INFORMATION TO USERS

This was produced from a copy of a document sent to us for microfilming. While the most advanced technological means to photograph and reproduce this document have been used, the quality is heavily dependent upon the quality of the material submitted.

The following explanation of techniques is provided to help you understand markings or notations which may appear on this reproduction.

1. The sign or “target” for pages apparently lacking from the document photographed is “Missing Page(s)”. If it was possible to obtain the missing page(s) or section, they are spliced into the film along with adjacent pages. This may have necessitated cutting through an image and duplicating adjacent pages to assure you of complete continuity.

2. When an image on the film is obliterated with a round black mark it is an indication that the film inspector noticed either blurred copy because of movement during exposure, or duplicate copy. Unless we meant to delete copyrighted materials that should not have been filmed, you will find a good image of the page in the adjacent frame.

3. When a map, drawing or chart, etc., is part of the material being photographed the photographer has followed a definite method in “sectioning” the material. It is customary to begin filming at the upper left hand corner of a large sheet and to continue from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps. If necessary, sectioning is continued again—beginning below the first row and continuing on until complete.

4. For any illustrations that cannot be reproduced satisfactorily by xerography, photographic prints can be purchased at additional cost and tipped into your xerographic copy. Requests can be made to our Dissertations Customer Services Department.

5. Some pages in any document may have indistinct print. In all cases we have filmed the best available copy.
CUNNINGHAM, DAVID WINN, JR.
MUSIC NOTATION IN NETHERLANDISH PAINTING OF
THE FIFTEENTH AND SIXTEENTH CENTURIES.
THE OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY, PH.D., 1978

© Copyright by
David Winn Cunningham, Jr.
1978
MUSIC NOTATION IN NETHERLANDISH PAINTING
OF THE FIFTEENTH AND SIXTEENTH CENTURIES

DISSERTATION

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for
the Degree Doctor of Philosophy in the Graduate
School of The Ohio State University

By
David Winn Cunningham, A.A., B.M.E., M.A.

*****

The Ohio State University

Reading Committee:
Professor Herbert S. Livingston
Professor Anne Morganstern
Professor Richard H. Hoppin, Adviser

Approved by
Richard H. Hoppin
Advisor
School of Music
PLEASE NOTE:

Some pages contain illustrations with dark background which will not reproduce well. Filmed as received in the best possible way.

UNIVERSITY MICROFILMS INTERNATIONAL
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

No one begins or completes a dissertation without becoming indebted to more people than it would be possible to enumerate. From those who are not mentioned I ask indulgence. There are some, though, whose help has been invaluable.

I must thank all of the Music History faculty and students of The Ohio State University School of Music who have passed along tidbits of information and pictorial sources. I am particularly grateful to Professor Herbert Livingston whose interest in photography and in my subject has been a stimulation and to Professor Anne Morganstern who has always been willing to share her time and knowledge with an intruder in her field.

My thanks go also to the galleries and museums that have been kind enough to allow me to reproduce works from their collections. The assistance of J.C. Ebbinge Wubben of the Museum Boymans-van Beuningen, Professor Franco Mazzini of the Galleria Sabauda, and Dr. Wilhelm H. Köhler of the Staatliche Museen in Berlin has saved me many hours of work.

My special thanks go to Professor Richard Hoppin whose humor, equanimity, knowledge, and editorial skills...
have been a constant source of inspiration. He and his wife Jean have been highly valued not only for their intellectual capabilities, but just as much for their friendship.

Finally, my gratitude must be expressed for the support and encouragement given by my parents throughout all these years. Without them, none of this would have been accomplished, and it is to them that I offer this dissertation.
VITA

October 23, 1938. Born - Pahokee, Florida

1964. A.A., Palm Beach Junior College
   Lake Worth, Florida

1966. B.M.E., Florida State University
   Tallahassee, Florida

1966-1968 Elementary and Secondary Music Teacher
   Grady County Schools, Cairo, Georgia

1968-1970 Elementary and Secondary String Teacher
   Palm Beach County Schools, Boca Raton, Florida

1970-1972 Secondary Music Teacher, Department of
   Defense Overseas Dependents Schools, Okinawa

1972-1978 Graduate Teaching Associate, Division
   of Music History and Literature, School
   of Music, The Ohio State University,
   Columbus, Ohio

1974. M.A., The Ohio State University, Columbus,
   Ohio

1978. Choral Director, Port Huron High School,
   Port Huron, Michigan
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGMENTS</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VITA</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF PLATES</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Chapter**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I.  INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Miniature Tradition</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Political and Social Climate</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flemish Painting</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music Printing</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flemish Music</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Synthesis of Painting and Music</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.  PAINTINGS WITH SIMULATED MUSIC NOTATION</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Devotional Paintings</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moralistic Paintings</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. PAINTINGS WITH LEGIBLE NOTATION</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Devotional Paintings</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moralistic Paintings</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allegorical Paintings</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portraits</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.  CONCLUSIONS</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plate</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.</td>
<td>School of Hugo van der Goes: Nativity. Dunedin, Public Art Gallery. (Museum photo)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.</td>
<td>School of Hugo van der Goes: Nativity, detail. Dunedin, Public Art Gallery. (Museum photo)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III.</td>
<td>Flemish: Nativity. Columbus Gallery of Fine Arts, Ohio; Gift of the Hildreth Foundation in memory of Mr. &amp; Mrs. Louis R. Hildreth. (Museum photo)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.</td>
<td>Flemish: Nativity, detail. Columbus Gallery of Fine Arts, Ohio. (Museum photo)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.</td>
<td>Master of Delft: Altarpiece of the Holy Family. Amsterdam, Rijksmuseum. (Museum photo)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI.</td>
<td>Master of Delft: Altarpiece of the Holy Family, detail. Amsterdam, Rijksmuseum. (Museum photo)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII.</td>
<td>Jacob Cornelisz. van Oostsaanen: Mary With the Child and Angels, detail. Berlin-Dahlem, Gemäldegalerie der Staatlichen Museen. (Museum photo)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII.</td>
<td>Jacob Cornelisz. van Oostsaanen: Mary With the Child and Angels, detail. Berlin-Dahlem, Gemäldegalerie der Staatlichen Museen. (Museum photo)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX.</td>
<td>After Jan van Eyck: The Fountain of Life. Madrid, Museo del Prado. (Museum photo)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X.</td>
<td>After Jan van Eyck: The Fountain of Life, detail. Madrid, Museo del Prado. (Museum photo)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XI.</td>
<td>Hieronymus Bosch: The Garden of Delights Madrid, Museo del Prado. (Museum photo)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XII.</td>
<td>Hieronymus Bosch: The Garden of Delights, detail. Madrid, Museo del Prado. (Museum photo)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
XIII. Hieronymus Bosch: *The Haywain*, Madrid, Museo del Prado, (Museum photo) .............. 62

XIV. Hieronymus Bosch: *The Haywain*, detail. Madrid, Museo del Prado. (Museum photo) ........ 63


XVI. Jacob Cornelisz. van Oostsaanen: *Adoration of the Christ Child*, Naples, Museo e Gallerie Nazionali di Capodimonte. (Museum photo) .......... 81

XVII. Jacob Cornelisz. van Oostsaanen: *Adoration of the Christ Child*, detail. Naples, Museo e Gallerie Nazionali di Capodimonte. (Museum photo) .................. 82


XX. After Hieronymus Bosch: *The Concert in the Egg*, Lille, Palais des Beaux-Arts. (Museum photo) .... 94


XXIV. Premier livre des chansons a quatre parties ... T. Susato, Anvers, 1543. Tenor part-book, fol. 16. .................................................. 109

XXV. Ambrosius Benson: *Couples at Table*, Basel, Kunstmuseum. (Museum photo) ............... 120
XXVI. Master of the Female Half-Lengths: Magdalene. Rotterdam, Museum Boymans-van Beuningen. (Museum photo)............... 125

XXVII. Master of the Female Half-Lengths: Magdalene, detail (inverted). Rotterdam, Museum Boymans-van Beuningen. (Museum photo)............... 126

XXVIII. Master of the Female Half-Lengths: Magdalene. Hamburg, Kunsthalle. (Museum photo)............... 127

XXIX. Master of the Female Half-Lengths: Magdalene, detail (inverted). Hamburg, Kunsthalle. (Museum photo)............... 128

XXX. Master of the Female Half-Lengths: Magdalene. Turin, Galleria Sabauda. (Chomon-Perino photo)........................ 129

XXXI. Master of the Female Half-Lengths: Magdalene, detail (inverted). Turin, Galleria Sabauda. (Chomon-Perino photo)........................ 130

XXXII. Master of the Female Half-Lengths: Three Female Musicians. Vienna, Schloss Rohrau. (Museum photo)........................ 140

XXXIII. Master of the Female Half-Lengths: Three Female Musicians, detail (inverted). Vienna, Schloss Rohrau. (Museum photo)........................ 141

XXXIV. Master of the Female Half-Lengths: Three Female Musicians, detail (inverted). Vienna, Schloss Rohrau. (Museum photo)........................ 141

XXXV. Willem Key: Portrait of Lady Helen Leslie. Edinburgh, National Gallery of Scotland. (Tom Scott photo)........................ 149

XXXVI. Willem Key: Portrait of Lady Helen Leslie, detail. Edinburgh, National Gallery of Scotland. (Tom Scott photo)........................ 150

XXXVII. Hans Holbein the Younger: The Ambassadors. London, National Gallery. (Museum photo).............. 158

XXXVIII. Hans Holbein the Younger: The Ambassadors, detail. London, National Gallery. (Museum photo)........................ 159
CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

Representations of music in the visual arts have fascinated many musicians and been a source of information to some. In the former case, writers and publishers have found pictures of musical subjects a way of enlivening the page and showing, only in the most general manner, the place of music in the visual arts. Some writers have chosen their illustrations with care to demonstrate the position of music in the society with which they have dealt. Often, however, these illustrations have been referred to only in passing, leaving it to the reader to judge their significance for himself.

The fascination of musical subjects in the visual arts has led to the publication of numerous collections of reproductions. Many of these, under the general title "a history of music in pictures," are nothing more than collections of pictures with little or no comment, spanning decades in the history of music. As such, they are both tantalizing and frustrating—providing some information but leaving the reader with questions as to what has not been included. They do, however, give a starting point for the serious
student of musical iconography. The intent of these collections is not to present an exhaustive study of musical iconography, but, as Kinsky said in 1929:

The intention is to mirror music history's course throughout the centuries and present the reflections to our readers 'in pictures,' although we realize that pictorial representations can be but makeshifts in visualizing the growth of an art of sound of a different variety from our own. Yet pictorial representations are in many cases the only aids to an insight into the musical life and activity of bygone times...

Komma followed Kinsky's general plan in his 1961 Musikgeschichte in Bildern, giving a bit more commentary on each of the reproductions. From these beginnings arose the new series of books dealing with musical iconography in various contexts under the general editorship of Heinrich Besseler, Max Schneider, Werner Bachmann, and Walter Salmen. This series, also entitled Musikgeschichte in Bildern, presents visual representations of music with extensive commentary, devoting each volume and part to a specific subject. The exceptionally fine reproductions in the series illustrate such areas as drawings in theoretical manuscripts,


concert life, and sixteenth-century musical life.

A second classification of studies of musical iconography are those dealing primarily with representations of musical instruments. These organological studies have been of value in determining the characteristics and kinds of instruments and how they were used in different historical periods. Emanuel Winternitz, Geneviève Thibault, and others have examined a variety of visual sources from this point of view. Probably the single most important point made by any of these studies is that iconographic sources may provide valuable evidence for both instrument construction and performance practices, but must always be approached with care. Mirimonde describes a portrait of a musician by Tadeo Zacchia showing a strange instrument appearing to be a viol with the neck of a violin. It seems that when the painting was cleaned during the nineteenth century it was done carelessly and during restoration the neck of the viol was repainted incorrectly.¹ Other errors in the visual representation of instruments and performances may arise from the artist's lack of musical understanding or from pictorial requirements. ⁵ One must always approach visual representations


⁵ Emanuel Winternitz, "The Visual Arts as a Source for the Historian of Music," Musical Instruments and Their Symbolism in Western Art (London: Faber and Faber, 1967), pp. 38-41 gives a tabulation of the factors to be considered in determining the realism of musical depictions.
of musical subjects with the consideration that the artist was not just a chronicler of contemporary life, but a creative individual using music as an adjunct to his vision.

Lesure has been careful to consider this point in his collection of reproductions entitled Musik und Gesellschaft im Bild. The paintings were chosen to represent views of musical life as it concerned patrons and producers, amateurs and professionals. Through a collection covering the sixteenth through the nineteenth centuries, Lesure presents paintings with musical subjects or symbolism to show music as a diversion for the privileged classes, as ornaments of life for the lower classes, and as political or religious weapons.

In a similar vein, Richard Leppert has recently presented a study of musical life as depicted in the Spanish Netherlands of the seventeenth century. He considers organological aspects not only in terms of realistic depiction, but as they relate to allegorical and symbolic musical activities. His catalog of 770 paintings, even without the separate volume of text, is a valuable contribution to the literature. It gives the theme and setting of each painting together with a listing of all the instruments and their


players, if any. If a piece of music is shown (a book, sheet, or roll), that too, is indicated in the catalog with an identification of its location (placed on a table, held by an angel, and the like). Unfortunately, the catalog does not identify the piece of music if it can be read. Perhaps these will be included in H. Colin Slim's forthcoming study of musical inscriptions for the Répertoire International d'Iconographie Musicale series.

The study of music accurately copied in the visual arts is of rather recent origin. It is not uncommon to find that a piece of music included in a painting has been identified but the reasons for the choice of that particular piece have been little considered. Only in recent years have music and art historians begun to study musical quotations systematically with a view to the iconographic reasons for their incorporation in the visual arts. Max Seiffert foreshadowed this kind of approach in his study of the "picture motet" in the Netherlands, published in 1929 as an expansion and continuation of his "Bildzeugnisse des 16. Jahrhunderts" of 1918. These picture motets are a special case, however, for the music is an essential feature of the picture, in most instances an engraving, for which it was


evidently composed and in which it first appeared.

Musical quotations of a different sort are found in both Italian and Flemish Renaissance paintings. In these, the music most often seems to have been chosen to define a particular aspect of the painting. Pieter Fischer's recent monograph, *Music in Paintings of the Low Countries in the 16th and 17th Centuries*, 10 deals with the inclusion of musical quotations in both paintings and prints. His discussion of music in the "Vanitas" paintings of the seventeenth century is particularly interesting. Working from a premise that painting subjects and styles differed in the north and south Netherlands, especially because of religious differences, Fischer describes the use of musical quotations for "... important symbolic functions of diverse kinds, from the simplest to the most complex and exalted." 11

An examination of the almost four thousand paintings reproduced in the new edition of Max Friedländer's *Early Netherlandish Painting*12 shows that ninety-two include some indication of musical notation. This number represents only


11. Ibid., p. 1.

those paintings showing a scroll, sheet, or book associated with instrumentalists or singers. The number of paintings depicting performers without music is much larger. In general terms, the paintings implying or including some form of musical notation are those depicting happy scenes. A great number of Nativities include singing angels, often holding a scroll or sheet as do many Coronations of the Virgin. Depositions, Deaths of the Virgin, and the like do not seem to use music at all. Secular scenes including music may be broadly described as those showing private music-making, either solo or group performances, and those showing public merry-making for which music is an essential entertainment.

Evidence of musical notation ranges from books, sheets, and scrolls shown from the back so that no notation is visible, through those with simulated notation of lines and dots, to accurate copies of musical excerpts or even entire polyphonic compositions. The purpose of this study is to illustrate and describe, through a few representative examples, these levels in the depiction of musical notation, to some extent a chronological development. Each of the paintings discussed has been chosen as representative of a subject area—sacred, secular, allegoric, satiric, or moralistic. The premise of this study is that when artists included a recognizable musical quotation, they chose one with a significant relationship to the subject of the painting rather than simply suggesting "music" in general.
this latter purpose, simulated musical notation provided a sufficient visual clue.

Because Netherlandish panel painting grew out of manuscript illumination, this study will begin with a brief discussion of depictions of music in these earlier sources. The use of simulated notation will be discussed in Chapter II, and quotations of actual musical compositions will be considered in the third chapter. For the continuation of musical subjects and styles in the seventeenth century, the reader is referred to the studies by Fischer and Leppert.

****

The inclusion of musical subjects in works of visual art has a long tradition. Friezes, reliefs, vases, and other decorative or utilitarian objects from early cultures often depict musicians. Examples of Etruscan, Mesopotamian, Egyptian, and Greek origin give evidence of instrumental music used for entertainment, for rites, and for festivals.\(^\text{13}\) Medieval manuscript miniatures also contain many illustrations of musicians of various types and in various settings. Sometimes the musicians are theorists or composers; sometimes they are performers. Often these performers are angels, either singing or playing instruments, and occasionally they hold a scroll simulating a piece of music.

\(^{13}\) Komma, *Musikgeschichte in Bildern*, pp. 1-17 reproduces a variety of examples from ancient sources.
music.

Sheets or scrolls, sometimes blank, sometimes with text, and sometimes with lines and dots were often included in the miniatures to depict a piece of music. They were included in pictures of composers as symbols of their work, and in sacred pictures to illustrate the singing of angels. Because Netherlandish painting grew from the miniature tradition, these symbolic pieces of music were taken into the symbolic language of the panel painters. At first the painters used these in the manner of the miniaturists, but later they began to copy musical compositions, both to achieve greater realism, and to enhance the symbolism in a painting. A brief examination of the miniature tradition will demonstrate the types of musical subjects and symbols that were incorporated later in the works of the panel painters.

The Miniature Tradition

Especially frequent in medieval manuscript illuminations showing musicians are pictures of that most famous biblical musician, King David. In an eighth-century codex in the British Museum, he is shown surrounded by musicians, and playing the rota. The king is again shown with a

rotta in the tonary of the Lat. 1118 manuscript in Paris, and playing the psaltry in a number of other miniatures.

Pictures of theorists and composers are also found in manuscript illuminations. Guido of Arezzo and his pupil Theodal are shown with a monochord in a twelfth-century manuscript; in another, he is shown, again with the monochord, with those two other major figures in medieval music treatises, King David and Pythagoras. In this miniature, King David is shown with a harp, and Pythagoras is listening to the hammers in a smithy, which led him to the derivation of intervallic proportions. A cleric, perhaps Guido himself, explains the Guidonian hand in a marvelous miniature from the 1274 music treatise Scientia artis musicae of Elias Salomo. The tonsured cleric, with rosy cheeks, points with his right hand to his huge left hand which grows, evidently without benefit of an arm, directly out of his torso. The inscriptions on the hand show the natural, hard, and soft hexachords.


17. Milan, Biblioteca Ambrosiana, Cod. D 75 inf., fol. 6r.

18. Van Waesberghe, Musikersiehung, p. 136 and plate 72 gives a color reproduction.
The poet-musician Guillaume de Machaut, with Amor, Doux Penser, Plaisance, and Espérance, is shown in a miniature in one of the manuscripts of his *Louange des dames*. The composers Dufay and Binchois, with portative organ and harp, are together in another miniature. This illumination is in a manuscript of Martin Le Franc's *Le Champion des dames*, which was prepared for Philip the Good and was dated 1451 and signed by J. Boignan d'Arras, the copyist, on fol. 147v. The miniature of Dufay and Binchois was intended to illustrate the passage concerning the novel style of these two composers.

---

**Tapissier, Carmen, Césaris**

N'a pas longtemps si bien chanterrent
Ou'ilz esbahirent tout Paris
Et tous ceulx qui les fréquenterrent;
Mais onques jour ne deschanterrent
En melodie de tel chois
Ce m'ont dit qui les hanterrent
Que G. Du Fay et Binchois.
Car ilz ont nouvelle pratique
De faire frisque concordance
En haulte et basse musique,
En fainte, en pause, et en muance,
Et ont pris de la contenance
Angloise et ensuy Dunstable,
Pour quoy merveilleuse plaisance
Rend leur chant joyeux et notable.

---


Tapissier, Carmen, Césarís
In recent times so well did sing
They were the wonder of Paris entire
And of all those who gathered there.
But still their discant tunes were not so choice
Nor filled with charming melody
As—so I'm told by those who know them—
Those of G. Du Fay and Binchois.
For these have found a newer way
Of making fresh bright concordance
In public music and in private songs
With ficta, rests and mutation.
Now they've learned the English way,
And Dunstable's their model
In making songs of wondrous charm,
Music joyous and far-famed. 21

Pieces of music, too, are shown in some miniatures. Early illuminations usually show only a blank page or one with some lines to simulate music; later ones sometimes have words written on the page. A thirteenth-century manuscript in Munich, illustrating how Pope Gregory I received the chants directly from the Holy Spirit (in the form of a dove), has a quotation from Psalm 150, "Laudate Dominum in organis," written on the pages of books by two scribes. The quotation obviously refers to the figure of King David as an organist in the other half of the miniature. 22 Later some miniatures have what appears to be music, written on books, sheets, or scrolls. One miniature in a Machaut manuscript depicts a group of singers reading from a rotulus on which


there are staves and note forms. A well-known sixteenth-century miniature shows Ockeghem and his choir performing a "Gloria in Excelsis Deo" from a large sheet inscribed with words and note forms placed on a choirbook stand.

It is not surprising that the tradition of including music and musicians in miniatures should have been transferred to Renaissance panel painting in both the North and in Italy. As a consequence of the larger picture area, painters could not only simulate music notation, but could include actual musical quotations. It appears that when a painter chose to include a musical quotation, most often it was done for a specific iconographic reason rather than for a purely decorative purpose.

The Political and Social Climate

During the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries the Low Countries came under the control of the Dukes of Burgundy and their heirs, with ties to the Hapsburgs and to the Spanish throne. When Philip the Bold was given the duchy of Lower Burgundy in 1363, he began a unification of the diverse


population of the region. Through marriage he consolidated a large area including Burgundy, Flanders, Artois, Brabant, and Nevers. When he was succeeded in 1404 by his son John the Fearless, the unification process was well under way. John, and his successor, Philip the Good, added to the domain through fortuitous marriage, conquest, and purchase so that the areas of influence extended to the north and east of the lands held by the French crown. Charles the Bold, the last of the Burgundian dukes, was killed at the battle of Nancy in 1477 attempting to consolidate the region even more through the conquest of French holdings.

Under the leadership of Philip the Good, the court became one of the most illustrious in Europe, attracting artists, musicians, and writers into its sphere. Dumont quotes Paul Lambotte as having written: "Only Greece, no larger in size, is comparable to Belgium for its role in the creation and development of its original art, for the fertility of its masters, and the duration of their glory." 25 Mees describes the Burgundian period in terms of a five-pointed star with developments in painting, architecture, music, literature, and science as its points. 26


University of Louvain was founded early in the period (1425), and was to influence intellectual life for a century. Agriculture and commerce flourished; the first commercial exchange in Europe was established in 1460 in Bruges. An export trade in fine woolens, fish, lace, tapestries, and paintings supplied the needs of other countries.  

Under Philip the Good's son, Charles the Bold (1467-1477), the region was torn by social unrest and retribution. Many of the important cities, including Ghent and Liège, felt the wrath of Charles and suffered under heavy fines and taxation for his armies. On his death, the holdings passed to Mary of Burgundy who married the Archduke Maximilian, son of Emperor Frederick III. The provinces supported their marriage, hoping that the alliance with the Hapsburgs would protect them from the French under Louis XI, and in fact, Louis was defeated at Guinegate in 1479.

Following Mary of Burgundy's death, Maximilian was forced to subdue uprisings in Flanders in order to secure the regency on behalf of the two children from the marriage, Philip the Handsome and Marguerite of Austria. When Maximilian became Emperor of the Holy Roman Empire, he handed the Low Countries over to his son who expanded the political connections through his marriage to Jeanne of Aragon, daughter of Ferdinand and Isabella of Spain.

When Philip died suddenly in Spain in 1506, the Low Countries fell to his son Charles, still a minor. His aunt Marguerite of Austria became governor, and followed Maximilian's policy of warfare for reconquest of lost regions.

Her knowledge and patronage of the arts were too extensive for recapitulation; but politics interested her most, and after the death of her last husband, the duke of Savoy, in 1504, she was anxious to return and govern the Netherlands for either Philip or Maximilian. Her hostility to the Crown of France was no mere personal rancour deriving from her rejection by Charles VIII, but sprang from her Burgundian dynasticism, for while she knew that the Netherlands made the fortune of her family she thought of Dijon as its capital.

Charles inherited Castile, Aragon, Naples, Sicily, Spanish America, and the Indies from his mother. Through his grandfather Maximilian, he inherited Milan, the Low Countries, the Franche-Comté, the Artois, Austria, the Tyrol, and Styria, and became the head of the Hapsburgs. When he ascended the throne as King of Spain, he conferred the powers of regent on Marguerite.

In spite of the political wars throughout the Burgundian period, and the Reformation in the sixteenth century, the Low Countries flourished. The northern provinces became mostly Protestant; the southern ones remained Catholic. In 1581 the northern provinces declared independence.


from Spain, remaining strongly Protestant and becoming a dominant power in commerce and industry. The southern provinces became a center for the Counter-Reformation but fell behind in commercial development.

**Flemish Painting**

Regardless of political machinations, internal and external wars, and religious strife, the Low Countries developed techniques in the arts which would influence the rest of Europe. Netherlandish painters and musicians traveled throughout Europe and contributed to the development of an international style. Developments in polyphony cultivated by northern composers—expansion of the number of voice parts, equality of voices through imitation, lowering of range and the creation of a true bass part—were carried to Italy by the many Netherlandish composers employed there. Italian painters incorporated the northern techniques of oil painting and naturalistic expression into their work.

The development of the technique of painting with oil-base pigment has traditionally been credited to Jan van Eyck. Carel van Mander says: "As far as I can learn, Johannes invented the process of oil painting in the year 1410." 30

Whether or not the invention of oil painting was Jan's alone, Van Mander gives a version of how the technique reached Italy through Antonello of Messina. There is some doubt that Antonello was ever in the Netherlands as described by Van Mander and the question of how he learned the technique is beyond the scope of this study. It is sufficient here that the technique was a northern one which was adopted by Italian painters.

The Flemish panel painters developed from the miniature tradition cultivated throughout the region, with roots in Italian and Parisian book painting. The French court was a stimulus for the production of manuscripts and for manuscript illumination. The development of naturalism begun in fourteenth-century France and evidenced in book paintings was taken over and expanded by the Netherlandish panel painters. As the political fortunes of the French court waned, in part because of the expenses of the Hundred Years' War, and the Burgundian court increased in power, manuscript production in the Netherlands grew.

John, the Duke of Berry, brother of Philip the Bold, was the instigator for the creation of a group of books of hours, among them the so-called Brussels Hours.\footnote{Brussels: Bibliothèque Royale de Belgique, Ms. 11060-11061.} This book, dating from about 1402, was attributed to Jacquemart de Hesdin, who was in the employ of the duke in Bourges, in
the duke's inventories. Historically, its importance lies in
the full-page miniatures which take on the characteristics of
very small panel paintings. Cuttler describes Italianate
and northern elements in these miniatures and says: "The
elegance of the International Style is enhanced by the great-
er, apparently Flemish naturalism..."32

Following the path opened by Jacquemart de Hesdin,
the Limbourg brothers, Pol, Herman, and Jehanquin, developed
this new naturalism in their illuminations for the Très
Riches Heures de Duc de Berry.33 This book of hours is
remarkable for its calendar cycle of twelve scenes represent-
ing the twelve months. Some of the miniatures are of elegant
court life, with banquets, hunting parties, sumptuous clothing
and ornaments; others depict the more prosaic life of the
lower classes as they till the fields, shear sheep, and warm
themselves by the fire on a winter day.

The Très Riches Heures, illustrated by the Limbourg
brothers between 1413 and 1416, was incomplete at the duke's
death in 1416 and was abandoned. It was not completed until
seventy years later by Jean Colombe.34 The miniatures of

32. Charles D. Cuttler, Northern Painting from
Pucelle to Bruegel (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston,

33. Chantilly, Musée Condé.

34. Alastair Smart, The Renaissance and Mannerism
in Northern Europe and Spain (London: Thames and Hudson, 1972),
p. 24.
the Très Riches Heures demonstrate a transition between the Gothic tradition and a new spirit of naturalism. As Smart puts it:

The brothers Limbourg can ... be seen both as the heirs to traditions deriving from the courtly style of International Gothic, which finds its own consummation in their delicately sensitive art, and as forerunners of a new manner which was to turn away from the purely ornamental graces of International Gothic in its exploration of nature and in its deeper concern for humanity. It is their astonishing powers of observation, whether in their marvellous landscapes or in their sympathetic portrayal of the common man, that remain their most memorable qualities, and relate them to the great school of Netherlandish painting founded by Jan van Eyck, the Master of Flémalle and Rogier van der Weyden.  

Manuscript production in the Low Countries continued to grow in quantity and elegance throughout the Burgundian period. A marvellous music manuscript which belonged to Marguerite of Austria, dating from the last third of the fifteenth century, has the notation and text in silver and gold on black paper. As they grew in elegance, so too did these music manuscripts grow in scribal care. A choir-book prepared for Philip the Handsome and Jeanne of Aragon gives a beautiful example of this scribal care in notation. The stems of the notes are approximately the same length, so

35. Smart, Renaissance and Mannerism, p. 27.

36. Basses Dances de Marguerite d'Austriche, Brussels, Bibliothèque Royale, No. 9085. A color reproduction may be found in Wangermée, Flemish Music, plates 57 and 58.
that they follow the rise and fall of the note heads accurately. The note heads are sharply drawn and are of approximately the same size and shape throughout without crowding the staves.\textsuperscript{37} Charles van den Borren has said of the quantity and quality of these manuscripts:

\begin{quote}
Manuscripts, circulating in abundance, carry the message of this art, at the same time so vigorous and refined, to the four corners of Europe. These are sometimes loose sheets that the artists distributed among themselves (but which have, for the most part, disappeared), sometimes choirbooks destined for everyday use, or for exhibition. In the last case, the parchment is decorated to the glory of musicians and their protectors, with admirably drawn notes, with capitals, with marvelously executed miniatures and arabesques. No epoch has known, in this regard, a greater display of luxury than the end of the fifteenth century and the first quarter of the sixteenth.\textsuperscript{38}
\end{quote}

\textbf{Music Printing}

Parallel to the golden age of manuscript production was the development of music printing. Although Johann Gutenberg had perfected the printing of books using movable type in 1450 and the technique had been sporadically applied to the printing of liturgical books using plainchant notation by 1475, it was not until 1501 that the first book

\textsuperscript{37} Brussels, Bibliothèque Royale No. 9126. A color reproduction is in Wangermée, \textit{Flemish Music}, plate 28.

\textsuperscript{38} Charles van den Borren, "D'Ockeghem à Josquin, ou l'Âge d'or de la polyphonie néerlandaise," in \textit{La Musique en Belgique} (Brussels: La Renaissance du Livre, 1950), p. 175.
of polyphonic music was printed. This book, the *Harmonice Musices Odhecaton A* printed by Ottaviano Petrucci, employed a triple impression technique of printing with movable type. That is, the page was imprinted three times, the first for the text and initials, the second for the staff, and the third for the notes.  

Petrucci had petitioned for the exclusive privilege of printing music for voices, lute, and organ in Venice in 1498. On May 14, 1501, almost three years later, he issued his first publication. This collection of part-music was followed by his *Canti B* (1502) and *Canti C* (1504). Together, these publications provide a particularly rich source for Franco-Flemish chansons.

The problems of developing a process for the printing of mensural music by a single impression for both the note and staff occupied a number of printers and engravers. Daniel Heartz has found evidence that points to Pierre Attaingnant as the developer of a new method for making type that would carry both the note and staff and would join precisely when set. He concludes that Attaingnant designed and engraved the type for his *Chansons nouvelles* of 1528. Concerning the part-books of this set, Heartz says: "... they showed the world not only a radically different method of

---

printing but a musical genre that was prophetic in its simple, yet telling harmonic language—the 'new' or 'Parisian' chanson 

The first volume of music printed in the Low Countries using movable type was a chansonnier entitled Een devoot ende profitelijck boeckzen, inhoudende veel gheestelijcke Liedekens ende Leysenen, printed by Symon Cock in Antwerp in 1538. It used a double impression technique, one for the notes in black, the other for the red staff. The first single impression music printing in the Low Countries was done by Tylman Susato in Antwerp with his collection Modulationes quatuor vocum musicae, in collaboration with Guillaume van Vissenaecken in 1542. The following year Susato published his first collection alone, issued as the Premier livre des chansons, à quatre parties ..., also in Antwerp. Susato became one of the foremost music printers in the north, issuing a large number of prints of both secular and sacred music until 1561.

A primary consequence of the widespread use of


41. Bergmans, La typographie musicale, pp. 53-54.


43. Ibid., p. 30. 44. Ibid., p. 34.
manuscripts, and later, prints of Flemish music was to spread the fame and, in turn, the style of Flemish composers. Petrucci's prints at the beginning of the sixteenth century, containing a large number of works by Flemish composers, indicate the popularity of the northern style. As more and more music became available through the collections issued by various printers, painters began to employ a greater variety of musical quotations in their paintings. No longer depending solely on the words written on a book, sheet, or scroll, they began to include musical notation with the expectation that it would be understood by a respectable percentage of the viewers. As they expanded the variety of musical quotations from chants and familiar hymns to popular secular songs, they created both a greater naturalism and a more sophisticated symbolic language in their paintings. Fortunately, painters did not often abandon the texts of musical quotations in favor of the notation alone. Today the texts make identification of musical quotations easier.

**Flemish Music**

In music, as in painting, the North made contributions which were to have an impact on the arts throughout Europe. That a new spirit in music became evident in the fifteenth century has already been seen in Martin Le Franc's *Le Champion des dames*, where he says that Dufay and Binchois
have "found a newer way." Tinctoris too, writing about 1475, says:

At this time ... the possibilities of our music have been so marvelously increased that there appears to be a new art, if I may so call it, whose fount and origin is held to be among the English, of whom Dunstable stood forth as chief. Contemporary with him in France were Dufay and Binchois, to whom directly succeeded the moderns Ockeghem, Busnoys, Regis and Caron, who are the most excellent of all the composers I have ever heard.

This new style spread the fame of Flemish composers throughout Europe and many of these composers travelled to Italy, where they found employment. The popularity of the Flemish style at the beginning of the sixteenth century, as reflected in Petrucci's early collections, has already been mentioned. Rabelais, writing in the middle of the century, also attests to the fame of these early Flemish composers. In the Prologue to the Fourth Book of Pantagruel (published in 1548), he has Priapus describe having heard two groups of musicians performing rather obscene songs. Some of these musicians had been dead almost a half-century at the time of the writing, others were contemporary with Rabelais. The list reads like a who's who in Renaissance composition and includes a number of Flemish composers.

These literary references to Flemish musicians only serve to emphasize the fame of the northern musical style and to indicate that the music of these composers would be recognized by the majority of sophisticated viewers. A painter could use quotations from the chansons of these composers with the expectation that viewers would interpret their meaning correctly.

The Synthesis of Painting and Music

Many Flemish painters found, as had the illuminators before them, that musical instruments, books, sheets, and scrolls could be used to add a new dimension to the meaning of a picture. Early attempts to indicate music on books and scrolls took the form of text indications or quotations. The Très Riches Heures de Duc de Berry has a miniature of the angels singing at the Adoration of the Magi (fol. 52r.) and reading from a musical scroll. The red letter "G" presumably indicates that they are singing "Gloria in excelsis Deo et in terra pax hominibus." The early panel painters followed this practice, and expanded it to include the text as the Master of Flémalle did in the Nativity at Dijon. 46

No readable musical notation is found in Flemish paintings until after the middle of the fifteenth century.

Although the Van Eycks and the Master of Flémalle included musical or singing angels in some of their works, only the Ghent Altarpiece has any indication of musical notation. One panel of the altarpiece has a group of instrument-playing angels standing behind an organ. No music is in evidence although there could have been some for the organist. The companion panel of the altarpiece has a group of angels singing from a choirbook placed on a stand so that only the very top of the book is visible and a few partial notes may be seen. There is a copy of a painting by Jan van Eyck in which some notation is barely legible. The original of this painting was in the Prado, but was destroyed in 1608. The copy, in Versailles, shows a scene of ladies and gentlemen of the court of Philip the Good in a grove after a hunt. One man, in a group of singers, holds a sheet of music on which Heinrich Besseler thought he could read a part of the Binchois "Filles à marier" chanson. Besseler also thought that the gentleman with the music might be Binchois himself. Whether the music was in the original painting, or added by the copyist is not known; however both Jan van Eyck and Binchois were at the Burgundian court at the same time.

The first known Flemish painting to contain a musical quotation, if one disregards the Van Eyck copy, is the well-known Bonkil panel of the *Trinity Altarpiece Shutters* by Hugo van der Goes in the National Gallery of Scotland dated about 1475. The panel (discussed in detail in Chapter III) shows Sir Edward Bonkil kneeling beside an organ played by an angel. On the music rack of the organ is an open music book inscribed with the hymn to the Trinity, "O Lux beata Trinitas." The chant notation and text are easily read, and it apparently refers to the Trinity College Church where Sir Edward was Provost.

Perhaps other paintings of this type also contained musical quotations, but many were destroyed by the iconoclasts during the religious strife of the Reformation and Counter-Reformation. At any rate, lacking other evidence, Fischer says that the *Trinity Altarpiece Shutter* of Sir Edward Bonkil is the "oldest Dutch work of art we know which has a musical composition on it." As more painters began to adopt the use of musical quotations, they too seem to have chosen them with care so that the inherent meaning of the text related to the picture subject. Not only did they use chants and hymns, they also quoted popular chansons. A viewer could be expected to recognise the significance of

"Si j'ayme mon amy trop plus que mon mary" in some representations of the Magdalene, or the satire of "Toutes les nuits que sans vous je me couche" sung by monks and nuns.

Unfortunately, as styles of music changed over the years, the ability to recognise these compositions was lost. Scholars studying musical iconography of Renaissance painting concentrated on the musical instruments rather than the musical quotations, even when they recognised the composition. It has remained for twentieth-century scholars to rekindle an understanding of the iconographic uses of musical inscriptions in Renaissance painting. The following chapters will explore a variety of Flemish paintings from the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries which contain some indication of musical notation, implied, simulated, or actual. Because of the number of Flemish paintings containing an indication of musical notation, representative works have been chosen to demonstrate the variety of subjects and musical quotations used by painters of the period. There has been no attempt to link Flemish paintings of this type with Italian painting using the same devices. The use of musical quotations in Italian painting is equally extensive and beyond the scope of this study.
CHAPTER II

PAINTINGS WITH SIMULATED MUSIC NOTATION

In an age of symbolism—the symbolism of flowers, of animals, of devices and ornaments—it is not surprising to discover the ultimately abstract symbol of musical notation included in the panoply of iconographic devices. Music, that most elusive of the arts, achieving reality only through re-creation by means of abstract symbols, subject to countless interpretations and re-interpretations, and endowed from antiquity with characteristics of good or evil, was given an added dimension in Renaissance visual art. Musical notes, either simulated or real, subtly expand the iconographic system of many Northern Renaissance paintings in representations of saints and sinners, of lust and love, of abandon and moderation.

Musical notation, or the illusion of notation, is found in a variety of visual media: in miniatures, tapestries, prints, and panel paintings. It was used to indicate the singing of angels, the delights of the pleasure garden, the work of a composer, or the character of the person depicted.

Musical quotations in paintings did not suddenly burst on the scene with Hugo van der Goes' Trinity Altarpiece.
Shutters. Many Flemish painters continued to use the various techniques for indicating music that had been common to the miniature tradition. Blank books or scrolls, those shown only from the back, or those inscribed with lines and random dots created the illusion of a piece of music as an accompaniment to entertainment, amorous dalliance, religious devotion, or even sacrilege. This chapter will examine some of the Flemish paintings that suggest music but do not incorporate actual quotations into the iconographic system. All of the paintings included in this chapter are sacred; some are devotional in nature, others moralistic.

Devotional Paintings

Nativities

Paintings of the Nativity are among the most often used subjects in the north and appear to incorporate musical angels as a standard device. Many of these paintings are similar and have been traced to a few source works so that frequently the musical angels are also similar. Many do not include legible music, and indeed some do not even include a scroll for the singing angels.

The Nativity by Night (Plate I) in Dunedin was thought to be by Jan Joest but is now attributed to an

1. Dunedin, New Zealand: Public Art Gallery; 69 x 50 cm.
unknown follower of Hugo van der Goes. Although reminiscent of the architectural setting of Hugo's Monforte Altarpiece in Berlin, the Dunedin work lacks the elegance of detail and monumentality of that work. It is much closer in concept to the tiny Nativity by Night of Geertgen tot sint Jans in London, particularly in the striking chiaroscuro developed by the light emanating from the Christ Child in the manger. The carefully detailed play of light in the Dunedin painting is carried throughout the work, lighting folds of cloth, cheekbones, locks of hair, mortar seams, straw thatching, and clusters of leaves. The foreground is in darkness as the light rises from the manger to illuminate the entire scene.

Kneeling at the feet of the Christ Child, the Madonna stretches our her hands as if to reach for him. As is so often the case in Nativities of this period, her face reflects only serenity; there is no hint of character other than purity reflected here. This is in marked contrast to the strong rendering of the face of Joseph and those of the two shepherds looking through the open portal. Angels gather above, three of them singing from a scroll, with one


pointing to the place. This motive of the pointing finger recurs frequently in renderings of singers as will be seen again in other works. The small part of the front of the scroll visible to the viewer contains no notation or hatching to simulate notation (Plate II).

The inclusion of singing angels in the Nativity scene is a traditional device; in some scenes an indication is given of the song of the angels (see page 26), but in others only a blank scroll is shown. A Nativity by Jacques Daret shows a group of angels similar to that in the Dunedin work, the angels again singing from a blank scroll. Other painters included hatchings and dots on the scroll to simulate notation. An anonymous Flemish Nativity, dated about 1510, now in the Columbus Gallery of Fine Arts (Plates III and IV), shows what is clearly a four-line staff filled with dots representing notes but having no meaning. At least one painter included a full four-voice setting of the "Gloria in excelsis Deo, et in terra pax hominibus" text before the middle of the sixteenth century. This Adoration of the Christ Child by Jacob Cornelisz. van Oostsaanen will be discussed in Chapter III.

Plate II. School of Hugo van der Goes: Nativity, detail. Dunedin, Public Art Gallery. (Museum photo).
Plate III. Flemish: Nativity. Columbus Gallery of Fine Arts, Ohio: Gift of the Hildreth Foundation in memory of Mr. & Mrs. Louis R. Hildreth. (Museum photo).
Plate IV. Flemish: Nativity, detail. Columbus Gallery of Fine Arts, Ohio. (Museum photo).
The Madonna and Child

Another subject frequently encountered in paintings of this period is that of the Madonna and Child, either alone or in a group of the Holy Family or saints. Often there are attendant musical angels, but seldom are they shown with music from which to perform.

The Amsterdam *Holy Family Altarpiece* (Plate V) by the so-called Master of Delft was painted about 1510 according to Friedländer, who places the master's birth about 1470. Friedländer says that this painter broke with tradition by including scenes from the Passion in other works, by showing noisy crowds and especially children where they didn't belong, and by creating the illusion of spontaneous movement.6

The center panel of the altarpiece7 shows the Madonna holding a standing, rather inquisitive, Child in her lap. She is placed in the center of a raised courtyard with Joseph, two unidentified female saints, and three angels. The attention of Joseph and the other companions is centered on the Madonna and Child. Only the Child's attention is drawn elsewhere—to a vision in the sky, shown by a pair of angels foretelling the Passion. The typically Dutch landscape background creates a placid atmosphere with its rolling


7. Amsterdam: Rijksmuseum, No. 1538LI; 84.5 x 68 cm. (central panel).
hills, harbour, and quiet town.

The musical angels are rather plain in comparison with the luxurious dress of the two female saints or the heavy modelling of Joseph's robe (Plate VI). The angels seem to have only three wings among them, and their robes are quite simple. One has a touch of embroidery at the neck and cuff, the other two have large collars, and the middle angel's collar is ornamented with a large round brooch. None of the angels appear to be enjoying either their music or the company in which they find themselves. In fact, the angel on the right, with a bagpipe, appears distinctly unhappy. There is no real music on the sheet held by the center angel, but music is suggested by lines and dots, much the same as text is indicated in the book held by the female saint on the left.

Jacob Cornelisz. van Oostsaanen (or van Amsterdam) was born about 1470, according to Friedländer, in the village of Oostsaanen, north of Amsterdam. Although he included musical quotations in some paintings (his Adoration of the Christ Child has already been mentioned), in others he only simulated music notation and text by lines and dots.

The Berlin Mary With the Child and Angels, the central panel of a triptych, has the Madonna seated behind a

8. Friedländer, Early Netherlandish Painting, XII, p. 53.
table, holding an overly plump Child in her hands. The Child, wearing an ornate necklace, raises his hand in a gesture of blessing (Plate VII). Above the Madonna, two putti hover with the crown of the Queen of Heaven, and two pairs of musical angels stand just behind the Madonna and Child on either side (Plate VIII). On the left, one plays a lute and one a recorder; on the right, another plays a recorder and one holds a sheet of music. Although there is no real music on the sheet, there is an attempt to make it look real by putting heads on notes and placing the notes on a four-line staff (like liturgical chant); under each staff, hatchings simulate text.

The bustling and detailed landscape background, so much a part of Dutch painting, enhances the serenity of the foreground scene of the Madonna and Child through contrast. The landscape shows village life centered around a castle with people of a variety of classes going about the everyday business of life.

---

9. Berlin-Dahlem: Gemäldegalerie der Staatlichen Museen, No. 607; 42 x 32 cm. (center panel).
Plate VII. Jacob Cornelisz. van Oostsaanen: Mary With the Child and Angels, detail. Berlin-Dahlem, Gemäldegalerie der Staatlichen Museen. (Museum photo).
Plate VIII. Jacob Cornelisz. van Oostsaanen: Mary With the Child and Angels, detail. Berlin-Dahlem: Gemäldegalerie der Staatlichen Museen. (Museum photo).
The Hierarchy of Grace

The **Fountain of Life** in Madrid (Plate IX) is thought to be a copy of an altarpiece by Jan van Eyck.\(^\text{10}\) Friedländer dated the original panel about 1430 and related it to Jan's journey to Portugal for Philip the Good late in 1428.\(^\text{11}\) Jan had been appointed official painter for Philip in 1425 and remained in his service for the rest of his life, as painter, confidant, and emissary.

The concept and composition of this altarpiece are related to the hierarchical arrangement of the **Ghent Altarpiece**\(^\text{12}\) dating from approximately the same period. Placed within an architectural setting recalling the miniature tradition are three levels of grace.\(^\text{13}\) Two groups of figures in the foreground represent conflicting aspects of spiritual life on earth. These groups are gathered on either side of an elaborate golden fountain which pours forth golden Eucharist wafers from a stream originating beneath the lamb.

\(^\text{10}\) Madrid: Museo del Prado, No. 2188B; 181 x 130 cm.

\(^\text{11}\) Friedländer, *Early Netherlandish Painting*, I, p. 70.

\(^\text{12}\) Ghent: Cathedral of St. Bavon; 350 x 439.5 cm.

\(^\text{13}\) An example of a similar architectural setting is in the "Purification in the Temple" miniature of *Les Très Riches Heures*, fol. 54v.
at the foot of the Throne of Grace. References to God as the "fountain of life" or the "fountain of the waters of life" abound in both the Old and New Testaments. John writes of seeing "... a new heaven and a new earth" where he saw God sitting on a throne, and God said, "Ego sitienti dabo de fonte aquae vivae gratis" (Rev. 21:6). 

In the middle ground, separated from the earthly figures by a wall, are four groups of figures without wings, but generally considered to be angels. The groups on each side, within tower-like structures, appear to be singing; the two groups seated in the garden play musical instruments. There is no music in evidence for these angels who play (from left to right) a lira da braccio, portative organ, tromba marina, dulcimer, harp, and lute. What appears to be a music book, held by two angels standing in the left tower, contains only hatchings to simulate music (Plate X). Although no staff is shown, the arrangement of the hatchings perhaps is supposed to represent a book of hymns with music and extra verses below.

The third level shows the Godhead, clothed in a red robe and wearing the papal tiara, seated on a throne. At his feet is a lamb, symbol of the Shepherd and of sacrifice. On his right, clad in a blue robe and reading a book, sits the Virgin; on his left, also reading a book, is John

---

the Baptist.

Comparison of the **Fountain of Life** with the **Ghent Altarpiece** reveals some striking similarities and differences. The most obvious difference is that the **Fountain of Life** compresses into a single panel the essential ideas expressed in the ten interior panels of the **Ghent Altarpiece**, creating a more unified composition. The lines of perspective in the Madrid work lead rather consistently to the Godhead, and the size relationships of the figures generally support that perspective, although the third tier figures are slightly larger than the angels in the middle ground. The heavenly figures are much larger than those of the earthly personages in the Ghent work, and the perspective of the lower panels is separate from that of the upper ones.

The **Mystic Lamb** at the feet of the Father in the **Fountain of Life** is found in the lower central panel of the Ghent piece as the object of adoration. In its place at the feet of the Father in the Ghent painting is the crown of worldly power. Cuttler describes the Adoration panel of the **Ghent Altarpiece** in this manner:

In the foreground, left of the **Fountain of Life**, are the patriarchs and prophets from the old dispensation with Vergil (?); and on the other side are the apostles (seven of whom are kneeling), with Sts. Paul and Barnabas and the martyrs led by St. Stephen and St. Lievin, patron saint of Ghent. In the middle ground of this scene set in Paradise are the bishop confessors, at left, and the (much repainted) virgin martyrs, at right, led
by Sts. Agnes, Barbara, Catherine, and Dorothy.
In the background is the Heavenly Jerusalem.
All adore the Apocalyptic lamb standing on the
altar and bleeding into a chalice. Angels kneel
on either side, some holding the instruments of
the passion, and two angels cense in front of the
altar.\(^{13}\)

In the **Fountain of Life** the "patriarchs and prophets
from the old dispensation" are on the right of the fountain.
They are led by a blindfolded high priest holding a broken
staff with an attached banner inscribed with Hebrew letters.
Another kneeling figure holds the end of a Torah scroll which
is unrolled to show more Hebrew letters. On the left of the
fountain is a group representing "... the Christian Church,
or perhaps ... spiritual and secular power—the Pope, a
cardinal, a bishop, the Emperor, a king, then six figures
that appear to be portraits, although no clear indication of
their estate is given."\(^{16}\)

The variety of musical instruments played by the
angels in the **Fountain of Life** has already been mentioned.
In comparison, the instrumental angels of the **Ghent Altarpiece**
are shown playing only a harp, viol, and positif organ.
Neither painting has any indication of musical scores for
any of the instrumental angels; however this is not

\(^{15}\) Cuttler, Northern Painting, pp. 92-93.

\(^{16}\) Friedländer, Early Netherlandish Painting, I,
p. 70.
particularly unusual. There are many instances throughout the entire period of angels playing instruments without written music.17

The two groups of angels within the tower-like structures may, or may not be singers. An angel in the group on the left holds an open book in which two pages are visible. This angel points to the place in the book which contains only hatchings indicating what seems to be both music and text. As previously stated, perhaps this is intended to be a book of hymns. This is the only angel that appears to be singing; the others are shown in various attitudes, some watching the group of churchmen and princes below, others more interested in the personages on the third tier. The group on the right displays much the same attitudes. In this group one holds an unfurled scroll on which the text "...sancta et fons ortorum puteus aquarum viventes" is legible. The text, in part, is a quotation from the Song of Solomon (4:14)—"a fountain of gardens, a well of living waters" and may refer to the garden in which the musicians are seated. There is no notation or hatching on the scroll, which leaves open the question of whether these angels are singers or not. The text on the scroll is lettered so that it is upside down for the angels, but readable from the viewpoint of the observer.

17. Komma, Musikgeschichte in Bildern, pp. 62 ff. gives examples from various countries throughout the Renaissance.
Similar uses of text for identification or commentary are found in several Van Eyck paintings, including the Ghent Altarpiece. On the exterior shutters of that work are representations of the prophets Zechariah and Micah and the Erythraean and Cumaean sibyls with quotations from each painted on scrolls. The Annunciation scene in the lower panels shows the words of Gabriel's greeting issuing from his mouth; the Virgin's reply is lettered upside down to indicate that it is meant to be read by God the Father. In an interior panel the Godhead is identified as the Trinity by the embroidered inscriptions on his robe.

It is surprising that, considering the careful attention to details of ornamentation and the frequent use of text inscriptions in these works, no known work by the Van Eycks contains readable music notation. There are obvious places for its use in both the Fountain of Life and the Ghent Altarpiece. The organ in the latter, painted from the keyboard side, has neither music rack nor music; the choirbook in the same work shows only the tops of a few notes and no staff is visible. The supposed hymn book in the Fountain of Life has only hatchings and seems to simulate lines of text with space on the left page for music. If one excludes the sixteenth-century copy of Jan's Hunt of Philip the Good (see page 27) as possibly having music

18. These words are lettered in the same manner in the Van Eyck Annunciation (c. 1428) in the National Gallery of Art, Washington, D.C.
added by the copyist, it seems that no work by the Van Eycks contains more than these slight indications of musical notation.
Plate IX. After Jan van Eyck: The Fountain of Life. Madrid, Museo del Prado. (Museum photo).
Moralistic Paintings

Hieronymus Bosch was born in 's-Hertogenbosch in North Brabant about 1450 into a family with a long tradition as painters. Bosch apparently took his name from the town of his birth to distinguish himself from the other painters there with the family name van Aachen. Various documents record his presence in 's-Hertogenbosch until his death in 1516, which was reported in the records of the Brotherhood of Our Lady.

Few painters have been subjected to as much interpretive study from so many divergent points of view as has Bosch. Astrology, numerology, Freudian and Jungian psychology, alchemy, and neo-Pythagorean music theory have all been drawn into the search for a cosmic interpretation of his Garden of Delights triptych (Plate XI).² Bosch's membership in an heretical, erotic, and anti-clerical cult has even been suggested by some writers, notably Fraenger, as an explanation for the highly complex symbolism of the altarpiece. A number of scholars have contested Franger's theories on the grounds of erroneous interpretations of


details as they relate to the iconography of Bosch's own time; he has found new support in a recent study by Patrik Reuterswärd. 21

Most scholars see the Garden of Delights as a condemnation of the follies and sins of mankind. The delights of man on earth become the torments of man in hell; constantly goaded by demons, man must continue to participate in his earthly pleasures until they become their own punishment in a world where all things are reversed. As Charles de Tolnay described it:

The earth itself has become a hell; the very objects that had been instruments of sin have become gigantic instruments of punishment. These chimeras of bad conscience, which enliven the night with hallucinatory clarity, possess all the special significance of sexual dream symbols: vase and lantern, knife and skates refer to the two sexes. Out of the barrel-organ, the mandolin and the harp Bosch forms an orchestra of instruments of vengeance that draw their harmonies from man's suffering. 22

Both the Garden of Delights and the Haywain (Plate XIII) utilize the triptych format to show, reading from left to right, the Garden of Eden, the sins of man on earth, and Hell. The presence of music and musicians is conspicuous in the Hell panel of the Garden of Delights triptych, and


similarly, in the Vienna and Brussels Last Judgements. Musical instruments abound as instruments of torture— one man turns the crank of the hurdy-gurdy on which he is skewered, another is hung in an attitude of crucifixion in the strings of a giant harp, still another is required to carry an enormous shawm on his back while holding a fife in his rectum; still others march to the tune of a living bag-pipe.

A group of singers led by a monstrous frog-like creature sing from a score inscribed on the buttocks of a man pinned beneath a huge lute. Under the base of the lute is an open music book beneath which another man is trapped. Neither of the scores contains actual music although a four-line staff is used and there is one recognizable note shape, a breve at the end of the last staff on the recto side of the music book (Plate XII). The use of the four-line staff here is unusual since it had long been replaced by one of five lines except for liturgical chant. Perhaps Bosch intended to suggest that the unholy choir is singing a perverted chant, not to God, but to Satan. The four-line staff and the breve show that Bosch could have quoted real music if he had thought it appropriate; the

23. Reinhold Hammerstein, Diabolus in Musica: Studien zur Ikonographie der Musik im Mittelalter, Neue Heidelberger Studien zur Musikwissenschaft, Band 6 (Bern: Franke Verlag, 1974), plates 153-165.
detailing of the instruments is so accurate and precise that the omission of real music is even more startling. Bosch may have considered real music unsuitable for the cacophony of Hell.
Plate XI. Hieronymus Bosch: The Garden of Delights.
Madrid, Museo del Prado. (Museum photo)
The *Haywain* triptych exists in two copies, one in the Escorial, the other in the Prado. The question of which of these is the original and which is the copy is still contested and is unimportant to this study. Unlike the *Garden of Delights*, music and musicians are absent from the hell scene but a lone grotesque figure with a chanter-like nose may be related to the bagpipe figure of the *Garden* Hell panel.

In the central panel of the *Haywain* triptych, seated atop the hay wagon, a group of people perform music (Plate XIV). Accompanied by a man playing a lute, a couple sings from a sheet of music which contains only hatchings and no music notation. In the bushes behind the seated couple, another couple is shown in an embrace, and flanking these figures are a praying angel and a winged grotesque creature playing a tune on his elongated nose. Carl Justi has described this creature as "an odd personification of *Fama*, whose nose is turned into a trumpet, and who announces the harvest festival." This strange figure, with its pear-shaped body and chanter-like nose, is perhaps more accurately described as a personified bagpipe. Even though the nose is longer than a chanter on a bagpipe, it keeps

24. Madrid, Museo del Prado, No. 2052; 132 x 100 cm. (center panel).

approximately the same proportions as the bagpipe oc the Garden Hell panel and another bagpipe figure in the Hell panel of the Vienna Last Judgement where it accompanies the singing of an unholy choir. The interpretation of this figure as a personified bagpipe allows for the traditional Bosch symbols of lust—the lute (as the female symbol) and the bagpipe (as the male) to accompany the amorous couples. The importance of the lust motive in this panel has been shown by Ludwig von Baldass who says:

In The Haywain Lust assumes the most important position, on top of the load of hay. It gives rise, in those wishing to participate in the carnal pleasure it typifies, to the other Deadly Sins.26

Cuttler dates the Haywain triptych c. 1490-95, early in Bosch's mature period, and the Garden of Delights c. 1505-1510, at the beginning of his late style.27 This dating is a bit later than the chronology determined by Charles de Tolnay in his chronology; he places both these triptychs in the middle period, ending in 1505.28

Plate XIV. Hieronymus Bosch: The Haywain, detail.
Madrid, Museo del Prado. (Museum photo).
The Bosch original of the so-called Concert in the Egg at Lille probably falls between these two works. The Concert in the Egg (discussed in Chapter III) exists only as a later copy of the lost Bosch original and as a sketch by Bosch that has been preserved in Berlin. The copy contains a four-voice chanson by Thomas Crecquillon which was published by Tylman Susato in 1549. Since Bosch died in 1516, this music must have been added by the copyist. There are some indications of notes in the sketch, but whether the original painting had real notation or not is unknown. Although the painting and music will be discussed in detail later, a brief comparison with the Garden of Delights and the Ship of Fools (c. 1495, according to Cuttler) is in order here for chronological purposes.

The Ship of Fools and the Concert in the Egg contain a number of similar elements and seem to be related stylistically. Jacques Combe describes the company of the Ship of Fools as "... a crew of nitwits crowded together in the bottom of a tiny skiff, eating and carousing." Among other figures, the crew includes a monk and nun singing to the accompaniment of a lute and a fool in motley perched in the branches of the tree which serves as a mast.

---


oarsman has abandoned his oar to participate in the revels, leaving the ship to the mercy of the sea. Food and wine are the primary symbols here, pointing up the folly of gluttony. A secondary motif is the lute, always a sexual symbol in Bosch's satiric works, representing the unchaste behavior of the monk and nun. An owl, Bosch's equivalent of the serpent as a symbol of evil, perches in the branches of the tree.

Combe describes the theme of the Ship of Fools in this manner:

It illustrates, long before Pascal, the Pascalian theme of man's pursuit of illusory happiness, seeking it in entertainment which makes him forget the precariousness of his condition, and diverts his mind from the contemplation of his end, an idea familiar to Bosch and his contemporaries. It underlines the 'Praise of Folly' by Erasmus. The ardour with which men run after happiness is proportionate to their degree of folly.32

The Concert in the Egg contains the same motifs of wine jug and food, singers with lute, and an owl in a tree. The man with the birdhouse hat replaces the fool, but the monk and nun are again in the foreground. Very tiny figures at the base of the egg prefigure the grotesque inhabitants of Hell in the Garden of Delights. Combe says that the drawing (and, by extension, the painting) "... may be considered ... the beginning of alchemistic symbolism in the

32. Combe, Hieronymus Bosch, p. 21.
Thus, on iconographic grounds, the Concert in the Egg appears to fall chronologically between the Ship of Fools and the Haywain and Garden of Delights triptychs.

Summary

Painting of the Netherlands in the first half of the fifteenth century demonstrates a growing desire for realism as it developed from the miniature tradition of the Limbourg brothers through the Van Eycks. Although no musical quotations were used, the careful inscription of texts on banners and scrolls, and the use of simulated notation seem to point the way for later use of musical quotations.

Musical angels appear most often in scenes of the Nativity where their singing of the "Gloria in excelsis Deo, et in terra pax hominibus" text is implied, sometimes even showing the capital "G" on the scroll from which they sing. In scenes of the Madonna and Child, musical angels again appear with some frequency, playing and singing without the aid of written music.

The moralistic paintings of Bosch include music and musical performance as a symbol of licentious behavior. The relationship between the amorous couple on top of the hay wagon in the Haywain triptych and the monk and nun in

33. Combe, Hieronymus Bosch, p. 97.
the *Ship of Fools* is obvious—the action is the same although
the monk and nun are supposed to be celibate. Music and
musicians figure prominently in the Hell panel of the *Garden
of Delights* where they are tortured by the very things that
gave them sensual pleasure in life.

The following chapter will examine some paintings
which, rather than implying or simulating music, use actual
musical quotations to give an added dimension to the inter­
pretation of the subject.
CHAPTER III

PAINTINGS WITH LEGIBLE NOTATION

The destruction of many paintings by the iconoclasts during the Reformation and Counter-Reformation makes the identification of a first Flemish painting to include a musical quotation speculative. Based on existing evidence, the credit is given to Hugo van der Goes, who quoted a hymn to the Trinity in his Trinity Altarpiece Shutters (c. 1473-1478). If this is the first, it provides a convenient transition between the quotation of texts found in the miniature tradition and early Flemish painting, and the quotation of chansons found in later paintings, because the notation is the type used for plainsong.

Mensural notation is found in two paintings by the Master of the Embroidered Foliage, thought to have been painted during the last two decades of the fifteenth century. These works, the Virgin and Child with Angels in the R.J. Grog Collection in Paris and the Altarpiece of the Virgin with Angels in Polizzi Generosa, contain quotations of the Walter Frye motet "Ave regina coelorum." An angel in the Paris painting holds a music book on which both the Superius and the tenor of the motet are painted. The Polizzi Generosa
work shows an angel holding a scroll on which only the Tenor of the motet is inscribed.\(^1\)

It is known that the Polizzi Generosa painting was in place there in 1496, and was probably executed not long before that date.\(^2\) Dating of these paintings based on the Walter Frye quotation is not satisfactory, since only the year he was enrolled in a London guild of musicians (1457) and 1475, when his will was proven in Canterbury, are known with any certainty. Evidence suggests that he worked on the continent because the primary sources for his work are two manuscripts of Burgundian origin,\(^3\) but his name is not found in the archives of the Burgundian court.\(^4\)

Barring new evidence about the work or the anonymous Master of the Embroidered Foliage, or an exact dating of Hugo's \textit{Trinity} panels, it would seem that the quotation in the \textit{Trinity Altarpiece Shutter}s was the first in Flemish painting. Without presuming a view of history based on movement from the simple to the complex, it appears that the addition of chant notation preceded that of mensural

\(^1\) Detail photographs showing the music in both paintings are reproduced in Sylvia W. Kenney, \textit{Walter Frye and the Contenance Angloise} (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1964), plates 4 and 5.


\(^3\) Brussels: Bibliothèque Royale, \textit{Ms. 5557} and Yale University: \textit{Mellon Chansonnier}.

polyphony.

Paintings which include musical quotations may be grouped for convenience into either sacred or secular categories. Within the category of sacred works, as in Chapter II, they may be further classified as devotional or moralistic. Devotional paintings include altarpieces and donor panels of a pious nature; moralistic paintings point up the sins of the world, with or without showing the final reward for that sin.

Two major sub-classifications of secular works are the allegorical painting and the portrait. Both of these subjects became very popular in the sixteenth century and a large quantity of these paintings, with or without musical quotations, is extant.

Devotional Paintings

The Trinity Altarpiece Shutters in Edinburgh\(^5\) are probably the sides of a triptych for which the central panel has been lost. Although there has been some speculation that these were organ shutters, current opinion is that they are indeed the wings of a triptych. Little is known about the commissioning or the execution of the work; it is possible that it was completed before Van der Goes entered the Rode Klooster near Brussels in 1478. The latest study of the

\(^5\) Edinburgh: National Gallery of Scotland, on loan from H.M. the Queen; 216 x 115 cm. each.
panels suggests that they were begun after 1473 and completed by 1478 on the grounds of the absence of the second son of James III in the panel with the future James IV and his father. The identification of the kneeling clergyman as Sir Edward Bonkil, Provost of Trinity College Church in Edinburgh, resulted in the conclusion that the panels were commissioned for the Trinity College Church.

Whether the donor was James III or Sir Edward is not known. It has been suggested that the commission might have been given by James III or his emissary, since at the time of the execution of these panels there were close political and commercial ties between Scotland and the Netherlands. It has also been suggested that Sir Edward Bonkil had a brother living in Bruges and that, during the course of a visit to the Netherlands, Sir Edward gave the commission. There is no documentary evidence that an Alexander Bonkil living in Bruges was a brother of Sir Edward, but there is evidence that Alexander acted as emissary from Charles the Bold to James III so that the commission might have been made through him.


7. Ibid., p. 40.

8. Ibid., p. 51.
Hugo van der Goes, who was chosen to execute the work, was the leading painter in Ghent in the second half of the fifteenth century. He was responsible for the civic decorations of Ghent and Bruges for such important occasions as the funeral of Philip the Good, the marriage of Charles the Bold to Margaret of York, and the triumphal entry of Charles into Bruges. After he entered the monastery of the Rode Klooster in 1478, he continued to receive visitors and to paint. He travelled occasionally—to Louvain in 1480 to appraise the Justice Panels of Dirk Bouts, and to Cologne in 1481. On his return from Cologne, he was struck by an attack of melancholy which continued until his death in 1482.

The Trinity Shutters, when closed, show the Trinity in one panel and Sir Edward Bonkil, the Provost of Trinity College Church, kneeling in front of an organ in the other. When open, the panels show King James III and his son with St. Andrew in one panel, and his wife, Margaret of Denmark with St. George in the other. The identification of the saint with Margaret of Denmark as St. George rather than St. Canute, patron saint of Denmark, may have been explained by Lorne Campbell, who says that one of the principal altars of the Trinity College Church was dedicated to St. George.9

The Bonkil panel (Plate XV) is of particular interest to this study because of the large music book on the music rack of the organ behind Sir Edward. The music quoted here is the first stanza of the hymn "O Lux beata Trinitas" for Saturday Vespers as found in the *Breviarium Aberdonense* (1509-10). 10 The quotation, which fills two pages of the music book on the organ, is in chant notation on a four-line staff.

Example III-1. Notation of "O Lux beata Trinitas" in the Bonkil panel of Van der Goes' *Trinity Altarpiece Shutters.*

Plate XV. Hugo van der Goes: Trinity Altarpiece
Shutters, Bonkil panel. Edinburgh, National Gallery of
Scotland. (Museum photo).
The text is in four octosyllabic lines with a rhyme scheme A A B B. The musical setting follows the lines of the text so that a musical form a a b a' is developed, with the only change in the fourth phrase occurring at the first two-note ligature. Variants of this hymn have been found in several other sources, and that given in the Worcester Hymnal is very similar to this setting.¹¹

Example III-2. Transcription of "O Lux beata Trinitas" from the Bonkil panel of Van der Goes' Trinity Altarpiece Shutters.

O blessed light, Trinity
and original unity,
The fiery sun is now receding;
Pour light into our hearts.

¹¹ Bruno Stählein, Monumenta monodica medii aevi I, Hymnen (1); Die mittelalterlichen Hymnenmelodien des Abendlandes (Kassel: Bärenreiter Verlag, 1956), p. 180-81. Other versions are given on pp. 85, 211, 252, and 364.
It is probable that this hymn was chosen because of the relationship between the text to the Trinity and the location of the painting in the Trinity College Church. Another aspect of the Bonkil panel that relates it to its location is the organ shown directly behind Sir Edward. It is known that he procured an organ for Trinity College in 1466-67, which was paid for from the customs revenues of Edinburgh on the orders of James III.12 It is not certain that this is the organ in question, but Sir Edward's arms appear on the organ bench. Thompson and Campbell follow Panofsky in suggesting that the treatment of the organ case, worked in gold leaf, was exceptional and emphasises its significance.13

The method of representing the organ-case in gold leaf and the organ-pipes in silver, with the fall of light on their surfaces described by black cross-hatching, is a distinctive feature of the design. Panofsky describes this use of gold, here and in the throne of the Trinity panel, as archaic, and points out the heightened iconographic significance acquired by gold leaf after the realism of Van Eyck and Campin had been developed in the 1420's. The use of gold grew rare because it conflicted with the illusion of reality, and its presence in paintings became correspondingly pointed and meaningful.14

The inclusion of both these objects, the hymn and the organ, seems to leave little doubt that these panels were, indeed, commissioned for placement in the Trinity College Church. In view of the exceptional use of gold leaf on the organ case, it is possible that Bonkil did commission the work and that the inclusion of the organ in his panel was a reminder that it had been procured by him.

The relationship between the painting and the music of this work and the similar relationships in the paintings of the Master of the Embroidered Foliage that quote Walter Frye's motet are forthright. The appropriateness of the "Ave regina coelorum" quotation is pointed up by the hovering angels holding the crown of the Queen of Heaven over the Virgin's head. The quotations in both the Van der Goes panel and the Master of the Embroidered Foliage works are very specific: one helps fix the original location of the painting, the other serves to identify the function of the Virgin as the Queen of Heaven.

The Naples Adoration of the Christ Child (Plate XVI) by Jacob Cornelisz. van Oostsaanen (c. 1465/70-1533) is a memorial tablet for Dirck Boschuysen and the Boschuysen and Pijnssen families of Amsterdam. The date of the work,

15. Naples: Museo e Gallerie Nazionali di Capodimonte, No. 3; 128 x 177 cm.

1512, is worked into the design of the relief around the top of the church wall.

Placed within the confines of an elegant structure recalling the ruined churches of earlier Nativities, the Madonna and Joseph kneel on either side of the Child. The Boschuysen and Pijnssen families kneel in adoration on each side of the Holy Family. In the background, shepherds kneel in the doorway or look through a window. Above, at the rear of the church are multitudes of cherubim singing, playing instruments, and holding an Italianate garland of leaves and fruits. In the far distance, seen through the arches, are a landscape in which an angel announces the birth to the shepherds and a port city with many ships and boats in the harbor.

A group of six cherubs, five playing musical instruments and a sixth holding a large choirbook, occupies the center foreground (Plate XVII). Concerning these musical angels, Hammerstein says:

We see a purely instrumental ensemble ... in a Nativity by Jacob van Oostsaanen. Before the crib five angels with instruments (two shawms, dulcimer, trumpet, and sackbut) are grouped around a large choirbook inscribed with text and mensural notation, held by a putto. Although they are not looking at the notes, so that one must again doubt the full reality of the representation, the result is, nevertheless, that one begins more and more to find instrumental music presented in association with notes.

Written on the pages of the open choirbook are the parts for a four-voice setting of the song of the angels, "Gloria in excelsis Deo, et in terra pax hominibus" (Luke 2:14). The music is in white mensural notation with the Superius and Contratenor parts on the left page and the Tenor and Bassus parts on the right. Each voice part, with the exception of the Superius, is indicated by name (Plate XIX). The placement of parts is notable since the more usual practice would be to have the Superius and Tenor on one page and the Contratenor and Bassus on the other. No source has been found for this composition, and it appears to have been copied from a manuscript choirbook which has, perhaps, been lost. The note shapes do not have the regularity of those found in printed music of the period, and one may infer, judging from the careful detailing of other objects, particularly the feathers of the cherub's wings, that Jacob did copy the source faithfully.

The text given here is the song of the angels to the shepherds plus two alleluias as found now in the Antiphonale monasticum pro Diurnis Horis and in the Liber usualis for Lauds for Christmas Day as the antiphon for the Benedictus. The Tenor of this four-voice setting closely follows the Liber usualis version of the chant omitting one alleluia, for which the text is given in the Contratenor.

and the musical phrase in the Superius (with the text "bone votantis"). A comparison of the Tenor from the four-voice setting and the chant is given in Example III-3.

Example III-3. Comparison of the Tenor of the four-part "Gloria" in Jacob Cornelisz.' Adoration with chants from the Antiphonale and Liber usualis.

Cornelisz. painting

Antiphonale transposed up a 5th

Liber usualis transposed up a 5th
Plate XVI. Jacob Cornelisz. van Oostsanen. 
The musical setting in the painting is a not very skillful example of contrapuntal writing resulting in several unacceptable dissonances and augmented fourths. The Tenor carries the cantus firmus, the original chant transposed, and is kept intact with the single exception of the omitted alleluia. Evidently the Superius was the first voice added to the cantus firmus because the dissonances between the two voices cause no problems and they work together in imitation, first the Tenor imitating the Superius (mm. 1-4), then the Superius imitating the Tenor (mm. 7-9). The addition of the other two voices results in unacceptable dissonances such as the ninth to seventh intervals between the Tenor and Bassus at measure 2-3.

The dissonance problems that occur on the first two beats of measure 12 could, in part, be the result of a scribal error. If the rhythm in the Tenor is changed to breve-semibreve-semibreve rest, it allows retention of the chant melody while removing the ninth which occurs at the entrance of the Superius, and permits the Tenor and Bassus to complete the phrase together. If the C minim in the Bassus was changed to a D it would get rid of the ninth between the Bassus and Tenor and give a smoother line.

Example III-5. Dissonances in measure 12 of Jacob Cornelisz.' Adoration with possible changes.

The choice of a setting of "Gloria in excelsis Deo, et in terra pax hominibus" for this scene of the Nativity is rather obvious. It is an extension of the practice of having angels sing from books or scrolls at the Nativity coming directly from the miniature tradition. It has already been pointed out that in the "Adoration of the Magi"
miniature (fol. 52r) of the Très Riches Heures du Duc de Berry the angels sing from a scroll on which the red letter "G" indicates that they are singing this text. Whether the painter or the commissioner of the work selected this particular setting for inclusion in the painting is not known, and no other musical source has been found. Pieter Fischer, commenting on this composition says:

Was the music commissioned by the Boschuysen family, as was frequently the case ...? Must we seek the composer in the Leyden-Haarlem circle or in that of Amsterdam, or must we search among the famous South Netherlands or for one of them who worked in a town of Holland? In view of the fact that the music is an antiphon from the Laudes, it might be from a 'Zevengetijdendoek' (Seven Hours Book) ... However, although the founders of the altar were able to find a painter in Holland, they will have had to look for a composer, particularly in those early years of the sixteenth century, in the South Netherlands ...

The text falls into three sections of unequal length:

Gloria in excelsis Deo,
et in terra pax hominibus bonae voluntatis.
Alleluia, alleluia.

The composer has also set the text in three sections, but they do not fully correspond with the lines of the text. The end of the first section is shown by a corona in all parts marking the point of congruence on the word Deo; a rest occurs in all parts after the word hominibus so that the third section begins in the middle of the text line at bonae.

The first section begins with imitation between the Superius and Tenor at the distance of a measure, and the other two voices are independent. The second section is characterized by rhythmically varied imitation between the Tenor and Superius, beginning three beats apart. The Contratenor and Bassus move together with the Tenor in essentially the same rhythm, thus highlighting the imitation in the Superius. All four voices come together for the word hominibus, so that the individual entries of the Bassus and Tenor at the beginning of the third section are heightened by contrast. The third section shows a pairing of voices—Bassus with Tenor, and Contratenor with Superius—until all four voices come together for the final alleluia. A complete transcription of the setting is given as Example III-6.

Another painting by Jacob Cornelisz. shows what appears to be a sheet of music. A small triptych made in 1515 for the Amsterdam banker Pompeius Occo shows the Madonna and Child with musical angels. A group of angels hovering in the sky sing from a sheet which, according to Fischer, contains no notation because of its small size. Instead, worked into the golden crown on the Madonna’s head, are the words "Gloria in excelsis Deo."20

Example III-6. Transcription of "Gloria in excelsis Deo" from Jacob Cornelisz. van Oostsanen's Adoration.

Gloria in excelsis Deo et in terra pacem

Both the Edinburgh Trinity shutter and Jacob Cornelisz.' Adoration give a text so that identification of the composition is possible. Even though no source has been found for the polyphonic "Gloria" in the Adoration, we still recognise it as the text from Luke and associate it with the other elements in the picture.

Sometimes a painter would use what appears to be a musical quotation but did not include the text so that identification of the music is left to chance. The donor panel of a pair of altarpiece shutters in the Musée de Cluny presents one such musical quotation for which no text is shown (Plate XIX). These shutters, thought to be by Jan Mostaert (c. 1475-1556), have King David with angel musicians in one panel, and a donor, a prophet, and singing angels in the other. The prophet and one of the angels hold the sides of a large sheet of music with only the top staff visible to the viewer. Is the music a quotation from a real composition? The notation seems regular enough, but there is a sign which might be either a mensuration sign \( \text{C} \) or a C clef. If this is a mensuration sigh, this could be a cantus part with the C clef on the first line, covered by the sleeve. The vertical lines at the beginning

22. Paris: Musée de Cluny, 63 x 27 cm. (each).
and end of the staff look like the side rulings found in manuscripts. The absence of text makes the identification of this music, if it is a quotation, a matter of chance recognition. Perhaps the music was a composition having significance for the donor; perhaps it was chosen by the painter, expecting it to be recognized, for an iconographic reason. On the other hand, it may only be a skillfully painted imitation, used to balance the musical ideas of the companion panel. Perhaps one day someone will recognize this music and determine its significance to the painting.
Moralistic Paintings

The previously mentioned Concert in the Egg at Lille (Plate XX) is a copy of a lost Bosch original for which the sketch by Bosch is extant. The sketch, differing from the copy in many details, has a group of people within a broken eggshell, singing from a large book. Only a few lines on the book suggest musical notation, so that reference to the sketch does not show Bosch's intention to include a musical quotation. However, as stated earlier (page 64), he could not have quoted the composition found in the copy of the painting. The chanson, by Thomas Crécquillon (d. 1557), was printed in mensural notation by Tylman Susato in 1549. Perhaps closer to Bosch's intention is the notation in another copy of this painting that is now located in Senlis.

The music in the Senlis painting is in mensural notation without text and has not been identified. Each staff is very short, containing at the most only four notes and a single rest so that it is not clear whether or not four parts are represented. The same clef sign and B-flat are given on each staff so that only one part might be indicated. Perhaps this is not a quotation, but only

22. Berlin: Kupferstichkabinet. Reproduced in Combe, Hieronymus Bosch, plate 129 II.

realistic notation without any meaning other than showing that this is a music book.

The painting is a satirical comment on the clergy, showing a monk and nun, with laymen, within a broken egg, singing from a choirbook. According to Combe, the egg is "... the starting-point of alchemistic emblematics and notation. Each part of the egg has an emblematic meaning: thus, the shell figures the Earth." Other alchemistic and satanic symbols abound; the snake, the owl, dead fish, ibis, ravens, and fruit are all symbols associated in Bosch's works of this period with demonic attributes. All of these and more are found in the Garden of Delights and the Haywain. In addition to these symbols of evil, music is used here as a symbol of good used for evil purpose. A monkey plays a cornetto, a man with the head of an ass (or dog, according to some writers) plays the lute, a nun plays the harp to accompany the singing. Both the lute and harp were instruments traditionally used by angels to sing the praises of God (as in the Fountain of Life, the Ghent Altarpiece, and Hans Memlinc's angel musicians). Used here, they represent a perversion of purpose, especially since they are used to accompany the singing of a bawdy song. Hammerstein in discussing these paintings, says:

The hitherto proposed interpretations of this thrice-transmitted picture subject of the Concert in the Egg as a choir of heresy, as reference to alchemy and witchcraft, or something similar, are difficult to

24. Combe, Hieronymus Bosch, p. 61, note 85.
prove definitely. We probably will not go wrong if we perceive the whole in general as a representation of sinful profane pleasures, especially of the vices of drunkenness, gluttony, and fornication, but also of human madness and folly. For all these activities and opportunities music gives, in the artist's view, a strong and plainly pandering support. That the interpretation of this concert as a deeply satanic entertainment is correct is further confirmed by the dog-monster with a lute and the monkey-monster with a zink, which are added to the music scene in the last-mentioned version; both are old friends from the musical arsenal of Hell.  

The selection of Thomas Crécquillon's polyphonic chanson "Toutes les nuits" by the copyist is completely in keeping with the other symbolism of the painting. The text of the chanson is a complaint about the frustration of sleeping alone. Surely here it is a spiteful comment on the morality of the ostensibly celibate monk and nun.

Toutes les nuits que sans vous je me couche,  
Pensant a vous ne fais que sommeillier;  
Et en resvant jusques au reveillier  
Incessament vous quiers parmi la couche,  
Et bien souvent au lieu de votre bouche,  
En souspirant je baise l'oreillier  
Toutes les nuits.

Every night that I go to bed without you,  
thinking of you, I do nothing but doze;  
And delirious until waking  
I search incessantly for you in the bed,  
And quite often, instead of your mouth,  
sighing, I kiss the pillow  
Every night.

The first known publication of Crécquillon's chanson in mensural notation was Susato's collection, *L'unziesme livre contenant vingt & neuf chansons ...* of 1549. The chanson had been published in lute tablature three years earlier by Pierre Phalèse and presumably was known in manuscript prior to that. The exemplar used by the copyist has not been found, but that he was not working from the Susato print is shown by the notational variants in both the Superius and Bassus parts. The beginning of the Superius in the printed version differs radically from the Susato print in both pitch and rhythm; after the first two-and-a-half measures, both pitch and rhythm are the same in both sources. The Bassus, although the same in pitch and rhythm, differs in both type and placement of the F clef. The clef in theSusato print makes the third line F, whereas the painting shows the fourth line as F, moving the notation up a third on the staff. The Bassus parts in both sources are identical in note and rest forms, but not in placement of note stems, which are almost all painted down from the note heads rather than up or down depending on height of the note head on the staff as found in the print.

The Contratenor is identical (with the exception of stem direction) in both sources; the Tenors are the same with only a few discrepancies. The painting shows a minim in the place of a semibreve as the first note of the Tenor, the semibreves on the word "couche" have been changed to
minims and one has been left out, and the B-flat minim following has been replaced by a line through the entire staff. Only part of the composition is given in the painted version. Variants in text underlay pose no particular problem, since printers at this time were not careful to place the text exactly under the corresponding notes. The music detail from the Lille painting is shown in Plate XXI, and a comparison of the notation follows as Example III-8.

Example III-8. Comparison of the notation of "Toutes les nuits" in the Concert in the Egg and Susato's 1549 print.

Concert...

SUPERIUS

L'unziesme livre

Concert...

CONTRATENOR

L'unziesme livre
Example III-8 (continued).

Concert...

TENOR

L'unzième livre...

BASSUS

L'unzième livre...

Toutes les nuits que sans

Toutes les nuits que sans vous je me couche. Pensez à vous... ne.

Toutes les nuits... sans

Que sans vous je me couche. Pensez à vous, ne fais que somnoler.
Although only a part of Crécquillon’s chanson is quoted in the painting, it is enough to have been readily recognized by viewers of the period. The text was a popular one, set by some of the leading composers of the day, including Clemens non Papa, De Villers, Cartier, and Lassus. The following partial list of sources demonstrates some of the forms that were available over twenty-two years of the setting by Crécquillon. The date with superscript is the RISM identification number.  


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1546</td>
<td>Des chansons reduictz en tablature de luc a trois et quatre parties. Livre deuxieme ... Pierre Phalèse, Louvain.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1549</td>
<td>L'unziesme livre contenant vingt &amp; neuf chansons amoureuses a quatre parties ... Antwerp, Tylman Susato.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1549</td>
<td>Carminum quae chely vel testudine canuntur, liber primus ... Louvain, Pierre Phalèse. (French lute tablature).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1552</td>
<td>La Fleur de chansons et cincquiesme livre à trois parties ... Antwerp, Tylman Susato.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1568</td>
<td>Nova longeque elegantissima cithara ludenda carmina ... Louvain, Pierre Phalèse. (French cittern tablature).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
painting, the copyist chose one that enhanced the symbolism of lust and, at the same time, made the satire of the choir-book more obvious.
Example III-9. Transcription of "Toutes les nuicts" from Susato's L'unziesme livre..., fol. 11, all part-books.
Example III-9 (continued).
Example III-9 (continued).
Example III-9 (continued).
Allegorical Paintings

The Allegorical Love Feast (Plate XXII) in the Wallace Collection is an allegory on youthful and mature love. It is signed "Petrus Pourbus" and, though not dated, must have been done after 1543 when Pourbus entered the Guild of St. Luke in Bruges. That this is the earliest possible year for the execution of this painting can be determined from the music sheet on the marble table in the center of the work. The music is an almost exact copy of the Tenor part of the chanson "Ung gay bergier" by Thomas Crécquillon as printed by Tylman Susato in 1543 (Plates XXIII and XXIV).

Pieter Pourbus was born in Gouda in 1513 and became an apprentice to Lancelot Blondeel in 1538. Travels in Italy made him familiar with the work of the Italian Mannerists, and in 1543 he settled in Bruges, where he became a member of the guild. In Bruges, he was employed by the Magistrates to superintend festival decorations, as a surveyor, and as a civil engineer, until his death there on January 30, 1584.

27. London: Wallace Collection, No. P541; 134 x 207 cm.
Plate XXII. Pieter Pourbus: Allegorical Love Feast.
London. Wallace Collection. (Museum photo).

A description of the painting and the allegory in
the Wallace Collection Catalogue reads:

The persons represented are labelled by the painter
Pasithea, Aglaia and Euphrosine (i.e., the Three
Graces: but Pasithea and Aglaia are the same person
and the third would be Thalia), Affectio, Cordialitas,
Fidutia (still young and comely, but more fully clothed
and sedate than the rest), and Reverentia; Adonis,
Daphnis, Sapiens and Acontius. In the left corner
lies Cupid, in the right is shown the Fool with his
bauble. The allegory teaches that love and folly
are for youth, but that the greybeard (Sapiens) must
content himself with loyalty rather than love. 28

The al fresco interlude around a marble table set
within a grove is the scene of amorous pleasures among the
young people while Sapiens and Fidutia look on. The table
holds bread and wine for the pleasures of eating and a pair
of recorders with a sheet of music for the pleasures of
music. It is entirely suitable that the music should be
a rather suggestive song.

Ung gay gergier prieit une bergiere
En luy faisant du jeu d'amours requeste.
Allez, dict elle, tirez vous arriere,
Vostre parler je trouve deshonnestee.
Ne penses pas que feroie tel deffault,
Par quoy cessez faire telle priere
Car tu n'a pas la lance qui me fault.

A jolly shepherd asked a shepherdess
to play the game of love with him.
"Go away," she said. "Take yourself away!
I find your words dishonest.
Don't think that I will commit such an error.

28. Pictures and Drawings, 16th edition, Wallace
Therefore stop making such a request
Because you don't have the lance that I need!"

The chanson seems to derive from the pastorela, one of the favorite poetic types of the troubadours (and later the pastorelle of the trouvères). The troubadour type has been described in this manner:

A knight, riding in the countryside, meets a shepherdess whom he addresses with frankly dishonorable intent. After a more or less extended discussion between the two, virtue usually—but not always—succumbs. ... We may presume that the encounters described in pastorelas are usually imaginary. If they do represent knightly manners of the time, it is no wonder that the shepherdess so often has a father, brother, or lover within hailing distance.  

Sometimes, it was not necessary for the shepherdess to call for outside help; she was able to discourage the lecherous knight by her sharp wit and even sharper tongue. A particularly pleasant example is found in Marcabru's pastorela "L'autrier jost' una sebissa," where, in reply to the knight's outrageous praise, the shepherdess says:

"My lord, you have praised me so much that everyone would envy me. Since you have driven up my value, my lord, ... you shall have this reward in parting: 'Gape, fool, gape,' and wait all afternoon."  


In other poems of the same type, the knight acts as an observer rather than a participant, and reports a similar scene between a shepherd and shepherdess. The figures of Sapiens and Fidutia act in the same capacity in Pourbus' Allegory, where they are observers of, instead of participants in, the amorous dalliances of the rest of the company.

Créquillon's setting of the text is the polyphonic type favored by Netherlandish composers but has a repetition of the final line, for formal balance, more typical of the Parisian chanson. It is divided into three sections, the outer ones being polyphonic and imitative with the middle section in chordal style using the text of the fifth line. To heighten the contrast, a change from duple to triple meter occurs at the middle section, but returns to duple for the sixth and seventh lines. There is some use of voice pairing and exchange of parts. Example III-10 shows both voice pairing and exchange of parts in double counterpoint. The Superius and Contratenor are paired against the Tenor and Bassus pair which enters in imitation one-and-a-half measures later. At the point of entry, the two lower voices take the previous parts with the top (Superius) moving to the Bassus and the Contratenor moving to the Tenor so that the relationship between the parts is inverted.

The forms for the text and the music are as follows:

Syllables: 10' 10' 10' 10' 10 10' 10'
Rhyme: A B A B C A :C:
Music: a b a b c d e:

Example III-11 gives a complete transcription of the chanson.
Example III-11. Transcription of Thomas Grécoquillon's "Ung gay bergier", Premier livre ... Tylman Susato, fol. 16.
Example III-ll (continued).
Example III-11 (continued).
Créquillon's chanson was printed in the four part-books of Susato's *Premier livre* and Pourbus evidently copied the Tenor part directly from the print. His fidelity to the original source is evident when one examines the stems of the notes and the calligraphy of the letter "S". All of the note stems are placed in the same direction as in the print, and the two forms of the letter "S" (as in the word "deshoneste") are alike in the same places. There is one place where an error was made and two notes were copied (marked A in the following example) on each side of the recorder which is laid across the sheet of music. The blanks marked B in the example are places where the recorders cover the printed music. One note is different in the painting—the G semibreve at the end of the example appears to be an F in the painting. This part is in deep shadow where it falls between the two recorders. The only other difference between the print and the painting is the capital, which is not as elaborate in the painting. The notes beginning and ending each staff are the same in both sources. To facilitate comparison, Example III-12 shows the notation as given in each of the sources. The ' is used here to indicate the end of staves.
Example III-12. Comparison of the Tenor part of Créquillon's "Ung gay bergier" as found in Susato's 1543 print and Pourbus' painting.

The popularity of the subject of amorous al fresco dalliance in paintings may be seen in the number of works in similar style. The basic idea goes back to the many illustrations of pleasure gardens in manuscript illuminations.
such as are found in the Harley manuscript\textsuperscript{31} and the Codex "De Sphaera".\textsuperscript{32} Contemporary with Pourbus are the paintings by Ambrosius Benson on the same subject. The Benson work in Basel (Plate XXV) is closely related to the Pourbus painting and appears to contain music. The painting is being restored however, and detail photographs have not been available for study to confirm the presence or identity of a musical quotation. In citing similar paintings by Benson or his school,

\textsuperscript{31} London: British Museum, Ms. Harley 4425, fol. 12v. A color reproduction of this miniature is given in Wangermée, Flemish Music, plate 44. Wangermée says that this manuscript of the Roman de la Rose, dated about 1500, contains miniatures of Flemish origin (p. 312, note 44). In the miniature, aristocratic ladies and gentlemen are grouped around a fountain in a walled garden. Four of the people perform music; one man plays a lute, a lady and gentleman sing from a sheet of music, and another lady sings from a separate sheet.

\textsuperscript{32} Modena, Biblioteca Estense, Ms. lat 209.X.2.14, fol. C10r. A color reproduction is given in Lesure, Musik und Gesellschaft im Bild, pp. 106-7 and plate 43. Lesure says that this manuscript is of Lombard origin. Within a walled garden, a group of nude men and women play in the bowl of an ornate fountain. A group of instrumentalists and a group of singers accompany their revels. The singers sing from a scroll on which the text "Mon seul plaisir" and some notation is written. The fragment has not been identified if the notation is a quotation.
Plate XXV. Ambrosius Benson: Couples at Table.
Basel: Kunstmuseum. (Museum photo).
Slim says: "In none is the music readable or probably real."  

**Portraits**

For convenience of categorization, all paintings in which a person or a small group of people is shown as the most important feature of the work will be considered as portraits. Some of these have been identified as portraits in the true sense, that is, showing the individual's characteristics and often accompanied by some object peculiar to that person's life. Other paintings, particularly those of young ladies, are possible portraits but lack conclusive evidence to that effect, and may be only idealized women. Several of this type are pictures of the Magdalene executed by the Master of the Female Half-Lengths; at least one writer considers that they might be actual portraits.

The unknown painter called the Master of the Female Half-Lengths (or the Maître des demi-figures) received that identification through a number of works showing women from about the waist up, often playing musical instruments. He is thought to have worked in Antwerp between about 1520 and 1530.  

---

33. H. Colin Slim, *The Prodigal Son at the Whores': Music, Art, and Drama* (Irvine, University of California, 1977), p. 25, note 49. Slim sees many of these as elaborate scenes of the debauchery of the Prodigal (p. 10).

The best-known works by the master are a group of five paintings showing a lady playing a lute (the *Magdalene*) and two showing three lady musicians. The ladies in the Three Female Musicians paintings are a singer, a flautist, and a lutenist. The master's style is one of elegant simplicity, with marvelous attention to the details of drapery folds in the gowns of these beautiful women. The faces are smooth and serene, the hair parted in the middle and drawn back smoothly under a headdress. In the *Magdalene* group, the lady is sitting beside or behind a table, playing a lute from a book or sheet of tablature. In each of these paintings, an ointment jar in very ornate style identifies the figure as Mary Magdalene. In one, a wooden lute case hangs on the wall. The two paintings of the Three Female Musicians are much in the same style; the ointment jar is missing, but the lute case hangs on the wall in both paintings. The *Magdalene* paintings located in Rotterdam (Plate XXVI), Hamburg (Plate XXVIII), and Turin (Plate XXX), all have the lady playing the same piece of music, as do the copies in Bonn (Landesmuseum, formerly in the Weber Collection in Hamburg) and in a private collection in Brussels.  

35. Rotterdam: Museum Boymans-van Beuningen, No. 280; 56.5 x 43.5 cm.; Hamburg: Kunsthalle, No. 760; 37.5 x 27 cm.; Turin: Galleria Sabauda, No. 40; 43 x 30 cm.  

36. Reproduced in Heartz, "Mary Magdalene," plates A and B.
The music is a transcription in French lute tablature of the chanson "Si j'ayme mon amy trop plus." In each instance the tablature is the same, so that it is possible to develop a complete version by comparing the paintings. The Rotterdam version gives the complete tablature, and letters difficult to read there may be identified by reference to the other paintings which give varying amounts of the tablature.

No source for the tablature has been found, and it is a strong possibility that the master's source was a manuscript intabulation now lost. If one assumes that the master copied the source with fidelity not only to the tablature itself, but also to the details of the notation, it appears to be manuscript rather than print. Bits of staff run past the bars of the tablature, beams on the stems indicating rhythm are not straight, and the flags on the stems are not all the same size or shape as would be expected in a manuscript but not in a print. The consistency of the intabulation among the various copies of the painting is remarkable; letters, rhythmic signs, and bar lines are the same in all versions. Using the Rotterdam version as the standard because it gives the complete intabulation, the following composite can be made.
Example III-13. Composite of intabulation of "Si j'ayme mon amy trop plus" from the Magdalene paintings by the Master of the Female Half-Lengths.
Plate XXIX. Master of the Female Half-Lengths:
Magdalene, detail (inverted). Hamburg, Kunsthalle.
(Museum photo).
Plate XXX. Master of the Female Half-Lengths: Magdalene. Turin, Galleria Sabauda. (Chomon-Perino photo).
The chanson is found in a monophonic version with five stanzas of text in Paris and in two three-voice collections in London. Related versions of either the text or one of the voice parts are contained in two other manuscripts. The intabulation is closely related to two voices of the Add. 35087 manuscript in London as may be seen by the following comparison. Both the Tenor and the Bassus of the London manuscript are essentially the same in the intabulation with the exception of ornaments added in the melodic line typical of lute transcriptions.


38. London: British Museum, Ms. Add. 35087, fol. 24v-25. See also the study of this manuscript by William M. McMurtry, "The British Museum Manuscript Additional 35087: A Transcription of the French, Italian, and Latin Compositions with Concordance and Commentary" (Ph.D. dissertation, North Texas State University, 1967). Another collection is the British Museum Ms. Harley 5242 which is missing the leaf containing the two lower parts (Heartz, "Mary Magdalene," p. 61, note 21.

Example III-14. Comparison of Tenor and Bassus parts of British Museum Ms. Add. 35087 with composite transcription of the Magdalene tablature.
Only the first three lines of the first strophe are
given in the paintings, but that is enough to identify the
text as the chanson of the London and Paris manuscripts.
Following the text of the Paris manuscript, the complete
poem is as follows:40

Si j'ayme mon amy
Trop plus que mon mary,
Ce n'est pas de merveille;
Il n'est ouvrier que luy
De ce mestier joly
Que l'on fait sans chandelle.

Mon amy est gaillard,
Et mon mary fetard,
Et je suys jeune dame;
Mon cueur seroit paillart
D'aymer ung tel vieillart,
Veu qu'il est tant infame.

Quant suys avecques luy
Je n'ay que tout ennuy
Ne chose qui me plaist;
Or feust ensevely
Et en terre pourry;
Sy serois a mon aise.

Et quant j'ay mon amy
Couché auprès de my,
Il me tient embrassée;
Aussi fais je moy luy;
D'avoir un tel deduit
Jamais m'en fuz lassée.

Sy je fais mon desduit
Soit de jour ou de nuyt
Et le villain se cource,
Ne me chault s'on en bruyst;
Je feray mon plaisir
Aux despens de sa bourse.

40. As given in Gaston Paris, Chansons de XVe
siècle, with transcriptions by Auguste Gevaert (Paris:
If I love my friend
much more than my husband,
it is not to be marvelled at.
There is no workman like him
for that pleasing trade
that one plys without a candle.

My friend is lusty,
and my husband is sluggish,
and I am a young lady.
My heart would be crazy
to love such an old man,
seeing that he is so shameful.

When I am with him
I have only boredom
and nothing that pleases me.
But if he were buried
and rotting in the ground,
I would be at my ease.

And when I have my friend
lying in bed with me,
he locks me in his arms
as I also do with him.
I'm never tired of
having such pleasure.

If I take my delight
either by day or by night
and the miser gets provoked,
I don't give a damn if one talks.
I will take my pleasure
at the expense of his purse.

Perhaps the use of this bawdy chanson in these paintings is meant to show the sinful nature of Mary Magdalen prior to her conversion. Traditionally she is considered to have been a prostitute although the Biblical evidence is uncertain. The legend of the Magdalene was created out of several stories which may or not have been about the same woman. She is named in Mark 16:1 as one of the three who brought spices to the tomb of Jesus. Other stories
that have come to be associated with Mary Magdalene are the woman who poured ointment over Jesus' head in Simon's house (Mark 14: 3) or over His feet (Luke 8: 38 or John 12: 3), and the Mary Magdalene from whom Jesus cast out seven devils (Luke 8: 2). Heartz says that the theological controversy about the identity of Mary Magdalene was very strong in Paris about the time of these paintings, and that her identity as both courtesan and penitent was attractive to people everywhere.\textsuperscript{41}

The musical setting of this bawdy song is in a simple, chordal style without imitation. Heartz identifies this style with that popular with the court of Louis XII at the beginning of the sixteenth century, lasting from about 1510 to 1520.\textsuperscript{42} The text is set syllabically according to the following scheme:

\begin{align*}
\text{Syllables:} & \quad 6 \quad 6 \quad 6' \quad 6 \quad 6 \quad 6' \\
\text{Rhyme:} & \quad A \quad A \quad B \quad A \quad A \quad B \\
\text{Music:} & \quad a \quad b \quad c \quad a \quad b \quad c'
\end{align*}

\textsuperscript{41} Heartz, "Mary Magdalene," pp. 64-65.

\textsuperscript{42} Ibid., 62-63.
The version of the Magdalene painting in Brussels shows the lady lutenist sitting behind a table on which there are two sheets of music. The top sheet has the same tablature of "Si j'ayme mon amy trop plus" as the other versions of the subject; a partially visible second sheet contains mensural notation and the word "Jouyssance." This has been shown by John Parkinson to be the Superius of Claudin de Sermisy's (c. 1490-1562) setting of a poem by Clément Marot.

The occurrence of these two musical compositions in the same painting forms a connection with the paintings known as the Three Women Musicians. The "Jouyssance vous donneray" chanson is used in each of these paintings showing three young ladies performing music from an open book and a music sheet. The flautist and lutenist read from the open book and the singer holds a separate sheet in both versions of the painting. There are some difficulties concerning the parts the individual performers are using. In the Leningrad copy, the book gives the Tenor part of Claudin's setting (Example III-16); the Vienna copy has the


44. John Parkinson, "A Chanson by Claudin de Sermisy," Music and Letters, XXXIX (April 1958), p. 120.

flautist playing from the Superius book (Plates XXXII and XXXIII). 46


The sheet of music held by the singer presents other difficulties. The Leningrad copy gives a portion of the Superius (measures 2-4) with minor rhythmic errors for the first two notes. However, the music that the singer holds in the Vienna version (Plate XXXIV) does not match

46. Vienna: Schloss Rohrau, No. 44; 60 x 53 cm., with additions.
any of the parts of Claudin's chanson. Just what the singer is supposed to be singing is, therefore, not known. The notation looks real and can be transcribed if a clef (not visible) is assumed. The rests (described by Parkinson as three semibreves in length) are a longa and a semibreve, which would equal five semibreves. Parkinson offered the explanation of these rests as an insertion to account for the singer's closed mouth. Spacing of the notes in this part does not seem to substantiate this explanation. Perhaps a more reasonable explanation for the discrepancies in this and the other parts is that the artist was working from a source that has not yet been discovered. It is difficult to conceive of a painter reproducing the notation with such fidelity to details of clef, pitch, dots, custos, and signature, yet failing to follow the direction of note stems. With few exceptions, the note stems in the Vienna book rise from the note head although most of the heads are above the third line. Normally the stems of notes, both in prints and in many manuscripts, fall below the note head if it is above the third line. This may mean that the master was working from an unknown manuscript or printed source.


The "Jouyssance vous donneray" text by Clément Marot from his *Adolescence Clémentine* (1532) was set by a number of composers other than Claudin, and was cited by Rabelais in Book V of *Pantagruel.*

Jouyssance vous donneray,
Mon amy, et si meneray
La ou pretend vostre esperance;
Vivante ne vous laisseray,
Encor, quant morte je seray,
L'esprit en aura souvenance.

Si pour moy avez du soucy,
Pour vous n'en ay pas moins aussi,
Amour le vous doit faire entendre;
Mais s'il vous greve d'estre ainsi,
Appaisez vostre cueur transyi;
Tout vient à poinct qui peut attendre.

I will give you pleasure,
my friend, and so will I lead
there where your hope aspires.
Living, I will never leave you,
and still, when I am dead
your spirit will remember.

If you have a care for me,
I, also, have no less for you;
Love should make you understand it.
But if it burdens you being thus,
calm your chilled heart.
Everything comes to those who can wait.

Although the poem appears to be a fairly innocuous love song, the double entendre of the word "jouyssance"


(implying sexual pleasure) leaves little doubt about what is hoped for and promised. The final proverbial line, "Tout vient à point qui peut attendre" indicates that gratification will not be swift but will be sweeter for the wait. In the absence of other iconographic evidence, the musical symbolism becomes more important for an interpretation of these paintings. The lute figures prominently in both the Magdalene series and in the Three Women Musicians paintings; the lute case hangs on the wall in one of the Magdalene copies and in both the Three Women Musicians works. The inclusion of both "Si j'ayme mon amy trop plus" and "Jouyssance vous donneray" in the Brussels copy of the Magdalene creates a connection between the two groups of paintings, but the ointment jar is missing in the Three Musicians pair. Is one of the ladies in the Three Musicians the Magdalene and the other two her courtesan companions? Daniel Heartz has made a case for the Magdalene series being portraits of Françoise de Foix, the mistress of François I. Taking his departure from the inclusion of "Si j'ayme mon amy trop plus" in the Chansonnier de Françoise, Heartz finds evidence that Françoise had as one of her devices "playing the role of maumariée in the tradition

of the medieval chanson rurale," and concludes that another might have been taking the role of the Magdalene. If this is a portrait of Françoise executed for François I, it must have been done during their liaison between 1515 and 1524. This period was also the period in which chansons of this type were popular with the court.

If the Magdalene series represents François de Foix as Heartz believes, then the connection between the Brussels copy and the Three Women Musicians might indicate that they are Françoise and two of her friends from the court circle. This too, might explain the use of the Marot/Claudin de Sermisy "Jouyssance vous donneray" in the Three Women Musicians paintings, since Marot was connected with the court of François I and wrote an eulogy on the death of Françoise. Heartz concludes that the Magdalene paintings were connected with Françoise between 1515 and 1525 and that they were executed in Paris rather than in Antwerp. Perhaps this is true of the Three Women Musicians as well.

Claudin's setting of Marot's poem, in four-part polyphony, was first printed by Pierre Attaingnant in the collection Chansons nouvelles en musique a quatre parties ... imprimees a Paris ... 1527 and appeared in six later

53. Ibid., p. 63.
Attainnant prints. The musical setting is sectional, alternating chordal and imitative styles, so that line 1 is chordal, lines 2 and 3 are imitative, line 4 is chordal, and the last two lines are imitative, with the last line repeated. The structure of the setting is as follows:

Syllables: 8 8 8' 8 8 8
Rhyme: A A B A A B
Music: a b c d b' c'

54. Daniel Heartz, Pierre Attainnant, Royal Printer of Music: A Historical Study and Bibliographic Catalogue (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1969). The other prints include three reprints of the four-voice version, one transcription for lute, one for voice and lute, and one for keyboard.
Example III-17. Transcription of "Jouyssance vous donneray" from Trente et sept chansons musicales (attaingnant, 1531), after Allaire and Cazeaux.

Example III-17 (continued).
The most problematic painting to be considered in this study is the portrait of a young woman, supposedly the wife of Mark Ker, in the National Gallery of Scotland (Plate XXXV). 56 The half-length portrait shows a lady in a black dress with red sleeves, holding a tablet with music. The music, in white notation on a dark ground, is headed "ca... a 4 in eodem," and is without text (Plate XXXVI). According to the gallery catalogue, this painting might be the marriage portrait as a companion to the half-length portrait of Mark Kerr, Commendator of Newbattle. 57 Both were thought to have been painted by Antonio Moro, 58 but an old inscription on the back of the lady's portrait gives "Willm Kay" as the painter. Both portraits have since been ascribed to Willem Key on the basis of style. 59

56. Edinburgh: National Gallery of Scotland, No. 1939; 15½ x 11½ in.


Plate XXXV. Willem Key: Portrait of Lady Helen Leslie. Edinburgh, National Gallery of Scotland. (Tom Scott photo).
Plate XXXVI. Willem Key: Portrait of Lady Helen Leslie, detail. Edinburgh, National Gallery of Scotland. (Tom Scott photo).
Both Moro and Key were in demand as portraitists in the middle of the sixteenth century. In the *Schilderboeck*, Carel van Mander quotes the descriptive poem which accompanies the portrait of Key in Lampsonius' series of engraved portraits of famous artists.

Through the able hand of Key,
People's faces have been portrayed;
You believe you are looking at the very persons,
So well did Key succeed.
If we leave Moro beyond consideration,
According to my judgement,
Not any artist in the Netherlands
Excelled Key.

Key, who was born in Breda, became master in the guild at Antwerp in 1542. Antwerp remained the center of his activities until his death there in 1568.

The music shown in the portrait of Lady Helen raises several questions. The first, and the most obvious, is concerned with the reason for having the lady hold a sheet of music. Was she a composer? If she was, there is no existing evidence other than this sheet to prove it. Little is known about her except that she was the daughter of the fourth Earl of Rothes, and that she was married twice. The first marriage was to Gilbert Seton in 1542; the second was


to Mark Ker about 1551 (the date of the painting). Frequently, in portraits of this period, the artist would include in the picture objects identifying the profession or interests of the person portrayed. Some, like the portrait of the Humanist Guillaume Budé by Jean Clouet (c. 1535), showing him with pen and book in hand, are easily understood. Another portrait, of a young man from Cologne, painted by Barthel Bruyn (1528), shows an elegantly clad gentleman standing behind a ledge or table on which rests a sheet of music and a scroll with text. The music is the chanson "Mon seul plaisir, ma douce joye," and the scroll contains a passage from an old French comedy, "Pamphilus de amore." As Lesure puts it, "... it completes the symbolic representation of the inclinations of the young German." More complex symbolism is found in the well-known double portrait by Hans Holbein the Younger of The Ambassadors (Plate XXXVII), to which we will return later. The two gentlemen portrayed were ambassadors from the court of François I to that of Henry VIII and were civil or church officials. On a table between them is a collection of objects representing knowledge of various kinds. Among


64. Lesure, Musik und Gesellschaft im Bild, p. 48 and plate 13.
the objects in the grouping are musical instruments and a book of music containing Luther's setting of "Veni sancte spiritus" and the beginning of his "Ten Commandments Lied" (Plate XXXVIII). The music indicates the efforts of one of the gentlemen pictured, the Bishop of Lavour, to heal the rift between the Catholics and the reformers.

By extension then, the music in the portrait of Lady Helen should be significant. Perhaps she was a composer or a serious amateur musician. She is shown pointing to the music as if to indicate its importance. We have seen this same motive of the pointing finger in a number of other paintings. Surely the music is not merely something to hold, having no other meaning.

What of the music itself? Although not all of the heading is readable, it appears to be the instruction "canon a 4 in eodem," or a four-part canon at the unison. Canons such as this were quite popular among Flemish musicians of the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries. Apel, who quotes Tinctoris' definition of canon as "... a rule which shows the intention of the composer in an obscure way" goes on to say that "Musicians of the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries certainly succeeded in making this definition come true."65 Some of these canons were to be resolved by using different mensurations for each part, others by finding the

hidden meaning in an inscription.

Almost immediately the problem of realizing the canon becomes apparent. There is only one mensuration sign and no "explanatory" canon to suggest a resolution. There are two symbols that seem to be the letters "B" and "A" over the final note, but no explanation for them has been found. Are they really letters, and if so, what is the meaning; do they hold the key to the resolution? There are also two signa congruentiae, which could either indicate the stopping points or the starting points for two additional voices, but where does the fourth voice begin or end? Is this, perhaps, the reason for the pointed finger?

Example III-18. Notation of the canon in Key's Portrait of Lady Helen Leslie. The arrow indicates the pointed finger.
In mensuration canons, the *signa congruentiae* would normally indicate the stopping points, but, if one employs the mensurations commonly used in such canons (C, C, C₃, O), the parts run past these points or end before reaching them. There is no sign to indicate that there should be a repetition in any of the parts. If they are starting points, using only the mensuration sign shown, a large number of unacceptable dissonances result because of the almost completely step-wise movement of the original melody. The lack of a repetition sign, and the shortness of the melody causes a long extension of the final note. A realization of only two voices, using the first *signum congruentiae* as the starting point for the second voice, will serve to demonstrate the harmonic problems.

Example III-19. Realization of two voices of the canon in Willem Key's *Portrait of Lady Helen Leslie*.
And so the questions remain unanswered. If Lady Helen was a composer, and this is an example of her work, she does not seem to have been very skillful. At least part of the problem in realizing the canon must be laid at the feet of the painter who copied the music. The notation is not carefully drawn, and clues to the realization seem to be inadequate or incomplete. Perhaps one day the key to this puzzle will be found, but until than it remains a tantalizing mystery.

The previously mentioned double portrait of The Ambassadors by Hans Holbein the Younger, with its complex musical quotations, provides a transition to the popular "Vanitas" still-life paintings of the seventeenth century. This well-known portrait of Jean de Dinteville and Georges de Selve was executed in 1533. Between them, a table holds a variety of items showing the knowledge of these two gentlemen. Included in the collection are a globe, books, astronomical instruments, a lute with a broken string, several flutes, and an open book of music. Concerning this book, placed near Georges de Selve, the Bishop of Lavour, Lesure says:

Holbein lets us glimpse near him the tenor part-book of a song collection. It is Johann Walter's Geistliches Gesangbuchlein, second edition, printed by Peter Schöffer in 1525, and it

66. London: National Gallery; 81½ x 82½ in.
signifies here a symbol of the hopes of Georges de Selve for a reunification of the Roman church and the churches of the Reformation, which was his most longed-for wish. The choice of the two pieces in the open book—Luther's German revision of the "Veni sancte spiritus" and the beginning of his "Ten Commandments Lied"—was probably intended to conjure /zu beschworen/ the fulfillment of this wish. 67

One of the most interesting aspects of this painting is the diagonal gray shape stretching across the bottom. When viewed from the correct angle, it resolves into a skull which Cuttler says may refer to the personal device of Jean de Dinteville. 68 Perhaps more importantly, it combines with the other still life objects in a symbolism of "Vanitas".

In his discussion of the "Vanitas" paintings of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, Fischer says:

The "vanity" of painting becomes all the more poignant when it comes to portraits: to "immortalize" oneself on a painting is a threefold deception—a transient person, who wants to display himself in his vanity, by means of a vain method. The remedy was soon put into the paintings: the emblem of transiency such as the hour-glass and especially the skull. ... Throughout the sixteenth century the portrait with the "instructive" skull prevailed in North-West Europe, and especially in the North Netherlands... 69

---

67. Lesure, Musik und Gesellschaft im Bild, p. 28.
68. Cuttler, Northern Painting, p. 413.
69. Fischer, Music in Paintings, p. 46.
The gentlemen of the Ambassadors portrait were both highly placed, one an important civil official, the other a Bishop; both were ambassadors from the court of François I to that of Henry VIII. It is not unlikely that the hidden skull represents, in conjunction with the symbols of knowledge, a hidden warning against vanity just as the obvious skull did in other portraits and in "Vanitas" still-lifes.

The guild portrait, popular during the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, is represented here by two examples. The first, by Dirk Jacobsz. (c. 1497-1567), the Cloveniersdoelen (A Company of the Civic Guard in Three Parts) in Amsterdam,70 shows a sheet of music held by one man in the left wing. The central panel was signed and dated 1529; however the two wing panels were not painted until much later.71 The music in the left wing, although not added until the seventeenth century, seems to be part of a chanson from the earlier period. Only two words are clearly readable, but the notation is rather carefully drawn. The composition has not been identified, but the notation is shown in Example III-20 with the hope that someone will recognize the work.

70. Amsterdam: Rijksmuseum, No. 1288; 122 x 340 cm. (center panel), 120 x 78 cm. (wings).

71. Catalogue of Paintings, Rijksmuseum Amsterdam (1960), p. 153 gives a dating for these wings as not before 1635/40.
Example III-20. Music notation in Dirk Jacobsz.' A Company of the Civic Guard, left wing. The section marked with the asterisk is not distinct in the painting.

\[ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccc}
\text{pour amor} \\
\text{pour} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} \\
\text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} & \text{...} \\
\end{array} \]

Another painting, by Cornelis Antoniszoon (or Teunissen) of the Braspennenmaaltijd is dated 1533 in the top left corner. This group portrait of seventeen members of the civic guard shows them at a banquet and one of the members holds a sheet of music.\(^72\) Martin Picker has identified the music as the Discantus of the Busnois setting of "In minen sin." Since Busnois died in 1492, Picker considers the choice of this chanson appropriate to the archaic style of the painting.\(^73\) Fischer, on the other hand, suggests three other possible interpretations.

\(^{72}\) Amsterdam: Rijksmuseum, No. 366A1; 130 x 206.5 cm. For an expanded discussion of this work and that of Dirk Jacobsz., see Alois Riegl, Das Holländische gruppenporträt, 2 vols. (Vienna: Österreichischen Staatsdruckerei, 1931), I, pp. 40-65.

\(^{73}\) Martin Picker, "Newly Discovered Sources for In Minen Sin," Journal of the American Musicological Society, XVII (1964), pp. 133-143. Reproductions of the painting and the detail of the music are included in this article.
The banquet was probably held on the festival of the patron saint of marksmen, Saint George, April 23rd. He can be seen in the top right-hand corner of the panel: a knight on horseback pictured in a stained-glass window. But this is only half of the St. George story. The other half is that he rescued a beautiful young princess from a dragon. A landscape in which this is supposed to have taken place can be seen through the window, but there is no sign of the maiden, and it is not certain whether the painter really intended to illustrate the dragon's homeground. For although this landscape is not reminiscent of Amsterdam, it was the fashion to paint such views through windows, especially in portraits of Amsterdam citizens at that time. Perhaps the maiden for whom St. George is searching is the one referred to in the song, so that the marksman could feel the association with their patron saint. And in the second place we see the merriment of the gathering expressed here. But perhaps there is a third 'meaning'. If we consider the brown habits, might we not see a gibe at the poor Franciscans, which would mean that this painting represents the same type as those from the circle around Hieronymus Bosch (the monks making music in the egg), where the love song indicates the depths to which the monks have sunk, or simply a gibe at their celibacy?

Of the three possibilities presented by Fischer, the second, that this is simply a scene of merry-making, seems the most plausible. The first interpretation, that involving the story of St. George, appears to be an attempt to force some rather diverse elements to fit an interpretation. True, the text of the chanson, "In mijnen sijn heb ijk vercoren een meijsken" ("In my thoughts I have chosen a maiden") could fit the St. George story. Likewise, it would be appropriate music for a gathering of this kind.

74. Fischer, Music in Paintings, p. 43.
The text, and the tune associated with it, was an extremely popular one in the late fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries. As a popular song it is quite suitable for a scene of merry-making. There is no evidence to support Fischer's third interpretation, that this could be a satiric sork in the manner of Bosch. The "habits" are very similar to the clothing worn by the company of civic guards in the earlier group portrait by Dirk Jacobsz.

Summary

Following in the footsteps of Hugo van der Goes, some Northern painters began to include musical quotations in paintings for specific iconographic reasons. During the late fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries, a number of paintings contain pieces of music by some of the leading composers, and others contain works by unknown composers. Some of the quotations may be traced, as in the case of the "Ung gay bergier" chanson in Pieter Pourbus' Allegorical Love Feast, to a specific musical source. In other paintings, the source for the quotation has not been found, but the music was widely disseminated through numerous printed collections so that recognition of the music could

75. For a list of many of the settings see Martin Picker, "Polyphonic Settings c. 1500 of the Flemish Tune 'In minen sin'," Journal of the American Musicological Society, XII (1959), pp. 94-95 and additions in the article cited in Note 73.
be expected. The text of a quotation in some paintings, always important, is the most significant item in some musical inscriptions now because no source, other than the painting itself, has been found. This is the case with the "Gloria in excelsis" bound in Jacob Cornelisz. van Oostsaanen's Adoration of the Christ Child. A few readable quotations like the canon in Key's Portrait of Lady Helen Leslie, defy analysis, and pose more questions than they answer. It appears that, even when they are no longer completely understood, when readable music was included in a painting, it was done to expand the meaning of the picture in addition to the realism imparted by the notation itself.
CHAPTER IV
CONCLUSIONS

The preceding chapters have shown that the use of music notation in Netherlandish paintings of the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries gave added meaning to the subject. Whether merely hinted at by blank books, scrolls, or sheets, simulated by lines and dots, or brought to fruition by accurate quotation, music brought its own special qualities to the iconographic system. In paintings of sacred subjects, of satirical or moralizing scenes, of allegory, or in portraits, music, and especially musical quotations, provided substantial clues for the interpretation of a painting.

Real or simulated notation was used to give more naturalism to the singing of the angels at the nativity of Christ by showing the song of the angels, "Gloria in excelsis Deo, et in terra pax hominibus" (Luke 2:14). Similarly, devotional pictures of the Virgin and Child could be given added meaning by the inclusion of the crown of the Queen of Heaven and a quotation from a setting of the "Ave Regina coelorum" text.

The satirical and moralizing works of Hieronymus Bosch also benefited from the use of music notation even though, as far as is known, he never painted a quotation
from a real musical composition. His use of the four-line staff in the choirbook of the Hell panel of the Garden of Delights was surely intended to represent a perversion of sacred music, just as the use of musical instruments associated with the praise of God (Psalm 150) was a perversion in the same panel. Many of the same motifs and devices are found in the Last Judgements located in Vienna and Brussels. Lutes and harps are featured, along with many of the other instruments of the Garden of Delights Hell panel. In addition, the Vienna work again has an unholy choir, accompanied by a personified bagpipe, singing from a choirbook of the same style as that in the Garden of Delights.

Secular pieces, sometimes produced in numerous copies like the Magdalene group by the Master of the Female Half-Lengths or the al fresco amorous scenes by Pourbus and Benson, were given added meaning through the use of music notation. The Magdalene group appears, on the surface, to be merely pictures of a lovely young woman playing the lute. The elaborate jar could be considered only an ornament unless it is recognized as the ointment jar symbolic of Mary Magdalene. However, taken with the bawdy chanson, "Si j'ayme mon amy trop plus que mon mary," one sees this young lady in a different light. Perhaps these objects, taken together, refer to the Magdalene of the Bible stories in her traditional role. On the other hand, perhaps Heartz is right in finding an association between the role of the
Magdalene and the games played by Françoise de Foix, the mistress of François I. It is certainly true that Colin Slim has found a hidden significance in many group scenes of amorous dalliance which translate into scenes of the debauchery of the Prodigal Son.

Musical quotations in portraits were sometimes used to indicate the profession or provide an insight into the life of the person portrayed. In some instances, like Key’s portrait of Lady Helen Leslie, they suggest that the person was a composer or a musical dilettante. In other cases, like the Bruyn portrait of the gentleman from Cologne and the Holbein Two Ambassadors, they show the pleasures or aspirations of the person portrayed.

As seen in this study, the variety of paintings containing musical quotations, and the variety of music quoted, is broad. During the seventeenth century, many of these types of paintings continued along with a growing interest in portraits, landscapes, still-life and genre paintings.\(^1\) The symbolism inherent in the use of musical notation in the fifteenth and sixteenth century Netherlandish paintings was incorporated into seventeenth century works,

especially still-life and genre paintings. With the increasing interest in musical iconography, more examples of musical quotations in paintings may be expected to emerge. As these quotations become identified, we may recapture an important iconographic device and thereby expand our understanding of the Northern Renaissance mind.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Music

General Research Sources


Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart. Edited by Friedrich Blume. 14 vols, to date. Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1949-.


Studies


Pirro, André. *Histoire de la musique de la fin du XIV\textsuperscript{e} siècle à la fin du XVI\textsuperscript{e} siècle*. Paris: Librairie Renouard, 1940.


Musical Sources


________. Manuscript Additional 35087. British Museum Microfilms.


**Art**

**General Research Sources**


Studies


Iconographic Studies


Besseler, Heinrich; Schneider, M.; Bachmann, W.; and Salmen, W. Musikgeschichte in Bildern. 4 vols. Leipzig: VEB Deutscher Verlag für Musik, 1961-68.


_______. "La Musique dans les allégories de l'Amour. II. Eros." Gazette des beaux-arts, Ser. 6, LXIX (1967), pp. 319-43.


**Miscellaneous**


