INFORMATION TO USERS

This dissertation was produced from a microfilm copy of the original document. While the most advanced technological means to photograph and reproduce this document have been used, the quality is heavily dependent upon the quality of the original submitted.

The following explanation of techniques is provided to help you understand markings or patterns which may appear on this reproduction.

1. The sign or "target" for pages apparently lacking from the document photographed is "Missing Page(s)". If it was possible to obtain the missing page(s) or section, they are spliced into the film along with adjacent pages. This may have necessitated cutting thru an image and duplicating adjacent pages to insure you complete continuity.

2. When an image on the film is obliterated with a large round black mark, it is an indication that the photographer suspected that the copy may have moved during exposure and thus cause a blurred image. You will find a good image of the page in the adjacent frame.

3. When a map, drawing or chart, etc., was part of the material being photographed the photographer followed a definite method in "sectioning" the material. It is customary to begin photoing at the upper left hand corner of a large sheet and to continue photoing from left to right in equal sections with a small overlap. If necessary, sectioning is continued again—beginning below the first row and continuing on until complete.

4. The majority of users indicate that the textual content is of greatest value, however, a somewhat higher quality reproduction could be made from "photographs" if essential to the understanding of the dissertation. Silver prints of "photographs" may be ordered at additional charge by writing the Order Department, giving the catalog number, title, author and specific pages you wish reproduced.

University Microfilms
300 North Zeeb Road
Ann Arbor, Michigan 48106
A Xerox Education Company
NESBITT, Charles Emerald, 1939-
PROPOSED BASIC CRITERIA NEEDED FOR DEVELOPING
RELEVANT ADULT BASIC EDUCATION PROGRAMS FOR
USE IN URBAN BLACK COMMUNITIES.

The Ohio State University, Ph.D., 1972
Education, adult

University Microfilms, A XEROX Company, Ann Arbor, Michigan

© 1972
CHARLES EMERALD NESBITT
ALL RIGHTS RESERVED
PROPOSED BASIC CRITERIA NEEDED FOR DEVELOPING
RELEVANT ADULT BASIC EDUCATION PROGRAMS
FOR USE IN URBAN BLACK COMMUNITIES

DISSERTATION

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for
the Degree Doctor of Philosophy in the Graduate
School of The Ohio State University

By

Charles Emerald Nesbitt
B.A., M.A.

The Ohio State University
1972

Approved by

John Ohliger
Adviser
Faculty of Special Services
College of Education
PLEASE NOTE:

Some pages may have indistinct print.
Filmed as received.

University Microfilms, A Xerox Education Company
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The author acknowledges his indebtedness to the numerous individuals who have made this study possible and to those who contributed to his personal growth and educational development.

A special note of appreciation and gratitude must be addressed to my total family, but moreover to my wife Veronica, and daughters Lena Cherise and Tiffany Lynn. Without their loving support and patience this study could never have been completed. My very special love goes to my wife for it is only through her endurance and motivation that I was able to reach this important juncture in my life.

The author wishes to thank John Ohliger for advising his total graduate education program including the dissertation. His expert prodding and probing guided me continuously.

In addition, Carl Candoli, William Dowling, Jim Gunnell, Roosevelt Johnson, Richard Kelsey, Robert McCormick, Bernard Mehl, Mary Irene Moffitt, and Charles Ross, my graduate and or personal Reading Committee deserves special thanks for their valuable assistance.
Appreciation is also extended to Paul Moss of the Opportunities Industrialization Center (OIC) in Cincinnati, Ohio; and Jim Vicars, Supervisor of Adult Basic Education (ABE), Columbus Public Schools, Columbus, Ohio for their cooperation.

The ABE experts throughout the country who provided the population for this study are thanked most sincerely for their vital contributions.

Final thanks go to Brenda Freeman, Sharon Harris, and Cheryl Smith who endured my writing to type the draft, and Jane Wyatt who performed the intricate and perplexing task of typing the final form.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>September 26, 1939</td>
<td>Born - Nashville, Tennessee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1959-1963</td>
<td>Student - Philander Smith College, Little Rock, Arkansas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1963</td>
<td>B.A., Philander Smith College, Little Rock, Arkansas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1964-1968</td>
<td>Teacher - Elementary School, Columbus Public Schools, Columbus, Ohio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1968</td>
<td>Teacher - Communications and Community Affairs, Columbus Urban League - Ohio State University, On-The-Job Training Program for Adults, Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1969</td>
<td>M.A., Adult Education, Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1969-1970</td>
<td>Graduate Research Associate, Center for Adult Education, Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1970</td>
<td>Administrative Assistant, Division of Continuing Education, Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PUBLICATIONS


"Communications Skills", "Community Affairs Skills", Columbus Urban League/Ohio State University, On-The-Job Training Project Report, Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio, pp. 25-40.


FIELDS OF STUDY

Major Field: Adult Education

Studies in Adult Education, Associate Professor John Ohliger and Professor W. D. Dowling

Studies in Educational Administration, Associate Professor I. Carl Candoli
LIST OF TABLES

Table | Description | Page
---|---|---
1 | Comparison of Modal Predictions With Consensus By Item Responses Among Questionnaires II and III. | 71
2 | Number of Percentage of Item Responses Toward Consensus Across Questionnaire III. | 72
3 | A Comparison of Modal Ranking by Expert Groups A, B, and C, Across Questionnaire II. | 62
4 | EVRs By PCs for Group A Across Questionnaire III. | 65
5 | EVRs By PCs for Group B Across Questionnaire III. | 66
6 | EVRs By PCs for Group C Across Questionnaire III. | 67
7 | CIRs By PCs Across Questionnaire III for Groups A, B, and C. | 68
8 | Geographic Locations of Experts Participating in the Study. | 77
TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VITA</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF TABLES</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statement of the Problem</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Definition of Terms I</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objectives of the Study</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limitations of the Study</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significance of the Study</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. DESIGN OF THE STUDY</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Population</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procedures</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questionnaire I Group A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questionnaire I Groups B &amp; C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questionnaire II Group A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questionnaire II Groups B &amp; C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questionnaire III Group A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questionnaire III Groups B &amp; C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questionnaire IV Group A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questionnaire IV Groups B &amp; C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Definitions of Terms II</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

vii
CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM AND NEED FOR THE STUDY

Adult Basic Education (ABE) programs which have been developed since the 1960's are numerous indeed, however, their pattern is similar. The U. S. Office of Education or Census Bureau supply statistical data which justify the need for developing adult basic education programs. Professional adult educators and control agencies design programs aimed at meeting the theoretical needs of "poor illiterate adults." The programs they design are based on the middle class American concepts of education, their world of work, and religious and political indoctrinations that do not fit the urban Black adult population. ¹

Traditionally, illiterate adults have been characterized by low income, unemployment, underemployment, chronic welfare clients, and as those most in need of the rudiments of education. ² However, because these descriptors do not include ethnic heritage, the Black illiterate suffer as much from such programs as they benefit from them. The program designers and the persons for whom
the programs are developed live in two different realities. The opinion that most ABE program developers to date have presented programs that treat only the symptoms of illiteracy for urban Black adults is well founded, because of the traditional free public education framework attached to them. A racist tinge is expected in ABE programming where free public education is used as the model around which the curriculum content is based. In such a setting the designers and teachers are predominately white or white controlled. White values of success are held up as reasons for needing basic education; i.e., job, money, material things, "so you can get off welfare."

Experiences in ABE from 1965 to the present have prompted the writer toward dissatisfaction about adult basic education and its relation to Black people typically defined as illiterates in need of ABE program services. Experiences as a teacher, administrator, and student of adult education have moved the writer to the following hypothesis. ABE programs should not be constructed generally to fit all people. The writer contends that program components from development through implementation and evaluation should be developed as separate portions and built around the needs and desires of the clientele they will serve. Programs of ABE constructed using a general scale for all persons who fit the
professionally accepted definitions of adult illiteracy will fail. The failures are built in because ABE programs historically have been built around the teaching of reading and writing as technical employable skills. Administrators and teachers have stayed away from the social and political implications apparent in learning to read and write. Freire argues that if indeed adult educators want successful literacy classes they must build in and observe learning as a process of "implying values, forming mentalities and leading to social and political consequences."^4

The professional adult educator must realize that urban Blacks who learn to read and write via socially and politically meaningful programs will look critically at the social situations in which they find themselves. These same persons will often take the initiative in acting to transform the society that has denied them the opportunity of participation. To design relevant programs of ABE for use in urban Black communities, the total "Black Experience" must be considered. Black Experience is defined as the total participation in social, mental, physical, and educational experiences of Black people in America. This consideration will raise fundamental questions about the historical process of education in this country. Such programs will require a radical re-evaluation of education and ideas about the history of man.
In essence, the Black Experience in America is a radical re-appraisal of the society from the standpoint of those on the bottom. No matter how or by whom the American societal structure is viewed, Black people as a group cluster toward the bottom with the nethermost portion being occupied by Black adults and their families, whose lack of educational credentials, defined in the terms of the dominant society, labels them illiterate.

Programs designed with meaning for Black illiterates will raise total questions about the meaning of education in a situation of institutionalized oppression. Such program designs must challenge adult educators to be either oppressors or liberators. The programs, if built out of the Black Experience, will go much further than the usual subjective, disposition, and attitude kind of questions that infer institutional oppression. Meaningful programs for Black adults will require objective awareness and confrontation about the meaning of American education. Properly designed ABE programs must reflect the particular lifestyle toward which they are pointed; thus programs written for the urban Black adult must deal with their realities of life. Black adults in general and the illiterate adults in particular have lived in joblessness, poverty, and despair. They have experienced violation, violence, and exploitation as their truth. Because of whom they are, because of the irrefutable evidence of their scars, they are
the creative negation of all the placid myths about American education and society in general. Meaningful ABE programs for the illiterate urban Black adult must challenge all American institutions and values to justify their existence in their respective communities.

The task of identifying criteria of the Black Experience to be used in developing relevant adult basic programs of education for use in urban areas was undertaken because of the writer's personal feelings narratively described. The following statements of facts and opinions based on national, state, and local levels provide further information for the need of this study.

1. The 1960 U. S. Census data putting adult illiteracy between 23-25 million people which represents about 13% of the total population. (1970 Census figures are not available as of this date.)

2. The fact that the Federal government spends over 45 million dollars on ABE programming each year.

3. The vast number of past and present programs in operation since the Economic Opportunity Act of 1964.

4. The relatively few adults attracted to ABE programs despite recruitment and retention efforts on a national scale.
5. The vast number of teacher and/or administrator training workshops and institutes conducted or being conducted in the interest of adult basic education.  
6. Local (Columbus, Ohio) programs attracting from 2-9 hundred persons per year since Federal funding began in 1964.
7. Local (Columbus, Ohio) 1960 census data revealing 43,000 persons 25 years of age or older, living within a 2 mile radius of downtown having less than an eighth grade education. This 2 mile area encompasses the heart of Columbus' Black Community.

Additional justification for the need of this study is provided by the fact that until quite recently the knowledge and practice used in the educational process with adults was largely borrowed from youth education. This was especially true of adult basic education where marginality in curriculum and financial resources caused professional adult educators to design and operate programs for adults patterned after public school models. The vast difference between adult learners and youth learners demands that special emphasis be placed upon the development of educational programs for adult learners. The institutional setting cultivates
a competence with respect to theoretical knowledge and research techniques necessary for program development. However, the question arises as to whether these professionally trained adult educators have been equipped with a workable knowledge adequate enough to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in highly urban areas. Further, since the overwhelming majority of persons living in highly urban areas are Black, do programs developed for use there meet their particular basic education needs?

The purpose of this investigation is to establish a set of criteria for developing adult basic educational programs for Black adults residing in urban areas. These criteria are designed by the researcher based upon the generated opinions and recommendations of the following groups of experts; (1) Black adult basic education participants, (2) Black professional and community people, and (3) professional adult educators. The research is an attempt to identify a set of criteria essential to the development of relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities. The application of the Delphi Technique is used in the research to specifically promote decisions of consensus relative to the stated objectives.
DEFINITION OF TERMS I

The following terms are defined by the researcher so that their use in the writing will not be misconstrued by the reader with dictionary or other definitions found elsewhere. The meanings are limited for use in the interpretation of the writing only.

1. Black: American citizen of African heritage; because the term is used throughout the writing designedly to indicate race, it will be capitalized.

2. Black Community: sections of larger urban communities where 60% or more of the residents are Black.

3. Black Experience: the total physical, mental, and social experience of Black people in America from birth to death.

4. Adult Basic Education (ABE): any organized program of educational instruction for adults whose former public school or other institutionalized experiences were at or below that institutions 6th grade standard of educational measurement.

5. Functionally Illiterate: the inability to speak or write to the degree defined and demanded by the larger society for effective economical and social stability.

6. Oppressor: person who commits or allows through his omission the cruel exercise of authority or power by one individual or group over another individual or group.
7. Liberator: person who actively works against oppressive authority and power exercised over individuals or groups by the ruling authoritarian group.

8. Employable: having the necessary skills and desire to work but no job upon which these attributes can be brought to fruition; an oppressive term used by authority figures of society.

9. Expert: a person whose physical or theoretical past whether ethnic, educational, economical, or professional has been associated with adult basic education activities designed for Black adults residing in urban areas.

10. Criteria: the generated judgmental opinions of defined experts in the field of ABE toward the development of relevant programs of basic education for use in urban Black communities.

OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

To use the Delphi Technique of expert forecasting to.....

1. Establish a set of criteria for developing basic adult education programs for Black adults residing in urban areas.

2. Promote consensus from the generated opinions of three (3) groups of experts relative to the establishment of criteria essential to the development of relevant ABE programs designed for urban Black communities.
LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

This study will be limited by:

1. The judgmental opinions of defined experts in the field of ABE pursuant to relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities.

2. The criteria or competencies of the expert groups are not to be field tested or operationalized.

3. The inferences made and conclusions drawn should not be generalized to populations not defined in this study.

4. The opinions of the experts will carry equal weight within and among the groups.

5. Time and the financial resources of the researcher will place limits on the study.

6. The Delphi Technique of extracting opinions and striving for consensus among diverse groups will limit the study.

7. The philosophical and historical nature of public education in America will finally limit this study.
SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY

As community leaders of urban Black neighborhoods are becoming more concerned about the public school offerings for youth, they are realizing the injustices done to them by these same institutions in the past. These realization takes the form of concern in one urban area after another through (the community's) activism. Simply stated, these communities are demanding a voice in the decision-making process. The academic term for these demands is decentralization. Most large urban areas, especially those with sizeable Black populations, have heard the hue and cry for community control of public education. This demand has come from the adult population of activists who visualize their children's future as a duplication of the present socio-economic and racially oppressive conditions unless immediate actions are taken to assure the contrary.

This research will seek to use Black community activists both professional and amateur on par with professional adult educators to reach consensus in needed program criteria for adult basic education. The writer agrees with Whittler's argument that, "The realignment of power is a painful process without a guarantee of improvement, yet changes must be made to better serve all citizens and particularly those who find the present system inadequate.
It seems, however, that plans to utilize the strengths of the professionals and lay citizens together hold more promise for bringing about improvement and maintaining it than plans to allow other groups to have exclusive decision-making power."?

This research should be viewed as an attempt to realign the adult basic education power base by utilizing the expertise of Black ABE participants themselves in the program development or decision-making process.
CHAPTER II
REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE
INTRODUCTION

This study is concerned with the use of a consensus building procedure, the Delphi Technique. Specifically, the study will attempt to use a variation of Delphi to establish basic criteria needed for the development of relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities.

In order to limit the scope of the research, only literature closely related to the subject will be reviewed. The references in this chapter will be listed under the following sources: (1) Recent Primary Sources, (2) Social and Philosophical Sources, (3) The Most Allied Study, and (4) The Delphi Technique of Decision Making.

RECENT PRIMARY SOURCES

Cortwright and Brice writing in the Handbook of Adult Education, 1970 edition state "About 23 million people 25 years of age or older were the educationally disadvantaged population of 1960. Undereducated adults make up about 13 per cent of the total population." The realization that the majority of these adults are
non-white unemployed, welfare recipients would seem to justify the significance of the problem. The need for relevant program development seems implicit in these Department of Health, Education, and Welfare figures. (See Appendix 19) During Fiscal Year 1967, although 24 different programs identified 18,220,000 eligible ABE participants only 380,838 were counted as enrolled. Considering these figures in the most liberal sense, disallowing dropoffs in attendance and dropout rates, these figures are shamefully low. The poor enrollment figures seemingly cannot be traced to a lack of trained instructors or administrators. Cortwright and Brice imply that teacher training institutes are inadequate to handle the required training and instruction of teachers and administrators.

Previous to the enactment of federal legislation, several universities conducted programs to train administrators and teachers of ABE: Syracuse University, Baylor University, Indiana University, San Francisco State College, Tuskegee Institute, Florida State University, Virginia State College at Norfolk, and the American University. Funds from Amendments to Title III of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act of 1966, made possible an extended, in-depth series of summer institutes for teachers and administrators of ABE. The first federally supported institutes were held in 1966: 9 were held that year, 20 the following year, and 25 in 1968.

The major objective of these first institutes was to provide an overview of concepts and procedures useful in conducting ABE programs. A typical institute lasted three weeks and involved from 50 to 100 participants. No figures were compiled on the actual
number of persons who received inservice training via such institutes, however, this first year estimate from Cortwright and Brice should help in that attempt. "It is estimated that participants in the nine 1966 institutes alone gave pre and in-service training to over 12,000 teachers." Such a first year estimate in 1966 would seem to justify the belief that the urgent need in ABE for 1972 is not more administrators and teachers; but rather more relevant program development to recruit and retain ABE participants.

Blum and Schmidt suggest that ABE instruction should be accompanied by job training to be successful.

To break the cycle of inferior education and unemployment which makes many Negroes members of a disadvantaged class; good education for children must be accompanied by education and job training for adults. Human relations commissions, school systems, Negro leaders and community action programs have usually failed to provide programs to upgrade the Negro labor force.

Although the writer does not fully agree with the above assumption that successful adult basic education be linked with job training, the publication titled Job Training Through Adult Education; A Second Chance for the Negro and The Community pointed up four specific criteria of success in the programs studied. First, the programs were based in the Black community. Second, they were the result of tremendous Black community pressure. Third, they related to the needs felt by the Black poor themselves. Fourth, the
trainees of the studied programs became employed, not employable,.
either during training or after its completion. The opinion that very
few ABE programs came into being as a direct result of community
pressure seems well founded considering the public nature of such
programming. Black ABE participant involvement in program
development and implementation seems limited to the student status.
With more community involvement in program development, adult
basic education sponsoring agencies should begin to realize improve-
ment in the number of adults actually enrolled when contrasted with
the census figures which indicate the number of eligible participants.

SOCIAL AND PHILOSOPHICAL SOURCES

Freire theorizes that illiterates, especially adult illiterates,
can learn to read and write. "Every human being no matter how
ignorant or submerged in the culture of science, is capable of looking
critically at his world in a dialogical encounter with others, and that
provided with the proper tools for such an encounter he can gradually
perceive his personal and social reality and deal critically with it." 13
This theory was developed during Freire's work with Latin American
peasants. He found that the most successfully motivating factor for
learning with these illiterate adults was an emotionally charged
political or cultural issue. "The more the rise of the masses is
emphasized in Latin America, the more the elite holding power,
committed to foreign interests, will polarize against them... Cultural freedom is not a gift but the conquered right of the popular classes to express themselves and act which enables them to pronounce the world and to live a continuous re-creation of it."^14

It would seem that Freire's philosophy of education rests more on the subject area rather than the method. "Observers in Latin America no longer think of learning to read as acquiring mere technical skill, but as a process implying values, forming mentalities and leading to social and political consequences."^15 This view of education surely poses some very serious questions for most ABE teachers and administrators who operate in general out of a youth education concept where teachers have all the knowledge and send it out for the students to receive. The burden of acceptance or rejection of these "knowledge messages" rests with the students. If the students accept the messages, they are labeled 'good', receive excellent grades, and stay in school. On the other hand, if students reject the messages, they are labeled 'bad', graded poorly, and eventually are forced to leave school.

Freire is quoted as saying: "Education is an act of love and for that very reason is an act of courage. It cannot fear debate and analysis of reality. It cannot flee from creative discussion for fear of being farcical... It is not possible, with an automatic education, to mold men who will play an active role in the exciting
process of developing democracy: such education is directly opposed to the emergence of a people into public life. 

Another social education philosopher who seems to agree with Freire's ideas of education is Ivan Illich. He has become one of the most controversial advocates of adult education. However, his advocacy does not fit the traditional mold of adult educators. He reveals his convictions about the value of adult education and traditional schooling in the following quotation. When Illich was asked to define his conception of grace, he replied, "Another form of grace, in our time, can be attained through night school... Traditional schools should be abolished because they favor the privileged middle class at the expense of marginal groups; only through the radically transformed system of adult education can the underprivileged rise from misery to the secular grace of enlightenment." Illich does not stop at mere philosophy about the faults of schools as we know them, he suggests a very definite alternative. In an article titled Education Without Schools, he answers the question as to how it can be done.

The alternative to dependence on schools is not the use of public resources for some new device which 'makes' people learn; rather it is the creation of a new style of educational relationship between man and his environment. ... I intend to show that the inverse of school is possible: That we can depend on self-motivated learning instead of employing teachers to bribe or compel the student to find time and the will
to learn; that we can provide the learner with new links to the world instead of continuing to funnel all educational programs through teachers... A good educational system should have three purposes: it should provide all who want to learn with access to available resources at any time in their lives; empower all who want to learn it from them; and finally, furnish all who want to present an issue to the public with the opportunity to make their challenge known. "18

These views sound strikingly similar to the contemporary phases of community control and community involvement in the literature. The fault in such phases for adult education in general and adult basic education in particular seems to be in the middle-class nature of its programming. Grondin revealed this fact in striking proportions as late as 1971.19 The writer agrees with Grondin's analysis and suggests that unless the expected populations of participants are used from beginning to end in program development ABE enrollment will continue to be proportionally low. Without a sustained effort at relevancy by program developers school for persons defined as potential adult basic education participants will continue to be a frightful place of failing memories to be avoided at all cost.

This research will be an honest attempt to use the talents of adult basic education participants themselves as experts who should have a vote in educational decisions that affect their lives. Freire, teaching Brazilian peasants to read and write in six weeks of evening
classes, seems to disprove the notion of the hard to reach
disadvantaged adult while at the same time supporting learning as
a life-long process. The teaching of reading and writing skills for
these illiterate adults was built around emotion-loaded key words
of their political vocabulary. Adult basic education programs
developed for use in urban Black communities seemingly must be
built on their generated concepts which could be just as emotional
or political. The relevancy of such concepts would be justifiable
based on their source of origin, the urban Black adult basic
participants themselves.

Today's energetic Black thinkers and authors are flooding
the literary journals with their expressions of discontent concerning
the relevance of past and existing school programs in urban areas.
In a search for a concise, yet all-inclusive statement describing
this discontent, the following example, a statement made by Rhody
McCoy, Unit Administrator of Ocean Hill-Brownsville Schools,
seems to capture the mood of urgency expressed by urban Black
communities about public education.

By no means are we saying that it is not
important to know how to read, write and manipulate
figures. But we are saying, it is also important that
you begin to understand yourself, that you are a person,
that you can also have a glorious future... Black
communities which have been degraded "X" number of
years will not come up with answers to urban education.
Miracles will not occur, but things will happen. Students
and parents are showing a greater interest in school.
The Ocean-Hill Brownsville school encounter probably did more to point up the value of constant community pressure than any other situation before or after it to date. The Black community in one large city after another has been speaking out for the right to interject its thoughts into public school curriculums offered to its children. The parents and grandparents who are speaking out realize the utter failures of the past and are living testimonials to such failures. They are simply saying with McCoy and others: "Everyone else has failed. We want the right to fail ourselves." 21

THE MOST ALLIED STUDY

The most recent study reviewed utilizing the Delphi Technique as an approach to solving urban education problems similar to this research was completed in 1971 by Emmons. 22 He attempted to identify a process that could assist persons in making more amenable decisions through the application of the Delphi Technique. The research setting was limited to one particular city with special emphasis placed upon a particular area. Emmons sought the answers for the following fundamental questions:

1. Can the Delphi Technique generate criteria for the selection of a secondary principal in a model neighborhood?
2. Can the Delphi Technique promote consensus from the participants in the process from the establishment of criteria to select a secondary school principal in a model neighborhood setting?

3. If consensus is found, what is the character of it and what are the dynamics of the participating groups as they move toward consensus?

The similarity between Emmon's specific questions and the stated objectives of this research are evident by comparison. The present inquiry seeks criteria relevant to the urban Black adult basic education community whereas the past investigation sought answers with implications for high school principals.

Though the Emmons study was of great value to the present work there were at least two major differences in procedure. First, even though Emmons questioned four (4) different groups of experts, his total population narrowed to fifteen (15). The present research sought the opinions of three groups of experts, nine (9) experts per group. Positive responses were received from all nine (9) experts from each group making a total population of twenty-seven (27). Second, Emmons was limited to the generated opinions of persons in one (1) particular urban area, with special emphasis upon a specifically defined sub-community. This research scope was broadened
to include the generated opinions of experts on a national scale including the opinions of ABE participants themselves (Group A); Black professionals and community people (Group B); and the scholarly perceptions of professors of adult education who have a particular expertise in ABE (Group C).

The limitations that correspondence over such a large geographic area might have, seemed inconsequential when compared to the probable immense results such an inquiry is capable of producing. Conclusions drawn utilizing such a range of expert opinion should have strong implications for national ABE program development in those urban areas with a high concentration of Black residents.

THE DELPHI TECHNIQUE OF DECISION-MAKING

The previous sections were concerned with various references from the literature germane to relevant program development for urban Black communities. This last section will focus on the particular processes of the Delphi technique used in this research. Delphi is a process which seeks to achieve the best group decisions through the elimination of personal confrontation as a contaminating variable while maximizing the bargaining process. Olaf Helmer appears to be the most salient promoter of Delphi as a decision-making technique. He discusses three important processes;
(1) the Delphi process of selecting experts, (2) the performance of experts, and (3) the utilizing of expert groups in the decision-making process in his Social Technology. Helmer states: "while model building is an extremely systematic way to promote the understanding and control of our environment, reliance on expert judgment, though often unsystematic, is more than expedient. It is an absolute necessity." Helmer concludes his argument by suggesting that if a particular decision cannot be based on theory, experts will be consulted. This use of expertise is specifically helpful in the fields of education and the social sciences, where definitive theory often is lacking. However, both areas have a rather vast reservoir of expertise of many kinds, both among substantive specialist and generalists that may be called upon for help in important decision-making situations.

The researcher has used the Delphi technique of decision-making for this study for two primary reasons. First, the procedure has been developed by a respectable assemblage of specialists who see a definite future for Delphi in educational forecasting. Second, the particular variation of Delphi developed by Pfeiffer (see Chapter III) seems to accommodate the particular decision-making process needed for a study of this nature. According to Helmer there is a growing recognition that it is necessary to
do something about our ability to predict the future, and that we should form methodological devices for a more effective approach to forecasting the future. The social sciences in Helmer's viewpoint are at the point of evolution. Traditional methods, he believes are proving inadequate to the task of delaying effectively with the growing complexity of forecasting. The degree of complexity increases the need for creating devices in both private and public sections of the field that facilitates the decision-making process. In "Analysis of the Future: The Delphi Method", Helmer posits that the proper theoretical foundation for planning for the future is through a device that relies on the intuitive expertise of various members of divergent groups. He continues saying the Delphi Technique..."derives its importance from the realization of projections to the future, and also based upon the personal expectations of individuals and groups, rather than predictions on well-established theory."  

In his exposition for the use of experts in the Delphi technique, Helmer gives three rules for inclusion of experts.

1. The researcher should select experts wisely; 2. he should create the proper conditions under which the experts can perform most ably; 3. the researcher should attempt to have several experts on a particular issue available. Adherence to the above rules according to Helmer can make a model like Delphi highly effective
in motivating participants to communicate with one another.

Individual group members are sure to learn more about the subject matter under consideration by studying it through the responses of persons with skills and backgrounds similar to, yet different from, their own.

A significantly large number of authors agree that the Delphi technique accomplishes the overall goals of a conference which is; combining opinions of the various members into concordant thinking on a single position. However, this single objective is most elusive due to personality conflicts. Carpenter lists the following limitations of conferences in his *Twenty Group Methods and Techniques in Adult Education*:

1. It is hard to predict attendance.

2. Advance arrangements must be made for conference facilities, eating facilities, and housing accommodations.

3. Evaluation of the results is often difficult.

The Delphi technique completely eliminates Carpenter's first two limitations. More importantly, it gives the researcher a better handle on the evaluation process by limiting the amount of coercion inevitable with the face to face arrangements necessary with conference facilities. According to Pfieffer, the conference
method of reaching consensus is apt to be a forced, contaminated, therefore artificial compromise among divergent groups. Both Helmer and Pfieffer agree that the Delphi technique in its simplest form eliminates a discussion group table, and replaces it with a carefully designed program of sequential, individual interrogations which flow from questionnaires interspersed with information on opinions of the feedback of other groups as well as individuals. Helmer specifically argues for the Delphi method as an appropriate technique for research of this nature. "The qualitative improvement of societal studies depends upon our acceptance of operations research technique. The Delphi Method is such a technique." The writer believes with Helmer that the Delphi process generates its value from the realization that all projections into the future are largely based on personal expectations of the individual rather than on predictions generated from well established theory. Writings from "The Future of Science", by Helmer conclude that the programmed use of informed opinion may lack the elegance and cohesiveness of the scientific theory, but effective use of devices for exploring the future are thereby aiding the planning and the decision-making process. While reviewing the literature certain strengths and weaknesses of the Delphi process according to various authors became
apparent. Listed below are examples of such comments that could be of value to a researcher applying this method.

Advantages of the Delphi as a research technique:

1. The Delphi-type conference eliminates the underlying emotional current which tends to make arriving at a single consensus on an issue forced and contaminated.

2. The use of informed opinion enables the group to explore the future and aids in the planning and decision-making process.

3. Because the expert group members never see each other in person, the possibility that consensus will be arrived at by a small vocal minority stampeding the majority is eliminated.

4. As compared to the conference forecasting method the Delphi Technique involves many individuals without the disasters of the conference structure according to Carpenter.

5. The Delphi structure has been found to produce substantially improved forecasting over the conference committee type structure.
6. The Delphi process does not subordinate the individual opinion to the group opinion.

7. It does not become contaminated with noise irrelevance, or redundancy of presentation.

8. It transmits no undue pressure nor does it give a premium to compromise.

The authors mentioned previously in this section of related literature are aware of certain weaknesses inherent in the Delphi process which need further refinement. Some admitted disadvantages gleaned from the literature are:

1. The influence of intuitive judgment can be neglected in the outcome.

2. The researcher has no proof of certainty about consensus in considering the various opinions of the expert population.

3. Initial stages of the process present a danger of similar, but not identical ideas being bunched together creating a false consensus or the experts may supply only a few firmly held independent opinions making convergence into single agreement difficult.
4. The inability to control certain variables places the reliability of the technique in question, it is not a controlled experiment in the usual sense.

5. The potential for an enormous amount of material makes possible a cumbersome procedure, and because of the time lapse it may be difficult for the participants to reproduce their original reasoning.

6. While today's social structure seems promising for the Delphi technique some authors question whether this would be true should the social order move in another direction, i.e. there might develop situations in which respondents would be less willing to be frank.

Both Helmer and Pfieffer believe that the shortcomings of the Delphi approach can be eliminated with additional experimentation. They caution that it is still difficult to measure the degree of convergence effected by the social pressure transferred through the feedback procedures of the Delphi technique.
SUMMARY

It is felt by the researcher that the previously mentioned references represent a contemporary review of the most illustrative writings common to the stated research problem. Using the stated objectives as a guide, material was chosen for review because of its: (1) contemporary nature, (2) relation to the problem statement, and (3) the Delphi technique of forecasting and educational decision-making. This research is considered to have many social and educational implications; summarily this literary review contains only the most salient material. The large clusters of material found to have a general relationship to the stated problem were rejected. This literature review was purposely limited and chosen specifically to cover only the scope of the research question.
CHAPTER III

DESIGN OF THE STUDY

INTRODUCTION

The essential function of this study is to develop a process of ascertaining from different groups of experts their consensus opinions relative to needed criteria for programs of adult basic education for urban Black communities. It is necessary to consider such a consensus within the context of both quantity and quality of past and present programs. The preceeding review of related literature clearly indicated that although an exceptionally large number of adult basic education programs exist or existed, they have not begun to significantly reach and or affect the masses of people defined as needing their services (Appendix 1). This is true even though maximum efforts have been undertaken to recruit and retain participants by various sponsoring agencies. Further, the preponderance of basic adult education programs are offered free of any monetary charges and in some cases stipends for attendance were offered.
It seems cogently clear that there are problems apparent in the character of urban adult basic education offerings that are not being solved by present methods.

Black citizens are expressing today, as never before, their distrust of the present educational system while calling for better education for their children and relevant adult educational opportunities for themselves. This call for significant and meaningful education is heard loudest in the urban Black communities where conditions are worst. Thus the problem: What basic criteria are needed for developing relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities? Although this study does not seek to completely answer the question, its results hopefully provide a basis for additional study toward the resolution of the question.

POPULATION

The experts were selected from the following groups based on a priori recognition of their various qualifications and the applicability of the Delphi procedure.

Group A: (Gr. A.) Black ABE participants residing in urban communities. Persons selected for this group included three (3) from a Columbus, Ohio public school group and six (6) from the Opportunities Industrialization Centers (O. I. C.) program in Cincinnati, Ohio. The O. I. C. participants numbered six primarily
because of a much larger attendance figure. However, a second factor considered during the selection process was the overall class response. The adults at the O, L, C. center expressed a significantly greater desire to participate than any of the other ABE classrooms visited. The fact that ABE programs seek to meet the needs of this group not only justify selections from this group as experts, but also the researcher assesses their educational situation as one demanding input.

Group B: (Gr. B.) Black professional people. Persons selected for this group have local, state or national reputations. Priority of participation was given to those individuals of the larger Black community who by their literary or personal definitions are striving for meaningful educational goals for urban Black people in this country. More specifically participating experts in this group included outstanding administrators of urban adult basic education programs; nationally known ABE program developers; state and local community leaders and organizers; recipients of the Ph. D. in Adult Education; prominent religious leaders; and outstanding educators.

Group C: (Gr. C.) Professional adult educators. Selectees were drawn from the Commission of the Professors of Adult Education list as of August, 1971. Those persons with
formal experiences in the development, or evaluation of adult
basic education programs were selected. The particular educational
preparation (Masters or Ph. D.) in Adult Education plus the policy
making positions held by this group of individuals indicate the
legitimacy of their expert categorization. The researcher further
assessed this group based on available personal or written
information.

Literature on the Delphi technique indicates the expert
numbering or selection process is one based on criteria developed
by the researcher. Helmer, Pfeiffer, Emmons, Weaver, and
others choose experts by assessing their qualifications against
standards of acceptance particularly set up for their various
situations. The determination of whom among the available persons
in each group was most expert in generating criteria for program
development was done through assessing the persons qualifications
against standards of acceptance. The standards for this study
included the following non-sequential items.
Group A:

1. Black resident of urban area
2. Participant in ongoing ABE program
3. Agreed verbally to questioning, and having their remarks recorded
4. Interest in the problem
5. Involvement in community affairs

Group B:

1. Formal education
2. Experience in education (ABE)
3. Knowledge of urban Black community
4. Involvement in Black community
5. Interest in the problem

Group C:

1. Formal education
2. Membership in the Commission of Professors group
3. Experience in ABE
4. Experience in urban Black community
5. Interest in the problem

Using Helmer's selection process and the researchers standard of acceptance, the expert participant groups and subsequent individual members were selected.
Table 8 affords the reader an opportunity to view the geographic distances involved in the research. A factor that proved to be quite demanding for the researcher. However, this condition proved to be very rewarding adding a dimension of national prominence to the concluding results of the research.

PROCEDURE

A variation of Delphi based on the work of Pfeiffer was employed for this research. The following four step procedure explains this technique in detail.

1. The first questionnaire calls for a list of opinions involving experienced judgment.

2. On the second round, each expert receives a copy of the list and is asked to rate or evaluate each item by his own criteria.

3. The third questionnaire includes the list and the ratings, indicates the consensus, if any, and asks the experts either to revise their opinions or else to specify their reasons for remaining outside the consensus.

4. The fourth questionnaire includes the list, ratings and consensus and minority opinions. It provides the final chance for revision of opinions.
The development of Questionnaire I (QI) followed the selection of the expert groups. Twenty-five persons were identified as a potential population for each group. Generation of the original list of criteria items, step 1, of the Pfeiffer variation, was accomplished in the following manner. The Black professionals (Gr. B.) and the professional adult educators (Gr. C.) were contacted by mail and asked to participate in the study (Appendices 1-2). They were asked to participate based on their availability over the extended period of time and procedural steps needed to complete the study. Nine of the originally selected participants in Gr. B. and Gr. C. responded favorably within the time period allotted for completion of QI. (Appendix 3) Based on this response the final population of all three expert groups was set at nine (9), making a total population of twenty-seven (27). It must be noted that all communication with Gr. A. was done on a personal oral basis, while the mail services were used exclusively with Gr. B. and Gr. C. The researcher reached this decision based on previous working experiences with ABE participants; comments from the contacted ABE administrators; and contemporary literature. The Black ABE participant group was asked verbally and selected to participate after permission initially was asked for and received from the school administrators involved (Appendices 8-10)
Questionnaire I Group A

After a favorable response was received from the school administrators involved (Appendices 10-11), meetings were set up and telephone communications were maintained with Gr. A. At a mutually agreed upon time the researcher traveled to the ABE classrooms used in the study and administered round one of the Delphi technique (Appendix 12). QI consisted of but one open ended sentence: In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities. .... The question was re-stated and defined and re-phrased to the participants satisfaction. The responses were written down and taped for accuracy in reproduction. Each expert was questioned individually after the confidentiality of his statement was assured before the total expert group. A 100 per cent response was received from all selected experts (Appendix 17). The participants were thanked and informed of the procedural date for administering QII. Verbal objection was made to the proposed two week waiting period allowed between rounds for Gr. B and C. A more realistic waiting period was arranged for Gr. A, based upon their schools class hours. It was explained by the researcher that the waiting period between rounds two and three would have to be synchronized due to the
consensus factor involved. The end result of QI for Gr. A. was forty-five very general and overlapping statements.

Questionnaire I Groups B. and C.

The process formally began with a cover letter being sent to the fifty (twenty-five per group) selected experts. (Appendices 1-2) Attached to the letter was an explanation of the Delphi variation being used in the research, a consent form, the proposed timetable for completion of the research, and the questionnaire (Appendices 3 thru 5). Each expert was asked to complete the questionnaire in his or her own words using no outside references. Within the allotted time period, as was previously stated, nine (9) experts had returned the completed questionnaire together with the signed consent form. A letter was sent acknowledging receipt of QI and the acceptance form. The letter asked the experts to be mindful of QII that would soon be on its way. The questionnaire itself consisted of the same open ended sentence that was administered to Gr. A.: In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities. . . . . The experts in Gr. B. and Gr. C. provided, as did Gr. A., the five asked for criteria making a total of one hundred and thirty-five (135) general statements.
Tabulation of the received general statements now became of prime importance. These general statements (135) were listed and coded for similarity in content and likeness in thought. A second list was developed with much coding and tabulation striking out or combining similar responses. The result of this process was a refinement of the original (135) general and overlapping statements into twelve (12) more specific criteria that became the Recommended Criteria for Questionnaire II. For a closer look at this process see Appendix 18.

Questionnaire II Group A

Questionnaire II was administered to Gr. A. following the procedures of QI. The researcher explained the instruction statement relative to priority ratings to the collective group. Reinforcement occurred during the individual interviews based on the participants reactions to the questionnaire items. All nine (9) experts responded positively giving a return of 100 percent. The researcher again explained to the Gr. A. participating experts the necessity to synchronize their priority ratings with those received from experts in Gr. B, and C. After a brief explanation of what to expect from QIII was given, the experts were thanked for their participation and encouraged to stay with the process to the end by cooperating with the researcher.
Questionnaire II Groups B. and C.

Questionnaire II followed the same procedural pattern of QI. It was sent to the eighteen (18) participating experts (9 per group) with an accompanying letter asking them to continue their participation and to complete QII and return it before the agreed upon date. Eighteen (18) questionnaires were returned (a 100 per cent response). These questionnaire forms were compiled with those received from Gr. A. for tabulation. Questionnaire III was formed from this combined tabulation of data.

Questionnaire III Group A.

At the previously agreed upon time the researcher traveled to the appropriate expert locations to administer QIII. The pattern and technique of instruction was basic to the previous procedures. The groups at both ABE locations were instructed in the correct completion of the questionnaire collectively. Specific attention was given to the modal response column. (See definition of terms) Working again on an individual basis the questionnaires were completed after the participants compared their previous responses very carefully to the modal responses of the total population. Some experts in this group seemed unduly skeptical about their individual responses that were different from the modal responses; whereas others seemed to expect the variances.
The Black adult basic education participants regarded the researcher as just another administrator through the first two rounds of questioning. By the third visit (QIII) much of the fear and suspicion the researcher had felt began to disappear. Because of the established rapport built with the experts they became convinced that the researcher was totally independent of the sponsoring organization; and would protect them from reprisal by preserving their anonymity.

Questionnaire III was completed at both ABE locations. These results were then tabulated with those from Gr. B. and C. to form the concluding round QIV.

Questionnaire III Groups B and C.

The process followed for Questionnaire III was exactly the same as Questionnaires I and II. To reiterate, a cover letter was sent to eighteen (18) respondents along with the questionnaire. The experts worked independently within the prescribed time period. However, two changes were noted on the return trip of completed questionnaires to the researcher. First, although all questionnaires were returned several experts were outside the agreed upon time schedule by as much as ten days. Second, numerous comments relative to the modal response column were made even though the cover letter and questionnaire itself explained its use in detail.
Finally, with the receipt of all questionnaire (Gr. A, B, and C) the results were tabulated. The result of this tabulation formed the basis for Questionnaire IV.

**Questionnaire IV Group A**

Questionnaire IV was processed in the same manner of Questionnaire III. The researcher explained the procedure to the ABE experts who now seemed more at ease about the Delphi technique being used. Although the form contained the original statements, their preferred ratings, the consensus or modal responses and minority opinions, the experts seemed at ease during this questioning. They were informed at the very outset that this visit represented the last time they would be questioned. The responses were recorded individually with considerable speed for the following very obvious reasons. First, the experts were familiar with the process. Second, they had come to know and expect the researcher's periodic visits. Third, it is suspected that the knowledge of this being the last visitation for specific question and answers speeded the process considerably. Finally, Gr. A. did not change its response for QIV as a result of the modal responses in QIII. Round IV was accelerated considerably due to the above factors.
The ABE experts were asked to make some final statements about the Delphi technique as a method of developing relevant ABE programming. They were further asked to comment about the use of ABE participant opinions in such programs. Some of these responses are listed in Appendix 20. The collective experts at both locations were informed again of the purposes for which their responses would be used. They were thanked for the use of their opinions and assured that the results of final tabulations would be interpreted for them. A final letter of thanks was sent to the cooperating administrators. (Appendix 21) The Delphi procedure was completed for Gr. A. participants by discussing the results of the fourth round questionnaire with participating experts at both ABE locations. The researcher went over the list of original criteria statements, their ratings and the effect they had on the modal responses and final consensus.

Questionnaire IV Groups B. and C.

Following the Pfeiffer variation Questionnaire IV represented the terminating round of the research. The return of this questionnaire was optional for the participating experts. Because the researcher wanted some final opinions about Delphi the cover letter to QIV served a two fold purpose. It served as the usual introduction to the questionnaire, but more important this
letter became an opinionnaire asking the experts to comment relative to the acceptability, practicality, and reliability of Delphi as an aid in guiding groups toward consensus. (Appendix 16) The researcher considered the collective opinions of such experts just completing the Delphi process to be valuable information for future studies.

The questionnaire itself consisted of the original criteria statements, the first and second modal responses, the individual experts' first and second ratings, and the consensus reached from rounds two and three. A final response column was provided for those experts who chose to remain outside the consensus.
DEFINITION OF TERMS II

The following definitions will be of value to the reader in understanding the next chapter. The meanings should not be generalized for use beyond this study.

1. Consensus: to reach general agreement from general opinion.
2. Consensus point and/or consensus level: the median value or above, i.e., over fifty per cent of the responses. For nine possible votes (responses) five or more votes will be necessary for an item response to reach consensus level; for twenty-seven possible votes (responses) fourteen or more votes will be necessary for an item response to reach consensus level.
3. Opinion: a clearly organized idea or judgment held to be true.
4. Agreement: consensus as to the approach to be taken; a reconciling of differences.
5. Modal Response: the predicted outcome of the final procedure by the experts on QII and QIII, the clustered individual rating of the item.
6. IR (Item Response): the questionnaire items from which the questionnaire form was constructed; these number from one through twelve.
7. PC (Priority Channel): the priority orders--first, second, third or fourth established by the experts--on individual items. PC uses an ordinal scale.
8. **EV (Expert Votes):** the selected group which participated in the process.

9. **QII (Questionnaire II):** the second instrument sent to the experts, but the first formal instrument in the Delphi process.

10. **QIII (Questionnaire III):** the third instrument sent to the experts, but the second formal instrument in the Delphi process.

11. **QIV (Questionnaire IV):** the fourth instrument sent to the experts, but the third formal instrument in the Delphi process.

12. **Round II:** administration of Questionnaire II.

13. **Round III:** administration of Questionnaire III.

14. **Round IV:** administration of Questionnaire IV.

15. **EVR (Expert Votes Received):** the number of tallies for a given item response and/or priority channel.

16. **TVP (Total Votes Possible):** the sum of the number of participants voting on that item response. The total was twenty-seven for this Delphi.

17. **PVR (Percentage of Votes Received):** the actual votes divided by the possible votes.

18. **PMR (Priority Modal Ranking):** the identification of the expert preference designated as Priority I, II, III, or IV. The PMR is based on an ordinal scale.
19. RC (Recommended Criteria): the result of classifying, codifying, modifying, and reducing the original responses of the experts on Questionnaire I into a new group of representative statements. The Recommended Criteria became the base item responses for the Delphi instrument as used in Rounds II, III and IV.

20. CIR (Consensus Item Response): the item response of a given priority channel which reached consensus (more than 50%) in that channel for a stated questionnaire.

21. TF (Total Frequencies): the sum of the number of participants voting for that suggested criteria in Round One (Q1).
CHAPTER IV

DISCUSSION OF THE FINDINGS

To support the earlier references to ABE programs as middle class American phenomena far short of the often described free and individualized program claims of various funding agencies, consider the following definitions of typical adult basic education programming, and a definition of free activities contrasted with those performed in a situation of oppression.

There is an inequitable distribution of opportunities for learning with respect to geographic areas, social class, and learning activities. A normal adult education program is designed and operated for the middle class; consequently the lower and even lower-middle class populations are not provided with suitable activities designed for their needs and interests. Finally, program and instructional objectives are derived from the traditions of the school rather than from the functional needs for learning of potential adult participants. 39

Thus the constructive activities of man take on a valid meaning only when they are assumed as a movement toward freedom. Perhaps it is permissible to dream of a future when men will know no other use of their freedom but this free unfurling of itself; constructive activities would possibly be for all, each one would be able to aim positively through his projects at his own future.
Every man transcends himself. But if it happens that his transcendence is condemned to fall uselessly back upon itself because it is cut off from its goals, that is what defines a situation of oppression. 40

While it may be true that the objectives and aims set forth in typical adult basic education programs are products of good intentions, the fact that the majority of such programming is Federally supported with Anti-Poverty funds, and offered to the public via the "standard brand" educational agencies indicates a growth out of political needs that are a great distance from the real lives of the poor. This being true simply negates any real value such programs might have initially set out to render.

Chapter I inferred that traditional adult basic education programs offered training that reflect assumptions made by the middle class society about the poor. The understandable reactions the poor, Black and otherwise, have toward such programs are minimal levels of involvement or actual withdrawal. While there undoubtedly are individuals who might take the position that adult basic education is adult basic education, such a position ignores the effect that cultural heritage has upon the behavior of the various groups who will participate in ABE programs of instruction. Because of their ethnic heritage Black people in general and poor Black folks in particular have been forced to accept white middle class values in every phase of the American society.
This research has taken the position that to be relevant for urban Black people, programs of adult basic education must be consistent with the situations of their lives. The establishment of relevant ABE program criteria thus became the primary research objective. The Delphi method was chosen as the vehicle for achieving this objective for two reasons: (1) It allowed for the full and equal involvement of people described by governmental and educational agencies as needing ABE and (2) The techniques of Delphi had been proven valid as a research design by educational institutions and the field of technology.

The purpose of this chapter is to discuss the findings relative to the stated objectives of Chapter I and the question posed in Chapter III. Since the overall findings serve little purpose alone, a detailed examination of expert votes by item response (IR) across questionnaires will be made. IR's that show strong agreement or disagreement will be identified. A compilation of Selected Criteria believed to be crucial to the research task by the experts will be reviewed. Finally the modal and consensus agreement between and among participating expert groups will be shown and discussed.
SELECTED CRITERIA

Twenty-seven (27) persons participated as individuals in four different categories. Each expert responded to Questionnaire I, either verbally or in writing depending upon their group classification. Five criterion statements were listed for or by each participant for a total of one hundred thirty five items (Appendix 17). These very broad statements were classified by the researcher into the following categories defined as Selected Criteria Categories.

1. Community Relations (CR)
2. Participant/Curriculum Interest (PCI)
3. Personnel Competencies (PC)
4. Physical Facilities (PF)

The above classifications were made based on an intensive examination of the total number of original criterion statements. Examples of these statements are listed below as original quotations. These items have been listed to assist the reader in perceiving what the experts thought to be crucial to the task. They are listed further, to help the reader trace a thread of continuity from the original statements to the final twelve criterion statements used in the ranking and consensus rounds of the Delphi procedure (Rounds II and III).
**Examples of Original Criterion Statements**

1. Community Relations

   a) Gr. A.  (1) "The schools got to be in the Negro neighborhood", (2) "I wish the classes were closer....I catch a bus and transfer coming and going." (3) "put where peoples can get to them with no trouble."

   b) Gr. B.  (1) "the median existing educational level." (2) "life styles and existing value of the community." (3) "Social and economic resources existing within the Black community setting." (4) "Recruitment of minorities in the urban centers...the recruiter must be recruited for this job."

   c) Gr. C.  (1) "ABE program should be shared planning endeavor by likely participants and those responsible for program development, easily accessible and available to all." (2) "assessment of subculture....attention given to ethnic group values and aspirations."
(3) "study needs of the people with the people... discuss and interpret results with the people and teachers in groups."

2. Participant/Curriculum Interest

a) Gr. A. (1) "start lesson low on right words", (2) "keep on students level... ground floor and work up", (3) "give the programs all year round", (4) "test peoples before putting them in class!", (5) "night programs should have all that regular day programs have", (6) "well they could use us to get others... I got five of these womens here tonight myself", (7) "no distance won't matter if the program is good for the people."

b) Gr. B. (1) "The curriculum must be Black, urban-oriented and subject to continuous modification. " (2) "the median age level and availability of relevant instructors. " (3) "Programmed instruction must be utilized to meet the needs of adults in urban centers. " (4) "Counseling should be an integral part of Adult Basic Education in any setting. "
(5) "Urban ABE must address itself to (a) basic education, (b) job placement, (c) evaluation for job advancement, (d) general educational development, (e) total evaluation.

c) Gr. C. (1) "Student participation in goal setting", (2) "learning climate which produces mutual trust", (3) "program materials relevant to students' problems and environment.

(4) "shared decision making throughout experience", (5) "continuing feedback from students for evaluation purposes", (6) "the program must be authentic; i.e. recognition must be given to dealing with real people, who have real problems and are seeking real answers." (7) "Positive feedback must be provided with provisions for adequate rewards and reinforcement to all participants."

(8) "Students should participate in planning, organization, curriculum development and operation of the school." (9) "Curriculum pattern should be developed to meet each situation without prescribed content or requirements,... completion and/or graduation
on basis of educational growth of students in their own terms without regard for courses completed or credits obtained or examinations passed. " (10) "informal atmosphere and procedure, abandoning all aspects of school".

3. Personnel Competencies

a) Gr. A. (1) "good teachers", (2) "people really interested in us like Mr. _____ so we can go away with something". (3) "Get teachers that help you learn not talk about what you ought to know." (4) "teachers should not put people down all the time."

b) Gr. B. (1) "The administrative and teaching staff must be Black, urban-oriented, academically sophisticated and street-wise." (2) "Black administrator must have absolute control of the program, especially the budget, personnel, curriculum and facilities." (3) "differential staffing pattern... paraprofessionals (less than 2 years of college); semi-professionals (two years of college or more)... a minimum of so-called professionals (M. Ed., M. A., or Ph. D.)".
(4) "A career ladder must be an integral part of the institution's staffing pattern." (5) "Teacher training in the form of what urban area is like."

c) Gr. C. (1) "A careful evaluation of the program should be made by the total staff and changes incorporated in light of this evaluation."

(2) Select teachers in terms of their commitment to help people, their understanding of adults, their knowledge of adult learning. (3) "Traditional requirements for certification should be disregarded."

4. Physical Facilities

a) Gr. A. (1) "Give us a choice of centers.... many different buildings." (2) "The buildings must be in Negro neighborhoods."

b) Gr. B. (1) "Many buildings being torn down now in the Black community could be renovated for use." (2) "Plan modern learning facilities based on recruitment, staff possibilities and finances." (3) "Existing school structure are adequate.... they must be planned for proper use."
c) Gr. C. (1) "All existing modern facilities for learning should be available i.e. public schools, churches, etc. " (2) "consult existing ABE agencies when its time to plan facilities."

The fifty-two items cited above illustrate the generation of criteria items as well as the interest areas of the expert groups. The following list of twelve items were formulated for use in the modal and consensus rounds of questioning utilizing the categorization procedures discussed earlier.

RECOMMENDED CRITERIA

1. The curriculum must be reflective of the existing educational and age levels of the geographic area involved.

2. The program should provide the participant with skills for the employment market.

3. Existing social, economic, and cultural values of the community must be considered.

4. The building of personal esteem must be provided through adequate rewards and reinforcements of the participants.

5. Realistic recruitment should be continuous utilizing participants as recruiters.
6. Based upon participant recruitment, staffing possibilities and finances, multiple modern learning centers should be planned.

7. Teacher training and selection should be conducted to secure individuals that demonstrate a sincere concern for Black adults categorized as potential ABE participants.

8. Structured verbal techniques must be planned to utilize the adult talents as teachers of each other.

9. Administrative teaching and counseling staff should be Black with real control of programming vested in a specific administrator.

10. Differential staffing using a built-in career ladder of professional, semi-professional, para-professional, and volunteer help is a must.

11. Participants and influential community people must be part of the program from original planning committees through operation and evaluation.

12. Planning should be done on an independent basis with existing ABE agencies.

Because the original questionnaire (QI) asked the participating experts to submit their opinions based on their particular experiences the returned suggestions were considered valid. A comparison of the original statements with the
Recommended Criteria used in Questionnaires II and III should show a continuity of items for the reader. Further the entire listings for QI are shown in Appendix 17 and should guide the reader toward a better understanding of the total process.

FINDINGS

It was found that the selected groups of defined experts suggested criterion statements they believed crucial to the specific program development task proposed by the research. These groups of experts further recommended specific criteria, voted a modal response and finally reached a consensus agreement on four (33 percent) of the twelve Recommended Criteria used during the formal questioning procedures. However, these findings represent the collective group reactions to the questionnaires and should not be defined isolated from the specific group reactions across Questionnaires II-IV.

Table 3 shows a comparison of modal rankings by the experts across Questionnaire II. A breakdown of these comparisons shows the following results. All the expert groups agreed that the Recommended Criteria (RC) numbered 1, 3, 7, and 11 should be given Top Priority. The agreement between the three groups shows 41 percent (5 of 12) between the ABE participants (Gr. A.) and the Black professionals (Gr. B.); 50 percent (6 of 12) between the ABE
TABLE 3

A Comparison of Modal Ranking By Expert Groups A, B & C, Across Questionnaire II

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Modal Ranking</th>
<th>RC</th>
<th>Gr. A</th>
<th>Gr. B</th>
<th>Gr. C</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Priorities were assigned by the expert groups using the following key.

1. Top Priority
2. Second Priority
3. Third Priority
4. Fourth Priority
participants and the professional adult educators (Gr. C.); and 66 percent (8 of 12) between Gr. B. and Gr. C. Because of the three group questioning process, agreement between any two groups resulted in disagreement with the third, unless, of course, the agreement was unanimous. A closer look at those item responses (IR's) where modal agreement was reached shows the following results: The ABE participants, all of whom, were Black and the Black professionals voted first and second priority respectfully on IR nine while the professional adult educators voted at the fourth priority level. IR nine reads: "Administrative teaching, and counseling staff should be Black with real control of programming vested in a specific administrator." It is interesting to note that while both groups A and B were totally Black all but one of the experts in group C were white*. Another interesting comparison of modal responses between groups proved to be item twelve. Here the Black ABE adults and Black professionals voted a modal response of Fourth Priority while the professional adult educators considered it Top Priority. IR twelve reads: "Planning should be done on an independent basis with existing ABE agencies."

*Verbal consent was granted from the expert involved for this statement.
Tables 4, 5 and 6 show the Expert Vote Response (EVR) according to Priority Channels (PC's) for Questionnaire III (QIII). These tables show the expert responses among the four priority categories. A comparison of the individual votes among groups by Priority Channels provides a broader awareness of the consensus agreements shown on Table 7. The ABE participant voltes were bunched much closer together by PC's and on more of the IR's than either of the professional groups. Table 4 shows the ABE group voting for IR's 1, 3, 4, 7, 9, 11 and 12 occurring at two of the possible PC's with two IR's receiving a unanimous vote at PC I. By comparison the two professional groups (B and C) spread their votes over three or more of the PC's. The Black professionals showed such a spread on ten of the twelve criteria while the professional adult educators voted a similar spread on eleven of the twelve items of the questionnaire. These facts indicate that the ABE experts used rounds one and two of the procedure to make a firm decision on more of the Recommended Criteria than the professional groups. It further shows the influence of the ABE participants on final consensus. The anonymity built into the Delphi questioning technique disproves the notion that personal influence persuaded these decisions.
TABLE 4

EVR's by PC's for Group A Across QIII

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item Response</th>
<th>I</th>
<th>II</th>
<th>III</th>
<th>IV</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE 5

EVR's by PC's for Group B Across QIII

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item Response</th>
<th>I</th>
<th>II</th>
<th>III</th>
<th>IV</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**TABLE 6**

EVR's by PC's for Group C Across QIII

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item Response</th>
<th>I</th>
<th>II</th>
<th>III</th>
<th>IV</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE 7

CIR's By PC's Across Questionnaire III
For Groups A, B and C

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item Response</th>
<th>I</th>
<th>II</th>
<th>III</th>
<th>IV</th>
<th>Total CIR's</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CIR 4 0 0 0 0 4

+ : denotes consensus total groups
- : denotes lack of consensus total groups
Consensus was reached at IR's 1, 3, 7 and 11 (Table 7) with the respective percentages being 62 percent, 77 percent, 88 percent and 74 percent (Table 2). A look at IR seven, which received 88 percent of the total expert vote, shows it to be specifically about teacher training and selection, defined as Personnel Competencies. The other three IR's receiving a consensus vote percentage came in the Community Relations category of the original statement selection. Two other categories of Selected Criteria did not receive enough votes to reach consensus agreement they were: the Physical Facilities and Participant/Curriculum Interest categories. A strong convergence of expert opinion was shown for the Community Relations categories that reached consensus (more than 50 percent of the votes) on three of the four Item Responses reaching consensus.

The above findings are considered valid evidence of support for the opinion that Black ABE participants themselves should share equally in programs developed for implementation in their particular communities. The fact that groups of adults whose characteristics were so diverse, accepted the task of selecting criteria following the objectives of this research is very important. These findings should be of significant value to the many urban ABE agencies and or administrators who seem to be
groping for solutions to their problems in the areas of recruitment, curriculum content, staffing and community relations.

PRESENTATION OF COLLECTED DATA

Table 1 is very broad including the votes of all expert groups by Item Response across questionnaires II and III. All the IR's reaching consensus in QIII show a numerical increase over the modal response vote recorded in QII. Although this is not a large increase in number or percentage of expert votes from questionnaire to questionnaire it does seem to indicate a cementing of agreement among the experts.

Table 2 illustrates the complete percentage picture for all IR's across QIII. Four of the twelve Recommended Criteria reached the needed percentage (more than 50 percent) for consensus. Five other PC's reached 48 percent which seems to indicate that they are items worthy of full investigation by future ABE program developers.

Tables 3-7 are designed to present graphically for the reader the findings written about in the preceding section. Table 3 shows a comparison of the modal rankings of the total population of experts (27). The voting patterns reveals some evidences of the similarities and differences between the various groups of
### TABLE 1

Comparison of Modal Predictions With Consensus
By Item Responses Among Questionnaires II and III

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>QII Modal Predictions</th>
<th>QIII Consensus Round</th>
<th>CIR</th>
<th>TVP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I</td>
<td>II</td>
<td>III</td>
<td>IV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>*16</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>*16</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>*23</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>*18</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Totals</strong></td>
<td><strong>EVR</strong></td>
<td><strong>130</strong></td>
<td><strong>86</strong></td>
<td><strong>61</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Modal Predictions QII; Consensus QIII equals 15 (more than 50%)
### TABLE 2

**Number and Percentage of Item Responses Toward Consensus Across Questionnaire III**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>IR's</th>
<th>EV's by PMR's</th>
<th>PVR by PMR's</th>
<th>CIR</th>
<th>TVP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I</td>
<td>II</td>
<td>III</td>
<td>IV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>132</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Totals:</th>
<th>EVR</th>
<th>CIR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>324</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Consensus equals 15 or more (more than 50%)

**Note:** Cell percentages do not total 100 due to rounding error.
expert participants. Tables 4, 5 and 6 show the individual group responses by priority of importance on the consenting questionnaire (QIII). A comparison of these tables gives the reader a more realistic picture of the actual voting patterns of the experts by Priority Channels (PC's). An analysis reveals the very noticeable fact that the Black ABE expert participants (Gr. A.) voted in a much more clustered manner than did the professional adult educators (Gr. C.) or the Black professionals (Gr. B.).

Table 7 finally lists simply the CIR's by PC's for the entire group of experts. Consensus was reached around four (4) items from the recommended list of criteria representing 33 percent of the total list of twelve (12) items. The interesting phenomenon of all consensus occurring at Priority Channel I would seem to support the opinion of a participating expert found in Appendix 16 which reads, "All my votes will be for the number 1 rating cause if something has to be thought of fourth in your mind there ain't no need to waste time thinking bout it so I got no number 4 items." It would appear that the other experts participating in the study agree with their peer group member for although agreement was not reached on a majority of the items where consensus did occur Priority Channel I received that agreement over the second, third, or fourth priority positions.
CHAPTER V
SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

SUMMARY

This research was based on and indeed undertaken because of the indications that although numerous programs of Adult Basic Education exist or existed they at best meet a few of the needs of "poor urban Black illiterate adults" as defined by educational agencies. The expressed opinion was that a major reason no inroads had been made in solving the problem of adult illiteracy in this country is because the program designs are basically geared to meet the needs of middle-class white Americans. A condition that totally ignores the life styles of perhaps the larger group within the millions of illiterate adults, the Black urban resident. Scharles noted in 1971 that 7.6 per cent of all Black's are illiterates as compared to an illiteracy rate of 1.6 per cent for all whites. Such statistical gaps in educational illiteracy indicate that Black people are relegated to inferior education. This research problem thus became one of identifying criteria basic to the development of relevant ABE programs designed for use in urban Black
communities. The researchers own personal beliefs about ABE programming also influenced the nature of this study. First, if the right programs are conceptualized and developed Black people could at long last begin to benefit from, rather than be victimized by, various educational agencies throughout the country. Second, Black adult participants themselves must participate on an equal basis in program development efforts if they are to be relevant to their needs in the final analysis.

The Delphi technique was found to have a number of advantages not found in other methods of research considered, for getting in usable form the information necessary to develop the suggested criteria needed for this particular ABE program area. These advantages are listed in Chapter II. The Delphi procedure chosen proved to be quite functional and allowed a maximum of flexibility toward the completion of the required task in the research design.

Three very diverse groups of experts were identified and contacted to participate relative to the stated objectives. Although, the population represented an educational range of from two years formal schooling to the Ph. D., and the geographical distance stretched over two thousand miles the cooperation was excellent. The development of Recommended Criteria (Chapter IV) and the later resulting modal and consensus agreements are
indicative of the full cooperation the researcher received from the participating experts. (See Table 8)

The primary objective of the research was to establish a set of criteria for developing adult basic education programs for Black adults residing in urban areas. Using the Delphi method of extracting expert opinion the research aimed for a consensus agreement on the criteria within and among the participating expert groups. It was found that twenty seven experts generated one hundred thirty-five criterion statements (Appendix 17). The statements were analyzed for commonality of ideas and reduced to twelve statements (Appendix 14). These twelve concise statements became the item responses for Questionnaires II and III, the modal and consensus rounds respectively. The title Recommended Criteria was formally given these twelve very important statements. The significance of the twelve Recommended Criteria is seen in the fact they represent the deliberated efforts of twenty-seven ABE experts on a national level. The quality and/or authenticity of these statements may be evaluated by inspection of the original criterion statements as well as the method by which the final twelve criteria were chosen.

Four of the Recommended Criteria reached a consensus level of agreement (more than 50 per cent). Considering the earlier mentioned educational ethnic, and geographic differences as
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City and State</th>
<th>Number of Participants by Expert Groups</th>
<th>Distance from Columbus</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Columbus, Ohio</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cincinnati, Ohio</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tuskegee, Alabama</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tallahassee, Florida</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statesboro, Georgia</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bloomington, Indiana</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chicago, Illinois</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Los Angeles, California</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Detroit, Michigan</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boston, Massachusetts</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Falmouth, Massachusetts</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Durham, North Carolina</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Washington, D.C.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madison, Wisconsin</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laramie, Wyoming</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

variables affecting the outcome the thirty-three per cent final result indicates a positive need for similar research in the future. Adult basic education participant opinions used in this research represent a valuable component that should not be overlooked by program developers in the future.

CONCLUSIONS

The data collection and final analysis did achieve the stated objectives. The use of the Delphi process did extract expert opinions which can be used in the development of adult basic education programs designed for use in urban Black communities. Not only were criteria established, 33 per cent reached a consensus agreement (more than 50 per cent). Considering the experts who participated in this research these results are concluded to be both acceptable and practical. The use of Delphi methods and techniques are credited with reaching the level of agreement found in this research. The research is considered valid based on the proven Delphi design. Seemingly any questions about the reliability or practically of this process can be handled through Delphi's wide acceptability in technology and business as a problem solving technique in areas of decision making.

The intriguing fact that Black adult illiterates teamed with Black professionals and professional adult educators on a
national level to agree on educational program criteria justifies the effort. An examination of the collected data via Tables 3-7 shows the levels of agreement. These tables also reveal some noticeable disagreements between the various groups. The following comparisons are being made to illustrate the different disagreeing factions among the experts. The "poor rich split" in the voting pattern is detected at IR 3. Here the Black ABE participants voted unanimously at priority channel one, while the Black professionals and professional adult educators vote totaled four and five at this priority channel respectively. Credit for this item ultimate achievement of consensus must go to the ABE participants because the combined total votes of both professional groups is not sufficient for consensus. The wording of this particular IR reads: "Existing social, economic, and cultural values of the community must be considered." Reflection as to the number of expert votes recorded for the various expert at the first PC gives rise to the speculation that neither group of professional people know what residents of the urban Black community want in ABE programming. This same pattern of voting occurred at IR 6 that referred to the building of ABE facilities for learning. The illiterate adults recognized this criteria as a second priority item while the professionals voted it the lowest or fourth priority.
The "Black white split" in the voting pattern occurred at two IR in noticeable proportions. Both the Black professional and Black ABE participants bunched all but two of their expert votes for IR 9 at the first or second priority channels while their white peers cast eight of their nine possible votes at priority channels three and four. The Recommended Criteria for this IR directly called for Black control of ABE programming. It specifically reads: "Administrative teaching and counseling staff should be Black with real control of programming vested in a specific administrator." Considering the fact that Black people control very little in ABE programs except their attendance the voting at this particular PC offers many alternatives for present and future program developers. The same "Black white split" occurred at IR 12 that read: "Planning should be done on an independent basis with existing ABE agencies." The vote could be interpreted to mean that both Black groups of experts realize the failures of existing agencies and are opting for new and different strategies in the future. The professional adult educators on the other hand seem to be suggesting planning vis-a-vis the old methods according to their clustered votes at PC's I and II.

This research offers strong suggestions for action on the part of Black community groups both local and national to work for relevant forms of adult basic education in urban areas. Locally
the Black Education Coalition of Columbus, Model Cities and Columbus Metropolitan Area Community Action Organization (CMACAO) should find this research suggestive to their program efforts. The National Association of Black Adult Educators and the Black Political Caucus should find the research method and findings of interest to their program goals.

The use of these findings in future programs however, rest with those responsible for the development of adult basic programs of education. If these program developers use the foundations suggested by this research it is posited that relevant well attended programs will be the end result.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The twelve Recommended Criteria arrived at in this research resulted from a cooperative effort on the part of twenty-seven experts in the field of Adult Basic Education on a national level. After an extensive treatise following the valid procedures of the Delphi research design four criteria reached a consensus level of agreement based on expert participant voting. It is recommended that this research, especially the Recommended Criteria, be consulted by basic education program developers in general and urban program developers in particular. The use of Black ABE participants themselves as co-developers of criteria for use in
programs designed for their communities is strongly recommended.

Future research conducted by graduate students, education
associations and the education arms of business and industry are
recommended and considered vital to the stabilization of the
techniques used. The commonality of ideas expressed by the
diverse groups of participating adults suggested a high degree of
understanding about the problem of adult illiteracy nationally.
This research is therefore recommended to the attention of all
educational agencies private and governmental on local, state
and national levels.
Dear Mr., Mrs., Miss, Dr.:

I am a Ph.D. candidate at The Ohio State University majoring in Adult Education. Because of my past experiences as a Black student and instructor of adult basic education (ABE), I am very much concerned about the effects of programs of basic education offered to adults residing in urban Black communities.

My dissertation committee is made up of the following professors at the university: C. Candoli, B. Mehl, J. Ohliger-chairman, and C. Ross. We have agreed upon an attempt to ascertain basic criteria that should be used in developing ABE programs for urban Black communities as my Ph.D. research problem. I contend that the best way to arrive at criteria that will be relevant is to generate the opinions of experts in the field.

You are known as a Black person whose past experiences as a participant in urban Black communities indicate a valuable and practical knowledge of criteria to be considered if relevant programs of adult basic education are to be developed for use therein. This letter comes as my personal solicitation of your help in this important academic task.
The Delphi Technique of expert forecasting selected for use in this research calls for four rounds of questions, however, you will only be asked to generate opinions on the initial questionnaire. The remaining three rounds will require that you merely rank or evaluate the opinions by assigning numbers to them. Three expert groups will participate in this study. You will be asked to identify yourself on each questionnaire. This will be for research purposes only. Expert group members will remain anonymous to one another at all times during the research period.

We feel that this is valuable research due to today's social, psychological, and economic climate in the Black community. In order to complete my research by Spring Quarter graduation 1972, I must follow the enclosed schedule as closely as possible. Please be so kind as to indicate your ability or inability to serve as an expert by completing the enclosed form and return it in the enclosed stamped self-addressed envelope at your earliest convenience.

Thank you in advance for considerations given.

Sincerely,

Charles Nesbitt

CEN:sh

Enclosures (4)
Dear Mr., Mrs., Miss, Dr.:  

I am a Ph. D. candidate at The Ohio State University majoring in Adult Education. Because of my past experiences as a Black student and instructor of adult basic education (ABE), I am very much concerned about the effects of programs of basic education offered to adults residing in urban Black communities.

My dissertation committee is made up of the following professors at the university: C. Candoli, B. Mehl, J. Ohliger, chairman, and C. Ross. We have agreed upon an attempt to ascertain basic criteria that should be used in developing ABE programs for urban Black communities as my Ph. D. research problem. I contend that the best way to arrive at criteria that will be relevant is to generate the opinions of experts in the field.

Your active membership in the Commission of the Professors of Adult Education and professional work in the past indicate valuable theoretical and practical knowledge of criteria to be considered if relevant programs of adult basic education are to be developed for use in urban Black communities. This letter comes as my personal solicitation of your help in this important academic task.
The Delphi Technique of expert forecasting selected for use in this research calls for four rounds of questions, however, you will only be asked to generate opinions on the initial questionnaire. The subsequent three rounds will require that you merely rank or evaluate the opinions by assigning numbers to them. Three expert groups will participate in this study. You will be asked to identify yourself on each questionnaire. This will be for research purposes only. Expert group members will remain anonymous to one another at all times during the research period.

We feel that this is valuable research due to today's social, psychological, and economic climate in the Black community. In order to complete my research by Spring Quarter graduation 1972, I must follow the enclosed schedule as closely as possible. Please be so kind as to indicate your ability or inability to serve as an expert by completing the enclosed form and return it in the enclosed stamped self-addressed envelope at your earliest convenience.

Thank you in advance for considerations given.

Sincerely,

Charles Nesbitt

ENC/sh

Enclosures (4)
APPENDIX 3

Time Schedule for Completing the Research


Nov. 1-13 - Time allowed for experts to receive, accept, complete, and return the first round opinions to the researcher.

Nov. 14-27 - Time allowed for researcher to tabulate and return a copy of the generated opinions for expert evaluation.

Nov. 28-Dec. 11 - Time allowed for experts to receive and evaluate the generated opinions, returning the evaluations to the researcher.

Dec. 12-Dec. 25 - During this time period the researcher will tabulate the evaluations indicating consensus. He will also prepare and mail the third round questionnaire during this time.

Dec. 26-Jan. 8, 1972 - The experts will receive their evaluated opinions and make revisions or specify their reasons for remaining outside the consensus. The experts will mail the researcher their final opinions.

Jan. 9-Jan. 22 - The researcher will list the consensus and modal opinions. The final revisions will be mailed to the participating experts for their information and possible comments.
APPENDIX 4

Process and Procedure

The Delphi Technique of expert forecasting determined the design of this study. Delphi utilizes expert intuitive judgment while striving for group consensus through sequential individual interrogations combined with opinion feedback. The following process will be used to generate and evaluate criteria essential to the development of relevant adult basic education programs designed for urban Black communities. Criteria will be defined by the researcher as: The generated judgmental opinions of defined experts in the field of adult basic education toward the development of relevant programs of basic education for use in urban Black communities.

1. The first questionnaire calls for a list of opinions involving your experienced judgment.

2. On the second round, each expert will receive a copy of the list and will be asked to rate or evaluate each item by certain criteria.

3. The third questionnaire will include the list, the ratings, and will indicate the consensus, if any, and asks all experts either to revise their list or support their reasons for remaining outside the consensus.
4. The fourth questionnaire will include list, ratings, and consensus and modal opinions. It will further provide the final chance for revisions of opinions.
APPENDIX 5

ACCEPTANCE FORM

Please indicate your ability or inability to serve as an expert by completing and returning the form below that applies to your situation.

Dear Mr. Nesbitt:

I've read your solicitation letter and accompanying proposed schedule of time for completing the research.

I agree to serve as an expert for research. I've enclosed my 5-10 first round opinions. My mailing address will remain the same throughout the research period.

Name: ____________________________________________

Address: ____________________________________________

Dear Mr. Nesbitt:

I've read your solicitation letter and accompanying proposed schedule of time for completing the research.

I cannot serve as an expert for your research.

I cannot serve as an expert for your research, however, I passed your request on to a colleague who has agreed to serve.

I cannot serve as an expert for your research, however, I suggest you contact the following person for his/her expert opinion.

Name: ____________________________________________

Address: ____________________________________________
APPENDIX 6

Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.

Name: (confidential information for) __________________________

Mailing Address: (research purposes only) __________________________

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities. . . . Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1.

2.

3.

4.

5.

Please make any comments you have below.
Dear Mr., Mrs., Miss, Dr.:

The result of the first round of the Delphi research, for which you so kindly agreed to serve as an expert is progressing. However, considering the proposed time schedule in conjunction with the more real rate of returned questionnaires, I feel compelled to alter my plans somewhat. Your participation will be the same, consequently the acceptance form you returned to me remains effective. The only difference for you as an expert will be a move forward in the schedule of allowable time for receiving rounds II and III of the questionnaire.

Considering the holiday season, as well as the above mentioned reason, I feel the following time schedule to be more realistic for the completion of the research:

Nov. 27-Dec. 11 - Experts accept, complete, and return first round to researcher.

Dec. 12-Dec. 25 - Researcher will receive, tabulate, and return generated opinions to experts.

Dec. 26-Jan. 22 - Experts to receive and evaluate opinions returning same to researcher.
Jan. 23-Feb. 5 - Researcher to tabulate, evaluate the responses, indicate the modal response, and return the results to the experts.

Feb. 6-Feb. 19 - Experts will receive evaluations and return final opinions.

Feb. 20-Mar. 4 - Researcher to receive and list consensus and modal opinions and mail final findings to the experts.

Thank you most sincerely for taking so much time from your busy schedule to participate in this study. Hopefully, the results will have many implications for sound ABE program development.

Sincerely,

Charles Nesbitt
APPENDIX 8

THE OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY
Office of Educational Services
190 West 19th Avenue
Columbus, Ohio 43210

Dear Paul:

Sometime ago, you will recall I spoke with you about permission to question some of your ABE participants for my Ph. D. dissertation research. This letter comes as my formal request for same, realizing the legal implications of such a request.

My dissertation committee is made up of the following professors at the university: C. Candoli, C. Ross, and J. Ohliger. We have agreed upon an attempt to ascertain basic criteria that should be used in developing ABE programs for urban Black communities as my research problem. I contend that the best way to arrive at criteria that will be relevant is to generate the opinions of experts in the field. Black ABE participants themselves fit the accepted definition of expert based on recent literature. Knowing your liberal position as to the value of participant input in program development, I felt compelled to consult you concerning this matter. This letter, then comes as my personal solicitation of your consent and help in this important task.

If your answer is affirmative, please do the following things for me: 1) Send a formal letter giving your permission to orally ask
my research questions of ABE students. 2) The permission to seek such information using other graduate students as questionees. A copy of the final questionnaires will be sent to you or your designated personnel at your request. In order to complete my research by Spring Quarter graduation 1972, I should complete all questioning by March 31, 1972. With this in mind, I will be contacting you about the particular procedures soon after receiving an acceptance letter from you.

Thank you in advance for considerations given.

Sincerely,

Charles Nesbitt
Dear Jim:

Sometime ago, you will recall I spoke with you about permission to question some of your ABE participants for my Ph. D. dissertation research. This letter comes as my formal request for same, realizing the legal implications of such a request.

My dissertation committee is made up of the following professors at the university: C. Candoli, C. Ross, and J. Ohliger.

We have agreed upon an attempt to ascertain basic criteria that should be used in developing ABE programs for urban Black Communities as my research problem. I contend that the best way to arrive at criteria that will be relevant is to generate the opinions of experts in the field. Black ABE participants themselves fit the accepted definition of expert based on recent literature. Knowing your liberal position as to the value of participant input in program development, I felt compelled to consult you concerning this matter. This letter, then comes as my personal solicitation of your consent and help in this important task.
If your answer is affirmative, please do the following things for me: 1) Send a formal letter giving your permission to orally ask my research questions of ABE students. 2) The permission to seek such information using other graduate students as questionees. A copy of the final questionnaires will be sent to you or your designated personnel at your request. In order to complete my research by Spring Quarter graduation, 1972, I should complete all questioning by March 31, 1972. With this in mind, I will be contacting you about the particular procedures soon after receiving an acceptance letter from you.

Thank you in advance for considerations given.

Sincerely,

Charles Nesbitt
Columbus Public Schools

ADULT EDUCATION AND
SCHOOL SERVICES CENTER
82 Starling Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
Area Code 614 228-3131

February 16, 1972

Mr. Charles Nesbitt
Office of Educational Services
190 West 19th Avenue
The Ohio State University
Columbus, Ohio 43210

Dear Mr. Nesbitt:

This is a confirmation of our conversation some time ago concerning a research project involving the Adult Basic Education Program in Columbus.

You may use our facilities and interview the adult learners in our program. The same information may be sought by using other graduate students as questionees.

Please send a copy of the results for me to utilize as a guide in program improvement.

Good Luck on your project and I wish you were in ABE with me.

Sincerely,

JAMES M. VICARS, Supv.
Adult Basic Education

JMVJb
January 11, 1972

Mr. Charles Nesbitt
Office of Educational Services
190 West 19th Avenue
The Ohio State University
Columbus, Ohio 43210

Dear Charles:

This letter will confirm our verbal agreement last month to have you question approximately six of the ABE students at the O. I. C. center in Cincinnati.

You may use our facilities and interview the adults involved in our program. I would suggest that you come on Tuesday or Wednesday evening because of our attendance patterns.

I look forward to talking with you again.

Good luck on the dissertation.

Sincerely,

Paul Moss, Instructor
O. I. C. Gilbert Avenue Center
Hello Ladies and Gentlemen:

I am Charles Nesbitt from Columbus. I have got a problem that your instructor Mr., Mrs., Miss _______ and I are sure you can help me with. Let me try and explain my problem to you. You see, for many years now adult basic education programs have been thought up, developed on paper, and then offered to you in the form of classes. Now, nothing is wrong with this basically; but I sort of believe, along with a lot of other people, that most of the ABE programs around the country were thought up; developed on paper; and offered to you without any real information from you about what should go into these programs. Now, I say this is all wrong; I say you must be part of the planning and writing, as well as the teaching and learning stages of ABE programs if they are to be good programs.

So, for that reason I have asked my good friend _______ to allow me to talk with you about those things you would like considered while building an adult basic education program for use where you live. In other words what things should a program of ABE have in order to be successful in the neighborhood where you live? As an example I would say that such a program in my
neighborhood would need to be offered at night because all the people on my street work during the day. So, please think about this question for a while, and see if you can think of at least five (5) things a good ABE program should have in order to be a success in your neighborhood, on your street, or block; or as my daddy would say "in your neck of the woods".

I am doing this so that what you tell me can be put with the things other people around Ohio, and other states tell me, to make one big list of things that people who develop programs will use when more ABE programs are developed. For that reason I need to get your answers or list of things you consider important, one at a time. The reason we want to do it this way is so that each person will be speaking for himself and his or her neighborhood, street, or block and not someone else's. Now, this does not mean that some of the answers you give will not be the same, so do not worry a bit about your list being like someone else's. Just thinking about what your list will include, you might want to write down a list, as a matter of fact that might be a good idea, o, k.?

So I will talk to you one at a time in the place already set up for us by your teacher. While this is being done the rest of the class can do whatever the teacher has planned for you.
APPENDIX 12 (con't)

Just one last thing, when I get all the things you tell me I will put them with things other people will tell me and ask you to pick from this list the most important ones at a later time. So I will be visiting you on two other nights. I hope we can become friends.

Thank you very much for helping me. Because of your help tonight and on the two other nights later on, I promise you that I will personally do all I can to get your ideas into ABE programs written for neighborhoods like yours.
Dear Mr., Mrs., Miss, Dr.:

The results of the first round of the Delphi research has provided the researcher with an excellent listing of Recommended Criteria. Thanks to you and twenty-six (26) other expert in the field, a total of one hundred and thirty-five (135) responses were returned. The researcher analyzed, interpreted, and tallied the responses and developed a list that encompasses all the mentioned criteria. To complete the Delphi Questionnaire II, you are asked to assign priorities to the items in the questionnaire. Detailed directions are included on the attached instrument.

Please return your completed questionnaire to me in the enclosed stamped self-addressed envelope. As soon as the data are collected and organized, you will receive a report of this analysis and your copy of the Delph Questionnaire III together with instructions for completing the next phase of the research.

Following the adjusted time schedule sent to all participating experts, I should have your completed questionnaire by January 22, 1972. It is imperative that you sign the enclosed
questionnaire so that your individual responses may be returned
with the group responses.

Thank you for your cooperation.

Sincerely,

Charles Nesbitt

CEN/sh

Encl. : 1
APPENDIX 14

Name ____________________________

DELPHI QUESTIONNAIRE II

Instructions

After each of the statements, indicate the way you would assign priority to the Recommended Criteria, using the following key.

1. Top Priority
2. Second Priority
3. Third Priority
4. Fourth Priority

The most needed criteria for the development of relevant ABE programs for use in urban Black communities are:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Priority</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The curriculum must be reflective of the existing educational and age levels of the geographic area involved.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Should provide the participants with skills for the employment market.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Existing social, economic, and cultural values of the community must be considered.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The building of personal esteem must be provided through adequate rewards and reinforcement of participants.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5. Realistic recruitment should be continuous utilizing participants as recruiters.

6. Based upon participant recruitment, staffing possibilities, and finances, multiple modern learning centers should be planned.

7. Teacher training and selection should be conducted to secure individuals that demonstrate a sincere concern for Black adults categorized as potential ABE participants.

8. Structured verbal techniques must be planned to utilize the adult talents as teachers of each other.

9. Administrative, teaching, and counseling staff should be Black with real control of programming vested in a specific administrator.

10. Differential staffing using a built-in career ladder of professional, semi-professional, paraprofessional, and volunteer help is a must.

11. Participants and influential community people must be a part of the program from original planning committees through operation and evaluation.

12. Planning should be done on an interdependent basis with existing ABE agencies.
Dear Mr., Mrs., Miss, Dr.:

Enclosed please find Delphi Questionnaire III. Completion of this questionnaire should take only a few minutes of your time.

Please complete the questionnaire using columns (d) and (e); if your priorities change from the previous responses (column c) or after reading the modal responses (column b).

According to the Delphi variation being used, this round of responses represents the crux of the research technique. Considering this fact, I would appreciate your continued promptness in the return of this important questionnaire.

As usual, I have enclosed a stamped, self-addressed envelope for your convenience.

Again, thanks for your continued cooperation.

Sincerely,

Charles Nesbitt

CEN/cs

Enclosures (1)
DELPHI QUESTIONNAIRE III

Name ______________________

Directions:

Listed below are the original statements (column a), the modal responses (column b), and your previous responses (column c). In light of knowing the modal responses, please list your new responses (column d), and the reason(s) if any, for the changes (column e).

For your new responses (column d), please use the following key:

1. Top Priority
2. Second Priority
3. Third Priority
4. Fourth Priority

The most needed criteria for the development of relevant ABE programs for use in urban Black communities are:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(a) Recommended Criteria</th>
<th>(b) Modal Response</th>
<th>(c) Previous Response</th>
<th>(d) Your New Response</th>
<th>(e) Reasons for variance between (b) &amp; (d)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The curriculum must be reflective of the existing educational and age levels of the geographic area involved.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Should provide the participants with skills for the employment market.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Recommended Criteria</td>
<td>(b) Modal Response</td>
<td>(c) Previous Response</td>
<td>(d) Your New Response</td>
<td>(e) Reasons for variance between (b) &amp; (d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Existing social, economic, and cultural values of the community must be considered.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The building of personal esteem must be provided through adequate rewards and reinforcement of participants.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Realistic recruitment should be continuous utilizing participants as recruiters.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Based upon participant recruitment, staffing possibilities and finances, multiple modern learning centers should be planned.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Teacher training and selection should be conducted to secure individuals that demonstrate a sincere concern for Black adults categorized as potential ABE participants.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Recommended Criteria</td>
<td>(b) Modal Response</td>
<td>(c) Previous Response</td>
<td>(d) Your New Response</td>
<td>(e) Reason for variance between (b) &amp; (d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Structured verbal techniques must be planned to utilize the adult talents as teachers of each other.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Administrative teaching and counseling staff should be Black with real control of programming vested in a specific administrator.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Differential staffing using a built-in career ladder of professional, semi-professional, para-professional, and volunteer help is a must.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Participants and influential community people must be a part of the program from original planning committees through operation and evaluation.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Recommended Criteria</td>
<td>(b) Modal Response</td>
<td>(c) Previous Response</td>
<td>(d) Your New Response</td>
<td>(e) Reasons for variance between (b) &amp; (d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Planning should be done on an interdependent basis with existing ABE agencies.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Dear Mr., Mrs., Miss, Dr.:

Enclosed please find Round IV of the Delphi Technique. This represents the final results of the research project. If you agree with the consensus reached please disregard column QIV and retain the questionnaire for your information. However, if your opinions have changed; please list those changes under Column IV and return the questionnaire for the minority report. I would greatly appreciate your final reactions to the three questions below. Your opinions, as an expert acquainted with the process from a practical point of view, will add a very important dimension to the completion of my project.

1. Do you feel that Delphi is an **acceptable** research technique for adult education?

2. How do you feel about its **practicality**?

3. Do you feel that Delphi is a **reliable** technique?

Just return this sheet in the enclosed envelope at your earliest convenience.

Once again, thank you most sincerely for the time and effort contributed toward the finalization of this research.

Respectfully,

CEN/cs

Enclosure (1)  

Charles Nesbitt
Directions:

Listed below are the results of three rounds of questioning designated by the appropriate columns, QI, QII and QIII. Consensus was reached as a result of QII and QIII. If you agree with the consensus reached, please disregard column QIV. However, if your opinions have changed; reflect those changes in column QIV and return the completed questionnaire.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recommended Criteria</th>
<th>QII</th>
<th>QIII</th>
<th>Consensus Results QII, QIII</th>
<th>QIV</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The curriculum must be reflective of the existing educational and age levels of the geographic area involved.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Should provide the participants with skills for the employment market.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Existing social, economic, and cultural values of the community must be considered.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommended Criteria</td>
<td>First Modal Response</td>
<td>Your First Rating Response</td>
<td>Your Second Rating Response</td>
<td>Second Modal Response</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The building of personal esteem must be provided through adequate rewards and reinforcement of participants.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Realistic recruitment should be continuous utilizing participants as recruiters.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Based upon participant recruitment, staffing possibilities and finances, multiple modern learning centers should be planned.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommended Criteria</td>
<td>First Modal Response</td>
<td>Your First Rating Response</td>
<td>Your Second Rating Response</td>
<td>Second Modal Response</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Teacher training and selection should be conducted to secure individuals that demonstrate a sincere concern for Black adults categorized as potential ABE participants.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Structured verbal techniques must be planned to utilize the adult talents as teachers of each other.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Administrative teaching and counseling staff should be Black with real control of programming vested in a specific administrator.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommended Criteria</td>
<td>First Modal Response</td>
<td>Your First Rating Response</td>
<td>Your Second Rating Response</td>
<td>Second Modal Response</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Differential staffing using a built-in career ladder of professional, semi-professional, and volunteer help is a must.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Participants and influential community people must be a part of the program from original planning committees through operation and evaluation</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Planning should be done on an interdependent basis with existing ABE agencies.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX 17

Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.
Name: (confidential information for) Gr. A.
Mailing Address: (research purposes only)

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities.... Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. I have to transfer coming and going... my program would sure be located in the Black community.
   (Editors note: transfer refers to the necessity to ride two separate busses on the same trip.)

2. It must aim for good education, not just for a job.

3. Must have better teachers interested in Black people so they can go away with something.

4. Use students as recruiters and teachers as recruiters.

5. Good teachers.

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant 
ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.

Name: (confidential information for) Gr. A.
Mailing Address: (research purposes only) ___________________

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities.... Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. First of all... The schools got to be in the Negro neighborhood.

2. Test people and put them in the proper classes because of how they do on the test.

3. Program should have at night all that offered during the day.

4. Get teachers that help you learn not talking bout what you ought to learn.

5. 

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.

Name: (confidential information for) Gr. A.________________________

Mailing Address: (research purposes only) ____________________________

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities. .

Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. Cut enrollment according to the teachers you have.

2. Use volunteer help to teach.

3. Good teachers. We need people really interested in us like Mr. ______ so we can go away with something.

4. Give us a choice of centers... now we only have ____ and ____ for all of the city people to come to.

5. Another thing, the program should be at night the same as during the daytime for kids.

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.

Name: (confidential information for) Gr. A.

Mailing Address: (research purposes only) ______________

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities. . . . Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. Offer programs at a time when the people can come.

2. The buildings must be in Negro neighborhoods.

3. Keep on students level...ground floor and work up.

4. Put the right teachers in the right classroom.

5. Some teachers should spend more time with students explaining material.

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant
ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.
Name: (confidential information for) Gr. A.
Mailing Address: (research purposes only) _______________________

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic
criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult
basic education programs for use in urban Black communities...
Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques,
and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. Teachers that explain and help students.

2. More help for us on what we want to do aside from in class.

3. Interested teachers willing to give individual help.

4. Day and night classes.

5. Right choice of teachers by those who hire them.

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.

Name: (confidential information for) Gr. A.

Mailing Address: (research purposes only)

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities...

Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. Start material low and on the right words.

2. Good teachers is the most important thing for us here.

3. Locate all programs for the convenience of all students.

4. Test all peoples before putting them in class.

5. Give the programs all year round.

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.

Name: (confidential information for) Gr. A. __________________

Mailing Address: (research purposes only) _______________________

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities.... Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. Teachers with pleasing personalities.

2. Keep size of classes small.

3. Right school atmosphere.

4. Watch time of day keep school open at a time convenient to students.

5. Hire staff people with right attitude.

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.

Name: (confidential information for) Gr. A.

Mailing Address: (research purposes only)

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities.... Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. Strict but fair teachers - considerate teachers.

2. Proper scheduling of classes.

3. Offer what students want.

4. Keep class size low.

5. Pay enough to teachers, keep them from working overtime and when not feeling well.

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.

Name: (confidential information for) Gr. A. ______________________
Mailing Address: (research purposes only) ______________________

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities...

Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. At first registration get the right test by grades for all students.

2. Go to GED at the proper time.

3. Screen teachers more by people in ABE.


5. More organized around what's needed.

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.

Name: (confidential information for) Gr. B.
Mailing Address: (research purposes only)

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities.

Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. Cultural heritage - past and current life style.

2. Learning deficiencies caused by environment and poor quality of previous learning experiences. Lack of how to study for effectiveness.

3. Self esteem and self confidence. One or both may be low and the learner timid and somewhat withdrawn.

4. Motivation appears to be primarily oriented toward vocational interests and is therefore short-term. However, most learners I have had experience with seek a vocation with high monetary rewards.

5. Quality in instructional techniques and curriculum. New or innovative methods and curriculum changes may require changes in the attitudes of the learner.

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.

Name: (confidential information for) ________________

Mailing Address: (research purposes only) ________________

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities....

Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. Urban Adult Basic Education should address itself to (a) Basic education (b) Job placement (c) Evaluation for advancement on that job (d) General education development (e) Total evaluation.

2. Recruitment of minorities in the urban centers. The recruiter should be recruited for this job.

3. Programmed instruction must be utilized to meet the needs of adults in urban centers.

4. Counseling should be an integral part of Adult Basic Education in any setting.

5. Teacher training in the form of what the urban area is like, its inhabitants as well as advantages and disadvantages.

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.
Name: (confidential information for) Gr. B. __________________
Mailing Address: (research purposes only) __________________

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities.... Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. The median existing educational level.

2. The potential employment market and skills need.

3. Life styles and existing values.

4. The median age level, and availability of relevant instructors.

5. Social and economic resources existing within community setting.

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.

Name: (confidential information for) Gr. B. __________________________

Mailing Address: (research purposes only) __________________________

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities... Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.


2. The goodness of man, i.e., #1 - less theory.

3. Andrology - Principles for adult learning.


5. Development of intellectual pattern.

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant
ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.
Name: (confidential information for) Gr. B.
Mailing Address: (research purposes only)

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic
criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult
basic education programs for use in urban Black communities....
Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques,
and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. In my opinion the development of a relevant adult basic education
program for use in urban Black communities should evolve from
the opportunities of employment available locally, the educational
level of the average adult in the community, and in consideration
of the level of motivation of these adults.

2. Other basic criteria which must be considered as I see it is need
for building personal esteem in black adults. Legitimate business
entrepreneurship opportunities might be helpful in increasing a
motivation for education.

3. Basic adult education programs might be built on a community
need for economic self improvement. Organized cooperative
enterprise might serve as a core for relevant basic adult
education.

4. Older adults in the black community maybe more effectively
reached through church sponsored educational activities which
give expression to individual talents. Example: Classes in
ceramics, the products being sold in community store fronts.

5. Basic adult education in urban black communities must relate to
the life style of blacks in urban communities who are trying to
orient their rural backgrounds to an urban inner-city culture.

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.

Name: (confidential information for) __________
Mailing Address: (research purposes only) __________________________

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities...

Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. The formulation of a broad organized philosophy, objectives, policies, and procedures for program development in the area of adult basic education.

2. The total involvement of clientele to be served when formulating, deciding and establishing objectives and priorities to meet the needs of the target group.

3. The organization and maintenance of a planning and evaluation committee composed of clientele the program will serve in order to provide for a high degree of flexibility in the program.

4. The adult basic education program should be based on genuinely life-centered activities in which the participant has been involved or will be involved.

5. The program, administrative personnel, and teachers must be flexible in their attempt to satisfy individual needs, concerns, and problems.

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.

Name: (confidential information for) Gr. B. ______________________

Mailing Address: (research purposes only) ______________________

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities.... Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. What is the academic level of the basic population you are serving?

2. What security measures are built into the program to prevent frustrations and self defeat.

3. To what degree are you proposing to take the programs where the participants are located?

4. Exploration of new occupations so that this new training will be meaningful.

5. As a part of the ABE program, will Counselors be used eg. in the role of buffers and will staff be re-oriented periodically to make the program relevant?

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.
Name: (confidential information for) Gr. B. ___________________
Mailing Address: (research purposes only) ___________________

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities.... Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. Survey of target population:
(a) educational level, (b) economic status, (c) measure of employable skills, (d) learning potential, (e) physical limitations.

2. Survey of facilities:
(a) location of possible centers, (b) availability of teaching materials and equipment, (c) accessibility of centers to target populations.

3. Staffing of program:
(a) teachers skilled in handling interpersonal relations, (b) teachers who are able to teach undereducated adults as experienced adults and not as children.

4. In-service for involved personnel (teachers, administrators, social workers, etc.).

5. Realistic evaluations of program, process and product.

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.

Name: (confidential information for) Gr. B.________________

Mailing Address: (research purposes only) ________________________________

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities. . .

Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. The administrative and teaching staff must be Black, urban-oriented, academically sophisticated and street-wise.

2. The Black administrator must have absolute control of the program, especially the budget, personnel, curriculum and facilities.

3. The curriculum must be Black urban-oriented and subject to continuous modification.

4. A differential staffing pattern that has a minimum of so-called professionals (M. Ed., M. A. or Ph. D.), supported by semi-professionals (2 years of college or more) further supported by paraprofessionals (less than two years of college).

5. A career ladder must be an integral part of the institution's staffing pattern.

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.

Name: (confidential information for) Gr. B.___________________

Mailing Address: (research purposes only) ___________________________

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities...

Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. Significant consideration should be given to the problem inherent in the urban polity itself. These include such inequities as inadequate housing, exorbitant pricing in many low-income areas, unemployment or unsteady employment, misrepresentation or non-representation in political spheres. All these problems and more should be considered.

2. Attention should be focused on the personal preparation of each participant in the program. Each person should be taken at whatever stage he enters the program (this includes his psychological, social, cultural, economic, etc., background). This differentiation of personality at the beginning will enable the trainer to see how much progress each person has made so far.

3. Laboratory experiences should be the rule rather than the exception in adult basic education programs. The practical knowledge and exposure that can be obtained from viewing an actual experience cannot be surpassed by textbook-lecture seminars.

4. Every effort should be expended to elicit personal beliefs from the participants themselves. Students actually are great teachers of each other. Also, verbalizing ideas makes them more significant for the presenter himself as well as for the listener.

5. At every instance, whenever there is a chance to capitalize on contributions, etc., from the Black community, they should be taken advantage of and discussed thoroughly.

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.

Name: (confidential information for) Gr. C. _______________________________________

Mailing Address: (research purposes only) _______________________________________

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities. . . .

Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. The program developed must lead directly to a clearly identified result. That is, if the program is designed to prepare people for employment, then there must be adequate provision to guarantee that employment will follow for all those who satisfy the criteria for successful completion of the course.

2. Examples used in all instruction through the high school level must be drawn from the life experiences of the students. English, math, biology, science, and government all impinge on the life of the urban black ABE student and examples drawn from this experience are more likely to be effective than those from other settings.

3. The educational program must contain stories and illustrations which teach the values of thrift, punctuality, good nutrition, social skills, and related topics which enable a black worker to succeed in a society in which bureaucratic skills are required of all workers.

4. The teacher has the responsibility of showing how the content being taught is related to a need which the student acknowledges. The teaching of abstract ideas is perhaps best done by beginning with very concrete examples.

5. For the majority of ABE students now in classes, the goal of a GED Certificate may not be a particularly useful one. Instead, for a large proportion of these students it is unlikely that employment is likely to be possible. Accordingly, for the majority of students the curriculum should be geared to increasing their
5. survival skills, parent skills, buying skills, health knowledge and skills and the like rather than to meeting the requirements of an external examination.

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.
Name: (confidential information for) Gr. C. ______________________
Mailing Address: (research purposes only) ______________________

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities.... Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. The personal needs of potential participants must be known for the specific community to be served.

2. Techniques for the assessment of individuals' skill development, etc., must be at hand.

3. Materials and techniques for responding to assessed (individually) must be available.

4. Skilled teachers must be available to see that assessment information is translated to sensible instruction for individuals.

5. Follow-up must be provided - perhaps "trouble shooting" - to insure that participants don't get hung up after the program has been completed.

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.

Name: (confidential information for) Gr. C. _______________________
Mailing Address: (research purposes only) _______________________

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities...

Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. Students should participate in planning, organization, curriculum development and operation of the school.

2. Careful study of the educational needs of the people concerned should be made with the people participating and the results discussed and interpreted by the people and the teachers in groups.

3. Teachers should be selected in terms of their commitment to helping people, their understanding of adults and their knowledge of adult learning without regard for traditional requirements for certification.

4. Curriculum patterns should be developed to meet each situation without prescribed content or requirements and completion and/or graduation should be on the basis of the educational growth of students in their own terms without regard for courses completed or credits obtained or examinations passed.

5. All programs should be informal in atmosphere and procedure, abandoning all aspects of "school". All modern facilities for learning should be available i.e. audio and visual devices, computer learning, etc., etc.

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.

Name: (confidential information for) Gr. C. ______________
Mailing Address: (research purposes only) ____________________

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities...

Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. The ABE program should be a shared planning endeavor by those likely participants and those responsible for program development, easily accessible and available to all.

2. A careful assessment of the subculture should be conducted with particular attention given to ethnic group values and aspirations.

3. Positive feedback must be provided with provisions for adequate rewards and reinforcement to all participants.

4. The program must be authentic; i.e. recognition must be given to dealing with real people, who have real problems and are seeking real answers.

5. A careful evaluation of program should be made and changes incorporated in light of this evaluation.

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.

Name: (confidential information for) Gr. C.

Mailing Address: (research purposes only)

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities...

Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. Student participation in goal setting.

2. Learning climate which produces mutual trust.

3. Program materials relevant to student's problems and environment.

4. Shared decision making throughout learning experience.

5. Continuing feedback from students for evaluation purposes.

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.

Name: (confidential information for) Gr. C. _______________________
Mailing Address: (research purposes only) ________________________

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities. ...

Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. Personnel - a) concerned, untiring, persuasive administrators, b) concerned, supportive, creative, competent teachers.

2. Money - Enough to pay competent personnel and provide adequate facilities and materials, both hardware and software.

3. Location - Multiple locations easily accessible to students, and functioning at times most convenient for the students.

4. Interdependency with a) other local, state, and national government agencies to interrelate programs, b) such private agencies (churches-group clubs, etc.) which are or could become primary allegiance groups for prospective students, c) employees (industrial, governmental, service, etc.) who are sources of non-dead-end jobs.

5. Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.

Name: (confidential information for) Gr. C. ________________________

Mailing Address: (research purposes only) ______________________

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities. . . . Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. Recruitment should be realistic -- it should neither under promise nor over promise results to the potential clientele.

2. The program must address itself to the social, cultural, and psychological deficiencies of the clientele as well as the academic deficiencies.

3. The program should be staffed by administrators, teachers, and counselors who are empathetic toward the students, flexible in approach and method, and are highly competent in their respective jobs.

4. Besides the pragmatic goals of increased basic skills, and job preparation of job upgrading, the program should strive to increase many individual living skills -- those needed to give personal satisfaction in living, those leading to more effective membership in the family, the community and as a citizen of the community and the world.

5. The program should contain built-in evaluation procedures so that it can be constantly improved and frequently revised.

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.

Name: (confidential information for) ____________________________ Gr. C.

Mailing Address: (research purposes only) ____________________________

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities.... Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. Is the program individualized so as to meet the specific needs and wants of hard-to-reach, hard-to-retain subjects?

2. Is the program based on incentives grounded in the here and now? (Incentives based on subject's perception of being such)?

3. Is the program integrated with related services programs to meet the gestalt of subject personal and family needs and wants?

4. Is the program actively involving paid professionals in adult basic education and actively involving many, many trained volunteers? (Manpower base and change agent/student ratio?)

5. Is the program operated by people-oriented leaders, highly motivated, and are they easily modeled by subject population? The sense of similarity with and identity for subjects (Black, etc.)

Please make any comments you have below.
Questionnaire On Basic Criteria Needed to Develop Relevant ABE Programs For Use in Urban Black Communities

Round one of the Delph Technique for expert forecasting.

Name: (confidential information for) Gr. C. ________________________________

Mailing Address: (research purposes only) ________________________________

In my opinion the following five (5) criteria are basic criteria that must be considered in order to develop relevant adult basic education programs for use in urban Black communities. . . .

Please consider your own personal beliefs, methods, techniques, and devices when defining and listing criteria.

1. Are potential black students and influential blacks in the community involved in the planning?

2. Is the community surveyed to determine crucial problems from which educational need is then derived?

3. Do program and instructional objectives reflect a complete and accurate analysis of the educational need revealed in (2) above?

4. Is evaluation conducted continuously at both the program and instructional levels.

5. Is the program operated (including recruitment, administration, counseling, teaching, evaluation, etc.) by those with whom the urban black may identify?

Please make any comments you have below.
APPENDIX 18

The Development of the Recommended Criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Clustering of Original Criterion Statements</th>
<th>Expert Votes Received</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gr. A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Locate the facility in the Black Community.</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Total community participation from planning through instruction and evaluation.</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Acquire teachers that express a genuine interest in the Black ABE student.</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Strive for a learning climate of mutual trust.</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Plan learning centers with existing agencies.</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Use the median existing education level while planning instructional phase of the program.</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Use the ABE participants as recruiters.</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. The social and economic resources existing in the Black community should guide program organization.</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. The administrators and teachers must be Black with real control of program in hands of Black individual.</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. The instruction must be kept on the students level.</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. The program should not be dependent on the day program for existence.</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. The facility should be made attractive using adult ideas for decoration... keep as modern as possible.</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX 18 (cont)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Expert Votes Received</th>
<th>Gr, A.</th>
<th>Gr, B.</th>
<th>Gr, C.</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13. City transportation should be considered when location plans are being made.</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. The curriculum must be Black oriented.</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. The median age level of community residents should be considered.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Have students participate in goal setting for individual classes and the total program.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. The learning climate must be one of mutual trust.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Continuing student feedback for evaluation is a must.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Programmed instruction should be used.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Test the adults before assigning classes.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. Offer the program on a year round basis.</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. Staff meetings must include students.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. Use a differentiated staffing pattern with a minimum of professionals (M. A., Ph. D., Ed. D.)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. Institute a career ladder for staff.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25. Staff must be academically sophisticated and street-wise.</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26. Set program for potential employment market.</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27. Counseling must be a part of the program.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX 18 (cont)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Expert Votes Received</th>
<th>Gr. A</th>
<th>Gr. B</th>
<th>Gr. C</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>28. Recruit Black community people for jobs as student recruiters.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29. ABE programs must be based on life-centered activities.</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30. Conduct evaluation continuously.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31. Survey the community to determine crucial problem areas of educational need.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32. Get Black college students and influential Black leaders involved in the program.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33. Individualize the program to meet specific needs of hard to reach students.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34. Integrate program with related service programs of area.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35. Program must be administered by oriented staff members and volunteers.</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36. Recruit realistically—-should neither under promise nor over promise potential clientele.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37. Program must address social, educational and psychological deficiencies of clientele... build personal esteem.</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38. Set pragramatic goals to increase basic skills, and job preparation or upgrading.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39. Develope techniques for the assessment of the participants.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX 18 (con't)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Expert Votes Received</th>
<th>Gr. A</th>
<th>Gr. B</th>
<th>Gr. C</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>40. Assign &quot;trouble shooter&quot; to uncomplicate program for adults as program moves along.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41. Concerned, persuasive administrators, supportive, creative, competent teachers.</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42. Enough money must be on hand to meet bills when they come due.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43. Multiple locations for easy accessibility of students is a must.</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44. Interdependency with local, state, and national governmental agencies is needed to interrelate program offerings.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45. Program must lead directly to clearly identified results.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46. Teach from concrete examples for abstract results.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47. Teach survival skills... parent skills, buying skills, health needs, not requirements of an external examination.</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48. Carefully assess the subculture giving attention to ethnic group values and aspirations; built in trust.</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49. Provide for positive feedback with adequate rewards and reinforcement for all participants.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50. Curriculum pattern should be set for educational growth of students and not requirements for GED or graduation.</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX 18 (con't)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Expert Votes Received</th>
<th>Gr. A.</th>
<th>Gr. B.</th>
<th>Gr. C.</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>51. Informality of total program from people, and instruction to evaluation and replanning.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Eligibles and Enrollments in Federally Supported Adult Education Programs, Fiscal Year 1967

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Administering Agency and Program</th>
<th>Estimated Number of Eligibles</th>
<th>Estimated Enrollments in Adult Education Programs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Department of Defense</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project 100,000</td>
<td>100,000</td>
<td>40,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project Transition</td>
<td>150,000</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Off-Duty Educational Services</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>for Military Personnel</td>
<td>500,000</td>
<td>210,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Department of Health, Education and Welfare</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adult Basic Education</td>
<td>18,220,000</td>
<td>380,838</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vocational and Technical Education</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work Experience and Training</td>
<td>1,326,000</td>
<td>33,400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Work and Training</td>
<td>300,000</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuban Refugee Program</td>
<td>44,000</td>
<td>5,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vocational Rehabilitation</td>
<td>4,000,000</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Department of Labor-HEW</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manpower Development and Training Programs</td>
<td>10,065,000</td>
<td>46,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutional, MDTA for RAR Residents On-the-Job Training, Coupled</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Department of Interior</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bureau of Indian Affairs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adult Education Programs</td>
<td>367,000</td>
<td>25,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment Assistance Programs</td>
<td>367,000</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Department of Justice</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizenship Education and Training</td>
<td>3,088,133</td>
<td>136,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational and Vocational Training for Federal Prisoners</td>
<td>20,000</td>
<td>12,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### APPENDIX 19 (con't)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Administering Agency and Program</th>
<th>Estimated Number of Eligibles</th>
<th>Enrollments in Adult Education Programs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Department of Labor</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concentrated Employment Program</td>
<td>Same as MDTA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operation Mainstream</td>
<td>Same as MDTA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Careers</td>
<td>Same as MDTA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specific Impact</td>
<td>Same as MDTA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neighborhood Youth Corps</td>
<td>2,485,000</td>
<td>12,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Office of Economic Opportunity</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Action Program</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adult Basic Education</td>
<td>11,000,000</td>
<td>50,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indian Training Program</td>
<td>367,000</td>
<td>19,400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Migrant and Seasonal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farm Workers Program</td>
<td>1,800,000</td>
<td>28,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job Corps</td>
<td>(2,485,000)</td>
<td>20,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Veterans Administration</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Veterans Readjustment and Training Program (GI Bill)</td>
<td>4,500,000</td>
<td>4,750</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Dear Mr., Mrs., Miss, Dr.:  

Enclosed please find Round IV of the Delphi Technique. This represents the final results of the research project. If you agree with the consensus reached please disregard column QIV and retain the questionnaire for your information. However, if your opinions have changed; please list those changes under Column IV and return the questionnaire for the minority report. I would greatly appreciate your final reactions to the three questions below. Your opinions, as an expert acquainted with the process from a practical point of view, will add a very important dimension to the completion of my project.

1. Do you feel that Delphi is an acceptable research technique for adult education?

   Yes

2. How do you feel about its practicality?

   Too much time and laborious.

3. Do you feel that Delphi is a reliable technique?

   Not very much,

   Just return this sheet in the enclosed envelope at your earliest convenience.

   Once again, thank you most sincerely for the time and effort contributed toward the finalization of this research.

   Respectfully,

   CEN/cs
   Enclosure (1)  

Charles Nesbitt
Dear Mr., Mrs., Miss, Dr.:

Enclosed please find Round IV of the Delphi Technique. This represents the final results of the research project. If you agree with the consensus reached please disregard column QIV and retain the questionnaire for your information. However, if your opinions have changed; please list those changes under Column IV and return the questionnaire for the minority report. I would greatly appreciate your final reactions to the three questions below. Your opinions, as an expert acquainted with the process from a practical point of view, will add a very important dimension to the completion of my project.

1. Do you feel that Delphi is an acceptable research technique for adult education?

   It is easy to work with and would appear to elicit pertinent facts.

2. How do you feel about its practicality?

   Great

3. Do you feel that Delphi is a reliable technique?

   I am not really qualified to make a judgment as to its reliability - but again judging from my brief exposure, it seems valid.
   
   Just return this sheet in the enclosed envelope at your earliest convenience.

   Once again, thank you most sincerely for the time and effort contributed toward the finalization of this research.

   Respectfully,

CEN/cs
Enclosure (1)      Charles Nesbitt
Dear Mr., Mrs., Miss, Dr.:

Enclosed please find Round IV of the Delphi Technique. This represents the final results of the research project. If you agree with the consensus reached please disregard column QIV and retain the questionnaire for your information. However, if your opinions have changed; please list those changes under Column IV and return the questionnaire for the minority report. I would greatly appreciate your final reactions to the three questions below. Your opinions, as an expert acquainted with the process from a practical point of view, will add a very important dimension to the completion of my project.

1. Do you feel that Delphi is an acceptable research technique for adult education?
   Yes

2. How do you feel about its practicality?
   It is a practical approach which should be instrumented as widely as possible.

3. Do you feel that Delphi is a reliable technique?
   Yes

   Just return this sheet in the enclosed envelope at your earliest convenience.

   Once again, thank you most sincerely for the time and effort contributed toward the finalization of this research.

   Respectfully,

   CEN/cs
   Enclosure (1)            Charles Nesbitt
Dear Mr., Mrs., Miss, Dr.:

Enclosed please find Round IV of the Delphi Technique. This represents the final results of the research project. If you agree with the consensus reached please disregard column QIV and retain the questionnaire for your information. However, if your opinions have changed; please list those changes under Column IV and return the questionnaire for the minority report. I would greatly appreciate your final reactions to the three questions below. Your opinions, as an expert acquainted with the process from a practical point of view, will add a very important dimension to the completion of my project.

1. Do you feel that Delphi is an acceptable research technique for adult education?
   No technique is suited for all purposes. It is acceptable only when used appropriately and with some sophistication.

2. How do you feel about its practicality?
   Inexpensive

3. Do you feel that Delphi is a reliable technique?
   The wording of statements which have ambiguous meanings are almost unavoidably low in reliability.

   Just return this sheet in the enclosed envelope at your earliest convenience.

   Once again, thank you most sincerely for the time and effort contributed toward the finalization of this research.

Respectfully,

CEN/cs
Enclosure (1)  
Charles Nesbitt
Dear Mr., Mrs., Miss, Dr.:

Enclosed please find Round IV of the Delphi Technique. This represents the final results of the research project. If you agree with the consensus reached please disregard column QIV and retain the questionnaire for your information. However, if your opinions have changed; please list those changes under Column IV and return the questionnaire for the minority report. I would greatly appreciate your final reactions to the three questions below. Your opinions, as an expert acquainted with the process from a practical point of view, will add a very important dimension to the completion of my project.

1. Do you feel that Delphi is an acceptable research technique for adult education?

Yes

2. How do you feel about its practicality?

Very practical

3. Do you feel that Delphi is a reliable technique?

Fairly so

Just return this sheet in the enclosed envelope at your earliest convenience.

Once again, thank you most sincerely for the time and effort contributed toward the finalization of this research.

Respectfully,

CEN/cs
Enclosure (1)

Charles Nesbitt
Dear Mr., Mrs., Miss, Dr.:

Enclosed please find Round IV of the Delphi Technique. This represents the final results of the research project. If you agree with the consensus reached please disregard column QIV and retain the questionnaire for your information. However, if your opinions have changed; please list those changes under Column IV and return the questionnaire for the minority report. I would greatly appreciate your final reactions to the three questions below. Your opinions, as an expert acquainted with the process from a practical point of view, will add a very important dimension to the completion of my project.

1. Do you feel that Delphi is an acceptable research technique for adult education?
   I'd like to see your completed paper report before commenting. It is interesting.

2. How do you feel about its practicality?
   It may cause us to rethink some practices for guidelines and generate new research questions.

3. Do you feel that Delphi is a reliable technique?
   I don't fully understand it, but the reactions are based upon professional knowledge of experiences, which says something about it to them. (In this study,)
   Just return this sheet in the enclosed envelope at your earliest convenience.

Once again, thank you most sincerely for the time and effort contributed toward the finalization of this research.

Respectfully,

CEN/cs
Enclosure (1)  
Charles Nesbitt
Dear Mr., Mrs., Miss, Dr.:

Enclosed please find Round IV of the Delphi Technique. This represents the final results of the research project. If you agree with the consensus reached please disregard column QIV and retain the questionnaire for your information. However, if your opinions have changed; please list those changes under Column IV and return the questionnaire for the minority report. I would greatly appreciate your final reactions to the three questions below. Your opinions, as an expert acquainted with the process from a practical point of view, will add a very important dimension to the completion of my project.

1. Do you feel that Delphi is an acceptable research technique for adult education?
   Yes

2. How do you feel about its practicality?
   Don't know

3. Do you feel that Delphi is a reliable technique?
   Yes, if carefully done.

Just return this sheet in the enclosed envelope at your earliest convenience.

Once again, thank you most sincerely for the time and effort contributed toward the finalization of this research.

Respectfully,

CEN/cs
Enclosure (1)  

Charles Nesbitt
Dear Mr., Mrs., Miss, Dr.:

Enclosed please find Round IV of the Delphi Technique. This represents the final results of the research project. If you agree with the consensus reached please disregard column QIV and retain the questionnaire for your information. However, if your opinions have changed; please list those changes under Column IV and return the questionnaire for the minority report. I would greatly appreciate your final reactions to the three questions below. Your opinions, as an expert acquainted with the process from a practical point of view, will add a very important dimension to the completion of my project.

1. Do you feel that Delphi is an acceptable research technique for adult education?
   Yes, for some areas.

2. How do you feel about its practicality?
   Yes - meaning workable?

3. Do you feel that Delphi is a reliable technique?
   To the extent that true consensus was reached, I expect that I would be more likely to deliver my 1st and 2nd rating if asked later than I would the consensus result.
   Just return this sheet in the enclosed envelope at your earliest convenience.

   Once again, thank you most sincerely for the time and effort contributed toward the finalization of this research.

   Respectfully,

CEN/cs
Enclosure (1)  Charles Nesbitt
Dear Mr., Mrs., Miss, Dr.:

Enclosed please find Round IV of the Delphi Technique. This represents the final results of the research project. If you agree with the consensus reached please disregard column QIV and retain the questionnaire for your information. However, if your opinions have changed; please list those changes under Column IV and return the questionnaire for the minority report. I would greatly appreciate your final reactions to the three questions below. Your opinions, as an expert acquainted with the process from a practical point of view, will add a very important dimension to the completion of my project.

1. Do you feel that Delphi is an acceptable research technique for adult education?
   Yes

2. How do you feel about its practicality?
   Useful

3. Do you feel that Delphi is a reliable technique?
   About as much reliability as any research technique that seeks to qualify value judgments.

   Just return this sheet in the enclosed envelope at your earliest convenience.

   Once again, thank you most sincerely for the time and effort contributed toward the finalization of this research.

   Respectfully,

   CEN/cs

   Enclosure (1)  Charles Nesbitt
Dear Mr., Mrs., Miss, Dr.:

Enclosed please find Round IV of the Delphi Technique. This represents the final results of the research project. If you agree with the consensus reached please disregard column QIV and retain the questionnaire for your information. However, if your opinions have changed; please list those changes under Column IV and return the questionnaire for the minority report. I would greatly appreciate your final reactions to the three questions below. Your opinions, as an expert acquainted with the process from a practical point of view, will add a very important dimension to the completion of my project.

1. Do you feel that Delphi is an acceptable research technique for adult education?

   It is extremely limited.

2. How do you feel about its practicality?

   I would think it has very little if any practical value.

3. Do you feel that Delphi is a reliable technique?
   Reliable enough if one is meticulous about the definition of what is under study and deductions and inferences are most carefully limited to the material studied.
   Just return this sheet in the enclosed envelope at your earliest convenience.

   Once again, thank you most sincerely for the time and effort contributed toward the finalization of this research.

   Respectfully,

   CEN/cs
   Enclosure (1)

   Charles Nesbitt
Dear Mr., Mrs., Miss, Dr.:

Enclosed please find Round IV of the Delphi Technique. This represents the final results of the research project. If you agree with the consensus reached please disregard column QIV and retain the questionnaire for your information. However, if your opinions have changed; please list those changes under Column IV and return the questionnaire for the minority report. I would greatly appreciate your final reactions to the three questions below. Your opinions, as an expert acquainted with the process from a practical point of view, will add a very important dimension to the completion of my project.

1. Do you feel that Delphi is an acceptable research technique for adult education?
   
   Yes

2. How do you feel about its practicality?
   
   Seems workable - I suppose the bookkeeping is heavy for the researcher.

3. Do you feel that Delphi is a reliable technique?
   
   Apparently it is not bad, judging from the summary of responses.
   
   Just return this sheet in the enclosed envelope at your earliest convenience.

Once again, thank you most sincerely for the time and effort contributed toward the finalization of this research.

Respectfully,

CEN/cs
Enclosure (1)       Charles Neshitt
Dear Jim:

The data collecting phase of my research has been completed, thanks to you. Now all that remains is for me to get to the serious business of analysis and writing to meet the Graduate School deadline date for dissertation drafts.

I shall always be grateful to you for allowing me to question the ABE adults. I think their input added a very valuable dimension to the research.

Please remember to remind the adults who assisted in the project that I'll keep my promise and report the findings to them when I am finally finished.

Once again thank you.

Sincerely,

Charles Nesbitt
Dear Paul:

The data collecting phase of my research has been completed, thanks to you. Now all that remains is for me to get to the serious business of analysis and writing to meet the Graduate School deadline date for dissertation drafts.

I shall always be grateful to you for allowing me to question the ABE adults. I think their input added a very valuable dimension to the research.

Please remember to remind the adults who assisted in the project that I'll keep my promise and report the findings to them when I am finally finished.

Once again thank you.

Sincerely,

Charles Nesbitt
FOOTNOTES


10. Ibid., p. 415.

11. Ibid., p. 416.


15. Ibid., No. 54, p. 43.

16. Ibid., No. 54, p. 43, second question.

17. Ibid., No. 22, p. 28.

18. Ibid., No. 42, p. 39.


21. Ibid., p. 54.


23. Ibid., p. 9.


25. Ibid., p. 11.

27. Ibid., p. 4.

28. Ibid., p. 4.


REFERENCES

BOOKS


PERIODICALS


16. Miller, Frederick E., "There is a Need for Militancy in Adult Basic Education", Adult Leadership, June 1968, pp. 68-70.


**UNPUBLISHED MATERIALS**


2. Anderson, Jourdon, "A Letter from a freedman to his old master, written as he dictated it", Taken from an anthology entitled, *The Freedman's Book*, L. Maria Child, 1865.


5. Cousins, Frances, "What Do We Mean By Poor?", Speech at the ABE Regional Institute, Wayne State University, July, 1967.


