualitative researcher separates her personal understanding of the data from the data that

is emerging from participants (Moustakas, 1994). Epoche was conducted prior to beginning data collection and during data analysis. This is discussed further in the trustworthiness and credibility section of this chapter.

Participant Selection

The researcher interviewed a diverse group of seven counselor educators who are faculty members of a CACREP accredited program for masters and/or doctoral counseling students. The researcher sought to obtain a diverse range of participants with respect to gender, race/ethnicity, and age. Diversity of participants allowed the researcher to hear from a wide range of perspectives. Sampling a diverse group enhances the credibility of a study by increasing the likelihood that the results are transferable (Marshall & Rossman, 2016). The researcher used a demographic questionnaire to determine the demographics of research participants. This is discussed further in the data collection section of this study.

Faculty members selected for the study were individuals who were familiar with creative teaching methods, and who believe that they are creative in their approach to teaching. The researcher also used the literature to assist her in determining years of experience necessary in her inclusion criteria. Alspup (2004) highlighted that while novice instructors may be knowledgeable about pedagogical strategies, they are still mastering learning methods and establishing their sense of self in the classroom. Consequently, they have not established self-efficacy in their teaching ability (Alspup, 2004). Walkington (2005) also asserted that the development of teacher identify takes time, and will occur over the course of a few years. Subsequently, the researcher chose

counselor educators who had a minimum of two-years of experience teaching counseling courses. Inclusion and exclusion criteria are described in further detail in the data collection section of this proposal. Detailed descriptions of participant demographics are discussed in chapter four.

Sampling

The researcher used *purposeful sampling* (Creswell, 2013) to recruit research participants. In purposeful sampling, researchers purposefully select research participants who have experience and understanding of the phenomenon (Creswell, 2013). Thus, participants were screened to assess whether they met specific criteria relevant to the phenomenon being studied (Creswell, 2013). In this study, the researcher purposefully selected research participants who have experience and understanding with creative teaching in counseling courses. Screening criteria is described in detail in the data collection section of this proposal.

Additionally, the researcher used network sampling (Glesne, 2011) to recruit research participants. In network sampling, the researcher finds participants by acquiring knowledge of people who meet research interests (Glesne, 2011). Participants recruited through network sampling in this study were also screened to ensure that they met the inclusion criteria for the study.

Participant Demographics

The researcher interviewed a total of seven participants ($N = 7$). Participants ranged in age from 33-years old to 71-years old ($M = 46.14$, $SD = 12.68$). Three participants ($n = 3$) identified as female, and four participants ($n = 4$) identified as male.

In addition, five participants (*n = 5*) identified as Caucasian, one participant (*n = 1*) identified as Caucasian-Latino, and one participant (*n = 1*) identified as Indo-European, Native American, Cajun/Creole, and Ashkenazic Jew. Table 1, below, illustrates the basic demographics. To maintain confidentiality, all participants were provided with pseudonyms.

Table 1

Basic Demographics

Participant	Age	Gender	Identified Race/Ethnicity
Oliver	50	Male	Caucasian
Clay	42	Male	Caucasian
Sydney	71	Male	Caucasian
Sophie	33	Female	Caucasian
Lucy	39	Female	Caucasian
Ben	55	Male	Indo-European, Native American, Cajun/Creole, Ashkenazic Jew
Camille	33	Female	Caucasian- Latino

All participants (*N* = 7) were faculty of CACREP-accredited counseling track programs, with a minimum of two-years of experience. Years of experience working in a CACREP-counseling track program for participants ranged from two years to 22-years of experience (*M* = 7.21, *SD* = 6.17). Participants held a diverse range of faulty ranks. Five participants (n = 5) reported that they held a title of Assistant Professor, one participant (*n = 1*) reported that he held a title of Full Professor, and one participant (*n = 1*) reported that she held a title of Instructor. Participants also reported that they taught a wide-array of courses. Table 2, below illustrates participants reported rank, years of experience

teaching in a CACREP-counseling track program, and a sample of courses taught by participants.

Table 2

Experience

Participant	Faculty Rank	Yrs. Experience Teaching in a CACREP Program	Courses Taught
Oliver	Assistant Professor	9	Introduction to Play therapy, Creative and Experiential approaches in Trauma-Informed Counseling, Adventure-based counseling, Child & Adolescent counseling, Counseling Skills and strategies, Substance Abuse, Research
Clay	Assistant Professor	5	Legal and Ethical Issues in Counseling, Lifespan, Counseling Techniques Counseling Families, Counseling At-Risk Populations Crisis Intervention Substance Abuse and Addictions, Internship
Sydney	Full Professor	22	Orientation to Counseling, Family Counseling, Group Counseling, Internship,
Sophie	Assistant Professor	2	Foundations of Clinical Mental Health Counseling Ethics & Legal Issues Lifestyle & Career Counseling Counseling Skills Advanced Clinical Practices Gender & Sexuality
Lucy	Assistant Professor	2.5	Behavior Disorders, Career Counseling, Trauma and Crisis, Practicum, Internship, Psychopharmacology, Group Counseling

Ben	Assistant Professor	7	Behavior Pathology Conceptualization and Treatment Planning, Counseling Practicum Measurement and Evaluation, Research Methodology Sexual Minority Issues in Counseling Theories of Counseling
Camille	Instructor	3	Clinical Mental Health Counseling Internship, Counseling Practicum, Group Counseling

All participants (N = 7) were actively using a creative teaching approach at the time of the Interview, and all reported that they had been using a creative approach since they began teaching in their faculty positions, or prior to that time. Participants' years of experience teaching using a creative teaching approach ranged from two years to 41-years of experience (M = 9.83, SD = 33.9) All participants were familiar with creative teaching literature, and most had made contributions by sharing their creative teaching ideas at workshops, or through publications. Table 3, below, illustrates participants' years of experience using a creative teaching approach, and contributions made sharing their creative teaching ideas.

Table 3

Experience and Contributions

Participant	Yrs. Experience Using a Creative Teaching Approach	Creative Teaching Contributions
Oliver	9	Association of Counselor Education and Supervision, Canadian Counselling Association and Psychotherapy, International Association for Counselling, North Atlantic Region Association for Counselor Education and Supervision, North Central Association for Counselor Education and Supervision, Rocky Mountain Association for Counselor Education and Supervision, Southern Association for Counselor Education and Supervision, Western Association for Counselor Education and Supervision
Clay	7	Journal of Creativity in Mental Health, Association for Creativity in Counseling, Association for Counselor Education and Supervision, American Counseling Association, Southern Association for Counselor Education and Supervision, Association for Spiritual, Ethical, and Religious Values in Counseling
Sydney	41	Journal of Counseling and Development; Journal for Specialists in Group Work; The Family Journal; Journal for Humanistic Counseling; Journal of Creativity in Mental Health; Journal of Mental Health Counseling; The School Counselor
Sophie	2	Indiana Counseling Association, Association for Counselor Education and Supervision and the Christian Association for Psychological Studies.
Lucy	2.5	None
Ben	7	Serves on Editorial Board for Journal of Creativity in Mental Health
Camille	3	Association for Creativity in Co International Association of Marriage and Family Counselors, Mississippi Counseling Association

Data Collection

The researcher chose interviews as the primary data collection method since it is best suited for capturing in-depth experiential understanding of human phenomena (Van Manen, 1990). Interviews are also another method used in qualitative research to obtain data saturation, since interviews allow an opportunity for the researcher to obtain rich descriptions from research participants (Marshall & Rossman, 2016). Phenomenological interviews are framed to capture participants lived experiences in-depth. Subsequently, interview questions focus on both the past and present experiences that participants have with the phenomenon, and how those experiences have guided their actions and interactions (Marshall & Rossman, 2016). The interviews were tape recorded with a digital tape recorder. A back up digital tape recorder was also utilized as a security measure. All interviews were transcribed verbatim in preparation for data analysis.

Recruitment

After the researcher obtained approval from the Institutional Review Board (IRB), she recruited a total of seven participants. To begin the recruitment process, the researcher sent out recruitment emails, which included a brief description of the study and participant criteria. Initial emails were sent to counselor educators whom she had met through networking at previous conferences, such as ACES, who had identified their interest in creative teaching. The emails were also forwarded to individuals who had contributed to the literature on creativity in counseling, and/or creative teaching in counselor education. A recruitment email was also sent to individuals who served on the editorial board of the *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health*. Referrals were also made

by participants who responded with interest to the study. Subsequently, the researcher sent recruitment emails to referred potential participants. A copy of the recruitment emails is included in the appendix of this dissertation.

Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria

Participants for the study were selected if they met the following criteria: (a) the participant has an interest in creative pedagogy and/or the use of creative teaching approaches in counselor education; (b) the participant teaches MA courses and/or doctoral level courses in a counseling department that is CACREP accredited; (c) the participant is familiar with creative teaching as an approach to pedagogy, as evidenced by familiarity with current literature available for creative teaching and creative teaching strategies (i.e. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health: Creativity in the Classroom, or any others relevant to creative teaching in education*); (d) the participant reports using creative teaching approaches and strategies as a part of their pedagogical framework; and/or has made contributions through writing, presentations, or workshops describing their creative approaches to teaching (e) the participant has a minimum of two years teaching experience with counselors in training as a faculty member of a university (excluding experiences in teaching internships, or graduate assistantships), and (f) the participant is willing to talk about their experiences of being creative in the classroom.

Participants were not selected if they meet any of the following exclusion criteria: (a) the participant is faculty of a non-counseling track program; (b) the participant has less than two years' experience teaching counselor educators; (c) the participant is uncertain about whether s/he engages in creative teaching practices.

Obtaining Informed Consent and Demographic Information

After participants were recruited the researcher emailed participants an informed consent document:

1. Participants were provided with a description of the study and its purpose.
2. Participants were informed that they may withdraw from the study at any time without penalty.
3. Participants were provided with a description of what they will be asked to do and the projected length of time that their engagement would be required.
4. Participants were notified of all potential risks and benefits of the study.
5. Participants were notified of all data collection methods.
6. Participants were notified that data remain confidential, with an explanation of circumstances in which confidentiality may be breached.
7. Participants were informed that their transcribed interviews would be made available, and that they would be provided with an opportunity to ensure accuracy of the information they provided.
8. Participants were informed that data interpretations, an explanation of the results and findings would be made available upon their request.
9. Participants were provided with the contact information of the researcher's committee chair, whom they could contact regarding the study, or researcher conduct at any point throughout the study.

Participants were asked to read through the document to ensure they understand the requirements, risks, and benefits of the study (see Appendix D, *Informed Consent*). Participants were asked to sign the document, scan, and email it back to the researcher. The researcher printed the document, and placed the consent form in a file, in a secure cabinet, discussed in further detail in the data management section of this proposal. The researcher also emailed a demographic questionnaire to research participants, asking them to identify the following information: ethnicity, gender, sex, age, and faculty rank. Identifying information was also kept in the secure file cabinet.

Interviews and Interview Setting

Once participants were recruited, the researcher scheduled and conducted individual interviews. The researcher conducted interviews via Skype, to increase accessibility of a diverse group of counselor educators who lived in various states across the country. Interviews occurred in a quiet space, such as the home or business office of research participants.

Interview Questions

The researcher designed a set of concrete interview questions that are rooted in the transcendental framework (Moustakas, 1994) of phenomenological inquiry:

1. When do you remember learning to be creative?
2. When did you first notice that you were accessing creativity, or using a creative strategy in the classroom? What did you notice about yourself and your students at the time?

3. How would you describe/define the act of creative teaching?
4. What contexts or situations have impacted or affected your experiences with creative teaching?
5. What does it feel like to be in a creative teaching moment?
6. Talk to me about creative acts that you have fully experienced. What have you learned in these instances of creativity?
7. What do you perceive students have learned in these creative teaching moments?
8. What can you share about your learning that may help other counselor educators?
9. Is there anything further that you would like to share?

Interview Transcription

After each participant completed an interview, the researcher transcribed the interview verbatim and reviewed it for accuracy in preparation for the first member check and data analysis. Accurate transcriptions are important because they assist in enhancing the studies credibility (Marshall & Rossman, 2016). Simple errors in punctuation could produce discrepancies or change the participants' intended meaning, thus compromising the reliability of the results (Marshall & Rossman, 2016). To avoid these types of errors, the verbatim transcripts were made available to research participants during the member check. The verbatim transcripts were also made available to the researcher's committee chair, methodologist, and the external auditor.

Data Management

To ensure participant confidentiality, data management was an important element to consider as a part of ethical practice. In this study, the researcher kept electronic files of the audio, and typed verbatim transcripts in electronic files labeled with pseudonyms. Identifying information of research participants was not kept in electronic files. The researcher kept signed informed consent forms, and participants contact information in a secure file cabinet, located in a secure room of the researcher's home office. To stay organized, easily locate, and access information, the researcher kept electronic files related to the study in separate file folders. Electronic files were also saved on a back-up drive for additional security. The back-up drive was kept in the secure file cabinet.

During the data analysis stages of research, the researcher utilized tables and charts to organize the findings. The researcher's reflective journal, and documents associated with an audit trail, discussed momentarily, were also stored in electronic files. Any hard copies that the researcher chose to print, such as verbatim transcripts and/or charts and tables used during the data analysis process were also kept in the secure file cabinet.

Credibility and Trustworthiness Measures

Trustworthiness and credibility are vital elements of qualitative research (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). Trustworthiness measures involve the strategies the researcher uses to ensure the truthfulness, accuracy, applicability, consistency, and neutrality of the findings (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). In this study, the researcher established trustworthiness by

applying several trustworthiness strategies: a research journal, member checks, imagination variation, and an audit trail.

Research Journal

The researcher kept a *research journal* throughout the entire course of the study. Research journals, used in qualitative research are beneficial for keeping track of autobiographical notes, such as descriptive reflective notes about the research, and analytic memos (Glesne, 2011). The researcher included both reflective notes and analytic memos. Reflective notes include personal impressions, ideas, feelings, and/or hunches that the researcher has throughout the course of the study about the phenomenon. Analytic memos include speculations and interpretations about what the researcher believes s/he is learning throughout the course of the study from research participants (Glesne, 2011). Analytic memos also provide an outlet for recording original thoughts that might otherwise be lost, thus freeing the researchers mind for new perspectives (Glesne, 2011).

Another advantage of keeping the research journal is that it may aid in enhancing researcher reflexivity. Reflexivity in qualitative research is the researcher's ability to critically reflect on how the researcher, participants, setting, and accompanying research processes impact, influence, and interact with each other (Glesne, 2011). Reflexivity is essential in qualitative research to increase awareness of researcher bias that may impact the research process. The research journal served as an important reference point during the data analysis stages of the research, to assist in addressing researcher bias. The researcher's methodologist and external auditor also had access to the researcher's

journal at that time. The researcher dated all recordings entered in the research journal, and notes the stage of the research process that the researcher was currently in at the time of entry. As previously mentioned, the researcher included the *epoche* (Moustakas, 1994) in the research journal prior to the data collection phases of the study. The researcher also kept track of the following items and documented in the research journal in preparation for the external audit: (a) all research activity, including dates and times when interviews and member checks occur; (b) all other documented information related to the researcher's intention, including imagination variation, discussed later in this section.

Member Checks

Third, the researcher conducted two *member checks* during the study. Member checks are conducted by other members involved in the research. They are frequently used in qualitative research to verify or confirm the researcher's interpretations, assess for sufficiency of data, correct errors, examine researcher intentions, assess for bias, or challenge the researcher by offering new or alternate perspectives (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). The researcher held the first member check with participants during the preliminary data analysis stage to confirm accuracy of the verbatim transcriptions. The second member check was conducted to confirm accuracy of the identification of significant statements. Additionally, the researcher scheduled and conducted regular debriefing meetings with her methodologist while she engaged in the data analysis phases of research.

Imagination Variation

Fourth, the researcher continued to adhere to the transcendental philosophy that she would maintain a fresh perspective through *Imagination Variation* (Moustakas, 1994). Imagination variation is important during the thematic phases of data analysis, and is considered another strategy for addressing and preventing researcher bias. The process involves the following steps: (a) vary possible structural meanings derived from textural meanings; (b) vary the possible perspectives that explain the materialization of the phenomena (i.e. vary vantage points, vary roles, consider opposite meanings; (c) consider the universal structures that may give rise to the phenomenon such as time, space, or bodily concerns; (d) look for examples that vividly illuminate the themes, and identify the structural qualities of the experience (Moustakas, 1994). During this phase of data analysis, the researcher created reflective notes and research memos that describe how she reached specific conclusions. She recorded these memos in the research journal.

Audit Trail

Last, the researcher established an *audit trail* throughout the course of the study. Audit trails are used in qualitative research to account for all data and research design decisions so that the logic behind interpretations and representations is transparent to others (Marshall & Rossman, 2016). In this study, the researcher kept track of the following items, recommended by Lincoln and Guba (1985): (a) raw data; (b) research activities; (c) research decisions; (d) data collection procedures; (e) materials prepared for the audit, including the research journal; (f) verification documentation: (g) data reduction and analysis products, and (h) materials related to researcher intentions. The

researcher provided the external auditor with audit packages for review throughout each phase of data analysis. The external auditor reviewed all materials provided, and provided her with a letter to confirm the research findings and interpretations. The letter is included in the appendix of this dissertation.

Data Saturation

In qualitative research, researchers must reach data saturation. Part of this entails receiving an adequate amount of data, which can be obtained through sample size (Creswell, 2013). Morse (1994) recommends a minimum of six participants in phenomenological research, and that data saturation is typically reached with no more than 12 participants. Data saturation is achieved through a process of reduction whereby the researcher considers all possible data interpretations to explain the phenomenon. When the researcher has determined that new themes and material are no longer emerging from the data, s/he has reached data saturation, and research can come to an end (Morse, 1995). When researchers meet data saturation the study is considered credible and the results may be transferable (Marshall & Rossman, 2016). In this study, the researcher reached data saturation with seven participants.

Ethical Considerations

For research studies involving human participants, it is essential that researchers protect the rights of participants and ensure that they do not put participants at risk (Creswell, 2013). The researcher maintained ethical research practices, and took appropriate measures to ensure the protection, autonomy, integrity, morals, and values of research participants. Establishing trust and maintaining rapport with research

participants was an important part of this process (Glesne, 2011). To protect the rights of participants the researcher implemented the safeguards previously described in the informed consent section of this dissertation. All participants signed the informed consent to confirm that they had a full understanding of the potential risks and benefits of the study, prior to the date of their scheduled interview. A copy of the informed consent is attached to the appendix of this dissertation.

Data Analysis

The researcher chose to interpret data using Moustakas (1994) modification of the Van Kaam method for interpreting phenomenological data. The approach includes several steps which will be described in further detail: identify and list significant statements, eliminate irrelevant statements, identify clusters and associated themes, final verification of themes, individual textural-structural descriptions, identification of themes across participants, and the integrated identification of the essence of the experience. Participant member checks were embedded in the process, and are also described.

Member Check One

After the researcher, transcribed each interview she conducted the first member check. In this stage, the researcher securely emailed the verbatim transcripts to participants and asked them to verify if the verbatim transcription accurately depicted their experience. Participants were given a maximum of two weeks to read through the individual transcripts. Participants were instructed to highlight areas of the transcript that do not depict their experience, and clarify any interpretations in the comments section of

the word document, next to each highlighted area. Participants were instructed to send the verbatim transcription back without edits, if it accurately depicted their experience.

Identify Significant Statements

Next the researcher took each verbatim transcript and highlighted all verbatim quotes that appear relevant to the experience of creative teaching, as described by the research participants. After highlighting each transcript, she extracted the verbatim highlighted areas from each verbatim transcript, one at a time, without altering them in any way. After the researcher identified all significant statements in the individual verbatim transcript, she organized them by placing them into a table so that they were separated from the transcript. The table was labeled with the participant's pseudonym (also identified on the transcript) to maintain organization. She conducted this procedure for each individual, highlighted, verbatim transcript. Moustakas (1994) also labeled this process: *horizontalization*. To approach this process, the researcher, was required to remain free of judgment by remaining receptive to all statements (Moustakas, 1994).

Eliminate Irrelevant Statements

Next the researcher reviewed each table that held the verbatim significant statements. She read each statement and asked herself two questions: (a) Does the statement capture a component of the experience that is necessary for understanding creative teaching? (b) Can the statement be labeled (Moustakas, 1994)? If the statement met both criteria, then the researcher kept it in the table. If the statement did not meet either criteria, it was removed from the table. Vague, overlapping, or redundant statements were also removed from the table. Moustakas (1994) also identified this

process as the reduction and elimination phase of data analysis. The remaining significant statements were considered the unique features of the participants lived experience that allow us to understand the phenomena and its meaning as perceived by participants. In this study, the remaining statements were considered the unique features that depict the experience of creative teaching. Moustakas (1994) labeled the remaining significant statements the *horizons of the experience*.

Member Check Two

Next, the researcher sent the completed tables, that held the remaining significant statements, to each corresponding individual participant. Participants were instructed to review the table of significant statements to determine if the statements accurately reflected the participants' experience of creative teaching. Participants were instructed to add significant statements that were not captured by the researcher, from the verbatim transcript, and cross out significant statements that do not capture the significance of the experience of creative teaching. Participants were given a maximum of two weeks to complete this task. After participants returned their results, the researcher created a revised chart for each participant that reflected each participant's revisions.

Identify Clusters and Associated Themes

Next, the researcher examined the tables created for each individual participant, to determine which statements had similar features and could be grouped together. The researcher grouped significant statements, otherwise known as meaning units, together if they had similar features. She created new charts that held each established grouping, otherwise known as a clustered unit (Moustakas, 1994). After that, the researcher

determined a theme that captured the overall essence of each clustered unit. Each cluster was labeled with a chosen theme. The labeled clusters, with their attached meaning units represent the core themes of the experience (Moustakas, 1994). In this study, they represent the essence of the experience of creative teaching.

Final Verification of Themes

Thereafter, the researcher took each clustered unit and compared it to each participant's individual verbatim transcript in their entirety. Next, she determined that specific criteria are met: (a) the researcher can confirm that the themes and accompanying significant statements, included in the clustered units, are explicitly expressed in the complete script; (b) the researcher can confirm that if the themes and accompanying significant statements included in the clustered unit are not explicitly expressed, they are compatible (Moustakas, 1994). If both the themes and accompanying significant statements included in the clustered units were neither explicitly expressed in the complete records, nor compatible they were considered irrelevant to the participants' experience (Moustakas, 1994). Subsequently, they were not used to determine the core features of participants experience, and were removed. If significant statements in a clustered unit were explicitly expressed or compatible, but the theme was not explicitly expressed or compatible the researcher generated a new theme that was compatible or explicitly expressed. After this process was complete, the researcher confirmed that the remaining clustered units and associated themes were the core features of the participants experience of creative teaching. Next, the researcher sent verified themes to the

methodologist and external auditor to determine errors, provided feedback, and confirm final verification of themes.

Individual Textural-Structural Descriptions

After the associated themes, were validated, the researcher assembled *individual textural-structural descriptions* for each participant (Moustakas, 1994). An individual textural-structural description is an integrated representation of what each participant experienced and how each participant depicted their experience of creative teaching. The final textural-structural narrative incorporates the themes and overall essence of the experience as expressed in the significant statements identified in the clustered units by each participant. The textural-structural narratives include verbatim examples from the transcribed interview. After completing the Individual-Textural Descriptions for all participants, the researcher sent them to her methodologist to check for errors and provide feedback. An exemplar including, the Individual-Textural Descriptions process was also sent to the external auditor for review. An example of an Individual-Textural Description is provided in the appendix of this dissertation.

Identification of Themes Across Participants

Next the researcher took the charts holding themes and associated clustered units of each individual participant and began comparing themes across charts to determine commonalities across participants. Thereafter, the researcher began grouping common themes together, and placed them in new charts. Meaning units across research participants were placed underneath common themes in the new charts. To verify themes the researcher confirmed that specific criteria were met: (a) the researcher

can confirm that the themes and accompanying meaning units, included in the groupings across participants are explicitly expressed among participants, (b) the researcher can confirm that if the themes and accompanying meaning units included in the grouping are not explicitly expressed, they are compatible (Moustakas, 1994). If both the themes and accompanying meaning units included in the groupings were neither explicitly expressed across participants, nor compatible they were considered irrelevant to the essence of the experience (Moustakas, 1994). Subsequently, they were not used to determine the core features of the experience, and were removed. If significant statements in a grouping were explicitly expressed or compatible, but the theme was not explicitly expressed or compatible the researcher generated a new theme that was compatible or explicitly expressed. After this process was complete, the researcher sent verified themes to the methodologist and external auditor to determine errors, provided feedback, and confirm final verification of themes across participants.

Integrated Description of the Essence of the Experience

Finally, using the individual textural-structural descriptions, the researcher developed an integrated composite description that reflects all participants' experience of creative teaching. This integrated narrative includes all the themes identified in the study that emerged from the data. It represents the overall essence of the experience of creative teaching across participants. Moustakas (1994) asserted that this final description should represent the group in its entirety. The description of themes section of chapter four of this dissertation represents the integrated description of the essence of the experience of creative teaching.

Presentation of the Results

The results of the study are summarized and visually represented. The findings include participant demographics, unique participant characteristics, and an explanation of themes and associated sub-themes. Visual representations include tables that are organized and sequenced in a logical manner. All data representations include preliminary and primary data analysis results, including samples of direct quotes taken from the verbatim transcripts of research participants.

Chapter 4

Results

Counselor Educators Self-Reported Experiences of Creative Teaching

This qualitative study is rooted in phenomenological inquiry, utilizing an adapted version of the transcendental method of data analysis developed by Moustakas (1994). The researcher sought to capture the essence of creative teaching by identifying the commonalities among a purposefully sampled group of counselor educators that illustrate the structure and process of creative teaching. The purpose of this study was to examine the primary research question, what are counselor educator's self-reported experiences of creative teaching? The researcher also posed the following sub-questions: a) what do counselor educators notice as they engage in creative teaching endeavors; (b) how do they experience the act of creative teaching, and (c) how do they perceive themselves as being creative in their teaching?

Data analysis involved several elements: (a) verbatim transcription, (b) member verification of verbatim transcription, (c) identification of significant statements (i.e. meaning units), (d) member verification of significant statements, (e) identification of

clusters and associated themes, (f) individual-textural structural descriptions, and (g) identification of themes across participants. The results of this phenomenological study are presented in this chapter. To begin, participants' relevant characteristics are provided. Thereafter, four overarching themes are illustrated that represent the collective experience of participants. These four overarching themes depict the structure and process of creative teaching.

Participant Individual Characteristics

Before presenting the results of counselor educators' collective experience with creative teaching in the classroom, the researcher presents the unique characteristics of each participant. Participants were purposefully sampled for this study. In other words, the researcher sought to obtain participants with experience using a creative teaching approach in the classroom. Participant characteristics are described below to highlight the unique features that made each participant a credible and reliable source.

Oliver

Oliver is a fifty-year old Caucasian male. He is an Assistant Professor in a CACREP-accredited counseling track program, and has been teaching for nine years. Oliver was both the first participant, and the first Counselor Educator who expressed interest in the study during the recruitment phase. The researcher had previously met Oliver at a conference for the Association for Counselor Education and Supervision, where she learned about his interest in creative teaching. Oliver has taught a wide variety of courses including *Play Therapy, Trauma-Informed Counseling, Adventure-Based Counseling, Child and Adolescent Counseling, Substance abuse, Assessment*, and

Scholarship in Counselor Education, to name a few. Oliver reported that he has used a creative teaching approach in his courses for all nine years that he has been a counselor educator. He also reported that he has presented his creative teaching ideas at various conferences such as, the Association for Counselor Education and Supervision (ACES), Canadian Counseling Association and Psychotherapy, and the International Association for Counseling.

During the interview, Oliver expressed his passion for teaching creatively, part of which was inspired by his past personal experiences engaging in creative endeavors. Oliver was trained to be a musician in college, a part of his life that he reported he felt passionate about. Oliver also reported that he is passionate about the arts. He enjoys using creative arts in the classroom, as a creative teaching intervention, discussed in further detail later in this chapter.

Clay

Clay is a 42-year old Caucasian male. He was the second participant interviewed in the study. The researcher became aware of Clay after discovering some of his published work. Clay responded promptly to the recruitment email, expressing enthusiasm about his participation, given his own prior research in creative teaching. Clay is an Assistant professor, who has taught in a CACREP counseling track program for five years. Clay has taught a wide variety of courses, some of which include, *Legal and Ethical Issues in Counseling, Counseling Diverse Populations, Counseling Across the Lifespan, Counseling Techniques, and Internship.* Clay reported that he has used a creative teaching approach in his courses for a total of 7 years, two years of which

include his time teaching during his doctoral training program. Clay reported that he has conducted research in creative teaching and has published his articles in the *Journal of Creativity and Mental Health.* He also reported that he has presented his creative teaching ideas at various conferences, including the American Counseling Association (ACA), the Association for Creativity in Counseling (ACC), and the Association for Counselor Education and Supervision (ACES).

Clay is also passionate about creative teaching. During the interview, he reported that he remains open to change and growth both personally, and professionally as a creative teacher. He reported that he is constantly challenging himself to come up with new ideas, or find other creative ways to approach the classroom. Clay reported that he regularly attends conferences conducted by the Association for Creativity in Counseling to help him maintain a fresh perspective, and connect with other creative people. He finds that in doing so, he is both sharing with others, learning from others.

Sydney

Sydney is a 71-one year old Caucasian male. He was the third participant interviewed in the study. The researcher previously met Sydney at an ACES conference, where she attended one of his presentations, and discovered he was familiar with creativity in counseling and creative teaching. He responded promptly with interest during the recruitment phase of the study. Sydney is a full Professor, and has been teaching in a CACREP counseling track program for 22 years. He reported that he has primarily taught *Orientation to Counseling, Family Counseling, Group Counseling*, and *Internship*. Sydney reported that he has shared both his creativity in counseling ideas, as

well as his creative teaching ideas in several journals such as the *Journal of Counseling and Development, Journal for Specialists in Group Work, Journal of Mental Health in Counseling*, and the *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health*. Sydney reported that he has been using a creative teaching approach in both the classroom and supervision since the mid-1970's.

Sydney reported that he worked in a counseling clinic for several years before ever stepping foot in a classroom. His passion for creativity began in the clinic arena, where he discovered how helpful creative interventions can be for helping clients move toward change. At that time, Sydney reported that he began writing prose and stories about his clients, and sharing his creative ideas in the literature. Sydney's experiences being creative in the clinic later transferred into his work as an instructor, and supervisor, training novice counselors.

Sophie

Sophie is 33-year old Caucasian female. She was the fourth participant to participate in the study. The researcher became aware of Sophie through Oliver, who referred her when he was recruited. Sophie has been teaching in a CACREP counseling track program for two years. She reported that she has taught several courses including *Counseling Skills, Ethics and Legal Issues, Lifestyle and Career Counseling, Gender and Sexuality,* to name a few. Sophie reported that she has been using a creative teaching approach since her doctoral teaching program, which would equal a total of four years. Sophie reported that she has also presented her creative teaching ideas for the Indiana Counseling Association, ACES, and the Christian Association for Psychological Studies.

During the interview, Sophie highlighted her passion for creativity. She reported that creativity is one of her personal strengths. She gave the researcher an example of her keen sense for aesthetics, remarking that she prefers Prezi over PowerPoint, Sophie also reported that she is passionate about the creative arts. She called attention to this fact by relaying to the researcher that she was late for the interview because she was caught up with her favorite show, *So You Think You Can Dance*. She shared with the researcher that the show became a source of inspiration for a new creative teaching intervention, discussed later in this chapter.

Lucy

Lucy is a 39-year old Caucasian female. She was the fifth participant to participate in the study. The researcher was already familiar with Lucy as a previous counseling colleague. Subsequently, the researcher was aware of her role as instructor at a nearby University. Lucy has been teaching in a CACREP counseling track program for 2.5 years. She reported that she has taught a variety of courses, some of which include, *Behavior Disorders, Career Counseling, Trauma and Crisis*, *Practicum*, and *Psychopharmacology*. She has not yet shared her creative teaching ideas in journals, or at workshops, but is familiar with creative teaching literature such as that which is provided in the *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health*. Lucy reported that she has been using a creative teaching approach for 2.5 years.

During the interview, Lucy reported that her passion to teach creatively is due in part to her experiences in graduate school. She reported that she was working a full-time job while attending graduate school. This made it difficult for her to stay engaged in class

lectures. “I was wondering if I was going to be able to stay awake. Maybe not because the content wasn’t interesting, but because I’d probably put in an eight to ten-hour day before I sat through class in the evenings.” Subsequently, Lucy reported that the memory stuck with her when she began teaching, and she sought to find creative ways to engage students.

Ben

Ben is a 55-year-old Indo-European male. He also identifies with the following ethnicities: Native American, Cajon/Creole, and Ashkenazic Jew. Ben was the sixth participant interviewed for the study. The researcher recruited him from the *Journal of Creativity* and *Mental Health*, when she discovered that he was one of the members of the editorial board for the journal. Ben is an Assistant Professor for a CACREP counseling track program. He has been teaching counseling courses for seven years, and reported that he is applying for tenure in August of 2017. Ben reported that he has taught an extensive variety of counseling courses over the years, some of which include, *Behavior Psychology, Conceptualization and Treatment Planning, Research Methodology*, and *Sexual Minority Issues in Counseling*. Ben reported that he has used a creative teaching approach for all seven years in which he has taught.

During the interview, Ben reported that he has tried to replicate the things he valued in his previous instructors, while avoiding the things that he did not value as a student. Ben stressed that he does not want to become “that boring professor,” and that he has the desire to continue to grow and develop as a creative teacher. Subsequently, he reported that he is constantly challenging himself to discover ways in which he can

promote more student engagement and connection in the classroom. Ben reported that he is not only passionate about his work in creativity, but that he is committed to doing his best. "The most important thing I've learned is never to stop doing this…I'm committed to a lifelong notion of creativity." Ben reported that to maintain this attitude he recognizes that he must remain open to all new things presented in the academic arena, including technology, and student ideas.

Camille

Camille is a 33-year old Caucasian-Latino female. She was the seventh participant to participate in the study. The researcher became aware of Camille's interest in creative teaching from Clay, who referred her as a potential participant for the study. Camille has been an Instructor for a CACREP counseling track program for three years. Camille has taught *Clinical Mental Health Counseling Internship, Counseling Practicum,* and *Group Counseling*. She has presented her creative teaching ideas at conferences including the Association for Creativity in Counseling, International Association of Marriage and Family Counselors, and the Mississippi Counseling Association. Camille reported that she has been using a creative teaching approach for the entire three years that she has been a faculty member.

During the interview, Camille expressed that she has always recognized her ability to be creative, and that others have recognized her creative talents as well. For example, she reported that she was labeled, "the creative person" in workplace environments. "I don't understand why I, you know, I got this kind of super power thing in creativity." Camille reported that while it may be natural for her to be creative, she

believes she must continue to challenge herself to try new things. She reported that she attends trainings, such as those conducted by members of the Association for Creativity in Counseling, where she can learn more about how she can be creative in the classroom.

Summary of Participants

Participants in this study had a vested interest in creative teaching, and used a creative teaching approach in the classroom. While each participant had a unique experience of their own to share about creative teaching, it was evident that there were common threads that reflected the overall process and structure of creative teaching. The remainder of this chapter illustrates the common themes and sub themes that emerged across participants.

Overarching Themes

Six themes were uncovered during data analysis: (a) creative teaching is shaped by past experiences, (b) creative teaching promotes student engagement, (c) creative teaching is not cliché, (d) creative teaching is more than didactic, (e) creative teaching requires risk taking, and (f) creative teaching requires openness. The remainder of this chapter illustrates the primary themes and supporting sub-themes that depict the essence of creative teaching as described across participants.

Theme 1: Creative teaching is shaped by past experiences.

The idea that creative teaching is shaped by past experiences was evident across participants (N = 7/7). Past experiences in childhood, young adulthood, graduate training experiences, and work were listed among participants as primary time-periods in which they remembered learning to be creative. For example, Ben, Clay, and Oliver recalled

engaging in creative endeavors in childhood where they used their imagination to entertain themselves and play. Ben, recalled making toys out of carburetor screws and other machine parts in his father's shop as a child, which he reported made him recognize that he was always "fairly creative." Oliver remembered that he would go out into the woods as a child and make things out of the materials he found. Sophie found herself attempting to paint "like an artist," a feat that she reported she believed was "magical" at the time. Clay remembered using his imagination to become different characters in play, or painting rocks by a stream. For Clay, Sophie, Ben, and Oliver, these early memories not only marked the beginning of their creative curiosity, but also stuck with them through adulthood as reminders of their creative potential.

It was also evident, that participants' positive experiences being creative influenced their confidence in their creative ability. Camille stressed that the positive re-enforcement she received as a child positively impacted her confidence in her creative ability. When she was sent to gifted school, she recognized that while she was talented in the visual arts, they were not the only way she could express herself creatively. Camille reported that the instructors in her class for the gifted challenged her to approach all her assignments in creative ways. On the contrary, Oliver reported that there was a time when he suppressed his creativity after an art teacher had discouraged him in the third grade. He regained his confidence later in young adulthood, when he discovered his talent for playing music. During the interview, he highlighted his positive experiences as a musician in college. He reported that at the time, he felt passionate about his ability to express himself through the music that he played, and found that he received positive re-

enforcement from others. “I enjoyed being able to make music and see people's response to it. It just kind of spoke to me on a very personal level.” For, Oliver, and Camille, these experiences demonstrate how positive re-enforcement impacted their confidence in their ability to be creative.

Sydney identified early career experiences as a time in which he began to pursue a creative identity. Sydney began working in a counseling clinic shortly after graduation, which he reported was the starting point of his creative adventures in counseling. While working in the clinic, Sydney began to realize that he needed to take a non-traditional approach to reach his clients. He reported that although he felt versed in the use of various counseling theories, that his clients were not always compliant. At that point, he realized that he needed to try something different. Sydney also noticed that clients were bringing in poetry, literature, and music to describe their thoughts and feelings. Subsequently, he began encouraging them to continue, and began discovering other ways to use creativity in his work to help clients move toward change. These early experiences later transferred into Sydney’s classroom, where he began using creative interventions to help students develop into creative counselors.

Clay also illustrated how past work experiences re-enforced his desire to take a creative approach in his teaching. At the time of the interview, Clay reported that he is not fond of expectations and strict agendas because he believes it restricts him from freely expressing himself creatively in his work. He recalled an experience he had as a guest teacher at a university, where he was given a detailed agenda of how to go about teaching the course, to which he refused.

> And he said, what do you mean no? I said, I'm not going to do this. He's like, what are you going to do? I said I'm going to walk in the class and see what they need, and respond. He's like, you can't do that. I went, I can't do it your way so we're stuck. Either you're teaching and you don't have a list, or you're going to let me walk in the room… and it was off to the races from that point on.

The experience contributed to his belief that limitations are no place for creativity in the classroom.

It is evident that participants' experiences in youth and early career life influenced their creative ability, and desire to teach creatively in the classroom. As the researcher examined the theme and subsequent data further, she uncovered two subthemes that support the overarching theme that creative teaching is shaped by past experiences: (a) creative teaching requires knowledge, and (b) role models influence creative teaching. Table 4, below, displays theme one, sub themes, and a sample of the attached meaning units provided across participants.

Table 4

Theme One with Sub-Themes and Sample of Associated Meaning Units

Main Theme	Sub-theme	Subtheme
Creative teaching is shaped by past experiences.	**Creative teaching requires knowledge.**	**Role models influence creative teaching.**
Meaning Units: I guess it was staying with the music, that's where it really, it was, and just something that stuck with me. It was kind of a passion thing. I enjoyed being able to make music and see people's response to it. It just kind of spoke to me on a very personal level.	Meaning Units: A good place to start is by, you know, educating yourself on, on creative practices, you know.	Meaning Units: I've found my people, and being around other people, knowing that you're not alone in the way that you're going to try to teach can be remarkably freeing. It may be hard to do it on your own, but there are people out there who will support you in these kinds of endeavors.
I, imagine as a little child. My father owned a machine shop, um, which grew into a large corporation. And, um, I used to take the machine parts like carburetor set screws, valve guides, piston rods, and piston heads. I used to take all	I had a class in instructional methods. And, we went over Bloom's taxonomy of Bloom's - Revised taxonomy. And, we went over McKeachie's, teaching methods of hooking and holding, and teaching around the wheel. And, we went over all of those things in my PhD program. But, a lot of professors that I have run into, they were never taught how to teach. And so, I was kind of lucky that the professors I had, had been taught how to teach.	The professor had said to a student, hey I really liked your reaction paper, would it be okay if I shared it? And the student said sure no problem, and they posted it, and I'm like alright let me see what she wrote. And I opened it up and it was so unlike what I had done, I realized that when he meant it was your reaction just do whatever it is you want, I was like wait, I can do that!?

of those different things and make toys out of them.		
I started writing impressions that were a bit poetic, and metaphorical about my clients.	There's actually a book out there on creative and experiential activities for teaching lifestyle and career. And I bought that book, well I used my professional development funds to buy it.	A former professor of mine…what he did is he had a little experiment that he did, for us as a learning experiment. And, he used to use words all of time like, 'let's engage in a thought experiment.' And, it sort of primes you, you know. Oh, this is an experiment, it's a thought experiment. We're not just talking. It's sort of a creative process; juices are starting to flow.

Creative teaching requires knowledge. Participants ($n = 6$) reported that being creative in the classroom requires knowledge; that instructors seek out resources, or receive training to enhance their awareness, and develop their creative ability. Oliver for example, reported that he needs to be familiar and comfortable with the creative modalities he is using in the classroom. He recommended that instructors receive training, supervision, or consultation when they are bringing new creative teaching interventions into the classroom. Oliver sought training in sandtray, for example, an approach that he has grown fond of. Oliver also reported that he has learned from other

individuals who are trained in the expressive therapies. He frequently attends workshops or other training seminars to enhance his awareness about creative approaches. The training Oliver receives in a variety of creative modalities assists him in approaching both the classroom and supervision in innovative ways. "It really has opened up so many doors, as far as the way I work with students." For Oliver, it is important to learn, and develop his creative ability by continuing to seek out training.

Ben also called attention to his previous training in graduate school, where he reports he was taught how to teach. Ben reported that he was required to take an instructional methods course, where he learned about Bloom's taxonomy, and other techniques, like scaffolding. Ben reported that the importance of developing student's creative ability was emphasized in this course. "I really was ascribing to Bloom's revised taxonomy, that the height of everything is not synthesis and evaluation, but creativity, and to be able to be a generative person." Ben reported that he believes it is important for future instructors to receive training in teaching techniques and methods, particularly those that emphasize student creativity. Ben reported that he is often surprised that other professors do not receive training in instruction. Ben feels fortunate about the training he received, which was key in fostering his creative ability, as well as his professional development.

Comparably, Sophie and Sydney believe that counselor educators who are seeking to develop their creative ability in the classroom spend some time reading the literature on creativity, creative teaching, and creativity in counseling. Sophie, for example, reported that she engages herself in new learning material to discover new ways

to be creative in the classroom. Sophie finds articles in the Journal of Creativity and Mental Health, books written by other counseling teachers, and creative teaching articles in other disciplines. Sophie called attention to the gap in the literature on creative teaching in counselor education, and suggested that counselor educators make time to research other disciplines that may have spent more time developing creative pedagogy. Sydney, also reported that he has made an extensive amount of contributions to the literature on creativity in counseling, and creative teaching that have been published by the ACA. He hopes that his material helps other counselor educators and counselors obtain the knowledge necessary to develop their personal creative ability.

For Camille, past experiences attending conferences reminded her of their importance in fostering her creative development. After attending a roundtable session at a conference led by a member of the Association for Creativity in Counseling (ACC), she reported that her desire to be more creative in the classroom was ignited. "Something about that experience just released within me, and empowered me to step into using creativity." Camille reported that the experience helped her recognize that a simple experiential activity can impact a student's understanding in a powerful way. She continues to attend conferences to gain new ideas, and share her own with others.

Role models influence creative teaching. Participants (*n* = *6*) emphasized the influence of role models in their ability, as well as their desire to teach creatively. Ben for example, talked about previous professors who he admired, who approached the classroom in a creative way. He reported that the experiences he had with these teachers stuck with him over the years. In a diversity class, for example, he was instructed to

spend four hours engaging in one of two activities: (a) going to a homeless shelter, or (b) spending the time blind-folded while engaging in daily activities. He chose to go to a homeless shelter, and talked about how the experience shaped his view of how to teach.

> The professor had worked out an arrangement with the director of the shelter. And, nobody knew that I wasn't a homeless person except for the director…so all day, I was treated as a homeless person. I interacted with other homeless people… It really sort of changed my whole world view about the homeless condition…That assignment…really impacted the type of professor that I became.

Ben models himself after his previous professors. He hopes that in his own teaching, he is impacting student's perspective, and that he is source of inspiration for their creative pursuits.

Similarly, Sophie, Oliver, and Lucy were inspired by professors who modeled a creative teaching approach. Sophie, for example, reported that prior to her entrance into counselor education she took on a non-teaching job in an academic setting where she interacted with other professors often. She reported that during that time she found herself feeling inspired as she witnessed students heightened academic involvement with professor's who tended to use creative methods in their classrooms. "I think I saw that the professors that the students connected with were those that embraced a creative spirit." The memory stuck with Sophie and later influenced her personal approach to teaching. Upon entrance into her doctoral training program, she reported that she felt a hunger to be creative, and found herself "fighting to have conversations about creative teaching." Sophie's experience demonstrates the power of influence that creative individuals can

have on others. In Sophie's case other, creative teachers impacted her desire to teach creatively.

Similarly, Oliver was inspired by a professor he took courses with in graduate school. The professor was both a licensed professional counselor, and a registered play therapist. Oliver reported that she not only introduced him and his classmates to the use of creative interventions in counseling, but that she used similar interventions as teaching interventions and learning tools for students. For example, Oliver recalled experiences that involved drawing, or what he referred to as "the rose bush" guided imagery activity, which the professor used to help students examine their personal perceptions and reflect on their experiences with clients.

Likewise, Lucy found herself inspired to be creative while working alongside professors in her co-teaching experiences in her doctoral training program. For Lucy, mentorship was an important element of her creative development. She reported that her professors at the time encouraged her to be creative, and provided feedback on the creative techniques she implemented in the classroom. Lucy reported that while feedback was essential, she found that watching her mentors model their own creative teaching style was also beneficial to her development.

> I had the opportunity to co-teach and we used transparent counseling pedagogy, where the two of us, me and the co-teacher, role played. We role played how to demonstrate a theory, and then had the students interacting and giving us what the next line should have been. So that was kind of my first time being a little bit

creative there. And I enjoyed that because I was getting to see my role model do it.

Lucy's experiences watching her role models engage with her in the use of creative teaching methods helped her build the confidence she needed to perform them on her own.

Participants also reported that creative teaching role models exist in other places, outside of the counselor education arena. Sophie, for example, was inspired by the work of artist, Bob Ross, as a child. She reported that she remembers his work to this day, and that witnessing his creative passion felt powerful. This early memory evoked emotions in Sophie. Subsequently, she reported that she believes creativity itself is an emotion. She hopes that her passion to be creative is revealed in her teaching so that she, in turn, evokes the creative spirit in her students. Likewise, Clay reported that he has been inspired by the work of former actor, Robin Williams. Clay reported that he perceives Williams' energetic style as the passion he wants to embody when he steps into the classroom. Clay reported that when he is accessing his creative ability in the classroom, he feels like he is "channeling" Robin Williams when he when he is up, and moving around, and getting people excited. "I mean I could be having a horrible day, but the moment I step foot in the class all that's gone and it's like show time." For Clay and Sophie, modeling themselves after creative individuals, who have had an impact on society, help them maintain their creative energy.

Past experiences clearly impacted participant's ability and desire to teach creatively. The data revealed that role models and training experiences were key factors

in assisting participants in their creative development. Knowledge was also evidenced as a factor in enhancing individuals' ability to be creative. Next, themes that illustrate counselor educators' perceptions about the impact of creative teaching on self and students are discussed.

Theme 2: Creative teaching promotes student engagement.

A second theme that emerged across all participants (*N* = 7/7), is that creative teaching promotes student engagement. Participants reported that when they use creative teaching they notice that students are engaged in the class; that they are active participants, interacting with the teacher, and interacting with each other. Lucy, for example, reported that student engagement was evidenced by an increase in the amount of questions that students asked in comparison to time periods in which she provided a traditional lecture. Lucy also reported that she often receives positive feedback from students. Students in Lucy's courses reported that they were excited and enthusiastic about her creative teaching style. Student's also reported that they felt that the time went by quickly when they were engaged in creative teaching interventions. Lucy noticed that when she brings creative teaching interventions into the classroom, her students are engaged, and can interact with each other, without the need for much guidance from her.

> Watching them actually engage and have everybody in each group engage without me having to prompt them was really kind of a cool experience… I would come in and be like everybody okay? And they'd be like, yeah, get out. I'm like okay, that's fine.

For Lucy, using a creative teaching approach makes learning more exciting for both herself, and her students.

In addition, Sydney and Ben called attention to cues that showed them students were engaged during creative teaching moments. Sydney for example, reported that student's non-verbal cues let him know that he was on the right track. "When I see the lights going on in student's eyes, then, realized, I'm doing something that's probably correct. Or that's probably impactful. Or, that's probably helping the learning process." Similarly, Ben reported that when he is engaging in creative teaching he can see "the light bulbs sparking" around him from the students who are having 'aha' moments. Ben relayed that because creative teaching promotes engagement, students gain insight quickly. During the interview, he reflected on a creative classroom experience that illustrates this phenomenon.

> One of the students said, 'I think it's cold anger…I said anger so cold that it burns you? And the student said, 'Yes.' I said, what do we think about this discussion of hot and cold anger?... one of the students who wasn't getting the idea before spoke up and said, 'The hot anger is like you're red hot.' And it's rage. And I can't remember all of the things he said…but the whole room got it, like instantly. It was like a wave. It just washed over the room. Boom.

Furthermore, participants reported that creative teaching promotes a deeper level of engagement in students. Sophie, used the phrase, "second level of engagement," to describe this phenomenon. For Sophie, this means engaging students on a cognitive, emotional, physical, and at times, spiritual level. She emphasized that the emotional

aspects of student engagement during creative teaching moments are a part of what fosters connection, and empathy. For example, she reported that engaging students in creative ways helps students feel more connected to their own emotions because they allow students to get out of their heads and into their bodies. "Something about creative expressions, whether its art, or dance, or music, that gets them out of their head, and puts their head into their heart, and connects them." Sophie also reported that because creative interventions help students connect to their emotions, they have an easier time developing empathy; an essential quality for the developing counselor. During the interview, Sophie described a creative intervention, where she had students engage in an experience, exploring alternate socioeconomic identities other than their own. She reported that the processing that occurred after the experience was emotional, and intense. Students had increased insight about their privilege, and they found themselves empathizing with a worldview that, for some, had previously been difficult to understand.

Similarly, Camille, reported that in creative teaching moments, she noticed that bonds are formed in the classroom as students interact with both her and each other. During the interview, she talked about a creative teaching moment where she found herself laughing with her students and connecting with them as they used songs to communicate with each other, and express themselves. Camille believes that through creativity, she and her students can express themselves in authentic ways, which is a part of what fosters bonding experiences. She reported that during creative teaching moments, such as the example she described above, rapport is established between student and teacher quickly. "We were able to expedite the relationship." For Camille,

watching students engage and connect with her through creativity is one of the most valuable experiences she has as a creative teacher.

Likewise, Oliver, perceives that creative experiences help students become more engaged in their learning, and share more of themselves. During the interview, he recalled a creative teaching moment, when a student interpreted a creative teaching assignment by telling his personal story through a break dance. "You could see the emotion, the emotion that was happening in the moment, both for the performer, and the rest of the class." Like, Sophie, Oliver noticed that creative experiences help foster empathy in students because they connect with each other and experience mutual support. His experience watching students share TV theme songs further illustrates this point.

> You could see the emotion on their face when they were sharing it. It was kind of a, a mixing of…feeling this is really a representation of me, but also feeling anxious because, I'm really exposing myself to people, you know, being vulnerable in this place, but then seeing the support that came from the other students in that activity.

Oliver, Sophie, and Camille's stories illuminate how creative teaching promotes emotional engagement in students, which deepens their understanding of each other, and their ability to empathize. Hence, the practice and experience of empathy translates into the counseling session, where students are open to empathize with their clients.

The data displayed in this section demonstrates that creative teaching promotes student engagement. Participants highlighted the positive outcomes that occurred as a result, among their students. These positive outcomes, were evident across all

participants. Subsequently, the researcher identified two subthemes that support the impact of creative teaching on student's, and instructors' levels of engagement: (a) creative teaching is aimed at empowering students, and (b) engaging students through creative teaching feels powerful. Table 5, below, displays theme two, subthemes, and a sample of associated meaning units across participants.

Table 5

Theme Two with Sub-Themes and Sample of Associated Meaning Units

Main Theme	Sub-theme	Subtheme
Creative teaching promotes student engagement	**Creative teaching is aimed at empowering students.**	**Creative teaching feels powerful.**
Meaning Units:	Meaning Units:	Meaning Units:
Students were going beyond a level of just pure cognitive understanding that it was getting into, as I would say the marrow of their bones where life is recreated all of the time because of red blood cells being generated there.	I think it's also important to tap into the people that you have in class. So, I had two students who'd done work with individual substance use disorders, whereas my experience is limited. So, I tapped into the two of them to share their experience and bring that in to enrich the class.	The fact that we're able to go and do that, and, and be excited about something, and see it reflected and get the feedback. Yeah, that's, it's about as awesome of a feeling
They don't check out. Some are still going to check out. That's just the nature of the human condition. But, most of them, they don't check out. They're engaged. They ask questions. I invite them to be part of a process, not the recipient of a process.	Let them be free to roam. Give people a chance to do that because if they don't do it in my classroom or other classrooms, it's sure going to be more difficult for them to do it, then they get out as a clinician.	There was just something about, somebody being able to get to create a story in making meaning that is really powerful.

And, they respond to that.

That if I'm good at, good enough at what I'm doing to really engage the students, and we create something together, it strengthens the rapport that exists between me and the students, because we've created something together, like that's a memory.

I think it really opens doors for them to experience, to learn, to understand what it is, how it is to be with a client, how it is to use certain interventions, and just simply to, to be themselves.

I think it's very powerful whenever they get put in a situation where it's like no, you know, like, you know, I want you to do this exercise and see what this feels like for you.

Creative teaching is aimed at empowering students. Participants ($N = 7$) emphasized that student empowerment is accomplished through creative teaching. A common reason participants valued creative teaching, was in part due to its emphasis on student creative development. In other words, a creative teaching approach means intentionally presenting students with opportunities to discover their own ability to be creative. For example, Sydney uses creative teaching to provoke creative thought in students, so that they come up with their own creative solutions to problems. He reported that when he has modeled creativity, students come up with many creative ideas that they may not have had before.

> I had a student one time in group class who wrote a closing poem called Group is Like a Garden. And she described everybody as a type of vegetable, for instance,

there's Carol, a carrot. a leafy top with a lot of substance beneath. I thought, well, that's pretty creative.

For Sydney, because creative teaching requires the instructor to also model creativity, students begin to understand how to be creative and feel empowered to try it on their own. Both Sydney, and Lucy emphasized that it is important to acknowledge that they are not the only creative people in the room. Hence, students' confidence in their creative potential is fostered when instructors invite them to share their creative ideas.

In addition, participants emphasized that the collaborative nature of creative teaching empowers students because they can contribute to what and how they are learning. Camille, Clay, and Oliver reported that they become involved in the teaching interventions that they create. For example, Clay conducts an improvisational workshop, where he reported that he becomes an active participant. "If they want me to play parts, I play parts." Clay frequently used the term 'co-creating.' He stressed that he did not just teach them, but that he created an environment that the students were a part of, and they co-created something meaningful together. For Clay, the collaborative nature of creative teaching helps promotes self-efficacy in students because they are encouraged and permitted to bring their own ideas to the table. In other words, as students are permitted to explore and share their creative ideas, they grow more confident, and learn to trust themselves. Clay's recollection of a student, who spontaneously found herself in a creative counseling moment at her internship site, further demonstrates this point.

And she came into the class and she was so excited because she didn't realize that she was capable of doing something like that, and the idea that she, it just kind of

came to her, and that she had been through so many experiences in the classes that she could just trust it.

For Clay, moments like these are what he expects to see in the classroom, as students embrace their creative potential.

Participants also highlighted the sense of equality that is offered in the classroom because of the collaborative structure of creative teaching. Since teacher and student are interacting and working together in a collaborative way, they discover ways to cooperate. These collaborative experiences can leave students feeling empowered, because, as Oliver remarked, "the inherent power differential that exists in the classrooms for the moment" is removed. For Ben, this means that students have the power to direct their own learning. Ben, for example, has students create their own final. "I don't believe in sort of keeping the cookies on the upper shelf. I like to put the cookies on a lower shelf - so everybody can reach them." More specifically, this emphasizes that because creative teaching can be collaborative, learning is accessible to students.

Participants also reported that when creative teaching interventions are brought into the classroom, students are more likely to feel freer to be candid, and find their creative voice. Camille, for example, reported that the first time she saw a need for creativity was with two students whom she remarked were "painfully shy." At that time, she recognized that she was going to have to do something different to get them to start talking. Creativity and creative interventions used in the classroom were a quick way in. Camille reported that a simple music intervention, where she had students communicate solely through music, helped the two students open up and share their thoughts.

Likewise, Oliver used a sandtray intervention to encourage students to provide him with feedback about his class. He reported that the experience gave students the freedom to be transparent.

> I remember one said, as she picked up a dragon…"This dragon is here because it has that fire breathe. You ask us those tough questions. You put us on the spot. And she says, but you have wings to lift us up.'

For Oliver and Camille, students need safety to feel empowered to explore and develop, and creative interventions help provide that safety. Overall, a creative teaching approach promotes the safe classroom environment necessary to foster growth in students.

Engaging students through creative teaching feels powerful. All participants ($N = 7$) agreed that engaging students through creative teaching feels powerful. Common words participants used to describe creative teaching moments were joyful, energetic, exhilarating, authentic, and powerful. During the interviews, many participants struggled to find the words to describe their experience. For example, Oliver, drew called attention to his facial expressions to help him describe how he feels in a creative teaching moment. "I don't know if I can come up with the exact word or words for it…It probably showed up on my face, I could feel a smile, because I'm thinking of how wonderful it feels."

Subsequently, participants reported that creative teaching moments are experienced through the senses. Sydney described it as a full body experience. "It gets into my limbic system, that it is a feeling. It's Wow! Hard to describe. But that it's an emotion….it goes all over my body. It's not just in my brain; It's really in my body." Similarly, Ben compared creative teaching moments to his experiences training in the

martial arts, reporting that it feels like the moments when he achieved harmony in his craft. "I had moved through my center of gravity; and just for like a moment in time, where I had perfect balance." Ben further illustrated his experience, remarking that it is comparable to experiences one has when time distorts, or slows down. For Ben, moments like these in the classroom are eye opening.

Participants also described creative teaching moments as an energetic experience. Camille, for example, reported that she gains extra energy during creative teaching moments, and that her curiosity grows. Ben also reported that he feels like there is a transmission of energy that passes through the room during creative teaching moments. Likewise, Oliver reported that he enjoys the energy he gets in creative teaching moments, and that they make him feel full of life. "I don't know how much sense it makes, but the moment feels more alive." Ben, Oliver, and Camille's comments illustrate, that creative teaching helps instructors generate energy, and bring the classroom to life.

Additionally, participants reported that creative teaching moments feel authentic. Sophie for example, remarked that when she is teaching creatively she feels like her most authentic self. Oliver also reported that when he is engaged in a creative teaching moment, he gets the sense that both himself and the students are "being real." In other words, through the connected and emotional experiences, exemplified earlier, the classroom becomes a space where transparency is present and genuineness occurs.

Feelings of excitement and joy were also experienced by participants during creative teaching moments. Lucy and Sophie reported that they feel excited when they see their creative teaching ideas working for students, and finding ways to make the

information applicable and personal to them. Sophie, highlighted her excitement. "It's an exciting thing because they're really taking what they're learning and making it real." Likewise, Clay described the elation he experiences when he notices that both he and the students are engaged with each other.

> There is an exhilaration, that comes from it, when you kind of lock in, and they're engaged and you're engaged and it's kind of an, an anything goes in, in a world where it's rare that we can say anything goes.

Clay's comment also illustrates the idea that creative teaching feels liberating.

The data in this section revealed that creative teaching promotes student engagement by enhancing understanding, perspective and connection. Participants also emphasized the levels of engagement that are involved; that students are engaged on cognitive, physical, and emotional levels. Additionally, participants' data revealed that creative teaching is aimed at student empowerment, as instructors intentionally create circumstances in the classroom that permit students to feel involved in their learning, and thus empowered to be creative. All participants agreed that engaging students in creative ways evokes powerful emotions and experiences.

Next, themes that further illustrate the structure and process of creative teaching are discussed.

Theme 3: Creative teaching is not cliché.

A third theme that emerged across participants ($N = 7$) about the nature of creative teaching is that creative teaching is not cliché. In other words, participants identified creative teaching as unconventional, or non-traditional. Clay for example, called

attention to a shift in the teacher role that is apparent in creative teaching. The idea that the traditional lecture format, where the instructor disseminates 'wisdom' upon his students, is no longer the case. "You're able to kind of disengage from that kind of cliché of the professor being a sage on the stage, and you're the student sitting here, and we're able to just let go" Likewise, Ben reported that creative teaching is not "the old jug and mug sort of teaching method," where the instructor merely imparts information upon the students, and the students merely take notes. He emphasized that professors who believe that students need to learn by rote memory, and just "drone on and on", do not encourage creativity in themselves or their students. For Ben, creative teaching is an authentic style of teaching that acknowledges lived experience, and that learning does not just take place by disseminating information from a book. "Education, was never meant to be trapped in stacks. It was never meant to be trapped, you know, in dusty libraries. Education was meant to be lived and experienced". In Ben's perception, assimilating knowledge into lived experiences is the way that individuals learn and grow. Hence, both students and professors lived experience must be brought into the classroom.

In addition, participants reported that creative teachers are compelled to learn and grow. Both Clay and Ben reported that creative teachers do not "sit on their laurels," but rather constantly challenge themselves to find innovative ways to approach the classroom.

Clay, for example, reported that he is constantly growing through his teaching experiences. He reported that even though he may conduct a similar activity with a different group of students in a course, it is impossible for him to come back from a class

without the need to change his lecture notes, or have other ideas generated from the class. For Ben, this also means asking himself questions like, 'what can I do to make this class more connected, more student-centered, more engaging.' Thus, creative teachers must find ways to evolve by challenging themselves to reflecting on new ways to approach the classroom, and trying different things over time.

Participants also stressed that creative teaching is about bringing in new ideas and original experiences into the classroom, sometimes spontaneously. For example, Oliver reports that creativity is not just about bringing in "arty or expressive modalities," but that having the ability to change directions in the moment with a thought provoking question, or comment that makes the material relevant to student's experience may be all that is needed to enhance student's experience. "I'll just all of a sudden go off somewhere I had no intention of going, and bring it in a different direction that helps the students understand the concept I try to get across better." Although Oliver commonly uses creative arts to engage students, he is also comfortable with the idea that he can rely on other methods to move his class forward.

Similarly, Lucy described creative teaching as "using modalities other than lecturing to engage the content in a different manner; potentially using different tools that you have on hand." Lucy uses games like Ka hoot Trivia, and Family Feud, to help students retain information, as well as engage them. She also reported that she must "get a little more creative" to relate to students, and help them get a clear understanding of the material. For example, she finds herself watching modern television to learn about the current generation of students she teaches. In class, she references television characters

that students may be familiar with to help them relate to course concepts. Correspondingly, Sydney reported that creative teaching requires one to have access to a diverse array of approaches to utilize in the classroom. He referenced Robert Sternberg, an author of creativity books, who mentions that one must have several ideas "to possibly have one that is new and useful, and creative." Subsequently, Sydney finds himself using a wide array of creative approaches in the classroom, such as art, humor, metaphors, and storytelling.

For Camille, creative teaching is 'not cliché' because it is often unplanned. Since creativity is not always structured or proscribed, instructors must be prepared to respond to the unexpected. Camille defined creative teaching "as spontaneous, attending to the needs of the students in the present moment," She described for example, using mindfulness techniques spontaneously when she noticed that students needed to regain focus, or to promote self-care. She also reported that she often purposefully puts herself on the spot, in the same way that students are put on the spot when she encourages them to be creative. Camille hopes that in her spontaneous moments, she is inspiring students to try something new. "I hope that it encourages my students whenever they see me kind of doing these different creative activities…that they will also try to step outside of their comfort zones sometimes." She also hopes that it encourages them to see things from another perspective.

Relatedly, participants compared creative teaching to creativity in counseling. Participants reported that like creativity in counseling creative teaching can facilitate confidence in one's ability to try different things to reach the same goal. Sophie, Sydney,

and Camille, emphasized that just as there are several ways of reaching a goal in the counseling process, there are multiple ways of helping students reach a goal. Sydney's comment further illustrates this notion. "There's a cornucopia of, of ways of being a good counselor...that creativity is at least a hand tool of that empowerment that clients need." Sydney emphasizes this idea with his students. Relatedly, Sophie stressed that an important element of fostering student empowerment toward a pursuit of creativity, is creating "a classroom environment that embraces multi-modal learning, and a variety of learning styles." In other words, students are taught that there is not one correct, way, but rather a multitude of ways to be creative.

Furthermore, participants expressed that because creative teaching is not cliché, students feel that instructors value and appreciate their learning. Like Clay, and Ben, who suggested that professors who sit on their "laurels" may lose the respect and engagement of students, both Lucy and Camille believe that students view their attempts as genuine and invested. Lucy's comment illustrates this point.

> That I'm willing to invest in their learning: that I'm not just standing at the front of the room, pretending that I know everything and they don't matter. That I actually have some investment in what they are learning and that it is a benefit for them, that I'm putting that much energy into it.

Similarly, Camille reported that she values her students learning experiences, and that when she is in a creative space, she believes that care and concern shows through in the creative process. The implication presented here by Camille and Lucy is that the effort

that is required on the part of the creative teacher has a positive impact on student's perceptions of their instructors.

The data in this section illustrated that creative teaching is not cliché. Participants revealed that creative teaching is unconventional, and that creative teachers must do more than lecture. Table 6, below, displays theme three, and a sample of associated meaning units across participants.

Table 6

Theme Three and Sample of Associated Meaning Units

Main Theme
Creative teaching is not cliché.
Meaning Units: It wasn't the usual lecturing kind of thing, they got to engage in something, and that's; what I realized I guess was that it was more important to create an experience than it was to simply pass along a lesson, and an experience is something they'll remember.
I would also talk about a client bringing in music, or a poem, or something else, even a movement that seemed to represent what was occurring in his or her life. I didn't find that in the-what I would consider- and, I don't mean this disrespectfully in the sterile cases that I was reading that were often in textbooks.
Everything just seemed kind of more organic because they weren't bored. It wasn't the usual lecturing kind of thing, they got to engage in something, and that's; what I realized, I guess, was that it was more important to create an experience than it was to simply pass along a lesson, and an experience is something they'll remember.

Theme 4: Creative teaching is more than didactic.

Participants (*N = 7/7*) agreed that creative teaching is more than didactic. Participants used words like "experiential" and "active" to describe the act of creative

teaching. Sophie for example, highlighted that she often gets students physically up and moving in the classroom, or prompts them to go outside to engage them in a creative experience. Lucy, described an activity she conducted to prevent students from falling asleep in a late-night class. She reported that she "creatively" got students up and began teaching them non-violent crisis prevention techniques for de-escalating clients. "Not necessarily like holds and things, but like how do you get out of a bite hold, how do you get out when someone pulls your hair; things like that." Hence, creative teaching means doing whatever it takes to get students engaged.

Participants also stressed that creative teaching is purposeful and intentional; that the instructors are not just presenting an activity to students and having them try it, but that they are putting thought into why they are introducing them. In other words, the instructor chooses an activity to help students understand theory and content. Sydney's comment illustrates this notion.

> You're not just being didactic. And you're not just showing videos but you're actively engaging students to think how they would apply- a theory, or, how they would implement a technique that is important in, in the counseling relationship.

Hence, creative teaching also takes planning and preparing; that instructors are carefully choosing how to creatively engage students in the content.

The use of experiential activities was popular among participants. Participants reported that experiential activities help students conceptualize information, and promote insight. Sydney's use of music lyrics and metaphors help students understand theory and content. Sydney, also reported that he shares music, poems, or movements that clients

presented to him so that they could have the opportunity to see and understand a client's perspective. Similarly, Sophie shows videos of dancers dancing about various human struggles, to help students conceptualize client's perspective on topics like eating disorders.

Oliver and Camille use their expertise in the expressive arts in counseling with students to help them reflect on their personal perspectives. Camille uses puppetry, for example, to foster personal insight.

> Using puppetry in the classroom…They get to experience like wow, like I stepped into this character that I chose you know, these emotions started coming out and these words started coming out that I didn't understand were there…and then, you know, there is a lot of processing like where did this sentence come from… and why did I act in such a way whenever I chose the tiger or the turtle or…you know these behaviors emerged.

Similarly, Oliver uses art to provoke thought in students. Oliver reported that, at times, students' express things that they did not intend to through art work, which leads to profound personal insight that can inform their development as a counselor.

Ben also found that he could create experiential activities in an online class. By becoming familiar with online technology, he created innovative interventions that allowed students to actively engage in their learning online. "I mean, we had like memory maps in the class…you could go from this type of medium on the Internet to that type of medium on the Internet. I was using YouTube. I was using all kinds of things." For Ben, it was important to create a dynamic teaching environment online. He reported that he

could have just conducted a traditional online class, where students just go in, write about what they read, and move on, but for him, that is counterproductive to deepening students' learning. Ben's online experience, is another example that creative teaching takes preparation, and planning.

As previously mentioned, Lucy's experiential activities include games in the classroom. Lucy plays games like Jeopardy, and trivia to help students retain information. She also talked about an innovative idea she is currently working on, where she would incorporate counseling concepts into an interactive "Candyland" game. Lucy also has her students engage in debates, such as arguing about the pros and cons of medication. Lucy reported that debates challenge students to see alternate perspectives because they are often required to argue for a viewpoint they do not agree with.

For Clay, creative experiential activities can extend outside of the classroom. For example, as an assignment Clay gives every student in his class a dollar. Students are asked to use the dollar at the dollar store and bring back whatever "strikes their fancy." When they return students place what they have in a bag placed at the center of a table and they circle around. One at a time, students are asked to pick an object out of the bag and think about how they can apply it to counseling, or use it in a counseling session.

> It's like, Okay! This is a spatula! How do we make this relevant for counseling? And we come up with, well what would you use it for? What kind of themes can you pull out of it? How might that go here? What's off book things can you do?

Clay finds that this activity also demonstrates to students how a mere 12 dollars can provide them with a whole new bundle of creative strategies to use in session with their clients.

Furthermore, participants reported that creative teaching makes learning memorable. Ben, for example emphasized that creative experiences will stay with them years after graduation. Ben's experience illustrates this phenomenon. He relayed his thoughts in response to an email he received from a former graduate student.

> And she said, you know. I just want to thank you for being the kind of professor that you were. I have my own clinic now. I am in private practice, "blah-blah-blah." And, you draw on a lot of stuff. But, you know what I remember the most, is a story you told about X, Y, Z - Because I had a client just like that today.

Ben reported that this was just one of the many stories he has, in which he finds students thanking him for their learning experiences.

Moreover, Sophie, Ben, Oliver, and Camille believe that creative teaching is memorable because the creative experiential activities that are involved in creative teaching are often emotionally charged. Camille, for example, conducts an experiential activity in a multi-cultural counseling class, where students take on another identity, such as refugee or single mother. She reported that the experience "touches the heart" because they begin to conceptualize what it may be like to live in another person's shoes. Participants reported that because experiential activities can evoke emotions, the information stays with students. This notion was evident in two ways: (a) participants descriptions of personal experiences they had as a student with previous professors that

are identified above, in the first theme, and (b) in participants direct commentary. Camille, for example reported that, looking back, to when she was a student in graduate school, it was the experiential activities that stuck with her throughout her career. Ben also directly stated that "Whenever you learn something, and it is emotionally charged, you will learn it better, longer. It will stay with you." For Ben, the experiential tasks involved in creative teaching also give students a sense of ownership of the material.

For participants, creative teaching is more than didactic, and creative teachers must do more than lecture in the classroom. Part of doing more, was engaging students in active ways, such as experiential activities. In this way, creative teaching meant making student learning memorable. Table 7, below illustrates theme four, and a sample of associated meaning units. Next, themes that illustrate essential ingredients of the structure of creative teaching, as perceived by counselor educators are discussed.

Table 7

Theme Four and Sample of Associated Meaning Units

Main Theme
Creative teaching is more than didactic.
Meaning Units: One thing I really appreciate about being in a creative moment is that it's so much more experiential…what I meant by real is just that they're experiencing.
Creative teaching is about doing something that will wake students up…piquing their interest and then providing them information in a rich way that enables them to decide how it is they're going to take this.
I decided that instead of starting kind of the dialogue with words with them, that I would start off the semester with music. And so, I had the students share, like their favorite song, or a song that kind of helped them feel some positive emotions like joy or peace and things like that.

Theme 5: Creative teaching requires risk taking.

A fifth theme that emerged from the data across participants (*N = 7/7*) is that creative teaching requires risk taking. During the interviews the phrase, "take a risk" was commonly used in response to the question, 'what can you share about your learning that may help other counselor educators. Other common phrases were, "have courage," and "don't be afraid." In short, participants agreed that a primary foundation of creative teaching is taking risks.

More specifically, participants reported that while risk taking may feel awkward, it is a necessary step to take when engaging in creative teaching endeavors. This is due, in part, to the fact that being creative means trying new things. Hence, instructors may experience the discomfort that accompanies a change. Camille, for example, remembered times in her teaching career when she felt nervous introducing a creative idea for the first time. She reported that over time it became easier because she recognized that it was a natural part of the experience. "It's normal to be a bit nervous when trying out creative practices." Camille has learned to let go, because she feels that the outcome of taking risks in the classroom is worthwhile.

Equally, Clay reported that while taking a risk may feel awkward, it is worth it for both the instructor and the student experience. "Yes, it's comfortable to do what was done for you. Yes, it's less risky, it's safer to go and just do something that's prepackaged. But who wants to be a prepackaged kind of person." In other words, creative teaching means taking risks and never growing stale. Similarly, Ben, stressed the idea that instructors who are not open to taking risks are in danger of becoming stagnant because

creative teaching requires instructors to grow. "You have to embrace the new things that are coming…if you're not in a state of growth, you're in a state of death." Ben highlighted how scary taking a risk can feel in the classroom, but that refusing to take risks is a risk. For Ben, it is unfair for instructors to have expectations for students that they do not have for themselves. Hence, modeling creative risk taking is essential, if instructors expect students to take creative risks.

Participants also emphasized that counselor educators must have courage when introducing new ideas to overcome the discomfort that arises when taking creative risks. For Oliver, Lucy, and Camille, this means putting aside inhibitions and taking a chance, even if they think they may fail. Lucy, for example, reported that she is not afraid to make mistakes. She reported that creative teaching involves a series of trial and error. Instructors must go through this process, and when they make mistakes they learn from them. Lucy reported that when she fails, or things do not turn out as planned, she accepts that it is time to try something different.

Likewise, Camille and Oliver reported that students learn from watching their instructors make mistakes. Camille, for example, reported that students can feel liberated to take creative risks if they see their instructors make mistakes.

> I think that students, too, need to see us have some struggle with creativity, too. I think that can be an empowering tool for them as they, you know, are preparing to be clinicians or school counselors or whatever it might be…that even their faculty members, you know, aren't necessarily perfect.

Similarly, Oliver reported that he has noticed that his students are reluctant to try something new or creative, until they see him get involved. "They're reluctant to do anything, until they see that the professors' are willing to put themselves out there." Like Ben, Camille and Oliver recognize that students benefit from watching their instructors take risks because it empowers them to take a chance and be creative.

Sydney and Sophie also emphasized the notion of courage in taking risks. They recommended that counselor educators approach the classroom with the same vigor that they may have had as a counselor, having to come up with creative ideas to help their clients. Sophie, for example, recommended changing the classroom environment. Both Sydney, and Sophie, also suggested using the same interventions they may have used with clients, adjusted to fit the classroom experience. In other words, one may not have to stretch too far to be creative in the classroom.

It is evident that creative teachers do not 'play it safe' in the classroom, but rather enjoy the experience of change. Creative teachers also appreciate how, in taking risks, they continue to develop their creative ability, while inspiring their students to take creative risks. Participants also emphasized that while risk taking can feel awkward or scary, the positive outcomes outweigh the risks. Table 8, below, displays theme five, and a sample of associated meaning units across participants.

Table 8

Theme Five and Sample of Associated Meaning Units

Main Theme
Creative teaching requires risk taking.
Meaning Units: Embrace creativity and take a risk. And I know it can be scary. But, take a risk. That's what we want our students to do. Why should anything less be expected of professors. Take a risk.
I think whenever I or students take a chance; and decide to either offer an idea or, to show a behavior that might not be quite expected. Then, it's an act of creativity.
What can I do that presses the envelope of my university's technological ability to put into a class It required, like extra money to be spent on the university's part, I guess. And, they, they agreed though. I mean, they spent the extra money and let me do my creative pieces.

Theme 6: Creative teaching requires openness.

Participants (*N = 6/7*) agreed that creative teaching requires an overall sense of openness; that instructors are open to possibility, and open to discover their creative potential. Oliver, for example reported that creative teaching is not a place for judgement, particularly self-judgement, because it can inhibit instructors from discovering their personal creative potential.

Participants reported that, for instructors to develop their creative potential, they must be open about the concept of creativity. For Clay, Camille and Lucy, misconceptions about creativity are a common reason instructors do not take creative risks. Camille's comment highlights this notion.

> Sometimes people have the misconception that they're not a creative person and so they shut down using creativity, period, because of this preconceived notion that you're born creative or not, you know…or that person is just naturally creative, so of course, she's using creative processes. But that's a myth.

Likewise, Lucy recalled that prior to discovering her creative capacity in the classroom, she subscribed to the creativity stereotype that creative means arts and crafts. "I would think of things like drawing and art, which just isn't me." Lucy reported that teaching helped her discover that she was in fact creative. She found that she was creative in the ways she could engage and teach others; that she could break things down into smaller pieces so that students could understand. For Lucy, this is a different type of creativity.

Finally, Sydney stressed that the future of the counseling profession begins with creative teachers, who are influential in developing creative instructors. Hence, instructors must be open to change in both themselves and the world, to assist future counselors in moving the profession forward. Sydney emphasized that in looking at counselor education over the years, one can see that it has changed a great deal, and that educators must adapt to the changes that are occurring. For Sydney, this means that educators must remain open, and challenge themselves to try new things to progress. "There's a lyric from the rock group Santana. That if you always do what you've always done, you always get what you've always gotten. And, and that's really true." Sydney called attention to the fact that counseling has changed because people have been creative, and that those who have stood out in the profession were not "just prosaic."

Hence, counselor educators must reach beyond the mundane and strive to be creative, since creativity begins in the classroom.

Overall, participants emphasized that there is a need for educators to be open in creative teaching. Participants agreed that a sense of openness alleviates inhibitions, and misconceptions that may prevent counselor educators from taking creative risks. Table 9, below illustrates theme six, and a sample of associated meaning units.

Table 9

Theme Six and Sample of Associated Meaning Units

Main Theme
Creative teaching requires openness.
Meaning Units: I had two faculty members come and present. So, it, sort of branches out and they realize that, oh, I didn't realize that was creative. Because some people just think that it's, oh I can't paint, I can't draw, I can't sing, I don't play an instrument. That's not creative.
I think the biggest thing that I've learned is to trust my instincts.
I kind of learned to accept that there are things - that it doesn't have to do with me, as me being able to be creative, as much as there are factors within students. Just like there's factors within the individuals we counsel; that they react to things a little bit differently

Summary

Chapter four presented a detailed description of the results of the phenomenological study examining counselor educators' self-reported experiences with creative teaching in the classroom. The data uncovered six primary themes that reflect the essence of counselor educators' experiences with creative teaching: (a) creative

teaching is shaped by past experiences, (b) creative teaching promotes student engagement, (c) creative teaching is not cliché, (d) creative teaching is more than didactic, (e) creative teaching requires risk taking, and (f) creative teaching requires openness. There was evidence that the six primary themes reflect the structure and process of creative teaching. Chapter five delivers a discussion, in which the researcher links the study's results to existing literature. Trustworthiness and credibility factors are also reviewed, and implications for future research are presented.

Chapter 5

Discussion

The results of this phenomenological study reveal the essence of creative teaching in counselor education among a purposeful sample of counselor educators who engage in creative teaching practices. Themes and associated subthemes that emerged in data analysis uncovered counselor educator's perceptions of the process and structure of creative teaching practices. The following overarching themes were identified by participants: (a) creative teaching is shaped by past experiences, (b) creative teaching promotes student engagement, (c) creative teaching is not cliché, (d) creative teaching is more than didactic, (e) creative teaching requires risk taking, and (f) creative teaching requires openness. These themes represented the collective experience of creative teaching among counselor educators.

In this chapter, the researcher discusses the findings of the study as they apply to the literature in creative teaching. She identifies the unique contributions offered by participants that address gaps in the literature. Additionally, implications for teaching in counselor education based on the findings are presented. Future research

recommendations are also illustrated, and transferability is discussed. Last, research limitations are acknowledged.

Contributions of Creative Teaching in Counselor Education

Creative teaching, as defined by Lin (2011) comprises of the following elements: creative teaching, teaching for creativity, and creative learning. Teaching for creativity refers to the creativity of the instructor and the ways in which s/he captures student interest. Teaching for creativity involves the exercises implemented in the curriculum to foster creative thinking, and creative learning involves the conditions that should be met for creative learning to occur (Lin, 2011). Creative teaching is common theoretical teaching framework used among primary school educators (Lin, 2011), however, it is less commonly practiced among educators in higher education arenas, even though authors assert that creative teaching methods also benefit adult learners (Livingston, 2000; Gibson, 2010). While some counselor educators are familiar with creative teaching practices, little is known about counselor educators' perceptions of creative teaching, or their perceptions of their ability to be creative in the classroom. Authors have shared their ideas about creative teaching in conceptual articles, (Hayes, 2008; Henderson & Malone, 2009) however, there is limited research examining the effectiveness of creative teaching methods in counselor education, or counselor educators' perceptions of the impact of creative teaching on students in the classroom.

Authors also assert that teaching frameworks should reflect the habits and heart of their professions (Gurung, Chick, & Haynie, 2009). In the counseling field, creativity is valued, and leading counselor educators suggest that counselors must be creative to be

effective (Gladding, 2008; Heckner & Kottler, 2002). Lawrence's (2012) study was the first to demonstrate qualitative evidence that creative teaching methods are effective for fostering creativity in counseling students. Still, more research is needed in creative teaching in counselor education (Lawrence, 2012). The present researcher addressed this gap by conducting a qualitative study examining counselor educators' self-reported perceptions of creative teaching in the classroom. The study was unique in that, there are currently no studies examining counselor educators' perceptions of the impact of creative teaching, or their perceptions of their ability to be creative in the classroom.

The Essence of Creative Teaching in Counselor Education

In this study, the researcher sought to uncover the structure and process of creative teaching as perceived by counselor educators. Four overarching themes and associated emerged during the data analysis. These themes are: (a) creative teaching is shaped by past experiences, (b) creative teaching promotes student engagement, (c) creative teaching is not cliché, (d) creative teaching is more than didactic, (e) creative teaching requires risk taking, and (f) creative teaching requires openness. Associated subthemes further illustrated the process and structure of creative teaching, as perceived by counselor educators. In the following sections, the researcher summarizes the results and presents their alignment with and enhancement of the existing literature.

Educators' Past Creative Experiences

The study revealed that creative teaching is shaped by past experiences. All participants identified at least one prior experience that marked a significant time period in which they remember exploring and learning to be creative. This was a noteworthy

finding, since there are currently no research studies linking instructor's desire to teach creatively to past experiences. Ben, Camille, Clay, Sophie, and Oliver, all identified childhood, and/or youth as the first memories where they recalled becoming aware of their creative potential. For these individuals, creative experiences in childhood and youth were positive and fulfilling. Oliver received positive re-enforcement from his audience as a developing musician in his youth. Camille also received positive re-enforcement from instructors for her talents in the visual arts, as well as her creative ability as a gifted student. Clay and Ben became aware of creative possibilities as they learned that using their imagination could help them fill fulfilled in play. These past experiences in youth positively impacted their confidence in their ability to be creative.

Sydney and Clay also identified past work experiences as important to their creative development. Sydney's experiences learning that his own ability to be creative in counseling helped his clients move toward change, and altered his perception of what it means to be a good counselor. This later translated into his teaching career, as he sought to inspire his counseling students to use creativity to solve problems both in the classroom, and in counseling sessions. Clay's past work experiences taught him that when rigid restrictions or limitations are imposed on instructors, creativity is stifled in both instructor's and students. For Clay and Sydney, past work experiences were a key time-period that re-enforced their desire to continue to be creative in their career.

While there are no studies that examine how past experiences may shape or lead to an individual's desire to engage in creative teaching, authors have noted that there are conditions that contribute to the development of creativity. Sternberg and Williams

(1996) asserted that building self-efficacy is essential for enhancing creativity in individuals. Accordingly, positive re-enforcement received from others, or rewards given for creativity, can influence individuals' confidence in their ability to be creative (Sternberg & Williams, 1996). Torrance (1987) also asserted that a supportive environment is important to foster creative thinking. Participants experiences align with this research, in that their past experiences exploring their creative potential in youth were positive, supportive, and helped them build their confidence.

Additionally, the literature revealed that creativity can be enhanced through learning (Csikzantmihaly, 1996; Runco, 1996; Sternberg & Williams, 1996). Subsequently, authors have emphasized that a curriculum that is geared towards promoting creative thinking in individuals will help foster their creative ability (Sternberg & Williams, 1996). Participants also emphasized that creative teaching requires knowledge. Hence, instructors who have a desire to enhance their ability to be creative in the classroom must engage in training or learning experiences that foster their ability to be creative. Ben further developed his creative ability in graduate school, which emphasized teaching methods for creativity. Camille attended workshops conducted by members of the ACC, who presented thought provoking material to promote creative thinking in attendees. She continues to attend workshops to enhance her creative development. While theorists in the literature were not directly focused on conditions to develop creativity in creative teachers specifically, they recognized that learning processes must occur for individuals to develop their creative ability (Sternberg & Williams, 1996). Subsequently, it is beneficial for creative teachers to enter training or

classroom experiences that promote creative thinking and creative learning. Oliver emphasized the importance of training experiences in his creative development because they help him grow more familiar and comfortable with creative teaching methods.

Sydney and Sophie's experiences differed slightly in their emphasis on learning and obtaining knowledge by seeking resources to enhance their creative ability in the classroom. Sophie sought out creative teaching resources from books illustrating experiential activities she could incorporate into the classroom. She also advised that counselor educators seek out resources from other disciplines, who may have spent more time developing creative pedagogy. Sydney emphasized that counselor educators consider reviewing the literature available in journals on the topic of creative teaching. Equally, authors suggest that instructors who desire to take a creative teaching approach seek out resources presenting creative teaching ideas or curriculum (Sternberg & Williams, 1996; Wisdom, 2006).

Furthermore, Milgram and Davidovich's (2010) study on lecturer effectiveness revealed a positive correlation between the instructors' ability to think creatively and students' ability to also think creatively. Instructors ability to think creatively also impacted student's perceptions of their instructors' effectiveness (Milgrim & Davidovich, 2010). Other authors also emphasized that students learn to be creative from instructors who are also creative (Bain, 2004; Jackson & Sinclair, 2006). Ben, Sophie, Oliver, Clay, Lucy, and Camille found that creative role models had a positive impact on their creative development and desire to also model a creative approach in their teaching. Participants noted that creative teaching moments with previous professors who modeled a creative

approach were significant because they stuck with them in a powerful way. Instructors' unique classroom assignments, such as Ben's explorations as a homeless man, were a part of what made their experiences with their instructors meaningful and memorable. For participants, these experiences with creative instructors either changed their views about teaching, or inspired them to discover their creative potential. For Lucy, it was also essential to witness instructors' modeling a creative approach so that she felt comfortable with her own creative explorations. In essence, participants' experiences with creative teachers were a part of what led them to become creative teachers themselves. This finding also aligns with assertions that institutes that place on emphasis on creative curriculum and creative teaching methods will produce creative leaders (Florida, 2002; Gibson, 2011).

Past training experiences had a positive impact on participants ability to teach creatively later in their career. The findings align with the research demonstrating that positive re-enforcement, creative role models, and creative learning experiences and resources enhance and promote creativity in individuals. The findings differ in that there are no current studies directly linking past experiences to individuals desire to take on a creative teaching approach.

Student Engagement

Livingston (2010) argued that educators in higher education institutes have held on to a traditional teaching model that allows the distribution of information, yet has little regard for how that information is grasped, or absorbed. He asserted that this was a problem for students, who upon graduation will be entering workplace environments

where they are asked to collaborate, and use creative thinking to solve problems (Livingston, 2010). Subsequently frameworks, like creative teaching, that foster creativity and incorporate creative elements into the curriculum are helpful in developing creative thinkers (Livingston, 2010). All seven participants in this study identified creative teaching as an approach that promotes student engagement, which in turn fosters their ability to solve problems in creative ways. Participants identified evidence of student engagement as their ability to focus on the task at hand during creative teaching moments. Ben, Oliver, and Sydney, for example, called attention to students' non-verbal cues as evidence that students were engaged in the present moment in the classroom. Lucy noted that because students were engaged they could also work with each other with little guidance from her. She noted that she found herself excited to witness students using their creative thinking skills independently. Sydney specifically spoke to his awareness of students' ability to come up with novel ideas, which they may not have had before, such as his recollection of the student who found a creative way to describe group members characteristics by comparing them to a garden. While authors identify the specific learning goals that creative teaching is geared toward reaching, there is currently no empirical literature focusing on instructors' perceptions of the behavioral attitudes of students during creative teaching moments in counselor education. By sharing their perceptions about the impact of creative teaching on student engagement, participants have contributed to this gap.

Still, others have shared their creative teaching interventions, and intentions for using them with counseling students (Henderson & Malone, 2009; Kress, Paylo,

Adamson, & Baltrinic, 2015). Henderson and Malone (2009) used ethics in fairy tales to enhance student perception, while Kress et. al (2015) used guided imagery to help students conceptualize client case studies. The results of this study support this literature given that participants confirmed their perception that creative teaching methods and interventions promote a deeper level of understanding in students. Sophie, Camille, Clay, Oliver, Sydney, and Ben noted that creative teaching engages students not only on a cognitive level, but also an emotional and physical level. For example, Sophie and Oliver emphasized the emotional activation that occurs among students during creative teaching moments. Both agreed that because emotions were activated, students expressed themselves in authentic ways, which fostered emotional bonds, connecting student to teacher and student to student. Camille specifically noted that because creative teaching encourages genuine expression, there is transparency, which enhances rapport causing bonds to form quickly.

Participants also noted that creative teaching experiences helped broaden students' perspectives about the worldview of others, or increased empathy, which would later translate into the counseling session. Oliver, for instance, noticed that creative teaching experiences helped students first connect to their personal emotions, and then connect with other students through mutual support, as they expressed themselves in creative ways. This aligns with current literature that demonstrates creative experiences in the classroom can help foster empathy in students (Lenes, Swank, & Nash, 2015). In a study by Lenes et. al. (2015), students could connect to strong emotions in themselves and relate to the emotions of peers, after engaging in a two-week class where creative

methods were used. Students also experienced vulnerability and discomfort, which helped them relate to the potential discomfort that clients may experience in counseling (Lenes et. al., 2015). Lenes et. al. (2015) study demonstrated how creativity was correlated with emotional activation and the ability to empathize. Participants perceptions of their student's in the classroom support the outcome of Lenes' et. al. (2015) study.

For participants, creative teaching was aimed at empowering students, and participants noted that, in their perception, students were empowered in their classrooms. Participants renowned that students felt empowered to express themselves, discover their personal creative potential, and trust their instincts in counseling sessions with clients because of creative teaching. For example, Clay illustrated a classroom example, where a student shared her success with her use of a creative idea in session with a client. Clay perceived the student as excited and empowered, relaying that the incident re-enforced her confidence in her ability to be creative. These results support Lawrence's (2012) findings that a creative curriculum promotes student self-development, promoting self-confidence in students' ability to be creative with clients.

Additionally, Lucy and Sydney emphasized that being a creative teacher means acknowledging that they are not the only creative people in the room. In doing so, they positively acknowledged students for their creative expressions, and invited them to share their knowledge in the classroom. Lucy, specifically expressed that she often welcomed the idea that students can have expertise in areas which she does not, and felt free to utilize their ideas to enrich the classroom experience. These findings align with creative

teaching theory that instructors must create encouraging classroom conditions to promote student creativity (Torrance, 1987). Torrance (1987) indicated that a supportive classroom climate, and an appropriate balance between reward and motivation are factors that promote creative thinking in the classroom.

Moreover, collaboration was emphasized as a component of creative teaching in the literature. Livingston (2010) asserted that teaching for creativity means encouraging collaborative experiences, which ignite creativity and creative thinking among students (Livingston, 2010). He further proposed that when collaboration occurs among students and teachers, a meaningful exchange permits students to develop their creative reflexes. Similarly, Sawyer (2004) proposed that creative teaching is a collaborative process, that resembles a constructivist approach, where student and teacher construct meaning together. The results of the study support this line of thought. Participants emphasized the collaborative nature of creative teaching, and its impact on student levels of engagement. Camille and Clay became involved in creative classroom experiences, as active participants. Clay for example, gets involved with his counseling skills improvisational workshop. If his students want him to play characters, he engages with them, and takes on those roles. Camille also found herself engaging in a creative intervention with her students, as they used music as a means of communicating with each other. Participants also highlighted that inviting students to be a part of their learning process empowers students and promotes self-efficacy in their creative ability. Ben for example, gets students involved in creating their own final, an experience where students are not only using their creative thinking skills, but they are being positively

acknowledged for their ability to create something with their instructor. Authors have acknowledged the collaborative component of creative teaching (Livingston, 2010, Sawyer, 2004), however, participants offered a unique perspective, highlighting student empowerment as an outcome of the collaborative nature of creative teaching.

Participant results also demonstrate that creative teaching aligns with adult learning theory. Ben explicitly emphasized self-directed learning as a component of creative teaching, while other participants noted that they invited students to be a part of the learning process. This aligns with Knowles (1984) theory that adults need to be involved in the planning and evaluation of their learning. In addition, the collaborative component emphasized by participants aligns with Bruner (1957) and Vygotsky's (1978) theories that adults learn through community experiences and social interactions in the classroom. Participants' perceptions that students were more engaged because of creative teaching provides evidence that creative teaching not only target student's level of involvement in the classroom, but that creative teaching methods align with effective adult learning models.

In addition, Camille and Oliver highlighted that the use of creativity is key in providing the safety necessary for students to feel comfortable expressing themselves. They emphasized the safety component inherent in the use of creative interventions, such as Oliver's use of sandtray to encourage transparency in the classroom. Camille also noticed that her use of puppetry allowed students to safely explore, and gain insight to who they are as developing counselor. This idea is not emphasized in the literature on creative teaching in counselor education.

Another unique contribution that participants offered that is not addressed in creative teaching literature are the sensory and evocative elements of creative teaching moments, that are perceived by the creative teachers themselves during creative teaching moments. All participants acknowledged creative teaching moments as momentous because they felt powerful. Participants like Sydney and Oliver, described creative teaching moments as visceral body-felt experiences. Oliver noted the smile that emerges on his face when describing his creative teaching experiences, while Sydney charismatically emphasized a full body sensation that he imagines beginning in his limbic system. Other participants identified feelings of joy, exhilaration, and excitement. The idea that creative teaching moments felt rare and authentic was also identified by participants. These findings are unique to the literature given that there are currently no empirical studies examining the perceptions of individuals sensory, or emotional experiences while they are engaged in creative teaching moments.

Conceptual articles that currently exist in the literature have served to present counselor educators with creative teaching ideas, and strategies, however, there is limited research demonstrating or testing their impact on student engagement. The study addressed this gap by providing qualitative evidence of educators' perspectives of the impact of creative teaching on students' behavioral responses, and ability to think creatively. The results supported authors promotion of the use of creative teaching approaches to promote creative thinking, self-efficacy, enhanced perception, and empathy (Henderson & Malone, 2009; Lawrence, 2012; Lenes, et. al., 2015). In addition, the collaborative nature of creative teaching identified in the literature (Livingston, 2010;

Sawyer, 2004) was presented by participants, and identified as an element of effective adult approaches to teaching (Bruner, 1957; Vygotsky's, 1978). The results of the study addressed additional gaps in the literature by identifying components of the impact of creative teaching on students, such as empowerment, and safety. Instructors sensory and emotional responses in creative teaching moments were also identified as new information available to counselor educators from the study.

A Non-Cliché Framework

Lin (2011) proposed the most recent comprehensive definition for *creative pedagogy* as a process that is threefold: (a) creative teaching, (b), teaching for creativity, and (c) creative learning. Creative teaching refers to the instructors use of imagination to design curriculum and engage students. Teaching for creativity refers to the exercises incorporated into the curriculum that are aimed at facilitating creative thinking, and creative learning refers to the classroom conditions that must exist to promote creative thinking in students (Lin, 2011). The findings of the study reflected how teachers used all three elements as they pertained to creative teaching in counselor education.

Participants categorized creative teaching as 'not cliché', meaning non-traditional, or unconventional. Ben and Clay highlighted the non-traditional aspects of creative teaching, noting that the instructor role shifts from "sage on the stage" to that of a guide that encourages students to become actively involved in the classroom. Ben explicitly emphasized the idea that education is meant to be lived and experienced. He identified his creative teaching approach as a framework that acknowledges students lived experiences, and he encouraged students to bring their experiences into the classroom to

enhance their learning. Lin (2011) asserted that neglecting characteristics associated with creative learning, such as acknowledging and permitting their autonomy can interfere with their ability to be creative. Thus, a supportive environment that respects students and their personal contributions are important aspects of creative teaching (Lin, 2011). This notion was further supported by participants like Lucy and Camille, who specifically noted that their use of a creative teaching approach was appreciated by students, who they perceived felt valued because of the energy and effort that their instructors put into their teaching. Participants were not just disseminating information, but engaging them in creative ways, which participant's perceived showed students they genuinely cared about their learning experiences.

More Than Didactic

The theme that creative teaching is more than didactic further illustrated that creative teaching was not cliché, and revealed the specific ways in which counselor educators applied creative teaching methods with counseling students. Participants identified the use of modalities, other than lecturing as an element involved in creative teaching. The term experiential was also used as participants emphasized that experiential activities were an important component of their curriculum. All participants provided specific examples of the creative experiential activities they used in the classroom to promote creative thinking, and enhance student understanding. Sydney used metaphors and music lyrics to help students grasp theoretical concepts. Sophie highlighted her use of dance videos to provide students with an alternate way of understanding various human struggles that their future clients may experience. Both

these examples support current literature that illustrates that creative teaching is often experiential. Harrawood, McClure, and Nelson (2011) used experiential activities to help counseling students understand the power of cravings in individuals with addiction. Henderson and Malone (2015), described above, also used fairy tales to help students conceptualize ethical dilemmas that they may run into with their clients.

Participants also felt that experiential activities helped students with self-reflexivity, permitting them to develop important counselor competencies, such as the ability to empathize and examine personal bias. For example, Camille conducted an experiential activity where students were required to take on an alternate socioeconomic identity. Oliver created expressive assignments, where students were asked to examine their personal perspectives through drawing or art work. The results further support the literature that emphasizes the use of experiential activities to promote self-reflexivity in students. Kress et. al. (2014) also added cultural elements to their guided imagery exercises to help students examine personal bias. Giardano, Clarke, and Stare (2015) used live actors in the classroom to assist students in overcoming obstacles to empathy.

Additionally, the idea that creative teachers use experiential learning to enhance creative thinking, and that students are responding positively supports Kolb's (2014) adult learning theory that experiential learning targets a diverse range of learning styles. Thus, learning is accessible because the experiential approach moves through a four-stage cycle, in which each stage targets a different learning mode: (a) a diverging stage is aimed at sensing and observing, (b) an assimilating stage is aimed at observing and

reflecting, (c) a converging stage is aimed at doing and reflecting, and (d) an accommodating stage is aimed at doing and sensing.

Participants also stressed that experiential activities make learning memorable. This was also illustrated in their personal experiences receiving training from creative teachers early in their career. Participants described creative teaching memories that inspired them and stuck with them, impacting their desire to teach creatively, as previously described. Participants noted that they used a creative teaching approach because it allows instructors to embrace a diverse array of learning styles. Experiential activities were inventive, and aimed at engaging all students. While Kolb (2014) does not specifically address experiential theory as a component of teaching for creativity, participants confirmed that the use of experiential activities compliment a creative teaching approach.

Another important item identified in the literature, that was also present in the findings was that everyone can be creative (Czikszentmihalyi, 1996; Duffy & Kerl-McClain, 2006), and that instructors can be creative in a multitude of ways (Creativity, Culture & Education, 2016, Lin, 2011). Oliver specifically noted that creative teaching does not necessarily have to be artsy, and illustrated his ability to be spontaneous and change tracks in his teaching as another way in which he finds himself being creative in the classroom. Camille, also identified spontaneity as a component of creativity, describing creative teaching as her ability to respond to student needs in the moment. These findings illustrate Czikszentmihaly's (1996) identification of flow in creativity, in that regardless of the activity individuals are engaged in, if they are experiencing flow,

they are accessing their ability to be creative in the moment. This means that artists, athletes, or scientists who are engaged in flow, can access their creative ability and apply to the task at hand (Czikszentmihaly, 1996). Hence, as Laughlin (2000) accentuated, creativity is not something that individuals have or do not have, or whether someone is artistic or not artistic, but rather something that can be awakened within every individual.

Furthermore, Ben's ability to use technology to creatively engage students in an online class further illustrates this idea. Ben did not use art components to engage students. Instead, he used YouTube videos and online memory maps to create a dynamic and interactive experience for students. Ben's use of technology also supports the literature that illustrates the use of multimedia as a creative teaching strategy in counselor education (Hayes, 2008). Instructors use of creative experiential activities in the study support the literature that emphasizes them as a component of creative teaching. Participants awareness of their creative capacity, and acknowledgment that creativity is not necessarily "artsy," also illustrates authors emphasis on the nuances of creativity.

Other findings that support the literature apply to the characteristics of creative teachers. Participants noted that they valued their students learning experiences. The effort that they put into their teaching was evident in their interview descriptions, as they described the innovative and imaginative ways in which they engaged students. Participants also acknowledged that self-growth was an important component of creative teaching. For example, Ben and Clay stressed that they were constantly challenging themselves to grow creatively. They noted that it was impossible for them to become stale because they were constantly thinking of new ways to engage their students, or help

them with concepts they did not understand. All participants expressed early on in their interviews their passion for teaching creatively. This was also evidenced in the contributions they made to the field through writing, publications, or attendance at conferences to enhance their creative ability. Authors among the literature identified creative teachers as persistent, intrinsically motivated, and passionate about their work (Bramwell, Reilly, Lilly, Kronish & Chennebathni, 2011). Bain (2004) also stressed that when teachers were consistently focused on how students learn, they constantly adjusted, or adapted their teaching approach in innovative ways. Still, research in this area is limited, and there are currently no research studies in counselor education examining the characteristics of creative teachers in counselor education. Thus, the study helped fill this gap by offering qualitative examples of common qualities that exist among creative teachers in counselor education.

These findings illustrate the components of Lin's (2011) definition of creative teaching by demonstrating how creative teachers in counselor education perceive, creative teaching, and teaching for creatively. Participants identified creative teaching as non-cliché, and more than didactic by providing examples of the experiential activities they used to enhance creative thinking, or foster enhanced perceptions. Participants also highlighted the collaborative nature of creative teaching, which enhanced relational bonds between student, and teacher, and removed the power differential in the classroom. The findings also illustrated that creative teachers in counselor education implement experiential learning components, which have been identified as an ideal method for adult learning (Kolb, 2014). Furthermore, the creative learning components of Lin's

(2011) definition were exemplified in participant results. Participants exemplified how counselor educators create classroom conditions that promote creative thinking, such as acknowledgement of student expertise, autonomy, and encouragement. The characteristics that depict creative teachers in counselor education, such as intrinsic motivation, passion for their work, and a drive to continue to grow are unique to counselor education literature examining creative teaching.

Risk Taking

Literature supports the notion that creative teaching requires boundary pushing, and risk taking (Gibson, 2010; Heckner & Kottler, 2002). Heckner and Kottler (2002) illuminated counselor educators on the notion that pushing the envelope can be the driving force that helps students move out of stuck places. This study further supported the literature given that all participants identified risk taking as a key component of the structure of creative teaching. Upon responding to an interview question asking participants to offer suggestions to future counselor educators who may be interested in counselor education, the phrase, "take a risk" was commonly used. Participants stressed that creative teaching can feel risky because there is a sense of discomfort that comes with the introduction of new ideas, or the implementation of an unconventional intervention in the classroom. Camille, for example, underscored the normalcy of nervous feelings associated with risk taking. Subsequently, participants reported that courage was a necessary quality to indulge, emphasizing that the outcome of risk taking was worthwhile.

Ben and Clay stressed that the risk of refusing to take risks could be far more detrimental to the instructor, who in such cases may be in danger of becoming stuck, and thus halting personal and professional development. Participants acknowledged that risk taking becomes easier over time, as instructors build self-efficacy in their creative ability. Participants, like Lucy, highlighted the idea that making mistakes is a part of the process, and that perfectionism is not a necessary or welcome quality for a creative teacher. Camille stressed that students also need to see their instructors make mistakes so that they also feel empowered to take creative risks. This notion supports Gibson's (2010) assertion that instructors must create an environment that encourages risk taking in students. Still, while risk taking was identified as a characteristic of creative teachers in the literature, participants offered in-depth and rich descriptions of their perceptions of risk taking, which is not currently seen in the literature.

Openness

Conversely, the theme that creative teaching requires openness is supported in the literature for creative teaching. Authors identify openness as an essential element of creative teaching in that creative teachers must remain open to possibility, as well as flexibility in the classroom (Denmead, 2011; Sawyer, 2004). Participants in Denmead's (2011) study on creative teachers emphasized openness, and instructors' ability to be comfortable with uncertainty. Participants in the study also emphasized the need for instructors to open to possibility, such as the possibility of discovering a new way to be creative. Lucy, and Camille emphasized, for example, the need to let go of pre-conceived notions of what creativity is to embrace their personal creative style. Camille and Lucy

would agree with literature that emphasizes the misconceptions about creativity can prevent one from discovering their creative potential (Csikszentmihalyi, 1996; Lawrence, 2012).

Last, the notion that counselor educators must remain open to change to move the profession forward is supported in the literature. Gladding (2008) stressed that it was the creative practitioners that created new counseling theory, or developed new ideas for training that changed the way the profession looks today. Lawrence (2012) also stressed creativity should be infused into all counselor education curriculum to advance our students, and the profession. In this study, Sydney, more specifically stressed that the counseling profession is reliant on counselor educators to encourage future counselors to be creative. Hence, counselor educators must strive to be creative, since creativity for counselors begins in the classroom.

The concept that risk taking is an essential element of creative teaching is supported in the literature (Gibson, 2010; Heckner & Kottler, 2002). Participants, however, offered in-depth descriptions of their perceptions about risk taking and personal experiences with risk taking, not currently presented in the literature examining creative teachers in counselor education. Finally, the view that the counseling profession is reliant on counselor educators' emphasis on creativity in the classroom is also supported in the literature (Gladding, 2008; Lawrence, 2012).

Implications for Creative Teaching in Counselor Education

While creative teaching is not an unfamiliar approach to counselor educators, it is not currently a well-researched topic in the field. This is evidenced in the fact that there

is limited literature discussing or examining creative teaching practices. Much of the literature available presents creative curriculum strategies that emphasize the 'teaching for creativity' component of Lin's (2011) definition for creative pedagogy. Lawrence's (2012) study was the first to develop and examine a creative curriculum for a counseling skills course. His study presented qualitative evidence of the effectiveness of a creativity based curriculum, with positive outcomes reported by both instructor and student pertaining to student development. Before this study was conducted there were no research studies examining the structure and process of creative teaching as perceived by counselor educators.

Lawrence (2012) stressed that creativity in counseling should be viewed as an orientation, rather than a series of strategies and interventions that counselors could apply in session. In a similar vein, counselor educators should acknowledge and view creative teaching as a formal teaching framework, rather than a 'teaching strategy.' While a component of creative teaching is the use of creative interventions, that is not the sole constituent. Lin's (2011) definition for creative pedagogy comprises of three essential aspects: (a) the elements of creative teaching that focus on the instructors' creative ability, (b) the elements of creative teaching that focus on the curriculum provided to students, and (c) the conditions necessary to promote creative learning. The results demonstrated that participants perspectives of creative teaching aligned with all three components of Lin's (2011) description of creative teaching. Still, evidence of counselor educators' acknowledgement of creative teaching as a theoretical framework is missing from the literatures. As the findings suggest, if counselor educators acknowledge

creative teaching as a theoretical teaching framework, they are more likely to attend to all the components that encompass creative teaching, thus encouraging their development as creative teachers.

Additionally, lack of awareness about the concept of creativity was acknowledged by counselor educators in the study. Findings indicated that participants were aware that their colleagues did not view themselves as creative because they did not engage in artistic endeavors, which prevented them from utilizing a creative approach in their classrooms. Hence, awareness is essential to increase counselor educators understanding of what it means to be creative. The findings also revealed that instructors can be creative in multiple ways, thus illuminating the idea that creativity in the classroom is not exclusive to art. A starting place for increasing awareness of creative teaching as a theoretical teaching framework may be in the inclusion of Lin's (2011) definition of creative pedagogy in counselor education literature when creative teaching methods and approaches are discussed or examined.

The findings also indicated that creative teaching promotes creative thinking in students. Participants acknowledged that creative teaching methods increased students' confidence in their ability to be creative, which translated into their counseling sessions. These findings were supported by the literature demonstrating the effectiveness of creative teaching in counselor education and supervision (Laughlin, 2000, Lawrence, 2012). Additionally, the counseling profession values creativity, which is evidenced in the professions development of the Association for Creativity in Counseling (ACC), and the contributions offered to the literature in creativity in counseling (Duffy & Kerl-

McClain, 2006; Gladding, 2016). Furthermore, Gurung et. al. (2009) promoted the use of signature pedagogies, which are the teaching frameworks that reflect the customs and values of the profession. Acknowledging creative teaching as a theoretical framework in the literature may also be a starting place for encouraging counselor educators to embrace creative teaching a signature approach that reflects the customs and values of the profession. Counselor education programs may also acknowledge creative teaching as a theoretical framework in training courses. Additionally, mentors engaging students in co-teaching experiences may encourage students to explore the use of creative teaching while training.

Furthermore, a unique contribution was offered by participants who emphasized the personal experiences that influenced their desire and ability to be creative in the classroom. All participants acknowledged that creative teaching is shaped by past experiences. Although several participants identified positive experiences in childhood as the beginning of their recognition of their creative potential, a majority of the sample also identified past training experiences as a primary time-period that influenced their desire and ability to teach creatively. Participants also emphasized that their instructors at that time were creative teaching role models, who inspired them to be creative. Accordingly, counselor education students may benefit from instructional courses that teach students about creative teaching and encourage its application. Faculty mentors may also consider modeling a creative teaching approach with doctoral students during co-teaching experiences. Consequently, one of the participants, specifically, stressed that he was surprised by how many of his colleagues were not taught how to teach. Perhaps

this also demonstrates that more emphasis should be placed on instructional methods courses in counselor education programs, in addition to co-teaching experiences.

Finally, the findings indicated that risk taking is a primary component of the structure and process of creative teaching. Participants stressed that risk taking and openness will move the counseling profession forward if we start by promoting creativity in the classroom. Although it is not clear whether counselor educators' country-wide are encouraged to be creative, Wisdom (2006) argued that higher education institutes should encourage the development of creativity in their faculty. Hence, an ideal place to start promoting creative teaching in counselor education, is within counselor education departments, where faculty chairs, and lead instructors are encouraging new staff, and colleagues to be creative. As indicated in the literature, that students learn to be creative from teachers who are also creative (Milgram & Davidovich, 2010), which was also supported in the study findings, faculty could also benefit from creative teacher trainings and workshops.

Overall, both the findings and the literature demonstrate that creative teaching impacts students in positive ways. Participants recognized that creative teaching ultimately empowers students to be creative. This is an important revelation because the instructors teaching approach will ultimately influence student outcomes. In the counseling profession, creativity is valued. The findings of this study, and the literature demonstrate that creativity can be enhanced, and that students can and do become more creative when instructors create learning conditions that promote creativity, including enhancing their own creative ability. Thus, the pathway to awaken creativity in the

classroom does not begin with students, but rather begins with the educators, who must first awaken creativity within themselves. Creative teaching is a starting point for fostering creative counselors.

Limitations

A primary limitation for this study, as with all qualitative research, is that it was subjective in nature, and generalizability is not possible (Glesne, 2011). The study provided counselor educators who engage in creative teaching practices with the opportunity to express their views and perspectives, however, this only included a small sample of participants. Still, the rich, and in-depth descriptions provided by participants presented nuances and details specific to the phenomenon of creative teaching that may not otherwise available through objective measures.

Additionally, participant recruitment was a challenge. While there is a large pool of counselor educators teaching for CACREP accredited counseling track programs, the literature demonstrates that creative teaching and creative teaching methods among counselor educators has only recently been discussed and promoted. Consequently, finding creative teachers in counselor education was difficult. Moreover, since creative teaching has not been formally acknowledged as a formal teaching framework, counselor educators may not recognize or acknowledge the extent to which they have been creative in their teaching. Misconceptions about the concepts of creativity that were identified in both the literature review, and the study findings, may have influenced counselor educators' views of creative teaching, and perceive it as an arts-based approach. During the recruitment phase of data collection, the researcher found two potential participants

were uncertain whether they were creative teachers. The participants noted that by reading the inclusion criteria they recognized that they "may" qualify as a creative teacher, but did not formally recognize creative teaching as a theoretical teaching framework, and were uncertain that their methods were in fact creative. These two participants were excluded from the study.

Finally, the fact that the researcher had a personal investment in the topic of creative teaching may be viewed as a limitation. While qualitative studies often stem from personal inspiration on the part of the researcher (Van Mannen, 1990), personal bias may impact the study if the researcher does not carefully attend to trustworthiness measures (Glesne, 2011). Trustworthiness factors and transferability are discussed in the next section.

Trustworthiness and Transferability

Adhering to trustworthiness measures are important in qualitative research to ensure the credibility of the study. These include the accuracy, consistency, and neutrality of the findings (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). The researcher used several trustworthiness strategies to ensure accuracy and truthfulness in reporting results: (a) research journal, (b) member checks, (c) imagination variation (Moustakas, 1994), and (d) audit trail.

In Qualitative research, bracketing is important to account for personal bias that may influence the researchers' choices during data analysis. In this study, the researcher immediately began using research journal, detailing all research activities, and bracketing notes (i.e. epoche) to illuminate her personal ideas about process and structure of creative

teaching. The journal was examined by her methodologist, and an external auditor throughout all phases of data collection and data analysis. The researchers' methodologist used the research journal to assist the researcher in the imagination variation phase of data analysis to assist her in maintaining a fresh perspective as the researcher identified collective themes.

Member checks are an additional method for enhancing the credibility and trustworthiness of the study (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). All participants in this study completed two member checks in which they verified the accuracy of data included in both the verbatim transcript, and the chart developed by the researcher in which she extracted significant statements. Participants confirmed during member checks that the verbatim transcripts and charts holding significant statements accurately depicted their experiences of creative teaching.

Furthermore, an external auditor completed three audits over the course of data collection and data analysis, in which she reviewed the following items: (a) verbatim transcripts, (b) charts holding significant statements of participants, (c) the researchers' identification of themes for individual participant's, (d) the researchers' individual textural-structural descriptions, (d) the researchers' identification of themes across participants, and (e) the researchers research journal. The auditor provided feedback throughout the initial phases of data. After the identification of themes across participants was determined, the auditor verified and confirmed her approval of the findings. A support letter from the auditor is provided in the appendix of this dissertation.

A final item that enhances the credibility of the study was that purposeful sampling was conducted by the researcher. Counselor educators who were selected to participate in this study had a vested interest in creative teaching, and all participants met the minimum of two-years' experience using a creative teaching approach. Nearly all participants had made several contributions to the field sharing their creative teaching ideas. Thus, participants knowledge of creative teaching, in addition to their years of experience using a creative teaching approach made them credible sources for this study.

Future Research Recommendations

The findings uncovered counselor educators' perceptions of the structure and process of creative teaching in the classroom. Counselor educators in this study acknowledged that creative teaching is shaped by past experiences; a unique contribution to the literature. Participants also identified creative teaching as an approach that promotes student engagement and empowerment, which aligned with the literature. Risk taking, and developing classroom experiences that are not cliché, and more than didactic, were important elements for creative teachers to acknowledge in counselor education. Additional sampling could provide more evidence that these themes exist, and enhance the credibility of the study, or offer additional themes that strengthen the findings. Another way to extend the study could include field observations of creative teachers in the counseling classroom over the course of the semester. This may allow researchers to obtain an external perspective, and deeper sense of the structure, and process of creative teaching, as well as what it means to be a creative teacher.

Additionally, the findings offered implications for counselor education, which point to opportunities for further research. For example, the findings suggest that creative teaching is shaped by past experiences, and that creative teachers were influenced by past role models and training experiences, where creativity was encouraged. Still, misconceptions about creativity exist. Hence, counselor educators may misunderstand what it means to be a creative teacher. Qualitative methods sampling large pools counselor educators, such as a survey examining counselor educators understanding of creative teaching, and what it means to use creative teaching in the classroom may yield more information about these misconceptions. The results could help counselor educators determine what might need to be done to promote the use of creative teaching in counselor education.

Additionally, the results suggesting that creative teachers in counselor education have been encouraged to be creative in the classroom by previous instructors provoked questions in the researcher such as, are faculty being encouraged to be creative in the classroom in counselor education programs? What kind of environment must exist for faculty to feel comfortable taking risks and subscribing to a theoretical framework like creative teaching? What needs to be done among counselor education programs so that departments embrace the use of a creative teaching framework? These questions can be addressed in two ways: (a) extending the current study by including additional interviews that ask participants to respond to some of these questions, and (b) conducting focus groups among a larger sample of counselor educators who are creative.

Additionally, the perspectives of students were not examined in the study. Lawrence's (2012) study examined the perceptions of counseling students' perceptions engaging in creative curriculum, and its impact on their professional development. Still, more research examining student perspectives would be beneficial, and may yield results that assist counselor educators in improving, and fine tuning their creative teaching approach.

Conclusion

In this study, the researcher sought to obtain information about the structure and process of creative teaching, as perceived by counselor educators. A phenomenological approach was used to uncover the collective essence of the experience of creative teaching. Data revealed that creative teaching is shaped by past experiences; a unique contribution offered by participants, not currently present in counselor education literature. In addition, participants acknowledged that creative teaching promotes student engagement, and requires risk taking and experiential processes that are more than didactic. The findings aligned with and contributed to the current literature. Further research would benefit the field by deepening educators understanding of creative teaching as it pertains to counselor education, and suggestions for promoting the use of creative teaching in counselor education programs.

References

Albert, R.S., & Runco, M.A. (1999). A history of research on creativity. In R.J. Sternberg (Ed.), *Handbook of creativity*, (pp. 16-31). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press. doi: 1017/CBO9780511807916.002

Alspup, J. (2004). Am I a teacher? Exploring the development of professional identity. *Language Arts Journal of Michigan, 20*(1), 35-39. doi: 10.9707/2168_149x.1245

American Art Therapy Association. (2016). What is art therapy. Retrieved from http://arttherapy.org.

American Counseling Association (2016). Association for creativity in counseling. Retrieved from http://www.aca.org.

American Dance Therapy Association. (2016). What is dance/movement therapy. Retrieved from http://adta.org.

Arthur, N. & Auchenbach, K. (2002). Developing multicultural counseling competencies through experiential learning. *Counselor Education and Supervision, 42*, 2-14. doi: 10.1002/J.1556-6978.2002.tb01229.x

Association for Counselor Education and Supervision, Taskforce on Best Teaching Practices in Counselor Education (2016). *Report of the ACES Taskforce on Best Teaching Practices in Counselor Education.* Retrieved from http://www.acesonline.net/default/files/ACES%20%Teaching%20Initiative%20Taskforce%Final%20Report%Oct%2023%202016%20.pdf.

Bain, K. (2004). *What the best college teachers do.* Cambridge, MA: Harvard University

Press. doi: 10.1080/00221340701460639

Ballile, C. (2006). Enhancing students' creativity through creative thinking techniques. In N. Jackson, M. Oliver, M. Shaw & J. Wisdom (Eds.), *Developing creativity in higher Education*. New York, NY: Routledge. *An Imaginative Curriculum*, (pp. 263-288). doi: 104324/9780203016503

Bodenhorn, N. & Starkey, D. (2005). Beyond role-playing: Increasing empathy through theater exercises. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health, 1*(2), 17-27.

Bohart, A. (1999). Intuition and creativity in psychotherapy. *Journal of Constructivist Psychology, 12,* 287-311. doi: 10.1080/1540130802023605

Bradley, L.J., Whiting, P., Hendricks, B., Parr, G., & Jones, E.G. Jr. (2008). The use of expressive techniques in counseling. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health, 3*(1), 44-58. doi; 10.1080/15401380802023605

Bramwell, G., Reilly, R.C. Lilly, F.R., Kronish, N. & Chennabathni, R. (2011). Creative teachers. *Roeper Review, 33,* 228-238. doi: 10.1080/02783193.2011.603111

Bruner, J.S. (1961). The act of discovery. *Harvard Educational Review, 31,* 21-32.

Bruner, J. S. (1957). *Going beyond the information given*. New York: Norton.

Bull, K.S., Montgomery, D., & Baloche, L. (1995). Teaching creativity at the college level: a synthesis of curricular components perceived as important by instructors. *Creativity Research Journal,* 83-89. doi: 10.1207/s15326934crj0801_7

Cardosa de Sousa, F. (2010). Creative teaching and effective teaching in higher education. *The International Journal of Organizational Innovation, 3*(4), 5-43.

Carson, D.K. & Becker, K.W. (2004). When lightning strikes: Reexamining creativity in

Psychotherapy. *Journal of Counseling & Development, 82,* 111-115. doi: 10.100 2/j.1556-6678.2004tb00292.x

Creativity, Culture & Education. (2016). Our work. Retrieved from http://www.creativityculutre education.org/our-work.

Chaiklin, S. & Schmais, C. (1993). The Chace approach to dance therapy. In S.L. Sandel, S. Chaiklin & A. Lohn (Eds.), *Foundations of dance movement therapy: The life and work of Marian Chace,* 75-97. Columbia, MD: The Marian Chace Memorial Fund of The American Dance Therapy Association.

Council for Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs. (2016). The *2016 standards.* Alexandria, VA: Author. Retrieved from: http://www.cacrep.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/10/2016-CACREP-standards.pdf.

Creswell, J. (2013). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches, 4th ed.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Cresswell, J. (2013). *Qualitative inquiry and research design* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Cropley, A.J. (1997). *More ways than one: Fostering creativity in the classroom.* Norwood, NJ: Ablex Publishing Corporation.

Csikszentmihalyi, M. (1996). *Creativity: Flow and the psychology of discovery and invention.* New York, NY: Harper Collins. doi: 10.1177/001698629704100309

Denmead, T. (2010). Being and becoming: elements of pedagogies described by three East Anglian creative practitioners. *Thinking Skills and Creativity, 6,* 57-66.

doi: 10.1016/j.tsc.2010.10.004

Duffy, T. (2008). Promoting relational competencies in counselor education through creativity and relational cultural theory. *Journal of creativity in Mental Health, 2*(1), 47-59. doi: 10.1300/j456v02n01_05

Duffy, T., Habberstroh, S., & Trepal, H. (2009). A grounded theory of relational Competencies and creativity in counseling: Beginning the dialogue. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health, 4*, 89-112. doi: 10.1080/15401380902951911

Duffy, T. & Kerl-McClain (2006). History of the Association of Creativity in Counseling: The evolution of a division, conference, and journal. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health, 2*(3), 61-70. doi: 10.1300/j456v02n03_06

Ellis, A. (2001). *Overcoming destructive beliefs, feelings, and behaviors.* New York: Albert Ellis Institute.

Fink, A., Benedeck, M., Grabner, R.H., Staudt, B. & Neubauer, A.C. (2006). Creativity meets neuroscience: experimental tasks for the neuroscientific study of creative thinking. *Science Direct, 42,* 68-76. doi: 10.1016/j.ymeth.20066.12.001

Florida, R. (2002). *The rise of the creative class*. New York: Basic Books.

Fosnot, C.T. (1996). Constructivism: A psychological theory of learning. In C.T. Fosnot (Ed.), Constructivism: Theory, perspective, and practice (p. 8-33). New York: Teachers College Press.

Freud, S. (1908/1959). The relation of the poet to daydreaming. In E.J. (Ed.), *Collected Papers* (pp. 419-514). New York, NY: Basic Books.

Gardner, H. (1983). *Frames of mind: The theory of multiple intelligences.* New York,

NY: Basic Books. doi: 10.1002/pam.405.0030422

Giardano, A., Stare, B., & Clarke, P. (2015). Overcoming obstacles to empathy: the use of experiential learning in addictions counseling courses. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health, 10*(1), 110-113. doi: 10.1080/15401383.2014.947011

Gibson, R. (2010). The art of creative teaching: Implications for higher education. *Teaching in Higher Education,* 15, 5, 607-613. doi: 10.1080/13562517.2010.493349

Gladding, S. (2008). The impact of creativity in counseling. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health, 3*(2), 97-104. doi; 10.1080/1541380802226679

Gladding, S. (2016). *The creative arts in counseling 5th ed.* Alexandria, VA: American Counseling Association.

Glesne, C. (2011). *Becoming qualitative researchers: An Introduction* (4th ed.). Boston, MA: Pearson.

Goldberg, R. & Stephenson, J. (2015). Staying with the metaphor: Applying reality therapy's use of metaphors to grief counseling. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health, 11*(1), 105-117. doi: 10.1080/15401383.2015.1113396

Guilford, J.P. (1967). *The nature of human intelligence.* New York: McGraw-Hill.

Gurung, R.A., Chick, N.L. & Haynie, A. (Eds.) (2009). *Exploring signature pedagogies: Approaches to teaching disciplinary habits of mind.* Sterling, VA: Stylus. doi: 10.1111/j.1467-9647.2010.00631.x

Harrawood, L.K., Mcclure, C.C., & Nelson, J. (2011). Using experiential activities to prepare counselors in training to understand the power of cravings when

addressing clients with addiction. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health, 6*(2), 105-117. doi: 10.1080/15401383.2011.579872

Hayes, G. (2008). The use of multimedia instruction in counselor education: a creative teaching strategy. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health,* 3, 3, 243-253. doi: 10.1080/15401380802334614

Heckner, L.L. & Kottler, J.A. (2002). Growing creative therapists: introduction to the special issue. *Journal of Clinical Activities, Assignments & Handouts in Psychotherapy Practice, 2*(2), 1-3. doi: 10.1300/j182v02n02_01

Henderson, K. & Malone, S. (2012). Ethical fairy tales: using fairy Tales as illustrative ethical dilemmas with counseling students. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health,* 7, 65-82. doi: 10.1080/15401383.2012.660128

Husserl, H. (1931/2002). *Ideas: General introduction to pure phenomenology*. New York, NY: Routledge.

Jackson, N., & Sinclair, C. (2006). Developing student's creativity: searching for an appropriate pedagogy. In N. Jackson, M. Oliver, M. Shaw & J. Wisdom (Eds.), *Developing creativity in higher education: An imaginative curriculum,* (pp. 226-266). New York, NY: Routledge. doi: 104324/9780203016503

Kaimal, G., Drescha, J., Fairbank, H., Gonzaga, A., & White, G. (2014). Inspiring creativity in urban school leaders: Lessons from the arts. *International Journal of Education and the Arts, 15*(4), 1-22.

Kaufman, J.C. & Beghetto, R.A. (2009). Beyond big and little: The four-c model of creativity. *Review of General Psychology, 13*(1), 1-12.

Kipper, D.A., Green, D.J., & Prorak, A. (2010). The relationship among spontaneity, impulsivity, and creativity. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health, 5,* 39-53. doi: 10.1080/15401381003640866

Kolb, D.A. (2014). *Experiential learning: Experience as the source of learning and development*. Upper Saddle, NJ: Pearson.

Kottler, J.A. & Heckner, L.L. (2002). Creativity in therapy: Being struck by lightening and guided by thunderstorms. *Journal of Clinical Activities, Assignments & Handouts in Psychotherapy Practice, 2*(2), 5-21. doi: 10.1300/j182v02n02_02

Knowles, M.S., Holston, E.F., & Swanson, R.A. (2005). *The adult Learner: The definitive classic in adult education and human resource development*. Amsterdam: Elsevier.

Knowles, M. (1984). *A neglected species (3rd ed.)*. Houston, TX: Golf Publishing.

Kress, V., Paylo, M., Adamson, N. & Baltrinic, E. (2014). Teaching diagnosis in context: Guided imagery as a contextually sensitive pedagogical technique. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health,* 9, 275-291. doi: 10.1080/15401383.2013.854190

Ladson-Billings, G. (2009). *The dream-keepers: Successful teachers of African American children, 2nd ed.* San Francisco, CA: John Wiley & Sons.

Laughlin, M.J. (2000). Teaching creativity in family therapy supervision: Looking through an improvisational lens. *Journal of Systemic Therapies, 19*(3), 55-75. doi: 10.1521/jsyt2000.19.3.55

Lawrence, C., Foster, V.A., & Tieso, C.L. (2015). Creating creative clinicians:

Incorporating creativity into counselor education. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health, 10,* 166-180. doi: 10.1080/15401383.2014.963188

Lawrence, C. (2012). *Jumping off the couch: Infusing creativity into counselor education* (Doctoral Dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest. (ED549224).

Lenes, E., Swank, J., & Nash, S. (2015). A qualitative exploration of a music experience within a counselor education sexuality course. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health, 10,*216-231. doi: 10.1080/15401383.2014.983255

Lin, Y. (2011). Fostering creativity through education-a conceptual framework of creative pedagogy. *Creative Education, 2*(3), 149-155. doi: 10.4236/ce.2011.230 21

Lincoln, G. & Guba, E (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry.* London: Sage.

Linneham, C. (2013). Beyond words: A creative arts approach to counseling the bereaved. *Association for Death Education and Counseling, 39*(4), 3-6.

Livingston, L. (2010). Teaching creativity in higher education. *Arts Education Policy Review, 111,* 59-62. doi; 10.1080/10632910903455884.

Marlott, K., Hall, H., Sheely-Moore, A., Krell, M., & Cardaciotto, L. (2014). Evidence-based teaching in higher education: Application to counselor education. *Counselor Education and Supervision,* 53, 294-305. doi: 10.1002/j.1556-6978.2014.00064

Marshall, C., & Rossman, G. (2016). *Designing Qualitative Research,* (6th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Maslow, A.H. (1943). A theory of human motivation. *Psychological Review, 50*(4),

370-96.

Matson, J. (1991). Failure 101: Rewarding failure in the classroom to stimulate creative behavior. *First Quarter, 25,* 82-85. doi: 10.1002/j2162-6057.1991.tb01357.x

Mayer, R. (1989). Cognitive views of creativity: Creative teaching for creative learning. *Contemporary Educational Psychology, 14,* 203-211. doi: 10.106/0361-476x(59) 90010-6

McAuliffe, G. & Eriksen, K. (2002). *Teaching strategies for constructivist and developmental counselor education.* Westport, CN: Bergin & Garvey.

Milgram, R. M. & Davidovich, N. (2010). Creative thinking and lecturer effectiveness in higher education. *The International Journal of Creativity & Problem Solving, 20*(1), 7-14.

Miller, B., Cardona, J. & Hardin, M. (2006). The use of narrative therapy and internal family systems with survivors of childhood sexual abuse: Examining issues related to loss and oppression. *Journal of Feminist and Family Therapy,* 18, (4), 1-27. doi: 10.1300/j086v18n04_01

Milner, J. (2006). Creativity and aging: Enhancing quality of life through the arts. *The Journal of Active Aging,* 54-58.

Morse, J.M. (1995). The significance of saturation. *Qualitative Health Research, 5*(2), 147-149. DOI: 101177/104973239500500201.

Morse, J.M. (1994). Designing qualitative research. In N.K. Denzin & Y.S. Lincoln (Eds.). *Handbook of qualitative inquiry* (p. 220-235). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Moustakas, C. (1994). *Phenomenological research methods.* Thousand, Oaks, CA: Sage Publications. doi: 10.4135/978142995658

Murphy, P.F. (1996). Defining pedagogy. In P.F. Murphy & C.V. Gipps (Eds.), *Equity in the classroom: Towards effective pedagogy for girls and boys,* (pp. 28-39). New York: Routledge.

Nachmanovitch, S. (1990). *Free play: Improvisation in life and art.* New York, NY: Penguin Putnam Inc.

National Alliance on Creative & Cultural Education. (1999). *All our futures: Creativity, culture and education*. Report prepared for the Secretary of State for Education and Employment and the Secretary of State for Culture, Media, and Sport of London. Retrieved from: sirkenrobinson.com/pdf/allourfutures.pdf.

National Endowment for the Arts (NEA). (2014). *How creativity works in the brain*. Produced by the NEA Office of Research & Analysis. Insights obtained from a meeting regarding the nature of creativity in the brain among 15 creativity researchers, co-sponsored by the NEA and the Santa Fe Institute in Santa Fe, New Mexico.

Nickerson, R.S. (1999). Enhancing creativity. In R.J. Sternberg (Ed.), *Handbook of creativity,* (pp. 392-430). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press. doi: 10. 1017/CB09780511807916.002

Osborne, A. (1963). *Applied imagination: Principles and procedures of creative thinking.* New York: Scribner.

Palmer, P.J. (2007). *The courage to teach: Exploring the inner landscape of a*

teacher's life. San Francisco, CA: John Wiley & Sons.

Phillip, R. (2015). The invisibility cloak of creativity. *Higher Education Research & Development, 34*(2), 436-438. doi: 10.1080/07294360.2014.980880

Piaget, J. (1936). *Origins of intelligence in the child*. London: Routledge.

Rinkevich, J. (2011). Creative teaching: Why it matters and where to begin. *The Clearing House, 84,* 219-223. doi; 10.1080/0098655.2011.575416

Rogers, C. (1961). *On becoming a person.* New York, NY: Houghton Mifflin Company. doi: 10.1002/jpoc.20072

Rosenthal, H. (2002). Samuel T. Gladding on creativity. *Journal of Clinical Activities, Assignments & Handouts in Psychotherapy Practice, 2,* 23-33. doi: 10.1300/j182v 02n02_03

Runco, M.A. (1996). Personal creativity: Definition and developmental issues. In M.A. Runco (Ed.), *Creativity from childhood through adulthood: The developmental issues* (pp. 3-30). San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Runco, M.A. & Sakamato, S.O. (1999). Experimental studies of creativity. In R.J. Sternberg (Ed.), *Handbook of creativity,* (pp. 62-92). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press. doi: 10.1017/CB09780511807916.002

Sandel, S. (1993). Imagery in dance therapy groups: A developmental approach. In S.L. Sandel, S. Chaiklin & A. Lohn (Eds.), *Foundations of dance movement therapy: The life and work of Marian Chace,* (112-119). Columbia, MD: The Marian Chace Memorial Fund of The American Dance Therapy Association.

Sawyer, R.K. (2004). Creative teaching: Collaborative discussion as disciplined

improvisation. *Educational Researcher, 33*(2), 12-20. doi: 10.3102/0013189x033002012

Schwartz, R. (1995). *Internal family systems therapy.* New York, NY: The Guilford Press.

Sheehan, S. (2014). A conceptual framework for understanding transcendental phenomenology through the lived experiences of biblical leaders. *Emerging Leadership Journeys,* 7, 10-20.

Shulman, L.S. (2005). Signature pedagogies in the professions. *Daedalus, 134*(3), 52-59. doi: 10.1162/0011526054622015

Snyder, B. (1997). Healing the soul through creativity. *Journal of Humanistic Education and Development,* 36, 2. doi: 10.1002/j2164-4683.1997.tb00375.x

Starko, A.J. (2014). *Creativity in the classroom: Schools of curious delight, 5th ed.* New York, NY: Routledge. doi: 10.4324/9781410611291

Sternberg, R.J. & Williams, W.M. (1996). *How to develop student creativity.* Alexandria, VA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development.

Sternberg, R.J. & Lubart, T.I. (1999). The concept of creativity: Prospects and paradigms. In R.J. Sternberg (Ed.), *Handbook of creativity,* (3-15). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press. doi: 10.1017/CB09780511807916.002

Sternberg, R.J. & O'hara, L.A. (1999). Creativity and intelligence. In R.J. Sternberg (Ed.), *Handbook of creativity,* (251-272). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press. doi: 10.1017/CB09780511807916.002

Thompson, B. (2014). Sketching out the story. In B.E. Thompson & R.A. Niemeyer

(Eds.), *Grief and the expressive arts: Practices for creating meaning,* (pp. 139-145). New York, NY: Routledge. doi: 10.1111/bjop.12128

Torrance, E.P. (1987). Teaching for creativity. In S.G. Isaksen (Ed.) *Frontiers of creativity research: Beyond the basics,* (pp. 189-215). Buffalo, NY: Bearly Limited.

Wallas, G. (1926/2014). *The art of thought*. Kent, England: Solis Press.

Walkington, J. (2005). Becoming a teacher: Encouraging development of teacher identity through reflective practice. *Asia Pacific Journal of Teacher Education, 33*(1), 53-64. DOI: 10.1080/135986605200341124.

West, J.D., Bubenzer, D.L., & Giminez-Hinkle, M.S. (2013). Considering and articulating one's beliefs about teaching. In J.D. West, D.L. Bubenzer, J.A. Cox, & J.M. McGlothlin (Eds.), *Teaching in counselor education: Engaging students in learning,* (1-11). Alexandria, VA: Association for Counselor Education and Supervision.

Wisdom, J. (2006). Developing higher education teachers to teach creatively. In N. Jackson, M. Oliver, M. Shaw & J. Wisdom (Eds.), *Developing creativity in higher education: An imaginative curriculum,* (pp. 334-357). New York, NY: Routledge. doi: 104324/9780203016503

Wolf, R. (2002). Self-reflection: An essential quality for phenomenological researchers. In S.B. Merriam & Associates (Eds.), *Qualitative research in practice: Examples for discussion and analysis,* (pp. 117-119). San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Van Manen, M. (1990). *Researching lived experience: Human science for an action*

sensitive pedagogy. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.

Vygotsky, L.S. (1978). *Mind in society: The development of higher psychological practices*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Yoruk, S. & Runco, M. (2014). The neuroscience of divergent thinking. *Activitas Nervosa Superior*, 56, 1-2, 1-14. doi: 10.1007/BF03379602

Appendix A

Recruitment Email

Dear_____,

My name is Carla McGhee. I am a doctoral candidate at the University of Toledo, Ohio in the Counselor Education department. In fulfillment of the requirements for my doctoral degree, I am conducting a qualitative phenomenological research study on creative teaching in counselor education, from the perspectives of counselor educators. I believe that the study will benefit the field by providing counselor educators with an understanding of what it means to engage in creative pedagogy/andragogy and how they can access their own creative teaching abilities. To recruit participants, I am asking for your assistance in identifying colleagues you know in your counseling track departments, or other counseling track departments who meet the study criteria, and may be interested in participating in this study. Potential participants must have a minimum of two years teaching experience as a faculty member of a CACREP accredited counseling track program (excluding doctoral internship & teaching assistantship experience). They must be familiar with creative teaching (i.e. have knowledge of creative teaching methods described in the literature, such as the *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health*). Potential participants must also be actively using creative teaching methods in their counseling courses with masters and/or doctoral students (i.e. self-reports and/or contributions made through writing or workshops, sharing their creative teaching ideas). If you know of individuals who meet these criteria, could you please forward their contact information (name, professional email, and professional phone number) to Carla.lafarga@rockets.utoledo.edu so that I can contact them to determine if they are interested in participating in my research study. If you have further questions about the study and prefer to respond via telephone, you may contact me 630-640-0373. You may also contact my dissertation chair, Dr. John Laux, at 419-530-4705.
Thank you for your time. I appreciate your assistance in this process.
Sincerely,

Carla M. McGhee, MA, LPCC, BC-DMT
Doctoral Candidate, University of Toledo, Counselor Education Department

Appendix B

Prospective Participant Email

Dear_____,

My name is Carla McGhee. I am a doctoral candidate at the University of Toledo, Ohio in the Counselor Education department. To complete my dissertation, I am conducting a qualitative phenomenological research study on creative teaching in counselor education, from the perspectives of counselor educators. I believe that the study will benefit the field by providing counselor educators with an understanding of what it means to engage in creative pedagogy/andragogy and how they can access their own creative teaching abilities.

_____identified you as an educator who has an interest in, and practices creative teaching with counselors in training. S/he recommended that I contact you since you may be willing and able to talk about your experiences as a creative teacher. Since I am conducting a phenomenological study, I will be conducting 60 minute interviews with participants who volunteer for the study. I will also be asking participants to conduct two 30 minute follow up tasks via email to ensure that I am accurately understanding the information provided in the interview. The requirements to participate in the study include: (a) a minimum of two years teaching experience as a faculty member of a CACREP accredited counseling track program (excluding doctoral internship & teaching assistantship experience); (b) familiarity with creative teaching (i.e. have knowledge of creative teaching methods described in the literature, such as the *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health*, and (c) actively using creative teaching methods in counseling courses with masters and/or doctoral students (i.e. self-reports and/or contributions made through writing or workshops, sharing their creative teaching ideas). Please email me at Carla.lafarga@rockets.utoledo.edu, to communicate your interest in participating, or relay that you are not interested in participating. If you have further questions about the study and prefer to respond via telephone, you may contact me 630-640-0373. You may also contact my dissertation chair, Dr. John Laux, at 419-530-4705.

Thank you for your time. I appreciate your assistance in this process.

Sincerely,

Carla M. McGhee, MA, LPCC, BC-DMT

Doctoral Candidate, University of Toledo, Counselor Education Department

Appendix C

Initial Email to Participants

Dear _____,

Thank you for agreeing to participate in my research study. I appreciate your willingness to share your experiences with me. Before conducting the study, I will need you to read and sign the consent form, and fill out both the demographic questionnaire, and the interview availability time sheet that I have attached to this email. For the informed consent, please print out the signature page, sign and scan it. Please email all completed materials to: Carla.lafarga@rockets.utoledo.edu. I will email you once again to confirm an interview date after I have received your materials.

Thank you for your time. I look forward to hearing from you.

Sincerely,

Carla M. McGhee, MA, LPCC, BC-DMT
Doctoral Candidate, University of Toledo, Counselor Education Department

Appendix D

Informed Consent

Principal Investigators: John Laux, PH. D, and Carla M. McGhee, Doctoral Student at the University of Toledo in the Counselor Education Program, (john.laux@utoledo.edu and Carla.lafarga@rockets.toledo.edu)

Purpose: You are invited to participate in a research project examining the research question: *what are counselor educator's self-reported experiences of creative teaching?* The purpose of the study is to contribute to the counseling field in the area of pedagogy. The results will be presented in a dissertation and shared with the faculty of the Counselor Education Department at the University of Toledo in fulfillment of the primary researcher's doctoral degree in Counselor Education & Supervision. The results will later be converted into a manuscript and submitted for publication in a counseling journal.

Description of Procedures: You will be asked to engage in a 60-minute interview where you will be asked questions related to your thoughts and ideas about creative teaching and how you apply creative teaching in the classroom setting. Interviews will take place online via Skype. Additionally, you will be asked to collaborate with the researcher by conducting two follow up tasks via email correspondence: (a) after the researcher has transcribed your interview, you will be will be asked to confirm that the verbatim interview accurately depicts your experience and make edits as you see necessary, and (b) after the researcher extracts significant statements from the returned verbatim interview, you will be asked to verify if the extracted statements accurately represent your understanding of the experience in its entirety, and make changes as you see necessary (eliminating statements, or adding statements).

The researcher will send you an email with detailed instructions when it is time to complete each follow up task. Each follow up task will take approximately 30 minutes of your time. You will be given to weeks to complete each follow up task.

Please note that samples, including quotes from the verbatim transcripts and tables will be displayed in the presentation of the dissertation and journal article. Your name and identifying information will be concealed and remain confidential. All final data interpretations and explanations will be made available to you at your request.

Please read and address the following additional information:

A tape recorder and back up tape recorder will be used during the interview. Will you permit the researcher to audio record during this research procedure?

YES Initial Here_____

The researcher will debrief you about the data, theory and research area under study and answer any questions you may have about the research prior to the interviews and procedure mentioned above, and after the procedure is complete.

Potential Risks: This study involves minimal risk; however, loss of confidentiality may occur due to human error. If you wish to disengage from the study at any point, you have the right to do so.

Potential Benefits: Others may benefit from what they learn from you regarding creative teaching, including educators in the field of counseling.

Confidentiality: The researcher will take precaution to ensure that individuals who are not involved in the research do not become aware of the information you have provided or your identifying information. Consent forms will be kept in a file, separate from responses and other data collected in a secure file cabinet located in a secure room of the researcher's home office. Names will not be included on interview transcripts or data samples. The researcher will keep the verbatim transcripts in an electronic file, encrypted with a password. Although the researcher will take every possible precaution to protect your confidentiality, there is a low risk that a breach in confidentiality will occur.

Voluntary Participation: You have the right to refuse to participate in this study with no penalty. You additionally have the right to discontinue participation at any time without penalty.

Contact Information: Before you make the decision to partake in this study, you may ask any questions you have. If you have additional questions that arise before, during or after your participation or experience any physical or psychological distress because of this research you should contact the principle researcher, Carla McGhee at 630-649-0373, or the researcher's dissertation chair, Dr. John Laux at, 419-530-4705 (john.laux@utoledo.edu).

If you have questions beyond those answered by the primary researcher, the researcher's dissertation chair, or if you feel that your rights as a research participant have been violated, or you have received research-related injuries, the Chairperson of the SBE Institutional Review Board may be contacted through the Office of Research on the main campus at, 419-530-2844.

Please review this form and ask any questions regarding any aspect of this study that is unclear to you before you accept and sign.

SIGNATURE SECTION – Please read carefully

You are making a decision to participate in this research study. Your signature indicates that you have read the information provided above and have had all your questions answered.

Name of Participant (please print) _____ Signature and Date_____

Name of Person Obtaining Consent_____ Signature and Date_____

Appendix E

Demographic Questionnaire

Please complete the following questions and return this form to the primary researcher, Carla M. McGhee, at Carla.lafarga@rockets.utoledo.edu, along with your signed informed consent. Your answers will be kept confidential, as described in the informed consent form.

1. What is your faculty rank?
2. How many years have you taught in a CACREP counseling track program?
3. What courses have you taught during the period in which you have been a counselor educator?
4. How long have you used a creative teaching approach in your courses as a counselor educator?
5. For what journals or workshops have you discussed/shared your creative teaching methods?
6. What is your age?
7. What is your gender?
8. What is your race/ethnicity?

Appendix F

Member Check Email One

Dear _____,

Thank you for sharing your experiences and knowledge about creative teaching in our previous interview. I have completed the interview transcription, and it is now time for you to complete the first follow up task for the study. To ensure that I have accurately depicted the information that you provided in the interview, I have attached the verbatim transcription to this email. Please review the transcript and make changes in the following manner: (a) set the word document to track changes; (b) make edits in any area that you have determined does not accurately depict your experience, by removing and/or adding text that accurately represents your intended communication, and (c) return the edited document to this researcher. If you determine that there are no errors, and that the verbatim transcript accurately depicts your intended meaning, please indicate in your return email that you did not find any errors in the transcript. Please email all completed materials to: Carla.lafarga@rockets.utoledo.edu. The deadline to complete this task is _____.

Thank you. I appreciate the time that you are taking to contribute to this research.

Sincerely,

Carla M. McGhee, MA, LPCC
Doctoral Candidate, University of Toledo, Counselor Education Department

Appendix G

Member Check Email Two

Dear_____

Thank you once again for taking the time to work with me in this research. I have completed the second stage of data analysis for this study, and it is now time for you to complete the last follow up task for your role in the study. I have attached two items to this email: your final transcript, and a table of significant statements extracted from the transcript. To ensure that I have accurately captured the statements that represent your overall understanding of the experience, please review the table and make changes in the following manner: (a) set the word document to track changes; (b) remove statements that do not accurately represent your overall understanding of the experience, and (c) at the bottom of the last page add any statements that you feel accurately represent your overall understanding of the experience, from the transcript, that were not included. If you determine that all of the statements included in the table accurately depict your overall understanding of the experience, please indicate in your return email that you did not make any changes to the table. Please email all completed materials to: Carla.lafarga@rockets.utoledo.edu. The deadline to complete this task is _____.

Thank you does not seem to be enough for all that you have contributed. I truly appreciate your efforts, time, and consideration in this process.

Sincerely,

Carla M. McGhee, MA, LPCC
Doctoral Candidate, University of Toledo, Counselor Education Department

Appendix H

Individual Textural-Structural Description

Sydney

Creative teaching begins with inspiration; that the desire and ability to be creative in the classroom stems from past inspirational experiences. For Sydney, inspiration to be creative began in his work as a counselor in a mental health clinic. There he found himself moved to be creative to relate to clients. "My clients were not compliant with all of the theories that I had learned in graduate school. So, I realized that I had to do something different sometimes." Sydney was also moved by his clients, who shared their creative expressions with him, such as poems and music, to describe their thoughts and feelings. "I started writing impressions that were a bit poetic, and metaphorical about my clients." These creative experiences in the counseling clinic later translated into Sydney's instructional approach with counseling students. "I realized that metaphors and even sometimes lyrics; which often are metaphors would convey information about a theory, or a person, or an event that just using plain prose would not."

For Sydney, creative teaching is more than didactic. He finds himself tapping into a diverse array of approaches such as humor, music, videos, and storytelling to engage students. In his experience, this approach not only helps students understand the information, it helps them embody it.

> It's not just a cognitive process. It's both an emotional experience, experiential and cognitive process. So, it's many things…going beyond a level of just pure cognitive understanding; that it was getting into, as I would say, the marrow of their bones where life is recreated all of the time because of red blood cells being generated there.

Sydney notices that through action oriented teaching and learning, he and the students are "having a lot more fun."

For Sydney, a creative teaching approach is about paying close attention to how students are responding in the classroom. Sydney uses this information to guide his instructional approach.

> When I see, the lights going on in students' eyes, then realized, I'm doing something that's probably correct. Or, that's probably impactful. Or, that's probably helping the learning process...Sometimes I'll ask students to draw me a line when they first entered class, about how they're feeling. So, are they up? Or, are they down? Or, are they flat? Whatever? And often, I'll say at the end of the class; draw me another line that shows me where you are now, and see how the lines compare.

Sydney believes that to empower students to be creative they must have the freedom to explore. “Let them be free to roam…because if they don't do it in my classroom or other classrooms, it's sure going to be more difficult for them to do it, when they get out as a clinician.” He sees creativity as a “game changer” for everyone involved, and encourages students to use creativity with their clients. “There's a cornucopia of ways of being a good counselor. Counseling is empowering; that creativity is at least a hand tool of that empowerment that clients need.”

Sydney sees creative teaching as a powerful experience that makes the classroom experience more alive. He describes his creative teaching experiences as visceral:

> It gets into my limbic system, that it is a feeling. It's Wow! Hard to describe. But that it's an emotion….it goes all over my body. It's not just in my brain. It's really in my body…It's really a wonderful sensation and yet, almost scary at the same time because it just doesn't happen every day…I don't know if you've had cold chills going up and down your spine; so, it'd be kind of like that.

For Sydney, creative teaching requires knowledge, and educators should seek resources or connect with other creative people to enhance their own ability to be creative. It also requires risk taking: “Having the courage to try something different. To take a chance.” Sydney believes that because it takes creative people to move the counseling profession forward, creative teaching is an important part of that process.

Appendix I

Audit Letter of Support

College of Health and Human Services
School of Intervention and Wellness
2801 W. Bancroft St., M.S. 119
Toledo, OH 43606-3390
419-530-2718; 419-530-7879 (fax)

Dear Dr. Laux and Dissertation Committee,

I acted as the external auditor for Carla McGhee's dissertation entitled *Beyond the Scenes: Uncovering the Spirit of Creative Teaching from the Perspectives of Counselor Educators*. I have served in this capacity throughout her data collection and analysis process, from spring of this year (2017) through her dissertation defense date. Carla selected me for the role of external auditor due to my extensive training in qualitative research, multiple qualitative publications, and chairing of qualitative dissertations. In my role as Carla's auditor, I reviewed and audited her data collection and analysis procedures to include memoing, transcription, member-checking, mapping, codebook building, and the creation of qualitative themes.

I conducted this audit based on standards set forth by qualitative researchers, to include research rigor and strategies and criteria of trustworthiness. Utilizing these standards, I reviewed Carla's data collection and analysis procedures multiple times throughout her research process. I gave Carla feedback at each step of the audit process; she took this feedback seriously and implemented in her research process to increase the rigor of her study.

In my opinion, Carla's dissertation research meets the standards of rigorous and trustworthy qualitative research and as her auditor I support her pursuit of dissertation defense.

Warm Regards,

Madeline Clark, PhD, LPC, NCC, ACS
Assistant Professor & Doctoral Program Coordinator
Counselor Education