INFORMATION TO USERS

This manuscript has been reproduced from the microfilm master. UMI films the text directly from the original or copy submitted. Thus, some thesis and dissertation copies are in typewriter face, while others may be from any type of computer printer.

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleedthrough, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send UMI a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

Oversize materials (e.g., maps, drawings, charts) are reproduced by sectioning the original, beginning at the upper left-hand corner and continuing from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps. Each original is also photographed in one exposure and is included in reduced form at the back of the book.

Photographs included in the original manuscript have been reproduced xerographically in this copy. Higher quality 6" x 9" black and white photographic prints are available for any photographs or illustrations appearing in this copy for an additional charge. Contact UMI directly to order.

UMI
A Bell & Howell Information Company
300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1346 USA
313/761-4700  800/521-0600
PICTUREBOOKS AND CHRISTOPHER COLUMBUS:
A CULTURAL ANALYSIS

DISSERTATION

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for
the Degree Doctor of Philosophy in the Graduate School
of The Ohio State University

By

Jennifer Lynn Cross, B.S., M.A.

* * * * *

The Ohio State University
1995

Dissertation Committee: Approved by
K.A. Marantz
E.L. Lankford
A.D. Efland

Advisor
Department of Art Education
To Dr. Kenneth Marantz
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I express sincere appreciation to Dr. Kenneth Marantz for his patience and guidance throughout this research. Thanks go to the other members of my advisory committee, Dr. Louis E. Lankford and Dr. Arthur D. Efland for their suggestions and comments. Gratitude is expressed to my colleagues overseas, Dr. Paul Duncum, Senior Lecturer in Visual Arts Curriculum, Central Queensland University, Australia and Dr. Fernando Hernandez, Professor, Divisio I de Ciencies Humanes i Socials, Universitat De Barcelona, Spain. To my husband, Ray, I offer sincere thanks for your faith in me and willingness to endure the strain of this endeavor. To my children, Katie and Emily, may this work encourage you to follow your dreams. Thanks go to my parents, for their love and support throughout this process.
VITA

September 21, 1959 .......... Born - Columbus, Ohio

1983 ........................ B.S., The Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio

1986-1989 & 1996 .......... Children’s Literature Conference Presenter Columbus, Ohio

1987 ........................ M.A., Department of Art Education, O.S.U.

1987 ........................ Graduate Teaching Assistant, Department of Art Education, O.S.U.

1987-1991 .................... Resource Teacher Columbus Public Schools Columbus, Ohio

1991 ........................ Lecturer, Department of Art Education, O.S.U.

1993 ........................ Graduate Research Assistant The Ohio Partnership for the Visual Arts, O.S.U.

1992-Present .................. Art Teacher Hilliard City Schools

PUBLICATIONS

Cross, J.L. (1994) On being non-traditional. Graduate Perspectives in Art Education, A Department of Art Education Publication at the Ohio State University, 1(1), 32.

FIELDS OF STUDY

Major Fields: Art Education: The Art of the Picturebook Studies in Children’s Literature with Dr. Janet Hickman
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. &quot;Columbus the Hero&quot; iconic images</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. &quot;Columbus the Dreamer&quot; iconic images</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Critical Imagery</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FIGURES</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Tracing of an image of Christopher Columbus in traditional period dress</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Tracings of &quot;Columbus the Hero&quot; iconic images</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Tracings of &quot;Columbus the Dreamer&quot; iconic images</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Tracings of critical images of Christopher Columbus</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTRODUCTION

Introduction

"The drive to story is basic in all human beings. Stories shape our lives and our culture - we cannot live without them" (Bob Barton & David Booth, 1990, p. 12).

In this section, the nature of the problem of extracting cultural meaning from visual images of Christopher Columbus in picturebooks is explored. Three research questions are stated. Definitions and limits are given. Concepts related to historic "truth" versus "story" are discussed. The picturebook selection process is briefly described. A historical overview of story variations provides the context for this study. The need for more research on the narrative function of illustrations in picturebooks is addressed. From the three research questions the methodology is outlined. A rationale for the study is offered.

Nature of the Problem

This study examined how stories of Christopher Columbus are retold through words and images in picturebooks. Speculations were made on how the art form of the picturebook is used to transmit cultural
information within this specific context based on historical research (Handlin, 1993; Sale, 1991). The narrative quality of the pictures was explored (Marantz, 1988; Nodelman, 1988) and a lens was created through which we were able to glimpse the changing face of Christopher Columbus.

**Research Questions**

1. What is the nature of relationships between pictures, meaning and culture?
2. How do pictures in picturebooks convey cultural meaning?
3. What cultural meanings would be revealed through a critical analysis of American picturebooks created from stories of Christopher Columbus?

**Definitions and Limits**

"The story of Christopher Columbus" refers to just that or more. It can include the Columbian encounter with the Taino (Yolen, 1992) or a vision of his childhood dream (Sis, 1991). "Story" according to Barton and Booth "is a living context for making meaning" (1990). More important than "truth" to my research is the notion of "story", for it is a story that we have handed down to our children.
"Truth" and "Story"

Arthur Danto (1989) suggests that human notions of "truth" and "falsity" rely on support from the world.

"You cannot tell from the sentence, "The battle of Hastings occurred in 1066," whether or not it is true. Its truth or falsity is altogether a matter of historical fact. And so it is with the belief that the battle of Hastings took place in A.D. 1066." (Danto, 1989, p. 130)

To relate this to Christopher Columbus, we might say that you cannot determine "truth" from the sentence, "In 1492 Columbus discovered America," without external evidence from the world. But something else has to happen within an individual for "truth" to occur, there must also be "belief".

"So there is a psychological component (belief), a semantic component (truth), and a justificatory component that makes it appear as though there were an ethics of belief - that is, a question of what a person ought or ought not to believe, very much as there are actions a person ought or ought not to perform." (Danto, 1989, p. 130-131)

Danto's elegant reasoning clarifies the role "truth" has played in the transmission of stories on Columbus. This relationship between "truth," "belief," and "ethics of belief" influences how biographers, revisionists, film-makers, historians and storytellers choose motifs and embroider them into what they perceive as the "true" story of Christopher Columbus.

The difference between "truth" and "story" can also be found in the intent of the storyteller. Jean Fritz, noted writer of historical fiction, discusses the
problem of "truth" in her stories. Her purpose in
telling the story is to bring history to life by telling
"the very truth", revealing that historical figures are
first and foremost, human. To Fritz, history is "the
very stuff of life..." Her "truth" is woven around facts
that reveal the humanity of the person and their time.
It is a subjective truth, peppered with a healthy dose
of humor.

The "very truth" according to Fritz, is closer to
Barton's notion of "story" than it is to "truth" as
viewed by historians who write for children. R. Conrad
Stein's *Christopher Columbus*, part of a "Cornerstones of
Freedom" series has a very different intent than Fritz's
and dePaola's *The Great Adventure of Christopher
Columbus*. What is this difference of intent? How does it
affect the visual, textual narrative?

Stein's (1992) book is part of a series that
consistently uses a set format. The book is illustrated
with engravings, paintings and woodcuts. The overall
mood of this book is historical TRUTH. Stein does not
tell a story, he provides the reader with factual
information. The majority of these illustrations are
stock images, credited to Historical Pictures Service,
Chicago. No information is provided about their
authenticity. The problem with a book like this is that
it is designed to convey authority, intended to give
facts that are true. However, many of these facts, when held up to the light of scholarship, are questionable. Under one picture the caption reads, "Columbus was laughed at by a commission of Spanish scholars when he presented his plans to reach the Indies by sailing westward." This is one of many myths of the Columbus story that has been handed down in America. The Spanish scholars of that day knew the westward voyage was a possibility, they were unfavorable because many felt that Columbus had miscalculated the distance.

So Many Books, So Little Time

The purpose in differentiating between "truth" and "story" is to provide a focus for the range of books to be analyzed and to determine what qualities of these books best fit my research. From the previous discussion on the "intent" of the author/illustrator, the focus of my research leans more toward books that have the "intent" to tell a story with words and pictures than books that have the "intent" to present "truth", although there is some overlap. To clarify this further, author Jean Fritz weaves a story, rich with elaboration, around "truth" as we knew it in 1992. Her "intent" is to tell a story, to make the man Columbus real for her readers. Stein, is a historian. His "intent" is to tell a history, to document events.
**Why Picturebooks?**

Could this study be done with film, textbooks, historical documents? Although some theories presented here could be applied to these areas, the focus of this study is an examination of how the format of the picturebook is used to convey cultural information. Many other topics could be used for this. The focus on Christopher Columbus opens a window into American culture. It is a story that embodies deep traditions of cultural beliefs. By looking at the story of Columbus we can speculate about what is happening to our culture as these beliefs change.

Picturebooks are ideal for this purpose; they take on the role of the storyteller, weaving in nuances of time and place, even cultural values, through their emotional capacity. Marantz (1988) eloquently describes this characteristic:

> All picturebooks tell stories. And all stories begin as things told by a storyteller. When transcribed onto the silent page the voice is lost and with it the idiosyncratic manner each teller has in making the story special. The illustrator replaces the speaker and the pictures become, symbolically, the voice that conveys some of the special qualities of meaning that language frequently cannot (Marantz, 1988, p. xii).
Picturebook and Picture Story Book

The word "picturebook" will be used to refer to books that rely on "the interdependence of pictures and words" to communicate meaning (Bader, 1976). This usage is similar to Schwarcz's (1982) "picture story book" which refers to picturebooks that tell stories. All picturebooks use words and images to communicate meaning, however, not all picturebooks are picture story books. Many information books on Christopher Columbus are picturebooks. Picture story books on Columbus are books that tell a story rather than recite information.

Culture

To clarify the discussion of issues, culture is defined as: "a people’s way of perceiving, feeling, believing, evaluating, and behaving (Goodenough, 1976) which can be affected by the environment, the economic system, and modes of production (Harris, 1979)" (Wasson, Stuhr, Petrovich-Mwaniki, 1990, p. 235).

Issues

In "Why Rethink Columbus?" a special edition of Rethinking Schools (1991) we are asked to rethink Columbus because the myth of Columbus is basic to children’s beliefs about American society. According to this publication, the story of the "discovery of
"America" is one of the first things our children are taught about the encounter between two different races in America. A study of the Christopher Columbus story is a study of race relations within and without American society.

June King McFee, in "Cross-cultural inquiry into the social meaning of art: implications for art education" (1986) poses eight research questions to focus art educators on the relationship of art and culture. One of her leading questions has helped guide this investigation: "How does art enhance and transmit cultural values, qualities, attitudes, beliefs and roles?" This question can be applied to the transmission of the Christopher Columbus story in American picturebooks.

An Overview of Story Variations

Stories of Christopher Columbus and the "discovery of America" (1) have shaped our lives and our society. Historically, they have reflected changing values and beliefs (Handlin, 1993; Dor-Ner, 1991; Sale, 1990; Todorov, 1984). Despite current controversy concerning the "Columbian Legacy" (Sale, 1990) the traditional Columbus story is still popular and continues to be retold through picturebooks.
One traditional Columbus story type is said to have originated with Washington Irving's *The Life and Voyages of Columbus*, published in 1828 in London and later in New York. It was immediately popular and its influence is present in many of today's picturebook versions. However, Irving's story has been criticized for perpetrating myths associated with the voyages of Christopher Columbus. Some contemporary picturebooks offer new perspectives that challenge this tradition. Books such as *Encounter* by Jane Yolen, illustrated by David Shannon, tell the story of Columbus from a young Taino boy's perspective, reflecting contemporary concerns regarding the need to illuminate the neglected part of the story. ("Rethinking Schools", 1991)

**A Need for More Research on the Narrative Function of Illustrations in Picturebooks**

The impetus for this study came from my fourth-grade art students as we searched through a variety of picturebook retellings of the story of Christopher Columbus. Students compared *Encounter* with *The Great Adventure of Christopher Columbus* and other versions with similar themes. Students discussed comparisons between words and images within each book, speculating about symbols and meanings between them. As the students talked, I realized that they were moving beyond my original lesson plans; this was more than student
response to visual/literary qualities. They were bringing what they knew about this story to the group and taking away new motifs to tuck into their story bags.

The new motifs came from pictures as well as from words. This occurs because "the words and the pictures in picturebooks both define and amplify each other, neither is as open-ended as either would be on its own" (Nodelman, 1988, p. viii). Nodelman suggests that we look closer at how pictures intermingle with words to tell stories. Citing Stephen Roxburgh in "A Picture Equals How Many Words?: Narrative Theory and Picturebooks for Children," Nodelman points to the need for more research: "Yet critical theory dealing with the narrative function of illustrations, as distinct from narrative elements in the text, is sadly lacking" (Roxburgh in Nodelman, 1988, p. ix).

Most of the research done on picturebooks has been in the area of children's literature (Huck, 1987; Roberts, 1981; Bador, 1976; Hurliman, 1968). Other sources have focused on illustration techniques (Herdeg, 1975; Klemin, 1966) or the artistic process (Shulevitz, 1985, Larkin, 1977). Kenneth and Sylvia Marantz (1988) have spent years combing through picturebook references, and have distilled their findings into a comprehensive reference guide. They have observed that although the
Illustrations in picturebooks have gained attention in this century, more emphasis is placed on concerns about size and shape and less on the importance of the pictures within the totality of the book.

"For me, picturebooks should be perceived and valued as a form of visual art, not literary art. To insist on valuing them as literature makes us appreciate the pictures primarily in relationship to the text, more as handmaidens than as symbols having unique personalities" (Marantz, 1988).

To Kenneth Marantz, the picturebook is not literature but an art object. According to this view, research in the area of the picturebook should move beyond investigations of the relationship of image to text, to explorations of symbolic images and meaning.

Method

To determine the method for this study I asked, "What kinds of questions are these? and "What information is required?" I discovered that each question needed different kinds of information. Questions One and Two were answered through a combination of methods taken from speculative philosophy (Scriven in Jaeger, 1988), aesthetics, iconology, semiotics and literary theories, anthropology, cultural studies, history and children's literature.
For question three, an analysis of picturebooks based on Christopher Columbus was done. What formed the criteria? To determine this, an analytical framework was shaped using Paul Duncum's (1993) "five functions of the visual arts cum children's motivations" and the taxonomy of picturebook conventions described by Perry Nodelman (1988).

Rationale

"Story causes us to tap into the universal situations of life, to stand in the shoes of others in all the world's past, present, and future, taking risks, suffering, sorrowing, laughing, wondering, challenging, feeling satisfied but, most of all, tuning into the archetypes of all story wisdom" (Barton & Booth, 1990, p. 14).

My fourth-grade art class will not think of Columbus again until the next Columbus Day, yet I remain mystified by the shadow of this man who has become an American symbol. I wonder at the power of this story in our society and the manner of its retelling in picturebook form. Stories of Christopher Columbus symbolize the archetypal American, the brave explorer of new worlds, the lone visionary. The purpose of this study was to analyse a broad selection of picturebooks variations on the story of Christopher Columbus to understand what the traditions have been and how they have recently been challenged.
In joining research strategies and knowledge from diverse fields, I have built a base for future investigations on how pictures communicate cultural meanings (McFee, 1986) and the narrative quality of picturebooks (Marantz, 1988; Nodelman, 1988). Analyzing variations of images and texts in picturebooks based on stories of Christopher Columbus provided a specific instance that lead to some sound generalizations.

Footnotes

1. The phrase "discovery of America" is unfortunately unavoidable within this discussion. Please note that the writer is aware that this was not the case, that the lands of the Americas were inhabited by peoples who were destroyed by the Columbian legacy. Although the word "America" appears as shorthand for the "United States of America", the use of this common misnomer was avoided as much as possible.

List of References for Introduction


**Picturebooks**


CHAPTER I

A HISTORICAL SKETCH OF VARIATIONS ON THE STORY OF CHRISTOPHER COLUMBUS

Introduction

The focus of this dissertation is an analysis of picturebooks based on variations of the story of Christopher Columbus. From these books I want to see if it is possible to extract cultural values and beliefs through the relationships of text and image. While working on the three research questions it became obvious that a history of the story variations was needed to provide external information for the analysis. Secondary sources such as Handlin (1993), Dor-Ner (1991), Sale (1990) were consulted to provide factual information regarding the significance and movement of the stories. These sources pointed to primary sources, notably Washington Irving’s The Life and Voyages of Columbus.

But history writing is more a form of literature than a science; gaps and conflicting evidence often exist among sources. For the purposes of this study, the view that a historian is one who builds bridges of understanding through interpretive analysis was adopted (Efland, 1993).
The story of Christopher Columbus (Cristobal Colon) was slow to emerge in the United States of America. From 1600 to 1750 A.D. Columbus was an insignificant figure due to the anti-Catholic, anti-Spanish prejudices of North American colonists. This neglect was largely due to the fact that Columbus did not land in the North; by the time the English arrived his initial contact was deemed unimportant. Many colonists wanted to name the northern portion of the continent Cabotia, after Sebastian Cabot.

The writings of Las Casas, hailing the achievements of Columbus, was available to the colonists through British anti-Spanish propaganda and Dutch travel literature. (In 1620 the Dutch translated portions of Las Casas’s work; making Columbus a symbol for national independence and religious freedom.) The Reverend Samuel Purchas provided a series of volumes on English navigation intended to justify the claim, "therefore this Land is justly yours O English" (Sale, 1990). His version of the story of "Colombo" told of how the new land was opened up for Europe.

Samuel Sewall drew upon this information while applying Puritan thinking to late-seventeenth-century turmoils: political upheavals, witchcraft, the problems of forging "civilization" out of "wilderness". Sewall
interwined the Columbus story with the prophet Daniel and the millennium. He recruited John Eliot, John Cotton, Joseph Mede and William Twisse and others to assist in this research. He hoped to receive help from Harvard but was turned down. Sewall published two pamphlets, describing the New World as the center of a heavenly metropolis. This represents an early attempt to shape the "truth" into a "story"; to mold Columbus into an American symbol.

1750 - 1825 A.D.

After 1750 Scottish historian William Robertson reformed the colonial image of Columbus. His story reflected the "Scottish Enlightenment's" (Handlin, 1993) ideal of manhood. Robertson's Columbus put the events of 1492 into a new mold; the promise of 1492 was to be fulfilled in 1776. Columbus in this form ceased being European; he became the first American. Speculation along this line may lead to questions about relationships between images and ideas over time: "The rich imagery associated with these thought processes fused classical and Christian elements" (Handlin, 1993, p. 85). Images of Columbus wearing a holy cross, eyes raised to heaven are familiar today. Popular motifs such as the legend of Isabella pawning her jewels to finance the first voyage, descend from Robertson.
The image of Columbus became further Anglo-Saxonized by poets of the new nation, trained in the British literary tradition. Alexander Martin’s poem, America, written in 1769 created a mythic link between the colonies, Great Britain, North America and Columbus. Martin’s neoclassical poem was liberally sprinkled with references to Jove and Minerva. Rusticus, a poem attributed to William Livingston, wove into the evolving story the convention of raising Columbus from the dead. This notion enchanted later writers such as Emerson and Whitman (Handlin, 1993).

Philip Freneau published "The Rising Glory of America" in The American Village in 1772. Enamored with the Genoese navigator, Freneau wrote, The Pictures of Columbus, the Genoese, a book-length verse in 1788 (Sale, 1990). In a later poem Freneau is given credit for being the first to personify the new democracy as Columbia.

1792 was not the hopeful time that 1776 had been. Problems of morality and the forging of a new democracy drew attention away from Columbus. Iconography for the new United States did not include an image of the navigator; Columbia, a neoclassical Indian princess, festooned with badges of liberty was chosen instead. Many questions could be raised regarding this; "Why was the name, "Columbia", a possible representation of the
spirit of Columbus, attached to an Anglo neoclassical image of a Native American?" The iconography, like the newly formed democracy, was swift to change. "Columbia" was soon replaced by Brother Jonathan and Uncle Sam (Handlin, 1993).

Nevertheless, the spirit, if not the image of Columbus, continued to be present in America. Early as 1784, King's College in New York changed its name to Columbia (Dor Ner, 1991, p. 330). Hundreds of places, poems, songs continued to bear this name. Columbus, Ohio, the state's capitol was named after the explorer on February twenty-second, 1812 ("History of Columbus", 1990).

Washington Irving: 1828 A.D.

During this time the story of Columbus was retold by a master storyteller to a receptive public. Washington Irving's, The Life and Voyages of Columbus, published in London in 1828 and later in New York was a huge success, translations were quickly produced in several languages (Dor-Ner, 1991; Handlin, 1993; Sale, 1990).

Irving's story was greatly influenced by the scholarship of Martin Fernandez Navarrete, a Spanish naval officer, who retired under a royal commission to compile documents related to naval history in Spain. He later discovered Las Casas's copy of the missing Journal
of the first voyage. For thirty-five years Navarrete searched all Spanish archives for information related to Cristobal Colon. News of Navarrete’s research became known in Madrid. The American ambassador to Spain, Alexander Everett, decided to ask Washington Irving, whom he had met earlier in France, if he would be interested in doing a quick translation of Navarrete’s work. Irving, struggling to make a living, agreed (Handlin, 1993; Sale, 1990).

However, once Irving saw Navarrete’s book, the quick translation became a seven-hundred page first draft. After the project had cleared with his publisher, Irving’s manuscript blossomed into roughly 340,000 words. Although Irving cited 150 sources, and was known to be a thorough researcher, his research was freely embellished with invented details, imaginary conversations and internal monologues. Rather than rely on the new primary material, Irving used unreliable secondary sources such as Las Casas and Fernando (Handlin, 1993, Sale, 1990).

In the Preface of The Life and Voyages of Christopher Columbus, published in 1904, Irving explains his process:

"Soon after my arrival, the publication of Mr. Navarrete made its appearance. I found it to contain many documents, hitherto unknown, which threw additional lights on the discovery of the New World, and which reflected the greatest credit on the industry and activity of the learned editor."
Still the whole presented rather a mass of rich materials for history than a history itself. And invaluable as such stories may be to the laborious inquirer, the sight of disconnected papers and official documents is apt to be repulsive to the general reader, who seeks for clear and continued narrative. These circumstances made me hesitate in my proposed undertaking; yet the subject was of so interesting and national a kind that I could not willingly abandon it" (Irving, 1904, p. 7).

To Irving, Navarrete’s book is a "mass of rich materials", not a history. Irving feared that the sight of "disconnected papers" and other "official" documents may "be repulsive" to the "general (American) reader" who wants a story not a collection of documents. He continued with the assignment because the subject of Christopher Columbus was so interesting and was of national importance:

"It appeared to me that a history, faithfully digested from these various materials, was a desideratum in literature, and would be a more satisfactory occupation to myself, and a more acceptable work to my country, than the translation I had contemplated. (Ibid, p. 8)

Irving wrote a "story" rather than a "history" because he felt that such a work such was needed and desired in the literary field. It is also possible that Irving fell under the spell of the Alhambra, the fantastic Muslim palace in Granada where he lived for three months. (He later wrote Legends of the Alhambra.)

Despite Irving’s explanations, many academics remained unconvinced that his narrative is also a work of scholarship. Possibly, in all the documents that lay
before him, Irving saw a captivating, human character, more interesting as a legend than he had been in life. His story contained many myths that had circulated about Columbus; his youth as pirate, mistreatment by the Portuguese and Spanish courts, the ignorance of the court of Salamanca University who insisted that the world was flat, Queen Isabella's generosity in offering to pawn her jewels and so on. Irving's story was criticized for creating "an enchanted falsehood" (Sale, 1990) but as it was a falsehood rich in drama, the critics were ignored:

"For Americans fascinated by Walter Scott and a fortunately irrelevant medieval past, Irving's Columbus proved immensely absorbing. The book provided a welcome relief to those fed a starched and future-oriented diet. The medieval-minded mystic whose sailings were to liberate Jerusalem proved more attractive than Columbus the First of the Moderns" (Handlin, 1993, p. 88).

1992 - 1992 A.D.

Washington Irving's story continued to live on in popular culture, to be reinterpreted and reborn into plays, poems, paintings, monuments and songs. But America in 1892 was changing, becoming a kaleidoscope of nationalities, customs and beliefs. The Columbus of 1892 went "ethnic". Italian and Irish immigrants identified with Columbus's Catholicism; the Santa Maria became almost as popular as the Mayflower. Although the
pluralistic Columbus was acceptable to all, no story emerged that could compare with Irving's (Handlin, 1993).

In 1892 Columbus was also heavily criticized by academics and ministers who thought him an unsuitable hero. Clergyman Edward Everett Hale started a controversy that continues to this day. He viewed America in 1492 as a "blank page" an undiscovered paradise. Charles Francis Adams, Jr., responded to Hale's speech by delivering a fiery address to the Massachusetts Historical Society. He claimed that Columbus was stubborn instead of bold. Adams blasted Irving's story: "the vein of platitudinous moralizing which runs through the book makes it difficult for a writer of the present day to take it seriously" (Adams, 1892; in Handlin, 1993, p. 91).

Adam's friend, Justin Winsor, wrote a brilliant biography intended to remove the man Columbus from the myths that surrounded him. He was sympathetic to concerns raised by blacks and Indians that Columbus was an unsuitable hero. Winsor's Columbus was an egotistical maniac, driven to make the Indies produce gold for the crown, something the United States should not celebrate. Winsor's Columbus failed to replace Irving's, but it started a movement to rethink the
myths, to tell the story from different cultural perspectives (Handlin, 1993).

An example of this movement in contemporary picturebook form can be found in *Encounter*, written by Jane Yolen, illustrated by David Shannon. *Encounter* represents "...the part of the story that has been neglected" (Rethinking Schools, 1991). It reflects current revisionist thinking with respect to America’s indigenous peoples. The story woven through text and image shapes the world of a Taino boy as he tries to understand the strange white men who look for gold. The imagery is powerful and symbolic. On the last page, a faded old man (who was once the boy) sits dejectedly on a stump, his back to the mission, his eyes to the sea. His legs are translucent, his feet... vanished.

My fourth grade students interpreted this image as a symbol for loss of culture; without feet the old man can not find his way. The text puts the emotional content of the image into poetic narrative:

"So it was we lost our lands to the strangers from the sky. We gave our souls to their gods. We took their speech into our mouths, forgetting our own. Our sons and daughters became their sons and daughters, no longer humans, no longer ours. That is why I, an old man now, dream no more dreams. That is why I sit here wrapped in a stranger’s cloak, counting the stranger’s bells on a string, telling my story. May it be a warning to all the children and all the people in every land".

(Yolen, 1992, from *Encounter*)
Michael Dorris, an anthropologist, is a member of the Modoc tribe. *Morning Girl* is his novel (juvenile fiction) about a sister and brother who live with their family in an Arawak village. The narrative is lyrical and warm, it is simply the story of a family, individuals who are a part of their environment, village, family, themselves. At the end, Morning Girl goes for an early swim and meets a large canoe filled with unpainted people. She greets them warmly, according to her culture, inviting them to dock their canoe on the tribal shore. She finds these people from another island to be funny and a bit stupid. She leaves them to wait until she can return with "the right people".

I mention these two books because they attempt to provide the neglected story. There are hundreds of other such stories from different parts of the world; Columbia, Spain, The Caribbean, Africa...stories that also need to be told in order to shape a global HISTORY. However, such stories were distractions because the focus here was on the stories of Christopher Columbus or the Taino/Arawak peoples in order to find out what Columbus has come to symbolize to American society as a whole. The Taino no longer exist, so the issue of who speaks for them is currently under debate.
In USA Today, Wednesday, March 18th, 1992, the cover story examines issues related to multicultural children's books. Yolen, the author of *Encounter*, is questioned about her decision to speak for the Taino. Although she is a "secondary" writer, Yolen asks, "Why can't a black illustrator do a white book?" If you have to live the experience to write about it, Yolen says, "then I would only be able to write books about Jewish girls growing up in New York". When accused of frightening her young readers, Yolen responds, "Hey, genocide isn't pretty - how do you write about this without being frightening?" ("Satisfying a hunger for ethnic variety", 1992).

Reflections

Images of Christopher Columbus have been an important part of life in the United States. Columbus has functioned within our society in a number of ways; as an image of a great dreamer, an explorer who "discovered" a new continent, an image for growth and expansion. He has become a symbol for a "new world" and possibly, an iconic figure representing the dreams and ambitions of countless immigrants. The focus of this chapter was to provide a context for understanding the role these images and stories have have played in the past, and what they represent to us now.
List of References for Chapter I


Efland, A. (paper presented in class, 1993). Historical research methods for art educators. Columbus, Ohio: The Ohio State University, p. 2-5.


History of Columbus. (1990, August, 17) Brochure produced by the Columbus Area Chamber of Commerce.


**Picturebooks**

CHAPTER II

PICTURES AND THE CREATION OF MEANING;
A POLYVOCAL REVIEW OF LITERATURE

Introduction

"A postmodern text is evocative rather than didactic, inviting possibilities rather than closure" (May, 1992, p. 239).

This chapter is an exploration into a variety of philosophical/interdisciplinary approaches into the nature of how meaning is created from pictures in general and as applied to picturebooks. "What is the nature of relationships between pictures, meaning and culture?"; and, more focused for this study: "How can cultural meaning be analyzed?" These questions have been explored through a polyvocal text that represents a review of literature.

Clarification

The term "pictures" was used to avoid the problem of defining the concept "art". The term "art" may be used to refer to the tradition of looking at specific kinds of pictures in specific contexts. In picturebooks, pictures create a sequence and are not considered to be "art" in isolation from one another, but within the context of the whole of the book (Marantz, 1978).
In this chapter, I have concentrated on those theories and concepts that address the problem of the creation of meaning from representational visual images (pictures) as these relate specifically to the nature of this investigation. Pictures in picturebooks relate to the "artworld"; (Dickie, Danto, 1989) reflecting changes within it while remaining outside of the critical mainstreams of its traditions.

Most research could be loosely categorized into one of two overlapping philosophical approaches: Universalism and Pluralism. Universalism is a philosophical research orientation that seeks to explain all processes related to art and meaning through one universal theory:

"Some traditional Western theories of art purport to be universal: all art objects (whether created as art or metamorphosed into art) are best understood and appreciated through the lens of that theory" (Lankford, 1992, p. 16).

Lankford describes pluralism as "an acceptance of the position that multiple perspectives should prevail over adherence to singular styles, theories or canons of art" (Lankford, 1992, p. 16).

Much of the research would not fit neatly into either category. For example: although Susan K. Langer (1953, 1942), uses semiotic theory to construct universalist theories; Clifford Geertz (1983, 1973) an
anthropologist, also draws on semiotics to create pluralistic arguments:

"The concept of culture I espouse...is essentially a semiotic one" "and the analysis of it to be therefore not an experimental science in search of law but an interpretive one in search of meaning" (Geertz, 1973, p. 5).

To shape the literature review and explore rather than avoid conflicts in research approaches, I used a theoretical framework developed by Harold Pearse (1992) which is based on a tri-paradigmatic structure (Habermas, 1971) to form the "speakers" for an interactive, polyvocal text. To create the polyvocal text I began by describing the form of "postmodern critique" (May, 1992). Following this the tri-paradigm structure was discussed with regard to the research approaches consulted. From this the speakers for the polyvocal text were introduced.

Exploring the Form of Postmodern Critique

Deconstruction "...is not a single "method" of analysis or critique... inasmuch as it is an effort to disclose how a text works or functions in terms of its power and our possibilities as critical readers" (May, 1992, p. 238). This approach to philosophical inquiry enabled me to "clarify ideas" and "reveal assumptions" (Lankford, 1992, p. 197). The polyvocal text format explored by Wanda T. May (May, 1992) was selected because it allowed me to: 1. clarify my thinking on the
nature of relationships among pictures, meaning and
culture; 2. explore conflicting approaches to research
through interactive dialogue; 3. determine which
approach (or combination of approaches) could be used to
guide an analysis of picturebooks about Christopher
Columbus for cultural meanings.

In this chapter the form of postmodern critique
(deconstruction) has been used to explore relationships
among pictures, meaning and culture. In employing the
method of postmodern critique I did not intend to become
an advocate for the "rightness" of any one theory or
approach. My intent was to reflect on the thoughts of
each "speaker" and reveal my own needs as a researcher.

Reflecting on "What Have I Done/Am I Doing"? May
(1992, p. 238) states that she began her postmodern
critique by "decentering" her authority as author. This
was done through an autobiographical account of her
"interests as author"; how she interpreted the "text
task" -her topic within the context of a research
journal, and how she made choices about how she
"should/could speak or proceed". She discloses her own
race, gender and other factors that might influence how
readers conceptualize authority, as well as disclosing
those factors for the other "imaginary/real authors".
Second, May "stages the text" (Ibid, p. 238) informing the reader that other voices as well as her own will be speaking. She described their interests and values; "...and hinted that I would not end up telling you what you should believe or do" (Ibid, p. 239). May cautioned that within each author’s philosophical stance a wide range of values and beliefs exists. She advised us as researchers to be aware that categories tend to make people more one-dimensional, less dynamic than they really are.

Third, May further "decenters" her authority by creating a polyvocal text to "...present material rich enough that it could be re-analyzed in different ways, and so that the reader might more readily enter into an active, critical analysis and interpretation. She added that polyvocal writing also allowed her to examine her own reasons for how she staged the authors and "catagorized (congealed) their discourse" (Ibid, 239).

An Autobiographical Interpretation of this Text Task

As I wrote this chapter I realized that my initial enchantment with the idea of constructing a postmodern critique was beginning to wear off. Just as May (1992) began her article with the heading, "Who Me? A Philosopher"? (May, 1992, p. 226) I found myself
tempted to begin this chapter with the subtitle, "Who Me? A Postmodernist"?

I discovered that the approach I needed to take in this chapter was a postmodern critique which was derived from deconstruction theories. My usual approach to the task of writing descriptive philosophical research about visual images could be called "universalist" and in some ways "modernist." After much research into theories that address the problem of visual images and cultural meaning I became aware of a tendency to look for universal concepts rather than those that discuss plurality.

My preoccupation with objectivity and universality fell within the tradition of philosophical "Modernity." I had always believed that to write clearly, I needed to be objective, detached and unbiased. Unfortunately, the tradition this notion of objectivity springs from often excludes those who work outside of it.

Postmodernism has been described as "a reaction to, a criticism of" (Parsons, 1992, p. 113) the tradition of modernism. "Post Modernists analyze what art means to our culture rather than what art does for our culture" (Everett, 1991, xi). I adapted the postmodern critique approach to this review of literature because through the process of deconstruction the layers of meaning
within each philosophical/interdisciplinary approach, including my own, will be revealed and explored.

The Possibilities of Paradigms

Harold Pearse (1992) takes another look at a "tri-paradigmatic" structure suggested by German social philosopher Jurgen Habermas that he had previously used to sort out conflicting, "highly value laden approaches to regarding the world and, more specifically, theory and practice in art education" (Pearse, 1983 in Pearse, 1992 p. 244). A paradigm was defined as "a view finder"; new paradigms represent new views. When the limits are pushed, a "new world view emerges" creating a "paradigm shift" (Pearse, 1992, p. 244).

Pearse (1992) identified each paradigm by describing it with a metaphor or "root activity". The paradigms are based on the history of philosophy and represent "specific cognitive "interests" with "distinct goals and values" that are not "aligned with any one philosophic position" (Pearse, 1992, p. 244). Pearse used the paradigm structure to clarify orientations to education and art education research and to examine the orientations of new developments in our field, such as DBAE and postmodernism. Like Pearse, I have used the tri-paradigm structure to help clarify the research
orientations and complex values of the literature reviewed.

Researchers who fall within Paradigm I, Empirical-Analytical, value "technical knowing" and their root metaphor is "work". This work helps people describe and control the natural and social worlds. Knowledge is created empirically in the form of facts, generalizations and theories with an eye on "cause and effect". This approach is primarily concerned with "the subject" in this case, with the formal qualities of pictures. Teaching objectives are clear cut and prescriptive, based on sequentially structured predetermined activities.

The use of basic strategies for art criticism discussions concerned only with the "subject" rather than on contextual information or critical analysis seemed to fit in Paradigm I. According to Pearse, DBAE (Discipline-Based Art Education) approaches to aesthetics and art criticism are basically formalist (Smith, 1986); oriented in Paradigm I. Criticism strategies suggested by Chapman (1978), Feldman (1992) and Smith (1986) may operate within this paradigm but are also emerging beyond it in response to changes in the field.

In Criticizing art: understanding the contemporary, Barrett (1994) applies four stages of criticism to the
problem of interpreting contemporary art. He includes a wide range of views on the subject of writing contemporary art criticism and offers concise definitions on the nature of slippery concepts such as feminism, modernism and postmodernism. In his open approach to critical dialogue, emphasis on interpretation and "theorizing", Barrett is pushing the limits of this paradigm into the next two.

Researchers in Paradigm II, the Interpretive-Hermeneutic orientation, are interested in communication. Situational ways of knowing, those that define the structures involved in the creation of meaning, are valued. This orientation is based on existential phenomenology; understandings are intersubjective and experiential, based on the perceptions created among many individuals. They are concerned with "subjective and intersubjective" relationships. The approach is "child centered" rather than "subject centered".

Included in this category is a wide range of research that attempts to find "deep structures" related to the intersubjective relationships between pictures and meaning. Many of the approaches within this paradigm borrow concepts from semiotics or literary criticism to find a common denominator for visual
perceptions which they acknowledge to be different among individuals.

The following researchers are grouped according to an overall approach that fits within this paradigm to provide an example of its complexity and interdisciplinary nature: Semiotics and Symbol Theory: Peirce (in Hopper, 1991), Langer (1942, 1953), Goodman, Eco, Barthes (in Mitchell, 1986); Phenomenologists: in criticism, Lankford (1984); as an "aesthetic" Kaelin (1989); applied with semiotics to narrative art "making", Zurmuehlen (1990); Visual/perception theorists: Arnheim (1969); Gombrich (1956, 1982); Cognitivists, who combine psychological theories on perception and learning with semiotics (Gardner, Goodman, 1977; Parsons, 1987).

In Paradigm III, the Critical-Theoretical orientation, the key word is "reflection," researchers analyze and attempt to transform their social world:

"Knowing is critical knowing which aims to render transparent tacit and hidden assumptions by initiating a process of transformation designed to liberate and, to use a favorite term of this paradigm, empower people" (Pearse, 1992, p. 245).

Paradigm III researchers are examining pictures in an interdisciplinary manner according to a variety of critical social theories and interpretations. These researchers represent a shifting "flux" of ideas on "visual representation" as "a matter of convention" that
is "wholly defined by its historical conditions of origin and reception" (Bryson & Holly, et. al., 1991, p. 1).

According to Philip Pearson (1995) two distinctions have emerged regarding research approaches within Paradigm III. One orientation examines pictures as a semiotic of culture or as "visual culture" (Freedman, 1994). In this approach, pictures are part of the social world, and can be investigated through the meanings within it. In the second approach, "image production" in the social world is explored in terms of social practices (Pearson, 1995).

To apply these distinctions to my own research: Paul Duncum explores "the social functions of pictures" placing emphasis on "why we make pictures and why we use them" (Duncum, 1993, p. 215). His research approach is interdisciplinary, based on "students' developmental characteristics, multicultural connections, and a socially critical position" (Duncum, 1993, p. 215). Duncum's critique of culture (Duncum, 1990) "is founded upon a clearly articulated cultural conception; the semiotic conception drawn from 'culturalist' cultural studies" (Pearson, 1995, p. 7). (Although in my opinion he applies this approach to social practice as well.) According to the distinctions made by Pearson (1995), Kerry Freedman's (1994) examination of "visual culture"
through an application of Kristeva’s concept of intertextuality, also follows this approach.

Writers such as Kristen Congdon, Doug Blandy and Patricia Stuhr seem more oriented toward the second approach, as described by Pearson (1995). His discussion of Bourdieu’s notion of ‘habitus’, "as the embodied state of the history of the social being, presents a reformulation of ‘culture’ to focus attention upon the inculcation of ‘ways of doing things’" (Pearson, 1995, p. 15) leads me to this conclusion. Congdon & Blandy (1987) and Stuhr (1994) are concerned with the social and democratic restructuring of art education, focusing attention on our "ways of doing things". This distinction became important as I examined the vast array of research approaches, trying to determine which is best suited to the problems of this study.

Setting the Stage for a Polyvocal Text

May invited other researchers to try out the postmodern critique format; "If you were to create a polyvocal text on philosophy or educational inquiry in art education, whom would you invite to speak, and why? Whom would you be inclined to exclude or discount, intentionally or otherwise?" (May, 1992, p. 243).

In forming the "speakers" of this polyvocal text I referred back to the problem of conflicting philosophical
approaches concerned with issues related to pictures meaning and culture. The three speakers represent an approach to aesthetic inquiry that is inclusive of a wide range of divergent views and applications. "This will be neither a play nor an expository academic text. It's something in between (May, 1992, p. 227). Like May, I used brackets around each "speaker" to let you know "who they could be as they speak" (May, 1992, p. 227). Interlopers appeared within this polyvocal text through citations from writers to reflect the diversity of views within each "speaker." Also, new speakers may have decided to join us "on-line".

Who was included or excluded in this dialogue? Even though this dialogue was limited to the realm of philosophical aesthetics I included those who may not be by definition, aestheticians, but who are interested in the nature of representational visual images, meaning and culture. Excluded, at present, were art teachers and students. The substance of this chapter helped me sort through complex philosophical/interdisciplinary approaches in order to ground my own analysis and clarify research objectives.

The "stage" for this polyvocal text was basically the same as May's (1992). Each "speaker" represented a composite view of a broad range of philosophical/interdisciplinary approaches within each
of the above paradigms. I have chosen to refer to my characters as "speakers" because May’s (1992) use of the term "author" to me implies a static monologue within a bound text, although her use of the authors was interactive and dynamic. In this text the term "speaker" denotes a composite philosophical/interdisciplinary persona that enters into an interactive text dialogue through an interactive electronic computer "forum."

In the forum, as "Reflective Researcher" I have posed a series of questions regarding the nature of visual images, meaning and culture for the speakers to respond to. Within the resulting dialogue, my own views may have appeared through the "Reflective Researcher" persona, or were couched invisibly within the voice of one of the "speakers". Please note that although I’ve given each speaker a gender, this is for representation only. Susan Langer appears within the Interpreter persona, although a woman, her views are often representative of male research from paradigms I and II.
Cast of Characters

1. Reflective Researcher: me, a white, middle class elementary art teacher who is also a reflective researcher during summers and school holidays and an artmaker/poet/songwriter within the peace of her garage-studio.

2. Formalist: a mature, white upper-middle class male researcher who uses a "subject-centered" approach to discussions of art, meaning and culture. He insists that art criticism should focus only on those formal qualities clearly evident in a work of art (Feldman, 1992). Teachers adore him because they can understand his approach and apply it easily with students of any age.

3. Interpreter: a middle-aged, white upper-middle class male researcher who has studied abroad and enjoys intellectual puzzles. He speaks several languages and is respected for his complex, mathematical reasoning and logic.

4. Critical Theorist: A woman from an under-represented race determined to shed new light on the problems of cultural misrepresentation and stereotyping. A teacher, she believes in empowering her students by teaching them how to reflect on their "visual culture" (Freedman, 1994, p. 158).
Pictures, Meaning and Culture

[Reflective Researcher] Thank you all for coming on-line. The first topic we will address concerns the nature of pictures, meaning and culture. What are your thoughts?

[Formalist] You mentioned earlier that you want to avoid defining the term "art" To me, this is unavoidable. To discuss the nature of pictures and meaning you must understand that "The starting-point for all systems of aesthetics must be the personal experience of a peculiar emotion. The objects that provoke this emotion we call works of art" (Bell in Dickie & Solafani, et. al., 1989, p. 74).

[Critical Theorist] To whom are you referring when you say "we?" Not all of us respond to objects in the same way. Nor do all cultures have a concept of "art" yet they produce objects that hang in art museums under labels created by people like yourself.

[Formalist] We have to have some common reference for what we mean by "art" or else we are all speaking gibberish! That we do have such a reference implies that we all make a "mental classification" between what we think of as "art" and other "classes." There must be one quality without which a work of art can not exist..." What common quality can be found between Persian carpets and the Mona Lisa? "Only one answer
seems possible - significant form. In each, lines and colours combined in a particular way, certain forms and relations of forms, stir our aesthetic emotions" (Bell, in Dickie & Sclafani, et. al., 1989, p. 74-75).

[Interpreter] Your "significant form" is not significant of anything! To pursue "pure form" is the work of logicians, not painters or poets. "An artistic symbol is a much more intricate thing than what we usually think of as a form, because it involves all the relationships of its elements to one another" (Langer, 1953, p. 51).

**Semiotics and Symbol Theory**

[Interpreter] Art can be thought of as a "sign."

"A sign is an object which stands for another to some mind." (Peirce in Hopper, 1991, p. 141). A sign must have "qualities which belong to it whether it be regarded as a sign or not" (Ibid, p. 141). This characteristic of "sign" is called its "material quality". A sign must have some "real connection" to what it signifies. For example, a portrait is a painting of a real person. So it is a "sign" of that person, but it is more. A portrait is a sign of one person indirectly, because the impression of the person was filtered through the painter's mind.
[Interpreter] Now to relate this notion of sign directly to the nature of pictures and meaning I will offer a definition of art which will enable us to differentiate between "a work of art" from other things in the world: "Art is the creation of forms symbolic of human feeling" (Langer, 1953, p. 40). This definition allows us to show how and why utilitarian objects may also be works of art and why a work of so-called "pure" art may fail its intention. "A work of art...is more than an arrangement of given things." Something is created beyond arrangements, shapes and colors that was not there before, beyond the "invention" of new concepts. "The making of this expressive form is the creative process that enlists a man's utmost technical skill in the service of his utmost conceptual power, imagination" (Langer, 1953, p. 40).

[Cultural Theorist] Although you criticize the Formalist and his definition of art as "significant form," you are still in the same Modernist dialogue. Even if I can overlook your constant references to "men" as being the makers of art, I still wonder about your need to define art at all. You seem concerned about "great men" who must create from their imaginations and their need to express feelings through art. Not all cultures view art as a vehicle that exists solely for
personal expression, although your definition does include utilitarian objects.

[Closet Formalist] If the interpreter would make more of a distinction among pictures, meaning and language things might become clearer. This problem has pervaded discussions of symbols or semiotics since Plato. In the Cratylus, the dialogue is oriented toward the problem of the arbitrary nature of language, which is challenged. The point here is that all the speakers of the dialogue understood that "whatever may hold for words - pictures, visual images, are natural signs. They are recognizable because they are more or less 'like' the things or creatures they depict" (Gombrich, 1982, p. 278). You must keep in mind that this discussion is concerned with representational images, that have developed according to evolving modifications in traditional schematic conventions under the pressure of new demands (Gombrich in Bryson, 1991 p. 63).

[Critical Theorist] Your use of "nature" seems to imply that it is universal; however, since your arguments are based on the rise of modern science this is misleading. The idea of pictures as "natural signs" is then problematic, because you are only considering the Western historical tradition of representation: "The notion of the image as a "natural sign" is, in a word,
the fetish or idol of Western culture" (Mitchell, 1986, p. 90). It constitutes the embodiment of the real thing it signifies, contrasting this with non-Western art. The Western idolatry of "natural sign" hides behind a "ritual iconoclasm" that it is based on critical principles that can be empirically tested "against the "facts" about "what we see," "how things appear," or "what they naturally are" (Mitchell, 1986 p. 90-91).

[Interpreter and Critical Theorist] Perhaps by combining our approaches we can arrive at a better understanding of the nature of pictures and meaning. At this point, it seems important to clarify the tangled web of semiotics and symbol theory to examine its history and influences: "The paradigm of semiotics has always been linguistics" (Mitchell, 1986, p. 55). To unravel the strands, we'll consider the symbol theory of philosopher Nelson Goodman, who if often cited with contemporary efforts to construct "a general grammar of symbol systems, but whose ideas tend to undermine this very project as it is conceived in many modern theories" (Ibid, p. 54).

[Interpreter and Critical Theorist] Goodman's concern is not to differentiate his theories from those he acknowledges as contributors to symbol theory such as Peirce, Cassirer, Morris and Langer, but to create his own, which he addresses in Languages of Art. The
Neo-Kantian theorist, Cassirer and Langer stayed close to the idealist conception of the relations between different symbol types. To Langer, distinctions between the arts are not false artificial divisions but are based on empirical facts. Because of this, Langer emphatically states that "there can be no hybrid works, belonging as much to one art as another" (Langer in Mitchell, Ibid, p. 55).

[Reflective Researcher] This becomes a problem because if there are no hybrid works there is no point in my attempting to construct a framework for the analysis of picturebooks for cultural meaning.

[Interpreter and Critical Theorist] Don’t worry, we find this to be an invalid assumption: "An empirical survey of works that attempt graftings of verbal and pictorial signs (illustrated books, narrative paintings, films and dramas) does not immediately lead us to the conclusion that such hybrids are impossible" (Mitchell, 1986 p. 55).

[Interpreter and Critical Theorist] Now the task at hand is to discover why Goodman also separates himself from the semioticians. The title, Languages of art, sets up the expectation that language will provide a model for all symbol systems including pictures. Unlike Roland Barthes who views all semiotic theory as language, or Umberto Eco who wants to throw out the
"puzzling notion" of the iconic sign, Goodman, a "nominalist" tries to resist "the proliferation of entities" while acknowledging that "worlds are made out of names" (Ibid, p. 62).

"Nelson Goodman's nominalism... provides... just the sort of Occam's razor we need for cutting through the jungle of signs so that we may see just what sort of flora we are dealing with" (Mitchell, 1986, p. 63).


**Visual/Perception Theories**

[Reflective Researcher] I have examined the possibility of applying visual/perception theories to the problem of pictures and meaning in picturebooks. What are your thoughts?

[Critical Theorist] "Perceptualism," which takes full bloom in Gombrich's, *Art and illusion* (Gombrich, 1961) is the notion that "artistic processes can be described exclusively in terms of cognition, perception and optical truth" (Bryson, 1991, p. 66). This leads to an impression of art existing in isolation, the artist is set apart, viewing the world through a perceptual lens but never interacting within it. This does not need to be the case: "If we consider painting as an art of the sign, which is to say an art of discourse, then
painting is coextensive with the flow of signs through both itself and the rest of the social formation" (Bryson, 1991, p. 66).

[Cognitivist Interpreter] In my view, cognitive processes cannot be eliminated from the process of perception. That is has been, presents needless problems. The separation of cognition from perception has its roots in the ancient Greek philosophical dichotomy between perceiving and reasoning.

"Psychology, as it came to be practiced, has cautioned us not to identify innocently the world we perceive with the world that "really" is: but it has done so at the risk of undermining our trustful familiarity with the reality in which we were at home" (Arnheim, 1969, p. 5).

The term "cognitive" as applied to perception causes problems for some psychologists who are used to separating sensory activities from the senses of cognition. (Arnheim, 1969, p. 13).

[Cognitivist Interpreter] Images serve as mediators between the realm of "practical" things and the "disembodied forces animating these things" (Arnheim, 1969, p. 135). They can be distinguished by their three functions. First, "Images can serve as pictures or as symbols, they can also be used as mere signs" (Ibid, p. 135). An image can stand for a mere sign if whatever it represents does not reflect its visual characteristics. The problem of signs that do come close to their visual counterparts, or serve as trigger
mechanisms, can be resolved by their nature as references.

Images are pictures in their portrayal of things at a "lower level of abstractness than they are themselves" (Ibid, p. 137). "Abstractness is a means by which a picture interprets what it portrays" (Ibid, p. 137). An image functions as a symbol when it portrays things at a higher degree of abstraction.

[Critical Theorist] Sounds like "Perceptualism" to me. You still aren't interested in looking at anything beyond cognition or perception. Let's get back to the idea mentioned earlier about looking at painting as an art of the sign within a context of social discourse.

[Biobehavioral Interloper] After experiencing a work of art, if you have a revelation, why must you analyze it? "Who wants to!" What we should look for instead of definitions is why the human species has continued to behave aesthetically. Instead of analyzing "art" in terms of an experience, we should ask instead, "What is art for?" More to the point, pictures have continued to be made by humans because they allow us to give order to the world and help us to understand the extra-ordinary by giving it shape and form. Art is a social product created to be used (Dissanayake, 1988).

[Critical Theorist, Interpreter] We agree, but the question is "How does this happen in pictures?" If we
understand the "text-image" relation as a "social and historic one", emerging from the interactive milieu among "individuals, groups, nations, classes, genders, and cultures", our research might be "freed from this craving for unity, analogy, harmony, and universality, and might, in the process, be in a better position to move toward some sort of coherence" (Mitchell, 1986, p. 157).

[Interpretive Formalist] I think you are getting closer to something almost all of us can agree on. Approaches to the study of art "should reflect not only different concepts of art within Western culture but also concepts drawn from anthropology", (Chapman, 1978, p. 123) [Critical Theorist] and social theory.

**Forming the Framework**

[Reflective Researcher] To shape the framework for a critical analysis of pictures I need a clear method that will allow me to examine the text-image relationship in picturebooks based on the social-historical context of the story of Christopher Columbus. What advice can you give?

[Interpretive Formalist] "The quality of our response to visual forms hinges on our ability to perceive, interpret, and judge the significance of our experience" (Chapman, 1978, p. 90). You may want to
consider an "inductive approach" to art criticism. Like "Dr. Watson" in the Sherlock Holmes mysteries, this procedure involves the gathering of "visual facts," interpreting recurrent themes, qualities and ideas to characterize the "expressive meaning" of the art work (Chapman, 1978, p. 80).

[Critical Theorist] This process of gathering "visual facts" to "interpret themes" which characterize the "expressive meaning" will not reveal the motivations that shape pictures. To reveal the layers of meaning in pictures, or "visual culture" we need to look at them within their "sociopolitical and cultural context" (Congdon, 1989, p. 177).

[Critical Theorist] Perhaps you should consider applying Paul Duncum’s (1993) research on *Children and the social functions of pictures* to some sort of criticism method. Duncum (1993) describes "five functions of the visual arts" with regard to teacher and student motivations; "based on the assumption that what students and teachers alike find most valuable in learning through and about the visual arts is what is motivating about making images and using them in different contexts" (Duncum, 1993, p. 215).

The "functions cum motivations" correspond well with the cultural meanings you are trying to reveal in picturebooks created on stories of Christopher Columbus.
The functions are:

(1) 'Substitution'; "pictures provide evidence of having been present, as a tourist before a monument or at an historic event" (Ibid, p. 217).

(2) 'Narration'; "In general, narratives help maintain a stable social order by establishing what the parameters are for the consideration of issues" (Ibid, p. 218).

(3) 'Embellishment'; "Establishing the specialness of an object is frequently related to power, where the extent of embellishment is proportional to the effort to exercise power" (Ibid, p. 220).

(4) 'Commitment/ persuasion'; "Not all persuasion is overt. In societies characterized by the struggle to assert power, all pictures are sites of ideological struggle" (Ibid, p. 221).

(5) 'Personal expression'; "Identifying and valuing individual endeavor is part of the discourse of power and domination in the same way as the other functions of visual art" (Ibid, p. 223).

Describing each function within your critical analysis of picturebooks will enable you to reveal layers of sociopolitical and cultural meaning.

[Critical Formalist] A critical analysis that is general should provide you with some direction without being overly prescriptive or limiting. Morris Weitz is
an aesthetician who is known and respected for his "open-concept" approach to art. According to Weitz, we should quit wasting our time trying to come up with more definitions of "art" and instead see how art is used (Weitz, 1956, p. 171).

Weitz developed a study that examined what critics did when they criticized literature. "Among his conclusions were that critics engaged in one or more of four central activities: They described, interpreted, judged and theorized" (Barrett, 1994, p. xii). Although he defended the Formalist notion "art for arts sake" (Weitz, 1950, p. 202) Weitz established a significant departure from it. His "open-concept" theory can provide a structure for your critical analysis that will enable you to reveal sociopolitical and cultural meaning.

[Reflective Researcher] Thank you. You have just provided me with what I need to structure my analysis.

Reflections on The Polyvocal Text

The polyvocal text allowed me to explore a variety of research approaches related to pictures, meaning and culture and develop an approach needed for this study. My use of the tri-paradigm structure based on the work of Jurgen Habermas (1971) as developed by Pearse (1992)
enabled me to develop a better understanding of the historical traditions of each approach.

In creating the dialogue, I discovered that I identified more with the Critical Theorist than any other speaker. My voice appears within hers. I was also concerned about the social/historical/cultural and gender motivations behind pictures because these shape our realities and what we think we can or can not accomplish in life. By teaching children to look critically at pictures as part of their "visual culture" teachers can prepare them to be critically aware of their visual environments.

**Implications of this Approach for Picturebooks**

I began this chapter on a quest for a research approach that would enable me to analyze picturebooks created from the story of Christopher Columbus for cultural meanings. The need to reveal the assumptions of visual culture for meaning related to gender (Freedman, 1994; Garber, 1992) and culture (Congdon, 1989; Stuhr, 1994) was established through the voice of the Critical Theorist in the polyvocal dialogue.

To relate this need to picturebooks based on a historic event I found that I needed to move beyond literary criticism theories from within children’s
literature and direct my attention to critical theories that deal directly with pictures. Joel Taxel's research (1992) was helpful in establishing a historical overview and social critique of the story of Columbus as in children's literature. But his discussion of the "selective tradition" of children's literature did not adequately provide what I needed for an analysis of pictures and text-image relationships.

Nodelman's (1988) semiotic foundation for a kind of picturebook taxonomy did provide what I needed as far as giving me "words about pictures" to use in a critical analysis. He describes specific qualities of picturebooks in great detail, building from Goodman's theories. What he doesn't provide is a means for revealing layers of cultural meaning within these books. Duncum's five functions of pictures does provide this. By using Barrett's overall criticism method for describing the works, Nodelman's taxonomy of picturebook conventions within Duncum's five functions I had what was needed for the analysis.

In the next chapter; Chapter III, Methodology, I describe the analysis framework and how it was used to examine picturebooks based on the story of Christopher Columbus. Pictures, meaning and culture were explored in this chapter to establish a context for the analysis.
List of References for Chapter II


CHAPTER III

METHODOLOGY

Introduction

The goals for this research were first to clarify the nature of relationships between pictures, meaning and culture and second, to develop a research approach that would allow me to extract cultural meaning from images of Christopher Columbus in picturebooks. For Question 1; "What is the nature of relationships between pictures, meaning and culture" and Question 2; "How do pictures in picturebooks convey cultural meaning?" a synthesis of methods was taken from speculative philosophy (Scriven in Jaeger, 1988), aesthetics, iconology, semiotics and literary theories, anthropology, culture studies, history and children's literature to explore both the nature of cultural meaning in picturebooks and to provide a methodological context for analysis.
To address Question 3; "What cultural meanings would be revealed through a critical analysis of American picturebooks created from stories of Christopher Columbus?" a cultural analysis of picturebooks was conducted in Chapter IV. A historical sketch of story variations was presented in Chapter I.

In joining research strategies and knowledge from such diverse fields, I have built a solid base for future investigations on the nature of relationships between the social functions of pictures (Duncum, 1993), meaning and culture (Congdon, 1989; Stuhr, 1994) and the narrative function of pictures in picturebooks (Marantz, 1978, Nodelman, 1988, Schwarz, 1982). Analyzing these relationships in picturebooks created from the story of Christopher Columbus will provide a specific example that may lead to some sound generalizations for the analysis of any form of "visual culture" (Freedman, 1994).

**Question One**

This question has set the stage for all that follows. In Chapter II, I explored this question through a process of philosophical inquiry within a polyvocal text. Although I consulted numerous sources on the tradition of philosophical inquiry, Landkford's (1992) and May's (1992) descriptions of philosophical
inquiry were the most applicable and are presented in this section to provide some background information. An overview of the historical methods used to provide a context for meaning and culture with regard to the stories is included in this section.

**Applicability of "Speculative Philosophy" as a Research Method**

In an editorial in Studies, "Philosophy of Art Education: Focusing Our Vision," Dr. E. Louis Lankford outlines five aims of philosophy that most educators will deal with in their careers. The fifth aim "To raise questions" sounds much like Scriven's (1988) version of "speculative philosophy" in a more positive light. The process of raising thoughtful questions is described as being "central to philosophizing" because it expands our idea of what is possible, stimulates our intellectual imagination and guards against dogma which "closes the mind against speculation" (1) (Russell in Lankford, 1992, p. 199). According to Lankford, questions are used to build the framework of educational research, theory and practice:

"What is the purpose of education? What content should be taught? To whom? Under what conditions? Asking questions helps us sharpen our perspectives, pinpoint problems, delineate issues, and explore new ideas" (Lankford, 1992, p. 199).

Point of clarification: Scriven (1988) is the only source I have consulted that refers to traditional
philosophical methods as "speculative." Other references to the older tradition include: "philosophy as systems of ideas" (Smith, 1992) "systems builders" (Lankford, 1992) and a process of "calling to question" (May, 1992). After wallowing in the quagmire of philosophical "kinds," I have concluded that Scriven's denotation, "speculative" does effectively differentiate between analytic philosophy and philosophy as building systems of ideas. As a research method, the term "speculative philosophy" will be used to refer traditional philosophical speculation. Arthur Danto is one contemporary philosopher that draws from this tradition.

Philosophy In Action: "Calling to Question"

Wanda T. May (1992) provides a reflective, poetic investigation of what it means to "do philosophy" through four diverse characters that represent a wide range of views; "Philosopher King," basically white, male, Western "analytic" philosophers; "Street Philosopher," based on the character of a bag lady; "Phantom Philosopher," multi-racial, critical of analytic philosophy but not all philosophy; "Self-Reflexive "I", "a white, upper-middle class woman who is a curriculum professor by day and an artist/poet by night" (May, 1992, p. 227).
May's statement that the "Philosopher King" represents Western analytic philosophers such as Socrates presents problems. If the concept of analytic philosophy did not fully emerge until Wittgenstein and other sources refer to the tradition of Plato as "speculative" as opposed to "analytic" then perhaps May has imbued her "Philosopher King" with the historical traditions of Western philosophy as a whole.

May's chorus of philosophers engage in dialogue at one point about "Philosophy as Doing the Right Stuff." According to the "Philosopher King" "Any systematic body of ideas on a subject may be turned into a theory" (Walker, 1990, p. 133 in May, 1992). However, the voice of the "Phantom Philosopher" cautions;

"As nonphilosophers, what we often fail to understand or appreciate is that almost any text can be read as "theory" or theoretical statements of sorts" (May, 1992, p. 231).

The "Philosopher King" provides a recipe for "doing philosophy";

"An author presents a thesis; argues with explicit or implicit assumptions, premises or propositions; presents evidence to support her claims; and then draws full-circle to her conclusion(s) (May, 1992, p. 231).

Both "Street Philosopher" and "Phantom Philosopher" comment;

"Any form of discourse is there for critical reading and/or enjoyment" (May, 1992, p. 231).
If I had taken the "Philosopher King's" advice, I would have created a framework for philosophical inquiry that might not be culturally responsive. However, philosophers like Arthur Danto build systems of ideas that are culturally sensitive and rely on argument rather than analysis. May does seem to suggest that this is possible; all her characters shout in chorus, "More than finding the answers, doing philosophy is calling to question" (May, 1992, p. 228). (But I hear the "King" whispering, "...with a systematic body of ideas...")

How much has "speculative philosophy" been used in my research? Question 1 required the kinds of evidence that this method provides. May's (1992) polyvocal "postmodern critique" on "doing philosophy" has left me with "goose bumps" and "a lump in my throat." I had originally planned to outline the philosophical inquiry method presented by the "Philosopher King", supporting this with additional sources. But the simple words of the street philosopher kept haunting me. She encouraged me to break open my mind and have a "pinata experience", to go out and wonder about LIFE, to get "goose bumps."

Philosophy is so many things. It comes in more flavors that Baskin Robbins ice cream; each philosopher has her own brand. New forms spring up daily, like new mushrooms on old, decaying trees. All these forms were spread before me; which should I have chosen? They seem
based on attitudes about life that transform themselves through scholarship into philosophical positions. For example: deconstructionalists... do; they take apart the "truth" of text, weighing the political/philosophical orientation of the author against his words. Although May's heading reads "postmodern critique" (deconstruction), her process of inquiry stands in dramatic contrast to Derrida's deconstruction of Nietzsche's texts.

Like May (1992), I critically examined the nature of relationships between pictures, meaning and culture through a process of "calling to question." Was I also attempting to separate truth from the combination of text and image found in picturebooks based on Columbus? Possibly. Philosophy like art, is an open concept (Weitz, 1956). It is not dead as Danto (1986) lamented; it is reborn every time a soul bounces her spirit off the universe.

**Question Two**

The polyvocal dialogue used to deal with conflicting research approaches in Chapter II, offered possibilities for how to extract cultural meaning from pictures; clearing the way for the development of the analysis framework used to address Question 3. The nature of picturebooks and meaning and general concepts regarding
the art-of-the-picturebook were discussed in the introduction to this study.

To provide a methodological context for the many layers of this interdisciplinary approach, Kristeva's semiotic approach to literature and art will be discussed as it affects Freedman's analysis of "visual culture". From this will follow recent developments within the critical theory paradigm.

Semiotics and Literary Theory

Julia Kristeva (1980) takes a semiotic approach to literature and art in *Desire in Language*. Many influences can be found in her work, from Marxism to postformalism, from Mikhail Bakhtin to Foucault. She introduces a new term, "semanalyse" (Kristeva, 1980, p. 4) which she defines as a critique of meaning, it's elements and laws. To semanalyse is to describe the signifying phenomenon while analyzing, criticizing and dissolving "phenomenon," "meaning," and "signifiers" (Ibid, p. 1).

Kristeva, expanding on Bakhtin's ideas, presents the concept of "intertextuality." This, according to Kristeva, moves beyond structuralist ideas such as those held by Barthes. She questions meaning and its structures as traditionally known, such as the speaking subject's subjectivity. This involves confronting
semiology stemming from Peirce and Saussure. She is also influenced by Lacan, a French psychoanalyst. Kristeva is interested in different practices of discourse, looking at categories and relationships.

Kristeva probes into the nature of the specific object to see what problems are presented by modern art. In "The Bounded Text" (1969) she claims that we need to move from a belief in one powerful theory to deal with the desire of language, to pay attention to the art and literature of our time. This will propel us toward a quest for Truth. She ponders the question of "otherness" and its relation to "truth." Kristeva defines text as "a translinguistic apparatus that redistributes the order of language by relating communicative speech" (p. 37). She discusses the concept of text as ideologeme, set within the context of society and history.

Semiotics, Literary Theory and Critical Theory

Kerry Freedman (1994) applies concepts borrowed from Kristeva's approach to literary theory; as well as poststructuralism and feminist critique to an analysis of "interpretive responses to fine art and other forms of visual culture" (Ibid, p. 159) by "115 eight and eleventh grade boys and girls from two middle
socioeconomic level suburban school districts" (Ibid, p. 163). Freedman uses the phrase "visual culture" "to refer to forms of human production that function as manifest images" (Ibid, p. 158).

Under the heading "Gender Stereotypes in Visual Culture: A Methodological Example" Freedman discusses the application of Kristeva's concept of "intertextuality" to her study. To Freedman intextuality "might be said to refer to the conceptual space between text" (Ibid, p. 162). Although originally related to textual experiences, Freedman suggests that "The same type of interdisciplinary, conceptual space exists for the relationships between various forms of visual culture" (Ibid, p. 162). She relates the notion of "intertextuality" to her idea of "intergraphicality": "when images cue references to and cognitively integrate with other images, building a conceptual network of imagery and meaning" (Ibid, p. 162). Freedman found this notion of "intergraphicality" at work while looking at a reproduction of the Mona Lisa in a book with some students. She discovered that students also recalled examples of kitsch they have seen created from this image. The notion of "intertextuality" and Freedman's description of "intergraphicality" applied to an analysis of "visual culture" are mentioned here as they
relate to research within the critical theory paradigm (Pearse, 1992) used to structure the analysis.

**Critical Theory, Cultural Studies and Social Theory**

At this point it seems necessary to clarify the differences I have noticed in methodology between the two forms of social theory mentioned in Chapter II. Also, I will attempt to understand the differences between the terms "critical theory" and "social theory" and the traditions they are founded upon.

According to Dr. Arthur Efland (1990), "the critical theory movement" began in the mid-1970's with philosophers and educational historians questioning the tradition of maintaining the socioeconomic class structure and the tendency of curricula to reinforce these structures. The purpose of this movement was to expose social relationships based upon the dominance of one social group over another. Efland states that methods of critical analysis fall into two categories: Marxist and post-Marxist (Efland, 1990, p. 254). Marxist researchers analyze pictures in terms(100,547),(873,932) of relationships between power and economics while post-Marxists view the work of art as a semiotic representation (Bryson, Holly, et. al., 1994).

In the preface of *Visual culture* the editors describe the differences between the two methodologies:
"According to the Marxist tradition of cultural analysis, social life consists of an economic base, which includes the circumstances of economic production and the organization of labor, and a superstructure that includes religious, philosophical, and artistic activity" (Bryson, Holly, et. al., 1994 p. xix).

In adhearing to the Marxist tradition of analysis, art history could only be understood in terms of the historical and social events that occurred within the economic based. Researchers who may be thought of as "post-Modernist" seek to collapse this distinction though semiotic theory:

"By claiming that all aspects of social life, those involving the economic activities of the base as much as the cultural activities of the superstructure, consist of signifying systems composed of signs, these social historians abandon the possibility of seeing through one level of culture to another" (Bryson, Holly, et. al., 1994 p. xix).

In looking at cultural and economic activities as representations these researchers view both as having social value that can be read as different forms of discourse.

The key to distinguishing the differences between critical theory and social theory seems to be in their separate, yet overlapping traditions. Critical theory analysis is either Marxist or post-Marxist according to Efland (1990) while social theory uses modes of analysis imported from social anthropology. According to Pearson (1995), social theory has two approaches that have each been shaped according to "differing responses to the
forces inherent to the field of social theory as opposed to differing conceptions of culture per se" (Pearson, 1995, p. 7).

The first is "culturalist" cultural studies which uses ethnography as its "methodological heart" (Ibid, p. 7). Pearson cites Henry Barnard (1990), stating that to Barnard, ethnography was "appropriated" from anthropology in its ‘colonial’ form without critique of the discipline, or a recognition of the crisis and changes occurring within it. 'Culturalist' culture studies are based on the use of ethnography to study "signifying systems" at "the site of their manifestation" (Ibid, p. 8).

Pearson contrasts the 'culturalist' culture studies with the traditions arising from Levi-Strauss, which were used by Anthony Giddens (1990) to form a "structuration theory" (Ibid). In this approach, "signs and symbols used by the group constitute the actual logic of social life and they are collected and analyzed as such" (Ibid, p.8). Pearson combines the "structuration theory" of Giddens with the notion of "habitus" offered by Pierre Bourdieu to offer a methodological approach to the analysis of pictures that would go beyond the visual analysis itself, to explore the "habitus" of their creation and how this affects the "habitus" of the viewer.
Pearson seems to imply that 'culturalist' culture studies are based on a flawed tradition, that of social anthropology from the "colonial" era, that seeks to categorize visual culture according to semiotic theory and social function, which is fine; flawed in the sense that it doesn't deal with the 'habitus' involved in picture production nor of the 'habitus' of the viewer.

My impression is that Paul Duncum (1993) uses both approaches, and suggests to those who might implement his ideas that they might look at a "wide range of visual expression" with children from their own cultures as well as others. Duncum (1993) builds the "five functions of the visual arts" on the motivations of children and adults, how they use pictures and spontaneously create them. His method is based on "developmental psychology" and the "sociology of culture" (Duncum, 1993, p. 224)

Duncum offers an analysis of the high-culture critique of society in "Clearing the decks for dominant culture: some first principles for a contemporary art education" (D uncum, 1990) "which condemns the dominant, popular culture with which students are largely engaged" (Duncum, 1990). The arguments that displace this tradition come from many sources, those used by Duncum (1990) are based on "Cultural Studies as developed in
England, which is a network of disciplines including literary criticism, media studies and semiotics" (Duncum, 1990, p. 208).

Pearson cites Duncum (1990) in his article "Looking for culture: implications of two forms of social theory for art educational theory and practice" (Pearson, 1995), placing his research in the realm of 'culturalist' cultural studies mentioned earlier. Pearson suggests that Duncum's high-culture critique be extended to include critique of the social practices that influence pictures as well; exploring questions such as "Which pictures are mass produced and which are rejected?" "Who decides which picturebooks are published and which are not?"

Pearson recognizes the importance of Duncum's (1990) research as applied to art education. While stating that "the semiotic conception of culture is the inclusive mirror image of high cultural exclusion," he also adds that "it is precisely this inclusiveness which is attractive for art education" in that:

"It provides Duncum (1990) with a coherent model for encompassing a wide range of experiences manifest in the forms of cultural production most closely aligned with dominant economic and political organization; forms which constitute the 'dominant culture', as Williams (1977, p. 125) terms it, within social life" (Pearson, 1995, p. 9).
According to Pearson, dominant culture is dominant in its seizure of the 'hegemonic' "ruling definition of the social" (Williams, 1977, p. 125; in Pearson, 1995). Pearson suggests that "high culture" meaning the Modernist tradition can "co-habit" within an 'education in pictures' "because value is not located in the dominant culture but, rather, in the uses people make of the most pervasive and abundant signs and symbols in social life" (Pearson, 1995, p. 9).

To relate these considerations to my research, according to Pearson, if I want to effect social change, I must come up with an analysis that also explores the social practices behind the publishing industry. To me this is relevant only as far as it influences what is decided to be published and what is not. Although I can not take into account all processes involved in publishing, I can include writing from artists, authors and publishers regarding their experiences during the publication process.

**Question Three**

To address Question three an analysis framework was developed from the five social functions of pictures as presented by Duncum (1993). Nodelman’s taxonomy of picturebook conventions was used to establish a syntax for meaning in picturebooks. From Barrett’s (1994)
criticism method I will borrowed his insights regarding descriptive criticism. Duncum's five functions provided what was needed for the interpretation of pictures for cultural meaning as well as social function. My task was not to "judge" nor "evaluate" the books I analyzed, but to reveal layers of cultural meaning.

To provide a theoretical background for the analysis framework I will first discuss Nodelman's (1988) taxonomy of pictures and how it provides a syntax for meaning with regard to picturebook conventions. Following this, Duncum's five social functions will be described in greater detail. In the analysis I will use Duncum's five functions to structure the analysis of picturebooks, pulling information from a variety of sources as needed within each function.

**Nodelman's Taxonomy of Picturebook Conventions: Establishing a Syntax for Meaning**

Professor Perry Nodelman (1988) offers his readers "something like a taxonomic classification—a catalog of the many different ways in which pictures communicate information about their subjects" (p. xi). As a whole, Nodelman's work can be viewed as a framework that describes the processes that occur as we create meaning from images in picturebooks.
Nodelman’s framework is divided into three large areas. First, he examines "exclusively visual information"; second, "the meaningful relationships of a series of pictures" and third, "aspects of the relationships between pictures and texts" (p. xi). To Nodelman, a deeper understanding of the richness of the complete book can be gained by examining smaller components of communication in isolation.

**Visual Information**

Nodelman begins his analysis by stating that the complementary nature of text and illustration in picturebooks can be explored "only after considering the narrative content of the books as objects and the pictures by themselves" (p. 41). To Nodelman, the non-textual elements that create mood or "tone" work together; size, shape, medium and style of the artist, paper texture and weight, binding quality and font of typeface, all influence our aesthetic enjoyment of the picturebook as an art object. These elements set up expectations about how we should attend to the work:

"The emotional quality of what is asserted must be conveyed by the pictures, which then inform those who look at them about the tone of voice in which to read the words—the attitude to take toward them" (Nodelman, 1988, p. 42).
Emotional quality occurs through "systems of signification" that create "specific expectations" in viewers, based upon their prior knowledge and experiences. A successful picturebook according to Nodelman, makes use of these conventions and matches them to the appropriate signifiers. Books that are "poorly perceived" often contain "misused signifiers". For example, we do not expect books about giants to be found in tiny, Beatrix Potter-sized bindings. In this example, size is also a signifier, it sets up the expectation that the book is intended for young viewers. From a practical standpoint, small books usually contain small characters.

Nodelman discusses specific picturebooks which he considers to be done by respectable artists, pointing out specific visual conventions and how they contribute to the overall emotional quality of the visual narrative. Visual features such as framed borders work to draw the viewer in; unframed borders open up the total world of the illustration, creating distance between that world and the viewer. White space around a picture can also draw our attention to it. Nodelman also discusses the physical arrangement of image and text and how this affects the mood:
As such, they communicate information beyond their specific meanings. Most obviously, the size of type conveys information about the intended audience; it is a convention that books for younger readers contain larger type sizes (Nodleman, 1988, p. 53).

How does Nodelman account for meaning within visual images? He discusses meaning through style: "The medium is never the message" (Ibid, p. 76). Style is defined as "that which transcends the implications of its specific codes and marks it out as different from other works" (Ibid, p. 77). Style in picturebooks evolves from "patterns of structure" or "attitude" and subject choices, as well a characteristic medium, color range and characters. How does style evoke meaning in picturebooks? Nodelman states that:

"The peculiarities of picture-book style are best explained by the paradoxical combination in good picture books of the narrative informativeness of preexisting styles with a more specific signature or accent—a moire’ pattern exclusive to each book that combines aspects of format, color, shape, and content in a way that conveys specific information" (Nodleman, 1988, p. 80).

Nodelman’s focus in his discussion of style in picturebooks is on how artists draw upon a preexisting repertoire of styles to create meaning.

In Nodelman’s fourth chapter; "Code, Symbol, Gesture: the Contextual Meanings of Visual Objects," (Ibid, p. 101) the main premise is that pictures of specific objects become meaningful within a perceived context. This context is connected to the viewer’s
general understanding of life, literature and visual art. The amount of visual weight given to an object affects how much we notice it on the page. For example, pictures containing humans will receive more attention because the viewer, (being human) will assume that the human in the picture is more important than other objects.

How are objects within specific context weighted with meaning as well as visual importance? Nodelman suggests that meaning is perceived through the symbolic values of visual objects: "Symbolism is the habit of mind through which physical objects come to represent abstract ideas other than their actual selves" (p. 106). These symbols are usually attached to specific traditions, evoking unspoken texts. The cross sometimes pictured on images of Christopher Columbus may be interpreted as linking him with Christianity; a string of beads with the cross, to Catholicism. Nodelman finds it surprising that icons should appear in picturebooks intended for the young, only because they are usually considered too unsophisticated to understand the meanings behind them. To Nodleman, "All symbols are inherently arcane. Only those in the know can interpret them, and a cross is just two pieces of wood to those who are not familiar with its implications" (Ibid, p. 107). He suggests that children are capable of leaping
through the gateway of hidden meanings that such symbols convey when provided with a general understanding of symbolism.

Visual weight and directed tension are discussed in terms of the relationships of visual objects. The pictures in picturebooks can not be taken out of context and hung on the wall with the same effect as a painting or series of paintings. The pictures are not necessarily balanced as compositions. Rather, they move along with the story and may be "excitingly imbalanced." Shapes can also imply specific tensions. Sharp, jagged rocks may loom dangerously against the smooth shore that beckons the ship. Lines also work to draw things together in unified spaces or separate them. Diagonal lines create tension and excitement; horizontal lines denote stability. Size relationships can evoke tension; large creatures hovering over smaller ones can appear threatening. The relationship between the size of a creature against the background environment can also set a mood, for example, a small creature against a dark, threatening sky may be perceived as in need of shelter. Space relationships such as figure-ground will also influence how a picture is perceived.
Relationships

The second section in Nodelman's analysis is concerned with relationships that occur between a series of images. One example of this is to examine how movement is perceived. Nodelman states that pictures in picturebooks make use of established conventions to imply movement. This works by a manipulation of the viewer's assumptions about context: "Since pictures are unlike life in that they stop time, we can relate them back to life by guessing about what must come before and after what we actually see" (Ibid, p. 159).

The third section in Nodelman's analysis is concerned with what meanings are generated when words are combined with visual elements. To discover this, Nodelman asked "hundreds of different people", both children and adult students of children's literature, to record stories that "occur to them" using only the visual information from picturebooks containing texts. Nodelman mentions that these students "always express frustration and arrive at a surprising variety of different stories," yet, when he read the texts of picturebook stories without the pictures, they "often seriously misunderstand the implications of the words they hear" (Ibid, p. 193).

He concludes that "These experiences reveal much about the different ways in which words and pictures
contribute to the total effect of a picturebook narrative" (Ibid, p. 193). Nodleman suggests that "The extent to which the meaning in pictures depends on exterior contexts is confirmed by the stories that people do and do not find" (Ibid, p. 195) in the pictures. This implies that without a text, the visual information is fragmentary; pictures can change the meaning of the text and vice verse.

Nodelman supports these claims with Howard Gardner’s research on hemispheric brain activity:

"What research into hemispheric activity actually suggests about picture books is what my experiments in separating words from pictures reveal—not that words and pictures are quite separate from each other but, rather, that placing them into relationship with each other inevitably changes the meaning of both, so that good picture books as a whole are a richer experience than just the simple sum of their parts" (Nodelman, 1988, p. 199).

Nodelman’s framework of taxonomies represents an exhaustive effort to apply semiotic, literary and reader’s response theories to the problem of how meaning is created from visual elements in picturebooks. I have briefly sketched the main points of each of the three sections of analysis. Irony and the rhythms of picturebook narrative are included in the Nodelman’s last section but these areas are not central to the discussion.
Duncum's Five Social Functions of Pictures: A Lens For The Analysis of Cultural Meaning in Pictures Applied to Picturebooks

The five social functions of pictures (Duncum, 1993) will form the structure of the analysis in Chapter IV. Duncum’s research approach is based on "students developmental characteristics, multicultural connections, and a socially critical position" (Duncum, 1993, p. 215). Duncum builds on Alan Gowans (1981) notion of basic functions, and "willingness to cut across traditional categories like fine, folk, indigenous and popular art" (Duncum, 1993, p. 216) although his "definitions and terminology" and "attempt to match functions with children’s motivations are significantly different" (Duncum, 1993, p. 216). His application of Gowans (1981) work applied to cultural studies takes it a step further, into an examination of how pictures function in terms of power.

The five social functions of pictures presented by Duncum (1993) are not separate entities, but are intended to be viewed as "interactive" and overlapping:

"These functions are not mutually exclusive: indeed they often overlap and support one another. For example, substitute imagery is used by each of the other functions. Likewise, children’s picture-making is not the product of distinctively separate motivations, but frequently the result of a complex set of motives" (Duncum, 1993, p. 216).
The five functions cum motivations are presented separately by Duncum (1993) to clarify concepts, not to imply that they occur in sequence. I will highlight points from each function cum motive that directly relate to the analysis, describing how each will be used. The value of these functions cum motives to this study is that they enable me to reveal cultural meanings within the analysis.

**Clarification**

In using a criticism method of any form I find it necessary to detaching myself, in order to find order and method within the analysis; while at the same time examining the stories from "an insiders experience" (Duncum, 1990, p. 215) both as it has affected my life and what I have observed from my students. The problem of "What do we do now with Christopher Columbus" affects us all.

As I continued to investigate the many paths of critical theory, via Cultural Studies, I realized that according to some "American pluralist", the "imperialism of aesthetic judgement" (Duncum, 1987, p. 10) is rejected. What is proposed is making "defensible judgement" through careful "documentation and argument" (Ibid). According to this view, there should be "no a priori honoring of selected cultural forms" (Ibid).
I find this pluralistic approach problematic as a methodology. Although I have exhaustively researched the story of Christopher Columbus, its social function and role within the "selective tradition of children's literature (Taxel, 1992) and located writings of American Indians on the subject, I have limited my investigation to picturebooks because my students identified the problem they wanted to investigate from them. I am not choosing to "honor" them in any fashion. Yet, according to the pluralist view, my research includes discussion of the aesthetic qualities within these books, which may lead to an "imperialist" aesthetic judgement.

Researchers across the Atlantic also find this relativism a problem. The Marxist approach (or Neo-Marxist) examines cultural products "in terms of their whole conditions of existence" (Ibid, p. 10). "Critical relativism" is viewed as irresponsible in the development of a new society. According to these theorist, "an engaged criticism means offering judgements about the conditions of existence while also describing the conditions under which the judgement is offered" (Williams, 1979, p. 336; in Duncum, 1987, p. 10). To Duncum, in acknowledging the purpose of the critic's engagement, cultural relativism is avoided, as well as "the imperialism of omnipotence, and the
reduction of analysis to mere description" (Duncum, 1987, p. 10). According to Williams the purpose of cultural analysis should be:

"to make interpretation conscious, by showing historical alternatives; to relate the interpretation to the particular contemporary values on which it rests; and, by exploring the real patterns of the work, confronting us with the real nature of the choices we are making" (Williams, 1961/1965; in Duncum, 1987, p. 10).

These are my goals for the analysis.

Aesthetics has been ignored as part of the "rejection of the bourgeois use of aesthetics as the subjective apprehension of the fine, beautiful and vital" (Ibid, p. 11). Marxist analysis has often become too focused on ideology, resulting in a clashing together of two "inadequate concepts" to Williams (1977, p. 52 in Duncum, 1987, p. 11). The advantage of the culturalist view "notably in Williams' work" (Ibid, p. 11) is that is recaptures the "aesthetic", "as a broad range of sensory effects" (Ibid, p. 11) within "the idea of an interconnected ensemble of social practices, aesthetic and others" (Laing, 1978, p. 136 in Duncum, 1987). This view allows me to consider the aesthetic qualities of picturebooks while analyzing them for layers of cultural meaning.
(1) Substitution

The most fundamental function according to Duncum (1993) is substitution:

"No more fundamental function cum motive is possible, for the semiotic act of making one thing stand in for another is the most basic of human attributes [4], and the visual arts substitute better than any other symbol system because they consist of concrete objects with specific graphic equivalents" (Duncum, 1993, p. 216).

In my analysis, the function cum motive of 'substitution' will be used to examine how the pictures in picturebooks about Christopher Columbus "stand for what they represent by standing in for what they represent" (Duncum, 1993, p. 216, italics mine). "Pictures provide evidence of having been present, as a tourist before a monument or at an historic event" (Ibid, p. 217, italics mine). How do these pictures attempt to stand in for an historic event? How do they draw us in to the historical period? When do they depart from the representation of a historical event and enter into the world of Story? When does the story enter into myth? These questions will be examined within the function cum motive 'substitution' from two methodologies; first, through descriptive criticism, relying on internal and external information, second, through examining the iconic elements (Mitchell, 1986) that reoccur throughout all works analysed.
(2) Narration

Narrative is viewed as "a prime motivator for many drawings" (Duncum, 1993, p. 218). This is also supported by Zurmuehlen (1990). For the analysis I will examine narrative or narration as a total storytelling phenomenon, an ancient need to bring order into universal chaos. As a social function narrative, both in text and image serve a variety of purposes. Visual images have been examined as icons for how they are used to "teach" "they seem to speak for themselves by persuading, telling stories or describing" (Mitchell, 1986, p. 2). They also maintain social order:

"In general, narratives help maintain a stable social order by establishing what the parameters are for the consideration of issues. Stories provide models of what the world is thought to be like and how to cope with it"

(Duncum, 1993, p. 218).

A point made by Duncum (1991) as an outsider to American research seems to support my notion of the power of Christopher Columbus, the individualist, as a pervasive cultural icon and ideology in this country:

"So pervasive is the ideology of individualism in North America that it underlies a discipline which to other eyes seems non-individualistic by nature. Cultural anthropology, as practiced in North America, sets out to discover things about human nature, while social anthropology as practiced in England is directed toward discovering things about human societies (Leach, 1982, Ch. 1 in Duncum, 1991, p. 47, italics Duncum's).

In examining the narrative function of image as well as text, I am breaking new ground. Both Nodelman (1988)
and Duncum (1993) point to the need for more research on the narrative function of pictures: "Literacy educators remain largely preoccupied with words, and art educators are equally preoccupied with static images" (Duncum, 1993, p. 219) My research will hopefully attempt to grapple with what Duncum views as a need in this area: "Issues that need to be considered involve the techniques of intelligibly moving from image to image, and the variety of relationships between images and language" (Ibid, p. 219).

How will these techniques be determined? Nodelman’s taxonomy of picturebook conventions will allow me to move between images, taking elements of the story and examining common narrative motifs within all the picturebooks, as well as discussing those that depart from the tradition. The tradition will be outlined first within the social critique of the historical/social function of the story of Christopher Columbus and in Taxel’s (1992) examination of the tradition as part of the "selective tradition" in children’s literature.

(3) Embellishment

To Duncum "Embellishment refers to a cluster of ideas: decoration, ornamentation, patterns or more generally, style" (Duncum, 1993, p. 219). Embellishment, to Duncum, is expanded from the
traditional aesthetic to include "sense activity in
general: the dulling, lulling, the tedious and boring"
(Ibid, p. 219). It provides pleasure can can also
"obscure ideas" (Ibid, p. 219).

Duncum suggests that embellishment also separates
specialness from the ordinary, similar to Dissanayake's
(1988) notion of art as "making special": "Establishing
the specialness of an object is frequently related to
power, where the extent of embellishment is proportional
to the effort to exercise power" (Ibid, p. 220).

Nodelman's discussion of style will be used to describe
the visual embellishment within the books investigated,
and explored in terms of the "specialness" or lack of.
For example, how are picturebooks "packaged" or
"embellished" through design? Do we perceive them as
"boring" history packages or captivating stories? What
differences exists between picturebooks based on this
historic event in books classified as "biography" versus
those labeled as "fiction"?

For example, the romanticized, "story" of
Christopher Columbus the young "dreamer" by Peter Sis is
catalogued "biography" while another, the only book that
presents the story from the perspective of the Taino
people is labeled "Fiction". Yet, both are embellished
and told as "story". My task here, will be to use the
basic design elements provided by Nodelman to pull out
how and what is made "special" in these books, how they are classified and "used" and speculate about the social function involved.

(4) Commitment/Persuasion

Within this function cum motive images "convey the commitment of their author to an idea or action and attempt to convince others" (Ibid, p. 221). Persuasion is not always overt: "In societies characterized by the struggle to assert power, all pictures are sites of ideological struggle" (Ibid, p. 221). According to Duncum "Providing students with the critical skills required to resist attempts at visual persuasion which are not in the students' best interest are perhaps the most important skills formal education can deliver" (Ibid, p. 222). Studies by Freedman (1994), V.O. Pang (1991) and Wasson, Stuhr et al., (1990) provide examples of how to examine "visual culture" with students.

For the analysis I will look at how commitment/persuasion is evident within the social function of the stories as they have been retold. I will look for the point of view of the artist and author in regards to the influence of "power" at work in the retelling. What is the purpose of the story as it is presented? What social function does it serve? What iconic images exist?
Barrett (1994) describes exhibition materials created by museum educators based on an exhibition by artist Fred Wilson entitled "Mining the Museum" at the Maryland Historical Society in Baltimore. Wilson's work functioned as a social critique of the power and influence of museums; who they do or do not represent. The museum educators asked visitors to consider any object in light of the following four questions, "none of which would have been asked of an art object during the reign of Modernism:

For whom was it created?
For whom does it exist?
Who is represented?
Who is doing the telling? The hearing? [42]"
(Barrett, 1994, p. 132)

These questions were internalized as I examined the function of commitment/persuasion in the analysis.

(5) Personal expression

Duncum (1993) describes two misconceptions about personal expression: one, that it "involves unfettered freedom" and two, "it is the special province of the fine arts" (Ibid, p. 22). He describes the research of Gowans (1981) who argues that prior to the nineteenth century "what is now called fine art performed each of the five functions, but subsequent to the emergence of a self-conscious avant-garde, fine art expunged all social functions save that of personal expression" (Duncum, 1993, p. 222).
The "ideology of individualism" is so prevalent according to Duncum that "it often underpins the way essentially collaborative arts are viewed, so that even the history of cinema has been written in terms of a tradition of great individuals" (Ibid, p. 222). This is especially true in the area of picturebooks, which are cataloged in libraries according to the name of the writer only, even though they are collaborative works. This is not to criticize the library system, which must do what it does for practical reasons. But it does point to the problem of individualism. Illustrators "illustrate" stories told by someone else, they are not recognized as being storytellers themselves through the power of the images they create. No matter how large the pictures and how spare the text, it is the writer who is usually recognized as the "original creator" and so books are cataloged accordingly. Picturebooks both written and illustrated by the same person are in a somewhat different position. The artist/illustrator is indeed the sole "creator" and is regarded as such by book reviewers, critics and libraries.

The crux of this function for my analysis will be to call attention to the storytelling quality of the images, as a collaboration with the text and not to be separated from it. Duncum (1993) writes that "it is necessary to acknowledge the historically determined and
socially constructed nature of individual achievement" (Ibid, p. 222). Applied to the analysis framework this involves a thorough investigation into the nature of the story; how it has been retold through the picturebooks I have analyzed, and of how the illustrators function as collaborative narrators or as "creators" using both image and text within the social structure in which they operate. Discussion of this function will occur within the analysis within the above four functions cum motives and will be introduced separately at the end of the analysis to describe my findings.

**Data Collection**

Book selection will be determined in two ways; first, by the "intent" of the author/illustrator regarding the story of Christopher Columbus and second, by criteria set by Marantz (1978) and Nodelman (1988) for identifying picturebooks. How is it possible to determine the "intent" of these books? My guess is that "intent" can be discovered by asking "Which format does this picturebook follow; picture story book or information book?" To do this I must first discover what "format" means and then compare the formats of these two types of books.

Format refers to the overall tone of the book. Nodelman (1988) describes this as: "The non-textual
elements that create mood or atmosphere in picturebooks", "They are not objects within an individual picture but, rather, predominating qualities of the book as a whole—matters like the size or shape of pictures (or even of the book the pictures are found in), the artist's choice of medium and style, the density of texture, and the qualities of colors. Paper (glossy, mat finish, handmade), type face, page layout and overall book design also contribute to format.

To compare the formats of information and picture story books, I will examine all factors that contribute to the overall tone. Information on artists and illustrators, library catalogues and book reviews will be used to support book choices.

Kubler (1962) states, "A principal aim of the historian therefore is to condense the multiplicity and the redundancy of his signals by using various schemes of classification that will spare us the tedium of reliving the sequence in all its instantaneous confusion." My data will consist of American picturebook retellings of the story of Christopher Columbus that can be accessed through the Columbus Metropolitan Library System that would be included in a teacher collection. To reduce the "multiplicity" of the "signals" the data will first be placed on a narrative continuum with regard to the type of story retold, then analyzed for
cultural/social meaning within the five social functions described by Duncum (1993).

The narrative continuum will reflect the duality of image and text. For example, two picturebook retellings, *Encounter* by Yoland/Shannon (1992) and *Follow the Dream* by Peter Sis (1991) represent contrasting views and approaches. *Encounter* represents "the part of the story that has been neglected" (Rethinking Schools, 1991). It reflects current revisionist thinking with respect to America's indigenous peoples. *Follow the Dream*, at the other pole, tells the story of the boy Columbus who had a great dream. Peter Sis, the author/illustrator is a native Czechoslovakian who immigrated to the U.S. in 1982. "He was inspired by his own discovery of a new world to think about Christopher Columbus and that most famous voyage of exploration" (Jacket leaf). Sis's book conveys the story of Irving, flavored with the fire and passion for discovery held by the wave of immigrants in the late 1800's. (This was crowned by the gigantic national celebration in 1892 when Columbus "went ethnic").

Books for detailed analysis will be selected by their adherence to the criteria for picturebooks (Marantz, 1988; Nodelman, 1988) and by the significance of the version retold. For example, there are many picturebooks that carry most of the narrative elements
of the Irving text. The visual narrative, however, is strikingly different, sometimes even at odds with the text. I will be looking for qualities of narrative that convey distinct kinds of cultural information.

Footnotes

1. Betrand Russell (1872-1970) has been recognized for his reaction against idealism and for establishing the mathematical foundation of logic used by many contemporary philosophers (Bales, 1987).
List of References for Chapter III


**Picturebooks**


CHAPTER IV
CHRISTOPHER COLUMBUS AND CULTURAL MEANING:
A PICTUREBOOK ANALYSIS

Introduction

In this analysis, I argue that Christopher Columbus has become a cultural icon in the United States of America, one that has been created more from myth and "the selective tradition in children’s literature" (Taxel, 1992, p. 8, p. 26) than historical facts. This iconic image represents a history of individualistic thinking that has led to the silencing of other historical facts such as genocide (Yolen, 1992a), enslavement and forced removals of Native Americans to reservations. It has also come to symbolise the "American dream", the immigrant hope of finding a better life in a new land (Sis, 1991), of curiosity and valor; "to boldly go where no man has gone before" (Gene Roddenberry, the original "Star Trek" theme).

The analysis was written from an "insiders" perspective (Duncum, p. 214). The story of Christopher Columbus, entwined with iconic images from textbooks, picturebooks and other forms of "visual culture" has
influenced much of my thinking. As a researcher, I wanted to boldly go where no woman has gone before; to create a new approach for the analysis of picturebooks. Through this research I have seen the need to shed this myth. We have had enough of this kind of thinking. Instead, I need to build on the work of others, to view this research as but one strand in a complex social tapestry.

The purpose of this chapter is to analyze picturebooks created from the story of Christopher Columbus for cultural meaning. The framework for the analysis was taken from Duncum's (1993) five social functions cum motivations for pictures. Research directly related to each function is used to support social/cultural interpretations. Within the five functions, Perry Nodelman's (1988) taxonomy of picturebooks conventions and Terry Barrett's (1994) criticism method will provide the kinds of visual evidence needed to support my findings.

This chapter is organized as follows: First, the book selection process is described. Second, the analysis of picturebooks is presented within each of Duncum's (1993) five social functions of pictures. In the first function, 'substitution,' each book is analyzed individually to determine the overall iconic image of Columbus. In the other four functions, the
analysis is conducted through comparisons to avoid duplication. Individual works are described to illustrate arguments and provide evidence for interpretations. Findings from the analysis are summarized at the end of the chapter.

**Picturebook Selection**

I began the picturebook selection process by asking the following questions: "What picturebooks on Christopher Columbus are available to children within the Columbus Metropolitan Library System?" and "How are they referenced, as "biographies" or "stories"?" I used a variety of methods to locate the picturebooks I wanted to examine. Joel Taxel's (1992) bibliography was consulted, as well as the books recommended under "Elementary books" in *Rethinking Schools* (1991, p. 86). Computer searches were conducted under: "Columbus, Christopher": "biography", "fiction" and "stories" as well as broad subject searches under topics such as "exploration" and "American History" and "Indians of North America".
Criteria

Pictures in picturebooks "exist primarily so that they can assist in the telling of stories" (Nodelman, 1988, vii) through their unique dual narrative. The difference between a picturebook and an illustrated book lies in the balance between image and text. In illustrated books, the pictures can be removed; the text can tell the story by itself. Illustrations may enhance or extend the world of the text but are not necessary for the story. In picturebooks, the pictures are necessary, they provide the emotional qualities of the story, filling in what the text omits. They can not be removed from the text, each symbolic form needs the other (Bader, 1976; Marantz, 1978; Nodelman, 1988; Cross, 1987, unpublished Master’s thesis).

Based on this criterion, twenty picturebooks were selected. They were grouped into the following categories:

Category I: Picturebook Biographies

(1) Christopher Columbus. Based on the text of Ceserani, pictures by Piero Ventura (1978).


(3) Christopher Columbus. By Jan Gleiter & Kathleen Thompson, pictures by Rick Whipple (1987).

(4) Christopher Columbus. (First Biographies) By Jan Gleiter & Kathleen Thompson, pictures by Rick Whipple (1995).
(5) **Christopher Columbus.** (Step into Reading series, for grades 1-3). By Stephen Krensky, pictures by Norman Green (1991).

(6) **The value of curiosity; the story of Christopher Columbus** A "ValueTale" by Spencer Johnson, M.D., pictures by Pileggi (1977).

(7) **Christopher Columbus and the great voyage of discovery** ("with a message from President George Bush"). By JoAnne B. Weisman and Kenneth M. Deitch, pictures by Marion Eldridge (1990).

**Category II: "Columbus Day" Picturebooks**

(8) **My first Columbus Day book.** By Dee Lillegard, pictures by Betty Raskin (1987).

(9) **Our Columbus Day book.** (A Special Day Book) By Jane Belk Moncure, pictures by Jean Shackelford (1986).

(10) **What is Columbus Day?** By Margot Parker, pictures by Matt Bates (1985).

**Category III: Picture Storybooks that Contain Elements of Traditional Biographies:**


(13) **All pigs on deck: Christopher Columbus's second marvelous voyage.** By Laura Fischetto, pictures by Leitzia Galli (1991).

(14) **In 1492.** By Jean Marzollo, pictures by Steve Bjorkman (1991).

(15) **Follow the Dream: The story of Christopher Columbus.** By Peter Sis (1991).

(16) **I, Christopher Columbus.** By Lisl Weil (1983).

(17) **The canary who sailed with Columbus.** By Susan Wiggs, pictures by Sharon Loy Anderson (1989).
Category IV: Picturebooks that Represent Different Perspectives:


Limits

I have chosen to limit the analysis to picturebooks that would appear in a teacher collection from Main Library that children in the Columbus, Ohio area would have access to. Older picturebooks found at the Edgar Dale Media Center on The Ohio State University campus would be appropriate if the analysis were to consist of an overall cultural critique of the biographical story in picturebooks. I did explore this possibility, but discovered that my goal was to analyze the "selective tradition" in books that my elementary students would be exposed to in the classroom. The main thrust of the analysis is to examine what the tradition continues to be, contrasted with works that challenge it.
A Cultural Analysis of Picturebooks Based on Duncum's Five Functions of the Visual Arts cum Children's Motivations

(1) Substitution

This function cum motive was analysed in the twenty picturebooks based on Columbus through visual evidence concerning symbolism and the iconic nature of the image of Christopher Columbus. Nodelman’s (1988) chapter; "Code, symbol, gesture: the contextual meanings of visual objects" will be used to support visual descriptions and interpretations.

The following concepts are borrowed from Nodelman for the analysis of the "substitution" function:

1. The function of symbolism within the picture.
   "As many studies of visual iconography have shown, traditional visual art is replete with such symbols. So, perhaps surprisingly, are many picturebooks" (Ibid, p. 107). To reveal the cultural meanings behind the symbols, it is necessary to examine them in relation to other objects within the picture and according to their context. 2. Visual weight. Nodelman suggests that in pictures containing images of people and other objects that the viewer will attend first to the people in the picture, or animals that "tell" the story; focusing on faces, expressions and gestures. The meanings we derive from these as viewers are based on cultural assumptions:
"Cultural assumptions allow us to derive information from the gestures and postures of characters, both animals and humans. We understand that upturned lips mean happiness, slumped heads sadness, and so on" (Nodleman, 1988, p. 117). Visual weight is described in each book, related to the concept of Christopher Columbus as a cultural icon. Gesture, facial expression and the context of symbols pictured with the image of Columbus are analyzed.

The Iconic Images of Christopher Columbus

"Images are not just a particular kind of sign, but something like an actor on the historical stage, a presence or character endowed with legendary status, a history that parallels and participates in the stories we tell ourselves about our own evolution from creatures "made in the image" of a creator, to creatures who make themselves and their world in their own image" (Mitchell, 1986, p. 9).

According to Mitchell, images have a history, one that is loaded with cultural information. Cultural meaning is generated between what iconic import the image has within the cultural traditions and what each member of a culture brings to the image. The iconic images of Christopher Columbus tell us about ourselves, our beliefs within a specific historical tradition that evolved in response to social changes. The history of the story of Columbus presented in Chapter I reveals the
change of elements of this story from "fact" into the grand mythic narrative of Washington Irving.

The analysis of picturebooks within this function is based on the proposition that the iconic images of Christopher Columbus descend from paintings and symbols used to illustrate biographical texts. Although these iconic images also appear in picturebooks, they are portrayed differently. For example, on the covers of many illustrated biographies, Columbus appears as a lone visionary, eyes raised to heaven, chin set in determination, dressed in cornered hat and cloak. Often he is pictured holding symbols of exploration, maps, flags or navigational devices. Depending on the historic emphasis of the text, Columbus is either pictured on a ship, dreaming off onto the horizon or as arriving on the shores of the "New World", leaning on his sword.

The differences between the covers of the biographies and the picturebooks can be found in the design and layout of the images and text. Biographies tend to be "packaged" or formatted as "true" while the picturebooks are designed to be perceived as "story". This will be explored in greater detail under the third function, "embellishment". What is different in the picturebooks is how the dual narrative through image and text shifts the emphasis from historic "truth" to
"story" allowing for a greater variety of iconic images and interpretations.

To analyze twenty picturebooks for the substitution function, I created a conceptual framework to reveal the overall iconic image of Christopher Columbus within the dual narrative of text and image. The framework consists of the following questions:

1. What is the overall iconic image based on my survey of all images of Columbus and text?
2. What kinds of evidence supports this? (Symbol, gesture, facial expressions, text.)
3. How do the other characters in pictures and text relate to Columbus and support the iconic image represented?

**Analysis of Picturebooks for Iconic Images**

**Category I: Picturebook Biographies**


The central iconic image is the Santa Maria. The caravel sails diagonally off to the right on the cover, and inside on a double page spread. Around all sides, long canoes filled with miniscule, playful, bare "Arawaks" appear to be rowing out to greet it. The largest mast contains an iconic "Madonna and Child" image painted in the center of a red Spanish Cross.
The smaller front mast bears another Spanish Cross which surrounds a red, gold and white coat of arms.

A small cartoonish image of Christopher Columbus is included on one page opposite "The Crew" text heading. He is shown wearing the traditional hat and cloak at the top of a large heirarchical pyramid of tiny figures that represent various crew members. Columbus appears to be pointing with his right hand, while his left is tucked into a belt. Around his neck hangs a beaded medallion, possibly a rosary. Other symbols include a Spanish flag and simple wooden cross that are planted in the soil of the "new land".

The tiny characters lend more visual weight to the ship, making it the most powerful image. In this picturebook, the ship is an icon for "Discovery". Images of ocean sea and inlets suggests that the iconic ship sails through "symbolic paths to wisdom" (Nodelman, 108). The overall iconic image of Columbus is The Hero, "Admiral of the Ocean Sea" who commands the iconic ship of "Discovery".

(2) *Columbus*, Ingri & Edgar Parin D’Aulaire (1955).

The central iconic image is Columbus the Dreamer. On the cover and in many scenes, a "reddish-blond", blue-eyed Columbus looks off to the horizon, or ponders round objects with sketchy faces laughing behind him. This iconic image is evident in the first scene; a large
open double doorway through which young Christopher is about to step, holding a model ship, eyes gazing dreamily beyond the page. Almost hidden in the "gutter" is a light pencil sketch of an old bearded man clutching a staff, wading in ankle-deep water. He appears dream-like against one of the doors, near a key. Above him floats a cherub holding a small cross. Light rays eminate from their heads, similar to drawings of saints.

Nodleman (1988) suggests that doors and gates represent "symbolic thresholds" (Ibid, p. 108) particularly in pictures where a journey is about to take place. The icon of "Columbus the Dreamer" celebrates his navigational achievement while excusing his inept leadership on land. The "Indians" are depicted as helpful and friendly at first, but later become secretive, peering out through tropical vegetation. The overall iconic image of "Columbus the Dreamer" in this book is "blessed" and continues to follow his dream despite shackles and misunderstandings.

(3 & 4) Christopher Columbus, Gleiter, J. & Thompson, K. pictures by Rick Whipple (1987, 1995).

The images between these two editions are almost exactly the same, except for the covers. In the 1987 edition, Columbus in traditional hat and cloak, grips the ship rail with one hand and a scroll in the other. His expression is calm, serene, chin set in determination. He appears to be at ease, a born leader,
confident and wise, gazing off toward a distant shore, against a sunset. In the 1995 edition, the image of a younger Columbus sighting land through a telescope pulled from a book page, replaces the 1987 cover image of Columbus. In the 1995 edition, one picture was removed, I suspect for economic reasons. No new images were added.

The iconic image of Columbus in these books is Columbus the Hero. Most of the pictures contain images of an active, tanned white-haired Admiral, smiling sagely as he listens to his son, Fernando (Ferdinand in Adler, 1991). Fernando gazes at his father with admiration.

The image of the first contact is very iconic: a "chief" stands center behind a mat on which baskets of food and beads have been aesthetically placed. Three beautiful women kneel beside the chief. Columbus in traditional cap and cloak strides forward confidently to meet them.

One of the last images is that of lofty, beautiful Queen Isabella stepping from her throne to honor Columbus by placing a blue ribbon around his neck. Columbus is viewed from the back, standing tall and straight as an Olympic gold medalist. The character of
Fernando, who preserves the memory of "Christopher Columbus, Admiral of the Ocean Sea" reinforces this image.


The iconic image in this picturebook is also Columbus the Hero. From the cover image of Columbus holding out gifts of beaded necklaces to "friendly Indians" to the last image; a statue depicting a tall, confident, domineering leader, Columbus is painted larger than life, a hero who calmly strides onto a "new land", who seldom expresses fear.

He is portrayed with reddish blond hair, in traditional hat and cloak. Hand raised to the stars, holding a sextant, Columbus charts his course. He calmly gazes at crew members who threaten to mutiny, an appeal can be seen in his facial expression for them to be calm and reasonable. Columbus bears the Spanish coat-of-arms as he arrives on shore, ready to claim the new land. Returning to Spain, he travels to greet the King and Queen on a donkey, surrounded by rejoicing townspeople. He bows before the King and Queen, head bare, face proud but humble: "Columbus is a hero" (text p. 46).

This iconic image is a modern application of Columbus the Hero in this picturebook series of biographies that instruct children in "values". Columbus is given the most visual weight, portrayed comic-book style with a bulbous nose, round brown eyes and dark hair, dressed in traditional hat and cloak, holding a scroll map. He is shown on the cover peering out to the horizon, one hand raised over his eyes, in the other a map. This gesture is mimicked by his friend, "See Gull".

The crew, diverse in skin tone but similar in cartoonish style, smile at Columbus and respect him enough to tell him when they are afraid they will not find land. The "Indians" are represented as stereotypical comic book characters wearing grass skirts and arm bands. They hide, then greet Columbus and crew and point to various aspects of their island, while a cartoon bubble over Columbus' head indicates that he is still looking for gold. At the end, crew members embrace, "thumbs up", proud of their accomplishments with Columbus. He is greeted with joy in Spain by Queen Isabella and King Ferdinand. The text at the end of the book suggests to children that if they are curious they will find out wonderful things that will make them
happier "Just like our curious friend, Christopher Columbus" (Ibid, p. 62).

(7) Christopher Columbus and the great voyage of discovery, By Weisman, J.B. & Deitch, K., pictures by Marion Eldridge (1990).

The broad iconic image of this "picture book biography" is Columbus the Hero who believed that his success was a "miracle" of God. The book is prefaced with an endorsement from President Bush, illustrated with his photograph in front of an American flag, iconic images of leadership, democracy and national pride.

The cover image of Columbus depicts him as a sensitive, determined older man, graying reddish hair and blue eyes that survey the "new land" he is about to "claim" with an unfurled Spanish flag. A boy with dark hair and cap kneels in prayer behind him; beside him is a man dressed in white, dark hair bare, gently smiling. His calm gaze and simple dress seem to indicate a religious vocation. The ship is moored in the background, Arawaks look on behind tall grass. The Arawaks welcome Columbus, on one page they hold out rolled tobacco to him while he gazes indulgently. He ponders a bean map made by one "Indian" with the same indulgent smile.

Over the text heading; "The Triumphant Return" Columbus rides horseback into a lavishly festooned Barcelona, the main street filled with joyous townspeople. Smiling Arawaks lead the procession.
Columbus is honored by the King and Queen of Spain in the last scene. Nobels cheer in the background, in the foreground, young boys struggle to glimpse the hero.

**Category II: Columbus Day Picturebooks**


The iconic image is that of Columbus the Hero. This is evident from the first image of a child who "knew what he had to be - an explorer"; to the last, another "explorer" traces the way to the Indies on a map, following "Columbus' plan". Opposite the heading "A New World", Columbus appears in the foreground on bended knee; in one hand the Spanish flag, in the other a sword that extends off the page. His expression is that of divine communion, repeated in the faces of the crew. A priest, dressed in a brown monastic robe belted by a rope off of which hangs a rosary, holding a simple wooden cross adds iconic symbolism to this scene.

On the next page Columbus appears as a friend of the "natives". Dressed in a simple white tunic and green robe, reddish brown head bare, he seems to be trading his red cap for a red parrot. The heroic Columbus appears before the King and Queen of Spain, presenting the "Indian friends" as well as the other offerings of fruits, parrots and decorated pots. The iconic image of Columbus the Hero is reinforced toward the end of the
book, through an image of "his son" leaning over a scroll by candlelight. The text on the scroll reads: "This prophecy was fulfilled by my father, the admiral, in the year 1492" (Ibid, p. 28). The rhyming text refers to the alleged reading of Seneca by Columbus, "A great new continent will be found" (p. 29).


This book is for young children to show them "how we celebrated Columbus Day in our class" (Ibid, half-title page). The overall iconic image is Columbus the Hero. In the first image shown to the "class", Columbus is viewed from the back, a brown cap covers his golden hair. Holding a scroll, he gazes at the ships drifting out to sea. In the next scene, Columbus kneels before the King and Queen of Spain, still holding the scroll. The iconic image of the landing scene is similar to others; Columbus with Spanish flag in one hand, sword in the other, a well dressed priest with golden crucifix kneeling behind him. But this Columbus does not kneel, he stands, dominant and proud, golden head bare wearing a large golden Spanish Cross around his neck. His eyes survey the land like a king surveying his kingdom. He trades with "friendly Indians" who offer him gifts of food and parrots.

The last image shows the heroic explorer in a plush fur robe, golden medallion on his breast, presenting the
"Indian friends" and gifts of pineapples, yams and gold ornaments to the King and Queen of Spain. Nobles appear in the shadows. In this picturebook, Columbus the Hero helped to pave the way for other explorers to find the "Indies" and found a "rich, new world".


This picturebook tells the story of Columbus Day and why it is celebrated from a child’s perspective. The iconic imagery relates to the alleged fears of sailors, represented by images of a ship being tossed around, about to be eaten by a smiling green sea serpent with yellow spots. An image of a globe cut in half, floats in a cartoon bubble above the heads of the two children discussing the story. The next scene shows ships falling off the globe. The children then explore the roundness of a red rubber ball, the older brother telling his sister that the sailors really couldn’t fall off.

The first image of Columbus appears in a large dream bubble; the older brother in period dress represents Columbus experiencing the rejection of his proposal by the King of Spain. In the next image, Queen Isabella appears as a fairy godmother, bathed in golden light. Opposite, a chest of jewels illustrates her willingness to finance the dream of Columbus. On the following page, the brother dressed as Columbus, extends his hands
toward a money bag from the "Treasurer of Spain". The rest of the images show the hardships of the sea journey and the sighting of the "new land". The last image of the boy as Columbus shows him proudly planting a non-descript gold and red flag on a small cartoony island. The younger sister decides that she will make a picture for Columbus Day because "Columbus was a brave and important person" (Ibid, p. 46). The overall iconic image in this picturebook seems to be Columbus the Hero who was "brave and important" because he followed his dream and overcame many obstacles.

**Category III: Picture Storybooks that Contain Elements of Traditional Biographies:**


Columbus the Dreamer is the central iconic image in this picture storybook. In the first image, young Columbus is seated by a window helping his mother entertain a baby; on the next he is an adolescent, dreaming, gazing at the sea, his back to the symbols of the weaver's trade. Later, Columbus is shown with maps pleading for funding, while nobles snicker. Finally, a white-haired Columbus clutching maps looks proudly at his three ships, his dream becoming a reality. Out in the open sea, the three ships small on the horizon, Columbus encourages fearful sailors: "Adelante-Sail on!"
He appears next as "friend to the natives" offering glass beads and a red cap as gifts. The presentation of the "Indians" to the king and queen also has an iconic quality. Three Arawaks wearing feathered turbans offer flowers, a treasure chest of gold and jewels, a parrot and fruit, one figure waves a tobacco fan. Columbus, hands raised toward the king and queen, present the Arawak as if he owned them. In this scene, the text indicates that Columbus had become a hero to his people.

The hero status is lost after the disasters that follow in successive voyages according to the text. This is not the case in the pictures. Opposite text that indicates Columbus was no longer a hero, he appears as a sage, smiling old man, dreaming from his window, gazing at the sea. The end text indicates that, though no longer a hero, Columbus is remembered as a great sailor. He went out into the unknown and found his way back and in doing so found a "New World". This suggests that perhaps dreamers are valued for their dreams even if they don’t turn out to be heroes.


The overall iconic image is Columbus the Hero. The text is taken from Robert H. Fuson’s work, based on the translation of the original log by Las Casas and the biography of Columbus’ son Ferdinand. The cover illustration, a dramatic linoleum-cut print, depicts
Columbus as a white-haired, tanned, rugged leader, his brown eyes appear to look past the horizon, into the future. Ship ropes, sea and glowing sky emphasize the weathered, hardened lines of his face.

Columbus is first pictured as a young man in the Spring and summer 1492 log entry, blue cape gently rippled by the ocean breeze, a purple cap over his long, dark hair. Leaning against a brick parapet, he looks out at the ships he will soon lead. In the next image of Columbus, he seems troubled but resolute; hand raised to his face, pondering the fearful expressions of the crew. The image of Columbus sighting land with Pedro Gutierrez is dark, moonlit almost magical. The purple cap of Columbus is softly lit, as are touches of grey hair. The moon is partially hidden by clouds, the light plays on the water.

The last two images of Columbus reinforce the notion of Columbus the Hero. The image of the arrival on shore depicts a young Columbus, hand on hip, one foot raised on a tree stump, sword at rest, surveying the island of "San Salvador". Only one crew member bows to the soil, the other looks down with disdain. The "natives" are shown without clothing, very muted and distant. In the last scene, a silhouette of Columbus looks out over the sea across to the other shore. The blazing sunset in a sky filled with striking contrasts, lush tropical
vegetation and mountains in the background lead the viewer to celebrate his "discovery" of an "enchanted land".

(13) All pigs on deck By Laura Fischetto, pictures by Letizia Galli (1991).

This story is loosely based on the second voyage of Columbus, which was undertaken to start a Spanish colony. The purpose of the book is summed up in the text and cartoon-like illustrations on the last page: "So at least one thing Columbus brought from the Old World was suitable for the New", implying that the pigs were suitable while other things weren’t. Below this text, a large yellow, gold and blue compass appears as a setting sun behind a floating chunk of land with two pigs on it, one pig turns to smile at the pig farmer who waves from the Santa Maria. Columbus, eyes wide, compass in one hand, scroll in the other, smiles absently at the horizon.

The central icon is Columbus the Dreamer, in images more than text. The image of Columbus that walks this historic stage is often puzzled by the reactions of his crew and looks helpless rather than heroic when facing difficulties. The image of the pig keeper appears as the unlikley hero in this story.

In the second voyage, Columbus selects tradespeople to establish a new Spanish colony. Tradesfolk lean toward him, holding up their wares. The pig keeper and
pigs scurry on board at the last minute. Columbus looks mildly surprised; the pig keeper, determined. The pigs are huge, taking up much space on the ship. Members of the crew hold their noses, Columbus, hands behind his back, looks puzzled. The rest of the pages are filled with the pigs, very fat, rolling all over the ship, taking up space and bothering the crew.

Upon sighting land Columbus smiles, hand on hip; leaning against the ship, as if to say, "See, I’ve done it again!" The natives stand around at odd angles, some with eyes closed, fingers in ears, watching the tradespeople work. Columbus strides about the island, pointing, scroll in hand, like a contractor; an "islander" follows behind like a client. In the next scene, Columbus looks depressed, hands behind back, pacing, the "islander" behind him concerned, finger raised to mouth, hand on hip. Things are not going well, the builder’s planks have sunk into the sand, the baker’s cake is flat, the "inhabitants" do not like their newly made clothes. But they adore the pigs in the next scene. The "moral" of this story seems to be, those we think unlikely to achieve success may end up to be the people we need.


The iconic image in this picturebook is Columbus the Hero. Based on a simple, rhyming text, the images fill
in the details through dramatic staging and perspective. The figures are small, more visual weight is directed toward the ships. In the first scene, the bow of the ship faces off to the right, one diagonal wave, swishes left; the other, dark blue in contrast, sways right, imitating the ship’s movement. The ship is viewed from below the bow at night; from under the sea, from the shore and the horizon. The iconic image of the ship in this picturebook is similar to that of Ventura’s (1978) leading humanity through waterways which represent symbolic paths to wisdom (Nodelman, 1988, p. 108).

The pictures of Columbus in this book suggest the iconic image of Columbus the Hero. Columbus is seen celebrating the sighting of land, planting the flag, trading with friendly natives for gold, warming himself by their fire. Columbus the Hero appears iconically on the last page, in a modern parade on board a Santa Maria float, waving and smiling as joyful people of diverse cultural backgrounds throw confetti:

"We cheer for him and say hooray, Especially on Columbus Day!"


The imagery in this picturebook seems to fall within Columbus the Dreamer icon, but with a "misunderstood hero/dreamer" twist. Black line cartoonish images and brown ink text give the book a personal storytelling
quality, conveyed through first person narration in the voice of Columbus. Iconic images of the hero begin with cover and title page scenes of a tall statue of the explorer, hand on hip, in traditional dress, surveying the city-scape from a tall pillar. The first scene depicts another statue of Columbus pointing out to sea beside a tourist dock of the Santa Maria, representing the Paseo de la Colon in Barcelona, Spain. Other images of the hero icon; the large sea with small ships, difficult voyages, successful landing and friendships with the "Indians". This culminates in the iconic processional image: Columbus kneeling before the king and queen lauded with flowers. Following behind, crew and "Indians" unload baskets of fruit, chests and parrots.

The "misunderstood hero/dreamer" twist begins with an image of people falling off a globe, implying that most people did not believe that the earth was round: "People laughed when I said this. How could the world be round?" (Ibid, p. 6). The following scenes illustrate how Columbus was misunderstood; turned backs indicate rejection, nobles laugh at his idea of sailing west to find the East.

After the heroic entry back to Barcelona, Columbus sets sail again. In the images that trace successive voyages, he loses hero status. Vignettes show a village
burned, enormous mosquitos attacking a crew member, graves being dug, a dead man with a knife buried in his side. Wild men with knives chasing others holding money bags. Safe away from the violence, Columbus looks on, frowning.

Back in Spain, dispirited "Indians" exit the ship moving toward Isabella, who looks down on them and yawns. Columbus looks depressed, he has brought back slaves not gold. On page 36 a small scene of Columbus indicates that he is misunderstood by the men who are yelling at him; on the next page he meekly holds out his hands to be chained and led away. Images of despair continue. The last two scenes are of death; monks in black robes holding crosses follow the casket of Queen Isabella; opposite page, Columbus on his death bed. The "misunderstood hero/dreamer" reflects back on his life: "In the end, the land I found did bring great wealth to Spain. And in time I was honored for what I had done."


Columbus the Dreamer is the iconic image within this picturebook loaded with fifteenth-century symbolism. The child Columbus peers out at the bright blue sea from a small arched opening within a gray stone castle that engulfs the title page. Referring back to Nodelman (1988) this opening suggests a symbolic threshold away
from the gray life of a weaver to the rich, adventurous life of an explorer about to follow his dreams.

The dream of the boy Columbus can be seen in the transformation from the dull, gray weaving room into a dream-filled paradise. As he sits at the loom reading, *The Travels of Marco Polo*, a subtle change takes place, similar to the transformation of Max's room in *Where the Wild Things Are*. In the first scene, Columbus appears small on the page, weaving a royal blue cloth dotted with white stars on the large loom. The room is bare; the blue cloth and sea outside the small, double-arched window provide the only color. On the opposite page, the room is the same but Columbus is now seated on a large caravel, the blue cloth a billowed sail, treasure chest on the bow, tall tree at stern. The room is gently illuminated by a small candle that hovers on a mountain behind the boat. Dream-like medieval icons of sea monsters, a Chinese dragon, an angel, the Great Wall of China and elephants bearing a tall pagoda are smiled upon by three stylized Buddha-like faces, cloud-like and smooth.

Vignettes show Columbus receiving the news from Isabella that the dream will soon be a reality. From this point, the imagery seems focused on the long sea journey, depicting tiny ships that bravely sail along the horizon. The last two scenes suggest that the dream
of Columbus lives on. On the left page, the small figure of Columbus, hand on hip, casts a long shadow across the beach that stretches out toward the Taino, who wait for him in a perfect semi-circle. On page right, a statue of Columbus in similar pose, stands above a city on a high pillar, surrounded by a semi-circle of children and an adult who all seem to honor his memory.

(17) The canary who sailed with Columbus By Wiggs, S., pictures by Sharon Loy Anderson (1989).

The iconic image here is clearly Columbus the Hero.

In the first scene, Columbus strides into the shop of Gabrielo, a humble, white-haired cobbler. Columbus is portrayed as a handsome, white-haired, active "Admiral of the Ocean Sea". Carlos the canary, perched on the shoulder of Columbus, allows himself to be stroked. Columbus pours coins onto the cobblers’ table in exchange for the bird. He is pictured throughout as a smiling, wise and benevolent Admiral, who laughs at the playful canary.

Columbus raises his hand in greeting to the "natives" as he lands. They are adorned with flowered wreaths, otherwise bare, hidden behind vegetation. Images of the journey show stormy seas and a wrecked ship that barely makes the trip back. In the next scene, Columbus is honored by the King and Queen of Spain. This scene is rich in symbolism; high priests appear on either side of the royal family holding gold cross
staffs, gazing with admiration at Columbus. A noble examines a trunk of treasures beside the throne; brightly painted feathered masks and spears are scattered on the floor. "Natives" stand proudly in green and yellow feathered capes. Columbus stands before the throne, holding a parrot out to the royal family. A smiling Columbus releases Carlos who flies home. In the last scene, the canary strokes the cobbler’s balding head in front of a large chest of gold coins. Villagers smile through the half-circle window.

The imagery in this story is reminiscent of a fairy tale. The "poor" kindly "old" man allows his bird to go off and have "adventures" and is rewarded by "Columbus the Hero". The images indicate that the cobbler "deserved" his good fortune through the symbolism of the Madonna and Child icon and rosary.

Category IV: Picture Storybooks from Different Perspectives

(18) Columbus Day By Liestman, V., pictures by Rick Hanson (1991)

This Columbus Day book presents the traditional iconic image of Columbus the Hero, including descriptions of the effect Columbus had on Native Americans. The painted images begin with young Columbus dreaming from his window. The iconic portrait of Columbus, white haired, black cap, rounded face that
appears in many biographies, is repainted here rather than photographed, superimposed over a map of Portugal with an image of King John; another view of a popular iconic portrait shows Columbus with sketched caravels opposite a painting of a map of Spain with portraits of King Ferdinand and Queen Isabella.

The landing scene in this book does not look as optimist as in the Columbus the Hero iconic imagery. The Taino do not seem pleased to greet Columbus. The text, opposite cheery paintings of trade objects, foreshadows the destruction ahead: "The Taino seemed to like the Spaniards. They treated the Spaniards like friends. Columbus liked the Taino, too. But he did not think of them as friends. He said he thought they would make very good servants" (Ibid, p. 27). The dual narrative includes the perspective of the Taino as well as the traditional story. The "Indians" that will be taken to Spain are stiff and still, not friendly, not smiling. The scene of the "Indians who were left behind" (Ibid, p. 40) portrays unhappy people cultivating fields as slaves.

The last three scenes invite us to celebrate positive aspects of exploration while rethinking the negative and learning from past mistakes:
"We forget about the awful way the Native Americans were treated. We forget about the people who died. Maybe it's time to think of Columbus Day in a new way. October 12 can be a day to tell the whole story of the voyage that changed the world. It can be a day to remember the Native Americans. And it can be a day to remember that when we explore, we must be good to the life we meet along the way" (Ibid, p. 52).

Opposite this text are images of Native Americans that might have lived in the Caribbean.

The last images are of planets suspended in space, relating the voyages of Columbus to space exploration: "Who will be the one to find lands that are new to us? Who will be the one to find other beings? Maybe it will be you. If it is, how will you treat those beings? Maybe you can think about it on Columbus Day."

(19) The first voyage of Christopher Columbus, 1492, By Smith, B. (1992).

The iconic image of Columbus is difficult to determine from this picturebook. It is told through image and text from the perspective of a "sailor who needed a job". Columbus is pictured throughout as a hard man to work for, who seldom smiles. The predominate images are of the crew performing tasks on ship. Columbus, a small figure with reddish hair and black cap; points, extorts and frowns at the crew. The black line, colorful cartoonish figures are juxtaposed against realistic, finely painted backgrounds. This gives the impression of a cartoon reenactment of "authentic" history.
Columbus appears puzzled in the landing scene when asked by the sailor, "Is this Cipangu - or Cathay?" (Ibid). They seem to have bad luck, a small image of Columbus on board the shipwrecked Santa Maria holding a torch is deserted by his crew. On the opposite page he frowns at the sailor, arms crossed, while the Taino look on from behind palm trees. The Taino smile as the two remaining ships leave, while crewman in ragged clothes point at the ships, frowning, crying and waving. In a scene of an audience with the King of Portugal, Columbus bows, and pushes back the curtain so the crew can see that he is being honored. A priest, dressed in black robes bows behind him. The crew, hands to mouth, frown and look puzzled.

On the last page, Columbus is seated, arms crossed in front of a picture of himself on the Santa Maria. A book with his picture lies open on the table beside him, a large globe is pictured in the corner; symbols of exploration and success. Below this image the text summs up: "Christopher Columbus became the Admiral of the Ocean Sea and a respected seaman..." adding that "The world was a much bigger place than he imagined. He never did find any treasure either!" (Ibid). My guess is that new iconic images are being created in this book. The image of a cartoonish, scowling Columbus who is not sure of what he is doing or where he is going but is
honored anyway suggests that the traditional story is being challenged. That the tale is told from the point-of-view of an average sailor might imply a paradigm shift away from "Great Men" biographies.


The images in this picturebook are different from all others. The story in image and text is told by a young Taino boy and his dream that the white men should not be welcomed. On the cover, the image of Columbus, dressed in dark cloak and hat, looks down at the Taino child with a cold, calculating expression. Soft golden clouds encompass the sky behind him, ominous dark clouds threaten to overtake them. The child seems small but brave as he reaches to touch Columbus. The title page contains a "fin-shaped stone zemis" with an iguana wrapped around it, an artifact of a lost civilization.

The first scene depicts images of gigantic birds, keening out on a stormy sea. The text indicates that these are figures from the Taino boy’s dream. This image blends into the next, a picture of the three ships with red Spanish crosses, the Santa Maria dominates the page. The strangers come ashore in the following double-page spread, planting flags of Spain into the sand. Weapons wave in the air, the crew and soldiers appear in large numbers, extending off the page. Taino hide behind bushes, whispering to each other.
The most iconic image of Columbus in this book appears opposite the following text: "I watched their chief smile. It was a serpent's smile - no lips and all teeth. The face of Columbus commands the whole page in this scene. He holds a gold amulet to his face, leering at it, his smile and eyes lit by greed. The light of the campfire illuminates the gleam in his eyes and the crookedness of his teeth. The background is black; the eyes of Columbus seem to glow in the night.

This image appears in contrast to the last; a white-haired Taino dressed in cast off jaket and pants, slumped on a tree stump, face lined but chin proud, gazing off toward the sea. The red tiled roofs and white buildings of a mission village can be seen in the distance. There is a surreal quality to this figure, his legs become increasingly transparent, his feet, invisible. What icon walks this historic stage? In this picturebook, the tradition is not only challenged it is turned inside out. The Taino boy represents The Dreamer who was misunderstood, Columbus represents "The Serpent". More speculation will be made about these iconic images under 'Narration'. 
Table 1 "Columbus the Hero" Iconic Images

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Religious Symbols</th>
<th>Images of Leadership</th>
<th>Friend of Taino</th>
<th>Hero's Welcome</th>
<th>Royal Honor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3,4</td>
<td>3,4</td>
<td>3,4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>*14</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Numbers refer to picturebook numbers listed in text.
* denotes honor in Columbus Day Parade illustration.
Table 2 "Columbus the Dreamer" Iconic Images

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pre-Voyage Dreaming</th>
<th>Images of Rejection</th>
<th>Friend of Taino</th>
<th>Images of Inept Leadership</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>16</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3 Critical Imagery

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unheroic Images of Columbus (Greedy/Grouchy)</th>
<th>Images of Inept Leadership</th>
<th>Images Forshadowing Destruction of the Taino</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Numbers refer to picturebook numbers listed in text.
Figure 1

Tracing of an image of Columbus in traditional period dress. The number refers to the number of the picturebook the image was derived from.
Figure 2

Tracings of "Columbus the Hero" iconic images. Numbers denote picturebooks the images were derived from as numbered within the text.
Figure 3

Tracings of "Columbus the Dreamer" iconic images.
Figure 4

Tracings of critical images of Christopher Columbus.
(2) **Narration**

Duncum (1993) describes the importance of the social function of narrative in visual art: "In general, narratives help maintain a stable social order by establishing what the parameters are for the consideration of issues. Stories provide models of what the world is thought to be like and how to cope with it." (Duncum, 1993, p. 218). Duncum suggests that children are exposed to more visual images today than ever, and tend to be less critical of what they learn from television, magazines, etc. Freedman (1994) also found this to be true of adolescents asked to respond to magazine ads.

The point of the analysis within this function is to explain the iconic images of Columbus found within 'substitution'; analyzing each in terms of its social meaning and significance. Issues related to the overall social purpose of each iconic image will be examined under the 'commitment/persuasion' function. My goal for this section is to see what the iconic images consist of within the dual narrative of the picturebook, comparing images to see how they have been used to maintain "a stable social order" and "establishing what the parameters are for the consideration of issues" (Duncum, 1993, p. 218).
The conceptual framework used to analyze each iconic image for social meaning was developed from the following questions:

1. What narrative elements are similar across all the books analyzed within each iconic image?
2. What "social order" has been maintained in each iconic image?
3. What parameters have been established in each iconic image for the consideration of issues?

From the previous analysis within the 'substitution' function, two iconic images were identified: "Columbus the Hero" and "Columbus the Dreamer". The third category consists of books based on stories of Christopher Columbus but told through image and text from different perspectives. The writers and illustrators within this category are operating within the critical theory paradigm. The iconic images in this category are diverse, based on criticisms of the previous two. This category was designated: "Critical imagery based on new perspectives".

In this analysis, imagery found to be similar across each of the two icons are described and discussed in terms of social significance and parameters set for the consideration of issues. In the third category, "critical imagery" three books are compared and discussed individually regarding the critical narrative
contained in light of the new story perspective. The paradigm structure described by Pearse (1992) relates to each category and were used to illuminate and support findings regarding the social order maintained in each iconic image.

The Iconic Images
I."Columbus the Hero"

Picturebooks 1, 3 & 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 12, 14 and 17 contained this iconic image. The following represents basic iconic imagery and story elements:

1. Columbus is "called" to be an explorer. Some books include images of the "flat world" thought to be the beliefs of that day, contrasting these with the "round world" idea of Columbus. Several books include text indicating that most educated citizens knew that the world was round but didn't realize how big it was. All books reinforce the notion that Columbus was the first man who had the courage to sail where no one had ever sailed before. Images include Columbus, rugged and handsome, wise, a man of action.

2. There is great emphasis on the first voyage. The hardships of the sea journey; huge, stormy seas, indicate the bravery of the hero and illustrate his insights and persistence in the face of obstacles.
Some books emphasize frustrated funding attempts and persistence.

3. Columbus the Hero is a "friend" to the "Indians" who respond to him with friendship.

4. The hero is clearly seen in the iconic procession of Columbus, crew and "natives" through the streets of Barcelona with celebrating townsfolk, culminating in the image of Columbus honored before the King and Queen of Spain. Most of the "hero" picturebooks end with Columbus earning the title "Admiral of the Ocean Sea". Little attention is given to problems related to mismanagement on land in text, none in the imagery. In the epilogue of Christopher Columbus and the great voyage of discovery (Weisman & Deitch, 1990) the only reference to issues is mentioned in one sentence: "Not all of the results of the voyage were positive, but that's another story" (Ibid, p. 40). Columbus the hero "paved the way" for "discovery" by going into the unknown; his spirit lives on, through new discoveries and in space exploration (also in Liestman, 1991). In My first Columbus Day book, Columbus "fulfilled the prophecy" that a "great new continent will be found" (Lillegard, 1987, p. 29).
In these picturebooks Columbus is acknowledged as a hero because he found a "new land" in the first voyage. Columbus the hero "lives on" in paradigm I (Pearse, 1992), written from the historic, linear perspective of "Great Men" who accomplished what no man had tried before. In this paradigm, Columbus is a "great man" who sailed "where no man had gone before" and in so doing, regardless of the fact that he didn't realize it, became a hero because he "discovered" a new continent.

The hero in fairy tales and myths follows structures similar to the Columbus story told in "hero" picture-books: The image of man portrayed in the fairy tale-or, rather, one aspect of this image-is that of one who has the capability to rise above himself, has within him the yearning for the highest things, and is also able to attain them" (Luthi, 1970, p. 140). In this manner the Columbus the Hero iconic narratives through words and images maintain the social order of those who operate in paradigm I. The hero overcomes obstacles to follow his "call". He travels through stormy seas into the unknown, to new paths of wisdom. In shaping the image of Columbus into a hero, the writers and illustrators of these books have created a social icon that exists beyond the confines of reality: "As he listens to the fairy tale, the child gets ideas about
how he may create order out of the chaos which is his inner life" (Bettleheim, 1975, p. 75). By lulling children into the story of Columbus the Hero, these books maintain the social order of history as a linear progression of "Great Men"; hero's that they should pattern themselves after. In these picturebooks the parameters for the discussion of issues are nil, they do not exist. Heroes are not questioned in these books. Problems are left for "another story".

II. "Columbus the Dreamer"

These picturebooks contain elements of "Columbus the Hero" in the "discovery" of a "new land" but also describe the "other" story, the "bad luck" Columbus had in successive voyages. The central iconic image is that of the dreamer. There is more variety in these books with regard to story elements, the following is a general outline:

1. Young Columbus, the dreamer, spends much time looking out of windows "symbolic thresholds" toward the sea.

2. More emphasis is placed on the struggles of Columbus to convince others that his plan to "sail West to get to the East" is valid. He is often portrayed as being "misunderstood".
Columbus the Dreamer is not the strong leader that he is in the "Hero" picturebooks. In *All pigs on deck* (Fischetto, 1991) he seems puzzled by the behavior of the crew. In *I, Christopher Columbus* (Weil, 1983) and *Columbus* (D'Aulaire, 1955) Columbus is shown in chains. *Follow the dream* (Sis, 1991) and *A picture book of Christopher Columbus* (Adler, 1991) spend more time with the childhood dream, culminating with the heroic status of Columbus as the man who unknowingly discovered a new continent. The text of the Adler (1991) picturebook alludes to problems but the images do not. In Sis (1991) the text mentions that Columbus "never really knew that he had reached "America" but appears below a heroic image of a statue in modern times that is surrounded by a "teacher" and students appearing to honor his memory. In the Sis (1991), Adler (1991) and Fischetto (1991) the ending is happy in images; only in the Adler (1991) is there mention of "bad luck" in successive trips. In the D'Aulaire (1955) the tone is generally cheerful but at times the imagery is haunting. The last scene represents the childhood home of Christopher Columbus in Genoa, Italy. A black and white sketch depicts an old house with double doors (as shown in the first scene, refer to
description in 'substitution'). A large skeleton key hole can be seen in one of the doors. The image of a hissing black cat and ferral dog makes the image troubling. The house is illuminated by light bulb suspended on wires in the street. A crowd is shown in the distance behind an old castle wall. City high-rises fill the black sky. The tone is similar to the deathbed scene in Weil (1983) (see 'substitution').

Who is the man that walks this iconic stage? He is a happy dreamer who followed "his dream", not quite a hero but a "great sailor" "able to find his way across unknown waters and back home again" (Adler, 1991). He unwittingly found a "new continent" (Sis, 1991) and we can honor him because he beleived in his dream, even if it turned out to be different from what he expected. His dream made it possible for us to have pigs in America (!) (Fischetto, 1991).

In the other two picturebooks, Weil (1983) and D'Aulaire (1955) the man who walks this iconic stage is a misunderstood dreamer, who is imprisoned and socially rejected, but is vindicated by Queen Isabella, his "great friend" and sponsor. He is introspective, searches for wisdom, is "blessed" either by the Queen (Weil, 1983) or by holy figures, possibly saints (D'Aulaire, 1955). He is sure of his vision and
purpose. This iconic image excuses the problems that plagued Columbus, while honoring him as a "dreamer". Dreamers aren't always practical, but they are seen as visionaries.

In "Ancient myths and modern man" Joseph L. Henderson (1964) points to "symbols of transcendence" in initiation rites. Henderson suggests that in addition to "arousal" and "submission" symbolism descended from ancient Greek religions, there is another kind, "belonging to the earliest known sacred traditions, that is also connected with the periods of transition in a person's life" (Ibid, p. 149). They do not integrate the initiate with group-consciousness but instead point to the need of the individual for liberation from a fixed or "immature" state: "they concern man's release from-or transcendence of-any confining pattern of existence, as he moves toward a superior or more mature state in his development" (Ibid, p. 149). When the adult reaches a sense of completeness between her "unconscious" and "conscious" mind this union is referred to as "the transcendent function of the psyche" (Jung in Henderson, 1964) through which she can achieve the "highest goal", that of the "full realization" of the potential of her "individual Self" (Ibid, p. 149). In this iconic image, Columbus the Dreamer is led through his dream to a higher state, toward new knowledge, crossing "turbulent
seas" to an unknown continent. His dream "liberated" his contemporaries from the confines of their continent, opening the way for new insights.

How does the image of Columbus the Dreamer maintain social order? By providing an alternative to the hero. The actions of the dreamer can be questioned, while we honor the dream and the insights it has provided. Columbus in these picturebooks falls between paradigms I and II (Pearse, 1992). The writers/illustrators of these picturebooks acknowledge the issues within this story, but excuse Columbus of any wrongs; he was ahead of his time, "misunderstood". In these books Columbus becomes the original "Modernist", socially outcast, with a few farsighted patrons. He is neither "right" nor "wrong"; a complex figure, a transcendent modern who continued to believe in his dream.

3. **Critical Imagery**

Joseph Campbell (1972) views the first voyage of Columbus as "marking the end—or at least the beginning of the end—of the authority of the old mythological systems by which the lives of men had been supported and inspired from time out of mind" (Campbell, 1972, p. 4). He closes his investigation of myth in everyday life by asking "What is—or what is to be—the new mythology?" (Ibid, p. 275). What Campbell does not recognize in his
embrace of Columbus as part of the separation between the old myths and science is that the story of Christopher Columbus, as it has evolved in the U.S. has become "the new mythology". He is the "scientific hero" a "modernist" who dreamed alone, a man "ahead of his time" who opened the way for new "discoveries".

Campbell would remove the old "myths" in favor of a new realization of individuals as centers of "Mind at Large", "each in his own way at one with all, and with no horizons" (Ibid, p. 275). Perhaps in revealing new perspectives of the story of Christopher Columbus the creators of the following three picturebooks are attempting to remove the old iconic images of "Columbus the Hero" and "Columbus the Dreamer". The perspectives that could extend from this story are endless and largely unexplored. But the notion of "each in his own way at one with all" and "no horizons" is troubling in its pluralistic reductionalism.

The creators of two of these picturebooks seem to be critical of the old images, replacing them with new perceptions rather than removing all "horizons". *Encounter* and *Columbus Day*, contain warnings: "when we explore, we must be good to the life we meet along the way" (Liestman, 1991, p. 52) and "That is why I, an old man now, dream no more dreams" "May it be a warning to
all the children and all the people in every land" (Yolen, 1992). These warnings can be viewed as an effort toward cultural healing. This notion is reinforced in The people shall continue, an epic account of Native American history, written by Simon Ortiz, an Acoma poet:

"The People looked around them and they saw Black People, Chicano People, Asian People, many White People and others who were kept poor by American wealth and power. The People saw that these People who were not rich and powerful shared a common life with them. The People realized they must share their history with them.

"We shall tell you of our struggles," they said. "We are all the People of this land" (Ortiz, 1988, p. 22).

Encounter (Yolen, 1992) and Columbus Day (Liestman, 1991) were both written in this spirit of healing. In Encounter the message is sharper, the contrasts stronger between life before and after the arrival of Columbus. However, despite the portrayal of the traditional "Columbus the Hero" icon, Columbus Day does move beyond it, asking children through image and text to rethink Columbus Day as a day to honor Native Americans.

The social function of these two books is to promote cultural healing. From the sharp bite of Encounter, the transitional approach of Columbus Day provides an emotional bridge for children, from the traditional "Hero" icon to images that are new: unhappy Taino slaves
who labor in the fields and are forced to travel to Spain.

Between the two books a new perspective emerges, one that allows children to question, to experience the loss of a "hero" and the awareness that they can do something to prevent human destruction. At the time this is written, ethnic cleansing is taking place in Bosnia. Television news fills the screen with icons of pain and horror. But the horror is happening somewhere else in the minds of most American children. Books like these two can show them that it has also happened here; that how we perceive ourselves through iconic images often leads to how we treat others.

In contrast to the previous two books, The first voyage of Christopher Columbus, 1492 by Barry Smith (1992) appears to criticize the iconic images of "Columbus the Hero" and "Columbus the Dreamer" through narrative imagery and text, by telling the story from a sailors' point-of-view. The sailor represents the "everyman" of his time. He thinks that Columbus is "crazy" in his desire to sail west to find the spice islands of Japan and China but he needs the job so he applies for a position.

The icon on this historic stage is not Columbus, but the sailor who survives many hardships and lives to tell his story. The image of Columbus in this book could be
called a "grouch" who is never satisfied with the
efforts of the crew. When asked by the sailor which
island they have landed on, is it Japan or part of
China, Columbus is evasive and looks puzzled. The sailor
and Columbus share the same expression of sadness on a
scene which depicts them frowning on the deck, soaked,
above text that reflects their dispair upon losing sight
of the Pinta on the return voyage. The last page serves
as an epilogue, describing Columbus as a respected
seaman. No mention is made of the problems of later
voyages. Yet, Columbus seems to be criticized in the
voice of the sailor for not realizing that he had found
a "new" continent instead of Japan and China and that he
didn’t find treasure "either".

The social function of this picturebook seems to lie
in its critical view of Columbus from an "everyman’s"
perspective. Whereas Columbus appears as a looming
figure with a "serpent’s smile" in the eyes of a young
Taino in Encounter, or absent in pictures of Taino as
slaves in Columbus Day, thus retaining a more positive
image; in Smith’s (1992) book he is painted as a comic
grouch who doesn’t know where is is going. Even in
Encounter where Columbus appears as a greedy white man
with a "serpent smile" I perceive the frustration of the
Taino boy because he was a child with an important dream
that no adult would listen to, as much as the greed of
Columbus. In Smith (1992) Columbus is perceived as a person with "power" in the eyes of a person who just needed a job.

These picturebooks all fall within Paradigm III, the critical theory paradigm (Pearse, 1992). On a continuum, Columbus Day leans more between the traditional, Paradigm I with the critical elements within Paradigm III. The first voyage of Christopher Columbus, 1492 falls squarely in Paradigm III with its critical view of Columbus as a man in power who was an inept leader. Encounter exists almost near the end of Paradigm III, challenging the tradition from the view of a Taino child, representing a civilization that was completely destroyed by Columbus and successive explorers.

Each of these books offers a challenge to the tradition of "Great Men" theories. None portrays Columbus as a lone dreamer that can be excused for his poor leadership. They each invite the viewer to question the role of Columbus in the "discovery" of a "new world". The parameters for questioning are open, inviting speculation rather than discouraging it.

Functions 3, 4 & 5: Embellishment, Commitment/Persuasion and Personal Expression

The last three functions are grouped together to avoid duplication. They have been analyzed within each of the three iconic images described under 'Narration'.
Discussion is based on Perry Nodelman's (1988) descriptions of "predominating visual features" and "overall qualities" of picturebooks (Nodelman, 1988, p. 40). At times I have referred back to Chapter I, drawing upon evidence taken from the "truth" and "story" section to support my claims.

The following questions form a conceptual framework that encompasses all three remaining functions with regard to how visual conventions in picturebooks set up our expectations as viewers as to what kind of story is presented. They are not mutually exclusive, but overlapping:

1. How do the overall "predominating qualities" (Ibid, p. 41) of the picturebook as a whole lead to certain expectations regarding content? ("Truth" vs "Story")

2. How is each iconic image embellished or "made special"?

3. What visual devices are used to "persuade/commit" the viewer into "belief" within each iconic image? Whose "dominant interests" (Duncum, 1993) are served?

Nodelman (1988) describes the non- textual elements that create mood or "atmosphere" in picturebooks, stating that they are not separate components but part of the whole storytelling quality. Pictures and book
design establish the 'tone' or narrative voice of the
oral storytelling tradition. They tell us how to attend
to the story; is it serious or comic? In this analysis
the following qualities borrowed from Nodelman (1988)
will be used to illustrate each of the questions within
the instrument: "matters like the size of shape of
pictures (or even of the book the pictures are found
in), the artist's choice of medium and style, the
density of texture, and the qualities of color. Aspects
of books and pictures such as these focus our
expectations even before we explore the pictures closely
enough to notice relationships among their details; they
imply an overall mood or atmosphere that controls our
understanding of the scenes depicted" (Ibid, p. 42).
From Duncum (1993) the following concepts will be used
to shape the analysis: 'Embellishment' as separating
special events from the ordinary by "making special",
similar to Dissanayake (1988); 'Commitment/Persuasion'
as an examination the three iconic images as "sites of
ideological struggle" (Duncum, 1993, p. 221); 'Personal
Expression' as a "social construction serving dominant
interests" (Ibid, p. 222).
I. **Columbus the Hero**

The picturebooks in this section fall into two categories with regard to overall format: picturebook biographies and picture storybooks. Two observations led to this distinction: First, overall qualities of the book's design and manufacture: size and shape, cover designs printed onto the boards or sumptuously printed on dust jackets, lettering qualities and layout of text and image on the cover and pages. Second, the point-of-view of the creators: is the picturebook "packaged" to appear as a "true" biography of historic "facts" or does it convey the emotional content of the story?

Referring back to Chapter I, Danto (1989) writes that notions of "truth" and "falsity" rely on support from the world; we can not know from the sentence "Columbus discovered America in 1492" that it is "true", more external evidence is needed from the world. For the phenomenon "truth" to occur, according to Danto, there must also be "belief". Relationships between "truth", "belief" and "ethics of belief" influence how picturebooks are formatted and "made special".

In the picturebook biographies the distinctions regarding overall format qualities are difficult to make. Most of the books are small and narrow, with much white space around text and image:
"But in narrower books, or in those books in which illustrators have chosen to place pictures only on one side of the two-page spread, there is less opportunity for depicting setting and, as a result, greater concentration on and closer empathy with the characters depicted" (Nodelman, 1988, p. 46).

Books that are illustrated with cartoons are also narrow and tend to focus more on action than setting. Glossy paper stock adds a "distancing" quality. Books that have frames around the pictures, and/or around the text "take an objective, unemotional view of the events they describe" (Ibid, p. 51). Color saturation also affects viewer response to images. Highly saturated colors draw the viewer into the story while light washes tend to create distance.

Nine of the picturebooks within the "Columbus the Hero" icon function as biographies that are formatted as "true". All but one, Christopher Columbus and the great voyage of discovery (Weisman, 1990) are small to standard book size, a range between 8 inches and 10 inches high. (The average size of a picture storybook is 8 1/2 inches wide by 11 inches high). Because these books are formatted for younger children, differences between "truth" and "story" are sometimes difficult to determine. Qualities of format similar in all of these books is how they establish our expectations that they are "true" biographies that contain "historic facts" through bold, conventional type face, mat rather than glossy covers and text book layout and design.
On the covers and throughout, all of these books contain realistic images of Christopher Columbus, the Santa Maria and navigational instruments. White space surrounds the text and most images or scenes. They all use distancing devices. Christopher Columbus (Ventura, 1978) contains minute figures on a large ship surrounded by white space. In Krensky’s (1991) Christopher Columbus, the double-spread illustrations extend off the page, with framed white space text blocks superimposed onto the illustrations. More emphasis is placed on "factual" objects; maps, globes and navigational tools are pictured on many pages in simple illustrations against white backgrounds. My first Columbus Day book (Lillegard, 1987) Christopher Columbus (First Biographies, Gleiter, 1995) and Christopher Columbus and the great voyage of discovery (Ibid) all use framed images or image and text pages to create distance.

The pages of all of these books except the Ventura (1978) are numbered, the Ventura and many of the other books contain text headings that serve as chapter headings formatted for younger readers. Books with chapters and page numbers that contain realistic images and are labeled "biographies" set-up expectations of "truth". The distancing devices also seem to set up this expectation. Historic events are "distant" they happened in a different time.
The realistic images, distancing devices and biography formats of these books attempt to persuade the reader that Columbus was a "Great Man" who opened the way for new "discoveries". They also persuade the viewer that the Taino people were delighted to meet Columbus and that they became "friends". This can be seen through images of happy Taino enthusiastically greeting Columbus and joyfully standing before the king and queen as Columbus presents them. They are exotic and fascinating, and seem delighted to be "discovered".

The three picture storybooks in this iconic image are similar in regard to how they persuade the reader that Columbus is a "Great Man" and in their portrayal of the happy, friendly Taino. The difference between the two types of formats lies in the storytelling quality of the picture storybooks. Because they are larger, more emphasis is placed on visual setting and details that lead the viewer to assumptions about the character of Christopher Columbus:

"The extra width of wider books allows illustrators to fill in the extra space around the people they draw with information about the places they occupy - their setting; and if we operate as illustrators almost always do, on the assumption that such external appearances reveal internal characteristics, we learn much of character in such pictures through the details of background" (Nodelman, 1988, p. 46).
Two of these picturebooks, *In 1492* (Marzollo, 1991) and *The canary who sailed with Columbus* (Wiggs, 1989) blend image and text into wide, double-spread scenes drenched in saturated colors; intense cobalt and sky blues with golds and reds adding warmth. The text is part of the scene and functions as the narrator; the emotional tone is conveyed within the world of the story visually described on the wide pages. *The Log of Christopher Columbus* (Lowe, 1992) is a complex work. The double-page spreads are filled with intense, saturated blues, greens and golds, the dramatic staging and dynamic lines of the linoleum cut illustrations combine with the blocks of framed text, which contain excerpts from the log of Columbus. The overall effect is something like a dramatic reading or a play. Because the narrative is from the voice of Columbus, the text block seems integrated with the whole, not separate. The block is not white, but a flat aqua bordered in dark blue, consistent throughout.

The difference between the picture story books and the picturebook biographies in this iconic image lies in the visual formats which indicate how to attend the works and how they should be "used". The Columbus Day books are intended for younger children to show them why they should celebrate Columbus Day. The picturebook biographies are formatted as historical, factual texts
but contain pictures and labels for young researchers. The three picture storybooks are larger and appear as "stories" about Christopher Columbus that teachers would read aloud to children.

II. **Columbus the Dreamer**

The five books within this iconic image are all picture storybooks. They function differently from those described in the "Columbus the Hero" icon because they focus on "Columbus the Dreamer" a more introspective, complex figure. In two of these books, *A picturebook of Christopher Columbus* (Adler, 1991) and *Follow the Dream* (Sis, 1991) white spaces around frames and borders focus the attention of the viewer in toward the image rather than creating distance:

"But while white space around a picture can act as a frame, create a sense of constraint, and demand detachment, it can also do the opposite; it can provide a focus that demands our involvement" (Nodelman, 1988, p. 53).

Both of these books use frames and borders, as well as arched windows and doors that appear as "symbolic thresholds" (Ibid, 108) to focus attention in to the world portrayed. The Adler (1991) book is suffused with warm sunset colors whereas the Sis (1991) is drenched with majestic blues and golds. Both are optimistic stories about Columbus the Dreamer. In the Sis, the magic and wonder of the dream through borders, medieval
symbolism and intense colors contrasted with the gray of his earlier life persuade the viewer of the enchantment of the dream. In the Adler there is a brief hint in the text that Columbus ceased to be a hero, but the overall tone, the warmth of the colors and strength of the iconic "Hero" persuade the viewer of the power and importance of the dream.

*All pigs on deck* (Fischetto, 1991) and *The Christopher Columbus* (Weil, 1983) convince us of the "truth" of the iconic image of "Columbus the Dreamer" through caricature and comic book imagery:

"Caricatures and other cartoons convince us of their interpretations of reality because the lines left after the simplification represent movement rather than shape, the smile rather than the lips that made it (Nodelman, 1988, p. 97).

In *All pigs on deck* Columbus appears as a comic book figure, squared body, sensitive eyes and mouth, with a dark, pointed beard. The Taino are very sterotypical and squared, appearing as large figures that float on small chunky islands, or shown standing on small hills with odd perspectives. The reality portrayed is more earthy, centered on the pigs and the pig keeper. Columbus, we are persuaded, was a dreamer that tolerated the antics of pigs while on his second voyage to establish a Spanish colony. The pictures spread off the page, text is integrated. The viewer enters the comic world of the second voyage and frolicks with the pigs.
I. Christopher Columbus (Weil, 1983), although similar in comic style is a darker book in tone. The sketchy black line drawings, with light black and brown wash distance the viewer from the scene. This is not the case with the pencil line drawings of Columbus by the D'Aulaire's (1955). The softness of the lines contribute to the dream-like images within this long story, appearing to embellish the color illustrations: "black-and-white illustrations seem so much more appropriate in longer books than in picturebooks" (Nodelman, 1988, p. 69) The black-and-white images work in the D'Aulaire book because the text can carry more of the description than in I. Christopher Columbus.

The longer formats and line drawings of these two books set up expectations of "truth" by conveying images of the whole story, all voyages, and the images of Columbus in chains. They both contain line drawings of "historic sites" such as the Paseo de la Colon, and the childhood home of Columbus. These images contain labels that also create an impression of historic authenticity. These books persuade the viewer that the man Columbus did leave behind the legacy of "discovery" but also that he was human, instead of a hero.
III. "Critical Perspectives"

The three picturebooks in this section each function differently with regard to overall format, embellishment and visual devices that lead to "belief". They do all appear to criticize the previous two iconic images by presenting Columbus and the Taino from a new perspective.

_Columbus Day_ (Liestman, 1991) is formatted as a biography. The book is small and narrow. The cover contains images that would appear in a standard biography, the three ships and a vignette of one of the traditional Columbus portraits. The difference lies in the inclusion of a huge "earth rise" behind the ships, with planets superimposed, or suspended in space. The images are all painted on a texture that resembles oil on canvas. All pages have a painterly quality, enhanced with the appearance of a canvas painting overlaid on to the page. The page continues off from the canvas-like rectangles, breaking in odd places. The "painting" on the page is sketchy, lines can be seen, washes instead of the heavy paint are used. This unusual format creates a warm, storytelling quality. At times, the washes "bleed" from under the canvas-like rectangles out into the white space which contains the text. Text and image are separate, but the splotches of paint seem to pull the text back into the image. The vaugness of line
creates some distance between the historic events and the viewer. Several pages contain canvas rectangles that function as overlaid images, creating an impression of time passing, or of different things happening at the same time.

This book uses the sketchy, painterly contrast to set up contrasts in the text. We are persuaded that, in addition to the traditional story of "Columbus the Hero" something new will be presented. The discussions of Native Americans in this book and how they were affected by Columbus are subtly mirrored in the change you see in the Taino. They are not thrilled to greet Columbus, nor do they merrily jump aboard his ships. They are pictured as slaves. In the last scene which depicts an astronaut floating in space, we are asked to consider how we would treat the other beings we might meet in "lands that are new to us" (Liestman, 1991). In the imagery and text, the viewer is persuaded to "rethink" Columbus Day and to consider its implications.

In The first voyage of Christopher Columbus (Smith, 1992) the expectations established on the cover are different from those within the story. Although borders are used throughout this wide picturebook, on the cover the border functions as a series of vignettes, introducing the viewer to a story significantly different from its contents. The border vignettes
contain images of chubby, bare children above ships, cherubs sprinkling stars, mermaids reading scrolls, mermaid children looking at globes, pairs of brown and light skinned angels holding pineapples.

The center rectangle is framed in gold and contains traditional images. A large Santa Maria dominates; the title is presented in black calligraphy on its large sail. A compass appears in the upper right-hand corner. A smiling, cartoony Columbus, reddish hair, black hat, theatrically extends one arm toward the title. An image of the real "hero" of this story, a sailor in ragged white shirt and red tunic, sits with arms crossed, smiling below Columbus. The whole effect is light and cartoonish. Small vignettes of ships in stormy seas and lightening bolts foreshadow the difficulties of the sea voyage.

From the symbols on the cover, I expected a humourous, cartoony story about "Columbus the Dreamer", similar to All pigs on deck (Fischetto, 1991). This is not what I found. The only images of a smiling Columbus are: on the cover, a calculating, show-off smile as he bows before the king and queen, lifting the curtain for the crew to see, smiling as they see a bird sailing toward Palos, Spain. The last image of Columbus shows a reflective, Columbus, not smiling but contemplating, arms crossed as if still insisting that he did find
Japan and China. The images of the globe, his log opened to his picture and a painting of young Columbus on ship support this. Throughout the book this Columbus scowls, frowns and is never pleased with the sailor. The borders consist of small vignettes of repeating images; mermaids, moon, cloud, sun and stars, three ships. Puffy cheeked medieval cloud faces appear in the four corners as the four winds. The borders call attention to the images of grumbling sailors and a grouchy Columbus.

In this book the viewer is persuaded that Columbus was an uncertain navigator and a "crazy" man who was hard to work for, but who did nevertheless find a new continent. The critical view of Columbus presented within the book is softened by the cover, which serves as transitional bridge between the traditional story and this new perspective. Through the voice of the sailor who just needed a job, we are persuaded that history is made up of people like him, instead of "Great Men".

Encounter (Yolen, 1992) sets up expectations for a different kind of story. The book is 11 and 1/2 inches taller and 9 and 1/2 inches wide, which results in "greater concentration on and closer empathy with the characters depicted" (Nodelman, 1988, p. 46). The large, dark, brooding image of Columbus is dramatically staged above the small Taino boy, the perspective from
underneath Columbus emphasises his dominance. The title is printed in a delicate serifed calligraphy hand, reminiscent of medieval manuscripts on a old, cracked parchment band. It appears above the head of Columbus, like a label of the total image.

The scenes, single page and double-spreads, are painted within a bark-like border. The white space around the pictures creates tension between the spare, poetic text and moody, dream-like images. The acrylic paintings have soft edges rather than hard lines. The point-of-view of the images and text is from the Taino child, creating unexpected images that expand on the text. Most images are shadowed, figures in the distance are vague. There are great contrasts, between the dream image of bird-like ships and the "real ships," between the smiling, calm Columbus in the shadows of the potlach fire and the image of the greedy man with the "serpent's smile" who leers at a golden ornament.

The greatest contrast lies between the cover image of Columbus towering over the Taino child and the last scene, the boy as an old man. The dream-like quality of the previous pages makes the surrealness of the man literally fading into the horizon acceptable. In this image, and throughout the book, the intent is to persuade the viewer that the "encounter" of Columbus resulted in the "fading away" of an entire civilization.
Summary

This analysis was conducted to reveal layers of cultural meaning in picturebooks based on the story of Christopher Columbus. I started with the premise that I would find a shift of emphasis from historic "truth" to "story" in the picture storybooks, allowing for greater variety of iconic images and interpretations within the dual narrative.

This analysis revealed that the majority of iconic images in the picture storybooks were similar to those in the traditional picturebook biographies. All Columbus Day books presented the traditional story with the exception of Columbus Day by Vicki Leistman (1991). The other three Columbus Day books contain images of young children, or young Columbus, formatted to appear as "true". Through image and simplified narrative viewers are persuaded by the overall format that Columbus Day should be celebrated because Columbus was a hero who "discovered" a "new land", the land we live in.

The analysis revealed three central iconic images that correspond with the paradigm structure described by Pearse (1992). "Columbus the Hero" places Columbus on a historic time line of "Great Men" and fits into Paradigm I, "Columbus the Dreamer" with its introspective approach and symbolism belongs within Paradigm II,
"Critical Imagery" consists of counter-icons to the previous two, and fits well into Paradigm III (Refer to Chapter II p.). All three iconic images are present in books published from 1991 to the present, indicating that the debate about how Columbus should be remembered continues.

The "Columbus the Hero" iconic image was expected, "Columbus the Dreamer" was a surprise. Originally, I had placed Follow the Dream on one end of a narrative continuum as representing the most traditional approach to the story with Encounter on the other. After the 'substitution' analysis, I realized that this would no longer hold true. The "Columbus the Dreamer" picture storybooks all contained an awareness that the story of Columbus isn't entirely positive. Two variations arose within this iconic image: One, the creators were aware of problems, but chose to soften the impact—either by cutting off the story after the first voyage and building on "the dream" or creating a humourous fiction of Columbus taking pigs on the second voyage (Sis, 1991; Adler, 1991; Fischetto, 1991).

The other approach taken by Weil (1983) and the D'Aulaire's (1955) are not as optimistic. The longer books attempt to tell the story of all the voyages of Columbus. The D'Aulaire book is softer than the Weil and more upbeat, Columbus is merely misunderstood at the
end. The Weil shows images I had not seen anywhere else; graphic violence among the crew, stabbings and death only distanced from the viewer through the sketchiness of cartoonish black lines. Both books contain images of Columbus about to be borne away in chains. However, the Taino were presented in both books as sterotypical "natives" that hid or were "lazy". They were not part of the overall questioning tone of these books.

The third iconic image I labeled "Critical Imagery" because other than this I could not find one iconic image that all three books had in common. Here was the diversity of story perspectives that I expected to find across most picture storybooks. The creators of these three books portrayed Columbus from a socially critical perspective. Columbus looms over a Taino boy, cold and calculating, scowls at a sailor who is just trying to do his job, or appears as a soft, vague figure, who has enslaved and kidnapped Taino people. Thus, "Critical Imagery" represents criticism of the previous two icons through counter-icons.

My thought at the conclusion of this analysis was that we need more books like these, books that reveal the possibilities of other perspectives within this story. Jane Yolen reflects on the "left-out school of history" part of what Katherine Lasky calls "the
fictions of history" (Yolen, 1992b, p. 235). Yolen views herself as a writer who is "mired in society" (Ibid). She suggests that although we may hope to rise above the prejudices of our culture and time as artists, we should not expect to be able to: "The writer not only reflects upon life; she reflects it" (Ibid).

Explaining her conviction to write Encounter, Yolen ponders the issue of cultural authenticity:

"What about the idea of some other Native American writing the story? Would an Iroquois, or a Crow or a Sioux have more insight into the island massacre than the daughter and granddaughter of Ukrainian Jews? Is genocide different if perpetrated by Cossacks, Hitler, the American army or Columbus? Are the feelings of a destroyed people made less or more valuable if they are Cree or Taino or Jew? And what good is a writer if she is not able - with careful research, total empathy, and great admiration - to assume the mantle of her characters" (Ibid, p. 237).

Genocide doesn’t make for a happy story. Yet the story must be told, and as Yolen has done, told poetically and appropriately for younger children. The images of Encounter painted in acrylics by David Shannon add emotional power to the quiet poetry of Yolen’s text. Human destruction isn’t pretty. Perhaps if the storytellers of our time will tell the whole story, thoughtfully and critically, the destructive aspects of the Columbian legacy can be healed by future generations.
List of References for Chapter IV


Picturebooks Used for the Analysis


CHAPTER V

REFLECTIONS

Introduction

In exploring the nature of cultural meanings in picturebooks created from stories on Christopher Columbus, a complex research approach was synthesized from a wide range of academic disciplines. Conflicts among and within these disciplines motivated my search for an research perspective to weave the divergent strands together within one uniform study.

Early in this investigation it became clear that issues related to the nature of cultural meanings and picturebooks required what Louis E. Lankford describes as "philosophical therapy": "Issues that may require "philosophical therapy" are those that cannot be resolved by appeals to factual observation or empirical evidence" (Tice & Slavens, 1983, p. 308; in Lankford, 1992, p. 196). The analysis of picturebooks shed some light on the nature of pictures and cultural meaning, but careful reflection was necessary in determining the values and assumptions behind the images.
Philosophical methods were used to guide this study. Philosophy in art education has been defined as: "concentrated reflection and reasoning aimed at the formation of fundamental beliefs that are applicable to decision-making concerning teaching and learning art" (Lankford, 1992, p. 196). How does a cultural analysis of picturebooks based on stories of Christopher Columbus meet this definition? According to the five aims of philosophy in art education outlined by Lankford (1992) this study is focused on the third aim, "To synthesize ideas" (Ibid, p. 198). In bringing complex ideas together this investigation focused on "drawing connections, showing relationships and scaffolding ideas" (Ibid, p. 198) that lead to the creation of a framework for the cultural analysis of pictures in picturebooks. Images of Christopher Columbus and the history behind the images was chosen as an example. The nature of the problem to be examined was concerned not only with images of Columbus, but the process of creating the research approach, developing the analysis framework and the reflection involved within the analysis. Although a theory was not advanced, the groundwork was established. Speculations on "the social and individual purposes for which art has been made and is being made" (Ibid, p. 197) from the first aim,
"To justify our reason for being" (Ibid) were instrumental in forming the questions for this study.

The questions for this investigation were stated as follows:

1. What is the nature of relationships between pictures, meaning and culture?
2. How do pictures in picturebooks convey cultural information?
3. What cultural meanings would be revealed through a critical analysis of American picturebooks created from stories of Christopher Columbus?

Discoveries

"[Street Philosopher] "See, the human mind is kind of like... a pinata. When it breaks open, there's a lot of surprises inside. Once you get the pinata perspective, you see that losing your mind can be a peak experience" (Wagner in May, 1992, p. 232).

May's (1992) postmodern critique of what it means to "do" philosophy cleared a path through the tangled forest of conflicting research approaches. The polyvocal text format explored by May provided an example of how to examine opposing views by revealing assumptions that guide research practice. Her article encouraged me to investigate assumptions that have guided my research.

The characters, "Street Philosopher" and "Phantom Philosopher" asked questions that enabled me to look
more honestly at my research objectives; to embrace unanswerable questions rather than avoid them.

Philosophy was described by all of the characters in May's polyvocal text as a process of reflection; "More than finding the answers, doing philosophy is calling to question" (May, 1992, p. 228).

In adapting "the pinata perspective" I had to become a different kind of researcher. No longer was writing from a "disinterested" perspective acceptable. The examination of my priorities and beliefs through the character of "Reflective Researcher" in Chapter Two yielded the discovery that I operated more within Paradigm III, the Critical-Theoretic orientation (Pearse, 1992, p. 245) than the other two paradigms.

My concern about the nature of cultural meaning in picturebooks began from an experience I had as an art teacher after discussing pictures in the picturebook, Encounter. My students were troubled by two images; the portrayal of Christopher Columbus leering with a "serpent smile" at a golden amulet and the faded, surreal depiction of a gnarled, forgotten old man who was once a young Taino boy. Previously, my students had regarded Christopher Columbus as a hero. Their emotional struggle with the images of Encounter, as well as my own, lead to reflection on the nature of images and cultural meanings. The questions for this study
were derived from this "insiders experience" (Duncan, 1990). Why were we so disturbed by unheroic images of Columbus? What factors lie behind emotional responses to controversial images in picturebooks?

In developing the research focus, I pondered a question posed by the "Phantom Philosopher"; "What do we want to be and do?" (May, 1992, p. 230). Early in this process the question raised by my students, "What do we do with Columbus now?" was my primary concern. The analysis of picturebooks based on stories of Christopher Columbus was originally intended to provide a research approach that could be used to develop curricula. As I delved deeper into the problems of this study, I realized that the creation of a research approach for the analysis, and the analysis itself, required more time than I had planned. After asking, "In the field of art education, what do I want to be and do?", I decided that determining the nature of relationships between pictures, meaning and culture was a more vital concern than the development of curricula. Hopefully, other researchers will glean ideas from this study which could be applied to practice.
**Question One**

Speculations on the nature of relationships between pictures, meaning and culture, addressed in Chapter Two lead to an investigation of research approaches on which the analysis framework was built. The polyvocal review of literature yielded unexpected insights. Prior to this study, my understanding of Popular Culture Studies was limited to research in the United States. Much of the research examined was based on "liberal pluralism" (Duncum, 1987), a perspective that encourages the democratic examination of multiple aesthetics and the rejection of a traditional "high art" critique. Research from this orientation recommends the use of multiple criticism formats and art objects representative of a wide variety of cultures.

Cultural Studies as developed in England employed liberal pluralism as "a stepping stone toward Marxism" (Duncum, 1987, p. 1) which evolved into Neo-Marxism. An advantage of the Neo-Marxist perspective is that it examines cultural practice:

"in hypothesizing a dominant ideology and in stressing its centrality to cultural comprehension, Marxist analysis establishes a basis on which all cultural products and practices can be both described and evaluated in an openly contestable way" (Duncum, 1987, p. 1).

The liberal pluralism stance proved difficult to adapt due to the need for one set of compatible structures on which to create an analysis framework.
Cultural Studies as developed in England provided a foundation that could be combined with principles of iconology and Nodelman’s taxonomy of picturebook conventions. All three of these structures employed semiotic theories to some degree. Barrett’s general criticism guidelines under "description" meshed well with these structures and was used to shape the descriptive writing within the analysis.

What discoveries were made regarding the nature of relationships between pictures, meaning and culture? Through the polyvocal review of literature the voices of the "Formalist", "Interpreter" and "Critical Theorist" agreed that approaches to the study of art "should reflect not only different concepts of art within Western culture but also concepts drawn from anthropology" (Chapman, 1978, p. 123) and social theory (refer to page 56, Chapter II). Within the text as "Reflective Researcher" I chose to concentrate on Nodelman’s use of Goodman’s theories, to investigate relationships between pictures, meaning and culture through the use of his taxonomy of picturebook conventions. Discoveries gleaned from the analysis pertaining to Question One will be described under Question Three.
**Question Two**

This question was concerned with how pictures in picturebooks convey cultural information. I began to address this question in the polyvocal text. The voice of the "Critical Theorist" urged me to consider adapting the "five functions of the visual arts cum children’s motivations" (Duncum, 1993) to the analysis framework to reveal the motivations that shape pictures. To address this question, the "Critical Theorist" advised me to look at pictures within their "sociopolitical and cultural context" (Congdon, 1978, p. 80).

The structure of the "five functions of the visual arts cum children’s motivations" became the framework for the examination of images of Christopher Columbus for cultural meanings. Within this structure, Mitchell’s (1986) "essays in iconology" provided a guide for the critical examination of iconic images from a variety of perspectives, which included but was not limited to Marxist criticism. Key concepts taken from Mitchell were the notions that iconic images do occur in popular culture and that "hybrids" such as picturebooks contain iconic images that reflect their relationships to textual information, history and culture as well as socioeconomic influences. In Chapter Three, these concepts were further discussed.
The taxonomy of picturebook conventions outlined by Nodelman (1988) provided a scaffold of visual devices that allowed me to examine the mechanics involved in setting up viewer expectations. Meaning is achieved from prior experiences with these conventions and what they signify. Small books are expected to contain small characters and so on. But conventions could only answer a part of the riddle. While layout and design, style, size and format do influence viewer expectations, I found that the taxonomy did not take into account the social, cultural, historic milieu of the images. The taxonomy alone could not yield information on how picturebooks convey cultural meaning. The "five functions of the visual arts" filled in this gap and helped address the problem of revealing cultural meaning in pictures, which will be expanded upon in the following section.

**Question Three: Reflections on the Analysis**

The "five functions of the visual arts" was used to structure the analysis of twenty picturebooks based on stories of Christopher Columbus. The first function 'substitution' was used to analyze images of Columbus in terms of their iconic meanings, symbolism and social significance: "Visual substitutes of the famous have long been commonplace, and for good reason. They are
figures to whom others show allegiance, look for guidance, or hope for a stable social order" (Duncum, 1993, p. 216).

One social motivation for the creation of visual substitutes of Columbus could lie in what Duncum describes as "the need to understand the world through recreating it" (Ibid, p. 217) which he attributes to Piaget’s analysis of how children learn. In the picturebooks about Columbus, the writers and illustrators shaped their substitute images differently, and a variety of factors influenced the kind of stories they told. Yet through these books, each recreation of the world and actions of Christopher Columbus is directed toward a better understanding of this historic figure for elementary grade students.

To probe deeply into the nature of the meanings behind pictures, I examined each book within the substitution function for its overall iconic image of Columbus. Using concepts borrowed from Mitchell (1986) I asked, "What historic figure walks this iconic stage?" To identify the iconic image in each book, Nodelman’s (1988) taxonomy of picturebook conventions and Barrett’s descriptive criticism guide were used to provide the visual evidence required to support my findings.
Picturebook numbers 1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 12, 14 and 17 were found to contain the "Columbus the Hero" icon. The majority of these books were grouped under Category I, picturebook biographies on page 111. All Category II "Columbus Day" picturebooks portrayed this iconic image. Only two picture storybooks from Category III were identified with the "Columbus the Hero" iconic image. At the beginning of the analysis, I suspected that the majority of picturebook biographies would be limited to one iconic image, whereas I had hoped to find a greater variety in the picture storybooks. Yet, this was not the case. The analysis revealed only two iconic images: "Columbus the Hero" and "Columbus the Dreamer". The third category, "Critical Imagery" could not be classified as one kind of icon due to the diversity of story perspectives. Only three books were found to contain critical imagery.

With this information, I focused the analysis on the qualities of the iconic images that revealed major cultural themes. Since picturebook publishing is a highly competitive, culturally determined enterprise, the cultural themes referred to here are those that reinforce what Taxel (1992) describes as a "selective tradition" in children's literature. The "selective tradition" refers to the practice of social domination
by those who wield control in literary criticism and the publishing industry.

Table 2 indicates that all picturebooks contained images of leadership within the "Columbus the Hero" icon. Images of Columbus as "friend of the Taino" were located in all but two books. No book portrayed any criticism of Columbus as a leader nor in his treatment of the Taino within this icon. Half of the books contained religious symbols. Eight of the twelve books contained a picture of Columbus being honored before the king and queen of Spain. Three of the books portray the triumphant return of the hero.

In Table 2, all of the picturebooks portray Columbus as "friend of the Taino". Four out of the five books within this iconic image category contain images of the rejection of Columbus by royalty, and images symbolic of inept leadership. None of the "Columbus the Hero" books included these images. Three of these books portrayed young Columbus dreaming of adventures.

In the Critical Imagery category, as shown in Table 3, all picture storybooks contained images of inept leadership, as in the "Columbus the Dreamer" icon. However, this category contains imagery not found in the previous two icons; unheroic images of Columbus are also found in all three books. In two of the books, images
that foreshadow the destruction of the Taino combine with the text to serve as a warning.

Under the second function, 'narration' the picturebooks were grouped according to iconic image or critical image category and analyzed for narrative elements in image and text. The narrative elements were compared to determine how they have been used to maintain "a stable social order" (Duncum, 1993, p. 218). The analysis indicated that the "Columbus the Hero" icon resembles the hero of fairytales. Supporting visual evidence was found in images of Columbus as a revered leader, the depiction in most books of the difficult journey and the honor at journey's end.

The "Columbus the Dreamer" icon was more complex, some books contained elements of the hero icon. These books differed from the hero books in their treatment of the narrative elements. Columbus might be an inept leader but he can be excused because he was a great visionary. *Follow the Dream* is the only book within this icon that did not contain images of inept leadership. The focus of this story is on the dream of Columbus.

Functions three, four and five; 'embellishment', 'commitment/persuasion' and 'personal expression' were grouped together to avoid duplication. Within these functions the iconic images identified previously
were analyzed according to the point-of-view and intent of their creators. Format and book design were analyzed under 'embellishment' for how visual devices are used to set up viewer expectations. Speculations were made regarding the nature of each iconic image and its impact on American society. The analysis indicated that the "Columbus the Hero" icon maintained the individualist notion that one person with special insights can change the course of history. Columbus was a hero who discovered the land we live in. Ignored within this iconic image is the genocide of a people.

In the "Columbus the Dreamer" iconic image, the parameters for the consideration of issues was broader. Columbus was a great dreamer, but he wasn’t a good leader. He was a misunderstood dreamer who dreamed alone. In this icon, Columbus is the embodiment of the Modernist myth, a great man who was not appreciated in his time.

The Critical Imagery category yielded insights from different story perspectives. Columbus was not a hero, nor was he a dreamer. In all three books he was portrayed unheroically: as a groucher in The first voyage of Christopher Columbus, a greed-filled stranger with a "serpent’s smile" in Encounter or indirectly as a man who didn’t see the Taino as friends but as slaves in
Liestman’s *Columbus Day*. All three books stretched the parameters for the consideration of issues.

Reflecting on the findings from the analysis I wonder why there aren’t more books like these. *Encounter* is a popular book in my school and was enthusiastically welcomed by Taxel (1992). Liestman’s book was listed as a recommended resource for teachers in "Rethinking Schools" (1991). *The first voyage of Christopher Columbus*, 1492 offers a unique look at Columbus from a sailor’s perspective. It offers a model for students to write about Columbus from the perspective of a laborer of that time and place who "just needs a job".

Speculation on the social functions behind the iconic images: "Columbus the Hero" and "Columbus the Dreamer", indicates that according to the "selective tradition in children’s literature", literary critics and publishers are currently choosing to promote books that honor Columbus as a hero (Taxel, 1992). In so doing they ignore the fact that the Taino people were completely destroyed as a result of that discovery. This limited space for the consideration of issues robs children of the opportunity to investigate and explore problems of cultural intolerance and exploitation.

In summary, the analysis yielded insights into the nature of relationships between pictures and meaning
through Nodelman's taxonomy of picturebook conventions that set up viewer expectations. These relationships were considered within each of the "five social functions of pictures cum student motivations" (Duncum, 1993) and applied to the problem of extracting cultural meaning. Mitchell's (1986) notion of the icon as a cultural mirror enabled me to pull together relationships between pictures, meaning and culture; providing a lens for the examination of pictures for cultural meaning.

Implications

The six points outlined in McFee's "Perception-Delineation Theory (1977) will be described and compared to Nodelman’s taxonomy of picturebook conventions described previously in Chapter III. Following this, speculations will be made about the application of the work of each researcher to the processes of learning and teaching from picturebooks.

McFee's Perception-Delineation Theory

June King McFee's "Perception-Delineation Theory" is presented as a model "based on psychological and biological findings that every individual has a somewhat unique potential to learn" (McFee, 1977, p. 324) that is dependent on past and present opportunities to use
their potential. McFee's model illuminates the complexity of relationships that exist within culturally diverse classrooms. The "Perception-Delineation Theory" referred to as P. D. III (simplified and updated from McFee, 1970) is provided as a model for art education students in Art, Culture, and Environment. The model illustrates a theory of relationships to allow teachers to deal with diversity. It consists of six points that teachers need to consider within the total instructional environment.

Point I: Students' Readiness

Student readiness, according to McFee is a result of prior opportunities to use their potential to learn as encouraged through their psychocultural-physical environment. The psychocultural-physical environment is made up of relationships between the "values, attitudes and beliefs of a group of people" which in turn influence the physical environment that children also learn from. A person's readiness to "know, to see, to relate" forms a screen through which information from the environment is processed.

McFee (1961) identifies six individual differences which are related to behaviors in art that teachers should consider in addressing student readiness. These differences are the result of past experiences rather
than ability: 1. Flexibility-rigidity. Children differ in their approach to new situations and transitions in "motor-cognitive tasks." 2. Orientation to space. This depends on how a child was raised to deal with the environment. Restrictive parents tend to have children who rely more on visual cues; those who encourage self-direction tend to produce independent children who make use of "bodily cues." 3. Learning and the perceptual process. "Perceiving is an information-handling process in which visual stimuli are organized in order to make cognitive responses." The manner in which visual stimuli is organized is determined by cultural orientation, values and training. 4. The perceptual constancies. This refers to individual tendencies to interpret visual elements such as size, shape and color by what one knows about them rather than the actual visual image. This also varies across cultures. 5. Subcultures. Children bring the values of their cultural context to the art experience. Difference between the values of the school art program and home may stem from differences in attitudes about art. 6. Prior learning. Past experiences can create mindsets that inhibit or enhance creative exploration.
Point II: The Psychocultural Classroom Environment

This is created through the transactions between individual students and the teacher. How successful these transactions are depends on how comfortable the individuals are with each other. McFee states that the more students and teachers are alike, the easier communication will be. She notes that some children react to praise and blame differently (McFee, 1961), and adds that teachers should be sensitive to the different needs of extroverted and introverted students.

Point III: The Visual-Physical Environment

This consists of the actual physical environment that provides the context for student learning. Is the arrangement of the room conducive to group interaction or solitary work? What kind of materials are used to motivate? How are the needs of all students met? McFee adds that the way a student responds in class provides the teacher with input on how they view the physical environment.

Point IV: Information Handling

This is dependant on the student’s prior knowledge and readiness, how they respond to the psychocultural environment and new input which may alter their readiness. The amount of new information and a
student's ability to handle this changes their original readiness. McFee encourages teachers to build bridges of understanding to help students connect their past experiences with new ones.

**Point V: Delineating and Responding to Art**

At this point McFee states that an art work is more of an expression of student readiness than of personality. Motor skills, comfort with media, tools and techniques all are factors in expression. When students can make decisions about media, put ideas and materials together creatively and have a high degree of comfort and success with tools and techniques, then they are free to express ideas. Student analysis of art or criticism is also based on readiness, the learning environment, familiarity with the form, media, artist and context of an artwork. Again, McFee suggests that teachers make artworks more accessible to students by connecting it with their life experiences.

**Point VI: Feedback**

Feedback is the end of the double feedback loop in this system. By observing what happens at points IV and V we can see how a student’s readiness for new work has changed. This provides information regarding the possible need to modify points II, III, IV, and V.
Comparisons Between Nodelman and McFee

Both Nodelman (1988) and McFee (1977) are concerned with the creation of meaning from images and the importance of prior knowledge as it influences perception. However, the emphasis each places upon the significance of culture varies. Nodelman acknowledges the importance of culture to the creation of meaning from pictures but does not discuss culturally sensitive issues. McFee is focused on multicultural concerns.

Unlike McFee, Nodelman does not discuss student readiness and pedagogy: "Most discussion of children's books, including picture books, dwells on their educational uses; my own approach focuses on qualities of pictures and texts rather than on pedagogical issues" (Nodelman, 1988, p.x). To Nodelman, picturebooks are "serious art" and deserve the respect given to other forms of "serious art." His priority is to "offer a number of words that can interestingly and usefully be said about pictures" (Ibid, p. xi). He hopes that his work will be used by educators who will "develop a means of sharing them with children" (Ibid). McFee's "Perception-Delination Theory" was streamlined into a theoretical model that teachers can immediately put to use in their classrooms. McFee walks teachers through each point, providing additional questions to help them
focus on the task of shaping the art curriculum to fit the diverse needs of the students.

With such differences in orientation and method what can these two theories have in common? What do they tell us about the processes of learning and teaching from picturebooks? I was amazed to discover many connections between the two theories and how often they complemented and enhanced each other. To discover these relationships I had to walk through both theories as an teacher who develops lessons from picturebooks. Nodelman's taxonomies can be applied to the classroom through a discussion McFee's Points I, IV, V and VI.

First, I considered Point I: Student Readiness. In a section on questions for teachers, McFee (1977) asks teachers to consider the development of their students with regard to three modes of learning, remembering and communicating ideas and relationships:

1. **Manipulating**, "using sensorimotor skills to analyze present and past situations."

2. **Perceptualizing**, classifying visual and auditory information into "mental images with visual qualities and relationships" and the ability to express and remember using symbols, icons and signs.

3. **Conceptualizing**, categorizing sensory information into mental concepts with "labels of qualities and
relationships," the ability to remember and express using words (McFee, 1977, p. 326).

Nodelman states that "our understanding of any given picture depends on our understanding of the purposes of pictures" (p. 15). By planning for differences in learning modalities and prior knowledge, the teacher can assist students in developing an understanding of the pictures in picturebooks. One way to do this is to use a book that plays with conventions and signifiers such as The Stinky Cheese Man. The students and teacher track down how conventions are used and purposefully misused to achieve humor and irony. Baby books, humorous picturebooks, picturebook versions of fairytales and wordless picturebooks could all be investigated for their intended purpose. Questions such as: "What kind of story do you expect when you see a small binding?" "A large binding?" "What kinds of information do you see on the front cover of a picturebook?" "The back cover?" "What kind of story do you expect when you see a lot of bright colors?" "Dark colors?" "Black and white?," can lead students into group explorations of picturebook conventions.

Point IV, information handling, is concerned with how teachers help students connect their prior knowledge to new art experiences. McFee informs teachers that "Helping students become more aware at a rate that keeps
growth stimulated is your most challenging task" (McFee, 1977, p. 328). How can this be related to teaching and learning with picturebooks? Once students have moved from their original readiness to familiarity with new ideas about picturebook conventions, the teacher can lead them into more challenging discussions on style and meaning. To allow for differences in student readiness the teacher should supply picturebooks that are familiar, then move into more challenging formats.

In my unit on Christopher Columbus, my fourth graders began by examining familiar picturebook versions of stories based on the arrival of Columbus in America. Groups were asked to look for picturebook conventions such as size, binding, page layouts, bright or dark colors and then general style observations—the artist’s medium, techniques such as pen and ink and so on. Then I asked the students to form a hypothesis about what kind of story was being told and to whom. Was it a humorous tale for young children or a serious story for older students? Students supported their hypothesis with evidence taken from the combination of image and text. This activity could be related to a student analysis built upon Duncum’s (1993) five social functions of the visual arts cum children’s motivations.

Point V lends itself to studio investigations of Nodelman’s taxonomies. McFee states that functions at
this point depend on whether the purpose of an activity is to create art through manipulation of media and materials, "to express images through visual analysis" or to locate "significant forms" to express through "conceptual analysis" then finding visual forms to express these ideas (McFee, 1977, p. 329). She suggests that artists successfully use all these modes, but beginners can fail unless they can begin with a familiar means of expression. To accommodate this need in the classroom, McFee encourages teachers to offer a variety of materials and procedures that encourage a range of artistic expression.

Nodelman’s framework of taxonomies tells us how visual images are perceived as meaningful in isolation, as part of a series and when combined with text in picturebooks. He has nothing to say about teaching, leaving that for those of us who are interested in applying his "words about pictures" to our classrooms. However, when Nodelman’s taxonomies are combined with McFee’s "Perception-Delineation" theory on how to teach art to culturally diverse students, a model could be created that enables teachers to use picturebooks in art education, to help students find "words about pictures" in picturebooks. The "five functions of the visual arts cum children’s motivations" could be used to develop a more socially responsive curriculum in the visual
arts, using picturebooks as an accessible focus for elementary school students. To build a solid foundation for such a curriculum, more studies need to be conducted on the application of these ideas to classroom practice.
List of References for Reflections


BIBLIOGRAPHY

List of References for Introduction


**Picturebooks**


**List of References for Chapter I**


Efland A. (paper presented in class, 1993). Historical research methods for art educators. Columbus, Ohio: The Ohio State University, p. 2-5.


History of Columbus. (1990, August, 17) Brochure produced by the Columbus Area Chamber of Commerce.


Picturebooks


List of References for Chapter II


List of References for Chapter III


Picturebooks


List of References for Chapter IV


**Picturebooks Used for the Analysis**


**List of References for Chapter V**


