INFORMATION TO USERS

This was produced from a copy of a document sent to us for microfilming. While the most advanced technological means to photograph and reproduce this document have been used, the quality is heavily dependent upon the quality of the material submitted.

The following explanation of techniques is provided to help you understand markings or notations which may appear on this reproduction.

1. The sign or “target” for pages apparently lacking from the document photographed is “Missing Page(s)”. If it was possible to obtain the missing page(s) or section, they are spliced into the film along with adjacent pages. This may have necessitated cutting through an image and duplicating adjacent pages to assure you of complete continuity.

2. When an image on the film is obliterated with a round black mark it is an indication that the film inspector noticed either blurred copy because of movement during exposure, or duplicate copy. Unless we meant to delete copyrighted materials that should not have been filmed, you will find a good image of the page in the adjacent frame. If copyrighted materials were deleted you will find a target note listing the pages in the adjacent frame.

3. When a map, drawing or chart, etc., is part of the material being photographed the photographer has followed a definite method in “sectioning” the material. It is customary to begin filming at the upper left hand corner of a large sheet and to continue from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps. If necessary, sectioning is continued again—beginning below the first row and continuing on until complete.

4. For any illustrations that cannot be reproduced satisfactorily by xerography, photographic prints can be purchased at additional cost and tipped into your xerographic copy. Requests can be made to our Dissertations Customer Services Department.

5. Some pages in any document may have indistinct print. In all cases we have filmed the best available copy.

University Microfilms International

300 N. ZEEB RD., ANN ARBOR, MI 48106
Dorgan, Peter Paul

FRANZ LISZT AND HIS VERDI OPERA TRANSCRIPTIONS

The Ohio State University

University Microfilms International 300 N. Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, MI 48106

D.M.A. 1982
PLEASE NOTE:

In all cases this material has been filmed in the best possible way from the available copy. Problems encountered with this document have been identified here with a check mark √.

1. Glossy photographs or pages √
2. Colored illustrations, paper or print √
3. Photographs with dark background √
4. Illustrations are poor copy √
5. Pages with black marks, not original copy √
6. Print shows through as there is text on both sides of page √
7. Indistinct, broken or small print on several pages √
8. Print exceeds margin requirements √
9. Tightly bound copy with print lost in spine √
10. Computer printout pages with indistinct print √
11. Page(s) _______ lacking when material received, and not available from school or author.
12. Page(s) _______ seem to be missing in numbering only as text follows.
13. Two pages numbered _______. Text follows.
14. Curling and wrinkled pages √
15. Other _________________________________________
FRANZ LISZT AND HIS VERDI OPERA TRANSCRIPTIONS

DOCUMENT

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for
the Degree Doctor of Musical Arts in the Graduate
School of the Ohio State University

by

Peter Paul Dorgan, L.T.C.L., L.R.A.M., M.M.

The Ohio State University
1982

Reading Committee
Peter Gano, Ph.D.
Mario Alch
Richard Tetley-Kardos

Approved By:

Advisor
School of Music
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This project began, from a pianist's point of view, at the wrong end. The operas of Giuseppe Verdi have interested me for a number of years; from them I moved to the various arrangements made by great, and not so great, pianists and composers in the nineteenth century. The arrangements made by Franz Liszt were so superior to all of the others that my wonder at their neglect led to this paper. Dr. Peter Gano guided my previous Verdi studies, and, as adviser for this project, deserves much thanks for his guidance. The patience of my piano teacher, Richard Tetley-Kardos, was sorely tried by my attempts to play the transcriptions. My wife, Lorna, provided much more than her encouragement and interest. As a singer, her professional knowledge and experience in performing the works of Verdi proved invaluable; it is no exaggeration to say that without her this paper would not have been written.
VITA

June 23, 1949
Born - Dublin, Ireland

1969
L.T.C.L., Trinity College, London

1972
L.R.A.M., The Royal Academy of Music

1974-80
Teaching Assistant, School of Music, The Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio

1976
M.M., The Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio

Recital Dates:
April 20, 1978 Chamber recital
April 3, 1979 Lecture recital
November 20, 1979 Solo recital
November 2, 1981 Solo recital

iii
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGMENTS</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VITA</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Liszt and the Transcription</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Title in Liszt's Arrangements</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Liszt and Verdi</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Liszt's Verdi Arrangements</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSION</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDICES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTRODUCTION

Recent years have seen what is virtually a birth of interest in Franz Liszt. Performers, with a few exceptions, ignored most of his compositions, and scholars seem to have considered him beneath their attention. Liszt is finally emerging as a giant of Nineteenth Century Romanticism. Much still remains to be done before the final assessment can be made. First in importance is the publication of his complete works. The Collected Edition published by Breitkopf and Härtel between 1901 and 1936 is far from complete. Among its omissions are the transcriptions of Schubert's songs and the nine arrangements Liszt made of portions of Verdi's compositions.

Eight of these arrangements are the subject of this paper. The ninth is an arrangement for organ, harmonium or piano of the Agnus Dei from the Manzoni Requiem, and, as such, is not included. First it will be necessary to discuss, briefly, the role of the transcription in Liszt's creative life and why he concerned himself with such an unoriginal aspect of composition. We will examine the various titles given to the arrangements in an effort to determine if there is a formal reason for the title. We will examine, too, the relationship between Liszt and Verdi, a relationship for which there is scant primary source material, while evidence of the
transcriptions points to a real understanding of and deep respect for the Italian by Liszt. In the central section of the paper we will examine each of the Verdi arrangements individually, comparing each with its operatic original, noting, in as much detail as possible (given that not all of them are available) the differences, and, where applicable, the ways Liszt encapsulates the drama of the opera in a few pages. Finally, there is a complete catalogue of Liszt's transcriptions for piano solo.

A discussion of Liszt without some mention of the contemporary development of the piano is impossible, for he was the supreme master of what was virtually a new instrument, and was the first to experiment compositionally with it. Of necessity, this discussion will be as brief and untechnical as possible. The reader interested in more detail is referred to Arthur Loesser's *Men, Women and Pianos*¹ and to John Golightly's *The Piano between 1800 and 1850*.²

The piano at the start of the nineteenth century was a very unreliable instrument. In the large halls where the increasingly popular concerts were held, it could be heard better than the harpsichord and the clavichord, but, with its wooden frame, any force tended to break the strings, and any attempt to strengthen the


²John Wesley Golightly, "The Piano between 1800 and 1850; the instruments for which the composers wrote" (unpublished DMA document, The Ohio State University, Columbus, 1980).
strings put an impossible strain on the frame. Experiments were made with metal bars to reinforce the frame, and it was an American, Alpheus Babcock of Boston, who produced the first complete cast-iron frame in 1825. The French piano makers favoured this improvement. Four years earlier the French piano maker Sébastien Erard perfected his 'double escapement' action, which allowed for greater ease in repeated notes, greater rapidity and greater responsiveness. The third major improvement was patented in 1826 by another Frenchman, Jean-Henri Pape, who used felt to cover the hammer heads; up to that time leather had been used, but it was unsatisfactory for in time the leather became brittle, and a dry, harsh tone was the result. Two years after this patent, Pape introduced cross-stringing.

The metal frame permitting a stronger blow and therefore greater volume, the rapid double-escapement action making for more delicate stroke-responsiveness combined with speed, the thickly felt-covered hammers giving a "rounder" tone than those formerly used - all these developments converged into one trend; the making of an instrument suitable for use by a person who could project piano music commandingly, fascinatingly, in a large room, a concert virtuoso in other words; a piano that could be played louder and faster, with more sensitive shading, more violent contrast, and a richer, more "singing" quality than had been possible previously.

---

3 Golightly, op. cit., 30.  
4 Ibid., 21.
Liszt was the master of this new instrument, as is demonstrated in a composition like *Hexameron* a virtual compendium of nineteenth-century piano techniques. For a charity reception the Princess Belgiojoso asked six of the greatest pianists to contribute a variation on "Suoni le trombe" from Bellini's *I Puritani*. The pianists were Thalberg, Pixis, Herz, Czerny, Chopin and Liszt. Each pianist's variation demonstrates his peculiar technical facility; Liszt provided the introduction, the arrangement of the theme, the linking passages and the coda where all the variations are recalled, Chopin's excepted. The implication is that Liszt could do all that the other pianists could, and more.

With his transcriptions, Liszt experimented with what was pianistically possible, and, as we shall see, the Verdi arrangements, spanning as they do Liszt's serious composing years, illustrate the progression to simplicity that this composer made.

---

5Loesser, *op.cit.*, 339.

Chapter 1
LISZT AND THE TRANSCRIPTION

Franz Liszt made over seven hundred arrangements of his own and other's compositions. Considering that this amounts to over half of Liszt's entire output, some discussion of the reasons for this concentration on one compositional area is in order.

In a musical era dominated by the piano, it was only natural that successful compositions were brought out in versions for piano, either as solos or duets. Even today it is possible to find piano arrangements of Strauss tone-poems, and while the notion of arranging, say, Messaien's "Turangalila" Symphony would seem absurd, publishers still regard piano-duet arrangements of Beethoven symphonies and string quartets as profitable, since they are kept in print.

In the nineteenth century, a living was to be made contributing to such volumes as "Gems of the Opera, being a Collection of Fantasies, Rondos, Transcriptions, etc. Arranged for Pianoforte from the Favourite Operas of Donizetti, Bellini, Meyerbeer, Rossini, Verdi, Auber, etc." And while Liszt never went so far as to

---

1 Barbara Crockett, "Liszt's Opera Transcriptions for piano" (unpublished DMA document, University of Illinois, Urbana, 1968), 5.
publish, as J. Ascher did, a "Traviata Grand Caprice," or "Verdi's Quick Step (Ernani)," it is reasonable to assume that Liszt would not have expended time and energy on his arrangements had there not been some financial recompense.

It is not easy to determine the value of payment of over a century ago. Not only have certain denominations of currency disappeared, but the purchasing power of those currencies can only be surmised. In 1850, for instance, Liszt asked, bashfully, for eighty to one hundred louis d'or for six compositions, consisting of "Lieder of Beethoven; Lieder-Cyclus of Beethoven; Consolations (6 numbers); Illustrations of the Prophète (3 numbers)." According to Webster's New World Dictionary (1960), a louis d'or was the equivalent of twenty francs, making Liszt's fee somewhere between 1,600 and 2,000 francs. By comparison, twenty years later Verdi contracted to write "Aida" for 150,000 francs, a figure which did not even include the performing rights outside of Egypt.

---

2 Ibid.


5 Hans Busch, Verdi's "Aida": the history of an opera in letters and documents (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1978), 474.
It would seem that Liszt could have demanded a higher fee for his arrangements. No doubt there was a certain amount of "hack-work" in many of the arrangements, just as there was flattery behind the arrangements of works by such Hungarian amateurs as Count Imre Szechenyi; for such arrangements, causing him little effort and time, Liszt might have requested a low fee. Arranging Beethoven's works, on the other hand, caused him much trouble. In 1839 he had written to Breitkopf and Härtel concerning some Beethoven songs they had asked him to arrange: "I shall certainly do the Adelaide, however difficult it may seem to me to transcribe simply and elegantly. As regards the others, I am afraid I cannot find the necessary time."\(^6\) Two years later he was still concerned with Adelaide:

I have just added a tremendous Cadenza three pages long, in small notes, and an entire Coda, almost as long, to Beethoven's Adelaide...I will beg you to have the last coda printed in small notes as an Ossia...so that the purists can play the integral text only, if the commentary is displeasing to them. It was certainly a very delicate matter to touch Adelaide, and yet it seemed to me necessary to venture. Have I done it with propriety and taste?\(^7\)

It seems that financial rewards were not of primary importance to Liszt. The two reasons that were important are related:

"Together with Liszt's desire to bring acknowledged masterpieces to a wider public went a desire to put his glamorous reputation at the disposal of his less fortunate colleagues, by introducing his own

---

\(^6\) Liszt, *op. cit.*, 37.

\(^7\) Ibid., 51.
versions of their music into his recital programmes." The roll of composers whose works Liszt arranged includes every major contemporary composer, many minor ones, and many predecessors.

A measure of the usefulness of these of these arrangements can be taken from the fact that the two most famous articles on Hector Berlioz's *Symphony Fantastique* (by Francois-Joseph Fétis in the *Revue musicale* of February 1, 1835, and by Robert Schumann in the *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik*, spread over six issues in July and August, 1835) were based on Liszt's piano version. In December of that year Berlioz could write of the "Good reports from Germany, thanks to Liszt's piano arrangements of my symphony." In this case, not only did Liszt arrange the work for piano, he seems to have paid for its publication as well: "The *Symphonie Fantastique* is out, and as our poor Liszt has spent a terrible lot of money over it, we arranged with Schlesinger that not one copy was to be given away."

---


Three years after the Berlioz was published Liszt went to Vienna to give a series of recitals to raise money to help the Hungarian government cope with disastrous floods. In these eight recitals, which raised some 24,000 gulden, Liszt reminded the Viennese of their native composer by playing much Schubert, particularly his own arrangements of some of the songs.\textsuperscript{12} The symphonies of Beethoven were also little known, so Liszt played some of those. The series of nine arrangements was actually completed in 1863, but three of them date from Liszt's days as a touring virtuoso. The letters to Breitkopf and Härtel while he was engaged in completing these arrangements illustrate Liszt's reasons for transcription and the problems he faced and tried to solve, sometimes unsuccessfully.

\begin{quote}
A pianoforte arrangement of these creations must, indeed, expect to remain a very poor and far-off approximation. How instill into the transitory hammers of the piano breath and soul, resonance and power, fullness and inspiration, colour and accent? However, I will, at least, endeavour to overcome the worst difficulties and to furnish the pianoforte-playing world with as faithful as possible an illustration of Beethoven's genius.\textsuperscript{13}
\end{quote}

Six months later he wrote again:

\begin{quote}
Whilst initiating myself further in the genius of Beethoven I trust I have also made some little progress in the manner of adapting his inspirations to the piano, as far as this instrument admits of it; and I have tried not to neglect to take into account the relative facility of
\end{quote}


\textsuperscript{13} Liszt, \textit{Letters}, II, 57.
execution while maintaining an exact fidelity to the original.\textsuperscript{14}

To a friend he wrote:

In honour of H\"artel's edition of Beethoven I have been occupying myself again with studies and experiments in pianoforte pieces. The arrangements of the Beethoven Symphonies which I am about to send to Leipzig are, I trust, successful. They cost me more trouble, in attempts of various sorts, in corrections, eliminations and additions, than I had anticipated.\textsuperscript{15}

With the symphonies finished, he would then tackle the string quartets, "those magnificent jewels in Beethoven's crown which the piano-playing public has not yet appropriated in a measure suitable to its musical culture."\textsuperscript{16} Much to his chagrin, Liszt found the project impossible. "After several attempts the result was either absolutely unplayable - or insipid stuff. Nevertheless I shall not give up my project, and shall make another trial to solve this problem of pianoforte arrangements."\textsuperscript{17}

It is in these extracts that Liszt sets forth his reasons for his interest in transcriptions. The pianistic/compositional challenge of transferring the music of one medium to another effectively was paramount. The key word in this is "effectively." It was not enough that the result be playable by two hands on one keyboard: the

\textsuperscript{14} Ibid., 57.
\textsuperscript{15} Ibid., 59.
\textsuperscript{16} Ibid., 59.
\textsuperscript{17} Ibid., 117.
sounds of the original had to be reproduced on the piano. Thus, for example, in the trio of the third movement of the Fifth Symphony, it was not only the notes that were to be reproduced, but the difficulty in playing those notes had to be duplicated on the keyboard, and so the left hand plays in octaves, reflecting the problems Beethoven's double basses have with the passage.

Liszt refers to these Beethoven arrangements as "studies and experiments." This could be applied to all of the arrangements, for they were as much experiments in what was possible on the new piano as they were attempts to bring the music to a wider public.\textsuperscript{18}

A side effect of Liszt's transcriptions was the subduing of the noisy audiences, especially in Italy. Operas and concerts were as much social getherings as they were musical events. Audiences at La Scala, Milan, for instance, occupied their time "chattering, having supper, conducting love-affairs and paying social calls throughout the performance."\textsuperscript{19} Not only were they uninterested in the music of an earlier time, they seemed interested only in opera and whatever novelty the performer could produce. When Liszt asked for themes on

\textsuperscript{18}See Introduction, p 4.

\textsuperscript{19}Arthur Hedley, "Liszt the Pianist and Teacher," Franz Liszt, the Man and His Music, ed. Alan Walker (London: Barrie and Jenkins, 1970), 27.
which to improvise, they suggested the railway or the Milan cathedral.\textsuperscript{20} Liszt solved the problem, to a certain extent, by giving a series of solo concerts whose novelty seems to have stunned the Italian public into some semblance of attention. Of course he gave them opera - after his own fashion - and having dazzled them with his technique, which the operatic fantasies were carefully tailored to display, he could then play a Beethoven sonata, or the latest Schumann composition.

But while audiences loved the transcriptions, critics and so-called "serious" musicians did not, and tended to regard Liszt as a purveyor of cheap pianistic effects. The criticism has survived and is only now beginning to die. Today we can study the transcriptions and arrangements for what they are, and not for what his contemporaries thought they were not. They were attempts to bring to a wider audience music that was neglected or ignored. They were experiments in the advancement of piano technique by solving the special problems inherent in such piano reductions. They expanded Liszt's own performing repertoire, and their publication earned him a modest income.

Chapter 2

THE TITLE IN LISZT'S ARRANGEMENTS

A glance at the Index of Transcriptions at the end of this essay reveals a confusing array of titles: Réminiscences; Illustrations; Fantasies; even a Divertissement. It might seem that these are little more than a publisher's attempt to provide a novel and eye-catching title-page. An examination of the music will show that formally there were differences, and that in some cases, particularly in the Beethoven symphonies, Liszt himself insisted on a particular title.

When the publishing firm of Breitkopf and Härtel first suggested that Liszt arrange the Beethoven symphonies for piano in the 1830's, he expressed interest in the project. Three of the symphonies, in fact, were already completed, and Liszt had spoken to another publisher, Hofmeister, about what he termed the "pianoforte score." In 1863 he elaborated this for Breitkopf and Härtel:

By the title of Pianoforte score (which must be kept, and translated into German by Clavier-Partitur or Pianoforte-Partitur), I wish to indicate my intention of associating the spirit of the performer with the orchestral effects, and to render apparent, in the narrow limits of the piano, sonorous sounds and different nuances. With this in view I have frequently noted down the names of the instruments...as well as the contrast
of strings and wind instruments. It would certainly be highly ridiculous to pretend that these designations suffice to transplant the magic of the orchestra to the piano; nevertheless, I don't consider them superfluous. Apart from some little use they have as instruction, pianists of some intelligence may make them a help in accentuating and grouping the subjects, bringing out the chief ones, keeping the secondary ones in the background, and - in a word - regulating themselves by the standard of the orchestra.¹

In the Preface to the Symphonies, Liszt explains his philosophy still further, and it is worth quoting at some length for the light it sheds on the seriousness with which Liszt approached his task.

The words might also be applied to many others of the transcriptions.

...every way or manner of making them accessible and popular has a certain merit, nor are the rather numerous arrangements published so far without relative merit though, for the most part, they seem to be of but little intrinsic value for deeper research...By the development in technique and mechanism which the piano has gained of late, it is possible now to attain more and better results than have been attained so far. With the immense development of its harmonic power the piano seeks to appropriate more and more all orchestral compositions. In the compass of its seven octaves it can, with but few exceptions, reproduce all traits, all combinations, all figurations of the most learned, of the deepest tone-creations, and leaves to the orchestra no other advantages than those of the variety of tone-colours and massive effects - immense advantages, to be sure...I confess that I should have to consider it a rather useless employment of my time, if I had but added one more to the numerous hitherto published piano arrangements, following in their rut; but I consider my time well-employed if I have succeeded in transferring to the piano not only the grand outlines of

Beethoven's compositions but also all those numerous fine details, and smallest traits that so powerfully contribute to the completion of the ensemble.²

Liszt may have exaggerated the piano's ability to usurp the orchestra (perhaps in his hands it did), but, as Alan Walker has pointed out,³ his piano versions are supreme. Liszt knew they were. In a letter to Breitkopf and Härtel written sometime in the 1830's, Liszt said:

...whether I am right or wrong, I think it sufficiently different from, not to say superior to, those of the same kind which have hitherto appeared. The recent publication of the same Symphonies, arranged by Mr. Kalkbrenner, makes me anxious that mine should not remain any longer in a portoflio. I intend also to finger them carefully, which, in addition to the indication of the different instruments (which is important in this kind of work), will most certainly make this edition much more complete.⁴

The piano scores, then, were straightforward arrangements, complete with scoring indications, designed as much for the study of the works themselves as for their public performance. In his performing days, Liszt, as was pointed out at the start of this chapter, had arranged only three of the symphonies, and there are


⁴Liszt, Letters, I, 22.
reports of his playing only one of those - the Sixth, in public.\textsuperscript{5} The same is true of the Berlioz piano scores. Both the \textit{Symphonie Fantastique} and \textit{Harold en Italie} were arranged for piano in Liszt's performing days; there is no evidence that Liszt ever played these works in their entirety in public. Sir Charles Hallé has left an account of Liszt's performance of the \textit{March au Supplice} immediately after an orchestral playing of the movement "with an effect even surpassing that of the full orchestra and creating an indescribable furore."\textsuperscript{6}

Liszt's version of \textit{Harold en Italie} was lost for many years. The arrangement was completed in 1836, in Switzerland, and when it was eventually found and was being readied for publication, Liszt asked Berlioz to send him a copy of the orchestral score "which is necessary for the accurate revision of the arrangement."\textsuperscript{7} Liszt may have revised his arrangement, but the piano scores of the \textit{Symphonie Fantastique} and \textit{Harold en Italie} do not take into account Berlioz's final revisions.\textsuperscript{8} Perhaps Liszt felt that these revisions were of

\textsuperscript{5}Cosima Wagner, Jr. a diary entry for January 10, 1883, writes "Around 6 o'clock my father plays to us the Andante from the A major Symph. and the Scherzo Allegretto from the F Major; twice during the latter R. comes in dancing, which makes Fidi laugh a lot." \textit{Diaries,} II, 988.

\textsuperscript{6}Alan Walker, "Liszt's Musical Background," \textit{Franz Liszt, the Man and his Music}, 43.

\textsuperscript{7}Liszt, \textit{Letters}, II, 319.

minor importance compared to the major task of bringing these compositions before the public.

Song Transcriptions

Alan Walker divides Liszt's song arrangements into two broad categories: paraphrases, which are free adaptations; and transcriptions, which are strict. As is usual in such attempts to classify composers' works, this is not an absolute division, as Walker himself admits. "We are probably correct to call the Schubert song arrangements 'transcriptions', although one or two of them do stray over the border and behave, albeit fleetingly, like paraphrases." Liszt did not give the arrangements any particular designation: Beethoven's Lieder von Goethe, for instance, consists of a selection of Goethe songs taken from three separate collections of Beethoven (Opp. 75, 83, and 84).

Humphrey Searle, in the catalogue of Liszt's compositions for the Fifth Edition of Grove's Dictionary, places the song arrangements with the Piano Scores. This is somewhat misleading, for

---


10Ibid., 52.

while Liszt insisted on printing the words as they occur in the songs, in the same way as the orchestral scoring was indicated in the symphonies, the song transcriptions are much freer than the symphonies. A cursory examination of the arrangements themselves will prove this.

We have already quoted Liszt on the subject of the cadenza he introduced into his version of Beethoven's *Adelaide*. The correctness of this addition caused him some pangs of conscience, but the fact that it was successful with the public, assuaged these pangs. Schubert's *Ave Maria* has its accompaniment figure doubled, with the melody in the middle, divided between the hands, - a technique made famous first by Liszt's arch-rival Sigismond Thalberg - while *Ständchen* is treated as a duet: the first verse is given to the soprano, the baritone has the second, and both sing the third. There is no tampering of this sort in the Beethoven or the Berlioz symphonies, which should exclude these song arrangements from being coupled with the symphonies.

**Operatic Arrangements**

It is with the arrangements of operatic melodies that the plethora of titles predominates. Only two of them are actually called

---

12 See above, p.3.

"transcription": the auto-da-fe scene from Don Carlo of Verdi, and the Valse d'Adèle by the Hungarian Count Géza Zichy. The music of neither of these compositions was available to me. The extract from Don Carlo will be discussed in detail on page 65f of this essay. For the moment it is sufficient to note that it is a fairly literal piano version of the scene. From the full title of the Hungarian waltz Valse d'Adèle. Composée pour la main gauche seule. Transcription brillante à deux mains, something less literal may be assumed. Walker's suggestion, then, that transcriptions are strict versions of the original certainly does not hold true for the operatic arrangements.

There are two sets of Illustrations, both taken from operas by Meyerbeer. The set from Le Prophète consists of four separate pieces: the first consists of two numbers from Act III and one from Act IV; the second is a movement from the skating ballet in Act III; the third utilises the opening chorus, the chorus of Anabaptists from later on in the scene, and the final duet of the opera; the fourth is a Fantasy and Fugue on the chorale "Ad nos, ad salutarem undam" which occurs in the first scene of Act I.

Since the word illustration to most of us means the depiction of a single scene, Liszt's title might be confusing, for, as we have seen, the piano pieces do not confine themselves necessarily to one scene from the opera. The French word, however, also has the connotation of the English 'illustrious,' or, in the form of a verb, 'to honour.' Certainly Meyerbeer was very conscious of the honour done to him by Liszt:
M. Schlesinger has communicated to me a letter from you where you inform him that you have composed a large piano piece on the chant of the Anabaptists in Prophète, and that you have planned to dedicate this work to me when it will be published, but that first of all, you wanted to write directly to me. I will not wait for that letter to arrive to express to you how happy I am that one of my songs seems worthy to serve as a motif for one of your compositions, destined to travel over Europe and to inebriate those who have the good fortune to hear it played by those marvellous and poetic fingers. However, I feel myself more honoured by the mark of sympathy that you give me in dedicating your work to me: because if it is honourable for me to see my name united to yours, it is sweeter still to me to learn that we are friends.  

Although there is no evidence that Liszt chose the title "Illustration" he may well have been the originator of it, for the title is French, with a peculiarly French connotation, and there are no other "illustrations" available from Breitkopf & Härtel.  

The Reminiscence figures prominently in Liszt's operatic arrangements: I Puritani, Norma, Lucia di Lammermoor, Lucrezia Borgia, La Juive, Robert le Diable, Don Giovanni, and, last of all, Simon Boccanegra. In all of these there is a common form. An introduction is followed by a number of themes taken from various parts of the opera, and a concluding section rounds off the piece with increasing virtuosity. The most famous of the Reminiscences -

---


15The cover of Breitkopf and Härtel's edition of Liszt's first Prophète Illustration gives their catalogue of operatic arrangements. The only 'Illustrations' are Liszt's.
Norma and Don Giovanni - adhere to this pattern, as do I Puritani and Simon Boccanegra although since Boccanegra is a late work, it contains little virtuosity.

As it is known today the Réminiscences de Lucia di Lammermoor consists of one number from Donizetti's score: the sextet which forms the climax of the second act. There is, however, a second "transcription" from the opera: March et cavatine de Lucie de Lammermoor. Barbara Crockett discusses this piece and concludes that it has an "inconsistency that few of the other transcriptions have...The ending is a ludicrous tailpiece, in no way unified logically with anything that has gone before." Since the ending recalls the chordal accompaniment to the sextet, Miss Crockett is quite correct in her criticism. She seems to have overlooked, however, the note in Humphrey Searle's catalogue concerning this piece - originally it was intended as part of the other "Lucia" piece, but the publisher separated them.

Put the two pieces together and the "Réminiscence form" as we have shown it above is indeed present: an introduction, the sextet, the funeral chorus and Edgardo's aria from the second scene of Act III, the concluding chorus of Act II, a more brilliant version of the aria, and, to conclude, the accompanimental chords of the sextet crash up and down the keyboard. Without consulting Liszt's original manuscript, it is not clear how these two halves would fit together,

---

16 Barbara Crockett, "Liszt's Opera Transcriptions for piano," 59.
17 Searle, op.cit., 295.
but fit together they did, and "Lucia" is not the exception it appears to be.

The real exception is another Donizetti-based 'transcription,' Rémisiscences de Lucrezia Borgia. Firstly, instead of one continuous piece there are two separate numbers: "Trio du second acte," and "Fantasie sur des motifs favoris de l'opéra; Chanson à boire (Orgie) - Duo - Finale." This second number does conform to the 'reminiscence form' already established. It is possible, though there is no indication in Searle's catalogue, that this, too, was cut in two by the publisher. The title page of my copy of the second number reads thus: Rémisiscences/de/Lucrezia Borgia/Grande Fantaisie/Premiere Partie: Trio du second Acte/Deuxième Partie Chanson à boire (Orgie) - Duo - Finale/pour/Piano/par/F. Liszt. This division into two parts is unique; even the Meyerbeer pieces were considered separate pieces, capable of standing on their own, and were not divided into "parts."

The Paraphrase was, for Liszt, a fairly free adaptation of the original. In a letter to the Parisian music publisher Pacini, he writes concerning one of his arrangements of a Paganini etude: 18

As the title implies, it is an Etude (di Bravura) after Paganini...you had better, I think, reprint directly afterwards this Etude Facilitée, which I have also sent you. This second arrangement is by M. Schumann, a young composer of very great merit. It is more within the reach of the general public, and also more exact then my paraphrase. 19

18 Liszt does not mention which one.
Exactly what he meant by that last phrase can be understood by comparing the same Paganini caprice in Liszt's version and then in Schumann's version.20

It is not surprising, after all of this, that there is much confusion surrounding these titles. Writers on Liszt ignore what distinctions of form and content there are in pieces (Sitwell, for instance, begins his discussion of the works thus: "The Operatic transcriptions, or, as he called the 'partitions de piano'..."21). Publishers thought the titles interchangeable, and what was published in France as a Grande Fantaisie, might appear in Germany as a Réminiscence. Liszt himself seems to have been unconcerned; he was insistent only on the Piano scores. Any attempt to determine the distinguishing characteristics of Liszt's arrangements can only lead to a greater understanding of the composer. The titles of the Verdi arrangements, for instance, are Liszt's own, and having spent some time discussing the differences between the various arrangements the formal structure of the pieces will be immediately apparent simply from their titles.

20 Both are reproduced in Appendix B.
21 Sitwell, Liszt, 72.
Chapter 3
LISZT AND VERDI

The two greatest opera composers of the middle and late Nineteenth Century were Richard Wagner and Giuseppe Verdi. The relationship between Liszt and Wagner has been voluminously documented. That between Liszt and Verdi is vague almost to the point of suspicion. Despite the fact that each of them spent much time in the other's country, there is no record of their meeting. They exchanged no letters, and in the letters they did write there is scarcely a mention of the other composer. This is not altogether surprising on Verdi's part, for he was an intensely private man and wrote little beside what was absolutely necessary.

From Liszt, however, one would expect some acknowledgement of the Italian's musical activity. Instead there are two letters, both to the Princess Belgiojoso, in which he refers in passing to seeing Nabucco, twice, and Ernani, once, in 1845.¹ Then there is silence on the subject of Verdi until the final years. In the letters he wrote from Italy to Olga von Meyendorff in Paris he encourages her

to hear performances of the Requiem and the String Quartet. From this scant evidence Eleanor Perenyi concludes that "he wasn't much attracted to Verdi." In making this observation she has ignored two important facts: the productions at Weimar, and the arrangements for piano.

In 1842, Liszt was appointed Grand Ducal Director of Music Extraordinary at Weimar. He had begun to conduct two years previously, and continued with more regularity after 1844 not only in Weimar but also in other German cities. In 1848 he moved to Weimar on a permanent basis. With an orchestra of thirty-seven, a chorus of twenty-three, a ballet of four, and assorted soloists, Liszt turned the small city into the wonder of Europe. Lohengrin was given its world premiere there, Tannhauser received its first performance outside of Dresden; Fidelio, still a rarity, Berlioz's Benvenuto Cellini, some operas of Gluck were all produced there, while for concerts Liszt gave his audiences, for instance, festival weeks of Berlioz. And there were three proposed productions of Verdi operas, two of which reached the stage.

---


3Eleanor Perenyi, Liszt. The Artist as Romantic Hero. (New York: Little, Brown and Company, 1974), 284. The evidence is even scantier, for the von Meyendorff letters were not available until after Perenyi's book was published.
It is doubtful that Liszt would have presented works for which he felt no sympathy. Today we might wonder at the productions of Rubinstein and Raff, but Liszt considered them composers worthy of encouragement. Verdi was certainly no unknown, struggling composer. It is possible that pressure was brought to bear on Liszt to produce Verdi - after all, he was the leading composer of Italian opera. There is no mention of such pressure in any of Liszt's letters (not an infallible guide, admittedly), but if there were pressure it seems unlikely that the result would be an old opera - Ernani, in 1852, - or an obscure one - I due Foscari, in 1856; nor would the proposed production of Rigoletto in 1854 be abandoned on the grounds that "the German translations of Verdi's operas are not worth a straw, and we are great purists at Weimar."\(^4\) In 1872, some ten years after his official connection with Weimar had ended, it was Liszt's enthusiasm that prompted negotiations to obtain Verdi's latest opera, Aida, then scarcely a year old: Weimar's Intendant "was completely sold on Aida, about which he is enthusiastic, having heard it played and sung by Liszt, another admirer of the opera."\(^5\)

It is doubtful, too, that Liszt would have so consistently followed Verdi's career with transcriptions had he not been attracted to the music. The first of the Verdi arrangements was

---


made in 1847, and the last in 1882. It is one thing to dazzle audiences with bravura pyrotechnics on the latest operatic successes, it is far and away another thing to make an arrangement, at the end of one's life, of a new opera, especially if one dislikes the music. Yet, in 1882, Liszt composed his _Reminiscences de Boccanegra_, the year after the revised version of Verdi's opera was produced at La Scala.

It should be borne in mind that the arrangements of Wagner operas were begun in 1848, the year after the first Verdi one. It should also be noted that, had the 1854 production of _Rigoletto_ not fallen through, the number of Verdi operas produced at Weimar would have equalled those of Wagner. No one doubts Liszt's admiration for the works of Wagner; part of the evidence is the arrangements Liszt made of the operas, and the Weimar productions of three of them. Eleanor Perenyi's statement quoted above does not stand up to examination.

The career of a composer can usually be divided into clearly defined "periods." In Liszt's case, the Weimar appointment marks definitely a watershed, for it was here that his career as a serious composer began. At Weimar, twelve of the symphonic poems, the _Faust_ and _Dante_ symphonies, the B minor sonata, the _Harmonies poétiques et religieuses_, among various other works, were composed, not to mention revisions of earlier piano pieces. The revisions were all simplifications. Having ended his performing career, all virtuosity was, as Sitwell notes, cast aside.\(^6\) Obviously this was true of his piano

\(^6\)Sitwell, _op. cit._, 148.
playing, but it was true in a more significant way of his compositions.

The abandoning of virtuosity and the companion search for simplicity parallels the move to Verdi as a source of transcription material. Bellini and Donizetti belonged to an era of singer-dominated opera, where virtuosity was paramount and decoration essential; both elements are found in abundance in Liszt's arrangements of these composer's works. Verdi, on the other hand, insisted that the singers perform only what he wrote, allowing few liberties, and none of the vocal displays that were usual in the earlier works. In keeping with this, little of the technical exhibition of the Bellini and Donizetti pieces is present in the Verdi arrangements. Indeed the Verdi arrangements, as we shall see, trace the increasing simplicity of Liszt the composer. Just as the move to Weimar symbolised Liszt's desertion of virtuosity, which was, in turn, paralleled by the progression from the operas of Bellini and Donizetti to Verdi and his corresponding development as a composer, so the move to Verdi marked a further step in Liszt's exploration of Italian melody. The great Italian pianist, Ferruccio Busoni, has noted that the influence of Italian melody "on Liszt's original compositional output remains inextinguishable." 7 Having explored Italian melody as it was practised by Bellini and Donizetti, it was but logical to move on to Verdi.

---

7Quoted by Paula Rehberg in her Franz Liszt: die Geschichte seines Lebens Schaffens und Wirkens (Zurich: Artemis Verlag, 1961), 569. The quotation is taken from Busoni's preface to his edition of Liszt's works.
Chapter 4

LISZT'S VERDI ARRANGEMENTS

The first of Liszt's arrangements of a Verdi opera was a Concert paraphrase on "Ernani," written in 1847. The work was never published. In November of that same year, Verdi's first French opera, Jérusalem, was produced at the Opéra. Following the earlier example of Rossini, Verdi re-worked an old score, I Lombardi alla prima crociata which had been first produced in 1843. While the libretto was new, the crusading atmosphere was retained, and Verdi took the opportunity to tighten and improve the Italian score.

From this "new" opera, Jérusalem, Liszt arranged the Prayer from the first act, retaining a mixture of French and Italian in the title: Salve Maria de "Jérusalem" ("I Lombardi"); the mixture goes further than the use of both titles: the opening Italian words are "Salve Maria" while the French opening is "Ave Maria." Liszt was probably working from the published Italian score, and the use of the Italian and French titles can be explained by the simultaneous publication of the piece in France and Italy. Musically the aria is the same in both versions, though its dramatic position is changed: in I Lombardi it comes at the beginning of the second scene, preceded by three pages of recitative, whereas in Jérusalem the aria
comes at the end of the opening scene.

On pages 31-33 the aria is reproduced from the piano-vocal score of "Lombardi." Certain elements should be noted: the tonality is not firmly established until half-way through; there are four measures only of repetition; the melody itself is simple; and the final cadence, with its series of chords unrelated to each other, is an early example of what was later to become a favourite device of Verdi. The scoring for the aria is out of the ordinary, heralding the delicate textures of the third act of Aida: eight violins, two violas, one bass, solo flute and clarinet. Julian Budden writes that "...this astonishing piece of music, ...[is] one of the strangest entrance arias to be given to any leading soprano." It is not altogether surprising that such an unusual piece would appeal to Liszt, whose own interest in irregular melody and tonal ambiguity would lead him to the atonal compositions of his final years.

Liszt's arrangement of the aria is relatively simple. He adds chords to the opening apostrophe; he repeats the central, D major, section, elaborating the accompaniment; he extends the final cadential phrase, replaces the vocal cadenza with a chordal one, and he adds a coda based upon the rhythm of the opening.

In 1847, as we saw above on page 29, Liszt composed an unpublished Concert paraphrase on "Ernani." Two years after this Liszt

1 Julian Budden, The Operas of Verdi, Volume I, from "Oberto" to "Rigoletto" (London: Cassell, 1973), 121.
Example 1

\[2\]

Giuseppe Verdi I Lombardi alla prima crociata, piano-vocal score. (New York: Kalmus), 85-89.
composed Ernani. Paraphrase de concert. Verdi's fifth opera received its Paris premiere in 1845 as Il Proscritto, because Victor Hugo, who wrote the play on which the opera was based objected to what he regarded as a travesty of his play. By 1847 the novelty of Ernani might well have disappeared, which might account for the arrangement's remaining unpublished. But there would be no reason to return to the opera two years later and produce a different composition. Unless, of course, he was attracted to the music.

Ernani. Paraphrase de concert (1849) was revised ten years later and published the following year as one of "Trois Paraphrases de Concert: Trovatore, Ernani, Rigoletto." The three pieces were also available separately.

Verdi's Ernani was almost as successful as the Hugo play on which it was based. Dealing with the struggle between honour and love, the plot of the opera and the difficulties of the score have kept it out of the regular repertory. It was with this score that Verdi established "...most clearly his male vocal archetypes: the granite-like, monochrome bass...the heroic tenor, lyrical, ardent, despairing; and partaking of both natures, now zephyr, now hurricane, the Verdi baritone, the greatest vehicle of power in Italian

\[3^{\text{See Searle, op. cit., 298.}}\]

Liszt's paraphrase is based on the final ensemble of the third act which takes place in a vault containing the tomb of Charlemagne. Conspirators draw lots to murder the King, and then sing a noisy battle hymn. Their rejoicing is interrupted by the appearance of the King who has overheard the entire plot. Magnanimously he forgives the traitors, calling on the spirit of Charlemagne, in the passage "O sommo Carlo," and it is with this melody that Liszt begins his paraphrase.

The operatic scene is reproduced on the following pages - example 3 overleaf. As can be seen in the example below Liszt clearly distinguishes melody from accompaniment.

Example 2

This paraphrase, in accordance with Liszt's ideas, is not a strict reproduction of the operatic scene. The full company's "A

---

5Budden, op. cit., 147.

6This example and examples 4 and 5 are taken from Verdi-Liszt, Ernani Paraphrase, (New York: Paragon Music Publishers).

7See above, Ch. 2, p. 22.
Example 38

Oh sommo Carlo, più del tuo nome le tue vir...

tu di... aver vogli-o; sarò, lo giuro a te ed a Dio, delle tue

gesta imitat.tor. Perdono a tutti. (Mi brame ho

guidando Elvira tra le braccia di Ernani)

dome.) Sposi voi siete, vamante o gaor. A Carlo

Verdi Ernani (Milan: Ricordi) piano-vocal score, 253-266.
Ex. 3 contd.
Ex. 3 contd.
Ex. 3 contd.
Ex. 3 contd.
Ex. 3 contd.
Ex. 3 contd.
Ex. 3 contd.
Carlo Quinto sia gloria e onor!" (mm16-18) is repeated before Liszt continues with the harmonic outline of the next phrases, figure 94 in the example from the piano-vocal scores, in double octaves and rich chords. Note that in these measures Verdi moves simply to the dominant and immediately returns to the tonic. Liszt side-steps into A major - far removed from the F minor/major tonic - and returns home.

Example 4

The opening melody is repeated. As can be seen in measures 23ff, Carlo's phrases are punctuated by the comments of the chorus, and are shorter this second time. Liszt ignores these changes, preferring instead to vary the accompaniment, with right-hand arpeggios. Another cadenza leads into the major section, where
melody and accompaniment are again clearly differentiated.

Verdi's ending, as can be seen, is relatively simple: with the entire company singing the praises of the King to the accompaniment of the full orchestra, complete with percussion, cymbals and bass drums, there was nothing to do but bring down the curtain on the already cheering public. Liszt devises a three-and-a half-page coda, which, while not as brassy as Verdi's ending, is, nonetheless, equally effective. 9

Despite the brilliant technique required to bring this piece off, the result sounds almost severe. Much of this is due, no doubt, to the atmosphere of the scene itself, and to Liszt's increasing concern with the craft of composition. But some of the severity of the atmosphere must be attributable to the person for whom the work was written, Hans von Bülow. Von Bülow was Liszt's first great pupil, a superb technician who was criticised for his coldness as a performer. His programming did nothing to dispel the view that he was an "intellectual" pianist. 10

---

9See example 5 overleaf.

10For his Viennese debut in 1881, von Bülow played the last five Beethoven sonatas, and he was known to end a cycle of Beethoven symphonies with two performances of the 9th — one before and one after intermission!
Ex. 5 contd.
Ernani is not one of Verdi's better scores. Melodically it is superb, but it shows little of the musico-dramatic insights that were to come, and that had already been demonstrated. It is difficult, for example, to accept as psychologically right, a character who expresses, to the melody that Carlo sings, the following collection of thoughts and pronouncements: a resolve to imitate Charlemagne; a general pardon; an aside to himself that he has mastered his desire (presumably for Elvira); and his giving of Elvira to Ernani in marriage.

The remaining two-thirds of this trio of paraphrases are better compositions. The music for Il Trovatore and for Rigoletto is far better than that for Ernani, and Liszt responds by producing works which, while not encompassing the entire drama as does the Norma paraphrase, do, however, encapsulate the dramatic situation of the scenes selected.

Il Trovatore was first produced in Rome in 1853. In 1857 it was produced at the Paris Opéra, resulting in some minor changes to the score: a ballet introduced into Act III, and the role of Azucena slightly expanded for the reigning star of the Opéra. The so-called 'Miserere Scene' was left untouched. Leonora has come to the tower where her lover Manrico is imprisoned. A bell tolls in the distance and the monks (for whose presence, either off- or on-stage,

11 Julian Budden, The Operas of Verdi from "Il Trovatore" to "La Forza del Destino" (London: Cassell and Company, 1978), discusses these changes in detail, 107-111.
there is no dramatic reason) chant the Miserere: over a menacing
ccompaniment Leonora sings of her despair and anguish, while above,
in the tower, Manrico bids his love farewell. As was usual with
Verdi, each melodic strand of this musical fabric is first presented
by itself before being combined with the others to form a stunning
musical-dramatic scene.

In 1859 Liszt was at work on his symphonic poems, and, as a
result, very much aware of the possibilities for expressing drama
through music. He seizes on the dramatic aspects of this sombre
scene, and begins immediately with the tolling of the bell in the
depths of the piano - example 6 below. But it is not just the bell
that Liszt notates. That sforzando F flat resolves down to create
the interval of a fourth supplying the menace and foreboding which,
in the theatre, has already been built up.

Example 6\(^\text{12}\)

\[\text{Example Image}\]

The chant of the monks is heard, and while Verdi's monks sing a
complete chord, Liszt's sing an incomplete one, adding to the tension

\(^{12}\text{This example, and examples 8 - 11 are taken from Liszt Klavierwerke Band VIII (New York: C.F. Peters), 66-80.}\]
of the semitonal bell. The chant as it appears in the opera is reproduced in Example 7 below; Liszt's monks are the chords of the right hand in Example 6 above.

Example 7

Leonora's despairing melody, which is now heard, is introduced over the shuddering chords that acted as a harbinger of death in Italian opera of this period.14

The tenuto Liszt adds to the beats, marked x, not only sustains the harmony over the rest in the left hand - the pedal sustains it anyway - but also suggest the weight of Leonora's anguish and sorrow, again, something that has already been built up in the theatre.

---

13Verdi, Il Trovatore, piano-vocal score (Milan: Recordi), 288.
14See Budden, op. cit., 99-100, and 162.
Liszt does not change the melodic line, rather he reinforces the descending "sobbing" triplets with the left hand and repeats the whole phrase an octave lower. The final triplet is changed: instead of simply repeating the third beat, as in Verdi, Liszt changes it to F flat and E flat - the two notes that were heard initially as part of the opening tolling bell.
Manrico is the last character to be introduced in this scene; his solo, "Ah! che la morte ognora," marked cantando, is accompanied in the opera by a harp - he is a troubadour (hence the title) and apparently carries his lute with him everywhere. As in Ernani Liszt notates the melody in large notes, the accompaniment in small ones. This accompaniment is more elaborate than in Ernani, working around the melody, as it does, with a 'three-hand' effect developed by Thalberg to the astonishment of his audiences.

Example 10

The melody at x differs from that in the score. It is possible that Liszt mis-remembered, though he usually worked from a least a piano-vocal score; it is possible, too, that he purposely changed the phrase. It is also possible that this was one of the alterations Verdi made for Paris - perhaps to accommodate the French text. Budden notes all the changes for Paris, and does not mention this one; however, the autograph of the Paris score is missing, and one or two slight changes may have escaped his notice. The diminished chords at the final cadence are Liszt's.
Verdi's repeat of the monks' chant is an exact one; that of Liszt is sonically enriched by tremolos and trills in the lower reaches of the keyboard, immediately increasing the gloomy atmosphere of the scene. Leonora's melody which follows is accompanied by chromatic scales, while the orchestral death-motive is given to the right hand. Again the triplet figure is repeated, this time without the alteration to the final beat, and Manrico's farewell, as before, is notated in large notes, while the elaborated accompaniment is in small ones. The final notes of the solo are interrupted by a cadenza, which leads directly into the final section.

As we might expect in a paraphrase, this is an expanded and an elaborated version of Verdi's original eleven measures. On the following pages Verdi's conclusion is followed by Liszt's. The time-signature in Liszt changes to $\frac{12}{8}$ to ease the notational problems. Harmonically the section moves through B major and D major before returning to the home key of Ab; in the repeat the accompaniment is changed, the harmonic travels remaining the same.

Liszt's alteration of Leonora's final descending triplet - Fb to Eb - which might be though a mere piquant change, reveals its structural importance here, for it is by means of it that the modulation to B major and then to D major occurs. The resulting increase of tension is released on the $\frac{6}{4}$ chord that was the monks'
Example 11
Ex. 11 contd.
chant of the opening. The coda reinforces the tonic major, with brief interruptions from Manrico, and Leonora's triplets ascend this time, perhaps to where the lovers will be eternally united.

There is a consistency of compositional technique in the third paraphrase of this series, Rigoletto. Paraphrase de concert. As we saw in the Trovatore paraphrase, the changing of one note led the way to the harmonic excursions of the final pages. This chromatic alteration of essential notes with a resulting harmonic 'event' later in the arrangement is continued in the Rigoletto piece. This is based on the Andante section of the Quartet that occurs in the third act of the opera. The Duke of Mantua has been lured to Sparafucile's den where he is to be seduced by Maddalena and then killed; Rigoletto has brought his daughter Gilda to observe her faithless lover.

To each of the four characters Verdi gave wonderfully apt music. The Duke is light-hearted, graceful and passionate:

Example 12

---

16Examples 12-15 are from Verdi Rigoletto, (Milan: Ricordi), 265-268.
Gilda is despairing and broken-hearted:

Example 13

Maddalena is laughing and flirtatious:

Example 14

Rigoletto is stern and unmoving:

Example 15

The wonder is not so much that the four parts are so characteristic, nor that Verdi came up with four distinct musical lines that fit together - he had done that in earlier operas, "His real achievement here was to apply the differentiating technique vertically and within a regular, almost classical design...Only Mozart has achieved
a comparable result, as in the sextet from *Le Nozze de Figaro* and the quartet from *Don Giovanni*.  

Liszt begins his paraphrase with a *Preludio*, introducing the two women, Maddalena in the left hand, Gilda in the right.  

Example 16  

Maddalena's sixteenth-notes dissolve into a cadenza, during which the tonality changes from E major to Db major, and which leads directly to the principal *Andante*. This *Preludio* is not simply an introduction—it parallels the first part of the Quartet in Verdi's score. What is generally regarded as 'The Quartet from *Rigoletto* is, in fact, only one section of a larger number. The Quartet proper, Number 12 in the score, begins with the Duke's words "Un di, se ben ramentomi." The tonality is E major, which moves to G sharp major, enharmonically the dominant of Db major. Liszt follows the

---


18 Examples 16-21 are from Liszt *Klavierwerke Band VIII*, 55-65.
same harmonic pattern.

As he did in the Ernani and Trovatore paraphrases, Liszt differentiates between melody and accompaniment. There is one melodic change. Verdi's melody for the Duke was quoted in Example 12 on page 58; here is Liszt's, with the change marked by x: the Ab is raised a semitone to B-double-flat, a small change that will have important consequences later on in the composition.

Example 17

Liszt elaborates the Duke's melody at the cadence-points. In doing this Liszt was simply following the vocal tradition of decoration. It was a tradition that Verdi was fighting against in the opera house, insisting contractually that nothing in his scores be altered. Liszt's decorations do nothing but enhance the Duke's line, adding the grace that is so characteristic of the Duke's music throughout the score, but which is so rarely encountered, vocally or histrionically, in the theatre.

Maddalena's laughing sixteenth-notes are printed in small notes, while Gilda's drooping, despairing line is in large print. In the Ernani and Trovatore, and even in this paraphrase, we have
seen large and small notes used to distinguish melody and accompaniment. Here the technique is used to distinguish the characters.

Example 18

The phrase leading to the climax is expanded, arriving on a triple fortissimo Ab seventh chord, which dissolves in a cascade of chromatically descending sixths, settling on a trill in preparation for the repeat.

The second time the Duke's melody is accompanied by delicate filigree, including arpeggios, chromatically descending thirds, and chromatic scales, while the tune sings out in the thumb, à la Thalberg. It is now that Liszt's alteration of the Ab to B-double-flat bears fruit "in an ethereal dream sequence."26 B-double-flat is actually the same pitch as A; the juxtaposition of an Ab seventh chord with an A seventh chord is a magical effect that Liszt was

master of. Impossible from a classical-harmonic point of view, it would also have been pianistically impossible a few years previously; Liszt was very much aware of what was harmonically and pianistically possible, and modulation by enharmonic means was something of which Liszt was particularly fond. Note also the pedalling Liszt required — a blur of overtones that would enhance the sound of the melody and lead, ultimately, to the impressionistic pianism of later Liszt and of Debussy and Ravel.

Example 19

There is a brief cadenza which leads into the final section of the quartet. Gilda's rising pattern of broken sixteenth-notes dominates — Maddalena is but scarcely heard. When this is repeated
the melody is heard in repeated octaves, a passage of great dif-
culty today, but one which would have been comparatively easy on
Liszt's lighter-actioned piano.

Example 20

The coda reunites the Duke with his two women, and emphasises
the B-double-flat alteration of the melody, as if to point out that
it was no mistake. The original change in the Duke's line has been
shown above, page 61 and Liszt's phrasing of the change points up
this important alteration. The change is retained each time this
melody reappears. Now in the coda the tritone is reinforced. It
should be remembered that this forbidden interval was to play an
increasingly important part in Liszt's later compositions.
Example 21

In March 1866, Verdi returned to Italy from a lengthy stay in Paris, taking with him the libretto for *Don Carlos*, which, after some eight months of rehearsals, was produced in Paris in March 1967. (Liszt's transcription was published the following year.) The opera was given forty-three times in its first season, but Verdi, writing after the opening thought "It was not a success. I don't know what the future may hold, but I shouldn't be surprised if things were to change." 20 What did change were Verdi's thoughts on the work: in 1884 he revised the score, reducing it to four acts for its Italian production at La Scala; three years later the original first act was restored, but this was still not the score that Verdi had composed for Paris. 21 These cuts and revisions, however, do not

---


21 The convoluted performing-history and the various revisions of what is one of Verdi's greatest operas, *Don Carlos*, has been discussed in many places, the most readily available being Andrew Porter, *Music of Three More Seasons, 1977-1980* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1981) 81-89, 313-318.
really affect the music Liszt chose for his transcription.

The populace has assembled outside the Cathedral of Our Lady of Atocha to witness the burning of the heretics. The Auto-da-fé is turned into a massive pageant beloved of, and necessary to, the Parisian audiences. Verdi's opening fanfares are re-arranged on the piano to capture the orchestral sonorities and richness.

Example 22

The chorus of praise is presented intact ("Spuntato ecco il di d'esultanza"), including the intricate contrapuntal section at letter B of the vocal score, Example 23 overleaf.

---

22Example 22 is taken from Thematisches Verzeichniss.

23Example 23 is taken from Verdi Don Carlos (Milan: Ricordi), 184-5.
Example 23
There is a cadenza before the opening melody returns.

The funeral march of the heretics is now heard, ominous and dark. Liszt adds drum-roll effects to compensate for the loss of Verdi's "unusually effective and original orchestration." There is no attempt to include the sanctimonious, almost monotone, chant of the monks. The "trio" of this march, in G major, is a cantabile expressivo given to the cellos. Liszt seizes the lyrical moment and expands its eight original measures to twice that, elaborating both the harmony and the orchestral accompaniment. The return of the chorus is also elaborated, leading, not to the entrance of the court, which occurs at this point in the opera, but to a climactic repeat of the trio; the coda is simply the fanfare figure.

Liszt has followed Verdi faithfully in all of this: the music of the trio does return, sung off-stage by a Voce dal cielo, offering consolation to the burning heretics, a nice touch, the irony of which would not have been lost on Verdi. Liszt omits the entire central, political, episode of the scene.

Musically the scene is probably the weakest in the score.

Osborne sums it up as "comparatively weak when one examines it in detail..." while Hughes notes that the whole "...is far more than the sum of the parts." The opening chorus and the fanfares are

---


25 Osborne, op. cit., 367.

26 Hughes, op. cit., 351.
trite, though how enthusiastic the inhabitants of Madrid really were when attending ceremonial burnings staged by the Inquisition is questionable. Real feeling appears in the major section of the funeral march. The scene improves immeasurably with the arrival of the Court and with the development of the political aspects of the score, elements which Liszt elected to omit.

Why, if the music is banal, did Liszt choose to arrange it? Firstly, since it was the most spectacular scene in the production, it would remain longest in the minds of the audience, the potential purchasers of pianistic highlights. Secondly, Liszt had moved away from the pot-pourri type of operatic arrangement - none of the Verdi arrangements are of this type. Thirdly, since he was no longer as deeply involved with teaching or playing, a virtuoso version of one of the arias was out of the question.

Musically Liszt was undergoing a change. He was now principally occupied with choral music, and it may be that this influenced his choice of what to extract from the Verdi score. Christus, the Legend of St. Elizabeth, and the Messe de Gran were all in the process of composition, revision and performance. He was also anxious at this time to take charge of the Sistine Choir "and to effect a renaissance of church music...it is certain that he was deeply immersed in studies appropriate to the new world of music in
which he was engaged."27

This new world would be fully revealed in the late piano works - the third volume of the Années de Pelerinage, Nuages gris, and La lugubre gondola, but the Don Carlos transcription must be considered a step on the way. There is no trace of virtuosity for its own sake; there is a brief cadenza, but it is more in the nature of a decorated cadence-point. There is nothing that is pianistically difficult in this piece. Its principal interest lies, then, in its position as a step on the way to the late piano pieces.

After Don Carlos Verdi occupied himself with a revision of La Forza del destino for La Scala; there was a proposed Requiem to commemorate Rossini; and there was much correspondence concerning future operatic projects. The project that appealed most to Verdi became Aida, first performed at the Cairo Opera House in December 1871. The following month, after some revision, it received its Italian premiere at La Scala.

Liszt, as was noted on page 26, admired Aida tremendously and in 1879 published Aida. Danza sacra e duetto final. The two numbers Liszt arranged are not, as can be deduced from the title, connected in the opera. The Sacred Dance takes place in the second scene of Act I, in the Temple of Vulcan while the sword of the Supreme Commander is being consecrated; the final duet is the lovers' farewell to earthly life as Aida dies in Radames's arms.

Both numbers have in common a magical orchestration. As for the final duet, Verdi was very concerned about the effect of its scoring. Letters were sent to the conductor in Egypt, Bottesini, to report back to Verdi:

I hope you won't mind writing me a few words as soon as you have rehearsed it well with the orchestra and a few more words after opening night, to tell me about the honest effect of this piece. When reading through the score, you will understand that I have given this duet the greatest care; but since it belongs to what I would call the transparent genre, it may be that the effect does not correspond to my wishes...Tell me about the song and its instrumentation, always with regard to its effect.28

Two weeks later there was another letter:

I was interested, and am still interested, in having precise, particular information about the effect of the final piece. Mind you, I don't talk about its quality but only about its effects...I want to know about the effects of the orchestra, about those of the songs, and above all about the total effect - that is, what impression it produces.29

The "Transparent" effect Verdi sought is provided by the miraculous string writing. And this is the section Liszt chose for his arrangement, a real challenge, for the scoring is so peculiar to the orchestra that translation to any other medium results in a loss of the effect Verdi was so anxious to achieve. Later, on page 82, we will discuss Verdi's orchestration in some detail, with examples,

28Busch, op. cit., 263-264.
29Ibid., 265.
showing how Liszt does, in fact, achieve an effect comparable to Verdi. It is interesting, too, that while in *Don Carlos* Liszt chose the most spectacular scene, here he selects perhaps the quietest moments of the score. We are further on the way to those late piano works mentioned above.

In the course of this essay mention has been made of Liszt's experiments in the possibilities of the keyboard, and that the operatic arrangements were a means of this experimentation. In these later arrangements, which we are now discussing, there was no longer any need to explore the keyboard's potential. Liszt was becoming more interested in harmonic possibilities. The characteristics of this late style have been described thus: "The style has become stark and austere, there are long passages in single notes and a considerable use of whole-tone chords, and anything resembling a cadence is avoided. The result gives a curiously indefinite feeling, as if he were launching out into a new world of whose possibilities he was not quite sure." 30 How far Liszt would take his harmonic experiments can be seen in the closing measures of *Nuages gris*, composed in 1881 and unpublished until 1927.

---

Searle, in the same article,\textsuperscript{32} refers to Nuages gris as a "remarkable piece of impressionism. In the final passage the chromatic rising phrase should be noted, driven against the whole-tone harmonies in the left hand without regard for orthodox consonance.

It is certainly hard to believe that this piece was written by the composer of brilliant fantasies on themes by Rossini and Donizetti." It is hard to believe that this piece was written by the composer of any of Liszt's virtuoso, youthful, pieces. But just as Liszt experimented with keyboard technique in the early arrangements, so he experiments with a new harmonic language in the later


\textsuperscript{32}Searle, Ibid., 75.
arrangements; these operatic arrangements can be seen as sketches for the language of the Final Period. The composer has completely superseded the pianist.

Liszt begins Aida. Danza sacra e duetto final with an Allegretto introduction that is harmonically and rhythmically ambiguous.

Example 25\textsuperscript{33}

After twenty-two measures the key of Eb major is established, but instead of presenting the danza sacra Liszt gives us the music of

\textsuperscript{33}Examples 25-27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 33 and 34 are from Verdi-Liszt Aida Paraphrase (New York: Paragon Music Publishers, 1975), 3-23.
the chant of the High Priestess. This is somewhat of a surprise; after all, the chant of the High Priestess is not the sacred dance, nor are the two sections linked by Verdi, other than that they both appear in the same scene. On page 87 we will discuss in more detail Liszt's possible reasons for using this section of the scene, and for using it in the way he does. The last phrase of the priestess is expanded, and the whole chant is repeated with a richer figuration: octaves in the right hand and an arpeggiated bass.

At measure forty-four there is a thoroughly Lisztian enharmonic change of key: the Ab of the third beat of the bar becomes G sharp, and the tonality slips into B minor.

Example 26

Over the sinuous triplets of the Priestess' chant the theme of the danza sacra is softly heard. Whereas Verdi keeps the tonality of Eb for both the chant and the dance, Liszt perhaps felt modulation would avoid tonal monotony; Verdi, with the orchestra at his disposal could use contrasting timbres to solve the problem. Certainly
the way Liszt modulates adds to the exoticism of Verdi's already exotic harmonies, and compensates for whatever loss of colour about which Liszt may have been concerned.

There is a pianistic reason for the change of key: the figuration Liszt invents as decoration lies under the hands more easily in B than it does in Eb, and, as if to prove this, Liszt returns to Eb later on.

The rhythmic ambiguity of the Introduction is emphasised by Liszt's procedure at the beginning of the dance:

Example 27

That first low B in the left hand is heard as a down-beat, which is not contradicted until the fourth measure of the section. Verdi, on the other hand, begins his dance with a definite downbeat.
The second section of the dance, scored by Verdi for three flutes playing in unison, is turned by Liszt into Thalberg's trick of three hands. Liszt, as we have seen, had done this many times, but here the virtuoso is completely subservient to the music and to giving pianistic effect to Verdi's scoring.

Example 28

34Verdi Aida orchestral score.
Example 28 (continued)

Liszt

\( \text{leggiero e legato} \)
Eb major returns and the music dies away. The chant of the Priestess interrupts the silence, marcato this time, and over a menacing bass. As the chant is repeated, louder each time, so does it move tonally upwards, through E major, reaching a six-three chord over F sharp in the bass. This, too, dies away in the depths of the keyboard, and out of the silence is heard a fragment of the final duet, answered by the Priestess' chant. Below the section is reproduced in Example 29.

Example 29
Ex. 29 contd.
The tonality changes to Gb, and the melody of the duet is presented. On page 71 two of Verdi's letters to the conductor of the first production showed his concern for the effect of his scoring. That scoring is reproduced on the following pages, Example 30; followed by the same passage as it occurs in the piano-vocal score; and then by Liszt's version. Note, first of all, that Liszt has retained all of Verdi's vocal inflection marks. It is obvious which piano version more accurately reproduces the sound of Verdi's orchestration.

We have noted in earlier arrangements that Liszt altered a note or two in the melodic line, and that these changes resulted in an important structural event. It was also pointed out that, in keeping with the vocal practise of the day, Liszt elaborated the cadence-points in the Duke of Mantua's melody in the Rigoletto paraphrase. Here he does the same thing, adding an appoggiatura to the end of Aida's phrase, on the word "pianti." That this was common practise can be surmised from a direction in the score of Rigoletto: "Questo recitativo dovra essere detto senza le solite appoggiature. - This recitative must be performed without the customary appoggiature." And writing of Aida, Charles Osborne has this to say:

37See p.

38Giuseppe Verdi, Rigoletto, piano-vocal score (Milan: Ricordi, 1980), 280.
Example 30
Example 30 (continued) piano-vocal score
Example 30 (continued) Liszt
I have always felt an appoggiatura should be sung on 'pianti.' I don't know that Verdi was consistent, or, for that matter, insistent about appoggiature, but in the last scene of Otello his direction 'a tempo prestissimo, senza appoggiature' implies that he normally expected them.  

Liszt obviously felt the appoggiatura necessary.

The final phrase of Aida's melody is slightly expanded, and just as Verdi altered his orchestration for Radames's verse, so does Liszt change his figuration, introducing a shimmering arpeggio that points to Les jeux d'eaux à la Villa d'Este. Here, first of all, is Liszt's version of Verdi's orchestra, followed by the later piano piece.

Example 31

\[\text{Example image}\]

\[\text{Example image}\]

\[\text{Example image}\]

\[\text{Example image}\]

\[\text{Example image}\]

\[\text{Example image}\]

\[\text{Example image}\]

39Charles Osborne, *op. cit.*, 392.
Les jeux d'eaux

Allegretto

p"trance

poco poco cresc.
Liszt expands the duet, working it up into an Italianate "Liebestod," going far beyond the letter of the original. Verdi achieves the same intensity of emotion with more delicate forces. But it must be remembered that Verdi has built to this point over a lengthy period of time. Liszt has not had that time. The climax of Liszt's arrangement is interrupted by the chant of the Priestess, fortissimo. The pianist desirous of ending to cheers can finish with F sharp major chords that crash up and down the keyboard. The musician will turn the page and end quietly, as Verdi did, and as Liszt intended his arrangement should end.

The use of the Priestess' chant in this arrangement is extraordinary. The title of the piece is simply Aida. Danza sacra e duetto final. There is no mention of the chant. Yet it appears three times in the course of the piece, each time at a higher dynamic level. Though Verdi had progressed far beyond the "number" opera by the time of Aida, and though the danza sacra is separated from the preceding chant, it is possible that Liszt considered them a single unit. Such thinking on Liszt's part would explain the first appearance of the chant, at the beginning of the piece, but hardly its dramatic interruption of the dance (Example 29), nor its use a linking material to the final duet:
nor would it explain its use as a conclusion:

Example 34
As Liszt utilises it, the chant serves an important structural purpose. In its three appearances, it provides unity for what would otherwise be a two-part arrangement, with nothing in common between the two parts. But, more importantly, the use of the chant reflects the drama of the opera. On the surface the story deals with the inevitable love-triangle: the tenor is loved by the soprano and the mezzo, and, inevitably, the tenor and soprano triumph over the mezzo, even though they, inevitably, die. On a deeper level, Aida is placed in an impossible situation. She is a slave in the country of her enemies, the Egyptians; she loves, and is loved by, the commander of the Egyptian army; her father calls on her patriotism to persuade her lover to betray his country with fatal results. The real rulers of Egypt are not the Pharaohs, but the Priests, in the dramatic person of Ramfis, the High Priest, and in the musical person of the Priestess and her chant. It is the priests who select the commander of the army; they overrule the Pharaoh in Act II; they try and they condemn Radames for desertion, and, most importantly, it is their chant, together with Amneris's prayer for peace, that ends the opera. Liszt condenses Verdi, as he had condensed Bellini and Mozart, without losing sight of the real conflicts of the opera.

Four years after this arrangement was published, Liszt published his last piano version of a Verdi opera, Réminiscences de Boccaneegra. In his last operatic arrangement he returns to a form that, in his youth, provided him with many opportunities for technical display; think, for instance, of the Réminiscences de Norma or
the Réminiscences de Don Juan. The Réminiscences de Boccanegra is as far removed stylistically from those early works as Liszt himself was in years.

Verdi's Simón Boccanegra was first produced in Venice in 1857. It was not a success, and although it was given elsewhere with some success, the work soon disappeared. Julian Budden, in his masterly study of the operas, sums it up as a "hard, gritty work, austere in its vocal writing and uncompromising in its expression, but it was not a work of which its composer had any reason to be ashamed."41

Twenty-three years later, thanks to the prodding of Ricordi, Verdi revised the score, ostensibly to try out a new librettist, Arrigo Boito. In March 1881 the new version was produced at La Scala, and though Verdi was optimistic about the work's ability "to go the rounds of the theatres like so many of its sisters,"42 neither version has had the success it deserves.

Liszt begins his Réminiscence with eight measures of bare octaves, serving as an austere introduction.

41Budden, The Operas of Verdi, from "Il Trovatore" to "La Forza del destino" (London: Cassell and Company, 1978), 254.

42Quoted in Budden, op. cit., 267.
Verdi's introduction is brief and strict in its writing:

Example 36

43 Ex. 35, 37, 38, 40-42 are taken from Liszt, Piano Works (New York: Kalmus), 31-48.

44 Verdi Simon Boccanegra piano-vocal score (Milan: Ricordi), 1.
Example 37 (continued)
Liszt expands Verdi, adhering to the strictness of the writing, but note how subtly Verdi is transformed into Liszt, particularly the final measures. (See Example 37, above)

The tonality changes from E major to A minor; fanfares interrupt the left-hand octave figure which is the off-stage chorus from the end of Act II, in embryo. The chorus is soon heard in its entirety. As in his earlier reminiscences, Liszt does not feel compelled merely to reproduce: the urgency and tension that the ever-approaching chorus produces in the theatre is reflected in the piano, but not necessarily the notes as Verdi wrote them. The following examples illustrate Liszt's transformations.

Example 38
Verdi has written only one trumpet blast at this point. By adding to the number Liszt recalls the interruption to the Council Chamber (Act I, scene 2). But note the diminished fourths and open fifths of Liszt's fanfares, so typical of his late piano writing. The orthodox choral writing of Verdi (shown here)

Example 39\textsuperscript{45}

is changed into pure Liszt simply by the use of augmented chords:

Example 40

\textsuperscript{45}Verdi, \textit{Simon Boccanegra}, 196.
There is nothing in Verdi to warrant this sequence of measures with their repeated sequence of unrelated chords, again a typical feature of Liszt's late style.

Example 41

The chorus is repeated with left-hand octaves underneath adding to the agitation. The storm passes, the key changes to F sharp major and the tempo to Largo. Boccanegra has been poisoned but before he dies he blesses his daughter and son-in-law, and prays for peace. By extending the Doge's final phrase Liszt makes a final gesture towards a cadenza, but how changed it all is!

Example 42
Simon's daughter Amelia begins "one of the longest and most moving final melodies to grace any concertato,"\textsuperscript{46} and Liszt reproduces this typically Verdiian ensemble in all its simple grandeur. Verdi's opera ends quietly, but Liszt, with a final, grandioso, recalling of the Prologue brings his forty-seven-year career as an operatic transcriber to a close fortissimo.

\textsuperscript{46}Budden, \textit{op. cit.}, 328.
CONCLUSION

In Liszt's forty-seven-year career as an operatic transcriber, the most popular and the greatest operas were examined by him. Not only did this list include the works of his popular contemporaries, Bellini, Donizetti and Verdi, but also the unknown Russians, Glinka and Tchaikovsky, for instance. There were also little known Hungarians, who are still as little known today. And then there were Mozart, Meyerbeer, Wagner, of course, and Berlioz. There was even the totally unknown Count of Saxe-Coburg-Gotha, whose opera, Tony, Liszt produced at Weimar - no doubt for political reasons, though he liked the music.¹

The transcriptions span Liszt's entire composing life, and reflect that life, from the earliest, extraordinarily difficult Paganini Caprices to the final Boccanegra, where "the music is reduced to its barest essentials; it is dignified and powerful, with no display for its own sake."²

¹See Liszt Letters, I, 67.

The transcriptions of Liszt have been unjustly neglected. With the availability by means of records, broadcast and live concerts, of so much music, the need for transcription has gone (though the best way to study a piece of music is to play it), but, as has been shown, there is more to the art of transcription than simply promulgating infrequently heard music. In Liszt's case there was his unending interest in the technical possibilities of the keyboard; there was also the simple challenge of reproducing on the piano the total effect of the original - voice and piano, orchestra and voices, orchestra alone, or even all the effects of a Hungarian gypsy band.

Study of the transcriptions help us understand more fully Liszt the composer, and, of equal importance, Liszt the pianist. Because the transcription has practically served its purpose it should not be disparaged. Busoni wrote:

Transcription occupies an important part in the literature of the piano; and looked at from a right point of view, every important piano piece is the reduction of a big thought to a practical instrument. But transcription has become an independent art, no matter whether the starting point of a composition is original or unoriginal. Bach, Beethoven, Liszt and Brahms were evidently all of the opinion that there is artistic value concealed in a pure transcription; for they all cultivated the art themselves, seriously and lovingly.

---

Since transcription occupied so much of Liszt's composing time, no study of Liszt the composer can be complete without spending time with the transcriptions, and, of the many operatic arrangements, those of the Verdi operas form a central core, spanning his compositional career, leading us out of the virtuoso period, into the austere, final, period. In these Verdi transcriptions we can follow, as we cannot in the Wagner arrangements (they are far too literal), the development of the composer Liszt. Perhaps with the current revival of things Romantic, all of the Verdi transcriptions, indeed all of the transcriptions, will become available, so that eventually the complete works of this extraordinary composer will be published.
APPENDIX A

This list of transcriptions is not complete. It contains only those transcriptions for piano solo; Liszt arranged compositions - his own and others' - for two pianos, for piano duet, for piano and orchestra; he orchestrated some of his own piano works; he arranged piano accompaniments into orchestral ones. The complete list of these transcriptions can be found in such sources as Searle's article in the fifth edition of Grove's Dictionary and the symposium on Liszt edited by Alan Walker. A complete list is not necessary for our purposes.

Alabieff.
Mazurka pour piano composée par un amateur de St. Petersburg, paraphrasée par F.L.

Auber.
Grande Fantaisie sur la tyrolienne de l'opéra La Fiancée.
Tarantelle di bravura d'après la tarantelle de La Muette de Portici (Masaniello).

Bach, J.S.
Six Preludes and Fugues for organ: A minor; C major; C minor; C major; E minor; B minor.
Fantasy and Fugue in G minor for organ.

Beethoven.
Symphonies de Beethoven. Partitions de piano.
Capriccio alla turca sur des motifs de Beethoven (Ruines d'Athens).
Fantasia on Beethoven's 'Ruins of Athens.'
Grand Septuor.
Adelaide.

101
Sechs geistliche Lieder (Gellert)

Beethoven's Lieder von Goethe (from
Opp 75, 83, 84). Mignon: Mit einem
gemalten Bande; Freudvoll und leidvoll;
Es war einmal ein König; Wonne der
Wehmüt; Die Trommel gerühret.

An die ferne Geliebte.

Bellini.

Réminiscences des Puritains.

I Puritani. Introduction et Polonaise.

Hexameron, morceau de concert. Grandes
Variations de Bravoure sur le marche des
Puritains.

Fantaisie sur des motifs favoris de
l'opéra La Sonnambula.

Réminiscences de Norma.

Berlioz.

L'Idée fixe. Andante amoroso.

Bénédiction et serment, deux motifs de
Benvenuto Cellini.

Episodie de la vie d'un artiste. Grande
Symphonie fantastique. Partition de
piano.

Ouverture des Francs-Juges.

Harold en Italie. Symphonie en quatre
parties avec un alto principal.
Partition de piano (avec la partie
d'alto).

Marche des Pèlerins de la sinfonie Harold
en Italie. Transcrite pour le piano.

Ouverture du Roi Lear.

Danse des Sylphes de La Damnation de
Faust.

Air chanté par Massol arrangé pour le piano.

Bulhakov.  Russischer Galopp.

von Bülow.  Dantes Sonnett "Tanto gentile e tanto onesta."

Chopin.  6 Chants polonais. Mädchens Wunsch; Frühling; Das Ringlein; Bacchanal; Meine Freuden; Heimkehr.

Conradi.  Le Célèbre Ziguenerpolka.

Cui.  Tarantella.

Dargomizshsky.  Tarantella, transcrite et amplifiée pour le piano à deux mains.

David.  Bunte Reihe.

Dessauer.  Lieder.

Lockung; Zwei Wege; Spanisches Lied.

Donizetti, Gaetano.  Réminiscences de Lucia de Lammermoor.

Marche et cavatine de Lucie de Lammermoor.

Nuits d’été à Pausilippe.

Barcojuolo; L’Alito di Bice; La Torre de Biassone.

Réminiscences de Lucrezia Borgia. Trio du second acte; Fantaisie sur des motifs favoris de l’opéra; Chanson à boire (Orgie) - Duo - Finale.

Valse à capriccio sur deux motifs de Lucia et Parisina.

Marche funèbre de Dom Sébastien.

Donizetti, Giuseppe.  Grande Paraphrase de la marche de Donizetti composée pour Sa Majesté le sultan Abdul Medjid-Khan.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Composer/Musician</th>
<th>Work/Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Draeseke</td>
<td>Cantata; Der Schwur am Rütli, Part 1. Piano reduction.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Egressy and Erkel</td>
<td>Szozat und Ungarischer Humnus.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ernst Herzog zu Sachsen-Coburg-Gotha</td>
<td>&quot;Halloh! Jagdchor und Steyrer&quot; from the opera &quot;Tony.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erkel</td>
<td>Schwenengesang und March from Hunyadi Laszlo.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Festetics</td>
<td>Spanisches Ständchen.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Franz</td>
<td>Er ist gekommen in Sturm und Regen.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lieder. Auf geheimen Waldepfaden; Drüben geht die Sonne scheiden; Trübe wird's; Sonnenuntergang; Auf dem Teich; Der schaalk; Der Bote; Meerestille treibt der Sommer; Gewitternacht; Das ist ein Brausen und Heulen; Frühling und Liebe.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glinka</td>
<td>Tscherkessenmarsch from Russian and Ludmilla.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goldschmidt</td>
<td>Liebesszene und Fortunas Kugel, from Die sieben Todsünden.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gounod</td>
<td>Hymne à Sainte Cecile.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Valse de l'opéra Faust.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Les Sabéennes. Berceuse de l'opéra La Reine de Saba.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Halevy</td>
<td>Reminiscences de La Juive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Herbeck</td>
<td>Tanzmomente.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hummel</td>
<td>Septet.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lassen</td>
<td>Löse Himmel meine Seele.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ich weIl' in tiefer Einsamkeit.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
From the music to Hebbel's "Nibelungen" and Goethe's "Faust." Nibelungen: Haagen und Krimhild; Bechlarn. Faust: Osterhymne; Hoffest. Marsch und Polonaise.

Symphonisches Zwischenspiel (Intermezzo) zu Calderons Schauspiel "Über allen Zauber Liebe."

Lessman.

3 songs from J. Wolfli's "Tannhäuser,"
Der Lenz ist gekommen; Trinklied; Du schaust mich an.

Liszt.

Abschied. Russisches Volkslied.

Album d'un voyageur, III.
Improvisata sur le Ranz de Vaches de Ferd. Huber; Un soir dans les montagnes;
Nocturne sur le chant montagnard d'Ernest Knoe; Rondeau sur le Ranz de Chevres de Ferd. Huber.

Alleluja et Ave Maria (d'Arcadelt)

Années de pelerinage. Deuxième année: Italie; Canzonetta del Salvator Rosa;
3 Petrarch sonnets.

Ave Maria (2 versions).

Ave Maria IV.

Ave maris stella.

Der blinde Sänger.

Buch der Lieder für Piano allein.
Loreley; Am Rhein; Mignon; Es war ein König in Thule; Der du von Himmel bist;
Angiolon dal biondo crin.

Cantico del Sol di San Francesco.

Canzone napolitana.

Comment, disaient-ils.

Elégie sur des motifs du prince Louis Ferdinand de Prusse.

Epithalam zu Eduard Remenyis Vermählungsfeier.

Etudes d'exécution transcendante d'après Paganini.

Enfant, si j'étais roi.

Excelsior! Preludio zu dem glocken des Strassburger Münsters.

Fantaisie romantique sur deux melodies suisses.

Fantasie und Füge über das Thema BACH.

Faribolo Pastour and Chanson de Dearn.

Festmarsch nach Motiven von E.H.z.S.-C.-G.

Gastibelza.

Gaudeamus igitur. Concert paraphrase.

Gaudeamus igitur. Humoreske.

Geharnischte Lieder.

Grandes Etudes de Paganini.

Gretchen. 2nd movement of the Faust symphony.

Grosse Konzertfantasie über spanische Weisen.

Glaces de Woronince. Ballade d'Ukraine; Melodies polonaises; Complainte.

God save the Queen.

Hungarian National Melodies (21 divided into 10 volumes).

Hungarian Rhapsodies.
Five Hungarian folk songs, transcribed for piano.

From the Hungarian Coronation Mass. Benedictur; Offertorium.


Impromptu brillant sur des thèmes de Rossini et Spontini.

Il m'aimait tant.

Loreley (2nd version).

La Gloche sonne.

Liebesträume. 3 Notturnos.

La Marseillaise.

Les Morts.

Second Mephisto Waltz.

Oh, quand je dors.

Pastorale. Schnitterchor aus dem Entfeselten Prometheus.

Puszta Wehmut. A Puszta Keresve.

Rhapsodie espagnole. Folies d'Espagne et Jota aragonesa.

Rondo fantastique sur un thème espagnol.

La Romanesca.

Romance oublieée.

Salve Polonia.

Sarabande and Chaconne from Handel's opera Almira.

Sept Variations brillantes sur un thème de G. Rossini.
Slavimo Slavno Slaveni!

S'il est un charmant gazon.

Der Tanz in der Dorfschenke (Ist Mephisto Waltz).

La tombe et la rose.

Totentanz.

Le Triomphe funèbre du Tasse.

Tre sonetti del Petrarca. (1st version).

Variations on a Waltz by Diabelli.

Variations on the theme of BACH (Basso continuo of the first movement of his cantata Weinem, Klagen, Sorgen, Zagen, and of the Crucifixus of the B minor mass).

Weinen, Klagen, Sorgen, Zagen. Prelude (after Bach).

Vive Henri IV.

Zum Haus der Herrn ziehen wir.

Die Zelle in Nonnenwerth. Elégie.

Weimars Königslied.

Mendelsohn.

Lieder.
Auf flügeln des Gesanges; Sonntagslied; Reiseliend; Neue Liebe; Frühlingslied; Winterlied; Suleika.

Wasserafaht and Der Jüger Abschied.

Wedding March and Dance of the Elves from the music to Shakespeare's "A Midsummer Night's Dream."

Mercandante.

Soirées italiennes. Six amusements sur des motifs de M. La primavera; Il Galop; Il pastore svizzero; La serenata del marinaro; Il brindisi; La zingarella spagnola.
Meyerbeer.  
Festmarsch zu Schillers 100 -jahriger Geburtsfeier.

Grand Fantaisie sur des thèmes de l'opéra Les Huguenots.

Rémimiscences de Robert le Diable.  
Valse infernale.

Illustrations du Prophète.  

Illustrations de l'Africaine.  

Le Moine.

Mosonyi.  
Fantaisie sur l'opéra hongrois Szep Ilonka.

Mozart.  
Rémimiscences de Don Juan.

Confutatis and Lacrymosa from the Requiem.

Pacini.  
Divertissement sur la cavatine "I tuoi frequenti palpiti (Niobe).

Pezzini.  
Una stella amica. Mazurka.

Paganini.  
Grande Fantaisie de Bravoure sur la Clochette.

Raff.  
Andante finale and March from the opera "King Alfred."

Rossini.  
La serenata e l'orgia. Grande fantaisie sur des motifs des Soirées musicales.

La pastorella dell'Alpi e Li marinari, 2me Fantasie sur des motifs de Soirées musicales.

Soirées musicales. La promessa; La regata veneziana; L'invito; La gita in
gondola; Il rimprovero; La pastorella
dell'Alpi; La partenza; La pesca; La
danza; La serenata; L'orgia; Li marinari.

Ouverture de l'opéra Guillaume Tell.

Deux Transcriptions. Air du Stabat Mater
(Cujus animam); La Charité.

Rubinstein.
2 songs.
O wenn es doch immer so Bliebe;
Der Asra.

Saint-Saëns.
Danse macabre.

Schubert.
Die Rose (Heidenroslein).

12 Lieder.
Sei mir gegrusst; Auf dem Wasser zu
singen; Du bist die Ruh; Erlkönig;
Meeresstille; Die junge Nonne;
Frühlingsglaube; Gretchen am Spinnrade;
Ständchen; Rastlose Liebe; Der Wanderer;
Ave Maria.

Der Gondelfahrer.

Schwanengesang.
Die Stadt; Das Fischermadchen;
Aufenthalt; Am Meer; Abschied; In der
Ferne; Ständchen; Ihr Bild;
Frühlingsssehnsucht; Liebesbotschaft; Der
Atlas; Der Doppelsänger; Die Taubenpost;
Kriegers Ahnung.

Winterreise.
Gute Nacht; Die Nebensonnen; Mut; Die
Post; Erstarrung; Wasserflut; Der
Lindenbaum; Der Leyermann; Täuschung; Das
Wirtshaus; Der stürmische Morgen; Im
Dorfe.

Geistliche Lieder.
Litanei; Himmelsfunken; Die Gestirne;
Hymne.

Sechs Melodien.
Lebewohl; Mädchens Klage; Das
Sterbeglücklein; Trockene Blumen; Die
Forelle.
Die Forelle.

Müllerlieder.
Das Wandern; Der Müller und der Bach; Der Jäger; Die böse Farbe; Wohin?; Ungeduld.

Melodies hongroises (d'après Schubert)

Schubert's Marsche für das Piano-forte allein.

Soirées de Vienne. Valses caprices d'après Schubert.

Schumann.

Liebeslied.

An den Sonnenschein and Rotes Röslein.

Frühlingsnacht.

Lieder von Robert und Clara Schumann.

Provencalisches Minnelied.

Sorriano.

Feuille morte. Elegie d'après Sorriano.

Spohr.

Die Rose. Romanze.

Szabady.

Revive Szegedin. Marche hongroise transcrète d'après l'orchestration de J. Massenet.

Szechenyi.

Einleitung und Ungarischer Marsch.

Bevezetes es magyar induló.

Tchaikovsky.

Polonaise from Eugene Onegin.

Vegh.

Concert Waltz after the 4-hand waltz-suite.

Verdi.

Salve Maria de Jérusalem (I Lombardi).

Concert paraphrase on "Ernani."

Ernani. Paraphrase de concert.

Miserere du Trovatore.
Wagner.

Rigoletto. Paraphrase de concert.

Don Carlos. Transcription. Coro di festa e marcia funebre.

Aida. Danza sacra e duetto final.

Agnus Dei de la Messe de Requiem.

Réminiscences de Boccanegra.

Phantasiestück on themes from Rienzi.

Spinning chorus from The Flying Dutchman.

Ballad from The Flying Dutchman.

Pilgrims chorus from Tannhäuser.

O du mein hold Abendstern. Recitative and Romance from Tannhäuser.

Two pieces from Lohengrin and Tannhäuser.
1. Entry of the guests on the Wartburg;
2. Elsa's bridal procession to the Minster.

From Lohengrin. 1. Festival and bridal song; 2. Elsa's dream and Lohengrin's rebuke.

Isolde's Liebestod from Tristan und Isolde.

Am stillen Herd from Meistersinger.

Valhalla from the Ring of the Nibelung.

Feierlicher Marsch zum Heiligen Gral from Parsifal.

Weber.

Freischütz Fantasy.

Leyer und Schwert.

Einsam bin ich, nicht alleine, from the music to Preciosa.

Polonaise brillante.
Overture to Oberon.
Overture to Der Freischütz.
Jubel overture.

Wielhorsky.
Autrefois. Romanze.

Zichy.
Valse d'Adele. Composée pour la main gauche seule. Transcription brillante a deux mains.

Unknown.
Piano piece on Italian operatic melodies.
Three short pieces on themes by other composers.
Kavallerie-Geschwindmarsch.
APPENDIX B

A comparison between Paganini's Caprice in E major, as arranged for piano by Schumann and by Liszt

Studien nach Capricen von Paganini, Op. 3. Caprice no. 2. Robert Schumann.¹

Etudes d'execution transcendante d'apres Paganini, No. 5. "La Chasse".

BIBLIOGRAPHY


122


Westerby, Herbert. Liszt, Composer and his piano works. London: Willian Reeves, Ltd., 1936.


The Music


Donizetti, Gaetano. Lucia di Lammermoor, piano-vocal score. New York: Kalmus.


Halevy, Jacques. La Juive, piano-vocal score. New York: Kalmus.


Beethoven Symphonies, 2 volumes. New York: Kalmus.


"Rémisscences de Boccanegra." Early and Late Piano Works. New York: Kalmus.


Illustrations du Prophète, Nos. 1 and 3. Leipzig: Breitkopf and Härtel.


Le Prophète, piano-vocal score. New York: Kalmus.


Aida, orchestral score.

Don Carlos, piano-vocal score. Milan: Ricordi.

Ernani, piano-vocal score. Milan: Ricordi.

I Lombardi alla prima crociata, piano-vocal score. New York: Kalmus.

Rigoletto, piano-vocal score. Milan: Ricordi.


Il Trovatore, piano-vocal score. Milan: Ricordi.