University of Cincinnati

Date: 6/29/2016

I, Sarah M Jernigan, hereby submit this original work as part of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts in Communication.

It is entitled:
Human Trafficking as a Wicked Problem: An Analysis of Five Indian NGO Leaders Combating Traffickers

Student's name: Sarah M Jernigan

This work and its defense approved by:

Committee chair: Gail Fairhurst, Ph.D.

Committee member: Zhuo Ban, Ph.D.

Committee member: Shaunak Sastry, Ph.D.
University of Cincinnati

Date: 6/29/2016

I, Sarah M Jernigan, hereby submit this original work as part of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts in Communication.

It is entitled:
Human Trafficking as a Wicked Problem: An Analysis of Five Indian NGO Leaders Combating Traffickers

Student's name: Sarah M Jernigan

This work and its defense approved by:

Committee chair: Gail Fairhurst, Ph.D.

Committee member: Zhuo Ban, Ph.D.

Committee member: Shaunak Sastry, Ph.D.
Human Trafficking as a Wicked Problem:
An Analysis of Five Indian NGO Leaders Combating Traffickers

A thesis submitted to the
Division of Graduate Studies and Research
of the University of Cincinnati
in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the degree of
Master of Arts
in the Department of Communication
of the College of Arts and Sciences
2015
by
Sarah Marie Jernigan
B.A., University of Cincinnati, 2010

Committee Chair: Dr. Gail Fairhurst
Committee Members: Dr. Zhuo Ban
Dr. Shaunak Sastry
Abstract

This thesis explores the ways in which leadership is affecting five Indian non-profit efforts to combat human trafficking, identified here as a wicked problem. Using an iterative, grounded theory approach, data was analyzed from five non-profit presentations and generated the following four themes: vision and mission statements, cross-sector partnerships, language and definition issues, and intervention practices, all of which influence the combative efforts of organizations fighting traffickers. This study adds to our understanding of how non-profits are making a difference when combating human trafficking.
Table of Contents

Abstract ........................................................................................................................................... ii

Table of Contents .............................................................................................................................. iv

Chapter 1: Introduction ...................................................................................................................... 1

Chapter 2: Literature Review and Research Question ................................................................. 4
  Preview of Literature Review Sections ......................................................................................... 4
  Wicked Problems ........................................................................................................................... 5
  Human Trafficking ......................................................................................................................... 10
    History ......................................................................................................................................... 10
    Defining and Researching the Issue .............................................................................................. 12
    Discourse of Human Trafficking in India .................................................................................... 16
    Human Trafficking as a Wicked Problem .................................................................................... 18
  Current Solutions ........................................................................................................................... 22
  Leadership within Non-profits ........................................................................................................ 25
    Successful Non-profit Leadership ............................................................................................... 25
  Collaboration between NGOs ......................................................................................................... 29
  Critiquing a Western Lens .............................................................................................................. 33

Chapter 3: Methodology ................................................................................................................... 36
  Preview of Methodology Sections ................................................................................................. 36
  Data Collection ............................................................................................................................... 36
  Data Analysis .................................................................................................................................. 38

Chapter 4: Results ............................................................................................................................ 41
  Preview of Results Sections ............................................................................................................ 41
  Description of the Five NGOs ........................................................................................................ 41
    Jagruthi ......................................................................................................................................... 41
    Shakti Vahini ............................................................................................................................... 42
    Rescue Foundation ...................................................................................................................... 42
    Anyay Rahit Zindagi ................................................................................................................... 43
    Video Volunteers ......................................................................................................................... 43
  Organization Vision and Mission Statements .............................................................................. 43
  Cross-Sector Partnerships .............................................................................................................. 47
  Language and Definition Issues .................................................................................................. 52
  Intervention Practices .................................................................................................................... 55

Chapter 5: Discussion ....................................................................................................................... 61
  Organization Vision and Mission Statements .............................................................................. 61
Chapter 1: Introduction

A 2012 USA Today article asserted that “2.4 million people across the globe are victims of human trafficking at any one time” according to the United Nations Office of Drugs and Crime. They define human trafficking as “the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, abduction, fraud, or deception” (2015). Trafficking thus encompasses many forms, not just sex trafficking. Regardless of the trafficking practice, it can be identified as one of the fastest growing industries, marked at $32 billion, just behind the selling of illegal drugs (Polaris Project, 2002). It is a hidden crime, which most citizens are unaware of, even if it is occurring in close geographical proximity.

Human trafficking will not diminish unless action is taken. The fight against this crime is in desperate need of robust organizations that are well equipped to battle traffickers. This research project is important and essential for this reason. An analysis of non-governmental organizations (NGOs) that are combating this massively difficult problem will provide suggestions for future organizations on what is effective and ineffective when combating. NGOs have had a significant role in combating human trafficking (Yousaf, 2006). They have assisted others in understanding the scope of the problem and have provided access to specific data on human trafficking.

In this study, I will evaluate five non-profit organizations in India, which are actively combating human trafficking. Specifically, I will try to learn from the leaders from each group, provide an overview of how each organization began, examine their specific missions, and
analyze what systems or processes were employed. Whether the organization is successful or not will determine what positive or negative practices can be gleaned from each group.

The data for this project involves a secondary analysis of data collected as part of a University of Cincinnati service learning course, “Transforming Lives: India,” members of which traveled to India in May of 2015. I traveled with the class and listened to presentations by non-profit leaders who are dealing with the subject of human trafficking. Through these presentations, it became apparent that human trafficking is a global issue and requires many different leadership approaches to effectively combat the problem. The purpose of this research is to discern what organizational tactics and leadership dynamics are effective for organizations to successful combat traffickers.

This study is significant in both theory and practice. It will connect theories of wicked problems, human trafficking, and leadership practices. The following paragraphs highlight the theoretical and practical significances of this research project.

Theoretical Significance

The field of communication can make a difference in how non-profit leaders combat human trafficking. However, there is a lack of literature on the communication issues surrounding human trafficking. The literature on leading non-profits should be expanded to include this very important issue as the management of this wicked problem may pose a number of unique challenges. Thus, this project will also strengthen literature surrounding organizational leadership, including leadership involved in productive collaboration among non-profit organizations.
However, drawing from intercultural communication theory, this study will also examine the lens used to make claims about the operations of leadership. Intercultural communication theory, according to Jandt (2004), is “communication between individuals of diverse cultural identifications as well as communication between groups of diverse cultural identifications” (p. 26). Since the data collection for this research took place in India and concerns itself with leadership practices, this study also questions a Western conception of leadership that may or may not be relevant for organizations operating in the East.

Practical Significance

In practice, this research should provide suggestions for future organizations on the kinds of leadership dynamics that are successful when combating human trafficking and other crises. This project will elaborate on current solutions for managing trafficking and provide results from which other organizations combating traffickers may benefit. These results will highlight past solutions that were not beneficial and therefore establish tactics organizations should not employ. The following chapter reviews literature relevant to the research study.
Chapter 2: Literature Review

Preview of Literature Review Sections

Literature relevant to this thesis arises from three primary areas: wicked problems, human trafficking, and leadership within non-profits. To fully encapsulate the importance of this research, each of these areas is essential to identify what current literature exists and how this paper will add to the present literature.

The first section highlights research on wicked problems. The criteria established on wicked problems were selected for this study because I make the argument that human trafficking classifies as a wicked problem. Specifically, I explore work by Grint (2005) and Rittel and Webber (1973). Drawing from Rittel and Webber (1973), Grint (2005) identifies wicked problems as “complex, rather than just complicated, it is often intractable, there is no unilinear solution, moreover, there is no ‘stopping’ point, it is novel, any apparent ‘solution’ often generates other ‘problems’, and there is no ‘right’ or ‘wrong’ answer, but there are better or worse alternatives” (p. 1473). Although other authors have written about wicked problems (Conklin, 2001; Jha & Lexa, 2014; Ritchey, 2011), the three aforementioned authors set the foundation for defining and understanding wicked problems and provide the framework for my argument that human trafficking fits the criteria for a wicked problem.

From there, the next body of research proffers an overview of the history of human trafficking, defines the issue, and provides several current proposed solutions to the problem. A history of human trafficking is necessary to fully comprehend how it has evolved and imprisoned so many victims, and to understand the efforts leaders must undertake in order to successful combat the problem. Reviewing literature that defines the issue is crucial as it will showcase the
multiple layers of human trafficking and explain its various intricacies, making it a wicked problem. Lastly, current solutions to the issue are relevant to this research because they will suggest tactics that have been successful when combating traffickers. Literature on prior solutions to this issue provides a basis for what research has already been conducted surrounding human trafficking.

Lastly, the third section concentrates on leadership within non-profits. This section of the literature review evaluates published literature on successful non-profit leadership in order to analyze how NGOs collaborate. Both of these sub-sections provide comprehensive insight on what constitutes successful leadership within non-profits. However, this section concludes by questioning what “successful leadership” may mean from within a Western versus Eastern view of leadership.

**Wicked Problems**

Rittel and Webber (1973) were city planners who introduced the concept of wicked problems in their paper, *Dilemmas in a General Theory of Planning*. They believed the search for the scientific bases for confronting problems of social policy is bound to fail because science has been designed to manage “tame” problems and not “wicked” problems. Rittel and Webber differentiated tame and wicked problems by stating tame problems can be clearly evaluated to determine if the problem has been solved. In contrast, wicked problems cannot be clearly identified as solved because they are constantly evolving.

Ten distinguishing characteristics exist for wicked problems, according to Rittel and Webber. It should be noted that this terminology is not necessarily a moral judgment or label, but rather a schema for thinking about social problems. The first characteristic is there is no
definitive formation of a wicked problem. This means that it is impossible to identify all of the information necessary to solve the problem. It is impossible because generating solutions is contingent on the problem solver’s understanding of the problem. All material related to the problem must be analyzed and as wicked problems are constantly evolving, a comprehensive evaluation is futile.

Second, wicked problems have no stopping rules. There is not an end to the causal chain of a wicked problem, which leads to the problem solver experiencing an unending list of solutions. This may eventually lead them to claim a “that’s good enough” mindset and terminate the work being done against the wicked problem.

Third, solutions to wicked problems are not true-or-false, but good-or-bad. There are no established criteria for solving wicked problems, meaning that it is unattainable to cross check two wicked problems to search for similar solutions. Since wicked problems do not allow for true or false answers, there are no “formal decision rules to determine correctness” (p. 163). Rittel and Webber also assert that although good or bad responses could be given toward wicked problems, “better or worse” or “good enough” are more likely to be responses.

Fourth, there is no immediate and no ultimate test of a solution to a wicked problem. In contrast, potential solutions to tame problems may be evaluated instantaneously, whereas attempted solutions to wicked problems take time to assess. Rittel and Webber identify assessment as “waves of consequences” (p. 163) that must run their full course before being appraised. This process may transpire longer than one’s lifetime and are often incapable of being completely documented, adding another level of complexity to wicked problems.
Fifth, every solution to a wicked problem is a “one-shot operation.” Because there is no opportunity to learn by trial-and-error, every attempt counts significantly. Non-wicked problems may include various attempts that do not include penalty. With wicked problems, however, every single implemented solution has consequences. They are often irreversible, take up long periods of time, and require large sums of money; in short, every attempt at solving wicked problems is essential.

Sixth, wicked problems do not have an enumerable (or an exhaustively describable) set of potential solutions, nor is there a well-described set of permissible operations that may be incorporated into the plan. In other words, there are not established criteria that can be utilized to prove all solutions have been identified and considered. Typically, when managing wicked problems, either an array of potential solutions develop, or none at all. Even when a potential solution is manifested, it does not solve all aspects of the wicked problem.

Seventh, every wicked problem is essentially unique. Rittel and Webber are careful to identify them as essentially unique because “despite long lists of similarities between a current problem and a previous one, there always might be an additional distinguishing property that is of overriding importance” (p. 164). There are no classes of wicked problems, meaning any similarities observed between two wicked problems need to be evaluated based on the contexts mediating them.

Eighth, every wicked problem can be considered to be a symptom of another problem. The first step in solving a problem is to search for its cause. When searching for a solution to a wicked problem, the problem solver may find one symptom that will lead to another symptom and yet another. Even if one is to discover a set of symptoms for a wicked problem, an intricate
web of related problems may form so that it is impossible to address all levels and aspects of the problem.

Ninth, the existence of a discrepancy representing a wicked problem can often be explained in numerous ways. The choice of explanation determines the nature of the problem’s resolution. Since there are no criteria in place for evaluating wicked problems, each problem solver ranks potential solutions according to their own worldviews. The solution one chooses is based on what they believe to be most plausible.

Finally, the planner has no right to be wrong. Problem solvers seek to improve the world by managing wicked problems. “Planners are liable for the consequences of the actions they generate; the effects can matter a great deal to those people that are touched by those actions” (p. 167). Since wicked problem solvers are in fact often dealing with incorrigible situations, the stakes are raised when trying to find a solution. Lives can be improved if wicked problems are successfully managed.

Drawing from Rittel and Webber’s (1973) distinction between wicked and tame problems, Grint (2005; 2010) proposed a model that incorporated both of them, but added critical as a third type of problem. Grint’s model matches an authority style to each type of problem; however, his goal was to show the ways in which individuals socially construct problems according to their preferred authority styles. Nevertheless, this model can be helpful in explaining how human trafficking problems are addressed.

For example, Grint (2005) restates Rittel and Webber’s definition of wicked problems as “complex, rather than just complicated, it is often intractable, there is no unilinear solution, moreover, there is no ‘stopping’ point, it is novel, any apparent ‘solution’ often generates other
‘problems’, and there is no ‘right’ or ‘wrong’ answer, but there are better or worse alternatives” (p. 1473). Grint suggests that because there is a large degree of uncertainty involved, leadership is required to form a resolution. Grint identifies the leader’s role as “to ask the right questions rather than provide the right answers because the answers may not be self-evident and will require a collaborative process to make any kind of progress” (p. 1473, emphasis original).

Grint (2005) argues that tame problems require a management approach. The distinction between tame and wicked problems is an important one to make, for as Rittel and Webber (1973) asserted, if the design for confronting wicked problems is the same as tame problems, the attempt will not be successful. Grint restated Rittel and Webber’s definition of tame problems as “complicated but is resolvable through unilinear acts because there is a point where the problem is resolved through unilinear acts occurred before” (p. 1473). Due to the limited degree of uncertainty, Grint identifies management as the most efficient means to address tame problems. The manager’s role in executing solutions is to “provide the appropriate processes to solve the problem” (p.1473, emphasis original).

Grint (2005) then introduces critical problems as a third type of problem. Critical problems are commonly referred to as a crisis and encapsulate “very little time for decision-making and action, and it is often associated with authoritarianism” (p. 1473). It requires a command form of leadership, in which a commander takes control and determines which actions are necessary or provides an answer to the problem. A commander may privately be uncertain on what the answer is, but typically followers believe a commander is convinced his or her answer is correct.
One upshot of Grint’s contribution of critical problems to Rittel and Webber’s tame versus wicked problems is that different styles are needed to seek an answer to the problem. As previously mentioned by Rittel and Webber, tame problems are resolvable because parts of the problem have been solved through prior unilinear acts, whereas wicked problems are unique and cannot fully be applied to other problems. Thus, new ways of managing a wicked problem must be developed rather than looking toward other previously established solutions.

Wicked problems are so complex that one right answer does not exist; recall that they constantly evolve and morph into new problems. A command style cannot be utilized to solve wicked problems because no one person is likely to have the answer to a wicked problem; collaboration is thus required. When managing wicked problems, leaders “must frame problems and collaborate to help their organizations engage the right knowledge networks, amass the right intelligence, and collectively decide possible futures” (Fairhurst, 2011). Based on the above definitions, I will make the case that human trafficking constitutes as a wicked problem, one that is complex, constantly evolving, and without any clear solution.

The foregoing literature review provides the foundational groundwork for establishing human trafficking as a wicked problem. The next section will be instrumental in understanding human trafficking as a wicked problem. I will also provide the history of human trafficking and evaluate what has already been accomplished with combating traffickers.

**Human Trafficking**

*History*

There are many discrepancies among scholars regarding the origins of human trafficking. Some argue that it began in the 1400s through the European slave trade in Africa while others
contend that it began in the 1700s with the forced labor of children (Kara, 2010). Lee and Lewis (2003) said:

Historically, the limited opportunities for lawful immigration to the U.S., combined with the need and availability of cheap labor, created fertile ground for human traffickers to ply their trade; these same factors, we would argue, contribute significantly to today’s trafficking industry as well. (p. 174)

Human trafficking is not legal throughout the world because “instead of being held by law, victims are trapped physically, psychologically, financially, or emotionally by their traffickers” (Kloer, 2011, p.1). The 2014 USDS Trafficking in Person Report estimates there were 44,462 victims of human trafficking identified in 2014 in comparison to 30,961 in 2008. Many of these people are kidnapped or voluntarily go to a different geographical area with the intention of beginning a better life, but instead are tricked and forced into prostitution or hard labor (Masci, 2004).

It is estimated that 800,000 to 900,000 persons are trafficked across international borders annually (Bernadin, 2010). In 2010, human trafficking surpassed drug trafficking as the most profitable criminal activity (Bernadin, 2010). According to the International Rescue Committee (IRC), “generally, ethnic minorities or lower class groups are more vulnerable to trafficking, and certain social and cultural practices further leave women and children more susceptible to exploitation” (p. 88). IRC also states that potential victims are at an even greater risk when they come from countries experiencing political and economic instability, civil unrest, or natural disasters. Human trafficking takes many forms today and can be found in a wide range of sectors such as brothels, domestic service, construction sites, sweatshops, and hotels. Despite debates on when human trafficking originated, it is clear the issue has long been in existence.
Defining and Researching the Issue

Human trafficking can be defined in a myriad of ways, but most definitions include coercion, exploitation, and violence in their definition. The following definition by Batsyukova, (2007) is one such example:

The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, or fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability… to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. (p. 47).

The foregoing definition highlights threat and exploitation. However, the definition by Gajic-Veljanoski and Stewart (2007) highlights torture, degradation, and violence. They define human trafficking as involving “the denial of the person’s rights to liberty, integrity, security and freedom of movement. This is often combined with violence, torture and degrading treatment” (p.339).

Hughes (2001) states that victims of trafficking are moved across borders through various means such as “force, coercion, manipulation, deception, abuse of authority, initial consent, family pressure, past and present family and community violence, economic deprivation, or other conditions of inequality for women and children” (p. 627-628). Increasingly, however, not only women are subject to trafficking, but many men and young boys are as well. Bales (2000) adds that of the 300 laws and international agreements since 1815 that have been written to combat human trafficking, none have defined the problem exactly the same. Perhaps this is due to the evolution of human trafficking over time.

Definitional problems ultimately give way to conducting research on human trafficking. Since researchers cannot agree on a definition, it is difficult to draw conclusions about the
empirical research as there are many discrepancies on what is and is not human trafficking. This includes what constitutes an accurate definition of a victim. Some researchers may include prostitution, human smuggling, or exclude men in their number, which other researchers may challenge. Other characterizations by researchers or other observers even suggest a “hierarchy of victimization where those who are kidnapped or coerced are worthy of protection and those who agreed to work in the sex industry deserve their exploitation” (O’Brien, et al, 2013, p. 409). A lack of a clear universal definition of human trafficking, and what establishes someone as a victim, are major hurdles in human trafficking research.

Another hurdle in human trafficking research is many researchers cannot find a large enough sample size. Human trafficking is secretive, the victims are silenced, and the traffickers are dangerous. Moreover, because the behavior being studied is illegal, many participants, even if they are victims, are hesitant to engage with researchers (Andreas, 2010). Weitzer (2015) asserts it is “impossible to satisfactorily count the number of persons involved or the magnitude of profits in an illicit, underground economy internationally or nationally—especially when there are no tangible items such as illicit drugs or weapons” (p. 4). In other words, the worldwide number of victims from trafficking is unclear.

It is estimated worldwide that there are 20.9 million victims of human trafficking locally in the United States, and trafficking is marked as a $150 billion industry worldwide (International Labour Organization, 2012). Interestingly, victims of trafficking often occur during periods of migration. Hughes (2001) cites a specific example beginning in 1989 when 800,000 Soviet Jews immigrated to Israel. Russian and Ukrainian traffickers used this immigration to cover up the harboring of 10,000 women into Israel for the sex industry (p. 632). This is just one example of the exploitation of victims through migration, and it leads one to
question what might be happening with the mass migration from countries such as Syria, Afghanistan, Iraq, Gaza, Haiti, and Mali at the current time.

Kapur (2005) adds we are currently witnessing the largest mass migration seen in human history. This results from “the reconfiguration of the global economy, an increased ability to travel, the displacement and dispossession of marginalized people, an awareness of better options, armed conflict, and an aspiration to explore the world” (pg. 411). Often, migrants know early on that their work will have a sexual component. Studies in Australia (David, 2000), Northern and Southern Europe (Agustin, 2007), the US (Chapkis, 2003), and Japan (Murray, 1998) have all documented migrant’s knowledge of their work containing a sexual component. In response to why migrants might accept the risk, Agustin (2007) states, “women in Nairobi who were asked if they realized that sex jobs could be dangerous, answered that they were not selling sex in order to live safely but to earn money and be independent” (p.33). While the opportunity for a new life may not be the only determining factor for migrants, one may reason it is at the center, making sex work more necessary for migrants.

With regards to the sex industry, Hughes (2001) asserted that transnational trade, specifically with women, is driven by supply and demand. “Countries with large sex industries create the demand and are the receiving countries, while countries where traffickers easily recruit women are the sending countries” (p. 626). The original primary sending countries were Asian countries, but after the collapse of the Soviet Union, Ukraine, Belarus, Latvia, and Russia have become major sending countries for trafficked women to sex industries globally.

In the book Sold, Patricia McCormick (2006) interviewed female trafficking survivors in Nepal and from their accounts writes a chilling story of a young girl who is sold by her parents
into trafficking. According to McCormick, most families in developing countries sell their daughters because of a dire need for food. However, they are told their daughters will be taken to the city to work as maids, not as sex workers. Most of the girls are from rural towns and have never seen a car, so when they are taken to a large city, they feel completely overwhelmed. They are passed on to various dealers who show them some kindness, and since the girls are usually afraid of their new surroundings, they will do whatever the dealer asks of them as they are their only connection to home (McCormick, 2006).

In McCormick’s (2006) book, she elaborates on what occurs when they arrive at the brothel. If they refuse to see clients, they are drugged and raped. After being raped, they are told they may one day leave and return to their families, if they pay back their debt. Of course, the debt is a ludicrous amount of money and constantly accrues interest, meaning it would take the girls years to pay off. McCormick records that the girls are told that if they run away, they will be caught, beaten, and made to walk naked in the streets. Occasionally, missionaries come into the brothels and try to convince the girls to leave with them. The girls have been told that if they go with the missionaries, they will be publically humiliated (McCormick, 2006).

Hughes (2000) supported these narratives with further research on coercive methods of recruitment and trafficking in Ukraine. One method of recruitment Hughes identified is the use of advertisements in newspapers, which claim to offer well-paid job opportunities in foreign countries for low skilled jobs, such as waitressing or babysitting. These advertisements promote competitive salaries for young women who are attractive; they are recruited through photo shoots and auditions for dancers and hostesses. During interviews, the girls are even ensured the job opportunity is genuine. Hughes estimates that around 20 percent of trafficked women are recruited through media advertisements (p. 634).
To allow transfer across countries, the women are either given tourist visas to legally enter or given false documents (Hughes, 2000). Once they reach their destination, pimps tell them they will not be working in their perceived occupation, but will be sex workers. There is little chance of escape for a multitude of reasons: their travel documents are confiscated; they are not given much of their earnings so money is scarce; because of the negative stigma associated with prostitution, they would face discrimination if they returned home; and their pimps threaten to harm their families (Hughes, 2000, p. 635).

When the sex workers are discovered in police raids, they are often treated as illegal immigrants and do not receive any sympathy or assistance from authorities or the public. Hughes (2000) asserted that studies on woman in the sex industry “indicate that many women have serious health problems and are exposed to life-threatening risks. Women suffer from infectious diseases, injuries from violence, drug and alcohol addictions, depression and other mental health problems as a result of trauma” (p. 638). Researchers hypothesize that the reasons for a lack of studies include blaming the victims for being sex workers and minimizing the severity of the violence and coercion.

Corruption also exists through bribes made to public officials by pimps to keep their trafficking businesses covert. With the support from public officials, pimps’ profits flourish and allow them to work with little to no interference (Hughes, 2000). For this reason, anti-human trafficking organizations must gain support from authorities and work collaboratively with them in order to combat pimps.

*Discourse of Human Trafficking in India*

As the present study directly pertains to the issues surrounding human trafficking in India, some of the research challenges associated with the depth of the problem in that part of the
world are necessary to note. According to the U.S. Department of State (2011), India has one of the highest levels of human trafficking due to their geographical location. India has easy access to neighboring countries and has access to many ports, making it easier for traffickers to distribute victims. Although it is true that every country has access to neighboring countries, India’s geographical location causes it to be an easy access for Northern Asian countries. Also, the Indian Ocean positions India as an easy entry for South Eastern Asian countries. In a study conducted by the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (2014), researchers discovered between 2010-2012, 96% of trafficking victims originating in East Asia and the Pacific were taken to India as their final destination.

In a study conducted by UN Women (2012), 2,001 women and adolescent girls, and 1,003 men and adolescent boys, between 16-49, all of whom lived in New Delhi, were surveyed. In the study, only five percent of women ranked public spaces in Delhi as being ‘safe’ or ‘very safe’ in terms of sexual violence.

When questioned about their experience of sexual violence, nine out of ten female respondents reported experiencing at least one form of sexual violence in Delhi within their lifetime, while others experienced at least one form in the last six months. Sexual violence includes anything from obscene gestures, to groping, to rape (United Nations, 2012). Also, 51% of the male respondents admitted to committing one form of sexual violence against women in public spaces in Delhi within their lifetime, and 25% have done so in the last six months. These are startling statistics pointing to the depth of India’s problem.

The U.N. study also discovered that many men blamed woman for the sexual violence they experienced saying that women provoke men by what they wear. Women in the survey
commented that they did not report the incidents to authorities because they believe “police would trivialize the matter, not do anything, blame them for the incident, or turn around and harass them” (p. 11). Women also asserted they had no knowledge of help lines set up by the police, with only eight percent of women who had heard of the helpline.

The depth of India’s problems with sexual violence underscores the need for more research on human trafficking and the difficulty of doing so if few victims are willing to come forward. New Delhi is not the only city in India where women are subject to sexual violence. According to the National Crime Records Bureau (NCRB) report for 2013, 70% of crimes against women were reported from 53 mega cities including Mumbai and Bangalore.

The above literature illustrates the real sexual and physical violence that all women in India face. This increases the intense need to combat traffickers; I believe this public display of violence against women may correlate to the value men place on women in that society. The sexual violence and disregard of rights indicates that men are willing to exploit women in various ways, including trafficking. The following section establishes the relationship of human trafficking as a wicked problem.

*Human Trafficking as a Wicked Problem*

As previously identified, there are many problems that surround human trafficking; the most pertinent relate to limited access to victims, ruthless dealers, and the coercion or force involved with initiation into trafficking. These complexities cause human trafficking to qualify as a wicked problem. Recall that Rittel and Webber (1973) distinguish ten characteristics for wicked problems.
For example, there is no definitive formulation of human trafficking as a problem (1st characteristic of a wicked problem, hereafter “1”), and there are no stopping rules (2). Wicked problems make it nearly impossible to fully comprehend all possible components and therefore conceive possible solutions. The same is true of human trafficking where once one element of the problem seems to be solved, the solution proves to be faulty, or another problem arises; it is continually evolving (Bales, 2000). Due to the hidden nature of human trafficking, it is nearly impossible to identify all of the information essential to solving the problem. If the victims cannot be found or if they do not come forward, obtaining a comprehensive account of how they were trafficked, what their current living situations are, and how they can be rescued appears prohibitive (Hughes, 2001).

Since there is a continuous causal chain of limited access to victims, ruthless dealers, tactics involving coercion and force, and severe financial limitations, the problem multiplies in complexity as human trafficking systems establish and maintain themselves. Victims also experience many health repercussions from human trafficking such as frequent headaches, fatigue, dizziness, back pain, memory problems, anxiety, depression, and post-traumatic stress disorder (Abas, et al., 2013; Oram, et al., 2012; Zimmerman, et al., 2009). The mental, physical, and sexual risks associated with human trafficking add another layer to this wicked problem.

It is also important to note that solutions to human trafficking are never absolute, but rather lead to better or worse alternatives (3). Also, since there are no established criteria for solving wicked problems (6), there are few parallel situations to be consulted for possible solutions. Human trafficking is vastly different from other wicked problems that Rittel and Webber identify such as poverty, street crime, or constructing a subway in a large city. Thus, each wicked problem, in this case human trafficking, requires its own set of possible solutions.
Consider two more criteria for wicked problems. One cannot know if a proposed solution to a wicked problem will succeed (4), and often a trial-and-error system must be utilized (5). Combaters of human trafficking might design a plan to safeguard victims by placing them in 24-hour care facility that has full-time security to protect them. Are these precautions enough if the cycle of poverty is fueling the motivation to consent to be sex-trafficked? Only trial-and-error will demonstrate if the preventative measures will suffice. Whatever the threat may be, combaters will not know until they have already engaged themselves. There is, of course, a heightened danger if they should fail, as lives of the victims and, in some cases, the combaters, are involved (Andreas, 2010; Hughes, 2000).

Rittel and Webber (1973) reference “waves of consequences” (p. 163) as describing how a problem solver will not be able to determine if their perceived solution has succeeded until the implemented solution has completely run its course. This process may take longer than one’s lifetime, require large sums of money, and is often incapable of being fully documented. Related to human trafficking, the victim may be transferred, lost, or killed before the solution has run its course. This relates to another of Rittel and Webber’s wicked problem criteria, the planner has no right to be wrong (10). Since human trafficking situations are often incorrigible, the stakes are very high when trying to find a solution. Victims can be rescued if solutions are found.

Consider also that human trafficking as a wicked problem is unique (7) and can be a symptom of another problem (8). Human trafficking is unique because of the mix of economic, social, political, and legal factors that come into play in trying to combat this problem (Chuang, 2006). It is also likely symptomatic of other problems by considering where human trafficking originates. For example, trafficking is prominent in low-income neighborhoods or areas of
extreme poverty where there is a lack of well-paying jobs. Also, apathetic bureaucracies exacerbate the problems of a weak economy.

Campana and Varese (2016) state that “trafficking and exploitation are inextricably linked: victims of trafficking are forced into exploitative working conditions by the traffickers themselves or their associates” (p. 94). Increasing inequalities and poverty within countries “create marginalized populations without safety nets to ensure basic necessities such as food or shelter, nor social provisions such as education and health care. Groups in such positions provide a ready supply of trafficked persons” (Limoncelli, 2009, p. 79-80). Many times, traffickers take advantage of persons living in extremely poor economic situations and exploit them because they know they are in dire need of resources. This shows that a wicked problem can add to the intricacies of other wicked problems.

Lastly, the choice of explanation determines the nature of the problem’s resolution (9). As previously mentioned, since there is not a concrete list of criteria for solving human trafficking, each problem solver ranks potential solutions in accordance with their own worldviews. This means the solution chosen is often based off of what the problem solver deems to be most plausible. This can be highly problematic in regards to human trafficking. Unless the problem solver is someone who has survived being trafficked themselves, their worldviews will likely not align with the victim and therefore may not generate the best possible solution. Moreover, activists from Western countries often attempt to bring their knowledge to Eastern countries to combat traffickers. While their attempts may seem admirable, their worldviews often do not align with the victims in the country they are seeking to aid. The solutions that may be effective in combating traffickers in their countries are not transferrable to other countries.
The above literature illustrates the identification of human trafficking as a wicked problem. Based on Rittel and Webber’s (1973) characteristics of wicked problems and the many repercussions from being trafficked, it is clear that human trafficking is a wicked problem. It is beneficial to view human trafficking through a wicked problem lens for two major reasons. One, wicked problems cannot be managed like any other problem; they are unique and must be treated as such. Recognizing human trafficking as a wicked problem will shape how combaters address the problem. Second, although there are no criteria in place for solving wicked problems, work by Rittel and Webber (1973) and Grint (2010) establishes what needs to be done to begin managing wicked problems. Following the above criteria could assist combaters when fighting human trafficking. The following section reviews literature on specific problems associated with trafficking and what has previously been done to block traffickers.

Current Solutions

Many girls are not welcomed back to their families due to the stigma associated with sex work. If they were trafficked in their country of origin and did not leave, it is easier to return them to their hometown. However, if girls were transferred to another country, they are not permitted to stay in their destination country (O’Brien, 2013). “Rather, they are returned home as undocumented migrants, left to face the shame and humiliation that accompanies such categorization” (p. 413). There is often concern that if the victim returns home, they may be entered into an exploitative situation once again. Obviously, victims need other options besides returning to their country of origin.

Chuang (2006) states the problem that trafficking begins with the conditions that cause victims to migrate, which makes them vulnerable to exploitation. This is a common ideology with anti-human trafficking organizations as many of them have centered their efforts on
preventive measures. Chuang continues with placing globalization as one of the key problems leading to human trafficking, “the wealth disparities created by our globalized economy have fed increased intra- and transnational labor migration as livelihood options disappear in less wealthy countries and communities” (p. 140). Migrants are a vulnerable population; they are so desperate to escape economic hardship that they will accept dangerous migration arrangements. Chuang (2006) urges that long-term preventative measures be put in place to at least provide a temporary solution to this growing problem. She offers two preventative measures that may achieve this.

The first is to conduct meticulous assessments on the benefits and drawbacks of potential long-term effects of implemented solutions to human trafficking strategies. In other words, researchers need to evaluate how effective current anti-trafficking campaigns are and rectify where needed. The second measure is to utilize international human rights laws in order to provide a framework to focus on the root cause of human trafficking. This would involve not just analyzing the surface level problems of human trafficking (corrupt police officers, sadistic traffickers, and forces of coercion), but also researching the deeper causes of trafficking (oppression, gender and race inequality, and poverty). These two measures would serve as a promising start to managing this wicked problem.

UN Women (2012) recommends six preventative measures to improve the safety of women in India and to impede traffickers. The first is to establish police protocols and procedures for response to sexual violence. UN Women further asserts that these protocols must also be strictly enforced in order to advance trust from women and girls. If police not only create, but also implement stricter procedures, traffickers will begin to understand that they do not have police support and women and girls will likely be more trusting toward law officials.
Maintaining collaborative relationships with law enforcement is a key component in determining how effective organizations will be in combating human trafficking. As mentioned earlier by Hughes (2000), police corruption is a massive issue when combating traffickers; so gaining law enforcement support is instrumental.

Second is to further install help lines and have them advertised in public areas. The UN Women’s report also recommends continuous analysis of the help lines to discern their effectiveness. Many victims of trafficking are not aware help lines even exist. Increasing the prominence of help lines in preventative education would be advantageous.

Third, UN Women advise that men and boys should be taught about gender equality and increasing bystander intervention. Teaching boys at a young age to value women is an invaluable asset. If boys respect women, they are less likely to engage in trafficking initiatives as they mature. Fourth, and similarly, is to incorporate the conversation of gender equality and the use of violence into a school curriculum. This will also positively shape how young boys view females.

Fifth, UN Women recommends that the Criminal Law Amendment Bill of 2013, which outlaws “sexual harassment, voyeurism, and stalking” (p. 15) should be widely publicized. Knowledge of this amendment may deter men from stalking women, or more charges against men who harass should be brought. Lastly, another strong preventative measure is to frequently review the national research on sexual violence in public spaces in rural and urban areas. Increasing the review process provides current statistics and may provide valuable information for combaters on where their efforts may best be focused. Although more preventative measures could be added to this short list, it serves as a strong starting point to hamper human trafficking and sexual assault.
By adopting many of the above measures, many NGOs focus on prevention and awareness. This includes educating the public on labor migration (Borysova, 2014), informing men about the importance of valuing women (UN Women, 2015), and enlightening vulnerable populations on the dangers of traffickers (Nieuwenhuys & Pécoud, 2007). Due to the hidden nature of this industry, it is inconceivable to locate all traffickers and shut down their “businesses”. Instead, the listed preventative measures are viewed as the most attainable and long-term solutions to trafficking. As stated previously by Chuang (2006), more research needs to be completed on successfulness of preventative campaigns. This project will add to present literature and evaluate the effectiveness of current measures NGOs are utilizing. In the next section, NGO leadership and collaborative efforts will be evaluated.

**Leadership within Non-profits**

*Successful Non-profit Leadership*

To understand leadership in a human trafficking context, one must understand that most of the work being done to combat this wicked problem is being accomplished by non-profit organizations, some of which are government-backed, others not. Non-profits make an excellent combater to trafficking because they exude collaboration and have immense passion for the issue or cause they are fighting for. Renz and Herman (2010) differentiate between non-profits and for-profit organizations by clarifying that non-profits develop their product or service to attain some social value while for-profits develop to primarily make money. This means there will be some difference in leadership approaches.

Bramwell (2014) identifies two additional differences between non-profits and for-profits. Due to “its social role, non-profit are normally owned by a community sector/governing
board (rather than a businessman or woman), as a result leading to diffusion of control and accountability” (p. 89). The second difference is non-profit leaders must be more resourceful than for-profit organizations in regard to funding and obtaining clients. Due to the structure of non-profits, most NGO leaders will spend a majority of their time fundraising and focusing on internal operations (Bramwell, 2014). This added responsibility can sometimes hinder a leader’s effectiveness in fulfilling typical managerial requirements, such as supervising subordinates or promoting their organization within the community. Moore (2000) argued that leaders in non-profits should focus on the public value to be created and the operational capacity to deliver that value. In addition, they should provide general support to the organization.

NGOs are a common force working to manage human trafficking, however maintaining a functioning non-profit business can prove to be arduous. Even though passion is immensely beneficial, knowledge of how to run an organization is essential. NGO leaders must possess logistical knowledge on how to maintain a business, and they must gain followers, obtain consistent funding, and maintain the organization’s growth and progression.

Cronin and Genovese (2012) claim that all successful leaders must balance being both ruthless and cooperative in their jobs, or otherwise stated, being mean-spirited and sensitive, or ferocious and compassionate. I would argue that this paradox is one that NGO leaders may have difficulty balancing. Renz and Herman (2010) acknowledge nonprofits cater to more social and charitable purposes than most for-profit businesses.

Non-profit leaders also tend to have more humility than self-confidence and embody a compassionate nature (Carbone, 1993). Due to their encouraging character, many non-profit leaders may struggle with being ruthless and ferocious. Ruthlessness and ferociousness are
needed because excessive humility may paralyze the leader from achieving their mission. Cronin and Genovese (2012) urge that the successful leader must not show any doubt and completely believe in themselves.

As mentioned, non-profit leaders tend to be humble and compassionate (Carbone, 1993). Due to this characteristic, non-profit leaders must strive to exhibit self-confidence. Cronin and Genovese (2012) identify humility as “the ability to view and evaluate oneself honestly and without defensiveness,” but caution that “excessive humility paralyzes” (p. 9). They also distinguish between having a strong ego and a big ego. “A strong ego pays attention to others and context. A big ego craves flattery and attention” (p. 10). Non-profit leaders who lack self-confidence may struggle to provide the benefits a strong ego offers.

A key take away from Cronin and Genovese (2012) is that successful leaders will learn to balance being moral and manipulative, being a visionary and realist, and so on. Franklin Roosevelt, despite his moves toward social justice and peace also had a manipulative and secret side. As Cronin and Genovese state, “leaders can’t always combat evil with goodness” (p. 6). In some instances, effective leaders must choose between the lesser of two evils in order to be successful. However, leaders must always find a balance; otherwise leadership can be misused.

Most non-profit leaders could be identified as employing transformational leadership (Bramwell, 2014). According to Burns (1979), transformational leadership encompasses recognizing “existing needs of potential followers, they also look for potential motives and higher needs in followers. In this manner, they completely engage their followers and help them to achieve their fullest potential” (as cited in Thach & Thompson, 2007).
Almost all non-profit organizations have a mission or vision statement; some may be realistic while other may be vague or too ambitious. “A sold vision is a dream of a more desirable future, a dream realistic enough to appear attainable, compelling enough to inspire, and attractive enough to gain consent and commitment” (Cronin and Genovese, 2012, p. 13). Creating an effective vision statement can motivate employees and establish an attainable goal for the organization to strive for.

Rowe (2014) argues that many non-profit and for-profit organizations work with similar leadership styles. For example, both organizations require some form of visionary leadership. These leaders are focused toward the future and work to create a shared vision among stakeholders. However, this style of leadership can be problematic in NGOs if the vision is too idealistic and not focused enough on what needs to be accomplished short-term. It is for this reason that Rowe recommends balancing visionary leadership with managerial leadership (focused on short-term) to form strategic leadership (a combination of the two).

Moving on to the employees of non-profit organizations, Carlson and Schneiter (2001) acknowledge that they typically have strong personal commitments toward the organization’s mission and exude passion toward the vision. They add that servant leadership often appeals to the employees of non-profit organizations. Carlson and Schneiter (2001) define servant leadership as “a mission of care and service of others” (p. 298). Usually the person desires to first serve, and then aspires to lead. Servant leaders lead gently, but still effectively, which is why employees respond so well to them. Carlson and Schneiter conclude by stating that the first step of effective leadership is to connect the personal values of employees to the organization’s mission. Once this has occurred, powerful and effective non-profit leadership may ensue.
To summarize, the focus above was heavily on the internal leadership demands of non-profits. In the section below, I address more of the external leadership demands, specifically those involved in cross-sector partnerships.

Collaboration between NGOs

Koschman et al. (2012) discuss the effectiveness of cross-sector partnerships (XSPs), which involve businesses, the government, and civil society groups. Selsky and Parker (2005) identify cross-sector social-orientated partnerships (CSSPs) as organizations that “jointly address challenges such as economic development, education, health care, poverty alleviation, community capacity building, and environmental sustainability” (as cited in Koschman, et al, 2012, p. 850). Selsky and Parker asset that such problems increasingly require collaboration across multiple organizations. NGOs could greatly benefit from such collaboration.

Research shows the number of CSSPs have grown robustly in the past few decades (Berger, et al, 2004; Crane, 2000; Elkington & Fennell, 2000; Klitgaard & Treverton, 2003), both in advanced and developing economies (Oliveria & Tandon, 1994), (as cited in Selsky and Parker, 2005). Although these groups have a profound effect locally and globally, several obstacles hinder them. When different agencies collaborate among sectors, they are likely to have various views, have differing goals, and approach the issue inconsistently (Selsky & Parker, 2005). However, due to the structural limitations of non-profits acting alone, it is beneficial for them to partner with other sectors. Businesses may be interested in business-nonprofit partnership because participating in philanthropic endeavors may boost their social respect and trust (Millar et al., 2004). They may also profit from non-profit leaders through gauging public sentiment more effectively, as the NGO leaders tend to be more conscious and protective of their
organizations (Carbone, 1993). Non-profits may receive financial support or increased public acknowledgement from such partnerships, making the union beneficial for both parties.

Some scholars view a government-nonprofit partnership as less beneficial. For example, Hodgson (2004) contends a government-nonprofit partnership may only advance the causes of governmental organizations, as the state’s creation of manufactured civil society groups may be a means of controlling rather than empowering. Furthermore, these power-laced tensions “can increase levels of frustration and distrust between state and voluntary bodies and among groups themselves because governmental values are forced onto communities” (Selsky & Parker, 2005). Non-profits combating human trafficking may experience tension when collaborating with the government. Often the government does not have an insider’s view of the problem to the extent that the NGOs working directing against traffickers do. This leads to the government and non-profits disagreeing on best practices--and the costs associated with them--to address this wicked problem.

The tension between the government and non-profits leads Lister (2000) to question if “project-based development partnerships between non-profits and powerful donors can actually be considered partnerships, given the wide power disparities” (as cited in Selsky and Parker, 2005, p. 852). Non-profit leaders have to balance making sure their organization’s vision is not undermined by the government, but also must work collaboratively with its agents to effectively combat the problem. This balance is difficult to maintain and requires much control and skill from leaders. This thesis will add to current literature on government-nonprofit partnerships as many of the NGOs analyzed work directly with the state.

Collaboration in and of itself presents its own rewards and challenges. According to Poole (2013) collaboration is “the joint activity of two or more people which is directed by a
shared purpose, honors the perspectives and contributions of all parties involved and strives for a
high quality experience and outcomes for all parties” (p. 2). He makes the argument that having
a shared goal or purpose does not have to be a prerequisite for collaboration, rather the shared
purpose will evolve or materialize as the group continues to collaborate together. The goal of
collaboration is to create a “collaborative advantage” or one where both parties are going to
benefit from the partnership than if they tried to complete a task individually (Huxham, 2003;
Onyx et al., 2009).

However, there are many forms of collaborative leadership. Huxham and Vangen (1996)
observed that “many definitions of collaboration exist, and much alternative terminology has been
used at times interchangeably with it, including cooperation, coalition, partnership, or, on the
darker, collusion or co-option” (as cited in Lewis, 2006, p.138). According to Archer and
Cameron (2012), “collaborative leadership is the leadership required to get across organizational
boundaries” (p.89). In another study, Kramer and Crespy (2011) assert that leaders must
empower group members to co-construct the problem through dialogue while minimizing the
power differences. This enables member-to-member exchanges and permits followers to share
responsibility for decision-making.

Lewis (2006) argues that collaborative literature on non-profits involves a group of
people working together, but not losing their personal identities or collective identity as an
organization. Wenger and Snyder (2000) sum up collaboration as “groups of people informally
bound together by shared experience and passion for joint enterprise” (p. 139). Passion is a
particular quality likely to be a mark of a successful NGO combating human trafficking. Lewis
(2006) observed that while formal interactions must certainty take place, a strong collaboration
does not grow until “a specific type of relationship between participants develops” (p. 219). Of
course, this applies to relationships inside and outside of the organization, including cross-sector partnerships. Typically, scholars believe this relationship must strive for a heavy emphasis on equality.

Poole (2013) describes several paradoxes that apply directly to the collaborative efforts currently being made within NGOs combating human trafficking. One paradox Poole identifies is focusing on the immediate situation versus a long-range perspective. “Collaborators must have a sense of where they are going and of precedents and history as guideposts and as standards for judging the merit of their activities” (p. 13). This must also be balanced with focus on the present in order to accomplish the task on hand. This balance is essential for NGOs to manage if they desire to further their organization’s goal. Specifically, in regards to human trafficking, NGOs are driven to manage the immediate needs of victims. However, they must also focus on long-term goals to ensure their efforts may have a lasting effect, which means combating some of the root causes of human trafficking. But how does one solve the problem of poverty?

Another paradox Poole establishes is the paradox of individualism versus collectivity. He states an effective collaboration “cannot simply be the sum of individual contributions. The collaboration must be collective. Each collaborator must recognize the contributions of others” (p. 13). Most NGOs have a particular skill set that they utilize and therefore, effective collaborations can exponentially influence how successful their efforts are. NGOs must find the balance of applying their own unique skill set and yet recognize the contributions of other organizations in order for the collaboration to be collective. As the literature on cross-sector partnerships demonstrates (Koschman et al., 2012), how harmoniously the organizations collaborate has a major impact on the success of the overarching mission.
Critiquing a Western Lens

The above sections describe the research on internal and external leadership demands in non-profits, but it must be acknowledged that this work is solely based on Western organizations. Thus, it may be biased in terms of an overly rational view of the organization. For example, Chen (2002) discovered that several organizational approaches in the East involve rooting themselves in group harmony and shared accomplishment. In contrast, organizations with more Western values focus on individual performance and have a strong task-orientation.

Eastern countries’ concept of time is also more circular and process-oriented, with an emphasis on history and tradition. Western countries are more linear in relation to time and are deadline-oriented with a future-oriented mindset. This difference may cause the East to view the West as too quick paced and demanding, and it may cause the West to view the East as too slow and relaxed.

Chen and Miller (2011) assert that leaders in Eastern cultures are not only highly respected; they are viewed as “the embodiments of the spirit of their companies” (p. 9). Chen and Miller identify them as “vital actors” and “direction-setters” who shape the identities of their companies. Not to essentialize all Eastern approaches, but due to Eastern cultures being more process-oriented, they have the freedom to utilize their talents for long-term projects whereas Chen and Miller argue is not always the case for Western leaders as Western culture is driven by deadlines.

Chen and Miller (2011) identify that Eastern culture is much more integrative in business strategy and considers all things in terms of their relationship. In contrast, Western culture supports an analytic way of thinking where the whole of something is broken into smaller parts in order to be more easily understood.
Finally, Eisenberg (1984) and Eisenberg and Whetten (1987) show us that clarity and specificity are Western values, while Eastern values may favor ambiguity. In particular, Eisenberg (1984) asserts that strategic ambiguity is a valuable approach. First, it promotes unified diversity, which Eisenberg refers to as allowing “multiple interpretations to exist among people who contend that they are attending to the same message” (p. 231). Eisenberg and Whetten (1987) argue, “ambiguous missions and goals allow divergent interpretations to coexist and are more effective in allowing diverse groups to work together” (p. 422).

Second, strategic ambiguity can aid with organizational change. Eisenberg (1984) argues that organizations that maintain ambiguous goals have more room to maneuver, and it gives employees the freedom to alter operations more easily. Similarly, Eisenberg contends that employing ambiguous definitions is advantageous, as narrow definitions may exclude important information and overly broad definitions do not provide direction during times of change.

In short, different orientations towards ambiguity, collectiveness, integrative thinking, process, and time appear to be significant differences between leaders in the East and West. They provide a beginning set of criteria by which to evaluate a Western lens and see alternatives. Ideally, they will also sensitize me to the nature of the conclusions I draw about leadership effectiveness within non-profits combating human trafficking.

This review of literature shows there are opportunities to expand our knowledge of managing human trafficking as a wicked problem though collaborative or other forms of leadership. It is clear through my discussion of wicked problems that human trafficking can be identified as one. The research from this project will try to supply additional insight and/or solutions to the wicked problem of human trafficking. Similarly, this thesis will add to the
literature on leadership within non-profits and effective NGO collaborations. Thus, the driving research question for this research is as follows:

**RQ:** *How is leadership making a difference within non-profit organizations combating human trafficking?*

In this chapter, I reviewed current literature and found opportunities to expand the research base in the areas of wicked problems, solutions to human trafficking, and collaborative leadership in NGOs. The next chapter elaborates on the methodology used to collect and analyze the data that will answer my research question.
Chapter 3: Methodology

Preview of Methodology Sections

In this chapter, I describe the qualitative methods used to analyze how non-profit leaders and members frame human trafficking, what methods they employ to combat, and what measures they believe are most effective to apply for future combaters. I draw from Locke, Golden-Biddle, and Feldman’s (2008) discussion of Peirce’s (1976) concept of abduction, followed by Tracy’s (2013) iterative analysis, a form of abductive reasoning. The first part of the methods section describes the data collection process, while the second part describes the data analysis for this particular study.

Data Collection

The data for this project was collected through a secondary analysis of data obtained as part of a University of Cincinnati service learning course, “Transforming Lives: India” that traveled to India in May of 2015. As one of the students for the course, we visited nine NGOs dedicated to combating human trafficking in India, five of which were selected for this study.

For each of the NGO site visits, students heard PowerPoint presentations by non-profit leaders dealing with the subject of human trafficking, and then were given an opportunity to ask questions afterwards in a group setting. These sessions were recorded and are the basis of the data for this project. During the presentations, I took copious notes, which yielded 31 single-spaced, hand-written notes. No victims of human trafficking were actually involved in the presentations, and all victims referenced remained anonymous. Student documentaries were then created based on these presentations and follow-up question/answer sessions, which can now be found on YouTube.
Verbal consent and permission was given by the course instructor to utilize filmed material for purposes of this study. The Institutional Review Board (IRB) passed on a formal review of the proposal. IRB had deemed this project as involving non-human subjects as it is a secondary analysis. The information discussed for this study is identifiable, but not private information and I did not have additional interactions with the individuals after the group’s trip to India.

Regarding the question/answer sessions after the presentations, students were able to ask several open-ended questions pertaining to the daily functions of the organization represented, leadership challenges and styles, current methods employed for combating traffickers, and questions on the success of their past efforts. The presentations and question/answer sessions provided a comprehensive overview of each organization.

The presentations ranged from 60 to 90 minutes. Selection of the five NGOs for this study was based on clarity of the filmed footage. Clarity was determined by film quality and the clearness of the collected audio. Interviewees consisted of leaders, members, and activists associated with the non-profits. They were all Indian nationals, and most spoke English with only a few presentations requiring translation. The ages of the interviewees ranged from late 20s to late 50s and were balanced in terms of gender. The interviewees who gave the presentations also were all currently working directly with victims of human trafficking.

To address the leadership implications of this data set, I selectively transcribed any and all references to leadership, organizing, organizational structure, or organizational processes in the five presentations and question/answer follow-ups, which consisted of about 75% of the
interviews. This yielded approximately 19 single-spaced pages of transcribed material that allowed me to assess how leadership is making a difference within these non-profits.

Data Analysis

Peirce (1976) believed abduction is necessary for inquiry. He differentiated between deductive, inductive, and abductive reasoning by stating, “Deduction proves that something must be; induction shows that something actually is operative; abduction merely suggests that something may be” (Peirce, et al., 1931, p. 171; emphasis in the original). Thus, this constant back and forth between data and theory is neither purely inductive nor deductive (Ban, et al., 2013). Locke et al. (2008) argue that doubt drives abduction and leads the researcher to iteratively generate and test possibilities. This process is repeated until new concepts are produced that satisfy our doubt. For this reason, Locke et al. (2008) argue that doubt is essential to the research process. “The question is not whether, but how, to engage doubt” (p. 908; emphasis in original).

Locke et al. (2008) contend that doubt provides opportunities for abduction to create solutions or propositions and in that way spurs creativity. According to Locke et al., a researcher who engages and explores doubt can lead to great discovery. However, cultivating this doubt requires the researcher to embrace the idea of not knowing. This is sometimes extremely difficult for some researchers as they are often under pressure within academia to deliver their findings rapidly.

Lastly, Locke et al. discuss the importance of hunches and the discovery of blind alleys. They define hunches as “vaguely felt notions” (p. 913) that can assist the researcher with managing doubt and discovering something new. Blind alleys are the ideas that do not work out,
and although they may be frustrating to experience, Locke, et al. contend that they are an essential part of the discovery process. According to Paavola (2004), blind alleys may provide awareness on why one route is not working and may assist in developing new ideas surrounding the research topic. In order to determine if hunches are good ideas we must test them and discern if they lead to blind alleys, or substantive results.

It is with this mindset that I embraced a project surrounding the wicked problem of human trafficking. To analyze this data, I used grounded theory, a method that Charmaz (2006) defines as consisting of, “systematic, yet flexible guidelines for collecting and analyzing qualitative data to construct theories ‘grounded’ in the data themselves” (p. 2).

Specifically, I utilized an iterative analysis, a grounded theory technique by Tracy (2013) that is more abductive than the inductive approach of a pure grounded theory. That is, researchers consider existing theories and research along with emergent qualitative data in a repetitive, constant comparison process until no new themes emerge. Glaser and Strauss (1967) identify constant comparison as “a method of joint coding and analysis… by using explicit coding and analytic procedures” (p. 102). Iteration is “not a repetitive mechanical task,” but rather a reflexive process in which one develops meaning by visiting and revisiting the data while connecting emerging insights with extant literature, which then refines the researcher’s focus and understanding (Srivastava & Hopwood, 2009, p. 77). In this case, I drew from the extensive literatures on leadership, nonprofit leadership, wicked problems, and human trafficking to help me understand these leadership dynamics.

After selectively transcribing the five presentations, I recorded any mention of the speakers referencing leadership, organizing, organizational structure, or organizational processes.
After this first level of coding, I then conducted a second round of coding, which led to four themes emerging and are the subject of my four findings. Throughout coding, I drew from literature on wicked problems, human trafficking, and non-profit leadership.

In this chapter, I described my data collection for this project and explained how I utilized an iterative analysis to examine the data. The next chapter will highlight my findings from this process.
Chapter 4: Results

Preview of Results Sections

The goal of this research is to better understand what methods are currently being utilized by Indian non-profits to combat human trafficking and discern what procedures can be recommended to other non-profits. This study also seeks to expand the communication literature surrounding organizational collaborative non-profit leadership by asking the question:

How is leadership making a difference within non-profit organizations combating human trafficking?

My findings can be divided into four thematic sections: 1) communication of organization mission and value statements (or lack thereof); 2) cross-sector partnerships; 3) language and definition issues; 4) intervention practices. In order to discuss these findings properly, it is important to first provide more details about the organizations under investigation.

Description of the Five NGOs

Jagruthi

Jagruthi is based in Bangalore, a city in the Southern part of India. The non-profit organization was founded in 1995 after director and founder, Renu Appachu met Mother Teresa. She was so impressed by Mother Teresa’s work that she was motivated to create the organization in order to make an impact on society. “Jagruthi” means awareness, so the organization is focused on providing awareness on sexual exploitation to nearby vulnerable populations in Bangalore to prevent the spread of Sexually Transmitted Diseases (STD) and the Human
Immunodeficiency Virus (HIV). It is a child-centered program for females who have been commercially or sexually exploited or abused.

*Shakti Vahini*

Shakti Vahini is located in New Delhi, which is the capital of India and is in the Northern region of India. The president and founder of the organization, Ravi Kant, started Shakti Vahini in 2001 because he found anti-trafficking work lacking strong programs on providing legal aid or prosecution of traffickers. Kant created the organization to facilitate and promote investigations on sex trafficking, bonded labor, child labor, and forced marriages, which result in the prosecution of traffickers. According to Kant, the organization has achieved about 18 convictions since 2010. Kant says this is a huge amount because conviction rates against traffickers are usually at 1% or 2% based on all cases.

*Rescue Foundation*

The Rescue Foundation is in Mumbai, a large Indian city on the West coast. The non-profit was started in 2000 by Balkrishna Acharya who was unfortunately killed in a car accident in 2005. Acharya became aware of what was occurring in Mumbai’s red light district, but lack of finances caused him to reach out to other organizations for support. He realized that he could achieve better results if he organized rescue operations under an officially government-recognized NGO. Acharya’s wife, Triveni Acharya, was nominated as the new president after her husband’s death in 2005. She continues his work of rescuing, rehabilitating, reintegrating, and repatriating women and children who have been trafficked.
Anyay Rahit Zindagi

Anyay Rahit Zindagi (ARZ) was conceived in 1997 by a group of development professionals from the Tata Institute of Social Sciences in Mumbai in order to fight commercial sexual exploitation. It is located in Goa, a city on the Western coast and the smallest state in India. ARZ identifies as a social work organization that combats traffickers specifically in regard to sexual abuse and commercial sexual exploitation in Goa. In 2006, they established Swift Wash, a laundry business that provides an opportunity for trafficked women to work and earn money.

Video Volunteers

Video Volunteers was established in 2003 by Jessica Mayberry after she spent a year as a fellow of the American India Foundation where she trained rural Indian women in filmmaking. Video Volunteers is also based out of Goa. They identify as an international community media organization that equips people in underdeveloped areas with video journalism skills. It is their hope that through their partnerships with communities they will expose underreported stories and enable marginalized communities to take action against poverty, injustice, and inequality. The following sections will provide details on the four major findings resulting from the five presentations of these NGOs.

Organization Vision and Mission Statements

The five NGOs had a mixture of strong to weak communication of their vision and mission statements. Vision statements articulate a future path for the organization to follow (Bennis & Nanus, 1986). Mission statements articulate an organizational purpose and sometimes include a statement of values, which describes what “really matters or counts” in an organization.
(Orhan, et al., 2014). All are believed necessary for organizations to thrive, whether they are for-profit organizations or non-profits (Yozgat & Karataş, 2011). Consider the five organizations I studied:

First, Jagruthi had the strongest display of statements in their presentation. The presenter proclaimed their vision as, “A world where every child is protected and enabled to enjoy his or her rights, and leads a value-based life.” They cited their mission statement as:

This is the mission of Jagruthi: it exists to protect children and their rights through a process of community education, motivation, and intervention; neutralizing the influences that could deprive program participants of safe childhood; upholding their right to dignity and self-esteem; ensuring that they will not be subjected to any form of discrimination; and be safeguarded from all forms of exploitation in the best traditions of transparency and accountability.

The vision establishes what the organization hopes to achieve in the future and the mission statement provides details for how they will reach their goal (Orhan, et al., 2014). Although the leader for this organization was not able to be present during our meeting, the employees appeared energized by the vision and mission of the organization communicated by their leader through constant and enthusiastic repetition of these statements.

Second, Ravi Kant, the founder and president of Shakti Vahini did not explicitly state a vision or mission statement during his presentation. Thus, when his presentation concluded, our group was very unclear what his organization specifically did and had to ask him many clarifying questions. Kant is obviously passionate about combating human trafficking, which was evident through his detailed explanations of explaining the problem of human trafficking in India and what is needed to combat it, but an ingrained vision or mission statement should be able to be articulated in just a few words.
On the organization’s website, however, their mission is written as, “Aspiring and striving for a just, free, and equitable society. We consider it a duty of every citizen to have social concerns and strive for the progress and development of society.” Underneath this statement, they add a description of their values, “In our efforts and struggle to achieve the above, we draw our inspirations from our rich civilization, plurality of culture, spirit of our Democratic Constitution, National Movement for freedom struggle, [and] lives and teaching of our great leaders.” Thus, the values they expose include participation and democracy, diversity, and independence.

As mentioned, we were puzzled by the fact that Kant had a mission and values statement, but failed to mention these or a vision statement when meeting with us. Although we were not able to meet with any of his employees, we were left to wonder if Kant was also short on details with his staff. The literature on organizational vision and mission statements suggests that it is not enough to possess such statements; one must also communicate them clearly (Bennis & Nanus, 1986).

Third, the presentation by the Rescue Foundation was one of the few presentations that had to be translated. As such, it was sometimes difficult to find an English word to match a Hindi word, or not all information was expressed accurately through the translator. While there was no mention of a vision or mission statement in their talk, they also provide a brief mission statement on their website: “The Rescue Foundation is an organization that’s working on trafficking, they work in the red light areas, and they rescue women and girls who have forcefully landed up in trafficking situations.” The website does not contain an elaboration on their values in the way that Kant’s organization did.
Fourth, the two presenters representing ARZ also did not mention a vision or mission statement. On their website, however, they present a brief mission statement: “ARZ is a social work organization committed to combating trafficking of persons for the purpose of sexual abuse and commercial sexual exploitation in Goa. The organization works both with the victims of commercial sexual exploitation, and also against those who are perpetrators.” On their webpage, they also have a section labeled “ARZ Philosophy” which states:

Commercial sexual exploitation of persons is the most heinous crime against human beings. Commercial sexual exploitation is a form of bonded slavery that results in consistent and unrecognized victimization of the most marginalized and stigmatized group in society. Through effective social work intervention it is possible to limit trafficking of human beings as well as limit abuse and exploitation of trafficked victims.

Their philosophy points to a vision of the organization: to limit all future human trafficking, abuse, and exploitation of victims. However, the organization’s mission and vision statements were never stated during the presentation, which again raises questions about employees’ comprehension of these statements.

The fifth NGO, Video Volunteers, also did not clearly state a vision or mission statement during their presentation. However, their representative articulated two goals for the organization:

There are two main things we are trying to tackle. The first being the absolute lack of marginalized communities being represented on mainstream media platforms and the second being filling the massive gap that exists between these marginalized communities and access to the media to obtain information they need.
These goals were in line with the mission statement on their website: “Our mission is to empower the world’s poorest citizens, to right the wrong they witness by becoming players in the global information revolution.”

What conclusions can we draw from this data? First, every organization had a mission statement, at the very least, on their website. Second, in at least two cases, their mission statements appeared brief, almost perfunctory. Third, organizations differed greatly in their ability to articulate their mission, vision, or values during their presentations, which is concerning because a mission or vision statement must be communicated to be effective (Ledford et al., 1995 & Wheatley, 1992). Only one of the five organizations could clearly articulate their vision/mission statements in person. Moving on, the next section will elaborate on the current cross-sector partnerships these NGOs have formed.

**Cross-Sector Partnerships**

The five organizations were all variously involved with cross-sector partnerships (XSPs), which may be defined as when either businesses, the government, or civil society groups work together toward a common cause (Koschman et al., 2012). The five NGOs engage with three primary partnerships, they are: the police, other NGOs, and the government.

Two of the five non-profits are currently attempting to improve relations with the police. Kant from Shakti Vahini acknowledges that blame for trafficking cannot be placed entirely on law enforcement because they have not received proper training on how to combat trafficking. He believes a major flaw in the justice system is that there is not enough proper training taking place. Part of Shakti Vahini’s mission includes working with law enforcement agencies to train them on how to handle trafficking situations or violence against women. Shakti Vahini and ARZ
both provide skill building for police who conduct rescues. Specifically, they have tried to teach police to regard women and men as victims instead of the accused, and they have trained them on how to handle the victim and how to identify human trafficking cases in the field.

Recall that one of UN Women’s (2012) recommendations was to increase police presence when combating human trafficking. They believe that if police protocols are enforced and abided by, then traffickers will recognize that they do not have police support and women and girls may become more trusting of public officials. ARZ has also worked to increase police presence in the field. During their presentation, they expressed that when they find someone who is need of being rescued from an exploitative situation, they immediately share that information with the police in order to work together to rescue the victim. “We share [information] with each other and work out a plan on how to get them out.” The relationships that are slowly being formed between the police and organizations are a promising start between combaters and law enforcement.

In addition to the police, all of the leaders emphasized the importance of collaborating with other NGOs. Jagruthi explained that many of their rescued children are referred to from other NGOs whom they have named their “support system.” We are “connected to other NGOs, so we do get referred for children to be sheltered, or we refer children.” This idea of a support system indicates a reliance on each other to succeed and coincides with Wenger and Snyder’s (2000) definition of collaboration as “groups of people informally bound together by shared experience and passion for joint enterprise” (p. 139).

Video Volunteers like Jagruthi, also accept references from other NGOs. Video Volunteers’ presenter said they are “very consciously” recruiting through other NGOs to ensure
their correspondents are rooted in their communities. We “ask NGOs to suggest people who they think fit a profile. They must be economically backward, and they must belong to a minority community or vulnerable community.” Video Volunteers recognizes that many of their correspondents result from suggestions from other NGOs. Without these suggestions, they would most likely not have found many of the communities that have been impacted by their work.

ARZ recognized that there was a gap between many non-profit organizations. One presenter explained, “If I am working in Goa, people in other states, they don’t know about our organization in Goa even though we are working on the same issue.” So, they created a web portal called stoptrafficking.in, which they describe as a data bank where more than 2,500 non-profits from India, Nepal, and Bangladesh who combat trafficking are registered. This web portal enables NGOs from various areas to know of each other’s existence and collaborate with one another. ARZ exhibits collaborative leadership by finding means to “get across organizational boundaries” (Archer & Cameron, 2012, p.89).

On the web portal, ARZ also created a missing person’s directory where any non-profit can upload someone who is missing. This allows all NGOs in the database to view the missing person and based on where the person may have gone, they can identify which organization can take up the issue and contact the local police. In addition, ARZ circulates a newsletter on any new human trafficking initiatives or practices to the data base.

ARZ also work with for-profits such as hospitals and private psychiatrists. ARZ presenters explained that through counseling the victims, they have discovered that many of them struggle with addiction. They have an addiction program set up through the state hospitals,
and for cases of victims suffering from extreme anxiety and depression, they go to a private psychiatrist. ARZ acknowledges that they are not certified to handle addiction or extreme anxiety or depression cases, so they collaborate with hospitals and professional psychiatrists to take care of the victim’s mental state. Through these collaborations, the victim is better served.

Finally, the third category of XSPs involve the government. For example, ARZ collaborates with the government, especially when transferring a victim back to their home state. They contact the NGO from the source state, involve the government, and rely on the state government to pay for the transfer of the victim. ARZ leaders admit that without the support from these various organizations, it would be nearly impossible for them to return the victim back to the source state safely.

ARZ operates in Goa, which is the smallest state in India, making it easier for ARZ representatives to work directly with the government. As one of the ARZ representatives said:

Goa is the smallest state in India so it becomes much easier for the magistrate to come [to us] because the work load is much less. It is much easier to communicate and talk with them and for them to give their time. We have been sharing this with other NGOs to see how they can implement it.

ARZ specifically assisted the Goan government with a law that was endorsed by the Supreme Court that calls each state in India to ask the rescued trafficked victim what they want to do. Rather than forcing them into a shelter home or making them go back to their families, rescuers are now required to let the victim decide what their next step is.

The leaders of ARZ and Shakti Vahini both believe it is essential to collaborate with lawmakers and continue to strengthen laws against trafficking. Shakti Vahini receives 20-30%
of their budget from the government of India. He claims that one of their biggest supporters since 2007 has been the United States Department of State’s Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons, which comprises 80% of their support. Shakti Vahini has been a large recipient of international grants distributed from the United States. The two non-profits represent an advantageous relationship between non-profits and the government.

Shakti Vahini’s founder, Ravi Kant, says it best when he states:

I know that a small amount of work is being done by us, and a small amount of work is being done by other NGOs and the government. It will all together turn into a big thing which will lead to the future. Small things can change big things, which we are all trying to do.

In contrast, Jagruthi was actually formed because their leader, Renu Appachu, found that the government was not actively working to fight trafficking and thus, she decided to make an impact herself. Similarly, the Rescue Foundation discovered that there are certain interventions the government will assist with such as rescue, but they are not as involved with the rehabilitation process. Rehabilitation was a major gap in the recovering process that non-profits fill.

It is clear that XSPs are very important and becoming increasingly popular among organizations (Selsky & Parker, 2005). The collaborations these five NGOs have formed reinforces data from a decade ago and shows collaboration taking place across three main sectors: with the police, with other non-profits, and with the government. The strongest collaborations were between the police and other non-profits, which are making a difference when combating human trafficking. The next section will discuss the language these non-profits utilize when addressing human trafficking.
Language and Definition Issues

While non-profits may be trying to support the victims, other forms of human trafficking are ignored because the focus is kept solely on sex trafficking. With such a narrow focus, all other victims of bonded and forced labor and involuntary domestic servitude appear forgotten. Did the five NGOs under analysis subscribe to this narrow definition of human trafficking? Some did more than others.

First, at the beginning of their presentation, Jagruthi identified as a child-rights organization that “understand(s) that child exploitation entails various forms of forced or dangerous labor, child trafficking, and child prostitution. It refers to a broad range of situations, whereby children are abused physically, verbally, sexually, or when they are submitted under unsatisfactory conditions as either forced or voluntary employment.” After the presenter acknowledged that there are many forms of child exploitation, they did a thorough job of incorporating all forms of child trafficking throughout the rest of their presentation. Jagruthi was one of the few NGOs that seemed to comprehend that all forms of human trafficking should be equally weighed.

Second, Kant from Shakti Vahini has a great amount of passion for the issue of precisely defining human trafficking. He provided a lot of background information on what he determined was human trafficking. However, every reference to anti-trafficking work was focused on sex trafficking. When referring to how victims of human trafficking are viewed, Kant said, “A sex worker is never arrested nowadays because we don’t treat them as a victim.” The only distinction he made was between sex workers and prostitutes:

We are not against woman in prostitution, we are only against traffickers. Woman in prostitution are in a separate group, which is a big group, and they need all the rights,
which any woman in this country need to have. Despite prostitution being a crime in India, woman in prostitution still need to be taken care of and opportunities need to be provided for them. So that if they want to come out, they can have some choices.

This shows that Kant felt the need to heavily focus on the differences between sex trafficking and prostitution, instead of acknowledging the various distinctions of human trafficking. Raja (2013) states that language is the “primary channel through which cultural concepts, ideas and practices are floated” (p. 1). Kant’s description is thus problematic based on what he excludes from the definition of human trafficking.

Third, the Rescue Foundation also narrows human trafficking to just sex trafficking. The very first thing the Rescue Foundation presenter said was, “Rescue Foundation is an organization that’s working on trafficking, we work in the red light areas, and we rescue women and girls who have forcefully landed up in trafficking situations.” Although they mention trafficking situations as a general term, for the entirety of their presentation, they only referenced sex trafficking.

Fourth, ARZ presenters also began with stating they wanted to provide a comprehensive understanding of trafficking, “We thought we would give you a little bit of a picture or scenario of what is the situation of human trafficking in India.” However, throughout their entire 90 minute presentation, they did not mention any form of human trafficking besides sexual exploitation. There were many instances where they could have introduced other forms of trafficking, such as when they talked about turbulent home lives or poor economic situations leading to trafficking, but they always related it to sex trafficking.

During their entire presentation, they referenced sex trafficking 22 times and other forms of human trafficking zero times. When speaking about their relationship with the police, they said the police often contact them because, “ARZ is a well-known NGO of the anti-human
trafficking unit.” This seems in need of being rephrased to “a well-known NGO of the anti-sex trafficking unit.”

Unlike Shakti Vahini, ARZ representatives equate trafficking with prostitution. When discussing the need to protect the victim’s privacy, one presenter said, “So later no one can blackmail the girl and say you were in prostitution. Because there is a lot of stigma toward a girl when she gets trafficked.” Like Shakti Vahini, ARZ only discussed sex trafficking and prostitution and not other forms of human trafficking.

Fifth, Video Volunteers had a mixture of all forms of human trafficking. They mentioned various forms of trafficking throughout their presentation. However, they also seemed to separate sex trafficking from other forms of human trafficking because they regarded the former as problematic. For example, the presenter said, “ Trafficking is a slightly more complicated issue than the other stories we pick up, like abuse, fair compensation, and equal wages, those are relatively easier problems to fix.”

What can we draw from this data? First, only one of the non-profits successfully acknowledged all forms of human trafficking in their presentation. Second, three of the NGOs were biased toward defining human trafficking only as sex trafficking. This disparity is troubling as it is clear from many of the presentations that there is heavy emphasis on sex trafficking while other forms of human trafficking are pushed to the back burner. The final section will present each NGO’s intervention practices to understand what means they are taking to combat human trafficking.
Intervention Practices

As presented in the literature review, there are many current attempts underway to manage human trafficking. In this section, I will review intervention practices that are currently in place for each of the five NGOs. Organizational practices are defined as “the behavioural, cognitive, procedural, discursive and physical resources through which multiple actors are able to interact in order to socially accomplish collective activity” (Jarzabkowski, et al., 2007). Although the five non-profits may have different practices, they are all centered on intervention to stop human trafficking and aid its victims.

First, Jagruthi identified their main practices as rescue, rehabilitation, reintegration, and follow-up. Since they identify as a child-rights organization, they established their target community as trafficked children, including: children who are in domestic work, sex work, child labor, children who are illegally adopted, and children who are begging on the streets. To reach their target audience, they conduct field-based interventions.

Field-based interventions are when field workers “identify, rescue, and rehabilitate children who are in vulnerable situations.” They befriend the scared children, “they talk to them, listen to them, bring them to our shelter, and then they enter the process of rehabilitation.” Jagruthi provides a shelter for the children that they are brought to. “After identified in the field, they are motivated to join a rehabilitation center; we provide shelter, education, medical treatment, and also reintegration into the mainstream society.”

At the shelter they have various schools and programs such as: a preschool, a sexual health clinic, awareness programs to educate adolescents, and a skill development program. After the children complete school, Jagruthi assists them in searching for a job, or if they want to
marry, they allow them to stay at the shelter until they do. They also assist the children if they decide they want to identify their parents. Jagruthi maintains a very hands-on approach and once they rescue a child, they take care of them until they are ready to be reintegrated back into society, no matter how long it takes.

Second, the Rescue Foundation also takes on this approach, with three current shelter homes built, and a fourth in progress. The Rescue Foundation focuses on medical treatment, counseling, and persecution. As soon as the victim is rescued, they undergo a medical examination and are assigned a counselor to support them. The presenter for Rescue Foundation was one of the councilors; she described her job as difficult because many of the victims lie, they lie about themselves, about their family, their background, their name, and their age. It is because of “the stigma, it’s the fear, it’s the intimidation. They wonder, where will I go? What are my options?” After they receive the true story from the victims they attempt to prosecute the traffickers and support the victims in court.

Third, Video Volunteers have different practices from Jagruthi and Rescue Foundation. They do not bring vulnerable or exploited people to a shelter, but rather try to empower them in their local communities.

We select people from some of the most vulnerable communities in India. They include tribes, women, sexual minorities, religious minorities; those are the sort of groups that we work with. We give them a two week intensive training on journalism, video making, and knowledge of basic rights like access to health care, water, education, and untouchability.

Once the people have received their training, they go back to their communities and begin filming their exploitative situations. They then send the raw footage back to Video Volunteers who edit them, put them on the web, and distribute them to news channels such as Al
Jazeera, the Huffington Post, and MTV EXIT. Once the videos have been produced, Video Volunteers takes the footage back to the communities for screenings to begin a place of discussion on the issue.

The Video Volunteer presenter indicated that “when correspondents make a video on an issue, they are actively seeking to change it.” Their ultimate goal is for the videos to reach the authorities and have them bring about change to solve the issues. Video Volunteers has had success according to their presenter, they have trained a total of 300 community partners and enabled 17,000 people to take action and implement local solutions, which has directly benefited 635,000 people.

Fourth, ARZ combines providing shelter for victims and empowering them to make change where they are. Once they rescue a victim, they take them to the magistrate who refers them to a government-run shelter home. ARZ does not have its own shelter home, but rather works as a social agency to place victims in a safe place.

As O’Brien (2013) stated, trafficked victims are not permitted to stay in their destination country. A large role of ARZ is to return the victim to their country or state safely. They work with NGOs in the home state who conduct a home study to determine if it is safe for the victim to return. If it is determined to be safe, many government officials are involved with the transfer of the victim. During the transfer, nearly ten representatives from various departments are there to witness the handing over. This is all done to ensure the victim is not returning to an exploitative situation.

If the victim’s country of origin is India, they enter a rehabilitation program. Counseling, after-care services, recreational activities, self development, self exploration activities, group
therapy, and group activities are provided during the program. They also work with the families back in the victim’s community to see if they will receive acceptance and support from their family, peers, and community if they return. Even if the family was responsible for entering the person into the exploitative situation, ARZ will still work with them in order to see if they will accept their child; they want the family and community to be a part of the rehabilitation process. This involvement is carefully monitored; if they believe the family is not willing to change, they will move the victim to a shelter home.

If the victim is too old for school, ARZ gives them the opportunity to take computer classes or beautician training. ARZ also owns and operates a laundry mat called Swift Wash. This is a place for trafficked women to work and provides an economic alternative to either sex work or forced labor. The presenters explained that it is not enough to just rescue victims; they must also ensure that they are able to support themselves after they have escaped exploitative situations. They believe that the victims need to reach a sense of normalcy and should not be continuously treated as victims; working full-time is a way to begin this process.

Fifth, Shakti Vahini also does not intervene through shelter homes, but rather assists the victims in persecuting the traffickers. Their main practice is to not only focus on the future by strengthening laws against trafficking, but also to look into the past to convict the traffickers that have exploited their clients. Since 2010, Kant stated that they have achieved 18 convictions, which is a huge amount due to the overall low success rate of convictions against traffickers.

Since they do not represent the client, they are not permitted to appear in the court during the case. As a NGO, they may appear as a private person in a criminal case so they can observe the proceedings in the court, but are not able to engage. Instead, they encourage the victim to
follow through with the case, as many times the victim and their family are either threatened or bought out by the traffickers. Kant said his team realized they must remain with the victim “until the last breath” in order to assure they are not bought out or scared away. Their main practice when working with trafficking victims is to “plug all of the loopholes” that are utilized by the traffickers to prolong the cases, such as: threats, bribes, making sure parts of the defense council do not show for the court date, not having a translator for the victim, or traffickers requesting the court date to be extended. Through these practices, Kant says they are “getting wonderful results.”

Although their primary practices focus on intervention, all of the NGOs emphasized the importance of moving toward prevention. Non-profits are searching for ways to prevent trafficking in order to avoid some exploitative situations. Their primary tool is awareness; they are beginning to travel to local villages and teach men and young boys the importance of valuing women. They are working feverishly with law enforcement to build a relationship with them; their hope is to empower police officers and law officials to create stronger laws against trafficking and enforce them. The non-profits are also conducting research to understand how victims enter exploitative situations and discover the root causes of trafficking. So far, the organizations found that many situations result from extreme poverty and an unhealthy home life. They plan to continue research in order to unveil the core origins of trafficking.

This data shows that NGOs are currently combating trafficking in three primary ways, all which center on intervention. The first is through the facilitation of shelter homes, which aid the victims in reintegrating into society. The second is empowering victims of exploitative situations wherever they are; intervening in their actual communities and attempting to change the system. The third practice is remembering the past in order to bring guilty traffickers to
justice. Despite the accomplishments of these practices, all non-profits indicated a need to move toward prevention practices.

In this chapter, I presented the findings from this study, which can be divided into four categories: organization mission and value statements, cross-sector partnerships, language and definition issues, and intervention practices. The implications of these themes are the subject of the next chapter.
Chapter 5: Discussion

This study analyzes the organizational practices of five Indian NGOs currently combating human trafficking. The data results from a study abroad trip where students attended presentations given by non-profit leaders and employees about their organizations. Data analysis offered four themes that generated insights into how best practices of the NGOs should be managed.

Organization Vision and Mission Statements

My first finding was the use of vision and mission statements by the NGOs. While most organizations will often have a vision and mission statement, there are notable differences between the two. According to Orhan et al. (2014) a vision statement is formed as part of the first steps of strategic organizational planning and will set the business up to survive for a long period of time. They define a vision statement as a future-orientated term, meaning that it describes what the firm wants to be in the future. In contrast, the mission statement is a “declaration of an organization’s ‘reason for being’” (p. 252); it describes what the organization does.

As shown in the analysis, the five NGOs ranged in successful use of vision statements. Some explicitly stated each during their presentations, while others never mentioned them even though they were displayed on their webpage. Why is this important? According to Fairhurst (1993), the leader of an organization must actively and effectively promote the organization’s vision statement, “Just as an artist works from a plate of colors to paint a picture, the leader who manages meaning works from a vocabulary of words and symbols to paint an image in the mind of the member” (p. 3) and, we would add, its other stakeholders. When the leader or leaders of
an organization craft a vision and mission statement it is imperative that they have their internal and external audiences in mind. They should frequently and readily articulate such statements to them, much as high reliability organizations do to ensure effective performance (Weick, Sutcliffe & Obstfeld, 2005).

Only one of the NGOs (Jagruthi) stated their vision statement during their presentation and ARZ was the only non-profit to have a vision statement on their organization’s webpage. Jagruthi’s presenter energetically introduced the company’s vision statement, showing he had understanding of what his organization is working towards. Jagruthi received the least amount of questions out of the other organizations during the presentations likely because they had a comprehensive overview of their organization.

The projection of mission statements had a different response. Jagruthi was the only organization to present their mission statement during their presentation. All of the other NGOs had a perfunctory display of their mission statements on their website. Ledford et al. (1995) and Wheatley (1992) state that “under-communicating the Mission Statement sends a message that the Mission Statement is little more than window dressing, not a set of useful, identity-shaping ideas that members can and should use to weather chaos and turbulence in the environment” (as cited in Fairhurst, et al., 1997, p. 245). This can cause the mission statement to be reinterpreted or misunderstood.

This data supports the literature in that the organization that explained their mission statement during their presentation was the best received by the students. The vision and mission statements point to where the organization wants to go and how they are going to get there. Kant, the founder of Shakti Vahini, never mentioned the organization’s vision statement, nor
explicitly stated what the non-profit hopes to reach. Thus, in agreement with the literature, his external audience (the students at his presentation) were unclear on what his organization stood for. While he maintained zeal for the issue, he lacked clarity on how his own organization was striving to combat human trafficking. Only through student’s prompting, did he answer our questions and give us a more holistic understanding of his non-profit.

This causes me to wonder: if Kant and the other presenters did not adequately articulate their vision and mission to a group of students, who else are they not reaching? Employees? Potential donors? Other possible collaborators? Victims? As the literature shows, in order to build a strong organization, leaders must create and consistently use their vision and mission statements. Through constant repetition, employees and external audiences are more likely to comprehend the organization’s purpose (Ingenhoff & Fuhrer, 2010).

**Cross-Sector Partnerships**

My second finding is the formation of three cross-sector partnerships with the police, other NGOs, and the government. As discussed by Koschman et al. (2012), cross-sector partnerships (XSPs) are becoming more and more popular. Selsky and Parker (2005) add that massive problems (such as wicked problems) require collaboration among multiple organizations. However, many scholars have debated whether or not government and non-profit partnerships are actually advantageous (Hodgson, 2004; Lister, 2000; Mirabella & Wish, 2001).

Some believe that governmental organizations are only interested in advancing their own interests and thus the partnership may be a means of controlling rather than empowering (Hodgson, 2004). This viewpoint is seen from two of the non-profits, while two others currently have a very positive relationship with the government.
Jagruthi and Rescue Foundation both believe that the government does not actively work to combat traffickers. It is for this reason that Jagruthi’s leader formed their organization; they did not feel enough was being done, specifically by the government to fight trafficking so they intervened. Similarly, Rescue Foundation did not think enough was being done by the government surrounding rehabilitation, so that is where they focused most of their effort.

Although these two NGOs had a negative experience with the government, the collaborations being built between Shakti Vahini, ARZ, and the government indicate that the dynamics between non-profits and the government may be improving. As Selsky and Parker, (2005) stated, often the government does not have an insider’s view of the problem to the extent that the NGOs working against the issue do. Thus, the non-profit perspective provides a valuable asset for the government. Through their collaboration with the government, Shakti Vahini and ARZ have greatly increased their amount of rescues and an ARZ presenter even admitted that a lot of what their organization achieves would not be possible without government assistance. This finding is important because it points to change in non-profit and government relations and indicates that collaboration between the two may be beneficial for both parties.

Another important relationship that is being built by Shakti Vahini and ARZ is with local police. As mentioned previously, these two non-profits have worked to not blame police for trafficking incidents and instead work with them. Through their collaborative efforts, more arrests and rescues have been made, and they hope to change victim’s perceptions of the police. If they change their perceptions, the victims may view the police as an ally rather than an enemy. Improved relations with the police would also reduce traffickers’ reliance on bribing police to overlook exploitation. Although it is idealistic to assume all police will resist bribes from
traffickers, increased collaborative efforts between non-profits and the police point to a move
toward law enforcement and NGOs fighting for the same thing.

The last major XSP is between the five non-profits analyzed and other non-profits. Almost all of the NGOs indicated in their presentations that it was essential for non-profits nationally and internationally to collaborate and work toward the issue. Although there have been various collaborative efforts among non-profits, ARZ was the only organization to mention working with for-profits such as hospitals and private psychiatrists. Although the other non-profits may collaborate with for-profits, their relationships were not prevalent enough to mention in their presentations. This indicates that other non-profits may be missing out on important relationships with for-profits, ones that could greatly improve their efforts toward combating trafficking.

This uneven quantity of XSPs illustrates that the five organizations may not be utilizing all their resources to their fullest advantage. For example, only Shakti Vahini and ARZ seem to have strong relationships with the government and the police. If the other three organizations also collaborated with these two groups, then their amount of rescues, arrests, and overall success of their organization may increase tremendously. If this gap in collaboration was filled, traffickers may have a lower chance of productivity.

Language and Definition Issues

Human trafficking includes many forms of exploitation such as bonded labor, smuggling, forced labor, debt bondage among migrant laborers, involuntary domestic servitude, forced child labor, and sex trafficking. However, definitionally speaking, the majority of the non-profits equated human trafficking with sex trafficking, perhaps because of the intractability or wicked
nature of the problem. Some definitions of sex trafficking categorize all sex work as trafficking (Nawyn, 2013). As discussed in the literature review, this leads to definitional problems, confusion as to who a victim is, and no accurate numbers on how many people are currently being trafficked (Weitzer, 2015).

Grint’s (2005) work on wicked problems leads us to consider how they made be socially constructed and calls us not just to consider what the situation is, but how it is situated. This relates directly to human trafficking, perhaps because sex trafficking is referenced more because it leads to more attention from the government, press, and public. It might pull at the public’s heartstrings and bring them to support a non-profit’s cause. This suggests that language and definition issues are essential because they have consequences for how trafficking is managed.

If sex trafficking is taking precedent over other forms of trafficking, those other forms may not receive the attention they desperately need. For this reason, it is essential for NGOs to not only target sex trafficking and instead incorporate all forms of trafficking into their intervention practices, budgetary issues notwithstanding.

*Intervention Practices*

My last finding showcases each of the intervention practices presented by the five NGOs. Kostova (1999) defines strategic organizational practices as, “those practices considered to be dominant, critical, or crucial for achieving the strategic mission of the firm” (p. 308). The strategic organizational practices identified by the non-profits for this study are intervention practices such as: shelter homes and other services that provide reintegration into society for the victim, empowering victims to change their local communities, and having a past orientation in
order to bring past traffickers to justice. These intervention practices have been instrumental in shaping current efforts by non-profits to fight trafficking.

Although the five NGOs have experienced some results from these practices, they also realize that these are not enough to combat traffickers and are searching for ways to incorporate preventative practices. Several of the preventative practices they have begun to incorporate are: awareness, creating stronger laws against trafficking, and to discover the root causes of trafficking. Some of the presenters even acknowledge that the paramount practices are shifting from intervention to prevention. This shift notes that non-profits do not want to wait until the victim has already been enslaved to act. They instead want to avoid the situation entirely. Whether this is possible remains to be seen, as all wicked problems require time to determine if solutions are working and are constantly morphing. This is a significant finding because it denotes a change in best practices utilized by NGOs combating human trafficking and indicates that other organizations fighting the same issue may benefit from this information.

Critiquing a Western Lens

Rittel and Webber’s (1973) description of wicked problems lays the foundation for identifying human trafficking as a wicked problem. It is constantly evolving, solutions are never absolute, and each wicked problem is unique. The four leadership themes identified in this thesis are my attempts to analyze this wickedness and its solutions. However, I analyzed them from the perspective of a Western leadership lens.

Regarding the first theme, I argued for the importance of crafting and sharing a successful vision and mission statement because the more explicitly an organization states their
vision and mission statements, the stronger their organizing potential because leaders will minimize ambiguity and multiple interpretations.

For the second theme, I argued that through collaboration with the police, other NGOs, and the government, more efficient ways of combating traffickers can be developed. Regarding the third theme, I argued that the language and definition issues surrounding human trafficking must be clear and unambiguous in order to enhance the collective efforts to combat traffickers. The fourth and final theme involved intervention practices, but they were less affected by my Western lens because I was simply reporting the nonprofits’ activities.

Is this a fair assessment? As mentioned in the literature review, research shows that Eastern cultures are more focused on the long-term than the West and they are more collective thinkers rather than individualistic. Chen and Miller (2011) identify that Eastern businesses are more free flowing and more integrative whereas Western businesses like to break things into smaller parts and make everything definitionally clear. However, of all of the distinctions between East and West, the difference between ambiguity and clarity stood out the most in terms of my findings. This difference may be an indication of why some of the five non-profits did not communicate their mission or vision statements frequently during their presentations. Instead of being ineffective communicators, or poor strategists, an Eastern lens would suggest that they may not identify the clear and unambiguous communication of such statements in their culture as important. Perhaps, as Eisenberg and Whetten (1987) assert, they wish to remain vague to allow “multiple interpretations to exist.”

This can also be applied to language and definition issues. If Eastern culture suggests fluidity and enacting a process-oriented business, they may not see the importance of utilizing
particular language or definitions to define human trafficking. Clear definitions may get in the way of conducting business, especially if they create strict categories and rules associated with them. They may inhibit initiatives sought by employees who might wish to take on situations or cases falling in the grey areas of the organization’s mission. As Eisenberg and Whetten (1987) point out, Eastern cultures prefer multiple viewpoints to be acknowledged while the organization is working toward its goals. It provides employees with more freedom, which may spur initiative, for example, to search for new ways to collaborate in cross-sector partnerships.

Thus is it important not to commit Said’s (1979) claim of Orientalism where Western ideals are viewed as superior to Eastern values. Chen and Miller (2010) suggest a solution to limit the divide between the East and the West through ambiculturalism. Its aim is “to integrate and optimize the best of two (or more) ‘cultures’ while eliminating the worst; thus, the ambicultural perspective recognizes not only the strengths but the pitfalls of Western and Eastern business models” (p. 22). Chen (2014) adds that ambiculturalism is “a continuous act of becoming, with emphasis on the process of learning and growing, rather than an arrived at or ideal state of being” (p. 120). Chen and Miller acknowledge that through this method, each culture can learn from the other and develop the best possible practices.

For example, Chen and Miller (2011) suggest that even though Eastern cultures are highly collective, sometimes organizations can limit themselves too exclusively to long-standing partnerships and hinder themselves. Or, strategic inconsistency may develop from the desire to please everyone in their partnerships. Chen and Miller (2011) identify the West as a highly individualistic and deadline-oriented culture that might miss out on prosperous long-term relationships by focusing on short-term financial fulfillment. Similarly, Eisenberg and Whetten (1987) suggest that a benefit of having ambiguous vision and mission statements is it allows
diverse groups to work collaboratively and allows varying interpretations to be formed, a benefit the West may underestimate.

These examples show that if each culture takes a blended approach to East-West leadership, they might develop a more effective strategic plan and organizational practices. Chen (2014) argues this approach assists in fully understanding our own culture while also valuing other cultures and traditions. This approach may also be the key to managing human trafficking as a wicked problem.

Limitations of Study

Before presenting recommendations for future research, several limitations from this study must be discussed. A primary limitation was that I had to rely on the five non-profits’ self-description of how they are combating human trafficking and how they would evaluate their success rate. I had to take all of their descriptions of cross-sector partnerships and intervention practices as fact, regardless of possible data to the contrary. In addition, language barriers posed a problem in some cases. Selection of audio footage was partly based on clarify of the presenters. For example, one additional NGO would have been an asset to this study; however their video footage was difficult to understand due to the distance of the microphone from the speaker, background noise, and the speaker not being fluent in English. There was also the fear with the Rescue Foundation, which was an entirely translated interview, that some information was lost in the translation or not fully stated by the translator.

Lastly, not all of the leaders were able to be present during the meetings. This caused me to rely on their employees to accurately explain the organization’s vision and mission statements and overall functions of the organization. Although an employees’ perspective is quite valuable
in its reflection of leadership, I did not have enough data to compare organizations represented by their leaders versus those represented by their employees. Despite these limitations, I was still able to obtain substantial data from the presentations.

**Future Research**

There are several important areas for future research that can be directed from this study. The first area for potential research is to more comprehensively study the language and definitions used by other non-profits combating trafficking in order to determine if their main focus is also on sex trafficking, or if they cover all forms of trafficking. Coupled with this, it would be beneficial to conduct an examination of the press and determine how they portray trafficking in the news. Is their primary focus on sex trafficking, or do they equally cover all aspects of trafficking? This data would provide evidence to determine if sex trafficking is receiving more attention, and if more awareness in this area leads to more rescues for victims in sex trafficking than other forms.

A second area for further research is to examine Eastern and Western views of leadership solutions to human trafficking as a wicked problem. Determining what best practices are being utilized by organizations based on their cultural identity would provide further evidence for the utility of an ambicultural and strategic ambiguity perspective. Wicked problems are constantly evolving and with that, so are best practices. In order to fully evaluate the effectiveness of the ambicultural and strategic ambiguity approaches, more research needs to be conducted in order to determine which theories and practices are most advantageous. For example, examining how Eastern and Western leaders approach potential language and definitional issues would provide valuable insight.
A third area for future research would focus on cross-sector partnerships and collaboration and focusing on the disparities between the East and West and how these differences are shifting over time. Since wicked problems and organizations are constantly morphing, it is essential to develop further theory of what successful collaboration looks like in the East and West and amalgamating best practices from the two cultures to report the most advantageous cross-sector partnerships. Although there is a plethora of literature on cross-sector partnerships and collaboration, it is important to update information as the managing of the problem shifts.

A fourth area is to explore other efforts of non-profits across India, Asia, and other continents to evaluate their efforts on combating. With an even larger sample size, we can begin to draw comparisons on what methods do and do not work and have access to large array of innovative ideas for fighting traffickers. It would also be beneficial to visit the actual locations where non-profits have their shelter homes, or see them in action when they are rescuing victims or prosecuting traffickers. Observing them would provide extra data, and validity to their actual organizational practices.

The fifth and final area for future research is to analyze the shift from intervention to prevention practices not just at the five non-profits used for this study, but also other NGOs combating the same issue. Have these five non-profits made further attempts at prevention practices, or have they stuck with intervention practices? What about other NGOs? Have they also realized the need to incorporate prevention methods to their strategic organizational plan? Determining what current practices are being upheld and analyzing if those practices have made a difference within human trafficking would be a valuable addition to the literature. These five
areas of further research would all add to the data and theories focused on combative efforts against trafficking and aid us in having a better understanding of this wicked problem.

**Conclusion**

This study was an opportunity to study a very wicked problem, human trafficking. Rittel and Webber’s (1973) description of wicked problems laid the foundation for identifying human trafficking as such a problem. Coupled with non-profit literature, this study set out to understand how leadership is making a difference within non-profit organizations combating human trafficking.

Findings for this question were revealed in four primary themes. The findings of this research show the importance of forming organization vision and mission statements, cross-sector partnerships, definitional issues, and the move from intervention to prevention practices and how they may benefit non-profits combating human trafficking. Thus, this study has important theoretical and practical implications.

Future work from researchers should be done to further investigate ways to combat human trafficking. Exploring other NGOs will provide a larger sample size and contribute additional data toward best practices. By conducting current studies on the successfullness of the ambicultural and strategic ambiguity approaches, theory can be developed on how advantageous these perspectives are toward combining Eastern and Western business practices in order to more efficiently combat traffickers. In addition, observing the shift of intervention to prevention practices will produce insight on what future means should be taken to combat this issue. Through these methods, we can continue to manage human trafficking as a wicked problem.
This analysis was executed with the expectation that current organizational, human trafficking, and wicked problem literature would offer insights into how best practices of the NGOs should be managed. Communication scholars can add an important understanding to organizational practices by determining what language and definitional issues surround the issue and how they should be managed. In order for human trafficking as wicked problem to be managed successfully, it will require the collaborative efforts of the East, West, North, and South; it cannot be solved by one organization nor by one demographic alone, but rather will take the collaboration of many.
References


Rowe, Glenn. (2014). Is nonprofit leadership different from business or government leadership? *The Journal of Nonprofit Education and Leadership, 4*(2)


Zook, A., & OhioLINK Electronic Theses and Dissertations Center. (2014). *Museum as site of meaning: Exploring audience responses to the national underground railroad freedom center's invisible: Slavery today exhibit*