INFORMATION TO USERS

This material was produced from a microfilm copy of the original document. While the most advanced technological means to photograph and reproduce this document have been used, the quality is heavily dependent upon the quality of the original submitted.

The following explanation of techniques is provided to help you understand markings or patterns which may appear on this reproduction.

1. The sign or “target” for pages apparently lacking from the document photographed is “Missing Page(s)”. If it was possible to obtain the missing page(s) or section, they are spliced into the film along with adjacent pages. This may have necessitated cutting thru an image and duplicating adjacent pages to insure you complete continuity.

2. When an image on the film is obliterated with a large round black mark, it is an indication that the photographer suspected that the copy may have moved during exposure and thus cause a blurred image. You will find a good image of the page in the adjacent frame.

3. When a map, drawing or chart, etc., was part of the material being photographed the photographer followed a definite method in “sectioning” the material. It is customary to begin photoing at the upper left hand corner of a large sheet and to continue photoing from left to right in equal sections with a small overlap. If necessary, sectioning is continued again — beginning below the first row and continuing on until complete.

4. The majority of users indicate that the textual content is of greatest value, however, a somewhat higher quality reproduction could be made from “photographs” if essential to the understanding of the dissertation. Silver prints of “photographs” may be ordered at additional charge by writing the Order Department, giving the catalog number, title, author and specific pages you wish reproduced.

5. PLEASE NOTE: Some pages may have indistinct print. Filmed as received.

University Microfilms International
300 North Zeeb Road
Ann Arbor, Michigan 48106 USA
St. John's Road, Tyler's Green
High Wycombe, Bucks, England HP10 8HR
TULL, James Robert, 1929-
B. V. ASAF'EV'S MUSICAL FORM AS A
PROCESS: TRANSLATION AND COMMENTARY
(VOLUMES I-III).

The Ohio State University, Ph.D., 1977
Music

Xerox University Microfilms, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48106

© Copyright by
James Robert Tull
1976
B. V. ASAF'EV'S MUSICAL FORM AS A PROCESS
TRANSLATION AND COMMENTARY

VOLUME I

DISSERTATION

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for
the Degree Doctor of Philosophy in the Graduate
School of the Ohio State University

By
James Robert Tull, B.M., M.A.

THE OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY
1976

Reading Committee:

Dr. Norman Phelps, Professor of Music Theory
Dr. William Poland, Professor of
Music Theory
Dr. Keith Mixter, Professor of Music History

Approved By
Norman Phelps
Department of Music
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

A profound debt of gratitude and affection is acknowledged to Professor Norman Phelps, who has been more than merely an adviser. His wise counsel, unwavering support, and infinite patience have been an irreplaceable and priceless gift, and my association with him during the preparation of this dissertation and before has been a rare privilege.

Particular appreciation is due to Professor Keith Mixter and Professor William Poland for their interest, the long hours spent, and the valuable advice given as members of the reading committee for this dissertation, with a special note of thanks to Dr. Poland for his painstaking proof-reading of the final copy.

Profound gratitude is also acknowledged to Professor Henry A. Bruinsma, who, during the short period during which he served as my adviser, exerted every effort on my behalf.

I am indebted to the Administration of The Ohio State University Graduate School which, throughout my association with that institution has shown an exceptional degree of sensitivity and understanding consideration of my goals and circumstances. I am further indebted to the Foreign Area
Fellowship Program of the American Council of Learned Societies and the Social Science Research Council for a generous grant which enabled me to undertake a valuable year of study in the Russian Institute of Columbia University in New York City, and to the Board of Education of the Central Islip, New York, Public Schools for granting me a one year sabbatical from my duty as an instrumental music teacher to continue my research.

Special thanks go to Professor Leon Twarog Chairman of The Ohio State University Department of Slavic Languages and Literature for his interest and efforts in my behalf, and to Professor Malcolm Brown of the Indiana University Music Department and Professor Stanley Krebs, of the Music Department of the University of California at Santa Barbara, for their advice, support and friendship.

For the practical realization of this paper I thank the typists of the Heim Business Corporation in Melville, New York, for diligent and dedicated application of their skills in a time period almost too short, and express particular appreciation to Mr. Lew Harris, of Helm Business Corporation for interest and dedication beyond a mere business arrangement.

I acknowledge my debt to a long list of professors, teachers, colleagues and friends who, by instruction, example, support and encouragement have all played a part in the completion of this study.
Last, and far from least, I affectionately and gratefully acknowledge the many roles my wife has played, as typist, proof-reader, consultant, critic, sounding board and cheerleader; and the understanding patience of my two children, who, for the first time in their young lives will no longer have to share their father's time and attention with his dissertation.
VITA

February 3, 1929 . . . . Born - Tuscaloosa, Alabama

1951 . . . . . . . . . B.M. (Public School Music), Ohio Wesleyan University, Delaware, Ohio

1959 . . . . . . . . . M.A. (Music Education) Western Reserve University, Cleveland, Ohio

1960-1962. . . . . . Graduate Assistant in Music History The Ohio State University.

1962-1963. . . . . . Graduate Fellowship The Ohio State University

1963-1964. . . . . . Foreign Area Fellowship Program Grant, Columbia University, New York, New York

1966-1977. . . . . . Adjunct Lecturer in Music, Brooklyn College, City University of New York, New York, New York

FIELDS OF STUDY

Major Field: Music Theory

Studies in the History of Music Theory. Professor Henry W. Kaufman and Norman Phelps

Studies in Twentieth Century Musical Analysis. Professors Norman Phelps and Alvin Johnson

Studies in Music Theory and Composition, Professor Marshall Barnes

Studies in Analysis of Renaissance and Baroque Music, Professor Richard Hoppin and Mark Walker
# TABLE OF CONTENTS - VOLUME I

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGMENTS</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VITA</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF MUSICAL EXAMPLES</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. BIOGRAPHY</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Early Years</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Revolution and Civil War</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The NEP Period</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Proletarian Hegemony in Literature and Music (/929-32)</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The 'Thirties: Socialist Realism: Asaf'ev as Composer.</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. World War II</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. The Last Years: The Zhdanovshchina</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. THEORETICAL WORK: MUSICAL FORM AS A PROCESS.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Literary Style</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Marxism and the Sociological Method.</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Content of Musical Form as a Process</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Philosophical Contemporaries: Kurth and Yavorskii</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Assessment and Conclusion</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. A NOTE ON THE TRANSLATION</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## LIST OF MUSICAL EXAMPLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ex.</th>
<th>Musical Example</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Basic pattern of symmetrical repetition.</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Repititio vocis (Stimmtausch)-thirteenth century</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Examples of repetition in &quot;exchange of voices&quot; (from Wooldridge):</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Example a) and b)</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Example c)</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Example d) Conductus duplex.</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Rondellus (Wooldridge)</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Subject of c♯ minor fugue (J.S.Bach, Das Wohltemperierte Klavier)</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Outline: Opening of Beethoven Symphony #5</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Formula of Psalmody (from G. Adler)</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Rhythmic motive: R. Schumann, Symphony #3</td>
<td>282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Motive from Beethoven, Symphony #1</td>
<td>282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Fragment from Schubert, &quot;Wanderer&quot; Fantasia</td>
<td>284</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Fragment from Tchaikovsky, &quot;The Tempest&quot;</td>
<td>286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Introductory passage, Beethoven, Symphony #1, Finale</td>
<td>286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Examples of medieval cadences with two semitones (Machabey)</td>
<td>294</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>Examples of twelfth, thirteenth, fourteenth century cadences</td>
<td>294</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>Excerpt from Haydn, G Major Quartet (op.,33 No. 5)</td>
<td>297</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>Passage from Beethoven, &quot;Prometheus&quot; Overture</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td>Passage from Wagner, Siegfried</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.</td>
<td>Rudimentary rondo melody (Gennrich)</td>
<td>310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20.</td>
<td>Unidentified example</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21.</td>
<td>Passage from Mozart, Overture to Marriage of Figaro</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22.</td>
<td>Ibid</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23.</td>
<td>Theme from Beethoven, &quot;Eroica&quot; Symphony</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25.</td>
<td>Ibid</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26.</td>
<td>Rondo from &quot;Romance of the Rose&quot;</td>
<td>359</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27.</td>
<td>Ibid</td>
<td>359</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28.</td>
<td>Rondel William d'Amiens paignour</td>
<td>359</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29.</td>
<td>Example: Beginning of the fourteenth century</td>
<td>360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30.</td>
<td>Example: <em>Roman de Fauvel</em></td>
<td>360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31.</td>
<td>Ibid</td>
<td>361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32.</td>
<td>Fragments from J. S. Bach, Fifth Brandenburg Concerto</td>
<td>386</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33.</td>
<td>&quot;Dialectical&quot; chord progression</td>
<td>405</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34.</td>
<td>Mozart, Quartet No. 7, Sonata allegro (transition to working-out)</td>
<td>408</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35.</td>
<td>Mozart, Quartet No. 9, Sonata allegro (end of exposition and beginning of working-out)</td>
<td>408</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36.</td>
<td>Beethoven, Violin sonata, op. 23, Sonata allegro (transition and beginning of working-out)</td>
<td>409</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37.</td>
<td>Mozart, Quartet No. 5, Principal theme of Allegro</td>
<td>409</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38.</td>
<td>Mozart, Quartet, No. 5, End of exposition and beginning of working out</td>
<td>410</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39.</td>
<td>Haydn F Major Quartet, op. 74, No. 2:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a)</td>
<td>Beginning (Introduction)</td>
<td>411</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b)</td>
<td>Theme of allegro</td>
<td>411</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c)</td>
<td>Subsidiary theme</td>
<td>411</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d)</td>
<td>Transition to repetition of exposition</td>
<td>411</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e)</td>
<td>Transition to reprise</td>
<td>411</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
40. Beethoven, C major sonata (op.2, No.3):
   Beginning of working out.............416

41. J.S. Bach, Fragment from First Brandenburg Concerto,
    Adagio ..............................421

42. Beethoven, fragment of C major sonata ............423

43. Pass’e mezzo d’Italia ............................448

44. Pass’e mezzo d’Italia (Secondo modo) ................448

45. Pass’e mezzo d’Italia (Quinto modo) ................448

46. Saltarello (Pass’e mezzo moderno) ................449

47. Saltarello (Secondo modo) ........................449

48. Saltarello (Quarto modo) ........................449

49. Represa ..........................................449

50. Frescobaldi Canzona ..............................455

51. Beethoven, passage from Symphony #5 (Finale)
    (Examples a & b)  ..........485
    (Examples c, d, e) ..........486

52. Tonal sphere of Beethoven, Symphony #5 1st movement.487

53. Tonal sphere of Beethoven, Symphony #5, finale,...487

54. Opening motive, Beethoven, Symphony #5 sonata
    allegro  ................488

55. Opening passage, Beethoven, Symphony #5 Finale  ...488

56. Main theme, Haydn Quartet, op. 33, No. 2, finale .494

57. Seventeenth century German festive, "triumphal music" .500

58. Mozart, Piano sonata in B♭ major (K. 331), 
    Rondo theme  ................526

59. Mozart, Piano sonata in B♭ major (K. 281) ........526

60. Thematic outline from Rimski-Korsakov, Snegurochka .550

61. Thematic outline from Rimski-Korsakov, Kitezh  ....550
INTRODUCTION

There can be few instances of Russian musicians of the very highest distinction in the land of their birth about whom so little has been heard in Western Europe as that of Boris Vladimirovich Asaf'ev.¹

The literal truth of this observation may be questionable, but the underlying point remains valid. It is indeed curious that Asaf'ev, a highly respected and influential Soviet musicologist and composer, who received an almost unprecedented list of honors and awards in his native land, whose life and works continue to evoke new studies and republications more than twenty-five years after his death, and whose most successful musical compositions are still performed and widely known among his own people, remains virtually unknown outside the borders of the Soviet Union. We will try to dispel some of the anonymity shrouding Asaf'ev in the West and place him in his historical setting, after which we will examine the content of his two books entitled Musical Form as a Process in light of their philosophical stimuli.

A. BIOGRAPHY

1. Early Years

Boris Vladimirovich Asaf'ev was born, by his own account, "...in [St.] Petersburg on 17 July (old style [i.e., by the Julian calendar]), 1884, in the family of a petty official...."2 Unusual musical ability manifested itself early in the boy, in the form of absolute pitch, excellent tonal memory, and the ability to sight-read (both piano music and full scores) with facility, but neither his exceptional gifts, nor his general educational aspirations received much encouragement from his family. He was, however, able to complete his secondary education (with distinction) at the gymnasium in Kronstadt (the island, deep-water port, serving St. Petersburg, on the Gulf of Finland), all the while pursuing a rather haphazard path of musical development, mainly by "autodidactic" methods.

In 1903, Asaf'ev entered the department of history and philology of the St. Petersburg University. The same year, however, he came to a major turning point in his life's course when he became acquainted with two major figures of nineteenth century Russian musical life: the culture critic V. V. Stasov (1824-1906), who had been personally acquainted with Glinka, and is best remembered in

western musical circles for his close association, in the capacity of ideologist, propagandist, and adviser, with the members of the "New Russian Music School," known to westerners more commonly, as "The Five") and Rimski-Korsakov (1844-1908), a composer of international reputation, who had been one of "The Five", and was a professor at the St. Petersburg Conservatory.

The latter association had profound practical advantages for Asaf'ev. His musical gifts seem to have made an immediate favorable impression on Rimski-Korsakov, who accordingly sent him for music studies, preparatory to entering the Conservatory, to Kalafati, a respected musician. The following year (1904) Asaf'ev passed his entrance examinations and was admitted to the Conservatory with a stipend (granted through the direct intercession of Rimski-Korsakov, who was also on the examining committee). At the same time, he continued his studies in the university.

Stasov's influence on Asaf'ev, though of a less practical nature than that of Rimski-Korsakov, was the

---

3Vasili Pavlovich Kalafati (1869-1942), a composer and professor of composition at the St. Petersburg Conservatory, and a former student of Rimski-Korsakov's. At the time of Asaf'ev's studies with him, Kalafati was also performing a similar tutorial function, apparently also on Rimski-Korsakov's recommendation, for Stravinsky, who seems to have made a less positive initial impression on Rimski-Korsakov than did Asaf'ev.
more profound. Stasov's personality was marked by an exceptionally broad range of interests, a voracious appetite for learning and culture, infectious enthusiasms, and a need, amounting almost to an obsession, to share his enthusiasms with receptive disciples. Although he had received some early musical training and enjoyed playing the piano for his own amusement (especially four-handed arrangements of orchestral compositions—a tradition of those pre-phonographic times), his professional involvement with music was in the capacity of critic and propagandist, an activity which was obliged to compete for his time and attention with critical and scholarly writing in the fields of literature, the visual arts, and archaeology. An immediate effect of Asaf'ev's association with Stasov was to put him in personal contact with a number of the outstanding Russian cultural figures of the time, including the writer Maxim Gorky (1868-1936), the painter Repin (1844-1930) the composers Lyadov (1855-1914) and Glazunov (1865-1936), who were also both on the examining committee for the Conservatory, and the singer Chaliapin (1813-1938).

In broader terms, Stasov represented, for Asaf'ev a direct personal link with the entire history of Russian music as an internationally recognized, national art form. He imparted to Asaf'ev his enthusiasm, his fascination with new ideas, and the breadth of his involvement in other
disciplines. More specifically, he seems to have recognized and stimulated (by counsel and example) Asaf'ev's incipient interest in folklore and Russian nationalism in music. His influence is particularly apparent in Asaf'ev's life-long study of Glinka and only slightly less intense later interest in Musorgskii. The subject of Shakespeare, also a part of Stasov's legacy, crops up often in Asaf'ev's writing, in addition to which he wrote incidental music for eight Shakespearean plays.

Among the figures of major stature in Soviet musical life during its first three decades, only Glazunov (beside Asaf'ev) could claim significant personal contact with Stasov, and, although he was director of the St. Petersburg Conservatory from 1905, his creative productivity seems to have dwindled drastically from approximately that same 

\[4\text{A much quoted remark is Asaf'ev's observation, "As a matter of fact, I cannot remember when I have not worked on Glinka" (B. V. Asaf'ev, "Moya tvorcheskaya rabota v Leningrade v pervye gody Velikoi Otechestvennoi voiny [My Creative Work in Leningrad in the First Years of World War II]," Sovetskaya muzyka, X, No. 10 (1946), p. 93.}

\[5\text{During the 'twenties Asaf'ev was a particularly fervent supporter of the restoration of the "authentic" Musorgskii from Rimski-Korsakov's "corrective" editions, a task completed, in the case of the opera Boris Godunov, in 1926 by P. A. Lamm. Asaf'ev himself attempted a reinstrumentation of Khovanshchina in 1931, but it has remained unpublished.} \]
his participation thereafter was largely administrative and his artistic influence minimal. He left the Soviet Union for good in 1928. Thus, only Asaf'ev served to continue and expand Stasov's heritage in the field of music into the Soviet period, thereby providing the connection for Soviet music with its national heritage.

In the conservatory he studied composition with Lyadov and orchestration with Rimski-Korsakov. His desire to study composition on an individual basis with the latter was left unrealized when the great composer died in 1908, the very year in which Asaf'ev's successful completion of his university studies left him sufficiently unencumbered with other academic commitments to permit the necessary concentration on his compositional studies.

During his Conservatory years, Asaf'ev entered upon lifelong friendships with two other aspiring young composers, Sergei Prokofiev (1891-1953) who was only thirteen years old at his entrance to the Conservatory in the same year as Asaf'ev's, and Nicolaï Myaskovskiï (1881-1950) who is remembered as the composer of twenty-seven symphonies. Myaskovskiï, for much of his life, had been engaged in the conscientious, but unenthusiastic, pursuit

---

(in conformity with family tradition) of a course of training as a military engineer, while simultaneously carrying on a dogged and dedicated struggle to study music. After completion of his military studies, in 1903, and an additional four years of military service, he resigned from active military service and entered the Conservatory at the age of twenty six. As a mature and serious student he seems to have exerted a salutary influence on both of his younger classmates. With Prokofiev, ten years his junior and seemingly of a disposition of character almost diametrically opposed to Myaskovskii's in all but their commitment to composing, he entered into a remarkably productive relationship of friendship, mutual respect, and creative interchange, a relationship noted with benevolent envy by Asaf'ev who sometimes felt himself to be an outsider in their presence.  

Prokofiev, himself, acknowledged that he had "...derived much more benefit [from this association] ...than from Lyadov's dry lessons." To his association with Asaf'ev, Myaskovskii brought an already quite extensive knowledge of musical literature, especially

---


of the works of several western European composers regarded as progressive at that time (e.g. Reger, Debussy, etc.).

In addition, in their early post-Conservatory associations, Myaskovskii was the first of the two to engage in critical writing, and it was he who encouraged Asaf'ev to enter this field of activity.\(^9\)

Completing his Conservatory education in 1910, Asaf'ev secured a position as piano accompanist for rehearsals of the corps de ballet of the Mariinski Theatre,\(^10\) employment which provided a solid apprenticeship in the area of theatrical music—his area of maximum competence as a composer—and permitted him to expand his knowledge of the musical literature of ballet and opera by both Russian and European composers. It also provided continued and additional opportunities for personal contacts with many of the greatest figures of Russian music—performers, composers,


\(^10\) Now the Kirov Theatre (Leningrad State Academic Theatre of Opera and Ballet in the Name of S. M. Kirov).
conductors, choreographers, entrepreneurs—particularly in the fields of opera and ballet. Parenthetically, on whatever date his actual employment commenced, it is apparent that Asaf'ev was no stranger to that theatre, for a short ballet piece of his composition was publicly performed there in 1909 by the great dancers Anna Pavlova (to whom the work was dedicated) and Vatslav Nizhinski. Nizhinski had also collaborated with Asaf'ev in the preparation of the ballet portions of an unpublished children's opera as early as 1906. The performance of the latter work, Asaf'ev's first independent large composition, was also Nizhinski's debut as a balletmaster.  

From 1911 to 1914 Asaf'ev made annual summer trips to Europe in connection with his intensified study of the history and theory of the arts. On these trips he visited theatres, museums, and libraries in Germany, France, Italy, Austria, and Switzerland, and in general expanded his knowledge of the West. Although the principal focus of these trips was on the visual arts, he also attended

11Kabalevskii, op. cit., p. 9.


concerts and absorbed information on and impressions of western music.

Asaf'ev's literary career in the field of music, after a number of tentative anonymous efforts beginning as early as 1907, began in earnest in 1914 with a survey of the Mariinskiĭ Theatre's 1913-1914 season, appearing in the Moscow-based journal, Muzyka, edited by V. V. Derzhanovskiĭ. Asaf'ev entered upon this aspect of his activity with great reluctance and self-doubt, and only, finally, after repeated urging by Myaskovskiĭ. Even at that, so strong was Asaf'ev's lack of self-confidence, that he would not permit his own name to be attached to the article, but published it under the pseudonym, Igor' Glebov, suggested to him by Derzhanovskiĭ. The article, a constructive criticism of the Mariinskiĭ Theatre's "unenterprising repertoire," elicited a wide, generally favorable response, and proved to be only the first step upon a long and illustrious career as a critic and scholar. For some time, however, Asaf'ev's musicological and critical writings continued to appear exclusively under the pseudonym, Igor' Glebov.

Asaf'ev continued as a regular contributor to Muzyka

---

till 1916. In March of that year, he transferred the major part of his activity to the journal, *Muzykal'nyi sovremennik* [Musical Contemporary] edited by Andrei N. Rimskiĭ-Korsakov (the son of the famous composer) and P. P. Suvchinskiĭ, contributing both to the journal and to a separate supplemental publication, *Chronicle [Khronika] of the Journal "Musical Contemporary."* In 1917, on the very eve of revolution, Asaf'ev parted company with *Musical Contemporary*, when an enthusiastic review by him of a concert of compositions by Myaskovskiĭ, Prokofiev, and Stravinsky was rejected for publication by Rimskiĭ-Korsakov. Asaf'ev and P. P. Suvchinskiĭ (who joined him in his break with *Musical Contemporary*) then planned to co-edit a series of collections of articles under the title of *Melos*. Only two volumes were actually published, in December, 1917 and early in 1918 (both prepared for publication before the October Revolution). A third planned volume never appeared.

It is worth noting that in his collaboration with both of the aforementioned journals--*Muzyka*, the orientation of which inclined to be almost uncritically modernist, and *Musical Contemporary*, which in spite of its name was "moderately academic"[^15] in its inclinations--Asaf'ev

[^15]: Orlova, op. cit., p. 36.
maintained a characteristic balance in his own interests between a sensitive and sympathetic approach to the nineteenth century "classics," both Russian and Western European, and a discriminating and perceptive interest in contemporary works. Asaf'ev was early in recognizing the great promise in the output of his two friends and former classmates, Myaskovskiĭ and Prokofiev, as well as that of Stravinsky. The work of his old mentor and benefactor, N. A. Rimskiĭ-Korsakov, not surprisingly, figures quite prominently in his studies of the nineteenth century.
2. Revolution and Civil War

The year 1917 in Russia witnessed two revolutions. The first, in February and March, marked the culmination of a prolonged period of social unrest and dissatisfaction, brought finally to the boiling point by Russia’s increasingly unpopular participation (from 1914) in World War I. The first revolution resulted in the abdication of Tsar Nicholas II and the establishment of a Provisional Government, made up of a coalition of groups to the left of the political spectrum. The second, in October —the so-called "Great October Revolution"—was a massive takeover of power by a tightly organized Marxist minority, the Bolsheviks, headed by V. I. Lenin and Leon Trotsky, and culminated

---

16 At the time of the Revolutions, the Old Style or Julian calendar (dating from Julius Caesar) was in use in Russia, and was not replaced till February, 1918, by the New Style or Gregorian calendar, which had been adopted by the other countries of Western Europe by the mid-eighteenth century. Thus, by Western reckoning, the February Revolution of February 27 - March 3 actually occurred March 12-16, and the "Great October Revolution" (October 25-26, Old Style) took place November 7-8, there being a discrepancy of thirteen days between the two systems.

17 The term bol'shevik actually refers to a member of the majority (from bol'she, meaning more or larger), and dates from a 1903 Party Congress of the Russian, Marxist, Social Democratic Party held in Brussels and London. When a faction led by Lenin won a point opposing the organization of the Party along ethnic lines, several
in the establishment of the present Soviet system. The latter event had, ultimately, the greater influence on all segments of Russian society, including the arts. Asaf'ev, in advance of many of his colleagues, manifested an early involvement in the political events of that time and, among other activities, contributed to the newspaper, Novaya Zhizn' [New Life], edited by an old acquaintance from his participation in the "Stasov Circle," the writer, Maxim Gorky, who later played a significant part in the development of the doctrine of "Socialist Realism." He was also associated in this endeavor with the poet Mayakovskiǐ and (of greater significance for his own personal future) with A.V. Lunacharskiǐ (1875-1933), who was to become the Commissar of Public Education. By contrast, Asaf'ev's


Not long after the October Revolution, the Social Democratic Party was renamed the Communist Party. It should be noted, however, that in the strictest Marxist ideological sense Communism is conceived as a world-wide, classless society, representing the ultimate future goal of socialism.

18 This doctrine is discussed, infra, pp. 53-57.
two former classmates, Myaskovskiĭ and Prokofiev, were among a large number of composers and other intellectuals who assumed a largely passive stance during the period between revolutions, seeming almost oblivious to the artistic consequences of the unfolding social upheavals, this in spite of the fact that Myaskovskiĭ was on active duty on the Austrian front when the February Revolution occurred.

The years immediately following the October Revolution were a period of extreme hardship, conflict, and deprivation for the Russian people. These years were marked by economic chaos, a wrenching and internally divisive withdrawal from participation in the world war (at considerable cost in territory and industrial

---

19 It is general knowledge that Prokofiev left Russia in 1918 and did not return to take up residence in his homeland for some fifteen years. A rational and informative discussion of this phase of Prokofiev's career, shedding new light on the composer's motivation, and also on the duration of his absence from Russia, is contained in Stanley D. Kräus, Soviet Composers and the Development of Soviet Music (London: George Allen and Unwin, Ltd., 1970), pp. 141-42, 145-46, 152-53.

potential), civil war, foreign military intervention, repressive terrorism, and shortages of all basic commodities. Yet this was a period of almost feverish cultural activity in Russia. Concert and theatrical performances continued and multiplied in the major cities, with new audiences of poor working people drawn by massive issues of free tickets. Culture was brought to the factories, the villages, even the military front lines by artistic "brigades" of performers and musicians. Amateur activity flourished, and general education in "appreciation" of the arts was encouraged on a broad scale.

This seeming paradox was a manifestation of both the immediate and long-range goals of the new Bolshevik leaders. The ascendancy of the Bolsheviks was not, as their ideology prescribed, the result of a mass uprising of urban industrial workers (the so-called "proletariat"), but was a seizure of power by a small, cohesive, conspiratorial group which proved to be the best prepared, both organizationally and ideologically, to take advantage of an opportunity presented by international, domestic, and historical circumstances. Faced

---

with the formidable tasks of resolving the catastrophic economic crisis and rebuilding the machinery of government on a foundation of the generally antagonistic personnel of the Tsarist civil service, while at the same time defending themselves against the hostile forces attacking from both within and without, the Bolshevik leaders were obliged to come to some terms with the populations of those areas which were under their control. Especially for Lenin (who combined unwavering, long-range ideological vision with pragmatic adaptability and ruthlessness) there was no question of a broadly representative government. The ideology required a period of the "dictatorship of the proletariat," that is, of absolute control in the name of the ascendant class. In its practical application, the solution to the problem of how to deal with the population was one which has characterized the Soviet system throughout its history, with varying degrees of emphasis and different means of implementation. On the one hand, cooperation and support were sought through persuasion and education; on the other hand, any serious opposition was systematically eliminated. The "Extraordinary Commission for the Suppression of Counter-Revolution" (known as CHEKA) was created as the instrument of the
latter expedient, and "... the 'Red Terror' against enemies of the state was proclaimed."22

The cultural florescence of the Civil War period answered several immediate needs. The continuation, virtually without interruption, of the concert and theatrical schedules in the cities23 helped to restore some semblance of stability and normality to the urban populations. In making available to the working classes those cultural institutions which had been the sole property of the aristocracy, it was hoped that the masses would come to identify their own interests with those of the Bolsheviks. From another point of view, many of the artists and performers who participated in the traveling "artistic brigades," including some of the country's most respected talents (e.g., Chaliapin and Grechaniov), were motivated more by

22 Von Rauch, op. cit., p. 64.

23 Von Rauch's assertion that the theatre and ballet were "... temporarily closed down completely" (Ibid., p. 144) is contradicted by Schwarz's discussion of the period immediately following the October Revolution (cf., Schwarz, op. cit., pp. 11-12, 16-18, 26-29, 37), although, as evidenced in the account of the conductor, Nikolai Malko (cited Ibid., p. 9), the theaters apparently were closed briefly after the February Revolution.
tangible remuneration in the form of food (or even firewood), which they received for their efforts, than by any lofty ideals of public enlightenment. 24

Apart from the obvious short-range benefits, the top Bolshevik leadership sought long-range ideological goals in this cultural activity, which they viewed as an approach toward educating the uneducated, illiterate masses who made up the majority of Russia's population at that time. Lenin's early choice of Lunacharskii for Commissar of Public Education was a particularly fortunate appointment. Lunacharskii, a man of intelligence, imagination, and persuasiveness, brought a total dedication--albeit, flexibly applied--to what he saw as his three-fold task: to educate the masses, to gain the confidence and cooperation of the pre-revolutionary intelligentsia, and to convince the political leadership of the important place of the arts within the overall goals of mass education. 25

Lunacharskii found an able ally in this work in Asaf'ev, who experienced a "profound emotional response"

24 Ibid., p. 16.
25 Ibid., p. 12.
(amounting almost to a religious conversion) to the
events of the October Revolution and particularly to
Lenin's public personality.\(^2^6\) He emerged as one of the
pre-revolutionary intellectuals "... who from the
very first days devoted all their strength, experience,
and knowledge to the Soviet, socialist culture."\(^2^7\) As
an ardent propagandist for the cultural work in progress,
he contributed fifty-seven articles, according to his
official bibliography,\(^2^8\) to the journal Zhizn' iskusstva
[Life of Art], the official organ of the Commissariat
of Public Education (Narodnyi komissariat prosveshchenii,
abbreviated NARKOMPROS), during the years 1918 and 1919.
He was a member of both the music (muzykal'nyi otdel,
abbreviated MUZO) and theatrical (teatral'nyi otdel,
abbreviated TEO) divisions of NARKOMPROS. In direct
participation in the educational process, Asaf'ev

\(^{26}\)Orlova, op. cit., p. 69.

\(^{27}\)Ibid., p. 67.

\(^{28}\)T. P. Dmitrieva-Mei (comp.), "Bibliografiya i
notografiya sochinenii B. V. Asaf'eva [Literary and
Musical Bibliography of B. V. Asaf'ev's Works]," in
raboty o sovetskoï muzyke [Selected Writings on Soviet
Music]; Muzykal'naya forma kak protsess [Musical Form
as a Process]; Bibliografiya i notografiya (Moscow:
delivered lectures on music in the Petrograd University and wrote a number of short, informative leaflets (letuchki) on composers and their compositions, to accompany concert programs. He also compiled a concise layman’s guide to technical musical terminology for the benefit of the new mass audiences.

Asaf’ev’s writings on opera during these years (1912-1919) are of particular interest and significance, and claimed a share of his attention. He shared with Lunacharski two firm belief in the viability and value of opera in the new society, and proved to be an articulate protagonist in its defense against significant opposition. Many of the Party leaders saw in opera a survival of aristocracy, and even Lenin expressed reservations about the costs of maintaining and subsidizing theatres and opera houses in the face of the population’s urgent and widespread

---

29 Kabalevskii, op. cit., p. 10.

need for the most basic schooling. Asaf'ev responded by emphasizing the folk elements of opera, particularly that of the Russian classical tradition. Its unique national characteristics and links with folk-song creation could be utilized to introduce the masses to their artistic heritage. "Our direct responsibility," he wrote, "is to try to use the Russian opera, i.e., its folk-like song and recitative, to return to the people their own property."

Asaf'ev also found time to pursue his career as a composer. In 1918 he composed a three-act ballet, The Ice Maiden, based on music of Grieg (first performed in 1922), and a one-act ballet, Carmagnole, based on music of the French revolutionary period. The latter (unpublished) was performed in a Petrograd workers' club on the first anniversary of the October Revolution, and is

---

31 Schwarz, op. cit., p. 27.

credited as the first Soviet ballet. It is considered as a prototype to his later ballet, *Plamya Parizha [Flame of Paris]*, composed in 1932 and performed by the Kirov Ballet in celebration of the fifteenth anniversary of the October Revolution.

At the end of 1919 Asaf'ev was associated with The Russian Institute of Art History (Rossiiskii institut istorii iskusstva) as a staff member of the music division, becoming dean of the division in 1921 (both Kabalevskii and Lunacharskii date Asaf'ev's leadership of the music division from 1920). The consequences of this fact were significant both in Asaf'ev's own personal history and in the history of the development of Soviet musicology. As Schwarz puts it, "Asaf'ev preached

---


34 Orlova, op. cit., p. 84

35 Kabalevskii, op. cit., p. 10.

the gospel of 'living' musicology, of research related to contemporary life . . . [and] shaped Soviet musicology in his own wide-range image, . . . [balancing] the study of the past with an awareness of the present. "\(^{37}\)

\(^{37}\)Schwarz, *op. cit.*, p. 90.
3. The NEP Period

The commencement of Asaf'ev's leadership of the Institute's music division roughly coincided with momentous political and social developments. By the end of 1920 the Civil War and foreign interventions were effectively ended, but it soon became apparent that radical steps would be necessary to counteract the catastrophic effects of "War Communism." A central feature of this necessarily repressive policy had been the forceful requisitioning of agricultural products to further the war effort, which resulted in extreme peasant discontent, a decrease in efficiency in an already backward agricultural economy, and, ultimately, widespread famine. This, in turn, led to increased dissatisfaction and hostility on the part of the urban workers, fed by the continuation and even aggravation of war-time deprivations. The culmination of these developments, early in 1921, was a wave of strikes in Petrograd, in response to the reduction of food rations, and finally a violent uprising by the Kronstadt garrison, which was suppressed only after an exceptionally bitter and bloody battle. Lenin's response to this crisis—an extremely pragmatic solution though it

---

38 The city of St. Petersburg, founded in 1703 by Peter the Great, was renamed Petrograd (a Russianization of the Germanic original) in 1914, after the beginning of hostilities with Germany. In 1924, after Lenin's death, the city was again renamed, Leningrad, in his honor.
posed severe ideological questions--was the institution of the New Economic Policy (Novaya ekonomicheskaya politika, abbreviated NEP). Under this policy, most government restrictions were removed and private management encouraged in agriculture, light industry, and retail trade.

On January 21, 1924, however, after several years of progressively deteriorating health, Lenin died, leaving no effective machinery for the orderly transfer of power nor even any indication as to his preference for an heir-apparent. For a short period after Lenin's death Russia was ruled by the so-called "troika," the triumvirate of L. B. Kamenev, G. E. Zinoviev, and Josef Stalin. The latter, however, by a combination of patient preparation, shrewd calculation, and fortuitous circumstance, was able to raise himself to the position of final authority in the Soviet Union by first politically neutralizing and then physically eliminating all potential rivals for power within the Communist Party. By the end of 1929 Stalin's power was secure and the first of the notorious "Five-Year Plans" instituted. There were ominous forebodings for the future of culture and the arts in these political and economic developments, but they were not yet clearly apparent during the decade of the 1920's. Although the principle of accountability of the arts to the Party and
State authority was officially established in 1920, the government to a considerable extent had followed the principle, articulated by Trotsky, of letting art "make its own way... by its own means." But, while it is true (given the economic and political tasks and struggles confronting the Party leadership) that official oversight of the arts was not the first concern of Party officials during this period, it is apparent in retrospect, that by the middle of decade the question of party policy in the arts had become a useful weapon in Stalin's rise to power.

Nevertheless, the NEP period was a period of artistic ferment, marked by great vitality and diversity. In this period, within a significant segment of the various artistic disciplines, the immediate post-revolutionary preoccupation with involvement of the masses in culture, gave way to a spirit of experimentation and the desire, as an obvious concomitant to the relaxation of foreign trade restrictions, to explore and interact with the more radical developments in contemporary Western European culture. The consequences

39Cf. Schwarz, op. cit., p. 25.

were often mutually beneficial. As Stephen Cohen puts it, "...it is clear not only that the Soviet twenties were a 'golden era' in Russian culture, but that NEP culture...was a major chapter in the cultural history of the twentieth century."41

The trends toward experimentation and creative interaction with the West were nowhere more apparent during the NEP period than in the field of music. Compositions of such contemporary western composers as Schoenberg, the French Les Six, and Krenek were studied and performed, as were those of Stravinsky (whose status, after a decade of absence from his homeland, was neither clearly Western nor yet clearly Russian.) Hindemith, Bartok, Casella, and Milhaud were invited to perform or conduct performances of their own works, and Henry Cowell lectured in Moscow and Leningrad on his compositional techniques. A particularly profound impact was made by Alban Berg's Wozzeck. The 1927 Leningrad premiere of this opera was attended by the composer.

Domestically, the Persimfans (Pervyi simfonicheskii ansambl', translated, First Symphonic Ensemble) conductorless orchestra was founded as a unique experiment in musical

collectivism in 1922 and survived, with some success, for a decade. Studies in quarter-tone music were organized by G. M. Rimskii-Korsakov\(^{42}\) (b. 1901), a grandson of the composer. Joseph Schillinger's mathematical system of composing, which found an enthusiastic reception in the United States after Schillinger emigrated here in 1929,\(^{43}\) was developed during this period. The invention of the Aetherophone (the first musical instrument to produce sound by purely electronic means) by a young Russian engineer, Lev Terman (later westernized as Leon Theremin), occurred on the eve of NEP in 1920. The device, which was renamed the Thereminovox and, in America, has been called simply the Theremin,\(^{44}\) was patented in Washington, D.C.,\(^{45}\) in 1928 after its inventor came to demonstrate it in the United States. In 1929, The First Airphonic Suite by Schillinger (one of his few compositions), written for Thereminovox and orchestra, had its premiere performance in

---

\(^{42}\)In 1929 G. Rimski-Korsakov completed a dissertation on The Evolution of Musical Scales at the Leningrad Institute of Theatre and Music, under the supervision of Asaf'ev, whom he also served as a teaching assistant (cf. G. Bernandt and A. Dolzhański (comp.), Sovetskie kompozitory: Kratkii biograficheskii spravochnik [Soviet Composers: A Short Biographical Reference], (Moscow: Soviet Composer, 1957), p. 488.

\(^{43}\)Schwarz, op. cit., p. 85 (n.)

Cleveland with the inventor as soloist. It is appropriate that these two men should have had occasion to collaborate in the United States, for their respective brainchildren enjoyed intensive application in the American motion picture industry in the creation and instrumentation of background music. Terman returned to Russia in 1938, and was reported by Schwarz to be still active there in 1970.

The influence of Asaf'ev in helping to stimulate the creative curiosity of this period is noted by both Olkhovsky (a former student of Asaf'ev's at the Institute of Art History whose manifest admiration for Asaf'ev somewhat exceeds objectivity) and Schwarz. Olkhovsky attributes the free investigative spirit of the Music Section to the fact that "most of the collaborators of the . . . Section were either pupils of Asaf'ev or completely shared his views . . . ." and notes particular emphasis

\[45\] Ibid., p. 466.
\[46\] Ibid., p. 499.
\[47\] Schwarz, op. cit., p. 385.
on questions of Russian musical development on one hand and contemporary western music on the other. He describes Asaf'ev as "... a pioneer and inspirer of the movement of contemporary music..." Olkhovsky's own doctoral thesis, prepared at the Institute of Art History (with Asaf'ev's active encouragement), but then denied publication as a "formalist" work, dealt with Schoenberg, Berg, and Webern. Olkhovsky, by the way, refers to the Institute as the Institute of Theatre and Music. At the present time it is called the Scientific-Research Institute of Theatre, Music, and Cinema. Schwarz registers substantial agreement with Olkhovsky's evaluation with the statement: "The intense activity of Asaf'ev and his circle on behalf of contemporary music brought about an artistic climate in Leningrad that made the city a centre of musical modernism receptive to all kinds of

49 Ibid.

50 Ibid., p. 61.

51 Ibid., (ed. n. 34) p. 97.

52 Ibid., p. 58.

experiments."\(^5^4\)

The focal point of the modernism-oriented elements of Soviet musical life in the twenties was the Association of Contemporary Music (Assotsiatsiya sovremennoi muzyki, abbreviated ASM), a rather loose confederation of esthetic points of view which was founded in Moscow in 1923. The Leningrad ASM was founded three years later, and grew out of the joint efforts of the Institute of Art History and the Leningrad Philharmonic\(^5^5\) in publicizing and sponsoring performances of contemporary music, a project spearheaded by Asaf'ev. The Leningrad group is characterized by Schwarz as being "... somewhat more adventurous..." than its Moscow predecessor;\(^5^6\) yet Asaf'ev apparently felt the need for an even wider scope of exploration and founded another group, the Circle of New Music (Kruzhok novoy muzyki), which competed with the ASM in the sponsorship

\(^5^4\)Schwarz, op. cit., p. 52.

\(^5^5\)The Leningrad Philharmonic evolved out of the Petrograd Court Orchestra, which was renamed the State Symphony after February, 1917, then the State Philharmonic Orchestra in 1920. In 1921, Asaf'ev collaborated with Emil Cooper, the conductor of the Philharmonic Orchestra at that time, in expanding the activity of the organization beyond mere maintenance of the orchestra to sponsorship of chamber music concerts, lectures, and various other music-educational activities. (cf., Ibid., pp. 29-30).

\(^5^6\)Ibid., p. 53.
of concerts of contemporary music—both Russian and Western—for a short time, before uniting with it in common cause. Schwarz emphasizes an aspect of Asaf'ev which has generally been overlooked by his western advocates (such as Olkhovsky) and not explored in depth by his Soviet chroniclers. During this period of the mid-twenties, Asaf'ev displayed an avant garde exclusivity, in his activities in connection with the ASM and the Circle of New Music, which had no patience with any hint of traditionalism in contemporary musical composition, and which seems at odds with the balanced emphasis of his pre-revolutionary activities. Actually, he, like his mentor, Stasov, continued throughout his life to be interested in new ideas and techniques in musical composition; therefore, his preoccupation with the ultra-modern is not out of character especially when one considers that for several years—during the Civil War period—contact with western developments had been largely closed to Soviet musicians. It should also be noted that, apart from his activities in the modernist groups, his interest in the past continued. At the same time that his tastes in the concerts he supported and sponsored seemed overwhelmingly modern, he was engaged in a study of Russian music of the

57 Ibid., p. 101.
nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

The scope of Asaf'ev's activity during this period is truly impressive. In 1925, when the training of musicologists was transferred from the Institute of Art History (leaving that institution free to devote its resources to research) to the Leningrad Conservatory, Asaf'ev was appointed to organize the new musicological section of the Conservatory. He approached his task with characteristic enthusiasm and very definite ideas as to their implementation. To begin with, he welcomed the availability within the conservatory of the "full complex of theoretical disciplines and practical studies," which would provide the comprehensive musical preparation he considered obligatory for the training of a musicologist. Apparently, his original projection involved a six-year course of study in the musicological section. While he was not successful in instituting his complete plan, he did succeed in initiating courses on melodics, on ancient Russian notation, on the origin and development of musical instruments, and seminars on Bach and on the musical literature of the Middle Ages and early Renaissance in

\[58\] Kershner, loc. cit.

\[59\] Ibid.

\[60\] Cf., Asaf'ev's concepts of "melodics," melos, etc. \emph{vis-à-vis} melody, pp. 158-159.
Western Europe. Especially in the face of this work at the conservatory, his continuing work at the Institute of Art History, and his organizational activity among the modernist factions of Leningrad, his multi-faceted literary output is staggering. Of his total lifetime catalog of 940 separate titles, more than half (489) date from the single decade, 1921-1930, and over 300 (almost one-third of his lifetime output) are listed for the four-year period from 1925 to 1928. Included in the writings of this decade are several of his more significant works, in particular the controversial Book on Stravinsky, Russian Music from the Beginning of the Nineteenth Century, and Musical Form as a Process (the first of the two books under that general title which are the object of this translation). Asaf'ev's Russian Music . . . (to supplement Nef's

---

61 Kershner, loc. cit. n. 1 (Ibid.) notes that the latter seminar engaged the interest of the professors of the Paris Conservatory when Asaf'ev visited there in 1928.


64 B. V. Asaf'ev (Igor' Glebov), Russkaya muzyka: Ot nachala XIX stoletiya (Moscow-Leningrad: "Academia," 1930).

History of Music, a translation of which Asaf'ev was preparing) was published in a new edition in 1968 (with an introductory article by E. M. Orlova) and has been published in an English translation. Musical Form as a Process fell under an ideological cloud, and was not re-issued till 1963 when, for the first time, it appeared in a single publication with the second book of the


B. Asaf'ev, *Russkaya muzyka: XIX i nachalo XX veka* [: Nineteenth and Beginning of the Twentieth Century] (Leningrad: Music Press, 1968). The revised title was chosen, as we are informed in a footnote, p. 3, as more precisely defining the scope of the book's contents from our present point of view.


title, originally published 17 years later than the first. Only the latter volume was chosen to appear in Asaf'ev's five-volume Selected Works, published from 1952-1957. Much of the actual writing of all these works was accomplished well before (sometimes by several years) their initial publication, mostly within the intensive four years, 1925-1928.

Another important work by Asaf'ev, published earlier in the decade, is Symphonic Etudes, a collection of articles dealing with operatic and ballet compositions by a number of Russian composers including Stravinsky. This book has also been reissued in recent years. Of these four important works by Asaf'ev from the decade of the 20's, only his Book on Stravinsky has not yet been rehabilitated.

---


73 Igor' Glebov [B. V. Asaf'ev], Simfonicheskie etudy (Petrograd: State Philharmonic, 1922).

74 The title of this work vis-à-vis its subject matter is a direct reflection of Asaf'ev's concept of "symphonism," which will be included in an examination of his terminology later in this discussion (cf., p. 177).

even in the face of the gradual rapprochement of that expatriate composer with his homeland, culminating in his visit to the Soviet Union in 1962.

Asaf'ev was also a contributor to virtually all the modernist-oriented journals and collections which sprang up in short-lived profusion during the NEP period, and he served in an editorial capacity for some of them. In 1923 Asaf'ev edited a collection of theoretical articles by members of the Music Section of the Institute of Art History to which he also contributed and which appeared under the title, *De Musica*. Beginning in 1925, in a separate publication project with obvious ties to the 1923 endeavor, the first of three similar collections (under the same title and issued annually, in the form of yearbooks) was published. The fourth book (1928) in this series appeared under a new name, *Muzykoznanie*. The 1925 publication drew a generally favorable reaction from

---

76 *De Musica: Sbornik statei* [Collection of Articles] (Petrograd: State Philharmonic, 1923).

77 *De Musica: Vremennik Razryada istorii i teorii muzyki Gosudarstvennogo instituta istorii iskusstva* [Yearbook of the Section of the History and Theory of Music, State Institute of Art History], No. 1 (Leningrad, 1925).

78 This series is included in the bibliography of Olkhovsky (op. cit., pp. 393-394), with a listing of the contributors for each issue.
Lunacharskii, 79 who saw in it significant progress toward development of a truly Marxist, sociological approach 80 to musicology, a development which he attributed specifically to Asaf'ev's leadership, 81 resolving to study in detail all the writing of "this remarkable thinker ... " 82 (although, considering Lunacharskii's position as arbiter of ideological acceptability in the area of culture, this promise may not have been altogether reassuring).

79Lunacharskii, op. cit., pp. 204-229.

80The Marxist interpretation of sociology will be examined (cf. pp. 135-41, infra).

81Ibid., pp. 204-205, et passim.

82Ibid., p. 211.
4. Proletarian Hegemony in Literature and Music (1929-32)

The period of NEP, however, also witnessed the rise of the so-called Proletarian movement in the arts, the most tangible impact of which could be seen on the field of literature. Although there were several diverse manifestations of this trend, the common goal of all of them was to establish a specific proletarian class culture, in which the proletariat would participate, both as consumers and producers. The advocates of proletarian culture found significant support among some members of the Party leadership, notably Lunacharskiy and the prominent Party theoretician, Nokolaï Bukharin (1888-1938), but, even more significantly, the concept was opposed by the top Party leaders, Lenin and Trotsky.33

The so-called PROLETKUL'T (the abbreviated designation for the proletarian cultural and educational organizations) rose shortly after the October Revolution, but, apart from some noteworthy contributions in the area of education, had little impact on cultural life as a whole, and died out by the beginning of the NEP period. The leadership of PROLETKUL'T advocated the parallel, but

33Trotsky's position, which was similar to Lenin's, is expounded in Literature and Revolution, passim (cf., p. 27, n. 40, supra.)
independent development of the political, economic and cultural spheres, a position which was unacceptable to the Party leadership.

NEP was marked by the accelerating conflict between the so-called "fellow travellers" (the non-Communist, non-proletarian intelligentsia who accepted the revolution as a fait accompli and were willing to cooperate with it) and the militant Proletarian Artists' Associations, notably the Russian Association of Proletarian Writers (Rossiiskaya assotsiatsiya proletarskikh pisateley, abbreviated RAPP) and its musical counterpart, the Russian Association of Proletarian Musicians (RAPM). These proletarian groups had little in common with PROLETKUL'T. Far from wishing to function independently of the Party, they aspired to total domination of the cultural sphere in the name of the Party. In addition (and contrary to the view which had prevailed among the leadership of PROLETKUL'T) the Proletarian Associations of NEP largely rejected the cultural heritage of the past; their artistic output took the form of popularized, easily accessible creations with a high degree of ideological content and a low degree of structural complexity and enduring artistic merit.

Following Lenin's death in 1924, the official Party position on proletarian culture gradually changed from rejection of the concept, to qualified acknowledgment of its existence, to full moral and material support, as set
forth in a resolution of the Party's Central Committee, "On Serving the Mass Reader with Literature," dated December 28, 1928. This document was, in fact, a Party directive to the publishing houses calling for greatly increased support for Communist authors and worker and peasant writers, thus effectively closing the means of publication to the literary fellow travellers.

The rise of the proletarian movement in literature is quite clearly linked with the rise of Stalin, and it is no coincidence that the issuance of the 1928 Central Committee resolution, affirming the Party's support of proletarian literature and stating a view of literature as "an instrument for the mobilization of the masses around the basic political and economic tasks,"84 coincided with the institution of Stalin's first "Five-Year Plan," a radical intensification of industrialization and agricultural collectivization. From this point the RAPP served increasingly as the voice of the Party in literary matters. Its task, in exchange for this position of prominence, was the implementation of the principle of "social command" (sotsial'nyĭ zakaz), a term implying service to the aspirations of the ruling class. This

---

principle had been implicit in the Soviet system as a subconscious expression of Lenin's Theory of Reflection; now it was interpreted specifically to reflect the tasks and accomplishments of the "Five-Year Plan." The period, 1929-1932, in Soviet Literature, has been called the "dictatorship of RAPP." 

The musical analogue to the conflict between the proletarian writers and the literary fellow travellers during NEP and the First Five-Year Plan is provided by the juxtaposition of the ASM and the RAPM, both founded in 1923. Although the variety of techniques and schools of musical composition during this period was extremely broad, the representatives of each orientation regarded themselves as committed, within their own interpretation, to the creation and propagation of "revolutionary" art.

---

85 Cf., p. 128, infra.

forms. The proletarian faction aimed at mass accessibility and the elimination, so far as possible, of the influences of past, alien class cultures. The staple of their output consisted of an exhortative, propagandistic text set to generally uninspired music of a simple, homophonic texture, on which they hoped to stimulate the growth of new forms of "people's music," as an appropriate expression of the "people's revolution." A major part of the ASM membership, on the other hand, saw the correct approach to be through the assimilation of the newest achievements of the West, not merely to become an adjunct to Western Europe, but in order to incorporate the best of these innovations into the construction of a revolutionary Soviet musical culture based on the highest achievements of the Russian classical tradition.\textsuperscript{87} The aim of this faction was to raise the cultural level of the masses, rather than to lower the general level of culture to the point of universal accessibility.

The proletarian musicians do not seem to have made the same impact, in this period, as did their literary counterparts. Olkhovsky, in fact, sees no halt in "... the comparatively free development of Soviet music ..."

\textsuperscript{87}The Russian "classical" tradition in music and literature is generally that of nineteenth century Russia.
[until] 1932 [1] "88 (emphasis added), thus virtually ignoring the final, three-year period of the RAPM's ascendancy. Krebs does not go so far, but does observe the Party control of the musical sphere has tended to lag behind that of the other arts. 89 This is partially explicable by the fact that the situation in music differed significantly from that in literature in several respects. To begin with, the discrepancy in achievement between the two opposing factions was considerably wider than that in the sphere of literature. With few exceptions, most of the active professional composers and musicians, representing a wide range of tendencies and persuasions, were affiliated with the ASM, while a considerable percentage of the RAPM membership were Komsomols (members of Communist youth organizations) in the Conservatories, many of whom owed their presence there more to their certifiable peasant or proletarian heritage than to their demonstrated musical aptitude. The discrepancy could only be aggravated by the exceedingly specialized nature of musical training and activity. In addition, the

88 Olkhovsky, op. cit., p. 150.
89 Krebs, op. cit., p. 50.
subject matter of music is much less susceptible to objective ideological criteria than that of literature or the representational arts, making it difficult (though not impossible, as later events were to prove) to evaluate a musical composition in terms of its ideological correctness. Furthermore, the ideological lines of demarcation between factions were somewhat blurred. Although some members of the ASM corresponded to the image of the "fellow-traveller" (e.g., Myaskovskiĭ), there were others, such as Roslavets, a Party member, and Asaf'ev, who had been an enthusiastic supporter of the revolutionary regime from the very beginning, who transcended that image. Finally, even the issuance of the Central Committee resolution of December, 1928, in effect granting supremacy to the proletarian forces to compensate for their technical shortcomings, resulted less in a victory over the non-proletarian faction, than in a strategic, self-defensive migration of much of the membership of the ASM to the RAPM (a sort of mass infiltration) which effectively redirected the orientation of the latter.

The period of proletarian dominance, from 1929 to 1932, was not without negative effects in the sphere of music, however. In 1929, Lunacharskiĭ--liberal and intellectually-oriented and a friend of music--was removed from his office as Commissar of Education and Culture, and
replaced by Andrei Bubnov, a Party functionary of no intellectual or artistic distinction. The ASM ceased to exist entirely by 1931, and, even though as we have seen many of its members "infiltrated" the RAPM, a sizable number of musicians remained unaffiliated, hanging in a virtual intellectual limbo, for most of this period. Asaf'ev is exemplary in this respect.

The replacement of Lunacharskii must surely have been a personal disappointment to Asaf'ev, especially in light of his close and long-standing, cooperative relationship with the former. Furthermore, as an eloquent and highly visible spokesman for the ideas of the ASM, Asaf'ev was a prime target of vindictive proletarian criticism, a position in which he now found himself particularly vulnerable with the twin setbacks of his highly-placed friend's departure and the ascendancy to almost dictatorial powers of his principal adversaries. His utter discouragement is evident in a letter of April 15, 1930, to Myaskovskii, in which he confides that, in light

---

90 Noted in Schwartz, op. cit., p. 111. Lunacharskii was not discredited, however, and his reputation within the Soviet Union has continued virtually undiminished to the present. In 1933, he was appointed ambassador to Spain, but died of a heart ailment in transit. (cf. I. Sato. "Predislovie [Introduction]" in Lunacharskii, op. cit., p. 7).
of the virtual repudiation of his method of attempting to propagate appreciation for music, he has "turned sour." For at least a decade after this, Asaf'ev initiated no significant musicological projects. Most Soviet commentators simply observe that in this decade Asaf'ev turned his energies to his first love, musical composition (about which, more later), but it seems clear that he did so out of the frustration and disillusionment resulting from the unceasing harassment by his proletarian critics. Another glance at his musical and musicological catalogues is especially informative. As compared with the tremendous output of 300 items for the four years immediately preceding, the period 1929-1932, inclusive, shows only fifty-one entries in his bibliography. Of these, twenty are in 1929, and, while even this is a considerable quantitative decrease from the fifty entries for 1928, the subject matter does include articles on Bartok and Hindemith, the text of a report on "The Tasks of Contemporary Music," a contribution on Musorgskiĭ and Stravinsky to a German yearbook, and the introductory article for his Book on Stravinsky which was published that year (the text of the book had been written earlier). In 1930 the number of entries drops to sixteen, of which

eight are articles written for the Bol'shaya sovetskaya entsiklopediya (Large Soviet Encyclopedia, hereafter abbreviated BSE). Included in that year's output are the publication of Book I of Musical Form as a Process (portions of which had been written as early as 1925), his expanded translation of Nef's book on Western-European music history, and the editorial work and introductory article for Z. Eval'd's translation of Ernst Kurth's Grundlagen des linearen Kontrapunkt . . . 92(published the following year), all of which represented the completion of work either already begun or previously committed. His book Russian Music from the Beginning of the Nineteenth Century was actually written in 1928, and is listed in his bibliography for that year, though it was published in 1930. Only eight entries appear for 1931 (four of them articles for the BSE), and only seven for 1932. It is also significant that several of the articles written during the last three years were either never published, or else appeared for the first time in

Asaf'ev's Selected Works, published in the 1950's. His only listed contribution to any of the proletarian journals appeared in the journal, Proletarskiĭ muzykant [Proletarian Musician], No. 2 (1931), and was a set of answers to a questionnaire on Musorgskiĭ, sent out by the editor of the journal to a number of Soviet musical figures. Although the contents of Asaf'ev's catalogue of musical compositions for this period remains negligible, in 1932 we find the first of his historically significant ballets, the four-act Flame of Paris,\(^3\) which was begun in 1931, and which serves to give an indication of the redirected emphasis of his efforts for the next decade.

\(^3\)Cf., p. 23, supra.
5. The 'Thirties: Socialist Realism; Asaf'ev as Composer

The final chapter of the proletarian episode came with shocking suddenness. On April 23, 1932, a resolution "On the Reorganization of Art and Literary Organizations" was issued by the Central Committee,\textsuperscript{94} which stated the Party's intention to do away with the Proletarian Writers' Associations and to bring together all the writers sympathetic to the goals of Socialist construction in a single Union of Soviet Writers. The same procedure was to be followed in each of the other arts. The official reason for these changes was the fear that the proletarian organizations were becoming too narrow in scope for the increased numbers of writers and artists who had now been drawn to the Soviet cause; the effect was to place the entire cultural sphere securely under the direct control of the Party. A close reading of the resolution, with the retrospective advantage of a knowledge of subsequent developments, reinforces the suspicion that this was, in fact, the Party leadership's intent.

Nevertheless, the resolution, abolishing the proletarian associations, was greeted enthusiastically by

\textsuperscript{94}The text of this resolution, in English translation, is reprinted in Brown, \textit{op. cit.}, pp. 200-201, and in Olkhovsky, \textit{op. cit.}, pp. 278-79.
many writers and musicians who did not see the ominous implications beyond their own immediate liberation from proletarian tyranny. There was, in fact, a two-year period of comparative liberalization and relief from repression in the areas of literature and the arts. This was paralleled by relief from repression in the political arena as well. The Seventeenth Party Congress, held from January 26 to February 10, 1934, was characterized by an impression of unity and solidarity of purpose, under the acknowledged supreme leadership of Stalin. The First Congress of Soviet Writers, held in August of the same year, conveyed a similar atmosphere of reconciliation (though not altogether free of dissension), and was attended by many previously estranged Soviet writers, as well as some forty foreign guests. A great number of speeches and greetings from individuals and groups, representing a wide variety of occupations and persuasions, were heard at the Congress, along with messages from, and expressions of regard for absent foreign writers. Speeches by Gorky (who occupied something of a patriarchal role in Soviet literature) and Bukharin called for improvement in craftsmanship, and the latter especially emphasized the need for a greater exercise of imagination in Soviet literature. A short official inaugural address citing "tendentiousness" as an obligatory quality of Soviet
literature, delivered by Andrei Aleksandrovich Zhdanov (1896-1948), a Secretary of the Party Central Committee (who was to have a most profound effect upon literature and the arts in later years), was proved by subsequent events to be the most significant and preindicative statement heard at the congress. As it turned out, the seeming unity and general good will at both these gatherings was illusory, at best, if not a deliberately contrived facade. In fact, before the end of that year, the assassination of Sergei Mironovich Kirov, the Leningrad Party chief and Politburo member, was used by Stalin as the excuse for launching his Great Purges, in which Bukharin, Kamenev, and Zinoviev, along with literally hundreds of thousands of Soviet citizens from all social and political levels perished. As regards the Writers' Congress, the two years of apparent liberalization preceding it had, in fact, seen the development of the doctrine

of Socialist Realism, which was now firmly established as official cultural policy. The period had also seen the consolidation and reinforcement in positions of maximum influence and authority of that Communist element within the cultural unions which had been provided for by the 1932 Central Committee resolution.

The term Socialist Realism, was first used, according to Ermolaev, by Gronskiǐ, the editor of Izvestiya, in a speech of May 2, 1932, and was subsequently developed by Gorky in a 1933 essay, "On Socialist Realism." The theory was addressed in some detail at the Writers' Congress by a number of speakers. Slonim notes that Socialist Realism is derived (though rather narrowly) from the theory that the arts reflect reality; but the only reality officially permissible in its context is that of the development of Socialism. Implicit in Zhdanov's speech is the requirement that "objective" reality be depicted in

96 Cited in Ermolaev, op. cit., p. 144.

97 Cited in Schwarz, op. cit., p. 110.

terms of a very subjective Socialist bias. In short, the reality of Socialism must not simply be reflected as it is, but rather in an exclusively favorable and positive light. Accordingly, in the practical application of Socialist Realism, the echo of nineteenth century psychological realism, which characterized the literature of the First Five-Year Plan under the banner of "tearing off all masks" and had lent it some semblance of artistic integrity, was superseded by the concept of the "positive hero," who was to be the embodiment of all the Socialist virtues. Bukharin's painstakingly drawn distinction, in his speech at the Writers' Congress, between the negative quality of individualism (the alienation of the individual) and the positive one of individuality (the personal development of the individual, which is fostered

99 An aspect of this positive approach was an obligatory "happy ending," which, in many cases, gave rise to the paradoxical concept of "optimistic tragedy," the implication of future good resulting from the present death or objectively adverse circumstances of the hero at the end of a story. In some cases (as in Sholokhov's novel, *The Quiet Don*), a considerable stretch of the imagination was required to envision this future good.

100 The "positive hero" phenomenon is examined in a scathingly ironic discussion by Abram Terz (Andrei Sinyavskii) in his remarkable work, *On Socialist Realism*, trans. George Dennis (New York: Pantheon Books, 1960), pp. 48-69, in which he attributes the origin of the concept to Gorky's 1901 work, *The Petty Bourgeois*. 
by Socialism) was lost in the assertion that man was to be depicted, not in his individual essence, but rather in terms of his place in the social scheme of things. Esthetic considerations faded to virtual non-existence, and the educative and moralistic aspects of art became primary. Furthermore, despite protestations to the contrary, Socialist Realism became the only politically acceptable, artistic method, a fact made crystal clear in short order by the purging of literary personalities with an intensity almost equal to that of the purges of political figures. The real and overriding significance of the developments surrounding the First Writers' Congress was that the literary doctrine which emerged from the Congress was, as Ermolaev tells us, "... the product of a distinct political, social, and economic period of Soviet history ... It's theories were created


102 This assertion forms the basis for criticism of Tolstoy and Dostoevsky by I. Nusinov in the article "Dvoryansko-burzhua i sotsialisticheskii realizm (Gentry-Bourgeois and Socialist Realism)," Novyi mir [New World], Vol. V. (1934), p. 253, cited in Struve, op. cit., p. 258.
primarily by politicians, not writers, and were dicta-
torially imposed by the Party." The Writers' Congress
served as little more than a launching platform for what
was, in fact, a comprehensive propaganda campaign for the
Party.

An interesting, interrelated development at this time
was the modification of the official attitude toward
history, reflected both in the historical discipline it-
self and in the treatment of historically-based litera-
ture. A first step in this direction had already been
taken at the Fourteenth Party Congress in 1925, when, in
response to the acknowledgment that the achievement of
Socialism on an international scale was far from imminent,
a resolution was passed at Stalin's insistence committed
to the concept of "Socialism in one country." Such a con-
cept, while consistent with the realities of the situation
represented a compromise with Marxist principles in its
incipient nationalism. Nevertheless, in 1934 an even
sharper break with Marx occurred when the hitherto pre-
vailing approach to prerevolutionary history was condemned
for belittling the positive aspects of the Russian people.
The 1925 commitment had made possible a series of histori-
cal novels dealing with earlier Russian revolutionary move-
ments such as the 1825 Decembrist uprising, or with rebel

---

103Ermolaev, op. cit., p. 206.
leaders on the order of the legendary Stepan Razin, and even novels about non-Russian revolutionary movements of the past (such as the French) were acceptable. Such writing required great care in the choice and treatment of subjects. The character of a former tsar, for example, was always necessarily portrayed unfavorably. The 1934 revision in the interpretation of history, however, greatly broadened the scope of permissible subjects, to the point that even some of the more herioc (and, of course, remote) tsars— in particular Aleksandr Nevski, Ivan IV ("the Terrible"), and Peter the Great—were treated positively. The historical genre proved particularly attractive to some writers as a means to escape dealing with more dangerous contemporary issues. Furthermore, the intensification of Russian nationalism proved to be an indispensable component of Russia's herioc defense against Hitler's invasion during World War II. At the same time, however, the Party leadership's direction of historical interpretation, employed in the most unscrupulous manner by Stalin, became a critical element in the process of establishing the notorious "cult of personality" with Stalin himself as its object, which had, eventually, to be disavowed by his successors.

The state of music, in the wake of the 1932 Central Committee resolution and its attendant reorganization of
the cultural organizations, was less clearly defined than that of literature. Schwarz observes that the musical sphere "... lacked a dominant personality comparable to Maxim Gorky ..."\(^{104}\) who could serve as a focus for the reconciliation of its divergent trends. Such a leadership role would have seemed eminently compatible with Asaf'ev's organizational abilities, but he chose to keep a low profile at this time because of his close association with the now discredited modernist faction.\(^{105}\) The termination of the RAPM hegemony was greeted with a collective sigh of relief by composers, but the adventurous spirit in musical composition by which the NEP period had been distinguished, was now effectively chastened, and there was no resurgence of the experimental vitality so characteristic of that earlier period.

The application of the concept of Socialist Realism to the area of music remained a troublesome problem. In this period, as in the proletarian-dominated period of 1929-1932, music did not yield easily to ideological evaluation, and overt political controls over music lagged behind those imposed on literature. The first attempt at an official definition of Socialist Realism in music, and

\(^{104}\)Schwarz, op. cit., p. 111.

\(^{105}\)Ibid.
the first palpable indication of the Party's intention to enforce the doctrine in the field of music, was the notorious denunciation of Shostakovich's opera, Lady Macbeth of Mtsensk District (Katerina Izmailova), in 1936, which was violently attacked in a Pravda article (surely with Stalin's agreement, and probably at his instigation). Till the very eve of the attack, the opera had been lavishly praised in the Soviet press, and even defended against foreign detractors, having enjoyed two years of enthusiastic reception in Soviet and international opera houses. At the same time, a manifestly second-rate opera, Ivan Dzerzhinski's The Quiet Don, was held up as a model for the application of Socialist Realism in music.

The extensive Soviet writings on Socialist Realism in music resemble the voluminous musico-ethical treatises of ancient Greece which are long on philosophical theory, but shed little light on practical application. As in the sphere of literature, Socialist Realism demands from music the three basic elements: Party spirit ("Partyness" or service to the Party), Nationalism, and mass accessibility. The latter element is, obviously, essential to

---

106 The Russian term is narodnost' (or folk-quality), denoting devotion to the Russian land and its people (an age-old, deep-seated, traditional motivation, in any event), without implying allegiance to political systems.
communication of the requisite expression of the other two, which in their turn have become closely interdependent in light of the concept of "Socialism in one country." Soviet composers have, through a combination of trial-and-error and outright prescription, evolved a set of working principles for the implementation of these components by which they have been guided to a greater or lesser degree for the past forty years. The educative and moralistic (i.e., propagandistic) goals of Soviet music, for example, are best served by the employment of vocal or programmatic genres for the most convenient expression of extra-musical ideas (especially on historical or patriotic subjects). The nationalistic bias requires a renunciation of any Western influences, past or present, and has taken the form of an almost exclusive dependence on Russian Classical models. Musical complexity, even such a less-than-radical technique as the use of polyphonic texture, is to be avoided in favor of a simple, easily accessible idiom. The incorporation of folk elements can perform a dual function, both as a factor of greater accessibility, and as an additional (and more valid) expression of nationalism. An often quoted statute of the Union of Soviet Composers calls for the embodiment of "... the victorious, progressive principles of reality, ... in musical images
full of beauty and life-asserting force." In fact, these "musical images" often emerge as naive stereotypes such, for example, as the use of major modes and march rhythms to express an optimistic view of the future. This device was, for a time, virtually *de rigueur* for the concluding section, particularly of programmatic compositions, often serving as an affirmative resolution of musical depictions of suffering, sorrow, and tragedy (through the use of minor modes, etc.). The mass-song (which is virtually identical with the simplistic, homophonic, propaganda-laden staple of the proletarian musicians during their period of ascendancy) has acquired considerable influence, both as a self-sufficing, pseudo-folk creation, and as a pervasive influence in larger forms. Above all, Socialist Realism requires a seriousness of purpose from which playfulness and facetiousness are excluded.

---


The charge of lack of seriousness was levelled against Shostakovich's Ninth Symphony, for example.

Yet, even though Socialist Realism unquestionably "... has become the basic creative method in the art of the USSR, "\(^{109}\) and even after the Shostakovich incident made abundantly clear the extent to which musical activity was subject to Party surveillance, Soviet composers continued to produce compositions of originality and esthetic merit. Juri Jelagin, in his illuminating, personal account of the musical life of Moscow during the 'thirties and 'forties, comments on the existence of two diverging lines of musical composition--one of orthodox, uninspired music for domestic consumption, and the other of "really worthwhile musical production by the best composers, largely for export,"\(^ {110}\)--during the ten-year period 1938-1948. The near impossibility of a strictly literal ideational interpretation of musical composition remained, even to some degree in those compositions which carried a text or a clearly defined programme (and there was, in

\(^{109}\) EMC, loc. cit.

\(^{110}\) Juri Jelagin, The Taming of the Arts, trans. Nicholas Wredin (New York: E. P. Dutton and Co., 1951), p. 213. Without disputing Jelagin's main point, it must be said, however, that his prefatory assertion that "... the musical NEP began in 1938" (Ibid.) can hardly be taken at face value.
fact, no concerted attempt to limit musical creation to such genres). As Krebs observes, the "... status quo was achieved in the ideology... not... the practice of music."\(^{111}\) The creation of symphonies and chamber music persisted. Nevertheless, while the inherent ideational ambiguity of musical content sometimes worked to the composers' advantage, at other times it left them vulnerable to individual interpretations of the content of their works by Party functionaries (perhaps totally at odds with their actual intent) and to charges of "formalism."\(^{112}\)

During the decade of the 'thirties, as we have seen, Asaf'ev's center of emphasis shifted from musicology to musical composition. His literary output dwindled almost to a standstill, comprising mostly operatic reviews, articles for the BSE, commemorative articles, program notes, a

\(^{111}\)Krebs, op. cit., p. 53.

\(^{112}\)The Soviets define formalism "... in the broad sense, [as] the artificial isolation of form from content and the attribution to form or its separate elements of self-sufficing, primary significance at the expense of content" (article "Formalism,"EMC, p. 287, col. 2). In practice, the term is disparagingly and indiscriminately applied to any art work which exhibits insufficient attention to officially prescribed ideological content and an excessive (by Soviet standards) preoccupation with structure and technical considerations.
few exhortative articles, and some autobiographical pieces (including accounts of the methods he employed for the creation of some of his most important ballets). On the other hand, his musically creative activity, which had been minimal during the NEP period (being understandably subordinated to the enormous volume of his literary and organizational work at that time), now not only began to increase quantitatively, but also became more ambitious and diversified.

Asaf'ev's lifetime musical catalog contains more than two hundred titles, a quite respectable numerical output, especially in view of his efforts and achievements in other areas; yet, his role as a composer is equivocal. His real reputation as a composer rests, almost exclusively with his approximately thirty

---

113 One of these was the article, "Volnyuyushchic voprosy [Exciting Questions]," Sovetskaya muzyka, IV, No.5 (May, 1936), pp. 24-27, which was his contribution to the discussion of Shostakovich's "errors," whereby he rationalized his own, earlier, favorable reaction to the controversial works in question. This article (which is reprinted in Asaf'ev, Izbrannye trudy, Vol. V, pp. 116-19) and its effects are described by Schwarz as signalling "... the end of an era" (op. cit., p. 126), that is, presumably, the "dignified," but complete capitulation of the last remnants of viable resistance to the imposition of Party principles on the esthetics of music.
ballets, of which all but perhaps a dozen have been virtually unperformed. Of these, only three—the aforementioned Plamya Parizha, Bakhchisaraïskiî fontan (The Fountain of Bakhchisaraï, 1933), and Kavkazskiî plennik (The Prisoner of the Caucasus, 1936)—have had any significant success. Both Plamya Parizha and Bakhchisaraïskiî fontan have, in fact, been performed by visiting Russian ballet companies in the United States.

114 A classified index of Asaf'ev's musical compositions (in Asaf'ev, Izbrannye trudy, Vol. V, p. 375) lists thirty ballet compositions (two of which, however, are classified separately simply as "Ballet Music"). An additional, 1922 work (Asaf'ev's only ballet from that decade), which is missing from the classified index, is listed in M. Rybnikova, Balety Asaf'eva [Asaf'ev's Ballets] (Moscow: Muzgiz, 1956), p. 63, and is mentioned both in Rittikh, op. cit., IRSM, Vol. I, p. 203, and Krebs, op. cit., p. 89. Rybnikova and Krebs do not completely agree on specific titles, but they, along with Bakst (op. cit., p. 346) and Lyudmila Polyakova (Soviet Music [Moscow: Foreign Language Publishing House, (1961)], p. 131) unaccountably concur in attributing only twenty-seven ballets to Asaf'ev.

115 Cf., p. XXV, above. The original title of the ballet is Triumph respubliki (Triumph of the Republic), but the subtitle seems to have caught the public fancy.

116 Although Krebs includes only the latter two in a list of the seven Soviet ballets which, in his estimation "... have held the stage with any consistency" (op. cit., p. 94), the earlier ballet, Plamya Parizha, would appear to have a stronger claim to inclusion than The Prisoner of the Caucasus.
Yet even these successes have gained most of their significance more from their historical influence as models of "scientific," compositional methodology and of spectacular, but prosaic entertainment, written by a composer who was "... from first to last ... a practical man ... of theatre music,"\textsuperscript{117} than from any intrinsic aesthetic merit.

Western reaction to Asaf'ev's music has been particularly hostile, and is perhaps summed up most succinctly by Kurt London's assertion that Asaf'ev"... cherished a misguided ambition to compose."\textsuperscript{118} In fact, the nagging question lingers as to just how real this ambition was. Several factors cast doubt on the depth of Asaf'ev's commitment to composing. An early sign is suggested in the Nestyev citation concerning Asaf'ev's view of the relationship between Myaskovskii and Prokofiev in the three friends' conservatory days,\textsuperscript{119} whereby Asaf'ev felt himself to be outside of their creative interchange. Further substantiation is supplied by examining the emphasis of Asaf'ev's activity between 1918 (the last year before

\textsuperscript{117}\textsuperscript{Ibid., p. 84}


\textsuperscript{119}\textit{Cf.}, p. 7.
NEP in which he carried on any significant musical composition) and 1932 (marked by the first performance of Plamya Parizha). This was a period of maximum inspiration for many elements of cultural life in the Soviet Union and was also characterized by considerable freedom of choice as to the nature and content of one's activity. It encompassed the period in Asaf'ev's life (ages 35-47) which is generally considered to represent the peak of one's powers. And, indeed, as we have seen, his literary output was enormous during this period, comprising well over half of his lifetime production. On the other hand, his musical catalog for the same period contains only twenty-one entries, of which almost three-fourths are incidental music (for plays by Shakespeare, Schiller, Ibsen, Moliere, and a handful of Russian writers, including Lunacharskiï), and the remainder, except for one cycle of two songs, involve arrangements of, or minor additions to existing works by other composers. Given these indications and what we know of the general set of circumstances surrounding Asaf'ev's change of emphasis, it is difficult to avoid the conclusion that Asaf'ev moved toward musical composition, during the 'thirties, as a defensive maneuver, primarily because he was convinced that his useful productivity as a musical scholar was at an end. Musical composition was the pursuit toward which his conservatory training had been directed, and his
practical experience in the theatre had prepared him well to handle its technical and practical considerations, but there is reason to suspect that musical composition represents his first love only chronologically rather than in terms of major commitment. Through it, he was able to continue his activities and achievements in the field of music at a time when his real aspirations were temporarily frustrated.

Asaf'ev's method as a composer represented, in its ideal conception, a productive interaction of the process of composing with that of scholarly research. His approach was to conduct a painstaking study of the "musical language" of the historical period and milieu which was to serve as the setting for his musical representation, and, by immersing himself in it, to assimilate and recreate it, "... employing the means of contemporary technique."120 In practice, however, any procedural method must ultimately be, judged by its results, and by such a measure, Asaf'ev's method has been of much more benefit to his scholarly activities than to his musical

---

120 B. V. Asaf'ev, "Muzyka 'tret'ego sosloviya' [Music of the 'Third Estate'] "Izbrannye trudy, Vol. V, p. 138. Asaf'ev's stated aim is suggestive of the achievements of Stravinsky's "Neo-Classic" phase, but Stravinsky was infinitely more successful in wedding the spirit of the past and the techniques of the present in musical creation of vital artistic immediacy--and with much less rhetoric.
creation. As such, it represents the implementation of an idea often stated by him that the study of music in the historical and analytical sense must depend on the hearing, on the perception of music as a living, vital force, rather than as a collection of museum or archaeological specimens. In the application of the same method to musical composition, however, Asaf'ev seems to have lacked the requisite creative initiative and imagination to create anything but music of a derivative or ancillary nature, incapable of standing on its own musical merits.

Nevertheless, Asaf'ev the composer, like Asaf'ev the musicologist, had great influence on his contemporaries and successors. Just as, in his musicological and critical activity, he defined tasks and methods for implementation by others, so, in musical composition, he devised a formula and a methodology for producing acceptable creations under the guidelines of Socialist Realism which served as a model for other composers. The fact that Asaf'ev rarely composed without a programme in mind (even in his abortive and notably unsuccessful attempts at symphonic writing in 1938 and 1942) is a trait attributable to his particular capabilities, which happened to correspond to the artistic and political expediencies of the

---

121 Cf., Ibid.
time. His choice of subject matter also represented a fortuitous concurrence of his natural inclinations with official acceptance, for his subjects were most often drawn either from history or from the Classics of Russian literature, both of which served as officially tolerable expressions of Soviet nationalism, and also had numerous precedents in the Russian Classical tradition of music. Still a third favorite area of subject matter, which was often interlinked with the other two and had numerous traditional antecedents, was the depiction of exotic, especially oriental, civilizations which have figured in Russian history, and the remnants of which remain in certain areas or within certain ethnic groupings now incorporated into the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics.

122 The latter device, for rather obvious reasons, lent itself much more readily to exploitation in the musical sphere than in the area of literature.

123 An outstanding example, combining both traits in one work, is Musorgskii's Boris Godunov, which depicts an actual historical event and is also based very closely on a play by Pushkin.

124 Bakhchisaraiskii fontan and Prisoner of the Caucasus, both based somewhat loosely on Pushkin, and the 1939 ballet, Ashik-Kerib, after Lermontov, are cases in point.
In his own description of work on *Plamya Parizha*, Asaf'ev recounts how he "... worked on the task at hand ... as a musicologist, an historian and theorist, and as a writer, not shunning the methods of the historical novel." His reference to the "methods of the historical novel," reinforced in subsequent passages, points up how closely Asaf'ev's approach to musical composition in this period parallels contemporaneous developments in literature, where, it will be remembered, the historical novel was enjoying a resurgence at just this time for reasons almost identical to Asaf'ev's motivation.

His historical subjects included, in addition to the French Revolution, ballets dedicated to Ivan Bolotnikov (1938) and Stepan Razin (1939), both leaders of early peasant revolts, and, in another genre, a 1936 opera on Minin and Pozharskiĭ (a butcher and a general, respectively), whose joint efforts rallied the Russian people after the death of Boris Godunov, expelled invading Polish troops, and made possible the establishment

---

125 Asaf'ev, "Muzyka 'tret'ego sosloviya'"; p. 138. The article was originally printed as an introductory article to the collection *Plamya Parizha* (Leningrad: State Academy of Theatre, Opera, and Ballet, 1934), pp. 6-13. Quotations from this passage are contained in Krebs, op. cit., p. 89 and Schwarz, op. cit., p. 150.

126 Cf., p. 58.
of the Romanov dynasty in 1613.

The fact that all three of the works just cited are concerned with events no more recent than the seventeenth century is significant. Most of Asaf'ev's musical subjects are escapist in nature and reflect a reluctance on his part to deal with contemporary problems. The same attitude was reflected in his pronouncements on the 1936 Shostakovich matter, which he preferred (and was permitted) to deliver in a written article rather than in open debate. Only one of his ballets, the 1935 Partizany (Partisans), more commonly designated as Partizanskie dni (Partisan Days) and set in the Russian Civil War period, is concerned with what could be called a "contemporary theme."127

Soviet critical evaluations of Asaf'ev's creative musical gifts have not, in fact, been unanimous in their acclaim, and, unlike his major musicological works whose value has been assessed at a progressively higher level with the passage of time, his musical compositions have not aged well. Actually, as early as 1937, a Soviet critic, who had formed a generally favorable impression of Plamya Parizha and Bakhshisaraiškiř fontan, pointed out significant defects in Asaf'ev's more recent creations,

127 This is pointed out by Danilevich (op. cit., p. 162).
Utrachennye illyuzii (Lost Illusions, 1934) and Partisan Days. In the former, he found the music well suited to choreographic needs, but lacking in dramatic force, attributable, in his view, to "... the predominance of intellect over feeling ..."¹²⁸ The latter work he found much less successful, revealing "... a qualitative weakness of thematic material,"¹²⁹ and "... the absence of real symphonic development."¹³⁰ In general, he finds Asaf'ev better able to deal with characterizations of entire epochs, than with individual representations.¹³¹

¹²⁸ V. M. Bogdanov-Berezovskii, B. V. Asaf'ev (Leningrad: Muzgiz, 1937), p. 24. This brochure represents a revision—somewhat condensed and updated—of an article of the same title in Novyĭ mir (New World), V (May, 1935), pp. 5-29. The earlier work did not contain the evaluation of the later ballets.


¹³⁰ Ibid. Krebs voices similar criticisms, finding "... the inability to find the drama within the music for providing the form ... surprising in Asaf'ev, who could discuss these things, their presence or absence in the music of others so brilliantly." (op. cit., p. 95).

For a time, in the aftermath of World War II, Asaf'ev's position in Soviet music was elevated very nearly to the level of secular canonization, and his role as a composer was regarded in an exclusively favorable light. More recently, however, some timid reservations as to the quality of his creative work have been ventured. Polyakova, in her 1961 English-language book, intended for export and foreign propaganda purposes, comments on Asaf'ev's concentration "... on the historical atmosphere... to the detriment of individual characterizations," and notes, significantly, that, in spite of Asaf'ev's "... assiduous... efforts at capturing the style of music of different times and peoples, real artistic values were nevertheless created by other composers..." (emphasis added). Danilevich (1963) elaborates on this point, and concludes that "... in his scientific [i.e., musicological] activity B. Asaf'ev was more daring, original, and brilliant, than in his activity as a composer." Nevertheless, Plamya Parizha and Bakhchisarai'skiy fontan have persisted in retaining a

132 Polyakova, op. cit., p. 132.

133 Ibid., p. 133.

134 Danilevich, loc. cit.
place in the repertoire.\textsuperscript{135} And, in fact, few of
Asaf'ev's many imitators in this area have transcended
their model. The wry observation by Krebs, that Asaf'ev
"... bore the heavy cross of not being a composer; and
the younger Soviet composers have borne the cross of
having to match him,"\textsuperscript{136} summarizes the situation well.

\textsuperscript{135}Krebs makes the infinitely plausible suggestion
that the popular success of Bakhchisaraïskiï fontan and
its artistic offspring may be attributable in large
measure to their inclusion of harem settings, with cos­
tumes which are not only exotic, but erotic (cf., \textit{op. cit.}
p. 91 n. 2, and p. 320).

\textsuperscript{136}Krebs, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 95.
On June 22, 1941, Hitler's Germany attacked the Soviet Union, and by September German troops had encircled the city of Leningrad. Hitler's intent, stated succinctly in a directive to his commanders, was that the city should be "... wiped off the face of the earth" (emphasis in the original). But the city held out under the military leadership of the famous General Zhukov and the civil leadership of the city's Party chief, A. A. Zhdanov. Asaf'ev, with his wife and sister-in-law, remained in the besieged city under the most difficult conditions of hunger, cold, periodic interruptions of water and electric service, and repeated bombardments by the enemy, till the end of February, 1943. At that time they were finally evacuated across the ice of frozen Lake Ladoga to Moscow, all of them in poor health, and Asaf'ev himself just recuperating from a serious illness which had felled him in August, requiring several months of hospitalization. Asaf'ev's own account of this grim period


is preserved in a *Sovetskaya muzyka* article.\(^{139}\)

Yet in these unlikely circumstances, Asaf'ev once more resumed his scholarly activities, producing a veritable deluge of historical and analytical works. His combined creative and musicological output during approximately the year and a half of his residence in the besieged city, is impressive by any standard, and—given the conditions under which he was forced to work—is incredible. He composed often without a piano or other instrument, studied and wrote without assured access to library facilities, and sometimes was obliged to wait till electricity was restored, or until daylight, to be able to write down the ideas which came to him in enforced darkness. As Danilevich observes, "There are few musicians who, even in normal, peaceful circumstances, work so productively and with such unquestionable enthusiasm."\(^{140}\) His dedication and achievements during this period without doubt contributed immeasurably to the veneration afforded him in his last years and had the direct result of his election to full membership in the USSR Academy of Science, in 1943, an unprecedented (and unduplicated) achievement for a musical

---


\(^{140}\) Danilevich, *op. cit.*, p. 272.
His scholarly output from this period is significant and quite wide-ranging, including works on Glinka, Tchaikovsky, the members of the "Five," and various Soviet composers, as well as on Grieg, Mozart, Beethoven, Mahler, Czech music, and folk music. Three major works from this period, meriting particular attention, are the second volume of *Musical Form as a Process* (subtitled *Intonation*), and two complementary works on Tchaikovsky's opera, *Eugene Onegin*, 141 and Glinka's *Ruslan and Lyudmila*. 142 The first of these (the second part of the present translation), develops his unique contribution to Soviet musical thought, the theory of Intonation, and the other two represent detailed applications of this theory to specific musical works. In addition, he made a comprehensive outline of planned


142 This work constitutes the second main section (designated, "Kniga vtoraya [Book Two]. Ruslan i Lyudmila") of Asaf'ev's monograph, *Glinka* (Moscow: Muzgiz, 1947). The monograph was awarded a Stalin Prize of the First Degree (the first musicological work so recognized): it was re-issued in 1950 and again (as a major portion of *Izbrannye trudy*, Vol. I [pp. 58-283]) in 1952.
future projects. As to his creative work, the total number of titles in his musical catalog for each of the years 1941 and 1942 exceeds that of any other single year of his life. It should be noted, however, that a large share of this creative output consisted of patriotic songs, inspired by the war effort and intended for performance at the front, and also that several of the compositions in large forms on which he worked in these years (e.g., a Fifth Symphony \textsuperscript{143} and a continuation of his ballet on Tchaikovsky compositions, \textit{Snegurochka} [Snow Maiden]) were not completed. Of his musical compositions from these years, only his ballet \textit{Militsa}, which lacked but two pages of completion when Asaf'ev fell ill in 1942, \textsuperscript{144} appears to have been at all viable.

His activity continued virtually unabated for the remainder of the war years, although the focus of his creative work turned again to more extended forms with a corresponding quantitative decrease. His total dedication in these years appears motivated, not only by his personal inclinations, but by a profound and genuine conviction of

\textsuperscript{143} Asaf'ev also engaged in some revision and editorial work on two of his other symphonies, written earlier.

\textsuperscript{144} This fact was mentioned by Asaf'ev in "Moya tvorcheskaya rabota v Leningrade . . . ," \textit{Izbrannye trudy}, Vol. V, p. 149.
his patriotic duty to contribute his best efforts in the areas of his competence.
The last three years of Asaf'ev's life saw a decrease in his quantitative output, perhaps as a concomitant to declining health. In addition, his last full year--1948--is unfortunately marked by a note of ambiguity and compromise. In 1946, A. A. Zhdanov, who had presented the Party's position at the Writers' Congress in 1934, and whose ruthless, but effective defense of Leningrad, in the interim, was cited,\footnote{Cf., p. 77 and n. 138, supra.} returned to his role as cultural arbiter. In August, 1946, two Leningrad literary journals were attacked in a Central Committee resolution (reinforced a week later in reports by Zhdanov to the Soviet Writers' Union and the local Leningrad committee of the Party) for continuing to publish the writings of two ideologically suspect writers, Mikhaïl Zoshchenko and Anna Akhmatova.\footnote{Discussions of this episode are found in Struve, \textit{op. cit.}, pp. 347-357, and in Walter N. Vickery, "Zhdanovism (1946-53), "Hayward and Lebedz, eds., \textit{op cit.}, pp. 99-124.} These events signalled the end of the comparative moderation of ideological strictures and the expansion of relations with Soviet Russia's Western allies which had emerged as a logical
corollary of their military partnership or "cobelligerency", as Struve aptly phrases it). They marked the beginning of the period in cultural policy which took Zhdanov's name (even though Zhdanov himself died—somewhat mysteriously—on August 31, 1948), the so-called "Zhdanovshchina, which lasted till Stalin's death in 1953. The attack on literature proved to be only the first frost of the cultural cold war, being followed in short order by denunciations of activities and individuals in the theatre and cinema and ultimately spreading to all the arts.

Music's turn came in 1948. Once again, as in 1936, the immediate target for an ideological object lesson by the Party was an opera, Velikaya druzhba [The Great Friendship], by a Georgian composer, Vano Muradeli, composed in honor of the thirtieth anniversary of the October Revolution, and premiered in Moscow on November 7, 1947. The premiere was attended by Zhdanov (and, possibly, by Stalin) and was poorly received. In January, 1948, an informal meeting

147 Struve, op. cit., p. 349.

148 The suffix -shchina is employed in Russian to indicate a movement of some kind, usually dominated in some way by the personality, policies, or actions of a particular individual. A seventeenth century rebellion against Peter the Great's Western reforms, led by Prince Ivan Khovanskiĭ, gave its name to Musorgskii's opera, Khovanshchina.
with the Moscow Composers' Union was convened by Zhdanov (with three other secretaries of the Central Committee present) ostensibly for the purpose of discussing Muradeli's opera. As it turned out, however, Zhdanov's criticism of the latter proved to be little more than a springboard for an attack on the current state of Soviet music which surpassed, both in scope and intensity, the 1936 Shostakovich denunciation. Zhdanov, in fact, by making reference to the earlier event in his opening remarks, gave a signal to a number of the thirty subsequent speakers, in the discussion which occupied the remainder of the three-day meeting, that Shostakovich and his creations were fair game for criticism. The discussion almost immediately degenerated into an acrimonious squabble, with composers of rather limited gifts and only modest success scrambling to join the denigration of the giants, among whom Zhdanov named, in a summation of the discussion on the conference's third day, not only Shostakovich, but also

149 An English language account of this affair--now regarded almost as a primary source--is Alexander Werth's Musical Uproar in Moscow, cited supra (p. 77, n. 138), which includes an intelligently rendered condensation of the stenographic transcript of the January meeting. Other commentators (notably Olkhovsky, op. cit., passim, and more recently, Schwarz, op. cit., pp. 208-48) have added retrospective insights to Werth's almost on-the-spot report.
Prokofiev, Myaskovskiǐ, and Khachaturyan, who with Shostakovich, were generally regarded as the Big Four in Soviet music. Three other influential composers—Shebalin (the director of the Moscow Conservatory), Popov, and Kabalevskiǐ —were also added. Also drawing condemnation were the Soviet critics, who were represented as standing so much in awe of the major composers that they dared not write anything but the most servile flattery when reviewing their works. Although it is possible, as some scholars have suggested, that Asaf'ev was included, at least by implication, in this blanket denunciation, on the strength of his generally favorable past treatment of the composers in question, there is some evidence to the contrary. Tikhon Khrennikov (who emerged from this episode as a power to be reckoned with in Soviet musical politics), speaking fairly

\[\text{\textsuperscript{150}}\]

Krebs (op. cit., p. 57) notes that Khachaturyan and Kabalevskiǐ "... were included as afterthoughts," and, indeed, the latter is not named in the formal Central Committee resolution which followed this meeting; nor was Shaporin, whose name, according to the stenographic transcript (as quoted in Werth, op. cit., p. 80) was volunteered by an anonymous voice during the discussion. Khachaturyan's inclusion, however, seems more than merely incidental, for, as vice-chairman of the Organizational Committee (ORGKOMITET) of the Composers' Union, which was established in 1939 for the purpose of coordinating the Union's activities, he received a major share of the blame for the ineffectiveness of that body, its chairman, the aging Glier, serving a role primarily as an honorary figurehead.
early on the first day of the conference, singled Asaf'ev out specifically as "... a highly sensitive musical judge ... who felt the growing alienation between our big symphonists and the People," a concern which he voiced in "... a short article in Soviet Art." The characterization occurs in a context in which Asaf'ev is obviously cited as an antipode to those "kowtowing critics" who are represented as tools of the big composers. Furthermore, Asaf'ev's subsequent role in Soviet musical life suggests anything but a fall from official grace.

A resolution of the Central Committee was issued on February 10, 1948, which, for the most part, echoed Zhdanov's remarks. In sum, it attributed "... the unsatisfactory state of contemporary Soviet music ... [and] the spread of a formalistic tendency among Soviet

---

151 Quoted in Werth, op. cit., p. 56.

152 Ibid. The article in question is "Muzyka dlya millionov [Music for Millions]," Sovetskoe iskusstvo [Soviet Art] (December 20, 1947).

153 Ibid.

composers, to an overemphasis on modernism and abstract instrumental forms, with a corresponding neglect of classical models (both Russian and Western!) and folk elements, resulting in an unacceptable loss of mass accessibility. Much of the blame for this state of affairs was assigned to the Committee on Art Affairs of the Council of Ministers of the USSR and to the Organizational Committee of the Union of Soviet Composers (to which the name Khachaturyan was appended parenthetically as its acting chairman) for their laxity in ensuring the development of a sufficiently "realistic" spirit in Soviet music. Implicit in the resolution is a demand for greater concentration on vocal forms and more explicitly programmatic instrumental works with "high (i.e., social, which is to say extra-musical) content," the dependence on classical models, the cultivation of popular and folk elements and instruments, the predominance of melody, and the virtual elimination of modernistic innovation. The implied goal of Soviet composers

155 Quoted in Olkhovsky, op. cit., p. 281.

156 Cf., n. 150 , supra, p. 85.

157 In view of the officially encouraged preference given to the homophonic mass-song, it is surprising to find a statement in the resolution deploring the prevailing "... rejection of polyphonic music and singing ... native to our people, ... [which] leads to the impoverishment and decadence of music" (quoted in Olkhovsky, op. cit., p. 282).
was to be the creation of music of immediate accessibility to the largest possible audience.

The appearance of the Central Committee resolution was followed almost immediately (February 17-26, 1948) by a General Assembly of Soviet Composers, at which, in addition to an opening declaration by Khrennikov, the emergent spokesman for Soviet music, "self-critical" statements of contrition and gratitude were delivered by Muradeli, Shostakovich, and Khachaturyan, and a letter, in the same vein from Prokofiev, absent because of ill health, was read. At the conclusion of the session, a letter of gratitude was sent to Stalin in the name of the Composers' Union. 158

The First All-Union Congress of Soviet Composers was held April 19-25 and elected a fifty-one member directorate to replace the disgraced ORGKOMITET. According to Schwarz, the new directorate was almost entirely "... an assemblage of Party-line stalwarts ... " 159 with the sole exception

158 Slonimsky, op. cit., pp. 1364-76, contains translations of the texts of the principal addresses at the meeting, and of the letter from Prokofiev and that written to Stalin. The text of a speech by Zhdanov is also included (Ibid., pp. 1362-63) which appears to be that of his opening remarks at the January meeting. The available evidence suggests that Zhdanov was not present at the February meeting.

159 Schwarz, op. cit., p. 215.
of Asaf'ev, who was designated as its chairman, although he was too ill to attend the Congress. The designation seems quite clearly to have been, like that of Glier as chairman of ORGKOMITET, a purely honorary appointment, especially when we learn that after Asaf'ev's death, less than a year later, no successor was chosen, Khrennikov assuming full authority of the Composers' Union in his position as First Secretary. However, there has been some confusion as to just where Asaf'ev actually stood in this matter. The confusion results from an address which was delivered in Asaf'ev's name at the Composers' Congress, which appeared to endorse wholeheartedly the conclusions of the Central Committee resolution denouncing composers whose work Asaf'ev had previously enthusiastically admired, and who

160 Ibid.

161 Asaf'ev had, for example, in the article, "Vos'maya simfoniya Shostakovicha [Shostakovich's Eighth Symphony]," included in the collection, Moskovskaya filarmoniya [Moscow Philharmonic] (Moscow: "Iskusstvo [Art]," 1945), pp. 5-9 (reprinted in Izbrannye trudy, Vol. V, pp. 132-35), cited Shostakovich's highly effective treatment of polyphony in that controversial symphony (which was later characterized, in 1948, as devoid of any of the qualities
were, in some cases (especially in the cases of Prokofiev and Myaskovskiĭ), his close personal friends of long standing. 162

Werth, in the concluding chapter of his book, devoted a special subsection to "The Strange Case of Professor Asafiev," in which he concluded that Asaf'ev's address must have been "... very heavily subedited." He continues, "In fact, nobody in Moscow demanded of Soviet music), summing up as follows:

In Shostakovich's music, increasing mastery and maturity of creation fully coincide with his ever more inspiring comprehension of the beauty and strength of music [expressed] in the energy of competing rhythms and lines which reflects the drama of the gigantic forces of mankind on the path toward realization of the ancient dream of the unity of strengths and capabilities. (Ibid., pp. 134-35.)

162 The title of his report, as given in the stenographic record of the Composers' Congress, was "Tridtsat' let sovetskoi muziki i zadachi sovetskikh kompozitorov [Thirty Years of Soviet Music and the Tasks of Soviet Composers]." The report was also printed in Sovetskaya muzyka, No. 2 (1948), pp. 12-22, under the title "Za novuyu muzykal'nuyu estetiku, za sotsialisticheskii realizm [For a New Musical Esthetic, for Socialist Realism]."

163 Werth, op. cit., pp. 96-98.

164 Ibid., p. 97.
who knew anything of . . . Asafiev's previous views could quite believe that his address represented his honest and candid opinion." Olkhovsky, too, betrays some skepticism as to the authenticity of the thoughts expressed in Asaf'ev's address with the observation that " . . . not everything written and signed in the Soviet Union . . . expresses the writer's real thought. . . . " Olkhovsky's explanation of the incident adds virtually nothing to Werth's surmises, and, in fact, seems rather lame in its apparent interpretation of Asaf'ev's failure to appear personally to read his address as a tacit protest, thus attempting to represent Asaf'ev's very real and ultimately fatal illness as little more than a contrived excuse for his absence. A much more viable explanation involving Asaf'ev's illness might well be that it rendered him more susceptible to pressure, as both Werth and Schwarz suggest.

165 Ibid.
166 Olkhovsky, op. cit., p. 83.
167 Cf., Ibid.
168 Werth, op. cit., p. 97.
169 Schwarz, op. cit., p. 226.
Time and a gradual liberalization of Party and State controls has served to shed more light on the subject. A major revelation, if not unsuspected, was the acknowledgment by Elena Orlova, in her informative and comprehensive monograph on Asaf'ev's literary activity, that Asaf'ev's "... report was prepared collectively, with the participation of other Soviet musicians. However a draft of the statement, preserved in manuscript, testifies to the large role played by Asaf'ev in its preparation." However, after reviewing and acknowledging the probable validity of various explanations for Asaf'ev's apparent compromise (his health, the counsel of colleagues, and even an appeal to his patriotism), Schwarz advances an additional explanation, directing attention to Asaf'ev's long-standing emphasis on music comprehensible to the masses, which also constituted the principal thrust of the central committee resolution.

---


171 The latter idea was advanced by Werth (op. cit., p. 97) who suggests, "It may have been impressed upon him [Asaf'ev] that State reasons demanded this address." Quoted in Schwarz, loc. cit.

Orlova, in a memorial collection dedicated to Asaf'ev, dealt with this question, summing up the matter in the title of her contribution, "Composer and Listener--One of the Leading Themes in the Works of B. V. Asaf'ev." Schwarz concludes, however, that Asaf'ev, in his advocacy of art comprehensible to the masses, surely did not foresee most of the harmful effects which would accompany the implementation of such comprehensibility.

Schwarz's suggestion may be carried even further, however, raising additional possible interpretations. One can find a number of positions in Asaf'ev's writings, throughout his career, which are consistent in principle with the demands of the February resolution. He repeatedly emphasizes the importance of melody, for example, and particularly asserts the necessity of vocal quality or

---


174 Schwarz, op. cit., p. 227.
song-like quality as the basis for all music including instrumental. The value of Classical models and folk elements in musical composition is also a constantly recurring theme, as is his insistence upon content and expressiveness as obligatory qualities of music. Of special interest is his stress on the expressive possibilities of polyphony, and in particular that practiced in predominantly improvisational manner by Russian peasant choirs.

At the risk of appearing to belabor this point, the appearance of a similar concern in the Party's resolution seems more than coincidental, and is, in fact, something of a paradox in that context. It is, in the first place, difficult to reconcile a call for more attention to polyphony

175 The Russian term designating the peculiarly recognizable song-quality of native Russian music is pesennost'. Swan devotes particular attention to this phenomenon throughout his book (op. cit.).

176 Cf., for example, his discussion of polyphony in Shostakovich's Eighth Symphony (Cf., p. 90, n. 161, supra). In addition, Orlova (B. V. Asaf'ev..., p. 8) observes that "the thoughts of Taneev regarding the area of national polyphony find their continuation in the works of Asaf'ev."

177 This subject appears repeatedly in Asaf'ev's Musical Form as a Process. The Soviet composer and musicologist, A. D. Kastal'skii (1856-1926) is credited ([Gerald R. Seaman], "Folk Music [Russian]," Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians, ed. Eric Blom and Denis Stevens, 5th ed., Vol. X [Supplement], p. 166, col. 1) with clarifying this practice, which is discussed elsewhere in this dissertation.

178 Cf., f. 87, n. 157, supra).
with the overriding demand of the resolution for mass accessibility, the most direct expression of which had been, and continued to be, the homophonic mass-song. Even more curiously, this point was not mentioned in the discussion with Zhdanov in January, but is the subject of a separate paragraph in the February 10 resolution,\(^{179}\) so placed as to make it difficult to miss. Finally, in retrospect there appears to have been little subsequent effort to implement this particular provision of the resolution; thus its inclusion in the resolution would seem to have had some other purpose. That purpose may well have been to help persuade Asaf'ev to lend his support to the position of the Party.

There are other similarities to Asaf'ev's views in the language of the resolution, which suggest that its authors may have drawn upon his writings for their ideas and terminology. Indeed, this would have been understandable in

\(^{179}\)Schwarz (op. cit., p. 219) cites two rather minor differences between the January discussion and the text of the resolution as evidence of Zhdanov's purposeful role in the latter's preparation, tending to suggest that such discrepancies should not be regarded lightly. The inclusion of the subject of polyphony in the resolution was noted at the General Assembly of Soviet Composers in February in the speech by Khremlikov (quoted in Slonimsky, op. cit., p. 1365) and in Prokofiev's letter (quoted Ibid., p. 1374), which was read at the General Assembly.
any case, for Asaf'ev was perhaps the most highly respected Soviet music critic and scholar at that time, and the second volume of *Musical Form as a Process*, which is perhaps the most comprehensive summation of his ideas on music, had only recently (1947) been published. But the similarities may point to an even more purposeful (and, it must be said, cynical) intent. Olkhovsky speaks of "... an exceptionally persistent campaign ... for the purpose of drawing Asaf'ev into the role of ideological leader of Soviet music," which had begun about 1940, and his character and stature in 1948 surely would have made him even more desirable for that position from the Party leadership's viewpoint. His well-documented public-spiritedness (demonstrated by his vigorous organizational and pedagogical activities in the 'twenties and his feverish scholarly and creative work in the war years) and his unquestioned artistic integrity could serve to lend legitimacy to the Party position if he could be persuaded to associate his name with it.

Thus, it is altogether possible that the curious reference to polyphony in the resolution was intended as a specific signal to Asaf'ev. The question, in such a case, is not how consistent Asaf'ev's ideas were with the resolution, but rather, how much the resolution reflected those

180 Olkhovsky, *op. cit.*, p. 82.
ideas. As it has been pointed out, Asaf'ev was gravely ill, and there is no evidence to suggest that he personally attended any of the meetings which dealt with the problem. Thus, it is possible that Asaf'ev's only knowledge of the events of January and February, 1948, were obtained from a reading of the resolution, which merely hints at the treatment to which his friends were subjected. In addition, finding at least an intimation of a number of his own ideas (including the rather esoteric concept of polyphony) included in the resolution it was perhaps possible for Asaf'ev to reconcile the remaining differences. A picture emerges from this affair, however, of Asaf'ev, exploited as the voluntary, but unwitting instrument of the Party's design, who had no idea of the mischief which would be done in the name of principles which he advanced in all

---

181 Werth (op. cit., p. 44) mentions the difficulty in obtaining copies of the verbatim report of the Zhdanov meeting.

182 In 1943, for example, Asaf'ev had advocated as one of the three basic stimuli to Soviet music, "... close attention to the music of the West and the selection [from it] of that which is most essential and valuable" ("Puti razvitiya sovetskoj muzyki [Paths of Development of Soviet Music]," Izbrannye trudy, Vol. V, p. 51), a position decidedly at odds with the resolution except with regard to the Classics. The article cited was first published in a 1946 collection, Ocherki sovetskogo muzykal'nogo tvorchestva [Essays on Soviet Musical Creation].
good faith. The scenario is admittedly conjectural, but does perhaps raise some compelling possibilities.

Asaf'ev died on January 27, 1949. To the many honors he had accumulated in his lifetime were now added posthumous honors, as well as rewards to his family members. The honors included the placing of a memorial tablet on the facade of his Leningrad home, the assumption by the USSR Academy of Science of financial responsibility for the publication of some of his technical works, the payment of funeral expenses by the State, and an extended eulogium over the signatures of well-known Russian musical figures. 183 In addition, his widow was awarded an outright cash payment of 20,000 rubles, plus a lifetime pension, and her sister, in consideration of expenses incurred on Asaf'ev's behalf, was granted a pension of 500 rubles per month for life. 184

---

183 Montagu-Nathan, op. cit., p. 335.
184 Ibid.
B. THE THEORETICAL WORK: MUSICAL FORM AS A PROCESS

1. Literary Style

Before proceeding to discussion of the content of Musical Form as a Process, it is appropriate to consider a problem which arises in the reading of any of Asaf'ev's writings, that is the frequent instances of vagueness, obscurity, and general lack of clarity in his literary style. This is a deficiency which is noted by a number of Soviet commentators, and even by Asaf'ev himself, in the section, "In Lieu of An Introduction," which begins the book, Intonation\(^{185}\) [ 607 ].\(^{186}\) N. Shakhnazarova observes "... many inconsistencies, mutually exclusive assertions, and different expressions concerning the same phenomena, which cannot be explained merely as the creative evolution of a musician and publicist."\(^{187}\) Kabalevskiy characterizes the language of Musical Form as

\(^{185}\)Book II of Musical Form as a Process, in subsequent references, will be, as here, designated by its subtitle.

\(^{186}\)All subsequent references to the content of the present translation will be followed (as here) by page numbers enclosed in square brackets indicating the location of the cited passage in the translation.

a Process as "... complicated and ... perceived not without difficulty." Echoing the admission by Asaf'ev himself, he attributes this to the fact that the complexity of Asaf'ev's language, in effect, increases in inverse proportion to his understanding of the subject under discussion. L. Mazel', however, rejects this explanation and sees the root cause of Asaf'ev's complicated style in his early, post-revolutionary attempts to escape being charged with dogmatism. This resulted in a deliberate avoidance of the use of commonly accepted terminology, often necessitating involved explanations which tended to obscure more than they revealed. A related device was the self-conscious introduction of "... 'fresh, figurative' expressions"--the "neologisms" to which Asaf'ev himself refers--as replacements for

188 Kabalevskii, op. cit., p. 22.

189 Ibid.


191 Ibid.
conventional terminology, which might better have been used, as Mazel' suggests, to supplement rather than to replace the old terminology. 192

Yet, beyond these explanations, some characteristics of Asaf'ev's literary style can only be regarded as stylistic devices which contribute more to colorful literary expression than to clarification of his ideas. Mazel' cites, as a positive feature of Asaf'ev's writing, his presentation of ideas "... in vital, emotional, figurative language, often corresponding to the inner nature of the artistic phenomenon about which he was writing." 193 In fact, Asaf'ev's presentation of his ideas has almost a quality of musical development about it -- an organic quality--whereby ideas introduced in later stages of his presentation seem to have developed from earlier points, often requiring reference to ideas expressed previously. One is reminded of a musical concept which Asaf'ev designates as "intonational arches" or "sound arches," by which (particularly in larger forms) musical ideas are introduced in incomplete form in the earlier stages of a musical composition, temporarily abandoned, picked up again and ultimately completed (or

192 _Ibid._

193 _Ibid._, n. 1.
resolved) at a later point. Such a technique in his literary work might be labeled "thought arches." A similar organic quality is noted by N. Ya. Bryusova\(^\text{194}\) in the very modest literary output of the theorist Boleslav Leopoldovich Yavorskiĭ (1877-1942).\(^\text{195}\) In view of the very extensive influence of Yavorskiĭ's theories on Asaf'ev's concepts (discussed below),\(^\text{196}\) a connection between their literary styles would seem quite consistent. Still another literary device common both to Yavorskiĭ\(^\text{197}\) and Asaf'ev is their exploitation of the multi-significance of terminology. Such a device has also been attributed to the eighteenth century German poet


\(^{195}\) Yavorskiĭ's theoretical heritage (the "Theory of Modal Rhythm"), though very influential in the Soviet teaching of music theory (cf., Schwarz, op. cit., pp. 382, 388-89), has been preserved more comprehensively in the writings of his students and colleagues than in his own. His own efforts were devoted to teaching, more than to writing, and his personal literary output consists, in large part, of short articles, letters, and uncompleted works.

\(^{196}\) Significantly, one of Asaf'ev's borrowings from the theories of Yavorskiĭ is the concept of "sound arches."

\(^{197}\) Noted in V. Tsukkerman, "B. L. Yavorskiĭ--Teoretik [Theorist]," Yavorskiĭ: Vospominaniya ..., p. 205.
and philosopher, Schiller, who, in contrast to Kant's desire to be as unmistakably precise in his language as possible, seems deliberately to have accentuated the multiple interpretations possible for a given word.198 This basically rhetorical usage was the apparent manifestation of advocatory, persuasive, and rhetorical motivations rather than expository intent. Yavorskii was particularly interested in emphasizing links between ancient and modern music by tracing the historical evolution of concepts and terms. Being an accomplished pianist, as well as a theorist, his ultimate aim was the achievement of breadth and historical authenticity in performance practice. In Asaf'ev's case, the results of such a device are uneven and often questionable, and in some contexts his true meaning becomes hopelessly obscured in what degenerates into seemingly capricious literary mannerism. Such is the case, particularly, in his virtually incomprehensible discussion of the "quality of play" (or "playing") in the secular, instrumental polyphony of the

Renaissance [696-700]. In the final analysis some aspects of Asaf'ev's literary style possess more purely stylistic interest than instructive validity, appearing as an actual impediment to the serious student, approaching the book in search of a clear exposition of Asaf'ev's ideas. Indeed, many passages in the book emerge as merely evocative rather than truly informative.

Seventeen years passed between the commencement of Asaf'ev's work on Book I of Musical Form as a Process in 1925 and the completion of the second book, Intonation, in 1942, the same duration of time.

---

199 Cf., also, Commentary, n. *73, p. 964, infra. There is no clear evidence specifically linking Asaf'ev to Schiller, but several factors are worth noting in this connection. Schiller's influence on a number of nineteenth century Russian intellectuals (including Belinski) is documented (e.g., in Edmund K. Kostka, Schiller in Russian Literature [Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1965]), and Asaf'ev makes several references to him in Musical Form as a Process. Also interesting is Schiller's role in the development of the philosophy of "art is play," an idea which is implicit (as one aspect of Asaf'ev's interpretation) in the context under consideration here.


201 The date given by Orlova, in the commentary to the publication of Intonation in Izbrannye trudy, Vol. V (p. 284), for completion of the manuscript is January 24, 1942.
which elapsed between the initial publication dates of the two books (1930 and 1947, respectively). Twelve years elapsed between the completion of the preparation for publication of Book I in 1929\textsuperscript{202} and the beginning of his work on Book II in 1941. Yet there is an undeniably high degree of continuity running through the two volumes. As Asaf'ev himself characterizes it in \textit{Intonation} [600], the second book is "...not so much a continuation as a development..." of the first. The Czech scholar, Jaroslav Jiranek, describes the two volumes as "...a mutually conditioned, dialectical whole, ..."\textsuperscript{203} neither part of which can be truly understood, in its essence, in isolation

\begin{itemize}
\item[202] Orlova, Issledovanie Asaf'eva ...", \textit{loc. cit.}
\item[203] Jaroslav Jiranek, \textit{Asafieva teorie intonace. Jeji geneze a význam [Asaf'ev's Intonational Theory: Its Origin and Significance]} (Prague: Academia, 1967), quoted by V. Vit in a Russian language summary at the end of the book (Ibid., p. 296). Since mastery of the Czech language is not an attainment of the translator of the present work, the inclusion of summaries in German, English, and Russian, along with translations of the Table of Contents into those languages, constituted a welcome feature of this book. The English language summary, however, owing to an incomplete knowledge, at best, of the subject matter, and an insecure grasp of English, by its author, proved to be considerably less illuminating than its Russian language counterpart.
\end{itemize}
from the other. In fact, some of Asaf'ev's main concepts, in particular the concept of intonation, and of one of its principle components, the intonational "vocabulary," achieves an almost visible development throughout the course of the two volumes.
2. Marxism and the Sociological Method

Asaf'ev conceived of this work as a social or sociological theory of musical form, which is made clear in his first sentences: "Musical form, as a socially determined phenomenon, is perceived . . . as a form for revealing music socially . . . ." [184] It is perceived as " . . . the purposeful distribution in time of musical material, [the principles of organization of which] . . . are not the principles of individual creation, but rather social principles. " [185-86] These passages set the tone for the entire work and serve to establish immediately its Marxist orientation. This is given additional reinforcement a few paragraphs later in Asaf'ev's reference to musical formation as a "dialectical process," [187] and again in his assertion that "an acoustical medium which is not organized by the human consciousness does not . . . constitute music." [187] Asaf'ev's work is suffused with Marxian concepts and terminology. At times, especially in the first book,

204 This assertion, which permeates Asaf'ev's discussion, closely parallels Marx's presupposition of labor " . . . in a form that stamps it as exclusively human." (Karl Marx, Capital, ed. Friedrich Engels, trans. Samuel Moore and Edward Aveling; "Great Books of the Western World," Vol. L; Chicago: Encyclopedia Brittanica, Inc. 1952], p. 85, col. 2).
this evocation of Marx becomes extremely self-conscious and heavy-handed, as, for example, when Asaf'ev refers several times to music's direct dependence on the "relations of production." [e.g., pp. 257, et passim.] Such direct attribution of the superstructure to the economic base came to be designated by the Soviets themselves, during the 1930's, as "vulgar sociology," a designation which does not seem inappropriate in instances such as those just noted in Asaf'ev's works.

In view of the basic Marxist orientation of Asaf'ev's thought, it seems useful to provide a synopsis of the main points of Marxism, particularly emphasizing those aspects which are more or less directly applicable to the content of Asaf'ev's *Musical Form as a Process*. A number of these points of connection are stressed in the subsequent discussion of that content, and others are noted in the commentary which accompanies the text of the translation.

Throughout the history of human civilization, the attempts to resolve the persistent question of the relationship of the individual conscious human mind to nature and

---

205 It is interesting that Jiranek, from the vantage point of the 1960's, also sees "... some vulgar materialistic, schematicizing tendencies of the Stalin-Zhdanov era" in Asaf'ev's second volume (op. cit., p. 296).
the material world have tended in varying degree toward one or the other of the two philosophical orientations designated as idealism and materialism. Stating the basic, extreme proposition of each orientation in the simplest possible way, we may say that idealism recognizes thought as the only reality and regards matter as having existence only in the mind as the product of sensations, while materialism recognizes matter as reality which, by acting directly on our senses, creates a generally accurate reflection or image of itself in our mind. Marxism classifies itself as dialectical materialism. The materialist side of this philosophy, in essence, states that matter is the basis of all existence. The dialectical aspect expresses the dynamic interconnectedness of things: the inevitability of continuous, qualitative change as a fundamental element of existence.

Marx derived his dialectical method from that of Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel (1770-1831)--the so-called Hegelian dialectic--which, in its turn, represented a development of the philosophy of Immanuel Kant (1724-1804). Kant's contribution was to establish the objective existence of matter, albeit within an idealistic orientation. His conclusions took the form of a duality, in which
material objects exist independently of thought. According to Kant, this independent, material entity, which he calls "thing-in itself" (Ding an sich) or Noumenon, exercises an effect upon our senses, which produces in our minds a perception, image, or phenomenon of the object. These perceptions, made up of combinations of sensations, are then grouped into conceptions, which are, in turn, classified into twelve categories (e.g., Causality, Unity, Necessity). However, our only contact with the object is through the medium of our senses. Thus, the reality of the object, insofar as we are capable of dealing with it, is the experiencing of it, rather than the object itself, of which we have not, and cannot have, any direct knowledge. When science and theology attempt to go beyond—to transcend—sense experience, to examine objective reality, they are confronted with endless dilemmas and contradictions. The examination of these contradictions, which to Kant, reveal the limitations of human reason, he calls Transcendental Dialectic.  

In Kant's epistemology, our conceptions are basically static; our experiences of the world come to us in finished

form. It is significant, in this connection, that Kant's twelve categories, which supposedly encompass all experience, include the concepts of Existence and, by contraposition, Non-existence, but do not include the dynamic stage of Becoming. The motivating factor in Hegel's revisions of Kant's system was the attempt to add this missing dynamic element.

Hegel placed particular emphasis on the category of Relation, since every idea is, in essence, a group of relations. The most universal relationship, moreover, "...is that of contrast or opposition. Every ...idea or situation ... leads irresistibly to its opposite and then unites with it to form a higher or more complex whole." This principle of inevitable progression from


208 In Kant's table of categories, as contained in Kant The Critique of Pure Reason, trans. Thomas Kingsmill Abbott, W. Hastie, and James Creed Meredith ("Great Books of the Western World," Vol. XLII; Chicago: Encyclopedia Britannica, Inc., 1952), p. 42, Relation appears as one of four supercategories under which the individual categories are then arranged in groups of three.

209 Durant, op. cit., p. 295
an original idea (thesis) to its opposite (antithesis), then to ultimate resolution of the contradiction in a higher unity (synthesis) is the quintessence of Hegel's concept of "dialectical progression." Contrary to Kant's Transcendental Dialectic, Hegel sees contradiction not as a limitation on human reason, but as an indispensable factor in its progressive development. Thus, change in terms of the Hegelian dialectic, is "... the cardinal principle of life ...", and dialectical movement becomes the sine qua non of history. The twelve categories conceived by Kant do not, in fact, encompass all possible experience even now, as we have already seen in the case of the category of Existence, and as new aspects of experience are encountered, new categories must be evolved to accommodate them. Hegel raises the possibility of the future development of our experience to the point where we may gain, at least by inference, some knowledge of the noumenal world. Lying at the core of Hegel's philosophy is his concept of the Absolute Idea, the concept of

210 Ibid., p. 297.

211 Kaminsky, op. cit., p. 9.

212 Ibid., p. 7
ultimate reconciliation and resolution lying hidden beneath the universal conflict of life. The Absolute Idea serves as a reflection in human thought of an absolute standard, representing the concept of God, against which all human functions are measured.\footnote{Durant, op. cit., p. 296}

Though acknowledging the objective existence of matter, Kant and Hegel fall within the Idealist orientation, for they considered the reality of human life to be centered in the mind. Material objects were recognized as merely peripheral to the conduct of human experience. The fundamental stipulation of the Marxist definition of matter—that it must be confirmable by evidence and reason—is absent from the concepts of both Kant and Hegel.

Marx, although he embraced the dialectical principle and credited Hegel with "... being the first to present its general form of working in a comprehensive and conscious manner...",\footnote{Marx, op. cit., p. 11, col. 2 (author's preface to second (1873) edition).} rejected the idealistic specifics of Hegel's philosophy. By his application of the dialectic to materialism, he had, as he put it, set on its feet the Hegelian concept which was "standing on its
head. in the process he injected a dynamic element (as Hegel had done to Kant) into the prevailing form of materialism at the time—that designated as "mechanistic"—which explained the material world in terms of laws of motion fixed in immutable patterns of strict causality, operating within a deterministic framework, in which history, in terms of active human participation, is only incidental, and change and motion are merely surface features.

The nature of reality, in the Marxist view, is governed by the nature of matter. Matter may be examined in terms of three aspects: its physical properties or identifying characteristics (within a given time frame), its functions or external relationships, and its immanent capacity for change in its essence. Of fundamental importance to the dialectical concept is this inherently dynamic (hence dialectical) nature of even the simplest forms of matter. There is, in fact, no evidence to suggest that any aspect of existence is immune to change; thus, the Marxist concludes that change is the universal norm, the essence of matter, and that stability (or, more properly, the impression of stability) is a temporary condition.

Ibid.
dependent upon the rate of change or motion of the matter in question.

The concept of perpetual change carries interesting implications in the Marxist concept of the origin of matter. Marxism interprets the familiar aphorism, "You can't get something from nothing," very literally, there being no objective evidence to the contrary. This is not to say that there can be nothing new, but its origin is seen, not as spontaneous generation, but rather as the result of the transformation of something old. And, if this is accepted as an objectively confirmable fact now, there is no logical reason to conclude that it was ever otherwise and, therefore, no scientific substantiation for a "First Cause" or a point at which matter first originated. If matter now exists, then it must always have existed, though not in the same form in which we perceive it now. By the same line of reasoning, matter must be comprehended as infinite and eternal, but infinitely and eternally changeable—in process.

It is precisely this concept of an eternal process which gives rise to the Marxist concept of History which, in contrast to the incidental nature of its inclusion in the mechanistic interpretation, is intrinsic to dialectical
materialism. History is seen as the totality of the evolution of matter and, by logical extension, of existence. Every aspect of existence has a history; it represents the product of changes which occur, not merely in reaction to the intrusion of external forces, but as the result of internal dynamics, the opposition of conflicting internal forces, resolved into unity, and then, as a unity, opposed by new contradictory forces in a never ending process.

But where is the purpose of such an existence? In Marx's view there is no ultimate purpose, since the term implies a goal, and, thus, completion, but there can be no goal beyond the totality of existence. Within this totality, however, there are endless numbers of particular and finite things, recognized as having determinable limits. Beyond the span of the specific existence of any such particularity, however, a former, qualitatively different condition of existence, from which it has evolved, and a subsequent state representing a further qualitative transformation, must be acknowledged.

Human existence may be regarded as such a particularity within the total process of existence. Marx's philosophy differs from those of Hegel and the Mechanists particularly in its recognition of direct, conscious, human
participation in the dialectical process. The unique aspect of human experience is the activity of the mind, which is clearly not of an explicitly material nature; nevertheless, Marx insists that thoughts, ideas, values, esthetic responses, emotions, etc.—in a word, all the processes of the mind—are the product of objective matter. The mind itself, is explained by the hypothesis that the mechanism for human thought represents a refined stage in the evolutionary development of the nervous systems possessed, in varying stages of complexity, by lower forms of life. Ideas are viewed as reflections of objective matter transmitted through the senses. Emotions represent a similar response to sensory stimuli on a different level; reason can explain these responses but cannot reproduce them nor substitute for them. Esthetic, ethical, and moral values represent the least comprehensively developed area in Marxist philosophy, but, in general, may be seen as responses to man's practical and esthetic needs, rather than as the dictates of divine authority; values and ideals can serve as guides to the best use of the matter at man's disposal.

Thus, the reality of the processes of the mind is
recognized, and these processes are subject to the same
dialectical principles as are the processes of nature,
with one significant difference. The operation of the
dialectic in the area of human thought involves the
element of consciousness, which is absent in the purely
material or natural sphere. The human mind does not
merely receive the action of dialectical forces, it can
consciously react to those forces and, in reacting, can
apply forces of its own, thus actually affecting the
course and outcome of the dialectical process. This reciprocals relationship is entirely beyond the scope of the
purely mechanistic concept of cause-and-effect.

Marxism rejects both the mechanistic view of man as
an ineffectual particle in an inexorable mechanical pro-
cess and Hegel's Absolute Idea as the expression of a
divine authority to which man is uncomprehendingly subordinate. Instead, Marx placed his full confidence in the
power of human reason; his philosophy is characterized by

\(^{216}\)Frederich Engels, Ludwig Feuerbach and the End of
Classical German Philosophy, trans. Anon., excerpt in
Howard Selsam and Harry Martel (eds.) Reader in Marxist
Philosophy: From the Writings of Marx, Engels, and Lenin
Translated from text of German publication, Stuttgart, 1888.
the desire to understand the totality of existence rather than merely to accept it. Basic to the pursuit of this aim is the application of the scientific method of investigation—the logical and systematic analysis of sensory data, observation, and experiment—in all fields. Rejection of conclusions based on revelation, supernatural authority, intuition, or pure, uninformed faith is implicit in this method. Faith has validity, in the Marxist view, only as the product of rational evaluation of past experience, not as an explanation of reality. Marxism finds no evidence of any level of existence which is inapprehensible to human experience and reason; therefore reality, as the aggregate of existence, encompassing both natural processes and the processes of the mind, is susceptible to objective confirmation by science. However, reality is dialectical at every level; consequently our conceptions of it must remain open to modification in light of possible new objective evidence. At any given time, definite and objective reality exists capable of full knowledge and definition, but our knowledge of it remains incomplete, limited by what we have not yet experienced. Reality cannot be fully described, but the process of description can be defined and the results thus far achieved, stated.
In pursuing this objective, the correct method of thinking, in the process of solving problems and reaching provable conclusions, must be determined by the basic properties of existence, which, in the dialectical materialist view, are the pervasiveness of change and the temporality of stability. Formal logic, as exemplified by the three Aristotelian laws of existence—Identity (A=A), Non-Contradiction (A is not non-A), and Excluded Middle (λ must be either A or non-A)—does not satisfy the requirements of a dialectical method of thinking. Marxism supplants these laws with three laws of dialectical logic: Strife, Interpenetration, and Unity of Opposites (change caused by the opposition and interrelation of internal forces as an intrinsic quality of all things, balanced by sufficient unity to permit their existence as coherent entities); Transition from Quantity to Quality (accumulation of changes of degree as the sole and inevitable means of achieving changes in essence; and Negation of Negations (the inevitable subsequent cancellation, through qualitative change or "negation" as it is called, of each new state resulting from a previous "negation," proceeding in a never ending succession). One of the more spectacular applications of these dialectical laws is the refutation
of the Aristotelian laws of Non-Contradiction and Excluded Middle. The subject of any observation (A) must be recognized as being in a constant state of change, that is, in the process of becoming something else. In its totality, then, it must be perceived in terms of what it is changing into (non-A) as well as what it is changing from. Thus, it exists simultaneously as both A and non-A, though, at any given time it is generally more one than the other.

These dialectical laws are presented as conclusions based upon factual evidence, and represent, to the Marxist, the correct method of thinking to arrive at truth. Truth, in the Marxist view, must be objective, that is, it must be capable of proof. However, insofar as it is based upon our knowledge of reality, which is incomplete and subject to modification, truth also contains an element of relativity. Contrary to the pragmatic concept, in which truth is subordinate to utility, the Marxist view of truth is based on objective reality and its validity is merely confirmed by utility and practice.

Reference to the "class approach" or "party spirit" in relation to truth is a reference to the fact that the interests of different classes of society may be differently served by the suppression or acceptance of newly
discovered truths. This does not represent a refutation of the objectivity of truth, nor does it represent a value judgment of the positions of any specific group. "Party spirit" need not be a conscious inclination nor a deliberate distortion, but manifests itself most often in the form of selective emphasis on the questions to be resolved.

The concept of "party spirit" is closely related to Hegel's controversial assertion that "All that is real is rational; and all that is rational is real." A prevailing view for some time was that this represented a reactionary facet of his philosophy, seeming to serve as a rallying cry for preservation of the status quo, by advancing the proposition that whatever now exists (with specific reference to political systems) must be accepted as having rational validity merely on the basis of its existence.

Engels, however, citing Hegel again ("... in the course of its development reality proves to be necessity.")

rebuted this interpretation with the supplementary equation, Reality=Social Necessity. A concept or institution


could be considered real and rational so long as it filled a necessary place in the evolutionary process. The French monarchy in 1789, according to Engels. "... had become so unreal, ... so robbed of all necessity, so irrational, that it had to be destroyed by the Great Revolution..."

In relation to the scientific method, it is the content, not the form, which sets Marxism apart from other scientific disciplines. There is no attempt to expand the scientific method, but rather to operate within the limits of the method as it stands. In its general application, Marxism posits no absolutes. It is acknowledged, for example, that the application of the concept of contradiction does not represent valid dialectical thinking in every case, or that the rate of motion and change may be so minimal, in relation to a particular observation, that the subject can be regarded as effectively static. Beyond the general recognition of the universal occurrence of quantitative and qualitative changes and of contradiction, Marxism claims no powers of clairvoyance with regard to specific laws of change, which yield only to factual investigation and cannot be

219 Ibid.
determined in advance. The approach to understanding, in
the best traditions of the scientific method, must be
through rational and informed hypothesis, on the basis of
factual observation and sensory experience, which will
serve as a foundation for continuing investigation and
experimentation.

Based on the interdependent suppositions that man is
capable of full understanding, and that reality is capable
of being fully understood (given time, discipline, and the
proper vantage point), the Marxist sees man's goal as the
accumulation of objective knowledge of the totality of
existence, whereby he can play an active and creative part
in that totality. By the recognition of qualitative
changes as the natural consequence of evolutionary process­
es in the past, the expectation that they will continue in
the future, and the acceptance of the fact of correspond­
ing evolutionary processes in human society, man can,
through study and increased understanding, improve his
ability to forecast this social evolution, to control and
direct the course of events where possible, and to adjust
to whatever is beyond his control.

Thus, Marx's philosophy is not merely a passive,
academic exercise in logical argumentation, but a plan for
action. The substance of its proposed implementation is
treated in that part of his writing dealing specifically
with social philosophy. This part of Marxist philosophy
is designated by the term Historical Materialism, which
may be defined as "... the application of dialectical
materialism to the study of the evolution of human soci-
eties."\textsuperscript{220} The term "historical" here receives dual
significance as denoting both the inherent dialectical
nature (as discussed above) of the approach, and also,
the more commonly understood meaning of the word as having
specifically human connotations.

Marxism places the economic processes of society at
the foundation of its development. Society, in this con­
text, is subdivided into three levels. The first level, the
forces or means of production, constitutes the material
and technical aspects--land, natural resources, the labor
force, technology, etc.--of the economic life of society.
The second level, relations of production, are the legally
sanctioned human relationships established with respect to
ownership or control of the material forces of production,
that is, between those who control these forces and those
who work on them. The totality of these relations of

\textsuperscript{220} Howard Selsam and Harry Martel (eds.) \textit{op. cit.},
p. 182.
production forms the economic structure of society on which is erected the third level, the superstructure or institutional level comprising the systems of government, law, religion, culture, etc., all, in essence aimed at perpetuating the prevailing system of productive relations. Social change results from the interaction of these three levels—what we may call the "internal dynamics" of history.

The development of the forces of production (especially in the area of technology) eventually reaches a stage at which it renders the prevailing human relations of production obsolete, necessitating corresponding changes in that level. These changes, in their turn, precipitate changes in the institutions of society—the superstructure. Such qualitative transitions constitute periods

of social revolution or "dialectical leaps,"\textsuperscript{222} in human history, in which, it should be noted, Marx did not consider violence inevitable.

The institutional superstructure, while manifestly subordinate to the interaction of the other two levels, plays an active, if unequal, part in the process of social change. As Engels observes, all the institutions of the superstructure "... react upon one another and also upon the economic base. ... Interaction on the basis of economic necessity ... ultimately always asserts itself."\textsuperscript{223} The state, for example, is capable of exerting


an active influence (either positive or negative) on this process by the economic policies (tariffs, fiscal policies, etc.) which it formulates. Thus, men make their own history, within the given conditions of their existence, of which, however, economic factors are ultimately decisive.224

The superstructure represents the institutionalization, the tangible manifestation of society's consciousness of ideology, relative to its economic base. Lenin's so-called Theory of Reflection is an expression of this concept: "Just as man's knowledge reflects nature, . . . so man's social knowledge reflects the economic system of society."225 While Lenin is often credited with the formulation of this theory, his main contribution would appear to be to the form, rather than the content, for the idea embodied here was discussed and developed by both Marx and Engels. Engels, in fact, used the term, "reflection," though in a very specific context, in his

224 Ibid., pp. 202-203.

characterization of legal principles as "the reflection of economic relations." Of additional interest in this statement is the presumption that, even though the functions of the institutions comprising the superstructure are consciously executed, the executants are generally not conscious of the economic basis of their activity.

Basic both to the necessity for the establishment of superstructures on the economic base and to the continuing process of social change through conflict and interaction between the material forces and the human relations in the mode of production is the concept of Class Struggle. This is the expression of the intrinsic antagonism which exists between the two predominant social groupings or classes--those who control the means of production and those who work on them--so long as their interests are not identical, which is to say, so long as they remain two separate levels of society. Although some subsidiary groupings are acknowledged, these two represent the principal classes in society.

The Marxist subdivides past human history into the following stages, based on economic relations:

1. Primitive Communal Society;
2. Slave Society;
3. Feudal Society; and

In the belief that the given designations are sufficiently self-evident for the purposes of this discussion, no detailed explanation will be given here.\(^{227}\)

The central motivation, and the basis of antagonisms in bourgeois capitalism ("the last antagonistic form of the social process of production"\(^{228}\)), emerging with no pretext of justification by divine right, hereditary superiority, or humanitarian interest, is the accumulation of profit or "surplus value."

---


This, in its simplest and crudest terms, is defined as the appropriation by the capitalist (who controls the means of production by virtue of having invested his capital in it) of the difference between what the worker is paid for his labor and what the labor is actually worth. The dynamic nature of capitalism creates a condition of pervasive instability in the lives of the workers, the proletariat. Increased production is accompanied by improvement of technology in the material forces of production and an increase in the numbers and concentration of workers. The increased use of machines, however, leads to a decrease in the value of human labor and a resulting deterioration of working and living conditions for the proletariat. Overproduction and other stresses on the system precipitate periodic economic crises which result in unemployment, lower wages, and other dislocations of the workers' lives. Meanwhile, as wealth is concentrated more and more in the hands of a progressively smaller minority, the proletariat grows, fed both by demands of increased production and by the addition of members of the lower levels of the bourgeois capitalists who are squeezed out of the
capitalist ranks into those of the proletariat. Thus, drawn together by the common cause of protecting its existence, the proletariat forms labor organizations and unions, welding itself into a potent and cohesive social force. When the point is reached that the society can no longer assure the continued existence of all the members of the exploited class, the bourgeois capitalists will inevitably be eliminated as the ruling class and replaced by the proletariat.

The resulting stage will be a transitional period for the construction of socialism, during which a governing body representing the majority class, the proletariat, will oversee the absorption of all elements of society into the collective control of capital and the means of production. This, which is theoretically the present condition of the Soviet Union, is the so-called Dictatorship of the Proletariat, which should remain in effect until all countries have resolved their national antagonisms, and international Communism has become an accomplished fact.
Paradoxical as it may seem, Marxism considers this stage to be an expression of democracy. In the Marxist view, the bourgeois version of democracy, in which there is majority balloting, free speech, civil liberties, etc., is seen merely as the machinery for making political decisions; but political institutions, as part of the economic superstructure, are dominated by economic interests, hence are actually controlled by that minority of the population which controls the economic structure. Marxist democracy, on the other hand, is based upon rule by, or in the interests of, the true majority, the major concern of which is, above all, the economic security of all its citizens (a point neglected by bourgeois democracies). In this sense, socialist democracy, even in the form of a dictatorship of the proletariat, is regarded as more democratic in substance and purpose than is the traditional bourgeois system.

Socialism at this stage is still a form of capitalism--state-controlled capitalism. Work is still performed for wages, and private ownership of consumer goods continues. Control of the means of
production, however, devolves on the state, hence is construed as being collectively controlled (that is, by the majority of the population), and the exploitative concept of surplus value disappears. Class antagonisms are eliminated by the simple (in theory) expedient of eliminating the distinction between capitalist and worker. In such a system, employment is stabilized, and planned production, by the most efficient and effective methods, rather than the most profitable, can be instituted.

The highest stage of socialism, and the ultimate goal of Marxism is the stage of Communism. In this stage, production will have reached a peak of efficiency in which all of man's material needs can be supplied in abundance with a requirement of, at most, only a few hours of human labor each day, and, in the absence of shortages, can be made generally available, rendering the use of money obsolete. The state, as an instrument for exercising force or restraint on its citizens, will cease to have a necessary function and will "wither away." The emphasis of Communism will be on "all-human" values, rather
than on class values, and man, freed from the necessity to devote most of his energies to providing subsistence, will be able to develop his human potentialities (both intellectual and physical) to their fullest extent.  

The sociological method, applied to the area of the arts, like so many other elements incorporated into the Russian Soviet interpretation of Marxism, has its roots in pre-revolutionary Russia. Its source is to be found in the literary criticism of Vissarian Grigorievich Belinski (1811-1848), whose activity marks the appearance in Russian cultural life of the so-called raznochintsy or "classless intelligentsia," 

---

229 This discussion of Marxism is heavily indebted throughout, except where other sources have been indicated, to the comprehensive and lucid presentation in John Somerville's book, The Philosophy of Marxism: An Exposition (New York: Random House, 1967), which has served as an invaluable and extremely accessible source of information on, and interpretation of, this complex subject.

230 Harkins, "Belinski, Vissarion Grigoryevich," op. cit., p. 17. In his entry on "Raznochintsy" (Ibid., p. 325) Harkins notes that the term is literally translated, "people of various classes" (including the upper classes). Having been educated, these
thereby putting an end to the aristocratic monopoly on Russian literature. Although Belinskiĭ never completed his formal education, his evaluations of the literary creations of his immediate contemporaries (notably Gogol' and Lermontov) have proved to be remarkably perceptive. He was less successful in his judgments of European writers (partly attributable, perhaps, to a lack in his linguistic skills) and of earlier Russian writers, including Pushkin. His critical criteria placed the expression of progressive social, political, and moral ideas much higher than exclusively esthetic considerations. His influence on the development of Russian criticism has been enormous; "... it has helped to infuse Russian literature with that spirit of moral questioning and ethical sensitivity which is one of its chief distinctions, ..." although, as Mirsky tells us, the accompanying disregard for esthetic and technical values proved nearly fatal to Russian literature in the  

individuals had then abandoned the professions or class status of their fathers for intellectual pursuits.  

quarter century following Belinskiĭ's death.\textsuperscript{232}

The emphasis on political and social content at the expense of esthetics is even more pronounced in the so-called "Civic Critics," Nikolai Gavrilovich Chernyshevskii (1828-1889), Nikolai Aleksandrovich Dobrolyubov (1836-1861), and Dmitri Ivanovich Pisarev (1840-1868), who were Belinskiĭ's spiritual successors. In all three cases, they used literary criticism as a vehicle for social commentary rather than esthetic evaluation.

Chernyshevskii, so Louis Fischer tells us, exerted a particularly strong influence on Lenin;\textsuperscript{233} he formulated a theory (in some respects anticipating the Theory of Reflection) which stated that art is, in effect, only a \textit{copy} (necessarily an inferior one) of reality, and that literature, having no \textit{raison d'être} other than the expression of progressive social ideas, moreover, can only reflect society, but cannot change it. Dobrolyubov shared

\begin{footnotesize}

\textsuperscript{233}Louis Fischer, \textit{The Life of Lenin} (New York: Harper & Row Publishers, [1964]), pp. 504-505. The title of a popular novel by Chernyshevskii, \textit{Chto delat'}? (What Is to Be Done?), written in 1863, in prison, was taken by Lenin as the title for a 1902 political pamphlet outlining his plans for the organization of a Marxist revolutionary party in Russia.
\end{footnotesize}
Chernyshevskii's esthetic views although his choice of subject matter displays somewhat more discriminating literary taste. His practice of isolating characteristic social traits exemplified in literary works (such as "oblomovism" after the thoroughly passive hero of Goncharov's novel, Oblomov) has had enormous influence even to the present time in the social as well as literary criticism of Russia and the Soviet Union. Pisarev's period of critical activity had barely begun at the time of Dobrolyubov's premature death at age 25. Pisarev advocated an extreme utilitarianism in his criticism, rejecting art and, in fact, any aspect of society which was not characterized by manifest social purpose.

The three civic critics have been identified with the "Nihilists" (those who believe in nothing) because of their criticism of most of the traditional institutions of society. This identification is, however, not truly justified. They did, in fact, entertain a quite strong belief in the universal validity of the natural sciences to answer the problems of life. This belief places them in the camp of materialistic positivism which originated with the French philosopher, Auguste Comte (1798-1857). Comte elevated the natural sciences literally to the status of an organized religion and sought to combine all the sciences into a uniform system to which a single set of methods might be applied. His solution was to classify
sciences in a sort of cumulative progression from simplicity to complexity, the criterion being the degree of dependence of the separate categories on one another. Having established mathematics as the foundation underlying all natural science, Comte then placed above it, in increasing order of complexity, astronomy, physics, chemistry, physiology (or biology), and sociology (or "social physics"). Each category is dependent on all of those which precede it. Implicit in this system is a second progression from generality to specificity, paralleling that from simplicity to complexity and acknowledged by Comte in the statement that "... the simplest phenomena ... are necessarily also the most general ... .”

While the philosophies of Comte and Marx betray a number of similarities in concept and terminology (Comte's

---

234 Comte is credited with the invention of the term "sociology," denoting a science of social relationships; however, to reinforce the uniformity of his classifications, he represented all the particular scientific categories above the mathematical base as progressive subdivisions of the concept, physics (e.g., "inorganic and organic physics," "celestial and terrestrial physics," etc.), designating the highest category "social physics." Cf., Auguste Comte, Introduction to Positive Philosophy, [trans, Paul Descours and H. Gordon Jones], ed. and rev. Frederick Ferré (Indianapolis: The Bobbs-Merrill Company, Inc., [1970]), p. 13 (n. 9), 52-67.

235 Ibid., p. 52.
emphasis on "reasoning and observation"\textsuperscript{236} in arriving at his conclusions, the evolutionary character of his basic concepts, his emphasis on scientific method, and his rejection of the validity of theological and metaphysical explanations and also of investigation of original and final causes), in the final analysis, Comte's system is unacceptable to the Marxist, and is viewed as an "idealistic approach,"\textsuperscript{237} the essence of which can find no better expression than Comte's own words, "... the world is governed and overturned by ideas..."\textsuperscript{238} Underlying every aspect of Comte's thinking is the concept of mental or intellectual development as the key to social and scientific evolution.

In the Marxist view, as we have seen, social institutions are not the conscious creations of human thought, but rise independently of man's conscious intent, as reflections of the economic base of society, to which man then adapts his consciousness, his ideas, unconsciously. As Lenin sums up the essence of Marxist sociology, the

\textsuperscript{236}\textit{Ibid.}, p. 2.

\textsuperscript{237}\textit{Somerville, op. cit.}, p. 118.

\textsuperscript{238}\textit{Comte, op. cit.}, p. 28.
recognition of the material, rather than the "ideological," basis of all things leads to acknowledgement of the "relations of production" as the objective basis of society; this provides sociology with a recurrent scientific standard, making it possible to study social evolution as a "process of natural history." In light of this statement, it is easy to see why Asaf'ev should have felt himself to be on firm ideological ground in his own frequent references to the relations of production.

---

239V. I. Lenin, "What the 'Friends of the People' Are," quoted in Selsam and Martel (eds.), op. cit., p. 197 (written in 1894).
3. **Content of MUSICAL FORM AS A PROCESS**

In fact, much of Asaf'ev's "Marxist" orientation can be traced directly back to Hegel. For their parts, neither Marx nor Engels, nor, for that matter, Lenin discussed music specifically, or even the arts in any detail. Hegel, by contrast, left a fairly complete exposition of his esthetic views in his *Lectures on Esthetics*, with which Asaf'ev was thoroughly familiar.\(^{240}\)

Hegel considered music to be one of the highest forms of art (surpassed only by poetry) in its ability to portray feelings and emotions, being capable, not only of a greater range of subtlety and variety of expression than the passive, visual arts (architecture, sculpture, and painting), but also of depicting, through its dynamic nature, not just a single frozen moment of an emotional experience, but the entire experience in its course of development from beginning to conclusion. Thus, the unity of music, as an art form perceived in time rather than space, is in the process or evolutionary quality of its occurrence, which stimulates the dialectical nature immanent in the human consciousness. Hegel considered elements of music such as stress and accent, rhythmic variation, and the interaction of dissonance and consonance as abstract but perceptible reflections of human

experience, as a background to which the underlying rhythmic pulse sustained the consciousness of unity in diversity. Hegel regarded music as an exclusively human phenomenon, the only thing in nature which is inherently musical being the human voice. Thus, the human tone emerges as the clearest expression of man's inner being.

Obviously many of Asaf'ev's concepts, notably his emphasis (as revealed in his chosen title) on process, on the passage of music in time, his discussion of impetus, progression, and conclusion in a musical composition, and of the dialectical nature of music, reflect Hegel's influence. Hegel's concept of human tone bears striking resemblances to Asaf'ev's concept of human intonation; it is reflected almost literally in Asaf'ev's discussion in Intonation [609-12] of the importance of the human voice and the possession of "tone" in human communication. It also underlies his emphasis on the vocal quality of music.

One respect in which Hegel differs from Asaf'ev, however, is his rejection of imagery as a quality of musical expression. In fact, Hegel regarded the absence of objective representation of external objects in music as a positive
factor. Asaf'ev, as we shall see, maintained somewhat different views on the subject of imagery.

The two books of *Musical Form as a Process* represent different (though interrelated) approaches to the concept of process in music and to its social manifestation. Book I is an attempt by Asaf'ev to explain the dynamic character of musical formation. Considerable emphasis is placed on the dialectic of formation, the coexistence and interpenetration of opposites (as, for example, when a progression customarily recognized as a cadence is employed as a stimulus to continued motion rather than as a conclusion), a concept which may be recognized as reflecting the Marxist "negation of negation." Asaf'ev's principle task in this volume is that of answering the question, "how?", and is addressed, in large part, to the technical means for initiating, continuing (and prolonging), and concluding the course of musical motion. He does, however, come also to considerations of content in music, embodying this in his concept of intonation, which is defined in some detail at

---

the end of the volume.

Book II, subtitled Intonation is devoted to further development of this concept. Here the central question to be answered is "why?" This volume is an attempt to explain the social and historical causes of the evolutionary process of musical formation. Its ideological essence is, at once, more subtle, more restrained, and more profound.

Structurally, the two volumes are quite similar. Each consists of twelve chapters in its main body, preceded by an introductory chapter (in Volume II, emphasizing its role as a further development of the first volume, this section is designated "In Lieu of an Introduction"), and followed by two supplementary chapters. In Volume I these concluding sections are called simply "Supplement 1" and "Supplement 2," while in Volume II they are designated "Conclusion" and "Epilogue." In each case, the first of these supplementary chapters ("Supplement 1" and "Conclusion," respectively) provides a summation of the preceding content of the volume. The final parts, however ("Supplement 2" in Volume I and the "Epilogue" in Intonation), are disconcerting and unsatisfactory in an organizational sense. "Supplement 2" might be regarded as a developed glossary of key terms in the book. In addition to an explanation of the concept of intonation (indicated by the chapter heading, "Bases of Intonation"), Asaf'ev also defines terms and concepts such as "dynamic
properties of music," "focal point," "tension and gravitation," and melos, all of which he has used quite freely throughout the book. There is also a discussion within this supplement of Asaf'ev's philosophy of terminology. The section beginning with the words "in conclusion . . ." (which turns out to be a conclusion of the content of the Supplement, rather than the volume as a whole) is concerned with Asaf'ev's view of "imagery," or "figurative content" in music. In his view, each historical epoch evolves certain "symbolic" sound complexes which arise almost invariably in connection with poetic images, concrete visual or muscular sensations, and emotional expressions in opera, song, and even symphonic music. In this historical and social context, very strong associations are found which assume a stature "not inferior" to verbal associations.

[562] In effect, this argument is an attempt to extend the Hegilian view, which sees music as limited to the expression of an abstract universal, the expression of a concrete universal being reserved to poetry. Asaf'ev characterizes his own concept of imagery as " . . . the

---

242 An artistic image, in general, is conceived as the reflection of the artist's comprehension of concrete reality, not merely as a naturalistic imitation of that reality.

243 Kaminsky, op. cit., p. 122.
process of concretization of musical images and the
transformation of music into living figurative speech, full
of significance." [563] In this sense, he finds the term
"musical symbolism" unacceptable, however, since it carri
an implication of mysticism which is inconsistent with what
he sees as an eminently practical concept. Thus, he adopts
the term "musical semantics," borrowed from the more
realistically oriented field of linguistics. [563-64].

The "Epilogue" of Intonation, like "Supplement 2,"
contains consideration of terminology, including the intro-
duction of new terms. Its main function, however, is as a
continuation and finalization of the summation begun in the
previous part. The two chapters together constitute a
closely interconnected whole which serves as a conclusion to
the entire study, and, as we are informed in the commentary
accompanying the publication of Intonation in Izbrannye
trudy,244 the two chapters were originally unified in the
manuscript under the single heading "Conclusion and
Epilogue, . . ." followed by a detailed subheading, out-
lining the intent of the combined section. The two sections
were unaccountably separated in the initial publication and
the explanatory subheading omitted. The resultant effect,
particularly in light of the chapter designations, is not

satisfactory.

Book I does reflect a conscious attempt at rational and preconceived organization in its structure. The main body of the work is divided into three subsections. Part One: "How Musical Formation Occurs" comprises three chapters (1-3) dealing with the underlying principles of musical organization, advancing as a major principle the alternation or interaction of identity and contrast. Part Two: "Stimuli and Factors of Musical Formation," (Chapters 4-6) takes up the question of specific devices and techniques which can be employed in initiating, continuing, and concluding musical motion. In this context, he derives a formula I (initium): M (movere): T (terminus), or impetus: motion: conclusion:, which can be applied to musical structure as a whole and to each of its parts. [310]

The formula is derived from the medieval formula of psalmody, initium: tenor: punctum,\textsuperscript{245} which is introduced earlier.[267] Part Three: "Principles of Identity and Contrast; Their Exposure in Crystallized Forms" comprises the remaining six chapters (7-12) of the body of the work and categorizes forms in terms of the organizational

\textsuperscript{245}The term metrum, designating a temporary pause, comparable to a half cadence in Classical terminology, is also included in this formula.
predominance of either identity (Chapter 7) or contrast (Chapters 8 and 10). In the latter case, he sees the sonata allegro form as the highest manifestation of the predominance of the principle of contrast. Chapter 9 [396-424] is devoted to a consideration of dialectics in musical formation, in which he discusses the concept of the interaction of consecutiveness and simultaneity. In microcosm, this concept is embodied in the coexistence of the linear (horizontal) and harmonic (vertical) aspects of music; however, Asaf'ev's discussion carries it much further, to the dual concept of musical form, both as a process of formation (consecutiveness) and as a crystallized scheme (simultaneity), both of which are valid and essential concepts. Chapters 11 and 12 both deal with cyclic forms as expressions of the predominance of contrast. The chapter heading for Chapter 11, however, is misleading in that it fails to indicate that the cycles under consideration are almost exclusively pre-Classical. Chapter 12, as the heading indicates, takes up the question of suites and the symphony. The rather long, sometimes involved chapter headings in this volume, are generally, with the few exceptions noted, fairly clear indicators of their content.

246 This particular concept of Asaf'ev's has received an especially positive response from his chroniclers. More will be said about this. (Cf., pp.163-65, infra.)
It must be said, however, that the organization of this work is not totally satisfactory. One feels, for example, that the final supplementary chapter might better have been located much earlier in the presentation. The introduction, with its concise statements or preindications of most of the main ideas underlying, not just the first volume, but the development of the entire, two-volume work, in combination with the summarization of ideas in Supplement 1 and the terminological discussion of Supplement 2, cannot help but raise a fleeting question in the reader's mind whether the main body of the work is not largely superfluous.

Intonation, on the other hand, displays fewer outward pretensions to systematic organization, but rather projects almost an atmosphere of "stream-of-consciousness."

Descriptive chapter heading are omitted, apart from those appended to the chapters tersely designated as "Conclusion" and "Epilogue" and that of the section entitled "In Lieu of An Introduction." The latter is, in fact, very appropriately designated, for its main function is less introductory than transitional, serving to define the goals and procedures of the volume in hand, and also to recall the main ideas of the previous volume. The real introduction to the second volume is contained in the first chapter, in which, as Asaf'ev described it, we encounter "separate, almost aphoristic statements of opinions" [606] scattered
with seemingly reckless abandon, which are separately developed in the subsequent chapters. There is perhaps no better illustration of the musical orientation of Asaf'ev's literary style than this literary evocation of exposition and development, an analogy which appears to have been deliberately cultivated.

The impression of spontaneity which the organization of Intonation conveys is understandable, in view of the circumstances under which it was written. It will be recalled that the work was accomplished under the siege and active bombardment of the city of Leningrad, under a constant threat of imminent death to the author, and was apparently regarded by Asaf'ev as a kind of scholarly last will and testament. Thus, his aim was presumably to commit as much of his thinking to paper as quickly as possible in order that his ideas might be preserved even if their author perished.

Unquestionably, the most pervasive factor in the musicological writings of Asaf'ev is his preoccupation with the concept of intonatsiya (intonation). In spite of a

\[247\text{Cf., p. 102. above. The concept of "thought arches" is applicable here.}\]

\[248\text{Cf., Asaf'ev, "Moya tvorcheskaya rabota v Leningrade. . . .," Izbrannye trudy, Volume V, pp. 145-46.}\]
great deal of controversial and involved discussion over a workable definition on the part of other scholars, the concept has entered firmly into Soviet musicological thinking and also, if Jiranek's work may be taken as an indication, into that of other countries of the so-called "Eastern bloc."

It should be understood at once that Asaf'ev's concept of intonation has little to do with traditional Western European interpretations of that term. Asaf'ev acknowledged the existence of such definitions of intonation as "accuracy or inaccuracy of pitch relations," or "an introductory melodic pattern in certain chants," as well as "the manner of performance of chants and incantations" (which are included in most Soviet musical dictionaries as secondary definitions), but he considered them to be only peripheral concepts. Concerning the first of these, for example, he felt that accuracy of pitch in "musical speech" is necessary for its understanding (thus, necessary for intonation), in the same way that accuracy of pronunciation is necessary to the comprehension of verbal speech. [605, n.2] Asaf'ev's broad concept, however, is associated with the linguistic concept of intonation as "meaningful expression in sound," a concept with particular relevance to the Russian language in which voice inflections (intonation) play a larger part in understandable speech than in a language such as English (though even the meaning of English can be greatly enhanced
by expressive speech). Stanislavskiǐ, in his training of actors, placed great stress on the importance of intonation to dramatic expression and recommended careful study of the art of singing as an approach to this skill. 249

Asaf'ev conceived of musical intonation as the organization of acoustical media, by the human consciousness, into meaningfully expressive sound correlations. It is suggested that this definition covers all of Asaf'ev's uses of the term. Breaking the definition down into its component parts, it is, first of all, concerned specifically with music; it incorporates the essential elements of conscious human organization and meaningful human communication; it stresses the factor of mutual relationships; and above all, it has to do directly with sound. All of the separate features of the concept must be regarded as interdependent.

Such a concept is applicable, not only to the creative (compositional) aspect of music, but equally to its performance and to its perception by the listener. The definition is, at the same time, capable of embracing both the broad concept of human expression and communication on a large scale and the very narrow concept of a simple sound

relationship, as when Asaf'ev refers in the first paragraph of *Musical Form as a Process* to "... intonations which are assimilated by the environment through the most productive possible forms of music-making." [184] The concept of "motive" enters into the narrower interpretation of intonation, but must be considered as only one manifestation of it. A motive is normally described as a characteristic pattern peculiar to a specific musical composition, even though it may be borrowed for use in other compositions. An intonation, however, in Asaf'ev's narrow concept, is a particular musical relationship which has a much more universal application; thus, it may be characteristic of an entire group of compositions or of composers, the musical composition of an entire country, or even that of an entire historical epoch. Such an intonation may be no more than a particular interval which is widely used, in various settings, by composers of a particular milieu. Asaf'ev's discussion of the role of the sixth musical composition of the nineteenth century is illuminating in this respect. [616, 907-11, et passim].

250 Much of Asaf'ev's system of "Intonational analysis," which will be touched on, seemingly takes the form of motivic analysis, similar to that applied by Ernest Newman to Wagner's operas (cf., Asaf'ev's analysis of Tchaikovsky's *Eugene Onegin* [cited, p. 79, n. 141, supra]).
The interval, in fact, is the basic unit in Asaf'ev's concept of intonation, by virtue of its quality of relationship. Asaf'ev equates a single tone with the sound of a vowel or consonant, which has no meaning except in combination with other sounds (a few exceptions, such as "I" or "a" may be noted). In the same way, an isolated musical tone is meaningless until its relationship to some other tone is established. Thus, Asaf'ev calls the interval "... one of the primary expressive unities--a summarized intonation,"[618] and again "... one of the primary forms [emphasis added] of music."[619].

This emphasis on the interval can serve to lead us to a further delimitation of the concept of intonation as distinguished from music, per se. In fact, the distinction is largely semantic, in that the term "music" in current usage may be interpreted as referring to purely acoustical phenomena, rather than necessarily incorporating a connotation of expressiveness. We may speak, for example, of an isolated musical tone, by which we mean only that it is produced by a given frequency of vibrations and is perceived at a precise pitch level, but, as we have just seen, it would be inaccurate, in the same context, to speak of an intonational tone.

The confusion concerning the definition of intonation,
noted above, is rather puzzling, and seems to be attributable more to Asaf'ev's own definitions, given in a variety of his works, than to his actual usage and application of the term. In the latter respect he seems remarkably consistent, at least in the two volumes of *Musical Form as a Process*, and those works which followed it. The turning point in his own ability to define the concept adequately apparently came in the writing of Supplement 2: "Bases of Musical Intonation" in Volume I of *Musical Form as a Process*. It is here that we find the statement that "... intonation is ... the interpretation of sound." [543] This particular citation provides an unusually clear opportunity for us to observe the evolution of Asaf'ev's thought in a relatively short period of time, for in 1925 he wrote an unpublished article, "Obosnovanie russkoï muzykal'noi intonatsii [Basis of Russian Musical Intonation]", which is cited as the prototype for the chapter under discussion.251 In this 1925 article we find an almost identical statement, in which, however, the Russian work proyavlenie ("exposure" or "manifestation") appears instead of osmyslenie ("interpretation").252 Moreover, even in the first

251Cf., Orlova, B. V. Asaf'ev . . . , p. 178, n. 4.

252Quoted, Ibid., p. 44.
supplement of the book on form, we find a definition of intonation as "... organized sound conjugation, exposed [emphasis added] in the process of sounding." [510] Here, again, the difficulty seems to be semantic. The word "interpretation" has a definite connotation of human communication, hence, of purposefulness. The use of the term "exposure" or "manifestation," however, dilutes those qualities, in effect reducing the concept to a reporting of acoustic phenomena. The listener, in particular, is seemingly excluded from such a phrasing of the concept, and, in fact, the emphasis would appear to rest on the performer, at the expense, even, of the composer. It is quite clear that, especially in the latter interpretation, Asaf'ev had no such intent; it seems equally apparent that his actual comprehension of the concept of intonation was much greater than his ability, at that time, to frame a comprehensive definition of it.

Having noted, earlier in this discussion, the associations with speech intonation by which the concept of musical intonation is characterized, it is appropriate at this point to distinguish between the two concepts. Speech or verbal intonation, especially when emotionally charged, occurs as a kind of continuous, spontaneous glissando, not characterized (except perhaps accidentally) by precise pitch relationships. Musical intonation, especially in the
melodic area, though it may be emotionally and semantically colored, is always controlled by the intellect, and may be regarded as an "intellectualized reflection" of the continuity of emotional speech. The establishment of precise pitch relationships serves as an approximation of the spontaneous "glissando" of verbal intonation, with tones and intervals representing points or "knots" on the curve of this glissando.

In light of the analogy just given, it is no surprise that "horizontal" elements are treated as the most organic and clearly expressive elements of music. Melodiousness is regarded as the chief quality, both of verbal speech, and of vocal continuity in music. In dealing with the "horizontal" in music, however, Asaf'ev prefers to use the term melos, as a concept embodying the "quality and functions of melodic formation." Melody, per se, is only one aspect of the concept. Rational voice-leading and harmonic progression are also aspects of the concept of melos. Thus, melos may be said to encompass the linear in music. A related term, "melodics" (melodika) usually denotes the

---

253 This passage clearly betrays the influence of Lenin's Theory of Reflection.

254 Asaf'ev employs the Russian terms napevnost' or pesennost' (cf., p.94, n. 175. above) for this concept.
application of this principle in the works of a given composer (thus: Tchaikovsky's melodics, Glinka's melodics, etc.). It must be emphasized that the concept of intonation, in spite of Asaf'ev's stress on a number of aspects of linearity and melodiousness, is by no means limited to considerations of melos, but encompasses all other aspects of music--harmony, rhythm, timbre, form, and style.

A very important outgrowth of Asaf'ev's basic theory of intonation is his concept of the "intonational vocabulary" of an epoch, which, like the concept of intonation itself, is developed throughout the course of both volumes of this

255 In a passing thought, not further developed, Asaf'ev suggests that rhythm, as a factor of musical formation (thus, necessarily linked with sound) may be seen as a sociological, rather than a biological, concept. Citing the theory that much music has its roots in the use of rhythmic intoning for the purpose of coordinating collective efforts, he observes that "... the single fact of setting muscular effort to rhythm evokes neither musical tone nor correlations of pitch,... but the necessity to unify muscular efforts calls forth the need for a sound, a shout, a call, in a word, for the audibility of gesture." [511]

256 Asaf'ev expresses some particularly penetrating thoughts on timbre as an intonational phenomenon, including special attention to the achievements of Stravinsky and Schoenberg in this area, and to the future role of electronic music, as he saw it. [673-74, 790, 868-875]

257 In addition to considerations of style which crop up at several points in Intonation, Asaf'ev expressed his intention (never realized) to write a third book on form exploring its interaction with style. The passage stating this interest appeared in the concluding paragraph of the manuscript, and was omitted from the final publication. Cited in Izbrannye trudy, Volume V, p. 289, n. 84.
work, appearing under several different designations. This intonational vocabulary is conceived as an accumulation of musical ideas, often no more than fragments, which is crystallized in the collective consciousness of people within a given epoch and environment, and which represents the totality of all previous musical experience of that epoch. As indicated, by the designation "oral," appended to it, and especially in light of Asaf'ev's emphasis on melos, the intonational vocabulary is made up primarily of melodic formations. In essence, this reserve serves as a standard of comparison, against which new intonations are measured and ultimately either rejected or accepted and assimilated, in the process which Asaf'ev designates as social selection. The dialectical nature of this concept may be seen in the fact that, while at a given moment of comparison the intonational vocabulary functions as a standard of stability, it is also in a continuous process of change as new intonations are gradually assimilated. In

258 The concept is variously designated as an "intonational reserve [zapас]," a "basic fund [фонд, which may also be translated 'reserve'] of intonations, "memoranda" or "memorable" moments of music," a "dictionary [словарь, which is also translated 'vocabulary']" of the "words of music," and the "oral vocabulary of intonations." It is not until we reach the "Epilogue" of Intonation that we find the designation, "oral, musical, intonational [emphasis added] vocabulary." [935]
general, moreover, this vocabulary is regarded as objective and universal for its milieu, though some degree of quantitative variation in its possession by individuals is acknowledged. A composer, for his creation to become viable, must be receptive to the mood of his epoch and environment (in which national characteristics are presupposed), and aware of its previous intonational experience. A too subjective approach to composing runs the risk of isolation from the listeners, and, thus, eventual oblivion. Asaf'ev has been criticized for insufficient attention to the reciprocal effect between the composer and his intonational environment. In other words, he fails to acknowledge fully that the composer's creation is not only shaped by the intonational vocabulary of his epoch, but, in its turn, also helps to shape that vocabulary.

An even more controversial point is Asaf'ev's explanation of seeming aberrations in the orderly course of musical evolution, which he characterizes as "intonational crises." These crises are seen as radical reevaluations of intonational values, which occur as a consequence of great social upheavals. In such a crisis there is a marked

259 Shakhnazarova, op. cit., pp. 72-73. This point is apparently in Orlova's mind also in her observation that Asaf'ev was not able "... to apply Lenin's theory of reflection in a completely organic and comprehensive manner" ("Issledovanie Asaf'eva...", p. 12).
tendency to discard everything regarded as superfluous in music in the name of truth of expression. The controversy appears to be centered on some misunderstanding of Asaf'ev's theory, stemming from his identification of this concept with a linguistic theory, formulated by N. Marr, which dealt with "explosive" changes and "outbursts" in language, precipitated by social revolution. Marr's theories were discredited, largely on ideological grounds, as denying purposefulness to the process of linguistic change, and Asaf'ev, guilty by association, came under the same criticism. Apart from some employment of Marr's terminology, however, it is clear from Asaf'ev's writing that he considered these crises reevaluations of the existing vocabulary--a kind of "streamlining" process--rather than a radical rejection and elimination of past experience and introduction of entirely new, unprepared and unjustified elements.

As an apparent result of his profound interest in Beethoven's music (which is clearly seen throughout the work), combined with his research into French Revolutionary music, in the preparation of his ballet, Plamya Parizha, Asaf'ev arrives at a characterization of Beethoven's music as the product of such an intonational crisis engendered by the French Revolution. This is a recurring theme in Intonation.

Nikolai Yakovlevich Marr (1864-1934), a linguist and archaeologist. He was especially noted for the study of Caucasian languages.
Shakhnazarova, in acknowledging this, suggests the use of the terms "intonational renovation" or "reintoning" (which is to say "reinterpretation") rather than "outbursts." Asaf'ev's difficulties in coming to terms with this concept are evident in his awkward references in Volume I to the influence of the relations of production on intonational evolution.

The most practical application of the theories contained in this work, and the goal toward which it was clearly and consciously directed, is the system of "intonational analysis," the implementation of which is recorded in other works by Asaf'ev. The designation, intonational, is clearly to be viewed as indicating an analysis of the communicative and expressive properties of the composition under study. As such--and this is repeatedly emphasized by Asaf'ev--it must proceed from what is heard; in other words, it must be analyzed first of all as a process occurring in time. At the same time, it must be perceived as an immediate manifestation of a larger category which represents the product of generations of previous experience.

---

262 Shakhnazarova, op. cit., p. 70.

263 Notably those written in the 1940's, which analyze compositions of Tchaikovsky, Glinka, Grieg, and others.
and social selection. For example, a given composition in sonata allegro form must be examined in terms of its own peculiarities, as a dynamic entity in the process of unfolding or developing, and also as one manifestation of a larger, crystallized relatively static concept--the "scheme" of the sonata allegro. The latter concept, then, represents the historical-materialistic base of the concept embodied in the specific process of the individual composition. This is the essence of Asaf'ev's much heralded, dual concept of form as a process and, simultaneously, as a crystallized scheme. As a method of analyzing form, viewed in this dual perspective, "intonational analysis" may be defined as the theoretical analysis of the form of a specific composition as a relatively complete entity, perceived in terms of the concrete content and interpretation of its historical setting. Jiranek sees this method as necessarily a collective one, in which the work of the analyst depends on scientific investigation of the intonational conditions of the historical period in question, a task which is "... not within the power of the individual researcher. ..." Such a complex and "... exacting

\[264\] The essence of this definition is contained in Jiranek, op. cit., p. 298.

\[265\] Ibid.
task of scientific synthesis . . . [requires] a correspondingly complex organization of scientific work." 266

266 Ibid.
4. Philosophical Contemporaries: Kurth and Yavorskii

We can do little more than mention two of Asaf'ev's contemporaries, whose philosophical theories bear similarities to his, and who appear to have had some influence on the formulation of his analytical system. They are the Viennese-born, Swiss scholar, Ernst Kurth (1886-1946) and Asaf'ev's compatriot, B. L. Yavorskii (1877-1942), both of whom represent departures from the basically static and schematic approach to formal analysis in the late nineteenth century. Both of these scholars, like Asaf'ev, were drawn by the Hegelian view of music as a dynamic process, rather than a scheme, and each established his own unique theoretical system. Kurth's influence is regarded by Soviet commentators in a particularly negative light, since his theory represents, in effect, the synthesis of two patently idealistic philosophies: the concept of Will as the essence of man, expounded by Arthur Schopenhauer\(^{267}\) (1788-1860), and the "energetic-monistic"

---

\(^{267}\)Schopenhauer saw art as an idealization of reality lifting us above the strife of wills which is the essence of life. Music, in his view, particularly possessed this ability, and was not (like the other arts) only a copy of Ideas, but rather a copy of the Will itself (cited in Durant; op. cit., p. 337).
philosophy of Wilhelm Ostwald (1853-1932). Although the two theories are directed from opposite sides of the question—one from within (Will) and the other from without (Energy)—they both, in effect, reject the objective existence of matter, and therefore must be classified as idealistic philosophies. Mazel', in fact, sees Kurth's orientation as so exclusively idealistic that it cannot be called contradictory.

Kurth approached the dynamic quality of music as a psychological, rather than an acoustical phenomenon, seeing it as the expression of psychic energy, directed by the Will. Within the concept of psychic energy, he distinguished kinetic energy (conceived as the discharge of energy in melodic progression) and potential energy (a vital force operating within a tone or chord). The principle manifestation of musical motion, therefore, is

---

268 Ostwald, a Nobel Price-winning chemist, resigned a teaching position in Leipzig in 1906 to pursue the study of philosophy. A member of the quasi-theological International Monist League, he substituted the concept of energy for that of matter as the fundamental element of reality. Thus, the properties of matter were seen in terms of a pluralistic perception of the different properties embodied in the single entity, energy. Ostwald characterized mental activity, both conscious and unconscious, as psychic energy, a distinct level of energy.

269 Mazel', op. cit., p. 74.
Kurth is credited with first recognizing the now almost universally acknowledged "linear polyphonic" character of Bach's music. In his book, Grundlagen des linearen Kontrapunkts. In this book, Kurth's emphasis is on kinetic energy, which can be roughly equated with Asaf'ev's concept of melos. Kurth does not, however, regard polyphonic texture as a negation of harmony, but rather as a "complementary counterprinciple."

In his later book on Romantic harmony as exemplified in Wagner's Tristan und Isolde, Kurth devoted more attention to the concept of potential energy, employing, as a point of departure, a fifty-page examination of the play of forces within the famous "Tristan chord." From this study he arrived at a new (for its time) interpretation of the concept of dissonance as a correlation of

---


272 Cf., p. 49, n. 92, supra.

273 Von Fischer, op. cit., p. 246.

274 Ernst Kurth, Romantic Harmonik und ihre Krise in Wagners "Tristan" (Berne: P. Haupt, 1920).
tension and release.²⁷⁵

Asaf'ev was initially impressed with Kurth's ideas, and the latter's influence is particularly noticeable in the first volume of Asaf'ev's work, though most strongly in the area of terminology, as in Asaf'ev's frequent references to "energy," "energetics," and the concept of tension and release.²⁷⁶ Kurth is also mentioned by name several times in that volume. The influence does not appear to have been very profound, however, most of the similar ideas of the two scholars having been arrived at independently. Mazel' suggests that Asaf'ev was originally attracted to Kurth because he saw in his dynamic concepts an ally against the static concepts of form which prevailed at that time, but that his interest in Kurth faded as dynamic concepts gained in influence and the "static-dogmatic trend" faded.²⁷⁷ Indeed, there are rather profound differences in the outlook of the two men.


²⁷⁶Asaf'ev does not employ the concepts of "potential" and "kinetic" energy in Kurth's sense, applying the concepts rather to the written composition and to the performance of that composition, respectively. [248]

²⁷⁷Mazel', _op. cit._, p. 78.
Kurth was almost exclusively committed to the concept of form as a process, rejecting entirely the schematic concept. Jiranek cites his "... idealistic absolutization of melodic motion and its continuity[which] prevented Kurth from seeing the importance of conclusion and discontinuation." Asaf'ev, too, is criticized for a disproportionate emphasis on the dynamic aspect of his formulation, at the expense of the crystallized concept, but he does also recognize, in his dual interpretation (discussed above), the element of stability implicit in the purely constructive aspect of form.

The point on which Asaf'ev eventually found fault with Kurth was in the latter's complete disregard of any concept of intonation and of the social existence of music. In effect, Kurth gives virtually no consideration to the aspect of music as a medium of communication, that is, to the interaction between creation and perception. His concept of music as an expression of Will is, thus, oriented toward the individual psychology and makes no provision for its social role.

The Soviet reaction to Yavorskiǐ's influence on
Asaf'ev is much more positive than that of Kurth, for the quite logical reason that Yavorskiĭ is, in effect, "one of their own," and, as noted above, many of his theoretical precepts are at the basis of present-day, Soviet pedagogical practice. It is also quite apparent that his influence on Asaf'ev was more profound and more direct than Kurth's, and many of his ideas may be regarded as the legitimate, direct predecessors of Asaf'ev's thoughts.

Yavorskiĭ's theory, which is variously designated as the "theory of modal rhythm" (its most widely known designation), the "theory of auditory gravitation", and others, is an interesting attempt to classify modes in terms of their dynamic properties. Time and space do not permit any extended description of what is a complicated and ingenious, if perhaps also a somewhat arbitrary

---

281 One such precept is the view that mastery of general principles of form may serve, not only as a guide to past practices, but also as a basis for expansion and derivation of new forms (ergo, theory leads creation), which is the basis for the widespread practice, in the Soviet Union, of teaching principles of form before approaching actual analysis.

282 The obvious emphasis on hearing implicit in this designation suggests an influence on Asaf'ev's conviction that analysis must be based on direct hearing.
and overorganized system, but its essence is contained in the tritone and its resolution, as a microcosmic representation of the progression from instability to stability, which Yavorskii regards as the essential principle of all music (as a reflection of life). The rhythmic expression of this concept (cf., "theory of modal rhythm") is contained in the succession of pred'ikt and ikt, which, in its simplest rhythmic form comprises the rhythmic unit of up-beat and down-beat.

There is a remarkable degree of similarity between the concepts and terminology of Yavorskii and Asaf'ev, to the extent that in many instances Asaf'ev's concepts appear to be little more than developments, expansions, or reinterpretations of Yavorskii's. For example, Yavorskii, differentiated between form (a unique individualized entity) and scheme (a generalized, typified structure). He spoke of music as "expressive speech," the "accumulation of energy . . . [building] a feeling of tense expectancy," and the conditioning influence of

---

283 A quite literal translation of these two terms might be (in reverse order) ictus and pre-ictus.


285 Cited Ibid., p. 179.

286 Cited Ibid., p. 193.
the epoch on language and musical intoning. The links between these thoughts of Yavorskii's and similar ones of Asaf'ev's are obvious. Like Asaf'ev, Yavorskii also placed great stress on the music of Beethoven as the basis for his theory of form and even applied the adjective "dramatic" to some musical forms.

There can be little question that Asaf'ev's concept of intonation evolved from that of Yavorskii. In the latter's definition, intonation comprises the "... 'words' which constitute musical speech--the smallest parts in time (formed by one voice)." Thus, intonation is "... the primary cell of form and expressiveness in music." It should be noted that Yavorskii's definition is a monophonic concept. Nevertheless, it is easy to see why Asaf'ev felt free to employ the term (in this limited interpretation) from the first page of his

287 Quoted in L. V. Kulakovskiĭ, "Yavorskii chitaet rukopis' [Yavorskii Reads a Manuscript]," Yavorskii: Vospominaniya, p. 218.

288 Tsukkerman, op. cit., p. 205.

289 Ibid., p. 198.

290 Ibid., p. 192.

291 Ibid.
book on form, [184] without further explanation.\textsuperscript{292}

Finally, Tsukkerman refers to "... the concept of the 'connecting principle,' i.e., connections at a distance (Asaf'ev's 'arched connections' [or 'intonational arches']), and, in particular, 'connecting intonations,' i.e., the subsequent resolution of 'abandoned instabilities.'\textsuperscript{293}

There are, however, some significant differences between the theories of Yavorskii and Asaf'ev. Yavorskii devoted very little attention to the problem of "imagery" and "figurative content" in music, a fact which may be largely attributable to another, even more significant difference. He rejected the linear principle in music, regarding it as an "eye" approach to music.\textsuperscript{294} In his harmonic thinking, he assigned qualities of Tonic, Dominant, and Subdominant to the various harmonic structures characteristic of his modes. A curious sidelight of this concept is his attribution to the sixth scale degree of

\textsuperscript{292}The term \textit{oborot} was employed by Yavorskii, in polyphony, to designate a concept analogous to intonation. Asaf'ev defined that term, in a more generalized, less purposeful way, as "musical turn" or "fragment."

\textsuperscript{293}Ibid.

\textsuperscript{294}Cited Ibid., p. 204. Yavorskii characterized a melodic line as "a collection of note heads."
the function of "leading tone" of the subdominant, resolving, not to the first degree, but to the fifth degree of the mode. One may see a possible link between this concept and Asaf'ev's disconcerting references to the supertonic as an "upper leading tone." [239]
5. **Assessment and Conclusion**

In assessing this contribution of Asaf'ev's and his life as a whole, the one quality which emerges most clearly is his position as an organizer and educator, in the sense that he possessed, in a high degree, the ability to inspire and direct significant work in a variety of areas. As we have noted, he was especially accomplished in the identification of those tasks which needed to be addressed, and in the formulation of a methodology for accomplishing them. This trait is noticeable both in his creative (compositional) activity and in his scholarly work. The work under study here—the two volumes of *Musical Form as a Process*—is an excellent case in point. The book, for all its technical deficiencies (those which have been noted and more), is impressive in its display of wide-ranging erudition, incisive analysis, and logical reasoning. It is thought-provoking and innovative in many respects, and, as we have seen, couched in vivid language, much of which is quite valid and effective. Yet, in the final analysis, Asaf'ev, in this book, does not draw definitive conclusions. The work is admittedly incomplete (as witness Asaf'ev's expressed intention to write a third "section") and
It represents only "... the most systematically formulated part ..." of Asaf'ev's theoretical work, which requires supplementation by his studies of specific composers and compositions. It stands as a kind of reference book, guidebook, or road marker, pointing the way for Asaf'ev's musicological heirs, to tasks remaining to be done.

Perhaps Asaf'ev's most tangible contribution through the medium of this book is in the area of terminology. The work is a veritable gold mine of terms and concepts which have been firmly assimilated into the Soviet musicological vocabulary. We have already mentioned the concept of intonation in this regard, and its apparent spread even beyond the borders of the Soviet Union proper. Another term which is directly attributed to Asaf'ev's innovative usage is "symphonism," denoting a quality of dramatic musical development which is particularly characteristic of

---

295 The hypothetical nature of the work is repeatedly stressed by Asaf'ev in both volumes. We read, in Chapter 12 of *Intonatsiya*, for example, "I am aware that I have been forced to state in a concentrated and generalized manner, and in form of hypotheses [emphasis added] much that became clear for me long ago." [902]

296 Jiranek, op. cit., p. 295.
the symphonic sonata allegro (especially as employed by Beethoven), but which, in Asaf'ev's interpretation, may be applied to other genre, including operas, ballets, cantatas, and even chamber music, as well as symphonies. His talent is not so much the invention of new terminology, but rather the particularly efficacious reinterpretation of already existing terms. The discussion of his philosophy of terminology, in Supplement 1 of Volume I, [538-41] is particularly interesting, especially in its close parallel to his concept of (musical) intonational crises. In fact, his influence, in this area, on Soviet musicology, is virtually unmatched. As Krebs observes, [Asaf'ev's vocabulary] . . . has become the vocabulary of Soviet musical science, although none wield it so well as he."

The principle aim of this study is to make a first step toward greater accessibility of Asaf'ev's ideas to non-Russian readers, through the present translation of this pivotal work in the output of this remarkable and prolific scholar. The examination of this particular, two-volume work, seems an especially efficacious approach.

\[297\text{We recall Asaf'ev's early Symphonic Etudes, a collection of studies on opera and ballet compositions (Cf., p. 37, supra).}\]

\[298\text{Krebs, op. cit., p. 86.}\]
to such an objective, for, in addition to its central role in his theoretical writing (as indicated by Jiranek's characterization above), it also represents a summarization of Asaf'ev's thinking in each of two crucial periods both in his life and in the history of the Soviet Union. At the same time, the two volumes, under the same title, collectively permit an assessment of the development of his thought over the course of nearly fifteen years. The work provides a unique vantage point for observing the consistencies (and inconsistencies) of his positions, and for tracing the evolution of some of his basic concepts.

In a broader sense a familiarity with Asaf'ev's Musical Form as a Process is important for two reasons: this work must be numbered among the highest achievements of Soviet musicological thinking, first for its artistic integrity and intellectual open-mindedness; secondly, if only on the strength of its terminology, as discussed above, it is an indispensable prerequisite to the study, not only of Asaf'ev's other works (many of which merit consideration in their own right), but to Soviet musicological and theoretical writing as a whole.

This is not easy reading. The difficulties of style have been noted, and comprehension of much of the content presupposes possession of a body of knowledge which cannot
necessarily be assumed for Western scholars as a group. In the present introductory remarks, it is hoped that the extensive biographical, historical, and philosophical background provided will aid in the comprehension of what is, at best, a complex and esoteric work.
C. A NOTE ON THE TRANSLATION

In the translation an attempt has been made to project both the letter and spirit of Asaf'ev's writing. To this end, some of the vividness, as well as the unevenness and verbosity, of his language has been preserved. In a few instances, certain passages have been omitted as being meaningless out of the context of their native language. Where feasible, English language equivalents for Asaf'ev's neologisms have been attempted. Some of these attempts are noted in the commentary. In other cases, it has seemed more appropriate simply to use the transliterated Russian term (as in the case of opevanie) with an explanation of its meaning at its first occurrence.

The system of transliteration employed is not exclusively indebted to any single source, but constitutes an attempt to represent each character in the current Russian alphabet in a form distinct from every other. The system is not applied inflexibly, however; compromises have been made, in the interest of recognition and general Western usage, in certain familiar Russian names (e.g., Tchaikovsky rather than Chaikovskii, Chaliapin rather than Shalyapin, Scriabin rather than Skryabin, and Stravinsky rather than Stravinskii). In quoted passages the spelling of the original has been preserved (e.g., Asafiev or Assafiev).
The system of transliteration, with selective pronunciation guides, follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Russian</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Russian</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>А а</td>
<td>a (pron. ah)</td>
<td>Р р</td>
<td>r</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Б б</td>
<td>b</td>
<td>С с</td>
<td>s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>В в</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>Т т</td>
<td>t</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Г г</td>
<td>g</td>
<td>У у</td>
<td>u (pron. oo)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Д д</td>
<td>d</td>
<td>Ф ф</td>
<td>f</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Е е</td>
<td>e (pron. yeh)</td>
<td>Х х</td>
<td>kh (Ger. ch)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ё ё</td>
<td>ё (pron. yoh)</td>
<td>Ц ц</td>
<td>ts (as in Watson)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ж ж</td>
<td>zh</td>
<td>Ч ч</td>
<td>ch (as in rich)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>З з</td>
<td>z</td>
<td>Ш ш</td>
<td>sh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>И и</td>
<td>i (as in mi)</td>
<td>Щ щ</td>
<td>shch (as in fresh cheese)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Й й</td>
<td>й (y as in day)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>К к</td>
<td>k</td>
<td>У у</td>
<td>y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Л л</td>
<td>л</td>
<td>Б б</td>
<td>' (palatizes preceding consonant)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>М м</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>Е е</td>
<td>è</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Н н</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>Ю ю</td>
<td>yu (pron. yoo)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>П п</td>
<td>p</td>
<td>Я я</td>
<td>ya</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes in the body of the translation, designated by number, are Asaf'ev's. The translator's notes, designated by numbered asterisks (e.g., *, **, etc.), are found in a separate commentary section at the end of each book.
B. V. ASAF'EV'S MUSICAL FORM AS A PROCESS
TRANSLATION AND COMMENTARY

VOLUME II

DISSERTATION

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirement for
the Degree Doctor of Philosophy in the Graduate
School of The Ohio State University

By
James Robert Tull, B.M., M.A.

THE OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY
1976

Reading Committee:
Dr. Norman Phelps, Professor of Music Theory
Dr. William Poland, Professor of Music Theory
Dr. Keith Mixter, Professor of Music History

Approved By

Adviser
Department of Music
# TABLE OF CONTENTS - VOLUME II

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[AUTHOR'S] INTRODUCTION [ASAF'EV]</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PART ONE: HOW MUSICAL FORMATION OCCURS</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. FACTS AND FACTORS OF MUSICAL FORMATION</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. PRINCIPLES OF IDENTITY OR REPETITION (RECOGNITION OF SIMILARITY);</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KINDS OF REPETITION; IMITATION, CANON, AND FUGUE; THE CONCEPT OF A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THEME; MUSICAL DYNAMICS AND STATICS</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. THE STUDY OF THE MOTIVE FORCES OF MUSICAL ORGANIZATION AND THE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCEPT OF ENERGY; THE DYNAMICS OF IMPETUS; THE ESTABLISHMENT OF THE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCEPT OF MUSICAL FORM</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PART TWO: STIMULI AND FACTORS OF MUSICAL FORMATION</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. IMPETUS AND CLOSE OF MOTION (CADENCE)</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. DEVELOPMENT OF MOTION (STAGE OF PROGRESSION BETWEEN IMPETUS AND</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSION); UNIFORM, UNINTERRUPTED, AND OTHER FORMS OF MOTION; MOTION</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BY INSERTION OF NEW ELEMENTS AND BY INTERRUPTION, ADJUSTING MOTION AND</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TURNING IT ONTO NEW PATHS TO AVOID INERTNESS</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. DISSONANCE AND CONSONANCE, SEQUENCES, MODULATIONS, PARALLEL</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONSTRUCTIONS, AND OTHER STIMULI AND FACTORS OF ORGANIZATION</td>
<td>336</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PART THREE: PRINCIPLES OF IDENTITY AND CONTRAST: THEIR EXPOSURE IN</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRYSTALLIZED FORMS</td>
<td>352</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII. FORMS BASED ON THE PRINCIPLE OF IDENTITY (VARIATION, CANON,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FUGUE, RONDO, ETC.)</td>
<td>353</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII. FORMS BASED ON THE PRINCIPLE OF CONTRAST (1)</td>
<td>384</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE OF CONTENTS - VOLUME II

[AUTHOR'S] INTRODUCTION [ASAF'EV] ............ 184

PART ONE: HOW MUSICAL FORMATION OCCURS. ........ 199

Chapter

I. FACTS AND FACTORS OF MUSICAL FORMATION .... 200

II. PRINCIPLES OF IDENTITY OR REPETITION (RECOGNITION OF SIMILARITY); KINDS OF REPETITION; IMITATION, CANON, AND FUGUE; THE CONCEPT OF A THEME; MUSICAL DYNAMICS AND STATICS ........ 216

III. THE STUDY OF THE MOTIVE FORCES OF MUSICAL ORGANIZATION AND THE CONCEPT OF ENERGY; THE DYNAMICS OF IMPETUS; THE ESTABLISHMENT OF THE CONCEPT OF MUSICAL FORM .... 240

PART TWO: STIMULI AND FACTORS OF MUSICAL FORMATION

IV. IMPETUS AND CLOSE OF MOTION (CADENCE). .... 263

V. DEVELOPMENT OF MOTION (STAGE OF PROGRESSION BETWEEN IMPETUS AND CONCLUSION); UNIFORM, UNINTERRUPTED, AND OTHER FORMS OF MOTION; MOTION BY INSERTION OF NEW ELEMENTS AND BY INTERRUPTION, ADJUSTING MOTION AND TURNING IT ONTO NEW PATHS TO AVOID INERTNESS .... 301

VI. DISSONANCE AND CONSONANCE, SEQUENCES, MODULATIONS, PARALLEL CONSTRUCTIONS, AND OTHER STIMULI AND FACTORS OF ORGANIZATION . 336

PART THREE: PRINCIPLES OF IDENTITY AND CONTRAST: THEIR EXPOSURE IN CRYSTALLIZED FORMS . . . 352

VII. FORMS BASED ON THE PRINCIPLE OF IDENTITY (VARIATION, CANON, FUGUE, RONDO, ETC.) . . . 353

VIII. FORMS BASED ON THE PRINCIPLE OF CONTRAST (1). 384
IX. THE DIALECTIC OF MUSICAL FORMATION:
CONSECUITIVENESS AND SIMULTANEITY;
FORM IN THE PROCESS OF FORMATION AND
FORM IN THE PROCESS OF CRYSTALLIZATION ....... 396

X. FORMS BASED ON THE PRINCIPLE OF CONTRAST (2) .... 425

XI. THE FORMATION OF CYCLES ON THE BASIS
OF CONTRAST ........................................ 443

XII. SUITE AND SYMPHONY .............................474

SUPPLEMENT 1. GENERALIZATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS
WHICH SYSTEMATIZE MY OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROCESSES
OF MUSICAL FORMATION AND THE CRYSTALLIZATION OF
MUSICAL FORMS IN THE HUMAN CONSCIOUSNESS ...... 504

SUPPLEMENT 2. BASES OF MUSICAL INTONATION ....... 536

COMMENTARY ............................................. 565
MUSICAL FORM AS A PROCESS

BOOK I
Musical form as a socially determined phenomenon is perceived, first of all, as a form (i.e., a condition, a method, and a means) for revealing music socially in the process of its intoning. Whether it be the crystallized scheme of the sonata allegro, the system of cadences, or the formulae of modes and scales, behind it all lies a lengthy process of groping, searching, and adapting the best media for the most "intelligible" expression, i.e., those intonations which are assimilated by the environment through the most productive possible forms of music-making. In essence, unfamiliar forms of expression in music are a major factor in the rejection by a given environment of new music, even though this music often turns out later to have been completely contemporary to the epoch which regarded it with distrust. People who understand their epoch very well in many areas of development cannot feel this epoch in the music which is contemporary to it, just as musicians who create compositions compatible with their times cannot estimate the significance of the contemporary events which are most important to them. (Bizet was not in

\[1\]See n. 11, p. 332, below.
a position to comprehend the significance of the Parisian Commune, but nevertheless his Carmen was a reflected protest [against] that same system which the Commune opposed, in the sense of an abrupt switching of the customs of the Parisian opera theatre to a new path—a protest, weak perhaps in comparison with the political performance of the Communards, but striking in its own right, and born of the same atmosphere which gave birth to the Commune). In speaking of forms of expression, I do not mean simply the manner of realization of music, i.e., the genre and character of performance, but rather, I have in mind the forms of intoning in which music manifests itself, and especially the system of intonations characteristic for any given epoch (from scales to harmonic functions, from the simplest instrumental melody to symphonic variations).^2

Form is not merely a constructive scheme. Form, verified by listening, sometimes by several generations, i.e., socially manifested (otherwise, how and where could it become crystallized), is the organization (the purposeful distribution in time) of musical material, or, in other words, the organization of musical motion, for, generally speaking, there is no stationary musical

^2But a system of intonations which is not static, but in incessant evolution and mutation, in living practice, in historically based forms of music-making.
material. It is natural that the principles of this organization are not the principles of individual creation, but rather, social principles. They grow out of practical demands; the environment assimilates them and selects the most necessary. The practical demands expand their limits according to the degree of development of the culture. Music can be traced from intonations which are fixed in a given environment on the basis of directly utilitarian purposes (signalling, primitive magic and medicine, etc.) to complicated sound combinations with a strict delimitation of their functions, which become the object of aesthetic enjoyment. But along this path, no aspect of music survives if it is not socially assimilated—if the means of expression inherent in this aspect do not represent the results of social selection and further variants of these essential qualities. Do not the so-called classical compositions and entire epochs of classicism in music represent periods of creativity in which the organization of material achieves such a degree of comprehensibility and necessity for the perceiving environment, that the principles of this organization and its forms become normative for several future generations, while the music created on this basis is considered exemplary!

Classical forms are the result of prolonged social selection of the most stable and useful intonations. But,
of course, we should not regard them as being petrified or ossified, because the process of musical formation never stops, since it is a dialectical process, and since music which absolutely corresponds to some ideal, abstract schemes does not exist. Composers who are considered by the rational aesthetic to be creators and strict observers of exemplary formal schemes, usually turn out to be the destroyers of those schemes.

I have just said that the process of musical formation is a dialectical process. It cannot be otherwise. Form is not an abstraction. It would not be at all paradoxical to assert that form is the same sort of medium for the manifestation or exposure of the social existence of music as a musical instrument (not without reason, in the formation of forms, can the influence of the instrumentation of the epoch of their origin be observed). I repeat, in terms of music this is not a paradox. The fact that an instrument is tangible, but forms are intangible, does not alter the matter. An acoustical medium which is not organized by the human consciousness does not, indeed, constitute music. Even the most primitive stages of selection of the media of musical expression from among acoustical phenomena, reveal the prolonged process of formation and the crystallization of that which is formed. It is well known that scales, before appearing in works of
theory in the form of series, abstracted from living music (ascending or descending formulae of the correlations of separate tones), were first assimilated by the memory in practice and occurred in the form of melodic formula-tunes or turns of melody characteristic for each mode.

Form as a process, and form as a crystallized scheme (or, more precisely, as a construction) are two sides of the same phenomenon—the organization of the motion of socially useful (expressive) sound combinations. I am not speaking now of the stimuli for this organization and the stimuli for intonational selection, i.e., of the content, which conditions music as one aspect of ideology, and I do not intend here to reveal the concept of content which I make in another place.* But this does not at all mean that form is some sort of metaphysical principle, sufficient unto itself. In biology it is clear that the form of a cell is limited—i.e., it occurs as it is, on the basis of a certain number of determining factors—and that we neither observe nor apprehend the cell except in this form. But this does not mean that the form is more essential than the cell. It is the same in connection with music; the form of a musical composition as a whole and the forms of the elements which constitute it are the instruments (or tools) of the collective human consciousness, which reveal music as an organized medium.

Each musical composition for that reason is perceived
These principles are worked out through a prolonged process of selection. But what signs characterize musical (intonational) selection, and why do some intonations survive longer than others? So far as music is perceived by the hearing, so far as the process of its perception demands the assimilation of material in motion, to that extent the process of selection is first of all a process of memorization, i.e., the concentration of attention on like or similar sounds, or sounds in all respects equal to one another (the recognition of resemblance), and on the isolation of the dissimilar, the unequal, the separate. In other words, on one hand the ear crystallizes in the consciousness sound complexes or correlations of sound which are typological for a given musical formation (or, repeated irritations evoke repeated reflexes). If, in this process, these sound complexes and conjugations have already been partially assimilated earlier, then the process of perception proceeds along the line of least resistance. On the other hand, the ear notices intonations which contrast with these stable factors and, according to their degree of isolation from the familiar

---

3 The continuity of music consists in the fact that the ear is always concerned with an insignificant percentage of absolutely new sound combinations and with an overwhelming number of combinations of familiar formations. "Musical semantics" is based on this fact. (See Supplement 2, 563-64.)  
4
combinations, feels the movement of the music as a sharper and sharper imbalance and contradiction (conflict) in the interrelation of the sounding elements. This is one side of the process.

But it is natural that the memorization of music, in the face of music's constant fluidity and the necessity for continuous comparison of identical and non-identical intonations, presupposes the presence in the consciousness of man, in a given epoch and environment, and in a given segment of time, of a certain sum of sound combinations, crystallized since ancient times (an "intonational reserve"). One man may have more of them, another less, but on the whole each epoch has, and each class possesses a certain number of intonations so settled in the consciousness that the hearing of a composition in which the interaction of familiar combinations dominates over the unusual affords more pleasure than the perception of music in which intonations dominate which have not yet been assimilated and for the assimilation of which a greatly increased activity of the consciousness is necessary. The process of comparison of identical and non-identical material in such cases is unquestionably complicated, and, on first hearing, any unfamiliar music

\[4\text{It goes without saying that this reserve can only be conceived as a "reflexive accumulation".}\]
presents itself to the consciousness, not only as a sharply unstable balance of the elements of its make-up, but even as a complex noise or as chaos and formlessness. On repeated hearings the outlines are ascertained; the understanding of music begins with the memorization of correlations more familiar to the consciousness, and from their comparison with the less familiar. Selection leads to the assimilation of the form. (This does not at all mean that the listener must know the names of the form-schemes and distinguish them; it is a matter of the mastery of the order, the conformity to rule of the distribution of sound combinations, at the basis of which, as was said, is assumed a reserve of intonations already established in the consciousness. Without them, i.e., finding oneself in an alien environment, in an alien intonational system, it is difficult to "understand" music, which is what happens when an Indian or Chinese hears European music, and, conversely, when a European hears music of cultures alien to him. When one becomes accustomed to the music, then the perception of sound combinations occurs by inertia\(^5\) and the energy of "attentive listening" transfers into the stage of "enjoyment" of music.

According to the measure of assimilation of any sound system, some sound combinations become so habitual that they are perceived as something which goes without
saying, having always existed; they are perceived as "original content," or, in the case of intonations which have almost lost expressiveness and have become some sort of sound formulae, for example, scales or arpeggios, as some sort of building material or neutral constructive elements. The collective consciousness "forgets" that these elements also were crystallized long ago, and that many generations worked over their selection and assimilation. Thus, to professional musicians it now seems that methods of transfer from one tonal sphere into another, the correlation of tonic and dominant, the connecting of triads, and similar easily employed devices have always existed, and did not have to be worked out in the course of a long period of time as the result of enormous efforts and experiments ("the struggle of intonations for existence"\textsuperscript{6}).

Without the "exercise of memory" there is no progress in the perception of music and no evolution in musical culture. And memorization is inconceivable without the activity of comparison, of the differentiation and isolation of sound combinations in the process of their interchange. In other words, perception secondarily organizes motion which was initially organized by the composer. This can occur only on the basis of the fact that the very construction of music, the organization of sound motion, or what is the same thing, the exposure
of music in the systematic conjugation of its intoned elements (musical form) is conditioned by possibilities of perception in accordance with practices which have been worked out on the basis of social necessity (having become obligatory factors of assimilation through a series of repetitions). The ever more intensive evolution of musical forms and their complication and enlargement became possible in Europe only when the collective consciousness, step by step, had fashioned and mastered, in the intonational experience of centuries, the most rational correlation of sound elements, from which very gradually was worked out our contemporary tempered system. If it should be suggested that the process occurred in reverse and that only people exceptionally gifted in music assimilated the correlation of the twelve, seven-degree major scales, while to the remaining masses the tonal feeling in this form remained alien, then neither the music of Bach, nor that of Beethoven, nor of anyone else would have existed publicly, nor would it be the same as mankind has known and even now knows it.

Thus, if musical form is the process of exposing music in the systematic conjugation of intoned elements, then it is possible to say conversely that the exposure of music occurs through the process of organizing sounding materials (it seems to me that the concept of sounding matter is permissible). This process represents the
creative (i.e., pertaining to the presence of features of invention) organization of sound combinations on the basis of socially tested principles, which, in their turn, grow out of the social experience of assimilation, or out of practices of the perception of musical phenomena. From what has been said earlier about these practices, we may consider the "two-faced quality" of the process of formation in music, or the simultaneous co-existence in it of two tendencies: the tendency toward crystallization—toward the exposure of similar intonations, similar and parallel constructive landmarks such as cadences—and the tendency toward a progressively more intensive feeling of unstable equilibrium, i.e., toward the destruction of identical and repeated features by the introduction of unfamiliar, unexpected capricious intonations, and by means of the breaking down or expansion of structural norms. In later stages this passes on to a struggle between the immediate factors which stimulate motion and the traditional compositional schemes. The actual factor which initiates and continues the motion (and consequently prolongs the form) is not at all a constant value. In music everything is measured by correlations which are always unstable. The very same factor may be, in one epoch, a revolutionary intonational stimulus ("a spokesman of new sensations") and in another, a lifeless device, hampering the development of music, and
devoid of expressiveness. For example, the perfect cadence in the epoch of its formation was a progressive factor, but for Wagner in Tristan, on the contrary, the transcending of the "classical" (musical) period, traditionally closed, and limited by a cadence, was the motive force. Otherwise, in the face of this opposition, it would have been impossible for him to design that intensively unstable flood of sounds with the continuous transformation of familiar tonal and chordal functions into unfamiliar ones, that uninterrupted or "endless" melody which served as the expression of the exalted, refined, individualistic eroticism of that epoch.

This means that, in the process of formation, there appear similar elements on one hand, which make up the base or landmarks of the memorization of music, and contrasting elements on the other. The scheme resists movement. Movement in music occurs only when new intonations come to displace these intonations which are regarded as firm. Concerning the aforementioned dialectical quality in the process of musical formation, it is felt always as a condition of unstable equilibrium; no single aspect of intoning is evaluated as self-contained, but always as a stage of transition into the following one.

5 Impetus--continuation of motion (inertia and the struggle of new stimuli)--breaking and stopping (cadence): 7
Even stable points demand this transition, and, in order to displace, let's say, some firm "starting point" of sound, it is necessary to oppose to it another "aspect" of sound.

A study of the evolution of musical forms reveals that the gradual "prolongation" of musical motion (the increase of length) proceeded by extremely varied paths and was reached with difficulty. Even though individual, exceptionally gifted people outstripped their time and established forms of significantly larger scope in comparison with the preceding epoch, their environment, the class which reared them, was still far from assimilating at once what they had achieved. There are an infinite number of examples of this. It is well known how the gigantic dimensions of Beethoven's "Eroica" staggered the imagination of his contemporaries, and how "negatively" another very gifted composer, Weber, reacted to this symphony.* Thus, we may conclude that if the class which calls forth new achievements in music is for a long time unable to assimilate them, even as they occur in the creations of its own representatives, then other classes or social groupings will entirely disregard the peaks of musical culture of the predominating class, and their musical consciousness will evolve in its own way, developing a range of assimilated intonations native to their environment.
Thus, the evolution of musical forms in Europe from the first attempts of polyphony (the ninth to the thirteenth centuries) to the colossal dimensions of the Romantic symphonies (Bruckner, Mahler) and operas (Wagner) is in some respects a process of extending the limits of music and widening the limits of motion, a process closely linked with the practice of assimilation and conditioned by the evolution of auditory perception, based, of course, on its indispensable features (memorization by means of the comparison and differentiation of identical and contrasting sound conjugations).

In their most general features, the stages of this process may now be observed, thanks to the publication and thorough study of the sources of music of the Middle Ages and the monuments of music of the Renaissance and Baroque, and to the excellent publications of complete collections of the Classics. In addition, the appearance of a series of thoughtful analytical works in the area of investigation of the process of musical formation and crystallization has helped me to treat more confidently those problems of musical formation at which I had already worked for a long time, and to feel myself on firmer ground. Among those works are, for example, the book by A. Machabey, *Histoire et évolution des formules musicales du I-er au XV-e siècle de l'ère chrétienne* (Paris: Payot, 1928), in which the emergence of intonational bases, the organization of tonal
feeling, the formation of cadences, etc., etc., are traced step by step, based on the study of monuments of the epochs, with continual reference to the practice of music-making, or the articles of Heinrich Besseler under the title, "Studien zur Muzik des Mittelalters" (Archiv fur Musikwissenschaft for June, 1925 and January, 1927), or the pithy article by Vladimir Helfert, "Zur Entwicklungsgeschichte der Sonataform" (Ibid., April, 1925), and others. In the same way, still earlier, the appearance of works of Ernst Kurth confirmed the opinions stated by me in 1916-1917 on the essence of melos and the concept of the "horizontal," on the crisis of harmony, on the dynamics of the fugue, and on the necessity for a new understanding of musical form, not as architectonic "non-sounding" schemes, but as a systematic process of organizing sounding material and of its crystallization. The study of monuments and the circumstances of the spread and cultivation of popular music (especially of an instrumental, domestic nature, as for example, lute music) and the forms of its realization, have also widened and enriched the range of my observations.
PART ONE

HOW MUSICAL FORMATION OCCURS
CHAPTER I

FACTS AND FACTORS OF MUSICAL MOTION AND ORGANIZATION

Two basic phenomena help one to understand the properties of the process of musical organization: (1) motion (the succession of sounds one after another as the inter-relation of pitches) and (2) the conditions of memorization of music or the means which our consciousness has worked out for the retention of consonances in motion. The temporal nature of music--its fluidity--and, at the same time, the peculiar methods of memorization which are evoked by this fluidity, inevitably have an influence on the forms in which musical motion is fixed. Its laws, which are conditioned by the sounding material itself, do not yield at present to precise definition. But, if one observes similar phenomena, occurring constantly and everywhere, in any music, in the formation of the musical fabric, it is possible to establish their purposefulness through their recurrence. The study of the functions of these repeated phenomena permits one to approach the establishment of useful working hypotheses and, with their help, to systematize and unify the most varied facts.
of musical organization.

Here it is necessary to make the important reservation that, in the observation of facts and factors of musical motion and musical organization in this study, the analysis is conducted with written music, i.e., music fixed in note symbols. Each system of writing, in its turn, is crystallized as the result of prolonged experiments and adaptations, during which the stages of musical formation are, of course, reflected in the methods of the written representation of music and in the forms of this representation. A striking example is the correlation between neumatic and mensural writing. The first is an obvious product of music just barely emerging from the epoch of the oral tradition into the epoch of "written history," and, moreover, of music closely united with the word. The second was created on the basis of the insistent demand in creation for methods of setting down music independently of verbal metrics in view of the development of polyphonic thinking and other factors (including linguistics, that is, new national tongues, their rhythmics, and their intonations). If the growth of music demanded an ever more convenient and easily comprehended notation, then, conversely, the improvements in notation helped both the creation and the perception of music, making easier for the memory the processes of the memorization and the coordination of unstable sound
correlations. Music of the oral tradition, including both the music of primitive cultures such as our peasant song and the practices of perception and preservation of music only by ear, preserving its significance even in far removed musical cultures, is not considered here. This does not mean that there are entirely different principles and methods of formation in this kind of music, but still the peculiarity of its forms and even its character are conditioned in many ways by its "vocalness." I propose to expound my views about this in a special work devoted to the art of Russian folk song.  

In the same way, in order to focus greater attention on the characteristics and the principles of organization of music which result from the rules of its motion and the methods of its memorization, we must ignore a series of other factors here which have an influence on the character of motion and organization but do not alter them in essence. These factors are merely enumerated here. First of all, it is necessary to take into consideration the role of the breathing of man (its supply, force, and intensity) in the formation, not only of vocal music and music of the oral tradition, but also of instrumental and written music. Short or long breathing has an influence on the structure and breakdown of music, on its contraction and expansion, on the length of the ascending and descending motion of melodic arcs—in a word, on the dynamics of
melos. In music of the oral tradition a great difference is observed between the extent of the melody as a whole and of its segments, depending on whether the song is linked with a condition of rest or of motion in the organism, and with the forms of this motion. Drawling songs and songs for dancing, as well as songs linked with various processes of work, are formed differently and have not only rhythmic and constructive differences, but also a different intonational nature.

It is also natural that a difference is observed in the organization of the melos of solo singing and that of choral songs, of the melos of worship and that of the street, of the salon and of the public house.\(^1\) The place and the environment, the tempo of life and the social milieu—all exert influence on melos. To the present time the influence of methods, devices, practices, and the dynamics and construction of oratorical speech, in general, on forms of musical speech and the construction of musical compositions has been very little (in fact, almost not at all) considered, but, nevertheless, rhetoric could not help but be an extremely influential factor in relation to music as an expressive language. This is apparent, in particular, if we again turn our attention to the agitational

---

\(^1\)Something along this line is given us by the report of M. Friedlander, Eigenleben von Volksliedmelodien, Bericht über den Musikwissenschaftlichen Kongress in Basel (Leipzig: 1925).
significance of music (at least of religious music). Both Protestant and Catholic composers, especially in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries in many respects were outstanding orators, if not always religious advocates, in their music, and this orientation influenced the process of organization. The difference between chamber and symphonic forms of music, between lyrically contemplative music (the expression and confession, as if for oneself, of some sort of introspection) and active music, rests to an impressive degree on the presence or absence of some feature of rhetorical direction and on the presence of agitational elements; in this respect there is a great distance between some sort of a salon "song without words" and a Mass. But on the other hand, some sort of laconic street song can be more active than a large-scale introspective symphony.²

Still another extremely important factor which influences the process of musical organization and the result of that process, the composition itself, is the selection of musical instruments, their material, their structure, their timbre, the technique of playing them, etc. Of course, this factor is understood as formative,

²I note here only briefly the influence on music of oratorical speech or, more precisely, the sphere of "oratory" itself. My interest in this area almost coincided with considerations of this same subject by A. Schering and I.A. Braudo, who are working on this problem at the present time.*¹²
only if we reject the abstract idea of form in music and the purely visual-architectonic concept of it as a quantity of time units. If we take two melodies of sixteen measures, for example, even with similar cadences and identical modulatory deviations, but one composed, let's say, for the violin, with the use of all the possibilities which its range and bow strokes permit, and the other for the English horn, they will differ in relation to form.*13 This will be the case in spite of the similarity of many elements, and will occur only because each is composed in the character of a given instrument; but the difference will certainly affect the melodic outline in its length, breakdown, duration, and range--its sinews and breath, so to speak. In fact, the influence of instrumentalism as a factor of form is, generally, even much stronger. It is sufficient to point out the colossal formative significance which the "drone" (bourdon) basses had in primitive forms, and how they then affected rich and well-developed musical cultures in the form of the devices of the basso ostinato, organ points (pedal), etc. The instrumental cantus firmus of the Middle Ages is, likewise, one of the aspects of the principle of bourdon, because its goal is to unite, to link, and to support the blossoming polyphonic fabric.

The presence of decorative (ornamental) elements in a composition also, to a certain extent, relates not only to the Manner of execution, and serves not only as an index
of style, but also has significance in relation to form, if only because there is a great difference between a melodic line which is made up entirely of organic, constructively conditioned sounds, and a line, the movement of which is "cloaked" with ornamentation. Beside that, the process, often enough observed in a melodic pattern of the transformation of decorative elements into the basic melodies which determine the mode and take on the significance of harmonic functions, definitely indicates the necessity of considering instrumentally and vocally decorative elements as factors of organization. But, as much as instruments and their properties have greatly influenced the character of ornamentation, it is equally important, in this area, not to overlook the very active influence on form exerted by instrumentalism. In this connection, the ancient division of musical forms into vocal and instrumental is fully justified, and the predominance in a given locality, country, or people, of the vocal or instrumental practice of music, influences the formation of certain principles and methods of organizing the sound fabric.³

³In epochs when forms were not yet identified with schemes or "outlines," in the epochs of "improvisational formation," it is interesting to observe how the "transplantation" of a composition from one sphere of music-making to another appears, at the same time, as a process of organization (for example, in the Renaissance, lute and organ music; the same is true in the Baroque era).
After this unavoidable digression, it is possible to concentrate on several basic facts in the area of musical motion, temporarily disregarding the method of sound production (human voice or instrument). To understand the form of a musical composition means to understand the logical basis of motion in a flow of sound as it is perceived by the hearing—to be aware of why motion continues as it does, sometimes shortened, sometimes extended. Once more I repeat what has already been said: in order to comprehend a composition, people instinctively compare the "features" of flowing music and impress on their memories similar, frequently repeated complexes of consonances. These consonances little by little are fixed in the consciousness and become easily recognized, familiar, pleasant. Upon hearing any new composition, people compare unfamiliar sound complexes with familiar ones and make a selection, sharply rejecting particularly unfamiliar combinations. Repeated hearing, however, gradually evokes recognition of the connection between unfamiliar and familiar sound elements. Preceeding from sound relations which have been crystallized in the memory as a result of the development of listening habits, the ear becomes accustomed to the novel combinations which strike it, and establishes their greater or lesser similarity with the previous ones. The professional musician and the ordinary listener differ from one another
only in the fact that in the consciousness of the former there is a much larger reserve of prepared, strictly systematized sound correlations, whereas the ordinary listener has fewer of them and contents himself with only familiar listening habits and the recognition of individual features, rather than with the general functional quality of their connections. The degree of prejudice toward the new, however, is no less among professionals than among mere musical amateurs. Often it is even increased in the case of the former because of their inability to penetrate into an alien and unfamiliar way of thinking, so firmly do familiar norms and formulae of sound combinations and permutations, which are solidly assimilated in professional musical practice, settle in their consciousnesses and make them inert. One succession inevitably evokes another, and any unexpectedness is felt by the professional ear to be a sharp violation of established rule.\(^4\)

A similar process of clinging to familiar consonances or rejecting them--of comparison and selection--occurs in the creative work of composers. The greater or lesser expressiveness, the originality, and the novelty of any composed music are conditioned to a considerable degree by

\(^4\)Social inertness\(^14\) in perception, in a word, is to be found in varying degrees both among professionals and among ordinary listeners.
the feeling of the connection between various features of musical motion and sound correlations which are still unfamiliar for many people, but are already fully recognized by the consciousness of the composer. The inertness or vitality in the creative work of composers depends on just such a choice between combinations long since assimilated, remaining passively in the memory (creation along the line of least resistance always rests on combining, in the simplest versions, correlations which are familiar to the ear), and "material not yet mastered"--between sound conjugations which have been substantiated on a completely rational basis, and those which, up to that time, have appeared as inexplicable, irrational windfalls and new perspectives. It is a frequently observed fact, both in conservatories and music schools, and in non-scholastic training in musical composition, that especially gifted pupils with a marked imprint of individual talent, who compose music even before the assimilation of rules of voice leading and harmony, for a long time instinctively and firmly resist the mechanical and passive assimilation of prepared prescriptions of technique. These prescriptions are presented to them in the form of scholastic theses or dilapidated formulae. They naturally fear the infection of "inertness" and seek mastery of technique through general principles and methods of controlling the material
rather than through set, passively perceived schemes. The replacement of such principles and methods with sound combinations prepared long ago, but regarded as absolutely correct, of course, intimidates any strong talent. 

On the basis of what has been said, it may be concluded that, in attaining its highest level (the predominance of intellectual factors and acts of thinking over the instinctive combining of sounds, and the predominance of features of invention over the passive, varied reproduction of familiar intonations), creation, and therefore the process of formation in music, passes through a series of prolonged stages. In time, "social inertia" is produced in a given environment, in the attitude toward music—a factor of enormous significance for form and for the crystallization of socially stable and valuable sound conjugations, but in the same degree opposed to the free flow of creative invention. The various stages of the creative process are observed not only in historical sequence, but also exist in any given environment in any epoch. The most primitive type—that is, creation "by memory"—is an attempt to fix by their frequent repetition (along with the feeling of pleasure

5Musorgskiĭ, in this respect, emerges as a distinctive type of composer of great power of invention, trying persistently to protect himself against the influence of generally accepted form-schemes, against "inertia" in creation.
which accompanies this) those consonances which are pleasing or especially acceptable to the organism, which rouse or soothe it, and are assimilated and wrung out of various musical impressions. This lowest form of sound combination is extremely organic and fortuitous. The feature of invention is almost absent here, just as is the process of musical thinking. Consonances are compared with one another in an habitual way, and the stringing of them one after another does not have artistic purposefulness, but is conditioned only by the search for a spontaneous, psycho-physiological effect resulting from just such habitual combinations. Usually these consist of the persistent repetition of very bedraggled cadence formulae, serving as points of support, around which rotate "accidental" combinations, with continuous returns to the points of support. The consciously organized, prolonged motion of music involving the development of given sound correlations does not yet exist here. The characteristic "aspect" of such music is this hypnotic repetition of the same formula, which may be observed even to the present time in popular music-making, in the use of the perfect cadence as a stimulus in the dance. Here, the very fact of the exposure (the intoning) of a familiar sound complex, which arouses no resistance and is familiarly formed, is sufficient stimulus for its endless repetition.
This is a primitive form of creation. But, since creation is stimulated by perception, it is no surprise that the ordinary listener perceives music as a series of "separatenesses," pleasant or annoying; he rejoices at the repeated, variegated appearance of identical consonances, familiar to him, and treats alien combinations with distrust. Primitive stages of perception, like primary creative skills, growing out of specifically utilitarian, biological, and psycho-physiological demands in the stimulation of the organism by sounds, are always characterized by a decided preference for the repetition of similar elements, and a striving, not so much for prolonged development, as for the varied repetition of sound formulae,\(^6\) which have been firmly assimilated and fixed in the memory. Of course, the effect of music in arousing muscular-motor sensations and, conversely, the demand for music as a medium ("irritant") for organizing and collectivizing these sensations (pacing, dancing), have, to a considerable extent, furthered the consolidation of creative practices, the aim of which is to build intonationally uncomplicated melodic formations on the same rhythmic core and to repeat them, varying them or

\(^6\)It would be possible to say, "of rhythmic intonations," for rhythmic factors in this stage achieve particular prominence in the face of the almost complete neglect of melody as an independent area of intoning.
alternating them with different formations, equally uncomplicated and similar to them. The rhythmic-intonational formulae of marches, dances, etc., are a result of this phenomenon.

In contrast to the ordinary listener, the professional musician, first of all, directs his attention to the grasping of relations in music, to the understanding of the connections between the consecutive motion of sounds in time and complexes of sounds at a considerable distance from one another (in the sense of the period of their occurrence in the consciousness of the listener, not in the sense of concretely tangible distances as in the spatial arts), and to the analysis of the causes of these connections. The hearing of the musician tries to establish the mutual gravitation of sound combinations in their progress, and to reduce to rational unity all the variety of their relations to one another. The more unfamiliar the composition, the more the ear is struck by this variety. The more solidly and firmly the formulae of sound conjugations, which are basic and characteristic for a given time and environment, are crystallized in the consciousness (and, in the process, for most people they are associated with various non-musical notions and linked with the "emotional tone" of life perception), the stronger and more prolonged will be the opposition to
diversity, and the more protracted will be the process of "connecting" combinations, seemingly remote from one another, with a system of familiar sound relations. Thus, in the assimilation of music there occurs a constant battle between sound combinations which are crystallized in the memory (usually such sound combinations are perceived as forms, and from them constructive schemes are derived by which the teaching of "forms" occurs) and the equally continuous process of organization, i.e., the reduction to some rational unity of a variety of sound relations inspired by creative instinct in the search for new stimuli.

Thus, as distinct from primitive musical-creative practices in which dependence on extra-musical factors is very strong, the successive stages of the art of composing are concerned with overcoming the inertness in one's own consciousness, and with an increased striving toward the mastery of purely musical relations--that which may be called the origin of a "professional musical consciousness"). The overcoming of this inertness is a vital prerequisite to the organization and development of material on the basis of its dynamic properties--a process which is not influenced by purely psycho-physiological factors (that is, by primitive demands for frequent repetition of sound combinations serving as "instantaneous" irritants,\textsuperscript{16} which either stimulate or soothe the
organism). Rather, it is stimulated by a series of intervening steps, beginning with the relations of production, which, as they become more complicated, evoke a corresponding complication in music—a phenomenon which may be observed in the economic evolution of European cities.*17 It is here that principles of the formation of material are worked out which rationally summarize the whole process of organization (just noted) and lead to the development of extended forms with complicated correlations of their constituent elements and the functions peculiar to them. These forms, of course, are developed in close relationship with the growth of the whole culture of mankind in a given period of time and in a given country.

---

7 For this reason we must be careful not to exaggerate the bio-emotional significance and sexual influence [of these primitive demands], as if they were the only objective of music.
CHAPTER II

PRINCIPLES OF IDENTITY OR REPETITION (RECOGNITION OF SIMILARITY); KINDS OF REPETITION; IMITATION; CANON, AND FUGUE; THE CONCEPT OF A THEME; MUSICAL DYNAMICS AND STATICS

Repeated motion or the execution twice or several times of the same musical material is the simplest and, at the same time, the most easily accessible medium for continuing a correlation of sound, once it has been found or selected. For the assimilation of music by the memory, this medium proves to be the most reliable. Forms of repetition are extremely varied, from the literal and exact reproduction of a given correlation, to the contrasting comparison of two or several features of music, in which sound formations occur on the basis of the same material, the original similarity of which is discerned with difficulty. Thus, the monotony of literal repetition is avoided, and the principle of repetition is transformed into a stimulus to the development of music from a single thematic premise. Perception then establishes, not a literal unity, but a similarity of separate elements, joining separate manifestations of material which is identical in its origins. This may be observed in the highest variational forms, in which the music, flowing from one original source, is allied in its
development with music which is organized according to the principle of contrast (sonata allegro). The last movement of Beethoven's "Eroica" Symphony is such an example, in which the path of variational development of the material is comparable in its scope and tension to the contrasting thematic development of the first movement.

Since the multiplicity of ways of repeating identical material does not, at present, permit classification of all such kinds of formation, I will indicate only those which are "in the greatest demand". Two natural subdivisions present themselves. They are exact repetition of music and repetition which is varied, in terms of its duration, in terms of the introduction of ornamentation, and also, in terms of the repetition of movement of the same elements, but in inverse order, in reflection or inversion, etc. These methods are complicated by the possibility of the simultaneous occurrence of several repetitive devices in different voices. For example, in polyphonic forms we may find the simultaneous execution of a theme in augmentation and in its normal aspect, or in diminution and in the original form, and also, in literal and contrary motion of diverging and converging voices. In Brahms' "Junge Lieder" (op.63), in the first of them ("Meine Liebe ist grün"), the latter method of varied repetition permits the composer to construct an instrumental interlude which "tightly" closes the motion of the vocal line:*
In the Coda of the Overture to *Ruslan*, Glinka reinforces the approach of the moment of "denouement" of the entire movement of the overture with an inverted repetition (exact inversion of the theme and the chromatic scale which accompanies it.* He prepares the appearance of the whole-tone scale which follows immediately with a similar transposed repetition, and, after its repeated execution—this time with a literal, consecutive repetition and the leading of the motion to the cadence formula, he confirms the tonic by means of a stretto run (i.e., by repetition in different voices) of the principal theme.* This Coda is a classic example of the dynamization of musical development on the basis of repetition in the very last stages of motion, completing the entire development of the
Repeated motion in the same voice, either literal or varied, is always consecutive (horizontal), while with two or more voices the problem is complicated by the introduction of possible vertical rearrangements (different types of repetition), and also by the use of a special kind of horizontally mobile repetition—imitation. In the latter case there is a feature of variety, which gives much interest and musical meaning to the motion while literal repetition evokes in too small a degree the feeling of the continuation of motion. Repetition is less significant as an agent of motion, than as the medium for the firmer reinforcement in the memory of a given correlation of sounds. For example, the correlation \((a:b) + (a:b) + (a:b), \text{ etc.}^1\) repeated for a very long time, will evoke a feeling of monotony, and finally, of immobility. The ear will perceive this as a means of developing motion only in the first few repetitions, depending upon the number of sounds and their complexity in each of the given elements. In other words, literal repetition will be perceived as movement only as long as there is some interest in comparison, discernment, and memorization. As soon as this interest is exhausted, repetition becomes annoying. If we take two sound elements

\[\text{\footnotesize\textsuperscript{1}These are relatively generalized designations, into which can be placed any complexes of tones.}\textsuperscript{22}\]
which are intonationally absolutely identical, for example:

(a:a) + (a:a), then there will be almost no stimuli for
comparison at all, for the difference evoked by the bar
line accent, or even correlations of duration between a and
a (for example: J J J J and J J J J or J J J J and
J J J J) will be fully assimilated from the double repeti-
tion. One has only to introduce into this identity an element
of intonational variety, even in the most primitive form--
such as the repetition at the octave (A:a)--and immediately
a stimulus to comparison is felt. And if one also intro-
duces a characteristic timbre into the intonation, the ear
will perceive such a correlation, with its repeated recur-
rences, as motion.

In Beethoven's Eighth Symphony, in the finale, the re-
peated octaves of the bassoons and tympani are felt as a
factor which organizes motion, as an organic element in the
general development of the music, and as a stimulus to this
development. The stronger the rhythmic-intonational differ-
ence between two or more repeatedly conjugate elements, the
more stimuli to comparison by the ear will result, the more
repetition will be required, and the more naturally this
repetition will be perceived by the ear as a stimulus to
the progression of the music. It is this necessity for a
two-fold assimilation which accounts for the practice, so
common in the music of the Classical Period, of repeating
each section of the theme in its statement before the
variations, and what is even more significant--of repeating
the entire exposition in the sonata-allegro.

The simplest forms of non-identical repetition occur in the appearance of the same formula of conjugation in ornamentally varied "attire," while in a constructive sense everything remains unchanged. The same kind of effect is produced by breaking up the sound rhythmically, by the recurrence of a chord in an arpeggiated form, etc.\(^2\)--in a word, by all possible decorative and figural alterations of the basic form of the sound correlation. In fact, even an exact repetition of music in different tonalties, in a close tonal relationship, is counted among the simpler forms of non-identical repetition. The further removed the tonalities are from one another, and the sharper and more pronounced is the tonal coloristic contrast, the more basis there is for comparative judgment by the ear, and the more intensive is the perception of tonal difference in identical material as a stimulus to movement and, consequently, as a formative factor. In symphonies of large scale, however, the device of repeating large episodes in the development section, with parallel execution in different tonalties (most often in a third relation), does not always evoke a feeling of tenseness of motion and tends to reduce the dramatic effect and dynamics of development. This is

\(^2\)With transportation into other registers and with variations of timbre.
observed in Schumann. For example, in the first movement of the Fourth Symphony, in the development section, there is repetition of a large episode at the interval of a minor third, and in the first movement of the First Symphony, also in the development section, the repetition again of a large episode in a fifth relation. Beethoven employs a similar method of development in the first movement of the Sixth ("Pastoral") Symphony. Rimskii-Korsakov knew how to apply a similar type of execution as a medium of symphonic development in theatrical music, particularly in the static-decorative and descriptive (figurative) moments. In this respect, he follows in the footsteps of Liszt. We must return to this device again.

On the other hand, the repetition of the same music in different modes (major to minor or minor to major) was considered by the Classics as a sharp contrast. This is indicated by their variations in which, for example, the execution of the theme in minor served as a necessary medium for avoiding tonal monotony. The minor variation in the midst of major was perceived in strong relief, and is so perceived now, for our hearing has a remarkable capacity to regulate perception and the degree of its acuity in conformity to the style of music. Thus, much which seems stagnant

---

3 In a correlation at the second, the contrast is softened by tonal relations at the third within the repeated episode.
in contemporary music sounds like a daring contrast in music of a different milieu. After a series of major executions of the theme (often in the form of ornamental-decorative variants) the minor creates the feeling of a sudden change of motion, and, undoubtedly owing to that, this device is favored over the execution of a theme in the same mode, but in different tonalities.

The history of the development of variation forms—in which the principle of identity ("the recognition of similarity") completely subordinates both the principle of contrast ("the ascertaining of differences") and the attempt either to equalize it with subsequent motion or to aggravate it with new contrasts—affords an opportunity to trace, step by step, the evolution of gradually more daring and further departures and deviations from close and similar repetitions toward contrasting repetitions. In the latter, the recognition of similarity occurs by means of prolonged and extended adaptations of the hearing to the alien elements deposited in the process of modification. In complicated contemporary variations there is observed a much less gradual departure from the original form of the theme than in the variations of the Classics, and some strongly developed variation may become so far removed from its origin, and may contain such contrasting new formations, that it is perceived by the ear as a strong stimulus toward further motion and the search for synthesis. But the fact that, in variation forms, the first stimulus of motion (the theme)
is assumed to be identical in all its appearances, gives one the right to continue any variational motion indefinitely, i.e., to consider this form open. Indeed, however brilliant and dynamically striking the finale of any set of variations may be, in principle it is possible to imagine an even stronger variation after it.

Rather than give a multitude of examples of the gradual breakdown and complication of variation forms, in terms of the gradual differentiation of identical features and the increasing "difficulty" of recognizing similarity, one may merely cite a series of more or less well-known variations in historical sequence. It would be unthinkable to set forth, step by step, the growth of differences within the framework of repetition as a principle of formation. Only a study of the compositions or at least a quick survey of them will help one to assimilate the course of development. Variations, outstanding for their mastery and expressiveness, and variations which do not "go too far", always will be those in which motion, although dynamically formed, does not permit the feeling of connection between links of a single chain to be entirely lost. The 32 c-minor variations of Beethoven and the 33 variations on the Diebelli waltz; Schumann's Symphonic Etudes; Brahms' series of variations, and among them especially that on a theme of Handel; and finally the variations from Tchaikovsky's Third Suite, and the variations from Taneev's String Quintet with two violoncelli are sufficient to permit one to trace consec-
utively the development in the processes of organization of identical material on the basis of the principle of repetition, from the first to the last decades of the nineteenth century. Acquaintance with the historically progressive approach to these compositions in the highest and most complex forms is achieved by a study of types of variational organization from approximately the sixteenth century. The best training aids in this respect are the diferencias of the Spanish lutenists and organists of the sixteenth century, the division and ground of the English violists and the virginalists of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, and the doubles of the French clavecinists of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries.

Three main stages may be observed in the evolution of variation, in terms of the difficulty in recognizing similarity. The first stage is that in which the ear still cannot part from the foundation or basis on which the new melodic formations are built. The bass keeps repeating the selected sound correlation or theme (hence the English name for such variations or identical formations: ground). The forms of passacaglia and chaconne are the epitome of the application of this principle. The next stage is that in which the composer rejects the monotonous, exact repetition of a basic formula, by modifying the bass, but, preserving inviolable the construction of a theme or an entire small piece of music, loads it in repetition with decoration and ornaments (this is typified by the French doubles). Final-
ly, the third stage consists of variations with only a very gradual disclosure of the possibilities of the theme—from purely decorative to symphonically developed execution. From Handel and Bach to Mozart and Beethoven, and from there to the variations of the romantic and contemporary composers, the path becomes even more complicated. The 30 variations in G Major (*Aria con XXX Variazioni*) by J. S. Bach, which appeared about 1742, are extremely significant, historically, as a watershed between variations of the canonic and contrapuntal style, and homophonic and harmonic variations. All these stages did not follow one another strictly chronologically, and the variational organization of material on an invariable bass (of the type of passacaglia and chaconne), for example, shows a great vitality. In 1885, in his Fourth Symphony, Brahms created a monumental finale based on an ostinato, eight-measure, e-minor theme of flexible line, significant for its melodic tension, which is achieved because the semitone located in the fifth measure (the raised fourth degree) introduces a striking "intonational asymmetry" in the motion of the theme, destroying evenness with its gravitational inclination

\[
\begin{align*}
&\text{e}^1 : \text{f}^\#1 : \text{g}^1 : \text{a}^1 : \text{a}^\#1 : \text{b}^1 : \text{b} : \text{e}^1
\end{align*}
\]

Returning to the simplest non-identical repetition of a motive or theme in a single-voiced texture, let us consider the uncomplicated types of reverse motion, which we may regard as symmetrically repeated. This is represented by the formula \((a:b)+(b:a)\). Its forms are extremely varied,
from the most primitive construction of a motive of two notes:

\[ \text{\fbox{\begin{tikzpicture}[scale=0.5]
\fill[blue!50] (0,0) circle (0.5cm);
\fill[red!50] (0,1) circle (0.5cm);
\fill[blue!50] (0,2) circle (0.5cm);
\fill[red!50] (0,3) circle (0.5cm);
\end{tikzpicture}}\] \]

to the melodic formulae of Bach, as in the first C major fugue from the Wohltemperiertes Klavier and, even more, the first C major invention, with the device characteristic for Bach of a melodic ascent by leap and reverse motion, filled in with close intervals in sequential treatment.*26 This device is so often used by Bach that it serves as the key to the understanding of one of the basic principles of motion and the organization of materials in his music; the dynamics of a leap are almost always followed by a gradual, smooth descent to the starting point (or below it, if it is necessary to prolong the motion).4 The frequent use of the sequence gives some passivity to such a descent, and is perceived as motion by inertia.*28 (The analogy rises automatically from the area of muscular-motor sensations, in connection with an ascent up a mountain or up the stairs, when the movement upward evokes an inclination to take large strides or to skip over steps, while, in descending,

---

4 As we will see later, this alternation of motion by leap and smooth motion is strikingly apparent in so many types of music, that it may be regarded, on the strength of its continuing recurrence, as one of the rules of musical organization, just as alternations of the expansion and contraction (gathering) of sound complexes are governed by rule.*27
the movements become smaller, filled in, and consequently more sluggish—not in the ordinary psychological sense as a sign of weak will, but in the biomechanical sense, as a necessity for braking and gradualness, in order to avoid the effects of acceleration.*29 This principle is one of the bases of Bach's mechanics. It is employed by him in fugues in order to set off the dynamic tension in moments of purely thematic exposition (statements of the "subject") from movements by inertia, which connects these passages and shifts the centers of sound. These are the so-called intermedii or interludes.*30

The Bach inventions contain many possibilities for the observation of a variety of methods for organizing material by means of direct and retrograde motion, since they permit one to trace each voice separately, and, at the same time, to trace the occurrence of this sort of progression in the polyphonic texture. The skill of Bach in developing motion from identical premises strikes one at every step. Employing the devices of augmentation and diminution, and also of inversion, in the execution of material, i.e., using principles of organization which were inherent in the imitative-canonic style, he achieved, with the aid of a very few basic principles, a remarkable variety in the transformation of a given sound correlation serving as an initial impulse.

Of course, the principle of imitation is of primary importance, in this connection, and is extremely fruitful.
The invention of imitation a "windfall" in its time\(^5\) revealed the possibility of a horizontally-mobile, polyphonic expansion of music, proceeding from a single prerequisite. This material, organized in some correlation, received the impulse toward motion from within itself. At the same time, the hearing and the memory, still not having become accustomed to the grasp of polyphonic musical motion on a large scale, had a continuous point of reference in the recurring appearance of the same intonational formula. Musical motion had already acquired the possibil-

---

\(^5\)The first use of imitation is attributed, according to contemporary studies, to the twelfth century. This is the device of *repetitio vocis.*\(^31\)

I cite an extremely characteristic example of medieval imitation of the thirteenth century (from the Montpellier Codex) as it is cited by M. Brenet in *Dictionnaire pratique et historique de la Musique* (Paris, 1926):

![Example notation](attachment://example.png)

[\*Typographical error. Should be a whole note.]

This same example is cited by Riemann in *Musikgeschichte in Beispielen* (Leipzig, 1911). A great many examples of forms of polyphony (forms of the interchange of identical intonations in different voices) are cited in the work of I. Miller-Blatau, *Grundzüge einer Geschichte der Fuge* (Konigsberg, 1923). The latter has an extensive bibliography of the given material. See also *The Oxford History of Music*, Vol. I. "The Polyphonic Period." by H.E. Woolftridge (Oxford, 1901).\(^32\)
ity of development on the basis of the constancy provided by the crossing over of identical elements into different voices at different times, while in any given moment there was contact between contrasting intonations. Here it is necessary to emphasize that the simple transferrence of identical elements from voice to voice, although helping to support the motion, still does not exert such an impulsive influence on it as imitation. This is understandable, for imitation is characterized by the insertion into one melodic line, of another line identical to it; it is not a simple continuation (repetition) in another voice, but

Here are several examples, given in the most condensed form, from the many in the first volume of the aforementioned Oxford History of Music (Abbrev., Wooldridge, p.), examples from the epoch of polyphony of the twelfth to the fourteenth century (organa), in which the principle of repetition occurs in the "exchange of voices" (more properly, "of melodic figures" and, in general, of identical melodic formations) and in sequences:

[Ex.4]

a)  

The tone c is held in the cantus firmus.

b)  

The tone d is held in the cantus firmus.
rather the **insertion** of the second line before the motion of the first line is completed. This makes possible the endless prolongation of the sound. In early forms of medieval polyphony, as we have just seen, the exchange and transferrence of identical elements from voice to voice is continually observed, but only the fact of the insertion of a new voice into the incomplete motion of the first intensifies the dynamics of motion, thanks to the impulsive character of the horizontal mobility of the voices. The principle of identity remains immutable in all types of imitation and is transformed into the development of one of its forms—the canon. The development and reinforcement of the tension of musical motion in the imitative-canonic style depends on the extent to which the devices of augmentation, diminution, inversion, and retrograde motion are employed, and also on the displacement of time, distance,

The tone g is held in the cantus firmus.
and place of entrance (or rather, of insertion) of the voices.

Canon is exact imitation, closed into an independent organism and strictly rationally constructed. As a crystallized form, canon, in essence, is a static formation and a mechanical phenomenon; in it the principle of motion from identity, as completely opposed to its occurrence in variational formations, is brought to extreme conclusions, while the idea of development of the artistic organism--an idea, nourishing both monothematic (variational), and polythematic (sonata, symphony, rondo) formations--is completely

Two-voiced Conductus (conductus duplex)

Rondellus
rejected. For that reason it is not surprising that the evolution of imitation as a stimulus to intensive motion did not stop at canon, but went in the direction of fugue, the most perfect form of the imitative style.

Fugue is also a strictly closed unity, and in this respect, approaches canon. But within the limits of this unity, it represents, not only a rationally constructed mechanism, but also a dynamic formation. This results from the primary characteristic of the fugue, which is, in contrast to canon, neither the observance of exact imitation in the face of the strictest limitations and difficulties in achieving it, nor the "stabilization" of the composition to the point at which the entire process of formation is completely predetermined and mechanized, but something quite opposite; it is the growth and development of motion from a monothematic prerequisite or from the identical execution of the same intonational formula (preserving unchanged a correlation of sound elements for the entire extent of the fugue), which is immediately revealed in two aspects (subject and answer), as a differentiated unity.

The assertion of the tonic-dominant correlation, as it occurs in the exposition of the fugue, was in its time an extremely vital factor of formation and a stimulus to new evolution. The development of motion and, corresponding to that, the dynamics of composition are utterly without significance for the form of a canon; the most important element in it is the exact coincidence—given a certain set
of conditions, and with correspondingly calculated insertions of the voices--of all the imitative passages. For this reason, the themes of a canon can be intonationally and dynamically neutral and inexpressive. On the other hand, themes of a fugue must be of a maximally distinct character, flexible, and potentially active, in the sense that they must cause and evoke the possibility of the development of motion, unrestricted by precise limits or bounds. The movement of a fugue (its growth and dynamics) depends on the theme as a nucleus, as a stimulus, and on the presence in it of inclinations toward motion. Here, the concept of energy -- sound energy or thematic energy -- must inevitably be introduced, because one cannot otherwise explain the differences between the mechanically predetermined, strictly closed progression of a canon and the organically developed movement of a fugue.

If we compare, for example, the theme of the D major fugue form Part I of the Wohltemperiertes Klavier with the themes of the c# minor and e minor fugues, then the essence of their difference is quickly sensed by the ear, and it is clear to any musician that neither a "smooth", melodious, song-like fugue, like the e minor, nor the severely concentrated c# minor fugue, could grow out of the D major theme--a rotating figure serving as a swing preparatory to a "leap", then a jump to the sixth, and a "step-wise" passage down to the point of departure. The character of a theme undoubtedly predetermines the character
of the music and the motion of a fugue. But how can one substantiate objectively the intuitive recognition of these undeniable factors, which define the precise influence of the theme on the whole structure of the fugue?
In the tone system in which Bach's fugues are organized, the correlation \( c^\# : b^\# : e : d^\# : c^\# \)--the theme of the \( c^\# \) minor fugue--is intensively concentrated. One has only to alter the correlation of the tones thus:

\( c^\# : b : e : d^\# : c^\# \), and the sharpness is gone. The point is that in the theme selected by Bach each moment of progression from sound to sound evokes a tense expectancy in the ear. The leading tone, \( b^\# \) follows the tonic \( c^\# \); this first correlation [that is, tonic to leading tone] is already a succession of tones contrary to the normal progression. Next, the significance of \( b^\# \) as a leading tone is so undermined by its "leap" of a diminished fourth, that to the ear it constitutes (enharmonically) a major third. Thus, the second correlation contains a dual character for aural evaluation, for the hearing of music is, I repeat, a process of the most intensive comparison of each intoned moment with that which precedes, and that which follows it. The duality is revealed by the fact that, taken outside its relation to \( c^\# \) independently, the correlation \( b^\# : e \) is perceived as consonant, just the same as if we had sounded the correlation \( c^\# : e \) without the \( b^\# \). But \( c^\# : e \) through \( b^\# \) gives a feeling of instability and demands continuation. At this point, the new relation, \( e : d^\# \) is intoned in which \( d^\# \), as if it were the initial tonic according to its duration, is twice the length of either \( b^\# \) or \( e \). This new feature complicates the relation, for even if the correlations \( c^\# : b^\# \) and \( e : d^\# \) were rhythmically identical, and
even with the obvious presence of ascent, comparison does not lead the ear to a feeling of equilibrium, since $d#$ in relation to $e$ is a minor second, in relation to $b#$ is a minor third, and in relation to the initial tonic is a major second. Moreover, $d#$ emphasizes the dissonance of $b#$ : $e$, and the stop on $d#$ before its drop to the point of departure, $c#$, accentuates still more the instability and expectancy. But at the moment when the $c#$ sounds, balancing the whole formula, the answer ($g#$) enters, begins to intone the theme a fifth higher, and thereby, picks up the motion.

Carried on as if "under a microscope," such a detailed analysis of the $c#$ minor theme displays a series of extremely unstable intonations within it. The identical motion of the answer, of course, reinforces the instability. At the same time, the restraint and shortness of the theme permit its frequent repetition; each repetition in a new context evokes further comparison of correlations, and the interest of the motion is renewed with each new execution, notwithstanding the pervasive repetition of the basic formula of sound conjugations. All this is absent in canon, a self-contained form. The dynamic qualities of the theme of a canon are not fundamental for its formation; its purely constructive features are most important. In the fugue, the stronger the capacity of the theme to evoke, by its occurrence, a feeling of intonational novelty and unusualness in the comparison of any given moment with all those
preceding it, the more tense is the entire course of the music and the richer is the potential for development contained in the theme. Consequently, the sound energy of any correlation of sounds is a relative quantity. It takes shape as an aggregate within the theme of the most unstable intonational features (in a given system of sound conjugations), in the same degree as their capacity to evoke further intensive motion.

The same can be observed in symphonic development; the dynamics of the theme of the first allegro of Beethoven's Fifth Symphony are revealed through a horizontally mobile conjugation or stratification of repetitions of the leading rhythmic-intonational formula, made up of three eighth notes with an accent on the sustained fourth sound. It is not possible to isolate the primary intonation, \( g : g : g : e_b \) from the whole succeeding development, because of the "ambiguity" resulting from the fact that this intonation could belong either to \( E_b \) major or to \( c \) minor. In the first instance this third would sound less intensive, because the stable assertion of the tonic would appear immediately. Here, however, Beethoven goes from the dominant (g) to the third (\( e_b \)) of the fundamental triad,

\[6\] The dux in canon, in essence, is not a theme [as it is in a fugue].
then, by repetitive motion \(^{37}\) from the subdominant (f) to the upper leading tone (d),\(^{38}\) thereby compelling the ear to take notice. The tension is reinforced by temporizing fermati. Only after the double intoning of the basic motive in the manner indicated, does the complete tonic triad appear, defining the mode. The repetition evokes comparison and the demand for synthesis, and for that reason it is necessary to consider as the theme of the Fifth Symphony, not two notes, \(g : e^\flat\), but a correlation \((g : e^\flat) + (f : d)\) evoking the triad \(g : e^\flat : c\),\(^{39}\) as the following reduction illustrates:

\[
\begin{array}{cccccccc}
\text{\textbf{\textit{f}}} & \text{\textbf{\textit{f}}} & \text{\textbf{\textit{f}}} & \text{\textbf{\textit{f}}} & \text{\textbf{\textit{f}}} & \text{\textbf{\textit{f}}} & \text{\textbf{\textit{f}}} & \text{\textbf{\textit{f}}} \\
\end{array}
\]

Thus the energy of a theme appears in the aggregate of the rhythmic intonational phases of its organization.
CHAPTER III

THE STUDY OF THE MOTIVE FORCES OF MUSICAL
ORGANIZATION AND THE CONCEPT OF ENERGY:
THE DYNAMICS OF IMPETUS: THE
ESTABLISHMENT OF THE
CONCEPT OF MUSICAL
FORM

The motive forces of music or the causes of musical
motion are determined according to the characteristics of
some system of sound relations, a system created within the
conditions of a given culture and depending on a multitude
of causes lying outside the system itself. From this point
of view, each musical composition is a complex of mobile
sound correlations, the totality of which may be a strictly
closed and stable form, or may be conceived in the form of
an endless series of links (open form). When such a tota­
ity is grasped by the mind as a crystallized unity in all
the complexity of its correlations, and is found as a whole,
to be completely at rest and in equilibrium, then it is
possible to talk about musical statics. The extraction
from this unity of rhythmic-constructive relations, taken
in immobility and without any relation to their actual
sounding (intoning), constitutes the subject of indepen­
dent techtonic analysis. On the other hand, the
predominance in intoned music of characteristics of stability, almost to the point at which it is not felt necessary to transfer from one vertical structure (complex of simultaneous consonances), to another, in the same way permits one to call the composition static, but here, in the sense of opposition to dynamically mobile music. Thus, for example; tonal relations of thirds, the favorite of the Romanticists, in their own time were a reaction to the tonic-dominant relations which had begun to be too often employed and were beginning to lose the force of their influence. Coloristically fresh, they, nevertheless, soon turned out to be inert in a constructive sense and in the end did not eclipse the significance of the tonic-dominant sphere. Included in this sphere, however, they appreciably enriched and strengthened the intensity of its influence as a stimulus of motion.

If one examines a musical composition in its concrete reality—in motion, for it is, first of all a complex of mobile sound relations—then one must inevitably pass from the stage of the study of form-schemes (forms in immobility or crystallized intonations) to the observation of the stages of motion in music or the processes of its organization, and from observation to the study of the forces which serve as causes or stimuli of motion. This is the area of musical dynamics. In terms of musical dynamics, the evolution of musical forms appears as the striving of human thought to achieve the maximum extension (within
established norms) of musical motion, in other words, to intensify the effect of the stimuli which stir the growth and continuation of motion (and with it the energy of a given sounding mass), and to postpone, as long as possible, the approach of the moment of equilibrium. The means by which such an aim was fulfilled varied a great deal along the path of evolution, and the evolution itself proceeded in a far from consistently progressive manner, but rather, through a series of mutations and digressions; but in its essence the process remained the same for centuries. The idea of the "endless melody" of Wagner, in this connection, seems neither more worthwhile nor newer than the intensive striving toward the germination and progression of the polyphonic fabric of the composers of the medieval motet in the flowering of the *ars nova* (the fourteenth century) or, still earlier (the twelfth and thirteenth centuries), of the masters of the Parisian school of *Notre Dame* in their *organa*.

Of course, in other epochs, tendencies toward the reinforcement of stimuli which establish equilibrium and dominate over "explosive forces", have prevailed. But, in the first place, by its very nature, music can never be absolutely static, and the striving toward the formation of more and more complicated sound correlations has always led to an increase of motion. In the second place, in connection with epochs of "static" music, it is necessary to be particularly careful, in order not to substitute one's own
auditory ideas, for those people of earlier periods of musical evolution. That which may seem to us to be the compositional statics of the past, in its own time could have been perceived as much more piquant.*41

As an example is the style of Palestrina, the classical perfection of which, in the light of contemporary studies of Morris*42 and Knud Jeppesen,*43 appears to be far from academic placidity and serenity. Rather, it is a consequence of the complicated interaction of contrasting factors, i.e., a formation growing from contradictions and teeming with conflicts.

The first task in the study of the formation of music as a dynamic art is, for that reason, the observation of motive causes (forces) which organize motion (in the sense noted—the postponement of the attainment of equilibrium) and the study of their operation.1 The concept of the leading tone, for example, from the point of view of the study of musical form as a formation of motive forces, may be analyzed in the sense of the disclosure of those characteristics within it which stimulate motion.

The place of the leading tone in the system of European

---

1I would remind the reader that these motive forces are forces entering into the process of intoning, and not mystical initial causes.
intoning permits it to be considered as one of the unquestionable forces which evoke intensive sound gravitation. To the non-European listener, accustomed to another system of sound conjugations, the energy of the leading tone does not produce the same effect as on the European who accepts music within the limits of equal temperament and tonal relations. However, the objective significance of the leading tone as a moving force, and the significance of other factors of organization—for example, the suspension, or the "deceptive" cadence (the resolution of the dominant to the sixth degree) --as phenomena which postpone the establishment of equilibrium are not at all diminished. Without the study of the stimuli which evoke motion and the forces which operate within it, the study of the processes of organization is not possible; but without the study of these processes any study of form ceases to be an investigation of the concrete qualities of musical formation and is transformed into no more than a study of schemes. There is, of course, one scheme for the sonata allegro, but there are as many forms of its occurrence as there are sonatas. In order to understand them, other than schematically, it is necessary to classify them according to the similarity of principles of organization which originate from the dynamics of sound, rather than to reject as an exception everything
The concepts of harmonic consonance* and dissonance, examined in a musically dynamic (not accoustical or psycho-physiological) sense are studied in the same way as causes which arrest or reinforce motion, i.e., as forces. In such a case, the confusion heaped around them is cleared away. Consonance and dissonance emerge as factors of style i.e., as the most practical expressive media of music, for style as a complex of the media of expression of a given epoch or master is conditioned by the operation of laws of selection. These laws, on the one hand, strengthen the most vital media and devices by which art exerts an influence, and, on the other, they establish not only the criteria of high artistic value, which are characteristic for a given environment, but the very concept of what is artistic. Thus, a connection is observed, so it would seem, between inherently musical dynamics, together with the processes of musical organization, and the surrounding structure of society, the environment which engenders the music.

Without enumerating here all the "categories" of forces

\[2\] For example, the prolonged evolution of the seventh of the dominant chord--the "restriction or freedom" of its employment--permits one to consider several stylistically differing epochs, and aids the classification of compositions in a strictly musical sense, without bringing in acoustics and physiology, which must explore this same phenomenon in their own spheres.
which excite musical motion (in perception, their influence is felt either as a departure from a moment of rest, or as an intensive urge toward it, as, for example, the effect of the leading tone), we may return to the attempt, already made, to define the concept of musical energy with more illuminating data. In the theme of the c\# minor fugue, reasons were established for the feeling in it of an intense instability from the initial tonic, c\#, to its reappearance. The tonic could have occurred immediately after the leading tone, b\#, as is expected in the rationally stable condition of the melodic minor mode; however, since the tonic, c\#, did not follow the b\# directly, and the appearance of the next tonic was "delayed", for a period of musical time, under the influence of the intonations designated above, motion was evoked and an expenditure of energy was produced, accompanied by characteristic transformations of quantity (the correlations of tone vibrations) into quality (irritation and reaction).\textsuperscript*\textsuperscript{45} The more intensively this expenditure of energy is felt, the more complex is the activity of the consciousness, comparing each new moment of sound with that which precedes it ("the hearing of music"\textsuperscript*\textsuperscript{46}).\textsuperscript{3}

\textsuperscript{3}I submit that, with this strong emphasis on the process of the perception of music, by which the activity of the consciousness (the comparison and evaluation of similarities and dissimilarities) is organized, I do not at all reject the content of music and its emotional influence,
The concept of energy cannot help but be applied to the phenomenon of the combination of consonances, because otherwise the concept of musical material ("sounding matter")—that is to say, the physical reality of music—is completely destroyed. The problem is raised thus, since in the study of the processes of musical formation it is quite impossible to exclude the fact of sounding or intoning (not in the passive, but in the active sense of this concept, as the moment-by-moment exposure of material), and, for that reason, in whatever way the results of intoning and musical motion are defined—whether it be the expression of an emotional state or the satisfaction experienced from a pleasant combination of sounds—the fact of work, the fact of the transfer of some expended force into a series of sound movements, and the recognition of the consequences of this transfer in perception, is present in music, as in other phenomena of the surrounding world.

If the composer, in his creation, produces work, and thereby expends a part of his vital energy, then the concrete form of this work—the musical composition—will be as does the alleged "formalist". It is possible to feel the force of any sort of physical blow as pain, but it is also possible to recognize it as a cause, engendering some kind of action and energy. Here I am attempting to recognize these motivating causes in music. The leading tone which Grieg, in his melodics, so often led away from the tonic to the dominant, is a motive force of great tension.

I. perception, the phenomenon evokes a feeling of uncommonness, then of dissatisfaction, without losing its objective musical significance as a dynamic factor.
a form of transformation of the energy of the composer. Till the composition sounds, till it is intoned, it might as well not exist. Some form of intoning, beginning with the mental sounding or "reading" of the score, then the performance in an arrangement or in its original form, transforms the potential energy of the music intoned by the composer into kinetic sound energy (reproduction), which is converted, in its turn, in the act of listening to the music, into a new form of energy--"emotional experience." This series of transformations constitutes the necessary path of music from the first steps of its conception in the composer's imagination, under the influence of his environment, to its perception by a sensitive listener. Whether one considers that the composer quite deliberately "infects" the listener with a definite feeling, or that he "translates" the surplus of his vital energy into the energy of sounds, the result, i.e., the fact of "infection", always occurs through the medium of musical material, through a complex of sound correlations, selected by the composer and fixed in musical notation. In order that the result be exactly what the composer wants, it is necessary that the listener also be capable of understanding music, i.e., be culturally developed to such an extent that sound correlations do not appear to him as an accidental collection of consonances. Beside that he must be emotionally and ideologically pre-
disposed toward those experiences with which the composer wishes to "infect" him through his music. Considering the complexity of the problems of musical content and the closely connected problem of the transfer of energy from the composer to the listener through an organized complex of sound correlations, i.e., through the composition, it has been necessary to indicate the possibilities of their solution in the study of the process of formation. Thus, the place of the musical composition, as one form of the transformation of energy, is established between the creative act and its perception. The kind of energy, by which musical motion manifests itself, is intonational energy, unfolded in the motion of sound. It may excite in the listener certain emotions, in so far as it is transformed in him, but the listener can also analyse its manifestations in the musical process itself, in the unfolding of the flow of sound. Sound energy, beyond its transformation into experience, manifests itself in double form: as the occurrence of work of either more or less extended duration of motion, and as the presence of the force which organizes this motion, i.e., the process of the organization of material. For example, the leading tone is a force which draws sound, as a given relation, into a certain motion. But the work or effect of this motion is felt as the gravitation of the leading tone to the tonic. In this sense, it is possible to speak about
the energy of the leading tone and, in just the same way, about the energy of the tritone interval, and in general, about the **qualitative** differences of the distances between tones (but not about their mechanical displacement) in systems of sound correlations other than those used exclusively in the European system.\textsuperscript{50}

The concept of energy infers, as its consequence, the concept of musical motion and of the forces or stimuli which evoke it and operate within it; these same forces or stimuli infer a concept of impetus as a phenomenon from which the motion itself arises, and on which the development of the energy of motion depends. Physically, from without, the impetus is either a blow on the keyboard, or the moment of blowing into an instrument, with its inevitable accent. The energy of breathing provides the force and energy of sounding. But the concept of an impetus is also felt in the musical motion itself. First of all, this is moment of the beginning of a musical *conjugation*. A blow on the keyboard and an isolated sound, without further continuation, does not form music. Only an impetus or blow which draws our consciousness into a system of sound relations receives musically dynamic significance, since it becomes a force which evokes motion.
Analyzing the further organization of Bach's c# minor figure, after the statement of the theme by the leading voice, will help one to understand the role of impetus. When the theme, with the second appearance of the tonic, passes for a moment into equilibrium and can, in principle, remain in a state of rest (bar 4, example on p. 235), at that moment the answering voice enters with the theme intoned a fifth higher. The initial sound (g^#) of the answer is perceived as an extremely active impetus and an accent because it "takes up" the motion of the leading voice, which at that moment has reached a point of support, and with it a state of equilibrium, for the d^# as a sound which gravitates in its descent to the stable c^#--to the tonic--fulfills the function of an upper leading tone.\textsuperscript{51} G^# converts the motion into a new stage just at that moment when a close could occur. If the g^# of the answer had occurred a half-measure later, its force as an impetus and the new influx of energy evoked by it would have been somewhat less significant. The next entrance of the subject (c^#) does occur a half-measure after the theme "exposed" by the answer has attained a point of rest. Its dynamics at the moment are not only not reduced, but are reinforced, since the theme of the answer before it, having attained the tonic (g^#), does not achieve equilibrium.
because of the fact that the lower voice forms the suspension of a second with it. In the same way, the new entrance of the subject occurs in a very critical moment; the $c^\#$ (tonic) in the upper voice sounds simultaneously with the sharply contrasting tone, $d^\#$, in the lower voice. This $d^\#$ fulfills the same function here, of the upper leading tone and carries the voice along to the tonic. Because of the suspension, the tonic occurs on the fourth, the weak beat of the measure, and the $d^\#$ temporarily receives the significance of rest, by which the significance of the tonic ($c^\#$) as the point of departure is compromised. As a result, equilibrium is not yet restored in the lower voice; from $c^\#$ the motion returns to $d^\#$, sharply clashing with the two upper voices, and once more goes to the tonic ($c^\#$) where it seems to attain stability. But, on the one hand, in this lower voice inertia of motion occurs, which evokes a suspension similar to the preceding ones (measures 4-5, 6-7, 8-9) with a "recoil" downward after the resolution; on the other hand, the stability or consonance of the second half of the eighth measure is undermined by the functional significance of $e$ in the upper voice. This $e$ does not at all appear as a stable tone, but rather, as a diminished fourth following the $b^\#$, it strongly demands further motion. Beside that, the equilibrium resulting from the consonance of the vertical on a relatively weak part of
the measure sounds as a feminine ending. It appears as a passing equilibrium because of the conflict between the functional harmonic significance of the generated vertical complex (e--g#--c# reading from the top down) and the functional significance of each individual tone of the complex in a melodic relation as a point of the horizontal. Furthermore, if we even admit the intonational significance of this complex as a tonic foundation, then it enters into opposition with the rhythmic-constructive position of the chord, as it was just pointed out, on the comparatively weak part of the measure. All these causes together evoke further motion and the development of sound energy. With each new impetus, each new entrance, the force of sound tension is increased and the size of the sound space is expanded. In relation to the further development of the fugue, the entire exposition is a process of the accumulation of energy.

It is not necessary to continue further analysis of the motion of the c# minor fugue from the point of view of the dynamic functions of its organizing elements and the concentration of the energy of motion. With the aid of these explanations, it is not at all difficult to conduct the analysis to the end of this fugue, and to apply

---

4 This is a characteristic example of the dialectical trend of musical motion, in which the "horizontal" and the "vertical" occur as functionally conflicting coordinates. More in detail about this later.
it to any other. It is necessary now to extract some essential conclusions in terms of the formal structure, from the process we have examined and from the observations which have been made.

We have just mentioned an extremely important factor in this connection, namely, the contradiction between the functional and intonational significance of the tonic at the point of its attainment, and the rhythmic and constructive order or distribution of the sound elements. The fact that the occurrence of the tonic complex does not coincide with the strong part of the measure prevents the establishment of full equilibrium. In addition, in the intonational-dynamic scheme a conflict is continually felt between the functional dependence and role of each individual tone as a point in the mobile horizontal (melodic scheme) and the function of this same tone as a consonance belonging to some vertical complex. In other words, any given conjugation of tones can be regarded in two coordinates, that is, in the scheme of interaction both of the rhythmic-techtomic (or constructive) principles and of the intonational-dynamic principles of formation. The totality of these phenomena and the forces, mentioned earlier (but far from enumerated), which operate within the given modal tendencies, permits one to examine the process of the formation of music as a dialectical process with the continuous coexistence of opposites.
Depending upon which of the functional values of tones is regarded as maximally expressive by the consciousness of the epoch, and of the composer, either vertical complexes predominate ever linear inclinations, or vice versa. The motive forces change in each type of musical organization, and the force which dominates in one case may almost be left out of consideration in another. But, in all cases, the effect of the forces is directed toward overcoming the resistance of the material—one might say toward the transformation of an acoustical phenomenon into the emotionally expressive language of music—and toward the organization of motion. From this point of view, any system of sound conjugation, whether it be the European tonal system in different periods of its existence, with the greater or lesser predominance of the principle of alteration [chromatics], or the archaic pentatonic system, or other antique scales, conditioned by the number of strings and tuning of the lyre, arises as a result of the selection of tones within the sphere of acoustical phenomena, with a view toward the possibility of organizing music within the limits of a circle of intonations demanded by a given environment. Within the limits of a system of sound conjugation which is worked out as the result of a prolonged series of efforts and adaptations of the ear and arises from socially recognized demands, music is created and intoned in a continuous
striving for the establishment of stable and balanced sound correlations, which make up a sort of basic fund of intonations. At the same time, however, there is an equally persistent trend toward the replacement of these crystallized complexes with new ones. I explain in Supplement #2 ("Bases of Musical Intonation") how the feeling of resistance of [musical] material is weakened, and how sound correlations, which were perceived as intensively expressive, cease to be so.*53

However, is the objective meaning of such intonations which have become "archaic" thereby lost for musicology? Of course not. If the functional significance of the cantus firmus in a motet of the ars nova or in the masses of the Franco-Flemish school is alien to our intonational system, then the researcher who wishes to understand this practice of music must first of all try to assimilate the functions of the elements of the system prevailing at that time. Similarly, if a composer like Hindemith should wish to compose in the scheme of harmonic thinking of Schumann or Liszt, he would have to accept the functions of the tones as those composers accepted them.*54

Thus, study of the occurrence of the stimuli of musical motion and of the energy of motion, in the history of musical development, indicates the necessity for regarding this motion as a dialectical process in which the tendencies toward equilibrium are, simultaneously, refuted by
the no less strong impulse toward postponement of the achievement of equilibrium and, along with it, of the complete crystallization of the given correlations. Such a complete crystallization is never practicable, because each of the correlations, having become familiar, without losing its objective functional significance in the given system, ceases to be felt by the collective consciousness as a flexible and urgent formula of conjugation and gives up its place to the new when there is a change in the relations of production which this system reflects in its musical "specifics." The epochs of academicism in music are the epochs of the predominance of combinations which are pleasing to the majority of people, and are, as much as possible (but not absolutely), habitual. The epochs of crisis and struggle are the result of the search by musicians for more intensive and unfamiliar combinations, which therefore have a sharper impact, and the adaptation of the listening habits of the environment to these combinations.

Since the complete crystallization of the sound relations of any given epoch is unattainable, the conventional study of forms as completed schemes always lags behind musical formation in its concrete historical reality, and form-schemes, which systematize the already discarded intonational experience of former generations enter into irreconcilable conflict with new formations. Consequently,
in the activity of composers, it is necessary to distinguish two basic inclinations in terms of changing processes of organization. Some composers, reflecting the tastes and psyches of the class, of which they are the ideologues, continue to assert deductively methods of formation, accumulated in previous experience, while others, proceeding from new properties of sound conjugations newly "discovered" by the ear, establish new principles of formation. Some, therefore, adapt conventional schemes to the given material, others seek in unfamiliar material forms for its exposure which correspond to the force of its expressiveness. Thus the dialectic of musical organization is formed.

Proceeding from all the stated prerequisites, any musical motion, which, both as a whole and in any given feature, is perceived as a formation of its organizing forces--as an act of organization--must be considered as a condition of unstable equilibrium, enclosed between the first impetus (point of support, starting point, or point of departure) and the final formula (conclusion or cadence) which closes the motion. These beginning and closing formulae must be distinguished from impetuses and cadences within the given process of the unfolding of the music, which partially close the motion of the individual stages and appear as cadence-landmarks and as distributors of the sound flow. They reinforce some direction of motion, or deflect it, or indicate something new. The history
of the development of the perfect cadence, as a formula which takes in conjugations fundamental and characteristic for all the systems of sound relations of a series of epochs, represents the most important chapter in the evolution of musical formation, and this evolution, in its turn, in the light of the dynamic study of musical forms, is a prolonged struggle to fill, as intensively as possible, the ever increasing space of the "course" between the point of departure and the point of restored equilibrium by utilizing the energy of sound conjugation and gravitation.

The variety of sound relations has not, even to the present time, been exhaustively classified in its historical setting, but the basic principles of organization are still open to observation and generalization. However modest these attempts at observation and generalization may be, they must not be rejected, just as we must not neglect any hypotheses which might help to explain the various phenomena in the complicated processes of musical formation. Such a procedure is characteristic for any system of research. The classification and systematization of form-schemes in a purely constructive sense, avoiding penetration into the essence of the intonational processes and the transformations of sound energy which give rise to these crystallized schemes, is of no use for the comprehension of the laws of musical motion in its
organization, in the act of formation, and in the convers-

sion of certain forms into others. Without in any way

negating the usefulness of this kind of research, one

must not ignore its limitations and the dangers connected

with the notion of forms as schemes, indifferent to the

properties of the material and seemingly filled with

content from without. This formalistic notion played an

extremely harmful role in separating form from intonation,

and carried to absurdity the dualism of form and content,

passing over the fact that music, as a sensually spontan-

eous apprehension of the world, is the exposure of materi-

al in forms of motion, organized by human consciousness

and skill (the technique of art). Indeed, even primitive

forms of musical "signalling" emerge, in their influence,

as organized sound correlations. Otherwise, music would

not have moved further than the stage of intonational

interjections. The city-dweller of our epoch may not

even suspect the existence of scales, nor study the "ele-

mentary theory" of music, but the primary, basic sound

correlations (which are already forms) of the European

musical system have sunk deeply into his consciousness

and memory from the experience of perceiving music, whether

at home, on the street, at concerts, in motion pictures,
or in restaurants, and he himself, without suspecting the

fact, experiences the emotional impact of music only

through its form. To people, who do not perceive music
in terms of organization, it seems to be chaos and noise. This is easy to observe when even highly cultured listeners of the ruling class collide in their perception with unfamiliar intonational turns and forms in the music which occurs in the environment to which they are related by class. The opposite is apparent when the departing class accepts the music of the class coming to replace it, on the grounds of its simplicity and general accessibility, as a reaction to refined tastes; as an example we may cite the success in aristocratic circles, of the bourgeois comic opera (properly, the vulgar, genre, lyric comedy) with its thematics and semantics, on the eve of the Great French Revolution. In just the same way, many prominent representatives of the Austrian aristocracy met Beethoven halfway, while in the bourgeois environment, for a long time, strong resistance to his art arose (the history of the spread of Beethoven symphonies, at least, speaks of this), since the listening habits [of the emerging class] were still in a formative stage. Beethoven was acknowledged, so to speak, by the opposition, through the art of the Romantics.*55
PART TWO

STIMULI AND FACTORS OF MUSICAL FORMATION
CHAPTER IV

IMPETUS AND CLOSE OF MOTION (CADENCE)

Each musical composition unfolds between a primary impetus (point of departure, moment of pushing off) and a braking, or close of motion (cadence). The observation of the impetus, the pushing off or beginning of musical motion, is as important as the study of the process of closing. Although something has been achieved in relation to the classification of cadences as closing formulae, and a partial attempt has even been made to trace the evolution of the perfect cadence (Alfredo Casella, *L'evoluzione della musica a traverse la storia della Cadenza perfetta*, 1924), unfortunately, when it comes to research on the devices and intonational formulae which determine the beginning of motion, one can gather material only with great difficulty. In fact, anything important in this connection is yielded only by observation. Much depends on the force and character of the starting point or initial source (impetus) of motion. From the psychological point of view, the first moment of intoning draws the attention of the listener into the
forthcoming formation of music. In this musically dynamic process, the first source of motion determines its immediate direction, its degree of force and velocity, and its character and rhythm. But there is no absolute "measure" of the impetus in music, and, although the first sound, as the first irritant, is naturally the point of departure of the music, it is not just the first tone—the first moment of intoning, nor even the first conjugation of sounds—which may be considered as an impetus. The impetus is not a sharply delimited intonation, but rather the function of a tone or series of tones (sound conjugations), which establish themselves in a given formation, in the capacity of the initial stimuli of motion.

Just as in the process of the closing of motion clear-cut forms of finality may occur which gather within themselves characteristic elements of the mode, while at the same time whole sections (codas) may serve, in relation to all the foregoing development, as a braking and closing synthesis, in the same way, there are methods of commencing, peculiar to a given style, beginning intonations which are sometimes reduced to favorite formulae, while at the same time a whole group of sound conjugations may become an impetus. In the large cyclic forms, a large and broadly developed introduction often serves as the initial source of motion in its relation to the following sonata allegro. All sorts of melodies,
ritornelli, and refrains in small forms, may also properly be regarded as starting features of the musical formation. In the process of development of a rondo, the continuous return to the principle melody to the theme, which presents itself, at the same time, as a refrain function inherited from the folk khorovod song with choral refrain (the medieval Rundgesang takes on meaning even more significant for the process of organization than any melodies in couplet or dance forms. In a rondo of this type, the continuous gravitation toward the initial source indicates the necessity to cling to the starting moment as the organizationally strongest and most unifying factor of all the motion. Otherwise, without this factor, the whole unfolding of motion and the process of organization in the rondo have no stable connections and are supported by functionally unsteady comparisons of little validity. The return to the initial source is a characteristic sign of this form (derived from the aforementioned circle-dancing song). In opera, the overture and entractes before the acts fulfilled the role of the initial source. The Wagnerian Vorspiel (in Lohengrin, Tristan, Die Meistersinger, and Parsifal) concisely summarizes, in symphonic form, the entire act, and serves as a dramatic introduction or point of departure for it.

Thus, analyzing, in the most general way, the impetus or initial feature of musical motion in terms of the
process of intoning, the following manifestations of it may be distinguished: the first sound\(^1\), then the first conjugation of sounds characteristic for all further motion, which determines both rhythm and tonality, and finally, the enlarged introduction (for example, the slow introduction of a symphony). One can regard any given formation of music, in its full extent, as a "course from the first impetus to the last cadence, and can simultaneously observe, within this formation, separate "impetuses and brakings" subordinated to the whole. In this course, the first and following impetuses, as determinants of motion, operate at varying distances from one another. Here it is necessary to remember, that each initial feature of intoning has as its immediate goal the engaging of the consciousness of the listener in the tone\(^2\) in the sphere of musical formation, on the basis of a system of correlations of sound peculiar to a given epoch and social environment. If we take some medieval intonational formula of psalmody or of recitation, we may usually distinguish within it the following divisions: the initial feature (Initium), recitation on the basic tone (Tenor) with a caesural half-cadence (Metrum), and

---

\(^1\) That is, the very fact of beginning to intone the music--its disclosure for the listeners.
the conclusion (Punctum), for example.²

It is as if the voice "stealthily approaches" the desired point of stability, but does not attack it immediately. The impetus here is the "approach" and the device for fixing the tone on which the recitation is conducted.

The corresponding function of any finality, of any cadence, is to conclude the motion in the sphere of a given system of sound correlations. It is usually in that sphere in which the music appeared at the beginning or at the time of the principal, leading stages of formation. Thus, if Beethoven's First Symphony in C major does not begin with chords of the tonic, but the concluding cadence of the first movement is, nevertheless, on the C major triad, so that it corresponds to the triad of the tonality of the main part of the allegro, but not to the initial impetus, this is in no way inconsistent with the requirement that the cadence must draw together the basic group of tones established for the given piece of music.

²This is one of the intonational formulae of the eight church tones. (Example taken from G. Adler, Handbuch der Musikgeschichte [Frankfurt am Main: Frankfurter Verlags-Anstalt, 1924], p.90).
This basic, established group of tones is revealed as a result of the gravitation of the entire slow introduction of the symphony toward the first point (the C major triad) of the first theme and toward the main part as a whole; furthermore, the formation of music preceding this point and this thematic group is an impetus of great force and length, which, in proportion to the extent of its development, intensively evokes and prepares its "resolution," its "discharge," in the music of the main part. In this way, the dynamic essence of any organically conceived musical introduction is revealed. In the primitive intonation cited above, the role of the impetus, or of the initial sounds, is such that inevitably, within the conditions of a given modal system, a certain tone is evoked, and no other. Though entirely different in both its music and its scope, the impetus to the first allegro of the Beethoven symphony (it has within it, in its formation, both its own impetuses and moments of closing) is, in fact, not so far from its predecessor. Beethoven also, instead of beginning directly with the tonal base of this movement of the symphony, "leads" the ear to it from afar, from chords on other degrees of the mode. To the contemporaries of Beethoven the approach seemed remote, but we now hear the first chords of the introduction as harmonies which are not at all alien to the C major structure. The formula of medieval psalmody led the ear
to the **tone**, proceeding through related, characteristic degrees of a given mode; the difference with Beethoven rests only in the degree of emphasis of the very same method, and not in its essence.

Thus, the first function of an impetus is the engaging of the ear in the basic **tone** (tonal sphere) of the music which is about to be unfolded. In how much space the impetus operates depends on various factors, not only on its energy, but also on the character of the motion and other features of this section of the piece. Of course, the sound saturation and tension, occurring, for example, in the introductory section of Beethoven's Seventh Symphony, and the very stirring feeling of expectation which is evoked by the beginning of the Ninth Symphony, occurring as vibrating space from which the theme is born—these "sample beginnings" or "initiatory intonations" reveal the widest perspectives of musical formation. But this does not at all mean that more concentrated and clear-cut introductory intonations, which do not teem with contrasting formations, cannot evoke, or "motivate" motion. This second, so to speak, energetic function of any point of departure or of an entire introductory section of music, serving as a motivating force, (the evocation of the energy of motion and the operation of the impetus at a distance) is implemented in two ways; either the attention of the listener is engaged by a
gradual "accumulation" of sound combinations, apparently remote from the goal (the exposure of the tonic or principal theme), or else, as the result of the occurrence of a short, sharp, and tonally defined intonation, the listener is immediately introduced into the sphere in which the given formation will develop. This may be an invocatory fanfare (this very often occurs in marches), or an introductory formula employed in a given epoch, in a given style (as, for example, the beginning of the "Jupiter" Symphony of Mozart), or, finally, simply a chord or even a single tone taken by the whole orchestra forte, as a call to attention (the overtures to Egmont, Coriolanus, Leonore No. 3, and the Second Symphony of Beethoven).

Glinka begins the overture to Ruslan... with a full-voiced intoning of the chords of the perfect cadence formula (I, IV, V, I of D major). Rimski-Korsakov begins the introduction to the opera, Christmas Eve, with a succession, of triads in the third relation, which is characteristic for the whole work—in its own way, a musical motto. In the beginning of Mozart's overture to The Marriage of Figaro there is a "run" of strings within

3 In Coriolanus this introductory tone sounds directly before the theme, in Egmont it is a call to the introductory music. The same is true in Leonore No. 3 and the Second Symphony.

4 The cadence here fulfills a function contrary to its essence; it becomes the beginning intonation of motion, or, in other words, is transferred into its opposite. It will be necessary to return again to this phenomenon.
the limits of the tonic-dominant system, which includes the semitones "neighboring" to the principal degrees (and among them alterations), by which a modal synthesis is immediately achieved, i.e., the inclusion not only of the basic tonality, but also of accompanying ones; the intensive motion of this overture evokes the impression of D major, as a synthesized tonality, seemingly uninterrupted. No less remarkable is the slow introduction of the overture to Weber's *Der Freischütz*; it not only contains the potential of the succeeding allegro, but also holds the nucleus for the development of the music of the entire opera in the comparison of the light, calmly contemplative feeling of nature (genre French horns) and the feeling of tension, evoked by the *tremolo* [in the violins and violas], with low clarinets, and blows of the timpani (*pianissimo*), and with the *pizzicato* of the basses [mm. 9-36]. The romantics of nature (we might say, the forest by day with the sun, and the forest at night) are the *leitmotiv* of this whole opera.

I have intentionally referred to still another new factor--the coloring of the music in the introduction to an overture--in order to demonstrate that this factor plays an extremely important role in the formation of "introductory attitudes". But the very beginning, the first eight measures of the overture to *Der Freischütz*, appearing as the starting point of the whole introduction,
is equally interesting. As a scheme of impetus this is a simple comparison of the tonic and dominant, but as an intoned formula of initii, it is dynamic. Let us listen to it carefully. From the tonic C the correlation of the upper and lower semitones (b and d)\textsuperscript{64} is drawn out. A pause interrupts the sound (but not the motion).\textsuperscript{5} The first violins "transfer" the sound downward, filling in the octave leap, but do not sound the dominant, g. On the other hand, the succeeding analogous stage of music--the identical intonation from g--does not touch upon the tonic. This device achieves both a feeling of contrast on the basis of identity, and a tonal synthesis, since all the elements of the C major scale are given. At the same time, the direction of motion from tonic to dominant (contrary to the Beethoven introduction in the First Symphony) evokes a new gravitation toward the tonic.

\textsuperscript{5}The dynamic function of pauses, in a musical formation, is extremely significant. A pause--the sign of silence--does not at all discontinue musical motion, nor cut off perception from a circle of sound conjugations, and is, therefore, a factor of musical organization. A pause most often "cuts off" the quantity of sound, but a cut-off sound complex continues to have an influence (it does not lose its functions) and, having ceased actually to sound, reinforces the tension of motion, that is, evokes still greater tenseness of attention, as for example, in the beginning of the overture to Der Freischütz. A pause in polyphonic style, before the thematic entrance of a voice, assists in the discernment of its function and accentuates the impetus. A pause, a caesura, interrupting the motion as an unexpected obstacle or as a sort of dam, reinforces its intensity.
The starting feature of Weber's overture to Oberon sounds both as the leitmotiv of the opera, and as an attractive stimulus, disclosing alluring perspectives to the ear (a similar device is used in the overtures to Rimski-Korsakov's May Night). A complete contrast to vague "Romantic distances" is the beginning of the overture to The Magic Flute of Mozart, where the sharp blows of chords, then the plastic unfolding of modal formulae and assertive syncopes, dynamically, rather than coloristically, prepare the attention. This stately, but tense motion seemingly cuts itself off, in order the more intensively to permit the theme of the allegro to burst forth.6

But the slow introduction does not always play the role of a direct impetus. Sometimes it is detached from the allegro and forms an independent section, but between it and the tonal sphere to which it must lead is wedged a "preparatory run"x65 (most often on the dominant organ

---

6 An analogous device is the beginning of Glinka's Jota Aragonesa; this Grave is so dynamic (thanks to harmonic complexes remarkable for their own conjugateness and to the accented intonational significance of the tone, d, by means of the "show" of changeability of its functions) that the entire subsequent E♭ major allegro is perceived in its main function as a discharge of the energy accumulated in the Grave, as the tonic sphere which supports this Grave and resolves it.
point, with an indispensable crescendo, i.e., a simultaneous increase of the quantity of sounds and the force of sonority). This preparatory run serves as a powerful dynamic impetus. We may cite as examples, the overture to *Prince Igor* by Borodin-Glazunov (a preparatory run with fanfares on the organ point, A, before the main part, and a preparatory run within the overture in the form of a B♭ major construction of one of the melodies from the sphere of melody of Konchak), the preparation of the allegro in the first movement of Tchaikovsky's Third Symphony, the "formula of transition" to the theme after the introduction in the first movement of Beethoven's Fourth Symphony, etc. A similar method for the "gathering of energy" before the accent on any important feature in the formation of music, as this appears in the given examples, occurs especially often in the so-called "pedals" or organ points, which prepare the reprise (and, in operas, before the finales or especially important occurrences or events). Such "internal stimuli" must be regarded as factors of formation, which are very essential from a dynamic point of view.

There remains still another function of impetus, similar to the initio, but within the formation, which serves to affirm the tone, i.e., to re-establish the basic tonal sphere after prolonged digressions. This occurs not only before the reprise, but
also before the Coda, with the aim of achieving the proper intensity (a wonderful example, because of its identity with the preceding motion and its naturalness, is the organ point on the tonic, serving as the beginning of the Coda in the overture to Mozart's *Marriage of Figaro*). It is possible to introduce other curious compositions in which the whole process of formation represents a series of consecutive organ points. Each stage of such music is perceived as an accumulation of sound energy and a strenuous preparation for [its] discharge, for summation; but the bass shifts and an analogous process occurs till the motion again transfers into the initial sphere (it need not be identical material), and thus the desired equilibrium is delayed for some time. Remarkable classical examples of such formations may be found in the toccatas of the seventeenth century. For example, in a toccata in F by Frescobaldi the stages of accumulation occur in succession from the tonal sphere, F, through C, g (minor), D—with the close interchange characteristic of the epoch of the d minor and D major triads as the tonic of d minor and the dominant of g minor (I mean in the functions familiar to us), then A, again C, and F only at the very last moment, in the last measure, although elements of the quality of F major are prepared in the intonations on A, for this is the sphere with the least definite triad and is either the dominant of the preceding
D, or the sphere of d minor and F major* which do not occur till the end. In the collection of [Luigi] Torchi, L'arte musicale in Italia [Milan: G. Ricordi & Co., 1897], there is another interesting toccata by Frescobaldi (the correlation of the spheres: G - C - F - A - D - G), with a sharply unstable intonation in the opening measures--c# with the simultaneous sounding of f. In the development of the toccata, the sphere of C includes the functions of the C major and c minor triads and the dominant seventh chord of F major, not, of course, in the sense of a phenomenon of modulation, but as a synthesizing mode, a phenomenon also observed in the C major tonalities of contemporary music, which no longer consist of diatonic tonalities with digressions and alterations, but rather, include, organically, a series of overtones. In this sense, the intonational sphere of C, as employed by Frescobaldi (c, d, e♭, e, f, f#, g, a♭, a, b♭, b, c), is diatonic; as are other, correspondingly developed spheres.

In the light of the concept given above of "organ points" or "pedals" as intonational stages which accumulate sound energy, not discharging it till the last

---

7. This toccata is located in I. Classici della Musica Italiana, Bk. 12, (Milan: [Instituto Editoriale Italiano], 1919)*70
moment, such toccata compositions, which do not have a place or a "berth" in the table of form-schemes, emerge as extremely interesting forms in motion, and as examples of dynamic formation. These toccatas have at the basis of their construction and texture a graphically revealed condition of disequilibrium or instability as a principle of composition, thereby displaying to an unusual extent a property which is inherent in musical formation, the shift from stability to instability and vice versa. In toccatas, each of the successive stages or spheres takes on the significance of a gathering of forces and an accumulation of energy as an impetus for the next stage.

Individual intonations which are especially unstable and sharply dissonant in a given system may serve as impetuses which intensify motion. It is as if they "shake up" or "urge on" the motion by bursting into it, and serve as the signs of "crisis stages" in a given formation. Such are the famous "peckings" of Borodin, and the various sorts of "zig-zags" which "perforate" the fabric in the music of Prokof'ev. All such "stimulative" media prevent the occurrence of inertia in formation (motion and organization). Practically speaking, we may also consider here the significant role of "unexpected" pauses, and also, particularly, the syncope with its mutually exclusive functions, the shifting of the accent from its accustomed place and, simultaneously, the
affirmation of the rhythm; on this is based the whole system of sharply unstable equilibrium of the jazz band, in which the syncopation has become a constructive principle of formation which, by emphasizing the weak part of the measure, forces the hearing continually to "introduce" equilibrium into the flow of sound through the imagined assertion of the strong beat.

Let us turn now from the observation of the various forms of beginning impetuses as motivating forces of music which anticipate the main theme, the melody, or a whole movement of a composition, and of the internal stimuli which transfer motion from one stage into another or "shake it up," to the study of primary intonations or points of support and primary stimuli of motion in the predominating motives, themes, parts, and melodies. In other words, let us presume that the elements which make up the center of the medieval intonational formula are contained in any theme of an overture or symphony, in any melody of a march, independently of the introductions which "signal" them. Then in the analysis of the concept of impetus we will move from a broad comprehension of the phenomenon to a study of the primary stimuli of thematic
motion. I would emphasize once again the ability of the function of any factor of musical formation to transfer into its opposite. The main part, and even the first tone (c⁴) of the first theme of Beethoven's First Symphony, in relation to the preceding music which "evokes" and prepares them, occur as the result, the sum, the discharge of accumulated energy and as a progression which is conditioned by a strong impetus. But, in relation to the succeeding organic development of music, the first formation--the first preparatory run of the theme--appears as its chief stimulus. And again, regarded in itself merely as one of the stages of formation, this theme also includes features of impetus, motion by inertia, collision of forces with a change of direction, braking, and cessation of motion. Of course, if one speaks, not about some stage of music in an extended composition, but about a short song, a dance melody, a march, etc., then, to disclose all these features is usually easy. The longer and more complicated (in the correlations both of sections and of the smallest fractions) the musical formation or the process of organization, the more difficult it is to reveal in detail the effective factors of this process in

---

8 It is necessary to say that in studying these initial stimuli as such within music I do not in any way deny that they themselves are determined by extra-musical [translator's emphasis] motivating factors which promote the formation of certain, unique intonations in the music of every historical epoch.
their interaction. That which a disciplined and sensitive ear grasps with fantastic quickness demands a great expense of energy and perseverance in the process of analysis and the description of the results of that analysis. But for all the complexity and variety of phenomena, the basic principles of formation are discerned everywhere and aid the understanding of the process.

An impetus may evoke a preparatory run. The more contrasting are the elements compared in the course of the musical motion, the more vigorous is the preparatory run, and the more intensive the following discharge. We may cite the following examples: the beginning of the overture to Ruslan... (a preparatory run on the organ point, A, as the dominant of D major); the beginning of the allegro of the overture to Der Freischütz (the agitated motion from the c minor triad to that moment when c minor flares up in the whole orchestra as a completion [mm. 37-61] is perceived as a preparatory run and as the development of a given impetus); and the already mentioned beginning of Beethoven's First Symphony, in which a short beginning motive in C major, containing, however, the essential elements of the mode (tonic, dominant, leading tone), switches over to d minor, then into the sphere of the dominant, after which follows the cadence formula and only after this an "outburst" (mutation) affirms the C major quality, fortissimo, in all its fullness. It is
noteworthy that it was not necessary to repeat the theme in its original form for this affirmation. Such repetition would have weakened the effect from that point since then there would not have been a new synthesized formation; there would not have arisen the feeling of discharge as a result of the whole preceding preparatory run.9 But a no-less striking exposure of the basic tonality, which would be, at the same time, a repetition of the already stated theme without dynamically weakening the whole formation, is conceivable.

Just such an example may be found in the beginning of Schumann's Third Symphony in E♭ major. The impetus is given immediately, without preparation. The theme ascends by means of wide leaps; these spaces are immediately filled with a descent by step. A new execution of the theme in the basses, however, is interrupted by a new figure of music (both rhythmic and melodic). Thereby the inertia which was on the point of taking over is broken. The theme as an impetus, however, is not at all lost but time after time its rhythmic aspect emerges, now in a succession of minor chords, now in a still more elementary

9Further development occurs through the transference of the music by means of an ascending sequence formed from the initial motive, through d minor, e minor, etc., into the sphere of the dominant which is no longer merely the fifth degree but a tonal sphere in contrast to C major.
rhythmic nature—in the intonation of the single tone, G:

\[ \text{\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{image.png}} \]

Thus the unity of the scheme and its execution are preserved; thus features of identity are firmly established in the midst of a strenuous development, and the return of the theme is prepared, for it is not revealed till the end and does not close in a cadence. In view of all this, the new intensive execution of the theme (measure 57, horns, etc.) appears as completely organic. In Beethoven's First Symphony, in which a different situation exists, there is no need for such a procedure, for there the initial motive:

\[ \text{\includegraphics[width=0.3\textwidth]{image.png}} \]

is immediately stated whole, and its development is conceived as a series of shifts and transpositions, and not as a completion and a gradual disclosure.

But Schumann does not complete the development of the theme and again interrupts it with a previously used device (sforzando). Motion parallel to the preceding is formed, but in another tonal scheme which leads to the secondary theme in g minor. Nowhere does the completed
exposure of the first theme become the **predominating stimulus for any further development of the music of the first movement of this remarkable symphony.** The theme passes as an identical element through the most diverse stages of formation making its presence felt everywhere (now in the form only of the rhythmic design, now clothing itself in new material, now coming forth as a cadence intonation, closing the exposition) and everywhere remaining unfinished, thereby preserving its function as an impetus or a persistent dynamic stimulus.

Another characteristic example of an impetus-theme may be seen in the first movement of Tchaikowsky's Sixth Symphony, one of the most brilliant of compositions in the logic of its formation. The theme occurs as a foundation in the lower register of the slow introduction. In the allegro it is the chief strategist and directs the development, meeting opposition in motives of the opposite direction. An impetus-theme, as a clear-cut, rhythmic foot (dactyl), asserting itself with particular elasticity through several phases of development and unifying them, permeates the entire C Major ["Wanderer"] Fantasia of Schubert. In the same work, there is a characteristic example of the birth of a melody from the cadence by means of rotatory movement around the tonic [A\(\text{b}\)] (an "upbeat"
Sometimes such an "upbeat" stimulus is transformed into a "vortical intensification" before an especially significant execution of the theme. There are as many examples as you please in Tchaikovsky, and one of the especially significant ones is in the Tempest—the flight of the strings (allegro molto, p. 87 of the score [published by P. Jurgenson]) before the grandiose execution of the theme in C major. This example is characteristic again as the "switching over" of a cadential melodic phrase which slows down the preceding motion into an

---

10 This is a significant example of the transfer of the function of a given tone into its opposite, a powerful stimulus to musical formation (motion and organization).
impetus, a headlong figuration. I have in mind the following:

12

\[\begin{array}{c}
\text{Allegro molto} \\
ppp \\
pp
\end{array}\]

Still another kind of impetus appearing as a preparatory run is a gradual movement from the tonic with returns to it, but in such a way that each time a still larger range is taken. The best example is the beginning of the finale of Beethoven's First Symphony:

13

\[\begin{array}{c}
\text{Adagio} \\
\text{pp} \\
\text{ff} \\
\text{Adagio molto e vivace}
\end{array}\]

Thus, the study of the impetus as the source of musical motion naturally proceeds to a consideration of the animating and motivating forces which organize and direct this motion, and to a study of their work (energetics). As we have seen, forces arise and are engendered in the sound formation itself from those correlations which are found between the tones of a given system. These correlations, apart from what has already been mentioned, are conditioned first and foremost by the dynamics of the distance between sounds (Weber's
Distanz-Prinzip)\textsuperscript{11} and the resultant interaction of intervals (comparative pitches), and by the dynamics of dissonance and consonance; they are conditioned, in the second place, by the rhythmic-intonational reductions (contractions) and broadenings or expansions of the "sound components" (lines and verticals); they are conditioned, in the third place, by the interchange of irregular ("by leap") and smooth (filled in) progression of the voices; and, finally, they are conditioned by comparisons of tonalities and by the transfer of material from one tonal sphere into another. If, for example, in the music of Palestrina the correlation of consonance and dissonance—understood as contrast and equilibrium between "vertical and horizontal"—are phenomena of style and essential dynamic factors of organization,\textsuperscript{12} and for the exposure and clear-cut demonstration of this interaction

\textsuperscript{11}See Max Weber, Die rationalen und soziologischen Grundlagen der Musik (Munich: Drei Masken Verlag, 1921). A Russian translation by Igor Glebov (Asaf'ev's pseudonym) is being prepared for publication.\textsuperscript{77}

\textsuperscript{12}Concerning this [it is stated] in Dr. Knud Jeppesen's remarkable work, Der Palestrinastil und die Dissonanz (Leipzig, 1925), p. 265\textsuperscript{78}:

The style of Palestrina must, therefore, be defined on the basis of its innermost factors,
special methods are worked out (on the basis of which academic studies affirm a rational system of preparation and resolution of dissonances), then for the music of Schubert it is equally necessary to admit the phenomenon of modulation as an essential factor. Schubert is capable of "filling" huge "areas of sound gravitation," in terms of the range of correlations, thanks to his exceptional flair for tonal connection and tonally-coloristic expression.

Modulation opened rich perspectives and possibilities for musical formation since tonal correlations put in the as the practical realization of a state of perfect equilibrium between two dimensions, of which the ideal of the vertical is "the complete triad in its most beautifully sounding disposition," and the ideal of the horizontal is "diatonic motion by step." The criterion of the state of equilibrium is the strict treatment of the dissonance by step. In the history of dissonance treatment, the style of Palestrina is significant as the moment in which the complete grasp of the dissonance and, simultaneously, its complete mastery were attained.

In this work, the detailed analysis of the appearance in operation of such an essential factor of motion as the syncopated dissonance (Synkopen-disonanz) is extremely important.
hands of the composers a powerful means for displaying material in colorfully diverse schemes. Moreover, a principle of the interchange of tonal strata, analogous to the interchange of the smooth and irregular progression of voices, was revealed in the modulatory processes. Modulatory leaps into far-removed systems with the elision of intervening tonalities are offset by modulations compensating for these gaps. Furthermore, the rotation of tonalities around a tonic corresponds to the phenomenon of opevanie\(^{13}\) of a basic tone in a melodic formation. But the path toward a detailed analysis of those factors which organize musical formation lies not only through the study of "impetuses" or initial stimuli to the progression of music and the forces brought into operation by them, but also, certainly, through the examination of the factors and processes for slowing down and closing motion, and also of concluding formulae--cadences. There is no necessity to enumerate all the schemes employed for these purposes. As regards the historical course of things, as

---

\(^{13}\)Opevanie--the grouping of [neighboring] tones around the stable degrees of the mode--constitutes the main factor in the formation and progress of the melodic fabric (especially that of songs).\(^{79}\)
I have already said, work in that area which is concerned with the origin and evolution of cadences is only just beginning. And if the above mentioned book of the composer Casella (Alfredo Casella, L'evoluzione della musica a travers la storia della Cadenza perfetta) as a sort of reference book, alas, incomplete, concerning the perfect cadence, the study by Machabey (Histoire et évolution des formules musicales...) must be considered a most valuable contribution in the study of the area of musical form.

There is no doubt that an enormous amount of effort was expended in the first centuries of European polyphony in the working out of formulae for reinforcing the tonal feeling and closing the motion by affirming a tone which would be felt as stable for the given mode, and that this process was extremely slow. From this we may form the hypothesis that, in any creation of the oral tradition, and particularly in the case of the newly discovered improvisational practice of polyphony, the natural "fear" of losing the feeling of a stable tone—not the tonic in our sense (although the feeling of the finalis and the gravitation to it, apparently, was no less strong), but a tone serving as an "omnipresent" intonational landmark—compelled the singer-"discantors" to cling to the cantus firmus as a tune firmly settled in the memory like a
ring-buoy in a sea of still unstable intonations. It appears to me that an hypothesis advanced by me about the role of the \textit{cantus firmus} as a mnemonic formula of the mode and a sort of guide for the ear and memory can explain the whole course of development of medieval polyphony from parallel organum—in which just this parallelism, as an intonationally dependable sort of accompaniment to the prevailing melody, is a completely natural stage in the search for the polyphonic texture—and the various methods of discanting, to the branched motets of Machaut (fourteenth century) and the masses of the Netherlanders. Just as the ear sought stability in sustained instrumental basses ("bourdons"), the line of the \textit{cantus firmus}, firmly imprinted in the memory of successive generations, was the same kind of medium for stable intoning in vocal practice as, in still more primitive stages of musical development, the intonations of appeals, calls, etc., were preserved in the consciousness. Such an hypothesis is in full conformity, in the first place, with the actual conditions in which practices of polyphony were conceived and, in the second place, with the further deformation and, one can say, the "mechanization" of the sacred \textit{cantus firmus}, from a living melody, closely connected with the text and comprehensible to all, into a fragmentary and extended, supporting voice involving separate figures of the melody, very probably
intoned by instruments. The introduction of the melodics of secular folk songs, in the capacity of support for later compositions of the imitative, canonic style, is also completely understandable. In connection with the process of greater and greater secularization of music the sacred cantus firmus, when it finally disappeared, was replaced by fresh melodic intonations from popular tunes familiar to everyone. These again were linear landmarks for the ear and the memory in the complex, polyphonic texture of masses and motets—landmarks all the more necessary in view of the fact that the harmonic functions of the vertical sound complexes had not yet been realized. All the available material on medieval music which I have examined confirms this hypothesis, in my opinion. It is also in agreement with the line of evolution of musical formulae from the first to the fifteenth centuries, outlined in Machabey's research. As for its confirmation by the actual conditions in which the practice of primitive polyphony developed, the problem comes down to the fact that this practice was primarily "oral", and music was preserved by the memory, not by musical notes (as the system of [staffless] neumes demonstrates). Polyphony could be improvised and polyphonic practices could be preserved only on the basis of the characteristics of aural memory and musical perception.

Proceeding from these characteristics which largely
determine the musical composition, I maintain that the cantus firmus, as a sacred melody, known to everyone, served as a completely dependable basis for groping improvisation, for emergence above and below the cantus of parallel as well as heterophonic intonations. Little by little, as more stable practices of discanting were worked out, the cantus firmus was mechanized. I repeat: it "decomposed", was differentiated, separated into segments, and the words in it were so stretched out that they lost their meaning. Nevertheless, the cantus firmus, as the constructive basis, was retained a long time in the practice of intoning\textsuperscript{14} and emerged in the form of an harmonic fundamental as a unifying (identical element) and organizing factor, as a set of landmarks for the aural memory among the polyphonic hurdles of the imitative style. Having apparently become instrumental and having taken the functions of the bass supporting voice, the cantus firmus was deformed as a memory-aiding melody, as the predominating melody\textsuperscript{82} and began gradually to acquire the properties of an harmonic fundamental, determining the

\textsuperscript{14}The cantus firmus was retained, as a constructive principle, in dance forms—the passacaglia and the chaconne—in the form of the basso ostinato and its various conversions. The cantus firmus, as well as imitation, are clear-cut factors of formation on the basis of the principle of identity in medieval and Renaissance music.
tone* of the verticals (or of sound complexes crystallized into chords). At this point, leaps of the fourth and fifth which are characteristic of the tonal functions of the bass voice began to appear in it long before these functions were finally organized and transformed into the system of the general bass. The moment of the appearance of these "leaps" is the beginning of the final metamorphosis of the cantus firmus from a melodic, melodious voice into an harmonic fundamental—the basso continuo. The formation of bass passages in fourths and fifths, not as elements of a cantus firmus, i.e., a melody lying at the basis of polyphony, but as an harmonic fundamental, may naturally be considered as the crystallization of cadence formulae in that direction and aspect in which they were finally established later in the epoch of the assimilation of the tempered system.

In the process of evolution of the cadence, it is possible to trace a curious phenomenon. Even in medieval music, the ear attempted to concentrate the maximum intonational tension, the maximum disequilibrium and instability, before the fundamental tone (or tonal complex) which concluded the motion, just as later, with the development of the symphonic sonata allegro form, composers, especially Beethoven, began to concentrate and develop in the Coda (after the reprise) dynamically intensive, contrasting comparisons and to achieve an impetuosity of
Here are several examples of characteristic cadences, with two semitones, in medieval music (I cite from the book by A. Machabey, *Histoire et évolution...*, pp. 162, 202):

[Ex.] 14
(a) 12th c.; (b) same; (c) same; (d) 14th c.; Machaut;

(e) same; (f) same.


Ex. [15]
(a) (b) (c)

(d) (e) (f)
strettos of the fugue ("close construction"). The gravi-
tation toward a synthesis of polarities in the final
cadence postponed the center of tension of the music till
the final stage of formation, and in its turn began to
evoke an intensified accentuation of the tonic. In addi-
tion, two contrasting types of harmonic cadences were
revealed; authentic (dominant) and plagal (subdominant),
which is less intensive without the note sensible (leading
tone).

As for the melodic cadence as a further evolution of
methods for slowing and closing motion in monophony and
in the original, non-harmonic polyphony, it is impossible
to trace the diversity of its forms. On the one hand,
the development of the melodic cadence had to be brought
to a halt at the moment when the existence of the numerous
melodic formula-tunes of the medieval modes lost their
meaning because all the modes were subordinated to two
basic ones, major and minor, with constructively identical
cadences in each of them. On the other hand, the melodic
cadence became individualized. Having ceased to be a
mnemonic formula of the mode, it began to be shaped accord-
ing to the character and style of the composition. It
might appear simply in the form of clear-cut and sharply
delineated concluding intonations at cadence points; it
might take the form of some sort of melodic synthesis,
reduction, or concentrated presentation of the preceding melodic material; it might be the reproduction, at the end, of the most characteristic theme or tune of a given composition (as at the end of the first movement of the Eighth Symphony of Beethoven, and the same in the Ninth Symphony).

But in music there are no absolutely firm, stabilized functions, and the very same correlation of sounds in different compositional schemes may be transformed into its own antithesis. Sound correlations which constitute an impetus often occur, in relation to the preceding formation of music, as cadences, i.e., they perform the function of braking or transfer the motion onto a new path, in a new direction. The same thing is observed in the case of the cadence, but in reverse relation. From a formula, the basic feature of which is to be a conclusion, a landmark, either completing the motion (perfect cadence) or regulating it (half cadence), the cadence is transformed into a powerful stimulus to further musical motion, especially powerful because the opposite property, that of
conclusion, is characteristic to it. This feature, having been transformed into its own opposite, operates all the more strongly since it destroys the regularity and periodization of motion [normally] defined by the cadence. It is not surprising that the ear reacts especially sharply to a deviation from the cadence formulae and that the simplest of such deviations (the progression of the dominant cadence to the sixth degree instead of the tonic) served for a long time in classical music as a reliable and dependable medium for prolonging the period and continuing motion. This path, contrary to that which we observe, for example, in Richard Strauss in whose style the "swelling up" or "bursting open" of the cadence formulae from within is very characteristic, is a

The classics of the symphony and of chamber ensemble already employed the cadence as a stimulus. The most common beginning formula:

\[ \text{Ex. 16} \]

is in essence, a cadence. Haydn begins one of his quartets (G major, op. 33, No. 5) with this formula:

[Ex. 16]
phenomenon similar to the medieval "tropes"--insertions in religious music.*\(^86\)

The deviation of the cadence from a direct path (or, more precisely, the postponement of the gravitation of the music toward the tonic), or the transformation of the "energy of resolution" into a new form of gravitation, thus reinforcing this gravitation through "delay," gave composers an additional means for the enrichment of the tonal-harmonic fabric. Moreover, such deviations were progressively intensified by various types of alliterations.*\(^87\) As a result, it is not at all paradoxical to assert that the Wagnerian "endless melody" may be examined as a formation the limits of which continuously develop by means of an uninterrupted chain of "false cadences" and the postponement of a "direct hit" on the tonic. Although the harmonic texture here is deformed to such an extent that it becomes a "melody of verticals," still this is not a linear, melodic formation, not a formation of tunes, but rather an intensive germination (contraction and expansion) of the harmonic fabric resulting from the maximum decomposition of the strictly constructive period.

If this germination did not seem linearly amorphous and formless to the perception of several generations of people (although the "aural opposition" to the long and tedious passages of Wagner never ceased) it must be noted
that the amorphousness, the formlessness, of the "Tristan" fabric, from the point of view of linear, constructive polyphony, was undoubtedly moderated by the Wagnerian system of establishing "landmarks" for the "memory", the system of leitmotifs, serving as a kind of stabilizing cantus firmi, and at the same time as thematic material. The sequences of Tristan, for example, often become, in principle, from the point of view of the constructive unity of the fabric, something similar to the basso ostinato of the passacaglia and chaconne or the "cementing" cantus firmus of the Netherlands, but in the sense of a supplement to harmonically complicated homophony, or "homophonic polyphony."

On this note I conclude the examination of the phenomenon of the cadence as one of the factors of musical formation. I will return to it once more in connection with the analysis of this formation in the combined

---

17 The leitmotif of Wagner, like any factor of musical formation, is dialectical, and, as a function, possesses the property of transference into [its own] opposite. On the one hand, this is a constructive element, unifying the fabric, aiding in the assimilation of a musical formation of colossal scope; its invariability and distinctive outline are the conditions of its recognition. On the other hand, leitmotifs are themes, i.e., material for symphonic development. These, on the one hand, are a semantic series, images in sound, embodying characters who are immutable in their essential qualities; on the other hand, just like character-images in a dramatic scheme, leitmotifs are unceasingly in operation, in motion, in the process of formation, i.e., their essence is one of "changing quantities and qualities."
operation of all its constituent factors which is revealed in the dialectical correlation of identity and contrast as mutually exclusive, and, simultaneously, mutually linked principles of musical organization.
CHAPTER V

DEVELOPMENT OF MOTION (STAGE OF PROGRESSION BETWEEN IMPETUS AND CONCLUSION); UNIFORM, UNINTERRUPTED, AND OTHER FORMS OF MOTION; MOTION BY INSERTION OF NEW ELEMENTS AND BY INTERRUPTION, ADJUSTING MOTION AND TURNING IT ONTO NEW PATHS TO AVOID INERTNESS

The rudimentary medieval intonational formula mentioned above [p. 267] contains a stage of motion designated by the term Tenor. This stage in its primitive form contains a single musical-intonational element, a single tone of determined pitch, on which or in which are recited words. It is supposed that the words become more intelligible for the listener by presenting them in this manner, rather than simply reading them without musical intonation. Here there is a minimum of musical influence, and this minimum is subordinated to the word, the intelligible and emotionally intensive expression of which is the raison d'être of this formula. But at the same time, there are already present in it all the basic stages of musical formation the beginning and ending base points, the stage of impetus.
and ascent, the stage of the braking of motion, and finally, the central area of intoning (Tenor), here on only a single tone (the simplest form). Moved from the point of stability and having attained the most expressive sonority (for the given "pace"), the intoning continues by inertia while there is a supply of breath, here up to the caesura, and then commences anew. The taking of the higher tone re [D] as the culmination at the point of the "cutting off" of motion is necessary to maintain the proper pitch, and not to flat the tone. This is also an element of contrast, the "marking" of some limit in the midst of the monotonous repetition of a single pitch. The visual projection of this form of musical motion is a symmetrical figure. Of course, any melodic line, even one which is neither very extensive nor convoluted, yields a more complex outline, usually in a wave pattern (for "settling" on one pitch is a rare occurrence), but the combinations of directions are limited. [The musical motion may be] up and down or, conversely, may descend at first, then ascend. There may be a sliding ascent, by step, or a jump (a "leap"), sudden or prepared. There may be a leap and a prolonged delay of the voice in the sphere attained, or a quick return.

I will not enumerate, however, the various visual projections of musical motion, especially of melodic
Here, it is only necessary to give some leading principles of the formation of melody. As such they are "felt" by the ear, and not the eye. Let us recall at least the main part of Beethoven's "Prometheus" overture. Pushing off from $c^1$, the motion (in uniform eighth notes) for some time rotates around this tone; it makes its way by leap into the lower register on $g$ ascends, as from a push, sliding along all the degrees to $e^1$, and from there flows into $c^1$ ("a running start" and "a reverse hitting of the mark"). The energy for the ascent is accumulated in this rotation, and the third time the voice does not move to $c^1$ after $e^1$, but reaches $g^1$, skirts it ($f^#1$ and $a^1$), and drops by step to $c^1$, but touches this tone on the weak part of the measure. The stress, the accent

---

1 [Material may be found] on melodic lines in the work by Ernst Toch, *Uchenie o melodii* [Study of Melody] (Moscow, 1928). In Russia the problem of melodic was raised by me in 1917-1918,* An attempt to generalize visual projections of melodic lines in the material of Russian folk songs, made by me in 1924-1925, remained unpublished. In his previously mentioned work on Palestrina's style, Jeppesen sets up two sharply contrasting forms of the direction of melodic: that of Bach, , and that found in the Gregorian Chant, , and opposes to them the balanced curve (Kurvenbildung) of Palestrina, in which the "ascent and descent balance one another with almost mathematical precision" (p. 39 [p. 45 in 1927 English translation]). Whereas in Bach's music, "... the strongest emphasis of interest is in evolution, the delight of experiencing the process of development," in the melos of the Chant, there is "... a concentrated feeling of conclusion and self-containment."
falls on $d^1$, and an analogous motion begins anew, but from another point. It rotates twice around $d^1$, but the third time does not go down by the leap of a fourth, but flies up the C major scale from $d^1$ to the octave above, where it still does not stop, and, having reached $e^2$, rushes smoothly down. This time the stress falls on $e^1$. Now the direction is changed: three times (including the descent just mentioned) the descending scale is repeated (from $e^2$ to $e^1$ all in C major), after which the motion remains in the central register between $e^1$ and $a^1$ (pushing away from $e^1$ first of all to $g^1$, then from $e^1$ and $a^1$, from $a^1$ drops to $f#^1$, rises to $a^1$ and in a descending tonal sequence falls to $c^1$, etc.):

Many methods for solving the problem of such a "course" from $c^1$ to $e^2$ and back, may be imagined, but in music what is important is the fact of a given, concrete solution, the fact of creative invention, which is subordinate to the principles of formation, peculiar to a given sound system. First of all, we see that Beethoven
selected **uniform** and **uninterrupted** motion. In the given instance, it occurs without contrasts. Of the two methods of filling in space (as a musical gravitation between the sound limits $c^1$ and $e^2$),\textsuperscript{89} by smooth, step-wise intonations or by leaps, the first kind predominates. Leaps down a forth (five times), up an octave (twice), and down a third (five times), are immediately filled in, and serve to emphasize still further the smoothness and regularity. The correlations between lines of ascent and descending lines are uniformly distributed, but the process of ascent is longer than the process of descent (eight and four measures, respectively), and this results in the reinforcement of [the feeling of] impetuosity. Actually, in the descent, a single scale, thrice repeated, proves to be sufficient, and the last two measures summarize, or rather, reflect like an echo, the whole process, but in narrower limits ($e^1 - a^1 - c^2$), and thereby complete it.\textsuperscript{90} The complete conformity of intonations between the first to fourth and fifth to eighth measures is avoided; schematically they are almost identical, but the tonal contrast (C major and d minor) of the ascents, of course, strengthens the intensiveness of the ascent and the swiftness of the descent.
Comparing the course of the Beethoven theme with the primitive medieval intonation, we see the same elements, but with a different correlation between them. In the first place, we have a double ascent and, in each, a moment of pushing off and a moment of contact with the high point. After the culminating point there is a sharp, although step-wise descent. The concluding passage, in its symmetry, is a melodic synthesis of the entire flowing process. The basis difference is in the stability (musical and intonational) of the "tenor" in the medieval formula and the fleeting quality of the pause in the highest area attained by Beethoven. It is possible to say that the ascent, the moment of the break (caesura), and the turning point (descent) merge in the Beethoven theme (both in the fourth and the eighth measure). This comparison explains the static quality of the Gregorian intonational formula (it had to be thus) and the dynamic quality of the melodic formation of "Prometheus".

Let us take another example from music of a different order, with a wide, descending melody, and let us observe how the uninterrupted, but irregular
motion is organized (in Wagner's *Siegfried*):

This melody is one of the remarkable "ascents" in music. Its tension is achieved by the transition of a line with unfilled "spaces" into a filled [line], and by "stops" on "points", which, according to their position in the given system, demand an immediate displacement and further motion. For that reason, any lingering on them is perceived by the ear as a moment of sharp disequilibrium and evokes a striving to move higher and higher (the same feeling as in the case of mountainous ascents!). The starting note, $g$, the seventh of the [dominant] seventh chord on $A$, gradually loses its meaning and takes on the
functions of the third of the triad on e, but in the next moment the stop on d\textsuperscript{1} draws the ear further toward the "clarification" of the function of this sound. The tone b, which could have clarified the position (bars 5 and 6) reveals itself after e\textsuperscript{2}, not as the tonic of b minor, but as the fifth of e minor, etc., etc. [sic.]. A "crossing over" of functions occurs throughout the entire passage, and the defining tone, now sounds earlier (for example, the leading tone starts later than the tonic), now lags and mixes with sound which reveals a different gravitation. At the "high point", the note c\textsuperscript{4} is supported by harmony (c - d\# - g) at a distance of four octaves below, by which a sensation of height (and depth) is achieved, all the more strong, in that this extremely tense sound of the violin is advanced through a second still higher to c\#\textsuperscript{4}. The equilibrium, seemingly just achieved, was, in fact, illusory, and the c\textsuperscript{4} deceptively sounded for only a brief moment as the tonic. The harmony, c : d\# : g, transfers through c : d\# : f\# into b : d\# : f\# : a, and on this background, after the contact with c\#\textsuperscript{4}, a descent by step begins (it is shorter than the ascent). The descent reaches g\# and a, after which a second, synthesizing ascent begins--a sort of melodic Coda after a melodic development. It is still necessary to turn our attention to the fact that this descent from c\#\textsuperscript{4} is based on a single motive, repeated in three octaves,
and, in contrast to the tense ascent, is accomplished as if by inertia. The tonic of the motive is heard the whole time as the basis of the descent. Only below, in order not to stop the motion entirely, a stop is made, not on b (the tonic), but on a², from which begins the concluding stage of the entire episode, the new ascent with the change of the function of a from the seventh of the seventh chord on b to the third of the triad on f♯
and, finally, to the fifth of the minor triad on d, in exactly the same way this occurred in the large ascent with the tone g. In other words, during the ascent tonal "metamorphoses" are accomplished. There is a moment (bar 10) when, by virtue of its sounding and its inclination, the tone g³ becomes the fifth to the tone c⁴ (as later the tone a is the fifth of d minor in the Coda of the ascent). But the step on g³ is somewhat premature for this, and just at the time when the ear enharmonically reconstructs the C major triad after b♯, d♯, e, g³, b³, c⁴ -- in this moment g³ turns out to be led away into b³ and then into c⁴, while in the harmony, enharmonic c minor occurs (bars 10-12). *91

I have consciously entered into the smallest details of this intonational formation, not for formalistic statistics, but in order to show how organic is the process of formation of a developed melody, and how, at the same time, this process has the same stages as the primitive
intonational formula of psalmodizing and the formula of the perfect cadence in the tempered, twelve-degree, tonal system, for a musical formation always occurs as follows: an impetus, or starting point of sound, and a displacement; the motion or condition of unstable equilibrium; a return to the source, to the condition of equilibrium (to the basis), or the closing of motion--i.e., the correlation i (initium - beginning): m (movere - to move): t (terminus - close, ending). The formula of the perfect cadence reflects in itself this same type of formation and contains between T and T (the limiting tonics), S (subdominant) and D (dominant) as spheres forming stages of instability in relation to the initial stimulus T. Without this, without the displacement from T, without the comparison of intonations, there is no musical motion. Strictly speaking, there is no necessity to introduce examples of melodic formation, in which the motion occurs irregularly and brokenly. The principles remain the same and display the same correlations: i : m : t. Here is a rudimentary melody of the rondo, in which progression is conditioned by brokenness, by the fact that the middle stage of the formation consists of

---

2From the above-mentioned book: Fr. Gennrich, Rondeaux, Virelais... (Vol. I, p. 82).
a cut off refrain, thanks to which the motion is intensified:

What kind of factors (both on the basis of what has been said and of other new factors) condition the progression of music (I have in mind the system of European music) between the points of commencement and conclusion? If the impetus proceeds from the tonic (T), whether this be a single tone or a stable sphere of intonation in general, then the motion becomes more urgent, as the disequilibrium between the initial premise and the comparison becomes stronger. Beethoven, for example, often begins development from the execution of the idea stated in the tonic sphere, in repeated (identical) form, but higher by a tone (let's say, C major - D minor). Here there arises an intonational "conflict", urgently demanding resolution. The ear, comparing the two executions, senses a condition of unstable equilibrium rising and "seeks" its source. Let us assume that after the correlation C major: D minor, there occurs dominant harmony. It reinforces still more the intensity of motion, but also evokes a gravitation toward a return to the tonic on the basis of the properties of the leading tone
(and tritone). If the return occurs immediately, we receive the sensation of equilibrium achieved in a short "distance." If in the place of the tonic, new intonations enter, leading still further away from it, tension is reinforced, but only to the point of some sort of "threshold" beyond which the operation of the impetus--the opening tonic sphere--ceases; owing to the distance of the "separation," the ear (having no basis for comparison) loses track of the goal of the formation.

But the tension can dissipate from another, contrary cause. It can disappear if the motion becomes inert, if it does not receive new stimuli and is transformed into the uniform and similar, which takes place when it is carried out with the aid of sequences. Sequence is a method of continuing and advancing music from any given point to any other point by means of repetition of a given segment of music in an upward or downward direction by the same interval (by scale step, by whole-step, by semitone, etc.). Sequence is a great convenience! The ear, receiving almost identical, repeated irritations, "justifies" the further displacements and itself enters into the sphere of motion by inertia. But from the point of view of the musically expedient, i.e., the functionally conditioned, but not accidental, "transformation" of material as a direct condition of the dialectical formation of music, the excessive employment of sequence is a
It is even possible to say, in a certain relation, that any excessive employment of sequences is similar to the excessive employment of imitations a medium which has been misused by entire epochs as a stimulus to the beginning of motion or an impetus. Nevertheless, just as, in its own time, in the first stages of polyphony, the invention of imitation was a fact of intonationally revolutionary significance for the further formation of music, for it revealed new possibilities of organization (the progression of material out of itself), thus, in a later epoch, the introduction of sequences into the fabric equally expanded the possibilities of music in the highest degree. Gradually imitation was transformed from an actual stimulus to a mechanical device. The same thing occurred with the sequence. Even in the works of Bach sequences were sometimes transformed

---

3 I do not at all deny that the sequence can be an expressive medium and a device for characterization, which Romantic theatrical and symphonic music, especially, demonstrated with its "accumulations" of sonorities by means of ascending sequences, as a valid medium of emotional excitation. But at the same time I assert that this is not an actual creative stimulus and is not a medium for overcoming the resistance of inertness inherent in the material, and that motion of the sequence type, in relation to the musical development and formation of ideas, is a passive, and even a negative factor. In sequences the material is shifted from one sphere into another, but does not "grow" and is not in any way "transformed."
into prepared cliches for the filling of "space" between the actual executions of intonations. I refer to sequential interludes in fugues and inventions. However, such a "location" for them is completely logical. As I have already stated, it served for the disclosure of the dynamic contrast between the actual intonations (subject-answer) and motion by inertia which alternated with them.

If the development of motion is directed along the line of the greatest resistance to inertness and monotony, it can not be based only on sequences if it is to work out within itself, from moment to moment, stimuli which ensure continuation. Degrees of gravitation, both of separate tones in a given system and also of complexes of sound and their placement in relation to the "points" or "knots" which are perceived as bases ([the specific relationships] may change in different epochs, but the principle of the diversity of sound correlations in a system exists always, and in this sense the Greek tetra-chord and the contemporary synthesized mode are alike)--these degrees ensure a quite sufficient number of methods for continuing motion. We have tried in part to reveal them by the analysis of melodic formation in the examples presented above. For example, the elision or delaying of the tonic at the point where the ear expects it to provide a feeling of "ground under one's feet," reinforces the tension of motion; the same effect is promoted by the
opposite device—the appearance of the tonic of the ensuing tonality, not with that function, but with the leading tone of the next expected or evoked tonality following it, as in this example:

\[\begin{array}{c}
\text{Example 1} \\
\end{array}\]

It is not possible to enumerate the large number of means for "advancing" the melodic line, since, apart from the correlations of the degrees, it would be necessary to take into account the alternation of identical and contrasting, intra-motivic "molecular" fractions. The problem is not in statistics, but in the understanding by the ear of the "persistency of transformation" of these fractions and the changeability of their functions—tonal, rhythmic, and dynamic—and also in the fact that this changeability is not an accidental phenomenon, but represents a fundamental property of musical formation. It is clear, for example, that if, in a run of sounds toward any base, this desired point of support falls on a weak part of the measure, and besides, on a short note, then the "effect of discharge" is lost, and the motion not only is not slowed down, but on the contrary will become more intensive. In just this way the difference makes itself
felt in Mozart's overture to *The Marriage of Figaro* between:

21

\[\text{music notation} \text{ etc.}\]

and 22

\[\text{music notation} \text{ etc.}\]

It must also be understood that rhythmic displacements in themselves do not have any significance, except in connection with intonational dynamics (with the distribution of forces between degrees of the mode). In addition, in the example from *Siegfried*, it was not difficult to notice what a role in the development of necessity for motion was played by "overexposures" (retentions) of tones, i.e., the delaying of the entrance of a sound expected by the ear by prolonging the duration of a preceding sound onto the strong part of the measure. Still another means of reinforcing the intensity of motion is to transfer the tone sharply from clear-cut tonal relations into a relationship of "multi-significance."
A significant example of this device [follows]:

\[ \text{\text{The slide of the tone } \text{d down to } \text{c}\# \text{ imparts to the theme the most intensive impetus, opens new perspectives before the motion, changes direction, and makes itself felt as an unexpected displacement. There are many similar examples in Beethoven's symphonic development.}} \]

\[ \text{(diagram)} \]

If we turn to the motive forces which condition the correlations of large sections of music, and if we take note of the principles of progression within large spaces, then within these same principles of formation other new phenomena come to light which are applicable only with difficulty to compositions of small extent. It would be possible to consider the "breathing" of themes, phrases, periods, sections, etc., as the principle manifestation of such phenomena. I would point out the capacity of an organically growing musical idea seemingly to contract and expand musically, to fill out and compress. In the visual examination of music without sound such a process does not exist, but there are mechanical additions of all sorts, false cadences, shortenings, etc. In the perception of a musical formation by the ear as organized, intoned motion all of the stages occur as essential qualities of a unified dynamic process in which, on the one hand, there is a continuous interaction of tones and sound complexes.
and, on the other, each moment of sounding is determined by the entire totality of the given correlations of tones; i.e., it is not merely an adding together of bar units, but rather the product of elements of different degrees of tension.

With the recognition of this process, we can move on from the observation of the "breathing" of developed and extended melodic lines made up of the interchange and shift of "melodic figures" which have been firmly mastered and assimilated by the collective memory of that environment by which they are determined and in which they "exist." The principle of identity is apparent here in the repetition, from time to time, of the very same figures (or their constituent particles) or of versions of these figures. Their contraction and expansion constitutes almost the chief factor which conditions mobility and flexibility and evokes a feeling of vitality in this kind of musical formation. The principle of contrast is apparent in various kinds of comparisons. The dynamic quality of the formation of melos is conditioned by the "conflict" of fundamentals within the melody and points of support toward which the voice strives intensively, in order, having finally become firmly established on such a point, to "wring out" (usually in a crescendo) the last reserve of breath. This is very easy to notice in an examination of the collective art of
voice-leading of the peasant choirs. The whole technique of their so-called heterophony is conditioned by the dynamics of open-air breathing and depends on the melodic formation and its continuity, on the support (the "catching up" of the melody) mutually rendered by one voice to another (i.e., by one line to another), together with shifts from one fundamental to another and with the opevanie of some fundamental (the rotation of a voice around any of the basic tones).

Shifts and opevanie are, in essence, the two principal kinds of melodic formation. In both of them, intoning

---

4I insist that such support, such catching up and germination of supporting voices, like sprouts on a branch (right up to a point at which it is completely impossible to distinguish the basic line)—all these are not at all devices of performance, but rather the essence of the process of formation (motion and organization) in such polyphony. Melody, in the usual sense, as the leading voice, to which the rest are subservient does not and cannot exist here. This collective exposure of music is based on the continuous transfer of each function into its opposite; each voice may be, in any given moment, the leading one, and in the next moment, a subordinate one. The highest forms of the music of the European, urban, musical culture of the pre-individualistic period, represent the artistically rational realization of the principles of collective polyphony, and the fugue in its best examples proves this, especially in the case of Handel and his brilliant choruses. The idea of unity, of mass effort, and of equality is realized in the correlation of subject, answer, and countersubject. . . .

---
occurs in the alternation of filled space (the passage of the voice by step and even glissando) and unfilled space ("jumps" or "arches" between two tones). Such a periodization or rhythm of shifts bears a relationship to the charge of direction of lines and the interchange of like and unlike melodic elements. Moreover, a "leap" is always felt as tension, in comparison with the inertia of sliding. For me there is no doubt, although this is difficult to prove directly, that in this whole process the chief role is played, not by physiological, but by social factors, and that the very selection of certain "devices", and not others, for the organization of a moving, variable, melodic fabric, is conditioned by the practice and intonational experience (constant evaluation by the ear) evoked by a given environment, not only in the ordinary conditions of life but, more profoundly, in the relations of production of that environment. Physiological conditions define only the possibilities and limits of sound reproduction, its strength, coloring, etc. But the fact that certain ones, and not others, out of a given number of sound combinations, survive and stubbornly combine and that, with the invention and assimilation of new sound combinations, we always observe some opposition on the part of the social environment ("social custom")--this fact is undoubtedly affected by the operation of intonational selection. The intonations which become
necessary and habitual are those which prove to be the most stable and intelligible in the given conditions. In other words, they are those which, even in their highest ideological stage of conversion, are nevertheless some sort of "aural signals." In this process of the search for and adaptation of intonations we have the prerequisites of form.*

The practice of comprehending form as a finally crystallized scheme, isolated from the process of selection, has led to a complete misunderstanding of the significance of improvisation in music, though even in the beginning of the nineteenth century (as we may be convinced by the biography of Beethoven) improvisation was an obligatory matter for a musician. The further we go into the nineteenth century, the clearer it is that music in its essence is creation in formation, that any construction and scheme in it is the result of selection, on the one hand, and the influence of such an important factor as social inertia or custom, on the other.

---

The assimilation of a musical formation cannot occur without the presence in it, in this formation, of repeated irritations which evoke repeated reactions and the natural memorization of identical formations. From this premise, it follows that the perception of music is not a passive condition, but rather a kind of cognition; but cognition is also comparison, i.e., not only the memorization of similarity, but also the determination of difference. The more habitual intonations become, the stronger the search for new irritants and the more diverse the degrees of contrast. What is extremely fundamental is the fact that the necessity for intonational contrast, most of all, ensures the presence of invention in the creative musical process and, through that, the continuous comparison of "motion by inertia" with motion deviating from the path by means of "innovative" intonations. In essence, improvisation is the raising of the principle of creative invention as the bearer of unexpectedness to the position of the leading factor of

---

6 The difference between the improvisational musical art of the collective experience and individual creation is in the fact that the composer, for the expression of his personal feelings requires great freedom of invention, but in return, to a greater degree, runs the danger of reserve and isolation. On the other hand, in all manifestations of "communal" music (created collectively) a strictly defined and controlled role is assigned to the principle of individual creation (the medieval; Ubilatio; village laments; concentrated forms, such as solo cadenzas, etc.).
The borders of this unexpectedness are always socially determined and limited, but all the same the essence of the formation of music is in the dialectic of invention and inertia. This formation is always purposefully improvisational for it arises as the uninterrupted experience, conditioned by the class struggle, of selecting the most intelligible of invented intonations.

All this I repeat here in order to make still clearer the assimilation of the organization of melodics, both in music of the oral tradition and in other areas of musical creation, for the source of all other forms of organization is in the melodic fabric. The opevanie of individual tones and the shifting from tone to tone, the interchange of melodic figures, etc.—all these separate processes are felt by the ear as motion organized at each moment and as a whole. Here inertia collides with "unexpectedness"; the sluggishness of the ear (accustomed to combinations assimilated long before) collides with the "expectation of the unexpected," for the very life of this process consists only in the dialectic of formation, in the struggle of opposites. Whether we take this process within the limits of some firmly established, rational system of sound relations (academic epochs) or in the collision of such an established system with forces which destroy it (critical epochs), the essence (dynamics) of the process does not change. It is
always improvisational,\textsuperscript{7} to a greater or lesser degree, and always consists of a chain of surprises, mutations, or intonational "outbursts," within the limits of comparison of a given system, or in the struggle for extension of these limits. Whether we listen to Russian peasant polyphony (especially the open-air songs "with bells"), or delve deeply into the flexible and resilient lines of ancient singing or Gregorian Chant, or comprehend the Five Orchestral Pieces of Schoenberg (in one of them he found the path through Impressionism to "biological naturalism," having evoked a complete sensation of the "respiration of orchestral music"—the "muscular" contraction and expansion of sound complexes), musical formation always reveals itself in an uninterrupted series of alterations. Any act of the reproduction of music (even, it would seem, the most precise realization, by the most precise means, of fixed compositions), on the strength of what has been said, cannot be merely a mechanical "exposure of notes," but is rather a creative reconstruction of the process of organization with a more or less inevitable reinterpretation of the functions of intonations.

Let us assume that several outstanding pianists play the very same work. With each performance, the work

\textsuperscript{7}Improvisational in the above-designated sense, as the elevation of the unexpected to the position of a principle of organization, or the predominance of the principle of invention.
undergoes modifications. Of course, the basic sound conjugations (for example, the intervallic relations or the constructive limits and scope of the piece), remain formally unchanged, but the dynamics of the formation, its agogic and coloristic aspects (and indeed for the penetrating and organizing ear these qualities of sound are of the essence, as well as the chief intonational factors), demand creative realization. The shift of accents forms rhythmic displacements; the singling out of any voice or complex of tones and the overshadowing of other?, redirects the sound correlations anew. In a word, even in conditions of completely accurate reproduction, concretely exposed music is nevertheless composed of a certain sum of factors which is revealed only in the process of intoning. Even the most formal eight-measure phrase "breathes" in performance.

But in the personal creation of composers there are epochs when the influence of surprise, of improvisation, is reflected in the construction of compositions as the dominance of invention over the familiar, in opposition to epochs in which stable intonations, accumulated for a long time, support schemes of composition which have a reverse influence on creation and restrain original
thinking. There have been times when preludes, which are, in effect, formless, have provided an alternative to languishing schemes. In such epochs even the most formal schemes begin to "breathe." "Four-square," monotonous constructions, correct in the manner of the Philistine, disappear from music; the dynamics and correlation of sound forces condition everything, even the constructive limits. But periods of the destruction of schemes and the quest for new ones are followed by epochs of the negation of negations, and then again intonation and construction become a unity, and form-schemes do not stand in opposition to music. In these epochs the reproduction of music becomes severely precise, because there is no necessity for any factors exerting an influence from without (even rubato); everything which comprises music, everything which shapes its material (i.e., not only architechtonic elements, but also the dynamics of gradations of the force of sound and timbre)—everything is included in the musical formation, is organically conjugate with it, and is

---

8 I emphasize the point that stable intonations, habitual in a given environment, i.e., concretely sounding music, support the existence of constructive schemes, but mute, soundless form-schemes do not in any way "create" music. Apart from intonations they simply do not exist. There is only a visual projection of music which permits the "imaginary" existence of abstract schemes to be inferred from it by the imagination, apart from the dynamics of sound, apart from the process of intoning.
revealed according to rule, not demanding "justification" from without. This is a genuinely classical epoch of music, and it is not at all paradoxical that the idea of constructivism is advanced into the foremost position at just that time when intonation occurs under the rule of organization.

The immutability of the occurrence as if of muscular expansion and contraction ("the process of breathing") in music as a formation, and not as mechanical motion, has its most obvious effect on the most stable crystallizations of harmonic succession which, having been shaped through centuries and having arisen as a result of long selection, have been transformed into unquestioned tonal formulae. I have in mind cadence formulae (the formulae for slowing and stopping musical motion). They, as observations reveal, are stylistically altered, not only in the course of epochs, but also in the works of the very same composer. Beside that, they take upon themselves different functions within the very same composition. Indeed, there is a profound difference between the effect which would have been produced if the first movement of Beethoven's Ninth Symphony had ended with a chordal succession of the perfect cadence type, and the way in which it does in fact end, with a melodic cadence which is a synthesis, a clear-cut, resolute statement of the principle theme. On the other hand, to Tchaikovsky, in the symphonic poem, Burya
The Tempest it appeared completely unavoidable to break the contrastingly tense, figurative development of the music by one of his favorite devices, by the firm "hammering in," fortissimo, of the cadence chords,\(^9\) by which he frequently, rudely interrupts his lyrical statements, as if"ashamed" of their excessiveness, and brings the powerful run of motion to an abrupt halt.

There is an interesting article on Richard Strauss's treatment of the cadence (Roland Tenschert, "Die Kadenzbehandlung bei Richard Strauss," Zeitschrift für Musikwissenschaft, 8. Jahrg., H.3).\(^{105}\) The material utilized here (true, in a limited quantity) is examined in a somewhat isolated manner, within the scheme of the alteration of cadence formulae, but not in terms of the dynamic formation and functionally necessary "breaching" of the limits of these formulae, resulting from the whole process of formation. Nevertheless, the basic premise of the author of the article("The cadence has, through centuries-long use, become a worn-out formula. However, it is not to be done away with in creation, since it represents a completely necessary medium for segmenting the course of

\(^9\) I have in mind the allegro risoluto, with tritone successions in the bass after the broad C major execution of the love theme (andante non tanto), page 90, etc. of the score (Moscow, pub., P. Jurgenson). I recall also the dynamics of formation of the concluding triad (B major) in the overture Romeo and Juliet.
a composition by creating points of rest and for forming a convincing conclusion by evoking a feeling of termination."\) is noteworthy on the strength of its correct motivation. An examination of the most obvious examples of transformations of cadence formulae in the compositions of Richard Strauss, introduced in the article (from Elektra, Salome, Rosenkavalier, Legend of Joseph, etc.), becomes especially valuable if we link it with a careful survey of these same figures and those identical to them in corresponding intonational surroundings in the piano reductions and scores. The expansions (stretchings) and contractions of cadences become still more significant in the intonational environment which begat them, in the total context of the music, when the concluding formulae are linked with thematic melodic material. In the metamorphoses of the Strauss cadences we have examples both of opevanie (the rotation around a certain point or harmonic sphere), and the conflicts of points of support and various types of displacements (rhythmic and tonal). For example, in Elektra the dominant sphere of the cadence is
intoned thus (piano score, p. 19):\footnote{106}

 Mutations of this formula in connection with the thematic element on pages 12 [11], 13 [12], 14 [13], and especially 151 [139] of the piano score are very curious.\footnote{107}

The \textit{cadence} is the most muscular sphere of intonations. The constructive skeleton, lying at the basis of the perfect cadence, is the most stable area of the fundamental sound conjugations, having undergone very slow changes since the time when it was crystallized in the form of a tonal synthesis. The occurrence of contraction
and expansion in this area most obviously reveals the dynamic nature of musical formation, not only in its horizontally mobile aspect, in melos, but also in the most immobile concluding formulae. It cannot be otherwise, because musical formation is a chain of mutations, conditioned, not only by the immanent laws of organization of the musical fabric, but also by the operation of social selection, which assures the longevity of some intonations and the dying off of others.  

10 I recall the methods for the "dissipation" of the clear-cut outlines of the cadence formula in cadenzas.

11 I perceive this correlation of immanence and causality in music, not at all in the sense of a conditionality of a purely popular order; on the contrary, popular music is most often a conservative and inert factor, and there is no direct bridge from it to the highest stages of musical formation, although there is sometimes a "leap" over a huge number of vile tastes. I understand causality in the same way in which the properties of linguistic mutation are presented by the outstanding French linguist, A. Meillet, in his *Linguistique historique et linguistique générale* (Paris, 1921), pp. 15-18:*108

The laws of phonetics or the general history of morphology in themselves cannot suffice to give an explanation of a single fact. . . . But there is such a factor as the structure of society, the conditions of development of which evoke uninterrupted changes in language, sometimes sudden, sometimes gradual, but never completely discontinued.
Every aspect of musical conjugation has its beginning, its period of flourishing (of greatest expressiveness), a period of conversion into the current coin, and a period of dying out. The beginning of the existence (the invention) of any new intonation,

Thus, language is an eminently social phenomenon. . . . [Proceeding from the position that] language is a social institution, it is possible to draw the conclusion that linguistics is a social science, and that only social changes can evoke changes in language and clarify them for us. These changes sometimes occur quickly and directly, but more often they are mediate and indirect. . . . [Further,] historical facts themselves never directly determine linguistic changes, and only changes of the structure of society can change the conditions of existence of a language. It is necessary to determine to which social structure any linguistic structure relates and in what way, in general, changes in the social structure find their reflection in changes in the structure of linguistics.

In this light it is quite possible to replace the concepts of linguistics, of language and its structure, with the concepts of musical knowledge, music as a language, and its forms. Therefore, the inherent properties of music--I state the thought of Meillet, applying it to musical formation--only work out certain possibilities of development, but that which promotes or impedes the realization and operation of these possibilities is, in the final reckoning, neither the psychological sphere of music, nor the physical sphere, but only the relations of production--the structure of society--to which I add: and not as a mechanical impetus, but as a spontaneous refraction [of the social structure], within the specific media of music.
the simplest as well as the most complicated, is that moment when it is revealed by a sudden mutation ("by a leap") of the kinds of intonations which precede it. The end of its existence is its gradual loss of expressiveness. But simultaneously new mutations occur, new "outbursts", new transformations. Any new sound complex does not at all preclude the simultaneous existence of older kinds of intonation as long as they continue to be socially necessary, even when listeners with active auditory organization no longer feel any stimulation in the perception of sound combinations which are becoming petrified for them.  

I do not at all conceive the process of the formation, flourishing, and dying out of intonations as some course of development of "separate steps", of separate intonational spheres. In essence, this is a unified process; the flourishing of some complex of sound combinations is simultaneously accompanied by the formation of a new expressive complex, evoked by it, which replaces it. The replacement itself occurs, not by evolution, but by mutation ("by leap"). One does not infer imitation from the multitude of devices for permutation of the voices in primitive medieval polyphony, although they prepared it. From the madrigal comedy of the Renaissance epoch, similarly, one does not infer opera, although it would seem that the experiments of Orazio Vecchi, for example, are very nearly opera.  

\[12\]
After all that has been said about the possibilities and factors of musical motion, it would be proper to switch to an analysis of the concept of development in music, and the technical term, razrabotka ["working out"] which is linked with this concept. But I consider it more expedient to dwell on such a problem in connection with the examination of the musical formation of the sonata form, or, more precisely, the form of the sonata allegro. Here it is still necessary to add that the expansion and contraction of the musical fabric becomes a necessary condition of any dynamically mobile form—that in which the music does not proceed apropos of the word or the dance, but rather works out its own vital principles. For that reason the following must be considered one of the traditional formulae (or pivots) of musical formation: the exposure of a theme and its repetition (fully or partially identical, extended or condensed); the switching of motion into a new sphere, i.e. the exposure of new material and its affirmation; a series of confrontations of the intonations already exposed; their synthesis; a Coda (the "excitation" or new, intensive "outbreak" of motion either through the employment of stimuli evoking the "energy of discharge" or the "feeling of the tonic," while at the same time delaying "the end," or, through more primitive means of an agogic order, the speeding up of the tempo of motion by a simultaneous stretto, i.e., "squeezed,"
or "contracted" execution of the principal theme, as for example in the end of the first movement of Tchaikovsky's Fourth Symphony).
CHAPTER VI

DISSONANCE AND CONSONANCE, SEQUENCES, MODULATIONS, PARALLEL CONSTRUCTIONS, AND OTHER STIMULI

ACT FACTORS OF ORGANIZATION

In my exposition of the essential stimuli on which the progression of music is based, and which support a condition of unstable equilibrium (by means of functional substitution) between the starting point and the point of conclusion, between the moment of engaging the attention of the listener in the musical motion, and the moment of cutting it off ("the discontinuance of the flow"), I have not yet touched in detail on a series of expressive media by which the contraction and expansion of the musical fabric is achieved. Thus, those rhythmic-intonational impetuses, interruptions, and displacements which are formed in various sorts of "cut-offs" and collisions of sound complexes are extremely valuable dynamic stimuli for the contraction or expansion of the musical fabric, as, for example, when the concluding measure of a musical period serves at the same time as the starting measure of the following one or vice versa; when two-beat combinations are wedged into a three-beat rhythm; when, in a series of equal measures, irregular ones are introduced ($\frac{2}{4} + \frac{2}{4} + \frac{1}{4} + \frac{2}{4}$, etc.); when the melodic
line is contracted (as happens, for example, with the "shift" of the same figure from an odd-numbered to an even numbered meter); when duple and non-duple (2, 3, 5,) measures are combined, etc. One cannot consider all such phenomena as rhythmic "games" which are not conditioned by the intonational, sounding nature of the given context. They have an influence on the intensity of motion in its concrete exposure, not in a visual formation, but in that perceived by the ear. The "collisions" of measures are dynamic factors in the music of Haydn and Beethoven, just as are Mozart's stretto entrances (for example, in the Menuet of the g minor symphony). Through them the forces which break down the stagnation and inertness of "four-square" periods reveal their influence.

In this work of mine I still want most of all to explain the process of musical formation itself, to give an account, not of the results in completed form, but of the course of my observations of it. By the same token, I will not give an historical survey of all the factors and all the stimuli which organize, determine, and comprise musical formation. The reason for that is simple; I am afraid that, by continuing to postpone the exposition of the principal stages of my laboratory work, I will not succeed in stating my ideas at all.

After this involuntary pro domo sua¹ I will continue

¹Pertaining to a personal matter.
to enumerate the most important of the formative forces, the factors or stimuli of progression. There is no doubt, as has already been mentioned, that consonance and dissonance belong among such phenomena. In the given context, I am not considering these concepts in terms of their acoustical nor their musical-stylistic significance, although here I will say that Jeppesen's understanding of dissonance as above all, a factor of style, seems to me extremely fruitful, for it brings to light the dynamics of style. By the same token, I do not take these concepts at face value. To me such-and-such a dissonance in its historical-stylistic existence (let's say, the seventh of the dominant seventh chord, prepared or unprepared, resolved, "switched" or isolated) is not what is important, but rather the dynamism of consonance and dissonance in its effect on musical formation and as a stimulus to sound motion. From this point of view the phenomenon of dissonance has a series of essential properties.

In the first place, [dissonance] evokes a feeling of intonational impetus and displacement sharper than that which occurs in the juxtaposition of consonant combination. If c serves as the starting tone, then the tone b or f# taken after it demands "continuation" of motion with
greater insistence than the tones g or e. It is exactly the same in vertical correlations. In the second place, dissonance sharpens the feeling of contrast. True, if, in any epoch, any dissonance is especially frequently used on the strength of its expressive properties, then for the next epoch it becomes "common currency" and a sign of "commonness"; it is vulgarized and serves as an index of bad taste, i.e., it loses its expressiveness. But the matter is, in principle, as follows: each historical epoch has certain dissonant combinations which serve to express contrasts of sensations and, among them, one or more which are maximally expressive, which some composers timidly avoid, but which others intone with considerable frequency in juxtaposition with sound combinations expressing a feeling of rest or equilibrium and the conclusion of motion. These correlations are unstable and stylistically varied. It is sufficient to recall the "fear of the tritone" and the supremacy of the fourth over the third in the Middle Ages, the hesitation in relation to the second, the role of the diminished seventh chord in the works of the Romantics, especially in opera, the expressive significance of the ninth chord in the works of Wagner, etc. Contemporary composers in the very same epoch interpret intervals in various ways. For Borodin, parallel seconds are admissible. For Musorgskiǐ, fourths in parallel motion as in medieval polyphony, are accept-
able; in Rimskii-Korsakov they evoked undisguised horror ("The chorus of the Raskol'niki with the strokes of a bell, before the self-immolation, written by the author in barbaric, open fourths and fifths, I completely altered, since its original condition was impossible."²). For Lyadov the six-four chord "hangs in the air," if it is not prepared, and has no independent, "supporting" significance like the other inversions of the triad. For Richard Strauss the six-four chord in the very same epoch already has almost lost its only moderately dissonant significance.

In our time, the bare dominant as a direct sign of the cadence is avoided, or rather, specifically dominant chord intonations are avoided³, and are replaced by others, to which the tonic appears in greater relief, and its function as rest especially accented, even without the obligatory forewarning of the leading tone. More recently, in the music of Scriabin, even the feeling of the tonic as rest was almost on the decline; the tonic was often intoned, not dynamically as a masculine force, authoritatively stating the end of motion, but in a somewhat

³Let us recall Glinka's reference to Weber, "In my opinion, Karl Maria von Weber was most unsatisfactory (even in Der Freischütz) because of his superfluous use of the dominant seventh chord in its first position." (M.I. Glinka, Zapiski [St. Petersburg, 1887], p.181.*111
coloristically passive manner, as harmonic timbre, as a sort of "intonational perspective" with overtones disappearing in the "auditory distance." On the other hand, in the works of the Viennese Classics and, as we have now seen, of Richard Strauss, the accumulation in the perfect cadence (the most rational of formulae--the organic "product" of the epoch of Enlightenment) of dissonant elements, characteristic for the mode, reveals an intensification of contrasting sound relations in the "closing" moments such as was observed in earlier times. The intensity of motion is opposed by the solid stability, irresistible for the ear, of tonic harmony. The dominant seventh chord, preceded by the six-four chord, urgently "evokes" the tonic.

Replacement of such a formally rational affirmation with the harmonic timbres of Scriabin (and even before him, of Liszt) and the Impressionists led to coloristic cadences or, as I have just said, to "intonational perspectives." The cadence dissolved, but, at the same time, both the feeling of dissonance itself and, if it may be so expressed, the very construction of correlations of consonance and dissonance changed. But there is still a third point: the phenomena of consonance and dissonance as strictly rationally measured correlations of the stability and instability (the degrees of gravitation) of
the elements of the mode and as a contrasting manifestation of these correlations are transformed into their own opposites, into the display of a sort of musical chiaroscuro. Stimuli of a coloristic order are given first consideration. And already in this scheme impetus, displacement, cadence, and contrasting comparisons receive a new intonational content. Let me add, however, that formally harmonic logic is not at all abolished thereby. Neither Scriabin, nor the Impressionists exceeded the limits of the tonal harmonic system, and only the novelty of the vertical correlations and the comparisons of verticals ("columnar perspective") which they discovered, suggested to the ear, at the time, a feeling of the "absolute" predominance of the coloristic stimulus over the tonally-constructive. In fact, the former principles of organization remained; however, the harmonic fabric became more refined, and the former, clear-cut formulae of the correlation of dissonance and consonance were made hazy, softened, and expanded, with the result that motion became little more than the interchange of verticals.

This was the natural course of events, a natural consequence of the evolution of European harmony and the decomposition of the cadence (the "endless melody" of Wagner), a discussion of which still lies ahead. The principle of linearity and the rebirth of melody, brought forward in our epoch, are just such a natural reaction to
the crisis of Romanticism (Kurth). At the same time, having rejected, as the heritage of rationalism and Romanticism, the view of the correlation of dissonance and consonance as a correlation predetermined for ages by the limits of a given tonal harmonic system, our epoch transforms this phenomenon as a whole into a dynamic plan, into the interaction of intonations which stimulate motion and intonations which affirm rest, a stoppage of motion. Corresponding to this, the functions of plagal and dominant, the evaluation of melodic factors from the figurational harmonic point of view (auxiliary and passing notes), and the study of preparation, suspension, and resolution—all these principles of organization, while retaining their historical, rational conditionality, have been carried over into a new stage of their existence (a dynamically constructive style).

In its significance as a factor which both arouses and directs musical motion, the phenomenon of consonance and dissonance, of course, makes itself felt as organically expedient. The study of intervals, consonant and dissonant, has thus been transformed into the base of support of so-called elementary theory and of the whole structure of

---

4 This refers to the work of E. Kurth, Romantische Harmonie und ihre Krise in Wagners "Tristan" [Romantic Harmony and Its Crisis in Wagner's "Tristan"] (Bern: [p. Haupt], 1920).
harmonic music, into the basis of intoning. Consequently, one cannot be surprised at the fact that when, on the threshold of the nineteenth century, composers began to intone as the initial stimulus, not the tonic, but dissonant intervals, as did Beethoven in the First Symphony or Mozart in the remarkable introductory Adagio of the C major quartet, where the functions of the tonic are so cleverly veiled (it sounds in an ostinato fashion in the cello from measure 1, but on the third quarter the a-flat in the viola and the further entrances of voices in the following measure "punish" the ear and "persuade" it that this was not the tonic), such devices were really perceived as a leap into the unknown and were undoubtedly an "intонаtional revolution" and, of course, a sharp stimulus to sound motion, its "dynamization". The exaggerated use of sequences -- the "hypertrophy of sequences", as it is observed in all Romantic music of the nineteenth and beginning of the twentieth centuries -- must

\footnote{In the "Gratias" of his Grosse Messe (c minor), Mozart leads the motion to the final tonic (a minor) having pushed off from c-sharp as from the basis of a sixth chord and a diminished seventh chord of the d tonality, and "along the way", for a distance of ten measures of slow motion (Adagio), the tonic is not taken. A six-four chord on a minor occurs in the seventh measure. The entire fragment represents a curious example of pre-Wagnerian realization of the principle of the "endlessness" of motion by means of a chain of deviations from the tonic, and thereby the reinforcement of the gravitation toward it as a final goal.*\textsuperscript{1}}
be considered a less significant triumph in this scheme. The use of sequence, as a means of progression and a convenient device for the transfer from one stage of motion to another, is also characteristic of classical polyphony. It is sufficient to name the inventions and fugues of Bach, about which we have already had occasion to speak. Descending, diatonic, smoothly conjunct sequences serve there especially often to fill in runs and ascents which have just taken place, and they evoke the feeling of motion by inertia up to the first new impetus. This purely dynamic application of sequences is transformed in the thinking of Bach into one of the favorite "cliches". In Romantic music the sequence loses its modest significance and becomes a powerful factor of formation, a popular medium for any transfer and for the "arbitrary" change of the direction of motion, and also becomes a means, easily attained at any moment, for contraction and expansion of the fabric. And this is not only the case in theatrical music, (where the necessity to follow the text and the action comes into conflict with the logic of purely musical development, and where the sequence really turns out to be a flexible means for different types of characterizations), but is also true in symphonic music.

It is natural that "hypertrophy of sequences", on the one hand, should have led to sluggishness, passivity, and
inertness of musical thinking, but, on the other hand, without the sequence it would have been utterly impossible to manage the "building" of compositional structures of such a huge scale and extent as those by which the second half of the nineteenth century was distinguished. In addition, particularly in the case of ascending sequences, a powerful medium was found for emotional influence (the "inertia" of ascension, of intensification, of agitation) which became a characteristic indication of style. In the hands of a multitude of Wagner's imitators, this medium became a cheap method for moving music forward and for organizing the fabric, for listeners already reacted habitually to the ascent of sequences with its inevitable crescendo of sonority, irrespective of the quality of the material. Nevertheless, the scores of Wagner himself, and also of Tchaikovsky, contain many model examples of the rational and expedient use of sequences as a valuable stimulus to the contraction and expansion of the musical fabric and the growth of motion.

An almost equally common medium for the continuation of motion and the construction of music of "large schemes" were the so-called parallel constructions of material. Ordinarily these were repetitions of large, more or less identical "pieces" or closed episodes, either in immediate proximity or at a distance but in another tonal sphere. In symphonic developments parallel construction yielded the
possibility of increasing the intensity of motion at the expense of novelty of invention; thus it remained only to arrange the tonal layers so that the first execution postponed, but repeated execution more inevitably led to, the tonic, the reprise. In the beginning of symphonic poems, overtures, orchestral fantasias, etc., this medium permitted the repetition (to impress it upon the listener) of the leading idea in two tonal schemes instead of monotonous, identical execution. Schubert, Schumann, especially Liszt and Rimski-Korsakov (the latter very often employed parallel construction as a means of developing operatic musical action and organizing the operatic fabric), and other composers resorted to such a method of stretching out music with enthusiasm and displayed taste and mastery in the arrangement of parallel spheres and in their tonal interrelation. The methods of execution of identical material in the tonal correlation of a third flourished magnificently from Schubert onward. Afterward, such an execution became somewhat canonical (for example, in the New Russian school), but Musorgski dared bolder comparisons and

\[\text{It is characteristic for the style of Schubert that parallel executions of identical and varied material, especially of broad melodic lines with corresponding, rhythmically uniform accompaniment (as in the first movement of the B-flat major sonata), became adequate for development, i.e., in essence, they made up the development of Ideas. This is a complete contrast to the dramatics of the Beethoven sonata, with its conflict and its brilliant exposure of active intonations in contrasting, tense comparisons.}\]
parallel constructions of identical and non-identical material in the correlation of a second, which unquestionably heightened the expressiveness of this method, already beginning to fade even in the seventies of the past century.

Parallel stratification, an unquestionably valuable medium in the sense that it increases the scope of motion, is not, however, equally effective in terms of the dynamics of development and—if it may be so expressed—the saturation of musical "breathing" (the contraction and expansion of the fabric). Parallel constructions of the third, so fresh in the works of Schubert, lost their expressive significance especially quickly and evoked the feeling of sluggishness and a static quality in the music, though in a coloristic relation they opened a new era of instrumentally colorful comparisons.

Rimskii-Korsakov left many remarkable examples in his operas of the model "treatment" of different sorts of parallel comparisons of timbre in the capacity of illustrative, descriptive, and decorative "layers" of music. The area of the musical landscape, demanding, by its essence, a static impression, evoked an especially persistent employment of parallel constructions, not only of third relations, the most "peaceful" and coloristically effective, but also in alternation with seconds, "tritones", etc. For example, the scene of daybreak in which the city of Ledents appears
in the rays of dawn in The Tale of Tsar Saltan presents orchestral figurations in a series of colorful comparisons from B major to F major through A major, D-flat major, f minor, E-flat major (without the appearance of the tonic), g minor, F major (without the appearance of the tonic), and a minor. Similar examples occur in Mlada, in Kitezh, etc. Soft color contrasts are manifested here most often, either in the alternation of figurational harmonic backgrounds, or in parallel constructions of thematic material, also harmonically (tonally) contrasted. A minimum of mobility and development in motion is thereby combined with diversity in these tonally coloristic stratifications of music, thanks to contrasts of timbres and instrumentally colorful comparisons on a basis of identical material.

Thus, parallel constructions are, strictly speaking, an unsatisfactory stimulus to motion, although they expand the scope of music. Sequence, a much more intensive stimulus of motion, contains, however, an element of inertness. The ear quickly becomes accustomed to the progressive ascents and descents of identical "segments" and, thanks to this, more and more ceases to feel modulational contrasts. The degree of relationship between tonalities, such a powerful medium of formation for the Classics, especially Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven, begins to be smoothed out, to "be obliterated". Schubert, with all his colossal sensitivity to modulation, furthered
this smoothing out a great deal, bringing together distant tonalities by means of parallel constructions of identical material. Nevertheless, modulation continues to the present time to be a powerful factor of formation and a means for the continuation of motion, no matter how the methods of modulating may have changed.

But the basic law of musical formation—the alternation of a "leap" and "smooth, filled-in motion", as I have indicated—is always evident in this area; tonal elisions demand restoration; distant comparisons require smoothing out.*113 In this connection, both modally melodic (on the basis of the Distanz-Prinzip)*114 and tonally harmonic formulations are established on an identical premise, the basis of which must very likely be sought in the physical and physiological principles of "musical mechanics", in the interaction of statics (relative7, of course) and dynamics.

At this point I will venture to conclude a greatly expanded section on the stimuli of musical formation ("the progression from a given impetus to a given limit"), the goal of which was to demonstrate, in their operation and interaction, the forces which evoke and support this process.

7In music, strictly speaking, there are no forces at rest, and in this sense even so-called perfect consonances still always stimulate motion unless they appear as ultimate points of support of a given formation.
Of course, the operating forces of music are not at all absolutely independent factors, and their possible manifestations are, I repeat, socially determined. If I have examined them in the given context as motive causes which are independent, immanent, or inherent in musical organization it is only because otherwise the account would have gone beyond the limits of a book about form in its musically constructive and dynamic essentials.
PART THREE

PRINCIPLES OF IDENTITY AND CONTRAST:

THEIR EXPOSURE IN CRYSTALLIZED FORMS
CHAPTER VII

FORMS BASED ON THE PRINCIPLE OF IDENTITY
(VARIATION, CANON, FUGUE,
RONDO, ETC.)

Proceeding from the basic position, stated above, regarding the unavoidable mnemonic conditionality* in the perception of a network of intonations in motion (or revealing itself to the ear of a perceiving subject) -- a conditionality resulting from the necessity to retain moving sound material in the consciousness -- it follows that the whole process of musical formation and of all crystallized form-schemes must be based upon two principles which give shape to this "insubstantial" material, namely; the principle of identity, i.e., the succession or periodic recurrence of similar, or even completely identical combinations, and the principle of contrast, i.e., the succession of intonations which are opposed to the preceding sound complexes.¹ The degree and character of opposition may, of course, have many different shades, inclinations, and stages. For example, there is

¹Conversely, if we proceed from the activity of perception to form, this will be the recognition of repetition and the differentiation of dissimilarities.
without question a great difference between the correlation of the periodically returning refrain and the episodes or executions of the new themes which break the monotony of these returns in a rondo, and the correlation of the principal and subsidiary parts in a sonata or symphonic allegro. However, such differences change nothing in the essence of the process—in the necessity for a purposeful interaction of identity and contrast—for one principle, with the inevitability of dialectical logic, evokes the other, but the predominance of one of them, giving rise to a particular category of forms, does not at all revoke the influence (even though it may be hidden) of the other principle. This bespeaks a manifestation of the law of the coexistence of opposites.

The interconditionality of these principles of the formation of sound material permits us to divide all musical forms into two basic categories, according to the predominance in each of factors peculiar to one principle or the other. To the first category belong forms in which the possibility of moving the music forward is evoked by the repetition of similar sound combinations, ranging from the primitive correlation of a strong and a weak beat (the simplest formula of repetition, independent of the qualitative aspect of the material) to complicated variations in which the element of identity—the given
theme—is recognized with difficulty, and is then discernible only to an experienced ear in the new formations which are both engendered by it and contrasting to it. In this category there are a number of degrees and stages; one need only, for example, introduce into the simplest gradations of percussion (the combination of two features—a strong and a weak beat or vice versa) an element of timbre, i.e., let's say, to evoke a certain number of repetitions by blows on a table, and then to interchange them with clapping of the hands, and already the identical feature is somewhat complicated. Along with the identity of the gradations (the invariable element), there occurs a non-identity in the quality of sound of these gradations, i.e., a minimum contrast. If we complicate the formula of interchange by means of a comparison of binomials of two feet [dimeter] in the relation, let's say, of trochaic and iambic (-: -), and also inject here nuances of timbre, then there occurs a series of similar sound combinations in which each binomial contains a contrast (a converse correlation of durations) within itself, a contrast which is quickly crystallized in the memory by means of repetition, and a contrast of timbre in the longer time period. This kind of contrast does not aggravate the perception of the first type (the contrast of durations), but rather, softens it.
The binomiality loses its initial sharpness and becomes an element of unity and similarity in relation to the difference of timbre.

This most simple example makes further eludication unnecessary. One must not conceive of the operation of the principle of identity in contemporary musical formation as something primitive in comparison with the operation of the principle of contrast. The difference lies in degree and not in essence. If we take the 33 variations of Beethoven on the waltz of Diabelli and compare with this composition any of the most simple, three-part dance forms, where the contrast displays itself in the alternation of melodies of the first and second figures, then a trio, and again the first two figures, and where the functional correlation of these parts is expressed only within the context of a definite tonal plan, and neither thematically nor in development, then the complexity will be on the side of the variations. Their musical content is dialectically richer because in them the principle of identity, while not ceasing to operate, still engenders striking and bold new formations in an increasing degree of contrast in relation to the theme; on this fact depends the possibility of the development (in principle, endless) of variations, and also their dynamics and motion from a given point of reference. In the simplest dance form, consisting only of the comparison of melodies
(comparison as a stimulus of motion on the basis of some
general rhythmic formula), contrast, in spite of its
dominating position (different melodies), is felt to a
lesser degree and does not engender of itself the occur-
rence of identity with the same force with which in the
first instance the identical element (theme of the
variations) engendered contrast. I repeat, it is a matter
of degree in the occurrence of one principle or the other.

In the historical course of things, during the pro-
longed evolution of music, the first stages of the forma-
tion of material inevitably reveal the predominance of the
principle of identity. Subsequently, when any stage of
intoning has attained its highest point of development
then a new stage evokes a return to the simplest factors of
construction (as an example, we may cite the correlation
between the magnificent, complex a capella style, and the
newly appearing style of monody on the threshold between
the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries). If we compare
the melodics of the Gregorian chant and the melodics of
the rondeaux and virelais with the experiments in polyphony
which were developing at the same time, then the melodics
of the Gregorian chant stands higher in its development of
the horizontal than the dance songs, in which repetitions
of short refrains prevail. But in the polyphonic
compositions, one is struck by the complete dependence on the cantus firmus as a basis, as a complex of identical intonations, habitual and familiar to a given circle of singers and settled in their memory on which, or around which blossom other voices. As we have seen the passacaglia and other forms with an ostinato bass were organized later on the basis of the same sort of stimuli to prolonged polyphonic motion.

I will introduce several characteristic examples of melodic formation in which repetition prevails and where new elements appear either as a melodic cadence or in the form of timidly sprouting shoots from the prevailing intonation. All the examples are from the already mentioned book of Fr. Gennrich, Rondeaux, Virelais... (Volume I). I present the tunes without words. Repetitions are not written out in the interest of conserving space.

\footnote{Identical, not in the sense of the resemblance of all the cantus firmus melodies, but as firmly assimilated correlations of tones.}

\footnote{In my Kniga o Stravinskomet [Book about Stravinsky] (Leningrad: "Triton", 1929), in the chapters devoted to an analysis of Renard and L'histoire du Soldat, I have dwelt in detail on melodic formation in the character and style of improvisation based on motivic variants. Curious transformations of instrumental motivic material, in different tonal schemes, are contained in J.S. Bach's Brandenburg Concerti.}
In this example it is characteristic that the new element measures 7-10), entering after the first phrase, immediately catches up one of the preceding links.
29 Beginning of the fourteenth century (p. 259):

![Musical notation image]

30 The following example is from the songs of the Roman de Fauvel (1310-1314), among which is a series of curious examples in a melodic style based on motivic variants.¹¹⁹ (pp. 292-293):

![Musical notation image]
In the last example, the strictly constructive disposition of related melodic figures (a and b), according to the tones of the mode from $d_2$, $c_2$, $a^1$, and $g^1$, is worthy of attention.

Returning to the interrupted description of the two basic categories into which musical forms are divided as a result of the domination of one of the two interacting principles of formation, and keeping in mind the concept of form as organized and intoned sound motion, it is necessary to turn particular attention to two basic channels in the category of forms with identical elements. One channel consists of variation forms, i.e., motion with subdivision into episodes, in which the varied theme serves as a cohesive agent. As has already been indicated, these
forms can achieve extremely high degrees of development, transcending the episodic quality by the cyclicization of progressively more complicated, contrasting transformations of the theme. The example of Schumann's symphonic variations (Etudes Symphoniques) show how much astonishing mastery and emotional saturation forms of this sort contain; development is displayed in metamorphoses, and a sort of regeneration of the theme is observed here rather than the chameleon-like change in the embellishment of an essentially unchanged theme by means of various sorts of ornamentation. The theme is perceived as a stimulus of such powerful force that all the successive episodes grow out of it and out of one another and do not simply alternate as independent links of a single chain.

The other channel by which the principle of identity makes its way is the extremely well-developed and rich area of imitative and canonic forms, the highest point of development of which was, and has remained, the fugue. In opposition to the inevitable static quality of variations (the predominance of the static quality is the stimulus to their development), the forms conditioned by imitation, 4

4This brilliant invention of someone's creative mind or result of the collective efforts of musicians of the twelfth and thirteenth centuries permitted enormous progress in experiments with polyphony. The possibility arose of organizing motion in a prolonged stage, proceeding from identical material, with a progressively larger number of voices; the cantus firmus was pushed aside.
on the one hand, have stimulated horizontally mobile polyphony and, on the other, with the maximum economy of material (imitation arose in the epoch when individual melodic invention in our sense, i.e., as one of the distinguishing signs of the composer's gift, barely existed) have guaranteed its maximum mobility and rational transference. The rise of imitation was almost the first revolution in the area of medieval intoning. It was indispensable to successive development and was undoubtedly a qualitative improvement in relation to the device stressing the exchange of voices (Stimmtausch), which was characteristic for the epoch of improvisational searchings for purposeful polyphonic movement, and in which similar motives [popevki], occurring first in one voice, then in the other, tied the polyphonic fabric together. 5

Imitation was a "leap" in the evolution of European polyphony, involving, in effect, a new quality of formation. Further ramifications and enrichments of the initial impulse of imitation (the initiation of identical motion

5Such motives, serving as a sort of wandering or shifting cantus firmus, gave stability to the improvisations of singers (one must not forget that this is the epoch of the predominance of aural practices in the vocal tradition), but did not unite the fabric to the same degree as imitation. Examples have already been introduced earlier (pp. 229 -32 ) and here I only summarize what has been stated in a broader and more general way.
in another voice before the first has reached the end of its thought) should not confuse the investigator with their diversity. Very likely in the entire history of European music, not one of the processes of organization took its course, and not another form was crystallized with such logical gradualness and with such a rational growth of one device out of another. Apparently some social resultant of the needs of the composers and the tastes of the epoch permitted this process to occur over a comparatively long period of time, as if naturally, almost without being subjected to the influence of extra-musical stimuli. Nevertheless, even with the multiformity and the very rational development of the basic premises of the imitative-canonic style, its principal landmarks are based on this initial impulse, on polyphonic motion engendered by the given material from within itself. But where in the variation forms the progress of music also engendered by identical material flows before us in the form of successive episodes and represents a series of transformations of the given, leading thought, here, in imitation, the material engenders motion by means of an uninterrupted coupling of identical elements in different voices, i.e., it forms a firmly cohesive polyphonic fabric.

The essence of the forms of the canon and the form of the fugue is found in the cohesiveness and continuity of
similar motion, on the basis of similar material. But whereas the forms of canon had to come to a self-contained conclusion and become stabilized (motion, within limits predetermined by the selected methods of intoning and by the number of entrances in the several stages of development of the canon, was no longer perceived as developmental motion with elements of unexpectedness), the form of the fugue appeared as that new form in the evolution of the principle of imitation in which an alternative was found to the organization of motion by means of the permutations of a single premise, a device which had lost its expressiveness and was apparently becoming a formal intellectual game.

This is not the place to go into the social and historical causes which engendered the new type of organization (the fugue), in which the mechanical motion inherent in the canon was overcome. Before us is one of the processes, observed many times throughout the course of development of European music; the increasing complexity and accumulation of spiritual values (in the sense of the presence of intellectualism) in a culture leads to the intensive growth of the process of formation in music, to the further expansion of forms, and to the absorption of already crystallized forms by those which follow. The canon entered into the fugue, as, subsequently, in
Beethoven's works, the fugue became a component part in the development of the sonata. A form, having an independent existence, enters as a component element into a series of elements which comprise the functions of a more complex whole.

In order for this to have occurred in the given instance the organization of motion in the canon and the very possibility of development in this type of organization had to be converted, on the basis of the principle of identity, into a new and newly-coordinated type of motion. This occurred when the fundamental (tonic-dominant) correlations were crystallized. Their temperament was finally fixed, and, in Bach's Wohltemperiertes Klavier, we see the complete triumph of the classical fugue, a flexible form full of intricate comparisons on the basis of a controlling core.

This core is the correlation of subject and answer (a kind of cantus firmus) in a chain of executions, in which the active exposure of the subject and answer is broken up by motion of a passive order (sequences) and motion by inertia. The motivic material of the sequences consists either of elements of the subject and answer (and their counterpoint), or of new material. Gradually the principle of contrast wedged itself into the fugue, and its monothematic structure began to waver. In particular,
apropos of Bach's thinking, one must say that in some particulars he was almost ready to move into the sphere of the sonata with its contrasting comparison and to abandon the path of the canon or the variation, i.e., in both instances, the path of monothematicism.

However, in order to observe how the composer's consciousness sought a way out of the schemes and cliches of monothematic forms and moved first toward improvisational polythematicism and then to a tonally coordinated double arrangement (from which the so-called subsidiary part was subsequently crystallized) it is necessary and useful to analyze the most varied forms of motion in the organ and lute pieces of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries (ricercare, preludes, capriccios, fantasias, canzoni, and the stylized dance sections of the suite, especially the Allemande). In these, the correlations of identity and contrast are revealed on the basis of uniform, uninterrupted motion with an extraordinary display of color in a great number of devices. It is often even difficult to say whether some contrasting comparison arose as the result of new thinking, or whether it was revealed as a practice crystallized out of the manner of treatment of material which was common and advantageous for the demonstration of the essential features of an instrument. A type of instrumental declamation was also worked out.
For example, the presentation of material by means of the alternation of an imitative melodic formation with "colonnades" of verticals (usually arpeggiated) permitted the comparison of clear-cut linear contours with complexes of tones, i.e., with chordal formations. From this practice or manner of diverse presentations of sound, the path toward an expressive method is that which leads toward the contrasting comparison of melodic relief with melodically uncoordinated sound correlations. In this laboratory of the Renaissance instrumental forms, in these gropings for the most rational forms and methods for the unfolding of motion, the principle of identity and monothematic linear thinking prevailed first of all, which, as has already been said, attained the peak of its development in the form of the fugue, and especially in the works of Handel and Bach (first half of the eighteenth century).

One must not think that the subsequent triumphal procession of the sonata (symphonic) allegro in the works of the Viennese classics entirely pushed aside the development of monothematicism and of the principle of identity as the dominating one in musical formation. In the first place, the variation forms and rondo continued to evolve, and in the second place, as a matter of fact, work on the fugue has never ceased (right up to Reger and to the contemporary Renaissance of linear organization and the new
transformation of monothematicism).

In general, through the principle of identity the distinctive combination of variation, alteration, and other methods of the transformation of material in the various aspects of this principle was advanced. Indeed, the single idea of the cantus firmus as summarizing the motion and organization of the fabric of a vocal melody or as a mnemonic formula had already passed through a series of transformations without losing its essence. Let us imagine a passacaglia in which its cantus firmus (basso ostinato) progresses in different voices (strata), being modified and forming new variant-sprouts. In this manner the "wandering" cantus firmus (as a principle of formation, and not as an historically given complex of melodic figures forming the basis of the polyphonic fabric), in the form of the melody of a Protestant chorale, is refracted in innumerable figural treatments of the same chorale and finally crystallized in the fugue in the shape of a subject and answer. But this is not all; the idea of the cantus firmus as a significant landmark received further fruitful development.

Let us imagine the formation of music, not on a

---

6Subject and answer are the same as cantus firmus, but are treated, not statically, but dynamically. They represent the functions of the cantus firmus transferred into their opposite; at one and the same time they are two contrasting exposures of a common modal essence.
single fundamental, ostinato motive, but on two, three, or more, alternating and crossing motives, melodic figures, and other types of fragments, periodically returning or repeating time after time. Though in this imagined formation thematic spheres at times are coordinated, as in the sonata-symphonic allegro, while at other times the germination of motion of an improvisational order occurs, still reference points arise thanks to the aforementioned periodic returns of identical material. If such a process is linked with a program or with theatrical activity (with poetic images or ideas, or with characteristic or scenic situations), then we have the properties and kinds of organization found in programmatic symphonies, symphonic poems, overtures, etc., on one hand, and leitmotif operas, on the other. Berlioz, Liszt, and Wagner come to mind immediately. True, in the executions of the idée fixe of Berlioz and in Wagner's leitmotifs, the sonata-symphonic working-out, i.e., a coordinated, thematic development, is not always present. But at the basis there lies a principle which is not of an immanently musical dialectic, i.e., not pure symphonism; rather, the juxtaposition of leitmotifs is evoked from without by directing stimuli ("programmatic causality"). The leitmotifs themselves are applied as a certain number of elements which comprise identical groups and which organize the motion (it may in principle be limitless, like
the "endless melody" of Wagner) by means of the permuta-
tions and transformations of these elements and, as noted,
by means of their more or less periodic appearances. But
are these appearances not conditioned by some sort of
immanently constructive principle of organization? It
appears that the structure of the Wagnerian operas
represents a process of organization intermediate between
the strict execution of the principle of identity (fugue,
canon), and the equally strict execution of the principle
of contrast (sonata, symphony) as manifested in the co-
ordinated comparison of thematic spheres. One can say that
the Wagnerian leitmotif fabric, on one hand, is like a
fugue with a certain number of subjects and answers and a
certain number of identical executions, and, on the other
hand, it is like the symphonic development of a certain
number of thematic spheres, now strictly tonally co-
ordinated, now--thanks to chromaticism and altered harmony--
freely (coloristically) juxtaposed with one another and
developed with the aid of methods of sonata-symphonic
construction (thematic development). Consequently, there
is present here a further development of constructive

^In the passacaglia, if we present it with several
ostinato canti fìrmi, the rhythmic formula of the dance
itself serves as a constructive "guide". 
principles which were in prospect for the ear even in the case of the medieval discantors: the execution of identical parts in different voices or the cohesion of the fabric by means of several *canti firmi* (leitmotifs) which, having been assimilated by the memory of the listener and crystallized in it, make possible the perception of even an extremely prolonged formation of music—music to a considerable extent appearing as motion organized by means of the juxtaposition of a series of stable elements. The fact that the Wagnerian *canti firmi* (leitmotifs) are not necessarily found in the bass—i.e., they do not represent an ostinato fundamental—does not alter the matter. The *cantus firmus* became mobile even in the Middle Ages. The ostinato motives of the *passacaglia* and *chaconne* may also be shifted from the bass to the upper parts; the development of this form in the works of Brahms (the finale to the Fourth Symphony) serves as substantiation of that.

The essence of the matter, of course, is in the principle and not in its different manifestations. In the main, the Wagnerian system of leitmotifs made it possible to "move music forward" in large spaces just on the strength of its constructive unity. The leitmotif is
a reformed, leading *cantus firmus*. The leitmotif in the constructive scheme is, to a certain extent, the same as the vocal or modal melodic figures, the memorizing of which helped retain in the mind the essential intonations of a given mode. I am not in a position to introduce those rules by which the interchange in the fabric of leitmotifs (canti firmi) occurs, if one removes the stimuli which proceed from the word and drama in the works of Wagner. But apparently there is musical purposefulness in this interchange or in the "coming to surface" of one or another leitmotif, as there is purposefulness in the occurrence of subject or answer in the fugue, amidst and within the development.

It is possible, it seems to me, to advance an hypothesis about the musical-mnemonic threshold in relation to forms in which the principle of identity prevails. This threshold or limit demands repeated execution of the identical elements which organize the fabric, repeated execution at comparatively short distances, without which the ear is not able to unify prolonged motion. Wagner's

---

8It is interesting that the leitmotif system was conditioned by the intensive appearance of contrapuntal themes,*¹²⁰ the aim of which was, above all, mnemonic--"to impress on the memory" the leitmotifs by special groupings, with accompanying philosophical and poetic associations.
leitmotifs fulfilled these functions excellently. Serving not only as factors which constructively tie together the flow of the music, but also as leaders of the dramatic action and even as operating forces within the Wagnerian drama, they do not require the appearance of the singer-actor on the stage in order to suggest to the listener the memory of some hero through the execution of his leitmotif. Here is Wagner's link with symphonic leitmotivism as it was projected by Berlioz, displayed by Liszt, and developed by Richard Strauss.

One is struck by the attempt, in the works of Liszt, to coordinate the fabric to the greatest extent on the basis of the principle of identity by applying the art of variation and the combining of variants to the construction of themes and leitmotifs. He forms themes from a single general premise, which differ according to the functions assigned them (the most popular example is the thematics of the b minor Sonata); he substitutes the variants and transformations of a single theme in diverse guises for a series of juxtaposed and contrasting leitmotifs. The principle of identity is thus carried through to the highest degree. In the Wagnerian fabric, identity is felt through the recognition of the leitmotif and its variants, but there may be many leitmotifs, and very diverse ones besides; on the other hand, Liszt wants to reduce them to
a single denominator, to a single thematic complex, by which, of course, the intensity and contrast of comparisons diminish.

On the other hand, Wagner sometimes so counterpoints the fabric, that entirely unrelated leitmotifs begin to approach one another as elements which fulfill similar functions. In this sense the score of Die Meistersinger represents the polyphonic interaction of a certain number of subjects and answers. I do not wish to say that the whole fabric of this opera is a complex fugue, but there is no doubt that some leitmotifs here fulfill, in their polyphonic correlations, the functions of subjects and answers of a fugue. One cannot, therefore, be surprised at the fact that the fight scene in the end of the second act is perceived as the dynamically culminating moment of Meistersinger. This occurs not only because here before us is a truly masterfully and fascinatingly written episode, but also because the expressiveness of the music is emphasized by its formation as a fugue--i.e., in one of the tensest moments of the act, the maximum concentration of the polyphonic fabric is achieved. In other words, in the fugue, as the most rational of polyphonic forms, polyphonic tendencies, generally typical for the texture of this opera are concentrated at the most dramatically striking moment. A coincidence is generated; the
structure or type of formation which is characteristic for this work is exposed with the greatest force and persuasiveness just in that moment when the action itself demands a corresponding concentration of sound energy.

A constructively strict form gives maximum expression on the strength of maximum organization. The method of formation which is the same for many of the moments of this opera (I mean the polyphonic quality), finds its fullest expression in the most striking scene and thereby accentuates it.

The importance of this example was to make the following points: The application of the principle of identity and its exposure begins with the simplest methods of repeating identical motivic material, then is developed in the form of material which is subjected to various degrees of variation or alteration, finally revealing itself in the extraction of polyphonic motion from the given motive by means of its imitative realization. In a similar manner, the building up of the devices of the polyphonic style occurs on the basis of identical material (the cantus firmus). The application of this principle does not end here, but goes further. Features of identity in tempos and timbres are also important for the process of formation, and the distribution of identical dynamics is necessary, as well as the occurrence of intonational and rhythmic identity. Features of identity of texture in
musical compositions have equal significance. From this point of view, the predominance of polyphonic texture makes itself felt in Die Meistersinger, while Tristan is predominately harmonic; a comparison of these two compositions reveals the dialectic of texture in Wagner's works and the dependence of texture on thematics, which is also very significant.

Returning to the significance, just noted, of identity of tempos in cyclic compositions, it is proper to point out that the predominance of either slow or rapid motion of a similar character in a given cycle, changes the whole process of formation in the highest degree. The difference between the Italian and French overtures of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries generally rests on this point. The examination of suites from the point of view of the predominance within their sections of identity or contrast of tempos, and also the identity or contrast of the rhythmic formulae which organize the motion of each section, is just as significant for understanding the dynamics\textsuperscript{122} of organization or the process of formation in these mobile and unstable cycles.

We need not speak of the way the Romantics and Impressionists employed the identity and contrast of timbres for expressive purposes, nor of the fact that the formation of material depended on the predominance of one principle or
the other. It is clear that the skillfully executed return time after time of some characteristic timbre gives a piece an appropriate mood and evokes watchful expectation, i.e., it becomes a coloristically identical factor, connecting different phases of motion. There are as many such examples as one wants, from Weber and Berlioz to Debussy and Schoenberg, if one does not wish to go back to even earlier periods. The characteristic phrase of the flute in the Prélude à L'après-midi d'un Faune of Debussy expressively formulates the "lazy, languorous" motion of the music. The timbres of the horns and clarinets in Der Freischütz, typical of Weber, unify many moments of the opera and impose a peculiar imprint on the music with each of their returns. The role of timbre in this relation is not inferior to the role of the leitmotif, although timbre is not linked with the same melodic outline or harmonic motion.

Finally, no less important is the execution of the principle of identity in cadences. The prevalence of one or another type of cadence unquestionably influences the composition in the highest degree. The ear usually concentrates on features of the closing of motion, and the type of cadence which prevails leads the listener on, though for this purpose it is not at all necessary that the cadence be in any way specifically emphasized. The listener may not have any idea about cadences, their make-up,
their forms, etc., but he cannot help but react to them. For that reason, the plagal structure will have a different effect from that of the authentic structure, and the prevalence of one or the other, in the final accounting, echoes the impression. We have already observed what an organizing role is played by the extremely varied and harmonically developed cadences in the music of Richard Strauss and how the effect of this music is changed depending on the diversity of the cadences or, on the other hand, on the periodic return of some identical cadence formula. I recall the simplest and best known example from the dance of Salome. A series of frequent, repeated closings of the motion on variants of the altered authentic cadence (lowered second degree, lowered fifth, etc.) in the first part of the dance (ziemlich langsam) gives the music the character of restraint, a halting character; the consciousness is hypnotized by a single idea, and the music is not permitted to stray far from any point of support. Each strong inclination, each new, more and more intensive stirring evokes a still more intonationally pointed figure which closes the motion. An image is created characteristic of the eastern dance: the wriggling body and the immobility of the feet, as if thus not to lose touch with the earth. Later in the performance this cadential monotony or persistence goes astray, elements of cadential identity are
hidden from view, and the motion begins capriciously to change direction.

Of course, the given example is one of a multitude no less significant. I would like only once more to confirm the significance (not only constructive) of cadences, and the dependence of the character of music on the prevalence of identical or contrasting endings.

Summarizing everything said about the inter-conditionality of the principles of identity and contrast in the process of formation of music, we come to the following conclusions. These are not abstract categories. They are determined by the properties of musical motion and the conditions of perception of this motion as a process elapsing in time and irreversible. In order to find points of support in the flow of music the attention of the perceiving subject is directed to repeated intonational features (no matter of what kind of sound elements they are composed), and these moments are crystallized in the consciousness. In other words, our memory emerges as the most active factor in the assimilation of music, and this factor inevitably influences the construction of form schemes and the whole process of musical formation. Different aspects, kinds, methods, and devices, and the character of exposure of music engender different phases and forms of musical motion. But these differences can be
reduced to two basic ones; in the process of organization and motion, either similar, identical intonations or contrasting ones will prevail. In so far as musical form is the organization and disclosure of musical motion, one or the other means of organizing the material (that based on the principle of identity, or that based on the principle of contrast) will result from the prevalence of one or the other of the two kinds of intonation indicated. It is clear that the application of either of the principles in pure form is unthinkable and leads to absurdity; the principle of absolute identity gives an endless series of repetitions, and the principle of absolute contrast gives an endlessly changing sound fabric, not caught by the consciousness, for there is no means of fixing it in the memory. Thus, in music we are always concerned with the inter-conditionality and interaction of both of the basic principles of formation.

An examination of the form schemes which have been crystallized in musical evolution testifies also to the possibility of their division into two groups: a group with the prevalence of identical sound complexes, and a group with the prevalence of contrasting ones. Behind this division, the processes of formation which condition it are easily revealed. Investigating these processes, we see that they are dynamic and dialectic, and that not one of the crystallized form-schemes has any right to lay claim to
constancy, to esthetic immutability, to "eternity" and absoluteness. One epoch consolidates in the consciousness certain crystallized forms; another will destroy them and find others. But the principles of organization, on the strength of their dialectical nature, remain the same for the whole course of the evolution of music, engendering by their interaction the dynamics of organization and epochs of intonational revolutions (mutations) when by means of an unexpected leap into a new type of organization of material, music gains new means of expression corresponding to new changes in the relations of production.

Both variational and canonic forms are based on identical elements which tie the fabric together. In just the same way, the various types of the widely branching forms of the rondo have in the refrain a factor which constructively unites the juxtaposed sections. The refrain with each of its appearances, returns the motion to the initial source. It groups around itself and draws to itself new complexes of sounds, or seemingly wedges itself into them without permitting these new formations to receive independent significance and be transformed into the alternation of motives, harmonic movements, etc., which are devoid of purposefulness. In the evolution of the forms of the rondo one may observe how the tendencies toward the increase of the number of themes of the rondo battled with the tendency toward greater and greater concentration of
these themes around the refrain, how the latter gradually took on itself the functions of the principle part of the sonata (symphonic) allegro and subordinated to itself the remaining themes, how thematic working-out enters into rondo, and how, in summation, mixed rondo-sonata form schemes are formed. In the rondo of the sonata type, the refrain almost loses its original predisposition to be a mnemonic landmark and, by the constancy of its return, to establish the limits of motion—to transform it into circular motion. In general, in the rondo the principle of identity plays an essential and, not only a unifying, but a directing role. It is both a stimulus and a brake, the source and the goal of motion.
CHAPTER VIII

FORMS BASED ON THE PRINCIPLE OF CONTRAST (1)

The highest expression of this principle [the principle of contrast] is the form of the sonata (symphonic) allegro. The scheme of the allegro is simple: exposition, working-out, reprise. Within it is contained the following process: impetus, breaking of equilibrium, restoration of equilibrium. The formula of the perfect cadence represents a microcosm in which this process has impressed itself.*

In other words, the sonata allegro, in relation to this organic formula (cell), is a developed organism. The process of formation of each sonata allegro form is perceived as the arrangement of contrasting material; first of all a "tonic" group of themes (the principal part) is exposed, then a second group (subsidiary part), most often in "dominant". The so-called connecting passage carries the music from one tonal sphere into another and emerges as an extremely fundamental factor for organizing motion. The name "bridge passage" engrafted on it too superficially reflects the essence of the process. The problem is that this "connecting music" must not so much mechanically
transfer the ear from one sphere into another, as that, in developing a given thesis (the principal part), it must evoke from it and oppose to it an antithesis (the subsidiary part) and must do this with the maximum economy of time and means of expression, in order that the main idea—the sharpness of contrast of two parts, two tonal spheres (the usual correlation is tonic-dominant)—will not disappear because of distance.

This new theme (or group of themes), which by its character is set off against the principal part, is strengthened in its new tonal sphere by a developed cadence, music of an affirmative, stable quality, often with new thematic material (the so-called closing theme). The dynamics of the process are clear; one sphere is not compared with the other mechanically, but in the course of its development it inevitably evokes the other as its antithesis. From the comparison the possibility of the further motion of music arises. Even more than a possibility, a necessity arises, because, within the conditions of the tonal system, the given correlation of themes (one may say strophe, anti-strophe, and epode)*124 is
perceived as extremely unstable and contrasting.\footnote{In the fugue this correlation is given in a very close relation in the comparison of subject and answer; in the concertato style it becomes a formula for the exposition of the first, leading complex of intonations (this is still not exactly a theme). A statement like this one of Bach's (the beginning of the \textit{Fifth Brandenburg Concerto})}

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{example.png}
\end{figure}

has a multitude of variants, and finds in the pre-classical sonatas, concertos, allemandes, etc. a multitude of uses in more or less short and long spaces. It may be said that the subject-answer correlation was expanded to the contrasting correlation of tonal spheres on the basis of a common thematic complex. The contrast of tonal spheres was established earlier making it possible for a contrasting theme to be clearly isolated in a contrasting sphere; this isolation constitutes that "leap" which determined the form of the sonata allegro in its dialectical formation. And here, as in the occurrence of imitation, as in the rise of opera, as in the formation of the classical fugue, we have before us a consecutive chain of events leading to a given "discovery"; but the "discovery" itself emerges as the transformation of quantity into quality--as a \textit{leap}, both confirming, and at the same time exploding the evolutionary course of things.\footnote{125}
germination of movement from the tonic-dominant complex (the impetus). In the continuity of motion of the sonata exposition, an uninterrupted, contrasting thematic formation is achieved, in which even the moment of the closing of motion (the cadence at the conclusion of the exposition) simultaneously serves both as a brake and, on the strength of the fact that it reinforces the new thematic and tonal complex, as a powerful motive force in music. Creating in itself an impression of attained equilibrium, the closing theme, nevertheless, in relation to all the preceding progression of the music, does not appear as the moment of resolution of the disequilibrium created. On the contrary, it seems to affirm, and thereby to intensify [this instability], and, consequently, it inevitably and intensively evokes a continuation of motion.  

This is natural. In its evolution, the exposition of the sonata allegro has been directed, to an increasing degree, toward the accentuation of instability. This has been achieved primarily by the intrusion of contrast into all the correlations (tonal, rhythmic, constructive) of the

---

2 In general, it seems to me that the features of connection and transition (connecting passages) and of conclusion and affirmation (the closing theme) are the features which determine the character and intensity of the contradictions revealed in the development of the sonata movement; in a word, these are "explosive" features.
elements of formation, and the evocation of conflict in the initial sphere itself, in the statement of the principal part, not even to mention the connecting and subsidiary parts. In proportion to the more intensive evolution of the principal part, the connecting passage has lost its specific meaning as music which "transfers" motion from one tonal sphere to another, and has merged with the development of the first group of themes or the principal part. But, in view of the ever more conflicting nature of the statement of the principal part, its difference from the subsidiary part and their mutual "antithesis" has emerged all the more sharply. The lyrically melodic, somewhat passive character of motion, characteristic for the subsidiary part, and its primarily melodic formation are opposed by the flexible, laconic, sharply contrasting, even "assertive," principal part. Figuratively speaking, the initial theme of the sonata must possess the "will to develop"; the energy of a great force of tension must be condensed in it.\(^3\)

\(^3\)The concept of a theme is profoundly dialehtical. A theme is simultaneously both a self-sufficing, clear-cut formation and a dynamically "explosive" element. A theme is both impetus and affirmation. A theme concentrates within itself the energy of motion and defines
These obligatory qualities are intensified to a considerable extent when the principal part flows out of a preceding slow introduction (a new stage of contrast in the exposition) and is itself an antithesis to this introduction. The more monumental the introduction, and the more force and pressure with which the first theme rushes from it, like a mountain torrent from the watershed, or an arrow [from a bow], the more intensive, energetic, and far-reaching is the build up of the whole principal part (Beethoven's First, Second, Fourth, Seventh, and Ninth Symphonies provide splendid confirmation of that), and the sharper its contrast with the sphere of the subsidiary part. It is not possible to dwell in detail here on the way the great masters of the symphony have achieved maximum expressiveness in the exposition, how the accumulation of energy has occurred in the introduction, how motion has been its character and direction. However, in spite of its chief property—a clear-cut outline—a theme possesses the capacity for the most diverse metamorphoses. Its functions are contrasting. By its formation, a theme evokes new formations which negate it, and, by opposing them, affirms itself. A theme is a striking, resourceful, creative thought, an idea rich in implications, in which opposition is the motive force. Thus, in brief, I summarize my conclusions from the study of the themes of Classical and Romantic symphonies.*127
slowed down in it in order that the allegro should be felt as all the more flexible and headlong, how the principal part has been constructed, how it has been stated, and how this statement has been conditioned by the dynamics of the entire exposition. Through the understanding of the functions of contrast inherent in the basic sound complexes (conjugations) of the European intonation system from Bach to Schoenberg and Stravinsky, through the analysis of the process of formation on the indispensable basis of hearing (the constant sensing of intonational energy, its fluctuations, its shifts both sudden and gradual, its accumulation, and its discharge), each organically created musical formation is perceived as dynamic and in terms of this perception, represents a complete contrast both to the predominantly sensual enjoyment of separate elements of music, and to the abstract comprehension of form as a scheme for the visual analysis of soundless horizontals and verticals.

Such abstraction leads to false, antidialectical views of the nature and meaning of musical forms and to the complete isolation of form from content, for form as a non-sounding, architectonic scheme does not permit an understanding of music and is transformed into a neutral medium, filled with indiscriminate content. It seems to me that the historic roots of such views lie in a rationalistic esthetic based on the figurative arts. In our time, they are the heritage of lazy Philistinism in
musicology, the fruit of an inert consciousness and the belief that all music finds its place in schemes. It is possible to be freed from them only by regarding form as a flexible and changeable process directed from without by operating stimuli and forces and, at the same time, controlled by properties of organization inherent in musical material. These properties in their turn do not at all appertain to music as mechanical motive forces lying outside the organizing human consciousness. They have been formed in the evolution of the perception of flowing musical material and are conditioned by perception. In this sense, there is a profound difference between sound as a phenomenon of physics and sound as a musical [or, more properly, psychological] phenomenon.

Returning to the description of the development of motion in the sonata allegro, let us recall that the device of repeating the exposition, which is characteristic of the majority of Classical and Romantic sonatas, was evoked by the necessity for reinforcement and assimilation by the consciousness (memorization) of so complex and extended a series of thematic interrelations. Therefore the element of identity is introduced, and the stage just completed is fixed with great firmness in the memory. As it was pointed out, the final stage of the exposition is affirmed (concluded) by a developed cadence in the newly "achieved" tonal sphere. I repeat that the affirmation
of the new tonal sphere, however, is not perceived by the consciousness as the end or complete conclusion of motion. On the contrary, in relation to the basic tonal sphere, the concluding theme sounds contrastingly like a "crest", a crossing, a crossing, or an extreme degree of instability, and urgently evokes subsequent motion.

In the central section of the sonata allegro, in the so-called "working-out," the instability which has been created is emphasized even more sharply, and the entire formation of music becomes more intensive. In this stage, the principle of contrasting comparisons prevails in full measure; everything which was expressed in the exposition, in the consecutive course of events, is shifted into a new set of correlations in the "working-out." The opposition of thematic schemes at a distance is transformed into the collision of contrasting elements in direct encounter, in contiguity and interchange. This is achieved by the most diverse methods. The composition of the working-out sometimes repeats the exposition in an expanded form, hardly changing the elements, but other times the correlations which have already appeared are completely reshuffled, and those fragments of material, which seemed in the perception

Emerging as the most dynamic factor of musical development.
of the exposition to be secondary and unessential, are elevated to first importance. In each working-out there is undoubtedly a purposefulness of formation, but at present it is not yet possible to classify comprehensively the causes which account for the refashioning of material in one way and not another. The general cause—the striving to reveal the dialectic of themes—is, of course, always present and conditions the selection of material. One may observe in each individual case how that which is unfinished or only outlined in the exposition is converted into a completed statement in the working-out, and how new functions and new expressive possibilities are revealed in seemingly fully established sound complexes. It is possible to mention two basic channels along which the dialectical formation of themes is directed in the working-out. Either this formation appears as a dynamically contrasting "play" of thematic fragments, without clearly pronounced changes of ascent (accumulation) and discharge, or, on the contrary, it is a unified line of intensification of forces toward a projected limit. Perhaps the working-out is constructed of parallel executions (but in different tonalities) of some of its large sections—a process in which the principle of identity shows its worth. Perhaps it becomes so laconic that it is reduced to the case of a reverse transition of the tonal sphere just attained, or to its flexible and concise
"transfer" into the principle tonality (for example, the laconicism in the overture to Mozart's Marriage of Figaro!). But, in the majority of cases, the purposefulness of the working out is apparent in the maximum exposure of contrasting tonal correlations between conjunct elements, and in the introduction into this area of various unexpected turns and deflections of the motion. For example, instead of a tonally consistent "coupling" [of elements], elisions are formed between various complexes of intonations; one observes an effort to transform the cadence, from a factor which concludes or completes some stage of motion, into a factor which stimulates further motion (various sorts of "false" [or deceptive] cadences).

But, in spite of the "cultivation" in the working out of various kinds of "unexpectednesses," one may still notice a natural purposefulness of motion; each elision is compensated for or balanced after a time, each deviation from the path is justified by fastening on that point of support, for the attainment of which it was

---

6 The cutting off of a connecting chord or chord of "resolution" in a chain of verticals (the succession of dominant or diminished seventh chords), for example, is an elision, i.e., the replacement of two-unit combinations with one-unit ones, identical in structure, but contrasting in tonal relations. Any sharp leap between tonalities is an elision.*
necessary to make a "leap" or sudden shift, in order to let the ear feel more urgently the inevitability of the restoration of equilibrium. Any "run", "thrust", or transference over an expected sound correlation, or over a conclusion which is natural and consistent with the given complex of sound correlations, is, in one way or another, motivated by, and serves that same objective—a stronger confirmation of the basic intonation.
CHAPTER IX
THE DIALECTIC OF MUSICAL FORMATION;
CONSECUTIVENESS AND SIMULTANEITY;
FORM IN THE PROCESS OF
FORMATION AND FORM
IN THE PROCESS OF
CRYSTALLIZATION

One may speak of consecutive motion or development, and motion or development by means of shocks, elisions, mutations, etc. Consecutive motion is the rational transfer of intonations from complex to complex by the most habitual and stable formulae of conjugation "accumulated" within the conditions of the given sound system. A primitive example is that in which the motion is directed from a C major intonational complex to G# minor through A minor and E major, being confirmed in each tonal stage with the exposure of its basic indicators. This is not unique, but is one of many consecutive, rational progressions. The same motion, however, can reach the same goal through a series of elisions and deviations, and will also seem natural. Everything depends on the intonational environ-
ment, and therefore, even from the point of view of the system of tonic-dominant correlations which seem the most rational in terms of a "strict style," characterized by a clear-cut "resolution" of each dissonance, not every "roundabout" motion is inconsequent, destructive of the rules of procedure, or irrational (it is conditionally irrational for the majority of those who perceive it, until, with the passage of time, the hearing assimilates these stimuli and reflexes become habitual, or in other words, until the mind becomes attuned to the conditions to which that of the composer, who first formed these irrational correlations, was attuned.)

"Irrational," "inconsequent" motion of music has its explanation in the following phenomenon. Music is a motor art. It is recognized as motion, but motion which is not at all completely uniform. In fact, if it were uniform, it would be perceived as monotonous, neither rhythmically nor dynamically differentiated, but chiefly indifferent in relation to material. This is noticeable in the impression which is left by sequences. A large number of them, or the immoderate use of them for easy transference from one tonal sphere to another, leads, as has been noted, to a feeling of inertia, i.e., identical and uniform motion
"without resistance" (without effort, without the necessity to overcome). In such motion there is felt no active participation of the composer's directing thought, no organization of material, no invention. Rather, only the initial complex is invented. Moved from its place it engenders a chain of repeated reproductions of the sound combinations contained in it. The motion is directed from a given impetus up or down by planned degrees, and can continue in principle to that time when it comes up to the point of departure through the octave, i.e., when the given complex is repeated twelve times, if the transfer goes by half-steps, six times, if by whole-steps, seven times, if by the degrees of the diatonic scale, etc. Outstanding contemporary composers, not without reason, avoid sequences; their frequent use displays passivity of thinking. As soon as a sequence is admitted into a passage, and "established" there, the motion becomes mechanical. This does not at all mean that sequence is inexpressive; on the contrary, with its skillful insertion into the fabric, especially if its occurrence is justified by a plan, it can be a medium of emotional influence and character. I recall, for example, the "sequence of Tatyana" in Tchaikovsky's *Eugene Onegin*, and the Wagnerian sequences
in Die Walküre, in Tristan, etc. In the sequence, however, the development of ideas is lacking, and, at the same time, the vital functions of the musical fabric—the interrelation of voices and switching of their functions—are suspended. There is motion, but nothing is encountered on the way. In other words, music moves along the lines of least resistance.

It is an entirely different matter if the functions of the sound fabric change with each moment of intoning, and if, in order to continue motion even further and more intensively, the creative thought of the composer which organizes the material, strives toward its dynamization and "dialecticization". Invention is displayed here, not so much in novelty, nor in mannerisms, but rather in the avoidance of beaten paths and general purpose formulae. The composer who is searching for new, unused sound combinations is interesting, but still more interesting is that one who, out of the simplest sound complexes which are seemingly accessible to everyone, creates correlations which strike one which their freshness and expressiveness.

Let us take the simplest scheme—impetus, condition of unstable equilibrium, conclusion—for example: $c^1 - b - c^1$. The first sound, $c^1$, may be conceived of as
the result of preceding motion, let's say a run from the lower g (g, a, b, c'). The middle stage can be variously prolonged (c : d : b : c or c : f : e : b : c or c : f : e : b : c or d : e : f : e : b : e : a : b : e, etc.) in which case it will turn out that, instead of a direct return to the point of support, the voice will delay this return and move by roundabout paths. Something similar to that occurs when, in the case of a run or a leap, a body does not immediately come to rest at the point of contact, but moves forward somewhat, or rocks back and forth several times before settling down. In ascending, we raise our foot higher than is necessary and then lower it. With a long and powerful running start, it is unthinkable to stop immediately. It is possible to introduce many examples, but not for the sake of analogy, for this is not a question of analogy, but rather a similarity in essence (the motor quality of music). Even in the simplest processes of recitation, after an extended "reading" on the tone, the voice drops or energetically rises several moments before a stop or breathing place, after which it returns to the basic level and concludes.

If we not only observe certain moments of braking or
conclusion of the musical motion, but also trace the more
or less prolonged stages of the whole course of the music,
there comes to our attention the constancy of change, the
occurrence of which I have cited several times; motion by
leap (unfilled) changes into motion by step, filled-
in right up to the point of glissando. Thus, consecutiveness
and "irrationality" of formation, in a crossing of
the evolutionary process and the process of mutation, are
expressed not only in the alternation of cohesiveness
(conjunct motion) of sound conjugations with elisions of
intermediate links, described above, but also in the fact
that sound correlations are subjected to a further alter-
nation of filled in motion and motion by leap with the
motor features characteristic of that kind of formation;
a forward thrust and deflection back before the basis or
point of support, the rotation or fluctuation on the point
preceding the base, etc., are devices which are analogous
to the muscular-motor processes of stress, effort, the
concentration of forces and attention, and finally, action,
i.e., tension and release.\textsuperscript{1}

To this consideration it is necessary to add the periodic change of direction—the ascent and descent of intonations (projected visually on the staff, this is the motion of voices up and down). The combination of periodic changes of filled-in and unfilled ascent and descent, and also of consecutive and non-consecutive motion in the above mentioned sense, creates a complex of mutually contradictory, and at the same time, mutually counterbalancing sound conjugations, which evoke the perpetuation of the condition of unstable equilibrium.

\textsuperscript{1}The cadenza, in its symphonically developed stage of formation, may serve as one of the manifestations of the characteristics mentioned, as for example in the Piano Concerto in $b^b$ minor of Tchaikovsky. Having touched on this composition, I cannot help mentioning one more of its remarkable features—its initial impetus (horns: $f^1$, $g^b$, $c^1$, $b^b$). In this stimulus-cadence is summarized the tonality of $b^b$ minor (the basic tonality of the concerto), and summarized with such persuasiveness (as if some $b^b$ minor stage of the music, carried out beyond the brackets, preceded the cadence) that the succeeding (primary) stage of formation of the concerto is carried out not in $b^b$ minor, but in $d^b$ major. In general it is necessary to say that the sensitivity of Tchaikovsky to form as a process of formation and crystallization, and not as a mechanically filled-in sound scheme is apparent in his compositions at every step.
The rhythm of musical formation becomes apparent in exchanges of contrasting phenomena. Contrast moves the chain of sound formations forward. But it must not be forgotten that contrast is felt only in the presence of identical elements, and that without them this principle would reveal itself anarchistically. In the same way, only in the continuous correlation of a thesis complex and an antithesis complex do we experience the operating forces or stimuli of musical formation, all elements of which are functionally conditioned. A musical composition may be examined as a whole, perceived in motion, in which all the links (all stages, all features) are dialectically correlated with one another in such a way that each moment of the exchange of thesis and antithesis (a given sound complex and the sound complex opposed to it) is perceived by the ear dualistically. In the process of the first exposure it is perceived as a contrast, but immediately after that, when each of these comparisons is grasped, it becomes in its turn, a unity in relation to the following stage of motion, i.e., a compound thesis complex opposed to the new complex, etc. Consequently, the complex of thesis and antithesis, as a combination of opposites in its exposure (intoning), is transformed for the
ear into a synthesis, immediately following the exposure. The new (and longer) correlation of sound then engenders a new comparison and a new synthesis.*131 Thus we approach what is most difficult in the analysis of the process of musical formation—the disclosure of correlations of consecutiveness and simultaneity in a musical composition which exists both as a dynamically mobile formation, saturated with contrasts, and as the unity which is the result of this formation2.

Music begins to sound. The first sound engages the consciousness in a series of sound correlations. Their consecutive perception permits a chain of insertions of one sound complex into another, let's say, thus: \(a + a^1 + a^2 + a^3 + a^4\), etc.3 or \(a + b + a + c + a + d\), etc. In this case, the ear will perceive \(a\) as an identical, stable element. But this is the simplest case. Another example is the correlation: \((a + b) : (a + c) = d\), in which the last link (d) would be the synthesis or resulting formation of the first two.*133 Usually any one of

2The dialectic of consecutiveness and simultaneity, from the point of view of form, becomes the dialectic of formation and crystallization.*132

3That is, a chain of variational or altered comparisons or transformations of a single element (a).
the modulatory, tonic-dominant formulae, in which the substitution of tonal functions of a chord or degree occurs, for example, \( I:V:IV=V:I \), contains such a phenomenon. In sound, the chords at \( b \) and \( d \) [see Ex. 33] may be identical, but, in essence, \( d \) is perceived as a new, enriched sound complex:

\[
\begin{array}{cccccc}
\text{a} & \text{b} & \text{a} & \text{c} & \text{d} \\
\end{array}
\]

Thus the simplest form of conclusion or cadence (IV:V:I) establishes a synthesis of all the degrees of the tonality. The consecutive perception of a musical composition, from the initial stimulus to the final closing complex engages the consciousness in a chain of sound correlations. Each successive correlation emerges for the ear with several meanings; either it contrasts with (opposes itself to) the preceding one, or it sums up and unifies it. But at the same time it must be the starting point for succeeding complexes, because within the composition there may not be a full close. If we designate by the letter \( i \) the beginning, the impulse, the initial impetus, then by the letter \( m \) a certain stage of motion, and within it a
series of correlated elements (a : b : c ...), and finally by the letter t the conclusion, the limit of motion, then on the basis of everything said above we will have to admit that in the system of European music, the formula of sound formation, i : m : t, will have to represent, not only each individual stage of motion, but also the complete perfect cadence which finally completes this motion—not only a composite link in the chain of conjugations, but also the entire composition as a whole (the composition itself as the result of the interaction of all elements). In the process of the unfolding of a chain of intonations there occurs a constant shift of functions of the fellow members of a given formula. For example, the third member, t (cadence, conclusion), is perceived as a brake in relation to the preceding group of intonations, but in relation to the succeeding stage, this is only a comparative, transient braking of motion and a "local" concentration of the prevailing intonations. In relation to the concluding cadence of the whole composition, all the internal cadences are to a considerable degree coordinative. In just the same way, the first member of the formula, i, the point of departure, can prove to be simultaneously an impulse which activates the motion of the
immediately following intonations through their contrast with the preceding, and a concluding link (a terminus) also, in relation to the preceding intonations, if we perceive this "moment" only as the next link in turn, apart from its connection with further progression.

For example, the Classics often begin the working-out [of the sonata allegro] with a repetition of the concluding phrase (the melodic cadence or chordal accompaniments) of the exposition, but they shift this phrase into another tonal sphere. There are no constructive changes within such a phrase, but in spite of the presence of identity of material in both instances of the intoning of the phrase, its functional significance changes sharply; in the first case it is a terminus, in the second, an initium, an impulse. Examples follow:

---

4. The modified principal theme often serves as the initial stimulus of the working-out. It often enters as a component, "affirming" element in the concluding part, and in this way places itself in a new tonal sphere and in a new environment as the antithesis to its own first exposure. The active and frequent participation of any basic element of the principal part is also possible in all stages of the formation, as cement, as a sort of cantus firmus. Haydn builds the development of parts of his symphonies from a single theme on such a principal, anticipating thereby the monothematicism of Liszt.
Mozart, Quartet No. 7 (transition to working-out):

34

Mozart, Quartet No. 9 (end of exposition and beginning of working-out):

35
Beethoven, Sonata for Violin, op. 23 (transition and beginning of working-out):

In the following example, the melody of the principal theme and the melodic cadence of the closing theme are combined in the capacity of an initial stimulus for the working-out.

Mozart, Quartet No. 5. Principal theme of the Allegro:
End of the exposition and beginning of the working-out:

Finally, any of the connecting elements—the links of the formula (i:m:t)—entering into m, can emerge in just the same way, in the capacity of i or t in relation
to any of the preceding or succeeding sound complexes.

For example, the intonation serving as a transition to the repetition of the exposition becomes the same in relation to the working-out. At the same time, this intonation is a refraction of the prevailing theme—the initiative intonation of the entire sonata allegro. For example, Haydn's F major Quartet, op.74, No. 2, begins thus:

39

a) \[ \begin{align*} &\text{etc.} \\ &\text{\textcopyright\textregistered} \end{align*} \]

This is the introduction; the theme of the allegro has the following form:

b) \[ \begin{align*} &\text{etc.} \\ &\text{\textcopyright\textregistered} \end{align*} \]

This complex emerges as the subsidiary theme:

c) \[ \begin{align*} &\text{etc.} \\ &\text{\textcopyright\textregistered} \end{align*} \]

The transition to the repetition of the exposition is based on the following:

d) \[ \begin{align*} &\text{\textcopyright\textregistered} \end{align*} \]

and the transition to the reprise is as follows:

e) \[ \begin{align*} &\text{\textcopyright\textregistered} \end{align*} \]
In a word, it is as if there occurs an intonational "overgrowth" of each of the elements which organize and comprise the motion.

In addition, as a result of various sorts of interruptions and elisions, and after the admission of intermediate links for the rectification or filling-in of rhythmic and intonational deviations, new complications arise in the system of intonational connections. The tonic, if it is not revealed at the proper time because of some deviation from the path, is compensated for at some distance, in the subsequent course of motion; an alteration included in the melodic structure of some phrase of "color," which does not receive a "resolution" at that point, demands, in its turn that an eventual conclusion be drawn from its appearance and, thereby, the renewal of stability; the so-called deceptive cadence delays the return of the tonic and intensified motion, but at the same time it even more persistently calls forth the tonic as the point of support, etc. In connection with the continuous transfer of functions and their transition into their opposites, all this taken together raises a complex network of mutual gravitations operating on one another at various distances and with varying force, or a system of
crossing, intonational arches.* 134

It goes without saying that there is definitely nothing abstractly formal nor subjective in the term mutual gravitation of sound elements; there is not a single system of sound relations in the world (as a result of the constantly evolving process in music of the selection or "stylization" of acoustical phenomena by the collective human consciousness) in which there is not a purposeful organization of connection, and an intonationally dynamic dependence between the tones included in the system (more about this in detail in Supplement 2, "Bases of Musical Intonation"). Music, to repeat, is a system of organized motion; it is not an anarchistic succession of sound complexes, but rather, their strictly mutually conditioned exposure in the process of intoning. Form is heard, is perceived, as a formation, and is crystallized in the consciousness as a unity (or, music is remembered and fixed in the consciousness as the result of the exposure of intonational contradictions). 6

6 The resultant unity, however, consists of unified links, which our consciousness "catches" in the sequence of a musical formation, for, as it has been said, this formation comprises an uninterrupted comparison and interlinking of sound complexes. Each comparison, after its exposure, becomes a unity in relation to what follows.
The system of crossing, intonational arches (an arch is only a necessary descriptive or illustrative analogy or a visual projection of musical correlations, and is not at all an identification with architectural terminology) permits one to understand the above designated correlation, \( i : m : t \), as a constructive principle of any organic musical composition and as an effective intonational element of each stage of musical formation. This correlation permits a constant transformation of the functions of each of its constituent members, so that, if we go from the moment of initial impetus or the beginning of the sounding of a composition, then it is possible to imagine the unfolding of the stages of a united musical formation in the following manner (of course, as a simplified scheme of inclusions): \( I : M : T = i : m : t(=i) : m : t(=i) : m : t \), etc., as a sort of continuity. I point out once more that \( m \) (motus) is a totality of a certain number of sound correlations, each particle of which may take on the function of \( i \) or \( t \), and that, in addition, each of the elements of the correlation \( (i : m : t) \) and its constituent members "radiates" an influence at a distance. That means such a scheme as the following is possible: \( i : m(a + b + c + \ldots) : t(=i) : m(d + e + f \ldots) : t(=i) \), etc.
The form of the sonata allegro has turned out to be the most intensive expression of this correlation, and the working-out, as the most important stage of formation of this form, embodying in itself the musical development, displays, especially significantly, the motor and dialectically dynamic nature of music. As to the views, stated here, on the character, principles, and types of formation of the exposition and working out of the symphonic sonata allegro, their application to the analysis of each separate case does not present difficulties. The thinking of the composer and of his epoch is reflected in the character of formation. In this sense, the form of the symphonic sonata allegro, as a type of dialectically contrasting formation (in contrast to the monothematicism of variations, canon, and fugue) was the result of a new, critical world view of the class which was moving toward supremacy. The dialectically contrasting kind of formation manifests itself in any stage of symphonic sonata formation, and makes itself felt in any concrete example of the exposure of the correlation. In the capacity of such an example, let us take at least the beginning and one feature of the working-out
section of Beethoven's C major sonata (op. 2, No. 3)\textsuperscript{7}:

In twelve measures we have a sufficiently persistent execution of the unifying rhythmic formula, \[ \begin{align*}
\text{\quad}\end{align*}\]
with its characteristic swing. It is the natural impetus for the entire motion. Thanks to the prevalence of this formula, the whole fragment is perceived in the form of a coherent complex with identical elements. Thus, the first member of the correlation i:m:t, the initium (i), proves to be the predominant one. The cadence (t) flows directly into a new section and serves as a point of departure for it (t = i), thanks to which the motion does not end on the thirteenth measure. The occurrence within the intonations of the chromaticisms c^# and f^# does not pass without notice, and later on receives its reflection in the intonations of a new theme, shifting the motion into another tonal sphere (from measure 26 of the sonata). Consequently, there arises a system of connection at a distance.*

Examining the correlation of intonational complexes within the first 12 measures, we see that the point of departure, the chord of the tonic, figures in the fourth, the fifth, the sixth, the seventh, the eighth, measures, etc., as well as in the first measure, now occupying a space of 4 and 6 beats, i.e., a measure and a measure and a half, now figuring as an extremely unstable six-four chord in a moment of sharp disequilibrium in the cadence and reinforcing the gravitation toward the tonic in its
dynamically striking appearance (measure 13). The tonal functions of the C major chord are nowhere changed (for a moment, they waver in measure 11 because of the introduction of $F^\#$ as the basis of a seventh chord on the fourth degree, but are immediately renewed). The dominant occupies a somewhat subordinate position, and the predominance of the tonic is accentuated in the entire fragment. Only the contrasting $F^\#$ (and, to a small degree, the $C^#$) "interrupts" this predominance and introduces into the music an element indicating the further possibility of forward movement.

The first four measures disclose one of the intonational complexes typical for the Classics—the correlation I : V : V : I, in which I = i, V = m (the moment of displacement or condition of unstable equilibrium) and I for the second time = t. Though complete in itself, this section demands further motion because of the fact that the verticals or columns of the tonic do not suppress the intonational tension formed between them (V occupies a two measure segment with the alliterative\textsuperscript{136} $C^#$ within it), and this is evoked by the fact that the basic rhythmic formula, $\begin{align*} \mid \underline{\underline{\underline{\underline{\mid \mid \mid \mid \mid}}}} \end{align*}$, is repeated, and by its repetition reinforces the instability. Further, examining the
melodic line, we see stepwise and even sliding motion (directed upward) alternating with leaps of the voice (a fourth in measure two and a sixth in measure four). The first leap of a fourth is filled in by the melodic motion of the third measure. The second leap remains unfilled. Thus, the four measures would seem to be architectonically closed (I:V:V:I) thanks to the strict symmetry, but, in fact, in the living sound, in intoning, it proves to be far from closed and demands further unfolding and completion.

Here before us is one of the simplest and most obvious examples of the difference between the formal, abstract, architectonic view of musical form as a mute scheme, removed from the intonational formation, removed from its actual sounding, and the study of form as a process, always perceptible to and verified by the ear. But the concept of form as the process of organizing music which is crystallized in the consciousness is not thereby disaffirmed, but is filled out and enriched. The study of interrelations which are only spatial (the interaction of symmetrical and asymmetrical constructive elements) without the perception of intonational mutual gravitations, i.e., the very act of organizing music, hangs in the air in the form of very
clever visual projections of rhythmic divisions. But the assimilation of these projections separates form schemes from music and creates a gulf between living musical speech and its forms. It then appears as if this living musical speech for some reason fills prepared, architectonically irreproachable form schemes (as water and wine fill vessels of different sizes and types), while actually music itself can exist splendidly without any schemes. However, it is possible to be convinced here that a complex which is architectonically closed and balanced to the eye (I : V - V : I) might demand development. Beethoven, in the following two measures, "catches up" the unfilled sixth, gives it the significance of a "local" point of departure and compresses the correlation I : V (tonic : dominant), transforming it from a two-measure construction (see measures one and two, three and four of the example cited) into a one-measure construction (see measures five and six), here twice repeating this new condensed execution. The ear senses an extremely unstable correlation. It is intensified further by the fact that the sixth does not remain unfilled to the end. The filling-in is realized in the following stage of motion (measures 7 and 8 of the musical example) and equilibrium is somewhat restored by the
cadence. Now it is as if we have a closed eight measure passage--I : V - V : I = 4 measures and I : V - I : V - I : II - V : I = 4 measures, the latter being an asymmetrical structure (with eight beats on the tonic, and six on the dominant). But, to make up for it, the melodic arc--the ascent from e\textsuperscript{1} to d\textsuperscript{1} [sic.]*137 and the descent to e\textsuperscript{1}--receives a full close.\textsuperscript{8} In the eight measure passage, the formula i : m : t is also realized, in which i takes up

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{example.png}
\caption{Example of a musical passage illustrating the non-convergence of cadence intonations and the tonal non-convergence of lines.}
\end{figure}

The non-coincidence of the "completions" of simultaneously operating factors is usually an indication of the instability of a formation and serves as a dynamically striking stimulus to the progression of music. This phenomenon is especially obvious in the polyphonic fabric, when one voice, for example, may intone the cadence formula, while another has not yet reached it. In the works of Bach there are many examples of this sort, as well as more complex linear non-concurrences.

The following example is from the First Brandenburg Concerto (Adagio, measure 9, etc.):

\textsuperscript{8}The non-coincidence of the "completions" of simultaneously operating factors is usually an indication of the instability of a formation and serves as a dynamically striking stimulus to the progression of music. This phenomenon is especially obvious in the polyphonic fabric, when one voice, for example, may intone the cadence formula, while another has not yet reached it. In the works of Bach there are many examples of this sort, as well as more complex linear non-concurrences.

The path leads from the non-convergence of cadence intonations to the tonal non-convergence of lines at a considerable distance, and, consequently, to polytonal complexes.
the first complete four measures, \( t = \) the formula of the complete cadence (the last two measures of the eight), and \( m = \) the repeated, unstable two measures (I : V - I : V).

The motion still does not stop, and not simply because of the occurrence of the connecting, half-measure, chromatic phrase (see measure eight of the example), but primarily because of the shift of the tonic to the second half of the measure (feminine ending) which occurs here, thanks to which, the stop on the tonic proves to be intonationally unsatisfactory. Beethoven then repeats the last four measures, but not literally, rather in the form of a variant with extremely important intonational and rhythmic displacements. When the perceiving ear compares the "original" with the "variant" there arises a new intonational "conflict," tensely demanding resolution or completion. This completion appears in the thirteenth measure; the tonic is intoned ff on the strong beat of the measure and authoritatively seizes the attention. Tension is quickly evoked, so intensively that the subsequent six-measure "stand" on the tonic, in the form of a arpeggiated run, up and down, does not evoke a feeling of inertness.

How is the working-out section of this sonata allegro constructed? The predominating and unifying rhythmic
formula does not appear for some time. Beethoven begins
the working-out section with a "catching up" and a series
of repetitions of the cadential-like phrase from the con­
cluing stage of the exposition:

\[
\text{etc., (in } f \text{ minor and } E^b \text{ major)}
\]

By means of the dispersion of a clear-cut melodic image in
a virtuoso, arpeggiated run—a device employed several times
in this sonata—and also by means of elisions, Beethoven
transfers the music from a flat tonal sphere (E\textsuperscript{b} major,
but without the appearance of the tonic; \textit{c} minor, also with­
out the tonic, but only the diminished seventh chord;
\textit{f} minor—a six-four chord of the tonic\textsuperscript{10}) into a sharp
sphere, by a harsh "break" from the \textit{f} minor six-four
chord to the dominant seventh and then the six-four chord
of \textit{f}\# minor, after which (through the six-five chord on
\textit{c}\#) he brings forward the principle theme of the sonata
in \textit{D} major, i.e., in the sharpest tonal juxtaposition of
it with the basic tonality of the entire allegro (C major).

\textsuperscript{10} From measure 97, from the beginning of the sonata,
or from measure 7 of the working-out section.
The sharp displacement, having occurred, is soon filled-in. After D major, this theme is led into g minor, then c minor, then f minor, and, in this way, the six-four chord of this tonality, abandoned above, attains completion before the beginning of the reprise, i.e., before the recurrence of the first theme in the basic tonality. The "demonstration" of the first theme in the contrasting key of D major is effectively forgotten, whereas the rhythmic formula which organized this theme and unified the entire motion of the allegro, appearing in a condensed form (\( \text{\textbullet \textbullet \textbullet \textbullet} \)), remains within our field of perception, forming a transition to the reprise.
CHAPTER X

FORMS BASED ON THE PRINCIPLE OF CONTRAST (2)

The description just introduced of the process of working-out in one of the sonatas of "the eighteenth century Beethoven", illustrating all that has been said above about the stage of symphonic, sonata allegro formation, brings us to the further analysis of this formation, not only in sonatas and symphonies, but also in other compositions corresponding to them. The expositions and working-out sections usually display a complicated "play" of contrasting sound combinations, and constitute a sort of "dramatic structure" with conflicting tendencies, ideas, and characteristic images.

In the latter connection, both operatic and non-operatic overtures—not of the superficial, concert-virtuoso style, but rather, overtures saturated with symphonic development and transformed into concise, one-movement cycles of motion—are especially significant. In them, the themes emerge in full measure as the bearers of characteristics or ideas, and the "working-out section" is the arena of conflicts and collisions, in which the consecutive, evolutionary formation of music changes, at
every step, into the contrasting and the catastrophic; the gradualness of conclusions and their preparations are replaced by intonationally revolutionary displacements and unexpected shifts and alterations (mutations). The Beethoven overtures give especially brilliant examples of the "instrumental dramatic quality," and the finales or concluding stages of some of them represent exceptionally expressive and organic syntheses of events (e.g., the tragic ending of the overture to Coriolanus, the triumphal symphony of Egmont, the ecstatic joy in the final of Leonore, No. 3). Overtures are characterized by more concise stages of transition and connection, and more condensed working-out sections than symphonies.

To counterbalance the sharply dramatic formation, there emerge those compositions (symphonies, sonatas, overtures, symphonic poems) in which a broadly developed, lyrical, song line (not a total theme, but a line) generalizes and smoothes out the constructive sections of the symphonic, sonata allegro. Undulating ascents and descents, dynamic gradations, the "swelling" and release of the fabric, in a word, manifestations of organic life prevail, in such "songlike" sonatas, over oratorical pathos, over sudden contrasts, over dramatic dialogue and the headlong exposure of ideas. The Great B♭ Major Sonata of Schubert is a characteristic example of this trend. It is noticeable in the symphonies of Brahms and Bruckner, and also in
the works of Mahler. Nevertheless, even in working-out sections of the most diverse character, it is still possible to distinguish the three successive stages: the moment of departure (pushing away from the cadence of the exposition, displacement, the push forward) and preparation for development, one or more stages of development (the display of ideas in the exposition from various points of view, their juxtaposition, their crossbreeding, their breaking up), and, finally, the feature of gathering together, of concentration—usually an organ point—on which is formed the transition to the reprise, to the return of the dominating theme. If the establishment of the basic propositions occurs in the exposition, and their development and conflict in the working-out section, then there occurs in the reprise a reduction to unity. Actually, by its position the reprise is a synthesis—that feature in which, out of the comparisons of the exposition and working-out section, a new unity must rise. In the reprise, a process must be realized similar to the formation of a new quality.* Thus, the scheme of the symphonic sonata allegro ceases to be merely a rational construction. Beethoven (he is incorrectly associated with Kant; Beethoven is much more a contemporary of Hegel than a follower of Kant)* struggled long and hard with the problem of the reprise. The difficulty lay in the fact that a single tonal unity of the principal and subordinate parts did not
alone realize a synthesis as a negation of negation, did not give a "new quality," but most often merely completed the formation, firmly, but in a mechanical way. Thus, an organic conclusion could not be drawn from all the preceding intonational conflicts, which meant that either all the preceding development led to nothing at all, and the reprise was a dead-end, a wall, a mechanical brake, or the reprise was not the concluding stage of motion, but only a powerful point of support, naturally opposed to the working-out section. In the *Egmont* overture (1810) a conclusion was found which was prompted by the program. But somewhat earlier, Beethoven, in expanding the limits of the symphonic allegro under pressure of necessity in the headlong and stormy development of the thematic ideas, had already begun greatly to enlarge the coda, i.e., the music after the reprise. This became apparent already in the Second Symphony (1802), and received great development in the third (1804). Thus, symphonic formation became more complicated. Apparently, instead of the formally consistent trilogy of exposition - working-out section - reprise (impetus - development - conclusion; thesis - antithesis - synthesis; or strophe - antistrophe - epode*¹⁴⁰*) a broadly inclusive, periodic system was formed, with a complex differentiation of functions within each of its sections. If we regard the exposition of the Third Symphony as an impetus of colossal force, evoking the most intensive
development (working-out), then the reprise with its tonal unity, of course, did not represent a synthesis, but became only a dam, holding back the instability for a time and concentrating the operating forces (antagonists). Out of the consecutive execution in the reprise of the music of the exposition, music already assimilated by the ear, and here grasped as basic, identical, firmly organized material, the feeling of equilibrium arose, but there was no organic synthesis of the formation, for as a result of development, a stage already passed was again intoned, but was not a conclusion of the music, engendered by the entire preceding formation and enriched by it. In other words, the elements making up the working-out section had to transfer into their opposites, into forces completing the motion, rather than stimulating it. This is observed in the Beethoven codas. In relation to the reprise, they are like a new stage of development, and a new type of working-out section, but in relation to the working-out section which precedes the reprise, the forces operating in the coda emerge as those engendered by the working-out section, but directed, not toward conflict, not toward the exposure of contrasts, but toward the establishment of a synthesis and a concentration of motion in the final basic stage. Thus, the motion, not brought to a stop by the reprise, but only tonally regulated, evokes the coda as a new affirmation of the basic propositions. It is interesting how
persistently and urgently the principal theme of the "Eroica" is affirmed in the coda. This is far from a "mechanical flood-gate."

Thus, the exposition and the working-out section, comprising the first half of the formation of the allegro, represent a powerful expansion of motion. To this onslaught is opposed the reprise, in which the repeated music of the exposition loses its function as an impetus and is transformed into a massive support. The broadly developed coda, based partly on elements of the music of the working out section, joins with the reprise and together with it forms a second huge section of the allegro.

In such an organization, Beethoven found it necessary to include, in the development of ideas, still another antithetical sphere beside the subsidiary part. He achieved this in the "Eroica," by introducing a new, contrasting, lyrical theme into the working-out section. This theme naturally returned in the coda, complicating the formation of the trilogy and affirming the division of the allegro into two large masses with periodization within: thesis (the sphere of the principle part), first antithesis (the sphere of the subordinate part), second antithesis (execution of the new, lyrical theme at the highest point of the struggle of ideas and dramatic tension), and an answering, synthesized kind of repeated execution of the music of the exposition and, in part, of the working-out
section, occurring in the reprise and coda. The trilogy is destroyed, in a formal sense, by the developed coda (four stages occur: exposition, working-out section, reprise and coda) and by the inclusion of a new antithesis; but it is not destroyed in its essence. Here we see the triumph of Beethoven's creative intellect over the scheme. The essence of the matter seems to me to be the following: the whole allegro of the "Eroica" is an uninterrupted torrent of the development of ideas in their interpenetration and coexistence. But to the conflicting tendencies of the first section (the exposition and working-out section find themselves in the correlation of thesis and antithesis) is opposed a synthesis, jointly realized by the reprise and the coda, for, as I have already said, the reprise alone, being the repeated, tonally summarized execution of the basic ideas, did not solve, either dynamically, nor psychologically, the problem of symphonic sonata development and its synthesis as the negation of negation, as a new formation (quality) resulting from the juxtaposition of thesis and antithesis. In essence, the tri-partite nature remains intact. But another question is whether the coda of the "Eroica" is not a sound complex which fully synthesizes the entire formation of the symphonic allegro.*141 To me personally it seems that the last movement, the finale, may be such a synthesis in cyclic forms, but even then not always. Theatricalized finales of overtures are syntheses of single
movement formations; for example, *Egmont* and *Leonore* unquestionably stand forth in this connection. Multiple repetition of the principal theme in the allegro of the "Eroica" in a denser and denser sound environment (with an increase in the force of sonority), of course, evokes the feeling of a long familiar idea, but not of a qualitatively new sphere. The reason for that is clear; Beethoven in his symphonic allegros projected dramatic stages of conflict and the triumph or destruction of an ideal, heroic personality, bringing good fortune to his fellow men. In the development of the allegro of the Second and Third Symphonies, after a chain of conflicts, the synthesizing coda takes on the significance of a triumph of the thematic idea in a concentrated struggle conducted through an extended formation. It energetically asserts itself within the encirclement of other ideas, which were opposed to it earlier, and which now accompany it and are coordinated with it. Therefore, that "music of a new quality," which is sometimes formed in the codas of the first movements of Beethoven symphonies, inevitably revolves in the orbit of the main idea, is eradicated by it, and returns to it. It is a different matter in overtures in which the symphonic formation is tied together by a program, and limited by a given, self-contained, non-cyclic task. The synthesizing finale of the "Egmont" overture flows out of the entire formation of the tragedy; the hero dies but his cause triumphs. From
this the music of the concluding stage is formed, not as
the assertion of the leading theme, subordinating everything
to itself, not as still another exposure and enrichment of
the sphere of the principal part, but as a new quality, as
a new formation. And if in the first movement of the
Eroica we have, in essence, an evolutionary formation to
the end, then here, in the finale [of Egmont], a leap, a
mutation of the music is perceived as the most organic
synthesis, as a triumphant idea engendered by the struggle
of contrasting tendencies.

After everything which has been said about the
formation of the symphonic sonata allegro, there is no
necessity to dwell in detail on the formation of overtures
either by Beethoven or by other composers. I refer the
reader to attempts at the analysis of this form and the
disclosure of its significance made by me for other
reasons. The sphere of "the overture" is, in its own way,
the richest experimental field for the application of those
stimuli of musical formation which can be united as
principles of contrast (struggle, conflict, dialectical
formation of ideas, "instrumental dramatics"). From the
point of view of the creation and accumulation of flexible,
exact, and concise devices and media of expression in the

---

1 Igor' Glebov, "Uvertura Ruslan i Lyudmila Glinki
[Overture to Glina's Ruslan and Lyudmila]", Muzykal'naya
letopis" [Musical Chronicle], II (Petrograd, 1923).
symphonic, sonata allegro, the work of composers on overtures seems to me to be a creative laboratory in which all the outstanding European musicians took a most active part.

In analyzing the dynamic formation of the first allegro in Beethoven's Third Symphony, I called attention to the exposure there of the consistent development of ideas through the periodization of motion and to the surmounting by Beethoven of the formal tripartite scheme with preordained limits for each section. The dynamic formation of music in the struggle of contrasting thematic stimuli, leading to the final affirmation of the basic thesis, makes itself felt in the first movement of the Ninth Symphony to an even greater degree than in the Third Symphony. There the motion is developed in four, consecutive variant stages. I say variant, because each of the stages has a common impetus or initial stimulus, and the leading ideas are intoned in various gradations of sonority. The four stages comprise the formation of the first movement—the exposition; its development, or the first variant; the reprise or second variant of the exposition; and the coda, or third variant, with a synthesizing intensification which closes the motion and a final statement of

---

2I have in mind the build up of "funeral fanfares" on the chromatic, "creeping" figuration of strings and bassoons,
the basic thesis in the form of a melodic cadence instead of merely the chords of the tonic. In each of the stages, all the basic thematic ideas or operating forces (in the dynamic sense) take part, each time in a changed form, as if being enriched from each execution in its turn and by each mutual contact. Such parallelism or consecutive stratification of the stages of an essentially unified development is completely natural in such a gigantic conception; the listener grasps the music thanks to just this parallelism which integrates a complex formation, and thanks to the varied quality of identical material in each of the stages—grasps it in spite of the scope of the conception, the multitude of contrasting juxtapositions, the splintering and permutation of the thematic material. Thus, musical development which is contrasting in its essence is summarized by means of the repeated exposure of similar or identical operating forces in their varied formation or interrelation.

In his Ninth Symphony Beethoven embodied a conception quite exceptional as to its scope and interest, and its first movement occupies by right, as well as by location, an outstanding position in the cycle, in comparison with the first movements of all the other Beethoven symphonies, in spite of their indisputably valuable qualities. The

i.e., the music from measure 513 of the first movement of the symphony.
development of music through a series of variational "transformations" of image-bearing ideas nowhere else rises to such a wise treatment of the correlative identity and contrast and the organization of unity through the exposure of opposites. The year of performance of the Ninth Symphony (1824) is the boundary beyond which the problem of symphonism branches out, spreads, admits more or less successful solutions; but, in principle and in essence, all subsequent solutions of this problem, either oppose themselves to [the solution embodied in Beethoven's Ninth Symphony], or vary it in the most diverse aspects, but they do not surpass the boundary established by Beethoven. This must be recognized now, when the old world has broken down and everything which was of value in it can be discerned at a great distance. The Ninth Symphony was a gigantic push forward, and at the same time was already a synthesis of genius, the heralding of an ideal new world, and the consciousness of expectations not realized by revolution. It seems to me that even if Beethoven had not died in 1827, but had survived longer, he would not have written a second Ninth Symphony, nor a Tenth Symphony, which would have surpassed its predecessor.

If one takes as the point of origin both the crystallization of the symphonic, sonata allegro in its typical form and of the formation of the symphonic sonata cycle, the creation of the Mannheimers, that of Haydn (from
the 50's of the eighteenth century), and that of the sons of Bach, then the rapid evolution and sharp growth of this type of musical formation, advancing contemporaneously with Klopstock and Lessing, coincides with the epoch of "stormy strivings" in Germany, and the liberatory currents in France, which led to the great revolution. This is the epoch of bold darings and contradictions. When one reads the passionate attacks of Johann Georg Hamann against rational formalism and becomes acquainted with the majestic conceptions of Herder; when one lives through the stormy and restless outbursts, the results of a surplus of forces and a thirst for activity of the heroes in the dramas of Klinger ("Sturm und Drang," 1776) and Friedrich Müller; finally, when one falls under the influence of the violent utterances of Wilhelm Heinse and the unrestrained fantasy of Bürger, one understands that music had to follow after contemporaneity, and that it truly followed

3"Herder, thanks to his conception of evolution, is the first man in Germany with a sense of history" (F. Gundolf, Goethe [1916], p. 89). Against the concept of Schöpfung (creation), he set off that of Entwicklung (development) and perceived "the evolution of historical diversity, both in the world as a whole, and in individual manifestations, in their historical interconnection."
it, creating a form in which the *principium concidentiae oppositorum* and conflict, as operating forces, revealing themselves in contrasting images, became the leading stimuli of motion. Beethoven, a contemporary of Hegel (1770-1831), brought out the dialectic of the sonata and intensified the functional interconditionality of the formative elements of the sonata and symphony to the highest degree of expressiveness. Simultaneously, formations of a different sort found a place for themselves; a thread stretches from the dream of Rousseau,*146 from the eulogies of Herder on the unassuming life and song of the people, to the simple folk element in the symphonies of Haydn, and to the song-like, unsophisticated sonatas of Schubert. On the other hand, in France, Berlioz again picked up the title "Sturm und Drang," and through the prism of Byronism and "Byronized" Goethe (Berlioz's Faust is not so far from Lelio and Harold) led the dramatized symphony out onto a new path. Laying aside the intimate, "chamber" sonata of the Rococo style and the open-air, "village and rural" symphonism of Haydn*147 as premises belonging to the eighteenth century it is possible to break up the evolution of the symphonic sonata formation of the first half

---

*The principle of the destruction of opposites.*
of the nineteenth century into four channels, dominated, of course, by one basic channel—the symphonism of Beethoven—expressing the dynamics of the attitude of the prevailing class.

In the song-like sonata and symphony a process is observed in the working-out section, which is more like the blossoming of melody, of pro and contra ideas, than conflicts of character or a dramatized game. Of course, there is no absolute limit, but, nevertheless, one may state with a high degree of confidence that Beethoven emerges, in his sonatas, symphonies, and overtures, as the dramatist and people's tribune of the epoch of revolution, that he directs musical formation as if he is planning the action and "bringing together" characters in a tragedy. Elements of the theatricality of the Greeks and of Shakespeare (for example, the dramatic quality of the "Appassionata") are combined in his work with an unrestrained play of passions as in the romantic plays of Schiller, and in the C# minor sonata (in this—to use the expression of V.V. Stasov—"wonderful drama, with love, jealousy and a terrible blow
of a dagger at the end" one cannot help feeling the pathos of *Kabale und Liebe* and of *Die Räuber*. In fact, there are two different cultures—the theatre and the orator's platform, on the one hand, and lyrical excitement and psychoanalysis, on the other. The exposure of emotion in dramatics and rhetorical composition is one art, while the attempt to infect the listener, not with preaching, not with "playing," not with acting, but with direct personal experience, with sincere utterance, with tension and release of the emotional current is an entirely different art (the Schubert sonata, in this sense, may be the antithesis of the Beethoven sonata, as Romantic is to Classical). And the very same epoch brought forth a third type of virtuoso, concert and salon sonata, very weak dramatically, but saturated with refined lyricism—the lyricism of agreeable speech, but not the lyricism of "I cannot keep silent," of agitation evoked by an impassioned feeling of nature or by amorous contemplation. Refined speech, instead of preaching or flaming rhetoric, coquettishness instead of sincere love, the play with forms

---

instead of the competition of ideas and characters—all are characteristic of this type. In the texture of such sonatas (issuing from the rococo sonata of the eighteenth century), ornamentalism, foppery in the form of the virtuoso aspect, the calculation of coloristic effects, prevail side-by-side with the pathos of the theatre of romantic adventure and now clamorous, now sentimental melodrama. In their melodics there is the comfort of the salon, or a concert gloss. The best examples in this area are to be found in the sonatas of Weber. There is little in them of the Weber of Der Freischütz, but there are still pleasant, fresh pages, either in the character of theatrical romanticism, with the pathos of the terrible and the extraordinary (with the indispensable diminished seventh chord), or, as a contrast to this pathos, "domestic" comfortableness, modest, in the taste of the Biedermeier style. Thus, the scheme of the sonata is the same everywhere, but the formation of the music and its character and, at the same time, the process of formation, as it is perceived in the sounding, in the intoning, are profoundly diverse. The working-out section in the "concert" type of sonata loses its tension, and is reduced to effectively external comparisons.

The properties of the symphonic sonata allegro were displayed still differently in so-called program music.
(Berlioz, Liszt). In program music, contrasting formation, as the basic property of the sonata, interpreted the situations, images, and ideas, presented and dictated by the program, through its own principles of formation. The action and pictorial quality (figurative elements—landscape and genre) forced the intrinsic development of the music to combine with stimuli given from without. As a form which is chiefly dramatic and rises from the formation of contrasting thematic ideas, the symphonic sonata allegro turned out to be an extremely flexible medium, capable of assimilating programs of the most diverse nature, as a result of which the mutual fertilization and organic inter-action of music, poetry, literature, philosophy, and painting became possible (Liszt, Strauss, Reger, Mahler). Of course, to repeat, only the idea of thematic development, as it occurred in the symphonic sonata formation, made such a fruitful union possible.

Berlioz, with exceptional insight, divined and developed the theatrical prerequisites of symphonic sonata form as a dynamic cycle and created most valuable models of "instrumental theatre" or theatricalized symphony and also the symphony as a romantic novel, as oratorical speech, etc.
CHAPTER XI

THE FORMATION OF CYCLES ON THE BASIS OF CONTRAST

Up to now, we have concerned ourselves with one of the highest forms of music, in which the principle of contrast, as a factor which stimulates motion, has found its profoundly meaningful realization. But the symphonic sonata allegro is not always a closed whole, but rather, a part of a sonata or a symphony, both of which represent cycles of "musical motion" in diverse textures and tempos. The origin of instrumental cycles, and the factors in the historical process of their rise and development are very likely rooted in muscular-motor stimuli (the comparison of motions of different rhythms and character, the tempo and step of dances, as evident in suite compositions) and also in stimuli resulting from an enriched spiritual life, in accord with the growth of intellectual culture. The evolution of instrumentalism signifies the liberation of music from the direct influence of the theatre, poetry, and the dance, and the growth of its independence (sonata cycles).
I will venture to make several references. First, I cite the example, available in Musikgeschichte in Beispielen of Riemann-Scherin, of a very early contrasting rhythmic juxtaposition—the succession of a pavane (a stately and smooth-flowing dance) and a galliard (a mobile dance with leaps). The contrast of tempos is largo and allegro giocoso, according to the determination of the editors. The rhythmic-metric contrasts are ritmo di tre battuto [sic.] in duple meter (alla breve), and ritmo di quattro battuto in triple meter.* The melodic material is identical [in both dances], but correspondingly rhythmically transformed. The period is 1530. This same example is introduced side by side with other worthwhile examples for the study of the organizational processes of music, in the work by F. Blume, Studien zur Vorgeschichte der Orchestersuite im 15. und 16. Jahrhundert. The pavane and galliard in

---

1 Hugo Riemann, Musikgeschichte in Beispielen, commentary by Arnold Schering (Leipzig: [Verlag von E. A. Seeman], 1912), pp. 58-59.

2 The material of the early suites leads directly to the sources of European instrumental music—
the sixteenth century form almost the first substantial link in the history of the suite (for it is necessary, at present, to speak with caution about such a role for the Basses danses in the fifteenth century). Of other paired formations, the following stand out: basse danse and tourdion, passamezzo and salterello, allemande and salterello. All these juxtapositions arise, in choreographic practice, from the coupling of the processional dance, "by step," in a sliding motion and even rhythm, and the dance with "leaps," in uneven rhythm. A third member, the dance, volte (Italian piva), was associated with the polyphonic dance music of the Middle Ages and Renaissance, and to observation of the growth of modified and variational organization of the fabric; this is the laboratory of instrumental melodies. Blume very neatly defines the art of variation "as the progressive intensification of an idea, generating ever newer forms out of itself." As a matter of fact, the material in Blume's work on the evolution of instrumental variations and the accumulation and growth of the technique of identical (modified) formations in the music of the Renaissance, are especially interesting. Blume considers the allemande, "Lorrayne," in Pierre Phalese's 1571 and 1583 collections to be the earliest example of variation in the orchestral dance.
paired group. The factor organizing the form was, above all, the rhythmic transformation of the material. From $\frac{2}{3}$ was obtained $\frac{2}{3}$ and from $\frac{1}{2}$ was derived $\frac{1}{2}$. But, as Blume correctly observed, the further development of the suite as a musically regulated process of the cyclicization and mutation of material was conditioned by other more fundamental factors than "Suitenbildung durch Reduktion," and in particular by the growth of domestic and social music-making, not only with utilitarian goals, but for the sake of the enjoyment of music.

The problem, first of all, consisted in the combination of two principles of organization. On the one hand, there was the principle of preserving, in each of the movements of the suite, elements identical with the first movement (this was achieved, not only by a purely mechanical transference of the melody from one meter to another, but by more and more profound metamorphoses and modifications of the basic melodic line), and, on the other hand, the principle of accentuating contrasting elements, thereby pointing up the independence of each new movement (for example, by means of a new harmonization of the common material). It is possible to trace such tendencies even in the most primitive suite formations of the second quarter of the sixteenth century in collections of Franco-Netherlandish dances (the best examples, once
again, are in the above-mentioned book of F. Blume).
But the most striking and highly artistic achievements
of the sixteenth century in the historical perspective of
suite formation on the basis of the variant technique\(^3\), as
a principle which both unifies and develops the motion,
are [illustrated by] the instrumental pieces titled
Pass'e mezzo d'Italia and Pass'e mezzo moderno from the
1583 collection of Pierre Phalese.\(^{152}\) The former con­sists of an initial melody (alla breve) and four variants,
(modi) of it, then a reprise (represa) with two variants,
and an adjoining saltarello in 3/4, with some common in­tonations, but from different melodic material, with four
variations\(^{153}\) and a reprise; the latter is made up of an
initial melody (alla breve) and four modi (secondo, terzo,
quarto, and quinto), then a reprise with three modi, and
finally a saltarello in 3/4 with two variants and a devel­oped reprise.\(^{154}\)

\(^3\) I employ the concept, variant, as opposed to ornamen­tal, instrumental variations. In the case of variants, we
are not concerned with an immutable skeleton on which orna­ments blossom, but rather with reorganizations (expansions
and contractions or reductions) of the melodic lines.
Subsequently, in the nineteenth century, variations similar
to the variant finally began to dominate over ornamental
variations.
Examples

I offer several examples of modi from the above-mentioned Pass'e mezzo d'Italie (Fr. Blume, Example 25a).\footnote{155}

43

Secondo modo

44

Quinto modo

45
Saltarello

Secondo modo

Quarto modo

Represa
As the material of these early cyclic formations indicates, musicians proceeded in their improvisional practice by means of a thorough assimilation of every inch of what had been achieved intonationally. The technique of moving the voices forward is based on a firm and persistent clinging to an initial melodic point (it is usually the finalis), a timid departure from it and an immediate return, two or three variant motions, and a cadence. True, some melodic, instrumental formations of the fifteenth century contain up to five or six, more or less, independent variant "motives" or articulations, but all of them are "short-breathed," contrasting only slightly and, as just mentioned, they "hurry" to return to the point of origin. Apparently intonational stability was attained with difficulty. Perception, in just the same way, apparently, demanded a continuous feeling of identity and "touch" with the points of support, there being no other means for "remembering". More prolonged motion, over a comparatively large distance, in view of the necessity to intone the points of departure frequently, did not come easily till the time when the ear began to distinguish basic points of support with their functions and mutual gravitations; then each newly attained point could be grasped and from there advanced further. The lines began little by little to become more developed and more extensive.
Still, on this path, the variant-type of working-out could not progress beyond comparatively narrow limits and a restricted number of devices, while formations based on ornamental variations were perceived more easily as a series of stages in the development and transformation of given melodic material, than as a progression. Dance pieces, constrained by the constant exposure of a rhythmic formula, varied the same motion, and therefore it was difficult to consider the process in the sense of a widening of the size and duration of the music. The dance rhythm formula permitted a considerable amount of modified repetition within defined limits, but in order to alter and enlarge the construction, in order to carry out the development of cycles in full measure, it was necessary to find more favorable soil. This, naturally, proved to be the area of instrumental music which was not conditioned by the dance, especially organ music. Without going into an historical examination of the separate forms, since in the given instance the tracing of the principles of cyclic, non-dance formation back to its sources is not as important to us as their more or less distinct manifestations, let us point out only a few, especially characteristic phenomena, as for example, the instrumental canzoni, church and chamber sonatas, and other similar compositions of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, from which the cyclic compositions of the Classical and Romantic Periods
(eighteenth and nineteenth centuries) were gradually formed. Six canzoni of Frescobaldi^4 (1583-1644) represent interesting models of cyclic construction. The first four-voiced canzona in G (Dorian mode with the key signature of F major) consists of a succession of uniform, fast \( \frac{4}{4} \), slow \( \frac{3}{2} \), and fast \( \frac{4}{4} \) sections. Imitation serves as the factor tying the composition together. The first fast section is a gradual germination of the fabric in a fugue-like, clear-cut execution of the voices—the statement of the theme, its imitation at the lower octave, the entrance of a third, middle voice at the fifth, like an answer, then its imitation at the lower octave (bass voice), after which there is a cadence on the dominant.

Then a new theme is intoned over the first theme, imitated at the octave in exactly the same way by the middle and bass voices, etc., etc., in a word, the prototype of the double fugue. The second section is a measured, peaceful section \( \frac{3}{2} \), tied together in exactly the same way by imitation of the melody; it ends with a cadenza.

---


Three of these are also found in Luigi Torchi (ed.), L'arte musicale in Italia, Vol. III: Composizioni per organo e cembalo, secoli XVI, XVII, XVIII (Milan: G. Ricordi & Co., n.d.).
(an improvisational episode, breaking the regularity) and then transfers into the last fugal allegro (the theme is immediately accompanied by a contrasting addition). This first execution is also interrupted by a cadenza, somewhat similar to the preceding one. After this follows a variant of the theme, but with a new contrasting addition, developed with great scope to the point of striking sonority. Common motivic elements permeate the whole fabric. Before us is a strictly constructed, cyclic, polyphonic composition with a predominance of elements of identity. Inertia is overcome mainly through the juxtaposition of sections in different meters, and, where there is a common measure of time, through the "play" in the shift of durations and the insertion of cadenzas into the regular structure of the music (the most contrasting factor).

The second four-voiced canzona (in C) also contains three sections, differing according to the prevailing durations in each of them and the character of the leading imitated motives. In the first section, rhythmically regular (on the basis of a dactylic impetus \( \uparrow \uparrow \uparrow \uparrow \), etc.), there is again imitative motion, which, after all the voices have been concentrated in a sonorous ensemble, is dispersed in a cadenza-like cadence. The second section (in \( \frac{3}{2} \)) is interrupted by an extended cadenza. The third (in \( \frac{4}{4} \)) contains two fugal executions of the theme,
which is a variant of the theme of the first section (identity). In connection with rhythm, here, as in the first canzona, the outer sections in duple meter frame the middle section in triple meter. The third canzona (G),\(^5\) also four-voiced, is of a different type, in which the first section \(\(\text{\(4\)}\)\) is replaced by motion in \(\frac{3}{4}\), flowing out of the same first thematic impulse and also treated fugally. It is interrupted by a short cadenza-like cadence, after which a new transformation of the leading theme occurs with more mobile figurations. This section transfers again into three-beat motion, the theme of which (executed imitatively) is also formed from the initial impulse. The last section, still another new variant of the leading theme with a new contrasting addition, again proceeds in even-numbered rhythm \(\(\text{\(4\)}\)\).

\(^5\)In Torchi, Ibid.; it is the first of the three printed there.
Here are these metamorphoses of the original idea:

50

a) Allegro moderato

b) Allegro vivace (J - J)

c) Allegro moderato

d) Adagio

e) Allegro moderato
The fourth canzona (in F), energetic in its tempo, consists of a brisk section in \( \frac{4}{4} \), a peaceful one in \( \frac{6}{4} \), a march-like section in \( \frac{4}{4} \), closing again with motion in \( \frac{6}{4} \) and a short, closing cadential turn in even-numbered rhythm. There are common motivic variants. The fifth canzona (C) consists of slow and smooth sections and motives alternating periodically with mobile and agitated ones, or, one might say, of juxtapositions of contemplative music with dance music (\( \frac{3}{2} + \frac{3}{4} + \frac{3}{2} + \frac{3}{4} \); this prevalence of triple meter is interesting). It is as if contrasts of mood are formed from these shifts.

The sixth canzona (C major)\(^6\) is clear, solidly constructed music. The two outer sections in \( \frac{3}{1} \), with smooth motion, frame the two middle sections in \( \frac{3}{2} \), the tempo of which is characteristic of the dance with "leaping" rhythms: \( \text{♩ ♩ ♩ ♩} \) and \( \text{♩ ♩ ♩ ♩} \). The sections are separated by cadences; the C major triad in \( \frac{4}{4} \) meter ends the first section, F major in \( \frac{4}{4} \)--the second, and C major in \( \frac{4}{4} \)--the third and fourth sections. This canzona is a clear-cut, four-section cycle, though very

\(^6\)In Torchi's edition it is the third, and, like the two preceding ones, is cited without arbitrary fantasies of tempo designation, with which Casella, the editor of the above-mentioned publication [I Classici della musica italiana], supplied all six canzonas.
short. Proceeding from correlations of durations, it is possible to determine the speed of motion in the canzoni, relatively of course, not in the sense of our tempo designations, but in terms of a pattern and a comparison of the preceding section with that which follows it. The terms fast (or quick) and slow motion I will henceforth apply, not in the sense of our allegro and adagio, but rather in the sense of more animated and less animated motion (abbreviated as m. [for medlennoe=slow] and b. [for bystroe=fast] ). The six canzonas follow this scheme:

I. m. \( \frac{4}{4} + b. \frac{3}{2} : m. \frac{4}{4} \\
II. m. \frac{4}{4} : b. \frac{3}{2} : m. \frac{4}{4} \\
III. m. \frac{4}{4} : m. \frac{3}{4} + m. \frac{4}{4} : b. \frac{3}{4} : m. \frac{4}{4} \\
IV. m. \frac{4}{4} : m. \frac{6}{4} : m. \frac{4}{4} : m. \frac{6}{4} \\
V. b. \frac{3}{2} + m. \frac{3}{4} : b. \frac{3}{2} : m. \frac{3}{2} : b. \frac{3}{2} : m. \frac{3}{4} \\
VI. b. \frac{3}{1} + m. \frac{3}{2} : m. \frac{3}{2} + b. \frac{3}{1}

7 I denote contiguity of sections by the sign (:), and independence by the sign (+). Another important point is that slowness or quickness [in this music] are usually not achieved by accelerating [or slowing down] the measure of durations, but rather by increasing or diminishing the number of parts [i.e., notes] within the measure.\[157\]
Let us try now to outline the basic factors (I have not made up my mind to say norms) in the organization of cycles during the first half of the seventeenth century.

Factors which unify and evoke a feeling of identity are: (1) modal unity with few deviations; (2) motivic relationship (the varying of "melodic figures"); (3) periodicity in the return of identical meters and rhythmic formulae, sometimes passing on to a symmetry of meters, rhythms and motivic variants, i.e., the employment of identical material at the beginning and the end; (4) regularity of motion (stability of the unit of time or basic beat, in the face of differences of duration in each of the sections; (5) imitative texture.

Factors which serve to counteract monotony and inertness of motion, and evoke a feeling of contrast are: (1) the intrusion of chromaticism, which brings "contradictory intonations" and an interaction of diatonically clear-cut and "colored" motives into the regularity of the musical lines; (2) the juxtaposition of various rhythmic formulae and rhythmically diverse motives (themes), in general, with motion in even note values--a factor of fundamental
importance in music of other periods also; (3) juxtaposition of the kind of continuous and regular motion which flows out of the imitative style (the stability of the unit of time and the leading rhythmic formula—the "subject") with "arbitrary," improvisational motion, such as is exemplified by cadenzas which "disperse" and interrupt the regular flow of the music; (4) the contrast between a spaced-out and a filled-in fabric (especially between the beginning—the accumulation of voices—and the full ensemble), a device which almost entirely lost its significance in the four-part, harmonic-homophonic texture, but was inevitable in the imitative style; (5) the opposition of linear to chordal motion, of the horizontal to the vertical, and of imitative to harmonic texture. The latter has been one of the fundamental factors of formation since the sixteenth century (especially in fantasias, preludes, capriccios, toccatas, etc.). The distinction

---

8In addition to this sort of distinction, it should be noted further that the "play of durations" and the contrast of "smooth" and "irregular" melodies, in general, play a major role, especially in the Classical suites (for example, one need only compare the pattern of the allemande with that of the courante, and the patterns of both of them with that of the gigue). The basis for such contrasts lies in the smooth, sliding step or the "springing" step of [contrasting] dances (e.g., a Basse danse and a Spring-Tanz such as the saltarello, galliard, etc.) which exerts influence both on the rhythmics and the intonational organization of a melody.
between ricercar and toccata lies in the complex, uninterrupted imitation of the first ("endless motion," or a chain of linking imitations inserted into one another), and the contrasting variety of methods for filling-in the "sound field" in the other (for example, Frescobaldi's imposing toccata in F).

Let us briefly examine several more cyclic constructions of music by other seventeenth century composers, both in the form of variational links (ornamental and figurational, containing melodic development within themselves), and in the form of contrasting new formations. In Riemann's above-mentioned Musikgeschichte in Beispielen (abbreviated M.G. in B.), there are several valuable examples of "connected" cycles. Thus, No. 81, Sonata a 3, sopra l'Aria della Romanes (Chaconne) by Salomone Rossi (1613) is a theme from the family of variations on the basso ostinato. This is a chain of figurational, eight-measure sections. The principle of identity dominates in them. The five-voice paduana and galliard (Nos. 82-83) by B. Praetorius (1616) are constructed on common melodic material. Each dance consists of three sections, the two outer sections of which, both in the paduana and in the galliard, are united by cadences (E major triad). The measure structure is uneven. In the paduana, with a basic meter of \( \frac{4}{4} \) the outer sections have groups of eight measures, but with the inclusion of a single measure in \( \frac{3}{2} \).
there are, consequently, not thirty two, but thirty four measure beats, in all. In the galliard, the same sections are as follows: eight measures in the first section, but sixteen in the third, each in \( \frac{3}{4} \). The melodic and the harmonic fabric, if we compare both dances, are not simply transferred, but are unquestionably developed in each of the parallel sections. This is a large step, in comparison with the paired group pointed out above—the pavane and galliard of 1530. But both there and here, the common material for both dances gives predominance to the principle of identity. The contrast lies in the rhythms, in the tempos, in lines of different length, and in the harmonic fabric. Different cadences in the middle sections (a G major triad in the paduana, A major in the galliard) also evoke a feeling of contrast. No. 88, Canzon de sonar a 4 (1626), by the composer, Biagio Marini from Brescia, represents a contrast of quick motion of an imitative (fugal) character, with slower (andantino) motion, in which the voices are beautifully juxtaposed in pairs, in different registers, forming a refined canon. A chaconne by Tarquinio Merula, Canzon "La Pedrina" (1673), No 90, is a theme with six figural variations on a basso continuo, with a broadly developed "epilogue" (Nachspiel). We notice a frequent use of sequences, to which the theme gives a stimulus.
The entire composition is a cycle of identical intonations.9

A characteristic, typical example of the "church sonata" [sonata da chiesa] is the Sonata a 4 (1644) by Massimiliano Neri, organist of the Venetian Cathedral of St. Mark (M.G. in B., No. 98). The sonata consists of periodic juxtapositions of fast and slow motion, with a distinct rest in the central section, a smooth and measured largo. In contemporary tempo and meter designations this sort of chain occurs: allegro (4/4 and 2/4), adagio (C) -- here, in contrast to the mobile lines of the allegro, there occur sequentially organized vertical successions--allegro (3/4), adagio (2/2) as a transition to the central largo (2/4), repetition of the adagio and largo a fifth lower (an extremely curious organizational method of identical execution which is necessary here), and again allegro (3/4) on the same theme as the preceding allegro, but more developed and extended. Here we have two large sections: the first allegro as an introduction, and the stable center, the largo, bordered by faster sections.

Typical of the epoch is La Torriana, a trio sonata (1655) by Legrenzi (M.G. in B., No. 102) with its

9 We need not repeat that in this entire work musical identity is conceived dialectically, i.e., not as the mechanical equality of contrasted intonations.
successive sections as follows: a fugal allegro (c minor), a stately adagio with vertical elements predominating, a short transition (also adagio, but in $\frac{3}{4}$), and a refined allegretto ($\frac{3}{4}$) of a dance character. The sonata ends with a condensed statement of the material of the first allegro.

Not so plastic in its music, but richly developed as a cycle, is Johann Rosenmüller's g minor trio sonata (M.G. in B., No. 108). After a short, slow introduction (adagio $\frac{2}{2}$), there is an allegro ($\frac{2}{4}$) of a homophonic, harmonic cast with the working out of a short thematic motive. A smooth adagio replaces the allegro. In contrast to it a presto is advanced, Haydn-like in its mobility in B♭ major ($\frac{2}{4}$) with a cadence in g minor, providing for a connection with the subsequent, second adagio ($\frac{3}{4}$). This adagio transfers directly into motion of a gigue character ($\frac{9}{8}$) which successfully ends the cycle. It is difficult to leave Corelli's trio sonata in b minor, from the same collection (M.G. in B., No. 121), unnoticed. Its first section, as was becoming common in sonatas, is restrained and sonorous, homophonic in character, in spite of "close" imitations (this is already a manifestation of "harmonic counterpoint"). This serves as a "saw kerf" to the characteristic vivace (C), in polyphonic texture—the execution of a flexible theme with a countertheme. The central
section is an adagio (\(\frac{3}{8}\)) of a tenderly melancholy character, with "pliant" sequences, already similar to the "sweet," refined melodies of the eighteenth century Italians. The concluding section, presto non tanto (C), is the execution of a new, clear-cut theme. The entire sonata is tonally unified, with full-weight cadences, convincingly closing the motion. The motion of each section is uniform, proceeding "by inertia"; the melos is "short-breathed," but, nevertheless, the music flows easily and freely. We are on the threshold of the florescence of the homophonic sonata, although the imitative instrumental style has still not said its last word (I have in mind, primarily, the most perfect orchestral and keyboard cycles of Bach).

The "church sonatas" of Antonio Caldara, in g minor (M.G. in B., No. 124)* and b minor (in A. Einstein's Beispielsammlung zur alteren Musikgeschichte, No. 16)* both represent periodic interchanges of grave-allegro-grave-allegro, each cycle in a single tonality, with homophonic writing decisively prevailing; the rhythms are contrasting, and the figurations and character of the motion are alternately smooth and connected, or fractional and uneven. In the same Beispielsammlung of Einstein [No. 17], there is an interesting Solo sonate für Violino und Basso Continuo by Giovanni Battista Somis [1676-1763]*. a pupil of Corelli. In it, two quick movements
of a dance character follow the introductory adagio. The first is an allemande, with the division into two repeated sections characteristic of the sonata allegro of that epoch; the exposition of the theme occurs in the first section, its development (essentially a parallel execution) and a reprise in the second. The second movement, a type of rigaudon (according to Einstein), also follows the scheme of the sonata allegro of that time. For this composition, the following is characteristic: the succession of two quick movements after the adagio, the transfer of dance texture into sonata texture*174 (the allemande received a special position in this connection in the suite cycles of the eighteenth century, occupying in them the place of the symphonic sonata allegro),*175 and thereby, the rapprochement of the church and chamber sonatas was achieved.

In order not to overload the presentation, I will limit myself to this comparatively small number of examples, which are more or less easily understandable as an approach to this material, although, of course, there are far from enough of them. Later, it will be proper to turn to the "experimental laboratory" of concerti grossi and the solo chamber sonata.

Of course, in the cyclic forms, the attention of the composers was concentrated on the sonata allegro. Judging by the innumerable keyboard pieces of Domenico Scarlatti
(1685-1757), any new and clever resolution of the sonata formation, such as the interaction of identity and contrast, proceeded along the line of approach to the dialectical formation of the Classical sonata, with thematic development triumphant in it. Undoubtedly, only in the form of a primer of musical examples would it be possible to present, completely visually, the stages of the rise of variational and dance cycles, of sonata and sonata-suite cycles and the development within them of the sonata allegro form, from motion permeated throughout with imitation, to pieces of a homophonic cast with crystallized tonal correlations and the specified limits of exposition, working-out (for the present, still an execution in parallel of a single theme), and reprise. In the works of D. Scarlatti, the second, contrasting theme and the melodic cadence which synthesizes the motion (later—the closing theme) had begun to make its appearance. J. S. Bach, in his concerti, stood on the border of dialectical sonata thinking, and was almost ready to go out beyond the limits of monothematicism or psychologically undifferentiated polythematicism (the execution and alternation of ideas, without the development of contrasting themes, i.e., as the "exposure" simply of
"energy" and not of characteristics). But this step could only be made by an epoch which was bringing to life a new class with its cult of the freely "competing" personality. The succession of motives did not become, for some time, the development of themes. Contrast occurred in rhythmics, agogics, and dynamics (of course, not in the emotional dynamics of tension and release, but in the quantitative stratification of voices, without changes of intensity or phonation apart from the gradations of the force of sonority). The seventh volume, devoted to instrumental music of the seventeenth century,

\[ \text{It is necessary to take into consideration this difference between the polythematicism of Bach and his predecessors, and that of Beethoven and the composers who followed him. In the first instance, polythematicism is, in essence, a single theme, duplicating itself, or a series of themes and counterthemes; in the second case, it is a dialectical formation of conflicting ideas. Here before us, on the face of it, a paradoxical course arises in the evolution of instrumental thinking. It appears that composers approached the contrast of two themes (but, first of all, the contrast of two tonal spheres), through the cultivation of "multi-thematicism" in a series of experimental formations (ricercare, canzoni, fantasias, etc.). On the one hand, the fourth-fifth correlation of identical material still found for some time in imitation, had to be developed into a similar correlation at a distance, with the combination of different motives. In other words, the crystallized formula of the coupling of subject and answer was expanded to a concept of tonic-dominant "polarity" (for these were contrasting tonal spheres for the ear at that time, and were far from being the familiar, simple, and natural correlation we are accustomed to today). On the other hand, the dialectical formation of thematic material, apparently, could not take shape before music became a mirror of the developing human phycye.} \]
of Luigi Torchi's *L'arte musicale in Italia,* \(^{176}\) contains much which is instructive in this connection, touching on the problem of the organization of cycles. First of all, the alternation of changing tempos comes to our attention:

- slow - fast - slow motion, or
- fast - slow - fast motion.

Music historians have often made the oversimplified assertion that the French overture is a connected cycle following the scheme of slow motion - fast motion - slow motion, while the Italian overture is just the opposite. The first assertion, even in relation to the overtures of Lully, does not bear criticism. What was important in them? It was that they represented a *formula for the formation of musical motion* (and not merely triplcity as a scheme). This formula is usually triromial: \(a+b+c\). First, there is a slow stately section of music, from which a rapid section flows, by way of contrast, and, as a result, as a *resolution* of this juxtaposition, rather than just a mechanical repetition of the first section, the sedate and stately, or energetic and active music of the third section strives toward the initial tonal point in the new material.

In Lully's overture to *Roland* (1685) in \(d\) minor (*M.G. in B.* , No. 110)\(^{177}\) a slow section (in \(\frac{2}{2}\) ) with a cadence on the \(D\) major triad\(^{178}\) is followed by a faster section.
in $\frac{3}{4}$, closed by the D major triad, with the closing section again in $\frac{2}{2}$, leading to the full affirmation of d minor. The three-part scheme turns out to be a dynamically uninterrupted, unified formation. The problem is not in the succession of the sections, nor in the fact that the slow section is first, but in the fact that the fast motion is inseparable from the slow motion from which it is extracted, just as the stream of an intensively gushing spring is inseparable from the rock. From this point of view, the difference between the French and Italian overtures (and other forms) is a difference of a dynamic order, and, as is apparent, the essence here is neither in France nor Italy (for there are Italian instrumental pieces which begin slowly), but rather in the problem of cyclic organization. One type consists of the accumulation of sonority in a slow, stately movement, from which the faster music flows impetously; the other type consists of spontaneously occurring quick motion, alternating in its development with slower motion, and, as in any case in which obstacles are encountered, either drawing new forces from within this development, or gradually weakening. Finally, it is an entirely different matter when the slow section stands first, by itself, and the fast section begins as a new, fully independent section (it is easily perceived whether or not the beginning of the fast section is a tonic, serving as a "resolution"
in relation to the final cadence of the slow section).

Examining the material of various cycles contained in Torchi, we see that seemingly the simplest schemes, such as slow (m.)-fast (b.)-slow [cf., p. 262, above] or, on the contrary, fast (b.)-slow (m.)-fast, contain a multitude of organizational stages. In the first place, a strictly symmetrical structure such as m. - b. - m. or b. - m. - b. is rarely maintained, and is transformed into a periodic formula: m. - b. - m. - b. or b. - m. - b. - m., etc. Furthermore, symmetry is not always represented by m. : b. m. or b. : m. : b. \*179 i.e., as entirely connected motion, nor is it always m. + b. + m., but rather, m. : b. + b. : m., or even m. : b. + b., etc. Besides, all such formulae of formation were complicated by changes of meter, from even to uneven meter, and vice versa. The change of meters led to inevitable contrasts of motion. For example, if an allegro in \( \frac{4}{4} \) (C) shifts without change of tempo into a meter of \( \frac{3}{2} \), in which half-notes prevail as the basic measure, then the ear perceives this change as new motion. (slow, in relation to the preceding allegro).\*180 Here are some of the kinds of constructive formulae encountered in the sonatas of the seventeenth century, in the works of Biagio Marini, Giovanni Battista Fontana, Giovanni Battista Vitali, Marco Uccelini, and other composers (the designation C is replaced everywhere with \( \frac{4}{4} \) for the sake of clarity):
m. $\frac{4}{2}$ (s$^{11}$) : b. $\frac{4}{2}$ : b. $\frac{3}{2}$ (s) : m. $\frac{4}{4}$

m. $\frac{4}{4}$ : b. $\frac{4}{4}$ + b. $\frac{4}{4}$ + b. $\frac{3}{2}$ : b. $\frac{4}{4}$ + three movements$^{182}$

m. $\frac{4}{4}$ : b. $\frac{4}{4}$ (s) + m. $\frac{3}{2}$ : b. $\frac{4}{4}$ (s)$^{183}$

b. $\frac{4}{4}$ (s) : b. $\frac{3}{2}$ (s') : b. $\frac{2}{2}$ $\left(\frac{4}{4}\right)$ : b. $\frac{3}{2}$ (s') : b. $\frac{4}{4}$ (s)$^{184}$

m. $\frac{4}{4}$ + b. $\frac{4}{4}$ : b. $\frac{3}{4}$ : m. $\frac{4}{4}$

m. $\frac{4}{4}$ : b. $\frac{4}{4}$ + m. $\frac{4}{4}$ : b. $\frac{4}{4}$ + m. $\frac{3}{4}$

m. $\frac{4}{4}$ + m. $\frac{3}{4}$ : b. $\frac{4}{4}$

m. $\frac{4}{4}$ : b. $\frac{4}{4}$ + m. $\frac{3}{2}$ + b. $\frac{3}{4}$

m. $\frac{4}{4}$ : b. $\frac{4}{4}$ + m. $\frac{4}{4}$ : [b.] $\frac{3}{2}$ + m $\frac{6}{4}$

b. $\frac{4}{4}$ : m. $\frac{4}{4}$ + b. $\frac{12}{8}$ (gigue) + m. $\frac{4}{4}$ + b. $\frac{4}{4}$

m. $\frac{4}{4}$ : b. $\frac{4}{4}$ : b. $\frac{3}{2}$ + b. $\frac{4}{4}$

b. $\frac{4}{4} \left(\frac{4}{4}\right)$ : m. $\frac{4}{4}$ : b. $\frac{3}{4}$ (s) : m. $\frac{2}{2} \left(\frac{4}{4}\right)$ : b. $\frac{3}{4}$ (s)$^{192}$

m. $\frac{2}{2} \left(\frac{4}{4}\right)$ : b. $\frac{4}{4}$ : m. $\frac{3}{4}$ : b. $\frac{4}{4}$

b. $\frac{4}{4}$ (s) + b. $\frac{3}{4}$ + b. $\frac{4}{4}$ (s)$^{194}$

m. $\frac{2}{2}$ + b. $\frac{4}{4}$ + m. $\frac{3}{8}$ : b. $\frac{4}{4}$

I add the letter s as an indication that the sections so designated contain identical or similar (similis) motivic material.
It goes without saying that it is not possible to make any statistical calculations here. I introduce these correlations only in order to indicate how the schemes of cyclic movements were varied. But one cannot help noticing the prevalence of slow sections as spheres of support at the beginning of the cycles. If one takes into account the fact that the melodic material, in spite of its seeming diversity, contains very many similar "melodic fragments" (usually short figures), then it is possible to presume that the process of organization in this epoch consisted of a variety of permutations of similar and, for the most part, tonally unified material, and of the juxtaposition of different speeds, turning out to be a consequence, not only of the contrast of tempos, but, even more important, of proportional changes of note durations within uniform motion [=pulse]. This uniformity of motion, almost a conditio sine qua non of the imitative style, became so rooted in music of the time that it served as an essential factor in the process of formation, and these contrasting correlations which arose from shifts of meter and note value were an extremely valuable medium for the overcoming of inertness of motion, just as in our time, by the intensified application of syncopated rhythms, composers endeavor to relax the monotony of bar-line metrics, and to re-establish the "play" of rhythms under the conditions of a regular beat.
Thus, in the seventeenth century, the resistance of the uniform scanning of music to the "free play of rhythms," was an important stimulus to organization. In our time, the conflict of the measure with the syncope, and the attempt to eliminate the rubato, rooted in Romanticism, and, consequently, to eliminate the persistent, "nervous" oscillation of the measure (unit) of musical time, is no less important as a stimulus.
CHAPTER XII

SUITE AND SYMPHONY

The innumerable suite cycles of the eighteenth century, especially in keyboard music, represent the most diverse combinations of dance and character pieces. The greatest diversity in this connection is presented by the ordres of the French clavecinists, with their attempts to include both psychological "sketches" (portraits, sound pictures of moods) and genre and landscape motifs (the awakened feeling for nature) in these series. At the same time, the juxtapositions of allemande (4/4), courante (3/4), sarabande or menuet, and gigue, as a four movement core within the suites stubbornly persists with additions and variants (the prelude as an introductory movement, the aria serving within the suite as a contemplative musical contrast to the dance movements, and some additional dances). The best of such juxtapositions are revealed by a review of the suite cycles of Bach. Let us compare his French and
English clavier suites and four orchestral suites.\(^1\)

**French Suites**

First (d): allemande (\(\frac{4}{4}\)), courante (\(\frac{3}{2}\)), sarabande (\(\frac{3}{4}\)), menuet I (\(\frac{3}{4}\)) and II (\(\frac{3}{4}\)), gigue (\(\frac{2}{2}\)).

Second (c): allemande (C), courante (\(\frac{3}{4}\)). sarabande (\(\frac{3}{4}\)), aria (\(\frac{2}{2}\)), menuet (\(\frac{3}{4}\)), gigue (\(\frac{3}{8}\)).

Third (b): allemande (C), courante (\(\frac{6}{4}\)), sarabande (\(\frac{3}{4}\)), menuet I and II (trio) (\(\frac{3}{4}\)), anglais (C, vivace), gigue (\(\frac{3}{8}\)).

Fourth (E\(_b\)): allemande (C), courante (\(\frac{3}{4}\)), sarabande (\(\frac{3}{4}\)), gavotte (\(\frac{2}{2}\)), menuet (\(\frac{3}{4}\)), aria (C), gigue (\(\frac{6}{8}\)).

Fifth (G): allemande (C), courante (\(\frac{3}{4}\)), sarabande (\(\frac{3}{4}\)), gavotte (\(\frac{2}{2}\)), bourree (\(\frac{2}{2}\)), louré (\(\frac{6}{4}\)).

---

\(^1\)Cited according to the Peters edition.
moderato), gigue \( \frac{12}{16} \).

Sixth (E): allemande (C), courante \( \frac{3}{4} \), sarabande \( \frac{3}{4} \), gavotte \( \frac{2}{2} \), polonaise \( \frac{3}{4} \), bourree \( \frac{2}{2} \), menuet \( \frac{3}{4} \), gigue \( \frac{6}{8} \).

Common tonality unifies all the sections. The periodic juxtaposition of more active and less active motion is in general operation, but if one takes each suite as a whole, from the first section to the last, then it is possible to say that a progressive gradation of tempo is felt, and the gigue sounds as the fastest and most impetuous movement. A break is felt in the center—especially in the sarabande.² The alternation of even and odd meters is also included as a characteristic property of the suite, but a succession of sections of the same meter is permitted (for example, courante and sarabande) with

²The sarabande anticipates, in the suite, the slow movement of the symphony.
different tempos and musical characteristics.*

**English Suites**

First (A): prelude (allegro, $\frac{12}{8}$), allemande (C), courante I and II (both $\frac{3}{2}$) with two doubles (variant -variational executions), sarabande ($\frac{3}{4}$), bourrée I ($\frac{2}{2}$) and II (a minor $\frac{2}{2}$), gigue ($\frac{6}{8}$).

Second (a): prelude (allegro con brio, $\frac{3}{4}$), allemande (C), courante ($\frac{3}{2}$), sarabande ($\frac{3}{4}$) with ornamental variant, bourrée I ($\frac{2}{2}$) and II (A major, $\frac{2}{2}$), gigue ($\frac{6}{8}$).

Third (g): prelude (allegro, $\frac{3}{8}$), allemande (C), courante ($\frac{3}{2}$), sarabande ($\frac{3}{4}$) with ornamental variant, gavotte I ($\frac{2}{2}$) and II (or musette, G major, $\frac{2}{2}$), gigue ($\frac{12}{8}$).

Fourth (F): prelude (allegro, C), allemande (C), courante ($\frac{3}{2}$), sarabande ($\frac{3}{4}$), menuet I ($\frac{3}{4}$) and II (d minor, $\frac{3}{4}$), gigue ($\frac{12}{8}$).

Fifth (e): prelude (allegro, $\frac{6}{8}$), allemande (C), courante ($\frac{3}{2}$), sarabande ($\frac{3}{4}$), passe pied I ($\frac{3}{8}$) and
II (E major, $\frac{3}{8}$), gigue ($\frac{3}{8}$).

Sixth (d): prelude (lento, adagio, allegro, $\frac{9}{8}$).

allemande (C), courante ($\frac{3}{2}$), sarabande ($\frac{3}{2}$) and

double (ornamental variant, $\frac{3}{2}$), gavotte I ($\frac{2}{2}$) and II (or

musette, D major, $\frac{2}{2}$), gigue ($\frac{12}{16}$).

While all the same properties and principles of organization as in the French suites are preserved in the English suites, there also occur tonal contrasts (very timid ones, it is true, in juxtapositions of major-minor, or vice-versa)*197 in neighboring variants of menuets or gavottes. But the greatest achievement in the English suites is the developed prelude preceding the allemande as the opposition of "free" motion to motion bound by the rhythmic formula of the dance, and serving as an ornate headpiece of an improvisatory character. The prelude, to a considerable extent, enlivens the suite. Together with the allemande and courante it forms the first thematically rich and contrasting stage of the suite. The sarabande, as a sort of caesura, separates this symphonized stage*198 from the more active last stage in which the material discharges itself, and the music finally takes on a headlong tempo. The English suites are exemplary cycles from the point of view of the gradation and distribution of the forces which
organize musical formation of the motor type.

Four Orchestral Suites

First (C) for 2 oboes, bassoon, violins I and II, viola, bass, and cembalo: overture (grave-C, vivace-fugue
\[ \overline{2} \text{, grave-C}, \] courante (3/2), gavotte I (2/2) and II (2/2),
forlane—Venetian dance (6/4), menuet I and II, bourree I (2/2) and II (c minor, 2/2), passe pied I (3/4) and II (3/4).

Second (b) for flute, 2 violins, viola, and continuo:

overture (grave-C, allegro-fugal, lento-3/4), rondo (2/2),
sarabande (3/4), bourree I (2/2) and II (2/2), polonaise
(3/4) with double, menuet (3/4), badinerie (allegro, 2/4).

Third (D) for 2 oboes, 3 trumpets, tympani, 2 violins, viola, and continuo: overture (grave-C, vivace-fugal,
grave-C), aria (C)—strings and continuo only, gavotte I (2/2), and II (2/2), bourree (2/2), gigue (6/8).

Fourth (D) for 3 oboes, bassoon, 3 trumpets, tympani, 2 violins, viola, and continuo: overture (grave-C,
fugal allegro [vivace]-9/8, grave-C, bourree I (2/2) and II
Réjouissance (allegro, $\frac{4}{4}$).

The texture, construction, and dynamics of formation of these suites differ from those of the keyboard suites. The comparatively variegated "tangles" of dances are, in all of them, clearly opposed to the monumental style and majestic step of the massive overtures, not so much to provide a new stage of development, as to counterbalance the first section of the music, and to release the tension created. In this sense the orchestral suites approximate the English suites, but in the latter the first stages still do not achieve such power as the overtures. In the last stage [of the English suites], on the other hand, there are observed more systematic tempo and dynamic gradations; the gigue always evokes, by its concentration and impetuosity of motion, a feeling of finality (and here, the Third [orchestral] suite, with the aria in the center and the gigue at the end, is the most evenly balanced). $^3$

$^3$The history of the rise and development of the gigue, beginning with the instrumental practice of the English comedians, and its flourishing from the moment of its insertion into the French lute and keyboard music (c. 1635) is exhaustively illuminated in the work of Werner Danckert, Geschichte der Gigue (Lpz., 1924). $^{199}$ The work also deals with the stylistic differences of the English, French, Italian, and German gigues (the gigues of the early and high Baroque and of the Viennese Classics), and well selected musical examples—models of the gigue—are presented.
If we now compare these cycles with the classical succession of movements of the sonata and symphony, then the advantage of the symphonic, sonata formation is immediately established, an advantage, in the sense of dynamic clarity and lucidity of gradations. The first movement of the cycle, the symphonic, sonata allegro, in comparison with the allemande (in which the prerequisites of the symphonic, sonata formation are present, but constrained, compressed, and undeveloped) forms a dialectical development of contrasting ideas, their conflict and synthesis. The slow (second) movement, much more concentrated than the sarabande or aria, is an expression of contemplation, contrasting with the action [of the first movement]; lyrical conditions, in their most varied stages and nuances, are concentrated with depth and force of expression within the formation of the symphonic adagio. The third movement of the symphonic cycle preserved elements of the suite, but the active, rustically provocative menuets of Haydn were replaced by the witty scherzos of Beethoven. In other words, "playfulness" took the place of the dance. Finally, the finale of the symphony, in relation to the scherzo, is the same as the gigue in the suite in relation to the preceding dance-games, following the sarabande. On the one hand, the finale, together with the scherzo, makes up a contrast to the slow movement; on the other, it is found in a complex
correlation with the first movement. This correlation is most often expressed as the juxtaposition of the unity of mood or prevalence of a unified condition ("mass obsession") in the finale, to the dramatics and conflict of the symphonic, sonata allegro with its accentuated thematic contrasts. This is best conveyed by the forms of the rondo with the refrain predominating in them, subordinating other themes to itself. Finality, as a headlong shifting of the "reflections" of a single obsessive idea or intensive feeling, is no less successfully revealed by variations; the finale of Beethoven's "Eroica", in comparison with the first movement of the symphony, evokes a feeling of complete resolution of the personal struggle of the beginning, in a torrent of sensations, unified in all its aspects, and thereby approaches the finale of the Ninth Symphony. If the problem of the finale of a symphony is, in essence, the problem of the parcelling out of a unified spiritual state into its diverse nuances, then there could be two basic inclinations here: either the joyful and free merging of the personality with the cosmos and with humanity (Beethoven), or the oblivion of spiritual pain and isolation in the crowd, or tragic destruction (Tchaikovsky). I should not have had to touch on the psychological aspect of the problem of the finale in a book about form, but I do so only with the purpose of revealing two directions in the
final stages of the symphonic cycle: either there are various sorts of collectivized conditions, or the accent is again on conflict, on dramatic formation, i.e., the reinforcement of the contrasts of sensations, as in the first movement. Between these extreme points (as, for example, between the finales of the Sixth Symphony of Tchaikovsky [as exemplifying the latter tendency] and the Ninth Symphony of Beethoven [embodying the opposite tendency]) there are many modifications of the concept of finality, hence, the variety and instability of the forms of symphonic finales, from clearly expressive rondos, to rondos mixed with principles of the symphonic, sonata allegro, and to symphonic, sonata allegros, as such. But still, in spite of all this diversity, in finales there is usually revealed a leading idea, concentrating the attention, and from it and around it occur growing waves of development. It seems to me that it would be most correct, dynamically, to express the meaning and development of the formation of the finale as a wave-like intensification of unified feeling, or as an ascent, in opposition to the dramatic formation of the first movement of the symphony which is characterized by conflict, by the overcoming of contradictions. In the finales of [Beethoven's] Third and Ninth Symphonies the conception of ascent is affirmed by the whole texture; in the finales
of the Second and Seventh Symphonies this same conception
is realized primarily through the concentration of motion
around the main themes, immediately blazing up and, in
their very first executions, disclosing with full expres­siveness their influence, their circle of activity, so that
further statement is not so much development as it is a
series of returns to the centralizing theme as an initial
stimulus and center.

The wave-like character of intensification, the
gradation of ascent, is reflected even in the structures
of the themes of the finales. Significant from this point
of view is the finale of Beethoven's Fifth Symphony, not
only in the whole of its growth, but also in the "sphere
of activity" of its separate elements. The theme moves in
a series of leaps and "upward flights", alternating with
the filling in of these leaps, with each stage reinforced
by means of repetition:

The next thematic complex (from b) moves in the same way, the "wave" of intensification distributed between the fanfare of the winds and the arched figuration of the celli and bassi with the contrabassoon. But the violins again take the initiative, and again in melodic gradation reach,
as a peak, $d^3$. The third wave is a new thematic complex:

\[
\begin{align*}
&\text{\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{image1.png}}
\end{align*}
\]

The next motive is stated in gradation:

\[
\begin{align*}
&\text{\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{image2.png}}
\end{align*}
\]

Always there is a unified line of intensification, in which the spheres of the main and subsidiary parts are collectivized. The working out section continues the intensification, originating from motive c and refracting in various combinations its inherently wave-like character of sound. An episode--[a quotation from the] scherzo--contrasting in time [i.e., meter], interrupts the intensification and returns it to the starting point, but thereby strengthens the intensity of the complexes of themes, the gradation of ascent, but in continuous C major, to a new complex of fanfare-like nature:

\[
\begin{align*}
&\text{\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{image3.png}}
\end{align*}
\]

and to a concluding, headlong ascent on the motive d--presto. And here the growth moves by waves, and each new intonation wave takes each "new intonation section" progressively higher, to the last triumphant statement of the first
theme (a), transformed into a cadential intonation (the transfer of a function into its opposite). Through the entire course of this exemplary finale, extended as a unified, elastic line, the music does not reduce its dynamic tone. But in relation to the first movement of the symphony, the finale emerges as a manfully serene formation, counterbalancing the contrasting character of the first movement, its sharply stimulated pathos, so that the whole conception is realized as one of the innumerable contrasting comparisons of the spheres of:

\[
\begin{array}{c}
\text{52}\\
\text{53}
\end{array}
\]

In spite of the fact that each thematic complex of this finale is a symmetrical intonation of ascent and descent—sheer or wave-like, pyramidally stepped or like pushes from the same base point (as in example 51 e)—in a word, in spite of the fact that the alternation of step-wise (sliding) passages with passages characterized by leaps (over wide intervals), and the unity of impulse (tension) and discharge are revealed in the overall melodic formation, still the intonation of upward motion is perceived as prevalent and dominating, thus conveying a general impression of continuous ascent. Beside that, the more distinct the first impetus of motion, the more strongly it determines the whole character of the formation. Thus
there is a vast difference between the impetus in example 54 and that in example 55 (below).

\[ \text{Example 54} \quad \text{Example 55} \]

The idea of development made musical formation on a large scale possible. In spite of the fact that the dynamics of the gigue in the suite solved the same problem as the finale in the symphony, it could not evolve, as was also true of all the other sections of the old suite, because of the narrowness of its limits of formation, narrowness conditioned as much by the restraining effect of the dance rhythm (just the rhythm of a definite dance, and not the motor quality as such; the finale of the Fifth Symphony, in essence is a march, a procession, i.e., a symphonically treated tread, and the symbol of the epoch of "revolutionary campaigns"), as by causes of a social order. The intense thirst for activity and the colossal reserve of strength and energy, of health and "respiration", peculiar to the conqueror class, could not find expression either in the monothematism of the canonic intonational style, nor within the narrow limits of the suite. One could increase the number of sections as much as one pleased, but it was not possible to achieve, to any great extent, dynamic growth and development through opposition
in a situation where the purposefulness of a formation was conditioned either by juxtapositions of identical material (imitation, fugue), by its transformation (in the gigue) and changes of direction (contrary motion of the theme in allemandes and other forms as a principle of formation of the second section), or by the interchange of thematically independent material, with accentuated divisions into sections. Only the gradual recognition of the principle of thematic contrast--not just the functional conditionality of all elements of formation, but also of opposition as a motive stimulus of music--led to the spectacular rise of the idea of development and opened new, rich perspectives before the evolution of music. The idea of thematic development, in conflict and in the overcoming of contrast, as the path to unity permeated all the highest manifestations of musical creation. The theme became the operating force, the nucleus. That which could not be achieved, either in the suite, nor in the various forms which emerged from the idea of competition ("concerti"), was achieved in the sonata and symphony because, in the place of the unity of identical juxtapositions and the self-contained competition of sound complexes in the concerto, the symphonic sonata allegro advanced the concept of thematic formation. A composition became an organically and psychologically motivated unity, unfolding in growth and
development. Finally, the organizational principles of music as a dialectical formation, spread beyond the limits of individual pieces, and embraced a cycle of "movements," transforming it into the highest unity, in which each section fulfilled a role predetermined for it in the given intonational system in a synthesis of complex correlations, i.e., it became a function of this system (sonata or symphony). A composition as a cycle usually breaks down into separate "movements" (allegro, adante, etc.), following one another in turn, but may also be indivisible (as, for example, the great one-movement structures of Liszt and Wagner\textsuperscript{4}). The essence of the matter does not change because of this; the cycle always represents the exposure of the idea of the symphony in contrasting formations, and its perception as the highest and final

\textsuperscript{4}In the work of Wagner, I refer to the prelude to Die Meistersinger, where the essential elements of the symphonic, sonata allegro emerge simultaneously as stages of the cycle in a single line of development. Thus the beginning of the prelude, as the first stage of the symphonic, sonata allegro, is followed by Walter's lyrical melody (the subsidiary part), a sort of andante of the symphony. Further, the working-out section with its grotesque execution of the principle theme, has the inherent character of the scherzo. A powerful organ point leads to a synthesized execution of the principal and subsidiary parts. This stage, by its development and dynamics, is perceived as a symphonic finale. The transformation of the cycle into a one-movement structure in the works of Liszt and Wagner, must be considered one of the disclosures of the dialectic of musical formation, one manifestation of the transfer of functions of a system into its opposite.
unity results only from the "grasp" of an extended process of struggle between sound complexes. Each of them, before becoming a unity for the consciousness, reveals itself in opposition, in contrast. From these revelations new unities are engendered, from them new oppositions, etc. Dissonance, in the classical style, evokes consonance, and vice versa. Or, in more general terms, instability is followed by stability, an elision (of intervals or tonalities), by its filling in, the ascent of a line of melody, by its descent, or, from another viewpoint, a stretching is followed by a shortening or gathering together, a complete execution of a tune or theme, by a fragmentary statement, an accumulation, by a discharge, a saturated fabric, by a transparent and mobile one, quick motion, by slow, etc. But each of these "paired" intonations, being opposed by the next in succession, after its exposure forms with the next a unified complex, which, in its turn, is again define through new opposition (through its negation).

Side by side with contradictions which are revealed in succession, musical formation reveals contradictions in simultaneity, or the transfer of the function of a given intonation into its opposite, about which we have spoken repeatedly in this work. A cadence is changed into an impetus; a combination, perceived in one exposure as consonant, as a point of stability, becomes in other conditions a stimulus to further motion. A cycle is
gathered into an indivisible, cohesive composition, while, conversely, tendencies toward cyclization are present in the connected stages of some forms (canzioni). Individual tones, introduced to expand the diatonic character of a mode (alteration), take root in it and organize a new enriched, modal unity—a phenomenon having a place already in the fugue, where the subject and answer in their "fifth" relation, even if the signs of the dominant as a tonality are clearly displayed, nevertheless remain a single conjugation on the strength of the identity of material and construction, and on the strength of the immediacy of the juxtaposition.

This dynamic and dialectical musical formation, rich with expressive possibilities, began to be revealed fully only in connection with the formation of the symphonic, sonata allegro form, and only to the extent that the symphonic, sonata cycle was set as the arena for exposing the interconditionality of all the operating forces and elements of this formation. I emphasize once more that the growth of the symphonic, sonata form coincided with the growth of social contradictions and conflicts of ideas which gave rise to a mighty upheaval, and that the symphony attained the apex of its development in the creative work of Beethoven, a contemporary of Hegel. It would seem, in the given instance, that we have before us
something more than historical parallelism. Truly, if the idea of development—shaped by Herder (1744-1803), the son of a bell-ringer and school teacher—together with an admiration for folk creation, found its parallel expression in the creation of the son of a coachmaster, Haydn (1732-1809), then in the Beethoven quartets and symphonies—which were so much conditioned by Haydn's and at the same time so different from them—their distinction, that which signified an abrupt "leap" in the evolution of the symphony, lies in the further refraction of Haydn's style of development into a dialectical formation of ideas at the hands of Beethoven. A notion of how Haydn, lavish with clear-cut melodic themes, developed the music of his allegros, may be given by his $E_b$ major quartet, op. 33, No. 2, in which the beginning theme, now opening, now closing the various stages of motion, emerges in the

---

5Danckert, therefore, is right when, in the end of his above-mentioned work, Geschichte der Gigue, he says, "The fundamental distinction between the Baroque and Classical styles, with regard to the formation of gigue-like finales, is clearly not at all exhausted by the adduction of factors of form and content. More important than all this detail is the central, subordinating, functional principle of the Classical composer—the organizational method of free, autonomous mankind, which has finally renounced pre-Classical restraints.

The finales of Haydn and Mozart contain the last stylistic traces of the Baroque gigue. In Beethoven's finales, it is already useless to seek similar reminiscences. Individual attempts by nineteenth century masters to revive the old dance type may be ignored here as relatively insignificant experiments in the area of stylization." (p. 145).
capacity of "subject" of the entire working-out section, turns out to be the "prime mover" of the given formation, and conditions it by its energy. With Haydn, therefore, the subsidiary part is often only a "satellite." It is limited to a short "run." The principal theme, which is generally inclined toward various "disguises" in Haydn's work, is converted into the subsidiary theme ("simulates" it). Kretschmar, in his Führer wisely remarks, of the subsidiary part of one of Haydn's symphonies, that in comparison with the first theme it seems "nur pro forma da zu sein". Of course, this is not a "formality," but only a consequence of the insufficient recognition of the second theme's dialectical significance as an "antithetical stage" of formation, and the still strong influence of the fugue in the extraction of all the music of the symphonic allegro from a basic, ruling thought. In the same $B_e$ major quartet, in the final rondo, it is possible to observe just such an example of the typically Haydneshque formation of music from one single premise:

56

![Musical notation]

This theme is not only an impetus, but also a

5"...to be there only for the sake of formality."
developed idea, and a melodic tail-piece (the quartet ends with it pianissimo).^6

After this example, it is proper to turn immediately to one of the Beethoven quartets, at least to the allegro of the F major quartet, op. 59, No. 1. Then the essence of Beethoven's thinking will immediately become understandable. The clever, Haydenesque distribution of material is revealed as a house of cards, as an amusing game, in comparison with Beethoven's disclosure of ideas. There is a different scope, a different range, a different tone of discourse, and, at each step, the exposure of some position, through opposition, through contrast, through contradiction. Haydn's toy-like mechanism, with cogwheels well adjusted to one another, in which everything sounds in its place and in time, is another world alongside Beethoven's organisms with their complex, functional formation; in them the spirit of a strict, searching mind, weighing the expressive worth of each feature of motion, is felt everywhere, along with the beating of a refined and profoundly sensitive heart (the Beethoven adagio).

The Romantics, of course, enriched the form of the

---

^6In the last stage of this quartet, Haydn shrewdly achieves an impression of finality, of the completion of motion, not by the usual means of a dynamic growth and impulsiveness, but, on the contrary, he unexpectedly wedges a short adagio into the presto, surrounds it with fermata, then again returns to presto and the principal theme, but separates its five appearances with temporizing pauses, alerting the attention.
They found many striking new methods and media of expression, expanded the circle of ideas and subjects, worked out in programmatic symphonic music appropriate "semantic intonations," by which recognition of the content was facilitated, and finally extended the borders and limits of the symphonic cycle. But all this was only the development of those possibilities which were revealed by Beethoven; all this was the manifestation of Beethoven dialectic, which stimulated musical consciousness in equal measure, whether it was applied to the realization of human feelings and ideas, or limited to the contemplation of the emotional life of the composer and the view of symphonic formation as the reflection of the "inner man," a tendency so characteristic for the lyric symphonies of the second half of the nineteenth century. Dramatic conflict, as a stimulus of

_7Liszt's Faust is characteristic, in this connection. The formation of this symphony is based on the dialectical contradiction of the first and third movements, as searching creative thought and destructive thought--the play of thought. In the center stands the image, "untouched" by Mefistofeles, of Margarita, which again is characteristic for the romantic symphony with its cult of the erotic (here the erotic element is taken in a contemplatively static aspect). The antipode to Liszt's Margarita is Richard Strauss's Salome. The end of Faust—a devout chorus—is a disappointing, non-organic synthesis, but, as compensation, the opposition or negation in the image of Mefistofeles (third movement) is a most clever attempt to assert a grotesque scherzo as a final antithesis. Such is the step, after 30 years, proceeding from the finale of the Ninth Symphony to this conception!_
formation for the first movement of a symphony and as a reflection of the split personality and contrast of sensations so characteristic of Romanticism, finds a striking and profound representation in a number of symphonies form Schumann to Tchaikovsky, and from Bruckner to Mahler. But the problem of the finale as the realization of the mass, collective consciousness, quite naturally, did not surpass even the intensification of a single, unified emotion achieved by Beethoven in the finale of the Fifth Symphony, much less the formation of the great idea, the great dream of human brotherhood--grandiose both in scope and tension--which he accomplished in the "Hymn of Joy" of the Ninth. Music as an appeal to humanity and not to the mob, to an organized society and not to a self-willed and unbridled, anarchistic majority--thus are the conceptions of Beethoven interpreted, and such, in essence, is the entire symphonism of Beethoven--simultaneously deeply emotional and powerfully constructive, fulfilling the slogan of "free will" in the consciousness of what is necessary, and in discipline (for Beethoven, this discipline was ethos, not a prescribed, Philistine moral, but that height and force of soul, thanks to which the deaf musician manfully coped with his misfortune and believed with conviction in the fact of the brotherhood of man).
With such an unintenional deviation I complete my work. I have far from exhausted the theme. The rich material, analyzed here, demands a more exhaustive and systematic presentation. Works such as the keyboard suites of D. Scarlatti, the concerto grossi of Handel, the inventions, toccatas, and Brandenburg concerti of Bach, as prerequisites of sonata-dialectical thinking demand, not just separate studies or chapters, but entire separate researches. In just the same way, an extended digression would be required for comparisons of the Beethoven and Schubert sonata styles, the symphonism of Bruckner and Brahms, and then an analysis of Russian symphonism, etc. Even in the area of the chamber musical culture of the nineteenth century there are "subjects" (the last quartets of Beethoven, the etudes and preludes of Chopin, the sonatas and preludes of Debussy, the string ensembles of S. Taneev) which present profound interest from the point of view of the dynamic study of musical form as a formation (the motion and organization of intonations crystallized in the consciousness). Omitted from my presentation was the area of urban instrumental music, both "amateur" and professional, of ancient Germany\textsuperscript{8} (the sphere which engendered the Bach

\textsuperscript{8}In this relation, the most interesting area, of course, is lute music, paralleling organ and keyboard music.
musician-artisans), with its enormous literature, from "tower sonatas" to the Mozart serenades, and also contradanses, German dances, etc., for there are no insignificant forms, but rather there is only the long or short exposure or formation of music. The length or shortness depends on the demands issuing from the social order, and these demands, of course, are conditioned by the relations of production.

From the literature of "the simplest and most common juxtapositions and correlations" a series of stages of formations ascends to the highest manifestations of musical thinking. Is not the theme of the finale of the "Ninth" [sic.], in the final summation, indebted, in both its quality and origin, to the prolonged experience of innumerable generations of musicians, whether known to us, little known, or entirely unknown, dilettantes and professionals alike, seeking both in the direct delights of music, and in occupation with it as a profession, the expression of their feelings and thoughts and, for that reason, as a consequence of complicated mental processes, unquestionably enriching the forms of exposure of music? Here is a curious example of festive, "triumphal" music, collected in Leipzig in 1631 by Marcus Dietrich ("Victoria sveco-saxonica für 5 Stimmen auf 3 Chöre so verteilt, dass bald die 5 Stimmen des ersten, bald die des zweiten, bald
beide zusammen und uberein singen. Instrumente, besonders Bläser, sind hinzudenken [Victoria svecosaxonica for 5 voices in 3 choirs, so distributed that, now the 5 voices of the first sing, now those of the second, now of both together and in accord; the instruments, especially the winds, are an afterthought]). Intonations "exist" in this example which anticipate the march rhythm and rejoicing of the finale of Beethoven's Fifth Symphony.  

9The example is taken from Rudolf Wustmann, Musikgeschichte Leipzigs, Volume I: Bis zur Mitte des 17. Jahrhunderts (Leipzig, 1908), pp. 179-80.
And there is a multitude of such examples.

This interrelation of the "highest" and the "lowest" intonations (applied or directly dictated by the way of life) testifies to the fact that the process of organization in music not only must be examined in the "horizontal," in the consecutive evolution of forms crystallized in the consciousness, but also in each given, historical moment, in a reciprocal stratum from the top down and the bottom up. The great classic composers always reflected in their creation, within an enormous scope, music belonging to their epoch. And before many of the intonations of Bach, Haydn, or Beethoven became "universal," they "existed" within the petty, burgher environment which engendered them. The composers--nurselings of this environment--transformed material grasped from childhood into the fabric of their compositions. This is the source of the popularity, in the very best sense of the word, of classical music. It is not a matter of simplicity of forms--the forms are far from simple--but in the broad prevalence of the elementary and more complex instrumental
intonations by which this music was conditioned. The burgher culture created them, and, having become bourgeois culture, carried them out into the broad social arena.

I did not, in my work, touch upon the opera, the Lied, or other manifestations of the vocal style. I made this omission consciously, for otherwise it would have been necessary to turn to the study of musical semantics (I prefer this concept, borrowed from linguistics, to the concept of "musical symbolism"), to the study of the genesis and crystallization of sound complexes linked with poetical images and ideas and their influence on musical formation, without which it is inconceivable to analyze forms of vocal music, for "pure" music and its schemes cannot be abstracted from them any more than it is possible to study folk song motives without text, or text without motives, or to understand the essence of foreign opera without understanding the intonations of the language on the basis of which this opera grew. For the same reason,

10 The perception of music is a chain of the most complex reflexes. Already the single phenomenon of the simultaneous comparison of the preceding and succeeding moments and the combining into a unity of intonations opposed to one another, the combination of unities, and their crystallization into well-proportioned images and forms familiar to the consciousness--already this one phenomenon confronts the researcher with the most difficult psycho-physiological problems in the recognition of similarity and difference in the "accumulation" of intonations.
because of the impossibility of touching in detail on the problem of musical semantics. I have only barely touched on the area of program music.

I repeat, my principal endeavor was to formulate, in the most general way, the premises of the dialectic of musical formation, as they emerge from a dynamic study of musical form, a study rejecting the self-sufficing evolution of "mute" form-schemes, and examining form as an intonational process of organization, which is to say, as a medium and an aspect of the public exposure of music.
SUPPLEMENT 1

GENERALIZATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS WHICH SYSTEMATIZE MY OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROCESSES OF MUSICAL FORMATION AND THE CRYSTALLIZATION OF MUSICAL FORMS IN THE HUMAN CONSCIOUSNESS

Theoretical Positions:

A. Form as a formation, whether in the creative sense, the area of performance (reproduction), or the process of perception, is comprehended by our consciousness as the co-existence of opposites—familiar, crystallized formulae and constructive schemes, on the one hand, and correlations which reorganize them or are newly invented (improvisational features), on the other. The most accessible field for observation is found in the formulae, most firmly crystallized in the European tonal system, of cadences—their "swelling up" from within (as in the works of Richard Strauss*207 and Max Reger) and their "transformation" from factors which slow down and close motion to impelling factors. Even the seemingly most fossilized
sound correlations represent an extremely unstable medium. The dialectic of the cadence in Wagner and Debussy, as in many antipodal relations, can serve as an example. The problem of form in the music of Debussy is interesting from the point of view of the opposition of the classically constructive or rationally realistic orientation to the tendencies of Impressionism (the "sketching of impressions"). Not without reason did Debussy himself feel some lack of coordination between his aspirations and the understanding of Impressionism in the ruling circles at that time. Apropos of his Images, he wrote to Durand, "... I am trying to create something "different"--to some degree real--that which ignoramuses call "Impressionism," a term very badly employed especially by critics of art who do not hesitate even to thrust it on Turner, a most remarkable creator, who understands the secrets of art!"¹

B. Form, in consideration of the material of music as acoustical reality, emerges in the capacity of a method (an instrument)² for the treatment of this material, with the view toward its adaptation to the needs of man as a social animal. Consciousness, as the relation of man to his environment, controls, through form, a multitude of the most widely varied sound excitations. Thus,

¹Lettres de Claude Debussy a son editeur (Paris, 1927), p. 58
²²⁰⁸
various methods of treating material arise, gradually brought together into a system. Let us say, for example, that now for us, within the terms of familiar temperament, the major and minor thirds are crystallized systems, which permit "exact" solmization and have been installed as the basis of harmony. It was not so in [classical] antiquity; it was not so in the Middle Ages; it is not so, in our time, in "musical dialectic" which does not know European temperament. Thus, between the relatively complete crystallization of thirds as a system and their realization somewhere in the dawn of the "primitives of music" lies the prolonged stage of their assimilation as "raw material." I wish to say that even the seemingly most stable elements of music--for example, scales--before becoming organized or prepared material which we employ in this, its "secondary stage" (for the board which the carpenter sees "in his mind's eye" in the unfelled tree is one thing, and the planed-down board from which a table, or part of a table, is obtained, is another), and before being changed into prepared schemes, have undergone a prolonged period of transformation. This explains the difference between some melodic pattern which defines a mode, a tone series as the intonational formula of a mode, and some scale taken in the capacity of an element in some composition. The distance from the acoustical material of music to the organized elements of this material in the
capacity of already prepared material, but differentiated according to the goals of the composition, must necessarily be taken into account in the evaluation and analysis of musical phenomena. It is possible to dispute whether consonance and dissonance, for example, are acoustically objective qualities, but, at the same time, as material of a "secondary order," consonances and dissonances emerge in the evolution of music both as changeable factors (operating forces) of musical organization and as crystallized forms, component elements of larger forms.

It is also necessary to distinguish, from the concept of material in the senses just indicated, the concept of the material medium (wood, metal, skin) by which this material is exposed. The intonations of percussion instruments defined to a considerable extent the process of organization of the music of primitive peoples, as well as that of later periods. In the eighteenth century, the insertion of the instruments of "janissary music" into European orchestras, first of all as if in the form of exotic toys, had an influence on the organization of operatic and symphonic scores, and simultaneously penetrated into
the ubiquitous occurrence of "military" music (incidentally, public concerts by military orchestras became a common occurrence in Europe about 1780, especially in London and Vienna). An extremely popular echo of the penetration of elements of "janissary music" into the chamber style is the organization by Mozart of the scheme of the final rondo in his A major piano sonata [K. 331] by means of the stylization of blows and rolls of the drum and flute intonations. 2

We need not speak of how the forms of extended and prolonged instrumental melody are linked with the evolution of the building of violins, nor about the dependence of vocal forms on the progress of human singing, conditioned by the manner of breathing, by the manner of presentation and support of sound, and by the environment which "colors" this sound. These

2Apropos of the influence of the "material medium" on the organization of music, some splendid, and some merely good material, worthwhile facts, and a "rough draft," are given in the first volume of Sammelbande für vergleichende Musikwissenschaft (München: 1922), with such articles as "Ton system und Musik der Siamesan," by Stumpf, and "Ton system und Musik der Japaner," by Abraham and Hornbostel, and also in the outstanding work by Curt Sachs, Geist und Werden der Musikinstrumente (Berlin, 1929); there are also useful data in the same connection in the collection, Chinesische Musik (Fr. am Main, 1927), and in the popular booklet by M. Brenet, La musique militaire (Les musiciens célèbres, Paris).*210
problems are all still little studied, but meanwhile there is no doubt that only the urgent necessity for the expression of emotions of a "liberated" personality, as a consequence of the culture of the Renaissance, led to the splendid epoch of the vocal virtuoso style and to its "representative" form, the aria da capo. Such a developed form, rich with possibilities, containing within it the prerequisites for the sonata, of course, could become the answer to the social order of the epoch only because the same relations of production which gave rise both to the Vita Nuova (Dante) and to the man's perception of the world in a new fashion, led to persistent work on the material medium of "vocalness," in order to make the voice a flexible and responsive instrument, while parallel work proceeded on the improvement of stringed instruments as instruments of

---

3 The aria, with an accompanied recitative preceding it as a dramatic prerequisite, contained an exposition, development, and reprise (da capo). As a lyric form, as a "formation" of sensation or affect in vocal melody, it could not develop to the dialectical level inherent in the sonata, but the essential prerequisites of the sonata allegro were already beginning to emerge from the occurrence of "contrasting sensations" in the aria's da capo. This is convincingly apparent even from the examples in the article, already cited, Vladimir Helfert, "Zur Entwicklungsgeschichte der Sonatenforms," Archiv für Musikwissenschaft, April, 1925.
"large breathing" (the bow and its stroke). 4

C. If form does not exist except in sound, and is only intonation (organized sound conjugation, exposed in the process of sounding), then it is all the more necessary to keep in mind that the idea of "musical rhythm" as a factor of form is inconceivable apart from intonation.

This is not the place to argue about how much rhythm is a biological concept, and how much a sociological one. To

---

4 The attempt made by P. Bekker to link the basic aspects and character of musical thinking and expression, and the basic divisions of style (polyphony and harmony), with the material basis, in the sense of the medium of sound production (voice and instrument) is based on a confusion of concepts--the concept of matter and the material [adj.], on one side, of the material of music on another, and of the material medium in the sense just mentioned on the third. I refer to his brochure, Materiale Grundlagen der Musik (Vienna, no date indicated). In this brochure, however, correct prerequisites are given for the understanding of form, namely that the view of art of almost all aesthetically productive times and peoples strives toward the establishment of antithesis, . . ." and that the necessary " . . . prerequisite to any examination of music is always only to perceive sounding music. Music is only possible when it sounds or is represented as sounding." Opponents of the contemporary musical esthetic apply to it the concept of "formalism," employing" . . . the " . . . designation 'formalistic' in its former sense as a term of critical disparagement, the antithesis of aesthetic content" (the sensualists' view--B.A.), whereas, the task of contemporary musical esthetics is the establishment of form in an entirely different formation--a dialectical and dynamic formation. 213
me personally it seems that rhythm as a sociological factor plays a large role in musical organization, especially through the link with gesture, in the broad sense of this concept, for an enormous amount of music has its roots, not only in signalling, in communication at a distance, but also in communication through an accent (a thesis, a blow, a sound drawn-out at the moment of greatest effort) simultaneously heard by all participants in work or a game. Bücher, in his illustrious work, \(^{215}\) completely omits intonation from consideration, and therefore omits, in principle, the undeniable link of the intonations which set the rhythm of work with the character of this work. Conversely, the existence through intonations of rhythmically regulated work (marching, any game set to music) remains unproved in his work, because of the isolation of rhythm from melody. Indeed, the single fact of the setting of muscular effort to rhythm evokes neither musical tone nor correlations of pitch, i.e., melodies. But the necessity to unify muscular efforts calls forth the need for a sound, a shout, a call, in a word, for the audibility of gesture; \(^{216}\) this is all we need to say now in this connection. It is clear that, from this point, it is still very far to a resolution of the complex problem of musical rhythm.

The conditions of the origin of mensural notation bear witness to the fact that, with the development of
polyphony, and with the liberation from poetic rhythmics and metrics, musical rhythm, measured by the duration of tones in their ever more complex interrelations, became almost the basic problem of the epoch. From the point of view of musical organization, the system of mensuration made possible the further fruitful interaction of international processes with processes for economizing the energy expended in intoning (which became especially necessary with the development, not only of vocal polyphony, but also of ensemble instrumental playing). The repetition of equal durations through a definite period of time, the symmetry of duration, the contrasting of small and large divisions, and of even-numbered and odd-numbered divisions of durations—all these "specific cases" were united in a common attempt to establish firm "systems" for the measurement of durations of intonations. If one may speak of rhythm in the broad sense, in application to any proportional interchange of the elements of music (the rhythm of chords, of cadences, of tonalities, of timbres, of repetitions of identical material, etc.), then, in the narrow sense, in rhythm as a factor of form, it is not possible, it seems to me, to see only a numerical factor, a measuring gauge of durations, except to abstract it from sound, from the object of measurement. Meter and bar are gauges of measurement, but rhythm is that which is measured, that which in meter
and bar reveals itself as a quantity, i.e., "the purposeful motion of material, repeatedly performed with equal intervals between separate acts of the motion."\(^5\) One of the expressions of this "equalness" in music, is the bar, but only as a landmark for the grouping of durations, and not at all as the sole index to the varied manifestations of the rhythmic nature of musical formation. The sum of the bars yields only a quantity of identical durations in succession, but does not determine the interrelations of durations nor the "product" of durations in a complex whole such as is a musical piece, consisting of more than the simple succession of equal metric units. Only a study of the functions of durations, similar to intonational studies of the functions of chords, tones of a mode, etc., reveals to us the true role of rhythm in musical formation.

A simple example follows: the three-beat measure as an abstract concept is indivisible, but, as a rhythmic function (and rhythm in music, it is now necessary to add, is revealed in the interaction of accented and unaccented durations, and in the co-existence of factors which mechanize motion--automaticism and repetitiveness--with factors

---

\(^5\) I cite this definition from the article by O. Ermanskiĭ, "Problemy trudovogo ritma [Problems of the Rhythm of Labor]," Vestnik Sotsialisticheskoi akademii [Herald of the Socialist Academy], No. 2 (1923), p. 103.
which break them up while still reaffirming rhythm
as purposeful motion and the purposefulness of motion,
for example: the syncope), it is different in the
mazurka and in the waltz, in the courante and in the
sarabande, in quick and in slow tempo, etc.

D. From what has been said it is a natural tran-
sition to the understanding of the rhythmic-constructive
factors of musical formation (repetition, periodization,
symmetry) in their dynamic essence. All the usual
definitions of rhythm suffer from the fact that they
are static, that by advancing to the forefront the
qualities of equality and repetition, they affirm,
not rhythm, but the inertia of rhythm. In fact, in
music there is no equality without inequality, there
is no symmetry without asymmetry, no uniformity of
accent or beat without syncopes, no evenness without
unevenness, etc. Rhythm exists only in the mutual
conditionality of contradictions. From this fact, all
past attempts of musical formalism to reduce all music,
without exception, to a placid balance of all elements,
as if to a uniform ideal, have been broken up against
the reality of music as a condition of unstable equi-
librium. Form, as a formation, includes rhythmic-con-
structive elements in juxtaposition with their opposites.
Thus, neither periods, nor phrases, nor motives, nor any such divisions have any significance in themselves as some ideal schemes to which music is adapted. On the contrary, these divisions are always a consequence, a result, drawn from the formation of music; but in this formation rhythmic-constructive factors reveal themselves, not in isolation, but functionally, in interconditionality and in opposition. Therefore, to say, for example, that the march is a song form consisting of three parts \((a + b + a)\), each of which also may consist of three periods, of which the third is a repetition of the first, that the third part of the march repeats the first, and that the second is called the trio, is to say nothing about the march as a concrete form, if we do not point out the specific rhythmics of the march and the particular character of its intonations, for this already, in itself, forces one dialectically to contrast the intonations and rhythm of the march with other forms of musical formation. Then it turns out that the "march with trio" is only one of the steps in the evolution of this form, and it is not simply a matter of sixteen bar periods, etc.\(^6\)

\(^6\)The error of placing both the assimilation of the principles of formation and the functions of the
Thus, rhythm, understood dialectically, indicates the correct path to the cognition of constructive factors as the highest "unification of the elements of purposeful sound motion" in the interaction of the opposing tendencies which form them. The "square" period is a perfect period on the strength of its symmetry and other such properties. This is true. But, taken apart from the reality of the music, in which the given square period has meaning only as a function in such-and-such conditions or stages of formation, a succession of square periods in itself, for the sake of their constructive completeness, evokes nothing, except an impression of monotony. Music cannot elements into ideal schemes, strictly apart from the study of the intonational process, is evident from the pedagogical practice of teaching forms "from prepared models," similarly to the teaching of singing "from the voice" of the pedagogue, with his own personal style of singing. The teacher points out an ideal composition, but if the pupil imitates exactly its constructive scheme (as at one time, not so long ago, it was the fashion, in the large Petersburg Conservatory, to write the Allegro of a sonata in the manner of Glazunov's First Sonata), he will learn nothing. Rather, it would seem, the whole matter of "progress" would be in the imitation of ideal schemes, if they were truly forms. However, until the pupil realizes the dynamics of organization, till he understands functional conditionality, till he "brings into motion" all the elements, he will not master form, but will write "from the voice" and in the style of his teacher his whole life.
be good only because it is possible to "extract" from it a beautiful, symmetrical scheme, and, on the other hand, it is not possible to "evoke good music" merely by means of a beautiful scheme. From the point of view of form as a process of growth, asymmetrical constructions may be purposeful to the same extent as symmetrical ones.

E. The situation is the same with the intonational factors of form. Melos, harmony, and timbre—the vocal or instrumental aspect of sound realization—all define form, in their mutual conditionality, as a growth process. In different epochs, one or another of these factors has become foremost, then again become subordinate. But there has been no epoch when the organization of music has not depended on the properties of the material medium of sound realization.

F. That tempo is also a factor of form is apparent from the fact that, in the case of a sharp change of tempo in a piece intended for such-and-such a gradation of speed, the music begins to seem either more long-winded or vice versa. For example, the change of allegro $\frac{4}{4}$ into allegro $\frac{2}{2}$ prolongs the piece, because the correlation of durations is upset; the hearing perceives spaces between features which are foreign
to one another as drawn together. "Vacuums" are formed, and each functional vacancy in music evokes an impression of fragmentariness and diverts attention from the musical formation. This results in a vexatious feeling of tediousness.\textsuperscript{217}

The fact that the sonata allegro is usually allegro and not a slow movement reveals the organic link of a given kind of formation with tempo; the contrasting thematic correlations evoked by the sonata quality are perceived as such within the limits of certain speeds. Otherwise they are dispersed.\textsuperscript{218}

G. Categories of form and kinds of formation of music are conditioned by a whole series of factors, to which, till the present time, little attention has been directed. These involve location in "space" and in the environment of the listeners. It is perfectly obvious that music, filling some space with sounds, exerts an influence, not only by the force of sound and the stridency of timbres, but also by appropriate dimensions and intensity of formation. Until music-making moved into large concert halls, a symphony such as those of Beethoven would have been inconceivable. One may say that the limits of the symphony grew with the extension of the architectural spaces which were enveloped by it. But the
problem of the prolonged, out-door, popular symphony, for example, remained unsolved, in spite of the attempts of Berlioz.* From this it is possible to draw the not very paradoxical conclusion that the European symphony is the offspring of a closed space, i.e., it is descended from the expansion and development of chamber forms of music-making.

The relation between music and the space "occupied" by it is not just a phenomenon of a purely acoustical order. The street, the square, the urban garden, or the boulevard, all these call for a special kind, a special "specific quality" of forms. Of course, it is possible to sing the animated, village chastushka in the concert hall, but its form is still determined by the village street. A military march may be performed on a pianoforte in an apartment, but its authentic sphere is the military orchestra in the square, on the street, or in a garden. The well-known funeral march with gong by Gossec (Marche lugubre, first performed on September 26, 1790, in one of the funeral ceremonies in Paris), like almost all the compositions of composers in the epoch of the great revolution, could have arisen only from the search for intonations which would "envelop" the wide
spaces of squares and would "arouse" masses of listeners. 7

On the other hand, the epoch of the creation of Schubert's songs and their later dissemination in Europe is characterized by the gathering of music into a restricted space, into forms of song-like lyricism, intended for a small circle of friends and for emotional concentration. The songs of Schubert were spread slowly, not because the Viennese were so frivolous, but because the forms of music-making common to the Vienna of that time (the aristocratic salon, the theatre, the concert hall, the square) did not correspond to the modest scale of intimate lyricism. The environment which gave rise to them was still not widespread and powerful enough to become the legislator of taste, as it did a score of years later,

7"The impression produced by the Marche lugubre was enormous. The broken harmonies, interrupted by pauses and accented by the muffled strokes of gongs truly strike a chill into the listeners and inspire religious terror in the soul!' Thus it was expressed in Le Moniteur. And Les Revolutions de Paris wrote even more strongly: 'Its detached notes break the heart, tear at the entrails!'" (Louis Dufranc, Gossec, sa vie, ses oeuvres [Paris, 1927], p. 121).*221 And this is far from an isolated case. A partial solution to the problem of "out-door", mass music with a powerful oratorical influence is a principal achievement of music from the festivals of the great revolution. The results are reflected in the forms and performance media in Berlioz's Music.
after Schubert's death. The appearance of the first scores of Mendelssohn's *Songs Without Words*, in the early thirties of the nineteenth century was already a definite reaction of tastes away from the pithy Schubertian lyricism, toward transient, faintly stirring emotions; this is music for a new type of salon, for a reception room or living room in a cozy, bourgeois apartment, and not in a palace.

Thus concert-symphonic and chamber music, salon and domestic music, outdoor, genre music of the streets, squares, gardens, boulevards, and cafes, music of magnificent festivals, splendid processions, etc., all demand different kinds of organization, since the differences in dimensions and essential features of the space filled by the sounds (a closed location or the open air) influence, not only the methods of sound production, but also the sound correlations.

H. The most important kinds of formation which have been crystallized in the development of European music have, as a foundation, either cyclical or self-contained structures.

1. **Cyclical Structures.**

   a. Suites consist of the juxtaposition of contrasting dance pieces, supplemented by additional pieces of a contemplative-lyrical nature (arias), a descriptive nature (character pieces, portraits, sound pictures of
moods), or an intellectually symphonic scheme (for example, the preludes in Bach's English Suites).

b. Sonatas and symphonies (concerti, etc.) involve the juxtaposition of contrasting "movements," each of which, occurring as a self-contained structure (symphonic, sonata allegro; adagio, andante, or a movement in a quicker tempo; a scherzo or dance in quick or moderate tempo; and a rondo of either the common or the symphonic, sonata type), simultaneously serves as a manifestation of the idea of the sonata or the symphony as a unity, which is often further emphasized by the commonality of thematic material in all the movements, or by the execution of some leitmotif through all the sections, (as in Tchaikovsky's Fourth and Fifth Symphonies).

c. Variations occur in a variety of degrees, from the simplest interchanges of episodes of a variously ornamented theme, up to complicated transformations of a theme, involving the extraction from it of contrasting new formations, and even the introduction of devices of symphonic development.

---

8 I find it difficult to give sections of the symphony any designation other than "movement" (in the sense of the French term, mouvement) [the Russian term dvizhenie, meaning movement or motion, is used here, in preference to the more commonly employed term, chast', meaning section or part]. Their dependence on functional premises is emphasized by this term.
d. A fourth subdivision within this category includes various other cyclical structures which are conditioned by an operatic libretto or some kind of program, or which realize a poetic text. All these formations are linked internally through the interaction of the principles of contrast and identity. Variations proceed from the predominance of the latter principle, and develop in a constant approach to maximum contrast between the point of departure and the point of arrival (conclusion).

The symphonic, sonata cycles are based on the predominance of the dramatic principle of contrast, but each of them endeavors, as the end result of its formation, to become a unity, to express the basic idea peculiar to it. Suite cycles occupy a middle position in this regard.

2. Self-contained Structures With Clear-cut Subdivisions Into Sections.
   a. One-part structures consist of identical repetitions of an identical complex. Typical forms of this structure include the couplet and the strophic song without refrains or instrumental repetitions of the melody.*

   b. Two-part structures involve juxtapositions of two complexes, contrasting in greater or lesser degree; these include songs with a repeated refrain, instrumental repetition, or ritornello.*
c. Three-part structures, conforming to the formula $a + b + a$, are the most common and varied kinds of juxtapositions. Each of the sections permits expansion into some degree of connection. For example, in several menuets of Haydn and Mozart, and in the scherzi of Beethoven, the first section (a) usually represents a two-part complex, the first part of which is a statement of the theme, and the second, its development in various tonal digressions with a firm cadential complex at the end, establishing the basic structure. The middle section is a three-part trio with repetition of the first part. The third section is a repetition of the first. In the works of Beethoven, a coda is added to this "order" as a synthesis of the elements of the main section and those of the trio (the Ninth Symphony). Then a new formula of formation arises--$a + b + a + b$--representing a chain of periodic alternations, and, in essence, presenting itself as the development of a two-part structure.

9The coda occurs in the Scherzo of the Third Symphony as a cadence extended over a basso ostinato. In the Fifth Symphony, the Scherzo passes on into the finale, and is closely interwoven with it; in the Sixth, it is turned into a sound picture (the juxtaposition of a peaceful, genre scene and a storm). In the Seventh, the short coda of the Scherzo sounds like an echo of the basic idea of the trio. The most synthetical of Beethoven's codas is that added to the Scherzo movement of the Ninth Symphony.
3. **Self-contained Structures of a Connected Type, but with Partial Preservation of Sectioning.**

   a. One may consider the form of the *rondo* as a periodic chain of interchanged or juxtaposed complexes, from the simplest transformation of the "circular" couplet song of the *khorovod*, to the rondo of the sonata kind where the melodic refrain, around which the motion is grouped, and to which it returns, becomes a theme. In the latter case, the central one of the several episodes which occur between the refrains of the rondo is transformed into an "arena" of thematic development. In the motion of the rondo, the idea of a circle--the circular, "recurrent," execution of a single idea--is valuable. The difference between the simple rondo and the rondo-sonata lies in the fact that, in the first instance, the episodes are not subordinated *thematically* to the basic melody (the refrain). The whole motion carries a more melodic and lyrico-epic character, with juxtapositions around the refrain definitely predominating over thematic conjugation and the contrasting of theme and episodes, as these occur in rondos of the sonata type. For that reason, the rondo of the couplet type is more diffuse than the rondo with thematic development. If we compare
the primitive rondos (choral songs) of the Middle Ages with the symphonic rondos of the Viennese Classics and the rondos of later symphonies, then in the first the refrain rules entirely as the basic pivot; the melody digresses very shyly and takes another direction, but soon returns to the initial source.

It is natural that the forms of the rondo, in their evolution, had to come to thematic development; the melodic episodes, increasing in number and not connected thematically with the refrain, would have absorbed it, and the rondo would have been transformed into no more than a variegated chain of juxtapositions, with the periodic return of the refrain. Such a unifying principle does not permit a way out of a circle of naive "utterances," even though grouped tonally around the prevailing melody.

In order to assimilate the formation of the rondo and its continuous vacillation between separate juxtapositions of refrain and episode, with clear-cut cadential "sectioning" and connected juxtapositions passing on into thematic development, it is sufficient to compare two rondos from Mozart's piano sonatas in B♭ major [K. 333 and K. 281, respectively].
It will be recalled that the theme of the first rondo is as follows:

\[ \text{Allegro grazioso} \]

and of the second:

\[ \text{Allegro} \]

In both pieces the first, expositional section, the execution of ne-, episodic melodies, and the repetition of the first section, passing on into a coda, are clearly defined.

The first section of the first rondo represents a connected, three-part complex (the refrain, the melody adjoining it in the dominant tonality, and the refrain, again) with a transition into the central construction. This center in the first rondo consists of the juxtaposition of two new melodies in g minor and Eb major, and a transitional return to the refrain by means of a series of short modulations on one of the melodic elements of the refrain itself.

In the second rondo, the first section also forms a connected three-part complex with a direct transition into the central stage. But here there is a difference, in spite of the similarity in tonal groupings. The g minor
episode is not a short melody, but a delimited, two-part complex, with each part repeated. After this, a short modulation brings back the refrain. The statement of the refrain is followed by the appearance of a new melody in $E_b$ major, passing into the refrain again, by means of modulations.

The reprise in the first rondo (the refrain with its appendant melody, now tonally subordinate to it) is more developed in comparison with the exposition, but in the second rondo, on the contrary, it is more concise. In the first rondo, the third part of the reprise, i.e., the repetition of the refrain passes on into its development, interrupted by a virtuoso cadenza, after which the refrain is intoned once more, in an abbreviated version, and the whole movement concludes with a melodic cadence, with a deviation into $E_b$ major. In the second rondo, the reprise begins with the second part—the repetition of the subsidiary melody (but the melody of the refrain serves as a transition to it with an organ point on the dominant). To compensate, the refrain is intoned after this melody, not abbreviated, as in the first rondo, but complete, concluding with a short cadence.

Thus, in both these rondos there is a plastic and balanced melodic formation (an abbreviated execution in one stage is compensated for by one at greater length in another), with a predominance of the element of identity
(the refrain). The apparent similarity to the symphonic sonata allegro (exposition, center, reprise; the connectedness of statement; some thematic development) must not deceive one. In the exposition of the rondo there is no second theme (part) as a contrasting sphere; the melody which adjoins the refrain, closely linked with it, is not a theme as an independently operating force. The center of the rondo is not a working out section; it is not an arena of struggle nor of the comprehensive exposure of contrasting ideas, but rather the execution of new melodies, again grouping themselves around the refrain as a pivot. Hints of thematic development are transitional stages in the rondo, while in the sonata and symphony, just this "transitional quality" (i.e., those moments of formation in which the main role is played, not by statically successive exposures of melodies, but by contrasts of thematic elements) becomes the center, the dynamic essence of motion. Motion is transformed into development; an objective display of melodies, into a dramatic formation. The well-proportioned, balanced rondos of Mozart stand at the turning point. Beethoven dramatized his rondos and saturated them with symphonic development. On the other hand, one may say of Schubert's symphonic, sonata allegros that, on the strength of the song-like character of their formation, they approach the character of the rondo.

b. It is not necessary to speak here about the
symphonic, sonata allegro as a closed type of construction, with the (partial) preservation of sectioning—the repetition of the exposition, and its clear-cut delimitation from the working out section.

4. Self-contained Structures With Complete Unity of Sections and With Largely Uninterrupted Uniform Motion.

   a. Forms constructed on the basis of a cantus firmus or linked by an ostinato bass (passacaglia, chaconne), in a word, built on the basis of identity (on a core which unifies the motion), fall within this category.

   b. Also included in this category are forms conditioned by the movement and germination of identical (ostinato) material: imitation, canon, and fugue.10

   Between these prototypes may be found innumerable "variants" of them (for example, ricercare, several kinds of preludes, elaborations of chorales, etc.).

   c. A third group is composed of forms of unified, monothematic motion, representing developed, one-part

   

10I call attention to the fact that one of the essential differences in formation between the fugue and the sonata consists in the fact that all features of a connecting or transitional character (interludes in fugues, working out sections and so-called transitions or connecting passages in sonatas and symphonies) have a passive character in an imitative or canonic formation—motion is usually sequential or "terraced"—while in the symphonic sonata formation (as has been pointed out in connection with the rondo, and is even more significant here), all such features began to acquire a strikingly expressive, dynamic, urgent character, as the sonata and symphony developed.
structures of a dynamic character. The point of departure—a clear-cut, intonational sound complex, like the subject of a fugue—serves in these forms as an impetus or a running start of such force that the whole formation is determined by it. It proceeds from this point—connected (all the elements are coupled with one another, like cogs in clockwork), uniform, and logically well-proportioned.

The best models for studying this type of formation are most of the preludes of the Wohltemperiertes Klavier of Bach, especially in Vol. I, notably the following: C major, c minor (motion, uninterrupted and uniform, at its most intense stage "strikes against" the vertical, and for some time is "diffused" in a cadenza, after which it soon slows to a stop; this is a rather frequent method of constructing a coda in the works of Bach), C# major, c# minor, D major (a device for breaking off the motion, as in the c minor prelude), d minor, e♭ minor (an ostinato-like rhythmic background, over which twists a capricious melodic line), E major (a smooth, undulatory melody as the stimulus to a continuous unfolding), F major, G major, g minor, and A♭ major (a one-measure complex as a sort of ostinato or motto for the entire movement; the same device is used in the a minor prelude). In the B♭ major prelude, the device for "breaking off" the headlong race of the music by means of a "blow" against the vertical is
repeated several times in the second stage of the movement; an exchange of efforts (the renewal of motion) and of new obstacles occurs. Furthermore, in this same prelude, the race of harmonic figurations alternates with headlong lines of melodic figurations. The $b$ minor prelude is a prelude of undulatory intensification; a "tenacious," connected unity is organized, seemingly, from mosaic fragments (repeated intonations of this pattern:

\[ \text{\includegraphics[width=2cm]{image.png}} \]. At the end, the device of breaking off the intensification against the vertical, again occurs.

I have not introduced examples from the second part of the Wohltemperiertes Klavier, but there are, besides the preludes of Bach, splendid models of "dynamic one-partness" among the twenty-four preludes of Chopin, beginning with the first. Later, however, as the prelude lost its dynamic properties, changing into "modulatory preluding," it became all the more loose.\(^{11}\) "Sound pictures of moods," "sketches of emotional outbursts," stimulated extremely "tasty" consonances, but at the expense of the dynamics of the composition. Such are many of the

\(^{11}\) Wagner's well-known Vorspiel to Lohengrin, in spite of the harmonic cast of the composer's thought, is a linear composition, having deep roots in the ancient German organ art of preluding on, and from, a basic dynamic premise. In general, the prelude, as a "demonstration" of unity on the basis of the dialectical transformation of the initial impulse, is one of the most difficult ways of constructing music, based on the principle of identity.
preludes of Scriabin. On the other hand, the impressionistic preludes of Debussy deceive one with the "illusory quality" and refinement of their music; the skeleton of each is firm, and its idea is unified, usually by a pivotal theme (or complex of themes), but the music, dazzling and delicate, "overflows" more than it evolves or ferments. This is the creation of an intellectually strong composer in a very rich, but tired, culture.

d. Forms of unified, polythematic motion, representing contracted, concise, and concentrated symphonic, sonata cycles with more or less distinct sections, also fall within this category. The Prelude to Wagner's Die Meistersinger is such a composition. Many symphonic poems (by Liszt, Richard Strauss, Tchaikovsky, et al.) and some one-movement sonatas (such as Liszt's) represent forms of unified motion. But not all such works are concentrated cycles; the mere absence of breaks between movements does not always transform a work into a many-sided unity like the aforementioned prelude to Die Meistersinger or Liszt's Sonata. Often, the sections of a sonata or symphony, which are reduced to an uninterrupted series, remain sections and not close-knit stages of a given unity. A more or less successful solution to the problem of form in a "unified cycle" depends on many factors--on the organic transformations of ostinato or pivotal elements (identical rhythmic, melodic, and
harmonic complexes), in the first place. But such transformations are difficult, and sometimes, even in the works of Liszt—a master of thematic metamorphosis—it is apparent that a theme merely wears a mask which is foreign to it, and is not truly transformed.

Forms of the vocal *aria da capo* fall, in part, within the latter category [closed structures with unity of sections and uniform motion, #4, above], and, in part, within the preceding one (closed structures of a connected type, but with the preservation of *sectioning*, [#3, above]). Toccatas and all forms of the symphonic, sonata allegro (overtures, etc.) in which the formation achieves unconditional unity, but appears with multi-ciphered (thematic) contrasts, are also included in this category [#3].

In conclusion, I enumerate those dynamic factors and operating forces, the varied and multi-faceted manifestations of which comprise the formation of music of the kinds of organization and the crystallized forms (realized as a unity) which I have noted.

(1) The principle of identity and the principle of contrast, in their mutual conditionality, have created the possibility of expanding the limits of musical motion, and they express its dynamic essence.

(2) Various degrees of contrast—from simple juxtapositions or alternations of sound complexes to thematic contrasts—generate various kinds of juxtapositions of the
elements of music, as a consequence of which, various methods for actuating musical motion, are also generated.

(3) Identity is manifested in repetition, in variants and ornamentation of the same sound complexes, in the constancy of execution (sounding) of the complex which is accepted as the initial one, and in the repetitiveness (the ostinato quality) of the basis on which the formation occurs; absolute identity (repetition) does not engender motion, but serves for the strengthening in the consciousness of some stage of motion.

(4) Identical and contrasting formations appear both in single-line and multi-line textures, and also in the juxtaposition of harmonic timbres; the single-line quality may be seen, not only in monophony, but also in the parallel movement of intervals. The so-called monody with accompaniment, and homophonic music in general is, in essence, a two-line formation (melody and bass), but, where the melody is wholly dependent on the harmonic fundamental, it turns out to be a single line formation, filled out with exposed overtones (harmonic complexes).

(5) The interconditionality and interaction of horizontals and verticals (in relation to durations, i.e., rhythm) determine the texture of music (of a given formation).
SUPPLEMENT 2

BASES OF MUSICAL INTONATION

This appendix is a short statement of the work, written in 1925-1926, entitled, "The Basis of Russian Musical Intonation." The work remained unpublished, but entered partially into my report at one of the congresses for the retraining of instructors of the music technikums. It was an important stage in my development. That part of it which I still consider significant, I present here as a supplement to the study of musical form, in explanation of the concept, often encountered in that context, of "musical intonation," and of several other terms. Apart from intonation and the realization of the process of intoning, I see no possibility for the study of music as a dialectical formation, nor of its dynamic essence, for music is above all an intonational art. The very concept of tone, the basic concept of music, indicates, by its very nature, the inevitability of understanding music through the perception of sounds which are purposefully conjugated through the sensing of their pitches. But, meanwhile, the study of the dynamic properties of musical material is still very poorly understood. People most
often perceive individual features of "flowing" music, or, more precisely, they experience their impressions from these features. The whole, i.e., the composition, escapes them. Musicians usually listen, checking themselves their successes and mistakes--as to whether the manner in which they have been accustomed to compose corresponds to the manner in which the author of a given composition composes. With those of more gifted natures, the analysis of sound correlations assimilated by their ear dominates over the formal style; they are already able to realize, and to admit into their horizon a wider circle of musical phenomena, but they are usually the phenomena of the past. Only the next stage, the ability to perceive music as a dialectical formation in the interconditionality of sound correlations, changeable in conformity to place, time, epoch, and properties of the media of reproduction, makes it possible to evaluate, not only common and well-known combinations of sounds, but music as a great cultural heritage.

The development of habits of musical perception does not at all signify the cultivation of "new art" as new sonorities at any price, but leads to the cognition of music through the study of the principles which build forms and organize the life of music at all levels. The musician must hear and evaluate the intonations of twelfth century organum, archaic heterophony, and the instrumental
fabric of the music of the seventeenth century lutenists; he must perceive folk creation, not with a view toward the esthetic selection of beautiful themes, but as music of a concrete social environment, constantly changing in its formations. Dynamism rules high and low in music; its development flows dialectically and purposefully; its constructive norms are conditioned, not at all by visual, but primarily by aural and motor sensations. At no point is music led by theorists and textbooks, with their "do's and "don'ts", but, at the same time, at no point, can music evade the influence of the relations of production, on which everything depends, for it is one of the sensitive spheres of activity of the human consciousness, and consciousness is the relation of man to the reality by which it--this consciousness--is conditioned.

In its attempt to understand music as a system of dialectical motion, contemporary musicology involuntarily strives to go out beyond the limits of obsolescent, "static" (a heritage of an old esthetic) terminology. This is a critical stumbling block, especially perceptible when one translates the data from analysis of the forms in which musical motion occurs into the language of ideas. Any new philosophical direction, naturally, seeks definitions adequate for its newly conceived thought. The definitions flutter in the air; instinct says that they are necessary. Contemporaries, participating in the same
sphere of ideology, assimilate convenient practical generalizations. Successive generations, if they accept part of the "intellectual capital" from the preceding ones, take their terms, but shade them in new ways. By whom, where, and when, was the concept of musical classicism precisely defined? But this concept simplified for hundreds of thousands of people the possibility of passing on their thoughts. If we take old textbooks of music and rummage there in the definitions, we will discover that, before they became rational formulae, their meaning was caught at once by anyone who used them in his own time. In speaking of the inaccuracy of definitions, I have in mind static definitions--definitions of a formal, rather than a dialectical, esthetic.

Each term in an art, if it is vital, is without fail something mobile and changeable, more the coexistence of mutually contradictory tendencies, than a precisely limited measure of "eternal truth." The definition of the correlations of one or another set of factors, and the functions which are peculiar to a given totality of phenomena and to the observed properties of material are too important to be identified by ossified, verbal designations. A definition lives so far as it economizes words, helping immediately, through one concept, to denote and distinguish from others a fact or a complex of phenomena which is under investigation. For that reason, before arguing
about the necessity or uselessness of recently created concepts such as melos, intonation, linearity, tension, gravitation, tonality, atonality, etc., it is necessary to understand their genesis. Perhaps subsequently some of these terms will turn out to be superflous, but now they are necessary in order to pick out what is new in the content of musicology and to delineate this new within the old. What kinds of phenomena and attitudes are united by these defining words? It is not at all a matter of an intentionally destructive policy in relation to the old terms, but rather of their insertion into a new, more generalizing circle of definitions. While dialectically opposing to one another the concepts of "vertical" and "horizontal," contemporary musical thought does not at all wish to drive out the concept of the chord or of harmony as a system of chords. It wants to say that, of the two common coordinates by which the place and function of a given complex of sound are determined as if in a certain acoustical space, the vertical establishes the simultaneous sounding together of several tones, while the horizontal states a succession of tones in time. It is clear that within the concept of the vertical are included the medieval fauxbourdon, the simplest complexes of "note against note," the ninth chord links of Debussy, and the chorale from the manual of Rimski-Y-Korsakov. The concept of "harmony," as a whole, associated with the
system of relationships within the two modes of the
twelve tonalities, does not contain within itself all the
variety of occurrence of verticality.

Let us take the concept of "melos." I would recall
that it rose in my consciousness in 1917, when I considered
how to define that quality of music or musical formation
in the occurrence of which the interchange of pitches, not
as separate "points," but in their interconditionality
and their interconnection through "breathing," appears as
the chief operating force. The familiar concept, melody,
has long been associated with limited forms of the occur­
rence of music, and has not served to unify all the
properties and possibilities of melodic formation. After
a while the concept "melos" flared up in Germany, and has
now become widely disseminated. This concept embodies the
quality and functions of melodic formation; it is the
catchword of music which is vital, real, emotionally re­
sponsive, in contrast to currents of effeminate estheti­
cism or conservative Philistinism and academicism. Melos,
first of all, includes that which is primary in music--
melodiousness, connectedness, and dynamic quality, but
dynamic quality, not in the sense of accentuated, sepa­
rate shades of the force of sound, but as the operation
of forces which condition the sound experienced in the
correlations of pitches, in the purposeful interchange of
tones, and in their conjugation. In other words, in
contemporary musicology the concept of dynamics and the dynamic quality is not limited by the force and gradation of a stroke, insufflation, or friction (the objective moment of realization), but emphasizes, above all, the transition of quantity (the correlation of pitches as the sum of a certain number of oscillations) into quality (changes of the relationships or degrees of intensity of a sounded tone), which is an objective characteristic of the process of musical formation at any given moment.

Kurth's monumental works on linear counterpoint and the crisis of Romantic harmony have finally brought into common usage a whole series of dynamic definitions of musical phenomena which have replaced the earlier, static, formal terms. Contemporary musicology strives toward the formation of terms which would reflect, not a crystallized and congealed property, but a living process, the very formation of the phenomena to be defined. In music nothing exists outside aural experience. For that reason, not a single definition can arise from "mute", abstract premises, lying outside the material of music, but only from the concrete perception of that which sounds. In other words, the recognition of music as the movement of sound in the intonational and rhythmic formation of the forces which organize it becomes the basic premise of contemporary musical terminology.

From this premise, there inevitably arises the concept
of intonation as the actual basis, or as the realization of sound, whether within the hearing, with the voice, or with the help of an instrument. Intonation does not merely signify the mechanical overcoming of the resistance of material, and is not merely the passive reproduction of visually projected marks. Thus, intonation is a factor of the highest degree of importance—the interpretation of sound and not the simple ascertainment of deviation from the norm (the pure or impure presentation of sound). Without intoning and apart from intoning there is no music. The intonation of speech is the interpretation of sounds not musically fixed, not stabilised in musical spaces nor in the invariable relations of sounds which have become tones. Musical intonation is the interpretation of sounds already placed in a system of sound relations precisely fixed by the memory—a system of tones and tonalities.

Music as art began from that moment when people had mastered useful sound manifestations ("signals") in mutual contact, and when these manifestations of sound were deposited in the memory as constant, basic relations of two or more intoned elements. Thus, even the simplest musical intonation presupposes the presence of two features, a sound manifestation, and the relation of this sound manifestation to the following one. This succeeding sound
manifestation enters into a series of relations\textsuperscript{1} with the preceding one. Consequently, any musical presentation of sound, in order to become an intonation, cannot remain isolated; it is either the result of an already given correlation, or it evokes by its appearance a subsequent sound, for only then does musical motion occur with all its characteristics.

How is this motion perceived? Any cognition is a comparison. The process of perceiving music is a process of comparing and distinguishing repeated and contrasting features. The assimilation and memorization of music is based on this activity of the consciousness. It is not enough to hear in general (i.e., not to be deaf) in order to listen to music and to assimilate it, even in the most primitive forms. One intonation, having evoked another, is compared with it in relation to similarity and difference. A feature of absolute identity yields only

\textsuperscript{1}An intonational relation contains three essential factors of melodic formation: distance (the Distanz-Prinzip), direction (the limits of pitch) and melodiousness (the distribution of the force of breathing in the given sound correlation; i.e., a factor of a dynamic order), the degree of which is conditioned by the other two factors. Having employed the concept of intonation, up till now, only in connection with epithets (accurate, false, pure, impure), as indicative of a deviation from the norm in intoning, musicologists and theorists have, in essence, defined the qualities and properties of the phenomenon, while absolutely ignoring the phenomenon itself.\textsuperscript{x228}
repetition, in which it is possible to see a fundamental principle of a musical form; we see that any intonation, in order to be assimilated, demands its recurrence. After repetition (whether a certain number or only twice—in the given instance it does not alter the matter), any smallest deviation from identity intensifies the feature of intonational comparison and leads to a feeling of contrast. This stage permits a more developed musical motion, or rather, creates the possibility for such development. But, because musical identity is not a self-contained equality, a + a gives rise to a + a + b. Comparison demands a return to a, from which arises a + a + b + a. This series may be further complicated. According to the level of aural development, the recurrences of a may not be so periodically obligatory, but under all conditions the meaning of the whole process of intoning remains the same; through comparison and the recognition of identity and contrast the consciousness perceives the further actuation of sounds.

In primitive cultures, since the experiences and the entire practice of intoning occur orally, repetition or motion from an initial impetus and features of identity (the recognition of similarity) predominate as basic features over features of contrast; otherwise the memory would not be able to crystallize the unstable process of
sounding. We will notice that an improvisational manner of progression, based on combinations and permutations of melodic formations (popevki)\(^{229}\) which are assimilated by the memory in every feature of aural development, is inherent in all music of the oral tradition (folk creation). The primary relations of identical and non-identical sounds, fixed by the memory in the struggle for existence and with utilitarian aims, have now become crystallized sound conjugations, i.e., forms. Any fixed interval is already an intoned form, for there is a relation of two elements of a certain system, even the very simplest binomial. Even if stable tones are placed, each as an individual sound, regarded as self-sufficient, they are heard only as members of a relation (whether to a preceding or subsequent member, does not play a role), for, as it was already explained, separate, isolated sounds do not exist in music.\(^{230}\)

The motion of music, perceived in the process of being intoned (music is perceived by the eyes only by musical "architects", those who measure visual projections of musical formation, not concerning themselves with the music by which these projections are generated), is coordinated in two directions—"horizontal" and "vertical." These have already been mentioned. But it is necessary to forewarn of one essential danger; neither concept should be accepted wholly as a visual projection. Music flows in time, and is distributed in space adapted to its transmission or in
vibrating space. It was not the motion of the melody on the staff, up and down, which gave rise to the feeling of this motion as horizontal, but, rather, from the concept of the horizontal, the visual fixation of melody as a line came into being.

The concept of horizontal as a melodic formation led to the insertion of new terms: line, design, linear, focal point, mode, melodic fabric, etc. It was necessary to divert thought from the customary, narrowly scholastic associations connected with the terms, melody, voice, counterpoint, tonic, note, etc.

But there are, in essence, grounds for this representation. The concepts of line and design suggest a feeling of plasticity in melodic motion and its direction; they impart a nuance of independence to the motion of the voice and, very importantly, stimulate dynamic perception of the musical horizontal as incessantly changeable—now thickening, now thinning, now full, now spare, now like a muscle, expanding and contracting, now a single-line unison, now giving off a sprout of a "supporting voice," now serene, now tortuous. Each melodic line is conditioned by breathing (of the human voice or an instrument), i.e., by a certain coefficient indicating the maximum durations and extents of intonations in relation to a given reserve of breath, a given length of bow, the smooth motion of the hand, etc. The concept of melodic line, and
and the epithet linear, in this sense, expand the substance of ideas about the durations, the dynamics, and the extent of a melody, not limiting it by a certain number of measures, by the borders of phrases and motives, by poetic metrics, and especially not by measure boundaries and beat accents. In a word, in order to liberate the melodic principle in musical thought from alien analogies (period, phrase), which had a numbing effect on it, it was necessary to utilize concepts which would not connect such thinking with predetermined theses of formal esthetics and theory. For example, the epithet linear points up the essence of polyphonic formation and organization in music and liberates the idea of this process from utilitarian, scholastic dogmatism. In other words, this epithet, and also the concept of linearity in relation to the technique of polyphony, underscore the independence of the voice or melodic line from any sort of harmonic postulates, without, however, completely repudiating them. In relation to polyphonic composition as a whole, these concepts affirm the final conditionality of its texture, by means of an interlacement of voices, not by a succession of separate chords or a single tonal connection. 231

The necessity for the concept of a focal point is equally clear. This is not a new concept. The assimilation of the intonational systems of the entire East, of the ancient Mediterranean culture, of Gregorian monophony,
and of all the music of the oral tradition would be unthinkable without this concept. In part, subordinate concepts, such as consonance and tonic, as factors which establish equilibrium and close motion, are included, but the concept itself embraces a much wider circle of phenomena. The concept of a focal point is applicable to all the factors which are involved in the process of formation (melos, harmony, coloration), and not just to modal or harmonic successions. As a point of support in any conjugation of sounding elements, the concept of a focal point unifies the whole conceivable variety of musical formation. This is not an abstract quality, accomplished without reference to the sound itself, but is one of the empirically perceptible properties of sound manifestation. The focal point is not necessarily the tonic, for, of course, the "final" tones of the medieval modes are focal points. A focal point is not merely a consonance, because it is a concept from the area of musical kinetics and dynamics, and not from acoustics nor from the study of intervals, but a consonance may be a focal point. Let us take the simplest kind of psalmody (a reading or recitation on one tone with deviation into tones lying nearby and a return descent or ascent to the starting point), for example: do (several times repeated), then an ascent to re and a descent to do, do (several times repeated), then a descent to si and an ascent to do. Or if we combine the
descent and the ascent of the voice in the concluding stage, then we have the following arrangement: do (several times repeated), then a descent to si, an ascent to do and higher to re, and a return descent to do.

In these cases, do, each time, is both focal point and center—both the beginning note (point of departure) and, of course, the ending (finalis). If we take a series of such lines, first of all going from do, then from re, from mi, etc., then the result will be a series of systems of three sounds, in which each time the focal point will be shifted: do ... si - do - re - do; re ... do - re - mi - re; mi ... re - mi - fa - mi.

If we take a broader intonational system, the formation of which consists not only of the contact of neighboring tones, but of the transference of the voice into a larger space, for example, the system which is characteristic for the melos of Rimskiĭ Korsakov as in the following examples:

60

or

61
we are confronted with more complex directions of motion and intonational combinations. There occurs, in the first case, a shift of focal points from sol² to sol¹, since there are two systems, do² - sol² and re² - sol¹, united within the octave, sol² - sol¹; in the second case, there is a complicated kind of movement from the given point of support (do²) with a return to it. In both examples the sounds are shown in rhythmically neutral relation to one another (cantus planus!). If we place them in those rhythmic relations which were chosen by Rimski-Korsakov in Snegurochka [The Snow Maiden] and Kitezh, respectively, then the positions of the focal points are further emphasized by the accents. The first of the chosen octaves gives us a characteristic example of an archaic intonational formula, the dynamic (the conjugation of forces operating within it) of which is conditioned by the movement or shift of the voice from one division of the octave into another. The first feature is the oscillation or selection between two of the tones of the given systems of fifths; the second feature is the establishment of the voice on the upper point of the octave series, which is, however, not yet felt as an octave; the third feature is the return to the intonational starting point (do² : re²); and the fourth feature is the final selection and stabilization on sol¹. If we designate the feature of comparison, or selection between do and re by the letter a, and the
touching of the octave--b₂ and b¹, then we obtain the series a + b² + a + b¹. Why sol¹, and not fa¹ or la¹? Because the "aim" of the given series of intonations, or system, crystallized in the given process of formation, is the octave with its two divisions ("coupled fifths") emphasized. If we recall what has been said about intonation, then it is easy to see the phases of formation in this process, which are essential for the occurrence and realization of music; the moment of pushing off (the point of departure and the establishment by the next tone of a condition of instability), repetition or return to the starting point, comparison of two or several intonational features, the final choice or selection between them, as a result of which the form comes into being.

Form, as the exposure of contradictions, and as the result of comparison and selection of a sum of intonations in the act of comprehension, must include all correlations of the system selected. Thus, if the given system is the combining of two fifths (do² - sol², re² - sol¹), then the voice, having taken both members of the division of the octave (do² and re²) and the top point of the series, sol², inevitably must take sol¹ also, because only then, the entire, selected system as an intonational unity will sound (will be exposed) in the final summation.*

Thus, the composition which is perfect and complete in form will be that in which the sound relations which
make up the given, selected system of intonations are revealed as much as possible in their logical connection. But does this mean all or merely some sound relations? Let us take a piece in C major. If, in the final summation, neither the tones g, nor f nor b occur among its intonations, will its tonal form be C major? Of course not, for C major is an octave system, and f and g are points of division of this octave. As for b that tone in the correlation si - do, most insistently defines this octave structure as the tonality, C major.

Thus, it is obvious that if not all, then at least some relations which are essential to the given system must inevitably enter into the form which is finally tonally crystallized as a result of these intonations.²

Here we come to the concept of tension and gravitation. It is difficult to deny that, in the perception of music, we experience processes which are analogous to conditions of attraction and striving, alternating with sensations of more or less satisfaction and a feeling of equilibrium or "discharge". If one has no such response, we can only infer that he is insensitive to the

²I steadfastly maintain that form is exposed and experienced only in the motion of music itself, in the process of its formation, but it is conceived by our consciousness, or fixed in it as a unity of relations, post factum, as the grasp of what has been heard.
emotionally dynamic nature of music. But is it possible to expect that these feelings always determine the phenomenon of gravitation in music, i.e., that the conditions of instability, which are perceptible in it, are accounted for and conditioned exclusively by emotional factors? There is no doubt that music became a language, a sphere of the expression of feelings, and a manifestation of thought, as it is now perceived, under the influence of a series of stimuli which were not at all limited to those of an emotional order, although to deny the influence of the contrasts of feelings experienced by man on the organization of musical phenomena seems to me impossible. However, systems of intoning, which have been justified by the experience of centuries, undoubtedly possess immanent properties of organization (which continuously "readjust" to reality,\(^{234}\) as the highest criteria of their significance or force of influence).

The immanently musical concepts of gravitation and tension permit a completely satisfactory interpretation, of course, only as a hypothesis. Music is an art of motion revealed in intonations. It is mainly a motor art; consequently, it is realized in time. But, in so far as this motion is neither an end in itself nor an abstraction, but is the exposure to the ear of one kind of energy conversion, to that extent, the feeling that the resistance
of the generating material of music must be overcome in some degree is unavoidable. Each of the intonational systems which form the music of different peoples and generations, up to that moment when it is fixed in the consciousness of the mass of people as a completed, familiar system of relations with the multi-significance peculiar to it, and after it is rationalized in the form of a sound series, a scale, or some other formula, passes through a long stage of organization (adaptation and selection). In this stage there are intonations, or phases of motion which are, with greater or lesser ease or difficulty, assimilated by the environment. Since there is no motion without the overcoming of resistance in material, these stages and phases, reduced to a system and crystallized, still preserve traces of the whole process of their organization, and each intonational system retains its expressiveness and lives, as long as the ear

3This prolonged assimilation is perfectly observed in the study of medieval music, in the processes or stages of formation of the European modes and the attempts at crystallizing tonal bases which preceded them; it is further observed in the gradual consolidation of cadences, in the differentiation of the dynamic significance of each of the tones which make up a mode, in the conversion of the melodic (smooth) motion of the bass voice into a harmonic basso continuo, etc. All of this was determined, finally, by social reality, but the internal history of its development occurred in a succession of gradual reorganizations and mutations.*235
senses in it these features, these stages in which the resistibility of the material is overcome. When these features disappear, the system of intonation ceases to "touch the ear" and becomes an absolutely neutral stream of sound. All sound correlations in it are effaced; it ceases to have any sort of social value. It is possible, if one continues to compose with this system, to concoct various sound combinations with great dexterity, but there will no longer be any feeling of the dynamics of sound motion. The ear becomes accustomed to an endless series of repetitions of the same intonational formulae, and ceases to react to them. In other words, intonational habits acquired through several generations gradually become blunted, and the associations and semantics connected with them (for example, F major as the sphere of the pastorale quality) expose their conditional nature.

I make only this reservation; such a consistent process of "eradication" and "renovation" can be conceived only in an epoch in which the relations of production are altered comparatively little. In the case of a sharp change of the latter, even those intonations which are "in their full flowering", may be cut-off from the consciousness, as not conforming to the new structure of society. It is necessary to keep this in mind. The so-called seconda-pratica[sic.] of the seventeenth century
came to replace the style of Palestrina which had engen-
dered it, not because the latter style had said its last word and could develop no further, but because it had to be stabilized, for the societal factors which engendered it had "congealed."

Those phenomena in the process of intoning which may be characterized as sensations of various degrees of tension and gravitation are evoked by the dynamism of sound motion and by the necessity for more or less expenditure of the forces which organize this motion as it is exposed, for the material of music possesses both elasticity, on one hand, and the capacity for dissipation, on the other, because of its instability. The time period, from the first intoning by someone of some sound relation (its discovery or invention), through its assimilation by the social environment which evoked it and then its rational explanation, to an endless number of repetitions of this relation in the musical practice of many generations, does not yield to a precise determination. We may, however, take as an example the whole-tone scale in the nineteenth century; the course from its employment by Glinka, Liszt, and Dargomyzhskii, to its wide use by Debussy and the Impressionists, then its assimilation and use by the majority of composers, to the point of satiety, required little time; but for the achievement of stable thirds, centuries were required, just as also for the formation
of a rational and, seemingly, simple system of tonal relations. In its turn, within this tonal system, the sphere of the "tritone" was such an intensive demonstration of the resistance of material (in other words, the difficulty of intoning), that it continues to the present time to be the strongest unstable relation in the European tonal system, and the most striking factor of organization in terms of its dynamics and its disequilibrium; that is to say, it is the strongest impulse toward motion. Therefore, anyone who composes in the European tonal system, in its Classical stage, must without fail feel the "tritone" as the most unstable relation. If he does not feel this, it means his ear has either gone out beyond the bounds of this system of relations, or else it has not yet developed up to it. Anyone who does not already feel the significance of the tritone, the significance of the leading tone, the significance of the dominant, and still wants to compose in such, and only in such a classical tonal system, may become an able and skillful stylizer, who is committed to reckon with all the relations peculiar to the given system, but he will not be a composer in full measure, for music demands truth of expression. This is why, in musical creation, any initial invention, any new intonation, found for the first time, any new, sound correlation, publicly exposed, is so sharply and keenly perceived, and why epigonism or borrowing strikes one
so unpleasantly. The intonation found for the first time, or the resistance of material overcome for the first time, serves to inaugurate musical motion along a given line; it is motion in which inertness does not yet dominate, and the dynamic feature is not yet lost. Later, there begins an assimilation of the intonations and the acquisition of the new practice by the environment because of its expressive qualities, first of all reluctantly, then willingly. Finally, the intonation enters into universal use; then it gradually ossifies. At any given moment in a given social situation, in different strata of the population, relatively different intonations enjoy popularity; for one class, certain intonations die out or become symbols of bad taste, while for still another class they are sound correlations which have been barely assimilated for the first time. Let us take again a simple example. At the end of the nineteenth century, some song intonations began to sound new and fresh to the Russian intelligentsia, while, among the people, they had already lost their attractiveness and, as a result of the changing structure of village life, were rejected by the townsfolk as cheap tunes, influenced by the music of the street and tavern. Of course, this situation was actually

[^4]: I recall the reservation on a previous page [cf., 347-48].
somewhat more complex and the chastushkas, which replaced the dosyulnye songs, were a more organic formation. But the essence of this process, this search by the people for new intonations, more conformable to a changed environment and a different tempo of life, was the same—the rejection of habitual, archaic sound correlations which had lost their expressiveness.

Thus, such concepts as focal point, gravitation, tension, discharge, contraction, and expansion, are conditioned by the objective properties and manifestations of the quality of musical motion, by its dynamic nature, and not at all by subjective notions. These concepts and others introduced earlier, unite, not only all correlations of the tonic-dominant system and its doctrine of intervals and their resolution, but also all earlier systems of intonations and all those which may yet arise, for there can be no "indifferent," dynamically neutral musical motion; its existence would signify an incredible triumph over the material, over the properties of acoustical phenomena, and their transformation into some sort of neutral matter, no longer evoking either stimulation, nor reaction.

The concept of intonation as the interpretation of sound correlations in the process of sounding, assumes societal conditionality or social justification, as the
highest criterion of any musical phenomenon. The ear becomes the measure of things in music. There are no abstract architectonics, no abstract, visual form-schemes. It is clear that, in connection with this concept, melos is still further advanced, both as an essential element of music, and as the most important intonational sphere. Melos unifies everything which concerns the formation of music, its fluidity, and its extent. From melos is born the idea of the horizontal. As an intonational sphere, this concept decisively unites all manifestations of horizontalness: in a drawling song, in a measured dance melody, in declamatory intonations, in ornamentation or a supporting voice, in the thematic and leitmotif area, in the specific melody of the Italian opera (i.e., that which is chiefly called melody), etc. Thus, melody turns out to be a particular case of the occurrence of melos, or simply a technical term. Melos is peculiar not only to melodics or to the polyphonic style. Melos permeates the sound fabric as a whole. In several of its sections, Wagner's Tristan is a sphere of melos in the harmonic context because the homophonic harmony here becomes an uninterrupted line and the vertical is dissolved in this head-long, linear torrent. On the other hand, there are many contrapuntal works entirely devoid of melos, and turning out as a succession of separate verticals, without the
principle of melodic formation to unify them. To them, the progression of the sound fabric through changes of horizontally measurable sound distances (melodic intervals), which condition uninterrupted alterations of this fabric, is alien.

In conclusion, it is necessary to dwell on the connection of the concepts of melos and intonation with the figurative content revealed in music. Each epoch works out in operatic, symphonic, and song creation, a certain sum of "symbolic" intonations (sound complexes). These intonations spring up in invariable conjunction with poetic images and ideas, with concrete sensations (visual or muscular-motor), or with the expression of affects and various emotional conditions, i.e., in mutual "coexistence" with these factors. Thus extremely strong associations are formed, which are not inferior to meaningful verbal semantics. A sound image—an intonation which has taken on the significance of a visual image or concrete sensation—evokes an accompanying idea. It is not necessary to cite examples; even the Venetian opera, then the French cantata and opera of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, and finally the Romantic opera and program music of the nineteenth century, all testify to this phenomenon in a thoroughly obvious manner. Gluck, when revising the Italian edition of his Orfeo for the French stage, had not only to consider the demands of another language in
relation to the vocal parts, but had also to modify some-
what the instrumental fabric with a view to attaining more
picturesqueness to conform to certain intonational,
figurative "cliches" which were common for the French
lyric-tragedy of that time.

Several Wagnerian figurative formulae (for example,
the forest, fire, etc.) entered into the flesh and blood
of European music. In Russian music also there have
been "current" formulae or "cliches" for the sea, winter
snowstorms, and other images, and also for the East, Spain,
etc.

To all these phenomena a definition is usually given
which is far from peculiar to them--musical symbolism.
"Symbol," "symbolic," "symbolism," are terms and epithets
which divert the thought from concrete reality. But,
what we have before us is actually the process of con-
cretization [emphasis added by translator] of musical
images and the transformation of music into living
figurative speech, full of significance. It seems to me
that it would be correct to reject decisively the concept
of "musical symbolism" because there is nothing symbolic
in the phenomena described here. It is much more to the
point and more correct to employ the terminology of
linguistics, and, in all cases, in which there is a close
connection of music with surrounding reality through
definitely figurative intonations, to attribute this connection to the area of musical semantics,*241 as the expression of a completely practical interrelation. Both for the study of musical content, and for the establishment of the interaction between verbal speech and musical intonations (as correlations and as a process for exposing music), the study, analysis, and some sort of systematization of the manifestations of musical semantics would be extremely valuable, and plainly necessary, basic data. From musical symbolism (again one of the heritages of the formal esthetic), however, there is no bridge to living musical and verbal intonation because of the abstractness of the term.
COMMENTARY

BOOK I
Notes from pages 185-95 of translation

*1 The preposition "against" (protiv) appears as an editorial insertion in the 1963 edition. The reason for its omission in the original is not altogether clear. However, in view of the grammatical declension of the noun, the omission is less critical than it would be in the (English translation). In the original form (without the preposition) the phrase could be translated "... a reflected protest of that same system..." 

*2 The reference here is, of course, to the dialectical concept of Marxism, which is to say the Hegelian dialectic.

*3 A Soviet editorial note directs us to Supplement 2 (pp. 562-63 of the present translation), to the discussion of "figurative content."

*4 But cf., Asaf'ev's subsequent rejection of the term "musical semantics," in the opening section of Volume II (p. 608).

*5 Asaf'ev's use of the word inertia here and elsewhere implies an analogy with the physical principle of inertia of a moving body (the tendency of a body to continue moving until force is exerted to stop it). This is a variation of the reference to musical perception proceeding "along the line of least resistance" (cf., p. 189, supra).

*6 This is an obvious paraphrase of the Darwinian concept of biological evolution, undoubtedly included as an attempt to emphasize the cumulative evolutionary nature of music in its historical development. This implied analogy is quite consistent with the Marxian concept of process.

*7 This three-stage outline of musical motion is subsequently discussed at some length (cf., p. 265 ff.; infra).
Notes from pages 196-202.


*9The Russian term sozvuchie (literally, "sounding with": so- = with + zvuchanie = sounding [cf., Latin, con- + sonans]), used here, is defined, both in *Entsiklopedicheskii muzykal'nyi slovar'* [Encyclopedic Musical Dictionary], hereafter designated *EMS*, ed. G. V. Keldysh, comp. B. S. Shteinpress and I. M. Yampol'skii (Moscow: State Scientific Press, 1959), p. 251, col. 2, and A. Dolzhanskii, *Kratkii muzykal'nyi slovar'* [Short Musical Dictionary], hereafter designated *KMS* (Leningrad: "Muzyka," 1964), p. 324, as the simultaneous combination of two or more sounds. Asaf'ev's usage here and elsewhere, however, is clearly intended to designate individual sounds or tones within a relationship, which most often must be understood (from the context) as consecutive (horizontal) rather than simultaneous (cf., n. *40, infra*).

*10A Soviet editorial note informs us that Asaf'ev's intentions are preserved in a conspectus for a study under the title, *Krest'yan'skoe pesennoe iskusstvo* [Art of the Peasant Song], although partial treatment of the subject appeared in the articles, "Krest'yan'skoe iskusstvo Severa [Peasant Art of the North], "Problemy sotsiologii iskusstva [Problems of the Sociology of Art]" (1st issue; Leningrad: "Academia," 1926); pp. 175-83, and "Na rekakh (Iz put'evykh nablyudeni) [On the Rivers (From Travel Observations)]," *Muzika i Revolyutsiya* [Music and Revolution], No. 12 (1926), pp. 34-35. The text of a
The "drawling song" (protyazhnaya pesnya) is a style of Russian folk-song characterized by smoothly flowing melodic lines and rhythms governed by the text and the performer's breathing (discussed in James Bakst, A History of Russian-Soviet Music [New York: Dodd, Mead & Company, 1966], pp. 14-15). Its subject matter normally deals with various personal discontents, sorrow, or nostalgia, somewhat akin to the textual content of the American "Blues." Gerald R. Seaman (who prefers to translate protyazhnaya as "protracted" rather than "drawling") distinguishes between the "protracted lyrical song" (conforming to the description given above) and a kind of historical song, characteristic of central and southern Russia from the fifteenth century, which was variously called protyazhnaya or doselnaya (a regional term meaning "old" or "former") pesnya (song), employing a similar musical style. The text of the latter, however, dealt with some historical event in a comparatively accurate way. It was distinguished from the earlier northern Russian bylina or starina (epic ballad, which tended to a more imaginative treatment of history, incorporating elements of legend and mythology (cf., "Folk Song [Russian]," Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians, ed. Eric Blom and Denis Stevens, 5th ed., Vol. X (Supplemental Volume), pp. 161, col. 1-163, col. 2.

*12 The following references are supplied by a Soviet editorial note:

I.A. Braudo, "Artikulyatsiya [Articulation]," Leningrad: Muzgiz, 1961);

I.A. Brando, "K voprosii o logike bakhovskogo yazyka [On the Question of the Logic of Bach's Language]," Muzykoznanie [Musicology] (Leningrad: "Academia," 1928);

A. Schering, Musikalische Bildung und Erziehung zum Musikalischen Hören (Leipzig: Quelle & Meyer, 1911);

A. Schering, "Vom musikalischen Vortrage," Jahrbuch der Musikbibliothek Peters, XXXVII (1930).
Notes from pages 205-218

*13 It is important to keep in mind here Asaf'ev's definitions of form, given at the beginning of the book (e.g., the "... means ... for revealing music" [p. 184 supra] or "the organization ... of musical material" [p. 185 supra]. Thus, "form," as Asaf'ev employs it here, is taken to mean any aspect of the presentation of music (including those governed by the physical properties of the instrument on which it is to be performed). Idiomatic English usage would most likely phrase this thought, "... they will differ in the treatment of the material," or "... in the character of the music," in which case, of course, Asaf'ev's point would be lost.

*14 The terms "inertness" (inertnost'), implying unresponsiveness or sluggishness and a general lack of motion, and "inertia" (inertsiya), suggesting mechanical momentum or unrestrained, undirected motion (cf., n. *5, supra), are not identical in meaning; however, Asaf'ev, in his usage of the two terms here and in the pages following does not always make this distinction clear.

*15 Use of the term "organic" (organichen) in this context seems inappropriate unless it is understood in terms of a more or less spontaneous (natural) arrangement of material. The subsequent discussion makes clear that it is not to be understood in terms of a purposeful development.

*16 The use of the term "irritants" seems a bit overstated. The obvious intent is to imply a reflexive reaction and to suggest a view of the listener as an "organism," thus attempting to convey an impression of pseudo-scientific legitimacy to the discussion.

*17 This reference to the relations of production and the development of music paralleling economic evolution is an example of Asaf'ev's "vulgar-sociological" digressions, as noted in the "Introduction," p. 108.

*18 It may be noted that the repetition in an upper voice (from m. 3 of the example) of the descending line originally found in the lowest voice is marked by some alteration. Additional semitones (provided by the addition of the E# and D natural) are inserted, (serving, perhaps, to compensate for the omission of the octave changes of the original), and the drop of a third, from D# to B, is
Notes from pages 217-222

filled by the appearance of $C^\#$.

$^{19}$The terms "inverted" and "inversion" are understood here in the sense of invertible counterpoint—that is, a change in the relative positions of two lines of music by octave transpositions—rather than in the sense of inversion by contrary motion. The passage in question is found in mm. 341-48 of the Overture.

$^{20}$The fragment in question is more accurately designated as a three-note motive, derived from the opening measure of the main theme.

$^{21}$Asaf'ev's description of the example (mm. 349-57) is grossly oversimplified. The passage following the "inverted repetition" (cf. n. $^{19}$, supra) is properly designated as a sequential treatment of the three-note opening motive (cf., n. $^{20}$, supra) with a descending whole-tone accompaniment, rather than merely a "transposed repetition." Asaf'ev's "stretto run" (mm. 365-77) is made up of a two-measure ascending pattern (the three-note motive and its altered sequential repetition) followed by a similar descending pattern, introduced in the lower voices. It is imitated in the upper voices two measures later, resulting in the coincidence of the ascending pattern in the upper voices with the descending pattern in the lower, and vice versa. The final seventeen measures consist of a further reinforcement of the tonic by repeated chords and scale passages.

$^{22}$A Soviet editorial note directs attention to n. 7, p. 457 to further clarify Asaf'ev's "generalized designations."

$^{23}$The passage cited occurs at the end of the development section, carrying over into the recapitulation (mm. 157-65), and again in the Coda (mm. 351-59). A similar figure for the tympani alone is found in mm. 466-81. The example sheds no light on Asaf'ev's discussion at this point, and seems out of place in relation both to the previous paragraph and the remainder of the paragraph in which it occurs.

$^{24}$Asaf'ev's offhand citation of this example again does little to clarify his point. He apparently has in mind the development section of the movement, especially mm. 151-232, involving the development of a characteristic motive. His reference to a "correlation at the second"
Notes from pages 222-29

apparently refers to the fact that at several points, in successive treatments of the motive, the octaves within which the motive is contained are in a relation of the second to one another, but the intervallic structure within the motive is altered so that there are several instances of tonal relationships at the third.

*25 Poplarly known as the "Goldberg Variations."

*26 Here, as in a number of cases throughout the book, Asaf'ev's selection and presentation of his musical examples is somewhat equivocal. Contrary to the relative emphasis implied, the fugue subject would seem to illustrate Asaf'ev's points more satisfactorily than the invention motive, as an example both of "symmetrical repetition" and of the filling of a leap with motion by step. Moreover, in view of Asaf'ev's characterization of the forms in which his formula of symmetrical repetition occurs as "extremely varied," the range between the supposed extremes of this variety seems remarkably narrow and limited.

*27 A Soviet editorial note directs attention to a further development of this thought in the second volume of this title (cf., especially, Asaf'ev's designation of this device as one of his four "guiding principles" of intonational analysis, p. 623).

*28 Here Asaf'ev's use of the term "inertia," quite clearly refers to the idea of momentum continuing without resistance (cf., nn. *5 and *14, above).

*29 The description is not consistent with the definition of inertia from which the factor of acceleration would be precluded, as a manifestation of the force of gravity.

*30 Also "episodes."

*31 Also Stimmtausch.

*32 The footnote entries given by Asaf'ev are completed as follows:

M. Brenet [Marie Bobillier], Dictionnaire pratique et historique de la Musique (Paris: A. Colin, 1926); Hugo Riemann, Musikgeschichte in Beispielen (Leipzig: E. A. Seemann, 1912);
Notes from pages 229-41


*33 Asaf'ev employs the Russian terms vozhd' (leader) and sputnik (companion or co-worker).

*34 Asaf'ev's use of the term "theme" as applied to canon, in this passage, is inconsistent with his specific disavowal of such usage a few pages later (cf., n. 6, p.248). In fact, the essence of his concept of theme (one of the areas of consideration of the given chapter, as indicated by its subheadings) is its capacity for development, a quality not required in the canon. The definition of theme recurs in Intonatsiya (cf., p. 626).

*35 The introduction of the concept of energy here is undoubtedly a product of Asaf'ev's enthusiasm for the ideas of Ernst Kurth (cf., "Introduction," pp.167-68). The concept is further developed in the next chapter (cf., pp. 245-60).

*36 Given Asaf'ev's apparent emphasis here on the subject of the D major fugue, it comes as something of a surprise that his subsequent, more detailed analysis is concerned with the C# minor theme instead.

*37 Transposed repetition.

*38 This inappropriate terminology, describing the supertonic as the "upper leading tone," is encountered repeatedly in this work, and is apparently derived from the thoughts of B. L. Yavorskii (cf., "Introduction," p. 172).

*39 It does not seem quite accurate to suggest that the correlation (g:e\textsuperscript{b}) + (f: d) evokes the tonic triad, since as Asaf'ev himself implies just above, the mode is not defined until the complete tonic triad makes its appearance after the correlation in question.

*40 The wording of the parenthetical passage—specifically, the inclusion of the word "simultaneous"—is a further indication of Asaf'ev's concept of consonances
Notes from pages 241-47

(sozvuchiy ([pl.]) as related single tones (cf., n. *9, supra). The passage as a whole is an example of the rather puzzling tendency on Asaf'ev's part to provide alternative expressions or terms parenthetically, resulting in an impression of redundancy. It is probable that the frequency of occurrence of this device indicates Asaf'ev's desire to be thoroughly understood, but the residual effect of many such passages is of a rather patronizing approach to his readers, almost as though he felt he were writing for musical semi-literates.

This passage is not altogether consistent with Asaf'ev's observation on p. 222f. that "the minor variation in the midst of major was perceived in strong relief, and is so perceived now, for ... much which seems stagnant in contemporary music sounds like a daring contrast in music of a different milieu." (emphasis added).


Asaf'ev, in this context, uses the Russian term konsonans (consonance) understood in the normally accepted sense of the word as a simultaneous combination of sounds conveying an impression of stability.

The Marxian implication in this passage, embodied in the discussion of the transformation of quantity into quality, are obvious (cf., "Introduction," p. 120).

Asaf'ev often uses quotation marks without obvious justification, apparently serving the function of italics. The passage also represents another example of Asaf'ev's inappropriate and redundant use of parentheses.

The reference is to a melodic progression from the eighth to the seventh and fifth degrees of the scale, which occurs frequently in Grieg's music (e.g., the opening motive of his a minor Piano Concerto, op. 16). Kristian Lange and Arne Østvedt, in Norwegian Music (London: Dobson Books, Ltd., 1958), p. 34, inform us that this is a characteristic feature of Norwegian folk music.
Notes from pages 247-52

*48 Sozvuchiya. Commentary on subsequent occurrences of the term consonance or consonances in the translation will not be made except in cases in which the meaning is not reasonably clear in context.

*49 The obvious attempt here and in the subsequent passages to link musical motion with the definition of "work" drawn from physics, is not particularly successful.

*50 The foregoing discussion appears to owe more to Ostwald's concept of "energetics" than to Kurth's, reflecting a somewhat more universal application of the concept than is characteristic for the latter. In the final analysis, the interpretation of this concept is Asaf'ev's own, reflecting an underlying materialistic base which is inconsistent with the thought of either Ostwald or Kurth. Although Asaf'ev employs Kurth's terminology ("potential" and "kinetic" energy) his usage differs considerably from the latter's. Asaf'ev's references to "emotional experience" as a form of energy, and intonational energy," however contrived these expressions may appear to be, do serve to point up his emphasis on the factor of human participation and communication and his view of perception as the ultimate stage of musical intonation, thus distinguishing his concept from the idealistically oriented views of the other two scholars (cf., "Introduction," p. 170).

*51 Although the d♯ in the passage cited does give an effect in context of leading down by scale step to the tonic, the use of the term "upper leading tone" still seems arbitrary and inappropriate, this progression in no way approximating the urgency conveyed by motion to the tonic from the leading tone a semitone below.

*52 The suspension under discussion is found in the lowest voice in mm. 8-9; thus Asaf'ev's characterization of it as "similar to the preceding ones (measures 4-5, 6-7, 8-9 [emphasis added])" is confusing. The suspension in question is clearly a sequential repetition of the one immediately preceding it (mm. 6-7) but displays significant differences from the one in mm. 4-5. Furthermore, Asaf'ev's expressions, "inertia of motion" and "a 'recoil' downward," intended as mutually inclusive in this context, seem to be rather contradictory concepts to apply to the descending motion after the resolutions, in mm. 7 and 9, of the two related suspensions.
Asaf'ev seems to be saying here that the accurate perception, in context, of dynamic devices employed in the music of the past is not automatically achieved, but requires a conscious predisposition on the part of the modern listener. This passage, like the passage on pp. 242-43 (also cf., n. *41, supra), has the effect of weakening Asaf'ev's earlier assertion (cf., p.222f) that our hearing responds to the dynamic factors of the past, even those which would be regarded as static in contemporary usage.

This passage represents a peculiarly Marxist interpretation in musical history, of the profound influence of Beethoven, a product of the Classical Period, on the musical composition of the Romantic Period which followed and superseded his period.


Translator's license has been exercised here in reversing Asaf'ev's word order ('"closing and braking") which is contrary to the normal sequence of events.

Asaf'ev employs the Russian term napev, rather than the more obvious cognate melodiya. It is interesting that the definition of napev (EMS, p. 175, col. 2) designates it as a specifically vocal melody, even though in Asaf'ev's context it seems clear that he has the instrumental form in mind. This usage is consistent, however, with his stress throughout the book on song-like quality as an obligatory feature of music.

The term used here, pripev, also normally carries a vocal connotation.

Medieval dance songs of the kind which Gustave Reese designates as "rondel-type" (Music in the Middle Ages [New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 1940], p. 221), which are characterized by a recurring refrain. The khorovod, an ancient Russian form of round dance, is discussed in Seaman, op. cit., p. 161, col. 1 p.162, col. 2, and Bakst, op. cit., pp. 242-43. Asaf'ev's supposition that the rondo forms are descended from these
medieval forms (one of which was designated rondeau) is not universally accepted, owing partly to the fact that the distinction between the refrain sections and the verse sections (additamenta) were determined primarily by the text, with the same musical material being employed for both, in the majority of cases. The attempt to make this connection, however, is additional evidence of Asaf'ev's tendency to attribute vocal origins to most instrumental forms.

*61 Asaf'ev's analogy between the rondo refrain and the operatic overtures and entractes as "initial sources" seems a bit finely drawn.

*62 Tone is evidently to be understood in this passage, as synonymous with mode or tonality, that is, the system of relationships which is characteristic for the piece of music in question. The employment of this particular terminology by Asaf'ev appears to be an attempt to draw an analogy between the main body of a musical composition (falling between impetus and cadence) and the tenor which serves the same function in the psalmodizing formula, that of filling the space between initium (impetus) and punctum (cadence: the metrum in the formula corresponds to an internal cadence). The tenor, however, consists of the recitation of the text on a single pitch (tone). The matter is clarified in the subsequent discussion (cf., p. 269), but only after several pages. This literary device, which occurs fairly frequently with Asaf'ev, by which concepts are introduced and only later clarified is reminiscent of his concept of musical "sound-arches," as discussed in the "Introduction" (cf., pp. 101-102).

*63 It seems clear, from this statement that Asaf'ev employs the term "energetic" as virtually a synonym for "dynamic."

*64 The use of the term "semitones" in this context is not only inappropriate (cf., similar references to "upper and lower leading tones," pp. 239 and 251), but patently inaccurate vis-à-vis the interval between d and c.

*65 Asaf'ev uses the Russian term razbeg, literally translated as a "running start" or simply a "run," or as a "take-off run" in the case of an aircraft. The principle involved, in its musical application, is a building of tension and expectancy in an introductory passage,
primarily through increased motion, resulting in a feeling of release and inevitability when the first note of the theme proper is achieved.

*Borodin's opera, Prince Igor', unfinished at his death in 1887, was completed by his friends, Glazunov and Rimskii-Korsakov. It appears that Borodin had never actually written down the overture, but had, in Glazunov's presence, often improvised fragments of themes which he intended to use in the overture. After his death, Glazunov actually composed the overture, based upon these fragments which he had memorized. This anecdote, as told by Asaf'ev, appears in Izbrannye trudy, Vol. III (Moscow: USSR Academy of Science Press, 1954), p. 269.

*Asaf'ev's use of a lower case letter designation here seems intended to indicate that a substantial portion of the section on a C pedal seems most closely to conform to a C minor tonality, though he does not specifically label it as such. His lack of commitment to either major or minor probably stems from the consistent appearance of E-natural in the initial measures of this section. The predominance of B♭ in the upper voices of these early measures, however, suggests a dominant pedal in F, rather than C as an independent, related tonality, in any case.

*There seems to be a little basis for such ambiguity here. The section on A clearly functions in the manner of a dominant pedal.

*Asaf'ev's language suggests that he has in mind, in particular, the tonal theories of Paul Hindemith, later systematized in the latter's Unterweisung im Tonsatz (Mainz: B. Schotts Söhne, 1937) [appearing as The Kraft of Musical Composition, in an English language translation by Arthur Mendel (London: B. Schott & Co., 1942)]. It will be recalled that Hindemith visited the Soviet Union during the NEP period, which could explain Asaf'ev's knowledge of these theories before their publication.


*The designation as "peckings," of some distinctive passages in the Scherzo (second) movement of Borodin's First
Symphony in $E^b$, is attributed to Musorgskii.

*72* This would appear to be a reference to the abrupt, unprepared changes of tonality which characterize much of Prokofiev's music. The theme representing Peter in Peter and the Wolf springs to mind as an obvious example, or the "Gavotte" in his Classical Symphony.

*73* The passage in question (mm. 9-19) is not as clear-cut as Asaf'ev's brief description would lead us to believe. It is first prepared by two four measure passages in tonic and subdominant, respectively, which present the basic pattern--four and one-half beats, alla breve, of half and quarter notes--followed by an ascending and descending scale-wise passage in eighth notes and parallel open octaves. The dominant organ point occurs in measures 9, 10, and the first quarter of 11, sounding in the upper and middle voices over the dominant and submediant triads. This is followed by running, scale-wise, eighth notes in sequential treatment, ascending six steps, then descending four. This results in a gradual ascent (mm. 11-15) from the dominant starting note, A, to $f^\#$ at the interval of a thirteenth above. A descending sequential pattern, consisting of consecutive, descending seconds, each repeated once, follows immediately, with no interruption of the eighth note rhythm. The pattern is broken on the last half of m. 17 by an ascent of three semitones, $C^\#$ to E, resulting from the insertion of a chromatic D$^\#$. This is followed by a diatonic descent to the starting point, A, and another chromatic ascent, this time of five semitones, coming to rest in m. 19 on the tonic, D, with a full triad. The eighth note passage (mm. 11-19), as Asaf'ev implies, is felt as an elaboration of the dominant, A, even though the tone A does not actually sound throughout the passage as a pedal point. The passage as a whole describes a large arch, rising from A, its lowest point, and returning to it at the end, with a short chromatic bridge to the tonic. The consistent appearance of G-natural in this passage, however, reminds us that this A is the dominant of D major, rather than a tonic in its own right. The rapid motion, especially in comparison with the longer note values immediately preceding it (mm. 9, 10), and the chromatic passage at the end combine to create the impression of an accumulation of energy. The effect of discharge when the tonic is reached in m. 19 is reinforced by the fact that the main theme does not actually begin till m. 21, after two measures of an accompaniment-like figure on the tonic triad.
A "mutation" in the sense of a change in the character of the music, becoming broader and more expansive. The term "outburst," however, does not seem particularly appropriate, and the parenthetical coupling of the two terms seems especially inapt.

Soviet editorial insertion.

Asaf'ev seems to be guilty of carelessness in his choice of words here, for the point of departure is clearly the dominant, rather than the tonic.

Max Weber (1864-1920), a German economist, turned in later life to the study of sociology and social philosophy. The basic conclusion of his book on music, is that the chordal-harmonic nature of Western or Occidental music demands an extremely rational foundation. The opening section of his book, accordingly, is devoted to an explanation of how the tones of the diatonic scales are derived from the tones of the three principal triads (tonic, dominant, subdominant) of any given tonality. The "distance principle," or, more precisely, the principle of intervallic distance or tone proximity, constitutes his explanation for the presence of "irrational" melodic elements within this chordal-harmonic system. Indeed, the tension resulting from the insertion of melodic intervals, not explained in terms of triads, into this essentially triadic system, provides the principal dynamic element in music, and serves as a medium of expressiveness, offsetting the harmonic rationality.


Notes from pages 286-97

observes that "Social," rather than "Sociological" is the term which properly should have appeared in the title (Ibid., p. 77 [cf., the title of the English language translation]), and elsewhere, characterizes Asaf'ev's theory of intonation (which he describes as a concept "intimated by Rousseau" [p. 95] as too closely linked with linguistic considerations (Ibid.).

*78 Quoted from Knud Jeppesen, Der Palestrinastil und die Dissonanz (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1925), p. 265 (English translation mine. JRT).

*79 The term originated with Yavorskii, who specified, however (as Asaf'ev does not), that these were neighboring semitones (cf., Tsukkerman, "Yavorskii--Teoretik," B. Yavorskii: Vospominaniya, stat' i, pis'ma, ed. D. Shostakovich [Moscow: Muzyka, 1964], p. 184).

*80 Cf., n. *56 (citation of English language translation), supra.

*81 Cf., p. 197.

*82 The use of the term napev, here, although in an instrumental context, is clearly intended to suggest the vocal origin of the cantus firmus (cf., m. *58, supra).

*83 "Tone" is once again to be understood in the sense of a system of relationships, thus as generally equivalent to mode.


*85 Asaf'ev's meaning and even his reason for inserting this reference to Strauss's cadence practice, at this point, is unclear, though a musical illustration could be helpful. The "swelling up" or 'bursting open' from within" may be a reference to Strauss's practice of subjecting more or less traditional cadence formulae to a kind of diversionary chromatic alteration, delaying its ultimate
resolution. It is probable that Asaf'ev is basing this passage on a reading of the article by Roland Tenschert, "Die Kadenzbehandlung bei Richard Strauss: Ein Beitrag zur neuren Harmonik," Zeitschrift für Musikwissenschaft, Vol. VIII, No. 3 (December, 1925), pp. 161-82, which he cites infra (pp. 328-30). The contrast, which Asaf'ev suggests here, may be that Strauss's postponement of the resolution of the cadence is accomplished, for the most part, by alterations of the harmonies which precede and evoke the resolution (tonic), while, in the "deceptive cadence" which he describes, the postponement comes through a momentary evasion of the chord of resolution itself.

*86 Asaf'ev's analogy is not convincing, since the tropes were conceived as additions to the text more than to the music.

*87 "Alliterations" in music refer to the repetition of various aspects of the music (motives, intervals, rhythmic patterns, etc.) serving to prolong the postponement of the tonal center and thus aggravating the expectation of the attainment of stability. Cf., p. 418 for a specific application of the term. (also n. *136, infra).

*88 Reference is to the Russian language translation of Ernst Toch, Melodielehre: Ein Beitrag zur Musiktheorie (Berlin: M. Hesse, 1923). Asaf'ev's works on melodics (mentioned here) are not identified.

*89 It is clear that Asaf'ev does not interpret the expression "sound limits" as synonymous with "pitch range"; rather, the concept designates the starting point (c₁) and the high point (e²). The low point (g) is regarded simply as part of the process of filling in the space between these two pivotal features. Asaf'ev's system of designating precise pitches is similar to "System #3" in Willi Apel, "Pitch Names," Harvard Dictionary of Music (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1955), p. 586, cols. 1-2, but Asaf'ev begins his reckoning one octave lower. In Apel's system, the notes designated above would be c, e¹, and G.

*90 Asaf'ev has overlooked the predominantly descending character of m.4, which shifts the ratio of ascending to descending measures from 8 : 4 to 7 : 5.
This example, unfortunately, contains several inaccuracies. Indications of precise pitches are inconsistent, and the a in m. 19 should appear as a half-note, rather than a quarter. Furthermore, the triad in the final measure, which Asaf'ev has designated d minor, is clearly major. Inaccuracies notwithstanding, Asaf'ev's analytical approach to this example is convincing.


*Cf., n. *84, supra.

The example, as given, fails to illustrate the point, displaying no indications of any tonality other than a quite clear-cut b minor.

Asaf'ev uses the Russian term popevki, denoting characteristic melodic figures which comprise the eight glasy (roughly equivalent to modes, in function) of the znamennyi rospev, the body of Russian Orthodox Church music. The popevki (sing., popevka) originated in Russian folksong, before being assimilated into the church music. In contemporary usage, the term is employed in the analysis of folk music, and also, often, in a very general way, denoting characteristic melodic turns or melodic "intonations." Asaf'ev appears to have introduced the latter concept in his Book on Stravinsky. A similar term is naigrysh (a melody performed on a musical instrument, most often a dance tune), which he employs when the passage in question has a clearly instrumental character.

*Cf., n. 13, p. 298. The term opevanie conveys an idea of decoration or embellishment of individual tones.

Asaf'ev concludes this passage with a parenthetical comment based upon the use of the term vozhd' (leader) as denoting the leading voice in the fugue. In view of the translation (subject), the comment loses its meaning and is, in any case, facetious.

Published by J. A. Barth.

This passage, in spite of its "vulgar sociological" invocation of the relations of production, represents a stage in the development of Asaf'ev's concept of the "intonational vocabulary of the epoch" (cf., "Introduction," P. 159-61).
Notes from pages 322-32

*100 The items enclosed in parentheses would appear to be examples of the kinds of "strictly defined and controlled" manifestations of the principle of individual creation which occur in "communal music."

*101 In other words, Asaf'ev equates improvisation with the quality of unexpectedness (for the listener), more than with the quality of extemporaneity.

*102 The phrase, "conditioned by the class struggle," represents another aspect of Asaf'ev's 'vulgar sociological" tendencies, for which this volume has been criticized. In fact, statements such as this, and his ubiquitous references to the "relations of production" usually convey the impression of having been grafted on his thought, and lack the ring of true conviction.

*103 This is a clear anticipation of Asaf'ev's controversial concept of "intonational crises."

*104 Cf., "Introduction," p. 120.


*106 The translator examined the vocal score of Strauss's Elektra prepared by Carl Besl (London: Boosey & Hawkes, Ltd., 1943), the pagination of which does not coincide exactly with the edition examined (but not cited) by Asaf'ev. The example cited here is found on p. 18 of the Besl edition. In Asaf'ev's subsequent citations, the Besl page numbers are indicated in square brackets. Note also, the erroneous indication of \(_\text{g}^1\), rather than \(_\text{g}^\#1\) in the final measure.

*107 Asaf'ev's examples give only a very incomplete conception of the thematic relations involving the material shown, in the opera as a whole. They fail to show, for example, that Example 24 is the concluding section of a passage almost identical with Example 25. The effectiveness of this example is also marred by the following errors in the notation: the whole note in the final measure, designated as \(_\text{c}^\#\), is actually a \(_\text{c}^\#1\), and the \(_\text{d}^\#1\) in the same measure is actually a double sharp.

Notes from pages

*109 It is easy to see in this discussion the source of the criticisms levelled against Asaf'ev for his "intonational crises" theory. Although that theory, at this time, remained in an undeveloped stage, it may be noted that Asaf'ev does acknowledge the preparation of the new complexes by the old, and, though rejecting the concept of gradual evolution in favor of that of mutation or a "leap," he also admits the continued existence, for a time, of the old formations.

*110 The passage cited refers to a scene in Act V of Musorgskiï's opera Khovanschchina, which was completed, after its composer's death, by Rimski-Korsakov. The autobiographical work from which the Rimski-Korsakov quotation is cited was published by the Music Sector of the Government Press.


*112 Asaf'ev clearly contradicts himself in stating that "for . . . ten measures . . . the tonic is not taken," while acknowledging a tonic six-four chord in m. 7. A tonic triad, in root position, also occurs at the beginning of the tenth measure; however, neither of these instances convey an impression of finality, which is finally supplied by an arpeggiated tonic (a minor) triad in the eleventh measure, settling, finally, on the tonic in octaves in m. 13.

*113 These two points appear to be aspects of the same problem, the direct modulation to remote tonalities ("distant comparisons"), which would necessarily result in the omission of some intervening tonalities in a more conventional progression ("tonal elision"). These harmonic manifestations of Asaf'ev's "basic law of musical formation--the alternation of a 'leap' and 'smooth, filled-in motion'"--would necessitate the eventual 'restoration' of the omitted tonalities, serving at the same time, to smooth out the harshness of the "distant comparisons."

*114 Cf., n. *77, supra.
Notes from pages 353-84

*115 That is, the necessity for memorization as a condition of perception (cf., pp. 189-92, supra).

*116 It may be recalled that the term "melodics" is used to designate principles of melodic structure (cf., "Introduction," pp. 158-59).

*117 Cf., n. *84, supra.

*118 Asaf'ev here uses the term variantno-popevochnyi (literally popevki-variant, as a modified adjective denoting material based on variants of characteristic popevki). The translation of this term as "motivic variants" seems consistent with the spirit, if not the letter, of Asaf'ev's passage (cf. n. *95, supra).

*119 Example 30 seems quite out of place in a discussion of "melodic formation in which repetition prevails."

*120 Asaf'ev has used the German term Führer (analogous to the Russian vozhd-"leader" [cf. n. *33, supra]), understood in its specialized musical sense as "fugue subject." This has been translated here, quite liberally, as "contrapuntal themes," which seems to be a clearer indication of Asaf'ev's meaning. The significance of Asaf'ev's choice of this German term is not apparent, but on its face appears capricious.

*121 It is not clear whether Asaf'ev is using dynamics here in his customary interpretation--as motive forces--or in the sense (more familiar in the West) of variations in intensity or "volume." The context suggests the latter.

*122 The meaning here is clearly that of operating forces.

*123 This analogy is valid if the perfect cadence is taken to include an initial tonic as a point of departure (I : IV : V : I), as in Asaf'ev's earlier description of the opening of the overture to Ruslan (cf., p. 280). It is less convincing, however, if the initial tonic is omitted from the formula (i.e., IV : V : I), as in Asaf'ev's subsequent description of the perfect cadence as a "synthesis of all the degrees of the tonality" (cf., p. 405).
Notes from pages 385-94

*124 The outline of the ancient Greek lyric ode. The three-part pattern of the ode, however, is not, as Asaf'ev suggests in this passage, consistent with the essentially two-part juxtaposition of subject/answer in the fugue, or principal part/subsidiary part in the sonata allegro exposition.

*125 Asaf'ev outlines a course of evolution in the development of contrast as a principle of form as follows:

1. presentation of the same melodic material at different pitch levels, subject to a single basic tonality;

2. presentation of the same material in contrasting tonalities;

3. presentation of contrasting material in contrasting tonalities.

Neither the basic premise, nor its accompanying evocation of the Marxist concept of "dialectical leaps" (cf., "Introduction," p. 127 and n. 222) is completely convincing.

*126 Asaf'ev's terminology here betrays the influence of Kurth.

*127 Cf., n. 34, supra, also pp. 244, 248 (n. 6), supra, and Book II, p. 626.

*128 Asaf'ev's language is rather esoteric in this passage; he employs the terms greben' (a crest or peak) and pereval (a mountain pass or crossing) to suggest that the equilibrium or feeling of rest attained is, at best, only temporary.

*129 Though rather awkwardly stated, Asaf'ev's definition of elision appears to correspond to the familiar device in Western terminology, by which a single tone or chord serves simultaneously as the conclusion of one phrase or section of music, and the starting point of the next one, resulting in an overlap of sections. In Chapter IX, however, he uses it in the sense of an omission of some customary element in musical succession. Both concepts have a linguistic basis.
Notes from pages 401-27

*130 Cf., n. *27, supra.

*131 This represents one of two manifestations of the dialectical quality in music. In this case, thesis and antithesis combine to form a synthesis, a unity, in retrospect. This is exemplified by the sonata allegro exposition, in which the juxtaposition of contrasting thematic sections are perceived as a synthesized unity (thesis) in relation to the succeeding working-out section (antithesis). The second manifestation of the dialectical quality is the emergence of a synthesis as a new, separate stage of music, evoked by the previous juxtaposition of thesis and antithesis, and representing a new combination of previously presented elements. Such a condition occurs in the case of the sonata allegro movement as a whole, especially as handled by Beethoven, with a coda as an essential ingredient (cf., Asaf'ev's detailed discussion of this interpretation, pp. 405, 427).


*133 This is, in essence, the "second manifestation" of dialectical quality in music, noted in n. *131, supra.


*135 An illustration of the concept of "intonational arches."

*136 Cf., n. *87, supra. The c^# is alliterative in that its inclusion in this passage in a tonality of c natural, is solely to reproduce at a different pitch level the semitone between b and c in the previous phrase. In other words, it produces a similar sound to another feature of the music.

*137 The tone at the top of ascent is obviously d^2 (by Asaf'ev's reckoning), rather than d^1, that is, a minor seventh above, rather than a major second below.

*138 Asaf'ev's detailed discussion of the "second manifestation" of dialectical quality begins at this point, reaching the conclusion that the actual synthesis evoked by the juxtaposition of exposition and working-out section of the sonata allegro must be found in the reprise and coda together, and cannot be realized by the reprise
alone. This conclusion is not a particularly comfortable one, for it leaves essentially unresolved the status of numerous compositions in sonata allegro form which have no coda.

139 Asaf'ev's comparison of Beethoven and Hegel is an obvious attempt to emphasize the dialectical quality of Beethoven's music. The comparison arises again, infra, p. 438.

140 Cf., n. *124, supra. The comparison seems much more apt in this context than in the earlier one.

141 Asaf'ev equivocates on the answer to this question, switching abruptly to his discussion of finales in cyclic forms. Actually, the most valid part of this section of subsequent discussion is that concerned with the finales of single movement formations such as overtures, to which such a concept as a synthesizing finale would seem to have the most relevance.


143 Asaf'ev and other Soviet musicologists commonly use the term "laboratory," both as noun and adjective, to designate work of an experimental or innovative nature.


145 Friedrich Gottlieb Klopstock (1724-1803), Gotthold Ephraim Lessing (1729-81), Johann Georg Hamann (1730-88), Johann Gottfried Herder (1744-1803), Friedrich Maxmillan Klinger (1752-1831), Friechrich ("Mahler") Müller (1749-1825), Johan Jakob Wilhem Heinse (1749-1803), and Gottfried August Bürger (1747-94) are eighteenth century German literary figures associated, either directly, or in spirit with the literary and philosophical movement known as Sturm und Drang (Storm and Stress). The movement was a reaction against the extreme rational emphasis of the early Enlightenment and immediately preceded the period of "classicism" in German literature. The principal contributions of Klopstock and Lessing slightly preceded the movement, but were important as preparatory influences.
*146 The reference to "the dream of Rousseau" probably has a double meaning, alluding, primarily, to the philosophy of music, espoused by Jean-Jacques Rousseau (1712-78), stressing the expressiveness of music. The other probable allusion, facetious rather than profound, is to a tune from his opera, Le Devin du village, which found particular popularity in England as a hymn-tune and a theme for variations, under the title "Rousseau's Dream." (See, "Rousseau's Dream," Grove's \ldots \ldots , Vol. VII, p. 263, col. 1.)

*147 Asaf'ev devotes a more extended discussion to the quality of Haydn's symphonism, and to his instrumental writing in general, in Book II, pp. 732-33, 736-37.

*148 These are the titles of plays by Schiller.

*149 The designations Ritmo di tre battute and Quattro battute are normally associated with the second, Scherzo, movement of Beethoven's Ninth Symphony, and indicate patterns of three and four measure phrases, respectively, taken at a tempo of one beat per measure (in Beethoven's case, the meter is triple). Riemann has employed the terms for essentially the same purpose—to indicate a three-measure phrase pattern in his transcription of the pavane and a four-measure pattern in the galliard. However, it is doubtful, at least in the case of the pavane (in alla breve) that a one beat per measure tempo should be indicated. Riemann's tempo for the galliard is "Allegro giojoso," rather than "allegro giocoso" as Asaf'ev gives it.


*151 "Suite formation through diminution," i.e., through changes in note values. (Ibid., p. 118).

*152 Contained in Blume, Ibid., Anhang B. Musikbeispiele, pp. 47-58 (pagination of the supplement is independent of the body of the work.

*153 There are actually only three variations of the salterello, designated secondo, terzo, and quarto.
Notes from pages 447-61

*154 The "development" of the reprise consists of nothing more complicated than two repetitions of mm. 5-12 of this section.

*155 Ibid., pp. 47-53.

*156 A Soviet editorial note points out that Asaf'ev's description of this sixth canzona is actually based on Torchi's transcription. In the Casella edition, the outer and inner sections are given in \( \frac{3}{2} \) and \( \frac{3}{4} \), respectively, rather than in \( \frac{3}{1} \) and \( \frac{3}{2} \), as Asaf'ev describes them. It is also pointed out that, in Torchi's edition of the third canzona, the penultimate section, as shown in Example 50d, on p. 455, appears in \( \frac{3}{4} \), rather than \( \frac{6}{4} \) as in the Casella edition.

*157 This note actually appears several pages later in Asaf'ev's original text, but it is obviously necessary, for a proper understanding of his outline, at this point. His criterion for "contiguity" or "independence" of the sections is based primarily on the kind of cadence which ends the preceding section. Independence of the succeeding section is recognized only when the cadence chord is on the tonal center in its "perfect" position, i.e., in root position, with the root doubled in the highest voice. Any other possibilities, including both dominant chords and "tonic" chords in "imperfect" position, even though such chords may be in longer note values, with a fermata, are not regarded by Asaf'ev as sufficiently stable to permit independence of the succeeding sections.

*158 In this outline, Asaf'ev is again under the influence of Torchi's transcription (cf., n. *156, supra.


*160 Ibid., pp. 154-55.

*161 The value of the quarter note is constant.

*162 Ibid., p. 162.

*163 Ibid., pp. 164-66.
*164*Ibid., pp. 178-82.

*165*I.e., although, in fact, seven of the eleven measures in this section are given a meter signature of $\frac{3}{2}$ by Riemann.

*166*Ibid., pp. 188-92.

*167*Ibid., pp. 203-209.

*168*Riemann has designated this section *L'istesso tempo*.


*170*Asaf'ev uses this term several times in this work, generally to describe a kind of introductory section of music, intended to "guide" the listener into a major section, as a saw kerf guides the saw into a straight cut. It is a curious metaphor.


*173*Ibid., pp. 52-58.

*174*The term "texture" does not seem to be appropriate in this context.

*175*It is worth noting the distinction that Asaf'ev draws between "symphonic, sonata allegro," the standard first, allegro movement of the Classical sonata in the second half of the eighteenth century, and the "sonata allegro," which simply designates the first, allegro movement of any sonata, regardless of the period of music history which is involved. He discusses this on p. 481, *infra*.

Notes from pages 468-71


*178 This is an error. The triad is A major, not D major.

*179 Asaf'ev's original note (n. 7, p. 457, also cf., n. *157, supra), appeared at this point.

*180 It must be assumed again that the value of the quarter note remains constant in the instance cited. In modern performance practice the alla breve designation normally results in an apparent increase in tempo, rather than a decrease.


*182 Idem, Sonata, Ibid., pp. 49-59.


*184 Giovanni Battista Fontana, Sonata per Violino, Ibid., pp. 92-98.

*185 Giovanni Battista Vitali, Due Sonate per Violino, Prima Sonata, Ibid., pp. 179-90.

*186 Idem, Due Sonate . . ., Seconda Sonata, Ibid., pp. 191-95.

*187 Idem, Sinfonia a sei, Ibid., pp. 222-228.

*188 Giovanni Battista Bassani, Sonata (2\textsuperscript{a}), Ibid., pp. 229-38.

*189 Idem, Sonata (6), Ibid., pp. 239-49.

*190 Idem, Sonata (7\textsuperscript{a}), Ibid., pp. 250-64.

*191 Mario Uccelini, Sonata XVI a due Violini, Ibid., pp. 265-73. The third section is actually designated 3 in Torchi's transcription, but corresponds to 3 in Torchi's transcription, but corresponds to 3 in Torchi's transcription, but corresponds to 3 in Torchi's transcription, but corresponds to 3 in Torchi's transcription, but corresponds to 3 in Torchi's transcription, but corresponds to 3 in Torchi's transcription, but corresponds to 3 in Torchi's transcription, but corresponds to 3 in Torchi's transcription, but corresponds to 3 in Torchi's transcription, but corresponds to 3 in Torchi's transcription, but corresponds to 3 in Torchi's transcription, but corresponds to 3 in Torchi's transcription, but corresponds to 3 in Torchi's transcription, but corresponds to 3 in Torchi's transcription, but corresponds to 3 in Torchi's transcription, but corresponds to 3 in Torchi's transcription, but corresponds to 3 in Torchi's transcription, but corresponds to 3.
Notes from pages 471-78

*192 Massimiliano Neri, Sonata a 4, Example 98 in Riemann, op. cit., pp. 179-82. This same composition was described earlier in the chapter (cf., p. 462), as were the compositions following by Legrenzi and Corelli (cf., pp. 462-64).


*194 Giovanni Legrenzi, "La Torriana": Trio Sonata, Example 102, Ibid., 188-92.

*195 Arcangelo Corelli, Trio-sonate H moll, Example 121, Ibid., pp. 226-37. The first section of this transcription is presented as the alternation of short passages designated Largo 2 and Allegro 4 with a somewhat extended Allegro passage just before the end of the section.

*196 The best that can be said of Asaf'ev's general characterizations of the French suites is that, apart from the common tonality for all sections of each suite (his first point), there is none of them which does not yield to significant exceptions. His discussion of comparative tempos seems particularly contradictory.

*197 Asaf'ev's characterization of major-minor juxtapositions, here as "very timid" tonal contrasts is not consistent with his earlier assessment of this device as conveying the impression of a "sharp contrast" in its time. (cf., p. 222f). Cf., also, p. 252-53 (and n. *41, supra) which would appear to occupy an intermediate position between the extremes of this statement and the one on p. 222f.

*198 Asaf'ev's terminology is not entirely accurate (by his own standards) in this passage, when he speaks of "the first thematically rich . . . contrasting . . . symphonized stage" of the suite (here, the prelude, allemande, and courante, collectively). Both the concepts of "symphonism" and "theme," in Asaf'ev's stated interpretations, involve a capacity for development, which is decidedly not a feature of this "first stage" of the suite. The contrast here is in terms of a side-by-side comparison, rather than any interaction between the sections (even the variational effect resulting from the earlier employment of identical material in different rhythmic and metrical settings, which
could impart some semblance of development, is absent from Bach's practice). In fact, only the courante can be said to be at all thematic (and only in the sense of clearly marked melodic contours), both the allemande and prelude being characteristically rather amorphous, in a thematic sense.


\*200 Asaf'ev, however, ignores the fact that Haydn himself employed the term "Scherzo" to designate the menuet movements of his six "Russian" Quartets (op. 33, 1781). The scherzo of the G major Quartet from this set (No. 5) is a particularly good example of a movement which may be aptly characterized as "playful" rather than dance-like.

\*201 It may be seen that the emphasis throughout this discussion is on the dramatic quality of the music, not just of the first movement, but of the entire symphonic cycle (not, however, in a programmatic sense) in which the finale emerges as a denouement. Krebs (op. cit., p. 90) speaks of Asaf'ev's awareness of himself, both as a composer, and in his writings, "as a 'dramaturgist,'" and also notes the prevailing practice in Soviet conservatories of treating musical form as dramaturgy (Ibid., n. 1).

\*202 Johann Gottfried von Herder, German poet and philosopher, whose particular contributions to the field of poetry, were his ideas on simplicity and spontaneity of expression and the encouragement of national art forms. He exerted a particularly strong influence on the young Goethe. Included in his philosophical views was the concept of human evolution and development as a strictly natural process, intimately and irretrievably linked with the development of his physical environment.

\*203 Asaf'ev's apparent familiarity with this set of Haydn quartets makes his disregard of the latter's anticipation of Beethoven's substitution of scherzo for Menuet somewhat more puzzling.


\*205 Published, Leipzig: Geschichte, 1908.
Notes from pages 502-10

*206 Cf., more detailed discussion of this concept in Supplement 2, pp. 563-64.

*207 Cf., supra, pp. 328-230 (also nn. *85 and *105).

*208 Published, A. Durand et fils, 1927. The reference is to Joseph Mallord William Turner (1775-1851), an English landscape painter, known for vivid use of colors.

*209 One of Asaf'ev's most widely discussed views. Cf., p. 187.

*210 The reference given in Asaf'ev's note are completed as follows:

Sammelbände für vergleichende Musikwissenschaft 4 vols., ed. Carl Stumpf & E. M. Hornbostel (Munich: Drei Masken Verlag, 1922-23);

Curt Sachs, Geist und Werden der Musikinstrumente (Berlin: D. Reimer, 1929);

Chinesische Musik, ed., Richard Wilhelm (Frankfort am Main: A. Morgner, 1927);


*211 Cf., supra, p. 198.

*212 Account by the Italian poet, Dante Alighieri (1265-1321), of his love for a girl called Beatrice and the devotion of his life to study in her memory, after her death, completed approximately 1293. Asaf'ev's analogy, complicated as it is by reference to the relations of production, is not clear.

*213 Reference to Bekker work completed as follows:


*214 Cf., Asaf'ev's definition of intonation in "Supplement 2," p. 543 (also see discussion of this point in "Introduction," p. 156.


*217 In this case, the change from $\frac{4}{4}$ meter to $\frac{2}{2}$ meter should definitely result in a quickening rather than a slowing down, unless, once again, the quarter remains the unit.

*218 Asaf'ev's premise here is questionable, taking no account of numerous examples of symphonic slow movements in sonata allegro form.

*219 An apparent reference to the massive orchestral resources which Berlioz employed, especially for his *Requiem* and other works on a slightly less grand scale. There is no indication, however, that he intended them for outdoor performance. Asaf'ev's reference to "open-air (plenernoe)" performance is used several places quite ambiguously. In this context, he is apparently linking Berlioz to the influence of Gossec (cf., n. 221, infra), though with a slightly misdirected emphasis.

*220 Simple, but lively and popular folk or folk-like songs with characteristic musical features and satirical or topical textual content.

*221 The cited work is published by Fischbacher. François Josep Gossec (1734-1829) was a Netherlander who went to Paris as a youth and established a reputation, both before and after the Revolution, as an especially innovative orchestrator. He exerted considerable influence on Berlioz.

*222 Asaf'ev employs the term naigrysh, derived from folk instrumental practice, here (cf., n. *95, supra).

*223 Here, Asaf'ev adds the term otygrysh, also derived from folk practice, in the sense of an instrumental refrain.

*224 Asaf'ev's seeming implication that Beethoven's Scherzo Codas are little more than a recurrence of the Trio does not seem valid.
Notes from pages 541-55

*225. The Russian term, used here by Asaf'ev, is napevnost', which, like much of his terminology, is derived from folk practice and carries the implication of a song-like quality.

*226. The real significance of this passage lies in its revision of earlier definitions of intonation, more than in its subsequent distinction from "pure and impure presentation" (intonation, in the commonly accepted Western sense).

*227. Asaf'ev's emphasis on the "fixing by the memory" indicates that he conceives of any given system of sound relations as a conditioned phenomenon (conditioned by the society, the epoch, and history), not an absolute.

*228. The discussion of the properties of the interval is not clear. It could be interpreted as stating that melodiousness involves the concept of stability and instability (i.e., "dynamic" factors). If so, this should be further explained.

*229. Cf., n.*95, supra.

*230. However, it is possible to refer to a single isolated sound as a musical tone, a designation based upon its possession of a specific frequency, hence a fixed pitch. Cf., "Introduction," p.155.

*231. This seems to be a fair statement of Kurth's view also.


*233. This discussion is not at all convincing, but seems contrived. Regarding this as a system of two fifths, combined, smacks of a "visual" rather than an "aural" approach to its analysis.

*234. Reality is understood here as "social necessity" (or even "social utility"). (Cf., "Introduction," p. 122.)

*235. This process of prolonged assimilation of musical elements is discussed at length in Book II: Intonation, of the present work.
Notes from pages 556-64

*236 Clearly a direct anticipation of the concept of "intonational crises."

*237 A term which has found considerable currency in the Soviet cultural vocabulary, denoting imitation, generally of an inferior quality.

*238 Cf., n. *220, supra.

*239 Cf., n. *11 supra. This appears to be an alternate spelling of dosel'nye (plural of dosel'naya).

*240 This seems an intelligent approach to this controversial problem. Asaf'ev does not suggest that figurative content is an immanent property of music, but rather, it is an associative phenomenon, related to extra-musical concepts.

*241 Cf., Book II: Intonation, p. 608.
B. V. ASAF'EV'S MUSICAL FORM AS A PROCESS
TRANSLATION AND COMMENTARY

VOLUME III

DISSERTATION

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirement for
the Degree Doctor of Philosophy in the Graduate
School of the Ohio State University

By
James Robert Tull, B.M., M.A.

THE OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY
1976

Reading Committee: Approved By

Dr. Norman Phelps, Professor of Music Theory

Dr. William Poland, Professor of Music Theory (Advisor)

Dr. Keith Mixter, Professor of Music History / Department of Music
# TABLE OF CONTENTS - VOLUME III

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>IN LIEU OF AN INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>609</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>684</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>720</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV</td>
<td>746</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td>769</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td>777</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII</td>
<td>796</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII</td>
<td>812</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX</td>
<td>849</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td>859</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XI</td>
<td>876</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XII</td>
<td>887</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSION</td>
<td>904</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EPILOGUE</td>
<td>929</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COMMENTARY</td>
<td>954</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>978</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Articles</td>
<td>978</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Books</td>
<td>980</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
MUSICAL FORM AS A PROCESS

BOOK II

INTONATION
IN LIEU OF AN INTRODUCTION

This work is not so much a continuation as a development of my book, Musical Form as a Process, which was published in 1930. In this earlier work, the leading thread of the presentation was to show how the organization of sound occurs, by what intonational causal forces (understood as essential properties of music) it comes into being, and how the motion of music—its development in time—proceeds. In other words, I tried to limit myself to a study of how music runs its course, how, having arisen, it continues, and how its motion is brought to a stop.¹ Only in the concluding section of Musical Form as a Process did I touch on questions of intonation, the wellspring of music, and thereby on the hypotheses, dealing with the question of why the form of music comes into being in one way and not another. In this study, I will dwell entirely on the why, and will try to link the development of the means of expression of music with the principles of human intoning as a manifestation of thought, with musical tones in their manifold conjugations, and with verbal speech. Thought, intonation, the forms of music—all are in

¹All this, I will not repeat in this work.
continuous connection; although, in order to be phonetically expressed, becomes an intonation—is intoned. The process of intoning, in order to become, not speech, but music, either merges with speech intonation and is transformed into a unity, into a rhythmic intonation of word and tone, into a new quality, rich with expressive possibilities, which is defined for a long time in the stable forms and varied practice of millenia, or else, having escaped the word (in instrumentalism), but experiencing the influence of the "mute intonation" of rhythmic movement and the movement of man (including the "language" of the hand), the process of intoning becomes "musical speech," "musical intonation." Here it is still a long way from music as we understand it.

The protracted liberation of music from the "temporal arts" which were combined with it—a process measured in centuries—is now being accomplished. This liberation cannot be viewed as a mechanical process of isolation. Musical intonation never loses its ties with the word, nor with the dance, nor with mimicry (pantomime) of the human body, but it "re-interprets" the purposefulness of their forms and the constituent elements of form into its own (musical) media of expression. This path of musical intonation toward music as an independent manifestation of intonation runs, if not parallel to, then very likely in
close interaction with, the rise of entirely musical phenomena and the fixing in the public consciousness of the qualities and forms of music alone, as a direct musical manifestation of the human intellect. The first such achievement was undoubtedly the differentiation of intervals as precise guages of the emotional pitch of sound utterance. As is generally known, in speech intonation, even in the area of poetry, accuracy of intonation is determined only in sensation, and only in the conditions of a heightened emotional tone (amazement, surprise, a sharp question) are the limits of speech intonation marked appreciably in relief, but still not to the same degree as musical intervals. In the theatres of the old intonational, declamatory culture (for example, the theatre of the French comedy in Paris, or the Petersburg Alexandrine theatre), just as in the oratorical art, the traditions of declamation and rhetoric worked out more or less precise patterns of intonation, linked with definite emotional "situations." But all this is outside of music, for it is outside the musically specified interconnections of intervals.

In the study of music as a science, great interest is taken in the quantitatively measurable, accoustical standardization of intervals. This is proper, although this is not at all what is important in the history of
music, where only the intonationally qualitative significance of an interval and its place in a system of conjugate tones (a scale or a mode) determine its vital capacity in music. In theory, an acoustically proportional correlation of two sounds may become a musical interval, but, in fact, it turns out that, in a great number of scale systems of different peoples and cultures, intonational selection prevails. Of course, in the European intonational culture, intervals, as the conjugations of sounds which create our music, do not arise like Athena from the head of Zeus, and, although personally I do not very much believe that precise intervals were fixed in the consciousness of society from the everyday practice of audible signalling (Stumpf), it still seems that the "musicalization" of intervals was preceded by their gradual and prolonged singling out, as the result of repetitions of the same, consistent rhythmic intonations. A consistent, rhythmic, intonational "pitch pattern," repeated from time immemorial, either in a magical formula of incantation in worship, or together with the occurrence of the same "emotional tonus" in poetic, oratorical, or theatrical declamation, could be isolated from the word as an aggregate of two tones and become a musical interval, and, especially with an instrumental accompaniment, the interval could be confirmed on the instrument. Could be confirmed, true, but it is unlikely that the system of intervals as a purely musical phenomenon first arose in
instruments. The history of the establishment in the consciousness of society, of the intervals of our European mode, reveals very clearly their vocal essence. The qualitative "ponderability," i.e., the various degrees of surmountability of the intervals by the voice, testifies to their muscular, intonational nature, similar to speech articulation. In instrumentalism, the feeling of "ponderability," i.e., the qualitative difference of intervals, has a different nature, which was later revealed in the distinction of "manners" and nuances in voice leading, as, for example, in lute music in comparison with organ music, and in our time, in music for guitar and even for piano-forte in comparison with classical orchestral voice-leading. The fetishism of the four-voice texture in European music is closely linked with the "spacing out" in "register levels" of the choral range, at the same time that lute music, in the era of the Renaissance, already possessed a complex voice-leading, almost to the limits of timbre. The persistent, prolonged retention of the tetrachord orientation also testifies to the intonational limits of the "rhythm-word-tone unity"; in speech intonation the fourth, and the fifth as the inversion of the fourth, are quite firm, "stable: intonationally "constant" peaks of the voice in a heightened emotional tonus of speech (especially in dialogue). There is another characteristic phenomenon
in Gregorian chant—the typical art of "rhythm-word-tone intonation"—a phenomenon which has even become one of the definitions of intonation. This is the traditional solemn utterance by the priest, in the Catholic mass, of an intonation, determined from time immemorial, as a certain formula (rhythmic, tonal, and verbal), after which the choir enters. Thus, a certain, predetermined, rhythmic-intonational order of singing is indicated to the choir beforehand (in our Russian monasteries a similar practice, but on the musical basis of the eight glasy,* was performed by a cantor, with the choir entering after him).

In any event, the actual history of European music began only with the establishment and consolidation in the European public consciousness of intervals in their musical essence, but the art of rhythmic intonation, with its unity of word and tone, developed in several directions:

---

2 As regards the definition of intonation as the last phase of tuning of instruments, it is simply naive. To "smooth out," to "smooth over" correlations of sounds on instruments, i.e., to achieve purity of pitch, is actually important for intonation, because false pitch disturbs the meaning, the qualitative tonus of music as intonation, in just the same way as careless pronunciation in language cripples the meaning of speech, even if one is generally understood.

*The eight glasy are a set of eight pitch categories used in the Greek Orthodox Church for intonation.

---
in part, it was retained for liturgical purposes; in part, it gradually changed form in the development of polyphony; in part, it was transformed in a complex manner in the lyricism of the troubadours and trouveres, in monodic declamation, in operatic recitative, and in instrumental music.

The present study is structured as follows: the account begins with separate, sometimes almost aphoristic statements of opinion. This is a sort of exposition of concise themes or "nuclei," from which then arises an unbroken, connected statement. Such an exposition, it seems to me, is not superfluous for entry into the range of questions and discussions linked with the basic direction of this book, to explain the essence of musical phenomena defined by the concept of intonation. Not so long ago I introduced and validated in musicology, the term symphonism along with several others). With a feeling of satisfaction I see that symphonism and other conceptual terms, which I introduced have become established and are helping to generalize and explain some musical phenomena, formerly by-passed with no attention at all, or very little, being directed toward them, because of the disassociation of facts which were, in fact, similar or joined by common sources. Perhaps such an essential concept as intonation will have the luck also to come into more general usage.
I very much suffer from the inability to present this book in a literarily blameless manner, and I acknowledge the viscidity of its language. I could now write an easily understood book on symphonism, but, at the time, it was difficult to express myself about this phenomenon. By the same token, I now acknowledge my guilt in the use of neologisms, such as "tonicness," "intervallics," "rhythm-tone-word" (i.e., composite intonation), etc. I employ them, not because we live in the midst of an "influx of neologisms," but because of the necessity to emphasize some unfamiliar nuance in a very common and unassuming term. In most cases, this new qualitativeness in a phenomenon, which is emphasized by a neologism, may be clearly grasped from the context of this book. In the same way, in the selection and classification of epithets, I have tried to reveal the aspects of musical perception or influence which I consider necessary or to suggest them to the "listeners," for it is necessary not only to read this book, but also to hear it (indeed, this is a basic property of almost all my books). Or, if one does not hear how this book-so abounding in sound images-sounds, then it is necessary to hear at least a little of the material (for example, the symphonies of Beethoven, and his quartets) with which it is concerned. But it is necessary to hear intonationally, and not merely in a constructive sense. I do not wish to deny the naturalness of construction in music, but is is proper...
to know the sources of meaning and the place of the constructive element, and not to turn schemes into subjects of a splendid fugue--the intonational evolution of music.*^5

I use almost no figurative rephrasing of impressions from music in this work. I have renounced my term "musical semantics,"*^6 which has become established, but, alas, not in the same sense as I conceived it (cf., Musical Form as a Process, [Book I]). The preeminence of content in music has always existed for me. But I am accustomed to hear that content in a musical composition which has been organized by the composer, and not to "listen to a symphony" under an idea, pre-determined for it from outside--an idea which is philosophically valuable, perhaps, but which is not in the given composition of the given composer, and never could be. I have in mind opinions of the content, which are given out as principles and as norms for evaluation, though I am not at all prejudiced against witty and subtle observations, thoughts, and opinions which arise "to music" in any of us as listeners, and which are always evoked by a composition in any art.
CHAPTER I

Many people listen to music, but a few hear it, especially instrumental music. Also, nearly everyone looks at pictures, but not everyone sees the art of a painting. It is pleasant to dream to instrumental music. To hear so as to evaluate art, however, calls for strained attention, and requires mental work and speculation. Even in an art such as ballet, music is merely tolerated as something added. When its expressiveness has barely awakened and its development has barely appeared, i.e., when it has become something more significant than "pleasant melody," easily remembered and easily hummed, then the music has already begun to "interfere with the dancing." All this is not irony. It is simply the essence of the matter and the normal course of things.

But if one begins to sing, that is another matter; there is attention, attentiveness, "perception." If the singer has a good voice and his singing is natural, and if he is, even more, a talented artist, expressing the meaning of what is performed, people are won over. Man is diverted by song from the grey, habitual, commonplace. Nowadays, we
have become accustomed to speak "without tone," intoning "the devil knows how." Only folk, peasant speech, where the quality has not yet been lost, is juicy, tasty, melodiously meaningful. It would seem that our flat speech ("for reading," but not for listening) should have completely eradicated both singing and the wish to hear good singers; on the contrary, however, there is a longing for them. More than that, for the voice alone (for its quality) people are prepared to forgive the singer for the stupidity, sensual insolence, vulgar presumptuousness, and bad taste, if only there is a voice, a human, expressive voice! Even in our daily round, people speaking melodiously, with a beautiful chest quality, evoke friendliness and sympathy toward themselves. In their speech, lyrical, natural expressiveness and spiritual warmth are felt. Here is where an appraisal of intonation begins, even though still intuitive, almost unconscious.

And when people say of a violinist, that his violin sings, this is the highest praise for him. Then they not only listen to him, but try to hear what his violin is singing about; the coldness of instrumental intonation is overcome. And not only a violinist, but any instrumentalist, feels flattered to hear such praise. About the playing of instrumentalists, it is said that there is tone, about pianists, there is a touch, i.e., the expressive,
natural touching of the keyboard, overcoming the "hammering quality," the percussiveness of the instrument. This signifies that the hand of a man can almost "put a voice" into instrumental intonation. To have tone is to keep some quality of sound consistently, without interruption, like the natural smoothness and clarity of speech of a well-placed human voice. Even about an instrument, if the smoothness and clarity of playing is not impeded, it is acceptable to say the very same thing—it has tone.

But to have tone, to maintain tone, for what purpose? What is this, a caprice, a "formalistic delirium?"

Indeed, even professionals—musicians of high qualification—almost constantly make of the piano some sort of universal receiver of music; for example, in playing accompaniment, they rap out the vocal melody somewhere in the highest register. They listen and make a wry face, but still they continue to do the same thing.\(^1\) It would seem to be simpler to learn to hear music by reading the notes with the eyes, and intoning it for oneself in the same tangibility of sound as it sounded for the composer. But

\(^1\)But other people think, if qualified musicians act in this way, that means it is possible to hear music in a highly distorted way, if only to know its content beforehand—before listening. Someone said to me about a certain composition, "Why should I listen? Tell me the content, that's all!"
no, the ear is not trained intonationally. In the works of professionals, theorists and composers, living intonation grows especially numb when encumbered with any sort of "visible aspect," any "visualization of music." Singers and instrumentalists instinctively, through the practice of performance and the properties of the voice and their instruments, feel the value of intonation; singers will still command attention if their intonation, even though not meaningful, is not false. It is difficult for violinists and other instrumentalists to draw attention to themselves with a badly tuned instrument and a meaningless, inexpressive technique of playing.*

No, to maintain the tone, to have a tone, is no caprice. To be on the tone, in a given system of sound conjugations, is the basis of music. Otherwise there is no meaning in performance. It is the same as if the words in a language were formed each in its own way and pronounced each in its own way. To be on the tone in music, i.e., to intone accurately, is the rule of intonation as the statement of a thought or feeling is either verbal or musical speech, which means that this quality of music is not accidental, but makes music an art of human communication. And the more pithy and intellectual music is, the more strict its intoning must be, because each given stage of musical intonation, as a sphere of the thinking of the composer,
may become more complicated and more precise in relation to the perceptibility of its thoughts and its emotional tonus. Consequently, systems of music (intervals, scales, modes) which are rationally invented or brought forth with proud subjectivity as "my language," however perfect and precise they may be, will not become viable if they do not find support in a given stage of intonation as stipulated by the public consciousness.*

The people, the culture, and the historical epoch define the stages of intonation, and through intonation are determined both the means of musical expression, and the selection and interconnection of musical elements. In the epoch of the great cultural overturn in Russian history from the seventeenth to the eighteenth centuries, Russian musical culture was, in the most important and basic of its manifestations, exclusively based on song intonations and on the raspevy,* by which the entire system of music was determined. The sharp turn to western European instrumentalism, with its academic norms, transferred almost mechanically onto Russian soil, evoked a complex and prolonged intonational crisis. The essence of the matter was not simply a new type of "musical training in a new manner" by foreigners, but in a completely different method of auditory (intonational) though expression; indeed, both the attitude and world outlook of the people were affected. The entire eighteenth century was occupied with processes
of assimilation and experiments with the merging of cultures, and also with the spreading and testing of almost all the means of expression peculiar to European music of that time. Of course, only an insignificant part of the country (the cultural centers and the most enlightened landed-estate, "breeding grounds" for music listening) participated intensively in the "rebuilding of musical consciousness." Aside from these centers, the assimilation and merging proceeded lingeringly and reluctantly, till the genius of Glinka, through creative generalizations, summoned new life for Russian music, combining in his style all our worthwhile folk elements with the foremost musical intonational thinking of Western Europe.

Within the wisdom, the seriousness of style, and the supporting voice technique of the old, native Russian, peasant choirs was contained a culture of music as intonation, realized with surprising clarity. In these choirs, intonation conditioned by the whole structure of life and its everyday tenor, determined everything, all the more so because, in the everyday practice of "music of the oral tradition," both creative improvisation and performance were closely fused with on-the-spot evaluative, critical listening by one's own countrymen, almost any one of whom could himself appear as a performer. In this song collective was contained, as in a nucleus, everything further which
existed, in a dismembered form, in the most varied manifestations of musical culture of the larger European centers. Intonation here determined the persistence of the art of popevki and podgoloski as its own organic form of expression. The high level of technique of this art was maintained by the continuous presence of an audience of judges, who well understand the expressive language of the popevka and podgolosok, for everything in this intonational language had been assimilated by them since childhood. If only European symphonies were audited thus!

Now it is necessary, as I enter the heart of the presentation, to move ahead somewhat further and to outline concisely some prerequisite positions and definitions, which are extremely essential to an understand of the development of my thoughts. First of all, I must emphasize that, at every point where the discussion concerns the interval, I treat this most important element of music as expressive, and consider that the interval is one of the primary forms of music, for the consciousness of man, as it has sought to express itself in sound (i.e., has been intoned), has inevitably worked out stable base points of tone and pitch ("knots") with connections ("arches") between them, for the manifestation of intonational "constants" or precise degrees of tension.

Thus, intervals, as a form of expression in any given
intonational "constants" or precise degrees of tension.

Thus, intervals, as a form of expression in any given system of tones, any scale, comprise intona­
tional indicators which are in constant operation (stability, pitch range, the degree of tension of a tone, all of which are qualitatively different for different instruments). But the prevalence of any interval in the music of any time period or genre, within a given epoch, is a consequence of intonational selection, occurring under the influence of the public consciousness, and becomes a manifestation of style. So, if, in the popular Russian romance and the arioso-romance forms of opera in the nineteenth century, the sixth began to prevail in the most varied aspects,*11 forming, with the added neighboring tones or semitones, some intonationally expressive constant, then we may see here a distinctive phenomenon of style,2 operating over a long period of time.

2Style, it may be said, is incomplete, unstable form. It is only necessary for a formerly transient series of characteristic, intonational indicators, functioning as expressive media, to become stable for some time; from them may arise a rhythmic sound formula of expression, which, in turn, may become the basis for some architectonic, constructive norm. The more primitive and abstract the construction (as, for example, the so-called song-form, or even better, the three-part, periodic dance form), the more diverse are the variants which may be revealed in it, i.e.,
Some of the many characteristic indicators of popular intonations built around the major sixth in the major mode persist to the present time, changed only in degree. We may find, for example, a leap to the minor seventh, then to the third below, to the more capacious is the constructive scheme.

The symphonic sonata allegro, as a form expressing itself in the incessant, logical formation of themes, contains within it several "variable" stages (for example, the so-called transitional passages, the working-out section, and the coda). Within these sections, the most diverse stylistic dislocations in form are in constant operation.

The forms of the sonata and the symphony, which are essentially the same (both as a process and as a constructive scheme), may be grouped historically, according to stylistic epochs. And so, the intonationally realistic conception of form as a process, and as a formation of thoughts and ideas, is found in close contact with all stylistic phenomena which serve as spontaneous spokesmen of intonational "storms and stresses," or as barometers of public consciousness. This means that a form, as a formation or a process, always exposes and reflects the most functional, most vital operating forces of music to the perceiving consciousness; in an intonational sense, the content is, first of all, set apart in stylistic complexes, not all, in fact very few, of which are crystallized into stable forms, but remain as variable qualities of musical formation in its function as the expression of figurative thinking. Thus, the following series arises: a vital intonation, the stylistic selection of expressive media, and finally, form as a process (the disclosure and organization of sound-idea images), and then as detached form-schemes and constructions.\(^{12}\)
fourth above and back, and only then is the sixth finally struck; in other words, the operation of the intonational rule of gravitation of the minor seventh toward the sixth is delayed.

Dargomyzhskii, for example, loves to begin his idyllic melodies with an exposure of the triad, but from the third of the chord, sometimes cleverly introducing ornamentation before the triad is melodically revealed as a whole. This is a typical specimen of stylistic intonational selection based on the sixth, in which the interval is revealed as an intonational kernel, or in a distinctive manifestation of the triad (I recall the beginning of the aria of the miller in Rusalka, "Okh, to-to vse vy, devki"), in a series of stylistic variants.

From the intonational point of view, each interval is attained (realized) by the ear, and a melody is, in essence, an exposure of intervals. What can be more common than an ordinary interchange of octaves? But in an intonational melodic sense, the octave is a complicated phenomenon. The common assertion of elementary theory, that the octave is the same sound carried across seven [diatonic] degrees to the eighth, is a naive statement, for this is a sound of a new intonational quality.

The interval, as a system, is one of the primary expressive unities—a summarized intonation. The interval,
governed (organized) by rhythm, forms the simplest, shortest, and most persistently expressive rhythmic intonational form (a metric foot)—either iambic or trochaic, depending on the distribution of durations (quantitative rhythm) or accents (tonic rhythm).*\(^1\)

A motive, groups of motives, or periods before becoming constructive, schematic accumulations and the objects (the norms) of the teaching of forms, have been, and continue to be, formed in living intonational formation and stylistic selection, as expressions of figurative thinking.

I will permit myself to state an hypothesis. The prevalence of "percussive instrumentalism" in primitive musical cultures perhaps points to a curious phenomenon in musical practice of the early stages of social development; in the musical culture of primitive societies (and also its survivals in the music of the ancient world and the musical cultures of the East), in the esthetic of reflections of reality based upon rhythmic and tonal timbres, the human consciousness for a long time resorted to the deliberate concealment, in various forms, of the timbre of the human voice by masking it with instrumental timbres foreign to living intonation, which was, in effect, prohibited (an intonational "tabu"). This delayed for a long time the process of recognition and mastery of the sensitive, animated instrument, contained in the human organism (the voice
and its vocalization), and impeded for a long time the opposite tendency, the perhaps even more prolonged process of the humanization of instrumental timbres. It is for that reason, that primitive musical art remained for so long locked within the limits of intonations based on percussive timbres and dictated by extra-musical, "mute" stimuli (step, gesture, pantomime, dance). ¹⁴

The humanization of instrumentalism has a most protracted evolution, throughout the course of several cultural stages; but, apparently, only in Europe, in the epoch of the last Renaissance, with the vocal flowering (bel canto style) and the building of intonationally expressive, "singing," stringed instruments, did instrumentalism become in full measure the spokesman of the emotional and ideological world of European humanity. And then the evolution of the symphony became possible; without the inculcation of bel canto into instrumentalism, the expressive flexibility in the speech of individual instruments would not have been achieved, and, consequently, neither would thematic development. But the process of the humanization of instrumentalism must not be understood as crude imitation of the human voice. It is not imitation, but the search in instruments for the expressiveness and emotional warmth peculiar to the human voice; that is the essence of the process. An important role in the accomplishment of this goal was played by
the concertato style, and especially by the great violinists of the eighteenth century. Soon afterward, instrumentalism in Europe achieved such completeness of emotional tone and intonational expressiveness, that it "pushed aside" the bel canto, a style which was lapsing into virtuoso mannerism. The concertato style and the chamber sonata style worked out a sensitive instrumental dialogue, which subsequently flourished in the symphonism of Haydn in the form of witty instrumental observations.*\(^{15}\)

The highest flowering of the culture of solo bel canto was the dramatic aria with its intonationally contrasting "sections," by which were achieved the maximum fulfillment, plasticity, and figurative clarity of expression, in a word, the monumental style. The nineteenth century, with its culture of "nepotism" and "family exclusiveness," side by side with tendencies toward subjectivism and its expressions of introspection, brought the intimate intonational culture of the Lied, with its very rich poetization of human spirituality in opposition to the "representative" aria. This was the accomplishment of the Romantics, and opened the way to the triumphs of psychological realism; in the multiformity of the Lied were fashioned short, generalized intonations of the most delicate nuances of spirituality and humanity.

A basic premise for musicologists, from the point of
the intonational method of analysis, is very simple and, one may say, single-minded; if music is not heard, it is not necessary to undertake analysis. To hear is already to understand. To listen without hearing and then "to analyze," as regards music, is not forbidden to anyone, but then this is not intonational analysis. A musicologist, analyzing a score or examining a manuscript, must hear like the composer. If he is treating performance he is obliged to hear like a performer, understanding what constitutes the aim of the performance and the performer's intention. To force one's own aim and intentions on the composer or performer, without considering their aspirations or the direction of their thoughts, is the same as a blind man standing before a picture and asserting that the artist has painted entirely incorrectly. To suggest that a piece of music is a failure as regards form, and that other forms are necessary, without having heard the composer's thought and the possibilities of its exposure, is the same as demanding of music that which is fulfilled by a fresco, and of a fresco, that which is peculiar to the oil painter's easel, etc.

In musicological systems outside of the intonational method this kind of judgment, out of context, occurs quite often, and musicologists who are consistent in this respect are justified when they themselves do without music and suggest to their students to do without music in musicology.
and to throw out of the history of music the "auditory ballast," i.e., the music. Are there really not enough biographies of composers, lists of compositions, and some characterizing opinions about them?

In the present study, I, of course, am not concerned with musicological systems outside of music, and would wish to be understood by those musicologists who, first of all, are musicians, and who know that hearing and its refinement are not the least concern of music, and that hearing, guided by the intellect, is necessary for musicologists no less than for composers. For the consideration of such scholars, in order that they may train the ear for the assimilation of music as a process of intoning, as living speech, directed toward the listener, and in order that they may better understand the purpose of this study—the substantiation of musical intonation—I call attention to the following guiding principles. One must continuously direct auditory attention toward such phenomena in order to understand the development of the musical fabric, its metamorphoses and qualitative changes.

1. Intoning through the degree of scale "by leap" always evokes the opposite movement, a filling in of the empty "sound spaces," either directly, or gradually with various kinds of obstacles and digressions. It is necessary to train the hearing persistently to notice how this occurs and try to understand why it occurs one way and
not another, and also when and in whose works (style).

2. There is a continuous displacement and replacement of the base tones or "points" of the mode (especially in folk melos), and also a change of direction from tonic to tonic. For example, an octave scale may be formed from the fifth degree, with the tonic in the center, or a "scale of six sounds," a six step scale, may occur within a mode, having an extraordinary influence on the correlation of elements of the mode and on the intonational significance of certain degrees.*17 This leads to still another important, characteristic phenomenon.

3. "Aberration of hearing" takes place when any tone (or semitone) is intonationally colored by the ear as a "prefix" to an interval. The interval appears stable and draws to itself neighboring degrees, but the tone at this moment, already sounds in a new version as the top or the basis of a wider interval, which has become an independent intonation. For example, in relation to the fifth of the scale, the sixth may be either a "prefix," or it may have supporting significance for the seventh. On such a "play" on the intonational predestination of the sixth and fifth is based Ruslan's smooth meditative melody ("Vremen ot vechnoi temnoty"), which becomes a persistent thought in his famous aria.*18 To this third guiding principle, which evokes a continuous delusion ("aberration") of the hearing,
is related the variability in the intonational predestina-
tion of the semitone, that is, the determination of whether
each is a half-tone of chromaticism, a factor of coloration,
an organic half-tone of the mode, or a leading tone. This
is especially difficult to distinguish in scales, still
essentially pentatonic, but already with semitone prefixes
intoned within them. For example, in the tone series,
C - D - E - G - A, the tones F or B^b may occur as prefixes
to E or A, neither changing the pentatonic logic, nor form-
ing tetrachords.

4. Tonality may be a phenomenon of the quality of a
mode, let's say of a major mode, intoned on some degree of
the overall series of sounds, and may be defined by its
position in the circle of fifths, i.e., its place in har-
mony. Such "predestinations" of tonalities, properly of a
metric constructive order, are exposed by the hearing with-
out difficulty and even mechanistically. A different
quality results when tonality occurs as an intonationally
melodic phenomenon, in which a complicated mode may accomo-
date within itself several tonal complexes (let's say major
and minor), also conceivable from any degree of the sound
series, which creates peculiarly subtle, expressive inter-
relations. For example, there is G major, the tonality
(dominant) in relation to C major, and there is the G major
quality, entering into the major mode from a C tonic, with a raised fourth degree as a constituent element of this mode. Further, an interval is a correlation of [two] tones of a scale and is the smallest intonational complex.

What is a song? It is a concise intonation operating within a brief "space of sound."

What is a symphony? It is two or three short, "fundamental" intonational theses operating in mutual attraction and repulsion, in larger sound-spatial distances, without losing their intensity, just as in painting, in canvases by the great masters, the colors, unabating, operate within the limits of wide "visibility" and of a painting space saturated with contrasts of chiaroscuro.

European harmony, in its formation before Mozart (and including his, of course), is the cooling lava of Gothic polyphony.

A theme is an intonation, which, throughout the extended course of monumental forms, does not lose its expressiveness, and is always recognized and "greeted" by the hearing as the source and basis of symphonic development.*

A basic rule of the intonation of "oral music" is the filling-in of sounding space (or rather, space, committed to sound or intoned) after an intervallic "leap". Depending upon the "basic distance" in the given intonational system, this filling-in is accomplished by whole tones and
thirds in pentatonics, by whole tones and semitones in European music, and, on the strength of the recognition of the semitone as a leading tone, in the latter, chiefly by semitones. A monument of a fully completed system of this kind is the brilliant "March of Chernomor" by Glinka. The diminished fifth (augmented fourth), on the borders of tetrachords, naturally became one of the most important intervals of this epoch. This system is sharply contradicted by the mechanical harmony of the "bass of fourths and fifths," i.e., the so-called general-bass or "figured bass" (accompaniment continuo) with its structure based on the disposition of chords (indifferently to the melody) and "ornamentation" (figurations) by means of arpeggios. On the mutual repudiation of two systems of harmony--one growing intonationally out of the by then archaic practice of polyphony, and the other, the mechanical harmony growing out of the continuo practice--is built the whole evolution of European music from Rameau to Scarlatti.

The essence of the classic quarrel between Rousseau and Rameau lies in this radical contradiction between harmony drawn "from keyboard execution" and harmony drawn "from melody," from breathing, from the feeling of the degree of "tension" or the "tenacity" of any given interval. To such a contradiction may be traced the distinction between passive and active hearing, and between form
as a scheme and form as a process (the intoning or committing to sound of the conceivable space between the initial and final sound) it helps explain the emergence of mechanized cadence formulae to replace melodic cadences, and also the confinement of musical thought in a narrow corset--the four-square period with formal symmetry, etc. Lack of understanding of the process described above, [is common among] the majority of theorists, who deny to human hearing (the "ear") the role and significance of a working organ, evolving like the hand, or the eye, i.e., developing together with all of "social man's" progress and all his activity in organizing the world; such incomprehension leads to the piling up of one "extra-auditory," abstract system upon another, each of which is subsequently put into pedagogical practice. The experiment is performed on students, i.e., on young composing organisms at the most sensitive time in the development of hearing, and, in the name of the alleged mastery of technique, spontaneous and active hearing is "buried" by a multitude of habits and dogmas drawn from "schemes," from "mechanical movements of the hand," from the "visual memory," etc. all of which hamper its natural development. Perspective in painting, which is engendered by the eye, in conflict with the two dimensional quality of the plane on which the design is impressed, is mechanically transferred into music, etc.

How, in reality, is the conflict solved between the wish of the composer to obtain a certain timbre, and the
technical nature, or rather, the technical limits of the instrument? It is solved in only one way--by training oneself to hear, not abstract timbres, but intonational timbres. To achieve this is difficult, but if one hears his own thought in a specific way, then one may be confident that the instrument for which it is intended will embody it. Difficulties, if they occur, will be natural ones, or of such a nature that [necessary improvements in] technique will follow them; for the intonational method of hearing timbre is not mistaken, and "valves," doigté [fingerings], etc. continually expand their limits! Only in this sense does a composer create his own technique of "instrumentation," i.e., not every composer, but the one who trains such hearing in himself. To call this hearing internal is not entirely correct, for in common word usage, the epithet "internal" carries an aftertaste of subjectivism, of suspension of, or withdrawal from reality, while in intonational hearing, strictly trained within oneself, we are dealing with an objective factor, with timbre as a phenomenon of music concretely sounded (not an extra-musical concept).

Beethoven is the Shakespeare of music. Without his "Shakespearean connections" he is dissolved in Schillerian rhetoric (narrowly abstract and oratorical, unlike Bach's vital, advocacy style), in incorporeal Kantianism, in
"sentimental Rousseauism," but without the sensuality of Rousseau. Still, Beethoven is not, to any great extent, a theatrical composer, but he is saved by his keen feeling for dramaturgy (possibly developed through his early Bonn impressions, especially those of the French operas of the "third estate"—operas which, in their treatment of emotions of a new quality, constitute the revolutionary style and genre still called "comic opera," "rescue operas," etc.). In his Fidelio, Beethoven conceived the idea of raising this genre to heroic tragedy. From this brilliant failure of the great dreamer rose the opera of the nineteenth century: Wagner, Tchaikovsky (Onegin and Pique Dame), and Bizet. In the works of Rossini (who carried Mozart out of the salon into the square) there is, however, quite a different path! But this path demanded more intensive media of expression. Mechanized, "ossified" intonations, elements of musical speech (scales, arpeggi, and various other kinds of passages), which have come into common usage as connecting, filling, or "passing" combinations of sounds, demand a special sort of treatment, accentuation, and setting in order to become anew the "bearers of meaning."

Sequences often fall into a similar position (mechanization), if the composer has no feeling of how large a dose of repeated sequential fragments will be tolerated, so that
its quality, its intensity will continue to make itself felt. The frequency of use of the same sequence throughout a composition easily turns into importunity; the sequence is mechanized. For example, even such a "sensitive" opera, in an intonational sense, as Pique Dame is not free from this weakness, and Eugene Onegin, an opera in which sequence is an essential element of form, also suffers a great deal.24

Music is natural wealth, but words are very often currency bills. Words may be spoken without intoning their quality, their true meaning; music is always intonational, or otherwise it is "inaudible."

Musicologists who do not accept music as an intonational process are absolutely devoid of a "sense of the age," and it is difficult for them to hear difference in decades of remote centuries; I mean difference in musical phenomena. For that reason, they prefer to "chew over" the same well-known compositions of the nineteenth century and especially of Beethoven. It is incomprehensible to them that the formation of the art of the ars nova required the most prolonged searches and efforts, and demanded much time for assimilation; even the intellectualism of the musical Middle Ages is unintelligible to them.

Chopin is perfection, but Schumann is emotionally more elemental; he represents the confession of the soul and the
beginning of an epoch. Thus the immensity and limitless-
ness of his influence are felt everywhere and his "voice"
is all pervasive.

All great, as well as less great, but still "firmly established," musical compositions inevitably have within them "commonplace intonations" of the epoch which engendered them. That is why contemporaries, recognizing in these intonations "native," "familiar," "beloved" elements, accept the given composition through them, first "on faith"; then gradually, with the help of familiar intonations as "guides," the hearing builds a bridge to the comprehension of the remaining "components" of the composition. After a time, the new intonations enter into "everyday use," and judgements about subsequent compositions are formed in relation to them. Works on a large scale, of course, are never immediately comprehended in all their constructive significance; even the critics are limited thus in their initial comprehension. According to how much the meaning is twisted and the living intonations are numbed, a composition drops out of performance practice, even though it may be "super-great." Its greatness remains in the textbooks of music history. The genius of Bach, Beethoven, Mozart, Tchaikovsky, and Verdi is in the wonderful feeling for the "quantity," the "measure" and degree of stylization, the transformation, and the selection of
everyday intonations. We see that, of the compositions of these geniuses, it is not just the most intellectually subtle and profound which live longer and more persistently, but rather those of them in which characteristic, widely known intonations of the epoch are clearly inlaid. Tchaikovsky's Sixth Symphony, the B Minor Symphony of Schubert, and Bach's St. Matthew Passion, are only three of a multitude of examples. And, conversely, what an unenviable fate has befallen Verdi's Falstaff, an opera written for a few musicians!!

Why, in the so-called sonatas da chiesa, did the sprouts of musical development or independent signs of music of "pure," "symphonic" plasticity and motion, irrespective of the dance and poetry, reveal themselves earlier, or, at least, more clearly than in other genre? Was it not because in sonatas da chiesa the "vocal sensation of intervallic tension" was not yet lost? And for that reason, the "dance quality," and, in general, the music of the "step," of the "movement of the body," of "touch," lay less heavily within them.

If one does not train oneself to perfection in the "vocal," i.e., the "tangible," feeling of the tension of intervals and their interrelations, their resiliency, their resistance, it is not possible to understand "what intonation in music is"; it is not possible to understand the
processes of the historical evolution of music (of music, not the history of musical compositions) nor the principles of development (not simply of "working-out") and form, comprehended in the unfolding of meaning, i.e., in process. More than that, it is not possible to cultivate in oneself the composer's internal ear. Every great singer has felt each tone in his voice, and its relation to the other tones of his vocal motion. This simple phenomenon is always overlooked. But in it is the true key to the understanding of everything in music, and especially of the processes of the composer's activity. It is not at all a paradox that the humanity of purely instrumental compositions and their ability to penetrate the ear of a wide circle of listeners, depends to a great extent on the presence, in the symphonism of any given composer, of the "vocal intonational" essence (I am speaking, not of "vocal melodies", but of "vocal ponderability," of the tension of "intervallics," i.e., the presence of this nature in the hearing and creation of a composer).

The history of the life of chamber compositions, especially of string quartets, is very interesting from this point of view. For example, what is the reason for the difficulty of perception of the unquestionably masterful, viable, and intelligent string quartets of S. I. Taneev, which are deserving in every way of attention and respect?
Indeed, I would raise the question whether symphonies are feasible as vital, and not purely academic, phenomena, if they do not contain a dramatic nucleus or a dramaturgical development in the "Shakespearean" mold (or, more accurately, the Shakespearean spirit) rather than that of Schillerian rhetorical pathos. The inadequacy of the "singing quality" in the symphonism of "the Five" and, of course, the "Belyaev Circle," and of "Balakirev's business" in general, undoubtedly lies in the "inaudibility" of musical dramaturgy.\textsuperscript{27} Even the freshness and provocativeness of the discoveries of Borodin did not help, for the improvisational and empirical cast of his surprising talent did not find the path to the seemingly simple truth that without the "yeast"\textsuperscript{28} in musical development there is neither cohesion, nor tension, nor progressive motion, even though the impulses are energetic and the material quite fresh.

The great vocal culture already showed signs of cracking in the art of Rossini, and he logically arrived at the romanticism of the orchestra of William Tell, where his orchestra almost broke into song. But earlier he had defended the vocal opulence of opera from the attacks of instrumentalism with the dams of his expressive overtures. Even in the works of Verdi, long after the orchestra had begun to sing in the works of Romantics everywhere, the
segregation continued, in opera, between the human voice and the orchestra as two separate spheres, but becoming more and more interlaced. But, while Verdi and especially Rossini seem to us to be the pinnacles of vocal mastery, from the point of view of the glorious vocal culture of the hedonistic eighteenth century they were its destroyers! The mastery of singing receded, and because the vocal quality, i.e., not the art of singing with the human voice, but the expressive essence of this culture, was taken over by instrumentalism. In this sense, the symphony became more and more vocally expressive (from Beethoven, through Schumann, to Tchaikovsky, in whose work the symphony orchestra "began to sing" to the fullest extent); I am speaking not about melodiousness, as such, but about "vocalness," i.e., about the special nature of the comprehension and feeling (the "muscular sensation") of intervals and of each tone. Only by having mastered this quality—an entirely different "sound exposure" from the "non-vocal" accessibility of intervals associated with instruments—could instrumentalism, with its added power of timbres, attain its gigantic psychical and intellectual achievements. The transference of vocalness into instrumentalism, naturally, led to the decline of the culture of singing with the human voice, rather than the reverse, i.e., this [vocal] culture did not collapse entirely on its own.
In its turn, instrumentalism, having offered, in the person of Tchaikovsky, the last "singer of the orchestra," is more and more, in our epoch, abandoning the culture of "instrumental vocalism" as the heritage of Romanticism, i.e., the culture of feeling, and, since the initial successes of the "timbre style" (Impressionism), is cultivating the pure nature of the instruments and their basic quality—timbre. Timbre is becoming the bearer of the new comprehension and hearing of the interval—an antivocal comprehension, completely overcoming the "infirmity" (from the point of view of contemporary demands for expressiveness) of the human voice and of the whole art of singing. If, in their time, the Romantics perceived the vocalness of the orchestra and opened to instrumentalism the road to the overcoming of self-sufficing virtuosity and finger acrobatics, now the culture of timbre, which is in the process of developing, will make the orchestra unnecessary, and will open unprecedented perspectives to intellectualism and to the consciousness of the contemporary composer by making it possible for the composer to make contact with timbre, "without instruments" in their usual form, but with the aid of electrified "devices" as the bearers of expressiveness.*²⁹ In essence, Stravinsky's Rite of Spring was a composition which went beyond the common limits of the orchestra; it was a flight into the "instrumentation of timbres." A few especially sensitive
(particularly, French) composers justifiably felt in Sacre... a new epoch, but the composer himself did not fully comprehend his own path, possibly because of the absence in Europe of the appropriate set of instruments, or because of a narrow understanding of the art of timbres as merely colors. Moreover, in our country, because of false fears of "mechanization," composers are not promoting the growth of an "instrumentation of timbres," almost confusing this with the principles of the player piano and the phonograph, i.e., with purely "sound-reproducing" mechanisms. Even the inventors and the scientific investigators in the field of electrified music-making hardly dream of these perspectives, or of the "stunning" virtuosity which would surpass the technical capabilities of the player piano, because they do not understand the requirements of music which are purposefully shaped by history.

The quality of the leading tone is one of the most important stimuli of the growth of European music and a "prime mover" of the European synthesized mode;30 that is the operational stimulus of the mode--its "verb." Only one who understands and traces, in European music, the feeling of the leading tone, the evolution of this phenomenon, but in a concretely historical context can interpret for himself the music of recent centuries with full clarity, precisely as music (in its creation and perception), and
not merely as individual works. All the searches for temperament, both unequal (at first) and equal, are incomprehensible without the feeling of "leading-toneness" as the chief motive force of European music. The so-called medieval modes disintegrated under the influence of this powerful motive force, this key factor. The leading tone on the seventh degree of our major mode did not immediately find, nor confirm for itself, this place. The struggle was very prolonged, and whoever has a feeling for this, well understands that the so-called alterations and raised and lowered degrees of the major mode are also a sort of cooling lava of the leading tone's prolonged process of struggle for its place. The fact that the fantasy of Werckmeister (1691) took root among a multitude of other, clever conjectures, which turned out to be lifeless, was possible only with one condition—the full triumph of the note sensible as the basic quality of the European mode! Uniformity (as exemplified in Das Wohltemperierte Klavier) is possible and is exercised by the ear, only because the feeling of the intonational significance of tones and semitones, even within the scales, even when they are played through mechanically, changes profoundly from tone to tone, and is especially intensified with the distinction between simply a semitone and a semitone functioning as a leading tone. This feeling led (even with the Classics) to the
persistent introduction into the major mode of "leading-toneness" on other degrees beside the seventh. This process, intensified by the Romantics, was accelerated still more thanks to the fact that all the archaic modes were continually "metamorphosed" and continued to live in musical practice (only for theorists did the Aeolian mode alone, of the medieval modes, remain in music as minor), and not only in the scholastic "strict style," thought out by pedagogues. Yes, even the minor (as the alleged survival of Aeolian mode) is such an unstable aspect in musical practice, that it always has made trouble for the pedagogue. In their time, Glinka and Chopin wisely and sensitively "continued the existence of the medieval modes." And it was not simply a matter of an appeal to folklore, as was often the case with the "Five."

A mode is not a theoretical generalization, and, indeed, is not even conceivable as such; if there is nothing more than a series of sounds, a scale, or a set of "functions," the quality of the mode vanishes into thin air. A mode is always experienced as a formation, and, for that reason, it is felt in all the musical compositions of the epoch under investigation;*32 but its generalization involves the most characteristic operating intonations of the epoch, as, for example, was the case in the practice of the
One may say that there is only one mode in European music, for it has a single and most characteristic indicator—the quality of the leading tone. Major and minor are, in fact, only inclinations, or rather, "trends." But the unity of the European mode is so unprecedented in relation to other musical cultures, because there are included in it, not mechanically nor empirically (conforming to the demands of the structure of instruments), but as a phenomenon of creatively generalizing thought, various kinds of modal groupings, i.e., the heritage of the modes of the Mediterranean culture. This has been the result of a long and complex process of assimilation and reworking (transformation).

The best and most brilliant generalization of the characteristic and essential properties of the European mode is given in Glinka's "March of Chernomor," in the end of the 1830s (see my analysis of this composition). The solution of the famous "bugbear," diabolus in musica, the tritone, lies entirely in the area of intonational struggle; there was a reaction of scholastic musical speculation or pedagogical rationalism, not only

---

3A reaction, because of a phenomenon which is characteristic for any declining style; its decline is accompanied by [the application of] conventional habits of perception ("passive hearing") to the new intonations which are gaining strength.
against the persistent introduction of semitones into the Gregorian system of modes, as a kind of alteration, but also against the feeling of the semitone as a leading tone and the new musical practice connected with this feeling. There still remains the question as to the source of the introduction of the note sensible into European music. Was it from the peasant music of the West? Was it from the practice of the musical craft guilds in the cities? Or perhaps it was from the Mediterranean musical cultures (was it perhaps late Rome?). And if it was from western European musical practice, was it not then from dance music?

Having lent an ear to the struggle with the "devil in the form of the tritone," one can be certain that the "fear" was evoked by the sharply emphasized feeling of the leading tone quality in this interval.*35

What is the subdominant? It is the overcoming of the dominant quality, and, more precisely, of just this quality of the leading tone.*36 That is the reason, for example, that we find $B^{b}$ in the Dorian or Lydian modes, and, in our time, in $C$ major as a manifestation of a "counter-leading tone" phenomenon, with the purpose of softening the "tritone" and the note sensible. In the process of expansion of the major mode, by the introduction into it of "internal" leading tones (for example, on the fourth step),

*From D and from F.
it becomes necessary strictly to distinguish these two
tendencies, i.e., the aggravation and the softening, the
spreading and the narrowing of the feeling of the leading
tone quality.

In pure melodics (i.e., chiefly in folk music),
conceived without harmony, it is apparent from observations
that two basic rules predominate:

1. The rule of the shift of tones (within the mode).
A tone which attracts, which groups around itself, degrees
of the mode lying near it, becomes, itself, drawn into a
new grouping (system).

2. The rule of the strict economy and selection of
tones within the mode. If a leap is taken, it is filled in
by the by-passed tones (not necessarily by step, but flexi-
ibly, with various sorts of obstacles in its way). This
leads to intonational symmetry and the interpretation of
the repetitions of certain tones.

Both these rules, however, function in conditions of
intoned activity, disclosed motion, and self contained (not
homophonic) melodics. But the general-bass (i.e., the
whole practice of the figured bass) has already almost
"neutralized" the operation of these rules in melodic
development, and in our time the "notorious" functionality,
which subordinates melodic motion to an abstract, acoustical
principle, to the mechanical coupling of chords under the
dictatorship of the bass voice (for the significance of the degrees of the mode is reckoned by the bass), has finally killed the melodic feeling, destroying or depriving of potency the basic rules of the selection of tones and their shift in the melodic formation of the mode. Furthermore, this even impoverishes the harmony! Why wonder at complaints of the lack of melody, of the prevalence of hackneyed songs?!

It is very interesting to observe the rule of the filling-in of "breaks" with the fluency of motion of (whole) tones in the pentatonic melodic style. This style may be considered a strict style in the evolution of melody, and the epochs of its prevalence as epochs of strict melodic style. Improvement of this style, in the sense of its enrichment by means of stylistic harmony (without leading tones), is entirely feasible.

When will people understand the difference between scholastically mechanical voice-leading (the voice-leading of a "practised hand"), and intonationally intelligent voice-leading? They listen to Glinka and Chopin, and they do not hear. Even instrumentation, where the whole problem is intonationally meaningful voice-leading, is separated from creation and considered, only as a technical problem, by which any "device" from music of one quality may be freely transferred into music of an entirely different
quality, style, and meaning. Indeed, it seems clear that one may, for example, write music all one's life for performance on the grand piano, but not know how to compose pianoforte music; for this it is necessary to hear one's music in oneself as pianoforte music, and then, when it is written down, to instrument it for the pianoforte. But this process is far from mechanical, and there are no antennae, if one is equipped only for abstract voice-leading, with which one can feel the "norms" of this instrumentation, unless it is for a superficial and ornamental, virtuoso production. It is the same in a work for orchestra. The mechanical transference of alien methods, especially seductively pleasing ones, yield nothing to the hearing of the composer. There are profoundly personal instrumentations (a subjective instrumental style), and to draw from them is especially dangerous, for the more sharply "one's own face" occurs in instrumentation, the less chance there is that it will become generally significant. Very few works, even by the great masters, turned out well as the result of prolonged efforts to achieve an instrumental style in which "their own" and the "universally significant" were mutually and organically interlaced. Glinka is one of the fortunate ones. Even Berlioz, in much of his work, is only "for himself."

In examining musical form (in process, in its "breaking down," from the position of a perceiving listener, but
a listener who is not passive), I have noticed an interesting phenomenon; the rhythmic (and consequently the symmetrical) distribution of "material" goes in different directions in different styles and even in different instrumental textures. I call attention, for example, to the regularly rhythmic alternation of thematic executions with (most often) "sequential" episodes in which the auditory attention seems to rest, in such a rationalistic form (and, I might add, a deductive form,\textsuperscript{5} in terms of its quality of thought) as the fugue. Also in the fugue there is a rarefaction or condensation (stretto) of thematic execution, etc. The rationalistic quality of a form does not prevent the manifestation of the "nerve" of vitality in its development. Only scholastic theory is little concerned with the "inner life" of the fugue. This is understandable; a strict system of "deriving" all the music of a fugue from monothematicism (double fugues, too, are essentially monothematic, for their themes are rationalistically connected, rather than dialectically

\textsuperscript{5}Musical form for a long time could not (and still cannot part with naive "deductivism"; it is interesting to observe how in the sonata forms little by little there began to arise, in the form of introductions before the sonata allegro, "gropings," "searches," "foretellings of the theme." I recall Mozart's famous beginning of the C major quartet, and Beethoven's introductions to symphonies (there are outstanding ones in the Second and First, particularly the latter).\textsuperscript{*37}
contrasting, and they constitute a unity) and, in general, the "deductiveness" of the fugue and the forms related to it, permit one to consider this premeditation as a denial of inner development. But historically this is not so. There are fugues in which the "lava of music" is still not cooled down, a symptom of the organicness of the form, and there are fugues which are only the realization of a scheme. In the same way, in any music there are cadences which stop and close motion, and cadences which are simply strokes of the pen: "I wish you well," "I remain loving, honoring you," etc.--strokes, sometimes very intrusive and prolonged.*38

Thanks to theoretical abstractions and scholastic theory, such an important element of music as the cadence has remained almost outside the sphere of observation, not in terms of its structure, but in terms of its content and meaning, and of the significance of the cadence in the rhythm of form and in the dynamics of development. Composers have instinctively understood this meaning of the cadence, but the hearing of many was so "dislocated," because of formal teaching about the cadence by prepared formulae, that only with great difficulty were they able to find the way to rhythmically and dynamically interesting cadences which answered their purpose, without merely getting by with prepared strokes. And the more romantic, the more emotionally tense the music became, the deeper and deeper the rupture became. Still
the powerful genius of Beethoven almost always found a sensitive way out when the strenuous flow of his music evoked "difficulties" in how to restrain and close the intensive flight of feeling and thought. It is the same in Beethoven's music of profound meditations. But later in the nineteenth century, with the prevalence of the cult and culture of feeling, the cadence became more formal and was mechanized even in the works of some of the outstanding masters, not to mention in popular music!

For example, if we take Tchaikovsky, we recall an abundance of cadences which disturb even sincere, true lovers of his music--"formal excuses"--"well, here's the end." Or there are interminable repetitions, tutti, by the orchestra, of the tonic triad at the end, and at times even within compositions with a strenuous development (Burya [The Tempest]), when it is difficult to stop the music. But the cadences in Pique Dame are an entirely different matter. The mature ear of the composer feels, by now, the significance of place (and the degree of accent), the quality of the musical filling (content) of the cadence, the gradualness of braking, the sharp obstruction, the shift of thought, the daring cut-off, the inevitable

... Especially early Tchaikovsky.
conclusion, the naturalness of a laconic ending, etc.

The main difficulty with the technology of the cadence--apart from its rhythmic quality (symmetry) and distribution according to the quality of musical content--is its expressive significance; cadences which are side-by-side or near one another must not "kill one another"; it is not feasible, where the sense and motion of the music do not demand completion, that the expression of the cadence be an expression of the "final point"; and, on the other hand, where the music demands accentuation, "conclusion," closing, it is not feasible to give an insipid flourish or a cadence less expressive by correlation with neighboring ones. Such blunders are especially noticeable in dramatic music and in the most subtle forms of the Lied, i.e., of chamber singing in general.

The area of the Lied (romanza, etc.) can never be a completely harmonious union between poetry and music. It is rather a "contract for mutual aid," or else, a "field of battle," single combat.*39 And just here is the interest, the attractiveness, and the meaning of the evolution of these forms. The unity which arises at times is always the result of a struggle, if it is not "mechanistic" or formal. One need only understand the simple fact that the Lied and related genre arise and develop, not from the relationship, but from the rivalry of the intonations of poetry and music,
and all their creative history becomes completely understandable, clearly visible, and extremely meaningful. It is the same with the stylistics and esthetics of the Lied.

Each composer, in persistent training of his internal hearing, must carefully develop in himself the feeling of the "ponderability" of intervals, the particular musical tangibility of a given sound space, its tension and the difficulty or ease of its attainment (its reproduction by the voice or an instrument). It is necessary to devise exercises, to give tasks to one's hearing, to train one's auditory imagination without help from outside, i.e., without helping oneself at the piano or by any other means. It is necessary to work out for oneself, in every way possible, activity of the hearing, to verify, for example, sensations realized by internal hearing from certain instruments, from harmonic complexes, and from timbre, to trace voice-leading, especially within the instrumental fabric of available "composed scores," to compare the quality of sound coming from without with an impression received earlier from perception of a given fragment by the internal hearing, to weigh, on the spot, the quality of a performance, and to try to explain to oneself the reason
for apparent "inharmoniousness" of sound,\(^7\) whether in the intention of the composer, or as a result of inability, lack of understanding, or incorrect treatment on the part of the conductor, etc., separating all this from evaluations of personal taste (I like it; I do not like it; it is pleasing; it is not pleasing) or preconceived esthetical norms, but learning to grasp and evaluate the "auditory essence" of each musical moment.

The most difficult and highest stage, which must be attained in this work on the composer's hearing, is to learn to hear (to perceive with full consciousness and strained attention) music, with a simultaneous grasp of all its "components" which are revealed to the hearing, but in such a way as to understand each moment of the movement of sound in its connection with those preceding and following it, and instantly to determine whether this connection is logical or illogical, making a determination by spontaneous feeling, without resorting to technical analysis. Such comprehension of musical meaning expresses the highest stage in the development of internal hearing, and has nothing in common with formal analysis. An excellent

\(^7\)Or rather, whether the alogicality of sound is a consequence of interruption of the sound fabric, a lack of correspondence of timbre to what the hearing expects, etc.
exercise on the path to this kind of comprehension is to play for oneself pieces in some unfamiliar forms, demanding of the ear, at every moment, recognition of the "logic of the unfolding of the torrent of sound," or rather, of the intonational, the meaningful exposure of music as living speech. It is very difficult to describe in words what sort of auditory perception the "narrative" is concerned with here; only a musician who rises above purely mediocre or even narrowly professional hearing, led by theoretical conditionality, can understand how this process of the profoundly realized perception of music as meaning proceeds without an appeal to its grammar and syntax. Of the forms which are very useful for the training in oneself of auditory sensitivity and the realization of the logic of musical motion, one may point to the Allemandes (especially of J. S. Bach) with their remarkable continuity in the leading forth of idea after idea, link after link, and with their surprising fluidity.

The logical unfolding of music attracts the ear, and thus, any unexpectedness, obstacle, or simply technical awkwardness is perceived as a breach of meaning. But if this unexpectedness is calculated, occurring with the full consciousness of the composer, is only unexpected in the context of immediate succession, and is justified in further motion by some logical development, peculiar to music, the
attentive ear reacts sensitively to such a "leap of thought." A sort of "arched system" of sound complexes is formed, in which a response to any of them may rise at a distance, but not immediately. This is a phenomenon of extraordinary significance. To a certain extent it is analogous to the replacements of "leaps" by smooth successions of tones (filling not yet intoned intervals) in a purely melodic (not homophonic) composition. But unquestionably the system of sound arches, \(^40\) in terms of its perception (not passive, of course), forms a much more complex formation of music, demanding strained attention, full of "events." It belongs to a higher artistic culture, and is the bearer of a more intellectual, creative mastery than intonations which exhaust themselves in naive direct succession, telling the whole story "in the immediate vicinity." In the same way, the medieval, western European polyphony, the Russian, peasant, choral polyphony of the popevki and podgoloski, and the multiform, intellectually refined music of the contemporary city with its expressive dynamics and meaningful language of timbres, have all contained this system of compositional development or exposure of intention based on "sound-arches"; one intonation answers another here, not side by side, but at a distance, achieving both emotional tension and intensification of meaning. In such a formation, the sound idea is
grasped by the hearing in connection with a whole series of internally engendered sprouts, juxtapositions, "structures," and "hints of the future" in a word, it is recognized (analysed) and is enriched by acquiring derivatives. Thus music becomes a more and more sensitive and profound embodiment of artistic experience. For we are not concerned with an auditory game of "hide and seek" (to find a sound complex corresponding to the one intoned), nor the wandering of the ear in a labyrinth of sound combinations, nor the solution of problems of sound perspective, but rather, with the fact that, in the highest stages of its development, music, as meaning, becomes a reflection and a realization of its surrounding reality, perceived and transformed or reorganized by man, and is equal to all other manifestations of human consciousness.

Having been liberated from dependence on poetic metrics and on the naturalistic reproduction of the human step or processes of muscular work which evolved into the architectonics of motion by [musical] periods and by narrowly defined dance music with its clear-cut, rhythmic postulates, compositional thought has gradually discovered the possibility of a purely musical formation as a new method for the recognition and comprehension of reality.

Through complex stages of creative searching, composers have arrived at a peculiarly musical means of
expressing feelings and ideas, at the formation of music as development. Just as in the case of the feeling of the leading tone or the sound-arch system on intonational comparison, musical development, which is, for the composer, a completely objective reality, is defined in words with difficulty. It is possible, of course, to employ figuratively the representation of any sound space in which music is perspectively arranged; for example, it is possible to imagine the duration of music as a sound-temporal continuum (time filled with sounding matter), but all this does not explain exhaustively the phenomenon of development in music. As a technical term, development is revealed through an enumeration of the methods, by the use of which it is achieved, but as a phenomenon of meaning, as the bearer of the intellectual, creative consciousness and as one of the means of comprehension, musical development must be accepted, at present, as one of those qualities of European music, in the highest stages of its evolution, which are irrefutable for composers and sensitive musicians. But what of the listeners? In their direct perception, without analysis of this quality, music as development exists as living intonational speech, persuading by means of its emotional figurativeness, saturated, now with oratorical pathos, now with intimate lyricism, now with dramatic passion, now with thoughtful contemplation. The
sympathy of listeners for the monumental forms of music proves the "accessibility" of the properties of musical development to any cultured listener for whom music is not just amusement, nor a caprice of the imagination, nor a "tickling" of the sensitivity.

The history of development, as the essence of European symphonism (symphonism is inconceivable without development, which is recognized, at least, as a technical principle of the scope of the form of greatest "duration" for any given epoch), is very complex and prolonged, for the path of these searches (for the most part groping and at random) and experiments has been winding and zig-zag. The difficulty of these seekings and strivings was the result of a great number of factors; human hearing, as a consequence of a complex social process (and indeed we are not speaking merely of a physiological organ here), gave way to sight. And the rules of "sight," having provided the perspective of Renaissance painting, also defined the "sound-spatial" perspective of music. It is possible that the temporal-spatial perception of compositions of this art plays a significant role here; "form occurs in time, unfolding," and it does not stand like a picture before a spectator, who can continue his gaze as much and however (from whatever point) he likes. But still, beyond the technical complexities of perception, there are in
operation even more obstacles of a cultural-historical order; professional hearing (especially of the composer, even when the composer is almost inseparable from performer and theorist, as was the case for a long time in Europe) too much outstrips the hearing of the perceiving mass. From this results the inevitability of the formal "refinement" and "solitude" of innovators, if they choose the path of subjective searchings, creating their own sound language, avoiding universally recognized intonations which convey comprehensible meaning to everyone. These solitary experiments sometimes, therefore, are swallowed up by oblivion and no one returns to them, but sometimes they are picked up and become "audible" (people are amazed by them!), because the process of auditory perception from other positions has led to the same discoveries by listeners now better prepared by their historical and cultural development.

With the so-called "Netherlandish schools," and then with the evolution of the madrigal\(^41\) (at least here, the strivings were grouped by characteristics of the epoch and by the principles of its esthetic), there is evidence of the estrangement of profoundly intellectual efforts from the limits established by the time; speculativeness sprang up in creation, and an acute romantic refinement, in the works of isolated individualists, in the area of the
madrigal. In spite of the high artistic level of these discoveries, they were swallowed by oblivion; the epoch heard that which it wanted, and not that about which the minds that had outstripped it were dreaming.

But there is no uninterrupted evolution in art, and succeeding generations do not "pick up" subjective refinements. True, they do not begin from the technical rudiments, but neither do they continue from "unheard" intonations. Rather, succeeding generations either enrich what has been "heard" and established by the consciousness of society, or they try to overcome this heritage in their own way; again and again the subjectivists try to escape "to freedom" and to the creation of their own language, but only a select circle of the same kind of dreamers hears them. It is understandable, therefore, that, when the growth of ideas in Europe pushed even the art of music to self-determination, to a sort of Cartesian cogito, then the quality which ensured the life of music, development, became the object of persistent work by a number of generations. But it is also understandable that this work was "intermittent" and varied, for only those composers who combined within themselves a progressive, sensitive mind, with an understanding of the concrete requirements of their time, and a flexible, perfected technique, with a conception falling within the limits of practicable intonations,
well known to the cultured listener ("speaking" to thought and feeling), introduced a solid contribution into music. And the wider the sphere of these "native" intonations (even the most commonplace ones), a sphere which was absorbed into the orbit of composers' thinking on development, the more solidly and profoundly were the results of this work consolidated by the public consciousness, becoming "rules of musical composition." Without these "native" intonations, in the face of the growing ideational requirements for music in the course of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, this art could not have become a conceptual force, for it would have remained an applied art, an art without independent forms and without "its own language." Along the paths of the struggle for development, musicians often found themselves in ideational blind alleys, involved in exaggeration and "coloring" of technical resources, which afterward proved to be useless. Only with the discovery of the "sonata quality" did music receive a concrete stimulus, a stable, powerful lever for the intensive growth of development into all areas of musical creation; and only then did the "age of symphonism" begin. But prolonged, wandering "trials,"

8"applied to" the church, "applied to" theatrical and other "plays, "applied to" poetry, "applied to" the dance, "applied to" the court, "applied to" the army.
during the course of several centuries, preceded it.

At the dawn of the musical Renaissance, the first harbinger of musical independence was the effectuation of the principle of development through imitation. From the first experiments with the insertion of one intonation into another (before one completion of a melodic figure, it has already begun to sound in another voice) to the complex forms of the canon and the monumental art of the fugue, music lived through several periods of crises and expansions, but the curve of the struggle for development went on even while the composer's thought was still subordinated to the demands of worship. The church was a powerful organization, and disciplined each artistic profession. For a time, religion gave wide scope to music. Just as in scholasticism, in the "play of concepts," human thinking was being sharpened. so music, still the "servant of the church," but sharpening and expanding its forms of expression, was preparing itself for independent emergence in instrumental, symphonic forms.

In the struggle of music for independent means of expression and self-sufficiency of forms, a considerable period of time was spent on working out rhythmic standards (and metric norms, and schemes conforming to them), which were independent of verbal speech and poetic metrics. Since the struggle for "its own rhythmics" was
closely linked with the problems of preserving music in writing and the evolution of musical notation, comparatively little attention was directed toward the essence of another phenomenon, namely, that music could not develop in terms of its intonational nature, nor of its dynamic expressiveness and the expressiveness of its timbres, without the stabilization of its fluidity (its development in time) by means of firm rhythmic-constrictive and rhythmic-accentual norms, which would discipline the motion (the intoning) of sounds. Much effort was spent on the working out of strict rhythmic statutes. Indeed, here musical rhythm collided with the interacting rhythms of poetry and the dance (in essence, with the rhythms of the human body, both in statics and in dynamics). In addition the ossification of medieval Latin (with the metrics of which music was significantly united), as a consequence of the development of new European languages, accelerated the independent rhythmic formation of music. The course of this process was complicated by the fact that "vulgar" Latin was closely interwoven both with church Latin, and with the new language intonations and rhythms. These new linguistic formations unquestionably influenced both musical intonations and rhythms, sometimes furthering their independent formation, sometimes impeding it. Extremely curious
perspectives: e presented to the hearing of the sensitive researcher by the epoch of the troubadours and trouveres. And here, in the midst of diverse influences and interactions of perspective, the struggle for independent musical rhythm still went its own way, being equally a struggle for the principle of musical development, and not a purely formal and constructive phenomenon. Intonation is so dependent upon rhythm, as a factor which disciplines the exposure of music, that without the standards of rhythmic formation there is no musical development. More than that, if the suite, as the first great cyclic musical form, made up of a chain of dances, turned into an artistic whole, into a superstructure above the ordinary forms of applied music, then it is indebted for this, its "extra-ordinary" significance, to work on the rhythmic development of commonplace dance material by several generations of instrumentalists who were simultaneously musicians and artisans. In other words, they not only performed "religious ceremonies" for the townspeople, but they also made music as artists, going beyond the requirements of the merely applied use of their skill.42

The further one goes into the Renaissance, the stronger is the development of individual, virtuoso mastery of improvisation, together with the evolution of "domestic" music-making (especially for the lute); here again the sensitive, analytical ear will sense the complex and persistent germination and consolidation "in the hearing" of rhythmic norms and rhythmic forms. This work
of generations led European music to such freedom of "rhythmic intonational speech" (which, essentially, is what music is, as an art of communication), that now, when we compose music, we no longer think of rhythm as a discipline of musical development, but only mark off quite roughly and in a general way the "mileposts of musical motion," i.e., the meter (measurement of equal divisions of a given piece).

The process of fixing intervals as intonationally (not mechanically) tangible and conceivable sound correlations, in the consciousness of European man, has escaped researchers. The everyday practice of "calls," of auditory signalling, demanding precise sound intervals and the precise intoning of them,\(^{43}\) of course, could not help but play a large role (alongside other sound-signal or sound-symbol requirements, etc.) in the formation of "intervallics" as a phenomenon of culture. But from the everyday practice of signalling to the working out of a discipline of the intervals of musical art (the study of sounds, correlated in systems of trichords, tetrachords, and octaves, and forming a mode) must inevitably have involved a prolonged process of realization. It is possible to assume with certainty that each interval was fixed in music (after surmounting its utilitarian practice) as the bearer of some emotionally meaningful tonus, as an intonation in the process of taking shape or
being confirmed, as a vocal or instrumental expression, or as an echo of sensations which manifests itself in a given, constant sound relation. It is not possible, as philologists and literary critics sometimes do, to limit the area of intonation to intonations of question, answer, surprise, denial, doubt, etc., for the area of intonations as the meaningful exposure of sound is limitless, but their selection in any social stage is limited, both by the epoch and, in art, by stylistics.

It is possible, for example, that intonation as a phenomenon of the interpretation of timbre (that quality by which native speech, or the voice of the mother, of one's own child, or of any woman, may be distinguished, independently of the content of the pronounced sounds and independently of feeling and emotion) had the most influence on the formation and consolidation in the consciousness of any "constants", or of any invariable sound connections which gave rise to meleg--interpretively melodious speech--from which were "distilled" stable sound connections, i.e., intervals. In this particular quality (the interpretation of timbre), intonation operates both beyond speech and beyond music, preceding both of them. I will take the liberty of stating an hypothesis; not at all doubting the value of the so-called "speech of the hand" [i.e. sign language], and fully
understanding the continuity of its origin and development, I still think that neither poetry nor music could have attained such heights in the cultural history of mankind if, in primitive mankind, alongside a cultivated, "tactile" speech of the hand, there had not also existed a sensitive, refined, "intonational speech," or rather, a language of intonations. Was not that significance of content, which is peculiar to verbal, figurative concepts of language in the elementary stages (though not exclusively) of their development, differentiated for the hearing of people of primitive cultures by the most subtle nuances of intonation, i.e., in this instance, by the interpretation of expression (melodious pronunciation) through timbre? But not only in primitive languages and cultures is such a phenomenon significant; it is familiar to anyone who studies foreign languages, not bookishly, not with the eyes, but by ear; it is known to any sensitive

---

It is enough, for example, to open an English dictionary and to analyze the process of trying to grasp words, the inscriptions of which differ from their pronunciations, and to many of which a variety of meanings is characteristic. This plurality of
philologist who tries to hear an historical document, for whom it sounds or is intoned. Among Russian linguists, the views of Senkovskii\textsuperscript{44} are very convincing and not only on the Arab language and associated phenomena, but also where he writes about music; his intonational sensitivity, the feeling for the melos of language and the melos of music, are profoundly intonational. Indeed, the way in which he unraveled Glinka's Ruslan shows that he heard the "intonational mastery" of the man (speech, music, and poetry) in their living, emotionally meaningful formation, and not merely as pronounced and sung symbols. This same virtue was undoubtedly possessed by Odoevski\textsuperscript{45} the most sensitive friend of the music of Glinka, (Not without reason are

the "functions of meaning" is differentiated not only by the grammatical connections of words, but also by nuances of the timbre of intonations. And is this not the same in the Chinese language? Not being a specialist, I only timidly state my observation; Chinese musical intonations, side by side with Chinese speech intonations, sound to me, as a sensitive musician (I do not understand the language), not only intonationally and musically logical and convincing, but, also, as conditioned by the intonations of speech. By this, I do not wish to say that Chinese music depends on speech, but that the "intervals" and quality of timbre of Chinese music and language [appear to] have a common intonational base.
communications of a "creative, laboratory order" addressed to him by the modest Glinka who rarely confided in anyone).

But whether intervals were fixed in human consciousness as the selection of the language (the sound speech) of feelings and passions, or arose from the generalized sound "mastery" of primitive cultures as the melodious sounding of expressive timbre, accumulated during the formative process of music as an independent, intonational art, their influence and role as indicators of intonational tension (the above mentioned quality of "ponderability" of intervals, their differences in utterance and perception) have semantic significance. It is not accidental, therefore, that a certain complex of sound relations occurs in any musical culture. More than that, only the occurrence of a prolonged and complicated struggle for the place, the system of relationships, and the meaning of the sound of each interval in a modal system i.e., for the quality of intervals, as this occurred in the history of European music, could have evoked such an intensive growth of musical art and could have conditioned its ideological significance.

Few musicologists are interested in the most serious processes of musical formation in historical reality. They prefer to analyze individual compositions, especially if they are universally recognized, but not to observe the
life of music in the socially determined consciousness of mankind. Thus, the important struggle, in the formation of the European modal system, for its inclusion of the "tritone" as a sound combination of equal rights,\textsuperscript{10} is left without attention with respect to the intonationally meaningful essence of this phenomenon. The problem here was not at all a fear of dissonance, sharp though it may have been for the culture and style of the epoch of medieval modes, though, of course, the conservatively narrow hearing of the medieval petty bourgeois could fear this "musical devil" no less than his modern counterpart fears the music of Stravinsky's \textit{Sacre} . . . or \textit{Les Noces}, Schoenberg's intellectualism, the "Scythian-ism" of S. Prokofiev, etc. The problem was not in the notorious rule of the "resolution" of dissonances into consonances, allegedly as an immutable demand of the ear.\textsuperscript{11} The tritone, like none of the other

\textsuperscript{10}At present, in contemporary music, the "tritone" has long since received the right of self-determination and is perceived so by the ear.

\textsuperscript{11}It is high time that the very concepts of consonance and dissonance, in their rigidly dogmatic conception, as well as of the notorious "resolutions," were relegated, in the main, to the archives. The creatively ideational life of music so corrected
intervals traditionally existing in the early Middle Ages (I mean primarily the system of Gregorian modes, organized very firmly, according to rules, by the sixth century*46), destroyed the intonational habits which had taken shape, especially in the church. This is natural. But in destroying [these habits], it was also a progressive phenomenon for European hearing; the tritone sharpened and confirmed in the consciousness the feeling of the semitone as the leading tone. This is all the more important if one accepts the entirely probable hypothesis that, in medieval

them long ago, that little remains of them except a scholastic mold. From the viewpoint of acoustics these concepts contribute little to musical creation. The intelligent consciousness of the Russian people long ago demonstrated, in the peasant music, the right of self-determination for any interval, in conformity with the voice-leading of a given, concrete style. Even before Borodin, with his brilliant, "prophetic" hearing, this consciousness managed seconds and fourths, for example, very sensitively, but not according to scholastic norms of "preparation and resolution." From the position of realistic psychologism, consonances and dissonances involve a sensation which is relative, unstable, and dependent on the expressive persuasiveness of music and the development of the "auditory perception" of a given environment, the sluggishness of keenness of its "social hearing," for it does not always occur on the basis of need or benefit; it does not always conform to the suppositions of acoustical researchers, nor to that which serves only as food for esthetes.
music of the masses (peasant music, especially dance music, but possibly also that of the urban, "local" artisan population), the feeling of major with its chief vehicle, the leading tone, removing the limits of the tetrachord, had taken shape spontaneously since olden times, perhaps even since Roman times.\footnote{47} In the face of this feeling of the leading tone\footnote{12}, the tritone, consisting of the combination of the tone which closes the lower sound series '[tetrachord]' (for example, F, the fourth degree) and the leading tone (for example, B, the seventh degree), organized the scale in a tense ascent as an unquestionable intonational unity. Into this unity, however, thanks to the insistent, sharply emphasized "ambiguity" of its motion, the "tritone" introduced an "uneasiness", a peculiar intonational instability, which the hearing had to smooth out. Thus, this interval, which is "ponderable" on the basis of its tension, organized the mode, synthesizing its component elements and at the same time intensifying their mutual conjugation and making up, out of the degrees of the mode, not separate sounds, simply adjoining one another, but tenaciously connected links, conditioning,  

\footnote{12}{Again and again I emphasize that the quality of the leading tone is not qualitatively equivalent to every semitone. In musical ethnographic studies, especially of the diatonicism of melodies, it is not necessary to identify "similar" sounds, nor to take the occurrence of semitones as the introduction and consolidation of the "leading tone quality."
by their seemingly limited independence, a limitless variety of intonational "expressions." A tone series, a scale, in becoming a graphic, strictly regulated generalization of the tones of the mode, supplanted the identification of the mode through characteristic melodic patterns, maqamat,*48 etc. The "tritone," by intensifying the sensation of the leading tone and smoothing out the intonation of the scale, introduced into melodics a heightened emotional feeling and a variety of possibilities of melodic motion and attraction. Of course, later, with the "equalization," according to the model of the major scale, of other tonalities, "tritoneness" became one of the most intensive factors of development. The interaction of "tritones" of different tonalities became possible.*49 The intensification of verticals, i.e., of harmonic complexes, was also conditioned by "tritoneness." Later, closer to our own epoch, the hearing of Europeans became more and more free to "accept" tritones as "self-determined" elements of the mode--as a still more tense sphere of the dominant; and then, a tritonal conjugation of tonalities became possible along with a new summarization of the mode, a new synthesis, by including in the mode, several links of "tritones" and "leading tones," instead of just one, and a particular intensification of the mode by means of semitones. In this formative process, the significance of Russian music
is immense; both Glinka, and especially Borodin are among the great reformers of intonation.*50 Among theorists, a profound analysis of "tritonenness" and a disclosure of the significance of this intonational sphere in contemporary music was given by the Russian musician and scholar, B.L. Yavorskiï.*51

On the other hand, the Riemann system of "functional harmony," which slavishly subordinated the minds of many theorists to itself, has enslaved the ear and consciousness of composers with its conservative, mechanical "predetermination." This system is a sad heritage of the so-called "general-bass" or figured bass, i.e., the teaching of harmony born out of the practice of organ and keyboard accompaniment—a kind of art of the accompanist. But even this practice (in its turn, possibly, engendered by the metrically measured, instrumental bass of the dance) was, in its own time, to a great extent, a progressive phenomenon, till it began persistently to impede the growth of intonationally melodic harmony (Mozart, Cherubini) and harmony as a composite of intonation and timbre. As a counterweight to the kind of harmony flowing from the mechanized continuo and the general bass and calling forth the worst kinds of homophony, intonationally melodic harmony was born naturally from the hardening lava of Gothic polyphony and formed the rich, polyphonically [oriented] harmonic "practice," in which (after
Mozart) the whole Romantic symphonic culture of the nineteenth century freely felt its way and luxuriantly flourished. Glinka, Chopin, Wagner, and Tchaikovsky, such different individuals with respect to their creative inclinations, are among the outstanding masters in this sphere! In the main, contemporaneity has still not been freed from the purposeful norms of this polyphonically harmonic culture; its intonational resources are so rich thanks to the fact that this culture feeds on the melodic nature of music, and not on motion mechanized according to the steps of the bass voice. The Riemann "predetermined" harmony, on the other hand, establishes the "vertical" as the basis of the musical fabric and mechanizes its development.*

This [Riemann] system tells no less harmfully on the development of harmony as a complex of timbres, the evolution of which is difficult to trace in the history of European music, but which unquestionably has, it its origin, the so-called diversified heterophony (the overgrowth of a melody with equally important sprouts of intonations, like a stalk overgrown with branches, and branches with leaves), a practice which is quite extensive in the musical cultures of various peoples;* this culture, systematically reorganized, reintoned, and reinterpreted by the contemporary European city has yielded luxuriant shoots in the creation of composers of diverse
persuasions, from Borodin to Prokof'ev, in our country and, in the West, first in Impressionism, then in the works of Schoenberg (especially the well-known Five Pieces for Orchestra), Verdi, and others. Stravinsky, in Sacre . . . and in Les Noces, also revealed new emotionally meaningful perspectives with the aid of harmony based on a complex of timbres. The presentiments and "gropings" of this culture are easily discovered, even in the works of Glinka, for all the strictness of his classical, melodically polyphonic voice-leading with its Mozartian clarity (in Ruslan," "Nights in Madrid", and "Kamarinskaya"). Harmony based on a complex of timbres has opened the way, again and again, to the perception in music of new aspects both of man and nature; the variety, polychromatic, and emotional sensitivity of the music, developing within the possibilities of this harmony, are unquestionable. And this path, to a considerable extent native to Russian music, as in the polyphonic, harmonic melos of Glinka and Tchaikovsky with its many-sidedness, the melos of psychological realism, and the Romantic culture of feeling, fundamentally opposes the mechanical predetermination of Riemann's "functions" and their denial of the intonational nature of music as an art, first and foremost of tuneful, melodious "speech." The intonational nature of music is alien both to notorious linearity*54 and to vertical harmony "following in the footsteps of a lifeless
bass," but it does not at all contradict harmony as a sphere of moving voices, always forming, in the aggregate, a melodic stream organized by rhythm. **Melos** creates this harmony as intonation, for only living intonation both moves and spiritualizes music.

"Pre-determined harmony," with its functions, runs counter to folk music, which is always intonationally created within the rules of "vocalness." Intonational music demands incessant activity of the hearing, in its creation as well as in its perception. Functions, which are learned by rote by the intellect, demand of the ear only a passive "accounting" of chords--their mechanical comparison and accommodation. It is not necessary to intone them. Everything is given; everything is calculated. In recent years the study of Russian music has advanced almost not at all because of the persistent concentration of theorists and musicologists on "function"--a system alien to the evolution of Russian music with its rhythmically polyphonic **melos**, in essence, but not "pre-determined," and with its development which fundamentally rejects a mechanical working-out. The technique of youthful composers, infected by "functionality," is, to a great extent, limited and even impotent.

An extremely cautious use of the dominant quality, assigned to a determined degree of the mode, and prevailing over the tonic, is characteristic for Russian Folk music.
The tonic, the basis, is the chief resting point of intona­tional striving. The striving of the voice toward it is expressed in the interchange of filled and unfilled (motion by leap) passages, and this comprises the develop­ment of melody as a method of reaching the tonic, but the tonic, of course, prevails. The hyperbolism of the domi­nant quality, arising from the attachment of a chord to the fifth degree of the major mode, including not only the leading tone but also the tritone, was, in his time, caustically noted by Glinka in the works of the Germans, and especially of Weber.* The ear of Glinka sought and found a means of overcoming this hyperbolism by the "upgrading" of the subdominant for equilibrium, especially in pauses and conclusions of motion of the music. This explains his plagal cadences. Glinka, with his sensitive melos, founded on the song-style of Russian folk music and its subsidiary voice system, understood that excessive exposure of the dominant quality in harmony ran counter to the essence of his melodics. Beside that, as a stylistic

13The famous plagalness, which is supposedly inherent in Russian folk music, and also, especially, in the music of Glinka (in which fact is discovered one of the charac­teristic features of his "Narodism")* is largely the fab­rication of Laroche, echoed by Stasov. Glinka's plagal cadences do constitute a characteristic quality of his style, which is easily explainable as it appears and is confirmed in the practice of several Russian composers, but it is far from an indigenous and compulsory feature of Russian national harmony.*
device, the balancing of dominantness with plagalness (particularly when plagal harmonics appear after dominant ones, and even after the tonic) imparts to music a measuredness of pace, an epic quality, a narrative cast. Glinka sensed well how and where to apply this, and since the musical dramatics of Ruslan demanded just such regularity, it is natural that in appropriate moments of the opera, Glinka employed this stylistic device. But his harmony as a whole is wider, more varied, and more dynamic, and, although, in general, a feeling of measure in relation to the "exposure" of dominantness is characteristic to it, still to call this harmony, in particular, plagal, is not feasible. "Functionality" is all the more alien to Glinka. Thus, in the contemporary enthusiasm for Riemann's functional harmony, one cannot help but see an impediment to the development of the national folk bases of Russian music (development, not archaization). In the evolution of western European harmony, also, not all streams lead to the hyperbolism of the bass-dominant sphere and to the attachment of voice-leading to the "functions" of the bass, rising from the practice of "keyboard" accompaniment and
the theory of the figured bass. In the process of combining the Russian song style with the foremost aspirations, for his epoch, of western European harmony, Glinka naturally favored harmony conditioned by voice-leading as an intonational process, i.e., the stylistics of Mozart and Cherubini.

In "functionalism," the following phenomena are observed: (1) There is a mechanization of the harmony of the general bass and the practice of the *continuo*, which was formerly a progressive factor. (2) The independence of harmony as the vertical aspect of music, self-sufficing and, at the same time, functionally pre-determined, is established. (3) The latter aspect leads further to the

---

14 In fact, the accompanist or "leader of the *continuo*," always and persistently seeing before him the figured bass with the melodic outline over it, naturally, had to consider quickly both physiologically and visually, what tones to use, and how to build a "superstructure with the fingers" according to the bass. This process inevitably mechanized the voice-leading, and led it to a "functionalism" which was remote from the kind of harmony which is always engendered by voice-leading as an intonational process.

15 It is interesting that one may observe a line from Cherubini and Catel, through Klein, to Dehn (in his extremely curious manual); and thus it is possible to explain why Glinka identified with Dehn. This was his contact with the French conception of harmony.
practice of harmonizing "by spots," i.e., of bringing harmonic (chordal) voices to separate points of the melody. The result of this practice is the breaking up of melodic intonations into abstract "features" of emphasis, and simultaneously the sharp isolation of the elements (melody, rhythm, harmony) which make up the musical fabric. Normally the hearing perceives this fabric, in the aggregate of elements, as motion formed by voice-leading and disciplined by rhythm. The harmonies of Mozart and Glinka are classic models of such naturalness. The same is achieved by Beethoven and Tchaikovsky. Music is perceived as a whole, and not merely as a series of harmonic "spots." The elements are not differentiated unless a conscious isolation and emphasis of the significance of one of the elements (e.g., rhythm, as this occurs in the works of Beethoven, melody, harmony, or a complex of timbres) enters into the intention of the composer. (4) Functionalism, isolating "points" of the melos, runs counter to polyphonic, harmonic voice-leading and to "heterphonic" harmony based on a complex of timbres, for "functionalism" fixes timbre by means of its rationalistic pre-determination.

But criticism of "functionalism" as a method of constraining the consciousness of composers does not in any way detract from the historical significance of the practice of general-bass harmony and the transformation
of this practice in the music of the nineteenth century, especially in the works of the Romantics. It is important only to recall that the creation of European harmony is complex, made up of a whole series of expressive stylistic tendencies, theories, and "practices," not at all united by rationalistic functionalism. In our own country the fundamental bases of Russian folk intonation, with its system of centralization on a focal point—on a tonic—and its firmly disciplined oral polyphony, constitute a method which is an intonational, not an abstractly rational, process of voice-leading, a method in which polyphony, harmony, melody, and rhythm constitute a unity. Functionalism, in our circumstances, is an impediment to development, a principle which differentiates the elements of the musical fabric in the service of the hypertrophy of mechanized harmony. The outstanding, vital trends in Western European music, however, have struggled equally with the metric, "dance" bass and its accented measures, with the pre-established motion of the bass voice as the basic of harmony, and with the hypertrophy of the dominant.

But in order to understand these processes it is necessary to return to the historical prerequisites of "functionalism," on the one hand, and on the other, to note, at least sketchily, the stages of development of European polyphony. The practice of chordal accompaniment (basso
continuo, general bass, figured bass), i.e., the practice of performance, worked out appropriate norms of harmony—the harmony of performance, but not of creative, compositional practice, between which there is a little noticed, but fundamental, difference, almost as between the process of thinking and its reproduction, between a philosopher, the creator of a world view, and the philosophers of scholastic systems, etc. Medieval theorists understood this difference in music as a difference between thought, which was both compositional and theoretical, and musica-pratica [sic.] (training and performance). In the epoch of the Renaissance, with the development of "good manners" and domestic and social music-making, the concert performer was distinguished by improvisational skills. Even if he himself was not the composer (more often he was both composer and virtuoso), this line of performance was still creative, since the practice of accompaniment demanded a different sort of skill. There is no doubt that this practice of harmony existed before its inculcation into the chamber concerto and representative theatrical style; if it was not stipulated, nevertheless it was linked with dance music, with its supporting, accentuated bass, and its constructive norms. Unquestionably, another sphere of European harmony, rising parallel to these tendencies from the womb of medieval polyphony uniting with the practice of
dance music and the practice of accompaniment (lute and keyboard), received from them a series of stimuli toward the creative recognition and establishment of polyphonically harmonic voice-leading in that stage which led on to the classical harmony of the Viennese school.

What did the practice of accompaniment (continuo) give to creation in the area of harmony? First, it worked out—and this is most important—a rapid adaptability of compositional technique to the harmonic potentials contained in any melody, in the melodic voice, but it also brought about homophony with all its positive and negative qualities (a negative one being this composing of melody in conformity to a tonic-dominant bass). Second, it promoted the rapid evolution of dance music, from the suite, with its polyphonic fabric, to the homophonic dance in the theatre and in social and domestic music-making. 16 Third, it encouraged the introduction into the musical fabric of chords of a different kind, chords of a "keyboard" orientation, chords of figuration; in that way it promoted the

16 This evolution led to the supporting, accented, "broken" bass, outlining the harmony on the strong beats of the measure, and from here to the new rhythmic formula of Romanticism which reformed the "dance," namely, the waltz.
liberation of "piano style" from unwieldy organ intonations, but it delayed the development of voice-leading based on the pianoforte timbre and a purely pianoforte instrumentation, having conditioned a generally "neutral" manner of pianism, the pianism of "keyboards" and transcriptions. Finally, it consolidated the mechanical formula of the full cadence, overexpanding its use in terms of the prevalence of the dominant quality over the tonic (I recall the characteristic profusion of the dominant seventh chord, even in the works of Weber, smothering the valuable nuclei of Weber's poetic Romanticism with its universal adaptability).
CHAPTER II

What kind of intonational processes occurred during the time of the intense evolution of European harmony from the seventeenth to the nineteenth century, the "golden age" of Classical-Romantic harmony? Alas, they do not yield easily to a generalized accounting, for both observation and analysis of them are very difficult; our contemporary thinking (thanks to the training of the hearing in the psychologically sensitive harmony of the Romantics, the Impressionists, and the Expressionists, on the one hand, in the wealth of folk melody, i.e., the music of the oral tradition on the other) is not so sharply "attuned" to all the processes of intoning concealed within the polyphonic speech of the old masters. Beside that, the scholastic, theoretical practices of counterpoint in a strict style, abstracted from living music-making (though it never actually existed in such a prepared form), have greatly "obstructed" our hearing, and we hear the polyphony of the past, to a great extent,
through theoretical systems.¹

In the polyphonic practice and creation of the Renaissance and, later, in that of the epoch of rationalistic thinking, European polyphony achieved great intellectual triumphs. The liberation from the chains of the medieval modal systems and the inclination toward a unified mode, summarized in two directions,² did not shake its creative power. Quite the contrary. Not only in the church did polyphony occupy the most important position, but also in all forms of social and domestic music-making; on the basis of the polyphonic practice of the urban musician-artisans, the instrumental suite, the first monumental form of secular music-making, the precursor of European symphonism, the first statement of instrumentalism as an ideationally generalizing, creative culture, rose from the surmounting of commonplace dance music. The consciousness of artistic quality (the level of

¹In my living contacts, I have found only two people among seriously thinking musicians, who have a keenly vital comprehension of the polyphonic language in its intonational processes. They are the Basel organist and musicologist, J. Handschin, and, in Leningrad, Prof. I.A. Braudo. I profoundly regret that the latter's thoughts and statements about polyphony are not published, at least in the form of essays, or even aphorisms.²
production), peculiar to guild workmanship and the strengthening of burgher society, both of which promoted the growth of interest in cultural pastime and the filling of leisure with "admiration" of the arts, undoubtedly raised the level of the musician-artisan's environment, providing enthusiasts for his cause.*64 The suite was one of the stages in the development of the concertante, instrumental ensemble style; the path runs from here to the form of the ensemble concerto [concerto grosso] with a group of solo voices, and further, toward the elements of the symphony, to the point of groping for the forms of the sonata allegro, in which the principle of succession or of sticking one link to another gave way to development through contrast and the system of sound-arch reoccurrences. This path is clear. It is clear that the symphony as a form, growing out of the varied practice of instrumental music-making, absorbed the metric construction of dance music with its "periodics," the technique of the basso continuo, and, to a considerable degree, homophony.

The difficulty in study does not lie here, but in the observation of the germination of instrumental polyphony and its survival in an epoch in which harmony was triumphant, the epoch of the polyphonically-oriented harmonic orchestra.*65 The phenomenon of Reger showed that the
problem was not in the revival of organ polyphony, nor in the stylization of the "contrapuntal style." Reger freely felt polyphony as living intonation; his system and way of thinking demanded just such a technique of expression and no other. I recall that A.K. Lyadov, on his return from Leipzig, told me, "And you know, Reger is heard and particularly appreciated there, on his own merits, while here, the whole point of his music escapes you." In our time, the creation of Hindemith, with its unquestionably contemporary stylistics, but perceived, at the same time, as an aboriginal, even primordial, but not as a subjective, statement, has had an even more striking effect than Reger's music did in his time. Furthermore, Reger did not feel completely free in his "orchestral use,"\(^2\) while Hindemith created both his own orchestral style and his own chamber ensemble. In fact, his chamber ensemble goes beyond the limits of the chamber style, in the usual sense, and, without losing its inner concentration, it speaks like the orchestra. Hindemith's orchestra, in its turn, is saturated with the dynamics

\(^2\)I do not at all belittle the artistic merit of the orchestral compositions of Reger, but the fabric of his score is still a thick net of barely differentiated interlacements.
and concentrated life of the chamber ensemble, without being, however, limited in its possibilities. Hindemith does not ask himself whether this is harmony or polyphony. It is always intonation, the statement of thoughts in voice-leading, governed by rhythm, not formally, but so that the rhythm helps to interpret the developmental course of ideas. There are no dead, passive voices. There is no self-loving virtuosity, but rather, the concertante quality is often present as dialogue, competition, or aphoristic statements of the voices, and is shaped with technical brilliance. The music of Hindemith represents a revival of that ancient, instrumental culture of polyphony, inspired by enthusiasm for music-making, which arose amidst the seething youth of the European burgher cities and was created, not out of the womb of the church, not out of theorizing about counterpoint, but out of the congenial commonality of interests of the guild artisan-musicians, not only fulfilling orders, but also advancing the native art, and out of the combined music-making of instrumentalists not yet changed into a "passive hundred-headed orchestra," which, in the majority of cases, obeys, not the mind, but prepared gestures, for directors with creative consciousnesses are still few.

Wagner apparently understood the mystery of how to
shape the new quality of instrumental polyphony, i.e., a polyphony replacing church polyphony, both vocal and instrumental-vocal. If he had not understood, then in his *Die Meistersinger*, a good-naturedly ironic work on the vocalizing masters, he would not have created such an instrumental atmosphere around them. He created it with tender, poetic admiration and penetration into the soul of the instrumentalism of the epoch, not stylizing, but speaking with the language, the intonations of polyphony, and not merely with categories of counterpoint. Nor can one say of the *Meistersinger* orchestra that this is the style of any kind of aristocratic chamber ensemble. Its quality is different, although, I repeat, it is not a matter of stylization. Wagner understood that the actual practice of the "Meistersingers" was, perhaps, conservative, "clumsy," and rigoristic, but because of it, shoots of democratic art and democratic music-making had already developed in the Renaissance burgher cities, especially among the guild musicians. They did not appear on the stage, but their soul, their polyphony, born out of common music-making, is in the score. And Wagner, not with the technique of *Tristan*, of course, tactfully reminded the music of the nineteenth century of the rich possibilities of the half-forgotten language of polyphony, not mechanized, but intonationally inspired, and he accomplished this in the epoch of the victorious rule of the
polyphonically-oriented, harmonic, Romantic orchestra.

In the characterization of the creation of Hindemith and the digressions to Reger and Wagner I have almost exhaustively stated my hypothesis of the first stages of the development of European instrumental polyphony from the practice of music-making by the artisans of music, i.e., of music as one of the branches of vital activity of the laboring culture in the European cities of the Renaissance and the so-called epoch of the Enlightenment. This practice worked out a polyphonic language and technique in living contact with, and almost bordering on, the similar kind of joint, collaborative singing of peasant choirs, and also in contact with the habits and norms of "music of the oral tradition," in the direct interchange of experience and competition for mastery. Researchers, struck by the monumentality and size of the church choral and organ polyphony and the luxuriousness and brilliance of concertante ensembles attached to churches, to cathedrals, and to courts, both princely and aristocratic, have lost sight of the simple phenomenon, completely understandable in a psychological sense (by the very nature of the activity, the instrumental musician
cannot function properly except in a circle of friends and colleagues\(^3\), that out of an interest in art are born. not only technical exercises for the improvement of professional skills, but also the search and contrivance for perfection of one's own art, that in the findings of this laboratory, not only virtuosity is fostered, but also creation, and that, in such an atmosphere, a living art flourishes, and not merely subjective, abstract invention. The burgher cities, having torn out with their teeth\(^69\) a place for themselves in the life of the feudal lords, lived a seething, tense existence, and whatever "my city" created, whatever and whomever it took pride in, whatever kinds of handicrafts and arts flourished in it, all this was of personal interest for each city dweller. In such conditions, the art of collaborative music-making, i.e., the art of the polyphonic, instrumental ensembles, could fully "prevail," and the dividing line between performance and creation (as in our peasant choirs, with their practice of zapevki, popevki, and podgoloski)*\(^70\) was almost

\(^3\)In my book about how the musician in me took shape and grew and how my musical consciousness matured,*\(^68\) I set forth in detail how much, in my youth, I was indebted to joint, serious music-making of vocalists and instrumentalists from the strata of "musical democracy," and how much artistry there was in them!
In spite of the powerful, long-standing growth of church and court polyphony, instrumental "polyphonism" as an independent phenomenon (i.e., not as duplication or ornamentation of vocal parts) had to create its own principles of organization, its own constructive norms, its own fundamentals of voice-leading. Already the feeling of intervals and the stylistics of the interlacements of voices were qualitatively different (from an intonational, and not an abstractly theoretical, point of view). And, while, in a constructive sense, it was possible to catch up the rhythm formulae of the dances of the epoch and the structures of dance schemes, still, in intonational development, it was necessary to grope for new paths, conforming to the nature and the timbres of instruments. It was necessary to be concerned, not about vocal smoothness, but about the expressive character of instrumental "utterance," not without regard for the peculiarity of its intonations. It is possible that the "open-air quality" of the majority of

4Undoubtedly, the foundations of the monumental orchestral technique were laid, and the organizational rudiments of the contemporary orchestra--the orchestral business and its professional ethic--were engendered, in this practice of professional, instrumental music-making.
religious [instrumental] genre evoked "utterances" especially advantageous for a given instrument, but it is more likely that something characteristic lay in the very esthetic of instrumental polyphonism with its striving toward an expressive "presentation," in contrast to the flexible rhythmic organization and ceremonial "representativeness" of church music. Just as typical here is, not the luxuriousness of ornamentation, as in the "high concert" style, but an accentuated vehemence, a "breaking up," as if the instruments were ready to enter into a dispute with one another, or were imitating the outcries of a gaping, festively noisy crowd of city dwellers. In general the expression of this polyphony is very close to the famous description of the village festival in Goethe's Faust. Unfortunately, there have been few material examples published, and they are, for the most part, fragmentary. Much must be restored from its remains in the polyphonically-oriented harmonic and homophonic, symphonic music of the eighteenth century. For example, humorous "intonational aphorisms," perhaps on the bassoon, inlaid by Haydn in the placid fabric of his symphonies, or the expressive dialogues, like human conversations (both in his symphonies and in the instrumental expression of his famous oratorios), could not merely have been the personal invention of Haydn or the
imitation of what was characteristic in the vocal style. It is more likely that, in his youth, he listened attentively and repeatedly to popular instrumental music, which was intonationally figurative, almost like living speech, and that, in addition, he himself, being of a psychological frame of reference close to the professional, artisan, musical circles, keenly understood the characteristic, expressive speech of each instrument. One must not be confused; the Haydnesque manner of singling out an instrument by means of some sort of "figurative utterance" is not an impressionistic "index" of timbre. It proceeds from the realistically expressive treatment of instruments as the bearers of living intonation, and not as "reproducers" of some line of the score, assigned to a given voice. That is why, even in the most naively harmonic or, more often, the homophonic structure of many Haydn symphonies, instrumental polyphony is heard, so characterological is the voice-leading. Of course this proceeds from the already formed, but half-forgotten practice of instrumental polyphony which was born in the environment of independent and original, artisan-professional music-making; at that time the instrument was like the voice of its "master," his alter ego, and playing on it became living speech. I cannot express my thought, or the essence of "pre-symphonic polyphony," in any other
Why did this practice not become a composed style, and why did it not attain the heights, rather than merely impregnating the rapidly developing, new polyphonically-oriented, harmonic, instrumental structure of the symphony with its essence and, for almost the entire course of the nineteenth century, wasting away as if underground, though, in fact, it was a living spring? It is understandable that church vocal polyphony ideationally destroyed itself and that organ polyphony, after Bach, grew numb and became mechanical, just as Protestantism grew numb and shrivelled, having ceased to be an oppositional religious ideology. In addition, the epoch of great rationalistic reflections gave way to concrete, revolutionary construction, and the psyche "longed for" naive, but nevertheless vital, "warm," spontaneously exciting intonations. The culture of the monothematic forms, with their abstract "elicitation" from the "leading voice," of its likenesses, became alien. The fugue ceased to be a living language. "to speak only what was important, urgent, that which directly appealed to the heart,"--thus it would be possible for musicians to formulate the desires of the mass audience of the epoch of "storm and stress" and of the French bourgeois revolution. But why did the secular style of intonationally realistic instrumental polyphony, rising in the
midst of the ossifying religious culture of canon and fugue with its rationalistic voice-leading, yield its superiority to homophony and polyphonically-oriented harmony? This style, like a fresh stream passing under the ground, only now and then appeared on the surface, till its rebirth was begun in our contemporaneity.

It is possible to distinguish one basic stylistic trend in the practices, methods, and manners of ensemble music-making, just as in the higher forms, unified by the concept of the suite (alternating links). The closer secular polyphony is to daily life, the more sharply is its realistic quality revealed—the quality of play. Let me not be suspected of "Hanslickianism."*72 "The quality of play" and polyphony based on this quality clearly constitute the youthful Renaissance manner (and even more, style) of expression of emerging secular instrumentalism. The sounds caused joy; mastery evoked emulation and admiration: the fetters of the church were cast off; instrumentalism endeavored to reflect reality in all the variety of its rhythms and sound combinations. Simultaneously with the consolidation of the new norms and habits of the trade, the individual expressiveness of the master performer grew also. Gradually, the concertante style developed more and more intensively, and with it the forms of the concerto began to be established.
Concerti grossi, cassations, divertimenti, serenades burst into the urban way of life in a broad wave; the former naive "tricks of the trade" the "democratic ways" of ensemble music-making were "ironed out," stylized, and shaped into generalized "norms of expression." "Play" was intellectualized. The Brandenburg Concerti and then the suites of J. S. Bach\(^5\) remains unsurpassed as high points of the process in question.\(^7^3\) A parallel phenomenon occurred in the secular, solo polyphonic style [of keyboard music]; in the partitas and suites of Bach and Handel and in the French musical portraits, pastorals, and dance-like pieces, the playing essence, not yet having lost its own realistic qualities, was also intellectualized and psychologized. But, simultaneously, in the sphere of solo performance, individual concertizing began to develop rapidly, and, along with it, the luxurious virtuoso style of the solo concerto, in which the "playing" principle was partially symphonized and partly degenerated into self-sufficing virtuosity.\(^7^4\) Here it is manifestly understandable that the possibilities for the polyphonic ensemble remained few.

---

\(^5\) J. S. Bach was such a giant that he is perceived, not as a personality, but as a powerful creative laboratory, in which all the creative practices, styles, tendencies and searchings of the music of his time were reforged. Thus, while the sphere of his activity is not limited to polyphony, he is always and everywhere, a polyphonist.
In the process of its intellectualization and the improvement of its ideational level, secular [instrumental] polyphony, both ensemble and solo, inclined more and more toward sonata principles and the concept of development through contrasts of ideas, and from here toward a polyphonically-oriented, harmonic cast, especially in the symphony, where the ensemble became an orchestra. In chamber music, the polyphonic, instrumental ensemble was narrowed down to a string quartet. Though inclining toward the sonata style, the chamber ensemble firmly and for a long time preserved and maintained a polyphonic cast, but very much smoothed out by the effect of Romantic homophony (the influence of the Lied); its arena, in the course of things, was especially the first two thirds of the eighteenth century. In the music of Haydn the democratic principle, established in the sources of the practice of instrumental, ensemble, "pre-orchestral" music-making, with the emphasis on expressive "playing," on "performance," succeeded in flourishing anew within the limits of the new style. All attempts to make of Haydn some sort of village Narodnik are very far-fetched. Haydn was a product of the artisan-musical culture of the city, which, by his time, had already assimilated the homophonic-harmonic style, but with the preservation of polyphonic expression in the treatment of instruments (cf., above).
The countryside could not have organized the symphonic style. The folklore patterns in the music of Haydn show more of the influence of the environs of Vienna and, subsequently, of the landed estate culture, than creation realized on a peasant, folk basis.

The bridge from instrumental polyphony to the sonata-type of harmonic thinking is formed by the brilliant, extremely witty chamber music, saturated with the joy of living, with tangible human mimicry, and with characteristic habits (like the play of the masks, the commedia dell'arte) of Domenico Scarlatti (1685 - 1757), i.e., his keyboard compositions; they represent the "free play" of a most observant mind and a sensitive ear; each thought is a spark, each utterance, a clear-cut image. Everywhere there is motion, gesture, cheerfulness. There is no disorderly agglomeration. And almost always there are dialoguing voices, but no homophonic coordination. Here, at the threshold of the rule of sonata form, we hear and feel the rebirth of the polyphonic fabric, its revitalization, and all this within a style of joyous playing.

I recall the following chronological landmarks: J.S. Bach (1685 - 1750), Rameau (1683 - 1767), Handel (1685 - 1759), Couperin ("Francois le Grand," 1668 - 1743).

Once more, the creation of music as the brilliant play of a keen mind came to light in the youthful music of Rossini, but already in a different stylistic setting.
And now it is feasible to try to give an answer to the fundamental question about the lessening of interest in complex polyphonic constructions, about the subordination to harmony of still vital, brilliant manifestations of ensemble and solo, polyphonic, instrumental playing as manifestations of the feeling of the joy of life, to the question of the prolonged pause in the just emerging development of domestic and artisan-professional, polyphonic music-making with its democratic tendencies and brilliant, realistic powers of observation. The answer must be sought only in the intonationally meaningful content of this remarkable epoch of change, in the turning of the history of European music onto the path of instrumental symphonism.

Playing, as a polyphonic instrumental art was oriented, not toward the psychology of the personality, but toward man in his social development and behavior, as the people around him saw and understood him on the strength of the external projection of his habits and feelings. The prevalence of the intonations and rhythms of the "dance" were not accidental in this period, nor were the characteristic dynamics of the motives and meter in the music of D. Scarlatti. It is as if here there is a flourish, there a stroke, fixing a gesture, here a figure unexpectedly bursting in, as if a new personage, a new mask, comes running in. Each sensation lives, not as an
internal experience, but as an occurrence observed from outside. In the works of Bach (all the more so with Handel, with his mastery of the depiction of living behavior and graphic sensations of the mass, the crowd), even in the meditative, concentrated moments of his secular, polyphonic compositions, one cannot feel the analysis of inner experience, of subjective feeling, of Schumann's "Warum?". In them, in these moments, it is felt that his ideas and thoughts, indigenous to city-dwellers, and not merely personal, emotional states, sound in such a way that lyrical generalizations are shaped here, as a whole and overall, from impressions and meditation, just as stormy, joyous feelings express themselves in a common, unified gust; dance rhythmic intonations permit one to feel, or even to see manifestations of universally familiar sensations. The play of sound is transformed into the living behavior of social man, for it is not at all an abstract sound puzzle; it is here, in formation based on the quality of play, that European musicians of the fore-epoch of a great political and ideational outburst, heard life and felt the human element.

But at the same time, at the upper levels of art, music entered ever more intensely into the sphere of ideas of contemporaneity, and its development inclined toward the mastery of symphonic sonata form, the dialectic of
the sonata quality, because only through the evolution of this form\textsuperscript{8} was it possible to express the stormy dramatic nature of the epoch, the collision of ideas and sensations, and to raise music to a still higher level of ideational content, to give a more profound analysis of the human heart. Neither the rationalism of the fugue, nor the oratorical pathos of church polyphony, nor the virtuoso brilliance of the concertante style, could express what was desired and fortokened. Even less could secular, instrumental, ensemble polyphony compete with these powerful styles and forms of music-making, even though it contained the democratic tendencies and realistic bases of its "playing culture." This polyphonism was constrained by its own narrow, artisan-professional mode of life and by its service of the ideationally cramped or official business requirements of the burgher and artisan strata of the cities. It had not yet matured to the levels of art, and its concession to the ripening culture of symphonism was a foregone conclusion; but it was just here, in the womb of ensemble music-making of the musical artisans, that the sensitive technique of playing

\textsuperscript{8} Or more properly--this category and stage of musical thinking.
in common, was worked out, preparing the way to symphony, which demanded the presence of the orchestra, e.g., a collective instrumental ensemble of a new structure, for its "expression."\footnote{83}

But these considerations still do not exhaust the process under discussion. The matter was, ultimately, decided by the emotionally oriented trend of a time of crisis. Mankind changed his world view; there was a struggle of concepts, opinions, and traditional convictions. People reinterpreted their own emotional order. By whatever intonations an epoch has been saturated, that is what it has wished to hear in music. The period of "storm and stress" in Germany was characterized by the intonations of passion, delight, and pathos, leading to anguish, clamour, and frenzy. Of course, the rhetoric of the fugue and similar rationalistic constructions could not accommodate these intonations, but in the vocal art, especially in the sphere of recitative and declamation, and in the music of the "Passion" cycles, the passionate pathos already was present, as also in various kinds of organ improvisations. That same time period also saw meditative, majestic intonations, not only in lyric poetry and drama, but in the speeches of orators, in books of philosophical meditation and in communications by letter—in epistolary language. The formation of
sentimentalism ran parallel to these developments. There was still no psychological realism with its analysis of the personal emotional life; the Romantics did not yet rave, advancing the culture of feeling, but the masses already thirsted to hear "simple speech" and tender and stirring melody, for the dominance of close family ties, of sentimentality, of the worship of the "simple customs" of unsophisticated peoples and "domesticity," of tender emotion in the presence of nature, and of quiet meditation, was drawing near. Intonations corresponding to all these inclinations evoked in music the melos of the romanza, sincere and tender; both the words and the music, for the most part not pretending to lengthy development, were cloaked with a unified intonational structure, "sounding from heart to heart."

To the present time, Rousseau's reformative, advocatory, and creative, initiatory role in the defense of, and struggle for, a "style of heartfelt intonations"--its propagation and the keen comprehension of purposefulness in its animation--is still too little estimated at its true worth and too little understood. This was the rebirth of European melos, and a new, beautiful formation of it. Through it was achieved the close contact of a multitude of listeners with professional musical art, and, by absorbing into itself a lyricism conceived in the womb
of domestic life and family traditions, the formation itself was permeated with intonations of sympathy for man.

Gluck was an outstanding bearer and spokesman of the intonational expectations of pre-revolutionary times. One of the most intelligent of composers, who clearly realized the qualities of music as living speech, an intellectualist who profoundly understood that music, like poetry and drama, is not a case of "broadcasting at random and instinctively," but rather, of "intelligent contrivance," he placed before himself distinct and definite reformative tasks. He well understood, just what people thirst to hear in music, and how, and why, and he created a series of most expressive, lyric tragedies, saturating them with the intonations desired by the epoch and--through these intonations--with contemporary content. There were endless disputes over Gluck's reforms. The problem here was the unit of word and music. This was not at all a new thing, particularly for the French of the eighteenth century with their exceptionally sensitive understanding of the culture of "lyrical speech," in which the word with its "meaningful plasticity" (the meaning of the word was at that time a sort of material for the sculpture of speech, strophe, or verse) evoked a peculiar, "inextravagant," non-self-contained melody, and, as a whole, there arose an intonationally unified
lyrical utterance.

Gluck understood well this quality of French music. But the essence of his reform is that he found new forms of this unity through the introduction into the musical theatre of contemporary, "conflicting," intonational content. The epoch of "storm and stress" impressed on him the intonations of stormy, passionate pathos; the ethical trend of philosophical thought and political dissatisfaction evoked intonations of pre-storm forebodings, of majestic thoughts and convictions, but alongside this entire structure which was tragically making itself felt, lived intonations "from heart to heart," intonations of a new world of sensations, to which everyone was drawn. The ensuing revolution fully sensed, accepted, and valued the work of Gluck. Thus, in his reform, he had to think, not so much about the unity of word and music (this goes without saying), but about the new expressiveness flowing out of the new emotional structure and content of the intonations of the environment. Consciously or not, each sensitive, intelligent composer keenly senses the smallest nuances, interruptions and, even more, the changes in the intonational structure of his time, in the way in which people state
their thoughts and feelings. Each crisis in the musical theatre and each reform of opera begins with the feeling of the inopportuneness, the obsolescence, and the deadening, of intonations even in compositions still considered as image-bearing, and ends with their replacement by compositions of a new intonational structure, as bearers of contemporary thoughts and sensations. For that reason, Gluck, Gretry, Wagner, Dargomyzhskiĭ, and Musorgskiĭ formulated their reformative ideas separately, but the essence of their work remained the same. The "differences," were contained in differences of epoch, place, time, and historical situation.

To Gluck, it was perhaps more difficult to find a corresponding rhythm of words and, in general, a poetic conformity to his music, than the reverse. Indeed, he was concerned with the Italian structure of speech and vocalization, and later on, with French poetry, though he himself was German. But, if the reform was a success, this is one more essential indicator that its essence was, first of all, in a new intonational content, a new

---

9 To say they "state" their thoughts and feelings, is not entirely accurate, for intonation, as an emotionally meaningful tonus of sounds uttered by man, is felt both in the word and in the musical sound, for intonation is, above all, a quality of interpretive utterance.
a new emotionally meaningful expression, and, only then, in the validity of the "technique" of selection of verbal material in conformity with the qualities of a given language. Glinka, as a typically intonational composer, having conceived the creation of a national Russian opera, and having already worked out the musical intonational structure, took very great pains with the search for a text as an adequate verbal intonational fabric. For him the main point was not whether a good or bad poet made the libretto; what he needed was [a librettist] who, even if only a versifier, was sensitive to the intonations necessary for his purposes. It was the same with Tchaikovsky.

Gluck so brilliantly and truthfully felt the freshness of the new intonational structure of his epoch that there are few, even to our day, who sense the stylistic dissension, almost a "musical bilingualism" in his best lyrical tragedies, betrayed by the fact that the "Rousseauisms" of his sentimental, romanza melodies are coordinated, with difficulty, with the majestic, before-the-storm pathos of tragic declamation, and do not create the unity demanded by the subject matter. But this stylistic dissension is a consequence of the organic contradiction in the intonational structure of the epoch itself, and therefore is not noticed. And the French of the revolution, who were already dancing the "Carmagnole"
and hearing a call to vengeance and struggle in the severe rhythm of the "Ça ira"\textsuperscript{85} were right when, in the music of Gluck, a composer friendly to the party, and hostile to the crown, they continued to feel that which was their own, something dear, in harmony with the pathos of the great renovation of the nation. In the revolutionary years, The Parisian people, re-intoning, in their own language, a multitude of popular tunes of the past, side by side with the creation of newer and newer songs of the streets and squares of the flaming city, did not introduce into the already shaped reserve of melodic, homophonic music (all these tunes implied the simplest accompaniment—short, vital, generalizing, and active) anything new in a structural or harmonic sense. The theorizing eye will see nothing essentially new in this mass of song and dance melodies.\textsuperscript{10} But the fact that the principle concern here is neither the "revolutionariness" of the text, nor the verbal interest, is shown by the testimonies of contemporaries as to the keen influence of the melodies, and, chiefly, by their colossal and widespread distribution and their influence on European melos. Working on the ballet, \underline{Plamya Parizha},\textsuperscript{86} where did I not meet fragments or elements, or even direct quotations, 

\textsuperscript{10}Such, in the majority of cases, was the relation to music of the French Revolution.
from the "songs and dances of the revolution"! and even some figures, heard as typically German (for example, in the works of the early Romantics), turned out to be fashioned in France. A very strong, impulsive "suggestion" issued from the dance and march rhythms inspired by the revolutionary gust. The frantic, "sparkling and bright," circle dancing of the "Carmagnole," the decisive step of the invocatory march songs, the provocativeness of couplet refrains, and especially the inexhaustible inventiveness in the melodic play with the same rhythmic formulae of a multitude of contra-danses is everywhere, and everywhere the courageous, joyous, and, at the same time, wrathful will of the masses is heard.

In this music, modest in the make-up of its elements, but stirring, displaying expression and force, there is brilliant proof that rhythm and intonation are the chief bearers of musical expressiveness and persuasiveness. If both these stimuli of expression operate, not just accidentally, nor mechanically, and if this occurs when intonations and rhythms correspond to the content of ideas and the inclination of feelings of the ruling strata of the people, then perception in its turn becomes natural and unrestrained; music is heard as true "speech" and felt as reality, as truth. When, moreover, both rhythm and intonations are generally known and
and generally assimilated, then the hearing does not have to overcome unfamiliar impressions; it only notices how, and with what mastery, the familiar elements are transformed. The consciousness compares "similarities" and distinguishes esthetically different qualities in them and the variety of life beyond them. That is why, in any epoch, sometimes in the course of several generations, a very small number of basic intonations comes to light, on the basis of which an intricate complex of creative musical phenomena is created.

In the stormy years of the French Revolution there occurred a selection of intonations which best answered the emotional "requirements" of the masses. In the sphere of these intonations, in their modification and reintonation, in their rhythmic reorganization, whether by means of the sharp emphasizing and displacement of accents, or by means of the play of durations within the tune (with the general prevalence of duple meter), in a word, in their continuous reworking, the creative imagination of known and unknown composers worked intensively, sensitively responding to the wishes of the revolutionary people; music answered reality and

11 Much was found spontaneously (even the intonations of La Marseillaise), picked up, and confirmed by life. Much then sprang up on the basis of what had been tested and experienced.
and was perceived as a real, not a forced, art. Such, it turned out at the given stage, was the art of clearly constructed, easily recalled melody, quickly grasped by the consciousness, and, like both the romanza and the dance, sharply rhythmic. Without accompaniment these tunes sound quite valid, but still their structure prompts simple harmony, and therefore such an harmonic style was homophonic. The Parisian song and dance-song of the epoch of the revolution, having spread widely, turned out to be that historical wedge which split musical development into music before Beethoven, and the subsequent music, after him, the music of the nineteenth century. Although Beethoven lived through thirty years of the eighteenth century and met the revolution at the age of nineteen, it is just with it, with the French Revolution, that the new era of music--the musical nineteenth century--begins. And it always seems as if Beethoven were not in the eighteenth century. The intonations and rhythms of the music of the French Revolution, played a huge role in his creation, with its dynamics and ardour; they, in their turn, were developed and matured in his powerful consciousness. Rhythm, in its just indicated significance in the music of the Parisian Masses, as a stimulus of expression and living development, and not as a mechanical principle of construction, becomes in Beethoven's symphonism, one may say
the primary motive force. In close unity with intonation, rhythm is the "developer" of Beethoven's ideas, disciplining the course and fulfillment of thoughts and simultaneously furthering the gigantic growth of the possibilities of musical development.* In essence, it is in the works of Beethoven, in whose creation were embodied the urgent, vital problems of music in the great historic crossing from the eighteenth to the nineteenth centuries, that development, as the basis of symphonism and as the key to the fantastic possibilities of thinking in music and by means of music, is manifested for the first time in the totality of its media. In the same way, the significance of the interval as the bearer of intonational tension grows and is extended, because the correlation of tonalities, their mutual substitution, their grouped inclusion of one another and "arched" interchange, are conditioned by their intervallic conjugations, by the quality of intonational space. In other words, the role of "intervallics" in the motion and formation of melodics and in the statics and dynamics of chords, i.e., in harmony, is carried over into the interrelation of tonalities and their mutual conjugations. The interval, the index of the degree of tension of intonation, enters now into the construction of form and overcomes the constructive
sketchiness tied to music by poetic metrics and by the
dance-quality with its regular, mechanical "division into
measures" of musical motion, paralyzing music's function
in the conception and development of ideas. \(^\text{12}\) Beethoven
understood the significance of form as a scheme, and did
not destroy the "constructivism of periods," but, over­
coming the inertness of these norms, he subordinated
them to development as a principal "accomplice," in the
growth of the possibilities of music as the bearer of
ideas.

The independence of music as an art is inconceivable
without the organization of the elements of music in a
form, as a process of the formation of intonations, i.e.,
a process of constructive principle; the temporal nature
of music--its unfolding in time--deamnds this. The
liberation of music from the buttresses of poetry, dance,
and the influence of "visualness" and the visual arts,
became apparent for the first time, with such complete­
ness, in the creation of Beethoven, and thus the prin­
ciples of organization acquired musical bases conditioned

\(^\text{12}\) In the same way, the "emotionalism" of the leading
tone is intensified and the use of this important "figure"
in the formation of tonal relations becomes refined.
Again I emphasize that, in the European modal system,
the semitone, having become the leading tone (note
sensible), is, by its very nature, an intonal phenomemon; it cannot be felt "visually."
by aural perception and creation. Therefore, all the essential qualities of intonation (the interval, the leading tone, development, and the unity of rhythm and intonation), perceived not at all abstractly, intellectually, nor from the position of "visual construction," occupied, in Beethoven's music, a place peculiar to them, consistent with the course of historical development.

Always, after epochs of intonational crises, many complex and artistically refined achievements and experiments cease to be accepted, and these paths are abandoned. New people, a new ideational direction, a different "emotional attitude," all call forth different intonations, or the re-evaluation of familiar ones. Woe to the composers who do not hear these changes! People will not listen to them, for they do not hear the idea of their music. It is the same as if a writer, established in any superior academic vocabulary of past creation, comes with this style into the literature of a new epoch, the language of which has been dynamized and morphologically and phonetically re-interpreted.

In many of its expressions, any art which has been renovated in its content, begins "from the beginning," and if not "from the rudiments," then from simpler ways and means of expression, in comparison with those which were peculiar to the preceding period of that art.
But these "rudiments," these "simple paths" most often only seem so, for the new art, in its struggle, makes a selection of the best, in terms of expressiveness and life persistency, of the experiences and achievements of the past, from those which permit reinterpretation under the conditions of a new content, a new system of thought and feeling. In the works of the great masters this is a synthesis, a summarization of everything which they need from preceding experience, and, on the basis of what has been assimilated, a powerful thrust forward into the future through the thoughts of the present. Such a master, to the fullest extent, was Beethoven. There is a simplicity in his work, which is almost "rudimentary," not only in comparison with Bach, but also with Mozart. He is a son of the epoch of the revolution, and he often uses the "method of selection and re-intonation" of very common, very accessible, even vulgar (from the position of a lofty esthetic) material; and this "baseness" sounds in his work, not only as a living word, but even as lofty expression, thanks to the ethos of his thoughts, the greatness of his intentions, and their conformity to the highest ideas and sensations of this stormy, passionate time. Thus, Beethoven is
entirely in his present.  

Revolutionary Paris, singing and dancing, setting to rhythm, and intoning "in its own spirit," a multitude of already well-known melodies (alongside the creation of new), introduced, with its "how"--its new quality of "utterance"--a contemporary system of emotions into the composed style of homophonic song-dance and romanza. This is the selection, the re-evaluation, the re-interpretation, the test of whether material and forms will bear the pressure of new ideas and sensations, and, since this is music, this test occurs through re-intoning; the tonus and dynamics are entirely different, but the material is familiar. The rhythmic accents are sharp, "intermittent"; the final cadences are clear-cut, "without flourishes"; intervals and durations, beloved and characteristic of the epoch of "La Marseillaise" and the

---

13 Even where Beethoven is a "recluse," locked into his own "solitary self," in his brilliant last quartets, he is still great and sensitive; he "sorts over," one after another--as if reevaluating them, testing their life persistency--the emotional states and ideological dead-ends characteristic for the thinker and martyr of the epoch. And here he is a son of his time. Is it not possible to observe the same thing in the works of Byron, Shelley, Goethe, Lamartine, and our Batyushkov? * 

"Carmagnole," are inlaid; the step (mouvement, tempo) is decisive; the lines of melody are severe, without superfluous decorations. This is a short enumeration of the means, by which the dynamics, the spirit, the rush, and the aspiration of revolution are introduced into a simple, homophonic mold. The mass art of flaming Paris, the music of the peoples' revolutionary enthusiasm, found its development in the powerful mastery of Beethoven, who, as no one else, had heard the explosive intonations of his time. And in his mastery we find the most characteristic of the enumerated qualities of the mass musical movement of Paris and France, which he has converted into uniquely Beethovenesque, expressive means, and has employed them on majestic scales.  

Here, as in the succeeding presentation, condensed and summarized because of the complexity and immensity of

14I do not at all maintain, with all this, that Beethoven, in terms of his world view is a consistent, orthodox revolutionary, but without the "songs of the revolution" his method of intoning (the transformation of the ideational and emotional content of the consciousness into music) and the quality of his intonations would have been different. Byron and Goethe, also, were not revolutionaries, but their intellectual aristocraticism would have been shaped differently without the dynamism of the revolution, without its stormy formation, without the "explosions" of the world of ideas.
the subject, the discussion is concerned, not with the "technicism" of Beethoven, but always about that which is basic: how the thoughts and sensations of a composer become intonations—the processes of "committing to sound" the states of his consciousness, by musical means. Only through interpretive, purposeful reproduction in sound of some mental conception (which manifests itself as intoning), occurring in some significant combination and mutual relation, are the elements of music converted into a work of art, into figurative thinking. Thus, from the point of view of music as meaning, the processes, both of musical creation (the composer's internal intoning, the "transferrence" of a state of consciousness into the language of musical elements, the hearing of what is invented by the internal ear and its technical realization), and of musical performance (the reproduction of what has been composed, when the musical art object becomes the property of the public consciousness), are coequivalent. The public consciousness either accepts, or does not accept, the musical object and its interpretation by the performer; it criticizes, fixes in the memory the whole or details, etc.; but this is the sphere of existence, the life, of the composition.
CHAPTER III

The life of a musical composition is in its performance, i.e., in the revelation of its meaning through intoning for an audience and, further, in its repeated reproductions by the listeners for themselves, if, by chance, the composition has drawn attention to itself, has excited, or has "stated" something desired by, or necessary to, a given circle of listeners. If it has answered the requirements of the mind, the feelings, or the tastes of many people, they argue about it, they demand its performance again and again, they intone it, making music in their own way, in the original fashion or in various adaptations, transpositions, or arrangements. The composition merges with the consciousness of the listeners; they keep it in mind (most often those fragments which especially move them), sing it, "hum it to themselves under their breath," at times even unconsciously or mechanically, whistle it, play it on whatever comes to hand. This is what constitutes popularity.

The life of a musical composition, its existence, very "precariously" depends on a multitude of fortuities.
For the composer this is a million torments. First of all there is the problem of achieving performance. Then, a major problem is whether the performer (director, singer, instrumentalist) will understand and appreciate the intention and the language of the composition--its meaning--and not merely "play it back" mechanically or purely arbitrarily. And indeed, the listener hears the intoning of the performer, and does not care whether it meets the author's intentions or not; particularly if the author is little known, a "tradition of appreciative judgement" has not yet been created in relation to his music (such a tradition is a major factor in the fate of compositions). In each epoch there are works of great talent, and there are composers, who never find performers of corresponding ways of thinking, tastes, and feelings. And, in comparison with the quantity of music created, the number of compositions regularly circulated in concert practice, in musical life, and in "domestic music-making," is extremely insignificant. In a word, selection, both casual and complex, operates in this realm. There are no available data from which to

\[1\] Indeed, music is an art deserving of pity. A painted picture can live in a museum or in any room; verses, if they are printed, already live; but a printed composition--sheet music--is still not music; it is necessary to reproduce it, to intone it; instruments and performance are necessary.
assert what, always and everywhere, "sounds" for the public
and what is always familiar and of unquestionably higher
quality.

I will not continue to "analyze" the causes of the
prolongation or momentariness of the existence of musical
compositions, since this "subject" is touched on for a
different, basic, and important reason, directly concerned
with questions of musical intonation.

When a musical composition answers the tastes and
various needs of the listeners, then the most stirring and
pleasing fragments, portions, greater or lesser details,
and sometimes, whole episodes, receive wide distribution
becoming firmly fixed in the consciousness. As I have
already said, these native, familiar sounds, easily recogni-
nized by anyone and frequently reproduced, merge with the
consciousness of a multitude of people, and, more than that,
with their everyday life, and take a position outside of
esthetic criteria. These could be fragments of melodies
or whole tunes, themes, figures, even a rhythmic pattern;
they may even be quite short, "rough drafts." Character-
istic, harmonic successions which are picked up by various
individual amateur music-makers and become something in
the nature of "stylistic norms" and obligatory "formulae"
in some improvisation, are no rarity. This phenomenon is especially significant in the formation of cadences (endings, "flourishes") in popular musical practice. These heterogeneous elements of a composition draw people into concerts and into theatres for the performance of the compositions themselves. In every opera there are several favorite arias, melodies, fragments, or ensembles; in symphonic compositions there are themes, sequences, expressive sonorities, even "taste treats" of timbre (dainties for the ear), and dynamically striking and spirited "developments"; but, on the other hand, there are moments of calm and meditations, and sentimental utterances. These "memoranda" become the measure of evaluation and recognition, and through them the composition as a whole is "assimilated"; like guides, they lead the thoughts and feelings of the listeners to a grasp of the entire artistic conception and form, to an analysis of the ideational content, and to an esthetic evaluation. Monumental compositions are experienced in all their details not only by professionals; but the cognition of listeners, seeking in music, first of all, a living response to, and sympathy with, the needs of mind and heart, always differs from the hearing of music as a trade, in terms of technology, constructive schemes, and norms, and the hearing of style, as a conglomeration of technical media established by academic traditions, both of which are
characteristic of professionals. Composers most often hear music, other than their own, like their own, issuing from their own habits, and if such people do not agree with the "counter-plan" of a composition they are hearing, it is for them almost a "hostile object," in which one ought to assimilate only what is of interest for "one's own cooking." Exceptions are not a rarity, but "egoism" in the listening habits of composers is still a prevailing nuance. The problem here is not an ethical one, but originates in the fact that the ideational and emotional value of music as an art is experienced and felt as more natural and welcome by the professionally disinterested strata of listeners. Patiently, through assimilation, memorization, and fixing in the consciousness of their favorite, most moving, and "memorable moments of music," they approach a composition as a summarization of the content necessary for the epoch, and then hold firmly to the artistic enjoyment they have achieved. Only in this way could the symphonies of Beethoven have become, individually, the First, Second, Third, Fourth, Fifth, Sixth, Seventh, Eighth, and Ninth Symphonies, in the European public consciousness, and not just symphonies in general; the same is true of the recognition of the Fourth, Fifth, and Sixth Symphonies of Tchaikovsky, etc.

These "memoranda," these "memorable moments"--fragments through which one gains access to the 'heart [of music]--are
guides for the memory, evaluative indicators, and norms of judgement. But, most importantly, being often reproduced and flowing into everyday life, they begin to live a kind of independent artistic life, so to speak, within the oral tradition. They sound everywhere, and enter into thought; they are not abstract presentations, but living intonations. They cannot truly be called forms, periods, schemes, constructions, or necessarily even melodies or fragments. They lose touch with the compositions which begat them; it is as if they become the words of music, and a dictionary* of them could be a guidebook to the favorite, most interesting sound combinations of a given epoch. Like words, they are wedged into newly appearing compositions, and experience a series of metamorphoses. Thus, popular "segments" or "moments of music," on the strength of their habitual intoning by many people, become something in the nature of norms of taste and evaluation; the process of popular intoning developments objects --intonations; I repeat, these are not abstract formal categories, but are a complex of musical thoughts, persistently occurring in the consciousness of a given social environment. And each listener, coming into the musical theatre or concert, involuntarily and inevitably begins an "auditory acquaintance" with a composition new to him through recognition and comparison as to whether there are elements in it of intonations familiar to his consciousness, [and through evaluation
of] how they have been transformed and into what.

In the penetration into the public consciousness of intonations characteristic of the epoch, in the seizing upon them by the hearing, in their stability in the consciousness, lies a fundamental, most important quality--the feeling of the close, inseparable link of music with reality, and consequently, that "Ariadne's thread" which leads the listener into the state of consciousness of the composer and into the meaning of his conceptions. Apart from these "sound-meaning accumulations," always evoked by the memory like the sounds and words of native speech (but without "external" representations and abstract concepts), music could not become an ideology, a figurative and cognitive activity of the consciousness, and could be no more that a guide of physiological sensory irritations, as this occurs at the "lower" stages of its cultivation. Music cannot come into being only at the moments of its reproduction and performance, and exist only as "musical literature," a very limited complex of the compositions most often performed by professionals and in domestic music-making. Not at all!

Behind them, beyond the compositions themselves, lies the world of music as the activity of the mass public consciousness, from little more than sound interjections, at times simply rhythmic intonations, and from characteristic, universally loved melodic figures, to more developed
melodic shoots and harmonic turns, and to distinctive summarizations of "extracts" from the long chain of musical impressions of the epoch. This is the "oral vocabulary of intonations" very mobile, always in the process of formation, always in a struggle of the familiar with new "contributions". But at the same time, extremely "durable," stable elements, constituting "intonational stereotypes," and overcome with difficulty, are constantly present in it. In the creation of this "vocabulary of the oral musical tradition" everyone participates, both the listeners, and the professionals of music, everyone for whom music is living, irresistible, cultural necessity. Therefore, the more subjective a composer's intonational language and its constituent elements, the more difficult it is for them to enter into the "sphere of sound ideas" of the epoch. A composition may be ideationally elevated, wise, penetratingly reflective of reality, but much time will pass before it will become generally accepted. The best of the symphonies of Beethoven (and not only the symphonies), if we examine closely their "journeys into life," advanced slowly, but, as we can see, their basic intonational content was deeply rooted in the social milieu.

The gigantic scope of [Beethoven's] creation, in terms of
the complexity of its development and its extraordinary scale, though it was not a new phenomenon (indeed, Bach had already existed), nevertheless, manifested itself anew, in an unfamiliar way, in the sphere of a non-religious musical culture. As soon as these obstacles were overcome and the Beethoven symphonies entered into the public consciousness as artistic entities, his music became a musical and ideational beacon inclusive of our days.

The presence of meaningfully exciting, popularly accessible intonational generalizations in the musical language of compositions is not vulgarity, as it has been supposed by the "dictators of taste," art critics who view music as an abstractly intellectual art. Popular intonational material becomes vulgarity either in the hands of people who consciously and sensually embellish musical trivialities, or in the hands of naive worshippers of "inner inspiration," even though animated by the best feelings of the composers. When a lofty creative mind keenly comprehends the emotionally meaningful significance of intonations which "circulate in the public hearing,"

---

We usually call them "esthetes." But the esthetic of the lofty does not at all deny the vital reality and socializing properties of art.
and on this, the only valid basis, develops ideational concepts, music is brought out of formally abstract thinking and becomes native to "mind and heart." As art it increases in value, for the authentic sound combinations of contemporaneity enter into it. But, whether these intonations turn into pearls of art or are reduced to vulgarisms is a matter of intellect, conscience, mastery, genius, and artistic sensitivity and taste. Misunderstanding of the ideational significance of Tchaikovsky's symphonism, especially in the period of modernism, is explained to a considerable extent by the absolute deafness of his realistic intonations and the occurrence of uncommon, refined, sharply subjective sound combinations in unfamiliar material, purely as flavoring.

When I state that the sources and roots of the realistic in music lie in the intonational communication of people, and in the recognition of these socializing elements of music in the compositions of the musical past and present, I am trying to base the problem of musical realism on the unquestionability of the experience of musical communication, on the continuously occurring process of assimilation, evaluation, recognition and non-recognition of the music of one's environment. In recent
times, evaluation, both positive and negative, of realistic musical compositions from the "viewpoint of the feeling of the critic" is more and more finding a place for itself in our criticism. Some compositions, according to some kinds of indicators (most often plot or program indicators) are declared to be unconditionally realistic, others, absolutely not, and this in the face of a very superficial treatment of the composer's intentions, and of the "obstacles" to musical-creative work in the searches for a new style in an epoch of the most complex "crisis of intonations." In place of realism, either condensed emotionalism, or "this pleases me," or sometimes even the promising title of a composition is [sufficient]. Feeling, in criticism, is an important property; it almost never failed Belinskii,* for example. But how intellectually well-grounded his judgments were! His sensitiveness in the definitions and evaluations of realism in Russian literature and poetry have little of the nature of "accidents of feeling."

Furthermore, in the musical criticism of our contemporaneity--criticism especially crucial in such a great epoch--it is characteristic that the concept of realism* as an artistic method, school, or trend, is not...
differentiated from the realistic roots or bases of a given art, which, in the creative experience of a given master, may become either romantic or abstractly academic, if his world view (his, i.e., the creator's, the author's) [sic.] is not realistic.

Let us take two sharp contradictions--Haydn and Mozart. They are contemporaries. They both solidly assimilated the vocationally firm, one may say, guild bases and aims of mastery, and even the vocational tenor of life and habits. Neither is ashamed to use the "small change," especially the commonplace, most habitual, intonations of their contemporaneity. Their esthetic individuality manifests itself in "selective deviations"3 from generally familiar material, and in peculiarities (the "how") of its "development" and "coloration." The further from an epoch we are, and the less we know the "musical environment" of a master and the intonations existing around him, the more often we end up removed from peculiarities of thinking and mastery, and closer to the material, the elements of music, and it seem to us that, in the area of invention of material, Mozart and Haydn were almost solitary, original

---

3Mozart, as a musical dramatist, to a considerable degree depends more on popular operatic intonations approved by the taste and sensations of the epoch.
peaks. This "shortsightedness from long range" expressed in detailed evaluations of the past, only on the basis of outstanding, individual compositions "still living among us," very much distorts the historical perspective of music.

Thus, realistic tendencies, in terms of the substantiation of their creation by means of intonations of the environment, are unquestionable in the works of Haydn and Mozart, and, through this, their music is linked with the ideas of their time. But further, a profound difference may be observed between them. Haydn, a sensible, village intellect,* endows his vocational mastery with his own sensibleness and reasonableness of thought, feeling, and skill. Haydn's innate humour, his ability to give to instruments intonations almost like the pantomime of "comic characters," his powers of observation, and the animation of his sensible imagination help him to create in his symphonies his own kind of "Flemish" scenes and pictures in "realistic sound paintings," Thus, realistic tendencies in the selection of material develop, in his mastery, in his "how," in the "representation" of material, into a striking revelation of "visible" reality. In this, he is a realist, in spite of all the narrowly mediocre,
patriarchal character of his outlooks and beliefs. But as soon as Haydn begins to create ideational conceptions, rising above everyday picturesqueness and "the dear old patterns," his religiously idealistic inclination has an influence both on the selection and on the treatment of intonations, and his inclination begins to "weigh heavily" on his perception of nature and on his practicable feeling of reality. In spite of all the "Flemish elements" in his well-known oratorios (The Creation, 1798, and The Seasons, 1800), their style and ideational content diverges to a considerable extent from the "sensibleness" of his symphonic music. However, the realistic "additions" of the composer, to the rationalistic and sentimentally deistic tendencies of the text, impart to both compositions a vital freshness, perceptible to the present time; in the final analysis, the high mastery of Haydn answered the lofty idealistic needs of the epoch and appears as their summation. But Haydn's realistic powers of observation and the trend of his art did not develop into a creative method, nor become his world view.

And what of Mozart? He is already more of an urbanite, more of an individualist, almost a "nineteenth century Romantic intellectual," in spite of the rationalistic
trend of his mastery and the erotically tinctured sensivity typical of the end of the eighteenth century. In Mozart there is no emotional balance, none of the sensibleness of reason. Inquisitiveness, even resourcefulness, are characteristic of his intellect (self-defense did not come easily to him!), and he sincerely sympathized both with Leporello and with Figaro, and, I think, also with Beaumarchais himself. Mozart's feelings are passionate, avid, and proud, in spite of all the outward show of "Rococo gallantry." A passionate nature does not obscure his role as the analyst of Eros, and, in this sphere, even with all the sweet sentimentality inherent in Mozart and the epoch, his art borders on psychological realism. Not without reason, was his influence so strong on Glinka, and especially on Tchaikovsky. The versatility of the subject matter in Mozart's plots is not sufficiently explained just by his exceptional auditory organization, which permitted him to be as if in his native element in any sphere of intonations. It is not explained by his wonderfully flexible mastery, which was capable of responding brilliantly to any commission, for Mozart was not at all a "guild artisan." He fought and suffered for his freedom as an artist; commissions were necessary in order to ensure himself this
freedom. The versatility of his creation stems from the same passionate inquisitiveness of mind and curiosity toward life. He is not at all a "naive simpleton." His interest in Freemasonry and concern with mysticism are understandable when his passionate, easily crushed nature and the delicacy of his emotional temperament are understood. Alongside him, Haydn is a monolith, a model of "sensible meaning." But the creation of Mozart is always an art of experiencing, the experiencing of a limitless world of sensations, and, through it, of objective reality, but not the reverse. He approached the feeling of a tragic dichotomy of the consciousness, and the consciousness of the nearness of catastrophe, in his Requiem (the wonderfully pre-storm condition, the pre-storm quiet and oppressive heat in the beginning, "Requiem aeternam"), through long and passionate supplication to Eros. In the experiencing of love he is everywhere exalted, in the images of Don Giovanni, in The Marriage of Figaro (is it not an "engagement," rather than a "marriage" or "wedding"?), in The Abduction from the Seraglio, and in the refined

4 Is not Mozart, for that reason, beyond nature? The Romantic culture of the feeling for nature could not be in him. But it would seem, he could not disregard Rousseau and Gluck.*95
novella, *Cosi fan tutte*, like a painting from an eighteenth century snuffbox. Everywhere his music is amiable and emotionally infectious, \(^5\), and this in spite of the aforementioned versatility.

Intonational analysis reveals the whole depth of the difference in the art of the two great contemporaries, who so respected one another's mastery. The source and prerequisites of their art were the same in many respects. The method of including "intonations of the surrounding society" in their compositions was put into practice by both of them, but the meaningful quality of the intonations chosen was different; and, in this respect, the more consistent idealist, Mozart, moved toward psychological realism, through the artistic experiencing of the most authentic feeling of love, while the more objective, "sensible meaning" of Haydn, for all the realistic figurativeness and Flemish picturesqueness of his symphonism, did not "carry" this art beyond the limits of optimism and complacency, somewhat

\(^5\) The rational, cold style of performance imposed upon Mozart by the musical "academicians of the nineteenth century" almost killed this joyous music. It is even inconceivable how the music of Mozart could have had an influence on Rossini if it were so "cold-blooded." The petty bourgeoisie of the nineteenth century could not imagine that "people in wigs" could be passionate and avid for life and love!
sharpened by his sense of humour. The symphonism of Haydn is more an attitude than an ideology. The symphonism of Mozart is full of the inquisitiveness of mind characteristic of him, but it is extremely contradictory with respect to emotions. His symphonic "swan-song," the g-minor symphony (K. 550)* does not summarize even all the nuances of his lyricism and is not the basic melody of his symphonism.

My attempt to compare Mozart and Haydn in the intonational aspect is made out of the desire to show what care is demanded by determinations of realism in music and the realism of music, and, through a comparison of the intonationally realistic tendencies and elements of the art of the two great contemporary masters, to make more precise everything said above about intonations which are accumulated by the public consciousness as a complex of characteristic indications of the music of the epoch. First of all, these intonations are qualitatively different because of selection of them by society does not present itself as a consistent phenomenon; it is directed by the tastes, the opinions, the emotions, and the esthetic and ethical views of a multitude of different people. When a composer includes in his creation certain intonations from this "arsenal of
music," fixing them in the "consciousness" of his contemporaries, he is acting with a realistic method. But the quality and meaning of intonations differ. Their selection by the composer is subordinated to the prevailing ideas, tastes, personal aspirations and feelings of the composer himself. This means that the realistic method of selection of intonational material still may not stipulate a realistic essence in the music. On the other hand, the realistic world view of the composer may convince the listeners of the realistic essence of his compositions by means of characteristic methods of stating ideas; a "sound vocabulary" which is alien or unfamiliar to the public consciousness, will earn the right to recognition.\(^6\) And further, through the persistent substantiation of the

\(^6\)A good illustration of such a case is a comparison of the intonations of Musorgskiǐ's Salambo with those of Boris Godunov. However, the whole method of Rimskiǐ-Korsakov's editing of Musorgskiǐ's music is a struggle with a realistically most valuable intonational system in the name of "neutral," "academic," technique, under the cover of the alleged ignorance of Musorgskiǐ, or the adaptation of his intonations to the "hearing" of narrow professionals and to "good tone."\(^97\)
realistic essence of his creation, by means of popular intonations which are very convincing for listeners at a variety of levels, agitating them, and becoming, the most unconditionally authentic expression of ideas and feelings for a majority of people, a composer inevitably arrives at realism and the comprehensive recognition of his music through the course of many generations. A very striking example in the instance is Tchaikovsky. The life of his music, after the death of the composer, is passing through a stormy period in the history of our country, but its persuasiveness is not diminished. More than that, the profound realization of the ideational and emotional pithiness of his symphonism falls in a period of complete triumph of the realistic world view in the entire country. I dare say that here, in such and in similar phenomena, may be observed still another criterion of the musically realistic; although already significantly removed from contemporaneity, the creative heritage of a great musician, whose method, both of the selection of material, and of its development, was wholly realistic, is admitted to the perception of an entirely different environment, a new class, a revolutionized public consciousness.

Now, after a long "preparatory digression," we may
return to Beethoven, to his sensitive intonational art, and to the realistic stimuli of the "content" of his ardent and indomitable music. It is possible either to love or not to love his music, but it is not possible to avoid being astonished by it as a Promethean Titanism, nor to bow before it as before the mighty inspiration of a great epoch. Cosmic forces can, in a moment, reduce the earth to ashes, but they created the world and the solar systems. One may argue about technique, or about tastes; one may discuss Beethoven's "lost illusions," or feel compassion for the profoundly tragic life story of the man, the solitary artist. But all this is "beside" the main point, beyond the indisputable; in the history of European music, Beethoven is the revived myth of Prometheus; his is the art of Aeschylus, Shakespeare, Michelangelo, and Lev Tol'stoi. That is why his art is full of contradictions—majestic ascents and majestic frustrations; it is tragic and joyous, but always ardent, both when he meditates and ponders reality, and when he re-creates it. At the basis of Beethoven's music, as its essence, is reality and his reflections on it, which have become intonation, i.e., thought about reality, transformed into sound.

I know that this is a very difficult phenomenon for
non-musicians to comprehend, and also for musicians, who make of music habitual and prosaic work, and not an intellectual labor which affords the joy of creation. First, they usually suppose that a thought can be expressed only by word. Secondly, they suppose that, in music, both its content and all of its component elements, are self-sufficing. Thus, "certain forms" are generated from these component elements (or, more precisely, melody, harmony, and rhythm are put into these pre-established forms), on the basis of immutable rules and technical principles, and the content is introduced into the forms. Timbers and instrumentation, within this frame of reference, are still regarded as separate areas, technically independent of composing--areas which any "good practical musician" can carry out for the composer. Such "division of labor" and of the meaningful relations in the musical are, carried to absurdity, influences the attitude toward music of people who are alien to it and do not grasp its significance in human culture. Organized physical labor is an expression of thought. The degree of tension of the swing of an axe and the force and accuracy of a blow with it against a log not only involves habit, but also a correlation of durations--the action before the blow, and
the force (accent) of the blow—gained by the consciousness as the result of experience. This is the genesis of rhythm in the work process. When, in the more complex phenomena of life and work, man conceives his own relation to them, he can reveal this conception through his work, as, for example, in the case of a chemist making an experiment. But even though the rhythm of work may be expressed audibly, there is still no music. A system of intervals must present itself, a system of sound correlations, fixed by the consciousness, making it possible to "state," not just the rhythm of a thought or an emotional state, but its quality, its meaning, figuratively revealed. Otherwise, music would say nothing to people; indeed, even words without intonation, only as concepts, could hardly be regarded as living speech! The process of formation of sound correlations did not immediately work out intonationally precise intervals, "compulsory for all" (this is an essential quality of a musical language). The presence of noises of all kinds and glissandos in the music of primitive cultures, points out the protracted nature of the process, just as in European music, while the modes were being worked out, there was a struggle for the "disciplining of tritone" and for the specificity of thirds, a struggle
having expressive significance. But why expend energy on the selection of just certain intervals, and no others, if this is only a "professional game?" It is not just for the pleasure of the "ear" that purity of intonations in music is the basis of this art.

Intonation as sound expression in speech, in language, does not demand precise intervals, and the same is true in poetry where metrics* are often self-sufficing. It is natural, however, that words as abstract concepts, terms, even action words, or words designating an object, require intonation as a special timbre or expressiveness of pronunciation, if they are included in any emotional sequence (for example, in an oratorical phrase). But such words, in themselves, are not intonational. In the area of verbal speech only the oratorical art--the speech in the theatre, in part, and the poetry, alas, of a few poets--is based on intonation as a phenomenon of meaning, not only helping graphically ("affectively") to convey the ideational significance of a word or phrase, but also carrying content within itself; without intonation there is no sound image. Of course, living, oral, human speech, especially of folk cultures, continues to possess rich nuances of intonation, and in it, in living speech,
mankind finds the means for adapting written speech, which otherwise would be connected to sound only by a logical chain of terms and concepts. I will venture to say that the art of the image in written speech has not become extinct thanks to the vitality of the intonational processes in living speech.

All these explanations are necessary to understand what is most important in music— that it is above all an art of intonation, and without intonation it is only a combination of sounds on which, in essence, the Hanslickians may "make a play on words," and that content is not poured into music like wine into glasses of various shapes, but is fused with intonation, emerging as meaning expressed in sound images, for meaning without expression, in motion, in utterance, in song, or in the playing of an instrument, is also only an abstraction. Playing an instrument without intonation is, indeed, only a "playful pastime" or a "signal for work." Beethoven, the genius of European music, although he was "prepared" by the art of generations, and even centuries, is still indebted for what he became, in terms of the content of his art (both for the entire nineteenth century, and for our time), to a profound recognition of the effective
intonations of his epoch as the foundation of his creation, and in this lies the essence of his contact with realism. Therefore, I will not attempt further to prove that Beethoven is a realistic composer; I do not feel that there is yet sufficient basis in my knowledge for that, and, my research is only a complex of investigations in the area of musical intonation and an attempt to substantiate it. But Beethoven is the most convincing example, to me, of the exposure of European music as the reflection of reality through intonation, and in this lies the force and persuasiveness of his art as an art well-grounded in reality. In further discussion I will lean chiefly on Beethoven's symphonies and several of his sonatas, in order to avoid musical examples. But I do not analyze these compositions technically (there are too many analyses of them already), and I do not examine them, taken separately, as phenomena of "musical literature." I conceive of the entire creative activity of Beethoven, in the aggregate, as an intonational formation, and I make reference to phenomena corresponding to the course of my presentation, especially those which concretely expose the direction and nature of the given formation in the historical conditions of the epoch.
CHAPTER IV

In a period of intonational crises, not only individual compositions, but also the "intonational accumulations" lying at the root of the music of the epoch, which determine both the listeners' requirements from musical art and the prevailing tastes, either fall into decay or seem artificial to the new social strata of listeners. At such a time, music seemingly discards everything superfluous, formally complex, or excessively subjective or abstract, in the name of "truth of sounds," and the battle for new intonations, for new expressiveness, begins. This battle is accomplished by a re-evaluation of the prevailing musical values in light of the new listeners' ideology. It is so much sharper if it coincides with political upheavals and a reconstruction of the state and social structures. And thus it was in Beethoven's time. The sharpness of the intonational crises led to an attempt to return the art of music to its simplest fundamental principles. This does not imply a return to a "primitive art," and the technological progress of music which had already taken place did not disappear, but was transferred onto different paths,
once the use of the means of expression, thus achieved, was permitted in a "new artistic practice." For example, it is very interesting to observe what metamorphoses the great art of European polyphony experienced in Beethoven's creation. In some cases, it is possible to speak of some naive "simplification" and conscious "awkwardness," as if the intention "did not work out"! But, in those instances in which polyphony is organically fused with Beethoven's rhythm and voice-leading, i.e., with the whole fabric of the music (but not necessarily appearing as any given form--fugue, etc.), it becomes the formation of a new polyphonic style, a new quality in the development of polyphony. In essence, any simplicity in the new art (if we reject demagogic simplifications which hide technical feebleness and the self-advertisement of mediocrities) is complex; even the slogans "back to primitivism" lead not to imitation, but to qualitatively different treatment of the "elements of primitive mastery". Most often these "primal elements" result from the refinement of the best, most penetrating discoveries of the preceding epoch, to the clearest, most concise expressive media possible.

Here is an example. The art of Beethoven advanced rhythm almost to a foremost position. To Beethoven, uncommon dimensions were necessary for the maximum expressiveness and force of influence of his symphonic conceptions.
(beginning with the Third Symphony). He required a long-lasting impact, for his music is development, as uninterrupted and prolonged as possible. Nor formal constructions nor artificial meters could withstand the pressure of Beethoven's development. Of course, only rhythm, as an organic, organizing, and disciplining principle, fused with the intonational content of all music, emerges as the "motive force" of music and the "builder of form in time." The force and degree of flexibility of the correlations of durations and accents (especially of accents) in the Third Symphony becomes more and more powerful. Beethoven employs the simplest meters, but within these "mile markers," i.e., the three-beat measures, the rhythm rages, continually breaking the metric regularity. The simple "in appearance" trochaic meter of the opening, basic theme of the symphony is changed into a sort of rhythmic hammer; juxtapositions of triple meter and within-the-bar duple meter appear as a struggle of opposing forces; thus they are both figurative and dynamic. In a word, rhythm is heard as the directing thought, as the motivating will. It is vital, and melody and harmony resist it with equal resiliency. One such means of resistance of melodic-harmonic complexes to the impact of rhythm is gradation, i.e., repetitions of the theme, either in a successive manner (sequence), or in different planes [i.e., voices]. The melody, which is graphic, in sharp
relief, and dynamically saturated, aspires to draw to a close in its own thematic aspect, but rhythm already evokes the next stage of its disclosure; the melody is "frustrated," having been led up to the point of support, and immediately sounds again, confirming its conformity to the rhythm.*103 There are many such examples; it is not possible to describe them all. Here, I only outline a characteristic picture of a "musical-rhythmic formation," in which form presents itself to the hearing as a whole, being organized from moment to moment by the entire aggregate of musical elements and rising out of their clash; but it is always perceived as "thought after thought, wave after wave."

From both well proportioned and broken gradations of different degrees of tension arise the "large-scale schemes" of form, but the rhythmic activity within the bar reveals a striking variety. As many times as one may have been amazed by the scale and tension of motion of the first movement of the Third Symphony and the laconic dash of the first movement of the Fifth, each repeated experiencing of this titanic music evokes even more amazement. Why wish for the "translation" of intonationally exposed thoughts into the language of words? Beethoven did not "translate" either Plutarch, or Shakespeare, or Schiller into the language of music; he embodied his own understanding of
reality. But, when one reads the letters of the contemporaries of the French Revolution, and descriptions of the advances of the revolutionary people and the Protocols of the Convention, when one recalls the marches of enthusiastic armies, the struggle of ideas and striking, determined individualities, it becomes clear how music of such force and such striking figurativeness was born.

Beethoven was not afraid, at times, to "lay bare" the rhythm, as if wishing to emphasize the birth of mass, spontaneous clashes from some cosmic pre-existence, and he elicits a theme from clear-cut rhythmic intonations, from which the melodic ideas sprouts. Here there is a return to the original elements of music, almost as if to its primal nature. He intones a rhythmic formula on one tone, almost without harmonic accompaniment, sometimes sparingly harmonizing it with an ostinato (the beginning of the first Allegro of the Seventh Symphony, the beginning of the Scherzo of the Third Symphony, the beginning of the well-known Allegretto of the Seventh); he employs the dispersed tones and harmonic complexes of triads, creating of them a dynamized rhythmic formula (this is a characteristic feature in the "Appasionata," like a stormy flow of waves!) and often even as a thematic image (the principle theme of the Third Symphony, the same in the Fourth, and in the finale of the c# minor, "Moonlight" Sonata); from
two tones--the upbeat and the accented first beat, which is also the simplest rhythmic formula--he obtains a whirlwind, spiral-like motion, and here, forceful and resolute music turns out to be concentrated in this simplest intonation. I do not mention examples; anyone can hear them himself in a multitude of Beethoven's works. But I would remind you of the appeals of the orators--the leaders of the people, the ebb and flow of the voices of the masses, the rhythmic intonation of drums--terrifying to the enemies of the revolution and stirringly joyful to the people struggling for it, the signals of military trumpets like the heralds of a new world¹, the "rolls" of the tympani--the triumphal and menacing roar of victories and dangers; all of such simple intonations, drawn by the events of a passionate epoch into the whirlwind of life, had no trace of "formal exercises." In those years they were sound images, in which was heard a resolute pathos, a "wide amplitude of emotions," i.e., they were intonations comprehensible to everyone, catching and overtaking everyone everywhere. From the squares and streets of Paris the citizen-soldiers of the revolutionary armies spread

¹ I would remind you of the trumpet in Leonore, which will do for an example of how an ordinary signal becomes an intonation, a sound image, "meaning without words." And it is not at all necessary for one to know the subject and situation in Fidelio.
them everywhere across Europe, and the great composer included them as intonational stimuli of development, as manful voices of reality in his music, not imitating them but creatively reconstructing them.

Thus, there are rhythmic intonations serving as stimuli to motion and to the birth of melos, and there are intonations serving as invocatory calls of the epoch, intonations of the pathos of events, i.e., the bearers of emotional tension in concise sound combinations. Finally, there are intonations of timbre; just as we distinguish the dear, well-known voices of people close to us and determine their emotional state by the "quality of sound," so, in the works of Beethoven, the timbres of instruments extend to a considerable degree the expressive significance of the themes. If rhythm gives to a theme a design, an aspect, a character, then, in transferring from instrument to instrument, the theme reveals its "emotional tonus," its qualities. Of course, we are not concerned here with intonations based on a complex of timbres, as they are employed in Impressionism (however, they also occur in the late works of Beethoven); our concern is only with the expressiveness of the timbre of a given instrument. But the intonationally figurative, expressive significance of timbre is undeniable (as an example, there are the well-known timpani in the Eight Symphony). Remarkable for the sensitivity of the expression of its timbre is the tend-
slow movement of the Second Symphony; this is not coloration; it is just the intonation of timbre, the utterance of the affable voices of near and dear people.

In the stormy, intensive formation of Beethoven's music, two basic rhythmic "stresses," duple and triple, enter into continuous contrasting interaction, not as the opposition of meters--two beat and three-beat--but as rhythmic, intonational images. The measured rhythm of the march occurs in the most varied transformations, from the resolute, iron tread of the powerful processions of the masses and the movement of armies, to the concentrated, quiet tread of people enshrouded in sorrow, or filled with the stately peace of "quiescent will." In contrast to the march quality are the spiral-form rhythmic intonations of Beethoven's Scherzi, a completely new quality of music in a triple meter. I recall two unforgettable patterns: the gradually ascending, carefully drawn melody, of the Scherzo in the Fifth Symphony, and the headlong, but clear, elastic theme of the Scherzo in the Sixth. In comparison with the good nature of "Haydn's jolly settlers," we see here a rough, juicy peasant-like joy of living, a painting of Teniers or Brueghel,*\textsuperscript{104} without the details of genre, but rather, emerging as a symphonic summarization (even somewhat dramatized, and not without humour) of a realistic intonational image--the tramp of the feet of people who
know the "meaning of the land," and who are united with it by unbreakable ties.  

I must speak again about the importance of the "march quality" in Beethoven's conceptions, but it is necessary to dwell in more detail on Beethoven's "manner" of bringing duple and triple meter into conflict, with bearing on the various "meanings" of the human tread. The march in that epoch was not only a genre of "military music," but also of the iron tread of the advancing masses; i.e., the rhythm which summarized the meaning of the movements of man and its introduction into the music of Beethoven with such an intention was a natural phenomenon. But the musical triple meter, as a rhythm, strongly depended, before Beethoven, both on the dance genre and on poetic metrics (iambic, trochaic). Mozart and Haydn did much to promote the liberation of musical triple meter, but three-beat music with its

\[ \text{In his march-like passages, also, Beethoven "takes away" the prosaicness of the genre quality, but he does it in such a way that the realistic intonational value of the seemingly commonplace image appears all the more vivid. He thinks by generalizing, not by abstracting; just as, in poetry and literature, there are words and expressions full of the "juices of life," appearing, at the same time, as pithy generalizing concepts, so, in Beethoven's symphonism, reflections in response to the voices of reality become significant. These reflections are the ideational generalizations of a creative thought, acquainted with reality, and the artistic, figurative, and emotional (Beethoven passionately loved nature and people) re-creation of reality in music.} \]
inexhaustible variety of rhythm was almost non-existent in their works.

The dances of the salons (and of the court) demanded smoothness. The accent and duration of the strong beat of iambic or trochaic were determined either by a stopping of the foot after a "leap" or a "jump," or by a sedate curtsey on quiet feet. In the village dance, the accent of "stamping the feet," trampling down the earth, from the ancient religious and ritual traditions (of feasts, holidays, fertility, etc.), was also linked with the flight of triple meter. The recreational peasant dance was inclined to be too heavy; the frame of the body lay heavy in it. The paired dance, however, permitted rather coarse intimacies (see the pictures of the Hollanders and the Flemish), but the "stamping down" of the earth weighed it down, and the more full-weighted the leap or the movement, the heavier was the body's contact with the soil. The circle dance (khorovod step) at least developed a heavy circular motion (apparently the dances to the singing of the "Carmagnole" were similar), but the "chain of hands" did not allow full freedom to the circle, for the spontaneity and violence of the rotation, gradually increasing, compelled the dancers tenaciously to hold on to one another. Only the birth of the rhythmic formula of the romantic waltz injected new life into both the dance and musical triple meter. The waltz created a paired, circular, gliding motion with light contact with the earth (the floor), drew the body upward,
inserted circulation into the structure of three-beat measures, permitting smooth melodiousness and uninterruptedness of the melody even for sixteen or more measures.\(^3\)

In its music the waltz entailed a decisive transformation of triple meter and its poeticization—a deepening of content. A new sphere of rhythmic intonation arose, a lyricism of rhythmic images, and, on the basis of the rhythmic formula of the waltz, the imagination of composers was ineffably enriched in the nineteenth century and continues to be enriched to our day.\(^106\)

My presentation has run ahead a bit. In Beethoven's music the influence of the waltz was not yet felt and could not be. The menuet was already degenerating. Both Haydn and Mozart had sufficiently re-interpreted it.

But the peasant element of triple meter strongly possessed the imagination of Beethoven; from it and from his brilliant comprehension of the new meaning of the mass circle dance, of the mass "round dance" with whirlwind and spiral-like figuration of motion, arose Beethoven's dramaticized triple meter--his scherzo. It is doubtful that these forms of a completely new quality could have

\(^3\)I cannot but point out the exemplary waltz from Tchaikovskii's "Sleeping Beauty" as a classic example of the summarization of waltz expressiveness. This is an entire poem about the waltz in which "plasticity sings."
arisen simply from the transformation of the "menuet quality" as an uninterrupted evolution. The epoch was inappropriate for such a peaceful development of forms, and even the sphere of realistic rhythmic intonations, including the everyday genre on which Beethoven leaned in the given instance, was also qualitatively different from the gallant triple meter of the menuet. Thus, Beethoven's scherzos are a consequence of the "brokenness of evolution," and that is why the freshness of thoughts, the "grip" of living observations, and the temperament which captivates the listeners, so sparkles in them. This "reorganized triple meter" of the scherzo enters

---

4 It is important to remember that when a composer is guided by the intonational "capital" of the epoch, by the "sum of the music" which is well settled in the public consciousness, in the thoughts and emotions of his contemporaries, he reveals the realistic quality of his method. But, in the selection of intonations of an epoch, it is necessary to distinguish reality, i.e., the concreteness of existence, the presence of the "sum of music" in the social consciousness, from the realistic intonations proper within this "sum," i.e., the vitally necessary ones. For example, how inert and stale is the imagination of Haydn, when he is concerned with the religious intonations of Catholicism, in spite of all his good-natured, burgher-traditional piety! Yet, how his sensible meaning and humour come to life when his imagination operates within the sphere of the "convivial" intonations of the peasants, artisans, apprentices, and inhabitants of the countryside and environs of Vienna and its famous suburbs! It was not necessary for him to "quote" from folklore. Whenever Haydn wished, the popular musical speech became his own, for he breathed these intonations.
organically into the development of symphonism and all the music of the nineteenth century, competing with the triumphant romantic triple meter of the waltz, which was also being symphonized in a motley manner, and going beyond the limits of the genre of "the waltz," per se.

In the slow movements in triple meter of Beethoven's music, most likely as a counterbalance to the Scherzo, an almost "receding" march step is heard, or the slowness of step which characterized the "strolls of a solitary dreamer" (the slow movements of the Second and Fifth Symphonies). A different type of triple meter conveys an impression of resolute, but restrained, confidence (as in the main theme of the Third Symphony) or occurs as an ecstatic, triple-metered intonation, pompous, in the manner of a hymn (the dynamically lofty transformations of the main theme in the same symphony). Later in the nineteenth century these variants of triple meter engender a magnificent response, for example, the inspired, ode-like beginning of Tchaikovsky's First Piano Concerto. Of course, there can be no question of "waltz" here; neither the tempo nor the intonational sphere has anything in common with the waltz.

In relation to Beethoven's play of imagination with rhythms as intonationally significant "qualities", it is necessary once more to point out his remarkable mastery in
the bringing together and juxtaposing of iambic and trochaic feet, now in their metric-syllabic aspect, now in their tonically accented treatment; such "development" of the rhythmic quality is just one of the noteworthy features of rhythmic musical development. In fact, if we take the iambic, it can be intoned in triple meter on the up-beat (quarter note and strong beat of the measure (half-note), but it can also sound in duple meter on the upbeat (quarter note) and accented first beat of the measure (also a quarter note). In the first instance, the iamb is intoned syllabically, in the second—tonically. It is the same if we take the dactylic, or amphibrachic, or the anapestic; the accented beat of each may be of double duration in comparison with the unaccented ones (syllabic intoning), in which case, we have the dactyl or other metrical pattern, of those mentioned, in a two beat measure; and if their percussive, accented beat is the same duration as the non-percussive ones, we may have the same pattern within the limits of a triple measure (tonic intoning); for example, I would point out the striking amphibrachic qualities of the first eight measures of the Scherzo of the Sixth Symphony, tonically intoned, but suddenly, after them, a syllabic iamb, etc., etc. The Scherzo of the Ninth Symphony is very interesting from the point of view of these comparisons of syllabic and tonic intoning of metric
patterns and the struggle between duple and triple meters.

All this is the "A. B. C.'s" of musical rhythmics, but the creative imagination of Beethoven carves figuratively striking rhythmic intonations--sections of a profoundly intelligent development of musical ideas--out of the "opposition of rhythmic rudiments." I would remind you once again of the scherzo of the Third Symphony, where the melody (tonic dactyl) springs up out of an eight-measure intoning of the rhythmic formula of tonic amphibrachic.

Summarizing what has been said, it remains only to add that Beethoven, as no one else before him, established and developed rhythm as an organic element of music, as musical [translator's emphasis] rhythm, linked by interrelations with its surrounding reality.

I now pass on to the area of intonations of an emotionally affective tonus, i.e., of melodic and harmonic conjugation. In the area of verbal speech this intonational tension does not change either the timbre of the voice, nor

---

5 In essence, we should say, of modal conjugation, since a mode is not a mechanical totality, but an intonational totality of melodic and harmonic links--the manifestation of the phenomenon of intervals in both the horizontal (melodic) and vertical (harmonic) sense, if we may express these connections graphically--rooted in the public consciousness. A scale is a step-wise, graphic representation of the tones which comprise a mode, but the mode is defined only by the quality of the conjugations of intervals of the given system. *110
the rhythmic quality of speech; by increasing or reducing its tonus, a change is achieved in the quality of word and phrase, forming questions, exclamations, answers, statements, hesitation. In vocal music, in that type where a very close intimacy of the rhythms and intonations of words and musical tones is observed (for example in the so-called recitativo-ariosostyle), music almost becomes speech, and the intonational quality of the tone-word reveals, not only the emotional meaning of what is expressed but the character of the given personage. A striking example of this is in the Dargomyzhskii opera, The Stone Guest. The prevalence of certain intervals, revealed in word and tone, in the singing of each of the characters—Don Juan, Leporello, Donna Anna, the monk—reveals their characteristic habits, temperament, manner of speech (sly-ness, ingratiating manner, wonderment, passion), even their secret thoughts, in a word, a completely living image is created. But such detail is conceivable only in the chamber style.

Beethoven was not a vocal composer, i.e., his chief strength was not in this area; therefore, it is natural that the emotionally affective manifestation of the intonational quality of his work is properly examined in instrumental expression, that is in melodic and harmonic, modal conjugation. One of the most characteristic indices,
in the case of the European mode, of the quality and degree of emotional and intonational tension, and especially for the epoch of Beethoven, is the interaction of dominant and tonic. The feeling of the leading tone and its significance in the evolution of European music has already been discussed sufficiently. By the time of Beethoven, the leading tone was the essential determinant of the mode--its high point of tension. It is natural that the sphere of harmonies linked with the leading tone, the most important of which are the chords on the fifth and seventh degrees of the mode, becomes the bearer of an emotionally tense tonus. The prevalence of these chords inevitably imparts nervousness and instability, but also the force of affective influence, alongside sensitive refinement. The intonational significance of the tonic, in connection with this process, is greatly reduced. More than that, in the nineteenth century, for example, in Tristan und Isolde--one of Wagner's most remarkable works--the efforts of thought of the composer are directed toward achieving the longest lasting tension, passion, and extent of influence by "delaying" the appearance of the tonic by all means available. The sphere of the dominant becomes the governing one. The Beethovenesque gradations, within large-scale limits are replaced by intensification of intonations, by the ebb and flow of "nervous currents of music."
It is entirely the opposite with Beethoven (and, we may add, with Glinka). The tonic, and the sphere "of the tonic," dominate in his symphonism as unconditional affirmation, persuasiveness, confidence, and rationality (as it was understood by the eighteenth century). When the norms of the correlation of tonic and dominant in the classical [musical] period\(^{114}\) permit changing the dominant of a given melody, in its turn, into a tonic, Beethoven does it, not fearing a lack of balance, in the search for the greatest affirmativeness. For example, the first theme of the first movement of the Sixth Symphony is progressively more affirmative. The theme of joy in the Ninth Symphony is persistently tonic. The [musical] period, in itself, is formed with emphasis on the balance of the dominant and tonic harmony. Beethoven, wherever it is possible strengthens the tonic. The Third Symphony is a triumph of confidence and conviction, and the tonic prevails everywhere in it and remains in the consciousness. The enormous tension and development of its first movement is achieved by the decisive prevalence of positiveness and affirmativeness, and the tonic is nowhere felt as monotony, so skillfully distributed is the dynamic, the "tension of stability," of the tonic. In fact, this paradoxical image, this tense stability, best of all communicates the basic quality of Beethoven's tonic. As an example we may
introduce the first Allegro and the finale of the Seventh Symphony. True, in the works of the French composers of the second half of the eighteenth century, the stability of the tonic was revealed in a multitude of details, but the feeling of "tenseness," as a new quality, strengthening the supremacy of the tonic, is not achieved in the general impression. Rather, one may speak there of a "judicious balance" of dominant and tonic and, consequently, of calmness and equilibrium, whereas, in the works of Beethoven there is an unconditionality of affirmation; it is the watchword and will. This quality, of course, is linked with the prevalence in the personality and life behavior of Beethoven of a profound ethicality. Ethicality always supports him. He is not a hypocrite, not a bigot; he cannot imagine art without ethos, and the loftiness of his creation is beyond doubt. But the ethical, as the deepest conviction of the rightness of the great struggle for a new life, for humanity, was rooted in the epoch, in the public consciousness. Though different social strata, different groups of people, and separate, outstanding

6 In the beginning of the first Allegro we encounter one among a multitude of Beethoven's "methods" of affirming the tonic; in the upper, melodic voice, as a supporting tone, the dominant of the given melody is intoned, but when the harmony enters, it is tonic and the upper voice is included in it in the position of the fifth of the tonic triad.
minds, each in its own way, understood the means and goals of the struggle, still the spiritual development, the ardour of the best human sensations, and the ethical animation were extremely widespread. This animation had already been prepared by the Encyclopedists, and after them it sounded everywhere—in the lofty emotional tone of works of literature, in scientific research, in oratorical speeches, even in the dialogues of the salons—and this animation was accompanied everywhere by the affirmation of the triumph of humanism. All this resounded positively and clearly in the symphonism of Beethoven. In translation into the language of intonations, the strenuous ardour of Europe was expressed in the interaction, in harmony, of the poles of melos: the dominant\(^7\) and the tonic inspiration and affirmation, but not "irritation" and "relaxation" (the discharge of nervous tension). ...e is the principle difference between Beethoven's symphonism and the symphonism of the Romantics, and even psycho-realistic symphonism. There is no "irritation," no "unevenness," no "sensuality" in Beethoven's dominant as a stimulus of intonational tension, but there is "passion," ardent pathos, anger; there is not tonic as the formal resolution of dissonances, no tonic as a state of rest, but there is

\(^7\)Dominant, in this stage of the presentation, I consider in a general way as everything which, in melody or harmony, contrasts with the tonic [1].
the tonic as the governing intonational sphere of affirmation, of firm conviction--the tonic as "tense stability."
The first and last movements of the Fifth Symphony are an example. The dramatic effect, the impetuosity, the "stretta of tempo"\(^{115}\) of the first movement, nevertheless, retain in this same movement the accent on the tonic. But the symphony is a whole, a process, the "product of intonations, as of multipliers and multiplicands." The last movement, the triumph of C major, the procession of triumphant mankind, cannot be torn away from the beginning of the symphony (I would remind you how wisely Beethoven includes in the finale the c minor watchfulness of the Scherzo); thus, all the size and scope of the tonic of the finale are united, with the angry thrust of the c minor tonic in the first movement, in one idea--struggle and joy; such is the formation of life.

In this unity the Fifth Symphony is a "tense stability," the symphony of a powerful call to battle. If we consider the movements of the symphony only as a chain of links, each of which, setting the mind at rest, compels one to forget the dramatic quality of the preceding ones, then in such a "sound series" the finale obliterates the whole tragic tension of the symphony. In the first aspect--the symphony as a unified intonational process, woven out of the conflicts of ideas and sensations--the triumph of the
The finale is heard thus; "the struggle will continue, for such is life, but now there is happiness"; but, in the second aspect, it comes out, "the struggle has ended, we will settle down in joy." I am inclined to think that the first aspect, in which the entire symphony as a whole sounds as tense stability, is more in character for Beethoven, because the joy of the finale is not a settling down on the victories of the epoch, but the splendid carrying out of an idea; for each person, joy is conceivable only in union with mankind (it is the same in the Third and Seventh Symphonies and, of course, in the Ninth with the same intonational contrast as in the Fifth, and almost with the same plan; the insertion of the watchful theme of the Scherzo into the finale is analogous to the execution of a series of former themes in the beginning of the finale of the Ninth). Beethoven surmounted any abstract festivals, any "triumphs of Reason," in the name of a celebration of the unity of mankind. The dynamism of the tonic as the expression of the joyous triumph of the masses, with military fanfares, triumphant shouts, the roaring of the streets and squares, also resounds in the finales of his overtures (Egmont, Leonore), and not as a calming down, nor as an abstract, deistic (rationalistic) or pantheistic concept. The realistic instrumental intonations of the epoch, of trumpets and tympani, the whistle of
flutes and the roll of drums, the rhythmically graphic intonations of running and agitation of a gathering crowd—all these almost naturalistic sound elements are absorbed into the tonic, and it sparkles and glitters as the summarizing, creative ideal! Such is the finale of the Egmont overture, unsurpassed in realism. Hearing it one always wants to cry, "Beethoven is with us, with our contemporaneity!"

Beethoven achieved his triumphant, tense "tonic quality" under the very keen influence of the intonations of one of the genre forms of his time. This form is almost by-passed by scholars, which is not surprising for Western European musicologists, but for us it is vexing, because with us this form has been strikingly cultivated and developed to the point of a classical image. I have in mind the kant.  

---

8The late A. V. Preobrazhenski, a modest, serious scholar, knew the significance of the kant and promoted its study in the best known of his works, which are alas, too few.
CHAPTER V

The kant, in essence, is a choral, eulogistic song, sometimes achieving the structure and scope of the ode. In the West it is lumped together with the motet. This is incorrect; the motet is more contemplative and static. In the rhythmic intonation of the kant there is always motion; it is a procession of jubilation. With intensification of tension, the movement easily becomes a march. But this is not a military, "professional" march; it is still, unquestionably, a choral song, even when it is composed instrumentally. In Russia it was known in the pre-Petrine time, and in Peter's time it was somewhat "militarized."¹ Touring Italians in the eighteenth century cultivated it in their triumphal "Baroque" cantatas, "with cannonade and fireworks," and in religious, vocal concerti. In the unjustly forgotten creation of Bortnyanskiï, an outstanding Russian master, the kant flourished. The finales of Bortnyanskiï's

¹A splendid model of the Russian kant, irreproachable as to stylistic intonation, is the melody of an ancient (the so-called "Preobrazhenskiï") march.
concerti almost always reveal, in rhythm and tempo, the motion of the kant, of the procession. Within them, the movement of joyously agitated people is sensed. Sometimes a khorovod-like ecstaticism is heard, but almost never are these finales hardened into immobile, abstract praise of the deity. It is with good reason that the concerti*118 of Bortyanskii had an incredible prevalence in all of Russia, in all corners, and served as the esthetic lure for the attraction to the church of a multitude of lovers of good singing; many people thus appeared in the church "for the concert" (including the so-called "simple people," the merchants, dignitaries, and even the governor himself!). In the midst of the immobility and ceremoniousness of the church service, when the moment came for the singing of the concerto, everyone became animated, and the cheerful, joyous intonations, absolutely devoid of allusion to asceticism, moved every heart.

In the small religious compositions of Bortnyanski, in those in which respectful reverence was not required, the joyous step of the kant was expressed in full measure, becoming at times an outspoken march, without losing the manner and intonational quality of a song, precisely of a choral song. In this music there was light, warmth, and joy. Glinka, taking aim at his enemies in the court chapel and abhorring their choral style, undeservedly
degraded the significance of Bortnyanskiǐ. He himself created the well-known finale to Ivan Susanin in the basic form of the kant; "Slav'sja" ["Be praised!"] is nothing more than a kant,*\(^{119}\) in its stylistic and expressive intonational manifestations. But Glinka truly surpassed all the Russian masters of the kant in the conciseness of form, the clarity of intonations, the ideal simplicity of step, the Russian beauty of the smooth, joyous melody, and the blending of choral song-quality with instrumental song-quality.

This digression--very condensed for such an interesting subject--into the history of the kant in Russia (and it would be possible to begin with the sources of this form in the Ukraine and its development in Rus and then in Russia) was made in order that, through the familiar intonations of the Russian kant, we might more easily and concretely examine the intonational content of this small form in the music of Beethoven. Usually the kant, in our music, enters in as an element in a more extended form, but it occupies a "crucial position" there.

I will enumerate in detail the stylistic indicators of the kant. There is a clarity of rhythmic step, but without a "military march bearing," because the "choral quality" is always heard in kant intonations, resulting
in a smoothness of melody even in the instrumental aspect of the march kant. When the kant is heroic and "enthusiastic," the intonations become "more florid," and admit the "fanfare-like quality of trumpets and tympani," but the hymn-like quality in them still softens the march character. The naturalness of melodic and harmonic correlations and the concise, clear succession of the principal chords of the mode--the "equilibrium" of subdominant, dominant, and "tonic"--are equally necessary, but, as the end result, the hearing distinguishes the directing influence of the tonic; everything flows out of it, holds on to it, and comes back to it. The orderliness resulting from this fact, and also the naturalness and clarity of construction of the period, create the organic impression that intonation, as the aggregate of all the elements of music in the process of sounding, governs the constructive logic of the period, and not that construction governs the music.

There is one more important quality of the kant; it is driven and drawn by a melody in sharp relief, which is, also, always clearly imprinted in the consciousness of the listeners. It is easy to remember and easy to sing. The kant with its melodic and constructive "accessibility," naturally, therefore, enters, if not as a formal construction as a whole (it is most often, two eight-measure
periods, governed by a four-bar melody, which in the first eight bars, is repeated literally or with different cadences, in bars 9 - 12, forms a short development of the melody, and in the last four-bars, is a repetition of the basic melody), then in its stylistic features and intonational elements, into monumental forms.*120

With this insertion the perception of long musical spaces and complicated and extended development is facilitated for the listeners; the kant, on the strength of its melodic, constructive, and general stylistic relief, becomes in itself, a familiar intonation, dear to the listeners. Recognition of its elements in monumental music promotes a more tangible grasp by the consciousness of the "temporal flow of music," and that leads to understanding. The consciousness of the listeners is turned toward the thinking of the composer and the content of the music through living intonation; perfection of construction does not attract it. In the evolution of music of the second half of the eighteenth century and the beginning of the nineteenth, the kant became a sort of short encyclopedia of the triumphant homophonic style. And if the melodics of the romanza and the developing Lied drew music toward the "household," toward domesticity (instrumental romanzas and "song without
words" increased in proportion to the development of Romanticism), toward lyrical and personal declarations, and, finally, toward sharp and refined subjective lyricism, then the melodics, and the whole style of the kant were exclusively directed toward human expansiveness, toward contact, toward concord. From the kant came drinking songs, vocal serenades, student songs, and revolutionary songs with their inevitable "processional intonational quality." The melos of the kant, especially in the course of the nineteenth century, paled and was "simplified in the manner of a march." In addition, the rhythmic intonations of dance music began to compete with the homophonic stylistics of the kant (after the eighteenth century) in the public consciousness. The melos of dance music depended on the metrical construction of periods, till waltz rhythm and the melody of the waltz carried new life, new breath and new sensations into this intonational sphere.

The stylistic elements of the kant appear, in some degree, very often in Beethoven's symphonies*121 (the subordinate part in the first movement of the Second Symphony, the beginning of the funeral march in the Third,

*Mendelssohn's "Songs without Words" became the "reference book" of the bourgeois family.
the finale of the Fifth, especially, the second theme and the hymn in the finale of the Sixth, etc.) and the rule of tonic intonations in the kant and its "processional rhythm" exerted tremendous influence on all of Beethoven's symphonism, with its "open-air character" and aspirations toward "human expansiveness," with its positive, emotional inclination--its ethos. Of course, the personal strength of Beethoven's talent, his esthetic of the ideationally lofty, created a new quality out of whatever his genius touched. But this property does not disprove the realistic quality of Beethoven's creative method, which was to hear and sensitively summarize the intonations of surrounding reality.

The instrumental-choral intonations caught in the symphonic fabric of Beethoven's music (for example, the middle part of the Scherzo of the Seventh Symphony) may be attributed to the stylistics of the kant. Finally, in the finale of the Ninth Symphony, Beethoven creates the most perfect kant, the well-known theme melody "To Joy," intoning it first instrumentally, then vocally, and varying it powerfully. A monumental kant rises whole, as a symphonized form with a huge performing apparatus (orchestra, soloists, choir). The fundamentally vocal nature of the kant, and its rhythmically dynamic construction (from processions) have been combined here, in a brilliant creative summary, in the most grandiose in
conception of all Beethoven's finales.
Alekseı' Maksimovich Gor'kiı in one of his conversations with me about music and musicians once made a wellaimed observation: "You know, a musician or musical critic is bad if he does not hear the forest, the fields, the sea, yes, even the stars! I have had to walk a lot, and sometimes I walk alone and listen; I observe almost nothing and do not hum, but only listen and hear, especially on the steppe. I think the great people in music are great, and have created excellence in the midst of our abomination, because they also know how to hear more than just music." This was at the division line of the years 1915-1916. I am reluctant to be held accountable for the absolute accuracy of the words, but I believe I have not changed them, for the very words, so keenly giving shape to the thought, were so clear at the time, that I still remember them clearly. The discussion was not about the naturalistic imitation of nature in music (about so-called "sound imitation"); I know this from the context of the conversation, touching especially on the trends of musical estheticism--fashionable at that time--which ignored
the listener and the significance of perception.

In the creation of Beethoven (as in his life) the influence of nature is unquestionable. To establish the presence of the intonations of nature, except as in the Sixth Symphony where they are concrete, is very difficult; they are realized so profoundly by symphonic thinking that they enter into the fabric of the music organically and indistinguishably. Speaking crudely, nourishment is transformed into nerves! In addition, the fear of naturalistic sound imitation plays a role here. When in the Sixth Symphony Beethoven naturally "exposes" the singing of birds, this is a consequence of a cleverly and subtly executed conception of this, the second movement of the symphony; he thereby excludes himself, his thinking, his creative consciousness which continuously reworks impressions and perceptions into the music. He hears only the voice of nature! And that is why even this feature does not signify the merely incidental [translator's under-scoring] intervention of "naturalistic intonational activity." In "The Storm" this activity prevails even more, and its symphonic transformation is not always convincing. As a whole, although this symphony is the principle object of idle judgements about nature and Beethoven, it is too saturated with "reminiscences" of the literature of the time and really with the pastoral quality,
i.e., that aspect in which nature was seen by the art (and also by the music, of course) of the end of the eighteenth century. That is why the intonations of the Sixth Symphony, as soon as they are a bit farther from the imitation of the voices of nature, do not give the feeling of reality, but involuntarily evoke literary and poetic images and the sum of the intonations of nature, accumulated by the musical art of the century. The method of Beethoven remains the same as in other symphonies. But in them there are intonations of a mankind in the process of re-establishing social reality and becoming acquainted with it. Here there are only the intonations of people who hear and see nature in this esoteric way in their art. The "pastoral quality" was a style, and the composer reflects on nature symmetrically more through style than through intonations. This is not at all an attempt to belittle the symphony. Personally I love it very much, but I perceive it only through the style of the epoch. The Third, Fifth, Seventh, Ninth, and even the Second Symphonies sound now so that the listeners need not stylize themselves, nor specially attune themselves in some way; reality is heard in them. It is possible and proper to compose symphonies in this way now. But to hear nature as Beethoven hears it in the Sixth Symphony, if one does not admire the style of the epoch, is difficult now.
The feeling of reverence and poetic delight evoked by nature in Beethoven, are to a considerable extent similar to the dreams and sensations of the author of Strolls of a Solitary Dreamer.*¹²² But these characteristics are more likely born out of the general, ideational and poetic, deistic and emotional, "mutual experiencing of contemporaneity by sensitive contemporaries," than from the imitation of Rousseau by Beethoven. Their creative natures and personalities are very different. "Rousseauisms" as intonations of the epoch are frequent in the music of Beethoven. However, if Schindler, one of the few people whom Beethoven admitted into his "creative ideational laboratory," is right, then, in the "Appassionata" sonata (op 57, f minor), we have, according to the priceless explanation of the composer himself, a representation of the poetic idea of Shakespeare's The Tempest.¹ And how different all this is from the Sixth Symphony, for it is clear that in the "Aappassionata," not only love, but also, almost everywhere, "nature in its cosmic aspect" is evoked by "magical" genius, i.e., by the art of Prospero! Here the images of the phenomena of nature are symphonized by

¹"Only read Shakespeare's Tempest (Lesen Sie nur Shakespeares Sturm)," Beethoven answered Schindler's question about the poetic idea in the sonatas in f minor, op 57, and d minor, op. 31, No. 2.*¹²³
the composer, "looking it directly in the eyes," without stylistic spectacles. Beethoven himself becomes Prospero, the recreator of the elements of life in art; he does not write music to the play of Shakespeare, but musically reflects the same poetic idea.

The world of Beethoven's lofty meditation, his reflections, his lyrico-dramatic monologues and dialogues, all the pathos of personality, the conflicts of the sensations of sorrow and joy of everyday life--indeed, this is his music, which has become the comfort of mankind. In other words, the fact that Beethoven has recreated in his art--like a cosmos--nature, mankind, and himself as a feeling and thinking personality, all this for generations of people after him who are coming, and will come to build a life, to love, and to suffer, everything in its turn, results, not merely in a group of composed and performed compositions, but also in a tremendous code of intonations, which listeners have absorbed into their consciousness from the sounding art--the aggregate of the music of Beethoven. This treasury, accumulated by the perception of generations and preserved as the "memory of the heart," is, at times, reduced (mankind is changeable, and for that reason forgetful), at times, increased, if the performance practice goes out beyond the limits of the fixed opuses, i.e., those compositions of the great musician which are repeatedly
played everywhere. But independently of these reductions and augmentations, the cultural consciousness of European mankind firmly retains a creative image of Beethoven and a figurative intonational complex, fully preserving within itself that part of his music, in the most varied auditory aspects and forms, which is most dear to the people. Thus, the music of a composer, having grown out of the intonations of preceding epochs, becomes itself the object of the intoning of professional performers and of listeners in a broad spectrum of social levels, and nourishes the music and the whole spiritual culture of succeeding generations of mankind.*124 This process continues to the time when the vital content of the intonations of a given music are exhausted, transferring partially, in a transformed aspect, into the creation of new epochs. In this "process of exhaustion" there remains less and less of the music, even of the greatest composers, till it is no longer heard; its content and spirit are gone. The refined hearing of experts, evoking "musical antiquity," can learn to understand the music which has been forgotten by mankind, and even to "involve themselves" in a distant world of sounds. But this is no longer living perception, nor that process by which music, still existing in the social consciousness, is experienced.

Such is the true life of the "sounding art" of each
composer; it lasts while its intonations live and operate, while its creative experience continues to function, being transformed and converted. Such is the real history of music, not the literary history, which brilliantly describes, analyzes, reexamines, praises, and blames (usually music which no one hears any longer, since the closer to contemporary epochs of music one is, the more summary the presentation becomes). But all this is, unquestionably, strip-farming; here are styles, genre, individual outstanding phenomena, biographies, methods, theories, ideational and philosophical theses, tastes, technologies, questions of instrumentation, performance, criticism, sincere commentary, and anecdotes. The presentation clutches now at one thread, now at another, loses its way, is interrupted. I remember, while working on the music history textbook of Karl Nef, that I experienced all these difficulties— that is interesting, this is important, another is necessary, and a third is useful to know—but to make a selection according to extra-musical signs means to miss what is most essential. The life of music as art, with such an account of everything, fails at some point; the paths of schools, styles and genre, deviations, apparent turns from a line of artistic progression into more primitive stages,
became incomprehensible.\(^2\) Also incomprehensible is the basis for determination of public acceptance or rejection of certain music, the long or short duration of the life (in performance, in music-making, in literature about music, and in letters or memoirs) of separate compositions, etc.

I do not consider my hypothesis about the "crisis of intonations" to be an absolutely reliable thread in this labyrinth of musical facts and phenomena, but I have tested it very long and carefully, and I suggest that it will not be without usefulness.\(^*\)\(^{126}\) Indeed, even an hypothesis, which unites a variety of musical phenomena in an historically explicable succession is inescapably necessary and can direct the thought of scholars into other surmises and generalizations.

The "exhaustion" of the content of intonations is a lengthy process. The difficulties linked with the fixing in the consciousness of complex music, owing to its

\(^2\)That is to say, everything else is comprehensible, from widely known first causes (economics, politics, directing the culture of mankind), but within music these causes may function either one way or another; here, indeed, is the problem for this art, if we are talking about a history of it from which one wants to learn something beside descriptions, summaries, and references.
intonational "complexity," and the necessity for repeated impressions (the "temporal" nature of this art demands more effort of attention than does perception of visual arts, which are always before the eyes) impede the process of the introduction of new sounds into the circle of universally understood intonations. The "public memory" of music is, therefore, very conservative. And that which is intonationally fixed in it and speaks to mind and heart, holds on firmly, outliving generations. The conservatism of the hearing of the perceiving social environment is well known to performers who are not inclined toward inquisitiveness nor expansion of the repertoire, for the public naturally loves to listen to the familiar; there is less attention to assimilation and more to satisfaction. Therefore, the most acute mind of the composer who is working with intonations which, as he is convinces in principle, truthfully experience and reflect reality, but which demand a high culture of hearing, may meet insurmountable obstacles in the spread of his music, and not so much in the listeners, as in the environment of sluggish performers and musical entrepeneurs. The listener is always more sensitive.

3And, of course, to managers of musical theatrical and concert organizations, whose "politics of the cash box" and rejection of the frequent "showing" of the compositions of present-day music (till some of them accidentally break through into the line of "success") is a consequence of calculation of the properties of musical perception.
and, even through his limited auditory experience, he senses vital music, where the professionals still discuss it from the point of view of a handicraft and the technology of taste, impeding its appearance on the concert stage. Musorgskiĭ's Boris Godunov was warmly met by student youth and the enthusiasts of national music, but not by professionals. The progressive public accepted the music of Musorgskiĭ "without correction," and the "censorship of the professionals," vis-à-vis this unique and independent phenomenon of Russian musical culture, would seem most severe. Why does the hypocritical mask that all the "corrections" are made for the improvement of sonority appear here? Who asks for this? Let them then correct the language of Lev Tolstoĭ and the paintings of Repin from the points of view of succeeding "grammarians" and artists of light and color tinted Impressionism!127

References to the fact that any composition of authentic talent will open the way for itself is incorrect. This is an illusion of listeners who cannot know how many compositions there were in the whole history of European music, at least of the nineteenth century, which did not find performers, or were ruined by the incomprehension of performers, or were not published, or in general were not reproduced or performed except in a narrow circle of friends. How can a talented composition make its own way
if it is played only haphazardly or is not performed at all? Let us take such a seemingly accessible area for propagation as the individual art song, the Lied. Can it be that everything of Schubert and Schumann which is not performed is bad? It may be that the songs of Hugo Wolf, occurring within the period of the flourishing of this chamber art, art now comprehended by only a small circle of listeners, on the basis of the subjectivism of their "language", but in the development of the Lied his contribution is of high artistic value. Why is its performance impeded? A great multitude of musical phenomena are in such a position. It is well known how slowly the assimilation of Beethoven's music occurred, how his symphonies—so much of a piece with his ideational generalizing, with the unity of his conception—were performed fragmentarily, and in separate movements. If Berlioz and Wagner had not been superior directors, if even such a popular composer as Grieg, who was himself a subtle pianist\(^4\)

\(^4\)However, the majority of listeners do not have any idea how little of the music of Grieg is known to them and how many compositions of superior intonational freshness, written by him for piano (even in the midst of his vocal lyricism), are never performed.
and accompanist for the singing of his wife (a sensitive performer of his vocal lyricism), had not propogated his own music, it is doubtful that the art of these composers would have comparatively quickly won over even Europe. A recent example is Scriabin. Once again, the listeners were ahead of the professionals and, of course, the critics, in relation to him.

For that reason, one cannot examine historical processes in music by limiting oneself to judgments of separate compositions, styles and composers. One must be acutely aware of the fate of certain phenomena and not place blame on the incomprehension of listeners nor the lack of talent of a composer. If selection is determined by talent or lack of talent, then why, in concert, theatrical, performance "practice," and in everyday, general and domestic music-making in any epoch, is the quantity of indisputably classic, perfect creations insignificant in comparison with that of either worthless or trivial music. Apparently the selection of music (that is, of "intonational accumulations") in the "public auditory memory" proceeds according to some paths other than those considered by professional technologists of music and judges of musical esthetics, who are usually very short-sighted, if not simply calculating, in their evaluations. And the listeners, being exposed, in general, only to those
works of composers which the critics offer to them or permit to be performed, do not suspect how much music they do not know. The "theatrical development" of even such popular operas as Faust, Carmen, Traviata, and Eugene Onegin was very convoluted before these compositions, well-known to everyone, received the style of performance which more or less answered the requirements of the composers. The intervention and struggle of the composer on behalf of the character of performance has, in many cases, improved the situation, as was the case with Verdi, but not everyone has been able to do this. "First win popularity, and then we will see!" Thus, some compositions live and remain the rest of their lives in an immediately distorted aspect, if the composer is not able to bring the practice of performance under his own editorship "during his lifetime."

All these are not incidental lamentations, but the result of prolonged observations of facts and phenomena of music and musical life, the complexity of which few have pondered. This art [of music] plays a huge role in the cultural and even simply the everyday life of people. This matter should not be treated superficially. It is necessary to understand the difficulties, linked not only with the creative work of the composer, but also with the execution of his creations in a living, sympathetic environment of
The bitter words spoken by me about the prevalence in musical performance of stagnant tendencies or "personal stakes" in virtuosity do not at all mean that I underestimate the whole cultural and historical significance of performance. Of course, one may occasionally permit himself to dream that someday the composer can simply and conveniently "write down" his ideas, without considering performers, the orchestra, or instruments, but dealing directly with a limitless world of sounds and timbres, and that corresponding instrumentation will be at his disposal. This time will come, but for the present, the inventors in this area prefer to obtain reproductions of already well-known, "qualified" music, and not to further the creation of the composers and their direct contact both with the "material of timbre" of their art, and with the listeners.∗128

The culture of performance is a matter of enormous value, and it would not occur to anyone to deny this. My characterization of "abnormalities" results, first and foremost, from the wish to explain the nature and complexity of the "intermediary" between creation (the composer) and perception (the listener). But this intermediate stage itself (performance) is a consistent, purposefully and inevitable consequence of the intonational nature of the
musical art; without public intoning (the "statement" of music aloud before listeners), there is no music in social and cultural interchange. A composition which is not intoned (vocally or instrumentally) exists only in the consciousness of the composer, and not in the public consciousness. It exists in notation, perhaps, and is published. Then there are a few lucky men, able to intone music with their internal hearing—i.e., to hear it like verse, by way of the book—who are in a position to hear it. It is possible to write many good essays about music so conceived, but for the public consciousness it remains mute. Music which is not heard is not included in the "auditory memory" of the people who are interested in the art of music, and consequently, it is not in the "storehouse" of intonations which are generally accepted by society, by the environment, by the epoch, and of course, by the [ruling] class, and which "nourish the thought and move the heart."

The conclusion is clear; the conservatism of listeners, of which many hypocritical sharp dealers complain, employing it in their own interests, is, to a considerable extent, conditioned by the sluggishness of performers, or by their enthusiasm for the superficially virtuoso "work of the fingers and vocal chords." The limitation of the performance repertoire and the senseless brilliance evoked, in the
listeners, a deadening of attention and little interest in new creative facts. Repeated performance, always of the same circle of "things of certain success," in itself leads both the hearing and the consciousness of the listeners to inertness. Music becomes either a peculiar hypnosis or an amusement. The history of composers' direct meetings and contacts with listeners indicates a growth of interest in the given creation and a more rapid process of assimilation of the given music (I have pointed out Wagner, Berlioz, Greig, and Scriabin; it is possible to add Rakmaninov and Sergei Prokofiev).

When the art of improvisation was still alive and the composer emerged as a master in this capacity there arose an even closer contact and a mutually intonational consideration between him and the listeners; there was a testing and evaluation of the influence and significance of music, which was created, as it is said, "from under the fingers," or "by ear," and the composer, according to the reaction of the listeners, could both feel and evaluate the meaning and degree of intonational significance of the "sounding material," which he used, and the pithiness of its realization.

When this great art of "oral creation," of spontaneous improvisation, fell silent, there began a terrible process of separation between the composer and the listener,
between creation and perception--one of those internal intonational crises which tend to corrode music. It led to an independent practice of formal virtuosity out of touch with creation (which is constantly being renewed and renews the life of music) and catering to the performer's "false pride." Limited by a narrow repertoire, playing on the listeners' natural difficulties in the perception of music and on listening habits which were stagnating from repeated listening to the same music, self-sufficing performance became an obstacle to the creation "of the present," rather than an activity which cultivated it. In an intonational art like music, performance is the guide of the composer's art into the environment of the listeners; it is the art of intoning. If performance, itself, is lifeless, it also renders lifeless the process of accumulation of "intonational wealth" in the public consciousness, and the reserves of "musical memory" dry up or are filled ever more strongly by cheap, entertaining and sensual, intonational elements, the evil of musical urbanism, of the "boulevard cabaret manner." It would be moralistic Don Quixoticism to declare utopian bans on this "music without music," since it is called forth by the sensual demand of the neurasthenic crowd, which is a terrible force. Such music cripples the "auditory memory" of mass perception and artistic taste, always reducing, "in the hearing" of a
multitude of people, the value of the existing reserve of intonations. It is difficult for composers to defend themselves against such music, as against the "lures of wide demand," guaranteeing success, if one does not go off into proud, solitary intellectualism. The ethical stimuli and ethical content of creation are reduced, or else a sharp break is formed between creation and the "listening habits" of the listeners. All this had made itself known in Western Europe already by the end of the nineteenth century, and, in our country, after the gradual "departure from life," one after another, of the great masters of Russian music in the classical period of its flourishing. The ethical principledness of their creation could not help but have a profound influence on intonational content, and that selection of "beloved intonations of the Russian classics," which was fixed in the consciousness of Russian society, transferred, after the Great October Socialist Revolution, into the consciousness of fantastically broad strata of listeners, and has been disseminated through the entire USSR. Mass musical amateur activity--a large musical cultural movement--has, to a considerable extent, promoted the popularization, the accumulation, the revitalization, and the establishment in the consciousness of the masses of a most valuable intonational heritage.

Thus, in our country the development of an
intonational crisis has been delayed and perhaps averted. But, even with us, the "developing self-admiration" of performance and the persistent stubbornness of the same circle of compositions, clamoring for repetition, has led to the "exhaustion of the content of the intonational reserves of society," and to the filling of them "from below" with "cabaret," sensual elements. Reference to the fact that the mass listener recognizes only the Western European and Russian classics is not true. First of all, the people for whom art presents a vital interest are never inert, and it is a lie that the public consciousness opposes the living creation of the present. The natural conservatism of hearing in the perception of new intonational content is always overcome by principledness of performance and by an intelligent, attentive approach (but not the "performer's half-condescension") to the composers and the music of the present, and the creative culture of contemporaneity. The classics, of course, should always be intoned, but alas, very little of the most valuable classical heritage is actually performed, and performers compete with one another in that.
CHAPTER VII

Two mutually incompatible phenomena, which also influence the intra-musical "crisis of intonations," complete within the culture of performance. Music does not exist without the process of intoning. The composer, in the process of creating music, intones within himself, or improvises at the piano. The listener intones "by memory," humming or playing that which has left an impression. And, of course, by the very essence of his activity, which is wholly intonational, the performer, in intoning, translates the music into reality; the particular importance of the styles of performance is attributable to this fact. But the performer's culture has two "offshoots;" either it is co-creative with the art of the composer, or else it mechanically reproduces notation according to established norms of technique. Between these extremes there is a multitude of nuances, but there are still two basic divisions of performers. Some performers hear and understand music with their internal hearing, intoning it within themselves before reproduction, i.e., before they hear it from without,
from under their fingers, or from the orchestra; others learn a composition with their eyes, analysing its construction, but they hear it only when it sounds in voices or instruments. Some know beforehand what they will hear; others only guess. All this is especially significant in the area of the conductor's art. The conductor, intoning a score which is new for him, before an orchestral rehearsal, is a creative phenomenon, or rather co-creative with the art of the composer. And he, of course, is master, to the fullest extent, of the performed composition as an organism. Most often, with conductors of this high culture, the orchestra breathes; the listener feels the music as a manifestation of organic life. It is not a matter of formal, prescribed crescendos, but of the fact that the composition is fulfilled, is saturated with waves of sound, with their ebb and flow. In spite of the variety of interacting elements making up the score, the music is developed smoothly and compactly, driven by a single will, authoritative and stern (as in the case of Mahler), or by a marvelous combination of an unconditional desire to play just as the hand of the conductor demands, combined with an emotional sincerity and nervous enthusiasm (Mottl). But in either case there is a high culture of hearing, a sensitive intellectualism and, inevitably, a control of
oneself; the listener is moved and shaken because life sounds before him. Rhythm, with these conductors, is never purely metronomic. At any moment they may fill the orchestra, like the chest, with air, and control the breathing, and at any moment they may masterfully interrupt the inertia of motion and make the orchestra flinch (like an irregularity in the heart), having altered the dynamics or tempo. They control the accents freely. To them, rhythm is felt, not as [a row of] lanterns on the highway with their monotonous regularity, but as a vitally necessary, fully understood discipline, regulated by the breathing, and serving to organize and regulate energy. As a consequence of an organic quality of intoning, the performance of music accepts any emotional tone: passionate, nervous enthusiasm, the calm feeling of self-confidence, tragic pathos, deep meditation--everything arises and takes its turn flexibly and naturally. So it was with Mottl (particularly in Tristan und Isolde); nothing was over-studied, and the possibility remained of any deviation in the interpretation at any given moment. However, one should not speak here of interpretation: The art of performance, continuing

---

1They know how to prepare a change, so that the performers instinctively go "according to the hand" (Mottl, Mahler, Nikisch,131 and Napravnik,132 are so unfairly forgotten and accused of hack-work).
to be a great and valid art form, made itself felt as moving, passionate speech! Here, then was perceived the immortality of the emotional expressiveness and power of music as **intonation**. Mottl belonged to the splendid period in which the art of conducting—an art of living intonation—flourished in Western Europe. This development was called forth, to a considerable extent, by the influence of Beethoven's creation, especially his symphonism, which demanded expressive, intelligent, and decisive intoning. Berlioz and Wagner in their performance as conductors, with the slogan "toward Beethoven" (as also in the performing art of Liszt), and with their reformative compositions, created this art, which was transformed by their followers into an unprecedented triumph of the mastery of collective intoning; the orchestra became an organism, sensitive and responsive to an infinite degree. To our day, echoes of this mastery are still felt, but little by little, it has become transformed into a constructive, metric system of time beating, with memorized gestures, visually constrained by the score. Conductors of this school, having some general musical talent, can quite harmoniously direct an orchestra (they usually stifle singers, because they simply cannot understand the correlation of breathing and meaning, conditioned by vocally palpable "intervallics"
and rhythmics), but they only imagine that they re-create music as a creative idea. Not intoning music in their consciousness, receiving it from outside, they only reproduce notation. They can carry the training of an orchestra to the limit of soulless, mechanical virtuosity. Inadvertently taking refuge in the slogan of high professionalism, they do not intone music, but perform it "metronomically," thereby aggravating the "crisis of intonation." Fortunately, there need only appear in the theatre or on the concert stage a conductor whose "intoning hand tells the mind and heart" of the orchestra, how music is "drenched with air and saturated with breathing," how instrumental intoning approximates the vocal (in terms of the comprehension of the sounding of intervals), and the listeners will immediately, joyfully and gleefully exclaim, "Here at last is music!" Musical content cannot exist without breathing, governed by natural rhythm, but these are qualities which are
organically inherent in intonation.²

In "music of the oral tradition" (folk music, for the most part), which is created and transmitted only intonationally, without notation, and always in close contact with the listeners (they are also performers), "crises of intonation," like the process described above, cannot occur, because there is no gap between creative invention, reproduction, and perception. The spread of musical life, which ensured the progress of European music, also created both the contradiction mentioned above, and the isolation one from another of the "three motive forces" [i.e., composition, performance, and perception] of the common process.

But it is necessary to digress from the internal life of music and to examine the history of European

²N. A. Rimskii-Korsakov curiously expressed himself apropos of the performance of one of his operas which very much pleased him. To my naive, youthful statement that not all the tempi of the conductor met the indications of the metronome he answered with irony, I placed the metronomic markings for un-musical conductors (he added a crude epithet); otherwise the devil only knows what they will do. A conductor who is a musician does not need a metronome; he hears the tempo according to the music." In the book, Moi Vstrechi [My Meetings], I thoroughly discuss the judgments of Rimskii-Korsakov about the internal ear and hearing.*133
musical art together with the historical evolution of all of European culture and folk life, to digress in order more deeply to understand and more objectively to grasp the life which goes on all around music. Music moves forward in interrupted evolution, amid "crises of intonations" of broad social scope and significance, in addition to those already analysed. These crises are in part similar to changes and transformations in human speech and languages, which lead to the reform and replenishing, not only of vocabularies, but of the whole inner structure of the language. Since the causes of such a "revolution of language" are well explained (by Lafargue,134 for example) acquaintance with them is useful for an understanding of the following presentation, but there is no necessity to repeat them here. I add only that intonational factors also play a significant role in developments in the area of speech and language, a larger role than is customarily supposed.3

3What a penetrating intonational development was the creation of Khlebnikov,*135 in the poetic, verbal, and linguistic culture of twentieth century Russia! And earlier, in the second third of the nineteenth century, what a response did the "movement of the Raznochintsy", with its reexamination of the values of "manorial culture" and its phenomena of language and speech, and with its transformation of Russian speech and literature, receive in all the basic paths of Russian opera--a wholly intonational genre, closely tied to the word!*136
Sometimes long before a great political and social overturns, sometimes almost on the eve of them, "excitement" manifests itself in the area of human intonational culture (language, vocabulary, speech, singing). Arguments around various elements of music, as expressive media, become sharper, more persistent, and more vicious; these are no longer incidental judgments and opinions, nor transient critical essays and notices, but a struggle for existence. A sharp division between camps is disclosed. Passions flare up for seemingly insignificant reasons. It is felt that in the mutual reproaches of opponents is hidden a dispute more fundamental than the mere divergence of artistic points of view relative to a given composition, a given composer, a given subject or libretto, or even the creative method and theoretical views of the author, as this was especially sharply revealed in the well-known dissension between Rousseau and Rameau.¹¹³⁷ I did not mention these two names from the French culture of the eighteenth century merely by chance. The process about which I am speaking can be most graphically presented in the phenomena of French, pre-revolutionary musical history. The French music of this epoch is still quite pleasant to listen to. In addition, the political, philosophical, literary, and theatrical environment of musical phenomena, like the Parisian social life, is quite well-known to everyone, and there is much
material in the Russian language about them.

The arguments concerning music proceeded on the most diverse levels: whether French opera was possible in the presence of such and such conditions of the French language; the advantage, if any, of the Italian opera; the defence of naturalness and artlessness in music in opposition to the representative, monumental, court art; the clarification of national qualities, peculiarities, and ideological positions of French music; the interrelation of words (poetry) and music, i.e., of verbal and musical intonation in the lyrical musical theatre; discussions of subject matter, etc. In the voluminous and varied correspondence of Grimm*138 alone, it is possible to find a multitude of facts and judgements which reveal the purport of the processes occurring in music. It is the same in the memoirs of Gretry,*139 and especially in the works of Rousseau, not only in his specifically musical works (musically creative and literary), but also in his other works, including "The Confessions."*140

In spite of the quantity of groupings, the generalized lines of arguments and conflicts, like the notorious agitation with the "Buffonisti" (around Pergolesi's La Serva Padrona) and the battle of the Piccinists with the Gluckists, are quite easily distinguished. These are
only conflicts coming to light on the surface, but behind them, behind the "fencing duels" of tastes were concealed the rivalry between the aristocratic and the democratic arts of music. If music had been for this epoch a formal construction, "sound architecture," but with no room in its edifices for the human heart to live, it would not have drawn such exceptional attention to itself as an expressive force which was necessary for the "third estate" to possess. The two classes battled; people clashed irreconcilably in everything—in ideology, in politics, in economics, even in daily life, and in their manner of living. It would seem that music would have had a small place here, and its significance would have to be called into question! But it turns out that each phenomenon in musical life, which was in the slightest degree striking, became a social development in Paris. More than that, each compositional innovation in the area of musical media of expression, was seriously discussed, for not a single medium was put into practice as self-sufficing, nor was it perceived as such. Thus, in the public thinking of pre-revolutionary France, music joined the ranks of those ideational phenomena and factors which serve the creation of a new social system. Music of a lofty esthetical system of ideas was reinterpreted (Gluck); music—the naive, simple-minded, warm-hearted
world of the "lower classes"--emerged with such an emotionally persuasive system of intonations that it was not possible to resist them. This new, above all lyrical, system of intonations triumphed decisively in the most diverse nuances of the romanza and song-dance genre; from the rural, open-air, folk intonation and the sentimental expression of lyricism in the melodies (laconic, comfortable, complete in their unity of word, musical tone, and interval) of city-dwellers, artisans, and the petty bourgeoisie, to the romanzas in "pastoral style" which were sung in the environment of Marie Antoinette. But as the "laboratory for the intonation of the melos of the third estate" there was, of course, the brilliant, witty sphere of the French comic opera vaudeville. From the vaudeville ditties of the "carnival theatre" during the epoch of Le Sage, there emerged an emotionally melodic turmoil of intonations developing in close unity with the songs of the blocks, the streets and boulevards, the squares and cafes of Paris, at the height of the eighteenth century, which confused the defenders

4 A monument of this style is Choix de chansons mises en musique par M. de la Borde, vv. I - IV, Paris 1773 (an excellent publication with the plates of J.M. Moreau). A selection of typical romanza intonations is in the collection of Rousseau, Les Consolations des Miseres de ma Vie (1781).
of the by then old-fashioned, sedate, declamatory melos of a declining, royal France.  

The date of the presentation of the opera-vaudeville, Le devin du village, by the "plebian" Rousseau in the court theatre at Fountainbleu (October, 1752) is almost the turning point in the development of the "crisis of intonations" of pre-revolutionary France, a crisis which decisively revived music as a new style of expression, a new melodic speech; how all this was reflected in the music of the revolution and influenced the creation of Beethoven, in which it was synthesized, was examined above. It is most essential [to understand], in the entire development of the intonational crisis of this epoch, that the battle was not for an illusion of sound architectonics, but for expressiveness of music on a wide scale, from oratorical pathos to the idylls of domesticity, from lofty lyricism to naive, warm-hearted ditties. Rather, intonation began to dictate to musical architectonics, saturating the life of musical periods with intensive expressiveness, strengthening and emphasizing the affirmativeness of the tonic, and, above all,  

5. This [vaudeville] material is inexhaustible in the realism of intonations representing personages of the most diverse strata, in characteristics which are revealed intonationally, and in the diversity of situations.
extending the size and scope of monumental schemes; all this is audible in the titanic symphonism of Beethoven, and all this was evoked and tested by the requirements of new ideational and emotional content. Moreover, almost every one of the characteristic thematic intonations of the symphonies of Beethoven is concrete and convincing because it has behind it the authentic soil of the mass intonations from the whole epoch of a "crisis of intonations". The crisis was evoked, even in the preparatory stage of the revolution, by the decisive conquest of the most important posts in the area of spiritual culture by the ideologies of the "third estate." The crisis spread proportionately to the growth of revolutionary enthusiasm among the working masses, as they united in their burst of joyous lyricism and re-forged the most diverse layers of intonations. Of the writers of the epoch, Rousseau felt most keenly the necessity for the rejuvenation of music, and the spiritual bankruptcy of the monumental style of declining feudalism. And, although, in his dispute with Rameau, each of them was both right and wrong (Rameau, as the outstanding rationalist and theorist of the epoch of enlightened absolutism, recognized the logic of harmonic voice-leading in the European mode and, naturally, fought for a high, progressive professionalism), still the
conviction of Rousseau as to the importance of expressive, natural melody (i.e., intonation) to the life of music in the hearts of the listeners, was, at this stage in the history of music, a revelation of his philosophical, profoundly penetrating mind and his understanding, however naive it may have been, of expressive song style as the basis of musical progress. Rameau substantiated the theoretical possibilities of the evolution of the mode and of harmony, but without a revolution in the area of musical intonation, in material which was becoming old-fashioned and losing the force of emotional persuasiveness, even Beethoven would have had difficulty in creating music of such expressive force, and in prevailing over the inertia of antiquated schemes. But neither Rameau nor Rousseau could have estimated the triumph of a new organizing force, the forms of the sonata allegro, the dynamism of which presented the only possible way of overcoming the musical logic of the constructions of a rationalistic epoch (already becoming formalized), and of feeling musical form as an organic process of development. The triumph of this form marked the completion
of a complicated crisis. 6

6The expressiveness of symphonism is contained within the form of the sonata allegro. Elasticity--resistability combined with pliability--is present in this form, as a living sensation for composers, and promotes an extraordinary intensity and expressiveness of musical development. These qualities are wholly comprehensible and concrete for composers, but, apart from music, they are understood with great difficulty, in the same way as sensations of the leading tone, mode, the interval, and development--concepts which are palpable for musicians. The scheme of the sonata allegro is rudimentally simple, to the point of naïveté and the meaning and significance of a form as the formation of an idea cannot, in any way, be explained to anyone through it. On the other hand, forms which are merely constructive schemes do not live. The discovery of the sonata allegro form may only be compared in importance with such phenomenon in the evolution of hearing as the securing in the consciousness of a system of elastic, tangibly "ponderable" intervals (the dynamism of sound-space). To anyone who does not feel the elasticity of the sonata allegro in the same way as the elasticity and "ponderability" of the relations in any interval, it is difficult, even impossible, to become a musician. This is simply a deafness of the[ musical hearing] (not a physiological deafness, of the ear, but just, I repeat, a deafness of the hearing). It is not possible to be an artist if one does not understand the connections between nuances of color and chiaroscuro, even though one may discern colors perfectly well, in the daily round, of life. One cannot evaluate the charm of design, if one does not understand how difficulties of expression must be overcome by perceptive vision (not the eyes in an anatomical sense, but artistic vision--an activity of social man). Therefore, in my opinion, musicologists who assert that they reveal the content of music, without hearing a musical form as a process of thought--without feeling, for example, the elasticity of the sonata allegro form--improvise "their own content" to a musical accompaniment, but do not think in common with the composer. But merely to a musical accompaniment, one may do whatever one chooses. 143
A marvelous perspective was opened to music, on a level with the other manifestations of the spiritual culture of mankind, it could express in its own media the complex and subtle content of the ideas and feelings of the nineteenth century.
CHAPTER VIII

Our knowledge of the musical culture of the Mediterranean area, in terms of intonation, is both meagre and changeable, which is a great pity, for the origins of European musical culture are there.

Much has been written about the music of Greece, and much may still be written. But of what does such writing consist? It consists of theoretical directions and systems, some discourses about music, some very indistinct information about musicians and musical contests, and more distinct information about the place and significance of music in the social life of Greece. The very interesting doctrine of ethos seems to give the key to the recognition of the intonationally expressive force and the persuasive influence of music, but within the limits of a description, not a solution of the musical essence, of the phenomenon. Neither the nature of singing in the Greek culture, nor the vocal elasticity of the interval, is very clear qualitatively and technically; the connections of poetic rhythm with musical rhythm
are, for me, personally, still not clear. Of the music of Rome we simply know nothing of a musically positive nature. Of course, judging by the Greek study of ethos, the hearing of antiquity stood on a high level in terms of the differentiation of the intonational meaning of each separate mode. Indeed, the characteristics of the ethos of ancient modes which have survived to our time, could be the remains of the primitive magic of sacred incantational formulae, linked with certain traditional melodic turns, which were preserved with care. But how much, for how long, and, in general, when, these ethical qualities of modes were forms of living perception of music, intoned in a certain way, cannot be asserted with any precision. I, personally, am inclined to believe that the greater part of the forms of lyrical poetry and especially of mass lyricism, as also of poetic metrics, were created in close intonational unity with melodics, but I am not in a position to prove this conviction of mine, because the intonational evolution of modes, intervals, and other elements of musical antiquity does not lend itself to a more precise definition with the same clarity with which I can comprehend this evolution in relation to Western European music. The epochs of "crisis of intonations" are fully distinguishable in the latter. There undoubtedly were such crises in Greece, which is apparent from the discovery of complex intonational
transformations in poetic rhythmics and in the development of rhythmic forms of tragedy. But the danger of modernization of these phenomena (as this has occurred with Euripides in the work of Innokentiya Annenskii)*144 is always present here. Modernization is perhaps legitimate for attracting the attention of the public to an interesting, pithy phenomenon; as a basis for musical intonation, however, it is completely useless. In addition, Greek terminology, which is, to the present time, not clear, and is linked with philology, as well as with musical and intonational phenomena, is of little help here; only a thoughtful study of the practice of folk creation, transferred from the stage of acoustical measurements into the stage of recognition of an intonationally artistic process--I mean a study of the conditions of living sound, still existing in the conditions of our time--will help to hear that which occupied the thoughts of Aristoxenus (born about 354 B.C.), the Greek writer most sensitive to the intonational phenomena occurring in music. His Elements of Harmony and fragments of his Elements of Rhythmics truly help to explain much in the evolution of hearing and in the practice of living sound.*145

With the dissipation of Greco-Roman culture and the contact of late antiquity with the East, there occurred a new synthetic formation of musical, intonational cultures
in the world centers of civilization at that time. The first, and last, codex of concrete musical melodies, undoubtedly occurring as the organic selection of the melos of the Mediterranean area, is available still in the organized discipline of Christian worship, the so-called Gregorian Chant. There is full substantiation for supposing that, from the first centuries of the existence of Christian communities, there occurred a complex process of reinterpreting the musical intonations of the entire Mediterranean world. The practice of propagating Christianity without waiting for the establishment of new melodies for religious songs, demanded the employment of well-known, popular melodies, with the poetic lyricism of early Christianity and religious texts applied to them.\(^1\) Christianity was also a "psychic [intellectual] reformation," and, for that reason, it is natural that, in emotionally ecstatic circles of believers, especially in groups of exalted seekers of the deity connected with the philosophical trend of Gnosticism,\(^*\) new creation in the area of poetic lyricism had a place; undoubtedly it was

---

\(^{1}\) The practice of reinterpreting tunes, of transferring them into a new emotional context, was also widely employed in the epoch of the French bourgeois revolution, and is always employed in periods of "intonational crisis." These crises cannot be regarded as a decisive repudiation of "old musical practice"; they are a struggle for a new meaning in music, and thus also a demonstration of the recognition of the ideational significance behind the music.\(^*\)
linked, and very closely, with the improvisation of tunes in various "modal inclinations," and with the influence of a variety of national cultures.

This ongoing process of the reevaluation and fusion, in a new emotional order, of the lyrical melodies most adaptable to it and most accessible to the consciousness of the Christian masses, ran parallel to the creation of new melodies, and may be defined as a crisis of intonations in the lyricism of the Mediterranean area, within the conditions and properties of "music of the oral tradition." With the official recognition of Christianity by government in the fourth century, there very likely began a further period of the development of song creation, serving the official needs of the new religious centers, but, first and foremost, there was a selection and codification of the sung lyricism which was already fixed in the consciousness of believers. It is not surprising that in Rome, where the practice of the emotional and lyrical influence of the church was understood better than in sophistically philosophizing Constantinople, there came to life, in the sixth century, a splendidly constructed codex of the intonational lyricism of the divine service, the Gregorian Chant, also of course, not taking shape immediately. This codex, if it did not entirely stop the flood of ecstatic lyricism outside the church (a phenomenon which
was not much encouraged, with a view toward the liquidation of heresy), at least directed it along a definite intonational channel.

The stages in the evolution of poetry and sung poetic lyricism in this critical period of Mediterranean culture are impossible to retrace; one must not forget that this covered a period of almost six centuries. The scope and dimensions [of the problem] are insurmountable, and the musical intonational material must be restored in reverse, by analogy with succeeding phenomena. In addition, the musical folklore (i.e., the intonational basis, for the investigator, of listening habits and the culture of hearing) [in this extended period] is unknown. Even the "break-through" of the instrumental intonations of those distant centuries is an "area of obscurity"! As regards the various kinds of motive forces in this prolonged intonational revolution, I will permit myself one assumption; rhythmic intonation, the combination of word and sound, from which a variety of vocal genre of that period was derived, is an independent art. The traces of this independence, but only in a refined melodic and harmonic aspect, are preserved to the present time in the forms of the chamber vocal style--the romanza, the Lied, etc.--if they are examined from an intonational point of
view. 2 The struggle which occurred in the rhythmic intonationa melopejak, 153 in a psychological connection, was probably a struggle for free melodic improvisation, within the limits of the possibilities of the practice at that time, of course. Since improvisational, melodic singing, appearing as personal creation, was linked with ecstatic conditions and with individual deviations (especially in Gnostic circles) 154 from orthodox dogma, the church did not very much encourage this lyricism, especially after Christianity entered into union with government power. Consequently, at times, melodies of a syllabic rhythmic intonation (according to the length or duration of the tones) prevailed, while at other times, the preference was for tonically accented rhythm, with greater melodic scope. In view of the instability of the intonational system of intervals in those cultures, this struggle, closely united with the expressiveness and content of singing, was not a "small factor," but a fundamental phenomenon in the shaping of melos. The Gregorian Chant

2Otherwise, from the position of forms as schemes, these are some sort of "in-between forms", in which poetry and music are examined separately as two contending sides, whereas, the main thing here [in an intonational context] is this unity of intonation, resulting from the interaction of the two related arts which flow out of it. The "instability" here is consistent with a concept of organic opposition. 152
contains "deposits" of the most diverse stages of the intonational struggle; in it, one may discern and distinguish the strata of different "intonational cultures."

This codex is the most valuable monument of a most interesting epoch, strong in intellectualism. Its impact "on the centuries ahead" was exceptional, in terms of the depth and force of its intonational and emotional influence, imparting an ever new artistic quality to the individual art of the great musicians of the nineteenth century.

Before the first outbreak of distinctive, poetically musical romanticism--the "culture of feeling" within the borders of feudalism--i.e., before the decisive emergence of the troubadours and trouveres and the already well distinguished independence of the secular culture of "music of the medieval city," there passed an epoch of strenuous efforts and experiences in the area of substantiating the theory and practice of polyphony; these were very bright flashes of European musical consciousness, with a noticeable predominance of philosophically speculative theoretical thought. No doubt, behind the theoretical treatments and singing practice of polyphony in the centers and breeding grounds of culture of that time there occurred an intensive growth of popular urban music (with the undoubted influence of folk elements) through the exchange of regional tunes of the different corners of
Europe (the musical mastery, both vocal and instrumental of vagabonds, scholars, jongleurs, mimes, minstrels, etc., wandering about the highways and byways). Unfortunately, the intonational evolution of medieval folklore (not the chronological history of facts, which is, very probably, even unrealizable for "music of the oral tradition," but the development of the practice of intoning) cannot be restored with sufficient clarity. This entire practice of secular, domestic music-making may be defined as a strenuous period of accumulation of musical-intonational wealth "outside the walls of the intellectualism of religious singing," but within the circle of "those who traveled, either for enlightenment, for subsistence, or for adventure." Whether the characteristic aspect of European melody with its clear-cut periodicity, the clear logic of the intonations of major mode, and the feeling of the leading tone, first began to stand in contrast to the rhythmic intonational culture in songs, song-dances, or instrumental improvisation for various occasions, has not yet been determined. Undoubtedly, this would have served as an effective, progressively prepared counter-blow to the influence of chant melopeía from the centers of its cultivation, but it did not occur so simply; the process turned out to be more extended. The "accumulation" of melos proceeded by winding paths, in its own way, in every major province and country,
even, in fact, as I have already noted, in connection with changes in the area of language. For example, it is not only in Spain that the intonational influence of the Moslem world and, of course, the Arab culture can be observed, as it has been in philosophy and science. The musical fabric of the European centers of music-making was woven out of a multitude of varied intonational threads, for, in spite of the great inclination of feudalism toward decentralization, universal concepts with tendencies toward generalization were almost always characteristic of European medieval intellectualism. In the period of the intensified building of all areas of culture, and parallel to the processes of "intonational accumulation" already noted, centralized "breeding grounds of music-making" were formed in Europe, most often in connection with strong religious institutions (cathedrals, abbeys, and monasteries), because religion possessed the most stable social

3In our great country, there "sounds the music" of remote, archaic, rhythmic-intonational and melodic cultures. In the Caucasus and Trans-Caucasia intonational strata have been interlaced into a complex lump. That which Marr did, in part, in the area of linguistics, in relation to the Caucasus, it is urgent and possible, or rather, necessary, to do in the musical intonational area. One must not be limited here by narrow folkloristics or acoustics. The idea, like an auger, must penetrate into the sources and branches of musical, intonational development. The data received in such a study can help unravel much that is unclear in the evolution of Mediterranean and European intonations.
organization and official discipline, in which, from approximately the ninth century, an unquestionably unifying, creative idea, inclining toward universalism, began to break through in the area of music. Paris, of course, with its intellectualism, also turned out to be the foremost city in the given area at that time, and movement in the creation of the practice and theory of musical polyphony became the prevailing joint work of theorists and practitioners of music. Here, in essence, was conceived European music in its fundamentals, in the presentiments and prerequisites of monumentality, and in the new quality of the consciousness of "intervallics" as a phenomenon of thought revealing itself in music.\textsuperscript{156}

The movement away from the intonationally expressive toward the constructive realization of intervals,\textsuperscript{157} this stage of hearing the interconnections of tones, made European polyphony possible, not as a heterophonic complex, but with voice-leading distinctly differentiated according to the auditory qualities of horizontal and vertical, in the unity (or combination) of succession and simultaneity, which apparently struck the imagination and the intellect as an absolutely new quality.

The first experiments with polyphony proceeded gropingly. In the initial development of European polyphony there occurred "genre" which displayed a prevalence of
parallelisms. Does this not show that the unity of the succession and simultaneity of tones, discovered by speculative, intellectualized hearing, and the new comprehension of intervals which resulted, were not immediately felt (particularly in singing practice, even though it was "the business of experts") as voice-leading, as the intonationally realized, independent progress of each voice? Parallelism created illusory motion, not voice-leading.

On the other hand, there were experiments in which we are struck by the extreme independence (to the point of harshness) of the voices, as if they are not at all obliged to be linked with one another, and even as if they go on "without a backward glance" at the pivotal, cantus-firmus melody. Does not such independence point to the musical rights of the voice, the new feeling of the interval as musically meaningful expression, prevailing on its own merits, without intonational connection with the word? If so, then this was a path toward overcoming the inevitable combination of word and tone, a very ancient art, as we have just seen, and firmly codified in the Gregorian Chant. Nothing in an intonational sense, appearing here in the ars antiqua, in the twelfth century, may be neglected, even seemingly the very smallest, but qualitatively new, element. We have now become accustomed to "gulp down" music in a generalized way, in huge complexes, passing over
intonational details. The further from us it is, the more strictly one must remember that, in the art of music, each moment is verified either through general significance or through extraordinariness of expressive utterance (however, in folk music, in "music of the oral tradition," that is how things are, and that is how they have always been).

Consequently, this second expressive sphere of experiments with polyphony is still not voice-leading in its full, expressive, intonational independence, and in the unity of succession and simultaneity, but is a path toward it through the overcoming of the cantus firmus by means of opevanie§ and coloration, while still preserving it. This is an intonational stimulus, natural and consistent, to experiments with polyphony. The art of the indissolubility of word and tone, disciplined by the rhythm of syllabic feet, yielded, first of all, to tonic rhythm and semantically expressive accent (probably under the impact of the emotional lyricism of Christianity); this is already a path toward melody. Toward the eleventh century, and probably earlier, the expressiveness of this art, if it was not entirely exhausted, at least was "blunted." Human thought began to revive; intellectualism (even on the approaches to the flourishing of scholasticism) emphasized the work of thought. The ear (hearing) was individualized; in intonation, the process of liberation of the musical
principle from the "outside" forces linked with it, and the
struggle for the expressiveness of peculiarly musical
elements began. Such was the new "crisis of intonation,"
and, as usual, at its end there was a striking creative
phenomenon, a generalizing achievement. In this case,
there was not an isolated creative fact, but the birth of
European polyphony.

I repeat the sequence of events once more, in brief,
for this is a turning page of the history of European music,
but, in essence, its first page. (1) Polyphony became
possible only with the recognition of the interval, not
as a shift or a distance from one tone to another, as in
the rhythmic intonational art of the unity of word and
tone, but as one of the elements of the musically expres­sive connection and interaction of tones in their
succession and simultaneity. (2) The first experiments
with polyphony were in this creative assimilation of a new
understanding of intervals and a new feeling of their
quality--the possibility of the simultaneous movement of
voices in parallel, oblique, and contrary motion. (3) The
expression of the first experiments with polyphony arose,
not from consciously employed norms of voice-leading, but
from the surmounting of fossilization, in the musical
intonational sense, and of the art of rhythmic melopeia
(rhythmic intonational art); the plainchant melody (cantus
firmus) was not reduced in its significance, but the upper voice "embellished or colored" it, and thereby the independence of the melodic principle of motion was advanced almost into the foremost position.

Thus, European polyphony was born out of the overcoming of the rhythmic intonation of unison or solo singing, not as the art of independent leading of voices, nor out of the theory of polyphony, but as the encirclement of a religious melody with musically free intonations. The path was found, and the unity of consecutiveness and simultaneity of the motion of voices was realized; the remaining properties were achieved gradually. The superiority of expressiveness was in advance of its time. Contemporary Parisians were amazed at the masters, Leonin and Perotin, Kapellmeisters of the church Beatae Mariae Virginis, and, not without reason, conferred on the second of them the title The Great, not for artificial devices, but for expressiveness, for a new quality of intonation. They heard both the familiar chant tune, and, simultaneously with it, new voices sounding above, with no less expressiveness. This art arose, neither out of the principles of independent movement of several voices, nor out of voice-leading in our understanding. On the contrary, these principles were gradually elucidated for theorists, from the living practice of "coloring," which
was gradually promoting the right to independence of musical intonation. The given hypothesis exhaustively explains all the peculiarities of the *ars antiqua*, which are unusual from the point of view of "counterpoint," but wholly natural from the point of view of the intonational development of European music. And not only the "manner" of the *ars antiqua*, but also the succeeding practice of the *ars nova* does not surprise us with anything irregular, deliberate, or delicately contrived, if we do not neglect the ground in which it flourished, i.e., the struggle for the independent expressiveness of musical intonation on the paths to the organic, full-fledged polyphony of the following centuries.

When musicologists (especially German) emphasize the constructive significance of rhythmics in the Gothic mastery of the *ars nova* and in the first outburst of the Italian and French musical Renaissance, as well as in the polyphonic lyricism of the *ars nova* (with the explanation, however, that melody is already more prevalent in the latter), one receives the impression, that rhythm enters from outside and lives independently, that the elements of music are also self-contained, and that rhythm sometimes even hinders their development. Rhythm, of course, is always the constructive and organizing principle of "breathing" and of the regularity of motion, but it is closely
fused with the elements of music. It always constructs and organizes something, but, in general, does not systematize. This "something" is intonation, but concrete intonation--vocal and instrumental melody or a succession of chords. In dance music and, in general, in music linked with the motions of man, clarity is demanded of melody; the rhythmic organization of this music is not the same, let's say, as that in a broad vocal cantilena, where the "scope of breathing" is entirely different. Intonation is either verbal or musical if the merging of word and sound is not emphasized to the point of the complete dissolution of both the word and the musical tone in an intonation of unity; in the latter case, it seems that rhythm prevails. Actually, there is no unintoned rhythm in music and cannot be. Music, as a rhythmic scheme or construction is a visual concept, if not an abstraction. But rhythm can impede the development of intonation if syllabically enumerated or measured metric schemes, isolated from verbal and musical intonation, begin to direct musical intonation. Then music either grows numb, or becomes something "applied," or rises above the metric schemes and is directed by rhythmic breathing, but this is natural melody. Everything which has been said is necessary to understand that the practice of both the ars antiqua and of ars nova were not directed by abstract
rhythm, but that both practices were a very gradual release, reckoned in centuries, of musical intonation from its fusion with the word (with poetic intonation) in a very organic unity, in the ancient art of rhythmic intonation, having behind it "the weight of centuries," and that this art was still not music for a long time, for its expressiveness was not determined by the self-sufficing development of musical intonational factors (in our time, in spite of the qualitatively different significance and media of expression, the recitative, couplet, and even some romanzas are found in the same correlation to the symphony). The *ars nova* of the twelfth to fourteenth centuries was, in relation to the *ars antiqua*, a progressive, "secular" movement, but, together with the *ars antiqua*, this practice did not represent a complete emancipation from the rhythmic intonational traditions; that is to say, the art of the *ars nova* was still not entirely music. In addition, the manner of building polyphony by "coloring" a sacred melody, is here transformed into a clever, almost uninterrupted mutual "coloring" or "embellishment" of one voice by another! Everything flowers, and in the midst of the florescence there are already shoots of unquestionable melody. But rhythm is not an abstraction; it is the intonational core.

The French art of the *ars nova*, in the hands of outstanding musicians and musical writers, emerges as a
progressive intellectual current of quite exceptional force. Both speculation and creative invention strengthened the basic rules of European music. The struggle for a notation (the problems of the practice of mensuration) underneath its "arid" (as we would consider it) reasonings and experiments, contains something urgently vital; in its search for independence of expression, music is in no condition to develop without a "system for writing it down" which would fix its own utterance. The formation of rational languages, the evolution of European music and poetics, the powerful impact of the lyricism of folk (rural and urban) singing and dancing, and above all, the most strenuous striving toward melody as the most important and clearest "voice of emotionality," these and many other stimuli forced musicians not only to create, but also to learn how to consolidate what was created; earlier notation could suffice while music still maintained its rhythmic intonational connections, or, even more important, developed in an atmosphere of "oralness," in the midst of the influence of "musical art of the oral tradition," Only the art of polyphony demanded a more graphic and visually legible system of note writing than those "mnemonic landmarks for the hearing" such as neumes and similar notational systems. Mensuration, with its more precise differentiations of durations, introduced, by its
visibility, a new, even more intricate syllabication in place of the "syllabic reckoning of antiquity."

In its striving toward a precise fixing of rhythm, in its metrics and in its rhythmic "modi," music, of course, preserved the traditions of its unity with poetic intonation. But this was only the "formula for transfer" to an even greater quest--how to establish the chief quality of music, the unity of intonational succession and simultaneity. The "laboratories of polyphony," were already striving to escape from the mere coloration of a given core, toward polyphonic voice-leading, toward the intoning of several voices in their melodic naturalness. It was still a long way to such an achievement, but the tendencies toward it, and chiefly the furious onslaught of a new style of rhythmic and melodic formation (the music of the troubadours and trouveres, the metrics of dance melodies) maintained indisputable progress and continued the path toward naturally melodic intoning. I am not inclined to consider the melodics of the troubadours and the metric dance melodics as the flourishing of that "musical melody," natural for us Europeans, which was given to mankind considerably later by Italy. But with its persistent "will" toward the "re-interpretation" of all preceding musical practice and theory in the direction of melos, of melodiousness, as the quality which defines musical intonation, the fourteenth century was an epoch of uninterrupted
intonational crises; in it, the layers of musical theories and "practices," conservative and progressive speculations, and creative operating forces, were brought sharply together and found common ground with one another, but the moving force was the manifestation of the melodic.

It is not accidental that just in this century the remarkable summarizing treatise, Speculum musicae (Mirror of Music)* appeared. Rhythmic intoning, as the indissolubility of word and tone, noticeably became musical rhythmic intoning; such, in most of its trends (and there are many of them), was the art of the troubadours. Simultaneously, the art of declining chivalry, the sentimentally romantic art in its several genres and stages, was democratized under the pressure of a healthy sensuality in its lyricism. Of course, this proceeds from those "makers of tunes," singers, and "players," who were closely linked with the peasant and urban "plebians."

The syllabic rhythmic element struggles, in the lyricism of the troubadours, with tonic rhythmic intoning, a fact which occasions disputes among researchers, who

---

*Properl: this is rhythmic melody, inclining at times, almost to the point of self-sufficing melodiousness, at others, approaching the conservative (by our standards) norms in the rhythmic intonational style of the Gregorian Chant.*
decipher the tunes, but completely forget about intonation and the manner of intoning. The mensuralists were not struggling for abstract rhythmics (even in the face of undeniable scholastic survivals of the epoch); their theories were devoted, primarily, to the exposure of the melodic and the establishment of a notation, by means of which, the standardization of musical correlations of duration and tonic accents as bearers of musical intonation would be distinguished from the rhythmic intonational art. This was the path to the formation of rhythmic melody in its latter stages.

In the musical development of the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries, the attention of contemporaries was completely captured by the formation of a great polyphonic style, representing the labors of centuries, the so-called Franco-Flemish or Netherlandish schools of polyphony. The intonational "compromise" of this movement is indisputable; even with all its mastery, blinding one with its "speculative" brilliance, the contrapuntal art of these schools, linked, as it was, chiefly to the Mass, as a monumental, cyclic, solidly organized, musical form, was a doomed art. Its preordained doom is understandable, in spite of the introduction into the polyphonic fabric of popular tunes, from "vulgar, plebian music," serving as the pivotal voice (cantus firmus), which, of course, achieved a measure of
intonational freshness. The familiar street tune drew along with it, into the consciousness of the listeners, a complex, rationalistic interlacement of polyphony. But the complexity of this practice could not be validated by emotional need; naive believers preferred, as always, the "everyday songs," familiar to them from childhood, in their modest intoning, and those listeners who were patrons of the arts (clerics of high orders, ruling princes, prosperous burghers), although attracted by the esthetic loftiness of mastery were themselves so influenced by "mundane tastes" and so "secularized" that they could not be zealous, ideational advocates of this style.

Above all, the "secular element in music" with its rousing, though simple-minded, feeling of melodiousness, and the growing recognition, at last, among the masses, of the emotional value of instrumentalism, which was already becoming for everyone a vital, natural "medium of musical intonation" (the progress of organ playing as an art of the profound pathos of oratorical speech, which Protestantism brilliantly took possession of, concealing its rationalistic moralizing with music), these "paths and presentiments" of the imminent flowering of music as a language of "the thoughts and movements of the human heart," without religious connections, doomed the esthetic intellectualism of the Franco-Flemish, to a "fireworks
display"; the public consciousness of Europe drew the operating forces of music in another direction.

In those cases in which the Franco-Flemish mastery transferred to "secular themes," it yielded at times, to the impact of a concrete feeling for life and was itself inspired (for example, in the works of Orlando Lasso, a great and sensitive musician, ⁵ in the late-Renaissance art of the madrigal and the culture of convivial, drinking-song ensembles, especially in France). This flexible technique of counterpoint created "auditory tidbits" of startling fascination, but life soon passed them by for a still greater truthfulness in musical art, which has always stood for music as living human intonation.

On this score, the stately philosophizing of the Franco-Flemish, in the area of religious music, collided with an ever-growing, anti-clerical religious movement, demanding a return to fundamental Christianity as a religion which was a stranger to wealth and to the "princes of the world." In terms of music, this movement, by nature, very emotional, and with mystical coloration, called to life new hymn intonations, sometimes simple-mindedly naive,

⁵In general, it must be said that the Franco-Flemish style had, as its spokesmen, a galaxy of outstanding musicians, but, while providing for the intensification of their professionalism, it still, to a great extent, hindered the manifestation of the "flame" of their individual talents.
sometimes manfully severe, calling to mind the practices of the first centuries of Christianity, but now in a melodic setting. In Italy, Franciscanism, with its "justification" of the joy of living and its animation of a feeling for nature, actively promoted the birth of musically natural intonations in forms which were generally accessible and appealing in their lyricism—the Laudi and other similar lyrical hymns, which were not limited merely to professional performance. These hymns were sung in the native (Italian) language, and, with this important new formation—the merging of musical melody with native speech—intonational sensitiveness was heightened. This movement revealed itself in different countries with national "nuances," everywhere standing in opposition to "artificiality" in religious music. It is quite apparent that when the Franco-Flemish "inlaid" popular motives as cores in the polyphonic fabric, these motives, removed from their own intonational sphere, lost their natural intonation and, in their new capacity, could hardly compete with the "lack of artificiality" of the Laudi, Noels, and similar manifestations of the folk-religious feeling in music.

The Reformation in Germany and the stormy outbreaks of religious wars in Europe filled this almost three-century, mass germination of emotionally elevated lyricism with stern dramatic tension and manful conviction. The chorale of the
Lutheran Protestant communities in Germany proved to be ahead of its time in the ardour and stylistic fashioning of its melos and in the new quality of its rhythmic, verbal, and musical unity. This new quality consisted in the exceptionally powerful, generalizing force of influence of its melos; its melodies, like formulas of intonational generalization, possessed rich possibilities for musical development, as was proved, after the peasant wars, by the rapid growth of German organ and vocal polyphony based on the intonations of the chorale. In a word, this was a powerful stylistic phenomenon, full of vital activity and not cut off from the "juices of the earth." The triumph of the chorale style of Lutheran Protestantism quickly went out beyond the borders of worship alone, thanks to the power of its auditory emotional content, and, while music created from the womb of the chorale served the needs of worship, it also occupied a place and significance in it which overwhelmed the narrow musical needs of the church only. In the music engendered by the chorale, there was always preserved the ardent breathing of intonations engendered in the struggle of the people for the right to think and to feel nationally, in their own way, in opposition to Rome and the papacy, oppressors of will and the psyche, "dealers in human souls." Engels laconically and accurately defined the political significance of the
Reformation and the religious wars of the sixteenth century:*161 there is no need to repeat his words, which are well-known to everyone, and often quoted, but it is necessary to add that, in the history of music, this epoch was the most fruitful and creative of all the "crises of intonations" which preceded the French bourgeois revolution. Mankind is indebted to it for the ascent of the genius of Beethoven to the peaks of humanity, and for the great ethical art of Johann Sebastian Bach and the many other bright stars of music who were overshadowed by his "measureless creation."

The melodics of the Protestant chorale represent a complex intonational summarization, into which were absorbed both Gregorian melodies and folk-song intonations; but quantitatively, the extent to which each of these factors is present is impossible to calculate. In general, the whole movement, presented above in the most concise words, represented the growth of hymnic lyricism from Franciscanism (and possibly from more distant, reformative, religious trends) to Luther, not at all in an uninterrupted line. Similar causes engendered similar manifestations of folk-musical, religious lyricism in different areas of Europe. Thus, the German, Protestant chorale was a summarization, growing out of the rise of national, ideational, and emotional elements as the result of the centuries-long
accumulation of common intonational tendencies. Chorale melos was, above all, an intoning of the lofty ethical order of thoughts and feelings of commonality, of the "collective spirit," in strict and clear-cut melodies; but in musical terms, these melodies were already themes, i.e., intonations which evoked development and served as its stimulus and summarization. This was the origin of the unprecedented growth of musical polyphony in Germany of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. The chorale tunes and their elements were not only the formal cores and "girders" of polyphonic construction, they were thoughts and figurative ideas which had become intonations. Out of this intonational essence of the chorale style there developed, almost everywhere in Europe, the melodics of concentrated reflection, of serious and profound meditation and thought; this new quality of melos was born, not out of imitation, but, I repeat, out of the essence, the ethical substance of the chorale, as a stimulus. The arias, both vocal and instrumental (the latter are particularly stirring), of Bach, Handel, and Gluck, the passacaglias, toccatas, and

6 Only the vocal art of the northern Russian peasants did not succumb to the ethos of chorale intonations; the greatness of spirit, profound and serious attitude toward life, loftiness of feeling, and calmness, reflected in their "drawling" songs, and in their "oral," collective, choral lyricism (which developed within the hearing of all), even surpassed the chorale ethos with wise concentration and stern, restrained strength, secure in the confidence of its own merits.
ricercare, of the great organists, powerful in their intonational flow, the splendid, choral "symphonies of the folk masses" in passions and oratorios, in short, all the inestimable treasures of human emotions were transferred into musical intonations by the spiritual enthusiasm of the people, which manifested itself in the form of religious struggles, but, in its content, betrayed a thirst for a reconstruction of all aspects of life. Bach died in 1750 and with him died the "soul of polyphony"; in 1759, Handel the great dramatist of national movements in forms of biblical epos, perished. But Beethoven, who began to realize, in new intonations and forms of music, the grandeur of the spirit of the people and the epos of revolution, was born in 1770. To replace the instrumental aria meditations of Bach and Handel, the thoughtful Beethoven Adagios arose as eternal, questioning "reveries" of man about everything which is splendid and stirring in life. Western European music created nothing higher and more profound than this.

In the course of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, the influence of peasant folk song and dance music entered into the music of the city in the most diversified manifestations. The western European city, in its intensive cultural growth, substantially levelled the regional "song dialects" (of those songs which it
absorbed) and crystallized them; in the outskirts of the cities, in the suburbs and neighboring settlements, the border between lyrical-song and dance-song folklore and the song style of the urban [social] strata, close to the working people, was almost obliterated. The song of Paris arose as a result of the evolution of a complicated complex of intonations in various song genre; the folk music of Vienna is also a complicated structure of intonations (even in its national nuances), as is typical of this cultural and musical center which, thanks to its position, absorbed many national influences and crystallized them to a considerable extent. It is even possible to speak of a "Viennese folklore." The musical and intonational direction in all these processes, as also in Italy, in England, and in the north of Western Europe, was the same in the music of almost all strata of society—toward natural melody, like any healthy feeling, directed by human breathing (rhythm!), and easily grasped by the consciousness, thanks to the clarity of its intonations and its constructive equilibrium. It had to be completely "satisfactory" without accompaniment, but also had to permit accompaniment without violating the naturalness of its rhythmic-intonational form. Thus, the homophonic style, about which we have already spoken above, came into being.

A new phenomenon, moving parallel to the flourishing of polyphony and the suite, and to the development of the
sonata forms, the *concertante* style, and symphonized instrumentalism, wedged itself into these processes, on the threshold of the seventeenth century, introducing its significant voice into all the succeeding development of Western European music as a system of intonations. This was opera. Its origin in Italy, not quite like opera in our conception, was to be expected, but that circle of people, among whom this theatricalized monody with instrumental accompaniment arose, did not imagine, and could not have had any presentiment, what fate awaited their offspring, how many composers would devote their best ideas and forces to it, how it would influence both the vocal and instrumental art. In a word, the fortunate invention of a group of Florentines--connoisseurs of poetry and music--crudely speaking, "hit the mark of expectation" of the epoch and became, in the end, that which was demanded by the cultural and historical course of events in the European theatre, poetry, and music. By this time, in Italy especially, there had come to light the "crisis of intonations," which had appeared and been overcome, in northern Europe, by the reformation and religious wars, but was delayed and aggravated here by the Catholic reaction. The Renaissance evoked the culture of individualism and the cult of man as a powerful, passionate, and intellectually developed personality. In music, "secular music-making"
(in friendly communication, in conversations, in domestic diversions, and in social life—songs of carnivals, festivals, feasts, etc., etc.) appeared more and more brilliant, and more and more often, the names of composers came to light as bearers of artistically individual, musical creation. The area of apposition for all these operating forces turned out to be the madrigal, more a genre than a form, and more a lyrical sphere of secular polyphony, emotionally flexible and sensitive, than a style; the points of apposition of the madrigal were diverse (from searchingly intellectual love lyricism, the heritage of Petrarch, to distinctive musical comedies with their joyous reflections of everyday life and "pointedness of the street"), but no less "multifacted" were the madrigalists and composers from Willaert and Palestrina to Oratio Vecchi, Monteverdi (the great musical dramatist), Marenzio, and the subjective darings of Gesualdo. The madrigal is closely linked with poetic lyricism, but elements of musical dramaturgy also grow within it, and musical figurativeness arises, with tendencies toward characterization, sound painting, and the folk quality.*162

The variety of the madrigal, whether stylistic, genre, or musically formal, is explicable only on the basis of historically concrete, real premises—the persistent demands made upon the art of music by the public consciousness. The
reconstruction of the intellectual and emotional "culture of man" as it occurred in the stormy epoch of the Renaissance, led to a new quality and structure of intonations, and satiated them with the force and brilliance of unprecedented feeling of vitality.* The final turn toward natural melody was completed in Italy, where the musicality of the people and their artistic sensitivity led to the most progressive vocal culture, to the bel canto, to natural singing, wholly conditioned by the breathing, to a culture revealing the charm, the warmth, all the treasures of the psychical life of man, in his voice, "organized in breathing." The birth of the new musical practice of Italy, which soon conquered the entire world, and the soul of which was melody, was not the consequence of the strivings within music itself, within its technique and style, but the consequence of a revolution of intonation. One may say that, before this, music was rhythmic intonation, utterance, and pronunciation. Now it began to sing; breathing became its fundamental principle. Here, at just this time, opera arose.

Like all intensive intonational revolutions, this supreme revolution (intonation becoming "singing with the diaphragm") defies precise chronological dating. Perhaps the Italian people sang for a long time as "the chest sings," but the artistically musical practice "at the summit
of art" lived its artificial life, till the psyche, saturated with the new content, broke through this dam, not immediately finding a channel, however. "The future opera" was not born as opera. They [i.e., its inventors, the Florentine camarata] dreamed of a return to the theatre of antiquity (imaginary, of course), and began a word-tone-rhythmic utterance or exposure of melos, i.e., they returned to age-old norms of rhythmic intoning, to rhythmic monody, but in the Italian language, in the intonations of Italian Renaissance, lyric poetry with instrumental accompaniment contemporary to the epoch. Such an experiment with theatricalized musical lyricism was, to a great extent, an intellectually artificial, conservative phenomenon. But, the public, artistic consciousness quickly transformed such "narrow invention"—possibly even the result of speculation, the discussions of a circle—into a center of the apposition of forces in the "intonational storms" of the Renaissance epoch. In 1594 in Florence, the first performance of Dafne (poetry by Rinuccini, music by Peri) took place. This was a sort of "saw kerf"164 to opera. In 1637 the first public opera theatre opened in Venice. [Also] in Venice, the wonderful musical and dramatic talent of the great Monteverdi (1567-1643) was developed, and after him a galaxy of opera composers were active, among them, Cavalli and Cesti. Opera spread to Rome, Vienna, and other cities. Finally in Naples, in
the person of the brilliant Alessandro Scarlatti (1660-1725), the universally famous style of bel canto opera flourished. The new psyche saturated human intonations with a new quality, a new expressiveness.

Neither the complex polyphonic interlacement of Catholic music, nor the extensive (though constrained by centuries-long traditions of "ensemble polyphony") culture of the madrigal, which, to a considerable extent, prepared the opera, could give a new channel, that is a sensitive, flexible, responsive, musically intonational form, to the new content of mind and feeling. This was achieved by opera, the greatest triumph of Renaissance Italy in the area of music, theatre, and national Italian poetry; here the new psyche, the psyche of strong individual characters, of the powerful mind, liberated from the eyes of scholasticism, and most important, of the feeling of reality, received expression. The Catholic and political reaction, which was crushing the inquisitiveness of the Renaissance consciousness, could not stop the "Renaissance after-effects" in the flourishing of a whole new musical practice. If the new structure of intonations was felt to be reflected in singing based on breathing, in natural melody, then, in opera, its vital capacity was emphasized. On the other hand, opera could not have developed so intensively, in spite of all its detractors,
who argued its meaninglessness, through the entire century, if there had not arisen, in the new world attitude, and in the human social consciousness, the need for intonational utterance of the states of the mind and heart, not only in abstract concepts, and not only in the art of the word and the conflicts of characters, i.e., in the theatre, but also in theatricalized music, in music performed jointly with poetry and drama.

Except for this necessity, dictated by reality, opera would not have become a living art, filled with contradictions. But the whole history of opera is made up of just this constant and uninterrupted emergence of contradictions, and the equally constant overcoming of them. Opera is not a form, although it consists of "forms"; in the final analysis, it rests upon any of the theatrical genre, and makes it into an intonationally dramatic genre. For that reason there are opera-tragedies, opera-comedies, and opera-dramas, or musical tragedies, musical comedies, and musical dramas, though the musical dramas of Wagner are, in essence, opera-symphonies. In some epochs, opera was transformed into a complex "visual mechanism" against the background of musical-lyrical declamation; in still others it became a "through-melodic activity," in which everything is settled vocally and even characters and figures are
confined to certain determined types of voice; basses are villains, tenors, sensual types, and baritones, passionate lovers, etc., with a designated quality of intonations for each given type. When the enthusiasm for bel canto was transformed into the prevalence of concert virtuoso style, opera became a sort of "contest of singers." In France, for some time, it was a full-dress, court spectacle, saturated with ballet, but then there occurred in it an intonational struggle of allied rivals—the word and the tone as bearers of declamation (Lully); the orchestra, in the meantime, also won the right to attention through opera, creating a new instrumental dramatic style and forms corresponding to it, for example, the overture. This dramatization of instrumentalism through opera was a very significant phenomenon in the formation and establishment of European symphonism. One cannot categorically state that the form of the symphonic or sonata allegro, with its formation of contrasts and contradictions, was not an artistically intellectual summarization of dramatic stimuli to musical development, in the period of the quest and first shoots of sonata form, i.e., that the principle of sonata form was without theatrical dramaturgy.*165
We have come close to a definition of the meaning of "operatic quality." But it is necessary to make one more digression. In Italy, not only the human voice began to sing; the principle of singing based on breathing took possession of all music. It is well known how the violin began to sing. Soon after, the style, forms, and special kind of music-making took shape, in which the soloist became the principle figure. Did not the "competitive" and concertante style and the various forms of the concerto, which became a motive force in the musical life of Europe, emerge as a consequence of the individualism engendered by the Renaissance? Yes, of course they did. Thus, in essence, we see three links of a single chain of phenomena. The individualization of human thought and feeling--having enriched and refined the processes of thinking, cognition, and attitude--generated a flexibility and sensitivity of verbal and musical intonation as media for the expression (exposure) of the quality of thinking and feeling, and of tenseness and distinctiveness. Musical intonation,
continuing to reveal itself in norms of rhythmic intonation, in declamation, now a highly elevated dramatic style, found the basic channel, which shaped it, in singing based on breathing and in the most human medium of expression of all the elements of music, in melody, the typically Italian style of which is bel canto singing. We have now become so accustomed to the word "melody" and to the content of this concept that it is difficult for us to understand what its value was for the contemporaries of the epoch of its creation and cognition, in the style of singing based on breathing, bel canto singing, and its basic quality and principle of uninterruptedness, smoothness of "flow" and logical progression from tone to tone, a phenomenon now called "melody." It became the chief motivating force of music from approximately the end of the seventeenth century, though I would again point out that the Italian folk

---

1 This expressive style had already penetrated into worship in the sixteenth century (the sung recitation of psalms, for example, was dramatized), chiefly in all the spheres of the monumental art of word and sound appearing as the transformation of the medieval mysteries, especially in the Passion. In Germany, the great master of this style was Schuetz. The "dissonant" genre of weeping (lamento) and pathetic monologues (Ariadne, Armida) became widespread. The madrigal and opera, similarly, did not shun declamatory pathos. Its themes were taken from the Bible ("The Lamentations of Jeremiah"), antiquity, and Italian poetry.
song was melodic from early times.

The extension of the melodic principle beyond the limits of vocalness, follows naturally, as the second link of the intonational development; bel canto singing strove to become "bel canto playing." The instrumental culture of that epoch took possession of melody, resulting in the emergence of the concerto style, both solo and ensemble (Concerti grossi and all conceivable genre of chamber music\(^2\)). The concertante style, in its most varied aspects, should not, on any account, be equated as a whole with the ubiquitous concept of virtuosity.

\(^2\)The concertante style undoubtedly exerted influence on the development of choral ensemble singing, especially in the sphere of the oratorio and cantata, and, of course, on the splendid florescence of operatic ensembles. I will take note of one more interesting phenomenon. Breathing as an expressive stimulus, defining the rhythm of singing, is felt in the religious music of the great Palestrina; I refer to his choral compositions in which a smooth succession of lucid harmonies emerges into the foremost position. These harmonies are stately and simple, like the light, slender columns of ancient buildings. Such calm and equilibrium inspire one with a particular, artistically expressive, Raphaelian loftiness of style, and do not at all correspond to the passionate, mankind-hating ardor of the Catholic reaction and the Jesuit movement; it is the Catholic reaction the "fires of the Inquisition" are already present, but in these works of Palestrina the reasonable clarity of the apex of the Renaissance and the majestic "eloquence" of Rome are still to be found.
Virtuosity, as the "hedonistic" sphere of the concertante style, and as the stimulus to the development of brilliance and the perfection of technique, did not at all nullify serious and profound work on the expressive qualities of the melodic, instrumental style. The area of chamber ensemble playing was, in many respects, the "laboratory of the sonata form" and of the exposure of musical intellectualism, which, as a result of the thinking of the most culturally and intellectually sensitive composers, led to the creation of the quartet style as the highest expression of musical thought. At the highest point of this line of ascent of "musical reasonableness," as also in the area of symphonism, Beethoven emerges with his brilliant series of quartets as poems, quartets as lofty tracts, quartets as lyrical monologues, and even quartets as diaries. But, of course, this high culture, rooted in the chamber, ensemble, music-making of Italy in the late Renaissance and the subsequent epoch, came together at some point with the "ensemble playing" of the instrumentalist-artisans of old, provincial Germany, about which we have already spoken. I think that the influence of the Italian florescence of melody based on breathing and of the new, concertante style in which "the violin began to sing," plus the impact of the pathetic-declamatory style,
"turned" the quality of thought of the German musical
guild (I here understand "guild," not in the socially
pejorative sense, as pertaining to "handicraft," but
rather as pertaining to the sources and establishments,
the "trend" and character of a given culture of labor)
toward the symphony and quartet, a fact which conditioned
the special peculiarities in the content and technology
of these forms of intoning in Germany, and their strong
development and profound expressiveness.

I now move on to the third link in this same chain
of phenomena, conditioned by the "intonational reforma-
tion" in Italy of the sixteenth and seventeenth centu-
ries. This is the area of the theatre. The theatre is
spectacle; it is the "mirror of social custome." But
visibility, as the essence of theatricality, is realized
with the aid of "three modes of figurative expression."
[The first of these is] the "language of the hand and
the movements of man, and also his mimicry." From
pantomime to ballet, this is the huge, purely visual
sphere of the theatre, and, of course, of theatre in its
original nature. The second and third spheres are into-
national, and have entered into competition with "visi-
bility" as the essence of the theatrical art, throughout
the entire course of theatrical history. The dramatic
theatre, in the totality of its genre, is the realm of
spoken intonation. At times, the dramatic theatre becomes almost a "republic of literature" (in my memory, there was a remarkable argument as to whether the creation of Shakespeare is not a phenomenon of literature to a greater extent than of the theatre); at times, "visibility" wins back its position as the essence of the theatre and declares itself independent of any "tyranny of literature." Verbal intonation, the word, literariness are recognized as necessary "facts" of the theatre, but subordinate to its "theatrical specifics." As regards musical intonation, both the "mute theatre"--the theatre of rhythmic plasticity--and the dramatic theatre--the theatre of verbal intonation--could hardly, at any time, have done without "musical aid." But, to the present, both types of theatricality regard music as a "handmaiden," as an unavoidable, but subsidiary, element of the visual and verbal cultures of theatricality.

From everything which has been said, it follows with complete consistency and regularity that the development of the theatre and music, but chiefly the musical intonational reformation of Italy, with its consequence, melody, and not melody alone, but both melody and breathing as the operating force, the will, of intonation, led to the independent exposure, formation, and development
of musical theatre. This is opera. Only in terms of the complete evolution of rhythm, the word, and the musical sound, and in terms of the full expressiveness of musical intonation, achieved in the images of melody, in other words, in terms of the development of the entire intonational culture of mankind as a means of human communication, is it possible to explain both the rapid spread of opera and the fact that, in the course of an already three-century-long development, this art has been, and continues to be, a barometer of all the "changes in the intonational atmosphere" of society. In addition, opera, after its modest beginning, soon required an organization of its own "services" around it, a whole network of institutions and establishments, which is really not surprising. Just as the dramatic theatre became a "small organism" in the complicated complex of artistic, literary, poetic, and theatrical, social life, so the musical theatre, still more complicated in the makeup of its performing media, called forth around it, as it spread, a progressively stronger and more robust system of its own internal, "artistic economy," and set up a whole tangle of interrelations with the surrounding cultural environment.

It is useless, therefore, to argue whether opera is genre or form. Opera, like the dramatic theatre, is a
collective concept; it is a kind of art, a composition, the theatre in the broad sense, and the theatre building. Coming to life as a new art of musical intoning, as musical theatre, from the natural evolution of music and forms of music-making, opera gradually absorbed into itself both the genre and their branches, and even the stylistic tendencies of its "neighbor and rival," the dramatic theatre. Opera became both tragedy and comedy, drama and vaudeville; but everywhere, music, having taken possession of these genre, molded them in its own way, reinterpreted and reintoned them. The most operatic genre, by its nature, was the Neapolitan bel canto opera and its progeny, until this genre "leaped over" beyond the bounds of theatricality to such an extent that opera was transformed into a virtuoso vocal concert, barely needing the theatre, either as "spectacle" or as "dramatic poetry," i.e., verbal intonation. At times, periods have set in when the operating forces are in balance, when the intensity of the influence and essence of musical intonation, and the rule of melody as
the principle which shapes the drama, coincide. These are rare epochs, because opera is always a formation and an arena of competition for the elements which stimulate and support it. Indeed, to achieve such equilibrium, without the deadening of operatic quality in the music or the deterioration of theatricality, was possible only to such "geniuses of the opera" as Mozart, Rossini, Verdi, Bizet, and Tchaikovsky.

France worked out a peculiar, very nationalistic genre, the opéra comique, in which verbal intonation is preserved in a kind of dialogue, alternating with the.

3The principles of musical dramaturgy are understood with difficulty, without an understanding of the essence and evolution of human hearing, the process of musical listening and hearing, and the nature and qualities of musical intonation, in general, and they are realized, to a great extent, intuitively, out of general musical sensitivity. This is why there are so few truly operatic producers; this is why there are so few operatic librettists, and why verses, even by the most finished poet, may be unacceptable as an operatic libretto, and are often even unacceptable for music altogether, unless they are reorganized. By the same token, an excellent symphonic director may not always be equally perfect in the operatic theatre. In general, the "tangle of operatic problems" is easily disentangled when approached with an understanding of musical dramaturgy as an intonational phenomenon.
musical forms of the opera, and not at all rejecting many of the achievements of the theatre as spectacle. The genre is very difficult with respect to the "balance of forces" and the rhythmically measured distribution of speech and music in the dramatic development. When it turns out well, when verbal intonation fulfills that which is inherent in it, and music, vocal and instrumental, fulfills only what is peculiar to it, first-class compositions are created; Bizet's Carmen, in the French performance, with vivid, freshly, well-intoned dialogues, but without the tedious and sluggish recitatives (those which were added later), sounds as the most perfect operatic form.

In this very concentrated analysis of the musical theatre as an historically purposeful manifestation of musical intonation, I have completed a very short, but almost exhaustive survey of the chief turning points ("crises of intonations") in the history of European music.
CHAPTER X

The nineteenth century, regarded in retrospect as the century of music, still did not know such stormy revolutions in intonational content as the epoch of the formation of polyphony, the chorale of the Protestant communities in the course of the religious wars, the early period of the emergence of opera as independent musical theatre against a background of the healthy maturation of bel canto melody, the pre-Beethoven and the Beethoven periods of formation of the romanza, of mass singing in the cities of the revolution, and of symphonism. However paradoxical such an assertion may seem, it is formed on this basis: the music of the nineteenth century, in spite of all the variety of its genre, its "forms," its schools, its systems, its directions, its slogans, and its great stylistic formations, not to mention the stimuli for all this--the shifts and struggles of world views and attitudes in the evolution of public consciousness--was based on rhythmic forms and voice-leading worked out by the Classicists and breathed into long life by the genius of Beethoven.

The voice-leading remained Classical, because the
fundamental principles and bases of the European mode, melodics, and harmonic usage, remained unchanged, in the work of the early and late Romantics, the Psycho-realists, the partisans of academicism, and even those brilliant enemies of academicism, the Impressionists. Debussy, in the strictness and intonational perfection of his voice-leading, is, of course, the Classicist among Classicists, and it was not without reason that he spoke ironically of the label conferred on him--"Impressionist."¹⁶⁶ Chopin was a most perfect Classicist. Such also were Brahms and Tchaikovsky, Glinka and Bizet, Stravinsky and Hindemith, for even out of opposition to Classicism (which often seems to the hearing, from initial impressions, to consist of intonational novelty), if the opposition has been organic in the evolution of intonation, an even stronger, essentially European-Classical logic of voice-leading has arisen. And, until the norms of voice-leading, worked out by a centuries-long-struggle and perceived, not as dead schemes, but as intonational processes, are completely altered in terms of their vital expediency, this voice-leading may undergo modification, especially in a period of "crises of intonations," but it will not be destroyed. It arose as a formation, as a process, a living process involving a means of intoning (in the simultaneity and consecutiveness
of sounds, in the combination of durations and accents, in the exchange of timbres) and a quality of intonations (for example, the conjunction of leading tone and tonic, and the raising and lowering of the emotional tonus of sound speech) which are characteristic for European mankind.

There is every reason to suppose that European voice-leading has firm roots in the folk consciousness, because, in the USSR, a country where all the phenomena of the European musical art have been decisively reevaluated, and a "crisis of intonations" has been clearly perceptible, often evoking deep division and ideational disputes, our mass, folk musical culture has entirely accepted European voice-leading as classical and has no intention of giving it up, either in the name of archaic or subjective "survivals" nor of "experiments with the deterioration or reinforcement of
The reduction of European voice-leading to "classical norms" became possible after the acceptance, by the mass hearing, of "equal temperament." If this reform had been absolutely hostile to European intoning, either it would not have been accepted, or it would have impeded the entire course of development of European homophony, harmony, and symphonism. This did not happen, which indicates that equal temperament turned out to be that "resultant of intonational qualities" which conditioned the progress of music; it indicates that, in the very conditions and qualities of European intoning itself, the necessity emerged for the introduction of a discipline which would counterbalance the diversity of

---

1 I do not, in any case, deny the laboratorial necessity and usefulness of the spread of new scale systems, but all of these experiments proceed, not from a study of intonational evolution, but rather from rationalistic premises—-from the belief, for example, that it is possible to command people to "reflect on tomorrow" and to hear and compose music in a system which is prescribed as better and more expedient. All the complicated and confused history of experiment and research, in connection with systems of temperament, does not dispute the rationalistic organization of the experiments, but, it seems to me that such a wise, ultimately perfect creation and affirmation of "equal temperament" as J.S. Bach's Das Wohltemperierte Klavier, could not have been written as the result of a task set by rationalists, but was, rather, a consequence of the overcoming of a "crisis of instrumental intonations"; in short, "equal temperament" itself was evoked by the natural course of development of European intonation and was, therefore, accepted by the public consciousness.
instrumental intonations, i.e., those which were mechanized, which had to be reduced to some unity. The "public ear" hears with displeasure the smallest falsity, the smallest digression from "pure tuning," demanding unity from an instrument in its method of intoning, but it does not object to "uniformity"; it does not make corrections, but listens, reflecting and feeling music, not a "mixed combination of sounds derived from acoustics." Human intonation is always in process, in formation, like any living phenomenon. Mankind, being social, constructs music as a social activity in which both rhythm and intonation (reconstructed and reinterpreted in the processes of labor and the evolution of public consciousness) are factors for man, and not "gifts of nature" to which human hearing is absolutely subordinated.*167

All this I recall here once more, in speaking about the nineteenth century, in order to clear up the contradiction between the amazing scope of the creative forces and ideational content of music and, as it would seem, the slackening activity of the "selection of intonations of nature," i.e., the enrichment of the material of music itself in this century. Is the problem here one of temperament as an obstacle? In the first place, when we discuss music of the past we shorten
"temporal distances," and changes which occurred over the course of centuries, we regard as very close, almost neighboring, overlooking the duration of centuries. Linguistics, in its observations of the processes of linguistic changes, learned to be more circumspect in defining distances. In the study of art, the history and theory of painting also began to be considered with the "eyes" of man.

Musicologists, for the most part, having defined the sources, the place in history, and style of a composition, study it as an esthetic object, at times drawing on the judgments of contemporaries, at other times using criteria of the present day, but not involving themselves in the causes of its vital capacity or the lack of it, and interpreting it not unlike the following: Bach is a great musician; his music is elevated and excellent (since this is easy to say, not calling forth arguments and even holding Bach up as an example for composers contemporary with us). One must understand that in music, as an art which is heard, not only are "new inventions" of the composer's intellect recognized slowly by the perceiving environment, but even the technology, in all its variety, is assimilated with exceptional gradualness and deliberateness.

It is true that, for the art of music, the
nineteenth century is a century of great individualistic composers. The same thing has occurred with music of that century as with Italian painting of the Renaissance; indeed, it not only turned out that what was created in the consecutive development of this art, from the quattrocento to the seicento (the fifteenth to the seventeenth centuries), was so remarkable that the average level of painting of that time was higher than the peaks of other epochs, but at the same time, within separate "clusters of years," there lived artistic giants, whose work, also individually disparate, enriched the most refined minds—those most avid for new impressions—with supreme compositions for years yet to come. This creation inspired, in multitudes of people, attitudes toward painting, conditioned by brilliant impressions, firmly imprinted in the consciousness, and these attitudes became a basic criterion for visual representation till the discoveries of the Impressionists inspired a vision of surrounding reality which, if not different, was at least enriched in a new way. Such an acute, keen penetrating, and far-sighted mind as that of Stendahl, who decisively influenced the European novel with his analysis of the feelings and passions of man, in his History of Painting in Italy, dwells with inquisitive wonder, through the three centuries beginning with Raphael, Michelangelo, and
Leonardo da Vinci, on these giants and their contemporaries and successors. One feels that he resists and wants to be freed from the "measurement of painting" bequeathed by the Renaissance, as he scatters well-aimed reservations here and there! But, in the end, he writes sparkling, positive, character "references" and summarizations" of his own observations, frankly giving himself up to lofty artistic emotion.

The music of the nineteenth century, starting from Beethoven, reveals to mankind a still far from exhausted world of intonations, of the same lofty inspiration [as the Renaissance masterpieces]. Man's excellence and the reality which he perceives, even in the midst of the century's brutality, is reflected, not only by the stars of first magnitude, but also by small, lesser stars, twinkling modestly, but still with light and color. Their music, of course, is psychological and does not, in general, attempt to be anything other than the music of the human heart. Berlioz, Chopin, Liszt, Schumann, Mendelssohn, Weber, Glinka, Schubert, Wagner, Tchaikovsky, Verdi, Bizet, Grieg, Brahms (this is only a small list!), however different were their talents, the force of their imaginations, their intellects, their tastes, their characters, their inclinations, and their creative methods, all observed the psychological
makeup of man and sympathized with the inevitable questions about the meaning of life which arise in the human consciousness. If Schumann set forth his "Why?" almost aphoristically, with maximum laconicism, others have done the same with no less intensity in broadly developed symphonic concepts, and, for the present, contemporary mankind does not really want to renounce all that is best, profoundly artistic, individually heartfelt, and intellectually lofty in these "questions from one life to another," for the sake of music which, frankly speaking, is objective, unemotional, and escapist. Obviously, the musical heritage of the nineteenth century (in many ways very far from us, but, on the basis of the humanity of its music, very near to us indeed), irrespective of its esthetic differentiation, is profoundly intonational in content. Thus, we, the contemporaries of the greatest economic, political, and social revolutions, trained by terrible wars to control ourselves in the face of innumerable misfortunes and losses, still breathe the ardour of the feelings in the intonations of Chopin, Schumann, Tchaikovsky, and the childish pureheartedness of Schubert; we delight in the classic lucidity of the genius of Glinka and the brilliance of Berlioz's imagination. And in the creation of all of them how much is still to be explored! Here,
it seems to me, is the basic cause of the apparent slowing down of the progress of music and of its media of expression; we are still in the atmosphere of the intonational content of a great musical century, which inspires us.

I will permit myself to introduce one more hypothesis, touching on the expressive qualities of "equal temperament," from under the aegis of which the European art of sound has still not emerged, although acoustical and mathematical data indisputably testify to its deficiencies. Perhaps the development of European music even within the limits of this temperament moved so persistently toward the recognition of the intonational qualities of timbre, especially toward the end of the century, that our hearing has already mastered the intoning of the overtone complex to the extent that it is fully in a position to shift to a new stage of instrumentalism "without those instruments which are familiar to us"--to the management of pure timbres as the maximally sensitive, expressive medium. It is necessary only to master them as the great violinists of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries mastered the violin, forcing it to begin to sing, i.e., creatively and not mechanically and rationally. It would seem that "movement forward,"
toward new vistas of expressiveness, and, consequently, toward a still more artistically keen concept of reality, is concealed in the unquestionable "sensitivity" to the intoning of timbres of the composers of the nineteenth century. Our mind will receive new joys, controlling sounds, in comparison with which our whole [present] system of intoning will seem less inspiring for our direct descendants, than the archaicness of the stern melodies of the Gregorian Chant is for us.*170

It is not without reason that Berlioz was the first, absolutely unique compositional personality of the last century; he did not instrument his ideas, but rather, conceived them only in terms of instrumental timbre. In his orchestra, the most important new quality was timbre as intonation. He himself proceeded gropingly, but methods of "academic elementary theory" have been undertaken to "measure" his creation. The results have been nonsense. The voice-leading of Berlioz, his melodics and harmony are irreproachable, where they are one whole with his feeling for timbres, but he himself, when he follows the track of scholastic harmony and abstract voice-leading, "leaves much to be desired" at times, and becomes intolerably careless. Not having understood the basic contradiction in the music of Berlioz, analysts have separated his "excellent
instrumentation" and his position as a "skillful orchestrator" from the intonational essence of his creation. They have begun to consider Berlioz's programmatic quality, his "figurative symphonism," his descriptive inventiveness as his essence, but the programmatic quality was merely his "Ariadne's thread" out of the labyrinth of academicism, into the atmosphere of timbre as intonation. Indeed, it remained as such a thread for succeeding "seekers of the language of timbres." But not all "program symphonists" have been numbered among these seekers. Berlioz has remained a "knight of solitude," with a tragic, wretched, confused soul, especially in his helplessness in the face of the shameless sensuality of Wagner. In another sphere, in contrast to the orchestra of Berlioz, there rose a star of intelligence and refined taste in the sphere of pianism. This was Chopin. He proved that the piano is, in essence, the "speech of timbres," sensitive, passionate, contrasting in its pathos. Indeed, if the "atmosphere of timbre," the breath of Chopin's melodic material, is removed, the music, in many of its features, withers. This is an indication that the charm and force of Chopin rests in his bewitching, logical knowledge of the "instrumentation" of the pianoforte,
the most difficult of all the arts of instrumentation, more difficult than orchestrating, because it is not hatched out of the learning by rote of ranges, registers, and trills according to the quantitative norms of textbooks. Pianism knows instrumentation only from the ear, from hearing the expressiveness in the intonation of timbre, and at that point the piano ceases to be a "percussion instrument."

These two graphic examples are sufficient to allow an attentive ear to deal in a general way with all the music of the past century and of our own twentieth century; then the picture will become clear. The recognition of timbre as an intonationally expressive quality passes by means of "Ariadne's thread," to our own time and is within the conditions of classical voice-leading. Even in the face of constructive canons which lag behind Beethoven, it is a most brilliant, progressive area of musical thought, seeking new paths for the artistic cognition of reality. It is not possible to reduce the value of these findings to the "progress of instrumentation" as an object of activity peculiar to composers of the nineteenth century. The instrumentation of the eighteenth century developed no less progressively and intensively and also "tastefully." However, at that point they were still not far from
almost a guild concept of orchestration, and they were a long way from the realization of the expressiveness "of speech" which was accessible to an intonation of timbres, with instrumentation subordinated to the influence of voice-leading founded on a complex of timbres. True, there were premonitions of this in the eighteenth century, but not to the point of the complete transformation of all elements of composition into a "language of timbres."

The path to timbre as an expressive element of music went through a very extensive process of feeling and understanding timbre as a factor of inventiveness, and as a manifestation of sound coloring. In the nineteenth century, in fact, this inventiveness of timbre was a predominant factor. One must not confuse the contemporary stage of the concept of timbre as expressive speech with the concept of timbre as the "coloring of intonations."

In the latter case, timbre is applicable to any music, seemingly being deposited in it, while in the former, timbre itself defines melody, harmony, rhythm, and figurativeness, i.e., it becomes an intonational unity. I very well recall how in 1912 the beginning of Stravinsky's Rite of Spring struck the ear and the consciousness with the most expressive "playing" of the bassoon; timbre became image. But indeed, at that time, our hearing was quite spoiled by the colorful dainties of French Impressionism, which
were easily assimilated. For example, Tcherepnin, in his lyrically agreeable music, tastefully applied timbre as color to the most varied material and achieved, like many others, a very beautiful coloration and play of highly colored spots. But Rimski-Korsakov had begun to do this long before, and did it well throughout the entire course of his brilliant artistic activity. His contemporaries, with some persistence, tended to draw a distinction in his work between the talented composer and the excellent, "incomparable" orchestrator. However, the penetrating mind of a composer sensitive to timbre led him ever forward; even after the death of Nikolai Andreevich, when Le Coqd'Or was presented, the effect of the second act was staggering. The timbres of the orchestra and the voice of the Queen of Shemakha became a living, expressive language. If it were not for the annoying, comic, or rather operatic fool's situation, with the naturalistic intonations of the stupid king and his army commander constantly spoiling the wonderful role of timbres, this music would serve as the revelation of a new world of intonations.*

It was not without reason that I named Berlioz and Chopin above. In the works of both there are presentiments of the expressiveness and pithiness of the language of timbres. Chopin, a musician intellectually more delicate and refined than Berlioz, consistently searched for the
expressiveness of timbre, while Berlioz was more often carried away by the pure coloration of timbres in the face of "indifferent" musical material. In his music there are many such annoying "ambiguities." But when expression and inventiveness coincided, what force and brilliance, what striking and realistic images arose in his music! Let us take Roman Carnival, "The March to the Scaffold" in the Symphonie Fantastique (there are many expressive timbre "fragments" throughout the work, but this movement is laconically and expressively whole), and the Byronic expressiveness of Harold in Italy, to name a few. There is much which is expressed, i.e. intoned, only by the language of timbre in the qualitatively uneven symphonic tragedy, Romeo et Juliette, and especially in the Requiem. One cannot help but recall that the intelligent, keenly observant Glinka, in the beginning of his "Nights in Madrid" (in general, this entire overture is perceived as a very early harbinger of Impressionistic inventiveness) displayed an exceptional example of timbre as figurative expression, afterward misunderstood for a very long time by Russian musicians, although they were carried away by the colorfulness of the timbres. Only Dargomizhskii in his characterological vocal style often employed the nuances and expression of the timbre of the human voice as a flexible and psychologically truthful language, both
in his romanzas and, especially, in *The Stone Guest*.
Here and there this is noticeable in his instrumentation.
Tchaikovsky achieved a profound expressiveness of timbre
in the scene of Gherman with the countess in *The Queen of
Spades*; this is the authentic, realistic speech of timbre.
Stravinsky, of course, is an outstanding master of expres-
siveness of timbre. Beside the treasures in *Rite of
Spring*, his *Wedding* (*Les Noces*) and especially the
*Symphony for Wind Instruments* are amazing in this respect.
The well-known pieces for orchestra of Schoenberg reveal
timbre as breathing, as "*melos of complexes of timbres*."
The same is true in some scenes from Alban Berg's *Wozzeck*. 
CHAPTER XI

Through the inventive and (to a lesser degree) expressive application of timbres, composers of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries have attempted, and are still attempting (while, for the most part, clinging to the logic of classical voice-leading) to overcome the stagnant, academic traditions of the constructive schemes of music. Constructive norms are necessary to and characteristic of the temporal arts, just as they are in the spatial arts, but in music, in the absence of "counterforces of visibility," these norms have been turned into an entirely different quality, into forms. The concept of "artistic form" as unity of content and its figurative realization has begun to be confused with the genre and kinds of music-making, with constructions, theoretical schemes, and forms as manifestations of construction. In music, this figurative realization is accomplished in time, in the formation, simultaneously and consecutively, of the elements of music, and in the continuous overcoming of formal schemes. If we transfer into figurative language, it is possible to make a comparison
with driving along a long highway. Along the road stand mile markers; they divide the distance into parts, but the road consists of links in a chain of living impressions, and only by traveling it does the traveler perceive the road as a whole. In music, the composer leads his thought along as the intonation of sound* employing, of course, various kinds of constructive schemes. But, like the mile posts, the schemes themselves do not sound, nor tell us anything. Music is established as a unity of content and form in the consciousness of the composer, who goes ahead of the listener to complete the journey as the embodiment of the intoned thought-idea which his composition becomes. In listening to and perceiving the music and making it a condition of his consciousness, the listener "travels the same path traveled by the composer, but introduces into it his own ideas, views, tastes, habits, or even simply, his emotional disposition. Still, only by having heard it does the listener perceive the content of the composition. If he does not hear the form as a whole, in unity, he "grasps" only fragments of the content. This is all clear and simple.

However, the development of music as an intonational language has been so complicated and saturated with so many contradictions, that only toward the epoch of
Beethoven did musical thought succeed in becoming independent, free, that is, to turn all the elements, all the properties and media which organize its form into a musically expressive language. But that is not all. Let us take timbre, for example. As a property, it was always inherent in the sound of the human voice and in each instrument. This was known and, at times, it was emphasized as something exceptional. But timbre, consciously employed, became an expressive language of music almost before our eyes. Nor is it possible to say precisely when the interval appeared, fixed in the consciousness, as the distance of one sound from another. Intervals as an intonationally expressive quality—the conjugation of tones of the mode and the different degrees of this conjugation—could be realized in such a self-contained content only with a certain self-sufficiency already, a certain independence of music from the "mute language" of human motion, and from the syllable enumerating (syllabic) rhythmics of verbal (poetic) intonation, etc., etc. Without the consciousness of the musical essence (not just of the acoustical nature) of intervals, the exposure of the basic quality of musical thinking, and, consequently, also the finding of the path to monumental musical forms, as a valuable revelation of artistic ideational content, was unrealizable. This basic quality is succession and
simultaneity in the sounding of intervals. The realization of this process ineffably enriched the possibilities of music; polyphony arose as intonational thinking with the gradual, ever greater disclosure of the independent intoning of each voice, with, however, a composite treatment of the "simultaneity" of sounds. The "discovery" of the activation of music, through the methods of imitation and the further development of its principles, introduced "refinement" into complexity and "revived" the expressiveness of the whole polyphonic fabric. Only the gradual (judging by the preserved monuments) consolidation in the consciousness of the qualitative differentiation of each interval, of its mutual conjugations with the remaining tones in melodic consecutiveness and in simultaneous, still composite, unity, only this consolidation, both in performance practice and in the perception of listeners, could promote the further development of voice-leading and, above all, the concept of the expressive force of harmony.*174

The heightened feeling of intervallic conjugation led, in harmony, through the centralization of the old-fashioned modal system (medieval church modes) into the feeling of major.

These modes were closely linked with the notion of music as a unity of the rhythmic intonation of word and tone together with the prevalence of the intonation of the
Gregorian Chant. European harmony itself grew out of the gradually forming new diatonicism, with the emphasized recognition of the second semitone in the mode as the leading tone. The distinctiveness of this phenomenon in the intonational nature of European music is striking. It was just this factor which revealed the qualitative variety (on the basis of intervallic conjugation) of sound complexes, and, again very slowly, conditioned their grouping according to the principle of their greater or lesser tension and their degree of striving toward the fundamental tone, toward the tonic. From the intensified quality of intonation of the leading tone, among the semitones, there developed another series of consequences of importance in a consideration of form as a process of intoning; in a modal sense, the quality of the tetrachord, a long-standing heritage of the Mediterranean musical culture, was obliterated and the European sound series became an intonational unity, a scale (according to visual codification). In connection with the evolution of harmony, the feeling of "dominantness" arose, was recognized more and more, and led to feelings of tonal differentiation within the norms of a common mode. There occurred a rapprochement of the musical intellectual culture of the cities with folk music, in which, one may assume, music-making in the major mode, with the presence of the leading tone quality, had already
taken shape in an emotionally spontaneous manner. 175

In addition, the whole further course of development of European music showed that modal formation had not congealed because increasingly intellectualized thinking evoked, in intonation, ever more subtle feeling of the conjugation of tones. First of all, the "feeling of the leading tone quality" organized the major mode, after which the "absorption" of the old modes into the sphere of the leading tone followed; this was a verification, in intonational experience, of their vital capacity. The old modes were crystallized in the major mode and "imitated" it. Further, from the progressively more subtle conjugation of semitones there began a complex intoning, a "reinterpretation" of the degrees of the major mode with the transference of the "feeling of the leading tone" into the degrees of the mode most necessary for the growth of the dominant sphere. For example, the raising of the fourth degree, thereby sharpening the leading tone quality, destroyed completely the quality still felt, cf the tetrachord which divided the sound series into two analogous halves. Raising of the second degree strengthened the dominant quality. On the other hand, lowering the second degree, introducing a leading tone from above, emphasized the striving toward the point of support, toward the tonic. Lowering the sixth degree of the mode, with a raised fourth
degree called forth many different intonational "reinterpretations," within the mode.\textsuperscript{1} Through almost the entire nineteenth century there occurred an intonational "testing" of the expressive qualities of the leading tone in a great number of compositions, to which was opposed an intensification of the influence of diatonicism, by means of the cross-breeding of the major mode, and its "tonal metamorphoses," with the most varied modes, both ancient European and "exotic."

There are innumerable examples of that, in both the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, up to the present time. The music of Chopin is permeated through and through with a complex connection and interchange of an intensified leading tone quality and a refined dominantness, with folk-modal diatonicism.\textsuperscript{*177} This interaction, carried out with striking naturalness, conditions the exceptional vital capacity, the expressiveness, of all the elements of a form which is always exposed in unbroken intonational formation; in the process of perception a feeling of the clarity,

\textsuperscript{1}I speak in more detail about all the processes given here, in a compressed manner, in my book about Glinka, devoted to an analysis of his creative method and to his intonational basis.\textsuperscript{*176}
just proportion, balance, and "tonic quality" of the musical thought remains in the consciousness, irrespective of the nervousness of the work's emotional tone. In the works of Chopin, everything--each intonational detail--organizes the mode as if it were reinterpreting it.

It is the same with Chopin's form. For example, it is possible to argue about the constructive schemes of his ballades, but Chopin's thought flows, within them, with the most persuasive naturalness, thanks to an ineradicably persuasive intonational logic. In passing "along the path of each ballade" jointly with the composer, intoning it with him, the attentive, thoughtful listener experiences the lofty, intellectual joy of close, direct contact with the music in all the wealth of its expressiveness.²

²This is the most difficult test of hearing music. If one possesses a firm theoretical and analytical preparation, it is necessary, through persistent exercises, to evoke intonational "activity" of one's own hearing, and, during perception, to "remove" and cut off from the consciousness any suggestions of theory, keeping them within oneself, as in a textbook, in case of the necessity for formal explanation. Activity of the hearing consists in connecting "each moment of perceived music, as it is intoned by the internal hearing" (if it is played, rather than "read,"
I have just repeated briefly some thoughts about the development of the most important stages of intonational "organization" in European music, in accordance with what has been stated above in the course of the entire study, but carrying my observations on into the nineteenth century.

Since the "past" of music was consolidated and the "present" was outlined in the person of Beethoven, the nineteenth century turned out to be, not only a "repository" for the intonational experience of the past, but also a fast arena for its exposure. Thus one must hear each of these moments with the consciousness, before it is sounded with the fingers, with the preceding and succeeding sounds, at the same time, establishing its correlation, through "arches," [with sounds] at a distance, until either its stability or "ambiguity" is felt. One must listen as to living speech, not thinking about musical grammar; when one perceives verbal speech, understanding comes, not from grammatical analysis, but from an evaluation of the intonational significance in each of its features (word, accent, tonus of speech, and connection of the preceding with the following), in conjugations of groups of features, and, finally, in the whole. Thus, in music, one cannot neglect a single detail, and must recognize each conjugation of sounds either as musically and meaningfully persuasive and natural, or, on the contrary, unnatural or accidental if, in the subsequent movement of the music, there is no conclusion drawn from a complex given earlier. It is very difficult to explain this condition of hearing verbally, but it is known to every musician, to a greater or lesser degree.
the realization of all the elements making up musical form, as manifestations of the intonational quality, continued with exceptional tension, as was revealed in the experiments with timbre as an expressive language. In the examples of Berlioz and Chopin it has been made clear how the work of the composers' thought proceeded and what stormy creative contradictions attended the development of music, by which it is demonstrated that the essence of development was not in merely the more or less flexible technological application of assimilated norms of musical etymology and syntax. All the channels of life were filled, in the beginning of the century, with seething, human thought and work.

Music, in the hands of Beethoven, matured to the level of the highest intellectual manifestations of the human brain. Therefore, it could participate both in all the purposefulness of the intellect and in emotional life, the life of feeling. The intonation of man has always been the most sensitive guide in the disclosure of his ideational world in musical sound and verbal speech. Creative conceptions become manifest for the public consciousness, through the disclosure of intonation,
either in speech, or in music (I have in mind the so-called temporal arts). But the nervous trembling and the heightened emotional tonus of the life of society of the new century were especially reflected in musical intonation (even poetry, in the persons of Lamartine, Byron, and Shelley, was tangibly refreshed by lyricism similar to music--by musical figurativeness). Music, sensitive to the ebbs and flows of the sea of life, again verified, in living creative experience, its own expressive possibilities, to which were adapted the norms of musical grammar. Intonation tested the vital capacity of these norms, and not the contrary. The intensity of this testing also created a perfect musical technique for the nineteenth century, which seems self-sufficing, since it is lifeless only in the music schools.
CHAPTER XII

In the concluding part of my attempt to formulate a substantiation of musical intonation, it has seemed necessary to illustrate, with several examples, how music has overcome its own peculiar inertia through the influence of figurative intonational thinking which continuously enriches itself. In the symphonism of Beethoven, powerful affirmation, persuasiveness and triumph persistently manifest themselves. The tonic, the tonic feeling, prevails, but it is more than a mere exposure of tonicness, rather, each manifestation occurs, not as an undifferentiated repetition of the tonic chord, but as a rising up of a chain of efforts. To take even the well-known purposefulness of the Allegro of the Fifth Symphony, all the furious dramatic effect of the music arises out of an "uninterrupted succession of affirmations" (of various degrees of tension), each of which is achieved, briefly and concisely, through the opposition of the dominant to the tonic, and is not simply inferred. What can be simpler, theoretically, than this chain of gradations, within which complete consonance arises by the superposition of tones of a chord one on another? It is the most
elementary of the elementary exercises in harmony. And yet, suddenly, thanks to just the dynamics of these most simple gradations, thanks to the impetuosity of their couplings in each moment and overall, the most tense music is achieved--one of the most stately, Beethovenesque statements of the drama of life--not in meditation, however, but in the image and beauty of struggle. The whole motion of the thought is unfolded with maximum brevity, severity, and authority. As a whole, there is an absoluteness of affirmation, persuasiveness, and artistic balance, but in the consciousness of the listener there is agitation. The thought has found the most perfect and satisfactory form for itself through the most expressive formation of the simplest intonations (from a theoretical point of view). From this, we may conclude that the essence of artistic success is in the concentration of the intoned thought in the most purposeful musical utterances and expressions.

The Allegro first movement of the Fifth Symphony serves as the most characteristic symbolic image for the development of form in a significant number of the symphonic compositions of the nineteenth century; in them, the basic, guiding principle is the gradation of sonority, the degrees and intonational structures of
which are extremely multifaceted.\textsuperscript{1} In these compositions are found both compressed "stretto" features, and the statics of the accumulation of sonorities on an "organ point," as if stopping the formation of thought for the purpose of gathering expressive force. Here are found contrasting juxtapositions of tonalities with the "gaps" filled in gradually with connecting tonalities, just as in the melodics of folk-music there is a constant alternation of motion by wide intervals and its step-wise equalization. In summary, one may say that not a single one of the intonationally purposeful "conjugations" of intervals, which has had a place in the melodics of past European music, is lost in the symphonism of the nineteenth century. Rather, it is reintoned on a larger scale, in more powerful, expressive layers of music, thereby confirming the established, basic operating forces of musical organization. These forces, in turn, have been conditioned by several "constants" or permanencies of musical expression--i.e., or the exposure of thinking--which have been determined in the evolution of intonation.

\textsuperscript{1}But in contrast to the persuasiveness of the "tonic," as I have already indicated, the rule of the "dominant" circle of intonations, i.e., a sort of "overflow of the leading tone quality," now has its beginning.
One cannot exaggerate the increased significance of the "instability" of the dominant and the growth from it of an apparent "weakening" of the mode. The intonational force of the "leading tone" operates in two ways: both as a tendency, a purposefulness toward the tonic, and as a delay, a "prolongation" of the tension of this tendency. Both depend on the quality of utterance, i.e., in what formation of ideas and feelings these "forces" are included. Either the purposeful inclination toward the tonic is turned into annoying repetition, which nullifies any persuasiveness (as this has occurred in the most varied forms and genre), or the "leading tone feeling," because of the sentimental "fragility" of its surroundings, loses its force of purposefulness (in the so-called "salon" music, and also in the intonational "comfortableness" of domestic or "family" music), or, on the contrary, the saturation of the "leading-tone quality" with full-blooded dominant harmonies so heightens the intensity of the conditions of "expectation of the tonic" that they become self-sufficing. Here it may be said, figuratively, that the stage of the gathering of forces prevails over that of a decisive stroke. The predominance of such "intonations of accumulation" before the tonic does not necessarily signify a "languishing" or "indecisiveness," in every case, nor diffusion of the
consciousness. This is not always the "hand with the axe," stiffening in the air in an indecisive movement before the stroke. The quality of the thought and of the emotional pitch decides here whether the intonation is purposeful or not.  

The causes of intonational and emotional "contradictions" are understandable. In the nineteenth century the sharpness of contradictions in all aspects of cultural development, and the tenseness of the perception of life, could not help but tell on human feelings, but it evoked in them, not only negative qualities, but also unprecedented sensitivity and refinement in the seeing and hearing of reality, which, in its turn, inevitably influenced the sensitiveness and the perceptiveness of the hearing and, in general, the loftiness of tonus of the intonational system. The intonational "nervousness," characteristic of the nineteenth century, is a reflection of all the changes in the psychological makeup of mankind, and it would be difficult for music, as the

---

2 One must still not forget that stable, counter-balancing, "tonic" intonations are also very symptomatic and persuasive in the music of the nineteenth century. The nervous age heard less of them, but now things are different, and, in a survey of the musical creation of the past century, the "layers of the tonic" emerge noticeably (Glinka, Grieg, Brahms, Debussy).
art of intonation, not to "reflect" phenomena, commonly
called "nervousness" or "nervous life," without itself
growing numb and being diverted from the mainstream of
the emotional order of its contemporaneity.

Fluctuations in various intonational "modal
structures," of course, intensified, for the perception,
the instability of the conjugations of sound elements,
because the thought of the composer was, itself, a re­
flection of complex social contradictions. However, one
must not forget that in any art there are epochs when the
highest intellectual purposefulness and esthetic balance
are achieved, not by the persuasiveness of "correct
correlations," but through all the semblances of the
destruction of the status quo. At a distance, however,
it turns out that the mind which directed this art, by
testing the force of resistibility and expressiveness of
historically determined norms of artistic thinking, and
by eliminating sluggish, moribund media of "expression,"
has turned artistic creation in the direction of progress.
We may always recall the great triad in the area of
painting, Leonardo da Vinci, Raphael, and Michelangelo,
the last in particular. Not one of them was a radical.
If there is no guiding thought or idea, then there is
nothing to say; transient human opinions, however inter­
esting, exciting, and very necessary in ordinary life,
still are only opinions. Just as it is in all types of art, so it is in music. For example, the native, age-old stability of Russian peasant life fashioned exceptionally perfect forms of art, saturated with wise strength; in its music, the great, indisputably perfect art was singing. But once the mode of life began to change, the new varieties of dance melody, like the "chastushka," and the "urban romanza," carried their own system. And can we say that there is nothing among these contemporary forms which is perfect or created by the "truth of life?"

"Deafened" both by physical deafness and equally, if not more strongly and profoundly, by the persistent lack of understanding of the real value of his creation, Beethoven in his last sonatas and quartets, as if to spite the "brilliant and joyous life" of the conquerors of Napoleon, went off into a distinctive sphere of music in thoughtful monologues, "in private with himself."

What a rich, supersensitive emotional world is unfolded before us by his thinking, which searchingly examines his own "ego" and that of mankind! Beethoven's intonations, like the powerful hand of Michelangelo, in his time, seem to destroy all the canonicity of rhythmic formulae, constructions, and conjugations. His thought strongly accentuates what is usually unrevealed and illuminates it in the manner of Rembrandt, sets in
sharp relief that which is obscured, and dwells for a long time on apparent details. Beethoven seems to throw away the powerful methods for the organization of symphonism and lays bare the "essence of music": voice-leading and rhythm, directed by his will. Neither Beethoven's pathetic Warum? (Why—for what reason—is there suffering?), nor the quiet majesty of joyous peace at the end of the last sonata, detract from what is most important: the existence, over all, of a clear "reasonableness of thought" and the will of the human mind.

And here, at the end of the century, is Scriabin. His is an art of completely refined, artistic intellectualism, of taste and a thirst for the joy of communication. Indeed, his Utopian philosophy rises from the strivings of a solitary enthusiast, a Promethean intellectual on the threshold between two centuries, toward the joy of universal human communication. The problem is not at all in the nervousness and trembling, the ecstatic quality of his art, for by this quality it was inescapably contemporary. Something else affirms the disputability of the greatness of Scriabin's music. Even the contemporaries of Scriabin felt the contradiction between the fervency and refinement of his harmonies and the indifferent immobility of his form, i.e., of
constructive norms and schemes, and even the lifelessness of his "periods." Moreover, Scriabin's "developments," in comparison with Beethoven's, are naive, and are strikingly inferior to the dramatized symphonic development, saturated with clashing sensations, in the works of Tchaikovsky.

Involuntarily, the thought suggests itself of the profound contradiction between the intellect which organizes music--its ideological formation and high ethical disposition--and the "influxes of new material," the "invention of novelty" in sound impressions. A vital form, conditioned by the quality and force of intonation of a given epoch, always overcomes the inertness of schemes and constructions, either expanding and developing them, or abolishing them. Only the most viable survive. The area of the sonata, the symphony, the overture, chamber music, and even the Lied, all were tested by the consciousness of Beethoven, from the point of view of form. But, as for novelty of material, his music is rooted very deeply in the intonations of his contemporaneity. Also deeply rooted in the intonations of its time, making an artistically esthetic and ethical selection from them, is the creation of Bach, as well as that of Mozart. That which is new in the "material" which the great masters present rarely occurs subjectively and arbitrarily, and is almost invariably a
requirement resulting from the entire ideational forma-
tion of the epoch. One cannot totally deny this even in
Scriabin; the "gothic ardour" of his harmonies and their
ecstatic quality, as if in the spirit of El Greco, re-
flected the mood of his own time. But the contrast of
this progressiveness with the almost lethargic work of
creative thought in the area of form has evoked, and
continues to evoke, to the present time, in spite of
all the feelings of wonder and love for Scriabin, pro-
found doubts as to the vital capacity of his music,
doubts whether this is not merely a complicated complex
of sensitive, nervous, and most original, lyrical
statements of "Utopian individualism"; whether all the
daring attempts (and not only on Scriabin's part) to
demonstrate the vital stability of this individualism
were for nothing, because this world outlook was long
since doomed; and whether, for that reason, in music
similar to Scriabin's the great achievement of European
musical thought and intonation--development--had not
begun to lose its force, to be exhausted. Beethoven, in
his time, depended, not upon "what was doomed," but on
what was living, and his symphonic development directed
the entire symphonism of the nineteenth century.

Side by side with sensitive receptivity to the
intonational qualitativeness of intervals and the striv-
ing to draw all conclusions from the major mode, to the
point of extreme psychological exhaustion of the "leading tone quality" (after which followed the stage, not only of the affirmation of "the tonic," but also of the peculiar process, characteristic of contemporary music, of "tonicalization of the dominant"), all post-Beethoven musical composition feels the influence of development. In this phenomenon, musical intonation finds the possibility of a prolonged, powerful revelation of thought, without conceding superiority to the achievements of speech intonation in the area of poetry, oratorical art, and the theatre. The flexibility of the methods of development in music permitted, as never before, the ascent to an artistic high point in the area of "poetic-figurative symphonism" (so-called program music). The Wagnerian musical drama also owed much to this achievement. In general, of course, Wagner's creation was not a synthesis of art, but a creative revision and summarization of the symphonic and dramatic, musical-intonational stimuli of development and intonational poetics (indeed, Wagner knew how to "hear" the myths and

3 This is achieved by a peculiar intonational shading--the shutting-off or obscuring in dominant chords of their characteristic, defining tones, or else by the inclusion within them of the elements of "tonicness."
the ancient German speech of legends). 4

In chamber music--the sphere of musical intellectualism--even though the elemental force of the romantic " ebbs and flows " of intonational waves became intolerable, still the principle of development revealed possibilities for the realization of the greatest expectations in the post-Beethoven epoch, as was demonstrated by Brahms and S. Taneev.

In the evolution of development, composers strove to overcome the "constructive framework" of the sonata allegro, "removing for the hearing" the clear-cut demarcation of sections (exposition, working-out section, reprise), something which even Beethoven had begun to do with the expansion of the introductions, the pithiness of which transformed the earlier classical introductions into "saw kerfs"*178 in comparison with his majestic symphonic formations. Beethoven's codas also emphasized development, serving as secondary stages of it, after the working-out section and the reprise. Subsequently, all the "component parts" of the symphonic allegro were permeated by development (this phenomenon is very

4 "Revision and summarization" concerned not only sonata principles of development, but also principles of monothematicism (imitation, variation, fugue), in which the polythematicism of Wagner found new expressive possibilities in continuing "Beethoven's revision."
interesting in the work of Brahms), and even the statement of the themes (exposition) radiated purposefulness and capacity for growth in each of its elements, especially in the structure of motives. The "Beethovenesque gradations" at times lose their force, massiveness, and tension, in the work of successive symphonists; symphonic development, in spite of all the power of intonational dynamics, becomes filled with a nervous, rather than a strong and manly temperament. At one time the "excitation" and "swelling" of aural dynamics by means of sequences and various sorts of "crescendoing" repetitions, then the tearing away of these intensifications by means of so-called "interrupted cadences" and various kinds of "postponements" of the appearance of the tonic, by which a still greater intensity of secondary expectation was achieved, was convincing. The emotional persuasiveness of this device was very strong. But then the presence of gradations of the "Beethoven style," even in very dramatized stages of symphonism, had not exhausted its manful influence. Brahms is amazing. In his symphonies and sonatas, his

5 This device may be figuratively and intonationally defined thus: the ear awaits the tonic to a degree corresponding to the tension created, but the affirmation when it finally occurs, sounds as if it is "in the wrong direction," "the wrong one." Interrupted or "false" cadences are a sort of intonational "deception."*179
concerti, and even in his lyricism (especially for piano), development is felt everywhere. It is rare to find a "motive" (the smallest intonational nucleus, as for example, a brief rhythmic intonation) which does not contain the potential for development, yet, as a whole, everything is convincingly monumental, even epical or narrative in character. The narrative quality is even felt as a truly classical, poetic deliberateness, but never as the result of anemia. And when it is necessary and "preferable," the mind of Brahms creates splendid, temperamental and dramatic pages.

In this great epical symphonism of the nineteenth century there is much in common with Flaubert, and not only in the exposure of thought, which in both cases is wholly by means of intonation. Flaubert tried to see whatever was written by him as something which he had already heard; in creating he spoke--intoned, his narrative aloud--seeking phrases, as Beethoven did for the piano. Brahms, as a musician and a composer, of course, is intonational in a more profound sense. But there is

6And usually it reveals itself immediately as such in development. The so-called coldness and academicism of Brahms are only the "excuses of lazy perception." The Aeneid of Virgil is also "cold," but what a passionate mind created this poem!
something else which they have in common, which seems to be a passionless, neutral, and cold objectivism; the thoroughness of execution, provability and validity of their thoughts bring them closer together. Brahms did not find the "quality of development" of his themes empirically, in improvisation, in a blaze of creation, but rather, in his consciousness they had already been evaluated for this very quality. It is as if they were included in the composition, because, while intoning them in his consciousness, Brahms recognized their value, having experienced them earlier. The emotionalism of Brahms is always perceived as a summarized, verified, and evaluated observation, and not as the suggestion of a strong impression, although such impressions could have been, and must have been in the work of Brahms, as well as in that of Flaubert.

With this comparison, even though it appears subjective, I conclude my study. Everything I have said, I have tested with long-years of persistent observations, persistent training in myself of internal hearing which is not abstract, and in constant testing of its intonational receptivity. My modest, personal creative experience, directed, in just the same way, by intonational tasks, has given me many possibilities to convert what has been observed into active experience. I have understood that
composers must possess for a long time that which poets, novelists, and orators have long possessed the ability to understand and value perception, impelled by the public consciousness, not as "a concession to the tastes of a contemptible public" (it has long since been necessary to abandon this pride), but as a phenomenon having profound significance in the entire process of organization and formation of music as a test of its vital capacity. I am aware that I have been forced to state, in a concentrated and generalized manner, and in the form of hypotheses, much that became clear for me long ago; I want only to give a guiding thread to those who, perhaps, will find something, in these still sketchy studies, which is valuable and deserving of further elaboration. Life will bear witness.

One thing more. This work was created and nurtured in the midst of many troubles in the world of reality, in creation, and in the art of music. In it, in spite of all the conflicting currents and directions, one thing is valid for the present day: Classical voice-leading, created by centuries of human efforts. Like a proud rock, it has met (for almost two centuries now) the sunrise and the sunset of creative individualism, styles, and technical media, and, just as the waves of a stormy sea test the vital stability of the rock, so shifts of
creative forces have tested the vital capacity of Classical voice-leading, justified by the naturalness of human intonation.
CONCLUSION

Music, of course, could not spring up out of the emotionally aroused speech of man, because both human speech itself, and the musical system of intervals which conditions the art of musical sounds, are possible only where there is a capacity for intoning, i.e., for the exposure of sound, directed by the breathing and comprehended as an activity of the human intellect. Music is wholly an intonational art and is neither a mechanical transference of acoustical phenomena into the area of artistic imagination, nor the naturalistic exposure of the sensual sphere. Like any activity of man which apprehends and reorganizes reality, music is directed by the consciousness and represents rational activity. The sensual (i.e., the emotional) tonus, inevitably characteristic of music, is not its cause, for music is an art of intoned meaning. This art is conditioned by nature and by the process of human intoning; man, in this process, does not consider himself apart from his relation to reality, and neither verbal nor musical intonation is exposed by means of mechanical articulation, removed from the quality of the
the voice. Therefore, the tonus of the human voice—the manifestation of psychological reality in sound—is always "colored" with emotional meaning and more or less emotionally tense, depending on the extent of the pitch range. But the formation of sensations exposed in sound—i.e., intoned—is always controlled by the brain, by the intellect; otherwise music would be some sort of "art of interjection," and not an art of the reflection of reality in sound images by means of the human vocal apparatus, and, with a musical instrumentation which reproduces to a significant extent the human process of intoning, especially in the formation of melody. For melody, in its emotionally meaningful expressiveness, is wholly a creation of the human consciousness, and its basis is a strictly rationalistic system of intervals.

The usual definition of intervals, the distance or relation between two sounds, is very narrow and mechanistic, or rather, static, for this is not a matter of [measurement] "by divider," nor of seemingly, conventionally fixed sounds. Both words and tones, the individual musical sounds, are separated, but the verbal and musical interchange of sounds creates intonational points, "knots," or complexes in an uninterruptedly tense range of sounds, in the vocal tonus of wooden or brass tubes, or the tonus of the violin bow. In this sense, verbal or musical
"speech" is continuous (with "caesuræ" for breath). The "sound arches," discovered by experience, linking one intoned "point" (in principle, any) to another, are fixed in the consciousness through repetition, as evoking an expected effect or figurative sound impression of a more or less similar quality. These are the causes and prototypes of intervals. Only in further prolonged evolution has a system of connections between expressive sound arches arisen, similar to an astronomical atlas or to an intelligible sound-net cast on an uninterrupted sound formation within the limits of a given pitch range, timbre, and vocal placement, in a word, of some "tonus of speech."

Spontaneous intoning, the affectively emotional tonus of speech is, in essence, a glissando, i.e., the indistinguishability of separate tones and their connections or correlations. Melody is an intellectualized reflection of this continuity of sound exposure; the indistinguishability of tones becomes a tightly cohesive fusion, i.e., both continuity and lack of continuity simultaneously, which is the art of vocalization (it is the same whether we are dealing with the human voice or with, let's say, the clarinet or the French horn: the difference is not in principle, but in different qualities of resonators).

The necessity, recognized through experience, for
musical intonation within a clear-cut pitch range and accordingly, within a constant set of sound relations, conditions the purposefulness of selection of expressive tones and their links (sound arches), by which the exceptional emotional and intonational sensitiveness of intervals is defined and clarified. The key to the comprehension of the realistically meaningful bases of musical art lies in the recognition of this sensitiveness.

A significant number of years have passed, in the history of music, during which musical intonation has revolved around some interval which is characteristic for a given epoch, like an intonational center around which both the simplest and the most complicated intonational relations are deposited. We may cite as examples, the fourth in the melody of the French bourgeois revolution, the sixth in the works of the Romantics as an expression of a unique hexachordal mode, the augmented fourth and diminished fifth in the works of the Russian Five, and the culture of fifths in the works of the French Impressionists. The expressiveness of these phenomena throws itself on the hearing to such an extent that it is not possible to reject them as "formal factors". These are composers whose talent, in an exceptionally refined way, is responsive to the socially expressive significance of a given interval in a given segment of time, and to that of the intervals most commonly grouped around it. This responsiveness does not
just occur intuitively, but summons up in the composer's intellect a fully conscious "control" of the emotionally meaningful effect of certain intervals. The Russian psycho­realist composers, especially Dargomyzhskiǐ, Musorgskiǐ, and Tchaikovsky, possessed this talent to an exceptional degree. The "purposefulness" of the employment of intervals as intonationally expressive "influences" in the works of Dargomyzhskiǐ is strikingly consistent. Of course, the "content of an interval" is not given once and for all in any verbal formula. It is always in a correlation, in process, in meaningful, concretely historical conditionality, and in this connection it is no less consistent and precise than the content of a word. In other words, the expressiveness of each interval is conceived of as limitless and eternal, but it is limited by historically concrete and psycho-realistic factors. The fourth of the Marseillaise and the fourth which is the characteristic interval in the figure of Don Juan in Dargomyzhskiǐ's Stone Guest are qualitatively different, for their intonational aims are different.

Everything which has been said here about intervals may properly be applied also to tonalities, the intonational content and expressiveness of which are conditioned by their "intervallic" correlations with one another which explains both the closeness and the remoteness of their
relationships, also not absolute, but concretely perceived in the historical process.

It is only necessary to understand that modes, like intervals, are the expressive realities of music, not formally structural elements, and the multi-form and expressive life of a mode in any epoch of musical formation will be revealed to the receptive ear. Thus, in contemporary European music, within the all-uniting major mode, the processes of modal differentiation and integration, which are constantly reflected in musical compositions, always coexist. The phenomenon of the leading tone quality has led to the spread of the feeling of the leading tone to many degrees of the mode, which, in its turn, has entailed a more refined auditory discernment of the relationship of tones and the inclusion in the major of any tonality belonging to, as it seemed earlier, a far-removed system. The natural continuation of this process is the transformation of the tonally neutral chromatic scale (like the elemental glissando), into a semitone mode of differentiated components. The "tritone," having become a free leap of the voice, i.e., almost a consonance, yields, when filled in, a "compressed" mode of six semitones, which has achieved great significance in contemporary music. In the nineteenth century, the increasing persistence of the major sixth as a "full consonance" led to an exceptionally
interesting phenomenon, which, it seems to me, has escaped scholars to the present time—to the revival and firm consolidation of the hexachord, now as a mode. In Russian classical music, in the works of Glinka, especially of Dargomyzhskiĭ, and of Tchaikovsky, and also in the work of the composers of popular romanzas, this phenomenon is observed quite often and strikes the ear with its expressively meaningful aspect. I speak in detail about this in my work on Tchaikovsky's Eugene Onegin.* The "hexachord"—the quality of six degrees—at times sounds as an independent mode (a well-known example is the ballade of the Finn in Ruslan,* and at other times forms a peculiar "internal mode," especially characteristic in the minor, where it is transformed into a minor sixth (especially from the fifth to the third or from the third downward to the fifth) with the "engagement" of the semitone before the fifth as the leading tone to it (the beginning of the aria of Lenskii, etc.). The well-known melody of the subsidiary part in Tchaikovsky's Sixth Symphony is a characteristic model of the hexachord of the major sixth as an "inner mode." We may say, incidentally, that in its multifaceted melodic conversions, the hexachord of the major sixth is one of the most popular intonations, always operating in an emotionally sensitive manner, from the early Romanticists to the present time. The melodists of
the nineteenth century felt this exceptionally well, building on the basis of the hexachord with the semitone added from above or below melodies of the most varied styles. I will name at least three examples: Schubert's "Trout," the drinking song from La Traviata, and "Uvy, somnen'ya nyet" ["Alas, there is no doubt"], from Eugene Onegin. The hexachord with the semitone taken from above the major sixth represents one of the frequent manifestations of Mixolydian mode.

The so-called medieval modes, i.e., in essence, the intra-modal metamorphoses of the "tetrachords of three structures" (depending on the location of the semitone within each of them), never disappeared from European music. But, in connection with the deepening of interest in folk element, manifesting itself in the works of the Romantics these modes came into contact with the diatonicism of folk music and came fruitfully into life, anew, overcoming with their clarity, their strictness, and even their intonational severity, the excessive, exalted sentimentality of the chromaticized dominant. Such an overcoming of "Tristanian" sensuality is especially significant in Russian music with its particular folk-song quality of mode. The aspiration to overcome the "bloated dominant" is also characteristic of the works of Grieg with his favorite device, the turning of the leading
tone after the tonic down to its fifth (a property possibly tracing its source from the Norwegian folk song, and, in European music, from the beginning phrase of the well-known Wedding March of Mendelssohn, although it is expressed there still in the classical setting of a digression). The overcoming of the dominant in the works of Debussy deserves careful observation, as does the "life of modes" which are integral, hybrid, and exotic, in French music, in general.

I have reflected much, long, and persistently on an expressive and meaningful way to clarify the "life of a mode." Here, with maximum condensation, I merely generalize my observations, hastening to direct the thought of scholars in this direction. I will try as economically as possible to state several unconditional underlying principles as a conclusion to my observations. These principles will easily help anyone who is interested in excavating those "fields of auditory investigation" which I designate as the realistic base of music.

The formation of a mode is always expressed in the consecutive interchange or the simultaneous combining of its intervals—from the leap of the voice to the filling-in of the given series, and conversely, from the filling-in to the leap. In itself the mode is a step-wise (fourth, third, whole tone, semitone, etc., depending on the system of
intoning) interchange of the degrees which are appropriate for it. Man, intoning, i.e., uttering sound intelligently, either spoken or musical, guided by his intellect, finds himself within the limits of his own "vocal tonus," "the holding of the voice at some level." This formation of speech is directed by the breathing, dynamized and expressively shaded by the apparatuses of the resonators, and regulated both by rhythm of long and short durations and accentual-tonic rhythm. The continuously tense process of sound utterance—tonation—is reflected in a variety of modes, as "musical likenesses" of this process, summarizing it continuousness, each in its own way, whereas the primitive glissando, or various modally neutral scales and sound series which imitate it, merely reproduce the basis of sound utterance—tonation, or the sustaining of the voice in various pitch ranges—in an elemental, rather than a figuratively meaningful manner.

Therefore, the basic law of any melodic speech, the filling-in of a leap with an uninterrupted series of tones, is the natural striving of the auditory apparatus of man to return from separateness (syllable, word, tone, interval) to continuousness of vocal sound utterance. But in this very separateness, in the intonationally interpreted interchange of different levels of sound, there exist both more
and less stable supporting tones to which some sounds adjoin, adhering to them as a core and gravitating toward them. It is possible that these adjoining sounds arise from the "leaping out" of an intonation beyond the accepted, normal limit, as the result of an emotionally heightened tonus. With the frequent repetition of any one of these "forward thrusts," it becomes habitual and can turn into an independent interval, and then no longer gravitates toward its supporting tone, but draws a neighboring "semitone" to itself. The system of hexachords,* well-known in the history of European music, as I see it, is not at all the abstractly scholastic philosophizing of theoretical pedagogues. Most likely, it was one of the prolonged stages on the intonational path toward the achievement of the European octave as a wholeness, as a unity, and represents the overcoming of the tetrachord, the age-old intonational basis. Thus the life of a mode must inevitably be observed in the formation and transformation of its bases, in their adjoining and the drawing to themselves neighboring sounds, and in the formation of new bases or characteristic "instabilities," as, for example, in the history of European musical intonation, in the evolution of the semitone, in the transformation of the semitone into the leading tone, or in the evolution of the tritone.
The tensely-explosive elements of the European mode, the leading tone and tritone, are a peculiar intonational contradiction; they are the maximum instabilities, evoking for the hearing the most tension and a sort of "disintegration," and, at the same time, they retain their own independent nature, their own "peculiar quality, just as in the case of consonances. The well-known major seventh (G♭ - f) in the concluding duet of Verdi's Aida could not sound so charmingly if the hearing had not passed through a prolonged evolution of the semitone quality; for the possibility of such a wide leap, with the passage from the major seventh upward to the octave, the sound f is intoned with clear-cut vocal independence at the top of the seventh and at the same time "advances" as a leading tone to the octave. Only from the subsequent development of the melodic phrase, which fills in this leap, does the ear "ascertain" that f is still supported as the seventh degree by the sound e♭ (the sixth degree), i.e., it is supported by the sixth of the scale, and later by the fifth, d♭. On the whole, this is one of the most amazing of melodies in its plastic expressiveness. The life of the mode is revealed still more profoundly in the melodies of Glinka, for example in the entire course of the aria of Gorislava [in Ruslan...]. "Lyubvi roskoshnaya zvezda [Splendid Star of Love]"), in the brilliant "Marsh
Chernmora [March of Chernomor]," unified in its own way, or in the ballade of the Finn, where, in spite of the immutability of the melodic premise, the life of the mode unfolds in harmonies and timbres like some sort of resonators (I discuss this in my study, Tvorcheskiĭ metod Glinki postigaemyĭ cherez intonatsionnyĭ analiz "Ruslana i Lyudmily" [The Creative Method of Glinka, Comprehended through the Intonational Analysis of "Ruslan and Lyudmila"]).

If we turn, for example, to cultures of the more primitive scales, then the notorious five-tone scale, in its various stages, may, in the same way, be observed, not as a closed sphere, but as an expressive tone series, full of life. In it, neither the distribution of elements (for example, the location of the minor third), nor the methods of filling-in the melodic leaps, nor the supplying of the pentatonics with a semitone, i.e., the smoothing over of the third by means of a sound which gravitates to it from above (which is not at all a leading tone, and does not at once form the independent interval of the fourth,* but only adjoins the third), are intonationally indifferent.

Similarly to rhymes in poetry--paired, alternating, overlapping or bordering--the elements of scales may follow, one after another, in Paris (the simplest case is exemplified by the two analogous, though qualitatively and
intonationally different, tetrachords of the European major scale), may be included, one in the other, similarly to the coupled tetrachords of ancient music or the contemporary Mixolydian mode, or to the conversely symmetrical tetrachords of contemporary hexachordal melodies, they may be bordered by an octave, having its center, the tonic, within, as for example the F major prelude of Chopin with its two Mixolydian melodic lines (c, d, e, f, g, a, b\(^\flat\), c, and f, g, a, b\(^\flat\), c, d, e\(^\flat\), f) bordered by tonic f (the harmonic bass and principal peak of melody). The parallel co-existence of modes is possible, as for example, major-minor, with the alternation of the major and minor third in the first three degrees. Curious semitonal raisings and lowerings of the degrees of the mode, qualitatively and stylistically varied, are also possible, in some cases, as survivals of some "vagans" ("wandering") semitones of medieval liturgical modes, having gotten into the militant major and having become fixed in it in the stage of its formation, in other cases, as "sensitive coloring," "chroma," possibly inlaid from the melos of the eastern (especially the Arab) lute culture in an epoch both of struggle and of contact in commercial relations, and, in still other cases, as the expanded influence of the leading tone quality in the diatonicism of the major mode.

I have already indicated that European harmony, from
a modal intonational point of view, i.e., as a meaningfully expressive reality, and not as an acoustical phenomenon, is a unique system of resonators for the tones of the mode. Man in his struggle for existence, and in the difficult reconstruction of reality, through the prolonged stages of experiencing it, "out of necessity" takes to himself, first of all, whatever is closest to his experience. It is quite possible that, in creating sounding instruments, he was governed by the experience of his own, personal intoning, reproducing in these instruments both the process of breathing and the phenomenon of "resonance." A primitive instrument, with the bass continuously droning under a primitive melody, represented, in this "organ point," a reflection of the continuously tense vocal formation which conditioned the process of intoning, i.e., sound expression on the basis of a given style of tone and pitch. Through long series of transformations this "droning bass" became a complex system of resonators for melos, i.e., it became European harmony. It is not accidental that its powerful development became possible only after a great event in the evolution of European musical intonation, after the realization of the style of bel canto singing, singing with the support of expressive breathing, with a naturally organic culture of resonators, when the process of singing ceased to be "an instrument in man,"
seemingly isolated from the human organism, from the whole nature of man (the Eastern manner of singing), and was transformed into singing based on breathing, into singing as the expression of feeling and thought, inseparable from the personality. This discovery, having had an influence on all forms of instrumentalism and, especially, having improved the system of resonators of stringed instruments (as a result of which the violin began to sing like the soul), to a great extent furthered, unconditionally and through the practice of the Generalbass, i.e., chordal and improvisational keyboard accompaniment, the cultivation of homophonic melos, which became more and more standardized. Homophony is nothing other than melody with its fundamental and its acoustically amplified reflection, melody with a supporting bass and exposed over-tones. This process, having been combined with the already developed formation of polyphony, created the Classical and Romantic harmony of the "golden age" of European symphonism.

My hypothesis about the evolution of European harmony as a system of resonators and intensifiers of the tones of the mode, i.e., the process, easily traced historically, of the exposure of overtones, by stages and purposefully, corresponds to the processes of "resonance" in the area of vocal art, in the sense of a more and more "humanized" quality of singing, and the corresponding development in
the building of instruments, where we continually observe
the search for more and more sensitive intensifiers. Here
and there are found tendencies toward a psycho-realistic
expressiveness of sound, closely linked, first of all, with
the progress of the various forms of the concerto, and,
further, with the evolution of symphonism. At the first
glance, it would seem that there are no interrelations
between the refined construction of violins, accompanied
by the discoveries of sympathetic sounding boards and
"resonator boxes," and the development of homophony (melody
as the surface resting upon the "depths" of chordalization,
or "melody in an atmosphere of overtones, indifferent to
timbre"), but these two phenomena are both conditioned by
the same aspiration toward the creation of music as a
manifestation of intellectualized humanity. From this
fact, there logically resulted speculative research works,
in the epoch of rationalism, on the substantiation of the
logic of musical language, especially in the sphere of
harmony, and, simultaneously, an acutely intonational
appraisal of musical phenomena by the listeners, i.e.,
always "testing in the hearing." Not only musical Paris
of the eighteenth century was characterized by this trait,
but also London (let us say, in the epoch of Haydn's
travels) and, to a lesser extent, Vienna, which, however,
underestimated Mozart, the great genius of music as living
intonational speech.

In the life of modes, as reflections of the intona-
tional tonus of a given epoch, the expressive role of
intervals is extremely multi-faceted. In essence, the
interrelationship of intervals and their expressive
qualities makes up a sensitive barometer of the social
significance of a mode, its publicly cognitive value. A
congealed mode, no longer developing, becomes a sort of
caste phenomenon; in primitive cultures, its intervals,
from which characteristic patterns are constructed become
either magical formulae, unattainable to the uninitiated,
or distinctive intonational laws. In Greece there arose
an entire ethical superstructure, above the modal disci-
plines, leading to the intonationally valuable and
significant study of the ethos of modes, and, consequently,
of intervals. The intonationally expressive
qualitativeness of Chinese music is very curious.

The congealing of modal "intervallics" is character-
istic of ecclesiastical intonational systems, as a result
of which the development of their melodic wealth in the
conditions of secular culture has been impeded and slowed
down. This phenomenon occurred in our country, for example,
with the "znamennyi rospev," and not only with it, but with
all the branches of "melos of the Raskol'niki." On the
other hand, as we have seen, this did not occur with the Protestant chorale, for its role in history was more than progressive.

An interval, in losing its expressiveness, especially if it has comprised the nucleus of the most popular intonations, is an indicator of the degeneration of a given intonation, or its vulgarization ("gross popularity"). It is curious to observe, in the face of this, that in ideationally signigicant compositions, where the expressive quality of a given interval is ethically different from its later executions in a sensually vulgarized intonational sphere, the ear unerringly determines the difference in its intonational value. This may be well observed in the intonationally expressive evolution of the above-mentioned sixths in the works of the nineteenth century Romantics and Psycho-realists. In our country, in old Russia, it is interesting to note the qualitatively different nuances in the intonation of the favorite intervals in the old gypsy music and in the gypsy movement at the end of the century. It is no less interesting to observe how Tchaikovsky succeeds in raising the ethically expressive level of several intervallic intonations, which had already seemingly been obliterated by the common figures\textsuperscript{190} of the everyday romanza, and, on the other hand, how several decidedly vulgar figures of popular musical intonation
reduce the artistic value of some features ever of his symphonic music. All such phenomena mark the expressive role of the interval as the intonational barometer of an epoch and of its style. To observe them is no less interesting than to observe the evolution of the content of words and turns of speech in linguistic intonation and corresponding changes in phonetics and morphology.

I now pass on to concise summarizations in the area of the construction of musical forms, in the light of intonational evolution. As a general line of development, there is observed here a tendency toward continuousness of sound, the reflection of the continuously tense tonus of human speech, as the basis of its emotionally meaningful expressiveness. But this tendency persistently "conflicts" with another very striking one, resulting from the conditionality of musical rhythm, not only by the processes of expressively organized breathing, but also by the "mute" intonations of gesture, step, and dance movement.

The [metric] foot, with its basic iambic or trochaic interchange of durations in its simplest formulation, plays the most important role in such acoustical architectonics, and, with the separation of musical intonation from the poetic, it promoted, in no small degree, the rise of the dictatorship of the measure, with its strong, percussive first beat. It is therefore understandable that all the
structurally visible and formally metric architectonics of musical forms are conditioned to a very broad extent by "mute stimuli," bringing the percussive, clear-cut marking of the measured step or mechanically standardized alternation of dance steps into the intonationally continuous formation of the "music of breathing." I do not vulgarize, nor reduce the whole construction of musical forms to the influence of steps; on the contrary, I merely indicate the organic quality of the "mutual conflict" of the rhythmics of "mute intonation" with the rhythmics of expressive breathing. But even the structural differences between the cyclical form of the suite and the cyclical form of the symphony, and, in the suite itself, between, for example, the allemande and the menuet, are so obvious, both to the ear and to the eye, that the given quality of conflict is revealed graphically, as both constructively rhythmic and intonationally expressive, in the struggle between the rhythmic formuale of mechanized motion, with their measuredness, and melodically rhythmic formation.

The intonational quality of the forms of cantus firmus and all the monothematic formations conditioned by it, right up to the interrelation of subject and answer in the fugue, is completely understandable; these are focal points, which direct the perceiving consciousness throughout the course of polyphonic formation, and, at the same time, are
meaningful theses, clearly grasped and fixed by the memory, which condition the extent of development.

Variation formations are extremely characteristic in the intonational evolution of musical forms, with their transformations of the theme, each time in a different, intonationally expressive capacity, the possibilities of which even extend to the exposure of an emotionally meaningful formation of a theme in an historically stylistic succession or in an intonationally multifaceted "painting" and dynamization of the emotional content of the theme. In this sense, the wealth of variation forms is inexhaustible, but, of course, it cannot surpass the expressive possibilities of the continuous, logical formation of sonata or symphonic forms.*191

Tonalities, from the intonational point of view, appear as the transference of a given tonus of sound expression or a given sojourn within the norms of a defined pitch range, into a new series of pitches, higher or lower, more or less tense. Modulation is the technique, the method for this transference. But modulation from one tone series into another is a more intonationally complex process, since with this there occurs not only a switching of a given tonus into a different tone series, as regards pitch, but also a different placement of intervals.*192

The intonationally expressive significance of tonalities is
closely linked with their expressiveness in terms of timbre and "coloration" as manifestations of intonation. This is especially true in the Impressionistic music so characteristic for the French musical culture, with its long traditional cult of purity and lucidity of musical intonation. The Impressionists subscribed to the slogan that everything which is written in notes must be irreproachably audible, for music lives for the ear, not for the eye, and is comprehended by the intellect through the hearing. There must be nothing in musical writing which will be superfluous, which will not be heard, be it in an intonationally refined pianoforte fabric or a complex orchestral score. In this sense Chopin, Berlioz, Bizet, and Debussy are "in harmony" in their intonational tendencies, in spite of their deep stylistic differences.

Different degrees of audibility are determined by the difference in the number of intoning voices: one, two, three, four, five, etc. With the establishment of the homophonic-harmonic style, four voices began to be recognized as the most normal arrangement, stipulating completeness (intonational saturation) of musical motion and its lucidity; this preference for four voices is explained by the comprehensive number of the most necessary overtones revealed by the harmony as resonators of the melody. The overcoming of the static quality of overtones, and their
conversion into voices which accompany the basic melody, and, at the same time, into almost independent melodic voices, constitute one of the basic, intonationally stylistic qualities of four-voiced homophony. This capacity to achieve the "independence" of the inner voices without suppressing the basic melody with anything "superfluous," and without permitting intonational "accidents" (for example, doublings or parallelisms which transform the four-voice texture into three and two-voiced) constitutes the unique artistic expressiveness of the four-voiced texture, and on this basis were worked out the rules or norms of the voice-leading of this style, similar, on the whole, in all textbooks of harmony, but almost always treated abstractly in them, without consideration of the intonational nature of these "principles."

As a matter of fact, homophony, with its four-voiced fabric, with its clear-cut constructive system of periods (from dance-song or couplet melodies), and with its clear symmetry and tonic-dominant conjugation as a basic stimulus of "progress," defined the intonational formulae which separate and close the formation of periods--the so-called cadences. This does not mean that cadences did not exist before the formation of the four-voiced, homophonic style, but in it they gained constructive, intonational standardization, stability, and clarification or crystallization of
formual. They contain, in the most concise and laconic formation, the essential elements of the mode and the tonality, often accompanied by a melodically summarized intonation of the basic melody or theme (for example, the end of Glinka's "Kamarinskaya," or of the first movement of Beethoven's Ninth Symphony). Intonational sensitivity, in the relation of melodic and harmonic content and the construction of cadences, constitutes a characteristic sign of stylistic intellectual activity, intelligent mastery, and the disclosure of the "personal handwriting" of the composer (for observation in the connection and in this area, Mozart and Glinka are especially interesting).
EPILOGUE

1. The ancient, close connection of music and poetry permits me to divide the arts into the intonational arts of expression and pronunciation (of course, it is rhythmic expression, for there is no tone, no tonus, nothing "tonal," which is not governed by rhythm), which is to say, those which are chiefly comprehended by the hearing, and the "mute" arts of rhythm and images which are visually manifested. Pantomime and the dance, as the "language" of the body, of the glance, of the hands, in this connection join with the "immobile" applied arts, such as sculpture (the "congealed language" of the body and its movement), painting, and architecture.

2. Tone, the tension or effort required for the expression of an affect, of a prolonged emotional state (it does not matter whether in musical tone or word), evolved in close connection with the evolution of the human, "public" ear.

3. The manifestation of tone, "tonation," if it is not simply the expression of a separate affect (a shout, an interjection), is always a formation, i.e., is given as continuity, as fluidity, as vocal tonus, the
limits of which are naturally defined by the method of breathing and the characteristics of breath. This continuity is governed by rhythm and timbre. The latter quality permits us freely to distinguish the voice of one's mother, of a beloved woman, of one's own child, etc.; furthermore, an emotional image, such as anger, endearment, greeting, terror, etc., may be expressed in timbre, independent of the pronounced word or phrase, but very meaningful and significant with respect to the tonus of sound. I am speaking of this apart from an Affektenlehre, but rather as concerns the natural tonus and endless nuances of the human "language of feelings" as a method of communication.

4. Behind both our speech of word links (language) and our "utterance" of musical tones, there sounds a coexistent continuity of tonal and "tonational," vocal melodiousness (such as may be heard in peasant speech, oratorical speech, the speech of mother and child, etc.), in relation to which the separate words and separate musical sounds may be regarded as "intonational complexes," "clots," elevations on a plain, curves and bulges, the "shading of a drawing," etc. In these knots the meaning is concentrated; they are the area of the intellect, of the consciousness. But the living tonus of audible language, the life of tones and words (on which the quickness with
which the content of speech is grasped depends) is fused into the fluidity and continuity of an emotionally vocal, "tonational" effort and tension, closely united with breathing. This tension, by its fluidity, reflects the continuity of thinking, for thinking as an activity of the intellect is only partially expressed in the flashing in the consciousness of the "intermittence of words," but, in essence, it is "melodic," tuneful," fluid, and conditioned by a kind of "mental breathing" and rhythm, appearing as "mental intoning."

5. This phenomenon or "condition of tonal tension," which conditions both "verbal speech" and "musical speech," I call intonation. Very prolonged stages in the formation of the human ear and the culture of human hearing passed under the influence of the close connection of "tonal" speech with "poetic" speech. I think that syllabic rhythm was the strongest solder here. The isolation (but not the actual separation) of the "tonal art" of the word (poetry) from the "tonal art" of musically organized sound was determined by the rise in the public consciousness of a new expressive phenomenon, of which verbal speech had no need; this phenomenon is the interval, the precise determinant of the emotionally meaningful quality of intonation, and not merely a measuring gauge, "its own expressiveness nearly exhausted,"
by which intonation is now interpreted. The most obvious intonations conditioned by the raising and lowering of the sound tonus—the fourth and the fifth—were probably the first to be isolated as intervals in the tonal continuum and then were very gradually filled in (the formation of scales). In any case, it was still a long way to the unquestionably musica1 quality of this "tonal continuum," which became melody in the epoch of the Renaissance. I am asserting that melodies did not yet exist even in the primary stages of European polyphony. On the contrary, these stages (including the ars antiqua and the ars nova) were merely leading toward melody, were, at the same time, steering the processes of the evolution of dance intonation through the song-dances of the village and the "urban guild," and were also developing all the stages of hymnology (in worship) and theatrical, melodic declamation ("recitative").

6. Having been singled out as a conjugation of sounds, the interval still did not immediately lead to the disconnection of the "rhythmic tonal continuity," the basis of music and poetry. This process of disconnection was fully defined in Europe, it would seem, in the conditions of formation of new languages, in the "disassociation" of poetry and music from Latin, in the origin of rhyme, and, in music, in the formation of [rhythmic]
"modi," "cadences," etc. The Mediterranean musical culture, even up to the completion of the first more or less clearly observed "crisis of intonations," i.e., to the creation of the system of the "Gregorian Chant," was a syncretic art of "rhythmic intonation," in which word and tone were inseparably merged. I will permit myself to think that the development of the seemingly complex musical theoretical systems of Greece does not contradict this merger as a method for examining the intonational art of tone, rhythm, and word, in the process of becoming divisible—an examination from two points of view: the metrically poetic and the intonationally phonetic. It is possible that the tragic theatre was the focus of "intonational crises," and it is also possible that "tonic rhythm" as the "rhythm of accents," as one of the stimuli of the isolation of the musical art from the rhythmical-intonational art of word and sound, played an "explosive" role in this theatre. In any case, in the European intonational art, even after the "separation of music from poetry," opera, and then the romanza (and all such formations as the Lied), are to our day indicators of vital capacity in the rhythmic-intonational art of "sound and word," and all the crises and reforms of the opera are easily interpreted in this light.

7. The presence of the phenomenon of intonation
ties together everything which occurs in music (creative and stylistic factors, the evolution of expressive elements, and the process of formation) in a unified process, concretely linked with the development of the public consciousness, and projects a fully concrete medium through which our intellect directs all "musical material," making of it an expression of ideational content in an emotionally meaningful shell. Conversely, if one approaches music from the point of view of its perception by the masses, the phenomenon of intonation explains the causes of both vital capacity and lack of vital capacity in musical compositions. It also explains that significance which has always been characteristic of musical performance as intoning, the exposure of music to the public consciousness. Unintoned, unperformed music, or music performed badly or not in accordance with its meaning, does not exist as a public fact, but remains in the consciousness of the composer while he is alive, or in notation till someone happens upon it.

8. The phenomenon of intonation combines musical creation, performance, and listening and hearing in a unity and also as a cultural formation, as the cognitive perception of reality, linked with the evolution of the hearing, with auditory attention, and with the auditory memory, like the corresponding evolution of the human eye (not parallel, and not simultaneous, but
corresponding). The problem lies in the fact that the listener, through the perception of an individual composition, listens to the music which is necessary to him at a given stage, and not to the history of musical literature. He listens to music as thought and as feeling (this is a question of disposition and taste), but also as something which nourishes his consciousness. Except in the case of professionals and rare amateurs, musical compositions do not enter as a whole into the consciousness of the listeners, i.e., the mass, public consciousness; rather, a complicated, very unstable complex of musical ideas is deposited, which includes diverse "fragments" of music, but which, in essence, comprises an "oral, musical, intonational vocabulary."\(^1\)

\(^1\) In this vocabulary, "melodic formations" and tunes naturally predominate as the most organic exposure in music of the intonational quality (the "tonus of speech") corresponding to every human 'utterance' of sound (in tone or in word). Therefore, melody has been, and remains, the principal manifestation of music and its most clearly expressive element. That is why there persistently arises, from the mass audience, a uniform demand from composers for melody! And this does not only occur in epochs of intonational crises, when renovation of the musical and intonational vocabulary commonly occurs along the line of new, melodic formations. Melody is the soul of music because it is a sensitive reflection of the principal quality of human, "vocal speech," of utterance in tone, in vocal continuity. Therefore, melody is, in principle, continuous.
I emphasize *intonational*, because this is not an abstract vocabulary of musical terms. Rather, it is a "reserve" of musical intonations, intoned by every man (aloud, or to himself, in various degrees and by various methods, according to his capabilities), which are expressive for him, and which "speak to him"; it is a reserve of living, concrete sound formations, even including characteristic intervals, which always "lie in the hearing." When one hears a new musical composition, comparison proceeds along these well-known "paths," for the generalized thoughts and feelings of one's class, stratum, etc., down to the smallest social groupings, are to be found within them. The more subjective and sharp in its intonational treatment the "language" of the composer, the more difficult and the shorter is the life of his music. The more strongly a circle of expressive musical intonations, summarized by a given epoch, is felt, even in the most intellectually complicated musical compositions, the more unconditional is the vital capacity of this music.

Proceeding from this fact, it becomes clearly apparent, for example, why many symphonies do not survive, but why Beethoven's Third, Fourth, Fifth, Sixth, and Ninth Symphonies continue to live
resiliently and persistently. Having traced a number of epoches, the shifts of styles and genre, the life of compositions, and the evolution of composers, from the point of view of an intonational musical vocabulary, I am convinced that there are, in the history of music, certain processes, to the present time little, or rather, barely and gropingly observed, in which the solution to many obscure, "interrupted" tracks, roads, paths, and turning points in the history of music may be found. From the point of view of general cultural evolution it is understandable that, in music, changes had to be accomplished under the influence of historical processes, but why they were accomplished just so and in just such a form has remained unclear.

9. To relieve this lack of clarity I have advanced the hypothesis of the "crises of musical intonations." In linguistics, the processes of

2The more stable the mode of life, the more solid are the intonational habits and the more complicatedly are forms worked out which, in their complexity, are attainable to an entire given circle of listeners. This is excellently observed in folk music; its "vocalness" (i.e., the vocally transmitted tradition of mastery) is possible on the strength of the fact that each listener, at any moment, is both
intonational changes of vocabulary in connection with social movements have long been observed, in music—hardly at all. It is not a matter of analogy, but of similar causes, which evoke, not only a renovation of the intonational vocabulary, but also more profound reconstructions of sound-thought, to the point of the decisive rejection of the "peaks of refined expressiveness," just achieved, in favor of a sound "language" which is simple, clear, and realistic.

At this point, the preceding forms of expression are declared to be forced, formal, etc., and continue to sound interestingly for only a few strata of listeners, while gradually dying away.

composer and performer, for the mastery of invention of the podgoloski or the popevki here is not a solitary matter. The evaluation of mastery is also characteristic of each and all. From that fact arises the amazing complexity of composition "by ear," oral composition, as for example, that of the Russian podgolosochnaya polyphony of the peasant choirs or the excellently organized melodic songs of the drawling songs (in comparison with which, all urban, homophonic melody is primitive). These are typically intonational formations, and they demonstrate that the "vocal quality" of the musical intonational vocabulary dilutes neither the thought nor the content of music. Any impoverishment may be attributed to the deterioration of the intellectual culture and the decomposition of the mode of living.
10. In my research I have examined in detail the history of European music in the light of "intonational crises"--the most important ones, of course--and I have taken note of evidences of purposefulness in them. It is characteristic that phenomena which are intonationally and organically prepared by the epoch preceding the crisis, and which are linked with the foremost ideas in the growth of the public consciousness, are not swept aside by the crisis of intonations, but are given meaning, become rooted, and pass on into a higher artistic quality. Such was the case with the conception and development of the sonata forms before the French, bourgeois revolution, and with the stormy, powerful flight of Beethoven's symphonism in which the simplest possible, generalized nuculeus of a renovated rhythmic-intonational vocabulary made up the most vital intonational stimuli.

I will not enumerate the "crises" here, but I affirm that, for my hearing and consciousness, there is no fact or factor, nor, in general, are there any operating forces, in the history of European music, which could not be explained through their intonational substantiation in connection with the growth and the crises
of the public consciousness, without any vulgarization whatever. The intonational vocabulary of any epoch, on the other hand, in the "hands" of a sharp dealer composer, a "manufacturer in bad taste," is inevitably turned into a consumers' jumble.

Passing through the mind, the intellectual culture, and the ideational purposefulness of the thinking composer, the most popular intonations of the epoch become a living source of music of a high intellectual level. This proves that the progress of the intonational arts does not consist only of the invention of subjective and unusual tonal materials. This explains why Bach, Mozart, Beethoven, Glinka, and Tchaikovsky, as it turns out in a closer examination of the make up of their "intonational vocabularies," worked with a comparatively "modest circle of basic, expressive intonations from the environment," not hesitating to use "intonational small change." But their thought, their ideational content, having become their artistic handwriting, created out of what was commonly heard a summarization rich with new possibilities. On the other hand, those "hothouse plants" of music, noteworthy for the refinement of their thought and culture of hearing, and all kinds of compositions which, according to their high designs, have been created as diaries, confessions, or declarations--as original statements "in private with oneself"--either die away or evoke the admiration of only a
few connoisseurs. This is not because they are unconditionally "decadent", but because their "personal expression" is, nevertheless, not audible.

The purposefulness of content of the musical-intonational vocabulary is linked in the closest way with the public consciousness of the epoch, and, as such, operates ruthlessly in the intonational arts; anything personal, however expressively tragic it may sound, though it may be a collection of verses by the most refined poet, or the refined sounds or even the most strongly expressive severities of an individualistic musician who holds the public in contempt, lacks vitality and is perceived as formal if there are in it no "kernels of intonational thought" which have something in common with revolutions still hardly dreamed of and with the "dawn of progress" in the public consciousness. The operation of this process of selection is, I repeat, ruthless. It overtakes the genius, the intellectualistic prospector of new paths, and the modest singer of lyrical sentiments equally. The charming florescence of the art of the madrigal, it would seem, broke off sharply at its peak, and the rapid rise of opera began here with all its seeming conventions. But opera was driven by homophonic melody and by the stile rappresentativo, which answered to the needs of the epoch with its expressiveness, although the "vocabulary" of this style was coarser than the refined madrigal.
What of Beethoven's brilliant last quartets? What vitality they have, in comparison with his symphonies! Bizet, for his whole life, "moved within the middle class," until, in Carmen, he fell instinctively into the sphere of the most vital intonations. His art, intellect, and culture raised these intonations into the area of high drama, and they helped his art to become vital just in Carmen. I will not mention other examples. I would merely remind the reader of the rapid "surrender" or ideational capitulation of the most complex forms of polyphony to the modest, naive flowers of the homophonic, sonata form and the rudiments of the symphony.

Let us consider Mozart. However much his C Major Symphony (the "Jupiter") has been eulogized, it is surpassed in the reinterpretation of polyphony within the harmonic-homophonic fabric, inlaid with subsidiary voice expressiveness, and in its vital capacity, by the G Minor Symphony.* In France, the disputes surrounding the "buffonists," the Rousseau-Rameau dispute, and the disputes between the Piccinists and the Gluckists are interpreted comprehensively in the struggle for a new intonational musical vocabulary, a new approach to hearing, for it was so dictated by the ideational content of the pre-strom epoch.

And for us in Russia, in the nineteenth century, there was the exceptionally sensitive phenomenon of
Dargomyzhskii with his [slogan], "I want truth," a phenomenon still not assimilated by Russian musical thinking to the end of the century. This phenomenon arose just at the height of the emergence of the "Raznochintsy culture," which intonationally reinterpreted the heritage of the "culture of the nobility." In the light of such a "crisis of intonations," the "crooked style" of Dargomyzhskii, with all its deviations, turnings, and strangenesses, even the "motley character" of its musical vocabulary, is fully clarified.

In connection with the complex overgrowth of "ideational artistic platforms" within the court intelligentsia after the crushing of the "Decembrists," and again under the impact of the "Raznochintsy intelligentsia," which immediately found a broad, sympathetic stratum of readers for themselves in the country as a whole, peculiar intonational stratifications could already be noted in the youthful, Russian, musical Classicism. Even in the early 1840's, the intellectually esthetic system of Glinka's Ruslan, in spite of the wide accessibility of its intonations, evoked perplexity, not only among the "Mendelssohnists" and the "Italian music lovers" among the aristocrats, but also among some representatives of the progressive Raznochintsy intelligentsia, on whom the sharp pathos of Meyerbeer and the sensual passionateness of the intonations of Donizetti had a directly emotional influence.
Glinka's intellectualism in the fifties became even more subtle and acute, while the growth of the more variegated, but, in an emotional, social, and intonational sense, the more sensitive talent of Dargomyzhskii became all the more intensive and responsive to social ideology. Dargomyzhskii stands on unquestionably valid soil, and it is not without reason that his creation "finds itself" solidly within the most intonationally sensitive areas of musical forms—in the intonational reinterpretation of intervals, in connection with the realistically dramatic expressiveness of recitatives, the "truthfulness" of melody, and the unity of word and tone.

In the Russian, popular romanza, even before the emergence of Dargomyzhskii, those same tendencies were already present, and now, in the fifties, they were becoming stronger. The fifths in Russian musical culture are characterized by the acute development of a "crisis of intonations." For that reason, Glinka's loss of listeners in these years was conditioned to a considerable extent, not only by persecutions and contemptuous treatment by his "enemies in court," but also by the fact that the wonderfully long-range, and, at the same time, completed creations of the last period of his creativity were a "prognosis of the distant future of Russian music," and might have seemed to be an "aristocratization" of
artistically figurative thinking. At that time, other songs in other forms were more necessary. Glinka's waning popularity was much the same situation as Pushkin's had been in his time. Pushkin sharply felt the loss of readers and created Tales of Belkin, opening for himself a path, both to "unsophisticated hearts," and to ideationally sensitive new readers. Glinka created nothing analogous. He by-passed The Captain's Daughter and Gogol', and even grew cold toward the domestic opera, Dvumuzhnitsa The[Bigamist], closing himself into his own haughty, musical intellectualism. Dargomyzhskiĭ is another matter. He did not lose his head at the height of the "intonational crisis," and, working modestly and sensitively, divined the most correct paths. It is, therefore, understandable that the "early Five" grouped themselves around him.

In the further development of Russian musical culture it is also very interesting to trace, even in the fate of individual, operatic, musical phenomena, the effects of intonational selection answering to the changes of the public consciousness. Composers have struggled with one another; they and their music have been warred upon by critics, esthetic and anti-esthetic, formalists and naturalists, the "heralds of the Russian interior," which Sal'tykov-Shchedrin so maliciously ridiculed. But the listeners, the masses, everyone to whom music is dear as
the voice of reality and as ideationally cognitive activity, have created their own, authentic history of music, and have supported that which is essential in its development, i.e., that which is intonationally fresh and vital. Rubenstein's Demon, rejected by the professionals, has persistently opened for itself a "road into life," and has won mass public recognition and the "license for a long theatrical existence," independently of whoever conducts it. And this is just, for now it is clearly heard that this opera by Rubenstein was, in its intonational content, one of the truly sensitive compositions of the epoch. Somewhat later the same thing occurred with Tchaikovsky's Eugene Onegin, which was brought by the mass, musical, public consciousness to the peak of recognition and a just evaluation. On the other hand, the intonational falseness and insensitivity of many Russian symphonies (of both Rubenstein and Rimski-Korsakov, as well as others) condemned them to a brief existence, in spite of isolated figurative and formal, esthetic successes. The disappointing fate of the individual, intellectually refined, most penetrating and distinctive achievements of Dargomyzhskii, where he, in essence, evolved from Glinka, is understandable in the light of the real and vital artistic demands of the epoch, but, alas, it is not justified in terms of the high esthetic
level of the peaks of Russian artistic culture of the nineteenth century. A fair evaluation of Rusalka, notwithstanding the persecutions of theatre management, would seem to judge it as a sensitive exposure of the artistic requirements of a great number of listeners, while The Stone Guest, for example, remained only an historical document of the artistic and esthetic experimentation of the great master, alas, in an improvisationally incomplete form, not easily grasped!

11. Intonational evolution in the area of the instrumental musical culture has its own qualitative distinctions. In primitive musical cultures the percussive element prevails, i.e., a very well-developed area of accented, rhythmic sounds, conditioned neither by breathing nor by absolute precision of intervals. This is understandable, for percussiveness is linked with the "language" of human movement, with accents of the feet, with playing and dancing, with non-intonational arts. But the intonational quality is inherent even in percussiveness, first of all through timbre, and, in the second place, equally through the presence of tone, tonus, or accent, that is, of the tension, the "ponderability" of sound. In the area of wind instruments, their conditionality by human breathing, with all the consequences of this factor, is obvious.
"Tonicity," i.e., the tension of sound extraction and expression ("utterance"), leads to various degrees of "ponderability" of intervals. Breathing and rhythm control the continuity of sound and create the "melodious quality." Timbre determines the emotional tonus, the expression. In the area of bowed, stringed instruments, its intonational culture of the "breathing of the bow" permits the coexistence of both "emotional, vocal melodics," and an "intonational quality of almost unlimited breathing," leading to the rich art of the virtuoso.

The pizzicato culture of stringed instruments plays a large role in the accompaniment of vocal intonations, and, as an independent sphere, it is distinguished by a sensitive and expressive intervallic quality (tonal conjugation), conditioned by the "language of the hands." Through this important phenomenon, the pizzicato culture is linked with keyed and keyboard instruments, the accented, rhythmic, percussive sphere of which is constantly in competition with the aspiration toward melodic continuity; the "language of the hands" in pianism reveals both a distinctive "culture of breathing," and the melodics of timbres, with unquestionably expressive tension and conjugation of "spaces," i.e., of intervals, as measurements of the degree of "melodic continuity," "Formation in tone," in the tension of sound, i.e., the intonational quality is characteristic of all instruments, but is qualitatively
peculiar to each. The art of pianism is one of the highest intellectual cultures of the intonational realization of timbre, and demands, in spite of the "acoustical limitation" in the manner of execution of the instrument, the most subtle auditory attention. The history of pianoforte construction reveals, in it "changes of character" the struggle of intonational determinants. In the striving toward intonational fluidity on the harpsichord, a most refined technique of ornamentation was worked out. But this refinement was consigned to oblivion under the impact of the melodic, anti-chamber culture with its concertante style, which was, of course, coarser than the harpsichord style, but answered the new expressiveness. Naturally, the pianoforte and the grand piano prevailed over the harpsichord with their melodic possibilities.

12. In conclusion, several words about the organ. The most essential thing in the culture of the organ is its unquestionable melodic fluidity; therefore, of all the wind instruments, the organ is the most intonational. Nevertheless, being a keyboard instrument, it is still governed, not by tonally accented rhythm, but by syllabic rhythm -- the rhythm of length, of durations. Thus its link with the intonational art of tone, word, and syllable (the melody of Gregorian Chant), with Latin poetic intonation in general, and with oratorical intonation in particular, is understandable. The oratorical culture of
Rome was not only abstractly rhetorical, but was concerned, simultaneously, with an "emotional intonational tonus."

Having exerted influence, not only on Christian preaching, but on all kinds and forms of liturgical recitation and, later on, even of choral recitation, the rhetorical intonational culture inevitably had an influence on organ forms. All of these organ forms, in their prolonged evolution, right up to the ricercare and to the apotheosis of organ rhetoric, the fugue, reveal the intonational content and intonationally rhetorical methods of mastering auditory attention which are inherent in the culture of oratorical speech, with its refined mastery of the defense of a thesis and the approaches to it (unexpected for the listener, like unpremeditated "windfalls" among deviations).

13. I will have much to say about the intonational substantiation of the evolution of scales, in connection with the development of my auditory experience in the first part of my book, Mysli i dumy [Thoughts and Reflections]. 199 While deeply esteeming acoustical refinement in this area, I still emphasize that the changing nature of scales is a consequence of social selection, carried out "by the ear" of social man. For that reason, it is necessary to take into consideration the centuries-long efforts of human thought on behalf of the organic introduction into the mass consciousness of the seemingly
smallest "acoustical fact," for, without the auditory assimilation of it, without its introduction into an "intonational series," the insertion of such a fact in the consciousness will be only theoretical.

14. In the exposition of the present study I have barely touched upon the vital question of the interrelationship of form and style as phenomena of intonation, for this interrelation, and even the switching of form into style and style into form, finds valid explanations precisely in the light of intonational problems. Style, apart from intonation, is always defined in a somewhat limited way, now as a manner, now as a selection or complex of expressive media. Its ideological basis either remains apart from music, or is applied to it rationalistically. The realistic basis of stylistic tendencies, norms, and rules, which are molded into form through their repetition and consolidation in the consciousness of composers, originates in the phenomenon of intonation and the selection of expressive media operating through it. A large number of exceptions, deviations, or new formations in the construction of forms find their resolution in the influences and demands of style, which are conditioned by intonational agitations and changes. Especially in the forms of the cadence and their stylistic contradictions in different epochs, one may, with comprehensive thoroughness, observe the mutual pressure of form
and style. It is the same in the eighteenth century, in the struggle of various "manners," ornaments, and cadenzas, as, in general, in all formations of an improvisational cast, which are under the continuous "control" of living intonations.

In established forms, the influence of style naturally makes itself felt more readily in various kinds of "variable" factors and elements--those which are more subject to stimuli of an "improvisational intonational order"--than in the basic, logical arrangement of a given form. These [variable] factors include transitions, connecting passages, modulations, supplementary parts, etc.; the rondo and variation forms are stylistically more changeable than fugues, sonatas, and symphonies. The intonationally artistic unity of the symphony, for example, is substantiated by the unity of stylistic tendencies, by the unity in contradictions, rather than by unity of form, for, except for the symphonic sonata allegro with its exceptional logical completeness, the other "forms" which make up the symphony as a cycle are very unstable in spite of all their external formal clarity.

Beethoven's "Eroica" as a whole is unified, in intonationally stylistic terms, quite validly, but it is questionable whether this symphony is unified in form. It is perceived as unified, however, under the influence of style. The Ninth Symphony is stylistically
contradictory and therefore, on the whole, is perceived as 
a form rather out of admiration for genius, than out of 
artistic persuasiveness. The problem of the finals of 
the symphony, in essence, has thus remained unresolved 
in the treatment of form, in comparison with the way in 
which the problem of the symphonic allegro, i.e., the 
first movement of the symphony, was handled. But even 
in first movements, the form experiences fluctuations, 
depending on the intonationally stylistic trend in the 
dramatic treatment of the symphonic allegro--either 
figuratively descriptive or epically narrative. I speak 
about all this sketchily here, since questions of form 
and style as phenomena of intonation must become an inde­
dependent book in my studies of musical form.

On this note, I permit myself to complete an ex­
tremely condensed statement of my research on musical 
tonation. The development of, and addition to, many 
sections of this book have in part already entered, in 
part are entering, and in part will enter into a cycle of 
works built around the present one.*200
Notes from pages 600-613

*1 Asaf'ev distinguishes here between musical intonation as an expressive medium and an aspect of human communication, on one hand, and the interrelated process of intellectualization and conceptualization of acoustical phenomena, on the other.


*3 The eight glasy (which comprise the system of osmoglasie) roughly correspond, in the music of the Russian Orthodox Church, to the Gregorian modes; however, their organization is much less strictly systematized, and depends more on the presence of characteristic melodic features than do the modes in their present system.

*4 Cf., discussion of this concept in "Introduction," supra, p. 177.

*5 In other words, no aspect of musical form is to be regarded as absolute or universal; rather, all are conditioned by the particular epoch and environment. Thus constructive patterns are not conceived as the basic material of music which continually reoccur (like fugue subjects) in any historical epoch.


*7 From the context, it is apparent that Asaf'ev is using the term "intonation," in this sentence, in the sense of correct tuning.

*8 There is considerable ambiguity in Asaf'ev's use of both "tone" and "intonation" in this passage. At some points it is clear he is referring to accuracy of pitch or "correct tuning," at others to quality of sound, and at still others to the broader interpretation of expression in sound. This ambiguity, as a characteristic trait of Asaf'ev's literary style has been discussed (cf., "Introduction," pp. 99-104, supra) and seems to be more evident in Book II than in Book I.

*9 An alternate spelling for rospevy, which constituted the body of music of the Orthodox Church.
Notes from pages 615-27

*10 Polyphonic voices in Russia peasant choral singing of the style called podgolosochnaya polifoniya (Under-voice polyphony).

*11 Cf., mention of this in "Introduction," p. 154, supra.

*12 Reduced still further, the evolutionary process of a musical intonation is as follows: invention, selection, assimilation, systematization, standardization.

*13 Asaf'ev's terminology as regards accent differs from that prevalent in the West. Apel (in "Accents," op cit., p. 6, col. 2) designates accents resulting from longer durations, as agogic (cf., Asaf'ev's "quantitative rhythm") and those resulting from reinforcement as dynamic (vis à vis Asaf'ev's "tonic rhythm"). Apel applies the term Tonic to accents resulting from higher pitch, a manifestation of accent which Asaf'ev seemingly ignores.

*14 This is purely conjectural, and Asaf'ev's case is not convincingly made.

*15 Haydn's instrumentalism is examined in more detail, infra, pp. 731-33.

*16 This concept is repeatedly encountered, in a variety of contexts (e.g., harmonic and rhythmic interpretations, as well as melodic) in this work.

*17 This is less a case of modulation than of displacements and redistributions of tones within a given mode or tonality.

*18 Asaf'ev's point is not clearly made with the Ruslan example. The subsequent discussion of semitones is more enlightening in this context.


*20 Basic interval.

*21 Chronologically speaking, it is more appropriate to say that the general bass technique is contradicted by Glinka's system.

*22 The "whole evolution" from Rameau (1683-1764) to (Domenico) Scarlatti, (1685-1757) must be perceived as a
discrepancy of viewpoint and approach, and obviously not a temporal one.

*23 This is discussed further, infra, pp. 803-805.

*24 A Soviet editorial note in Izbrannye trudy, p. 284, n. 10, however, notes a different interpretation of these sequences by Asaf'ev, as exposed in his study, Evgenii Onegin--liricheskie tsteny P. I. Chaikovskogo . . . (cf., "Introduction," p. 79, n. 141, supra), in which Asaf'ev explains the sequences in that opera as "the organic result of an 'intonationally associative system of reminders' in the opera," in other words, functioning in the manner of leitmotifs. Asaf'ev cites their "constructive flexibility" and "psychological sensitivity," and characterizes them as "the most refined expressive media."

*25 "Selection" of these everyday intonations would appear to be, properly, the first step.

*26 Development in the sense of evolution, not simply as the working-out of musical material.

*27 A reference to the principal focal points of Russian nationalist music of the late nineteenth century. A discussion of these groups is found in Swan, op. cit., pp. 73-113, 121-28.

*28 The "yeast" being, in Asaf'ev's view, the dramatic quality. In the case of Borodin, however, the "epic quality" of both his operatic and symphonic work has its own kind of dramatic appeal.

*29 Asaf'ev returns several times to this forecast of the future use of electronic instruments, evoking an objection in a Soviet editorial note in the 1963 edition of his Musical Form as a Process (p. 367, n. 5).

*30 I.e., a synthesis of the earlier church modes. The concept of a synthesized mode, especially in this context, could be taken to include, also, the introduction of secondary dominants.

*31 Andreas Werckmeister (1645-1706), German organist and theorist who is credited with the introduction of equal temperament into musical practice (per ed. n. 13,
Notes from pages 639-653


*32 This thought underlies Yavorskii's approach (cf., "Introduction," p. 171, supra).

*33 Cf., n. *3, supra.

*34 In "March of Chernomor": An Attempt to Reveal Its Intonational Content," Izbrannye trudy, Vol. I, p. 224, Asaf'ev writes, "The essence of the process consisted in an intonational reinterpretation, achieved by the hearing 'without explanation' of intra-modal semitones, which do not belong to the mode but only "color it. The reinterpretation involved the formation of a qualitatively new predestination of these semitones; the semitone became, for the aural perception, no longer 'transient' or 'decorative,' but rather a sound which directed it into the tonic of a new tonality, for which this sound was the leading tone." (Cited in ed. n. 9, Izbrannye trudy, Vol. V, p. 284.)

*35 Asaf'ev's certainty that the "fear" of the tritone is evoked by sharpening of the leading tone quality seems to be totally without foundation. If it is true, how does one explain the common practice of a "double leading tone" (to both tonic and dominant) at cadences, from this period. The manifest instability of the tritone interval itself seems a more likely reason for its rejection.

*36 This definition is related to Asaf'ev's subsequent discussion of "plagalness." Cf., pp. 676-77 and nn. 13 & *57.

*37 "Deductive" in the sense of the development of ideas from a previously stated premise.

*38 Asaf'ev's point of departure--the rhythmic factor as a dynamic feature, especially in the fugue--is almost obscured in this passage.

*39 This is not, however, Asaf'ev's only thought on the coexistence of poetry and music in the song. (Cf., infra, pp. 704, 817-18 (& n.2).

*40 This is, perhaps, Asaf'ev's clearest explanation of this phenomenon.
Notes from pages 657-71

*41 Asaf'ev's treatment of the Italian madrigalists (Gesualdo, et al) is equivocal, especially with regard to their chromaticism. (Cf., pp.670-71 and 848, infra).

*42 This thought is further developed, infra, pp. 685-86 (cf., also, n. *64).

*43 Asaf'ev earlier expressed reservations about such "precise intervals" in "everyday signalling" (cf., supra, p. 603.

*44 Osip Ivanovich Senkovskii (1800-1858), historian, Orientalist, and writer (pseudonym, Baron Brambeus); a friend and confidant of Glinka.

*45 Vladimir Fedorovich Odoevskii (1804-1869), writer, critic, composer; close friend of Glinka's and an ardent advocate of his music.

*46 Acceptance of the sixth century designation for "firm organization" of the Gregorian modes is not unanimous. Apel, who accepts the codification of the chant by the sixth century ("Gregorian chant," op. cit., p. 304, col. 2), observes that the system of modes "very likely did not originate until the 8th century" (Ibid., p. 146, col. 2).

*47 Asaf'ev's assertion is virtually impossible either to prove or disprove. Apel cites the tenth century as the date of the earliest theoretical writing on chromaticism, which, in the subsequent two centuries, was called musica falsa, and only in 1325 was it stated (by Philippe de Vitry) that musica falsa is "not false but necessary." (Ibid., p. 465, col. 2.) Given this chronology, Asaf'ev's attribution of the leading tone quality is Roman times is at least open to question.


*49 The significance of the tritone has been traditionally harmonic, and its acceptance as a melodic factor has been much slower. Asaf'ev's apparent emphasis on the
Notes from pages 671-76

melodic aspect, therefore, seems misplaced.

Asaf'ev, in an apparent excess of nationalism, seemingly ignores the intensive chromaticism of the late sixteenth century madrigalists (e.g., Gesualdo, Marenzio, Vicentino, and Monteverdi). He also ignores a significant body of chromaticism in the work of J. S. Bach.

A key factor in Yavorskii's Theory of Modal Rhythm is the organization and classification of modes on the basis of combinations of tritones with their resolutions. Cf., "Introduction," p. 172, supra.

It should be emphasized that Asaf'ev's apparent rejection of "functional harmony," here and elsewhere, is actually a rejection of the reduction of all harmonic functions to those of tonic, dominant, and subdominant and the disregard of the element of melos in harmonic progression (i.e., voice-leading), as epitomized (in Asaf'ev's mind) by Riemann. This point is discussed by Mazel (op. cit., [cf., "Introduction," p. 100, n. 190, supra] pp. 81-82.

This, in essence, is the technique of the so-called podgolososchnaya polifoniya (under-voice polyphony), as performed by Russian peasant choirs. (Cf., n. *10, supra.)

A probable allusion to the linear technique of twelve-tone (as practiced by Schoenberg, et al).

"... I thought Karl Maria von Weber was most disappointing ... because of his immoderate use of the dominant seventh in its first position." Glinka, Memoirs, trans. Mudge [cf.. Book I, n. *111, supra], p. 176. But, in context, Glinka's objection seems to be directed, not at the dominant seventh, per se, but at its "immoderate use in first position," a fact which weakens Asaf'ev's position.

A radical, Utopian Socialist, political movement of the late nineteenth century. Unlike the Marxists, the Narodniki advocated Socialism built on an agricultural base. In 1881, Tsar Alexander II was assassinated by a group believed to be a splinter group of Narodniki. It is perhaps significant that the Soviet concept of Narodism stresses only the contact with the countryside,
ignoring the radical and terroristic aspect. Thus, the association of Glinka with Narodism is based upon his documented interest in creating Russian national music, which supposedly also reflects a similar interest in the Russian peasant (a romanticized view).

*Mazel, however, attributes the "plagal" quality of Russian song to the interaction of two of its most characteristic features: the more or less regular interchange of stability and instability, and the predominantly descending motion of the melodic line toward final stability (which is, most often, the lowest tone of the scale). The latter feature decidedly minimizes the ascending gravitation of the leading tone. Thus, the tones of the tonic triad—first, third, and fifth degrees of the mode—are perceived as stable, and the tones adjacent to them—second, fourth, and sixth degrees, which comprise a chord with an essentially subdominant function—are perceived as instabilities. Thus, the alternation of subdominant (rather than dominant) and tonic harmonies is a characteristic of Russian song (op. cit., p. 82, n. 1). Yavorskii's equation of the sixth scale degree in subdominant harmony with the leading tone in dominant, may well be based on a similar concept (cf., "Introduction," pp. 174-75, supra).

Asaf'ev places undue emphasis on the application of functionalism to the figured bass or continuo technique, a phenomenon which actually occurred quite late in the practical life of the latter.

Luigi Cherubini (1760-1842): French opera composer (Italian-born), director of Paris Conservatory from 1822, collaborated with Catel in writing opera;

Charles-Simon Catel (1733-1830): French composer and theorist, author of Traité d'harmonie (1802), professor at Paris Conservatory;

Bernhard Klein (1793-1823): German composer and theorist, studied in Paris with Cherubini, teacher of Dehn;

Siegfried Dehn (1799-1858): German theorist and teacher, taught Glinka with significant influence.

Asaf'ev explores the connections between these men
Notes from pages 678-691


*60 Cf., development of this point, p.747 ff, infra.

*61 Cf., further discussion of waltz infra, p.756 f.

*62 Isaiya Aleksandrovcich Braudo (b. 1896): organist, professor at Leningrad Conservatory, author of transcriptions for organ and theoretical works;


*63 That is, both major and minor.

*64 This provides clarification of earlier, passing reference (p.662, supra) to artistic progress of these municipal musicians. Asaf'ev's equation of the improvement of artistic quality with raising the "level of production" is an interesting evaluation, clearly reflecting his Marxist orientation.

*65 Asaf'ev draws a fine line here between instrumental polyphony and polyphonically-oriented harmony. The concept of voice-leading is evidently a leading factor in the latter category. Some additional light is shed on this problem in subsequent discussions of Haydn's instrumentalism (cf., especially, p.698, infra).

*66 An editorial note (#27, Izbrannye trudy, p. 285) asserts that "... Asaf'ev's evaluation of Hindemith's creation changed significantly," but no examples of this change are cited.

*67 The passage seems to suggest contact between European urban, guild musicians and (Russian) peasant choirs, a suggestion which cannot be taken at face value.

*68 The reference is to the unpublished book, O sebe [About Myself], part of a projected major cycle of autobiographical, analytical, historical and theoretical works, entitled Mysli i dumy [Thoughts and Reflections]. An outline of the projection is found, pp. 330-31.
Notes from pages 691-96

Izbrannye trudy, Vol. V. Most of his last major works are included in this outline.

*69 Asaf'ev's customary device of setting passages in quotation marks for emphasis would have seemed appropriate here.

*70 Cf., n. *10, supra. The zapevki (not previously defined here) were introductory intonations which functioned as "subjects" of the podkoloschnaya polyphony, being introduced and then embellished and developed in the subsequent polyphony.

*71 Asaf'ev's meaning, in discussions of "open-air" quality, remains unclear. A possible reference to open-air religious processions (such as depicted in Gentile Bellini's well-known painting, "Procession in the Piazza San Marco"), in which musicians participated, may be suggested; or perhaps he has in mind the huge, vaulted, interior spaces of Gothic cathedrals, which were conscious imitations of a forest-like atmosphere. In any case, it seems an exaggeration to characterize the majority of religious instrumental genre as possessing this open-air quality.

*72 Asaf'ev here is indulging in the all too prevalent, but thoroughly unjustified, practice of vilifying Eduard Hanslick (1825-1904), the German music critic who has achieved a measure of dubious immortality as the acknowledged prototype for Beckmesser, the epitome of arbitrary, authoritarian (and, by inference, unenlightened) criticism, in Wagner's Die Meistersinger. His unenviable reputation appears to be, more than anything, the invention of Wagner, in retribution for the fact, so it seems, that Hanslick approached Wagner's music with less than unreserved adulation. In fact, Hanslick's views are generally quite moderate and rational, and possessed of considerable validity. His observation that the same music might be used, set with different words, to portray diametrically opposite emotions has been proved in practice, and history has substantiated his opinion that Wagner's music per se (whatever its influence may have been) would not be the music of the future. Likewise, the statement for which he has been most ridiculed—that music is roughly comparable to the arabesque (in the art of ornamentation), as exhibiting forms of beauty without
Notes from pages 696-99.


*73 This and the section succeeding it emerge as an extremely ambiguous use of the word "play." In this initial passage Asaf'ev appears to take the concept of "Art as Play," that is as a means of self-expression (as opposed to Labor which is performed as a duty, imposed from without), as his point of departure. (The numerous scholars and philosophers who have expressed this view include Kant, Schiller, and Tolstoy.) In the given context, Asaf'ev appears to be referring to the increasing freedom of expression in composing which characterized the early Renaissance, as composers moved more and more into secular work, away from the imposition of the church.

However, as the discussion proceeds, Asaf'ev introduces other meanings of the word play, without distinction, into his narrative, making his overall meaning extremely unclear. This is perhaps the most graphic illustration of this unfortunate facet of his literary style (cf., "Introduction," pp. 102-103, supra).

*74 At this point the discussion seems quite clearly to be concerned with playing in the sense of instrumental performance.

*75 Cf., n. *56, supra. It is clear from the context that the possibility of considering Haydn a Narodnik (which Asaf'ev rejects, in any case) is concerned entirely with the degree of his involvement with the country-side and carries no political implication at all.

*76 Asaf'ev's parenthetical reminder refers to pp. 686, supra. These two passages help to clarify what Asaf'ev means by "polyphonically-oriented harmony" (cf., n. *65, supra).

*77 Here still another concept of "play"--that of dramatic performance--seems to be suggested.

*78 The term chronological is entirely anappropriate here, suggesting, as it does, a temporal succession; the "landmarks" which Asaf'ev gives us, however, all serve
to mark one (the same) point in time, all being the contemporaries of Scarlatti.

*79 The Russian here is igrovoe razdol'e: literally, "playing expanse" or "playing freedom." The concept expressed here does not seem too foreign to Hanslick's "arabesque-like play."

*80 This passage in the published version reads " . . . each thought is a play [igra]." An editorial note (Izbrannye trudy, Vol. V, p. 286, n. 29) informs us that the manuscript, at this point, reads " . . . each thought is a spark [iskra]." The manuscript version seemed more appropriate and less redundant to the present translator.

*81 I.e., no coordination in subservience to the bass.

*82 An editorial note identifies this as a reference to one of the pieces in Robert Schumann's Fantasiestücke, Op. 12 (1837). (Cited in Izbrannye trudy, Vol. V, p. 286, n. 30.)

*83 The message of this section is, in the final analysis, fairly simple to summarize, Polyphonic instrumental music is generally objective, stressing the joy of life and expressing an external view of man (cf., emphasis on objectivity of Scarlatti and Bach); during the Storm and Stress and Romantic periods, more subjectively oriented toward introspection and inner conflict, the leading ideas of the epoch were more appropriately expressed by the "dialectical" sonata allegro, which utilized homophonic texture. Unfortunately Asaf'ev's ideas are obscured by his ambiguous use of the word "play," in what appears to be a deliberate literary device.

*84 This statement seems to contradict Asaf'ev's concept of the song as a "field of battle," although the "contract for mutual aid" idea is perhaps still applicable.

*85 A Soviet editorial note (Izbrannye trudy, Vol. V, p. 286, n. *30) identifies this as the title of a French revolutionary song from the late eighteenth century. It is translated, "it will go on," or "it will go well."
Notes from pages 709-38


*87 The point is discussed in some detail, infra, pp. 747-60.

*88 First use of this term.

*89 Konstantin Nikolaeevich Batyushkov (1787-1855), a Russian poet of the early nineteenth century who led in the introduction of pre-Romanticism into Russia. He was particularly preoccupied with Classical Antiquity.

*90 Asaf'ev uses the Russian term, slovar', which may be translated either "dictionary" or "vocabulary." In this context, the former translation seems most appropriate. Cf., however, "oral vocabulary of intonations," "intonational vocabulary of the epoch," etc.

*91 "Oral vocabulary [ustnyi slovar'] of intonations" might more properly be designated "aural [zvukovoi] vocabulary," as defining musical fragments remaining in the hearing. The more familiar term "intonational vocabulary" is not introduced until the Epilogue (cf., infra, p. 935).


*93 We may recall, once again, the Marxist concept of realism as social necessity, in light of this discussion.

*94 This characterization, and the subsequent discussion tend to suggest an agrarian orientation to Haydn's music, after all, throwing into question the earlier assertion that "Haydn is no Narodnik" (cf., n. *75, supra).

*95 Asaf'ev's meaning in this note is obscure.

*96 Asaf'ev has more to say about his designation of the g minor Symphony as Mozart's symphonic "swan-song" in preference to the C major ("Jupiter") Symphony, K. 551 (his last symphony), in the "Epilogue" (cf., p. 942, infra).

Notes from pages 739-57

*98 In a parenthesis, inserted at this point in Asaf'ev's manuscript, is the following:

. . . (the realistic quality of musical development consists in the drawing of this development out of the intonational nature of a given sound interval, heard by an observant composer, or prompted by his surrounding reality; it is not the result of the imposition upon him of alien properties . . .)

Cited Ibid., n. 39.

*99 In manuscript, this thought was developed further:

. . . [where metrics], and the distribution of words distributed in accordance with metrics, [are often self-sufficing.] Questions, answers, exclamations, interjections expressing pain, fright, satisfaction, joy—all these represent an extremely limited area, in comparison with the intonations in music.

Cited Ibid., p. 287, n. 40.

*100 Cf., n. *72, above.

*101 Cf., earlier references to this aspect of Beethoven's music, pp. 679, 712-13.

*102 This term is used often by Asaf'ev. His definition of it here should be noted.

*103 Cf., Asaf'ev's earlier approach to this theme in Book I, p. 316-17, supra.

*104 Pieter Breughel, the elder (1525-69), a Netherlandish painter, and the two David Teniers, father (the elder, 1582-1649) and son (the younger, 1610-90), Flemish painters. All three excelled in peasant, genre scenes, although the younger Teniers, after his early works, established a solid reputation in more "respectable" subjects.

*105 Cf., Book I, n. *60. supra.

*106 Cf., earlier reference to waltz, supra, p. 682.

*107 Asaf'ev seems here to be laboring to make a point to support his theory of intonational crises.
Notes from pages 758-71

*108 An editorial note observes that this is a reference to Rousseau's *Strolls of a Solitary Dreamer*, published in 1765 (cf., *Izbrannye trudy*, Vol. V., p. 287, n. 43). In fact, the title of this work (Les Rêveries d'un promeneur solitaire) translates literally *The Dreams of a Solitary Stroller*.

*109* The reader is reminded of Asaf'ev's terminology for designating kinds of accents (cf., n. *13, supra*).

*110* This conjugation of intervals within the mode is what Yavorskii wished to convey in his Theory of Modal Rhythm (cf., "Introduction," pp. 171-72, supra).

*111* However, it would seem that a change in tonus (i.e., tension) would necessarily involve a change in timbre, in voice quality, though not in the sense that the voice would sound like something other than a voice.

*112* However, Mozart achieves just such a clear and detailed delineation of character in his opera on the same general subject, Don Giovanni, which can hardly be characterized as "in the chamber style."

*113* This characterization by Asaf'ev of the "nervous quality" of nineteenth century music is frequently cited.

*114* I.e., the structural unit, not the epoch.


*116* The march is named for the Preobrazhenskii Regiment (charged with guarding the person of the Tsar), not for the scholar named in n. 8, of the preceding chapter. The close juxtaposition of names is (presumed to be) coincidental.

*117* Dmitri Stepanovich Bortnyanskiĭ (1751-1825), eighteenth century composer in a variety of forms and genre, including liturgical music.


*119* The final section of Prokofiev's *Aleksandr Nevskiî*, op. 78, also strongly resembles a kant.
Notes from pages 773-98

*120 In other words, simple a a b a form (Mazel', op. cit., p. 79, comments on this passage).

*121 Asaf'ev seems to suggest here that Beethoven's music reflects the direct influence on the Russian kant, a questionable premise.


*123 This was evidently also a favorite story of Stasov's.

*124 This is a clear-cut "dialectical" and "historical materialistic" interpretation of the historical development of music.

*125 Cf., "Introduction," p. 36, n. 66.

*126 An editorial note (Izbrannye trudy, Vol. V, p. 287, n. 45) notes the continuation of this sentence in the manuscript, "... even if it is disproved by life." Asaf'ev's apparent reservations, vis-à-vis the viability of his theory of intonational crises is interesting, especially in light of the controversial response to it from his contemporaries.

*127 A pointed reference to Rimskii-Korsakov's editing of Musorgskii's work, especially Boris (but cf., n. *97, supra).

*128 Another wistful glance at the future of electronic music.

*129 Gustav Mahler (1860-1911), Austrian composer and conductor, the latter most notably with the Vienna Court Opera (1897-1907) and the New York Philharmonic Society.

*130 Felix Mottl (1856-1911) Austrian composer and conductor. Especially renowned for performances of Wagner's works at Bayreuth.

*131 Arthur Nikisch (1855-1922), Austro-Hungarian conductor, active in Leipzig and (for a short time) Boston.

*132 Eduard Napravnik (1839-1916), Czech-born composer and conductor at Mariinski Theatre, St. Petersburg.
Notes from pages 801-804

*133 Moi Vstrechi is the second section of Asaf'ev's proposed cycle, Mysli i Dumi (cf., n. *68, supra).


*135 Viktor Vladimirovich Khlebnikov (1885-1922), Russian poet, founder of Russian "Futurism."


*137 This was the notorious guerre des bouffons, a controversy revolving around the comparative merits of French and Italian opera, precipitated by a performance in Paris, in 1752 of Pergolesi's La Serva Padrona. Rousseau (somewhat inexplicably, since his own opera, Le Devin du village, had premiered the same year) took the side of Italian opera, which stood against Rameau as the leading proponent of French opera. The struggle continued for some time in a battle of pamphlets. Some aspects of the affair are touched on by Asaf'ev in his subsequent discussion and elsewhere.

*138 Friedrich-Melchior Grimm (1723-1807), German writer and critic. The reference is to his journal, Correspondance litteraire, philosophique et critique, founded in 1753, but circulated only in manuscript. It was finally published during the next century, after his death. For much of his life he lived in Paris and took the side of the Italians in the guerre des bouffons.

*139 André Ernest Modeste Gretry (1741-1813), French composer. After living some years in Rome and Geneva, as a young man, he returned to Paris, enjoying great success as an opera composer. The reference is to his Mémoirs ou essais sur la musique, published in 1789 in 3 volumes. A Russian language translation by P. Grachev was published in 1939. (Cf., Izbrannye trudy, Vol. V, p. 287, n. 54.)

*140 Rousseau's Confessions, as well as Les Rêveries du promeneur solitaire, were among the first of his works to be included in the first publication of his complete works in Geneva, 1782.
Notes from pages 806-16

*141 The references are as follows:

Jean-Benjamin de la Borde, Choix de Chansons mises en musique par M. de la Borde, Vols. I-IV (Paris: DeLormel, 1773), and


*142 Alain Rene LeSage (1668-1747), French writer. Among his works is a series of plays for the carnival theatre. (Cf., Izbrannye trudy, Vol. V, p. 287, n. 56.)

*143 Cf., Asaf'ev's detailed description of sonata allegro form in Book I, especially chapters VII, IX, and X.


*145 Cf., following:

Elements harmoniques d'Aristoxenus, trans. & ed. Charles Emile Ruelle (Paris: Pottier de Lalaine, 1871); and


*146 This passage is crucial to proper understanding of Asaf'ev's concept of "intonational crises."

*147 A Soviet editorial note, actually placed later in the text, observes, "Gnostic circles" united the followers of the doctrine of Gnosis--the special knowledge allegedly revealing the secrets of life and the path to salvation of the human soul--and spread in the countries of the Near East during the first to third centuries." (Cf., Izbrannye trudy, Vol. V, p. 287, n. 58.)

*148 "Masses" in the sense of large numbers of people, not of liturgical services.

*149 Cf., n. *46, supra. This seems to suggest some agreement with Apel's position.
Notes from pages 817-22

*150 Note by Asaf'ev omitted here as dealing too esoterically with his choice of terminology to be intelligibly translated. The note also observed, however, that this lyricism is of a rhythmic intonational nature (cf., n. *151, infra).

*151 Rhythmic intonation, a term used frequently by Asaf'ev, refers to a combination of word and tone in which the word is of primary importance and a very limited pitch range is used, in short, a kind of rhythmic recitation as in incantations, chants on psalm tones, etc.

*152 This note does much to reconcile the seeming contradiction of Asaf'ev's view of the song genre as a "field of conflict" on one hand and a unity on the other.

*153 Melopeia, from Greek, is defined as virtually synonymous with melos.

*154 The Soviet note on Gnosticism (cf., n. *147, supra) actually appeared here.


*156 An editorial note (Izbrannye trudy, Vol. V, p. 287, n. 59) provides the following passage originally in the manuscript at this point, which helps to illuminate Asaf'ev's concept of the significance of intervallics:

I would wish to be clearly understood. We are all so accustomed to our musical intervals and their interrelation and we are also so accustomed to regard the history of music as a succession of descriptions of compositions, schools, styles, and lives of musicians, that it is difficult for us to imagine that musical heraring is a creation of social mankind, demanding centuries of effort, like the creation of the human eye, of visuality, and that behind the facts of music, in direct interaction with them, exist the processes of hearing, auditory selection, and the fixing in the public consciousness of the elements of music and intonations as expressions of the realities of life which one has experienced. The finished theory of intervals . . . has nothing in common with the original sensing of the interval [as the means for] fixing in the consciousness--as the bearer of expression and adduction (the opposite of that which is substantiated by the thinking)
--a system of interactions of tones (intervals) for the construction of music. Thus, . . .

This is followed by the beginning of the subsequent paragraph in the published version, which occurs as a continuation of the same paragraph in the manuscript.

*157 I.e., from expressive employment in chant (almost exclusively intonational, as expression of thought in connection with text), toward their use in vertical, as well as horizontal contexts in fixed rhythm.

*158 Used here in the sense of embellishment. As described, however, this process resembles an extension of heterophony.

*159 The Russian word used here is a verbal form of opevanie.

*160 An editorial note supplies the following:

The author of the treatise, Speculum musicum (Mirror of Music), was Jacob of Liege (Jacobsus de Liege); the treatise appeared in the early 'twenties of the fourteenth century.

(Cf., Ibid., pp. 287-88, n. 59.)


*162 But Asaf'ev seems to shy away from associating chromaticism with this early stage. Presumably, this would interfere with portions of his presentation (noted).

*163 Editorial note supplies following here:

"Intonation is the most sensitive barometer of the human psychological makeup."

(Cf., Izbrannye trudy, Vol. V, p. 288, n. 63.)

*164 I.e., a guide, an anticipation, or a first step toward . . .

*165 Asaf'ev here has chosen a most equivocal way of
stating a premise to which he firmly subscribes. Cf., Book I, n. *201, supra.

*166 Cf., Debussy quotation, Book I, p. 505, supra.

*167 This hypothesis of Asaf'ev's is consistent with Lenin's "Theory of Reflection." Cf., "Introduction," P. 128f.


*169 A Reference to the conditions of World War II.

*170 Another, somewhat more subtle, reference to electronic music.

*171 Asaf'ev uses the term naigrysh here (cf., Book I, n. *95, supra).


*173 Editorial note (Izbrannye trudy, Vol. V, p. 288, n. 68) informs us of the following parenthetical insertion in the manuscript at this point:

"... (a thought or an idea becomes a sound image; it is intoned) ..."

*174 Editorial note (Ibid., n. 69) cites following insertion at this point in manuscript:

"... (the simultaneous sounding of tones, differentiated according to the meaningful quality of the intervals involved) ..."

*175 Cf., also, p.882 and n. *177, infra.
Notes from pages 882-915


*177 In some interpretations, "folk modal diatonicism" could be taken to suggest a lessening of the leading tone quality, i.e., a whole tone interval from the seventh to eighth degrees of the scale, as an expression of modes other than major.

*178 Use of "saw kerfs" here seems almost to suggest a derogatory implication (earlier classical introductions are no more than guides into the main body of the music).

*179 Such a device is, in fact, frequently designated as a "deceptive cadence" in the West.


*181 The essence of this ballade (which is better known in the USSR than in the West) is a melodic phrase in A major, lying within the pitch range a - f♯1, the base points of which, however, appear to be b and e♯, which gives the music a modal cast. Cf., additional citation of this example, infra, p. 916

*182 The use of this term in the translation represents an attempt on the translator's part to approximate Asaf'ev's neologism, "tonnost". In fact, it would seem to have some merit on several accounts: it is a partial cognate; it carries an active, rather than passive, connotation; and it bears an obvious semantic relationship to intonation, in relation to which, it would seem to be a more elemental manifestation of the same process.

*183 A reference to the hexachord of Guidonian theory, rather than to Asaf'ev's own concept of "hexachordness" relating to the employment of the interval of the sixth in nineteenth century music.

*184 Asaf'ev's analysis of this example is not convincing. The e♭, in fact, seems to have no supporting significance in the passage, but merely functions in an ornamental relationship with the d♭. The latter, on the
other hand, flows from the $f - \frac{b}{3}$ immediately, and solidly establishes its own supporting significance.

*185 Contained in Izbrannye trudy, Vol. I.

*186 The "third" in this passage must be understood as the third degree of the mode (forming the interval of a major third with the first degree), rather than the minor third which Asaf'ev has just mentioned above. The addition of a semitone to the latter would form only a major third, not a fourth.

*187 Asaf'ev's "coupled tetrachords" are exemplified by the following succession: $G - A - B - C - D - E - F$, with the $C$ serving as a pivot. The symmetrical, hexachordal tetrachords emerge: $C - D - E - F - G - A$, with the semitone in the center.

*188 The description seems to have little relation either to the device it supposedly exemplifies, or to the Prelude in question.

*189 "Old-believers," a group of Orthodox Christians who seceded from the church as a rebellion against reforms in church doctrine and practice during the seventeenth century. They have preserved whatever remains of the znamennyi rospev.


*191 In manuscript, sentence continues (after "symphonic forms), "... representing the highest intellectual reflection of 'tonation,' i.e., the development of the activity of the mind in tone, in the intonational process, in musical or verbal expression." (Cited in Izbrannye trudy, Vol. V, p. 288, n. 75.) The last section of the quotation (following "i.e., ...") is in apposition to "symphonic forms," rather than to "tonation."

*192 The concept of tonalities is presented here apparently solely in terms of the capacity for modulation and the transference of intervallic relations into different pitch ranges. But discussion passes on into "degrees
of audibility" before the first point is satisfactorily resolved.

*193 This is further confirmation that Asaf'ev conceives of "tonation" as a general term, embracing both conscious and unconscious expression in sound, of which "intonation" represents the conscious part.

*194 I.e., podgolosochnaya polyphony. Asaf'ev's concept of "collective evaluation" is an interesting feature of the "phenomenon.

*195 Cf., supra. This passage gives an idea as to why Asaf'ev regards the g minor Symphony (K. 550), rather than the "Jupiter" (K. 551), as Mozart's symphonic "swan-song."

*196 Glinka's opera, The Bigamist, based on a play by his friend Kukolnik, was never completed.

*197 Mikhail Evgrafovich Sal'tykov (1826-89, pseud., Shchedrin), late nineteenth century Russian satirist, supposedly Lenin's favorite author.

*198 The problem here was, again, the translation of an Asaf'ev neologism, tonovost'. In this case, the English word, "tonicity," denoting a quality or condition of tension (particularly with relation to the human body), seemed quite appropriate in terms of Asaf'ev's definition, "... the tension of sound extraction and expression."

*199 Cf., n. *68, supra.

*200 In the manuscript (cited in Izbrannuye trudy, Vol. V, p. 289, n. 81) this final paragraph is extended. After a brief mention of his more recent major works, and his projections for the future, he concludes, "... in addition, in these great days and months, I want to prove to the 'barbarians of the entire world' that, in our great country, thought has not perished, not for a moment, even in the midst of our painful ordeals."

The manuscript is signed and dated January 24, 1942.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

A. Articles

Asaf'ev, B. "Moĭ put'," Sovetskaya muzyka, II (August, 1934), 47-50.


_____. "Muzyka dla millionov," Sovetskoe iskusstvo (December 20, 1947).

_____. "Obzor khudozhestvennoĭ ćeyatelnosti Mariinskiĭ teatra (Sezon 1913/1914)," Muzyka, 1914, No. 173, 232-37, No. 174, 251-56.


_____. "Za novuyu muzykal'nuyu estetiku za sotsialisticheskiĭ realizm," Sovetskaya muzyka, No. 2 (1948), 12-22. (Text of Asaf'ev's report delivered at the First All-Union Composers' Congress, April, 1948, under the title "Tridtsat' let sovetskoĭ muzyki i zadachi sovetskih kompozitorov.").


Bücken, Ernst, "Kurth als musiktheoretiker," Melos, IV, Nos. 7-8, 358-70.


"O opere 'Velikaya druzha' V. Muradeli; Postanovlenie TsKVKP (b) ot 10 fevralja 1948 g.," Sovetskaya muzyka, No. 1 (1948), 3-8.


________. *Simfonicheskie ètyudy.* Petrograd: State Philharmonic, 1922.


Prieberg, Fred K. *Musik in der Sowjetunion.* Cologne: Verlag Wissenschaft und Politik, [1965].

985


