

A11340063921

No. 68

1

A CRITICAL STUDY OF THE WALDEN MANUSCRIPT

EVELYN SIMMONS

Submitted in partial fulfillment  
of the requirements for the degree of  
Master of Arts

UNIVERSITY LIBRARY  
BOWLING GREEN, OHIO

BOWLING GREEN STATE UNIVERSITY  
Bowling Green, Ohio

1942

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|  | PAGE |
|--|------|
| CHAPTER I. INTRODUCTION.....                     | 1    |
| Purpose of the Study.....                        | 1    |
| Materials Used for the Study.....                | 2    |
| Method of Investigation.....                     | 2    |
| Limitation of this Study.....                    | 5    |
| CHAPTER II. THOREAU'S METHOD OF COMPOSITION..... | 7    |
| CHAPTER III. THOREAU'S REVISIONS.....            | 26   |
| Kinds of Revisions.....                          | 26   |
| Apparent Reasons for Changes.....                | 34   |
| Importance of the Revisions.....                 | 35   |
| CHAPTER IV. UNPUBLISHED MANUSCRIPT.....          | 37   |
| Number and Length of Unpublished Passages.....   | 37   |
| Literary Importance of these Passages.....       | 49   |
| CHAPTER V. CONCLUSION.....                       | 51   |
| New Light on Thoreau.....                        | 54   |
| New Light on <u>Walden</u> .....                 | 54   |
| Need for a Variorum Edition.....                 | 55   |

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

## APPENDIX

Sample of Manuscript Frames

Table of Contents for the Manuscript

# A CRITICAL STUDY OF THE WALDEN MANUSCRIPT

## CHAPTER I.

### INTRODUCTION

#### Purpose of the Study

Reasons for undertaking the study.- A first general survey of the Walden manuscript revealed that most of it is considerably different from Thoreau's final edited text.<sup>1</sup> This study was therefore undertaken to point out and illustrate the most significant of these changes, and, where it is possible, to propose some reasons for them. Why did Thoreau rewrite certain portions of the manuscript as many as twelve and thirteen times? Just how much variation is there in different versions of the same passage? Of how much importance can one consider these revisions? The answers to these questions will form one of the most important aspects of the study.

Growth of the study.- The variations between the Walden manuscript and the Walden text provide an interesting and valuable study of Thoreau's methods of composition. In studying these variations, the writer also found that there are significant unpublished passages in the manuscript. The study thus grew to include a survey of Thoreau's methods of composition.

---

1. Thoreau, Henry D., Walden or Life in the Woods, Modern Readers' Series, The Macmillan Company, New York, 1929.

his achievements and limitations as a literary artist, and a discovery of many unpublished passages of Walden.

### Materials Used for the Study

The manuscript sheets of Walden were copied on thirty-five millimeter microfilm by the Huntington Library, San Marino, California, from which Bowling Green State University purchased it. It is the only one known to exist, though other manuscripts may have been destroyed. The final proof sheets for the text are included with the present manuscript, but they, of course, are printed. Thoreau must have completed a final draft before he submitted the manuscript to the printers, but such a one has not been discovered.

The present manuscript is comprised of 1,201 "frames"; each approximately equal to two-thirds of an ordinary printed page, though some of the frames are fragmentary.

The most important materials for this study are the Walden manuscript and the standard Walden text.<sup>2</sup> The secondary sources listed in the bibliography have been read and consulted for background material, but were not used directly, since no similar study has been made.

### Method of Investigation

The first problem to solve in the study of the Walden man-

---

2. Ibid.

uscript was that of organization, for the frames are not consecutive; the same number is often repeated on different frames, and many of them are even unnumbered. The individual sheets of the manuscript may have become disordered in the library, but most of the disorder is conclusively due to Thoreau's own methods of composition. Therefore, before proceeding very far in a comparison between a textual version of Walden and those found in the manuscript, it was necessary to discover how one could progress from one page to the next. At first the task seemed impossible. But by first tabulating all the page numbers on the frames, and then skipping back and forth between the intervening frames with this imperfect "Table of Contents" as a guide, continuity has been achieved. The frames which are unnumbered can usually be placed by their context.

There are two numbering systems in the manuscript; the one so broken that it would be useless in this study. The other one, which is being used, seems to be Thoreau's own, since it follows his peculiar organization of the pages and is in his handwriting. Thus "frame 159,160,161" is that section of film which contains a portion of Thoreau's page 159, all of page 160, and part of 161. One frame corresponds to one sheet of paper. Why Thoreau chose to begin his pages just anywhere on the paper rather than at the top of each sheet is not clear. Frequently one finds several pages with

the same number, and these are usually variant readings of the same passage, but often in a passage which is continuous the page numbers overlap. By checking off each frame as the work on it was completed, it was possible, by the process of elimination, to know what portion of the film had not been covered. Such a process avoids the danger of skipping variant readings and unpublished passages.

The first method of investigation attempted was that of reading the text and comparing the manuscript with it simultaneously, writing in the text words and phrases that were different in the manuscript, and putting the longer passages which could not be written in the text on a labeled sheet of paper. This method works very well for some portions of the manuscript, but its limitation is that, while one has no difficulty in matching passages in the text, no guideposts through the manuscript are provided. It is therefore impossible to organize the manuscript completely by this method alone. The result was that it was necessary to copy, word for word, most of the frames included in this study. After they were copied, it was usually possible to match the last word or sentence on one frame with those which logically followed, and in this way to conclude what was the main consecutive context of the manuscript and which were variant readings.

Recording manuscript has sometimes been made easier by

consulting the text, because many portions of the manuscript are revised and written in with pencil, making words occasionally illegible. Thoreau's handwriting itself is particularly difficult to decipher.

Having once deciphered and recorded the manuscript for a given chapter, the next step was to compare and contrast parallel passages in the text. To do this means to comprise a variorum edition, which, with all the manuscript included, would be about 2500 pages in length. But the writer has paralleled 407 frames with 121 pages of the standard text, and this provides a fair sample of the study. From this wealth of material were chosen the best examples which could be found of the unpublished passages, the deleted and emended words, the revised sentences and paragraphs, word changes of various types, and other divisions of the study which have already been mentioned.

#### Limitation of this Study

The condition of the manuscript and its bulkiness have made it necessary to choose a representative portion for the study, rather than attempt to use all the evidence which has been compiled. The number of frames actually covered in this study is 622; the number of pages which are parallel to them in the text is 165. This means that approximately half of the text has been covered, and approximately half of the manuscript. If the number of variant readings or the number

of frames which they occupy is about the same in the latter half of the manuscript as it is in the former, there should be numerous unpublished passages which have not yet been discovered.

From the 622 frames completed, such passages as best illustrate the general conclusions of this thesis will be chosen. There is every reason to believe that further study of the manuscript will only reveal more evidence for the same conclusions. A study of the chapters which follow will reveal even more clearly the necessity of limiting the subject matter chosen for use in the thesis itself. When at least three hundred examples such as the ones given on pages 9-11 could be quoted to illustrate the same points, there is naturally a necessity for choosing the most representative portions. Examples have usually been chosen from the 407 frames actually paralleled to the text, though parts of the others, to which the equivalent in the text has not yet been made certain, are just as interesting. Some of these may be unpublished passages, but that cannot be ascertained until the remainder of the text and the remainder of the manuscript are studied. It has been determined that forty-four pages of the text are roughly parallel to some of the 215 frames which have been examined but which have not been accurately accounted for, because they were read aloud rather than written as the first 407 frames were.



## CHAPTER II.

### THOREAU'S METHODS OF COMPOSITION

As Thoreau has said in the first paragraph of Walden, most of it was written on the shores of Walden Pond, where he carried out his famous experiment. Yet the first paragraph in the text presents a conundrum. We know that the entire work was completed between March, 1845, when he began his life as a recluse, and some time in 1854, the year that the book was published. The manuscript bears conclusive evidence that, although most of the book was completed during the two years and two months during which he was a sojourner at Walden, it was subject to a number of revisions from beginning to end after he had resumed his place in civilization. The last sentence in the first paragraph of the text states: "At present I am a sojourner in civilised life again," and this is the way that the final version of the manuscript reads. How could he be "a sojourner in civilised life again" when the first paragraph of the book was written, and yet "write the bulk of the following pages...alone in the woods", as he says in the very first sentence of the same paragraph? The answer is obviously due to revisions, and of these the

manuscript is ample proof.

The first part of Economy was originally given as a lecture before Thoreau's townsmen at the Concord Lyceum.<sup>3</sup> If he wrote out the lecture, and he probably did, that version is not in the manuscript. Yet in the first variant reading, wherever "this book", "these pages", "this volume", or "my readers" is found in the text, "this lecture", and "my audience" are found. This could not be the lecture as it stood originally, because in the third paragraph he says: "After I had lectured to my townsmen last winter...", showing that some time had elapsed since the lecture had been given. Whether Thoreau became accustomed to this form of address by giving the lecture, or whether he copied the paragraphs from the lecture, if he did write it out, without revising them, cannot be determined. But the first variant reading in the manuscript reads as follows:

I should not presume to talk so much about myself and my affairs as I shall in this lecture

---

3. The Concord Lyceum was organized in 1829, soon after the Lyceum movement was under way in the United States. Thoreau became a member of the Lyceum soon after he was twelve, that being the least age required of members. His biographers mention a number of lectures Thoreau gave before the Lyceum, but none of them mention this particular one. The only proof that he gave such a lecture is in the sentence from the manuscript quoted above: "After I had lectured to my townsmen last winter...", but many other interesting details concerning Thoreau's connections with the Lyceum can be found by consulting the biographies by Canby, Sanborn, Atkinson, and others.

if very particular and personal inquiries had not been made concerning my mode of life,--what some would call impertinent, but they are by no means impertinent to me, but on the contrary very natural and pertinent, considering the circumstances. Some have wished to know what I got to eat--if I didn't<sup>4</sup> [sic.] feel kind o' lonesome--if I wasn't [sic.] afraid--What I should do if I were taken sick--and the like. Others have been inquisitive to know what portion of my income I devoted to charitable purposes, and some who have large families, how many poor children I maintained.

After I lectured to my townsmen last winter I heard that some expected that I would answer some of these questions in my lecture--so I must ask all strangers, and all who have little or no interest in this among my audience to pardon me, if I undertake to answer them in part now. In most lectures and stories the I, or first person[, ] is omitted; in this it will be inserted, that is the main difference. We are not apt to remember that it is after all always the first person that is speaking.

I warn you that I shall brag a good deal more than is according to the rules of good taste--I shall brag for you as well as for myself--trusting that God will grant me an eternity to fulfil some things in. Taste and I parted company long ago.

Perhaps this lecture is more particularly addressed to the class of poor students; as for the rest of my audience, they will accept such portions as apply to them. I trust that none will stretch the seams in putting on the coat, for it may be of good service to him whom it fits.<sup>5</sup>

There is a second variant reading which closely resembles this one, except that "my readers" and "these pages" are substituted for "my audience" and "this lecture." The third variant reading most closely resembles the text, although it is not identical with it:

I should not obtrude myself and my affairs so

4. This error occurs in other versions of the manuscript, also. In fact, Thoreau never changed it in any of the variant readings.
5. This variant reading occupies frame 7 of the manuscript.

much on the notice of my readers if very particular inquiries had not been made concerning my mode of life, what some would call impertinent, considering the circumstances. Some have wished to know what I got to eat, -- if I did'nt [sic.] feel "kind o' lonesome"--if I was'nt [sic.] afraid--what I should do if I were taken sick, and the like. Others have been curious to learn what portion of my income I devoted to charitable purposes; and some, who have large families, how many poor children I maintained. So I will ask all strangers and those who feel no interest in me among my readers to pardon me if I undertake to answer some of these questions now. In most books and lectures the I, or first person, is omitted, in this it will be retained, that is the main difference. We do not usually remember that it is after all, always the first person who is speaking. I should not talk so much about myself if there were anybody else whom I knew as well. Unfortunately I am confined to this theme by the narrowness of my experience. For my own part, I require of every writer that he give me a simple and sincere account of his own life and not so much what he has heard of other men's lives, some such account as he would send to his kindred from a distant land,--for if he has lived sincerely it must have been in a distant land to me,--describing ever his outward circumstances and what adventures he has had, as well as his thoughts and feelings about them. If anything has yielded him pleasure, or instruction, let him communicate it. Let the money-getter when he takes up the pen tell how much he loves wealth, and what means he takes to accumulate it. He should not write on Foreign Missions. The mechanic will naturally write about his trade, the farmer about his farm, and every man about that which he understands better than others, that is, his own affairs. Yet incredible mistakes are made; I have heard an owl lecture with a perverse show of learning on the solar microscope and Chanticleere [sic.] on nebulous stars, when both should naturally have been sound asleep, the owl in a hollow tree, the other upon his roost.

Perhaps this volume is more particularly addressed to poor students. As for the rest of my readers, they will accept such portions of it as apply to them. I trust that none will stretch the seams in putting on the coat, for it may do good service to him whom it fits. 6

---

6. This variant reading occupies frames 8 and 9 of the manuscript. What there is of its parallel in the text will be found on pages 1 and 2, lines 9-25.

A number of essential differences may be noted in these two variant readings. In the second one, there are several sentences which are not found either in the first variant reading given here or in the text. This passage of a little more than twenty lines is found twice in the manuscript, in varying versions which will be given in the chapter concerning the unpublished portions.

Changes in words and phrases in these two variant readings are given in the following table:

TABLE 1. DIFFERENCES IN THE TEXTUAL VERSION OF PARAGRAPH II OF ECONOMY AND PARALLEL MATERIAL IN THE MANUSCRIPT

| TEXT                                |              | MANUSCRIPT                             |                                     |
|-------------------------------------|--------------|--|-------------------------------------|
| Parallel in Text                    | Location     | Word or phrase in Variant Reading 1    | Word or phrase Variant R. 2         |
| obtrude                             | p.1, l.9.    | presume to talk so much about          | obtrude                             |
| my affairs                          | p. 1, l.9.   | myself and my affairs                  | my affairs                          |
| so much on the notice of my readers | p.1, ll.9-10 | as I shall in this lecture             | so much on the notice of my readers |
| very particular inquiries           | p.1, l. 10.  | very particular and personal inquiries | very particular inquiries           |

which some would call impertinent, though they do not appear to me at all impertinent, but, considering the circumstances, very natural and pertinent.

asked

if I did not feel lonesome

if I was not afraid

curious to learn

[NO PARALLEL]

I will therefore ask those of my readers who feel no particular interest in me

to answer some of these questions in this book

In most books,

in this it will be retained

p.1,11.12-15.

p. 1, 1.15.

p. 1, 1. 16.

p. 1, 1. 16.

p. 1, 1. 17.

-----

p.1,11.20-21

p.1,11.22-23.

p. 1, 1. 23.

p.1,11.24-25

what some would call impertinent, but they are by no means impertinent to me, but on the contrary very natural and pertinent, considering the circumstances.

wished to know

if I did'nt feel kind o' lonesome

if I was'nt afraid

inquisitive to know

After I lectured to my townsmen last winter I hear that some expected I would answer some of these questions in my lecture.

so I must ask all strangers, and all that have little or no interest in this

to answer them in part now

In most lectures and stories,

in this it will be inserted

what some would call impertinent, considering the circumstances.

wished to know

if I did'nt feel kind o' lonesome

if I was'nt afraid

curious to learn

[NO PARALLEL]

so I will ask all strangers and those who feel no interest in me among my readers

to answer some of these questions now

In most books and lectures

in this it will be retained

that, in respect to egotism, is the main difference

We commonly do not remember

I should not talk so much about myself if there were anybody whom I knew as well.

Unfortunately, I am confined to this theme by the narrowness of my experience.

Moreover I, on my side, require of every writer, first and last, a simple and sincere account of his own life and not merely what he has heard of other men's lives;

[NO PARALLEL]

p.1,11.25-26.

p. 1, 1.26.

p. 2,11.2-3.

p.2,11.3-5.

p.2,11.5-8.

-----

that is the main difference

We are not apt to remember

I warn you that I shall brag a good deal more than is according to rules of good taste--

[NO PARALLEL]

[NO PARALLEL]

[NO PARALLEL]

13.

that is the main difference

We do not usually remember

I should not talk so much about myself if there were anybody else whom I knew as well.

Unfortunately I am confined to this theme by the narrowness of my experience.

For my own part, I require of every writer that he give me a simple and sincere account of his own life and not so much of what he has heard of other men's lives.

--describing ever his outward circumstances and what adventures he has had, as well as his thoughts and feelings about them. If anything has yielded him pleasure or instruction, let him communicate it. Let the money-getter when he

takes up the pen tell how much he loves wealth, and what means he has taken to accumulate it. He should not write on Foreign Missions. The mechanic will naturally write about his trade, the farmer about his farm, and every man about that which he understands better than others, that is, his own affairs. Yet incredible mistakes are made; I have heard an owl lecture with a perverse show of learning on the solar microscope and Chanticleere on nebulous stars, when both should naturally have been sound asleep, the owl in a hollow tree, the other upon his roost.

Perhaps these  
pages

p.2,1.11

to poor students

p.2,1.12.

As for the rest  
of my readers,

p.2,11.12-13.

Perhaps this  
lecture

to the class of  
poor students

As for the rest  
of my audience,

Perhaps this  
volume

to poor  
students

As for the  
rest of my  
readers,



accept such  
portions as  
apply

p.2,11.13-14

accept such  
portions as  
apply

accept such  
portions of it  
as apply

do good service p.2,11.15-16.

be of good  
service

do good service

The deletions which are present in the manuscript are not included in this table because they will be studied in the next chapter. The emendations were naturally included to make the thought consecutive. If the deletions and the differences in punctuation were included, the table would be over twice as long as it is. Furthermore, there are two more variant readings, but these are not given because the study of variant readings will also be given more attention in the next chapter. They are, however, an intrinsic part of Thoreau's method of composition.

Another difference which the table does not reveal is the difference in paragraphing. It can be seen from the two variant readings given that the first one contains four paragraphs; the second, two; whereas the same material in the standard text occupies but one paragraph. This reveals a typical process which Thoreau underwent in his method of composition: that of writing short, choppy paragraphs and later combining them into longer, more skillfully organized ones. Sometimes it was necessary to dispense with some of the material in order to make the paragraph more unified and coherent. Here is a fairly representative example:

One farmer says to me you can't live on vegetable food solely, for it furnishes nothing to make bones with,--and so he religiously devotes a part of his day to supplying his system with the raw material for bones,--all the while he talks walking behind his oxen

whose vegetable-made bones jerk him and his lumbering plow along in spite of every obstacle.

Some things are necessities of life in some circles, the most helpless and diseased, which in others are luxuries merely, and in others still are entirely unknown.

I know a robust and healthy mother who thinks that her son who died abroad came to his end by living too low, as she has since learned that he drank only water.

I heard of a very poor family in Concord this winter which would have starved if it had not been for potatoes and tea and coffee.<sup>7</sup>

The second variant reading is almost identical with the text, and a comparison with the one above will show how Thoreau combined the usable thoughts into a single paragraph and omitted those which were not sufficiently developed:

One farmer says to me, "You cannot live on vegetable food solely, for it furnishes nothing to make bones with," and so he religiously devotes a part of his day to supplying his system with the raw material of bones; walking all the while he talks behind his oxen which, with vegetable made bones, jerk him and his lumbering plow along in spite of every obstacle. Some things are necessities of life in some circles, the most helpless and diseased, which in others are luxuries merely, and in others still are entirely unknown.<sup>8</sup>

There are passages, of course, to which there is but one parallel reading. In most cases, even that single version in the manuscript is not exactly parallel to the

---

7. Frame 17.

8. Frame 16, 17, 18. The parallel in the text is found on page 8, the last paragraph.

text. When there is more than one variation, usually none of them is parallel to the text, and Thoreau could have made his final version only by a conglomeration, if he used this manuscript.

The writer has no evidence that there is another manuscript or that there were others which have been destroyed, except that Thoreau published Walden in 1854, and it is unthinkable that he submitted the manuscript in this condition to the printers. They could not have known which reading of the same passage to choose for the text, even if the pages were in order at that time.

In the passage given on pages 16-17, it will be noted that the last two paragraphs are not very well developed, and that the former of the two is poorly stated. There is another variant reading of the manuscript in which Thoreau repeated these paragraphs almost exactly, but in the third, fourth, and fifth variant readings they are combined into one paragraph, one of these being quoted on page 17; the other two being so similar to this one that it is needless to quote them here. For the present, it would seem that Thoreau has discarded the other two paragraphs. Later, however, it is interesting to see them revised and used in both the manuscript and the text. On page 68 of the text, sixty pages after the one for which the paragraph was originally written, we find a new version

of it:

...Yet men have come to such a pass that they frequently starve, not for want of necessities, but for want of luxuries; and I know a good woman who thinks that her son lost his life because he took to drinking water only.<sup>9</sup>

The original "paragraph" has been revised and fitted into other material, and a marked improvement in the style can be noticed. There remains, however, an unexplained question concerning it. The parallel material in the manuscript is found on frames 97, 98, and 99, and unless there is another variant reading on some later unnumbered or misnumbered frame, it is omitted from all the variant readings in the manuscript, and it is the only sentence which is omitted. How it found its way into the text is therefore still a mystery. It is conclusively the same idea that is found on frame 17 of the manuscript, although the idea of the son's being abroad when he died is omitted--possibly because of its irrelevancy.

Amusingly enough, the exact opposite is true of the last paragraph of the passage given on pages 16-17. It is found in the manuscript, but not in the text. It is much more drastically revised than the sentence which has just been discussed, and if it is not an outgrowth of the same paragraph, it is in all probability an outgrowth of the same thought. It is revised and expanded 90 frames later than the first crude

---

9. Walden, Op. Cit., p. 68, ll. 8-12.

draft:

I saw the other day on the skirts of the village, a family which for three months had had no bed but a wisp of straw on a board and two Irish sheets, no furniture to their house but two plates, two bowls, ten pewter spoons, and a knife without a handle,--for I took a careful inventory,--no house but a shanty. There were two children who sat out of doors in fair weather and enjoyed perfect leisure. They lived with the door open in midwinter; and yet compared with the tent of the Indians, they felt their share of the cold. The father went three miles to his work and carried nothing but bread for his dinner. His family would have starved if it had not been for potatoes and tea and coffee. The greater part of what he earns is sent to Ireland to forward his remaining children to this land of plenty. I did not know whether most to pity or admire. In the meanwhile Mrs. O. D. R., president of the Charitable Society, has caught her death through a crack in the door, and Mrs. Farewell is pining away like a fly caught in a preserve pot, and calls her disease sciatica.<sup>10</sup>

According to the manuscript, this paragraph is supposed to fit into the material found on pages 73 and 74 of the text, and probably was written originally as one of the several examples given there. It was probably omitted from the text because it argues against the point he is trying to make--that most furniture is at best unnecessary and cumbersome. It is, nevertheless, good satire in the opposite direction.

It is not uncommon to find such fragments separated

---

10. Consult frames 104-107 of the manuscript.

from their final version by fifty or sixty pages of interpolated material. For the first five pages of Economy in the text, thirty-four frames of manuscript were covered. Most of this material was repetitions; a small part of it was unpublished. In the thirty-four frames there was but one entire frame which could not in any way be accounted for in the first five pages of the text, although there were a number of paragraphs and shorter passages like the one just quoted. The unnumbered frame was not long, but its being isolated made it difficult to place. The other fragments did not seem out of place, because they were originally written as part of the consecutive manuscript for the early portion of Economy. It was later found that the passage is probably a part of the central ideas from which the division entitled "Architecture", on pages 50-54 of the text, was developed. The paragraph is a good one, though it is not found in that passage. It is possible to place it there because it is the only division in the book which discusses architecture. Some of the ideas in this paragraph are also similar to those in the more detailed discussion on pages 50-54, though the ideas are expressed differently:

Architectural remains are beautiful commonly from association only. The American's taste for

architecture is like his taste for wine and olives and other foreign things.

The too exquisitely cultured I avoid as I do the theatre. There [sic.] life lacks reality. They offer me wine instead of water. They are surrounded by things which can be bought.<sup>11</sup>

It is another fairly typical illustration of how whole passages grew out of a few short sentences written long before the final version.

Writing detailed, complicated passages which grew out of a few short sentences, written hastily and sometimes even left to stand as paragraphs, was therefore one of Thoreau's basic methods of composition, and it can be illustrated by numerous examples of various length and quality. This process took place both when he reworked the material which was in its final place in the manuscript and when he wrote out what was little more than notes for later subject matter. Usually such changes were in the direction of greater detail and more picturesque exemplification, as may be illustrated by the first draft and the final draft of the following paragraph:

The virtue of philanthropy is greatly overrated, and it is our selfishness that overrates it. Our kind uncles and aunts of the race are more esteemed than its spiritual fathers and mothers.<sup>12</sup>

This is all that there is to the paragraph in its

- 
- 11. An unnumbered frame in the first thirty-four frames of the manuscript.
  - 12. Consult Frame 119.



original version. But note how it has been glorified and expanded in the final copy:

Philanthropy is almost the only virtue which is sufficiently appreciated by mankind. Nay [.] it is greatly overrated; and it is our selfishness that overrates it. A robust poor fellow one sunny day here in Concord, praised a fellow-townsmen to me, because, he said, he was kind to the poor, meaning himself. The kind uncles and aunts of the race are more esteemed than its true spiritual fathers and mothers. I once heard a reverend lecture in England, a man of learning and intelligence, after enumerating her scientific [.] literary, and political worthies Shakespeare, Bacon, Cromwell, Milton, Newton, etc., speak next of her Christian heroes, whom [.] as if his profession required it of him, he elevated to a place above all the rest, as the greatest of the great. They were Penn, Howard, and Mrs. Fry. The least intelligent audience must feel the falsehood and cant of this. The last were not England's best men and women; only, perhaps, her best philanthropists.<sup>13</sup>

There are no very important differences between this variant reading in the manuscript and the only complete paragraph on page 85 of the text. The important thing to notice is how two sentences have been expanded, particularly by exemplification, into a well-developed paragraph.

Usually Thoreau's revisions are in the direction of greater detail, as they have been in the illustrations given so far, but occasionally he changed the words and phrases so that they were more abstract in the later version. A

---

13. Consult frame 121.

sentence on page 5 of the text reads:

The finest qualities of our nature, like the bloom on fruits, can be preserved only by the most delicate handling.<sup>14</sup>

And this is exactly parallel to the last variant reading in the manuscript. But the first variant reading was:

The finest qualities of our natures, like the down of a peach, can be preserved only by the most delicate handling.<sup>15</sup>

In this case, it seems that Thoreau deleted the more effective of the two similies. Usually his microscopic criticism of his own work did result in changes for the better, but that is one of the few cases in which improvement is doubtful. There are a number of types of such changes, and here is one that is definitely good:

To the elevation of mankind, what are called the luxuries and many of the comforts of life are not only not indispensable, but positive hindrances.<sup>16</sup>

The sentence is definitely cumbersome and awkward, compared to the revision;

Most of the luxuries, and many of the so-called comforts of life, are not only not indispensable, but positive hindrances to the elevation of mankind.<sup>17</sup>

---

14. Walden, Op. Cit., p. 5, ll. 7-9.

15. Consult frame 10, 13 of the manuscript.

16. Consult frame 24 of the manuscript.

17. Walden, Op. Cit., p. 14, ll. 12-14.

By placing the inverted part of the sentence in its natural order, the proper emphasis is achieved, and the reader does not have to take the trouble to subordinate in his mind the introductory prepositional phrase. Such an improvement in subordination is a very important part of skillful writing, and of this Thoreau was no doubt very well aware.

If Thoreau had written an essay, as Edgar Allen Poe did, attempting to explain his methods of composition, he could not have made them clearer than a study of the original Walden manuscript does. Much of the labor of the actual composition of Walden remains in the variant readings and the deletions and emendations of the manuscript, and a study of it is fruitful for those who are interested in the mechanics of composition as a whole, as well as in a study of Thoreau's own peculiarities as a writer.

## CHAPTER III.

### THOREAU'S REVISIONS

No study of Thoreau's methods of composition could have been made without some discussion of his revisions, since they are an essential part of his methods. But many details concerning the kinds of revisions, apparent reasons for them, their relative importance, and their relative success should be discussed more fully. That is the intention in this chapter.

#### Kinds of Revisions

There are two very common kinds of revisions in the Walden manuscript. One is that of rewriting whole passages without having marked out other versions of them. This occurs constantly, and some of these revisions are very drastic; others show practically no changes except in punctuation. It is more commonly found that they differ widely; yet here is a passage which was rewritten seven times, with no appreciable change in any of the versions:

Old deeds for old people and new deeds for new.  
Old people can hardly walk upstairs. In Types<sup>18</sup>

---

18. This reference may have resulted from Thoreau's reading Melville's Typee. In many other cases such references can be directly traced to his reading.

the young men can walk up a smooth cocoanut tree sixty feet high and bare of branches. Old people did not know enough once to keep the fire agoing. New people put a little dry wood under a pot, and are whirled round the globe with the speed of birds, as the phrase is. Age seems no better, hardly so well qualified as an instructor for youth, for it has not profited so much as it has lost.<sup>19</sup>

None of these versions is marked out, and none differs appreciably from the others except that in two of them the sentence "In Typee the young men can walk up a smooth cocoanut tree sixty feet high and bare of branches" is omitted. No explanation can be advanced for this particular type of repetition--and it is certainly more of a repetition than a revision.

The second of these two most common types of revision is that of marking out words, phrases, clauses, and occasionally a half page or so, and inserting others in their places. There are deletions and emendations on at least three-fourths of the pages of the manuscript which the writer has covered. A list of word and phrase emendations in the first variant reading will give some idea of the number of them in the manuscript as a whole:

---

19. This version is on an unnumbered fragment. Others are found on fragments 16, 18, and 20, and frames 16, 17 and 19.

TABLE II.  
WORD AND PHRASE DELETIONS AND EMENDATIONS IN VARIANT READING I,  
PARALLELING THE FIRST TEN PAGES OF THE TEXT

| Parallel Page and<br>Line in the Text | Manuscript--Variant Reading I.   |                                 |
|---------------------------------------|--|---------------------------------|
|                                       | Deletions  | Emendations <sup>20</sup>       |
| p. 1, ll. 24-25.                      | inserted   | retained                        |
| p. 2, l. 6.                           | that he give me  |                                 |
| p. 2, l. 7.                           | and not so much  | rather than                     |
| p. 2, l. 9.                           | and  | for                             |
| p. 2, l. 11.                          | this volume  | these pages                     |
| p. 2, l. 12.                          | the class of   |                                 |
| p. 2, l. 13.                          | of it  |                                 |
| p. 2, l. 15.                          | be of  | do                              |
| p. 2, l. 23.                          | should   |                                 |
| p. 2, l. 26.                          | seemed   | appeared                        |
| p. 2, l. 27.                          | curious  | remarkable                      |
| p. 4, l. 4.                           | and this   | which                           |
| p. 4, l. 27.                          | purser   | finer                           |
| p. 5, l. 4.                           | outward  |                                 |
| p. 5, l. 13-14.                       | are here tonight   | read this                       |
| p. 5, l. 17.                          | here   | to this page                    |
| p. 5, l. 20.                          | of it myself   |                                 |
| p. 6, l. 21.                          | he feels so cheap<br>that he could like<br>the dust under his<br>feet. |                                 |
| p. 6, l. 24.                          | himself  | his own opin-<br>ion of himself |

20. In a number of cases the manuscript is deleted but not emended. These are usually deletions of verbose words and phrases.

p. 7, l. 19.

it was not always  
sop. 7, l. 4.<sup>21</sup>

mankind

men

p. 8, l. 17.

There

Here

p. 8, l. 18.

and

but

p. 8, l. 27.

who

which

p. 9, l. 2.

before us

p. 9, l. 2.

Our

their

p. 9, l. 31.

are various

p. 10, l. 6.

Almost all that

the greater  
part of what

21. The sentences in the paragraph are turned around in the manuscript in this version according to the text; therefore to be correct the table has to be out of order here.

The nature of these changes is various. In Variant Reading 1 paralleling the first ten pages of Economy, twenty-eight word and phrase deletions and one clause deletion have been made. A few deletions of longer passages are not included here, because they are too cumbersome to fit into the table. For the twenty-nine deletions listed, there are only eighteen emendations. Reasons for the deletion of the clause can be only speculative, but every one of the remaining ten deletions has no emendation because the words were unnecessary or verbose; therefore omitting them is a definite improvement.

The other types of changes are usually improvements also, such as changing the coördinating word used from "and" to "for" in lines 5-11, page 2: "Moreover I, on my side, require of every writer, first and last, (that he give me) a simple and sincere account of his own life; some such account as he would send his kindred from a distant land; for if he has lived sincerely, it must have been in a distant land to me." Here again it is a question of the right degree of subordination. The sentence is fairly long and complicated; consequently omitting the unnecessary "that he give me" is also a good choice. To be sure, in fully one-fourth of the examples, Thoreau seems to be quibbling with himself over the choice of a word. He sometimes crossed a word out, wrote another in, crossed that one out, and then restored the original. A study of Table I will show several places where that happened. And who shall say whether "this volume" or "these pages" is better, unless it is a question



of repetition, which it does not happen to be? "Do good service" is slightly smoother than "be of good service". "Doing penance in a thousand curious ways", which is deleted, seems even more individual than "in a thousand remarkable ways", which is his final choice. "The slave of his own opinion of himself" is more accurate and effective than "the slave of himself", and the same is true in a lesser degree of "almost all that my neighbors call good," changed to "The greater part of what my neighbors call good." Some of Thoreau's deletions and emendations are changes from an ungrammatical word or phrase to a correct one, as "his oxen who jerk him along" changed to "his oxen which jerk him along." Sometimes, possibly because of fatigue or hurry, Thoreau had trouble with the agreement of a subject and its predicate. On frame 21 in the manuscript he has written "Let us consider what all this trouble and anxiety are about," but he changed it to "Let us consider what all this trouble and anxiety is about." It does not seem that he would have wished the reader to consider "trouble and anxiety" as collective. On frame 19, 20, a similar error occurs: "The very tedium and ennui which presumes to have exhausted the variety and joys of life is as old as Adam." He marked out "is" and substituted "are", but he never changed "presumes" to "presume." There are a number of such cases in the manuscript, but they do not occur an undue number of times if this manuscript was intended only as a first rough copy of the book. There are some misspellings, but not many.

For instance, he was wont to write "mayest" and then change it to "mayst." Through hurry, probably, he committed such errors as spelling woolen "wellen" and attaching a "d", making "and" out of "an"--the sort of thing that anyone will do at times. But there is conclusive evidence that he did not know where to place the apostrophe in "didn't" and "wasn't"; he constantly wrote them "did'nt" and "was'nt". Also, Thoreau was not consistent in his spelling of the "-ors"--they are both neighbour and neighbor, labour and labor, behaviour and behavior, in the manuscript. In the final text, the "-our" spelling is adopted consistently, although in the manuscript the "-or" spelling is the more frequent of the two. It is possible to multiply these examples indefinitely. On frame 24, Thoreau has written "and for the stucious, light stationary" without changing it. Later, in another variant reading, he has written "stationary", but changed the last "a" to an "e". However, the examples given here are a fair cross-section of the manuscript as a whole, and there is no need for dwelling on them longer.

Before concluding this study of deletions and emendations, it should be pointed out that Variant Reading 1 was used for the examples in Table II, because it is the only consecutive reading that there is. Other variant readings usually have more deletions and emendations, since they were practically always written before the last consecutive copy was. An example of Variant Reading 3 will serve to substantiate this point:

TABLE III.  
DELETIONS AND EMENDATIONS IN VARIANT READING III OF THE MANUSCRIPT  
(PAGES 9-12 OF THE TEXT)

| PARALLEL IN TEXT  |   | MANUSCRIPT--VARIANT READING III.  |   |
|-------------------|---|---|---|
| Place             | Phrase  | Deletion  | Emendation  |
| p. 9, l. 4.       | cared for   | done  | tried   |
| p. 9, l. 27.      | What distant<br>and different<br>beings   | yet   | How many contem-<br>porary (yet) in-<br>finitely more<br>distant and<br>different beings. |
| UNPUBLISHED       | ----  | star  | point   |
| UNPUBLISHED       | ----  | at  | ----  |
| p. 10, l. 6.      | informing   | startling   | informing   |
| p. 11, l. 11.     | careful   | provident   | careful   |
| p. 11, l. 11.     | It would be   | imagine   | I think it would<br>be.   |
| p. 11, 11. 13-14. | to learn what<br>are the gross<br>necessaries of<br>life.                                 | and what are<br>the gross<br>necessaries<br>of life   | ----  |
| p. 11, l. 13      | know  | know  | learn   |
| p. 11, l. 15.     | obtain  | supply  | obtain  |
| p. 11, l. 19.     | the improve-<br>ments of ages   | effect of<br>the ages   | improvement of<br>ages  |
| p. 11, 11. 20-21. | have had but<br>little influ-<br>ence on the<br>essential laws<br>of man's exist-<br>ence | do not carry<br>a man backward<br>or forward in<br>relation to the<br>facts of his ex-<br>istence | have but little<br>influence on the<br>essential laws<br>of our existence.                |
| p. 12, l. 16.     | with  | with at least   | with  |
| p. 12, l. 17.     | ----  | may (a repeti-<br>tion)   | ----  |
| NO PARALLEL       | ----  | From this list  | ----  |

This variant reading parallels approximately three and one half pages of the text, for only the first half of page twelve is covered. Ten pages of Variant Reading 1 contained twenty-nine deletions; three and one half pages of Variant Reading 2 contains fifteen. There is no second variant reading for the latter half of page twelve or for several pages following; therefore it was impossible to use a parallel number of pages in both tables. If the passage tabulated in Table III were the same length as that in Table II, it should have on the average of forty-five deletions to the twenty-nine in the first variant reading. This illustrates that there are more deletions in the earlier written variant readings of the manuscript than in the later consecutive copy, and dozens of similar illustrations can be found without much difficulty.

#### Apparent Reasons for Changes

Some explanations and possible reasons for Thoreau's revisions have been given in classifying them: where long passages are marked out and rewritten it is usually because he had more details and examples to add to the original idea, because he felt a need for greater unity, coherence and emphasis in certain paragraphs which were either choppy or contained irrelevant material, or because he was attempting to

make them, in various ways, more skillful expressions of his thoughts and more interesting pieces of literary composition. In other words, his revisions, on the whole, definitely improve the style of Walden. Sometimes, however, though not usually, he was over-zealous in this activity, and a few examples are found in which he did not improve his work and even made it worse. But there are far more examples of awkward phrasing and incomplete expression of ideas which have been changed into a smooth, interesting, sometimes even poetic, style. This was the chief purpose of the word and phrase deletions and emendations as well as the longer passages. By omitting verbiages, correcting mechanical errors of grammar, punctuation and spelling, and substituting the more exact and colorful word or phrase for the vague ones, he has, on the whole, brought about a remarkable and skillful improvement in the context of the manuscript. The most outstanding reason of all, then, for these revisions, is Thoreau's untiring desire and attempts to improve what he had written. Such a discovery adds greatly to one's regard for Thoreau's ability as a literary artist.

#### Importance of the Revisions

The revisions in the Walden manuscript are therefore

of intrinsic importance for three reasons. First of all is the reason which has already been advanced: that they actually improved the context a great deal. Secondly, there are, in the longer revisions, passages of varying length and varying quality which have never found their way into the standard text; perhaps because when he was ready to publish his work, Thoreau could not find some of these passages in his chaotic manuscript! And finally, in studying the manuscript in its present condition, one gains a knowledge of Thoreau's capacities and limitations as a literary artist which could not be gained in any other way.

## CHAPTER IV.

### UNPUBLISHED MANUSCRIPT

The discovery of unpublished manuscript was the most exciting though perhaps the most difficult feature of this study. It was difficult because so many times the subject matter was merely out of place in the manuscript rather than actually unpublished. If it had been out of place only within the scope of a few pages, even that would have simplified the study. But occasionally there were passages that could be found, in a developed form, forty or fifty pages later. Consequently, the only unpublished manuscript which the writer can be certain of before the study of the entire manuscript is completed are those which follow consecutive passages in the first 121 pages of the text, and are a development of the thoughts which are present there; and of these there are an ample number of illustrations.

#### Number and Length of Unpublished Passages

The unpublished passages vary greatly in length, from part of a sentence to several pages. None over two to five pages in longhand have been discovered yet. Those consisting

of one to five sentences are too numerous to estimate; but from the longer ones discovered in the first 622 frames of the manuscript, there are possibly between sixty and seventy in all 1,201 frames, though it is possible that there are longer ones.

The short unpublished passages are both numerous and interesting. Here is one which contains the subject matter found on page 9 of the text:

How many contemporary (yet)<sup>22</sup> infinitely more distant and different beings may be contemplating yonder fine twinkling (star)<sup>23</sup> point (at)<sup>24</sup> this moment--an eye in Orion--an eye in Lyra--the eye of Omniscience itself. There is always the possibility of being thus related to the whole by our lives, and of being one with it, or of remaining, as it were[, ] an(d)<sup>25</sup> isolated particle in the universe.<sup>26</sup>

The unpublished part consists of a sentence and a half, since there is a parallel for the material down to the first dash. The parallel in the text reads as follows:

What different and distant beings in the various mansions of the universe are contemplating the same one at the same moment.<sup>27</sup>

The passage is an inspirational one, and the unpublished

- 
- 22. Deleted.
  - 23. Deleted.
  - 24. Deleted.
  - 25. The "d" placed on "an" in the manuscript is obviously a mistake.
  - 26. Frame 19,20 of the manuscript.
  - 27. Walden, Op. Cit. p. 9, ll. 27-29.



portion adds to its effectiveness, since it is both well worded and an unusual idea. It has never been published probably because Thoreau may have used some other variant reading in which it was omitted for his final draft, since there are several variant readings to this passage. Yet there are other unpublished passages with more than one variant reading in the manuscript, which are not included in the text, and so it is unlikely that they were all omitted through the choice of a variant reading without the unpublished part. The reason may sometimes be that they are inferior in quality, but that is not always true. For the second paragraph in the text there are four variant readings, and of these, two contain an unpublished passage of about twenty lines. If Thoreau used this manuscript in making his final copy of Walden, he must have at least come across this passage, and there seems to be no obvious reason for excluding the unpublished part. It may be of interest to show the two variant readings of this unpublished portion:

I require of a writer that he give me a simple and sincere account of his own life, what he has done and thought, not so much what he has heard of other men's lives--some such account as he would send his kindred from a distant land,--and if he has lived sincerely, it must have been in a distant land to me,<sup>28</sup> describing ever his outward circumstances and what adventures he has had, as well as

28. There is a parallel to this passage in the text up to this point (cf. page 2). It has been included for the sake of continuity.

his thoughts and feelings about them--(I want him to)<sup>29</sup> That he give me that which is most precious to him, not his life's blood but even that from which his life's blood circulated--what he has got by living. If anything has yielded him pleasure or instruction, let him communicate it. Let the money-getter tell us how much he loves wealth, and what means he takes to accumulate it. (He must describe those facts which he knows and loves better than anybody else.)<sup>30</sup> He (must)<sup>31</sup> should not write on Foreign Missions. The mechanic will naturally write about his trade, the farmer about his farm, and every man about that which he, (Compared with other men)<sup>32</sup> understands better than (other men)<sup>33</sup> others. Yet incredible mistakes are made. I have heard an owl lecture with a perverse show of learning (upon)<sup>34</sup> on the solar microscope (and)<sup>35</sup> or Chanticleere [sic.] (upon)<sup>36</sup> on nebulous stars, when both (ought to have)<sup>37</sup> naturally should have been sound asleep, the one in a hollow tree, the other upon his roost.<sup>38</sup>

The second draft is obviously a later one, for it is not as marked out and changed as the one above.

...for if he has lived sincerely it must have been in a distant land to me--<sup>39</sup> describing ever his outward circumstances and what adventures he has had, as well as his thoughts and

- 
- 29. Deleted.
  - 30. Deleted.
  - 31. Deleted.
  - 32. Deleted.
  - 33. Deleted.
  - 34. Deleted.
  - 35. Deleted.
  - 36. Deleted.
  - 37. Deleted.
  - 38. Consult frame 8.
  - 39. Paralleled in the text.

feelings about them. If anything has yielded him pleasure, or instruction, let him communicate it. Let the money-getter when he takes up the pen tell how much he loves wealth, and what means he takes to accumulate it. He should not write on Foreign Missions. The mechanic will naturally write about his trade, the farmer about his farm, and every man about that which he understands better than others, that is, his own affairs. Yet incredible mistakes are made; I have heard an owl lecture with a perverse show of learning on the solar microscope and Chanticleere on nebulous stars, when both should naturally have been asleep, the owl in a hollow tree, the other upon his roost.<sup>40</sup>

The former of the two versions seems the more effective, even though the latter is the emended copy and obviously the one which Thoreau intended to use. The quality of the passage is equal to that which precedes and follows it in the text. A few of the unpublished passages are nevertheless somewhat incoherent, as the following shows:

To show how little men have considered what is the true end of life--or the nature of things living which they have to get--I need only remind you how many within the last month started for California with the muck rake on their shoulders. According to the precepts of the received catechism--as if our life were a farce and God had cast down one of his handfuls of time, beckoning to the mountains of California for men to scramble for.<sup>41</sup>

It would be difficult to say just what Thoreau really intended to express in this paragraph, the ideas are so jumbled. It is little wonder that such passages are omitted

---

40. Consult frames 2, 8 and 3, 9.

41. This paragraph is on an unnumbered frame. Two phases of it are found later in the text.

from the text, even though parts of them are interesting.

Many of the unpublished passages seem to consist of examples, either wholly or in part. The unpublished passages which have been quoted so far all contain examples of some point which Thoreau has made in the text. The same is true of the one which is omitted from page 7 of the text. The teamster who drives for Squire Make-a-Stir seems to be Thoreau's classic example of the desperation of man, but originally he also had others, which he developed in varying degrees in different versions of the same passage:

I remember to have once met a particularly wretched man in our streets, asking for a lodging, whom it was almost no pleasure to befriend he was so helpless. He had come all the way from New York on foot, seeking work, but he did not know where he was at any time, only, perchance, that he had travelled thirty miles that day, when three would have done as well. He thought that he had seriously injured himself by lying out, but he was more seriously injured before. He could do work about a stable, but declared in a disconsolate voice that there was no work for him, as if the fates had a spite against him. I saw by his face that he was only a more desperate man than usual, whose whole life was a crime, who was endeavoring to escape from himself, but for once, derived no amusement from the method which he had chosen. He felt that nobody wished to employ him or would respect him, because he knew that he was unworthy to be employed, and did not respect himself; and thus he had come two hundred and fifty miles in a straight line, with desperate steps, offering himself, with a down look, (to do stable)<sup>42</sup> anticipating failure, to do stable work at such stable yards

---

42. Deleted.

as this path happened to intersect, doing his part, as he would fain have believed, toward getting work; but the truth was, he merely wished to convince the fates that he was willing to do his part, when he was not. And so, judging from his direction, he would go on, if his constitution held out, to the Gulf of St. Lawrence, where he would probably jump in. I knew very well that he was not the only man who had not succeeded in getting work.<sup>43</sup>

No part of this passage is published, yet it is found in the manuscript in six different versions, and none of them is marked out. Four are about half as long as this one; the remaining one is even longer and contains several additional examples:

We were astonished to meet away up here in New Hampshire an Italian with a hand organ, so far from Rome, for no youth has yet been born here who could bring his mind to follow this kind of life.

(Here was also)<sup>44</sup> I once met a poor wretch asking for lodging, whom it was almost no pleasure to befriend he was so helpless. He said that he came from New York and was seeking work. He did not know where he lodged the night before, nor where he was then, but asked "What place is this now?" He only knew that he had travelled 30 miles that day. He could do work about a stable, but he declared in a disconsolate voice that there was no work for him, as if the fates had a spite against him. He thought that he had seriously injured himself by lying out.

I asked him why he had travelled so far in a day, and farther each successive day--if he was any better off at night than in the morning? --Why 3 miles would not do as well as 30 and better. He allowed that I had the right of it. I concluded that he was a desperate man, who had committed some crime, who was endeavoring to

43. Frame 14, 15 is the only one of the three frames which this passage occupies that is numbered.

44. Deleted.

escape from himself. He travelled far superficially because he would not budge an inch in the direction of (reform and)<sup>45</sup> a good conscience. He thought that nobody wished to employ (or would respect him, because he felt himself unfit to be employed and did not respect himself.)<sup>46</sup> he was conscious that he was unworthy.<sup>47</sup> If he could have had one half hour of sanity he would have found a job at the next door, and all the world would have appeared (kind to him)<sup>48</sup> his friend.

He had travelled 250 miles from New York in a straight line with desperate steps, 25 or 30 miles a day, offering himself with a down look anticipating failure, to do stable work in such stable yards as that radius happened to intersect, doing his part, as he would fain have believed, toward getting work--but there was none for him. He only wished to convince the fates that he was willing to do his part when he knew that he was not. And so he would go on if his constitution held out to the Gulf of St. Lawrence, where he would probably jump in. It never occurred to him how few stable yards might \*\*\*<sup>49</sup> or that a shorter radius describing a circle might have advantages.

It is the sum of all wisdom not to do desperate things.<sup>50</sup>

From the desperate city you go into the desperate country and have to console yourself with the bravery of minks and muskrats.<sup>51</sup>

Sadi tells who may travel--among others--"A common mechanic who can earn a subsistence by the

---

45. Deleted.

46. Deleted.

47. The sentence which is not deleted here is incoherent. Perhaps Thoreau forgot that he had broken into the middle of a sentence; yet he did not capitalize the first word after the deletion.

48. Deleted.

49. One word illegible.

50. This paragraph is uninterrupted, but the sentence which is separated from the remainder of the passage is found in the text, p. 7, ll. 6-8.

51. From this point on the passage is not published.

industry of his hand, and shall not have to stake his reputation for every morsel of bread, as philosophers have said."

He may travel who can subsist on the wild fruit and game of the country.

A man may travel fast enough and earn his living on the road. I have frequently been applied to to do work when on a journey--to do tinkering and repair clocks when I had a knapsack on my back. A man applied to me once to go into a factory stating condition and wages, observing that I succeeded in shutting the window of a railroad car, when the other passengers had failed. "Hast thou not heard of a Sufi, who was hammering some nails into the soul[sic.] of his sandal; an officer of cavalray [sic.] took him by the sleeve, saying, come along, and shoe my horse." (But this admits of a higher application.)<sup>52</sup> Farmers have asked me to assist them when I was passing their fields--(one)<sup>53</sup> A man once applied to me to mend his umbrella, taking me for an umbrella mender, because, being on a journey, I carried an umbrella in my hand while the sun shone. (And)<sup>54</sup> Another (applied to me)<sup>55</sup> wished to buy a tin cup, observing that I had one strapped to my belt, and a saucepan on my back. There are many ways in which a man can live on the road without carrying a barrel organ.<sup>56</sup>

Perhaps these examples are unnecessary in the text as illustrations of the philosophical point he makes in the first complete paragraph on page 7, but they are nevertheless amusing and entertaining.

Another example which could have been inserted on page 13 of the text is found in one variant reading of the

---

52. Deleted.

53. Deleted.

54. Deleted.

55. Deleted.

56. Two of the frames containing this passage are not numbered; the remainder is on frame 15.

manuscript. Whereas the examples in the text are brought to a conclusion by Thoreau's insertion "but so much for the analogy", there is an added example:

Samuel Laing, who is a good authority on (such a subject)<sup>57</sup> this subject; says that "The Laplander in his skin dress, and a skin bag which he puts over his head and shoulders, will sleep night after night on the snow in the fields, an unusual table land in Norway [,] in a degree of cold which would extinguish the life of one exposed to it in any wollen [sic.] clothing." And yet he adds "They are not hardier than other people." He had seen them asleep under these circumstances.<sup>58</sup>

Usually when such examples definitely follow others or discuss a thought which is in the text, Thoreau never uses them in later passages. But this one is an exception, because it is fitted into page 29, at the very beginning of the division on Shelter, whereas it was originally written for page 13. Such examples illustrate the difficulty of finding passages that are actually unpublished; even examples written to illustrate one portion of the text are sometimes transferred and used for other portions. This passage was of course thought to be unpublished until it was found in the text.

An entire paragraph which was originally inserted between the two paragraphs after the break on page 11

---

57. Deleted.

58. Consult frame 23,25 of the manuscript. The parallel for this passage in the text is found on page 29, ll. 4-11.



has been omitted from the text, and from some of the variant readings in the manuscript. However, there is one in which it is included. Thoreau may have chosen to omit it because it carries one away from the main thought at hand; though it develops the more subordinate thought which closes the first complete paragraph on page 11; that is, the same paragraph which precedes it in the manuscript.

I do not here affirm the unchangeableness of the past, while I affirm infinite changeableness of the future; but we can see farther into the future with the evidence of faith, than into the shallower past, with the evidence of history; and we expect from the future changes to be paralleled only, perchance, by experiences which the race has forgotten. He is the wisest schemer whose scheme will be the latest to succeed. The greatest discoverers have not to fear that any will infringe on their patents during their lives.<sup>69</sup>

The thoughts are rather vaguely stated and combined in this Whitmanesque paragraph, and that may be an additional reason why it is not included in the text.

This same variant reading contains another more skillfully written unpublished passage which should be inserted after "None of the brute creation requires more than Food and Shelter," page 12, ll. 2-3. It is a digression, and the introductory phrase, "However this may be," inserted before

---

59. Frame 21.

the sentence which immediately follows the one just quoted, is further illustration that it is. Nevertheless, it is well written and interesting.

Perhaps man was also at first a mere animal in these respects, and the Nature which produced him was so genial that he wanted only food to sustain his life, and this was almost completely provided and prepared for him, like the albumen which surrounds the young bird in the egg. (On which supposition)<sup>60</sup> But, after the lapse of geological periods, Nature grown less fond, though not less kind, drove him from her breast, and is still driving him, with increasing sternness and coldness, as some assert, and is gradually weaning her child. He must earn his living at last by the sweat of his brow, that is, the exercise of his brain, in other words, the development of his reason. If he would maintain his position on the earth, he must build, and hunt, and weave, and fell, and mine. What was the effort of reason in ancient man has become, in a degree, instinct in their posterity, while, perchance, the seeds of new instincts still are being planted today.<sup>61</sup>

The passages given seem a fair cross-section of the unpublished portions of the manuscript. There can be no doubt left that some of them are very worthwhile indeed, though others are inferior to the material found in the standard text. Why, then, are they unpublished? In some cases, it may be because they are irrelevant to the material in which they are placed or digressions on some minor topic in the paragraph just preceding them in the manuscript. A few of them are unquestionably inferior and undeveloped.

---

60. Deleted.

61. Frames 21, 22.

Yet in the majority of cases, their quality is as good as that of practically any passage in the text. In such cases, why they did not find their way into the text is a mystery. It does not seem likely that Thoreau would have overlooked all of them or purposely omitted all of them. Therefore any reasons advanced as to why Thoreau chose to disregard them and why they have not been published can be only speculative. Reasons for the omission of most of the shorter passages are clearer. Thoreau had the good taste to omit many of his personal references: in the final text all of the names which he includes in the manuscript are deleted, and therefore his comments are made less personal and proportionately in better taste. Reasons for the other omissions have already been advanced.

#### Literary Importance of these Passages

The unpublished portions of the manuscript do not seem, on the whole, inferior to the quality of the text. Not only are they as good; in many instances they develop ideas found in the text in a very interesting manner. Among the unpublished passages not quoted here, there are several quotations from Andrew Laing and discussions of them by Thoreau. These give the reader an idea where Thoreau gained some of his inspiration; for frequently his reading is the starting point of his thoughts. For instance,

his idea concerning the mechanic talking about his trade may have grown out of the quotation from Sadi on page 39, and his reference to the young men of Typee may have resulted from his reading Melville's Typee.

The unpublished passages are therefore of considerable literary importance because many of them are well written, most of them add to the material given in the text, and they expand one's knowledge of Thoreau and his methods of composition.

## CHAPTER V.

### CONCLUSION--WHAT THIS STUDY HAS REVEALED

Numerous illustrations have justified the assumption that the variations between the Walden manuscript and the Walden text provide an interesting and valuable study of Thoreau's methods of composition. These variations have made possible a study of the thinking process which was necessary to the organization of whole passages: how Thoreau often wrote short, choppy paragraphs and then combined them into longer, more coherent ones; how sentences are rearranged in paragraphs so that they are more emphatic and unified; how verbose passages are condensed into more concise and sometimes even pithy statements; how he gradually deleted and emended, by many revisions, crude and sentimental expressions; and how whole chapters grew out of single paragraphs jotted down "helter-skelter."

To anyone who is interested in studying the actual process of creative writing, this manuscript provides a wealth of material. It reveals clearly one author's consistencies and inconsistencies, both in the mechanics of composition and in the more difficult process of organizing thought as a whole. For that reason it is fortunate that the manuscript remains in its present unorganized form, though it is a real challenge to anyone who wishes to piece together the whole of it.

Where it was necessary, significant and valuable changes which Thoreau made in his manuscript have been tabulated and discussed, and, where it was possible, reasons have been suggested for them. Thoreau rewrote portions of his manuscript as many as twelve and thirteen times in a tireless effort to improve what he had written. Mr. Canby suggests that Thoreau was trying to produce a book that would sell rather than write for his own enjoyment as so many critics have thought. This belief may go a long way in explaining the many revisions which Thoreau made in his manuscript, although it cannot be doubted that as a literary artist he was a perfectionist, just as he was in his endeavors as carpenter, pencil-maker, and naturalist. The extreme variations in many parts of the manuscript illustrate the limits to which he went in his efforts for improvement. These revisions can be considered of utmost importance for two reasons: they reveal Thoreau's achievements and limitations as a literary artist, and they actually improve the context of Walden.

The discovery of unpublished portions of the manuscript has been the most challenging part of the study. One has to familiarize himself completely with the subject matter in Walden before he can be sure that many of these passages are actually unpublished; they may be merely

misplaced in the manuscript. For example, there are some paragraphs concerning architecture among the earliest frames of the manuscript; yet they do not fit into the text until fifty pages later, and then Thoreau has revised them so much that they are scarcely recognizable. Nevertheless, there are many parts of the manuscript which are actually unpublished, consisting mostly of isolated paragraphs and short passages here and there, which may have been omitted from the present text because Thoreau chose some other variant reading of that portion. A very few of these unpublished passages were several pages in length, but more frequently they are sentences and short paragraphs. A few of the most interesting portions of the text have been deleted by Thoreau himself. For the most part, even when these were unpublished, the writer has considered them as deletions.

This study has made possible a keener appreciation of Thoreau's literary intentions, limitations, and achievements. A close study of the original Walden manuscript makes Walden an even more delightful book, even though it reveals many crudities which are not present in the edited text. It shows Thoreau's untiring desire to improve what he had written, and, in many places, a fine ability to criticise and revise his own work. The limitations of his ability as a composer show

up clearly here, as they do not in the text; yet his achievements, which overshadow his faults, are likewise made apparent.

### New Light on Thoreau

Most of the facts concerning Thoreau's methods of composition and his literary achievements and limitations have been discussed. Much remains to be said concerning the more personal values gained in this study: the inspirational passages Thoreau has written, and the clever things he has said. In learning to know the artist one learns to know the man; perhaps not all of him, but at least an important part. Most of his critics have said that the really worthwhile part of Thoreau is what he has written, and that as a friend or acquaintance he could probably be very exasperating. Some of the details of the latter part of his friendship with Emerson seem to substantiate that point of view. However that may be, it is impossible to finish the study of his manuscript without liking Thoreau, although he can be trying in his ideas and in his methods of composition.

### New Light on Walden

After a study like this one, a person is likely to feel that Thoreau is Walden and Walden is Thoreau, however unelucidative that may seem. However, the "oneness" of



his life and beliefs is very clear, and it is remarkable that one as provincial as he, could at the same time be as all-inclusive: he consciously narrowed his existence by excluding most people from it and by limiting his habits of living; at the same time he was the philosopher who visualized "an eye in Orion, an eye in Lyra" looking at the same star that he was looking at in a given moment!

To copy and to piece together page after page of Thoreau's manuscript is to think, to some extent anyway, as he thought. It may be even to feel as he felt. That, in the final analysis, is one of the important parts in any literary study. On the more factual side, however, one also sees Walden more clearly than ever before. The details of thinking become clearer, and the work which is behind them more understood. Many details which are not in the text are found in the manuscript, and many of the ideas in the text which one is interested to hear more about, are exemplified and expanded in the manuscript.

#### Need for a Variorum Edition

It has been indicated how widely some of the versions in the manuscript differ from those in the text, and how some of these variations are actually improvements over some portions of the text. An edition which reveals the

many interesting parallel readings and indicates unpublished parts of Walden will therefore be of inestimable value to the Thoreau scholar, and, it would seem, to the student of American literature. Walden cannot be known in its entirety until such an edition is produced.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

## Primary Sources

Thoreau, Henry D., Walden or Life in the Woods, Modern Readers' Series, The Macmillan Company, New York, 1929.

The Walden Manuscript, 35 mm. microfilm purchased by Bowling Green State University from the Huntington Library, San Marino, California.

## Secondary Sources

## Books

Atkinson, J. Brooks, Henry Thoreau, The Cosmic Yankee, Alfred A. Knopf, New York, 1927.

Bazalgette, Leon, Henry Thoreau, Bachelor of Nature, translated by Van Wyck Brooks, Harcourt Brace and Company, New York, 1924.

Canby, Henry S., Classic Americans, Harcourt Brace and Company, New York, 1931.

Thoreau, Houghton Mifflin Company, Boston, 1939.

Hawthorne, Hildegard, Concord's Happy Rebel, Henry David Thoreau, Longmans Green and Company, New York, 1940.

More, Paul E., Shelburne Essays, "A Hermit's Notes on Thoreau", G. P. Putnam's Sons, New York, 1904.  
Shelburne Essays, fifth series, "Thoreau's Journal," G. P. Putnam's Sons, New York, 1908.

Sanborn, Franklin B., Henry D. Thoreau, Houghton Mifflin and Company, Boston, 1882.

Van Doren, Mark, Henry David Thoreau, a critical study, Houghton Mifflin and Company, Boston, 1916.

## Magazines

## Signed Articles

Adams, R., "Thoreau's Literary Apprenticeship," Studies in Philology, Vol. XXVI, pp. 617-629 (October, 1932).

Brooks, Van Wyck, "Thoreau, Master of Simplicity," Readers Digest, Vol. XXI, pp. 25-29 (May, 1937).

- Burroughs, John, "A Critical Glance into Thoreau," Atlantic, Vol. CXXIII, pp. 777-86 (June, 1919).
- Canby, Henry S., "American Challenge, A Study of Walden," Saturday Review of Literature, Vol. XX, pp. 10-12 (September 2, 1929).
- "Back to Walden," Catholic World, Vol. CXXXIV, pp. 478-80 (January, 1932).
- "The Man Who Did What He Wanted," Saturday Review of Literature, Vol. XV, pp. 3-4 (December 26, 1936).
- "Thoreau and the Machine Age," Yale Review, Vol. XX, pp. 517-31 (March, 1931).
- "Thoreau and Women," Saturday Review of Literature, Vol. XXIII, p. 9 (November 9, 1940).
- "Thoreau in Search of a Public," American Scholar, Vol. VIII, No. 4, pp. 531-44 (October, 1939).
- "Thoreau, the Great Eccentric," Saturday Review of Literature, Vol. IV, pp. 337-9 (November 26, 1927).
- "Two Women, Strange Romances in the Life of the Walden Recluse," North American, Vol. CCKLVIII, No. 1, pp. 18-32 (September, 1939).
- Cournos, J., "Hater of Shams; in jail with Thoreau and his thoughts," Century, Vol. CXVI, pp. 140-6 (June, 1928).
- "Gauguin and Thoreau: a comparison," Bookman, Vol. XIV, pp. 11-13 (August, 1926).
- Cushing, C. P., "Thoreau, Bachelor of Nature," Mentor, Vol. XIV, pp. 548-51 (July, 1928).
- Gleason, H. W., "Winter Rambles in Thoreau's Country," National Geographic, Vol. XXXVII, pp. 165-80 (February, 1920).
- Hurd, H. E., "Henry D. Thoreau, Pioneer in the Field of Education," Education, Vol. XLIX, pp. 372-6 (February, 1929).
- Ingersoll, E., "American Naturalists," Mentor, Vol. VII, pp. 5-7 (June 15, 1919).
- Jones, S. A., "Biographers of Thoreau," Lippincott's, Vol. XLVIII, p. 224.

59  
Keiser, A., "New Thoreau Material," Modern Language, Vol. XLIV, pp. 263-4 (April, 1929).

"Thoreau's Manuscript on the Indians," Journal of German and English Philology, Vol. XXVII, pp. 183-99 (April, 1928).

Krutch, Joseph H., "Walden Revisited," Nation, Vol. CXXXVI, pp. 506-507 (May 3, 1933).

Lewis, S., "One Man Revolution," Saturday Review of Literature, Vol. XVII, p. 19 (December 11, 1937).

McAtee, H. L., "Adaptionist Melvete, Exemplified by Quotations from the Journal of H. D. Thoreau," Scientific Monthly, Vol. XLVIII, pp. 253-5 (March, 1938).

Merley, Christopher, "Granules from an Hourglass," Saturday Review of Literature, Vol. IV, p. 886 (May 19, 1928).

Munson, G. B., "Dionysian in Concord," Outlook, Vol. CXLIX, pp. 690-2 (August 29, 1928).

Peattie, D. C., "Is Thoreau a Modern?" North American, Vol. CCXLV, No. 1, pp. 159-69 (March, 1938).

Powys, L., "Thoreau, A Disparagement," Bookman, Vol. LXIX, pp. 163-5 (April, 1929).

Sanborn, F. B., "Thoreau and Confucius," Nation, Vol. XC, p. 481 (May 12, 1910).

Shepard, Odell, "Paradox of Thoreau," Scribner's, Vol. LXVIII, pp. 335-42 (September, 1920).

Stanley, H. M., "Thoreau as a Prose Writer," Dial, Vol. XXI, p. 179.

Stewart, C. D., "A Word for Thoreau," Atlantic, Vol. CLVI, pp. 335-42 (September, 1920).

Tomlinson, H. M., "Two Americans and a Whale," Harper, Vol. CLII, pp. 618-21 (April, 1926).

Wade, J. S., "Friendship of Two Old Time Naturalists," Scientific Monthly, Vol. XXIII, pp. 152-160 (August, 1926).

"Henry Thoreau and his Journal," Nature, Vol. X, pp. 53-4 (July, 1927).

60

White, E. B., "One Man's Meat," Harper, Vol. CLXXIX, pp. 329-32 (August, 1939).

Zahniser, H., "Indoors and Out, Recent Books on Thoreau," Nature, Vol. XXXII, p. 551 (December, 1939).

#### Unsigned Articles

"An Estimate," Arena, Vol. XXI, p. 489.

"Biographical Note on Walden," American Literature, Vol. II, pp. 166-8 (May, 1930).

"Thoreau as a Born Supernaturalist," Current Opinion, Vol. LXVII, p. 44 (July, 1919).

"Thoreau on The Kindly Relations," Scribners, Vol. LXVII, p. 379 (March, 1920).

61

## APPENDIX

There was more than  
Addressed to my former  
Kath

P. 7  
I should not presume to talk  
so much about myself and my affairs  
as I shall in this ~~little~~ <sup>book</sup> of very hasty  
and personal ~~remarks~~ <sup>remarks</sup> had not been  
made concerning my mode of life,  
what some would call impertinent, but  
they are by no means impertinent to me,  
but on the contrary very natural and  
pertinent considering the circumstances.  
Some have wished to know what I got  
to eat - If I did not feel kind &  
lonesome - If I was not afraid - What  
I should do if I were taken sick - and  
the like. Others have been inquisitive  
to know what portion of my income I  
devoted to charitable purposes, & some  
who have large families, how or how  
poor children I maintained. ~~Some~~

~~have not come any longer. Because I loved them -- better than I do now. But I loved them -- better than I do now. Because I loved them -- better than I do now.~~

After I lectured <sup>to my class</sup> last winter  
I heard that some had expected that I  
would answer ~~these questions~~ these questions  
in my lecture - So I will do so



P. 17 farmer says to me  
you ~~say~~ you can't live on vegetable  
food solely, for it furnishes nothing to  
make bones with - and so religiously de-  
votes a part of his day to supplying his  
system with the <sup>raw</sup> material of bones,  
all the while <sup>to him</sup> walking behind his own  
wheeled vegetable-made bones, <sup>himself</sup> yester-  
day lumbering blough along through every obstacle.  
Some things are really necessities, <sup>in some</sup> some  
circles, the most helpless and diseased which  
in others are luxuries, <sup>in others</sup> - and in others still  
are entirely unknown.

I know a robust and hearty mother who thinks that  
her son who died abroad came to his end  
by living too low, as she has since learned  
that he drank only water.

I heard of a very poor family in Sicily  
this winter which would have starved  
if it had not been for potatoes -  
and tea and coffee. omit

Nature and human life are as various, as our  
several experiences, as our constitutions are  
various. Who shall say what prospect life offers to  
another? Could a greater miracle take place than  
if we should look through each other's eyes for an  
instant? We should live in all the ages of the  
world in an hour, and in all the worlds of  
the ages. History - poetry - Mythology! I know  
I was casting of a mother's experience as ineffably  
grand and ~~instructive~~ <sup>informing</sup> as this would be.

Over the river in the afternoon I sat with me, looking out  
had with me, as I was.

1830

To anticipate not the future & the plan  
merely but of possible nature herself. How  
many mornings before yet summer breaks  
before yet any man was stirring about  
his business I have been about mine. No  
doubt some of my readers have met  
me returning from this enterprise, farmers  
starting for Boston in the twilight, &  
woodchoppers going to their work. To  
be sure I never visited the sun ma-  
terially in his rising - but ~~it was~~ <sup>readers</sup> it was  
of the last importance and to the present of  
it. <sup>How many an afternoon has been stolen from more profitable if not more</sup>  
<sup>attractive industry, & how many a good sum of custom might have been expected</sup>  
<sup>on the main street, tempting all woman kind out a shopping, & what I say, say</sup>  
<sup>may be in the meadows, & the meadows in the well high hopeless, & the</sup>  
<sup>the river eye & country</sup>  
I went outside the town, trying to hear what  
was in the wind, to hear and carry it  
express. I felt high mark all my capital  
in it, and look my own breast in the  
bargain, running in the face of  
it - but concerned either of the <sup>political</sup> practice  
depended upon it - it would have appeared  
in the Gazette with the earliest  
intelligence -

At other times, watching from the ob-  
servatory of the cliffs, some tree-

to telegraph arm <sup>new arrival</sup> <sup>provisional</sup>  
<sup>it being of the new form for the time, that I might call something of the same</sup>  
<sup>congratulate me on a little progress, & that I might be able to do again of the same</sup>  
<sup>of the editor has been not seen fit to print my article, & I have</sup>  
<sup>of no very wide circulation, and, as I too</sup>  
<sup>common, I got only my business for my labor</sup>  
<sup>labor</sup>

13 who <sup>read this</sup> ~~are here tonight~~ are unable  
to pay for all the dinners you  
have actually eaten, or for the  
coats and shoes which are fast  
wearing on <sup>are</sup> already worn out, and  
have come <sup>to this page</sup> ~~base~~ <sup>to spend</sup> borrowed  
time, robbing your creditors for  
now.

It is very evident what  
mean and sneaking lives many  
of you live, <sup>for we have had some experience of it myself</sup> always on the limits,  
trying to get into business and trying  
to get out of debt, a very ancient  
struggle, called by the Latins des  
alienum another man, for some  
of their coins were made of brass,  
still living and dying and be-  
~~tried by this other man~~ <sup>tried by this other man</sup> always  
promising to pay — promising to  
pay — to-morrow — and dying to-day  
insolvent. — Seeking to  
carry favor, to get custom by low  
mean modes, not state prison  
offences — going, fluttering, voting,  
contracting yourselves into a sub-  
shell of civility, or dilating into  
an atmosphere of thin and vaporous



every favor, to get custom, by  
how many modes, only not state  
prison offences - lying flattering  
voting - contracting yourselves  
into a mesh of civility, or  
dilating into an atmosphere of

Thin and vaporous generosity,  
That you may persuade your neigh-  
bor to let you make his shoes or his  
hat or his coat or his carriage,  
or import his groceries for him. Making  
yourselves sick that you may lay  
up something against a sick day -  
something to be tucked away in an  
old chest, or in a stocking behind  
the plastering, or more safely, in the  
brick bank - no matter where, no  
matter how much or how little.

P. 114 I sometimes wonder how  
we can be so frivolous almost as  
to attend to the gross form of  
Negro slavery, there are so many  
keen and subtle matters that  
enslave both north and south.  
It is bad to have a southern  
overseer, it is worse to have a northern  
one, but worst of all when you are  
~~yourself~~ the slave-driver of your race.  
Ancient books, and some modern.

[illegible]

~~There is~~ ~~divine~~? How good-like, how  
immortal is he? Very like to  
god! See how he cowers and  
sweats, how vaguely and indefi-  
nitely all the day he fears, not  
being immortal nor divine, but  
the slave and prisoner of his own  
opinion of himself - a fame  
won by his own deeds. Public  
opinion is a weak tyrant compared  
with private opinion. What a man  
thinks of himself, that it is which  
determines or rather indicates  
his fate.

When we consider, to use  
the word of the catechism,  
~~what is~~ the chief end of man,  
and the true necessities and  
means of life; it appears only



that would sprinkle fertile rain upon  
their fields - what old people say  
you can't do, you try and find  
that you can. Age seems no  
better - hardly as well qualified for  
an instructor to youth, for it has  
not prospered so much as it has  
lost. <sup>(It is very true that this school has been a very</sup>  
<sup>great blessing to the people of the valley, but old people all</sup>  
<sup>over the valley are now dead, and new people</sup>  
they have left the river safely and  
old people can hardly get up the river, and  
improving for that a way is being made  
in some places and several others  
things are left out and are left out  
leave the hanging men because they  
have not got accustomed to that way  
of thinking.

P. 18 The whole ground of human life seems  
to have been gone on before us by  
our procession, both the heights & the  
valleys, and all things, & have been conducted  
by the people has even left di-  
rections how we should cut our trails  
w.e. even with the ends of the fingers  
neither longer nor shorter. ~~even~~ The very  
education and curriculum which presumes  
to have exhausted the variety of the joys  
of life is as old as Adam.

But man's capacities have never been  
measured, nor as we judge of what  
he can do by any precedent, or little  
ever been tried.



R39 be good <sup>but it is the object of the project</sup> policy to <sup>improve the harbor</sup> dredge it. It is  
a good port, and a good <sup>harbor</sup> ~~fin~~ <sup>foundation</sup>. No <sup>other</sup> ~~other~~ <sup>marshes</sup> to be  
filled; ~~though I suppose~~ <sup>though I suppose</sup> you must  
everywhere build on piles, if you are  
driving. It is said that a flood  
tide, with a westerly wind, and ice in  
the Neva, would sweep St. Peters-  
burg from the face of the earth.

R36 As this business is to be  
entered into without the usual cap-  
ital, it may not be easy to con-  
jecture where ~~those~~ <sup>such</sup> means ~~that~~ <sup>will</sup>  
be indispensable to every under-  
taking, were to be obtained.

As for clothing, to come at once  
to the practical part of the question  
perhaps we are influenced by the  
love of novelty, and a regard for  
the opinion of men, in procuring  
it, than by a true utility. ~~It~~  
~~was no doubt the strongest argu-~~  
~~ment against the faith of the Mil-~~  
~~lener, that most of them contin-~~  
~~ued to build and accumulate prop-~~  
~~erty as to be prepared in case~~  
~~the world should not come to pass.~~

Talk of a divinity in man! Look at  
 the teamster on the high way vend-  
 ing & marketing by day or night.  
 Does any divinity stir within him?  
 He rolls out of his cradle into a  
 four and twenty and goes at once  
 to look after his team, his fodder &  
 water his horses, without standing  
 aghast at his position. What are  
 life immortal & the destiny of man  
 to him, compared with the trif-  
 ling interests? What does he  
 care for his creator? Does not he  
 drive for Squire Make-a-thin?  
 — How godlike how immortal  
 is he? — See how he covers and  
 sneaks, how vaguely and indef-  
 initely all the day he fears, not  
 being immortal nor divine, but  
 the slave and prisoner of his own  
 opinion of himself, — a slave  
 won by his own deeds. Public  
 opinion is a weak tyrant com-  
 pared with private opinion. What  
 a man thinks of himself, that  
 it is which determines, or rather  
 indicates, his fate. Self eman-  
 cipation even in the West Indian

But men labor under a mistake.  
The better part of the man is <sup>3</sup> employed  
into the soil for comfort. By an  
apparent fate, soon called necessity,  
they are employed, as it says in an  
old book, laying up treasures which  
moths and rust will corrupt and  
thieves break through and steal.

It is a fool's life, & they will find  
when they get to the End of it.

P. 12 <sup>even in this comparatively free country</sup> Most men, through mere ignorance  
and mistake are so occupied with  
the <sup>superfluous</sup> factions, care and <sup>coarse</sup> labors  
of life that its finer fruits cannot  
be plucked <sup>from</sup> <sup>the</sup> <sup>tree</sup> <sup>by</sup> <sup>them</sup>. <sup>Actually</sup> <sup>the</sup>  
laboring man has not leisure for  
a lofty, <sup>to become</sup> integrity day by day, he can  
not afford <sup>to sustain</sup> <sup>the noblest</sup>  
~~relations of his labor would depreciate~~  
in the market. He has no time to  
be anything but a machine. How  
can he remember with his ignorance  
<sup>which</sup> ~~and then~~ the growth requires - who  
can <sup>be</sup> <sup>after</sup> <sup>to</sup> <sup>use</sup> <sup>his</sup> <sup>knowledge?</sup>  
We should feel and clothe and recruit him <sup>with</sup> <sup>our</sup> <sup>work</sup>  
first before we judge of him.

Some of you ~~who~~ <sup>and</sup> <sup>we</sup> <sup>all</sup>  
know are poor, find it hard to live, are  
sometimes as it were, gasping for breath.  
I have no doubt that some of you

MANUSCRIPT TABLE OF CONTENTS

74

|                       |                     |                     |             |
|-----------------------|---------------------|---------------------|-------------|
| Title Sheet           | 10, 13              | 20, 18<br>Fragments | 43          |
| Contents<br>Sheet     | 11 $\frac{1}{2}$    | 18, 19              | 41, 42      |
| 1, 8                  | Fragment            | 17, 19              | 42, 43      |
| 2, 8                  | 14, 15, 16          | Fragment            | 43          |
| 3, 8                  | No Number           | Fragment            | 43          |
| 4, 9                  | 12rw. 14, 15        | 17                  | 41          |
| 5, 9                  | No Number           | 18                  | 41          |
| 7                     | 15                  | 19                  | 41          |
| 8, 9                  | No Number           | 18                  | 39, 40 (51) |
| 8, 9                  | 15                  | 18, 19              | 37, 38      |
| 5, 9                  | No Number           | 19                  | 38, 40      |
| 8                     | 14                  | 19, 20              | 39          |
| 9                     | 15, 16              | 20, 21              | 37, 36      |
| 10                    | 16                  | 21, 22              | 37, (47)    |
| No Number<br>Fragment | 16, 17, 18          | 21                  | Figures     |
| 3, 11, 12             | 16 Fragment         | 21                  | 31, 33 (41) |
| 13                    | 16 Fragment         | 43, (37)            | 33, 34      |
| 9, 11                 | 20, 18<br>Fragments | 42, 43              | 35, 36 (45) |

|             |                |                    |                       |
|-------------|----------------|--------------------|-----------------------|
| 36          | 26             | 21                 | 61, 62                |
| 33          | 26             | 21                 | 56                    |
| 32          | 25, 26, 29     | 22                 | 57                    |
| 32, 31      | 26, 24, 27     | 22                 | 56                    |
| 29, 30      | 45             | 44                 | Fragment              |
| 28          | 23, 25         | 44                 | 55, 67                |
| 27 (33)     | 45, 23, 24     | 47, 48             | No Number             |
| 26, 27 (31) | 13, 14, 11     | Fragment           | Omitted from<br>p. 55 |
| 26          | 14, 15, 12     | Verse-Ch. II       | 65                    |
| 25, 26      | 14             | 53                 | 56(?) 65              |
| 28 (35)     | 13, 14         | Letter to<br>Blake | 53                    |
| 29          | 24             | 58                 | 52                    |
| 31 (39)     | 22, 23, 24, 11 | 54                 | 52                    |
| Fragment    | 21             | 61, 62, 33         | 54                    |
| 33          | 21, 22         | 62, 63             | 55, 56                |
| 30          | 19, 20         | 62                 | 51, 29                |
| 29 (15)     | 21             | 62                 | 51, 52                |
| 29, 27      | 23, 22, 45     | 61                 | 53                    |

|            |                              |             |                      |
|------------|------------------------------|-------------|----------------------|
| 59         | 46                           | 34 (19)     | 75                   |
| No Number  | Copy, 46                     | 32, 33      | 75                   |
| No Number  | 47                           | 31 (17)     | No Number            |
| 49         | 46                           | 82, 84 (87) | No Number            |
| Fragment   | Fragment                     | No Number   | "The Week"<br>75, 76 |
| 46, 49, 27 | 25                           | 85, 86, 87  | 72                   |
| 49, 50     | 45                           | 85          | 72, 73               |
| 46, 49     | 44                           | 80          | 73                   |
| 47         | No Number<br>From "The Week" | 81          | 74                   |
| 43, 44, 45 | No Number                    | 81          | 71                   |
| 47         | 43                           | 79, 80      | 70                   |
| 45         | 43, 44                       | 78, 79      | 70                   |
| 47         | 40, 41, 43                   | 79          | Fragment             |
| 46         | 39, 40                       | 79          | Fragment             |
| 46, 48, 49 | 36, 37, 38, 39               | 78 (374)    | 69                   |
| 46, 47     | 36 (21)                      | No Number   | 69                   |
| Fragment   | 39? 36                       | 77          | 67, 68               |
| 45         | 35                           | No Number   | 68, 69               |

|           |           |               |           |
|-----------|-----------|---------------|-----------|
| 67, 68    | Fragment  | 468           | 512 (rw)  |
| 55        | No Number | 466           | 449       |
| 66        | 340, 341  | 465, 466      | 448       |
| 65, 66    | ?         | 467           | 449       |
| 67        | No Number | 468           | No Number |
| 63        | 184, 185  | 468, 469      | 450       |
| 64        | 178       | 469, 474      | No Number |
| 65        | 185       | 469           | 176?      |
| 454 (54?) | Fragment  | 477           | No Number |
| 453, 454  | No Number | 478, 469      | Fragment  |
| 452       | Fragment  | 469, 470      | 68?       |
| 453       | No Number | 470           | No Number |
| 455, 456  | No Number | 470           | 232?      |
| 454       | Poetry    | 470           | No Number |
| 453       | Poetry    | 471           | 465, 466  |
| No Number | Poetry    | 471, 472, 473 | 464       |
| 451, 452  | 466       | 473, 474      | 464       |
| 452       | 467       | 512, 572      | 464       |

|              |               |           |          |
|--------------|---------------|-----------|----------|
| 465          | 455           | No Number | 426      |
| 464, 465     | 458           | No Number | 426      |
| 464          | 458           | 436       | 428      |
| 469          | 456           | 435       | 427      |
| No Number    | 456           | 434, 435  | 425      |
| 463          | Fragment, 439 | 434       | 478, 425 |
| 463          | No Number     | 434       | 426      |
| "Spring" 461 | 438           | 434       | 427      |
| No Number    | No Number     | 432       | 422      |
| 462          | No Number     | 433       | 422, 423 |
| 463          | 439?          | 432       | 423, 424 |
| No Number    | Fragment      | 431       | 424      |
| 460          | 440           | 430, 431  | 421      |
| No Number    | No Number     | 429, 430  | 419      |
| 459          | 441           | 428, 429  | 420      |
| No Number    | 462           | 428       | 420, 421 |
| Fragment     | No Number     | 428       | 421      |
| Fragment     | 437           | 427       | 420      |



|                         |           |                 |          |
|-------------------------|-----------|-----------------|----------|
| 422                     | Fragment  | No Number       | 411      |
| 423                     | 442       | No Number       | 413      |
| 424                     | No Number | No Number       | 414      |
| 424                     | 442, 443  | 447, 450        | 415      |
| 422                     | 444       | 407?            | 415, 416 |
| 420                     | 443       | 407             | 416      |
| 419<br>"Winter Animals" | No Number | Fragment<br>407 | 416, 417 |
| 416                     | 443       | 407             | 416      |
| 415                     | No Number | 404             | 416, 417 |
| 416                     | 445       | 409             | 417, 418 |
| 416                     | No Number | 408             | 418      |
| 415                     | 445, 446  | 408, 409        | 407      |
| No Number               | 447, 448  | 408, 409, 410   | 406      |
| 414                     | 446       | 408             | 404      |
| 413                     | No Number | 409, 410        | 404, 405 |
| 410, 411                | 446       | 410             | 405      |
| 413                     | No Number | 411             | 406      |
| 414                     | No Number | 412             | 404      |

|          |                 |           |                    |
|----------|-----------------|-----------|--------------------|
| 402, 403 | 288             | 281       | 272                |
| 404      | 285             | 280       | 271<br>"The Ponds" |
| 402, 403 | 285, 286        | 275       | No Number          |
| 402      | 286, 287        | 278, 279  | 270                |
| 400, 401 | 287             | 277, 278  | 269                |
| 400      | 284             | 280       | No Number          |
| 400      | 284             | 278       | 266                |
| 400      | 283             | 279       | 265                |
| 399      | Fragment<br>284 | 275       | No Number          |
| 399      | 283             | No Number | 265, 266           |
| 397, 398 | 282, 283        | 275       | 264, 271           |
| 398, 399 | 282, 283        | No Number | 272, 274           |
| 397, 398 | 283             | 276       | 261                |
| 397      | 282             | 275       | 263                |
| 396      | No Number       | No Number | 264                |
| 349, 350 | 279             | 272       | 265                |
| 348, 349 | 281             | 273, 274  | 261                |
| 288?     | 282             | No Number | 262                |

|           |           |  |               |
|-----------|-----------|--|---------------|
| 263       | 254       | 242                                    | 236, 237      |
| 266       | 255, 256  | 241                                    | 238           |
| 267       | 252       | No Number                              | Fragment      |
| 267       | 253, 254  | No Number                              | 235           |
| Fragment  | No Number | 241                                    | 234           |
| 259       | 247, 248  | Perhaps a<br>journal page<br>torn out. | 234           |
| 258, 261  | 248       | 242                                    | No Number     |
| 257       | 247, 248  | 241                                    | 234           |
| 257       | 249       | No Number                              | 232           |
| No Number | 247, 248  | 240                                    | No Number     |
| 252       | 249       | 240                                    | 229, 230      |
| 257       | 246       | 239                                    | 231           |
| No Number | 245       | 239 Fragment                           | 230           |
| 256, 257  | 244, 245  | 238, 239                               | 228, 229, 231 |
| 256, 257  | 243, 244  | 238, 239                               | 232           |
| 257       | 242, 243  | 273                                    | 228, 229      |
| 257       | 243, 244  | 238                                    | 230           |
| 258       | 242, 243  | 237                                    | 228, 230      |

|          |          |           |          |
|----------|----------|-----------|----------|
| 227      | 224, 225 | 215, 216  | 207, 208 |
| 228      | 224, 225 | 216       | 208, 209 |
| 229      | 217      | 215       | 209, 210 |
| 229, 230 | 237      | 213       | 210      |
| 230, 231 | 223      | 213, 214  | 207      |
| 229      | 222, 223 | No Number | 209, 208 |
| 230      | 221      | No Number | 207      |
| 228      | 221      | 208       | 208      |
| 227, 228 | 220      | 207, 218  | 205, 206 |
| 228, 231 | 220      | Poetry    | 206, 207 |
| 227, 228 | 219, 220 | 214       | 204      |
| 227      | 219      | 212, 214  | 204, 205 |
| 226      | 218, 219 | 213       | 205      |
| 226, 227 | 218      | 212       | 202, 204 |
| 226      | 218      | 213       | 202      |
| 227      | 219      | 211       | 203      |
| 225, 226 | 200      | 210       | 202      |
| 225      | 221      | 211       | 203      |

|                |             |                  |                |
|----------------|-------------|------------------|----------------|
| No Number      | 88          | 81,82,84         | 105, 106       |
| 200            | 253,288,254 | 85               | No Number      |
| 199            | 88          | 82, 83           | 108            |
| 199            | 88          | Copy<br>Fragment | 108, 109       |
| No Number (7?) | 89          | 87 Fragment      | 109            |
| No Number (8?) | 90          | 85               | 107            |
| 200,201,192    | 90          | 87, 88           | 100            |
| 120, 72        | 90, 91      | 94               | 100, 101       |
| 201 Fragment   | 91, 92      | 96               | 101            |
| 200            | 92          | 95               | 101, 110       |
| 201            | 92 Fragment | 97               | 110,111,112    |
| 196            | 94          | 101              | 110            |
| 196, 197       | 95, 96      | 102              | 110 as printed |
| 198            | 96, 97      | 103              | 110, 111       |
| 195            | 97, 98      | 129, 99?         | Fragment       |
| 194            | 97, 98      | 103, 104         | 112, 113       |
| 197            | 98, 99      | 104--copy 107    | 111, 112       |
| 86             | 99          | No Number        | 112,114,115    |
| 89, 87         | 100         | 105              | 113, 114       |

|           |           |            |                |
|-----------|-----------|------------|----------------|
| No Number | 116       | 187        | 178            |
| 114, 115  | 115       | 183        | No Number      |
| 113       | 119, 120  | 184        | 176, 177       |
| 115       | 120, 121  | 186        | (Not Printed)  |
| 113       | 120       | 187        | 175            |
| 115 copy  | 28        | 181        | 175, 176       |
| 115       | 120       | 182        | 176            |
| 124       | No Number | 181, 182   | 177            |
| 115, 116  | 121, 119  | 182, 183   | 178            |
| Fragment  | 121       | 183, 187 ? | 175            |
| 115, 116  | 119, 122  | 184        | 175, 176       |
| 117       | 193       | No Number  | 175            |
| 117, 118  | 193, 192  | 178        | Fragment       |
| Fragment  | 193       | 179, 180   | 174            |
| 124, 125  | 194       | 180        | 174, 175       |
| 119       | 192       | 180        | 170, 164       |
| 116, 117  | 197       | 179, 180   | No Number      |
| 117       | 186       | 178        | 166, 145 (105) |

| 163           | 152          | 131       | 140      |
|---------------|--------------|-----------|----------|
| 162, 163      | 152, 153     | 131, 132  | 141      |
| 162           | 151          | 133       | 139      |
| 160, 161      | 122          | 131, 132  | 140      |
| No Number     | 122, 125     | 133, 134  | 141      |
| 159, 160, 161 | No Number    | 133, 134  | 142      |
| 159           | No Number    | 134       | 140      |
| 158           | 123 Fragment | 133       | 140      |
| 157           | 124, 125     | 134       | 142      |
| 156           | 125, 124     | 134       | 142, 143 |
| 155 Gragment  | 125          | No Number | 143      |
| 155           | Note         | 135       | 143      |
| 154 Poetry    | 127 Poetry   | 136       | 143, 144 |
| 154           | 128          | 136, 137  | 144      |
| 153           | 129          | 137       | 145      |
| 153           | 130          | 138       | 145, 146 |
| 148, 153      | No Number    | 138, 139  | 146, 155 |
| 151           | 132          | 139, 140  | 146, 147 |

|               |              |           |                  |
|---------------|--------------|-----------|------------------|
| 147           | 291          | 297       | 315              |
| 147, 148, 149 | 291          | No Number | 315              |
| 149           | 292          | No Number | Fragment, 316    |
| 149? (7)      | 291          | 303       | Figures-Fragment |
| 146, 147      | 292          | 303       | 316              |
| 147           | 292, 293     | 303       | 317              |
| 148           | 293          | No Number | 323, 324         |
| 148, 149      | 299          | 313       | 324, 325         |
| 148, 149      | No Number    | 312       | 323, 324         |
| 149           | 294, 296     | 312       | 324              |
| 150, 151, 152 | 295, 296     | 306       | 324 (147)        |
| 150           | 296          | 306       | No Number        |
| 288, 289      | 292 Fragment | 304, 305  | 327              |
| 289           | 298          | 305       | 328              |
| 289           | 296, 295     | 274       | 327              |
| 290           | 300          | 304       | 328, 329         |
| 290           | 301          | 313, 314  | 329              |
| 291           | 296          | 314       | 328              |



|              |              |                          |           |
|--------------|--------------|--------------------------|-----------|
| 329          | 338, 339     | No Number                | 351       |
| No Number    | 339          | 342                      | 357       |
| 330          | 339          | 343                      | 351       |
| 331, 333     | 340          | 343, 344                 | 352       |
| 331, 332     | 341          | 344                      | Fragment  |
| 332, 331     | 342          | 345                      | 357       |
| 332          | 342 Fragment | 346                      | 352       |
| 333          | 335          | 345?                     | 352, 353  |
| 330          | 336          | 346                      | No Number |
| 333, 334     | 340, 341     | 347                      | 353, 354  |
| 334          | 341, 342     | 102                      | 353       |
| 335 Fragment | 343          | 348                      | 354       |
| Fragment     | 343          | "Brute Neighbors"<br>347 | 354, 355  |
| 335          | 343          | 348                      | 355       |
| 336          | 343          | "Animals"<br>347         | 355       |
| 337          | 344          | No Number                | 355       |
| 338          | No Number    | 350                      | 359?      |
| 338 Fragment | 344, 345     | 350?                     | 358       |

|           |              |           |           |
|-----------|--------------|-----------|-----------|
| 358       | No Number    | No Number | No Number |
| 359       | No Number    | 378       | 389       |
| 360       | 368          | No Number | 390       |
| 360       | No Number    | No Number | 390       |
| 361       | 370          | 385       | 390       |
| 361       | 371          | 380       | No Number |
| 361       | No Number    | 381       | No Number |
| 362       | No Number    | No Number | 392       |
| 361       | 372          | Fragment  | 392       |
| 362       | 373, 378     | 382       | 393       |
| 363       | 78, 79       | 383       | 390       |
| 363       | 373          | No Number | Fragment  |
| 364       | 374          | 383       | No Number |
| 364       | 373          | No Number | No Number |
| 364       | 374          | 384       | 394       |
| 365       | 375, 376     | 386       | 390       |
| 366       | 377          | No Number | 469       |
| No Number | 376 Fragment | 388       | 478       |
| No Number | Fragment     | 387       | 470?      |

|              |               |                  |          |
|--------------|---------------|------------------|----------|
| 471          | 483           | 476              | 510      |
| 472          | 482           | 478              | 511, 512 |
| Fragment     | 481, 482      | 475              | 510, 511 |
| 480          | 482           | 474              | 510      |
| 488          | 481           | 475              | 509      |
| 489          | 483           | 475, 476         | 505      |
| 490          | 481, 482      | 476              | 506      |
| 439 Fragment | 479, 480      | 472              | 507      |
| 488          | 478, 479      | 474              | 507      |
| Fragment     | 479, 481      | 474              | 507      |
| 488, 489     | 478           | 474              | 508, 509 |
| 484          | 480           | 471, 472         | 505, 506 |
| 484          | 478 Fragment  | 473              | 505      |
| 483          | 477, 478      | 512              | Fragment |
| No Number    | 474, 475      | 513              | 504      |
| No Number    | 475           | 514<br>(The End) | 503      |
| 485, 486     | 476           | 513, 514         | 504      |
| 483, 484     | 477? Fragment | 511              | 503      |

|                       |                |          |  |
|-----------------------|----------------|----------|--|
| 504                   | 498, 499       | 494, 495 |  |
| 504 Fragment          | 501            | 495, 496 |  |
| No Number<br>Fragment | 499            | 456      |  |
| 499, 501              | 492            | 455      |  |
| 502                   | 491            | 454      |  |
| No Number             | No Number      | 455      |  |
| 501, 502              | 495, 496       |          |  |
| 500                   | 491, 492       |          |  |
| 500                   | 490, 491       |          |  |
| 499                   | 491            |          |  |
| 499, 502              | 490, 491       |          |  |
| 498, 499              | 495            |          |  |
| 497                   | 493, 494       |          |  |
| 497, 498              | 493 Conclusion |          |  |
| 498                   | 493            |          |  |
| 498                   | 494            |          |  |
| No Number             | 494, 495       |          |  |