

# 1 Diversity without Inclusion

Diversity without Inclusion: A Comparative Analysis of the Production Value,  
Content, and Diversity of Co-owned Spanish and English-language Television  
Network News Broadcasts

Seaira Christian-Daniels

Ohio University  
Undergraduate Thesis

## 2 Diversity without Inclusion

### Diversity without Inclusion: A Comparative Analysis of the Production Value, Content, and Diversity of Co-owned Spanish and English-language Television Network News Broadcasts

#### **Introduction:**

This study is a comparative content analysis of the two Comcast-owned broadcast network television news programs, Telemundo's Spanish-language "Noticiero Telemundo" and NBC's English-language "NBC Nightly News." The study explores whether Telemundo and NBC news programs cover different types of stories, and how they cover the same story. It also explores the diversity of talent and sources used by both news programs. It will compare production values and style of presentation between the two, building on a previous study of Spanish and English-language network news programs produced by different corporations. The study examines one month of Telemundo and NBC newscasts during the November ratings period.

#### **Literature Review:**

Researchers project that the United States' current population will increase by as many as 134 million people within the next 38 years (Trounson, 2012). Latino and Asian immigrants are the fastest growing minority groups contributing to U.S. population growth. Latinos will make up 30 percent of the United States population by 2042 (BBC, 2008) and 90 percent of the Latino population immigrating to the United States will be of voting age and therefore constitute a significant portion of the U.S. electorate (Goodwin, 2011).

### 3 Diversity without Inclusion

According to a 2010 United States Census Bureau Community Survey, approximately 37 million Americans aged five years and older speak Spanish in their homes (U.S. Bureau of the Census, 2010). Spanish-language media is essential to the changing demographic of the United States. De la Garza, Brischetto, and Vaughn's (1983) research found television is the most important medium for Latinos to receive information—news or otherwise. The growing immigrant population in the United States creates a large market for Spanish-language television.

Research in business media has shown that Latinos and minority populations, in general, are consumerist cultures, making their business attractive to advertisers. A 2012 study by Univisión Networks to determine the cultural connectedness of Latino millennials (persons aged 18-34) found that Latino and Hispanic Americans have about as much buying power as the seventh or eighth largest country in the world. HispanicBusiness.com (2012) reported that Latino families constitute one billion dollars' worth of the purchasing power in the United States and remain loyal to certain brands for long periods of time. Latino viewers then closely identify with the products advertised on the television in ads targeted to them. Evidence of advertisers catering to a Latino audience can be seen in the increased use of Latino characters in commercial advertisements, and the growing number of Latino specialty advertising firms (Deshpande, et. al., 1986).

Univisión pioneered the Spanish-language television industry in the U.S. (Hale, 2011). In 1961, Emilio Azcarraga, who owned Spanish-language television and radio stations in Mexico, started Univisión's parent company, the Spanish

#### 4 Diversity without Inclusion

International Network (SIN). Univisión is the oldest and largest of all Spanish-language television networks (Hale, 2011). Telemundo, founded in 1954 by Ángel Ramos, is Univisión's biggest Spanish-language television network competitor. NBC acquired Telemundo Communications in October 2001 (Sorkin, 2001) for \$1.92 billion in an effort to target the nearly 50 million Americans who are of Hispanic descent. In 2011, General Electric sold the majority ownership of NBC Universal—including Telemundo—to Comcast (Chozick and Stelter, 2013). Thus, “NBC Nightly News” and “Noticiero Telemundo” were chosen for this study to control for differences caused simply by corporate ownership.

#### **Use and Influence of Spanish-language media in the U.S.**

Networks such as Telemundo provide news and entertainment programming for Latinos. To stay relevant to the public, television news naturally caters to the information pertinent to ethnicities in its broadcast market (Branton, 2008). Kerevel's (2011) Latino public opinion survey found that the cultural resources provided through Spanish-language media are essential for Latinos and are often lacking in English-language media.

Latino immigrants in the United States can be united with their home countries through language because language is the defining feature of Latino culture, according to Kerevel (2011). Deshpande, Hoyer, and Donthu (1986) also found the use of Spanish was a key distinguishing factor between Latinos and Anglo-Americans; common language allows immigrants to preserve their traditional values and beliefs.

## 5 Diversity without Inclusion

Hale, Olsen and Fowler (2011) surveyed a group of Latinos who said that Spanish-language news has a significant purpose in their daily lives. Twenty-three percent of all Latinos surveyed prefer to watch Spanish-language news exclusively. Eighty percent say that Spanish-language television is an important component of Latino cultural and economic development (Hale, et.al, 2011). Univisión Networks (2012) found that even Latino households where Spanish is not the primary spoken language watch Spanish-language programming as way to remain connected to their native culture.

Most Spanish-language media users were born outside of the United States (Faber, et al., 1986). Faber, O'Guinn and Meyer's (1986) study indicates that most Spanish-language media users are older and have a lower socio-economic class than Latinos who use English-language media. Television news has fewer socio-economic barriers to consumption than traditional media, allowing more viewers to quickly absorb the information they see on the television screen. The audio-visual aspects of television diminish barriers of literacy and cost. Television viewers are, in that sense, easier to mobilize than viewers who only consume print media forms like newspapers (David, 2000).

Kerevel (2011) found that the purpose of most Spanish-language media is to create a homogenous identity among Latinos. Allen (2013) confirmed that finding in research on Televisa, one of the original Spanish-language broadcasting networks, based in Mexico. Televisa's programming received extremely high Nielson ratings by

## 6 Diversity without Inclusion

being a Latino-homogenous network. It did not focus on any particular region, but instead found and amplified the similar characteristic of language (Allen, 2013).

Allen found that Televisa derived much of its success by stripping its Latino actors of their native dialect. Dialects also include the “Spanglish” style of speech common in some U.S.-born Latino journalists. Marszleck (2013) found that because Spanish-language television networks look for talent with “perfect” Spanish, many Latino journalists born in the U.S. are not hired by Spanish-language television news networks because they do not have native Spanish proficiency. To prepare U.S.-born Latinos for Spanish-language television jobs, the National Association of Hispanic Journalists (NAHJ) has begun efforts to help Latino Americans improve their Spanish, including training sessions and a Spanish-language stylebook *Manual de Estilo* (Torres, 2013).

Language, desire to preserve native culture, and socio-economic status are similarities among Spanish-language news viewers (Hale, et. al., 2011) Spanish-language media portrays Latinos as being defined by one major language, a set of similar physical characteristics, religion, and a set of similar family values. Latinos, in turn, accept the portrayal as the correct representation of their culture and encourage the importance of Spanish-language media (Hale, et. al., 2011). Hale, Olsen, and Fowler (2011) concluded that the media are the most influential actors on citizen behavior cited by researchers.

## 7 Diversity without Inclusion

### *Spanish-language Media and Transnationalism*

Spanish-language media allow Latino immigrants to sustain social and political relationships with their home countries (Hale, et. al., 2011), creating the cultural phenomenon known as transnationalism. Cepeda (2003) defines transnationalism as the overlap and extension of one country's influence to a foreign country.

Transnationalism is the result of an increase in the number of immigrants to a particular country and causes the integration of one country's people, information, or culture into another's. Often, transnationalism results in the redefinition of citizenship to all countries involved because it includes those citizens who were not born on native soil and must be naturalized to gain citizenship benefits (Cepeda, 2003).

Constant communication creates a connection between the United States and their home countries for immigrants. In turn, immigrants construct an identity composed of many national cultures. Because media amplifies and facilitates communication, it serves as a catalyst to transnationalism (Cepeda, 2003).

Transnationalism counters the complete assimilation into American culture and loss of Latino culture included in the Americanization societal model. The international ties created by transnationalism flow across generations, with elements of the cultural exchange existing in the involved countries for several generations (Cepeda, 2003).

Latino culture, in which family is extremely important, is an example of transnationalism in the United States. Univisión (2008) found that 78 percent of Latinos aged 18-24 with strong connections to their Hispanic culture watch television together as a family. Receiving information as a group reinforces the familial

## 8 Diversity without Inclusion

connection and allows Latinos to share experiences and preserve their culture that has been transplanted to another country.

Transnationalism practices allow immigrants to maintain native cultural relationships while integrating into American society (Hale, et. al., 2011). Spanish-language media allow Latinos to remain familiar with important people, places and traditions from their home countries. Immigrants engross themselves in Spanish-language media as proof they have not completely conformed to American society (Faber, et. al., 1986).

### *Spanish-language Media and Political Mobility*

Latinos polled by Kerevel (2011) say Spanish-language media is also a catalyst for group action. Kerevel noticed a unified identity promoted by Spanish-language media that pushes Latino citizens to act on issues presented by a given news outlet instead of viewing issues passively. Latinos who watch Spanish-language media try to preserve their culture more proactively than those who do not; they are more politically engaged and generally organize better for collective action than Latinos who do not watch Spanish-language media (Kerevel, 2011).

According to a 2004 Pew Hispanic Center survey, 75 percent of respondents believed Spanish-language media are crucial to Latino economic and political development, especially the equalizing medium of television (Hale, et. al., 2011). However, the amount of Spanish-language media consumed by Latino-Americans is based on how much the consumer identifies with being Latino. The more closely the viewer associates with his or her Latino ethnicity, the more Spanish-language media



## 9 Diversity without Inclusion

he or she will consume (Deshpande, et. al., 1986). Kerevel (2011) agrees, finding that that “Latinos who are most assimilated into the dominant culture mainly use English-language media, those who are bicultural tend to use both English and Spanish media, and those who identify as having a predominantly Latino heritage primarily use Spanish media” (p. 515, Kerevel, 2011).

Some Latinos may think that utilizing English-language media sources makes them more American. They prefer English-language media because it is a form of socialization (Faber, et. al., 1986). This does not mean that Spanish-language media hinders Latinos from integrating into American society, but rather, that Latinos use media as an indicator of the norms and values of the culture in which they choose to integrate (Faber, et. al., 1986).

### **Spanish-language Television News Content**

Efforts to hold Latino viewers’ interests cause some news organizations to be less informative and slant coverage toward a particular bias. Some organizations may even produce news content supporting the predisposed beliefs of their audience to increase profit margins (Baron, 2006). These practices are employed, according to Gentzkow and Shapiro (2006), because consumers want news that reinforces their own beliefs. Zaller (1999) and Arnold (2004) found that the extremely competitive nature of the news industry causes an imbalance between serving viewers’ desires with less informative content and preserving the journalistic quality of the news. The task of providing news that appeals to a particular audience becomes more of a challenge when the audience is more diverse (Mullainathan et. al., 2005). Therefore,

## 10 Diversity without Inclusion

news organizations must choose between projecting a homogenous identity to provide demographically specialized content or risk their ratings to provide news that an ethnically diverse audience will watch.

Several research studies have found that English-language news outlets do not include Latino issue stories (NAHJ, 2006; Christian-Daniels and Rogus 2013; Branton and Dunaway, 2008). Branton and Dunaway's study (2008) reported for every thousand immigration stories published per month in Spanish-language media, only one story was published in an English language news outlet. The researchers found the great discrepancy in the number of immigration stories covered between English and Spanish-language news is a direct consequence of inconsistencies in consumer demand (Branton & Dunaway, 2008). Since there is a direct correlation between how often a story is included in a newspaper and how often that type of story is read or demanded by consumers, the stories in circulation must be what the public wants. For example, news organizations assume the Spanish-speaking population wants to hear positively framed immigration stories, so they choose not to include negative opinions on immigration and stories concerning illegal immigration (Hale, et. al., 2011). If news outlets covered the issue of immigration in a similar way, it is possible that more people of different ethnicities would agree on issues of immigration (Branton & Dunaway, 2008).

Spanish and English-language news organizations cover issues differently. Audience stimulation is a key influencing factor in news content (Branton & Dunaway, 2008). The topic of the story or the story itself does not change with

## 11 Diversity without Inclusion

changing media outlets, but the tone and frequency of coverage does change (Branton & Dunaway, 2008).

Kerevel's (2011) research makes the case that Spanish-language news media perpetuates a liberal political ideology among viewers concerning issues such as immigration and elections. Viewing partisan information over extended periods of time has the power to change a network television viewer's opinion about a particular political event or candidate. Bartels (1993) found that if viewers repeatedly receive one-sided information, which includes one perspective of an event, over time, their opinions will become more similar to the bias of the news they had been watching. Spanish-language television news operations, such as Univisión and Telemundo, consider their main goal to help Latinos maintain ties with Latin America, so they do not cover as many U.S. political events as typical English-language news networks would (Hale, et. al., 2011).

In their content analysis of English and Spanish-language political coverage, Hale, Olsen, and Fowler (2011) found that Spanish-language news outlets devote less than 20 percent of their newscasts to election coverage. That is 13 percent less than English language newscasts, in which up to 33 percent of the newscast is devoted to election coverage. Spanish-language news organizations also frame most of their election stories in the context of Latino identity (Hale, et. al., 2011). For example, some U.S. political campaign information is left out of Spanish-language newscasts because a large portion of the Spanish-language news viewers cannot vote (Hale, et. al., 2011).

## 12 Diversity without Inclusion

However, the key to encouraging more Latinos to become citizens and become more politically active may be covering stories in which Latino citizens and non-citizens are politically involved. An analysis of the portrayal of Latinos in network television news by the National Association of Hispanic Journalists (NAHJ, 2006) posits that, “voting and news are intrinsically tied” (NAHJ, 2006, p. 16). It goes further to say that in order for Latinos to become politically active in their communities, they must see positive news images of themselves being engaged and connected with politics (NAHJ, 2006).

Spanish-language television viewers’ perception of political candidates may be impacted by political television messages if they hold weakly formulated political opinions when first viewing a television news program (Bartels, 1993). According to Bartels (1993), television viewers shape much of their opinion toward a political candidate based upon his or her appearance on television. Not only do they make judgments based on the candidate’s external appearance, but viewers also use the external traits presented on television to make judgments about the candidate’s personality characteristics. However, this finding does not apply to a viewer’s political ideology in its entirety. Compared to Spanish-language viewers, Bartels (1993) found that most English-language television viewers have already formed an opinion of a political candidate before they view any campaign messages on television. Defining the campaign season as the eight months before Election Day, viewers take much longer to change their opinion of a political candidate than the campaign season. Television messages do, however, have the power to weaken an opinion of a political

candidate previously held by a viewer, the only caveat being that the viewer's opinion is most impacted upon first contact with the television's portrayal of the candidate (Bartels, 1993).

### **Production Values, Format and Style**

Previous research done by Christian-Daniels and Rogus (2013) found that production elements of Spanish and English-language network newscasts differ in format, graphics usage, story length and story count. While the English-language newscast, "CBS Evening News" used a traditional network evening newscast format including a single anchor and heavy use of traditional style graphics, the Spanish-language Univision network television newscast more closely resembled a local news format. The Spanish-language "Univisión Noticias," used a technologically advanced graphics set with a large digital screen and was hosted by two anchors.

Christian-Daniels and Rogus (2013) found that Spanish-language network newscasts covered about one-third more stories than English-language newscasts. The Spanish-language newscasts also had more, shorter stories than the English-language newscasts. Spanish-language newscasts contained fewer soundbites (television 'quotes' from an interview) from American politicians and in general than English-language newscasts (Christian-Daniels and Rogus 2013). Hale, et al. (2011) found that soundbites recorded in English do not appeal to Spanish-language stations because they must be translated. Taking the time to translate soundbites deters Spanish-language networks from using English-language soundbites in their stories. Fewer

## 14 Diversity without Inclusion

soundbites in newscasts means Spanish-language news viewers must depend more heavily on the reporters' interpretation of the story than English-language news viewers (Hale, et. al., 2011).

### **Diversity in Spanish and English Language Network News**

Another factor influencing news coverage is the degree to which the audience shares the same paradigm. The more diversity of opinion in the audience, the less bias there is in the news coverage (Branton & Dunaway, 2008). Branton & Dunaway (2008) concluded that a homogenous audience can cause one-sided or single perspective news coverage. Their research found that the Spanish-speaking population of the United States is more homogenous than the more culturally and ethnically diverse English-language-speaking population. Their research is also supported by América Rodríguez (1999), whose study found that talent on Telemundo and Univisión networks have a homogenous ethnic identity. Because the journalists have a more uniform appearance, the local affiliates tailor their stories to the regions from which the majority of their audience originates as a way to connect with viewers.

Branton and Dunaway (2008) found that English-language media reflects some of the racial stereotypes in the societies of which it is a part. Non-whites often are portrayed as problematic and violent in English-language media. The NAHJ (2006) found that less than one percent of English-language network television newscasts' stories were about Latino issues; the majority of those stories portrayed Latinos as criminals. Santa Ana (2013) confirms the NAHJ (2006) research, finding that English-language local television news most often portrays Caucasian subjects as the victim of

## 15 Diversity without Inclusion

a crime and Latinos and other minorities as perpetrators of a crime. Negative images of Latinos were then perpetuated as stereotypes accepted by Caucasian television viewers.

Another stereotype common in English-language media, is immigrants portrayed as illegal and threatening to the societal status quo (Branton & Dunaway, 2008). In fact, Kerevel's (2011) research indicates, "When the English broadcasters did deal with Latino-related issues; the stories tended to exaggerate the differences between Latinos and Anglos, and served the purpose of creating an 'Us versus them' mentality," (Kerevel, 2011, p. 513). In addition to counter positioning whites and non-whites, a study by Miller and Kurpius (2010) found that English-language television news most often uses white sources to support news content. Minority sources, which were used about 15 percent of the time, were not given as much credibility as white sources in the network television news coverage of 2005; one-third of the Latino issue stories did not include sources at all; and the majority of the sources that were included only voiced one perspective on the issue (NAHJ, 2006).

The annual staffing and salary survey by the Radio Television Digital News Association (RTDNA) in 2013 found that local television newsrooms, in general, are not very diverse (Papper, 2013). RTDNA found that local television newsrooms are scantily staffed in terms of minority workers, and they have been that way for the past five years. The multicultural workforce at English-language local television stations in the United States has hovered around 20 percent since 2008. According to RTDNA's study, nearly eight of every 10 local television news employees in the United States

## 16 Diversity without Inclusion

are white, one in 10 is black, and the remaining non-white employee is Latino about three-quarters of the time (Papper, 2013). In English-language network television news, the Latino talent are often given the task of being newsroom translators and are expected to know the Spanish language, even if they were born in the United States (Bengoa, Fuentes, Izaguirre, & Perez, 2009). In addition, the majority of people in top managerial positions in English language local television newsrooms are white. Papper (2013) found that 82 percent of all local television news directors are white.

However, producing news targeted toward a multicultural audience does not make that newsroom more diverse. Papper's (2013) survey found that Spanish-language local television newsrooms were not very diverse either. All of the news directors in Spanish-language local television stations were either Latino or white. The survey also found that nearly 90 percent of all workers in Spanish-language newsrooms are Hispanic. The other ten percent are Caucasian or African-American, with no Asians or Native Americans, making them even less diverse than the English-language newsrooms.

Being a in a newsroom where the reporters understand the needs of their multicultural audience may provide better and more coverage of stories that may go uncovered by a predominantly white staff. Santa Ana (2013) found that minority and international journalists from Spanish-language and foreign news networks, such as Telemundo and BBC, provided a more accurate portrayal of Latinos using more culturally competent descriptions, which he attributed to their experiences abroad. In an article for the Nieman Foundation, Evelyn Hernández (2008), a Latina Spanish-



language reporter for *El Diario* said she appreciated her colleagues' innate understanding of Latino issue stories as opposed to having to repeatedly explain the significance of a Latino issue story in the predominantly white newsroom in which she was previously employed. Latino issue stories that would be underreported by mainstream papers would run on the front page of *El Diario*. Hernández (2008) describes the Spanish-language newsroom as one where it is not considered biased or unethical to advocate for Latinos whose experiences have been overlooked. The Spanish-language newsroom allowed her to be a better advocate for journalistic values such as fairness and truth without shouldering the responsibility of validating her race to others.

In 2013, women were underrepresented in almost all newsrooms, regardless of market size or the predominant race of staff members (Papper, 2013). In most of the 18 years of data, men outnumbered women in local television newsrooms two to one. Though practically all of the newsrooms surveyed had at least one woman on staff, on average, there were only 15 women on staff in local television newsrooms. This means only 2 of every 10 employees were female. Not only were there more men than women in the newsroom, but white, middle-aged men were making most of the decisions regarding how the news is presented. Papper (2013) found that 70 percent of all local television news directors are men and their average age is 46. Those numbers were consistent across both Spanish and English-language local stations.

### **Research Questions**

Given previous research that found that Spanish-language news perpetuates a liberal ideology and that the tone of Spanish and English-language news is different, the first research question is as follows:

RQ1: What are the differences in the tone and political bias of stories between the Spanish and English-language network television newscasts?

Previous research also found that Spanish and English-language news cater to different audiences and utilize different sources based on the needs of the network.

Given those two facts, the second research question is as follows:

RQ2: What are the differences in story angle, sources and tone when the Spanish and English-language network television newscasts cover the same story?

### **Hypotheses:**

#### **Production Style and Format**

Previous research analyzed the production style and format of independent Spanish and English-language network news. This research will expand upon the previous findings with the following hypothesis:

H1: The Spanish-language network television newscasts will follow a local news production style including elements such as dual anchors, higher story count and use of graphics.

#### **Content**

The content hypotheses are based upon previous research that found that English-language network news broadcasts spend less time on Latino interest story topics. To that end, the second and third hypotheses are as follows:

## 19 Diversity without Inclusion

H2: The English-language network television newscast will cover fewer stories on domestic Latino issues, such as immigration, border control, and the Dream Act than the Spanish-language network newscast.

H3: The English-language network television newscasts will devote less time to news from Latin-American countries than the Spanish-language newscasts.

### **Sources**

Previous research has found that Spanish-language television newscasts use fewer domestic officials because the network would have to translate the English-language soundbites. Previous research has also found that the English-language newscast does not have a high presence of Latino talent nor sources. However, neither claim has been analyzed when considering co-owned network television news networks. To that end, the fourth and fifth hypotheses are as follows:

H4: The Spanish-language network television newscasts will use fewer domestic official sources than the English-language network television newscasts.

H5: The English-language network television newscasts will use fewer Latino sources than the Spanish-language newscast.

### **Diversity**

Finally, little previous research has been done on the diversity of talent and sources Spanish and English-language network television newscasts. However, research has shown the lack of diversity in television newsrooms and the tendency of network news to portray their audience as a homogenous group. To that end the sixth, seventh, and eighth hypotheses are as follows:

H6: The English-language network television newscasts will have more racially diverse sources than the Spanish-language newscast.

## 20 Diversity without Inclusion

H7: The English-language network television newscasts will have more racial diversity in on-air talent than the Spanish-language network television newscasts.

H8: The English-language and Spanish-language network television newscasts will be equally likely to present the U.S. Latino population as homogenous.

### **Methodology**

This study examined the differences in production style, diversity of sources, talent, and story content of Spanish-language and English-language broadcast network television weekday newscasts using content analysis. The sample used to collect this data was one month of Spanish-language Telemundo weekday evening newscasts from the program “Noticiero Telemundo” and one month of English-language NBC weekday evening newscasts from “NBC Nightly News with Brian Williams.”

Content analysis classifies content into categories to make inferences about data. After placing data into categories, the researcher coded each category and study the similarities and differences in the data. Each category must be explicitly defined and not contain any of the characteristics of any other category (Stemler, 2001).

Stemler (2001) notes two types of coding: emergent, which uses previous observation of similar data to code the new data and a priori coding, which priori coding, which places the content into categories before any data has been collected. The type of coding used in this study was a priori coding. All categories were defined depending on coding results. For example, there were originally 22 story topic variables being coding in this study. However, the researcher found a notable number of stories covering Obama care; thus, a twenty-third category, Obamacare, was formed.

## 21 Diversity without Inclusion

The unit of analysis for this research was the individual story. The news story was used because a news story is the most fundamental parts of a newscast that contains all 14 variables. This study is both qualitative and quantitative in nature. It uses quantitative analysis to code the same day coverage story angle and quantitative analysis to gather to collect data on 14 production, content, and diversity variables. These variables include the following: story segment, format, graphics, dateline, tone, topic, talent type, talent gender, talent race, source type, source bias, Latino homogeneity, source race, and source gender.

### **Sample**

A 2013 study by Christian-Daniels and Rogus (2013) compared the Spanish and English-language network news programs, “CBS Evening News” and “Univisión Noticias,” which are produced by independently owned networks. This study expanded upon that research by controlling for ownership differences to see if there were more similarities when the two networks producing the evening news programs are owned by the same company. That is the reason for choosing “Noticiero Telemundo” and “NBC Nightly News,” produced by networks owned predominantly by the media giant Comcast.

The sample newscasts were recorded between October 28 and December 3, 2013. The newscasts were half-hour, live newscasts that aired Monday-Friday. Weekends were not coded because of inconsistent airdates due to live sports

## 22 Diversity without Inclusion

programming. The time period of October 28-December 3, 2013 was chosen because it falls within the November local television ratings period.

The ratings period is determined by the Nielson media research company which collects data on who is watching television and which programs they are watching. Nielson technology monitors viewing across television, computer, and mobile phone platforms using a representative sample of U.S. households. The numbers give audience information to local television stations, and broadcast and cable networks, and are a key factor in determining advertising rates. Nielson collects data year round from a national sample for broadcast and cable networks, but for most local stations audience measurement happens three times per year in February, November, and May (Nielson, 2013). These ratings periods, often called “sweeps,” usually garner the best programming that broadcast networks have to offer so they can support the local stations that distribute their programming (Fletcher, 2009).

The researcher coded a total of 44 newscasts over a time period of one month. During the coding period, 22 “Noticiero Telemundo” newscasts were coded yielding a total of 313 stories. Twenty-two “NBC Nightly News” newscasts were also coded, yielding a total of 281 stories.

### **Dependent Variables**

To test the various hypotheses and answer the research questions, fourteen different variables were coded. Formatting elements included the story format (reader, voice over, soundbite, package, live interview), graphics (over-the-shoulder, full screen, digital screen, or double box), story segment (pre-produced or live), and story

## 23 Diversity without Inclusion

length. Story content elements included the tone of the story (neutral, negative, positive), story topic (23 categories of story topic), sources used in the story (role and political bias). Diversity elements included the role of the talent (anchor, reporter, or other), source and talent gender (male or female), source and talent race (Latino, Caucasian, black, Asian, Other, or could not be determined), and Latino homogeneity of the story (generic Latino/Hispanic label, identifying origin, discriminating among Latino groups).

Each newscast was viewed twice, once to code time and formatting information and the second time for content information. The Spanish and English-language newscasts were both coded by the researcher to control for differences in interpretation and translation. The researcher is a native English speaker with Advanced Low proficiency in Spanish as determined by the Oral Proficiency Interview (OPI) exam.

### **Codebook**

#### *Story Format*

**Length of Story:** The length of story was recorded in minutes and seconds. Packages were timed from the moment the anchor introduced the story to the moment the reporter closed the story or the anchor thanked the reporter.

**Segment:** The story segment was defined as whether the story was live or pre-produced. It could either be **pre-produced**, such as a reporter package (coded as 1) or presented **live** in the studio or live from the field (coded as 2).

## 24 Diversity without Inclusion

**Story Format:** The story format was defined as the form in which the story was presented to the viewer. The forms were--a **reader** (coded as 1) in which the anchor reads the story on camera with no video; a **voice over** (coded as 2) in which the anchor reads the story with video clips; a **VOSOT** or voice over-sound on tape (coded as 3) in which a soundbite from an interview is added to the voice over; a **package** (coded as 4) in which a reporter tells the story combining video, soundbites, his or her voice and possibly an appearance on camera (stand-up); and a live **interview** (coded as 5) in which the anchor or reporter interviews someone live in the studio or live in the field.

**Graphics:** Graphics were defined as all pictures, words, and displays that help convey the meaning of the story. Graphics were identified as--over the shoulder (**OTS**) of the anchor (coded as 1); taking up the full television screen (**FS**) (coded as 2); a **double box** (coded as 3) in which the anchor and a reporter or interviewee are both present on the screen inside graphic boxes; or a **monitor** or graphic wall (coded as 4) and explained by the reporter or anchor.

### *Story Content*

**Story Tone:** The tone of the story was defined as the sentiment, positive, negative or well-balanced/neutral, based on the language of sources in soundbites (stories without soundbites were not coded for tone) (Taylor, 2007; Branton & Dunaway, 2009). A **positively** toned story (coded as 2) used soundbites with words and phrases that convey positive feelings such as “opportunity to live,” “worth the pain,” “safety,” “won the lottery”; a **negatively** toned story (coded as 1) used soundbites with words such as “heartbreaking,” “grave,” “sadness,” and “hopelessness”; a **neutrally** toned



## 25 Diversity without Inclusion

story, (coded as 0) possessed a relative balance of negative and positive words (Taylor, 2007; Branton & Dunaway, 2009).

Source: The sources were defined as the soundbites (portions of interviews) that were part of the story. Sources were coded by their roles in the story--as **experts** (coded as 1), someone with outside expertise to bring to the story; **officials** (coded as 2), politicians and others with titles involved in the story; **real people** (coded as 3), usually someone effected by the story or reacting to the story, but no official title; or **criminals/victims** (coded as 4).

Source Bias: The source bias was defined as the political predisposition or political party of the source. **Liberal** sources (coded as 1) represented any political party or ideology associated with more liberal, leftist or Marxist ideas. These groups advocate distribution of wealth and resources, social mobility and/or capitalism. This included but was not limited to the Democratic Party in the United States, the Partido Socialista de Chile, and Venezuelan Acción Democrática. **Conservative** sources (coded as 2) included political parties or ideologies that stress private sector solutions over government intervention, public order, growth of economy over distribution of wealth, or parties that appeal to higher socio-economic classes. These groups included but were not limited to the Republican Party in the United States, and Argentine CeDé. **Independent or Neutral** sources (coded as 3) had no political bias (Coppedge, 1997). Sources with no pre-determined political bias, typically “real people”, were labeled as **Undetermined** sources (coded as 4).

## 26 Diversity without Inclusion

Note: Soundbites were defined as any part of an interview, in English, Spanish, dubbed translation, captioned translation or reporter translation.

Dateline: The story dateline was defined as the country and/or city where the story took place. In addition to recording the exact dateline, the researcher categorized all datelines as being from the United States/**domestic** (coded as 1), **Central America** (coded as 2), **South America** (coded as 3), **Europe** (coded as 4) or **other** (coded as 5).

Topic: The story topic was defined as what the story was about. The researcher coded for 23 common topics and included a final category for story topics not included in the common list. The story topics included **accident** (coded as 1) **border control** (coded as 2) **consumer information** (coded as 3) **crime** (coded as 4) the **Dream Act** (coded as 5) **economy** (coded as 6) **education** (coded as 7) **elections** (coded as 8) **environment** (coded as 9) **feature** (coded as 10) **gender issues** (coded as 11) **government** (coded as 12) **health** (coded as 13) **immigration** (coded as 14) **investigative** (coded as 15) **military** (coded as 16) **obituary** (coded as 17) **sports** (coded as 18) **politics** (coded as 19) **protest** (coded as 20) **religion** (coded as 21) **other** topic not on list (coded as 22) or **Obamacare** (coded as 23).

### *Diversity*

Talent: The talent was defined as **anchor**--the lead person or persons delivering and introducing the news, greeting the viewer, or progressing the newscast forward (coded as 1) **reporter**--the person or persons out in the field collecting news and conducting interviews (coded as 2), or **other** news-related position, such as a videographer or guest commentator (coded as 3).

Talent Gender: The talent gender was defined as **male** (coded as 1) or **female** (coded as 2)

Talent Race: The talent race was defined as the racial attribution a typical viewer would attribute to the reporter/anchor—based on name and skin-color (Christian-Daniels and Rogus 2013). Race was coded as **Latino** (coded as 1) **Caucasian** (coded as 2); **Black** (coded as 3); **Asian** (coded as 4); **Other** (coded as 5); or **could not be determined** (coded as 6).

Latino Homogeneity: Latino homogeneity was defined as the extent that the story distinguishes among the ethnicities of Latino sources and groups. Each source was identified as--**generic** Latino or Hispanic Label—including a Latino first or surname or apparently native Spanish fluency (coded as 1), **explicitly identified** by country of origin (coded as 2), identified by some other **label that discriminates** among Latino groups, such as undocumented or dreamer (coded as 3), or as non-Latino and having **no Latino label** (coded as 4).

Source Race: The source race was defined as the racial attribution a typical viewer would attribute to the soundbite —based on name and skin-color. Race was coded as **Latino** (coded as 1), **Caucasian** (coded as 2), **Black** (coded as 3), **Asian** (coded as 4), **Other** (coded as 5) or **could not be determined** (Coded as 6).

Source Gender: The source gender was defined as **male** (coded as 1) or **female** (coded as 2). Each source was coded only once in a story for each diversity variable. If the source appeared more than once in a story, no diversity variable was coded for the additional appearances.

**Results**

Overall the content analysis found that co-ownership did not eliminate content and production value differences between Spanish and English-language network news. Key differences between the two networks included the story topics covered—most noticeably coverage of Latino issues, such as immigration—presence of Latino sources and talent, and the types of sources used in stories. Noted similarities between the two included the number of stories with soundbites, the lack of racial diversity and high Latino homogeneity.

*Research Questions*

R1: What are the differences in the tone and political bias of stories between the Spanish and English-language network television newscasts?

The difference in the emotional tone of the Spanish and English-language stories was determined by the numbers of positive, negative and neutrally toned soundbites in the story. Though Telemundo reported more total stories than NBC News, the percentage of stories with soundbites was equal for both newscasts, just under half (NBC-49%, Telemundo-48%).

Table 1: Story Tone

Network	Total Stories with SOTS	Negative	Positive	Neutral	no SOTS
NBC News	49% (126)	36% (45)*	41% (52)**	23% (29)	51% (132)
Telemundo	48% (139)	48% (67)*	25% (35)**	27% (37)	51% (146)

\*p> .05, \*\*p=.063

Table 1 shows that of the stories with soundbites, significantly more of the Spanish-language network’s stories had a negative emotional tone than the English-

## 29 Diversity without Inclusion

language network. Forty-eight percent of the stories covered by Telemundo were negatively toned, whereas 36 percent of the NBC News stories were negatively toned [t(46)= -2.63, p=.012]. Further, the English-language newscasts contained nearly twice as many positive stories as the Spanish-language newscasts, (NBC: 41% positive vs Telemundo: 25% positive), although the difference didn't quite reach a significance level of  $p > .05$  [t(46)= 1.9, p=.063]. The two networks had similar percentages of neutral stories; 23% on NBC News and 27% on Telemundo.

The political bias of each story was defined in terms of the political bias of each individual source. As seen in Table 2, overall, the English-language newscasts had more sources that could be identified as liberal, conservative, or independent than the Spanish-language newscasts. Part of the explanation for that difference is a smaller percentage of "official" sources used by Telemundo as compared with NBC. Because the large majority of sources with an identifiable political bias were officials, Telemundo had a much larger number of sources whose political bias was not identifiable in the story (Telemundo-70% vs. NBC-59%). There were no significant differences between NBC and Telemundo on numbers of liberal, conservative or independent sources.

Table 2: Sources and Political Bias

Network	Total Sources	Liberal	Conservative	Independent	Undetermined
NBC News	401	16% (62)	8% (32)	17% (68)	59% (239)
Telemundo	546	9% (48)	6% (31)	12% (69)	70% (398)

## 30 Diversity without Inclusion

The English-language newscasts had a higher ratio of liberal to conservative sources than the Spanish-language newscasts. Sixteen percent of the English-language sources had a liberal bias and half that number had a conservative bias which was a significant difference [ $t(46)= 2.34, p=.024$ ] compared with 9 percent liberal to 6 percent conservative for the Spanish-language newscast [ $t(46)=1.76, p=.084$ ]. The higher ratio of conservative sources on Telemundo may be explained by the fact that Telemundo used a small variety of liberal sources, but a larger number of different conservative sources, and each source was only coded once despite their number of appearances in a story.

NBC News stories contained nearly as many independent sources as liberal sources (independent-17% vs. liberal-16%). But Telemundo presented a third more independent than liberal sources (independent-12% vs. liberal-6%). Both networks had twice the number of independent sources compared with conservative sources.

The researcher analyzed ten stories covered and presented as reporter packages on the same day by both NBC News and Telemundo to answer research question 2.

R2: What are the differences in story angle, sources and tone when the Spanish and English-language network television newscasts cover the same story?

Table 3 shows the stories chosen for this comparison and the differences in length of coverage and emotional tone of stories the networks covered on the same day. On days when the two networks covered the same story, NBC News had more in-depth coverage and used more resources in all but one story—including exclusive interviews and sophisticated production style. There was no pattern in the results on tone of the coverage. In fact, the same-day coverage data analysis showed that the

differences found in Branton and Dunaway's (2008) study, that Spanish and English-language media do not differ in story topic but instead in angle, tone, and frequency, were not that prevalent in this study. On days when differences in story topic were controlled, the tone and angle of the story differed between networks only half the time. A more in-depth analysis of each story follows.

Table 3: Same Day Coverage of 10 Stories

Story	Date	Length	Tone
Obamacare	10/29/13	NBC: 3:12 Telemundo: 1:26	NBC News: Positive Telemundo: Negative
Hurricane Sandy	10/30/13	NBC: 5:18 Telemundo: 3:01	NBC News: Negative Telemundo: Negative
Pressure on Obama	10/30/13	NBC: 5:18 Telemundo: 3:30	NBC News: Negative Telemundo: Negative
VA Governor Elections	11/5/13	NBC: 3:37 Telemundo: 2:24	NBC News: Neutral Telemundo: Negative
Sky Divers	11/5/13	NBC: 2:48 Telemundo: 2:14	NBC News: Negative Telemundo: Neutral
Trans fat Ban	11/7/13	NBC: 3:19 Telemundo: 2:19	NBC News: Negative Telemundo: Positive
Super-typhoon Hiyan	11/11/13	NBC: 9:38 Telemundo: 6:33	NBC News: Negative Telemundo: Neutral
JFK	11/22/13	NBC: 5:42 Telemundo: 3:20	NBC News: Positive Telemundo: Positive
Sandyhook Update	11/25/13	NBC: 2:37 Telemundo: 2:34	NBC News: Negative Telemundo: Negative
NY Train Derailment	12/2/13	NBC: 3:31 Telemundo: 2:28	NBC News: Neutral Telemundo: Neutral

**Obamacare, 10/29/13:** The most immediate difference in coverage between the two stories on Obamacare on October 29, 2013, is placement in the newscast. NBC News led the newscast with the Obamacare story and it was a longer than average, three-minute, twelve-second package. The networks showed evidence of their shared ownership by using the same congressional hearing footage and using the same soundbites from Press Secretary Jay Carney, but each network took a different story angle. The NBC News story declared that Obamacare was making progress, albeit slowly, with a majority of positively toned soundbites, and the shorter Telemundo story was more negative, focusing on the fact that the Latino community was suffering from failures with the healthcare program.

**Hurricane Sandy, 10/30/13:** Consistent with the dominant story topic of immigration in “Noticiero Telemundo” coverage, Telemundo told the story from the perspective of immigrants who were unable to get housing months after the hurricane due to their legal status. There was also a major difference in choice of source; the Telemundo coverage did not contain an official source, but did use one non-Latino expert, and all other sources in the story were Latino real people. In the NBC story, there was an expert, two officials, and three everyday people. One source and the reporter were black.

**Pressure on Obama, 10/30/13:** Both networks led the newscast that day with the story, however the “NBC Nightly News” coverage was more extensive and contained more complex production values. NBC produced a two-part story about



political pressures exerted on the President entitled “Under Fire.” Telemundo named the story “se defende” or “He Defends Himself,” and the coverage angle was the President rebutting the attacks on him. Both network’s stories were negative in tone. Both “NBC Nightly News” and “Noticiero Telemundo” used only expert and official sources in the Obama story, a rarity for Telemundo. Both networks had near equal gender representation in sources. NBC used three female sources and four male sources, while Telemundo used two male sources and two female sources. However, the networks failed to present any other racial minority voices in their stories. All of the “NBC Nightly News” story sources were white, and the Telemundo sources were either white or Latino.

**Virginia Governor Elections, 11/5/ 2013:** On NBC News, the gubernatorial elections led the newscast, and the story provided extensive coverage of conservative candidate Ken Cuccinelli. The Telemundo story instead provided more coverage of liberal candidate Terry McAuliffe and showed video of efforts to register Latinos to vote. In one Telemundo soundbite, a man says that “they” referring to conservatives had previously doubted the power of Latino voters, but they will regret doing so in this election. Only two experts, but no official sources or everyday people were used in the Telemundo story, yet the NBC story used soundbites from both candidates and commentary from three everyday people. The Telemundo story contained mostly negative soundbites for an overall negative tone, and the NBC story contained a balance of negative and positive soundbites for an overall neutral tone.

**Skydivers, 11/5/13:** Both networks closed the November 5 newscast with a story about a group of skydivers who survived a plane crash. The stories were nearly identical in duration, story line, and video used; however, there were marked differences in the type of source and the tone of the story. Both the NBC and Telemundo stories began with the description of the tragedy and ended with the reporter stating how lucky the skydivers are to be alive. NBC had an exclusive interview with the four jumpers and pilot, each giving an eyewitness account of the crash, but despite being part of the same company, Telemundo apparently had no access to those exclusives. The Telemundo story did not contain any interviews with the survivors but instead the network interviewed an expert in skydiving as its only source.

**Trans Fat Ban, 11/7/13:** The story was given more importance in the NBC newscast as the second story in the a-block; it was the first story of the b-block in Telemundo. However, both stories shared a similar story angle, stating that trans fats damage health.

Neither network used racially diverse sources. NBC's sources were all white, while Telemundo's were all Latino. However, the Telemundo story included only female sources, two of whom were everyday people. The NBC story did not contain any real people sources but instead two experts and one official source, with two of the three sources being women. Interestingly, the soundbites of different expert sources in the Telemundo and NBC stories said the exact same thing, nearly verbatim.

**Super typhoon Hiyan, 11/11/13:** Both networks led their newscast with the story. The NBC coverage was much more extensive. The network aired a three-part story covering the damage from the storm, and then aired a fourth story detailing the relief efforts. Of the 11 sources consulted, there were three victims of the tragedy and three everyday people sources. There were also four experts and one official source. The victims shown were majority female, and the experts were all male. In the Telemundo coverage, four sources were consulted. There were three male sources, one being an everyday person, and the other two experts. The only female source was a victim of the typhoon. Racially, the NBC newscast included Asian victims, one white expert and one white official, and one source of another minority group (Indian). The Telemundo newscast contained one Asian, one Latino, and one white source.

**JFK Anniversary, 11/22/13:** The angle of the Kennedy story differed significantly in the newscasts. NBC Nightly News devoted nearly the entire newscast in homage to President Kennedy. The packages were long form and featured footage dating to 1963 when the President was killed. The opening story segued into an interview with David McCullough, a Presidential historian and Kennedy expert. Telemundo aired one package on the Kennedy story, but instead focused on Lina del Castillo, Jackie Kennedy's wardrobe assistant, a Latina. The Telemundo story frequently verified Kennedy's importance as President with phrases such as "[Kennedy] was the most famous President in the past 50 years [of the United States]" and often noted Kennedy's work on behalf of the Latino community.

Both the “NBC Nightly News” and “Noticiero Univisión” stories contained a balance of positive and negative soundbites, giving them both an overall neutral tone. NBC also balanced the types of sources, with three officials, two experts, and an everyday person. Telemundo’s sources were all either experts (two) or everyday people (two). The sources kept the dominant racial and gender scheme of each network. All of the sources used in the NBC broadcast were white male, and, with the exception of Ms. Castillo, all of the sources on Telemundo were Latino male.

**Sandyhook Update, 11/25/13:** The Telemundo story was more Latino-centric, covering the Latino children and families affected by the shooting. The sources used in the Telemundo newscast were everyday people (two) and one expert. NBC News, however, used an expert and an official source to tell the story. Both sources were white male.

**New York Train Derailment, 12/2/13:** As with several other NBC stories, all of the sources in the NBC story were officials. The Telemundo story contained two everyday people, an expert, and an official. Men dominated both stories—all of NBC’s officials were men, and the only non-male source in the Telemundo story was an unnamed woman. The same NTSB source was quoted in both the Telemundo and NBC News story.

#### *Production Values Hypothesis*

Hypothesis 1 dealt with the production values and story formats of the two newscasts.

### 37 Diversity without Inclusion

H1: The Spanish-language network television newscasts will follow a local news production style including elements such as dual anchors, higher story count and use of graphics.

Table 4: Type of Story

Network	Total Stories	RDR	VO	VOSOT	PKG	INTERVIEW
NBC News	281*	5 (1.7%)	136 (48%)	11 (4%)	129 (46%)	5 (1.7%)
Telemundo	313*	5 (1.6%)	139 (44%)	23 (7%)	146 (47%)	3 (1%)

\*p>.05

Table 5: Types of Graphics

Network	OTS	Full Screen	Double Box	Monitor	None
NBC News	225*	81**	49*	5*	38
Telemundo	95*	49**	13*	87*	105

\*p>.000, \*\*p>.001

As predicted in H1, and consistent with a previous analysis of CBS and Univisión newscasts (Christian-Daniels and Rogus, 2013), Telemundo network used a dual anchor format popular in local newscasts, with one male and one female anchor. NBC News featured only one male anchor. Looking at Table 4, Telemundo had a significantly higher story count (313) than NBC News (281) [ $t(46) = -2.43, p = .019$ ], although the distribution of story formats was virtually identical between the networks with exception of the VOSOT format, which is heavily used in local news.

Table 5 shows the distribution of graphics used by the two networks. Telemundo utilized a digital monitor screen significantly more often than NBC News (87 stories vs. 5 stories) [ $t(46) = -10.97, p > .000$ ], an innovation that is also heavily used in local newscasts. NBC followed the more traditional graphic news style with a

## 38 Diversity without Inclusion

significantly higher use of Over the Shoulder [ $t(46)= 8.38, p>.000$ ], and Full Screen graphics [ $t(46)= 3.19, p=.003$ ] to help tell stories, and Double Box graphics [ $t(46)= 5.14, p>.000$ ] to toss to reporters.

### *Content Hypotheses*

Hypotheses 2 and 3 address differences in content between the NBC and Telemundo newscasts for all the stories the network covered.

H<sub>2</sub>: The English-language network television newscast will cover fewer stories on domestic Latino issues, such as immigration, border control, and the Dream Act than the Spanish-language network newscast.

The hypothesis is confirmed, but not exactly in the way expected. It was somewhat of a surprise to find that immigration was the only traditional “Latino issue” which received any coverage on either network. However, an interesting finding in the data analysis was a large number of crime stories on Telemundo, which is a topic usually covered at the local news level. Further analysis showed that more than half of those stories focused on South and Central American drug trafficking, so were, in fact, Latino issue stories.

Table 6: Coverage of Latino Issues

Network	Immigration	Crime
NBC News	0% (1)*	4% (8)*
Telemundo	20% (50)*	18% (45)*

\* $p>.000$

Table 6 shows NBC News aired just one story (less than 1%) in all coded newscasts on immigration and 8 stories (4%) on crime. However, 20 percent of stories (50) on Telemundo [ $t(46)= -9.25, p>.000$ ] focused on immigration and 18 percent (45) [ $t(46)= -4.39, p>.000$ ] on crime. Of the 45 stories covering crime in the Telemundo

## 39 Diversity without Inclusion

newscasts, 23 covered the crime of drug trafficking, while none of the NBC News stories covered this type of crime. Extensive crime coverage is another way in which “Noticiero Telemundo” resembles local news more than traditional broadcast network news.

The difference in story topics is even more far-reaching when analyzing the most and least covered story topics for each network.

Table 7: Top 5 Stories Covered

Top 5 Ranking	NBC	Telemundo
1	Environment (22%)	Immigration (20%)
2	Consumer (15%)	Crime (18%)
3	Government/Politics (15%)	Government/Politics (9%)
4	Sports (9%)	Obituary (8%)
5	Obamacare (9%)	Consumer (7%)

Table 7 shows the top five most frequently covered story topics on NBC News and Telemundo. NBC’s most covered story topic was the environment (including natural disasters and weather). The most common environmental stories were natural disasters such as Typhoon Haiyan (39%), and inclement weather (31%). On Telemundo, environmental stories were not among the top five story topics but still made up six percent of the stories. Though government and politics was the third most covered topic for both networks, NBC devoted 40-percent more of its newscast to government and politics (NBC-15% vs. Telemundo-9%) than Telemundo. NBC also covered more sports than Telemundo. The majority of its sports stories were about the 2014 Olympics (6 stories) which NBC televised, however, Telemundo only

## 40 Diversity without Inclusion

reported one story on the Olympics, despite co-ownership. Telemundo had as many obituaries stories as NBC News did sports stories (20). Further analysis found that more than half of the obituary stories covered by Telemundo pertained to the death of Latin-American vocalist Jenni Rivera (60%). Obituaries were not included in NBC's top 5 most covered stories.

Table 8: Bottom 5 Stories Covered

Bottom 5 Ranking	NBC	Telemundo
1	Religion (2%)	Sports (2%)
2	Protest (1%)	Economy (1%)
3	Economy (0.45%)	Education (1%)
4	Education (0.45%)	Military (1%)
5	Immigration (0.45%)	Protest (1%)

The picture is somewhat different when considering the story topics which received the least attention from NBC and Telemundo. Looking at Table 8, the two networks shared three of five story topics in the least covered list: education (NBC-0.45%; Telemundo-1%), economy (NBC-0.45%; Telemundo-1%) and protest (NBC and Telemundo-1%). As shown in Tables 7 and 8, immigration, which was the most covered story on Telemundo was among the bottom five on NBC (0.45%).

The majority of stories from both networks came from the United States (NBC-81%; Telemundo-69%). However, large differences existed in reports from



Latin-American Countries. Table 9 shows the story datelines for each network and answers H3:

H3: The English-language network television newscasts will devote less time to news from Latin-American countries than the Spanish-language newscasts.

Table 9: Story Dateline

Network	Domestic	Central America	South America	Europe	Other
NBC News	81% (227)	0.4% (1)*	0.4% (1)	3.9% (11)	14.3% (40)*
Telemundo	69% (217)	22% (69)*	1% (3)	4% (13)	4% (11)*

\*p>.000

Table 9 shows that H3 was confirmed. NBC News devoted the majority of its newscasts (81%) to domestic stories, covering only two stories from Central and South America. Alternatively, for Telemundo, although the smaller percentage of domestic stories was not significantly different from NBC, 22 percent of its stories were from Central America [t(46)= -9.86, p>.000] and 1 percent from South America [NS].

Telemundo studios are located in Miami, Florida, making Central American the Latin-American region of closest proximity. Both networks carried an equal percentage of stories from Europe, but NBC had a significantly larger percentage of stories (14.3% vs. 4%) [t(46)= 4.65, p>.000] from other parts of the world, primarily the Philippines (28%--mostly Typhoon Hiyan) and Afghanistan (25%).

*Source Hypotheses*

Hypotheses 4 and 5 deal with the types of sources used in stories from both networks.

H4: The Spanish-language network television newscasts will use fewer domestic official sources than the English-language network television newscasts.

Table 10: Foreign and Domestic Official Sources

Network	Official Sources	Domestic	Foreign
NBC	98	94% (92)	6% (6)*
Telemundo	94	75% (71)	25% (24)*

\*p&gt;.05

Table 10 shows the data was in the predicted direction of H4, 75-percent (71) of the official sources in Telemundo newscasts were domestic sources, compared with 94 percent (92) of NBC News official sources, but the difference was not statistically significant. However the difference in foreign officials between the two networks was significant, with Telemundo having a much larger percentage [t(46)= -2.37, p=.022].

Further analysis of source data presented in Table 11, shows that overall Telemundo used a smaller percentage of expert and official sources (Telemundo-39% vs. NBC-55%), although the difference was not statistically significant, but was significantly more likely to use real people (Telemundo-56% vs. NBC-37%) [t(46)= -5.59, p>.000] to tell stories.

Table 11: Source Type

Network	Total Sources	Expert	Official	Real Person	Criminal/Victims
NBC	401	31% (124)	24% (98)	37% (150)*	7% (29)
Telemundo	546	22% (120)	17% (94)	56% (308)*	5% (25)

\*p&gt;.000

H5: The English-language network television newscasts will use fewer Latino sources than the Spanish-language newscast.

Table 12 shows H2 was confirmed. Of NBC News' 401 sources, only 3 (1%) were Latino, compared with 472 (86%) of Telemundo's sources who were Latino [t(46)= -21.36, p>.000].

Table 12: Latino Sources

Network	Total Sources	Total Latino Sources	Avg Latino Sources per newscast
NBC News	401	3 (1%)	0*
Telemundo	546	472 (86%)	37*

\*p>.000

Table 13: Source Racial Diversity

Network	Avg Latino Sources per newscast	% Total Latino Sources	Avg White Sources per newscast	% Total White Sources	Avg Other Minority Sources per newscast	% Total Minority Sources	Avg Underrepresented Sources per newscast	% Total Underrepresented Sources
NBC News	0*	1% (3)	25*	79% (315)	0.79*	19% (77)	0.42	2%
Telemundo	37*	86% (472)	4*	11% (59)	0.08*	2% (13)	0.13	1%

\*p>.000

*Diversity Hypotheses*

The differences in racial diversity of sourcing as well as on-air talent are explored further in the data for Hypotheses 6, 7, and 8.

H6: The English-language network television newscasts will have more racially diverse sources than the Spanish-language newscast.

As seen in Table 13, H6 is confirmed. Nineteen percent of NBC News sources were from a racial group other than White or Latino (Black, Asian, Other), compared with only two percent of the Telemundo sources that were of a minority group other than Latino [t(46)= 5.23, p>.000]. But neither network gets much credit for using

#### 44 Diversity without Inclusion

racially diverse sources because 86 percent of sources in Telemundo’s newscasts were Latino and 79 percent of sources in NBC’s newscasts were White.

Looking at gender in Table 14, NBC has significantly more male sources per newscast than Telemundo (NBC mean-11.6, Telemundo mean-5.1) [t(46)= 8.37, p>.000]. Telemundo has significantly more female sources per newscast than NBC (NBC mean-5.1, Telemundo mean-8.7) [t(46)= -4.96, p>.000].

Table 14: Source Gender

Network	Total Sources	Male Sources	Female Sources
NBC News	401	69% (278)*	31% (123)*
Telemundo	546	62% (336)*	38% (210)*

\*p>.000

The diversity picture gets worse for both networks newscasts when considering on-air reporting talent.

H7: The English-language network television newscasts will have more racial diversity in on air talent than the Spanish-language network television newscasts.

Table 15: Talent Diversity

Network	Total Talent	White	Latino	Other Minority	Undetermined
NBC News	138	86% (118)*	3% (4)*	11% (15)*	1% (1)
Telemundo	139	0% (0)*	99% (138)*	0% (0)*	1% (1)

\*p>.000

Table 15 shows H7 is confirmed with very similar results to sourcing. NBC News had significantly more racial diversity in its reporting talent than Telemundo. Though 86 percent (118) of its talent was white, 11 percent were of a minority group

45 Diversity without Inclusion

other than Latino, and 3 percent of its talent was Latino. Telemundo’s talent was nearly 100 percent Latino (99%) with the exception of one reporter whose race could not be determined by skin color or name. All differences were highly significant [White:  $t(46)= 17.45, p>.000$ ; Latino:  $t(46)= -28.07, p>.000$ ; Other Minority:  $t(46)= 4.21, p>.000$ ].

Table 16: Talent Gender

Network	Total Talent	Male Talent	Female Talent
NBC News	138	60% (83)*	40% (55)*
Telemundo	139	39% (54)*	61% (85)*

\* $p>.001$

Table 16 shows the gender diversity among reporting talent for the two networks, and the differences are much more dramatic than with source gender diversity. NBC News has significantly more male reporters (NBC 60% vs. Telemundo 39%) [ $t(46)= 3.48, p>.001$ ], while Telemundo has significantly more female reporters (Telemundo 61% vs. NBC 40%) [ $t(46)= -3.59, p>.001$ ]. Interestingly the percentages are exactly the opposite.

H8: The English-language and Spanish-language network television newscasts will be equally likely to present Latino sources as homogenous.

Table 17: Latino Homogeneity

Network	Total Sources	Latino Sources	Generic Label	Explicitly Defined	Discriminates
NBC	401	1% (3)	0.5% (2)	0% (0)	0% (0)
Telemundo	546	86% (472)	80% (437)*	6% (28)*	3% (14)*

\* $p>.000$

With only three Latino sources found in all NBC News stories over the 22 days, it is not possible to reasonably compare levels of homogeneity in the way sources are identified between the networks. However Table 17 does confirm what previous research has shown (Kerevel 2011), that Spanish-language newscasts are likely to present Latinos in the U.S. as a homogenous group with very little discrimination among areas of origin.

Telemundo explicitly defined ethnicity of its Latino sources six percent of the time, and discriminated among Latino nationalities or ethnicities three percent of the time, but significantly more often, 80 percent of Latino sources, were only identified by a generic Latino label [Explicit/Generic:  $t(46)= 15.55, p>.000$ ; Discriminate/Generic:  $t(46)= 16.63, p>.000$ ]. None of the three NBC Latino sources had any further identifying information.

### **Discussion**

This study supports and expands much of the previous research on Spanish-language and English-language network news. Key similarities included lack of diversity in both Spanish and English-language newscasts and the creation of a homogenous Latino identity in both, although the presence of any Latino content or voices in NBC news was negligible. However, the findings in this study run contrary to previous data on media political bias, especially concerning Latinos. Ultimately, the study finds that, although “NBC Nightly News” and “Noticiero Telemundo” are produced by the same company, the Spanish-language news is a very different

newscast clearly targeted at a specific Latino audience that makes little to no attempt to present the diversity of America as whole.

The data shows that co-ownership does not eliminate differences in production values and content between Spanish and English-language network television newscasts. In previous research comparing two independently owned networks, Christian-Daniels and Rogus (2013) found that Spanish-language network television newscasts resemble local television news in production style—including the use of graphics and dual anchors— and format—including the number and types of stories.

Christian-Daniels and Rogus (2013) examined independently-owned CBS and Univisión and found that, on average, they aired the same number of packages and readers per newscast (5.9 packages and 1.2 readers). This study also found that both NBC and Telemundo newscasts aired a similar number of packages and readers, but differed in number of shorter stories, though the two networks are co-owned by Comcast. The most noted differences in production style and format were the average number of stories per newscast and the use of graphics. In the previous study, Spanish-language network Univisión used nearly half the number of traditional, over-the-shoulder graphics than CBS News, instead opting to use a large digital monitor, and had more total stories. This study found Telemundo newscasts also had more stories on average, used many fewer traditional over the shoulder (OTS) graphics and made extensive use of digital monitor graphics—all production and format tools more commonly found in local television newscasts than in broadcast network newscasts. So despite being owned by the same company, NBC and Telemundo newscasts had

nearly identical production and format similarities and differences as CBS and Univision, which are independently owned (Christian-Daniels and Rogus, 2013). Telemundo and Univision newscasts were much more similar in format and production style to each other, than Telemundo and NBC. Likewise, NBC and CBS newscasts were nearly identical in format and production style.

On several occasions, NBC and Telemundo did show evidence of their co-ownership by sharing video. This occurred when the networks covered the same story. The two networks also shared interviews with elected officials. The Spanish-language newscast used fewer of those interviews compared with cover video (referred to as b-roll) because it needed to translate the soundbites, but nevertheless, as seen in the Same Day Story comparison, there were times when both networks used the same soundbites. The Spanish-language newscast also shared documents and made references to NBCnews.com in its reports.

Differences between the network newscasts become much more distinct when one examines the editorial content. The findings indicate that the English-language network covered many fewer Latino issue stories and international stories from Spanish-speaking countries than the Spanish-language newscast. Immigration was overwhelmingly the most covered Latino issue story on both networks. Though Telemundo also covered several stories on narco-trafficking, the majority of its Latino issue stories addressed immigration, which was the only Latino issue story on NBC News. Telemundo devoted 50 stories to immigration coverage. The stories varied in tone, but were average-length packages with soundbites from a variety of



stakeholders. The newscast even had a special segment called “Reforma Migratoria,” or *immigration reform* that aired almost daily to update Telemundo viewers on the state of immigration reform. The only time NBC news viewers saw an immigration story, or any Latino issue story during the analysis period, was November 25, 2013, a neutrally-toned voice over-sound on tape (VOSOT) story with a positive soundbite from President Barack Obama and a negative soundbite from an immigration reform protestor. These findings show that Spanish-language and English-language network television news networks provide an inconsistent or non-existent perspective on immigration and may explain Branton and Dunaway’s (2008) finding that neither Spanish nor English-language news media provides immigration coverage that could lead to any kind of consensus on this issue in the U.S. among Latino or other viewers.

Looking at the other stories that received the most and least coverage, it is interesting to note where the story topics matched, and where they diverged between the networks. Just as the top story topic for Telemundo did not even make the top five for NBC (in fact it was dead last in amount of coverage), the top story topic for NBC (Environment/Weather/Natural Disaster) did not make the top five for Telemundo. Surprisingly, neither network had very much coverage of the economy or education which are typically high interest topics for a broad range of viewers (Miller, Purcell and Rosenstiel, 2012).

The results found, as expected, that the Spanish-language network television newscasts was Latino-centric regardless of story topic. Sixty-two percent of stories covered something other than the top two Latino issue topics, immigration and

crime/narco-trafficking, yet all of the stories had a Latino interest angle. Telemundo's focus on the Latino community is best seen when the two networks covered the same story as described on the ten analyzed stories, but it was also evident in shorter stories, such as Telemundo's World Series coverage. Both networks covered the World Series on October 30 and 31, 2013, respectively. Though Telemundo's story was only 25 seconds, the network structured the story around Dominican-American David "Big Papi" Ortiz's performance. In coverage of the Miss Universe pageant, both of Noticiero Telemundo's anchors guessed who would be among the finalists in the pageant. When their predictions proved incorrect and Venezuelan Gabriela Isler was crowned Miss Universe 2013, one anchor commented "at least [the winner] was Latina."

In addition to production values and format similarities to local news, this research shows that Telemundo also resembles local news by covering stories in close proximity to Telemundo studios in Miami, Florida, despite its national audience. Most of the international stories covered by Spanish-language news were from nearby Central America. These findings reflect research by Branton (2008) who found that local television news appeals to the ethnicity of consumers within its viewing area. However a broadcast or cable network, such as NBC News, typically appeals to a more geographically diverse audience, and in this analysis NBC News mostly focused on international stories from the Middle East and Southeast Asia.

This study also supports Hale, Olsen, and Fowler (2011)'s finding that Spanish-language news dedicates less than 20 percent of its newscast to election

coverage. The data showed that NBC News covered government or politics 15 percent of the time compared with Telemundo, which covered government or politics 9 percent of the time. NAHJ's (2006) study found that Latinos will become politically active after seeing media images of themselves positively engaged in politics. Based on this study, Latino viewers of English-language news would get no positive reinforcement because there are few Latino actors at all, let alone those shown in politically active roles.

Alternatively, Spanish-language news viewers received most of their information from citizens and the few officials who were able to speak Spanish because Spanish-language network television news broadcasts avoided soundbites from officials or politicians in English, which it would have to translate. (Christian-Daniels & Rogus, 2013; Hale et al., 2011). The stronger presence of everyday people as sources in Spanish-language news gives viewers a more grassroots perspective of politics, compared with English-language news' more official (politician soundbites) and institutional (experts and pundits soundbites) perspective. This could lead to Spanish-language news viewers being more politically engaged after seeing images of everyday people participating in American politics (NAHJ, 2006).

Despite the fact that many Latinos self-identify as liberals (Taylor, et al., 2012; Weinger 2012), and Kerevel's (2011) research which found that Spanish-language news contains a liberal bias, the data from this study showed that Telemundo had no significant difference in the number of liberal and conservative sources. Telemundo also contained more independent sources than liberal sources. So, Telemundo viewers

may be going to the polls with a more balanced perspective than NBC viewers because there was a significant difference between liberal and conservative soundbites on “NBC Nightly News”. These figures are important because the majority of Latino immigrants (90 percent) are eligible to vote (Goodwin, 2011).

Prior research from Hale, Olsen, and Fowler (2011) found that the Spanish-language newscasts contained fewer official sources than the English-language newscast. In this study, while the percentage of official sources was higher for NBC News, the difference was not significant. However, another finding did support some of Hale, et al.’s (2011) conclusions. The researcher found that the Spanish-language newscasts contained more soundbites from international official sources than the English-language newscasts. NBC News stories only included 6 percent foreign official sources, but about 20 percent of the stories were from international datelines, whereas Telemundo included 25 percent international official sources and had 31 percent of its stories from an international dateline. These were typically Spanish-speaking officials whose soundbites did not have to be translated, and according to Hale, Olsen and Fowler (2011) allowed Spanish-language media to strengthen the Latino viewers’ connection to their home country.

However, when looking at domestic coverage, Kerevel (2011) and Allen (2013) concluded that Spanish-language media aims to create a homogenous image of Latinos in America. This research supports those findings. Spanish-language television news creates a common identity among different Latino ethnic groups by concentrating on the groups’ common characteristic of the Spanish-language. The use

of the Spanish-language officials reinforces the common Latino value of language and creates a transnational Latino identity, regardless of the ethnicity of the viewer (Cepeda, 2003; Hale et al., 2011).

Eighty percent of the Latino sources on Telemundo were given a generic Latino label and not defined by their specific ethnicity, such as Puerto Rican, Dominican, or Guatemalan. Since more than three-fourths of the Latino voices included in Telemundo's newscasts were not given an ethnically discriminatory label, this study supports previous findings that Spanish-language news does in fact create a homogenous identity of American Latinos (Mullainathan, 2005).

Branton and Dunaway (2008) found that English-language media, including news, reflects racial stereotypes that portray Latinos as mostly criminals. With only three Latino sources (two real people and one expert) and one reporter, it is not possible to draw any conclusions about racial stereotypes from NBC News—there simply was no Latino presence, stereotypical or not. The data from this study does find that Telemundo works against stereotypes by showing Latinos in a variety of protagonist roles, which includes experts and officials.

Though Telemundo portrays Latinos in a variety of different societal positions, it is still not diverse. This data supports Papper's (2013) study, which found a lack of racial diversity in Spanish-language local television and radio newsrooms. As this analysis found, the situation does not get any better at the network level, with a lack of representation of minorities other than Latinos in the Spanish-language newscasts, both among sources (86% Latino) and reporters (99% Latino). This is surprising

considering the large Afro-Latino population in the United States coming from countries such as the Dominican Republic, Cuba, and Colombia. While NBC News was significantly more racially diverse in sourcing (20% Non-white), and among reporting talent (14% Non-white), it still had a lot of room for improvement given that 37-percent of its U.S. audience is made up of people of color (U.S. Census Bureau, 2012). The absolute domination of Latino-interest angles, Latino sources, and Latino talent on “Noticiero Telemundo” was expected, but made the lack of Latino presence on the co-owned network NBC more surprising because NBC News had access to all of the video and talent used on Telemundo. One explanation for this may be that owner Comcast does not want to compete with itself for Latino viewers. However, a de la Garza et. al (1983) study found that second generation Latinos prefer to watch English-language news rather than Spanish-language news, provided the content relates to them. Confirming previous research comparing Spanish and English-language network news (Christian-Daniels and Rogus, 2013), Latino viewers of both Telemundo and Univisión are not receiving a complete picture of the diversity of the United States. Their newscasts are mostly Latino and White, as compared with the English-language networks’ “NBC Nightly News” and “CBS Evening News,” which have more racially diverse talent and sources.

Though neither network showed much racial diversity, the data did show that Telemundo network contained more gender diversity than NBC News. This may be attributed to the fact that Telemundo had twice as many real people sources as NBC News. Of the 308 real people sources on Telemundo, 136 (44%) were women. This

figure is ten percentage points higher than NBC News (34% women), which had only 150 total real people sources. Additionally, research done by Zinn (1980) and Ybarra (1982) shows that migrant families defy ideas traditionally associated with Latino culture, such as machismo and patriarchy, out of necessity, especially when women are educated. The working Latino family requires input from both men and women; women are therefore regarded as familial providers with valuable opinions.

### **Conclusions and Further Research**

Overall, this research shows that there is still work to be done to diversify the news, even when considering a newscast that was created to serve a racial minority in the United States. Telemundo succeeded in creating a Latino version of the news, but this research showed that Spanish-language news is not very diverse beyond its target audience. Both networks could benefit from showing the real diversity that exists in America, especially considering prior research (Hale, et. al, 2011; Univision, 2013) that argues that media—especially television—has the power to shape Latino Americans' identity both as Latinos and as Americans.

English-language news networks also are in need of improvement. Latinos on NBC News were sources only when referring to the Latino issue of immigration, and only in one story. If diversity among races is to be seen in the news, other minorities must be seen as experts in topics other than those that directly affect their race. Clearly, the news media must be more inclusive on the story, newsroom, and executive level for all groups and perspectives as the U.S. becomes a majority-minority country as early as 2043.

Opportunities for future research lay in several areas including gender roles in national news and Latino homogeneity levels in local television news. Concerning diversity, more detailed research could be done on the roles of women compared with the roles of men in Spanish and English-language news as gender differences in both sources and reporters were highly significant. Future research should also compare English and Spanish-language local television news. In the local news setting, Latino communities often have a more distinct ethnic identity, such as Cuban in Miami, Puerto Rican in New York, or Mexican in Texas. It would be interesting to find out if Spanish or English-language local news is more reflective of the local communities it serves, creating a more unique ethnic Latino identity, or does it follow the pattern of national news in creating a homogeneous perspective of Latino Americans.

In conclusion, this research has found that catering news to a marginalized racial population is not a sufficient condition for a diverse news network. To experience the full benefit of diversity, there must be an element of inclusion, in which a variety of difference races and perspectives are incorporated into a mainstream culture. Considering that Latinos both construct their identities and preserve traditional culture through television, diverse and inclusive television news broadcasts are a necessity. This research has shown that there is evidence contrary to presuppositions regarding the political bias and tone of Latino-Americans. As America approaches the brink of a population that is majority people of color, news networks will better serve their audiences by departing from the race and gender makeup they currently hold.



### Works Cited

- Arnold, R. Douglas, (2004). *Congress, the Press, and Political Accountability*. New York/Princeton: Russell Sage Foundation/Princeton University Press.
- Barco, M. D. (2013, March 1). Spanish-Language Network Univisión Ranks 3rd In U.S. Ratings . *NPR : National Public Radio : News & Analysis, World, US, Music & Arts*. Retrieved March 7, 2013, from <http://www.npr.org/2013/03/01/173211210/spanish-language-network-Univisión-ranks-3rd-in-u-s-ratings>
- BBC News. (2008, August 14). Minorities set to be U.S. majority. *BBC News - Home*. Retrieved June 5, 2012, from <http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/americas/7559996>
- Bartels, L. M. (1993). Messages received: the political impact of media exposure. *American Political Science Review*, (2), 267.
- Bengoa, B., Fuentes, J., Izaguirre, S., & Perez, S. (2011). How Spanish Journalists consider minorities and vulnerable groups should be treated by media. *Estudios Sobre El Mensaje Periodistico*, 17(2), 457-476.
- Branton, R., & Dunaway, J. (2008). English-and Spanish-Language Media Coverage of Immigration: A Comparative Analysis. *Social Science Quarterly*, 89(4), 1006-1022.
- Byers, D. (2013, August 16). RNC's NBC, CNN boycott will extend to Telemundo, CNN Español. *Politico*. Retrieved September 15, 2013, from <http://www.politico.com/blogs/media/2013/08/rncs-nbc-cnn-boycott-to-benefit-Univisión-170671.html>
- Christian-Daniels, S. & Rogus, M. (April, 2013). *A Comparison of Spanish and English-language Broadcast Network News Content and Production Style*. Paper presented at The Broadcast Education Association Convention, Las Vegas, NV.
- Chozick, A., & Stelter, B. (2013, February 12). Comcast Buys Rest of NBC in Early Sale. *New York Times*. Retrieved September 24, 2013, from <http://mediadecoder.blogs.nytimes.com/2013/02/12/comcast-buying-g-e-s-stake-in-nbcuniversal-for-16-7-billion/>
- Coppedge, M. (1997). *A Classification of Latin American Political Parties*. (Working Paper). Retrieved from Google Scholar.

- David, C. C. (2009). Learning Political Information From the News: A Closer Look at the Role of Motivation. (Report). *Journal Of Communication*, (2), 243. doi:10.1111/j.1460-2466.2009.01414.x
- De la Garza, R.O., Brischetto, R., & Vaughn, D. (1983). *The Mexican American Electorate: Information sources and policy orientations*. Austin: University of Texas, the Center for Mexican American Studies.
- Deshpande, R., Hoyer, W. D., & Donthu, N. (1986). The Intensity of Ethnic Affiliation: A Study of the Sociology of Hispanic Consumption. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 13, 214-220.
- Faber, R. J., O'Guinn, T. C., & Meyer, T. P. (1986). Diversity in the Ethnic Media Audience: A Study of Spanish Language Broadcast Preference in the U.S. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, 10, 347-359.
- Fletcher, D. (2009, October 29). A Brief History of Sweeps Week. *time*, October 29, 2009. Retrieved October 19, 2013, from <http://content.time.com/time/arts/article/0,8599,1883157,00.html>
- Gentzkow, M. & Shapiro, J. (2006). What Drives the Media Slant? Evidence from U.S. Daily Newspapers. *NBER Working Paper* No. 120707.
- Goodwin, S. (2011, April 18). *Talk of the Nation* [Radio broadcast]. Washington, D.C.: National Public Radio.
- Hale, M., Olsen, T., & Fowler, E. F. (2011). A Matter of Language or Culture: Coverage of 2004 U.S. Elections on Spanish-and English-Language Television. *Mass Community and Society*, 12, 26-51.
- Hernandez, E. (2001). Being a Latina Journalist at a Spanish-Language Newspaper. *Nieman Reports*, (2).
- Hispanic Purchasing Power Surges in U.S.: Study. (2012, May 17). *Hispanicbusiness.com*. Retrieved May 30, 2012, from [http://www.hispanicbusiness.com/2012/5/17/hispanic\\_purchasing\\_power\\_surges\\_in\\_us.htm](http://www.hispanicbusiness.com/2012/5/17/hispanic_purchasing_power_surges_in_us.htm)
- James, M. (2012, August 12). Fox launching Spanish-language network. *Los Angeles Times*. Retrieved March 7, 2013, from <http://articles.latimes.com/2012/aug/12/entertainment/la-et-ct-0813-mundofox-network-20120813>

Kerevel, Y. P. (2011). The Influence of Spanish-Language Media on Latino Public Opinion and Group Consciousness. *Social Science Quarterly*, 92(2), 510-534.

Marszalek, D. (2013). Hispanic Audiences Fueling TV News Growth. *TVNewsCheck: The Business of Broadcasting*. Retrieved November 8, 2013, from <http://www.tvnewscheck.com/article/71734/hispanic-audiences-fueling-tv-news-growth>

Miller, A., & Kurpius, D. (2010). A Citizen-Eye View of Television News Source Credibility. *American Behavioral Scientist*, 54(2), 137-156.  
doi:10.1177/0002764210376315

Miller, C., Purcell, K. and Rosenstiel, T. (2012). Local topics of interest and the primary Source for Information. Pew Research Internet Project. Retrieved April 1, 2014 from <http://www.pewinternet.org/2012/04/12/part-iv-local-topics-of-interest-and-the-primary-source-for-information/>

Mullainathan, S. & Shleifer, A., (2005). The Market for News. *American Economic Review* 95, 1031-1053.

Nielson. (2013). *Television Measurement--TV Ratings--Nielsen*. Retrieved October 19, 2013, from <http://www.nielsen.com/us/en/nielsen-solutions/nielsen-measurement/nielsen-tv-measurement.html>

Rodriguez, A. (1999). *Making Latino news : race, language, class / América Rodríguez*. Thousand Oaks, Calif : Sage Publications, c1999.

Rojas, V. (2004). The Gender of Latinidad : Latinas Speak About Hispanic Television. *Communication Review*, 7(2), 125-153.

Papper, B. (2013, July 29). Little change for women, minorities in TV/radio. RTDNA-Radio Television Digital News Association. Retrieved September 30, 2013, from [http://rtdna.org/article/little\\_change\\_for\\_women\\_minorities\\_in\\_tv\\_radio#.UknptJworV](http://rtdna.org/article/little_change_for_women_minorities_in_tv_radio#.UknptJworV)

Broadcasting Service. (n.d.). *Local News--The Ratings Game*. PBS: Public Broadcasting Service (PBS). Retrieved October 14, 2013, from <http://www.pbs.org/wnet/insidelocalnews/r>

Santa Ana, O. (2013). *Juan in a Hundred*. Austin: University of Texas Press.

- Smith, L. K. (2008). Race, Ethnicity, and Student Sources: Minority Newsmakers in Student-Produced Versus Professional TV News Stories. *Howard Journal Of Communications*, 19(2), 182-199. doi:10.1080/10646170801990995
- Sorkin, A. R. (2001, October 12). NBC Is Paying \$1.98 Billion For Telemundo. *New York Times*. Retrieved March 7, 2013, from <http://www.nytimes.com/2001/10/12/business/nbc-is-paying-1.98-billion-for-telemundo.html>
- Spanish International Network - The Museum of Broadcast Communications. (n.d.). *The Museum of Broadcast Communications*. Retrieved May 30, 2012, from <http://www.museum.tv/eotvsection.php?entrycode=spanishinter>
- Stemler, Steve (2001). An introduction to content analysis. *ERIC Digest*. 1-7. Retrieved from <http://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED458218.pdf>
- Taylor, L.K (2004). Dollars and sense: a content analysis of the network television news environment surrounding the passage of the Bipartisan Campaign Reform Act of 2002 (Thesis/Dissertation). Retrieved from Dissertations and Theses database. (UMI No. 1446988)
- Taylor, P., Lopez, M.H., Martinez, J., & Velasco, G. (2012). Politics, Values, and Religion. *When labels don't fit: Hispanics and their views of identity*. Retrieved from <http://www.pewhispanic.org/2012/04/04/v-politics-values-and-religion/>
- Trounson, R., (2012, May 18). U.S. reaches historic demographic tipping point. *Los Angeles Times*. Retrieved June 5, 2012, from <http://www.latimes.com/news/local/la-me-census-births-20120518,0,5678651.story>
- U.S. Bureau of the Census (2012) *Quick Facts* Retrieved March 25, 2014 from <http://quickfacts.census.gov/qfd/states/00000.html>
- U.S. Bureau of the Census. (2010) *Language Spoken at Home: 2010 American Community Survey 1-year Estimates*. Retrieved June 5, 2012, from [http://factfinder2.census.gov/rest/dnldController/deliver?\\_ts=356976542009](http://factfinder2.census.gov/rest/dnldController/deliver?_ts=356976542009)
- Weinger, M. (2012). Poll: Latinos say they're more liberal. *Politico*. Retrieved from <http://www.politico.com/news/stories/0412/74835.html>
- Ybarra, L. (1982). When wives work: The impact on the Chicano family. *Journal of Marriage and the Family*. 44 (1). 169-178.

Zaller, J.R. (1999). A Theory of Media Politics: How the Interests of Politicians, Journalists, and Citizens Shapes the News. *Unpublished Book Manuscript*.

Zinn, M. (1980). Employment and education of Mexican-American women: The interplay of modernity and ethnicity in eight families. *Harvard Educational Review*. 50 (1). 47-62.