INFORMATION TO USERS

This was produced from a copy of a document sent to us for microfilming. While the most advanced technological means to photograph and reproduce this document have been used, the quality is heavily dependent upon the quality of the material submitted.

The following explanation of techniques is provided to help you understand markings or notations which may appear on this reproduction.

1. The sign or “target” for pages apparently lacking from the document photographed is “Missing Page(s)”. If it was possible to obtain the missing page(s) or section, they are spliced into the film along with adjacent pages. This may have necessitated cutting through an image and duplicating adjacent pages to assure you of complete continuity.

2. When an image on the film is obliterated with a round black mark it is an indication that the film inspector noticed either blurred copy because of movement during exposure, or duplicate copy. Unless we meant to delete copyrighted materials that should not have been filmed, you will find a good image of the page in the adjacent frame.

3. When a map, drawing or chart, etc., is part of the material being photographed the photographer has followed a definite method in “sectioning” the material. It is customary to begin filming at the upper left hand corner of a large sheet and to continue from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps. If necessary, sectioning is continued again—beginning below the first row and continuing on until complete.

4. For any illustrations that cannot be reproduced satisfactorily by xerography, photographic prints can be purchased at additional cost and tipped into your xerographic copy. Requests can be made to our Dissertations Customer Services Department.

5. Some pages in any document may have indistinct print. In all cases we have filmed the best available copy.

University Microfilms International
300 N. ZEEB ROAD, ANN ARBOR, MI 48106
18 BEDFORD ROW, LONDON WC1R 4EJ, ENGLAND
PLEASE NOTE:

In all cases this material has been filmed in the best possible way from the available copy. Problems encountered with this document have been identified here with a check mark ✓.

1. Glossy photographs ________
2. Colored illustrations ________
3. Photographs with dark background ________
4. Illustrations are poor copy ________
5. Print shows through as there is text on both sides of page ________
6. Indistinct, broken or small print on several pages ✓
7. Tightly bound copy with print lost in spine ________
8. Computer printout pages with indistinct print ________
9. Page(s) ________ lacking when material received, and not available from school or author
10. Page(s) ________ seem to be missing in numbering only as text follows
11. Poor carbon copy ________
12. Not original copy, several pages with blurred type ________
13. Appendix pages are poor copy ________
14. Original copy with light type ________
15. Curling and wrinkled pages ________
16. Other ____________________________________________________________
WOMEN'S EXPERIENCE OF POWER:
A THEORY FOR EDUCATIONAL DEVELOPMENT

DISSERTATION

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree Doctor of Philosophy in the Graduate School of The Ohio State University

By

Jane Mayo-Chamberlain, A.B., M.A.

* * * * *

The Ohio State University
1980

Reading Committee:
Robert R. Bargar, Ph.D.
Beth L. Wismar, Ph.D.
David C. Broski, Ph.D.
Donald P. Sanders, Ph.D.

Approved By

Robert Bargar
Advisor

Department of Educational Foundations and Research
I dedicate this dissertation
to my two sons,
Allan and John Chamberlain
who have
received my animus and challenged me to grow,
and then stood by me as the growing unfolded.
VITA

May 15, 1928 ............... Born - Framingham, Massachusetts

1949 ....................... A.B., Mount Holyoke College, South Hadley, Massachusetts


1950-1969 ................ Parent and Community Volunteer, Massachusetts, Connecticut, New York and Columbus, Ohio

1969-1976 ................ Elementary and Post-Secondary Educator, Columbus, Ohio

1976-1980 ................ Graduate Research Assistant, School of Allied Medical Professions, The Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio

1977 ....................... M. A., The Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio

PUBLICATION


FIELDS OF STUDY

Major Field: Educational Development

Studies in Creativity and Human Development. Robert R. Bargar
Studies in Competency Based Education. David C. Broski
Studies in Educational Program Development. Donald P. Sanders
Studies in Organizational Behavior. H. Randolph Bobbitt
Studies in Instructional Development. John B. Hough
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>INTRODUCTION</strong></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. HABERMAS' CRITICAL THEORY.</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. JUNGIAN PSYCHOLOGY</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. ENERGY IN THEORETICAL PHYSICS AND MYSTICISM.</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. THE PLAN OF THE DISSERTATION</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PART ONE</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER ONE</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE EXPERIENCE OF POWER AND UNIVERSAL ENERGY</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. PHYSICS</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. PSYCHOLOGY</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. NEUROPSYCHOLOGY</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. PARAPSYCHOLOGY</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. SUMMARY</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER TWO</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRANSFORMATIVE POWER I</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. DEFINITION</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. SOURCE</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. PURPOSES</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. MEANS</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER THREE</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRANSFORMATIVE POWER II</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Means that Begin in Physical Experience</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Means that Begin in Emotional Experience</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Means that Begin in Mental Experience</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Means that Begin in Spiritual Experience</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Contingencies and Outcomes</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Women and Transformative Power</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

iv
TABLE OF CONTENTS (con’t)

WOMEN AND TRANSFORMATIVE POWER

1. Jungian Psychology of Women
   a. The role of the unconscious ..................................... 223
   b. Human bisexuality .............................................................. 225
   c. The foundations of Jungian psychology .................... 230
   d. Animus and anima .............................................................. 231
   e. The feminine principle................................................... 236
   f. Individuation ................................................................... 239

2. Empirical Validation by Welsh
   a. Origence and intellectence and gender role. . . . . 243
   b. Comparison to Jung's anima and animus archetypes. 250

3. Women's Experience of Transformative Power and
   Jungian Psychology of Women
   a. The emancipatory interest and the Jungian
      view of women ....................................................................... 253
   b. The source of transformative power and the
      Jungian views of women .................................................. 254
   c. Purposes in transformative power and the Jungian
      views of women ..................................................................... 255
   d. Means for transformative power and the Jungian
      view of women........................................................................ 255
   e. Outcomes from transformative power and the
      Jungian view of women...................................................... 264

CHAPTER FOUR

COMMUNICATIVE POWER

A. INTRODUCTION. ................................................... 269
B. DEFINITION. ................................................................. 284
C. SOURCE ...................................................................................................... 286
D. PURPOSE. .................................................................................................. 291
E. MEANS. ........................................................................................................ 295
   1. Criteria for methods in use in the realm of
      communicative power. ....................................................... 295
      a. Fosters enlightenment. ......................................................... 297
      b. Maintains symmetry of opportunity. .................................. 298
      c. Deepens trust. ................................................................. 300
      d. Enhances openness. ........................................................... 301
   2. Methods in use in the realm of communicative power. 303
      a. Methods in use in dyads. ...................................................... 304
      b. Methods in use in organization development ... 312
      c. Methods in use in social change. ........................................ 322
F. CONTINGENCIES AND OUTCOMES ............................................................ 325
TABLE OF CONTENTS (con't)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>G.</td>
<td>WOMEN'S EXPERIENCE OF COMMUNICATIVE POWER AND JUNGIAN PSYCHOLOGY OF WOMEN</td>
<td>329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. The practical interest and the Jungian view of women</td>
<td>329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. The source of communicative power and the Jungian view of women</td>
<td>333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. The purpose of communicative power and the Jungian view of women</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. The means of communicative power and the Jungian view of women</td>
<td>338</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. The outcomes of communicative power and the Jungian view of women</td>
<td>340</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER FIVE</th>
<th>INSTRUMENTAL POWER</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>341</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. DEFINITION</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. SOURCES</td>
<td>357</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. PURPOSE</td>
<td>364</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. MEANS</td>
<td>368</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
<td>368</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Criteria</td>
<td>369</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Stimulates the development of alternatives</td>
<td>372</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Clarifies decision-making</td>
<td>374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Releases energy for the process</td>
<td>375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Gives adequate impetus to achieve the goal</td>
<td>376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Methods</td>
<td>382</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. OUTCOMES AND CONTINGENCIES</td>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. WOMEN'S EXPERIENCE OF INSTRUMENTAL POWER</td>
<td>404</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The technical interest and the Jungian view of women</td>
<td>405</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The sources of instrumental power and the Jungian view of women</td>
<td>408</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The purpose of instrumental power and the Jungian view of women</td>
<td>411</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The means of instrumental power and the Jungian view of women</td>
<td>412</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Outcomes of instrumental power and the Jungian view of women</td>
<td>414</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER SIX</th>
<th>THREE KINDS OF POWER AND THE FEMININE ANDROGYNE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>415</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. THE INTERACTIONS OF THE THREE KINDS OF POWER</td>
<td>420</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The influence of transformative power on the use of communicative and instrumental power</td>
<td>420</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The influence of communicative power on the use of instrumental and transformative power</td>
<td>423</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE OF CONTENTS (con't)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3. The influence of instrumental power on the use of transformative and communicative power</td>
<td>425</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. THE ANDROGYNY PRINCIPLE.</td>
<td>427</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The cultural background of androgyny.</td>
<td>431</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The androgyny principle in Jungian psychology.</td>
<td>445</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The feminine androgyne.</td>
<td>454</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. SUMMARY: THE FEMININE ANDROGYNE AND THE THREE KINDS OF POWER AS EXPRESSIONS OF UNIVERSAL ENERGY</td>
<td>460</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CHAPTER VII
ANDROGYNOUS EDUCATION FOR WOMEN IN COMPLEX ORGANIZATIONS

A. CORPORATE SETTINGS FOR ANDROGYNOUS EDUCATION.                      | 463  |
| 1. Contemporary organizational settings profit from and promote women's development toward more androgynous behavior | 464  |
| 2. The educational implications to be drawn in this chapter are directed at policy-making with regard to the training and development of women in complex organizations and are not intended as a curriculum guide. | 467  |
| 3. The implications to be drawn form a network relating the four aspects of the woman (physical, emotional, mental and spiritual) and the three kinds of power (transformative, communicative, and instrumental) within multiple aspects of a corporate setting. | 469  |
| 4. The implications also refer to the transpersonal power flux within which both the women and the organization are relatively longstanding configurations of energy. | 470  |
| 5. The experiences available to a woman in contemporary corporate life afford her an excellent challenge for individuation as described in Jungian psychology | 471  |

B. PROPOSITIONS ABOUT THE PROCESS AND CONTENT OF EDUCATION FOR ANDROGYNY FOR WOMEN IN COMPLEX ORGANIZATIONS. | 473  |
| 1. Development beginning in the area of transformative power is centered in the autonomy of the woman and is best supported by the fullest transformative process of the facilitator | 475  |
| a. Educational experiences of transformative power by women in corporate settings |
| 1. A woman's developmental experience must be conceived holistically | 477  |
| 2. A woman should have experiences which will allow her to develop perspective on her states of consciousness. | 479  |
| 3. A woman should have experiences from which she can form an understanding of the purposes and source of personal transformation. | 481  |
TABLE OF CONTENTS (con't)  

4. A woman should experience means of transformative power which are relevant to the direction of her intent for her development .............................................. 483  
5. A woman should be supported in maintaining her satisfaction in development at a level high enough to keep her motivation strong .......................... 484  
   b. The involvement of facilitator(s) in educational experiences of transformative power by women ........ 485  
1. The facilitator(s)' personal experience of transformative power should have been as full as possible .................................................. 486  
   a. The facilitator's full experience of transformative power is important because her modeling will better support movement from hope through to knowing in participant women .................................................. 487  
   b. The facilitator's full experience of transformative power is important because her choices about content and process will have a more valid relation to transformation in participants .................................................. 488  
2. The facilitator's responsibilities for the transformative process in the corporate setting, according to the organizational development model, include needs assessment, design and delivery of developmental experiences, and follow-up and evaluation .................................................. 489  
   a. The facilitator should do needs assessment with developing women about their personal intentions and their present capabilities .................................................. 490  
   b. The facilitator should do needs assessment which is qualitative as well as quantitative with all organizational levels from the top to at least the level below the developing woman ........................................................................ 491  
   c. The facilitator should design developmental experiences having in view the special characteristics of women, the interactions of communicative and instrumental power with transformative power, and the organizational context of the transformative process .................................................. 492  
   d. The facilitator is responsible for guiding experiences of transformative process in the light of the propositions made from the standpoint of the participating woman ........................................................................ 495  
   e. The facilitator is responsible for guiding experiences of transformative process with the design as a base but with openness to emergent opportunity for growth for participants and facilitator .................................................. 497  

viii
TABLE OF CONTENTS (con't)

f. The facilitator is responsible to see that participants have feedback and dialogue. 498

g. The facilitator is responsible for mediating the transformative process and its outcomes to the organizational context, with the guidance and active involvement of participants, using understandings of persons formed in dialogue with Jungian psychology. 498

c. From the standpoint of organizational behavior theory, transformative power has an affinity with the human resource development school. 500

2. Development beginning in the area of communicative power is centered in the dynamics of the group and is best supported by the fullest use of communicative power by the facilitator. 502

a. Educational experiences of communicative power by women in corporate settings. 503

1. The dynamics and levels of understanding in the group are the raw materials for the experience of communicative power in mixed and in women's groups. 504

2. Women should have opportunities to develop awareness of their conscious and unconscious skill in communicative process in three kinds of life expression (i.e., a-linguistic, b-action, c-experiential). 505

3. Women should experience the transferability of their experience of communicative power to the significant interactions of their corporate life. 507

4. Women should be come aware of the power and the limitations of consensus through the process of developing it within the constraints of a complex organization. 508

5. The individual women involved in communicative process should have access to unconstrained intersubjectivity in some arenas of their lives. 509

b. The involvement of facilitator(s) in educational experiences of communicative power by women. 510

1. The facilitator's experience of communicative power should have been as full as possible. 511

a. The facilitator's full experience of communicative power is important because her modeling of genuine and effective linguistic, action, and experiential life expression, and her hermeneutic inquiry will be clearer. 511

b. The facilitator's full experience of communicative power is important because her judgment about content and process will be more relevant to the women and the corporate setting. 511
### TABLE OF CONTENTS (con't)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. The facilitator(s)' responsibilities for the</td>
<td>512</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>development of communicative power in women</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in corporate settings, according to the organizational development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>model, include needs assessment, design and delivery of</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>developmental experiences, and follow-up and evaluation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. The facilitator should employ needs analysis tools designed to</td>
<td>513</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>allow and encourage expression of as broad a range of blocks and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>challenges as possible, as seen by women themselves</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The facilitator should employ a similar range of methods in</td>
<td>513</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>attending to the needs of the persons elsewhere in the corporate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>structure with whom the developing women's roles interact</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The facilitator has the responsibility of designing so that the</td>
<td>515</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>other kinds of power will appear experientially in the process of the</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>group and also of using process consultation skills to raise the</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>other kinds of power to awareness</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The facilitator is responsible for assisting the</td>
<td>516</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>group in experiencing communicative power as discussed in other</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sections</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. The facilitator is responsible for mediating the</td>
<td>520</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>communicative process and its outcomes to the organizational context</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with the guidance and active involvement of participants, using their</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>understanding of persons formed in dialogue with Jungian psychology</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and her own understanding</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Educational experiences of instrumental power by women</td>
<td>524</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in corporate settings</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Women's experience in the developmental process should demonstrate</td>
<td>524</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to them their own capacity to set and achieve goals.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The contributions of transformative and communicative power to</td>
<td>525</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>instrumental process should be made clear in the experience of</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>instrumental power as should its serviceability to them</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Women's perceptions of their options for instrumental process</td>
<td>527</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>should be extended</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Women's optimism about their own experience of instrumental power</td>
<td>528</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>should be refined by realistic assessment skills and experience</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The involvement of facilitator(s) in educational experiences of</td>
<td>528</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>instrumental power by women</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The facilitator(s)' experience of instrumental power should have</td>
<td>528</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>been and must continue to be as full as possible</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE OF CONTENTS (con't)

a. The facilitator's full experience of instrumental power is important because her modeling of realistic goal-setting and achievement will suggest options for process and give an opportunity for participants to increase their own optimism about what a woman can do .................................................. 530

b. The facilitator's full experience of instrumental power is important because her perception of effective and appropriate options for content and process will be richer. ................. 530

2. The facilitator(s)' responsibilities for the development of instrumental power in women in corporate settings, according to the organization development model, include needs assessment, design and delivery of developmental experiences, and follow-up and evaluation ................................................. 531
   a. The facilitator should employ a needs analysis system that will yield measurable goals which show a clear relation to the goals and objectives of the larger complex organization ........... 531
   b. The facilitator should involve participants in a needs analysis for themselves as an aspect of a goal-setting process that has a demonstrable relation to the goals of the complex organization ...... 532
   c. The facilitator has responsibility for implementing the goal-seeking process by specific uses of effective and appropriate instrumental power to make possible the experiences called for in other sections ... 533
   d. The facilitator has responsibility for establishing a rational and thorough method of evaluating participant progress toward the goals of the experience .......... 533
   e. The facilitator has the responsibility for communicating effectively about the instrumental process and its outcomes to the organizational context with the active and specific help of the participants, using their understanding of persons formed in dialogue with Jungian psychology as well as her own understanding of it all .... 534

C. IMPLICATIONS FOR COMPLEX ORGANIZATIONS OF ANDROGYNOUS EDUCATION FOR WOMEN ............................................. 535
   1. Cost-effective human resource development .................. 536
   2. Higher morale among women yielding lowered absenteeism and turnover ..................... 536
TABLE OF CONTENTS (con't)  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3. Increased productivity resulting from better</td>
<td>537</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>human resource utilization</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REFERENCES</td>
<td>538</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>The TOTE Model</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Relationship of the Conscious-Unconscious Psychological Domain to the Voluntary-Involuntary Physiological Domain</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Self-Regulation of Psychophysiological Events</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>The Creative Problem-Solving Model</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Comparison of the Nine-Step Model and the Creative Problem-Solving Institute Model</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Three Types of Meditation</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Diagram of the Great Mother Archetype (Erich Neumann)</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>The Masculine Principle - A Teaching Diagram</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Quadrants Describing High and Low Origent and Intellectant Subjects</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Creativity and Intelligence Test Correlates of SVIB Dimensional Scores</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Hypothetical Interpretation of Sexual Identification as a Function of Origence and Intellectence</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Novant Frequencies for Masculine and Feminine Subgroups</td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>A Cyclical Model of Interpersonal Conflict</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>The Animus and Anima in Female-Male Relationship</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>Three Kinds of Power and the Yin-Yang Expression of the Jungian Psychology of Women</td>
<td>417</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>Summary of Androgynous Aspects of World Cultures in Relation to the Yin-Yang Symbol of Taoism</td>
<td>440</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
WOMEN'S EXPERIENCE OF POWER:

A THEORY FOR EDUCATIONAL DEVELOPMENT

A. INTRODUCTION

Twentieth century technology has unlocked doors that women have only begun to push open and walk through. Social gender stereotypes and deep unconscious resistance in men and in women themselves have limited women's access to the experience of power technology has opened the way to. Many educators involved with women in their life-long learning are now confronting the issues raised by the inner and outer barriers that women experience to developing their power. When women enter complex formal organizations, hinderances that initially had only personal and familial effects assume broader dimensions. The outcomes have serious implications for society as a whole, and they propose interesting research problems.

There is a wealth of specific questions relevant to educational development with women. Research topics that invite investigation range from child care problems of working student women to the track records of graduate women in financial institutions. Behind the multitude of specific research questions, however, lies a need for an organizing theory of women's experience of power. This paper addresses aspects of that need.
Women have been freed by birth control, household automation, support groups, and national legislation, but their freedom is only apparent. Control over pregnancy, increased discretionary time, and new legal options (Bird and Briller, 1970; Pati and Fahey, 1975) have not fully freed women to develop their potential nor to use it effectively. Why? What prevents women from using the power in themselves?

Historically, in the decade of the seventies, at least two educational responses to the problem of real emancipation have emerged. Both have operated on the hypothesis that women mainly needed to develop skills in gaining their legitimate ends. One cluster of response was the development of groups for mutual self-education (First Assertive Rap Group, 1974; Phelps and Austin, 1975; Bloom, Coburn and Pearlman, 1975). Educational programs planned with women's presumed needs for assertive behavior in mind formed another cluster of responses to the need (Bower and Bower, 1976; Lange and Jakubowski, 1976; Herman, 1978). Although consciousness raising and the need to learn and practice skills related to assertion was part of the problem for many women, the results of these educational efforts were baffling as well as heartwarming.

Women seem to have other complex needs and untapped resources. The interest during the last decade in developing (1) women's power to gain the objectives they and others set has diverted attention from two other kinds of ability that women have always had. These abilities are (2) the power to develop interdependence, and
(3) the power to change in growthful and adaptive ways. I believe that training and other interventions with women in complex organizations can be improved by basing such educational programs on a different understanding of the three kinds of power just mentioned, and of women's distinctive relationship to each.

In formal organizations women experience barriers to using their power that they do not find elsewhere. In such organizational settings they may even experience barriers to using forms of power that they use readily and comfortably in other situations. The barriers women experience have roots in the human environment of a complex formal organization, but they also lie in the psychological makeup of women, and in the relationship of that psychological makeup to the three kinds of power identified here.

Within a broad definition of power as the capacity to achieve a result, three kinds of power may be defined: (1) instrumental - the capacity to exert influence to achieve one's ends; (2) communicative - the capacity to form a common will or consensus; and (3) transformative - the capacity to grow and become more integrated. I have identified these three kinds of power in relation to the three "cognitive interests" drawn from the work of Jürgen Habermas by McCarthy (1978) and Milczarek (1979).

A. HABERMAS' CRITICAL THEORY

The Critical Theory of Jürgen Habermas (McCarthy, 1978) makes possible understanding of the human cognitive interests
which it would otherwise be difficult to extract from Habermas' philosophical works. Once grasped, however, the theory offers a way of organizing our experience of power as individuals which sheds new light on it. Cognitive interests are processes of reflection by which we develop the points of view from which we apprehend reality (Habermas, 1971). Our experience of power is contingent on what we see as real.

The three cognitive interests Habermas describes are: (1) the "technical" interest in acting on persons and things to gain pre-specified goals; (2) the "practical" interest in forming consensus based on unconstrained communication; and (3) the "emancipatory" interest in transcending our limited views and moving toward wholeness. Habermas explicitly includes non-verbal as well as verbal communication in action based on each cognitive interest (Habermas, 1971). The transfer of meaning in discourse goes on at all levels, he is clear, and every level influences the truth claims at every other level. Lying with words will not work as long as body language tells another story.

Habermas matches a kind of inquiry to each interest (Milczarek, 1979). The emancipatory interest, which relates to transformative power, is served by critical inquiry, an analyzing-integrating process which he sees as dialogic. Habermas critiques Freud's theory of psychoanalytic understanding as he is exploring critical inquiry (1971) while he discusses the dialogue between the analyst and the patient. It appears, though, that this type
of dialogue may also be entirely internal, as Horney suggests (1942) and Jung implies (1968) with regard to the individuation process. The practical interest, which relates to communicative power, can be advanced, according to Habermas, by what he calls hermeneutic inquiry, which is a discursive, open, pattern-making kind of shared inquiry. Habermas (1977) cites Hannah Arendt's analysis of the Greek democracy as the type, pointing out that the establishment of true community was an end in itself there. Forming community in depth involves according full respect to all the opinions and feelings of all the participants, even to those which were hidden from themselves as well as others at the first. The technical interest (Habermas, 1968) regards persons as well as things as objects, and the inquiry method which matches that kind of interest is rational, linear and syllogistic.

Corresponding to each of the cognitive interests is a kind of action (Milczarek, 1979) and a kind of power. Human beings operate in three realms, that of their own inner experience, that of persons seen as fellow human beings, and that of material things and persons seen as objects. The realms overlap, to some extent, but as we act effectively to meet our needs in each realm, we experience a measure of the kind of power in that realm. The power that is in action in us in transforming our inner reality to move toward our full human potential is "transformative". The power we experience in forming true community with fellow human beings is "communicative". The power we use in achieving
pre-specified ends, relating in rational ways to other humans and
to the material world is "instrumental".

But how do women experience these kinds of power differently from men? Are women as we know them likely to exercise any one kind more smoothly than men? For theory in this aspect of the study, I have turned to Carl Jung, and to other Jungian analysts. Drawing on their work, I will discuss both the conscious and unconscious aspects of women's experience.

Although much is being learned specifically about the neuroanatomy and neuropsychology of women, all discussion of that material lies beyond the scope of this paper. On the other hand, in developing ideas about how all power is related, I shall need to draw on discoveries in neuropsychology generally.

**B. Jungian Psychology**

Jung, and those who have explored and extended his thinking, have been absorbed with recurring themes of human experience springing from the unconscious, and as found in dream symbolism and in the cultural symbolism of the human race. These themes Jung called archetypes. Sanford, a Jungian analyst, writes of the archetypes that they are the common elements in the human psyche, just as the heart, liver and lungs are the common elements of the human body.

" . . . They are patterns of energy which, when released, shape consciousness, and influence the development and expression of our personality
in definite ways. The archetypes are inherited patterns that express themselves in human behavior, emotions, fantasies, and ideas . . . " (1978:16).

Among these archetypes is the male/female unity of universal energy, the syzygy (Jung, 1958). Singer (1976), another Jungian, shows how the vision recurs in the myths of one civilization after another of a primal unity which divides into masculine and feminine and then re-joins to create all things.

In the same work, Singer (1976) also elaborated on Jung's (1958) discussion of his psychoanalytical work with the masculine archetype which he called the animus, and the feminine archetype, the anima. Jung's work, first published in 1952 and 1953, described the anima as the unconscious femininity in the man; it is the relating, connective quality, the Eros principle. Similarly, he described the animus as the unconscious masculinity in the woman; it is the cognitive and discriminating quality, the Logos principle.

Jung's life work was to help people raise the contents of their unconscious to awareness, and to integrate what they became aware of into their conscious experience. This process he called "individuation", that is, becoming less divided and more the unique person one is capable of becoming. He agreed with Freud's idea that the unconscious held repressed material too painful to experience consciously, but insisted that it also held personal experience simply forgotten. This part of the unconscious Jung called
the "personal unconscious". He also saw in the unconscious collective archetypes of the whole human race as well as the source of the means to wholeness and self-transcendence. This part of the unconscious he called the "collective unconscious". Thus, the gradual integration of the contents of both parts of the unconscious into conscious life would heal and develop persons. Among the ways Jung affirmed and used to further individuation were: interpreting dreams and reveries, understanding projections, and analyzing creative products.

Frances Wickes, also a Jungian analyst, has provided a rich interpretation of the anima and the anima and animus in The Inner World of Choice (1963). In that book she shows, for instance, how man's becoming aware of his imaginative, nurturing principle, the anima, can allow her (the anima) to do her valuable work of fostering creativity and developing him within for his outer relationships. Thus recognized, and allowed to develop positive inner relationships, the anima will gradually be reduced in her capability to distort his rational, organizing insights with moodiness.

Wickes also shows how a woman's becoming aware of her own clarifying originality, the animus, and affirming it in consciousness can free her to use it without being opinionated or harsh. Here, I will be concerned mainly with the conscious and unconscious feminine gender roles, and the animus, in women. For the purposes of this paper, I will need to deal with the corresponding
experiences in men principally in showing how they help or hinder individuation in women.

More than a decade later than Wickes' book, June Singer re-examined the anima and animus archetypes in terms of the view from the seventies in a book entitled Androgyny (1976). She reaffirmed the value of the animus and anima archetypes in understanding our inner process. She went on to show how we experience our gender roles both consciously and unconsciously. For instance, a woman might say to herself, "No, I won't, it would make me seem too boyish," a conscious awareness of appropriate femininity. There are also prohibitions against some ways of acting that are unacceptably masculine which are embedded too deeply in a woman's unconscious ever to come spontaneously to mind. Example of such prohibitions might be against not waiting until men have spoken first, or against setting the ankle of one leg on the opposite knee while talking. Both of these are behaviors that women typically avoid without the intervention of their consciousness. Both examples can be raised to consciousness to permit choice about them, and can then be allowed to drift back into unconsciousness if the women decides to. Much other unconscious material like life expectations and some sexual behavior, is more difficult to raise to consciousness.

The animus archetype, the contra-sexual principle in the woman's psyche, mentioned above, is constantly acting in relationship to the woman's unconscious and conscious femininity. Conversely,
the opposite inner relationships are at work in various ways in any man. Wickes (1963) and Sanford (1980) affirm that relationships to men and to women who are outside, as well as the inner relationships, foster wholeness and individuation. Society often looks mainly at which behaviors are predominant, however, and judges accordingly. Nevertheless, Singer believes that the real question is not which is predominant, but how the various aspects are related to each other within the person. The dynamic tension of the inner interplay is empowering (1976:vii).

C. ENERGY IN THEORETICAL PHYSICS AND MYSTICISM

The constant alternation of the feminine and the masculine principles is symbolized in Eastern mystical traditions by the yin-yang, the intercurved flowing symbol of light-becoming-darkness-becoming-light. Other expressions of the nature of reality by Eastern mysticism are strikingly similar to the statements of modern high-energy particle physics, as Fritjof Capra has shown (1975).

There are many parallels between physics and mysticism, but these parallel insights also find confirmation in the explorations of neuropsychology and the practice of biofeedback. Writers who have explored these relationships have been led to hypothesize that the personal experience of power as based in the mind and consciousness of the individual, is part of a continuum with universal energy (O'Reagan, 1973; Gowan, 1975, 1980; McKenna and
As this continuity is being confirmed in laboratories and in personal experience, experimenters are finding new dimensions to the power that operates through and within the person.

A body of thought about energy is growing in several disciplines into a broad paradigm shift of the sort described by Kuhn in *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions* (1970, 1974). The shift is from viewing reality as a complex of interactions between material objects to viewing reality as energy configurations in dynamic change. In the context of this paradigm shift, some human powers of healing, learning, and communication which have seemed marginal in the old context now make sense and lead to new hypotheses. We are now led to wonder how personal our power is. Psychic experience often comes without the person experiencing it having consciously willed it. This may mean that we do not really possess our power. Perhaps, also, the time-transcending experiences people have mean that our powers of perception are not so bound to our bodily selves as we have assumed.

In this ferment of trans-disciplinary change, it has come to me in a series of insights that it is both possible and important to draw together three ideas. The first is that our power experience as we experience it inwardly is one with a universal energy field. The second is that there are at least three related,
but very different kinds of personal power, transformative, communicative, and instrumental. The third is that the alternation between the male and female energies within women is not only a subset of the transpersonal energy alternations but also is intimately related to women's experience of power.

Accordingly, the purpose of this dissertation is to discuss relationships between Jungian theory about women and three kinds of personal power - transformative, communicative, and instrumental - within the paradigm shift now in process. In that context, the dissertation will examine the implications for educational development of viewing persons as changing and effective configuration within a universal energy field.

D. THE PLAN OF THE DISSERTATION

As an author writing during the transition period of a paradigm shift, I realize that the burden of proof rests on me. Why won't our old ways of thinking about persons (including women) serve any more? What is the unexplained data, and what are the phenomena that are shaking the received view of reality? In the first chapter which forms the first of the three parts of the study, I intend to deal with some of the inputs from several disciplines that are being gathered to call for a shift in our concept of persons, and specifically for a shift in our ideas about how our individual experience of power is connected to universal energy systems.
The second major part of this study deals with other questions the reader may well ask. Even if this inner power source is a part of a universal continuum, why bother to think of kinds of power in a new way? What is gained by adding transformative and communicative power to the conventional instrumental power? Also, what justification is there for such a re-thinking? In the second through the fifth chapters, I intend first to describe each kind of power fully, and then to show how the Jungian psychology about women relates to it. Transformative power will be dealt with in two chapters to give space to introduce various concepts. The plan for describing each kind of power is first to define it, then to describe the source of it and the means of using it, and then to discuss some outcomes of that use. For each kind of power, I will also show briefly how I have based the concepts in the critical theory of Jürgen Habermas. His critical writings, ranging over the German philosophical tradition are the foundation for the three kinds of power I have identified.

For each of the three kinds of power, what reason do we have to believe that women's experience is different from men's? The Jungian material about the individuation process, and specifically about raising to consciousness the animus and the feminine archetypes in women has much to offer our understanding of women's experience of power. In the discussion of each kind of power, the last
section will treat the relationship of the psyche of women to it. Present followers of Jung have refined his thinking about women in subtle but productive ways, but the basic insights that Carl Jung had are still valid.

The third part of the dissertation will have to do with an androgynous concept of women's power arising in the Jungian tradition, and how that concept might influence training and development with women within complex organizations. In the sixth chapter, I will offer a model for the relationships between the kinds of power themselves, and attempt to show how the androgynous concept of women's power fits into these relationships. The endless alternation between the masculine and feminine energies within a woman is seen by Jungian psychology as her access to universal power working through her. That power is supported and adapted by the response to it of forces in her environments. The model shows each kind of power fostering the action of the other two types of power in the process of interaction between femininity and masculinity.

Finally, in chapter seven, I will draw out some implications for training and development with women who form part of the matrix of power relationships in a complex organization.

Seeing women as channels of three kinds of personal power standing in relation to a universal energy flux influences both the goals and the process of training in important ways. A woman becomes both more powerful and more limited or focused in the exercise of that power when the source and the purpose of power are
viewed from the perspective of the paradigm shift.

For instance, a woman can be helped to see how she can have great influence on goal-setting in her part of a complex organization by being made aware of her capacity for community-building. However, in order to gain that influence, she will also need to learn how to become centered in her own person, or how to deal fruitfully with her own animus.

In the view to be proposed here, the interactions between the three kinds of power both facilitate and constrain training and development interventions. We who are facilitators or "trainers" as the profession calls us, can plan to use the interactions between the three kinds of power and women's experience consciously in designing educational programs. Instrumental power, for example, has had a bad name in education, but women can use it to promote consensus-building and to help initiate and carry out personal transformation. These outcomes are also more likely if the trainer is aware of his or her own position in balancing among the kinds of power, and is engaged in her or his own individuation.

Thus, the three main parts of the dissertation are: (1) an exposition of the outlines of the paradigm shift in process with regard to power and persons, (2) a description of three kinds of power - instrumental, transformative, and communicative - and a relating of Jungian concepts of the female psyche to each, and (3) a discussion of the interrelationship of these elements and of their implications for training and development of women in complex organizations.
A. INTRODUCTION

This chapter would have been entirely unnecessary ten, or even five years ago. Even today, many sociologists, physicists, and political scientists may still wonder why it should be important to discuss aspects of physics, neurophysiology, and Eastern mysticism together (or at all!) in a paper on personal power. The first half of the reason is that it is now only becoming possible to gather inter-related information from a variety of these sources that bears directly on what the human potential may be. The second half of the reason is that data that are unexplainable in the accepted framework of these disciplines have been piling up for decades. Experiences and research results on telepathy, creative problem solving and synchronicities, for example, form an ever-enlarging mass of problematic material.

I would have been glad to avoid dealing with the intimations and discoveries of this gathering body of thought and evidence, but it seemed impossible to write clearly about the emerging view of human capabilities to be shown in the chapter on transformative
power without laying groundwork in this complex area. It is in the integration between disciplines that the need to think about reality in a new way shows most. Capra has quoted Heisenberg on this point:

It is probably true quite generally that in the history of human thinking the most fruitful developments frequently take place at those points where two different lines of thought meet. These lines may have their roots in quite different parts of human culture, in different times or different cultural environments or different religious traditions: hence if they actually meet, that is, if they are at least so much related to each other that a real interaction can take place, then one may hope that new and interesting developments may follow (Capra, 1975:xi).

Human beings consist of a hierarchy of energy systems which are also part of more comprehensive energy systems (Miller, 1978). Our tissue is formed of atomic and sub-atomic energy configurations which literally resonate with parallel structures in all parts of the known universe (Leonard, 1978). Some of our brain waives move at the same frequencies as the basic beat of the 10-mile layer of ionosphere that cushions the earth in space (Bentov, 1977). We are held in relation to this planet by a force of gravitation that exists in us just as it does in the planet itself (Capra,
The relation between our minds and our bodies is such that we can control the operation of a single muscle unit at will using biofeedback to learn the control (Green and Green, 1977), and can learn to slow or speed our heartbeat and lower or raise our blood pressure (Brown, 1974, 1977). Such powers lie in the realm between physics and metaphysics, and between psychology and parapsychology. In this decade we can finally admit them to our deliberations about personal power because rigorous scientific work in the last decade has moved back the edge of ignorance far enough for us to see where disciplines are coming together.

In this chapter, which forms Part I of the study, I will be discussing the contributions of a number of disciplines to the paradigm shift. I believe the progression will flow most naturally if I move from Physics to Psychology to Neuropsychology, and end with Paraphysiology.

B. PHYSICS

Fritjof Capra (1975), a theoretical physicist who is also a follower of Eastern mysticism, has spelled out clearly the parallels between the views of reality of several different clusters of high-energy particle physicists and those of thinkers in the Buddhist traditions, in The Tao of Physics. His two organizing themes are (1) "the unity of all things and events" (1975:159), and (2) the "intrinsically dynamic character of reality" (1975:159).
The concept of unity as it appears in modern physics transcends the Cartesian and Newtonian model of particles in a void in favor of Einstein's view which shows "that particles cannot be separated from the space that surrounds them" (Capra, 1975: 208). The empirical measurements that have substantiated Einstein's theory have not only confirmed the end of the mass-energy dichotomy, they have also forced physicists to abandon the discontinuity between the observer and the observed. We can only discuss the properties of an object in relation to our interaction with it.

As Heisenberg (also the originator of the indeterminacy principle) put it, "Natural science does not simply describe and explain nature; it is part of the interplay between nature and ourselves" (1958:107).

Heisenberg's indeterminacy principle also forwards the discussion in asserting that it is impossible to determine momentum and location simultaneously. The laboratory findings had defeated particle physicists until Heisenberg resolved them by declaring the paradox. No causal principle could be invoked to determine whether a particle would take the form of energy or matter in the measurement process. A physicist who held out against that resolution was David Bohm, a younger co-worker of Einstein's. In a book that combines theoretical physics with a theory of the historical development of physics, Causality and Chance in Modern Physics (1957), he affirms the basic reliance on lawfulness as a heuristic principle in physics. He also points out that at points of
frustration with data and data-gathering in the past, physicists have turned to chance to explain their results. The paradox established by the indeterminacy data, and David Bohm's own commitment to the lawfulness of both causality and chance seem to have precipitated his advancing a new model of reality. On page 22, following, I will have more to say about this holonomic model.

No identity can be established, as Capra is careful to keep in focus, between the experience of Eastern mystics and that of theoretical physicists, but their summaries of what they find are strikingly similar. Capra gives several dozens of paired quotes, of which the two following are typical.

"Isolated material particles are abstractions, their properties being definable and observable only through their interaction with other systems." Niels Bohr (1934, p. 57).

"The material object becomes . . . not a separate object on the background or in the environment of the rest of nature, but an indivisible part and even in a subtle way an expression of the unity of all that we see."

Aurobindo Ghose (1957, p. 993).

Niels Bohr, the originator of quantum theory, went to China in 1937 when his theory was quite fully developed. He was struck with the similarities between Taoism and the propositions that
unanswered questions raised in his laboratories had pressed him to formulate. The complementarity of the position of a particle and its momentum, and between its time and its energy, was central to the theory as he formulated it. Bohr believed that the yin and yang principle expressed what he had theorized. Later, when he was knighted in his native Denmark, he chose "Contraria sunt Complementaria" ("Contraries are Complementary") as his motto, and the yin-yang symbol as his shield. Although many other theoretical physicists have found this complementarity insight compelling, by no means all have.

On a slightly different tack, in the last chapter of his book, Capra discusses the work of Geoffrey Chew (1970) who has put forward the "bootstrap hypothesis", which claims that the universe is a dynamic web of inter-related events. He bases his theory entirely upon the observed "strong interactions" among sub-atomic "particles", and it is these interactions which he calls events. His assertion that there cannot be universal laws of nature, but only universal patterns of observation of natural phenomena, accords even better with the Eastern world view and especially with Taoism, than other earlier world views of physicists do. In Taoism, the idea of "li", or principle of organization, has it that all things have an organic and economical fit in which no part is fundamental, but all are essential. Although neither Niels Bohr nor Geoffrey Chew, as far as I know, has explicitly drawn any inferences about
the capacity of the human brain to decode or draw upon these energy fields, David Bohm has.

Einstein's co-worker, the physicist David Bohm, facing the paradoxes of research results in physics which I mentioned above (pp. 17-18), put forth a theory of the nature of reality which he believes has even greater power than that of Niels Bohr and others of the Copenhagen School. Bohm's theory, which he has been developing over at least the last two decades, was presented in a talk which was published in 1977. It proposes that the manifest reality we perceive is only a less subtle matter enfolded in a vast flux of unmanifest mass-energy.

The human brain, Bohm proposes, can decode into time and space representation those parts of the enfolded, or "implicate" reality with which it is most "closely" enfolded. Persons also have a reciprocal relationship with these parts. What man does can purify or pollute the part of the implicate or unmanifest order with which he is most closely enfolded. "Closeness" is not to be understood in Bohm's theory in terms of sequence, or of space-time at all, but rather in terms of degree of enfoldment (Bohm, 1978), a term of his own which will be explained more fully on page 24. With this summary of three physicists' views of the "unity of all things . . ." (Capra, 1975:159), we now turn to Capra's second organizing theme.

Capra's second area of parallel understanding between mysticism and physics, "the intrinsically dynamic character of
reality" (1975:159), is equally alien to the usual thinking of a
twentieth-century American schooled to think of space as experienced
in relation to the passage of time. We just know that it takes some
time to go a distance, no matter how small! It is well-nigh impos-
sible to extricate our minds adequately from our customary ways of
perceiving to absorb either Einstein's physics of space interpenetra-
ted by time, or the parallel timeless experience of enlightenment.
Capra locates space and time in the perceivers' minds:

Modern physics has confirmed most dramatically
one of the basic ideas of Eastern mysticism;
that all the concepts we use to describe nature
are limited, that they are not features of rea-
ality, as we tend to believe, but creations of
the mind; parts of the map, not of the territory
(op. cit.: 147).

Similarly, D.T. Suzuki (1968) in his work on Mahayana
Buddhism, affirms that "the past and the future are both rolled up
in this present moment of illumination, and this present moment is
not something standing still with all its contents, for it ceaseless-
ly moves on" (1968:149).

We westerners believe we understand ceaselessly moving on,
because of our fascination with progress, but the core of the Buddhist
thought in the Suzuki quote is the presence of all time in the imme-
diate moment, a notion our perception of reality makes very difficult
to apprehend. Dualism is fundamental for westerners, as Harvey Cox shows in his book *Turning East* (1977). He is writing about the current rush of Americans to experience the Eastern meditation traditions. For him, the dualism is an indispensible foundation for the separation between God and Man that makes love between us possible.

Although Bohm is a westerner (an Englishman), he offers an alternative "general imaginative conception" (1977:37), a unitary concept of reality. In explaining it, he asks his readers to envision an insoluble ink droplet placed in a viscous medium and swirled "n" times. The droplet would be spun out to an invisible thread, but if there were no turbulence, it could be regathered and become visible again if the swirl were reversed. His terms are that it is "explicate" (visible and tangible), then becomes "implicate" as it is distributed; then is explicated against as it is coalesced. If several droplets are implicated and then explicated as the viscous medium is itself moved, and this is done so rapidly that we do not distinguish the separate reappearances, it will appear that the droplets move across the medium. The same imaginative conception makes it plausible for effects to occur at what we perceive to be a distance. The same reasoning holds whether we are seeing with the naked eye, or with prosthetic visual devices like eyeglasses or neutron microscopes.
Bohm's conceptualization provides a framework for resolving the paradox enunciated by the Heisenberg principle (see p. 19-20). Quanta are neither localized particles nor "fields extended through space and undergoing wave motion" (1977:39), but are both, says the paradox. I think Bohm would claim they are probably neither. They are explicate manifestations of two different implicate orders. As particles they are one order explicate, or "manifest"; as waves they are a different order explicate. He says, "the notion of implicate order imaginatively captures the essence of this new situation [quantum mechanics] in physics" (loc. cit.). As with the ink droplets, quanta also have a "movement in which the results [which are] visible in some regions originate in and depend upon the whole fluid in an inseparable way" (1977:39).

To show how information can be encoded holistically on energy beams, Bohm introduces the idea of the hologram and extends it to what he calls the holomovement. A photographic hologram is formed by recording the combined result of two halves of a split beam of coherent light (a laser), one of which is reflected from an object to a photographic plate. The other, a reference beam, is sent directly to the plate. The interference pattern between the two is captured on the plate. The image is visually incomprehensible until seen in the same light conditions under which it was produced when it appears as if three dimensional. That is, he says, it is "implicate" until it is made "explicate" again.
Photographic holograms have another feature that is important for the present discussion, though. It is that every region of the holographic image contains all the information of the whole image. For example, if you cut or break a hologram into parts, you still see the whole picture. It gets fuzzy -- "resolution" is lost -- as you cut it into smaller parts, but the whole picture is still there.

With a hologram, Bohm continues, "light is taken as the particular movement that is involved in the folding and enfolding of a particular structure, but sound, or electron beams", or any other "movement" or pulse, which "like light, is able to carry a whole content in each region or part, can carry information . . . The totality of all such possibilities, known and unknown", he writes, "I shall call the holomovement" (1977:40, emphasis his.). The holomovement is in its essence, undivided, although particular manifestations have a certain autonomy, and can be studied separately. Since their fundamental order is "holonomy, i.e., the law of the whole" (1977:40), however, they cannot be understood, or even accounted for apart from the holomovement, within which they subsist. The holomovement is the totality of implicate orders, and only one manifestation can be explicate at once, since the others continue at a different degree, "m n", of implication. This conceptualization, he adds, affects our general world view and changes it by having the implicate order as primary, and the explicate as secondary. Bohm believes that our notions about the nature of
mind will be included in the shift. Karl Pribram, the Stanford neuropsychologist, has shown how data obtained in his laboratories can be explained effectively by the general imaginative conceptualization Bohm proposes (1971).

Theories as intricate as the one we have just been considering may seem to have little relevance to the daily experience of power by law westerners not immersed in particle physics or the higher reaches of mystical meditation. Before considering the relevance of Bohm's view to recent brain function research, it may be useful to bridge closer to mundane experience, using the work of Bentov (1977) and Leonard (1974, 1978). As we consider their ideas, it may be possible to see how the change in world view Bohm offers can help to explain previously perplexing evidence about how insight occurs.

Itzhak Bentov was a medical equipment inventor (d. 1979) who developed his ideas in interaction with medical colleagues and his associates in engineering. George Leonard, author also of Education and Ecstasy, has just completed his term as president of the Association for Humanistic Psychology. Both Bentov and Leonard are concerned with the extension of consciousness beyond limits which are commonly considered usual. Both also describe experiences of this extension which ordinary people either become aware of spontaneously or can notice by having their attention directed to them. At first thought, the experiences they describe are closer to insight than high energy physics is, although the paradigm shift lessens the intellectual and "physical" distances
among them. Earlier in the history of thought, the position Bentov and Leonard take has been called "the perennial philosophy" because it has reasserted in many eras its particular view of the relationship between the human mind and the nature of reality. For example, Bentov and Leonard (and other writers to be discussed) write of personal power fields (Leonard, 1974), altered consciousness with regard to time (Bentov, 1977) and remote-viewing (Leonard, 1978), to mention but three related areas of experience.

The perennial philosophy they affirm has had a fairly recently summary in a book of that title by Aldous Huxley (1945), and in two more recent ones by Gowan (1975, 1980). Essentially, the perennial philosophy is that the basic stuff of the universe is a flux of spirit ("noumenon", Gowan, 1975), and the familiar physical manifestations, including quanta, are illusion. This view has been advanced in western thought by Pythagoras, Plotinus, the Gnostics, the Hermetic philosophers, St. John of the Cross, Meister Eckhart, Leibnitz, the Hassidim, and William James, to name only a few (Gowan, 1975). It is now gaining adherents, not only among the theoretical physicists (if we identify energy with spirit), but also among brain researchers, psychologists, and everyday people.

At a symposium, "Consciousness and the Cosmos", coordinated by John Welwood (1978), both Capra and Pribram called this gradual swing to a holonomic model of the universe a paradigm shift. Bentov is also involved in the paradigm shift. He uses the
classification of mass/energy that is familiar to physicists to explain his understanding (which participates in the paradigm shift) of the decoding process carried out by the human brain. The classification is:

Strong interactions - between protons and neutrons in atomic nuclei

Weak interactions - between leptons also within atomic nuclei

Electromagnetic interactions - atoms and molecules (and in "radio" waves, although Capra does not specify them because of the context in which he is giving the classification).

Gravitational interactions - between masses of all sizes (Capra, 1975:215).

I am including this classification because much of the reluctance hard scientists display to accepting the transfer of information to awareness from the "physical world" to the mental arises in the sharp distinctions physics makes between the force levels in the classification, and by corollary, the wave lengths of these interactions. Human beings are not supposed to be able to decode information encoded on radio waves, because brain waves operate at different frequencies from those "decoded" by radio receivers.
Bentov (1977), however, takes these distinctions into account and asserts that since humans are composed of sub-systems having all of the levels in the classic classification Capra gives, they can readily be influenced by information coded in any of them. Specifically, he observes that the brain wave frequencies associated with meditation and reverie are the same as those of the natural Schumann waves\(^1\) that resonate in the earth's ionosphere (the first ten miles up from the earth's surface). These waves are relatively "slow" (7.8 Hertz) and are influenced by the relatively weak force of gravitation. Thus, they follow the curve of the earth's surface; they also pass through "material" obstacles. Bentov theorizes that individuals may have access to the thinking of any other individual operating at that frequency. People would become aware of these thoughts as insights. Most people, clinical neurophysiologists say, have musing moments when they produce such rhythms naturally; experienced meditators can induce them at will (Brown, 1974).

Leonard (1978) adds one more idea in the process of passing on his understanding of the holomovement construct. Leonard speaks of the, not 2, not 3, but "n" dimensional probability wave which is used to describe the functions of quanta. The mind, he affirms, also operates in "n" dimensional space. David Bohm confirms this

\(^1\)Leonard (1978) supplied the name of the waves.
conception in a 1979 presentation. Leonard makes his own statement of the work of the functional interrelationship between mind process and universal process:

... it is a large jump, but not an impossible one, to conceive the events of the universe as being actually made up of interference patterns of probability waves. If you can come this far, the rest is easy: In such a universe, information about the whole of it is available at every point. As with the photographic hologram, the information in the smaller fragments may be fuzzy, poorly resolved. But it is there.

The implications of such a formulation are intriguing. To take it back home, you can look to your own body and say that each subatomic particle within you is in touch with all that is. The rhythmic emptiness we have discovered deep within the proton is in some way a 'model' of the entire universe -- and so are the atoms, the molecules, cells, integrated systems of cells, organs, and organ systems (cardiovascular, nervous, lymphatic, digestive, and so on), and finally the whole being, the living, breathing, perceiving, conceptualizing person" (1978:80-81).
Thus Leonard summarizes his presentation of the thinking of Karl Pribram, and gets ready to go on to the dialogues that Bohm has been taking part in. Leonard himself has led energy workshops with 20,000 people in various parts of the United States in conjunction with his aikido master, illustrating in experience the theory he has discussed in his books (1974, 1978).

C. PSYCHOLOGY

Physics is having more to say about the working of the mind than ever before. It perhaps comes as no surprise, then, to discover that psychology is trying to validate in experience some of the hypotheses that are loosely related to physics. One group among many such attempts were the remote-viewing experiments conducted with particular care by the Stanford Research Institute and reported in the March 1976 Proceedings of the Institute of Electrical and Electronic Engineers (Puthoff and Targ, 1976).

The objective of the experiments was to gain data on the extent to which persons can perceive accurately at distances and through obstacles which would preclude their seeing by ordinary means. The viewing individual stayed with one investigator at the Stanford Research Institute (SRI), while the person "viewing" traveled with another investigator to a distant site. The "viewer" then told the investigator what he or she "saw". These reports were then submitted to independent judges who determined how accurate they were.
Details of the rigid controls arranged at the SRI for these experiments include randomly selected target sites kept in random order in sealed envelopes by a Senior SRI officer otherwise external to the project; an electronically shielded room for "viewing" by the subjects who did not travel; supervision of travel to the site by those who did travel by an Institute security guard, and so on.

The subjects have achieved a degree of accuracy in viewing which is significantly above chance\(^2\), although Leonard notes, the resolution is a bit fuzzy. Later, in his discussion of holograms, he draws attention to their characteristic loss of resolution as they are cut up into smaller and smaller pieces. In common with Pribram and Bohm (1979), he speculates that it is an appropriate analogy to suggest that the human brain is a fragment of the universal hologram. Using Bohm's terminology, we might say that the constantly shifting pattern-formation of the human brain is a fragment of the universal holomovement.

The capacity of the subjects in the Stanford Research Institute experiments to do remote-viewing is not limited to known psychics, persons who are aware of their paranormal power. Puthoff and Targ (1976) who conducted the experiments, also controlled for that variable. Half the participants were ordinary people, who had no previous intimations of being psychic. In any case, images came to both sets of subjects by some means other than those we have usually considered plausible, and those means accord very well with

\(^2\)Odds against such things happening by chance were in some cases 29,000 or 180,000 to one.
the conceptual framework provided by modern high-energy physics, and the belief system of eastern mysticism.

Fritjof Capra writes in the preface to *The Tao of Physics* (1971) of the experience which led him to write the book. It is an additional psychological statement of the far reaches of human experience.

I was sitting by the ocean one late summer afternoon, watching the waves rolling in and feeling the rhythm of my breathing, when I suddenly became aware of my whole environment as being engaged in a gigantic cosmic dance. Being a physicist, I knew that the sand, rocks, water, and air around me were made of vibrating molecules and atoms, and that these consisted of particles which interacted with one another by creating and destroying other particles. I knew also that the earth's atmosphere was continually bombarded by showers of 'cosmic rays', particles of high energy undergoing multiple collisions as they penetrated the air. All this was familiar to me from my research in high-energy physics, but until that moment, I had only experienced it through graphs, diagrams, and mathematical theories. As I sat on that beach my former experiences came to life; I 'saw' cascades of energy coming down from outer space
in which particles were created and destroyed in rhythmic pulses; I 'saw' the atoms of the elements and those of my body participating in this cosmic dance of energy; I felt its rhythm and I 'heard" its sound, and at that moment I knew that this was the Dance of Shiva, the Lord of Dancers worshipped by the Hindus (1975:xv).

Capra's background as head of the high-energy physics lab at Berkeley establishes him as a western man of unquestionable academic status, but as his belief system changed in response to his participation in the disciplines of Buddhism, it became possible for him to experience reality in a new way. Although he did not stop his work in theoretical physics at Berkeley, he did make a commitment to lecture and write explaining his new level of understanding. Astronaut Ed Mitchell had an experience that was apparently just as compelling to him. His belief system was Christianity. His experience came as he looked toward the fragile, beautiful planet Earth from its moon (Craig, 1980).

Capra and Mitchell may be typical of a much larger number of persons rather like themselves in some demographic variables, as reported in a study by Greely and McCready (1974). They made a survey of the ultimate values of 1,500 adults. They included this question: "have you ever had the feeling of being very close to a
powerful spiritual force that seemed to lift you out of yourself, an experience that can best be characterized by the word ecstasy?"

They prepared a checklist response for the question based on a survey of the literature of mysticism and on answers given on two pilot pre-runs of the survey. Frequency and intensity scales for such experiences and the Bradburn Psychological Well-Being Scale were also included in the instrument.

About 600 people (40% of the 1,500 sampled) reported having had such an experience at least once; 300 people (20%) reported several times, and 75 people (5%) reported having often had an experience they would describe as ecstasy. Two thirds (50) of the latter group reported it at the top of the seven point intensity scale. Responses to the qualitative options offered on the checklist clustered around "I couldn't possibly describe it", "the sensation that my personality had been taken over by something much more powerful than I am", "a sense of a new life or living in a new world", and "a sense I was being bathed in light" (Green and Green, 1977:188).

The demographics revealed those most likely to report such experiences to be college-educated, to have incomes over $10,000 (in 1972), and to be psychologically healthy. As a matter of fact, the correlation between frequent ecstatic experience and psychological well-being was 0.40, the highest correlation ever reported with any variable, according to Professor Norman Bradburn,
originator of the scale. When effects of education, sex, age and race were statistically removed, the correlation was reduced . . . to 0.39.

This research was reported in the book by Elmer and Alyce Green (1977) who were brought to the Menninger Foundation by Gardner Murphy to establish a biofeedback laboratory. Some of their work will fit naturally into the part of this paper that has to do with the means of exercising transformative power (pp. 72 ff.), but some of what they report belongs here. Alyce Green's account of the responses of Greely and McCready's professional colleagues and of funding agencies shows some of the sanctions by which a prevailing paradigm is enforced:

Greely and McCready were dismayed when their professional colleagues dismissed their findings with abrupt certainty, saying, "Those people can't be having religious experiences."

They responded, "Maybe not, but they're having something; and whatever . . . it is they are having, it correlates with mental health at a very high level. If we had found any other correlate, the mental health establishment would be knocking down our doors demanding to know more. If anything else but 'ecstasy' were that good for you, it would sell as if
it wouldn't be on the market next year . . .
We thought the funding agencies responsible
for mental health research would be intrigued
by the . . . correlation we had discovered be­
tween ecstasy and mental health. It turned
out they simply didn't believe us". (Green and
Green, 1977:188).
Even if we choose to believe the testimony of individuals and the
outcomes of the research summarizing them, we are still left with
the question, "How can this be?" If remote viewing and ecstasy are
genuine, then by what processes of human potential do they take
place? The answers are only beginning to come in, as research is
undertaken within the new paradigm that envisions a unified energy
flux as the prime reality in the universe.

Bohm, Capra, and Pribram are physical scientists whose reputa­tions within the old paradigm accord them the leadership within the new, but other substantial scientists are joining them in sug­gesting that as humans, we have direct connections to a unity and an energy in the cosmos that affects us with a cognitive and affective ecstasy.

D. NEUROPSYCHOLOGY

Among the scientists who have joined Capra and Bohm, the theoretical physicists, are Pelletier and Murphy, conventional psychologists; Walsh and Bugenthal, psychiatrists; and Goleman,
Welwood, and Kornfield meditation psychologists. Karl Pribram stands somewhere in the middle of the range from hard to soft science and his rigorous work in the field of neuropsychology spans three decades now. The brain laterality work of the Bogens (1969), Sperry (1973), and Gazzaniga (1965) and Levy-Agriesti (1968) and others is also relevant, although they have been less explicit in forwarding the paradigm shift. The differential contribution of the right and left hemispheres of the brain bears directly on the phenomenon of insight and will be discussed in the chapter on transformative power.

A paradigm shift poses problems of credibility to everyone at some level, so it is worthwhile to dwell on the stature and seriousness of at least one leader, in addition to letting the ideas speak for themselves. Karl Pribram's often-cited book Languages of the Brain (1971) is his reporting of his own and others' research results, and a preliminary statement of the concept of the holographic brain. It is characterized both by empirical rigor, and by the constant re-organizing of his understanding as perplexing results called for new hypotheses. His epilogue charts the changes, chapter by chapter. Woven into the epilogue are the personal interactions with Luria, Anokhin, and many others with whom he had clarified and extended his vision of what he and they were doing in their laboratories. Eccles has been seen by some as an arch opponent of Pribram's, but throughout the book (1971) Pribram cites with appreciation the productive theorizing and inspired laboratory work.
Eccles has contributed. Also, no chapter is without a small fillip of fun that lets the reader see a humorous angle to an otherwise weighty subject.

Karl Pribram's life experience has prepared him to speak with authority and precision on the workings of the brain. He began his career by becoming a Board-Certified Neurosurgeon. During the time he practiced neurosurgery, and following it, he was drawn by a series of research problems to work in the Yerkes Laboratory of Primate Biology, where he succeeded Karl Lashley as director. He then moved to Yale, where he continued his pioneering studies of the limbic system. During that period, and in the twenty years following it, while he has worked at Stanford University, his work has helped to launch the research specialty of neuropsychology.

In describing the operation of memory registration and recall, he summarizes work in his own laboratories and thinking that went on in interaction with other laboratories (1971, 1979). He affirms a two-process mechanism of brain function on which his research has increasingly been founded. The two processes are (1) the well-accepted build-up and discharge of electrical potentials from synaptic knobs to dendrites or cell bodies, and (2) the more-recently-conceived graded slow potential junctional microstructures which create wave fronts in the synaptic clefts. The graded slow-potential wave fronts are a refinement of the earlier idea that brain waves moved generally across the surface of the cortex. The graded potentials
"compute" the chemical and electrical inputs both within the nerve fiber and in the synapse to encode information (Pribram, 1971:17-18).

The improvements that the two process model adds to the logic of brain process (1971: Ch.5) are three. First, the two-process model provides for a specific kind of physiology for re-gathering and transferring previously encoded information and combining it with fresh percepts. An example would be recognizing a long-forgotten acquaintance in a foreign railroad station. The new perception finds the person older, but still having some of the image that had been tucked away years ago and labeled by name in another context.

Second, the model takes account of the response of nerve cells to their biochemical surroundings. An example of this would be stepped-up and more effective choice-making between several alternatives when in the midst of a dynamic emergency. Complex effects related to adrenalin production facilitate the process.

Third, the model allows for modifying images by inputs from adaptation and habituation. An example would be the gradual modification of our response to a loud noise if it is repeated, from being shocked to scarcely noticing it. The residents of New York City near the route of the Third Avenue elevated train who learned to sleep through the violent noisiness of the passing train are an illustration. Of course, many of them reported waking up uneasy if one failed to come through on schedule, showing a reverse effect.
A further discussion of the model Pribram uses may be useful at this point, because it will lead directly into the articulation of his thinking with Bohm's. The discussion which follows is taken from *Languages of the Brain* (1971:95-96), where he gives his summary of the two-process model.

When a stimulus, either from the world-within, or from the world-out-there enters the nervous system, it goes through two reciprocally related processes (See Figure 1). The first is the "test" (T), a state "composed of junctional (synaptic and dendritic) potentials". In this part of the logic, there is an excitation or inhibition effect on surrounding nerves which heightens the contrast of the impulse. Thinking of the impulse as a wave, rather than a particle, is useful here because of the spreading over (or "superposition") onto neighboring elements that also occurs. (A particle would not show this effect). This testing compares the input to existing states.

The second process is an "operation: (O) on the resulting state, "by nerve impulses generated by receptors (elsewhere in the body) or by the central nervous system". Through it, the central nervous system affects the original inputs by contrast enhancement in the bias part, for instance. In sequence, the operation is followed by another test (T) before the impulse "exist" (E). Pribram offers this TOTE model as a revision of the classic reflex arc originated by Sherrington.
Fig. 5-9. The TOTE servomechanism modified to include feedforward. Note the parallel processing feature of the revised TOTE.

Figure 1

The TOTE Model
(Pribram 1971: 94)
Sherrington had avoided making an absolute pronouncement, in proposing the reflex arc:

A simple reflex is probably a purely abstract conception, because all parts of the nervous system are connected together and no part of it is probably ever capable of reaction without affecting and being affected by various other parts, and it is a system certainly never absolutely at rest. But the simple reflex is a convenient, if not a probable fiction (1941:7).

Pribram continues the tradition of openness:

... The success of his [Sherrington's] explanations made the reflex arc an extremely useful fiction. The TOTE diagram is also a fiction when applied to neurobehavioral analysis. It is a somewhat higher-order fiction than the reflex arc -- the reflex arc is the limiting case of a servo (a feedback mechanism) in which feedback can be accomplished only via the organism's environment and in which the operation performed is insensitive even to this feedback, i.e., the effect, once initiated, runs itself off to a predetermined state. The usefulness of a higher-order fiction must lie in its ability to handle
a larger range of facts. The TOTE concept was brought to bear for just this reason: the reflex arc cannot encompass the central control of receptor mechanisms... yet, it is important to bear in mind that the neurobehavioral TOTE, just as the reflex arc, is but a fiction and should be supplanted or supplemented whenever it is found restrictive rather than useful (1971:94).

While Pribram honors Sherrington's "useful fiction", he also moves beyond it. Sherrington made a famous poetic vision of brain functioning which demonstrates the need for one of the improvements afforded by Pribram's two process mode. The vision suggests that we let our fancy run and imagine a great knot of nodes flashing, and trains of light-points running. The fantasy begins with the brain in a sleeping state, and we see only the pulsing control it exercises over the heart. But then:

... Should we continue to watch the scheme we should observe after a time an impressive change which suddenly accrues... The brain is waking and with it the mind is returning. It is as if the Milky Way entered upon some cosmic dance. Swiftly the head mass becomes an enchanted loom where millions of flashing
shuttles weave a dissolving pattern, always
a meaningful pattern though never an abiding
one; a shifting harmony of subpatterns (1941:
225).

Sherrington's decades had not provided the technology to
refine his vision, but Pribram's have. Now it has been possible
for Pribram to locate the weaving of the pattern in the wave inter­
ferences of graded slow potential microstructures in the synaptic
junctions, rather than having to endure the vagueness of the genera­
lized brain waves. He believes that it is, however, the commitment
to endless measuring and endless re-conceptualization that makes such
advances possible (Bohm and Pribram et al., 1979). I think it was
not until scientists progressed through the two-process model and the
concept of gathering of images through the multiple wave interference
patterns in the synaptic clefts that it became possible to advance
the hypothesis that interference patterns in the brain may gather
images from the larger systems in which the human being is embedded.

In order to show how that progression was followed through,
I will need to discuss a few more steps in Pribram's thinking. He
had discovered that the synaptic potentials were processed in the
brain in a way that could be described mathematically by the Fourier
transforms, which had been developed by the originator of holography.
"Fourier transforms . . . [are] a means of breaking up a [continuously
oscillating wave] into its constituent components and, conversely, a
means of generating a compound wave from its components" (Pelle-tier, 1978:117-8). Since they work both ways, they can describe processes which encode and then decode later. Seeing such waves as holograms has seemed to be an elegant and satisfying way of theorizing about the process of interpreting such waves as they take place three-dimensionally in the brain. Given the anatomical constraints of neural structure and the demand for functional labili-

ity posed by the need to make quick changes in activity in response to simultaneous changes in many potentials, the holographic model seemed to have considerable explanatory power.

The feature of the hologram that all parts have the whole image encoded, has also helped to explain a paradoxical fact. Pri-

bram and others found that although specific parts of the brain had clearly been identified with certain kinds of functioning, more than 80% of the brain tissue could be cut out, ablated, without destroying an organism's capacity to remember. If all the images are encoded everywhere in the brain, then it is less surprising that they can still be recovered when large parts of the brain have been ablated. The capacity of human beings to rise above massive trauma has always been a vivid example of one kind of human potential, but it is by the laying in of meticulous laboratory work that such intuitive break-

throughouts can be undergirded and groundwork laid for new intuition.

One main articulation between Pribram's thinking and Bohm's comes at this point. An article based on a conversation between Pribram and Daniel Goleman describes Pribram's understandings further,
and explains how they fit with Bohm's to make the next hypothesis possible. Pribram restates some of what I have discussed from Languages of the Brain (1971), and then goes on to explore some possible implications.

Individual cells act as frequency analyzers for incoming stimuli. For example, for visual stimuli, he says, single cells or patches of cells respond to a narrow band of wave lengths. Then:

... In each patch, the activity of the cells creates a wave front; I believe that the interaction of these wave fronts is what you experience. You get the total pattern all woven together as a unified piece by the time you experience it (1979:80).

These inputs are registered in the brain chemically on macro-molecules, Pribram suggests. Then when the appropriate stimulus is presented to recover the image, the brain organizes the individual component forms into a whole memory by means of calling up and forming holographic interference patterns. This formation of the memory can only happen if the first stages of image processing are already available in the frequency domain, as in the formation of a hologram. Pribram prefers to call the process "image processing" because it implies a more holistic mechanism than "information processing" does.

Pribram then goes on to say that Bohm is coming at the problem in the same way he is, finding that wave forms interact to create and destroy particles. These wave forms may compose hologram-like
organizations that Bohm calls the implicate order. Pribram expresses his own belief, held in common with Bohm, that behind what is now known there is a "domain of constraints" that "will provide a consistent, non-statistical basis for the apparently haphazard comings and goings of individual particles" (1979:83). This belief appears to be in harmony with the theory of knowledge proposed by Habermas (see Chapter 4, Introduction).

E. PARAPSYCHOLOGY

Here Pribram and Bohm, the hard scientists, step into a science that has been an instigator of the paradigm shift, parapsychology. Pribram tells Goleman in the 1979 article that the mystics seem to have tapped the reality of the implicate order through "attention". By attention he means that focused mental discipline that is called meditation. The capacity to perceive in the implicate order would provide an understandable context for synchronicities. An example of a synchronicity is the one that occurred during an imagery study being conducted by Elmer and Alyce Green. In it, a student had an image of his roommate telling him as he came in the door for lunch that he (the student) had received a letter from the graduate school that he wanted, and that he had been accepted. The student, in the Green's lab, was annoyed at what he took to be his roommate's opening his mail, broke off the session, and went home for lunch. His roommate greeted him exactly as he had "seen" him.

\[3\] The objective of the study was to examine imagery that came to mind when subjects were generating theta brain waves, in the 4 through 7 Hertz frequencies. These are the next set slower than alpha waves, 8-14 Hz.
in the hypnagogic imagery of the session. The roommate responded
to the student's annoyance by pointing out that he hadn't actually
opened the letter, but had just peeked in through the plastic
window in the front.

Several of the other students involved in the study reported
synchronicities, but they also reported examples of better daily
functioning. Among the examples the Greens gave are unusual clari-
ty on exams, resolution of interpersonal problems, and improved
ability to get organized and stay organized in daily life (Green
and Green, 1977).

Louisa Rhine, perhaps the best-known parapsychology research-
er, has compiled over 15,000 validated experiences of psychic (psi)
phenomena, such as synchronicities, precognition, and psychokinesis.
The reports range from the mundane to the extraordinary. A fairly
dramatic one was reported by a young woman, and she believed it saved
her parents' lives. She cancelled her plans to go to a funeral that
she had gotten off work to attend, because she felt drawn to go to
her mother. When she got home, she had a hunch that she should get
her parents out of the living room, where they were calmly sitting.
She talked them into having a snack with her in the kitchen. As they
sat talking, a car crashed through the front wall of the house and
demolished the chairs her parents had been sitting in (Bartlett,
1974:84).
Resistance to data that do not fit the old paradigm shows at many levels of scientific process, as we saw in the reception given the Greely and McCready research on mystical experience. Another level at which such resistance appears is an organizational one. The Parapsychological Association was not finally accepted as a member of the American Association for the Advancement of Science until 1969. The climate of credibility for the phenomena which are the objects of its research was poor, even then. Probably the climate is not good today, but the data being reported from such places as the Langley-Porter Neuropsychiatric Institute at the University of California, Berkeley; The Maimonedes Dream Laboratory in Brooklyn, New York; and the American Society for Psychical Research, also in New York, continue to pile up. The old paradigm does not incorporate them, and they are relevant to this paper because they call for a revision in our concept of personal power. The revision places a more appropriate emphasis on those kinds of personal power that women already have.

Pribram believes that the model offered by Bohm gives an imaginative construct that makes it possible to understand some of the data that had to be left out of "science" before. Pribram says that the way the holographic model serves as a conceptual framework for the imaging process in the brain provides a model for our access to the implicate orders. In order to affirm the model, however, we have to imaginatively set aside the notions of space, time, and
causality that serve us so well in the realms of our experience covered by Newtonian physics. It is only necessary to set aside those forms of the mind in the band of our experience covered by Newtonian physics, not all space, time, and causality.

Other realms are both transcendent and immanent. That is, they both go beyond the data of our usual senses and are "in hand" (im-manent). We can read out the data we access in implicate orders in space-time co-ordinates or in others which may be more appropriate for the experience. Pribram tries to show how this may be in his conversation with Daniel Goleman. He suggests that on an electroencephalogram (EEG) tape, one axis has to do with the spectrum through which the needle swings, and the other with the "power, or amount of activity in its density at each node in the spectrum" (1979:84). Goleman asks whether density isn't an attribute in space, and Pribram rejoins, "Fine, if there is space!" and adds that space is not a necessary way of looking at reality. The dialogue that follows between them is included here to show their efforts to clarify the concept.

Goleman: So it's possible to translate time-space phenomena into other domains in which the organizing principles are not interims of time or space, repackaging information in a new way.

Pribram: Yes. In the frequency domain, time and space become collapsed. In a sense,
everything is happening all at once, syn-
chronously. But one can read out what is
happening into a variety of coordinates
of which space and time are the most help-
ful in bringing us into the ordinary domain
of appearances.
Goleman: Is there any way an ordinary
person's brain can jump into such a timeless
and spaceless domain?
Pribram: It does it all the time. I've
been talking to you for two hours, and I
didn't have any of the material we discussed
organized in time or space. It was holographi-
cally organized, and I've been reading it out
of my brain. Like printout from a computer
memory. My memory is organized along other
dimensions than time and space -- though
space and time tags may be attached to
particular memories.
Goleman: Even so, the paranormal demands
much more than our ordinary access to the
implicate order.
Pribram: While we don't know what the
mechanisms for a leap to the paranormal might
be, for the first time we have to suspend our
disbelief in such phenomena because there is now a scientific base that allows understanding. Perhaps if we could discover the rules for "tuning in" on the holographic implicate domain, we could come to some agreement as to what constitutes normal and paranormal, and even some deeper understanding of the implicate order of the universe.

We all could perhaps then leap, occasionally, into the timeless and spaceless domain (1979:84).

Mind-stretching though this dialogue is, it shows two responsible scientists attempting to ground their new understandings in perceptions that are familiar. Daniel Goleman is drawing Karl Pribram out on the transpersonal potential of human beings and getting him to articulate a point of view that Goleman himself has expressed in parallel ways elsewhere (Goleman, 1977). In essence, the point is that as we humans enter transpersonal realms of experience, in ordinary or extraordinary ways, we may transcend time, space, or both, in what we perceive. The word Pribram uses is paranormal, but he calls for a redefinition of it in relation to "normal". He does not suggest how we may gain access to what we now consider paranormal. Goleman (1977) does not imply that such access is more than normal, although he does imply that it is not common. Goleman
discussed various forms of meditative practice (1977) as entry disciplines.

F. SUMMARY

In closing this chapter I would like to make a conservative summary of the working hypotheses that have emerged in the paradigm shift. In chapter 2, on transformative power, I will be building on the following propositions:

1. The brain participates in bringing to consciousness images (or "information" or "stimuli") which result both from the world-out-there and from the world-within. At the least venturesome level, most people would agree that our brains deliver information both about the green apple tree (out there) and the stomach ache (within). I intend this proposition to refer to more venturesome claims, however. I mean, for example, that our brains decode such things as material encoded on theta frequency waves (7.8 Hz.) in the ionosphere (out there) to enable psi phenomena such as remote-viewing. I also intend the proposition to refer to the decoding into consciousness of universal archetypal images from our unconscious (within).

2. It is probable that images from the universal holomovement are part of what our minds can hold in consciousness. By this I mean that our brains can probably decode directly those interference patterns in the part of the universal holomovement with which we are closely "implicated". An example would be our capacity to sense
impending or long-past events that have special relevance or motivating power for us.

3. Consciousness of images appearing during times when we are producing alpha and theta frequency brain waves may provide life-enhancing insights. The rapid-eye-movement phases of sleep when we are dreaming are a well-established example of such awareness. Meditation is another. Integrating these experiences into conscious life through thoughtful consideration and action activates transformative power, as we shall see in chapter 2.

While none of these propositions has been "proven" by any means, present experiments and experience are rendering all three of them more plausible than ever before. We now have reason to suspend disbelief at least long enough to consider the action of transformative power.
CHAPTER TWO

TRANSFORMATIVE POWER I

A. INTRODUCTION

We create our own reality and it begins within. Our experience of reality then binds or frees our exercise of power. The Jungian concept of individuation, and humanistic and transpersonal psychology are among the models that we can use to mold a new life experience. When old "realities" change, in meditation, in envisioning, in systematic dialogue, and in other disciplines, new behaviors and feelings will appear. This restructuring of our belief system is clearly far more complex than a mere conscious willing to do so. The inner dialogue gradually involves all aspects of our being when it is fully productive. Hutschnecker (1951), an early physician writer on the mind-body effect, has said that if will and imagination are in conflict, he would place his bet on imagination every time. Both will and imagination, however, are grounded in a person's system of beliefs. For transformative power to work, a first step is a shift in belief. It is this freeing shift of the personal belief system that Habermas is concerned with in the part of his critical theory on works having to do with the emancipatory interest.
McCarthy (1978) points out that in the technical and practical interests (having to do with instrumental and communicative power), Habermas could discuss "generally accepted modes of inquiry" (1978:75). In dealing with the emancipatory interest (having to do with transformative power) he was reaching beyond the generally accepted. He based his work in this arena on Marx' and Freud's writing, but he felt neither of them had developed a mode of inquiry that was adequate to deal with the thrust for autonomy, the emancipatory interest. The process Marx urged is not relevant here because he focused on social dimensions, but Habermas' reasons for rejecting Freud's theory of inquiry in the working of the psychoanalytic method will concern us here.

Habermas himself says (1971:214) that he addressed Freud's psychoanalytic theory to add the dimension of self-reflection to the process of meaning making. However, he considers Freud to be less compelling as a theory-of-inquiry builder than he was as a method-builder. Habermas concludes that the promise of a "mode of philosophical inquiry appropriate to the emancipatory interest" (1971:75) offered by Freud's theory of inquiry in psychoanalysis is unrealized. The reason, in the end, is that Freud could not allow to others that self-analysis, the self-reflection that he performed on himself (1971:245). Habermas has not dealt with Jung's thought in a published work nor has he written about Horney, so perhaps this lack of a mode of philosophical inquiry for the emancipatory interest may yet be overcome.
Habermas' essay on Freud (1971) and his article on systematically distorted communication (1970) do provide a foundation for the use of transformative power, by discussing the method of psycho-analysis, as distinct from theory about that method. Habermas (1971) explains the layers of self-reflection involved in dream analysis itself. He reminds us that Freud has urged analysts to examine dreams, not only to get at the true meaning of what is distorted, but also to discover the meaning of the distorting itself for the dreamer. What is at the core of the process is the freeing of the person from the compromises he or she has made inwardly in order to maintain the appearance of common understanding in his or her social setting. These repressions of the person's individual needs are woven together in complex ways, and are strongly protected from consciousness. Nevertheless, the needs continue to cause neurosis and physical illness, because being gathered into the unconscious does not eradicate them. It removes them from "view", but in so doing it distorts the view of the person.

Habermas' specific contribution here is to identify, and place parallel importance on the emancipatory interest with the technical and practical interests. In summarizing the dimensions of the three cognitive interests analyzed in Habermas' work, Milczarek (1979:52) calls the kind of action typical of the emancipatory interest "enlightened". The corresponding social medium and/or structure of life he calls "power/authority" meaning that the individual in this kind of development is establishing autonomy. Habermas says
"The [psycho-] analytic situation makes real the unity of intuition and emancipation, of insight and liberation from dogmatic dependence . . .". Habermas has outlined here (and elsewhere) the domain of the emancipatory interest. In this paper transformative power is to be defined as operating in that domain.

**B. DEFINITION**

The definition of transformative power for this discussion is "the capacity of persons to act effectively to achieve change in the direction of their own full human potential". If such action is to be effective, it has to be appropriate to the individual and to the developmental moment in that individual's life-sequence. It must also, of course, be responsive to the environments of the individual.

While concepts can generalize, and cultural norms will guide, the effective power for transformation is released for each individual in some form of insight, be it cognitive, affective or somatic. How insight acts as the source of transformative power will be explored more fully below.

It is also important to recognize that transformative power is centered within the person, rather than in some other person or in some other part of the environment. This is true even though Jantsch (1976), Prigogine (1976) and Mooney (1951) have shown that the environments are necessary to maintain a human system that is undergoing a transformative process. As Jantsch (1976:40) puts it,
"human evolution is both unfolding of an inherent dynamic potential, and correlation with many levels of dynamic environment, which in their totality fall together with universal evolution".

Dunn (1971) has illuminated the otherwise troublesome distinction between development and evolution by showing that adaptive change in individuals is a subsystem of the selective transformation produced by evolutionary process. In his words, "phylogenesis operating as a learning system produced a learning subsystem -- the learning organism -- that operates at a different level and by more direct means (1971:76). Thus persons can modify their own behavior during their lives without going back for another round of genetic alteration. For the present discussion, development will be regarded as a subsystem of evolution.

I would emphasize, in addition, that others in a person's milieu may assist or obstruct; indeed, some gifted and disciplined others may be especially helpful to a person who is fostering his or her own development or evolution. Finally, however, the power to transform must become active within the person. The source of this power will be discussed in the next section.

The person changing may undertake various disciplines, or build skills that assist and support the force of transformative power in fostering development. These activities are the means of using the power, and they need to be considered, at least, in defining transformative power itself, because they are involved in the person's
acting effectively to achieve change. Some of the disciplines and skills to be considered in the means part of this transformative power section are psychotherapy, creative problem solving, dream work, envisioning, artistic expression, meditation and psychic disciplines, and biofeedback. It is the "peculiarly forceless force" of insight, in Habermas' phrase (1977:6) that is the initial source of transformative power, but it does not function effectively unaided by the person in whom it is working.

An analogy that has been useful to me in clarifying this point is the "standing waves" that are formed in "whitewater" rivers. The transformative power is the force of the flow that raises the wave and keeps it there. The means are the shaping rocks that cause it to assume a particular shape. We humans are the energy configurations that appear as transformative power assumes certain shapes, channeled by our unique histories and choices.

Paul Tillich is describing another aspect of transformative power (1954) in commenting on Nietzsche's will-to-power concept, but his comment is relevant here, too. He says it is not will in the familiar sense of determination to go after something, nor power in the sense of forcing others, but rather a "dynamic self-affirmation of life" (1954:36). "The drive of everything living to realize itself with increasing intensity and extensity" (loc. cit.). In a recent article, Keith Sward (1980:16) quotes Otto Rank, a close disciple of Freud's in a strikingly similar comment:
"By will, I do not mean will-to-power as conceived by Nietzsche and Adler, or 'wish' in the Freudian sense, though it might include both these aspects. I mean rather an autonomous organizing force in the individual which does not represent any particular biological impulse or social drive but constitutes the creative expression of the total personality and distinguishes one individual from another" (1941:5).

In Tillich's analysis, and the one I am making, will-to-power is directed toward overcoming both internal and external resistance to the person's fullest becoming. The opposite Tillich claims, results in non-being, so power is the pivotal concept for being, as well as becoming.

Although the role of insight is perhaps implicit in Tillich's "dynamic self-affirmation of life" (1954:36), it is of such importance that it should be re-stressed. In fact, the volition to carry out all that is contained in the insight often seems to be given as part of the insight. This is especially true if the person having the insight is keeping ego out of the way, and "allowing" the insight to have its own expression. Thus, two main aspects of transformative power, insight and volition, may be bound up with each other.

But how can we describe change "in the direction of [a person's] own full potential" without knowing what that full potential is?
Predictions about the potential of a person must always be based only on observed trends, since persons are open learning systems. The complex of influences that are already acting within a person may not be fully knowable, and it is clear that major new learnings are always possible that will make changes in a person's full potential. The general form of Dunn's argument (1971:125-7) on the impossibility of a "Law" of evolution for society as a whole applies to the parallel impossibility of a "Law" of individual development.

In addition, it is one of the characteristics that distinguishes transformative power from the communicative and instrumental that no end-point can be established. Instrumental power has some particular end in view, no matter how vaguely or inadequately it may be conceived. Communicative power also has an end in view, but that end can only be the formation of a "common will", as Habermas defines it.

George Leonard, in The Ultimate Athlete (1975:97) summarized it this way:

The human destiny, I feel, is beyond our power to conceive. I believe we can travel toward that destiny without sacrificing intelligence, humor or compassion. If we can stay centered and balanced, we can take that journey in harmony with nature and other people. As for what a human being can do and be in this context, who would dare to set the ultimate limits?
In addition to its being nearly impossible to set ultimate limits for the race as a whole, each person's individual potential is unique, and unlikely to be fully conceivable.

To summarize this section defining transformative power, the first phrase, "the capacity of persons to act effectively . . ." is defined as their ability to experience insight and the confirming volition that comes with it, and to use the disciplines and skills needed to carry it onward. The outcome must also, by this definition, be open-ended, because any person's human potential may be constantly unfolding. Insight, access to the source, is a multi-dimensional experience, as will appear in the discussion on the "source" which follows. Transformative power is: "The capacity of persons to act effectively to achieve change in the direction of the development of their own full potential".

Other parts of this chapter, to follow, are "source", "purposes" to show how they influence the process, "means" to show how they interact with the whole person, "contingencies" to explore drawbacks to the use of transformative power, and "typical outcomes", which are often interactive, and not entirely predictable. Finally, we will consider women's experience of transformative power, as shown in Jungian psychology.

C. SOURCE

Once we posit that insight itself precipitates transformative power, the question is "What is the source of insight?" But before
we undertake to respond to that question, it is important to discuss insight itself.

The insight which is part of the transformative power process in persons is not different in any important ways from other creative insights. In fact, all insight contributes in some way to the transformation of the person in whom it appears. As scientists, artists, parents, and athletes, we each become ourselves more fully in the experience of insight. This is especially, and probably proportionally, true to the extent that we act effectively on our insights.

Bargar has helped to focus the concept of insight (1980:6-8). Among the points he makes are that insight: (1) is expressed in aural, visual, or kinesthetic imagery, (2) is the result of deep, wholistic psychic processes, (3) is integrative of material available to it, (4) is responsive to various preparatory experiences which can be consciously chosen, (5) carries with it a perception of its own value, and (6) can be implemented better if the person consciously controls his or her own ego to allow it.

How people get insight has been the focus of much thought over recorded time. Speculation has ranged from magical to mechanical; gods have been given credit for implanting it, but so have starvation and beating with rods.

In chapter one, I have discussed a communication theory of insight which is emerging in the paradigm shift. The likelihood that insights from beyond our familiar boundaries can be decoded
directly by our brains was presented there, but no distinction between the role of our right and left brain was made. Much research has been done in the last decade to determine precisely what the different roles are that the two sides of our brains play. Some of that research is now being applied to the process of insight. I have included it because it is also related to the contrast between the masculine archetype (the animus) and the feminine gender experience in the Jungian view of the woman's psyche. The section immediately following is an attempt to show how the analytical and wholistic modes each contribute to insight.

From time to time in the history of thought, and with increasing frequency in the 19th and 20th centuries, scholars have commented on the two different ways our minds work, not only in perceiving, but also in processing what we have perceived. The partial list of the writers below (p. 68) who have called attention to the two modes, and of the words they used to describe what they meant, has been adapted from Bogen (1968:111); Languis and Kraft (1977:27); and Ornstein (1977:37. (See Figure 1).

In spite of the differences, which have been apparent to all the researchers listed, it is important not to separate too rigidly the functioning of the two hemispheres. The brain functions as a whole (Luria, 1970; Pelletier, 1978), and it does so by subsuming systems within itself. Insight is a complex example of the subsuming process, and subsystems within each hemisphere are included.
Table 1: Two Modes of Knowing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author or Source</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Tentative Dichotomy in Mode of Knowing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I Ching</td>
<td>1143 B.C.</td>
<td>The Creative, masculine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The Receptive, feminine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bacon</td>
<td>c. 1650</td>
<td>argument</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schopenhauer</td>
<td>c. 1850</td>
<td>objective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James (William)</td>
<td>1880</td>
<td>differential</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lee</td>
<td>1940</td>
<td>lineal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Humphrey &amp; Zangwill</td>
<td>1951</td>
<td>symbolic or propositional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>visual or imaginative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jung</td>
<td>1952</td>
<td>causal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Piaget</td>
<td>1954</td>
<td>operative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maslow</td>
<td>1957</td>
<td>rational</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hecaen</td>
<td>1962</td>
<td>linguistic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bruner</td>
<td>1962</td>
<td>rational</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semmes, et al.</td>
<td>1968</td>
<td>discrete</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Levy-Agriesti &amp; Sperry</td>
<td>1968</td>
<td>logical, analytic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>synthetic, perceptual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bogen</td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>propositional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deikman</td>
<td>1971</td>
<td>active</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pribram</td>
<td>1971</td>
<td>digital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sperry</td>
<td>1973</td>
<td>verbal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ornstein &amp; Galin</td>
<td>1975</td>
<td>analytic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jaynes</td>
<td>1976</td>
<td>analytic, part-oriented</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>synthetic, contextual</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Languis and Kraft, in their review article, stress the complexity of the interactions between the hemispheres (1977:2). The interaction between these two processing systems is complex and not fully understood. However, the fact is known that the human has both inhibitory and facilitatory functions (Hilgard and Bower, 1975) which enables the hemispheres to exhibit complementary functioning when the hemispheres work integratively (Bogen and Bogen, 1969); selective complementary functioning, when one hemisphere uses subsystems of the other to solve a problem (Vogel, 1966; Broadbent, 1974); parallel functioning, when each hemisphere works independently on a problem which may later be integrated (Dimond, 1972; Dimond and Beaumont, 1974); independent functioning, when one hemisphere inhibits the other to solve the problem (Galin, 1974); and conflicting functioning, when one hemisphere works alone on the problem and is in conflict with the other in terms of the solution (Galin, 1974).

The authors Languis and Kraft have cited here are primarily neuropsychologists, so the conclusions summarized here so briefly are based on work with subjects in laboratories. The addition that
Pribram (1971), and Pribram and Bohm et al. (1979) have made is to show the mechanisms in nerve function and the theoretical model of how these nerve functions might interact with the universal holomovement to summarize wave interference patterns into meaningful insight. Whatever the outcomes of the increased activity in these areas of research, the important result for our discussion of transformative power is that the options for the sources of insight are multiplied.

D. PURPOSES

Purposes are the conscious ways we shape the process of transformative power. They influence the quality of the experience, and which ones we choose lies within the control of our conscious decision. How the process comes out lies beyond our conscious control, though. Attempting to dominate the outcome can distort the process, and is often a self-centered exercise.

The relationship between process and purpose is well illuminated by D.T. Suzuki, introducing a book about Zen in the mastery of archery.

One of the most significant features we notice in the practice of archery, and in fact of all the arts as they are studied in Japan . . . is that they are not intended for utilitarian purposes only or for purely aesthetic enjoyments, but are meant to train the mind; indeed, to bring it into contact with the ultimate reality. Archery is, therefore, not practiced solely for
hitting the target; . . . The mind has first to be attuned to the Unconscious.

. . . . In the case of archery, the hitter and the hit are no longer two opposing objects, but are one reality. The archer ceases to be conscious of himself as the one who is engaged in hitting the bull's eye which confronts him. This state of unconsciousness is realized only when, completely empty and rid of the self, he becomes one with the perfecting of his technical skill, though there is in it something of a quite different order which cannot be attained by any progressive study of the art (Herrigel, 1953:9).

The process is his prime concern. The purpose of hitting the target infuses that process with a specific character. It is the gradually increasing openness to the unconscious that the person has chosen which illustrates the experience of transformative power.

What kinds of purposes may start from an insight and lead toward the development of full human potential? Our potential can be developed by beginning in any one, but all are inseparable in

---

4 Vaughan (1979a) has adapted from a psychosynthesis workshop a classification of intuitive awarenesses that seems to me to divide other experience productively, as well. She uses as classes physical, emotional, mental, and spiritual (1979a:66 and Vaughan 1979b:102). By spiritual, I mean those experiences which are independent of sensation, feeling, and thought, and in this, also I am following Vaughan's definition (1979a:77).
living experience. No purpose lies entirely within any of these areas; most have to do with the lavish variety of interactions among them. Robert Keck, a clergyman devoted to wholistic health, recently observed that a sick saint is a contradiction in terms (1980). There is bound to be some spiritual malaise, he claimed, if the person's body is unwell. Others might not go so far, but few investigators would disagree that all aspects of the person are closely related in their well-being.

In summary, I am defining the role of purpose as being one of guiding, but not limiting, the use of transformative power. In addition, I believe we can hardly claim that purposes in any one area of our experience are prime. All our purposes interact. We do want to be well, counting on our bodies to be capable and free from pain. We want to be happy, too, feeling our joys and transcending our sorrows and anger. We want also to be knowing, having the facts and ideas that we need. And in some way, we want to be growing spiritually, sensing ourselves more and more at ease in our widest frame of reference. We have our being and becoming within a universal energy continuum.

E. MEANS

1. A Model For Transformative Process

This section of the first chapter on transformative power begins by introducing a nine-step model of how it is that we human beings are transformed toward our fullest human potential. Following
the discussion of the model, I will explore how it works in each of the four areas of experience - the physical, the emotional, the mental and the spiritual.

The nine steps in the working model of the means of using transformative power are:

a. Sensing a yearning or dis-ease
b. Having an insight
c. Developing volition for change
d. Generating options for process
e. Envisioning the purpose
f. Evaluating the options
g. Engaging in the process
h. Seeking feedback/dialogue
i. Making shifts in process

Some of its intellectual antecedents that I am aware of are Wallas (1926), Cantril et al. (1949),\(^5\) Parnes, Noller, and Biondi (1964), 1977\(^6\) and May (1975).

a. Sensing a yearning: An inner confusion or discomfort usually precedes the first insight in a transformative process. The person begins to be aware that something or other is not as good as it might be. This step has been labeled "the big mess" (Parnes, Noller, and Biondi, 1977), or "clearing a space" (Gendlin, 1978).

\(^5\)Osborne, 1963
\(^6\)Torrance, 1975
Artists and scientists have expressed this step as a sense of being pulled by what is beyond what they currently know or can articulate (Bargar, 1980; Ghiselin, 1952). Everyone who has ever been ill has had the initial vague sense of dis-ease that Hans Selye identifies with the general adaptation syndrome, the feeling of "just being sick" (1974:38). We may say to ourselves, when this step is going on, "What, if anything, is going wrong here?" Some dissonance arises in consciousness. We sense a yearning or dis-ease.

b. Having an insight: The next step is having the insight. It is at this point that the breathtaking complexity of the human organism shows so clearly. The parts of the word portray the experience. "in" and "sight", taken together indicate the inner viewing we experience. Insight emerges, probably by a holographic process, as we have seen earlier (Chapter 1), and typically it comes as a pattern. It may be a kinesthetic experience; we suddenly know how the difference would feel (Gendlin, 1978). Or it may come as an inner hearing (Bargar, 1980).

Bohm is very explicit that insight can only come through when "thought" is stilled, because thought acts as a filter which cannot capture what is beyond itself. Insight, on the other hand (in his inimitable wording):

... may arise in this unknown totality [the non-manifest] and this insight acts directly on brain matter either at the subtle non-manifest
level or possibly at the manifest . . .
Thus the brain matter itself can change and be made orderly through insight. And thought itself changes in that case, not by thinking, not by reasoning, but rather a direct change takes place in thought . . . It is something else. It has been transformed in its being (1978:35).

Insight, he goes on, uses the energies of the universal flux (the "plenum") to bypass thought and bring order into the confusion of ordinary thinking. When we have had an insight, we are able to perceive reality in a new way.

c. Developing volition: As Bargar (1980) noted, the insight brings with it a sense of its value. This sense of value can be inhibited very quickly, and our tendency to do so constitutes a major contingency in the use of transformative power. Some insights are flawed, however, and the hesitation may even be life-saving! The quality of the willing also influences the transformative process in significant ways. An egotistical willing can force the process, resulting in harmful side effects. A rigid determination spends much energy focusing on what is not wanted.

Elmer and Alyce Green, in their years of coaching people in using biofeedback, have come to call the productive kind of willing "passive volition. Imagining and visualizing the intended change while in a relaxed state" (1977:33) exerts a "metaforce" (1973-4:20)
from outside the subsystem we intend to influence. The Greens also note that "A symbolic way of putting it is to say that the cortex plants the impulse in the subcortex and then allows nature to take its course without interference. This is passive volition" (1973-4: 19).

d. Generating options: The phase of imagining alternative ways of proceeding comes next, as we generate options for the process. Studies conducted by the Creative Problem Solving program (Parnes, Noller, and Biondi, 1977) have shown that the longer we can maintain an open mind at this phase, the richer and better conceived our outcomes will be. Imaging and synthesizing activity in the right hemisphere goes into action as we delay. To delay, we must avoid identifying ourselves with any one option. To this end, Assagioli has included exercises in "disidentification" in his manual *Psychosynthesis* (1965).

e. Envisioning the purpose: Envisioning the intended outcome is next. Whether this envisioning is actually visual or not seems to be less important than whether it is vivid and vital (Green and Green, 1977; Simonton, Matthews-Simonton and Creighton, 1978). People vary in their capacity to make mental pictures, both of these authors claim, and Barbara Brown confirms their findings (1974:23-33). The vision may be verbal, auditory, or olfactory or it may amount to the "felt sense" that Gendlin (1978) identifies, and still be effective. The essential is that it be vivid and relevant. I will be offering criteria for evaluating this important step.
f. Evaluating the options: Having a "vision" of the purpose makes it possible to evaluate the options for achieving it. Some options move surely on-line because they fit the purpose smoothly; others drop out with no more than a nudge, if we have kept our self from identifying with any of them. That aspect of our being which transcends the purpose in hand is capable of establishing criteria which allow us to be in charge of selecting which option we will choose. Choosing an option according to the criteria allows the next step to begin.

g. Engaging in the process: Actually engaging in the process may amount to no more than going through the phases listed thus far, if no outer action is called for by the purpose. Taken together these first few steps form what the adage calls "inspiration", only. That, itself, may move a person toward fuller realization of his or her potential, and thus use transformative power. Most transformation calls for some "perspiration" also, even if it is only a brow beaded in intense concentration. Some kind of doing, however, is involved in becoming.

h. Seeking feedback: Seeking feedback from the inner and outer environments keeps the transformative process on track with the purpose or with variations that emerge as the process unfolds. Dialogue with significant others, coaches, counselors, and mentors gives the person markers as to how the process is going. Outer dialogue
may also have the function of sharpening inner dialogue, as we shall see in chapter three, on communicative power. It may also be that the perceived purpose must change by the very nature of the kind of transformation that is going on. Bargar and Duncan (1980) have shown how this refining of purpose can be part of the dissertation process, for example.

Even if the process must only continue, to move on toward transformation, feedback on how far it has gone keeps hope fresh. The inner feedback is the more important in transformative process, and dialogue with others is mainly to help it. Corrections in the process can flow from feedback, in the next step.

1. Making shifts in process: Making shifts in the process as it goes on keeps it from becoming distorted by wasteful effort. The object of making shifts is not to bring the process back to a steady state, as it would be in establishing homeostasis. Rather, it is to maintain a balance within the flow of change. Jantsch has called this balance "homeorhesis".\(^7\) He has identified it with evolutionary process, and with inventive systems. Jantsch says that interruptions that disturb a process are dealt with in such a way as to leave the process at the point it would have moved to, rather than bringing it back to the point where it was interrupted (1975:92). Parts of the old view of reality which have not been incorporated into the view that is guiding the transformative process can disturb

\(^7\)Jantsch credits Waddington (1970) with having coined the term.
the flow, and may make a shift in process necessary to keep it mov­ing toward the purpose in view. Shifting in process, as new insights emerge and new visions form, empowers volition and releases more and more of the transformative power to come through the developing person.

In the next chapter, I will be applying the nine-step model to the experience of transformative power in physical, emotional, mental, and spiritual experience. Before I begin to do that, I need to make three brief points about what I am and am not attempting, and I need to offer a general conceptual framework of the mind-body continuum that will apply across all four of the artificial subdivisions of experience.

2. Clarification of the Model

The three points are the following. I am not claiming that any of the nine steps is either a necessary or a sufficient condition for the action of transformative power. Nevertheless, I am claiming that all nine are frequently found in experience during the action of transformative power. Finally, I am attempting to clarify the meaning of transformative power by discriminating among the steps often taken in using it.

We need a conceptual model of the mind-body continuum because we live in it most of the time unaware. If we take a closer look at the neural and biochemical processes involved in transformative power we see ever-more-minute and usually automatic interactions. Fortunately, we do not have to understand, or even describe them to profit
from them. Lewis Thomas, M.D., president of the Memorial Sloan-Kettering Cancer Center discusses the human immune system, for instance, in terms which are mundane for his specialty, but sufficiently esoteric to make the point:

... the toxin is not, properly speaking, the diphtheria bacillus' own idea; it is made by the bacterium under instruction from a virus, a bacteriophage. Only the organisms that have become lysogenic for the virus are toxigenic. Diphtheria is not simply an infection by the diphtheria bacillus; it is an infection by a bacteriophage whose real business in life is infecting the bacillus (1979:98).

The complexity would boggle the mind if we had to attend to it to operate it.

Usually there are powerful inhibitory mechanisms which prevent our being aware, as we live, of any major part of the transactions that maintain the many balances within us. Apart from relatively gross indications, we simply do not know how we ace a tennis ball, sprint to a finish line, or do needlepoint. We do have to bring some of the process to awareness, however, in order to develop our potential more fully. The objective of this final section of this chapter is to give the model that underlies the means of using transformative power to be discussed in the next chapter.
The basic conceptual framework is set forth in two diagrams given by Elmer and Alyce Green in Beyond Biofeedback (1977). In the first (Figure 2, p. 81), they divide the unity of the person into conscious and unconscious by a wavy line, suggesting that the margin between the two is constantly moving back and forth as we use

![Diagram](https://example.com/diagram.png)

Psychophysiological diagram relating the conscious-unconscious psychological domain to the various sections of the voluntary-involuntary physiological domain. The solid horizontal line separates the central and peripheral nervous systems, CNS and PNS, into functional subregions. The dashed line, conceptually visualized to be in continuous undulatory movement, separates the conscious and unconscious areas.

**Figure 2** (Green 1977:41)
Relationship of the Conscious-Unconscious Physiological Domain to the Voluntary-Involuntary Physiological Domain
different ways of becoming aware. They divide the central nervous system (CNS) from the peripheral (PNS) by concentric circles, and the sub-regions of each of them by the solid horizontal line (1977:46).

In order to achieve voluntary control of any part of the system, we must move the wavy line that borders consciousness far enough to include the part we wish to influence. For instance, if we want to control our food intake, we need to notice what we put into our mouths, and diet records are designed to accomplish this end. If we want to gain voluntary control of our autonomic nervous system, most ordinary people require assistance from biofeedback equipment. If I wish to raise or lower the temperature of my hand, for instance, I will be greatly helped by being wired up to equipment (a galvanic skin response meter) which will tell me by lights or a tone how I am doing.

The Greens' second diagram shows how a pathway for such voluntary control may be established (Figure 3, page 83). The midline is the margin between conscious and unconscious process, as in the previous diagram. Inside-the-skin events are labeled INS, and those outside the skin, OUTS (1977:47).

The specifics of the limbic system and the hypothalamus and pituitary will become useful in chapter three. With this diagram in mind, then, let us turn to the means of using transformative power, the outcomes, and women's special experiences of these events in the light of Jungian psychology.
Simplified operational diagram of "self-regulation" of psychophysiological events and processes. Sensory perception of OUTS events, stressful or otherwise (upper left box), leads to a physiological response along Arrows 1 to 4. If the physiological response is "picked up" and fed back (Arrow 5) to a person who attempts to control the "behavior" of the feedback device, then Arrows 6 and 7 come into being, resulting in a "new" limbic response. This response in turn makes a change in "signals" transmitted along Arrows 3 and 4, modifying the original physiological response. A cybernetic loop is thus completed, and the dynamic equilibrium (homeostasis) of the system can be brought under voluntary control. Biofeedback practice, acting in the opposite way to drugs, increases a person's sensitivity to INS events, and Arrow 8 develops, followed by the development of Arrows 9 and 10. External feedback is eventually unnecessary, because direct perception of INS events becomes adequate for maintaining self-regulation skills.

(Green 1977:42)

Figure 3
Self-regulation of Psychophysiological Events
CHAPTER THREE

TRANSFORMATIVE POWER II

A. INTRODUCTION

All our transformative purposes do interact. If I want to stop having headcolds, I may need to learn the intellectual and emotional components of responsible assertion. If I want to apply the insights of Jung and Habermas to women's exercise of power, I may need to improve my practice of meditation. In this chapter, I will artificially separate these arenas for the use of transformative power only because I can discuss them more clearly that way. In life, we humans are part of a unified continuum of energy, and we express that unity in our own physical, emotional, mental, spiritual continuity.

MEANS, CONTINUED

1. MEANS THAT BEGIN IN PHYSICAL EXPERIENCE

As examples, I will be using behavioral medicine, biofeedback, and sports. In behavioral medicine I am drawing on the work of Herbert Benson (1974, 1975, 1980) and O. Carl Simonton, both physicians (Simonton, Matthews-Simonton and Creighton, 1978). In biofeedback, I am basing my discussion on Elmer Green and Alyce Green (1973-4 and 1977), and Barbara Brown (1974, 1977). In sports
I am working with material offered by George Leonard (1974, 1978) and others (Suinn, 1976; Murphy, 1973). At each step of the model, I will be referring to the first presentation that I made of it on page 73 and following. At some points, it may also be useful to refer again to the diagrams of conscious and unconscious process on pages 81 and 83.

a. Sensing a yearning or dis-ease in physical experience:
Let us begin, then, with the sensing step as we experience it in our bodily experience. Herbert Benson's approach is forthrightly part of the way of looking at healing that we know as "medical". That is, as a physician, he expects to find out what is wrong with the patient, and then prescribe. His emphasis is not on strengthening the patient's capacity to sense the problem, but rather on putting a behavior into the patient's repertoire to use on the problem the doctor has identified. The behavior is the "relaxation response", a physiologic response of decreased sympathetic nervous system activity induced by Transcendental Meditation. He also includes a range of other methods, including biofeedback, in his specialty which is now called "Behavioral Medicine".

In taking the responsibility we expect him to, the doctor will, as Benson represents it, pass over training the patient to recognize the problem in the first place and concentrate on teaching what to do about it. This observation should not be misunderstood as even covertly suggesting that people who are ill should try to do without medical intervention. As modern Americans, many of us have
blunted our awareness of stress-induced states so effectively that medical intervention is often essential in limiting the ensuing disease processes.

Benson's view of the change process that limits the disease is substantially the one shown in the Greens' diagram, but his approach plays down the role of the transforming person in the sensing step. By contrast, the Greens, at the Menninger Foundation, emphasize the responsibility of the patient for understanding the process he or she is in. In preparing to work with others, they invariably undertake the procedures themselves that they plan to use with others. They also express greater reliance on co-discovery with their subjects than Benson does. One example is their explaining how they teach patients to recognize their own early warning signals in controlling migraine headaches.

The process is based on an insight in co-discovery which will be discussed in the next sub-section. The Greens are not medical doctors themselves, so their operating outside a "medical model" is not surprising. They repeatedly emphasize the importance of the full involvement of the patient:

... For long-lasting results in biofeedback training, it is important that patients have a clear understanding of what they are doing and realize that neither the machines nor the doctors are making anything happen. It is the patient who does it ... (1977:45, emphasis theirs).
I will return to Benson and the Greens for other steps of the model, but before I leave sensing, I want to contrast to their work the energy workshops pioneered by Robert Nadeau, a teacher in the martial art of aikido (Leonard, 1974). The whole focus of these energy workshop experiences is on becoming conscious of, and using, one's capacity to sense body states. Here the participants do not enter as patients, although they do come as students. Nadeau emphasizes permission, merely allowing people to recognize the power of the energy field that "exists in and around each human body". In the workshops they do exercises that help participants to become progressively more aware of the physical force in their "energy being" (1974:63). Full aikido teaching uses this force in "... loving attack and ... peaceful reconciliation" (1974:49), but the first stages of awareness consist in sensing the force field by feeling its warmth and its firmness. Leonard's description makes it clear that body warmth is not what the participants experience. The work in Kirlian photography seems to confirm visually this kinetic perception (Krippner and Rubin, 1980). The energy exercises in the Nadeau and Leonard workshops build into awareness experiences that can be used later in an insight.

b. Having an insight in physical experience: The Greens report (1977) a moment of insight in co-discovery with one of their subjects that has since helped thousands of people with migraine headaches. They were trying to understand the effects of the
during my weekly meditation group meetings, and had thought that the group was somehow healing. The insight that came was that it was my own meditation practice that was affecting the cold symptoms. Continued practice, now extended to follow the steps of the model being proposed here, has made it possible to eliminate the symptoms soon after they come to consciousness. I remember vividly the sudden sense of re-alignment of reality that came along with the insight.

Similarly, insight and commitment to it, figured in Benson's blood pressure research cited earlier. An insight about reducing blood pressure through Transcendental Meditation apparently came to the Boston TM proponents, but Benson's Harvard research team were very much involved with high blood pressure in monkeys at the time, and turned the TM people away twice. But the commitment that the representatives of the TM group had to their insight brought them back. Benson's own insight was, he says, "I felt there was little to lose in a preliminary investigation and the potential gains were great" (1975:83).

All that people have to lose in the energy workshops is their customary ways of perceiving energy, but their experience of doing so is very emotional, as their faces, and their later attempts to articulate the experiences in words show (Leonard, 1974:72-97).

Several of the characteristics of insight noted by Bargar (1980) have appeared in these examples. The insights are expressed
Autogenic Training in relaxation exercises that they were using. One subject, a woman, was involved in a two-week process with them in which she knew the electrodes would give data about her state of relaxation by recording the temperature of her hands. She was afraid (in spite of their efforts to put her at ease) because she did not think she could warm her hands. She had a migraine headache which she thought was brought on by anxiety about the hand warming, so they gave her a task to distract her. The task extended over a period of ten minutes; at the ninth minute, the polygraph showed a sudden dilation of the blood vessels in both hands. In the next two minutes, the temperature of her hands went up 10°. When Elmer Green came into the room, he asked, "What happened to you a couple of minutes ago?" She replied, "How did you know my headache went away?" (1977:35). Here, the insight was a surprise; as the outcome has been repeated, it has become less and less of a surprise. It must always be a bit of a surprise for each new person to discover that it can work for him or herself.

For me, the parallel experience was the insight that early common cold symptoms disappeared from my body under similar circumstances. I undertook the biofeedback experience to discover whether I was producing in my own meditation the physiological correlates reported in the literature. In four of the ten sessions I did, I had a stuffed up nose and rough throat as I began, and found them relieved at the end. Previously, I had noticed that I often "got over" a cold
in a bodily sense, although not in a pictorial kind of imagery; they are integrative of material available to them; they are responsive to various preparatory experiences which can be consciously chosen; and they carry with them a perception of their own value. Not all the characteristics are associated with each of the examples noted, and it would be hard to determine whether any of them is the result of deep wholistic psychic processes. It will be easier to show the action of such processes when there is fuller verbal data available, as in the emotional aspects of transformative process.

c. Developing volition in physical experience: Volition is at least as complex as intuition. The history of philosophy is rich with work on the concept of free will. Much popular wisdom also centers around the exercise of will, generating humor ("She had a whim of iron"), aphorism ("You can do anything if you want to bad enough"), and a fair amount of guilt, in all of us. There is a fine line between the stubbornness of ego which raises new barriers as it smashes through the old, and perseverance which always finds new ways to go beyond any barriers encountered to move toward its objectives. That line is often clearer to observers than to the person moving onward.

For the purpose of this discussion, I need to clarify the position I am taking as to the source of volition, before expanding on how it is developed. First, we experience ourselves as having
the power to control by our own volition our craniospinal nervous system which innervates our voluntary muscles. Second, willful control of our autonomic nervous system (Figure 1) has not been so apparent, leaving many authorities uncertain as to whether we have voluntary control of it or not. Third, more and more physiologists and practitioners are becoming certain that much of our autonomic nervous system can be brought under voluntary control. The evidence has persuaded me that events ordinarily under the control of the autonomic nervous system, such as heart rate, body temperature, and GI tract contractions can be controlled by relaxed intent through envisioning. Some of the evidence follows.

Barbara Brown (1974:250-297) has a chapter devoted to summarizing results of experiments in which subjects controlled their heart rates (most often in an upward direction) in response to tones, lights, certain photographs, and to avoid electric shocks. Her interest is in the connection between thought and the autonomic nervous system, but she also discusses volition. The subjects chose to change their heart rates, even though they may not have "known" how they were doing it. In fact, some of the experiments were set up to conceal from the subjects even what it was that they were doing. For our purposes, however, the important thing is that in many different ways, the experiments showed that people can voluntarily exercise control over their heart rates, long thought to be one of the functions least accessible to control.
The argument as to whether we can have volitional control over changes in our autonomic processes has been stated by Elmer and Alyce Green. What follows is based on their chapter 5 (1977: 58-71). Our homeostatic balances are similar in some ways to the operation of a heating system thermostat. Changes in our mental-emotional states are reflected in our physiological states, and vice versa. Their full statement of the principle is, "Every change in the physiological state is accompanied by an appropriate change in the mental-emotional state, conscious or unconscious, and conversely, every change in the mental-emotional state is accompanied by an appropriate change in the physiological state" (1977:58).

The interrelationship is continuous. Similarly, the thermostat regulates the heating system so that when the house temperature goes down, the furnace turns on, and so on. The action of volition is analogous to the hand that changes the thermostat, the Greens point out. Volition enters the closed feedback loop that was maintaining a steady state, and calls for a new state. The mind/body system responds by producing the new state, and our inhibiting mechanisms reduce the likelihood of our becoming consciously aware of precisely how the change is brought about.

Patients and subjects at the Menninger Foundation occasionally ask variants of the question, "How does volition get into the nervous system?" The fact that all the answers to that question are
not in makes it necessary to take a position, rather than to merely lay out facts. The position the Greens take offers a way of understanding otherwise implausible but nevertheless well-validated feats of "self-regulation" or transformative process. The position, stated simply, is that "All of the body is in the mind, but not all of the mind is in the body: (1977;63). They mention the way Aurobindo Ghose (1955) has written of the idea, as well. "If you are embarrassed by the word 'spirit', think of the spirit as the subtlest form of matter. But if you are not embarrassed by the word 'spirit', then you can think of matter as the densest form of spirit" (Green and Green, 1973-4:63). And again, farther on in the book:

In our estimation, the psychosomatic syndrome with most people includes a case of mistaken identity . . . the self that does the regulating is logically and existentially not thought, not emotions, not actions. Whatever it is, it exists in, or has extension in, the realm of paraphysiological inputs. The problem is that if we believe we are only our body, then we cannot control it. If we believe that we are our emotions, then we cannot control them. And if we believe we are our thoughts, then they, too, cannot be controlled . . ." (1977:186).

Pelletier, a psychologist at the Langley-Porter Psychiatric Institute of the University of California at Berkeley, concurs. He puts it:
... many researchers have concluded that the brain is a transducer or conductor of mind rather than the mind being an epiphenomenon of electrical or biochemical activity in the brain. Despite the philosophical complexity of such an issue, we are obliged to deal with the fact that the individual engaged in the simplest act of autonomic control phenomenologically experiences volition. This exertion of will appears to be the means by which he transcends the normal or habitual parameters of human functioning. . . . Neurophysiological data may be regarded as incomplete indices of an exceedingly, perhaps infinitely, finegrained process, termed volition, that can be evoked to regulate macro-scale events of autonomic functioning. There are significant indications that such control may be used by individuals to regulate their own dysfunctional biological systems" (1978:177).

The implication of this position is that, although the brain may mediate the processes initiated by will in a biochemical way, determination of those processes can be made by will. The biochemical processes, in turn, may influence the will, but cannot finally determine it. Elmer Green offers four kinds of data in support of
of his position: (1) self-regulation of non-sensory processes like control of single muscle units, which he calls inferential support; (2) human awareness, the feeling that we can exercise volition, "existential" support; (3) summaries of ESP studies, "statistical" support; and (4) "hard data from psychokinetic studies" (1977:63).

Some of the data from psychokinesis studies, in which people move objects with their minds, seems to me to be more problematic than it does to him, but the other three supports seem plausible. In any case, the rising tide of subjective or "existential" reports of expanded voluntary control and consciousness are more readily explained and predicted by the position the Greens take. It is also congruent with the opinions and experience discussed in chapter one of this paper.

Hope, hypothesis, belief and knowing all influence the operation of volition, the Greens have discovered. They also find that biofeedback makes it possible to move from hope to knowing in one leap. Hope has to be rather focused, in order to fend off despair, and to function at all. We have to eliminate wild dreams, and choose a space within which we can hope (Lynch, 1965), such as to warm hands, ski the slalom, or lower the blood pressure. Biofeedback, and envisioning, and understanding the ways of insight offer specific steps that can be seen as a way to achieve a circumscribed success, a purpose on the path of development.

Hope does influence volition. The Greens cite the experience of at least one subject in a group like the one in which they made
the discovery about migraine headaches, who believed that the bio-
feedback method might work for everyone else, but not for her . . .
and she proceeded backwards to show the reverse. What she enter-
tained negatively was a hypothesis, in spite of herself. When she
had the electrodes on, and was supposed to be warming her hands,
she steadily made the temperature go down. Elmer Green showed her
what had happened, she began to believe, and again, it was in spite
of herself. She began to try, hard, to make the temperature go up.
With all the tension she invested in it, she failed completely, and
quit. In the next three minutes, her hand temperature climbed
steadily. She then became very excited, as her belief level
climbed, but her excitement interfered, and her hand temperature
pitched down again. Now belief was shading into knowing, as she
learned what she was doing that controlled the process. She was
amazed, and delighted with the new thing she had learned about her-
self. Ultimately she achieved control over her migraine headaches.
Her story illustrates both the hierarchy of hope to knowing men-
tioned on page 95 that influences volition, and the importance of
a relaxed intent.

First, the woman had moved from the weak hope that brought
her into the Menninger Foundation workshop, through a negative and
then a positive hypothesis, and through belief in the process, to
knowing that she had control over at least one autonomic nervous
system function. For her, all four steps were needed; for some
others the leap from hope to knowing is easier to make. At the
level of knowing, volition enters the feedback loop as surely as
the hand moves the thermostat. The person who knows what he or
she can do has established some control over the part of the un-
conscious from which psychosomatic changes emerge. Much of the un-
conscious remains untouched by such a shift, but other writers have
commented, as the Greens have, on the subtle positive changes in
self-perception that ensue on the development of such areas of
self-regulation (Brown, 1974, 1977; Pelletier, 1977, 1978; and
Simonton, Matthews-Simonton and Creighton, 1978).

Second, the woman made the essential discovery that when
she tried to force the process, it wouldn't go. Volition seems to
develop greatest effectiveness in an inner climate of relaxed intent.
The important thing is to keep the ego out of the way, and allow the
action of the natural process by which volition guides the body to-
ward a desired purpose.

Suinn, a Winter Olympics psychologist and chairperson of the
Colorado State University Department of Psychology writes of his
work with world-class skiers who were suffering from over-tense
exercise of volition in developing their physical skill (Suinn, 1976).
His three-step method relies heavily on visualization, but the relaxa-
tion part is relevant here. The first step was using the Edmund
Jacobson method of tensing and relaxing progressive groups of muscles
to achieve fuller relaxation than the athletes could manage by just
deciding to relax. Here, the conscious volition acted at two levels, the choice to engage in the progressive muscular steps, and the decision to trust the method. The other two steps in Suinn's method come into the discussion of the model at a later point, but the result of the goal Suinn and the team set may be of interest. The U. S. Cross Country team took its highest place ever in the 1972 Olympics when Suinn worked with them. This seems to be an example of a transformative process being used in the service of a use of instrumental power. The purpose of relaxing tension was effective in the use of transformative power within itself, however.

Benson has been more analytic about the relaxation process in an article (Benson, Beary and Carol, 1974). He analyzed the conditions for the "trophotropic" or relaxation response as being: (1) a mental device like a mantra (the word "one" in his scheme) to move away from logical and outward-oriented thinking; (2) a passive attitude in which passing thoughts should be disregarded without anxiety, and attention redirected to the technique; (3) decreased muscle tonus so that a minimum of muscular effort is needed; and (4) a quiet environment with as few external stimuli as possible, with eyes closed.

A distinction must be made between passivity in the broadest sense and the passive attitude involved in the exercise of passive volition. Gardner Murphy selected Elmer and Alyce Green to set up
the biofeedback lab under him at the Menninger Foundation because he found them to be persons with relevant skills who shared his life-long interest in the "problem of the autonomy of the mind" (1977:xii). This autonomy results from an active exercise of freedom of choice, an attitude that is a direct contrast to the broad sense of passivity. Once the decision is made, then the ego steps aside to allow the unfolding of the experience according to its inner necessities. The person may not be passive in decision-making, but must exercise passive volition during the process. In the vernacular, we can't "cop out", but we have to "keep cool".

In each of the three sources, Benson et al., Green and Green, and Suinn, we have seen aspects of the exercise of volition as a force entering a system otherwise in balance, to alter it in a way chosen by the person, through relaxed intention and increasing expectation.

d. Generating options in physical experience: Generating options in physical experience can be either options for physical transformation, or physically generated options for transformation beginning in other areas. By whatever ways it is done, or for whatever processes, the important thing is that it be done, because it will improve the quality of the ensuing process.

Alyce Green gives the outcome of the idea-generating process in describing the options used by a 39-year-old woman nurse who took control of her autonomic nervous system sufficiently to drop
her blood pressure after a 16-year history of frustration with high blood pressure. Even with medication, her blood pressure was high at 190/120, when she began, and upward swings had been correlated with numerous stresses in her life. During the period when she was gaining control, her husband died, she settled the estate herself, sold the store and business they had had, returned to work as a psychiatric nurse, continued Girl Scouts, Little League and bowling team adult leadership and endured a severe dislocation of her shoulder. She needed a maximum number of options for her process, in the midst of multiple daily and life-style changes. Alyce Green recounts how the nurse took her biofeedback equipment on trips, kept a diary, noted her "scores", shared what she was doing with others, and generally used her intellect in generating options for her physical transformative process. She chose not to take the first thought that occurred to her, but had to keep going until she had a method that worked. One person's story can hardly be as convincing as statistical studies, though, and I will be citing some in the section on mental process.

Parnes, Noller and Biondi (1977) stress the importance of deferring judgment in order to "come up with" better options to be evaluated later. Among the ways of deferring judgment and keeping the generation of options going which are used at the creative problem-solving institute they organize are a number of physical activities. Acting out a "machine" with each person forming a part, mirror motion, fantasy trips, and physical problem-solving games are among the
exercises that leaders use to go on beyond verbal brainstorming.

Although idea-finding can be done in the physical imagery ways just discussed, the development of a self-transcending level of skill involves what Thomas calls "trial and triumph" (1979:36). What looks to a bystander like mere repetition of runs by downhill skiers, for instance, is often a persistent trying of many closely-related, but actually very slightly different ways of going over a mogul to take a gate at exactly the best angle. It is a physical process of generating options. Jean Claude Killy, a three-time Olympic gold medal skier reported that the best race he ever skied was one for which his only preparation was "running" the course time and time again . . . in an arm chair. The "inspired" gold medal run is a re-play of all the best turns from somatic, or bodily, memory. In it, the skier transcends himself.

In some ways, the envisioning step, which follows, is a kind of option generation, although it is clearly focused on seeing the purpose as already realized. The most effective release of transformative power in the envisioning step, however, is based on suspended judgment that allows rich generating of options.

e. Envisioning the purpose in physical experience: Evidence is piling up that the moment of insight and repeated envisioning are the two most important parts of facilitating transformative power, with volition acting in a supporting role. Probably the gathering
force of the perennial philosophy can be traced to our continual rediscovery of the subtle but relentless power of envisioning. Popular wisdom has it, "Be careful what you pray for; you'll probably get it," or "No wonder she's that way; it was just a self-fulfilling prophecy". This wisdom has been around for a long time, too: the "Pygmalion effect" has to have been ancient to have appeared in a myth. People as far removed from each other as Maxwell Maltz, M.D. who wrote Psycho-Cybernetics (1960), and the many stars of My Fair Lady have profited from the public's wistful faith in the power of envisioning to change their lives. The plain fact is that those who profited gave fair exchange. Envisioning works, for better or for worse.

In this sub-section, I will be offering examples from the process of correcting pathological physiology, improving ordinary physiology, and developing outstanding physiological skill. I have developed an extension of the criteria for effective imagery used by the Simontons at the cancer (oncology) clinic where they work in Fort Worth, Texas.

Carl Simonton is an oncologist, and his wife is a psychologist. They developed criteria with assistance from Dr. Dean Achterberg-Lawlis, a research psychologist, to help their cancer patients check out the envisioning they were doing to help other medical treatments (chemotherapy and radiation). In their book (1979:143-145) they point out that while people have great potential for individual variety in imaging, effective images have certain
qualities in common. To evaluate the imagery of their patients, they use criteria similar to the ones I will be proposing. In the group therapy sessions they encourage patients to use the criteria on each other's imagery and on their own, as well. The Simontons find that the patients' imaging is more likely to be effective if it meets criteria like:

1. The cancer cells are weak and confused . . .
2. The white blood cells are aggressive, eager for battle, quick to seek out the cancer cells and destroy them . . .

Their book is addressed to cancer patients and to their families, and in suggesting how to use their criteria they remind their readers of the trial-and-triumph process:

. . . none of our patients have started out with imagery containing all these elements. You may need to experiment before you find strong enough images to capture your new positive expectancy. Use the criteria to help you identify images that need strengthening or changing. Although it is not possible to provide a medically correct "prescription"
of images, it is essential that you see
your body's natural defenses triumphing over
the disease. Strong images represent a
strong belief in recovery (1979:145).

Their words embody a strong emphasis on the autonomy of the patient
that seemed to be lacking in the Benson prescriptions. The Simontons'
words also call for a highly positive attitude toward the effectiveness
of the process, which the Greens also found valuable. Finally,
the Simontons focus on the importance of envisioning triumph as the
outcome.

In preparing a parallel list of criteria that would have a
broader relevance, I checked items on it with meditations made for
me by Diane Keck, a research associate, then at the New Wineskins
Center in Columbus, Ohio. She put the meditations on tape, to be
used for fifteen to twenty-five minute periods three times a day
in a similar way to the taped meditations used by the Simontons'
patients. The tapes have helped to shape the criteria. These
broader criteria for effective imagery could be amplified by appro-
priate descriptions for a variety of kinds of transformative process.

1. The opposing forces to the transformative process are
weak and disorganized.

2. The helping forces act directly and effectively.

3. Your normal life processes support this transformation
effortlessly.
4. The transformative power within you makes achieving the purpose inevitable.

5. Your natural potentials are exactly the ones needed for this precise change.

6. Your normal life processes remove any after-effects of the opposing forces' defeat.

7. By the end of the imagery, you have reached your present purpose.

8. Your present purpose fits in with your life purposes as you now see them.

9. The triumph in the imagery can go on improving indefinitely.

The ninth criterion is needed to provide for the open-ended aspect of transformative power, as seen by this study. The Simontons recognize the ongoing nature of the self-transformations their most successful patients engage in, as we shall see at the end of this section, but for some reason they have not included that focus in their list of criteria. The ninth criterion is also needed to confirm gains that have been made. There is no standing still on the transformation continuum; we are either growing or dying (Land, 1973).

With these criteria in mind, let us hear from some other authorities. Barbara Brown (1974) thinks it is likely that Edmund Jackson, who devoted his life to the subject of relaxation from about the turn of this century on, is the father of relaxation techniques. He believed that in order for the mind to get on with
its own business, it was necessary to stop the flow of messages from the muscles to the brain. Repeatedly in the literature surveyed here, Jacobson's tense-relax-attend method has been cited. Some adaptation of it seems to be fundamental to the relaxation phase of successful envisioning.

The German neurologist and psychiatrist, J.H. Schultz, is another early proponent of the relaxation techniques now in use. He was a hypnotist, and according to Brown (1974), he wanted to avoid the psychological dependence in hypnotism that was becoming apparent in the 1920's. He noticed that his hypnosis patients felt that their limbs were very heavy, and that they felt warm. He reasoned that if patients could learn to induce such states in themselves, they might gain the advantages of hypnosis without falling prey to its dangers.

Schultz prepared a "formula" which is in use today in adapted form at the Menninger Foundation and at New Wineskins, in Columbus, Ohio, among many other places. The formula uses envisioning in the service of relaxation as the person repeats phrases describing what is "seen" or experienced. The first round of the formula has to do with various muscle groups feeling heavy, and the second deals with feeling warm. Nurse-facilitators now at Health Care Plus, in Columbus, Ohio, suggest imagining holding a hot coffee cup, or nestling hands into warm sand at the beach, to
prompt the client's own imaging. The imagery helps the perfectly natural process of relaxation to proceed more easily toward eliminating residual muscle tension. It also helps prepare the person to engage in other envisioning more effectively.

Brown suggests (1974:151) that other forms of energy may be released in the body by the relaxation of the mind provided in autogenic training and other systems that minimize the traffic in the reticular activating system at the base of the brain. She expresses her respect for the control exercised by the mind over bodily processes, that ordinarily unconscious, after biofeedback gives signals about them. The biofeedback allows the mind to become conscious of changes, but the mind regulates the change, and does so most effectively through imagery. Thomas (1979), the Greens (1977), and Pribram (1971) have all marvelled in print at the mind's control over processes so intricate that sophisticated laboratory methods can hardly describe them.

Elmer Green reports healing bursitis in his shoulder using hypnagogic imagery. Meditation-level auto-suggestion had not helped, and the painful bursitis had gone on for months. Green hypothesized that his body had not been "quiet" enough to "hear" his suggestion, and he tried in vain to get into a deep enough quietness or trance to be effective. At 3:00 a.m. one morning he drifted awake and realized he was in just the state he had been trying to achieve, a conscious natural trance. He began making a visualization in which
large increases of blood and lymph to the shoulder were a major feature, but suddenly realized that he did not know the names of the chemicals that would dissolve the irritating calcium crystals he understood to be causing the trouble. He told his body to mobilize whatever substances were needed, manipulate the concentrations as necessary, and bring whatever enzymes and acids would dissolve them. He held the visualization for what seemed like two or three minutes, but then realized that his attention had wandered. He brought his attention back, realized that there was no pain, and drifted back to sleep. In the morning, he was able to raise his arm over his head for the first time in three months (1977:165-167).

In trying to explain what happens in cases of auto-suggestive healing, now rather common, Green draws an analogy to computers. If we had to solve all the details of how to bring about the desired change, the process would be like an "actual" language. Instead, we are able to use a command visualization, which is like a "command" computer language (e.g., FORTRAN, COBOL) in which the computer has already prepared internal programs to carry out the operations. All we need to enter is "Take the square root of 239", and the computer does the rest.

The concept of the command visualization is a useful one, until neuropsychology can spell out the "emergent" capacity of mind to control bodily functions. The command visualization which enables physical transformation does have some parameters, as suggested by
the preceding example. Too much straining, unfocused attention, or an inadequate level of "quietness" slows or stops the process. Green's experience was introspectively reported, but examples of external reporting of similar happenings are scattered throughout the works cited here.

In sports, two examples may help sharpen the concept. George Leonard provides the first. In the *Ultimate Athlete*, he introduces himself as a person relatively immune to the effects of good tennis instruction (1974:105-108) but interested enough in improving his game to try a new method of learning. His teacher, Dyveke Spino, erstwhile concert pianist and ski instructor, has him imagine that he and she are in a pool of calm, clear energy (in the midst of the normal savageries of an indoor tennis club). "No matter how turbulent the energy is on the other court, our court is still and serene at all times" (1974:105). She had him imagine stepping off from the apex of a triangle on the court surface in front of him toward the right point at the base. He was also to imagine at the same time holding a four-foot basin in his hands and swinging it to the left, as the basis for his (right-handed) backhand swing. He was to hold the racket as gently as one would hold a living bird, except for the moment of impact. As he did this, balls were moving smoothly and swiftly over the net. All at once he started to marvel at his new-found prowess, and imagine
future successes on the court. The balls began to smash into the net. Ms. Spino took over. Leonard reports: "Gradually my teacher guided me back into the delightful state of not doing that had allowed me to do so well" (1974:107). Unstrained attention and a relaxed mind seem both to have been present here, at the quiet court where Ms. Spino and George Leonard were working.

By contrast, the parallel application of Suinn's three-step visualization method to the training of ski teams has won national and international recognition (1976). His research results with students not on teams showed that the Jacobson relaxation process he uses permits richer imagery with those who had the relaxation experience than with those who did not. Subjects who had only envisioned in black and white were able to see in color. Tactile, auditory and muscular sensations also appeared after relaxation.

These were Suinn's three steps: first was the Jacobson muscle relaxation mentioned before. Second, a series of imaging experiences designed to improve their visualization in general. In the third step, when he worked with Colorado State University ski team members, he had them move through the phases of an actual competitive situation in their mind's eye. The EMG (electromyograph records) showed that they were simulating the course fully, even to a spurt after the finish line. He was mystified by the final spurt until he realized how hard it is to come to a stop when you are going forty miles an hour on skies.
In working with the team, Suinn established a treatment group and a control group by randomization. He intended to run both groups through the same experiences, all the way to intercollegiate competition. The coaches of the downhill men's and women's ski teams agreed to his plan, and he began training. The results of the experiment were to have shown whether the treatment or the control group did better in actual competition.

What actually happened was that the treatment group did so well in practice that the controls never got to ski in competition. However, the Colorado teams took the league banner and won both the men's and women's individual titles. Suinn, himself an Ohio State graduate, says that the envisioning is a "well-controlled copy of experience, a sort of body-thinking" (1976:41).

The information Elmer Green gave introspectively is the only set that is full enough to allow the application of the criteria for effective imagery given on page 105, although elements given in the other accounts correspond. He saw the bursitis as being the result of a few fragile calcium crystals. He envisioned flooding his shoulder with blood and lymph to act directly on the crystals. When he realized he did not know the names of the chemicals that would dissolve the crystals, he just trusted that his normal life processes would know what to do and told them to do it. He had been sure, throughout, that if he could just get into the right mental state (his body "quiet" enough to "hear"), his problem would be solved. His mind/body interaction was exactly
what was needed and was all that was needed. His body would remove the remains of the crystals. At the end of the imagery, his pain was gone, and he was able to go on with his life's purposes unhampered.

None of these examples can prove that this envisioning step of the model proposed here works every time, but they have perhaps served to show that envisioning works best when the person is in a relaxed state with focused attention and when the envisioning has a vivid relevance.

f. Evaluating the options in physical experience: Openness to the flow of ideas is needed to succeed in generating options. When the unconscious has done its work, the conscious ego must go into action again. Once the envisioning of the purpose has been established, criteria can be selected and applied more accurately for determining which options for moving toward it are best. The near absence of information about evaluating options in the examples given so far suggests that in some transformative processes at least, the evaluation is never raised to consciousness. In Psycho-Cybernetics (1960), Maxwell Maltz, M.D., warns against concentrating too much on how to achieve the ends we envision. He finds that for his patients, the psyche works out ways of getting to the end in view most smoothly if the ego gives a minimum of attention to the steps on the way. He gives the example of reaching for an object, pointing out that if we thought out how to do it, we would be
immobilized by the complexities.

Maltz' example does appear to make sense. Many more involved purposes require such complex processes to achieve them that dividing up the focus of attention between the purpose and the steps would weaken the transforming force. Dividing attention further by evaluating a variety of options might confound the problem. On the other hand, some ways really are better (more effective, more pleasant, less expensive) for moving toward our purposes. Indeed some options defeat the outcome by their very nature. The real issues that emerge from this discussion are not whether to evaluate options, but how much, and in what ways. How much energy would be well invested in measuring the options for process against criteria derived from the purpose? Also, how does a person in a transformative process go about sizing up options that have come to light?

Two of the examples already discussed in part one from physical health, and one from physical skill, may help to clarify the issues. The nurse who controlled her blood pressure had a complex life by any standards. Her options for process were innumerable, but in deciding she constantly used the criterion of whether the option in question contributed to success with her purpose. Appearances and convenience, even finances, were not major criteria for her. She threaded her way through the maze with one criterion as her guide, but she did choose consciously.
It seems, however, that she did not spend much energy on her choosing.

George Leonard's account of his tennis lessons may illustrate a slightly different focus on the issues of how much energy to invest in evaluating options and how to go about it. As he practiced his developing skill, he kept tuning his body to delivering his shots in the fluid way he was being taught, so mini-decisions were being made. On the other hand, when Leonard began to be self-conscious and self-aggrandizing about his choosing, it promptly got in his way.

A simplicity which may be nearly un-conscious seems to be the most effective way to evaluate options in the physical realm. The "choosing" is largely physical, and the body "knows" the right feel. Elmer Green's "choosing" the right chemicals to dissolve the crystals in his bursitis is another example even though from a medical science standpoint he was mistaken about the cause.

There were options, but they were bodily healing options, and his conscious ego did not need to intervene to take part in evaluating them.

Memory of successes may be a guide to evaluating options in transformative process. It may be a right-brain imaging process that delivers the memory back into conscious evaluation, but registration of successes and failures may have a component that lies deeper in the brain even than the wholistic functioning of the right.
hemisphere, that is, in the limbic system. Pribram conducted a series of experiments (1962) involving bilateral resection or ablation of the amygdala in the limbic system in pre-adolescent male rhesus monkeys. The outcomes, he says, raise the question of what the meaning of the idea of "memory" may actually be. The monkeys had established a hierarchy of emotional and physical dominance before any of them were operated on, and with minor changes the order stayed the same except for the position of the monkeys who had the operation. They were taken in order from the top of the original hierarchy. The monkeys operated on moved either to the top (becoming unpredictably aggressive and vicious) or to the bottom (becoming cringing or intermittently aggressive, and outcast). Further experiments in the series render it likely that severing the amygdala interfered in some subtle way with the registration and recall of successes and failures. (Reference to Green's diagrams, pp. 81 and 83 may be useful here).

This primate research is included here for three reasons. The first is to show the importance of the functioning of the organism as a whole system. The second is to call to attention the inter-relationship existing among the option-generating aspect of the transformative process, the evaluation step, and the feedback loop to be discussed later.

The third reason also points ahead, because the limbic system has been identified with the "four F" functions: feeding,
fighting, fleeing, and sexual activity. The limbic system is
called the emotional brain, because it apparently conducts these
functions. Karl Pribram's (1971:200-08) results with primates
are included here to show specifically that some kind of emotion-
al process is involved in the registration of results with the
monkeys. He also mentions one woman who had her amygdala severed
and describes how she could not tell whether she was hungry or not.
Pribram seemed to think this was an indicator in favor of a hypoth-
thesis that there would be a similar process in persons to that
which he noted in monkeys. He was quick to point out, however, that
we will be a long time in finding out, because amygdalectomy is not
a popular elective surgery!

In summary, then, I find that the purposes we choose for
our transformative process have characteristics which generate
criteria for evaluating options for the process. In the physical
realm, at least, these criteria and the evaluation process may or
may not become conscious. They may be registered deep within the
unconscious. The only essential is to choose a workable way that
does not interfere by its nature with moving toward the purpose.

g. Engaging in the process in physical experience: Trans-
formative process in the physical realm must take place in space-
time dimensions, in contrast to transformative process in emotional,
mental, and spiritual experience. Even an instantaneous experience
of healing takes place in a physical body, and at a given time. The development of a new skill that takes place over a period of time but mainly in the mind will be demonstrated at a given time by a three-dimensional body. This contrast is being drawn to follow up on the "inspiration/perspiration" discussion (p.77), and to point out a difference between the details in the four aspects of our experience. The experience of physical becoming always involves doing. It usually involves doing over a period of time as physiological change is made or skill develops by successive approximation.

An example in point that involves healing, but healing by the development of a physical skill, is the control of tension headaches (as opposed to migraine headaches), as reported by Budzynski, Stoyva, et al. (1970, 1973), cited by Alyce Green (1977). Earlier work by British researchers had shown that the resting levels of forehead muscles in tension-headache patients was higher, as measured by the EMG (electromyelograph), than that of people without the headaches. Budzynski and Stoyva (1970, 1973) and their associates at the University of Colorado, randomly divided headache sufferers into a treatment group that received feedback and understood what they were doing, a treatment group that received pseudo-feedback, and a no-treatment group who were told they would begin treatment in two months. All subjects kept charts of their headache activity for the whole period, and all subjects ultimately received
the full training. Overall results, checked by three- and eighteen-month follow-ups showed a 75% drop in headaches. The experimental design made it possible to state with a significant level of confidence that having real feedback about the level of tension in their forehead muscles was associated with success in controlling the headaches.

Verbal reports from the people who engaged in this much-reported experience showed them to be passing through four stages in their development. In the first stage they could not control the headaches; in the second, they were more aware of the tension preceding their headaches, and had begun learning to relax but could not stave off the headaches. By the third stage they increased their awareness of the tension; they could relax better, and were able to abort light-to-moderate headaches. In their final stage of development, they had learned to relax automatically in the face of stress, and had greatly reduced or eliminated their headaches (Green and Green, 1977:99-102).

Engaging in the process may be simply carrying out the inspiration of the first six steps of the model, but in our physical experience, it usually takes some time, and it always has its significant component in our bodies as they occupy space. Transformative power has been at work when the person is in better health or has developed a skill. Each of these experiences allows that person to move closer to his or her full potential.

h. Seeking feedback/dialogue in physical experience: The
feedback and or dialogue that is most productive in transformative process is the inner one, because the processes themselves are inner. This is at least as true of the physical realm as of the others. The outer dialogue with significant others, including teachers, is a counterpoint to the basic melody going on inside. The person has to be constantly checking at some level of consciousness, internally, whether the process as it is going on corresponds to the purpose-in-view. To learn a new behavior, however, we must raise it to consciousness. Elmer Green says:

In order to develop voluntary control of behavior, whether it be slowing the heart or playing the piccolo, it is necessary to become conscious of (or focus consciousness on) the present behavior and at the same time visualize (imagine) the desired behavior ....


But conscious feedback from a coach or a member of some medical profession, or from a piece of feedback equipment, has to be integrated into the inner circuit in order to help keep the process on track. Sensitive feedback from valued other persons has such special significance that the caring involved has sometimes been mistaken for being the most significant component.
A caring relationship does deepen that special awareness that gathers precise feedback and shares in such a way that it can become part of the inner feedback process. In fact, the caring is so often associated with quality feedback that we are likely to infer caring from the presence of quality feedback. The caring, real or inferred, can improve a person's hope entirely apart from how she or he is progressing. This caring effect is a special case of the effect of high expectation, and can have the same kind of positive results. On the other hand, the caring, apart from the accurate feedback, can mislead and have negative results. The effective component for the immediate change is the accurate feedback. For the long-term transformation, the caring may be more important since it is a kind of wholistic feedback. I will be exploring these issues in greater depth in the Fourth chapter, on Communicative Power, but the essential point is that outer feedback is principally of value as it fosters and helps the person to clarify the internal feedback.

Physical internal feedback can have emotional transformative effects, as Gendlin (1978) has shown in a fifteen-year program that teaches a kind of self- and peer-counselling at the University of Chicago, called "Focusing". The process he and his co-workers teach has several parts, but the central one is getting the felt sense of the problem. When the felt sense of the problem is just right, a
"shift" occurs which is like a visceral "aha!" He does not explore all the neuropsychological realities of the shift, but it has existential reality. It could be said to be a confirmation of an inner feedback process. Clearly the phenomenon stands at the artificial border we have established between physical and emotional transformative process.

The emergence of biofeedback arts and such therapies as Focusing both depend on and foster the "New Age" or paradigm-shift thinking about the potential of the human being. Technology has made biofeedback possible; advanced philosophical work and psychological thinking has made Focusing conceivable. Both are an integral part of the transformative process model being proposed here, and both contribute to the exercise of balance-in-flow.

i. Making shifts in process in physical experience: With the earlier discussion of "homeorhesis" (see p. 78), I have called attention to an experience of returning a process, after interruption, to the stage to which it would have progressed. Jantsch regards the exercise of homeorhesis in the regulation of inventive process (e.g., transformative change) as one hallmark of an evolutionary approach. Whether the exercise of transformative power is evolutionary is a question that lies beyond the scope of this study, but there does appear to be a correlation to man's exercise of evolution, as Jantsch describes it. He says:
... At the evolutionary level, we regulate energy flows and conversion processes between equivalents -- energy, matter, complexity, information (negentropy), motivation, etc. Regulation, within a framework of human scope -- in particular, regulation of the energy processes in the physical, social, and spiritual domains on our planet -- is man's chief contribution to evolution (Jantsch, 1975:94).

Regardless of its significance for evolution in general, the importance of regulating the transformative process by making shifts as we go can hardly be overemphasized. The data being fed back into the controlling of the process both from within the person and from beyond are useful. From within, old habits and patterns of motion and adaptation in response to stimuli well up and would claim the process back into the established feedback and correction loop, returning it to homeostasis. Both from within and from without, new data never encountered before are brought to experience by the new thrust of transformative process. From the world outside, feedback from other persons and from the transpersonal context impinges. Every bit of data unsettles the process to a lesser or larger degree, but every bit of data also holds within itself the potential to refine the process, if acted upon. Making appropriate shifts in the
process in response to feedback from inner and outer dialogues keeps it tuned to an unfolding vision of new potential.

A rather technical example of this step in the process is one described by Elmer Green (1977:31-32) in his discussion of muscle relaxation experiments. Here, openness to new data and willingness to change the flow of the process had been built in by the Greens' experimental stance. Elmer Green was trying to study subjects' capacity to achieve very low levels of muscle tension. In the process, he had an insight, which I shall describe, but he confirmed it only by taking the pains to make a very involved shift-in-process.

Green had instructed the subjects to alternate periods of visualization of muscular activity such as rowing a boat, with periods of relaxation. In the relaxation interims, several subjects were succeeding in reducing tension to levels that Elmer Green did not believe possible. The electromyelogram showed single spikes at seven-per-second intervals during episodes of zero and near-zero muscle tension.

Green and his associates first checked their apparatus; then they scoured the literature. They found that Basmajian, in *Muscles Alive*\(^8\) reported the same phenomenon, and identified the spikes with the firing of a single muscle unit (SMU). In fact, Basmajian had persevered and learned that people can learn to

control the firing of a single muscle unit. The Greens confirmed this finding.

The shift-in-process that Elmer Green made was to spend three weeks checking out every aspect of his apparatus, and to scour the literature to understand the surprising feedback. The outcome was to return to the process at the point where he had left off, but with a changed orientation toward the process.

A single muscle unit is one or more muscle fibers which are innervated by one nerve fibril. Not all subjects were able to learn to control SMU's but those who could they labelled single muscle unit geniuses (SMUGs). Both Basmajian and Green called attention to the potential offered by this capability for therapy in rehabilitation of non-functional muscles in paralysis and atrophy.

The shift-in-process for both Basmajian and Green included experimenting with what they had discovered to see whether people could learn to control an SMU voluntarily. Neither Green nor Basmajian reports (according to Green) having taken the next step and implemented the finding in actually doing therapy. Often it falls to someone else to carry out the implications of one person's shift-in-process.

Barbara Brown, writing in 1977 on clinical applications of biofeedback, refers to Elmer Green's and Basmajian's work and goes on to mention numerous clinical applications. She points out that
the visual or auditory path to the cortex can replace the normal pathways in the cerebrospinal network that have been injured when nerve damage is the cause of the non-functioning of a single muscle unit. Judging from her writing, the "art of biofeedback" has encountered and attempted to overcome some problems of patient fatigue and anxiety. She gives a protocol for using biofeedback that is designed to work with both.

It is interesting, especially in the context of shifts in process, that she takes trouble to point out that the fatigue a person may have to deal with while re-developing the functioning of a paralyzed or atrophied muscle will be mental, rather than narrowly physical. Her words are worth quoting directly:

"The significance of the dominant role of higher cerebral activities in relearning effective muscle activity is important to remember in rehabilitation therapy; moreover, the cerebral influence has been amply demonstrated in rehabilitation studies and has been reported. The important considerations are (1) that the patient can become easily fatigued as he continues to control specific motor unit activation (this is a mental, not physical fatigue, presumably from the cerebral effort involved in such exquisite
discrimination of cellular activity along with suppressing non-productive, habitual patterns), and (2) that the anxiety of effort actually prevents or interferes with motor unit activation. The problems of anxiety and fatigue that occur during the muscle rehabilitation process can be relieved by including relaxation training in the treatment program" (Brown, 1977:106).

It seems that therapists have picked up on the shifts in process which Green and Basmajian saw as possible and have also confronted the need for passive volition.

In reporting the work of therapists, Barbara Brown also points the attention of her readers to the shifts in process that they may need to help patients make in response to their own fatigue from suppressing old habit patterns, and from their anxiety about their own effort. Actually making shifts in process enables the transforming person to keep the process focused on the original purpose, but also helps the person to identify unfolding extensions of the original purpose, such as whole body relaxation, as they emerge.

**SUMMARY**

In concluding this "physical" part of the section on means, I am going to use the Simontons' process because it exemplifies in
physical experience each of the steps in the model. It also forecasts the application of the model in emotional and mental experience. Carl and Stephanie Matthews-Simonton base their support of persons dealing with cancer on their belief that psychological stress may result in cancer through the mind/body connection. Their approach is interdisciplinary and wholistic, working fully with the medical science specialists in their Ft. Worth hospital (Simonton, Matthews-Simonton, and Creighton, 1978).

The results have been encouraging. Of the 159 people with whom they worked who were medically expected to die within 12 months, 63 were alive after 6 years. Of these 63, 76% were at least 75% as active as they had been before their cancer was diagnosed. Of the nine people who involved themselves without reservations, taking part in the whole program, all are free of cancer process.

A reading of the authors' chapter 7 on a mind/body model of cancer development and recovery confirms the impression that the stresses that may lead to a person's contracting cancer are complex and compelling. That some persons have learned to overcome these stresses and are now free of cancer is striking. The authors' clinical observations identify a clustering of stresses in their patients' lives six to eighteen months before diagnosis. Those stresses most likely to precipitate cancer threaten some "role or relationship that is central to the individual's identify or . . . they pose a problem or situation from which there is apparently no escape" (1978:87). How have the Simontons and the team within
which they work helped people release into their lives the trans-
formative power that has reversed the situation for some?

The Simontons and Creighton preface their presentation of
a pattern for implementing the methods they use with two "crucial
suggestions" (1978:100), that the person promptly get: (1) medical
attention and (2) psychological support, to deal with the health
challenge. An overview of the various methods used in their Ft.
Worth program will give a foundation for comparing their methods
with the model proposed for the working of transformative power.
They ask their patients to examine the stresses in their lives in
the six-to-eighteen month period prior to the diagnosis, the belief
system that classifies these events as stresses for the person, and
(through reading) their beliefs about the will to live. They also
encourage the patients to see what the psychological benefits of
illness are for them. They teach them a relaxation process and
ask them to envision recovery, saying that it is a "central element"
in their approach (1978:97). In addition, they examine with the
patient very carefully the actual quality of their mental images.
Working with negative feelings, in counseling, and finding specific
ways to overcome harbored resentments is another phase of their
process. Patients are asked to set positive, life-enhancing goals
for reinforcing their expectancy that they can live to meet their
goals (1978:98). There are patient group meetings that reinforce
all of these learnings. The team also teaches ways of managing
pain and how to get exercise (if only in envisioning, when the
disease is advanced) and a sensible diet. The team's early ex-
periences with the dying of some of their patients taught them how
important it is to include in all aspects of the program the
emphasis on self-responsibility that pervades their work. Finally,
the family of the patient are helped to understand their own feel-
ings about the patient and the illness and are also helped to
establish open, loving communication.

How does this plan fit the model being explored here? Most
fundamentally, it recognizes the basic understanding that transfor-
mative process is triggered and carried out within the transforming
individual. Beyond that, what aspects of the Simontons' design for
their patients' process correlate with the model? First, the sensing
of a yearning has to follow the diagnosis of the disease, or the
patients would stay within the usual oncology routines. Second, in
fostering insight, the Simontons ask that the new patient read about
the mind/body connection as well as "think about" the stresses,
belief system, and benefits she or he sees in relation to having
cancer. Thid, in developing volition for change, the Simontons
give specific, limited encouragement to the patient's hope and ex-
plain the exact nature of the kind of passive volition needed.
Fourth, the therapeutic team, through the individual counseling,
group therapy, and work with the family help the patient to become
aware of the range of options such as diet, exercise, and envisioning
for the process ahead. Fifth, the Simonton team lays great stress upon envisioning of the purpose and does very detailed work with the patient to develop the quality of his envisioning. Sixth, the patient is supported in evaluating the options for process and is increasingly put in charge of doing so. Seventh, the person is expected to engage in the process on his or her own responsibility negotiating for needed supports from the environment as needed. Eighth, seeking feedback and dialogue is a regular part of the process as the Simontons see it; they keep in touch with the patients in their home locations and have them back for week-long dialogue sessions in the Ft. Worth setting. Ninth, making shifts in process such as improving aspects of the envisioning are standard operating procedure. There are numerous details that are specific to the disease they are working to overcome, but the central elements of the Simonton-Creighton methods seem to correspond to the model.

Their approach is not unheralded. In 1959, Eugene P. Pendergrass, M.D., then president of the American Cancer Society, said:

... There is solid evidence that the course of the disease in general is affected by emotional distress ... Thus we as doctors may begin to emphasize treatment of the patient as a whole as well as the disease from which the patient is suffering. We may learn how to influence general body systems and through them modify the neoplasm which resides within the body.
As we go forward . . . searching for new means of controlling growth both within the cell and through systemic influences it is my sincere hope that we can widen the quest to include the distinct possibility that within one's mind is a power capable of exerting forces which can either enhance or inhibit the progress of this disease. (Quoted in Simonton, et al., 1978:26-27. Emphasis added by the authors).

Similarly, but perhaps more personally, Norman Cousins speaks for himself, after he and his physician aided Cousins' healing:

Something else I have learned. I have learned never to under-estimate the capacity of the human mind and body to regenerate -- even when the prospects seem most wretched. The life-force may be the least understood force on earth. William James said that human beings tend to live too far within self-imposed limits. It is possible that these limits will recede when we respect more fully the natural drive of the human mind and body toward perfectibility and regeneration. Protecting and cherishing that natural drive may well represent the finest exercise of human freedom (Cousins, 1979:48).
With that summary of the mind/body connection from the physical
entrypoint, we may now turn to the emotional aspects of experience.

2. Means that Begin in Emotional Experience

The Jungian analyst John Sanford, in writing of the inner
movement toward wholeness said, "We do not 'decide' to become whole;
rather it is thrust upon us by the life force within us: (1977:16).
Carl Jung himself, looking back over his life's work wrote, " . .
In therapy the problem is always the whole person, never the symptom
alone. We must ask questions which challenge the whole personality"
(1963:117). In the context of this quote, it is clear that by per­
sonality Jung meant the Self. Frances Vaughan, a transpersonal
psychotherapist adds yet another aspect to wholeness when she writes,
"A holistic approach to psychological integration and well-being
cannot overlook the dynamic effects of belief systems on psychosoma­
tic health or the significance of spiritual development for the
health person" (Vaughan-Clark 1977:73). With these three statements
taken together, we begin our exploration of the model of transforma­
tive power being offered here in relation to emotional experience.
John Sanford is writing about physical health, but he sees it as
interpenetrating emotional well-being. Carl Jung calls attention
to the symptom as leading to the growth potential hidden in the uncon­
scious, i.e., elsewhere in the whole psyche. Frances Vaughan reminds
us of the influence of belief systems on the mind/body connection
and on spiritual transformation.
I will apply the nine-step model of transformative power in the person proposed on p.73 to two schemes of psychotherapy. One, essentially that used by Carl Jung, will be discussed as it is presented by Mary Louis von Frantz, an analyst who was a follower of Jung's. The other, still emerging in the context of the paradigm shift (see chapter 1) is called "transpersonal". It is wholistic, and sees persons as capable of being fully healed only when they see themselves in their largest settings. Frances Vaughan and Roger Walsh are two psychotherapists who practice in the transpersonal school, and their writings are the basis for the interpretation of it given here. Transpersonal psychology has drawn on the view of the person and therapeutic process of Jung, but has also gathered insights from Gestalt psychotherapy, psychedelic (mind expanding drug) therapy, and the Eastern mystical traditions.

I chose these two therapeutic models for three reasons. First, both give attention and full credence to the full range of developmental potential that I am affirming. Both the Jungians and the transpersonal psychologists expect people to deal with physical, emotional, mental, and spiritual development in their transformative process. Second, both emphasize the productive and inescapable interrelatedness of all aspects of the person. Spiritual matters, they find, can interfere with physical healing, for instance. And third, both Jungians and transpersonal psychologists see the ultimate wisdom for transformation already at work in (and through) every person.
This last common belief especially concerns me here, because the view that there is transformative power within the person, creating a life-long urge for growth helps keep the distinction clear between transformative and communicative power. If a person needs a psychotherapist to carry on his or her process of full becoming in emotional experience, then that aspect of the developmental process would be a subset of communicative power. Communicative power, as we have seen, arises within any group, no matter how small, and the dialogue between a psychotherapist and a client is one kind of "community". More will be said about this kind of communicative process in the section on communicative power. For now, it is only important to note that both Jungian and transpersonal psychologists are agreed that the urge that drives transformative power is a natural part of human beings, and operates from within.

Before launching the comparison of these two psychotherapies to the nine-step model, a brief description of the way each of them views the human being is in order. Carl Jung's own writing on the subject is found in many of his works; for a briefer summary, June Singer's writing in *Boundaries of the Soul* (1972, Ch. 3) serves. Roger Walsh and Frances Vaughan have set forth their summary in an article entitled, "Beyond the Ego: Toward Transpersonal Models of the Person and Psychotherapy: (1980).
In Jung's view, the unconscious of every individual person is an interacting blend of personal contents in the personal unconscious, and universal forms or modes of experience or transpersonal contents, in the collective unconscious. The conscious mind is that part of the Self that knows that it knows. In Jung's words, the distinction between the personal and collective unconscious is this: "Whereas the contents of the personal unconscious are acquired during the individual's lifetime, the contents of the collective unconscious are invariably archetypes that were present from the beginning" (1958:6). There is a border area between the conscious and any unconscious that is rather like the area indicated by the wavy line in the Greens' model (see p. 81). Freud called it the pre-conscious. There is a constant flow of influence between these divisions, Jung believed. He saw, in himself and in the reports of his clients, other forms existing from the beginning than just the basic drives of hunger and sex that Freud found. He termed these forms for receiving life experience archetypes, but he saw them as being very deeply rooted in the unconscious. So deeply rooted, in fact, that no person could fully raise all their contents to consciousness.

Among the archetypes, the "shadow" or dark side of the Self seemed to him especially difficult to work with, but especially important because its projections out into life are harmful. He said that the dark characteristics of a person have a kind of autonomy
(as do all archetypes) and a possessive quality. To discover these characteristics within the Self is a "moral achievement beyond the ordinary" (1958:7). The reason is that the resistance is very stubborn and takes the form of perceiving that other people are the very way that the ego is so unwilling to admit that the ego itself actually is.

The inner flow of meaning shapes the individual person's life experience, and is beyond his control to the extent that the unconscious part of it stays beyond awareness. The life-long process of inner dialogue between the conscious and unconscious by which we gradually bring to consciousness a significant portion of our unconscious contents and integrate them into our conscious lives Jung called "individuation".

Just as Jung had begun to elaborate his psychology as he saw needed additions to the psychology developed by Freud, so Walsh and Vaughan and other transpersonalists have been moved to define their new psychology to meet lacks in older models. Walsh and Vaughan (1980) use four dimensions in their model of the person: consciousness, conditioning, personality, and identify. They see ordinary consciousness as being a "defensively contracted state" (1980, p.10). However, in their writings surveyed for this study (Vaughan, 1973, 1977, 1979a, 1979b; Walsh, 1976, 1978, 1979; and Walsh and Vaughan, 1980b), they seem to give much less emphasis to the dark side of the unconscious than the Jungians I have investigated (Jung, 1958, 1963, 1964; Sanford, 1977; Singer, 1972, 1976; Wickes, 1963).
For the transpersonalists, there are a range of states other than the "defensively contracted state" (loc. cit.) of consciousness that we are wont to call "normal". They cite the collection of thirty-five articles gathered by Charles Tart in *Altered States of Consciousness* (1969) as confirmation. Some altered states are functionally useful for emotional or physical healing, or for problem solving, like hypnagogic reverie. Some are genuinely higher states, valuable to transpersonally oriented people in their own right, but also valuable because they confer a lasting poise. Walsh and Vaughan see the usual conditioning we receive as we become part of society as being a snare, but one which can be escaped through medication (Goleman, 1977) among other disciplines. A person can become aware of "attachment", for instance. Among the several kinds of attachment Walsh and Vaughan mention are desire for success in reaching goals or pride in relationship, but they stress that any kind of attachment can result in pain. One common attachment they find is to a particular emotional process. Suffering and a sense of unworthiness is an attachment often experienced as essential in the early stages of a transformative process, they write (1980:12-13).

The meaning Walsh and Vaughan use for "personality" is narrower than the one Jung implied in the quote at the start of this section. They see it as only one aspect of a person's whole being.
An individual can modify personality, but Walsh and Vaughan believe that it is more freeing to move beyond identifying with personality and the dramas of one's own or others' personalities.

The culminating concept for Walsh and Vaughan is identity. They write, "Here identification is defined as the process by which something is experienced as self" (1980:13). The problem is that since we do identify, we sense all reality from within the position we have taken. We are hypnotized by our present experience, not perceiving that there is any other reality. Unless we open our identification to review, we are bound within a view of reality that blocks transformation. The path toward disidentification is long, and involves progressive awareness of more and more levels of identification, a process of dehypnosis. "Finally, awareness no longer identifies exclusively with anything. This represents a radical and enduring shift in consciousness known by various names such as enlightenment or liberation: (1980:16). The emphasis here is on "exclusively"; identification is with a framework that transcends exclusivity.

Here, within the means that begin in emotional experience, we have perhaps the first explicit statements of the "emancipatory" interest articulated by Habermas. He called the interest "cognitive", and as we shall see again in the mental and spiritual sections following, there are important cognitive elements. The emancipatory interest is concerned with all the nuances of inward life, however, and emotions are indicators. Liberation is seen by transpersonal
psychology as an emancipation from all attachments. Vaughan points out that there must be a shift from seeing Self as object to seeing Self as subject (1977:76), in much the same way that Habermas did in his study of Freud (1971). When disidentification is complete, self-transcendence comes. The person is then capable of experiencing his or her identity with all reality. Emancipation in Jungian psychology would be the gradually developing product of the individuation process. Jung is explicit that by the very nature of the collective unconscious no individual could ever fathom all the depths of it that lie within. He did, however, have a stream of experiences of transpersonal reality himself (1963) and found them in the lives of his patients.

One more prefatory note is called for. The entire transformative power section on means that begin in emotional experience is based on an assumption that emotional transformation essentially depends on inner dialogue that involves the whole person. That assumption is so at variance with one productive mainstream of thinking about emotional illness that the difference needs to be recognized. Much practice in counseling and in mental health centers is based on the assumption that the individual is fundamentally wholesome but becomes emotionally disturbed in response to (or in protest against) "craziness" or distortion in the situation surrounding her or him. One representation of this model of mental illness is the idea that the disturbed person in a family is the scapegoat
(or sacrifice) for the derangement of the family system. Szasz (The Myth of Mental Illness, 1974) and Satir (Peoplemaking, 1972) are popular and helpful exponents of this point of view.

They share with Jungian and transpersonal psychology their belief in the innate striving for wellness of individual humans. Both also share a belief that inner blockages may result in distortions in the outer situation. The difference comes at two related points. One is that the situational model sees the "community" as the critical variable; the other is that this view calls for intervention in the "community" (family, classroom, gang or club) rather than in the inner dialogue with the unconscious.

The first reason, then, for not including examples from proponents of this model here is that they are concerned with community and would be more appropriately dealt with in the section of this work on communicative power. The second reason is dependent on the first. It is that the nine steps being considered here have to do with transformative power at work within the individual.

In this introduction to means in the emotional realm I have touched on the reasons for choosing the Jungian and transpersonal psychologies to compare to the nine-step model, and have described briefly the view of the person inherent in each. Now let us consider how well the model fits the process of emotional transformation as seen by each of these psychologies. The steps, and their correlates in emotional process are: (1) sensing a
yearning or dis-ease, becoming aware of some emotional discomfort; 
(2) having an insight about what change is desired or possible; (3) 
developing volition for change, committing to engage with the diff-
iculty or opportunity; (4) generating options for process, looking 
into ways of going about the change; (5) envisioning the purpose, 
allowing the inner wisdom or health into awareness; (6) evaluating 
the options for going about the change in relation to one's own 
history and hope; (7) engaging in the process, attending inwardly 
and enacting in outer life what one becomes aware of; (8) seeking 
feedback/dialogue inwardly and with others; and (9) making shifts in 
the process to respond to what is sensed in feedback or dialogue.

a. Sensing a yearning or dis-ease in emotional experience: 
Emotional discomfort comes in many forms. As Singer says, it may 
be only that the person "has looked at himself and does not like the 
person he has become, and that he believes that somewhere there is in 
him the possibility of being another sort of person, the one he was 
meant to be" (1972:32). Mary Louise von Franz, another Jungian 
analyst, says that the process of individuation begins with some 
kind of wounding that works like a "call" although the person may not 
recognize it as one (1964:169). For some people, who have been 
socialized all too well to ignore their emotions, physical illness 
or just plain deadly boredom may be the signal (Hutschnecker, 1951; 
Frances Vaughan speaks of the sensing step at the beginning of each of her sections on the stages of development (identification, disidentification, and self-transcendence). In discussing meditation as a way of opening up, in her section on identification, and she writes, "The awakening to a deeper sense of oneself associated with meditation may also involve painful awareness of neurotic patterns of behavior and aloneness" (1977:74). Whatever the stimulus, the person begins to be aware of an urge to change that is somehow related to him or herself.

b. Having an insight in emotional experience: The insight that is the source of transformative power in our emotional experience is an emerging feeling in awareness of a direction to move. It may be overlaid or infused with a clear cognitive impression, but it is not validated by cognitive insight. Words may fail us, but we feel quite different after an emotional insight. In the writing of both the Jungians and the transpersonal therapists, this step quite often appears as the person's decision to seek psychotherapy. Some examples are the paragraphs in von Franz (1964) and in Jung's writing about himself (1963) in which the decision to turn and face the shadowy awareness that all is not as one would wish is described. "There is only one thing that seems to work; and that is to turn directly toward the approaching darkness without prejudice and totally naively . . . try to find out what its secret aim is, and what it wants from you" (1964:170). The person is suddenly aware that a
critique from the unconscious is in order, perhaps in part because a series of attempts to deal with the uneasy feeling as if the cause were "out there" or only in the body have failed.

One of the places that Singer deals with the insight step is in her discussion of the mask archetype (1972:209,ff). Jungians call it the "persona" and Singer describes it as the two-dimensional individuality having to do with roles, statuses, clothing and possessions. To the extent that the ego, the conscious "I" sees itself as being identical with the conscious persona it will be prideful and can be badly hurt. Even within the ego, though, there is a deeper individuality that can stand separate, and the insight that this is so is the immediate source of transformative power in an individual. Singer provides an example of one young woman's dream that shows the shallowness of the mask, and at the same time reveals her beginning sense of an individuality apart from it. The dreamer reported: "I came . . . in a beautiful gown of black velvet with a high neck and long sleeves, but when I turned around there was no dress at all in back, just bare skin from top to bottom" (1972:209). In this case the insight came in the form of a dream, but it may come silently slipping into awareness in a number of ways, starting a process of personal emotional transformation.

c. Developing volition for change in emotional experience: Most people have experienced at some time the futility of ordering their emotions to change, or the hopelessness of responding to
someone else's command to not get upset. We can scarecely compel our emotions, but in a passive mode of consciousness like that of meditation we can open up the flow of data to ourselves. This mode is as well suited to inner change as the active mode is to changing objects like machinery and reports. "Essentially, the state is one of passive volition, characterized by a willingness to allow things to happen" Vaughan writes (1977:75).

Following on her discussion of insight that provides motivation for change, von Franz begins to deal with the need for a steady volition to deal with inner resistance. In the case of work with the shadow, which is the stage of individuation that Jungians tend to see as the first one, resistance to change even after the person has decided to try, often comes in the familiar way of the pot calling the kettle black. We most readily see in others those forms of the shadow we most reject in ourselves. The task of volition is to maintain a relaxed attention to the unwelcome contents of the unconscious. This is very hard to do. After dealing with sensing and insight in the first two stages of transformative process, Vaughan speaks of the increased tension, anxiety, and even despair that people typically have after their initial insight (1977:75, 77).

Both kinds of therapists whose writings I am working from have principally experienced people, including themselves (Singer, 1972; Walsh, 1976), who want the support of a therapist to undertake the task. Yet both groups affirm the need for everyone to
have access to the theory and methods to do it for themselves. Singer asserts in the introduction to *Boundaries of the Soul* (1972), that although the potential for individuation is built into everyone, there are not enough resources to afford support for that venture for more than a few via psychoanalysis. There were, in 1972, only about five hundred Jungian analysts in the world. Even the proportion of all psychotherapists, of whatever persuasion, is very low in comparison to the number of people whose inner press for individuation has made them sick. Hutschnecker (1951) sees emotional and physical sickness as combined and says that estimates of the proportion of people who are sick range as high as half of all people.

One way of dealing with the disproportion between care givers and need is to form groups for joint work. Singer suggests that groups often grow up to respond to the need people feel in their growth process. There is a fairly extensive network of Centerpoint groups which are explicitly Jungian in which people are sharing their individuation experience. The kind of process they use is similar to those to be discussed in the next chapter, on communicative power.

None of the writers I have cited mentions the all-too-obvious problem that psychotherapy is quite expensive. In all fairness it should be noted, though, that it is less expensive than surgery, chemotherapy and other procedures which may actually be alternatives.
d. Generating options for process in emotional experience:
Perhaps the variety of options that exist for progress in transformative emotional process is an indicator of the difficulty of maintaining open connections between the conscious and the unconscious. A more likely probability is that the well-nigh endless variety of personal styles calls for, and has generated, the assortment of ways of going about it. Our connection to the numinous, or the substrate of spirit, in experience is through the unconscious. Thus, the whole range of behaviors Gowan (1974) describes provide access. He has grouped them loosely into trance, art, and creativity.

Vaughan mentions (1977:75) dreamwork, gestalt awareness, imagery, confrontation (with unintended behaviors), and unconditional position regard (from the therapist) as facilitating the encounter of the person with his or her own unconscious. At the level of the emergence of the transpersonal self she mentions meditation, dream work, guided fantasy, art, and music.

Singer mentions a similar variety of options that she may put at the disposal of an analysand. She describes herself as therapist, tuning to the inner world of a person needing to get in better touch with her own unconscious in the case of a girl called Maureen. The girl had been given crayons to use in adjunctive therapy in a mental hospital and had expressed in some small way her enjoyment of them. Singer gave her crayons just to express whatever came to her the ground of being (Gowan, 1975:1).
and helped her to use what she drew to make the contact the young woman needed. For another patient, an occupational therapist, Singer guessed that the expertise he felt he had in painting would carry him past his own compulsive need to concentrate on doing everything very well and allow him to use the medium to express what lay hidden from him. In relation to still another person, Singer took the picture the person had drawn of herself in a cage, and she, Singer, assumed the hunched up posture the patient had drawn. What emerged was that the cage in the picture (which was not drawn in perspective) was actually only a frame. Although she had her eyes closed as she sat in it, when she opened them, both literally and figuratively, she was not caged at all. The patient's physical, emotional and mental identification with her art production and the revelation of the unreality of the bonds it claimed truly freed her to another whole level of becoming (1972, chapter 12). All of these excursions into imagination come within the general category of Jung's "active imagination", in that they are to some extent directed by the person. Active imagination is quite a different option from self-propelling fantasy, although both have their part to play for different people in different ways.

Dreams may come uninvited and unguided by the conscious mind, or they may be to some extent guided. In the process of individuation, we may have a developmental need that the conscious self, the ego, wants to understand better but has come to a halt on. Dream
incubation is a way of directing the flow of unconscious activity toward a general area of concern. What specific contents will emerge does not seem to be under control, but the symbols often provide direct emotional illumination without recourse to involved mental process. An example comes from a time when I was becoming aware of the complexities of the development of the animus or male principle. I wrote out a basic question, "I need to know more about the hindrances to my animus from my unconscious", and then explored some aspects of what they might be, just letting my mind rove over the possibilities. "Are my connections as a family member holding me back?" "What are some of the roles I play that bind my animus?"

The dream that came had me paying off the young man who was taking care of my wild meadow . . . a 12' by 12' miniature complete with wild grasses and small wild flowers. I didn't have the right change, although I had an assortment of kinds of money, such as plastic trapezoids with portraits of famous people on them, which are not known as currency. He wanted his pay in coin, so I went indoors. "Indoors" was a miniature replica of my grandmother's house. The upstairs hall was so narrow that I had to get down on hands and knees to avoid falling into the stairwell.

The dream helped me to focus on some of the ways I tend to reduce my insight and hem in my masculine energies. It did not give me specific examples, but rather gave the feel of the limitations I make. Especially, I felt how crowded the space I have inherited
from my female relatives is. I couldn't rise to my full height within it. The work that my employee, (the animus), the male character in the dream, could do for me was circumscribed by the size of the task, as I had planned it, and the pay I was offering him was phoney.

From these examples, it may be seen that there is a range of balances between control by the conscious and total spontaneity in the options for using imagery in emotional development.

From the preceding description, from Singer's accounts, and from other sources, it seems correct to infer that the generation of options is integrally related to the whole process and to the whole reality of the person in the process. Especially in emotional experience, generating options may be done very quickly and may flow without interruption into envisioning the purpose. In fact, one may not actually wait, in emotional experience, until after envisioning the purpose to evaluate, but may need to select an option in order to envision the purpose in its full emotional meaning.

e. Envisioning the purpose in emotional experience: Emotional transformative power in humans working through envisioning seems to have endless application. The record extends from the Bible to the National Enquirer news sheet. A significant difference from the envisioning in physical experience needs to be noted,
however, In the case of physical transformation, often the ego is the leader in the balance between the conscious and the unconscious. In emotional transformation, the ego is the follower, trying to learn how to work out a better relationship with the unconscious. von Franz puts it this way:

... The individuation process is more than a coming to terms between the inborn germ of wholeness and the outer acts of fate. Its subjective experience conveys the feeling that some supra-personal force is actively interfering in a creative way. One sometimes feels that the unconscious is leading the way in accordance with a secret design (1964:164).

Although the conscious must somehow be brought to give attention, to ask, the unconscious holds a plan that is so little realized that it holds a series of surprises.

Accordingly, and especially in emotional experience, the danger of over-controlling by the conscious ego is vivid. von Franz goes on in the next paragraph, "The ego must be able to listen attentively and to give itself, without any further design or purpose, to that inner urge toward growth" (loc. cit.). Vaughan concurs: "Learning to hold the ego in abeyance, to have it stand aside in order to get in touch with a deeper level of experience, takes practice in concentration, and a subtle, skillful exercise of the will" (1979a:30).
The envisioning of the purpose may simply stand alone, without any other part of the process, although if it does, the full force of transformative power may not be felt in the emotional life of the person who has the experience. The experience may function in the person's life as a solitary insight would, without actually transforming that person's emotional life. Indeed, Jung warns that such an experience may have a negative aftereffect if the person does not respond to it by incorporating it into his life process in some change. His words come from his autobiographical account of his experience in analyzing his own unconscious contents:

... I took great care to try to understand every single image, every item of my psychic inventory, ... and, above all, to realize them in actual life. That is what we usually neglect to do. We allow the images to rise up, and maybe we wonder about them, but that is all. We do not take the trouble to understand them, let alone draw ethical conclusions from them. This stopping-short conjures up the negative effects of the unconscious (1963:192).

To weave the insights of a solitary experience of envisioning a purpose for emotional transformation into daily life may take titanic efforts for the person directly involved. Such an effort may also be resisted even to the point of self-destructive behavior.
by others closely associated with the transforming person. For example, if two or more people are bound into a family system and one decides to change a pattern of dependency, others who have helped to form that pattern may be so profoundly threatened that their resistance may result in a life threatening illness or suicide gestures. The interpersonal structures of our lives are fully as complex as the inner workings of each of us. Even so, a single dream in which a transforming experience is envisioned may give a subtle and lasting shift in the emotional life of the person who has it. It can give, as I said earlier, the "inspiration" without the "perspiration".

A rather special example from the dream of a talented woman in the middle of life shows the power of an envisioned purpose and also some of the delicious humor that pops up in dreams. The woman had had a biopsy which had been interpreted as indicating the need for a mastectomy. She had to wait in the hospital for two days until the day when there would be room for her surgery in the fully-scheduled surgical suite. The biopsy had left her breast black and blue and looking like a wounded bird; her loving but distant family was beyond her reach. There was no one close who knew of her pain and also knew enough to cradle her in it. She fell asleep, and these are her words:

My mother's mother was there. She was the most loving person ever, and there she was, sitting on the porch of the house where we lived in the
summer. I was a child, and I brought her
a sick bird. I curled up in her lap, and
childlike, I asked her to "Kiss it and make
it well". She carried me indoors, and put
me in my bed, but all at once I was grown
and in my bed in the hospital.

The Grandmother went and got all the people
in my childhood who loved me, and who have died.
She brought them into the room, one by one:
Grandfather, my father and his brother, each of
them holding a child of theirs who died. Then
all at once, my dog, Duke, from childhood, just
flew into that hospital room against all the
rules, and jumped up on the bed beside me. And
finally, my horse, Dick, who was a foal the year
I was born came ambling in. He and I were raised
together (personal communication).
The woman woke up laughing, and crying a bit, but cared for by the
best of mothering care. As she said later, "Grandmother created a
cocoon of love around that bed!" That day in the hospital was not
an easy one, nor were those that followed, but the feeling of being
wrapped in loving care endured throughout her hospital stay. Al-
though she was not involved in an ongoing conscious effort to include
her visions from dreams in the transformation of her daily life, the
caring she experienced at that time is still a landmark in her emotional experience.

The presentations of the unconscious may perhaps be seen as "purposes" of the psyche. They are not readily available to consciousness, but they do function in the ways defined in this study. That is, they (1) shape the process of experience, and (2) they unfold into other purposes in developing ongoing potential.

In shaping the process of experience, the purposes of the unconscious have two roles which interact so intimately as to be nearly indistinguishable. On the one hand, unconscious purposes erupt in overt acts that the conscious ego knows it did not choose. Such experiences as the "Freudian" slip and remarks that surprise the speaker are among the roles the unconscious plays in shaping experience. On the other hand, unconscious purposes color all the perceptions of the conscious mind. This action of the unconscious is far more difficult to catch because the conscious mind is entirely infused by the unconscious purpose. Through this role of the unconscious, experience is shaped by the way all of life is seen.

Perhaps equally subtle, and certainly as elusive, is the second function of the purposes of the psyche, that of guiding the formation of the ever-unfolding conscious purposes of the person. In some sense, this function of the psyche with regard to purpose formation is a compound of the two aspects described above for the shaping of experience. It influences both acts and attitudes.
Here, however, it is having that influence in relation to purposes, and in reverse order. A purpose will seem like a good idea (desirable, and possible) according to the set provided by the unconscious, and the person will act effectively to carry it out according, in some measure, to the overt expression the unconscious promotes.

Why should we think about the "purposes" of the unconscious mind in this discussion of transformative power? Precisely because unless they are faithfully attended to, they contribute mightily to our sense of powerless-ness! We hesitate to set out for purposes we might indeed be capable of, because our "shadow" darkens our hopes. We fail when we "thought" we were sure to succeed, because for some (unconscious) reason, we just did not do what we consciously expected to. When we consciously confront and interact ethically with the unconscious, it becomes a powerful ally. We then sense we can move toward our purposes with all our hearts and minds.

Further consideration of the effects of envisioning purposes must be left to the sub-section "g" on engaging in the process. The main points that have been affirmed in this subsection are four: (a) envisioning the purpose in any of the ways suggested previously in the sub-section on options begins to implement the action of transformative power; (b) the person acting must not allow his or her ego to over-control the process; (c) for the fullest benefit to ensue, the person must integrate the envisioning in life process; and (d)
the purposes of the unconscious play vital roles in our experience of personal power.

Although each of these points shows indirectly a relation between envisioning the purpose and various other steps in the transformative process, envisioning the purpose can have great power even standing alone. It clarifies some aspect of life experience. One of the matters it may clarify is the relative value of the various options which may have been generated to aid the process.

f. Evaluating the options for change in emotional experience: Evaluating the possible ways of going about the process is of course quite different from evaluating the initial insight or later imagery as to the validity of its content. There is always the danger that what appears to be a grand new insight is really a projection cloaked in that excess of emotion that often marks an illusion. Sorting this question out is really the work of the feedback and dialogue step. The criteria for evaluating options for the process have to do with the interaction between the purpose and the person.

Vaughan puts the issue in this way, "... the client is presumed to know best, at a deep level, what he or she needs for further growth and self-healing and the therapist simply facilitates the process" (1977, p. 76). As we noted earlier, with regard to Singer's facilitating the use of active imagination by her clients, her role is to tune in to the precise history of the person working
and let them use their own resources. In the three cases given by Singer (1974), the resources were different forms of art. Jung, himself, found that many people can use dreams effectively, although he repeatedly included words of caution lest the ego be overwhelmed by the unconscious. When people choose to help their own transformative process without benefit of a therapist, they need to learn from books or in groups how to evaluate the options they may have found out about in the same places. Thus far we have looked at the history of the person as the criterion for evaluating options, but the purpose or hope the person has also influenced the choice.

References on this point are scarce; I am not aware of any except in Jung’s own story in Memories, Dreams, Reflections (1963). He elected to use any images at all that his unconscious presented him. His hope seems to have been to offer his discoveries for the assistance of all people. His personal history was filled with strengthening experiences that gave him understanding and balance. Thus, we can see that his radical openness, and his use of all possible options fit well the high hope and the sturdy history of this remarkable man. He was undertaking the individuation process on his own, just as many people who decide to do it today must. The difference is that we have his experience as a major resource. The words just before his comment that he tried to understand every single image give some idea of the complexity and riskiness of the task as he saw it: "My science was the only way I had of extricating
myself from that chaos. Otherwise the material would have trapped me in its thicket, strangled me like jungle creepers" (Jung, 1963: 192).

My own experience is the only other commentary I can cite. As I try to evaluate all the options I am aware of in any cycle of transformative process, I do bring my history of emotional experience to bear. I also relate my present hope or purpose, however, small, to the decision. When I am faced with emotional discomfort, I have learned that it is a chance to further the developmental transformation I am in. Usually, I keep enough balance to look over my choices. If it is late at night, or if I am just anxious and not even sure what the real problem is, I am likely to incubate a dream. If I want to see how different aspects of the situation interact, I may make a drawing. I choose a different color for each aspect, and a shape that seems expressive to me and draw how I feel. The colors and shapes I choose often lead to some way of having them form a design together that brings a sense of rightness. If I am conscious of having a lot of tension in my body, I may pick a piece of music that matches the mood I sense and then act out the feelings in dance. This gives my unconscious a chance to express in action without hurting me or anyone else. A part of me watches this process to evaluate the outcomes, but that kind of evaluating belongs in the feedback and dialogue sub-section, "h", p.164.
My purpose in outlining the criteria I personally use in selecting an option for any particular bit of transformative process is to show how such criteria can interact with one person's history and unfolding hopes. I note that in describing the process from the inside out, I have paid attention to my own transient "here and now" states as well as to what I am capable of doing and what my immediate purpose is. I mentioned attending to a physical sign, "tension in my body", an emotional sign, "just anxious", and a mental sign", see how the different aspects of the situation interact", and no spiritual sign. I am aware that meditation and the particular quest represented by this dissertation are options that I chose in relation to what I now see as having been spiritual signs, such as a vague sense of dislocation in my life, and some times of profound exaltation. I note also that in identifying these different states that form part of my criteria for choosing an option in emotional transformative process, I have mentioned physical, mental, and now, spiritual experience, as well as the emotional state of being "anxious". This seems appropriate to me in view of the holistic nature of the organism involved!

In summary of evaluating options for transformative process in emotional experience, the three points that emerge are: (1) the life history of intellectual and expressional experience of the person gives one cluster of criteria, (2) the present physical, emotional, mental and spiritual states of the person generate another
set of criteria, and (3) the purpose that the person is hoping to move toward yields certain other criteria. Now, we may turn to a discussion of actually engaging in the process.

g. Engaging in the process in emotional experience: Thus far we have separated with some care other steps in the process of experiencing transformative power from the present one in order to clarify their contents and their effects. The separation might be considered artificial if it were not for the fact that in accounts of the working of transformative power in emotional growth, such as von Franz' description of dealing with the shadow (1964), and Vaughan's outline of the progress of the first two stages of transpersonal therapy (1977, 1979b), most of the nine steps can be identified rather readily. Also, since each step does have some measure of influence on the outcomes, leaving out or mis-using one or more is likely to alter the shape of the process.

Still, in the flow of feeling life, all the steps may be experienced nearly at once. Even when there is delay, or steps can be felt separately, there are echoes. For instance, the positive or negative impact of the initial insight may lend a distinctive feeling tone to the whole process. Or, whether the volition was developed out of an approach or an avoidance motivation can make the difference between feeling like a loser recovering or a winner going on to a new triumph. Sometimes, too, the option chosen for the process (like dance or drawing) can become so absorbing that the
subtle working of transformative power through it is all but ignored. Certainly feedback and dialogue can be ubiquitous and usually infuse engaging in the process.

Although other points need to be made about engaging in the process, the salient one is that for transformative power to be experienced in a positive way in emotional life (and probably in life at all!) it must change behavior. Jung is unequivocal on this point, as the earlier quote emphasizes (see pp. 151).

He reiterates:

"It is equally a grave mistake to think that it is enough to gain some understanding of the images and that knowledge and here make a half. Insight into them must be converted into an ethical obligation. Not do so is to fall prey to the power principle, and this produces dangerous effects which are destructive not only to others but even to the knower. The images of the unconscious place a great responsibility upon a man. Failure to understand them, or a shirking of ethical responsibility, deprives him of his wholeness and imposes a painful fragmentariness on his life" (1963:192-193).

Jung is clear that engaging in the process involves responsibility.
From the somewhat different conceptual framework of transpersonal psychology, the message is the same. The client has responsibility for disidentifying from illusory contents of consciousness, and it is only through accepting this responsibility that she or he can move toward letting go of all exclusive identification (Walsh and Vaughan, 1980).

Further, in my own experience of the dream in which several elements were miniaturized or artificial and I sensed the urging to allow a wider scope to my masculine energies (see p.148), the responsibility to act was mine. The dissertation process offers me the opportunity to spell out some of my insights in a systematic way. My inheritance, symbolized in the dream by my grandmother's house, has led me to deny intellectual insights in the past, with destructive results. At the time I had the dream, I was stalling before undertaking the next section of the dissertation. The responsibility for action on my part was clear, as I thought over the dream. Both attending to the dream by taking the trouble to remember it and write it down, and considering its implications in my life are part of "engaging in the process”.

As to the other points, it needs to be said that the engaging step is evanescent, and spiral, and risky in emotional experience. The flickering moment of emotional awareness may be short or long, but once it is gone, it is difficult to recreate. Words fail us.
Pictures that are worth a thousand words are awfully hard to draw. Dance, as expressive as it is, has so many nuances that it is nearly as hard to recreate as emotion. Still, if we are intent on allowing the maximum force of transformative power within us, we need some record. Whatever method we choose can yield a similar range of benefits, because all are a means of objectifying the experience. The record helps us seek dialogue - with ourselves ("No, it wasn't just like that, . . .") and with others ("Now, by that do you mean . . . ?") The record helps us reflect later on where we have been, and it helps us see now where we want to go next. Both Jung (1963) and Singer (1972) point out that recording helps in the dialogue by making available to the therapist aspects of the experience that are hidden from the client by resistance of the ego to becoming aware of contents that may upset its ways.

Although emotions are evanescent, the person having them is a whole being within whom emotions recur, and they will do so on the same level, of feeling fine, or on a downward spiral unless some intervention is made. On the other hand, a transformative process in emotions will be an upward spiral. One psychologist observed that if he missed something going by that seemed important and did not intervene, he did not despair, because he knew it would come by again.\footnote{John Carter, personal communication, 1980.} The spiral experience exists only when we are involved in a transformative process; otherwise we would be going in circles.

Finally, it is important to stress that transformative power is Power, and taking hold of it is risky. A person whose ego
is not well developed must first build that ego to avoid being engulfed by the power in the unconscious (von Franz, 1964; Singer, 1972; Gowan, 1975; Vaughan, 1977; Walsh and Vaughan, 1980). Dreams may tell of the awesomeness of the experience of confrontation with such power: the balcony on which one stands floats loose from the building and from the earth as one rises toward being engulfed in balls of fire (Singer, 1972), or the force which draws one through the air toward a confrontation with a vast mirror can still be felt in waking hours (personal communication). To channel this colossal power productively, we need to build strong supports and establish safeguards. Some supports and safeguards are the topic of the next sub-section, on inner and outer feedback and dialogue.

Let us summarize, now, the points concerning engaging in the process: (a) it includes ethical responsibility for enacting in outer life the inner awareness that appears; (b) it involves making some kind of a record to gain optimum effectiveness; (c) it is a spiral process; and (d) it is risky because the power is very great.

h. Seeking feedback and/or dialogue in emotional experience: Feedback loops simply give information; dialogues analyze, evaluate, and propose. In emotional experience, an inner feedback loop may be direct ("My palms are sweating"), or externally mediated as in biofeedback ("There goes the yellow light on the temperature trainer"). An outer feedback loop is here defined as one involving another person ("You looked sad when you said that"). An inner dialogue about
emotional experience must be largely, although not entirely, mental. The mental components might be analytical ("What else gives me that feeling?") , evaluative ("Now that feels better!") , proposing ("I'm going to add that to the list, but not get involved for now") , or cognitive in other ways. Gendlin (1962, 1978) has provided a theoretical framework and a practice model to establish the validity of a fully emotional inner dialogue process which he calls "focusing". Outer dialogue about emotional process might be any kind of exchange that is centered on someone's emotions, whether those of the person initiating the use of transformative power or those of the one invited into the dialogue.

The preceding paragraph of definition and instances belie the emotional quality of feedback and dialogue. While feedback itself is not intrinsically emotional, one's response to it may be very emotion-filled. The discovery that after weeks of developing the delicate skill of passive volition one has finally achieved a level of inner poise shown by an electroencephalogram that is 85% alpha waves may give rise to an emotion that is very sweet. The sweetness could be intensified by seeing the chest x-ray that shows that in the same period the tiny malignant tumors scattered through one's lungs have shrunk and many have disappeared.

Dialogue, even with one's own self, is a kind of community, as poets have made us all aware. Dialogue with a thoughtful and
beloved other person is one of the best uses of the gift of being human. We shall have more to say about the characteristics of communicative power later, but we will begin to explore it here because it aids and directs the use of transformation in emotions.

A brief summary of the dialogue that followed each of the dreams mentioned in the previous sub-section "g" (p.160), may be useful in thinking about the qualities of dialogue. June Singer tells that earlier dreams of the person whose dream balcony had floated loose from the earth were "... fantastic in their plots and ... luminous in their imagery ..." (1972:166). A partial quote will give the flavor of the dreamer's report. After telling of brilliant balls of fire rolling in from the four quadrants of the heavens, the person went on:

"... Then out of the western sky a ball of purest white came flying in my direction, and I could see that it bubbled and foamed as though a million whitecaps were tumbling over each other in brilliant sparkles. As I leaned forward it occurred to me to look back, and suddenly I saw that the balcony where I stood had detached itself from the building, and that the whole earth was a brown ball receding from me in astonishing swiftness" (1972:166).

Singer observes that this person clearly did not need to go further
into her unconscious. "Standing on the brink of the abyss, the
analysand needed more than anything the support which would help
her regain her hold on the material world" (loc. cit.).

In the second dream mentioned earlier, the dreamer, a close
friend, reported to me having been stoned by people who didn't know
her, observing herself having hallucinations, and finally being
drawn out of a building through a second-story arch and pulled with
great force across above a lawn toward a house-wide mirror. She
had thrown her arms over her face to protect herself, and cried out,
"Oh, my God, help me!" The force then gently set her down just
short of the great mirror. She said she was still very deeply
frightened by the dream. As we discussed the dream, an interpreta­
tion that had meaning for her finally drew together. It was this.
Her psyche had exposed her to serious risks, but would treat her
gently if she sincerely asked for help. Working out the theme of
the dream reduced her fear and suggested a direction for action.

The common characteristics in these two examples of dialogue
about an emotional transformative process seem to be (a) the concern
for the well-being of the dreamer expressed by the other person, (b)
the turning in on the inner wisdom of the dreamer, (c) the applica­
tion of a conceptual framework to the specifics of the dream situa­
tion, (d) a context of ongoing trusting relationship.

I have discussed some aspects of the effect of caring in the
dialogue process earlier in relation to physical experience (see pp.
Here in the one case the expression of caring for the emotional well-being of the dreamer resulted in helping her withdraw from further interaction between her conscious and unconscious. In the other case, the dreamer's own inner wisdom set safe limits both within and outside the dream situation, and concern for her well-being could be expressed by active listening alone.

Singer's conceptual framework is Jungian, and as she applied it to the casual unconcern of the dreamer about floating loose from the world, it was obvious to her that the patient's fascination with the dream contents was loosening her ego's strength. Our conceptual framework in working on the second dream is also Jungian, and it includes his transpersonal concern with spiritual dimensions. In both cases, the analysis and the friendship, the dream was being explored in a context of trust. In both cases, the second person involved in the dialogue knew the dreamer's life situation and history of dreams well, and brought it to bear on the dream to support the dreamer's understanding.

By extension, these same four characteristics may be applied to inner feedback and dialogue. (a) A person who has involved himself in biofeedback or who is seriously thinking over an emotional experience is expressing concern for his or her own well-being. (b) The very possibility of using body feedback rests securely on the extraordinary wisdom of the human being, as a whole. Likewise, inner dialogue helps us to test the meanings of our imaginal experience
against our whole awareness. (c) Every person has some conceptual framework, however self-contradictory, for understanding reality. Although it may be infused with shadow, and confused by the representation of various residues in personal unconscious, it nevertheless belongs to the person and provides continuity in the midst of change. It helps the person understand. (d) The context of an ongoing trusting relationship may not always be positive, within an individual. There is always the possibility that what the person finds he or she can trust in himself is quite negative. Still, the person knows a great deal of his personal history, and that provides a certain perspective on the process in hand.

The important value in all kinds of feedback and dialogue is in truing up and balancing the transformative process as it flows. Jung speaks of this inner dialogue as he tells of writing down his work on his own anima:

"Often, as I was writing, I would have peculiar reactions that threw me off. Slowly I learned to distinguish between myself and the interruption. When something emotionally vulgar or banal came up, I would say to myself, 'It is perfectly true that I have thought and felt this way at some time or other, but I don't have to think and feel that way now. I need not accept this banality of mine in perpetuity; that is an unnecessary humiliation.'"
The essential thing is to differentiate oneself from these unconscious contents by personifying them, and at the same time bring them into relationship with consciousness . . .

. . . In the final analysis the decisive factor is always consciousness, which can understand the manifestations of the unconscious and take up a position toward them (1963: 186-187).

In telling of these thoughts, he gives a small clip from an inner dialogue that by his own report, went on intensely for five years and formed the foundation for his contribution during the rest of his life. Here, Jung is using other aspects of his psyche in reviewing and integrating the emotions he was experiencing. At this point I want to re-connect my observation that a part of me evaluates the outcome of the options I have chosen (see p. 159). It seems to be one thing to engage in a process of choosing the best way to proceed, and quite another to evaluate what emerges from the process. Such an evaluation, as we have seen in the foregoing quote from Jung, is a matter of balancing the dialogue between the conscious and the unconscious, so that neither takes over until the last, when the conscious must prevail. In my own inner experience, the balancing is like the support of both opponents in a conflict to be sure that neither overwhelms the other by sheer force.
Instead, the aim is to help maintain sufficient equality of power between them so that they can complete their dialogue and achieve a synthesis that represents each point of view in a new understanding which is better than either of them could have achieved alone (Walton, 1969). Balancing the process brings this discussion to the last step in the transformative process for emotional experience, making the shifts indicated by feedback and dialogue.

i. Making shifts in process in emotional experience:

When von Franz was coming to the end of her discussion of individuation, she described the task of this last step, in talking about dealing with the shadow. She recognizes, first, that the conscious self must sometimes act without understanding the intimations of the unconscious, and then restates the importance of being open to an emergent need for a shift:

Somewhere, right at the bottom of one's own being, one generally does know where one should go and what one should do. But there are times when the clown we call 'I' behaves in such a distracting fashion that the inner voice cannot make its presence felt.

Sometimes all attempts to understand the hints of the unconscious fail, and in such a difficulty one can only have the courage to
do what seems right, while being ready to change course if the suggestions of the unconscious should suddenly point in another direction . . . (1964:184-185).

Similarly, the transpersonalist psychotherapists write of the need to be constantly alert to discover renewed or deeper identifications and to turn from them. As the self disidentifies from purely personal contents, identification with archetypal contents becomes focal. A person turning from a self-centered life to one of service to others may identify himself or herself with the archetypes of healer, wise one, or teacher, for instance (Vaughan, 1977). The next step is to affirm the guidance of the transpersonal self.

The need for flexibility in redefining the purpose of transformative process is especially salient for transpersonalists in making shifts in process. They find their focus on well-nigh unlimited potential means that even broadly conceived "goals" bind the process unnecessarily.

. . . The misconception that goals such as self-knowledge and self-acceptance will adequately serve to reconcile the existential human dilemma can, . . . interfere with the process of deepening experience. This intensification or deepening of experience is not a
product of the therapeutic relationship
defined in terms of traditional roles, but
a continuing expansion of the experience of
being who we are (Vaughan, 1977:77).
These words come at the end of Vaughan's description of the second
stage of transpersonal therapy, and form the end of her description
of the process. Her discussion of the next stage is concerned more
with explaining the state of self-transcendence than with the process
of becoming.

What is distinctive in the making of shifts in process in
emotional experience is that the emotions are indicators, and cannot
be shifted directly. Other adjustments need to be made if the emo-
tional indicators do not fit the purpose as envisioned.

Summary of the Transformative Process Model in Emotional Experience

In each of the nine steps we have seen what the meaning of
the step is for emotional experience. The sensing step in emotional
experience comes mainly as discomfort, but the discomfort may be
physical, mental or spiritual, as well as emotional. The insight
which follows may appear in a dream or just come slipping into aware-
ness, but it gives a sense of direction. We "know" in some way what
change is called for. Passive volition is as important in emotional
process as in physical, but the volition must be persistent as well
as relaxed to deal with one's inner resistance. The generous variety
of options for process may reflect the great difficulty of overcoming that resistance, or it may be related to the variation in personal styles. In emotional process, as in physical, there is value in considering a variety of options for process. Emotional process is like physical in that envisioning is a major step as it brings in imagination, springing from the unconscious, to free the action of transformative power. In evaluating options for the process, considerations enter such as the history and skills of the person transforming, the present state of the person, and the purpose. The main point about engaging in the process is that in order for it to be positive, it must change behavior. This is true because transformative process is a channel for power, and blocking the flow of that power creates dangerous pressure. The inner and outer feedback process can help check to see if the inner flow is moving toward changed behavior. Four characteristics of productive dialogue were given in the feedback and dialogue section. If the process is found to be off course in the feedback interaction, shifts need to be made.

3. Means that Begin in Mental Experience

Although I have analytically separated physical and emotional experience, in life process they are integrated. It will also be an analytical exercise to extricate the cognitive aspects of the means of exercising transformative power from either physical or emotional experience. I have imagined the reader saying, "But look here, the
way you have described volition, it sounds like decision-making".
or, perhaps, "Now wait, that insight looks like a bright idea, to me". My answer to my imaginary reader is, "Right. Each of the steps in the process takes place in the mind to some extent. But that is just how it is with us human beings".

By giving a fuller explanation of physical and emotional means of guiding the force of transformative power, I hope I have established the outlines of what the steps mean. Means that begin in mental process have fascinated those who deal with words, and much has been written about why and how people transcend their intellectual limits and form new creations with their minds. To narrow the field in this section, I define the action of transformative power in the mental realm as the full development of a novel cognitive response to a problem following MacKinnon (1962:485). Similar definitions are used for creativity, and it seems right to allow that the action of transformative power does create new outcomes in response to "problems" in art and technology, in relationships, and in social institutions. The full implementation of these kinds of creative problem-solving calls for the action of transformative power in the other three realms of experience. Thus the definition has to be limited to the cognitive response to maintain for discussion the artificial distinction between these aspects of experience.
The creative problem-solving model proposed and practiced under the auspices of the Creative Education Foundation and described by Parnes, Noller and Biondi (1977, 1978) has helped shape the model for the means of using transformative power. I will be comparing it to the nine-step model in the body of this section. I want to set the creative problem solving model in the context of other thinking about problem solving before I examine it in detail.

In the early 1960's, stimulus-response theorists and information processing theorists were doing research based on opposing views of what takes place in problem-solving. The stimulus-response researchers, and operant behavior analysts like B.F. Skinner (1950) were claiming that complex behavior (problem-solving) is not different in kind from discrimination learning. They analyzed it in terms of operants, habit family hierarchies, and chains of associations (Kleinmuntz, 1966).

The information processing specialists, that is the computer programming theorists like Herbert Simon, Allen Newell (1963) and others associated with them, laid greater emphasis on the hierarchical arrangement of systems and sub-systems. In this they got support from Miller (1962) and Chomsky in linguistics and Miller, Galanter and Pribram in neuropsychology (1960) among others.

Essentially, the Gestaltists like Kohler (1925), and Wertheimer (1945), although they had not been able to describe
physiologically how gestalts were formed, were forecasting the information processing theorists in that they stressed the complexity of the processes involved in human problem-solving.

Another example of research supporting the richness of the problem solving process was Feldman’s (1961) in which he offered subjects the barest possible stimuli and task. The subjects were asked to guess whether a red or green light would be flashed on next. Although the order had been carefully randomized, subjects persistently refused to believe that it had, and offered hypothesis after hypothesis about what the order was.

By 1965, when the Carnegie Institute of Technology opened an annual series on cognitive process with a symposium on Problem-Solving, one of the presenters had identified two main barriers to effective problem-solving - functional fixedness and an atmosphere effect (Green, 1966). The first has to do with seeing units of the problem-solving situation such as tools or equations only in the way that they were originally presented, e.g., a pliers only as a tool for turning, not as a pendulum weight or a part of a sculpture. The atmosphere effect has to do with previously learned associations' inhibiting the credibility or even the appearance of certain solutions, e.g., not thinking of adding a double-curved line when the problem is to make "six" out of the roman numeral for nine by adding one more line (i.e., s plus ix).
The study of problem-solving had developed considerably by 1980. A commonly used handout at the Creative Education Foundation's Institute culture was a list of not two, but fourteen "Blocks to Creativity". It will give some evidence of the advance in the art of fostering creativity to note what the items are: fear of failure, reluctance to "play", resource myopia, over-certainty, frustration avoidance, being custom bound, impoverished fantasy life, fear of the unknown, dislike of complexity, reluctance to exert influence, reluctance to let go, failure to appreciate the motivational power of emotion, unintegrated yin-yang, and sensory dullness.

Some psychologists have always wanted to go beyond the algorithmic formulations of the behaviorists and the information processors to take a more phenomenological approach. They say real people solve problems in much more complex ways. Ghiselin (1952) wrote of one such formulation in introducing his collection of accounts of the creative process of Mozart, Poincaré, and many others. Each part of the sequence he drew from the work of Wallas (1926) is in practice, as the accounts show, a complicated interweaving of cognitive, emotive, and somatic awareness. The steps are the now-familiar (1) preparation, (2) incubation, (3) inspiration, and (4) verification. It is a form of information-processing, but such a volatile and elaborate one that it is scarcely recognizable. Green claimed that it was "sterile" (1966:12) for ordinary use, but that it was best suited to very complex problems. The
focus of the Carnegie Institute symposium was the General Problem
Solver program for the computer contributed by Newell, Shaw and
Simon (1958).

Now, in 1980, it is possible to see the results of two
other rather long-term trends in the problem-solving literature.
Both were moving before the computer modeling of human intelligence
and problem-solving work began, and both have continued to interact
with it in the fifteen years since the symposium at Carnegie Tech.
They are (1) the neuropsychological studies, and (2) the social-
psychological studies, which are based in an evolving behavioral
science.

In neuropsychology, two kinds of research have been espe-
cially fruitful with regard to the understanding of creative process -
microneural research and functional laterality studies. Karl Pri-
bram (1971) and John Eccles (1977) and those associated with each of
them have had an increasingly complex technology at their disposal
to observe the micro-phenomena in the central nervous system con-
cerned with the problem-solving process. Pribram, for example, has
proposed a model for thought (see p. 38 ) based on the TOTE model
(a refinement of the reflex arc) that he originally set forth in
1960. Pribram is now showing how thought can use an information
recall and cross-correlation process that is holographic (1971:
369-374). His work and Eccles' have shed light on the minute events
of problem-solving within the brain in ways that were impossible
even as recently as the mid-sixties.
The second kind of research in neuropsychology that is contributing to our understanding of problem-solving is the study of brain laterality. The chart on p. 68 summarizes the perceptions of philosophers and psychologists (ranging forward from the legendary author of the I Ching in 1143 B.C.) on the two different modes of thinking we human beings exhibit. It is easy to over-dichotomize and notice only how different the contributions of the logical left brain and the metaphoric right brain are. Ornstein, a laterality psychologist, has warned against over-dichotomizing, because there are parallel functions in each hemisphere which appear both in compensatory recovery after brain damage and just naturally in ordinary functioning (1977).

Sperry's work with patients whose two brain hemispheres have been cut apart to prevent their severe epileptic seizures from spreading from one side to the other, has shown that each hemisphere has a distinctive part to play in problem-solving processes (1973). Parallel work on people who have not had the operation has confirmed his results, both before and since Sperry's publication in 1973 (Bogen and Bogen, 1969; Dimond and Beaumont, 1974; Galin, 1974; Languis and Kraft, 1977). It has become quite clear that the two kinds of thinking that thoughtful observers have always known about are centered in the two different hemispheres of the brain.

One center that has drawn together all the thinking related to creative problem-solving has been sponsored by the Creative
Education Foundation at the State University College at Buffalo. Work was begun there through the interested support of business and industrial leaders in 1954. Over the years, a leadership group, headed now by Sidney Parnes, Ruth Noller and Angelo Biondi has also organized a summer workshop which has gathered persons from all the disciplines touched upon thus far in this section. They have also drawn in specialists in general systems theory, giftedness, and future studies, for the Creative Problem Solving Institute (CPSI). The institutes have a dual purpose. (1) They give new participants a grounding in the problem-solving model to be discussed here, and they do it in both group and individual settings. (2) The institutes also hope to generate advances in the field by fostering the interaction of the different kinds of specialists.

The way I am presenting the material is founded on my understanding drawn from the experience of two Creative Problem Solving Institutes. I find a rough parallelism between the Parnes, Noller and Biondi model (the CPSI model) and the one I have been proposing (See Figure 5, p. 185. Their model has all the elements but one of those I suggest, and that one is volition. At the Institute, the problem of volition is raised occasionally by both participants and leaders in the "Springboard" or basic sessions, and I will be discussing it at greater length in sub-section c., p. 188. Comparing their teaching model with my theoretical model puts a strain on the
comparison process. I would not expect to find an exact match, because some theoretical and even experiential complexities need to be compressed or extended to make a teachable model. I found, while taking part in the teaching process there, that since people can remember the outline of the process, they can guide themselves over and around the individual differences they experience in carrying it out.

The experience of participants has been a frequent subject of study for the creative problem solving program at Buffalo. A philosophy department colleague joined with the Parnes group to do an exhaustive study of twenty-eight workbooks completed by each of sixty-two experimental students. She reported in her summary an observation that relates their experience to the experience of transformative power I have been discussing.

In the creative problem-solving course, students are allowed to exercise full play of their imagination while in command of their own process. The student is encouraged to express, develop, and discipline his imagination. The main characteristic of this experience for the student has been one of a new-found command of himself. In this way the student recognizes himself as a powerhouse of ideas rather than as a destructive force . . .
Appreciation of their spontaneous and judgmental powers as both balancing each other -- on their command -- gave students a feeling of being able to contribute creatively to their environment (Parnes, Noller and Biondi, 1977:15).

This quote mentions an important feature of the CPSI model, that imaginative and divergent idea-generation in each step is followed by some form of "judicial" and convergent idea management. People tend to value the resulting sense of control and to feel better than before about themselves. The danger of valuing the control and forgetting the context within which it is possible occasionally brings on the loss of perspective that George Leonard mentioned in his tennis lessons. As he began to think of the personal glory he would gain from his new skill, his shots started crashing into the net.

The CPSI model consists of five steps, each of which combines a first divergent phase and a second convergent phase. Typically, the first step is preceded by a step called "the big mess", in which the problem-solver scans her or his field of awareness for problems. The five steps are called "fact-finding, problem-finding, idea-finding, solution-finding, and acceptance-finding" (Noller, Parnes and Biondi, 1978:1). The fifth step is followed by action and new challenges in an ever-repeating spiral, as projected in Figure 4. The comparison to the nine-step model being presented here is shown in Figure 5 on page 185.
a. Sensing a yearning or dis-ease in mental experience:

In the CPSI model, the "problem sensitivity" and "mess or objective" part, and the first step "fact finding", taken together, correspond closely to the step I introduced on p. 73 as "sensing a yearning". In the practice of the model, these introductory steps (the problem sensitivity and objective) are sometimes combined into what is called "the big mess". This part gives a time for the person to look over what he is aware of to see what, if anything, is wrong, and what he would like to improve. The freedom and even vagueness of process in this section is well suited to drawing on the person's whole being, and especially on the image-making right brain. The limbic system inside of the cortex also comes into play as feelings are valued, and the sense of how-it-is comes into consciousness. Often people move physically to loosen up.

When problem sensitivity and objective seeking are kept separate, it adds a useful clarity, and helps to mobilize volition later. "Problem sensitivity" draws the person to look over all
### Nine Step Model vs. CPSI Model*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nine Step Model</th>
<th>CPSI Model*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Sensing a Yearning, or a Dis-Ease</td>
<td>The Big Mess and (1) Fact Finding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Having an Insight</td>
<td>(2) Problem Finding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Developing Volition for Change</td>
<td>May be done in Acceptance Finding within oneself, as opposed to with others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Generating Options for Process</td>
<td>(3) Idea Finding Volition may be generated with insight, here.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Envisioning the Purpose</td>
<td>(4) Solution Finding: # Generate Criteria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. Evaluating the Options</td>
<td>(4) con't. Use Criteria (5) Acceptance Finding; Implementation Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g. Engaging in the Process</td>
<td>Action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>h. Seeking Feedback and Dialogue</td>
<td>New Challenge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i. Making Shifts in Process</td>
<td>Beginning a New Cycle</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Parnes, Noller, and Biondi (1977)

# divergent phase + convergent phase

---

**Figure 5**
Comparison of the Nine-Step Model and the Creative Problem-Solving Institute Model
the problems she or he can raise to awareness, so the person can be sure that the one chosen is the one he or she most wants to work on, given present resource limits. The "objective" seeking part helps the person to get into focus what she or he wants, positively, to have happen. This part of the CPSI model is similar to "envisioning the purpose" as I have described it "e" (p. 76).

The "sensing" step, as I see it is most directly related to the "fact finding" step in the CPSI model (although problem sensitivity and objective also appear to be related (see p. 184). In it people gather the facts about what is bothering them. It has its divergent thinking phase, in which all that is wrong is brought out, and its convergent thinking in which the salient aspects are focused. It provides material for the psyche to work on in the important "problem finding" step, next.

Although the first step, "fact-finding" and the two parts that precede it are mainly related to the "sensing" step of the model proposed here for the means of using transformative power, they have overtones of the "volition" step (c), and the "envisioning the purpose" (e) steps.

b. Having an insight in mental experience: The sudden appearance in consciousness of an insight is the result of deep wholistic psychological process, as we have seen. An Ohio State doctoral advisor in the Economics Department observed that the unconscious eats, or it doesn't work. If you do not feed in
relevant material it cannot do its creative work\textsuperscript{12}. The incubation phase of creative process is also essential, but we must never overlook the importance of consciously directing data inward to support intuition.

The whole CPSI model is set up to foster the "Aha! experience of insight, identified in the transformative power model as the second step. Insights appear on their own inner timetables at unpredictable moments all through the CPSI process, although the most important ones to be hoped for are in the second CPSI step, "problem-finding". Actually, all five steps of the CPSI model might be classified as preparation for insight. Consciously guiding oneself in successive divergent and convergent thinking lays in at every step the material which the deep unconscious flow works with, making the connections and corrections that emerge suddenly as an "Aha!"

In addition to the insights that may appear at any point in the creative problem-solving process, many writers quoted by Parnes, Noller, and Biondi assert that insight in correctly stating the problem is central to winning through to a productive solution. Einstein's frequently quoted comment seems especially relevant:

The careful formulation of a problem is often closer to the essence of the process than its solution, which may be merely a matter of

\textsuperscript{12}Richard A. Tybout, personal conversation, 1980.
mathematical or experimental skill. To raise new questions, new possibilities, to regard old problems from a new angle requires creative imagination and marks real advances in science (quoted in Parnes, Noller and Biondi, 1977:47).

"Creative imagination" is the name Einstein gives to insight in this context. Its role is to give a new and fruitful direction to inquiry. It serves as the source or the entry point of transformative power into the situation where the problem is found.

Thus, insight functions through all the steps of the creative problem-solving process, but is of central importance in the problem-finding step.

c. Developing volition in mental experience: After reviewing the literature on creative process, principally in the cognitive arena, Robert Bargar gave as the first characteristic of the creative experience, the valuing of insight that leads to a commitment to developing it fully. In his words:

(1) With the emergent insight often comes a sense of excitement, of implicit value in the meaning and potential implications of the insight. This excitement and sense of value stimulates the commitment and dedication
necessary to fruitful and sustained creative work; it helps generate that sense of reverence for the process that is essential to the nurturing of ideas (Bargar, 1980:9).

He is summarizing the self-reports of a number of persons whose creative products have done much to transform the experience of all people. The volition to finish the development of the insight they have had arose naturally, and was sufficient to carry the process through to the point where its contribution was needed.

In working with participants in problem-solving groups that I have led myself, and in helping to facilitate a group in the Creative Problem-Solving Institute, I often heard participants ask, "But what if I get all finished, and I don't like my solution?"

There are a number of helpful answers, within the model used by Parnes, Noller, and Biondi. Among them are, "Go back and repeat a step", and "Ask yourself why you don't like it, and then put that answer in as a criterion in solution-finding". The answers are helpful because they focus on the need to go deeper inwardly in order to make the most of the process.

On the one hand, it seems quite likely that the volition to develop the solution fully in action would be a fortunate, but not controllable, parallel outcome along with a real insight. On the other hand, in a model that is so fully grounded in the experience of creative problem-solvers, and is so practical in supporting the
problem-solving process in everyone, it seems surprising that there is no step developing volition. Volition is a natural outcome of careful work, but volition can be controlled consciously, as well.

The conscious control of developing volition is most evident in the need to control egoistic forcing of the transformative process. It is quite possible, and indeed necessary, to consciously step aside from self-centered pushing of the transformative process. This is at least as true of mental experience as it is in the other realms, because it results in blocking the process. Parnes, Noller, and Biondi know the delicate balance well, and quote Aaron Copland:

The inspired moment may sometimes be described as a kind of hallucinatory state of mind: one half of the personality emotes and dictates while the other half listens and notates. The half that listens had better look the other way, had better simulate a half attention only, for the half that dictates is easily disgruntled and avenges itself for too close inspection by fading entirely away (quoted in Parnes, Noller, and Biondi, 1978: 19).

In summing up this discussion, perhaps it can be said that volition in the CPSI model is a serendipity that emerges without anyone's organizing to produce it. It is an essential step in the model being proposed here because it allows and fosters the action of transformative power.
d. Generating options in mental experience: In a charming but authoritative book entitled *On Knowing: Essays for the Left Hand* (1979), Jerome Bruner is articulating some paradoxes and antinomies of intellectual problem-solving. The one that concerns us here is "deferral and immediacy" (1979:26-28). He quotes from Picasso, and from Virginia Woolf, and summarizes "It is . . . conflict, knowing deep down what one wishes to say and knowing that one has not said it" (loc. cit.). The immediacy of insight lets us know what we want to communicate, but the deferral is necessary to get a large enough variety of options before ourselves to say it well.

The idea-finding step in the CPSI model calls for deferred judgment. Parnes, Noller, and Biondi (1977) cite three studies which quantify the value of continuing to stay open to the flow of ideas or options. One showed that "significantly more good ideas evolved from the deferred-judgment session than from the conventional group session" (Parnes, Noller and Biondi, 1977:337). Two other studies dealt specifically with the effect of the delayed-judgment technique known as "brainstorming" showing that in the experiments, persons trained in brainstorming produced better ideas later in the process (Parnes and Meadow, 1959; Meadow, Parnes and Reese, 1959). Parnes also refers to a study which demonstrated that 78% more good ideas came forth in the second half of the ideas produced than in the first half (Parnes, 1962).

The "generating options" step in the nine-step model I am proposing corresponds to the divergent thinking part of the CPSI
"idea-finding" step. The convergent or judging aspect of the "idea-finding" step is matched with the sixth step, "evaluating options", in my model. It seems that this is one place in which the need to have a simple, memorable method precluded a move to express the complexity of experience. If we defer envisioning the purpose in vivid detail until we have generated options for process, the idea-finding process may be much freer. But, before we evaluate the options we need the purpose clearly in mind as a resource for making the criteria by which we will evaluate. Therefore, I put the envisioning step between the two halves of the "idea-finding" step. Both halves are essential, and both are in both models.

e. Envisioning the purpose in mental experience: The "envisioning" step which follows the divergent, deferred judgment "generating options" step in my model seems to me to be matched with the divergent thinking phase of the CPSI model's "solution-finding" step. Here, the desired outcome, refined by the preceding steps can be vividly clear and can both mobilize volition (see the account of "sensing", pp. 184-186) and resource the criterion-making needed for evaluating options.

The "envisioning the purpose" step is fully as important in mental experience as in either of the other two discussed so far, physical and emotional. Seeing the desired purpose in the mind's eye guides the process in subtle, unconscious ways and in straightforward conscious ways, as well. Some parts of the experience of
mathematician Poincaré (1913:383-394), have been quoted by others, but I would like to give his summary, which I have not seen elsewhere, because it draws together several elements in the model, and highlights the envisioning step:

I shall make a last remark: when above I made certain personal observations, I spoke of a night of excitement when I worked in spite of myself. Such cases are frequent, and it is not necessary that the abnormal cerebral activity be caused by a physical excitant as in that I mentioned. It seems, in such cases, that one is present at his own unconscious work, made partially perceptible . . . yet not having changed its nature. Then we vaguely comprehend what distinguishes the two mechanisms or, if you wish, the working methods of the two egos . . . (1913:394).

The purpose is present in his mind, and guides the process of spelling out the insight in mathematical equations, i.e., of evaluating the options.

f. Evaluating the options in mental experience: The rather exact correspondence between the judging step in my model and the judging step in the CPSI model seems natural. After the divergent production of ideas (in idea-finding) and of criteria (in solution
finding), comparing the most promising ideas to the highest ranked criteria should lead to a solution that will find acceptance. In my model I have put the two divergent phases in sequence, not evaluating until after the purpose (or solution) has been envisioned. In the "evaluating the options" step, the convergent and judging thinking is done for both.

The CPSI model has a fifth step of "acceptance-finding" which has to do with planning to overcome the resistance of others to the solution. It could also be used to overcome one's own resistance, that is, to develop volition. This would only be necessary if volition had not come spontaneously as it did in Poincaré's example.

g. Engaging in the process in mental experience: There are probably relatively few mental experiences of transformative power in which the process is nearly instantaneous. By the reports of Henry James, and Hart Crane, and Poincaré, Jerome Bruner, Henry Moore and on and on (the list is long) engaging in the process takes concentrated application (Ghiselin, 1952). Some disciplined souls like Henri Poincaré stay at the process a certain amount of time every day until they finish. Some undisciplined but colorful characters like Hart Crane and Stephen Spender return again and again to the project as further inspirations come. All report continuing work. It is hard work, but it is satisfying to them. My experience of dissertation-writing confirms these reports; the excitement of
seeing the outcome whole is followed by months of seeing to it that I do spend the satisfying hours in my desk chair and do so daily.

The transformative power is subtle, and relentless. Incremental and irreversible changes take place. Each day that more of the insight is realized in an external product leaves its deposit of change in the inner and outer life. Responses to others are gradually grounded in a finer-grained and surer knowing. Other areas of experience than those directly touched by the new mental transformation are nevertheless influenced. Posture and poise and a sense of at-one-ness with all process develop almost unnoticed.

h. Feedback/dialogue in mental experience: Again, the dialogue that counts for the exercise of transformative power is the internal dialogue. The fine-tuning of the process to the demands of the original insight and the vision of the purpose consists, in mental experience, of many short and long feedback loops. Each time one is completed, we know again either that the process is on course, or that it isn't.

The whole person is involved in the feedback process just as surely as in any other step. Accordingly, it should not be surprising to discover that dreams can give intimations as to whether the process is on track or not. Patricia Garfield, Ph.D. a dream specialist, now practicing in San Francisco, visited the Senoi in Malaysia and other cultures that use dreams in problem-solving. She reports that students in her dream classes often come up with
solutions in dreams to problems that have been bothering them. This would be analogous to the "insight" phase of this model. However, she tells of experiences in which the dreams let people realize that the way they are solving the problem is flawed (1974: 94-96). Dr. Garfield's emphasis, however, is on the helpfulness of dreams, and the book is full of ways to get useful feedback from dreams on the daily solutions to problems of life.

In the CPSI model, the last step is followed by "action", and "new challenges", two phases that provide for implementation and the renewal of the cycle, respectively. Taken together, they correspond to the seventh, eighth, and ninth steps of the model I am offering here. "Action" is "engaging in the process", and "new challenges" result from the interaction of external feedback and inward dialogue. The shifts in process that would result would come as the person entered the transformative process at a new level.

Thus, the feedback step in mental process is holistic, and has echoes in the CPSI model, and it is of value in keeping a mental process in line with the original insight and the envisioning.

i. Shifts in process in mental experience: The conscious ego is probably most involved in making the actual shifts in process that are indicated in keeping on track. Admitting, to oneself or others, that one is off, and then deciding to make the corrections called for is a trial-and-triumph process even before the purpose is realized. The triumph consists in setting aside the ego's involvement in being right the first time.
The ego has two roles in this step: (1) firmly making the needed shift, and (2) humbly transcending its own attachment to the old way.

Summary of the Transformative Process Model in Mental Experience:
As far as possible, the nine-step model being proposed in this study was compared to the well-researched Creative Problem Solving Institute model used by Parnes, Noller, and Biondi, and by many others over a period of twenty-five years. Although each part of each step in the CPSI model found a corresponding part in the transformative process model, the order was different. The volition step in the transformative process model has no direct correspondence in the CPSI model, but developing volition might be an unsought outcome or a possible addition to several of the CPSI steps. If it were added, it would meet a felt need mentioned by some persons using the CPSI model.


Spiritual experience has typically been regarded as an untouchable topic in secular education. The norms of academic process in other land-grant universities, I suspect, are not so different from those that keep spiritual development from being presented as a topic in The Ohio State University. I confess discussing spiritual development would not have occurred to me had it not presented itself. The topic came up in the sequences of readings that I have undertaken in gaining an understanding of the means for exercising transformative power.
Herbert Benson, the rigorous Harvard Medical School professor, was one of the first academicians to point out beyond the familiar boundaries with his chapters in *The Relaxation Response* (1975). Benson discusses Christian meditation and several varieties of Buddhist meditation in showing the precedents that exist for the Transcendental Meditation package, trademarked for American consumption, that he selected for his experiments.

Not surprisingly, the trail led straight from the east coast to the west coast where Claudio Naranjo and Robert Ornstein, both holding degrees from east coast universities met and collaborated to write *On the Psychology of Meditation* (1971). Naranjo, in the introduction to his part, gives credit to the climate of the times which fostered their book:

The time when East and West meet, our time, is one of meeting between religions, philosophies, and psychological schools that had hitherto ignored one another or looked upon one another with fanatical disdain. Furthermore, it is a time of meeting between science and religion, psychotherapy and education, a time when we envision the rise of the discipline of integral growth (1971:3).

Talk about the paradigm shift was just beginning in the early sixties among the people who later heralded it in print (Welwood, et al., 1978). For example, Karl Pribram's office was next to Thomas Kuhn's
at the time when Kuhn was writing *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions* (1970). Work in meditation psychology preceded the paradigm shift and the Greens (1977) were and are among the leaders in its theory and technology.

A fairly early study which impressed me with the potential for documenting spiritual process using the tools for investigation so well-developed within the old paradigm was one published by Charles Garfield (1975). He identifies the culturally based fear of death which is prevalent in Occidental culture. He also describes his controlled experiment with five groups: two kinds of meditators, a group of psychedelic drug users, and graduate students in psychology and in religion. His method was to determine their galvanic skin response to stimuli related to death and dying. All groups were composed of Caucasian males aged 22 to 32. Garfield found that the Tibetan Buddhists were the least susceptible to the death stimuli and that the others were more susceptible in the following order: Zen meditators, psychedelic drug users, psychology graduate students, and theological graduate students. He says "Differences, statistically significant at the 0.01 level, existed on nearly all experimental procedures" (1975: note, 150. See p. 200 for a table of the results).

When I later came to organize my impressions into the model for using transformative power, I came back to Garfield's interpretation of his results. He believed that the regular experience of setting aside the ego that came in the alterations of consciousness in meditation and drug use made the loss of ego which people expect in death less threatening.
Charles Garfield gave each group a code letter as follows:
Graduate students in psychology (P), graduate students in religion (R), psychedelic drug users (D), Zen meditators (M), and Tibetan Buddhists (T). His own footnote giving the rankings based on his data gave the highest ranks to the group with the least fearful reactions. His footnote follows:

This data represents a portion of that collected in a two-year doctoral dissertation research project (Garfield, 1974) at the Department of Psychology, University of California, Berkeley. The entire investigation was directed at assessing the differential responses on measures of conscious and unconscious fear of death across the five groups. The results demonstrated that the phobic responses differentiated the groups in the following rank order:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>T</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Galvanic Skin Response&lt;sub&gt;w&lt;/sub&gt;</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heart Rate Fluctuation&lt;sub&gt;w&lt;/sub&gt;</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Galvanic Skin Response&lt;sub&gt;f&lt;/sub&gt;</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heart Rate Fluctuation&lt;sub&gt;f&lt;/sub&gt;</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Death Anxiety Scale</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<sub>w</sub> = word association task
<sub>f</sub> = death fantasy exercise

Differences, statistically significant at the 0.01 level, existed in nearly all experimental procedures. (Garfield, C. Psychothanatological concomitants of altered state experience. U.S. Government Printing Office, 1974).
Garfield grounded this interpretation of his results in a wide-ranging study of scholarly work on the experience of dying and death, lending further credence to his understanding of the results.

The transcending of consciousness-distorting fear is an experience that begins in the emotional realm. However, that same transcending of fear in the context of a broader reality that encompases our understanding of death seems to be a spiritual transformation. I define spiritual means for transformative process as being those that lie in a realm of experience that subsumes bodily, emotional and mental experience and goes beyond them. Such experience is focused on an energy reality which is not apprehended directly by our usual senses. I find in my own experience that I can only say that body, emotion, and mind are subordinate, but not entirely excluded from my experience in the spiritual realm. I suspect from the reading I have done that my being at a neophyte level is responsible for the slight degree to which I experience that reality in a way that transcends my other senses. The holistic experience that has been persistent through the other realms continues in this realm. Still, there is a difference, and the quality of the difference is not familiar to me from the beginnings I have made in each of the other realms.

Meditation, in its various forms, is associated with spiritual experience. Prayer, ecstatic visions, fasting, and solitude are other ways people have reported approaching spiritual experience, but I will
be referring to meditation practice in discussing the relevance of the means of transformative power model in the spiritual area. I have chosen meditation because there is a literature of the scientific study of meditation and because meditation is used as a spiritual discipline in the major religious traditions.

I did not find confirmation of the nine-step model (see p. 43) in the readings I have done in the spiritual area. I suspect that one reason this is so is that only certain steps of the model as applied to the spiritual realm lie in the areas of our experience that we explain in words, and also these are principally actually cognitive or emotional and volitional rather than spiritual. Those parts that do not lie in the part of our experience that we express in words, i.e., the truly spiritual aspects, lose their essential meaning when compressed into verbal expression. The essential core is the holistic impact of the statement of a unitary reality as mystics from the Buddha (Ghose, 1954) to Thomas Merton (1970) have testified.

My own experience of transformative power in the spiritual realm did and does alternate between conscious will and passive volition. I will compare it to the nine-step model to show what I mean. First, though, the practice of meditation needs to be introduced. Daniel Goleman, who qualified in psychology at Harvard and in meditation at a number of meditation centers in India and Ceylon, has classified several approaches to meditation in *The Varieties*
of the Meditative Experience (1977). In introducing his final chapter, on meditating as a practice, he writes, however:

In some respects, every method of meditation is like all others, like some others, and like no other. The first level is that of the most general commonalities, disregarding the idiosyncratic variations of technique, emphasis, or belief of any one system. At this most universal level, all meditation systems are variations on a single process for transforming consciousness. The core elements of this process are found in every system, and its specifics undercut ostensible differences among the various schools of meditation (1977:106).

The human being is the common denominator, and at "higher" levels of meditative practice, all ways are one way. I have placed "higher" in quotes because "deeper" might equally well have been used, as Naranjo points out (1971).

Dimensionality is irrelevant in more practiced meditation, many commentators are agreed (Bohm, 1978; Capra, 1976; Goleman, 1977; Gowan, 1975, 1980; Krishnamurti, 1978; Merton, 1961; Naranjo and Ornstein, 1971; Walsh, et al., 1978). Space and even time are transcended as the meditator directs attention away from body, mind and emotion.
Naranjo has made a diagram (Figure 6) that helps to sort out both the apparent differences and the unifying samenesses in meditation. He defines the differences in terms of an outward way, an inward way, and an emptying way.

![Diagram of Three Types of Meditation](image)

**Figure 6** (Naranjo and Ornstein 1971:16)

Three Types of Meditation

The Way of Forms, the outward way, surrenders self in concentrating on a symbol outside him or herself. The Expressive Way "could be seen as a pursuit of formlessness: the meditator seeks to relinquish expectations, pre-conceptions, pre-determined courses of action so as to make himself receptive to the promptings of his un-programmed spontaneity" (Naranjo and Ornstein, 1971:17). Naranjo goes on to show that although the two seem to be opposites, they lead in the same direction, toward a "definite structure that all men share" (1971:17). All the forms we develop begin in spontaneous expression, and the more generalized they become, the more they are
found collectively in all human beings. Behind them all lies the object of meditation practice, the quietness and unity that transcends ordinary thought processes. It results in an altered consciousness, a new perception of reality that is not cognitive, but experiential.

This, the Negative Way approaches directly by attempting to still the mind's activity and go behind appearance and "illusion", to the center of being. This purpose is expressed as achieving "unitary consciousness" by Capra (1975).

The value of such experience is discussed by Gowan (1975) in describing the most advanced level of contact with the "numinous", the inexpressible, trans-personal Absolute. This level he calls syntactic, and it involves being really "together" in touching the Absolute. The ego is aware, but not self-conscious. The benefit to be gained is that isolation is lost. The person perceives truly that she or he is one with all reality (1975:333).

Much has been written about methods in meditation. Goleman summarized eleven of the best-known in his book (1977), and drew some generalizations at the end. Krishnamurti's "Choiceless Awareness" is the only one which does not suggest having a leader to follow, nor recommend any doctrine. His way and that of Gurdjieff also differ from the others in suggesting that daily life is the best setting in which to practice meditation. Many other extremes are
recommended by at least one of the major schools: fasting, violating sexual conventions and other proprieties, devoting two-thirds of the day to study and the other third to meditation, spending twenty-minutes twice a day only in meditation, and purifying body and mind in various other ways. Re-training attention is an area of greatest agreement across all schools. Whether this is to be done by "concentration" or "mindfulness" is a major division in Goleman's classification, but he sees all of the methods as resulting in altered consciousness.

David Bohm speaks in an interview (1978) of the implicate order and our experience of it. It is in the nature of a personal statement of his own perception of reality based on meditation. He says that insight can come through only when thought is stilled, because thought acts as a filter which has a small measure, and it cannot capture what is beyond itself. To strike a balance between theory of meditation, as offered by Naranjo and experience of meditation, from Bohm, I turn now to a summary of meditation research by Roger Walsh (1979), a medical school professor and psychotherapist.

Walsh, one of the transpersonal psychotherapists mentioned in the section on emotional transformative power notes three stages of research typically found on new topics: (1) research that is basically descriptive, (2) research on the interaction of the phenomenon with other factors, and (3) research on mechanisms which might produce the effects noted. He finds that meditation research is still mainly in phase one, although he reports some research in
phases two and three. He divides his material into psychological and physiological variables, which I will cluster without separating the kinds of research.

Walsh states that using objective measures researchers have found that meditation seems to enhance psychological well-being and improve perceptual sensitivity, and produces positive psychosomatic effects (vis. Benson, 1975). Experienced meditators report an underlying calm and non-reactive equanimity. Apparently those who would understand the reports of advanced practitioners need an experiential base themselves, so this need for qualifying the researcher constitutes a limiting factor in research efforts. People who continue transcendental meditation are better off psychologically on a number of variables, than those who stop. Individuals who have a history of schizophrenia may have breaks into their old psychotic patterns with intensive meditation. On the other hand, people who do have breaks often remit spontaneously, without psychiatric intervention. Meditation practice by either the therapist or the client in psychotherapy improves psychotherapeutic outcomes.

Physiological outcomes show the bodily parallels to the psychological outcomes. In metabolism, there is a marked reduction in oxygen consumption and carbon dioxide production. Blood lactate levels fall, and stay low, during meditation. The general stress response (GSR) indicates less reactivity. Experienced meditators displayed greater anticipatory response to negative stimuli, but
had a quicker recovery from them. Preliminary results indicate that meditators may demonstrate better right-brain skills such as remembering and discriminating musical tones. Also, electroencephalogram records seem to be showing an increased ability on the part of meditators to shift from one hemisphere in response to the changing demands of a task.

In summarizing the mechanisms by which meditation produces the desired effects, Walsh emphasizes the value of de-hypnosis, the progressive disidentification from images and ideas which distort and constrict consciousness. In advanced meditation, the un-layering process gradually results in more unhindered perception of a unitary reality.

What follows, in the application of the transformative power model to spiritual experience is personal. I offer it tentatively, in the hope that it may draw a response from the experience of others. The resources I have consulted have not provided data that seems applicable. The fullest source on meditation I believe is the *Visuddhimagga: the Path of Purification* (Ghose, 1954), but I base that belief on the number of other writers on the subject who consider it to be all-inclusive, rather than on reading it. I understand that it unfortunately begins at a level far advanced beyond my present experience. Since I take my experience to be more common, at least among the readers of this study, there may be some value in my setting down what took place with me. I hope to study others' experience according to this pattern.
a. Sensing a yearning in spiritual experience: The yearning for a deeper spiritual experience came to me in part through others' accounts of what had or was happening to them, and in part through a kind of dryness in myself. I have had a lifelong interest in spiritual phenomena, but I had little direct experience.

b. Insight in spiritual experience: The insight I experienced as a pivot point. At one moment, I felt empty-handed, and sensed being walled out. At the next I "knew" the something more in experience could include me, or a part of me, at least. I had not adopted any plan, I had just become aware of the reality that I could touch. This happened as I was sitting thinking about it.

c. Volition in spiritual experience: The yearning became a sureness that I would move into that possibility that which I had glimpsed. I had read enough that I knew I could not force what I had sensed as possible, but on the other hand I "knew" that my orientation was not going to go away. I would keep on.

d. Options in spiritual experience: I pulled back into mental experience to go over the options for growth in this area. It was clear to me with all parts of my being that being genuinely moral and "right thinking", i.e., a setting aside of ego-centeredness were necessary to the practice I was entering. This qualifying structure was based in my experience. I reviewed all kinds of options like meditation, what kind and how much meditation;
exercises; study; church attendance; silent and verbal prayer; meditation group membership; and service, and what kind of service; and others that attracted me less.

e. Envisioning the purpose in spiritual experience: I have a strong sense that I cannot envision my furthest purpose in spiritual experience. This is frustrating to me, but new vistas do come as I practice toward what has already come clear in insight. The purpose I envision now is a memory of calmness and clarity that is holistic. It is a"relaxation response" to be sure, but it is infused with something I cannot describe. "Poise" and a "joy" that is not tense describe it partly. I "envision" it several times a day.

f. Evaluating the options in spiritual experience: In the light of the purpose that had claimed me in the insight, meditation was easy to choose from among the options. Again, this was a result of a mental and emotional process. I do not have a sense for how I might have done this spiritually. I decided to meditate twice a day for at least a half an hour each time. This was a conscious choice, based on evaluating options.

g. Engaging in the process in spiritual experience: My conscious ego has to intervene firmly to keep my commitment up. Urgencies of all kinds tend to shorten the time, if I am not firm. Further, keeping attention focused takes the intervention of conscious intent. The reward of experience of the purpose in gradually (but not steadily) increasing spiritual experience keeps me at it.
h. Feedback in spiritual experience: Regularly mentally comparing what I am experiencing with the purpose would interfere with moving toward it, judging from what I have read and have been told. Still, I occasionally go back over a day, in my mind's eye and see what has kept me from or helped me move toward the spiritual purpose I am focusing on. Friends who have a similar commitment help. I often become aware that I am thinking of something or other during my meditation time, thus completing a feedback loop mentally. The core of the experience is a non-verbal awareness.

i. Shifts in process in spiritual experience: As I become aware in meditation that my attention has come to rest on a person or event, I gently steer it back to the spiritual focus by repeating one word (usually "one"). Awareness of body tensions is another cue. I also repeat a word aloud at every breath if I feel myself in danger of falling asleep. The shifts in process that I am conscious of are called for by the awareness that other levels of experience are getting in the way of the spiritual.

Summary of Transformative Process in Spiritual Experience

I have used as few words as possible in summarizing my experience of transformative power in the spiritual realm because it does not lend itself to words. In fact, more silence in my life has already been one outcome, although the reader may smile, noticing the page number and comparing it to the plan of the study.
Meditation is one experience within the spiritual arena of the whole being we call human. The state of being meditation engenders is an indescribable component of experience which gives intimations of a consciousness at one with the universal flux of energy within which we form our own configuration. It is also only one component and is, in my experience at least, always present with the others that I have artificially separated for discussion.

I chose meditation as my means for the spiritual transformative process, but others have chosen very different means. One such person is the poet Elizabeth Herron, and her "means" was drastic by my standards. However, she has been most articulate in telling about it:

The world had gone flat and colorless. I had withdrawn. I was a tiny kernel inside my body, adrift amid necessities and obligations, oppressed by my separateness, cut off from the wellspring of my soul. I walked up to the pond, took off my clothes and plunged into the water -- a sudden shock, cold against my skin. Floating to the surface, I heard a bird call across the meadow. Suddenly, I was at the stillpoint. The bird's call was my voice. We were separate and yet one. I was out there and in here . . . All things converged in me and radiated from me. "The center of the
circle is everywhere, the circumference nowhere". I recognized this, knowing it had always been so, though I had been cut off from my experience of it. My head filled with poetic images. The dimension of the infinite was everywhere.

This was a repetition of similar experiences. It is a paradoxical awareness. In these moments I KNOW. But my knowing is not enough. I must struggle to comprehend what I know. My intuitive knowledge must be expressed in order to be communicated. I cannot share my experience merely by telling you about it. As a poet, I seek words for my experience but words alone are not enough. There are realities -- nuances of feeling and meaning, for which words are inadequate (Quoted from an unpublished paper, 1976, in Vaughan 1979a:72).

Elizabeth Herron writes of a paradox that has been familiar to many transforming persons. It is a challenge to communicate with others the immediate experience of transformative insight. In concluding this section on the means for transformative power, I need to say that although the model I have offered does seem to give an approximation of the action of transformative power, it omits an important paradox of experience. Although we move toward our full
potential in transformative process, still, we resist. There are realities that we cannot express in words or even in action; we cannot quite "comprehend" what this is that is working in us.

It is probably incorrect to equate the action of transformative power with creativity, but creative process is a major transforming expression. Repeatedly, writers in the field of creativity (Koestler, 1964; Maslow, 1968; May, 1975; McMullen, 1977; Parnes, Noller, and Biondi, 1977) call attention to the paradox of the creative person. People who open themselves to and implement transformative power in any realm of experience are in flux, and they are full of opposites.

Rollo May, in *The Courage to Create* (1975), for example, dwells at some length on the "mystery" of the "soft spoken" artists who are the "bearers of the human being's age-old capacity to be insurgent" (1975:28). He says it takes courage to create, because the "gods" object. May gives as examples Prometheus, who took fire from the gods, and Adam and Eve who took knowledge of good and evil for mankind.

But what gods are these? Such gods are an "outmoded and inadequate form of God" (loc. cit.). They are a projection of our own doubt. As a personalization of our resistance to full becoming, they are symbols of the existential fear we all have. The force of transformative power pushes us toward transpersonal spirit, but the denser matter in us resists, and we call it "the gods". Tillich
(1952) reminds us that the ultimate source of the courage to be (and to become) is the God above the God of the Old Testament. It is in terms of this power, as we experience it, that we challenge the old gods.

The creative transformative process looks like a mystery because it is just beyond the fingertips of our minds. May guesses the resistance from "the gods" comes about because man is trying to overcome his own death. I believe the problem can be better stated if we call the process transcending ourselves. The death we are overcoming is limitation, and we are overcoming it in tiny increments. Death is also a symbol. We are reaching beyond the present reality of what it has meant for us to be human, in order to become now.

We are still our own old selves, though, with our all-too-familiar specific and particular ways, and this is one side of the paradox. Within the same life experience, we are aware that we are now beings with a frighteningly larger power and scope. And this is the other side of the paradox. We may say, "The gods will be angry", but we may equally well say, "It can't be right to be so happy".

May says that "creativity carries with it such an inexplicable guilt feeling" (1975:23), but further on he explains it as the result of the destruction of the old that every creation entails. He also reports the popular wisdom that genius and psychosis are
close, and deals with it briefly in much the same way that Schubert and Biondi have done in full detail, based on a comprehensive review of the literature (Schubert and Biondi, 1977). Both find the idea to be more of a commentary on popular misconceptions of creativity than being one of those bits of folklore that can readily be confirmed empirically. They also show that several researchers have concluded creativity is associated with better than average mental health (Maslow, 1968; Kubie, 1961; Garfield, 1969).

When we transcend ourselves and allow and support the new insight, we come out on a new level of being. Roger Holmes (1939) called the process the logic of maturing thought. It involves affirming within ourselves the greatest breadth of options we can encompass, and holding it unresolved, deferring judgment long enough for the process to be fruitful.

But what I have said so far implies that the clay in old forms begins to have value only when it is shaped by the transcendent insight. Tillich, using the analogy of clay (1952), states the opposite view just as clearly. The reality of that opposite truth can be inferred from the daily exercise of resistance-to-change by gifted and dedicated practitioners the world over. The old ways worked, and the new way often hurts, at least at first. Keeping us much of our lives familiar as possible has three values: it allows us to be free to cope with assaults, it frees us to maintain
ourselves in daily life, and through these two, it frees us to be sensitive to the new.

Our ability to eat and breathe and lie down to rest without making brand new arrangements for it every day does give us latitude to listen to our own intimations of transcendence. We have to hold life as we know it in order to infuse it with creative change. We have to have problems in order to press for solutions. We have to have clay in order to give our dreams to life. Imaginary pots do not hold water.

Although we also have to have community to have conflict between persons, as we shall see in the next chapter, we can have violent conflict within ourselves alone. The conflict is richer and more productive of insight if we keep both sides of it supported equally so that neither is lost by repression into forgetfulness. Otherwise, we may be "blessed" with the conflict acting itself out in neurosis, from the hiding place in forgetfulness.

Tillich's thesis (1952) is that we must not deny the mundane and leap toward the absolute ideal. We must, instead, affirm within our paradoxical situation the power working in us. I have shown that meditation is a means in the area of transpersonal spirit for the working of transformative power, but meditation is bound together in the whole reality of experience with body, mind, and emotion.
E. CONTINGENCIES AND OUTCOMES

The limitations on our response to transformative power constitute familiar contingencies, as May (1975) and Tillich (1952) have pointed out, but the positive outcomes still pull us on, as the Walsh review article (1979) and other observers indicate (Benson, 1975; Green and Green, 1973, 1974, 1977; Simonton, Matthews-Simonton and Creighton, 1978; Jung, 1952, 1953; Singer, 1972, 1976; Vaughan, 1973, 1977, 1979a, 1979b; Parnes, Noller and Biondi, 1964, 1977; Goleman, 1977; Naranjo and Ornstein, 1971).

Contingencies stem both from outer and inner limitations. Every advisor, mentor, and parent has seen people, in the midst of a transformative process that absorbs them, disregard the exhaustion of their personal and social resources. The dissertation-writer overruns his or her borrowing limit at the bank. The new manager drives the department to non-verbal rage testing his or her own limits for growth in the new position. Or the soggy grade-schooler comes dragging in from Little League grey with weariness and one hour late for supper. In every case just named, the lack of shifts in response to feedback from both inner and outer dialogue has been going on, but outer dialogue seems called for.

Inner dialogue may not be enough, and outer dialogue may be inaccessible, as well. For example, the messages of the personal unconscious may be confusing, or even crippling, as in the case of psychosomatic feedback. We get a headache, and we do not know why;
or we get cancer and die. Jung often observed, as he did in *Man and His Symbols* (1964) that a whole society may be acting out a neurosis. When this happens, the cultural pressure to misunderstand the force of transformative power coming through the collective unconscious may be very great. Individuals who get direct pressure from it may suffer inwardly or be punished by their society, depending on how forceful they are in expressing their insight.

Gowan (1975) has called another contingency to my attention. I find it plausible, but I have seldom seen it conceived in the way he presents it. He calls the unitary reality the "nouminous", and affirms, with considerable research support, that we may be in touch with it at any time. This view is also held by proponents of the perennial philosophy, of whom Aldous Huxley (1945) is perhaps the most famous. Gowan warns, however, that the power in the nouminous represents a considerable threat to those who are unprepared. He has arranged a hierarchy of experiences by which we enter contact with the nouminous, beginning with automatic, uncontrolled experiences in trance states, continuing through dreams, art and ritual within which we have increasing conscious awareness, to creativity, meditation, peak experiences, and the higher jhanas or levels of ecstasy. In these latter levels, he claims, the person must exercise both discipline and receptivity, but above all, must be rightly perceiving the unitary nature of reality and the actual position of the ego as not at the center. The contingency consists in a too-full exposure
to the power of that unitary reality before the full perception of one's own minor role in it is gained. The danger is that the person, sensing the power, may be deranged by it, and that terror at one end of the continuum or megalomania at the other may result.

Concurrent outcomes of the experience of transformative power, in which the person makes a commitment to help the action without egocentric distortions, are positive and numerous. Although they are implicit in the reports of the numerous means by which transformative power is facilitated, I have deferred writing about them until the end, and I will do so briefly because they must not be the focus of the process. To make the outcomes the focus is (1) to misunderstand the nature of transformative power, and (2) to limit its action. The section on Purposes (pages 69-71) is a discussion of the latter point, and the former point is made in the paragraph about Gowan's ideas (page 219) and in many other places throughout this study.

The primary concurrent outcomes are inward and personal, while secondary concurrent outcomes are both personal and social. Freedom from egocentric illusions is the most important, and is both part of the process as we have observed, and part of the outcome. It is both a catalyst for the process and, like any true catalyst, a residue at the end. Likewise, other capacities developed by and for the transformative process are increases in discipline, skill, creativity and healing.
Secondary concurrent outcomes which are also personal are of a number of kinds. Malcolm Westcott\textsuperscript{13} reviewed attempts to measure differences in intuitive thinking (as reported by Vaughan, 1979a:46-47). Some subjects were highly successful in arriving at an accurate conclusion on the basis of less information than is usually required. He characterized these subjects on the basis of a battery of psychological tests in the following way:

They tend to be unconventional and comfortable in their unconventionality. They are confident and self-sufficient, and do not base their identities on membership in social groups . . . Their investments appear to be primarily in abstract issues . . . (and) they explore uncertainties and entertain doubts far more than the other groups do, and they live with these doubts and uncertainties without fear. They enjoy taking risks, and are willing to expose themselves to criticism and challenge . . . They describe themselves as independent, foresighted, confident, and spontaneous (Westcott, 1968:24).

Intuition is not to be equated with transformative process, but as the Means section suggested, it is certainly part of it. This description of the persons who exercise intuition successfully is

a summary of characteristics noted elsewhere in this study.

The outcomes are secondary in the sense that they cannot be gained by conscious choice as the primary outcomes can, but they do seem to come. Westcott has mentioned outcomes having to do with self-image. In addition, a person who is allowing the action of transformative power to work in her or himself may be offered increased opportunities for development by the social setting. The broader transpersonal setting seems to be in touch as well, because certain unsought skills may be added, which are called "siddhis" in Eastern traditions. The person may find that he or she can wake up at a time chosen in advance, or know in advance who is calling, for instance.

Other secondary outcomes have social relevance. The creative products of art are among them, as are technological and social inventions. Bohm has also pointed out (1978) that persons are in touch with the implicate orders (see chapter one) and have the power to pollute it further or to begin to clarify it. They do this through the power of spirit to the extent that they allow it to work in them. From the personal standpoint this capacity is a secondary outcome for the individual.

With this brief discussion of contingencies and primary and secondary outcomes to the use of transformative power I am ending the presentation of transformative power. Now I would like to consider the relationship of the psyche of woman as described by Carl Jung and his followers to the experience of transformative power that we have been exploring.
F. WOMEN AND TRANSFORMATIVE POWER

In this section, I intend to expand on the brief statement of Jung's psychology that I gave in the Introduction to this study, to discuss an empirical study that confirms the Jungian insights, and then to show how the Jungian psychology of women applies to each of the aspects of transformative power that I have just been discussing.

1. Jungian Psychology of Women

   a. The role of the unconscious: Jung, in articulating the differences between himself and Freud, three years after their 1913 break, affirmed a generalized energy as the interpretative principle in psychoanalysis, rather than the narrower sexual energy that Freud had advanced. Both called the interpretative principle "libido", and both found its dynamic action in the complex relationship between the unconscious and the conscious as empowering and controlling behavior. A natural consequence of the generally broader view that Jung took was that he was aware of more of the significant aspects of the unconscious.

       It is interesting to note that Freud's views had at least one root in his practice, which was with patients living in the sexual no-man's land between men and women imposed by the culture-wide neurosis of Victorian moralism. Jung, nearly 20 years younger than Freud, was of a generation that was experiencing the beginnings of the swing away from the sharp polarization between male and female (Singer, 1976:38-43).
Following Jung's assertion that energy should be the dominant principle in analysis (1917: par. 442), he describes the main contents of the unconscious. He also described them, but more briefly, in the following quote from "Aion" in Psyche and Symbol (1958):

... from the standpoint of the psychology of the personality a two-fold division ensues: an "extra-conscious" psyche whose contents are personal, and an "extra-conscious" psyche whose contents are impersonal and collective. The first group comprises contents which are integral components of the individual personality and could therefore just as well be conscious; the second group forms, as it were, an omnipresent, unchanging, and everywhere identical condition or substrate of the psyche per se. This is, of course, no more than a hypothesis. But we are driven to it by the peculiar nature of the empirical material, not to mention the high probability that the general similarity of psychic processes in all individuals must be based on an equally general and impersonal principle that conforms to law, just as the instinct manifesting itself in the individual is only the
partial manifestation of an instinctual sub-
strate common to all men (Jung, 1958:6).

Thus he enunciates the personal and collective unconscious. Earlier
in the same chapter he has stated a simple identify between the ego
and consciousness. "Despite the unlimited extent of its bases, the
ego is never more and never less than consciousness as a whole". He
adds, however, that "... this would never amount to more than a
picture of the conscious personality, in which all those features
which are unknown or unconscious to the subject would be missing".
(Jung 1958:3-4).

In these quotes, first published in 1958, Jung summarizes an
operating hypothesis which he had earlier articulated in 1917. Thus,
his claim to empirical validation was founded on approximately 45
years of fruitful psychotherapy. The psychotherapy was directed to-
ward furthering the individuation process. Individuation is the
process of integrating into one's individual conscious self-hood
the contents of the various un-conscious levels just described.
The section on means in the emotional transformative process (p. 132,
ff.) details some of the myriad ways individuation takes place.

b. Human bisexuality: Jung's ideas have two similarities
to Freud's in regard to sexuality and at least two important differ-
ences. Both Jung and Freud contended that all human beings are by
nature bisexual in their tendencies to interpersonal relationships.
Both also assumed that every individual by nature has elements of maleness and femaleness within. One difference was that Freud saw this bisexuality as an illness to be cured, while Jung saw it as a phenomenon to be understood.

The second difference was that Freud was principally interested in helping his patients develop a mature relationship with a person of the opposite sex, and saw work with inner contents as a means. Jung was interested in helping his patients develop the inner relationships between the parts of their own personalities as a process having intrinsic value. As Singer puts it, "... Jung was more concerned with the interplay between the masculine and feminine components of the individual psyche" (Singer, 1976:43).

It may be helpful at this point to explore the positive and negative aspects of the feminine and masculine principles, since they were described so briefly in the introduction (pp.7-10). The feminine principle concerns us directly, here, of course, but the masculine principle is the foundation for the woman's contrasexual animus which has a major inward role to play in freeing her power.

Erich Neumann, a Jungian analyst, has written the definitive work on the great mother archetype (1963), showing its expressions in the cultures of the world through all of recorded history. He identifies positive and negative aspects of the great mother archetype along two axes, the nurturer and the enticer. He has organized the aspects into a wheel diagram which helps to show the
juxtapositions and oppositions of the varying aspects of the archetype in experience (see Figure 7). The positive (top) side of the diagram shows the life-giving and inspiring qualities, and the mythical figures associated with them. Development and vision are among the many valued contributions of the feminine principle.

Oddly, and perhaps characteristically, the Jungian literature does not include a similar diagram of the masculine principle. As a teaching device to clarify the concept, Robert Barger offered a parallel diagram which is included here as Figure 8. Here the various positive and negative aspects of the masculine principle are displayed along two axes, the guide and the creator. Bargar has organized aspects gathered from the literature, and especially Frances Wickes, showing which meanings are near and which are more distant from each other in human experience. The positive side of the wheel shows the desired characteristics. Wisdom, clarity and differentiation are positive characteristics, and the opposing negative characteristics are intellectualization and coercion.

While the anima in the man gathers positive and negative aspects of the great mother archetype into one womanly principle (the anima), the animus in the woman is a multiple archetype which has the same role in the unconscious as the anima in the man. The animus shows himself in a woman's speech and even in actions as "everyone" or the powers that be. This expression can be positive, and is especially likely to be so when the animus is doing his
Figure 7
The Feminine Principle
Diagram of the Great Mother Archetype (Erich Neumann)

(Neuman 1955: following p. 82 )
Figure 8
The Masculine Principle - A Teaching Diagram

(Bargar 1980: unpublished)
appropriate work clarifying and fostering understanding within. Then he is data-oriented (Singer, 1976:34), and analytical, rational, and level-headed. The negative potential may result in the woman's acting opinionated, domineering, and harsh (Singer, 1974: 242, 263). The role of the animus archetype is not to conduct the woman's relationships with her outer world, but to refine and add wisdom and depth to her inner world.

c. The foundations of Jungian psychology: Jung's own views, and those of his followers have impressed me because of their foundations in all-embracing studies of the person. Jung first qualified himself as a medical scientist and physician, but he also read archaeology, theology, and comparative religion. He explored his own psyche in depth as a counterpoint to his early years of medical practice. Then he made a five-year intensive study of alchemy, the underground psychology of the middle ages. Furthermore, he read widely in anthropology, and made a number of anthropological field studies himself. When I read Jung's writing on the experience of being human, I have the sense of a sureness based on perspective as well as intimacy.

Wickes and Singer both had strong backgrounds as laypersons, the one in Christianity and the other as the widow of a rabbi. Then both studied psychology, and Singer, at least, completed a Ph.D. In the 1960's, Frances Wickes was finishing her professional life as an analyst and was in her late eighties as June Singer was beginning her
professional life. John Sanford is an Episcopal priest. All three completed the rigorous program at the Jungian Institute in Zurich, and became Jungian analyst.

Even though Jung lived twenty years later than Freud, he still took his place in a Vienna that was highly patriarchal. He tried to be fair in his perceptions of women's psychology, but his efforts fall short, and frustratingly so from the standpoint of a modern feminism. He is "un-consciously" patronizing.

d. Animus and anima: Jung saw the anima or soul as the feminine unconscious aspect of the man's psyche which gave a compensating balance to his conscious and unconscious masculinity. Similarly, he named the animus of the woman, and found it to be the gathering of all the unconscious compensatory meanings associated with maleness. He regarded the animus as a very complex principle in women, in part because he continually found "him" to be multiple. His women patients would give their opinions which arose in the animus archetype as coming from "them", e.g., "They say . . ." or, "Everyone knows . . . ."

The results in experience of this animus principle for women are opinions rigidly held, unexamined, and unassailable because they are founded on untestable assumptions.

We must therefore expect the unconscious of woman to show aspects essentially different
from those found in man. If I were to attempt to put in a nutshell the difference between man and woman in this respect, i.e., what it is that characterizes the animus as opposed to the anima, I could only say this: as the anima produces moods, so the animus produces opinions; and as the moods of a man issue from a shadowy background, so the opinions of a woman rest on equally unconscious prior assumptions. Animus opinions very often have the character of solid convictions that are not lightly shaken, or of principles whose validity is seemingly unassailable. If we analyze these opinions, we immediately come upon unconscious assumptions whose existence must first be inferred; that is to say the opinions are apparently conceived as though such assumptions existed. But in reality the opinions are not thought out at all; they exist ready made, and they are held so positively and with so much conviction that the woman never has the shadow of a doubt about them (Jung, 1913:206-207, par. 331).

In Wickes as in Jung, I have found a "natural" predilection to view the woman as supplementary to the man who was seen as
the principal actor. Although Wickes does devote two chapters each to men and to women, she begins with men, and begins both her chapters on the feminine principle and her chapters on the animus with references to the anima in man. By contrast, the chapter on the masculine principle she begins with a powerful filled quote from the I Ching. Wickes also ends the first paragraph of her feminine principle chapter with a statement about serving relatedness, her "god", with "clear-eyed devotion" (1963:203).

Jung follows the paragraph just quoted above (p.231-232) with discussion of the negative effects of the animus which has been ignored by the conscious ego, and then moves to another important theme in his discussions of animus and anima, that is, the importance and value of having these principles do their appropriate inner work, as opposed to the danger of allowing them to be projected:

However, all these traits, as familiar as they are unsavory, are simply and solely due to the extraversion of the animus. The animus does not belong to the function of conscious relationship; his function is rather to facilitate relations with the unconscious. Instead of a woman merely associating opinions with external situations -- the animus, as an associative function, should be directed inwards, where it could associate the contents of the
unconscious . . . The animus is the deposit, as it were, of all woman's ancestral experiences of man -- and not only that, he is also a creative and procreative being, not in the sense of masculine creativity, but in the sense that he brings forth something we might call . . . the spermatic word. Just as a man brings forth his work as a complete creation out of his inner feminine nature, so the inner masculine side of a woman brings forth creative seeds which have the power to fertilize the feminine side of the man. This would be the femme inspiratrice who, if falsely cultivated, can turn into the worst kind of dogmatist and high-handed pedagogue -- a regular "animus hound", as one of my women patients aptly expressed it.

A woman possessed by the animus is always in danger of losing her femininity, her adapted feminine persona, just as a man in like circumstances runs the risk of effeminacy. These psychic changes of sex are due entirely to the fact that a function which belongs inside has been turned outside. The reason for this perversion is clearly the failure
to give adequate recognition to an inner world which stands autonomously opposed to the outer world, and makes just as serious demands on our capacity for adaptation (Jung, 1913:208-209, paras. 336-337).

The part of this statement that still seems relevant has to do with the inner work of the animus; the part that seems dated has to do with the implicit assumptions about the "naturally" supplemental role of women. It is expressed in this quotation by the woman's "creative seeds" being seen as mainly to fertilize the feminine side of the man, but he is seen as appropriately bringing about his creative work only by relying on his own inner femininity.

John Sanford and June Singer both resist this implication, and tune the valuable basic insight to the tone of the '80's. June Singer objects that women could benefit from similar fostering and nurturing of their creative insights from men. She also asserts that women seldom get it, even now, because of the lingering cultural norms. How often have I heard a woman, busy raising children, holding a job, and going to graduate school exclaim, "How I wish I had a house-husband to listen to my ideas as he served dinner!"

Both Sanford and Singer value the role of the animus in associating the conscious and unconscious elements of the psyche, and join Jung in showing how this can be done. I will be giving this work of the animus a fuller treatment in the sub-section below on individuation.
e. The feminine principle: Before we consider the individuation process further, I would like to include a discussion of the conscious and unconscious feminine aspects of woman's psyche that June Singer wrote. She draws on Erich Neumann's exhaustive treatment of the great mother archetype (1963) to show how it has lived on through time and the consciousness of mankind. Singer finds that it is equally important in shaping the psyches of women and of men, although it has different roles. Women apprehend directly the phases and forms of the feminine archetype. There are at least four profound transformations in the lives of women which are physical and archetypal; the beginning of menstruation, conception and pregnancy, giving birth, and lactation (1976:233-234). If the sequence following a woman's physical puberty is not chosen by the woman, then the awareness of having decided not to bear children is still an important turning point in the contact between the conscious and the unconscious parts of the feminine principle in the woman. A woman experiences these phases over extended periods in her own being, but they must always remain somewhat distant for a man. They potentially confer a unique sense of power, which may as well be enacted in the mental arena, for a woman.

These aspects of women's experience which are unique to us are portrayed with loving care by Frances Wickes as she writes of "The Feminine Principle" (1963). She describes the conscious feminine which knows the difference between good and evil, and uses this difference to love. The woman knows this difference in herself and
sees it in others, but always moves to use it to help it to serve relationship and growth. Beneath, in her unconscious there is always the pressure to smother with love, to possess, to devour the lives of those she consciously seeks to nurture. This is her dark side, and she must create a new balance all the time between it and her capacity to discriminate in loving. I would identify this discriminating capacity as the outcome of the work of the animus, although she includes it in her chapter on the feminine principle. However, she relates it to the instinctual feminine smoothly, showing their complementarity:

Discrimination and separation must enter feminine choice if compassion is to follow the ways of love. This does not mean separation from the instinctual irrational side of feminine wisdom, for often this subtle wisdom is a medium-like power that enables woman to penetrate the veil of appearances and see contained within the evil, the potential of good, embryonic within its darkness; or it warns her of the evil that is coming to birth in the seemingly good. Through this perception, her compassion may be directed upon the wheat, not the strangling tare. Jung speaks of that "understanding at all costs" which is so bent on sympathetic interpretation of
the other person's experience that it can become a state of "uncritical passivity coupled with the most complete subjectivity and lack of social responsibility" (Jung, The Undiscovered Self, p. 51). Indiscriminate tolerance may serve evil as effectively as it serves good . . . Shadow and light must both have their place in every feeling situation if it is to portray the three-dimensional reality of life, its solid fact illumined by the aura of inner perception (Wickes, 1963:211).

Seldom in her writing does Wickes dwell on the emancipatory experience implicit in individuation as it refers to the woman's independent exercise of her clarifying power, but Singer and Sanford both do.

The original quote for the motto for Wickes' second chapter on the psyche of women highlights in a slightly different way Jung's assertion that the role of the animus is an inward one. It says, "The animus is a psychopomp\textsuperscript{14}, a mediator between the conscious and the unconscious, and the personification of the latter" (Jung, "Aion" 1958:15). Throughout the chapter, it seems to me, Wickes still sees the role of the creativity released by the positive action of the animus as active largely in the service of bringing to life

\textsuperscript{14} a guide
powers dormant in others. Up to this point, I see much of the promise of the Jungian concern with inner process as opposed to relational outcomes as under-realized in promoting the emancipation of women.

It remains for Singer, a woman who has found her own power through much struggle, to draw together instances of women's finding their own strength in the feminine archetype. She tells (1972: 104-107) the story of a woman drawing on a vision of her mother to gather the confidence she needed to help her friend give birth in a lonely ranch house. She had never watched a baby being born, but there was no other help. The woman felt her fear gradually turn to a calm determination as she seemed to watch from the corner of the room what her mother would have done. Actually, she was doing it herself. She and her friend delivered the baby there, alone. There are many other instances of such empowerment in Boundaries of the Soul (1972), and in Androgyny (1976). The hospital dream my friend had of her grandmother was another empowering dream of the feminine archetype, in which the becoming that was enabled was the woman's own. Sometimes, also, the unconscious suddenly presents a glimpse of a little girl's clear gaze into the consciousness of an adult woman, giving back the childlike fearlessness.

f. Individuation: The consciousness-raising that Singer calls for in her modern Jungian work is subtly dual, and quite different from strident feminism. On the one hand, woman needs
to go beyond the question of whether her masculinity or femininity is predominant to the question, 'How are these aspects within myself relating to each other?' If peace about this is established within the individual, there will be no need for a public proclamation (1976:53). And on the other hand, a woman can legitimately see herself as a whole being, neither partial nor damaged. Singer presents the case persuasively for women, and men as well, to see themselves as androgynous beings. In our world, however, androgyny is hard won. There is nothing automatic about wholeness.

As I noted in the Introduction, Jung and those who have built on and extended his psychology have been explicit that the "individuation" process takes concentration and commitment. Jung called the encounter with the animus (and the anima, for men) the "masterpiece of individuation". Nevertheless, every step in which the ego confronts the anima or animus brings forth releases of energy of short or long duration.

A woman may move on in the individuation process by talking to her animus like the autonomous inner being that "he" is. John Sanford quotes Jung as having said, "It is not we who personify ... (him; he has) a personal nature from the start" (Jung Collected Works 13, Alchemical Studies, Princeton, 1967, par. 62). If a woman experiences the discouragement and put-down that comes from the negative action of the animus when he is being rigid and unfeeling,
John Sanford suggests that she talk to him and remind him of her feelings and values, and of her strong points, if necessary. If she does so, the animus can be a help. If not, "being deprived of the essential data of her feeling he had no alternative but to voice the general truths of the day" (quoted by John Sanford from Irene de Castillejo, Sanford 1980:78).  

Sanford also quotes from de Castillejo's writing about her own animus:

I personally like to think of my helpful animus as a torch-bearer; the figure of a man holding aloft his torch to light my way, throwing its beams into dark corners and penetrating the mists which shield the world of half-hidden mystery where, as a woman, I am so very much at home.

In a woman's world of shadows and cosmic truths he makes a pool of light as a focus for her eyes, and as she looks she may say, "Ah yes, that's what I mean", or "Oh no, that's not my truth at all". It is with the help of this torch also that she learns to give form to her ideas. He throws light on the jumble of words hovering beneath the surface of her mind so that she can choose the ones she wants, separates light into

---

the colours of the rainbow for her selection, enables her to see the part of which her whole is made, to discriminate between this and that. In a word, he enables her to focus (quoted by John Sanford 1980:76, from Irene de Castillejo, *ibid*, p. 76).

Jungians run to "poetry", and it is no accident. Poetic images are part of the language of the unconscious.

A woman can, by taking charge, aided by the positive aspects of her animus, continue her individuation process. When a woman notices that her opinions are arbitrary, or that she is imputing harsh motives to others, she is attending to projections of her animus. When a woman gives thoughtful attention to a dream of compelling force or vividness showing her perhaps relating to a male figure unknown to her in her waking life, she may be appreciating a gift from her animus. Artwork may show the animus' workings, and conscious consideration of it may help with the freeing process. Thus, by paying attention to the animus as guide and mediator, and to other aspects of her unconscious, such as images of the feminine archetype, a woman can go on integrating her unconscious into her conscious process. In these processes she is carrying on with her individuation.

The large body of case material upon which the formulations of Jungians is based constitutes a validation of it, but in addition,
recent work by George S. Welsh on creativity and intelligence seems to validate further some aspects of Jungian theory.

2. Empirical Validation by Welsh

   a. Origence and intellectence and gender role: In an extensive review of the literature, Welsh (1975) found that there was need for non-cognitive psychological constructs for creativity and intelligence. He undertook studies using as subjects outstandingly able young people at the Governor's School, a summer enrichment program in North Carolina. He used standard psychological instruments to identify the characteristics of the young people. Among the instruments were the Gough Adjective Checklist (ACL), the Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory (MMPI), and the Strong Vocational Interest Blank (SVIB). All of the instruments measured several dimensions, and all had more than one scale. Welsh had also developed (1940) the Welsh Figure Preference Test (WFPT), and had revised the Art Scale (RA) from it.

   Using the battery of tests, and eliminating cognitive tests for creativity, Welsh developed a construct he called "origence". Performance on the RA was significantly correlated to the origence construct. Practicing creative artists also scored significantly above chance on the scale. Other characteristics of persons who scored relatively high on the RA were that they were mentally normal (i.e., not mental patients), original, creative, feminine, expressive, non-conforming, flexible, playful, and self-directed, among other things.
Welsh also coined a parallel term, "intellectence", to refer to the characteristics associated with high performance on the Terman Concept Mastery Test (CMT), and similar instruments. He created a two-way grid by crossing the origence dimension with the intellectence dimension. I have summed up his verbal discussion of the characteristics of subjects whose scores placed them in each of the four quadrants he thus identified (Figure 9, p. 245; Welsh, 1955:102-197).

Welsh also included a scatter plot of the Strong Vocational Interest Blank (SVIB) scores from the vocational preference scale for males and females as projected on the high- and low-origence and intellectence scores. I have included the scatter plot as it appears in his book (Welsh 1975:110-111) to convey further the meaning of the quadrants in relation to vocational preference. For example, while those preferring to become architects centered in the high origence and high intellectence quadrant (II), those preferring to become bankers centered in the low origence-low intellectence quadrant (III) which is opposite. Similarly, those preferring to become salesmen centered in the high origence-low intellectence quadrant (I) while those preferring to become mathematicians were centered in the low origence-high intellectence quadrant (IV), (See Figure 10 "Creativity and Intelligence Test Correlates of Dimensional Scores", p. 246.)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quadrant</th>
<th>High Origence/Low Intellectence</th>
<th>High Origence/High Intellectence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(I)</td>
<td>extroversion</td>
<td>introversion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>responsive to obvious events and</td>
<td>responsive to own subjective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>the overt actions of others</td>
<td>feelings and attitudes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>influenced by the feelings of</td>
<td>rejects others' views and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>the moment, impulsive</td>
<td>opinions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>likes lively and stimulating</td>
<td>uninterested in having others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>people especially those who</td>
<td>around, has a few close friends</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>give praise</td>
<td>planful, persistent, and capable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>seeks immediate gratification</td>
<td>of working independently toward</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>seeks to persuade others by</td>
<td>a goal</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
|          | personal charm                  | confident of value of own conclu-
|          | rejects authority               | sions arrived at by insight       |

| (II)     | introversion                     | introversion                     |
|          | likes people for themselves      | neither withdrawn nor asocial     |
|          | willing to work as hard for      | objective and responsive to      |
|          | them as for self                 | others but keeps own distance    |
|          | accepting, uncritical, con-      | intellectual and rationalizing    |
|          | forming and conventional         | seldom acts impulsively          |
|          | cautious, prefers organized      | follows rules and believes the   |
|          | life                            | world to be an orderly place     |
|          | sincere, loyal, works cheerful- | prefers protocols to insights     |
|          | ly and with conviction           | ethical and moralistic           |

Figure 9
Quadrants Describing High and Low Origent and Intellectent Subjects
Figure 10
(Welsh, 1973, pp. 110-111)
Creativity and Intelligence Test
In addition to these findings about vocational distributions, Welsh discovered that masculinity and femininity were not necessarily opposites on the same dimension, but varied independently, so that it would theoretically be possible for a subject to score high on both. However, when Welsh analyzed his data into a three-by-three grid, he found that the highest origent subjects were not in the highest ninth, or "novant" in the reverse-sex characteristics (Figure 12). That is, the boys were not in the highest ninth in feminine characteristics, and the girls were not in the highest ninth in masculine characteristics. Instead, the boys in the highest novant on origence ranked third in femininity out of the nine clusters. The girls in the highest novant in origence ranked fourth in masculinity.

Welsh found that both the most creative males and the most creative females, as identified by the RA, tested significantly higher in the direction of femininity on the five masculinity and femininity scales (Parts left out of the following quotation have to do with a study of creative architects who were all males).

... The Governor's School results ... suggest that creative males and creative females alike will show certain feminine characteristics particularly those tapped by conventional masculinity-femininity scales. This would seem to argue against the hypothesis of reverse-sex identification in creativity --
that creative men should be more feminine
but that creative women would be more mas-
culine. A resolution of the seeming contra-
diction is possible through certain implica-
tions of the present results (Welsh 1975: 169).

Several paragraphs follow in which he shows how he discovered that
masculinity and femininity were not uni-dimensional. These he
summarizes:

An alternate explanation, then, and a hypo-
thesis stemming from implications of . . .
Governor's School results, is that creativi-
ty requires a blending of both masculine and
feminine characteristics and cannot be
accounted for by assumptions of reverse-sex
features on a single bipolar dimension (ibid.
170).

In quadrant II, high origent boys were significantly more feminine
than the norms of all five scales, but the high origent girls, al-
though also more feminine than other girls, did not reach signifi-
cance on three of the five. The most origent groups of girls scored
higher than any groups of boys on femininity. (Figure 11).

In a parallel finding of reverse-sex characteristics, Welsh
found that in quadrant IV, High Intellectence and Low Origence, the
girls were significantly more masculine than other girls (though not more masculine than the norms for boys). The high intellectence boys were also more masculine than the norms for boys but not to the same levels of significance as the girls. The diagram which follows (Figure 11) summarizes Welsh's findings on the relationships between origence and intellectence and gender roles, and Figure 12 for novant placements.

Figure 11
Hypothetical Interpretation of Sexual Identification
As a Function of Origence and Intellectence
(Welsh, 1975:172)
The effects noted are more pronounced for males than for females, but there seems to be a clear association between creativity and feminity and between intelligence and masculinity, for both females and males.

b. Comparison to Jung's anima and animus archetypes: Welsh points out that the persons who are most conforming to conventional gender roles are in the quadrant opposite to the one where the most creative people are located, in both sexes. And, in confirmation, Jung's psychology would predict that persons who are not the most bound by their gender roles, but exhibit some characteristics of the opposite sex, would be found in the creative quadrant. Indeed, this is exactly what is shown by Welsh's results. The summary is given in his words, and in Figure 12, "Novant Frequencies for Masculine and Feminine Subgroups".

To the extent that high origence/high intellectence is the creative quadrant, the Jungian position would imply that this type should be neither the most masculine nor the most feminine within either sex, but should show instead some characteristics of the opposite sex. Such a relationship has indeed been shown in the analyses . . . The most feminine boys are the high origent/low intellectent group of Novant (1); the most masculine girls are the low
(Welsh, 1955:167)

**Figure 12**

Novant Frequencies for Masculine and Feminine Subgroups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Low INT</th>
<th>Medium INT</th>
<th>High INT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High ORIG</td>
<td>(1)</td>
<td>(1-2)</td>
<td>(2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium ORIG</td>
<td>(1-3)</td>
<td>(0)</td>
<td>(2-4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low ORIG</td>
<td>(3)</td>
<td>(3-4)</td>
<td>(4)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Masculine Boys</th>
<th>Totals</th>
<th>Masculine Girls</th>
<th>Totals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0 2 5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2 5 5</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 9 7</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>3 8 9</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 16 17</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>6 10 14</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Feminine Boys</th>
<th>Totals</th>
<th>Feminine Girls</th>
<th>Totals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>17 14 7</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>9 9 5</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 9 8</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>14 12 4</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 6 1</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>6 3 0</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
origent/high intellectent group of Novant (4). Both boys and girls of Novant (2) fall between these extremes and may be considered to show a mixture of masculinity and femininity. These results are congruent with the animus/ anima balance specified by Jung's theory although they are complicated to some extent by the relationship of the two dimensions themselves to the specific measures of masculinity-femininity employed in the Governor's School study that have been discussed previously (1975:184).

Thus, it appears that Welsh's careful empirical work with its extensive statistical analysis corroborates what Jungian psychology has proposed. The integrating of unconscious contrasexual contents aids individuation and allows persons who are high in both creativity and intelligence to function androgynously.

As I have pointed out earlier, it is probably incorrect to identify creativity with transformative power. On the other hand, creativity and intelligence joined probably do support the operation of transformative power in the ways described in the earlier section on Means.

3. Women's Experience of Transformative Power and Jungian Psychology of Women
Now that I have presented the theory of transformative power, and the continually developing Jungian views of women's psychology, what is the relation between the two? Briefly, it is that the individuation process results in the release into the woman's life of more transformative power. Individuation is not, narrowly, emotional development, but lest there be any confusion from that connotation, I want to say clearly that individuation facilitates the action of transformative power in every realm of women's experience, physical, emotional, mental, and transpersonal spiritual. What applies to people generally applies to female people specifically.

There are, however, some aspects of the individuation experience for women which are related to the distinctive effects of the feminine principle and of the positive and negative effects of the animus, which will be interesting to explore. I shall follow roughly the outline which has guided the rest of the chapter in discussing the relation of the Jungian view of woman's psyche to the idea of transformative power I have been proposing. That is, I will briefly relate the experience of women to first, the emancipatory interest of Habermas, then I will show how it relates to source, purpose, means, and outcomes of transformative power.

a. The emancipatory interest and the Jungian view of women: Habermas has identified the mode of inquiry appropriate to the emancipatory interest as critical inquiry. Critical inquiry involves a
gradual, sensitive unlayering of the packed-down residue of social necessities and distorted co-communication. In this kind of inquiry, as a woman does it herself, she ideally has the help of her animus in casting light inwardly on the repressed material and the conscious and unconscious bindings that are given in her gender roles. She can come to know herself, to find out "who she really is", in common parlance. The psycho-analytic situation, or a situation of political liberation like the one women have provided themselves in the women's lib movement is typical of the cases Habermas analyzed, but they seem to me to be better to discuss in the chapter on communicative power.

b. The source of transformative power and the Jungian views of woman: Neumann's monumental work on the Great Mother archetype (1963) reveals a frequent identification in various cultures between the mother and the nurturing (or consuming) earth. This concept I would extend to the transpersonal source of transformative power. As woman is co-extensive with earth, and beyond, so is she one with the universal energy.

New becoming comes through women in the birthing cycle (Singer:233-234), and this is brought about by the insemination by the man. Similarly, through woman's nurturing mind, new ideas can come into being, from the illuminating inner spark of the animus, the masculine principle. The alternation between the two phases
is a large-scale analog of the minute alternation of the micro-phenomena in the woman perceived as a hierarchy of energy sub-systems.

c. Purposes in transformative power and the Jungian views of women: It is in the area of purposes that the opinionated character of the negative animus is most often criticized by Jungians. The woman makes up her mind to a certain course of action, and no data will deter her. This rigidity of animus "possession" is the kind of domination of outcomes that I have expressly put outside the type of purpose appropriate for transformative process (see p.70). Rather, the receptive stance of the feminine principle is the one most likely to produce a useful relationship to purposes in transformative power. The openness to the world and the adaptability that characterize the free action of the feminine principle allow a woman's purposes to guide, but not limit, the use of transformative power. The holistic character of being more in touch with all of her selfhood that Jungians have seen as typically womanly is relevant to the importance of having purposes in all the arenas of experience, as well.

d. Means for transformative power and the Jungian view of women: Drawing from the several Jungian analysts, I find quotations that show how they see the woman experiencing each of the steps in the model I have offered in this study. I have drawn mainly from Frances Wickes, since I have used Singer more in the means in the
emotional area, and since John Sanford's work that I have seen is on healing, and on dreams, and on the anima and animus, specifically. There is a natural bias, in using a psychological base, in favor of discussing the model from an emotional point of view, but I will be extrapolating from that area into the others.

(1) Sensing a Dis-Ease: Relationship is the guiding principle of the feminine psyche, and sensing a yearning or dis-ease may very readily spring from some discomfort in relationship, for a woman. Wickes writes of self-doubt and the setting in which she discusses it is the old myth of Eros, in which Eros must leave Psyche when she turns the lamp onto his face so that she can know him. Unexamined love indeed creates a situation of jealousy and dangerous for a woman to be in. And so the woman doubts; first herself, then the feeling of the relationship, and then the lover. Wickes says:

The first agent of liberation may be doubt -- doubt of herself, doubt of the experience, doubt of the object who has been clothes in the image of god. This doubt asks the fatal question, who are you? (Wickes 1963:229).

The incapacity to express anger in relationship has been charged with the onset of some diseases to which women are statistically more liable, such as arthritis (three times the rate of men) (Pelletier, 1977). Sensing the problem is the beginning, and a woman may very well sense it in terms of flawed relationship in the Jungian view
because she is oriented toward relationships and sensitive to subtle shifts in them.

(2) Having an Insight: Jungian thought would find two avenues open to the woman in this step in the model. On the one hand, the deep, earthy awareness—that-does-not-know-how-it-knows that is typical of the feminine principle, provides a kind of insight. And on the other, the flash of light from the lamp held aloft by the animus provides a special, sudden seeing. The quotation from Jung that Wickes gives (1963:209) I like especially because it has intimations of the volition that needs to follow, as well as of the problem-sensing that predated it:

Conflict lights the fire of affects and emotions and has two aspects like every fire: namely combustion and the production of light. On the one side the emotion is the alchemistic fire whose warmth makes everything manifest and whose heart burns away all superfluities and, on the other, the emotion is the moment when steel strikes stone and a spark is produced. For emotion is the chief source of becoming conscious. There is no transformation from dark to light or from inertia to movement without emotion (Jung, "Psychological Aspects of the Mother Archetype", Spring 1943, p. 22).
The emotional prompting does not limit the insight to any one arena of experience, it seems. Women are likely to have an intellectual insight of a vivid and convincing kind, but then have to work very hard, in a way that does not come easily, to figure out the steps that lead from the sources to the culminating arguments.

(3) Developing Volition: Springing from an emotion-prompted discovery comes the will to bring the possibility imagined into a reality experienced. In the setting of the Eros legend, Wickes reminds us the woman could be reunited with the man if she could perform the impossible task of sorting several kinds of seeks so that the nature of each would be recognizable. She summons her friends, the ants, from her native medium, the earth, and they help her. The urge to relatedness gives her volition for the task.

Wickes puts it that "... The old illusion is gone. A new reality takes its place if now she has courage to face what the light reveals" (Wickes, 1963:229). I have the impression that the deep earth forces of womanly self-hood are seen by Jungian analysts as the source of the will to transform, for a woman (Wickes 1963:203-204).

(4) Generating Options for the Process: All the forms of the feminine principle offer the woman different options for process, some of them negative. Erich Neumann (1963) discusses the forms of the feminine in terms of their appearance in mythology: Lilith the enticer, Kali the devourer, Hecate the wrathful, Sophia the wise, Demeter and Mary the good (see also p. 1936 for Neumann's diagram
in locating them). Wickes sees the true search of every woman as being the search for love itself. This is not love of individual persons, but the love that lies behind all loving.

... For this she may have to wound in order to awaken, to risk the loss of the beloved rather than lose the truth of love itself. This may mean the choice of the lonely way, for the journey into the self is a solitary one. But its aloneness is not the loneliness of an isolated ego, for the meaning of the search is ever present, and each step brings her nearer to a knowledge of love (Wickes, 1963:230).

The purpose or meaning of the search overarches the looking at options. A woman's options are numerous, and with her two kinds of intuition, and the patience to wait, she is likely to see many of them.

John Sanford emphasizes the role of the animus in making inner suggestions. Sanford believes that it is especially important for a woman to write down the ideas that come into her head, both because that helps to keep them conscious, and as we shall see in the sub-section on feedback, it also helps to strengthen the ego in the dialogue (Sanford, 1980:62).
(5) Envisioning the Purpose: For envisioning the purpose, the joint action of the feminine principle and the animus in a woman's psyche is especially important. The feminine principle alone may bog down in the details of immediate demands without the light to see the pattern of her process. On the positive side, Wickes tells of a woman physician who was a labor law advocate. When she was asked how she could defend her objectives without arousing negative undercurrents in a roomful of antagonistic men, she answered, "I keep before my inner vision a scene I once witnessed -- a thin tired bewildered child sitting with loving patience beside a father who was dying of lead poisoning. Then I remember the meaning of my research in terms of human life" (Wickes, 1963:238). This kind of a guiding image of the purpose infused with the feeling of daring devotion is a classic of positive womanly style in the Jungian writers.

Its relevance to transformative process is central, and it is one of the ways women are especially strong in enabling the action of transformative power in their lives.

(6) Evaluating the Options: The multiplicity of options that may come easily to a woman who has paid attention to her animus can be evaluated by the same principle. "Possibility becomes actuality if a woman works to bring intuitive perceptions into line with reality, whereas unchecked intuition plays with a possibility
assuming that it is inevitable destiny" (Wickes 1963:206). The inner logos, the animus, or masculine principle in the woman, with its analytical and discriminating capacity, must be consciously given a chance to do the work or the woman will be at the mercy of her deep urges, and especially of the urge to relatedness.

This clarity is part of woman's psyche, but her using it regularly is by no means inevitable in the Jungian view. Stepping back to be logical must be a conscious choice. The ego decides how to use the material offered by the unconscious; the woman does not just "go with the flow".

This phase is of practical significance in transformative process, because the pull of the feminine principle toward relationship values may tend to blind her to options that would be productive. Exercise, other than as a social activity, for instance, would have to be a conscious choice.

(7) Engaging in the Process: The process is the validation. Jung was very successful in his actual treatment methods that he used with people. The result was that the world, in Jung's opinion, took too little cognizance of the fact that the only real importance of the treatment was in relation to the living his patients did elsewhere in their lives. The way of envisioning and examination was not of value just for itself. "Quite the contrary, for such a way is possible and profitable only when the specific worldly tasks
which these individuals set themselves are carried out in reality" (Jung, 1913:224, par. 369). This principle applies to women equally with men, of course, but the woman has a special challenge in carrying out her purposes. Individuation is important in enabling a woman's engaging-in-the-process because the feminine principle is likely to make her open to all sorts of interpersonal distractions. The contrasexual principle within must provide the organization to follow through. If the process is conducted in a setting which includes relatedness the setting can reinforce the focus as I shall be suggesting in the final chapter on the relation of these concepts to corporate training situations.

(8) Seeking Feedback/Dialogue: In its similarity to evaluating the options at the start, this step also calls for the woman's latent capacity for thinking about the impressions that come to her as she is engaging in the process. John Sanford suggests writing down the suggestions of the animus, as I mentioned in the sub-section on generating options. He then calls for inner dialogue:

... Then it is only a simple step beyond this for a woman to reply to the voice of the animus. In this way she can challenge his opinions, disagree with him, and educate him about her true feelings and actual situation. Writing down the ensuing dialogue strengthens a woman's ego, for taking up pen or pencil to write is the ego's work. Once such a dialogue is begun, the animus
may go on to tell a woman what it is that he really wants out of life. When this happens the chances for a positive relationship between a woman and her animus are greatly increased (Sanford, 1980:62).

The dialogue may infuse the mental or physical process as well as the emotional with a saving grace of tentativeness.

(9) Making Shifts in Process: The view of woman that Wickes shares so warmly in The Inner World of Choice does not close anyone's eyes to the potential for interruption and distraction that a woman experiences. The purpose can bring a woman back on track, however:

Perhaps the woman is caught in the details of a job or career. As tired businesswoman she may be quite as much at the mercy of detail as is the household drudge. Yet she too must learn that her problem as a woman is not only the task but the central purpose with which the task is imbued. If the "invisible sun" reveals the hidden motive, she may be delivered from ego ambition and petty intrigue and may release her feminine feeling so it can function in appreciation and generous cooperation. For the "invisible sun" can throw light upon all the frustrating interruptions, the innumerable demands,
transforming them to fragments to be set into the mosaic of her daily life (Wickes, 1963:224-225).

The shifts Wickes envisions hint at incorporating the insights that come from the interruptions, but I would lay more emphasis on them, as would Singer. The important point in the quote, it seems to me, is that the sense of the purpose transcends the details and guides her.

Thus, we see the relation of the model for the means of transformative process in relation to the views of Jung and some of his adherents on woman's psyche.

e. Outcomes from transformative power, and the Jungian views of women: The nurturing, life-giving Frances Wickes herself has been especially articulate about the positive outcomes possible for women within the belief system she portrays, in The Inner World of Choice (1963). She describes very winningly all through her chapter on the "Man in the Woman" the steps and the courage to take the steps that lead to transcending the domination of the ego. From this basic removal of self from center stage and the overcoming of the masklike selfhood put on to impress society and to shield oneself from its prying eyes, the person gains a new sense of self, she finds. In summarizing the two chapters in which she has treated the feminine principle and the animus in the woman, she has given a dream in which the negative animus is transcended by a compassionate set of
understanding by the woman. What appears, then, is a powerful figure of a positive animus, who unites with her in a leap of energy between them, in a vast amphitheater.

... She saw the difficulties, the demands of his complex nature, the necessity for full commitment. In that moment the negative animus again stood before her in his form of self-doubt and negation, and she chose love and trusted the power of yielding in order to transform this dark element of her own being. In that moment she again heard the music, felt the pulsations of energy and knew that, even as in the dream, she had entered into the Dance of Life, and the vast and empty amphitheater had become filled with its eternal energy.

It is through woman's relation to the transformed and transforming animus and through the intricate steps of a fully lived human relationship that she learns the varying patterns of this dance. In trusting herself to the movement of the guide, she discovers that no matter how intricately the dance moves, no matter how many its changes, interruptions and deviations, it never loses the
vital thread of meaning that holds it connected with and that returns it to the center (Wickes, 1963:258).

Thus Wickes, writing in the early sixties expresses the outcome of a woman's experience of the transformative process of attending to the images of her unconscious. She writes poetically of the release of energy and the new sense of self that the woman finds.

Sanford, standing in the new wave of Jungian thought about women, is concerned that the woman use her conscious purpose to confront the negative animus that would put her down. The outcome that the following quote illustrates is an ego, strengthened by productive awareness of and insights from the animus, able to engage in dialogue with it.

As we have seen, the negative animus resembles an inferior, ill-informed, and prejudiced man; his sweeping judgments and banal opinions come from his ignorance. So a woman may need to sit down with her animus and say, "This is the way it is, and this is what is important to me. You are not to keep telling me to the contrary." Obviously, in order to do this she must first know what is important to her. In this way the animus can have the positive effect of helping a woman become conscious of her true values.
She must also find out what he wants. As we noted, the anima and animus live through us, and the lives we lead must have room in them for these archetypal figures and their life energy. For a man this means that his life must include warm and meaningful human relationships, and the area of the heart. . . . For a woman this means that her life must include a certain fulfillment in the area of goals, aspirations, spirit, and mind (Sanford, 1980:60).

Sanford's statement is less poetic, and more explicit about the woman's need for individual fulfillment, but both Wickes and Sanford stress the emergent energy that results from the transforming process. This appears to be the experience of transformative power.

Finally, the outcome of increasing individuation, and through it, the release of transformative power, is the transforming of society. M.-L. von Franz' statement of this transformation is similar in spirit to those of other Jungians:

. . . The animus in his most developed form sometimes connects the woman's mind with the spiritual evolution of her age, and can thereby make her even more receptive than a man to new creative ideas. It is for this reason that in earlier times women were used by many nations
as diviners and seers. The creative boldness of their positive animus at times expresses thoughts and ideas that simulate men to new enterprises (von Franz, 1968:207).

In summarizing a woman's contribution in this way, von Franz has provided a transition to the effects in outer relationships of the transformative process. In the chapter which follows, I will be discussing communicative power, the second of the three main ways that I find women experience the universal energy in ways that are unique to them.
CHAPTER FOUR

COMMUNICATIVE POWER

A. INTRODUCTION

We create our own reality, and it does begin within, as I postulated at the beginning of the two chapters on transformative power. However, as we create our own reality, we deal with the data from a world of nature seen as objects, and a world of persons seen as fellow subjects. Our transactions with the world of nature (including other persons, when they are seen as objects) take place within a structure of rules which we take for granted, but in our transactions with the world of persons, we have the additional dimension of trying to understand the rules as well as their operation in the content of our experience. The knowledge we form in this dialogue, in community with other human beings, comes into being as a result of our interest in surviving in that community. This interest Jurgen Habermas has called "practical", and the action involved he has called "communicative" (Habermas, 1971). I have called the capacity to take such action effectively the use of communicative power.
In this Introduction to the chapter on communicative power, I will be discussing Habermas' concept of the practical interest, and how the practical interest is served by what he calls "hermeneutic inquiry". I will then show how the use of hermeneutic inquiry helps the use of communicative power. The second section (B) will be a discussion of the terms in the definition of communicative power, in order to give a fuller understanding of the definition itself.

The third section (C) will be a summary of what I take to be the sources of communicative power. Even before that section, however, I want to be clear that in speaking of source in the plural, I am indicating the immediate sources, rather than the original source. All power used by persons has its sources in the universal flux of energy of which we are fairly long-standing energy configurations. The power released as persons exercise the capacity called communicative power is part of the apparently endless alternation of energy in the universe, it is dialogue, two-way inter-action.

Although I will be discussing the interactions between the three kinds of power in Chapter Six, it is important at this point to show that the use of communicative power is a process that is independent of, and of parallel importance with, transformative power. Communicative power is "the capacity to form a common will or consensus," in undistorted communication. The release of transformative power may be an outcome of such a process, but it is not necessary
that it be. It would be, of course, if there were within the persons some distortion in existence on the subject upon which the consensus was finally reached. Similarly, it would not be logically necessary that persons engaged in communicative process have experienced transformative power. They might simply achieve a consensus for its own sake on a topic that called for no transformative experience previously. Communicative power has different sources, a different purpose, different means, and certainly different outcomes from transformative power. Transformative power acts within the person, and communicative power acts among persons. Communicative power is a different experience from transformative power, but they are of parallel importance in human experience.

In the section on purpose (D) I will be showing that communicative power can be used to the extent that it has only the purpose of forming a consensus or a common will. To the extent that any other purpose is present, communicative power is hindered. In the fifth section on means (E) I will be presenting four criteria by which methods employed in communicative process may be evaluated, and applying them to dyad interactions and to some larger group interactions. I will then summarize some of the contingencies I have been mentioning in the earlier sections of the chapter, and I will also discuss primary and secondary outcomes in the sixth section (F).
Finally, I will return to the Jungian psychology of women (G) to draw out some of its implications for women's use of communicative power. The popular pre-feminist view of women has always been that women are good at creating community, but I will be showing that this view needs to be refined and adapted by the Jungian understandings about the contrasexual animus principle in the women's psyche, and about the negative as well as the positive feminine principle or archetype in the woman. Both the nurturing and the clarifying aspects of women's psyches are needed in exercising the practical interest as Habermas describes it.

McCarthy (1978) is the principal explicator of Jurgen Habermas' thought to date. In introducing Habermas' work on the practical interest, which I am associating with communicative power, McCarthy's first concern is to discriminate it from the technical interest. The technical interest is associated with instrumental power, as I will be showing in Chapter Five. It comes into being as people need to deal with objects or persons as objects, in the various worlds of work. By contrast, the practical interest is grounded in the basic need in sociocultural life, that is, that in order to survive, people need to have a dependable agreement that they can communicate about their mutual framework of meaning. In other words, people require a "reliable intersubjectivity" (McCarthy, 1978:69). The inquiry processes by which the agreement is established and maintained are
directed at understanding, in the practical interest, rather than at establishing what the laws are, as in the technical interest. As long as the inquiry directed toward understanding, the "hermeneutic" inquiry, is successfully continued, it gradually eliminates misunderstandings based on both the life history of the individuals involved and their cultural history, and on the interactions between individuals and groups. Habermas, himself, makes the distinctions:

In its very structure hermeneutic understanding is designed to guarantee, within cultural traditions, the possible action-orienting self-understanding of individuals and groups as well as reciprocal understanding between different individuals and groups. It makes possible the form of unconstrained consensus and the type of open intersubjectivity on which communicative action depends. It bans the danger of communication breakdown in both dimensions: the vertical one of one's own individual life history and the collective tradition to which one belongs, and the horizontal one of mediating between the traditions of different individuals, groups and cultures. When these communication flows break off and the intersubjectivity of mutual understanding is either
rigidified or falls apart, a condition of survival is disturbed, one that is as elementary as the complementary condition of the success of instrumental action: namely the possibility of unconstrained agreement and non-violent recognition. Because this is the presupposition of practice, we call the knowledge-constitutive interest of the cultural sciences "practical" (Habermas, 1971:176, emphasis his).

In discriminating the practical interest from the technical interest, Habermas also introduces the interest itself. Although he states very simply that hermeneutic understanding bans the breakdown of communication, he has a great deal to say about how that banning takes place.

Hermeneutic understanding is very complex. So complex, in fact, that discussions about it have typically grown out of professional practice of some kind. When it is done well in difficult situations, Habermas calls it a hermeneutic "art" and says that it is tied to "'personal virtuosity'" (Habermas, 1971:175). An empirically-based confirmation of this valuing judgment by Habermas is to be found in the taxonomy of vocational skills used by the Dictionary of Occupational Titles of the U.S. Employment Service which is based on extensive research by Dr. John L. Holland and Dr. Sidney A. Fine. The skills based on hermeneutic art, which are
at the top of the people skills section of the taxonomy, are "negotiating" and "mentoring", and the descriptions of them include such words as "counsels, exchanges ideas, and advises on implications". (Holland, 1973; Bolles, 1976:73-76, Dictionary of Occupational Titles 1965).

Habermas points out in the quotation given above (p. 274) that the practical interest has a dual function of maintaining the identity of the individual and in establishing the meaning of the individual's non-identity with other individuals and groups. Both functions are needed to interact in dialogue. However, human persons are so complex that all expressions of the inner reality in either words or actions must be partial. Habermas discusses the problem at some length in his critique of the work of Wilhelm Dilthey in Knowledge and Human Interests (1971: Chapter Eight).

Habermas affirms three classes of "life expressions" as discussed by Dilthey (1) linguistic, (2) action, and (3) "experiential expression" (1971:166). Experiential expressions include physiologic statements of unarticulated intentions, such as gestures, blushing and turning pale, glances, bodily relaxation, and laughing, all the behaviors that are usually gathered together under the term "non-verbal". In trying to understand the expressions that a person is making out of his or her own life experience, sentences and actions are not enough. The gap that remains has to do with all the rest of life experience that is unstated. Attending to the experiential
expressions closes the gap. Functioning together, the three make as full a reflection of the inner world of meaning as possible, providing what Habermas calls the "reflexivity" of a natural language.

When there is a breakdown in this complex network of communication, the resulting problems cue an investigation of the missing understanding. Action cannot be effectively oriented, nor can the individual validate those aspects of his or her self-understanding that arise from comparing his inner experience with the expressions others are making of theirs. The specific kind of effort that is triggered is a probing to interpret the disturbance in the consensus of meaning that was thought to exist, to form a more workable understanding.

The process of understanding can go on at two levels in hermeneutic inquiry. The first is the one that it shares with technical inquiry, namely whether there is a correspondence between the facts and the expression. Here the pattern of language is a guide to accurate expression. However, the pattern of language itself is also capable of being discussed, and this contributes to understanding. Once a person can speak his native language and knows how to interpret it, he does not speak just be referring to the rules of how to speak the language, but infuses that language with the reality of the world as he experiences it. He has the feel of reality to go by, as well as the rules of language, in deciding whether he is telling or hearing, the truth.
Habermas has explored the issue further in an article published later than the original publication of the Dilthey article in Knowledge and Human Interests (1971, orig. 1968). Although the article is "On Systematically Distorted Communication" (1970), in psychopathology, the basic criteria he says are available for identifying such communication apply also to the process of clarifying the miscommunications of everyday life. They serve in this discussion to extend our understanding of the "life expressions" Habermas discussed in the Dilthey article. The discussion which follows has to do with an example of Habermas' theory-building about hermeneutic inquiry, the inquiry that expresses the practical interest. It is based on Habermas' exposition (1970:206-207).

At the linguistic level, distorted communication may be recognized by deviations from usual semantic use of words, and even of syntax. Freud, on whom Habermas draws for his understanding of psychopathology, saw the dream distortions as meaningful in this way. Jung's interpretation of dreams also attended to "condensation, displacement, absence of grammaticalness, and the use of words with opposite meaning" (Habermas, 1970:206). The use of words in dreams is certainly productive of understanding, but the use of words in ordinary or stressful talk is often characterized by these same revealing characteristics. Abbreviated syntax, non-standard use of words, and omissions, for example, often give a clue to our own or
another person's disturbed communication, Disidentifying enough to notice is a use of communicative power, as we shall see.

A second criterion of distorted communication that Habermas discusses is in the language-behaviors used. Rigidity and compulsive repetition, and stereotyped behaviors in emotionally loaded situations are examples he gives. Habermas points out that the words do not have the independence of the situational content that they usually do. The person "just has to" respond in the way every time he or she encounters a situation that feels like the one that originally became attached to that verbal reaction. In Freudian psychoanalysis, the sources for relieving the rigidity must be sought in childhood experience. But in everyday experience, when communication is less systematically distorted, the remedy may not be so far off. The aware listener may be able to understand and interpret without making an issue of having discovered.

The third criterion of distorted communication has to do with the coherence of all three aspects in the whole expression. If "the usual congruency between linguistic symbols, actions, and accompanying gestures has disintegrated" (1970:207) then we recognize distorted communication. Some one of the elements is not usual for a "public language-performance" (1970:207), and it is isolated by its content from the rest of the communication. It represents only what one part of the person is trying to say, but in addition to not fitting the public part of the rest of the
communication, it often is not accessible to the person communicating, either. Even in grossly distorted communication in extreme pathology, such incongruities may be subtle, and their meanings may be difficult to understand. In the expressions of persons who are nearer to their societies' norms, however, lack of coherent expression is also a clue to the need for re-working the consensus of meaning in which they have been working. The distortions in communication may be subtle or obvious, but if they are dealt with within the ongoing sense of community, communicative power is at work.

It is not automatic that participants in miscommunication will notice that something is amiss, Habermas points out. "Pseudo-communication produces a system of reciprocal misunderstandings, which due to the false assumption of consensus, are not recognized as such" (1970:206). A "neutral" observer, or one of the participants who maintains perspective on the process may notice, but can never be fully neutral because of being embedded in the same natural language situation. The sense of community that undergirds efforts to restore consensus is rooted in this common culture.

Habermas' propositions about the structural conditions of normal communication in the same article (1970:210-212) are also of importance to the consideration of communicative power. The first is that the three classes of life expression must be congruent, as I noted above on pp. 275-276. The second is that normal
communication is public in the sense that the rules and meanings it uses match the common consensus about them. The third is that the speakers recognize the difference between the public realm and their inner reality which may include inexpressible connotations. The speakers also recognize the distinction between the words or expressions and the objects which they designate. This is the independence from the situation that I mentioned above.

The fourth is that the participants establish not only an intersubjectivity in which they have a common reference to objects and common rules for speaking about them, an analytical use of language, but they also recognize in each other the subjectivity they experience personally. Habermas points out that there is a paradoxical quality to this second recognition because by the very recognition in which they establish that the other person is a subject, experiencing like they are, they also establish that the other person is distinct from themselves, "ego and alter-ego" (1970: 211). This is part of the reflexive use of language. The analytical use of language is included in the reflexive use of language to permit a full intersubjectivity.

The fifth is that substance and causality, and space and time, have different meanings when applied to the objective phenomena that are dealt with in the analytical aspect of intersubjectivity from the meanings they have when they are applied to the mutuality of persons who recognize each other as subjects. The substance of
clear-cut objects is different from the identity of the rich complexity of persons experienced as subjects. Causality makes sense when objects are moved according to some observable schedule, but the concept of motive replaces it when persons move according to their inner direction.

Similarly, and also in the fifth proposition, space and time have different meanings when applied to "experienced interactions" (1970:212), from those that they have when applied to measured properties of external events. "Space" becomes social space, and "time" becomes subjective historical time.

These five propositions about normal communication, and the previous observations about the three kinds of "life expressions", linguistic, action and experiential, form the base for Habermas' comments in his article, "Hannah Arendt's Communications Concept of Power" (1977:3-24). They form that base by giving a set of guidelines for carrying out in practice the theory of power he describes her as setting forth.

He begins by describing Max Weber's concept of power as the capacity to achieve one's own will (or the will of one's group) by whatever means one can command. These means may include force, or any method of contriving the agreement of others. However, others' agreement is seen solely as a means to achieving one's own goal, so Habermas labels the model of action Weber describes "teleological"
(1977:3). By contrast, he calls Hannah Arendt's model of action "communicative" (1977:4). Paraphrasing her he says, "The fundamental phenomenon of power is not the instrumentalization of another's will, but the formation of a common will in a communication directed to reaching agreement" (1977:4, emphasis his). To complete the separation of Hannah Arendt's concept from the teleological one, Habermas also notes Talcott Parsons' systems theory of teleological power. Parsons defines power as a capacity of a social system to mobilize resources to achieve collective goals, but includes mobilizing its own components among the resources. Persons who are part of such a system are subject to the same instrumentalization as external persons may be in Weber's scheme.

The key sentence in Habermas' exposition is also key for the concept of communicative power advanced here. It is, "The power of agreement-oriented communication to produce consensus is opposed to this [teleological] force, because seriously intended agreement is an end in itself and cannot be instrumentalized for other ends" (1977:5). How is this power? It is power because it rests directly on the rational force of insight. When people engage in truly unconstrained dialogue the power of the agreement that does emerge is based on the rationality of human beings. I shall have more to say about the characteristics of "unconstrained" dialogue in what follows but the important distinction Habermas makes in this part of his commentary is that people have to set aside their individual successes
and make forming consensus the purpose of their communication together. Then, as he says, "power is built up in communicative action; it is a collective effect of speech in which reaching agreement is an end in itself for all those involved" (1977:6). Arendt says that this power serves to keep healthy the interaction processes that it comes from, so it becomes manifest" (a) in orders that protect liberty, (b) in resistance against forces that threaten political liberty, and (c) in those revolutionary actions that found new institutions of liberty" (1977:6-7).

To return to the idea of "truly unconstrained dialogue" mentioned above, the ideas of substance and causality, space and time, come into play. Communicative power is evanescent. To exist, it must be experienced in practice. For it to be experienced all participants must recognize each other as alter-egos, experiencing subjects with the characteristic (1) contextual substance, (2) motivated causality, (3) interpersonal space, (4) and historical time mentioned above. Lest this series of provisos seem impossibly difficult, I must add that participants need only recognize each other in this way experientially, not necessarily cognitively, if my reading of Arendt and Habermas is correct. Habermas points out that in the ancient Greek democracies that Arendt writes about in The Human Condition (1958), and wherever communicative power is at work, it is unstable and needs to be protected. The protection it needs is provided by some kind of a "political" institution, but the political
institution that protects it is totally dependent on communicative power, the power of a "nondeformed public realm" (1977:9). And this power rests on the deep-rooted ("radical") equality of the "rationality claim immanent in speech" (1977:8). Speech, again, is to be understood as all the life expressions.

Both Habermas and Arendt are profoundly concerned with the applications in political history of the ideas that she advanced and he explicated. They show how totalitarian states use fear to strip people of their differentness from each other in order to treat them as one item. They show how such a state having made people all the same in their relations to the state, then instrumentalizes the people's action to the goals of the state. I believe that in the institutions of a democracy that is in the kinds of transitions ours is, we may well be wary of the same dangers. Our complex organizations, I hope to show, exert similar pressures to extinguish communicative power, but are similarly dependent for their vitality on its force. Nevertheless, communicative power must function alongside instrumental (or teleological) power in real-world institutions and relationships, as Habermas goes on to comment (1977:10-24). The definition of communicative power follows straightforwardly from Habermas' own hermeneutic inquiry.

B. DEFINITION

Communicative power is the capacity to achieve a common will or consensus. This can only be done by ensuring unconstrained
intersubjectivity in the dialogue. The power will be communicative if it conveys meaning between persons. The communicative process is one of the three kinds of power to the extent that it conveys the actual capacity to form a common will.

A common will, however, is not a simple reality. Each person brings with him or her to the experience of forming a common will an assortment of conscious assumptions and fears or anxieties that do much to prevent full participation. Further, as we have seen in the chapters on transformative power, each person also brings much unconscious material to any interaction. While some of the unconscious material is common with other human beings (the collective unconscious), much is idiosyncratic (the personal unconscious). The means for releasing communicative power are complex skills, although I will be identifying some criteria from the literature that will give structure to understanding them.

Apart from its complexity, and the difficulty of bringing a common will to pass, a common will is a mutual commitment to a way of seeing an issue. It is a consensus about how reality is perceived.

"Unconstrained" means that no force outside the process of open dialogue is brought to play on the participants. The process of using this kind of power is complex and subtle. The self-discipline needed is complex and double-faced. Looking outward, we must be alert not to use any accidental or intended disproportionate advantage in the dialogue. We must be watchful not to coerce others in
any way that would keep them from expressing as much of their understanding as they can become aware of. Looking inward, we must use all the imagination and persistence we can mobilize to express our own understanding both clearly and persuasively. We need to turn a penetrating gaze on our thoughts, our feelings, and our inward images to find all that is ours that must be entered in the dialogue to make the emergent consensus represent our personal reality.

"Intersubjectivity" means a relationship in which each conscious ego, each person, involved deals with each other person, every alter-ego, as a subject. Dealing with others as a subject means, as Habermas has pointed out on the one hand, validating our own experience by the symbolic expressions of the others and understanding others' experience through our own. On the other hand, it also means taking the differences between us, the inviolable and incomprehensible private experience, seriously.

By defining each of the concepts used in the definition I have attempted to make the definition itself clearer. Communicative power is one way of using the universal power of which we are all a part, and it consists of using the capacity to form consensus by developing it in a process of unconstrained intersubjectivity, in alternations of the direction of power.

C. SOURCE

In order to describe the relationship between communicative power and the universal power flux within which we are manifest to
to each other, I would like to return to concepts of Sri Aurobindo and Geoffrey Chew which were presented by Capra (1975:263-284).

Capra presents the Eastern Mystical idea of "li" or pattern by which all things fit together. He also points out that in the Eastern view (as in modern physics) no part is a fundamental part. The inter-relation of parts is the most significant aspect of them, and the properties of each part are to be understood in terms of that relationship. In the mystical view, since no one part can be fully explained without the (impossible) explanation of all, the quest is for a direct experience of the unity rather than for any explanation.

Capra discusses the work of Geoffrey Chew, a theoretical physicist, who enunciated a principle popularly known as the "bootstrap" hypothesis because it models how the universe holds itself up. Chew's work was with sub-atomic particles, and one aspect of it was to show that the concept of an ultimate elementary particle was a logical impossibility. The characteristics which allow the particle to respond to forces outside itself require that it have some internal structure. Capra quotes him as writing, "A truly elementary particle -- completely devoid of internal structure -- could not be subject to any forces that would allow us to detect its existence. The mere knowledge of a particle's existence, that is to say, implies that the particle possesses internal structure!"\(^{16}\) It is an interesting

---

analogy to Habermas' specifications for normal communication in the practical interest. In that line of thought, we can know others by establishing an intersubjectivity based on knowing our own inner reality. Sir James Jeans, the beloved scientist philosopher, is quoted by Kenneth Pelletier (1978) in a remarkably similar vein:

Today there is a wide measure of agreement, which on the physical side of science approaches almost to unanimity, that the stream of knowledge is heading toward a non-mechanical reality; the universe begins to look more like a great thought than like a great machine (Jeans, 1937:122).17

All three of these writers have emphasized elsewhere the great complexity of the phenomena involved both at the sub-atomic level and at the interpersonal level.

A parallel appears here to experiencing the process of a group (two or more individuals in meaningful contact for a purpose according to Mills, 1967:2), i.e., the "experience of community". We cannot know any one person fully, because of the influence of the past, and the quality of relationship in the present. We cannot fully explain the individuals and we cannot explain fully why the process in the group is as it is, but by keeping an unstrained awareness in the present we can experience as much as is possible for us.

Capra quotes Sri Aurobindo, an Indian mystical leader of the twentieth century, as he continues his discussion of Geoffrey Chew's bootstrap hypothesis. "Nothing to the supramental sense is really finite; it is founded on a feeling of all in each and of each in all", (Capra, 1975:282) and says it is similar to a passage from the Avatamsaka Sutra, a work considered to be a culmination of Buddhist thought. The concept of interpenetration being expressed here goes beyond Habermas' concept of intersubjectivity, and I am including it to show how communicative power relates to the universal source. The Avatamsaka Sutra passage is presented as a dream of the Buddha after his Awakening, or enlightenment, and it is of a great tower, containing many towers:

The Tower is as wide and spacious as the sky itself. The ground is paved with [innumerable] previous stones of all kinds, and there are within the Tower [innumerable] palaces, porches, windows, staircases railings, and passages . . . And within this Tower, spacious and exquisitely ornamented, there are also hundreds of thousands . . . of towers, each one of which is as exquisitely ornamented as the main Tower itself and as spacious as the sky. And all these towers, beyond calculation in number, stand not at all in one another's way; each preserves its individual existence in

perfect harmony with all the rest; there is nothing here that bars one tower being fused with all the others individually and collectively; there is a state of perfect intermingling and yet of perfect orderliness (Capra, 1975:283).\footnote{Originally quoted in D.T. Suzuki. \textit{On Indian Mahayana Buddhism}, E. Conze (Ed.). New York: Harper and Row, 1968.}

The passage seemed to be especially worth quoting in this study since it has such a definite combination of images related to the masculine and feminine archetypes. The towers, with all their light from the precious stones may be interpreted as an image of the masculine principle, while the pervasive sense of fusion and intermingling may be an image of the feminine principle. Capra himself interprets the dream as an image of the mutual interdependence of all things and events, and comments that "causal explanations become unnecessary" (1975:284). It seems especially interesting to include because it has an oriental origin and is an example of the trans-cultural nature of archetypes. (See Jung in the Chapter Six analysis).

Although this statement of the source of communicative power must be somewhat allegorical, I am indebted to Capra for drawing
together the parallel understandings of Geoffrey Chew, the physicist, on the one hand and of Aurobindo, Suzuki, and the Buddhist writers of the Avatamsaka Sutra, on the other. It is a view of the source of communicative power that is sympathetic to that proposed by Habermas and Hannah Arendt, as well, although it goes further than either of them would be likely to go, in affirming a transpersonal unified power flux.

By contrast, however, the immediate sources of communicative power can be stated more briefly, and they lie in the specific capacities of persons developed, perhaps, in response to the need for a reliable intersubjectivity in order to define the self and initiate action. Communicative power has its immediate source in our ability to sense what is not said by others, and to express what cannot be portrayed in words by ourselves, as well as what can be portrayed in our various levels of facility with words. Its universal source is still a matter for speculation, but may fairly be said to arise in the energy "dialogues" and alternations of the universal flux of energy within which we are configurations, or sub-systems. Someone has said that the human being is a culture-bearing mammal, and that description seems to summarize the immediate sources of communicative power.

D. PURPOSE

The purpose of communicative power is always to seek consensus, to form a common will. "Common will" adds meaning to
"consensus" by connoting a direction to the consensus. "Consensus" by itself lacks the explicit meaning of giving a guide to action. That potential must always be present when a multi-dimensional consensus involving all available life expressions has been achieved, but it is not explicit.

Similarly, "consensus" adds meaning to "common will" by drawing attention to the quality of feeling alike about the matter that is implicit in any willing that is truly held in common. All of these meanings inhere in the purpose of communicative power. The purpose can be more inclusively stated as being to form a reliable intersubjectivity that weaves in as much as possible of the relevant life experience of all the participants and constitutes a guide to action and self-definition.

Any purpose other than seeking a common will or consensus distorts the use of communicative power because it prejudices the outcome of dialogue to some extent. Insofar as one member of a communicative process insists on the goal he or she entered the process with, that goal-seeking bends the process away from openness and a straightforward seeking of the will that expresses the life experience of all the participants. To say this is not to say that any person need necessarily give up his or her goals on entering the kind of hermeneutic inquiry that is involved in communicative process. Actually, the opposite is true. Each person must represent honestly what is most important to her, or to him. Each person's
goals give structure to the process, but must be open to change by it. Rather, the emphasis is on putting the context first, in order to accord full respect to what is most important to the others involved. The purpose is achieving a common will; how that is done will be the focus of the next section, on means in communicative power.

A particularly moving example of a successful exercise of communicative power in Belfast, Northern Ireland was described by Carl Rogers (1977). It illustrates the role of purpose in communicative power. Rogers states the purpose of the meeting as having been to "facilitate straightforward communication" (1977:129), a clear articulation of the purpose of communicative power. Catholics and Protestants, extremists and moderates, men and women, and older and younger people were included. They were drawn together to hear each other in an environment which was safe and open both physically and emotionally. The interaction went on for a total of sixteen hours, and as the participants spoke it was clear that the bitterness, fear, and anger they felt stemmed as much from their personal histories as distinctive individuals who were also experiencing the violence in Belfast, as it did from the centuries of hatreds between their cultural groups. As they talked and listened they were able to draw out of each other and of themselves the seething feelings and deeply held opinions that drove them. One sensitive young Catholic teacher said he had had to draw a steel shutter between his functioning self
and the animal feeling that would otherwise drive him berserk.

No other outcomes were planned than mutual understanding. No public pronouncements were anticipated. As a matter of fact, observers made a movie of the meetings, and some of the comments had to be deleted, lest those who made them be punished by their co-religionists. A further indication of the commitment of the members that developed was their determination to continue meeting in the home of one of themselves later. I shall have more to say about this, and about other action the group took, in the outcomes section of this chapter. The outcomes were positive, but they were not designed for, or sought as goals.

Rogers summarizes this incident and others he has given, in three sub-purposes (1977:138-139). The first is that the participants should not be manipulated, but allowed to become more of the selves that they are. The second is that persons be allowed to touch other persons at the level of that selfhood so that relations can become expressive and understanding. The third is that participants come to be accepting of the negative as well as the positive in each other. Such purposes contribute to the appropriate purpose of communicative power.

The purpose of communicative power would be a cruel dream if it were not for the means to actualize it. To speak about it without the knowledge and practice to allow it to happen would be
to raise hopes that seem like judgments. The outcomes are so heartwarming that they have drawn a wide range of practitioners to refine their skills. Unfortunately, the results are also so inviting that they have drawn many to refine skill without yielding their egos to the absolute demand of the purpose for open-ended process. Communicative power can be released only to the extent that the actual purpose of all the participants can become the seeking of a truly common will.

E. MEANS

The practice of psychotherapy, organizational development, and social change all lie within the realm of communicative power. Each of them in its goal-seeking form is prone to distort the pure force of communicative power, however, Family life, loving pairs, and deep friendship groups also release communicative power into people's lives. Each of these settings may also allow the dominance of ego that limits the strength of communicative power. Rigid goal-seeking seems to be a form of ego control that vitiates the potential of communicative power, but that general statement can be analyzed into at least four criteria to apply to the actual process, or means, within a variety of methods currently in use.

1. Criteria for methods in use in the realm of communicative power.

The criteria I am about to offer have been drawn intuitively from my own experience of groups of all the kinds I have listed

There is a great deal of overlapping among these authors in proposing the four criteria I sense to be fundamental and reasonably inclusive, but certain authors have asserted one or several of the criteria with more energy or vividness so that they have become identified with them. Rensis Likert has been identified with openness, Richard Walton has with symmetry of opportunity, Jack Gibb has with trust, and Frances Vaughan has with enlightenment, for example.

The criterion of fostering enlightenment bridges into communicative power from transformative power, and I will be discussing it first, but otherwise the order in which I am presenting these criteria has no meaning. The criteria themselves may not exhaust the possible significant criteria, but they will serve us here as a checklist of significant characteristics of methods of using communicative power.
a. Fosters enlightenment: The criterion of having fostered enlightenment might be seen as a way of evaluating the outcomes of using communicative power if it were not so essential to the process. Enlightenment cannot be taken narrowly in the sense that the Buddha came to be "enlightened" either. Enlightenment in the sense of a gradual disidentification with one's own goals and possessions of all kinds is bound to be an intermediate product of an effective communicative process in which confrontation exists. That is, it is a mark of the quality of process in communicative power that the participants transcend exclusive ego identification with what is their own, and commit to the common will that forms among them.

It is important to note that unless the process is actually fostering enlightenment, members may form a new, and equally crippling identification with the consensus they produce. This is a particular danger if they have not consciously experienced communicative power in action before. People are very likely to become attached to the people or the place where they experienced communicative power, in a kind of magical way, failing to notice that the power was released in them, instead. When the action of the process (as distinct from the subject-matter content) is brought to awareness, people have an opportunity to release themselves from exclusive identification and realize that the power is a general phenomenon. They can also realize that although it is generally available,
it only becomes actualized as they follow its disciplines. That is, if the process fosters enlightenment, they can come to realize that they can exercise communicative power themselves with other people in other circumstances to the extent that they are willing to release the control of their own ego and set their own goals second to the formation of a common will.

b. Maintains symmetry of opportunity: Symmetry of opportunity, like enlightenment, is a potential outcome that is integral to the process. Symmetry of opportunity within a communicative process means that the invisible and understated constraints that prevent each person from having full entry to the process, at all levels of his or her being, must be removed, little by little. This criterion, like the first, is not likely to characterize a communicative process at the outset. It must be enacted increasingly, though, for the fullest release of communicative power.

The principal reason why symmetry of opportunity must be a criterion of effective communicative process is that as soon as one or more of the participants sense that they do not have equivalent opportunity, they begin to hide those very needs, and dreams, and bright ideas, that enrich the process. The narrowing of contribution may be very subtle, and it is quite likely to be in contrast to the expressed norms of the group. Classic examples are the impoverishment of contribution to American life by Blacks, and the limited conversational contributions of women in gatherings.
where men and women are both present. Voices of those whose opportu-
nities are not symmetrical are also often raised to claim that they do not want to make the contributions they are in fact limited from making. Blacks may claim that they prefer to contribute in the areas of sports and music that have provided a somewhat more symmetrical opportunity.

Two points may be drawn from the preceding comment. The first is that communicative process need not be limited to small face-to-face groups. To expand on the first, it can be said that the group is constituted by the opportunity for meaningful ongoing contact, that is, by communication. In national life, Blacks singly and in groups are in contact with the dominant white culture repeatedly and often continuously. Privately, women singly and in groups are in contact with men and in social and semi-social gatherings regularly. However, the contributions of each are less valued, and in both cases, they contribute less.

The second point that can be drawn from the comment above on the lessening of contribution by those whose opportunity is compromised is that those who lack equivalent opportunity may not be conscious of wanting it. The daily absence of an experience eventuates in an attrition of awareness that the opportunity even might exist. Persons can hardly ask for or use what they are not conscious of having. Of course, both Blacks and women are gradually gaining a greater symmetry of opportunity with results predictable
from this discussion. More communicative power is in action.

c. Deepens trust: This criterion, like the other two, is almost circular. As trust deepens, persons can and do behave in ways that deepen trust. The slightest trust engenders an opportunity for trust-building, and it is presence of the deepening of trust that signals the release of communicative power. A number of sub-processes tend to build trust, and they are all indicators of the focus on the building of consensus at many personal levels.

Among the sub-criteria that may be identified within "deepens trust" are: responding in terms of the issues instead of in terms of official roles; getting involved in terms of concerns touching on the matters at hand instead of exclusively with reference to rules; and depending on the integrity and intelligence of others in the process rather than only counting on one's own contribution.

Setting aside official roles does not mean abandoning their meaningful content for which one is responsible. Indeed, those contents are among the many levels of self-hood that every person brings to communicative process. The trust-inhibiting behavior is to guide one's contribution to the consensus-building by reference only to one's formal role, instead of moving with increasing freedom among the levels of self-hood.
Similarly, rules as well as roles have a way of keeping us in touch with our numerous contexts, and it is not productive to sever those contacts as we engage in communicative process. Rules express accumulated wisdom, and if they have been drawn in communicative process themselves they may be profoundly valid expressions. They need to be taken seriously, but they need to be related to concerns at hand as only one element in the complex network of interaction.

Another criterion within the cluster related to deepening trust is whether the participants can increasingly rely on the integrity and intelligence of the others. If they are meeting this criterion they will gradually count more and more one each other's honesty, self-respect, and consistency. They will come to expect sensible, relevant responses unclouded by fears and poses.

The cluster of criteria included in "deepens trust" are essential to the release of communicative power because they allow participants to be free to form a common will without diverting energy into defensive goals.

e. Enhances openness: Openness reveals the inner wisdom and the inner pain that each person brings to communicative process. It builds on itself in reciprocation between persons because it aids inward transactions that lift more and more of each person's realities to awareness. Like trust, and also like enlightenment and symmetry of opportunity, it can be an outcome, but its presence
the process is a sure criterion to test for the presence of communi-
cative power.

Openness is cyclical in that the sharing of one aspect of
one's self makes another aspect of one's self accessible. Fears
and joys, dogmas and convictions, trivia and useful innovations
gradually come to consciousness through the sharing and valuing that
takes place in openness.

Openness is also intentional. People can decide to be just
a bit more open, and to take hold of a fleeting thought to offer it
into the mutual communication. A person can decide to dare expres-
sing an emotion even though the risk of being overwhelmed is always
present. A person can allow him- or herself an expressive gesture
of rejection or acceptance in spite of the chance of having it taken
for more than was intended.

Finally, openness is synergistic. One person's openness
creates a connection for another's half-hidden need or hope or idea.
The reciprocation noted above results in co-creativity that pro-
duces innovation. Probably the most impactful aspect of communica-
tive power is that sense those using it have that something is
emerging which none of them could ever have invented individually.

Thus openness is cyclical and intentional within each per-
son, and synergistic among all the people involved. Used with the
other three criteria; fostering enlightenment, maintaining symmetry
of opportunity, and deepening trust, it provides a guide to recognizing the extent to which communicative power is at work among people.

2. Methods in use in the realm of communicative power

The criteria were drawn from three general kinds of group experience in which communicative power is typically at work, psychotherapy, organizational development, and social change. In each of these arenas, there are methods in use that will illuminate further the means of using communicative power. I would like to broaden the category of psychotherapy enough to include other dyads, such as those that are constantly springing up in family life. I will be drawing on David McClelland's exploration of the life and contribution of his Quaker mother-in-law (1975), and on Walsh and Vaughan's (1980) and Singer's (1972) discussion of the therapeutic process, in the dyads section. In the arena of organizational development I want to discuss third-party conflict resolution (Walton, 1969), team development (Beer, 1976; Hackman, 1976; Golembiewski, 1970a), and process consultation (Schein, 1969, Federation of Ohio River Cooperatives; and Coover, Deacon, Esser and Moore, 1978). Finally, in the arena of social change, I want to summarize the methods section with a discussion of Carl Rogers' presentation of his experience in applying the insights of his lifetime to the issues of social change (1977). In each of these arenas I hope to how how the level to
which it fulfills the criteria controls the operation of communi-
cative power in the experience of the group.

a. Methods in use in dyads: David McClelland introduces
the life story of his Quaker mother-in-law, Grace Waring, to illus-
trate his own points that sexual gender roles determine the expres-
sion of personal power, and the feminine expression has three major
characteristics which can all be taken positively. The characteristics
are (1) that it is context-oriented or interdependent; (2)
that it is giving; and (3) that it is perceived in an endure-first-
for-pleasure-in-the-end pattern. He follows Jourard\(^{20}\) in finding
that women are significantly more open than men, and notes that Grace
Waring is typically feminine in being willing to have him share her
personal communication within the family, in his book.

By her example and by her guidance she encouraged the full
expression of her family members' needs and dreams in arriving at
decisions. McClelland speaks with special appreciation of her doing
so in relation to the planning he and her daughter were doing before
their marriage. He felt a responsibility to establish his career
before marrying her, but Grace Waring encouraged him to keep his
decision on career open, since he was uncertain about it, but to go
ahead with the marriage, since they had all come to a whole-hearted
agreement on that point. Clearly a profound trust had grown up among
them. In fact, a further sign of trust was the family's willingness
to entrust him with the first member of their family to move out of

1963.
the community in nine generations. The Philadelphia Friends community has a broad reputation for thorough consensual process over several centuries, so a climate of trust exists within the community. The community has developed consensus forming skills, which Grace Waring had learned with her basic socialization, that enable them to develop trust readily with others outside the community, as well.

Their consensual process is founded on a constantly refined and improved symmetry of opportunity for all members that is rooted in their religious belief in the value of every human creature. The popular expression among Quakers is that there is an "inner light" in every person, stemming from being the child of God. The behavior that stems from this belief is to accord symmetry of opportunity to everyone including children and women. As McClelland says, "Everyone is equal before God, and in the silence of the Quaker meeting God may speak through anyone, male or female. Indeed, some of the best known Quaker ministers -- those who spoke in meeting -- were then and had always been women" (1975:109). This same symmetry of opportunity engendered a symmetry of responsibility for group life so that sharing and collaboration were norms to which boys were taught to conform as well as girls.

Grace Waring apparently illustrated in her own skills an unusually fine fruition of a community culture that cherished
communicative power. She formed a marriage committee in her own Friends meeting, and through it helped to extend to other couples in the consensus-building skill that she had practiced with her own children (three by birth and four step-children). On into her eighties young people came to her to define and deepen the consensuses that they were seeking with each other.

Grace Waring herself never stopped developing, beginning with a rather unhappy childhood in which she was regarded by her parents as a redundant additional girl child, and not even a very pretty one. She saw each new adversity as a challenge. Explicitly, she believed sufferings "should be assets in helping and understanding and sympathizing with other people" (McClelland, 1975:117). In her old age she was able to act more fully on her lifelong concern in the area of race-relations, although at some personal cost to herself, physically, since she had just weathered the long death of her second husband by cancer. Her way of transcending in life seemed to be taking initiative.

However, the enlightenment she experienced undergirded her development of consensus with others. The enlightenment she articulated in this way: "I fail so much in all . . . kinds of faith, but now and then get hold. It is a sort of surrender to the will of God and letting power flow through" (1975:112).
The attractiveness of her consensus-building skill is attested by McClelland's words about her: "Small wonder that people in trouble, particularly young people, beat a path to her door for advice and help. They sensed that they could not shock her into abandoning them no matter what they had done, and that she would go right on believing in them and strengthening them to make the right decision" (1975:114, emphasis his).

The interactions she had over the years of consensus-finding with young people guided her own action in founding the Marriage Council, and contributed to her own self-understanding as she made her way through a very difficult life. Probably the daily down-to-earth dialogue with the seven children she raised was the unseen forge in which the means of releasing communicative power she used were refined. McClelland does not provide what it was that she and her children said to each other, since his interest is in how she saw herself and in the outcomes of the power she used. If it were not for the plausible hypothesis that she was personally and openly involved with her children, we might have to conclude that Grace Waring exercised communicative power for the well-being of others, and not purely for consensus. The outcomes in the development of common will make it all the more likely that Grace Waring was a resolute and skillful user of the means of communicative power, as she went through life involving others in developing consensus and community of understanding.
The transpersonal psychotherapists, Frances Vaughan and Roger Walsh, whose work I presented in the subsection on means for transformative power in emotional experience (pp. 132-173), believe that the therapists' inputs to therapeutic process must be made in radical openness to new understanding in order to develop a sufficiently profound common perception of reality. However, I think the following quotation also shows that they expect the transpersonal therapist to enter the therapeutic relationship with a goal in mind which he or she will not set aside, in addition to the commitment to shared process.

A transpersonal context in therapy is determined entirely by the beliefs, values and intentions of the therapist. For example, if a therapist intends to communicate attitudes that facilitate trust, and is comfortable with his/her own transpersonal experiences, the client may gain confidence in exploring these realms. What can take place in therapy is inevitably limited by the personal fears and beliefs of the therapist, just as it is limited by the readiness of the client to explore these realms. Therefore, in order to establish favorable conditions for transpersonal exploration, the therapist must be willing to handle
any obstacles to self-awareness that may arise in the process. When, for example, a therapist identifies with an expanded sense of the self as the source of experience, the potential for healing in the therapeutic relationship is enhanced" (Vaughan, 1979b: 102-103).

The commitment to fostering of enlightenment in the sense of dis-identification for both participants is explicit, but the goal is also given, and it is enlightenment for both, or healing for the client. Here, the fostering of enlightenment is a goal, rather than a criterion.

Symmetry of opportunity in this kind of therapeutic situation is a means, as well as a criterion. The following quote makes a rather clear statement to that effect:

Acknowledging the centrality of consciousness in psychotherapy implies that the state of consciousness of the therapist has a profound and far-reaching effect on the therapeutic relationship. For example, the relationship may be deepened by the therapist's awareness of the underlying oneness of all beings and his/her essential connectedness with the client" (Vaughan, 1979b:103).
Such a sense of oneness might, and judging from the rest of the article, does form the basis of a productive respect for the client's integrity. It could also be a mark of the symmetry of opportunity to develop toward full potential for both the client and the therapist. In order for that symmetry of opportunity to enter into the dialogue to be a criterion of communicative process, however, both participants have to be gradually more and more willing to entertain the other's way of looking at reality. Vaughan, and elsewhere Walsh (Walsh and Vaughan, 1980) stress the value of that openness, but only as a means to helping the client give up crippling identifications.

In such a context, trust in the goodwill of the therapist can develop, but extra efforts have to be expended to foster trust in his or her openness. The client's trust in himself develops as he or she deals successfully again and again with the content of therapy (problems, fears, anxieties) in the broadest possible context of disidentification by the therapist. In adhering to his or her role as therapist, the therapist provides a reliable intersubjectivity about the definition of that role also, but Vaughan and Walsh allow for a further and most important addition.

In pointing out the value of modeling in psychotherapy, they add that in transpersonal therapy, the therapist may serve the client best by modeling transpersonal growth. Rather than trying to be a
blank screen on which the client may project whatever is useful to him, the transpersonal therapist models openness about his or her own growth, in addition to the openness about reactions to the client's experience that humanistic existential therapy advocates:

To this participation the transpersonal orientation has added the perspective that the therapist may benefit both the client and him or herself best by using the relationship to optimize his or her own transpersonal growth through consciously serving the client . . .

Indeed, working with one's own consciousness becomes a primary responsibility. The growth of one participant in the therapeutic relationship is seen as facilitating that of the other, . . . Where the therapist is consciously serving the client there is no hierarchical status accorded to being a therapist. Rather the situation is held as one in which both the therapist and the client are working on themselves, each in the way that is most appropriate to their particular development. The therapist's openness and willingness to use the therapeutic process to maximize his or her own growth and
commitment to service is viewed as the optimal modeling that can be provided for the client. (Walsh and Vaughan, 1980:19-20).

Here, the common will to move toward a consensus about the way reality is to be perceived is very clear. The symmetry of opportunity is consciously preserved, and a truly deep trust can emerge. The radical openness of the therapist can facilitate an increasing openness on the part of the client. The therapist holds his role rather seriously, but is not bound by it in such a way that he cannot be open to the process.

The only hampering of communicative power that I see in operation in the way Vaughan and Walsh see the transpersonal therapeutic process is that in some subtle way the action of transformational power is a criterion of the process, rather than merely a possible outcome. The seeking of consensus is not the goal, mutual self-development is. Taking this difference into account, though, the process of transpersonal therapy still meets the criteria for the release of communicative power to a large degree. The outcomes, according to the authors, are increased energy, joy, and improved effectiveness, among others.

b. Methods in use in organization development: In considering methods of releasing communicative power in organization development a facilitative role is defined in each case. The role of the
facilitator is precisely not to take part directly in the development of consensus, but rather to attend to the condition of the process. In this way, the participants can move freely within the process to develop a common will. It is the facilitator's role to set up an agreement to try to meet the criteria of communicative power among the participants, and then to keep them in touch with their motivation to do so. In a situation in which the facilitator role does not exist, the role tasks would be divided among the group members.

The most elemental case of this kind of process is that described by Richard Walton, a Harvard Business School behavioral scientist, in his discussion of the third party role in conflict resolution in complex organizations (1969). On the basis of his extensive practice of organization development in business and industrial organizations, he has written of the interpersonal conflict resolution aspect of his practice. He presents three cases in which the participants in the conflict situation had all had training experiences that led them to recognize the role of the consultant, and to identify it with norms calling for confrontation and openness. However, he insists that such past experience on the part of those in conflict would not be a prerequisite, and I would concur from my own experience. The essential is that the persons be ready to attend with awareness to the dynamics related to the criteria for communicative process.
In working with the three conflict-ridden dyads that he has written about, Walton explicitly rules out by definition any attempt to deal with them in terms of a legal-justice mechanism such as would emerge in a labor dispute covered by a contract provision, or in terms of a power-bargaining approach such as would be needed if one participant had decisive power over the other. In short, he is engaged, in all three cases in a hermeneutic kind of inquiry, in which there is at least a possibility of symmetry of opportunity. He calls his approach "social-science analysis and intervention" (1969:12), and describes it himself as a kind of pattern-finding observation style, combined with a trust-building intervention style. Note that here the meaning of "analysis" that is associated with inquiry in instrumental process is only partly in action. The participants are seen as "alter egos" by the third party consultant, and that enables him to empathize with their feelings and judge the value of potential interventions. However, he is a third party, and has the objective of helping the participants get back into a productive relationship to continue meeting the objectives of the organization in which they work. That goal, and that method of holding himself at a distance from their interaction, helps him to think analytically about their consensus-seeking. His relationship to the communicative power they release must be a hybrid one.
The pattern of conflict theory that Walton presents helps to show what some of the means of releasing communicative power are. He shows that conflicts are cyclical according to the following figure:

![A Cyclical Model of Interpersonal Conflict](image)

(Walton, 1969:72)

The model is shown in a horizontal position for simplicity, but according to whether the conflict is moving toward greater bitterness or toward productive resolution, the pattern moves either in an upward or downward spiral.

The tactics Walton identifies are means for releasing communicative power, whether they move toward more conflict and hence to the potential for introducing data that will sharpen and clarify the issues, or toward reconciliation that will affirm a consensus emerging.
His role, and the one that might be shared among participants if there were no third party, has a number of aspects. One is to keep up the hope of the participants and ensure their both being motivated to continue the process. Another is to create parity between the level of instrumental power each perceives the other to have. Another is to synchronize their efforts to deal negatively and positively with each other so that a conciliation move is not met with a punishing effort to increase the conflict level. Another is to suggest trust-building and openness-enhancing ways of talking and questioning. And finally, still another is to maintain adequate tension with regard to outcomes to keep it moving but also avoid destroying relationship (Walton, 1969:v).

All the criteria for communicative process are met to some degree by the process Walton describes. Participants have an opportunity to gain in enlightenment. Symmetry of opportunity is maintained so that each experiences sufficient comfort to enter his side of the matter into the conflict effectively. Trust develops as neither side is demolished, and openness becomes increasingly possible so that the less obvious reasons for the conflict can emerge and be dealt with. As we shall see again in the team-building example, however, the organizational setting reduces the possibility of an unconstrained intersubjectivity. The participants are ultimately subject to the goals of the organization, and a completely
unconstrained intersubjectivity is only possible to the extent that their personal goals coincide with the organization's.

In team development, the immediate objective is communicative process. Beer (1976) suggests that typical team development efforts involve a work-group. They start with a data-gathering process which may be a brainstorming session, or may be a survey conducted in small groups, individually, or on paper. Topics may be "leadership behavior, interpersonal problems and process, roles, trust, communication, planning and decision making, goals, delegation, technical and task problems, and barriers to effective group and organizational functioning" (Beer, 1976:955-956). The consultant feeds back the results of the data-gathering, and guides the group in forming tactics for dealing with the data. He or she may coach the participants on communication styles, or may help them to recognize which aspects of the data to tackle first in order to move through the rest smoothly. She or he may operate in much the way Walton described, in relation to conflicts portrayed by the data gathered, and may provide personal consultation to individuals as needed. In all those aspects of the role, the effect is to release communicative power. In all of them, however, the consultant does play a role, and Beer is frank to admit that "We do not yet fully understand what it takes to create a self-sufficient group" (Beer, 1976:956). I shall have something to say about that in Chapter six on the interrelationships between the kinds of power, because it seems
likely that moves toward full human potential, and toward an uncluttered use of instrumental power may impinge on the self-sufficiency of a group in communicative process.

Team development offers an opportunity for the use of communicative power that meets the criteria to a limited extent. The process must be kept at a level that meets the norms of the organization or extends them slightly, so that some confrontations and supports that would foster the enlightenment of the individual such as dealing with family concerns or individual histories must be barred. Contingent trust can develop, subject to the reality that the persons are being affirmed as workers rather than fully as persons, and their enlightenment is being sought to the extent that it will influence their performance as workers. Openness must be controlled by the same concerns. Finally, symmetry of opportunity is not a natural part of the process because some persons are necessarily in charge of the destinies of others in a work team. Symmetry of opportunity must be maintained artificially by the outsider, or by the person having greater instrumental power, until norms are established that define temporary and limited areas for power parity.

I have left process consultation for the last example in the organization development sub-section because it seems to me that it offers most promise for phasing out or minimizing the role of facilitator and placing the control of communicative power in the hands of the group members. Edgar Schein defines process consultation
in very general terms, and then gives the following description of process consultation in the introduction to his book on it (1969):

The process consultant seeks to give the client "insight" into what is going on around him, within him, and between him and other people. The events to be observed and learned from are primarily the various human actions which occur in the normal flow of work, in the conduct of meetings, and in formal or informal encounters between members of the organization. Of particular relevance are the client's own actions and their impact on other people (Schein, 1969:9).

For the present, I intend to concentrate on the aspects of process consultation that has to do with the conduct of meetings organized to conduct business or arrive at decisions. I believe that very similar processes and parallel awareness and consequent intervention can be used in the other interactions Schein mentions. Schein's observations are general enough to apply to organizations which do not use consensus-seeking as a method of decision making. He identifies the six human processes that he most often is called upon to deal with as a consultant, "(1) communication; (2) member roles and functions in groups; (3) group problem-solving and decision-making;
(4) group norms and group growth; (5) leadership and authority; and (6) intergroup cooperation and competition" (Schein, 1969:13).

The Sixteenth Avenue Food Cooperative\textsuperscript{21} is involved in all of those processes in various ways and they appoint one of their members as a facilitator to help them deal with the process aspects of their board meetings. They operate within a definite commitment to a consensual process, however, in sharp contrast to the numerous complex organizations which form the organization development practice of Edgar Schein. Accordingly, no matter which of the six aspects of the group process that Schein identified that they are working on at any time, their facilitator helps them with the task they have set themselves. He or she does this using power explicitly and temporarily offered by them to the facilitator, for the purpose of helping them gain their goal of consensus. Their instrumental goal is to run their consumers' cooperative effectively, but the members regularly refresh their common perception that the best way to do that is to have consensus as their goal in the meetings.

In addition to giving the power to facilitate to one of their members, they have chosen a process model for consensus-seeking that proceeds through certain steps to ensure that each person present has several different kinds of opportunity to enter his or her physical, emotional, mental or even spiritual inputs to the consensus-seeking. Each meeting includes a re-presentation of the

\textsuperscript{21}The S.A.F.C. is a Columbus, Ohio, consumers' cooperative organization.
model, in part because the board has open membership, and in part to keep it before the mind of everyone taking part.

All the steps of the model, and most of the levels of participation came into play when the board was trying to decide whether or not work credit should be extended to members who gave time to Amnesty International or not. The physical level was least in evidence, but it became clear on the first test for consensus, as members spoke their minds, that some people had emotional resistance to allowing credit for participation in an organization that would oppose the death penalty for persons convicted of first degree murder. The group had established a norm for process comment that exists like an energy configuration in the group's history apart from the presence of any particular members at a particular time. Process comments were offered in a reasonably disidentified way that helped participants to discover a pattern of remarks on the issue that discriminated substantive from subjective content. Finally the issue was resolved, in the affirmative, in a way that included the contributions of every member who cared to make one.

The facilitator did very little during the specific discussion, in part because the group had developed a considerable expertise in consensual process. The upsurge of joy and satisfaction at the end of the module was a natural outcome of the communicative power released by the carefully selected method that formed the means for using the power.
Although the Sixteenth Avenue Food Cooperative is a practical example functioning Columbus, Ohio, the method has been thoroughly researched and presented in Coover, et al. Resource Manual for a Living Revolution (1978). The book responds to a need experienced by change agents who are concerned that the means by which social change is brought about should match the outcomes they are pressing for. Seeing the cost of violent revolution (in ongoing distorted communication) they have found and practiced nonviolent ways, which they report in the book, to achieve consensus among those involved in the change. Carl Rogers also gives examples from his experience and enunciates some general principles.

c. Methods in use in social change: When a person who has spent a great many years exploring the inner meanings of persons, and of the process of exploring such meanings in dyads, as Carl Rogers has, becomes involved in the practical application of what he has learned to the movements that express the crying needs of the dispossessed in our society to take part in their own liberation, we may expect a release of communicative power. Carl Rogers is concerned that people be listened to in ways that allow them really to listen to themselves. He gives the example discussed earlier in this chapter (pp.293-294) of the attempts at understanding between

22I get the impression that he or other facilitators with his concern have been available from the Center for Studies of the Person to meet with intercultural groups to initiate understanding.
Protestants and Catholics in Ireland, one of the start of a Chicao-Anglo understanding process in Wyoming, and one of an international, intergenerational group meeting in Sweden. The pattern is much the same as that of the Catholic-Protestant meeting -- a gradually deepening trust developing on the basis of a multi-faceted sharing of ideas and emotions. The facilitator's role was to support people in their own exercise of communicative power.

Carl Rogers summarizes what he has been saying about the dynamic involved. He believes that tensions can become productive for all involved if someone can introduce "facilitative attitudes" (Rogers, 1977:113). He then goes on to describe facilitative attitudes in the following way, setting forth conditions under which the revolutionary nature of the person-centered approach can be seen. If a facilitator gets into a group where tensions exist because the members have not made their larger society listen to their needs and act on them:

If this facilitator is genuinely free of a desire to control the outcome, respects the capacity of the group to deal with its own problems, and has skills in releasing individual expression;

If a respectful hearing is given to all attitudes and feelings, no matter how "extreme" or "unrealistic";
If the problems experienced by the group are accepted and clearly defined as issues;
If the group and its members are permitted to choose, collectively and individually, their own next steps; (Rogers, 1977:113)

Then, he says, remarkable things begin to happen. People will begin to express long-hidden hostile feelings, and others hearing them will share such feelings and all the range of other feelings. As people are recognized for themselves they will be able to trust each other, and they will begin to give and receive feedback that will help to correct the most irrational things expressed. The feelings based on experiences that are common to the group will be clarified and strengthened, and the group's confidence will be gin to build. This confidence will allow the group to consider the problems more rationally, and will spontaneously reduce individual claims based on ego trips, because of increasing trust in how contributions will be treated by the group's members. The group can begin to move toward "innovative, responsible, and often revolutionary steps", (1978: 114), that are realistic and immediate.

The person-centered approach apparently meets the criteria for means for the release of communicative power. Its focus on persons fosters enlightenment because people do not have to defend themselves desperately. It establishes a basic symmetry of opportunity by requiring that everyone be fully heard, again and again, if need

The latter part of this passage is to be found on page 328 of this study where it is used to clarify and extend the discussion of outcomes.
be. Openness is enhanced, bit by bit as they feel safe, and trust is deepened as genuine contributions are made. Carl Rogers goes right on to outcomes, which I will consider in the next section.

F. CONTINGENCIES AND OUTCOMES

The principal constraint to the operation of communicative power is the muddying of its only true purpose, the seeking of the common will, as I have noted in the means section. Other contingencies really are subsidiaries of that one. The countless ego trips that people engage in during processes that might otherwise have released communicative power may actually be seen as the result of those persons' pursuing their own emotional comfort as a goal. This may go on without the group's recognizing what is happening, and quite often goes on without the individual's knowing.

Another constraint that may result from not pursuing a true consensus as the only goal, is a communicative process being used by an outside person or organization to further its prespecified goal. "Go see if you can get a resolution from the group to support our cause", might be the instigation that would result in distorting the process of achieving consensus. The group might well have made the desired resolution anyway, but the commitment of one participant to the pre-specified goal would cause his or her lack of openness to be perceived in some subtle way, reducing the amount of trust available to the group. Assorted varieties of cooptation of group process fall into this kind of constraint.
The participants' lack of skill practice-with-feedback, in working toward consensus can trip up their efforts to use communicative process. The intention may be there, as well as the opportunity to carry out a thorough and respectful development of all participants' full contribution, but people can be hampered by not knowing what to do. People need to learn how to ask open-ended questions, and how to tell whether their summary of another's contribution is faithful to that person's meaning. People need to learn how to focus on their real feelings, and how to express those feelings in non-judgmental ways. In short, one contingency is simple lack of know-how.

Finally, the release of communicative power takes time. Carl Rogers' account is replete with notations as to how the people mobilized the personal and social resources to engage in communicative process. There has to be some kind of "political" support to keep communicative power safe from the inroads of instrumental power. An odd contrast exists between the enormous force of communicative power and its great vulnerability. When it is released by a pure communicative process, its force is nearly invincible - the power of an idea that has found its time. The communicative process itself can be distorted by any inappropriate goal-seeking or by the participants' not knowing how to go about it, and these distortions are very hard to deal with. They are stubborn constraints.
The outcomes of communicative power cannot be sought for themselves; like happiness, which they resemble and foster, they come unsought or not at all. (Seeking skills is not the same as seeking the outcomes of practicing the skills). They divide easily into outcomes for individuals and outcomes for groups, and both are so likely as to seem nearly inevitable. When persons engage more and more fully in communicative process, the outcome for them as individuals, as communicative power is released, is almost certain to be the release into their lives of transformative power. Deep, honest dialogue, real listening, almost always precipitates insight and launches a transformative process. The transformative process is subject to all its own constraints, and may not carry through, but it has a chance to begin. Communicative power also may have a direct input to transformative process at the dialogue and feedback step, although Parnes, et al. would claim that step to be the initiation of a new cycle. In any case, one outcome of the release of communicative power is transformative process.

Another major outcome is group cohesion. When people have engaged each other fully in communicative process, they have confronted together many of the divisive misunderstandings that usually keep a group from coalescing. The formation of a common will—in unconstrained communication binds those who hold it to each other strongly. People will see the realization of their common will as linked to their loyalty to each other... No one else understands
it in quite the way they do, since they looked at all the angles together. No one else knows what it means to them, since the people in the group really listened when they told how they felt about it.

Carl Rogers has seen practical outcomes related to goals chosen by the common will that is formed. He ends the list he began in the series of provisos quoted on p. 323 with the following outcome statements:

Leadership in the group multiplies. Each individual tends to respect himself and the leadership qualities he has.

Constructive action is taken, both by the group and by the individual members, they change the situation they are in.

Individuals feel enough support by the group to take actions they know will be regarded as radical, even when high risk to themselves is involved (1978:114).

In the preceding part of this chapter on communicative power we have seen its distinctive role in meeting what Habermas calls the practical human interest by means of various forms of hermeneutic inquiry. A definition of it has been explored, and its particular purpose of seeking consensus and the common will has been discussed. Specific kinds of means by which it is used were
described, as were the major contingencies and outcomes of communicative power. Next I will turn to what the Jungian psychologists have to say about the way the psyche of women relates to the dimensions I have identified as distinctive to communicative power.

G. WOMEN'S EXPERIENCE OF COMMUNICATIVE POWER AND JUNGIAN PSYCHOLOGY OF WOMEN

I have discussed the theory of communicative power, and have presented Jungian psychology as it relates to women (see pp. 223-224); now I would like to relate Jungian psychology of women to the experience of communicative power. In doing so, I will follow the pattern I used in discussing communicative power, presenting first its relation to Habermas' concept of the practical interest and hermeneutic inquiry. I will then show how the Jungian view of the woman's psyche relates to the source, purpose, means and contingencies and outcomes of the experience of communicative power.

1. The practical interest and the Jungian view of women

Habermas leaves little doubt that hermeneutic inquiry in the practical interest is a complex effort, involving as it does subtleties at multiple levels of openness in all three kinds of life expression - linguistic, action, and experiential (see pp. 274-281). Although Jung did not see women as having great skill in analytical and linguistic understanding, the following quote, written now over fifty years ago, shows his appreciation for women's awareness of what Habermas calls "experiential expression" (Habermas 1971:166): Jung writes:
An inferior consciousness cannot eo ipso be ascribed to women; it is merely different from masculine consciousness. But, just as a woman is often clearly conscious of things which a man is still groping for in the dark, so there are naturally fields of experience in a man which, for woman, are still wrapped in the shadows of non-differentiation, chiefly things in which she has little interest. Personal relations are as a rule more important and interesting to her than objective facts and their interconnections. The wide fields of commerce, politics, technology, and science, the whole realm of the applied masculine mind, she relegates to the penumbra of consciousness; while, on the other hand, she develops a minute consciousness of personal relationships, the infinite nuances of which usually escape the man entirely (Jung, 1928:206, para. 330).

Singer, in discussing this passage (1974:262-263), comments that although Jung's comment is still basically true, we are on the verge of a tremendous change. The feminine consciousness, which Jung said was associated with maintaining relationship, and "caring for, nurturing, cultivating, . . . and preserving," (Singer, 1974:263)
she now sees as beginning to be concerned with careful differentiation. The contributions of the animus, the contrasexual principle in the woman, motivate her in this direction and society, through all the expressions of the women's liberation movement, confirms her motivation. As a matter of fact, the women's movement may be an example of that kind of compensatory action in society at large that develops in response to a culture-wide neurosis. Jung, in *Man and His Symbols* (1964) for example, called war a projection of the "shadow" which western society had been denying access to consciousness. Thus, the women's liberation movement may be a projection (or "externalization", since projection has a negative connotation for some) of the animus in the collective unconscious of women. Societies' ongoing demand that the woman be the maintainer of relationships has caused a collective repression of the clarifying, differentiating principle in women. The coming change to a fuller selfhood that women are experiencing is being heralded by an incongruent life expression, as Habermas would have it, in the form of a strident movement for women's liberation. Our collective individuation would have us raise this externalization, as Horney (1942) has called it, to consciousness and integrate it into our behavior, so that our action and our linguistic expression can communicate what our projection reveals.

To return to the capability of women in hermeneutic inquiry, however, the given sensitivity to experiential expression which Jung
sees as natural to women, needs to be supplemented by capacities which the animus can help women develop. Women need to develop linguistic discrimination and action-orienting clarity if they are to be fully functioning participants in forming consensus. Otherwise, the negative animus is expressed in the opinionated utterances that frustrate consensus-building. A generalization will not serve in the delicate negotiations that go into creating a common will. A woman must use her ego, as Sanford (1980) points out, to insist that the animus work to shed the light of reason on the collective values of society that the urge to relationship of the feminine principle would affirm uncritically without it.

Habermas calls the kind of action that is indicated by the practical interest "communicative" (Milczarek, 1979). Capability to use hermeneutic inquiry is precisely what constitutes communicative power. Women can experience communicative power fully to the extent that they continue with the individuation process, insisting that the animus do his appropriate work within their psyches. As that work progresses, the clarifying, pattern-forming capacities women have exercised less than men can be integrated with the sensitivities involved in maintaining relationships that women have always exercised better than men. Both are needed for communicative power.
2. The source of communicative power and the Jungian view of women

The source of communicative power in women has been a matter of enduring interest to Jungian psychologists. The conceptualization that is typically presented has within it the elements of alternation that emerge from the yin-yang symbol of Taoism and the energy waves of physics. In different places Jung emphasizes that his concern in working with his patients was focused on a better functioning articulation among the parts of their psyches, and that the purpose of his work was to help them function more effectively in their relationships in the real world outside the consulting office. There is no real conflict between the two emphases. The full title of John Santford's latest book includes them both: The Invisible Partners: How the Male and Female in each of Us Affects our Relationships (1980). In it he explains the diagram in Figure 14, one which other Jungians also use in showing how relationship can have what I am here calling communicative power.

Communicative power is increasingly actualized as the unconscious elements of the male and female psyches are integrated with the conscious elements, in a dialogue in which neither is fundamental, but both are essential. Of course, communicative power can and must be exercised between women, and between men, but the alternation and interaction of elements can most easily be conceptualized initially between a woman and a man. The conscious relationship (A) between the man and the woman consists of the conscious aspects of the socially accepted gender role as affirmed by the woman and the man for
Conscious Woman

Conscious Man

Animus

Anima

Figure 14
The Animus and Anima in Female-Male Relationship

(adapted from Sanford, 1980:17 and Lila Dennis\textsuperscript{24}, personal communication)

\textsuperscript{24}Lila Dennis, Ph.D., is a Columbus, Ohio, Jungian psychotherapist.
relationship -- "Men are appealing. Women are attractive". The unconscious relationship (C) contains all the unconscious (forgotten, repressed, or never raised to consciousness) elements of the principle that corresponds to the person's physical sex, e.g., the feminine principle in women. The relationship may be positive or negative depending on the individuals' life experiences and on their own inward conscious-to-unconscious contact (D₁ and D₂). The inward D₁ relationship has been discussed in several parts of this study, as I have described the role of a woman's animus in individuation. The part of the diagram that is of particular interest in relation to a woman's participation in the experience of communicative power is the B₁ and B₂ aspect. It is in this part of the relationship between men and women that each can, by receiving and stimulating the other appropriately, release communicative power. It is the model for an energy alternation that parallels the yin-yang and the wave motion of electrical power.

The mutual release of power may be initiated by either the woman or the man, but it always works to respond to the contra-sexual principle in the other. If a woman acts out the prompting of her animus and attempts to clarify or bring order into an interpersonal process a man may consciously recognize the value of her contribution. He may also consciously decide to honor and complement her offer with his own power of differentiation. All of this is positive and tends to release communicative power. On the contrary, however, the
man may be threatened because of his own relationship to his own inner woman, and may reject the contribution prompted by the woman's animus. Another negative possibility is that the woman may be operating with an opinionated and unexamined projection from her animus which it may be very difficult for a man to receive productively. In order to do so, he would have to have a comfortable relationship \((D_2)\) with his own anima, the inner woman in him.

Similarly, a woman may nurture expressions of the inner woman in a man, helping him to express his emotions and his artistic and creative capacity. If she is animus possessed, however, not in fruitful contact with her own clarifying and ordering capacities, and not using them consciously and comfortably, she may be threatened by the man's emotional expression. Her response would reduce communicative power between them by harshly rejecting his contribution to a potential consensus between them. Communicative power is ideally generated in the dialogue between the conscious and unconscious elements of a man and a woman when they are interacting.

The varying inner balance among the elements is part of what makes each of us unique. The result is that a woman may be able to receive the animus of another woman in much the same way that an aware man would, if she has established a comfortable relationship with her own unconscious femininity, has been responsive to her own animus. Thus communicative power can have its source in relationship between persons to the extent that they have become individuated, in
the view of Jungian psychology. Female persons can experience it ever more fully as they become aware, consciously integrate their conscious and unconscious process in individuation.

3. The purpose of communicative power and the Jungian view of women

Since the purpose of communicative power must always be the formation of consensus or a common will, and not some external goal, the Jungian view of women as relationship-seekers and relationship-builders sees them as capable of moving toward that purpose. One main handicap they would experience is the tendency to smother or ensnare others involved. The negative mother principle is embodied in the goddess Kali, the devourer, and it is also expressed in smoothing-over behaviors which do not foster the individuality of the other person(s). The other main handicap would be the tendency to encourage irrationality either through ecstasy or madness. The mythical figure of Circe, the enchantress, is among those chosen by Erich Neumann (1963:82 ff.) to symbolize this aspect of the feminine principle. A woman's capacity to contribute irrational excitement to an interaction is an example of such behavior.

Again, both Sanford (1980) and Singer (1972, 1976) would point out that the animus can motivate a woman to use her clarifying capacity to overcome the handicaps she would experience in using communicative power if she were only to express her nurturing and undifferentiating feminine principle. A woman's special
sensitivity must be called to account consciously and refined by
the action of the animus, in order to allow her to experience
communicative power in action.

4. The means of communicative power and the Jungian view of women

In this section, I will be examining the Jungian view of
women's psyches in the light of the four criteria that I used in
the section on means in communicative power. They are: (a) fosters
enlightenment, (b) enlarges symmetry of opportunity, (c) deepens
trust, and (4) enhances openness. I find that Jung and the psycholo­
gists who follow him agree that as a woman becomes fully indivi­
duated she has an increasing capacity to function in ways that meet
all four criteria.

Women in their child-rearing roles have nurtured developing
persons both from the expression of their conscious and unconscious
feminine principle and from the expression of their animus. Simi­
larly, in their roles as lovers and wives, they have carried the
projection of males' animas, and have helped them to withdraw and
repossess those projections to recognize that their emotionality
and creativity are truly their own. The negative animus in a woman
can provide an impetus to harsh rejection and the negative feminine
principle can engulf, instead of fostering enlightenment in others.
Insofar as a woman is moving in the direction of her own individua­
tion, she will be capable of meeting that criterion of commuника­
tive power.
A woman in her full exercise of the feminine cooperative and accepting principle naturally works to enlarge symmetry of opportunity among those with whom she is associated. The hampering possibility is that she may overpower or immobilize others by an undifferentiated nurturing effort. Careful and perceptive listening and a similar quality of expression will result from a woman's inner interaction with her own animus principle. In practice, a woman can accord others and ensure for herself an ever-increasing symmetry of opportunity to gain the rewards available in communicative process as she engages in her own individuation process.

The consistency of positive functioning which results from integrating unconscious contents into conscious process inspires trust when it is well advanced. However, women are not born with that kind of integration, and of course, neither are men. But if a woman uses her ego to consciously seek a greater and greater degree of integrity with as much of her unconscious material as she can come in touch with, she will gradually achieve a fuller congruence between her conscious intent and her unconsciously motivated behavior. This allows others to deepen their trust in dialogue, and releases more communicative power to move toward a deeply felt consensus.

By the same token, as a woman moves toward a fuller individuation in integrating her unconscious contents with what she is conscious
of, she can be more open and enhance others' openness. She becomes aware of what it is that has been hidden within herself, and can listen and look more wisely to what may be hidden from others' own view of themselves, as a result. As this process continues, a woman becomes more and more able to exercise communicative power.

5. The outcomes of communicative power and the Jungian view of women

The contingencies that I have explored in other sections of this chapter can, if they are managed in the light of the Jungian insights about the individuation process as women experience it, yield to a fullness of shared experience that brings with it an ever-enlarging measure of the joy a woman is capable of experiencing. At each level of her experience of communicative power a satisfaction comes that is directly related to the mutuality of perception and purpose that has developed. This pleasure is especially rich for a woman because, as the Jungians see it, a woman is expressing the core of her feminine nature in communicative process. To experience communicative power is, for a woman, what achieving a long-sought goal is for a man. It resonates with her whole being.
CHAPTER FIVE

INSTRUMENTAL POWER

A. INTRODUCTION

The material world around us has a stubborn feel of being separate from us, and subject to its own rules. We experience that reality as created by processes that have little to do with our inner reality, and it is at this point that the subtle extensions of the paradigm shift I discussed in the first chapter come to bear. The rules that operate in the objective, material world around us describe the processes by which the universal power is mediated. When we tap the universal power source to create a new reality, we trigger mechanisms within and around us to do the job. Chipping away at a block of material to release a form, in sculpture, or writing a memo to inaugurate a plan, we use an instrument to achieve a goal. As long as we stay in this objective realm we can utilize cause and effect thinking, and can expect to measure, predict, and control. Within this band of the spectrum of our total experience, time is sequential, space has extension, and causality exists. This kind of experience is daily, and important, but it is not everything.

341
In the centuries of our growing technological domination we have concentrated so fully on learning the rules by which the material world is governed that we gradually began to assume that the material world governed by the laws of Newtonian physics was the whole world. In fact, we included the networks of hierarchical systems that form persons, with all the emergent characteristics inherent in such networks, in our attempts to make the material world be the whole world. In doing so, we limited our power to transform ourselves and to create consensus, because we extended the rules of the instrumental realm to our whole experience. We did not expect, and hence did not allow, our potential to create using the power of the larger reality within which we are configurations of energy.

On the other hand, to say that the instrumental realm is not the whole world is not to attack its profound significance. It continues to be the effective instrument by which the universal power is mediated when it comes to achieving pre-specified goals. In releasing the clamped-down blood vessels that are causing a migraine headache, a person counts on the instrumental action of the cardiovascular system. It is the instrument by which the will empowered by transformative power can do its work. In implementing a common will to plan for a social change, a group of persons counts on the efficient operation of offices, computer rooms, and perhaps a city newspaper. They are the instruments by which the consensus
achieved by communicative power can act. As long as the offices and other person-machine systems perform in an instrumental way, they are not a problem. However, like all systems, offices have emergent characteristics that cannot be predicted from the characteristics of the components (Miller, 1978). Even though they are formed of persons, along with machines, offices sometimes perform in perfectly instrumental and controllable ways. At other times, they transcend their instrumentality and introduce variation far beyond (or far below!) mere predictability. Instrumental and technical rationality are suddenly inadequate to explain an office that works all night in high excitement to launch a political campaign, and we have to turn to hermeneutic inquiry to understand. Negative examples of unpredicted performance jam the files of organizational behaviorists, it must also be added.

Instrumental action to gain pre-specified ends is the kind of power that Habermas identifies with the technical form of inquiry. In the latter section of this introduction I will be discussing points Habermas makes about the bases of instrumental power. In the second section (B) of this chapter, I will discuss some of the numerous definitions of instrumental power in showing how I arrived at the one I have been using. Section C of this chapter will expand on the idea I have discussed in introducing this chapter, that instrumental power has its sources within the band of experience which it operates in and functions as an instrument of transformative
and communicative process. The purpose section of this chapter (D) will discuss some of the issues involved in the use of power to achieve pre-specified goals. In the means section (E), I will describe some criteria which mark the action of instrumental power, and give examples drawn from individual, organization, and societal experience. Next, in section F, I will be dealing with primary and secondary outcomes, (some of each negative and some positive) of the use of instrumental power. Finally, in section G I will explore how the Jungian psychology of women describes women's potential for exercising instrumental power. I will discuss how the inner action of the animus is central to the individuation that undergirds a woman's effective use of instrumental power.

Habermas takes the position that instrumental power is one tool of communicative power. He includes the areas of objective analytical and theoretical process in the action appropriate to the technical interest (Milczarek, 1979). When Habermas also includes analysis and theory as tools of the practical interest, he makes a proviso. The proviso is that when they are used in the practical interest to understand both the biological and psychological aspects of persons, analysis and theory are used by subjects, i.e., individual egos, who recognize others as subjects, or alter egos. Empirical and analytic inquiry in the technical interest stands perfectly well on its own when it is not being used as a tool by communicative process, however.
There are some problems with how we can know, in technical inquiry, that bear directly on one of the themes of this study. The theme they bear on is the one that we create our own reality from within as individual egos and continue to develop this reality among alter egos to establish a reliable intersubjectivity. Habermas seems to lay the groundwork for the scientific realignment that characterizes the paradigm shift, in the way he deals with the problems of how we build our reality. McCarthy (1978) outlines the problems and how Habermas deals with them. The outcome of the discussion seems to be that we can know the world-out-there as we interact with it, but it has both "independence" and "externality" (Habermas, 1971:33). Habermas explicitly rejects the possibility that materialist philosophy can explain man's understanding of nature in terms of "the heritage of mysticism" (1971:33), although he says such materialists as Benjamin, Bloch, Marcuse and Adorno are attracted to it.

McCarthy finds that Habermas deals in three ways with the problems of how nature can have a prior existence to man's interaction with it, and yet be shaped by his knowing of it. The ways are -

epistemological, subjective and natural-historical.

Reality is both "constituted" and "disclosed", in Habermas epistemological argument. As it is constituted by our knowing

---

25 It is interesting to speculate whether the attraction that materialist philosophers, in Habermas' view, have for an interpretation of man's knowing of nature that depends on a mystical epistemology may be a compensatory projection related to their minimizing the subjective in their philosophical speculation.
epistemological argument. As it is constituted\footnote{26} by our knowing we give the "meaning of true statements about reality"; as it is disclosed by our knowing its independent and external "existence" is revealed and given in true statements about reality (McCarthy, 1978:117).

Habermas' subjective argument about how we can know in technical inquiry has to do with the structures of thought about empirical nature that a knowing subject can grasp reflectively and use to try to understand how we know. In other words, we can know reality because we can observe ourselves categorizing and ordering our experience; we can observe ourselves knowing nature.

In response to the problem of how we can create or constitute a reality that has in effect created us, Habermas advances a natural-historical argument. Nature is "objective nature for us", as we know it. It may have a farther reality, but as we know it, it is only what we know. Our knowing is bounded both by the independence of nature, and by our structures for knowing it, but we do still form what objective nature is for us (McCarthy, 1978:123).

Each of these three attempts to resolve the problem of how we constitute reality has some logical difficulties, but in combination, they represent a careful effort by one of this century's most rigorous philosophers to state in philosophical terms how it is that we create the reality that we live in. Each provides a rationale

\footnote{26}"Constituted", here, refers to Habermas' designation of three major ways that we formulate our reality (technical, practical and emancipatory) as "knowledge-constitutive" interests.
for the paradigm shift by allowing for our interest in creating objective nature for ourselves. The epistemological argument provides for us to constitute reality through the meaning of true statements about it, and thus gives us the possibility to re-frame our statements in terms of emergent meanings. The salient example of the epistemological argument is the interactivity of our perception. That one is emerging from discoveries in particle physics like those of John Wheeler, described by Capra which redefine the observer as "participator" (Capra, 1975:127). Capra shows how this redefinition is confirmed by Eastern mysticism.

The subjective argument provides a way for us to constitute reality through observing ourselves knowing reality, and thus gives us the possibility of re-casting the agreements we have about how we interact with reality. A leading example of that process of renegotiating our old reliable intersubjectivity is the ongoing dialogue between medical science and neuropsychology. Reality must be somewhat different from what the medical scientists had agreed if it is possible for us to control the heretofore unconscious processes that cause our diseases.

The natural-historical argument provides for us to constitute reality to the extent that we know it, without prejudging what the nature of reality that extends beyond that scope may be, and thus gives us an open-ended arena for re-forming our understanding of
objective nature for us. Perhaps Bohm's critique of quantum theory is the outstanding example of that re-formulation going on now.

I believe that gathering the three arguments together provides a philosophical base for the knowledge-constitutive aspects of the paradigm shift that are central to the hypothesis of this study. Further, I think it shows that, given the ways we constitute knowledge, it is not surprising that paradigm shifts occur.

In each case, however, the role of the agreement among persons as to the nature of reality is seen to be of the greatest importance as Berger and Luckman (1966) have also pointed out. The bounding contingency of the independent and external existence of nature continues, and is not under our control. The part that is under our collective control is constitutive of reality for us. It constitutes its meanings, the ways we order the structure of our understanding of it, and what we know it to be.

Consensus about the nature of reality has altered in major ways over the time during which mankind has been recording such matters. The perennial philosophy, which borders on the pitfalls of absolute idealism, has claimed followers in all periods of time. The perennial philosophy has also been the target of centuries of

27 The "perennial philosophy" has been so named because it continues to reappear in the history of philosophy. It asserts that many can know the cosmos directly through mystical means (see also pp. 28-29).
refining critique. What seems to be emerging in the twentieth century is a more-richly conceived version, tempered by the contingencies of an independent reality.

The principal corrective that the present version of the perennial philosophy offers the prevailing materialism is to regard empirical reality as a band of experience within a much broader spectrum of the human potential. For several centuries, the dominant intersubjectivity held that the technical realm where instrumental action was effective was the whole of experience. Distortions of the common understanding of communicative process ensued, and Habermas has been a leader among the hermeneutic philosophers who have pointed out these distortions.

The nature of emancipatory action was seen principally by many thinkers, among them Marxians, as limited to the instrumental band of experience. Habermas has, in addition, offered a critique of Freud which also incidentally helped to broaden the perception of the realm of emancipatory interest to include psychotherapeutic activity. Habermas should not be identified with the contemporary proponents of the perennial philosophy; his philosophical rigor precludes it. However, his critical theory suggests a space within inquiry which allows for the paradigm shift ensuing from the most thoughtful forms of the perennial philosophy. McCarthy states, "Habermas' theory of cognitive interests is an attempt to formulate
the relevant questions and to provide some guideposts on the way to their resolution" (1978:52). This section has briefly sketched some of Habermas' contribution along those lines.

Habermas finds analytic empirical inquiry to be the base of instrumental power. If we make correct statements about reality, we can predict and control the behavior of the empirical world. This is the appropriate kind of action in the technical interest, and the power to control that results is the base of our technological society. Milczarek (1979:52) has outlined the six aspects of it (i.e., the technical interest) that follow. (1) analytic-empirical inquiry deals with the world of nature, including persons seen as objects; (2) it permits us to operate effectively in the world of external reality, correcting our knowledge of external reality in relation to its independent existence and improving our strategies in relation to its behavior. (3) analytic-empirical inquiry deals appropriately with objective experience, but must be regarded as a tool of hermeneutic inquiry when dealing with intersubjective experience. (4) its frame of reference is the material world rather than the interpersonal or privately personal world. Insofar as persons appear in the material world they can be included in that frame of reference. (5) the kind of action that matches the technical interest is instrumental, and that action, taken effectively, constitutes instrumental power. Thus, (6) the goal of the technical interest is technical control. In the next section I will discuss some of the definitions of this kind of power.
B. DEFINITION

As I have observed above on page 341, one of the distortions of the consensus that has eventuated from the dynamic development of technical control has been that we have confused instrumental power with all power. A corollary is that definitions of power in political science and social psychology have been limited to instrumental power. This study has attempted to visualize the concept of power to include transformative and communicative power among the human potentialities. In the refocusing, I have come to see instrumental power as only one band of the experience of power, and to regard it as a tool to be used by transformative and communicative power. I offer the definitions in this section within that context of understanding, to refine the concept of instrumental power.

The definition of instrumental power that I have been using is intentionally general. It is, "Instrumental power is the capacity to act effectively to achieve a pre-specified goal". Although power is likely to increase with exercise, as I will show in section C on sources, it is not necessary to use power in order to have it. The United States does not have to launch its missiles in order to have "missile power". If the power were to be tested, the capacity would have to be adequate to be effective. Many considerations may intervene to keep a person or group from acting to achieve a prespecified goal, but to have instrumental power is to be able to act effectively to achieve the goal.
Although I shall return to the question of positive and negative uses of power in Section C on source and D on purpose, for the purpose of definition I only want to point out that instrumental power, itself, is essentially a value-neutral term.

Action, in the definition, may be of many kinds. Initially, we might divide action into consciously or unconsciously motivated action. Winter (1973) is among those who recognize that a person's intention to produce an effect may be conscious or unconscious. He includes the possibility of either in his definition of power. Unconscious "intent" is a problematic concept. However, if we take "intent" at its lowest complexity as an urge of some sort, the numerous examples of behavior resulting from unconscious urges which have been described earlier in this study may lend credence to the idea of unconscious intent. Winter's definition of social power is "the ability or capacity of 0 to produce (consciously or unconsciously) intended effects on the behavior or emotions of another person" (Winter, 1973:5).

Winter's definition is explicitly concerned with interpersonal action. In the context provided by my following Habermas' distinctions, I have wanted to include physical action, since empirical/analytic inquiry has to do with measuring and theorizing about the purely material world. Instrumental power has to do with putting up school buildings as well as setting up programs within
the buildings. Instrumental power comes into play, in Habermas' view, every time the end to be achieved is specified in advance, as opposed to being developed and altered in the process of exercising the power (Habermas, 1977). Thus, in principle, an emotional goal or a spiritual one could also prompt action. Presumably the action would be emotional or spiritual in each of those cases. I am using tentative language for each of these, though, because they seem particularly unlikely arenas for the use of instrumental power. I have discussed this problem in greater depth in the section in communicative power having to do with transpersonal psychotherapy (see pp.132-173).

The world "effectively" in the definition is the one that has gathered by far the most comment. Two definitions from political science and two from social psychology serve to illustrate that effectiveness is the main concern. Hobbes, a nineteenth-century political theorist, says "The power of a man, to take it universally, is his present means; to obtain some future apparent good; . . ." (Hobbes, 1839:Ch. 10). Champlin, a twentieth-century Ohio State University political theorist says "Having power is thus being in a position to get others to do what one wants them to without having to make unacceptable sacrifices" (Champlin, 1970:94). Champlin's reference to "position" is important, and I will have more to say about it shortly. Next, Ronald Lippitt, a twentieth-century social psychologist says "Social power is (a) the potentiality (b) for
inducing forces (c) in other persons (d) toward acting or changing in a given direction" (Lippitt, Polansky, Redl and Rosen, 1953: 463). Cartwright offers a similar definition, but with an addition based on Lewin's field theory. He says, "... power refers to the induction of (psychological) forces by one entity b upon another a and to the resistance to this induction set up by a" (Cartwright 1959:188). Cartwright's including a's resistance seems to refer the power to the field, rather than to either of the actors, and would be useful in evaluating the amount of power necessary to be effective. In each of these definitions there is a focus on being effective.

The next main word of the definition is "achieve". Rosabeth Moss Kanter places the emphasis of her definition on achieving, rather than on hierarchical considerations. She says, "... power is the ability to get things done, to mobilize resources, to get and use whatever it is that a person needs for the goals he or she is attempting to meet: (Kanter, 1977:166). Getting things done, rather than influencing people is her main concern, although she realizes that things get done through people.

Kanter's distinctive contribution to the power dialogue is that she sees the capacity to achieve as a function of position when it acts within an organizational structure. In this she is related to Champlin's interest in "position", although he defined it more broadly as being generated by the structure of the situation, whether that situation was part of a complex organization or not.
The sharp distinction Kanter makes on this point allows her to clarify the powerlessness reported in previous research about token persons in complex organizations. Kanter finds that women and other minorities who have arrived in token numbers at positions which should give them power to reach goals often do not reach them. She believes they are likely to fail because they are not tapped into the power structure that controls resources in the organization.

"Achieve" requires one more comment, and that is that using it in the definition implies that the goal must be achievable in two senses, and not in another. It must be achievable in the sense that it is possible to tell when one has arrived; it must also be achievable in the sense that it is possible at the outset to conceive that it be achieved. In other words the goal must be objective for it to be achieved. It is not important how feasible the goal is, because an unfeasible goal may just be an extra challenge.

In order to distinguish instrumental power from communicative power I have defined it as the capacity to act effectively to achieve "pre-specified" goals. This definition is in contrast to Lasswell and Kaplan's (1950:75) definition, "Power is participation in the making of decisions: G has power over H with respect to the values K if G participates in the making of decisions affecting the K-policies of H". Their definition allows for many shades and degrees of power in decision-making. In that aspect it shares in some of the
meanings Habermas established for communicative power. Their definition also uses the concept of power "over" others, and in that aspect it shares in the interpersonal action arena of instrumental power. However it is in contrast to the one I have adopted in that it focuses on the process of decision-making. The definition I am using removes shared goal-formation from the use of instrumental power.

Of course, instrumental power is often used in goal-setting processes, and Lasswell and Kaplan have that use in mind, as they show in their discussion (Lasswell and Kaplan, 1950: Ch. V). The difference is that when the goal of one or more of the parties to a goal-setting process has specified his or her goal in advance, and does not shift to take account of the needs and meanings that others bring to the situation, instrumental power is in action.

The last main word in the definition is "goal" and it is used here in contrast with the open-ended purposes of transformative power, and the single workable goal (i.e., consensus) of communicative power. Goals can be held in every aspect of human experience; one can have physical, emotional, mental and spiritual goals. Having them may lead to distortions of transformative process because the process may be bent to fit the goal instead of being allowed to fit the person. Goals may be held in every kind of human grouping from dyads to multi-national corporations and beyond. Goals may be quite short-term like getting into the subway before the door
closes, or they may be projected over a century like the building of a cathedral. In every case where a goal has been decided in advance, it colors or coopts or in some way curves the process to fit itself. It also can be seen to guide and focus and invigorate the process, as well. The effectiveness of the function of goals in influencing process is related to the means of exercising instrumental power which I will be discussing in section E of this chapter. The source of instrumental power in the band of experience where it arises is the subject of the next section.

C. SOURCES

Kanter expands on her definition of power (quoted here on p. 354) showing a basic consideration related to the source of instrumental power. First she points out that her meaning of power is closer to "mastery" or even "autonomy" than to "domination or control over others" (Kanter, 1977:166). If you mobilize powerless people, you still can not get much done, but "Power is the ability to do in the classic physical usage of power as energy, and thus it means having access to whatever is needed for the doing: (1977:166). The basic consideration is increasing power and that can be done by empowering others: "... empowering more people through generating more autonomy, more participation in decisions, and more access to resources increases the total capacity for effective action rather than increases domination: (1977:166). Instrumental
power, even though it is goal-oriented, and even though it does not operate through the free action of people under no constraint, is not necessarily a zero-sum game. People may be freed within its operation to seek goals that they pre-specify within the autonomy available to them. People may enrich decision-making, even if the goals of the decision-making are pre-specified. Thus, spreading power bases is one source of instrumental power.

Another source of instrumental power is expectation. Those who use power efficiently get more. It is not as circular as it may seem to say that the source of power is the use of power, itself. In fact, because of the expectations of others, even those who do not use instrumental power efficiently get more if they use it regularly because people see that they can mobilize resources and they give them more opportunities for doing it.

Kanter suggests that a study done by Pelz in the early 1950's showing that high morale groups in Detroit Edison were those whose leaders had effective power connections both up and down the organization, was one that helped to re-direct thinking on this point. Earlier research had tried to associate morale, productivity and other variables with good human relations and had failed. Subsequent research has been successful in associating morale and productivity with the perceived power of the group leader. As she says, what makes a difference to the effectiveness of a leader is "power -- power outward and upward in the system: the ability to
get for the group, for subordinates or followers, a favorable share of the resources, opportunities, and rewards possible through the organization" (Kanter, 1977:168). Among the studies Kanter cites in making this point about power is one, now classic, by Lippitt, Polansky and Rosen (1953) which showed that middle class boys and girls attributed power to those who had various combinations of physical, intellectual and socio-economic resources.

In the same study by Lippitt, et al. (1953) the point is made that in addition to being willing to accept direct influence attempts by the persons to whom they attribute power, subjects were open to behavioral contagion. That is, they acted like those they believed to have power. I would contend that this is another source of instrumental power, and I would call it in-group power. It is the power potential that stems from being "like us", and it is reciprocal, as I am showing. People act like those they believe to have power, and they gain power from acting like those whom they believe to have power. Unspoken dress codes are one mediating mechanism; people who dress "right" have rights to exercise power.

The French and Raven study (1959) of the bases of social power is useful here, although it has certain limitations. It deals specifically with the one-to-one action of interpersonal power, except in its fifth category. The five categories are (1) reference power -- based in being attractive to others, (2) reward power -- based in the capacity to reward, (3) coercive power --
based on the capacity to punish, (4) expert power -- based in control of information, and (5) legitimate power -- based in the authority of a role which is accepted by others. The last relates to the "position" of Champlin's definition (see p. 353) and to structure as seen by Kanter (see p. 354), although it is not identical with either. The limitations of the typology seem to stem from the authors' basic assumption that power is a zero-sum relationship in which if one person has more power, the other person must necessarily have less. Kanter's affirmation to the contrary is intuitively more plausible.

Thus we have seen that although various sources differ as to exactly how the sources of power may most productively be categorized, it appears likely that instrumental power arises within the systems where it is used. Further, it increases in response to its use within those systems. It might be observed that the discussion thus far of the sources of instrumental power has focused on social power, but that is not entirely true. The capacity to mobilize resources carries with it the capacity to get physical tasks accomplished. However, much the same mechanism that operates as a source for social power operates for the source of instrumental physical power. The more power is used, the more it is available.

Looking at the situation as portrayed by the observations I have just made, I would like to hazard the hypothesis that the increase in power that is observed from all the sources just explored
has to do with an unobstructed channelling of the available energy through the structures of a system. What Kanter has observed in the company she calls Indsco obtains in two-person systems and in physical systems. The more instrumental power moves, the greater force it has. Bernouille's principle in physics is analogous; it states the increase in force that obtains as free flow is focused. When instrumental power is blocked by one sub-system's monopoly, or by an obstruction in the form of one person's unindividuated ego, its force is reduced.

Before closing this section I want to return to the principle first mentioned as the fifth base of social power in the French and Raven typology of power bases, legitimate power. Habermas has dealt with the most significant aspect of legitimate power, i.e., that it is accepted by others, in a number of places (Habermas, 1971, 1973a, 1977). Marilyn Ferguson (1980) has drawn together thinking associated with the implications of the paradigm shift for political interaction in a way that extends Habermas' thinking still further, to call "appropriate" those uses of instrumental power which are actively affirmed by all others involved.

First, Habermas (1977), in dealing with the problem of legitimation of power in "late", or controlled, capitalism, calls attention to the passivity of individual members of society in relation to the administration of the structures that operate to produce what
is of value. In order to achieve relatively free and autonomous functioning, government must get a grant of legitimacy from a people who want certain problems they have in common to be dealt with. Once this grant is made, individuals surrender their involvement in the process of exercising the power they have legitimated. Habermas holds that the theorem of crisis (a test of the ability of the system to self-limit its dis-eases) he is trying to develop "must establish why the state apparatus is bound to run up against not only difficulties, but long-term insoluble problems" (Habermas, 1977:377 - his emphasis). The privatism by which an affluent society maintains its depoliticization, or apathy, creates a problem of loss of legitimation for the power held by the administration of government.

One alternative is a revolution which is a mass response to the low level of legitimacy. Another alternative, and one that I see as more likely in a society which has come to love its pleasures, is the establishment of a re-legitimating network of smaller initiatives. This network of small initiatives is formed of thousands and thousands of persons getting together in clubs and social change organizations to re-assert their power over the means for the values they cherish. The pleasures of affluence are not entirely lost, although they are certainly minimized by the weight of the administrative mechanism that people legitimated and then released. Affluence can continue, as it could not if the alternative of revolution were chosen.
A broad-scale survey of just such a networking process is Ferguson's *Aquarian Conspiracy* (1980). In it she outlines the assumptions of the re-politicization that Habermas implies would aid the society in self-limiting its malaise, as expressed in the numerous life-signs of crisis to be observed presently.

I have selected from Ferguson's table of contrasts between the old assumptions of a de-politicized society and the new assumptions resting on the paradigm shift:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assumptions of the Old Paradigm of Power and Politics</th>
<th>Assumptions of the New Paradigm of Power and Politics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Change is imposed by authority</td>
<td>Change grows out of consensus and/or is inspired by leadership.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutionalizes help, services</td>
<td>Encourages individual help, voluntarism, as complement to government role. Reinforces self-help, mutual-help networks.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impetus toward strong central government</td>
<td>Favors reversing trend, decentralizing government wherever feasible; horizontal distribution of power. Small focused central government would serve as clearinghouse.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Power for others (care taking) or against them. Win/lose orientation</td>
<td>Power with others. Win/win orientation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solely &quot;masculine&quot; rational orientation, linear model.</td>
<td>Both rational and intuitive principles, appreciation of non-linear interaction, dynamic systems model (<em>Ferguson, 1980: 210-211</em>).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Ferguson affirms the manifestations of power on the right, as "appropriate" (*Ferguson 1980:190*). Both columns represent the exercise
of instrumental power to gain pre-specified ends, but those on the right are exercised to gain ends that have been set in communicative process, or accept a shared power in which the goals of others set in communicative process are recognized. All of those on the right have developmental potential.

Appropriateness has to do with the underlying sources of instrumental power, and with the broader purposes beyond its immediate goals. It is grounded in the elemental legitimation processes deeper than the immediate sources of instrumental power. In its essence, it has to do with the profoundest issues of good and evil.

Thus the source of instrumental power may be seen to be a multi-level concept, resting on the deepest human issues of value and motive, but operating as a fluctuating quantity within the band of experience in which it is employed.

D. PURPOSE

The purpose of instrumental power must, by definition, be a pre-specified goal. However, such goals may be objective and realizable in the outside world, or subjective and realizable in the world within. Typically, instrumental goals have an objective focus of some kind. Subjective goals do arise, and I discussed them in the section on purpose in chapter two on transformative power (pp. 70-72). They have the effect of distorting transformative process if they are
pursued rigidly. Far more effective for transformative process are purposes which are naturally transcended and reshaped as the process unfolds. Subjective goals can focus and release energy in the short run, however,

Pre-specified goals have certain characteristics of their own, in their most useful form. In order to have their most effective function, they should be measurable in some way. There need to be some ways of examining the outcomes of an instrumental power process in which those pursuing the goal can determine whether they have arrived. An end-point may be specified, or some state of affairs may be agreed upon or chosen as the termination. Another characteristic of a goal, as distinguished from a purpose, is that it should be conceivable from the outset. For it to be conceivable it need not be feasible, or even credible, but in order to qualify as pre-specified, it must be imaginable.

The crucial question that always rises about power is whether it must, of necessity, be negative in some way. The question belongs naturally in this section on purpose because part of the answer has to do with the goals of power. Another part of the answer has to do with means, however, and will be discussed in the methods sub-section of section E on means, beginning on page 368). Although I believe the answer must surely be that instrumental power is neither positive nor negative in itself, the issue is complex.

Even profoundly positive uses of power may inspire fear and negative valuing by the very magnitude of force mobilized. History
is always pockmarked with the after-effects of power, used in violently destructive ways, which inspired delight, and positive valuing, in the hearts of those who used it. Thus great instrumental power is not positive or negative solely because of how it is valued.

On the other hand, subtle uses of power which precipitate little overt valuing or disvaluing may be devastatingly harmful to persons or causes which have great human value. Subtle and low-key uses of power in positive ways may have effects beyond what anyone can presently perceive, as history often shows. Thus subtle uses of instrumental power may have long-range effects, beyond immediate perception, that are either extremely negative or positive in contrast to how they are perceived at the time.

In each of the cases I have just suggested, the perception of the goal for the use of instrumental power was different, for at least some of the observers, from the real goal. There is another whole realm of cases, though, in which perceptions are more in agreement, but power may be either positive or negative. That is, cases in which the goals are agreed both by those receiving the effects of the power and those exercising it to be harmful to the receivers. Similarly there are numerous cases in which the agreement is that the goal is helpful to the receivers. Cigarette advertising, police retaliating force, and assassination are examples of goals that are agreed to be negative uses of instrumental power by both receivers
and users. Courtship, high school education, and the care of curable diseases are examples that are agreed to be positive uses of instrumental power by both receivers and users. Thousands of other pre-specified goals that have mobilized all sorts of resources could be cited as either positive, negative or ambiguous uses of instrumental power.

Still another step needs to be taken in this discussion to support the point that instrumental power is, of itself, value-neutral. Is it possible that the same use of instrumental power may be either positive or negative? Immediately, the power of persuasion as in cigarette advertising and courtship appears to be an example. But perhaps the two kinds of persuasion are really different. Then persuasion in advertising cigarettes and in advertising vitamin D milk in sanitary cartons may be closer, the first being negative and the second being positive. Similarly, some courtships may involve kinds of persuasion that are different, perhaps? The ways of determining which specific uses of instrumental power are positive and which are negative may be very complex, indeed, but for the present purpose it is hardly necessary to decide about them. What does emerge from this discussion is that instrumental power is intrinsically neutral as to value, taking at least some of its value tone from the goals pursued.
1. Introduction

Instrumental power moves toward pre-specified goals, but it is more useful, i.e., "instrumental" if it serves purposes beyond itself. Even if it is sought for itself, it can still be effective; history provides countless examples of the outcomes of power, instrumental power, sought for itself. However, if the pre-specified goals sought in the use of instrumental power have been arrived at through any degree of seeking a common will, a more vigorous support is available for the instrumental process. In a like manner, if the pre-specified goals include moving toward transformative purposes sensed and desired by the human beings involved, their focused intent is available to empower the instrumental process. The most effective means of using instrumental power incorporate aspects of communicative and transformative process, as I will be showing in the examples below.

Paul Tillich, whose concept of power as a "dynamic self-affirmation of life" (1954:36) I cited in the definition section of the chapter on transformative power (see p. 62) has more to say about the importance of power being seen as an instrument of being and becoming. "It is not compulsion that is bad, but a compulsion which does not express the power of being in the name of which it is applied" (1954:48). By "express" I take him (from the context) to mean show in action, rather than verbalize.
This section, on means in instrumental power, has two subsections, criteria and methods. Two overarching criteria against which to check methods in instrumental power are whether the process is effective in moving toward achieving the pre-specified goal, and whether it is appropriate in relation to developmental values. Within effectiveness, I will also present sub-criteria, or process criteria, to offer means of examining aspects of an instrumental power process. The criterion of appropriateness will be presented second, with a rationale for accepting it as a criterion, and aspects of it to consider when evaluating an instrumental power process.

In discussing examples of methods, I will cluster those of individual, organizational behavior, and societal scope, and apply the criteria to them. Individual methods of using instrumental power will include examples from the allied health professions (Broski and Cook, 1978; Kjervik and Martinson, 1979) and from personal administrative style (Rogers, 1948, 1977). In the discussion of organizational behavior and instrumental power, I will work with examples on work and productivity (Likert, 1961; Kanter, 1977). Examples of confrontation in society from May (1972) and McClelland (1975) will be evaluated in the last paragraphs of the methods subsection of this chapter.

2. Criteria

One major overarching criterion upon which instrumental power can be evaluated is effectiveness in achieving the pre-specified goal.
Considerations of value have to do with the appropriateness of the process as well as the goal. They relate to communicative and transformative power, but they infuse the use of instrumental power. I have explored the issues of appropriateness earlier in the sections on source (C, pp. 357-364), and on purpose (D, pp. 364-367), but must return to it again at the end of this sub-section on criteria, to support the second overarching criterion.

The four effectiveness sub-criteria I would like to propose are arranged in the order in which they would come to bear on instrumental process. Each of them is related directly to the achievement of the goal, but at a different phase of the process. They are: (1) stimulates the development of alternatives, (2) clarifies decision-making, (3) releases participant and resource energy for the process, and (4) gives an impetus adequate to achieve the goal. Any or all of them may be present regardless of the appropriateness of the use of power from a human development standpoint. From the perspective of the paradigm shift, negative and inappropriate uses appear to be less likely to have long-term relevance, but from any perspective instrumental power does achieve its goals if it meets these criteria.

At this point, though, I would like to call attention to the contrasts between these effectiveness criteria for the exercise of instrumental power and those I offered in the chapter on
communicative power (see pp. 295 ff.). The contrasts are, first, that in instrumental power the criteria are sequential, and second that there is unlikely to be any confusion between the aspects the criteria evaluate and the outcomes of the use of instrumental power. Both differences have to do with the distinctions between the nature of instrumental and communicative power.

As to the first, the criteria in instrumental power deal with aspects of the use of the power in sequence: developing alternatives for action, then making decisions about how to proceed, next releasing the energy to carry out the process, and finally carrying through to the end. The criteria in communicative power are essentially repetitive and interlocking; they may be said to be iterative. The difference between the two kinds of power that this first distinction between the two sets of criteria relates to is the type of goal that each has. A sequence leads to a pre-specified goal; an iterative network leads to a common will.

With regard to the second difference, that the effectiveness criteria for instrumental power, in contrast to those for communicative power, evaluate aspects of the process that are unlikely to be confused with outcomes of the process, a separate difference between the two kinds of power comes into play. The effectiveness criteria in instrumental power apply only to the process itself, since the goal has been stated in some way before the process began, and is not influenced by the process. The criteria in communicative power apply
to the process, too, but the process and the goal and the outcomes are all interactive. If the process is flawed, the goal will be flawed, and the outcomes will be different, as well. The difference between the two kinds of power that comes into play in this second distinction between the two sets of criteria is the different relationship between the process and the goal that each has. An independent process leads to a pre-specified goal; an integrated process leads to a consensus.

Each of the four effectiveness sub-criteria I am proposing can be better understood by considering how the quality of process it calls for relates to the overarching criterion of effectiveness in reaching the goal. Each of them also can be clarified by some examples of that phase of various processes they would evaluate. The paragraphs devoted to each criterion will both relate the criterion to effectiveness in reaching the goal, and give examples.

(1) Stimulates the development of alternatives: The stating in advance of a goal need not pre-determine the methods to be used in achieving it. When only one method is noticed there is really no guarantee that it is even one of the best methods. In fact, if the findings given in the creativity literature cited in the section on mental means in transformative process (see pp. 174 ff.) are correct, 75% of the most productive ideas are generated in the last 25% of the time devoted to brainstorming.

In using the word "productive" I mean to refer directly to the general criterion of achieving the goal. An alternative is
productive to the extent that it moves the process on toward the pre-specified goal. The more alternatives considered, the more likelihood there is that the alternatives chosen will direct the process toward the goal as effectively as possible.

Even the most technological and circumscribed pre-specified goals admit of some minor alternative options, whereas more person-oriented goals that are broader in scope may actually require a wide range of alternatives to choose among. Entering checks in a ledger can be done in a dozen ways, for instance. Anyone who has ever been bored with a posting task will testify that there are many positions of the book and the pile of entries, and many ways of setting the checkmarks on the paper. Some of the differences are bound to be trivial, but the constant criterion of effectiveness in getting the job done is well served by thinking of a number of ways of doing it.

The principle of equifinality discussed by Bobbitt (1974:245) and Miller (1978:41) is relevant. Given known (i.e., pre-specified) goals, and the starting state of an open or living system, many ways are possible, but it cannot be predicted certainly in what way the goal will be achieved. This is especially true of systems, and goals, near the far end of the continuum of complexity. Goals like having taught children to read at the fourth grade level, having organized the launching of a new product line, or having synthesized a vitamin are end states of a system which can be reached
Those who are responsible for achieving such goals find that the production of many alternatives has instrumental value. Learning to read is a transformative process, but the pre-specified goal of getting children to meet certain standards calls for an instrumental use of teaching ability. The goal is served by having many alternatives to choose from.

(2) Clarifies decision-making: Whether the decision-making in a goal-oriented process is made by one person who is in charge or by a group who are involved in the process, or by any variation of possibilities in between, reference to the goal sharpens the issues. Probably every effort directed toward a goal involves some trade-offs and deciding among them can be made more effective if the goal is kept in view and the decision is made in terms of gains or losses in relation to it.

A number of management decision-making models in critical-path analysis, such as Gantt charts and P.E.R.T. are highly-structured examples of relating aspects of the goal to choice-points throughout the process (Haberstroh, 1965:1194-1195). The goal includes the time frame within which it is to be achieved, and the sequence of steps needed to gain it is ordered and within-process times are established so that all sub-processes converge at correct times. Looser goals like having a successful party, buying a new card, or keeping machinery in order also provide clarification for the use of instrumental power.
(3) Releases energy for the process: A successful instrumental power process must mobilize the human and material resources needed to achieve the goal. Mobilizing resources may be thought of either as de-fusing forces working against the goal or as gathering forces working for the goal, in Lewin's classic analysis (Lewin, 1951). The forces may be seen from the standpoint of the many, and varying degrees of, organizational environments (Thompson, 1967; Starbuck, 1976). Material resources are subject to the control of humans working within various constraints as Thompson (1967) and Kanter (1977) and others have shown. Whatever the leverage points or boundaries may be, the dynamic between them and the goal-in-view sets up a way of judging the instrumental process. If contingency management is effective the goal is well-served.

Examples that may point up the function of this effectiveness sub-criterion are to be found in every system. For instance, the goal of having a conference calls for gathering the program leadership and finding the setting, as a base. To do both of those tasks requires organizing money from within and outside the sponsoring organization, and organizing the people and the place to function together smoothly. The structure within the sponsoring organization offers vantage points from which to exert power to control contingencies as they are forecast and as they arise. A tight, straightforward goal like building a storm drain has an equally demanding
relationship to the instrumental process that brings it to pass. No matter how complex or straightforward the goal, the process criterion of releasing human and material energy to do the job can be used to evaluate the process.

(4) Gives adequate impetus to achieve the goal: A necessary criterion for any instrumental process must logically be that it provides sufficient force to go all the way to the goal. To meet any of the other three criteria and fail to reach the goal, finally, is to negate the success with the other three. To have the capacity to achieve a pre-specified goal implies that one does do it when tested. Thus, the relationship of the fourth process criterion to the overarching criterion is direct and essential.

The more clearly defined the goal, the more relevant the criterion of giving adequate impetus to complete the process becomes, because it can be applied with more precision. If the goal is clearly defined, like to have a new continuing education program be a financial success by January of the first fiscal year the criterion can be very effective. If the start-up and running costs are known, and are checked against the income, it can readily be determined whether the resources mobilized by the instrumental process were adequate to complete that process and achieve the goal. Whatever the failings of instrumental power in other phases of the process may have been, meeting that pre-specified goal was achieved.
Taken together, these four criteria provide a way of examining a specific method of exercising instrumental power to tell whether it operated fully to achieve the pre-specified goal, but they require some criterion of appropriateness to be used with them for completeness. Sheer effectiveness is a stark measuring rod when stripped of the richness of human meaning that goal-striving behavior exhibits.

b. Appropriateness: As an aid to proposing this second overarching criterion, I turn to the typology of power proposed by May, which I take to be an organization of the ways of exercising instrumental power (May, 1972:105-113). He suggests five "kinds" of power, all of which have goals in view:(1) exploitative power which uses violence in some form as a persuader, (2) manipulative power which uses some need in the less powerful to control, (3) competitive power which uses matching skill to challenge, (4) nutritive power which uses capability for the other, and (5) integrative power which uses a dialectic process of thesis and antithesis to form a new synthesis with the other. The kinds of power are arranged in an ascending order of social value, but even the integrative power is illustrated by a politicized kind of confrontation. Martin Luther Kind, Jr. and Ghandhi in their non-violent confrontation are among the examples May chooses to illustrate integrative power. He says that their consciously divesting themselves of power was their "innocence".
Literally, in plus nocens, i.e., not harmful (May, 1972:48).

Integrative power seems to use some forms of communicative process, as he describes it, but his view of integrative power resembles a communicative process of conflict resolution most. The saving grace of innocence appears to be less an ego-free state of consciousness than another strategy, ethical, to be sure, but a strategy nonetheless.

The gradient May uses to discriminate between the ascending levels of power seems to be respect for the value of persons, including self and others. Exploitative power has no respect for the other and slavery is one expression of it. At the other end of the scale, integrative power accords full respect to the user as well as to the other. It depends for its force, however, on the response of the other.

May's series of kinds of power is truncated in not having at least a sixth level at which power is seen as energy. He describes with approval John Dewey's analysis that "coercive force is the middle ground between power as energy and power as violence", noting that Dewey also said "Not to depend upon and utilize force is simply to be without a foothold in the real world". (May, 1972:101).

Although Dewey's pragmatic orientation is a welcome dash of realism, the interesting part of the quote is the implication that the high end of the continuum that begins at the low end with violence is power-as-energy.

Based on the preceding discussion, I would like to propose a second major overarching criterion to complement the meaning of the effectiveness criterion proposed at the start of this subsection. That criterion is appropriateness. The criterion will be a sliding-scale in which the gradient is the degree of developmental process present in the experience of instrumental power. It would begin toward the low end with a quality of process akin to the exploitative power May identified, and would be developmental for neither the person experiencing the power nor for the recipient. This level of the scale would be characterized by raw force, a high level of ego-involvement, and an instrument attitude toward other persons who may suffer the impact of the force or violence. Instrumental power at this level only compromises more the person who uses it effectively, so that probably the two criteria are at least independent if not antithetical, here.

Toward the high end of the criterion the power would be characterized by a quality of motivating energy, an ever lower level of ego-involvement, and a cherishing attitude toward the whole being of other persons touched by the action of the power. Instrumental power at this level continues to enhance the human potential of the
person who experiences its effective use. The possibility emerges that the curve of rankings on the two criteria swings in toward a near parallel or convergence.

As a name for such a criterion for instrumental power, in the context of the paradigm shift, I would like to adopt Ferguson's term, "appropriateness" (Ferguson, 1980:190). She says:

In the spirit of the Eightfold Path of Buddha, with its injunction about Right Livelihood, Right Speech, and so on, we might also think in terms of Right Power -- power used not as a battering ram or to glorify the ego but in service to life. Appropriate power (Ferguson, 1980:190, emphasis hers).

The instrumental power gains appropriateness as its process serves life, and as its goals and methods for reaching the goals are oriented toward the development of persons toward their fullest potential.

Instrumental power high on this criterion is infused with communicative and transformative process. It will not be confused with either, however, because it has clear goals of widely varied kinds. Moving up from the lower end of the appropriateness scale, I think I would expect to find communicative process emerging in

---

29 Ferguson's footnote: "The eight: Right Belief, Right Intention, Right Action, Right Livelihood, Right Endeavoring, Right Mindfulness, Right Concentration" (Ferguson, 1980:190).
consensus decision-making, participative management, and democratic governance. I would then expect to find increasing transformative process as the manifestations came closer to the experience of power as energy.

c. Summary: Thus, in formulating criteria for examining methods in instrumental power, I have suggested two overarching criteria, effectiveness and appropriateness. Both are focused on the process of using instrumental power; both examine instrumental power from a vantage point outside it. The effectiveness criterion measures the process in terms of whether it achieves the pre-specified goal. There are four process criteria within it which attend directly to successive parts of a process of using instrumental power, but to do so in relation to the parts' contribution to the goal-achievement. The vantage point outside the process is the system that set the goal that it served.

The appropriateness criterion examines the process in terms of the extent to which it serves the development of persons, and thus serves life itself. The appropriateness criterion attends to the qualitative aspects of the instrumental process which are (or are not) communicative and transformative. Communicative processes are described in organization behavior literature as "participative", and transformative processes are said by Habermas to lead to "auto-nomy". The quotation from Men and Women of the Corporation, parts I included in opening the section on sources (C, pp.375 ff.) is even more point, here:
Power is the ability to do, in the classic physical usage of power as energy, and thus it means having access to whatever is needed for the doing. The problems with absolute power, a total monopoly on power, lie in the fact that it renders everyone else powerless. On the other hand, empowering more people through generating more autonomy, more participation in decisions, and more access to resources increases the total capacity for effective action rather than (increasing) domination" (Kanter, 1977:166).

Kanter’s motto for her chapter on power is the paraphrase of Lord Acton’s comment, "Powerlessness corrupts. Absolute powerlessness corrupts absolutely" (Kanter, 1977:164).

3. Methods

This sub-section will have three parts in which I will compare various examples of goal-seeking behavior with the criteria I have developed in the previous sub-section, beginning on p. 369. The three parts are: (a) individual uses, (b) organizational behavior uses, and (c) societal confrontation. In each of the three parts, there is at least one example of a use that I would rank high on each criterion (or on both), and one that I would rank low on each criterion (or on both). For a preview of the sources I will be using see p. 369.
a. Individual uses of instrumental power: In the paragraphs which make up this part of the sub-section on methods in instrumental power I will be contrasting the experience of instrumental process of individual allied health professionals considered statistically (Broski and Cook, 1978; Broski and Mayo-Chamberlain, 1980) with Carl Rogers' experience as administrator of the Counseling Center of the University of Chicago (Rogers, 1948; Rogers, 1977).

Allied health professionals and nurses are prepared in their academic and clinical training to set realistic goals and mobilize resources to achieve them. The medical profession counts of them for laboratory analyses, summaries of vital signs, range-of-motion series, diet plans and a host of other aids to patient care. All of these products result from knowledgeable goal-fulfillment based on detailed training and professional orientation. Although some of the processes are narrowly technological, very few are so rigidly prescribed that no need for alternatives arises. Virtually all of them require the practitioner to do skilled decision-making, often very quickly. The work is hard, and the human environment of a health care institution often calls for a wise use of position-power to elicit the cooperation from other departments needed to deliver on some goals. No matter what the odds, however, the allied health professional is judged by whether she reaches the goal -- accurately and on time. The countless uses of instrumental power that are carried out in the average hospital in a day meet all the effectiveness sub-criteria at a high level.
No such claim can be made for the appropriateness criterion. Nurses and allied health professionals do not see their jobs as offering opportunities to do all they know how to do, much less grow on the job. The job satisfaction of allied health professionals measured in two recent surveys (Broski and Cook, 1978; Broski and Mayo-Chamberlain, 1980) is below national norms on all five scales of the Job Description Index (Smith and Hulen, 1957). The Broski and Cook study (1978) of a five-year sample of graduates of the baccalaureate programs of the School of Allied Medical Professions at The Ohio State University found that the sample fell below the 45th percentile in satisfaction with opportunities for promotion. Even worse (30th percentile) was the satisfaction with the job itself.

For instance, Allen and Cruickshank (1977) found that entry level occupational therapists perceive their greatest on-the-job problems to be those involving collaboration with other health professionals who do not understand or appreciate their function. The epidemic complaint is, "No one trusts me to do what I can do!"

The nursing profession faces a similar sense of frustration and dissatisfaction. Although typically the duties of a floor nurse include much more continuous responsibility for patient care than most allied health professions, their satisfaction is not much greater. The nursing epidemic is leaving-the-profession. As high as 85% of a given class of nursing graduates will not be working as
nurses five years after graduation. The goals nurses expect themselves to meet involve responsibility, but the cultural structure calls for them to act as if the responsibility is the physicians'. Kjervik and Martinson (1979) give a vignette that expresses a much broader situation than the one it immediately portrays:

The phrase "doctor's orders" says a great deal about the type of communication patterns that exist. Consider the following anecdote in which a nurse noted that a physician prescribed Librium for a patient. After thanking the doctor for the drug orders, the nurse commented, "Oh Doctor, I forgot to tell you that the night nurse reported that Mrs. M. was nauseated after each Librium. Did you want to write a new order?"

"Yes, thanks, Trudy, I did want to change the order". This doctor-nurse game situation reflects how a nurse can indirectly demonstrate knowledge without threatening the physician's authority... (1979:138).

The rigidity of this social structure has been defended as a means of establishing accountability, but it reduces the participation and autonomy of one group of participants to a very low level. In both allied
health and nursing the appropriateness of the use of instrumental power from the standpoint of the developmental needs of the practitioners is low.

Carl Rogers, Ph.D., author, professor, and counselor began his role as administrator about twenty years before he wrote of his discoveries in beginning to apply his person-centered views to the practice of administration in the University of Chicago Counseling Center (Rogers, 1948). Naturally, we may be sure, his experience as leader was a contrast to the experience of the nameless med techs, P.T.'s and nurses who made up the populations behind the statistics of disaffection and departure from health professions just given. From the vantage point of Carl Rogers' national reputation we may also naturally expect that the goals set by the staff of the center under his leadership were indeed met. The Counseling Center gave service to the University and a model to the profession of college personnel work over twelve years, strong testimony to their meeting the effectiveness criterion. The goal of providing counseling service was met, and Rogers' description of the process (Rogers, 1977) leaves little doubt that it rated high on each effectiveness sub-criterion. The effectiveness of the instrumental power in releasing human resources for the goal was especially striking:

I have never seen such dedicated group loyalty, such productive and creative effort, as I saw
during those twelve years. Working hours meant nothing, and at all hours of the day, far into the night, and on weekends and holidays, staff members were working because they wanted to (Rogers, 1977:93).

Predictably, however, Rogers' administration also gave a great deal of autonomy to staff members and developed very sensitive participation in administrative process.

I found that when power was distributed, it was no big thing to be the coordinator or chairman of the budget committee or whatever. Consequently administrative tasks were very often sought by the newest members of the staff, because it was an avenue of becoming acquainted with the workings of the operation . . . Senior members of the group were freed to spend more time on research and therapy, knowing that if the various administrative task groups failed accurately to represent the sentiment of the members, their decisions would be rejected by the staff as a whole (1977:94).

The administrative responsibilities that were developmental for newer staff members could thus be taken up by them. But note also that the research and therapy that was more likely to be developmental for older members of the staff could be done by them, since
they were able to count on reasonable controls within the staff group over processes leading to administrative goals. It appears that the instrumental power exercised at the University of Chicago Counseling Center while Carl Rogers was there ranks high on both the effectiveness criterion and the appropriateness criterion.

b. Organizational behavior uses of instrumental power:
In this part of the sub-section on methods in instrumental power, I will first be presenting Kanter's outline of ways of using instrumental power in a complex organization and showing how Shari Crain's program prepared women to do the things Kanter describes (Crain and Drotning, 1977; Kanter, 1977). Then I will discuss a case example relating productivity to the appropriateness criterion (Rogers, 1977).

Almost by definition, the ways that Kanter lists to accumulate power to get things done in "Indsco" are effective. She is essentially making a summary of the successful strategies for getting to be known as a person capable of achieving goals which she has discovered in her studies of, and consulting with, companies. She finds that power can be gained through activities and alliances. Activities must have three characteristics in order to work; they must be extraordinary, visible, and relevant. To be extraordinary one might be the first in a new job, or take risks on the job (and succeed), or make changes such as reorganizing the department. To be visible one would need to work in a boundary-spanning unit that had impact in
two directions in the organization, or do work that must be communicated about beyond the immediate unit, or work directly under or in view of top management. To be relevant one should do a job that relates directly to a pressing organizational problem and solves it.

The second cluster of ways that Kanter has identified to get power in a complex organization is through alliances. Alliances of three different kinds are needed; they are with mentors, peers, and subordinates. Alliances with mentors are needed to both guide and protect the person as well as support or pull the person up the hierarchy, and give luster by association. Peer alliances help by showing that the person finds acceptance, but must be made without becoming a captive to the peer group. This balance may perhaps be held if the relationship is based on favors exchanged. Finally, a person needs alliances with powerful and capable subordinates so that he or she can pull a strong support structure up the hierarchy if promoted, and get things done effectively whether he or she is promoted or not.

With the list of power moves just given, doubt is bound to appear as to whether the goals of the organization would be met effectively if they were all used. Those who do not succeed in risks taken suffer sufficient sanctions in Kanter's "Indsco" to limit the number of alternatives others would be willing to try. The emphasis on succeeding was sufficiently heavy that few people
would be willing to make a decision on their own that involved any significant amount of risk. The principal factor in decision-making became security rather than goal-achievement, except in rare cases when the person had extra assertiveness or know-how. All the alliance skills, on the other hand, served to release human and technical energies to achieve goals, and there was a great emphasis on following through. Probably the constraints of the system of using and developing power that Kanter described would keep it from the highest ranking because enough of the goals that were sought got realized to keep the company doing very well in the marketplace.

Kanter's book (1977) is full of horror stories about the narrow and rigid roles allowed to secretaries in "the Corporation", but at least they were usually allowed to increase their own status and the complexity of their job if their bosses were promoted. Their positions, however, offered little opportunity for a participative role, and their autonomy was in most cases very circumscribed. By contrast, as Kanter points out, the successful exercise of power through activities and alliances led to enriched responsibility, upward mobility and financial recognition at Indsco. The person who used power effectively was given more freedom, and an ever-expanding role in decision-making.

At this point in the discussion, the distinction between Habermas' definition of autonomy as freedom from both inner and
outer bondage has become urgent to make. When Kanter uses the word "autonomy", she usually means freedom from external restraints, not emancipation from old thought patterns. Autonomy means that one can go about one's tasks and get things done without a lot of supervision, for Kanter. The freedom from supervision was possible exactly because of the controlling thought patterns that life in the corporation instilled. Kanter makes it abundantly clear throughout the book not only that to abide by the norms was to survive, but that the reverse was inexorably also true. Thus the emancipatory interest was held at bay and consensus kept superficial. The appropriateness of the exercise of instrumental power inside Indsco is problematic.

Carl Rogers (1977) salutes an earlier proponent of the value of the management style which is now called "participative". Rensis Likert (1961) wrote a book and did a lifetime of research that strongly supported the view that a maximum involvement of all levels of a complex organization in "management" goal-setting and decision-making was not only appropriate but absolutely the most effective way to do business. His "systems" 1 through 4 were a typology of management style that amounted to a power methods categorization. Likert's research methods were to identify first the highest and lowest managers on a productivity scale, and then to examine in a most careful and "scientific" manner their management styles. He
summarizes his "newer theory" of effective management behavior:

- The objectives of the entire organization and of its component parts must be in satisfactory harmony with the relevant needs and desires of the great majority, if not all, of the members of the organization and of the persons served by it.

- The goals and assignments of each member of the organization must be established in such a way that he is highly motivated to achieve them.

- The methods and procedures used by the organization and its subunits to achieve the agreed upon objectives must be developed and adopted in such a way that the members are highly motivated to use these methods to their maximum potentiality.

- The members of the organization and the persons related to it must feel that the reward system of the organization -- salaries, wages, bonuses, dividends, interest payments -- yields them equitable compensation for their efforts and contributions (Likert, 1961:116).
Although it might be argued that the language of this summary is ambiguous (and that what the phrase "in such a way" means is not at all clear), from the context it is clear that Likert means that everyone participates, and that maximum autonomy is the preferred operating procedure.

Rogers draws on a summary by Lyon of Likert's work to give a more explicit list of the differences between the high and low producers. The high producers were people oriented, good delegators, allowed subordinate participation in decision-making, were nonpunitive, were two-way communicators, held few formal meetings, had great pride in their work groups, planned ahead, and held to their supervisory role in crises (Rogers, 1977:97-98).

Likert's views converted a generation of true believers in the world of organizational behavior. Tales like the one following, also given by Rogers, are the stuff on which System 4 believers build their faith. In a large, successful industrial organization with a sizable number of plants, a certain consultant had achieved sufficient trust by top management that he was allowed to set up an experiment in which certain plants were to be trained to operate in participative and, (Rogers' word) person-centered ways, and control plants were to continue without intervention from the consultant. Rogers emphasized that both sets of plants were "'well run' systems".

---

30 H. D. Lyon, Jr. It's Me and I'm Here! New York: Delacorte Press, 1974
(1961:101). The experiment, in full view of top management, was allowed to run for seven years.

During the past seven years the people in the experimental plants have become more and more deeply involved with a person-centered philosophy. Employees tend to be trusted by those in charge, rather than having their work closely supervised, inspected, and scrutinized. Likewise, employees tend to trust each other. The degree of mutual regard among the employees is unusually high, as is their respect for each other's capabilities. The emphasis of the consultant and of the plant personnel has been upon building up good interpersonal relations, vertical and horizontal two-way communication, and a dispersion of responsibility, choice, and decision-making" (Rogers, 1977:101).

The average cost of the item being produced is 22¢ in the experimental plants, 70¢ in the controls. The plausibility of there existing a top management that would allow the experiment to progress to a point at which the differential was that great is in doubt. But if the facts are as represented, the effectiveness criterion is certainly met in the experimental plants. By contrast, the control plants are reported to have seventeen to twenty-three managers doing
doing the work done in the experimental plants by three to five. Further details, including the name of the corporation, were withheld as a trade secret, but it seems likely that the control plants were as low as the experimental plants were high on both the effectiveness criterion and appropriateness, in the use of instrumental power to gain pre-specified goals.

c. Societal confrontation uses of instrumental power: What works well in face-to-face situations may break down altogether in the wider spaces that our technologic society has allowed to develop between "idealists" and "realists" and between Blacks and whites. Instrumental power is in action, most people would agree, when the military-industrial complex is able to coopt a generation of young people to go fight a war. Likewise, most people have come to agree that instrumental power is in action when Blacks work but do without substantial participation in the rewards of the society in which they work. Although there is now, and there is likely to be for the foreseeable future, substantial disagreement about how to remedy the problems arising out of these uses of instrumental power, there is widespread uneasiness about the problems themselves. This part of the sub-section on methods in the use of instrumental power will not attempt to deal with the broad uses of instrumental power just mentioned, but rather with the effectiveness and appropriateness of a social confrontation response to each. May (1972) has discussed the incident at Kent State in 1970 in terms that make an assessment of it on the two criteria being used here possible. McClelland has given
a similar treatment of the Black Muslim movement (1975).

At Kent State, the issue as the students saw it, was their demand for an end to the war in Viet Nam. The people in the community saw the issue as being their need for an end to the students' behavior, as a minimum. The students' behavior included simple poignant acts like dropping a flower into the barrel of a gun, but it also included obstructive sitdowns on town sidewalks, the burning of at least one building, and throwing rocks at the Ohio National Guard. Apparently the goal stimulated a variety of alternatives. May does not report any focused decision-making about how to arrive at the goal, and I am not aware that any was reported elsewhere. I think it is doubtful that the goal stated exerted much pressure to focus a choice of options. The young people involved displayed a great deal of energy in pressing for their goal, although the irrelevancy of some of their efforts is striking, in retrospect. Some of the behavior seemed to be directed at adults generally, or at social order per se, rather than at the specific evil they were ostensibly protesting. These weaknesses in their campaign might better be charged to the lack of decision-making than to lack of mobilization of resources. The weaknesses seem to have resulted in many cases, their not mobilizing the resources that would have changed government policy without loss of life in the protest. The question of whether the use, at Kent state, of instrumental power
did result in the ultimate shift in government policy is hard to answer. The war did stop, and the protest did have some effect, but there were multiple causes. The Kent State protest, in summary, might be rated moderate in its effectiveness. The effectiveness was stepped up considerably outside of Ohio after the shooting, however, and that leads to the consideration of how the protest might be rated on appropriateness.

Those who lost their lives did not have any observable further opportunity to develop their human potential. Those who did not die had been participants in an intense developmental experience. To the extent that the protest had impact on the conclusion of the war, it fostered a chance at further living that might not have existed otherwise.

But apart from prolonging or shortening life, itself, what effect did the protest have on the quality of life? Participants were pushed into some profound evaluation of their reasons for living, and for living in certain ways, as a letter to Rollo May from the sister of an Ohio National Guardsman is one testimony (1972). Others were carried in the media at the time, and have appeared since. Townspeople questioned themselves, and questioned the Viet Nam war in ways they would have been unlikely to had the protest not taken the turn that it did. The question whether the gain was worth the loss of four student lives is open, but I tend to believe that it
was. The randomness of those who died is almost a symbol of the point of the protest, since an ROTC student in uniform, on his way to take a test on military strategy was one. Rolly May points out that "there are no bystanders anymore" (1972:201, emphasis his).

Within the protest, a high degree of consensus had emerged. The protest was a strong statement of belief and feeling in a conflict that had not been resolved. On both scores, I would rate the communicative process moderate, even though the outcome was not a national consensus. Overall, it seems that the Kent State protest could be called a fairly good example of the appropriateness criterion.

McClelland (1975) uses the Black Muslim movement as a prime example of a top-down patriarchal power system. The information he gives about it from that standpoint will help to evaluate its instrumental power over members as to appropriateness. The effectiveness of the Black Muslim movement in building the image and self-respect of Black people in their own eyes has become legendary. As an initiative designed to change the image of Black people in the eyes of the larger community, it also had a fair degree of success. In fact, it seems that the Black Muslim movement was quite effective in gaining its original goal.

The control fanning out through the movement from Elijah Muhammad gained its moral authority from the new history of the human race that he created. This history showed how the original great
empires which had been built by Blacks, while whites were still living on all fours, had been raped by the fiendish white man. The power of the control was pervasive, touching every aspect of daily life as well as infusing the belief systems of those involved. McClelland passes on the account of the start of a day in a Black Muslim household showing how the authority of the father was shown, and the behavior of every member of the family was changed.

There was little autonomy, and little opportunity for new ideas to work in below the top of the system. Appropriateness on those scores was at a minimum. What appears to have been affected, although it is not explained by the theory that McClelland introduces it to illustrate, is the inner bondage to a crippling belief system. The Black Muslim movement worked in Black people's lives because it emancipated them from guilt about their behavior and their poverty and lack of opportunity. It also gave them not only a chance, but a requirement to enact expressions of their new belief system in their daily lives. In these ways, the Black Muslim movement achieves a very high ranking on the criterion of appropriateness. Seen with all its effects, the Black Muslim movement ranks quite high on both criteria.

I have applied the two overarching criteria to methods of using instrumental power in individual, organizational behavior, and social confrontation situations. It appears that the two
criteria have some usefulness in judging the characteristics of uses of instrumental power. Apart from that usefulness, though, applying the criteria to a range of instrumental power situations has perhaps helped to clarify the meaning of the concept. Next, I will be discussing the outcomes of the use of instrumental power.

F. OUTCOMES AND CONTINGENCIES

The outcomes of the use of instrumental power have apparently fascinated famous thinkers and ordinary people for as long as mankind has been capable of self-consciousness. People discovered very early that although they might achieve what they set out to do, the results might well not be what they expected. The legendary Midas, who surprisingly, was given the golden touch that magically made him as rich as he yearned to be, surprised everyone even more by turning his beloved little daughter into a gold image of herself. His plight is a true symbol of the experience of all of us. We want to be better off than we are, so we set a variety of goals to bring that (supposedly) better state to pass. The ways we achieve our goals are often a surprise to ourselves as well as to others. More surprising still, however, are the other contingencies we face as a result of gaining our goals.

In discussing the primary outcome of the successful use of instrumental power, and two types of secondary outcomes, I will also be identifying negative contingencies that may also come about.
Clearly, the primary outcome of using instrumental power effectively is achieving the pre-specified goal. The person or group that wins through to the end has the opportunity of experiencing the situation specified as the goal. No matter how carefully planned the goal-achievement has been, however, there is nothing quite like the reality of a new state. Every change, even those which people take initiative to bring to pass, brings some kind of stress, as Holmes and Rahe (1967) have documented. Living with the goal itself may be easier than dealing with the contingencies that arise out of winning it, though.

Such contingencies may be neutral, or positive or negative in the eyes of those who gain the goal. Positive contingencies may come from the unexpected favorable attitudes of others toward a person who can win that goal. A young man who has climbed dozens of mountains mainly "just because they were there" may suddenly find that the prep school admissions officer wants him to come to the school where he has applied, in spite of his low math grades. Doors open and new relationships form.

The negative contingencies that stem from achieving pre-specified goals have been the focus of more interest, probably, than the positive ones. The goal may be found to be more than necessary; the desired state turns out to be overkill. The goal may hurt other people; the desired state turns out to be harmful to
bystanders. The goal may have been gained by ignoring people who did not assert their needs; the process involved insensitivity, or callousness. Contingencies that are neutral in the eyes of those whose goal is gained may have quite another meaning for others involved. Dealing with the rest of the human and technical system that has been disturbed by any goal-seeking use of power quite often calls for a high degree of innovation and sensitivity on the part of everyone.

Closely related to the primary outcome of the use of instrumental power is the first of the two secondary outcomes to consider, the increase in power for the user of it. Those who use power effectively almost invariably increase the power they have to work with. This secondary outcome is often just as frightening to the user as some of the contingencies that come with achieving the goal. It may be unsettling, as well, if the person only had the immediate goal in mind, and did not foresee the increased expectations for the use of power that would be directed toward her or him.

The main contingency connected with this secondary outcome of getting more power from using it, is that it may seem like too much more power. In the paragraph above, I have just explored what some of the meaning of that "too much" may be for the person using it. At the same time, it may seem to be too much to others for two reasons, at least. One is that others may believe that the extra power will be used to their detriment. They may not trust either the
level of ego-involvement of the person, or her or his further goals. The other is that they may see power as a zero-sum situation in which the one person's getting more power necessarily means less for them. The zero-sum game is precisely the situation that everyone agrees exists often enough to give it a good deal of credibility as Kanter (1977) points out. However, as she also shows, it is by no means necessary to settle for that agreement. As power is "appropriately" used (in Ferguson's meaning and the one adopted for this study) everyone is empowered, and the whole system gains.

The second of the two secondary outcomes is the human development outcome. It is secondary in the sense that it is a by-product of the essential gaining of the goal, and it is by no means certain. It only obtains when the process and the goal of the instrumental power have been appropriate. The use of instrumental power can contribute to transformative process in making resources available, e.g., getting loans to support a Ph.D. program. The use of instrumental power can contribute to communicative process, e.g., securing a room for a consensus-seeking meeting. In both of these cases, the goal of the use of instrumental power was appropriate, but similar examples can be given for the process. The steps in getting the loans may call for a person's transcending his or her present capabilities in an imaginative way. The process of getting a room for a meeting may be an experience of establishing a common will with the owners of
the room, or their representatives, and may involve achieving a fairly deep level of understanding of what the use of the room means to owners and the prospective borrowers.

Negative contingencies of the human development secondary outcome of effective use of instrumental power are hard to imagine, but might come about if the users became so involved in appreciating the human growth and interaction that they lost track of the importance of the goal itself. Positive contingencies might be new vistas of effectiveness, the encountering of unexpected relationships, and simple satisfaction.

There are a world of outcomes and contingencies stemming from the effective use of instrumental power. The major differences among them in relation to human values have to do with the extent to which the use of instrumental power in question meets the criterion of appropriateness.

G. WOMEN'S EXPERIENCE OF INSTRUMENTAL POWER

The record of history has tended to confirm the popular belief that in the field of action called instrumental power, women are just not as effective as men. There have been glorious and infamous exceptions in history, as described with great richness of detail in Elise Boulding's book (1979). However, the book is aptly entitled, The Underside of History for it records thousands of
outstanding goal-achievements of women which have been both under-reported and under-rewarded. Boulding's conclusions do not confirm popular belief. She finds that those women who have had instrumental power to use have done so most effectively. With rigorous historical detail she reports the lives of medieval queens who marshalled their armies, and controlled their monies, and also raised their successors. The book's scope lives up to the title, covering recorded history. However, Boulding also finds that most women have not had or used instrumental power as I have defined it here, and thereby shows how it is that popular belief about women has become what it is today.

In this section of the chapter on instrumental power, I will discuss the Jungian views of women's psyche in relation to each of the aspects of instrumental power that I have discussed in the rest of the chapter as a whole.

1. The technical interest and the Jungian view of women

In this section I will be comparing the Jungian view of women with the five aspects of the technical interest identified by Milczarek (1979:52), as briefly described in this study on p. 350. First, the technical interest deals with the natural dimension of the world, including persons seen as objects. Although Jung would be likely to hold that women have no interest in things, he would be sure to hold that the action of the feminine principle would always be concerned with things mainly in terms of their meaning for relationship. Viewing persons as predictable and controllable objects
would be the negative work of the animus, a kind of de-personalization not typical of women.

Second, Milczarek notes in his dissertation on Habermas that the "dimension of reality" of the technical interest is "external reality" (1979:52). The Jungian view of the psyche of women is likely to predict that women would have less interest in external reality because the natural focus of a feminine person is on what is going on inside her body. This is not to say that women are introverts, but rather that the internal aspects of persons are likely to be of more interest to women, in the Jungian understanding, than they are to men.

Third, Milczarek observes that the technical interest has to do with the objective realm of experience (1979:52), rather than the subjective. This, most clearly, sets a distinction between the technical interest and the psyche of women as perceived by Jungian psychologists. Women, they assert, are more subjective in their natural orientation. In fact, unless the animus does his rightful inner work in enlightening the feminine principle, women are unlikely to be objective enough to function rationally.

Fourth, the frame of reference of Habermas' technical interest in Milczarek's table (1979:52) is the material world. A woman's likely frame of reference, unless she is very unusual, Jungians would be likely to say, is precisely not the material world, but rather the world of interpersonal relationships where
the Eros principle holds sway. The privately personal is a part of that uniting process, and it is the other main focus of the woman's psyche.

Fifth, Milczarek identifies the "kind of action" of Habermas' technical interest as being "instrumental" (1979:52). This, again, Jungian psychology is not likely to find to be the natural motivation of the feminine principle, with her concern for persons, and her nurturing urge. A woman's psyche is dominated by the feminine principle, but the animus has work to do, and if that work is done well a woman can form a rational plan and move forward on it toward pre-specified goals. Otherwise, a woman is more likely to follow a man's leadership and support his program of instrumental power.

Finally, sixth, the goal of the technical interest, Habermas says (according to Milczarek, 1979:52) is technical control. The logical and analytical processes needed to achieve technical control are alien to a woman's psyche, in the Jungian view. A woman's interest would be in those humanistic and interpersonal aspects of control that have reference to the feelings of people. If she does not come to grips with and understand her shadow, or dark side, a woman may be manipulative and emotional in her ways of controlling others. Her focus is usually on people as alter egos, however, and rarely on a kind of control that could properly be called "technical".
Thus, each of the dimensions that Milczarek identified as belonging to the technical interest as described by Habermas, the Jungian view of women's psyche would probably find to be naturally alien. The positive work of the animus would tend to bridge the gap between a women's psyche and the technical interest, but negative animus work would only broaden the chasm between the feminine and the technical interest.

2. The sources of instrumental power and the Jungian view of women

The Jungian view of women's psyches is more favorable in relation to the sources of instrumental power as they have been described in the sources section (C, p.357-364) of this study. Since the sources of social power are interpersonal, and even the power to command material resources is often interpersonal, woman's natural interest in persons seen as alter egos is relevant.

There are four sources of instrumental power that I would like to comment on in this sub-section. The first is power that arises from empowering others (Kanter, 1977); the second is power that is gained by using power (Kanter, 1977); the third is "reference power" (French and Raven, 1959), and the fourth is power that arises in natural processes of legitimation (Habermas, 1977).

As Kanter describes how people gain power in "Indsco" she shows how important empowering others through giving them autonomy and participation in decision-making is. This process would seem natural for women, in Jungian psychology, since the nurturing role
is typical of the feminine principle. A woman would be open to all the distortions of the feminine indicated by Neumann (1963), of course. The destructive and oppressive engulfing tendencies of the dark, earth mother could come into play to oppose truly giving others autonomy. The chaotic and distractible tendencies would oppose involving others in decision-making. Other negative tendencies latent in the negative action of the feminine principle are also to be found in the diagram from Neumann, (1963) - see page 228 of this study. However, as a woman overcomes her shadow (von Franz 1964:171-185) she can transcend these negative tendencies. She can also gradually benefit from the positive action of the animus in improving understanding and clarity to help with giving others autonomy and participation in decision-making.

In describing how people gain power at "Indsco" Kanter also emphasizes how important using power is in increasing it. Here the males' anima comes into action, providing a real obstruction to woman's gaining power enough to start using it. Kanter points out how important the secretarial and wifely supportive roles are to the men who run the company (Kanter, 1977:69-126). Women are seen as helpful back-up people, not as power users. This fits well with the Jungian view of the male psyche, and especially with the un-individuated action of the anima which keeps the man yearning for a sweet, nurturing woman to care for him (von Franz, 1964:186-198). Unless a
woman is wise enough to work around this tendency in some men, her chances of asserting her capacity to exercise power will be greatly reduced.

French and Raven's typology of power bases ranks reference power as least effective and most risky, because it is power by being attractive to others. "You will do this because you like me" is its message. Women's interest in relationship generally, and, when the shadow is in action, in using relationship to control, makes them especially likely to use reference power. This would appear to be the most vulnerable attempt to use power that women are likely to be prone to. The redeeming change offered by individuation for a woman to become aware of the action of the shadow and to gradually emancipate herself from attempts to control through attractiveness. Then her reference power is returned to her, but assumes a less ego-directed place in her instrumental power capacities.

Habermas (1977) reminds us that legitimation takes place when an unquestioned natural consensus emerges to support power. This kind of faith in a woman's capacities to exercise power effectively emerges often enough to make it credible that the positive trends in a woman's psyche that Jungian psychology has identified can predominate. With reference to legitimation in complex organizations a woman needs several things, all identified in Jungian writings as potential for women. She needs a clear rationality unhampered by opinionated generalizations. This she can develop by encouraging her masculine
principle to do his proper internal work with her unconscious (von Franz, 1964:198-207). She needs a warm, genuine relationship style unimpeded by possessiveness and controlling tendencies. This she can gain by working to overcome the ego-involvement guided by her shadow (von Franz, 1964:171-185). She needs a patient, thorough way of working undistorted by mindless persistence and stubbornness. This she has naturally through the feminine principle, if she becomes aware of and overcomes its negative tendencies (Neumann, 1963).

The outlook for a woman's access to the sources of instrumental power discussed here is good, according to Jungian psychology, provided she continues with her individuation.

3. The purpose of instrumental power and the Jungian view of women

The purpose of instrumental power is always achieving a pre-specified goal, and that is difficult for a woman, Jungian psychology would claim. A woman's psyche is dominated by her gender-related feminine principle, and that is the Eros or combining and relationship principle. The opposite principle is the man's gender-related principle, the Logos or rational and goal-oriented principle. Using power to achieve a pre-specified goal is natural to the masculine principle, but it is a hard-won re-organization of the psyche for a woman to shift her orientation in that way.

This difference is not so easily seen, because women's dogged persistence is legendary, and the Jungian psychologists recognize it.
Women are persistent once a course has been established. What is harder for a woman to do is to keep her focus on the goal and judge and dispose of minutiae in productive and effective ways in relation to it. A woman's commitment is to finishing her work, rather than to getting parts of it in perspective in relation to the goal and its demands.

The action of the animus in shedding light on what is going on inside a woman and providing clarification is a natural part of a woman's psyche, Jungian insights would claim (Sanford, 1980:76). It is her birthright, but it takes concentration to actualize it.

A woman has all that she needs to choose and carry out the purpose of instrumental power, the achieving of pre-specified goals, but she must exercise conscious concentration and control over the dogged and disorganizing tendencies of the negative aspects of her feminine principle in order to have full access to her instrumental power.

4. The means of instrumental power and the Jungian view of women

I have had a good deal to say about women's capacities to exercise transformative and communicative power, the components of the appropriateness criterion (see pp. 223 ff., and pp. 338 ff.). The criterion of effectiveness, with its four sub-criteria is what I would like to discuss here.
Each of the four sub-criteria has a direct correspondence to characteristics of the masculine principle as shown in the diagram gathering the ideas of Wickes and other Jungian psychoanalysts (Bargar, 1979, see p.229), on the masculine principle. Stimulating the development of viable alternatives for instrumental process is essentially a creative process, the central role of the masculine principle. Clarifying the decision-making needed to carry out an instrumental process involves the discrimination and analysis that is identified with the masculine principle. Releasing the psychophysical energy of participants is a leadership function and is analogous to the charismatic role of the masculine principle. Finally, providing an impetus adequate to achieve the goal is in practical experience, the thrust and follow-through characteristic of the masculine principle Jung has described (Jung, 1953:188-211). Each of these characteristics has a necessary complement in the feminine principle, however. Furthermore, every woman has an animus, which is the masculine principle at work in her psyche, as we have seen earlier in this section of the chapter.

The woman's psyche, in Jungian psychology, is less likely to embody without conscious intention the characteristics measured by the effectiveness criteria in instrumental power. Her capacities develop through the stimuli that life experiences and her conscious intent offer to get her individuation process, however, Thus, the view of women's psyche held by Jungian theory is not entirely pessimistic about women's exercise of instrumental power.
5. Outcomes of instrumental power and the Jungian view of women

To the extent that a woman is successful in carrying on her individuation process and becoming the whole person that her unconscious and conscious being holds the potential for, she can gain the benefits of enlightened use of instrumental power. Her relationships can be enriched by fruitful and appropriate goals met through mutual seeking with others whose individuality and growth is honored and fostered. The potential for satisfaction as well as continuing growth is nearly unlimited, as we shall see in the next chapter which has to do with the interrelationships between the three kinds of power, and the potential for androgenous functioning that every woman has.
PART III

CHAPTER VI

THREE KINDS OF POWER AND THE FEMININE ANDROGYNE

A. INTRODUCTION

"The purpose of this dissertation is to discuss relationships between Jungian theory about women and three kinds of personal power, transformative, communicative, and instrumental, within the context of the paradigm shift now in process" (see p. 12). In the pages following that statement of purpose, I have explored aspects of each of the major topics in the statement. Now a new vista opens, in much the way I suggested in the purpose section of the transformative power chapter (see pp. 70-72). We experience all three kinds of power in interaction with each other, although I separated them in order to discuss them. We also experience women as using all three kinds of power effectively in a way that transcends either the feminine or the masculine principle within by uniting them in an unending balance. Finally, we experience ourselves as living in a universe of energy relationships that transact within us to energize the power we use as persons having innate feminine and masculine principles. Thus, in recombining what has been analyzed thus far into life experience again, we
may find a new purpose for the study that includes, but leads beyond, the first one.

This third major part of the dissertation deals with two main issues, (1) how a woman who consciously combines her feminine and masculine principles in androgynous functioning uses all three kinds of power, and (2) how education can support her development. Much of what I shall have to say in Chapter VII about the educational implications of the view of woman's power being offered here also applies to educational development in relation to men's experience of power. I will not be able to explore the educational implications for men in the scope of this paper, but I regard them with interest from the perspective gained here.

The new purpose for this dissertation that emerges from the first, but transcends it, is to present some of the significant educational implications of the interactive use of three kinds of power, (instrumental, communicative, and transformative) by androgynous women within the context of the paradigm shift of world view now in process. The two chapters in this third part of the dissertation are based on the model shown in Figure 15 on the following page. The model uses the yin-yang symbol of the "way of life" from Oriental tradition to imply both the integral relationship of the feminine and masculine, and the universe created by their interaction. Superimposed on the yin-yang is a representation of the interactive relationships among the three kinds of power (communicative, transformative, and instrumental).
Figure 15
Three Kinds of Power
And A Yin-Yang Expression of the
- Jungian Psychology of Women
Each of the sections of this chapter, VI, refers to some aspect of Figure 15 including this introductory section (A). Section B, on the interactions of influence among the three kinds of power deals with the band of circles and arrows in the middle of the diagram showing that each of the kinds influences each of the other kinds of power. The section C on the principle of androgyny in mythology and Jungian psychology deals with the intercurved yin-yang symbol. In this section I will be turning again to the relation between the emerging conception of a participatory universe and Eastern mysticism, as symbolized by the yin-yang, that I discussed in the universal energy chapter (see pp. 16 ff). Finally, in section D I will offer a way of relating andogyny as experienced by women to the three kinds of power within the universal energy.

Figure 15 illustrates by its circularity the emphasis of this chapter on the integral nature of the meaning of all the aspects shown. It embodies the "li" principle of the universe (Capra, 1975). Capra summarizes: "In the Eastern view then, as in the view of modern physics, everything in the universe is connected to everything else, and no part of it is fundamental" (Capra, 1975:280). A woman's masculinity is essential to the meaning and function of her femininity, and the meaning and function of each kind of power is essential to that of each other kind. Similarly, the meaning and function of each of these elements is connected to the meaning and function of
every part of the universal flux of power, and likewise, no part of it is fundamental. This also fits well with the assertion of interrelatedness of all aspects of our functioning that I demonstrated in the chapters on transformative power. Our physical, emotional, intellectual and spiritual aspects are snugly interrelated in our lives.

The educational implications I will be discussing in chapter VII stand firmly on this same interrelatedness of all aspects of our experience. Although I will follow the outline of the dissertation thus far in analyzing aspects of educational process about which to make proposals, one of the basic underlying assumptions I operate on is the functional interactivity of all our experience, in every realm. Thus I shall have something to say about supporting women in using all the experiences of their lives including those formally identified as educational to further their individuation. As I discuss in chapter VII, the approaches to educational process that I believe to be natural in terms of the view offered in this study, I will analyze them into communicative, instrumental and transformative clusters. Within each cluster, however, I will need to show how the use of each other kind of power, and the changes arising in the individuation process affect the group of proposals being made. Finally, I will be describing how the world view that might be called
"holonomic" influences each aspect of educational process under consideration. Following this plan, I will round out the discussion of "Women's Experience of Power: A Theory for Educational Development" and conclude the study.

B. THE INTERACTIONS OF THE THREE KINDS OF POWER

Although Habermas' critical theory has been helpful in discriminating among the three cognitive interests (the emancipatory, the practical, and the technical), he has also recognized the interrelatedness of the interests and of the types of action and power related to each of them. It is probably impossible to exercise any one kind of power without interference or support from one or both of the other two. In fact, each has worthwhile contributions to make to the use of the other two. It is these varying influences and contributions of each to the others that I will be discussing in the sub-sections that follow.

1. The influence of transformative power on the use of communicative and instrumental power:

What Habermas calls the emancipatory interest forms or constitutes meaning and knowledge relating to liberating persons from their bonds, whether they be societal, as in the Marxian critique, or intra-psychic as in the Freudian. Both the practical interest and the technical are posited in the emancipatory interest, he points out:
Reason's interest in emancipation, which is invested in the self-formative process of the species and permeates the movement of reflection, aims at realizing those conditions of symbolic interaction and instrumental action; and, to this extent, it assumes the restricted form of the practical and technical cognitive interests. Indeed, in a certain measure, the concept of the interest of reason, introduced by idealism, needs to be reinterpreted materialistically: the emancipatory interest itself is dependent on the interests in possible intersubjective action-orientation and in possible technical control (Habermas, 1971:210-211).

In my adaptation of the emancipatory interest to offer the transformative power concept, I have indicated a realm of experience that is neither part of the "symbolic interaction" or of an "intersubjective action-orientation" which Habermas posits in the quotation just given, although it includes them. Further, transformative power goes beyond being part of "possible technical control", although it may also include that interest. In addition to those interests, transformative power involves other idealistic intra-psychic envisioning and self-transformative processes that I have discussed in the means section of the transformative power chapter.
Both in its contributions to communicative power and to instrumental power, transformative power acts to develop the person using the power, rather than to achieve the goal of the other kind of power. For example, an outcome of transformative process that would influence communicative process might be that the person, who had become more at ease emotionally and more incisive intellectually, would be prepared to clarify issues leading to mutual understanding in hermeneutic inquiry. Such an enrichment of interpersonal skill would allow that person to support consensus-building more effectively. However, the action of transformative power is within the person, organically integrating growth.

In a like manner, a person who had had a spiritual experience of transformative power might have a more refined sense of personal priorities that would guide goal selection in his or her use of instrumental power. Actually, both the development of greater clarity and creative insight in an intellectual use of transformative power might strengthen goal-seeking skills for instrumental power process. The few examples given here are only suggestive of many ways that transformative power can influence the exercise of communicative and instrumental power. Given the understanding of the relationship of the individual to the rest of the cosmos enunciated in Pribram's discussion of the energy systems of the brain, I think it is not too strong a statement to say that it is in transformative process most directly that the generalized power of the universe is
brought into the human realm. Arrows in Figure 15 headed from transformative power to communicative and instrumental power show the direction of this influence.

2. The influence of communicative power on the use of instrumental and transformative power:

The influence of communicative power on the exercise of each of the other two is so great that it is relatively easy to confuse some forms of each with communicative power. In relation to instrumental power, for instance, goals are often set with some explicit communication about the goal and the possible outcomes, among those impacted by the potential outcome. Even when no explicit attempt at dialogue is made, an internal sizing up of the impact on others' opinions and rights is quite likely to be made. Instrumental power is very seldom exercised without some kind of context or environment, but the extent and seriousness of the dialogue is what determines the amount of communicative power present in the situation. A goal-setting interaction can be profoundly communicative in character, or very superficial.

Once the goal is set, in instrumental power, communicative process can make another contribution, and that is to the ways of going about achieving the goal. If a climate is established in which the needs and feelings as well as the capacities of each person involved is of mutual interest, then the energies released by communicative process can be made available to vitalize the goal-directed process of instrumental power.
The contribution of communicative process to transformative power is rather different from the contribution that it makes to instrumental power. The gentle, thorough, listening and exchanging interactions of hermeneutic inquiry may help a person to deepen his or her own self-understanding. It is here that the potential confusion of communicative power with transformative power is likely to occur. Deeply probing dialogue is so facilitative of transformative process that it is all too easy to identify its power as the source of the change. In fact, as I have shown earlier in the discussion of the power of caring (see pp. 120-121), the transformative power is released within the person whose understanding is deepening. Actually, all parties to communicative process are likely to gain self-understanding and the transpersonal psychologists have commented that this often happens in the most fruitful psychotherapy (Walsh and Vaughan, 1980; Vaughan, 1979b; and my discussion of their point of view, pp. 132-178).

Another facet of communicative process, the development of a common will, works as a support system to nurture a person who is using transformative power. As such a person experiences him or herself as valued in the forming of a common will, he or she is strengthened. This releases energy for the process of self-transformation. Here, positive regard is linked to the cognitive component in just the way I showed to be important in the earlier discussion of caring (see pp. 120-121).
Arrows headed from communicative power to instrumental and transformative power in Figure 15 show the direction of the kind of influence described here.

3. The influence of instrumental power on the use of transformative and communicative power:

Before discussing the positive influences of instrumental power on the other two, I would like to draw attention again (see pp. 341-342) to the root problem from which I believe the negative influence of instrumental power on them comes. In our rational, technical society, we have all too often assumed that instrumental power is all power. This assumption is reinforced by seeing the world through an ego-centered bias. When this error is rampant, abuses of the nature of communicative and transformative power can readily be condoned and even affirmed. Rigid goals may be set, and pursued with unimpaired commitment in spite of the aborting of the potential transformative processes available within individuals in the unfolding situation. Everything goes, in the name of the goal. Likewise, under the banner of goal-seeking, potentially powerful consensual processes may be set aside without anyone's consciously noticing their loss.

In contrast to these negative contributions, instrumental power used appropriately makes valuable contributions to transformative and communicative power. Within transformative process as I
have defined the steps in its use, many short-term and supportive instrumental goals arise. Getting materials to create with, forming feedback relationships, and making the corrections called for in shifts in process are all examples. Setting and achieving these intermediate goals releases more power for the transformative process.

Also in relation to transformative process, instrumental power may be the trigger that causes a person to sense a dis-ease. Stress engendered in a goal-seeking process may be interpreted by the person experiencing it as a strain that needs attention, for instance. Then a transformative process may be set in motion as the person makes some change in the physical, emotional, intellectual, and spiritual network of his or her life. In order to use transformative power effectively a person also often needs to adopt some structure for change. In addition, the seeking of feedback and dialogue may involve the seeker in analysis or theory-building to implement the correction-in-flow process.

Analytic inquiry and theory-building form a more important part of the use of communicative power. Persons may productively be seen as objects, for purposes of understanding, as long as this viewpoint is firmly held in the context of a fuller additional inquiry about the person's motives and history. Apart from its usefulness in developing knowledge about persons, analytic inquiry, as
facet of the use of instrumental power, can help communicative process in noting aspects of systems, and noting regularities in behavior as well as the correlated irregularities. In addition, theory-building in an objective or instrumental sense is useful in speculation about relationships and (multiple) causes (see pp. 342-343).

In much the same way that instrumental power may trigger transformative process, it may set off communicative process by bringing a breakdown in reliable intersubjectivity to attention. In fact, organization development efforts often stem from such breakdowns. The need to repair it stands out immediately, and communicative power comes into play. And, again in a parallel way, the intermediate goals within a communicative process energize the process. Furthermore, some structure for communicative process like the consensus-seeking rules cooperative (see pp. 320-321) is often needed.

Arrows going from instrumental power to transformative and communicative power in Figure 15 stand for the influence just discussed. All the arrows taken together, thus indicate the reciprocal influences among the kinds of power.

C. THE ANDROGYNY PRINCIPLE

In this introduction to the androgyny section, I would like to show what its components are and what its value to our society and us as individuals might be. The highly prized technical mastery
of the twentieth century has been won in countless forays into a chaotic unknown natural world. By the application of logical and step-by-step linear intellectual methods, mankind has gradually dominated a nature that previously dominated him. In their personal writings, many scientists have given due credit to "hunches" that provided organizing structure as well as instigating their discoveries. Both the logical explorations and the organizing structure are "masculine" in quality. The high value our society now puts on them has tended to be opposed by a lower valuing of what is seen as "feminine". The "feminine" quality is intuitive, context-oriented, and nurturant (McClelland, 1975; Singer, 1976). The capacity to pounce on the vision of the outcome, allied to an ongoing awareness of many aspects of the entire setting is seen as feminine; so is the capacity to nourish the developmental process. Together the masculine and feminine qualities make a strong process.

Each quality has grave weaknesses alone. Femininism and the male chauvinistic backlash to feminism might be able to deprive us of the strongest response to these weaknesses, which is androgynous functioning, if it were not that it is a built-in human potential. The animus and anima archetypes of the unconscious described by Jung (1930, 1953, 1958, 1959, 1960, 1968) on the basis of his thousands of hours of therapeutic work with women and men are one statement of this potential. Jung's followers, Wickes (1963), von Franz (1968), de Castillejo (1973), Singer (1972, 1976), and Sanford
(1977, 1978, 1980), have all expanded in various ways on the principle. I have discussed the anima and animus in the sections on the Jungian psychology of women in three chapters of this study (see pp.223-243 , pp. 329-340, and pp.404-414). In each of these parts of the study I have shown the relevance of a woman's fuller exercise of both her feminine and her masculine principles to her experience of power. Wickes' chapter entitled "The Man in the Woman" (1967), expresses her dealing with the subject, but Singer has moved a step further in the title of her book, Androgyny (1976).

Singer states a value of understanding the androgyny principle, and begins to define it, in the following words:

... When we begin to recognize androgyny as an essential reality of human nature, we begin to move toward a world in which individual roles and the modes of personal behavior can be freely chosen. Androgyny has the power to liberate the individual from the confines of the "appropriate".

In order to understand what androgyny is, we may begin by suggesting what it is not. It is not hermaphroditism and it is not bisexuality, although sometimes it gets confused with one or the other (Singer, 1976:30).

Singer continues by explaining that hermaphroditism is a physiological abnormality, and bisexuality is a psychological condition. She then
points out that an androgynous person is at ease with the sexuality that matches his or her physiology. Further, he or she is unlikely to be extreme or stereotypical in sharing it. The androgynous person is one who consciously accepts a dynamic masculine-feminine balance and interplay within. In a society founded on the Judeo-Christian tradition, as ours is however, androgynous functioning is open to criticism and hence is risky. The Total Woman (Morgan, 1973) concept is a recent example of that critique. Therefore, it is important to realize that the female-male interaction survives and evolves as an intra-psychic process, and is not, in its essence, an inter-personal one. This is true, even though the inter-personal forms a setting for the intra-personal process.

Androgyny within us is a natural state of affairs, if we only refrain from splitting ourselves apart in response to a mis-interpretation of society's real needs. The potency inherent in the androgyny principle within is also continuous with that universal wholeness and power which consists of dynamic opposition. Singer closes her introduction to Androgyny with this comment:

"... The power (inner strength) lies in the openness to the opposites within oneself -- not by an effort to integrate that which is strange or foreign, but by awakening to the reality that the opposites have been there"
all along, and would coexist in harmony if
only we did not drive a wedge between them
(Singer, 1976:37).

1. The cultural background of androgyny

In the rest of Androgyny, Singer (1976) shows how the
androgyny principle is expressed in Western mythology and the Taoist
scriptures before she extends Jungian psychology to bring Jung's
legacy into accord with the emerging world view of the 1970's. I
am indebted to her for the insights around which the two following
sections, C. 1. a. and C. 1. b. are formed.

a. The principle of androgyny in western mythological tra-
ditions: For decades in this country it was common to regard mytho-
logy as a collection of fascinating tales that every young person
ought to be exposed to as a part of growing up. Clearly they were
not to be taken literally, and perhaps they were not really to be
taken seriously, either, except as an artistic way of expressing
some truths about human nature. A shift to taking myths as a projec-
tion of the recurring regularities of unconscious process has made
them of even greater interest. Jung, himself, was among the leaders
of this transition, in his earlier work (1913) and in "The Structure
of the Psyche" (1960, originally published in 1931). Neumann (1968)
in the Jungian tradition, and Joseph Campbell (1959, 1968), and
Mircea Eliade (1965) have been leaders in the shift to a more
psychological understanding of myths. It is in this context that I find the earliest myths, and all myths about the beginning of the world, to be of significance.

Singer suggests that the predominance in many mythologies of descriptions of the primordial ancient time as matriarchial may be founded on how "the psyche remembers in an organic but non-conscious way the formation of the first embryonic cells in the vast wasteland of the womb . . ." and its "early attachment to and dependence on the Mother, which is the common and archetypal experience of all human beings" (Singer, 1976:56-57). Although the woman is often given as the first being, and this fits with contemporary understandings in embryology (Sherfey, 1972:30-53), the beginning of all things comes from a sexual union in early myths.

An example is the Pre-Hellenic Pelasgian myth of Eurynome and Ophion. Eurynome in the myths of the Pre-Hellenic culture, is the goddess who rises up out of the Chaos and establishes land because she has no place to dance on the waves. Her dance draws Ophion, the serpent, (or the North wind, Boreas) to couple with her. Singer writes:

It is said that she then assumed the form of a dove, brooding on the waves. When the time was right, she laid the universal egg. Ophion the serpent coiled himself seven times around it, and remained there until it hatched and
split into two parts. Out spilled all the things that exist, the children of Eurynome: the sun, moon, planets and stars, the earth and all that grows upon it (Singer, 1976:60).

The elements that appear in this story and that recur in later Greek myths, in the closely related Roman myths, and in Babylonian and Egyptian myths, are the Great Mother, a Primordial Separation, Loneliness, Dance, the Serpent, and the Cosmic Egg. They reappear in the Homeric creation legend, for example.

The Homeric version of the creation myth differs from the Pelasgian, in that all gods and all living creatures are said to have originated in the river of Oceanus, which circles the world. The Universal Female, Tethys, ruled the sea, like Eurynome; and Oceanus wrapped himself about the Universe, like Ophion. But the Orphics says that the Mother of All was black-winged Night who, embraced by the wind, laid a silver egg (the moon) in the womb of Darkness. Eros, ... was hatched from this egg, and was born double-sexed. This androgynous god of love

---

was golden-winged and had four heads; he was the one who set the universe in motion.\(^{32}\) (Singer, 1976:62).

As she points out, this Eros is an imperfect androgyne, and hermaphroditic. In a similar sense, the Adam of Genesis in the second chapter where he is portrayed as the source of Eve, is also hermaphroditic. A version which has an intuitively truer sound is the version in the first chapter of Genesis. In it, a God who is dual creates man-and-woman in her/his own image. The quote, of course, is "And God said, Let us make man in our image after our likeness: and let them have dominion over . . ." (American Standard Version 1901:2). The name for God is Elohim, a feminine noun with a masculine plural ending, Singer indicates. She has also shown that there was ample reason for the invading Jewish tradition to set itself off from the earth-goddess-worshipping natives by asserting the masculinity of its God. Inadvertently, though, the writers of Genesis showed a deeper wisdom, by indicating that their God was dual, containing both the male and female principles.

The notion of the androgyne had gone through many imperfect versions, in the Amazons, in the various versions of the Pasiphaë-Minos tale, and in the Zeus-Europa myth. Indeed it was subject more

\(^{32}\) Singer again cites Graves, ibid.
than once to distortions guided by a need to establish a difference between the invading culture and the earlier fertility cult. In each case, a matriarchy had had a primordial wholeness, then divided between up and down, dark and light, etc. in its mythology, to understand creation. The matriarchal culture was taken over by an invading culture that insisted that a male principle was alone in instigating the creation, "fathering" it on a passive feminine principle (Singer, 1976:69).

The androgyny principle founders, and is submerged, but it reappears. Singer would like to go beyond, or return to before, the masculine monotheism of the Judeo-Christian tradition to an "androgynous monotheism" (1976:88). In it, the one God would be recognized as a

... pervasive Divine Essence containing the World Parents, the Two in the One, then a new culture-myth would come into being. The motif of loving (union) would characterize the prevailing myth; instead of the more typically prevailing motif of strife (separation), which produces so much of the degeneration and fragmentation we see all around is (Singer, 1976: 88 - emphasis hers).

June Singer, the rabbi's widow, a woman, seems to be speaking out of her own feminine principle here, although the outcomes of the inner action of her light-giving animus are everywhere to be seen in her writing.
It was Carl Jung, her male mentor and the product of his masculine-dominated culture, however, who discovered the remarkable psychological implications of the alchemical opus of the middle ages. In its secrets were passed on the mythic understanding of the unifying and purifying work of the masculine and feminine principles. This wisdom went underground into alchemy to escape the punishment of the church of the middle ages, but Jung re-discovered it with exacting scholarship over a period of many years as a parallel to his psychotherapeutic work. In alchemy, the androgyny theme re-asserts itself as a conjunction of opposites. What has been separated and purified becomes one again in the philosopher's gold. Consciousness is separated from the unconscious and then reunited in a new and finer, working whole.

The dynamic that alchemy found and celebrated between spirit and matter, Singer finds again in the passionate energy between masculine and feminine in the Jewish mystical literature of the Kaballah (Singer, 1976:153-154). With her discussion of it she makes the bridge to the energy alternation of the Taoist myths of the yin-and-yang principles. It is not within the scale of this paper to do justice to the depth and range of meticulous scholarship by which Singer has supported her speculative synthesis of the androgyne principle. Perhaps her work on the androgyne principle is convincing in part because it provides an intuitive resolution to the shrill
assertions of feminine or masculine superiority that seem so barren. Whatever its sources of legitimacy for those of us who are bearers of the Western culture myths, it only gains more plausibility by also being an integral part of Eastern myths, as well.

b. The principle of androgyny in oriental traditions:
Fritjof Capra (1975) has described in some detail the parallels between modern micro-physics and Eastern mysticism. The alternation of energy that is symbolized for physics by the sine wave \( \sin x \) is symbolized for Taoism by the yin-yang, as shown in the diagram in Figure 15, near the start of this chapter. The principle of entropy which states that systems tend to run down and become disorganized stands in direct contrast to the constant becoming-through-alternation that Eastern thought has found to be the nature of reality. Capra shows that different regularities obtain in the relatively narrow band of empirical investigation covered by Newton's "laws" from those that hold for micro- and macro-physics. Both in the sub-atomic orders of magnitude, and in those of galactic space, however, the flux of energy consists of an oscillation that sums to an apparent equilibrium which is nevertheless composed of endless and anti-entropic alternation (Capra, 1975).

Like Capra, Singer also sees the striking parallel between the Taoist yin-yang and the world view of modern theoretical physics. She also points out that the positive charge of the nucleus of the
atom is a masculine, or organizing force, and the negative charge of (the) electron(s) is a feminine, or responsive force (Singer, 1976:244). Figure 16, on page , summarizes some of the names for the masculine and feminine forces she has elaborated on in her discussion of Western mythical, Hindu, Jewish, Kaballistic, and the modern physics views of reality in their relation to the yin-yang. A few of the concepts shown I have not mentioned thus far, and I will set them in context here.

In the Kaballah tradition, the secret wisdom is arranged as a tree of life, or the body of Adam. The crown or top position is regarded as the source, and is called "Kether"; it is masculine. The feet is the kingdom, and symbolizes harmony or wholeness; it is feminine (Singer, 1976:161-163). In the Hindu tradition, Siva-Sakti is the androgynous Creator-Creatrix which generates all things and nurtures them. It is interesting from a psychological perspective that the feminine Sakti aspect of the God-Goddess does her nurturing work within, and "maintains the surface consciousness that thinks of itself as master while utterly unconscious of the invisible activity of the real mistress of the abode" (Singer, 1976:181).

This concept bears a striking similarity to Pierre Tielhard de Chardin's concept of radial, or nuclear and organizing energy, and tangential energy, which is associated with the outer structure of the atom.
Singer locates these ideas from other cultures on the dynamic phases of becoming-in-alternation symbolized by the flow of energy in the yin-yang shown in Figure 16.

Two dimensions of Singer's thought are of special relevance in this paper. One is the rich diversity among and the great congruity across various cultures of the masculine, the feminine, and the androgynous principles. This, she summarizes in the Taoist conceptions of the yang, the yin, and the yin-yang. The other dimension of Singer's thesis that is of special interest here is the creative dynamic of the yin-yang, androgynous alternation of energy.

In the Taoist conception, the masculine defines the feminine, and the feminine defines the masculine, but the oneness that they both together form exists only because of them. Alan Watts has translated Lao-tzu:

2
When everyone knows beauty as beautiful, there is already ugliness;
When everyone knows good as goodness, there is already evil.
"To be" and "not to be" arise mutually;
Difficult and easy are mutually realized;
Long and short are mutually contrasted;
High and low are mutually posited; . . .
Before and after are in mutual sequence (Watts, 1975:22-23)34.

When Yang has reached its greatest strength, the dark power of Yin is born within its depths. For night begins at Midday when Yang breaks up and changes into Yin.

**Figure 16**
Summary of Androgynous Aspects of World Cultures in Relation to the Yin-Yang Symbol of Taoism

(adopted from Singer, 1976:240)
This passage is valuable (but not more so than others I might have quoted) because each of the contrasted elements is taken together with the other and becomes value-neutral, just as I perceive the masculine and feminine to be. Each comes to consciousness by its nature as not-the-other. The pejorative assumption that everything good is masculine and everything opposite to that is both feminine and negative, which McClelland so effectively resists (McClelland, 1975), is absent here, because both are seen to be essential. Perhaps it is clearer to say that each is neutral with regard to value because both are only valuable in terms of the other.

The intellectual thread through history that becomes relevant here again is the contrast between the two kinds of thinking so many observers have identified. Among the many names (see table, p. 68) are the propositional and appositional mind (Bogen, 1969), the differential and the existential (James, 1880), the rational and the intuitive (Maslow, 1957). The left column on page 68 lists the names of the character of mind which has been called "masculine", and the right those called "feminine". All times have noted the difference, but our own time has been preoccupied with the masculine characteristics. The mythical, poetic, and intuitive side has acted as a counterpoise in times past, but has been overbalanced in modern times by the Western rationalism that gave us our celebrated technologic revolution. Recent emphasis
on the "right brain" has started the balance tipping back, but the Taoist wisdom has been quietly waiting for the turn.

The masculine is the assertive, the light-giving, and the creative. The feminine is the receptive, the dark-sheltering, and the nurturing. The Yang, as a moving-outward principle holds within its meaning the return, or moving-inward principle of the yin. The upward thrusting of the yang is met by the yielding of the yin, which re-gathers the fountain into the pool.

Singer watched the T'ai chi Master Al Chung-liang Huang exemplify the androgynous flow of yin into yang into yin into yang and on in the movements of the T'ai chi. Her description both summarizes the androgynous union of the masculine and feminine and introduces the creative dynamic of the yin-yang energy flow:

The teaching was in the man, in his dance, in his every movement, in his calligraphy, in his face, and in his life. The life as graceful, undulating, rhythmic motion, appeared to be a dance that had neither beginning nor end.

Chung-liang is neither old nor young. His very being expresses the meaning of movement and change without pause or cessation. He gives expression to the principle of life itself, that is, to the breath of life, the ch'i that flows through life and enables life to flow. When Chung-liang
dances, the circular process of life is made manifest. Each movement in T'ai chi flows into the next, which is its opposite ... The energy never stops, never pauses, never appears to be blocked. The circulation of the light, a goal sought in Chinese philosophy, takes place before my eyes. It takes place in the body of this man, the body that seems to float in air one moment and to be fully grounded the next. He presents a curious combination of lightness and weight, of the strength of a great tree and the yielding fluidity of a forest stream. Although in continuous movement, the body is always in balance; the balance is always asymmetrical, so that at any moment the design formed by the body is in the process of turning into its opposite (Singer, 1976:212-213).

Other observers and his own words (Watts, 1975:vii-xiii) portray Chung-liang as a wholly masculine man with a heart-warming sense of fun. He is precisely accurate, imaginative, rigorous in scholarship, and endlessly inventive. A theme that appears where ever he appears is releasing control over process and letting the flow happen.
This openness to the influence of context is empirically observable in women subjects according to McClelland's review of the experimental psychology literature (1975), and it is associated with the feminine in the yin. Thus, being mindful of it would be a special challenge to a male person like Al Chung-liang. It is characteristic of the Taoist perception of reality, generally, and is now being affirmed by Bohm and Pribram in their joint perception of the holographic brain experiencing a universe that is a holomovement (see chapter 1). The energy flow tends to provide more complexity and more meaning when it is not blocked. The most important blocking to avoid is that between the masculine and feminine elements of experience, in the Taoist view. In this way of thinking, it must be remembered that all that is not masculine is feminine, and all that is not feminine is masculine, so the energy alternation is in all times and in all places.

Elsewhere, Singer has put it this way:

... The divine paradox is this -- becoming complete, becoming whole as individuals, means that our completion is not limited to the bag of skin in which we live. Rather, it makes us open and porous, utterly permeable to the universal source of strength outside ourselves. This source is not really "outside" although it may be in the beginning be so experienced. It is the greater
Self, of which our own experiential self is a part, a participant, and integral part of the ultimate order. The human psyche is the microcosm which reflects in ways both known and unknown to us, the macrocosm that Jung has termed the Self (Singer, 1972: 268-269).

The human microcosm, according to the androgynous view of Lao-tzu as expressed in the yin-yang symbol is constantly experiencing the arising of the contrary principle in the fullness of the principle now being experienced. Jung saw this potential, although in his practice he often saw it blocked, in the anima in the man and the animus in the woman. In commenting on The Secret of the Golden Flower, a Tibetan Buddhist meditation guide, he illustrated the trans-cultural archetypal nature of the contra-sexual principles.

2. The androgyny principle in Jungian psychology

Everything changes all the time, but some things change in ways that never seem to differ. Archetypes are just that sort of phenomenon. Sanford, a Jungian psychoanalyst, in describing archetypes likens them to bodily organs in that they are present in all human beings (see quote, p. ). Just as everyone has a liver, although no two are exactly alike, everyone has either an anima or an animus and everyone is a little different. Everyone's liver
has the same general function in the body, and everyone's contra-sexual principle has the same general function in the psyche.

The archetypes are observable regularities in persons, but one of the ways that they function is in the ongoing change process called individuation. Individuation goes through predictable phases (Jung, 1964; von Franz, 1964) in which the shadow archetype is dealt with first, and then the anima or animus, and other archetypes later. This section of the chapter will have two sub-sections, C.2.a. on archetypal expression and the collective unconscious, and C.4.a. on the individuation process as development toward androgynous functioning.

a. Archetypal expression and the collective unconscious: What little I have had to say about the archetype of the persona, or mask, has been connected to disidentification or transcending the demands of our self-centeredness. Actually, it deserves much fuller treatment, but it lies apart from the main emphasis of this study on the masculine-feminine axis in the psyche. Each of the Jungian therapists has called attention to the persona as the ego's first line of defense against the messages of the unconscious. Through its action, the person has the unexamined notion, through projection, that what is actually the work of his or her own unconscious, is taking place "out there", in some way. Becoming conscious of the persona is the process of withdrawing those projections and the outcome is recognizing them as the products of one's own unconscious.
As I have mentioned (pp. 6, 445) everyone has the same general archetypes. The fact that their presence has been found to transcend all the wild variety of different life experiences that people have led Jung to postulate the collective unconscious. It is natural to assume that such phenomena being alike is the result of some unconscious communication, and now that we have the concepts of the brain functioning described by Pribram (1971) and the implicated and explicative orders of the universe proposed by Bohm (1977) to work with, it does not seem entirely implausible, as I have shown in chapter 1. Jung apparently encountered many people who wanted to use his concept of the collective unconscious for that kind of a leap of belief. In the times when he wrote, however, it was a leap from a precipice of established thought. To be associated with it was to imperil one's professional reputation and Jung was not willing to do so until very late in his life (Jung, 1960).

Jung is pressed by his own material to deal with metaphysical true-or-false-questions when he writes of the Book of the Dead (Jung, 1958) and The Secret of the Golden Flower (Jung, 1931), because the Eastern mind deals in both cases with work with the "persona" as lying beyond ordinary experience. There was no necessary conflict for the authors of either of the Eastern spiritual guides to see growing beyond ego-centeredness as both a practical psychological problem and a transcendent spiritual one. Their metaphysics was unitary in a way that Jung's professional stance would not permit him to allow himself.
He has to draw himself up to his full height as a Western scientist and declare:

. . . It certainly is not within the competence of the psychologist to establish the metaphysical truth or falsity of this idea; he must be content to determine wherever possible what has psychic effect. . . . Without a doubt, ["favorable as well as unfavorable gods"] . . . are psychic contents which can be experienced, and which have an indisputable autonomy (Jung, 1931:109).

Later in his life, with the publication of *Synchronicity: An Acausal Connecting Principle* (1952), Jung began to allow his scientific reputation to be associated with some of the parapsychological phenomena he had experienced personally all his life. In 1963, in *Memories, Dreams, Reflections*, he tells of seeing two apparently un-caused events as a young man. In one he saw a sturdy oak table split right across; in the other a serviceable steel knife fractured.

Here we see Jung dealing with his own "persona", and I include it because women also need to deal with theirs in the individuation process. I shall have more to say about individuation in the chapter on educational implications, but a further example specifically from Jung himself will help to give a foundation for what I will have to say. One of the techniques of psychoanalytic practice is to look
for the action of the persona, or mask archetype, when we have strong emotional reactions which have no reasonable motivation. Note that in the quote just given on page, Jung uses rather extreme language: "It certainly is not . . .", and "Without a doubt . . ." (Jung, 1931:109). The subject appears to be what we might call a "hot button" for him.

Continuing this train of thought, I note that Jung's first words in the Foreword of Synchronicity: are: "In writing this paper I have, so to speak, made good a promise which for many years I lacked the courage to fulfill . . ." (Jung, 1952:3). He goes on to list a number of points of professional pride that have kept him from writing on a subject that he has been alluding to for at least twenty years. Thus he confirms that something has been keeping him from doing what he believed he should, but that now he is going to act on the intimations he has had. A classic problem, and how refreshing to find the old master himself still working with his archetypal expressions into his eighties!

Jung was increasingly androgynous during his lifetime, and the foregoing bit of editorial observation also reveals an example of his androgynous functioning. His commitment to his own individuation allowed, and even insisted, that he take account of his feminine intuitions. He began his professional life as a throughgoing medical scientist, using the masculine quality of his intellect to the utmost in establishing his reputation and his position in the academic
circles of his time and place. As he continued to develop along the lines of self-investigation he described in *Memories, Dreams, Reflections*, he affirmed the positive work of his own anima and honored his intuitions and paranormal experiences more. Now, after his death, the "science" that he originally trusted has begun to confirm the prophesies of his inner woman.

b. The individuation process as androgynous development:
The previous section demonstrates the difficulty of dealing with the archetypes separately from the process of individuation. Archetypes have independent existence and we discover them through their action. Jung was frequently challenged by his peers on the point of his personifying archetypes. He asserts that it is appropriate to personify the anima and animus, for example, because they act autonomously. He says "I must declare once and for all that the personification is not an invention of mine, but is inherent in the nature of the phenomena" (Jung, 1931:119). Again: "It is not we who personify them; they have a personal nature from the very beginning" (Jung, 1931:192), as I had occasion to quote him earlier in connection with transformative power emotional experience.

Our dealings with the expressions of our archetypes are the ways we conduct our own individuation process. Two examples, one from a man's experience with his feminine anima, and one from a woman's experience with her masculine animus can show how we may deal with archetypal figures in individuation and move toward androgyny. Both
of these examples are taken from von Franz' chapter on individuation in the sections on the anima and animus (1964:186-207).

The man, who was a psychotherapist, incubated a dream by thinking, before he went to bed, that he felt lonely having to stand in life without the maternal support of a meaningful church affiliation. In his dream he was in an old church filled with people who were expecting him to lead them in worship. He had a Mass book, which did not resemble one in the least, but his mother and wife were beside him chattering and he could not find the place. An old nun, to whom he turned, told him the number and led him to the altar, where she led part of the liturgy before it was his turn. At the last minute he was able to read the numbers and began to read at the right spot in the Mass.

In the process of analyzing his dream he came to realize that his unconscious was telling him that he must become a priest in his own church. The nun was his anima, leading him to his own right functioning in which he could begin to see that his work had a sacred quality. His mother and his wife stood for the forces distracting him from his true work (dependency and extraversion). Often the anima and animus are represented by an unfamiliar female or male figure, whereas familiar same-sex figures represent aspects of one's persona or characteristics of the ego that are shared with the person shown. In this case, the man took the dream perfectly seriously, and kept
checking its insights with his life as he put them to work. Through it he was led to a closer touch with his feelings of dependency, and was able to use the guidance of his anima to affirm the importance of his work and the value of his feelings in doing it. In this way, the psychotherapist moved toward a more androgynous functioning, using in his daily life both his masculine intellect, and his feminine feelings.

The woman of whom von Franz writes was, like the man just described, about 45 years of age. She was struggling with issues of meaninglessness in her life, and had the following dream. Two hooded figures come over the balcony into her house seemingly to torment her and her sister. They drag her sister out from under the bed, where she had hidden, and torment her. The woman is pushed against the wall where one of the men makes magical gestures before her, and the other makes a drawing on the wall. When she admires the drawing, her tormentor throws back his hood to reveal the "noble head of an artist, and he says proudly, 'Yes, indeed! and begins to clean his spectacles" (von Franz, 1964:203).

Here, the woman's animus is more than one figure, as "he" often is, and can be recognized as animus because he is unknown to her in waking life. The woman's sister, who had in outer life died young, had artistic talent, as did the woman herself. The parallel went even further, because the woman's sister had made very little use of her talent and neither had the woman. The dream seemed to
say that if she recognized the talent, the negative and menacing forces would turn benign. Much time and pains would be needed for her to act on her dream, but if she does, the possibility is definitely there for using her talent to give her life the meaning she sought.

What is needed, in this case, for her to take the dream and its meaning seriously, is planning and organizing herself. This would involve her actualizing her masculine characteristics, and would move her toward a more androgynous functioning. She cannot gain the meaningfulness she seeks unless she replaces some of her feminine passivity with a more proactive style. The dream even shows her how, with a precision that I have come to expect from dreams. She starts by appreciating, and by doing something, even though she is afraid. Note that the dream is not literally true, but is very exact about the kind of action needed.

The dialogue with the unconscious was aided by dreams in each of these cases, but there a most generous range of other ways of opening the dialogue. Free association, drawing, creative motion, writing, and guided meditation are the most obvious ones that come to mind.

Finally, before ending this section on increases in androgyny that come about in the individuation process, I would like to make one last, emphatic, androgynous note. The movement toward androgyny is equally open to, and equally needed by, men and women. Individuation is for people, and some measure of androgyny is available
to all. The word androgyny itself is half male ("andros") and half female ("gynos"). We are whole beings, and our physiological androgyny presses to be echoed in our psychology. Both men and women are capable of androgynous functioning, but this study has to do with women and the three kinds of power I have been discussing.

3. The feminine androgyne:

In this brief section of the dissertation I have the opportunity to describe the person-in-process who is the feminine androgyne. She is the crown jewel of the study, the person who experiences all three kinds of power moving through her with ever less and less ego-identification with them as "hers". She is also the envisioned outcome of the educational experience and processes I will be suggesting in the next chapter, which are based on the power theory I have been discussing. I am also aware as I begin to write that I am deeply involved with this person, because she is the woman I envision myself becoming. Becoming her is a transformative process, though, so I know from experience that my vision of how it will be to be more androgynous is partial. But it will do for now, and it draws me on.

von Franz' analysis (1964:204-205) of the stages of the animus leads us into the aspects of androgyny in a way that oddly complements the artificial division of the person into physical, emotional, intellectual, and spiritual suggested by Vaughan (1979a) (and incorporated into the means section of the transformative power chapter).
The stages von Franz finds are identified as animus projections in her essay. The woman, she finds, first projects her animus onto a "wholly physical man" (1964:205) (a Tarzan type), and next onto a romantic man like Shelley, the poet, or a man of action like Ernest Hemingway. Shelley is easier to identify with the emotional component of experience, but Hemingway is not impossible. The next more developed animus projection is onto a man of the "word", and she proposes Lloyd George, the orator. I think a typical college crush on a professor is a natural example of this kind of projection. The last male figure likely to receive a woman's animus projection, in the woman's higher development is a spiritual leader like Gandhi. It is not clear in the context whether von Franz means to imply that a woman who does not withdraw any of these projections may unknowingly move through them in chronological order as she adds years to her life. Perhaps if the woman never sees her crushes as demands of her unconscious, they will continue to control her. If that is a fair interpretation of her meaning, then the adoration some middle-aged ladies have for their ministers may be confirming evidence. The adoration of young teen-aged ladies for football heroes is an example, too, confirming this theory.

The theory is of interest in presenting the idea of the feminine androgyne because a woman whose life experience becomes conscious may withdraw each of these projections and become them
herself, in addition to living her feminine principle to the fullest. A teen can become a hockey star herself without giving up her womanly receptivity to the intrepid courage of her favorite football hero. I am inclined to see Jacqueline Bouvier's work as a photographer and journalist as a projection withdrawn from her romantic father and acted out in her own life. She does not seem to have sacrificed her special brand of mystical womanliness in the process of becoming a competent newswoman. Rather, I would say that she enhanced it, and used it as an ingredient in her competence.

The oft-cited Matina Horner, president of the Radcliffe segment of Harvard-Radcliffe, has functioned in a statesmanlike manner through the difficult period of Radcliffe's achieving full citizenship in Harvard, meanwhile continuing to publish in her field. Her articles on the fear of success in women have had an influence in her field that might be correctly be called seminal. What is less well known is that Mrs. Horner is sharing with her husband the raising of their three children in a natural and warm-hearted manner, alongside of her contribution at Radcliffe. Similarly, Rosabeth Moss Kanter, whose intellectual contribution has been so useful in this dissertation, is another woman of the "word" whose motherliness is evidenced in a joyful little boy named Jonathan. He was pictured on the cover of the *Radcliffe News* (June, 1980), playing with his father, also a sociologist, while his mother made her speech on dual career families. Both of these women have lived with their feminine principle in ways
that our American society expects, in addition to experiencing the inner clarification provided by their animus principle.

Mother Theresa, head of the Missionaries of Charity, and Nobel Prize winner, has lived out her feminine principle in quite a different way from Horner and Kanter. It is her living out of the conscious application of her spiritual-level animus principle that has drawn thousands of others to serve "the poorest of the poor" (Time, 1979:87) as she does. Since she was touched by a "divine command" (loc.cit.) in 1946 she has felt responsible to share the love of God with those whom no one else cares for. Beginning in the slums of Calcutta, India as soon as she had permission from her order, she cared for people bodily. However, it seems to be the spiritual quality of "practical mysticism" (Woodward, 1979:60) that is at the core of the world-wide order that has grown up around her. She is quoted as saying, "For me, each one is an individual. I can give my whole heart to that person for that moment in an exchange of love". The selfless rigor of the order is testimony to the leadership toward ego-transcendence Mother Theresa has given in her devotion to the God she represents. Her service and her irrepressible smile are testimony to her warmth, and womanly nurture. She is quite explicit about her satisfaction with her womanly role, having little patience with women who want to be ordained priests. She said, "Nobody could be a better priest than the Virgin Mary. She remained only the handmaiden of the Lord, which is much better" (Woodward, loc. cit.). Another comment of hers that reveals her feminine principle is, "The biggest disease
today is not leprosy or tuberculosis, but rather the feeling of being unwanted, uncared for, and deserted by everybody" (Woodward, loc.cit.). The fruitful relationship between her orderly masculine principle and the relationship-orientation of her feminine principle shows in the strength of the international network of care centers. An abundance of energy is available to her and those who follow her example. She is thoroughly androgynous, and the interaction seems to be spiritual as well as material.

Writing about the alchemical understanding proposed by Jung and elaborated by her own scholarship, Singer has this to say about the woman becoming more androgynous:

... The alchemical model allows, even encourages, her to accept the opposite element within herself, realizing the natural androgyny of the human psyche. As a woman striving to succeed in the world, yet torturing herself because she feels obliged to perform all the traditional feminine rituals whether she wants to or not, she fears that she must end up a psychological hermaphrodite -- a hideous anomaly who hides first one aspect of her nature from view, and then the other. But if she can somehow come to the point of transformation, if she
can accept that both parts of her nature are legitimate, then it becomes unnecessary to display either her "masculinity" or her "femininity". She can simply be who she is, a person in whom opposite tendencies can exist not as enemies but as lovers, with one aspect fertilizing the other and the other bearing the fruit of the union into real existence.

In both cases, man and woman are moving from an ambivalent state, akin to the hermaphroditic image, toward the state of dynamic energy exchange that androgyny implies . . . (Singer, 1976:148, emphasis hers).

Given the emerging model of the universe as powered by energy alternations, it is not surprising, after all, that the exchange of energy between the masculine and the feminine principles in androgynous living yields power. Singer summarizes: "Androgyny is the outcome of a dynamism based on the application of energy in an organic system that is open-ended and that interfaces with an open-ended universe . . . (Singer, 1976:276). And at the end of the book, again using the metaphor of alchemy, she challenges:

. . . The real flask is the physical body, and the real mixture that is held in that vessel is the "subtle body" -- which is formed by distillation and refinement, by separation and fusion,
of all that a person has ever been and all that the person is. The fire that effects the transformation is the passion that a human being brings to life when there is an embrace between the inner-Masculine and the inner-Feminine. Of this union is born the willingness to transmute experience into meaning, relationship into love, and egotism into the worship of the Spirit embodies in matter.

There is no easy way. There is no book of instructions. Though many "panaceas" are offered, no one can produce the true elixir for anyone else. There is no need to seek it out in the Cosmic Drugstore, because Androgyny is not for sale.

D. SUMMARY: THE FEMININE ANDROGYNE AND THE THREE KINDS OF POWER AS EXPRESSIONS OF UNIVERSAL ENERGY

A woman who is engaging in the individuation process, whether she knows it by that name or not, has a direct relationship to each kind of power. This relationship arises in her unconscious and is modified and expressed by conscious and unconscious action. The relationship between the woman and the power she experiences is based equally on the nature of the power and the nature of the woman.
Communicative power arises in action oriented toward forming consensus by a process of tuning to all those involved at many levels of their being. The feminine principle, as experienced consciously and unconsciously by the individuating woman as her own dominant principle is a capacity for relationship. Thus, a woman has direct access to communicative power by the nature of her being.

Instrumental power arises in action oriented toward achieving pre-specified goals by a process of analytical and theory-building investigation of objective reality. The masculine principle, or animus, is experienced by the woman unconsciously at first, but with increasing consciousness as it guides her. Through the effects of her animus, a woman gains in initiative and objectivity. Thus, a woman has direct access to instrumental power by the effect of her own masculine principle.

Transformative power arises in action oriented toward transcending our limited views and moving toward our full potential, by a process combining insight, volition, and envisioning. The androgyny principle is experienced by the individuating woman as the fruitful interplay between her feminine and masculine principles. Clarifying insight is followed by nurturing volition and energizing envisioning. Thus, a woman has direct access to transformative power through the alternating and flowing energy of her own physiological and psychological androgyny principle.
The inner alternation is continuous with and resonant with
the energy alternations that form the innumerable macrocosms within
a woman and the marccosm including her. The energy and power that
is specialized in each kind of power, communicative, instrumental, and
transformative, is generalized in the broader flux of energy. Every
woman is an energy configuration in that broader flux capable of
experiencing each kind of power by the nature of her being.
CHAPTER VII
ANDROGYNOUS EDUCATION FOR WOMEN IN
COMPLEX ORGANIZATIONS

A. CORPORATE SETTINGS FOR ANDROGYNOUS EDUCATION

Theories are fine, but the matter comes down in the end to whether a case can be made for changes in the way the education of women is being done in today's hierarchical organizations. There may be cosmic significance to the ideas I have been building together here, but can a modern corporation afford to implement them? First, I will be setting forth some propositions about the broad and immediate contexts I have in mind and the relation to them of women as seen by Jungian psychology. Next I will show how the argument thus far in the study tends to support some propositions about how the development of women might be conducted in complex organizations to take into account women's experience of three kinds of power. Finally, however, I expect to show in a general way why a corporation can scarcely afford not to implement a shift toward this theoretical framework in its women's development practice.
In describing the relevance of the "women and power" theory to the development of women in complex organizations, I will discuss parallel propositions for transformative, communicative, and instrumental power. The sub-section for each kind of power will have propositions from the standpoints of: (a) developing women, (b) facilitator(s), and (c) a school of organizational behavior that seems to show an affinity for that kind of power. The last section of the chapter will draw together how shifting to androgynous education for women in the corporate setting might yield gains (1) in the cost-effectiveness of the development operation, (2) in morale, and (3) in productivity. Each sub-section throughout this chapter begins with a proposition and continues with one or more paragraphs explaining or supporting it. The propositions are given consecutively in the Table of Contents.

1. Contemporary organizational settings profit from and promote women's development toward more androgynous behavior:

First, the various words I have been using to describe the organizations need to be woven into a coherent description of the kinds of human groupings I will be referring to. I mean to use "complex organization" and "hierarchical organization" and "corporation" interchangeably to indicate a public or private sector organization that has multiple levels of managerial responsibility. Occasionally I will need to specify which of the many kinds of such organizations I mean, but for the most part I expect to be making propositions that will be suitable for the whole range of these settings.
Such organizations employ more and more women as the work force approaches being half women and half men. The majority of women are still employed at the lower levels of these hierarchies, but federal legislation and corporate guidelines are putting pressure on managers to develop women in ways that will fit them to fill positions higher up in organizations. As Ferguson (1980) has observed, the top spots in organizations are still typically filled by men . . . and so are the second spots! Women who are becoming more androgynous, whether by responding to the demands of their supervisory and managerial roles or in response to overt development efforts, bring a special mix of capabilities to their roles. On the one hand, their feminine awareness of interpersonal cues and interest in relationships supports their performance in their numerous interactions up and down their organizations. On the other hand, the animus-guided clarity and inspiration that they may grow more capable of providing can be a great asset to gaining their organizations' objectives. The analyses of women's use of communicative and instrumental power on pp. 329 ff., and pp. 404 ff, respectively, tends to support this part of the proposition.

Similar support is available for the claim that the complex organization could support women's development toward more androgynous functioning. Even within the constraints of the classic secretarial role outlined so compellingly by Kanter (1977: Part II; Roles and Images, Chapter 4: Secretaries), there are challenges that often do
promote a woman's urge to become more initiatory and organized.
Shari Crane (Crane and Drotning, 1977) has spelled out how a
woman can respond to potential aspects of even very circumscribed
roles in a complex organization and make them actual by sharper
functioning. I have discussed earlier (pp.425-427) how the ob-
jective focus of instrumental power can promote transformative
process toward androgynous functioning and fuller use of potential.

Everywhere from the popular press to the personal humor
of men and women in corporations there is evidence that less has
been gained from the contributions of women to organizations than
might be. Men are threatened by the insidious force of the women's
movement working in the minds of the women they supervise. They are
even more threatened by being supervised by a woman. Women are
angry at the well-nigh endless manifestations of the masculine
mystique in their bosses, who do not recognize the potentials that
the women are beginning to affirm in themselves. They feel even
worse when they see themselves as supervisors doing the very things
that men have always accused women of doing "just because they are
women".

I believe that the problems as they appear in corporate
life are surface signs of an underlying reality which the changes in
technology are now projecting into significance in a new way, as I
suggested in the opening pages of this study (pp.1-3). Now that
women are being freed by household technology to work in complex
organizations, they are bringing with them into a new life setting the many forms of their feminine heredity and their environmental conditioning. They have power to use. Policy-level decisions and development efforts that will implement those decisions can be based on a more profound understanding of the distinctive blend women are bringing to the corporate situation. With such decisions and implementation it is more likely that corporations can capitalize on women's potential contribution. Women's power has a specialized fit to the needs of complex organizations, and development designs can help to bring it about.

2. The educational implications to be drawn in this chapter are directed at policy-making with regard to the training and development of women in complex organizations and are not intended as a curriculum guide.

Decisions about policy in complex organizations are generally perceived to come down from the top levels of the organizations' hierarchies. Exceptions exist, and they are the order of operations in companies with fully participative management styles. Even in such organizations, policies are typically set at the level at which responsibility for their implementation rests. Thus, a policy about the development of women employees that applied across the whole organization would have to be made at a relatively high level. This set of propositions is accordingly directed at management with the status level of vice-presidents.
Briefly, the distinction between training and development I am making is that training is for skill learning other than subtle interpersonal skills. Telephone training for instance, is interpersonal, but it is repetitious and rule-guided. Development is oriented toward changes in capability that involve more aspects of the person's potential. Management development involves learning the coordination of sub-skills, such as interviewing techniques, with the application of policy to a variety of human situations. There are many degrees of both training and development on this dimension, though, so the margin between them is hard to find at times. Telephone training may include a self-image component, and management development is bound to have some report-filling included.

The propositions included in the process and content section of this chapter (section B) are preliminary to the formulation of what would actually be learned. Rather they have to do with attitudes toward the development processes envisioned and toward the kinds of content that might be selected to be included. Although a corporation is not a school in the narrowest sense, it creates a press for certain learnings that may be much stronger than most schools. Many corporations have overt curriculum guides for their skill training programs and varying degrees of covert curricula woven into all their activities. A curriculum guide that would cover most of the overt and covert content needed to implement the following propositions could be made, but I will not be offering it here.
3. The implications to be drawn form a network relating the four aspects of the woman (physical, emotional, mental and spiritual) and the three kinds of power (transformative, communicative, and instrumental) within multiple aspects of a corporate setting.

Language is sufficiently linear that describing a network with it poses problems. Even a three-way grid can be a challenge. In order to do justice to the holistic view of women I have espoused here, and to the other dimensions of interest, I shall need to create propositions networking together many variables. The intricacy of the task is responsive to the lavish complexity of the real-life situation it describes. What I cannot fully state in precise terms, I shall hope to imply by connotation.

The aspects of the corporate setting are what I have had least to say about thus far in the discussion, since I have wanted to gather that exploration into this chapter. Kanter has explained the convolutions of one corporate giant's organization chart, passing on the company joke that the chart was printed on adding machine tape and was two inches wide and three feet long (Kanter, 1977:30). That organization has a modified matrix structure in which managers report to one superior for their function and another for their cost center. Other simpler organizations like Ohio Medical Indemnity Mutual (Blue Shield) have a straightforward hierarchy, but it is five layers deep in some parts of the corporation and seven in others. Even in the shallowest parts, interlocking workflow relationships
and differing power skills among incumbents who are technically peers makes the exercise of instrumental power nearly hopeless without using considerable communicative power.

The triple hierarchies of hospital organizations (staff, nursing, and medical) are notoriously difficult to negotiate. Kanter's analysis of power building through activities and alliances (1977:176-186), which I have discussed in the chapter on instrumental power in the means section (pp. 368 ff.), also sheds light on the organizational aspects. The writers cited in the methods subsection of the communicative power chapter on organization behavior have illuminated other variables that describe the situations that really set the parameters of life for women in organizations (pp. 303 ff). They exist for men as well, of course, but they are experienced in subtly different ways according to the Jungian view.

The important point for this step in the discussion is that organizations' structures interact with the aspects of women's natures and with the kinds of power they experience within the universal power flux. I intend to propose a network of considerations relating to educating women in this large context in androgynous ways. I shall be proposing what seem to me to be the most significant of these in the middle section of this chapter.

4. The implications also refer to the transpersonal power flux within which both the women and the organization are relatively long-standing configurations of energy.
Writers who have explored fully the dynamics of organizational systems have generally ignored the parapsychological aspects of personal power, for the reason that it seems more useful to explore inside one discipline than to investigate the places where edges meet. Since this study has dealt with the latter choice, some unusual opportunities arise. Transformative power has its source in the relationship of the individual to the numerous systems of energy which come together to form a human, and of which humans are a part.

In the Jungian view of women's psychology as I have related it to the experience of transformative power (pp. 329 ff.) some special capabilities not usually sought by corporations have emerged. I believe that women can become aware of these capabilities in much the same ways that George Leonard and his Aikido teacher helped their workshop participants to become aware of theirs (as I described on pp. 87). Some corporations have begun to give their top executives opportunities to work with these dimensions at the Aspen Institute and the Menninger Foundation Institutes. I will be proposing that more such opportunities be made available.

5. The experiences available to a woman in contemporary corporate life afford her an excellent challenge for individuation as described in Jungian psychology.

Corporate life calls for communicative power from a woman which is her natural forte, as I have summarized at the end of
chapter six (pp.460-462 and Chapter 4, pp. 329 ff.). However, functioning effectively in a corporate setting also calls for a careful and flexible use of instrumental power, and this, in the Jungian view, a woman can only do well if she allows and responds to the promptings of her animus. Similarly, a woman must move toward androgynous functioning if she is to experience her transformative power potential, and corporations which begin to use a woman's capabilities more fully by increasing her responsibilities call for transformation.

Individuation is a personal process in which a woman may gradually integrate more of her unconscious life into conscious functioning. As a woman is called up to withdraw her projections onto others and become more "realistic" about herself and others in doing her job, she has an opportunity to do so consciously and intentionally. This provides her with an opportunity to move ahead in her individuation which a less rigorous setting might not offer.

A contemporary corporation actually creates a greater press for individuation for a woman than the housewifely role did, for all the complexities of that role. It often calls for defense of judgments based on quantitative measuring and controlling, as well as offering a woman a chance to get perspective on her usual way of looking at life.
B. PROPOSITIONS ABOUT THE PROCESS AND CONTENT OF
EDUCATION FOR ANDROGYNY FOR WOMEN IN COMPLEX ORGANIZATIONS

A few of the cultural offspring of the great liberals of our educational past like John Dewey, Maria Montessori, and Ross Mooney have quietly slipped past the guards at the gates of corporations and begun to work in the training departments. The Aquarian Conspiracy celebrated by Marilyn Ferguson (1980) is pervasive and profitable in business as well as other fields. Much of what she had to say in contrasting the old educational paradigm with the new learning paradigm (1980:289-291) might be said of education in complex organizations. The contrasts are still there. Not only are they there, but the emphasis and prevailing practice is still heavily on the side of the old way. Some items from her table of contrasts will help to set the tone for what I will be proposing by way of changes:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assumptions of the Old Paradigm of Education</th>
<th>Assumptions of the New Paradigm of Learning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on content, acquiring a body of &quot;right&quot; information, once and for all.</td>
<td>Emphasis on learning how to learn, how to ask good questions, pay attention to the right things, be open to and evaluate new concepts, have access to information . . . Importance of context.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning as a product, a destination.</td>
<td>Learning as a process, a journey.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relatively rigid structure, prescribed curriculum . . .</td>
<td>Relatively flexible structure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Priority on performance.</td>
<td>Belief that there are many ways to teach a given subject . . .</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Priority on self-image as the generator of performance.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Emphasis on external world. Inner experience often considered inappropriate in school setting.

Guessing and divergent thinking discouraged.

Emphasis on analytical, linear, left-brain thinking . . .

Increasing reliance on technology (audiovisual equipment, computers, tapes, texts), dehumanization.

Teacher imparts knowledge; one way street.

Education seen as a social necessity for a certain period of time, to inculcate minimum skills and train for a specific role.

Inner experience seen as context for learning. Use of imagery, storytelling, dream journals, "centering" exercises, and exploration of feelings encouraged.

Guessing and divergent thinking encouraged as part of the creative process.

Strives for whole-brain education. Augments left-brain rationality with holistic, nonlinear, and intuitive strategies. Confluence and fusion of the two processes emphasized . . .

Appropriate technology, human relationships between teachers and learners of primary importance.

Teacher is learner, too, learning from students.

Education seen as lifelong process, one only tangentially related to schools

(Ferguson, 1980:289-291).

Most business and industry, government organizations, and academe have embodies in their training and development programs the same linear and technical approaches that they have used in building equipment and processing forms. In doing so they have missed the recurring opportunity to take advantage of improvements that they might have used to gain the very ends they sought. The feminine context-oriented and relational approaches, although they have been disvalued, have a potential usefulness that is beginning to come into
its own. (Gordon, 1961; Prince, 1972). "Training Departments" newly relabeled "Human Resource Development Departments" are introducing "stress management" and "creative problem-solving" modules. The propositions that follow are offered to show how this new trend can be strengthened.

1. Development beginning in the area of transformative power is centered in the autonomy of the woman and is best supported by the fullest transformative process of the facilitator.

Transformative power acts within the individual, restructuring a person's view of reality in much the way the paradigm shift I described in chapter one is restructuring the prevailing scientific view of reality. As I have shown (pp. 72-123), a shift in the way some segment of reality - no matter how small - is seen, releases transformative power in physical, emotional, mental, and spiritual experience. That reality begins within, however numerous or compelling outer stimuli may be.

Thus, the focus of transformative process must be within, and education from outside the person must go through the same sort of subtle but radical shift that is possible for the individual. I would characterize the shift as one from making happen to letting (or helping) happen. The facilitator of transformative process must be experiencing transformative power in his or her own being as a minimal prerequisite to supporting others who are also doing it.
Transformative process takes place within or not at all. Educational technology cannot compensate for the absence of the experience of transformation in the facilitator. In the sub-section on facilitation I will have more to say about how the interaction between the facilitator(s)' experience of transformative power and that of the woman engaging in it interact. Here, again, I am faced with the conflict between the need to talk about both simultaneously and the limitations of language. I invite you, the reader, to supply in your mind's eye and in your feeling how the complementary person's experience would fit. The relationship to the corporate setting I will expect to supply at each step.

Much of what I shall have to say about women's experience applies to the experience of a man in the same situation, except that the masculine principle is his gender-related principle, and the anima or feminine principle is the one working to make the connections between his conscious and unconscious. Emphases must be different at many points, but the differences are of such a nature that they call for educational experiences to be designed in which women and men experience transformative process most often together, although women's training groups may provide a needed corrective at times.

a. Educational experiences of transformative power by women in corporate settings: The complex organization has a compelling need to indoctrinate the entering woman with the forms and
regulations by which interactions within it are believed to be technically and financially feasible. Right from the start, the woman whose socialization has prepared her to be cooperative voluntarily adopts the view that such things are important as part of her additional socialization to her new setting. The situation immediately begins to build into the generic problem I have identified at the beginning of the chapter on instrumental power. The bureaucratic routines that provide technical control are indeed useful, but they are not the whole world of the corporation. Actually, there may often be some recognition that this is so, but the placement near the end of the orientation process and the small time and energy devoted to interaction and human meaning in orientation procedures tends to confirm the impression that technical control is nearly the whole corporate world. What then happens is that a woman forces herself into the new mold and either goes underground with her human needs meeting them in long coffee breaks and similar escapes, or overcompensates with harsh rule enforcement. The loss of energy for corporate goals is great. A change is possible and can be productive, whatever balance among profit, service, and other goals the organization has. The following propositions may help to make the shift imaginable.

1. A woman's developmental experience must be conceived holistically.

"Holistic" as I have used it in this dissertation has referred to the artificial division into the four major clusters of experience,
physical, emotional, mental, and spiritual that I introduced from Vaughan's Awakening Intuition (1979a) on p. . As I have discussed earlier (pp. 84, 132, 174, 197 ), these clusters interpenetrate in daily life. In the same manner in which they blend into one another in daily life they will inescapably blend in educational experience. A woman learning corporate budgeting methods is also sitting on a chair, learning (in all likelihood) from a man with whom she has a certain emotional dialogue as a counterpoint. Her spiritual connotations about the situation and indeed the other aspects, too, may be in her unconscious experience either by her choice or without her intention. They are still a part of her experience, however.

It may or may not be productive for her to raise any or all of the other aspects of the experience to consciousness, but to deny their validity or importance is to deny herself. Standard ways of dealing with the emotional, physical, and spiritual now common are ice-breakers at the beginning of training, "coffee" breaks every two hours, and discrete silence about spiritual matters. The stress is on the cognitive content, and women superficially meet expectations.

Stress does result from cooperation that does not transact within with all the aspects of a woman's being, and a woman's inner shift to the reality of her wholeness can keep that stress from being experienced as strain. The facilitator can also conceive the woman's experience holistically and can initiate experiences which will allow
the woman to operate out of all aspects of her being. The freeing effect of the fuller experience can be felt in the cognitive arena and will make it more fruitful. For example, a woman may relate budget practices to the real human situation in the departments she will be in touch with as she goes along. Her perception of the process is fuller and more productive for the whole organization if she has developed a relationship of professional trust with the person presenting the budget practices, as well. If she has an understanding of the interaction between her own feminine and masculine principles, and of his (if it is a man presenting them), she can use each interaction to further her individuation and become more trustworthy as well as trusting (see p. 334), where I have discussed the Jungian model of this interaction). A development module in corporate training might present this model in a male-female experiential workshop.

2. A woman should have experiences which will allow her to develop perspective on her states of consciousness. Our normal state of consciousness is the one in which we usually spend our waking hours. Sleep is an altered state of consciousness in which a person "clearly feels a qualitative shift in his pattern of mental functioning" (Tart, 1969:1, emphasis his). All sorts of transformative process involve some shift in a person's state of consciousness, but usually the shift is much subtler than that which is experienced in moving from sleep to wakening. Vaughan and Walsh (1980a, 1980b and Vaughan, 1977, 1979a, 1979b) have shown how the constricted state of
consciousness that we have been socialized to know as "normal" can be layered off to allow a new perspective on reality. They experience it in psychotherapy and transpersonal growth. von Franz and other Jungians call this gradual shift individuation (von Franz, 1964; Singer, 1972, 1976) and expect it as the person cautiously experiences more of the contents of her or his personal and collective unconscious. Projections of the shadow and the persona can be withdrawn and integrated into understanding (see the subsection on means of transformative power beginning in the emotional realm, pp. 132-174).

Psychotherapy is not needed for a woman to experience the relative nature of her "normal" state of consciousness. In the present climate of some complex organizations it is already possible to do relaxation experiences and guided fantasy as part of regular training and development. As I noted earlier, it may be called stress management. In my experience, it produces a state of consciousness sufficiently altered to bring forth favorable comment from participants. Better discussion for the question participants typically raise, i.e., "What happened?!" could take advantage of the teachable moment for participants to gain perspective on their other potential states of consciousness. In a similar way, a woman participant can gain perspective on her constricted view of herself and her potential from positive feedback from other participants in
role play situations. The pessimism about themselves which women typically try to hide can be lifted somewhat by attention to the honest view of others, I find.

3. A woman should have experiences from which she can form an understanding of the purposes and source of personal transformation. The experience of transformative power can be sweeping and quite unsettling, as mystics and tennis players have joined to testify. Having such experiences in the magnitude that rocks the psychic boat is bound to be suspect in a corporate setting. The small shifts in inner reality that are often produced in ordinary training and development experiences will serve to start the cultural shift. The trainer can watch for the raised eyebrow and the sudden shift of posture that a woman may show when she sees something in a new way. At that point the trainer can become a facilitator by establishing a common awareness with the woman that something a bit different has happened. It may be better to do it nonverbally, without taking time to drape words on it. Most training groups have many moments for several of the participants which offer this opportunity for mutual recognition of a shift to a different perception of reality.

In order to confirm a shared shift in meaning, however, I believe it is important to discuss the harvest of such moments as a group. The experience of transformative power is continuous with "ordinary" experience but extends beyond it in ways that are unimaginable at the beginning. If the facilitator is envisioning the "farther
reaches of human nature" (Maslow, 1971), she can begin well within the nearer end with the simple "aha's" of daily life. All the shifts in perception that a group has, if they are summed and reassessed, provide an opening into the larger reality within which we all live, more or less unaware. Walsh and Vaughan have said, "in recent years it has become apparent that our traditional assumptions and thinking about who and what we are and what we can become may not have been generous enough (1980:15), and this brief section has made a start at showing how these assumptions can be made more generous in a corporate setting.

It is to a corporation's advantage to have an ever-enlarging proportion of its employees' powers available to its purposes. Those who have charge of the balance sheet may well regard with dismay the present truth of what William James observed near the beginning of the twentieth century:

I have no doubt whatever that most people live, whether physically, intellectually, or morally, in a very restricted circle of their potential being. They make use of a very small portion of their possible consciousness . . . much like a man who, out of his whole bodily organism, should get into a habit of using and moving only his little finger . . . We all have reservoirs of life to draw upon of which we do not dream (quoted in Walsh and Vaughan, 1980:8).
A woman's tolerance for ambiguity, arising in her feminine principle, may make her more at home than her male classmates with the idea that there is no fixed endpoint to the developmental process. Her flexibility, arising in her animus, may help her to adjust to expecting a subtle shift in her way of seeing herself in a new "space" or role. In this way, she can connect herself consciously to the broader energy continuum she experiences unconsciously, as I have discussed earlier (pp. 264-268).

4. A woman should experience means of transformative power which are relevant to the direction of her intent for her development. Although the power of insight, passive volition, and envisioning is awesome when seen from the perspective given in this study, small experiences of it can be simply heartwarming. The study Maxwell Maltz cited of the relatively greater value, in learning to shoot baskets, of envisioning practice over going out into the court to practice (1960) is a more approachable example. A woman's greater openness to her context and to imagination, as I discussed it in relating the Jungian psychology of women to the experience of transformative power, might make it easier for women to experience the steps of transformative process in the development they choose within the needs of the organization.

As I believe the section on means in the transformative power chapter substantiates (pp. 72-132) most kinds of transformation in physical, mental, emotional, and spiritual experience can be
brought into being by using several or better, all of the steps in the model. The reason is that the psyche, operating in all the realms of experience, is the molder of process. The important thing is to use the process in ways that fit the purposes in view. In development within corporate situations the power of transformative process can be experienced without costly equipment and training resources because the reality that is effective is within the developing person. The choice to feed the unconscious what it needs for insight may take slightly longer than feeding the conscious the products of others' insights, but the probable increase in effectiveness would justify the method. The experience of the facilitator with transformative process would be important in supporting women in this kind of developmental process, as I will be proposing in the next subsection, which is about the reasons for her or his having such experience.

5. A woman should be supported in maintaining her satisfaction in development at a level high enough to keep her motivation strong. The process of using transformative power is subject to interruptions and frustrations from within. I have mentioned pitfalls like being distracted by dreams of recognition (George Leonard and his tennis game, pp. 109) and by put-downs from the animus (Sanford's dialogue with the animus about one's purposes, p. 262). Vaughan and other psychotherapists have called attention to the difficulties a "normal" or
constricted state of consciousness offers, as I have just noted on page 484. There is an ample supply of impediments to the operation of transformative power.

The woman herself is the one responsible for gently setting these impediments aside in transformative process. Practice in doing so is essential to experiencing transformative power. Another person who is also involved in the experience is the most plausible support from outside the artificial barrier of skin, and that person may be the facilitator. The facilitator, or any other person can only share experience with the developing woman. The trust in the process builds up within the woman developing through repeated experience of the profoundly effective work of transformative power.

The satisfaction a woman experiences in the action of transformative power is enhanced by that reality's being within, where, as Singer (1972) has pointed out, much of the drama of the feminine principle is enacted. Both she and Neumann (1963) have called attention to the importance of inner space to the feminine principle, citing the experience of motherhood. I believe that same importance of inner space is transferable to transformative process. Women care what goes on inside them, and when it is positive, their satisfaction is bound to be at least as meaningful as a man's would be, if not more so.

b. The involvement of facilitator(s) in educational experiences of transformative power by women: Facilitation is a delicate
exercise at best. In addition, facilitating the experience of interacting kinds of power by other complex human beings is challenging. This is especially so when it is being done in the environment of a layered hierarchy of functional roles.

A natural reaction, and a wholesome one in such a complicated situation, is to reduce the complexity. Some responses have to be made "without thinking", from the unconscious in automatic ways. Some needs also have to be set aside and "forgotten" until later, when they can be raised into consciousness without interfering with other conscious business.

Although many functions can be laid down into the unconscious, some must be conducted at a conscious level. Some experiences which have been tucked away intentionally must be brought into play consciously to carry out the useful roles which a facilitator plays in supporting the experience of transformative and other kinds of power. This is especially true in an overtly rational and linear situation like a corporation. Here, the subtlety of the facilitator role is most valuable because it continually explores the fit between the person developing and the environment in much the way that inspired and inspiring bosses have always been known to do.

1. The facilitator(s)' personal experience of transformative power should have been as full as possible. This is important on the one hand because she or he is unavoidably a model for other participants, and on the other hand because control of the flow of process and
level of content is in her or his hands unless she or he decides to shift it to others.34

a. The facilitator's full experience of transformative power is important because her modeling will better support movement from hope through to knowing in participant women. The Greens' analysis of the steps from hope, however faint, through to knowing that one has control (see pp. 94-98 for a fuller discussion) is of value in understanding why the facilitator must have experience of transformative power at the conscious level to be fully effective. Learning any new skill goes through a conscious stage before it can be relegated to unconscious process just as driving a car does. The residue of such a cycle, when completed, is a kind of confidence that comes out in congruent life expressions of the sort Habermas reports that Dilthey described (linguistic, action, and experiential, see p. 274, and the sub-section of this chapter B.2.62(a) for further discussion. When a facilitator has relegated her personal experience of passing through the stages from hope, to hypothesis, to belief, to knowing into some level of her unconscious, what is available to an observer? "Only" the congruence of her life expressions remains accessible to the awareness of persons beginning the stages, but that is a great

35The proportions of training and development personnel are shifting toward a greater proportion of women than men more rapidly than they are in the workforce generally and may have passed the 50% mark in 1980, so I shall be using the feminine pronoun in the rest of this section.
deal. Congruent life expressions are profoundly persuasive, as I have observed earlier. Elmer Green's description of his dialogue with the woman about her ability to warm her hands (mentioned on pp. 94-98) also inadvertently shows his easy confidence in her ability to do it if she can allow herself to slip into the process. That sure knowing which he displayed in that interaction was founded, of course, on his own use of all procedures on himself first before he introduced them to others. I have put "only" in quotes because congruent life expressions are the most convincing evidence one human being can offer another about personal experience. In studies reported in Inside Intuition Davis (1971) claims that as high as 90% of the persuasiveness of a message is carried in the nonverbal component of it. If this is as true as it intuitively seems to be, then the importance of transformative experience for facilitators is hard to over-estimate. This part of the value really lies in the unconscious process; the next part has to do with the conscious process of the facilitator.

b. The facilitator's full experience of transformative power is important because her choices about content and process will have a more valid relation to transformation in participants. The facilitator has responsibility for the direction and flow of educational experience of transformative power, in ways that I will discuss below. At this juncture I want to relate to facilitation the quality of judgment that emerges from having had experiences of transformative power.
The subtle shift in view that accompanies the action of transformative power often, and perhaps always, is associated with a gain in perspective on one's own ego. A facilitator who can get raw solace for her own ego out of the way, will be able to attend better to the signs of process in others. This development will allow her, among other things, to act effectively to support others in feedback and dialogue.

The action of transformative power usually involves a better communication within the person experiencing it, so afterward there are tracks in consciousness of what happened. This awareness of what took place is an invaluable aid to a facilitator supporting similar experience by others. What content may be really appropriate for a person to use in experiencing transformative process is clearer if the person has had the experience herself. Probably, though, the gain in the sense for the process is even more important. This is true because the process is so transferable to a variety of contents.

2. The facilitator's responsibilities for the transformative process in the corporate setting, according to the organizational development model, include needs assessment, design and delivery of developmental experiences, and follow-up and evaluation. The seven sub-propositions following have to do with aspects of those responsibilities. I have dealt elsewhere with them separately (Finney and Mayo-Chamberlain, 1979; Mayo-Chamberlain, 1976, 1978a, 1978b, 1979a, 1979b, 1979c, and 1980 submitted), but I will summarize the applicable
material here. Needs analysis works most effectively as a foundation for development efforts if a variety of methods formal and informal are used both with the intended trainees and with those who form their work environment at several levels of the hierarchy. The highest levels of an organization should be involved to assure the credibility of the program in relation to the mission of the organization as a whole. Design and delivery of the development efforts should be securely and demonstrably grounded in the needs analysis. Material arrangements for delivering training must be geared to organizational realities (time of day, length of time for training, educational level of participants) as perceived by the members of the organization. Process and outcomes need to be monitored by evaluation efforts which are as individuated for the participants as possible and as generalizable for the organization as possible. If agreement can be reached to do so, it is desirable for evaluation of the outcomes of training in behavior to be made by participants and those directly above and below them in the organization. These general statements about the role of the facilitator are drawn from a survey of the literature current at the dates of the studies. I have drawn by concept of the organization development model from Pfeiffer and Jones (1972; 1978a; 1978b).

a. The facilitator should do needs assessment with developing women about their personal intentions and their present capabilities. This reversal of the ordinary order which calls for doing needs
assessment with the organization first would probably not be entirely workable in an ordinary hierarchical organization. It is offered here first as an indication of its psychological importance, since the reality of the woman involved is key to transformative process. The accommodation between the two priorities would probably be to work first with the top of the organization to set policy, and then to get general agreement about the policies set from midlevels between the top and the developing women. As I will suggest in the next section, needs assessment would then be focused on the perceptions of the women at the same time that further assessment was being done. The assessment done with women should tap their level of envisioning and volition as well as their performance capabilities, as a base for transformative process.

b. The facilitator should do needs assessment which is qualitative as well as quantitative with all organizational levels from the top to at least the level below the developing woman. Lest this appear to be a proposition so impracticable as to imperil the program, I need to clarify it. The needs assessment need not be done over for each program but rather should always be in the process of being renewed in part sequentially. The transformative experiences of the facilitator come into play here, as well, in allowing her more effective reception of what she is hearing.

A variety of methods should be used such as written surveys, independent measures of productivity, absenteeism and turnover; and
turnover; and performance evaluations, among others. Personal interviews in which the facilitator gives the person a chance to express opinions and concerns that may not have been asked for are an essential part of the process. They are especially important in preparing for experiences of transformative power because they reach out for the very kinds of obstructions to its flow that may prove to be of the greatest importance.

Both the receptivity that Jungian psychology sees as the strength of the woman, based in her feminine principle, and the organizing clarity that is the outcome of her animus' inner work are useful in a needs assessment process.

c. The facilitator should design developmental experiences having in view the special characteristics of women, the interactions of communicative and instrumental power with transformative power, and the organizational context of the transformative process. Women-in-the-view-of-Jungian-psychology has grown to be a verbalism in the context of this study, but I would like to refresh it here as it relates to the woman in the corporate setting. The human being, also a woman, who has entered and become sufficiently a part of a complex organization to be considered a candidate for the investment of resources that are used for development there, has already gone through some stages of individuation. She has taken responsibility for finding a job and invested her hope, making at least a hypothesis which is becoming a belief that she can make a valued contribution there. She
has adapted in hundreds of ways to a new context, learning names, tasks, and the directions to the lunch room (and other facilities). In all probability she has balanced and adjusted the other aspects of her life to fit the organization's regularities (like hours, pay, and benefits). She has followed her intuition that the company would be a possible place for her to work and is dealing in some way with whatever her intuition tells her about her boss. She has also listened to her animus in his inner promptings to be creative in inventing ways to keep the peace between her receptive womanliness and her masculine orderliness and insight. In short, she is quite a lady before she starts her first session of any developmental process! Her individuation is already under way, and she has made strides toward androgynous functioning.

This woman is the nexus of interaction between the three kinds of power whose reciprocal influence I discussed in the first section of chapter six (pp. 425-427). I will briefly summarize those mutual effects here: Instrumental power promotes the use of transformative power and gives structure and order to engaging in the process. Instrumental power also promotes the use of communicative power and gives form to consensus seeking. Communicative power enriches goal-selection in the experience of instrumental power and vitalizes goal-seeking strategies. Communicative power also deepens and gives access to the experience of insight and envisioning in transformative power and nurtures individual development. Transformative power refines and focuses goal-selection in instrumental power and
strengthens goal-seeking skills. Transformative power also yields the skills that help to increase mutual understanding in communi-cative power process and supports consensus-building.

It is no overstatement to claim that all these kinds of influence are felt in the course of even a conventional management development program. A fuller awareness of their potential, and skill coming from the facilitator's own experience of them can result in elegant support for a person engaging in the process of experienc-ing transformative power. Energizing short-term goals can be includ-ed in communicative process during contract-building for the inter-action; instrumental power can be brought to bear in maintaining the time and space needed to interact. Transformative power released in the interaction can prepare the woman to experience both instrumen-tal and communicative power more fully back on her job.

In addition to the woman herself and the training situation, the third aspect of the educational matrix that the facilitator should keep in view in designing is the work context within which women will be using what they have experienced in the development process. Care-ful job design and clear competencies make that aspect of the facilita-tor's design work easier. The same competencies in two different human settings come to rest in quite different jobs, however, and it is essential that the facilitator be as fully aware of such contin-gencies as possible. The generating of options for process and the
evaluating of those options are examples of steps in transformative process that will have a different emotional tone to them in two ostensibly parallel work settings. In one setting they may be done in a spirit of desperation, in the other as part of calm planning. Women, and their male co-participants, can gain a great deal more from a developmental experience that has had a maximum of these aspects sensitively designed in. Role plays, brainstorming, and directed meditations could provide them, for varying design needs.

d. The facilitator is responsible for guiding experiences of transformative process in the light of the propositions made from the standpoint of the participating woman (B. 1. a. 1)-5). Here is the complementary aspect I have asked you to imagine in thinking about the woman in the sub-sections under B.1.a. That is, we now consider the facilitator's role in conceiving the woman's experience in a holistic manner, her role in giving opportunities to women in which they can develop perspective on their states of consciousness and so on. I would like to speak briefly about strategies related to each. A holistic conception of a woman's experience of transformative power might lead a facilitator to design alternations into the flow of the experience between physical, interpersonal, and cognitive excitement. An activity that keeps participants physically still can have an energizing intellectual aspect (puzzles, theories); an activity that is répétitive cognitively can be exciting if the participants do it
face-to-face. I have experienced a wave-like alternation in highs and lows of all four of the components in training and have written about it in an instructional theory paper (Mayo-Chamberlain, 1978b). In guiding participants to get perspective on their states of consciousness, an example of a strategy other than relaxation (mentioned on pp. 485) is perception experiences, as practiced by Ross Mooney and others in the Ohio State University Perception Lab. For perception discoveries to be effective in giving perspective on states of consciousness they have to be explicitly connected. Otherwise it is all too possible to isolate the potential learning in the visual (physical) realm.

Experiences which result in subtle shifts in inner reality may be taken for granted and not connected to the purpose and source of personal transformation unless they are brought to awareness in the oncontext of a system of thought about them. This it is the responsibility of the facilitator to provide. The experience is not complete and productive without the inner shift (Gendlin, 1978) and the idea of it in awareness, as I have shown, I think, in the purpose and source sections of the first transformative power chapter.

Means of transformative power vary, depending on the arena of experience where they begin, but the structure of the means has a broad similarity across them all. Again, I believe the means section of the transformative power chapter does make this claim plausible with a number of examples. In somewhat the same manner as the Creative
Problem-Solving Institutes described earlier (pp. 174), I think a facilitator needs to put the steps of transformative process "in the hands of" participants. Women who will experience transformative power can do so more effectively if they know in their minds what they are about.

Finally, a woman's satisfaction in development can be lifted by strategies designed into the experience. Guided fantasies, structured dialogue, and written positive messages are reliable external supports at the facilitator's disposal. The best strategy of all is intrinsic, and that is success. Facilitators can help a woman envision purposes that give success without frustrating delay, such as making a brief presentation to the group or making some change in her own work pattern.

e. The facilitator is responsible for guiding experiences of transformative process with the design as a base but with openness to emergent opportunity for growth for participants and facilitator. What is involved here is the awareness that although the steps in the model proposed on page 72 in the means section is a guide, the whole being who is a woman may dispense with any or all of it and move immediately to a full experience of transformation. The facilitator who has had such experiences herself and is ready for more may recognize when this is happening to someone else. She may also be aware when some experience either in interaction with another woman (or man) or some inward event, is precipitating such an emergent
transformation or sudden shift of "knowing" in herself. The poise to maintain openness and not force such a shift into a mold is an asset when this is happening.

f. The facilitator is responsible to see that participants have feedback and dialogue. Feedback and dialogue have a more powerful effect on women than on men in transformative process according to Jungian theory since women are more oriented toward relationship by the action of their feminine principle. A facilitator need not provide feedback to participants herself, although she may. Instead, she may plan for other participants to give feedback. Other participants' feedback is profoundly meaningful and serves to orient the woman to the work situation they share.

The dialogue process is a kind of communicative process. It serves transformative power well and gives a chance for both people who take part to get their transformative process back on course (or onto a more productive course) leading toward the purpose-in-view. As feedback is one-way, dialogue is two-way. They are so important to transformative process that it must be one of the facilitator's most important roles to see that they are provided.

g. The facilitator is responsible for mediating the transformative process and its outcomes to the organizational context, with the guidance and active involvement of participants, using understandings of persons formed in dialogue with Jungian psychology. The facilitator is the person who provides a safe space within which a
woman can experience transformative power. She can only provide
this space by consent of the organization she and the participant
women work in. Thus, it is essential that the facilitator keep
the sense of relationship strong between the work group and the
developmental experience. The supervisor is usually the key person
for this connection in a hierarchical organization, and there would
be a number of supervisors for each woman in a matrix organization.
The Jungian view would be that a woman facilitator would have a
better relationship sense, but I also believe that she would be better
prepared for the instrumental power considerations involved if she
functioned androgynously.

Even though the connection between the training experience
and the organization is the facilitator's responsibility, she cannot
carry it out effectively herself. The participants have the best
sense for the feel of their own workplace. Their experience in the
developmental process may also have prepared them for active involve­
ment in maintaining their supervisor's sense of the worth of their
experience. For both reasons, the facilitator should have the active
cooperation of participants in keeping connected.

A working grasp of basic Jungian psychology would be an
asset in keeping balance-in-flow when interpreting developmental
experiences. All the experiences of life to the point of any inter­
action come to bear at some level of that interaction. The same can
said for all the experiences of life in dialogue with Jungian principles. Every person's perception of Jungian psychology is likely to be slightly different, if the evidence given by the differences among Jungian analysts is any guide.

Given all the variables in the context of development experiences, mediating them to the organizational setting is an operation that can use all the supportive involvement it can get.

c. From the standpoint of organizational behavior theory, transformative power has an affinity with the human resource development school. Will Schutz, author of Joy (1967), Here Comes Everybody (1971) and Leaders of Schools (1977) is a leading practitioner and theorist in this general cluster of behavioral scientists. Schutz is perhaps best known for his work in developing the FIRO instruments which can be used to estimate probable "fit" between the interpersonal expectations of bosses and employees, wives and husbands, and principals and teachers. Leaders of Schools is the outgrowth of the project in which he applied the FIRO hypothesis to the choice and length of tenure of school superintendents in California.

At times it seems that a change in nomenclature is all that has happened in the last decade and that the old personnel departments are still just as old but are now called human resource development departments. There are notable exceptions, and the tide of change that is part of the paradigm shift has flooded into some corporations. The way was prepared by the human relations school about
which I shall have something to say in connection with communicative power in corporations. The new wave has Esalen Institute as one of its watering places and Will Schutz as one of its heroes.

As Schutz reports in *FIRQ* (1966), a summary of his development work on the instrument, his hypothesis that work groups in which emotional expectations were complementary would have both higher job satisfaction and higher productivity was not confirmed. It was only the job satisfaction that was higher. This provoked a shift in his approach, which has gradually focused more on what is going on inside the person and on that person's relation to her own and others' power fields. *Here Comes Everybody* (1971) has to do with facilitator development in the direction of supporting participants' inner development.

This direction in human resource development also includes human resource accounting, as originally practiced by the Columbus, Ohio-based firm of R.G. Barry. The concept recognizes the dollars and cents increase in value to the company of development of increased capability in employees. It was found not to be cost-effective to maintain the level of complexity in record-keeping that the originators believed to be necessary for human resource accounting to be valid. The method is little practiced as a result, but the point it made is not likely to be forgotten. Namely, "Developing employees pays, financially".
2. Development beginning in the area of communicative power is centered in the dynamics of the group and is best supported by the fullest use of communicative power by the facilitator.

Communicative power acts through the individual in the group, bringing to awareness and sharing understandings that gradually foster fuller and fuller consensus, sense of community, and a common will. The criteria of fostering enlightenment, symmetry of opportunity, trust and openness may be applied in corporate settings to specified developmental experiences. The criteria may be applied with equal appropriateness to interactions surrounding those situations. Furthermore, as women act on the strength of the outcomes of their transformative experiences, criteria for communicative power come into play again. The challenge of corporate life calls for a heuristic approach to daily interactions, and women experiencing reality with the structuring of the feminine archetype, are likely to be quite good at it, as I have summarized in the last section of chapter four. Interactions of two or more people qualify as "group" interactions (Mills, 1967), and the dynamics of groups offer the raw materials for the exercise of communicative power. I do not mean to minimize the importance of instrumental power in corporate interactions, as I showed in chapter five; I just mean to emphasize communicative process here.

The natural and aesthetic use of communicative power by the facilitator of developmental process may be the entry point for its
practice in a very linear and technologically oriented corporate setting. If that is the case, it is at risk until proven to be effective. More than likely however, there are already persons (perhaps fully individuated male persons) in any corporation, no matter how analytically it is oriented, who practice communicative power.

In any case, as I shall be summarizing in the propositions to follow in this sub-section, the facilitator's modeling and her design skill will both be enhanced by her own experience of communicative power. The experience of the developing woman, however, is the subject of the first five propositions I would like to offer her.

a. Educational experiences of communicative power by women in corporate settings: The corporation's need to indoctrinate women into its bureaucratic ways of communicating tends to take precedence over getting to know the skills and interpersonal experience of the women. After carefully ascertaining that the woman can do the task for which she was hired, the organization is unlikely to go beyond the formal getting-to-know-you rituals that fit her into the bureaucracy.

A woman's communicative power, based in her feminine principle, freed from the illusions created by her shadow, and sharpened by the inner work of her animus, is potentially of great value in a complex organization. A woman like Grace Waring, the Quaker lady described in "methods is use in dyads" (pp.305-308) was never
employed, but the Five-Yearly Meeting of Friends served her as a complex organization to learn in. Further, she experienced a lifetime of "centering" in meditation in her local Quaker meeting. Development in the use of communicative power came to Grace Waring in the natural course of a life in her setting. Other women may have analogous life experiences, but not all women are so fortunate. Corporate development can begin to fill the gap.

The next five propositions have to do with the ways in which communicative power experiences may productively be offered in complex organizations.

1. The dynamics and levels of understanding in the group are the raw materials for the experience of communicative power in mixed and in women's groups. Communicative process calls for the development of similar skills no matter what the subject matter of the interaction, so communicative power can be developed in experiences which are low in tension. When the content on which people are trying to experimentally to reach agreement is not threatening, process observation can raise all sorts of useful information to awareness that anxiety would otherwise obscure. The stages of group development, the levels of life expression as presented by Dilthey (see p. 272), the interference and support from the unconscious, conflict management skills, and so on, are usually available for comment in a group dialogue situation.

Having both men and women in a group gives occasion for introducing the "invisible partners" (Sanford, 1980) material shown
in the diagram on p. 334. In the diagram the various conscious
and concealed aspects of a male-female interaction are shown. As
a woman carries on a discussion with a given man, both of them are
also in dialogue with the contra-sexual aspect of the other, i.e.,
the inner person of the other whose sex corresponds to their own
gender. These additional interactions may either confound or clari-
fy the conscious dialogue, but their action is not subject to con-
scious control unless it is intentionally raised to awareness. A
training or development experience gives people a chance to practice
implementing new understandings in a role play, or in a fishbowl
design, for example. Same-sex or both-sex groupings give differing
but equally valuable, opportunities to become aware.

2. Women should have opportunities to develop awareness
of their conscious and unconscious skill in communicative process
in three kinds of life expression (i.e., a-linguistic, b-action,
and c-experiential, see p.272). I emphasize first the awareness of
skill because most people tend to emphasize their lack of it, so train-
ing in finding flaws in communicative skill is likely to be redundant.
The opportunities women (and men) can profit from more are the ones
that reveal to them the ability they already have, which is enormous.

In a "fishbowl" half of a group sits in an inner circle carrying
on a discussion while the other half sits in an outer circle
observing and making notes on which to base feedback later.
In my brief summary earlier in this chapter of the individuation woman who has entered a complex organization to work, I touched on outcomes that would have required a woman to achieve some measure of agreement on common goals with a rather large number of people in a variety of relationships. The woman would have had to demonstrate enormous communicative skill to have made it to the training room, and that is the starting point for the further development of communicative power which then becomes possible.

Communicative power results from using communicative skill to develop consensus, or a common will. It runs deeper than mere agreement to throw in resources together to try for a goal. The distinctions between that more superficial level and the achievement of consensus and a common will are important to make in a complex organization. If the distinctions are made clear, then some of the problems arising when people feel "betrayed" may be forestalled. I shall have more to say on this point on page 37.

I emphasize second the awareness of the skill in the three kinds of life expression as they come from conscious and unconscious experience. I make this emphasis because skills must come to awareness to be improved. Linguistic ones are words and sentences; action ones are behaviors; and experiential ones are those that may loosely be grouped as nonverbal. It appears that the first two are amenable and life expressions, to extend Dilthey's concept, become skills as they become conscious.
to conscious control for the most part, but that the last, "experien-
tential", is considerably less so, since it moves into expression
almost directly from the unconscious. This being the case, it is
especially worth attending to and can be an irreplaceable help in
developing communicative power. Furthermore, it is quite possible to
develop ways of facilitating learning in this area as I have shown in
units on nonverbal communication skills for allied health profession-
als (Mayo-Chamberlain, 1979c). Confrontation by others in the area
of nonverbal expression is a way of dealing directly with the uncon-
scious.

3. Women should experience the transferability of their
experience of communicative power to the significant interactions of
their corporate life. Communicative power does not work only in low-
stress training sessions, nor is it limited to situations in which
trust, openness, and symmetry of opportunity are already present. As
I have shown in a chapter on communicative power, it develops gradual-
ly in a series of exploratory phases. The sense of community that
may grow up in a group that has been experiencing communicative process
cannot be transferred whole to the work situation, but the skills of
moving from a small measure of enlightenment and trust to a greater
degree are transferable. Women can learn to control the level of
openness and to work toward a symmetry of opportunity even in situa-
tions where they are clearly one down or even one up.
Having learned such things, they then need partly sheltered opportunities to practice. Various options are possible. A woman can work with her boss or a subordinate in a triad with the facilitator as observer. She can continue to have the facilitator as consultant to debrief after interactions in which she is transferring what she practiced in group sessions. She can role play with the facilitator, or with another group member, specific interactions she wants to engage in later.

4. Women should become aware of the power and the limitations of consensus through the process of developing it within the constraints of a complex organization. The contingencies and outcomes section of the communicative power chapter was an initial statement of the vulnerability and force of consensus (see pp. 326-329). A consensus fully and freely achieved can change the direction of a corporation, as it has upon occasion changed the direction of a nation. Because the consensus rests lightly and firmly on all levels of those who have forged the agreement, it is connected to their conscious and unconscious purposes and claims their commitment.

Far more typical in modern complex organizations are the myriad contingent consensuses. People agree in part, or they agree to a part of a proposal. They may not be even conscious of what their reservations are until suddenly they are not ready to go along with the consensus. The important thing to learn is how to detect one's own and others' hold-outs before they become critical. This, women (and
men) can consciously learn to do. Pfeiffer and Jones (1972; 1978) include a variety of multiple-structured role plays which help to illustrate in an experiential way this very principle. I have gathered some in relation to interventions for team-building (1976) in educational entities in health care institutions. Women can gradually emancipate themselves from a sentimentalized sense of what "fairness" means to a tougher negotiating style which is still profoundly consensual.

5. The individual women involved in communicative process should have access to unconstrained intersubjectivity in some arenas of their lives. Corporations run to partial and contingent experiences of communicative power because they are goal-seeking human groups. Consensus and the sense of community may run high in some corporations but there is invariably a "bottom line" of some sort, even in those rare organizations in which money is not a prime concern. Human beings are amazingly adaptive, but everyone needs a safe place somewhere in life to keep sane and whole. The corporate human resource development program cannot provide this kind of a haven for all women employees, and many women have primary relationships that give them basic trust with one or more other human beings. The human resource development program can provide a women's support group for a few women who have developed an understanding of communicative power, and want to continue it with other women.
The value to the organization of such groups is a general steadying effect in women who are otherwise valuable employees. The influence of communicative power on transformative power, especially in experiences beginning in the emotional area, is very great as I have noted in chapter six. It may take an investment of paid facilitator time to support such a group as it gets under way or to help it strengthen its own communicative process later, but the return to the organization of such an investment is hard to over-estimate.

b. The involvement of facilitator(s) in educational experiences of communicative power by women: The facilitator has a dual involvement in the development of communicative power by women, and it is similar, but not quite the same, in relation to men. On the one hand, she is involved by virtue of her own past experience and conceptualization of communicative power. On the other hand, she is involved by virtue of her various responsibilities in carrying out the role she is playing. Men may not care to model on a woman facilitator's communicative process, but they can be helped to attend to it consciously. A woman can also sensitively receive a male participant's anima and help to make him aware of its action in helping his creativity, for instance. For this study, however, the facilitator's relationship to women participants both as a model and as an organizer is what concerns us. This modeling is one compelling reason for the next proposition, but awareness of herself as instrument and of options for process are the others.
1. The facilitator's experience of communicative power should have been as full as possible. The reasons for this include the next two propositions.

   a. The facilitator's full experience of communicative power is important because her modeling of genuine and effective linguistic, action, and experiential life expression, and her hermeneutic inquiry will be clearer. The teaching value of seeing another person do what is being taught is well known. One of the classic four steps of skill training is demonstrating, and it is impossible to over-value it. All the little subtleties of phrase and nonverbal behavior show in the immediate interactions that participants observe the facilitator conducting. The actions of the facilitator in following through with what she has said she will do complete her modeling of effective life expressions. Both the life expressions and her modeling of hermeneutic inquiry to establish intersubjectivity are based in her experience of communicative power (see the "Habermas and the Practical Interest" section on pp.269-273 ). As she becomes aware of cues that indicate that supposed consensuses do not exist, she is likely to engage in on-the-spot inquiry to re-establish a working consensus. This, the participants may or may not notice, but if they do, it forms a clear model for them.

   b. The facilitator's full experience of communicative power is important because her judgment about content and process will be more relevant to the women and the corporate setting. It is ideal,
of course, if the facilitator's experience with communicative power can have been in the context of the kind of complex organization in which she will be designing training. The nuances of agreement about interpersonal process differ from setting to setting as Barger and Luckmann (1966) have observed. More of a facilitator's experience could be temporarily relegated to her unconscious to allow her to deal more effectively with what she needs to keep in consciousness if she is thoroughly familiar with the setting within which she is currently functioning. Familiarity is no substitute for awareness, however. The facilitator needs a conscious grasp of the aspects of communicative power if she is to make the best choices in supporting others' development in that area. It is not enough to know how to get along within the existing consensus, because the additional ingredient of perspective is missing.

2. The facilitator(s)' responsibilities for the development of communicative power in women in corporate settings, according to the organizational development model, include needs assessment, design and delivery of developmental experiences, and follow-up and evaluation. The five sub-propositions following have to do with aspects of these responsibilities. I have summarized general considerations relating to all of them on pp. 495 ff., and in other writings mentioned there.

a. The facilitator should employ needs analysis tools designed to allow and encourage expression of as broad a range of
blocks and challenges as possible, as seen by women themselves. As the facilitator first engages the women who will be participants in developmental process, she uses in depth qualitative inquiry to help them and herself understand their potential difficulties in experiencing communicative power. In doing this, the facilitator's grasp of Jungian views of women's psychology will help to guide her hypotheses about the woman's conscious and unconscious processes. Each woman has her own blend of the aspects of the psyche that Jung and other Jungian psychologists described, and it is the facilitator's task in hermeneutic inquiry to become more aware of it. The woman's idiosyncratic relationship to her organizational context should also emerge from the facilitator's investigation.

Apart from talk, other "tools" of the facilitator's needs analysis kit have been mentioned in sub-section B. 1. b. 2) b) on p. 498. The direction of inquiry in this aspect of the facilitator's responsibility is toward understanding the woman in communication with her environment.

b. The facilitator should employ a similar range of methods in attending to the needs of the persons elsewhere in the corporate structure with whom the developing women's roles interact. As I have also noted in discussing the needs analysis aspect of the facilitator role in relation to transformative power, there must be some common purpose negotiated with the highest levels of the organizational
hierarchy before the needs analysis with the woman. The developing person is psychologically first, but the organization must be chronologically both first and third. After gathering and understanding with the woman and formulating some consensus with her about what her developmental needs are, the facilitator listens in more detail to those who form the woman's environment in the organization. The object is to get a clearer picture of what those individuals see as the hang-ups and opportunities in the woman's situation. Questionnaires that can be quantified and interviews to get a more inward view, as well as such non-reactive measures as observations of the amount and condition of the paperwork on the person's desk, are all to be taken in and valued, along with concern for the persons themselves.

I want to be explicit about the tone of respect and warm sense of humor that I believe is an essential ingredient in hermeneutic inquiry. A facilitator who is really comfortable in an appropriate style of hermeneutic inquiry is pleasing to watch. A person whose individuation is not stuck is likely to have a decent attitude toward everyone involved, combined with the freedom to see funny contrasts and enjoy them without hidden hostility. There is very little of the hard-bitten and forced quality that characterize a woman whom Jungians might call "animus possessed". The woman is expressing herself genuinely in words, actions, and nonverbal
behaviors, and she is tuning in on the parallel expressions of the other person. In short, she is enjoying the experience of communicative power, and she is a joy to observe.

c. The facilitator has the responsibility of designing so that the other kinds of power will appear experientially in the process of the group and also of using process consultation skills to raise the other kinds of power to awareness. I have already shown ways in which transformative power influences communicative process (during the discussion of transformative process pp.483 ff. ). Communicative process is infused with the gradual or sudden transformations that take place within the persons who are outwardly engaged in understanding each other better. I have also described this interactive effect in discussing the criteria by which we may recognize and evaluate the experience of communicative power (see pp. 296 ff). The successive cycles of testing and trusting, for instance, may lead to that shift of view by which a more universal level of power enters a specific situation. The facilitator can plan for this, but can never control it. Individual life histories coming together have unlimited possibilities for differing results. Designing and delivering is just that; it is not determining.

The open-endedness and ambiguity that is an essential ingredient when designing for the appearance of transformative power in experiences is precisely the opposite of designing for the appearance
of instrumental power in communicative process. Goals can be set and achieved as long as their limits of effectiveness and their humanistic appropriateness are kept in mind. An example is planning to have the group decide about a mutual contract for promptness. The group can set the goal in communicative process, surfacing resistance they may feel to the sanctimoniousness of "punctuality freaks" or reverse effects like inner rage at people who loaf in late. They may decide that being on time is not a goal they want to have, but whatever goal they set serves communicative power in that achieving it is the "action" kind of life expression and is congruent with the performance agreed on in words. Thus, instrumental power appears in communicative process experientially, according to the design of the facilitator. Raising it to awareness with participants is an aspect of the role of the facilitator, to be performed with pleasingly little fanfare.

d. The facilitator is responsible for assisting the group in experiencing communicative power as discussed in sub-sections B. 2. a. 1) -5). In addition to her experience of communicative power as a support for her judgment in designing development experiences, the facilitator can be expected to have in mind a serviceable variety of specific interventions to help a group experience communicative power and know that they are doing it. Her skills need to be the complement of the needs of the women. For example, she should know and be able to use role-plays that give each participant different instructions to act on (multiple structured role-plays). Using them calls for
process consultation skill in which the facilitator gradually shifts to the participants the responsibility for making observations on the basis of which they can say, for example, "You look at Mary each time you speak, no matter whom you're talking to. Could you say what there is in your role that is leading you to do that?", or "Since this group just got past the 'forming' stage, I'm wondering what relationship this conflict has to the 'storming' stage of deciding who's in control. Any ideas?"

In supporting the participants' realization of the influence of their unconscious process on their conscious behaviors, the facilitator needs to have a clear idea of some theory of personality. I find the Jungian psychology to be a fruitful one because it is respectful, seeing persons as phenomena to be understood rather than as problems to be diagnosed. Depending on their own balance of feminine and masculine principles, among other things, other women who are facilitators may find some other theory more functional. Everything I understand to this point in my development, however, leads me to believe that a theory that includes a concept of the action of the unconscious will be most useful. It is much easier to understand and to help others understand life expressions, by whatever names they are called, using ideas about the effects of unconscious process.

The discussion of the ways in which women can experience the transferability of their experiences of communicative power is full of references to the parts the facilitator plays in helping the
woman settle her new skills back into her work situation (see pp. 508-509). The facilitator can act as role-play partner or as observer in role-playing. She can be an observer to the woman's interactions for feedback, or she can simply listen after the woman has experienced her communicative power in her work setting. Both the facilitator's role and the other woman's role call for development of androgynous functioning, as both masculine and feminine aspects of their psyches come into play. For instance, fuller experience of communicative power for a woman employs both clarity and nurture.

Probably the most significant application of communicative power a facilitator participates in with women is that of understanding the limits and the particular force of it as it is experienced in a goal-centered organization. The positive action of the feminine principle is so closely aligned with communicative power that women who do not consciously re-adapt what they already know about communicative power to their new experience in corporate life may see the organization as a "zoo", full of "unfairness" and "betrayal". The communicative power they know already does have powerful team-building effects in the corporate setting, but it also has limits because goal-seeking is the dominant way of life. Women need to be especially clear about the kind of trust they can extend to others, because trust and consensus develop in the context of the use of power as an instrument to attain pre-specified ends.
Furthermore, the male consensus in a complex organization is more likely to exclude women than it is in a family setting. Kanter (1977) believes this is related to the "tokenism" by which women are so few that they do not constitute a critical mass, and thus they are seen as examples of their gender rather than as persons (or alter egos). The facilitator's role in helping women to grasp the subtleties of this collection of differences about the use of communicative power in corporate settings is an important one. The facilitator can carry out this aspect of her role through group process interventions that focus on male-female differences and on dealing with exclusion directly.

Finally, the role of the facilitator in providing access for women to some area of unconstrained intersubjectivity in or outside the corporate setting is a delicate one. She is carrying on the expectation of the corporation that she will be aware of and active in pursuing the instrumental goals of the organization. At the same time, her own experience of communicative power has gained her entry to a level of interaction that is based on trust and openness. Ethical practice demands that she help women to be clear in their own minds and behavior about the double aspect of her role. Ambiguity is unavoidable, but the facilitator must keep it as low as she can.

e. The facilitator is responsible for mediating the communicative process and its outcomes to the organizational context with the guidance and active involvement of participants, using their
understanding of persons formed in dialogue with Jungian psychology and her own understanding. Keeping the connection with the supervisor(s) and the workgroup strong is a natural outgrowth of developmental experiences of communicative power. This is "lab" and "field-work" and essential, just as it is in connection with transformative power experiences (see pp. 479). The participants know their own communication norms in their own workplace and can guide the facilitator in interpreting what is new as it will fit into what they already experience there. Any understanding of the dialogues between the "invisible partners" (Sanford, 1980) that they have gained can support the process of interpretation, as can the facilitator's understanding and practice.

c. From the standpoint of organizational behavior theory, communicative power has an affinity with the human relations school; Rensis Likert is a leading theorist-practitioner. Likert, author of New Patterns of Management (1961) and The Human Organization: Its Management and Value (1967) has been a leader in returning the pendulum of organizational behavior thinking from the extremes of the human relations school of the 1930's and 1940's. He published papers on human resource accounting which was mentioned in connection with the human resource development school and which link him to it. He also published papers on the quantification of performance which link him with the scientific management school. However, Likert is most closely associated with studies of motivation based on participative practice.
in management. Likert showed that the success or failure of communication in complex organizations is directly related to attitudes. An example is the direct correlation shown by a plot of the perceived unreasonableness of pressure for performance against the extent to which men will take complaints or grievances to their superiors (Likert, 1961:44-46). That is, if workers believe that pressure for performance is unreasonable, they will not take grievances to their superiors.

Attitudes toward work and the organization were also shown to improve in direct relation to the level of participation workers felt they had in decision-making (see pp. 391-393). The orientation toward productivity outcomes is pervasive, so that I have the sense that Likert's work straddles the distinction I have made in this study between communicative power and instrumental power. Actually, some of the difficulties other theorists have found in Likert's applications may be related to the instrumentalization of communicative process.

The affinity between communicative power and the human relations school of organizational theory, and Likert's work is based on the concern of making the inner process of the employee a part of the outer process of communication. Fritz Roethlisberger, a founder of the human relations school, has this to say about the communications process he engaged in at the Hawthorne plant of Western Electric in the late twenties:
Therefore, my first object is to get people to talk freely and frankly about matters which are important to them... I listen. I do not interrupt. I do not give advice. I avoid leading questions. I refrain from moral judgments about the opinions expressed... (Roethlisberger, 1949:92-93).

The human relations school does seem to have an affinity with communicative process. The effects in productivity of this approach were sufficiently astonishing at the time that they launched a shift in personnel practices which ultimately resulted in some excesses. Later however, enlightened and scientific work was done in the human relations school by practitioner-theorists like Rensis Likert. It is the danger that the "Hawthorne effect" may be coopted by instrumental goals that lies at the base of the criterion of appropriateness for instrumental power.

3. Development beginning in the area of instrumental power is centered in relationships to the objective situation and is best supported by effective and appropriate use of instrumental power by the facilitator.

38 The Hawthorne effect is named for the plant in which the Harvard Business School researchers discovered that productivity continued to go up no matter how lighting was cut and finally associated the effect with the fact that the workers were being paid attention to by people who were important to them. Of course the workers were also on incentive pay, so the effect was not entirely "caused" by the attention.
Instrumental power is the objective capacity to achieve pre-specified goals by an individual or a group. It engages the intellectual skills of those who use it in figuring out angles and adding up results. The means of using instrumental power may also engage the imagination if the criterion of stimulating the development of alternatives is met creatively. Physical and emotional aspects of the person are engaged in releasing energy for the process and gaining adequate impetus to reach the goal. The effectiveness criteria can thus be seen to have a relevance to the holistic engagement of the person in gaining the goal (see pp. 369-376).

The appropriateness criterion has to do with the humanistic concerns about the use of instrumental power. These come into play especially in designing training and development experiences in the area of instrumental power. Relationships between developing women (and men) and the facilitator and between developing persons and the organization's goals are subject to evaluation on the appropriateness criterion (see pp. 377-382).

The effective and appropriate use of instrumental power is important to the development of the experience of instrumental power in others. Although it has implications for several aspects of instrumental process in training and development, two uses stand out. The first is that the facilitator will need to use instrumental power effectively to carry out the permission given in a general way by the organization for the development of transformative and communicative
power. The second is that the facilitator's modeling of instrumental power is essential in just the same way that I have indicated it to be in transformative and communicative process.

a. Educational experiences of instrumental power by women in corporate settings: The corporation's need to make a developing woman part of the smooth working of its bureaucratic machinery might seem to fit very nicely the woman's corresponding need to know how to operate that bureaucratic machinery to gain her own goals. I believe it does, but it might work only to allow the corporation to gain its goals and result in the woman's being left with many of her own goals unmet if she were not shown how to operate it for her own. This training and development situation can help to avoid, and the succeeding four propositions will show some ways in which it can be done.

1. Women's experience in the developmental process should demonstrate to them their own capacity to set and achieve goals. This first proposition is linked to the fourth because success in achieving goals feeds a reasoned optimism about the use of instrumental power in an organization. The kind of experience of goal-setting that is most productive in a complex organization is that which is grounded in the larger goals of the organization as a whole. A clear sense of what those goals mean in daily terms as well as over the long span of the life of the organization gives a springboard to effective goal-setting for individuals. Goals set within a clear
understanding of the mission of a corporation have a good chance of success.

Common practice in corporate training sets the goals for training, and plans for the integration of outcomes into the ongoing activities of the organization, without involving trainees. The educational implication of the experience of instrumental power is that practice will be more effective and certainly more appropriate if the trainee takes part in setting her or his own educational goals. Training should be truly optional, so that people do not fear demotion or firing if they do not value the training.

The shift toward pressing for a woman's taking a more active part in setting her own goals for development in experiencing instrumental power would stimulate the individuation process. It would require initiative in addition to the basic receptivity of the feminine principle.

2. The contributions of transformative and communicative power to instrumental process should be made clear in the experience of instrumental power, as should its serviceability to them. The appropriate uses of instrumental power in the service of individual transformation and the development of consensus need to be experienced and discussed in training and development. The value, for instance, of setting and working toward a goal of getting the department to pay for a developmental experience like a performance-evaluation workshop is double. The woman finds out what performance on her part is
valuable enough to warrant that kind of an investment in her potential. She also gets the empowering view of herself as a person able to ask for and get what she needs. The service that instrumental power renders transformative process is to mobilize resources to support it. If the workshop is conducted with communicative process methods, the woman profits in still a third dimension.

There is, of course, an extended organization development technology in training for goal setting. Like all aspects of the world of instrumental power, it is likely to be regarded as the whole of organization development. Team-building can be practiced as a goal-setting exercise. Career development can be practiced in the same way. Regarding goal-setting as the legitimate objective of practically every organizational development intervention does not serve the real needs of the organization nor the person, it misses significant dimensions both of the person and of the organization.

Starting with the steps of the transformative power model and using communicative process to build consensus put the ultimate use of instrumental goal-setting techniques into an appropriate framework. The work presently being done with the support of a number of Columbus, Ohio corporations' funding at Options¹ in career development is an example of an appropriate use of goal-setting in this way.

For this experience to serve the individuation process of a woman as conceived by Jungian psychology, it seems that it needs to

³⁹"Options" is an educational brokering service in Columbus, Ohio which guides participants in selecting educational options in terms of career development.
be done consciously. The initiative and clarification that it takes to do effective goal-setting is part of her development that is prompted by the working of her animus, her masculine principle within. Negotiating a rational process like goal-setting would tend to help a woman to recover her animus projections of opinionated and irrational thinking and make them more rational. She gains by doing it even once, but if she can connect it to the willpower of her ego and commit to it as a standard operating procedure she will aid her animus in his work.

3. **Women's perceptions of their options for instrumental process should be extended.** The principle of instrumental power can be taught with a few experiences but there is a lifetime's world of learning. There are hundreds of practices which are useful in the exercise of instrumental power. If a variety of practices can be gathered into a training experience in which women also learn the principle, they can learn both at once. Some examples are "copy"-ing one's boss, having lunches with people above one in the hierarchy, being the one to use the magic marker in a meeting, sitting to the right of the person with the most perceived power in a meeting, and so on. These few examples are minor, perhaps, but employed strategically they contribute substantially to the exercise of instrumental power. More substantial are the principles of alliances and activities outlined by Kanter (1977) from her observations of how people gained and used power (instrumental power) in Indsco, one of the nation's largest corporations.
4. Women's optimism about their own experience of instrumental power should be refined by realistic assessment skills and experience. Not all goals are possible, and it is the kinder part of encouragement to apprise women (and men, of course) of ways of assessing what some of the marks of an unachievable goal are. Poor planning, ill-defined outcomes, inadequate support structures are but a few of the signals which can warn a person involved in the use of instrumental power that something is amiss. Experience is an excellent teacher, but experiential learning combines the best effects of experience with the best benefits of cognitive teaching.

b. The involvement of facilitator(s) in educational experiences of instrumental power by women: Since women have typically been seen as less adept in the exercise of instrumental power than men, as I have shown in the section on instrumental power and the Jungian psychology of women (see pp.329-347), it is especially useful for a facilitator to use it well. There are at least two reasons for this as I shall show next, and there are five aspects, or more, to her role as facilitator of experiences of instrumental power which I will discuss in the sub-section following that.

1. The facilitator(s)' experience of instrumental power should have been and must continue to be as full as possible. The reasons for this include the next two propositions. In addition, the facilitator must exercise her own instrumental power to continue to have credibility in the organization in order to survive as a facilitator, apart from the influence of her experience on her capacity to train effectively.
a. The facilitator's full experience of instrumental power is important because her modeling of realistic goal-setting and achievement will suggest options for process and give an opportunity for participants to increase their own optimism about what a woman can do. The process of organizing and bringing off a development workshop is a prime example of instrumental power at work. With very little extra planning the facilitator can use the workshop itself as a case example in the content of the workshop. The various instrumental power strategies the facilitator uses then are kept in awareness by all participants.

Women watching the process can strengthen their own optimism about their functioning in instrumental power to the extent that they can maintain a working sense of identification with the facilitator. This is another point at which the way the facilitator keeps her own ego from interfering in the process is important. If she can downplay her special ability and expertise without being ostentatiously self-effacing, she will have done much to make it possible for other women to identify with her exercise of instrumental power. They then can pick up her ways without having to pick up their courage first. I am assuming that she has acquired ways that are worth emulating in the first place, like organizing resources to serve the goal and getting agreement on the viability of the goal from others concerned.
b. The facilitator's full experience of instrumental power is important because her perception of effective and appropriate options for content and process will be richer. A facilitator can learn a great deal from the voluminous literature of instrumental power, but the fine adaptations of that learning to a given set of learners in a given organization can be guided more effectively if the facilitator has experienced a span of the options herself. The judgment must inevitably by subjective to some extent, but the more successful experience the facilitator has had of setting a goal and going after it, the better she can decide what is workable.

Failures are useful too, and two considerations influence how useful they become. The first consideration is that the facilitator has used the failure as a stimulus for her own individuation, rather than as a defeat for her sense of self. The second consideration is that she remember how it happened. Remembering can help her to give others the chance to look at more angles as they proceed. Remembering is also valuable because it makes it possible to regroup the understanding gained when a shift of inner process allows it. The same old memory can serve a new view of reality, making the experience accumulate to the support of an enhanced sense of self, for example.

In this way, a facilitator with a rich experience of instrumental power, whether successful or not, can become a better resource to others' development of the experience of instrumental power. She is thus better equipped to carry out her responsibilities in facilitating.
2. The facilitator(s)' responsibilities for the development of instrumental power in women in corporate settings, according to the organization development model, include needs assessment, design and delivery of developmental experiences, and follow-up and evaluation. The five sub-propositions following have to do with aspects of these responsibilities. I have summarized general considerations relating to all of them on pp. 417-418 and in other writings mentioned there. The differences between the facilitator(s)' responsibilities in relation to instrumental power and to communicative and transformative power should become apparent in the discussion of the sub-propositions.

   a. The facilitator should employ a needs analysis system that will yield measurable goals which show a clear relation to the goals and objectives of the larger complex organization. In establishing such a structure of needs analysis tools the facilitator builds into the needs assessment process a functional and organic relationship to the mission of the organization for the developmental experience. If she specifies in advance that the presence of a certain proportion of indications of a need relative to a goal-oriented kind of functioning will get that functioning into the training, she has established a training structure that is snugly fitted to the organization's larger goals. If for example, the organization mission to serve the federal government part of its potential market, and it
does not have a proportion of women as managers and above that meets federal guidelines, then if a specific proportion of women who are eligible for promotion to manager can be identified who lack skills required for managerial roles, the facilitator's goals for developing those skills in the women has an observable relation to the mission of the company. Needs analysis will have done its work effectively.

b. The facilitator should involve participants in a needs analysis for themselves as an aspect of a goal-setting process that has a demonstrable relation to the goals of the complex organization. In this sub-section on instrumental power experience, the needs analysis with the women themselves comes second, after the needs analysis in the organization. There is a conflict between this process and that for transformative and communicative power which would have to be resolved by the feel of the organization to the facilitator. If she thinks the organization has come far enough from the old paradigm of education to make it possible to do the needs assessment with the women first, it may be an indication that certain kinds of developmental experiences are possible in that context that would not have been previously. Clearly there is a possible trade-off between the potential for change afforded by raising the issue and the potential for organization acceptance for the facilitator's functioning given by doing it the old way. Such issues are constantly involved in the exercise of instrumental power by facilitators.
In any case, at some point the participant has to plug her thinking into the goals of the organization in order to be effective.

c. The facilitator has responsibility for implementing the goal-seeking process by specific uses of effective and appropriate instrumental power to make possible the experiences called for in B. 3. a., 1)-4). The facilitator is the one to design and deliver the experiences that the woman needs to experience her own instrumental power more fully. In addition to the dimensions of design and delivery described in relation to experiences of transformative and communicative power, the facilitator needs to set goals for getting the training together and make good on them. I have mentioned one way she can use that process as a device for teaching the specifics of using instrumental power (see pp. 452-453). Beyond that one her function is complementary to each of the four sub-propositions given in B. 3. a.

d. The facilitator has responsibility for establishing a rational and thorough method of evaluating participant progress toward the goals of the experience. There is no necessary contradiction between establishing such a structure of evaluation processes and the evaluation style I have suggested as appropriate for the transformative and communicative aspects of a developmental experience. As Milczarek (1979) has noted in his chapter on the implications for educational evaluation of Habermas' thought, this kind of evaluation may seem tangential to the aims of that kind of education. The other kinds of evaluating (up close and qualitative) are relevant and essential to
those kinds of experiences. Evaluation that emphasizes rational process and thorough measurability has its place, and that place is in experiences having to do with instrumental power. To what extent the person can deliver the performance is a legitimate question in this realm. The danger, as Milczarek also pointed out, is that such evaluation may be regarded as all evaluation (1979). That, it is not.

e. The facilitator has the responsibility for communicating effectively about the instrumental process and its outcomes to the organizational context with the active and specific help of the participants, using their understanding of persons formed in dialogue with Jungian psychology as well as his or her own understanding of it all. The help of participants is much less crucial in instrumental process for the outcomes which can be measured and described quantitatively than it is in transformative and communicative processes. The figures tell the story, and they will be believed, in most hierarchical organizations.

The participants' help is still needed in making meaning of the figures. How they function in conveying any meanings that may be problematic may depend to some extent on their capacity to put to work their understanding of the levels of process in their work setting. The facilitator's understanding may help, as well.

c. From the standpoint of organizational behavior theory, instrumental power has an affinity with the scientific management
school in its recent forms. Peter Drucker would probably be embarrassed to be associated with the originators of the school of scientific management, principally because the science of management has made such strides in sophistication since the turn of the century when it was inaugurated. Drucker has no difficulty associating himself with the practice of instrumental power, however, as some of his titles indicate. Among them are *The Effective Executive* (1966) and *Managing for Results* (1964). The focus of his argument in *Management: Tasks, Responsibilities, Practices* (1973) is on performance and productivity in the workforce, and how the manager can organize to deliver them effectively to support the mission of his organization. Drucker has been effective, and his books crystalize the opinion of many management theorists and most managers. His contribution has been rather in showing how instrumental power may be used effectively than in questioning whether there is any other kind of power.

C. IMPLICATIONS FOR COMPLEX ORGANIZATIONS OF ANDROGYNOUS EDUCATION FOR WOMEN

In summary, I would like to make three points about the value of education for women in complex organizations that capitalizes on their capacity to develop in ways that Jungian psychology would describe as androgynous. The three kinds of value that I see for
hierarchical organizations are: (1) a more cost-effective human resource development organization, (2) higher morale leading to lowered absenteeism and employee turnover, and (3) increased productivity based on better human resource utilization.


Although implementation costs would be high, the outcome is likely to be a more cost-effective development operation for at least two reasons. The first is that clear theoretical guidance for resource use and development based on the same theory as spelled out in the propositions given in this chapter would make it possible to stop trying to do everything. Just focusing on what is needed could lead to a more parsimonious practice; it should cost less in the long run.

The second reason is that doing exactly what is needed in training, and not a range of what might be useful, is more likely to deliver a valuable group of capable women employees. Guiding practice by the theoretical framework would make it possible to select precise strategies to meet the specific developmental needs of particular women.

2. Higher morale among women yielding lowered absenteeism and turnover.

The clarification of interactions among women, and between men and women, based on the application of the theory generated here should eventuate in higher morale with consequent benefits to the organization for the following reasons. First, increased appreciation of their own and the company’s goals and realistic skill building to
achieve those goals would reduce women's frustration and tension. In addition, a wider understanding of the role of gender stereotypes and of real male-female differences can reduce men employee's confusion and anxiety. This would have the secondary effect of making it easier for women to operate in the new organization climate.

3. Increased productivity resulting from better human resource utilization.

If human resource development were based on the theory advanced here, there would be an opportunity for fuller utilization of the actual human resources of a corporation. The specific capacities that women bring to their corporate settings could be used consciously to complement those specific to men. Further, using a broader range of women's human potential available through theory-guided development, could deliver a more effective and appropriate achievement of the goals of the organization.
REFERENCES


Bartlett, Laile E.  What Do We Really Know About Psychic Phenomena?  The Reader's Digest, August, 1977, 82-87.


Galin, D. *Implications for Psychiatry of Left and Right Cerebral Specialization*. *Archives of General Psychiatry*, 31, 1974, 572-583.


Habermas, Jürgen. Hannah Arendt's Communications Concept of Power, 

Knowledge and Human Interests. Boston: Beacon Press, 
1971. (Originally published in German, Frankfurt am Main: 
Suhrkamp Verlag, 1968).

On Systematically Distorted Communication, Inquiry, 13, 

Problems of Legitimation in Late Capitalism, IN: Paul 
Connerton (Ed.), Critical Sociology: Selected Readings, New 


Haberstroh, Chadwick J. Organization Design and Systems Analysis, 
IN: James G. March (Ed.), Handbook of Organizations. 

Hackman, J. Richard. Group Influences on Individuals, IN: Marvin D. 
Dunnette (Ed.), Handbook of Industrial and Organizational 
Psychology, Chicago: Rand McNally College Publishing Company, 
1976, 1455-1525.

Hecaen, H. Clinical Symptomatology in Right and Left Hemispheric 
Lesions. IN: V. B. Mountcastle (Ed.), Interhemispheric Rela-
tions and Cerebral Dominance. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press, 
1962.

books, 1958.


Keck, Robert. Introduction to Holistic Health. A Seminar held by New Wineskins Center at First Community Church, Columbus, OH. January 12 and March 29, 1980.


MacKinnon, Donald W. Creativity and Transliminal Experience. 


Design for Affective Education for the School of Allied Medical Professions. Unpublished paper, Columbus, OH: The Ohio State University, 1978a.


Supervisory Training. Unpublished paper, Columbus, OH: The Ohio State University, 1979b.


Rank, Otto. _Beyond Psychology_. New York: Dover, 1941.


__________ Some Implications of Client-centered Counseling for College Personnel Work, _College and University_, 1948, October, 64.


__________ **Man on His Nature.** Cambridge, Engl.: Cambridge University Press, 1941.


Vogel, W., D. M. Broverman and E. I. Klaiber. EEG and Mental Abilities, EEG and Clinical Neurophysiology, 1968, 24, 166-175.


