I, Serena Wang, hereby submit this original work as part of the requirements for the degree of Master of Music in Music History.

It is entitled:
The Aesthetics of Silence in the Works of Federico Mompou, Chou Wen Chung, and George Crumb

Student’s name: Serena Wang

This work and its defense approved by:

Committee chair: Jeongwon Joe, Ph.D.

Committee member: Steven Cahn, Ph.D.

Committee member: Bruce Mcclung, Ph.D.
The Aesthetics of Silence in the Works of Federico Mompou, Chou Wen Chung, and George Crumb

A thesis submitted to

The Graduate School
of the University of Cincinnati

MASTER OF MUSIC

in the Division of Composition, Music History, and Theory
of the College-Conservatory of Music

2013

by

Serena Wang

BM, Northwestern University, 2005
Abstract

With 4’33” John Cage brought silence to the forefront of musical discourse. The avant-garde composer engaged with and promoted “silence” at an unprecedented level, but silence beyond Cage, in my opinion, has not received adequate coverage. This thesis engages in the aesthetics of silence in the twentieth century. Treating silence as a compositional tool and musical style, I examine silence’s different manifestations in the instrumental works by Federico Mompou (1893–1987), Chou Wen-Chung (b. 1923), and George Crumb (b. 1929). I begin by defining different manifestations and functions of silence, among which are structural, rhetorical, and metaphorical silences. The remainder of the thesis consists of case studies where I interpret these silences based on the musical, cultural, and biographical contexts. The case studies include Mompou’s first collection of Musica callada (1959); Chou’s String Quartet No. 1, “Clouds” (1996); and Crumb’s Music for a Summer Evening (1974).
Copyright Permission

Excerpts from Federico Mompou’s *Musica callada, cahier I*, Copyright © 1959 Editions Salabert – Paris, France, are reproduced by permission of MGB Hal Leonard, Italy.

Excerpts from Chou Wen-Chung’s *Windswept Peaks* and *String Quartet No. 1*, and George Crumb’s *Music for a Summer Evening*, are reproduced by permission from C. F. Peters.
Acknowledgements

This thesis was inspired by the course *The Art of Silence: Beyond John Cage* offered by Prof. Jeongwon Joe, who became my thesis advisor. I wish to express my deep appreciation for her continual input, feedback, and guidance. I am also grateful to my readers, Prof. bruce mcclung and Prof. Steven Cahn, whose insight and attention to detail will be remembered throughout my scholarly career. I want to thank Prof. Stephanie Schlagel for her support and encouragement during my time at CCM. I would also like to thank Christopher Erato for lending me his ears, jamming with me, and filling my life with fun(k) music. Finally and most importantly, I am forever grateful to my parents, Yueh Hua Hung and Yeh Wang, who have supported me in every way possible, continued to be my best friends, and showed me the good in this world.
Table of Contents

Abstract
Acknowledgement
Copyright Permission
List of Musical Examples

Introduction: Silence beyond John Cage 1

Chapter 1: Defining Musical Silence 9
   A. Manifestations of silence
   B. Functions of silence

Chapter 2: Spiritual Silence in Federico Mompou’s Musica callada 17

Chapter 3: The Aesthetics of Silence in Chou Wen-Chung’s Windswept Peaks and First String Quartet, “Clouds” 36

Chapter 4: Silence in George Crumb’s Music for a Summer Evening 56

Conclusion 75

Bibliography 78
List of Musical Examples

Example

1.1 Federico Mompou, *Musica callada*, No. 1, opening

1.2 George Crumb, *Music for a Summer Evening*, “Myth,” mm. 20–23

1.3 Franz Liszt, Sonata in B Minor, mm. 18–24

1.4 Chou Wen-Chung *Windswept Peaks*, mm. 161–63, cello and piano

1.5 Chou Wen-Chung *Windswept Peaks*, mm. 13–17

2.1 Federico Mompou, *Musica callada*, No. 4, mm. 1–4

2.2 Federico Mompou, *Musica callada*, No. 4, mm. 28–38

2.3 Federico Mompou, *Musica callada*, No. 1, opening

2.4 Federico Mompou, *Musica callada*, No. 2, mm. 1–5

2.5 Federico Mompou, *Musica callada*, No. 2, mm. 17–21

2.6 Federico Mompou, *Musica callada*, No. 8, mm. 1–4

2.7 Federico Mompou, *Musica callada*, No. 7, mm. 1–2

2.8 Federico Mompou, *Musica callada*, No. 7, mm. 11–14

2.9 Federico Mompou, *Musica callada*, No. 3, mm. 1–5

2.10 Federico Mompou, *Musica callada*, No. 5, mm. 1–7

2.11 Federico Mompou, *Musica callada*, No. 9, mm. 9–15

3.1 Chou Wen-Chung, “Clouds,” Movement I, m. 40

3.2 Chou Wen-Chung, “Clouds,” Movement III, m. 10

3.3 Chou Wen-Chung, *Windswept Peaks*, mm. 353–57

3.4 Chou Wen-Chung, *Windswept Peaks*, mm. 13–17

3.5 Chou Wen-Chung, *Windswept Peaks*, excerpt of m. 12, B-flat clarinet and piano
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Composer</th>
<th>Work/Movement/Excerpt</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>Chou Wen-Chung</td>
<td><em>Windswept Peaks</em>, mm. 233–39</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>Chou Wen-Chung</td>
<td>“Clouds,” Movement I, mm. 13–16</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>Chou Wen-Chung</td>
<td><em>Windswept Peaks</em>, mm. 119–122, cello</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>Chou Wen-Chung</td>
<td><em>Windswept Peaks</em>, mm. 287–89, B-flat clarinet and piano</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.10</td>
<td>Chou Wen-Chung</td>
<td>“Clouds,” Movement I, mm. 17–22</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.11</td>
<td>Chou Wen-Chung</td>
<td>“Clouds,” Movement III, mm. 1–4</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>George Crumb</td>
<td>“Nocturnal Sounds,” opening</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>George Crumb</td>
<td>“Nocturnal Sounds,” Japanese temple bells, p. 6, first system</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>George Crumb</td>
<td>“Wanderer-Fantasy,” opening</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>George Crumb</td>
<td>“Wanderer-Fantasy,” Piano I and II, p. 11, second system</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>George Crumb</td>
<td>“The Advent,” opening</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>George Crumb</td>
<td>“The Advent,” m. 16</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>George Crumb</td>
<td>“Advent,” p. 14, second system</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>George Crumb</td>
<td>“Myth,” mm. 27–30</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>George Crumb</td>
<td>“Music of the Starry Night,” opening</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.10</td>
<td>Georg Crumb</td>
<td>“Music of the Starry Night,” p. 20, first system</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.11</td>
<td>George Crumb</td>
<td>“Music of the Starry Night,” p. 20, second system</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.12</td>
<td>George Crumb</td>
<td>“Music of the Starry Night,” p. 25, second system</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Introduction: Silence beyond John Cage

Silence is the furthest extension of that reluctance to communicate, that ambivalence about contact with the audience which is a leading motif of modern art, with its tireless commitment to the ‘new’ and/or the ‘esoteric.’¹

—Susan Sontag

With her observation on the 1960s avant-garde movement, Susan Sontag gives the verdict that “silence” will eventually lead to the demise of art. I seek to offer an alternate view on the aesthetics of silence—one that not only pertains to negation of art, as per Sontag, but becomes increasingly pregnant with meaning amid the eclectic sound world of the twentieth century. The advent of globalization introduces a wide range of resources to be placed at the composer’s disposal. Although silence has been an important material and aesthetics for musical composition in the twentieth century, its significance has received less artistic and scholarly recognition in comparison to other “sounding” material and technique.

With 4'33” John Cage brought silence to the forefront of musical discourse. The avant-garde composer engaged with and promoted “silence” at an unprecedented level. Cage’s formulation of silence could be traced to his readings in south- and east-Asian philosophy starting in the 1940s. Among the teachings that influenced Cage were writings by Ananda Coomaraswamy, Huang Po, and Daisetz Teitaro Suzuki. Interpreting and appropriating these south- and east-Asian philosophies, Cage found silence to be a metaphor for infinite potential.²


² Literature on John Cage and his compositional philosophy is vast. For a comprehensive account of Cage’s Asian influences, including his approach to silence, see David Wayne Patterson, “Appraising the Catchwords, c. 1942-1959: John Cage’s Asian-Derived Rhetoric and the Historical Reference of Black Mountain College” (PhD diss., Columbia University, 1996), 168—178. See also Margaret Leng Tan, “‘Taking a Nap. I Pound the Rice’: Eastern Influences on John Cage,” in *John Cage at Seventy-Five*, ed. Richard Fleming and William Duckworth (Lewisburg, PA: Bucknell University Press, 1989), 49.
Indeed, the concept of silence exists beyond the acoustic realm, as it is also an attitude, a philosophy, and a compositional method.

Following the experience in the anechoic chamber, where he discovered that complete acoustical silence is impossible to experience as long as one is alive, Cage reached the conclusion that intentionality is the only factor that distinguishes between sound and silence. In the score of 4’33”, each of the three movements contains the single word “tacet,” which means that the instrument(s) should be silent. Cage’s note at the bottom of the score records the first performance in Woodstock, NY, by David Tudor, who indicates the beginning and end of each movement by closing and opening the keyboard lid.³ Paradoxically, the composition as perceived by the audience is anything but silent (“tacet”): per Cage’s realization after his experience in the anechoic chamber, ambient sound defines silence during 4’33”. Cage described its first performance in 1952: “What [the audience] thought was silence, because they didn’t know how to listen, was full of accidental sounds. You could hear the wind stirring outside during the first movement. During the second, raindrops began pattering the roof, and during the third the people themselves made all kinds of interesting sounds as they talked or walked out.”⁴

This stasis in artistic activity encourages audience interpretation and participation through means of “filling in the blank.”⁵ In this respect, 4’33” is analogous to Robert Rauschenberg’s monochrome paintings, where the context of the exhibition hall, lightning, and the viewers’ shadows all contribute to the content of the painting. As a result, the interpretation of a white


painting changes according to the exhibition venue, the number of visitors, and the individual viewer’s background, to name but a few factors.

By situating silence or a monochromatic field in the foreground, Cage and Rauschenberg both elicit audience contribution. Nevertheless, these two examples of aural and visual silence (created by Cage and Rauschenberg, respectively) lie on the extreme end of the spectrum, where the two artists offer maximum “silence” through minimal artistic activity. In music, 4'33” represents but one manifestation of silence. Composers before and after Cage have continued to explore silence’s potential, from the rhetorical silence in sixteenth-century madrigals, to silence that contributes to the manifold styles of the twentieth-century compositional pluralism.

A significant number of twentieth-century composers, including Olivier Messiaen, Tōru Takemitsu, and John Tavener, have engaged with silence in diverse ways. Both Messiaen and Federic Mompou found inspiration in the writings of the Spanish Carmelite mystic St. John of the Cross (1542–1591). As a punishment of his effort in reforming the Carmelite order, St. John underwent solitary confinement in a space no larger than a prison latrine. This experience led to spiritual encounters through which St. John produced a series of poetry and commentary. St. John sought to evoke and explain the ineffable “silent music” through words. Similarly, Messiaen and Mompou also aimed to evoke their respective spiritual experience through music. The oft-quoted verse from St. John’s Spiritual Canticle, “the silent music, the sonorous solitude,” appears in Mompou’s first collection of Musica callada. Likewise, Messiaen was inspired by the writings of St. John of the Cross and came to treat silence as a manifestation of faith. “Regard du silence” from Vingt regards sur l’enfant-Jésus thus becomes a sounding

---

contemplation of silence. As I will examine in detail below, to express “silent music,” both Mompou and Messiaen turn to sounding material instead of relying on acoustic silence. The result is the evocation of the experience of silence through sound.

Any discussion of Mompou’s oeuvre would not be complete without considering Vladimir Jankélévitch’s thoughts on the composer. Besides devoting a chapter to Mompou in La présence lointaine, the philosopher expounds on silence in Music and the Ineffable, as translated by Carolyn Abbate. Jankélévitch considers Mompou’s miniatures a kind of silence:

The “silence of music” is itself a constituent part of audible music. It is not just that music needs words to fall silent so that it might sing: silence also inhabits and dampens audible music. Laconic tendencies, reticence, and the pianissimo are like silences within silence. In effect, brachylogy – brevity, concision of diction – is a form of silence in the music of Satie or Mompou. The pièce brève is a silence not in that it emerges from silence, but indirectly, in that it expresses a desire to retighten the grip, a will to concentration. Concision harbors the wish to disturb silence as little as possible.

I will refer to Jankélévitch’s writings further in Chapter 2.

The conversion to the Russian Orthodox Church influenced the musical outlook of both John Tavener and Arvo Pärt, resulting in the simplicity of their musical language, and the prominence of silence in their works. During an interview with Brian Keeble, Tavener explains that his concept of silence, in which ison, or the drone of the “eternity note,” is the acoustic representation of the silence of God and eternity.

---


When describing the development of his tintinnabuli technique, through which pitches from the diatonic melody produce bell-like sonorities, Pärt links his aesthetic for simplicity to his experience with silence:

Traces of this perfect thing appear in many guises—and everything that is unimportant falls away. Tintinnabulation is like this. Here I am alone with silence. I have discovered that it is enough when a single note is beautifully played. This one note, or a silent beat, or a moment of silence, comforts me.\textsuperscript{11}

Pärt’s concept of silence cannot be separated from his Orthodox faith, as both are manifested in his application of tintinnabulation.

Although the composers above relate musical silence to their faith, the application of musical silence in the twentieth century extends beyond religious implications. For instance, Takemitsu took a contrasting stance on silence:

\begin{quote}
The fear of silence is nothing new. Silence surrounds the dark world of death. Sometimes the silence of the vast universe hovers over us, enveloping us. There is the intense silence of birth, the quiet silence of one’s return to the earth. Hasn’t art been the human creature’s rebellion against silence?\textsuperscript{12}
\end{quote}

Here Takemitsu makes a poignant analogy between silence and death. According to him, music is either sound or silence; confronting silence thus becomes the composer’s task. The relationship between Takemitsu’s music and the Japanese concept of \textit{ma}, which translates roughly into silence, occupies an important place in the composer’s own writings as well as scholarship on Takemitsu’s compositions.\textsuperscript{13} William Malm considers \textit{ma} a “hidden” aspect of time in Japanese music. He describes \textit{ma} as the space between events—“in music it provides a

\begin{footnotes}
\begin{itemize}
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotes}
rhythmic elasticity in which silence is as powerful as sound. Awareness of the art of ma is one of the rewards of enlightened listening.”14

The application of silence remains active outside the realm of concert music in the fields of communication studies, film, gender studies, and visual arts. Combined with the visual medium of the screen, film music features silence at strategic points of the plot. Stan Link explores the connection between silence and death in “Going Gently: Contemplating Silences and Cinematic Death.”15 By examining silence at individual moments in films such as Road to Perdition, Apocalypse Now, Run Lola Run, and The Good, the Bad, and the Ugly, Link concludes that “the reinforcement of death with some kind of silence is not likely a simple declarative statement couched in quiet. It is a negotiation inflected by all of a film’s elements.”16

This concept applies aptly to the instrumental repertoire as well. Silence in film often occurs in the form of “silencing,” where diegetic (ambient) sounds, or even background music in the case of Run Lola Run, are deliberately silenced. This type of silence, which I call the act of silencing, is one of the three manifestations of silence that I will elaborate in the Chapter 1.

The major collection of essays on silence in the field of music to date is Silence, Music, Silent Music, edited by Nicky Losseff and Jenny Doctor. The volume provides a basis for the interdisciplinary approaches to silence and music, including silence’s various connotation and application in musical compositions; silence in religion, performance, film, and music therapy; and silence’s ontology.17 In another essay collection, Silence: An Interdisciplinary Perspectives,

16 Ibid., 72.
Adam Jaworski demonstrates silence’s versatility in a variety of fields, including communication studies and gender studies.\textsuperscript{18}

In the monograph *The Power of Silence*, Jaworski shows silence’s significance in the visual arts.\textsuperscript{19} By extending Marshall McLuhan’s media theory, Jaworski considers silence a “cool” medium, which requires a high degree of participants’ interpretation and engagement. He provides the examples of visual silence in Edward Hopper’s landscapes, Japanese stone garden, and Rauschenberg’s monochrome paintings. Applying Goffman’s frame theory,\textsuperscript{20} Jaworski observes that Hopper’s representative, or figurative, paintings frame a narrative silence characterized by temporal and spatial vagueness. On the contrary, it is silence, in the form of negative space of the white sand that frames the rocks in Japanese stone garden. Another type of silence discussed by Jaworski is the evoked silence in Wassily Kandinsky’s abstractionism. I have already presented the analogy between Rauschenberg’s white paintings and Cage’s 4’33” earlier; in contrast, the spiritual silence evoked in Kandinsky’s works is akin to the silence that Messiaen contemplates in “Regard du silence.”

I begin my exploration of silence in musical compositions by categorizing different types of silence according to their functions and manifestations. An example of silence’s manifestation is the evoked silence mentioned in the above paragraph; I will discuss my typology of silence in detail in Chapter 1. This thesis does not attempt to catalogue all types of silences, but explores the salient types that continue to be applied in musical works throughout Western music history.


Chapter 2 explores the meaning and application of silence in Mompou’s *Musica callada*. “Musica callada” could be translated as “silent music.” The title came from St. John’s *Spiritual Canticles*, the Spanish mystic’s dialogue with God during his solitary confinement. I interpret the first book of *Musica callada* as the composer’s expression of the mystic’s experience of silent music.

Chapter 3 offers cultural and philosophical perspectives on silence by examining Chou’s *Windswept Peaks* and String Quartet No. 1. Besides discussing the role of silence in Taoism and the culture of the Chinese literati, I compare the application of silence in Chinese calligraphy and landscape painting with that in Chou’s two works.

Chapter 4 covers how silence is used and represented in Crumb’s *Music for a Summer Evening*. Crumb includes the five-movement work in his *Makrokosmos* series. The movements could be heard as mimetic, meditative, and profound. I propose that silence forms a universal theme that unifies the movements as it manifests through different aspects of the summer evening.
Chapter 1
Defining Musical Silence

This chapter provides a summary of the common functions and manifestations of silence that occur in a musical context. The categories I present below are by no means comprehensive. Silence, like the sounding note, has countless musical applications. Zofia Lissa’s “Aesthetic Functions of Silence and Rests in Music” paves the way for the aesthetic engagement of musical silence.¹ She summarizes the relationship between sound and silence: “It is the dialectic unity between [silence and the sound fabric] that shapes musical speech, that moulds the harmonic and architectonic elements, dynamic phenomena, rhythm, texture, and articulation, or in other words, the raw material of which music is made.”² Depending on the musical context, including the style and compositional techniques, silence has continued to contradict, enhance, or complement the sounding materials.

An aspect of silence that Lissa emphasizes is that “silence remains its own self while participating in the process of transformations unrolling within musical structures.”³ She considers silence an autonomous musical entity, distinct from, yet complementary to, the rest of the work. I base the interpretive framework of my thesis on Lissa’s work, from which I derive my two general categories of silence: manifestations and functions. Three of silence’s manifestations that I will discuss are acoustic silence, the act of silencing, and evoked silence; in a more analytical vein, silence’s functions that I will elaborate on are structural silence, rhetorical silence, and metaphorical silence. By examining the select works of Mompou, Chou, and Crumb

---

² Ibid., 448 and 451.
³ Ibid., 451.
in Chapters 2 through 4, I will show that because of its functional versatility, the same moment of silence may engender various interpretations.

**Manifestations of Silence**

Manifestations of silence refer to moments in music when silence comes to the foreground. Acoustic silence constitutes the most familiar and prevalent definition of silence. When sound becomes absent or recedes into the background (and turns into “unintentional sound,” as Cage puts it), we experience acoustic silence. On the score, rests often represent acoustic silence, expressed simply as the absence of sound.

The act of silencing can be understood as an act of negation, which creates various effects on musical form and flow. By silencing preexisting musical material or putting a stop to common practice procedures, the composer may negate the listener’s expectation for a tonal or atonal framework, a select layer of voices, or musical structure. The act of silencing brings to attention the presence and absence of various musical elements by turning sound into silence, or the existent to the non-existent. An example can be found in Crumb’s “Music of the Starry Night” from *Music for a Summer Evening*. The quotation from J. S. Bach’s D-sharp minor Fugue, *Well-tempered Clavier II*, contrasts greatly the pre-established musical framework. The different musical language of Bach appears like a dream or distant memory for three and a half measures; after which, the returning cascading figure cuts off, or silences, this distant memory. This act of silencing negates the listener’s expectation, especially when the abrupt reappearance of the opening material jolts the listener back to the present.

Cage famously stated that there is no such thing as silence, but simply intentional and non-intentional sound. In the case of silencing gestures, absence could also be intentional and
non-intentional. The act of silencing brings the absence to our awareness, thus creating intentional absence. A silencing gesture in film music often occurs during the most heart-rendering moments. In instrumental music, the act of silencing can be equally poignant by lending significance to a particular voice, gesture, or theme.

Evoked silence occurs when the composer creates the effect of silence through sounding material. Some characteristics of silence are stasis, stillness, and emptiness. In Messiaen’s “Regard du silence,” silence is analogous to faith, which Messiaen evokes through very slow tempo, soft dynamics, and harmonic stasis. Recurring harmonic or rhythmic patterns, ostinato, and pedal points are some techniques that the composer uses to build the atmosphere of silence. Having been inspired by St. John’s musica callada, or silent music, Mompou’s eponymous work also seeks to recreate the paradoxical “heard silence.” The opening passage of Musica callada exemplifies evoked silence, where the sustained chord and repeated melodic E5 convey silence’s static and ethereal qualities (Example 1.1).

Example 1.1: Federico Mompou, Musica callada, No. 1, opening. Copyright © 1959 Editions Salabert – Paris, France. Reproduced by permission of MGB Hal Leonard, Italy

---


6 All the subsequent musical examples from Federico Mompou, Musica callada, cahier I, Copyright © 1959 Editions Salabert – Paris, France, are reproduced by permission of MGB Hal Leonard, Italy.
Functions of Silence

Silence serves different functions depending on the musical context. Ellen Harris’ “Silence as Sound: Handel’s Sublime Pauses” offers a methodology of analyzing silence in Arcangelo Corelli’s trio sonatas and George Frideric Handel’s vocal works. She identifies three functions of silence in Corelli’s trio sonatas: boundary silence, which demarcates formal and harmonic boundaries; pre-cadential silence, which takes place between the dominant chord and the passage leading to the tonic; and interruptive silences, which “heighten the sense of retarded or impeded motion in an ongoing harmonic progression.” Of the three types of silence that Harris discusses, both “boundary silence” and “pre-cadential silence” serve structural functions, while “interruptive silence” belongs to the category of rhetorical silence.

Structural silence plays a part in defining musical form and is often signified by acoustic silence. In Crumb’s *Music for a Summer Evening*, silence, in the form of rest and fermata, permeates the score. Another way that silence defines structure is through contributing to a musical work’s timbral and textural makeup. In the case of *Music for a Summer Evening* (Example 1.2), silence enhances the different types of articulation, allows for the transparency and organization of contrasting timbres, and provides temporal space for the resonating harmonic.

---

7 Ellen Harris, “Silence as Sound: Handel’s Sublime Pauses,” *Journal of Musicology* 22, no. 4 (2005): 521–58. According to Harris, Handel transferred these different functions of silence to the vocal idiom, where his progression from the application of silence in word painting to expressive text setting had become one of his greatest legacies.

8 Joseph Ralph Debaise, “George Crumb’s *Music for a Summer Evening*”: A Comprehensive Analysis” (PhD diss., The University of Rochester, 1983), 51.
Silence that creates and enhances structure in musical speech may also embody a rhetorical function. Caesura, an important poetic concept associated with the pause for breath, serves both structural and rhetorical functions. In classical sonata form, we find the medial caesura articulating a classical two-part exposition.

Silence that frames the musical work and pauses in between movements are also both structural and rhetorical. The aesthetics of framing silence (boundary silence, according to Harris) prior to and after a musical performance has been examined by a number of scholars, including Zofia Lissa, Edward Cone, and Richard Littlefield. Both Cone and Littlefield approach framing silence from the Kantian theory of “free beauty.” In addition to the

---

9 All the subsequent musical examples from George Crumb, *Music for a Summer Evening*, Copyright © 1974 by C. F. Peters Corporation, are used by Permission.

“beginning” and “ending” silences that Cone identifies in *Musical Form and Musical Performance*, Littlefield considers a musical composition’s vertical, or registral, frame and internal frame. Countering Kant with Derrida’s aesthetic theory, Littlefield argues that the silent frame also fulfills Kant’s idea of “free beauty”: it is necessary, has equal importance as the work itself, and embodies meaning other than that of the ornament.\(^\text{11}\)

Other rhetorical silences include interruptive silence, and the silence that creates suspense and climax. Harris observes that Corelli incorporates interruptive silence to “heighten the sense of retarded or impeded motion in an ongoing harmonic progression at the opening of slow-tempo movements.”\(^\text{12}\) While interruptive silence heightens or retards harmonic motion in Corelli’s music, it impedes or denies rhythmic motion in Tōru Takemitsu’s *Rain Tree Sketch*, where musical notes are often tied to a measure of silence at phrase endings. Furthermore, composers may incorporate rests into a work’s motivic unit, as in the opening phrase of Crumb’s *Music for a Summer Evening* and its fifth movement’s “Song of Reconciliation.”

According to Lissa, Ludwig van Beethoven used silence as a suspense device in the introduction to his piano sonatas such as Opp. 13, 106, and 111. On the other hand, rests may provide relief when, in the case of Op. 111, it “acts as a sequel to the harmonic content of the two-bar phrases and their semi-cadenza character.”\(^\text{13}\) Silence performs a different rhetorical function when it becomes a statement of musical climax. Franz Liszt is a master of creating climactic effect through silence, as evident in the dramatic build-up from mm. 18–24 in his Sonata in B-minor (Example 1.3).\(^\text{14}\)

\(^{11}\) Littlefield, 9.

\(^{12}\) Harris, 529.

\(^{13}\) Lissa, 451.

\(^{14}\) Elizabeth Margulis uses the term “liminalizing silence,” to denote silence at the climax. She defines “liminalize” as “to make it seems as if the threshold of expressability had been reached.” See Elizabeth H.

The silence before the statement of the theme in m. 24 thrusts the transitional passage to the height of the E-flat major chord and is the climax of the crescendo passage.

One could also find climactic silence at the local level in Chou’s Windswept Peaks (Example 1.4):


---


All the subsequent musical examples from Chou Wen Chung, *Windswept Peaks*, Copyright © 1990 by C. F. Peters Corporation are used by Permission.
In this passage we see that the slur over the piano figure at m. 161 ends on the half note rest, indicating that silence is the goal of the crescendo. In the cello part at m. 163, the eighth-note rest that follows the fortissimo chords not only contributes to their articulation but also creates an agogic accent.

When composers impart extramusical meaning to silence, it becomes metaphorical. Evoked silence is itself a metaphor. In texted music, such as a cantata or madrigal, metaphorical silence becomes a text-painting device, where it may represent a sigh or pause in a dialogue. In instrumental music, Messiaen’s evoked silence in Le banquet céleste represents faith. In Crumb’s “Myth” (Example 1.2), the silence that frames the sound of the Tibetan prayer stones suggests Buddhist spirituality. In Chou’s Windswept Peaks, the stretch of silence that accompanies each single violin tones in mm. 13–15 conveys the image of the vast space in a Chinese landscape painting (Example 1.5).

Example 1.5: Chou Wen-Chung, Windswept Peaks, mm. 13–17.
Chapter 2

Spiritual Silence in Federico Mompou’s Musica callada

*Musica callada* (1959), a collection of twenty-eight piano pieces in four volumes, comprises Federico Mompou’s largest collection of piano miniatures. Inspired by St. John’s *Spiritual Canticle*, Mompou took the collection’s title from the mystic’s poetry. The Spanish term “*callada*” does not have a direct English translation but has often been translated into “quiet” or “silent.” The question then arises—how does one compose “silent music”? By comparing how St. John and Mompou arrive at their respective experiences of silent music, this chapter explores possible ways through which Mompou’s *Musica callada* realizes his own silent music.¹

Born in 1893, Mompou studied piano at the Barcelona Conservatory. In 1911 the Catalan composer travelled to Paris and befriended influential artists and musicians such as Joan Miró and Francis Poulenc. After his sojourn in France from 1911 to 1941, Mompou continued honing his aesthetics toward greater simplicity. He composed mainly miniature piano pieces and songs, music that is known for influences from his Catalan heritage as well as the French modernists active during his time in Paris.²

Mompou returned to Barcelona in 1944. He married pianist Carmen Bravo in 1957; the year after, he became faculty at an annual seminar in Santiago de Compostela. With the increasing recognition from his colleagues and the public, this new chapter of his life and the new-found confidence coincided with the composition of *Musica callada*. Upon acquainting St.

---


John’s works, Mompou composed a vocal piece and a cantata based on the mystic’s poetry. Eventually, St. John’s *Spiritual Canticle* and Mompou’s new aesthetic would find their voice in *Musica callada*. Since Mompou sought to inspire its listeners with St. John’s spiritual experience, the understanding of the mystic’s background and spiritual encounter is important to an understanding and interpretation of Mompou’s work.

**St. John of the Cross**

St. John of the Cross, together with St. Teresa of Avila, reformed the Carmelite order and founded the Discalced Carmelites. St. John’s writings and poetry became some of the most significant Spanish mystical literature. Born in 1541 St. John began his education at a Jesuit school in Medina del Campo. He entered the Carmelite order in 1563 and received higher education at the University in Salamanca.³

Upon returning to Medina, St. John made the acquaintance of St. Teresa, who persuaded him to assist her in reforming the Carmelite order. The two founded monasteries across Spain. Due to the stringent practice of the reformed order, their followers referred to themselves as “Discalced” (meaning “barefoot”) Carmelites and the non-reformed communities as “Calced.” As the reform expanded, St. John’s superiors in the Calced Carmelites finally placed him in solitary confinement in a Toledo prison in December of 1577. For nine months St. John suffered public lashing and a cell that had barely space enough for his body. It was during this time that St. John composed one of his most famous works, *The Spiritual Canticle*. St. John escaped in August of 1578 and continued the reform until his death in 1591.

---

Mompou and *Musica callada*

Mompou introduced *Musica callada* for the first time in 1952, when he was made a member of the *Real academia de bellas artes de San Jorge*. The speech, excerpted below, expressed Mompou’s ideology and interpretation of silent music:

> The music has neither air nor light. It is a faint throb of the heart. One does not ask it to take us any farther than a few millimeters in space, but it does have the mission of penetrating the greatest profundities of our soul and the most secretive regions of our spirit.

> This music is *callada* because its hearing is internal. Contention and reserve. Its emotion is secret and only takes sonorous form in its resonances beneath the great cold cavern of our solitude.

> “*La música callada, la soledad sonora*” foreseen by San Juan de la Cruz, will find in these pages a desire for reality.

> This music, true to my aesthetic creed, is a symbol or renunciation. Renunciation against the continuity of the ascending line of progress and perfection in Art, because it is necessary sometimes to rest from this scaling of rugged peaks, to change the route, to grasp the impulse if we want to continue forward.

> Apparent primitivism (feigned primitivism). The new point of departure is ideal and situated in our epoch… My *Musica callada* is only one more sign among the many that have marked our epoch, coinciding with the dominant tendency of “the returning.”

> My notebook of *Musica callada*, together with *Fetes lointaines* and *Charmes*, constitute, in the whole of my music, the principle and most authentic expression of this “re-beginning” (*recomenzar*), a sentiment that marks my work and that was reinforced by the coincidence of various other external signs and that marked our epoch in an identical sense.

> I want my *Musica callada*, this recently born child, to bring us to a new warmth of life and expression of the human heart, always the same and always renewed.4

In his speech, Mompou articulates the process of realizing or hearing “silent music,” which consists of the three stages of renunciation, returning, and reinvention. He also maintains that silent music occurs only in solitude and can only be sensed internally. According to Vladimir Jankélévitch, Mompou’s piano miniatures are in effect “silences” that sing:

---

Singing is a way of being quiet. Federico Mompou gave the name *Musica callada* to a suite of nine small “pieces” that I would have called nine “silences,” in which the *soledad sonora* of St. John of the Cross is given a chance to sing. Music rises up out of silence, divine music.\(^5\)

Although Mompou’s *Musica callada* is an attempt to realize St John’s “silent music,” the composer’s understanding of silent music does not adhere exactly to that of St. John’s. The three stages of Mompou’s creative process (renunciation, returning, and reinvention) are analogous to St. John’s spiritual experience; however, Mompou applied them to art instead of the human body and soul. On the other hand, St. John entered the realm of silence by renouncing the external world and heard silent music through his spiritual experience; on the other hand, Mompou’s *Musica callada* represents a renunciation of the “progression of Art,” followed by the return to the primordial. As a result, *Musica callada* becomes a realization of Mompou’s artistic creed, where music returns to the silent beginning and reinvents itself in the form of “silent music.”

**The Discalced Carmelite and the Practice of the Mystic**

St. John’s meditation aims to create images and experiences from within. By reversing the normal process, St. John sensitized his body from the internal, instead of the external, world. According to Antonio de Nicolas:

> St. John builds his poetic experience using the same method he uses to build his spiritual life. He desensitizes himself to the external world and builds inner images out of his own dismembered sensorium. The result is a sensitized image that impinges upon him through all the mysterious ways of grace and divine visitation, but which also changes his inner sensations and builds a chain of memories of those moments: “visitations” which when recalled serve as the warm and inspired base of his poetic communication.\(^6\)

---


To prepare or facilitate the process, “St. John searched for, or was given ideal conditions of silence for his meditation and his writing, so that the voice of God could be perceived.”

Belonging to the Carmelite order, which emphasized contemplative meditation, St. John practiced his faith mostly in silence and solitude. Listening to *Musica callada* also calls for similar contemplative meditation.

In the preface to *Musica callada*, Mompou writes:

> It is rather difficult to translate and to express the real meaning of *música callada* in any language other than Spanish. The great mystic poet, St. John of the Cross, in one of his fine poems, sings of: “La música callada, la soledad sonora,” in an endeavor to express the idea of music that was the very sound of silence. Music keeps its voice silent, that is, does not speak, while solitude has its own music.

In addition to Mompou’s emphasis of the relationship between silent music and solitude, the work’s dynamics often stay in the piano range; the terse forms, single-voice melodies, and simple harmonic and rhythmic gestures all suggest a particular intimacy between the listener and the work.

**Renunciation: Night and Light; *Todo* and *nada***

The following stanzas from St. John’s *Spiritual Canticle* pertain directly to *musica callada*:

> My beloved, the mountains,
> The solitary, wooded valley,
> The strange islands, the sonorous rivers,
> The whisper of the amorous breezes,
> The tranquil night
> At the time of the rising of the dawn,
> The silent music, the sonorous solitude,

---

7 Ibid., 56.

The supper that recreates and enkindles love.\(^9\)

In the *Spiritual Canticle*, silent music occurs in the night. St. John also emphasizes the concept of night in his other works, such as *Dark Night of the Soul* and *Ascent of Mount Carmel*. Gerald Brenan explains, “In the Dark Night we come to the deepest and most comprehensive of St. John’s symbolic themes…. In the *Ascent of Mount Carmel*, where we find the best account of it, he lays it down as an axiom that, compared to the infinite being of God, all the being of the creatures is *nothing*.”\(^10\) In the following passage, Brenan elucidates the dichotomy between nothing and everything:

> Man can only be *something* by allowing God, who alone has real existence, to fill him, but for this to happen he must first have emptied himself of every attachment to the creatures. Two contraries cannot exist together in the same person, said Aristotle, and so, if the choice is to be God, the senses, imagination, understanding and will, must all be torn up and uprooted from their usual functions, in order that the mind and soul may be free to receive God alone. It is this process of tearing up, known as purgation, which is the first meaning given to the term “Dark Night.”\(^11\)

In St. John’s works, the night symbolizes the purgative process. By purging everything known to oneself, the mystic was then able to sense the divine. In Book I, Chapter 13 of *Ascent of Mount Carmel*, St. John testifies the coexistence of everything and nothing (*todo* and *nada*):

> In order to arrive at pleasure in everything, you must seek pleasure in nothing.
> In order to arrive at possessing everything, you must seek to possess nothing.
> In order to arrive at being everything, you must seek to be nothing.
> In order to arrive at knowing everything, you must seek to know nothing.\(^12\)


\(^{10}\) Brenan, *St. John of the Cross*, 133.

\(^{11}\) Ibid.

From St. John’s biography and the mystic’s own writings, we learn that the path toward experiencing silent music is not without struggle. St. John composed *Spiritual Canticle* during solitary confinement and under extreme physical suffering.

No. 4 from Mompou’s *Musica callada*, marked *Affitto e penoso* (afflicted and pensive) and composed in ABA’ form, echoes St. John’s pain during the renunciation process (Example 2.1). In the opening, the right-hand part features descending chromatic thirds while the left-hand part consists of melodic seconds and octave leaps. The descending thirds may represent bodily affliction while the left-hand part an independent mind.

Example 2.1: Federico Mompou, *Musica callada*, No. 4, mm. 1–4.

Mompou contrasts the middle section, mm. 16–33, with the previous section. Through its homophonic texture and open sonorities (Example 2.2), the middle section may be interpreted as either an augmentation of suffering or a temporary escape from reality.
Example 2.2: Federico Mompou, *Musica callada*, No. 4, mm. 28–38.

Coming back to reality during the A' section marked “*a Tempo,*” we find reconciliation between mind and body: instead of leaping independently, the left-hand part supports and cushions the right-hand part’s chromatic descent with its own.

Finally, Jankélévitch summarizes beautifully the *result* of renunciation in the case of Mompou’s compositional process: “All of the effort of catharsis consists in cutting away the inessential, that is to say in trimming the flowers of rhetoric, and in reducing the buzzing of discourse to its most simple expression… Sobriety, decency, understatement: these are other names for the virtue of renunciation.”

**Solitude**

The solitary condition proved paramount for St. John’s spiritual experience, for whom “sounding solitude” is

---

almost the same as silent music; for although that music is silent to the senses and the natural faculties, it is a most sounding solitude to the spiritual faculties; for when these are alone and empty of all natural forms and apprehensions they can readily receive the spiritual sound most sonorously in the spirit of the excellence of God, in Himself and in His creatures.…  

The later stanzas (Stanzas 33 and 34) of *Spiritual Canticle* read:

The little white dove  
Has returned to the ark with the bough,  
And now the turtle dove  
Has found the mate of her desire on the green banks.

In solitude she lived  
And in solitude now has built her nest,  
And in solitude her dear one alone guides her,  
Who likewise in solitude was wounded by love.  

In the redaction, St. John makes clear that the dove lives both in solitude and in the companion of Beloved:

He says not only that He now guides her in this solitude, but that He does it alone, communicating Himself to her without intermediaries—either angels, or men, or images, or forms; and that, even as she has fallen in love with Him, so is He wounded with love for her in this solitude and liberty of spirit which comes to her through the solitude aforementioned.

The symbol of the dove and the Beloved presents the paradox of “solitary union.” Love, channeled through solitude, allows the dove to sense her Beloved. Similarly, silence is when the external environment disappears—it is an awareness brought on through clarity and tranquility. By renouncing the establishment, Mompou stripped his music of unnecessary flourishes in order to achieve the quiet consciousness of solitude.

---


16 St. John of the Cross, Redaction of *Spiritual Canticles*, 153.
An interpretation of solitude can be heard in *Musica callada*, No. 1, which begins with a chant-like melody (Example 2.3). Associated with the human voice, the melody may be interpreted as St. John’s “sounding solitude.” When it returns at the third system, the theme is enhanced by an additional voice; the two thus create a “solitary union.”


No. 2 from *Musica callada* also illustrates the dynamics of solitude. Mompou quotes a verse from the end of Paul Valéry’s *Les pas* in the score of No. 2: “*Car jai vecu de vous attendre/* Et mon coeur n’étais que vos pas* (For I have lived to wait for you and my heart was only your steps).” The poem itself could almost be read as part of St. John’s *Spiritual Canticles*. The narrative takes place prior to a union, spiritual or otherwise, and opens with the following:

Your footsteps, children of my silence,
Saintly, slowly placed
Towards the bed of my watchfulness,
Approach, muted and frozen.\(^\text{17}\)

In the poem, silence is the precondition for an unspecified encounter. Yet the religious connotation is unmistakable with the words “saintly” and “divine”; in addition, the thought of “naked feet,” the kiss, and the “bliss of being and non-being” later in the poem find their counterparts in the *Spiritual Canticle*. In Mompou’s music, one can interpret the dotted figures as the evenly paced footsteps (Example 2.4).

Although the narrator remains physically alone throughout the poem, he continues to wait and spiritually becomes one with the owner of the footsteps, thus achieving a form of solitary union. While waiting, the person seems to be listening and musing intermittently. From m. 9, the opening material is repeated but in a higher register and in more intense (sforzando) dynamics—perhaps the footsteps have moved nearer, causing a heightened emotion in the listener. However, like Valéry’s poem, Mompou’s ending is ambiguous: the opening material returns with the exact notes with the addition of a pedal point on E (Example 2.5), which fills in the rests (i.e., silence). Yet, with the word “profond,” Mompou directs the footsteps into a sacred journey that seems to be prolonged indefinitely for both the pacer and the narrator.
Acoustic silence, in the form of rests (Example 2.4), serves both structural and rhetorical functions in *Musica callada*, No. 2. The eighth rests contribute to the pacing of each thematic unite in the movement and suggests the “slowly placed” footsteps from Valéry’s poem.

**Silent Music**

From the symbolism of the night to sounding solitude, we have arrived at silent music itself. St. John attempts to explain silent music mentioned in *Spiritual Canticle* through his prose commentary on Stanza 14:

In the aforesaid tranquility and silence of the night, and in that knowledge of the Divine light, the soul is able to see a marvelous fitness and disposition of Wisdom in the diversities of all its creatures and works, all and each of which are endowed with a certain response to God, whereby each after its manner testifies to that which God is in it, so that it seems to hear a harmony of sublimest music surpassing all that concerts and melodies of the world. The Bride calls this music silence because, as we have said, it is a tranquil and quiet intelligence without the sound of voices; and in it are thus enjoyed both the sweetness of the music and the quiet of the silence. And so she says that her Beloved is this silent music, because the harmony of spiritual music is known and experienced in him.\(^{18}\)

According to St. John’s prose, a “harmony of sublimest music” is connected with the sight of all the creatures and works under the “Divine light.” More importantly, St. John equates silent music with the soul’s Beloved. St. John repeats his definition of silent music and associates it with “love” in the same prose commentary:

And inasmuch as the soul receives this sounding music, not without solitude and withdrawal from all outward things, she calls them the silent music and the sounding solitude. This, she says, is her Beloved; and He is further “The supper that recreates and enkindles love.”\(^{19}\)

---

\(^{18}\) St. John of the Cross, Redaction of *Spiritual Canticles*, 84–85.

\(^{19}\) Ibid., 86.
St. John’s spiritual exploration, along with the Catalan culture and French modernism, influenced Mompou’s aesthetic of primitivism. Both St. John and Mompou turned and searched inward for a new beginning. St. John emphasized the ineffability of his mystical experience and resorted to using poetic imageries and symbols. To depict “internal” music, Mompou turned to sounding notes, thus creating a paradox where sounding notes represent “silent music.” Olivier Messiaen also created his “Regard du silence” based on this paradox.

Returning and Reinvention

St. John’s writings belonged to the oral tradition of the sixteenth-century Spain where people were introduced to the norms of experience by listening to the rhythms of sentences, poetry, and speech. Nicolas observes:

An audile culture takes the ear as the primary human organ of sense, and all its texts are ruled by the correspondence between the innate auditory sense of harmony and tone, and certain mathematical properties and ratios as manifested; for example, in the vibrating musical string. Language within such a culture is primarily a language about wholes, frames, memories, images, contexts, systems, and only secondarily about things and information.20

The same can be observed in Mompou’s *Musica callada*. With stylistic influences from Chopin and Satie, the Romantic fragment and aphorisms, Mompou’s music needs first to be heard without intellectual barriers.21 The harmonic and rhythmic patterns in the short pieces are analogous to the rhyme scheme and rhythm of St. John’s poetry. Both the poetry and music have innate rhythm and repetition, to be heard first, then understood.

No. 8 is the most aphoristic piece in the first volume of *Musica callada*, consisting of two

20 Nicolas, 55.

statements of the first phrase and ends with a third that ascends melodically in the same rhythmic pattern. In the opening phrase, Mompou uses a single chord in the bass to support the melody (Example 2.6).

Example 2.6: Federico Mompou, Musica callada, No. 8, mm. 1–4.

Built on just three phrases, none of which contain a traditional cadence, this movement exemplifies the Romantic fragment. It represents both an ideal and a state of being by suggesting something larger than itself. In the case of No. 8, the fragments connote silent music.

Beside returning to the fundamental sense of hearing, Mompou’s Musica callada also finds its origin in the early beginning of Western music—plainchant. Mompou considered organum a point of departure for his own music, a way of going back to the “beginning.” Mompou realizes this belief in Nos. 1 and 7 of Musica callada. Like No. 1, No. 7 opens with a chant-like melody in the left-hand part. Marked “profond,” the simple melody contains the reciting tone on F (Example 2.7).

22 McDonald, 57.
Example 2.7: Federico Mompou, *Musica callada*, No. 7, mm. 1–2.

By returning to the fundamental melody, Mompou is then able to reinvent the material. For example, the *poco piu mosso* section (mm. 11–14) contains motives that are derived from the chant-like opening melody in mm. 1–2 (Example 2.8). As each section of No. 7 unfolds, the eighth-note figures subtly relate one phrase to another.

Example 2.8: Federico Mompou, *Musica callada*, No. 7, mm. 11–14.

Finally, the ordering of the sections reveals a palindromic construction—a way of starting and returning the music at its root, the plainchant.

Another way of returning and reinventing is to delve into one’s own cultural heritage; in Mompou’s case, Catalan culture. The characteristics of Catalan folk songs include the use of major scale, repetition of short melodic figures, limited melodic range, and the dance-like triple meter.23 Inspired Catalan folk music, *Musica callada* No. 3 also features alternating feminine

---

23 Ibid., 70.
and masculine endings derived from the Catalan language, which, according to Paine, is a “truly distinctive characteristic of Catalan folk melody.”24 On the other hand, No. 3 consists of B-flat major melody layered with whole-tone runs (Example 2.9). The juxtaposition of these two sonorities is the main “reinvention” of this piece.

Example 2.9: Federico Mompou, Musica callada, No. 3, mm. 1–5.

Musica callada No. 5 features metric flexibility and the stacking of intervals that are mostly fourths and fifths (Example 2.10). Although notated in triple meter, the slurs render the grouping of the repeated eighth notes to alternate between hyper triple and duple meters (Example 2.10).

---

Mompou instructs the performer to play the inner, repeated notes *legato metallic*, which gives them a descriptive, physical quality. The outer, more sustained notes are to be played *in lontananza*, which suggests sounds that are distant or even ethereal. Mompou does not develop the musical cells, but repeats them. The play between the voices’ distance, metric uncertainty and the emphasis on vertical positions can be considered as a depiction of a direct dialogue with the otherworldly. While silence is the precondition for divine encounter, No. 5 seems to be an aural realization of the encounter: the metallic sounds announce the connection to the divine, which is delivered by the outer, “distant” voice.

In *La présence lointaine*, Jankélévitch emphasizes Mompou’s penchant for bells: the composer “always lived amidst the jangling of bells, and he knew by experience to like and appreciate the sounds of their metal…”; in *Musica callada*, “one hears the seraphic bells that pulsate sweetly through heaven and earth (*Musica callada*, No. 8); elsewhere (No. 9) the mystical fifths and fourths resonate like a prayer; elsewhere again (No. 5) the obstinate note
jingles, monotonous, insistent, distant, with the metallic tones.”

Jankélévitch observes the bells as a bridge between the earthly and the heavenly, a notion that I have also demonstrated through *Musica callada* No. 5.

*Musica callada* No. 9 presents a play in timbre and tempo (Example 2.11). While the opening of the ABA' form begins with a slow droll, the shimmering *Poco piu mosso* section creates a contrast in register, rhythm, and timbre.

Example 2.11: Federico Mompou, *Musica callada*, No. 9, mm. 9–15.

![Example 2.11: Federico Mompou, *Musica callada*, No. 9, mm. 9–15.](image)

With *accelerando* and *ritardando*, the tempo becomes flexible with its dotted figures. As if celebrating the newly found temporal freedom, the returning A' section, marked *molto*

---

expressivo, offers the most emotionally wrought moment in the piece. The music seems to have traced the steps of St. John’s spiritual progress from the attainment of inner peace to being inspired by the Holy Spirit and falling in love with Christ. As the emotions subside, the ending returns to peace and quiet amid the continuous ritardando.
Chapter 3

The Aesthetics of Silence in Chou Wen-Chung’s Windswept Peaks and String Quartet No. 1, Clouds

This chapter explores silence’s manifestation in Chou Wen-Chung’s music through the lens of Eastern philosophy and Chinese literati tradition of calligraphy and landscape painting. While Chinese landscape paintings are visualizations of Taoist and calligraphic principles, Chou’s compositions could be considered their musical realizations. According to interviews with him and his own writings, Chou continues to be conscious of his Chinese heritage.1 Having been trained in both the Chinese literary and the Western musical traditions, he paved the way for expressing his Chinese literati learning through Western musical means. The influence of Asian aesthetics on his works has been commented upon widely.2 This chapter will show how he treats silence in his Windswept Peaks (1990) and String Quartet No. 1, “Clouds” (1996) in accordance to Chinese philosophical and artistic principles.

The Three Pillars of Chinese Thought

In “Wenren and Culture,” Chou upholds the Chinese scholarly tradition of mastering classical literature and self-expression through calligraphy and landscape painting.3 The three

---


philosophies/religions that exerted the most influence on Chinese culture, and hence its art, are Taoism, Confucianism, and Buddhism. Taoism and Confucianism spread across China during the Warring States period (c. 700 BCE). The writings of Laozi, Confucius, and their respective disciples came to define Chinese culture. Buddhism had arrived in China from India by the end of the first century. Since Taoism and Confucianism have been the strongest philosophical influence on Chou, I will hereafter focus only on the two philosophies, to which Chou also cites frequently.

The Chinese character “Tao” embodies the continual process of change that could be traced back to the oldest of the Five Chinese Classics, I-Ching. It evolved through the long periods of ancient China (the present version dates back to Zhou Dynasty, 1150–249 BCE) as an oracle book and guide to the cosmic process. Tao is essentially the law of Nature and the foundation to its recurring cycles and fluctuations. The interplay between ying and yang developed into Confucian and Taoist concepts of humanity’s relationship and interaction with the world. In the preface to his first string quartet, “Clouds,” Chou describes the principle of Tao in the way clouds move, transform, and interact with each other:

The subtitle, “Clouds,” is neither programmatic nor extramusical. It refers to the quality shared by cloud formation and calligraphy: the continual process of change. The phenomenon of “mingling and melting clouds”—in transformation, aggregation and dispersion—is the aesthetic impetus for the musical events and progressions in the quartet.6

---


According to *I-Ching*, the universe originated from nullity into being (*Taichi*). *Taichi* then separated into two polarities, the *Ying* and the *Yang*. The two polarities bred the “four phenomena” from which *I-Ching* derived its eight trigrams.\(^7\) The primordial nullity (*Wu-Chi*) is analogous to *Nada-Brahma* from Hindu *Vedas*, which puts forth that all creation comes from a single soundless note. Laozi (c. 600 BCE) of the Eastern Zhou Dynasty (770–256 BCE), the promulgator of China’s School of Taoism, summed it up in simple terms: “From *Tao*, One is born; One begets Two; Two begets Three; from Three the myriad of things.”\(^8\)

In the 1960s Chou developed a modal system based on *I-Ching*’s operation and his synthesis of Eastern and Western music theories. Consisting of six notes, each mode is built upon three conjunct major thirds in an octave with an additional note interpolated in each major third. The interpolated note, or *pien* tone, determines the quality of the modes through chromatic inflection. Moreover, the modes may vary according to their ascending and descending orders, hence they are referred to as “variable modes.”\(^9\)

In his *Tao-Te Ching*, the influential Taoist classic, Laozi extrapolates the relationship among silence, sound, and their extensions: being and non-being, doing and non-doing, and stillness and movement. In this context, silence could be understood as genesis, a state of being, and both action and its antithesis, non-doing. The book opens as follows:

> The Tao that can be told
> is not the eternal Tao

---

\(^7\) Ibid., 49.


The name that can be named
is not the eternal Name.

The unnamable is the eternally real.
Naming is the origin
of all particular things.\textsuperscript{10}

Already we find the abstract and contradictory nature of Tao—a phenomenon that cannot be expressed through words. Since Taoism values the unnamable, the pristine, untamed state of being, this original “chaos” defines perfection.\textsuperscript{11} Once humans attach a name to the originally chaotic realm, we have the beginning of “things,” order, and transience. This phenomenon is analogous to silence as experience, a neutral state before the silence is broken. Movement I, m. 40 of “Clouds,” may be Chou’s version of the Taoist primordial state (Example 3.1).


\begin{figure}[h]
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{example.png}
\caption{Example 3.1: Chou Wen-Chung, “Clouds,” Movement I, m. 40.}
\end{figure}

Played \textit{senza misura}, the overlapping voices, \textit{crescendo} and \textit{decrescendo} in succession, suggesting the constant vicissitude of natural phenomena. Although the passage features


continuous sound, the measure as a whole is highlighted with a rest at the beginning and breath marks at the end. This coincides with I-Ching’s operation, where nullity begets being, and silence begets sound; silence and the primordial chaos are two manifestations of Tao.

Chapters 2 and 40 of Tao Te Ching read that both being and non-being are part of Tao’s process. Silence, pregnant yet empty at the same time, demonstrates this Taoist concept. In m. 10 of the string quartet’s third movement, the stacked notes appear in and out of silence within the measure, akin to the elusive existence of clouds (Example 3.2).

Example 3.2: Chou Wen-Chung, “Clouds,” Movement III, m. 10.

Therefore Tao, as manifested through silence, is formless yet speaks volumes. Silence as Tao remains ubiquitously and eternally present. We can experience silence and Tao, but once we attempt to verbalize either, their essence become lost.

Chapter 16 of Tao Te Ching provides another description of Tao that pertains to silence:

One aims to achieve utmost emptiness and guard the stillness. Observe how the myriad of beings return to their source. Returning to the source brings stillness; stillness brings renewal; renewal is the lasting principle;
and understanding this principle brings enlightenment. ¹²

This excerpt teaches that stillness is a prerequisite for obtaining enlightenment—not unlike the prerequisite of silence and solitude prior to St. John’s spiritual encounter (see Chapter 2).

“Emptiness” and “stillness” are two forms of silence, which, in this case, becomes both the process and the goal. Between m. 327 and m. 357, Chou transforms the music from “excited” and “restless” to “relaxing” and eventually, to silence (Example 3.3).

Example 3.3: Chou Wen-Chung, Windswept Peaks, mm. 353–357.

The structure (or form) of Windswept Peaks follows a palindromic, albeit asymmetrical, construction. ¹³ The “broad and slow” vibrato, represented by the symbol above E5 at m. 355, harks back to the sighing motive at m. 13 (Example 3.4). The emphasis on single tones and the surrounding emptiness in both instances frame the work as a whole.

Tao functions through non-doing, which also characterizes silence. Tao Te Ching uses “stillness” to describe how a ruler should reign and relates stillness to non-doing in Chapters 37 and 57. An excerpt from Chapter 37 reads:

¹² Laozi, Tao Te Ching, 57.
The Tao never does anything, yet through it all things are done.

If powerful men and women could venture themselves in it, the whole world would be transformed by itself, in its natural rhythms. People would be content with their simple, everyday lives, in harmony, and free of desire.

When there is no desire, all things are at peace.\(^\text{14}\)

_Tao Te Ching_ emphasizes repeatedly that the ruler should rule by non-doing. In other words, silence reigns over the movement or unrest that may exist in thought and action. Taoist non-doing, the silencing of will, can be found in the way Chou elevates the single tone and allows it to speak for itself without the aid of harmony or counterpoint.\(^\text{15}\) Influenced by the sound and techniques of the Chinese zither, the quality of the single tone becomes a defining characteristic of Chou’s music. Measures 13–33 of _Windswept Peaks_ illustrate how Chou explores the single tone’s potential, in this case, D4 and E4 on the violin (Example 3.4).

Example 3.4: Chou Wen-Chung, _Windswept Peaks_, mm. 13–17.

---

\(^{14}\) Laozi, _Tao Te Ching_, 98.

This example demonstrates how the musical notes react with silence: each dotted quarter note in the violin and clarinet parts above vibrates not only at the moment that they are played, but also through the rests that follow. As sound enters into and overlaps with silence, the rests, or silence, also take part in the vibration. Ultimately, silence itself is an example of Taoist non-doing, which can impart specific or general connotation depending on its context. By giving up expression through sound and allowing free rein to the imagination, silence creates balance and harmony in a musical work through “non-doing.”

Finally, the passage from Chapter 41 of *Tao Te Ching* summarizes what Tao would “sound” like:

> The greatest square has no corners;  
> the greatest vessel completes late,  
> *the greatest tone has no sound,*  
> the greatest image has no shape;  
> Tao is invisible and nameless [my italics].

In Taoist belief, all sounds stem from silence and ultimately distill back into silence. During a musical composition, a sounding note may break the silence, take part in a variable mode and its aggregate and transformations, and flow in and out of silence. But the note would eventually come to a rest by returning to its source—silence, which gives it the potential for renewal.

**Confucianism**

In Confucianism silence takes on a special significance from its Taoist interpretation. Not only is it an important component of achieving the “middle path,” but silence is also a virtue that ensures the society’s order. According to the * Analects*, a collection of Confucius’ teachings,

---

the application of silence can be found in the Confucian definition of humanity and the execution of propriety.

Book 6 of the Analects describes humanity: “The wise find pleasure in water; the virtuous find pleasure in hills. The wise are active; the virtuous are tranquil. The wise are joyful; the virtuous are long-lived.” This passage resonates with Taoist beliefs in its affinity to nature. The complementary relationship between sound and silence finds its counterpart between water and mountains, movement and tranquility, and joy and longevity.

In several passages, Confucius stresses silence’s importance during human interaction. He teaches in Book 2 of the Analects: “He acts before he speaks, and afterwards speaks according to his actions.” In Book 4 Confucius comments on the interaction with one’s neighbors: “The righteous man wishes to be slow in his speech and earnest in his conduct.”

Comparing the application of silence in Laozi’s Tao Te Ching and Confucius’ Analects, we see that silence not only defines Tao, but also regulates human behavior. The teachings from the two classics resonate with Chou’s artistic creed: “affinity to nature in conception, allusiveness in expression, and terseness in realization.” In Chou’s compositions, silence plays an important role in the formal design of the movements. For example, breath marks and rests signify the beginning of a new section or a motive in Windswept Peaks (Example 3.5).

---


18 Ibid., 150.

19 Ibid., 172.

Example 3.5: Chou Wen-Chung, *Windswept Peaks*, excerpt of m. 12, B-flat clarinet and piano parts.

In the middle of m. 12, the clarinet’s “echo” emerges from a rest, which also marks the end of the previously piercing B6. The duet between the piano and the clarinet gives way to another “Sighing” section at m. 13, which also follows a rest.

At m. 208 of *Windswept Peaks*, the beginning of the mid-point of its palindromic structure, 21 we find a series of alternating “Pensive” and “Insistent” phrases, each prepared by breath marks (Example 3.6).

---

Moreover, breath marks contribute to the “out of breath” effect along with the staccato sixteenth notes. The contrast between the pensive and insistent affects increases between m. 231 and m. 237, when the alternation takes place in the brief intervals of two or three measures. Throughout the section between m. 208 and m. 262, the breath marks not only demarcate the beginning and the end of each phrase, but also enhance the driving force, and later, the relaxing force during the section.
Silence has long been considered a virtue in Chinese culture—Confucius explains propriety in a famous reply to his student in Book 12 of *Analects*: “Look not at what is contrary to propriety; listen not to what is contrary to propriety; speak not what is contrary to propriety; make no movement which is contrary to propriety.”22 The regulatory function of silence could bring order to society. On the level of the musical composition, silence contributes to the structure and formal design to music built upon Chou’s own modal system.

**Calligraphy**

Chou frequently compares his works to Chinese calligraphy. In the preface to “Clouds,” he describes the affinity between the string quartet’s sound and calligraphy: “Because of its exceptional homogeneity, the flow of sound of a string quartet is as close a sonic equivalent to the flow of ink in brush calligraphy as that of the music for the zither, or qin.” The composer believes calligraphy and the sound of the Chinese zither to be the foundation of Eastern aesthetics.23 One of the manifestations of calligraphy in Chou’s music is through the aesthetics of silence, where the relationship between silence and sound in Chou’s music has its counterpart in how the calligrapher’s brushstrokes interact with the surrounding space.

Chou indicates frequent pauses in between musical motives. These breath marks correspond to the breaks between strokes during the execution of calligraphy. An example is m. 13 from the first movement of “Clouds” (Example 3.7).

_____

22 Confucius, *Confucian Analects*, 250.

Example 3.7: Chou Wen-Chung, “Clouds,” Movement I, mm. 13–16.

Measures 13–16 form a summarizing statement of the musical activities thus far. The breath marks in between measures demonstrate rhetorical silence by propelling the generation of each two-chord gesture.

Rests function similarly at m. 119 from Windswept Peaks, where the cello builds upon the two-note motive with each pause it takes (Example 3.8). The musical gestures connected by the rests constitute a musical phrase just as separate strokes make up a complete ideogram.

Example 3.8: Chou Wen-Chung, Windswept Peaks, mm. 119–22, cello part.

In the monograph Chinese Calligraphy, Chiang Yee identifies two types of calligraphic “activity” through which silence finds another application: they are the activity in stillness and the activity in motion. Activity in stillness describes the organic growth in the direction, shape, pattern, and grouping of the ideogram’s component strokes: “The character must have the
balance of a human being or nature or other object caught in the act of moving.”

This “silent” aspect of calligraphy translates to the formal structure of a musical phrase or movement; sustaining a tone or chord also exhibits the activity in stillness. On the other hand, the audience witnesses the activity in action during the performance, or the execution of the music.

In “Calligraphy and Musical Gestures in the Late Works of Chou Wen-Chung,” Yayoi Uno Everett discusses the kinesthetic energy in calligraphy through the concepts of liubai (leaving space), tianbai (filling space), and daibi (the “invisible” motion between strokes). Related closely to Chou’s system of variable modes, these concepts describe important aspects of the composer’s treatment of space or silence in his music. The characters liu and tian are the action verbs that one applies to the musical or calligraphic space (bai). Although space constitutes the visually silent aspect of calligraphy, it is filled with potential energy ready to be released.

Everett writes, “In the Chinese calligraphic concept called liubai, space is intentionally left open without ink as part of the overall visual design. Chou uses a reverse process to express liubai, which he describes as tianbai.” She points to the first five measures of “Clouds” as an example of tianbai, where the trichords in m. 2 and m. 4 are notes auxiliary to Chou’s modal complex. By “filling” in the space between the modal hexachords, Chou gives form to the invisible energy flow that would otherwise be silent. Chiang relates the blank spaces in Chinese landscape paintings to the empty places in calligraphy:

---


26 Ibid., 576.

27 Ibid., 579. On the other hand, Everett describes the gestural continuity in Chou’s music as daibi, “the
The part played by the blank spaces in Chinese paintings is noticed by everyone. These spaces are not, in the truest sense, “blank” at all, but constitute unstated expressions of sky, land or water. In calligraphy the “empty” portions of the imaginary character-squares are full of empty spaces to exhibit some inherent harmony with the strokes.\(^{28}\)

Below, I focus on the role of liubai, or the aesthetics of intentionally leaving space open as part of the visual design in calligraphy or landscape painting.

**Chinese Landscape Paintings**

As if to invoke Chinese landscape paintings in his music, Chou often gives his works pictorial titles—such as *Windswept Peaks* and “Clouds.” Chinese landscape painting reaches its peak during the Song Dynasty (960–1279). A quick survey of the compositions during this period shows the prominence of space in each work (Figure 3.1). The scenes of nature and the space that surrounds it often take the foreground. The human, if present, are usually to the side, almost in the form of suggestion. The space, or visual silence, becomes a balancing force between the painting’s objects.

Figure 3.1: Guo Xi (ca. 1000–1090, Northern Song Dynasty), *Old Trees, Level Distance*, handscroll, ink and color on silk, 35.9 x 104.8 cm, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York.

---

28 Chiang, 169.
In Figure 3.1, *Old Trees, Level Distance*, the different motifs spread out linearly as in a musical movement. Viewing from right to left, we first encounter the contour of distant mountains as the landscape emerges from a dense and misty atmosphere. Moving across the painting, the focus shifts as the mountain’s remote opaqueness transforms into a closer proximity of interweaving branches and rocks. The arrangement of space and objects, or the composition behind *Old Trees, Level Distance* can also be detected in *Windswept Peaks*. Both Guo Xi and Chou Wen-Chung successfully manipulate empty spaces as means to absorb the forces of movement and to establish equilibrium of tension between solids and voids.

In *Principles of Chinese Painting*, George Rowley summarizes that “qualitatively, the void is the symbol of ‘that non-existent in which the existent is,’ and quantitatively the voids have become more important than the solids.” In both *Windswept Peaks* and “Clouds,” Chou gives shape to the “voids” by extending the registral span of the melodic outline, thus drawing attention to the vertical space in between sounding notes (Example 3.9).

---


31 Rowley, 72.
In Example 3.9, the “expansive” gesture passes from the piano to the clarinet, and finally to the violin. All three parts encompass a significant registral span that range as much as six octaves in the piano part. The arpeggiation gives form to the vertical space, while the shifting of the upward gesture between the instruments draws attention to the horizontal space.

According to Rowley, the quality of the voids determines the painting’s design value, which consists of three spatial depths that the Chinese marked foreground, middle distance, and
far distance. Each type of depth is parallel to the picture plane, enabling the eye to leap from one
distance to the next through a void of space. 32 Rowley points out that the blank spaces in
Chinese painting are not a lack of figures, but “constitute unstated expressions of sky, land, or
water.” 33 The void must be alive in order to satisfy the solids. The three depths that Rowley
identifies in Chinese landscape paintings are analogous to the vertical, or textural, depths in
music. Measures. 13–39 from the first movement of “Clouds” contain musical texture that
develops from chordal to a linear solo melody to a duet (Example 3.10).


32 Rowley, 64

33 Ibid.
Void or silence supports the solo violin at m. 17. As other parts begin to fill in the space starting at m. 21, silence also qualifies the passage’s texture, which is akin to the operation in a fugue. Besides defining the vertical texture, silence can also contribute to the piece’s horizontal design and gives music the effect of the landscape scroll, as in the case of staggered entrance at m. 137 from the same movement.

In the third movement of “Clouds,” Chou creates a canvas for the viola solo through sustained chords (Example 3.11). As the chords alternate with measure-long rests, they approximate the dynamics of silence and evoke the space in Chinese landscape paintings. Throughout the movement, the texture changes continually while the individual melodies enter and exit the sound canvas. As a result, the spaces, or silence, also expand and contract accordingly.


As Example 3.11 demonstrates, Chou presents silence in rests, approximates silence through sounding tones, and realizes the otherwise inaudible kinesthetic energy flow through musical gestures. In the preface to Yūn (1969), an earlier work for chamber ensemble, Chou speaks of silence as an inaudible form of reverberation:
Some natural resonances are audible, such as: wind and thunder, rain drops and cascades, frogs and cicadas, waterfalls and tidal waves. Other reverberations are not. The Taoist philosopher, Chuang Tzu said: “When it cannot be heard by the ear, listen with the mind; that is when nature and art merge as one.”  

For Chou silence is both philosophical and natural. On the one hand, the inaudible reverberation may take form in the harmonics of qin music, which the composer may create through plucking the strings inside the piano. On the other hand, silence may also be a manifestation of yūn, a “reverberation (yūn) of the vitalizing force (ch’i) in nature” as well as in music.

---

34 Chou, preface to Yūn (New York: Peters, 1971).
Chapter 4

Silence in George Crumb’s *Music for a Summer Evening*

With a nod to Béla Bartók’s *Mikrokosmos*, George Crumb’s own series of *Makrokosmos* explore the piano as an orchestra unto itself through playing both inside and outside the instrument. In the program note to *Makrokosmos* Volume I (1972), Crumb mentions “certain recurrent haunting images” that accompanied the evolution of his compositional language. Two of the images’ sources are a quote from Blaise Pascal’s *Pensées* and verses from Rainer Maria Rilke’s poem “Herbst.” Eventually, Crumb would insert these quotations, as well as an excerpt from “Isola di Ulisse” (“Ulysses’ Isle”) by poet Salvatore Quasimodo (1901–1968), under the headings of the three larger movements from *Music for a Summer Evening* (subtitled *Makrokosmos* III). These quotations and the images they inspire, along with Boethius’s definition of music from *De institutione musica*, form the starting point from which I discuss the role of silence in *Music for a Summer Evening*.\(^2\)

Written for two amplified pianos and percussion, the five movements in *Music for a Summer Evening* are titled “Nocturnal Sounds (An Awakening),” “Wanderer-Fantasy,” “Advent,” “Myth,” and “Music of the Starry Night.” The descriptive titles aside, the work as a whole shows that Crumb defines the music for a “summer evening” loosely. Although summer is a season on earth, the work encompasses not only the night’s earthly utterances, but also its celestial resonances. Activities by nocturnal animals, humans’ religious rites, and natural sounds made audible through the night’s stillness are all examples of sounds on the earth. In contrast,

---

\(^1\) Bartók’s *Mikrokosmos* consists of six volumes of short pieces for the piano, which progress in difficulty.

\(^2\) Joseph Ralph DeBaise provides a thorough analysis of *Music for a Summer Evening* in “George Crumb’s *Music for a Summer Evening*: A Comprehensive Analysis” (PhD diss., The University of Rochester, 1983). The dissertation contains a brief section on rests and fermate, which I reference and expand upon in my discussion.
the sound of the celestial spheres is physically inaudible to humans, or silent: since the atmosphere on Earth enables sound waves to travel while the outer space lacks the medium for their transmission, humans can only observe but are unable to hear the movements of the spheres.

Consequently, Crumb had to invent his version of celestial sounds. To present “Music of the Starry Night” (the final movement of *Summer Evening*) would depend on the composer’s imagination. Philosophers throughout history have long observed the motions of stars and planets, giving way to the discipline of speculative music. In this respect, Crumb’s “Music of the Starry Night” harks back to one of Boethius’s three categories of music, *musica mundana*. The relationship between the concept of music according to Boethius’s *De institutione musica* and Crumb’s portrayal of silence in his various interpretations of the “summer evening” merits further exploration.

**Boethius’ Definitions of Music**

As an exponent of twentieth-century Western art music, Crumb’s *Makrokosmos* series may be traced back to the Music of the Spheres proposed by Plato and Pythagoras, from which Boethius derived his concept of *musica mundana*. Harmonic ratios govern everything from the order of the celestial spheres, the relationship between human body and soul, to the music perceivable by ear. This concept of sounding number, which defines speculative music, finds its application in Crumb’s compositions.

Nicky Losseff points out that the Music of the Spheres should be differentiated from St. John’s “silent music”: 
The Music of the Spheres is a Pythagorean expression of the structured, harmonic perfection of the cosmic order: the planets dancing their divinely-ordered and inexorable course—a music perceived by the intellect…. Even though it cannot reach human ears, and even though it may exist whether or not it is expressed, this music takes place in time (notionally at least) and “sounds” of planets turning. It is unheard by humans, but not literally unhearable or silent…. St. John’s ‘silent music,’ however, is both infinite and complete in itself. Unlike either heard or inaudible music, it does not require the passing of time to be grasped but is comprehended by the soul instantaneously.3

Losseff distinguishes between two types of silent music. Where Mompou’s *Musica callada* depicts St. John’s spiritual experience through music (see Chapter 2), Crumb presents his version of “cosmic music” in his *Makrokosmos* series.

According to Boethius, there are three types of music: instrumental music (*musica instrumentalis*), human music (*musica humana*), and cosmic music (*musica mundana* or music of the spheres). Although Crumb’s *Summer Evening* is an instrumental piece, one could classify the different movements and sections as one of Boethius’s three types of music. Together they represent the various aspects of the summer evening.

Lowest in the hierarchy is *musica instrumentalis*, which is “governed either by tension, as in strings, or by breath, as in the *aulos* or those instruments activated by water, or by a certain percussion, as in those which are cast in concave brass, and various sounds are produced from these.”4 Although Boethius only mentioned music produced through instruments, *musica instrumentalis* applies to all music perceivable through the ear.5 Crumb’s first movement, “Nocturnal-Sounds (An Awakening),” depicts earthly sounds that belong to *musica instrumentalis*. The fourth movement, “Myth,” showcases instruments from various continents.

---


5 Susan Rankin, “Conceptualizing the Harmony of the Spheres,” in *Citation and Authority in Medieval and Renaissance Musical Culture*, edited by Suzannh Clark and Elizabeth Leach (Woodbridge, Suffolk: Boydell Press, 2005), 7.
as well as the human voice; thus, one could also describe certain passages from “Myth” as *musica instrumentalis*.

The next level is *musica humana*. Boethius writes: “Whoever penetrates into his own self perceives human music. For what unites the incorporeal nature of reason with the body if not a certain harmony and, as it were, a careful tuning of low and high pitches as though producing one consonance?”⁶ According to Boethius, *musica humana* is music of the mind, which finds a fitting interpretation in *Summer Evening*’s second and third movements. The second movement, “Wanderer-Fantasy,” depicts the wanderer’s train of thought, dreams, and longing. The title itself harks back to Schubert’s *Wanderer-Fantasie* for the piano, Op. 15—in addition to portraying the wanderer’s psyche, the movement also acknowledges its lineage in the Western musical heritage. The third movement, “The Advent,” reproduces the human’s fear and reverence toward the divine.

Cosmic music merits the most explanations from Boethius. Here, the philosopher qualifies the spheres’ silent music:

For how can it happen that so swift a heavenly machine moves on a mute and silent course? Although that sound does not penetrate our ears—which necessarily happens for many reasons—it is nevertheless impossible that such extremely fast motion of such large bodies should produce absolutely no sound, especially since the courses of the stars are joined by such harmonious union that nothing so perfectly united, nothing so perfectly fitted together, can be realized….

….. And just as, on the one hand, adjustment of pitch in lower strings is such that lowness does not descend into silence, while, on the other hand, adjustment of sharpness in higher strings is carefully monitored lest the excessively stretched strings break because of the tenuity of pitch, but the whole corpus of pitches is coherent and harmonious with itself, in the same way we discern in cosmic music that nothing can be so excessive that it destroys something else by its own intemperance.⁷

---

⁶ Ibid., 7.

⁷ Ibid., 9.
Using the analogy of the strings, Boethius points out that sound continues to exist even though the strings no longer accommodate it, thereby affirming sound’s presence in silence. As if responding to Boethius’s rhetorical question (“For how can it happen that so swift a heavenly machine moves on a mute and silent course?”), Crumb gives form to cosmic music in the fifth movement, “Music of the Starry Night.”

Since music can be viewed as notes filling up temporal space, rests acquire the pragmatic function of organizing and framing musical material. In *Music for a Summer Evening*, silence also contributes to music’s mimetic power and ethereal qualities. In what follows I interpret each movement of Crumb’s work through Beothius’s classification of music.

**Music for a Summer Evening (1974)**

In the program notes to *Music for a Summer Evening* recorded on the 1975 Nonesuch label, Crumb credits Béla Bartók for formulating the combination of two pianos and percussion in *Sonata* (1937). Crumb contributes to the genre with *Summer Evening*, which he composed for and dedicated to Gilbert Kalish, James Freeman, Raymond DesRoches, and Richard Fitz, who premiered it at Swarthmore College in 1974.

While interpreting *Summer Evening* from the point of Boethius’s *De institutione musica*, I approach silence from various perspectives: on the broader conceptual level, there is the silent music of the cosmos. On the level of the music and the score, there exists acoustic silence and structural silence in forms of rests. Since *Summer Evening* contains both measured and

---

unmeasured music, I refer to the system and page number on the Peters 1974 edition of the score when discussing music examples that are not measured.  

First Movement, “Nocturnal Sounds (The Awakening)”

“Nocturnal Sounds (The Awakening)” presents the earthly sounds of the night. The sounds from nature, including insects or other creatures on earth, form an essential part of the summer evening’s sound palette. While the movement portrays the earthly sounds, Crumb instructs that the music should be “magical, suspenseful,” thereby imparting the nocturnal world ethereal qualities.

In the score, Crumb inserts a quote under the movement title: “Odo risonanze effimere, oblio di piena notte nell’acqua stellata” (“I hear ephemeral echoes, oblivion of full night in the starred water”). Salvatore Quasimodo’s verse from “Ulysses’ Isle” inspires a programmatic reading of the movement, where music depicts in turn the “ephemeral echoes,” “full night,” and “the starred water.” Although the “full night in the starred water” evokes image rather than sound, the juxtaposition between the two scenarios of the “full night” and the “starred water” finds an analogy in the accumulation of sounding space which gradually takes over the silent space during the course of the movement.

“Nocturnal Sounds” incorporates activities in both the visual and aural fields. Before making any sound, the pianists need to depress a forearm cluster silently and secure the notes with the damper pedal (Example 4.1). As a result, music has begun before the audience hears a

---


10 Salvatore Quasimodo, quoted in Crumb’s *Music for a Summer Evening*.

sound from the score. In “Silence of the Frames,” Richard Littlefield defines the silence that frames the starting and ending of a musical work.\(^\text{12}\) In the case of “Nocturnal Sounds,” silence not only frames and prepares the piece, but also initiates the performance. The silence that accompanies the physical movements thus signifies the awakening of the nocturnal world.

With the absence of daylight, silence forms the night’s backdrop. Sound first appears sporadically, intruding upon silence timidly. Here the rests function to demarcate the musical events, as well as being part of the musical texture. Since rests indicate an absence of musical sound, I consider them a form of silence. Throughout the first system, the spontaneous notes emerge from silence and are accompanied by it (Example 4.1).\(^\text{13}\)


---


\(^\text{13}\) This interpretation differs from Debaise’s analysis, where he considers that the purpose of the rest is “to cease the progress of thematic presentation momentarily, and to isolate the small thematic units for maximum impression.” Debaise, “George Crumb’s *Music for a Summer Evening*,” 49.
The Japanese temple bells that follow provide textural and rhythmic contrast (Example 4.2); their sound emerges from silence “like a breath” instead of intruding upon it like the previous musical figures. The sound of the temple bells may be interpreted as an utterance by the quiet night, which creates distance and depth and invokes a breath of expectation.

Example 4.2: George Crumb, “Nocturnal Sounds,” Japanese temple bells, p. 6, first system.

Musical activities become more frequent and the texture thickens as the movement develops. Sound begins to takeover silence; by the second page of the score, sound has gained freedom in the temporal space, uncontrolled by meter or silence.

On p. 7, first system, the ritardando stretches out the duration of each note and makes flexible the temporal space. The frequency of the sound unit’s appearance increases and begins to occur simultaneously with rests, or musical silence. On p. 9 the ostinato figure in Piano I expands into a layer of continuous sound, accompanied by the trills in Percussion II. The velocissimo notes in Piano I form a backdrop for other musical activities. These runs constitute
the passage’s scaffolding that had been silent in the beginning of the movement. The movement reaches its climax in the middle of p. 10, third system, accumulating to the splash from the large suspense cymbal. In the final system, the fermatas allow the sound to vibrate and offer a moment of respite from the preceding sound mass.

Second Movement, “Wanderer-Fantasy”

In the “Performance Notes,” Crumb defines the comma symbol (Example 4.3) as “‘breath’ or pause,” which is distinct from the symbol for musical rest. The comma functions the same way as breath marks in vocal music, giving the music a more organic flow; conversely, rests often provide rhythmic impetus to the musical events. The difference between the “comma” and rests is best demonstrated in the second movement, “Wanderer-Fantasy.” In this movement, the sliding whistle starts and ends the movement, as if calling and responding to the middle section by Piano I and II. The movement can be described as *musica humana* as it creates the dreamy state of the Wanderer’s mind.

The comma during the opening whistle passage acts as a breath mark. Since the breath is a defining characteristic of life, its inclusion in the music affirms the life-like nature of the passage.\(^\text{14}\)

---

\(^{14}\) Cf. “divine breathings,” and “the Musick of Heaven” discussed in Tom Dixon, “‘Mediation is the Musick of Souls’: The Silent Music of Peter Sterry (1613–1672),” in *Silence, Music, Silent Music*, 187–204.

In contrast to the comma, the rests in the second system create syncopation in the quarter notes of Piano II (Example 4.4).


Unlike the organic breath in the first system, rests that occurs in the piano parts provide rhythmic organization to the phrase.

The dynamics of the whole movement consists of gradations of softness from *mp* to *pppp*. The middle section contains extremely quiet sound, which implies the section’s affinity to silence. The close approximation to silence from its dynamics sets “Wanderer-Fantasy” apart from the other movements. The music can be interpreted as a sequence of thoughts that are distant yet familiar, akin to how one could feel about silence.
Third Movement, “The Advent”

Crumb associates “The Advent” with a passage from Pascal’s *Pensée*: “Le silence éternel des espaces infinis m’effraie” (“The eternal silence of infinite space terrifies me”). Although Pascal’s quote pertains directly to silence, “The Advent” begins with fff. In addition to portraying Pascal’s overwhelming fear of the “eternal silence,” the movement becomes a manifestation of “deafening” silence (Example 4.5).


The first eight measures showcase the building up of voice parts and a long crescendo that climaxes at m. 8. Unlike the first movement, sound asserts its power from the outset, filling the physical space with arpeggios and their resonances. The following transitional section, labeled “stark, luminous!”, connects the two main sections of the movement: the opening section

---

and “Hymn for the Nativity of the Star Child” (Example 4.6). The music becomes unmeasured after m.16. Here, the piano part consists of upward leaps that feature reiterations of bright open fifth chords.

Example 4.6: George Crumb, “The Advent,” m. 16, “a tempo; stark, luminous!”

The openness and airiness around the individual notes contribute to the “luminous” effect. Instead of inspiring fear, the music now conveys the security of the sounding notes as they resonate through silence.

The third and last section, “Hymn of the Nativity of the Star Child,” continues to feature the interval of the fifth (Example 4.7). The sequence of open chords, played in glissandi on the piano strings, are separated by fermatas.
The four-second fermata that accompanies each plucking (Piano I) and glissando (Piano II) over the strings emphasizes the chord’s function as announcement and conclusion to the boxed passage.

Alone the lines of *Pensée*, in which Pascal proposes a defense of Christianity, Crumb associates the third movement with the penitential season of Advent, when one anticipates Jesus’ Nativity. The opening section of “The Advent” voices the individual’s fear of silence; however, the “stark, luminous!” section (m. 16) transforms the fear into a hymnal offering to the “Star-Child.” As a result, the movement becomes a negotiation between the mind and soul, fear and faith. It belongs to *musica humana*, but the “stark, luminous!” section, which suggests divine inspiration, invokes *musica mundana*.
Fourth Movement, “Myth”

I consider the fourth movement “Myth” an example of *musica instrumentalis*. As a man-made account or narrative, myth, in Crumb’s depiction, is told through the sounds of ancient instruments. Non-Western instruments used in this movement include African log drum, mbira, and Tibetan prayer stones, which evoke myth’s universality. “Myth” features isorhythmic organization while silence, in forms of rests, enhances the rhythmic division and timbral contrasts. Crumb prolongs the variety of instrumental and vocal sounds through rests, allowing precise articulation and freedom in each note (Example 4.8).

Example 4.8: George Crumb, “Myth,” mm. 27–30.

The texture of “Myth” remains sparse throughout. The musical activities continue to organize the temporal space and emphasize silence’s presence. The piano and the human voice are used percussively as part of the eclectic sound fabric. Finally, the movement contains sounds that are not traditionally considered “music,” but are encountered in everyday life in the form of
ambient sounds. They include bending pitch from a jug and “groaning sound” from the throat; all of which form the memory of myth that humans share. Like the instruments from the various cultures that are used in this movement, myth has survived through history. If one extends further back in history, the universe’s origin becomes the ultimate myth. Crumb gives his version of the cosmos, or *musica mundana*, in the final movement.

**Fifth Movement, “Music of the Starry Night”**

The first four movements have depicted the human and the mythical; together, they culminate in the celestial music of the last movement. In “Music of the Starry Night,” Crumb cites these transcendent images by Rainer Maria Rilke:

> Und in den Nächten fällt die schwere Erde
> aus allen Sternen in die Einsamkeit.
> Wir alle fallen
> […]
> Und doch ist Einer, welcher dieses Fallen
> unendlich sanft in seinen Händen hält.

(And in the nights the heavy earth is falling from all the stars down into loneliness. We are all falling […] And yet there is One who holds this falling endlessly gently in His hands.)  

The excerpt comes from Rilke’s poem “*Herbst*” (Fall), which extends the theme of falling leaves in autumn to that of the falling Earth. Continuing from the previous movements, the fifth movement for a summer evening takes us from the earthly realm to the heavenly realm. The last movement portrays the phenomenon of the Earth falling from the stars and opens with the crushing notes that sound like breaking glass pieces (Example 4.9).

---


The fermatas assume an imposing presence in “Music of the Starry Night.” Joseph Debaise identifies fermata’s two basic functions in *Music for a Summer Evening*: to separate and to aid transition between contrasting materials. In Example 4.9, we see that the fermatas are continuation of the preceding musical gesture, which allow space for the harmonics to resonate. Additionally, the fermatas also create suspense and prolong the symbolism of endless falling. Since the audience remains unaware of the fermata’s marked length, a few seconds can feel like infinity until the next musical gesture appears.

As inspired by Rilke’s verse, there is “One” (“Einer”) who holds the falling. In Crumb’s movement, Bach’s music could represent “the One.” The quotation from the D-sharp minor Fugue, *Well-tempered Clavier* Book II, emerges from the depth after each segment of falling, framed by fermatas (Example 4.10).

---

17 Debaise, 51.
The “Fivefold Galactic Bells” announce the “Song of Reconciliation,” in which the metered music represents, in Crumb’s words, “cosmic time” (Example 4.11). The drone fifth on G-flat and D-flat, along with the repeated eighteenth-note thematic unit, creates harmonic stasis and the illusion of a time vacuum.

At the beginning of the “Song of Reconciliation,” rests functions to demarcate each iteration of the thematic unit. Toward the end of the movement, rests become more prominent as musical activities decrease and give way to open space. On p. 24 the Japanese temple bells begin to emerge one after the other; in the second system, we encounter the whistle. It should be recalled that the Japanese temple bells, sounding “like a breath,” opens the first movement, while the whistle opens and closes the second movement. By including both timbres in the fifth movement, Crumb unites *musica instrumentalis* and *musica humana*; in other words, the two are combined in the fifth movement to represent *musica mundana*. In the last system of the fifth movement (Example 4.12), the Japanese temple bells again emerge “like a breath,” while other piano and percussion parts play whole-tone clusters marked *ppppp (quasi niente)*. With this cadential
gesture, Crumb recontextualizes Pascals’ “eternal silence and infinite space” in Rilke’s version of grounded serenity.

Conclusion

With its mimetic inclinations, music may also aspire to silence’s condition. This would then lead to an inherently paradoxical project, where sound emulates the absence of itself. The paradox makes silence powerful in a musical context. Through its many forms of manifestations, silence has the ability to evoke itself and be evoked.

As I write this thesis, the subject of silence has continued to gain traction. In the fall of 2010, New York City’s Lincoln Center inaugurated its annual White Light Festival with the mission of exploring the spiritual dimension of music.\(^1\) The festival event that showed special resonance with this thesis was a panel discussion titled “The Sound of Silence”; the guests included author Karen Armstrong, auditory physiologist Christopher Shera, and composer John Adams. After an almost mandatory performance of \(4'33''\), Armstrong turned to the famous passage from the Bible: “In the beginning was the word” and added that silence came before the word. This observation harks back to the primordial “soundless note” from Hindi and Toaist texts that I discussed in Chapter 3.

From a physiological standpoint, Shera pointed out that listening is also an experience in “touching” the sound. Our skin and ears feel or touch the rippling of sound waves and of the air molecules that exist during the relative silence. He emphasized that in terms of the required energy, silence differs little from sound; however, humans impart various meanings or spiritual dimensions to both sound and silence. From a composer’s perspective, Adams demonstrated the complementary relationship between sound and silence through his two compositions: *Strange and Sacred Noise* (1997) for percussion quartet and *In the White Silence* (1998) for orchestra. Although the titles contain the words “noise” and “silence,” respectively, the first work includes  

several minutes of structured silence while *In the White Silence* consists of seventy-five minutes of continual sound. Adams quoted Cage’s famous “there is no such thing as silence” and related the statement to his exploration of “global” or “ecological” listening, where the surrounding environment figures into the musical work and becomes part of one’s own listening experience.

While Adams considers sound and silence as part of his global listening experience, composer Joel Hoffman engages with silence in a more systematic manner. As stated in the program note to his work *départs* (2009) for solo viola, silence often functions to “frame and contextualize the notes.” During the piece, the violist would need to listen through the rests and treat silence equally as the musical notes that it surrounds. In Hoffman’s *9 Pieces for Piano* (2010), silence becomes the structural determinant of the work as it distinguishes the phrases and, at the same time, links each piece of the set together.

Throughout this study, I have discussed silence in art music from both Western and Eastern aesthetics. Yet the idea of silence also pervades popular culture. A case in point is “The Sound of Silence” by the folk-rock duo Simon and Garfunkel. Written in the aftermath of John F. Kennedy’s assassination in 1964, the song topped the charts in 1966. It laments the lost of the voice of truth and people’s indifference with the words

> “Fools,” said I, “You do not know
> Silence like a cancer grows
> Hear my words that I might teach you
> Take my arms that I might reach you”
> But my words, like silent raindrops fell
> And echoed
> In the wells of silence.”

---


Here the “sound of silence” has special social and political implications. As music from other
cultures extends its reach, silence also takes on other levels of connotation.

By discussing silence in terms of its manifestations and functions, I have demonstrated
some of silence’s main applications in Western music. In theoretical, musicological, and
compositional realms, silence has begun to receive equal status as its sounding counterpart. All
this is to show that silence continues to remain as relevant as ever before and beyond Cage.
Bibliography


