INFORMATION TO USERS

This manuscript has been reproduced from the microfilm master. UMI films the text directly from the original or copy submitted. Thus, some thesis and dissertation copies are in typewriter face, while others may be from any type of computer printer.

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleedthrough, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send UMI a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

Oversize materials (e.g., maps, drawings, charts) are reproduced by sectioning the original, beginning at the upper left-hand corner and continuing from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps. Each original is also photographed in one exposure and is included in reduced form at the back of the book.

Photographs included in the original manuscript have been reproduced xerographically in this copy. Higher quality 6” x 9” black and white photographic prints are available for any photographs or illustrations appearing in this copy for an additional charge. Contact UMI directly to order.

UMI
A Bell & Howell Information Company
300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor MI 48106-1346 USA
313/761-4700  800/521-0600
THE INFUSION OF AFRICAN AMERICAN ART FROM EIGHTEEN-EIGHTY TO THE EARLY NINETEEN-NINETIES FOR MIDDLE AND HIGH SCHOOL ART EDUCATION

DISSERTATION

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree Doctor of Philosophy in the Graduate School of The Ohio State University

By

Ronald Wayne Claxton, B.S., M.A.E.

The Ohio State University

1997

Dissertation Committee:

Dr. Vesta A. H. Daniel, Advisor
Dr. Arthur Efland
Dr. Sidney Walker

Approved By

Advisor

Department of Art Education
ABSTRACT

In this study I investigate one middle school art education text, *Understanding and Creating Art*, by Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunders (1986) and one high school art education text, *A Basic History of Art* by Janson and Janson (1992). I use content analysis research methodology to explore the written text for the diverse discourses on African American art and artists from the 1880's to 1992 in art history. This study focuses on the authors' sundry interpretations in which African American art and artists are represented. I investigated the authors' descriptions and interpretations on African American art and artist by probing three key issue categories such as: 1) historical (style isms, media, technique and terms), 2) anthropological (cultural diversity, social, culture, difference, race, representation, gender), 3) rhetorical (validation of multicultural views, D.B.A.E., identifications, description, interpretation, language assumptions, and attitudes).

This study examines key words like realism, cubism, expressionism etc. for historical issues, key words like minorities, mainstream, dominant, cultural and social for anthropological issues, and key words like non-Western, elements of design, race, ethnicity, gender, other, and difference for rhetorical issues. The context of the authors' descriptions and interpretations on all the represented artists within a given chapter, unit, and/or segment becomes the subject under analysis.
For My Mother, Georgia Louise Claxton

iii
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

First and foremost God must be given the most positive praise for blessing me through my successes, trials and tribulations. Secondly I would like to thank Dr. Vesta A.H. Daniel, Dr. Sidney Walker, and Dr. Arthur Efland for their direction and guidance in my research. Dr. Vesta Daniel was most instrumental in helping me better understand the importance of my research. Her role was vital for she informed me on lectures, artist talks, and multimedia resources that pertained to my topic. Dr. Sidney Walker illuminated areas of research of which I had littler understanding. Thanks to her professional leadership I developed a new knowledge base. Dr. Arthur Efland's keen insight with the history of art education and curriculum development motivated me to think and challenge traditional ways of studying art history, disseminating information on art, as well as helping me develop critical thinking skills. I would like to thank my colleagues, Carlyle Johnson, Dr. Charles Janson, Janet Higgins, Marisa Recchia for their kind, consistent mentoring. I would like to thank my best friends, Sam Starks, Bobby Graves, and Craig Spears who gave me an ample supply of positive support. I would like to thank my special friend, Rollin Seward, for reminding me that I am a sensitive and unselfish human being whom loves educating and empowering others. Last but not least I would like to thank my Mother, sisters, and brothers for their presence in my life. My learning experience with them has truly enriched my understanding of family, love, and sacrifice.
VITA

December 10, 1959.................................Born - Bloomfield, Kentucky

1982......................................................B.S. Art Education, Western Kentucky
              University, Bowling Green, Kentucky

1984......................................................M.A.E. Art Education, Western
              Kentucky
              University, Bowling Green, Kentucky

1986......................................................Art Instructor, Middle Tennessee State
              University, Murfreesboro, Tennessee

1992......................................................Panel Committee, Tennessee Arts
              Commission, Nashville, Tennessee

1994......................................................Graduate Teacher, The Ohio State
              University, Newark, Ohio

1994......................................................One Man Show, Martin Luther King
              Cultural Arts Center, Columbus, Ohio

1995......................................................Assistant Art Professor, Middle
              Tennessee State University,
              Murfreesboro, Tennessee
FIELDS OF STUDY

Major Field: Art Education

Studies in Art History and Curriculum
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dedication</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgments</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vita</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Tables</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Illustrations</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapters</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. UNDERSTANDING AFRICAN AMERICAN ART</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need for the Study</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Difference In Learning</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Race and Ethnocentrism in the Art Education</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Perspectives on Aesthetics</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historic Perspectives on African Descended Art and Artists</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Variables and Curriculum Development</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The African American Artist: Art and Culture</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statement of the Problem</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Related Literature</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purpose of the Study</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Definitions of Terms</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limitations</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. REVIEW OF LITERATURE</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Defining and Discussing Multicultural Art</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Defining and Identifying Multicultural Education</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multicultural Education</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiethnic Education</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational Psychology</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Art Education and Theory</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>African American Art History</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recent Literature on The Harlem Renaissance</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The 1960's and 1970's Art Movement</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recent Discussions on African American Art</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discourses on Race and Representation</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Defining Art History</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. PROCEDURE</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identification of the Two Art History Texts</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Description of Methodology for Content Analysis</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approaches For Viewing and Discussing Art</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. PRESENTATION OF THE DATA</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

viii
Analysis of Two Art Education Texts From 1880 To 1992

Middle School Art Textbook ........................................................... 61
Horace Pippin and Artwork ............................................................ 61
William Edmondon and Artwork ................................................... 85
Charles White and Artwork ......................................................... 104
Romare Bearden and Artwork ..................................................... 118
High School Art Textbook ............................................................ 133
Henry Tanner and Artwork ........................................................... 133
William T. Williams ...................................................................... 149
Barbara Chase-Riboud and Artwork ........................................... 164
Jame Van Der Zee and Artwork ................................................... 179

5. IMPLICATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS .................................. 197

Main Purpose ................................................................................. 197
Janson and Janson (1992): Main Purpose .......................... 198
Janson and Janson (1992): Sociocultural Approach
.................................................................................................. 200
Janson and Janson (1992): Race and Representation
.................................................................................................. 201
Comparison of the Textbooks ................................................... 203
Philosophy For Teaching............................................................... 204
Guidelines And Recommendations................................. 205
ix
APPENDIX .................................................................................................................. 208

List of Illustrations .................................................................................................. 209

LIST OF REFERENCES ............................................................................................. 242
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Pippin: Chapter artists and artworks</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Description of artworks</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Rhetorical Strategies</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>Terms: specific keywords</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>Edmondson: Chapter artists and artworks</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Description of artworks</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Rhetorical Strategies</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Terms: specific keywords</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>White: Chapter artists and artworks</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>Description of artworks</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Rhetorical Strategies</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Terms: specific keywords</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Bearden: Chapter artists and artworks</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Description of artworks</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>Rhetorical Strategies</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Terms: specific keywords</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Tanner: Chapter artists and artworks</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>Description of artworks</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Rhetorical Strategies</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Illustration</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Washington at Princeton by M. M. Sanford</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>End of War, Starting Home, 1918 by Horace Pippin</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>St. George and the Dragon by a 15th-century artist</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>St. George and the Dragon by Raphael</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>Benjamin Franklin Drawing Electricity from the Sky by Benjamin West</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Joan of Arc by Jules Bastien-LePage</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Esther and Ahasuerus by Artemisia Gentileschi</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>The Presidents on Mt. Rushmore by Gutzon Burglum</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>Monument of Bartolommeo Colleoni by Andrea del Verrocchio</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>Bronco Billy by Frederic Remington</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Groggy by Mahonri M. Young</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Jack Johnson by William Edmondson</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>The Preacher by William Edmondson</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>The Preacher by Charles White</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.5 Gross Clinic by Thomas Eakins...............................................................221
5.1 Still Life with Fruit Bowl by Pablo Picasso............................................222
5.2 Breakfast by Juan Gris.............................................................................223
5.3 Battle of Lights: Coney Island by Joseph Stella....................................224
5.4 House and Street by Stuart Davis...........................................................225
5.5 My Egypt by Charles Demuth.................................................................226
6.1 She-Ba by Romare Bearden.................................................................227
6.2 Arrangement in Black and Gray: The Artist's Mother by James
Abbott McNeill Whistler............................................................................228
6.3 Nocturne in Black and Gold by James Abbott McNeill
Whistler........................................................................................................229
6.3 The Morning Bell by Winslow Homer.....................................................230
6.5 William Rush Carving His Allegorical Figure of the Schuykill by
Thomas Eakins............................................................................................230
7.1 The Banjo Lesson by Henry O. Tanner.....................................................231
7.2 Red Blue Green by Ellsworth Kelly........................................................232
7.3 Empress of India by Frank Stella.............................................................232
7.4 Batman by William T. Williams...............................................................233
7.5 Odalisk by Robert Rauschenberg...........................................................234
8.1 Essex by John Chamberlain.....................................................................234
8.2 Black Cord by Louise Nevelson...............................................................235
8.3 Confessions for Myself by Barbara Chase-Riboud............................236
8.4 The Steerage by Alfred Stieglitz..............................................................237
8.5 Equivalent by Alfred Stieglitz.................................................................238
9.1 Pepper by Edward Weston....................................................................238
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>Moonrise, Hernandez, New Mexico by Ansel Adams</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>Fort Peck Dam by Margaret Bourke-White</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>The Wife of the Reverend Becton, Pastor Salem Methodist Church</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>by James Van Der Zee</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1

NEED FOR THE STUDY

The ideal situation is an equilibrium of self-respect between groups. It is hoped that we can achieve this by dissemination of information about different ethnic backgrounds. In the effort to insure youth that they are important and that their ancestors have made valuable contributions, it is also important for them to know that other people, different from themselves, have also made contributions to humanity, which can be respected and appreciated, and that each student has a contribution to make in the effort to improve the quality of living in the United States (Grigsby, 1977).

When art educators in the United States examine visual art of ethnic groups, they need to assess the Western view of aesthetics. Often when studying art from diverse ethnic groups, Western civilization overlooks elements which pertain to non-Western philosophies of art (e.g. mysticism, spiritualism). Art must to be explored in the context of the specific culture that produced the creation. I have chosen to conduct a historical, anthropological, and rhetorical inquiry about African American art and artists. I am particularly interested in recommendations and guidelines for teaching art history and aesthetics pertaining to African American art for grades kindergarten-twelve. According to Grigsby (1977) and Gollnick & Chinn (1990) art should be taught as a subject that addresses diverse ethnic heritages. In this study I explore the context of African American art and artists are discussed historically in two art education textbooks for middle and high school students.
This investigation limits itself to African American art and artists, since no one study could encompass the great variety of art from all cultures. Students will gain a better understanding of African Americans and their cultural identities through an enhanced art education curriculum. A content analysis of two art education textbooks in which I will focus on historical, anthropological, and rhetorical issues constitutes the body of this dissertation. Since a disproportionate number of African American artists are presented to students in art education textbooks, there is a need to find out where and how African American art and artists are discussed, and who they really are.

**Cultural Difference In Learning**

Ogbu (1992b) discusses multicultural education and core curriculum as inappropriate educational approaches to teaching diverse ethnic groups. He states that multiculturalists as well as those who implement core curriculum procedures provide a false teaching/learning environment. Multicultural education has a faulty design while core curriculum attempts don't properly address individual deficiencies of students (Ogbu, 1992b). He cites the problem as follows:

I argue that neither of the two responses will have an appreciable impact on the school-learning problems of those minorities who have not traditionally done well in school. The reason is that they are not based on a good understanding of the nature of the cultural diversity or cultural differences of minority groups. (p. 5)

Ogbu (1992b) quotes Yee (1991) on the question of who needs multicultural education and who does not. The pertinent issue becomes the academic enhancement of all students. Furthermore he iterates, how core curriculum and multicultural education will not be appropriate for learning until
an understanding of why children from specific minority groups are experiencing learning and performance difficulty. What becomes problematic is that each minority group's language in relationship to dominant culture varies. There are differences from one minority to another (Ogbu, 1992b). Students bring to the classroom ideas, values, beliefs, and often traditions that are closely connected to their family background. Due to diversity in student populations, educators, school administrators, and parents must for example familiarize themselves with individual minorities, learn to identify students with learning problems, and address gender and/or sex issues (Gollnick and Chinn, 1990; Ogbu, 1992a, 1992b). Various terms used by Ogbu (1992a), which follow below, provide a description of different dynamics at work within a group of learners:

1. "community forces"- includes the idea that there are great variables when looking at different minorities.
2. "cultural model"- (also known as folk theory, Ogbu, 1974; Bohannan, 1957; Holland & Quinn, 1987; Holy & Stuchlik, 1981) refers to peoples' understandings of their world.
3. "cultural language frames of references"- refers to a group before it became a minority (i.e. before immigrants from China, India, or Latin American arrived in the United States). Using these terms, Ogbu (1990a) points to how school and community relate to student learning:

   I suggest that an essential key to understanding the differences in the school adjustment and academic performance of minority groups is understanding of (a) the cultural models a minority group has with regard to the U.S. society and schooling. (b) the cultural and language frame of reference of a minority group. (c) the degree of trust or acquiescence the minorities have for White Americans and the societal institutions they control, and (d) the educational strategies that result from the above elements. These four factors are dependent in part on the group's
history, its present situation, and its future expectations. They are combined in the term community forces. (p. 289)

Ogbu (1992a) argues that because minority students have to adjust to dominant culture, they face additional learning problems. Primary cultural differences exist in the first place If for example, a non-Japanese speaking White American student moves to Tokyo, Japan, linguistic and cultural differences occur when the student arrives in Japan. Cultural difference becomes notable for this student because not only does he/she have to learn the new culture's language as well as deal with "inner self" ambivalence which did not occur when he/she was part of the dominant culture. In a similar fashion the African American student deals with "inner ambivalence" in the dominant culture. Ogbu (1990a) expounds further in the following with his concept:

Oppositional or ambivalent cultural frames of reference are due to secondary cultural language differences. The latter are differences that arose after a group has become a minority, such as Blacks were brought to America as slaves, or after an American Indian tribe was conquered, moved, and placed on a "reservation." (p. 289)

When minority students face new language differences, they either can make the choice to change and adapt to new White and/or dominant culture language or revert back to previous learning. The popular choice for survival in a technologically changing society is to make the first choice. Even agricultural careers or employment opportunities are linked to technology. Ogbu (1992a) relates how minorities have to learn and overcome secondary cultural language differences. Often minorities become conformists when they try to assimilate dominant culture or act like White Americans, but somehow are punished by their own group for their endeavors. Often minorities feel that their way of life is
altered by the dominant culture. Their way of learning and understanding becomes shared with dominant culture and minorities have to develop a collective sense of identity and self-worth (Ogbu, 1992a). Addressing the demographics of the classroom is crucial. Race and ethnocentrism in the art education classroom should not be overlooked. Exclusion occurs when such issues are ignored.

Race And Ethnocentrism In the Art Education Curriculum

Race is a factor that cannot be ignored in the classroom. When referring to race and ethnocentrism, we as art educators must be aware of our covert as well as overt behavior regarding a diverse student population. Grant (1988) stated that race is an important component in education and that teachers must daily consider its importance to the educational welfare of students, especially students of color. We as educators must realize that there is more than one way of teaching. Efland (1994) stated that there is more than one perspective in teaching any discipline, e.g., dominant culture, feminist, post modern, etc. Most often, curriculum is driven by dominant culture. However, cultural orientation is an important process art educators must consider. It entails introducing our students to other cultural or subcultural groups represented in our society (Grant 1988; Garcia 1993). As part of this inquiry I will examine issues concerning teaching tolerance, the dichotomy of resistance-acculturation, and assimilation. I will focus on African American art as a meaningful part of art education curricula. Again, we must pay closer attention to curriculum design as it relates to a diverse society.

Daniel (1994) raised valid questions in regard to the curriculum framework, asking: (a) Is the framework presented in a format which suits your
pedagogical needs? Do you want to present it in a chart first followed by a more expansive framework? (b) Have you been mindful of the developmental and stylistic requirements of your student population? Are these addressed in a philosophical introduction to the framework? and (c) Have you included exemplars which support your goals, concepts, and objectives? (Daniel, 1994). Her queries will be used in analyzing the content of art education texts’ (art history, art appreciation, aesthetics) recommendations and guidelines for teaching African American art (grades kindergarten- twelve).

Cultural Perspectives On Aesthetics

An examination of Western and non-Western views of aesthetics is an integral part of this inquiry. In Western civilization, art education consists of the three components- art history, art production, and art criticism. Aesthetics and critical thinking seem to be secondary to art production in art education. In some non-Western civilizations, aesthetics is often referred to as the spiritual and mystical experience associated with an art object.

Chanda (1993) wrote about the symbolic nature of images. She discussed the Kuba divination figures. Her investigation, a product of social and anthropological research, deciphered a spiritual and mystical meaning in the Kuba art forms that transcended beyond elements and principles of design.

Thompson (1983) discusses philosophies of art beyond formalism. He stated that the African art and philosophy of Yoruba, Kongo, Fon, Mande, and Ejagham cultures fused with new elements in the “New World”. They shaped and defined the Black Atlantic visual tradition (Yoruba- worshiping of their own gods and goddesses; Kongo- usages of the sign of the four moments of the sun-dawn, noon, sunset, and the mirrored noon of the dead; Mande- creation of
cone-on-cone cylinder building traditions and specific rhythmized textiles 
(similar to U.S. black quilt tops); and Ejagham- writings by the noblewomen 
(nsibidi).

Driskell (1993) stated that most colonial African Americans weren't 
allowed to practice their rituals, religion, art, and craft without incorporating 
European influences; furthermore, art production became an amalgamation 
process leaving behind some African traditions of art making.

Patton (1989) and Campbell (1987) discuss a renewed turning to 
tradition, such as Alain Locke's primary interest in teaching African American 
artists an African based philosophy/aesthetics (Black Americans were to claim 
to their African sculptural tradition) and his philosophy influencing the subject 
matter of African American art during the 1960's and 1970's. Patton points the 
controversy engendered by the question of assimilation and integration of 
European culture and values in works by African American artists below:

While many artists were vociferous in layering their claim to 
pursue any art style, still others were equally concerned with 
discovery of a true African-American aesthetic. Alain Locke's 
philosophy that African Americans must study and extract 
stylistic elements of African art, and incorporate them into their 
own work, came full circle in the late 1960's and early 1970's. 
The discussion over the definition and description of a black art 
became paramount among art historians and critics; it 
paralleled the defense of black culture and the rejection 
of racial integration as a panacea for black problems. Integration 
meant the denial of one's culture in acceptance of the mainstream, 
i.e, Euro-American culture. Many artists believed that following 
mainstream art styles meant creating an art which did not 'speak' to a 
black audience. Such artists felt that the modern axiom 'art for art's sake' 
was invalid. Instead, they adopted the tenet 'art for the people.' Often the 
tone was didactic, arrogant, and aggressive. (p. 96)

These are examples of some of the cultural issues I examine in regard to 
addressing and including aesthetics in art education curricula. I will compare
and contrast the varied discourses of multicultural educators, aestheticians, and art historians concerning the historical, anthropological, and rhetorical context of African American art. It is imperative to consider the cultural, social, and political contexts in which the artist presents his or her work. To better understand the Black aesthetic we must investigate the background of African American art forms. When African people came to America, they brought with them a wide range of skills they had developed for centuries. Ferris (1983) and Driskell (1993) discussed basket making, wood carving, blacksmithing, weaving, drawing, painting, and quilting as having their origins in a vast cultural tradition rooted in Africa. African Americans adapted these techniques to what was available to them in the United States.

As a rule African Americans were excluded from attending public schools where Whites attended. W. E. Du Bois (1903) wrote how Black common, grammar, and high schools evolved into higher institutions of learning, e.g., Fisk University-1871 and Spellman Seminary-1896) due to the need for Negro teachers to be broad minded, cultured men and women. He saw the need for African American teachers to be more than just trained in technical normal methods during times of change (the industrial revolution in America). Except for a few colleges such as Oberlin and Antioch, Blacks were excluded from institutions of higher education as well. Whites opted for the development of Black colleges rather than integration and preferred industrial education over classical education (Garcia 1984). Because of their impact on America, as well as the world of aesthetic experiences, it would be remiss for historians to exclude the contributions of these Africans, the descendants of crafts people, folk artists, and fine artists. Moreover, issues that affect curricula, such as art and politics in America, anthropological ties of African Americans to other ethnic
groups through art and culturally diverse ways of life as they contribute to the world are part of this study. The intention of this examination is to give an inclusive view of African American art in American art history.

**Historic Perspectives on African Descended Art and Artists**

It is problematic that historically certain art forms have been ignored and treated as useless and primitive creations. During the Harlem Renaissance, Aaron Douglas, a black artist and art educator, was told by Charlotte Mason, a White patron who supported primitivism in Black art, to use such an approach. Driskell (1987) discussed how Black artists in order to please their white patrons, used a stereotypical primitive approach. Douglas rejected the idea and pursued his art form in a trained manner. Mason felt that black art should reflect primitive aspects of African art (cubist form and identity). Carl Van Vechten, a white photographer, also disagreed with Mason's preference for the concept of primitism. Douglas tended to correspond and align his loyalty with Van Vechten (Reynolds and Wright 1989). James Porter and Alain Locke had several debates on this topic. Porter was against just following an African based aesthetic while Locke supported an Afro-centric ("primitive") approach. The word primitive bears a negative connotation. The Thames And Hudson Dictionary Of Art Terms defines primitive as: "1. Of the work of European artists working before 1500, especially those who seem to use a conspicuously archaic style. 2. Of the work of self-taught and unsophisticated artists of any period. 3. Of the art of Black Africa, Oceania. The word primitive is often placed within quotation marks, since it is increasingly felt to be pejorative (Lucie-Smith, 1984). Art is defined by Lucie-Smith as being primitive by a chronological date, untrained artists, and art from Africa and Oceania. Art is defined as being
primitive by European Americans as having a close correlation to early African art forms. Both interpretations of primitive seem to evoke a nontraditional way of art training.

African American artists have been excluded from history texts (Garcia, 1993). The number of African American artists discussed in significant cultural, social, anthropological, or political context in reference to art history is small. Chapell (1993) cited little to no significant information on African American artists in art history text books by Janson (1977), Munro (1979), Lippard (1976), and Harris and Nochlin (1976). For instance, where does one find mention of the institutions, entrepreneurs, and social/cultural organizations that supported African American artists (colonialism to present time) in the United States? For example, The Harmon Foundation is probably one of the most well known supporters of African Americans during the 1920's and 1930's (Reynolds and Wright 1989). Also, Black colleges such as Atlanta University, Hampton Institute and Fisk University were just some of the earlier Black institutions that supported and instructed African American artists.

Cultural Variables and Curriculum Development

Designing an effective multicultural art education curriculum means avoiding tokenism, stereotypes, and biases. Learning processes for students need to include race, religion, gender and other social categories, as well as art history, art criticism, art production, and aesthetics. Typically women and minorities have been excluded from these discussions and analyses. Grigsby (1977) and Sahasrahudhe (1992) advocate the importance in teaching art education through a multicultural approach. I believe the representation of ethnic groups within education must be acknowledged and contributions of
minority groups to the various disciplines deserve to be mentioned. Asante (1992) explained how identification and empowerment for African American students stems from knowing and understanding their African American culture as well as others. However, tokenism which only mentions or refers to a particular culture's beliefs, values, and traditions is a problem in that it only touches the surface of anthropological, social, cultural and/or political issues pertaining to a discipline. Grigsby (1977) stated that art teachers with a better understanding of ethnic backgrounds and artistic heritage and knowledge of contemporary contributions of artists from diverse ethnic backgrounds would be better prepared to address a multiethnic population of students. Ogbu (1992) suggests that an essential key to understanding the differences in school adjustment and academic performance of minority groups is understanding of: (a) the cultural models a minority group has with regard to the U.S. society and schooling, (b) the cultural and language frame of reference of a minority group, (c) the degree of trust or acquiescence the minorities have for White Americans and the societal institutions they control, and (d) the educational strategies that result from the above elements. The four factors are dependent in part on the group's history, its present situation, and its future expectations (Ogbu 1992). It becomes the responsibility of educators to address art using a multicultural approach. James Banks (1983) argues that the educational process should receive the greatest attention. He believes that multiethnic education offers the best hope of educational equity for minority students, because it focuses on reforming those variables of the school environment that now prevent minority students from having effective, enriching, and stimulating learning experiences. Hadaway and Florez (1988) discussed the importance of instructors to be careful not to rehash prior courses by others, to set clear communicative goals
and objectives, and provide ample opportunity to interact in a multicultural setting. Our task is to instill in learners a knowledge base of other cultures' art. Koroscik (1994) stresses the need for learners to have a broader foundation for better knowledge seeking strategies for learning and understanding of a discipline.

Defining culture is often debatable when trying to arrive at its meaning. Culture has been defined as a blueprint guiding the behavior of people in groups and nurtured by family life (Romero, Mercado, Vasquez-Faria, 1992). William (1972) describes culture and its complexities of meaning in the following discussion:

"Teachers need to be watchful that no matter how much they think they may know about other cultures, their knowledge is always subject to change- at the time cultures change, much in attitudes and beliefs do not change. Our tendency to think in progression or linearly gets in our way. Change is multidimensional and organismic- it is shifting of patterns and relationships with some new elements introduced and some parts or aspects of parts dropped. It requires an openness of mind, a willingness to tolerate ambiguity at the same time that one searches for better ways to interact with individual students. (William, 1972).

It becomes problematic in teaching and learning in any discipline when we ignore beliefs and ideas of other cultures. We must realize that people possess individual idiosyncracies within their culture and that culture and its many variables often shift in time.

The African American Artist: Art and Culture

There are many, sometimes contradictory, definitions of culture. African Americans have a multitude of cultures. The African American artist truly has
commented on the wide variety of culture and society in which he or she lives through the arts. In quoting Greene's (1994) statements on his Acacia Collection of African Americana (African American art), Gordon (1994) remarks that African Americans brought with them, ideas in their heads, their bodies, their souls, and recreated the art forms in America, such as carved walking sticks, clay vessels-face jugs, musical instruments-gourd folk banjo, basketry-corn shuck and reed storage baskets. Locke (1969) concurs that African artists brought decorative and design skills to colonial America (sculpture in wood, metalworking, weaving, pottery). A definition of African American art and culture is problematic since some ethnic artists are labeled as untrained and have consequently been excluded. Art produced by such "untrained" artists often falls into categories such as: (a) folk art, (b) crafts, and (c) outsider art. Gordon describes Greene's historic preservation of early African American art forms:

Greene's work involves not only locating and acquiring artifacts but immersing himself in the early African culture by studying the slave narratives and interviewing people who can provide critical links to this indigenous African American culture. Many artisans still draw upon these traditions, he says. For example, Greene notes that present day makers of walking sticks often carve them with a serpent motif and craft them in the same way as they have been crafted for hundreds of years. (p. 15)

As we see, indigenous culture and art are not necessarily primitive in the pejorative sense of the word. Creating art is part of mankind's existence.

It is most important for all children to know about art forms from diverse cultures and ethnic groups. For example, Hispanic Americans, Asian Americans, Native Americans and Appalachian craft people of Tennessee are
groups that can be studied within an art education curriculum. There are associated beliefs, ideologies, and aesthetic canons that come with each ethnic group which deserve examination. When facilitating a multicultural approach to teaching art education, art educators must consider philosophies and aesthetics of the cultures at hand.

Some parts of Africa have cultures which view art as a very spiritual part of their existence. Chanda (1991) commented that African canons from the past relate to present aesthetics. She described how African art canons of excellence, in the past, depended on one or more elements: (a) the function of the object, (b) it's mythological origin, and/or (c) the particular association from which it originated. Dominant culture approaches to teaching traditionally often excluded non-Western ideas, beliefs, and values from the art education curriculum. Sometimes certain art forms from diverse ethnic groups transcend traditional Western beliefs-aesthetics. Here, critical thinking must become important for learners. The educated, critical thinker, learns to more evenly evaluate toward their immediate and neighboring cultures. A multicultural approach to art education includes discussing the anthropological, social, and cultural aspects of African American art. Chapman (1982) concurs that art education curriculum must address diverse ethnic groups' thoughts, differences, similarities, and traditions if we aim to learn about and critically evaluate other cultures.

**Statement Of The Problem**

This study examines the dissemination of information about African American art and artists in two art education textbooks. I investigate two textbooks' historical, anthropological, and rhetorical content as they speak to
African American artists in each chapter and/or segment. My inquiry focuses on the two textbooks' in three parts: Part one is the author's description of the target artist (African American artist) and the authors' context for the target artist and artwork, Part two is an analysis of the representation of the target artist and Part three (rhetorical) the authors' language that represents the target artist and their artworks.

Related Literature

For this study, I will examine American art history, to see how the authors discuss and interpret historical, anthropological, and rhetorical contextual information from colonialism to present day. Multicultural and Multiethnic education are approaches where an abundance of research has been conducted. Beverly Tatum, James Banks, Jesus Garcia, Donna Gollnick, Ralph Chinn, and John Ogbu are some primary sources used to discuss multiculturalism and multiethnic issues in this investigation. Topics range from art and aesthetics, cultural hierarchy, and classroom pedagogy to the examination of textbooks for art instruction. Furthermore literature on the pertinence of cultural and social context of art (Hart, 1992) will be discussed.

PURPOSE OF STUDY

The purpose here is to address art as it relates to African American culture and to provide future recommendations and guidelines for teaching African American art in art education grades kindergarten-twelve. Approaches to helping all students develop new insights into their culture and reducing prejudice, and stereotyping and approaches for teachers and schools to see that sometimes change is essential and that they should acquire knowledge
from students of diverse ethnic groups and for promoting a cross-cultural understanding, reinforcing ethnic identity, should evolve from this study.

DEFINITION OF TERMS

An explanation of terms, as used in this dissertation, follows to clarify my intent in subsequent chapters:

1) **Aesthetics** refers to a response, a principle or set of principles, or a philosophical system according to Chanda (1991).

2) **American Africanism** coined by Morrison (1990) refers to blackness and how African peoples have come to be described or treated denotatively and/or connotatively. Morrison further identifies how Africanism means treatment of Blacks in literary discourse of America and Europe.

3) **Community forces** includes the idea that perspectives vary when looking at different minorities. **Cultural model** also known as **folk theory** in Ogbu (1974); Bohannan (1957); Holland and Quinn (1987). Holy and Stuchlik (1981) refer to peoples’ understandings of their world. **Cultural language frames of references** refer to a group before it became a minority (Ogbu, 1990a).

4) **Dominant art** is usually art created by popular culture. Duncum (1992) states that it is more visible than any other art. Usually it is constructed out of dominant beliefs, values, and meanings closely linked to dominant culture (Duncum, 1992).

5) Webster's II New Riverside University Dictionary describes **ethnic** as being related to religious, racial, national, or cultural group. Also Webster's II defines ethnic as relating to a people not Christian or Jewish, i.e., HEATHEN.

6) **Multicultural education** grew out of the 1960's social activist movement. It addresses cultural diversity, cross-cultural understanding, and
tolerance of difference and has been expressed with several viewpoints (Banks, 1993).

This list of definitions in itself shows how diverse our understanding of multicultural issues can be.

**Limitations**

Since no study can encompass all discussions on the subject at hand, the following limitations will apply here:

1. This study offers limited contextual data on African American art due to unavailability in library texts.

2. Only one popular middle school art education text book and one high school art education text book are used to examine middle through high school art education text books.

3. No actual interviews with art education scholars concerning the topic of African American art history will enter into this investigation.

4. This study refers to African American art created during the 1880's to 1992.

**Summary**

I interpret the art historians' and art educators' written text used in the one middle and one high school art education text books. Then multicultural, historical, anthropological literature will become tools to investigate the two textbook's written text. My findings will provide recommendations and guidelines when African American art. Findings will show what is and isn't mentioned in the art education and history texts. References to the diverse
ethnic groups including mainstream art will be revealed. The research should reveal what is actually taking place instead of presumptions. I hope to collect anthropological data (cultural, social, et cetera) on the lives of African American artists (e.g. fine artist, folk artist, and outsider artist). I hope to reveal an aesthetics (non-Western and Western art) which may or may not have influenced African American artists. The findings may determine if the represented African American artists and chapter artists are discussed with a historical, anthropological context and if so, what rhetorical context is provided. The research will be beneficial for students, teachers, parents, and State Departments of Education. This study will guide teachers when selecting textbooks for classroom instruction and refer to historical, anthropological, and rhetorical issues in art education. A pedagogy in America that ignores historical, cultural, social, and anthropological facts is destined for future problems.
CHAPTER 2

REVIEW OF LITERATURE

When searching for literature that provided for the inclusion of African American art as a content area in art education, I encountered the following: (a) multicultural art education literature was sparse when (specifically) investigating African American art, (b) multiethnic as well as multicultural literature addressed diverse ethnicity (race, class, gender, culture), (c) African American art (historical, anthropological, social, cultural, and political issues) was focused on by art historians, museum curators, art educators, and practicing or once practicing visual artists, specifically by Caucasian women and African American men and women, and (e) often a single article discussed multicultural, multiethnic, and anthropological issues concerning art education, therefore providing content for the construction of strategies by which African American art can be included in art education. This literature review is divided into four parts: (1) multicultural art education, multicultural and multiethnic education, (2) educational psychology, art educators and theory, and text analysis and methodology, (3) African American art history, and (4) discourses on race and representation.

Defining and Discussing Multicultural Art Education

cultures' aesthetics viewpoints and the need for students to understand and appreciate art within a global context. Blandy & Congdon (1992-1993), Krug (1992-1993) and Heard (1989) unanimously expose corporations' art collections and how they control the monetary value of art, thus affecting art and society. Krug, through an oral history, investigates Ellis Nelson (a non-academically trained artist) in great detail. Krug explains how art is categorized in pejorative terms such as outsider art and other until it becomes accepted by high culture. Outsider art is identified as art created by artists outside of the academic setting (fine art schools). He mentions the significance of art dealers, collectors, museum directors and their roles when encountering outsider art (Cardinal defined this art as alternative art). Most importantly he addresses the elitist attitude of Western culture and art produced by creators who are not fine artists (trained in an academic setting), and/or folk artists (untrained). Krug, Blandy & Congdon (1992-1993) both explain how discrimination of artists (people of color and artists outside the academic setting) has been perpetuated in our Western society.

Grigsby (1977) discusses traditions for understanding cultural heritage and a means of self realization for youth, bridging cultural differences in values and attitudes and focuses on ethnic groups such as African Americans, Native American Indians, and Hispanic Americans in his book, Art and Ethnicity. He also stresses greater inclusion of cultural heritage of African Americans and previously mentioned ethnic cultures. Greater information about these groups is needed without isolating them from other ethnic groups.

Chapman (1982) discusses the issue of how non-Western art is studied, learned, and disseminated by art educators. She addresses the importance of getting a broader view of art from various cultures and societies. Chapman
Ecker (1991) and Hart (1991, 1992-1993) cited that understanding the arts of another culture requires identification of the similarities and differences between another and one's own. Ecker adds that a specific basis has to be made for such comparisons. Cross-cultural understanding is blocked when art teachers reduce one culture to the terms of another. He stated that one needs to attend to the diversity of the arts of a society and to its folk aesthetics; what the people believe art is and does; to its folk anthropology and the people's beliefs about what they are. Hart concurred on differences in art of different cultures needing consideration of their own and specific social and cultural contexts in which the art is produced. She argues the pertinence of contextual information for art works. Contextual information is usually literature on labels or type written pages located near the art form. She discusses the significance of contextual information—cultural, social, historical, and political and environments of which art is produced. She defines traditional, modern, Western and non-Western and how their denotations and connotations alter their meanings. Hart (1991) presents 3 approaches to Aesthetics: 1) Formalism—(formalist/universalist) is described as the traditional Western aesthetic; 2) Anti-Formalism—(personal response/antiformalist) is based on personal response to a work of art (ektasis—name was coined by Friedler); and 3) Pluralist—draws upon many studies of art systems and consideration of the art form's cultural context. She admits two often are blended.

Thompson (1983) and Chanda (1993) discussed the varied views of aesthetics in Africa and America. Both cite how the different philosophies of
African cultures (Dogon, Fon, Benin, et cetera) have or may have influenced African American art forms. Chanda (1991) identified aesthetics as (a) a response, (b) a principle or set of principles or (c) a philosophical system. Her paper refers to the philosophical system or set of principles that underlie the visual qualities of a work of art. Chanda compares and contrasts Western canons of beauty (focus on philosophical beliefs such as: (a) mimeticism-focuses on capturing the likeness of the object, (b) pragmaticism-emphasizes the instrumental capacity of the art form, (c) emotionalism-focusing on inner experience and feelings of the individual and (d) formalism-deals with significant form and the manipulation of an artistic medium (Chanda 1991 quotes Anderson, 1990) and non-Western canons of beauty (Yoruba- e.g. one Ijebu Yoruba artist transformed Queen Elizabeth's appearance by making her appear youthful). They introduce specific cultures of Africa, discuss their tribal rituals and beliefs, and how the various cultures' philosophies dictate their way of life.

Duncum (1991) expounds on how television advertising is an example of dominant culture. Dominant art is defined as popular art. He discusses how dominant art is more visible than other art forms due to being connected to dominant beliefs, values and meanings. Its ties to economic and political organization within society makes the art more visible and accessible by viewers. He states, after the Industrial revolution, society became more influenced by products and their alleged virtues. He explains how the superficiality of advertising and how humans need to associate artifacts with meanings central to a person's life.

Liberatory Pedagogy, the context of Heard's (1989) paper, aligns with Duncum's statements (dominant culture has been the paradigm of which
society tends to follow). Her article, "A Pedagogy for Multicultural Art Education," takes on a sociopolitical stance. First, Heard identified liberatory pedagogy as the critical examination of how knowledge is produced and used. This process is explained as active participation of the teacher and students to determine their curricula and teaching/learning strategies. Heard's main issues in this article are as follows: (1) the failures of dominant approaches to art education; (2) liberatory pedagogy used for illuminating historical, social, political, cultural aspects for art appreciation; and (3) implementing self-reflection as part of learning, dialogical discourse of art in society and culture, and dialogical discourse of the possibilities of art in action. Heard (1989); Ecker (1991); Hart (1991); and Chanda (1991) all discuss how studying cultural art forms from another culture (whether it be in or outside the United States) requires learning the context before we can see differences as well as similarities in cultures.

Chalmers (1992) addressed multicultural art education and Discipline Based Art Education. He gives reference to Grant and Sleeter (1987) five multicultural approaches, and quotes Stuhr (1991). He states that D.B.A.E. can work in a multicultural society by following these approaches: (a) recognizing, acknowledging and celebrating racial and cultural diversity in art within our society (also Katter, 1995 and Sahasrabudhe, 1992 restate this); (b) promote cross-cultural understanding by identifying similarities (particularly in the role and function of art) within and amongst cultural groups; and (c) address, in all art disciplines, and not just art history, issues of ethnocentrism, bias, stereotyping, prejudice, discrimination, and racism (discussed by Gollnick & Chinn, 1990). Sleeter and Grant's (1987) 5th approach is usually met with discussion. Chalmers builds an argument that this is due to questioning dominant cultures' art canons. Sahasrabudhe (1992) responds to Bank's
(1990) statistics that by the year 2000, one out of four people will be a person of color in the United States. He discusses the fact that in the 1990 census: about 10 million people checked the “other” of the racial categories. His literature focuses on multicultural art education and what it has to include: (a) to celebrate this diversity amongst our students; (b) to affirm, to honor, to respect and in the process offer education which connects them to their cultural identities; (c) to enrich their education by exploring with them cultural meanings and values embodied in art works and artifacts; and (d) to cultivate a global awareness and a multicultural outlook. Schools are discussed as a place in need of an environment where students' family traditions, heritages, and a place that should provide an environment that cultivates the students' self esteem.

**Defining and Identifying Multicultural Education**

Multicultural and Multiethnic education are approaches where an abundance of research has been documented. Carl Grant, James Banks, Jesus Garcia, Donna Gollnick, Ralph Chinn, and John Ogbu were some of my primary sources for researching this particular literature. Topics range from cultural identification, tradition, self actualization, cultural transformation, loss of identity, self expression, socioeconomic issues, ethnic pluralism, ethnocentrism, and anthropology. The following research addresses approaches to teaching, ethnic diversity, pluralism, and other arenas of pedagogy.

**Multicultural Education**

Banks (1981, 1983, 1989, 1990), Grant (1977, 1992); Grant & Sleeter (1989); and Ogbu (1992) explain how to assist preservice and in-service educators to clarify the philosophical and definitional issues related to pluralistic
education and to derive and implement effective teaching strategies that reflect ethnic diversity. They discuss the pros and cons of multicultural education and the need for a more pluralistic approach for debunking myths and misconceptions about multiculturalism and cultural empowerment. Anthropological, cultural, and social references are discussed in pedagogical approaches for teaching and learning. Multicultural education can be viewed at least three ways: as an idea or concept, an educational reform movement, or a process. It includes the idea that all students regardless of their gender and social class, and their ethnic, racial, or cultural characteristics should have an equal opportunity to learn in school (Banks, J.A. & Banks, C.A. 1989). Banks, J.A. and Banks, C.A. (1989) seeks to instill the teacher with a knowledge base-one that includes skills at handling diverse ethnic groups represented in a immediate setting. The book is a compilation of literature by different authors all offering recommendations and guidelines for approaching a multiethnic group of students. They provide clear definitions and explain philosophical issues. He introduces guidelines for multiethnic programs in the article as well. Multiethnic education refers to specific neglected cultures and is focused on more narrowly than multicultural education. He presents charts and graphs to help organize information. Banks (1993) clarifies the definitions and stereotypes of multicultural education. He presents the statements that pertain to all students and their education. He does not exclude ethnic groups in his message for educating all students. He expounds on the following: (a) multicultural education; (b) infusion of multiethnic content in the curriculum is discussed as significant progress; (c) multicultural education is stated as complex and multidimensional dividing into 5 dimensional components; and (d) school restructuring was stated as needed for children to acquire the knowledge,
attitudes, and skill needed to function in an ethnically and racially diverse nation and world.

Boyle, Grant & Sleeter (1990); Boyle-Baise, Gillette & Grant (1991); Hadaway & Flores (1988); Romero, Mercado, & Vasquez-Fari'a (1992) and Williams (1972); have written concerning issues teachers face in the classroom. Student diversity is a key issue. The authors clearly discussed and linked problems teachers have to confront with socioeconomic problems (e.g., poverty, homelessness, cultural differences). They remark about approaches to cross-cultural instruction in the classroom as well as realizing one’s own biases as a classroom teacher. Cross cultural approaches to teaching is an idea and/or concept where social and cultural identifications are acknowledged and studied. They offer a curriculum framework that includes interviewing family, school, etc., debating viewpoints of others, reading biographies of noted people, students drafting original works about their own lives and analyzing literature and journalism for stereotypes or biases.

Lauter (1990) addresses the issue of gender and the role it plays in the art world for women artists and formalist aesthetic theory. She suggests the need for a feminist theory of art that excludes non-racist, unbiased theory. Lauter explains how women have been discussed as secondary when referring to creators of art.

Daniel (1994) has addressed a similar curriculum approach by focusing on some of the very same issues. She includes the special population (physical and mental handicappism, diverse ethnicity) their needs, their issues, etc. before designing units and/or lesson plans for students. Furthermore the rationale for the teacher’s pedagogy is questioned (i.e. what is the significance of the lessons, units, et cetera?) Her curriculum framework significantly included
the immediate demographics of the learners before preparing classroom instruction.

Daniel and Delacruz (1993) define and identify multicultural education. Banks and Nieto are addressed as important contributors in discussing the nature of multicultural education. Daniel and Delacruz quote Banks' (1991) characteristics of multicultural education. Multicultural education is referred to as education about cultural groups that are typically discriminated against. Multiethnic education, according to the writers, focuses on the inclusion of diverse ethnic groups in America. It is identified as being more narrowly focused than multicultural education. Both types of education are mentioned as having an emphasis on modifying the total educational environment to present an equitable educational opportunities for all students. The authors discuss the opposition to multicultural education. They deliver both the "pros" and "cons" of the educational process. Multiple histories and perspectives by various educational professionals mentioned by the writers provide one with a broader understanding of assessing ethnic diversity, cultural influences, aesthetic negation, historical views of U.S. Civil Rights, American Indians, and ecological approaches to education within the dissemination process in educational settings.

Garcia (1993) comments on classroom textbooks used in both elementary and secondary schools and notes that multicultural content has increased in prose, illustrations, highlighted material and the representation of minorities. Gollnick and Chinn (1986), (1990) also have compiled an informative book on multiculturalism. They wrote how textbooks and instructional materials affect curriculum and classroom instruction. They discussed how to examine texts and curriculum for biases: invisibility, selectivity
and imbalance, unreality, stereotyping, fragmentation and isolation, and linguistic usage. They maintain that effective curricula addresses ethnicity, women studies, bilingual education, sexism, the physically and mentally handicapped, the ageism, prejudice, discrimination, oppression, powerlessness, power, and inequality.

Multiethnic Education

Hayes (1992) compiled literature on the broad field of the African American in America. He presents literature written by several authors on the Black experience—both historically and present such as: (a) ideas that have influenced the genesis and current development of African American Studies—i.e. Carter G. Woodson and his first historical account of African Americans; (b) the African background and the history of African Americans, Diaspora; (c) Western Europe and the Culture of Domination; (d) Africa and the Americas: Pre-Columbian Contact, Enslavement, and Resistance—a broader view between Africa and the Americas; (e) African American Expressive Culture: Music and Literature; (f) The African American Family: Historical and Policy Issues—the breaking down of American families. (g) the African American Struggle for Literacy and Quality Education; (h) exploration of the "Political Economy of the African American situation—examination of the changing character of the American political economy and its constraints on the African American struggle for collective survival an economic well-being.

Educational Psychology

Gardener (1993) expounds on individual intelligence. His literature pertains to multiple intelligence. He presents the concept that there are separate human capacities, ranging from art intelligence to the theory of
knowing oneself. He states that there is not a separate artistic intelligence. He cited the idea that students have learned much of artistry through apprenticeships; they observe artistic masters at work; they are gradually drawn in these activities: they at first participate in simple, carefully supported ways, and then gradually tackle more difficult assignments, with lessened support from their coach or master. He provides the following conclusions: (a) children at age 10 and below should focus on art production: (b) perceptual, historical, critical, and other "per-artistic (learned through lectures, reading, and writing) should be closely linked to or emerge from child's own productions; and (c) art curricula need to be introduced by teachers with knowledge on the subject; et cetera.

Art Education and Theory

I have found Feldman's (1970) book to be informative regarding art as a subject and how children learn through art education. This book has a wide range of topics that refer to D.B.A.E. before Discipline Education became popular. I especially saw that learning could be obtained through his art critique stages for all ages not just children. He refers to different mediums and how to use them in the classroom. I have met and talked with Dr. Feldman on different occasions at National Art Education Association Conferences. His comments align closely with his book. The book is a very good resource for art teachers who are in interested in teaching art criticism to children.

Hurwitz and Day (1991) approach art as a subject in an manner that is conducive for learning on the child's behalf. They introduced art using the D.B.A.E. method. All of the four areas are discussed and explained well. They mention various characteristics of children during the development and ways to
teach them in art criticism, art history (attribution), art production, and aesthetics. The terminology of art (visual) is presented so that the instructor can understand as well as teach students to comprehend art as a subject.

Viktor Lowenfeld (1984) relationship with art and learning as well as other ethnic groups is expressed through his literature. His book has a wealth of information regarding children and their learning through art. His connection to art education is enormous especially this comments on expression of children, growth stages, use of mediums, etc. I can easily understand where he relates approaches to teaching art to understanding children and the manner of which they create images.

Barrett (1990) discusses art criticism and guides the reader to better appreciate art, particularly photography. He presents procedures which facilitate thinking, observing, and talking about art. The literature is organized in specific sections focusing on describing, interpreting, evaluating, and theorizing photographs. The book focuses on the prior stages of criticism however the author explains the significance of responsible judgment and how it effects the way art is perceived.

**African American Art History**

Du Bois (1903) offered essays on African American culture in detail. Historically, his essays discuss the plight of former slaves, their children, their grandchildren at the beginning of the twentieth century. He discusses the failure of Reconstruction and of the Freedman’s bureau, the scarcity of educational opportunities for black children; the poverty and lack of motivation of many rural Blacks; and the conditions and attitudes of both Whites and Blacks in the South at the time of 1903. Du Bois (1940) describes the history and corrects the interpretation of African American people and their problems faced
in America (e.g. education). He literature is devoted to his changing attitudes toward people of color during this time period. From his perspective, one can arrive at an understanding another culture-his. His books are pertinent because they provide content (contextual information) about African Americans and their role in America as well as global communities.

Porter (1943) located, collected, and recorded facts and documents to comprise this book. This book is probably the first historic body of literature discussing the African American artist. Porter discusses the general trends, events, and periods from the mid-Eighteenth Century to the early 1940's. In the process of documenting the art of African American, Porter provides an integrated cultural view of American history. His findings of unknown Black artists provide broader attention on African American art. For the first time he brings to the pages of history a more inclusive collection of American Art. He recorded the history: of early Negro craftsmen; artists of Pre-Civil War days; Freemen as artists; the New Negro (was first a phrase used consistently to characterize the more advanced social and cultural position of the Negro of the 1920's) during the 20's and 30's, the contemporary 40's, and the influence of Booker T. Washington, Alain Leroy Locke, W.E.B. Du Bois on African Americans (artists, poets, doctors, et cetera). Porter discusses Locke's philosophy on African art and its connection to African American art. His viewpoints concerning African American artists and aesthetics differed from Locke's philosophy; they are explained.

Locke (1925) documents the New Negro socially and culturally. He defines the dynamics of the inner and outer life of African Americans. His philosophy offers a new look at African Americans in which questions were raised: Who is the African American? What is our basis for living? How can

Locke (1969) presents a historical documentation of African American artists. The book is an attempt to record and illustrate Black art. This text is one of the first to give a narrative on the historical biographies of African American artists in the United States. He approaches the design of the text by discussing the maturity of the African American artist in the last decades preceding him: (a) his stated main objective of his book or portfolio was to document Black art pictorially for the wider knowledge of the general public; to present Negro themes in art; to reveal how art is related to Negro cultural history; and to document the representative art of the Negro subject, from its first occasional example in the works of the early European masters to it rapidly maturing contemporary vogue as a vital phase of the development of a native
American art. Locke arranged his illustrations in chronological order to present a more accurate time line study of Negro art. Part I in his book presents the whole range of the work of the Negro artist, from landscape and figure painting to still life and abstract design. Part II or section II shows the broader field of Negro art; including themes that to social and racial prejudice.

Bearden & Henderson (1993); Berger (1992); Campbell & Patton (1987); Creswell (1992); Davis & Driskell (1993); Driskell, Lewis, & Willis-Ryan (1987); Driskell, McElroy, Patton & Powell (1989); Ferris & Freeman (1983); Golden (1993); Lewis (1990); Locke (1969); Mc Elroy, Patton, & Powell (1987); Powell (1991); Ridley (1993) offer perspectives on African American art history from an African American viewpoint. They are insightful in sociocultural arenas that relate to black culture - race, prejudice, biases, etc. The literature is more inclusive on the life and times of practicing and/or deceased black artists, art educators, aesthetiticians, and philosophers, and how they truly relate to the sundry African American cultures.

Fine (1971) looks at the African American artist in American art history. Her book is one the first art history text books that address Black artists dating back to eighteenth-century. The author includes sociopolitical, socioeconomic, and sociocultural issues that relate to black artists' and their creative experience in the United States. She expounds on race issues and how it affected the development of African American artists.

Hopps (1976); Long (1976); Driskell (1989); Mosby & Sewell (1991); Powell (1991); and Tate (1993) examine African American art with discussions from art museum literature and books on exhibiting artists. They examine and discuss Black art as it is received and understood in a museum setting. Hopps discussed contemporary Black artist, Sam Gilliam and his art. Long has
documented black art through the 1973 Black art exhibit at the High Museum in Atlanta. Driskell and Powell have both written art history books on African American artists. They illuminate the reader with pertinent historical information pertaining to African American culture. Cultural, social, anthropological, and political contexts relating to African American art are exposed. They offer perspectives not addressed on African American art. Furthermore, they bridge gaps by finding new historical data on the training, education, mentoring of African American artist. Concerning the content of African American art, they all address (1) people who support Black art in specific historical time periods of American art history, (2) the individual rationales behind the artists, and (3) key motivations for African American art among other topics. Tate (1993) analyzed a more contemporary Black artist, Jean-Michel Basquiat. He described the artist as a dynamo, and as an outstanding artist of the late 1980's and early 1990's. Tate probed arenas of prejudice and race in reference to Basquiat as leading African American artist of the 20th century. Berger (1992) examined essays on American art and culture. The essays overlap social, political, aesthetic, and cultural issues in America. His book discusses some of the pioneering developments in art history and cultural studies, formalism of the late 60's, reemergence of Marxism in the 1970's, the infusion of semiotic, feminist, psychoanalytical and racial issues.

Brown (1974) narrated the life of Jacob Lawrence. His book offers several color plates of the artist's paintings. Along with the images, Brown provides contextual information concerning the content of Lawrence's drawings and paintings. Brown discusses political, social, and cultural issues in Lawrence's genre style of painting and how the artist's experience in America developed. Brown provided a life history that illuminates the sociocultural
experiences of African American artists in America. In this process a better understanding of Lawrence’s way of life is conveyed.

Chadwick (1990); Chapell (1993); Fine (1978); Heller (1987); and Slatin (1987); offer perspectives on African American women artists from a women’s historian view. The literature ranges from socioeconomic to sociopolitical issues that women artists have endured down through history. These women debunk stereotypes, myths, prejudice concerning skill, talent, and creativity of women artists. The authors described the social milieu women artist faced. Slatin stated that her text doesn’t build a case for a specifically “feminine” style in the visual arts. Chadwick explained how binary oppositions of Western thought-man/woman has been replicated in art history and how this has been used as a basis for aesthetic value of art forms. This book gives information on women in the arts and how they have been excluded from most art text. Until recently there has not been books like this one that address the subject. The book is concise in some areas of defining style and purpose of the artists. Her book give reference to history in the U.S. during the 1960’s and how art of that period reflected this turbulent time period in our American history. Fine recorded how women artist lived and worked as artists in their societies. She analyzed and illustrated art works from the Italian Renaissance to American moderns.

Lippard (1984, 1990) traces art for its cultural and social relevance. Her own consciousness is an integral part of her literature. She explores the relationships of art and life, artist and audience, aesthetics and politics, and boundaries between “high art” and “low art.” She presents literature that covers feminist art, Black art of the 60’s and 70’s, art by disabled, et cetera. She covers
all that is created by the mind and hands of man. Social, political, and cultural commentary is discussed as it relates contextual aspects to the art forms.

Lucie-Smith (1994) addresses American art today as an observer and art historian from London, England. Lucie-Smith gives full attention to the art of Los Angeles, San Francisco, Houston, New Orleans, and Chicago, as well as the latest developments in New York's east Village. His wide range of topics includes the “Old Masters,” the development of abstraction, the new figuration, graffiti painting, Pop art, Neosurrealism, mock architecture and mock science, the influence of crafts on the fine arts, realism and trompe l'oeil, feminist, gay, and Hispanic art, and photography (1989) all researched the Harlem Renaissance with great clarity. I was able to grasp the mood, energy, and vitality of this very important art movement in New York. Other disciplines like music, dance, literature, theater, were described as they unveiled in Harlem during 1919-1929. The authors offer anthropological, social, political, and cultural contexts on the topic of African American art. Through an analysis of the Black artists, their aesthetics, their supporting institutions, the cultural and social implications and their philosophies, they present varied perspectives on art during the Harlem Renaissance. Huggins' literature focuses on literary talents such as Countee Cullen, politics and race author, W.E. Du Bois, political activist, noted Black plays as well as visual art. Reynolds & Wright and Driskell, Lewis, & Ryan focus more on African American art history (race, sociopolitics, et cetera).

Recent Literature on The Harlem Renaissance.

Bearden & Henderson (1993) define the twenties in the United States as a time of social, political, and cultural growth for African Americans. World War I
is viewed as one of the most important factors that set the stage for change for Blacks. The authors discuss Europe's view of America as a land with no history. Literature, art, music, and theater were not recognized in America by Americans and/or Europeans. A new cultural identity is defined by Bearden and Henderson due to World War I. Bearden & Henderson clarify their point of view in the following remarks: World War I made it clear that the United States had emerged as a world power. Yet, except for overly idealized "patriotic" versions, American history was neither widely known nor understood. They address the issue: "In fact, many European-oriented academicians still argued that America had no history (paralleling what they said about Africans). The idea that there was an American literature, music, theater, or art was not widely recognized either in this country or abroad" (p. 115). The authors further iterate how the attitude of African-Americans changed after World War I. They based the philosophy upon three important factors: (a) the idea that Blacks had seen 200,000 of their own kind serving in World War I in Europe, and the black 369th Infantry from New York, alone among United States troops, had been decorated highly with the French government honoring the soldiers with the Croix de Guerre for their heroism; (b) millions of poor blacks left the south for the north in hope of finding jobs and a better way of life than what was experienced in the south. Bearden & Henderson attributed this migration to World I also. This historical happening is viewed as the cause for migration to the north (i.e. Harlem, New York, and Chicago); and (c) the great outpouring of creative energy by many talented African-Americans in the arts—visual, literature, theater, et cetera. This change brought about the demand for better conditions, education, and the encouragement of talented individuals. Bearden and Henderson (1993) assessed Alain Locke, Albert C. Barnes, and W.E.B. Du Bois
as the motivators and supporters behind African-American art in Harlem. Harlem was expressed as an environment where Blacks from the south could walk and mingle with such elites as James Weldon Johnson, W.E.B. Du Bois, and Alain Locke on the streets. Harlem’s mood (progressive times for Negroes) reinforced the concept of “black identity” according to the authors. This rich concept of African-Americans coming to recognize their culture- music, arts, theater promoted a strong sense of pride. Primarily Bearden and Henderson defined the culture around the influence of writings by Alain Locke. Locke is analyzed as the key figure who wanted to enlightened African-Americans about their black heritage.

Reynolds and Wright (1989) define the Harmon Foundation’s role and how it interacted with African-American artists during the late nineteen twenties and early nineteen thirties. The authors discuss in detail how William E. Harmon chose to recognize black artists by presenting The William E. Harmon Awards for Distinguished Achievement Among Negroes. The writers specifically discuss that blacks initiated awards for the achievement of blacks. The Joel E. Springam Medal was mentioned as a gold medal given to high achievers. Key black figures emerge in the literature of the authors. W.E.B. Du Bois, Alain Locke, William E. Harmon, George Edmond Haynes, Mary E. Brady, and others were key figures in the authors’ literature. Reynolds and Wright chose to investigate the social, political, and intellectual forces during the nineteen hundreds and nineteen twenties. Reynolds and Wright main objectives for writing their literature includes: (a) defining the context of the Harmon Foundation; (b) its role during the late twenties to nineteen sixty seven relating to African American artists; and (c) noting the key men and women and how their role play during this time period dealt with sociopolitical issues.
concerning African-Americans. The authors traced the history of the William E. Harmon and the creation of the Harmon Foundation. The authors discuss the earliest documentation for The William E. Harmon Awards for Distinguished Achievement Among Negroes; the 1928 to 1933 annual Harmon Foundation exhibitions and cite the earliest efforts to award African American visual artists. W.E.B. Du Bois was mentioned as one of the earliest figures to receive the Joel E. Springarn Medal. His attainment of the gold medal for organizing the Pan-African Congresses of 1919, 1921, and 1923 set the stage for his role play in influencing African-Americans. Reynolds and Wright argue the significance of Du Bois and the positive advancement of African-Americans. The importance of the Springarn Medal is argued as key support for its recipients. The authors state that Amy Springarn was instrumental for developing larger cash prizes known as the Amy Springarn Prizes. It was Du Bois and the board of directors of the N.A.A.C.P. who stated the conditions of these awards. The awards were given to visual artists, writers (poets, play writers, novels, illustrations for the cover of the Crisis, et cetera. Reynolds and Wright (1989) argue that the Springarn Awards initiated the Opportunity in creating cash prizes for literature (short stories, poetry, plays, et cetera).

Campbell, Lewis, & Driskells' (1987) literature on the Harlem Renaissance not only defined the roles of key social and political figures, but black artists as well. The writers mention the significance of black artists migrating to New York. The "amalgamation process" or shall I say the coming together of African American artists help launch a new way of thinking during this time period. Campbell stated that black artists before this era were under Jim Crow laws. This oppression kept them from achieving skill, credibility, ethnic pride, political gain, and cultural identity. It is of utmost importance to
mention the actions taken on by groups such as the Ku Klux Klan, the Knights of the White Camelia, and the White Citizen's Council in the south. They discussed the Harlem Renaissance pinpointing two major events that changed the thinking of African Americans: (a) World War I; and (b) the mass migration of Blacks from the South to the cities of the North. The artists and their roles during the prior historical events are also described and interpreted. Lewis discusses in detail a broader view of Harlem: literature, theater, music and the visual arts are interwoven into pictorial history of the time. Fuller's experimented with themes of sorrow and death in her sculptures is described by Driskell. Driskell (1987) stated that critics often referred to her works as macabre and highly emotional. Campbell identified Aaron Douglas as the most well known Harlem visual artist of the nineteen twenties. Douglas's style of painting was described as a highly stylized aesthetic, characterized by a spatially compressed compositions and chromatically subdued forms. Alain Locke is also given credit for the development of Aaron Douglas's paintings and murals. Johnson and the term, primitive, were discussed and identified. Primitive tended to imply early historical styles. The writer defines the artist's style of painting and its role in the Harlem Renaissance. Lewis (1987) mentions his departure from realist (natural looking objects) painting.

The 1960's And 1970's Art Movement

Spriggs (1971) states that the compilation of Black artists in this text aren't discussed in an aesthetic categorization. He theorizes that Black art cannot be put into one category. He gives a comparison and contrast to Western art and Black art of the 60's and 70's. This statement becomes the context for his discussion toward the Black aesthetic.
Driskell (1971) mentions Alain Locke, The Negro Renaissance, James Herring, and others in his discussion toward aesthetics. He introduces the reasons behind this particular publication: (a) to attempt to show that a relevant number of Black artists have always been conscious of their being art from the mainstream of American art and have worked toward the creation of symbols that reflect the aesthetic needs of Black Americans. He mentions this process as a manifestation toward the establishment of an ethos in Black art; and the book calls for attention to some of the problems generated by the attempts of contemporary philosophical thought to classify the art of Black people in America without looking at the social, economic, and political conditions that have helped to make it a particular cultural entity to itself. He iterates the concept of socialism and “Blackness” (being identifiable of African descent) and how it is impossible to escape sociological perspectives.

Long (1973) proclaimed Atlanta University to have the largest collection of Black American artists. The collection then had a total approximate number of 350 paintings, sculptures, and graphic works. Atlanta University through annual art exhibitions of African American was the start of the collection process. The collection also grew out of generous donations from the community. The Atlanta University Annual Exhibition was described as being master minded by Hale Woodruff-art professor and artist (Long 1973). Again it was noted that Alain Locke attended the First Annual Exhibition on April 19, 1942. Long discussed Locke as the featured speaker and chief mentor of African American art. Locke and The Annual Exhibition were mentioned synonymously in referring to Negro aesthetics and its roots.

Coleman (1978) analyzes David Driskell’s statement: “The black community must come to realize that art can have intrinsic value, and act
accordingly. Otherwise, it will limit artists to reproducing when they could define and reveal; dealing in the anecdotal when they could discover and express truths that go beyond temporal values (pg. 32). He sums up the statement as the context of this article which translate to this meaning: (a) artists create to what appeals to them at the time; and (b) the artist expresses to a more aligned collective pattern usually defined by cultural values. Aesthetic toughness renames the original context of his literature. Coleman defines African art and its connection to cultural patterns—puberty, birth, et cetera and compares the African American aesthetic to creating forms from their visual perception of daily life. Coleman states an aesthetic toughness evolves from informed art criticism. Informed art criticism is used to refer to those acts of evaluation that are performed by one who is thoroughly conversant with what has preceded and what is contemporaneous with the work that is the object of critical scrutiny.

Conwill (1978) interviews artist, Betye Saar, in her studio. He describes her working space as one filled with mystery and spirituality. The objects observed in her studio are mentioned as having some kind of communication, whether the found objects came from Haiti, Asia, Africa, or Mexico. The artist states that her art emanates certain characteristics: (1) magic being ritual; and (2) magic being other than ritual. Conwill discusses aesthetics with Betye Saar: (1) balance seems to take precedence over her art forms; (2) various rituals and cultural beliefs are linked to the power of the finished sculptures; and (3) form and design are mentioned as a secondary concern by the artist—Saar expounds that they are second nature because they are so much part of who she is as an artist. Conwill records fascinating elements associated with Saar’s sculptures; she is more concerned with the basic elements: water, earth, air and sky, e. g., stars, moons, butterflies, and birds are associated with the sky; certain animals
like snakes for the earth; and fish for water. Saar discusses the uses the five senses as elements in her works: (1) beautiful form for visual things; (2) different textures for touching; (3) burning incense for smell; and (4) sound she provides things that move and make noise.

Grigsby (1977) discussed traditions for understanding cultural heritage and a means of self realization for youth, bridging cultural differences in values and attitudes, focusing on ethnic groups such as African Americans, Native American Indians, and Hispanic Americans in his book, Art and Ethnics. He also stressed greater inclusion of cultural heritage of African Americans and prior mentioned ethnic cultures. Greater information about these groups was mentioned as needed without isolating them from other ethnic groups.

Recent Discussions on African American Art

Thompson (1983) discussed views on aesthetics in Africa and America. He cites how the different philosophies of African cultures (Dogon, Fon, Benin, et cetera) have or may have influenced African American art forms. He introduces specific cultures of Africa, discuss their tribal rituals and beliefs, and how the various cultures' philosophies dictate their way of life. Thompson's discusses the influence of African civilization in a more global frame of reference. He includes several illustrations: (1) African jewelry, sculpture, walking sticks, architecture, ceremonial costumes, and (2) landscape designs; African American landscape designs, sculpture, prints, costume designs, et cetera.

Berger (1992); Campbell & Gates (1992); McElroy (1990), all expound upon views and concerns towards American art. Through Berger's literature, as an art historian, he explores, discusses aesthetics, race, cultural, social, and
political issues concerning African American art, examines art history texts, interviews artist as an approach to document the histories and realities of African American art. Campbell, Gates and McElroy informally discuss similar topics by expressing their views with Berger through individual dialogues.

Gordon (1994) quotes Greene's (1994) statements on his Acacia Collection of African Americana (African American art). Greene (1994) said that African Americans brought with them, ideas in their heads, their bodies, their souls, and recreated the art forms in America (carved walking sticks, clay vessels-face jugs, musical instruments-gourd folk banjo, basketry-corn shuck and reed storage baskets, et cetera. The prior statement becomes the context for Gordon's article. Greene is interviewed by Gordon in order to do ethnographic research on the topic of Black America's African Roots. Even though it is mentioned that documentation was scarcely found on the connection between the two, Greene uses design elements that were indigenous to Africa (i.e. walking sticks in Savannah with African design influences).

Golden (1993) presented a lecture on African American art at the Columbus Museum of Art. The presentation was one of the finest I have seen on the topic. She expressed social, political, anthropological, and historical views as they related to African American art. She traced African American art as far back as: (a) Joshua Johnson; early American folk art portraiture. His work was discussed as portraiture before the popular photograph. His portraits documented American history. She expanded also on the following African American artists and role in American art history: Elizabeth Prophet, W. H. Johnson, Richard J. Powell, Charles Alston, Elizabeth Catlett, Charles White, Romare Bearden, Bob Thompson, Hughie Lee Smith, Robert Colescott, Ray
Saunders, Dalwood Bay, Loma Simpson, Joe Louis, Gary Simmons, Sam Gilliam, Carrie Mae Weems, Kelly Jones, Lyle Harris, and Allison Saar.

Mosby (1991) presents a lengthy art history text on the life of Henry Ossawa Tanner. He discusses the artist's education then explains how he was influenced by American painters. The content of this book goes beyond biographical data. The book has a plethora of exemplars. The author cites Tanner's cultural and social background. In the process a narrative story gives an account of Tanner's motivation. Mosby stated that Henry O. Tanner maintain along friendship with his mentor and instructor, Thomas Eakins. He gives a history of Tanner's formal training in painting and drawing at the Pennsylvania Academy of Arts. Mosby describes Tanner's curriculum he received at the Pennsylvania Academy. He identifies drawing and painting as two studio areas.

McElroy (1990) produces a scholarly account of Black images in American art. He surveys the portrayal of African Americans depicted by American artists of many races. He uses essays and images to provide a full-range survey of the various ways in which the African American was represented from the colonial time period to the present. From slaves to freedman, minstrels to genre scenes, McElroy mirrors the country's social, cultural, and political history. This book contains 116 paintings, sculptures, and works on paper by 80 artists. McElroy traces attempts by African American artists to fight against racial stereotypes. Alain Locke is mentioned for his African based aesthetic, His influence on art of the 1930's, and its revived philosophy on African American art of the 1970's and 1980's.

McElroy, Powell, Patton, and Driskell (1989) expound on social and political events relating to the emergence of African American artists dating
back as far as 150 years. The art of which the historians have referred has been housed in the historic Evans-Tibb Victorian row house off Logan Circle. The book starts with an introduction with the artists working during the Civil War. The post-Civil War movement is presented as a catalyst for Blacks to migrate out of the South. Locke again is mentioned as a key figure in advocating the arts. New York, Washington D.C., Baltimore, and Chicago were cited as key cities for the visual arts, music, and literature. The authors described the growth of these cites as educated and talented African Americans brought with them diverse artistic skills. The authors discuss the Great Depression, the 40's, the 50's, the turbulent 60's, 70's, and 80's and the associated art movements centered around these decades.

Discourses on Race and Representation

Dumcum (1991) cites dominant culture as being cyclic, ongoing, and self-regulating like an ecosystem. He discusses how it is a battleground of competing ideas, beliefs, and values and that the governing voices in a given culture often represents the individual's political and social power. He presents oppositions such as dominant culture/less dominant culture for better understanding of society.

Barbara Tatum (1992) discusses the concept of race, class, and gender in reference to the human experience. Her research is supported by several manuals that discuss the modification of course content: (a) she focuses on the issues of process that occur when attention of race, class, and or gender- she is aware of emotional responses that both people of color as well as dominant culture (Anger, Rage, Denial, etc.); (b) the context of her approach is the awareness of racial identity development between the two previous groups mentioned- her classroom deals with psychological causes and emotional
reality of racism; (c) her assumptions in reference to defining race and prejudice refers to people of color and their oppressor, the White race; (d) her sources of resistance for talking about race and racism are discussed and defined—race is the first topic she stated that racially mixed settings have a problem approaching; (e) she states that there are stages of racial identity development that will occur in everyone; and (f) her statements and discussions for *Teaching for Change* are good for following by all races.

Hall (1992) elaborates on America’s popular culture and black influences below. The author offers a perspective toward the interconnectiveness of Blacks and Whites in American cultures. He pinpoints how the dominant culture in the U.S. has excluded contributions by Blacks, whether they have been social or cultural references.

Gates (1992) responds to Berger’s (1992) socio-political question of race in literature and the visual arts and how some critics and art historians have eluded the issue. He states how truth, race, misrepresentation, and representation concerning ethnic art demand careful attention.

Morrison’s (1992) statements on African Americanism concurs with Gates. She concurs that matters of race need careful attention. She states that politics and race are inseparable. The authors presents a probing dialogue on literature and how it reflects race issues.

Chanda (1991) discusses the importance of context in African art. She stresses the pertinence of understanding African art through the cultural origin. Concerns like formal elements (line, shape, form, et cetera) mean little with out contextual information pertaining to the specific culture from which the art form was created.
Blandy and Congdon (1991) explain how scholars in the Western world assess many art collections to be racist, sexist, and colonialist. They described them as ignorant of cross-cultural and gender tolerance of the functions and purposes of art. They concur that people of color and women have been particularly de-contextualized and exploited (Blandy & Congdon 1991).

Daniel and Delacruz (1993) expound on problematic occurrences when addressing history. They elaborate on the addition of other historical perspectives to American curriculum other than the traditional approach. They present a dialogue on diverse cultural and ethnic histories to the development of America and the often strong confrontation by traditionalists.

**Defining Art History**

Art history has been a significant component art education. It would be ludicrous to think of one without the other. Upon coming to an answer to what is art history, art historians have interpreted and judged for themselves when trying to answer such a broad question. Collins (1991) defines and identifies art history:

Art history is a branch of history devoted to a particular kind of human activity: the making of art, that is, material objects which have a "more-than utilitarian" function. Art history emerged as a separate discipline in the nineteenth century in order to investigate that "extra" purpose-generally referred to as the "aesthetic" meaning—which certain objects (paintings, sculptures, buildings, etc.) so prominently display. (p. 53)

Chalmers (1993) cites objectivity as significant and a valid goal when doing historical inquiry. Documentation and interpreting facts are a few components of historical study (Chalmers, 1993). Gardener (1991) offers these comments on art and history in the following:
The goal of art history is the discerning appreciation and enjoyment of art, from whatever and place it may have come, by whatever hands it may have been made. Outside the academic world, the terms art and history are not often juxtaposed. People tend to think of history as the record and interpretation of past human actions, particularly social and political actions. Most think of art—quite correctly—as something present to the eye and touch, which, of course, the vanished human events that make up history are not. The fact is that a visible and tangible work of art is a kind of persisting event. (pg. 3)

Corley (1982) quotes Kleinbauer (1971) and delineates Kleinbauer’s definition of art history in the following comments: “Art history is molded by a philosophy of history—by an understanding of the general divisions of history, the nature of historical periods, and the causes of historical change” (Paraphrased from Kleinbauer, pg. 13, 1971). Furthermore she explains how Kleinbauer believed that the data the art historian records has reference to some historical notion or theory (Corley, 1982).

Rosenberg (1989) deconstructs art history by presenting four subcategorizes for examining art history in this list: 1) Connoisseurship— the determination of the identity of the artist, date, place of origin, materials and techniques, physical condition, and authenticity of a work of art by direct and indirect evidence; 2) Style—the visual language of a work of art. It involves both the choices that the artist makes in using the visual elements of line, color, space, et cetera, and the conceptual structure underlying those choices; 3) Iconography to the study of the subject matter or themes of a work focusing on their conventional and symbolic meanings. Some of these meanings may be universal, but many are culture-specific and often related to a text; and
4) Historical and cultural context is the complex of historical and cultural factors which may have shaped the work of art (Rosenberg, 1989).
CHAPTER 3

PROCEDURE

Introduction

When looking at art textbooks it is of utmost importance to understand the content as well as the context of the literature. This research will study semantics. My objective pertains to reporting historical, anthropological, and rhetorical context relating to the art and artists as it is stated in the written text three middle and three high school art education text books.

I will use the content (text) analysis approach described by Walker (1994) when investigating the text of the art educator’s curriculum frameworks. Walker describes text analysis as a method for uncovering symbolic meaning in a systematic fashion. She describes the term as one that can be defined narrowly referring to a written text or linguistic means of expression or broadly referring to semiotic (semantic) structures of not only language but music, architecture, visual images or social discourse and behavior. Context is identified as a dimension of textual analysis that can be defined as the kind and amount of information extra to the text itself that is considered to affect the understanding of meaning. She discusses how internal contexts can be described as the following: 1) linguistic contexts, 2) structural, and 3) content contexts. External contexts can refer to the author, the interpreter, and/or the audience for the text (Walker, 1994).
Semantic, structural and hermeneutic analyses are primarily qualitative. Walker states that in a semantic orientation the logic of sentence functions: analytical, synthetic, expressive, prescriptive, and performative, explain interpretation. The researcher must work within rules determined by theory and uses specified methods when undertaking text analysis (Walker, 1994). Systematic is defined by Webster’s II New Riverside University Dictionary (1984) as: 1) Of, marked by, based on, or making up a system, 2) Carried on in a step-by-step procedure, 3) Purposefully regular: Methodical, and 4) Of or relating to taxonomic classification (pg. 1175).

Words play a major role in this study. I will focus on the authors use of words and how they construct meanings. The authors’ descriptions and interpretations on their selected group artists becomes an integral part to this study.

The following paragraph gives a description of the two art education text books involved in this study. I provide the following for each art education text book: 1) the name and author of the art education text book; 2) the number of pages under investigation for each text book; 3) an identification of the context of each book, e.g., art history, art production, art criticism, and aesthetics; and 4) the number of exemplars (i.e. visual images of art).

Identification of the Two Art Education Text Books

I will provide one study in which I will use a systematic approach. In the first part of the study I examine one middle school art education textbook. The model for this systematic approach will be provided at the end of this chapter. For the second part of this study I examine one high school art history text book.
The middle school text is entitled, *Understanding Art and Creating Art* by Ernest Goldstein, Theodore H. Katz, J.D. Kowalchuk, and R. Saunders. In the second part of this study I examine one high school art history text entitled, *History of Art for Young People* by H.W. Janson and Anthony F. Janson, 1992. The Janson and Janson (1992) text ranges from page 377 to 497 (approximately 120 pages of written text along with pictures of art and 6 separate pages of pictures of art).

Next I discuss content analysis as it relates to my chapters of study. It must be understood that interpretations may vary when examining written text. My study becomes one interpretation of a possible many.

**Descriptions of Methodology for Content Analysis**

The selected chapters for determining the philosophical perspectives represent a kind of theory and/or point of view. The authors present sundry approaches for disseminating information on the artists in their art education text books. In studying the paragraphs, I must remember the relationship between context and interpretation. In some cases Ettinger and Maitland-Gholson (1990) state the difficulty in studying semantic orientation in the following:

The semantic orientation also denies the idea of one "correct" interpretation of text, stating that multiple, interpretations may be made based on connections established or found within the internal context. In other words the context determines the direction of the interpretation. Context in this case is internal and determined by the function of the sentences (Ettinger & Gholson, p. 92, 1990).

I will investigate the descriptions and interpretations of the artist and artwork as they relate to African American art. I will explore paragraphs as they
correspond with the model toward the end of this chapter. My interpretations are linked to Western belief because of my art education process in America. I must keep in mind that the theories and/or concepts are products of the philosopher's belief systems in art education. While reading the selected chapters I focused on particular sentences and words within the chosen paragraphs. It becomes problematic when examining written text where supporting information is deleted or overlooked.

Describing and interpreting artworks are processes closely linked to the author's philosophy and/or perspective. Webster's II New Riverside University Dictionary (1984) provides 12 definitions for the noun, philosophy. When trying to decide upon which definition to use for analyzing African American scholars, I have decided to use definition number 3. Webster's II defines philosophy in the following: "Analysis and critique of fundamental beliefs as they come to be conceptualized and formulated" (p. 882). The same dictionary provides 5 definitions for the term, perspective. I have decided to use the following definition number 4: "The relationship of aspects of a subject to each other and to a whole" (p. 877). I chose to study the meanings of the prior words for a better awareness of each. In studying the philosophical perspective of the authors, I will investigate the written text as it refers to their individual approaches. I will explore oppositions, e.g., European American/African American, dominant culture/Black culture, and non-Western/Western when referring to the following three categories: 1) historical issues, 2) anthropological issues, and 3) rhetorical issues. The authors' philosophical language, e.g., mimetic, pragmaticism, emotionalism, and formalism will be revealed and how it is used for their descriptions and interpretations of the artists and their artworks will also be an integral part of this study. The context
of sentences and/or phrases often change and evolve when the prior philosophies of art are practiced, furthermore overlapping of philosophies may occur. I will examine why and how the authors' use sentences for describing and interpreting artists and their artworks. I will carefully search the context and their various interpretations. It becomes most important to examine the author's written text for a better understanding of the literature.

Ettinger & Maitland-Gholson (1990) quote Krippendoriff (1980) on discussing text analysis in the following paragraph:

Text analysis provides researchers with procedures and tools to structure and analyze research data. Historically, text analysis has proven useful in the examination of descriptive or interview texts, as an unobtrusive measure, as a way to cope with large volumes of text, and as a means to validate other research methods. (p. 88)

I have chosen to look at the semantics of the written text. According to Ettinger & Maitland (1990), the semantic orientation is supported by a belief that language has an open structure and that text hides linguistics functions- which can be revealed. They describe semantic orientation as having several dimensions: (a) Dimension #1- description of orientation: Semantic- validates multiple, reasonable interpretations. Its (b) Dimension #2- underlying assumptions has a dependence on contextual factors based on sentence function: language has an open structure. Dimension #3 of Semantic Orientation, Operative Definition of Text defines text as linguistic expression in written or other forms. Dimension #4, Function of Context, refers to the kind and amount of information extra to the text itself that is considered to affect understanding of meaning. Dimension #5, Operative Interpretive Convention, concerns the process through which meaning is derived and represents a shared way of making sense of reality. Here analysis is viewed as different
forms of treatment applied to the manifest content of a text. Ettinger and Maitland-Gholson quote Lindkvist's (1981) definition of interpretation: it is usually seen as related to the latent content of a text. Dimension #6, Variation of Method, concerns techniques of application: (a) there is need to be systematic, and (b) clear documentation of the research process is essential. Dimension #7, Role of Researcher, is a dimension which considers and identifies the active or passive relationship between the researcher and the text is identified: the producer, the consumer, or the interpreter works within rules determined by theory and uses specified methods. Dimension #8: Historical Origins, is important in order to understand relationships among orientations. It is stressed that orientations to text analysis continue to evolve both across and within disciplines (Ettinger & Maitland, 1990).

I listed a preliminary model below that I will systematically use in determining the outcome of my findings. An explanation and identification of the model is also provided. I am basing my findings on the authors' written text (description and interpretation). The investigation is divided into three systematic parts for interpreting the two textbooks below:

MODEL

Part One lists in section A, the target artist (African American artist), the other chapter artists, the names of their artworks, the media used by each artist, and the date of their artworks, the reproductions' sizes, style of artwork, and the subject matter of each artwork. In section B, I provide a general description of the target artist and artwork. I present the authors' description of the target artist
in section C and the authors' context for the target artist and artwork in section D.

Part Two gives an analysis of the representation of the target artist. I use the following questions: 1) How do the authors represent the target artist and artwork from an art historical perspective? And 2) How does this perspective compare with other chapter artists and artworks? for examining the authors' approaches for discussing the artists and their artworks (contextual, comparative, interpretive, formal-elements and principles of design, stylistic, and media). If the authors present one of the prior approaches, I discuss how. Secondly I provide implications for each given approach.

Part Three refers to the rhetorical issues such as validation of language presented by the author. I provide the following question: How does the author's language represent the target artist and artwork? My rhetorical strategies consist of six distinct questions or statements in the following design:

I. Questions
A. The authors employ the following questions which direct the readers toward particular understandings of the artworks.

1) Comparative questioning - a rhetorical strategy for understanding artworks in relation to another artwork(s).

2) Contextual questioning - a rhetorical strategy for understanding artworks in relation to a particular context as a historical context.

3) Analytic questioning - a rhetorical strategy for understanding artworks in relation to an analysis of its formal properties and media.
4) Interpretative questioning - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork symbolically or metaphorically.

5) Descriptive questioning - a rhetorical strategy for understanding artworks in relation to its identifiable properties.

I provide rhetorical strategies used by the authors for the target and chapter artists. Furthermore I list the type and number of each rhetorical strategy for each target and chapter artist. Section B refers to specific questions the authors may or may not present to the reader. I also present implications for each question or statement as used in Part Two. In Section II, I examine specific keywords (evaluative terms- positive or negative) from the text on the target and chapter artists and their artworks. Each list of terms are evaluated in a paragraph summary. A final summary is given to re-evaluate all of the given language and terms as they specifically relate to each artist and their artwork.

Approaches for Viewing and Discussing Art

The content analysis of the text books investigate how the authors describe, interpret, study formal elements, and judge the art forms and how they provide a discourse on the artist. I have selected Ragans, Feldman, Hurtwitz and Day, and Barrett's theories for exploring art.

Ragans (1988) focuses on the stages for art criticism characterized by Feldman (1972). She presents the four stages of criticism (Description, Analysis, Interpretation, and Judgment) for the reader. Firstly Ragans compares how to criticize art to playing detective under the heading- How to Criticize a Work of Art: "Doing art criticism is like playing detective. You must assume that the artist has a secret message hidden inside the work. Your job is to solve the mystery and find the message (p. 15)." The author introduces four required
sequential steps for finding the "hidden message." She guides the reader to answer questions directly related to the stages of criticism such as the following: "What do I see?" (description), "How is the work organized?" (analysis), "What is happening?" and "What is the artist trying to say?" (interpretation), and "What do I think of the work?" (judgment) (p. 15)." For step one, description, she directs the reader to make a list of all the things they see and to be objective (give only the facts). In step two, analysis, she directs the reader to collect facts and pay attention to how the artist uses elements and principles of design. For step three, interpretation, she directs the reader to explain and tell the meaning of the work. In step four, judgment, the reader must decide if the work is successful or a failure based on their honest opinion. She guides the reader to think why and how they like or dislike a work of art. She presents a similar approach for the other chapter artists. The author introduces three theories for judging art: 1) imitationalism- some people think art should reflect the real world; 2) formalism- some people think the use of principles and elements of design are most important; and 3) emotionalism- some people think that art must speak to the viewer through her or his emotions (the mood the artist communicates) (p. 18)."

Hurwitz and Day (1991) introduce the same stages for criticizing art. However the authors refer to Feldman's list of principles of designs such as unity, balance, rhythm, and proportion as the major design elements. They introduce the last stage as judgment and informed preference. The authors mention that the teacher can observe how effectively the students use the art vocabulary and concepts for the last stage. They identify preference as the viewer's personal liking of an artwork and it should not be interfered by authority. The authors identify informed preference as the last part of the
judgment stage. This becomes the difficult phase. The viewer must render what they have learned as to the worth of an art object (Hurwitiz and Day, 1991).

Barrett (1990) introduces three stages for criticizing artworks: description, interpretation, and judgment. Description concerns listing seen facts, answering questions about images, subject matter identification and typification, materials and formal elements. Interpretation is needed for fully understanding and appreciating images. Viewers' responses are dictated by their immediate environments. He posits that description cannot be made without some kind of interpretation of an image. Judgments depend on reason. Reasons are statements that support appraisals. Responsible judgment should be argued (Barrett, 1990).

The following chapter four provides the presentation of the data found in my investigation. This chapter includes my content analysis of the three middle and three high school art education text books. Firstly I present the following middle school art education text book, Understanding Art and Creating Art, by Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunders.
CHAPTER 4

ANALYSIS OF TWO ART EDUCATION TEXTS INCLUDING CONTENT FROM EIGHTEEN-EIGHTY TO NINETEEN-NINETY TWO

Middle School Textbook


Race and count of Representation

WHITE MALES 63
WHITE FEMALES 6
BLACK MALES 4
BLACK FEMALES 0
ASIAN 1

PART ONE

TARGET ARTIST: HORACE PIPPIN & ARTWORK: END OF WAR, STARTING HOME, 1918

A. CHAPTER ARTISTS AND ARTWORKS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Title of Artwork</th>
<th>Media</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Horace Pippin</td>
<td>End of War, Starting Home, 1918</td>
<td>oil paint</td>
<td>1918</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 2) M.M. Sanford  | Washington at Princeton        | oil paint| early 19th c.     | To be cont.

Table 2.1 Pippin: Chapter artists and artworks

61
Table 2.1 (cont.)

3) unknown artist | St. George and the Dragon | not given | 15th c.
4) Raphael | St. George and the Dragon | not given | 15th c.
5) Benjamin West | B. Franklin Drawing Lightning... | oil paint | 1805
6) Jules Bastien-Le Page | Joan of Arc | oil paint | 1879
7) Artemisia Gentileschi | Esther and Abauerus | not given | 17th c.

Table 2.2 Description of artworks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reproduction Size</th>
<th>Style</th>
<th>Subject matter</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) 3/8 p.</td>
<td>self taught</td>
<td>simple soldier as hero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) 5/8 p.</td>
<td>not given</td>
<td>George Washington as hero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) 5/8 p.</td>
<td>15th c. Italian</td>
<td>St. George as a hero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) 1/4 p.</td>
<td>15th c. Italian</td>
<td>St. George as a hero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) 7/8 p.</td>
<td>not given</td>
<td>Benjamin Franklin as a hero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6) 5/8 p.</td>
<td>early 1400's French</td>
<td>Joan of Arc as a heroine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7) 5/8 p.</td>
<td>17th c. Italian</td>
<td>Esther as a heroine</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

B. GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF THE TARGET ARTIST & ARTWORK

PIPPIN

Horace Pippin an African American was born on February 22, 1888, in West Chester Pennsylvania, a suburb in Philadelphia. He spent his youth growing up in Goshen, New York where his mother and he had relocated. Pippin taught himself how to draw, paint, and burnish wood. He won a box of crayons, watercolors, and two brushes by copying funny faces from an
advertisement in the paper. This was the beginning and motivation for his art making (Bearden & Henderson, 1993; Stein, 1993). Biblical themes motivated Pippin in his youth. Icons of Moses, Daniel in the Lion's Den, etc. appeared in his drawings and crayon colored images. Later while enlisted in the army during World War I, he drew war images. During the war he was shot and injured in his shoulder. Pippin returned to America after the war. He then recounts his childhood years in Goshen and depicts various genre scenes of his family, African American people, interracial scenes of the townspeople, etc. In his adult years he is honored by the well known art entrepreneur, Dr. Albert Barnes, and the historical black aesthetician, and philosopher, Dr. Alain Locke, for his gifted talents as an American painter.

**END OF WAR, STARTING HOME, (1918)**

Pippin's oil painting contains pictorial elements of American soldiers fighting the Germans during World War II in French countryside. The painting has a style which is often referred to as folk art by some art historians. Pippin's style of painting reflects what he learned on his own instead of under the tutelage of painting instructors. Pippin depicts German soldiers with hands hovering in the air with signs of giving up, some German soldiers coming out of fox holes with their weapons, while the Americans are depicted as winning by surrounding the German enemy. The sky is filled with fighter planes circling the sky above with red explosions in the air. **End of War, Starting Home, 1918** takes up 3/8 page 169. It becomes difficult to see the implied texture because of the poor quality of the dark toned exemplar offered by Goldstein et al. The artist predominately uses dull earth tones such as: 1) brown and green for the highly vegetated landscape; 2) brown to dark brown almost black barbed wire
barricades; 3) muted green gray soldier outfits; and 4) a middle toned brown grayish sky filled with dark brown fighting planes.

C. AUTHOR'S DESCRIPTION OF THE TARGET ARTIST & ARTWORK.

Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunders (1986) discuss Horace Pippin in Unit 4 ("Forms Of Expression: Looking At Heroes In History Through Paintings" pp. 169 & 170). The authors describe Pippin's style as self-taught. The authors state the following:

Horace Pippin was an American artist who taught himself how to paint. He was not concerned about what he should or should not do when making a painting. He had strong ideas about what he wanted to say and invented interesting ways to present them (p. 170).

Pippin's painting, End of War, Starting Home, 1918 is the focus of Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunders discussion. They state that the artwork is an oil painting by Pippin. The simple soldiers (doughboys) as a hero of World War I become the subject matter of their discussion. Goldstein et al discuss and interpret Pippin's painting by referring to the subject matter, American soldiers fighting and defeating the German soldiers during World War I. They do not discuss the framework that encases the oil painting of the American doughboys at war. Other art historians expound on the sculpture which is found in the wooden frames. Bearden and Henderson (1993) explain that Pippin hand-carved hand grenades, tanks, bombs, and helmets in the wooden frame surrounding the oil painting because of his obsessed memories of getting wounded while fighting the Germans (p. 360).
D. AUTHORS' CONTEXT FOR THE TARGET ARTIST & ARTWORK.

Goldstein et al use an iconographic approach to examine meanings behind Pippin's art work. Rothenberg (1989) defines iconography as the study of the subject matter or themes of a work focusing on their conventional and symbolic meanings (p. 1). Goldstein et al place Pippin's painting in a context of heroes and heroines in art. The authors pinpoint the doughboys fighting the Germans as the subject matter for their discussion of heroes. The authors present Pippin's painting with the following description:

The hero is the simple soldier, the doughboy of World War I (1914-1918), who thinks not about medals and promotion or being a hero, but only about returning home. Fighting a war in a foreign country is not only a dangerous, but lonely experience. Perhaps these soldiers were thinking as much about going home as winning the war (p. 169).
PART TWO: ANALYSIS OF THE REPRESENTATION OF PIPPIN

How do the authors represent Pippin and End of War, Starting Home, 1918 from an art historical perspective? How does this perspective compare with other chapter artists and artworks?

Contextual Approach

Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunders (1986) create three different contexts for understanding the seven chapter artists: 1) nationality, 2) historical, and 3) mythological. Goldstein et al discuss nationality differently for the seven chapter artists. The authors refer to Pippin as a self-taught American painter. They do not discuss the nationality of M.M. Sanford. Goldstein et al state that the first St. George and the Dragon was created by an unknown fifteenth-century Italian painter. The authors also state that Raphael was a fifteenth-century Italian painter of the second St. George and the Dragon. They describe West as an American artist. They introduce Bastien-LePage as French while they posit Gentileschi as a seventeenth-century Italian artist.

In addition to Nationality, the authors place Sanford's Washington at Princeton within a historical context. George Washington is depicted as righteous and protecting America from English tyranny. The unknown artist's St. George and the Dragon is a mythological context with a good knight protecting a maiden from an evil dragon. Raphael's similar subject matter (mythological context), St. George and the Dragon is a knight with a halo protecting a maiden from an evil dragon. West's portrayal of Ben Franklin triumphing over a dangerous electric storm to discover electricity is within a romanticized historical context. They discuss Bastion LePage's Joan of Arc in a
romanticized historical context and Gentileschi's Esther and Ahauerus in a biblical historical context.

Goldstein et al place Pippin's painting in a historical context and mention how doughboys fought the Germans.

Implications:

The authors refer to the figures in Pippin's painting as simple soldiers. They fail to include the history of Pippin fighting in World War I against the German army. Pippin was shot in the right shoulder while fighting under the French command in France in 1918. Later the French government awarded Corporal Pippin and the entire heroic 369th Infantry the Croix de Guerre, a highly honored French medal. Pippin depicted End of War, Starting Home, 1918 as he experienced World War I in France (Bearden & Henderson, 1993). Goldstein et al's brief literature limits the historical understanding of the World War I doughboys. Their actual heroic role is in sharp contrast to Goldstein et al's portrayal as simple soldiers who merely wanted to get home. The authors present Sanford, Bastien-LePage, and Gentileschi's heroes and heroines in a historical context in the following: 1) The authors interpret Sanford's George Washington's feeling his convictions as a righteous, 2) Bastien-LePage's Joan as a martyr for France, and 3) Gentileschi's Esther as brave and risking her life. They discuss the unknown artist and Raphael's heroes in a mythological context in the following: 1) the unknown artist's knight protecting the maiden from the dragon and 2) Raphael's knight protecting the maiden from the dragon. The authors portray Pippin's heroes, the doughboys, as more cowardly and fearful while both St. George's, Washington, Franklin, Joan of Arc, and Esther heroes and heroines by the chapter artists are interpreted more bravely.
Goldstein et al identify Pippin and West as American artists. Goldstein et al indirectly avoid the topic of race for Pippin and the chapter artists and posit Pippin as an American artist not an African American artist. Tatum (1992) mentions the issue of race as key to classroom discussion. Often adults more than children have problems discussing race. The avoidance of the topic-race stems from one thinking of America as a just society (Tatum, 1992).

The authors characterize Pippin as a self-taught artist. They state: “He was not concerned about what he should or should not do when making a painting. He had strong ideas about what he wanted to say and invented interesting ways to present them” (p. 170). Nevertheless they do not provide social or cultural text for Pippin’s philosophy behind his creativity. Students gain a better understanding of Pippin as well as other artists’ art forms when they are presented with specific social and cultural contexts in which the art is produced (Chalmers 1992; Hart, p. 6, 1992-93). The authors text is indicative of their lack of knowledge about Pippin as an American artist. However, the same can be said for the other chapter artists. For instance they fail to discuss Sanford’s origin and/or nationality, and describe St. George and the Dragon as a fifteenth-century Italian painting, etc. The text lacks an adequate description of Pippin’s ethnicity, personal history, and artistic development for a substantive understanding of the artist and his work.

**Interpretative Approach**

The authors emphasize the theme, heroes through paintings, for Pippin and his painting, *End of War, Starting Home, 1918*. They stress the emotion of the doughboys as the heroes in Pippin’s work. They focus on the emotional drama of fear and the desire of the American doughboys to return to American
from the war they faced in France against the Germans. They briefly discuss heroes and heroines in art by describing and directing questions concerning the hero and/or heroine depicted by the seven artists in their book.

Implications:

Goldstein et al present a weak portrayal of the doughboys because of an emphasis on human weakness rather than historical facts or more positive human qualities as courage and bravery. They diminish the courageousness and possessiveness of the doughboys in Pippin's painting. This is in contrast to the portrayals of the other chapter artists' heroes and heroines.

They neither provide diverse contexts for culturally defining a hero or heroine and the many types found in different chronological time periods in American and world history. They randomly select choices from the 15th to 20th centuries without a common thread connecting each artists' depiction of heroes and heroines. Without this discussion the interpretive context is inadequate for all the chapter artists and the contrast of Pippin's doughboys to the contrast of the other chapter heroes and heroines is inequitable.

The authors describe End of War, Starting Home, 1918 as a scene filled with planes falling and burning, bombs bursting, and smoke billowing in the sky. They do not relate this scene to courage and bravery. Furthermore the doughboys' power and strength suffer in contrast to author's approach in describing and interpreting the symbolic subject matter in the other chapter artworks. For example, the authors interpret most of the chapter artists with positive cultural symbols such as:

1) They depict George Washington as a hero in Sanford's painting, Washington at Princeton with such symbols as the American flag: "The artist presents a
strong vision filled with symbols. What symbols can you identify in the painting, Washington at Princeton (p. 169)?

2) They refer to the unknown 15th-century Italian artist's painting as: "Could the white color of the horse symbolize light and goodness, which triumphs over the evil monster drawn from its dark cave (p. 171)?"

3) Raphael's St. George and the Dragon they describe as: "Notice that there are halos around the heads of both St. George and the maiden. What meaning might that detail contribute to the painting (p. 172)?" This implies that halos are symbolic and therefore they direct the students to believe that St. George and the maiden are saintlike.

4) They note West's Benjamin Franklin Drawing Electricity from the Sky, through the following statements and questions: "How did the artist dramatize the moment to make it more heroic? The storm billows about Franklin, blowing his cloak and hair. Cherubs surround him as well, assisting in this historic act (p. 172)." The authors discuss cherubs as heavenly symbols and imply that Franklin was saintly, if not godlike.

5) They refer to biblical characters for Gentileschi's painting: "Many of Gentileschi's works included strong, female heroines. She painted, among others, Susanna, Bathsheba, and Mary Magalene (p. 176)." Goldstein et al refer to the Old Testament for their discussion on biblical characters and what they symbolize to religion for Gentileschi's artworks. In addition to using positive cultural symbols for the other chapter artworks, the authors also present more positive dialogues for these artists such as:

a) Goldstein et al refer to Sanford's painting and the surety of Washington: "Sanford's Washington is sure of victory that he charges without even looking at the enemy. Perhaps Washington's conviction that he represents what is
right gives him this courage (Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, & Saunders, pp. 168-169) (Emphasis added).

b) The authors discuss West's painting, Benjamin Franklin Drawing Lightning From The Sky, positing Franklin as a scientific hero:

In the next picture, you will see a hero of science. Benjamin Franklin Drawing Electricity from the Sky is an oil painting on paper by the American artist, Benjamin West. Did you list imagination as one of the characteristics of a hero? Benjamin West certainly did. He has shown the imaginative Franklin as a superhuman, almost godlike man (p. 172). (Emphasis added)

c) Goldstein et al go to great lengths to dramatize their description of Bastien-LePage Page's Joan of Arc, as a saint:

Although the saints are so light and filmy that they can barely be seen, the impact of their presence can be seen and felt through the power they have on Joan of Arc. Her face, throat, and arms seem to be almost "lit up" by her vision. Her arm shoots forward, reaching, as if by some "electrifying" jolt. The artist has shown this most famous of heroines at the moment which will change her life (p. 175). (Emphasis added)

d) The authors refer to Gentileschi's painting, Esther and Ahasuerus with a comparison to Bastien LePage's Joan of Arc in the following:

Like Joan of Arc, another heroine who acted on behalf of her people was Esther. Look at the painting, Esther and Ahasuerus, by the seventeenth-century Italian painter, Artemisia Gentileschi. Notice the posture of both Esther and her husband, King Ahasuerus. How reluctant she is to approach him. How tense he is! The artist has captured the human suffering in this heroine's story most vividly (p. 175).

Formal Approach

Goldstein et al emphasize the explosive nature of Pippin's painting, End of War, Starting Home, 1918, but they fail to discuss any formal elements
relative to the explosive nature of the artist's painting. The authors discuss and identify formal elements for the following chapter artists:

1) They discuss space and color (symbolic meaning) for Sanford's painting and direct the reader to study space by referring to the foreground, middleground, and background of the battle scene. They then refer to Washington riding a white horse as an assured sign of victory, asking the reader: "What symbols can you identify in this painting (p. 169)?"

2) The authors focus on color (symbolic meaning) and size (height) for the unknown artist's painting:

   "Like George Washington in Washington at Princeton, St. George sits astride a white horse. Could the white color of the horse symbolize light and goodness, which triumphs over the evil monster drawn from its dark cave? Notice the pictorial design which reinforce the concept of good over evil. St George rises on his horse, and with physical advantage achieved from that height, drives a lance through the eye of the dragon (pp. 170-171)."

3) The diagram of an X and color is emphasized in Raphael's painting, St. George and the Dragon in the following:

   Compare the painting we have just looked at to another St. George and the Dragon by the fifteenth-century Italian artist Raphael. The composition of Raphael's painting is developed around a big X. Can you outline the X? To the left of the X falls the dragon, cave, darkness, and death; to the right, the maiden, hills, vegetation, light, and life. St. George, the knight in the middle, appears to have power over life and death, light and darkness, good and evil. He sits astride a bright white horse, but he is wearing black armor, and black cape rises from his back. Notice that there are halos around the heads of both St. George and the maiden. What meaning might that detail contribute to this painting (p. 172)?

4) The authors focus on color for West's painting of Benjamin Franklin: "Many pictorial elements in the painting lead the viewer to the light in the upper left
hand corner (p. 173)." They guide the reader to interpret the subject matter and how they point to the light in the sky.

Implications

They do not provide a discussion on formal elements for Bastien-LePage’s painting of Joan of Arc and Gentileschi’s Esther and Ahauerus. The lack of author’s discussion about Pippin, Bastien-LePage, and Gentileschi’s formal qualities is significant. Stein (1993) expounds that Pippin’s intuitive genius for composition, color, and form and how it was as strong as the “advanced moderns”. She compares his growth in prominence to that of the modernist painter, Jackson Pollock (p. 35). Henderson and Bearden (1993) mention how Pippin responded highly to shape and color of farm tools, dishpans, and split-log benches in his immediate environments. Cravens (1994) explains how flat shapes filled with pattern and bright color was typical formal elements the artist used in his works (p. 548). The quality of the exemplar, End of War, Starting Home, 1918, is poor when compared to the other chapter artists artworks. It is too dark therefore causing the dark colored subject matter to blend into the foreground and middleground of the painting. They are also poor in quality when compared to Stein (1993) and Henderson and Bearden (1993) exemplars, End of War, Starting Home, 1918.

The authors failed to discuss significant formal elements relating to Pippin's painting, End of War, Starting Home, 1918. Bearden and Henderson (1993) refer to how Pippin's carvings of three-dimensional bombs and tanks on his paintings' wooden frames and how the forms related to the artist who served in World War I that he often depicted. The authors described formal element as
they related to symbols and interpreted meanings for Sanford, the unknown artist, Raphael, West, and Gentileschi's artworks.

**Stylistic Approach**

Goldstein et al describe Pippin as self taught: "Horace Pippin was an American artist who taught himself how to paint" (p. 170). Both exemplars of *St. George and the Dragon* by the unknown artist and Raphael are labeled fifteenth-century Italian paintings. Goldstein et al discuss Jules Bastien-LePage's painting of *Joan of Arc* as a French created work of 1879. The same approach characterizes Gentileschi's painting of *Esther and Ahasuerus* as a seventeenth-century Italian painting. Bantel (1993) refers to Pippin's broad categorization as exemplar of the American spirit, folk artist, and African American artist. She expounds on Pippin as an artist who transcends the "primitive" categorization of a self taught artist. Art historians classify him often as a folk artist as well as an African American artist. In the book, *I Tell My Heart The Art of Horace Pippin*, Pippin is presented in a broader context. Pippin exceeds the bounds of one categorization. He is not just a folk artist or an African American artist. Pippin style captures the American spirit and his painting embraces not one but all the categories. (Bantel, p. vii, 1993). Bearden and Henderson (1993) state that Pippin in 1930-146 was self-taught and he became the first black painter to establish himself as one of America's great masters of color and design (p. 356). Cravens (1993) explain that Pippin was entirely self-taught and he was discovered by several pioneers of the folk art revival in the 1930's (p. 548).
Implications

Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunders (1986) posit Pippin as an obscure artist when they contrast him with the chapter artists from distinct historical time periods. These artists are identified with the art of the specific centuries and countries. Pippin's style of painting is not defined and he is isolated from a meaningful artistic context. They discuss Esther and Ahasuerus with a more positive written context: "Artemisia Gentileschi was a great painter of her period. She was known for her dramatic intensity and strong power of expression (p. 176)." They do not define Pippin's style of painting. The style of his and Sanford's work lacks a descriptive discussion. Cravens (1994) expounds on Pippin as entirely self-taught with a distinct style below:

Pippin found his own brand of abstraction in the stylization of natural form into flat patterns and delicate, linear rhythms. The color, too, is bright and decorative, and it is abstract in that it is largely independent of the actual color of the objects painted (p. 548).

Cravens (1994) continues that Pippin's popularity grew after his style was discovered by pioneers of the folk art revival during the 1930's. Craven refers specifically to Pippin's style in his painting, Victorian Interior, below:

Victorian Village (Fig. 36.4) shows a mode of vision that is independent of both academic naturalism and the modernist movements of the twentieth century, although Pippin was familiar with modernism through his frequent visits to the Barnes Collection in nearby Marion, Pennsylvania, and to the art galleries of Philadelphia (p. 548).

Cravens validates Pippin's style by its historical significance. He discussed how he was discovered by leaders in the folk art revival and Pippin's familiarization with modernism by his frequent visits to the Albert Barnes collection in Marion, Pennsylvania (p. 548). Goldstein et al discuss him as
follows: "He was not concerned about what he should or should not do when making painting (p. 170)". Bearden and Henderson (1993) and Stein (1993) both expound on Pippin's contribution to American art history (folk art), his dynamic use of color for creating feeling and mood, and narrative thematic approach to painting.

Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunders (1986) do not challenge the art historical canon or traditional perspective on Pippin. The authors' art historical statements on style are incomplete. Cravens, Henderson and Bearden, or Stein provide complex perspectives that posits Pippin more clearly in art history.
PART THREE: RHETORICAL

How does the author's language represent the target artist and artworks?

Rhetorical Strategies

I. Questions

A. The authors employ the following questions which direct the readers toward particular understandings of the artworks.

1) Comparative questioning - a rhetorical strategy for understanding artworks in relation to another artwork(s).

2) Contextual questioning - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork in relation to a particular context as a historical context.

3) Analytic questioning - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork in relation to an analysis of its formal properties and media.

4) Interpretative questioning - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork symbolically or metaphorically.

5) Descriptive questioning - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork in relation to its identifiable properties.
Rhetorical strategies used for Pippin and each chapter artists:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Rhetorical Strategies for Questions</th>
<th>Number of Questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Pippin</td>
<td>Interpretative (2), Contextual &amp; Comparative</td>
<td>four</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Sanford</td>
<td>Interpretative (2), Descriptive, Contextual</td>
<td>four</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Unknown artist</td>
<td>Interpretative (4)</td>
<td>one</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Raphael</td>
<td>Analytic (2), Interpretative</td>
<td>three</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) West</td>
<td>Interpretative (2), Descriptive</td>
<td>three</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6) Bastien-LePage</td>
<td>Descriptive (3)</td>
<td>three</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7) Gentileschi</td>
<td>Descriptive, Analytic</td>
<td>two</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2.3 Rhetorical Strategies

B. Authors' Questions for End of War, Starting Home (1918)

Interpretative

Question #1: "What are some of the ways in which Pippin communicates his vision in End of War, Starting Home, 1918?"

Implications

Goldstein et al prompt and direct the reader to interpret how Pippin communicated his feelings when painting his artwork. The question follows the authors' statements describing the subject matter for End of War, Starting Home (1918) and the statement that Pippin had strong ideas about what he had to say for his painting. The authors describe and identify Pippin's painting with their written words thereby leading the reader to think accordingly about End of War.
Starting Home (1918). They inconsistently present questions and implicate meanings questioning for Pippin and the other chapter artists. They present questions about George Washington as a hero in Sanford's painting, knights as heroes in the unknown artist and Raphael's painting, Ben Franklin as a hero in West's painting, Joan of Arc as heroine in Bastien-Le Page's painting, and Esther as heroine in Gentileschi's painting. This interpretative question strategy characterizes the doughboys as more cowardly than the chapter heroes and heroines.

Contextual
Question #2: "What do you discover about the past in this historical painting?"

Implications
Janson and Janson (1992) refer "the past" to World War I and/or 1918. It becomes unclear as to what context of the happening the reader has to ponder. The authors indirectly lead the reader to describe and interpret End of War, Starting Home, 1918 by using their written text on World War I. They lessen the credibility of strong fighting soldiers by stating that the simple soldiers (doughboys) were thinking of going home instead of proud, unafraid men fighting in Europe during World War I. They portray the soldiers as ones not wanting medals or promotions, but lonely. The authors create hierarchal levels of heroes. Pippin's subject matter, the soldiers (heroes), are reduced to coward and weak individuals.
Comparative

Question #3: How does it differ from the picture Washington at Princeton (p. 170)?

Implications

Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunders (1986) present a problematic situation with the prior question. The question follows their prior interpretation of Pippin’s subject matter—lonely soldiers, wanting to go home for End of War, Starting Home, 1918. They introduce President Washington as right for protecting the American colonies from British soldiers and the American flag as a dominant patriotic symbol for Washington at Princeton. The authors present inequitable hero comparisons of weak doughboys and the "victorious" first American President of the United States. Their comparisons were inequitable for Pippin and Sanford. The authors do not provide historic information on how the doughboys received France’s highest war medal, Croix de Guerre, for defeating the Germans in World War II. They compared doughboys of World War II to the first President of the United States. Most children readily know and can identify George Washington (an icon) because of his historic significance.

Goldstein et al (1986) present a statement for their comparing of the unknown 15th-century Italian artist and Raphael. The authors direct the reader to compare St. George and the Dragon by the unknown 15th-century Italian artist and St. George and the Dragon by Raphael with this statement instead of a question: "Compare the painting we have just looked at to another St. George and the Dragon by the fifteenth-century Italian artist Raphael (p. 171)."
## Terms: Specific keywords from the text

### A. Evaluative Terms:

#### ARTISTS (positive)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Sanford</th>
<th>unknown</th>
<th>Raphael</th>
<th>West</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pippin</td>
<td>strong</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bastien-LePage</td>
<td>Gentileschi</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>__</td>
<td>great</td>
<td>dramatic</td>
<td>strong</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### ARTISTS (negative)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Sanford</th>
<th>unknown</th>
<th>Raphael</th>
<th>West</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pippin</td>
<td>self-taught</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bastien-LePage</td>
<td>Gentileschi</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>__</td>
<td>__</td>
<td>__</td>
<td>__</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### ARTWORKS (positive)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Sanford</th>
<th>unknown</th>
<th>Raphael</th>
<th>West</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pippin</td>
<td>sure</td>
<td>goodness</td>
<td>power</td>
<td>imaginative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>right</td>
<td>good</td>
<td>superhuman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>strong</td>
<td>powerful</td>
<td>godlike</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

|       | Bastien-LePage | Gentileschi |       |       |
|       | power      | unselfish  |       |       |
|       | "electrifying" | strong    |       |       |
|       |           | lively     |       |       |

Table 2.4 Terms: specific keywords
Table 2.4 (cont.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ARTWORKS (negative)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pippin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanford</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unknown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Raphael</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>simple --</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>lonely</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bastien-LePage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gentileschi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. Negative Adverbs and Adjectives

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pippin</th>
<th>Sanford</th>
<th>unknown</th>
<th>Raphael</th>
<th>West</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Artwork</td>
<td>Artwork</td>
<td>Artwork</td>
<td>Artwork</td>
<td>Artwork</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>simple</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bastien-LePage</th>
<th>Gentileschi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Artwork

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artwork</th>
<th>Artwork</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2.4

A. Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunders (1986) refer to Pippin as strong and self-taught. They describe his ideas for painting as interesting. The authors refer to Gentileschi as a great painter of her
period because of her usage of dramatic intensity and strong power of expression. The chapter artists are not identified or described. The authors use more positive and dynamic word usage for describing and interpreting the subject matter for the chapter artists (See above). This approach presents partiality for the disseminating information on all the artists. The authors discuss Sanford's, Washing at Princeton, by interpreting President Washington as sure and right for rebelling against England. They interpret the unknown soldier and Raphael's St. George on his white horse as good challenging the evil dragon and they interpret West's Benjamin Franklin as superhuman and godlike for his discovery of electricity, and the same positive approach is used for interpreting Bastien-LePage and Gentileschi's artworks. The authors interpret Gentileschi and her artwork more complexity than Pippin and the other chapter artists.

B. Goldstein et al (1987) describe and interpret the subject matter of Pippin's artwork, End of War, Starting Home (1918) with more cowardly terms. The heroism of the doughboys is lessen due to the authors interpretation of the subject matter. The authors interpret the heroes as simple soldiers who were not interested in medals or promotions, but lonely and wanting to return to the United States by leaving Germany during World War I. (See above comments on chapter artists)

Goldstein et al (1986) cast a more favorable interpretation of Sanford's George Washington, the unknown soldier's knight, West's Benjamin Franklin, and Gentileschi's Esther in the following: 1) They discuss Sanford's Washington as sure and right about taking control of the battle by firing at the British invasion. They follow with statements on Washington's firing act with positive and "right" contentions for regaining control in the following: "Perhaps Washington conviction that he represents what is right gives him this courage (p. 169)."  2) They refer to the unknown artist's knight triumph over the evil dragon by introducing oppositions- good versus evil. St. George's height and his white horse is interpreted as overcoming evil, 3) Benjamin Franklin defeating the darkness by discovering electricity, and 4) Gentileschi's Esther risking her life to save the Jews.
SUMMARY

Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunders (1986) use the rhetorical device of asking questions about each of the artworks. The content of these questions implies that the readers may find certain meanings in each artwork. Goldstein et al describe and interpret Pippin and End of War, Starting Home, 1918 with sparse contextual information. All the artists lacked sufficient historical and anthropological context and artist information. Because Pippin is less familiar and his subject matter is less known than the chapter artists, the authors' written context is more detrimental to him. They lead the reader to interpret the doughboys as fearful and not heroic therefore implying a less positive view of doughboys as being significant heroes. Bearden and Henderson (1993); Cravens (1994); and Stein (1993) all expound on the importance of Pippin's paintings and wood burnishes of American life and the American soldiers battle in World War II. Goldstein et al neglect to provide a discussion about the theme (heroes and heroines), and therefore, this idea is misrepresented in Pippin as well as some of the other artists. Pippin, Sanford, and the unknown 15th-century Italian artist lack needed historical information and become "filler" or token artists instead of artist with historical context. The authors' categorization of Pippin as a self-taught artist creates partiality. That is, they guide the reader to believe that the chapter artists were trained academically. Therefore a hierarchy of fine art versus folk art occurs. This approach presents prejudice to Pippin. When the learner reads the written text about Pippin and the chapter artists, the authors direct their interpretation.
PART ONE
TARGET ARTIST: WILLIAM EDMONDSION & ARTWORK: JACK JOHNSON &
THE PREACHER

A. CHAPTER ARTISTS AND ARTWORKS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Title of Artwork</th>
<th>Media</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) William Edmonson</td>
<td>Jack Johnson</td>
<td>limestone</td>
<td>1935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) William Edmonson</td>
<td>The Preacher</td>
<td>limestone</td>
<td>1935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Gutson Borglum</td>
<td>The Presidents on Mt. Rushmore</td>
<td>granite</td>
<td>1927-1941</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Andrea del Verrocchio</td>
<td>Mont. of Bartolommeo Colleoni</td>
<td>bronze</td>
<td>1483</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) Frederic Remington</td>
<td>Bronco Buster</td>
<td>bronze</td>
<td>1895</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6) Mahonri M. Young</td>
<td>Groggy</td>
<td>bronze</td>
<td>1926</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2.5 Edmondson: Chapter artists and artworks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reproduction Size</th>
<th>Style</th>
<th>Subject matter</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) 1/9 p.</td>
<td>not given</td>
<td>boxer as hero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) 1/10 p.</td>
<td>not given</td>
<td>preacher as hero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) 1/2 p.</td>
<td>not given</td>
<td>presidents as heroes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) 1/4 p.</td>
<td>not given</td>
<td>Italian soldier as hero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) 1/3 p.</td>
<td>not given</td>
<td>American cowboy as hero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6) 4/5 p.</td>
<td>not given</td>
<td>boxer as hero</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3.1 Description of artworks
B. GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF THE TARGET ARTIST & ARTWORK

EDMONDSON

William Edmondson was born in Nashville, Tennessee. Because of his home catching on fire, his birthdate was destroyed along with the family bible. He was a descendent of Edmondson and Compton slaves. Although the artist's birth records are lost, Fletcher (1981) posits Edmonson's age at 68. He worked for the Nashville, Chattanooga, and St. Louis Railroad shops until 1907. He quit his job at the railroad because of an accident at work and returned to Nashville around 1907 and became a servant, fireman, janitor, and later orderly at the Women's Hospital (Baptist's Hospital) in Nashville. He stopped working at the hospital around 1931. He resorted to vegetable gardening, doing odd jobs, and later carving limestone figures. Edmonson's religious background inspired his sculpture. He used his work man's tools for carving, not tools used by stonemasons. He carved tombstones, religious figures, famous people, garden sculptures, flower pots, animals etc. In 1937 Edmondson became the first black artist ever to be honored with a one-man show at the Museum of Modern Art in New York because of photographers like Edward Weston and Louise Dahl-Wolfe. Dahl and Weston saw his photography and felt that it was worthy of an exhibition in New York. He worked under the Works Projects Administration Federal Art Project prior to his death in 1951 (Fletcher, p. 12, 1981).
**Jack Johnson (1935)**

The vertical limestone statue represents a solid, massive, squat figure of a male boxer. The form and appearance of this stone sculptures are more expressive than realistic. For instance the fingers are not represented clearly on the hands. With its stout composition, the boxer's body resembles a strong and worthy opponent for any fighter. Because the reproduction is very small in relationship to the page it is difficult to describe. Because it is impossible to view the sculpture in the round the exemplar is presented in a three-quarter view. Henderson and Bearden (1993) state that Jack Johnson was the first African-American heavy weight boxer to gain the professional championship (1908-15) and the boxer was Edmondson's hero in his youth (Henderson and Bearden, p. 351, 1993).

**The Preacher**

This vertical limestone statue represents a solid, rounded, representation of a minister. This stone artwork is made with expressive qualities similar to Jack Johnson. The sculpture has a smooth but hard surface and the hair is chiseled to show texture. The Preacher holds his right hand close to his side and raises a bible in his left hand. The reproduction is very small and is about1/10 of the entire page with the Preacher shown in 3/4 view in black and white. Preachers have been central figures in the lives of African Americans in American history and the raised bible is a symbol for authority as a warning for those not living a Christian life and a promise of God's love for His faithful followers (Henderson and Bearden, p. 353, 1993).
C. AUTHOR'S DESCRIPTION OF THE TARGET ARTIST & ARTWORK.

Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunders (1986) discuss William Edmondson in Unit 4 (Forms Of Expression: Looking At Heroes In History Through Sculpture) on pages 177 & 182. Goldstein et al do not refer nor provide contextual information and how The Preacher has hero status for Edmondson's artwork. They introduce his two sculptures titled Jack Johnson and The Preacher. The authors describe Edmondson's art and life in a general manner:

William Edmondson, the sculptor, was from Nashville, Tennessee. He did not begin sculpting until he was in his fifties. Most of his work is in limestone. Edmondson was a man of great faith and did not doubt, even thought self-taught, that he was a sculptor. Perhaps some of Edmondson's inspiration came from his local minister. Look at his sculpture called The Preacher. What kind of person does it show (p. 182)?

Art historian Vlach provides more extensive contextual information about Edmondson than Goldstein et al. Vlach (1981) posits that Edmondson's career as an artist began with his creation of grave markers. His later works of Adam and Eve, Jack Johnson and Eleanor Roosevelt are regarded as his most accomplished achievements and they serve as the primary basis for Edmondson's reputation as an important American folk artist (p. 19).

The authors describe and interpret Jack Johnson as equally powerful to the chapter artist Young's sculpture: "The William Edmondson statue, Jack Johnson, portrays an equally powerful athlete. However, this fighter does not ripple sway. He is planted firmly and squarely and appears to have the solidity of the side of a mountain (p. 180)." They discuss Edmondson' use of limestone for examining media and its ability to personify strength and power. Vlach
(1981) expands this knowledge to include facts that black quarry workers brought stones that were deemed odd and thought unusable by the contractors to Edmondson's home on 14th Avenue in Nashville. The workers were intrigued and supportive of the artist's sculpture (Vlach, 1981).

D. AUTHORS' CONTEXT FOR THE TARGET ARTIST & ARTWORK.

Goldstein et al continue to discuss heroes and heroines in art by describing, interpreting, and/or directing questions concerning the heroes and/or heroines in sculpture.

Vlach (1981) and Wardlaw (1989) provide much stronger connections between Edmondson and the African American community and the role of spirituality, a point not discussed by Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunders. Vlach (1981) explains that Edmondson's gravestones were folk art and closely linked to African American traditions on death and funerals:

For black Americans the cemetery has long had special significance. Beyond its association with the fear and awe of death which all humans share, the graveyard was, in the past, one of the few places in America where an overt black identity could be asserted and maintained. In some cases the opportunity for group expression took a political direction when the gathering of slaves at a funeral led to plans for escape or rebellion (p. 19).

Edmondson's creation of tombstones are closely tied to his community, of which he was an important and integral member (Vlach, 1981). The gravestones, which were his original creations, were demanded by those of his African American community for the burial of the people. The Preacher symbolizes a clear symbol of the combination of Biblical and Afro-American folk religion traditions.
PART TWO: ANALYSIS OF THE REPRESENTATION OF EDMONDSON
How do the authors represent Edmondson and \textbf{Jack Johnson} and \textbf{The Preacher} from an art historical perspective? How does this perspective compare with other chapter artists and artworks?

Contextual Approach

Goldstein et al refer to Edmondson as an American artist and imply that Edmondson's art works were influenced by his religious beliefs. (See the authors' paragraph under Authors' Description of Target Artist & Artwork) This is similar to the other chapter artists. For example they posit Borglum as an American sculptor, Verrocchio as an Italian artist, and Remington as an American artist.

Implications:

The authors are inconsistent in placing the artists within specific cultural contexts. They refer to social and/or cultural issues related to three chapter artists but not for the other two the artists and the time period of which they created. They provide only brief information. For example they explain:

1) Italian Renaissance and how Italian soldiers were hired to fight during the time period of Verrocchio.

2) The late 19th-century and early 20th-century when Remington, a magazine illustrator, helped popularize the American West with his illustrations.

Although the authors provide some cultural context for Edmondson they omit discussing race and representation for Edmondson as they did for Pippin. A lack of information about the significance of religion to Edmondson presents problematic situation for the reader because religion play a major role in
Edmondson's life and sculpture. They hint at Edmondson's background, but fail to present a meaningful dialogue on Edmondson, his sculpture and religion. Preachers have played significant roles in the African American community because they provided a dialogue in few places where congregations of African Americans could meet and not only practice religion, but sociopolitical and socioeconomic conditions (Jim Crow laws and segregation) of African Americans in early America (Vlach, 1981). Goldstein et al fail to provide contextual information on Edmondson's charitable nature for his poorer neighbors. During the Depression when the artist was over fifty years old, he carved tombstones for poor black people (Henderson & Bearden, p. 349, 1993).

Goldstein et al use "perhaps" in their description of the influence of Edmondson's religious beliefs on his sculpture, this implies a lack of knowledge about Edmondson and his artwork.

Interpretative Approach

Goldstein et al emphasize their "theme", heroes, by looking at heroes in history through sculpture. First they discuss Borglum's sculpture, The Presidents on Mt. Rushmore, (Washington, Jefferson, Roosevelt, and Lincoln) as heroes; Verrocchio's artwork, Monument of Bartolommeo Colleoni, Italian soldiers as heroes; Remington's sculpture, Bronco Billy, American cowboys as heroes; and compare and contrast Edmondson's Jack Johnson to the chapter artist Young's sculpture, Groggy, boxers as heroes; and lastly Edmondson's sculpture, The Preacher, as a hero:
This is a preacher who speaks up and says what's is on his mind. No doubt he offers encouragement and inspiration to the people in his community. Perhaps people came to him to hear him tell them what they could do. How has Edmondson showed solidity and steadfastness of this preacher? In what ways are these characteristics heroic (p. 182)?

Goldstein et al ask the reader to interpret the heroicness of Edmondson's The Preacher while they state that Verrochio's Monument of Bartolommeo Colleoni, Remington's Bronco Buster, Young's Groggy, and Edmondson's Jack Johnson represent heroes. They fail to present the similar context for Edmondson's The Preacher and Borglum's The Presidents as a hero. (See above)

Implications:

Because Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk & Saunders do not discuss Jack Johnson with contextual information about boxer, it's difficult for the reader to comprehend this analogy. Edmondson's characters seem to be less credible as heroes because they are compared and contrasted to historical heroes such as presidents of the United States, Italian Renaissance soldiers and even American cowboys take precedent over a boxer and preacher. The authors employ artworks from broad time periods, but do not explain how people for various cultures and time periods conceive heroes and heroines. The authors fail to introduce the multiple perspectives and belief systems that constitute heroes and heroines within specific contexts. They rely upon the reader's understandings of heroes and heroines which may be very ambiguous and uninformed. The lack of discussion about the role of the preacher in the African American community and Jack Johnson as an important African American boxer has already been noted. This information would have provided validity for The Preacher and Jack Johnson as heroes.
Formalist Approach

Goldstein et al discuss the media and its effectiveness for communicating the artists' message. They focus on the materials for Edmondson's and Young's sculptures in the following manner:

Still another kind of hero is the athlete. Look at these sculptures by two American artists—Groggy by Mahonri M. Young and Jack Johnson by William Edmondson. The first is made of bronze, the second of limestone. How do these statues of boxers portray power and strength (p. 180)? The William Edmondson statue, Jack Johnson, portrays an equally powerful athlete. However, this fighter does not ripple and sway. He is planted firmly and squarely and appears to have the solidity of the side of a mountain. Here is an athlete who dares one to dislodge him or try to get beyond him. The medium of limestone adds considerably to this image (p. 180).

Implications:

Goldstein et al refer to Edmondson's use of limestone, minimal working of the stone and strong expression. Vlach (1981) expands that Afro-American customs were linked to Edmondson's form making. He also used the Anglo-American tablet-shaped headstone design and incorporated it into his sculpture. This design refers to the typical vertical slab of stone. Henderson and Bearden (1993) posit that Edmondson did not create two-dimensional drawings for his sculptures, instead he carved three-dimensional sculptures from his creative thoughts. Texture is an important formal element for the artist's sculpture because the artist enjoyed creating highly dexterous surfaces (Henderson & Bearden, 1993) Edmondson stated that his sculpture was barely released from the block of stone and he carved "stingly" clearly identifying the minimal nature of is style of working (Vlach quotes Fuller, p. 25). This information goes beyond Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunder's
discussion and provides the reader with a more complex and complete understanding of the artist's work.

**Stylistic Approach**

Goldstein et al elude the style of Edmondson's sculpture. The focus is on the description of media and how the materials convey strength.

**Implications:**

Goldstein et al mention that Edmondson was self-taught. Again, as with Pippin, this stylistic category is not explained. Bearden and Henderson (1993) expound how Edmondson's sculptures had remarkable similarities with that of his modern contemporary, John B. Flanagan who was a well trained sculptor (Bearden and Henderson quote Anderson, 1982). This information implies that characterizing Edmondson only as self-taught, leaves the reader with an inaccurate impression on his abilities.
PART THREE: RHETORICAL

How does the author's' language represent the target artist and artworks?

Rhetorical Strategies

I. Questions

A. The authors employ the following questions which direct the readers toward particular understandings of the artworks.

1) **Comparative questioning** - a rhetorical strategy for understanding artworks in relation to another artwork(s).

2) **Contextual questioning** - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork in relation to a particular context as a historical context.

3) **Analytic questioning** - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork in relation to an analysis of its formal properties and media.

4) **Interpretative questioning** - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork symbolically or metaphorically.

5) **Descriptive questioning** - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork in relation to its identifiable properties.
Rhetorical strategies used for Edmondson and each chapter artists:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Rhetorical Strategies for Questions</th>
<th>Number of Questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Edmondson</td>
<td>Comparative (1), Interpretative (3), Analytic (1)</td>
<td>five</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. J. Johnson</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The Preacher</td>
<td>Interpretative (2), Analytic (1)</td>
<td>three</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Borglum</td>
<td>Contextual (1), Interpretative (2)</td>
<td>three</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Verrocchio</td>
<td>Interpretative (1), Analytic (1)</td>
<td>two</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Remington</td>
<td>(Authors do not present a question)</td>
<td>zero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) Young</td>
<td>Comparative (1)</td>
<td>one</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3.2 Rhetorical Strategies

B. Authors' Questions for Jack Johnson

Analytic & Comparative

Question #1: "How do the two statues of boxers portray power and strength?"

Implications

Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunders (1986) ask the reader to observe the chapter artists Young's boxing statue, Groggy and Edmondson's boxing statue, Jack Johnson. The authors describe how Young's sculpture is made of bronze and Edmondson's of limestone. They describe Young's statue, Groggy, as more realistic and Edmondson's boxer as expressive. The two artworks could be better understood by the reader if the authors reviewed realism and Expressionism. Edmondson's artwork which has a more expressive physical appearance and shows less human physiognomy. Thus, the question would be more instructive if it followed a discussion about how
physical differences are represented by these two styles, realism and expressionism. Again, as with the lack of context for interpreting heroes, the authors rely too much upon the reader's knowledge of stylistic differences.

**Question # 2:** "Why would bronze have been less effective?"

**Implications**

Goldstein et al (1986) present a valid question for discussing the differences in the use of media by Young and Edmondson. They discuss how the media gives individual character to each artists' expression in this manner: "Here is an athlete who dares one to dislodge him or try to get beyond him. The medium of limestone adds considerably to this image (p. 180)." The media discussion was one of the stronger areas in representing Edmondson because the authors explained how limestone contributed to the Expressionism of Edmondson's sculpture. This is unlike other discussions which leave the reader without adequate information.

**Interpretive**

Questions #3, 4, & 5: "What does it say?", "What do they say?", and "What do (oes) it say? (p. 18)" (Authors repeat question)

**Implications**

Goldstein et al (1986) state that Edmondson created very strong expressions with only a few chiseled cuts and then they ask the reader to interpret the boxer. The authors continue asking the question "What does it say?" as they add more descriptive information:
Look carefully at the forms and lines of Jack Johnson. With just a few cuts of the chisel, the artist has given the fighter a very strong expression. What does it say? The forms of the legs are simply two columns. They look like the trunks of two great trees. What do they say? The right arm ends in a blunt, smooth, rounded circle. It is pulled back, coiled like a spring into a massive chest. What does it say? (p. 182)

Goldstein et al's interpretation of Jack Johnson is solely based upon formal characteristics and not related to contextual information about Johnson as a noted African American sports figure or Edmondson's comments about his intentions and working methods. Thus they lead readers to interpret Jack Johnson formally. Barrett (1990) includes external and internal context for interpreting artworks while Goldstein et al do not. External context refers to cultural environment and time period of the reader and internal context refers to the formal qualities of the artwork (Barrett, 1990). The authors do not provide such contextual information.

B. Authors' Questions for The Preacher

Interpretive

Question #1: "What kind of person does it show?"

Implications

In the second exemplar, The Preacher, The authors' makes a transition from discussing Edmondson's boxing hero, Jack Johnson, to the artist's life: "Perhaps some of Edmondson's inspiration came from his local minister. Look at his sculpture called The Preacher. What kind of person does it show (p. 182)?" Unlike the interpretation for Jack Johnson the authors direct the reader to consider contextual information about the artist. However, this is
very thin without more contextual information about the role of the minister in the African American community is also needed for a more complete interpretation.

Analytic
Question #1: "How has Edmondson showed solidity and steadfastness of this preacher?"

Implications
The authors now offer readers an interpretation based upon the formal qualities of the media, limestone. They guide the reader to relate the solidity and steadfastness of limestone to unshakable faith linked to religion. The hardness of the forms exemplify strength while the stability of limestone relates to steadfastness.

Interpretive
Question #3: In what ways are these characteristics heroic?"

Implications
Goldstein et al (1986) direct the reader to use their own understanding of religion for their interpretation of The Preacher's heroic qualities: "This preacher speaks up and says what's on his mind. No doubt he offers encouragement and inspiration to the people in his community. Perhaps people came to him to hear him tell them what they could do (p. 182)." Again, this is very limited since they do not introduce the reader to Edmondson's personal thoughts concerning his religion and his artwork (See prior Part One and Part Two for discussion on artist and his beliefs).
The authors present the reader with a series of problematic questions. However, due to the lack of contextual information, the readers may be unable to answer the questions in more than a limited manner. The media question was the strongest because the authors provided need contextual information about the media and explained how it contributed to Edmondson’s expressive qualities. The other questions lacked adequate contextual information and the author’s examples which related to the questions led readers to answer the questions in a very limited manner. The authors provided more interpretive questions on media for Edmondson’s artworks than the other chapter artists.
II. Terms: Specific keywords from the text

A. Evaluative Terms:

ARTISTS (positive)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Edmonson</th>
<th>Borglum</th>
<th>Verrocchio</th>
<th>Remington</th>
<th>Young</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. great faith</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. did not doubt</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ARTISTS (negative)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Edmonson</th>
<th>Borglum</th>
<th>Verrocchio</th>
<th>Remington</th>
<th>Young</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

B. ARTWORKS (positive)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Edmonson</th>
<th>Borglum</th>
<th>Verrocchio</th>
<th>Remington</th>
<th>Young</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. equally powerful</td>
<td>well-known</td>
<td>hero of state</td>
<td>popular hero</td>
<td>athlete hero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>firmly</td>
<td>amazing</td>
<td>particularly</td>
<td>strong</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>squarely</td>
<td>important</td>
<td>power</td>
<td>impressive</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>considerably</td>
<td>giantlike</td>
<td>toughness</td>
<td>powerful</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>very strong</td>
<td>giant</td>
<td>strong</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. encouragement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>steadfastness</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>powerful</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>aggressively</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>well-chosen</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>strong</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vitality</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ARTWORKS (negative)

Table 3.3 Terms: Specific keywords

Table 3.3 (To be cont)
Table 3.3 (cont.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Edmonson</th>
<th>Borglum</th>
<th>Verrocchio</th>
<th>Remington</th>
<th>Young</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. even though</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>self-taught</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. perhaps</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A. Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunders (1986) present the artist's homeplace and briefly mention the artist's faith however they do not provide much contextual information on Edmondson however they discuss him briefly:

William Edmondson, the sculptor, was from Nashville, Tennessee. He did not begin sculpting until he was in his fifties. Most of his work is in limestone. Edmondson was a man of faith and did not doubt, even though self-taught, that he was a sculptor. (p. 182)

The authors do not provide the religious faith of Edmondson and this omission creates an unclear context for Edmondson. When they discuss the artist, their language present uncertainties how religion influenced him and the expressive qualities of his artworks. The authors' discussion imply that they are not knowledgeable of the artist and his cultural background. This lack of information lessens the understanding the artist for the reader.

B. Goldstein et al reverse the treatment that they did for Pippin. The authors did not provide expressive terms to interpret Pippin's End of War Starting Home, 1918 as they did for Edmondson's two artworks, Jack Johnson and The Preacher. They also do not provide any descriptive words for Young's artwork while they refer to Edmondson and the expressive qualities of the other chapter artists' artworks. The authors' description and interpretation of Edmondson's artworks was stronger when discussing media. However, they provided the reader with contextual information that did not support the artwork and provide explanations on the artworks. They lead the reader to believe that there are uncertainties about the expressive qualities of the artworks played a role in the African American community of which the artist lived.

102
SUMMARY

Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunders (1986) employ questioning strategies which direct the reader to compare and interpret Edmondson's two sculptures. The interpretive questions are placed in discussions of media and formal characteristics which direct the reader's interpretation. There is a need for contextual information to lead readers to answer these interpretation questions with a broader context. The comparative questions for Young's sculpture and Edmondson's sculpture also lacks a discussion of their differences in stylistic approaches. Without this discussion some readers may misunderstand Edmondson's expression.
PART ONE

TARGET ARTIST: CHARLES WHITE & ARTWORK: THE PREACHER

A. CHAPTER ARTISTS AND ARTWORKS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Title of Artwork</th>
<th>Media</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Charles White</td>
<td>The Preacher</td>
<td>ink drawing</td>
<td>1952</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Thomas Eakins</td>
<td>Gross Clinic</td>
<td>India ink wash</td>
<td>1874</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3.4 White: Chapter artists and artworks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reproduction Size</th>
<th>Style</th>
<th>Subject matter</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) 3/5 p.</td>
<td>not given</td>
<td>preacher as hero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) 3/4 p.</td>
<td>not given</td>
<td>healer as hero</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3.5 Description of artworks

B. GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF THE TARGET ARTIST & ARTWORK

WHITE

Charles White was born in Chicago on April 2, 1918 and died on October 3, 1979 of respiratory failure. White was the second African American to be accepted at the National School of Design in 1972, after Henry Tanner in 1927 (Bearden & Henderson, 1993). Fine (1973) states that White won a nationwide sketching contest in high school and when he received his prize to attend art school, he was rejected because of his race. Nevertheless he was granted an art scholarship to the Art Institute of Chicago in Chicago, Illinois and held his first one man show in 1938 at the Art Institute of Chicago. He received a Rosenwald Scholarship which enabled him to travel to the South where he recorded impressions of the southern Black at work, play, and prayer. He later
traveled to Mexico to study with the Mexican revolutionary muralists such as Diego Rivero. Their style of muralist painting influenced White's painting (Fine, 1973).

THE PREACHER

The ink drawing depicts an African American man with his left hand finger pointing to the viewer while his open right hand faces outward. The man is dressed in a dress coat, shirt, and tie hidden by the raised left arm. The man, a minister has an opened mouth as if he is preaching a church sermon. White executed the black and white ink drawing in a realistic style that employs cross-hatching to capture the three-dimensional form of the preacher. The man's facial expression is charged with emotion and feeling. The style of the hard formed image resembles realism with a tinge of expressionism in the preacher's facial and bodily gestures.

C. AUTHOR'S DESCRIPTION OF THE TARGET ARTIST & ARTWORK.

Goldstein et al (1986) discuss Charles White in Unit 4 (Looking At Heroes In History Through Paintings) on pages 182-185. They direct the reader to compare and contrast White's painting, The Preacher, with Edmondson's sculpture of the same subject: "You have looked at one preacher carved in limestone. Now turn to the ink drawing of a preacher by the American artist, Charles White (p. 182)." White's drawing, The Preacher is compared and contrasted to Edmondson's sculpture, The Preacher in the following paragraph:

*The Preacher* by William Edmondson is, of course, a three-dimensional sculpture. It communicates mass and volume through the space that it occupies. You move around it, further responding to its form. *Preacher* by Charles White is a two-dimensional drawing, yet it has
a three-dimensional appearance. White has modeled the figure by building up the lines, using carefully placed white highlights, and dramatic foreshortening of the hands and forearms (p. 182).

The authors present White's drawing for its three dimensional qualities and compare its form with Edmondson's sculpture.

D. AUTHORS' CONTEXT FOR THE TARGET ARTIST & ARTWORK.

Goldstein et al introduce White's *The Preacher* to compare and contrast formal elements in his and Edmondson's *The Preacher*. Their discussion on formal elements dominate the thematic context of heroes and heroines for their discussion about White. They compare White's drawing to Edmondson's sculpture for describing, interpreting, and studying the formal elements (lines, highlights, foreshortening, three-dimensional vs. two-dimensional). They focus on the subject matter for its visual qualities by describing and interpreting such as in the following: "The hands are particularly important in Charles White's drawing. One is pointing and one is restraining (p. 184)." The authors imply about the emotional qualities in White's drawing even though it's not stated:

The hands are particularly important in Charles White's drawing. One is pointing and one is restraining. What do you think each hand means? One might be saying, "Wait a minute. I've heard that argument before. Don't interrupt me." this preacher has a healing message and he means to be heard (p. 184).

The authors direct the readers to perceive a minister preaching a convicting sermon on good and evil provided by the hand and body gestures of White's *The Preacher*.
PART TWO: ANALYSIS OF THE REPRESENTATION OF WHITE

How do the authors represent White and The Preacher from an art historical perspective? How does this perspective compare with other chapter artists and artworks?

Contextual Approach

Goldstein et al continue their dialogue on the same theme—heroes and heroines by comparing White's artwork, The Preacher, to Edmondson's sculpture, The Preacher. However the authors do not present contextual information for White and his artwork. They compare Edmondson and White's media and formal qualities.

Implications:

Goldstein et al lack a contextual discussion on White and his artwork. Bearden and Henderson (1993) and Fine (1973) identify White as a descendent of Creek Indians from his father's lineage and of African American from his mother. His father and mother migrated from the South to Chicago. White was committed to communicating the experience of Blacks in America. His images reflected sundry historic periods, Black social and cultural commentaries, and portraits of Black Americans (Bearden & Henderson, 1993; Fine, 1973). The authors avoid the topic of race and/or ethnicity. (See Tatum's prior comments on race) Race bears significance for White's artwork. The role of the preacher is a figure represented a symbol of racial and cultural pride in the African American community (Patton, 1989). Goldstein et al focus on the subject matter, the preacher, and what he might be communicating in a general sense, but not in a specific cultural context of African Americans. Goldstein et
al discuss White's and Edmondson's *The Preachers* with the same context. They fail to provide the cultural context for each exemplar and there is no discussion on the difference of Black religion during 1935 and 1950 in American history.

**Interpretive Approach:**

The authors present the preacher's gestures as role playing for an actual sermon in American society in the following paragraph: "One might be saying, "Wait a minute. I've heard that argument before. Don't interrupt me." This preacher has a healing message and he means to be heard (p. 184)."

The authors discuss Eakins' painting, Gross Clinic, quite similarly. They express the human drama involved in the scene. Furthermore they direct the reader to believe that the patient and lady crying are somehow connected. They refer to Eakins as an American artist and emphasize the emotional qualities provoked by both drawings. Goldstein et al refer to Eakins' drawing in the following paragraph:

> Note the many people present in the clinic. Some are students observing Dr. Gross; others are those assisting in the operation. Of particular interest is the woman sitting in the left foreground of the drawing, close to the operating table. She has drawn back from the operation, lifting her hands to cover her face (p. 184).

Wilmerding (1993) posits that Eakins painted one of the most famous paintings with the paint handling and compositional mastery of the Paris teachers, Bonnat and Gerome and the chiaroscuro drama used by the baroque artist, Rembrandt. Eakins' painting documented Dr. Gross's surgical operation thereby reinforcing the credibility of surgeons alongside the popularity of physicians in history (Wilmerding, p. 21, 1993).
Implications:
Both Eakins' and White's artworks are examples of American genre. They present two very different scenes, but both comment on various social environments. The authors' approach of referring to a preacher and a doctor as heroes are similar, but neither is placed with its historical context. Thus, the issue of the preacher and physician as heroes in society diluted and limited. Without appropriate contextual information about the role of the preacher in the African American community and the physician in the early 1800's, the authors' interpretations are reduced to subjective, personal responses that relate to the expressive qualities. There really is no strong argument for naming either of these two as heroes.

Formal Approach
(See AUTHOR'S DESCRIPTION OF THE TARGET ARTIST)

Implications:
The references to White's 3-dimensional drawing approach is left unconnected to interpretation. Barrett (1990) relates that professional critics integrate description and interpretation. Thus, the reference to White's formal qualities gives an incomplete understanding of their role in conveying meaning.

Stylistic Approach
Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunders do not provide stylistic information on White's The Preacher.
Implications

Goldstein et al omit a discussion on style while Patton's (1989) dialogue for interpreting, identifying iconography and style demonstrates the significance of such information. Patton states that White continued to depict black figures for the subject matter of his work and he rejected abstract expressionism and minimalism in the 1920's and conceptualism in the 1930's. White's subject matter resembled realism with his own certain approach to the style. The stylistic differences between White and Edmondson's depictions of the same subject, the preacher, could have been utilized by Goldstein et al to informed readers about 2 African American artists who employed different styles. This would provide evidence that not all African American artists can be placed in the same stylistic category. Often minority artists are stereotyped and denied individual identity.
PART THREE: RHETORICAL

How does the author's language impact the target artist and artworks?

Rhetorical Strategies

I. Questions

A. The authors employ the following types of questions which direct the readers toward understanding of the artworks from the following particular strategies:

1) Comparative questioning - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artworks in relation to another artwork(s).

2) Contextual questioning - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork in relation to a particular context as a historical context.

3) Analytic questioning - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork in relation to an analysis of its formal properties and media.

4) Interpretive questioning - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork symbolically or metaphorically.

5) Descriptive questioning - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork in relation to its identifiable properties.

The following table displays the rhetorical strategies used for White and each chapter artist. The table reads as follows:
### Table 4.1 Rhetorical Strategies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Rhetorical Strategies for Questions</th>
<th>Number of Questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) White</td>
<td>Comparative (1), Interpretive (1)</td>
<td>two</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 Eakins</td>
<td>Interpretive (1), Analytic (1)</td>
<td>two</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

B. Authors' Questions for The Preacher

Comparing

Question #1: "What do Edmondson's preacher and White's preacher have in common (p. 182)?"

Implications

Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunders (1986) present an exemplar of Edmondson's three-dimensional sculpture of Jack Johnson above White's two-dimensional ink drawing, The Preacher on page 183. The authors direct the reader to compare and contrast three-dimensional art to two-dimensional art. Firstly the subject matter (preachers) is created with different stances and expressions. White's preacher is seen from the above stomach area to the top of the head while Edmondson's sculpture is seen from head to foot. The authors present entirely different images for a comparison and contrast. They present problematic exemplars for the reader to fairly answer the question. The reader's interpretation is limited because of the exemplars varied physical identities. The authors neither define or discuss flat space nor do they present a dialogue on "sculpture in the round". Goldstein does not introduce mood, feeling and emotion in the introduction for Looking At Heroes In History Through Drawing however they interpreted emotion when they described the paid
soldier by Verrocchio in the prior segment, *Looking At Heroes in History Through Sculpture*. Great emotion is seen in the expressions of White's The Preacher while Edmondson's stature remains quiet and emotionless.

**Examples of similar questions for the other chapter artists:**

1) None

**Interpreting**

*Question #2: "What do you think each hand means?"

**Implications**

Goldstein et al (1986) direct the readers' interpretations for answering the prior question:

The hands are particularly important in Charles White's drawing. One is pointing and one is restraining. What do you think each hand means? One might be saying, "Wait a minute. I've heard that argument before. Don't interrupt me." This preacher has a healing message and he means to be heard (p. 184).

The authors answer the question before the reader is allowed time to critically think. The answers provided by the authors are valid ones however they guide the reader to believe that the authors' interpretations are "truths". They should additionally provide a discussion on White's motivation behind emotions and feelings exemplified in *The Preacher* while their comments should follow lastly or not at all. The authors discuss formal elements in White's drawing: "White has modeled the figure by building up the lines, using carefully placed white highlights, and dramatic foreshortening of the hands and forearms (pg. 182)."

The hands are the focus of The Preacher by White. The authors fail to discuss...
lines complexly depicted by White in contrast to Edmondson's Jack Johnson which actually has form instead of flat space with lines.

Examples of similar questions for the other chapter artists:
1) "Who might she be?"

Summary

Goldstein et al discuss and identify heroes and heroines in drawing by comparing and contrasting them in sculpture. The authors compare and contrast White's The Preacher with Edmondson's The Preacher. They discuss and define the difference between White's two-dimensional drawing and White's three-dimensional artwork. They also identify the characteristics of two and three-dimensional art. They indirectly define sculpture in the round for Edmondson's sculpture while they discuss how White's drawing has three-dimensional appearance. They focus on White's drawing technique (use of lines) for building up the surface of his paper for creating his 3-D effect. The authors overly interpret White's drawing. However, for Eakin's Gross Clinic the authors leave the interpretation up to the reader. They vaguely identify White's media as ink drawing. Nevertheless, they present India ink wash for Eakins's.
II. Terms: Specific keywords from the text

A. Positive Terms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Edmonson</th>
<th>White</th>
<th>Eakins</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Artwork    Artwork    Artwork
round       round       healer as hero
full        full        hero of medicine
solid       solid       famous
very powerful very powerful
"head-on"   "head-on"

particularly import.

Goldstein et al (1986) compare and contrast Edmondson's *Jack Johnson* to White's *The Preacher* by describing and interpreting them. The authors state that both exemplars are rendered in round, full, solid form with powerful physicalites. They also use "head-on" to interpret the visual appearance the reader sees while looking at both exemplars. Goldstein et al refer to Eakins' hero unlike White's. The subject matter (doctor operating on patient) of Eakins' painting, Gross Clinic, is called a healer and hero of medicine. The authors reinforce the credibility of the doctor by interpreting the subject matter with two hero titles while White's preacher is not stated as a preacher as hero. They also describe and interpret Gross Clinic as a copy of a famous painting created by Eakins'. The authors present an equitable discussion for White's *The Preacher* when they use famous to describe an earlier work by Eakins.

Table 4.2 (To be cont).

Table 4.2

115
2. Negative Adverbs and Adjectives

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Edmonson</th>
<th>White</th>
<th>Eakins</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Artwork Artwork Artwork

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

3. Positive Action verbs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Edmondson</th>
<th>White</th>
<th>Eakins</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>modeled</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>building</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Goldstein et al (1986) use “molded” as another word for created while “building” refers to overlapping of lines to give the illusion of three-dimensional space. The authors interpret White’s drawing procedures while they use verbs like is and are repetitively for discussing Eakins’s "Gross Clinic."

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artwork</th>
<th>Artwork</th>
<th>Artwork</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>responding</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>glow</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>shining</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>bathed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The authors present descriptive verbs (glow, shining, and bathed) to exemplify illumination, wisdom, and intelligence for Eakins’ subject matter, a doctor operating on a patient: “Notice how the face

Table 4.2 (To be cont.)
and hair of Dr. Gross appear to glow. Perhaps his forehead, shining in the center of the drawing, suggests wisdom or intelligence (p. 185)."  

Table 4.2 Terms: specific keywords

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Edmondson</th>
<th>White</th>
<th>Eakins</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Artwork</td>
<td>Artwork</td>
<td>Artwork</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Negative Action verbs

SUMMARY

Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk (1986) continue using Edmondson's Jack Johnson for comparing and contrasting Edmondson's three-dimensional exemplar of preacher as a hero to White's two-dimensional drawing of preacher as a hero. Furthermore they exclude Eakins drawing from this discussion on three-dimensional form and two-dimensional form. The authors also interpret Edmondson and White's artwork with similar adjectives such as: powerful, round, full, solid, et cetera. They present neither negative adverbs and adjectives nor negative verbs for discussing the artists and their artworks. The authors interpret Eakins' Gross Clinic with more descriptive verbs than for their interpretation of White's drawing (i.e. am, is are).
PART ONE

TARGET ARTIST: ROMARE BEARDEN & ARTWORK: SHE-BA

A. CHAPTER ARTISTS AND ARTWORKS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Title of Artwork</th>
<th>Media</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Romare Bearden</td>
<td>She-Ba</td>
<td>fabrics, papers, etc.</td>
<td>1970</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Pablo Picasso</td>
<td>Still Life with Fruit Bowl</td>
<td>not given</td>
<td>1908-1909</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Juan Miro</td>
<td>Breakfast</td>
<td>paper, crayon, etc.</td>
<td>about 1912</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Joseph Stella</td>
<td>Battle of Lights: Coney Island</td>
<td>not given</td>
<td>not given</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) Stuart Davis</td>
<td>House and Street</td>
<td>not given</td>
<td>not given</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6) Stuart Davis</td>
<td>To the Fine Arts</td>
<td>not given</td>
<td>1964</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7) Charles Demuth</td>
<td>My Egypt</td>
<td>not given</td>
<td>not given</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.3 Bearden: Chapter artist and artworks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reproduction Size</th>
<th>Style</th>
<th>Subject matter</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) 1/2 p.</td>
<td>Cubism</td>
<td>An Egyptian Queen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) 3/8 p.</td>
<td>Cubism</td>
<td>still life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) 3/4 p.</td>
<td>Cubism</td>
<td>still life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) 1/2 p.</td>
<td>Cubism</td>
<td>amusement park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) 3/8 p.</td>
<td>Cubism</td>
<td>urban street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6) 1/20 p.</td>
<td>Cubism</td>
<td>postage stamp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7) 3/8 p.</td>
<td>Cubism</td>
<td>silos</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.4 Description of artworks
B. GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF THE TARGET ARTIST & ARTWORK

BEARDEN

Schwartzman (1990) states that Romare Bearden was born in Mecklenburg County, Charlotte, North Carolina on September 2, 1911 into a financially stable African American family. His great grandparents were servants to Dr. Joseph Wilson, president Woodrow Wilson's father. He spent part of his youth living in Harlem, New York during the Harlem Renaissance in a household regularly visited by Langston Hughes, Fats Waller, and Duke Ellington. He studied at the Arts Students League with the German expressionist, George Grosz in the mid-1930's (Wheat, 1986). He had group art exhibits in his later years with Robert Motherwell, William Baziotes, and Carl Holty in the 1940's. He had a career in songwriting in the 1950's and by the early sixties he turned exclusively to making collages. Hughes (1991) posits that his collages were linked closely with his Black heritage (Hughes, 1991) and is imbued with his influence of music especially jazz, and tied to his childhood years in North Carolina. Bearden provided his studio for the purpose of black artists to discuss African American art and its direction on July fifth, nineteen-sixty three. The meetings led to the development of Spiral, a group of Black artists committed to the struggle of African American's civil liberties and common aesthetic problems in the arts (Bearden & Henderson, 1993). Bearden was awarded the National Medal of Art by President Reagan in 1987 (Schwartzman, 1990).

SHE-BA

The subject matter of the bright mixed media collage consists of two figures. The central figure is a large female figure centered in the artwork
resembles a Black Egyptian queen sitting on her throne. A rod rests in her left hand and she lifts her right hand up into the air. The queen wears a polka-dotted scarf around her neck made from fabric and a green, purple, red and black geometrically patterned full length dress. Red sandals strap her feet and a large multicolored hat rests on her head. Behind her stands a Black male figure carrying an umbrella as to protect the queen from the sun. Paper cut from a previous black and white image becomes the man's shirt and pants. The background consists of green, purple, orange, yellow, and red geometric shapes. She-Ba consumes half of page 313.

C. AUTHOR'S DESCRIPTION OF THE TARGET ARTIST & ARTWORK.

Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunders (1986) identify Bearden in Unit 6 (Feature- Cubism-The World of the Twentieth-Century Artist) below:

Another American who made his own adaptations of Cubism is Romare Bearden. Bearden uses techniques for collage that have become entirely his. Along with fabrics, papers, and painting, he uses photocopied images and photography. She-Ba, painted in 1970, is one of Bearden's more colorful works (p. 313).

The authors present Bearden's painting in color and equal in size to the other artists' reproductions. They describe and identify Bearden with fifteen sentences (15), more than the chapter artists. The authors refer to She-Ba as Bearden's tribute to the Queen of Sheba: "This picture is Bearden's tribute to the Queen of Sheba. It is a cut and paste tribute in the materials of today to a great heritage (p. 314)." They identify his collage as a cut and paste tribute to a great heritage. They relate that the artist used materials such as scraps, cloth, papers, pictures, textures, sprayed graffiti, etc. for his collages.
D. AUTHORS' CONTEXT FOR THE TARGET ARTIST & ARTWORK.

Goldstein et al explain how Bearden's artwork incorporates collage with cubism and focus on the materials used by Bearden for his collages. (See above comments on Bearden) The authors primarily direct the reader to study the materials used by the artist and secondarily they provide contextual information on the background of She-Ba. They write in bold letters:

"Compare the figure She-Ba by Bearden to figures of ancient Egyptians (p. 313)." The authors depart from the theme, heroes and heroines, and switch to Cubism (Cubism-The World Of The Twentieth-Century Artist) for their discussion on Bearden and the other chapter artists and their artworks. The authors introduce cubism as the theme for exploring Bearden and the other chapter artists. To develop this stylistic context, Goldstein et al describe these artists' works in the following manner:

1) Picasso's theme is a cubist still life that is a less complex Cubist painting (p. 308). They do not state if less complex than his or the other chapter artists in the following: "Look at Still Life with Fruit Bowl by Pablo Picasso. This is one of the less complex Cubist paintings, but it shows the surfaces quite well (p. 308)."

2) Gris uses a similar still-life theme and emphasize materials as wall paper, real sheet-music and newspapers, actual rope, and pieces of wood (p. 309).

3) Stella employs a more advanced cubist style, and his theme is futuristic-geometric abstracted shapes full of movement (p. 310).

4) Davis' work follows a more linear approach for creating his cubist cityscapes and later the artist used cut paper (p. 311).
5) Demuth combined realism with cubism and blended cubist lines on to the surface of realistic scenes. Goldstein et al emphasize how these lines dominated the Demuth's style of Cubism (p. 312).

The authors interpretation context is stylistic instead of heroic series which limits their discussion as far as interpretation. They emphasize Bearden's style and media and ignore subject matter.
PART TWO: ANALYSIS OF THE REPRESENTATION OF BEARDEN

How do the authors represent Bearden and She-Ba from an art historical perspective? How does this perspective compare with other chapter artists and artworks?

Contextual and Stylistic Approach

Goldstein et al do not provide a clear discussion for Bearden and the other chapter artists. The authors present the following discussion on Cubism in art history:

Throughout the history of art, different schools or movements in art have influenced artists. In the twentieth-century that movement was Cubism. In their paintings, the Cubists looked at their subjects from all angles and put all the planes and angles on the picture surface. Viewers saw everything at the same time. Later the Cubists discovered the geometrical designs and patterns of African masks and sculptures, and they included these ideas in their paintings. At first many Cubists paintings shocked the public, who for over six hundred years had learned to look at objects from a single point of view. The many facets of a Cubist work confused people (p. 306).

The authors state that cubists created with their style before they discovered the geometrical designs and patterns of African masks and sculptures, and then they incorporated designs of African art into their own” (p. 307).

Implications:

The authors present a problem for their discussion on the artists' many approaches to Cubism, but in a decontextualized manner and the concept is divorced from any other aspect of the artwork. They do not relate Bearden and Cubism to his African history. The authors connect Bearden to Cubism through grouping him as another American Cubist. (See Part One: section C) On page 313 the author asks the viewer to compare the figure She-Ba to ancient
Egyptians with this bold written statement: "**Compare the figure She-Ba by Bearden to figures of ancient Egyptians** (p. 313)." The authors do not provide ancient Egyptian art exemplars of Egyptian queens or kings for a comparison or contrast to Bearden's She-Ba, therefore they present inequitable comparisons. Chronologically the authors could have produced a more historical dialogue on Picasso's investigation with African art and Bearden's affinity to Picasso's cubist approach. Schwartzman (1990) discusses Bearden's constant reference to Picasso and his artwork. Bearden refers to how Picasso explored African artwork as a guide for his cubist creations (Schwartzman, 1990). Goldstein et al limited contextual information on Bearden's cultural and traditional background instrumental for his making collages and present an inconclusive discussion for the reader. On page 313 the author asks the viewer to compare the figure She-Ba to ancient Egyptians. They do not supply ancient Egyptian exemplar(s) for the comparison.

**Formal Approach**

Goldstein et al present still lifes for Picasso and Gris, architectural landscapes for Stella and Davis (also a geometric stamp design), and a figure by Bearden for studying Cubism in the following manner:

You know that a collage is made of scraps of cloth, papers, pictures, and textures. Can you figure out what materials Bearden used to make She-Ba? In the museum where She-Ba hangs, the card beside it reads: "Paper, cloth, synthetic polymer paint on composition board." Bearden treated some of the paper and cloth to give his own effects and textures. Note the striped trim at the bottom of the maid servant's skirt and the dotted scarf around She-Ba's neck. Bearden also used photographs and newspaper. The umbrella looks as if it were cut from a photograph of sprayed graffiti on plaster wall. The throne She-Ba is seated on is from a magazine advertisement for wood paneling. The large green and blue squares for the background and for She-Ba's dress are shapes of paper painted blue and green. A filigree of cut glossy paper was used for the crown, arms, and faces. Gold paper dangles trim her scarf (p. 314).
They relate to the forms in Picasso's *Still Life with Fruit Bowl*, the materials for Gris and Bearden, subject matter-amusement park landscape for Stella, and formal elements for Demuth.

**Implications:**

The authors emphasize media while form is discussed secondarily. They refer to *She-Ba* as one of Bearden's most colorful artworks, his surfaces being treated to provide texture, and his use of shapes for creating design aspects for *She-Ba*. Schwartzman (1990) states that artwork is filled with his memories of music, his childhood, his adult years, and diverse historical aspects of his immediate culture.

**Media Approach**

The authors interpret Bearden's with the other American artists whom made adaptations on Cubism. They describe and list materials (fabrics, papers, pictures, synthetic polymer paints, textures) used for his collages. They describe Bearden's technique for making collages in the following:

Bearden treated some of the paper and cloth to give his own effects and textures. Note the striped trim at the bottom of the maidservant's skirt and the dotted scarf around She-Ba's neck. Bearden also used photographs and newspaper (p. 314).

(See discussion for Formal Approach)

**Implications:**

The authors offer a broader discussion on media for Bearden's *She-Ba* than the other chapter artists. Because the authors do not present an adequate knowledge base about Bearden's selection of certain materials for his collages,
they provide the reader with a limited understanding of Bearden's artwork. There is disproportionate information on media for Bearden and the other chapter artists and the discussion lacks cultural contextual information. The authors discussed media for Bearden more than the other chapter artists, therefore they introduce the reader to inequitable discussions on media for all the artists.
PART THREE: RHETORICAL

How does the author's language impact the target artist and artworks?

Rhetorical Strategies

I. Questions

A. The authors employ the following questions which direct the readers toward particular understandings of the artworks.

1) **Comparative questioning** - a rhetorical strategy for understanding artworks in relation to another artwork(s).

2) **Contextual questioning** - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork in relation to a particular context as a historical context.

3) **Analytic questioning** - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork in relation to an analysis of its formal properties and media.

4) **Interpretative questioning** - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork symbolically or metaphorically.

5) **Descriptive questioning** - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork in relation to its identifiable properties.
Rhetorical strategies used for Bearden and each chapter artists:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Rhetorical Strategies for Questions</th>
<th>Number of Questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Bearden</td>
<td>Describing (1)</td>
<td>one</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Picasso</td>
<td>Analyzing (1), Describing (1)</td>
<td>two</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Gris</td>
<td>Analyzing (1), Describing (1)</td>
<td>two</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Stella</td>
<td>No questions given</td>
<td>zero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) Davis</td>
<td>Analyzing (1)</td>
<td>one</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. House &amp; St.</td>
<td>No questions given</td>
<td>zero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. To Fine Arts</td>
<td>No questions given</td>
<td>zero</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.5 Rhetorical Strategies

B. Authors' Questions for She-Ba

Interpreting

Question #1: "Can you figure out what materials Bearden used to make She-Ba?"

Implications

Media (usage of fabrics, papers, photocopies, photographs, and paintings) is the focus of the discussion about Bearden. The authors describe the materials used in Bearden's collage then they ask the reader to list the materials they see. The questions for the other artists are similar:

Picasso- "What kind of fruits are shown?" & 2) Gris- "What materials did Gris use in this collage called Breakfast?"
They indirectly guide the reader to analyzing the physical properties of the form and media in the following statements: "This picture is Bearden's tribute to the Queen of Sheba. It is a cut and paste tribute in the materials of today to a great heritage (p. 314)." (Emphasis added) The question that they ask reemphasizes their focus on media and avoids discussion on cultural context.
II. Terms: Specific keywords from the text

A. Evaluative Terms: Descriptive Adverbs and Adjectives

1. Positive Adverbs and Adjectives

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bearden</th>
<th>Picasso</th>
<th>Gris</th>
<th>Stella</th>
<th>Davis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>entirely his</td>
<td>early days</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>a.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>great</td>
<td>familiar</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>b. typically Davis's popular</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Demuth

own sense

carefully (drew silos)

another

Artwork

more colorful

flat

real (6 times)

less complex

frantic

brilliance

a. basic

Artwork

clean

Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunders (1986) use "entirely" to interpret Bearden's style of collage as uniquely his. The authors also discuss Bearden as one of the great Cubist painting in the twentieth century however they pinpoint Davis as the key Cubist American artist for his cubist style. Davis' collage became a stamp. They recognize Davis for his design: "With this design, the U.S. Post Office gave official recognition to American Cubism as a popular style of art (pg. 312)." The authors least describe and

Table 5.1 (To be cont.)
interact artists, Gris and Stella then Demuth, Bearden and Picasso.

Goldstein et al emphasize media, formal elements, and subject matter more than they modify verbs. They interpret Bearden's She-Ba as one of the artist's more colorful collages. Furthermore they describe and interpret the media and how Bearden and Gris used materials for the production of his artworks. The authors least interpret Bearden, Gris, Davis, and Demuth's artworks with.

2. Negative Terms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bearden</th>
<th>Picasso</th>
<th>Gris</th>
<th>Stella</th>
<th>Davis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

There are no negative terms for chapter artists or artworks.

SUMMARY

Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunders (1986) use the rhetorical device by presenting questions about each of the artworks. The authors present one question for Bearden's She-Ba. Additionally they direct the reader to compare and contrast She-Ba to Egyptian art with a statement instead of a question. Bearden shares the same count of questions as Davis and Demuth. Goldstein et al imply that the readers may find more meanings by presenting Picasso and Stella's artworks with one additional question than Bearden's collage. The authors describe and interpret Bearden, the chapter artists and their artworks with little contextual information. All the artists lacked sufficient historical and anthropological context and artist information. Goldstein et al were insufficient in discussing Bearden's ethnicity therefore constructing a false representation of his identity. They presented the following anthropological information for the chapter artists: 1) Bearden as an American artist, 2) Picasso's cultural identity was not mentioned, 3) Gris as a Spanish artist, 4) Stella not given, 5) Davis not specifically given, and 6) Demuth as an American artist. The authors interpretation of Bearden was more detrimental to him because he is less familiar than Picasso, Stella, and Davis. Goldstein et al present inconsistent approaches for discussing
Bearden and the chapter artists. They describe and interpret Bearden and Gris's media while they heavily interpret the subject matter of Stella's *Battle of Lights: Coney Island* in great detail.
High School Art Textbook

2) Basic History of Art by Janson H.W. and Janson A.F., 1992

Race and count of Representation

WHITE MALES 105
WHITE FEMALES 8
BLACK MALES 3
BLACK FEMALES 1

PART ONE:
TARGET ARTIST: HENRY TANNER & THE BANJO PLAYER

A. CHAPTER ARTISTS AND ARTWORKS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Title of Artwork</th>
<th>Media</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Henry Tanner</td>
<td>The Banjo Player</td>
<td>oil on canvas</td>
<td>1893</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) James Whistler</td>
<td>Arrange. in Black &amp; White...</td>
<td>oil on canvas</td>
<td>1871</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) James Whistler</td>
<td>Nocturne in Black &amp; Gold...</td>
<td>oil on canvas</td>
<td>1874</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Winslow Homer</td>
<td>Morning Bell</td>
<td>oil on canvas</td>
<td>1870</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) Thomas Eakins</td>
<td>William Rush Carving...</td>
<td>oil on canvas</td>
<td>1877</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reproduction Size</th>
<th>Style</th>
<th>Subject matter</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) 3/8 p.</td>
<td>Eakins &amp; French influence</td>
<td>boy playing banjo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) 1/6 p.</td>
<td>Manet &amp; Degas influence</td>
<td>Whistler's mother</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) 1/6 p.</td>
<td>Manet &amp; Degas influence</td>
<td>nonrepresentational</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) 1/2 p.</td>
<td>Pre-impressionist</td>
<td>farm landscape</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) 1/2 p.</td>
<td>Velasquez &amp; Courbet style</td>
<td>nude female figure</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

133
B. GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF THE TARGET ARTIST & ARTWORK

TANNER

Henry Ossawa Tanner, the son of an African Methodist minister, was born in 1859. Tanner was named after the abolitionist John Brown Osawatomie and he was fortified with a solid grounding on race issues from his father, Benjamin Tucker Tanner (p. 11). He produced paintings with religious themes and expressions. While attending the Pennsylvania Academy of the Fine Arts in Philadelphia, Tanner encountered Thomas Eakins. Later because of racial prejudice and constraints he moved to Paris, France. He studied at the Académie Julien with Benjamin Constant. Tanner lacked interest in the Negro Renaissance. He believed that his work should be considered without regard to his racial identity. Nevertheless he became a role model for many young black artists (McElroy, p. 122, 1989). Tanner's genre and biblical paintings embodied the best qualities of French academic painting and impressionist-influenced color (McElroy, 1989). Mosby (1991) cites an art critic that introduces Tanner as the first black artist to acquire international reputation during the nineteenth-century.

THE BANJO LESSON

Mosby and Sewell (1991) recognize this painting as Tanner's most famous work. They describe the subject matter of The Banjo Player as a gray haired man who sits in a sparsely furnished interior on a straight back chair with a young boy standing between his legs. The young boy's right hand strums the instrument. Against the background wall, a plank table is partially covered with a white clothe and a white pitcher and plates rest on the surface of the cloth.
Two small pictures are attached to the wall. To the left of the man and child, a coat is draped over the back of another chair. Another piece of clothing hangs on a side wall. At the lower right of the painting, a part of a stone hearth is set into the bare plank floor. Resting on the floor around the man and the boy, a collection of objects—an iron skillet, a stoneware crock, and a tin coffeepot on the hearth at the right, and a hat and pipe on the floor on the left (Mosby & Sewell, 1991). Tanner's painting has more earth tones than bright color such as brown, green, and tan with the exception of blinding yellows caused by the intense light from a window and lamp.

C. AUTHORS' DESCRIPTION OF THE TARGET ARTIST & ARTWORK

Janson and Janson (1992) discuss Henry Tanner in Part Four: The Modern World (Realism And Impressionism) on pages 388 and 390. The authors refer to the artist in the following:

Henry O. Tanner (1859-1937), the first important black painter, studied with Eakins in the early 1880's. Tanner's masterpiece, The Banjo Lesson (fig. 383), painted after he moved permanently to Paris, avoids the mawkishness of similar subjects by other American painters. The scene is rendered with the same direct realism as Eakins' William Rush Carving His Allegorical Figure of the Schuylkill River (p. 390).

The authors discuss Tanner with 6 sentences which is comparable to the amount of text denoted to Homer and Eakins.

D. AUTHORS' CONTEXT FOR THE TARGET ARTIST & ARTWORK

Janson and Janson (1992) introduce Realism And Impressionism as a subcategory in Part Four: The Modern World. The authors categorize the
artworks according to countries in which work was produced: i.e. England, France, et cetera). Under the category of the United States, the authors list Henry Tanner, James Whistler, Winslow Homer, and Thomas Eakins. Janson and Janson (1992) state how African American men as well as women weren’t allow to enter art schools in America. They describe how Eakins accepted African American under his instruction and the authors identify Tanner as one of Eakins’s students in the following:

Thanks in large part to Eakins' enlightened attitude, Philadelphia became the leading center of minority artists in the United States. Eakins encouraged women and blacks to study art seriously at a time when professional careers were closed to them. African Americans had no chance to enter the arts before Emancipation, and after the Civil War the situation improved only gradually (pp. 389-390).
PART TWO: ANALYSIS OF THE REPRESENTATION OF TANNER

How does the author represent Tanner and The Banjo Player from an historical perspective? How does this perspective compare with the other chapter artists and artworks?

Contextual Approach:

The authors briefly discuss the sociopolitics before the Emancipation Act and The Civil War in three sentences. Historical references are referred to African Americans being prohibited from attending mainstream art schools in America. Eakins is also given full credit for the implementation of art education for minority artists in the United States. Janson and Janson expound on this issue: “Eakins encouraged women and blacks to study art seriously at a time when professional careers were closed to them” (p. 388).

Implications:

Janson and Janson (1992) diminished the historical importance of Tanner and his paintings. They limit Tanner to a historical discussion on African American artist:

Thanks in large part to Eakins' enlightened attitude, Philadelphia became the leading center of minority artists in the United States. Eakins encouraged women and blacks to study art seriously at a time when professional careers were closed to them. African American had no chance to enter the arts before Emancipation, and after the Civil War the situation improved only gradually (p. 388).

Janson and Janson (1992) place Whistler, Homer, and Eakins in a larger more sophisticated artistic context than Tanner. They identify the training of the other chapter artists with current European trends:
Whistler—"A witty, sharp-tongued advocate of art for art's sake, he thought of his pictures as analogous pieces of music and called them "symphonies" or "nocturnes" (p. 387)." The authors discuss Homer with the following statements:

Whistler's gifted contemporary in America Winslow Homer (1836-1910) also went to Paris as a young man, but left too soon to receive the full impact of Impressionism. He was a pictorial reporter throughout the Civil War and continued as a magazine illustrator until 1875, but he was also a remarkable painter (p. 388).

They refer to Eakins and his training and his influence on Tanner: "Thomas Eakins (1844-1916) arrived in Paris from Philadelphia about the time Homer painted The Morning Bell; he went home four years later, after receiving a conventional academic training, with decisive impressions of Courbet and Velàquez (p. 388)." Tanner's approach to painting is referred to Eakins. They compare Tanner to Eakins as an approach to validate his artwork. However according to Mc Elroy Tanner's work shows more influence of French Impressionist color and academic painting. There is no specific discussion of how Eakins may have influenced Tanner with French academic standards, but Tanner was also directly exposed to the French Impressionists which did not derive from Eakins.

Janson and Janson's text doesn't address racism, prejudice, and ethnicity with any depth. They hint at prejudice during this time period. Janson and Janson (1992) label Tanner as the "first important black painter." Nevertheless they do not give a rationale or background to this judgment. The authors do suggest that the ethnicity of Tanner is a cogent issue for discussing his art.

Bearden and Henderson (1993) refer to Tanner as the first American artist of African descent to attain world-wide acclaim for winning an honorable mention in Paris at the Salon of 1896. The leading French artist, Jean-Le'on
Ge’rome pointed him out. They explain that The Banjo Lesson was excluded from the 1895 Cotton States and International Exposition room in Atlanta. Tanner’s painting was exhibited in a special place called the "Negro Building" which was entirely African Americans. Eakins, Cassatt, and Homer’s paintings became the exhibitions major attraction (Bearden & Henderson, 1993).

**Stylistic Approach**

Janson and Janson (1992) note Eakins’s influence on Tanner’s style of painting. The authors cite Eakins as Tanner’s mentor. They state that Tanner’s painting has the same direct realism as Eakin’s painting. The authors mention that Tanner’s painting avoids the mawkishness of similar subjects by other American artists. Gardner (1991) discusses Tanner as an American artist who had ideas for painting subject matter that was similar to Ilya Repin. Both artists emphasized painting the lives of ordinary people (Gardner, 1991).

Mosby and Sewell (1991) explain how Tanner’s genre painting, The Banjo Lesson, departed from academic figure compositions during the late eighteen-hundreds. Tanner cut off a portion of the ceiling and placed the man and boy as the focus of the painting. Tanner painted a more defined space. He illustrated a more relaxed narrative more typical of conventional genre painting (Mosby & Sewell, 1991).

**Implications:**

Janson and Janson (1992) attempt to place Tanner with a stylistic approach that is distinguishable compared to the American painters of his time period but they do not directly state what made Tanner's style of painting distinct. Gardner (1991) explains how Tanner infused ideas from Eakins, Millet
and Rembrandt for his painting style and refers to Tanner as a realist painter. She states that Tanner combined Eakins' careful study of nature, Rembrandt's reverence to light and mood, and Millet's incorporative sensitivity to light similar to photography (Gardener, 1991).

Bearden and Henderson (1993) mentioned that Tanner was first under a mentor by the name of Issac L. Williams, a well known portraitist. Later Tanner received drawing and painting classes under Eakins at the Pennsylvania Academy of Fine Arts. Eakins style was influenced by objectivity. He used nude models, introduced dissection and medical studies of anatomy, and used photography to demonstrate muscles in action. This naturalist approach influenced Tanner's paintings.

Janson and Janson (1992) categorize Tanner with similarities to Eakins' style while they separate Tanner's painting style from other American painters. They do not provide the reader with text that tells why Tanner's painting was like Eakins and different than the other painters. This lack of contextual information for style situates Tanner creates a vague discussion. Bearden and Henderson (1993); Gardner (1991) discuss thenaturalist qualities in Tanner's painting while Janson and Janson (1992) hint at originality for subject matter. Janson and Janson (1992) do not discuss Millet, Rembrandt, or Issac William's influence on Tanner's style. Janson and Janson's (1992) approach lessens the importance of the French artist and their stylistic influence on Tanner.

**Formalist Approach**

Janson and Janson (1992) do not discuss the formal qualities of Tanner's painting.
Implications

Bearden and Henderson (1993) explain that Tanner learned greatly from Eakins use of modeling figures in wax in preparation for painting, using photography in preliminary studies, making small oil sketches in full color as a means of organizing masses of color, and emphasizing the solidity of all forms (Bearden and Henderson, 1992). Gardener (1991) also emphasizes how Tanner's subject matters for his paintings seem to dissolve in stroke of color and light resembling Impressionism. Fine (1973) quotes Art News (1968) comments on Tanner's and his use of color. She refers to how iridescent and luminous color and brushstrokes dominate his canvas.

Janson and Janson (1992) lessen the significance of color and how it affected the paintings of Tanner. Color and its effects for portraying form for *The Banjo Lesson* is pertinent for understanding how Tanner manipulated the element of design for light, shadow, and form. Janson and Janson (1992) refer to Whistler's flat areas for his compositions and they quote Whistler: "It is an arrangement of lines, form, and color, first, and I make use of any indent of it which shall bring about a symmetrical result (p. 387)". The authors emphasize formal harmony for Whistler's painting and balance for their discussion on Homer however a they do not provide a discussion on formal elements for Tanner or Eakins. Tanner and Eakins' paintings are lessen because Janson and Janson (1992) do not mention the importance of color and light for Tanner and Eakins' dramatic lighting effect for depicting form. Because of the authors lack of text, the reader must decide how and why Tanner created his Impressionist-like *The Banjo Lesson*. 
PART THREE: RHETORICAL

How is author’s language impact the target artist and artworks?

Rhetorical Strategies

I. Statements

Rhetorical Strategies

I. Statements

A. The authors employ the following statements which direct the readers toward particular understandings of the artworks.

1) **Comparative statements** - a rhetorical strategy for understanding artworks in relation to another artwork(s).

2) **Contextual statements** - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork in relation to a particular context as a historical context.

3) **Analytic statements** - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork in relation to an analysis of its formal properties and media.

4) **Interpretative statements** - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork symbolically or metaphorically.

5) **Descriptive statements** - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork in relation to its identifiable properties.
Rhetorical strategies used for Tanner and each chapter artists:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Rhetorical Strategies for Questions</th>
<th>Number of Questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Tanner</td>
<td>Contextualizing (4), Comparing (2)</td>
<td>six</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Whistler</td>
<td>Context. (3), Comp. (3), Analytic (2), &amp; Inter. (5)</td>
<td>thirteen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Homer</td>
<td>Context. (4), Analytic (2), Inter. (1), &amp; Descr. (1)</td>
<td>eight</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Eakins</td>
<td>Context. (4), Comp. (1), Analytic (1), Inter. (1)</td>
<td>seven</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.4 Rhetorical Strategies

**Contextual**

Statements #1-4:

"Thanks in large part to Eakin's enlightened attitude, Philadelphia became the leading center of minority artists in the United States. Eakins encouraged women and blacks to study art seriously at a time when professional careers were closed to them. African Americans had no chance to enter the arts before Emancipation, and after the Civil War the situation improved only gradually. Henry O. Tanner (1859-1937), the first important black painter, studied with Eakins in the early 1880's (p. 390)"

**Implications**

Janson and Janson (1992) emphasize Eakins and his role with four brief sentences for supporting art education of African Americans during the nineteenth-century for their discussion on Tanner. They explain briefly the restrictions and inequalities of education for African Americans before the Emancipation and after the Civil War however they do make an attempt to introduce the reader to the exclusion of African Americans in America during Tanner's time period. Furthermore the authors do not present the reader with Tanner's realistic approach that borderlined social realism. Tanner depicts a
probing view of African Americans that often reflects the socioeconomic and sociopolitical conditions of his time period.

Comparing

Statement #5:

The Banjo Lesson (fig. 383), painted after he moved permanently to Paris, avoids the mawkishness of similar subjects by other American painters. The scene is rendered with the same direct realism as Eakins' William Rush Carving His Allegorical Figure of the Schuykill River (p. 390). (Emphasis added)

Implications

Janson and Janson (1992) compare Tanner's The Banjo Lesson to Eakins' artwork: "The scene is rendered with the same direct realism as Eakins' William Rush Carving His Allegorical Figure of the Schuykill River (p. 390)". Janson and Janson favorably compare and contrast Tanner with other American painters. The comparison of Tanner with Eakins' painting further connects Tanner with Eakins for the reader. The use of artistic comparisons is a repeated rhetorical strategy for Janson and Janson. For example they compare Whistler with Manet and Degas, Homer with Monet and Corot, and Eakins with Courbet and Velasquez. This strategy strongly directs the reader to understand artworks as a result of influences often simplifies our understanding. In Tanner's case, the influences have been oversimplified.

B. Tanner and The Banjo Lesson

Janson and Janson (1992) divide their statements for Tanner into two types: contextual and comparative. They direct the reader to understand Tanner to be an important artist in his times and positively compare him to Eakins but not the work itself. The four contextual statements are too brief and
do not give an accurate discussion for Tanner and his artwork. The authors merely mention Tanner and his artwork with pertinent contextual information therefore they reduce him to a token artist for their discussion on nineteen-century American painters.
II. Specific keywords from the text

A. Positive Terms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tanner</th>
<th>Whistler</th>
<th>Homer</th>
<th>Eakins</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>first important</td>
<td>earliest</td>
<td>gifted</td>
<td>conventional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>black</td>
<td>purely formal</td>
<td>contemporary</td>
<td>academic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>witty</td>
<td>remarkable</td>
<td>decisive</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Janson and Janson (1992) attempt to situate Tanner as a significant artist of African American dissent while they refer to Whistler's personality and approach to painting. Furthermore they discuss Homer and Eakins with more descriptive words while Tanner is without contextual information on him personally.

Janson and Janson (1992) place Tanner's artwork, The Banjo Lesson with some significance. The authors do this by linking him to Eakins while they interpret Whistler, Homer, and Eakins more descriptively.

Negative Terms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tanner</th>
<th>Whistler</th>
<th>Homer</th>
<th>Eakins</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>rarely</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The authors lack of interpretation of Tanner suggests to the reader that the artist is not important as his contemporaries but it presents him with some significance as an American painter. What also is problematic is the question of Tanner being significant because he is an American painter or African American painter on the periphery. The authors few terms for Tanner suggest that they did not have a knowledge base for Tanner and/or they chose to omit discussing him voluntarily.

Table 5.5 (To be cont.)
There are no negative terms for Whistler, Homer, Eakins, and Tanner because the authors chose to
discuss the artists more favorably however their discussion on Tanner's artwork is limited. This approach
indicates to the reader that the Janson and Janson favors Whistler, Homer, and Eakins, and Tanner's
painting despite their brief text for Tanner's *The Banjo Player*.

**Summary**

Janson and Janson (1992) have oversimplified their representation of Tanner. The authors do not
explain the historical significance of the artist's work-porytraying Black figures, his awards, and his honors
and Tanner's influences complexly. Futhermore they neither interpret *The Banjo Lesson* for its subject
matter as a genre figure nor discuss how and why Tanner represented the figures.

They provide a total of six sentences about Tanner. Only three of the six statements discuss and
identify Tanner and his artwork. The first three sentences present contextual information about are African
American art and artist during the late nineteenth-century. The authors compare Tanner to other American
painters and Eakins. Janson and Janson (1992) refer to the other artists somewhat differently. For
example they describe and identify Whistler's personality and compare his style of painting to Turner's, and
they interpret and describe Homer's painting. Whistler becomes more of an individual and Homer's artwork
is given significance. Tanner, however, is not prescribed as a personality nor is *The Banjo Lesson* given
interpretive significance.

The painting, *The Banjo Lesson* is centered on the top of page 390. The authors do not leave
empty space for the pages on the chapter artists. Janson and Janson provide an exemplar for Tanner, but
they fail to present adequate contextual information about the artist and artwork.

Mosby and Sewell (1991) posit that the lighting effect in *The Banjo Lesson* used by Tanner was
successful. Tanner used the daylight from the left window and the light from the fireplace on the right. The
two light sources allowed Tanner to depict the effect of warm and cool colors on the figure's skin. Tanner
had similar serious and intense observation as Eakins, but the rich color keyed to the values of the man and
boy's skin is characteristic of Tanner (Mosby & Sewell, 1991).

Tanner is given credit by Janson and Janson as the first African American artist to produce black
genre works. Although some white Americans artists depicted blacks in paintings during the early
nineteenth-century, Eakins and Thomas Howenden have portrayed them more seriously instead of
grotesquely and caricatured. Mosby and Sewell (1991) state that recent interpretations of Eakins and
Howenden's black subjects suggest that some of their work reflects racial stereotypes. Tanner was quoted
for saying that many artists represented only "comic" or "ludicrous" aspects of black culture. He also stated
that he wanted to demonstrate that he could make positive statements about his ethnic group on canvas
just as effectively as his father could from the pulpit (Mosby & Sewell, 1991 quote Stevens, 1984).
PART ONE

TARGET ARTIST: WILLIAM T. WILLIAMS & ARTWORK: BATMAN

A. CHAPTER ARTISTS AND ARTWORKS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Title of Artwork</th>
<th>Media</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) William T. Williams</td>
<td>Batman</td>
<td>acrylic on canvas</td>
<td>1979</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Ellsworth Kelly</td>
<td>Red Blue Green</td>
<td>oil on canvas</td>
<td>1963</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Frank Stella</td>
<td>Empress of India</td>
<td>Metallic powder in polymer emulsion</td>
<td>1965</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6.1 Williams: Chapter artists and artworks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Size</th>
<th>Style</th>
<th>Subject matter</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) 1/4 p.</td>
<td>lyrical expressionist</td>
<td>non-representational</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) 3/8 p.</td>
<td>nonobjective</td>
<td>non-representational</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) 1/3 p.</td>
<td>nonobjective</td>
<td>non-representational</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6.2 Descriptions of artworks

B. A GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF THE TARGET ARTIST & ARTWORK

WILLIAMS

Williams was born in Cross Creek, North Carolina-across the creek from Fort Bragg Army base. He learned of Japanese culture and art from the Japanese World War II prisoners quartered at Fort Bragg. He studied at the Brooklyn Museum and later at Pratt Institute where he taught art. In 1968 he received his Masters of Art from Yale University where his painting style was influenced by Albers while at Yale (Fine, 1973).
A product of the 1960's Black Art Movement. Williams and other Black artists took part in the civil rights movement by challenging the canons of Western society because they were excluded from major museums in America. Often African Americans turned to African history and culture for possible answers for their subject matter (Bearden & Henderson, 1993). He engaged in a symposium on black art with Jacob Lawrence, Romare Bearden, Sam Gilliam, Richard Hunt, Hale Woodruff, and many other black artists at the Metropolitan Museum of art in 1968. Key discussion was about Black art and the community, the exclusion of Black artist from mainstream white American artists (Bearden & Henderson, 1993).

BATMAN

The acrylic painting is non-representational without identifiable images. The 80" X 60 " painting is composed of warm and cool colors rendered in several layers. Surface layers of yellow and orange hues dominate while underneath layers of blue recede. A horizontal separation in the center of the painting divides yellows, oranges, and blues in the upper portion of the horizontal center from the deeper, paler oranges in the lower portion of the painting. The artist creates a crackle effect with his use of paint and the surface crackles and promotes an actual rough texture.

C. AUTHOR'S DESCRIPTION OF THE TARGET ARTIST & ARTWORK.

Janson and Janson (1992) refer to Williams as a member of a "lost" generation of artists. They describe his method of painting as jazz
improvisation. The authors posit that William's central concern was with formal
issues (color and shapes). They place him in the following historical context:

Williams belongs to the generation of African Americans born around 1940 who have brought black painting and sculpture to artistic maturity. In the 1920's, the Harlem renaissance had produced a cultural revival that unfortunately was short lived, its promise dashed by the economic catastrophe of the Depression. Following World War II, however, blacks began to attend art schools in growing numbers, at the very time that Abstract Expressionism marked the coming of age of American art (p. 446).

The authors describe *Batman* in the following: "He weaves his color and
brushwork within a clear two-part structure that permits endless variations on
the central theme" (p. 446).

D. AUTHORS' CONTEXT FOR THE TARGET ARTIST & ARTWORK.

In Part 4: Twentieth-Century Painting, *Late Abstract Expression*, Janson and Janson (1992) introduces William T. Williams along with Ellsworth Kelly and Frank Stella. The chronological time period ranges from the late 1950's to the early 1970's. The author's focus on those artists who departed from the earlier painting styles (i.e. Rothko; color field painting) to more individual styles of painting (i.e. Kelly; hard edge paintings). The authors define creative approaches by African Americans that refer to dominant art, mainstream art, political art and black aesthetics. They associate black art with the Harlem Renaissance and the art movement of the 1960's in America below:

The civil rights movement helped blacks began to attend art schools in growing numbers, at the very time that Abstract Expressionism marked the coming of age of American art. The civil rights movement helped blacks establish their artistic identities and find appropriate styles for expressing them. The turning point proved to be the assassinations of Malcolm X in 1965 and Martin Luther King, Jr., in 1968, which provoked an outpouring of African American art. Since then, black artist have pursued three major tendencies. Mainstream Abstractionists, particularly
those of the older generation, tend to be concerned primarily with a seeking a personal aesthetic, maintaining that there is no such thing as African American, or black, art, only good art. Consequently, they have been denounced by activist artist who, stirred by social consciousness as well as by political ideology, have adopted highly expressive representational styles as the means for communicating a distinctive black perspective directly to the people in their communities. Mediating between these two approaches is a very decorative form of art that frequently incorporates African, Caribbean, and sometimes Mexican motifs. No hard-and-fast principles separate individual styles. Abstraction has nevertheless proved the most fruitful path, for it has opened up avenues of expression that allow the black artist, however private his or her concerns may be, to achieve a universal, not only ethnic, appeal (pp.446-447).

The authors connect Williams to the prior discussion by his association with blacks born around 1940 whom happening to be practicing artists in America. They present the artist and his generation and they place them into mainstream art for their contribution to painting and sculpture.
PART TWO: ANALYSIS OF THE REPRESENTATION OF WILLIAMS

How do the authors represent Williams and Batman from an historical perspective? How does this perspective compare with the other chapter artists and artworks?

Contextual Approach:

The authors mention The Harlem Renaissance as being responsible for a cultural revival for Blacks in America. Other historical content of the authors' text includes: 1) The ending of the Harlem Renaissance due to World War II; 2) Blacks attending art schools in growing numbers; 3) The coming of Abstract Expressionism coinciding with Blacks attending schools, 4) The assassination of Malcolm X in 1965 and Martin Luther King in 1968 as the precursor of subject matter/themes of African American art. The authors provide additional text on African American art and artists along with their segment on William T. Williams.

Implications:

Of 18 statements, only 7 specifically refer to Williams. The other 11 statements focus on the history of African American artists from 1920 to 1960. Janson and Janson (1992) define Williams in a broad context on other African American art and artists. Williams is contextualized a discussion on black artists and sundry artistic identities and the authors do not characterize Williams with an individual identity nor do they discuss Williams's personal artistic philosophy. For instance, they do not explain how the artist used painting as a vehicle to express his anger and aggression toward sociopolitical and socioeconomic conditions of himself and other African-Americans in the United States. Williams' work reflected a different time period during the late sixties and
early seventies where blacks rebelled against unjust socioeconomic and sociopolitic conditions. Fine (1973) introduces a view that describes Williams and his intent for producing art during the turbulent sixties and evolving seventies in the following:

Williams is interested in art as a means to transcend aggression, which he defines as "a state where man's mind is so reactionary that he cannot make positive decisions. Reactionary art is controlled art. History has forced Black artists to be reactionary, to make the moral decisions." In his art, therefore, Williams is attempting to purge himself of aggression and thus of reactionary impulses (p. 246).

Fine's discusses Williams and other Black artists with more complexity and how African American artists challenged the art canons of Western culture. Black artist expressed their anger through their art in response to their racial oppression in America. Janson and Janson (1992) generalize Williams however they discuss black painters and sculptors with pertinent contextual information in the following: "Williams belongs to the generation of African Americans born around 1940 who brought black painting and sculpture to artistic maturity (p. 446)."

**Stylistic Approach:**

Janson and Janson (1992) associate Williams with the lyrical expressionists of the early 1970's. The authors refer to the Civil Rights Movement as helping blacks establish their artistic identities and find styles that were appropriate to their intentions. The authors present three tendencies pursued by Black artists after the civil rights movement: 1) Mainstream abstractionists who were concerned with personal aesthetics and decided that
“there is no such thing as African American or black art (Janson & Janson, 1992, p. 446), 2) Activist artists who denounced mainstream abstractionist. The authors define this group as stirred by social consciousness as well as by political ideology. They adopted expressive representational styles for communicating a distinctive black perspective, and 3) Decorative artists who derived art from African, Carribean, and Mexican motifs. The authors recognize that this style often combines 1 and 2.

Implications:

Fine (1973) observes that Williams avoids labeling (i.e. hard edge painting, lyrical Expressionist) and placing himself within a particular school or movement. Williams is solely interested in creating art (Fine, 1973). The authors, however, place Williams within mainstream abstraction: "The contribution of the lyrical Expressionists from the early 1970s has been seen in the work of William T. Williams (born 1942), a member of this "lost" generation (p. 446)." This strategy reflects the authors overall approach of explaining all artworks as part of larger artistic movements. The larger artistic movement is more important to the authors explanation than individual artist's artworks. The authors state the following for Black artists: "Abstraction has nevertheless proved the most fruitful path, for it has opened up avenues of expression that allows the Black artist, however private his or her concerns may be, to achieve a universal, not only an ethnic appeal" (pp. 446-447). Janson and Janson (1992) fail to define universal. The arts truly don't have a universal canon for all cultures. There is truly no universal aesthetic (Delacruz, 1995; Hart, 1991). More appropriate terms like dominant culture, popular art, and mainstream art should replace universal. The authors indirectly mention ethnic art as different.
They create oppositions while using the words ethnic and universal but they do not elaborate on the concepts.

Formalist Approach:

The authors state that color and abstract shapes dominate Williams painting style. They identify the surface of the artist's paintings as "encrusted" and discuss color and shape as causing pattern, light, and space interaction in the following:

He interweaves his color and brushwork within a clear two-part structure that permits endless variations on the central theme. Although Williams is concerned primarily with formal issues, the play of color and abstract shapes across the encrusted surface further evokes the patterns, light, and space of nature (p. 446).

Implications

Fine (1973) mentions that color was vital for Williams' paintings. She states that color evolved from visual traditions of both the United States and Africa. His earlier paintings of the late 1960's focus geometry of pure color and line (Fine, 1973 quotes Shapiro, 1985).

Janson and Janson (1992) state that Williams was interested in color and shape but they fail to explain how the significance of color and shape. Furthermore they fail to connect their discussion on formal issues with the contextual information about artistic identity and the Civil Rights Movement.

Interpretative

The authors follow their preceding statements for Formal Approach with the following interpretative statement: "But instead of depicting a landscape, the
painting seemingly captures albeit unconsciously, an evanescent memory of the artist's past (p. 446).

**Implications**

Janson and Janson (1992) do not provide contextual information on the artist's past, that is, they do not mention his experiences and encounters as an individual artist. Furthermore, the authors do not define how the title of his painting, Batman, connects to his past or artwork. The authors overlook their referral to Williams' painting as a landscape of memory because they do not provide text on how the artist's painting connects to his life.
PART THREE: RHETORICAL

How is author’s language impact the target artist and artworks?

Rhetorical Strategies

I. Statements

A. The authors use statements as a rhetorical strategy to direct readers toward understanding of the artworks and these statements represent particular rhetorical strategies such as the following:

1) **Comparative statements** - a rhetorical strategy for understanding artworks in relation to another artwork(s).

2) **Contextual statements** - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork in relation to a particular context as a historical context.

3) **Analytic statements** - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork in relation to formal properties of form and media.

4) **Interpretative statements** - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork symbolically or metaphorically rather than literally.

5) **Descriptive statements** - a rhetorical strategy to understanding an artwork in relation to its identifiable properties.
Rhetorical strategies used for Williams and each chapter artist:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Rhetorical Strategies for Questions</th>
<th>Number of Statements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Williams</td>
<td>Contextual (5), Analytic (2), Interpretive (1)</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Kelly</td>
<td>Contextual (2), Analytic (1)</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Stella</td>
<td>Analytic (4), Interpretive (2), Description (3)</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6.3 Rhetorical Strategies

B. **Authors' Statements for Batman**

**Contextual**

Statements #1-5: "The contribution of the lyrical Expressionists from the early 1970s has been largely overlooked. Their legacy can be seen in the work of William T. Williams (born 1942), a member of the "lost" generation. Williams belongs to the generation of African Americans born around 1940 who have brought black painting and sculpture to artistic maturity. His method can be compared to jazz improvisation, a debt that the artist himself has acknowledged. After a period of intense self-scrutiny, he developed the sophisticated technique seen in Batman (p. 446)."

**Implications**

They placed Williams into the late Expressionist style as an approach to introduce Williams as an African American artist and to provide a dialogue on African American artists. They expound on diverse African American artists from the 1920s to the late 20th-century but they do not present any specific names of Black artists. Janson and Janson's (1992) lack of information
oversimplify Williams and place him in the first category of nonpolitical artists but Fine (1973) views the artist as expressing social and cultural aggression. The authors discussion on Williams lessen his work and they present the reader with a narrow understanding for the artist and his artwork. They are intent upon emphasizing the stylistic context for all the chapter artists. However they do not strongly connect or link the styles to interpretation. This is defined as a formalist approach to critique (Barrett, 1990).

Formal Analysis

Statements #6-7: He interweaves his color and brushwork within a clear two-part structure that permits endless variations on the central theme. Although Williams is concerned primarily with formal issues, the play of color and abstract shapes across the encrusted surface further evokes the patterns, light, and space of nature (p. 446).

Implications

The authors do not clarify if theme refers to jazz improvisation or another context for the reader. It is difficult for the reader to comprehend the authors' formal analysis of Williams' painting. The reader must decide if the authors reference to the "two-part structure refers to Williams' painting technique or to the many layers of paint, and if the central theme renames jazz improvisation. Janson and Janson's (1992) vague dialogue for Williams' painting leaves readers with a confused notion about Williams' purpose. They mention a reference to nature, but this approach is not developed as a consistent theme in Williams' work. With Kelly and Stella, it is clear that the formal elements are
about themselves therefore the authors favor a discussion for Kelly and Stella and not Williams.

**Interpretative**
Statement #8: "But instead of depicting a landscape, the painting seemingly captures, albeit unconsciously, an evanescent memory of the artist's past (p. 446)."

**Implications**

Janson and Janson (1992) provide little to no written text on the artist's and/or his artwork, *Batman*. The authors guide the reader to critically think how Williams' *Batman* relates to the artist's past instead of seeing the painting as a landscape. The authors somewhat identify Williams' formal qualities prior to the above statement. They prompt the reader to understand that Williams involuntarily reveals his vanishing past life experiences with painting surfaces with crusts of color right up to the present time period. Janson and Janson (1992) present a problematic statement because the reader must decide how the authors interpret the artist's past and how title relates their concept.
II. Terms: Specific keywords from the text

A. ARTIST

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Williams</th>
<th>Kelly</th>
<th>Stella</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>lyrical Expression.</td>
<td>Many</td>
<td></td>
<td>brilliant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>largely (overlook.)</td>
<td>early (leader)</td>
<td></td>
<td>precocious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;lost&quot; (generation)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>intense (labor)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>self-scrutiny</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Janson and Janson (1992) refer to Williams' "intense labor" as an artist to vindicate the artist as a successful painter. The authors discuss Stella's painting, *Empress of India*, more specifically while they interpret Williams as part of a group of African American artists struggling for artistic identify. Stella is singled out among the three artists and presented as a more dominant figure than Williams and Kelly which is consistent with Stella's reputation.

The authors do not directly present negative terms, however they separate Williams along with other African-American artists from the mainstream and thus they are not considered similar. This approach causes separative thinking when the reader considers Stella to be more important because he is part of dominant culture while Williams is connected to black painting instead of American painting. This is emphasized by the authors favorable discussion toward Stella and his art. African-American readers see themselves as "other" because the identity of Williams has been lessen. Kelly is included as mainstream but he is not presented as importantly as Stella. The authors discuss Williams and Kelly with little individuality.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artwork</th>
<th>Artwork</th>
<th>Artwork</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>sophisticated</td>
<td>softness</td>
<td>traditional rectangular</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>clear two-part</td>
<td>flat</td>
<td>quite sure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>endless</td>
<td>formal</td>
<td>majestic</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6.4 Terms: specific keywords

Table 6.4 (To be cont.)
Table 6.4 (Cont.)

Artwork

sufficient

The authors discuss Stella's individual style of painting with more contextual information than Williams and Kelly. The authors comments on Williams oversimplify his painting, Batman, while their brief contextual information on Kelly reduce him to trite statements on formal elements.

Janson and Janson (1992) present a clearer description of Stella's Empress of India than they do for Williams and Kelly's artwork. The authors discuss Stella's departure from a "traditional rectangular format" for painting and they comment how his field of action did not resemble "windows" (squares and/or rectangles). The authors explain that Stella's geometric field of action became an integral part of his design while they refer to Kelly's artwork as flat areas of color with formal investigation of color and design.

Summary

The authors provide inequitable and lesser statements on Williams and the chapter artists through their rhetorical strategies. They present Kelly least favorably with three comparison and analytic sentences. They create hierarchy with their discussion on the artists by the following approaches: 1) They associate Kelly with Rothko and 2) They label Stella as a brilliant and precocious painter, and 3) They state that Williams brought black painting to maturity. They do not refer to other important African American artists. The authors indirectly exclude Jacob Lawrence, Lois Mailou Jones, and other African American artists from the broad categorization of "maturity". Bearden and Henderson (1993) refer to Lawrence as one of the most original art talents to develop in America. From the beginning of his career he has been sought by major museums and collectors. Also Lois Mailou Jones became the first African American to be given a solo exhibition at the Boston Museum of Fine Arts (Bearden & Henderson, 1993).
PART ONE
TARGET ARTIST: BARBARA CHASE-RIBOULD & ARTWORK: CONFESSIONS FOR MYSELF

A. CHAPTER ARTISTS AND ARTWORKS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Title of Artwork</th>
<th>Media</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Chase-Riboud</td>
<td>Confessions for Myself</td>
<td>bronze &amp; wool</td>
<td>1972</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Rauschenberg</td>
<td>Odalisk</td>
<td>mixed media</td>
<td>1955-58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Chamberlain</td>
<td>Essex</td>
<td>car parts &amp; metal</td>
<td>1960</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Nevelson</td>
<td>Black Cord</td>
<td>painted wood</td>
<td>1964</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6.5 Chase-Riboud: Chapter artists and artworks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Size</th>
<th>Style</th>
<th>Subject matter</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1)</td>
<td>1/4 p.</td>
<td>not given</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2)</td>
<td>1/2 p.</td>
<td>not given</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3)</td>
<td>1/8 p.</td>
<td>not given</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4)</td>
<td>1/2 p.</td>
<td>not given</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7.1 Description of artworks

B. GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF THE TARGET ARTIST & ARTWORK

CHASE-RIBOULD

Barbara Chase-Ribould was born into a middle-class Philadelphia family. She received art lessons at age seven. By the time she graduated from high school, the Museum of Modern Art in New York purchased some of her
woodcuts. She was the only African American student in her undergraduate class associated with Temple University and her graduate training at Yale School of Art. She became interested in life outside America while traveling in Europe and Africa. Starting in the 1960s she began to experiment with color and texture for her sculptures. Chase-Riboud produced sculptures from metal and fibers. Her sculptures were often based on masks she saw in Asia and Africa. Her artworks often reflected sociopolitical meanings and well as spiritual mysteries. She has written and published poetry, *From Memphis to Peking* and two novels: *Sally Hemings* and *Valide: A Novel of the Harem* (Heller, 1987).

**CONFESSIONS FOR MYSELF**

The 10' X 3' 4" X 1' sculpture hangs vertically and is made of black bronze and black wool. The bronze metal has been manipulated with sculpting tools giving it a organic appearance. The wool which is dyed black has a clustering effect like octopus tentacles. The fiberous ropes hang downward and rest on the floor below. The rope forms meander and flow like water as they puddle on the floor. This sculpture is similar to the artist's *Monument to Malcolm X*, both bronze and wool in media and visual appearance. They have a similar flow from the positioning of the rope and metal. Fine (1973) adds that the bronze is cast in bas relief.

C. AUTHORS' DESCRIPTON OF TARGET ARTIST & ARTWORK

In Part Four, The Modern World; Construction and Assemblages, Barbara Chase-Riboud and her sculpture, *Confessions for Myself*, become the focus of the authors' discussion in the following:

Barbara Chase-Riboud (born 1939), a prize winning author who now lives in Paris, belongs to a generation of remarkable black
women who made significant contributions to several of the arts at once. She is heir to a unique American tradition (p. 470).

Janson and Janson (1992) refer to Chase-Riboud's media often as being often bronze and braided fiber. The authors state that her work expresses a distinct sensibility and feminist outlook. They discuss Chase-Riboud's and her sculpture Chase-Riboud with 11 sentences.

D. AUTHORS' CONTEXT FOR THE TARGET ARTIST & ARTWORK

Janson and Janson (1992) discuss Chase-Riboud with two different contexts. One they refer to the artist/author as a diverse creative individual and two, they declare her gender and ethnicity:

Nevelson's success has encouraged other American women to become sculptors. Barbara Chase-Riboud (born 1939), a prize-winning author who now lives in Paris, belongs to a generation of remarkable black women who have made significant contributions to several of the arts at once. She is heir to a unique American tradition. It is a paradox that whereas black women never carve in traditional African cultures, in American they found their first artistic outlet in sculpture. They were attracted to it by the example set by Harriet Hosmer at a time when abolitionism and feminism were closely allied liberal causes. Chase-Riboud received a traditional training in her native Philadelphia, the first center of minority artists (see p. 388). In search of an artistic identity, she turned to African art for inspiration (p. 470).

The authors place Nevelson within the following context:

Before Nevelson, there had not been important women sculptors in twentieth-century America. Women had traditionally been excluded from this medium because of the manual labor involved. Thanks to the women's suffrage movement in the second half of the nineteenth century, Harriet Hosmer (1830-1908) and her "White Mamorean Flock" (as the novelist Henry James called her and her followers in Rome) had succeeded in legitimizing sculpture as a medium for women. This school of sculpture lapsed, however, when the sentimental, idealizing Neoclassical style fell out of favor after the Philadelphia Centennial of 1876 (p. 467).
PART TWO: ANALYSIS OF THE REPRESENTATION OF BARBARA CHASE-RIBOULD

How does the author represent Chase-Riboud and *Confessions for Myself* from an historic perspective? How does this perspective compare with the other chapter artists and artworks?

Contextual Approach:

Janson and Janson (1992) mention Barbara Chase-Riboud in the section, "Constructions and Assemblages". She is introduced as a remarkable black woman who has made significant contributions to several of the arts. The authors state sociocultural references to African and African-American cultures. They state that she found her inspiration in African art and base their interpretation of *Confessions for Myself*, as a demonic archetype of awesome power. Additionally the authors state that the sources of her exemplar can be found in cast bronzes from Benin and in the Senufi tribes. Further, the authors place Chase-Riboud in an artistic context with Louise Nevelson, a 20th-century female sculptor who produced assemblages and constructions.

Implications

"They" is not identified or clearly defined. Do Janson and Janson refer to the African American woman sculptor, Edmonia Lewis? She was one of the original "White Marmorean Flock". Chadwick (1990) cite Edmonia Lewis along with Hosmer as creators of Neoclassical Greek and late nineteenth-century realism sculptures. Chadwick and other art historians have included a dialogue on Edmonia Lewis and Harriet Hosmer as some of first important American women sculptors. The authors contradict themselves in their historic discussion on the exclusion of women sculptors in American art history below:
Before Nevelson, there had not been important women sculptors in the 20th-century America. Women had traditionally been excluded from this medium because of the manual labor involved. Thanks to the women's suffrage movement in the second half of the nineteenth century, Harriet Hosmer (1830-1908) and her "White Marmorean Flock" (as the novelist Henry James called her and her followers in Rome) had succeeded in legitimizing sculpture as a medium for women (p. 467).

Chadwick (1990); Fine (1978); Heller (1987); Lewis (1987); and Slatikin (1990) cite Edmonia Lewis as an important sculptor in art history. The authors discuss significant women American women sculptors of the late nineteenth-century who traveled and created artworks in Europe, the re-emergence of the Neoclassical sculpture in Europe and America, and the fall of Neoclassical style sculpture in art history after the Philadelphia Centennial of 1871. Lewis' sculpture reflected her Native American Indian and African American heritage. She was one of the first black women to depict the images in her sculpture. Her work sometimes exemplified the struggle and suffering women faced during the late nineteenth-century (Chadwick, 1990)).

Janson and Janson (1992) introduce Chase-Riboud in a socio-cultural but they confuse the reader with incomplete information. The authors do not expand on the race and gender for Chase-Riboud however they connect her to Benin and Senufo sculpture of Africa. Furthermore, they do not introduce contextual information for the African art and how the art links to her philosophy for making sculpture. Berger (1992) identifies this approach as "white indifference" and even hostility toward black culture. He explains that interpreting black culture relies on investigating the person's philosophy to see if inherent racism becomes part of their interpretation (p. 172).

The authors refer to Philadelphia, the first center of minority artists, for Chase-Riboud's art training. Minority is not defined clearly. The authors
language make it difficult to understand if minority refers just to African Americans and/or women. Janson and Janson (1992) explain that Chase-Riboud was in search of an artistic identity.

**Stylistic Approach**

Janson and Janson (1992) state that the cast bronze figures from Benin and Senufo tribes' carved wooden masks influenced the artist's sculpture. They also argue that her aesthetic approach was influenced by the prior cultures.

**Implications:**

Fine (1973) refers to Chase-Riboud as an artist/crafts person. Chase-Riboud learned from the weaver, Sheila Hicks, on how to braid, knot, and cord. These were methods used for the raffia and hemp appendages on African dance masks. She also refers to the Parisian and Oriental influence on the artist's sculpture. Chase-Riboud was inspired by the French cultures and Oriental art while living and traveling in Siam, Peking, and Mongolia (Fine, 1973).

**Interpretive Approach**

The authors refer to Chase-Riboud's sculpture as one with spiritual origin produced with conjuring. They present the idea that her works are longlasting in one's memory because of the monumental scale of Confessions for Myself.

**Implications**

Janson and Janson (1992) present a discussion that would better understood if they had stated contextual information about the spirituality and
meanings of the Benin and Senufo cultures of Africa. The authors use conjure and demonic to discuss Chase-Riboud's Confessions for Myself and these terms are understood by readers to be associated with magic, devil, and evil. Janson and Janson (1992) make a positive case for Chase-Riboud's work and they place her work in a negative perspective because of a lack of contextual information on African art and its meanings.

Formal approach

The authors suggest that Chase-Riboud use color and braided forms of rope. They refer to Chase-Riboud's highly individual aesthetic and mention that she combined black painted bronze and braided fiber to express a distinct ethnic sensibility.

Implications

They explain that she studied bronze figures from Benin and wooden carved masks from Senufo but they omit how the formal qualities of African art influenced her sculpture. They relate their interpretation to an ethnic quality that is unclear for the reader.
PART THREE: RHETORICAL

How is author's language impact the target artist and artworks?

Rhetorical Strategies

I. Statements

A. The authors use statements as a rhetorical strategy to direct readers toward understanding of the artworks and these statements represent particular rhetorical strategies such as the following:

1) Comparative statements - a rhetorical strategy for understanding artworks in relation to another artwork(s).

2) Contextual statements - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork in relation to a particular context as a historical context.

3) Analytic statements - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork in relation to formal properties of form and media.

4) Interpretative statements - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork symbolically or metaphorically rather than literally.

5) Descriptive statements - a rhetorical strategy to understanding an artwork in relation to its identifiable properties.
Rhetorical strategies used for Chase-Riboud and each chapter artist:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Rhetorical Strategies for Statements</th>
<th>Number of Statements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Chase-Riboud</td>
<td>Contextualizing (6), Analyzing (2), Interpreting (1)</td>
<td>ten</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Rauschenberg</td>
<td>Comparing, Context., Interpreting (3), Describing (2)</td>
<td>seven</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Chamberlain</td>
<td>Comparing, Analyzing, Interpreting (2)</td>
<td>four</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Nevelson</td>
<td>Context. (4), Analyzing, Interpreting (7)</td>
<td>twelve</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7.2 Rhetorical Strategies

B. Statements for Chase-Riboud

Contextual Approach

Statements # 1-4:

Nevelson's success has encouraged other American women to become sculptors. Barbara Chase-Riboud (born 1939), a prize-winning author who now lives in Paris, belongs to a generation of remarkable black women who have made significant contributions to several of the arts at once. She is heir to a unique American tradition. It is a paradox that whereas black women never carve in traditional African cultures, in American they found their first artistic outlet in sculpture. They were attracted to it by the example set by Harriet Hosmer at a time when abolitionism and feminism were closely allied liberal causes. Chase-Riboud received a traditional training in her native Philadelphia, the first center of minority artists (see p. 388). In search of an artistic identity, she turned to African art for inspiration (p. 470).

Implications:

Janson and Janson (1992) create three different contexts for understanding Chase-Riboud and her artwork: 1) race, 2) black women artists, and 3) Chase-Riboud and her African heritage. They favorably place the artist with the chapter artists however their comments lack pertinent information for the understanding of her and her artwork.
The authors explain how the artist's race connects her to a remarkable group of black women who happen to have contributed to several of the arts. This approach excludes Chase-Riboud from the category of women artists of all races who have contributed to several of the arts and places her in an opposition, black women artists/women artists. They indirectly lessen her from dominant culture art to "other" while they attempt to discuss her positively. They change their discussion from women artist to artistic identity and link her to African art.

The authors present her as an individual artist and state that she was trained as a traditional artist while she lived in her native town of Philadelphia. The authors do not explain her traditional background however they discuss her transition to with some significance.

**Examples of similar statements for the other chapter artists:**

1) Nevelson - "Before Nevelson, there had not been important women sculptors in twentieth-century America. Women have traditionally been excluded from this medium because of the manual labor involved.

**Implications**

The authors situate Nevelson favorably over other important women sculptors in America. They discuss the exclusion of women sculptors from dominant culture artists with ambiguous statements on manual labor. They direct the reader to believe that women sculptors could not perform because of the manual labor involved. The authors present negative oppositions, male sculptors as stronger/women sculptors as weaker.
Analytic Approach

Statement #5: "Its sources can be found in cast bronze figures from Benin and in the Senufo tribe's carved wooden masks, which are sometimes embellished with textiles (p. 470)."

Statement #6: "From them she developed her highly individual aesthetic, which utilizes a combination of bronze that has been painted black and braided fiber to express a distinctly ethnic sensibility and feminist outlook (p. 470)."

Implications:

Janson and Janson (1992) mention that Chase-Riboud's materials have an origin from West Africa alone. They also refer to design aspects of her sculpture, Confessions For Myself, as having a distinct ethnic sensibility and feminist outlook. The authors guide the readers to believe that Chase-Riboud and her sculpture stems from ethnic (African) and feminist perspectives. Ethnic art and feminism could have a more explicit discussion since these terms have diverse and complex meanings. Fine (1973) discusses Chase-Riboud and her artworks more complexly. (See PART TWO: ART REPRESENTATION OF BARBARA CHASE-RIBOUD for Implications under Stylistic Approach)

Interpretative Approach

Statement #7: "In Confessions For Myself (fig. 484) she has conjured up a demonic archetype of awesome power (p. 470)."

Implications:

Janson and Janson (1992) imply that the sources of Confessions For Myself present a spiritual kind of presence linked to West African art however
they fail to elaborate how the spirituality of the sculpture is similar to the bronze figures from Benin and the wooden masks of Senufo. They do not compare and contrast the interconnectiveness of the physical properties and media of Benin and Senufo artworks of West Africa to Chase-Riboud's sculpture. This lack of contextual information is critical for understanding Chase-Riboud's sculpture.

Examples of similar statements for the other chapter artists

1) Nevelson - "Each compartment is elegantly designed and is itself a metaphor of thought or experience. While the organization of the ensemble is governed by an inner logic, the entire statement remains an enigmatic monument to the artist's fertile imagination (p. 470)." (Emphasis added)

Implications

The authors have oversimplified Chase-Riboud and Nevelson nevertheless Nevelson's work seems to be less even more because the authors refer to her sculpture as enigmatic and imaginative. They provide a better discussion for Chase-Riboud's work and they seem to be more accurate when mentioning the Benin figures and Senufo masks.
II. Terms: Specific keywords from the text

A. Positive Terms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ch.-Riboud</th>
<th>Rauschen.</th>
<th>Chamberlain</th>
<th>Nevelson</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>prize-winning</td>
<td>early</td>
<td>carefully</td>
<td>almost always</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>remarkable</td>
<td>ironic (intent)</td>
<td>external</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>highly individual</td>
<td></td>
<td>private</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>significant</td>
<td></td>
<td>generally</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unique</td>
<td></td>
<td>fertile</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Janson and Janson (1992) refer to Chase-Riboud as "a prize-winning author", "a significant contributor to the arts" and "a remarkable black women artist". The authors explain that her sculpture is "unique" and "highly individual". The authors interpret Chase-Riboud and Nevelson with more complexity than the other chapter artists however they oversimplify her influence from African art.

Table 7.3 (To be cont.)

Table 7.3 Terms: specific keywords
B. Negative Terms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ch.-Riboud</th>
<th>Rauschen.</th>
<th>Chamberlain</th>
<th>Nevelson</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>black</td>
<td>___</td>
<td>___</td>
<td>___</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>never</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The authors speak more on a socio-cultural context for Chase-Riboud however they exclude her from the categorization of women artists. They oversimplify her significance because they link her to “other” instead of a dominant culture artist. The authors present incorrect information because of the following statements: 1) The authors state that black women never carved in traditional African cultures and 2) There were no important women sculptors before Nevelson. The reader must decide, when in fact these comments have been disputed by several art historians.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artwork</th>
<th>Artwork</th>
<th>Artwork</th>
<th>Artwork</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>demonic</td>
<td>___</td>
<td>___</td>
<td>___</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

They interpret Confessions For Myself as “demonic” without carefully examining the spirituality and interconnectiveness her sculpture with West African art. Demonic has several negative connotations and the reader will find it difficult to understand the statement.

Summary

Janson and Janson (1992) introduce Chase-Riboud with Rauschenberg, Chamberlain and Nevelson within the “Constructions and Assemblage” section of Part Four: Twentieth-Century Sculpture. The authors favorably discuss the artist with three different contexts such as: an artistic context where she is linked to Nevelson, Chase-Riboud’s diverse talent as a black female writer and visual artist, her investigation and research with Benin and Senufo art of West Africa. The artists casually explain how Nevelson influenced Chase-Riboud and other women artists to become sculptors however they do not state
in what ways Nevelson inspired Chase-Riboud. The authors broadly state that Chase-Riboud was one of the many women influenced by Nevelson to become sculptors nevertheless it was other non-Western cultures artworks.

They present a somewhat positive discussion on gender and race for Chase-Riboud because of her "significant contributions to several of the arts". Furthermore they refer to her as an accomplished "black women artist" with implications that as a black women she is a mainstream artist. The authors favorably refer to her academic training in art and search for an artistic identity.

Janson and Janson (1992) provide important sociocultural information that links Chase-Riboud's artistic approach to West Africa. The authors identify her artistic expression however they vaguely describe how Benin and Senufo sculpture inspired her. Chase-Riboud's is simplified but not to the point of obscurity.

The authors situate Chase-Riboud with a good discussion on sociocultural issues nevertheless they have simplified race and gender issues for her and Nevelson. They place Chase-Riboud in the mainstream art of western art and the authors discuss her with acceptable inclusion unlike traditional accounts of art history. The authors text is more revisionist because several art historians have chose to create oppositions which place women artist as secondary (Collins & Sandell, p. 27, 1984).
PART ONE: TARGET ARTIST: JAMES VAN DER ZEE & ARTWORK: THE WIFE OF THE REVEREND BECTON, PASTOR OF SALEM METHODIST CHURCH

A. CHAPTER ARTISTS AND ARTWORKS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Title of Artwork</th>
<th>Media</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) James Van Der Zee</td>
<td>The Wife of the Rev. Becton...</td>
<td>not given</td>
<td>1907</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Alfred Stieglitz</td>
<td>The Steerage</td>
<td>not given</td>
<td>1930</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Alfred Stieglitz</td>
<td>Equivalent</td>
<td>chloride print</td>
<td>1930</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Edward Wesson</td>
<td>Pepper</td>
<td>not given</td>
<td>1930</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) Ansel Adams</td>
<td>Moonrise, Hernandez, New Mex.</td>
<td>gelatin-silver print</td>
<td>1941</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6) Bourke-White</td>
<td>Fort Peck Dam, Montana</td>
<td>not given</td>
<td>1936</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7.4 Van Der Zee: Chapter artists and artworks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reproduction Size</th>
<th>Style</th>
<th>Subject matter</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) 1/4 p.</td>
<td>imitation of fashion photo.</td>
<td>portrait of preacher's wife</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) 1/6 p.</td>
<td>documentary photography</td>
<td>ocean voyage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) 1/6 p.</td>
<td>fine art photography</td>
<td>clouds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) 1/2 p.</td>
<td>fine art photography</td>
<td>a pepper</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) 1/2 p.</td>
<td>documentary &amp; fine art</td>
<td>desert city landscape</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6) 1/4 p.</td>
<td>photojournalism</td>
<td>a man-made dam</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7.5 Descriptions of artworks
B. GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF THE TARGET ARTIST & ARTWORK

VAN DER ZEE

James Van Der Zee was born in 1886 in Lenox, Massachusetts. He won a simple box camera when he was twelve year old and became interested in photography. He later became adept with other complex cameras. He arrived in Harlem, New York during 1906, played the violin, and subsequently formed the Harlem Orchestra. At the turn of the century, pictorial photography rapidly gained recognition and popularity in America. Due to the interruption of the invention of radios, phonographs, and jukeboxes, Van Der Zee's career as a musician slowly came to an end. His first big job as a darkroom technician began at Gertz Department Store in Newark, New Jersey. On occasions, he filled in as a photographer for his employer. After gaining technical experience, he later opened his own portrait studio in 1917 in Harlem. He experimented with the negatives by etching on the surfaces and enhancing the appearance of the people being photographed. The Metropolitan Museum of Art presented an exhibit, Harlem on My Mind, and Van Der Zee had the largest and most important photographs for this exhibit (Willis-Ryan, 1987). James Van Der Zee's work can be categorized into six major areas or themes: 1) celebrities and personalities, 2) family groups, 3) weddings ceremonies, 4) street scenes and interiors, 5) large organizations, and 6) his record of Marcus Garvey and the United Negro Improvement Association (Willis-Ryan, 1987).
THE WIFE OF REVEREND BECTON, PASTOR OF SALEM METHODIST CHURCH

The subject matter consists of an African American woman well dressed in a dress, hat, and gloves resting in her left hand. She sits on a piano stool. Her right hand rests on key portion of the piano. On the floor lies an oriental rug. A tall Victorian period lamp stands behind the women. The room has tall Victorian ceilings with artwork hanging on both left and right walls. A tall basket of flowers stands on the upper portion of the piano and two others sit on the left and right of the piano. In foreground sits a silver tea service on a table in the right corner of the photograph. The photograph is in black and white. Lewis (1987) lists silver print and hand gravure print as Van Der Zee's most used kinds of photography during the early nineteen-thirties. The technique of this photograph is not given.

C. AUTHORS' DESCRIPTION OF TARGET ARTIST & ARTWORK

In Part Four, The Modern World, Janson and Janson (1992) present a segment on Twentieth-Century Photography. They introduce James Van Der Zee under the section, United States. Alfred Steiglitz, Edward Weston, Ansel Adams, Margaret Bourke-White precede him in this category. The authors discuss the Harlem Renaissance and describe Van Der Zee and the artwork in the following manner:

The nature of the Harlem Renaissance, which flourished in the 1920's (see p. 446), was hotly debated by black critics even in its own day. While its achievement in literature is beyond dispute, the photography of James Van Der Zee (1886-1983) is often regarded to day as its chief contribution to the visual arts. Much of his work is commercial and variable in quality, yet it remains of great documentary value and, at its best, provides a compelling portrait of an era. Van Der Zee had an acute understanding of settings as reflections of people's sense of place in the
world, which he used to bring out a sitter's character and dreams. Though posed in obvious imitation of fashionable photographs of white society, his picture of the wife of the Reverend George Wilson Becton (fig. 509), taken two years after the popular pastor of the Salem Methodist Church in Harlem was murdered, shows Van Der Zee's unique ability to capture the pride of African Americans during a period when their dreams seemed on the verge of being realized (p. 490).

D. AUTHORS' CONTEXT FOR THE TARGET ARTIST & ARTWORK

Janson and Janson (1992) discuss the Harlem Renaissance in American Art history as a point of departure for introducing Van Der Zee and his photography. The authors place the artist and artwork in the prior historical time period. They emphasize his style and subject matter. Janson and Janson (1992) also present an analysis on the photograph, The Wife of the Reverend Becton, Pastor of Salem Methodist Church. (See AUTHORS' DESCRIPTION OF TARGET ARTIST AND ARTWORK).
PART TWO: ANALYSIS OF THE REPRESENTATION OF VAN DER ZEE

How does the authors represent Van Der Zee and The Wife of the Reverend Becton... from an art historical perspective? How does this perspective compare with other chapter artists and artworks?

Contextual Approach

Janson and Janson (1992) introduce James Van Der Zee as an African American photographer. The authors direct the reader to refer to page 446, which contains literature on William T. Williams and black art in America. The Harlem Renaissance is described as a flourishing historical period debated by Black critics (p. 490). The authors refer to Van Der Zee and his style of photography below:

Through posed in obvious imitation of fashionable photographs of white society, his picture of the wife of Reverend George Wilson Becton (fig 509.), taken two years after the popular pastor of the New Salem Methodist Church in Harlem was murdered, shows Van Der Zee's unique ability to capture the pride of African Americans during a period when their dreams seemed on the verge of being realized" (p. 490).

The authors discuss the chapter artists by linking their photographic styles and/or media with a more meaningful historical context. They identify and discuss the chapter artists in the following approach:

1) The authors cite Steiglitz' style, straight photography, as the basis of the American School and explain that Steiglitz was against the urban realism of the Ash Can School. Steiglitz' s photography is interpreted as being a means of recording things (pp. 485-488).
2) They discuss the significance of Weston’s approach of photography for opening the way for "pure" photography (fusing abstraction and realism) (p. 488).

3) They pinpoint Adams for his picturesque style of photographing of a culture in Hernandez, New Mexico and title him as the foremost nature photographer in America (p. 488).

4) The authors identify Bourke-White’s photojournalist approach as important for photographing America’s industrial expansion during the Great Depression (pp. 489-490).

Implications:

The authors refer the Harlem Renaissance with a one-sided perspective: "While its achievement in literature is beyond dispute, the photography of James Van Der Zee (1886-1983) is often regarded today as its chief contribution to the visual arts. The authors present an incomplete commentary because they state their rationale for selecting Van Der Zee instead of Douglass, Fuller, or any other artist. The authors do not refer to the expatriate, Henry Tanner, and other African Americans who chose not to take part in the art movement during the Harlem Renaissance. Some African Americans such as Tanner studied art in Europe (Bearden & Henderson, 1993; Campbell, 1989; Mosby, 1991). Janson and Janson describe Van Der Zee’s style as an “imitation of white fashion photography.” The authors create an aesthetic issue between fine art and commercial art. They explain that Van Der Zee’s photography was more commercial while Steiglitz’s was closer to fine art. When Seiglitz began photography, it was a stage when photography was struggling to be recognized as fine art and not just commercial art. Barrett (1990) explains that photography and art are defined out of many aesthetic
theories and theories can also be partial, incomplete, and fragmented (Barrett, 1990).

**Formal Approach**

The authors remark about the formal elements of design:

1) Steiglitz' painting, *The Steerage*, becomes the focus of the author's discussion on his usage of elements and principles of design (shape and composition) (p. 489).

2) The authors refer to subject matter in Weston's photograph, *Pepper*. They emphasized composition. The authors interpret *Pepper* as having shapes intentionally suggestive of photographs of the female nude. Janson and Janson (1992) refer *Pepper* to O'Keefe's *Black Iris III*: "Pepper has the sensuousness of O'Keefe's *Black Iris III* (see fig. 443), which lends the Equivalent a new meaning" (p. 488).

3) Color dominates the literature on Adams: "As in all of Adams' pictures, there is a full range of tonal nuances, from clear whites to inky blacks (p. 488).

4) The authors discuss form and composition for Bourke-White's exemplar, *Fort Peck Dam*. They compare and contrast the form and compositions of the exemplar to forms and compositions of ancient Egyptian constructions-pharaoh's temples. The authors emphasize the quality of Van Der Zee's photography while they provide a discussion for the formal qualities of the chapter artists' photography.

**Implications**

Janson and Janson (1992) do not discuss the formal qualities of Van Der Zee's photography. Willis-Ryan (1987) expounds that Van Der Zee photographed nudes with careful attention to light and shade, natural forms and
textures. The photographer drew superimposed lines to enhance the surface of his photographs such as lines to represent a trail of cigarette smoke coming from a cigarette, musical notes and staff coming forth from the opening of brass and wind musical instruments, and dark marks to resemble moles for cheek features. Van Der Zee was innovative and maybe the authors decision to categorize Van Der Zee more as a commercial photographer.

Stylistic Approach

Janson and Janson (1992) discuss Van Der Zee’s photograph above (See AUTHORS DESCRIPTION FOR TARGET ARTIST AND ARTWORK). The authors refer to style for the other chapter artists. The following chapter artists are interpreted as follows:

1) Steiglitz’ photograph, The Steerage.
"This kind of "straight" photography is deceptive in its simplicity, for the image mirrors the feelings that stirred Stieglitz."
"Steiglitz' straight photography formed the basis of the American school (p. 486)."

2) Weston’s photograph, Pepper.
"Steiglitz' concept of the Equivalent opened the way to "pure" photography as an alternative to straight photography. The leader of this new approach was Edward Weston (1886-1958), who, although not Steiglitz' prote'ge, was decisively influenced by him (p. 488)."

3) Adams’ photograph, Moonrise, Hernandez, New Mexico.
"His justifiably famous work *Moonrise, Hernandez, New Mexico* (fig. 507) came from pure serendipity which could never be repeated, a perfect marriage of straight and Equivalent photography (p. 488)."

4) Bourke-White's photograph, *Fort Peck Dam, Montana*.

"Her cover photograph of Fort Peck Dam in Montana for the inaugural November 23, 1936, issue of Life remains a classic example of the new photojournalism (fig. 508) (p. 490)."

The authors state that Van Der Zee's photography reflected an "imitation of white fashion photography" while refer to the chapter artist's technique. They mention that the artist captured the thoughts and dreams of African Americans through photography.

**Implications**

The authors do not refer to any particular style for Van Der Zee's photography. The authors provide paradoxical statements in their original discussion by presenting contradictions in their later literature: "Much of his work is commercial and variable in quality. Yet it remains of great documentary value and, at its best, provide a compelling portrait of the era" (p. 490).

Barrett (1990) states that identifying a photographer's style relates to what subjects he or she chooses to photograph, how the medium of photography is used, and how the photo is formally arranged. Attending style for photography is based more on the individual's interpretation instead of their description of the photograph (Barrett, 1990).

Willis-Ryan (1987) posits that Van Der Zee used atmospheric effects, soft focus techniques, and diffused light, and was inspired by Impressionist painters.
for the photographs he produced in Lenox, Massachusetts. Van Der Zee additionally had no direct contact with the popular Photo-Secession group of aesthetic photographers in America. Van Der Zee collaborated and was influenced by Eddie Elcha's photography. They beautified and dramatized photographs with special creative effects by skillfully painting backdrops, hand-tinting and retouching negatives. Van Der Zee often superimposed images of one negative over a negative (Willis-Ryan, 1987).

Janson and Janson (1992) did not identify Van Der Zee's style and did so for the other chapter artists. The authors guide the reader to understand Van Der Zee's photography with many perspectives: the reader will see Van Der Zee as not part of the prominent Photo-Secession group of aesthetic photography and the reader will place Van Der Zee in a lesser hierarchy of photography because the authors state that the artist's photography is imitation and variable in quality. Van Der Zee's photography is lessen because the authors simplify the artwork and lack a discussion on stylistic connections for the chapter artists and his style.
PART THREE: RHETORICAL

How is author's language impact the target artist and artworks?

Rhetorical Strategies

I. Statements

A. The authors use statements as a rhetorical strategy to direct readers toward understanding of the artworks and these statements represent particular rhetorical strategies such as the following:

1) Comparing statements - a rhetorical strategy for understanding artworks in relation to another artwork(s).

2) Contextualizing statements - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork in relation to a particular context as a historical context.

3) Analyzing statements - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork in relation to formal properties of form and media.

4) Interpreting statements - a rhetorical strategy for understanding an artwork symbolically or metaphorically rather than literally.

5) Describing statements - a rhetorical strategy to understanding an artwork in relation to its identifiable properties.
Rhetorical strategies used for Van Der Zee and each chapter artist:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Rhetorical Strategies for Questions</th>
<th>Number of Statements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Van Der Zee</td>
<td>Context. (2), Analytic (1), Inter. (2)</td>
<td>five</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Steiglitz</td>
<td>Comp. (2), Context. (8), Analytic (1), Inter. (8)</td>
<td>nineteen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Weston</td>
<td>Comp. (2), Analytic (6)</td>
<td>eight</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Adams</td>
<td>Context. (2), Analytic (3), Inter. (1)</td>
<td>six</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) Bourke-White</td>
<td>Comp. (10, Context. (8), Inter. (4)</td>
<td>twenty-two</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8.1 Rhetorical Strategies

B. **Authors' Statements for VAN DER ZEE**

(See AUTHOR'S DESCRIPTION OF TARGET ARTIST AND ARTWORK)

**Contextual Approach**

The first and second statements are contextual.

**Implications**

Janson and Janson (1992) discuss the Harlem Renaissance but not its literal significance during the 1920's in America. The Harlem Renaissance is described as a flourishing historical period debated by Black critics (Janson & Janson, 1992). The authors didn't include comments on White critics and the Harlem Renaissance however they credit Van Der Zee as a chief contributor to the visual arts during 1920's. Campbell (1987) state that Van Der Zee captured the celebrities, ordinary families, famous political organizations, famous artists, and major occasions of the Harlem Renaissance. Reverend Adam Clayton
Powell Jr., Marcus Garvey, Madame C.J. Walker, and Aaron Douglas were some those people who were photographed by the artist (Campbell, 1987). African Americans came to the photographer to document important events and ceremonies in their lives because Van Der Zee provided one of the few photography businesses available to them. Nevertheless the authors judge his work vaguely in the following interpretive paragraph.

**Analytic Approach**
The third sentence is analytic.

**Implications**
The authors provide paradoxical statements toward their original discussion by presenting contradictions in their later literature: “Much of his work is commercial and variable in quality yet it remains of great documentary value and at its best, provide a compelling portrait of the era” (pg. 490). They give credibility and as well as discredit the artwork of Van Der Zee whereas Willis-Ryan (1987) posits that Van Der Zee's artistry came from his ability to combine his diverse talents as a painter, studio photographer, journalist-documentation, and his curiosity with people. (Willis-Ryan, 1987).

The last sentence is analytic.

**Implications**
The authors use one exemplar, *The Wife of the Reverend ...* to place universal meanings for all African Americans. Furthermore Janson and Janson clearly describes Van Der Zee's style as an "imitation of white fashionable photography." This judgment defines Van Der Zee as "other," and/or "different"
from mainstream. The authors statements suggest cultural difference in the creation of photography. Daniel and Delacruz (1993) quote Nieto's (1992) philosophy on cultural hierarchy:

Nieto (1992) notes that “in the United States, the norm generally used to describe all others is European American, upper middle class. English speaking and male” (p. 21). The relationships between and among students and teachers is often one that hinges on their perceptions of social, cultural, and ethnic superiority and inferiority. These relationships can have a dominant-subordinate characterization that affects the selection of relevant educational content as well as the method of delivery (p. v).

Janson and Janson (1992) direct the readers to perceive Van Der Zee's photography as less significant in quality and presents cultural separatism (stating one culture as being dominant over another) than the chapter artists with terminology like imitation and comparing Van Der Zee's artwork to fashionable white society. (Emphasis added)

The statements on the pride of African Americans were the strongest because the authors provided why the Van Der Zee's photography was important to the history of America during the 1920's however their comments on the quality of his work lacked sensitivity and understanding of African Americans in America's history. The authors provided more positive contextual information for the chapter artists and their artworks while their comments on Van Der Zee's and his photography lacked adequate contextual information.
II. Terms: Specific keywords from the text

A. Evaluative Terms:

**ARTISTS (positive)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Van Der Zee</th>
<th>Steiglitz</th>
<th>Weston</th>
<th>Adams</th>
<th>Bourke-White</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>chief</td>
<td>dominant</td>
<td>pure</td>
<td>uniform</td>
<td>first (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>great</td>
<td>tireless</td>
<td>straight</td>
<td>success</td>
<td>new</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>compelling</td>
<td>mature</td>
<td>new</td>
<td>foremost</td>
<td>closely</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>acute</td>
<td>classic</td>
<td>decisively</td>
<td>meticulous</td>
<td>important</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>wonderful</td>
<td>keen</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>miraculous</td>
<td>rare</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**ARTISTS (negative)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Van Der Zee</th>
<th>Steiglitz</th>
<th>Weston</th>
<th>Adams</th>
<th>Bourke-White</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>hotly</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>black</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**ARTWORKS (positive)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Van Der Zee</th>
<th>Steiglitz</th>
<th>Weston</th>
<th>Adams</th>
<th>Bourke-White</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>great</td>
<td>a. The Steerage</td>
<td>splendid</td>
<td>justifiably</td>
<td>classic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unique</td>
<td>true</td>
<td>new (2)</td>
<td>famous</td>
<td>visual parallel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;straight&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td>preternatural</td>
<td>pure</td>
<td>power</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>important</td>
<td></td>
<td>sharpness</td>
<td>perfect</td>
<td>remarkable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>importance</td>
<td></td>
<td>larger</td>
<td>effortlessly</td>
<td>colossal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pictorial</td>
<td></td>
<td>dramatic</td>
<td></td>
<td>spectral alertness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>independent</td>
<td></td>
<td>sensuousness</td>
<td></td>
<td>multiple</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8.2 Terms: specific keywords
Table 8.2 (Cont.)

**The Steerage**

first

b. Equivalent

independent

remarkably

full

major

ARTWORKS (negative)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Van Der Zee</th>
<th>Steiglitz</th>
<th>Weston</th>
<th>Adams</th>
<th>Bourke-White</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>commercial</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>variable</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>obvious imitation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fashionable</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>white</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A. Janson and Janson (1992) posit Van Der Zee and the chapter artist with positive contextual information however they discuss Van Der Zee as a less significant photographer. The authors introduce Van Der Zee with fewer contributions for his photography: "Much of his work is commercial and variable in quality, yet it remains of great documentary value and, at its best, provides a compelling portrait of an era (p. 490)." The authors present the chapter artists with broader historical context and greater accomplishments in the field of photography than they do for Van Der Zee in the following:

Table 8.2 (cont.)

Table 8.2
1) Steiglitz - "The founder of modern photography in the United States was Alfred Steiglitz, whose influence remained dominant throughout his life (1864-1946) (p. 485)" and "Steiglitz' straight photography formed the basis of the American school (p. 486)."

2) Weston - "Steiglitz' concept of the Equivalent opened the way to "pure" photography as an alternative to straight photography. The leader of this new approach was Edward Weston (1886-1958), who although not Steiglitz' protege', was decisively influenced by him (p. 488)."

3) Adams - "To achieve uniform detail and depth, Weston worked with the smallest possible camera lens openings, and his success led to the formation, in 1932, of the West Coast society known as Group f/64, for the smallest lens opening. Among the founding members was Ansel Adams (1902-1984), who soon became the foremost nature photographer in America (p. 488)."

4) Bourke-White - "Steiglitz was among the first to photograph skyscrapers, the new architecture that came to dominate the horizon on America's growing cities (p. 488)."

Janson and Janson (1992) do not provide contextual information on the artist and his role in documenting America's history. Willis-Ryan (1987) posits that the history of photography in America cannot be considered complete without acknowledging the work of James Van Der Zee because he documented the spirit of Harlem and its people during two world wars, the literary and artistic Renaissance, the Depression, and the era of swing (dance and music) (Willis-Ryan, p. 155, 1987)).

B. Janson and Janson (1992) direct the reader to see Van Der Zee's photography as less significant than the other chapter artists. The authors interpret and compare Steiglitz' photography to Steichen's Rodin and Riis' Bandits’ Roost, Weston to Steiglitz' Equivalent, Adams to Weston's photographic procedures and methods, and Bourke-White to Steiglitz' subject matter in his photography. The authors interpret Van Der Zee and lessen the importance of his photography.

The authors expand on the quality of Van Der Zee's photography while they present more contextual information for Steiglitz, Weston, Adams, and Bourke-White. Although the authors present a
broad discussion on historical contextual information during the Harlem Renaissance for Van Der Zee and Steiglitz and Precisionist painters and industrial photography for Bourke-White, they do not lessen the importance of Bourke-White's photography.

**SUMMARY**

Janson and Janson (1992) discuss Steiglitz, Weston, Adams, and Bourke-White with an inner connectiveness for the field of photography. They introduce how Steiglitz inspired the chapter artists and their art forms, but not Van Der Zee. The authors discuss and present Van Der Zee and his photography on the periphery of modern photography in America. They interpret Van Der Zee as an imitator of dominant culture photography in America. They introduce the artist's photographic contributions as important because it documents the Harlem Renaissance. They do not provide important contextual information concerning the artist and his photography.

Janson and Janson (1992) lessen the significance of Van Der Zee and his photography by comparing him to fashionable photographs in America's white society. They compare the other chapter artists to important photographic discoveries in America's history therefore they present an inequitable comparison between the photographers. They isolate Van Der Zee from the other mainstream chapter artists such that they narrow the reader's understanding of the historical context of the artist and his photography.
CHAPTER 5

IMPLICATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

While examining my summary, I have kept in mind questions and concerns future middle and high school art educators would consider before choosing an art textbook. Matters and issues relating to multicultural art education and discipline based art education would certainly play a significant role for art instructors' who opt for a particular art education text book. The underlying ability of a textbook to influence a learner is tremendous and deserves careful selection.

Upon investigating the content of the two art education text books, it becomes clear that African American artists are under-represented in the art history and appreciation text books. Under-representation refers to the disproportionate ratio of African Americans to other American artists. Goldstein, Katz, Kowlachuk, and Saunders (1986) and Janson and Janson (1992) each presented four known American artists who have lineage to Africa. Goldstein et al (1987) introduced 63 white males, 6 white females, 4 black males, and 0 black females. Janson and Janson (1992) discussed 105 white males, 8 white females, 3 black males, and 1 black females.

Goldstein et al (1987) presents a lack of complexity in most instances for the target and chapter artists. The authors use an inconsistent thematic approach (heroes and heroines) for disseminating information on the group of
Goldstein et al (1987) discuss heroes and heroines from different art historical periods and styles with little to no connections for their discussions. Their contextual information ranged from inconsistent and incomplete discussions on media, formal elements of design, style, and art historical context when they discussed the subject matter (heroes and heroines) of each target and chapter artist. The subject matter is emphasized but not with the same approach for each artist. Goldstein et al's (1987) inconsistent presentation of art historical periods, varied styles (self-taught artist, folk art, Neither of the textbooks discussed historical and/or anthropological issues such as race, sex, and gender with a complex dialogue, however, Janson and Janson (1992) make a clear attempt while discussing gender issues for Chase-Riboud's and African heritage. While investigating the written text of the two books for historical, anthropological, and rhetorical data, I discovered that the authors chose diverse approaches for disseminating contextual information on the art and artists.

Main Purpose

Janson and Janson (1992) provide time periods for their thematic approach and they present a traditional approach for art history. The authors discuss the artists within specific countries and art historical time periods. They present a more cohesive picture of the artists' styles, their influences, the artists' biographies, and use and manipulation of media. The authors state and/or elude to the individual styles of each artist and how each were influenced.

Janson and Janson (1992) emphasize the subject matter of each artwork for their discussions on each artist and not the role of African American artists. However Janson and Janson (1992) emphasize subject matter by reducing
their dialogue to formal qualities of each artwork. Janson and Janson (1992) state adequate biographies for each artist. The biographies list their birth dates and death, their travels, and what the artist did best. Unlike Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunders (1987), Janson and Janson (1992) list the media below the artist's art work. Janson and Janson (1992) list the media for each artist's art work. The authors list and/or discuss how the artists created with different media except for Van Der Zee, Weston, and Bourke-White's photographs.

**Sociocultural Approach**

Goldstein, Kowalchuk, Katz, and Saunders (1987) provide either a weak or no discussion on the social and cultural background for most of the artists and artworks in their text. The authors' socio-cultural discussions for Edmondson, Remington, and Stella are stronger than the other chapter artists. They elude to Edmondson's religion and his art, Remington's occupation as a magazine illustrator in the West, and Stella's connection to the Italian Futurists. Overall Goldstein et al (1987) do not focus on the artist however the art work becomes the topic of discussion. The subject matter and theme predominate their discussion. Most of the artists and artworks are oversimplified because of the lack of social and cultural information. Goldstein et al (1987) provide questions for the segments, *Looking At Heroes In History Through Painting, Looking At Heroes In History Through Sculpture, Looking At Heroes In History Through Drawings* and the feature, *Cubism-The World Of The Twentieth-Century Artist* that indirectly and directly refer to social and cultural context as it relates to the subject matter of some of the artworks.
Janson and Janson (1992) state a stronger socio-cultural approach for the artists and their art works. Unlike Goldstein et al (1987), the authors somewhat explain the social and cultural environment of the artists. The authors mention that: 1) how blacks and whites attended separate art schools after the Civil War, 2) that Eakins accepted and supported Tanner and other African Americans in his art classes, 3) that blacks were allowed to attend predominant white schools after the Emancipation and Civil War, 4) that W. T. Williams was associated with the Black American art and the Civil Rights Movement, 5) that Nevelson influence Chase-Riboud and other women to become sculptors, 6) that black women artists from African traditions never practiced sculpture, and 7) that women artists were excluded from the art world.

**Race and Representation**

Goldstein et al (1987) discuss four African American artists and sixty-nine other artists from the middle-eighteen hundreds to the late twentieth-century. The authors do not present a dialogue on race, ethnicity, and gender for the artists. In *Looking At Heroes In History Through Paintings*, the authors use a single category of American to classify all the diverse ethnic artists from America however they date the art works. For the segment, *Looking At Heroes In History Through Sculpture*, they repeat the very same categorization as before. This procedure is not inclusive of historical, social, and cultural contextual information relating to the diverse ethnic and women artists. They set up oppositions by placing all the diverse artists in one large category. This approach limits the readers' knowledge base and comprehension. The reader must assume an identity for the artist. This process limits the readers in these ways: 1) the readers' concept of the artists' background, 2) socio-politics and
socio-economics in history, and 3) how and why some environmental factors often influence their art work.

Janson and Janson (1992) present a stronger discussion on race, ethnicity, and gender for their chapter artists than Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunders (1987). The authors divide their textbook, *A Basic History of Art*, in four parts. Although the authors consistently leave out a discussion on racial ancestry of the artists, however they elude to racial inequality in the following: 1) Tanner who was excluded from white art schools, 2) W.T. Williams was discussed in the context of The Harlem Renaissance, civil rights movement, and the assassination of Malcom X and Martin Luther King and black art tendencies and styles, 3) Chase-Riboud-American was discussed as a black woman in the arts and 4) Van Der Zee was presented in the context of The Harlem Renaissance. Thus Janson and Janson (1992) explain gender issues for women, socio-political and socio-economic conditions for blacks in America's history much better than Goldstein et al (1987). However, Janson and Janson (1992) oversimplify Williams and Van Der Zee because race becomes a large category for their broad discussion on The Harlem Renaissance and The Civil Rights Movement of the sixties. Gollnick and Chinn (1990) describe this writing procedure as fragmentation and isolation. This is problematic for the discussion on Williams and Van Der Zee.

Disseminating contextual information on diverse artists becomes problematic when we ignore historical happenings that correlate to the artist's and his or her art making process. For example, Goldstein et al (1987) ignored Pippin's involvement in World War I. The authors do not provide a discussion for this event. Gollnick and Chinn (1990) state that this writing procedure falls under their category, selectivity and imbalance. Goldstein et al's (1987)
perspective for this historical event is oversimplified. The authors approach is indicative of selectivity and imbalance (Gollnick and Chinn, 1990). Another instance of selectivity and isolation occurs in Goldstein et al's (1987) discussion on Edmondson's Protestant religion and his belief. Religion had a very strong present in artist's life and artwork. Grigsby (1977) explains the significance of religion and art:

Religion is a powerful factor in shaping the ethnic component and is responsible for the production of more works of art than either nationality or race, or than intercontinental expressions, if either of these demand the creation of a work of art (Grigsby, p. 60. 1977).

Edmondson states that God speaks to him and then he is inspired to create his sculptures.

Furthermore, Janson and Janson (1992) fail to discuss why Tanner left America for France to escape racial prejudice for artistic freedom and the chance to attend art classes which blacks were mostly prohibited to attend in America (Bearden and Henderson, 1993). McCarthy (1990) explains that textbooks tend to oppress minority identities and reproduce inequalities that exist in our society. Graham (1996) reviewed four popular art survey texts. He argues that textbooks are written with opposite perspectives. Most authors such as Janson (1995) and Tansey and Kleiner's (1996) focus on traditional issues (style) and attempt to address contemporary art. This problem exists in Janson and Janson (1997) and Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunder's (1987) textbook. They attempt to discuss artists from culturally different worlds with a traditional viewpoint instead of gaining an understanding from the diverse culture's concept of art history (Graham, p. 99, 1996). Janson and Janson (1992) also use selectivity and imbalance when discussing W.T. Williams. The historical and anthropological information related to W.T. Williams and his work
is brief. The artist and his artwork is interrupted with a broad discussion on art of the 1960's, Civil Rights, the Harlem Renaissance, Mainstream Abstractionist art, etc.

**Comparison of the Textbooks**

A final comparison and contrast of the two textbooks lead me to select Janson and Janson's (1992) as the better textbook. The authors adhere to a traditional point of view for art history, but they also present a much needed dialogue on social and cultural issues and historical events relating to African American and women artists in art history that is absent from Goldstein et al. Goldstein et al's (1987) failure to include the ethnicity of artists and the social and cultural context of the artists and their artworks suggest to the reader that all artists have the same art heritage, which is not true. By omitting the racial identity of the African American artists, Goldstein et al (1987) provide an students with an incomplete picture of the artists and their art making process. By presenting social and cultural information for the artists, Janson and Janson (1992) help students debunk myths, misconceptions, and the homogenization of diverse ethnic groups.

Both Janson and Janson (1992) and Goldstein et al (1987) present a glossary of terms that is appropriate for their age group. Janson and Janson (1992) offer a four page glossary. Goldstein et al (1987) present a three page glossary. Janson and Janson (1992) go a step further with a chronological time line that commences from 1750 to 1990, and addresses political history, religion and literature, science and technology, architecture, sculpture painting, and photography. But a higher level of critical thinking could be achieved, if the
artists were introduced in a more equitable formalist, media, and cultural approach.

By the absence of contextual information, Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunders (1987) suggest that the readers are much too young to understand cultural diversity, difference in social and cultural morays, and that difference in racial identity is acceptable in a democratic society. The authors of both of these texts have a task for their next textbook. They must illuminate historic and anthropological concerns better. That is, if Janson and Janson (1992) researched more on Tanner and his art (French influences in Europe), William T. Williams and black art of the sixties, and the art and culture of Van Der Zee in the Harlem Renaissance and if Goldstein et al's (1987) identified Pippin as an artist who was a World War I hero, White and his art (expatriate studying and teaching art in Mexico), and jazz closely linked to Bearden's art and culture then the readers could achieve a more complete understanding of these artist's works.

Philosophy for Teaching:

As an art educator my goals for teaching art education allign with the empowerment of all my students. Classroom instructional materials such as textbooks and periodicals must be acknowledged as "individual perspectives" for disseminating information on varied disciplines. Just one resource (i.e. one textbook) for classroom instruction provides one narrative for discussing a topic or subject. My aim and rationale for instructing art education is closely linked to historic facts and anthropological findings. I present a marriage of social and cultural data with art historical events. Also the language of art making and design is needed for communication. However, students must write about art,
read about art, interview and gain an understanding of diverse ethnic artists, critique art, know diverse art philosophies and art historical perspectives as well as create art works. In the art world there are no universals for comparing and contrasting art forms. Artworks from diverse cultures have their own messages, codes, and techniques. All are equally important. Often these identifiable markings may overlap or appear to be the same in different cultures. Hierarchical categorizing of artforms cause problematic issues such as ethnocentrism, bigotry, gender bias, and simple ignorance. If we teach children that art works are less important because of their origin and their difference in function within a given society, we continue to perpetuate hatred, prejudice, and ignorance.

Guidelines and Recommendations

Based on the analysis of the two textbooks, I suggest that teachers should: 1) present fewer artists for the art history component, 2) provide more contextual information for artists and artworks, 3) introduce each artist with historical information, 4) give and explain logical connections between different artists, and 5) discuss race and ethnicity of each artist. The students will gain a broader understanding of man and his role in the art world, if the prior suggestions are presented in a logical, cohesive approach.

When fewer artists are presented to students, more time can be used for discussing, reading, and writing about artists, their artwork, and anthropological and historical issues. Often a large number of artists limit the amount of time for discussion. It is easier to go into depth with key issues with fewer artists than with several.
Contextual information must be presented with artworks if students are to gain a better understanding of the artwork. Problematic issues occur when students fail to see art in its proper context. For example, Goldstein, Katz, Kowalchuk, and Saunders (1987) failed to mention that Pippin fought in World War I while he painted the same scenes of war. Often the non-Western view of art interrupts the cultural context of Western artwork. Art teachers should research anthropological and historical issues in art education first, then guide students in the same direction. They should also avoid hierarchical categorizing of art from different regions of the world because the approach creates separation and indifference within a classroom culture.

Each artist should be disseminated in an equitable historical approach. That is, teachers should discuss the artist and artwork through historical facts, events and/or happenings that relate to them specifically. Many viewpoints can be examined on diverse artists through reading multiple art historical perspectives. Each art historian has their own interpretation and well as each historian has their own. This fact must be reinforced when students are given reading and research assignments. Art teachers should be aware of literature that addresses historical information non-related to artists such as Janson and Janson's (1992) discussion with W. T. Williams and Van Der Zee. They did not connect the Civil Rights Movement, the death of Martin L. King and Talcum X, The Harlem Renaissance, etc. directly to the artist's lives.

When a selected group of artists are presented to students, there should be logical connections between them. Themes play a pertinent role when discussing different artists and artworks. The demographics of the classroom can and may be addressed when using themes. Art teachers may choose landscapes, still lifes and/or the human figure for thematic unity when
introducing different artists. They may also choose a social or cultural theme such as poverty, race and identity, and war. A teacher's decided theme may and can ascribe to key historical, anthropological, media, stylistic, and formal design issues of study. Thematic approaches should also be equitable so that each artist is given an adequate dialogue.

Teachers should consider race, gender, and other sociocultural concerns as they relate to the immediate population of their class. For instance, Goldstein et al (1987) fail to address race and ethnicity with a proper discussion and present either little or no sociocultural connections to the artists. However, Janson and Janson (1992) explain about racism and cultural separation with a meaningful historical approach. Inclusion refers to addressing the total population. An example of this process could be implemented though reading and studying about cultural diversity, race and ethnicity in art education.

The appropriate selection of a text should be based on more than the language of art and art making techniques. Students gain a better knowledge base on complex art issues and concerns, if they are given useful art education information that connects artists and artworks to their immediate lives. By relating contextual information on art and artists from different cultures, students will appreciate differences and well as similarities in each culture. Futhermore, connecting art education with historical and anthropological events and/or happenings become a means for understanding diverse cultures near or at distance.
it is right gives him this courage. The American flag, re and dominant, waves over the general. Where, in vest, is the British flag? What else do you see in the painting? Look at the foreground. The images of death and cution are Sanford's reminder that the price of war is ble. The artist presents a strong vision filled with sym- . What symbols can you identify in the painting, Wash- on at Princeton? What does this historical painting re- d you of?

The End of War, Starting Home, 1918 is an oil painting by ace Pippin. Who is the hero and what is going on in this osive work? The painting's title gives you some clues. hero is the simple soldier, the doughboy of World War I (1914–1918), who thinks not about medals and promotion or a hero, but only about returning home. Fighting a war orign country is not only a dangerous, but lonely enience. Perhaps these soldiers were thinking as much ut going home as winning the war. The doughboys, in reground, are breaking through the barbed wire barri- e. The German soldiers are fleeing and surrendering.

re 116. End of War, Starting Home, 1918 by Horace Pippin.
George, the knight in the middle, appears to have power over life and death, light and darkness, good and evil. He sits astride a bright white horse, but he is wearing black armor, and a black cape rises from his back. Notice the halos around the heads of both St. George and the maiden. What meaning might that detail contribute to the painting? Notice also the almost human expression of the face of the horse, as it looks out of the picture at the viewer. What meaning do you see in the horse’s expression?

Not all heroes are knights in shining armor. In this next picture, you will see a hero of science. Benjamin Franklin Drawing Electricity from the Sky is an oil painting on paper by the American artist, Benjamin West. Did you list imagination as one of the characteristics of a hero? Benjamin West certainly did. He has shown the imaginative Franklin as a superhuman, almost godlike man.

In the painting, Franklin is drawing electricity from the sky. How did the artist dramatize the moment to make it more heroic? The storm billows about Franklin, blowing his cloak and hair. Cherubs surround him as well, assisting in this historic act.
Figure 120. *Joan of Arc* by Jules Bastien-LePage (1879).
Figure 121. *Esther and Ahasuerus* by Artemisia Gentileschi (seventeenth century).
Figure 122. *The Presidents* on Mt. Rushmore sculpted by Gutzon Borglum (1927–1941).
The Presidents show four of America's important leaders: Presidents George Washington, Thomas Jefferson, Abraham Lincoln, and Theodore Roosevelt. The heads are so huge that they can be seen from as far away as sixty miles. Why should an artist carve such an enormous sculpture? What might such giantlike heads symbolize? Perhaps the artist wants to show that these four men were giant influences in the history of their country. Gutzon Borglum is paying tribute to these leaders. He has done so in such an original and engaging way that you cannot help but take notice and perhaps pay tribute as well.

The hero of state is often represented as a conqueror on horseback. Equestrian statues are seen in parks and city squares, particularly in the Western world. The Monument of Bartolommeo Colleoni is made of bronze and is thirteen feet high. It was completed by the Italian artist Andrea del Verrocchio in 1488. The statue stands in Venice, Italy. During the Renaissance, Italian professional soldiers of fortune could be hired for a price to serve those in pursuit of power. The Monument of Bartolommeo Colleoni is an equestrian statue glorifying these soldiers of fortune. Notice the smug image of power. Both the man and the horse have expressions of toughness and arrogance. The Monument of
Bartolommeo Colleoni portrays brute power, not the power of mind, wisdom, or imagination. Nor does it show the devotion of an Esther or the fervor of a Joan of Arc. This man and his horse seem as one. The horse is strong and thickly muscled. The man is wrapped in heavy armor. The pair look almost like an advertisement which assures that whoever pays their services will indeed see an enemy crushed.

Look closely at the man's face. What do you see? The mouth is turned down in a snarl. The eyes look out from under the helmet in a fierce and penetrating way. Here you have an image of superhuman power and physical strength. This is the warrior hero. What other visual elements contribute to the image of fierceness, physical strength, and power in the Monument of Bartolommeo Colleoni?

Bronco Buster is a bronze sculpture of a man and horse which represents the popular hero of the American West.
Figure 125. Jack Johnson sculpture by William Edmondson (1935).

Figure 126. Groggy by Mahonri M. Young (1926).
Figure 127. *The Preacher* sculpture by William Edmondson (1935).

Figure 128. *The Preacher* by Charles White (1952).
Figure 129. *Gross Clinic* drawing by Thomas Eakins (1874).
Figure 223. The objects in this early Picasso painting, *Still Life with Fruit Bowl*, are slightly abstracted.

Look at *Still Life with Fruit Bowl* by Pablo Picasso. This is one of the less complex Cubist paintings, but it shows the surfaces quite well. Compare what you see with what you know. The table is horizontal, at least it should be, and the bowl is vertical. But is it? The table is flat against the wall. The shadows at the base of the bowl are tilted upward. The viewer is slightly above the table. What kinds of fruits are shown? Picasso does not really want you to know. He wants you to see the fruit shapes. Picasso forces you to see these familiar objects as shapes and forms in themselves.
Picasso painted *Still Life with Fruit Bowl* in 1908-1909 in the early days of Cubism. At that stage, the Cubists were looking at and analyzing their subject matter and painting it all.

About 1912 Cubists began including real wallpaper instead of the painted shapes of wallpaper, real sheets of music or newspapers, real rope and pieces of wood rather than painted pieces. *Breakfast* by the Spanish artist Juan Gris is an example of this type of Cubism.

Figure 224. What materials did Gris use in this collage called *Breakfast*?
Figure 225. In *Battle of Lights: Coney Island*, Stella captures the giddy excitement of an evening at the amusement park.
Figure 226. Notice how Stuart Davis simplified familiar objects and signs in *House and Street*.
Figure 227. Have you ever seen this stamp designed by Davis?

Figure 228. How does Demuth use line in his work *My Egypt*?
Figure 229. Compare the figure She-Ba by Bearden to figures of ancient Egyptians.
and working processes. Surface decoration likewise ought to be flat rather than illusionistic. His interiors (fig. 378) are total environments that create an effect of quiet intimacy. Despite Morris' self-proclaimed championship of the medieval tradition, he never imitated its forms directly but instead sought to capture its spirit. He invented the first original system of ornament since the Rococo—no small achievement.

**United States**

Whistler. American painters were among the earliest followers of Manet and his circle. James Abbott McNeill Whistler (1834–1903) went to Paris in 1855 to study painting. Four years later he moved to London, where he spent the rest of his life, but he visited France during the 1860s and was in close touch with the rising Impressionist movement. *Arrangement in Black and Gray: The Artist's Mother* (fig. 379), his best-known picture, reflects the influence of Manet in its emphasis on flat areas, and the likeness has the austere precision of Degas' portraits. Its fame as a symbol of our latter-day "mother cult" is a paradox of popular psychology that would have dismayed Whistler: he wanted the canvas to be appreciated for its formal qualities alone.

A witty, sharp-tongued advocate of art for art's sake, he thought of his pictures as analogous to pieces of music and called them "symphonies" or "nocturnes." The boldest example, painted about 1874, is *Nocturne in Black and Gold: The Falling Rocket* (fig. 380). Without an explanatory subtitle, we would have real difficulty making it out. No French painter had yet dared to produce a picture so "nonrepresentational," so reminiscent of Turner's "tinted steam" (see fig. 351). It was this canvas, more than any other, that prompted John Ruskin to accuse Whistler of "flinging a pot of paint in the public's face." (Since the same critic had highly praised Turner's *The Slave Ship*, we must conclude that what Ruskin really liked was not the tinted steam itself but the Romantic sentiment behind it.) During Whistler's successful libel suit against Ruskin, he defined his aims in terms that apply well to *The Falling Rocket*: "I have perhaps meant rather to indicate an artistic interest alone in my work, divesting the picture from any outside sort of interest... It is an arrangement of line, form, and color, first, and I make use of any incident of it which shall bring about a symmetrical result." The last phrase has special significance, since Whistler acknowledges...
that in utilizing chance effects, he does not look for resemblances but for a purely formal harmony. While he rarely practiced what he preached to quite the same extent as he did in The Falling Rocket, his statement reads like a prophecy of American abstract painting (see fig. 446).

**Homer.** Whistler’s gifted contemporary in America Winslow Homer (1836—1910) also went to Paris as a young man, but left too soon to receive the full impact of Impressionism. He was a pictorial reporter throughout the Civil War and continued as a magazine illustrator until 1875, but he was also a remarkable painter. The fresh delicacy of the sunlit scene in The Morning Bell (fig. 381) might be called “pre-Impressionist.” The picture is halfway between Corot and Monet (compare figs. 345, 370). It has an extraordinarily subtle design as well. The dog, the girl at the center, and those at the right turn the footpath into a seesaw, its upward slant balanced by the descending line of tree trunks. At the same time, the tilted walkway emphasizes the reluctance of the trudging figure, echoed by the little dog, to enter the mill where she will spend the rest of the day. The painting documents the early Industrial Revolution, before the advent of child labor laws, when young people often toiled long hours at difficult jobs.

**Eakins.** Thomas Eakins (1844–1916) arrived in Paris from Philadelphia about the time Homer painted The Morning Bell; he went home four years later, after receiving a conventional academic training, with decisive impressions of Courbet and Velázquez. Elements of both these artists’ styles are combined in William Rush Carving His Allegorical Figure of the Schuylkill River (fig. 382; compare figs. 366, 285). Eakins had encountered stiff opposition for advocating traditional life studies at the Pennsylvania Academy of the Fine Arts. To him, Rush was a hero for basing his 1809 statue for the Philadelphia Water Works on the nude model, though the figure itself was draped in a classical robe. Eakins no doubt knew contemporary European paintings of sculptors carving from the nude: these were related to the theme of Pygmalion and Galatea, which was popular at the time among academic artists. Conservative critics denounced William Rush Carving His Allegorical Figure of the Schuylkill River for its nudity, despite the presence of the chaperon knitting quietly to the right. Nevertheless, to us the painting’s declaration of honest truth seems an appropriate fulfillment of Baudelaire’s demand for pictures that express the heroism of modern life.

**Tanner.** Thanks in large part to Eakins’ enlightened attitude, Philadelphia became the leading center of minority artists in the United States. Eakins encouraged women and blacks to study art seriously at a time when professional careers were closed to them. African Americans had no chance to enter the arts before Emancipation, and after the Civil War the situation improved only
381. Winslow Homer. *The Morning Bell*. c. 1876. Oil on canvas, 24 x 38" (61 x 96.5 cm).
Yale University Art Gallery, New Haven, Connecticut. Stephen C. Clark Collection

382. Thomas Eakins. *William Rush Carving His Allegorical Figure of the Schuylkill River*. 1877.
Oil on canvas, 20¼ x 26½" (51.1 x 67.3 cm). The Philadelphia Museum of Art.
Given by Mrs. Thomas Eakins and Miss Mary A. Williams
Henry O. Tanner (1859–1937), the first important black painter, studied with Eakins in the early 1880s. Tanner's masterpiece, The Banjo Lesson (fig. 383), painted after he moved permanently to Paris, avoids the mawkishness of similar subjects by other American painters. The scene is rendered with the same direct realism as Eakins' William Rush Carving His Allegorical Figure of the Schuylkill River.

SCULPTURE

Impressionism, it is often said, revitalized sculpture no less than painting. The statement is at once true and misleading. Auguste Rodin, the first sculptor of genius since Bernini, redefined sculpture during the same years that Manet and Monet redefined painting. In so doing, however, he did not follow these artists' lead. How indeed could the effect of such pictures as The Fifer or The River be reproduced in three dimensions and without color?

Rodin. What Rodin (1840–1917) did accomplish is strikingly visible in The Thinker (fig. 384), originally conceived as part of a large unfinished project called The Gates of Hell. The welts and wrinkles of the vigorously creased surface produce, in polished bronze, an ever-changing pattern of reflections. But is this effect borrowed from Impressionist...
Stella. The brilliant and precocious Frank Stella (born 1936) began as an admirer of Mondrian, then soon evolved a nonfigurative style that was even more self-contained. Unlike Mondrian (see pp. 431—32), Stella did not concern himself with the vertical-horizontal balance that relates the older artist's work to the world of nature. Logically enough, he also abandoned the traditional rectangular format, so as to make quite sure that his pictures bore no resemblance to windows. The shape of the canvas had now become an integral part of the design. In one of his largest works, the majestic Empress of India (fig. 453), this shape is determined by the thrust and counterthrust of four huge chevrons, identical in size and shape but sharply differentiated in color and in their relationship to the
whole. The paint, moreover, contains powdered metal, which gives it an iridescent sheen. This is yet another way to stress the impersonal precision of the surfaces and to remove the work from any comparison with the "handmade" look of easel pictures. In fact, to speak of Empress of India as a picture seems decidedly awkward. It demands to be called an object, sufficient unto itself.

Williams. The contribution of the lyrical Expressionists from the early 1970s has been largely overlooked. Their legacy can be seen in the work of William T. Williams (born 1942), a member of this "lost" generation. After a period of intense self-scrutiny, he developed the sophisticated technique seen in Batman (fig. 454). His method can be compared to jazz improvisation, a debt that the artist himself has acknowledged. He interweaves his color and brushwork within a clear two-part structure that permits endless variations on the central theme. Although Williams is concerned primarily with formal issues, the play of color and abstract shapes across the encrusted surface further evokes the patterns, light, and space of nature. But instead of depicting a landscape, the painting seemingly captures, albeit unconsciously, an evanescent memory of the artist's past.

Williams belongs to the generation of African Americans born around 1940 who have brought black painting and sculpture to artistic maturity. In the 1920s, the Harlem Renaissance had produced a cultural revival that unfortunately was short-lived, its promise dashed by the economic catastrophe of the Depression. Following World War II, however, blacks began to attend art schools in growing numbers, at the very time that Abstract Expressionism marked the coming of age of American art. The civil rights movement helped blacks establish their artistic identities and find appropriate styles for expressing them. The turning point proved to be the assassinations of Malcolm X in 1965 and Martin Luther King, Jr., in 1968, which provoked an outpouring of African American art.

Since then, black artists have pursued three major tendencies. Mainstream Abstractionists, particularly those of the older generation, tend to be concerned primarily with seeking a personal aesthetic, maintaining that there is no such thing as African American, or black, art, only good art. Consequently, they have been denounced by activist artists who, stirred by social consciousness as well as by political ideology, have adopted highly expressive representational styles as the means for communicating a distinctive black perspective directly to the people in their communities. Mediating between these two approaches is a very decorative form of art that frequently incorporates African, Caribbean, and sometimes Mexican motifs. No hard-and-fast principles separate these alternatives, and aspects of each have been successfully combined into separate individual styles. Abstraction has nevertheless proved the most fruitful path, for it has opened up avenues of expression that allow the black artist, however
sides with real obelisks. Rauschenberg's unlikely "monument" has at least some qualities in common with its predecessors: compactness and self-sufficiency. We will recognize in this improbable juxtaposition the same ironic intent as in the ready-mades of Duchamp, whom Rauschenberg had come to know well in New York.

Chamberlain. A most successful example of junk sculpture, and a puzzling borderline case of assemblage and sculpture, is *Essex* (fig. 482) by John Chamberlain (born 1927). The title refers to a make of car that has not been on the market for many years, suggesting that the object is a kind of homage to a vanished species. But we may well doubt that these pieces of enameled tin ever had so specific an origin. They have been carefully selected for their shape and color, and composed in such a way that they form a new entity, evoking Duchamp-Villon's *The Great Horse* (see fig. 471) rather than the crumpled automobiles to which they once belonged.
Nevelson. Although it is almost always made entirely of wood, the work of Louise Nevelson (1900–1988) must be classified as assemblage, and when extended to a monumental scale, it acquires the status of an environment. Before Nevelson, there had not been important women sculptors in twentieth-century America. Women had traditionally been excluded from this medium because of the manual labor involved. Thanks to the women's suffrage movement in the second half of the nineteenth century, Harriet Hosmer (1830–1908) and her "White Marmorean Flock" (as the novelist Henry James called her and her followers in Rome) had succeeded in legitimizing sculpture as a medium for women. This school of sculpture lapsed, however, when the sentimental, idealizing Neoclassical style fell out of favor after the Philadelphia Centennial of 1876.

In the 1950s Nevelson rejected external reality and began to construct a private one, using her collection of found pieces of wood. At first these self-contained realms were miniature cityscapes. They soon grew into large environments of free-standing "buildings," encrusted with decorations that were inspired by the sculpture on Mayan ruins. Nevelson's work generally took the form of large wall units that flatten her architecture into reliefs (fig. 483). Assembled from individual compartments, the whole is always painted a single color, usually a matte black to suggest the shadowy world of dreams. Each compart-
Chase-Riboud. Nevelson's success has encouraged other American women to become sculptors. Barbara Chase-Riboud (born 1939), a prize-winning author who now lives in Paris, belongs to a generation of remarkable black women who have made significant contributions to several of the arts at once. She is heir to a unique American tradition. It is a paradox that whereas black women never carve in traditional African cultures, in America they found their first artistic outlet in sculpture. They were attracted to it by the example set by Harriet Hosmer at a time when abolitionism and feminism were closely allied liberal causes.

Chase-Riboud received a traditional training in her native Philadelphia, the first center of minority artists (see p. 388). In search of an artistic identity, she then turned to African art for inspiration. Her monumental sculpture makes an indelible impression on the viewer. In *Confessions for Myself* (fig. 484) she has conjured up a demonic archetype of awesome power. Its sources can be found in cast bronze figures from Benin and in the Senufo tribe's carved wooden masks, which are sometimes embellished with textiles. From them she developed her highly individual aesthetic, which utilizes a combination of bronze that has been painted black and braided fiber to express a distinctly ethnic sensibility and feminist outlook.

*Environments and Installations*

Some artists associated with Pop Art have also turned to assemblage because they find the flat surface of the canvas too confining. In order to bridge the gap between image and reality, they often introduce three-dimensional objects into their pictures. Some even construct full-scale models of everyday things and real-life situations, utilizing every conceivable kind of material in order to embrace the entire range of their physical environment, including the people, in their work. These "environments" combine the qualities of painting, sculpture, collage, and stagecraft. Being three-dimensional, they can claim to be considered sculpture, but the claim rests on a convention that Pop Art itself has helped make obsolete. According to this convention, a flat or smoothly curved work of art covered with pigments is a painting (or, if the surface consists mainly of lines, a print or drawing); everything else is sculpture, regardless of me-
content and appearance to his photographs. The resemblance is misleading. For Stieglitz, photography was less a means of recording things than of expressing his experience and philosophy of life, much as a painter does.

This attitude culminated in his "Equivalents." In 1922 Stieglitz began to photograph clouds to show that his work was independent of subject and personality. A remarkably lyrical cloud photograph from 1930 (fig. 505) corresponds to a state of mind waiting to find full expression rather than merely respond-
Weston. Stieglitz' concept of the Equivalent opened the way to "pure" photography as an alternative to straight photography. The leader of this new approach was Edward Weston (1886–1958), who, although not Stieglitz' protégé, was decisively influenced by him. During the 1920s he pursued abstraction and realism as separate paths, but by 1930 he fused them in images that are wonderful in their design and miraculous for their detail. Pepper (fig. 506) is a splendid example that is anything but a straightforward record of this familiar fruit. Like Stieglitz' Equivalents, Weston's photography makes us see the mundane with new eyes. The pepper is shown with preternatural sharpness and so close up that it seems larger than life. Thanks to the tightly cropped composition, we are forced to contemplate the form, whose every undulation is revealed by the dramatic lighting. Pepper has the sensuousness of O'Keeffe's Black Iris III (see fig. 443), which lends the Equivalent a new meaning. Here the shapes are intentionally suggestive of the photographs of the female nude that Weston also pioneered.

Adams. To achieve uniform detail and depth, Weston worked with the smallest possible camera lens openings, and his success led to the formation, in 1932, of the West Coast society known as Group f/64, for the smallest lens opening. Among the founding members was Ansel Adams (1902–1984), who soon became the foremost nature photographer in America. Adams was a meticulous technician, beginning with the composition and exposure and continuing through the final printing. His justifiably famous work Moonrise, Hernandez, New Mexico (fig. 507) came from pure serendipity which could never be repeated, a perfect marriage of straight and Equivalent photography. As in all of Adams' pictures, there is a full range of tonal nuances, from clear whites to inky blacks. The key to the photograph lies in the low cloud that divides the scene into three zones, so that the moon appears to hover effortlessly in the early evening sky.
Bourke-White. Stieglitz was among the first to photograph skyscrapers, the new architecture that came to dominate the horizon of America's growing cities. In turn, he championed the Precisionist painters (see p. 431), who began to depict urban and industrial architecture around 1925 under the inspiration of Futurism. Several of them soon took up the camera as well. Thus, painting and photography once again became closely linked. Both were responding to the revitalized economy after World War I, which led to an unprecedented industrial expansion on both sides of the Atlantic. During the subsequent Depression, industrial photography continued surprisingly to grow with the new mass-circulation magazines that ushered in the great age of photojournalism and, with it, of commercial photography. In the United States, most of the important photographers were employed by the leading journals and corporations.
Margaret Bourke-White (1904—1971) was the first staff photographer hired by Fortune magazine and then by Life magazine, both published by Henry Luce. Her cover photograph of Fort Peck Dam in Montana for the inaugural November 23, 1936, issue of Life remains a classic example of the new photojournalism (fig. 508). The decade witnessed enormous building campaigns, and with her keen eye for composition, Bourke-White drew a visual parallel between the dam and the massive constructions of ancient Egypt (compare fig. 36). In addition to their architectural power, Bourke-White's columnar forms have a remarkable sculptural quality and an almost human presence, looming like colossal statues at the entrance to a temple. But unlike the pharaohs' passive timelessness, these "guardian figures" have the spectral alertness of Henry Moore's abstract monoliths (see fig. 467). Bourke-White's rare ability to suggest multiple levels of meaning made this cover and her accompanying photo essay a landmark in photojournalism.

Van Der Zee. The nature of the Harlem Renaissance, which flourished in the 1920s (see p. 446), was hotly debated by black critics even in its own day. While its achievement in literature is beyond dispute, the photography of James Van Der Zee (1886—1983) is often regarded today as its chief contribution to the visual arts. Much of his work is commercial and variable in quality, yet it remains of great documentary value and, at its best, provides a compelling portrait of an era. Van Der Zee had an acute understanding of settings as reflections of people's sense of place in the world, which he used to bring out a sitter's character and dreams. Though posed in obvious imitation of fashionable photographs of white society, his picture of the wife of the Reverend George Wilson Becton (fig. 509), taken two years after the popular pastor of the Salem Methodist Church in Harlem was murdered, shows Van Der Zee's unique ability to capture the pride of African Americans during a period when their dreams seemed on the verge of being realized.

Van Der Zee. The Wife of the Reverend Becton, Pastor of Salem Methodist Church. 1934. James Van Der Zee Estate

Germany

With the New Objectivity movement in Germany during the late 1920s and early 1930s (see p. 437), photography achieved a degree of excellence that has not been surpassed. Fostered by the invention of superior German cameras and the boom in publishing everywhere, this German version of straight photography emphasized materiality at a time when many other photographers were turning away from the real world. The intrinsic beauty of things was brought out through the clarity of form and structure in their photographs. This approach accorded with Bauhaus principles except with regard to function (see p. 477).

Sander. When applied to people rather than things, the New Objectivity could have deceptive results. August Sander (1876—1964), whose Face of Our Time was published in 1929, concealed the book's intentions behind a seemingly straightforward surface. The sixty


LIST OF REFERENCES


Gates, H.L. (1992). Speaking Out: Some Distance to Go. In M. Berger (Ed.), *How Art Becomes History: Essays on Art, Society, and Culture in Post-


245


_______ (1993). Lecture presentation on content analysis methodology research. The Ohio State University.