IMPROVEMENT IN COLLEGE TEACHING THROUGH MORE
EFFECTIVE INTERPRETATION OF LANGUAGE

Dissertation

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree Doctor of Philosophy in the Graduate School of The Ohio State University

By

HARRY SHERIDAN WILDER, B.Sc. in Ed., A.M.

*****

The Ohio State University

1958

Approved by:

[Signature]

Department of Education
PREFACE

This investigation of the extent and the nature of the types of inaccurate and incomplete interpretation of language in the written work of university students developed from the writer's belief that such a study should help to shed light on the nature of this problem and to provide clues as to courses of action which may lead to at least a partial solution. On the basis of the findings, the writer has tried to suggest ways in which a university may assist its students in more effectively interpreting language and thus more clearly communicating ideas.

Appreciation is expressed to authors and publishers for permission to use materials from the books and periodicals quoted.

The writer wishes to acknowledge his obligation to the following members of the faculties of The Ohio State University and of Long Beach State College:

In the departments of the University which are designated below, the members named have been very co-operative in lending student papers as materials for detailed analysis: (Economics) Kendall P. Cochran, Alvin E. Coons, Memo Lovenstein, Robert D. Patton; (History) Robert H. Bremner, Theodore Fisch, Dwight L. Smith; (Sociology) Brewton Berry, Melvin Seeman; (English) J. Raymond Derby, Tom Burns Haber, William H. Hildreth, Robert Joseph Kane; (Education) Wilfred Eberhart, Alan Griffin, Samuel Hubbert Jones, Howard Francis Seely. Especially helpful in this regard have been Professors Lovenstein, Bremner, Berry, Derby, and Seely.
Professors Alan Griffin and Everett Kircher, of the Department of Education of the University, have been most considerate in offering suggestions for Chapters II and III, respectively.

The writer also deeply appreciates the suggestions of Professors Richard Powell (Economics), Donald Popham (History), and Nick Massaro (Sociology), of the staff of Long Beach State College, who have read Chapter V. Professor George R. Cerveny, Chairman of the Division of Arts and Languages, has read Chapters V - VIII and has given the writer the benefit of his experience and his deep discernment.

The writer feels, however, that his greatest indebtedness is to Professor Howard Francis Seely, whose generous and sympathetic guidance during the preparation of this study has been invaluable, and to whom the study is dedicated.

Harry S. Wilder
TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER</th>
<th>THE PROBLEM</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I.</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.</td>
<td>PHILOSOPHIES OF HIGHER EDUCATION</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Idealism</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Realism</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pragmatism</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Criteria Employed</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Application of the Criteria</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III.</td>
<td>MAJOR ASPECTS OF SEMANTICS</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Abstraction</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Symbols</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Contexts</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Uses of to be</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Two-valued Orientation</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Referential and Emotive Language</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Denotation and Connotation</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Metaphor</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Slanting</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.</td>
<td>POSSIBLE CONTRIBUTIONS OF SEMANTICS TO THE</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ATTAINMENT OF THE GOALS OF HIGHER EDUCATION</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Abstraction</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Symbols</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Contexts</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Uses of to be</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

iv
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Two-valued Orientation</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Referential and Emotive Language</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. TECHNIQUES FOR IMPROVING THE TEACHING OF THE SOCIAL STUDIES THROUGH THE INSPECTION OF INTERPRETATIONS</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economics</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of Responses</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary of Findings</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of Responses</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary of Findings</td>
<td>396</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations</td>
<td>415</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sociology</td>
<td>455</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of Responses</td>
<td>455</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary of Findings</td>
<td>520</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations</td>
<td>535</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER I

THE PROBLEM

In the broad panorama of human history, the significance of communication by means of language looms large. Verbal language reflects and interprets man's spiritual and temporal world, and is vital to the existence of an integrated human society.

Language is, it appears, an essential part of almost all thinking. Though there is disagreement about the extent to which thinking is carried on by means of words, the attitude of many students of the subject is expressed by Ballard:

To the question: Can we think without words? we can now give this reply: Yes, if we use other symbols instead. Pushing the question one step further, we ask: Can we think without symbols—without language of any kind, verbal or non-verbal? In other words, is there such a thing as pure thought; thought unsullied by anything that derives either directly or indirectly from the seven senses, or however many senses there are? One thing is certain: thought is not happy working in the void—even if it can work there at all. It has a fondness for sense material. It seems to need something necessary with which to steady itself and maintain its grip on real experience. So it seeks anchorage in percepts and images... If thought can proceed without language it cannot proceed very far.

Most psychologists and individuals concerned with this subject would agree that language is essential for sustained thought, that there is real interdependence between the two.

Language is also the medium for the building of the continuity, based on racial experience, that is an integral part of human life.

---

Man does not perpetually follow the path of instinct, of habit; he builds on what has gone before. By using language for communication, he is able to accumulate and draw upon the experience of the race, analyze it, and transmit it. As Johnson says, language helps to determine the structure of our civilization; it is also the means by which the individual acquires that social structure.²

It seems clear, too, that language plays a vital part in education. If we accept Whitehead's definition of education, "the acquisition of the art of utilization of knowledge," we see that Whitehead has in mind not only a body of knowledge but also the method of science, with its deliberate weighing of evidence and rendering of decisions based on that evidence.³ If education does consist of the transmission of information and techniques and of a method, an attitude, an approach to problems and situations, then the accurate and complete interpretation of language would play a major part in the entire process called education.

It appears, then, that at least reasonably reliable communication by means of language is essential to society; but language, as an instrument of communication, is complex and exhibits weaknesses as well as strengths. Language can be used to inspire and delight, as Shakespeare and Thackeray and Lamb used it in literature; it can be used to explain, as the scientist employs the precise language of mathematics.


And, through unskillful or unscrupulous use, language can be employed to misrepresent, mislead, and confuse.

Intentional misrepresentation may be considered first. This misuse of language is widespread, in peace and in war, though perhaps it is more conspicuous in wartime. In a mild form it may be a part of efforts to "win friends and influence people"—efforts in which one wears a "mask" and attempts to appear what one is not. It often enters into advertising, whether the selling campaign be a department-store sale or a business opportunity. It is almost always a part of persuasion, as in political campaigns, in which the potentialities for trickery in words are, as a rule, fully exploited. Hitler, a modern master of propaganda, has portrayed its nature in vigorous words:

It propaganda is a means, and must be judged from the point of view of the objective it is to serve. It must be suitably shaped so as to assist that objective. It is also clear that the importance of the objective may vary from the standpoint of general necessity and that the essential qualities of propaganda must vary so as to be in harmony with it . . . .

All propaganda should be popular and should adapt its intellectual level to the receptive ability of the least intellectual of those whom it is desired to address. Thus it must sink its mental elevation deeper in proportion to the members of the class whom it has to grip. If—as with propaganda for carrying through a war—the object is to gather a whole nation within its circle of influence, there cannot be enough attention paid to avoidance of too high a level of intellectuality . . . .

The receptive ability of the masses is very limited, their understanding small; on the other hand, they have a great power of forgetting. This being so, all effective propaganda must be confined to very few points which must be brought out in the form of slogans until the very last man is enabled to comprehend what is meant by any slogan. If this principle is sacrificed to the desire to be many-sided, it will dissipate the effectual working of the propaganda, for the people will be unable to digest or
retain the material that is offered them. It will, moreover, weaken and finally cancel its own effectiveness.

It appears that much effective propaganda is characterized by oversimplification; the use of two-valued orientation, which means seeing matters in terms of two values only; and what may euphemistically be called accurate adjustment of statements to the goal sought.

Even when language is not used to misrepresent, it is not invariably an accurate reflection of reality. Through the development of language and the signs which stand for language, man has evolved a way of co-operating with man and of availing himself of the experience of the race. This verbal world stands in relation to the extensional world, which man knows through experience, as a map does to the territory which it is supposed to represent. Often, man, in trying to adapt himself to the extensional world, finds that his verbal maps have misled him. The highway of communication through language has many obstacles; a few of them, as will be seen later in detail, are concerned with the use of symbolism, abstraction, and context. It appears that language can be a veil as well as a pane of glass, and that for guidance in communication we must keep in mind the significance of the extensional world and the correspondence of the verbal to this extensional world.

It has been said that inaccurate interpretation of language can result in confusion. Occasionally, the confusion is merely amusing.

---

More often, as in the example to be cited in a moment, the confusion constitutes a serious intellectual obstacle to clarity and precision of thought and communication. A student in History 403,\(^5\) in answer to a request to "explain and comment on W. B. Phillips's statement that the plantation was a school for the training of the Negro," wrote as follows:

Phillips means that it was easier to teach them practical things than less useful duties. They learned to perform duties expected of them as slaves. There were some early attempts at schooling which were something of failures and so planters kept more to teaching them work ways.

I don't think proper attitudes were created among the Negroes toward schooling but possibly any attitude would be shaded by the status of a slave.

The student, only partly comprehending the material read, has revealed his confusion by his faulty use of abstractions and generalities. If such a failure in intellectual discrimination is detrimental to the individual, it is even more serious when it involves a large number of people. If complex, difficult questions are deceptively oversimplified; if appeals are made to emotion rather than to intelligence; if the means are disregarded in the achievement of the end—then, indeed, incomplete interpretation, on the part of the reader or listener, of language is dangerous for both individual and nation.

Because of the significance of precise verbal communication and because of the difficulty—stemming from the complexity of language—in securing clarity and precision in communication, the writer believes

---

\(^5\)A course given at The Ohio State University in the development of the United States from the beginning of the Revolutionary Era to the end of the Civil War.
that an investigation of the extent and of the types of inaccurate and incomplete interpretation of language is needed. The need for the development of the discipline, skill, and discrimination involved in effective interpretation of language is recognized by Richards when he suggests that studies in interpretation be widely used in schools and colleges and that the teaching of interpretation be broadened into the development of the spirit of free inquiry. Even a study of limited scope should help to shed light on the nature of this problem and to provide clues for courses of action which may lead to at least a partial solution.

In such a study, semantics might well prove to be a useful tool, since it is a discipline that is concerned with the problems of meaning and with analysis of abstraction, figurative language, and context. It is the study of the connection between language and thought, between word and reality.

In this study, while the writer is concerned with the ascertainment of the extent to which the written work of university students exhibits inaccurate and incomplete interpretation of language and the nature of this inaccurate interpretation, he will of necessity be obligated to present instances of what he considers precise and full interpretation. On the basis of these findings, he will try to suggest ways in which a university may assist its students in more accurately interpreting language and thus more effectively communicating ideas.

---

The writer is restricting the problem to higher education; to the areas of the social studies, English, and work in professional education; and to papers written by students for these courses.

In order that the method to be followed in this study may be further clarified, the writer will now outline the steps to be taken in developing the problem.

1. An effort, based on an examination of authoritative studies concerning objectives in higher education, will be made to arrive at the purposes of higher education. This analysis will involve a consideration of three basic philosophies of education and of the statements of objectives of higher education in general. Following this stage, criteria will be selected and applied to the objectives listed, in order to formulate the educational aims to be employed for the purposes of this study. Clarity is essential in the exposition of the goals of education; for these goals will determine, to a large extent, the development of the entire problem.

2. It has already been mentioned that semantics, because of its concern with the nature and uses of words and their relationship to the extensional world, might prove to be a useful tool in an investigation of the problems involved in the interpretation of language. Before a discussion of ways in which this discipline may assist in the promotion of the objectives of higher education may be undertaken, it is necessary to clarify the significance of the term. The writer, therefore, will include an analysis of such significant and pertinent phases of semantics as figurative language, symbolism, abstraction, and context.
3. The next step will consist of a discussion of ways in which semantics may assist in promoting the objectives of education. It will be based on the implications of the semantic concepts considered in the preceding steps for the aims of education arrived at in steps 1 and 2.

4. In the fourth portion of the study, the writer will gather, with the assistance of professors in the departments of the social studies, English, and professional education, a large number of examples of students' writing in which interpretation has been called for. The interpretations found in this student work will be analyzed on the basis of abstraction, symbols, contexts, uses of to be, two-valued orientation, and referential and emotive language.

5. In the fifth portion will be presented a recapitulation of the findings made in the preceding step.

6. A presentation of suggested techniques for improving the teaching of the three areas under consideration will follow. These suggested procedures will be based on the results of the survey of students' interpretations.

7. The final step will consist of a summary of preceding materials, general conclusions regarding them, and suggestions for further investigation and study.
CHAPTER II

ARRIVING AT THE PURPOSES OF HIGHER EDUCATION

In this chapter, the writer proposes to consider three current philosophies of education and the aims implied in them for higher education; to evaluate these objectives in the light of Dewey's criteria; and, on the basis of the philosophical positions, the aims, and the evaluations, to arrive at a statement of purposes for higher education which will serve as a basis for this study.

It may be advantageous to approach this consideration of the purposes of higher education from the standpoint of philosophy, for philosophy is man's persistent, reasoned effort to answer the questions how and why. It is, as Finney points out in a workable and comprehensive definition, a guide, of which the goals are an integral part:

It [philosophy] is that careful, critical, systematic work of the intellect in the formulation of belief, with the aim of making them represent the highest degree of probability, in the face of the fact that adequate data are not obtainable for strictly demonstrable conclusions.¹

In education, as in other areas of human effort and thought, philosophy is of major significance in the respects mentioned by Finney. Because there has been something less than unanimity in the formulation of educational philosophy, and because emphasis on the purposes of education shifts with changes in philosophical outlook, it is, in the

opinion of the present writer, necessary to consider briefly three major educational philosophies: Idealism, Realism, and Pragmatism.

In all these philosophies, there are variations and divergences in interpretation. In the present study, the writer, taking this fact into account, has been more concerned with showing the fundamental premises of these three philosophies than with amplifying or magnifying differences.

In the first portion of the chapter, the following approach will be used for each of the philosophies: first, its basic tenets will be discussed; second, the conception of education inherent in the philosophy will be indicated; and third, the educational aims implicit in and derived from the basic premises and the concepts of education will be enumerated.

In the discussion of Idealism, it may be well to turn first to the significant problem of the nature of reality, a topic with which, as Wahlquist observes, all philosophic schools are concerned. To the idealist, true, final reality is spiritual, beyond the physical world. Thus the idealist lives, as Lodge phrases it, "in the world of mind or spirit." This changeless world is the realm of concepts and universals. In this realm, in which righteousness and justice, for

---


instance, have a true existence, purpose and order are evident, says the idealist, in the moral and spiritual realm as well as in the physical.\(^5\)

If reality is outside the realm of immediate experience, then as the idealist sees it, understanding of and insight into reality cannot come through the physical senses. Instead, the speculation of reason, which shapes and arranges the confusing indications of the senses, provides the method for arriving at the truth. The highest form of such mental or spiritual vision is intuition.\(^6\) It will be noted that according to the idealist, values are not created; instead, pre-existent values are discovered.\(^7\)

For the idealist, the test of truth lies chiefly in the extent of coherence in the ideas involved. In a true statement, ideas about any aspect of experience support each other. The truth is found, as Brubacher sees it,

\[\text{in the correspondence or consistency of different experiences with each other. If the experiences of numerous people or the varied experiences of a single person tend to support the same conclusion, consistency will have here a valuable aid to verification.}\] \(^8\)

Second, truth is systematic; to be true, ideas must cause the reader or the listener to be aware of the relationship of the object, idea, or

\(^5\)Wahlquist, op. cit., p. 49.


\(^7\)Wahlquist, op. cit., p. 49.

problem to the whole. Horne emphasizes the idealistic concept of unity as a touchstone of truth when he remarks, "The body and the different functions of the mind all constitute one unity."  

Another basic premise of Idealism is the priority of the self. The individual mind, as Horne emphasizes, is "a conscious centre of existence; it is a private self; it is a responsible being; it is a source of aesthetic enjoyment." Development—self-cultivation—therefore, is essential: The individual, through assimilation of the experience of the race, will come to realize the reliability and authority in such lessons of the past as the need for unselfishness and intelligence. This influence of the past over the individual is desirable, Horne contends; he suggests as a synthesizing formula for individuality and authority that "authority is to be upheld when its principles are true; individuality is to be asserted against false propositions, whether in theory or practice."

Having briefly summarized a few of the major premises of Idealism, the writer now turns to the idealistic concept of education.

---


12 Ibid., p. 420.

13 Loc. cit.
The idealistic viewpoint is clearly and tersely stated, it is
believed, in Horne's definition of the term:

   Education is the eternal process of superior adjust-
   ment of the physically and mentally developed, free,
   conscious human being to God, as manifested in the
   intellectual, emotional, and volitional environment of
   man.14

   In view of the major tenets of Idealism, and of the idealist's
concept of education, it is not surprising that the educational
objectives listed below stress the development of the individual. It
will be noted, however, that social development and responsibility
are also emphasized. The objectives may be stated as follows:

1. To provide for self-development to the limit of the
   capacity of the individual

2. To provide for the development and cultivation of
   the intellectual powers through the productive and
   evocative analysis of ideas, both contemporary and
   those inherited from the past

3. To assist in the development of competent citizen-
   ship through dialectical discussion

4. To help the individual to think of the universe as
   primarily of the nature of mind, in some cases as
   spiritual

One of the basic premises in Realism, the second of the philosop-
phies, is known as the principle of independence and refers to the
objectivity of the external world. The realist maintains that the
reality of external objects is independent of human thought or know-

14Herman Harrel Horne. The Philosophy of Education. Revised
J. Donald Butler, Four Philosophies and Their Practice in Education
ledge, that the act of perception does not, in itself, result in or constitute reality.\textsuperscript{15} The realist holds that his belief in the doctrines of "independent reals" is supported by science and by common sense\textsuperscript{16}—a contention which may gain added significance during the discussion of the nature of knowledge and the problem of truth. Thus the realist can say with Breed,

\begin{quote}
Transcending the experience of any given moment is an external world . . . elements of which enter and leave this experience, supplying the original content of mental life.\textsuperscript{17}
\end{quote}

The realist contends, then, that an object may exist without being known, that things may exist independently of our knowledge processes. In the realist's concept of the nature of knowledge is found another major premise of the philosophy.

For the realist, becoming known is an event that happens to things assumed to exist prior to and independently of the act of knowing. According to this interpretation, knowing is a process mediating an external relation between an organism and another existent.\textsuperscript{18}

Here is found a fundamental difference between the realist and the pragmatist. The realist believes that through thought man discovers

\begin{flushright}

\textsuperscript{16}Loc. cit.

\textsuperscript{17}Ibid., p. 217.

\end{flushright}
ideas or objects; the pragmatist believes, as will be seen, that the act of thinking creates them.

In considering the problem of truth, the realist defines the term as "confirmed natural knowledge."\(^{19}\) Contending that the test of truth is correspondence of idea to reality, many realists define truth as Breed does: "Reality is; truth is a quality of an idea or proposition referring to reality."\(^{20}\) That which actually exists, then, is reality, according to the realist; a statement about what exists may be truth.\(^{21}\) The truth of an idea depends upon the relationship between its intent and its realization.\(^{22}\) Breed summarizes the position of many realists in this matter: "It [Realism] accepts the general experience approach of philosophers just as Pragmatism does, but holds that knowledge consists, first, in the prehension of pre-existant entities and, second, in the discovery of their inter-relationships."\(^{23}\)

The stability of truth is not unqualifiedly asserted, however: In this matter, the realist appears to attempt to take a middle course. He advises against excessive skepticism.\(^{24}\) On the contrary, as he sees

\(^{19}\) Frederick S. Breed, *Education and the New Realism*, p. 116.

\(^{20}\) Ibid., p. 51.

\(^{21}\) Brubacher, *op. cit.*, p. 56.

\(^{22}\) Frederick S. Breed, *Education and the New Realism*, p. 35.

\(^{23}\) Ibid., p. 207.

\(^{24}\) Ibid., p. 221.
it, "That which bears the brand of truth today may relinquish it to-morrow; but until tomorrow it must serve as the standard of belief."25 Of the many beliefs in which there is much certainty, the majority are in the realm of science.26

This attitude toward the findings of science is, perhaps, to be expected since, as Bagley remarks, Realism is "a philosophy which has its source in the methods and findings of scientific inquiry."27 It may also be worthy of note that Breed considers philosophy, which uses the methods and materials of science, as continuous with science rather than separate from it, and that he believes that philosophy, adapting the tools of logistics and semantics to its purposes, is engaged in the task of generalization and synthesis of the facts reported by science.28 In the opinion of the present writer, then, Lodge emphasizes one of the major tenets of Realism when he asserts that "reality, for the modern realist, is, roughly, the content of the physical sciences."29

The realist's conception of education may serve here to link

25Loc. cit.

26Ibid., p. 220.


29Lodge, op. cit., p. 6.
the preceding summary and the enumeration of the implied objectives for higher education. As Breed sees it, education is "not a process of reconstructing the universe, but a process of teaching humans how to make their way in it. It is guidance through discovery." In the light of this concept of education, one may well expect that the educational objectives of Realism will stress a balance between content and method, with the ultimate goal being the satisfactory adjustment of the individual to reality. These objectives, then, may be listed as follows:

1. To transmit the verified knowledge of the race
2. To train students carefully in the use of logical thought
3. To maintain a balanced emphasis on method and on material
4. To strive for an adjustment between freedom and authority which includes respect for both individuality and social demands
5. To discipline the individual really to accommodate himself to those conditions and laws not subject to change and to exercise his productive faculties on the modifiable factors in the physical and human environment
6. To impart an understanding of life as dualistically made up both of mind and of matter, or— in the case of the naturalistic realist— of dynamically conceived matter alone

In the third educational philosophy, Pragmatism, the stress which the experimentalist, or pragmatist, places upon experience

---

31 In this study, pragmatism and experimentalism are used interchangeably.
is shown in Kilpatrick's listing of three major concepts in the philosophy:

The conception... that ideas mean only their consequences in experience:... that experience... is essentially social in origin and predominantly social in purpose; and... that we find out what to expect in life by studying experimentally the uniformities within experience. 

Thus experience is functional in that it provides valuable background and information to help the individual in making adjustments between himself and his environment.

It is, perhaps, to be expected that the pragmatist finds the test of truth in experience. According to this philosophy, one reaches the truth by trying hypotheses; if the desired result ensues, then one has come as near the truth as is possible for man. It may also be noted that to the pragmatist, truth is subject to close scrutiny when it is put to use in a situation in which it did not originate. The pragmatist, then, sees truth as based on experience and as restricted in scope. As Childs puts it,

Ideas, conceptions, are possible modes of response to situations of difficulty. They are tested by the consequences to which they lead. The true is the verified.

---


33 Demiaskevitch, op. cit., p. 112.

34 Wahlquist, op. cit., p. 71.

35 Ibid., p. 73.
Not truth but truths is the concern of the experimentalist. Truths are the opinions, the beliefs, the hypotheses which have been verified in experience. This restriction of truth to a given experience is in direct contrast to the inevitability and changelessness that the idealist attributes to truth.

The pragmatic concept of experience interacting experimentally with the environment has, according to Dewey and Childs, the scientific method as its basis. The method of science, however, has been broadened and generalized to cover all phases of life. The pragmatist's amplification is based on the belief that in living, the individual makes use of a great social inheritance. As he observes aspects of life which seem less pleasing and satisfactory than others, he may think of and put into practice ways of improving these situations. This process will result, says the pragmatist, in the building of ideals of a desirable way of life and a better understanding of ways to approach the attainment of these ideals.

In view of the preceding tenets, it is not surprising that the pragmatist refuses to go beyond the actualities of human experience.

---


He contends that there is no certainty beyond the realm of human experience and that change rules all. Childs phrases the pragmatist's attitude on this matter in a series of questions:

If one proclaims that the experimental method is the all-inclusive method, does he not in so doing express a belief that the general nature of the world is such that this one method is adequate to discover all important meanings discoverable by any valid method? Is this not equivalent to saying that experimental procedures are our ultimate resource in each and every realm where we are concerned to gain knowledge of and control of experience? Does not this position also tend to imply that there is no transemperical reality? That supernaturalisms of all sorts are untenable? That it is both useless and unnecessary to appeal to something above and beyond experience? Is it not also implied that no matter how emotionally invigorating immediate mystical experience can be, it can contribute nothing to be taken reliably as knowledge about the nature of existence.

The pragmatic concept of education, to which we may turn before listing the aims, emphasizes, as may be expected, the social values and consequences of education, as well as the values clarified by education, which the individual members of society share:

Education, as we conceive it, is a process of social interaction carried on in behalf of consequences which are themselves social—that is, it includes interactions between persons and includes shared values.

With the preceding summary of several major aspects of the

---

40 John L. Childs, Education and the Philosophy of Experimentalism, p. 46.
experimentalist philosophy and the concept of education in mind, we may now consider the educational aims implied in them. These aims may be listed as follows:

1. To offer as many opportunities as possible for learning through doing and for social participation

2. To assist students to develop skill in the use of the scientific method as the exclusively reliable road to progress

3. Through cultivating a disposition for co-operative inquiry, to develop character based on such qualities as integrity, self-discipline, and tolerance

4. To cultivate an understanding of the world as essentially naturalistic and empirical

Having briefly summarized some of the major premises of three educational philosophies and the educational aims implied in each, the writer now proposes to turn to the second major step in the chapter: the evaluation of these aims. The first part of this procedure will be to eliminate whatever duplication appears to exist among the aims as they are listed above.

It may be well at this point to state the writer's point of view concerning the formulating of composite aims: With respect to philosophical assumptions and ultimate ends among the three philosophies under consideration, there is irreconcilability, and no composites appear possible. With respect to procedure, however, their action is almost indistinguishable. In other words, these philosophies appear to show commonness in the field of action. (This last point of view will be further discussed, from a slightly different standpoint, in connection with the criteria selected for application.)
On this ground, then, it seems expedient to proceed with the discussion of aims which seem to overlap or duplicate each other. The writer believes that there are two instances of such duplication.

The first instance concerns the development of the power of logical thought. The three objectives are as follows:

**Idealism**

To provide for the development and cultivation of the intellectual powers through the consideration and analysis of ideas, both contemporary and those inherited from the past.

The goal as stated above may include the following contributory objectives: to stimulate an understanding of the cultural heritage and to help students realize the nature and extent of the problems of the present.

**Realism**

To train students carefully in the use of logical thought.

Because Realism has its roots in the principles and procedures of science, it is to be expected that, to the realist, logical thinking means the method of analysis defined by Breed as "a process of probing into problematic situations."\(^{12}\)

**Pragmatism**

To assist students to develop skill in the use of the scientific method as the exclusive road to progress.

---

As Dewey insists,

Thinking includes all of these steps,—the sense of a problem, the observation of conditions, the formation and rational elaboration of a suggested conclusion, and the active experimental testing. While all thinking results in knowledge, ultimately the whole of knowledge is subordinate to its use in thinking.\textsuperscript{43}

In all three aims is stressed the idea of developing the power to think clearly, accurately, precisely. Though the methods vary, the idea of critical thought is basic. It is what Whitehead calls "the central task of education . . . the evocation of curiosity of judgment, of the power of mastering a complicated tangle of circumstances, the use of theory in giving foresight in special cases."\textsuperscript{44}

The goal might be stated in the following manner:

TO ASSIST STUDENTS TO DEVELOP SKILL IN THE USE OF LOGICAL THOUGHT

The second example of duplication concerns the concept of matter. The three aims involved are as follows:

\textbf{Idealism}

To help the individual to think of the universe as primarily of the nature of mind, in some cases as spiritual

This aim stresses the idealist's conception of reality as being beyond the physical environment and of being of the nature of


\textsuperscript{44} Whitehead, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 17.
mind. The real world is that of mind. The spiritual is "the divine force existing apart from the material universe." The aim, then, stresses a point of view basic to Idealism: "the conclusion that the universe is an expression of intelligence and will, that the enduring substance of the world is of the nature of mind, that the material is explained by the mental."

Realism

To impart an understanding of life as dualistically made up both of mind and of matter, or--in the case of the naturalistic realist--of dynamically conceived matter alone

The neorealist maintains that an object is directly presented to consciousness. The naturalistic realist contends that an object experienced in consciousness is represented; it is "numerically distinct from the physical existent" causing the object perceived in consciousness.

Pragmatism

To cultivate an understanding of the world as essentially naturalistic and empirical

The pragmatist's statement here is laconic: "Experience knows

---

45 Wahlquist, op. cit., p. 47.
47 Butler, op. cit., p. 278.
48 Ibid., p. 299.
no division between human concerns and a purely mechanical physical world." The only road to knowledge lies through experience.

As each of these goals involves giving the student an understanding of the nature of matter, the goal might be expressed as follows:

TO IMPART AN UNDERSTANDING OF THE NATURE OF MIND AND MATTER

With the exception of these two groups, the aims appear to show neither duplication nor mutual exclusion.

Before proceeding to a discussion of the criteria to be applied, it may be advantageous to present a composite list of the educational aims which have been considered. This list is as follows:

**Idealism**

1. To provide for self-development to the limits of the capacity of the individual

2. To assist in the development of competent citizenship through dialectical discussion

**Realism**

1. To transmit the verified knowledge of the race

2. To maintain a balanced emphasis on method and material

3. To strive for an adjustment between freedom and authority which includes respect for both individuality and social demands

4. To discipline the individual really to accommodate himself to those conditions and laws not subject to change and to exercise his productive faculties on the modifiable factors in the physical and human environment

---

Pragmatism

1. To offer as many opportunities as possible for learning through doing and for social participation

2. Through cultivating a disposition for co-operative inquiry, to develop character based on such qualities as integrity, self-discipline, and tolerance

The two composite aims are as follows:

1. To assist students to develop skill in the use of logical thought

2. To impart an understanding of the nature of mind and matter

At this point, the writer believes that it would be helpful and advantageous to state the reasons for the selection of the criteria to be employed: those listed by Dewey in Democracy and Education.

In the first place, the present writer agrees with Russell's belief that the relationships between the high-order abstractions of philosophy are largely psychological rather than logical—that a way of life or line of action is not logically derivable from high-order abstractions. Such abstract words are general in nature and are subject to interpretation, just as the broad rules of ethics are. In writing on this matter, Russell maintains that the value of philosophy lies in the enriching of the mind rather than in its "practicality," and that probably the chief value of philosophy is in "the greatness of the objects which it contemplates and the freedom from narrow and personal aims resulting from this contemplation."  

Second, it appears to the present writer that no philosophy is directive in practical enterprises unless it is interpreted doctrinally. As Edman phrases it,

Philosophers have yearned to make a transcript of reality and speak eternal truths. They have longed to provide the philosopher's stone and cure all human ills. Not the philosopher's stone but the philosopher's vision is his contribution; his technique and his logic are simply the discipline that makes that vision ordered and responsible.51

Let us turn now to a more specific consideration of the reasons for selecting Dewey's criteria. First, Dewey's recommendations are generally consistent with those made by educational theorists and philosophers since the time of the Greeks. In Dewey's proposals, moreover, may be found duplication of many of the recommendations of idealism as expressed by Emerson, and of a large number of the ethical attitudes set forth in Christianity. Owing to accidents of circumstance, however, Dewey has concerned himself more with problems of education than has any other philosopher of our time. Probably because of this, the present writer feels himself more conversant with Dewey's educational philosophy than with any other. For this reason, the present writer feels free to follow Dewey's recommendations without any necessary commitment to the formal aspects of pragmatism. Finally, it may be noted that there is no item in the list of criteria which is a slave to pragmatism; and that criteria eclectically derived by the present writer from the three

philosophies under consideration would lack the acceptability of those formulated by a recognized authority in the field.

The criteria, then, as stated by Dewey, are as follows:

1. The aim set up must be an outgrowth of existing conditions. It must be based on a consideration of what is already going on; upon the resources and difficulties of the situation.

2. An aim ... must be flexible; it must be capable of alteration to meet circumstances.

3. The aim must always represent a freeing of activities. The term end in view is suggestive, for it puts before the mind the termination or conclusion of some process. The only way we can define an activity is by putting before ourselves the objects in which it terminates.

4. An educational aim must be founded upon the intrinsic activities and needs (including original instinct and acquired habit) of the given individual to be educated.

5. An aim must be capable of translation into a method of co-operating with the activities of those undergoing instruction. It must suggest the kind of environment needed to liberate and to organize their capacities.

6. A truly general aim broadens the outlook; it stimulates one to take more consequences (connections) into account. This means a wider and more flexible observation of means.

[We understand] the term general or comprehensive aim simply in the sense of a broad survey of the field of present activities. 52

Having listed the criteria, we may now turn to the evaluation. Two items of procedure should be mentioned here. First, the writer is employing a phrasal summary of each of the criteria just mentioned.

---

52 John Dewey, Democracy and Education, pp. 121-128, passim.
The criteria, thus summarized, are as follows:

1. Relevance to existing conditions
2. Flexibility
3. Freeing of activities
4. Foundation upon the student's interests and activities
5. Translation into a method of co-operation with activities
6. Comprehensiveness

Second, in listing the aims, the writer has placed, immediately after each of them, a brief comment about the meaning and nature of the aim.

The first educational aim to be considered is the following:

I. TO PROVIDE FOR SELF-DEVELOPMENT TO THE LIMIT OF THE CAPACITY OF THE INDIVIDUAL

Such development involves the gradual realization of the self through the continuous achieving of new insights. By means of realization of his nature and development of his possibilities, the individual will become "a rounded and complete person, integer vitae."

Relevance to existing conditions. As Cole states, "Personality and culture are poles of the same social axis." Change--growth or

---

53 Butler, op. cit., p. 318.
decline—is a condition of life. The change or growth, however, should be guided; the process called education should result, says Dewey, in "the making of human beings, of men and women generous in aspiration, liberal in thought, cultivated in taste, and equipped with knowledge and competent method." If the concept of the integrity and the dignity of the individual is granted, then, this aim seems to grow out of the situation.

Flexibility. As individuals differ, the alteration of the aim to particular conditions seems both likely and logical. The aim appears to provide for tentativeness and opportunities for modification. In the educative process, there is ample opportunity for adjustments for the student according to age, maturity level, background and temperament, for instance.

Freeing of activities. Through the growth of insight and the realization of potentialities, the goal may be reached and a successful continuation of activity may result. The process of self-development, complex in the beginning, should progress into increasing complexity and result in the desired freeing of activities.

Foundation upon the student's interests and capacities. The decision as to whether the aim meets this criterion depends largely upon the interpretation given to self-development. It may be that by this term is meant the developing of new insights through diverse and meaningful experiences; such an interpretation seems to be supported

---

by the wording of the rest of the aim. Even if self-development means
the realist's self-discipline resulting from the workings of social
demand, there is still ample room for individuality, as will be seen.
(The pragmatist, of course, would stress interests and needs.) On
the whole, the aim appears closely to involve the student's interests
and capacities, if it is not actually based on them.

Translation into a method of co-operating with activities.
In his discussion of the fifth criterion, Dewey stipulates that the
method should lend itself "to the construction of specific procedures"
and that these procedures should "test, correct, and qualify the
aims."57 Such specific procedures as individual guidance, flexibility
in course requirements, flexible reading and writing programs, and
discussion groups would help to facilitate self-development and are
examples of instances of the methods which are feasible under the
terms of the aim. Such procedures serve as a check on the validity
of the aim in the present form. The aim under discussion, then, seems
valid from both of the standpoints indicated.

Comprehensiveness. On this aim, the writer believes, is built
much of what is termed education. Modern society, too, rests on the
development and the contributions of the individual:

Society in its full sense as we have discussed it in
this volume is never entirely separable from the individuals
who compose it. No individual can arrive even at the
threshold of his potentialities without a culture in which

---

he participates. Conversely, no civilization has in it any element which in the last analysis is not the contribution of an individual.58

The educational aim listed above has many ramifications. Such an aim gives the instructor and the student perspective as they consider the present activities and the development of the individual.

The second of the educational aims to be considered is as follows:

II. TO ASSIST IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF COMPETENT CITIZENSHIP THROUGH DIALECTICAL DISCUSSION

The development of competent citizenship, as well as of character and efficiency, is significant because, as Horne points out, "individual aims are also secondarily social, and the social aims are also secondarily individual."59

Relevance to existing situations. The individual should learn how to be a competent member of society. Even higher individualism has its limitations in the heavy and unceasing requirements of modern society. It might be added that in a republic, even with shared power and shared respect, the responsibilities of the citizen are ever-present and highly significant; for on an informed and capable citizenry depends the welfare of the state. Moreover, since society


rests on a basis of communication, and since opinions—which often vary among human beings—are communicated, for the most part, by means of language, it seems probable that informal dialectic will tend to develop tolerance, co-operation, and the ability to work with others to a common end.

**Flexibility.** Dialectical discussion rests on the principles of unity and coherence in thought, mutual support and re-inforcement of truths, and the whole-part relationship—the idea that "reason must eventually bring us all to some all-inclusive whole which is an ultimate unity." It appears to the present writer that such a method may be so flexible as to be practically meaningless. First, the aim involves high-order abstractions, such as citizenship. Second, there would probably be wide variations in background among the members of the class. The potential problem of aimlessness might be at least partially solved by careful, intelligent guidance, including the use of example as well as precept. On the whole, as stated, the aim does not appear to meet the criterion. The method seems to need specificity, precision.

**Freeing of activities.** Though in theory ideas are clarified as, through dialectical discussion, differences in opinion are brought into the open and thinking becomes closer and more precise, actually the abstract nature of the aim, in addition to the potential flaws in method, might well prevent the aim from being clear in the mind of the student. The result might well be a lack of clear connection

---

between discussion—even though thoughtful—and the individual's unacademic pursuits. It is somewhat difficult, therefore, for the present writer to see how, even under the best of conditions, dialectical discussion of good citizenship could directly influence the unacademic pursuits of the student.

Foundation upon the student's interests and capacities. The formality of dialectical discussion is not a ground for condemnation; discipline and order, in themselves, are not evil. There is a question, however, whether the aim, as stated, allows room for careful consideration of the student's interests and capacities. It seems to the writer that less formal discussion based, say, on wide reading and experience, might provide more scope for individual interests than would the dialectical discussion specified in the aim as stated above. Formal logic based on Plato and Hegel seems a little too rigid to allow for the necessary careful consideration of what the individual is interested in and what he can do.

Translation into a method of co-operation with activities. Considering that the method of dialectical discussion is abstruse and controversial and that individual interests seem to be given insufficient consideration, translation into such a method of co-operation appears doubtful. Often such a procedure is merely a high-level analysis of what Walpole terms a "fiction" carried on without significant factual content. If dialectical discussion is used to the exclusion of other procedures—such exclusion is indicated by the wording of the aim—then it is difficult to see how anything more than discussion can ensue. Dialectical discussion appears,
paradoxically enough, to be at the same time too flexible and not flexible enough.

Comprehensiveness. This aim involves what might be called the social aspects of higher education—an understanding of the dignity of the individual and of his responsibility to society. It is broadly concerned, then, with the privileges and responsibilities of every member of society. It has breadth, then, even though the method that is a part of the aim, as stated, restricts it.

The third aim to be evaluated is the following:

III. TO TRANSMIT THE VERIFIED KNOWLEDGE OF THE RACE

The worth of the cultural heritage of knowledge, skills, and attitudes lies in its content of dependable solutions for the typical problems of man. Breed lists as "one of the transcendent aims of education" the achieving of the "fundamental truth that has accrued from the historic stream of human experience."  

Relevance to existing situations. Human beings continue to face problems, small and large. For everyone, the cultural heritage, built by the experience of the race, supplies solutions that have worked for representative problems. Because the whole situation is a part of living, a knowledge of this fund of experience would probably prove to be helpful. It is, as Breed suggests, largely a matter of the comprehensive and systematic grasp of the significant

---

61 Frederick S. Breed, Education and the New Realism, p. 215.

ideas needful to efficient and orderly arrangement of those ideas in the mind of the student. 63

Flexibility. If a part of the cultural tradition is proved fallacious or inapplicable, there is still room—and need—for the rest. Part of the aim concerns transmission, and the need for the possession of the heritage is still there. Under these circumstances, flexibility appears to result. The verification mentioned seems, therefore, to be a part of the intelligent use of this cultural tradition.

Freeing of activities. Since the application of the knowledge of others to the solution of one's own problems cannot be called uncommon or inexpedient per se, the aim seems to be a method of directing the activities. Because of the continuity of human life—because each individual learns from the experience of those who have gone before him—this aim appears to meet the requirement of providing for a release of activities and for their successful continuation.

Foundation upon the student's interests and capacities. Education supplies this fund of information—social experience and insight—to the individual. The student, drawing on this fund according to his needs, adapts this information to his own problems. In this way, transmission of the cultural heritage contributes to human development and ministers to the requirements of the individual. It may be mentioned that this use of humanistic knowledge is consistent

63 Loc. cit.
with that explained by Dewey:

Knowledge is humanistic in quality not because it is about human products in the past, but because of what it does in liberating human intelligence and human sympathy. 64

Translation into a method of co-operation with activities.
If the procedure used consists of abstract discussion of ideas—dessicated and remote from life—or of reverence for the past, the student will probably not see a direct connection between this knowledge and his activities outside his classes. Because the verified knowledge under discussion does provide opportunity for aesthetic enjoyment as well as challenge to intelligence, it is probable that an effective method of co-operation can be devised. For example, through wide reading, analysis, and discussion, the student would probably come to see that the background of human wisdom has a direct and beneficial contribution to make in the management of his own existence. It must be admitted that the nature of the aim seems to place a severe limitation on devising a method that will directly co-operate with the student's activities; but there would probably be some carry-over of, for instance, a sense of proportion, from reading and skilled analysis and discussion.

Comprehensiveness. This aim is concerned with the understanding and use of racial wisdom in the life of the individual. That it stresses the continuity of human life is not more significant here than that it touches closely the adjustment of the individual to his world. Thus, the goal, though undeniably

64 John Dewey, Democracy and Education, p. 269.
comprehensive, is close to human life and concerns. In this aim is represented much of the greatness of humanity: the bond between the individual and his world.

Next to be considered in the evaluation is the following aim:

IV. TO MAINTAIN A BALANCED EMPHASIS ON METHOD AND ON MATERIAL

Through such a balance, Breed believes, the organization of information and the precision of thought can be improved.65

In the following discussion, because the aim—as will appear—seems to be in reality a method or procedure, the writer has not employed the phrasal summary of each criterion.

From the point of view of the realist—that the pragmatist is concerned too much with the use of the experimental method and neglects the verified knowledge of the race—this aim involves a major problem in education. Though the idealist would probably emphasize the disciplinary value of a knowledge of the cultural heritage, and the pragmatist would stress the significance of the use of the method of science, the proponents of the three philosophies would probably agree that the educated man should possess both information and a reliable method for its use. Moreover, even though material is interpreted loosely, even though the use of the verified knowledge of the race is not involved, the aim concerns the old question of the comparative significance of content and method—a

problem that is doubtless nearly as old as education. The aim, however, though it has been included for the sake of completeness, impresses the present writer as being a method of procedure, a principle of operation, rather than an educational aim. An aim is an effect or condition which one wishes to attain through the expenditure of the necessary labor. Transmission and conservation of the cultural heritage is an example. It is an end the attainment of which requires the expenditure of effort and energy. But the method or procedure is not indicated in the aim quoted just a moment ago. It concerns what, not how. The aim under discussion, however, seems to be concerned much more with the method of reaching the desired end—which is not specified. The maintenance of a balance does not seem in itself to be an aim; it is a way to reach one.

Let us turn now to the fifth of the educational objectives, which is stated as follows:

V. TO STRIVE FOR AN ADJUSTMENT BETWEEN FREEDOM AND AUTHORITY WHICH INCLUDES RESPECT FOR BOTH INDIVIDUALITY AND SOCIAL DEMANDS

In this aim is found a statement of the need for respect for both individuality and social demands. The liberty of the individual should be supplemented by the authority of society. A flexible ground between these two complementary factors is the best ground for the maintenance of democracy.66

Relevance to existing situations. This aim is based on a question that constantly faces every individual and every society. The situation enters into the majority of decisions and is an integral part of individual and social adjustment. It is also a question that has baffled men for centuries and one that has never been settled with anything approaching finality. A central question in the existence of the individual and of society, it is also, it appears, a pivotal question in education.

Flexibility. The phrasing of the aim indicates that the adjustment is to be satisfactory to the individual and to society. This aim would provide for respect for individuality, while asserting that regard for the rights of others places a curb on individualism and imposes an unavoidable discipline on each member of society. If individuality and social demand are regarded as complementary rather than opposed, and the principle of conservation—of retaining methods or ideas which seem beneficial to the individual and to society until better methods or ideas are discovered—is accepted, then the aim appears flexible.

Freeing of activities. The basic concept is, as has been said, that of freedom and authority supplementing each other. The use of the problem approach to this situation, as to all others, means that the student will use the information at his disposal according to a specific method to attack the problem. He may not—probably will not—solve it even to his own complete satisfaction; but the successful continuation of the activity should follow in view of the nature of the aim.
Foundation in the student's interests and activities. Here is an example of a profound philosophical concept which, through social pressure in the form of convention and law, affects nearly every aspect of the student's living. In this aim is exemplified a fundamental problem of Western government and jurisprudence. It is doubtful, however, whether the aim is founded on the interests and capacities of the student. In the first place—though this is a minor point—the aim has something of the nature of a method of procedure. More significant, however, is the abstractness of the aim. Without further explanation and limitation, this aim, as stated, remains broad and impressive, but still only a philosophical principle, unrelated to the activities of the student.

Translation into a method of co-operating with activities. It has been said that the principle embodied in this aim is so broad and fundamental that it concerns practically every aspect of the life of the individual. The basic nature of the principle which is the foundation of this aim would tend to persuade one that it would be easy to translate the aim into a method of co-operating with the student's activities. If a sincere, well-planned effort is made to put this aim into practice, to bring the abstractions to the level of operations, then the student's life in school will probably be affected considerably, as he realizes the significance of this aspect of his adaptation to the demands of society. But there is still doubt whether a method could be formulated which would directly affect his unacademic activities. It seems to the writer that the outcome would be an indirect and variable influence rather than a reliable and
specific outcome.

Comprehensiveness. The aim can reasonably be termed comprehensive, for it touches all areas of life and concerns both the individual and the society of which he is a member. For the same reason, it can hardly be called remote from specific context. The aim is stimulating and challenging; it concerns a perennial problem of human society, and causes the individual to consider carefully the present status of the problem and the tentative solutions for it.

We may now consider the matter of individual discipline, as stated in the following aim:

VI. TO DISCIPLINE THE INDIVIDUAL REALLY TO ACCOMMODATE HIMSELF TO THOSE CONDITIONS AND LAWS NOT SUBJECT TO CHANGE AND TO EXERCISE HIS PRODUCTIVE FACULTIES ON THE MODIFIABLE FACTORS IN THE PHYSICAL AND HUMAN ENVIRONMENT

Duty and responsibility stem from the demands of the physical and personal entities constituting the environment, and furnish the basis of discipline in life. The individual should accept the discipline and realize that his plans can be altered or completely blocked. Interpretation of the world in the light of the classical tradition means a comprehension of the individual as influencing and being influenced by the world. As Breed sees it,

68 Frederick S. Breed, Education and the New Realism, p. 229.
In such a theory of education, habit is as solidly entrenched as the foremost element of experience; intellection as fully recognized as the element of change. The cultural tradition becomes a chart for navigation; individual exploration, the basis for a better chart.

Relevance to the situation. The situation, in this instance, is essentially that which Margaret Fuller faced when she somewhat belatedly decided to accept the universe. It is a basic problem of adjustment—a problem that every human being has to face as part of the price and the process of living. A great philosopher twenty-five hundred years ago said, "No man is free"; each individual learns that sombre truth as best he can. This aim, then, does not lie outside normal activities; it is fundamental to them, and constitutes a discipline essential to intelligent living. Physical and mental fact can affect the individual and his ideas; comprehension and adaptation are essential.

Flexibility. In application, the aim develops in the individual an expanding knowledge of the nature of the 'fact' which can modify or completely nullify proposals or plans. Such comprehension will serve as a basis for intelligent action. Second, individual interests and capacities are a basic consideration in this discipline; the application of the problem approach, insisted upon by the realist, is evidence for the statement.

Freeing of activities. In the opinion of the writer, the direction or freeing of activities lies chiefly in the stimulus

69 Ibid., pp. 227-228.
afforded to a better understanding and wider knowledge of unchanging conditions and laws and of the modifiable factors. The efforts which the individual makes to understand an essential discipline constitute the "freeing of activities" specified in the criterion.

*Foundation upon the student's interests and capacities.* It is difficult to state definitely whether this aim does or does not meet the foregoing criterion. On the one hand, the individual's acceptance of the inexorable fact which the realist insists upon is an individual matter, made according to the demands of temperament as well as those of intelligence, even though the analysis itself has been made in accordance with the scientific method. Second, it should be remembered that implicit in this aim is the realist's recognition of the dignity of the individual and of the retention of the good until tested improvement has been found. On the other hand, the word *discipline*, though expected in an aim formulated by the realist, tends to make one wonder how much room is allowed for the play of individual interests and capacities. On the whole—and in the light of the fact that a full comprehension of the principle which is the basis of the aim comes only with maturity and experience—the aim will be placed in the doubtful category as far as this criterion is concerned.

*Translation into a method of co-operation with activities.* The problem approach, of which the realist is so fond, might be such a co-operating method. This approach, of course, involves the use of logical thought in making analyses. Such activity often results in an extension of knowledge, often of the individual, occasionally of
society. Thus, the operation of the method provides for testing the goal, as well as for whatever change seems desirable and expedient.

Comprehensiveness. Since the aim concerns a major aspect of adjustment, involving the individual and the society in which he lives, it appears to be comprehensive in scope. The adaptation covered by the aim is one which every member of society must learn. Under these circumstances, and because the goal involves action as well as comprehension, the goal is not detached from specific context.

The next aim for consideration is the following:

VII. TO OFFER AS MANY OPPORTUNITIES AS POSSIBLE FOR LEARNING THROUGH DOING AND FOR SOCIAL PARTICIPATION

Whether the student is trying to learn an idea or understand a feeling, the idea or emotion must arise in his mind as a fitting response to a problem or a situation which he confronts.\(^7\) The natural course of development requires, therefore, beginning with situations which involve learning by doing.\(^1\) Second, through interaction with a social environment, the ways of life of the individual are modified. He learns the meaning of social living. "Through shared experiences he becomes a person."\(^2\)


\(^1\) John Dewey, Democracy and Education, pp. 216-217.

\(^2\) John L. Childs, Education and the Philosophy of Experimentalism, p. 84.
Relevance to existing conditions. Experience is inescapable; the idea back of this aim is to see that the student benefits to the maximum extent from certain broad specified types of experience. This goal, then, amounts to taking situations and building on them—seeing what is taking place, considering the difficulties and the potentialities.

The same is true of the social aspect of the goal. If democracy is the best environment so far developed for the growth of human intelligence and personality—and the three philosophies would probably agree on that—then the student would profit considerably from social participation. Through such participation, the student will come to understand better the privileges and the responsibilities involved in membership in a highly integrated society.

Flexibility. Both learning through doing and social participation can be either formal or informal, and can take place either in or out of the classroom. Moreover, the aim can be altered or modified to meet circumstances. The results of this aim, social development and the reconstruction of experience, are experimental and adapted to the individual.

Freeing of activities. The effect of this educational aim upon out-of-school activities would probably come, for the most part, from the provision of opportunities for social participation, since learning through doing would seem to have less connection with such activities. Because of the artificiality of many school situations, it is doubtful whether there would be much lasting or effective carry-over into the unacademic activities of the student.
Foundation upon the student's interests and capacities.

Since the aim is concerned with the stimulation of learning and with social development, it is probable that some of the student's interests and capacities are involved. The words in the criterion, however, are "foundation upon"; and it must be said that it is doubtful that the aim meets this criterion. In this instance, much depends upon method, and it may be noted here that the proponents of the three philosophies under discussion emphasize the value of individuality. Nevertheless, the emphasis on individuality is not stated in the aim.

Translation into a method of co-operation with activities.

This aim, involving as it does two vital phases of the individual's development, can be translated into a method which lends itself to the formulation of specific procedures. These procedures can include, for example, oral and written reports, trips, and investigations. They can be carried on in the classroom and in the community. Because of the nature of the aim, too, the instructor, considering closely the concrete conditions, the subject matter, and the student, can make a well-founded effort to formulate definite procedures which will have explicit provision for testing and amplifying this aim; for all of the elements are flexible, and the aim itself is considered as experimental in nature.

Comprehensiveness. The offering of numerous opportunities for learning through doing—without skilled guidance—and for social experiences does not seem comprehensive as the aim is stated. The impression left is one of aimlessness rather than depth. It may be
said, of course, that the aim involves, through the provision of many diverse experiences, the acquisition and comprehension of information, as well as the development of competence in social living. These are, no doubt, two basic aspects of the life of the individual. It is highly probable, however, that this breadth is in the pragmatic interpretation of the aim rather than in the statement of the aim itself.

The next aim to be considered involves the development of character. It may be stated as follows:

VIII. THROUGH CULTIVATING A DISPOSITION FOR CO-OPERATIVE INQUIRY, TO DEVELOP CHARACTER BASED ON SUCH QUALITIES AS INTEGRITY, SELF-DISCIPLINE, AND TOLERANCE

This goal is based upon the pragmatist's conviction that "character and mind are attitudes of participation in social affairs." Constant broadening of common interests is desirable to this end.

Relevance to existing situations. Since the individual lives in and is a member of society, he must learn how to think clearly as an individual and as a competent member of society. He learns from his own experience, but he learns also from the experience of others. Through investigation, analysis, and adjustments made co-operatively, the individual may develop individual strength and social consciousness and understanding.


Flexibility. The wording "cultivating a disposition" is indicative of the flexibility of this aim, which enables it to be altered to meet circumstances. It will be noted that the pragmatists emphasize the individual, but even if they did not do so, the development of a tendency can hardly be called a rigid aim. It is simply an effort to help the individual to see the advantage in a certain procedure and to make necessary and valuable adjustments to the situations that will result. Through thinking and working with others, the individual will tend to realize the meaning of membership in human society and his place in that society.

Freeing of activities. The end in view is definite and seems to direct the activities. The activities are significant on their own account; they include learning to work with and to understand others; learning to think clearly and accurately; and learning to make adjustments to society. Of course, the end, like the activities, will never be fully realized, but it will serve to guide them and insure their successful continuation. The aim, then, as the criterion requires, appears to be both a means of action and an outcome.

Foundation on the student's interests and capacities. In the first place, development of the potentialities of the individual is a basic responsibility of all education; and among the potentialities is an inner strength that will enable him to encounter the vicissitudes of life with some composure and understanding. Another potential is his ability to live intelligently as a member of society. It appears to the present writer, considering the above matters, that the aim under discussion is based on an understanding of the present status
of the individual. An understanding and consideration of what the individual is interested in and of what he can do is an integral part of the development of an understanding of co-operative inquiry and a willingness to participate in it.

Translation into a method of co-operating with activities. In the statement of this aim, a method is specified, and in the course of the preceding discussion, several specific procedures growing out of this method have been mentioned. Other methods could be formulated; the idealist would, no doubt, dwell on the disciplinary effect of a knowledge of the great writings of the past, just as the realist would stress a clear understanding of the accepted wisdom of the past. Nevertheless, the proponents of all three philosophies would probably agree that the procedure mentioned in the aim as stated would be valuable and that socializing and thinking would work well with the student's present program of activities. Moreover, these procedures would test the aim and bring about whatever modifications seemed necessary, especially if the free play of intelligence, emphasized by the pragmatist, were employed.

Comprehensiveness. The aim involves individual adjustment and logical thinking, two basic aspects of the relationship of the individual to society. It is stimulating in that it causes the instructor and the student to consider carefully the student's present activities and their potentialities. It does not seem to be detached from specific context, because the special significance of co-operative inquiry is clearly indicated with the development of logical thinking and of individual adaptation.
Next let us consider the two remaining aims, those formulated during the discussion of duplication. The first of them is as follows:

IX. TO ASSIST THE STUDENT TO DEVELOP SKILL IN THE USE OF LOGICAL THOUGHT

Relevance to existing situations. Two considerations concerning relevance enter here. The first is that ideas from the past may be used to illuminate and aid in the comprehension of the ideas and problems of the present. Second, thought is an integral part of living, and the solution of problems is a continuous process. The aim proposes development and training of the intelligence in its work. In the light of these considerations, the aim appears to meet the first criterion.

Flexibility. Though the method is a framework, a series of orderly steps, the objective is to develop skill in the use of the method; in this sense, the procedures and techniques can be adapted to the situation. The aim, then, is experimental, since it involves the individual, whose present status is considered, and the procedure, which can be tentative and based on the instructor's knowledge of the student's interests and capacities. A question about whether the aim is flexible might arise if the use of the scientific method were considered to be the only road to progress. Developing skill in the use of logical thought and of the scientific method seems to provide flexibility; but to close the doors to any other method gives an impression of rigidity.
Freeing of activities. The aim appears to have a specific end in view: the realization of the potentialities of the individual's intelligence. The end in view is significant and capable of directing activities because it means the development of skill in techniques of clear, accurate thinking. It is an objective of major significance—vital to education and essential to a man who is to become an artist in living. In the opinion of the present writer, the successful continuation of the activities—the "freeing of activities"—would follow the pursuit of this aim. Skill in thinking could be used in daily living—in the solution of problems and the resolution of difficulties. The aim provides for training in specific and tested methods which require practice and guidance. The successful continuation of the activity is a logical consequence of the development of skill in it.

Foundation upon the student's interests and activities. The objective proposes to make use of an existing ability, which is basic to the competent management of the student's life, and provide assistance in the development of the use of intelligence. Individualization is stressed in the criterion; from the nature of the aim seems to follow a careful consideration of the student's specific powers and endowments, to serve as a basis for guidance and instruction. In a sense, this aim is an "imposed" aim; yet it does have a foundation in the desire of many college students to understand, to solve problems, to find the answers to some of the questions facing them. And training and disciplining the ability to reason will have a close connection with what the student is interested in and what he can do.
Translation into a method of co-operating with activities.

First of all, as has been said, the carrying out of this aim involves consideration of the interests and capacities of the individual. Second, the student will come to realize the power of the process of disciplined thought as he becomes more and more aware, with the acquisition of more knowledge, of the achievements made possible through its use, both in the past and in the present.

Comprehensiveness. The aim is broad in the sense that without such development as that specified in the aim, education cannot take place; a basic skill, beyond mere recall of facts, is involved. The ability to think clearly and precisely is a highly specific one, for it concerns the use of intelligence—that of the individual as well as that of others—in the life of the individual. The scope of the aim is sufficiently broad to touch the individual as well as the society of which he is a member. Here is an aim which is essential and which gives both the educator and the student the perspective—the increased discernment and understanding of means and consequences—which Dewey insists upon in this criterion.75

The last aim to be considered here is the following:

X. TO IMPART AN UNDERSTANDING OF THE NATURE
OF MIND AND MATTER

Relevance to existing conditions. The modern college student lives in a society whose development, especially during the last few

75 John Dewey, Democracy and Education, p. 128.
centuries, has been considerably influenced by scientific discoveries and technological advances. These changes have affected nearly every area of daily life; one sees evidence of the truth of this statement as one thinks of modern conveniences, modern amusements, and modern thought. It is perhaps natural, then, that the individual should need information about himself and the world. Such information will help the individual to understand the development of modern society and to adjust himself to the environment.

**Flexibility.** Theoretically, if the understanding specified in the criterion were based on an entirely objective approach, then the comprehension and discernment implicit in the aim would probably result. A well-planned, clear discussion of the various major concepts would be illuminating and conducive to the concept of tentativeness. However, as there is considerable disagreement among the proponents of the philosophies being considered about the nature of mind and matter, and as the aim does not specify that thorough, impartial presentation of the major philosophical concepts of mind and matter be made, the aim does not appear to meet the criterion of flexibility. Moreover, the factual nature of the disciplines involved makes flexibility improbable if not impossible.

**Freeing of activities.** The end in view appears to be to develop a degree of comprehension of the nature of man and the world, together with the secondary objectives of assisting the student to see that even though the knowledge is limited and imperfect, it is still the best we have; and that there is a constant effort to broaden that knowledge. The major objective is attained through the use of
logical thought, which can and will be used after the desired undertaking has been achieved.

**Foundation upon the student's interests and capacities.**

Because much of the desired understanding is concerned with abstract and significant philosophical concepts and with highly factual disciplines, the relationship to the student's interests and capacities must be considered as limited. It is true that in its concern with both the individual and society, the aim may touch on such matters as the development of values for the individual and of effective control of atomic energy. In short, some of the basic problems of life are involved. It is doubtful, however, whether many individuals will perceive the need for the comprehension of material that might well help them to understand themselves better and to adjust more intelligently to their world.

**Translation into a method of co-operation with activities.**

The aim, in the first place, has a quality of abstractness. Though it is a basic philosophical concept, it does not seem really closely related to the student's unacademic pursuits. In this context, the majority of students might be inclined to deny the significance of any or all of the concepts under consideration here. Moreover, even with considerable attention to individual interests and to the development of skill in the use of logical thought—and all this is method, of course—the "transfer," the influence of an understanding of the universe would be limited, it appears. The aim does not seem to be close enough to what the student does outside his classes.
Comprehensiveness. The aim involves, as has been said, some of the basic problems of human life, not only concerning the nature of man, but of the world in which he lives. It includes both the method and the achievements of science. It is a stimulating and challenging aim, one whose application should result in a growth of perspective. For this aim will help man better to understand himself and his world.

The writer has evolved aims for higher education from the summaries of three educational philosophies, eliminated duplication, and tested these aims in the light of trustworthy criteria. He now proposes to list these aims in a manner which will show the results of the evaluation and which will indicate the aims to be used in this study.

The following aims meet the criteria with no exceptions:

1. To provide for self-development to the limit of the capacity of the individual

2. Through cultivating a disposition for co-operative inquiry, to develop character based on such qualities as integrity, self-discipline, and tolerance

3. To assist the student to develop skill in the use of logical thought

The three aims listed below meet all but one of the criteria:

4. To transmit the verified knowledge of the race

5. To discipline the individual really to accommodate himself to those conditions and laws not subject to change and to exercise his productive faculties on the modifiable factors in the physical and human environment

6. To offer as many opportunities as possible for learning through doing and for social participation
The following aim meets all but two of the criteria:

7. To strive for an adjustment between freedom and authority which includes respect for both individual and social demands

The eighth aim is a borderline case; but, since it satisfies three of the six criteria, the writer believes that it is at least reasonably valid and that it may be included with the other seven.

The eighth aim is as follows:

8. To impart an understanding of the nature of mind and of matter

These eight aims, then in the opinion of the writer, meet the standards sufficiently well that they may justifiably be accepted for use in this study.

Two aims are excluded from the list. They are as follows:

9. To assist in the development of competent citizenship through dialectical discussion

10. To maintain a balanced emphasis on method and on material

The ninth aim fails to satisfy four of the six criteria. The tenth is considered to have no validity because it appears to be a method rather than an aim.

The writer has now arrived at a list of educational objectives which can serve as a basis for the present study.

In the following chapter, he proposes to discuss the process of abstraction, symbolism and figurative language, connotation and denotation, and contexts; a number of semantic difficulties; and principles which will serve as the basis for a method of solving these problems. The phases of semantics which have been mentioned
are considered to be pertinent to the study in their potential contribution to the attainment of the educational objectives listed above and in their use in analyzing the specimens of student work later in the study.
In this chapter, the writer proposes to arrive at a satisfactory definition of semantics, to set forth some major problems encountered in verbal communication, and to enumerate a number of principles suggested by semantics which may be helpful in finding solutions for these problems.

No single chapter can offer an exhaustive treatment of the subject of semantics; nor, for the purposes of this study, is one needed. Therefore, the material has been selected on the basis of its potential contribution to the objectives of higher education and of its usefulness in the analysis of students' written interpretations.

The first requisite is to define semantics. In arriving at a satisfactory definition, the writer has made a survey of definitions formulated by well-known writers on the subject. This survey will serve to show some differing interpretations of the term, some restrictions placed upon it, and some differences as to degree of concern with methods of expressing and interpreting meanings clearly and precisely.

The list includes definitions offered by Ogden and Richards, Korzybski, Chase, and Hayakawa. In the first of these, Ogden and Richards, somewhat disdainful of the loose verbiage in Bréal's Semantics, have discarded the term semantics and substituted symbolism
in their definition:

Symbolism is the study of the part played in human affairs by language and symbols of all kinds, and especially their influence on thought. It singles out for special inquiry the ways in which symbols help us and hinder us in reflecting on things.

Symbols direct and organize, record and communicate. It will be noted that the definition includes the study of the relationship between the word, the referent, and the individual.

The need for precision, moreover, seems to be implicit rather than explicit in the definition. That need is implied, more strongly, perhaps, in such a sentence as "Language is the incomparable means of considering how we are thinking and so of improving our thinking."^1

The definition cited emphasizes the study of verbal meanings. Korzybski, however, (in a sentence which is open to criticism from the standpoint of sentence structure) defines the term from a much different point of view: "General semantics . . . is a new extensional discipline which explains and trains us how to use our nervous systems most efficiently."^2 (Extensional may be defined as "concerned with the experiential world.") It seems evident that Korzybski is concerned not only with meanings of words, but also, to judge from his definition—and his book as a whole—with the living reactions of human beings in their individual environments.

---


The differences in emphasis between the definitions of Ogden and Richards and of Korzybski are clearly indicated in the words of the latter:

There is a fundamental confusion between the notion of the older 'semantic' as connected with a theory of verbal 'meaning' and words defined by words, and the present theory of 'general semantic' where we deal only with neuro-semantic and neuro-linguistic living reactions of Smith₁, Smith₂, etc., or their reactions to neuro-semantic and neuro-linguistic environment as environment.¹

(Neuro is used to indicate Korzybski's belief that man's institutions and behavior are dependent upon his complicated nervous system.) He believes that in using language, an understanding of the devices of rhetoric is not enough; there must also be concern with accuracy—conformity to fact. Such attention to making verbal language correspond with the facts of the experiential world is essential.⁵

On the whole, since the definition involves, for example, the physical and biological sciences, philosophy, and sociology, it appears to be much broader than the other definitions cited previously.

It will probably be admitted that Chase's attempt at a definition of semantics does not seem especially helpful: "Semantics has to do with theories of meaning."⁶ In Chase's description of the semantic discipline, however, is found a revealing passage which

¹Ibid., p. x.


indirectly defines the term:

A good semantic discipline gives the power to separate mental machinery from tangible events; makes us conscious of abstracting; prevents us from peopling the universe with non-existent things. It does not dispense with poetry, fantasy, imagination, ideas, intellectual emotions. It checks us from acting as if fantasies were real events worth fighting and dying for.  

As one recalls that The Tyranny of Words is based chiefly on the work of Ogden and Richards and of Korzybski, one realizes that in the passage cited above, Chase has set forth a broad conception of a science of communication, including concern with the development of skill in both expression and interpretation and with the effect of that interpretation upon human behavior. It should be noted that the operational test of meaning—for which Chase is indebted to Bridgman—is an integral part of the former's conception of semantics.

Hayakawa does not appear to define semantics directly. He believes that the work of Richards in literary criticism; Bridgman, Carnap, and others in science and mathematics; Bloomfield in linguistics; and Malinowski in anthropology shows a "determination to increase the efficiency of thought through an improved understanding of how language works. The progress of these studies and the discrimination and application of their results are steps toward general sanity."  

The statement appears to be sufficiently broad to include the major ideas in the definitions formulated by Ogden and Richards

---

7Ibid., p. 357.

and by Korzybski. This assertion should not be surprising; for, as Hayakawa says, *Language in Action* is a "popular synthesis" of semantic principles drawn chiefly from Korzybski but also from the work done in more specialized fields by such men as Ogden and Richards.  

To Hayakawa, then, *semantics* seems to mean a critical study of language habits and their effect on human behaviour and human society. In this statement, one finds emphasis on what might be termed "evaluation" of language: analysis of communication for its correspondence to the facts of the experiential world.

The definitions, on the whole, concern analysis of the problem of communication and the making of intelligent, defensible choices among alternative interpretations. Such a viewpoint goes beyond the history of the changing meanings of words to the study of the potentialities and the limitations of language, and of the management of human affairs in the light of the understanding.

The present writer does not believe that semantics can cover all knowledge or solve all human problems. He does believe, however, that because semantics is concerned with the attainment of increased skill in verbal communication, it will affect all areas of human thought and endeavor. The writer, then, for the purposes of this study, offers the following definition of *semantics*: A STUDY OF THE COMMUNICATION OF MEANING THROUGH LANGUAGE, WITH THE PURPOSE OF DEVELOPING GREATER ACCURACY IN THE EXPRESSION AND INTERPRETATION OF MEANING TRANSMITTED VERBALLY.

---

The writer now proposes to turn to a consideration of major problems in semantics and to the listing of principles which may be of assistance in solving them. The headings under which these problems will be discussed are as follows: abstraction, symbolism, contexts, and the uses of to be, the two-valued orientation, and emotive and referential language.

ABSTRACTION

Abstraction is basically a process of selection of details from a total situation. The process and purpose of abstraction are well illustrated by Hayakawa's adaptation of Korzybski's structural differential.

In Hayakawa's diagram, which illustrates the relationships between words and what they stand for, the first level represents a phenomenon or "event," a continuous, non-repetitive process, at the submicroscopic level, with an indefinite number of characteristics. The event cannot be perceived by the senses. Korzybski's conception of the nature of an event, as well as the difference between the first and second levels in the diagram, is stated by Hayakawa:

It is impossible to say completely what Bessie [the cow used as an example in the diagram] or anything else really is. Bessie is no static "object," but a dynamic process.

The Bessie that we experience, however, is something else again. We experience only a small fraction

\[10\] Chase, op. cit., pp. 83-84.
of the total Bessie: the lights and shadows of her exterior, her motions, her general configuration, the noises she makes, and the sensations she presents to our sense of touch. 

At the second level—which, like the first, is non-verbal—the object has a finite number of qualities. It is at this level, moreover, at which the nervous system abstracts, or selects, qualities or features from the event. The third level is the lowest verbal level, at which a label is affixed. A word is used to represent the first-order abstraction in the second level. As one goes up from the third level, more and more qualities or features are omitted, and more and more inferences from the label are made.

A dotted line has been drawn to separate the non-verbal from the verbal levels. The order of the parts of the diagram has been reversed from that shown in Hayakawa's book; the diagram is to be read down.

---

Read Down

The cow known to science: a mass of flying electrons known only through scientific inference.

Circles indicate characteristics; broken edge indicates that characteristics are infinite. This is the process level.

The object of experience: an interaction between our nervous system and something outside it. Diagram is circular to indicate that characteristics, though many, are finite.

The word "Bessie" (cow): further characteristics left out. This is the lowest verbal level of abstraction.

The word "cow": further characteristics left out. A somewhat higher level of abstraction.

"bovine"
"quadruped"
"animal"
"organism"

"livestock"
"farm assets"
"assets"
"wealth"

\[12\text{Ibid.}, \text{p. 126.}\]
It will be noted that, according to this theory, man cannot ever "know" any object in its entirety, since the characteristics are infinite, and the nervous system gives him information about the object. As Hayakawa says,

Our nervous system, automatically abstracting or selecting from the process-Bessie those features in which she resembles other animals of like size, function, and habits, classify her as "cow."

When we say, then, that "Bessie is a cow," we are only noting the process-Bessie's resemblance to other cows and ignoring differences. What is more, we are leaping a huge chasm: from the dynamic process-Bessie, a whirl of electro-chemical-neural eventfulness, to a relatively static "idea," "concept," or word, "cow . . ."

As the diagram [the structural differential reproduced above] illustrates, the object we see is an abstraction of the lowest level, but it is still an abstraction, since it leaves out characteristics of the process that is the real Bessie. The word "Bessie" (cow₁) is the lowest verbal level of abstraction, leaving out further characteristics—the difference between Bessie yesterday and Bessie today, between Bessie today and Bessie tomorrow—and selecting only the similarities. The word "cow" selects only the similarities between Bessie (cow₁), Daisy (cow₂), and so on, and therefore leaves out still more about Bessie. The word "livestock" selects or abstracts only the features that Bessie has in common with pigs, chickens, goats, and sheep. The term "farm asset" abstracts only the features Bessie has in common with barns, fences, livestock, furniture, generating plants, and tractors, and is therefore on a very high level of abstraction. A branch line has been drawn in the design to indicate that in discussing Bessie for different purposes, abstracting may be done in different ways.13

The ignoring of differences, then, and the omission of characteristics or features appear to be inevitable in abstracting.

13 Ibid., pp. 124-125.
The process of abstraction is necessary for convenience in communication. This process provides a verbal shorthand; its use obviates the necessity for employing a different name for each item in a group—a necessity which, as Korzybski shows, many primitive peoples still face:

Some savage races have names for a pine or an oak, but have no 'tree', which is a higher abstraction from 'pines', 'oaks', etc. Some tribes have the term 'tree', but do not have a still higher abstraction 'woods'. It does not need much emphasis to see that higher abstractions are extremely expedient devices. There is an enormous economy which facilitates mutual understanding in being able to be brief in a statement and yet cover wider objects.\(^{14}\)

Moreover, as we shall see, because symbols are independent of the object symbolized, it is possible to go from low to high levels of abstraction; to manipulate symbols even when the referents—the objects to which the symbols refer—cannot be manipulated; and to manufacture symbols with abstractions as referents.\(^{15}\)

As the structural differential indicates, abstractions are on various levels. This concept of levels of abstraction is shown in a slightly different way by Lee, who uses the following example:

Pick out some corner of your room. Suppose a painting is made of it. The non-verbal scene will then be represented by means of colors, shading, lights corresponding to it, etc., with, of course, many details left out. Now suppose a photograph is made of the painting. The colorings will now be left out. And a painter could then do that photograph, and a photographer that painting,

\(^{14}\)Korzybski, op. cit., p. 377. (The punctuation in the original has been followed.)

\(^{15}\)S. I. Hayakawa, Language in Action, p. 132.
etc., endlessly. It should be clear that each successive reproduction was an abstraction of a higher order. In this process three results would be inevitable: (1) the greater the number of paintings, the further we get from the corner of the room as we see it, and the more details will be omitted; (2) the later paintings especially will show characteristics added by the impressions, judgments, preferences of the painter, not verifiable by observers; (3) fewer and fewer unique details of the corner would be shown, so that the painted corners would begin to look like corners of other rooms, similarities now being emphasized; or at the very least the later pictures could show less and less correspondence with the original.16

This type of verbal shorthand can go on almost indefinitely. The most significant feature of this process, however, seems to be the remoteness of the higher-order abstractions from the first verbal level.

As the process of abstraction goes from lower to higher levels, fewer and fewer details of the object are under consideration; the object is grouped with other objects similar in some respects; and conclusions are formed about it.17 There is often considerable difficulty in securing agreement on a referent or group of referents for such a term as "human culture," for example. Often, consequently, the result of the use of high-order abstractions is confusion of the levels of abstraction. This confusion will be discussed a little later in this section.

It should be mentioned first, however, that there are several basic differences between lower-order and higher-order abstractions.

---


17 Ibid., p. 185.
The source of lower-order abstractions is the lower nerve centers, in direct contact with life experiences. Such abstractions, examples of which are sense-impressions, such as the "perception" of the color of a book, are affected by the limitations of and differences among individual nervous systems, as well as personal habits and interests, the position of the observer, and the limitations imposed by the time-factor. If two or more people are looking at the book mentioned above, it is doubtful whether they would see it as having exactly the same color. These abstractions, therefore, are specific and individual.\textsuperscript{18}

If lower-order abstractions differ in these ways, it seems logical to believe that higher-order abstractions—constructed from lower-order ones and consequently further from life experiences\textsuperscript{19}—would vary considerably. They represent the inferences, the judgments. The book mentioned a moment ago may be "a masterpiece of auctorial insight" to one reader; "a piece of utter trash" to a second; "an amusing, uneven trifle" to a third. Yet the three observers are speaking of the same book.

A number of such high-order abstractions as democracy, beauty, and justice have several significant features. First, they are mental inventions, not names of objects or sense-impressions.\textsuperscript{20}

\textsuperscript{18}Ibid., pp. 55-56.
\textsuperscript{19}Korzybski, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 297.
They are, then, not based on a referent in the non-verbal (external) world. Second, many words of this kind—such as the three mentioned above—are highly connotative; therefore, they are often used in emotive writing (writing designed to influence the feelings rather than the intelligence of the reader).

The use of high-order abstractions often results, therefore, in a lack of precision. An example will perhaps serve to make clear the position of the writer that such abstractions are frequently all things to all men and that broad oversimplification rather than precision often results from the use of such words. The example is the response of a student in English 563 to the question: "How does the book of Job appear 'modern' in content and point of view?"
The student's answer is as follows:

Job didn't accept convention of tradition in believing that God punished those who sinned. Job maintained his own integrity as many of our modern-day people do. Many of our modern-day people are also conventional, though Job did critical thinking.

In using such terms as "convention," "tradition," "integrity," and "critical thinking," the student has given no explanation or detail, and has used no examples to show the meaning of these words in context. It appears that the reader is left to interpret them as best he can.

Confusion of the levels of abstraction has previously been mentioned. Such confusion is defined, in general terms, by Chase as unawareness of what level of abstraction one is on, and of what

\[21\] A course at The Ohio State University, in the masterpieces of English literature.
Confusion on the lower levels of abstraction means, according to Hayakawa, equating sensory perception with qualities possessed by an object: treating the two lowest levels of the abstraction ladder as one. "Properly speaking, we should not say, 'The pencil is yellow,' which is a statement that places the yellowness in the pencil; we should say instead, 'That which has an effect on me which leads me to say 'pencil' also has an effect on me which leads me to say 'yellow.'" Lack of recognition of the part played by the nervous system in producing one's conception of reality is the significant point in the definition.

Confusion on higher levels of abstraction takes various forms, but this type of confusion appears to be based on the impression that the word is the object. An example of confusion on the higher levels is represented by various taboos on the use of words, such as those classed as profane or obscene. The taboos on profane words, in which English is rich, seem to be breaking down considerably; but there are occasions on which a strident "God damn it to hell!" might be considered rather unseemly. Words referring to various physical functions, such as bowels, a number of four-letter Anglo-Saxon terms for sexual activities, and the names of several diseases, notably syphilis, are examples of words considered to be obscene. Regulations

---

22 Chase, op. cit., p. 89.
enforced in Hollywood afford an illustration of the workings of such taboos. As Mencken says,

Hollywood, always under heavy pressure from official and volunteer censors, has its own Index Expurgatorius, augmented from time to time. It includes, as permanent fixtures, broad (for woman), chippy, cocotte, courtesan, eunuch, fairy (in the sense of homosexual), floozy, harlot, hot mamma, huzzy, madam (in the sense of brothel-keeper), nance, pansy, slut, trollop, tart, and wench, and of course, whores. Sex is also forbidden, as is the adjective sexual... God must be used circumspectly, and Gawd is under the ban. So are Lord ("when used profanely") Christ, guts, Hell, hellcat, Jesus, Geez, son-of-a---, S. O. B., louse and punk.  

These taboos illustrate the belief that there is some mystical power in language. The issue here, as Lee says, is not whether the words should be removed from the forbidden list or whether they should be dropped from use entirely. There is no magic in such words; they are merely marks on paper—forms of representation. To believe that the words have authority in themselves is to confuse levels of abstraction and to start on the way to delusion. Often, moreover, there is confusion of the extensional person—the individual in the experiential world—with the abstraction in one's mind. A person, for example, is a Democrat; he is, therefore—in the opinion of one who confuses the levels of abstraction—good (or bad). In this type of confusion, that which is inside the head of the observer is equated with that which is outside.

---


Ogden and Richards make a discerning comment in their remarks on confusion in the use of high-order abstractions:

Many terms used in discussion where 'faith,' 'beautiful,' 'freedom,' 'good,' 'belief,' 'energy,' 'justice,' 'the State,' constantly occur, are used with no distinct reference, the speaker being guided merely by his linguistic habits and a simple faith in the widespread possession of these habits. Hence the common sight of anger aroused by the hearer's apparent obtuseness and wrongheadedness "where the matter is surely self-evident." 26

As this passage indicates, there are numerous problems resulting from confusion of the levels of abstraction. Let us turn now to a consideration of the major difficulties.

Often a word is given a one-valued, specific meaning as a result of this confusion of levels. For instance, one man says to another, "There is no doubt about it; he is bad." (The use of is in this sentence will be discussed later in the chapter.) First, bad is given a single-ordered meaning; second, the speaker is assuming that everyone else will use bad with the same meaning. Thus the confusion of levels of abstraction has led to a disregard of the flexibility of language and to the resultant multiplicity of meanings possible.

Often, the development of "signal reactions" is facilitated by such confusion. A "signal reaction" is defined by Hayakawa as "a complete and invariable reaction which occurs whether or not the conditions warrant such a reaction." 27 In his explanation, he uses an

26 Ogden and Richards, op. cit., pp. 122-123.

27 S. I. Hayakawa, Language in Action, p. 27.
example of a chimpanzee taught to drive a car:

There is one thing wrong with its driving: its reactions are such that if a red light shows when it is halfway across a street, it will stop in the middle of the crossing, while if a green light shows while another car is stalled in its path, it will go ahead regardless of consequences. In other words, so far as a chimpanzee is concerned, the red light can hardly be said to stand for stop; it is stop. . . . To the chimpanzee, the red light is, we shall say, a signal, and we shall term its reaction a signal reaction . . . .

Such a reaction tends, as a rule, to be hasty rather than considered, emotional rather than rational. Oversimplification and a spurious finality are all too often the products of such mental shortcuts. The necessity for withholding judgment pending a thorough examination of a situation as a whole is, in a signal reaction, either disregarded or unperceived.

The most serious effect of confusion of the levels of abstraction, however, involves the false-to-fact world built up by yielding to signal reactions:

The picture of reality created inside our heads by such unconsciousness of abstracting is not a "map" of any existing "territory." In this never-never land, all "Jews" are out to cheat you; all "capitalists" are overfed tyrants, smoking expensive cigars and gnashing their teeth at labor unions; all "W. P. A. workers" idly "lean on shovels," meanwhile "living off the fat of the land." In this world, too, all snakes are poisonous, automobiles can be disciplined by a well-directed sock in the eye, and every stranger with a foreign accent is a spy.29

28 Ibid., pp. 26-27, passim.
29 Ibid., p. 147.
Signal reactions, then, tend to produce, through oversimplification and primary certitude, a false-to-fact and rather frightening world—a world of phantoms, a world in which nothing changes and in which gradations of any sort are unknown.

There are, however, several principles which may be of help in arriving at a solution of the problems listed a moment ago.

1. As Lee recommends, the individual should acquire consciousness of abstracting—the realization that in using language, one abstracts some details and omits others—as a habitual reaction.\(^\text{30}\) (It is essential also that he be conscious of abstracting in different orders. All workingmen are not alike, nor are all Jews.)

2. The individual may use such devices as the how-what-when test and index numbers—as Chase suggests—to remind himself that an abstraction is being used and that he must exercise care in the use and interpretation of the term. (The use of the how-what-when test will help to pin abstractions down and make them specific.\(^\text{31}\) For example, if an individual says, "I don't like Germans," the listener or reader, in using this test would want definite information: How does the speaker define Germans? What Germans? When?

Index numbers and dates set off individuals from each other and help to remind the individual that persons, rather than humanity as a whole, exists. The use of dates—John 1958, John 1957, indicates that

---

\(^{30}\) Lee, op. cit., p. 63.

\(^{31}\) Chase, op. cit., pp. 92, 93.
John in 1958 is quite different from what he was in 1957.\textsuperscript{32)

3. The individual should realize that descriptive statements are not inferential statements.\textsuperscript{33} (One can measure the dimensions of a building; one can infer its uses; or one can form judgments about the style of construction. Confusion of the two types of mental activity leads to the formation of signal reactions. Lee cites the story of a man in a hotel room, who, wishing to get fresh air, tried to open a window. Unable to do so, he broke what he thought was a window glass, and went back to sleep. In the morning, he discovered that he had broken the glass in a bookcase. Nevertheless, he had slept soundly. His inferences were stronger than the facts.\textsuperscript{34})

4. Though realizing that there is no essential connection between the word and what it stands for, the individual should strive to promote in himself symbol reactions, instead of signal reactions. (A symbol reaction is "a delayed reaction, conditioned upon the circumstances."\textsuperscript{35} Such a reaction means thought, discrimination, the making of a decision on the basis of evidence available, rather than on an automatic response. Thought, always related to memory and experience, should be in the order of sensation, reflection, and action.)

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{32}Korzybski, \textit{op. cit.}, pp. xxviii, xxxix.
\textsuperscript{33}Lee, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 204.
\textsuperscript{34}\textit{Ibid.}, p. 197.
\textsuperscript{35}S. I. Hayakawa, \textit{Language in Action}, p. 27.
\end{flushright}
Having considered the nature of abstraction and some of the problems resulting from its use, we may now turn to the next section of the chapter, a discussion of symbols.

SYMBOLS

A differentiation between sign and symbol, made by Ogden and Richards, as well as by Walpole, should first be taken into account. According to Walpole, "a sign is a part of an experience, that part which, coming back to the animal's attention, has the same effect as the complete experience had in the past." For example, a person, for the first time, snaps an electrical wall switch to turn on the lights in the room. The action of flipping the switch is not a sign at first. Later, however, with repetition, pressing the switch evokes other details which had on earlier occasions accompanied the manipulation of the switch; thus this stimulus results in a reaction similar to that evoked by the original stimulus.

Ogden and Richards explain the wide variation in individual interpretation of signs in the following manner:

The effects upon the organism due to any sign, which may be any stimulus from without, or any process taking place within, depend upon the past history of the organism, both generally and in a more precise fashion. In a sense, no doubt, the whole past history is relevant; but there will be some among the past events in that history which will more directly determine the nature of the present agitation than others. . . .

36 Walpole, op. cit., p. 77.
When a context has affected us in the past the recurrence of merely a part of the context will cause us to react in the way in which we reacted before.\(^{37}\)

Symbols differ from signs in two significant respects: a symbol is more abstract than a sign, and is a stimulus provided for the \textit{intentional} communication of meaning.\(^{38}\) Thus, there appears to be justification for emphasizing the idea that a symbol \textit{stands for} something—an object or idea.

Human interpretation is essential for words to be symbols (words used referentially); therefore there is a relationship between the symbol, the thought, and the referent.\(^{39}\) This relationship is illustrated by the Ogden-Richards Triangle of Reference.

![Triangle of Reference Diagram](image)

As Ballard remarks, and as the Triangle indicates, a symbol refers to the world of individual experience and on the other hand, to the outer world of objective reality.\(^{40}\) Two notes of caution should be

\(^{37}\text{Ogden and Richards, op. cit., pp. 52, 53, passim.}\)
\(^{38}\text{Walpole, op. cit., p. 79.}\)
\(^{39}\text{Ibid., pp. 78, 79.}\)
\(^{40}\text{Ballard, op. cit., pp. 44-45.}\)
sounded here, however. First, the relationship between the thought and the referent is direct in the case of an object, indirect in the case of an idea.\textsuperscript{11} Compare, for instance, the relationship in the following situations: speaking or writing of a "real" table before one in a room, and speaking or writing of the major idea in De Quincey's "On the Knocking at the Gate in Macbeth." In the first example, the use of words is based primarily on sense impressions; in the second, on consideration of the world, literature, the play, and the referent. Second, as the structural differential emphasizes, there is no direct connection, except for gesture, between the word and the symbol.\textsuperscript{12}

Examples of the symbolic process are numerous and illuminating. Uniforms are worn to indicate or stand for certain types of work; members of the military, air, and naval forces wear them, as do guards and railroad workers. In academic life, keys represent scholastic achievement. On the whole, the symbolic process, based on human comprehension of certain objects or ideas standing for other objects or ideas, makes possible both language and the human achievements dependent upon language.\textsuperscript{13}

In view of the potentialities of symbols, and the achievements which they make possible, it seems clear that certain problems will arise in their use. The most significant of these is probably the

\textsuperscript{11}Ogden and Richards, op. cit., p. 11.
\textsuperscript{12}Ibid., p. 4.
\textsuperscript{13}S. I. Hayakawa, Language in Action, pp. 28-29.
confusion of word with referent. Now causal relations do exist between the thought and the symbol. Symbolism is influenced by the purpose and attitude of the speaker or writer: the listener, in seeking the referent, will adopt a mental attitude similar to that of the writer. Yet the matter goes deeper. If, as Stern says, "The meaning of a word, in any individual use in speech, is completely determined by its relation to the three factors, word, referent, and subject," then it seems that the confusion of word with referent is a major cause of failure in communication. This type of confusion is illustrated by the story of Rumpelstiltskin, in which the spell was dissolved by the magic in the name. Or, one may take the word chair. The word is not the object: one cannot sit on the word.

Another problem has as its background and its cause the process called change. In one sense of the word, Shelley uttered a profound truth when he said, "Naught may endure but mutability." The process of change goes on endlessly, and affects the entire world as we know it. Lee's statement is eloquent:

*The winds, the rains, and the snows; the ebb and flow of the waves and currents of the sea; the shifting clouds; the rhythms of the seasons ceaselessly changing; the growth and aging of animals and men; the nervous dartings*

---

44 Ogden and Richards, *op. cit.*, pp. 10-11.


46 Walpole, *op. cit.*, p. 82.
of the vehicles on the streets; the hum and drive of the
dynamos and power houses; the turning colors and dimensions
of the things that grow in the fields—these are but a hint
of the slow changes we perceive about us, an ever so brief
list of the endless and sometimes haphazard flux of our
"restless universe."^7

This process of eternal change affects points of view. Consider the
changes in the matter of morals, for example. In 1958, there is much
greater freedom from the pressure of convention, and conversely, more
stress on the individual's philosophy and moral code than in 1858.
The "emancipation" of women, and the growing insistence that an
individual's actions are his own affair so long as others are not
harmed—an attitude which has deeply affected sex mores—are specific
instances. Or, to take another example, consider how much the inter-
pretation of Plato's Republic has changed during twenty-five hundred
years. In Plato's time, to select one phase, slavery was accepted as
an inevitable and acceptable element of social organization; slowly,
the belief grew that—at least, before the law—all men are equal.
Sensed by the Romans and embodied in their law if not in their
practice, growing steadily over the centuries, this belief represents
a basic change in the interpretation of Plato's famous work.

As the world changes, so does the individual. Often, the use
of language does not reflect the process of change; instead, it
gives an impression of stability and finality. Lee cites the case of
a woman who, in 1936, was insulted by another woman. The feud con-
tinued through the years, even though, in 1941, the conditions and
the individuals had changed. The language—"She insulted me, and I

---

^7 Lee, op. cit., p. 71.
won't forget it!"—in no way reflects the change of circumstances.\textsuperscript{48}

Change, then, may take place at all three points of the Triangle—referent, thought, symbol. The individual changes—in attitudes, reactions, decisions. The thought changes; consider how the interpretation of the philosophy of Aristotle has altered during the centuries. For instance, he believed that heavy bodies fall faster than light ones, and worked out a sliding scale of the proportion of the speed of falling to weight. The law of identity—"A is A"—is being questioned seriously, too.\textsuperscript{49} The symbol changes: to cite two examples, the word \textit{dumb} is now often uncomplimentary in connotation, while the word \textit{woman} has risen in the social scale.

There are certain principles which may provide assistance in efforts to arrive at a solution of the problems which have just been discussed. The principles are as follows:

1. By recalling the Triangle of Reference, the individual should realize that the word itself is not the object, and that there is no direct connection between the symbol and the object.

2. The danger of believing that words have a separate life of their own can be largely avoided by remembering that in dealing with symbols, the order should be referent, thought, symbol. (A symbol is an effect, not a cause.\textsuperscript{50}) Moreover, as the discussion of signs

\textsuperscript{48} Lee, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 71.

\textsuperscript{49} Chase, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 209.

\textsuperscript{50} Walpole, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 104.
and symbols indicate (and as we shall note further in the discussion of contexts), the referent is interpreted through the past and present experience of the reader or listener.)

3. Among the rules set up by Ogden and Richards for the effective use of symbols are the following, which may be helpful:

   a. A symbol must stand only for one referent.
   (It might be observed that because of the nature of language, there is a difficulty at this point. Consider, for example, the word tongue. The question might arise as to the way in which the precise referent is determined. This question will be answered, in part at least, in the section on contexts.)

   b. Symbols which can be substituted for each other stand for the same referent.
   (Levels of usage complicate the rule to some extent: for instance, such words as lady, woman, and maid might make somewhat complicated the process of deciding upon the referent in a given passage.)

   c. The referent of a contracted symbol is the referent of that symbol expanded. "Hamlet was mad" is a contracted symbol, needing to be expanded before it can be discussed. "Hamlet was mad on the stage" or "in my interpretation of the play" may be expanded symbols for what is referred to. 52

51 Ogden and Richards, op. cit., pp. 88-106, passim.
52 Ibid., p. 93.
(This rule, then, often concerns both connotation and the uses of forms of to be to ascribe qualities to nouns. These topics will be discussed later in this chapter.)

d. A symbol stands for a specific referent, rather than what the reader or listener wishes it to refer to.

(This rule involves the attainment of accuracy in interpretation through close attention to contexts in order to decide which of several alternative interpretations appear most tenable. If we have the sentence, "Traffic is heavy on this street," there is need for drawing on the experience of the reader or listener, as well as careful interpretation of contexts, to find the correct referents for traffic, heavy, and street. How, for instance, does one decide just what "heavy" traffic is? Finally, the how-what-when test may also advantageously be used here.)

Let us turn now to the next major topic for discussion, the types of context.

CONTEXTS

Walpole's definition of context seems to be a serviceable one: "The context of anything is the frame or field or setting in which it exists."53 For practical purposes, context may be considered as meaning the situation or state of being prevailing at the time of the use of the word or phrase, and the words preceding and following the word or phrase in the given sentence.

53 Walpole, op. cit., p. 110.
Thus, a consideration of context involves not only evaluating --interpreting--a word in its relationship to the others in the passage but considering the referent in the light of one's experience. We learn the meanings of words through associating certain words with certain situations--in other words, through context. A little boy may clearly understand the meaning of punishment after he has been paddled for skating in the middle of the street. Or, let us turn to Walpole's more complex situation:

An Australian family deeply interested in cricket is following a series of test matches, of which so far Australia and England have won two each. Father comes in one evening and announces that "Bradman has broken a finger." The whole family knows that these words "mean" far more than their five words say. Their meaning depends upon a context which is not a verbal one but a context of happenings in which Don Bradman has played an important part, and a context of hopes and calculations and fears in minds of the members of this Australian family.55

Here, as in all verbal statement, utterance and situation are closely connected; and the meaning of the statement depends upon what Malinowski terms the "context of situation."56

Three types of context may be classified and defined. The verbal context of a word or group of words is comprised of the rest of the words in the sentence, but especially those immediately preceding and following the word or group of words involved. The physical context is made up of what may be termed the "objective facts" surrounding the speaking or writing of words: The time and

54 S. I. Hayakawa, Language in Action, p. 60.
place at which the words were spoken or written, and the circumstances or conditions prevailing around the speaker or writer. The psychological context is comprised of the experiential background and the mood or attitude of the speaker or writer.

Every individual puts together his experiences with words and his experiences with objects and weaves them into an outlook, a way of thinking—what the Germans call a Weltanschauung. There are two thousand millions of different psychological contexts in the world.57

Examples of each of these types of context may serve further to clarify the discussion. Verbal context is helpful in the following discussion: A scholar, in commenting on the textual accuracy of a drama, makes the following statement: "This text of the play seems correct as far as we know at this time." Here the words preceding and following correct define and limit its significance. The physical conditions surrounding the use of correct must be considered in the following example: A nervous hostess, anxious to make a good impression on her guests, makes a final inspection of the arrangement of the dinner table, and remarks, "That is correct, I hope." Here the circumstances—the social occasion and the power of convention—help define the meaning of the word. The thoughts of the speaker or writer—his experiential background and his mood—aid considerably in the interpretation of the demagogue’s statement, "I know that my interpretation is correct; it is the only one possible!" Here, the "either-or" approach (two-valued orientation) warns the reader to use great care in interpreting the term in this context.

57 Walpole, op. cit., p. 114.
The preceding examples should serve not only to show that, as Bridgman says, "Words in language are part of a stream of activity," and to clarify the definition of the three types of context, but also to indicate the first of the major difficulties in the understanding of contexts: the fact that although no two contexts are at any time exactly the same, they overlap and interact. As Seely says, "The whole thought is what is important. Its elements are of significance only to the extent that they support the whole and make it clear and understandable." If, in an advertisement, a book reviewer is quoted as saying, "This is an excellent book," when what he actually said was, "This is an excellent book of its kind, if one cares for that sort of trash," the context is ignored and the whole intended meaning of the sentence is changed. This ignoring of contexts can also occur in the use of the spoken word. If a famous statesman is quoted as saying that no foreign entanglements should be entered into, whereas he really said that no foreign entanglements should be entered into except in time of emergency, when they might be advantageous, the meaning is altered here, too. In this connection, it might be well to remember that a major linguistic premise is that no word has exactly the same meaning twice. Moreover, we cannot know in advance what a word means; we can only know approximately what it will mean.


60 S. I. Hayakawa, Language in Action, p. 66.
In spoken language, interpretation rests more upon comprehension of physical and psychological contexts than upon the verbal. Conversation, thus can be elliptical if not fragmentary without a breakdown of communication. In written language, however, interpretation must depend almost entirely upon understanding of verbal context. The circumstances surrounding the writer—not to mention his thoughts—are often difficult to discover. (Implicit here, of course, is the reason for the use of considerable biographical and general background material in courses in literature. Such contextual material can and often does facilitate interpretation.)

In written language, verbal context is especially significant; and the writer should supply a clear verbal context if he wishes communication to be fully successful. The student in English who wrote the response quoted below did not supply the necessary verbal context. (The question was as follows: "In what respects are lines 78-97 in 'The Sensitive Plant' different from Coleridge?")

This passage does not have as daring and original imagination. It does not deal so fully with the supernatural. There is no sentimentalism shown in this passage such as in "The Ancient Mariner."

Disregarding at this time the connotations of "daring" and "original," and the slanting in "does not deal so fully," we see that a major word here is "sentimentalism." Highly connotative and often used in name-calling, the word is not defined or qualified, just as the

61 A course given at The Ohio State University in the Romantic period in English literature.
others mentioned are not. All that the reader really comprehends is that the student indicates that he does not particularly care for "The Ancient Mariner."

Having considered several major problems in the understanding of contexts and having stressed that awareness of all three types of context is essential for adequate interpretation of verbal language, the writer lists below two relevant principles.

1. For meaningful communication, the speaker or writer should keep in mind the experiential background of the listener or reader. (One of the possible results of disregarding this principle is described by Max Eastman:

   Joyce [James Joyce] was reading his lines [Anna Livia Plurabelle] for me to "give pleasure" to me, lines on which he had worked six hundred hours and woven into them the names of five hundred rivers, and yet I did not hear one river. I have examined them particularly since and have not yet found more than three and a half rivers. Moreover, having had something to do with inductive and deductive logic, I know that if it took six hundred hours to weave those rivers into that prose, it will take something like six thousand hours to weave them out. I cannot help asking myself how many people will do this work, and how much fun they will have doing it. If Joyce's artistic pleasure is really to give pleasure to others, it seems fair to say that he has wasted about five hundred of those six hundred hours burying the names of those rivers where people who might happen to want them would not be able to find them. 62

   It seems clear that verbal context alone is not enough to insure efficient communication. All three sides of the Triangle, and all three types of context, must be taken into consideration.)

---

2. Meaning is determined by contexts. (This principle rests on two assertions made during the discussion of the process of abstraction: (1) full details are not given about any object when verbal language is used: (2) no two people select exactly the same characteristics when observing the same object.

As soon as a thing is named, the entire contextual system in which the thing is conceived to belong, along with all the doctrinal notions and judgments that comprise that system, are invoked. . . . If there is any doubt that contexts work in this way, consider the differences in social status and self-esteem that exist between two sets of public servants who perform similar menial tasks, "airline hostesses" and "Pullman porters." 63

Moreover, since the listener's or reader's comprehension of the contexts determines the degree of effectiveness in communication, it appears that there is no one right way of wording a statement. 64

"Who but a god goes woundless all the way?" could be phrased in many impressive ways; all—if the selection of terms were made with insight and understanding—would signify, to the well-read student of classic drama, the tragedy inherent in human life, the spirit of free inquiry, and the clear-eyed courage of humanity. Finality is a relative term.)

The next topic to be discussed is the use of forms of to be, and concerns especially the use of this verb to indicate identity and the possession of qualities, in short its use as a linking verb.

---

64 Walpole, op. cit., p. 118.
THE USES OF TO BE

Four uses of to be are listed by Lee: (1) To be may be used as an auxiliary in the formation of the passive voice and of various tenses: He was rewarded. He is going. (2) To be may be used as a word denoting existence; God is. The book is there. (3) With a predicate nominative, to be may be used to indicate the identity of different levels of abstraction: He is a wastrel. This man is a soldier. (4) To be may be used with a predicate adjective to ascribe qualities to nouns: The man was unkind. The house is red. The use of forms of to be in these sentences suggests that the qualities are in the nouns.

In the discussion of the last two uses—for the first and second appear to be obvious and easily-understood functions—let us consider first the so-called "is of identity."

Let us refer for a moment to the structural differential. The lowest level is that of the process, phenomenon, or event. The first-order abstraction is the object, abstracted by the nervous system. This level—sense perception—varies with every observer, and, like the first level, is non-verbal or silent. The word Bessie (cow₁) is a second-order abstraction, and cow is a higher one, for further
characteristics have been omitted. Now, if a man, pointing to Bessie, says, "This is a cow," the is in the sentence does not appear to be true to facts; for it does not reveal clearly, through structural implications, that abstractions of different orders have been identified, or considered as being on the same level of abstraction.  

Lee maintains that the use of a form of to be followed by a noun constitutes, therefore, a naming process: The term or name used will grow out of the details which the user decides to select. The selection will be influenced by the purposes and convenience of the user, as in the following example:

We say our candidate is a "statesman" and has "vision" and "ideas." How do we express these facts about the opposing candidate? We say he is a "politician," a "visionary," and that he has "theories."  

The most significant problem growing out of the use of the is of identity appears to be the creation of a spurious finality based on the impression that the naming mentioned above tells the whole story. As Hayakawa remarks,

Most people have a number of basic "certainties"; they know what "Jews," or "Stalinists," or "Trotskites," or "bankers," or "workingmen," or "niggers," or "the masses," really "are." Armed with such "impersonal" and "objective" knowledge, they "know what the situation calls for." In nine cases out of ten their "knowledge" may be good enough for immediate purposes, so that the extent of error may be negligible. But in the tenth

---

case the discrepancy between their "knowledge" and the event they are trying to appraise is so great that the action they resolve upon will be so inappropriate that it can only be regarded as insane. The reader can multiply examples at will, from the fully conditioned Pavlovian dog, that drips saliva at the ringing of a bell, whether food is brought to it or not . . . to the pre-Einstein physicist who cannot make head or tail out of Einstein because he already "knows" what "time" and "space" really "are." It is not the content of this kind of "knowledge" that is the principal difficulty; it is the fact that such "knowledge" is so fixed that it makes the acquisition of additional information impossible. 68

The principles listed below may be of assistance in arriving at a solution of this problem.

1. The use of the is of identity causes false-to-fact evaluation.69 (The nature of abstraction, as well as the process of change, makes identity—"absolute sameness in all respects"70—impossible, as Lee explains in the following example:

A thoroughgoing consciousness of abstracting reveals immediately the false-to-fact character of the "is" of identity pattern. In front of me I find what is called a "pencil." At deeper levels it is "known" as an electronic dance, a process. With my nervous system I abstract the object and I call it, leaving out many details, a "pencil." Leaving out more details, I move to higher levels, saying, "a very useful instrument." The abstracted object thus appeared at a level different from the verbal abstraction "pencil." If we would elucidate properly, these must be seen as different products of a human nervous system and not one and the same.71

The faulty evaluation which has been mentioned here is based

69 Korzybski, op. cit., p. 400.
70 Lee, op. cit., p. 234.
71 Ibid., p. 231.
primarily, then, on the identification of words with objects and on
the confusion of verbal levels of abstraction. The use of such
devices as index numbers and dates will help to specify experiences
and ideas and to classify the relationship of these experiences and
ideas with the words used to represent them.\(^72\)

2. The classification decided upon for an object is largely
dependent upon the wishes and interests of the speaker or writer at
a given time.\(^73\) (For example, quoting Earnest Hooton as writing,
"I am a frequent radio listener, and it is my considered opinion
that what comes over the air is mostly cacophony, lies, and imbecilic
nonsense," Lee remarks,

For a moment suppose that Mr. Hooton had written
the . . . sentence . . . this way:

I am a frequent radio listener, and it is my considered
opinion after listening to these soap-operas [with a list
of titles], these advertising plugs [with samples written
out], and these "advising" gentlemen [with names], etc.,
that these may be verbally classified as cacophony, lies,
and imbecilic nonsense.

The "is" having been eliminated, and the kinds of
programs designated, Mr. Hooton is probably justified in
making his classification. He then shows that his naming
grew out of specific interests and ways of looking at
indexed items at a date. The original form of his state­
ment, however, seemed to emphasize (in spite of the
"mostly") an unlimited evaluation.\(^74\)

The substitution of "may be classified as" for a form of to be
followed by a noun may serve—whether used in thought or in speech—to

\(^72\) Ibid., pp. 252-253.

\(^73\) Loc. cit.

\(^74\) Ibid., pp. 239-240. (The interpolations are Lee's.)
remind the user that there are many ways of classification.)

The use of a form of to be followed by an adjective—a construction which Lee terms the is of predication—is related, in nature and in the problems which its use produces, to the is of identity. In both cases the verb is used copulatively. One says, for example, "The book is green." The difficulty here arises from the implication that the word green symbolizes an objective existence, that it is something added to the book. Rather than being something which can be pointed to, as the object "book" can be, the greenness represents a relationship between the observer and the object or idea—a relationship which can be termed the result of the reaction of the nervous system of the individual to the object.

The use of is, therefore, to ascribe qualities to objects or ideas may result in rigid interpretation, caused by the impression that objects or ideas possess the qualities named, and that what is "perceived" or "seen" means the attainment of "truth" and "finality." The following passage from a student's paper in English 563 is an example. The question to be answered is as follows: "What important differences are there between the story of Ruth and that of Samson?"

---

75 Ibid., p. 243.
76 Ibid., p. 244.
77 Ibid., p. 247.
78 A course given at The Ohio State University in masterpieces of English literature written before 1675.
Part of the response is quoted below.

On the other hand, Ruth [the book of Ruth] is slight in its emotional appeal and even sentimental. It is a lovely and idyllic story, telling of human love and true religion. The story is simple and pure.

These words represent the impressions of the student, not the qualities possessed by the book of Ruth. It is quite possible, therefore, that another observer might experience different reactions to the work in question. It might be observed, for instance, that many readers have believed that the story of Ruth possesses considerable emotional appeal, and have cited cogent reasons for their belief. On the whole, the use of is in these sentences seems to give the reader the impression that one who does not perceive in the book of Ruth the qualities listed in the response is stupid or unperceptive: the student has seen these qualities; they must, therefore, be present.

Finally, misunderstanding and bitterness may result from the difference in impression caused by the use of high-order abstractions after is. Because of the impression of finality and the way these abstract words have of being all things to all men, the above statement appears to be especially true in such controversial areas as politics and religion. The problem here may be illustrated by Disraeli’s famous comment on Gladstone. As Woods says,

His Gladstone’s moral purpose was always emphasized, but by a slight shifting of words, it was possible for his arch opponent, Disraeli, to smear out the picture. Someone on the Liberal side had risen in Parliament to ask if there was a question in any one’s mind concerning the conscience of Mr. Gladstone. Disraeli replied, "There can be no question about the weight of Mr. Gladstone’s conscience, but too often his conscience is not his guide but his accomplice."79

79 Frederick Adams Woods, "Oily Words." In Taylor, op. cit., p. 421.
Principles which may be of assistance in an effort to reach a solution of these problems are as follows:

1. In using a form of to be, the employment of the expression "appears . . . to me" will help remind the user that the impressions are produced by the nervous system and are, therefore, within the individual rather than being in the outside world.\(^{80}\) (Awareness of the fact just mentioned is the significant idea here, rather than the employment of a pattern of words.)

2. In speech and writing, the use of descriptive levels—lower-order abstractions—is more conducive to the achievement of agreement than the use of high levels of abstraction.\(^{81}\) (For example, an individual says of another, "He's stupid." An application of the how-what-when test, mentioned in the section on abstractions and their use, would probably produce elucidation. In what ways does he seem to exhibit a lack of intelligence? What, specifically, has he done to warrant the judgment exemplified in the adjective? Where did all these observed facts take place?)

3. Is, like other words, may be used directly, that is, so as to influence human action. (As Hayakawa says, in a passage that affords further explanation of the term, as well as a warning to exercise care in its use,)

---

\(^{80}\) Lee, op. cit., p. 246.

\(^{81}\) Ibid., p. 249.
Such statements as "A Boy Scout is chivalrous and clean and brave" or "Policemen are defenders of the weak" set up goals and do not necessarily describe the present situation. This is extremely important, because all too often people understand such definitions as being descriptive and are therefore shocked, horrified, and disillusioned upon encountering a Boy Scout who is not chivalrous or a policeman who is a bully.82)

The next major aspect to be discussed is the two-valued orientation, to which the writer now proposes to turn.

THE TWO-VALUED ORIENTATION

The term two-valued orientation may be defined as the tendency to interpret ideas in terms of two opposing values only: love and hate, strong and weak, good and bad, and so on. For example, the student who wrote the following response has disregarded entirely any middle ground. The question, in History 423, is worded as follows: "How and why was our tariff policy changed between 1930 and 1940?" A portion of the student's answer is quoted below.

This tariff policy was changed because it was hindering world progress rather than helping it. It was shutting us off on an "island" of our own where we were no longer self-sufficient. We needed trade with other countries to help build our economy and theirs.

The student's use of the two-valued orientation, as defined above, is shown in his tacit brushing aside of any middle ground--the antithetical use of "hindering" and "helping"; and the omission of


83 The first course in a sequence (421-422-423) given at the Ohio State University in the history of modern Europe and the United States. History 421 is concerned with the period from the beginning of modern times through the first third of the nineteenth century.
any mention of alternatives or of the possibility of a limited free trade or of a tariff for revenue are aspects of this type of orientation.

When the two-valued orientation is used, major problems in interpretation often arise. It should come as no surprise that oversimplification, with its attendant disregard of gradations and of the process and effects of change, should often appear to be a direct consequence. A largely false and deceptive picture of the world and of humanity thus results; for people are not necessarily either stupid or brilliant, dishonest or honest. Degrees, nuances, shadings in human character—these are shown in literature and in life. Tom Jones, in Fielding's novel of the same name, is a likeable and intelligent man; yet it cannot be contended in strict truth that he always observed the conventions and laws of his country. Every individual can say, with one of Chesterton's characters, "I am a man; therefore, I contain all angels and all devils." The use of the two-valued orientation, "the failure to apply a spectrum analysis to the many different aspects of natural existence," results, then, in a lack of correspondence to fact.84

If many values are present in the world, then the conditions of conflict are prepared when the two-valued orientation is used in such a world.85 Differences of opinion—and they are stated as being

84 Lee, op. cit., p. 182.
85 Ibid., p. 104.
either black or white, right or wrong—are emphasized. All truth and justice are indicated as being on one side; all lies and injustice on the other. Moreover, in controversy, the individual using the two-valued orientation unconsciously forces his opponent to use it too. The level of discussion, under these circumstances, is all too apt to drop to one of assertion and denial, unsupported and unqualified. Thus, as Hayakawa says, "The two-valued orientation produces the combative spirit, but nothing else." 86

These difficulties and problems may be illustrated in the area of politics. The use of the two-valued orientation results in oversimplification of the facts of experience, as has been said, and in the reduction of the number of evaluations. As this type of orientation is often used by demagogues, a selection from Hitler's work may serve as an example here.

One cannot replace a parliamentary system by the mere creation of a new cabinet composed of men who belong to that system. If one wishes to supersede the parliamentary organization, that cannot be done through a clique which seeks to impose its will upon the people. That can only be done by means of an unparliamentary organization which has grown up already from below and has proceeded from the people.

The "either-or" technique that is the basis of the passage seems clear. Everything is black or white, good or bad. The fanaticism that is almost inevitable appears obvious.

Finally, the evaluation of new experience is made difficult. Any departure from the normal will be either "daring, courageous, and farsighted," or "thoughtless, aimless, and impractical." It may be "an advance toward the long-awaited millenium"; it may be "utopian." Of course, those who oppose these changes will be either "hidebound conservatives" or "guardians of the cherished and worthy ways that have been proved by the test of time." No qualifications or gradations are permitted.

The writer believes that certain principles may be of help in arriving at a solution of the problems listed above. These principles are as follows:

1. In the consideration of a problem, the use of a multi-valued, rather than a two-valued, orientation will, by increasing the number of distinctions, augment the number of courses of action available. (We should try to make our use of language reflect the different facts of experience. Instead of calling an individual "stupid," we should consider what the individual characteristics of his behaviour seem to be. Such an orientation will render speech and writing conformable to the world of events, people, objects, and feelings.)

---

89 Ibid., p. 174.
Increased consciousness of "similarities in differences and differences in similarities," as well as the use of index numbers and dates, will aid in preventing the obscuring of differences through identification.91 (In this connection, Hayakawa compares the two-valued orientation in primitive societies to a paddle, which can be used for starting and steering. In civilized societies, however, though this type of orientation arouses interest through emotional appeal--thus being the starter--the multi-valued orientation, true to fact, should be considered the steering apparatus.92)

The last major aspect of semantics to be discussed in this chapter is the use of referential and emotive language. Under this heading, denotation and connotation, as well as metaphor, will be considered.

REFERENTIAL AND EMOTIVE LANGUAGE

Referential language, according to Walpole, is employed with objects which can be described or pointed to; it is used to make statements which are capable of verification or refutation.93 It is used in the expression of scientific theories and hypotheses; and, as far as possible, the employment of highly connotative words, as well as assertions which cannot be verified, is avoided.

Emotive language, on the other hand, reveals and thus

91 Ibid., p. 110.
93 Walpole, op. cit., p. 40.
represents the feelings of the user, and is designed to stimulate those of the reader or listener. Its function, then, is the evocation of attitudes.\textsuperscript{94}

An example of the use of each of these types may serve further to clarify these definitions. The passages to be cited are from examination papers in Economics 671.\textsuperscript{95} The students wrote in answer to a request to enumerate the basic differences and similarities between the Russian and British economic systems. The first response is an instance of the use of referential language—an objective treatment.

Differences:

(a) In planning—the British lack of blueprint due largely to historical background and type of system developed

(b) British bottom up, U.S.S.R. top down economic and political organization—historical in Great Britain, result of system and history in U.S.S.R.

(c) The Soviet system adapts to change and necessity more rapidly—system done by order

(d) The British system works better with other economic systems—outlook of the people and system.

(e) Labor is less integrated in Britain—historic background

(f) More continuity of policy in U.S.S.R.—absence of multiple parties

(g) Soviet system more highly centered around same goals—limitation on criticism, rightness of system

(h) Way in which changes occur—by ballot in Britain, by central decree or plan in U.S.S.R.

\textsuperscript{94}Ogden and Richards, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 149.

\textsuperscript{95}A course given at The Ohio State University in Socialism and related movements prior to 1917.
(i) Private property as a part of British socialism
---historic

(j) The economy of the U.S.S.R. is much more an integrated unit (British still component parts)
---system and history

Similarities—all derive mainly from system

(a) Role of banking as key co-ordinator
(b) Role of the government as owner (though a difference in degree)
(c) Attempts to redistribute income
(d) Refusal to accept unequivocally the decisions of the market place (difference in degree)
(e) Both running at rate of full employment (also due to domestic world situation)
(f) Social responsibilities of government—opposite of laissez-faire
(g) Neither seems to promote international co-ordination to any great degree

In contrast one notices the use of emotive language in what should have been an objective, impersonal exposition:

And now the basic differences between the two economies. The Plan I feel is the culmination of a lot of wrong thinking. Animals work in a sociological group and have little individuality. They are limited as to choice by their own stage of evolution. But here are people—human beings—capable of thinking, choosing, growing, evolving to high forms. And they are being stifled by leaders who are dedicated to material ideals.

Problems in the use of emotive language involve denotation and connotation as well as metaphor. These aspects will be considered in the order of the listing.

Let us consider first the meaning of denotation and connotation. By denotation is meant that which belongs to the definition of a word, that which it points to in the world of events and ideas (the extensional world). Denotation means, then, the

---

dictionary definition of a word—its "actual" meaning. For example, house—whether of wood, stone, brick, or any other material, whether in the city or not—signifies a habitation for an individual or a group.

Connotation signifies that which is suggested by the word, the associations and images evoked. The word home is highly connotative, with the rich associations of affection and devotion which cluster around the word, in addition to its denotative meaning.

Woods, in his essay on connotation, comments on the implications of some often-used connotative words:

The subtle implications, good or bad, conveyed by many of our commonest words through the power of associated ideas have escaped attention. These words imply a little more than they actually state; they are both true and false in a single breath.

For example, at the beginning of the Boer War, London correspondents described the Boers as "sneaking" and "skulking" behind trees and rocks. As soon, however, as the British troops had learned this new and surprising method of warfare, they were described as "cleverly taking advantage of cover." The same facts but what a different picture! 97

Connotation is further divided into informative and affective types, 98 that is, general and personal connotation. Informative or general connotations are those meanings which—as far as meanings can be specifically and definitely given to such words—appear to be generally accepted. Affective or personal connotations are the


personal feelings, including associations and images, evoked by
the word in question. It may be observed, at this point, that the
problem here is similar, in a sense, to that resulting from the use
of abstractions: The speaker or writer, the listener or reader,
must rely on general rather than personal connotations for communi-
cation to be reliable.

A major problem involved in the use of connotation arises
when connotation is used, as it often is, to lead an individual to
accept or reject an idea. For example, in History 423, a student
was asked to "Contrast Hoover's attitude toward the depression with
Roosevelt's attitude toward it." The response follows:

Hoover was a man who felt that less and less social
benefits should be given to the depressed worker. In
other words, Hoover was a man who didn't understand the
lower class principle. He never had known hardship.
In fact, his whole administration was made up of men of
this type.

Hoover felt that the depression was just a cyclical
movement. Thus constantly he kept saying, "Prosperity
is just around the corner." Hoover's greatest fault was
that in reading statistics and articles of such he
didn't take the laborer in mind and it was these very
people who were unemployed. He constantly tried to stay
away as I said before from social benefits. Believing
the depression was cyclical he just established among
other things the Reconstruction Finance Corporation which
gave money to Big Business so as to enable them to start
up operations. But, who would buy these articles? The
people didn't have any money. So this just added up to
the surplus.

Roosevelt, however, was different. He knew the little
man's trouble. He knew that to stop the depression you

99The third course in a sequence (421-422-423) given at The
Ohio State University in the history of modern Europe and the United
States. History 423 is concerned with the twentieth century.
have to get purchasing power into the little man's hand. Roosevelt also established Social Security, enabling sick people and old people to receive money. He established the C. C. C. camps, enabling young men to earn a living by also keeping the U. S. beautiful, by reforestation, reclaiming carried soil.

Roosevelt also established a given strength to labor by the Wagner Act. This established minimum hourly rates, number of hours of work a week. Time and a half for overtime, the right to bargain, etc.

This is the difference.

The use of connotation to influence opinion appears in "social benefits," and "lower-class principle"; the impression is given that Hoover was out of sympathy with the condition of people who had small incomes and little property. The statement that he had never known hardship appears to be a combination of slanting--of which more later--and connotation; "hardship" evokes images of pioneering and suffering, and impressions of resulting rugged strength and endurance. The use of "laborer" arouses sympathy for the (image of) the stalwart, oppressed workingman, and the repetition of the phrase "social benefits" reinforces the impression. The phrase "Big Business"--note that personification is used here--arouses hostility; for the phrase, abstract as it is, evokes an image of a pompous, parasitical individual, grasping moneybags and ready to take more of them. He is, of course, hostile to downtrodden but upright labor. Finally, the word "people" is sweeping but arouses favorable emotion; for this is a republic, in which the people representatively rule.

In the discussion of Roosevelt, the connotation of "little man" is used to influence the reader. It may be mentioned, too, that the
selected details—concerning Social Security, the Civilian Conservation Corps, and the Wagner Labor Relations Act—help to build up the image of a great humanitarian.

It should be mentioned, too, that the two-valued orientation plays a large part in this response; the contrast between the two men becomes "either-or," with Hoover all wrong and Roosevelt all right. Oversimplification accompanies this orientation, with such generalizations as, "This whole administration was made up of men of this type!"

Two principles which may be helpful in arriving at a solution of the problems listed above may be included here:

1. The individual should acquire a clear understanding of the general connotation of the words in question. Personal connotation should be subordinated to general.

2. Close attention to context and the conscious use of a multi-valued orientation will also be of considerable assistance in the avoidance of oversimplification during the analysis of connotation.

Let us now turn to another significant aspect of the topic of referential and emotive language: the use of metaphor.

The term metaphor as used here is employed to refer to all figurative uses of language. The term is defined as follows by Richards: "two thoughts of different things active together and supported by a single word, or phrase, whose meaning is a resultant of their interaction."\[100\] The function of metaphor is to suggest an

analogy between the object or idea literally denoted by the word or phrase and the usual referent of the word or phrase.

Our dependence on metaphor is shown by the fact that we use language largely through a process of association, of comparison of the new with the old, on the basis of experience. The use of language, in speech and in writing, reflects this process. The presence and the persistence of such so-called "dead" metaphors as the "neck" of a bottle—metaphors in the use of which we often do not think of the implied analogy—tend to bear out the preceding statement. Many metaphors, such as "the lion's share," are clichés; others, some excellent examples of which may be found in modern slang, are fresh and new. It appears, then, that the use of experience to interpret the new is closely connected with the fact that language is essentially metaphorical.

An example of the use of metaphor may assist in showing some of the uses and the problems in the employment of metaphor. In History 421 a student was asked to write on the following question: "Explain what Palmer means when he says that the American Revolution was not a local event, but that its consequences were largely European and that they affected all the peoples of the Western world." A portion of the response follows.

---

102 The first course in a sequence (421-422-423) given at The Ohio State University in the history of modern Europe and the United States. History 421 is concerned with the period from the beginning of modern times through the first third of the nineteenth century.
America was used by a lot of countries as a guinea pig—if the minority (Americans considered as British subjects) could hold out against the majority for their rights. If they could—then the Western world would be able to get new strength from this.

It should be noted that—as often happens—several semantic problems occur in one passage. Here we see the use of an undefined high-order abstraction ("rights") and, in the last sentence, a vague and undeveloped generalization.

Our principal interest at this point, however, is in the use of metaphor. First, America is a guinea pig; the metaphor evokes associations of experimentation, not always precise or carefully defined. Then we have the minority "holding out"—image of beleaguered heroes—for undefined and apparently far-away "rights" which, in the context, might just as well be privileges.

Several problems are involved in the use of metaphor. First, it can be and often is used in name-calling. In name-calling, even though there is no actual relationship existent between the original object or idea and the term used to imply analogy, the use of metaphor shows the user's attitude and attempts to arouse a belief in relationship. Such words as bureaucrat, dictator, and fascist are often used in this manner. It is true, of course, that metaphor can also be used to praise. A man can be called a Spartan, or a Napoleon, or a tiger. The point is, however, that one aspect is made to serve—as a spearhead—to imply a thoroughgoing similarity.

The following response illustrates some of the dangers inherent
in the use of metaphor. The student was asked, in Economics 400, to reply to the following question: "Explain the subsequent economic changes (i.e., once laissez-faire had been established) which resulted in modification of the policy of laissez-faire." The response is as follows:

On the whole, economy and especially industrialization developed into the huge monster it is today. We have learned that a laissez-faire policy alone could not exist as it might have in days when industries were a baby.

In the sentences, such abstractions as "industrialization" and "industries" figure largely; the referents are not clear. The whole matter, moreover, is oversimplified.

The metaphor, in which we are chiefly interested at this point, is an instance of implied analogy rather than a linguistic reflection of an inherent similarity. The state of mind of the writer is revealed; he believes that the process of industrialization—the building of great factories, the growth of large cities, the breakdown of home industry—has harmed man in some unspecified ways (probably esthetic development). He tries to persuade the reader, through the transition from the pleasing word "baby" to the unpleasant word "monster" that the analogy implied actually exists.

Another major problem resulting from the use of metaphor appears to be what is called "slanting." The term is defined as

\[103\text{A course given at The Ohio State University in the development of modern economic society.}\]
"the process of selecting details favorable or unfavorable to the object being described."\textsuperscript{104} Slanting involves not only abstractions but connotative words and metaphor.

An example of slanting may be found in the following response to an examination question in Economics 520.\textsuperscript{105} The question to be answered is as follows: "Instead of money, what else could a country do to achieve purchasing power parity or an advantage?" The student's answer is quoted below.

In a depression prices may be just cut to unload goods on a foreign market and stimulate internal employment. This will only work on the short run. It only leads to cutthroat price wars and in a depression and everyone ends by losing.

The unfavorable connotation of "unload" is used to build up a two-valued orientation—either-or—which is somewhat strengthened by "foreign." The assertion "This will only work on the short run" is unexplained, but helps to build up opinion against the cutting of prices. Metaphors—"unload" and "cutthroat price wars"—are used to influence opinion.

The writer believes that the principles listed below may be of help in arriving at a solution of these problems:

1. The user of metaphor should be certain that the analogy between the object or idea and the word or phrase used is a legitimate one. (Notable exceptions must be made, apparently, in

\textsuperscript{104} S. I. Hayakawa, \textit{Language in Action}, p. 49.

\textsuperscript{105} A course in money and banking, given at The Ohio State University.
advertising and in political persuasion. Consciousness of the danger as well as the power of metaphor is imperative.)

2. In the selection of details, an effort should be made to keep the discussion balanced; both favorable and unfavorable details should be included.

3. In literature, emotive language is understood as being used for purposes of enjoyment; in other areas, such as political persuasion, its use must be carefully scrutinized for its correspondence with facts.

The writer has arrived at a definition of semantics which can be used for the purposes of the study; has defined a number of terms used in semantics; has discussed several major semantic problems; and has enumerated principles which may be of assistance in arriving at a solution of the problems.

In the next chapter, the writer proposes to discuss ways in which semantics, especially those principles discussed in this chapter, can be helpful in attaining the educational aims listed in Chapter II—in other words, the contribution which an improved understanding of the relationships between language and reality can contribute to the aims of higher education.
CHAPTER IV

THE CONTRIBUTIONS OF SEMANTICS TO THE ATTAINMENT
OF THE GOALS OF HIGHER EDUCATION

In Chapter II, the writer arrived at the statement of aims of higher education which will serve as a basis for this study. In Chapter III, a number of major semantic problems and principles were discussed. The writer now proposes to show the contributions which these basic principles of semantics can make to the attainment of the aims discussed in Chapter II.

First, in this chapter, the aims of higher education will be listed as they were presented in Chapter II. The next step will consist of an effort to demonstrate the adequacy and inclusiveness of the six basic principles of semantics employed. The third portion of the chapter will present an analysis of the potential contributions of the principles concerning the use of abstraction, symbolism, contexts, form of to be, the multi-valued orientation, and referential and emotive language to the attainment of each of the eight aims of higher education.

First, then, the following list of the aims of higher education is presented in the belief that its inclusion here may be helpful and convenient for the reader in following the discussion:

I. TO PROVIDE FOR SELF-DEVELOPMENT TO THE LIMIT OF THE CAPACITY OF THE INDIVIDUAL
II. THROUGH CULTIVATING A DISPOSITION FOR CO-OPERATIVE INQUIRY, TO DEVELOP CHARACTER BASED ON SUCH QUALITIES AS INTEGRITY, SELF-DISCIPLINE, AND TOLERANCE

III. TO ASSIST THE STUDENT TO DEVELOP SKILL IN THE USE OF LOGICAL THOUGHT

IV. TO TRANSMIT THE VERIFIED KNOWLEDGE OF THE RACE

V. TO DISCIPLINE THE INDIVIDUAL REALLY TO ACCOMMODATE HIMSELF TO THOSE CONDITIONS AND LAWS NOT SUBJECT TO CHANGE AND TO EXERCISE HIS PRODUCTIVE FACULTIES ON THE MODIFIABLE FACTORS IN THE PHYSICAL AND HUMAN ENVIRONMENT

VI. TO OFFER AS MANY OPPORTUNITIES AS POSSIBLE FOR LEARNING THROUGH DOING AND FOR SOCIAL PARTICIPATION

VII. TO STRIVE FOR AN ADJUSTMENT BETWEEN FREEDOM AND AUTHORITY WHICH INCLUDES RESPECT FOR BOTH INDIVIDUALITY AND SOCIAL DEMANDS

VIII. TO IMPART AN UNDERSTANDING OF THE NATURE OF MIND AND OF MATTER

In Chapter III, the writer enumerated a number of principles, the application of which, in his opinion, would contribute considerably to the solution of major problems in the use of verbal language. The writer has summarized the statements in the six fundamental principles listed below, and believes that they are sufficiently comprehensive to include those discussed in detail in Chapter III, and that they are better adapted than are the latter to the discussion which forms the major portion of the present chapter. He will demonstrate the validity of this contention by analyzing in detail the first of the six statements cited below.

I. IN THE PROCESS OF ABSTRACTION AS CARRIED ON BY THE NERVOUS SYSTEM AND BY LANGUAGE, SOME DETAILS ARE SELECTED; OTHERS ARE ABSTRACTED.

II. THE WORD IS NOT THE OBJECT.
III. THE MEANING OF A WORD OR GROUP OF WORDS IS DETERMINED BY CONTEXTS.

IV. THE USE OF FORMS OF TO BE TO IDENTIFY OR CLASSIFY APPEARS TO BE FALSE TO FACT, SINCE THE FIRST USE CONFUSES LEVELS OF ABSTRACTION, AND THE SECOND PROJECTS QUALITIES INTO OBJECTS.

V. A MULTI-VALUED ORIENTATION WILL INCREASE THE NUMBER OF DISTINCTIONS AND THUS HELP TO RENDER LANGUAGE SIMILAR IN STRUCTURE TO FACT.

VI. A CLEAR DISTINCTION SHOULD BE MADE BETWEEN REFERENTIAL LANGUAGE, WHICH IS INTENDED TO TRANSMIT VERIFIABLE INFORMATION, AND EMOTIVE LANGUAGE, WHICH IS DESIGNED TO INFLUENCE THE EMOTIONS AND ACTIONS OF THE READER.

In the consideration of the adequacy of the first of these principles, it may be well to list the four statements included in Chapter III in the course of the discussion of the process of abstraction, since these statements will form the basis of the discussion of the analysis to follow. They are as follows:

1. Such devices as the how-what-when test and index numbers and dates should be used to remind oneself that an abstraction is being used and that care must be exercised in the use and interpretation of the term.

2. Some details are abstracted; others are omitted.

3. Descriptive statements are not inferential statements.

4. One should learn to substitute symbol reactions for signal reactions.

Now, to turn to the first of these statements, one may justifiably contend—since the process of abstraction appears to involve the selection of similarities and the omission of differences—that when verbal language is used, similarities and differences should
be represented. This clarification may be achieved through the use
of several devices, one of which is the how-what-when test. This
test necessitates the use of low-order abstractions, with their
specific detail and shades of meaning. If the statement, "All novels
are alike," is made, for example, the use of this test would result
in some such questions as the following: How are novels alike? In
colorization, theme, time, setting, style, for example? And, if
novels are alike with regard to colorization, which characters?
Is Mrs. Proudie as carefully portrayed—and with the same skill—as
Elizabeth Bennett? What novels are alike? Ivanhoe, David
Copperfield, The Warden, Robert Elsmere, One of Ours, and The Naked
and the Dead can be said to resemble each other in little except
length. When did the speaker or writer believe novels to be all alike?
In his youth, maturity, middle age, or old age?

Index numbers and dates comprise another group of devices to
indicate significant aspects of the process of abstraction. For
instance, let us refer for a moment to Bessie, the cow used as an
example in the discussion of the structural differential. Bessie
(cow1) is not the same as cow. The abstraction cow is derived from
cow1, cow2, cow3, cow4, etc., and in this process, similarities are
abstracted, differences omitted. The use of index numbers emphasizes
this selection and omission. The employment of dates stresses the
process of change, which affects all matter: John Smith^1957 is not
the same as John Smith^1958. The use of dates emphasizes that the
changes that have influenced him must be taken account of in the use
of verbal language. The first principle, then, appears to be
The second of the four principles is as follows:

2. Some details are abstracted; others are omitted. As the structural differential indicates, abstraction means selection. In the process of selection, of omitting characteristics, we secure general terms, thus facilitating communication, but we pay a price with regard to exactness of reference. Cow\textsubscript{1} is much more exact, much easier to identify, than farm assets; but in discussion, instead of speaking in terms of cow\textsubscript{1}, cow\textsubscript{2}, and so on, we may refer to cow, livestock, farm assets, wealth, or possibly an even higher abstraction. The second principle, then, with its implicit admonition that partial description should not be regarded as complete description,\textsuperscript{1} appears to be included.

The third principle is phrased as follows:

3. Descriptive statements are not inferential statements.

Korzybski uses the classification indicated by these two terms, with the following example:

We must stress the fact that words, as such must be divided into two categories: a first, of descriptive, in the main, practical words; and a second, of inferential words, which involve assumptions or inferences. Thus 'A does not get up in the morning' may be considered as descriptive. If A explicitly refuses to get up, the statement 'A refuses to get up in the morning' may also be considered as descriptive. If A did not explicitly refuse, this statement becomes inferential, because A

\textsuperscript{1}Lee, op. cit., p. 65.
may be dead or paralyzed. . . . It should be stressed that this discrimination between descriptive and inferential words, although extremely important, is not based upon any 'absolute' difference, but, to a large extent, depends upon the context.2

It will be observed that descriptive terms are low-order abstraction, close-to-life facts, and that inferential statements represent inferences made concerning descriptive words—guesses, judgments, generalizations, conclusions.3 Since the crux of the entire principle lies in the warning against confusing the levels of abstraction in which the two categories lie, the third principle appears to be included in the summary statement.

We may now turn to the last of the four statements concerning abstractions. It runs as follows:

4. One should learn to substitute symbol reactions for signal reactions. The structural differential indicates how the process of abstraction operates, from the second-order abstraction (the label cow in the example) to the high-order abstraction (wealth). We have seen that, on the higher levels of abstraction, inferences are frequently made concerning low-order abstractions. The comment was made that the levels of abstraction should not be confused. The significance of that warning may be readily seen when it is realized that such confusion often results in faulty responses.4

---

2Korzybski, op. cit., p. 478.

3Lee, op. cit., p. 187.

4Ibid., p. 195.
The reader will recall, in the example used by Hayakawa, the chimpanzee to whom red was stop and green was go—regardless of circumstances.

The principle under consideration, then, is dependent for its meaning and its significance upon the process of abstraction itself. As Lee says,

Two types of reaction may now be distinguished: signal reactions, which are undelayed, impulsive, seeing similarities only, undifferentiating—in short, those which go on the assumption that what is seen is "all" there is to be seen and known; symbol reactions, which are delayed, (if only for an instant), taking into account more factors in the situation, going to the present facts rather than to prior-held judgments of them—in short, those which should accompany a consciousness of the partial character of acquaintances and attend to differences as well as similarities.5

In the opinion of the writer, therefore, the fourth principle appears to be included in the summarizing statement.

The writer has used, for the purposes of an example, the principle concerning the process of abstraction to show in detail that the summary—the principle in question—is adequate and comprehensive. He believes that the preceding analysis will serve to demonstrate the matter with sufficient clarity and effectiveness as to make unnecessary similar detailed consideration of the remaining five statements of principle. It is the writer's belief that the other five statements will, like the first one, be found sufficiently full and

---

5 Ibid., p. 197.
inclusive to serve as the basis of discussion in the chapter, since
the summaries were arrived at in a manner identical to that just
explained in connection with the first principle.

Having considered the adequacy and comprehensiveness of the
summarizing statements of principle, the writer now proposes to turn
to the next stage of the chapter: analysis of the potential
contribution of each of the six principles to the attainment of the
aims of higher education.

Two matters of procedure may be mentioned here. First, after
the statement of the aim to be considered, the contribution of each
of the six principles of semantics will be discussed. Second in
the course of the discussion, the terms in the left-hand column will
be used to denote the six principles of semantics:

| Abstraction | I. In the process of abstraction
as carried on by the nervous system
and by language, some details are
selected; others are omitted. |
| Symbols     | II. The word is not the object. |
| Contexts    | III. The meaning of a word or
group of words is determined by
contexts. |
| Uses of to be| IV. The use of forms of to be to
identify or classify appears to be
false to fact, since the first use
confuses levels of abstraction, and
the second projects qualities into
objects. |
Multi-valued orientation

V. A MULTI-VALUED ORIENTATION WILL INCREASE THE NUMBER OF DISTINCTIONS AND THUS HELP TO RENDER LANGUAGE SIMILAR IN STRUCTURE TO FACT.

Referential and emotive language

VI. A CLEAR DISTINCTION SHOULD BE MADE BETWEEN REFERENTIAL LANGUAGE, WHICH IS INTENDED TO TRANSMIT VERIFIABLE INFORMATION, AND EMOTIVE LANGUAGE, WHICH IS DESIGNED TO INFLUENCE THE EMOTIONS AND ACTIONS OF THE READERS.

We may now turn to a consideration of the contribution of these semantic principles to the first of the aims of higher education, which is as follows:

I. TO PROVIDE FOR SELF-DEVELOPMENT TO THE LIMIT OF THE CAPACITY OF THE INDIVIDUAL

Abstraction. Comprehension of the process of abstraction will lead, it is believed, to an understanding of some of the major limitations of language as a tool. For example, as is evident from a study of propaganda and advertising, abstractions can be used to misrepresent the realities for which they are supposed to stand. Such a sentence as the following, quoted by Stuart Chase, is a specific example of misrepresentation through the misuse of abstractions: "Those nations that prize personal liberty as their most valuable possession must today recognize the end of it must be and always will be the most agonizing form of dictatorship, a dictatorship of the masses. . . ."

6 From a speech by Dr. Bernhard Rust, German Minister of Education, at the University of Göttingen bicentennial, reported in the New York Times, June, 1937. Quoted in Chase, op. cit., p. 370.
An understanding of these limitations of language (including a grasp of the significant difference between the descriptive and inferential levels) will help the student to develop symbol reactions, including better understanding through analysis. Instead of merely accepting and reacting to the words just quoted, the individual understanding the process of abstraction would stop and analyze such terms as personal liberty, dictatorship, and dictatorship of the masses in terms of specific individuals, times, and places. He would think, for example, not of personal liberty, but of the specific legal rights, under the First Amendment, let us say of John Smith in the United States. Improvement in the reading and writing competencies, which are closely connected with the preceding understandings, will help the individual to make an increasingly sound adjustment, based on comprehension, to his world.

Symbols. The contribution of symbolism appears to reside chiefly in the facilitation of individual development based on increased discrimination. This discrimination, in turn, arises from comprehension of the approach to reality afforded by an understanding of the functions and limitations of symbols. The individual will be assisted in avoiding such childish attitudes as those mentioned by Hayakawa: "... The vague sense that we all have that foreign languages are inherently absurd. Foreigners have 'funny names' for things: Why can't they call things by their right names?"7 The

understanding of the functions of symbols should include a recognition of the following facts: that symbols are arbitrary representations, that words transmit only a part of what is perceived by the nervous system, and that verbal communication depends upon a fund—great or small—of experience common to the speaker or writer and the listener or reader. Such an understanding will lead to a more accurate knowledge of oneself and of others, by assisting one to avoid, not the word-magic of primitive societies, such as the casting of spells, but the construction of verbal maps of partially or wholly non-existent territories. An example of this magical power of symbols is cited by Bell:

Mathematics weaves a robe of wonderful colors to clothe the unseen nakedness of nature. Following the changing play of colors in the light of deductive reasoning, we infer something of the movements of the invisible mystery which the robe conceals. Believing that we shall never see either the dancer or even the shadow of her dance, we content ourselves with the changing colors, saying this is she herself. The colors fade, the robe wears out, and we see nothing. A new robe is woven, of richer colors and more intricate design. This in turn passes into the limbo of forgotten things, and so on, for generation after generation of patient weavers. . . . Of the weaving of symbols there is no end.

An awareness of what symbols can and cannot do should, then, assist the student to avoid such self-delusions. The assistance given by

---


symbolism in the exercising of intelligence as a guide to action, and thus, directly, to self-development can be expressed in terms of the aid given by improved understanding of the function of language and the structure of the world.

Contexts. The development of skill in the use and interpretation of contexts can in two ways contribute to the attainment of the first aim: It can, through insistence upon care in the use and interpretation of verbal contexts, provide assistance in the attainment of clarity and precision in speech and writing; through similar insistence with regard to physical and psychological contexts, it can develop discrimination in the acquisition of vicarious experience in listening and reading. As an illustration, let us consider the following few sentences from Agnes Repplier's essay, "Opinions":

It has been occasionally remarked by people who are not wholly in sympathy with the methods and devices of our time that this is not an age of keen intellectual curiosity. We have scant leisure and scant liking for hard study, and we no longer recognize the admirable qualities of a wise and contented ignorance. Accordingly, there has been invented for us in late years, a via media, a something which is neither light nor darkness, a short cut to that goal which we used to be assured had no royal road for languid feet to follow. The apparent object of the new system is to enable us to live like gentlemen, or like gentlewomen, on other people's ideas; to spare us the labor and exhaustion incidental to forming opinions of our own by giving us the free use of other people's opinions.\(^{10}\)

To understand and interpret correctly the statement just quoted, one

must do more than read Miss Repplier's literary work. Knowledge of her character, of major biographical details, and a grasp of the salient characteristics and trends of her time are essential. (One would become cognizant of her dignity and reserve; one would find that she was born in 1855 and that she was educated at the Sacred Heart Convent near Philadelphia; one would realize that she has witnessed, and has reacted to, the search for balance in the last half of the nineteenth and the first half of the twentieth centuries.) In considering contexts, one notes the irony, the understatement, and the urbanity in the verbal contest; the reserve, in the physical; and the conservative attitude, the looking to the past, in the psychological. Thus, understanding the types of contexts and their interaction, it appears, will assist in the formulation of tenable interpretations—as well as, in the opinion of the present writer, in carefully considered action based upon such interpretations.

Uses of to be. The application of this principle should serve to make the individual aware of the two major problems in the use of forms of to be: the impression of finality, and projection (ascribing qualities to objects, rather than seeing the use of verbal language as a problem in relations). The impression of finality is significant in that the individual who feels that the classification given by means of a form of to be represents a final and unchallengeable one is thereby prevented from gaining new insights and new experiences. For instance, to such a statement as "Dickens's work is outmoded," the individual applying the principle under discussion here will realize that this use of the adjective
constitutes a classification and represents the mental state of the observer, rather than a fact about Dickens' novels. Whether or not the observer intentionally misread—whether or not the projection was conscious—the individual seems to have missed Dickens's compassionate understanding of human frailty and human greatness. The quoted statement as it stands, is unqualified. An open-minded, receptive reading is needed; and such a reading is an example of the tolerance and the willingness to wait and appraise, that seem essential to the development of a well-educated human being. Awareness of the problems resulting from unconscious projection, the present writer believes, will help to open mental doors—and keep them open—for the development of new insights and new experiences.

**Multi-valued orientation.** The use of the multi-valued orientation is closely related, as will be noted later in another connection, to the growth of tolerance and of clarity in thinking, and thus to maximum self-development. One aspect of the relationship of the use of the multi-valued orientation to the over-all development of the individual is stated succinctly by Hayakawa:

> The greater the number of distinctions [as provided for by the multi-valued orientation] the greater becomes the number of courses of action suggested to us. This means that we become increasingly capable of reacting appropriately to the many complex situations life presents.\(^\text{11}\)

This idea is relevant here in the sense of adaptability. Such

appropriate reactions will afford the individual, through modification of interpretation and action to meet new conditions, opportunity to realize his potentialities. Using the multi-valued orientation, the individual, with his varied interests and ideas, will exhibit in his attitudes and actions a beneficial flexibility to change and circumstances. If he is faced with an unusual or puzzling situation, whether it be an analysis of the ultimate reality or an attempt to balance the monthly budget, he will analyze it on the basis of all the evidence available, instead of automatically classifying it as good or bad, and closing his mind to further consideration.

Referential and emotive language. There is, apparently, a single direct contribution to the first goal resultant from the application of this principle. It seems, first of all, that growth of aesthetic enjoyment of literature and the development of critical judgment—major aspects of the development of the individual—will result, since emotive language is used with clear and justifiable intent, especially in poetry, often giving the reader pleasure from the sound of words as well as their meaning. One reads the following stanza in Keat's "Ode to a Nightingale," for instance, and realizes anew the long agony of man and the poignancy of death, as well as the music of the great words:

Thou wast not born for death, immortal Bird!
No hungry generations tread thee down;
The voice I hear this passing night was heard
In ancient days by emperor and clown:
Perhaps the self-same song that found a path
Through the sad heart of Ruth, when, sick for home
She stood in tears amid the alien corn;
The same that oft-times hath
Charmed magic casements, opening on the foam
Of perilous seas, in faery lands forlorn.

(Though it is true, on the other hand, that emotive language greatly influences thinking through appeals to emotion, a discussion of this aspect seems irrelevant in this portion of the chapter.) Since literature interprets as well as portrays life, as Seely points out, 12 it appears, on the whole, that the application of this principle will make a significant contribution to individual development.

Let us now turn to the second aim of higher education, which runs as follows:

II. THROUGH CULTIVATING A DISPOSITION FOR CO-OPERATIVE INQUIRY
TO DEVELOP CHARACTER BASED ON SUCH QUALITIES AS
INTEGRITY, SELF-DISCIPLINE, AND TOLERANCE

Abstraction. First, the realization of the meaning of "non-allness" will help to prevent fanaticism. John Brown and Mahatma Gandhi, for example, felt that they possessed the whole truth, and that it could be perceived and communicated in words. Tolerance and responsibility, for the individual as well as for the group, are especially involved here, in the careful differentiation made, in the principle of abstraction, between descriptive and inferential levels of abstraction, and in the fact that agreement

12 Howard Francis Seely, Lectures, Education 670, The Ohio State University, October, 1950.
is much more easily reached when descriptive terms are used. "A large, attractive domicile" is less descriptive than "a three-bedroom brick house, with 1600 square feet of space; with a living room 18 by 24 feet, dining room 15 by 20 feet," etc. In the latter passage, no inferences are made; the descriptive statements can be verified; there is a common ground for discussion. As experience has shown, the confusion of descriptive and inferential levels has produced marked effects on human behaviour. Bell's comment on two statements, "All men are born free and equal" and "America entered the World War to make the world safe for democracy" is illustrative:

If anyone imagines such questions to be purely academic, let him ponder the two following hypotheses: "All men are born free and equal"; "America entered the World War to make the world safe for democracy." Are these statements true? Are they false? Possibly they are neither. Whatever may be the fact, it is certain that extensive theories of government have been constructed on the first of these hypotheses, and several thousand men lost their lives because somebody believed the second hypothesis to be true.

Symbols. The application of this principle can aid the individual, first, to achieve a realization of the scope and the results of change. He will come to perceive that change affects all events—all animate and inanimate objects. For example, a man changes, physically and mentally, through the years. Buildings change; the Pyramids show the effects of the passing of forty centuries. Even concepts change; the idea of justice reflected in the British criminal code of the early nineteenth century appears quite different

from that shown in the British code of today. A speaker or writer realizing the effects of the operation of change will tend to be cautious in the formulation of inferential statements. Second, the application of this principle will stimulate the individual to try to find referents for the symbols used. Though it seems to be true that finding the referent is only a part of the semantic discipline, the search for referents will aid both the group and the individual in co-operative inquiry. As Chase remarks,

> The point of every discussion is to find the referent. When it is found, emotional factors dissolve in mutual understanding. The participants are then starting from a similar foundation, talking about similar things. The disagreement, if it must arise, is grounded on a firm base.

**Contexts.** Because the experiential background of the reader or listener is taken into consideration, the application of this principle will aid in achieving a common ground for thought and discussion, thereby attaining exactness in communication, and in developing tolerance—based on a better understanding of the problems of others—for widely differing viewpoints. In *Madame Bovary*, for example, Flaubert, in a novel marked by keen observation, careful analysis, and unusual striving for verbal precision, attempts to portray character clearly through the use of concrete terms and of figurative language. He approaches his subject from various angles and uses everyday examples; and he appeals to the experiential background—first-hand and vicarious—of the reader.

---

She thought, sometimes, that, after all, this was the happiest time of her life—the honeymoon, as people called it. To taste the full sweetness of it, it would have been necessary doubtless to fly to those lands with sonorous names where the days after marriage are full of laziness most suave. In post-chaises behind blue silken curtains to ride slowly up steep roads, listening to the song of the postillion re-echoed by the mountains, along with the bells of goats and the muffled sound of a waterfall; at sunset on the shores of gulfs to breathe in the perfume of lemon-trees; then in the evening on the villa-terraces above, hand in hand, to look at the stars, making plans for the future. It seemed to her that certain places on earth must bring happiness, as a plant peculiar to the soil, and that cannot thrive elsewhere. Why could she not lean over balconies in Swiss chalets, or enshrine her melancholy in a Scotch cottage, with a husband dressed in a black velvet coat with long tails, and thin shoes, a pointed hat and frills?

Perhaps she would have liked to confide all these things to some one. But how tell an undefinable uneasiness, variable as the clouds, unstable as the winds? Words failed her, the opportunity, the courage.

If Charles had but wished it, if he had guessed it, if his look had but once met her thought, it seemed to her that a sudden plenty would have gone out from her heart, as a fruit falls from a tree when shaken by a hand. But as the intimacy of their life became deeper, the greater became the gulf that separated her from him.

Charles's conversation was commonplace as a street pavement, and everyone's ideas trooped through it in their everyday garb, without exciting emotion, laughter or thought. He had never had the curiosity, he said, while he lived at Rouen to go to the theater to see the actors from Paris. He could neither swim, nor fence, nor shoot, and one day he could not explain some term of horsemanship to her that she had come across in a novel.

A man, on the contrary, should he not know everything, excel in manifold activities, initiate you into the energies of passion, the refinements of life, all mysteries? But this one taught nothing, knew nothing, wished nothing. He thought her happy; and she resented this easy calm, this serene heaviness, the very happiness she gave him.15

Because the reader understands clearly the situation and the person, he will comprehend—though, in this particular instance, not condone. Insight and verbal precision seem, as here, to have a definite relationship to the development of tolerance. Moreover, the application of the principle that no word ever has the same meaning twice can be made, through stimulating the search for precision in the use of verbal language, to develop intellectual honesty. It may also help the individual to avoid signal reactions to certain words.

If we can get deeply into our consciousness the principle that no word ever has the same meaning twice, we will develop the habit of automatically examining contexts, and this enables us to understand better what others are saying. As it is, however, we are all too likely to have signal reactions to certain words and read into people's remarks meanings that were never intended. Then we waste energy in angrily accusing people of "intellectual dishonesty" or "abuse of words," when their only sin is that they use words in ways unlike our own, as they can hardly help doing, especially if their background has been widely different from ours.

Thus, though the chief contribution of the principle appears to be in the facilitation of co-operative inquiry, the development of the individual is also aided.

Uses of to be. The attitude expressed by "may be classified as" and "appears . . . to me" will help to provide a common ground in communication, through assisting the individual to avoid confusing levels of abstraction. Such a common ground seems necessary for co-operative inquiry and the development of character based on

tolerance. Specifically, the attitude mentioned will aid the student in understanding the special need, in such instances as the following, for descriptive—verifiable—evidence:

We have not yet—and the difficulty of maintaining peace in our world bears evidence—found ways which make us "look together" while we decide about the inner interpretations represented by beautiful, just, important, good, wrong, responsible, necessary, wise, interesting moral, etc. When these terms appear in discussion, we have no recourse to measurement which we can readily agree upon. We must fall back upon the descriptive levels and life facts about which the terms are used. 17

Application of the principle under consideration should also help to reduce the amount of primary certitude and over-assurance. Increased tolerance—stressed in the goal—should result from the growing realization that classifications made through the use of forms of to be are not final. For instance, consider such a statement as the following: "Cause and effect have here been completely confused."
The statement by itself means little. Evidence—on the descriptive level, if possible—is needed; after all, the statement as it stands is one person's reaction. This aspect, it may be said, will be further dealt with in the discussion of the contribution of this principle to the development of skill in the use of logical thought.

Multi-valued orientation. In education, as in life, the problem exists of reducing oversimplification and pseudo-finality. The nature of the multi-valued orientation makes it an aid in helping the college or university student to avoid such oversimplification

17Lee, op. cit., p. 25.
through the use of "either-or" statements ("The majority is always wrong; the minority is always right.") This orientation, by definition, should be instrumental in helping him to see that most problems, like most human beings, are complex in nature. Macbeth is not simply a play about a man overcome by ambition; nor is the man whose name the play bears characterized with utter finality by calling him a murderer. The depth and breadth of the portrayal give the reader or spectator a rounded, not a flat, characterization of Macbeth. Here, the use of the multi-valued orientation makes us see. Moreover, in higher education, the requirement that the student amass as much pertinent information about a problem, and that he carefully analyze that information in his attempt to formulate a tenable hypothesis, would assist, in the opinion of the present writer, in producing tolerance. Humility and compassion, expressed in terms of the realization of the complexity of human life and of the impossibility of absolute identity, in the experiential world, of ideas or problems, should be concrete terms and virtues.

Referential and emotive language. Application of this principle will further in two ways the development of character based on such qualities as integrity and tolerance. The individual will understand the risks involved in the use of emotive language— especially the dangers of the misrepresentation and misinterpretation, to which reference has already been made. He will comprehend the emptiness of many resounding phrases—as St. Paul perceived it in the famous comment on "sounding brass and tinkling cymbals." The student will also realize that interpretation and illumination are essential
in great literature, even though the illumination and interpretation are not verifiable. The chief ideas in the "Ode on the Intimations of Immortality" cannot be weighed; they can and should be carefully considered. What Max Eastman has said of critics appears to be applicable to all human beings:

It seems to me that we should be tolerant when poets are too childlike, knowing that to be childlike is an intrinsic part of their creative gift. But for infantilism in critics I do not see that there is a word of defense or apology possible to be spoken. It is hard enough to put up with the moral importance of critics even when they bring to bear in their judgments the most mature psychological and social intelligence in their time.¹³

When the student understands, or approaches understanding, he is at least amenable to the idea of working with others. When he realizes that language can never fully convey all thought and all aspects of reality, then tolerance and humility have a place in his world. He will read Antigone with an appreciation of its great poetry; he will read Godwin's Political Justice with caution, because of the temperament and the aim of the author; he will realize that the formula $EC = M^2$, though verifiable, is subject to modification. In short, he will probably be a wiser and better student after applying the principle of referential and emotive language.

Now let us turn to the third aim of higher education,

phrased as follows:

III. TO ASSIST THE STUDENT TO DEVELOP SKILL
IN THE USE OF LOGICAL THOUGHT

Abstraction. Awareness of the process of abstraction has in
its train certain understandings and disciplines. The individual
understands that verification of inferential statements is made by
using low-order abstractions; that abstractions are made by the
individual's nervous system; and that only a part of the character-
istics of an event are revealed. Thus, the individual comprehending
this viewpoint is stimulated to see, analyze, and understand. He
realizes that the "duty" of John Smith 1957 may not be the same in
a given situation as the "duty" of John Smith 1957; for the situation
and the individual have changed. He realizes that because of
physical limitations and the influence of the emotions, even sight,
the master of the senses, can mislead. He knows that it is best to
work carefully within these limitations. Second, formation of the
habit of following symbol reactions causes the individual to wait,
see, and analyze, whether dealing with a belief or an assumption
(which are high-order abstractions) or a physical object. It is easy
to verify some information—the dimensions of a room, for example;
it is much more difficult to decide whether John Smith 1958 is honest
in a specific situation or whether there has been a gradual develop-
ment of compassion over the centuries. These understandings and
disciplines tend to foster greater care and precision in analysis
and evaluation.
Symbols. As we have said, there is the world of events, of phenomena. Since language represents—stands for—these events, its maximum usefulness will result from accurate correspondence to the events in the non-verbal world. A comprehension of the extent of this correspondence, therefore, should lead to the attainment of greater accuracy in thinking in words about events. The creation of unreal worlds—delusional worlds—without shadings or differentiations, in which everything is "swell" or "terrible," can result in maladjustment and unhappiness. Awareness of the symbolic process can help the individual to avoid childish thinking of this type, and serves also to remind him that thought, always related to memory and experience, should be in the order of sensation, reflection, and action.

Contexts. The chief contribution to the third aim—the development of skill in the use of logical thought—of the application of this principle can be summed up in one word: precision. The realization that the meaning of a word depends upon the circumstances under which the word is used, and upon the past experiences of the reader or listener, will help the student to think more clearly and accurately than if he used words on the assumption that they have fixed meanings. He will not, for instance, use glare as if the word had only one meaning, or expect to see the significance of the title

\[19\text{S. I. Hayakawa, Language in Action, p. 35.}\]

\[20\text{Chase, op. cit., p. 45.}\]
of Conrad's novel *Victory* until he has read the entire novel. He will perhaps understand more clearly the meaning of Swift's definition of *style* as "proper words in proper places." The development of skill in thinking should accompany increased care in using words in formulating contexts so as clearly and unmistakably to indicate the meanings of the words used.

**Uses of to be.** The application of this principle should help to develop a habit of thoughtful exactness in naming and classifying. The avoidance of finality that is implicit here is based on the idea that classifying an object appears arbitrary and, often, a matter of opinion. Many other methods of classification besides the one used are frequently possible. The same man may be classified, on different occasions and for different purposes, as a librarian, an Elk, a man-about-town, and an excellent musician. Distinguishing between the informative and the directive uses of *to be* would seem to be beneficial here, also. For example, not all policemen are courteous, nor are they all subject to political interference. Finally, the use of descriptive levels—recommended where agreement is desirable—by bringing words closer to the world of facts and thus enabling the user of words to specify and measure, makes analysis and understanding easier. The dimensions of the United States are more specific than the phrase "the queen of the seas" or "a large ocean liner." Flexibility in thinking, then, should result from the application of this principle—a flexibility which seems to be closely allied to the tolerance which has already been discussed.
Multi-valued orientation. The avoidance of finality which should result from the use of this principle is to be taken in a slightly different sense from that discussed a moment ago. Analysis based on this principle will help in illuminating differences and clarifying distinctions among objects or ideas. Through the flexibility in thought required in the use of the multi-valued orientation, the realization of distinctions and differences will serve, in turn, as the basis for the development of symbol reactions and of subsequently carefully considered action. It may be said, then, that the chief contribution made by this principle appears to be in the stimulus to greater precision in thought, through the consideration of as many characteristics, traits, and qualities as possible, and the avoidance of superficially facile identification.

Referential and emotive language. Application of this principle involves understanding of the necessity for critical examination, involving such major aspects as contexts, and specific analysis of the use of connotation, metaphor, and slanting. The development of skill in such methodical investigation will accompany the growth of understanding of the different purposes that language is used for. For instance, the material to be interpreted may be Milton's "On His Blindness," Burke's "Speech on Conciliation," or a paragraph from Osler and McCrae's Principles and Practice of Medicine. Each of these poses a different problem, and the application of the principle of referential and emotive language stimulates the reader or listener to analyze such linguistic problems, and to employ the useful discipline called the "method of science" to verbal communication.
The development of skill in analysis and the use of the scientific method should result in greater precision and accuracy in the use of language, the medium of thought.

The next aim to be inspected is as follows:

IV. TO TRANSMIT THE VERIFIED KNOWLEDGE OF THE RACE

Abstraction. Since a concept of the process of change, of non-aliveness, and of the emphasis upon similarities is inherent in this principle, its application might reasonably be expected to contribute greatly to an understanding that the solutions considered dependable—a great part of the so-called racial wisdom—are tentative and must be adapted to the requirements of the time, the social group, and the individual. Dickens's Nicholas Nickleby is an eloquent attack on the faults in the English educational system of a century ago; but its applicability is limited now—in most respects—because of changes in the conditions in English schools. Application of the principle of abstraction will also stimulate the student thoughtfully to analyze inferences, in order to ascertain the degree of validity. A reader would probably not question too searchingly, for example, Balzac's description of places; the same reader might scrutinize closely this author's inferences concerning morality and government. The first rest on observation; the second, on interpretation. Thus, the outcome of the application of this principle might well be more thoughtful comprehension—rather than mere acceptance—of verified knowledge, and, also, more competent, trustworthy transmission.
Symbols. As Hayakawa points out, "The cultural heritage of our civilization that is transmitted to us—our socially pooled knowledge, both scientific and humane—has been valued principally because we have believed that it gives us accurate maps of experience."\(^{21}\) In view of the preceding statement, it appears probable that application of the principle of symbolism will help the student to become adjusted to the degree that he reconciles the verbal world and the experiential (extensional) world, in his analysis of the body of accepted knowledge. He will learn to discard that which seems unusable because of its inaccuracy. Riemann and Einstein, for instance, have modified the older conceptions of space and time. In the twentieth century the ideal political system is not identical with that described in Plato's Republic. Thus, under the circumstances mentioned, in which the individual carefully appraises the body of accepted knowledge for its accuracy and usefulness in this specific context, he has a part in the revision, as well as the transmission, of this heritage.

Contexts. The principle provides a stimulus for the individual to learn to interpret verbal language in the light of the circumstances prevailing at the time of speaking or writing, and to study all of a statement in attempting to arrive at a tenable interpretation of the statement as a whole or in part. The individual is assisted, in other words, in understanding psychological and physical

contexts. An adult reader will probably better understand the significance of *Vanity Fair* if he knows the major events and trends in English history during the nineteenth century, and the significant facts of Thackeray's life, and if he possesses an understanding of the author's temperament and general attitude toward books and men. The result of the understandings and analysis indicated by the principle of contexts should be an improved comprehension of the cultural heritage.

**Uses of *to be***. The application of this principle should result, first, in the scrutiny of naming and classification. For instance, if John Smith hears a noise in his house at 2:00 A.M. and decides that he will not challenge the burglar who he is certain is in the house, Mr. Smith may be termed "cowardly," "discreet," or "lazy." The term or terms used will largely depend upon the temperament, background, and frame of mind of the observer. Realizing that such naming and classifying depend upon circumstances and are arbitrary and often wrong, the individual thus analyzing material should seek—and develop—flexibility of mind. Second, the development of skill in avoiding the directive uses of *to be*, with their oversimplification and unreliability, should lead to increased precision in the use of words. Application of this principle would probably not result in a direct contribution to the attainment of the aim; however, it might also assist in the cultivation and development of an attitude, in which tolerance and accuracy are significant.
Multi-valued orientation. Since the use of the multi-valued orientation involves drawing upon all the available evidence concerning a problem, perceiving as many characteristics as possible, and making a thoughtful, open-minded analysis, the student would probably be more tolerant and better prepared to evaluate the verified knowledge of the race than if the two-valued orientation were used. Whether Prometheus Bound or a modification of the basic Einsteinian equations is in question, the multi-valued orientation requires that the individual use a symbol reaction, that he discriminate without prejudice among a large number of facts and ideas, and that he formulate an equitable evaluation. Thus, a deeper appreciation of the cultural heritage may well result, even though the contribution in this instance appears to be somewhat indirect.

Referential and emotive language. The use of this principle will assist the individual to differentiate intelligently between the use of emotive language in literature (in which emotive language is used legitimately and with the knowledge of writer and reader to influence the emotions of the reader) and the unfortunate, often misleading, use of emotive language in reports (objective exposition, in which the use of referential language is essential). (It may be added here that verified knowledge, or cultural heritage, if the term is preferred, is broad, including skills, customs, laws, manners, conventions, and attitudes. Thus the term includes both literary and non-literary materials.) It appears to the present writer that

22Frederick S. Breed, Education and the New Realism, p. 215.
the application of the principle of referential and emotive language will help the individual to discriminate between language used to persuade or mislead and language used to present verifiable data; to appreciate literature more intelligently; and to assist, directly and indirectly, in the transmission of the verified knowledge, with a minimum of alteration or distortion.

The fifth of the aims of higher education is as follows:

V. TO DISCIPLINE THE INDIVIDUAL REALLY TO ACCOMMODATE HIMSELF TO THOSE CONDITIONS AND LAWS NOT SUBJECT TO CHANGE AND TO EXERCISE HIS PRODUCTIVE FACULTIES ON THE MODIFIABLE FACTORS IN THE PHYSICAL AND HUMAN ENVIRONMENT

Abstraction. The use of low-order abstractions, even though the descriptions are necessarily partial, will enable the individual to come closer to the world of facts, and thus help him effectively to come to grips with those facts. Such abstractions as misunderstanding and fear, for instance, should be reduced to lower-order abstractions. For example, Galsworthy uses a philosophical statement as the basis of his story, "The Black Godmother": "The cause of atrocities is generally the violence of fear. Panic's at the back of most crimes and follies." He clarifies the statement by means of an account of the misfortunes of a specific dog:

Well, this poor puppy gave up just as it got to our village; and, roaming about in search of water, attached itself to a farm labourer. The man—with excellent intentions, as he told me himself—tried to take hold of it, but too abruptly, so that it was startled, and snapped at him. Whereon he kicked it
for a dangerous cur, and it went drifting back towards the village, and fell in with the boys coming home from school. It thought, no doubt, that they were going to kick it too, and nipped one of them who took it by the collar. Thereupon they hullabalooed and stoned it down the road to where I found them. Then I put in my little bit of torture, and drove it away, through fear of infection to my own dog. After that it seems to have fallen in with a man who told me: "Well, you see, he came sneakin' round my house, with the children playin', and snapped at them when they went to stroke him, so that they came running in to their mother, an' she called to me in a fine takin' about a mad dog. I ran out with a shovel and gave 'im one, and drove him out. I'm sorry if he wasn't mad; he looked it right enough. You can't be too careful with strange dogs."  

Second, use of this principle will help the individual to develop the habit of using symbol reactions when he is faced with high-level abstractions. When he encounters anger, for example, he will wait and analyze the term, using the procedures and devices that have been mentioned in Chapter III. Such analysis will help to develop discernment and judgment in thought and action concerning the problem involved in this aim, which concerns a major aspect of the individual's adjustment to his world.

Symbols. The contribution of this principle can be best shown by using the "map" analogy employed by Korzybski, Lee, and Hayakawa. Since words constitute a map, which may or may not be related to the world of facts, application of the principle under discussion will help the individual to see how reliable his maps are.

---

If a child grows to adulthood with a verbal world in his head which corresponds fairly closely to the extensional world around him in his widening experience, he is in relatively small danger of being shocked or hurt by what he finds, because his verbal world has told him what, more or less, to expect. He is prepared for life. If, however, he grows up with a false map in his head—that is, with a head crammed with false knowledge and expectations—he will constantly be running into trouble, wasting his effort, and acting like a fool. He will not be adjusted to the world as it is; he may, if the lack of adjustment is serious, end up in a mental hospital. 214

The use of the principle of symbolism will help the individual to see the degree of correspondence.

Contexts. There are, it appears, two major results of the individual's realizing that in all acts of thought—whether reflection on his own experience or that of others—meaning is dependent upon the circumstances surrounding the present use of words, upon the past experiences of the reader or listener, and upon partial rather than complete descriptions of any event. The first is the encouragement of the use of symbol reactions, giving him time for analysis of specific conditions and laws, to see whether they are subject to change. (It will be necessary for the individual to remember that since words have many meanings, accuracy of interpretation and understanding of the situation as a whole depends upon the evaluation of a specific situation.) The second result is a better understanding—with humility—of his place in the scheme of things. With tolerance and good humor, the student, knowing that man is a little lower than

the angels, will be able better to understand the social and physical disciplines, even though he cannot be said to enjoy them at all times. It may be said that assistance in the acquisition of such understanding may be considered as a major function of higher education. The individual, then, has his part in the process of change; and his comprehension of its operation and its scope is largely determined by contexts.

**Uses of to be.** Application of this principle should help the individual to see the complexity of a given problem. Pondering such statements as "Character is fate," "Man's lot is predetermined," and "Nature is kind," he will realize that such statements, as they stand, are misleading and inaccurate, and that they are stumbling-blocks to clear and precise analysis, evaluation, and action. Avoidance of such equating or of ascribing qualities to objects will enable him to see the complexity of a problem in terms of the specific rather than the general. Second, knowledge of the principles of non-alleness, multiple meanings, and the operation of change will enable the individual to grasp the partial and tentative nature of comprehension. Application of this principle, then, will assist him to have a defensible basis for evaluation and adjustment. He will realize that to be is a tool, a form of verbal shorthand, and that, useful as it is, it must be employed with judgment and awareness of the dangers inherent in its use.

**Multi-valued orientation.** The application of this principle should provide assistance to the individual in understanding and evaluating the elements of the disciplines. Whatever is being
considered—whether it be predestination or the survival of the fittest
—the necessity for many approaches will be understood and accepted.
The use of many approaches will result in flexibility and the employ-
ment of all the evidence that is available (which will mean, in turn,
less chance for bias). Second, the student will probably develop
greater readiness to accept the disciplines. Tolerance should
naturally grow out of the application of the principle: Narrow-
mindedness is not consistent with a willingness to receive and appraise
all relevant evidence in the consideration of a problem. Moreover,
the scientific method, with its calm acceptance of facts, follows
almost logically.

Referential and emotive language. First, through the use of
the accepted associations of connotative words, the writer and reader
will start from the same verbal locality, and the reader, understand-
ing the writer's purpose, as well as his attitude toward his subject
and toward the reader, will have a basis for formulating a valid
interpretation. The reader will also learn to discover—and discount—
atttempts to sway his emotions, whether through the use of "snarl words"
and "purr words," misleading analysis based on figurative language,
or the selection of details with intent to mislead. Second, a clear
comprehension of the demands of the environment, attained largely
through the medium of referential language, with its stress on clarity,
objectivity, and precision, will serve as a sound basis for intelligent
adjustment.
We may now turn to a consideration of the contributions of semantics to the attainment of the sixth aim of higher education. This aim is stated as follows:

VI. TO OFFER AS MANY OPPORTUNITIES AS POSSIBLE FOR LEARNING THROUGH DOING AND FOR SOCIAL PARTICIPATION

Abstraction. For learning through doing, careful analysis of an idea or a situation is needed, whether a criticism of the "Ode to the West Wind" or the repair of a power lawn mower is contemplated. It has been pointed out that application of the principle of abstraction, involving awareness and careful use of the levels of abstraction, should result in more accurate analysis, because of the differentiation thus made between descriptive and inferential levels. Thus a common ground, as a basis for analysis and interpretation, may be arrived at. Second, if it is conceded that an understanding of the mass of racial experience furthers social participation, then the use of abstraction, as a kind of shorthand, facilitates the communication and comprehension of this fund of experience. Whether as a member of a committee or as a citizen, the student will be assisted in securing a clearer understanding of the privileges, responsibilities, demands, and limitations placed upon him as he engages in social participation. It should be noted, finally, that except for the somewhat limited aspects noted above, the application of the principle of abstraction does not contribute directly to the attainment of the goal under consideration.
Symbols. The contribution of the principle of symbolism to the provision of opportunities for learning by doing and for social participation appears to be indirect. Sound thinking and effective learning by doing are dependent upon the accurate relationship of the symbolic operation to the experiential world. For instance, an engineer who did not know trigonometry, or who made an error in its use, might design a bridge which would soon buckle. Second, a person who keeps the rules of symbolism in mind will probably be slow to let any words frighten him. In adjusting to the demands of social participation, the student will be assisted through the analysis of propaganda, as has been mentioned earlier. In the opinion of the writer, however, the application of the principle of symbolism does not contribute specifically or directly to the attainment of the goal.

Contexts. Since information which the individual assembles concerning the problem involved in the aim will be communicated largely through the medium of words, there is a considerable advantage in and need for the realization that words, rather than possessing fixed meanings, can be used on different occasions to have different meanings. In context, for example, "Heart of Darkness" means much more than the center of a dark area; it stands, as well, for the jungle and the Congo river, and the mental and physical breakdown of a man who lived there. The application of the principle of contexts, moreover, should lead to a better understanding of people—other students, as well as teachers—based on the increased ability to communicate more accurately and effectively. The contribution of the
principle, then, appears to rest upon the individual's realization, when using verbal language, of the need for the provision of contextual clues to the meanings of the words used, and for consideration of the listener's or reader's experiential background.

Uses of to be. The contribution here to the achievement of the goal we have in mind is, in the writer's opinion, an indirect one. Naming often amounts to judging, as Johnson indicates:

When parents or teachers look at a child and say, "Wilbur is naughty and bad. He is a thief," they are likely to leave some scars on Wilbur's personality. They are not so likely to make such a statement in the first place if they are aware that the statement conveys practically no information about Wilbur, but that instead it says something about their own standards of child conduct, gives some indication of the sort of books they have read, the kind of parents and teachers they themselves have had, etc. As for Wilbur, the statement tells him not "how to be good," but that his parents and teachers don't like him. Being as unconscious of projection as they are, he is likely to summarize his reactions by replying defiantly, "You're another, and I don't like you either." And so another human life is started down the drainpipe of civilization.

It seems probable that co-operative endeavor is often hindered by a lack of awareness of projection. As the present writer sees it, then, the application of this principle will, by stimulating the student's awareness of projection, contribute in a restricted way to the attainment of the goal.

Multi-valued orientation. As far as the provision of opportunities for learning by doing is concerned, the contribution of the principle of the multi-valued orientation appears to be the development

25 Johnson, op. cit., p. 63.
of an attitude rather than a pattern of procedure. The mental flexibility which should result from the application of the principle under discussion will mean an increased willingness and readiness to accept and evaluate the evidence at hand in (1) solving problems and (2) applying ideas. Such adaptations will improve both analysis and performance. The student will see better not only what he has to do but also the extent to which he has succeeded in doing it; and he will be better able to perceive the value—and the extent of—the learning which has resulted. As for the effect on the provision of opportunities for social participation, the chief contribution seems to be the development of an attitude of tolerance—a willingness to accept the austere discipline of analysis and evaluation that is an integral part of higher education and to work in the light of an understanding of the infinite diversity among objects and living things.

Referential and emotive language. The contribution of semantic principle to the goal in question appears to be an indirect one. In the analysis of problems, an application of this principle will help the student to arrive at an understanding of the purpose and feelings of a writer or speaker. Such comprehension, in turn, will lead to a better interpretation of verbal language. Second, use of this principle should aid the individual in two ways in adjusting to modifications in his ways of life. First, an understanding of how words can be used to mislead and betray, as well as to inform and inspire, can lead to greater tolerance. (One thinks of "Every Man a King," of a factual news summary, and of Churchill's speech after
the French surrender.) Second, the individual is inclined to exercise increased care in the use of words, and greater caution in arriving at evaluations.

The seventh of the aims of higher education, to which we may now refer, is as follows:

VII. TO STRIVE FOR AN ADJUSTMENT BETWEEN FREEDOM AND AUTHORITY WHICH INCLUDES RESPECT FOR BOTH INDIVIDUALITY AND SOCIAL DEMANDS

Abstraction. First, the application of this principle will aid in the discussion of such terms as freedom, authority, individuality, and social demands, all of which are in the aim itself. Because of the nature of high-order abstractions, such terms must, if we are to have clear and meaningful discussion, be reduced to lower-order abstractions and must be verified by means of the devices, such as the how-what-when test, already mentioned. Referents should be found. As Dewey remarks, "Freedom means essentially the part played by thinking—which is personal—in learning; it means intellectual initiative, independence in observation, judicious invention, foresight of consequences, and ingenuity of adaptation to them."26 "Freedom," in this context, then, seems to mean basically a mental attitude: the calm, uncoerced reaching of conclusions through intelligence and inquiry. "Authority," on the other hand, means the restraints, largely physical, which a society imposes on its members.

For example, Richard Roe\textsubscript{1}, a chemist, maintains his intellectual freedom when he works in his laboratory; he is an impartial observer, refusing to permit emotional attachment to his ideas to affect his judgment. He is free to appraise a problem, amass evidence, prepare and test hypotheses, and make whatever modifications seem necessary. His intelligence is not in chains; he is not told what to find in his experiments. But when Richard Roe\textsubscript{1} is driving his automobile, he is exercising the privilege of motoring, and must meet certain social demands—obligations in the form of speed regulations. He must also co-operate with other drivers, and respect the rights of pedestrians. Traffic lights, boulevard stop signs, and crosswalks are the outward signs of authority—of social demands. Mr. Roe\textsubscript{1} cannot at any time with impunity drive down, say, High Street at seventy-five miles an hour, forcing other motorists to the curb, and pedestrians to the comparative shelter of doorways. His freedom does not extend that far.

Moreover, chiefly through the separation of descriptive and inferential statements, the principle should provide a sound basis for analysis. There is a difference between a measurement and a judgment. The use of symbol reactions, furthermore, with the accompanying attitude of "Let's see," and the following of the steps in the process of logical thought, should provide assistance in arriving at tenable decisions.

\textit{Symbols}. The contribution made by this principle to the attainment of the aim appears to be a major one. First, it assists the individual to preserve the order of facts: the event, the thought,
and the symbol. The individual observing this principle will realize that automatic reaction to words produces misevaluation, which can extend to intolerance and martyrdom.

People can be made deathly sick by symbols. They can be driven to wild distraction and to the most disastrous behaviour by words, especially when those words refer to their deeply personal concerns and disturb their self-evaluation.27

The use of this principle also helps the student to see that there is no connection between the word and the object, to understand the adjustment in terms of what is done, at what time, and by what means—and the effect on him. Then a label may be applied. The analysis of the assembled facts should precede—not follow—the labelling.

Contexts. First, the application of this principle by enabling the individual better to understand the relationships of words or groups of words in their verbal contexts, will help him to have more accurate material for interpretation and, eventually, adjustment. It will assist him in ascertaining and analyzing the feelings and purposes of speakers and writers on this problem—at least, their purposes. If four men—for example, John Gunther, John T. Flynn, Joseph Goebbels, and Harold Laski—were writing on the problem under discussion here, the procedure would be of major significance in this respect. The assistance provided in the analysis of propaganda seems clear, especially when considered in connection with the other phases

27Johnson, op. cit., p. 266.
mentioned. Finally, use of the principle of contexts will help in maintaining open-mindedness in striving for the adjustment mentioned in the aim. The individual will come to realize—and this is related, too, to a principle referred to in the discussion of the process of abstraction—that only a partial revelation of reality is accorded, and that words afford only a portion of that picture.

**Uses of to be.** The two major contributions here might be termed disciplines or attitudes in thought. The first is the use of the well-named adult discount, the attitude expressed by "In my opinion . . .," when the is of identity is used. The use of such an adult discount will help to produce a greater flexibility of mind (of which more will be said in the next section) in thinking, speaking, and writing about this perennial and significant aim. Second, the application of this principle will tend to produce dependence upon observation as a basis for judgment or generalization. The distinction drawn between what is observed and what is believed will result in increased accuracy in analysis and evaluation.

**Multi-valued orientation.** The chief contribution here is in the stimulus of open-mindedness—the readiness to see and appreciate differentiations and shadings in opinions or phenomena. The value of open-mindedness applies to all phases of thought, from the formulation of the problem to the testing of an hypothesis. Because of its many aspects and of human perversity, the adjustment involved in the aim constitutes a complex and difficult problem. In view of this fact, the solution should not be restricted to two alternatives, but, instead, should mean the acceptance and careful evaluation of all
available evidence and ideas, leading eventually to the formulation of a valid adjustment general in nature, adapted as much as possible to each person. Since a tentative solution of the problems under discussion need not be either good or bad, and since the individual's duty to himself is not a categorical imperative, it appears that the tolerance and flexibility of mind resulting from the use of the multi-valued orientation will help to facilitate reaching the adjustment mentioned in this aim.

Referential and emotive language. Application of this principle should assist the individual in his efforts to ascertain general connotations. Freedom, authority, respect, individuality are highly connotative words. Further explanation, through the use of low-order abstractions, will be necessary, in order to approach the precision of referential language. For example, the Roman concept of civilization founded on and upheld by law is an outstanding one. Rome was tolerant; the rights—and the responsibilities—of her citizens were explicit and rigorously maintained. But the whole concept becomes clearer when we read of a specific individual in the context of a situation. The Apostle Paul, in Brother Saul, had preached at Iconium and had thereby caused some disorder. The speech of the proconsul at the court to which Paul was summoned shows the Roman concept of freedom and authority:

Now, Saul, a word with you. Your creed is reasonable, your conduct excellent, your character without a reproach. And yet—I am going to expel you forthwith from Iconium. You may find it necessary to preach your prophet and cult. I find it more necessary to keep the
pax Romana in the district which the Senate and people of Rome have entrusted to my care. Disputes, dissensions, contentions, the letting of blood, the breeding of hatred shall not obtain where I have arms to use and authority to use them. Do I exceed my authority? Very well, I grant you I exceed my authority. But, Saul, remember that if Roman citizenship has privileges, it has also duties. And it is your duty to assist me in keeping the pax Romana, even in the smallest sense, and in upholding the ideal of brotherhood which it is the destiny of Rome to spread and enforce.

Moreover, as has been said, the individual should perceive the difficulty in—and the necessity for—differentiating between observing and feeling, especially as the adjustment under consideration is central in human affairs. Now, whether the individual likes or does not like the authority is not the question. He should ask such questions as What is the authority? How will it affect me? When will it do so? Through the use of the principle of referential and emotive language, he should realize that an analysis based on an explanation in simple, concrete terms—preferably those that can be measured—is imperative.

Let us turn now to the eighth of the aims, which is as follows:

VIII. TO IMPART AN UNDERSTANDING OF THE NATURE OF MIND AND OF MATTER

The question involved in the aim is difficult enough, without having it further complicated by comment about "universal laws of nature inspiring the spirit of mankind," for example. Such devices as the how-what-when test are especially useful in making the discussion manageable. An illustration is found in Whitehead's discussion

of the study of the elements of mathematics:

The art of reasoning consists in getting hold of the subject at the right end, of seizing on the few general ideas which illuminate the whole, and of persistently marshalling all subsidiary facts around them. Nobody can be a good reasoner unless by constant practice he has realized the importance of getting hold of the big ideas and of hanging on to them like grim death. For this sort of training geometry is, I think, better than algebra. The field of thought of algebra is rather obscure, whereas space is an obvious insistent thing evident to all. Then the process of simplification, or abstraction, by which all irrelevant properties of matter, such as colour, taste, and weight, are put aside is an education in itself. Again, the definitions and the propositions assumed without proof, illustrate the necessity of forming clear notions of the fundamental facts of the subject-matter and of the relations between them. All this belongs to the mere prolegomena of the subject. When we come to its development, its excellence increases. The learner is not initially confronted with any symbolism which bothers the memory by its rules, however simple they may be. Also, from the very beginning the reasoning, if properly conducted, is dominated by well-marked ideas which guide each stage of development.29

Whitehead believes that the significance of each proposition should be illustrated by examples, selected in such a manner as to show the fields of thought to which each applies.30 The techniques outlined here seem to the present writer to be an instance of the application of the principle of abstraction to the solution of basic problems in the realm of the mind and of the physical world.

Moreover, the principle of abstraction will provide assistance


30Ibid., p. 95.
in separating inferences from what is observed and can be verified. This view is related to the preceding discussion because the use of low-order abstractions for analysis and proof will clarify the differences and serve to facilitate and validate comprehension and evaluation. One may observe several instances of a specific phenomenon, but one may justifiably be hesitant about drawing up a natural law on the basis of those observations.

**Symbols.** The aim concerns abstract philosophical and factual disciplines. The application of the principle of symbolism would assist the individual, first, in distinguishing between symbols which stand for something and symbols which are used to mislead or to stand for nothing at all. When noises are used as though they were symbols, agreement is not possible. A reference to a triangular cube is meaningless so far as the experiential world is concerned. Second, the individual in following the order of event-thought-symbol—required by the principle of symbolism—will be assisted in ascertaining the precise meaning of the symbols used. Efforts to find the referent will also be helpful in this respect. It is well to remember Korzybski's warning:

Most 'philosophers' gamble on multiordinal and el [elementalistic] terms, which have no definite single (one-valued) meaning, and so, by cleverness in twisting, can be made to appear to mean anything desired.

---

31 Korzybski, op. cit., p. 82.

32 Ibid., p. 77.
Contexts. In attempting to comprehend the nature of mind and matter, one should maintain an attitude of reserve in both areas, since no verbal—or non-verbal—abstraction conveys all the characteristics of an event. The truth of the preceding statement impresses one especially when one is dealing with philosophical matters—warped space-time, for example. The individual applying the principle of contexts is led to see that care in the use of contexts helps to make symbols correspond more closely to facts. Korzybski cites the question, "What is the temperature of an electron which goes to make up this pencil?" and comments that the word temperature, which has a specific meaning in one context, means nothing in the context of this question. Since the range of contexts in this aim is broad—involving the accumulated factual knowledge and experience of many individuals—understanding of interaction of contexts and of the use of contexts in the determination of meaning would appear to be quite helpful in efforts to attain the aim.

Uses of to be. The contribution of this principle appears to be indirect. It probably has its chief value in the consideration of factual material—concerning the nature of matter, for example. Analysis based on the principles of abstraction and symbolism would probably be more helpful in the consideration of verbal discussion of the nature of mind. Observation of the

33 Ibid., p. 60.
principles concerning the uses of to be is essential in scientific study; it is helpful in other areas. In all realms of thought, it can be said that it facilitates co-operation through helping the individual to avoid finality and directive statements.

**Multi-valued orientation.** Application of the principle of the multi-valued orientation, too, is necessary in all scientific investigation, where precision is essential.

Instead of saying "hot" and "cold," we give the temperature in degrees on a fixed and agreed-upon scale: -20°F, 37°C, and so on . . . Instead of being limited to two answers or even to several, we have an infinite number when we use these numerical methods. The language of science, therefore, can be said to offer an infinite-valued orientation. Having at its command the means to adjust one's action in an infinite number of ways according to the exact situation at hand, science travels rapidly and gets things done.\(^3\)

In the attainment of this aim, then receptivity and willingness to learn, inherent in the use of the principle, is vital. In addition, its application is essential for the furtherance of co-operation and for the valid evaluation of new experience.

**Referential and emotive language.** Because referential language is classified as the language of science, and emotive language, on the other hand, is employed for the expression of emotions and moods, knowledge of the differentiation between referential and emotive language—and of the effects of the use of emotive language—seems imperative in the attainment of this

The goal involves fundamental concepts, and careful, methodical, accurate thinking is necessary for its achievement. Even under the circumstances indicated, emotive language cannot be altogether avoided in the analysis and evaluation of the material involved; but personal connotations and slanting can be avoided, and metaphor kept under control. It seems clear that knowledge of this principle will help the individual to achieve the precision and objectivity necessary for the attainment of this aim. The calmness of the scientist, rather than the passion of the poet, is needed here.

In this chapter, the writer has listed the aims of higher education and the summarizing principles of semantics, and has shown in some little detail the contributions of each principle of semantics to the attainment of the aims of higher education. He has made clear his belief that the contributions—some of which seem to be indirect—are not of equal value. It does appear, however, that the attainment of these aims will be furthered directly and/or indirectly by the application of these principles.

In Chapter V, the writer proposes to cite a list and provide a brief description of the undergraduate courses in the social studies, English, and professional education for which material for the analysis and discussion in the chapter has been secured. He will describe the type of material and
the bases for analysis. He will then analyze representative examples of interpretations written by students. A summary of the findings will conclude the chapter.
CHAPTER V

TECHNIQUES FOR IMPROVING THE TEACHING OF THE SOCIAL STUDIES THROUGH THE INSPECTION OF INTERPRETATIONS

In this study, the writer is endeavoring to ascertain the extent to which the written work of university students exhibits inaccurate and/or incomplete interpretation of language, and the nature of this inaccurate and/or incomplete interpretation. On the basis of these findings, he will try to suggest ways in which a university may assist its students to interpret language more accurately and thus to communicate ideas more effectively.

The writer is restricting the problem to higher education, and to the areas of the social studies, English, and courses in professional education. These restrictions are imposed because many difficulties in interpretation seem to occur in these areas, and because, under these limitations, the study will be manageable.

In Chapter II, a statement of the aims of higher education which will serve as a basis for the study was sought and arrived at. In Chapter III, a number of major semantic principles and problems were discussed. Later in Chapter III, the principles were phrased in six statements. The contributions which these basic principles of semantics can make to the attainment of the aims discussed were considered in Chapter IV.

Using the six major semantic principles, the writer now proposes to analyze, for accuracy and completeness of interpretation,
representative student-written responses to topics and questions in undergraduate courses in economics, history, and sociology. This is the subject matter of Chapter V. Subsequent chapters will deal with similar subject matter in English and Education courses.

First in this chapter will be listed the courses in which the interpretations were written. The course descriptions are quoted from catalogues of The Ohio State University. Second will be presented a discussion of the nature of the student-written materials. Next will come a listing of the six semantic principles which serve as a basis for the analysis. The fourth portion of the chapter will consist of a critical examination of representative examples of interpretations written by students in the courses involved, and of a summary of the findings. Finally, with these findings as a basis, techniques for improving the teaching of the social studies will be proposed.

Since the student-written materials have been drawn from work done in the courses described below, it is felt that the following information may prove helpful to the reader in following the analysis.

**Economics**

Economics 400. Development of Modern Economic Society. A study of the dominant historic forms of economic organization designed to provide a basis for understanding both the evolutionary nature of society and the role of capitalism in social development.
Economics 401-402. Principles of Economics. A study of the organization and operation of our economic system, with the objective of developing an intelligent understanding of our present economic system. Among the subjects studied are cost and price relationships; money and banking; taxation; labor problems; agricultural economics; international trade and finance; and public control of business activity.

Economics 520. Money and Banking. This course is intended as an introductory study to the more technical courses in banking and finance and also to give a comprehensive view of the field for those who are primarily interested in the subject. The organization, operation, and economic significance of our monetary and banking institutions are discussed, with special reference to current conditions and problems.

Economics 669. Socialism and Related Movements Prior to 1917. The development of capitalism and socialism, Marxian socialism, syndicalism, and state socialism. Comparison of proposed schemes with capitalism in respect to the determination of the lines of production to be followed, maintenance of full employment and encouragement of progress, and the distribution of income.

Economics 671. Socialism and Related Movements Since 1917. The Bolshevik Revolution of 1917; its background, plan, and results during the first decade; general features of Soviet economy; current socialist experience in Great Britain and on the European continent; economic trends elsewhere, including the United States.

History

History 403. History of the United States. A study of the general political, constitutional, and economic development of the United States, from the beginning of the Revolutionary era to the end of the Civil War.

History 421-422-423. The Western World in Modern Times. A course in the history of modern Europe and the United States. Emphasis is placed on the history of the United States in a world setting. Major themes include the development of representative government and democracy, the rise of capitalism, the role of organized religion, and the impact of scientific development.
History (cont.)

421. From the beginning of modern times through the first third of the Nineteenth Century. Absolutism and parliamentary institutions, revolutions, and new government in the United States and France; the reaction to the French Revolution in Europe and America.

422. The Nineteenth Century. Liberalism, materialism, and the Industrial Revolution; national unification in the United States, Italy, and Germany; urban and agrarian discontent.

423. The Twentieth Century. International rivalries and the two world wars; militarism and dictatorship; modification of economic and social systems.

History 537. Recent History of the United States. The impact of modern industrialism, society, government, and foreign policy. Laissez faire and government regulation, the Progressive movement, and the first World War.

Sociology

Sociology 507. Fundamentals of Sociology. A study of the nature of society and the factors affecting its development; culture, personality; groups and institutions; selected social problems.

Sociology 604. Race Problems. A study of the problems arising from the contacts of people who differ as to race and culture.

Sociology 622. Social Factors in Personal Adjustment. Nature of human nature; process of socialization; social change and individual demoralization; social roles in conflict situations; re-direction of social activity.
Certain comments concerning the selection of the student-written interpretations analyzed in this chapter, as well as in Chapters VI and VII, may be offered at this point. First, the chairman of each department concerned offered suggestions as to faculty members who might be interested in lending examination papers for use in this study.\(^1\) Second, several professors asked their colleagues to lend examinations. Finally, the writer was acquainted with a number of faculty members who he knew were interested in the development of this study, and from whom he was able to secure student-written materials.

The writer made an effort to secure, whenever possible, material from courses at the three undergraduate levels (400, 500, and 600) in each area. He believes that in this way, although the detailed statistical evaluation of a pattern of errors in proportionate series is not an objective of this study, a cross-section of the work of undergraduate students in courses at the three undergraduate levels would show the type and frequency of errors in interpretation rather than at one. In this way, the basis for suggestions and proposals for improving and teaching would be made broader and more significant.

\(^1\) All the materials have been drawn from midterm or from final examinations. The use of compositions and term papers was not considered feasible, because of the wide diversity in topic and in treatment (approach), and because of the necessity of returning these types of work as soon as possible to the student in the classes.
It should be noted, moreover, that student-written interpretations falling under the following two headings have not been included in the analysis to follow: (1) responses showing misunderstanding of the question asked (not a lack of knowledge of the subject-matter asked for); (2) responses to true-false, multiple-choice, or other objective-type examinations—answers which, because of their brevity and lack of context, render analysis and the formulation of reliable inferences practically impossible.

As a basis for the analysis of these materials, the writer proposes to use the six major principles of semantics as stated in Chapter IV:

I. IN THE PROCESS OF ABSTRACTION, AS CARRIED ON BY THE NERVOUS SYSTEM AND BY LANGUAGE, SOME DETAILS ARE SELECTED; OTHERS ARE OMITTED.

II. THE WORD IS NOT THE OBJECT.

III. THE MEANING OF A WORD OR GROUP OF WORDS IS DETERMINED BY CONTEXT.

IV. THE USE OF FORMS OF TO BE TO IDENTIFY OR CLASSIFY APPEARS TO BE FALSE TO FACT, SINCE THE FIRST USE CONFUSES LEVELS OF ABSTRACTION, AND THE SECOND PROJECTS QUALITIES INTO OBJECTS.

V. A MULTI-VALUED ORIENTATION WILL INCREASE THE NUMBER OF DISTINCTIONS AND THUS HELP TO RENDER LANGUAGE SIMILAR IN STRUCTURE TO FACT.

VI. A CLEAR DISTINCTION SHOULD BE MADE BETWEEN REFERENTIAL LANGUAGE, WHICH IS INTENDED TO TRANSMIT VERIFIABLE INFORMATION, AND EMOTIVE LANGUAGE, WHICH IS INTENDED TO INFLUENCE THE EMOTIONS AND ACTIONS OF THE READER.
In the course of the discussion, the following headings will be used to denote these six principles of semantics: Abstraction; Symbols; Contexts; Uses of to be; Two-valued orientation; Emotive language.

The analysis will follow the order indicated above; that is, responses from the courses under consideration will be grouped under Abstraction; under Symbols, and so on. Thus, in the opinion of the writer, the emphasis will rest on communication of ideas—on interpretation—rather than on comparison of the work of students in, for instance, a class in Economics 400.

Several matters of procedure may be mentioned here.

1. The responses will be numbered, as, for instance, Economics answer 1, 12, 43, etc., History answer 2, 10, 15, etc.

2. For ease of identification, the lines of the answers will be numbered in the right margin.

3. In the text of the chapter, representative responses—at least one-third of those inspected—will be quoted and analyzed.

4. At the end of the quotation and analysis of each body of answers (in economics, history, and sociology), a summary will be presented, which will show the frequency and classification of errors at the various course levels (400, 500, and 600).

5. Examples of superior or excellent answers will be quoted and analyzed.

It may be noted, too, that in the listing of ways in which the responses are defective, no implication is intended that the student could have or should have included everything mentioned in
the analyses; rather, the present writer is citing material of a sort necessary to give the responses concreteness and substantiation.

The writer will begin the discussion by considering answers from examinations in the following courses in economics: Economics 400, 401, 520, 669, and 671.

Abstraction. Let us consider, first, examples of so-called "dead-level" abstracting. It will be noted that the abstracting tends to remain at a high (or at a low) level. As Hayakawa says, "Some people, it appears, remain more or less permanently stuck at certain levels of the abstraction ladder; some on the lower levels, some on the very high levels." A number of examples of this type of difficulty in the use of abstraction are quoted below.

Question (Economics 400). Patton says, "Mercantilism hadn't a chance of survival once people started reading The Wealth of Nations." Do you agree or disagree? Explain fully.

Economics answer 21. To answer this question you must go according to the rules of the game at the time. Patton said that mercantilism hadn't a chance of survival once people started reading The Wealth of Nations. I disagree because at that time small business had a chance and was making a small profit. So, as we can see, mercantilism was not yet defeated. This system was that which started laissez faire, which meant for the government not to interfere with business. However, if you would ask me the same question a little later, you would have to agree because this is where big business came into power and

\[S. I. Hayakawa, \textit{Language in Thought and Action}, p. 177.\]
began to form monopolies, which could cause a depression. So with the government stepping in to control business enterprises, mercantilism was doomed.³

In lines 6, 14, and 17 of the foregoing answer, the student uses the terms "small business," "big business," and "government interference," but does not proffer examples or details to clarify the meaning--to answer the questions of How? What? When? that arise. The reader does not know the size of the corporation or the amount of regulation imposed by the state and/or the national government; nor is he told anything about the circumstances surrounding the events to which the student refers. The terms appear, moreover, to be connotative; many persons encountering these words tend to think in terms of the Sugar Trust, the Standard Oil Company, cartels, "all the traffic will bear," and Jeffersonian dicta about the proper functions of government. Similar comments may be made about "depression" (line 16), "control" (line 17), and "doomed" (line 17). They are vague, indefinite, and oversimplified. How serious would the depression be? Was the control complete or partial? "Doomed" is not qualified or explained.

Repeated use of a number of these high-level abstractions, then, seems to result not only in vagueness but also, paradoxically, in oversimplification. The student, as has been noted, is able to "write around" the question he has been asked to answer, and to use

³In order to facilitate reading, the present writer has edited the responses for spelling and obvious errors in punctuation.
unsubstantiated generalizations, as in lines 6-9.

Similar vagueness and oversimplification, as a result of dead-level abstraction, appear in Economics answers 46, 64, and 111.

Question (Economics 400). Explain the historical changes which resulted in the growth of the policy of *laissez faire*.

Economics answer 46. It created a large number of strong manufacturing concerns. It was a free enterprise system. The system helped big business more than anything else. Because of the extremely low wages and poor working conditions under big business, you might say it was the start of a strong need for labor unions.

Several unexplained high-level abstractions cause difficulty in the foregoing answer. In line 2, the student uses the word "strong," which in this context may mean, for instance, "large" or "financially sound." The hint of tendency toward monopoly is strengthened in the next sentence, and in the rest of the response. "Free enterprise" (line 3) is both abstract and connotative here, and gives the impression of a lack of "restrictions" and "hampering rules" imposed by governmental agencies. The "strong manufacturing concerns" mentioned in line 2 apparently developed into "big business" (lines 2-4, 6)—an abstract, connotative phrase used twice in eight lines. The term connotes power and suggests ruthlessness—the "trusts" and "The public be damned!" This impression is strengthened by the use of the phrase "extremely low wages and poor working conditions" (lines 5-6), an unsupported statement which may cause the reader to wonder whether such wages and conditions were restricted to companies considered "big business."
Out of this series of high-order abstractions, no clear concept emerges of what *laissez faire* is, or of the historical and economic changes which resulted from, and in turn acted upon, this economic theory. The vagueness of the expression and of the thinking behind the words is shown by the remarkably simple version (lines 4-8) of the development of organized labor.

**Question (Economics 401). What is the so-called "economic problem"?**

_Economics answer 64_. The economic problem deals with scarcity and the institutions or organizations man has created to cope with this problem.

1. The term "scarcity" (line 2) was probably limited and defined in class, but it seems in need of qualification and explanation here.
2. The reader may well ask the nature of, and the reasons for, the insufficiency or dearth, as well as the number of those affected.
3. The term "institutions" (line 2) may refer to public or private agencies—to commissions, to social workers, or to retail stores.
4. The use of "cope with" (line 3) does not reveal the degree of efficiency or of success, but hints that the efforts have not been wholly unsuccessful. Finally, the student has not mentioned the matter of choice, a basic aspect of the problem under discussion.
5. The student, then, has failed to give more than a vague, inexact impression of the nature of "the economic problem."

**Question (Economics 520). What are the advantages and disadvantages of using a metallic standard?**

What substitutes would you make and why?
In setting up a gold standard it was found that so much goods equaled so much gold and so much money equaled so much gold, etc. Gold was the natural item to use as a measuring stick. Simplification seems to be the greatest advantage of using one metal.

In this response, the student appears to depend on two terms for his explanation: "natural" (line 5) and "simplification" (line 6). There is no explanation of the contention that the use of the gold standard was "natural" -- no mention, for instance, of the advantages resulting from the malleability, ductility, and freedom from rust of this precious metal, or of its relationship to, for instance, silver. The use of "simplification" raises questions—unanswered—about the subject, manner, and extent of that which was simplified. A major idea is thus left hanging in air. The reader will notice, too, the connotation of making plainer or easier. Finally, "so much goods equaled so much gold and so much money equaled so much gold" (lines 2-4) is a rather oblique way of stating the principle that gold of specified weight and fineness was established as a unit of value. "Equaled," in these phrases, appears to be used for "was equal in purchasing power to."

"Naturalness" and "simplification" do not seem adequate explanation for the student's position here.

The preceding responses have shown vagueness and oversimplification resulting from dead-level abstraction. In Economics answers 77, 97, 20, and 114, similar difficulties are shown.
Question (Economics 401). In terms of the economic differences, contrast the United States and the Soviet Union. Use any concepts you have learned from lectures or the text.

Economics answer 77. The Soviet Union consists of a strong central government which controls the economic activities of Russia; the United States has an economic system which is touched only a few times by its government. The Soviet Union does not have the system of free private enterprise that is used in the United States.

The student has not clarified the meaning of "strong central government" (line 2); one does not know, for example, whether the government is highly centralized, by whom the government is managed, or whether the group managing governmental activities is large or small. The amount of "control" (line 2) is not indicated; and whether the central government dominates, regulates, protects, or simply obstructs "economic activities" (line 3) is not discussed. "Economic activities," as a phrase, furthermore, seems all-inclusive: Are there no exceptions in production, distribution, or sale, so far as governmental "control" is concerned? Next, the student states that the American economic system is "touched only a few times by its government" (lines 4-5). The phrase may mean that the United States Government maintains civil order, but avoids any sort of restriction on the activities of corporations; it may refer, on the other hand, to regulation by the Interstate Commerce Commission and similar bodies. The meaning of the phrase quoted above is not clarified by the use of the words "Free public
enterprise" (lines 6-7). The student, then, has placed in opposition vaguely defined terms, employed without definition, and has relied almost entirely on contrast for comprehension by the reader.

Question (Economics 520). "What are the advantages and disadvantages of using a metallic standard? What substitutes would you make and why?

Economics answer 97. I would like to see a managed currency. This would allow governments to control a more equitable system of exchange and keep the circulation of currency more constant. It would stop hoarding by putting dates by which this currency had to be turned in at the central bank to receive par or any fraction of par.

The terms "managed currency" and "fiat money" are accepted—and defined—terms in economics, but brief definition in the response (1) might show that the student was observing the limitations in meaning agreed upon by the group, (2) might help to support the explanation in the sentence following. Much of the weight of the student's explanation rests in sentence two, on "equitable" (line 3). This unexplained term may mean, for instance, "just," "fair," or "right." But the matter of exactly what constitutes fairness under such circumstances is not considered, and the connotations of the word—the suggestion that the course of action outlined by the student will result in "justice"—help the reader little. Furthermore, just how—and why—the circulation of currency would, under the circumstances hinted at, be kept more constant, is not revealed, except, perhaps,
in the brief comment about hoarding. The student, it appears, does not explain the disadvantages and advantages of the gold standard. He merely says that he would like such a standard. A statement of preference does not constitute explanation of abstractions.

Question (Economics 400). Patton says, "Mercantilism hadn't a chance of survival once people started reading The Wealth of Nations." Do you agree or disagree? Explain fully.

Economics answer 20. I agree with Patton because the ideas set forth in The Wealth of Nations—the ideas of laissez faire—were more agreeable to most people than the idea of mercantilism. The argument for laissez faire was explained so logically that it was hard to disagree with it. No one would be happier with a lot of governmental regulations if they could get along without them. Fewer restrictions on business are always welcomed because that means more profit—for the business man.

First, the student states (lines 5-7) that "the argument for laissez faire was explained so logically that it was hard to disagree with it." No further comment is offered; and the reader, already placed at some disadvantage by vague reference of the pronoun it, is not told why the explanation seemed logical to the student. Second, the "government regulations" mentioned in lines 8-9 are unexplained; the reader is not told anything about the type or the extent of the rules—which might involve, for instance, restrictions on installment buying or on increases
in freight rates. It will be noted, moreover, that the student makes "restriction" equivalent to "regulation" (lines 9-10)— instead of employing defining words or phrases—then over-simplifies on the basis of the seeming equivalence.

The dead-level abstraction is accompanied, in this example, by the use of the is of classification (lines 3-4). The student does not reveal the ways in which the major ideas of laissez faire appeared to be more agreeable to most people; perhaps they made a deep appeal to certain unspecified prejudices. Moreover, the attempt at illustration (lines 7-10) is confused and unhelpful in thought and in expression. Finally, there seems little logic in the sequence of ideas in the answer as a whole.

Similar difficulties appear in Economics answer 144, quoted and analyzed below.

Question (Economics 671). How does one evaluate an economy as to whether it is capitalist or socialist?

Economics answer 144. Criteria determining whether a capitalist economy has become socialist are difficult to determine. To what extent must an economy move to the left, and how much participation by government is needed before the line is reached? This is a difficult line to draw, and it depends to a great extent upon the personal point of view. Surely, though, we must look to the amount of participation of the government in the economy, and the extent of government ownership of industry. The amount and nature of planning for the future should also be considered. But no line can be drawn looking at the problem from any one discipline. We must take the panorama of events as criteria.
In the first place, "participation by the government" (lines 5-6) may mean anything from complete domination to mere maintenance of civil order—anything from regulation of interest rates to the construction and operation of the Tennessee Valley Authority (though the latter is probably the meaning of lines 5-6). Reading the phrase "planning for the future" (line 13), one does not know the kind or extent of the "planning"—whether it concerns social security, old-age pensions, legislation to reduce the likelihood of depressions, or a combination of such measures. Finally the meaning of "panorama of events" (lines 16-17) is obscure.

In addition, the is of classification appears in lines 3 and 7, showing the unsupported opinion of the student. Repetition and hedging in the response as a whole add to the difficulty of ascertaining the meaning.

Several other responses in which dead-level abstraction constitutes a major difficulty—Economics answers 29, 48, 50, 73, 79, 89, 108, 137, and 147—are quoted below. At various junctures, to aid in establishing the point the present writer is making at a given time, the difficulties in responses are indicated by comments in brackets, and key words are underlined.

**Question (Economics 401). What is the so-called "economic problem"?**

Economics answer 50. It is the problem of supplying all of the unlimited human wants [dead-level abstraction] in a society which is relatively scarce in goods and services with regard to these wants [dead-level abstraction].
Question (Economics 671). Comment on the development of socialism in Great Britain.

**Economics answer 147.** Great Britain had a long history of increasing controls prior to socialization. However, the long tradition of freedom and liberty enabled the transition to be peaceful. This was exhibited in the evolution from a mercantilistic system to a laissez faire system and finally to a semi-planned economy. Considerable help was provided by the Fabian socialists and Robert Owen, who advocated evolutionary socialism.

In several responses (Economics answers 29, 48, 73, 79, 89, 108, and 137), the difficulties arising from dead-level abstraction are complicated by the use of the two-valued orientation and/or forms of to be.

**Question (Economics 100).** Why has the controversy over tariff policy been important to an understanding of American economic development?

**Economics answer 48.** Our tariff policy has helped the American business get started without danger from foreign industries. The tariff protected our business competition from abroad and thus enabled us to go into an industrial revolution. Industry provided employment for the people of our country, and also we were not dependent upon foreign imports. If it had not been for the tariffs, we probably would not have developed the great industries that we have in our country today.

In using the words "get started without danger from foreign industry" (lines 2-3), the student does not indicate, for instance, that the protective principle—even though secondary to the purpose of raising revenue—was incorporated in the Tariff of 1789; or that Calhoun in 1816, maintaining that he was ignoring for the moment the
matter of American investments in industry, asserted that economic independence was as essential as political independence. Here, as throughout the discussion, the student has been content to use broad, unexplained references—as, for instance, in lines 4-5: "The tariff protected our business competition from abroad . . . " The use of "industrial revolution" (line 6) is another example of the high level of abstraction on which the answer is written: The development of American industry is hinted at but not clarified. The answer as a whole seems not only rather obscure but also repetitious.

It may be noted, too, that the "either-or" attitude shown in the presentation as a whole—the insistence that the tariff was responsible for our "industrial revolution"—is accentuated by the finality of the is of classification in lines 8-9.

**Question** (Economics 671). How does one evaluate an economy as to whether it is capitalist or socialist?

**Economics answer 137.** The criteria I would use to determine whether a capitalist economy has become socialist would be what portion of the economy has been taken over to be owned and operated by government. By this I don't mean a percentage, but more what specific industries had been nationalized. If the banks, coal mines, electric power, transportation, possibly iron and steel were nationalized, they could be used in such a way that for all practical purposes the remainder of the industry might as well be nationalized. I think socialism could be achieved and still have room for quite a bit of freedom and democracy just the same as the British now have. I'll grant they aren't as free as we are, but their background and that they have available differ from what we have. I'm not sold on socialism, although I do think there are some good features in the system.
The student appears to begin well, and cites examples of specific industries. The use of these examples, however, helps little so far as clarification is concerned; the connection between the control of credit, transportation, electric power, natural resources, and nationalization of other parts of the national economy is not made clear. Moreover, the respondent does not explain the significance of "for all practical purposes." Second, the comments concerning the probability of "quite a bit of freedom and democracy" under socialism are not completely clarified by the statement that the British "are not as free as we are." One wonders whether the student was thinking of the British regulations on medical and dental attention, and on employment. Possibly, too, the "good features in the system" concern the British cradle-to-the-grave system of social security.

The vagueness of the response as a whole is accompanied by certitude shown in the is of classification in line 18, and by the repeated and confusing opposition of ideas.

Question (Economics L00). Explain the subsequent economic changes (i.e., once laissez faire had become established) which resulted in modification of the policy of laissez faire.

Economics answer 29. Some economic changes after laissez faire had been established were as follows:

1. Manufacturing had gone down and organization [dead-level abstraction] in business became poor.

2. Demand was low and people were content [forms of to be: finality, obscurity, high-level abstraction] to have no rules [dead level abstraction] and live differently [dead-level abstraction].
3. In some opinions, this was a good era of finality, obscurity, high level abstractions, but the majority felt that the laissez faire policy was not up to standards and the country would be improved by other policies.

Question (Economics 520). What are the advantages and disadvantages of a metallic standard? What substitutes would you make and why?

Economics answer 89. If we peg our money to a metal, as we do now in the United States, operating merely [two-valued orientation: oversimplification, with primary certitude and high-level abstraction] to define our money in terms of a metal, and even changing the value of the metal to suit our needs [dead-level abstraction] (as indeed F. D. R. did when he devalued the dollar), then we have a standard which offers practically all of the advantages [dead-level abstraction] with practically none of the disadvantages, and in the end we are able to cope with problems [dead-level abstraction] which have no solution under a strict metallic standard. For these reasons, I am firmly convinced that a money supply such as ours, or one which has no dependency on metal, but which relies on the ability and integrity of our government and banking system [dead-level abstraction] is by far the best system which can be used.

Question (Economics 401). In terms of the economic differences, contrast the United States and the Soviet Union. Use any concepts you have learned from lectures or the text.

Economics answer 73. One of the main differences is [is of classification, with high-level abstraction] in the allocation of goods. In America it is decided by a free market and competition [dead-level abstraction]. In Russia the government controls what and how many goods are to be allocated.
and where they will go. In America the institutions have a free hand in deciding these questions [dead-level abstractions]; in Russia, on the other hand, these institutions are controlled by the government. The Russian government may even start and liquidate institutions for the economic process [dead-level abstraction]; in America this is done by demand and need [dead-level abstraction].

Question (Economics 401). In terms of the economic differences, contrast the United States and the Soviet Union. Use any concepts you have learned from lectures or the text.

Economics answer 79. U. S.: modified capitalism where private enterprise controls demand, allocates resources, and co-ordinates processes which produce want-satisfying material for man's basic wants. The government acts as a regulatory and security unit [dead-level abstraction].

S. U.: a communistic system where the public, through the government, controls demand, allocation of resources, and co-ordinates processes which produce want-satisfying material for man's wants. The main difference is [is of identity, with high-level abstraction] that in one the public controls the allocation of resources [dead-level abstraction]; in the other, the allocation of resources is controlled privately [dead-level abstraction].

Question (Economics 520). What are the advantages and disadvantages of a metallic standard? What substitutes would you make and why?

Economics answer 108. The use of only one metal as a base would not be too wise. If a great increase or decrease of the one metal came upon the market, the base would be upset because the change would cause the price to either decrease or increase [dead-level abstraction]. This is [is of identity, with high-level abstraction] one of the reasons why a mono-metallic standard would not be too wise.
Changing price levels: if prices changed, the value of the dollar would change. This is one of the difficulties of a base standard, i.e., to find a metal which has all of the characteristics necessary to cope with all of the conditions [dead-level abstraction].

International trade: You want a metal which is used in as many countries as possible or acceptable in as many countries as possible.

Gold and money supply: Gold is equal to so many dollars on the gold market; money is equal to so much goods and services on the consumer market. By this ratio, you can see that gold is directly related to the money supply of a country [dead-level abstraction].

To summarize briefly at this point: The writer has inspected twenty-seven responses containing dead-level abstracting. In these responses, the students, employing such terms as "big business" and "government interference" (Economics answer 21), fail to use both high and low levels of abstraction—to use details and examples to clarify high-order abstractions, or to use higher levels of abstraction to give significance to specifics. The danger of being lost in a welter of minutiae exists; such details mean little out of a frame of reference. It may be noted, however, that all the responses in this classification contain dead-level abstraction on the high levels—such statements as "our tariff policy has helped the American business get started without danger from foreign industries." (Economics answer 48). Often, too, the final impression left by responses in the group considered above seems to be one of oversimplification and finality.

Next, let us consider several answers in which, because the abstractions used seem to be practically without meaning, an almost complete lack of communication results. In the following example,
it is possible that the student possessed little information about the question under consideration; at any rate, his ideas are not communicated.

**Question (Economics 400).** Explain the subsequent economic changes (i.e., once laissez faire had become established) which resulted in modification of the policy of laissez faire.

**Economics answer 37.** This policy was to overwhelm the people who had the most distasteful perfection. The modification was the one that everyone watched for and was a very hard one to attach to. This policy was a changeover from bad to good. They modified the wrong and the right, and they needed the most important of all when they wanted the policy of laissez faire.

The meaning of "most distasteful perfection," in the first place, does not seem immediately apparent. "Hard" (line 4) is probably used in the sense of "difficult," but the question Why? remains unanswered. Moreover, "overwhelm" (line 1), "bad" (line 6), and "good" (line 6) are connotative but, in context, practically meaningless. It is difficult for a reader to understand how a policy can "overwhelm." "Bad" and "good" in the present context, leave too many questions unanswered; the student has paid considerable attention to personal connotations. Finally, "attach" (line 4), and "changeover" (line 4), are figurative as well as connotative, and seem out of place in the student's discussion. Seeing these terms, the reader may visualize a parasite and a gasoline filling station.

In such answers, abstractions tend to lose their usefulness
based on selection and concentration, and, as a result, to reveal the vagueness that is an ever-present danger when they are used with little or no care. Thought is concealed, rather than revealed; and the sequence of ideas is difficult to follow.

In Economics answers 10 and 96, quoted below, similar difficulties appear.

**Question (Economics 400).** Patton says, "Mercantilism hadn't a chance once people started reading The Wealth of Nations." Do you agree or disagree? Explain fully.

**Economics answer 10.** In Adam Smith's presentation of The Wealth of Nations are points which probably had never been printed before or even thought of. The circumstances as well as the book itself were important factors which gave rise to the quotation by Patton.

Once people had begun reading and circulating widely this book, they were not only forced or beckoned into depth of thinking, but found they wanted to think. As a result, they tried to analyze political and economic conditions.

I agree with Patton. Mercantilism is a good system for economics, but only in a secular sense. That is, it is a very good system for putting a shaky government on its feet, or in sustaining it while building up or developing resources; but essentially I agree with Patton that because mercantilism is too continuing, it is only natural that it should not last long.

First, in this discussion, the student writes of "circumstances" (line 4). No explanation is offered, however, of why either the circumstances or the book is "important"; there is no mention, for instance, of the harmony of the ideas expressed in The Wealth of Nations with those of the times, with their emphasis on assertion of natural freedom and individual rights—as the phrases
ran. Second, the statement is made in line 10 that the readers of the book "found they wanted to think." In making this statement, the respondent does not mention, for example, Smith's discrediting of old economic ideas. The rise to power of Smith's doctrines remains unexplained. In lines 13-15, there is a hint—in the use of "secular"—of the idea that mercantilism was a practical policy rather than a philosophy; but the hint is not developed. In lines 15-17, the student begins an explanation; but in 19-21, he becomes incoherent. The framework for an acceptable response is present; but the ideas—and their relationship—are not clearly communicated.

Question (Economics 401). What are the basic decisions that have to be made, regardless of the form of the economic system?

Economics answer 86. To determine scarce wants. 1
(2) To produce the necessary amount of scarce products which are human wants 2
Lack of communication. 3
(3) To allocate scarcity [lack of communication]. 4
(4) What commodities are to be produced and supplied. 5

In the six answers inspected, the use of high-level abstractions results in a lack of communication. When a student maintains, for instance (Economics answer 86) that a basic economic decision is "to allocate scarcity," the reader has only a hazy idea about the extent of lack, the reasons for it, and the items that are scarce. The reader of each of these responses, then, vainly awaits further information, which could have been given through the use of lower levels of abstraction in the form of illustrations. The errors
appear to be more than mistakes in diction; the concepts probably were not clear in the student's mind.

Such errors in the use of abstraction appear to be related to dead-level abstracting, but the task of interpretation, so far as these answers are concerned, is complicated by the reader's difficulty in ascertaining the relationship of ideas. These responses, moreover, are characterized by faulty sentence structure, stemming from faulty thinking. Finally, many words are used as counters—as meaningless symbols. These students may have been "in possession" of some of the "facts"; they were unable, however, to state their meaning.

In a third group of responses under the heading Abstraction, looseness of thought, as well as the maintenance of a high level of abstraction, is shown. Eight examples are considered below.

Question (Economics 400). What did Adam Smith believe would be the regulator in the economic system?

a. Why did he believe this would work? Was this a valid assumption for him to make? Why?

b. What, if anything, has replaced this as regulator? Explain.

Economics answer 17. Government today regulates much of trade. In some countries it is in complete control of commerce. In others it merely regulates trade just so the problem of monopolies will not hamper free private enterprise.

In this brief response, the student seems to have raised more questions than he has answered. In the first place, what is meant by "complete control" (line 3)? Does the term involve government economic planning, as well as ownership and operation of industry,
including production, distribution, and sale? Second, the student
might well have cited an instance of monopoly before complicating
the matter by using the phrase "the problem of monopolies"
(lines 4-5). The reference may be to such activities as those con-
demned by Ida Tarbell, Lincoln Steffens, and others during the "muck-
raking" era. The reader, however, cannot be certain that the student
had such matters in mind. Moreover, why is "hamper" used (line 5)?
No explanation is offered of just how the unexplained problems of
the unidentified monopolies will hold back the abstract "free private
enterprise." The thinking, like the phrasing, seems unclear.

Question (Economics U01). In terms of the
economic differences, contrast the United
States and the Soviet Union. Use any
concepts you have learned from lectures
or the text.

Economics answer 75. One of the differences 1
between the United States and the Soviet Union 2
is the government. Here we have different 3
parties to run for our government. Over there 4
they know but one government, the one they 5
have. People have very little to say about the 6
government. Here we have a lot to say. 7

It will be noted, first, that is in the first sentence equates
two high-level abstractions. A "difference" cannot well be identical
with a "government." The student may have been thinking of bitter
political campaigns, various uses of campaign funds, and ward healers;
but the sentence contains little evidence of such ideas. The second
sentence appears to be equally confused, especially in the use of
"run for." Apparently some steps in thought have been omitted.
"Government" is used in different senses in the second, third, and
fourth sentences; such varying meanings of the word as "political
office," "highly centralized administration," and "municipal, state, and national political rule" hardly represent the same ideas. The use of lower-order abstractions would have helped to prevent this difficulty: references, for example, to the Republican and Democratic parties and their place in the government of a republic; to Russian elections and the control exercised over them by the Communist party.

Question (Economics 520). What are the advantages and disadvantages of a metallic standard? What substitutes would you make and why?

Economics answer 112. First thing you would do is to establish a mint by law and government. Upon achieving this, you would take some metal and establish it as your base, in other words, what you are going to use as a base. My base will be gold.

1. Select unit to represent gold.
2. How much goods and services will this unit buy?
3. Find out how much gold can be bought by this unit.

International trade
1. To begin, the gold mechanism took place when the exchange rates went beyond the gold export and import points.
2. The shipment of gold was supposed to stabilize exchange rates, but in (3) this happens.
3. Beyond the gold point here is what happens: You ship gold; you increase their supply and increase their money supply. Then come higher prices, and you stop importing in that country.

This country might increase the reserve behind gold, make credit controls. The velocity of money might slow down because of higher price. The drawing of relationships of grams of gold to the dollar to goods, prices.
Though this response contains fewer unqualified high-order abstractions than do the responses just analyzed, the meaning in 112 is noticeably obscured. The reader is somewhat confused, for example, by the comments concerning "units" and the buying of gold (lines 7-11). Again, what is the meaning of "gold mechanism" (line 13)? The student may mean the operation of the gold standard; but even so, what is the relationship of the "mechanism" to exchange rates, and what are "gold export and import points" (line 15)? The phrasing hints at statistics of fiscal reserves in national treasuries and banks—but only hints. The term "velocity of money" (line 26) probably refers to the amount of circulation of currency, but such a general term for quickness of motion seems here to be somewhat inaccurate. Finally, "The drawing of relationships of grams of gold to the dollar to goods, prices" conveys nothing more than a general hint of ratios between currency, merchandise, and prices—rather a comprehensive topic to deal with in twelve words.

The circumlocution in this response may also be noted. The student does not answer the question directly; he does not discuss the advantages and disadvantages of using a metallic standard; nor does he explain clearly and explicitly what substitute he would suggest—and why. Lack of adequate transition—as in lines 6-7 and 11-12—is another obstacle to clear understanding. The sequence of ideas is at least difficult to follow.

Looseness of thought and the use of undefined high-order abstractions occur also in Economics answers 22, 109, 118, 72, and 78, quoted below.
Question (Economics 400). Patton says, "Mercantilism hadn't a chance of survival once people started reading The Wealth of Nations." Do you agree or disagree? Explain fully.

Economics answer 22. Mercantilism hadn't a chance of survival once people began reading The Wealth of Nations because the people of England who had the most power were the merchants [forms of to be: finiality, obscurity, high-level abstractions]. Also at the time the guilds were powerful too [forms of to be: finality, obscurity, high-level abstractions]. Then the king joined the merchants and did away with the guilds. This took the authority away from the local people and made a strong national government [looseness of thought, with high-level abstractions] which still prevails today to some extent in nationalistic countries.

But once the people started to read The Wealth of Nations by Adam Smith, mercantilism began to fall because Smith believed in laissez faire or no government [looseness of thought, with high-level abstractions].

Question (Economics 520). What are the advantages and disadvantages of using a metallic standard? What substitutes would you make and why?

Economics answer 109. In setting up a standard, it seemed necessary to have something that would be recognized and accepted internationally. Gold seemed to have more of the necessary qualities than any other metal [looseness of thought, with high-level abstractions]. However, the use of an international standard causes many changes in internal affairs because of foreign complications [looseness of thought, with high-level abstractions]. In efforts to maintain this balance the gold content of the currencies has to be shifted periodically. These shifts now take place in all currencies at the same time. Some believe that an independent currency would be of greater advantage to individual nations.
because they could stabilize their own prices and wages without being concerned with other countries, and exports and imports would tend to regulate the rate of exchange [looseness of thought, with high-level abstraction]. Others advocate an international currency to be administered and regulated by a world banking organization. However, this has many drawbacks in that nations mistrust each other and all countries do not progress at the same speed [looseness of thought, with high-level abstraction]. The World Bank and International Monetary Fund could serve as a step in this direction in that they do control exchange rates and gold content of the various currencies. Inasmuch as gold is an accepted and more or less understood standard [looseness of thought, with high-level abstractions] it would probably be the best policy to maintain it.

Question (Economics 671). How does one evaluate an economy as to whether it is capitalist or socialist?

Economics answer 148. It is quite a difficult task to determine just when a capitalist economy has become socialized. It is just like saying, "When does a piece of metal become hot?" What is going to be used as a basis of comparison? Certainly nationalization alone does not constitute socialization. Undoubtedly there must be planning of some sort, but just when the amount of planning enables one to say that the economy is socialist is a ponderous question indeed [looseness of thought, with high-level abstractions]. If we look for a definition of socialism, we are confronted with explanations covering from a half-dozen words to pages and pages.

The misconception contained in the popular belief of what constitutes socialism seems to stem from confusion of social legislation and socialism. While socialism contains much social legislation, social legislation does not constitute socialism. I frankly would have considerable difficulty in judging just when a capitalist
The economy has become socialist. The development seems to be one of degrees which vary almost imperceptibly from one another but manifest themselves in clearly different extremes [looseness of thought, with high-level abstractions].

Question (Economics 401). In terms of the economic differences, contrast the United States and the Soviet Union. Use any concepts you have learned from lectures or the text.

Economics answer 72. The difference economically would be due to the control of the economic system. That is, the U.S. has an almost complete free enterprise economic system, whereas the U.S.S.R. has a centrally controlled economic system. Our real income flows and production are left up to what the people of our country happen to influence them to; whereas the flows and production are basically decided in Russia by a central control method [looseness of thought, with high-level abstractions]. That is to say that Stalin says what and how much to produce, where in the U.S. the farmers have something, somewhat, to say about production [looseness of thought, with high-level abstraction].

Question (Economics 401). In terms of the economic differences, contrast the United States and the Soviet Union. Use any concepts you have learned from lectures or the text.

Economics answer 78. The Soviet Union and the U.S. are almost numerical opposites in terms of a planned or free economy. The more centrally controlled, as in Russia, the more planned the economy. The U.S. has approximately 75 per cent free economy; Russia 70-80 per cent planned economy. In this country, except in times of emergency, or when control is obviously necessary for the general welfare, the market and the consumer together determine prices and production [looseness of thought, with high-level abstraction].
In these eight responses, then, high-order abstractions are used without clarification by means of the use of lower levels. For instance, a student writes "The use of an international standard causes many changes in internal affairs because of foreign complications" (Economics answer 109) without explaining what he means by "changes in internal affairs" and "foreign complications." Second, the students who wrote these answers omit steps in the development of thought, so that perhaps the student— but certainly not the reader—understands the relationship among the ideas considered in the responses. There may be, for example, a connection between changes in internal affairs and foreign complications; the burden of explanation rests on the student. Finally, the responses listed just above contain tangential material. If a student is asked to explain the advantages and disadvantages of using a metallic standard, it does not seem necessary for him to add an explanation of the procedure usually followed in establishing a gold standard. In these answers, then, the need appears to be for additional—and more accurate—information, and for more precise distinctions in thought.

Symbols. As we turn to the use of symbols, it will be noted that there are comparatively few examples—none in fact, of explicit confusion of word with object or idea. Instead, the errors appear to involve implicit—tacit—acceptance of word-magic. This type of misinterpretation involves disregard of the idea that a symbol refers to what it is actually used to refer to, not what one wishes it to refer to.

The beliefs, then, that the referent will shift according to
the wishes of the user of the symbol, and that the magic in a word will influence the course of events, constitute major errors in the use of symbols—errors shown in the answers quoted below.

First, then, two responses appear to combine an implicit acceptance of word-magic with the use of unqualified high-order abstractions. In the following example, the student was asked to reply to the question listed:

**Question (Economics 520).** What are the advantages and disadvantages of using a metallic standard? What substitutes would you make and why?

**Economics answer 94.** The advantages of a metallic standard depend upon the world situation. If the citizens of a country have complete faith in their government, and the export-import trade flows freely each way, then there is no need for any backing, and you could use fiat money since the metallic standards are based on fear.

The attitude expressed in the discussion—the psychological context—indicates that the student believes that the word faith has magic in it, and that by using the word, he will solve the problem. It appears that to the student, "complete faith" is a sign, having definite meaning and evoking a specific response. The significance and the response, however, are not communicated to the reader, and questions as to the extent and the nature of the "faith" are likely to arise. The referent, then, is not clear; yet the student seems satisfied to use the word without definition or qualification. In addition, the antithesis of "faith" and "fear" shows the simplicity of the entire matter in the mind of the student, as well as the lack of clear referents for the words (even though each of these symbols
may have a fairly specific meaning for the student).

Economics answer 2, in which similar difficulties appear in the use of symbols, is quoted below.

Question (Economics 400). What did Adam Smith believe would be the regulator in the economic system?

a. Why did he believe this would work? Was this a valid assumption for him to make? Why?

b. What, if anything, has replaced this as regulator? Explain.

Economics answer 2. Adam Smith believed that the regulator in the economic system should be the people without any interference from the government (word-magic, with high-level abstraction; also in line 3). He believed that the people would not allow any monopolies to develop to ruin the free enterprise. He did not have the clairvoyance to see that monopolies could develop so large that nothing but government control could destroy it, and he could not foresee the good which a monopoly gives to a society (word-magic, with high-level abstractions).

In these two responses (Economics answers 2 and 94), the present writer finds no clear indication of what is meant, no common ground for comprehension or evaluation. In the mind of a student, such a term as "the people" (Economics answer 2) may mean a group of well-informed citizens who manage with skill and wisdom a republican government; to a reader, the term may mean the rabble of Kipling's "MacDonough's Song." To write, then, that "the people" would (or would not) allow such and such an event to happen does not convey specific ideas with clarity and vigor. Moreover, the student who uses symbols in this way seems to have a belief in the virtue of symbols—a sort of linguistic mysticism. He disregards the idea that a symbol is arbitrary: the word "people" can do nothing. Such a use of symbols,
as we have seen, involves a signal reaction for the user.

The belief in word-magic is shown somewhat differently in another group of answers, to which we may now turn.

Question (Economics 401). In terms of the economic differences, contrast the United States and the Soviet Union. Use any concepts you have learned from lectures or the text.

Economics answer 76. I have a concept of the true economic system, which by employing economic analysis I can compare. Our free enterprise is also compared in terms of economic analysis. The Soviet Union can be compared with the other forms by economic analysis.

The student's use of the phrasing "the true economic system" (lines 1-2) shows one of the major obstacles which the careless use of symbols places in the way of accurate interpretation: confusion of the symbol with the idea. The wording indicates the student's belief that the word true makes the system a sound one, even though he offers no explanation or evidence. He has apparently forgotten that there is no direct connection between a symbol and an object or idea; adulterated food will remain so even though the word pure is printed on the package. Second, the vagueness of "true" in the context of the response shows that the student is having "true" mean what he wants it to mean; thus, he has greatly reduced the possibility of accurate interpretation.

Similar difficulties appear in Economics answer 33, quoted below.

Question (Economics 400). Explain the historical changes which resulted in the growth of the policy of laissez faire.
Economics answer 33. The people came to this country to be free from any governing body [word-magic, with high-level abstraction and two-valued orientation]. They set up the laissez faire so they could do as they wished [word-magic, with high-level abstraction and two-valued orientation].

In the two foregoing responses one notices three uses which cause some difficulty in communication. First, the respondents use such symbols as "the people" and "free" rather broadly and loosely—that is, without clear, specific limitation. Second, though the meaning of such terms as laissez faire is agreed upon in economics, these students apparently use them to mean more—to contain a private significance. Thus, to the students, the broadened concepts serve as explanations because they seem to be realities. Finally, the generalizations are unqualified and undeveloped; the signal reaction seems to be present.

Perhaps the most revealing examples of error in the use of symbols are contained in Economics answers 23 and 35. The first of these, a rather lengthy answer, contains considerable inaccurate and/or incomplete interpretation.

Question (Economics 400). Discuss, analyze, and appraise—as an amateur economist—the attempts of Hoover and the economic activities of the New Deal to alleviate the depression. In appraising these two efforts, it will be necessary for you to set forth what you consider to be the crux of the problem before you can appraise their activities directed toward solving the problem.
Economics answer 23. The crash of the 30's was mainly caused by over-speculation in the stock market. People would buy stock purely to get more money when prices went up. The prices got so high that trouble soon came. When the market started dropping, Hoover saw no great alarm. He felt that all that had to be done was to restore confidence in business and government. That was his selling point. Hoover tried to stop the depression at levels rather than trying to stop the whole depression. But as times got worse Hoover tried to solve it. Banks and railroads were getting in bad condition, so Hoover established the RFC to lend money to banks and railroads to get them back on their feet. He set the program up for a two-year basis, but it is still going. He also gave aid to the farmers in drought areas of the west. He gave them feed for their cattle, but it wasn't the individual. Hoover felt it wasn't the responsibility of the government to put people back on their feet.

This is where Roosevelt and Hoover differ. Roosevelt felt the government should give aid to persons. I think that Hoover's idea was healthier. I think Roosevelt's idea of a "handout" has destroyed the will to work in many cases. Roosevelt's main thought was to balance the budget, which he did. WPA, AAA are good examples of this. Roosevelt also felt that confidence was important. When he said, "The only thing we have to fear is fear itself," the saying became famous. Roosevelt also felt that raising the price of gold would cause inflation. He found out that people weren't interested in what was behind money but in the buying power behind money.

The student, in using the phrase "restore confidence" (line 8) brings in abstraction and two-valued orientation; the term is vague, and establishes an "either-or" orientation. The student seems to believe that bustling activity---in the rather vague form of "restoring confidence"---would solve the complicated economic problem under consideration. One does not know how or where the unqualified
"confidence" would be restored. Other symbols—"get them back on their feet" (lines 16-17), "put people back on their feet" (lines 23-24), and "handout" (line 29), are highly connotative and metaphorical, and, like "restore confidence," involve two-valued orientation. Phrased in such terms as these, with the reader given only two choices, nearly all problems might seem to be simple. The reader is not certain, either, about the connection of the symbols WPA and AAA with balancing the budget.

Other errors may be mentioned briefly. They include the finality in "purely" (line 3); the impression is given that no other reason may be adduced. Oversimplification appears also in lines 4-5: "The prices got so high that trouble soon came." What was the trouble? The phrase "selling point" (lines 9-10) has unfortunate connotations in the context. "Bad conditions" (line 14) and "help the individual" (line 21) seem rather vague.

In Economics answer 35, quoted below, one finds the same types of difficulty.

Question (Economics 400). Name and explain some of the effects of technological growth on the American economic system.

Economics answer 35. Technological growth has greatly influenced the American economic system. Though we find people confusing right with wrong, we find them depending on gold instead of an inferior metal, and resenting the weakness of the government in this matter [word-magic, with two-valued orientation, connotation, and metaphor]. People have grown to wish stability instead of chaos [word-magic, with two-valued orientation, connotation, and metaphor]. Modern technology is dominant over everything. The economic system has turned out to be one of the most wonderful systems because
of the technology used.

In Economics answers 23 and 35, as we have seen, interpretation is complicated by a number of uses of symbols. One finds, first, the confusion of word with object. A student who writes of "depending on gold instead of an inferior metal" shows his belief in the idea of virtue in the word gold by his use of "inferior" without limitation or consideration of the unfavorable connotations of the word. Second, the use of antithesis and of highly connotative words is closely related to the error that has just been mentioned, because there are no clear referents for the symbols. The use of the two-valued orientation, moreover, increases the difficulty of interpretation. Writing of wishing for "stability instead of chaos" (Economics answer 35) does not help to clarify the issue of the desirability of using gold as a monetary standard. The use of the dilemma thus built up shows the avoidance of gradation that is one of the major aspects of these responses.

**Contexts.** Let us now turn to the third classification, contexts. Shifts in meaning, especially significant in a consideration of contexts, are shown in practically all of the examples to follow. In these, the meaning of a number of terms often varies unpredictably; accuracy in interpretation, therefore, is impossible without further explanation, including specific examples.

In one group of six responses, such shifts of meaning are found, in addition to slanting and the unskillful use of high-level abstractions. These answers are considered below.
Question (Economics 400). Discuss, analyze, and appraise—as an amateur economist—the attempts of Hoover and the economic activities of the New Deal to alleviate the depression. In appraising these two efforts, it will be necessary for you to make clear the crux of the problem before you can appraise their activities directed toward solving the problem.

Economics answer 9. The crux of the problem in Hoover's time was the depression itself. People were not spending money. Prices were dropping, and jobs were hard to find. Unemployment was high, and everything in general was slow and getting worse. Hoover tried to stop all this. He tried to increase jobs and start things going on the uprise. He tried to raise prices. He tried to do what was right, but he didn't do enough. He allowed five hundred million dollars to help the farmers, but it came too late. When he tried to stop the depression, he tried to stop it at one certain point and not altogether. He would try to stop the depression at one certain point or day and then hope for things to get better in the future. Had he worked for the future and a later date, he might have slowed down the depression to a point where things would have started on the uprise. This was his one big mistake. He allowed people to mortgage half on their homes, but this came too late and wasn't enough. I believe that if Hoover had started sooner and worked for the depression to stop at a later date, he would have succeeded and would not have been blamed so much for the depression as he is now.

The student, with considerable circumlocution, appears to state that Hoover should have worked for the future—soon enough—and that prices, employment, and wages should rise. The context, however, is unclear; the significance of "future" and allied ideas (lines 18-21 and 24-29) seem to vary unpredictably from the idea of "time" to "belief" to "potential greatness." A few hints about the
President's efforts to "increase jobs" (lines 7-8), to "raise prices" (line 9) and to aid the farmers (lines 10-12) confuse rather than clarify the discussion, so far as an understanding of the aims, the efforts, and the results is concerned.

These difficulties are emphasized by the use of such abstractions as "crux" (line 1) and "depression" (line 2). The judgments which are passed are, under these circumstances, to be expected, as is the use of the is of identity and the is of classification (lines 2, 4, 5, 6, and 21).

Similar shifts in meaning appear in Economics answer 47 and 91.

Question (Economics 400). Explain the historical changes which resulted in the growth of the policy of laissez faire.

Economics answer 47. The historical change which resulted in the growth of the policy of laissez faire were these changes: That men could have the start of free businesses without the help of the government. That men could invest their own capital in their businesses if they had it. One big historical change which resulted in the growth of the policy of laissez faire had a lot to do with the discovery of America because it gave men some freedom and increased their desire for more freedom and therefore helped to encourage the discovery of America.

The reader will note the change in the meaning of laissez faire. Through lines 2-5, the significance of the word seems to be the conventional one--so far as can be told; the student was evidently thinking in terms of little or no regulation of financial practices by such agencies as the Securities and Exchange Commission. In lines 5-9, however, the meaning of laissez faire seems to shift to the abstract idea of freedom--of complete lack of restraint (the
interpretation is complicated by the repetition in lines 11, 12), resulting from implicit belief in the beneficent results of the growth of large, powerful corporations, such as the Standard Oil Company, and of the accompanying growth of monopoly.

Further complications result from the use of the loaded word "help" in line 5; vague and connotative, the term does not noticeably illuminate the meaning. The use of the highly connotative "free" (line 4) throws the passage into the realm of emotive rather than referential language.

Question (Economics 520). Instead of devaluation, what else could a country do to achieve purchasing power parity or an advantage?

Economics answer 91. Government can finance the deficit until the product can be produced more economically. Producing goods as economically and as acceptably as possible will solve the problem. The government might create markets and articles economically until production is on its feet.

In this response, the significance of "production" changes without warning. The student has used "producing" in line 3 to mean "manufacturing"; but in line 7, "production" seems to have the general meaning of "the furnishing of articles having an exchangeable value." Thus, a term often used—and clearly defined—in economics is employed here with meanings greatly varying in depth and breadth. Moreover, the use, in seven lines, of "product," "produced," "producing," and "production" tends to make difficult anything approaching precision, whether in writing or in analysis.

Increasing the difficulty of understanding the meaning of "production" is the high level of abstraction. The student has used
few examples; instead, he has stayed in the rarefied atmosphere of
broad, abstract terms and statements. Finally, the connotative terms
"economically" (lines 3, 7) and "acceptably" (line 4) show slanting,
in that these words reveal the student's attempt to influence the
reader toward the conclusions already reached by the student.

Several other responses in which similar difficulties appear
(Economics 80, 36, and 83) are quoted below.

Question (Economics 401). In terms of
the economic differences, contrast the
United States and the Soviet Union. Use
any concepts you have learned from
lectures or the text.

Economics answer 80. Both countries use
great sums of money. The United States is
called a capitalist and Russia a communist
state. The difference is in how the money is
spent and what it goes for. The United States
goes on the basis of a maximum of private
enterprise with limited government inter-
vention [dead-level abstraction]. In Russia
the government has the role of running all
enterprises [dead-level abstractions]. The
money is spent practically in the same way
except for the differences in ownership
[slanting, with oversimplification]. The
economy [shifts in meaning, high-level
abstractions, slanting] for all of Russia is
run by the government, while in the United
States each concern may have a different
kind of economy [shifts in meaning, high-level
abstractions, slanting].

Question (Economics 400). Explain the
historical changes which resulted in the
growth of the policy of laissez faire.

Economics answer 36. This historical change
took place when laissez faire was put up for
the most rugged policy. This policy was to
determine whether or not a person was fitted
for this section or not. This policy was very
distinctive and made a very marked impression
Question (Economics 401). "What are the basic decisions that have to be made, regardless of the form of the economic system?"

Economics answer 83. The basic decisions that have to be made are to know how much to have each producer produce in order not to flood the market and have deflation, or not to have enough and have inflation. The other problem is to find out what price and how much the consumer is going to consume. The decision is one of achieving equilibrium through wise choice [shifts in meaning, high-level abstractions, slanting, and is of identity, with finality].

In the six responses examined, then, (Economics answers 9, 36, 47, 80, 83, and 91), one notices that the shifts in meaning are accompanied by several other aspects of word use. First, many words used are abstract and/or connotative; without limitation, their meaning is vague. Examples are "help" and "change"; with faulty context, their meaning is blurred. Second, the obscurity which results is increased by the use of such high-level abstractions as environment, a word which approaches all-inclusiveness. As a result, slanting—or the appearance of slanting—is probably often unintentional; for under these circumstances, misunderstanding is easy on the part of the reader.

In another group of answers, the repetition of crucial—and undefined—terms is accompanied by confused context, high-order abstractions, and connotative terms. For example, let us consider the response which follows.
Question (Economics 520). What are the advantages and disadvantages of using a metallic standard? What substitutes would you make and why?

Economics answer 98. By causing an inflation or deflation of a country it would act upon the other that remained static so as to appear that it was in a depression. Inflated currency would be able to buy more domestic goods, thus causing a foreign country to speculate within the inflated currency. This inflation would increase export of more goods than an import of goods.

First of all, "inflates" and "inflation" are used (lines 1, 4, and 7) without examples, qualification, or explanation of any kind. No differentiation is made between the meaning of "undue expansion of currency of a country" and that of "a substantial rise in prices caused by an undue expansion in paper money or bank credit." As a result, the verbal context seems somewhat uncertain and wavering; in his discussion, the student appears to fluctuate between the two meanings of the term.

Other errors, closely connected with the faulty context noted above, include misuse of abstraction and of connotation. The term "static" (line 3), in its disregard of the process of change and of relativity, appears, in this context, practically meaningless in thought and in fact. "Inflated currency" appears to be a symbol used to mean what the student wishes it to mean. He has repeated this term without clarification and without logical, careful arrangement of ideas.

One finds similar inaccuracies in Economics answers 13 and 32, which follow.
Question (Economics 400). What did Adam Smith believe would be the regulator in the economic system?

a. Why did he believe this would work? Was this a valid assumption for him to make? Why?

b. What, if anything, has replaced this as regulator? Explain.

Economics answer 13. Adam Smith believed that free enterprise would be the regulator of the economic system. I believe this would work because it would give the farmers and businessmen more say so in the government and their farms and businesses. No, I don't believe this was a valid assumption for him to make, because I think it would have been better if the government had given the small man more say so.

The governmental intervention has replaced this as a regulator because the government felt they must have a say so in the government or power; being over the people, they had say so what to do.

First, the meaning of "say so" (lines 5, 10, 13, and 15) seems to vary considerably. In line 5, the words seem to signify "authority" or "weight of opinion," though the nature is not revealed; in line 10, on the other hand, they seem to refer to opportunity to express ideas and opinions. In line 13, "say so" appears to mean "an interest"; but in line 15, a sort of veto power seems to be indicated. The vagueness is complicated by the high level of abstraction maintained throughout the response. For instance, in lines 3-6, the student does not develop or explain the idea sketched in the sentence; the reader does not know whether the "say so" refers, for instance, to management, to lower taxes, or to exemption from Federal regulation by, say, the Interstate Commerce Commission. Finally, the use of "better" in line 10 raises questions. Why, and in what ways,
does the writer of the discussion consider it "better"? Here, as in his unexplained use of the highly connotative "small man" and "intervention" (lines 10 and 11) the respondent has depended on verbal association and evocation to convey his meaning. A little more care in definition and in the use of denotative words would have made the answer considerably more clear and definite.

Question (Economics 400). Explain the historical changes which resulted in the growth of the policy of laissez faire.

Economics answer 32. With the growth of corporations, a philosophy of keeping "hands off" developed—an idea of freedom for private enterprise (high-level abstractions, connotation). Then, as the corporations and the freedom grew, the people became aware of the possibilities (confused contexts, shifts in meaning, high-level abstractions, connotation). After a long struggle for freedom in the United States, the people controlled the government finally (confused contexts, shifts in meaning, high-level abstractions, connotation) and felt that business should be free from government intervention if this was to be a free country (confused contexts, shifts in meaning, high-level abstractions, connotation).

To summarize briefly, then: In Economics answers 13, 37, and 98, one sees the close connection between confused contexts and shifts in the meaning of key terms. In these answers, repetition serves to increase the number of ideas communicated, rather than to strengthen an idea. As the students use different approaches, the varied meanings in mind are partly revealed. Moreover, many of the terms are abstract; and because abstractions possess varied aspects and meanings, the user of an abstraction, such as industry or inflation, should have a clear referent in mind, and should communicate it to his listener or his reader. Finally, the use of highly connotative
words, such as regimentation, increases the danger of misinterpretation, for emotion enters, and feeling, rather than verifiable information, is communicated.

Uses of to be. As we turn to the consideration of student errors in the use of forms of to be, it will be noted that problems of pseudo-finality and of projection appear. As will be seen, these problems often involve the use of high-level abstractions without examples or qualification, and of emotive language.

The first response to be considered is an example of what happened in several discussions. The student, in Economics 401, defines the "economic problem" in the following manner:

Economics answer 57. The economic problem is an abstract, dealing with the scarcity of goods that is a human want compared with the overall scarcity of goods.

The impression is given that two simple statements tell the whole story: (1) the economic problem is an abstract; (2) the scarcity of goods is a human want. Yet, there are several abstract terms in the response; surely more explanation would be helpful. Could not the problem have been defined, for example, in terms of food, clothing, and shelter? Then too, the highly abstract term "scarcity of goods" is equated with "a human want." Naming does not define; and the reader is told little about either "scarcity" or "want!" The relationship between scarcity and the desires of individuals for "goods" remains obscure. These errors—and it is worthy of note that in one sentence, the student uses the is of identity twice—plus the confused sentence structure, render responses difficult to interpret.
The ideas appear to be implicit, rather than explicit.

Economics answer 101 reveals equal finality:

**Question (Economics 520).** What are the advantages and disadvantages of using a metallic standard? What substitutes would you make and why?

**Economics answer 101.** A metallic standard is one that is permanent and is not something that would evaporate, spoil, or decay. Therefore, I am in favor of a gold standard, which is suitable and dependable.

Through the use of the *is* of classification, the metallic standard is described as "permanent" (line 2), "suitable" (line 5), and "dependable" (line 5). The assurance shown in the response may arouse no echo in the reader's mind; he may question the finality in the comment, as well as the lack of analysis of the qualities named in the predicate adjectives. Moreover, contrast appears: A metallic standard is something that will not "evaporate, spoil, or decay" --phrasing which might be more convincing if one could visualize an unnamed abstraction evaporating. "Permanence," "stability," and "dependability" are, after all, abstractions on a high level. One feels that the ideas are perhaps praiseworthy, but what are the referents? No explanations are offered; the reader has little to help him. He has before him only the assertion that a metallic standard possesses certain pleasing but undefined qualities.

In three other responses to be quoted (Economics answers 1, 62, and 70, which follow), one finds the same finality and high-level abstraction.
Question (Economics 401). What is the essential nature and characteristics of an economic problem?

a. In view of your study and analysis of economic history,

(1) What would you say is the most important point you have learned concerning the solution of such problems?

(2) What would you say is the most important point you have learned this quarter?

Economics answer 1. The major characteristic of an economic problem is to keep the system going in order to solve the problem, as a view must be taken on the conditions of what is prevalent at the time of the problem. What was efficient is not usable now. The most important thing I have learned in economics is this matter of looking at a situation from all points of view before deciding on an answer. The depression, and the attempts made to alleviate it, is an example.

One finds finality and assurance in lines 2, 5, 6, and 11.

First, in lines 2-3, the relationship between the continuance of an economic system and the solution of "the problem" is not made clear. A hint is given in lines 4-5, in the oblique comment on the need for analysis; but the respondent does not mention what is to be analyzed, except in the words "the condition of what is prevalent at the time of the problem" (lines 4-5). A related idea, the concept of the effects of change, is touched upon in line 6, in connotative, contrasted terms; but the statement is not made specific. Finally, lines 6-10 are not clarified by the example in the last two lines, in which the student seems to refer to the reasoning behind some of the "attempts." Throughout the answer, finality is accompanied by a consistently high level of abstraction and by considerable obscurity.
Question (Economics 401). What is the so-called "economic problem"?

Economics answer 62. It is in the relation between scarcity and want of a certain good [finality, obscurity, high-level abstractions]. If a product is scarce [high-level abstraction] and it is a daily need, the demand will be high [finality, obscurity, high-level abstraction]. If a product is plentiful [high-level abstraction], the demand will not be as great [finality, obscurity, high-level abstraction].

Question (Economics 401). In terms of the economic differences, contrast the United States and the Soviet Union. Use any concepts you have learned from lectures and the text.

Economics answer 70. The United States is a form of regulated capitalism, which is a system of free enterprise or control of government, wealth, and production by the people as a whole [forms of to be, with high-level abstraction].

The Soviet Union is a form of communism, which is a system of control by the state of all production, wealth, land, or property [forms of to be, with high-level abstraction]. The state is more or less made up of a select few. (In my opinion, the U.S.S.R. is practically a form of dictatorship run by "Uncle Joe."

It may be remarked, then, after the examination of seven responses containing such errors in the use of forms of to be (Economics answers 1, 57, 62, 70, 74, 81, and 101), that these answers are compressed without being clear. Using the is of identity and the is of classification, the students equate terms without using qualifying words or phrases; the result is a specious conclusiveness. Second, the terms which are equated in this manner are high-order abstractions; and the writing remains on that level. The lack of clarity which results is additionally complicated by the faulty sentence
structure.

In another group of student-written discussions, one finds a combination of errors, hinging on the use of the is of identity and the is of classification. For instance, one student, in Economics 671, was asked how one evaluates an economy as to whether it is capitalist or socialist.

Economics answer 140. The planning mechanism is the foremost criterion in my mind for determining whether a capitalist economy has become socialist. Freedom is the keyword to me in capitalism. Whether the result is wrong or right, there is freedom to decide.

The fact that the president has lifted controls and is giving the economy a chance to balance itself is to me a big step away from socialism.

Private property is just one phase of freedom, but it has many important implications. The ownership by individuals unrestricted by limiting national laws means individual power. The fact that the basic industries are not nationalized means certain freedoms to lesser industries.

The fact that people may freely choose their leaders is another indication of capitalism and is the means by which I hope Britain can hold the fort against further socialization.

The lack of a plan and set goals for America is a good omen. The government is most interested in making the way of free enterprise and individual decision as easy as possible. It is responsible for the legal institutions, etc., to that end.

Finally, any limitations upon men's souls is a decided step toward socialism and ultimate communism.

The student has used the is of identity five times; that of classification, twice. The equating of "mechanism" (line 1) with "criterion" and of "freedom" (line 4) with "keyword" presents comparatively few difficulties; but the use of "wrong or right" in lines 5-6 raises questions that remain unanswered. Is the student referring
to party politics or to the safety of the Republic? Is he writing in terms of legislation protecting a factory worker, or of the margin requirements set by the Federal Reserve Board? In line 13, the meaning may be that the ownership of property by individuals forms one phase of the economic system under which we live; but the logic does not seem to be clear. In lines 23-27, the assertion that "the lack of a plan and set goals for America is a good omen" is only partly explained by the comments—phrased in abstract terms—in the remainder of the paragraph. Finally, why is "any limitation" "a decided step"? What is meant by "limitation"?

Other errors, especially the use of unqualified high-level abstractions, contribute to the difficulty of interpreting such answers. "Planning mechanism" (line 1) is not defined; it may mean an export-import bank or a dictator. "Freedom" (line 4) is repeated in line 6, where the use of "freedom to decide" raises the question, decide what? The idea of the dignity of the individual, protected by basic civil rights, may be implicit here; but no explanation is offered by the student. The lack of clarity that results is aggravated by the connotation in "balance itself" (line 9), which reminds the reader of the teachings of Adam Smith; in "set goals" (line 23); and in "limitations" (line 29). The reader may wonder, too, what the writer means by "holding the fort" (highly connotative) against "further socialization" (lines 21-22).

The same combination of errors stemming from unskillful use of forms of to be is found in Economics answer 114, quoted below.
Question (Economics 669). Discuss Fabian Socialism.

Economics answer 114. Fabianism was conceived in 1883 by a small group of writers and intelligentsia. They were well versed in economic and social problems [is of classification, with lack of qualification]. They rejected Marxianism and class conflicts in the belief that economic inequities can be eliminated by rational co-operation [high-order abstraction, with connotation]. They were intelligent and determined men that worked steadily toward the goal of socialism [is of classification, with connotation and lack of qualification] through the trades-unions movement and middle-class organizations. They feel that competition has not served the purpose originally described by Adam Smith and advocate co-operation instead. The state and the people are held to be synonymous in their highly democratic state [high-order abstraction, with connotation].

In these two answers, 114 and 140, there appears to be, first a lack of qualification, of shading and discrimination. Hedging is not desirable; but a writer has the obligation to weigh and consider his words, especially in writing a discussion which is supposedly objective. A number of sweeping, unqualified, and unsupported statements appear in these two responses. Second, in these answers, the logic is not markedly clear, partly because of the lack of careful analytical thinking, partly because of the equating of high-order abstractions through the use of the is of identity and the is of classification. Finally, the students, through the use of emotive language, have frequently submitted feelings rather than facts.
Two-valued orientation. In Economics answers 24, 93, 142, and 149, to follow, finality and oversimplification are made prominent by antitheses, and accurate interpretation is rendered more difficult by the use of unexplained high-level abstractions. Let us turn first to Economics answer 24.

Question (Economics 400). Discuss, analyze, and appraise—as an amateur economist—the attempts of Hoover and the economic activities of the New Deal to alleviate the depression. In appraising these two efforts, it will be necessary for you to set forth what you consider to be the crux of the problem before you can appraise their activities directed toward solving the problem.

Economics answer 24. The cause of the situation in the 30's was to restore the confidence of the American people. Hoover tried to provide that confidence through the help of big business. Of course the majority of the people were laborers or the like. Many members of the administration followed the policy of helping private enterprise to get back on its feet and then waiting for the rest of the population to come back naturally. All confidence was lost when the measures of Hoover and the banks failed. Roosevelt just benefited from Hoover's mistakes, and instead of attaining confidence from the top to the bottom, he did it very successfully from the bottom up. All his reforms and policies were based on this thought.

In spite of the fact that the instructor asked for an appraisal, the student has set up, in the first sentence, a black-and-white relationship, which can be clearly discerned through the somewhat jumbled sentence structure. The explanation, which might have clarified or modified the student's position, rests on the sweeping generalization in lines 4-5, and on the high-level abstraction
"confidence" which appears in lines 3, 4, 11, and 16. Moreover, the broad classifications tend to strengthen rather than weaken the certainty that pervades the student's mind. For example, he writes, "The majority of the people were laborers or the like." (lines 6-7). Perhaps the statement is true; but considerable differences exist between skilled and unskilled workers. Moreover, does the student include all the "rest of the population" in line 10?

Connotation and oversimplification, too, figure largely in this response. How the "rest of the population" would "come back naturally" (lines 10-11) is not revealed, nor the nature of the "coming back." The "measures" (line 12) remain undiscussed. In lines 14-19, the student briefly disposes, in terms of "from the bottom up," of complex and controversial political issues. Finally, he includes all of Roosevelt's "reforms" and "policies" in this description. The vagueness and sweeping generalizations tend seriously to weaken the student's contentions.

Let us turn now to another response.

Question (Economics 520). What are the advantages and disadvantages of using a metallic standard? What substitutes would you make and why?

Economics answer 93. I myself would substitute fiat money. Why? I'll tell you why. I am under the firm school of thought that within the next 50 years we shall see some form of it in its true (absolutely no backing) form. Through custom and tradition I feel quite sure that societies should see more advantages and less bother connected with "no backing" currency. Given time and patience the world, I am sure, some day in the not-too-distant future, will gain confidence enough to sponsor this simplified form of money standard.
Assumption: Government control all the way.

Results: Ease in financial part of the economy.

In the phrase "more advantage and less bother" (line 8), the antithesis is overt. No explanation is offered, furthermore, concerning either of these abstractions; apparently the student expected that the connotations of the terms would convey pleasing and convincing ideas to the reader. The student is hinting, rather than explaining. "Simplified" (line 12), moreover, constitutes an assertion, not an explanation; the word appears to have been employed with the idea that the use of a metallic standard necessitates complex and unnecessary (but unspecified) activities. The use of "ease" in line 19 amounts to a repetition of the student's favorite, and vague, idea of simplicity.

The ideas thus obscurely advanced are linked only by such unqualified abstractions as "custom" (line 6), "tradition" (line 6), "patience" (line 10), and "confidence" (line 12). These pleasant but—in this context—vague terms do little to explain the advantages and disadvantages of using a metallic standard or to support the student's statements.

In Economics answers 142 and 149, the reader finds similar finality, with antithesis and high-level abstractions:

Question (Economics 671). How does one evaluate an economy as to whether it is capitalist or socialist?
In the United States, the revolution began with the end of the Hoover administration—perhaps in the middle of it—and has been with us for the past twenty Democratic Party years and Republicans a much shorter time. The power of the government grows stronger with each welfare issue and abuse in parity. We have social security, and the welfare state and a socialized health program are forthcoming.

Are the people ready for socialism in the United States? Ask any man or woman who gets old-age assistance or the farmer being subsidized—and those who suffered under controls during the war and until Ike's program.

In asserting (line 2) that "the revolution began . . . " the student has tacitly insisted on either the status quo or the revolution. Without explanation or qualification, he offers these two choices, plus the connotations of "revolution." His comments about the "revolution" are amplified in lines 6-10, in which the repetition of "welfare state" is accompanied by mention of social security and a socialized health program. Though the student appears to refer to the program of social legislation—such as social security, the Agricultural Adjustment Administration, and the Wagner Act—and to the governmental agencies that administer these programs, he does not explain the connection between the growth of power of the Federal Government and these developments. The second paragraph, with its partial explanation of the examples offered, intensifies the two-valued orientation already noted. The writer of the response, instead of objectively enumerating criteria and using specific examples for clarity and support, has offered an opposition of abstract, unqualified ideas. Though basically sound, the answer leaves too much to the interpretation of the reader.
Question (Economics 671). Discuss the derivation of socialism from capitalism.

Economics answer 149. Socialism arose as an answer to what socialists believed were the inherent evils of free enterprise. The group had the idea of helping the oppressed common man [finality, with antithesis and high-level abstraction]. Without competition, they thought, men would have freedom, civil rights, the right to work, and could stand on their own feet [high-level abstraction].

In my opinion, social legislation will lead inevitably to the welfare state. We must keep free enterprise.

In the four answers (24, 93, 142, and 149) considered just above, one finds generalization rather than thoughtful analysis. The students writing these discussions appear to have formed their opinions before making the careful evaluation requested and to have taken refuge in the dilemma built up through the use of antithesis. Interpretation is complicated, too, by the employment of emotive language, shown in such statements as "The power of the government grows stronger with each welfare issue and abuse in parity" (Economics answer 142)—statements in which feeling is revealed, even though objectivity seems called for. An appraisal presupposes not only careful thought but also the use of supporting evidence. Instead, one finds omnibus assertions in these answers.

In Economics answers 102 and 150, to follow, the two-valued orientation appears, on the other hand, to be implicit rather than explicit. Though the writers seem more mild and balanced in their writing, the "either-or" opposition—in spite of some hedging—appears.
Question (Economics 520). What are the advantages and disadvantages of using a metallic standard? What substitutes would you make and why?

Economics answer 102. As far as substituting another standard for the metallic standard, I don't think I could improve on it. Possibly some other commodities—types of goods, foods, or liquids—could be substituted, but they would not be as desirable as a metal standard.

It appears that the choice must fall to a metallic standard. The student has taken his position without supplying supporting evidence. The example in the second sentence does not provide explanation; the meaning might be clearer if one knew more about what goods, foods, and liquids were meant. The use of the is of classification (line 6) lends additional unbuttressed assurance to the student's comments. The question Why?—a question which needs answering in lines 3 and 7—remains unanswered here, as well. The two-valued orientation indicates a lack of open-mindedness, of unwillingness to consider new or non-traditional ideas.

In Economics answer 150, the reader finds the two-valued orientation appearing in a similar manner:

Question (Economics 671). Discuss the basic differences between communism and socialism.

Economics answer 150. Some of the basic—me—differences between communism and socialism are degrees, philosophy, and social situations [dead-level abstraction]. Communism was revolutionary. They killed and murdered anybody or thing that stood in their way. They wasted human and natural resources. They tried to change the philosophy of the people by outlawing religion. Communism wishes to dominate the man's free will. He has not democratic choice of who
or what type of government shall represent him. In socialism the people voted for it, but were not shot if they didn't like the proposals. This is due, of course, to national traits [oversimplification, with primary certitude and high-level abstractions]. People who have never enjoyed something will never miss it.

In Economics answers 102 and 150, considered above, the impression of mental inflexibility is less marked than in the answers discussed on pages 223-227 (Economics answers 24, 93, 142, and 149). Nevertheless, the lack of support for statements causes one to feel that in 102 and 150, the students have casually dismissed procedures other than the ones they consider desirable. The impression is often given that a student is saying, "I think that such a proposal would be workable, but it would be less desirable than the one I first mentioned, the one I favor." The tone of moderation in these responses, then, does not prevent one from feeling that the students writing these answers believe the matters to be settled—as they desire them to be settled.

Connotation. As has been mentioned, connotative words are often used, through influencing the reader to accept or reject an idea, to lead him to the formation of judgments. Personal connotations often appear in such writing, as well as dead-level abstracting, faulty context, and the finality accompanying the careless use of forms of to be.

In Economics answers 25, 92, 104, 124, and 143, which follow, though the students attempt to clarify the high-level abstractions used, the connotative words remain indefinite and relatively emotive.
Question (Economics 400). Show how the need for and development of quick and cheap transportation have affected the growth of the American nation.

Economics answer 25. When the trains came, they charged outrageous prices, as in the West the farmers couldn't ship by rail because of the great expense. The short and long haul in the East was a nuisance. The farmers then took this to the Supreme Court, which made the railroads change and start things more reasonable.

Through the use of connotation, the student passes a number of judgments. In line 2, the "prices" are described as "outrageous"; but the student lists no figures on freight rates, or details about, for instance, rebates, to support the associated ideas of injustice and lack of equity. Moreover, the "expense" mentioned in line 4 may have been "great"; but, to the reader, the size may be less significant than figures showing exactly freight rates on transcontinental shipments. Third, the "short and long haul" (lines 4-5) remains briefly characterized, through the is of identity, as a hindrance—a term which suggests deliberate obstruction of something by unnamed but reprehensible railroads. Finally, the use of "reasonable" in line 8 reminds the reader that exactly what the student feels is "fair," "just," "reasonable" is not revealed. The student seems to be more interested in displaying his feelings through the use of highly charged words than in communicating his ideas precisely.

Question (Economics 520). What are the advantages and disadvantages of using a metallic standard? What substitutes would you make and why?
Economics answer 92. It must be remembered that gold standards, too, are affected by price levels, and if a disproportionality does exist, there must be a common meeting ground for another sort of equality. Now in the metallic standard, practicing such policies could be quite dangerous; on one hand, you may have a threatened run, or draining away of your gold supplies, or a competitive warfare as a result of devaluation. With a paper standard the essential paper is dependent upon fluctuating price levels and not some artificial barrier. There would be no set standard or base, actually; however, the use of such a standard could be extremely dangerous, i.e., through runaway away inflation brought on by flooding the economy with too many dollars for too few goods.

In the first place, the example used to restrict the meaning of "dangerous" remains undeveloped. Second, the student does not answer the questions arising from his use of "essential" (line 11). Exactly why and under what circumstances is the paper money to be considered "essential"? He has apparently made up his mind, but does not explain the reasons for his "conclusions." "Runaway" (lines 16-17) appears to lead to the formation of a signal reaction; the reader reacts unfavorably to the idea of runaway horses, or automobiles, for instance. This impression is reinforced by "dangerous" (line 16) and by "flooding" (line 17). The reader, who may be thinking unhappily of the possibility that the middle classes may be ruined as a result of the reduction in the purchasing power of the dollar, might have been reassured and aided if the student had used examples—for instance, of what happened to the value of the dollar during the prewar and postwar years.
Other errors contribute to the obscuring of meaning. High-level abstractions include "another sort of equality" (line 5), "policies" (line 7), and "competitive warfare" (line 10). The matter grows more complicated when one remembers that "equality" and "warfare" are connotative as well as abstract. The reader is left with a hazy group of images—of dignity, value, worth, judgment, and the law of the jungle.

In Economics answers 104, 124, and 143, quoted below, the same indefiniteness is found in many of the connotative words used.

Question (Economics 671). Discuss the basic differences between Soviet Communism and British Socialism.

Economics answer 113. There are many basic differences between Soviet Communism and British Socialism. First and foremost in my mind is the totalitarianism as opposed to democratic functioning of the economy. The private owners in the various means are consulted in reference to economic policy. There is no private ownership in Russia to consult with. These differences are purely circumstantially created, the historical situations in the two countries differing so.

Also, the goals are not the same. Russia has aimed at and gotten a full control over the economy and political life of the nation. Britain, on the other hand, is seemingly content with partial nationalization and a welfare state. The historical differences explain this too. A severe change was called for in Russia in view of the oppression and the resulting emotionalism existent. Britain, on the other hand, has lived with her democracy for a great period of time, and her needs are limited.

First, in using the phrase "democratic functioning of the economy" (line 5), the respondent makes an effort to explain the phrase; but the explanation (in lines 5-7) is on an equally high
level of abstraction. No mention is made, for instance, of the Fabian Society or of its non-Marxist, evolutionary platform. Second, in lines 16-17, the words "partial nationalization and a welfare state" are used. The student might have specified, for instance, the nationalization of the steel industry, the program of medical care for all, the governmental control over employment. Finally, "historical situation" and "historical differences" are used in lines 10-11 and 17, respectively. Lines 10-11 and 18-23 represent an effort—only partially successful—to indicate the meaning in terms of Russia's revolutionary periods, such as that in 1905, and Britain's slow, for the most part orderly development, as shown, for example in Magna Carta and the Petition of Right. In the answer as a whole, the student has depended too much on connotation to communicate the ideas—thoughtful and carefully analyzed—*implicit* in the answer.

Question (Economics 520). What are the advantages and disadvantages of using a metallic standard? What substitutes would you make and why?

Economics answer 10½. I would do away with all standards and use paper money based on government promises to pay. If this is used properly [connotation not clear, though effort has been made to clarify high-level abstractions], it is much more flexible [connotation not clear, though effort has been made to clarify high-level abstractions] to the demands on currency. It is understood that this form of currency is dependent upon how they are controlled.
Question (Economics 669). Discuss Christian Socialism.

Economics answer 124. The movement was in protest against the products of industrialization—the mass misery and degradation of the working people [connotation not clear, though effort has been made to clarify high-level abstractions] who were associated with the industrial movement.

The Church dedicated itself to bettering the conditions of the working classes [dead-level abstraction] and tried to do this through peaceful means, such as airing the problems, social legislation, and humanitarian movements.

The people of the Church were gravely concerned with the lack of attendance to religious matters. This was in a large part responsible for its failure. There was no well-rounded-out program and no adequate leadership [connotation not clear, though effort has been made to clarify high-level abstractions].

From England, the movement for social and economic reform [dead-level abstraction] spread to many countries throughout Europe. However, there was no great success in the venture. The movement failed to attract the middle classes, especially, who were at this time becoming a virulent economic force.

In these five responses (Economics answers 25, 92, 104, 124, and 143), one finds a lack of precision, as well as of clarity. The lack of precision is related to the hedging shown in the refusal to answer questions directly and clearly. Instead, the students writing these answers have wandered and only slightly justified their conclusions. Moreover, the students have used such terms as "reasonable" (Economics answer 25) and "properly" (Economics answer 104) in such a way as to stimulate transfer and the signal reaction. In these answers, such use involves not only connotation, but abstraction as well.
In another group of responses (Economics answers 12, 14, 26, 65, 68, 105, and 116), which follow, the use of connotation sets up, in effect, a two-valued orientation.

**Question (Economics 400).** What did Adam Smith believe would be the regulator in the economic system?

**a.** Why did he believe this would work? Was this a valid assumption for him to make? Why?

**b.** What, if anything, has replaced this as a regulator? Explain.

**Economics answer 12.** Adam Smith believed that free competition would be the regulator in an economic system. He based this conclusion on this premise: A and B are producing the same product. In order for one of the two to gain control of a market, he has to produce a superior product at a low price. This could work out, but it is a utopian situation. Little regard was made in this direction. What's from stopping A and B to get together and thus controlling the market? As you can see, this wouldn't work. The regulation of competition is now in the hands of the Government. The Government doesn't tell you how to run your business, but they tell you what you cannot do. By this means, Government is now the regulator of the economic system.

The term "utopian" (line 9) seems to be well adapted to settle any argument. Based on the idea of "nowhere," it evokes associations and images of harebrained, starry-eyed visionaries, lacking "common sense," maturity, and judgment. In this answer, the use of the is of identity, because of the resulting definiteness and assurance, strengthens the unfortunate effect of the emotive language. Furthermore, the example which the student uses does not altogether explain "utopian"; the context appears to be inadequate. How do A and B "get together"? What is the extent of the control? The over-
simplification in "this wouldn't work" does not seem, in the light of the evidence offered, to be an adequately supported and entirely tenable opinion.

The use of unclarified high-level abstractions occurs here, too. What agencies of "the Government" are referred to? Perhaps reference, even though brief, to such agencies as the Federal Trade Commission, the Department of Justice, the Securities and Exchange Commission, might well have made the student's discussion more specific and convincing.

**Question (Economics L01).** In terms of the economic differences, contrast the United States and the Soviet Union. Use any concepts you have learned from lectures or the text.

**Economics answer 65.** (a) The United States is a capitalistic form of free government based on laissez faire, the competitive, interdependent, and indirect type of business. Our system of institutions revolves about three general principles—government, household, and firm.

(b) The U. S. S. R. is a communist type of government, whose concept is to have items of scarcity in the environment shared and split up equally to everyone for the good of all—a pure socialistic or communist form of government.

"Competitive" (line 3)—in conjunction with laissez faire—may be intended to convey the idea of "rivalry." The student, however, also uses "interdependent" (line 4), diametrically opposed in meaning, and evoking shadows of monopolies and the throttling of competition. "Indirect" (line 4) contributes little, except vague support of the idea that the government does not interfere with business—an idea apparently based on the concept expressed in "free government" (line 2).
On the other hand, "shared" (line 10) begins what appears to be basically a legitimate contrast: the idea of enjoying the "items of scarcity" in common, as opposed to the competitive capitalism mentioned. The next few words, however ("split up equally for the good of all") convey (1) an idea of forcible allocation, (2) a vague impression of the public weal or welfare.

The connotations of "laissez faire," "competitive," and "interdependent," then, seem to be used to set forth a highly simplified contrast with the forcible sharing of unspecified but scarce items for an undefined welfare of all. "Free government" (line 2) and "communistic type of government" (lines 8-9) might well serve as the basis for a valid, objective contrast; but the contrast should be objective and specific.

Question (Economics 520). What are the advantages and disadvantages of using a metallic standard? What substitutes would you make and why?

Economics answer 105. A substitution could be a paper currency with no adequate reserve at all. This would depend on a government's reasonable policy in issuing currency.

Here the connotation is found in "adequate" (line 2) and "reasonable" (line 4). The first term is relative, and is a matter of judgment rather than fact. A reserve may be equal to a requirement, or commensurate, or sufficient; but a standard is still needed in order to determine the validity of such an assertion as that which the student has made. The same comments apply to the use of "reasonable." Perhaps the reserve is agreeable to sound judgment, or is not excessive; but if the student has the information he keeps it to
himself, and hands down a judgment, which the reader is expected to accept on the basis of general connotation. It will be noted, too, that the use of these loaded words enables the student to beg the question.

In Economics answers 14, 116, 28, and 68, quoted below, the reader finds that here, too, connotation sets up what is in effect a two-valued orientation, with oversimplification and unqualified high-level abstraction.

**Question (Economics 400).** Explain the subsequent economic changes (i.e., once laissez faire had become established) which resulted in modification of the policy of laissez faire.

Economics answer 28. In time, the policy of laissez faire came under attack, and certain controls were enacted to curb the selfish interests of capital, and thus provide for the good of the people.

In using "selfish interests" (lines 3-4) the student, without defining, condemns. The words evoke images of, for instance, the Credit Mobilier and of the Pullman strike. These "selfish interests" are then set in opposition to "the good of the people" (line 5). "Welfare" or "general interest" may be the meaning, in terms of health, safety, or low standards of living; but in the answer as it stands, there is only an opposition of undefined terms. Through the use of these emotive words, the question is begged.

The contrast is not clarified by the use of "attack" (line 2), at which point mention of, for instance, the Populist movement or the Granger laws might have been helpful; or by the employment of "certain controls" (lines 2-3), which might have been supported by mention of,
for instance, the Interstate Commerce Commission and the Sherman Anti-Trust Act. Oversimplication is, then, accompanied by lack of specificity.

Question (Economics 400). Write an essay on "The Role of Money in the Modern Economy." Begin your essay with the following: "The security behind money is not the crucial factor in determining its value; what counts in the end in determining the value of money is ..."

Economics answer 14. The security behind money is not the crucial factor in determining its value; what counts in the end in determining the value of money is not so much its value in gold but what the dollar is worth when you go to buy something. For instance, now the price of $1.00 is not 100 cents but 50 or 60 cents. To my way of thinking, this would not have happened if Roosevelt hadn't taken us off the gold standard some years ago. I believe this was a very foolish move as it just cheapened the value of money or the dollar [connotation setting up, in effect, a two-valued orientation, with oversimplification and high-level abstraction]. The role of money is very important to the average American [dead-level abstraction]. If he wishes to go to the bank, he may have money in the form of a check, bank note, money order, draft, bonds, or other such forms as long as the Federal Reserve banks are backing it. It is now a very safe way to deposit money [abstraction: lack of communication] as it is secured for a certain amount by the bank in Cleveland. On the whole, I would say the value of money is determined by the amount of goods it will buy for a certain amount of money.
Question (Economics 669). Discuss Christian Socialism.

Economics answer 116. I think that Christian Socialism is the best form of socialism because it does away with bloody revolutions and merely suggests changes to be made according to the needs of society, not through struggle but through continuous education and persuasion. Because it does away with bloody revolutions and merely suggests changes to be made according to the needs of society, not through struggle but through continuous education and persuasion, it avoids the use of force and violence in achieving its goals. This makes it a more stable and peaceful form of socialism that can be achieved without resorting to revolution.

Question (Economics 401). In terms of the economic differences contrast the United States and the Soviet Union. Use any concepts you have learned from lectures or the text.


In these seven responses (Economics answers 12, 14, 28, 65, 68, 105, and 116), the use of connotative terms leads, through oversimplification, to a two-valued orientation. The users of words as heavily charged with associations as "selfish" and "the good of the people" (Economics answer 28) assume that such terms are to be accepted without question or qualification. In such responses, the reader makes an appeal to emotion, often to prejudice. The students who employ such terms set up a dilemma and beg the question by intimating that anyone with common sense would agree that the entire matter can be easily settled—merely by agreeing with the particular interpretation offered.
by the student writing the answer.

In another group of responses (Economics answers 26, 95, and 138, to follow), the difficulties result chiefly from the unskillful use of connotation, though several other types of error occur. The following student discussion is an example.

**Question** (Economics 671). How does one evaluate an economy as to whether it is capitalist or socialist?

**Economics answer 138.** It is rather difficult to determine whether a capitalist economy has turned socialistic. It's more a question of degree or interpretation. Some have professed that our New Deal legislation is a form of socialism. Others maintain that it is only a reform, that the basic institutions of capitalism have not changed. I seriously feel that a system becomes socialistic in form when an individual can no longer derive the maximum of benefit from the fundamental institutions of property. By this I mean that, under our system, a man who possesses property may sell or exchange this as he sees fit. He may grow or cultivate it with anything he wishes. If his gov't enacts legislation depriving him of a full benefit of his land, then that system is socialistic. A gov't may suggest what is best for him, but he does not have to comply with its wishes. His fundamental rights are protected. But if force or legislation placing punishment on that person is enacted—punishment in the form of a fine or other kind of penalty—then of course the economic system is altered. Regardless of what the legislation is used for (they may say for the welfare of the majority of the people, in turn benefiting the deprived ones, that system is altering the basic principles of a capitalistic democracy.

The answer, while consistent, seems to hinge on the use of "basic" and "fundamental," connotative but—as used here—somewhat
non-committal. By using two examples (lines 12-15 and 24-25) the student has made an effort to clarify his use of these words; but only the second example seems to be effective. In the first, "depriving" is connotative; the analogy appears to be restricted; the entire matter seems to be greatly oversimplified. No reference is made to the individual's responsibilities to the society of which he is a member, nor of the overshadowing right of eminent domain; the student appears to believe in what he would probably call "unrestricted individualism."

Other errors add to the difficulty in interpretation. The sentence in lines 3-4 seems to need further interpretation; as it stands, the student seems to hedge. The is of identity lends its usual air of finality in lines 5 and 6, concerning "New Deal legislation" and "reform"—the last abstract and connotative. Finally, the student uses the two-valued orientation in lines 26-31. No middle ground is considered; the use of coercion means change in the structure of "capitalistic democracy." One side is black; the other, white.

The two other responses in this group are quoted below.

**Question (Economics 400).** Explain the historical changes which resulted in the growth of the policy of *laissez faire*.

**Economics answer 26.** The growth of the policy of *laissez faire* was the major factor in the development of competition. Industries were set up in the North, while agriculture was the leading occupation of the South. Each business wanted a voice in government, and had one in the form of lobbyists. This pressure inside the government was important and indirectly led to the Civil War.
Connotation appears, first, in the use of "lobbyists" (line 7). The term, as used here, suggests lack of ethics, ruthlessness, as shown, for instance, in Coniston. The reader thinks of corruption, if not bribery. Again, the use of "pressure" in line 8 continues the line of thought, in conveying hints of undue and improper influence on the workings of government; one thinks of such men as Justin Smith Morrill and of A. R. Corbin, the friend of James Fisk. Furthermore, the use of "voice in government" (line 6), though indefinite, has at least a suggestion—in the given context—of reprehensible influence on the course of political events—the sort of political action discussed by Ida Tarbell and Lincoln Steffens. The student, in using highly connotative terms, has consistently oversimplified; he has not mentioned, for instance, in lines 5-7 that there was an agricultural lobby too.

The use of the is of identity in lines 2 and 5, and of the is of classification in line 8 serves to add finality to the oversimplification already noted. In this somewhat disjointed discussion, little or no allowance is made for any other approach to the assigned topic.

**Question (Economics 520).** What are the advantages and disadvantages of using a metallic currency? What substitutes would you make and why?

**Economics answer 95.** I believe that currency that does not have a metallic reserve is an arrangement that is satisfactory. The government regulates the process, as it does about everything else; so I believe that if this is done in good faith, there is little need for metallic backing [connotation, with forms of to be and two-valued orientation]. The government would face a problem of
In these three responses (Economics answers 26, 95, and 138), the use of connotative terms is combined with the use of the is of identity and the use of the two-valued orientation. This combination result in marked oversimplification. Unfavorable connotations dominate these responses as one studies the students' efforts to persuade; the final impression is that the writers have considered and solved with finality the difficult problems under consideration. No other ways out, no other solutions, are offered. One has the feeling, however, that the associations of words, and the images evoked, do not constitute irrefragable arguments.

Metaphor. As we turn to the second classification under emotive language, it will be remembered that oversimplification often results from the employment of figurative language, especially when, in the use of an analogy, one aspect of an object or idea is used to imply thoroughgoing similarity.

Occasionally, distortion of meaning, resulting from the use of a mixed figure, accompanies the oversimplification which is often a consequence of the use of metaphor. The following paragraph from a discussion of Fabian Socialism (Economics 669) furnishes an example.

Economics answer 120. Personally, I think this is the type of socialistic organization
I like to see exist. The pressure in favor of a group of ideas need not be violently grabbed at by the masses in order to put it across. The Fabian Society must live by the proverb that "one million jars will close a door as well as one big slam." The closing will also be less noticed, more sure, and leave less opportunity for the group to break apart. To repeat, I may not agree with the Fabian Society's ideas, but I think that their method is excellent.

Reading this brief response, one wonders just why the "closing" will be "more sure." A door can be slammed shut. From several standpoints, the validity of the assertion might be established; the careful persuasion of thoughtful individuals may result in the development of a school of thought; but slowness does not necessarily signify assurance of finality. Again, exactly how can a "closing" "break apart"? The student may have been thinking of a reduction in the number of adherents, or of the resistance of non-believers; the meaning remains decidedly obscure.

Moreover, in the second sentence, three highly connotative terms complicate the metaphor. "Violently grabbed" evokes associations of resistance against force and coercion, whether mental or physical; "masses" brings to mind, with unfavorable connotations, the great unwashed, the "herd"; "puts it across" suggests trickery. The metaphor, inaccurate and loaded, leaves an unfavorable impression. The basic idea—that Fabian Socialism depends on slow, cautious persuasion for its development—appears to be implicit in the discussion; but the unskillful use of metaphor distorts the meaning which the student evidently intended to convey.
Two other responses, Economics answers 11 and 96, which follow, exhibit the same weaknesses.

**Question** (Economics 400). What did Adam Smith believe would be the regulator in the economic system?

**Economics answer 11.** Adam Smith felt that hands-off competition would be the regulator of the economic system. He thought that free competition would drive prices down and would be a self-regulator. At the time he made the assumption, it was very good, because he had in mind the butcher, the baker, and the candlestick maker. These were all small, and he had no thought of monopolies.

Today we still believe in free competition as a regulator, but in a different form. The hands-off policy is now a thing of the past. There must be control of big business or all competition would be strangled out. This was the reason for the passage of the Sherman Act and the Clayton Act—not to place restrictions on business, but not to rule out free competition.

First, in lines 3-5, "free competition" is described as driving priced down, then becoming a "self-regulator." Apparently, the connotations of "drive" are expected to serve as explanation for the lowering of prices; but lines 4-5—evoking, possibly, the image of a governor on a steam engine—confuse the meaning. Unskillful use of metaphor is also shown in lines 12-14, in which the abstract "control of big business"—clarified to some extent by the samples in lines 15-16—is linked with the possibility of the strangulation of all competition. Brief mention of, for instance, the Sugar Trust or of the early activities of the Standard Oil Company, might have helped to make this portion of the answer more clear and exact. Though the response seems intrinsically sound, the combination of mixed metaphors, connotation,
and oversimplification—the last even in the examples in line 7-9—serves to lessen considerably the effectiveness of the answer.

**Question (Economics 520).** What are the advantages and disadvantages of using a metallic standard? What substitutes would you make and why?

**Economics answer 96.** Currency without backing, regulated by the government, is satisfactory of classification, with oversimplification. By "regulating," I mean that the government should keep hands off the working of the process, except to act as a policeman in the manufacture of money [oversimplification, with distortion of meaning resulting from the use of mixed figures]. Metallic currency is a hindrance of classification, with oversimplification.

The students have attempted, in Economics answers 11, 96, and 120, to use the vividness of metaphor to persuade the reader through an appeal to his emotions. First, the metaphors used seem inappropriate and inaccurate; they convey an unnecessarily limited description. Second, the use of highly connotative words adds to the distortion. (To say that the government "should keep hands off the working of the process, except to act as a policeman in the manufacture of money," does not constitute an accurate and easily understood discussion of a large economic problem.) One reading these answers is left with the belief that they are not only inaccurate but unclear.

In Economics answers 18, 19, and 103, to follow, the use of figurative language appears to be closely connected with slanting, as in the following answer:

**Question (Economics 400).** Discuss, analyze, and appraise—as an amateur economist—the attempts of Hoover and the economic activities of the New Deal to alleviate the depression. In appraising these
two efforts, it will be necessary for you to set forth what you consider to be the crux of the problem before you can appraise their activities directed toward solving the problem.

Economics answer 18. A general depression with people out of work. People had money but didn't want to spend it for fear of losing the value of the goods they bought. Hoover tried to improve the situation by passing several laws designed as public works programs, to put the people back to work. He also established land grants to the farmers so that their mortgages wouldn't be foreclosed. He believed that public works should be the "balance wheel" of business. The New Deal policy closed the banks, forwarded recovery policy (N. R. A., etc.) designed to put business back on its feet.

"Balance wheel" (line 12) as used here appears to approach slanting, in that the metaphor and the connotations combine to influence the reader in a specific way. The "balance wheel" might have been, for instance, a "bugbear," a "safety valve," or a "starting mechanism," depending upon the political beliefs of the student. This metaphor—as often happens—appears to be inaccurate and incomplete because it is unaccompanied by analysis, qualification, detail. Again, certain programs were designed to "put business back on its feet" (line 15). Here the reader has the image of reviving an unfortunate but deserving abstraction. The metaphor seems to be altogether general, and more picturesque than accurate. One may wonder, for instance, in exactly what ways N. R. A. was designed to help various types of business establishments.

Moreover, the reader will note that a high level of abstraction is maintained. "Laws designed as public works programs" (lines 6-7)
and "land grants" (line 8) might well have been clarified by brief examples. "Public works programs" may include much, from the planning and construction of parks to the building of highways; and "land grants" may refer to Veterans' Administration or to the Homestead Act. The reader is not told. Finally, "forwarded" (line 14) has a connotation of "progress," especially in conjunction with "recovery programs"; objectivity is manifestly endangered. One finds here more emotion than verifiable information.

The two other responses in this group, Economics answers 19 and 103, are quoted below.

**Question (Economics 520).** What are the advantages and disadvantages of using a metallic standard? What substitutes would you make and why?

**Economics answer 103.** The disadvantage is that once you tie yourself to a metallic standard, it is difficult to break away from when and if it becomes necessary to do so.

In writing of tying oneself to a metallic standard, the respondent uses a metaphor that evokes associations of considerable restriction. No discussion of the advantages of using a metallic standard is given; instead, the question is begged through the use of a striking but limiting figure of speech, employed without details and without substantiation. No mention is made, for example, of the meaning of the gold standard, or of the rise and fall in the purchasing power of money. There is no balanced discussion of the disadvantages of a metallic standard; there, is, furthermore, no mention of the advantages of possible substitutes. The student has depended entirely on the
one metaphor to explain and to convince.

**Question (Economics 400).** Discuss, analyze, and appraise—as an amateur economist—the attempts of Hoover and the economic activities of the New Deal to alleviate the depression. In appraising these two efforts, what you consider to be the crux of the problem before you can appraise their activities directed toward solving the problem.

**Economics answer 19.** In 1929, Hoover was elected President, and at this time a great economic depression was about to begin. Thus, he has always been blamed for this depression, even though anyone going into office at that time would have been the victim of circumstances. He tried, but not too hard, to curb this depression before it really got a good start [metaphor, closely connected with slanting].

During this serious depression came the Smoot-Hawley Act, which raised tariffs sky high. This act only helped to enrage the depression [metaphor, with lack of communication]. Next came the Underwood Tariff, which leveled the tariffs and helped to start foreign competition back on its way to profit-making [metaphor, closely connected with slanting]. Then in 1932, Roosevelt became President by a landslide, because of his advocacy of a "new deal." This new deal had many aspects to it: (1) to eliminate the sweat shops, cut-throat competition, and child labor; (2) to bring banking and insurance systems back to normal.

The metaphors used in Economics answers 18, 19, and 103, then, are sweeping but hardly detailed. One who reads these answers realizes that metaphors often dazzle without illuminating, frequently interest without convincing. The breadth of the metaphors used, plus the vagueness of the high-level abstractions employed, makes specificity, precision, difficult. These responses, then, show a lack of calmly evaluated factual evidence, and give an impression of hasty, sometimes
specious reasoning.

Slanting. Slanting—the selection of details to fit a conclusion precedently reached—often involves errors in the use of abstractions, connotation, and emotive language. Oversimplification likewise frequently results from this particular error in interpretation.

The following responses (Economics answers 3, 125, and 126) contain connotation as well as slanting. In the discussion quoted below, the student shows a tendency to omit or underestimate evidence.

Question (Economics 400). Discuss, analyze, and appraise—as an amateur economist—the attempts of Hoover and the economic activities of the New Deal to alleviate the depression. In appraising these two efforts, it will be necessary for you to set forth what you consider to be the crux of the problem before you can appraise their activities directed toward solving the problem.

Economics answer 3. The problem of the depression under Hoover and Roosevelt consisted of too much surplus of farm goods; therefore the decrease in the value of money and the widespread unemployment over the nation took place. Hoover went about the problem in entirely the wrong way. He tried to approach the problem from the point of view that if he told them what to do, the depression would cancel itself out in due time. When he appropriated $500,000,000 for the farmers, he thought that the farmers would be tempted to make improvements, and not produce so much for a period of time. However, the farmers went on producing a surplus which they would not sell abroad. Roosevelt and his "New Deal" approached the problem more scientifically. He tried to put the people back to work by setting up the N. R. A. and W. P. A. for internal improvements on the country. Even though Hoover did not cause the depression, I believe that if he had had
less opposition from the Democrats and had
taken a more scientific approach, he could
have done better.
Roosevelt had the right idea when he
tried to put the unemployed to work so that
people would not starve. Roosevelt attached
the problem from the aspect of the people's
point of view.

Slanting is shown in paragraphs 2, 3, and 4. In lines 7-8, the
student, by using "entirely the wrong way," has asserted one point of
view, but has given no evidence of consideration of any others. The
problem—and the approaches to its solution—appear to be complex; it
seems to be doubtful that any attempt at solution can be explained
adequately in a single weighted statement. The same observation can be
made concerning paragraph 2. N. R. A. and W. P. A. constitute only
segments of a program; and the student has given no glimpse of the
philosophy behind these names. No specific grounds seem to be offered
for the student's appraisal. Finally, paragraph 4 shows slanting. The
statement that under certain circumstances, Hoover "could have done
better" seems interesting but vague. "Better" has many meanings; and
questions about methods, effectiveness, and the recipients of the
improvement come to mind. The statement may have many meanings for many
readers.

Connotation and symbolism appear, too. In paragraphs 3 and 4,
the student, through the use of "scientific" and "scientifically" makes
an attempt to influence the reader's judgment. Do these abstract, con-
notative terms refer to so-called "scientific method"—realization of a
problem, analysis of evidence, and so on—or to an approach in confor-
mity with the student's political beliefs? The student apparently has
in mind some such meanings as "carefully," "thoughtfully," "analyti-
cally"; but the level of abstraction remains high. In the use of
"people's" (line 31) a high level of abstraction, plus considerable
connotation, strengthens the evidence that the student thought that
the use of word magic would somehow solve the problem—that people's
point of view" represents a sort of talisman. In the context above,
the phrase seems to have very little meaning.

In Economics answers 125 and 126, quoted below, one finds the
same combination of slanting and connotation.

**Question (Economics 669). Discuss Christian Socialism.**

**Economics answer 126.** The most naive but
very deep sincerity of these people struck
me as almost amazing. They were outraged by
what they had seen, and in their troubled
minds, torn between traditional concepts of
understanding and belief, and, on the other
hand, a new way of life. These utopians or
dreamers were expressing an innermost desire
to do justice and have a common understanding
among men. No matter how vague and/or
sentimental this notion of righteousness
might seem, it was an intense desire for
them. Who among us does not sigh for a some-
thing better to live in, void of greed and
hate, with men living in a quiet understanding
of one another?

First, the reader finds vagueness in lines 3-4. "These people"—
presumably Christian Socialists—"were outraged by what they had seen";
but one does not know the cause of the emotion—whether it was, for
example, inadequate housing for the very poor, or children working
twelve hours a day in the coal mines. The same willingness to genera-
lize, often vaguely, about groups of people—and to present only one
aspect of a situation—is shown in lines 4–10. The impression is given
that all these people had "troubled minds" over the conflict between
the unidentified old and new ways, and had the desire for justice.
Qualification and support for such assertion seem needed. The use of
such highly connotative terms as "naive," "utopian," "greed," and
"hate" increases the difficulties caused by one-sided presentation.
The student appears to have written a defense rather than an explanation.

**Question (Economics 669). Discuss Christian Socialism.**

**Economics answer 125.** Primitive Christianity
concerns itself mainly with the brotherhood
of man, man in society. It is with this
concept that socialism attempts to wrestle
[distortion of meaning, resulting from the
use of mixed metaphor]. Why are these
thoughts not practiced? What solutions have
we to offer which would create a society in
which we would live in peace and harmony
[connotation, with oversimplification] and
enjoy the benefits God and nature intended us
to enjoy. The society which existed was an
antipodal one [is of identity, with finality].
It was in direct conflict [is of classification,
with finality] with the teachings of
God and against His will. Misery and poverty
[connotation, with oversimplification] were
everywhere. Exploitation was the rule [is of
identity, with finality]. Entire classes of
people existed solely for the benefit of a
ruling aristocracy. The masses were but
pawns on the chessboard of life to be
directed at the will of a supposedly
superior human being, to be destroyed at
his whim. This was life in direct conflict
with his teachings and commandments and
would be stopped [slanting, with connotation].
Primitive Christianity gave rise directly to
Christian Socialism, which made a noble effort
[Connotation, with oversimplification] to
remedy the evils which existed. But these
ideas were used by a majority of the social
reformers as great ends to be desired and
sought after.

One sees, in Economics answers 3, 125, and 126, considerable difficulty in accurate interpretation, for slanting is accompanied by connotation and vagueness. Such loaded words as "misery" and "poverty" (Economics answer 125) are used, with their connotations of injustice and callousness. In addition to the loss of objectivity that is the essence of slanting, one finds evocative words that are sonorous but unprecise. Details are needed—plus a conscientious effort to be objective and impartial—as, say, John Galsworthy is in The Forsyte Saga or in Strife. All the pertinent evidence should be used in the development of a hypothesis.

In another group of responses (Economics answers 27, 30, and 107, which follow), slanting is accompanied by errors in abstraction, context, and connotation. The first of these responses is quoted below.

**Question (Economics 400).** Explain the subsequent economic changes (i.e., once laissez faire had become established) which resulted in modification of the policy of laissez faire.

**Economics answer 27.** Big business concerns arose and monopolized the basic products, which ruined the small businessmen and farmers. There was a series of depressions; people were getting restless; all sorts of crazy inventions were getting into the market, and something had to be done to protect the common man. Therefore, there started a series of laws and bills that were passed to get a hold on big business. The wars put a modification of laissez faire as the government gave contracts to big business concerns to produce their munitions and supplies for them, and the bigger the company the better facilities they had; so naturally the
government couldn't award a big contract to a smaller factory that wouldn't be able to handle the job. Therefore, there definitely was modification in the policy of laissez faire.

In this answer, omission of pertinent factors plays a major part. In line 5, the use of "restless" causes the reader to wonder about the extent of the restlessness and the manner in which it was shown. The "modification" of laissez faire mentioned in line 11 seems to be only partly explained by the example. Congress, various Federal commissions, the courts, and state legislatures had much to do with the changes in the application of this economic philosophy; the reader, however, is not informed of these matters. Moreover, explanation seems needed for "naturally" (line 15), rather than the use of a connotative word which brushes aside objections.

Besides apparently selecting ideas to fit his conclusions, the student has fallen into several other errors in his discussion. Unclarified high-level abstractions are numerous: Did these companies "monopolize" the production and sale of the "basic products" (line 2)—which are not named? Were all the "small businessmen-farmers" utterly "ruined" (line 3)? "Depression" (line 4) may mean anything from an adjustment to a revolution; how serious was the situation? The phrase "common man" (line 8) seems to be connotative rather than precise. An example of the "laws and bills" mentioned in line 9 might well have made the assertion clearer. Which "wars" does the student refer to? Second, two-valued orientation appears in lines 18-20. The student does not qualify the statement, in spite of the possibility that some
small factories might have been operated efficiently and economically.

**Question (Economics 520).** What are the advantages and disadvantages of using a metallic standard? What substitutes would you make and why?

**Economics answer 107.** I believe that this can readily be done. If we could find a metal that is as scarce and stable as gold is, we could substitute this metal for the gold. A metal would have to be scarce, but very usable to industrial production. Besides, I believe they ought to do so instead of using gold as a standard. If we could find a metal or some other source for a standard, then we could pick something that could not be devalued to make price levels go up or down.

By using this metal, international trade could be kept in a constant level. We therefore could abolish the debts owed by other nations. There would be more money in supply than gold backing it. However, if we used some other method or standard which would be cheaper to obtain, then we could have more resources in back of our money supply.

The student has decided, as he indicates in lines 6-8, that a metal "as scarce and stable as gold is" should be substituted for gold as a monetary standard. Therefore—in spite of the wording of the examination question—he lists only reasons which seem to support his contention. First, in spite of his classification of gold as "stable," he claims, without explanation, the virtue of stability for the proposed substitute (lines 8-11). His second point, in lines 12-13, is based on the preceding idea; but the rest of the paragraph—if the student means to use "abolish"—seems to be a non-sequitur. The third idea (lines 16-17), with its finality and obscurity, seems unrelated if not contradictory. The student appears to have written a one-sided, somewhat confused answer, and has, on the whole, assumed that statement is
Question (Economics 400). Explain the historical changes which resulted in the growth of the policy of laissez faire.

Economics answer 30. Instead of government having control of business enterprise, they were left alone on the laissez faire policy [slanting, with oversimplification]. The laissez faire led to a development of competition [dead-level abstraction]. The companies managed their enterprises as they saw fit [slanting, with oversimplification]. They cut prices when the other competitors reduced theirs.

To summarize briefly, then: In Economics answers 27, 30, and 107, selected ideas phrased in connotative terms make up the oversimplified verbal picture. Shifts in meaning of such terms as "standard" add to the difficulties facing the reader; the term may appear to mean a basis for an action, an experiment, or a dream. The tendency toward oversimplification, moreover, appears in all the answers. The assertions made remain only partly explained, even though the burden of proof rests on the students. For instance, the use of such a connotative term as "readily" appears to presuppose further explanation: Why can the goal mentioned be attained without undue difficulty? These students, it appears, have offered, without notice, insufficiently supported personal judgments. In so doing, they have omitted and selected ideas to fit their contentions, and have used loaded words to influence the emotions and the opinions of the reader.

In summarizing the results of the analysis of the responses in economics, the writer will present, first, an observation on the
subject-matter of the questions (in relation to the use of emotive language); second, figures showing the frequency and classification of errors; and third, examples of superior or excellent answers.

First, in appraising the results of the analysis, it may be well to remember that some of the examination questions concern events far removed from our time, but that other questions involve consideration of theories about which there is widespread current disagreement. For example, writers and readers might disagree considerably on the relative merits of Hoover's and Roosevelt's efforts to formulate the criteria to be used for deciding whether an economy is capitalist or socialist. No more is intended here than a reminder that such questions may be more apt to cause the use, say, of emotive language than, for example, an analysis of the rise of city-states. It will be remembered, too, that the 400-level courses are concerned with the principles of economics; the 500-, with money and banking; and the 600-, with the history and development of socialism and related movements.

The enrollment figures (for the academic year 1952-1953) for the three major groups in economics are appended:

- 400: 130
- 500: 85
- 600: 40

Let us proceed to a summary of the classifications under the six major headings, the first of which is Abstraction.
ABSTRACTION.

1. Dead-level abstraction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>600</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the answers in this group, the students are stuck on the higher, rather than the lower, levels of abstraction. They have not used details or examples to clarify the abstract terms used. The matters under discussion, therefore, are oversimplified, and are treated rather broadly and vaguely. The failure to use both high and low levels of abstraction was noted in responses written in all three course levels.

2. Lack of Communication

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Carelessness in the selection of abstractions, while not confined to the students in the 400 group, is considerably more evident in the work of the beginning students. Apparently the more advanced students exercised somewhat greater care in the selection and arrangement of abstractions—at least, enough to avoid the nearly complete blocking of communication. The beginning students were, understandably, less accustomed to working with carefully defined abstractions and to confining their meaning and use to the significance agreed upon in the
classroom.

3. Looseness of thought, with high-level abstractions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>600</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Here, numerous high-level abstractions remain unclarified; the sequence of ideas is not apparent; and considerable tangential material is included. These errors are more frequent in the 400 group than in answers written in classes at the 500 or 600 level. The responses examined indicate that the beginning students have their greatest difficulties here in matters of sequence and coherence; the relationship of ideas is often obscure.

SYMBOLS

1. Implicit acceptance of word-magic, with high-level abstractions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

One notes here the lack of common ground for comprehension and evaluation, a difficulty resulting from the students' belief in the inherent virtue of symbols. This error, as well as other difficulties with the use of symbols, is shown more frequently in the work of the first two groups than in that of the most advanced class. Numerically, the errors may not appear to be significant; yet, beginning and
intermediate students fall into the basic trap of the use of symbols, while advanced students tend more to avoid it. The preceding statement is true for the other classifications under the heading symbols.

2. Word-magic, with high-level abstraction and two-valued orientation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>400</th>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The reader finds here a loose use of symbols, numerous high-order abstractions, and unqualified generalizations. This type of error, it will be seen, consists fundamentally in lack of precision in both thinking and the use of broad terms. The fact that this type of error appears to occur more frequently in papers from beginning courses supports the evidence in the third (and to some extent in the first) group under symbols: that beginning students have more trouble in using symbols with clarity and precision—in avoiding the confusion of symbol with object or idea—than do more mature ones.

3. Word-magic, two-valued orientation, connotation, metaphor

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>400</th>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

One finds here confusion in the use of symbols, as well as oversimplification and the use of loaded words. Antitheses, highly connotative words, and frequent avoidance of gradation are present. These errors, as the reader will observe, appear in large part in papers in the 400 group. These beginning students appear to have marked trouble with qualification and discrimination; instead of weighing and
considering, they have recourse to broad, highly abstract, and connotative terms which appear to the users to have virtue in themselves to influence events in the extensional world.

**CONTEXTS**

1. **Shifts in meaning, high-level abstractions, slanting**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Here, faulty contexts, plus the unskilful use of high-level abstractions, result in obscurity and vagueness. These answers contain numerous judgments, even though the expression of them is often obscure. The students use broad terms to conceal the antitheses and the selection of ideas and statements. Beginning students appear to have more difficulty than do those in the intermediate or the advanced group, in these responses involving restriction and limitation of the significance of words, the use of relevant evidence in the consideration of a problem, and recognition of the difference between the descriptive and inferential levels of abstraction.

2. **Confused context, shift in meaning, high-level abstractions, connotation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

One finds in the three answers noted above, confused contexts interacting with shifts in meaning of key terms. The writing is
diffuse, rather than careful and exact, and the sequence and relationship of ideas are not clear. Faulty organization, then, combines with errors in the use of words to make interpretation difficult. It will be noted, too, that most of the answers in this group are written by beginning students. These students evidently have had as much difficulty with the marshalling of ideas—the psychological context—as with the clear limitation and qualification of meaning of major terms—the verbal context.

FORMS OF TO BE

1. Finality, obscurity, high-level abstractions  Number of responses inspected
   400 6
   500 1

One studying the answers in this group will notice that forms of to be are used to equate unqualified high-level abstractions. The apparent conclusiveness that results combines with lack of clarity to hamper accurate interpretation. More of the responses are the work of beginning students, who appear to have marked difficulty with clear organization of ideas, but who take the road of assurance anyway and achieve a decidedly perilous compression through the use of forms of to be.

2. Combination of errors, hinging on the use of the is of identity and the is of classification  Number of responses inspected
   600 2
Here one finds not only the finality that often results from the use of forms of to be—in the form of a lack of qualification, of sweeping statement—but also emotive language. Feeling, rather than logic, enters. In this combination of errors, the work of advanced students is represented. The subject-matter under discussion apparently causes them to react in terms of beliefs, prejudices, and generalities.

**TWO-VALUED ORIENTATION**

1. Finality, with antithesis and high-level abstractions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>600</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The difficulties in these answers result from the false dilemmas built up through the use of antithesis, through a lack of careful analysis and evaluation, and through the use of emotive language. The problem here is less a matter of organization than of critical, analytical thinking; for the students writing these responses see ideas in terms of black and white. It is significant that in this group the work of advanced students is well represented. The subject-matter may be considered, perhaps, to be partly responsible; yet it is surprising to see advanced students falling into this basic error in logic.
2. Oversimplification, with primary certitude and high-level abstractions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>600</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

With regard to finality, at least, the answers in this group appear to be more moderate in tone than those in group 1. They are characterized, however, by lack of supporting evidence for statements and by circular reasoning. This second classification is, perhaps, narrower in scope than the first one, because an attitude, rather than an overt statement, is involved—an implicit attitude of primary certitude, rather than an explicit use of antithesis. One will note that the upper-level courses loom larger in proportion than do the 400-level classes. These two advanced students seem to have difficulty in maintaining objectivity, and in using supported statements rather than judgments.

Under the sixth major heading, emotive language, there are three subheadings: connotation, metaphor, and slanting. Let us now turn to the first of these.

CONNOTATION

1. Connotation not clear, though effort has been made to clarify high-level abstractions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>600</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
These answers are characterized by the use of numerous connotative terms and high-level abstractions, as well as by hedging and a lack of precision. The problem here is partly one of clear organization, but more of clarification of ideas—of psychological context plus the careless use of highly connotative words, bringing in emotion and a loss of objectivity. Significantly, all course levels are represented here; advanced students, as well as beginners, appear to feel the influence of transfer and the signal reaction.

2. Connotation setting up, in effect, a two-valued orientation, with oversimplification and high-level abstraction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>600</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The use of numerous highly connotative terms leads, in the responses in this group, through oversimplification, to a two-valued orientation. There are appeals to feelings, often to deep-seated prejudice—an evocation of associations rather than an objective appraisal. It is not surprising, perhaps, that the papers of beginning students show more errors here than do those of students in the more advanced classes.
3. Unskillful use of connotation, with oversimplification, the is of identity, and the two-valued orientation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>600</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

One finds in these answers oversimplification through the use of unfavorable connotation, in conjunction with the is of identity and the two-valued orientation. The students writing these responses are persuading rather than considering, and their minds are apparently made up in advance. If the attitude is not one of rationalization, it appears to be, at least, one of flinging edged words about with intent to convert. The absence of objectivity here seems serious. Beginning, intermediate, and advanced students are in error here.

METAPHOR

1. Oversimplification, with distortion of meaning resulting from the use of mixed figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>600</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The inaccuracy and inappropriateness of the metaphors used in these answers result in the unnecessary limitation of ideas; and the use of highly connotative words adds to the resulting distortion of meaning. The student writers have used the vividness of metaphor at
the expense of accuracy and clarity. It will be noted that the three course levels are represented.

2. **Metaphor, closely connected**
   - Number of responses inspected
     - 400
     - 2
     - 500
     - 1

The metaphors used in these answers appear to have been chosen to fit the preconceived ideas of the student writers. The ideas themselves seem vague, and the metaphors lack clarification. The use of unqualified high-order abstractions adds to the difficulties of interpretation; and, as a result, the reader has great difficulty in arriving at an accurate understanding of the meaning intended. Beginning and intermediate students, according to the figures, seem to be more prone than are the advanced students to have difficulty in presenting clearly evaluated ideas on the descriptive, rather than the inferential, level.

**SLANTING**

1. **Slanting, with connotation**
   - Number of responses inspected
     - 400
     - 1
     - 600
     - 2

The selection of ideas, with the object of persuading the reader, is accompanied by the use of a number of highly connotative words, the use of which results in considerable vagueness. These answers are
difficult to interpret accurately, for the students are so busily engaged in projecting feelings that they forget the matter of clarity. Instead of presenting ideas objectively, they take refuge in words charged with emotion. This loss of objectivity, a serious fault, occurs, as will be noted, in the work of advanced students as well as in that of beginners.

2. Slanting, with oversimplification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Slanting, in these answers, results in oversimplification, and is accompanied by the use of some connotative terms and by faulty contexts. One notices also a lack of explanation, of support for statements advanced. Instead of offering the needed explanations, the students tend to pick and choose ideas which fit the contentions brought forward. The work of beginning and intermediate students is represented in this classification, which is concerned with a serious defect in analytical thinking.

The following portion of the chapter will be concluded with a few responses which may be classed as superior or excellent.

**Question (Economics 400).** Patton says, "Mercantilism hadn't a chance of survival once people started reading The Wealth of Nations." Do you agree or disagree? Explain fully.

**Economics answer 4.** The statement that "Mercantilism hadn't a chance of survival"
once people started reading The Wealth of Nations" is taken out of context and implies, standing by itself, that mercantilism withered away because people read a book which condemned it. This implication is not so. It is true that many people read the book by Adam Smith and that it has been published continuously from 1776, the date it was written. However, The Wealth of Nations put into good, clear expression the ideas many others had concerning the status of mercantilism. The feeling toward mercantilism was already largely negative. Smith in his book succeeded in producing a positive approach toward a new philosophy of economics. This negative feeling was largely caused by the ending of the honeymoon between government and merchants. Merchants by the help of governments had raised capital and secured protection and had established themselves and grown strong. Merchants no longer needed government protection and therefore began to resent the strict regulations imposed upon them by the mercantile system under which they had prospered. They wished for a freedom from government restraint. Even previous to Smith's book this feeling was apparent. However, no new method to replace the old one was possible for use until someone produced the new method. This person happened to be Smith, and so consequently his plan was adopted and the old one abandoned.

The reader will note several weaknesses. The first of these is the use of a number of unqualified high-order abstractions, especially in the third paragraph: "positive approach" (line 17), and "protection" (lines 23, 25), for example. Second, emotive language appears in "withered away" (lines 5-6) and in "honeymoon" (line 20); the student has not maintained complete objectivity here. Finally, the student has used the is of classification, with resultant finality, in lines 7 and 8.
In spite of these weaknesses, however, the present writer has chosen to proffer this answer as an instance of considerable success in the use of low as well as high levels of abstraction. Though the third paragraph contains several unqualified high-level abstractions, the student has made an effort to explain his statement made in the first paragraph. In the second paragraph, he has avoided the danger of using two-valued orientation. In the third paragraph, however, many terms seem to be broad and capable of varying interpretations. If the student had been more specific and detailed in this paragraph, the response might well have been as commendable in content as in organization.

The second answer is from a section of Economics 401.

**Question.** In terms of the economic differences, contrast the United States and the Soviet Union. Use any concepts you have learned from lectures or the text.

**Economics answer 67.** In the United States, most of the businesses are owned by private individuals. To a certain degree, these individuals have control over these businesses or production units. The prices for which the produced article sells, the problem of labor, and the general operation of the unit is left up to owners who are known as capitalists. This form of economy is known as "capitalism." In Russia, on the other hand, the government has practically complete control over the units of production. The government produces and taxes these products and also has complete control over the prices of these articles. Such an economy is known as a "communistic" form of economy.

In this answer, as in the one just discussed, unclarified high-level abstractions appear, such as "the problem of labor" (line 6).
The student, moreover, might profitably have explained the meaning of "to a certain degree" (line 3).

Even with these faults, however, the thinking appears to be fairly clear; the discussion, though comparatively brief, possess coherence. Rather abstract, somewhat oversimplified it may be; but the student has maintained an objective attitude, and has tried to avoid introducing irrelevant material.

The third of the responses is as follows:

**Question** (Economics 520). What are the advantages and disadvantages of using a metallic standard? What substitutes would you make and why?

**Economics answer 101.** When setting up a gold standard and using only one base, several factors occur which might be a hindrance in setting one up. First of all, in setting up a gold standard with one metal, you must take into consideration the fact that whatever happens to the value of this metal will automatically affect the price level and thus prices may decline or rise according to the way the metal acts. Therefore every time your gold changes, so do your prices, so that you can see there would not be a very stable situation. So we can say that if the price of gold would rise, so would the cost of goods and services rise in the same proportion. If the price of gold decreases, you would have a decline in the cost of goods and services; therefore I think that the best way you could offset the unstable situation is to have a bimetallic standard in which you would have two metals instead of one. Here you would have a more stable price level. If you had an increase in gold under a bimetallic standard, it would only offset your goods and services one half, while in a one-metal standard you would affect your goods and services one hundred per cent. Also if there was an increase or decrease in both metals, it would still be a better situation, because if you have a scarcity...
in one metal you can make up for it by using the other metal. On this question we can consider the possibility of using the other metal, and see how our gold mechanism is supposed to stabilize rates. If two countries have equal price levels and purchasing power, you would have a situation like this: In England 1 pair of shoes equals 2.80 equals 38.4 grains of gold equals 1 pound equals one pair of shoes. But a change in price levels in which England's prices rise and American prices remain the same would result in a situation like this: 1 pair of shoes equals 2.80 equals 38.4 grains of gold equals 1 pound equals 1 shoe. This causes a decrease in the amount of importing from England, while exports increase for the United States with a lower price level. England may do several things to try to remedy this type of situation. They could put tariffs on imports to stop people from buying cheaper shoes. They could try to be twice as efficient to increase production and thus lower prices. Then they could take the third step, devaluing the monetary unit to achieve purchasing power parity. Then 1 pair of shoes equals 2.80 equals 38.4 grains of gold equals 1 pair of shoes.

International trade: When there is a favorable balance of trade in the country, this is a situation in which exports exceed imports. However, if America had a fairly favorable balance of trade, we can see how this might affect a country which hadn't one. Suppose English imports exceeded their imports; then a problem would arise and thus make it difficult for her to meet expenses. Therefore, the price level of goods will rise; this will affect the amount of gold behind the dollar. Before this change in price level, we could have said that so much gold equals so much goods; but when we have an unstable situation, it upsets the whole system. In a stable economy, the number of grains of pure gold in an ounce is 480. The number of grains to a unit which was established is 13.71 divided by 280 by 13.71; you get $35 per ounce of gold.

In the present situation, England may impose high tariffs to balance her trade.
As to the money supply, when we think of setting up a gold standard, we assume that money is already in existence and that people are trading it for goods and services. This is determined by the price level, which is the average of prices, not an individual price. Since we first want to find out how much gold is behind the dollar, we find out how many grains of gold equal a dollar. This is 13.7 grains of gold per dollar, a rate which is established in the gold market. Then the government establishes the price of gold by law. But suppose this money supply increased rapidly and thus reduced the amount of gold equaling the dollar. This is the situation today, the result of the devaluation of the dollar. About ten or fifteen years ago, the dollar was worth about twice as much as it is today.

Since only so much gold is required to back a specified amount of money, any increase or decrease in the amount of gold would cause an increase or decrease in the amount of money in circulation and thus cause fluctuations in the price level and the value of money.

In this answer, one notices immediately the roundaboutness of the first sentence; the student does not begin directly and forcefully. Such passages, too, as those in lines 38-40 and 56-58 seems to be rather confusing. Moreover, the organization of the material appears to be only fairly effective.

On the other hand, the student has made an attempt--largely successful, in the opinion of the present writer--to clarify his meaning by means of figures, comparisons, and examples (lines 35-58 and 68-78). He has also, on the whole, avoided the use of emotive language, and has given an objective, rather detailed account of several significant aspects of the use of a metallic monetary standard.

The final example of a creditable answer comes from a section of
Economics 671.

Question. Compare Russian communism and British socialism with regard to the maintenance of economic and social well-being.

Economics answer 128. The Russian government established by revolution has been highly centralized from the first. Under socialist philosophy the government has a responsibility to maintain economic and societal well-being. In its position as virtually complete owner, the government is tied to the economy. The constitution establishes this perpetual social ownership. The government of the U.S.S.R. is the Communist Party, owing to the one-party system with its small margin of criticism and indirect control of policy by the populace. The government of the U.S.S.R. thus reflects party decisions on economic policy. This policy is influenced by political and social factors in addition to purely economic, owing to the communist "world mission."

In Great Britain, socialism also has its responsibilities, for economic well-being but in addition, these are to be met by democratic means. The 20% ownership, while influencing the free segment, means that the economy cannot be identical with the government. The government has wide powers of regulation, but these are not used directly as a means of ordering allocation of resources, goods, etc., in general. The policy is subject to popular criticism and reversal, and is carried out largely by indirect means. British government, embracing the empire, is necessarily very wide, and this has many ramifications in trade, such as the Sterling Bloc, etc.

Two obstacles to easy, clear interpretation may be noted. First, the answer contains a number of unclarified high-level abstractions: "Political, social, and economic factors" (line 16); "powers of regulation" (lines 25–26); and "indirect means" (lines 30–31). Second, the student uses the is of identity (line 10); an impression of
oversimplification and finality results.

Yet the reader, considering the response as a whole, may believe that the organization of ideas seem to be rather clear. The student has given careful thought to the question, and has tried to adduce evidence for his opinions. Then, too, he has maintained objectivity, and has avoided, for the most part, the use of emotive language.

In these responses, then, considered to be superior or excellent, many of the same errors appear as in the answers analyzed in the discussion earlier in the chapter. The occurrence, however, is much lower in degree; for the answers discussed in the earlier portion of the chapter are representative; they are neither the best nor the worst.

The present writer believes that the last group of students has largely avoided the difficulties and errors standing high in the analysis: dead-level abstracting; looseness of thought, with high-level abstractions; shifts in meaning of key terms; finality; and the use of connotation to set up two-valued orientation. On the contrary, these students have tried to be objective, specific, and definite, and to deal with verifiable information rather than vague impressions. They have tried to communicate substantiated views rather than to express feelings or prejudices.

Up to this point, Chapter V has consisted of a rather detailed analysis of responses in economics, a summary of the findings, and examples of superior or excellent answers. The section which follows
is devoted to a presentation of recommendations, based on the analyses, for use in the teaching of economics.

Before offering these suggestions, however, the writer wishes to note two matters of procedure: (1) The recommendations concern procedures within the six classifications—Abstraction, Symbols, Contexts, Uses of to be, Two-valued orientation, Referential and emotive language—serving as the basis for the analyses; (2) Comments which apply to all three areas with which this study is concerned—social studies, English, and professional education—will be found at the beginning of Chapter VIII.

In submitting these suggestions, the writer wishes to point out that he realizes that no one teacher or no one course can possibly include all the semantic teaching proposed. The idea of selection—based on the needs and capacities of a particular class—is meant to be implicit in all the recommendations submitted.

Finally, in the study as a whole, and especially in the recommendations, semantics is meant to be a means rather than as an end in itself. The study of the connection between word and reality, semantics is considered as a tool, since it is a discipline concerned with the problem of meaning and with analysis of such matters as abstraction, contexts, and emotive language. The employment of the semantic discipline or approach is designed to aid in the attainment of greater precision in verbal communication within the areas involved in this study.

Let us now turn to the recommendations for economics,
considering, first, the classification Abstraction.

ABSTRACTION

It will be recalled that the responses analyzed under the above heading contain (a) dead-level abstraction, with resultant vagueness and oversimplification (noted in responses written at all three course levels); (b) lack of (or decidedly dubious) communication, with carelessness in the selection and arrangement of abstractions (especially apparent in the work of beginning students); (c) high-level abstraction, with looseness in thought, as well as unclear sequence of ideas and the inclusion of tangential material (particularly frequent in the responses of students at the 400 level).

The following proposals are submitted for use in working toward the solution of these problems:

Dead-level abstraction. The instructor may profitably give instruction—and practice—in the definition of such terms as "free enterprise," "government acting as a regulator," and "freedom and democracy" by means of (a) synonyms, (b) classification—"logical definition," with genus and differentia; (c) details and examples; (d) operational definition, which involves a set of operations: a description of a physical operation, including observation, measurement, and performance. The instructor and the students should be aware that the first two methods often facilitate the use of dead-level abstraction, and that the last two encourage the use of lower levels of abstraction along with the higher levels; thus the use of details and examples and
of operational definitions will aid in the attainment of more accurate interpretation. As Chase comments,

To extend agreement and make the study of economics conform to the scientific method, it is necessary to lay aside abstract definitions and apply the operational approach. What is Rufus doing on his farm? What is Roy doing at his factory bench? What is Junius doing in his bank? (A bank studied on the basis of what is going on inside without recourse to abstractions like "credit," "liquidity," "soundness," is a pretty whimsical thing.) What is Sylvia doing at her desk? Observe and record what a great number of men and women are actually doing in furnishing themselves and the community with food, clothing, and shelter. Then proceed to inferences. Then proceed to general rules governing economic behaviour—if any can be found. Then check the rules with more firsthand observation. Never forget Adam acting, the date at which he acts, the place where he acts. 

Second, the instructor, using mimeographed pages or an opaque projector, may analyze a passage to show the results of dead-level abstraction. (It will be recalled that, for the most part, the dead-level abstraction in the responses is on a high level.) Some such passage as the following—on a consistently high level of abstraction—may serve for such a demonstration:

According to Marx, the proletariat should be educated for freedom in a democratic society. Such education will lead to the building of a higher social order. The lack of such education, on the other hand, may lead to civil disorder resulting from the efforts of the proletariat to gain power. The use of force may be necessary to achieve democracy; but eventually, the proletariat will seize power anyway, when the capitalistic organization of production cannot solve the problems arising from the development of productive forces.

---

4Stuart Chase, *The Tyranny of Words*, p. 256.
Consideration of such words and phrases as "freedom," "democratic society," "education," "higher social order," "civil disorder," "force," "democracy," and "development of productive forces" may serve to show clearly the uncertainty, if not vagueness, resulting from the use of such terms without qualification and without definite referents. It may be explained that such words, used in the manner illustrated above, have breadth without precision, impressiveness without accuracy. Students may thus be made aware of the need here for the use of examples and details and for operational definitions.

Moreover, brief passages from the work of professional writers on economics may be used to show students how both high and low levels of abstraction may be skillfully used. If the emphasis in the preceding treatment and illustration appears to be somewhat on difficulties and disadvantages, the stress here is on procedures and benefits. The instructor, in his careful consideration of such a passage as the following, may well emphasize that such terms as "purchasing power," while useful shortcuts, should be employed with consciousness of abstracting and with reference to lower levels. For instance, he might emphasize the concreteness of the third paragraph in the passage quoted below—

the use, especially in item 5c, of specific details to clarify the meaning of such highly abstract terms as "laissez faire."

During the eighteenth century the conviction spread that there had been too much government, too much interference by government with private business, and there arose a strong reaction against the economic restrictions of mercantilism. Laissez faire—let things alone—became the watch cry of philosophers, economists, and statesmen.

Laissez faire, in the first place, emphasized the
importance of the individual and of individual welfare. Second, it assumed that individual welfare and national prosperity are not incompatible. It went further and asserted that individual prosperity is at the very foundation of national prosperity; that the individual, if allowed to follow his own self-interest without external restriction, would tend to exert himself to the utmost in the line of endeavor for which he was best fitted and would therefore be a more productive and hence a more valuable member of society than if his occupation and his conduct in that occupation were prescribed by either law or custom. As each man followed his own interest, the clash of interests would lead to modification and compromises which would result in approximate justice to all.

Translated into terms of concrete policy, laissez faire supported (1) free trade, as opposed to a protective tariff; (2) no fixing or regulating of prices, or of either the quantity or the quality of goods produced; (3) entire freedom on the part of the individual to enter any occupation he might choose, in any place he might think advisable; (4) determination of wages by unfettered bargaining between employer and employee; (5) limitation on the functions of government to (a) defense and the maintenance of peace and order, (b) dispensing of justice, (c) establishment and maintenance of certain public works and institutions, such as the paving of streets, the improvement of harbors and means of communication, etc., which cannot be made commercially profitable as private enterprises.5

Lack of communication. Because several responses, especially at the 400 level, indicate not merely marked insensitiveness to shadings of meanings in words but also lack of clear understanding of such concepts as "laissez faire," "mercantilism," and "scarcity," comparison (and contrast) of definitions of such terms may help to clarify their

meaning for students. Most definitions of "mercantilism," for instance, would probably include details or illustrations of the major tenets of this economic policy: (1) making wealth and money identical; (2) holding that each country should so manage its dealings—through the maintenance of a favorable balance of trade—that it secures the maximum share of gold and silver. Such details and illustrations would concern the meaning of "favorable balance of trade," as well as the degree and the nature of the restrictions on imports—the emphasis, for instance, on the importation of raw materials which could later be exported in a more valuable form.

Revision of answers is a second way in which the instructor and the students may work toward a solution of the difficulties found here. Such revision may profitably be done in class, under the supervision of the instructor, and two matters of procedure should be carefully considered: (1) specific suggestions for changes in wording should be given—on the papers and in conference; (2) the instructor should require the students to use such terms as "mercantilism" and "scarcity" in the senses and with the meaning agreed upon in lectures and class discussions. For example, the meaning of "scarcity" is clearly limited in the following passage:

Not all goods are economic. Air, the most immediately essential good to man, is not economic under the ordinary circumstances of its use. Economic goods must not only have utility; they must also be scarce. If goods are available, like air, without human effort and in quantities so great that people can directly consume all they want, then they are not scarce. If nature does not provide them directly in such abundance, all desires for them cannot be satisfied, and decisions have
to be made as to how to use them and how to get the most out of them. Then they are scarce—and economic—and the process of getting the most out of them is the essence of economizing. Most goods are not provided directly by nature at all, but various steps have to be taken to make them available. If the resources used in getting them are scarce, if work must be done—effort put forth other than in the spirit of play—in order to get them, the resulting goods will be scarce—and economic. Scarcity, in this sense, must underlie every economic situation.

The meaning of scarcity should be noted carefully, since there has been some confusion regarding it. It has been said, for instance, that we are now able to enjoy an "economy of abundance," in contrast with the "economy of "scarcity" of the past, and references have been made to a "scarcity economics" that is said to be outmoded, if not positively vicious. These phrases may seem impressive, but in fact they are only a fancy way of saying that productive power is greater than it used to be, and that a fairly high level of living is possible for everyone if we use that power sensibly, avoiding practices that restrict its use, or promote scarcity artificially.

Such phrases cannot mean that we are no longer confronted with scarcity, as the word has always been used in economics. For if scarcity in the usual sense were absent, all good would be freely available as air is. All the wants of modern Americans would be met on the Garden-of-Eden principle, and excellent food and clothing, fine homes, cars, yachts, medical service, an abundance of everything desired, would be available just for the asking. This is what abundance must mean if abundance is the opposite of scarcity, and scarcity is used in the economist's sense. But with this meaning, the idea of an "economy of abundance" would be nonsense. With abundance, there would be no economizing, no economic activity, and no economics. Scarcity is the distinctive feature of economic situations; and economics is concerned with human behaviour in the face of it.  

The use of examples and of operational definitions should assist materially in clarifying meaning, and should be used whether the discussion is on the descriptive or the inferential level. The use of the how-what-when test, of index numbers, and of dates is strongly recommended as an additional aid to awareness of the levels of abstraction used.

**Looseness of thought, with high-level abstractions.** For students at the 400 level, especially, written and oral practice in the selection and arrangement of abstraction is urged. Such practice would involve instruction in outlining, including mechanical requirements, such as indentation and symbols; and in logical requirements, such as parallelism and accurate division. Instruction in the use of parallel structure—including parallelism of words, phrases, and clauses—may well be as the others—involves frequent and careful demonstrations by the instructor.

Furthermore, such terms as "government interference," "control," and "governmental planning" are of major significance in economics. Widely and frequently used, they touch political, social, and economic beliefs, even though the student—especially the beginning student—may not possess a comprehensive experiential background. The writer believes, therefore, that there is need for instruction in the meaning and the use of descriptive and inferential levels of communication. Through comparison and discussion of reports and of responses written in examinations, students would be helped in the attainment of a clear understanding of the difference, for instance, between "government
regulation" of a public utility (the power of the Interstate Commerce Commission to set rates and to prohibit rebates) and "government interference with free enterprise" (the Robinson-Patman Act).

**SYMBOLS**

In the responses analyzed under **Symbols**, the second of the classifications, one finds (a) implicit acceptance of word-magic, with high-level abstractions, with resultant lack of common ground for comprehension and evaluation (shown more frequently in the work of the first two groups than in that of the most advanced classes); (b) word-magic, with high-level abstractions and two-valued orientation—a type of error consisting fundamentally in lack of precision in thinking and in the use of broad terms (appearing in large part in papers from the 400 group); word-magic, with two-valued orientation, connotation, and metaphor, with oversimplification and the use of loaded words (shown chiefly in papers from beginning courses).

The following recommendations are submitted as aids in the solution of these problems:

*Implicit acceptance of word-magic, with high-level abstractions.* First, students may well be given an explanation of the Ogden-Richards Triangle of Reference. The explanation need not be highly technical, but it should be sufficiently detailed—with numerous examples—to clarify the relationship between the symbol, the thought, and the referent. Furthermore, in the opinion of the writer, students should be given sufficient oral and written practice in the use of the Triangle
of Reference so that they clearly understand its significance and its usefulness.

Moreover, students may be requested to define such symbols as "complete faith in government" by means of details and examples, and by operational definition. The citing of time, place, and circumstances will help students to see that a common core of meaning enables writer and reader, or speaker and listener, to understand each other. To focus attention on individuals and specific terms, the use of index numbers and dates is recommended in such practice. Moreover, the order suggested for dealing with symbols—referent, thought, symbol—should be followed. Such oral and written practice in the use of symbols may help to show students that the referents are interpreted through experience, and that symbols reach not only to the extensional world but also to personal experience.

It is also suggested that practice in analysis be given to help the students to avoid such oversimplification as "Metallic standards are based on fear." This instruction and practice would involve such matters as (a) points of emphasis, (b) suggested division, (c) limits of the question, and (d) kinds of explanation desired (fact, probability, value, or policy). Such work in analysis would not necessarily mean that students' written discussion would be longer; however, such instruction would probably help, in the attainment of greater coherence and precision.

Word-magic, with high-level abstraction and two-valued orientation. (The several recommendations in this and the following group are
intended to apply especially to students at the 400 level.) In addition to exercises in defining by means of details and examples, as well as of operational definition, students may be given practice in the use of evidence. Consideration should be given to the sources of evidence—experience, statements in lectures, opinions of specialists—and to criteria for evaluating evidence—clarity, verifiability, consistency, relevance, trustworthiness, authority, disinterestedness. The above procedure will help to prevent confusion of word with idea and to clarify the student's thinking.

Consistent and closely controlled practice in using such terms as "laissez faire" is urged, to develop the habit of using such terms in accordance with the limitations and meaning accepted in economics, and to aid in the avoidance of personal connotations and "private" meanings. (Some of this instruction and practice might also be given informally.) The above idea has been stressed before; but the problem seems to be recurrent.

It is suggested, furthermore, that the principles of sound generalization be reviewed, including such rules as the following: (1) The sample should be sufficiently large. (2) A random sampling should be used, if the making of such a sampling is feasible; if not, a weighted sample may be used. (3) Negative instances should not be ignored. Moreover, the connection between careless use of symbols and unqualified generalizations should be clarified through the use of numerous examples, preferably from the students' work. The discussion of such a response as the following may help the students to see how
such symbols as "the people" and "free" are used without clear, specific limitation; how "laissez faire" appears to be used with a "private" significance; and how the generalization in the second sentence is unqualified and unsupported.

The people came to this country to be free from any governing body. They set up the laissez faire so they could do as they wished.

The procedure suggested here will help to improve thinking habits and to develop greater skill in the use of such symbols as "the true economic system" and "the people."

Through the study of the effects of change on such words as "true" and "free," students may be assisted in understanding that change affects not only the referent and the individual but also the symbol. Such a study should help them to see that modification or complete change of the symbol may take place as words go up and down the scale of use.

**Word-magic, with two-valued orientation, connotation, and metaphor.** Besides giving practice in definition, as has been suggested, the instructor may use the inductive method, as well as Socratic questioning, in analyzing the use of such phrases as "restore confidence" and "depending on gold instead of an inferior metal." Such consideration and discussion might start with an analysis of the meaning of the phrase, and go on to the organization of ideas (involving elements of outlining and the use of questions and discussion topics for developing skill in organization and analysis) and to the use of qualifying words and phrases for both reserve and precision.
Also recommended is a study of antithesis—its nature and purpose, as well as its dangers. It should be pointed out, for instance, that in antithesis, opposite ideas are placed in close proximity to heighten their effect by contrast, and that errors in interpretation may result if the thought is distorted to achieve an impressive opposition to terms. Under these circumstances, the verbal map does not correspond to the extensional territory. The above study and discussion should be linked to a consideration of the need for multi-valued orientation and the maintenance of the descriptive level.

CONTEXTS

The answers considered under the above heading contain (a) shifts in meaning, high-level abstractions, and slanting, with obscurity and numerous judgments; (b) confused contexts, with shifts in meaning, high-level abstractions, and connotation, with diffuse writing and unclear sequence of ideas. Most of the answers in both the above groups are the work of beginning students.

The following suggestions may be helpful in eliminating the faults noted above:

Shifts in meaning, high-level abstractions, slanting. In the analysis of such a response as the following, the students would examine contexts to see what the respondents mean by their use of such terms as (in this answer) "production," along with "product," "produced," and "producing." Attention may well be called to the interaction between unexpected and unexplained shifts in meaning of key
terms and the use of unqualified high-level abstractions.

Question (Economics 520). Instead of devaluation, what else could a country do to achieve purchasing power parity or an advantage?

Economics answer 91. Government can finance the deficit until the product can be produced more economically and as acceptably as possible will solve the problem. The government might create markets and articles economically until production is on its feet.

Second, students may be asked to note the shifts in meaning of "economy" in the following passage, and to point out the various interpretations possible.

The economy enforced in the family was well known, and the purchase represented a real economy. In the free economy of the time, the buying of the land was legally, if not morally, defensible; and the purchaser could, with impunity, continue with his plans in spite of the perilous condition of the national economy.

It is also suggested that the class be asked to examine closely such a definition as the following, to see how the author uses details and examples, as well as operational definition—in rather involved contexts—to limit and to clarify.

Any act or process is productive that helps to make economic goods available. Or we may define production as adding utility to economic goods. The productive act may be performed by people, as in mining coal or making textiles, or it may be an act of material resources, as of land in growing crops or supporting a factory building, or of a machine shaping metals or an engine pulling a train. The product may be any kind of economic good. It may be a tangible, material thing, like a loaf of bread or an automobile, or it may be a nonmaterial service, like the music of an orchestra or the sermon of a preacher. The productive process may be related to the product directly or indirectly and may or may not alter its physical nature. In producing the
loaf of bread, farming contributed by raising the wheat, manufacture by milling the flour and baking the bread, transportation by moving wheat and flour and bread, merchandising by furthering a succession of exchanges, banking by providing funds to mobilize resources. Behind these activities were others that helped to make them possible, especially the production of equipment.

All of these processes perform necessary roles, and it should not be said, therefore, that one of them is more productive than another. This point is worth stressing, because it is often implied that the farmers and miners and lumbermen who take materials from the earth or the manufacturers who put them into useful forms are the only true producers, whereas others, like transporters and middlemen, merely shift products without adding to them. Such a view misses the real nature of production. The essence of production lies in making goods available to satisfy wants, not in adding to matter—that cannot be done—nor in manipulating matter. To satisfy your desires for an orange for breakfast, it is as necessary that the orange be transported from the orange grove as that it be grown.7

Confused contexts, with shifts in meaning, high-level abstractions, and connotation. The instructor may have the students construct an outline—preferably the sentence type—as a basis for analysis of such terms as "laissez faire" and "private enterprise." These outlines would be handed in, corrected for both form and content, and returned to the students for revision. The writing of the discussions from the revised outlines would be followed by the same process of correction and revision. It is suggested that stress be laid on methods of attaining smooth, adequate transition within—and between—paragraphs. Moreover, the students should be required to use relevant, carefully

selected examples and to maintain objectivity.

An explanation of the results of repetition may be given. Such an explanation would involve review of the types and the basic principles of contexts, as well as the need for developing the habit of examining contexts; and it would show that repetition may result in additional emphasis, as in the writings of Macaulay, or in additional confusion, as in passages in which such words as "industry" and "inflation" are used without the assistance of definition, examples, and clear organization of materials.

FORMS OF TO BE

The reader will recall that the answers considered under the above heading contain (a) finality, obscurity, and high-level abstraction, with apparent conclusiveness (with most of the responses the work of beginning students); (b) combination of errors, hinging on the use of the is of identity and the is of classification, with lack of qualification and with emotive language (shown, for the most part, in the work of advanced students).

It is felt that the following suggestions may be helpful in lessening this weakness:

Finality, obscurity, high-level abstractions. Students may be asked to substitute other words for forms of to be in a series of sentences as the following may be used:

1. The working of materials is the business of the construction industry.
2. Property is the relationship of man to his environment.
3. Economics freedom is the power to make contracts.
4. A patent is a limited property right.
5. Wealth is essential to the betterment of mankind.
6. A managed economy is planned and controlled.
7. Free enterprise is freedom not to produce.
8. The authority of state and federal governments is imperfectly co-ordinated.
9. Monetary action is a function of scarcity.
10. Social welfare is the result of individual welfare.

Using the inductive method, the instructor can show that the use of such expressions as "appears...to me" and "may be classified as" indicates recognition of the principle of equivalence rather than identity. The attitude of limited and convenient, rather than absolute and final, identification or classification should be stressed.

The instructor, after a review of the abstraction ladder and of the dangers of confusing levels of abstraction, may ask students to revise sentences, many of which involve the unskillful use of forms of to be ("Scarcity is a human want." "A metallic standard is permanent."). In revising the sentences--most, if not all, of which will have been taken from class papers--the students will be required to use examples and operational definitions, and to strive for clarity and precision. Such a procedure would help to show students the connection between faulty thinking and unclear sentence structure.

Analysis of selected passages, such as the following, will serve to show students (a) how examples and operational definitions may be effectively used, (b) how finality through careless use of forms of to be can be avoided, (c) how involved and technical materials may be clearly organized.

Apart from its use in speaking of bank balances, the word "balance" is used in a variety of ways in analyzing
international dealings. It often denotes a difference, as in the mercantilist phrase "favorable balance of trade." In this phrase the word "trade" refers strictly to physical commodity movements, and the balance of trade is the difference between the values of exports and imports. Such a balance, one way or the other, is a natural condition; with other items prominent in a nation's dealings, no tendency exists for commodity imports and exports by themselves to be equal.

In the same sense of "difference," it is sometimes useful to speak of a balance on current account. In arriving at such a balance, all transactions are included which involve ordinary sales of commodities and services or which give rise to remittances respecting which the sender will exercise no further claim. In other words, the current account excludes loans and investments and such short-run capital transfers as the building up and drawing down of foreign bank accounts. It also excludes gold movements regarded as settling balances. A nation with a deficiency on current account is either assuming a debtor position or losing gold. Current sales and gifts received do not equal current purchases and gifts made.

The other, and quite different, use of the word "balance" is to denote an equality rather than a difference, as when we say an old-fashioned scale is in balance. When all of the international dealings of a nation are included, and when statistics are accurate and complete, balance in this sense must prevail. Current items by themselves are not likely to establish a balance in this sense, but when current items plus gold flows plus capital and indebtedness items are all taken together, a balance has to result.

Combination of errors, hanging on the use of the is of identity and the is of classification. (The following recommendations are intended especially for members of advanced classes.) Students may be asked to expand statements compressed by means of forms of to be. In this writing, it is suggested that the following matters be emphasized: (a) grasp of the tentativeness of all "knowledge"; (b) the maintenance

---

8Peterson, op. cit., p. 326.
of reserve and balance in statement of ideas; (c) the objective presentation of sufficient, unweighted evidence.

The writing of abstracts or précis of passages is also recommended. Instruction for such writing would concern selection of essential ideas; maintenance of proportion; adherence to the original; emphasis on clarity. The following passage is offered as an example of a passage for précis:

The most evident type of competition among groups acting as units (under business organization) may be termed intra-industrial. Here one manufacturer, such as the Philco Corporation, competes with all the other radio manufacturers for domination of the market. This is the chief type of competition in young industries or where the nature of the work makes corporate control difficult. Coal mining and agriculture are still subject to considerable intra-industrial competition. The government has attempted to put these industries on a less competitive basis through regulation and payment for restriction of output.

Although less evident, inter-industrial competition is more pervasive. Competition for the surplus of the consumer's income above that required for necessities is chiefly between industries. Candy manufacturers compete as an industry with tobacco manufacturers, buses with railroads, and even movies with publishers. Sometimes intra- and inter-industrial forms of competition will appear in the same industry. For example, manufacturers in the mechanical refrigeration industry unite in acclaiming mechanical refrigeration preferable to ice refrigeration. This inter-industrial competition takes the form of cooperative advertising by the trade association or other central agency in each of many industries. The intra-industrial form is expressed in the advertising by each specific manufacturer in the industry. The general claims for the superiority of electric refrigeration are usually paid for on a prorata basis by all the manufacturers of such refrigerators who belong to the trade association. Sometimes the electric companies also contribute since their profits depend upon the widespread use of current-using devices. The intra-industrial form appears as claims for the superiority of the product of a specific manufacturer. Thus, while Westinghouse, General Electric, and Norge may contribute to the fund
for the ads proclaiming the superiority of electric over ice refrigerators, each of these spends large sums to convince the consumer that its product is the best available.

All advertising of specific firms in a given industry is not necessarily competitive, however. Many times the few large producers in an industry will spend millions on seemingly competitive advertising. When the corporate structures of these few dominating producers are analyzed, the control will be found to rest in the hands of an investment trust, a bank, or a holding company. Such unified control indicates that the advertising by the specific producing units must have some other purpose. The argument that it is done to conceal the unity of control so as to escape the anti-trust legislation has little merit since only the general public rather than informed government lawyers would be misled. The argument that it is used to make consumers believe the prices of the products are competitively, rather than monopolistically, determined may have some basis, but the very existence of specific terms with trade names would suffice to give the appearance of competition. Businessmen are not in the habit of spending millions on advertising unless the resulting profits are thereby increased. Pseudo-competitive advertising does pay since it greatly increases the consumption of the product. Cigarettes offer an excellent example. By clever slogans, testimonials, and scientific tests, cigarette advertising keeps the smoker conscious of brands. Instead of smoking a pack a week of some one brand, the smoker is led to change his brand frequently and to increase his consumption to possibly a pack a day. Those who control this industry care little what brand a consumer buys; they are interested only in the total number of packs purchased over a period of time. The intra-industrial competition among mechanical refrigerators is similarly, but to a less extent, superficial. Although all such manufacturers are probably not controlled by the same financial interests, their advertising keeps the consumer aware of general, rather than specific, improvements in mechanism or cabinet. Comparison of any year's models will disclose little or no difference in features or prices among the several makers' products.  

---

These procedures would help students to renew acquaintance with the rules of analytical thinking, and with the difference between the descriptive and the inferential levels.

**TWO-VALUED ORIENTATION**

In the responses analyzed under the above heading, one finds

(a) finality, with antithesis and high-level abstraction, accompanied by faulty generalization (shown in answers written at all course levels);

(b) oversimplification, with primary certitude and high-level abstraction, as well as lack of supporting evidence for statements (with the work of advanced students well represented).

The following recommendations are offered:

**Finality, with antithesis and high-level abstractions.** Analysis of the relationship between the development of two-valued orientation and the use of antithesis may be made. Such an analysis would involve definition and illustration ("The Puritans hated bear-baiting, not because it gave pain to the bear, but because it gave pleasure to the spectators"); it would also involve consideration of the danger—illustrated in the quotation above—attendant upon the use of this device, especially when it is used to prove rather than to illustrate.

Such passages as the following may be closely analyzed for organization and for accuracy of thinking and evaluation, and for the effect of the use of unqualified high-level abstractions and sweeping generalizations upon the presentation of ideas:

The cause of the situation in the 30's was to restore
the confidence of the American people.
Hoover tried to provide that confidence through the help of big business.

In the discussion, it may be pointed out that (a) in the first sentence, opposition of ideas is used instead of appraisal of activities; (b) the use here of such unqualified high-order abstractions as "confidence" and "big business" results in increased vagueness as well as oversimplification. The assurance implicit in these sentences may also be brought to the attention of the class.

Oversimplification, with primary certitude and high-level abstraction. Student-written answers exhibiting two-valued orientation might be compared with others in which multi-valued orientation is used (for instance, Economics answers 93 and 101, quoted below).

Question (Economics 520). What are the advantages and disadvantages of using a metallic standard? What substitutes would you make and why?

Economics answer 93. I myself would substitute fiat money. Why? I'll tell you why. I am under the firm school of thought that within the next 50 years we shall see some form of it in its true (absolutely no backing) form. Through custom and tradition I feel quite sure that societies should see more advantages and less bother connected with "no backing" currency. Given time and patience the world, I am sure, some day in the not-too-distant future, will gain confidence enough to sponsor this simplified form of money standard.
Assumption: Government control all the way.
Results: Ease in financial part of the economy.

Question (Economics 520). What are the advantages and disadvantages of using a metallic standard? What substitutes would you make and why?

Economics answer 101. When setting up a gold standard and using only one base, several factors occur which might be a hindrance in setting one up. First of all,
in setting up a gold standard with one metal, you must take into consideration the fact that whatever happens to the value of this metal will automatically affect the price level and thus prices may decline or rise according to the way the metal acts. Therefore every time your gold changes, so do your prices, so that you can see there would not be a very stable situation. So we can say that if the price of gold would rise, so would the cost of goods and services rise in the same proportion. If the price of gold decreases, you would have a decline in the cost of goods and services; therefore I think that the best way you could offset the unstable situation is to have a bimetallic standard in which you would have two metals instead of one. Here you would have a more stable price level. If you had an increase in gold under a bimetallic standard, it would only offset your goods and services one half, while in a one-metal standard you would affect your goods and services one hundred per cent. Also if there was an increase or decrease in both metals, it would still be a better situation, because if you have a scarcity in one metal, you can make up for it by using the other metal. On this question we can consider the possibility of using the other metal, and see how our gold mechanism is supposed to stabilize rates. If two countries have equal price levels and purchasing power, you would have a situation like this: In England 1 pair of shoes equals 2.80 equals 38.4 grains of gold equals 1 pound equals one pair of shoes. But a change in price levels in which England’s prices rise and American prices remain the same would result in a situation like this: 1 pair of shoes equals 2.80 equals 38.4 grains of gold equals 1 pound equals 1 shoe. This causes a decrease in the amount of importing from England, while exports increase for the United States with a lower price level. England may do several things to try to remedy this type of situation. They could put tariffs on imports to stop people from buying cheaper shoes. They could try to be twice as efficient to increase production and thus lower prices. Then they could take the third step, devaluing the monetary unit to achieve purchasing power parity. Then 1 pair of shoes equals 2.80 equals 38.4 grains of gold equals 1 pair of shoes.

International trade: When there is a favorable balance of trade in the country, this is a situation in which exports exceed imports. However, if America had a fairly favorable balance of trade, we can see how this might affect a country which hadn’t one. Suppose
English exports exceeded their imports; then a problem would arise and thus make it difficult for her to meet expenses. Therefore the price level of goods will rise; this will affect the amount of gold behind the dollar. Before this change in price levels, we could have said that so much gold equals so much goods; but when we have an unstable situation, it upsets the whole system. In a stable economy, the number of grains of pure gold in an ounce is 480. The number of grains to a unit which was established in 13.71 divided by 280 by 13.71; you get 35 per ounce of gold.

In the present situation, England may impose high tariffs to balance her trade.

As to the money supply, when we think of setting up a gold standard, we assume that money is already in existence and that people are trading it for goods and services. This is determined by the price level, which is the average of prices, not an individual price. Since we first want to find out how much gold is behind the dollar, we find out how many grains of gold equal a dollar. This is 13.7 grains of gold per dollar, a rate which is established in the gold market. Then the government establishes the price of gold by law. But suppose this money supply increased rapidly and thus reduced the amount of gold equaling the dollar. This is the situation today, the result of the devaluation of the dollar. About ten or fifteen years ago, the dollar was worth about twice as much as it is today.

Since only so much gold is required to back a specified amount of money, any increase or decrease in the amount of gold would cause an increase or decrease in the amount of money in circulation and thus cause fluctuations in the price level and the value of money.

The discussion should bring out (1) the relationship, if any, between the material under consideration and the use of two-valued orientation; (2) the results of failure to observe the rules of sound generalization ("The power of the government grows stronger with each welfare issue and abuse in parity"); (3) ways in which spurious generalization may be detected.

It is suggested, furthermore, that writing on such topics as the following be done in class under the supervision of the
instructor:

What are the advantages and disadvantages of using a metallic standard? What substitutes would you make and why?

In this prefatory remarks, the instructor might well consider the causes and nature of rationalization, and the results of the use of the rhetorical device called the "dilemma." He might also examine carefully the nature of restraint and moderation—genuine and assumed—in writing. Moreover, it should be made clear that evidence—in the form of details and examples—is to be offered for statements in the text of the written discussion.

CONNOTATION

In the responses considered under Connotation, the present writer lists the following groups: (a) connotation not clear, though effort has been made to clarify high-level abstractions (with all course levels represented here); (b) connotation setting up, in effect, two-valued orientation, with oversimplification and high-level abstraction (with more errors shown in the papers of beginning students than in those of members of more advanced classes); (c) unskillful use of connotation, with oversimplification, the is of identity, and two-valued orientation (shown in the work of students at all three course levels).

In the opinion of the writer, the following suggestions will be useful to teachers working toward a solution of these problems:

Connotation not clear, though effort has been made to clarify
high-level abstractions. Students may be requested to list the personal—and the general—connotations of such words as "reasonable," "dangerous," and "outrageous"—as shown in the following sentences or similar ones:

When the trains came, they charged outrageous prices, as in the West the farmers couldn't ship by rail because of the great expense. The short and long haul in the East was a nuisance. The farmers then took this to the Supreme Court, which made the railroads change and start things more reasonable.

It must be remembered that gold standards, too, are affected by price levels, and if a disproportionality does exist, there must be a common meeting ground for another sort of equality. Now in the metallic standard, practicing such policies could be quite dangerous; on one hand, you may have a threatened run, or draining away of your gold supplies, or a competitive warfare as a result of devaluation. With a paper standard the essential paper is not dependent upon fluctuating price levels and not some artificial barrier. There would be no set standard or base; actually, however, the use of such a standard could be extremely dangerous, i.e., through runaway inflation brought on by flooding the economy with too many dollars for too few goods.

Second, lists of synonyms for such words might be compiled, with detailed consideration of the general connotations. Finally, these words—the reference is to such words as "reasonable," "dangerous," and "outrageous"—may be used in conformity with general connotations, in paragraphs.

Students at all course levels may benefit from a review of the nature of factual, objective enumeration and explanation, as requested in such discussion topics as the following:

Show how the need for and development of quick and cheap transportation have affected the growth of the American nation.
In this consideration of referential, as distinguished from emotive, language, emphasis should be placed on the idea that explanation and enumeration do not call for or necessitate expressions of emotion. Moreover, the instructor, by suggesting possible ways of organizing materials, may well emphasize the need for directness and clarity in objective writing.

Connotation setting up, in effect, two-valued orientation, with oversimplification and high-level abstraction. Close analysis of such passages as the following may be carried out, with chief consideration given to the use of highly connotative words to influence opinion:

The word of the day is that we are about to civilize industry. We already have on our shelves the sciences—hygienic, industrial, political, ethical—to free the world almost at a stroke from war, accidents, disease, poverty, and their flowing vices and insanities. The men of these sciences are here at call praying for employment. The people, by the books they read, show themselves to be praying to have them put at work. If we who call ourselves civilization would for one average span devote to life-dealing the moneys, armies, and genius we now give to death-dealing, we would take a long step towards settling forever the vexed question of the site of the Garden of Eden.

The instructor should show clearly how such words as "civilize," "free," "vices and insanities," "praying," and "civilization" appeal—in this context—to feelings and prejudices, and result in oversimplification leading to two-valued orientation.

Moreover, such passages as the following may be employed to

---

illustrate the maintenance of objectivity and the analysis and explanation of related ideas. The class might be shown, for example, that "dissolve," "support," "abandoning," and "violation" are carefully used in their contexts to explain, not to communicate the condemnation or the approval of the author. Furthermore, the attention of the students might well be drawn to the clarification of ideas through brief explanation of background (the formation of the Northern Securities Company) and through the showing of relationships between Roosevelt's "trust-busting," the formation of the Northern Securities Company, and the decision of the United States Supreme Court.

Roosevelt's first action against the trusts was taken in February, 1902, when his Attorney General announced that suit was being brought under the terms of the Sherman Anti-Trust Act to dissolve the Northern Securities Company, through which the year before a merger of three northwestern railroads, the Great Northern, the Northern Pacific, and the Burlington, had been attempted. If the government could induce the United States Supreme Court to support it in this instance, Roosevelt believed that he might later make the Sherman Act a really effective weapon in arresting the trend toward monopoly that had set in. The organizers of the Northern Securities Company, James J. Hill and J. P. Morgan, believed that they had remained within the letter of the law, but a decision of the United States Supreme Court, reached in 1904, by abandoning the reasoning of the Knight case, held quite otherwise. According to the majority of the Court the Northern Securities Company was a violation of free competition within the meaning of the Sherman Act, and must be dissolved. 11

Careful, detailed analysis and discussion would serve to bring out clearly the differences mentioned above.

Unskillful use of connotation, with oversimplification, the is of identity, and two-valued orientation. Such passages as the following may be used for practice in revision for objectivity:

Through unchecked rate-adjusting power, this group of men were completely at the mercy of those who controlled the toll bridges. These bandits paid no attention to laws or regulation. They were heartless, and the rates were outrageous. The farmers had justice on their side; the others were wrong, but got the money.

Students would be requested to rewrite the above passage, in referential language, avoiding persuasion, the is of identity, and two-valued orientation.

Analysis—oral or written—of the following response may be made. Students should suggest items of evidence that might well have been included, and should note carefully the instances of—and the effect of—the use of unfavorable connotation and of the is of identity.

Question (Economics 400). Explain the historical changes which resulted in the growth of the policy of laissez faire.

Economics answer 26. The growth of the policy of laissez faire was the major factor in the development of competition. Industries were set up in the North, while agriculture was the leading occupation of the South. Each business wanted a voice in government, and had one in the form of lobbyists. This pressure inside the government was important and indirectly led to the Civil War.

METAPHOR

The classifications under Metaphor include (a) oversimplification, with distortion of meaning resulting from the use of mixed figures (shown in responses written at all course levels);
(b) metaphor, closely connected with slanting, with vagueness and unclarified metaphors (appearing, for the most part, in the answers of beginning and intermediate students).

The writer submits the following proposals:

Oversimplification, with distortion of meaning resulting from the use of mixed figures. Examples of the effective and appropriate use of metaphor—as in poetry—may be considered. (Frost's "Stopping by Woods on a Snowy Evening" might be used here.) The students should be cautioned, however, concerning the use of metaphor in discussions which are intended to be phrased in referential language—in a consideration, for instance, of the advantages and disadvantages of the use of a metallic monetary standard. Emphasis might well be placed on the idea that the clarity, vividness, and emphasis often resulting from the skillful use of metaphor are frequently lost when figures of speech are used in reports: Metaphors, by definition, are inexact and emotive.

Detailed analysis of several student-written responses, such as the following, is urged.

**Question (Economics 400).** What did Adam Smith believe would be the regulator in the economic system?

a. Why did he believe this would work?
   - Was this a valid assumption for him to make? Why?

b. What, if anything, has replaced this as regulator? Explain.

**Economics answer 11.** Adam Smith felt that hands-off competition would be the regulator of the economic system. He thought that free competition would drive prices down and would be a self-regulator. At the time he
made the assumption, it was very good, because he had in mind the butcher, the baker, and the candlestick maker. These were all small, and he had no thought of monopolies.

Today we still believe in free competition, as a regulator, but in a different form. The hands-off policy is now a thing of the past. There must be control of big business or all competition would be strangled out. This was the reason for the passage of the Sherman Act and the Clayton Act—to place restrictions on business, but not to rule out free competition.

The analysis should concern (a) the basis of the analogy suggested, as well as the original meaning of the metaphor, and the meaning in the present context; (b) the subordination of the metaphor to the major idea; (c) the quality of the thinking behind the use of metaphor. Consideration should be given, then, not only to the accuracy of the figures of speech used but also to the students' sense of proportion and to the indications afforded by mixed metaphor as to the precision and order of thought and analysis.

Metaphor, closely connected with slanting. Students may be asked to explain the metaphors in such passages as the following:

One cannot discuss the question of the closed shop in a vacuum. The closed shop is a term of fixed meaning. As it comes in contact with different and varying segments of industry, its impact produces widely varying results. The closed shop must be applied to a group of specific industries, and the impact must be evaluated as against the arguments and reasons advanced pro and con in each specific case.\(^{12}\)

The emphasis may well be on the use of metaphor to give clarity and

concreteness to abstract ideas—as aids to, and illustrations of, the thought.

The class may engage in an analysis of a series of metaphors taken from advertisements and political articles. The students would be asked to ascertain (a) the basis of the implied analogy, and the relationship of the major idea to the metaphor, (b) the purpose of the writer, as shown by his use of metaphor and connotation. Expansion of the metaphors—which might involve the writing of an outline and the rearrangement of ideas—would help to show what major ideas have been omitted in the original.

SIANTING

Responses analyzed under the above heading are grouped as follows: (a) slanting, with connotation and vagueness (shown in the work of advanced students, as well as in that of beginners); (b) slanting, with oversimplification, appearing chiefly in the work of beginning and intermediate students).

The following recommendations are offered in connection with this problem.

Slanting, with connotation. An analysis of a slanted newspaper article may be undertaken. In such an analysis, consideration should be given to the question of what facts necessary for a balanced, supported discussion have been omitted, as well as to the use of connotative words—the extent of the emotional appeal, and the effect of their use on the inclusion of detail. The organization (or lack of organization) and reasons for its effectiveness (or ineffectiveness)
should also be considered.

A response which combines slanting with the use of numerous highly connotative words may be used as material for another procedure. After discussion of the errors, students may be asked to slant the answer the opposite way. Again, attention should be drawn to the interaction between slanting and connotation.

**Slanting, with oversimplification.** Consideration may be given, through lectures and class discussions, to the relationship between (a) systematic, precise thinking, (b) the formulation and expression of judgments, often without evidence, and (c) the selection of details to cause favorable or unfavorable reactions in the reader. Attention may well be drawn to the connection between slanting and the process of abstraction, and to the fact that slanting may be unintentional as well as intentional.

The instructor may conduct an oral discussion—with diagrams and explanatory comments on the blackboard—of several possible acceptable answers to such questions as the following:

**Explain the subsequent economic changes (i.e., once **laissez faire** had become established) which resulted in modification of the policy of **laissez faire**.**

The emphasis may well be on (1) outlining, with stress on the inclusion of relevant ideas, presentation of a balanced discussion, and the maintenance of objectivity; (2) definition of major terms, to limit the meaning and to help students avoid unexpected shifts in meaning.
Let us turn now to the analysis and discussion of the student-written materials in history. For the convenience of the reader, the course descriptions will be repeated.

History 403. History of the United States.
A study of the general political, constitutional, and economic development of the United States, from the beginning of the Revolutionary Era to the end of the Civil War.

A course in the history of modern Europe and the United States. Emphasis is placed on the history of the United States in a world setting. Major themes include the development of representative government and democracy, the rise of capitalism, the role of organized religion, and the impact of scientific development.

421. From the beginning of modern times through the first third of the Nineteenth Century. Absolutism and parliamentary institutions, revolutions, and new government in the United States and France; the reaction to the French Revolution in France and America.

422. The Nineteenth Century. Liberalism, materialism, and the Industrial Revolution; national unification in the United States, Italy, and Germany; urban and agrarian discontent.

423. The Twentieth Century. International rivalries and the two world wars; militarism and dictatorship; modification of economic and social systems.

History 537. Recent History of the United States.
The impact of modern industrialism upon American imperialism, society, government, and foreign policy. Laissez faire and government regulation, the Progressive movement, and the first World War.

Abstraction. First, we may consider answers in which abstraction plays a major part. In History answers 21, 73, 87, 113, 138, 139, 164, 182, and 190, to follow, dead level abstraction--in which the abstracting remains at a high (or at a low) level--is shown.

Question (History 422). Compare and contrast the labor movements in France, Germany, and Great Britain, 1871-1914, showing their direct or indirect influence upon the policies and legislation of the national state.

History answer 87. The labor movement in Great Britain led the way for that of the other countries. They passed laws regulating the conditions, wages, and
hours of the laborers. That in France was slower because of the wars which it had been having. In Germany the unification slowed the start of industrialization. When the suffrage became the privilege of more people, the laborers were obtaining more representation in government and were able to get laws that were for their benefit passed.

Even though the reader guesses that the reference of "that" (line 4) is to "labor unrest," he vainly awaits more information about the nature of the organizations and their influence on politics and legislation. The developments in France, however, are disposed of in one short sentence (lines 4-5). One may wonder, too, just how "unification" (line 6) retarded "industrialization." The student's assertion (through the is of classification in line 4) does not constitute proof; his idea is set forth but not developed. Finally, what was the nature of the "laws that were for their [the workingmen's] benefit"? The student might well have made brief mention of sickness insurance, accident insurance, and old-age pensions, for instance; but he neither describes the legislation nor shows the influence of the labor movement on its passage.

Question (History 423). Discuss the results of Harding's belief that what the country needed was "more business in government and less government in business."

History answer 139. Harding's belief was that the President should not have strong central powers but that, instead, Congress should be the governing factor. The President should have expert advisors and they should make the main Presidential decisions. Business should be favored, and businessmen should hold the high policy-making jobs. The government should not enforce too strongly the anti-trust laws or legislation unfavorable to business. Also the government should not be too friendly to labor. Only in one instance, in the steel strike, was Harding in favor of intervening on the side of labor, and even then he used an off-the-record approach.
During his administration, Harding appointed many big business men, such as Mellon, to high office. He allowed these men to formulate policies that were favorable to the rich. He allowed tariff bills to be passed that were too high and that caused ill feelings with the other countries of the world. His idea of "experts" formulating the policies might have been good had the experts been of superior quality and had other than "special interests" at heart.

First of all, the use of such terms as "favored" (line 6) may cause the reader to apply the how-what-when test. He may be interested in the nature and extent of the favors, and the circumstances under which they were granted. Moreover, "too strongly" (line 8), "too friendly" (line 10), and "too high" (line 18) are practically meaningless as they stand; details about enforcement, friendliness, and tariff rates would be helpful. "Off-the-record approach" (lines 12-13) is not at all specific; besides, the unfavorable connotation may be unjustified. "Policies" (line 16) leaves the reader puzzled. Does the term apply to quasi-judicial agencies, to appeal boards, to departments, or to influence on legislation? Finally, were "ill feelings" (lines 18-19) caused between Americans and the people in all the other countries?

Other abstractions used in the response seem as vague as those mentioned in the preceding paragraph: "Businessmen" (line 6), "labor" (line 10), "the rich" (line 17), and "special interests" (line 22). Here, too, lower-order abstractions are needed to qualify and explain: Does the student refer to all businessmen, or to owners, say, of small businesses? Might he not advantageously have mentioned the names of a few companies? Does "labor" refer to the American Federation of Labor or to all workingmen, skilled or unskilled? And what are "special
interests"? Such questions as these are left unanswered; and only a vague, often connotative, impression is left.

Question (History 423). Discuss the social, economic, and political background of the New Deal.

History answer 164. The New Deal came into being after 1 the first and before the second world war during the 2 administration of F.D.R. It was for social improvement 3 and economic value. For the people who were out of 4 work and didn't like it, jobs were procured. Thus 5 money was in circulation, and the economic situation 6 became better. All excess farm produce was destroyed 7 to avoid surplus. Various work projects were set up, 8 not in competition with industry, but to provide work 9 and money for unemployed laborers. This, of course, 10 was all set up by the government. The financial 11 status of the country in general rose; various acts 12 were passed; wage laws were incorporated, with 13 shorter hours, and set wages per hour. 14
The actual projects set up by the government 15 among others were the P.W.A., N.I.R.A., W.P.A., etc., 16 all for the betterment and beautification of the 17 nation, plus a job for the unemployed. 18

First, the student contends that the New Deal was "for social improvement and economic value" (lines 3-4). The idea of advancement in social conditions is advanced, an idea to which the student clings tenaciously throughout the response, but one does not know whether the student is referring to such matters as higher wages and salaries, to a larger amount of leisure time, to improved educational facilities, or to such attitudes as increased co-operation and tolerance. "Economic value" (line 4) is a baffling term. It may refer to an increase in the number of gainfully employed individuals, to the growth of larger and more powerful labor organizations, or, perhaps, to such disturbing and abstract phenomena as "inflation" or "deflation." The response gives the reader few clues to this mystery. Furthermore,
"the economic situation" (line 6) is as general as "the financial status of the country" (lines 11-12). The student may have been thinking, for instance, of corporate and individual incomes, of governmental regulation of industry, of the national level of employment, or of the allocation of funds in the national budget. All that seems clear is that the student feels that the country has benefited in some way—an idea stated in "betterment and beautification of the nation" (lines 17-18), with the connotations of a step in the right direction. The student might profitably and informatively had cited examples of the work done in national forests, in parks, and in cities. Instead, he is content to repeat his impression that "betterment" and "improvement" resulted.

Question (History 403). Explain and comment on W. B. Phillips' statement that the plantation was a school for the training of the Negro.

History answer 21. In all, Phillips said that the training that the slaves got here was pretty good. He said that the slaves did not come here in the state of savagery that they were agrarians. They were not cruelly treated, as were the slaves around the Mediterranean area. That for the most part, says Phillips, much of their learning was increasingly a backward people in many of the ways of an advanced civilization. They were schooled, educated, and taught religion. Slavery was the best answer to meeting these people's needs.

First, the lines 3-4, one finds the statement that "the slaves did not come here in the state of savagery that they were agrarians." The last four words in the passage quoted above—words evidently intended to explain "state of savagery"—are, however, on the same level of abstraction as the term supposed to be defined. A brief reference
to the degree of obedience to law, or to the percentage of literacy, might well have aided in definition. Second, the comment (lines 7-10) concerning the slaves' "learning" seems obscure and confused: Words seem to have been omitted, and the sentence structure is faulty. One suspects that the student is referring to reading, writing, and arithmetic, and to what might be termed "vocational training"; but the use of "schooled, educated" helps the reader little, for these broad terms are not qualified.

Other errors may be briefly noted. In lines 4-5, the student states that "slaves were not cruelly treated." The phrase "cruelly treated," however, is relative, and might involve anything from harsh words to flogging. The reader must depend on connotation rather than details. Second, the sweeping statement in lines 10-11, complicated by the combination of the is of identity with high-level abstraction, seems to need qualification, as well as connection with the preceding material.

Question (History 422). Explain why the United States was somewhat slower than European nations in adopting social legislation.

History answer 73. The U. S. was very slow in
comparison to other countries, in adopting social
legislation. This was due mainly to the fact that
while the governments of European countries were
promoting such legislation, any attempts here were
purely on the state and local levels. Even these
attempts were not successful because there was not
enough public force and emphasis on conditions.
Government officials said action would be taken, but
they skipped over such measures when enforcing their
programs. It was only when certain individuals
perceived the poor conditions and wrote factual
reports of them that the public became aware of them
and began to clamor for improvement.
In stating that "any attempts here at the adoption of social legislation were purely on the state and local levels" (lines 5-6), the student might well have cited the maintenance by states, and by some local governments, of orphanages, insane asylums, and institutions for the deaf, the blind, and the dumb; or of the establishment, in 1877, of the Charity Organization Society in Buffalo. Second, lines 7-8 seem to need both qualification and further explanation. The student may have been thinking of the unsuccessful efforts of the New York legislature from 1865 to 1900 to regulate the building of tenements; but he gives no hint of the rising resentment from the eighties onward, shown in works ranging from Looking Backward to The Shame of the Cities, and evidenced in reforms in municipal government (in Cleveland, for instance). In line 11, the reference to "certain individuals" seeing the "poor conditions" (line 12), might well have been clarified by specific references—to Jacob Riis, for instance, and his campaign for better regulation of housing in New York City.

Connotation enters, too, in "skipped over" (line 10) and "clamor" (line 14). No details are given about the extent or the results of either the evasions or the outcry. Thus, instead of definite and exact statements, one finds here generalizations couched in emotion-charged words.

Question (History 537). Account for the decline of Progressivism (i.e., the reform spirit) after World War I.

History answer 190. The decline of progressivism after the war was due to the things that follow most wars, a state of uncertainty and an industrial slump. People were not as sure of themselves in this era of unsettled economic conditions, and a wrong move.
could very well end a political career. In this period people were more concerned with what was going to happen in Europe than what was happening in the United States. During Wilson's administration, progressivism had hit a new level, so high that it was due for a slump because Wilson was so concerned with making sure that there would be no need for future wars that he had to devote much of his time and his health to the ironing out of difficulties in Europe. He could not give his practically undivided attention to the reform movement here at home. From this high level that Wilson had attained in reform practically everything that could be done had been done.

A number of unqualified high-order abstractions serve as the basis for the generalization in lines 18-21. First, "a state of uncertainty and an industrial slump" (line 3) might have been clarified by reference, for instance, to the coal strike in 1919—as well as the "outlaw" strikes—and to the drop in foreign demand during 1920. "Era of unsettled economic conditions," by itself, seems insufficiently specific. "A wrong move" (line 5), in this context, probably refers to espousal of such causes as pacifism or the repeal of prohibition. Beginning with line 10, the respondent adduces another reason, but because of the high level of abstraction maintained, tends to oversimplify. He might have mentioned, for instance, the mobilization of national sentiment for war purposes, and the resulting difficulty in preventing that sentiment from turning into fanaticism, as manifested, for example, in the Ku Klux Klan. President Wilson's stubborn stand on the Treaty of Versailles and the League of Nations is hinted at; but the student, instead of relating and defining aspects of the problem under discussion, has tended to think and to
write in terms of a cycle that must take its course.

Question (History 423). Discuss the philosophy of the New Deal.

History answer 113. The philosophy of the New Deal reflected its founder's philosophy. It was a middle-of-the-road policy [dead-level abstraction] administered by Roosevelt. It believed that a capitalistic government should raise the standard of living by fair-practice laws for labor—N. L. R. B.—as well as business [dead-level abstraction] (though they wanted to continue the business policies of Hoover). Agriculture was to be aided [dead-level abstraction] and help given to underprivileged groups (Social Security Act of 1935). They wished to relieve the depression and restore the faith of the people in the national government [dead-level abstraction].

Question (History 423). Contrast Hoover's attitude toward the depression with Roosevelt's attitude toward it.

History answer 138. Herbert Hoover felt that the depression was an intangible low point in the normal economic cycle and that a hands-off policy was the best remedy for it [dead-level abstraction]. Big business had always come through before, and Hoover saw no reason why it shouldn't repeat. His White House bulletins stating that there was no cause for alarm and that prosperity was just around the corner, soon became nation-wide jokes.

F. D. R., however, recognized the depression for what it was [dead-level abstraction]. Roosevelt also saw that recovery from the depression could come only if the government stepped in with aid designed for stopgap recovery [dead-level abstraction]—followed by a program of providing jobs through government-sponsored projects which would provide a longer range recovery program that would sustain the nation until industry was functioning normally again.

Question (History 537). Account for the decline of progressivism (i. e., the reform spirit) after World War I.
History answer 182. The World War changed the
interest of the people from nationalism to
internationalism [dead-level abstraction].
It promoted a strong feeling of unity and could
not tolerate international strife. Another
factor for the decline of progressivism was the
death of Theodore Roosevelt, one of the
champions of progressivism. Another factor was
the relative lack of unemployment and
resultant prosperity during the 1920's. People
did not want things to change or anything which
might bring a change to the prosperity [dead-
level abstraction].

Let us summarize briefly: In the eight responses inspected
(History answers 21, 73, 87, 113, 138, 139, 164, 182 and 190), dead-
level abstracting results, first of all, in vagueness. Highly
abstract terms are used, but little or no explanation is added; too
much is left to the analytical ability—or the imagination—of the
reader. To say that "Hoover felt that the depression was an intang-
ible low point in the normal economic cycle" (History answer 138,
lines 1-2) does not convey a clear, accurate description of a complex
analysis. Second, in these responses, high-level abstractions are
often used with at least a hint of two-valued orientation, as in #113
(line 3), when the student describes the New Deal as a "middle-of-the-
road policy." The idea is implicit that Hoover's policy was, by
comparison, (1) extreme, (2) reprehensible. In such phrases, offered
without qualification, one finds not only a lack of precision but also
a tendency to think and write in terms of good and bad, defensible and
indefensible.

In some instances (History answer 126, 129, 133, 171, and 175,
to follow), a number of the high-level abstractions used are clarified
by details, but the students have generalized somewhat sweepingly
through the abstractions.

Question (History 423). What are the similarities between the British domestic policies of the thirties and the policies of the New Deal?

History answer 171. The similarities in England and the United States are twofold. 1. Similar backgrounds of reaction and conservative control leading up to the world reaction. 2. Similar over-all plan to solve the depression: i.e., raising prices to increase buying power. Thus the British nationalization of industry and crop schemes corresponded to our attempts to regulate agriculture and let industry regulate its prices. Doles to the unemployed and public works projects also were similar. The British created their inflation by devaluing the pound (under a Labor K. P.). This increased export income, raised prices, cut wage earners' buying power, and balanced the budget (which was necessary for a French loan). Thus the United States and Britain used economic techniques which had no relation to human need; i.e., creating inflation and scarcity first to increase buying power.

In this answer, though the student has attempted to use examples and details in the second paragraph, at least two high-order abstractions (lines 3-5) remain unclarified. What is the meaning of "reaction" (line 3)? The student may mean, for example, the Hawley-Smoot tariff act, or the British law of 1927 designed to curb labor unions; he does not say. By "conservative control" (line 4) does the student refer to political parties or to the disposition to preserve what is established? The student apparently wishes to make use of the cumulative unfavorable connotations of "reaction" and "conservative control"; in so doing, he combines vagueness with emotive language.

As the reader considers the generalizations in lines 8-13,
15-18, and 19-20 of this answer, he is reminded that statement does not constitute proof. There is a need for additional explanation of the details of the similarities with regard to industry, agriculture, relief, and public-works programs. Were the effects of the devaluation of the currency as stated—especially in balancing the budget? Finally, in what ways did the economic techniques "have no relation to human needs"? The explanation offered in lines 20-22 does not appear to clarify sufficiently the meaning.

Question (History 537). Evaluate Theodore Roosevelt as a Progressive reformer.

History answer 175. Theodore Roosevelt is considered to be a Progressive reformer for two reasons: (1) He was fortunate enough to be the President of the U. S. at a time when progressives were very active, and (2) he was by nature a progressive, motivated by a nervous energy which impelled him to get things done. This nervous energy showed itself many times during his administration, especially in his dealings with Congress where he often accepted alternative legislation for the bills which he proposed just so he had some kind of legislation. Roosevelt and his Secretary of State, Hay, set a new and progressive example in foreign policy. When war was imminent between France and Germany if something were not done to settle their disagreements, he prevailed upon his friendship with the ambassadors from France and Germany to sit in arbitration with them and iron out the difficulty. It was during Roosevelt's administration that the Panama canal was proposed, and Roosevelt, being a progressive, was quick to seize upon the opportunity to claim further honors. He initiated legislation in Congress to investigate the prospects in Panama and Colombia, this investigation being made by the Walker Commission.
The commission made its report to Congress, and the ultimate result was the Spooner Amendment.

Meanwhile Roosevelt was fighting a battle of territorial rights with England which concerned the Clayton-Bulwer Treaty and our right to build and fortify the Panama Canal. The ensuing exchanges resulted in one of the many Hay treaties which practically did away with the old Clayton-Bulwer agreement. For a nation which had been employing isolation tactics until the Spanish-American War, this was indeed progressive leadership.

Roosevelt made a progressive move in foreign relations when he incited, by a rather remote method, a revolt in Colombia which gave forth the Republic of Panama. He showed further progressive tendencies when he initiated the so-called "dollar" policy in the Central American countries, which practically forced American (U.S.) bank loans upon them and then allowed us to step in and protect our investment by controlling the tariff there. Needless to say, some of the things that were done there did not cause any good will, but they were progressive, and I attribute most of them to Roosevelt.

In this response, the word "progressive" is used in lines 2, 5, 6, 16, 26, 45, 49, and 57. As far as the reader can follow the significance of the word, "progressive" here seems to mean "new", "farsighted", "persevering", and "filled with driving energy". Nowhere is the word defined; but the connotations and the context suggest that the student is using the term in a favorable sense. For instance, in lines 12-14, the "nervous energy" that is, apparently, a part of the progressive temperament is linked with the "alternative legislation" (line 12). Legislative and executive horse-trading is implied; but the nature of the transaction is not revealed, and further details are needed. In lines 27-28, one notes the linking of "progressive" with the desire for "further honors." The assertion as it stands has
little meaning, and the statement about the "legislation" does not clarify the general comment. Finally, in line 44, "progressive leadership" seems to mean statesmanship of a high order: Isolationism is contrasted with internationalism - but neither term is explained or qualified. The student evidently feels that the connotations speak for themselves.

It may be noted, too, that the is of identity and the is of classification figure in this response: in lines 5-6 ("He was by nature a progressive") and in lines 57-58 ("They were progressive"). Thus a high level of abstraction - without detail - and an outwardly impressive finality are here combined.

**Question (History 523).** Choose either Mussolini or Hitler, describe the circumstances (immediate or background) that enabled him to come to power, describe the philosophy and program of the movement he led, and evaluate his achievement.

**History answer 126.** Mussolini was a leftist socialist and journalist before the war. He was impressed with power and war. He had been a corporal during the war, and a militaristic program and policy pleased him. The results of the war, fought on the side of the Allies, was a big disappointment to Italy. She had wanted a share of the spoils, but because she had not made a good showing, she did not get it. After the war, she was immersed in high prices, low wages, poor conditions, poor resources, and in general was burdened. The country was ripe for some kind of attack; there was fear of communism, which sent people in the opposite direction in reaction to it (or what seemed so).

Mussolini staged a "march on Rome." The top officials were already tipped off and so didn't declare martial law, and Mussolini, with his policy of anti-monarchism, anti-labor, anti-religion, and anything else he
could be anti about, including individualism, was in power. (His "platform" had been to make a radical change (for the masses) and to stabilize order (for the upper classes). After he got in power, he reversed himself and was not quite as anti. These policies meant nothing to him. His only philosophy was of the power or strength of war and of violence. This thought seeped into all of his policies and actions. Fascism became a way of life, a higher scheme of things; it meant dictatorship, one-party planning, discipline, economic planning. Labor suffered under miserable conditions. All individuals were co-ordinated into a "monolithic state." He got rid of other parties; he started building the navy; he planned buildings and agricultural reclamation; he tried to make Italy self-sufficient. His government was supposedly representative.

All these were accomplishments in an attempt to build up the power of Italy. He didn't really go about it too well, nor were the possibilities of Italy's ever becoming a great leading nation too good. However, it seems as though the need for some co-ordination was needed. If it hadn't been by a Fascist, it might have been a communist. The underlying causes remain the same in either case. It is very easy to say, now, that if the democracies had tried to help Italy in her time of need, a Mussolini wouldn't have made progress.

The ultimate achievements are that Italy's venture failed, but succeeded in waking up the democracies so that, after the war, they did not return to isolationism.

First, in lines 10-12, the student has used some details; but brief reference to, for instance, the violent strikes, the peasants' seizure of estates, and the starvation diet of many of the poverty-stricken, might advantageously have been substituted for "poor conditions, poor resources." Another passage in which the use of high-level abstraction is combined with the use of some details is found in lines 31-34. "Dictatorship," "one-party planning," and "economic
planning" seems fairly definite; but the respondent might well have defined the other terms—"a way of life" and "discipline"—by referring to the maintenance of private property—under state control; to the prohibition of class struggle or industrial disputes; and to the domination, by the government, of trade unions and manufacturers' associations. In lines 50-51, however, the student generalizes on seemingly insufficient grounds. He does not mention, for example (a) that many Italians believed that the strikes and the seizure of the factories were preliminary to the overthrow of the capitalist system; (b) that manipulation, strife, and inefficiency were damaging parliamentary government; (c) that many Italians were dissatisfied with the gains which Italy had from the war. The generalization in the answer seems to be very close to an "either-or" choice; but the problem—and the causes—are much more complex than the response indicates. Finally, in view of the formation, in 1934, of the pact between Italy, Austria, and Hungary, and of the failure of the League of Nations to prevent the invasion of Abyssinia in 1935, the statement that Italy's venture "succeeded in waking up the democracies" (lines 55-57) seems to need further explanation.

In two passages, forms of to be occur in conjunction with high-level abstraction. In lines 28-29, the assertion is made that Mussolini's only philosophy "was of the power of war and of violence." Perhaps a reference to Mussolini's belief in his definite duty to the revolution and to Italy, to his appraisal of the place of Italy in world politics, and to his ability as an actor, might have given
additional clues to his analytical intelligence and his complex personality. Second, the comment "His government was supposedly representative" (lines 40-41) might have been made more specific by mention of, for example, the power of the Fascist Grand Council in elections, restrictions on the franchise, and the establishment of "podestas" in the cities and towns of Italy.

It should be said that the response as a whole is thoughtfully written, with considerable factual information and with careful analysis. The comments in the two preceding paragraphs are meant to indicate ways of improving specificity and of avoiding sweeping generalization.

**Question (History 423). Discuss labor legislation and labor problems under the New Deal.**

**History answer 129.** Up until the period of the New Deal, the government had been partial to business. The influential men in the country felt that if business were healthy, all of the nation's economy would be healthy; and unfortunately the depression did little to help them see the light [dead-level abstraction].

F. D. R. was partial to agriculture and labor (or, maybe we can say he was working toward impartiality). Realizing that prices were too low and unemployment was too widespread, F. D. R. felt that labor would benefit the whole economy by being able to force prices up and better their conditions [high-level abstractions, with some detail but with sweeping generalization].

The Norris-LaGuardia Act outlawed injunctions, yellow-dog contracts, and redefined "labor disputes." Later ruled unconstitutional, the N. R. A. (National Recovery Act) along with a lot of provisions to aid industry, gave labor the right to organize, and forced employers to recognize unions along with collective bargaining.
With the Supreme Court's ruling that the N. R. A. was unconstitutional, the Wagner Act followed. This gave to labor the National Labor Relations Board, and it forced business to hold elections under the N. L. R. B.'s supervision to determine who should be bargaining agent for their employees.

The Taft-Hartley Law, though neither all black nor white, was weighted in favor of business. It resulted mostly because of public opinion about wartime strikes, and some feel that labor is too strong. They say that the pendulum has swung too far the other way.

Labor had a difficult time organizing. The A. F. of L. was too conservative (is of classification, with connotation) and was a horizontal union. Craft unions did not seem suitable to the basic industries, such as steel and the automobile industries.

Lewis, Dubinski, and Hillman tried to change the A. F. of L.'s philosophy and to organize vertical unions, including all workers in an industry. After much dispute, they were suspended from the A. F. of L., and the C. I. O. was organized. With the N. L. R. B. to force elections, the steel and automobile industries were rather well organized.

Negroes and women were taken into the C. I. O. and, for that matter, were taken into the A. F. of L. There is even a possibility of the A. F. of L. and the C. I. O. being reunited in the future. Their differences are not now very great.

The large companies and corporations resisted the organization of their workers into unions, or they would form company unions (which are just what their name implies). Yellow-dog contracts, which forced employees to agree not to join a union, had been popular with business. Strike-breaking and the hiring of spies and thugs by companies was common (is of classification, with connotation). There was discrimination against union members by business (high-level abstraction, with some detail but with sweeping generalization).

A favorable government attitude toward labor under the New Deal was what was needed to help labor help themselves.
sweeping generalization). F. D. R. gave them
that opportunity.

The Social Security Act and Fair Trade Labor Standards Act were passed, but though they were beneficial to labor, they were not inclusive enough. Anyway, they were a good beginning (is of classification, with
finality).

The Labor Standards Act put a floor under wages and a ceiling over hours, but it only applies to interstate commerce. Child labor provisions are not inclusive enough (is of classification, with finality).

Question (History 423). Choose either Mussolini or Hitler, describe the circumstances (immediate and background) that enabled him to come to power, describe the philosophy and program of the movement he led, and evaluate his achievement.

History answer 133. Adolph Hitler, a man of small stature, who ascribed to the rank of corporal in World War I. Hitler was unsettled and discontented after the war. He joined several secret societies, and the one which later became the Nazis was the National Socialist Party. He came to power because of several things: (1) Germany's Weimar Republic could not stand; it could not hold on to Germany. This caused much discontent. (2) War reparations--Germany owed other countries vast sums of money because of the World War. (3) War guilt--Germany was held entirely responsible and as instigator of the war. (4) People weren't satisfied with the Treaty of Versailles at all. (5) Economic crises--Germany was especially hard hit by the depression, because of the war. (6) There was a general feeling of discontent and unrest among all the peoples in Germany. (7) Hitler's profound propaganda also helped him.

He was elected into office, and a majority of the Nazis got into the chamber. Then when the economy began to rise, Hitler was worried. But it fell again, and Hitler took this opportunity to take over and save the Germans [high-level abstraction, with some detail, but with sweeping generalization]. Hitler's propaganda, which helped him get to the top, was aimed at hitting all the people...
By saying "Down with Jews," the common man could see and recognize a Jew, not knowing any better than to actually believe all of Hitler's propaganda [high-level abstraction, with oversimplification].

Hitler was the Leader, Fuehrer, dictator. He was the One, answerable to no one. The Nazi Party and the State and Hitler were one and the same. He was for anti-Semitism. No free thought was allowed at all.

Radio, television, movies, newspapers, everything was controlled and guided by the Party. A youth movement was started to train children the right way. A person lived for the Party, and for nothing else - to do otherwise would be weakness [high-level abstraction, with some detail, but with sweeping generalization]. For people against the State, there were concentration camps, gas chambers, and a great assortment of medieval torture devices. Men were to become strong and healthy, and women were to bear huge families to keep the Aryan race the only real one. Hitler had the Gestapo, which brought dread to many people. The Jews were horribly mistreated, killed, and tortured or sent away without any of their belongings.

Hitler could have actually become ruler of the world, as he had wanted to. To evaluate his achievement - if you can call murder, deceit, treachery, achievements - I don't see any of their value. He must have been mentally deranged to pursue such a path.

In History answers 126, 129, 133, 171, and 175, then, one finds a rather striking combination of strength and weakness. First, the breadth of a number of the abstractions used is modified and limited by the use of some detail (the explanation of devaluation by mentioning the raising of prices and the reduction of income, for example, in #171. On the other hand, several abstractions, many of them connotative, remain without explanation. If a student writes "Theodore Roosevelt was by nature a progressive," (History answer 175, lines 5-6), what is the exact meaning of "progressive", "liberal,"
"middle-of-the-roader," "visionary," or "dreamer"? Perhaps a brief mention of his "trust-busting" activities, or of his statement "I took Panama" might have made the meaning clear. Last, the generalization in these responses seem somewhat reckless. Many of the statements are broad, seemingly opinionated; the students use the inferential, rather than the descriptive, level of abstraction. A student who states boldly that "Italy's venture (into Fascism) succeeded in awakening the democracies so that after the war they did not return to isolationism" (History answer 126, lines 55-58) has raised more questions than he has answered, and has offered no evidence to support his statement.

In the last group under abstraction, high-order abstractions are linked with looseness of thought (History answers 2, 3, 43, 65, and 80, to follow).

**Question (History 403).** Discuss the major platform planks of the Republicans in 1860, stressing the shift of that party from a single-idea movement in 1856 to a successful sectional movement in 1860.

**History answer 3.** In 1860 the Republican party had progressed far from the platform (single-idea movement) in 1856.

At first the slavery question was not thought of as it came to be. Lincoln believed that slavery was undemocratic and unconstitutional, but he was not so much against it for war. Then since it was one of the basic reasons for secession, etc., it became a very large question.

The thinking in the answer seems to be careless. First, the relationship of ideas, the sequence, is unclear. In the second paragraph, the student does not demonstrate clearly the connection between a general comment on the emphasis on the "slavery question"; Lincoln's
attitude toward slavery, with relation to the Federal Constitution and to war; and slavery as a major cause of secession. Second, tangential material is included. The student has not answered the question directly; he has written about "the slavery question" rather than the major planks in the platform of the Republican Party in 1856 and in 1860. Further obstacles to clarity are the unqualified abstraction "democratic" (line 6) and the faulty sentence structure (lines 8-10).

**Question (History 421).** Explain what Palmer means when he says that the American Revolution was not a local event, but that its consequences were largely European and that its consequences affected all the people of the Western world.

**History answer 65.** The American Revolution was not a local event is true. It came about because the Europeans were not satisfied. They didn't like their rulers, and they weren't satisfied with their trading. The revolution changed all this; therefore it was mainly to blame for all the changes in the Western world.

The student, basing his discussion on the "dissatisfaction" of the Europeans, begins an explanation with two brief comments about the attitude of the Europeans toward their rulers and their trading (lines 4-5). He does not, however, comment on the percentage of Europeans involved, or on the causes, extent, or nature of the cryptic dislike and dissatisfaction. The two general comments which the student makes do little to answer the questions suggested above. The generalization in lines 5-6, furthermore, stands unsupported and unexplained; the reader is told only that changes occurred as a result of the American Revolution - certainly a statement which needs further explanation.
Moreover, the judgment implied in "blame" (line 7) renders the material in lines 6-8 largely tangential. The student was asked to explain, not to judge. The judgment is gratuitous; the analysis is missing.

Question (History H22). Describe the teachings of Karl Marx and discuss their significance.

History answer 80. Karl Marx said his socialism was not the Utopian kind. He believed that when conditions were bad, a revolutionary change will occur. He based his idea on economic happenings, and saw man as an economic being, not a human being. His assumptions were influenced by the economic happenings of his time.

Marx's theories didn't come true because democracy became established and the individual was emphasized. Also unions were established to have a strong hand in economics, thus usually suppressing revolutions.

First, the reference to the "Utopian kind" of socialism (line 2) might have been clarified by reference to More, Fourier, and Owen, and to their hope of reaching an ideal human society by propaganda rather than by revolution. In lines 3-4, the student has condensed the theory of exploitation, the theory of accumulation, the theory of concentration, the theory of impoverishment, and the hoped-for "expropriation of expropriators"—when the proletariat take over the machinery of production for the benefit of all. Moreover, in lines 5-6, the student uses a somewhat misleading contrast in his presentation of Marx's belief that economic conditions constitute the basis of human life, and that political beliefs and systems are only superstructure, and change with economic conditions. The student seems to have grasped
the meaning of dialectical materialism, but the presentation of his ideas is somewhat lacking in clarity. The reader of lines 9-11, furthermore, is not quite certain about the meaning of "democracy became established and the individual was emphasized." The respondent may have been thinking, for instance, of the broadening of the franchise in England, the program of social legislation in Germany, or the rise in incomes of workers in general. Here, as in his reference to the rise of trade unions and their political influence (lines 11-14), the vagueness of the words is accompanied by failure to organize ideas systematically and to present them clearly and specifically.

**Question (History 403).** Discuss the major platform planks of the Republicans in 1860, stressing the shift of that party from a single-idea movement in 1856 to a successful sectional movement in 1860.

**History answer 2.** The major platform planks of the Republican party were to abolish slavery and unite the different sections into one section united together [high-level abstraction, with looseness of thought]. Because the party was out to form a government where the people were a part [high-level abstraction, with looseness of thought], they had the people's vote. The party was successful in its platform, and Jefferson was made president. His works and planks were carried out to the best of his ability. He was out to abolish slavery, and after much hard work and time he finally succeeded [high-level abstraction, with looseness of thought]. Slavery was abolished.

**Question (History 421).** Identify the Second Continental Congress.

**History answer 43.** Americans needed a feeling of economic security which they did not have [high-level abstraction, with looseness of thought].
thought]; so a second Continental Congress 
met to form a Constitution of the United States. 

The errors in this group of six responses (History answers 2, 
3, 43, 65, and 80) are serious. First, though the number of high-
level abstractions may not seem to be large, much of the meaning de-
pends upon them: These students use such terms as "economic security" 
(#43) and "revolutionary change" (#80), without adequate referents. 
Second, the lack of careful, methodical thinking is shown in the un-
clear arrangement of ideas and in the omission of items essential to 
an understanding of the students' explanations. Circular logic, 
hedging, and the inclusion of irrelevant material frequently occur. 
In these answers, too, judgments are numerous; the descriptive level 
is often abandoned.

Symbols. As we turn to the next major classification, it will 
be observed that implicit confusion of word with referent occurs in 
all the answers to be considered under this heading. In several re-
sponses (History answers 62, 63, 70, and 82, to follow), word-magic, 
the unskillful use of high-level abstractions, and loose thinking are 
present.

Question (History 421). Explain what Palmer means 
when he says that the American Revolution was not a 
local event, but that its consequences were largely 
European and that its consequences affected all the 
peoples of the Western world.

History answer 62. The American Revolution 
was not a local event. America was rebelling 
against England because of many things. We 
wanted to be free. England, of course, is in 
Europe; and through trade and thought it 
affected the Western world badly. It all 
started in the English Parliament, probably,
and we wanted freedom. Our trading stopped, and some of the goods England used from us stopped. We were no longer an asset. It weakened them considerably to send troops to us. People in England got our idea. Other nations threatened them.

Much of the thinking in this response turns on the symbol "free." The student gives the impression that the colonists, filled with righteous indignation, rebelled in order to break their galling shackles. This idea, of course, is closely connected with the high-level abstraction "freedom." Moreover, the magic in the word "free" has prevented the student from carefully analyzing the situation under consideration; he can see only the idea of restraint. He makes no mention, however brief, of such matters as the Sugar Act, the Billeting Act, or the Stamp Act; he is content with the comment that, somehow, restraints on the good American freedom—tyrannical restrictions—started in the British Parliament. At least, the statement is made; then the student returns immediately to the idea of "free."

One notices, too, the carelessness in relating ideas. Both the material and the approach seem tangential. The sequence of ideas is unclear; and the question is not answered directly.

**Question (History U22).** Discuss the frontier as a distinctive influence in American life.

**History answer 70.** The frontier was an important influence in American life. The frontier was an entirely new experience for the American people. It led to conditions never before encountered, at least for a number of centuries, for in Europe there was no frontier. The frontier shaped American government, American policy, and American people. In this country where men had no titles, each helped
the other. The frontier inspired nationalism.  
The frontier was America. In the Turner thesis, Mr. Turner says that this new way of life was made by the people and its influence on America can never be fully realized.

The student evidently believes that frequent use of "the frontier" will serve to answer the question posed. Repetition is the key here: The word "frontier" is used five times in the brief response, and is linked with (1) newness; (2) the shaping of American government, policy, and people; and (3) the "inspiration" of nationalism. Instead of considering such aspects of the influence of the frontier as emphasis on utility, material success, physical strength, and optimism, the student is content to repeat "frontier," avoid the question, and generalize.

The generalization is accomplished by means of the use of the is of identity (lines 1-2, 3, and 12) and the generous employment of unqualified high-order abstractions: "conditions" (line 4), "policy" (line 9), and "nationalism" (line 11). In the response as a whole, the thinking seems as unclear as the phrasing.

Question (History 421). Discuss the rise and fall of the Federalist Party, showing the accomplishments of the party, its stand on domestic and foreign issues, and the reasons for its decline.

History answer 63. The Federalist Party was at its height during the Revolution. It made the people pep up [high-level abstraction, with connotation]. It gave them a democratic feeling [Note also the use of free in line 9: word-magic, with high-order abstraction and loose thinking]. It stood for a trading nation, one unit strong central government and a free nation. During the Revolution it was good because people were on the stage of
Question (History 422). Describe the teachings of Karl Marx and discuss their significance.

History answer 82. Karl Marx's teachings were on behalf of the betterment of the proletariat (is of classification, with finality), the laboring class.

Marx said that the large percentage of the national income is going to the already rich, and not to the laborer as it should. He said that families were being broken up as the result of women and children working in factories long hours and receiving no monetary returns. He implied that not all the wealth should be concentrated with a few people but should be divided equally among all. The all meaning the proletariat. The workers (See also laborer (line 21), masses (line 23), and workers (line 25): word-magic, with high-order abstraction and loose thinking) should be ruling, and not the rich, is another point inferred by Marx. The government was in the hands of the well-to-do. These people didn't have any cares for the laborer.

Marx's ideas in general were, at least they may have been, to benefit the masses. The masses who rightfully should rule and the workers who should get some returns for the labor which they do (word-magic, with high-order abstraction and loose thinking).

In these four answers, then, (History answers 62, 63, 70, and 82), the preoccupation with such words as "free" has affected the students' thinking so that they return again and again to the word, whether it be such a term as "frontier" or "proletariat." Instead of analysis and the evaluation of evidence, there is belief in the virtue
of the symbol itself to solve problems, to answer questions, and to influence the course of events. Unsupported statements and circular reasoning occur, and the verbal picture is confused, often distorted. Furthermore, the problem is complicated by the use of unexplained high-order abstractions and by loose thinking. Unclarified high-order abstractions usually increase the confusion because their meaning—without the use of lower-order abstractions for clarification—is elastic. The students make such terms refer to what they wish the symbols to refer to. Much irrelevant material is included, and the answers lack coherence.

In a second group (History answers 11 and 12, to follow), a belief in word-magic is accompanied by use of the two-valued orientation.

Question (History 403). In what ways did the question of the Bank of the United States versus Jacksonian democracy illustrate the political and social philosophy of Jackson's party? In your answer, discuss such items as (1) Jackson's message vetoing the recharter of the Bank, (2) the role which the controversy played in the presidential campaign of 1832, (3) Jackson's actions relating to the Bank after that campaign.

History answer 12. Jackson vetoed the recharter of the bank, and in so doing upheld the position of the common man. During the Jacksonian administration, democratic principles were upheld. Jackson stated that the bank was run by a few men and that the common man had little part in it. It was making the rich richer and the poor poorer. He also said that one-third of the shares were owned by foreign countries and that the West had only a few.
The student has used several symbols: "the common man" (lines 3 and 7), "the rich" and "the poor" (line 8), and "a few men" (line 6). As far as one can tell, the student uses "the common man" to mean a hard-working, conscientious, intelligent, well-informed citizen, the mainstay of a republic. This concept is apparently closely connected, in the student's mind, with the "democratic principles" mentioned in line 5. The "few" (the "rich") are grasping and selfish; the "poor" are meritorious and long-suffering. The ideas in this answer, then, are expressed largely in terms of symbols which may or may not correspond to objects or events in the extensional world. The use of "common man" does not constitute proof of the student's contentions, any more than "democratic principles" proves that the administration of President Jackson acted in the best interests of the citizenry. The use of "the rich" or "the poor" will not affect the facts of history.

Question (History 403). In what ways did the question of the Bank of the United States versus Jacksonian democracy illustrate the political and social philosophy of Jackson's party? In your answer, discuss such items as (1) Jackson's message vetoing the recharter of the Bank, (2) the role which the controversy played in the presidential campaign of 1832, (3) Jackson's actions relating to the Bank after that campaign.

History answer 11. The question of the Bank of the United States versus Jacksonian democracy illustrates the political and social philosophy of Jackson's party in three mannerisms. Jackson - who was a man of the people, a simple but broad-minded president [word-magic, with the is of identity and two-valued orientation] - was all for the rights of the common man and against the
aristocratic view and the Bank [word-magic, 10
with two-valued orientation]. Thus, it was 11
very natural that Jackson took the side of 12
the simple common Westerners [word-magic, with 13
two-valued orientation] who strongly opposed 14
the Bank. In the election of 1832, in which 15
Jackson won, one of the biggest questions was 16
the Bank controversy. Supported by the 17
Western men, Jackson, as I said above, won 18
the election.

In these responses, then (History answers 11 and 12), the use of such terms as "a man of the people" and "the simple common Westerner" appears to be, in the mind of the students, sufficient evidence for the statements advanced. Because of the basic belief in the reality of symbols, the difference between facts and judgments is obscured. It will be noted that those who use symbols in this way tend to write in terms of stereotypes, the use of which, the student writers feel, will somehow effect a correspondence with facts. The symbols are used; no further explanation is offered, except for antitheses which set up two-valued orientations and reinforce the starkness of the symbols.

In two responses (History answers 20 and 72, one finds symbols unskillfully used, with connotation and metaphor.

Question (History 422). Describe the teachings of Karl Marx, and discuss their significance.

History answer 72. Karl Marx's teachings consisted of the fact that he believed that the laboring man was being cheated. He said that the laboring man received only a small fraction of the value of products that he produced. He thought everything, such as railroads, power plants, and all other property, should be owned by the state. The laboring man, he thought, should have an equal chance. Churches and schools should
be run by the state. This arrangement should make the laboring man more free, and he would have less to worry about.

Marx and Engels brought the Communist Party out and made it known. Before they joined, it consisted of a few exiled Germans in France. The growth of this party made it bad for the monopolist and good for the laborer.

The symbol "laboring man" (lines 3, 4, 9, and 12) evokes the image of a chained giant, strong, dignified, oppressed, but determined. The term stands, apparently, for all men who work—the skilled, semi-skilled, and unskilled; it is, then, a counter, with no qualification or analysis apparent in the answer. The same faith in the word is shown in "free" (line 12), a word which is linked with the idea of the downtrodden but deserving "laboring man."

Connotation, too, enters into these responses. One might justifiably wonder about the type and the extent of the "equal chance" mentioned in line 10. The student begs the question of whether the recipient deserves whatever chance is meant. Connotation is combined with metaphor in "cheated" (line 3), with the suggestion of trickery; in lines 14-15, with the image of a jack-in-the-box; and in line 17, with the image of a plant growing.

Question (History 403). Explain and comment on W. B. Phillips' statement that the plantation was a school for the training of the Negro.

History answer 20. Phillips, a southern historian, probably is a little biased in the way he views the plantation, since he himself was from a wealthy home in the South. However, in his book he describes the moral, religious, and social training which the Master and Mistress bestow on the Negro. Even some educational schooling was given to the Negro.
children [dead-level abstraction]. Phillips believes it is better to keep the Negro on the plantation than to let him go elsewhere to learn a trade. In other words, you might say the plantation kept the ignorant masses in their place. [word-magic, with two-valued orientation].

In History answers 20 and 72, then, one notes a lack of analysis—of efforts to ascertain how closely the symbol corresponds to ideas or objects in the experiential world. There is little or no qualification or differentiation; rather one sees a thoroughgoing belief in the efficacy of the symbols used. Connotation enters, with an attempt to persuade through appeals to beliefs and prejudices and the stimulus to the signal reaction. When a student writes, "The plantation kept the ignorant masses in their place," the appeal is more to feeling than to reason. One does not know about the nature or the extent of the ignorance, the identity of "the masses," the nature of their "place," or the exact effect of the plantation system on the development of individuals. Metaphor, too, is often used, as in the above passage, and results more often in brevity than in precision. In these responses, one finds not only confusion of word with object but also loss of objectivity.

Contexts. As we consider responses under this heading, it will be noted that shifts in the meaning of key terms occur in all the answers quoted. In History answers 10, 83, and 180, which follow, these shifts are accompanied by the use of high-order abstraction.
Question (History 422). Discuss the frontier as a distinctive influence upon American life.

History answer 83. The frontier was a definite influence upon American life. Once people were left on their own in a wilderness, they realized their responsibilities. Most important, they realized their freedom. Out on the frontier, there were no social classes. Even the women stood side by side with the men, whether it was working in the fields or fighting for their homes. Out of this life came a new spirit of freedom and equality that influenced American life greatly. It made the American people more freedom conscious and more ready to accept someone else as equal.

A major difficulty in this response is that the meaning of "freedom" shifts from "civil liberty" to "personal liberty" to "exemption from personal control" to, perhaps, "the absence of ceremony." In line 5, "freedom" seems to mean "absence of the authority of society"—"emancipation." One feels the approach of the higher individualism, and visualizes the loosening of fetters. In line 10, on the other hand, a release from American and European cultural patterns seems meant. Here, the student may be thinking of the pioneers building a "practical" civilization, abandoning the futile "culture" of the past.

There appears to be, moreover, a conflict between the many-sided "freedom" and the "responsibilities" mentioned in line 4. The latter idea is undeveloped, and the apparent contradiction hampers communication. Whether the student is thinking of patriotism, the maintenance of a family, or the duty of developing the individual's personality, is unclear. Finally, the repetition in lines 12-14 does not help to clarify the thought.
Question (History 537). Evaluate Theodore Roosevelt as a Progressive reformer.

History answer 180. In an evaluation of Roosevelt as a progressive reformer, I would say that he did not do too much in actual progressive achievements but he set the stage for the advancement of progressives. After he was no longer president, he became the Progressive Party's candidate to run against Taft. He was a great advertiser and had a personal magnitude that did much to create the desire for reform.

In this response, there seems to be some confusion in the student's mind about the meaning of "progressive." At times, as in line 7, the term is a proper noun; in other parts of the answer, the word appears to refer to a somewhat indefinite advocacy of progress, improvement, and reform. First, in lines 3-4, the student, in asserting that Roosevelt "did not do too much in actual progressive achievements," apparently fails to see any contradiction in thought. He does not seem to recall, for instance, the indictments under the anti-trust and interstate commerce acts; the enactment of the Hepburn Act and the Pure Food and Drugs Act in 1906; and the setting aside of 148,000,000 acres of timberland for national forests. Second, there seems to be no evidence offered, except, possibly, the "personal magnitude mentioned in line 9, for the statement that Roosevelt "set the stage for the advancement of progressives" (Lines 4-5). It may be that the intended meaning is that Wilson's administration reaped the benefit of all the agitation for reform from the beginning of the century. More than a matter of capitalization, then, seems to be involved. The student has not analyzed sufficiently the meaning of "progressive", a key word in the discussion topic, in his own mind; he has not organized clearly
the ideas which he has on the subject. In the answer as a whole, the unexpected changes in the meaning of this word obscure the meaning and confuse the reader.

Question (History 403). What was the Republican position on slavery in the platform of 1860? Discuss their wartime change in attitude, analyzing the move for emancipation during the Civil War, and the reasons for the adoption of the Thirteenth Amendment abolishing slavery.

History answer 10. Lincoln really wanted slavery abolished in the South, and this would not be right (shifts in meaning of key terms, with high-level abstraction. See also lines 8-10) for it would be against everything they fought for (high-level abstraction, with looseness in thought). He did not believe that slavery was right. He wanted the country to be united. He didn't think that slavery was right, but he didn't think that war was, either.

In History answers 10, 83, and 180, then, the psychological and verbal contexts are faulty. The thought is clouded by unexpected and unexplained contradictions in thought. If, for instance, an individual should write, "I have a higher duty to myself, a higher responsibility. I need freedom," the basic idea would not be immediately clear. The author of such a statement should show clearly whether he is referring to a narrow-minded selfishness or to a problem as deep as that faced by Antigone. Moreover, in responses #10, 83, and 180, unclarified abstractions confuse the matter. The reader of the first of these feels the need for more information, including the answer to the question, Why would the action not be "right"? Finally, to say, as did the student in History answer 83, that the frontier made Americans more free, which made them more conscious of freedom,
does not help a great deal in explaining the influence of the frontier upon American life.

In three student-written discussions (History answers 47, 67, and 84, to follow), shifts in meaning are accompanied by the use of connotative terms and two-valued orientation.

Question (History 421). Explain what Palmer means when he says that the American Revolution was not a local event, but that its causes were largely European and that its consequences affected all the peoples of the world.

History answer 67. The cause of the American Revolution was mainly the bad treatment from England. The colonists resented the treatment in taxation and the prohibition of the sale of products from the colonies. Such treatment meant that they had no say in the government. The colonists were justified in giving the English similar treatment.

First of all, the word "treatment" varies considerably in its significance. In line 2, it appears to mean "control," with the idea of subjection; in line 3, "management," with a connotation of manipulation. In line 5, the term seems to convey a general idea of action, with a connotation of unfairness; in line 8, of behaviour, a very general use, involving attitude and procedure. Repetition does not clarify the meaning, because the psychological context is faulty. Words do not have single, unvarying significance; the student has the responsibility of making his thoughts clear to the reader, and the reader here is not at all sure of just what "treatment" is supposed to mean.

Connotation enters, too, in "bad" (line 2), the use of which
constitutes a judgment, and in "no say" (line 6), with its suggestion of unfair exclusion, as well as "justified" (line 7), which is emotive. This use of connotative terms shows that the student has used the inferential rather than the descriptive level, and, in so doing, has built up a two-valued orientation, in terms of good and bad, justified and unjustified.

**Question (History 422). Explain why the United States was somewhat slower than European nations in adopting social legislation.**

**History answer 54.** The United States was not as industrially inclined as European nations to start with. More farmer groups than labor groups, and it is the labor group which first presses for social legislation. Because of less laborers in the United States, and more farmer class, a higher wage was paid for labor. There was no monarchy or royalist group to fight with in America - and thus no existing class struggle, just what developed with industry and labor. There were more philosophers and ideologists in Europe, such as Karl Marx and Engels, who were striving for social legislation.

The use of the word "labor" seems to have given the student some trouble. In lines 4-5, he used "labor groups," and "labor group." It is not clear whether the reference is to individuals, clubs, or to such organizations as the Knights of Labor or the American Federation of Labor. "Labor" is also used in lines 8 and 12. In the first passage, the word apparently refers to physical work; in the second, to the class called "workingmen." The contexts seem inadequate to make the meaning clear; and that lack of clarity is shown, too, in the faulty organization of materials and in the construction of such
sentences as that in lines 6-8.

Two-valued orientation, accompanied by connotation in the use of "royalist group" and of "labor", occurs in lines 8-12. The student has offered only two choices in his analysis of one reason for the lack of "existing class struggle," even though, in view of the long conflict between the Jeffersonian and the Hamiltonian concepts of government, expressed in terms, for example, of social legislation, the student's presentation might seem to need qualification.

Question (History 121). Explain what Palmer means when he says that the American Revolution was not a local event, but that its causes were largely European and that its consequences affected all the peoples of the Western world.

**History answer 47.** The causes of the American Revolution was mainly because of the bad treatment with connotation and two-valued orientation. See also lines 10 and 16) from England from the standpoint of both economics and government suffrage. John Locke also helped with influence of his writings and such [Dead-level abstraction]. England taxed America, but didn't let them have any say in government. England sold excess products of theirs to America, and the American markets could not sell theirs. The consequences of such treatment affected the French people and influenced the French Revolution.

In these three responses (History answers 47, 67, and 84), major terms bearing the burden of meaning, shift in significance, and instead of being clarified, are allowed to remain vague. Words do have multiple meanings; but a reader should be enabled to understand the significance of a given word in a specific context, and to be
reasonably certain that unexpected basic changes in the meaning of a major term will not accompany repeated use of that word. Otherwise, communication becomes inexact and incomplete. Moreover, the writing of these students exhibits a serious loss of objectivity, in that judgments are handed down, many of them phrased in connotative terms; yet the answers were written response to questions designed to evoke thoughtful answers written on the descriptive level.

**Uses of to be.** As we turn to the next major element, it will be remembered that the use of forms of to be often results in problems of projection and pseudo-finality, often complicated, as we shall see, by high-level abstraction and by connotation.

In six answers under the above heading (History answers 39, 41, 53, 128, 134, and 167, to follow), the is of identity and the is of classification are used with high-level abstractions.

Question (History 42). Discuss the main features of Hamilton's financial program, and show how the measures he advocated affected American political, constitutional, and diplomatic history, as well as financial matters.

History answer 39. Alexander Hamilton was, 1
to say the least, a very unusual man. Now, 2
when the Constitution had just increased 3
the liberty of the workingman some degree 4
higher, Hamilton became Secretary of the 5
Treasury. He believed that the working-
debtor class was an ignorant mob, and that 6
government was for the wealthy. He was an 7
aristocrat through and through. 8

In lines 8-9, the student has used the is of identity to equate Alexander Hamilton with the high-order abstraction "aristocrat."
Unqualified as it is, the abstraction seems to be vague; and the statement as a whole constitutes a judgment rather than a factual statement. Moreover, the use of the is of classification in lines 1-2 links Hamilton with the adjective "unusual." The student might have mentioned, for instance, (1) Hamilton's practical, logical mind, and his ability as a controversialist; (2) Hamilton's proposals for assumption and funding of debts, for the establishment of the Bank of the United States, and for the enactment of a protective tariff; (3) the significance of the doctrine of implied powers; and (4) the stimulus to the rise of political parties. Instead, the student has affixed a label.

The high-level abstraction "liberty" (line 4) seems, moreover, without the use of lower levels of abstraction, to be all things to all men. One knows little of what the student had in mind when he used the term. "Government" (line 8) in its present context, seems to be rather indefinite; it appears to mean "authoritative direction and control" rather than simply "political administration." The student was probably depending on the reader to recall Hamilton's belief in the need for a strong central government.

Question (History 423). Discuss America's experience with Prohibition.

History answer 128. America during the 1920's became a place of free spending with people that had no deep concern of the future in their minds. Crime, government corruptness, and other disturbing things were going on in the country. One of the outgrowths of this was the Prohibition period.
The sale or purchase of any liquor or alcoholic beverage was forbidden under the National Prohibition Act. Therefore the entire country was dry, or at least was supposed to be.

The amount of liquor consumption was just as great or perhaps greater during this period as when the sale or consumption was lawful.

There were bootleggers all over the country, especially in large cities, and they obtained liquor from outside sources and sold it for large sums, an example of how corrupt the country was.

People paid no attention to the government; their thoughts were all of themselves. Since bootlegging was so prevalent, and drinking continued as much as ever, Prohibition ended.

However, even today there are some parts of the nation that are still dry and don't permit the sale or consumption of liquor or any other alcoholic beverage.

First of all, no mention is made of such factors as the modification of Victorian attitudes and conventions, or of the deep and lasting effects of the First World War on highly integrated social systems. Second, though in line 12 the finality resulting from the use of the is of classification ("therefore the country was dry") is modified by the seven words which follow, the student seems to be less skillful in phrasing the comments in lines 14-17, 23-25, and 25-27. The first of these statements needs evidence on a lower level of abstraction; reliable statistics, for instance, would be helpful in making the comment a fact rather than a judgment. The comment in lines 23-25, reminiscent of La Rochefoucald, appears to be more cynical than accurate. The statement is difficult to prove and—in view of current taxation and regulation—equally difficult to believe. Finally, in
lines 25-27, the student again needs to produce evidence. The problem here results chiefly from the use of unqualified assertion, in conjunction with the feminine comparison.

The response, then, is to a large extent composed of judgments. In addition to the finality often accompanying the use of forms of to be, a high level of abstraction is maintained. Some lack of coherence combines with the use of unqualified statements to make the response difficult to follow or to accept as valid.

Question (History 421). Explain why Napoleon was called "The Son of the Revolution" and show what he did to or for the principles of the French Revolution.

History answer 41. Napoleon was called "The Son of the French Revolution" because he ended disorder at home. His principles were the complete reversal of anything feudal [is of identity with high-level abstraction]. He employed equality although he did destroy liberty [high-level abstraction]. He made civil laws (man's responsibility to one another); criminal laws (the state's responsibility to individuals); procedural laws (procedures in trials); penal laws (pertaining to treatment of criminals); and commercial laws (pertaining to business). All of these laws were for the betterment of France [is of classification with high-level abstractions]. Napoleon also got church to come to terms with the government by the Concordat of 1801 and prophesied an education system, although the latter did not go into effect.

Question (History 423). List and comment on the major causes of the depression.

History answer 134. In the 1920's, everything was O.K. [is of classification with high-level abstractions]. It was the
perfect age [is of identity with high-level abstractions]. People were happy [is of classification with high-level abstractions]. They looked upon the World War I as a disgrace instead of glorifying it. There were all sorts of new interests and the housewife had more time to enjoy them. Prosperity was high; everything was great [is of classification with high-level abstractions]. Hoover was making speeches that the end of prosperity was not in sight and that the poorhouse was gone forever. Two years later, these statements made him look ridiculous [slanting, with connotation]. The major cause of the Depression was the stock-market crash of 1929 [is of identity with high-level abstractions]. The stock market was a new invention, by means of which a person could become rich. One man stated that if you invested in the stock market, you could retire in a short length of time with a fair share of money. The stock market, which had seemed only for rich people was now open to the poor as well. Big business wasn't a menace to the people any more, but rather a friend [is of identity with high-level abstractions]. The people were buying stock in hopes that they would soon get rich from the stock's rising. They didn't have to pay the whole cost of the stock, but they could buy on "margin." This was where they paid only a certain amount of money. This made more and more people invest in the stock market. In 1929, the crash began, and on October 22, 23, 24, it looked as though the bottom had fallen out of it. Then five days later, the real bottom fell. Men like Morgan and other wealthy men offered to give $200,000 of their own to hold off the crash, but while holding it up with one, they were tearing it down with the other. Unemployment was a big problem [is of identity with high-level abstractions]. The national income fell tremendously, and relief costs rose. Along with the stock market crash being a major cause for the depression, it was not the only
one. In the late 1920's, industry had just about reached its peak, and farmers had been in a state of depression for a long time now. Also the farmers' buying power was lowered. The stock market and speculators' buying were great causes for the depression of the late 1920's and early 1930's also.

Question (History 421). Explain the background causes of the French Revolution and describe the progress of the Revolution from 1789 to 1791.

History answer 64. The background causes of the French Revolution were its economic distress as a result of aiding America in our Revolution, and the fact that there were too many tax exemptions. From 1789-91, France was under a limited monarch, and she was suffering defeat in almost all of her foreign wars, and by 1791, the Duke of Brunswick was at her door demanding surrender.

Question (History 423). Evaluate the books written by Kennan and Carr.

History answer 167. I think these were good books to read for this course, although they seemed to be a little complicated in reading them. But by reading them, we were able to go beneath the surface of Russian and Western world diplomacy so as to see on what platforms their governments were established. Those governments that were dealt with in those books are nearly the types of governments which are employed in those countries today. We were able to learn about these countries without taking time in class. These books were of value in studying and understanding this course. We learned what concepts led up to the different revolutions and why some of these governments failed according to that time in history.
In these six responses, then, (History answers 39, 41, 64, 128, 134, and 167), the reader finds that the pseudo-finality resulting from the use of forms of to be to equate terms on different levels of abstraction is increased by the maintenance of a high level of abstraction. The student who writes of "economic distress" and "too many tax exemptions" in #64, might well have mentioned, for instance, the taille and the salt tax; some specific abuses of the guilds; and some major exemptions which the privileged classes had from taxation. Such terms as "distress" are lacking in specificity; yet through the use of forms of to be, the student writers frequently give the impression that complex matters have been adequately considered, even though further qualification or explanation is not proffered. The difficulties inherent in following meaning through the medium of written words are increased considerably when one faces a combination of finality and vagueness.

Study of several other responses (History answers 69, 86, 116, 125, and 140, to follow) shows that the use of forms of to be may be accompanied by the use of many connotative terms— in many instances "snarl words" or "purr words."

Question (History 422). Describe the teachings of Karl Marx and discuss their significance.

History answer 69. Karl Marx in his Communist Manifesto logically reasons that democracy is only temporary and its doom is inevitable. He theorized that in our democracy the rich would get richer and the poor get poorer. His plan of true communism meant the elimination of all
government eventually. His reasoning was sound, but it was only a half-truth. He didn't visualize that labor and capital might get together on their troubles and bargain things out. Marx was important, but many dissatisfied workers in France, Germany, and Britain turned to him for help. It was a starter for socialism in these countries also. Marx wanted no evolutionary measures in actual fighting, for he thought that in the end his was the only possible theory.

Both the is of identity and the is of classification appear in this response, and often the resultant finality is complicated by the overtones of connotation. In lines 8-9, the student uses the is of classification to evaluate Marx's "reasoning" as "sound"; then, in the following clause, he identifies this reasoning as a "half-truth." The statement seems to be a judgment; but the student omits mention or discussion of the contradictions in Marx's work, or of the use of pre-conceived ideas and of speculation in conjunction with the scientific method. The chief difficulties here, even though a partial explanation is offered in lines 9-12, seem to be apparent contradiction and unsubstantiated finality. A similar combination of connotation and the is of identity occurs in lines 15-16: "It [Marx's teaching] was a starter for socialism in these countries also." "Starter" evokes an image of the well-known "thin wedge," but the reader does not know, beyond the fact that many workers were "dissatisfied" (line 13), how or to what extent the teachings of Marx stimulated the development of socialism in France, Germany, and Great Britain. "Dissatisfaction" may mean anything from mild unhappiness over a trifling reduction in wages to extreme anger over an order to work a sixteen-hour day. Finally, to say that
"Marx was important" (line 12) leaves a great deal to the reader. Instead of mentioning, for instance, Marx's use of details and the method used in his consideration of the philosophy of history, the student has been content to submit the unsubstantiated assertion. He seems satisfied to substitute finality and suggestion for specific proof.

Question (History 423). Discuss the philosophy of the New Deal.

History answer 116. Whereas Hoover's method for getting out of the depression was based on the recovery of big business, Roosevelt's method was reform starting from the bottom up. That is, Roosevelt said that the first thing to do was to put the common man back on his feet. The New Deal wasn't a careful economic plan. It was quite haphazard. This is a reflection of Roosevelt's personality. He had great humanitarian sympathy. Thus the New Deal was for the people, not for business. He also believed that all this could be done within the framework of the New Deal. His program seemed radical because he favored labor and agriculture, but also because of its speed. Actually, he was only continuing what Teddy and Wilson had started, and which Harding and Hoover had completely reversed. But for the first time, the government was really stepping in on economic problems. In his relief program, through the C. C. C., W. P. A., and N. R. A., he increased employment and industry. The Social Security Act was a preventive for future depressions. It gave everyone assurance of some income during unemployment or old age. The important step in business and agriculture was the applying of controls in production and the removal of management's control over labor.

The is of identity appears in lines 5, 7-9, and 30-32. In line
5, the student equates "method" with "reform." Whether he wishes
"reform" to mean "improvement," "amendment," "correction," or "rectifi-
cation," for example, does not seem clear. In spite of the fact,
moreover, that the student is writing about a complex matter involving
ideas in the areas of economics, sociology, and political science, he
expresses his ideas in a flat statement which suggests, but does not
name, great evils requiring immediate action. In lines 7-8, the im-
pression of a lack of analysis and systematic procedure in government
is supported by the use of the is of classification with the highly
connotative "haphazard." The charge may or may not be true; the stu-
dent, nevertheless, bluntly reveals his feeling rather than object-
ively discussing a philosophy and using evidence to support his state-
ments. Instead of at least mentioning and analyzing, for instance, the
flaws in such governmental agencies as N. R. A. and A. A. A., the
student proceeds to a discussion of another aspect of the question
which he has been requested to answer. Second, the student uses the
is of classification in lines 9 and 12. In these passages, labels are
affixed, and projection again seems to be apparent. In line 8, as has
been mentioned, "haphazard" conveys the idea of dependence upon mere
chance. Moreover, the student, in using "for the people, and not for
business" in lines 11-12, builds a two-valued orientation with the
opposition of the ideas of the "commonalty" and "big business." In
this somewhat meandering response, the terms employed might be more im-
pressive if they were more specific.

The seeming conviction and simplicity resulting from the use of
forms of to be is increased by the employment of many connotative terms, as well as of high-order abstractions. "Reform" (line 4) has already been mentioned. In addition, the student has used "humanitarian" (line 10), with its suggestion of wide interests, high ethics, and broad philanthropy; and "radical" (line 14), with associations of excess and lack of moderation. A majority of the high-level abstractions used are connotative, such as "big business" (line 3) and "common man" (line 6). Others include "business" (lines 12 and 28); "agriculture" (line 28); "management" (line 30); and "labor" (line 33). No exact referents are given for these terms, though a few details are offered in lines 21-24, in the reference to "stepping in on economic problems."

Question (History 423). Contrast Hoover's attitude toward the depression with Roosevelt's attitude toward it.

History answer 140. Hoover's attitude toward the depression was in the old-fashioned Republican tradition [forms of to be, with connotation]: Help business first, and then business will help the little man [connotation with high-level abstraction]. This "trickle down" theory is fine if business men are all kind and benevolent. Unfortunately this is not true [forms of to be with connotation].

(2) Relief is not the Federal Government's problem. It is the responsibility of welfare organizations [is of identity and is of classification, with high-level abstractions]. And if they cannot cope with the problem, then it should certainly be no more than a state problem. Here, I think, Mr. Hoover failed to realize how large the unemployment problem was getting.

(3) Help the farmers by buying up surplus, then selling the surplus later
at higher prices.

(4) Extend credit to more business firms. Insurance, etc., to be used; if this fails, all will fall.

Roosevelt's plan was the opposite of the Hoover plan in that Roosevelt believed that the aid should be at the "little man" level [connotation with high-level abstraction].

a. Establish a Social Security Act to give aid to the widow, and the orphan, and the unemployed. Encourage states to have unemployment insurance as a buffer against this problem of unemployment [metaphor with vagueness and connotation].

b. Get the people back to work, and if possible in their field of endeavor (W. P. A.). Get unmarried youth busy (C. C. C., N. Y. A.).

c. To the farmer, stop overproduction to regulate prices, instead of buying surplus and letting farmers continue to produce.

d. To labor: Give them the right to organize and bargain with business [connotation with high-level abstraction].

e. In general, treat the depression as a national emergency and use the Federal Government the same as in war time, with the Federal Government taking the lead in getting the country out of the depression.

Hoover felt that business should pull the United States out of the depression [metaphor with vagueness and connotation]. Roosevelt felt that the government should do the job.

Question (History 422). Describe the teachings of Karl Marx and discuss their significance.

History answer 86. The teachings of Karl Marx were based on the belief that economics is a major part in government. Economics is the mainstay of the nation; and without production and manufacturing, a nation could not be successful. Thus the working class is very important [forms of to be, with connotation]. Marx thought that the working class was constantly being
exploited, being paid poor wages and working overtime. He thought a change should be brought about in order to better their lot.

Marx's influence has been brought about in three fields: economics, history, and politics. In economics, a definite new class has been recognized, and some of its aims are being carried out. In history, the theory of economics is being stressed much more than it was before Marx's time. In politics, the rise of a new party has been very apparent. This party is becoming more and more influential in many nations, and will stop at nothing to gain its ends.

Question (History 423). Discuss the philosophy of the New Deal.

History answer 125. The New Deal was aimed at helping the underprivileged people. It was sympathetic toward the farmers and labor. They had mortgaged and borrowed to buy machinery and land, and now that prices were down because of world competition again, they were unable to make ends meet. The government granted subsidies for the farmers, created Federal Farm Boards, etc., to buy up surplus crops, sell them on the world market and make up the deficit in taxes, or else store the produce away until prices rose. The government established the A. A. A. to control the farm price.

There were many unemployed because of technological unemployment. The government established the Social Security Act of 1935 to help these people. This act provided for unemployment and would help any state creating an old-age insurance plan.

In these five responses (History answers 69, 86, 116, 125, and 140), the reader observes, first of all, a number of judgments. The students, using the is of identity and the is of classification, hand-down decisions which give the impression of telling the whole story—or nearly all of it. In these judgments, however, there is a lack of
qualification, of shading; there is, in short, a lack not only of discrimina-
tion but also of humility. Second, one finds the omission of details and of steps in logic. The writers of these responses leave too much—both in background and in details—to the reader. Because many of the terms are on the higher levels of abstraction, communication is incomplete, often hazy. The use of connotative words further hampers interpretation, in that by using such terms, the students often suggest rather than state—and sometimes come close to name-calling.

Two-valued orientation. In three responses (History answers 26, 31, and 115, to follow), one finds antitheses and high-level abstractions accompanying the two-valued orientation.

Question (History 423). Evaluate American foreign policy in the 1920's.

History answer 115. American foreign policy in the 1920's was isolationist. The United States was in a period of great prosperity and did not feel like worrying about other countries. Of course, this gave a very bad impression to the European countries, because we would have nothing to do with them. Since we were having so little to do with Europe, we did not see how things were changing—how Communism was spreading, how many bad situations were developing between countries, how friction was developing between the minority groups and the majority groups. We didn't think that situations in Europe could affect us, but we found out differently. Everything bad that was happening during our isolationist period would come back to the United States.

Here, the two-valued orientation is based on the contrast between "isolationism" and "prosperity" (lines 2, 4). The impression is
given that material prosperity in the United States meant a lack of altruism and of international cooperation—and that there was such a limited choice for the government and the people as a whole. The student makes no mention of such matters as American adherence to international agreements sponsored by the League of Nations; to the appointment of an American representative to work with the League during the Manchurian crisis; or to the conference in 1921 for the reduction of naval armaments. His attitude is, apparently, that there are only two choices: full cooperation, or practically complete lack of contact with other countries.

Several unexplained high-level abstractions complicate the discussion and tend to emphasize the narrowness of the orientation. In line 6, the student writes of "a very bad impression," but offers no explanation concerning its nature, extent, or results. In line 12, in writing of "the spread of Communism," the student was probably thinking of such matters as Russian Five-Year Plans. The allusion (line 12) to "the bad relations...developing between countries" may refer to anything from major ideological differences to minor border disturbances. Finally, "we found out differently" (lines 17-18), with its image of birds of ill omen coming home to roost, does little to clarify the meaning.

Basically, then, the student's discussion is based on a thoroughgoing antithesis, which is supported and aggravated by a number of high-level abstractions. The student seems to be certain of the rightness of his judgments.
Question (History 103). Explain and comment on W. B. Phillips' statement that the plantation was a school for the training of the Negro.

History answer 31. He described things very descriptively, and told how the Negro received practical education by going around and watching folks work. It was very healthy for him to be out in the open spaces instead of being shut up in a city where he might be confined in a factory. He considered the children much better off on the plantation where both colored and white people played together and learned a lot of things by observing.

In this brief answer, the two-valued orientation appears explicitly in lines 4-8. The student outlines the choices: of being "healthy" in "the open spaces" or of being "shut up in a city," possibly "confined in a factory." No mention is made of the possibilities of enjoyable living in a large city—or of the hours of arduous labor in the fields of the country. The antithesis in these lines makes the "either-or" attitude quite apparent.

It will be noted that the "practical education" mentioned in line 3 is referred to again in lines 10-11, where the student seems to feel that observation constitutes a major part of this training—even though "practical education" is not defined, except by the somewhat cryptic "going around and watching people work" (lines 3-4). This answer seems to be more a defense of the student's judgment than an evaluation and comment on the statement given in the discussion topic.

Question (History 103). Explain and comment on W. B. Phillips' statement that the plantation was a school for the training of the Negro.

History answer 26. Since there were no schools for the Negro children, the mistress of the Big House would read to them from
the Bible. She had much to do with teaching
them right from wrong. On the plantation,
the Negroes were to learn everything which
would prepare them for anything ever
expected of them [high-level abstraction].
They had only to learn to do their work well,
and to obey, and everything was provided -
housing, food, and medical care [two-valued
orientation, with antithesis and high-
level abstraction]. Only the Negroes
stayed on the plantation and learned
manual labor. For the work expected of
them, this was sufficient. There was no
need to educate them, since they might
possibly have rebelled against their lot
[two-valued orientation, with high-level
abstraction].

In History answers 26, 31* and 115, ideas and impressions—many
of them abstract and undefined—are opposed in antitheses which are more
impressive than tenable. In such opposition, one finds the essence of
the two-valued orientation: an opposition of ideas, expressed in
verbal black and white. Furthermore, the student writers show an im-
plicit and explicit belief in the accuracy of their interpretations and
in the formulation of their judgments. They do not shade or qualify
judgments, nor do they hesitate. As a result, the students achieve a
clear, simple opposition of ideas.

In two other responses (History answers 165 and 191), the reader
finds oversimplification, high-level abstractions, and connotation.

Question (History 423). Explain the social, economic, and
political background of the New Deal.

History answer 165. At the time of the
New Deal, the nation had entered into a
state of depression. The New Deal was
produced because of the social agitation
in the United States. People were working
long hours and were not being paid for the
amount of work. Prices on certain articles
were high, and the people could not
afford to buy these products. As a result, there was a surplus of goods on the market, which tended to lower the prices of goods. The New Deal was adopted by Roosevelt when he came into office in 1932. The Republican Party had not done anything to prevent, or stop, the depression from 1929 to 1932. The Republicans said, "Just let the depression alone, and everything will be all right." They felt that the depression should be left to take its own course. The factory workers were not represented. To a great extent, by the labor unions, because the unions were those of the factory.

One of the main actions of the New Deal was to raise the prices of goods and to cut the production of some products so as to cause a scarcity and thereby avoid a surplus on the market, which would tend to lower the prices of these products. The Republican Party had not been able to pass any laws through Congress, but when Roosevelt took office, almost every law that was put before Congress was approved.

In this response, the oversimplification which often accompanies the two-valued orientation is largely caused by signal reaction, shown in (1) the description of what the student considers to be the Republican and the Democratic attitudes toward solving the problems of the economic depression which began in 1929, and (2) the comments on the Republican failure, and the Democratic success, so far as having legislation passed is concerned. The student does not mention, for instance, that in December, 1931, President Hoover submitted a number of far-reaching proposals to Congress, and that these measures—some of them modified by the legislators—were passed in the first six months of 1932. Instead, in the response, the impression is given that one party did all the work, had all the defensible aims, and deserves all
Abstraction and connotation figure largely, too. The student uses the term "social agitation" (line 4) but does not clarify his meaning by mentioning, for example, that during the years 1920–1927 at least 700,000 men were made jobless, or that the farmers were in financial difficulties during the same period. The remarks on "long hours" (line 6), "low wages" (lines 6–7), and high prices (lines 7–8) are likewise unqualified and unexplained. No comment on the tariff rates or on overproduction tends to amplify the note on the "surplus of goods on the market" (lines 10–11). The use of connotative words, as in lines 19–20 ("They [the Republicans] felt that the depression should be left to take its own course") serves to reveal emotion rather than to record or to interpret events.

Question (History 537). Account for the decline of Progressivism (i.e., the reform spirit) after World War I.

History answer 191. Several factors played a part in the decline of the reform spirit after World War I. One of these factors was the war itself. During the war, everything was brushed aside and put in the background, and efforts were directed toward winning the war. Wartime production and prosperity took precedence over the idealistic reform movements of the pre-war years [oversimplification, with high-level abstraction and connotation]. Then, too, the people had come to think that they were fighting for "the freedom of peoples all over the world" and when the dream of peace and a "new world order" crumbled, disillusionment was inevitable [is of classification, with finality]. The American spirit became one of ethnic nationalism and conservatism [high-level abstraction]. Anyone who did not think along the lines that the majority did, aroused suspicion [oversimplification, with high-level abstraction and connotation]. People
thought that the answer to peace was to be found in isolationism rather than inter-
nationalism [high-level abstraction]. They no longer thought that the cure for the ills of democracy was more democracy [high-level abstraction]. Materialism became once more the driving force behind the actions of the people [oversimplification, with high-level abstraction and connotation]. These trends in the changed thinking of the American people are illustrated vividly in Sinclair Lewis' Babbitt, the Ku Klux Klan, the 1921 Immigration Act, the conservatism of the Supreme Court in the decisions on child-labor cases, etc.

In History answers 165 and 191, the reader finds a recurrent oversimplification that appears to result from signal reaction. The students have seen names or ideas and reacted immediately and automatically, with little attempt to analyze or evaluate carefully. Thus, an air of conviction, of certainty, permeates these responses. Somewhat paradoxically, however, abstractions—some of them partially explained—bring a considerable amount of vagueness into the answers. In the responses as a whole, insufficient detail is used for clarification and substantiation. Finally, both the certainty and the vagueness are often complicated by the use of connotative words, the employment of which reflects the emotions of the students, and is designed to influence the opinions of the reader. Objective appraisal and evaluation, under these circumstances, appear to be rather difficult.

Connotation. In the responses in this classification, the students, through the use of words charged with association and emotion, reveal their own feelings and attempt to influence the opinion of the reader. As will be seen, the use of connotation often involves the
employment of unexplained high-order abstractions, of forms of to be, and of metaphor.

Several responses under Connotation (History answers 29, 38, 40, 50, 68, 71, 131, and 185, which follow) contain considerable personal connotation, high-level abstraction, and sweeping generalization.

Question (History h21). Discuss the rise and fall of the Federalist Party, showing the accomplishments of the party, its stand on domestic and foreign issues, and the reasons for its decline.

History answer h40. The Federalist Party can proudly and rightfully state that it put the United States on its feet. Under Hamilton, it gave the nation a sound financial policy, and under Washington it created a foreign policy which proclaimed neutrality. Washington freed the West from Indian disputes and made trading thrive. The chief accomplishment of Adams' administration was the creation of a navy - an essential thing for a young nation to continue to exist. The main belief of the Federalists was that the upper class should rule supreme over the middle and lower classes. The decline of the Federalists was due to the majority of people wanting to turn to more democratic beliefs and equal rights of every man, which was being prophesied by the opposing party. Although the Federalists firmly established the United States, their power came to an end in eleven years, because the people were remembering again the promises which were put into the Declaration of Independence.

In this response, the reader finds, first of all, several examples of the use of highly connotative words. In line 2, the phrasing "proudly and rightfully state" suggests loftiness, imposing self-righteousness. Whether the statement—partly explained in lines 3-12—is warranted or not, objectivity is lost; for the student is
defending his position instead of evaluating the achievement of a political party. In line 4, the use of "sound" suggests "financially strong," "secure," "reliable." In this passage, too, the student is suggesting without explaining; questions of why, and in what ways, the policy was "sound" remain unanswered. Furthermore, the statement is made in line 22 that the Federalist Party "firmly established the United States." The question is begged; the matter should be demonstrated rather than taken for granted.

The use of high-level abstractions and sweeping generalizations also complicates the communication of ideas. "Upper class" and "middle and lower classes" (lines 14-16) are undefined; the student does not reveal the criteria used for classification. Furthermore, these words are connotative, as two of them are unflattering as well as vague.

Finally, in lines 16-21, the student gives no hint of the number of people who wanted to turn to "more democratic beliefs" or to the promises in the Declaration of Independence. Statements as broad as those quoted above can be used to "prove" nearly any assertion!

Question (History U22). Describe the teachings of Karl Marx and discuss their significance.

History answer 68. Karl Marx was a man who
had failed in business and spent the rest of his life trying to prove that it was everybody's fault but his own. In brood-
ing upon his failures, he came to the con-
clusion that all business should be government controlled - all industry, communication, etc. With government control, he believed, would come the dissolution of the rich, who were the enemies of society. Only the proletariat - the poor and the workers - could operate a social system wherein quality could be achieved and justice triumph. They would
be the government - "dictatorship of the proletariat." To read Marx is to read some of the driest writings ever published prior to "My Day," the juvenile palaverings of a well-known New Deal politico. Indeed, many believe the latter to be a reflection of the former. But we are digressing. Marx wrote voluminously, and his words were published widely in Europe and in America. To the poor, to the unskilled worker, to the chronic envy of success, his philosophy appealed greatly. His statement that the entire value of a given thing depended upon the amount of labor used in producing it undoubtedly rallied many to his flag. He drew up a long list of things which his Utopia would accomplish - land distribution, confiscation of the property of the rich, armies of agricultural workers and industrial workers, confiscatory taxes, etc. - and there can be no doubt or denial that his rantings took root in many minds and flourished well. As with some other ideas, his grew faster in a country not his own. We all know today that Communism, changed to be sure, but still very much Marx, has transformed Russia.

In lines 2-4, the student, using the cumulative connotations of such words as "failed," "trying," and "fault," has built up a verbal picture of a self-deceiving, self-pitying weakling. The matter of the validity of the implied assertions is tacitly waived; here, as in other parts of the response, the student offers judgment without evidence, and shows a tendency to substitute what he thinks is wit for proof. Much the same approach is shown in lines 24-27, in which he combines a brief description of an incurably discontented and spiteful person with the vagueness of the high-level abstraction "success." The reader is aware that the student has passed judgment, but is not more certain about what than of why. In line 32, the use of "Utopia" represents analysis by
epithet. The impression of the impractical dreamer in his unreal
world is strengthened by such terms as "ranting" (line 38), suggesting
extravagance, vehemence, violence. The assertions may be valid; the
student, however, has used more persuasion than analysis.

It may not be surprising that the vagueness and breadth of un-
supported generalization, as well as the use of connotation, is accom-
panied by—and facilitated by—the use of high-order abstractions. In
line 7, "industry" and "communication" are used without examples or ex-
planation, and one is not told whether the governmental control means
"regulation," "supervision," or "management." "Quality," (line 13)
seems to be non-committal, and, in context, practically meaningless;
"justice" (line 14) likewise needs further explanation through the use
of lower levels of abstraction.

Question (History 422). Describe the teachings of Karl Marx
and discuss their significance.

History answer 71. Marx taught that the
bourgeoisie were the dread enemy of the
proletariat. He explained the changes in
trade routes, money systems, etc., brought
about the rise of a new bourgeoisie. The
bourgeoisie needed a proletariat. The
proletariat was exploited for the selfish
interests of the bourgeoisie. Marx said
that the working class would constantly be
at odds with their masters, the capitalists.
If his teachings had been followed, the
world would have been in a terrible state
of chaos. After that the state would either
have a no-class system, or the workers
would have been defeated and subjected to
even worse conditions and exploitations.
Fortunately for the world, the proletariat
itself defeated Marx's purposes. It settled
its grievances by peaceful means, getting
legislation to back it up.

The student concerns himself with certain aspects of the theory
of Marxism: the "theory of exploitation" and the "theory of impoverishment." So far, so good. Instead of being objective and clear, however, the student has weighted the discussion by using such terms as "selfish interests" (lines 7-8) and "masters" (line 10). In his analysis, which begins with line 11, the student has again been somewhat less than impartial. For example, in lines 12-13, he uses the words "terrible state of chaos" to describe the results of following the teachings of Marx. Instead of briefly explaining what Marx called the "expropriation of expropriators," the student has been content to let the connotative words carry the burden of both assertion and proof. Moreover, in lines 18-20, much is left to the imagination of the reader: The settling of the "grievances" (suggested but not explained) by "peaceful means" (not mentioned) was supported, apparently, by "legislation" (not analyzed). Similarly, no support is offered for the statement in lines 5-6: "The bourgeoisie needed a proletariat." The reader may, of course, gather that the proletariat was needed for purposes of exploitation.

The use of connotative words to convince as well as to communicate is, then, accompanied by the use of a number of unqualified or partly explained high-order abstractions. The ideas of selfishness and oppression run through the response as a whole; but the student offers little concrete information to make his meaning clear and definite.

Question (History 403). Explain and comment on W. B. Phillips' statement that the plantation was a school for the training of the Negro.

History answer 29. The Negro population of a plantation was sometimes very large and had the characteristics of a small town or village. The
Negro was in an ignorant state, and their white masters more or less took the task of educating the slaves in their own fashion. They were very careful to keep the slaves educated in matters pertaining only to the present duties and future activities. They (the masters) were careful to limit the Negro's knowledge to a point where he could offer only a passive resistance.

The major difficulty in this response—aside from the apparent irrelevance of lines 1-3—appears to be in the personal connotations shown in the use of "educating" (line 5), "educated" (line 7) and "knowledge" (line 10). In the light of the wording of Phillips' statement, the choice of the terms is, perhaps, to be expected; but throughout the response, the impression is given that the reader will automatically understand, without further explanation, the student's personal interpretation of these terms. In lines 7-9, the reference seems to be to training for specific work—such as picking cotton—in the fields. In lines 9-12, however, the idea is much less clear; one does not know whether the reference is, for instance, to instruction in science or in the use of weapons—to general education or to the use of force. The errors may not seem to be serious; yet communication is hampered by lack of specificity and of objectivity.

**Question (History 423).** How and why was our Latin-American policy changed during the administrations of Hoover and F. D. Roosevelt?

**History answer 131.** Because Hoover was a Republican and believed in isolationism and conservationalism, our relations with Latin America were almost nil except for a few disturbances concerning oil wells and occupation troops. However, Roosevelt being a good neighbor and a liberal, believed in a "good neighbor" policy, for he felt our economy and relations would be better balanced in America. The Platt
Amendment was repealed; tariffs were set lower to those countries; and most of our occupation troops were removed. Pan-American tasks began, and the Monroe Doctrine was changed from the United States's intervention on acts of aggression to all other countries will join the United States to put down that aggressor nation. Better trade agreements were also negotiated with these countries because there was the fear of infiltration of Fascism and Communism.

First of all, the student depends on the personal connotations of "isolationism" and "conservationalism" (lines 2-3) to persuade the reader of the correctness of his interpretation of our Latin-American policy during the administration of President Hoover. The somewhat oversimplified causal relationship is developed in lines 4-6, in which the student might well have mentioned, for instance, Hoover's "good-will tour" of eleven Latin-American republics, and his efforts toward withdrawal of American troops from occupied areas. The connotations of "Democrat" and "liberal" enable the student to give Roosevelt the credit for the "good neighbor" policy, on the grounds somewhat ambiguously given in lines 8-10. The respondent is much more specific in lines 10-13, it will be noted, than in any other portion of the response. In lines 13-22, however, depending perhaps unduly on "Pan-American tasks," he has given little definite indication of the work of the seventh Pan-American Conference and of the Inter-American Conference for Peace, or of the agreement reached at the eighth Pan-American Conference, affirming faith in adherence to the principles of international law, and pledging to work together for the peace of the continent. Avoidance of highly connotative, often abstract, words, and inclusion
of more examples and details would have helped to make the answer ob-
jective and accurate.

**Question (History 537).** Evaluate Theodore Roosevelt as a
Progressive reformer.

**History answer 185.** Theodore Roosevelt has
many personal advantages for his role as a
Progressive reformer. His personality was a
vigorous and colorful one, which would tend
to advertise any movement. He was by nature
a reformer, yet on the negative side his
very intolerance antagonized conservatives —
and others — and may have defeated his aims.

His record in the field of economics
would probably not uphold him as a reformer.
His attitude toward business was probably
always a little supercilious; and although
known as a "trust-buster" the facts show
that very few actions were taken against
the trusts during his administration.
With regard to organized labor, his outlook
was often unsympathetic; yet he was
extremely outspoken on the question of
child labor and undoubtedly could be
considered a reformer in the matter of
obtaining better working conditions. His
attitude toward those who investigated and
criticized social, economic, and political
questions, particularly the journalists,
was, nevertheless, intolerant and rather
thoughtlessly condemnatory. By refusing to
recognize the evils they described as
actual and demanding reforms, he deprived
himself of an ever—greater reputation as
a Progressive reformer.

As a whole, the response is carefully and thoughtfully written.

It is included as an example of how dependence on the connotations of a
few words can reduce clarity and effectiveness. First, the student has
used "intolerance" (line 7) and "intolerant" (line 25). Perhaps
Roosevelt's buoyant self-confidence—and his flair for pointed
comments—might have been more specifically indicated. The term
"supercilious" in line 12 does not seem to convey adequately Roosevelt's
attitude in this matter—his opposition to the policy of prohibiting trusts, his belief that business concentration was natural and desirable, and his advocacy of legislation to eliminate the evils of combinations. Finally, "unsympathetic" (line 17) might have been clarified by a reference to his action in the Pennsylvania coal strike in 1902, in which he intervened on behalf of the public, and was responsible for the settlement of the differences by an arbitration board. These words, it will be noted, are key words in the answer; and reliance on the connotations has facilitated maintenance of a high level of abstraction, as well as generalization.

Question (History 421). Explain what Palmer means when he says that the American Revolution was not a local event, but that its consequences were largely European, and that its consequences affected all the peoples of the Western world.

History answer 50. The American Revolution was not a local event [is of identity, with finality]. It was caused by the cruel, overly tyrannical rule of England. England thus forced all the people of the colonies to turn to battle [personal connotation, with high-level abstraction and generalization]. Had they allowed more rights here, an understanding could have been worked out [personal connotation, with high-level abstraction and connotation] ...  

In History answers 29, 38, 40, 50, 68, 71, 131, and 185, then, the reader finds, first of all, that the students often carry on argument by using words charged with association and emotion. Instead of objectively analyzing evidence, each of the students tends to beg the question, then defend the particular belief which he happens to hold concerning the question under consideration. Second, where evaluation is present, it is often vague because of the use of unqualified high-level abstractions. Illustrative materials are seldom used; the
The breadth, if not depth, of these abstractions lends itself to the formulation of these generalizations—often loaded and vague—found in these responses.

In three other responses (History answers 52-58, and 179, considered below), one finds connotation unskillfully used, with metaphor and forms of to be.

Question (History 421). Explain the background causes of the French Revolution, and describe the progress of the Revolution from 1789 to 1791.

History answer 58. Like most revolutions,
the French Revolution was slow in starting,
and at first there were not many signs of
dissension. But after it broke out, the
reaction was spontaneous. Driven onward
by the bitter memories of the cruelties
of Marie Antoinette, the Frenchmen
fought hard for their liberty. The
Frenchmen had been persecuted for many
years by the tyrannical rulers of France,
and at last they were revolting. From the
moment the Bastille fell until her new
constitution was adopted, France fought
hard and bitterly for her freedom.

The somewhat unskillful use of connotation is shown, first, in the use of "dissension" (line 4), an indefinite term which may mean, for instance, "difference" or "violent disapproval." The student writes, in lines 6-7, of the "bitter memories of the cruelties of Marie Antoinette," but no mention is made of the popular belief that she was an Austrian at heart, and that she was in league with the counter-revolutionary party. Her frivolity and extravagance, and her desire to safeguard the monarch and the position of the King are not even hinted at. The assertion that "Frenchmen had been persecuted for many years by the tyrannical
rulers of France" (lines 9-10) may be valid, but the language is loaded. The student might well have mentioned, for example, such matters as heavy taxation; the exemptions of the nobles; the administration of the high justice, the middle, and the low; pensions for courtiers; and the heavy expenses of the royal family. Instead, "persecution," "cruelties," "dissension" and "tyranny" are used to impress and convince the reader.

The employment of connotative words is accompanied by the use of metaphor and of forms of to be. Frenchmen, according to the student, were "driven onward" by memories of the cruelties of their queen (lines 5-7). The reader thinks of the condemned under the lash. When the student asserts (lines 13-14) that "France fought hard and bitterly for her freedom," he forgets that not all Frenchmen were revolutionaries. Many thousands of Frenchmen did fight; but many others died on the guillotine because they opposed the Revolution. Furthermore, in line 2, the student states that "the French Revolution was slow in starting," but includes no details about, for instance, Turgot, Necker, Colonne, the Summoning of the Notables in 1786, of the Estates General in 1789, or of the "National Assembly" in 1789. The term "slowness" seems to be considered sufficient explanation. The same comment holds for "spontaneous" in line 5. Both assertions are, on the whole, valid; but the student has given, not details, but finality without explanation. Instead of analyzing and evaluating, he has alternately suggested and insisted.

Question (History 537). Evaluate Theodore Roosevelt as a Progressive reformer.
History answer 179. Theodore Roosevelt was well liked by the people because of his great amount of energy and plans for speech-making, but he was not the progressive reformer that he boasted about. He was always willing to sacrifice major issues to get even a little done. He was pictured as a trust buster, but when it comes down to the facts, there weren't many cases of his actually breaking up monopolies.

Teddy's most notable contributions to the United States had to do with the Panama Canal, the big-stick policy, and conservation.

This evaluation of Roosevelt is based on three words, all of them connotative. The first of the terms is "boasted" (line 5). Roosevelt's histrionic abilities and his addition to "the strenuous life" seems to justify the choice of this word; but it will be noted that the connotations of "progressive" are lined with those of "boasted." The impression given is that he was something of an opportunist. That impression is strengthened by lines 5-7, with the connotative—and metaphorical—"sacrifice." The student has sketched here Roosevelt, the party man, who often worked with the bosses, and who often accepted a compromise when supporting a reform—as in the case of the Hepburn Act. In lines 7-10, finally, the student, in considering the "breaking up" of monopolies, might well have mentioned (a) Roosevelt's distinction between "good trusts" and "bad trusts", a distinction resembling the Supreme Court's rule of reason; (b) the dissolution of the Northern Securities Company and of the beef trust; (c) the twenty-five indictments secured in seven and a half years. The difficulty seems to be that the connotations of these quoted words suggest rather than specify; and, as shown here, the effect of such connotation is cumulative, often misleading.
Question (History 421). Explain what Palmer means when he says that the American Revolution was not a local event, but that its causes were largely European and that its consequences affected all the peoples of the Western world.

History answer 52. After the revolution, the United States set itself up as an example of a free and strong nation [connotation, with high-level abstraction] with a government which was based on the principles of democracy [connotation, with high-level abstraction]. America was an idol in the eyes of foreign nations [connotation, with metaphor and forms of be], and it did some toward strengthening the spirit of revolution in France.

In History answers 52, 58, and 179, then, the somewhat careless use of connotative words and of metaphor results in name-calling that may be more startling than convincing. To enumerate and analyze specific difficulties faced by organized labor during a given period, is one matter; to say, for instance, that "labor had been pushed backwards during the 1920's; it was almost illegal for them to even breathe" brings the comment under the heading of invective rather than of logic. These responses represent a combination of association, through the use of evocative words and metaphor. In places, too, the responses remind one of Carlyle's descriptions in The French Revolution—stimulating and forceful, but hardly objective. As a whole, the answers show more heat than light. The reader understands the students' emotional reactions and sympathizes with them; but he does not know how much verifiable information there is behind the statements.

Metaphor. Turning to the second classification under emotive language, we find that in two responses (History answers 45 and 176, which follow) the use of metaphor, with finality resulting from the
use of forms of to be.

Question (History 421). Explain why Napoleon was called "The Son of the Revolution" and show what he did to or for the principles of the French Revolution.

History answer 45. Napoleon was called the son of the Revolution because right after the Revolution was over he was monarch of France. Before the Revolution, he was rather an obscure successful leader, but when the smoke of the Revolution thinned, there came Bonaparte to take over. After he took over the power, France was the military power of the world, conquering some part or all of almost every country in Europe. But, like every successful military genius that tries to dominate too much, Napoleon fell. He stretched his sphere of influence so far that the surface tension broke, but not before he had put proteges of relatives in almost every country in Europe.

The metaphor in lines 6-7 seems comparatively unobjectionable, with its image of struggle and violence to describe the tumult of the French Revolution. In using the somewhat poetic image, however, the student has employed a simple analogy to describe a complex matter. The French Revolution consisted of more than the capture of the Bastille or the fury of mobs; it involved such matters as heavy taxation without adequate representation, the divine right of kings, and lettres de cachet. Another metaphor, in line 8, evokes the image of driving a horse. This figure of speech seems inexact: Mass hysteria, even during the French Revolution, did not affect all Frenchmen. Some people were afraid to protest against the new policies and the new government. Finally, the metaphor in lines 13-15 suggests a lack of insight on the part of Napoleon. The basic idea behind the words is probably sound; but the metaphor oversimplifies the entire matter.
Continuing the thought expressed in lines 12-13, the student has reduced a complex political and military matter to an explanation in three words: "attemping too much." Such matters as Napoleon's attitude toward civil liberties and toward commerce with other countries, as well as the results of the invasion of Russia, do not seem to have been taken into account.

The inexactness resulting from the use of metaphor is accompanied by finality from employment of forms of to be. Instead of pointing out that Napoleon, made First Consul in 1800, had practically all the power in his own hands, the student (in line 3) classifies the French general as a "monarch"—a sole supreme ruler. The same type of misplaced finality is shown in lines 5-6 ("He was rather an obscure leader"), though Napoleon was appointed commander-in-chief of the army of Italy. No explanation or detail qualifies these statements.

Question (History 537). Discuss the circumstances which led to our rejection of the Treaty of Versailles.

History answer 176. One of my two book reports was on The Great Betrayal, by Thomas Bailey. This was written almost entirely about Wilson and the treaty, and, therefore, I believe I can give much more detail than was covered in lectures or in the text.

In my report, I maintained the fact that the Treaty of Versailles was largely a Wilson-constructed document, and that the League Covenant of the Treaty, Article X, is attributed solely to Wilson. I also concentrated on the feeling between Wilson, a Democrat, and the Senate Republican majority, which led to the defeat of the treaty. At this time it might be better to say something about some of the general conditions which led to the rejection of the treaty. There are several other factors,
besides politics, which led to the defeat
of the treaty. During a war, the President
has the powers of a commander-in-chief,
and is disposed to make many decisions
on the spur of the moment for the good
of the nation. Many of these policies and
decisions would, in peace time, come from
the floor of the Senate. Consequently,
there was a move by the Senate, after the
war, to obtain some of its former prestige.
This meant giving the President a few
setbacks. It happened that rough drafts
of the Treaty of Versailles, a supposedly
well-guarded document, were made available
to the Senate and read on the floor before
its completion. Certain clauses were found
to be objectionable, namely, Article X; and
when President Wilson returned to the United
States from France to read the Treaty before
the Senate, he found them with the barriers
up, having an insight on secret material
mixed metaphor].

Even though the treaty which Wilson
brought back was much different from the
ones which the Senate had reviewed, they
still objected. This is more understandable
when one remembers that the Senate was
making a bid for its old position [metaphor,
with finality resulting from the use of forms of to be] and that the Treaty was a
Presidential measure.

Another point which eventually turned
the Senate against Wilson was his failure
to appoint a quota of Senators to the
treaty council [metaphor, with finality
resulting from the use of forms of to be].
Needless to say, in fighting the treaty,
the Senate related every controversial
issue to it, and dug up a lot of old
political footballs to kick around and
gull the people [mixed metaphor]. Note that
we have essentially the same plan in
effect today, which almost proves that the
measure wasn't bad, or are we that
changeable?

In these two responses (History answers 45 and 176), one finds
that a number of difficulties arise from the use of metaphor and of
forms of to be. In employing metaphor, the writers of these answers
have tended to overstate similarities—occasionally to the point of inaccuracy—and have failed to adduce sufficient evidence to clarify and to support their contentions implicit or explicit in the figurative language. The assurance stemming from the use of forms of to be complicates matters, for the inexactness of metaphor is joined with the certitude resulting from the projection of qualities to the object or idea named. If a student strains a metaphor to make it apply to everything he is writing about, finality is at once misplaced and misleading.

In two responses (History answers 174 and 177, to follow), the use of metaphor is accompanied by connotation and vagueness.

Question (History 537). What were some of the major results of World War I on American economic life?

History answer 177. There were many serious strikes in 1919. Wages had fallen very low, while prices continued to rise. The farmers' prices fell more than 100%, while the cost of producing anything actually rose.

The Fordney-McCumber tariff, the highest in our history, was passed. This tariff reduced outside competition and increased monopolies again.

We poured money overseas, creating an artificial boom. Yes, we were doing plenty of selling, but we were also fothing the bill.

The stock market ran rampant. Watered stock made huge corporations, like the United States Steel Corporation, possible. People believed in a get-rich-quick attitude, creating a world of unreal nonsense which collapsed in 1929.

Huge stadiums which people flocked to by the thousands were filled every Saturday to witness the football games.

The easy dollar ushered in an age of jazz, booze, and athletic heroes.

Ford, General Motors, and Chrysler motor companies were well on their way to giving the transportation in this country...
Several metaphors impress—if they do not startle—the reader. In line 13, "poured" carries with it ideas of abundance and of haste, perhaps of poor judgment. Here, the student seems to tell us that the waste of a flood of hard-earned money caused inflation. In line 16, the stock market is personified, and is depicted as violent and uncontrolled. No explanation, except in the phrase "watered stock," is offered. The personification of the automobile companies (lines 27-30) shows similar vagueness—and similar lack of illustrative material. The extended metaphor in lines 19-21, however, goes practically out of control: Beliefs, attitudes "unreal nonsense," and the breaking of bubbles are combined in a passage which is somewhat vivid but difficult to follow.

Connotation, and the broad though often vague impression given by the use of associative and evocative words, is closely connected with the use of metaphor. "Rampant" (line 15), with its impressions of violence, rage, and fury, builds up the metaphor, previously mentioned, concerning the stock market. In using the term "the easy dollar" (line 24), the student seems to mean more than that money was not difficult to obtain, but he does not explain exactly what he does mean. Instead, he uses the words as a basis for a generalization. He seems to prefer using vivid images and evocative words to giving an objective, exact explanation.

Question (History 537). Discuss the factors which led to our involvement in World War I.

History answer 174. The policy of the
United States was at first based upon the traditional isolationist policy and neutrality [connotation, with vagueness]. The neutrality was made most difficult by (1) British blockade and (2) German submarine warfare. However, the United States continued to attempt to remain neutral. The American government and public were, to say the least, greatly disturbed when many American lives were lost on the Lusitania. Things looked a little better when Germany stated that she would not attack any merchant vessels or liners without warning. This policy soon cramped Germany's style [metaphor, with connotation and vagueness], and more Americans lost their lives. Then the statement by Woodrow Wilson that if anything similar happened, we would be forced to sever diplomatic relations with Germany, Germany's reply to this was unrestricted submarine warfare. This, plus the Zimmerman note, seemed to more or less force the United States into a declaration of war which had been forced upon her [metaphor, with connotation and vagueness]. Some people think, too, that we were led into war by the munitions-makers, who, of course, would profit from the war [metaphor, with connotation and vagueness]. This motive, however, could have been associated with labor, agriculture, or any group for that matter, who became better off financially during the war. Others think that we entered the war to save the Allies, or because of the Russian Revolution. In general, though, it is felt that the United States entered the war because Germany would not let her remain a neutral forever.

In these responses (History answers 17b and 177), the majority of the metaphors used are broad, vivid—and unexplained. They impress the reader as being colorful rather than illuminating, and as needing qualification and explanation. The students, moreover, reveal their political beliefs and sympathies, though these were not requested. The
lack of objectivity is shown, too, in the use of connotative words; and, in this regard, the students often come close to invective—if, indeed, they do not reach that point. Connotation and metaphor combine, in these answers, to build images rather than explain events.

Slanting. In three responses (History answers 23, 24, and 123, which follow), one notes the interplay of connotation and of the selection of details to fit a conclusion precedently reached.

Question (History 403). Explain and comment on W. B. Phillips' statement that the plantation was a school for the training of the Negro.

History answer 23. Phillips meant that it was easier to teach them practical manual things than less useful things. They learned to perform duties expected of them as slaves. There were some early attempts at schooling which were something of failures, and so planters kept more to teaching them work ways. I don't think proper attitudes were created among the Negroes toward schooling; but possibly any attitude would be shaded by the status of a slave.

Here, slanting is accompanied by connotation. The phrase "practical manual things" is balanced against "less useful things" (lines 2-3). "Practical," however, suggests good judgment as well as the ability to turn what is at hand to account. Because details are lacking, just what the student has in mind remains unclear, and the idea hangs in air. "Useful" carries with it the ideas of "serviceable," "advantageous," or "helpful." Thus the student has built an antithesis with two unknown quantities, and has succeeded in writing a sentence with many possible meanings. Much the same type of wording is found in "duties expected of them as slaves" (lines 4-5). A brief explanation
at this point would have helped to clarify the meaning of the words, as well as to nullify the question-begging in the use of "expected." In lines 9-10, the student writes of "proper attitudes...towards schooling" --probably in the sense of "fitting," "suitable," or "appropriate." He ignores such matters, however, as variations in both intelligence and opportunities for schooling. The same type of slanting is shown in the comment about "early attempts at schooling" (lines 5-6). In the student's discussion, no account, however brief, is given concerning the reason for or the extent of the failure; these details are taken for granted. The student has established his thesis, and then has used loaded words and partial explanations to weight his judgments.

**Question (History 423). Discuss America's experience with Prohibition.**

**History answer 123.** The Prohibition Bill went into effect in 1920. There were several primary reasons why the states ratified the bill.

There was much indulgence. Many people drank too heavily. Not only were ordinary people affected, but the politicians too. Drinking led to corrupt politics. Even in 1914, there were 29 dry states - dry by their own choosing. The war and automobile aided the bill, too.

The discussion as a whole seems largely tangential. The student, instead of writing directly on the discussion topic, begins to explain "why the states ratified the bill." Moreover, the explanation is based on the broad, emotive statement in line 8; and the other comments (lines 5-8), equally broad and phrased in equally connotative words ("indulgence," for example) are selected to fit this conclusion. In these selected comments, no evidence is submitted; the student depends entirely on assertion and association. It will be noted, too, that the
relevance of lines 8-11 seems open to question, though lines 10-11 might, with further explanation, have some bearing on the discussion.

**Question (History 403).** Explain and comment on W. B. Phillips' statement that the plantation was a school for the training of the Negro.

**History answer 24.** Phillips believed the Negroes came from very backward conditions, that their movement was from barbarian civilizations. Such people knew nothing about our way of life; they needed to be in slavery for protection and training [slanting, with connotation]. Plantations were nearly like schools to train these Negroes. As was pointed out, though, no provision was made for graduation, and if they had ever planned on it, different types of training would have been taught. Also there is some theory that these Negroes came from a very arid region of Africa, already knowing such labor [connotation, with confusion in thought].

In these responses (History answers 23, 24, and 123), objectivity is lost, for the students have made up their minds in advance. The emphasis is on those ideas which will serve to support the conclusions which the students have decided upon. Instead of analysis, the reader finds selection. The analysis that is present in these answers often gives way, without warning and without evidence, to the use of highly connotative words. Frequently, too, the selection and the use of associative words are accompanied by question-begging.

In three responses (History answers 22, 110, and 132) which will be considered at this point, slanting is accompanied by some confusion in thought and by oversimplification.

**Question (History 423).** Contrast Hoover's attitude toward the depression with Roosevelt's attitude toward it.

**History answer 132.** Hoover's attitude
toward the depression, in one sentence, would be "There is nothing to fear; this will all be over in a year." Hoover wouldn't take any action, except to veto bills for help. He didn't believe in the obligation of the government to correct or to help the depression. He didn't know or understand the fact of the many millions of people hungry and without shelter.

Roosevelt's attitude toward the depression was that of action. Once he was elected, he performed "the 100 days," in which he put bill after bill up before Congress to alleviate one of his basic seven points. He saw it was the duty of the government to put down this depression and help all the unemployed, hungry, and shelterless people throughout the country. He is characterized by Freedom From Want and Freedom From Fear.

In lines 1-11, slanting in one direction is shown. For example, in lines 4-6, the student maintains that all Hoover did was to veto bills for "help." The reader, however, is not informed about the necessity for, or the kind and the extent of, the assistance—information which is needed as a basis for a fair evaluation of the statements made by the student. In lines 6-8, the strong suggestion of carelessness and negligence—of the disregard of the "obligation" of the government to help the unfortunate and the suffering—is reinforced by the comments in lines 8-11, in which one sees the starving and shelterless disregarded by indifferent men managing a huge government.

In the second paragraph (lines 12-13), the sketching of a somewhat startling contrast is begun by the use of the term "action" (line 13)—a term which repeats the suggestion of inaction on the part of the preceding administration. Further slanting occurs in the use of "alleviate" (line 16), used in the sense, one supposes, of "enact" and
"ameliorate." The insistence on adherence to what the student sees as "duty" (line 18) is repeated, and in line 19 the vague term "help" is used, without explanation. One might well expect further analysis of ways in which a depression can be "put down" and the unemployed "helped"; for these problems are far from being simple. The student's list of judgments is completed by the unqualified statement in lines 21-23, which can safely be termed resounding but abstract.

Question (History 403). Explain and comment on W. B. Phillips' statement that the plantation was a school for the training of the Negro.

History answer 22. Phillips' statement that the plantation was a school for training Negroes means that the plantation taught the Negroes basic things — religion (the main thing) and how to do their work on the plantations. In other words, the plantations taught the Negro everything he needed to know for the plantation, plus religion.

The student seems to have decided that the plantation "taught the Negroes basic things." He has restricted his discussion to this version, and has defined these "basic things," in lines 4-6, as religion and "how to do their work on the plantation." In developing and explaining his discussion, he might well have mentioned (a) the idea of many Southern owners of plantations that they were taking care of their Negroes, who were, after all, unsophisticated and ignorant; (b) the efforts of many of these Southern slaveholders to give added responsibilities to the more capable Negroes, even training some of the slaves for a trade. Instead, the student, in lines 6-9, has used a fairly high level of abstraction in what is intended to be another definition of "basic things." Here, then, oversimplification of a broad concept is
accompanied by faulty organization of ideas.

Question (History 423). How and why was our tariff policy changed between 1930 and 1940?

History answer 110. Our tariff set-up at the close of the war was one of a normal protection [slanting, with oversimplification and is of identity]. But the farmers of the United States were in dire need of some protection for their overproduced farm goods [slanting, with oversimplification and is of classification]. With the passage of the Smoot-Hawley Tariff, everything was thought to be fine. This tariff discouraged imports to such an extent that hardly any produced were coming into the country [slanting, with oversimplification and confused thinking].

In examples of slanting, one expects to find restriction of ideas to fit conclusions precedent reached. Such a procedure can be seen in History answers 22, 110, and 132: Ideas which might serve to modify or even to negate the contentions of the student writers have been omitted or slurred over. This omission or slurring over is shown in several ways. The first is the opposition of ideas—close to the two-valued orientation—through the use of words many of which are abstract or highly connotative. A second aspect is the lack of qualification; the majority of the statements have little evidence to modify or to support them. Moreover, steps in thinking are often omitted. Finally, the thinking—and the expression—are frequently confused and hard to follow.

In summarizing the results of the analysis of the responses in history, the writer will offer, first, an observation on the subject matter of the questions (with reference to the use of emotive language); second, figures showing the frequency and classification of errors;
and, third, examples of superior or excellent answers.

In the section on economics, the statement was made that some of the examination questions concern theories about which there is considerable disagreement. That statement holds true for the examination questions and discussion topics in the history courses. For instance, perhaps little emotion would be stirred up in a consideration of the South Carolina Exposition; but there is a distinct possibility of emotion in discussions of the background of the New Deal. It will be noted, in this connection that of the two courses in American history, the 400-level course (History 403) is concerned with early American history. The 500-level course (History 537), on the other hand, deals with recent events, as does History 423 (The Twentieth Century).

Second, the enrollment figures for the major class groups in history, during the academic year 1952-1953, are appended:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course</th>
<th>Enrollment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>403</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>421</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>422</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>423</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>537</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

We may now proceed to a summary of the analyses under the six major headings, the first of which is Abstraction.
ABSTRACTION

1. Dead-level abstraction

| Number of responses inspected |  
|-------------------------------|---
| 403                           | 3  
| 422                           | 6  
| 423                           | 6  
| 537                           | 2  

In the responses listed above, two groups of errors are represented, with vagueness and ambiguity in both. In the first group, many abstractions used show the need for further information—detail—in order that the reader may follow the meaning easily and clearly. In the second group are a number of high-level abstractions, usually unqualified; most of the few examples used are ineffective, chiefly because they are irrelevant or unduly brief—and sometimes close to two-valued orientation. It will be noted that several responses are from History 422 and 423—classes made up of beginning students writing about problems of the nineteenth and the twentieth century. The writers of these responses appear to have more difficulty in the avoidance of dead-level abstracting than do the more advanced students, even though the material under discussion in both 422-423 and in 537 is such as to evoke at least occasional disagreement.

2. High-level abstractions, with some detail but sweeping generalizations

| Number of responses inspected |  
|-------------------------------|---
| 423                           | 6  
| 537                           | 2  

Three aspects of these responses appear to be of major significance. First, though a number of the abstractions used are partially explained by means of the use of some detail, most of the qualifying words and phrases employed are insufficient for clarity. Second, many abstractions, the majority of them connotative, are without qualification. Finally, in these answers, the students employ generalizations without supporting evidence. Beginning students appear to have more trouble than do advanced students in avoiding these difficulties in the use of abstractions, and have often succumbed to the temptation to use the breadth of abstractions as a springboard for sweeping assertions.

3. High-level abstractions, with looseness of thought

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>403</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>421</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>422</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the responses listed above, the high-order abstractions, though few in number, are central in the thought; they are, however, not supplied with clear, unmistakable referents. Second, these answers are lacking—often seriously so—in coherence: The sequence of ideas is unclear; steps in thinking are omitted; and faulty logic frequently appears. Moreover, the students often proffer opinion, rather than evaluation. It will be noted that these types of error appear more frequently in the papers of beginning students than in those of more advanced students. The former seem to have more difficulty with (a) the use of both high and low levels of abstraction and (b) the
logical organization of ideas.

SYMBOLS

1. Word-magic, with high-order abstractions and loose thinking
   Number of responses inspected
   421 2
   422 2

Here, the students are sufficiently preoccupied with symbols so that analysis and evaluation seem restricted. Lack of adequate appraisal is accompanied by circular reasoning. Second, unclarified high-order abstractions, because of their multiple meanings, increase the looseness of the thinking. In view of the above, it is not surprising that the sequence of ideas in these answers is often unclear. It will be noted that students in the middle group—but still on the 400 level—seem to have more difficulty than do the more advanced students in using words charged with broad meaning. Careful analysis and qualification are necessary in using such terms effectively; and the more advanced students are perhaps better qualified to avoid this combination of major language difficulties and to evaluate objectively.

2. Word-magic, with two-valued orientation
   Number of responses inspected
   403 3

In these responses, as in the four just considered, one finds a lack of analysis and definition of symbols. To these students, the use of a symbol seems to be equivalent to proof. They phrase judgments rather than evaluate evidence. Second, as a result of this attitude,
antitheses are often used to set up two-valued orientation. Many ideas,
too, are expressed in mildly startling but rather unconvincing stereo-
types. Beginning students, it appears, have more difficulty here than
do the others in perceiving the need for caution in wording, for weigh-
ing and considering evidence, and for avoiding belief in the inherent
value of symbols.

3. Word-magic, with
connotation and metaphor

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of</th>
<th>Number of</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>responses</td>
<td>responses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>inspected</td>
<td>inspected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>403</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>422</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

First, in these answers, one sees the unquestioning faith in the
symbols used, the idea that the symbols are realities and that their use
will influence events in the experiential world. Second, connotation is
used to appeal to prejudice; signal reactions are thus encouraged.
Furthermore, the employment of metaphor, often inaccurate, strengthens
the effect of connotation. The result of this combination is a loss of
objectivity. As in the other two uses of symbols considered above,
there are more errors in the work of students in the 403 and 421-422-423
groups than in the responses of students at the 500 level.

CONTEXTS

1. Shifts in meaning of
key terms, with high-
level abstraction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of</th>
<th>Number of</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>responses</td>
<td>responses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>inspected</td>
<td>inspected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>403</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>422</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>537</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The reader finds that in these responses a number of contradictions and paradoxes are unexplained. Often the ideas are implicit but not developed, and the reader is often unsure of the meaning, especially when, as in these answers, the meaning of major terms shifts unexpectedly. The lack of clarity in thought and in the use of words indicates that many major ideas and their interrelationships are unclear in the minds of the student writers. The confusion is increased by the use of a number of unqualified high-order abstractions. This interplay of abstraction and context results in considerable difficulty for the students. The work of students at the three levels is represented here.

2. Shifts in meaning, with connotation and two-valued orientation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>421</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>422</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Because, in these answers, the students make little or no effort to clarify the shifts in meaning of key words, vagueness and inexactness result. The students seem content to use these terms without explanation sufficient to communicate meaning clearly. Moreover, the judgments offered, often phrased in connotative terms, lead to two-valued orientation. Usually, little or no evidence is offered in support of these statements. Students in the 421-422-423 group seem to have more difficulty than do those in the more advanced group, in coping with multiple meanings, expressing ideas with precision, and maintaining objectivity. It is rather surprising, perhaps, that more
errors of this type do not appear in answers from the 403 group.

**FORMS OF TO BE**

1. *Is of identity and is of classification, with high-level abstraction*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
<th>1421</th>
<th>423</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Forms of *to be* are used in these responses to equate words on different levels of abstraction, frequently on high levels. Thus, the finality which often results from the careless use of forms of *to be* is combined with dead-level abstracting. As a result, vagueness and impressive certitude appear in these responses; difficult problems are dealt with and solved with brevity and dispatch. It seems noteworthy that students in the first and third quarters of the 1421-422-423 sequence, more than in the beginning or the more advanced courses, show some inability to perceive—or, at any rate, to express—shades of meaning, definition, and qualification.

2. *Forms of to be, with connotation*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
<th>1422</th>
<th>423</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In these responses, as in the answers considered under group 1, above, the use of forms of *to be* gives the impression that the problems under discussion—and some of them are complex—have been solved clearly, conclusively, and thoroughly within the limits of brief statements. Such assurance and certitude are often reinforced by the
phrasing of judgments in connotative terms—terms which reveal emotions and appeal to them, and are designed to persuade. Students in the "middle group" (History 422-423), especially, have difficulty in showing shades of meaning, in maintaining objectivity, and in exercising due reserve in making statements.

**TWO-VALUED ORIENTATION**

1. Two-valued orientation, with antitheses and high-level abstraction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>403</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>423</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In these responses, finality, often accompanying the two-valued orientation, is noticeable. The students, apparently certain that their contentions are sound, use little or no qualification in their discussions. Under these circumstances, it is perhaps to be expected that major ideas—many of them unexplained—are balanced against each other. Even though some detail is employed, its use is uneven, frequently ineffective. Examination of the responses indicates that beginning students have more difficulty here than do those in the more advanced section.

2. Oversimplification, with high-level abstractions and connotation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>423</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>537</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In these responses, the reader notices, first, the oversimplification. The students, reacting with little analysis but considerable
certitude, reduce difficult problems to easy ones by giving only two sides of a problem or situation—the good and the bad, the right and the wrong. Second, the use of many high-level abstractions—as a rule used without sufficient illustrative material—makes for some vagueness and lack of precision. Moreover, the connotative terms, while perhaps useful in reflecting the students' feeling concerning the question under discussion, serve more as a means of persuasion than of analysis. Students in the two most advanced groups seem, perhaps rather surprisingly, to have more trouble here than the beginning students have.

The sixth major heading, Emotive language, has three subheadings, Connotation, Metaphor, and Slanting. Let us turn to the first of these.

CONNOTATION

1. Personal connotations, with high-level abstraction and generalization

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>403</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>421</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>422</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>423</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>537</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

First, the students, because of their use of words rich in suggestibility, have, in large part, recorded emotional reactions. Instead of objective analysis, one usually finds implications and associations. Second, personal, rather than general, connotations
are often evident, as has been shown in the discussion of the students' use of such terms as "sound," "Utopia," and "quality." Last, many high-level abstractions, employed with little or no explanation, frequently serve as the basis for generalization. This type of misinterpretation involves, then, confusion of the descriptive and the inferential levels. The work of students at all levels is represented here.

2. Connotation, with metaphor

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>421</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>537</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These responses show how connotation can be combined with metaphor to produce name-calling. The students' writing evokes associations and images, rather than serving as a means of communicating ideas which can be verified because of clear, definite referents. These associations and images are picturesque, but the reader is unsure of the appropriateness of the metaphors used as he is of the amount of verifiable information in the responses. Metaphor, like connotation, can be used to support and to illuminate; but here, it is used to dazzle and persuade. Students in the first quarter of the 421-422-423 group appear to have more difficulty here than do beginners in 403.

METAPHOR

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>421</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>537</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The metaphors, in the first place, are often inappropriate: The analogies are strained so that the students can make the figures of speech apply to everything that they write. Moreover, the metaphors are usually unsupported by evidence which will substantiate the implicit contentions. In these answers, furthermore, the figures of speech which are used show rather clearly the attitudes of the students; and the certitude is strengthened by the use of forms of to be. The responses represent a combination of approximation and assurance. Here, both intermediate and advanced students seem to have difficulty. They may have some command of materials, but they often employ metaphors which are more convenient than accurate.

2. Metaphor, with connotation and vagueness

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
<th>537</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

In these answers, the metaphors used do not seem particularly appropriate to the subjects discussed. They are inconsistent—occasionally spectacular, interesting, but not especially helpful in assisting the reader to follow the discussions. Moreover, the images evoked by these figures of speech are complicated by those called forth by connotative words. The opinions and prejudices of the students are shown, as are the attempts to stir the reader to a decision. Here, connotation—as it often does—works through name-calling. It may be noted that the work of students in the upper group is represented here.
SLANTING

1. **Slanting, with connotation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>403</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>423</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In these responses, the students have made up their minds in advance, and, instead of evaluating evidence, appear to have arranged it. Moreover, exaggeration, chiefly through the use of connotative words—many of them capable of arousing prejudices and bias—is involved. In many of these answers, the result is investive; the assertions are unsupported by anything more than the opinion of the student writing the answer. The reader will observe that the responses of students in the h21-h22-h23 sequence, as well as those of beginners, are represented here. These students have confused subjective comment, on the inferential level, with objective appraisal and evaluation.

2. **Slanting, with oversimplification and confused thinking**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>403</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>423</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Predetermined conclusions influence the ideas advanced and the evidence considered in these responses. Furthermore, the ideas listed are often diametrically opposed, and the respondents offer little evidence to show the significance of the ideas or to indicate other possible approaches. These answers show some lack of discrimination and of analytical ability, as well as a tendency on the part of the student writers to take the easiest way, the simplest way. Third-quarter students in the survey course appear to have more difficulty here than do others.
The following portion of the chapter will consist of a few responses which may be classed as superior or excellent.

Question (History 403). Briefly indicate the contents of Hanson's "The Flight from Hunger."

History answer 33. In Hansen's article "The Flight from Hunger," the author points out how any army of English, Irish, and Germans came to our land. They came for economic and political reasons. They came because they were starving. The article tells of how hungry the people were and how they needed wheat and corn, and of how when they finally got the wheat and corn it was too late. Many had starved; many had died. When the Irish finally got the wheat that would help them, they did not know how to use it, or how to bake bread. The article tells us, moreover, that many of the immigrants died on the way over from deadly fevers, and that some of the survivors tried to sneak across the Canadian border.

Some states enacted laws to prevent these people from entering, but such legislation was declared unconstitutional. Many of the immigrants eventually made new homes in the North.

The weaknesses which the reader notices seem to be chiefly in organization. Because of inadequate transition (lines 4-6 and 21-22, the sequence of ideas is unclear. Faulty sentence structure, too (as in lines 6-10) adds to the difficulties in following the meaning.

On the other hand, the student has, for the most part, maintained objectivity. He has kept, with few exceptions, to the descriptive level (lines 11-13, for instance) and has used comparatively few connotative terms such as "sneak" (line 17).
Moreover, he has used low-order abstractions along with high-level ones; his use of detail is quite consistent, and is one of the strong points of the response.

The second answer is from a section of History 421.

Question (History 421). Discuss the rise and fall of the Federalist party, showing the accomplishments of the party, its stand on domestic and foreign issues, and the reasons for its decline.

History answer 61. The Federalist party was largely responsible for the early success of the government of the United States. It led the young nation through some of its darkest hours, and helped the central government to use the power granted by the Constitution. Suspicious of the radical democrats, the Federalists favored a strong central government. Because of this attitude, they were responsible for the passage of the Alien and Sedition Acts, which provided for restrictions on immigration and for punishment for those who maliciously attacked the President or Congress. In foreign relations, the Federalists were pro-British, and did not favor close relations with France. Therefore, the Federalists helped to keep America from entering into an alliance with France during the rule of Napoleon.

Many Americans, reflecting on the Alien and Sedition Acts, feared that the Federalists were trying to set up a monarchical system of government, and in the election of 1800, the Federalists were defeated.

In this response, the reader observes a few unqualified high-order abstractions, such as "radical democrats" (line 6). Emotive language, moreover, is present, as in the phrase "the darkest hours" (line 5). Further information seems needed, too,

In spite of the weaknesses noted above, however, the response has considerable merit. The use of detail is uneven, but the student appears to perceive the need for the use of low as well as high levels of abstraction. Second, the student has remained objective in his discussion, and has organized the ideas rather effectively.

The third of the responses is as follows:

**Question (History 422). Discuss the frontier as a distinctive influence in American life.**

*History answer 79.* The frontier was the region in the United States where settlement ended and wilderness and free land began. It is defined as the area having at least two and no more than six people per square mile. The frontier promoted social equality—no man had to work for anyone else; there was no class distinction, and land was cheap and easy to get. It promoted political democracy—all individuals had equal rights; there was economic independence, a feeling of security and individualism. The frontier helped to bring about such democratic reforms as universal manhood suffrage, woman suffrage, and direct election of senators. It promoted nationalism. There was a feeling of self-sufficiency, and the idea of democracy sprang up; the people looked toward the national government for aid in internal improvements. With emergence of the frontier, old prejudices were erased. There were individual rights and liberty for everyone. Also with the emergence of the frontier, the United States was no longer so dependent upon Europe. The frontier furnished the industrial cities with natural resources, etc.; it provided a good market for goods from
the East; and it provided a place for the investment of surplus capital.

Though some unqualified high-level abstractions, such as "prejudices" (line 21) and "individual rights and liberty" (lines 22-23) are used, the student has qualified and limited the majority of the high-order abstractions, and has used sufficient illustrative material to make his meaning clear—at least, in most parts of the answer. He has defined and limited the topic, and, for the most part, has remained objective. The first part of the response, it may be noted, is more specific and clear than is the last part.

The next response is from a section of History 423.

Question (History 423). Choose either Mussolini or Hitler, describe the circumstances, (immediate and background) that enabled him to come to power, describe the philosophy and program of the movement he led, and evaluate his achievement.

History answer 122. Benito Mussolini was the son of a blacksmith, who in his early years earned his living by various means, such as elementary-school teaching and journalism. A pronounced radical, he clamored for Italian entry into the war on the Allied side, and during the war rose to the rank of corporal. During the war, he was "exhilarated" by the excitement and calamity of warfare, and felt, at last, that he was part of something. After the war, the disillusionment was bitter, and he sought excitement, which he found in working with the Fascists, who put the glorification of violence and war above all else.

Similarly after the war, there was in Italy a great deal of disillusionment. The Treaty of Versailles had not been as generous to Italy as the Italians expected. The unification of the country
was incomplete, and the high taxes resulting from the war debt helped to foster unrest.

The government was incompetent, and to the Italians, who had been used to authority, it seemed inadequate (as does all democracy which is not functioning properly). There was a great deal of labor unrest fostered by the Communists, and this added kindling to the growing unrest. Mussolini, sensing this, planned a seizure of power by his Fascists. He rose to power largely because the General of the Army persuaded the King not to use martial law to stop Mussolini. Actually, his "march on Rome" was a farce, and by taking advantage of the troubled conditions he became Il Duce.

The philosophy of Fascism is extremely difficult to define. The members of the group had no definite programs; the offered help to some, and contradicted themselves later in offering help to others. They used all types of methods and devices to gain their ends, mainly violence; and, to use Mussolini's terms, they wished to restore the "Roman Empire."

Actually, the Fascist philosophy was merely that they would remain in power and reign supreme. Any method, any means, any way to accomplish this was justifiable. War, especially on smaller opponents, was the height of Fascist glorification.

Mussolini's achievement is almost forgotten today; yet it is unfortunate that so demented a demagogue could take advantage of circumstance, seize power, and pave the way for another world war, more disastrous than the first. It is true that he did help Italy, always poverty stricken, in certain material ways, such as building construction, expansion of mining, and swamp clearance, but it must be remembered that he did this only for himself and the Fascists. By making a stronger, more unified Italy, he created a stronger Duce.
There are, it appears, two major weaknesses in this response. First, several unqualified high-level abstractions, such as "excitement and calamity of warfare" (lines 9-10), "disillusionment" (line 18), and "authority" (line 27), are used. Second, oversimplification, chiefly through the use of the is of classification (lines 22, 41), occurs.

Yet even though a rather high level of abstraction is at times employed, enough details are used—and enough insight is shown—for clarity. Interpretation on the part of the reader is aided, too, by the clear arrangement of ideas. In the majority of his statements, the student has avoided finality and slanting, and has submitted, on the whole, a balanced, understandable analysis.

The final example of a creditable answer comes from a section of History 537.

Question (History 537). Discuss the factors which led to a split in the Republican party in 1912.

History answer 186. Among the factors which led to the split in the Republican party in 1912, the most basic was the cleavage which had been developing for some time between the conservatives and the younger progressives in the party. Many of the events in Taft's administration alienated these progressives, and especially offended Theodore Roosevelt, who was to become the standard-bearer of the progressive "Bull-Moose" group which broke away from the party in 1912. Taft came into office with many people feeling that he was pledged to carry on Roosevelt's work before him. However, Taft was of a more legalistic mind and proceeded more
cautiously on such matters as trust
prosecution. (Actually, however, more
trusts were prosecuted under Taft than under
the more impetuous T. R.) One incident
concerning the trusts particularly alienated
Roosevelt. While in office, he had allowed
the United States Steel Corporation to
absorb a smaller company and had promised
them exemption from anti-trust prosecution
for this move. Taft, however, did
prosecute the Steel Corporation, and T. R.
felt that his promise had been betrayed.

Another incident of the Taft administra-
tion which added to the party dissension
was the Elkins Act, which the liberals felt
would weaken the Interstate Commerce
Commission. These more progressive
Republicans resented the fact that Taft
made no effort to help them in their fight
against the conservatives over the issue.

One of the final events which
convinc ed Republican progressives that
Taft had gone completely over to the
conservative side was the passage and
acceptance of the Payne-Aldrich Tariff.
This measure set higher tariffs still
than the Dingley Tariff which preceded it;
it was a confusion of inequitable and
prohibitive rates brought about by lobbying
and log-rolling. Taft, instead of vetoing
the measure, as the progressives thought
he should, actually defended it publicly
as the best tariff the Republicans had ever
passed.

Another incident which convinced
liberals that Taft was anti-progressive
was the Ballinger incident, in which the
President upheld his Secretary of the
Interior against the charge of Pinchot and
Glavis that Ballinger was permitting land
which had been set aside for conservation
to fall into the hands of private business.

Added to these factors was the growing
personal animosity between Taft and
Roosevelt. When the time arrived for the
Republican convention, the progressives
within the party had had enough of Taft and
conservative administration, and they knew
that in T. R. they had a strong leader.
Reading this response, one will notice some use of connotative words, such as "more impetuous" (line 19) and "inequitable" (line 43)—terms showing judgments rather than facts. Then, too, such high-order abstractions as "conservative" and "progressive" are used.

Even with these weaknesses, however, the answer shows that the student has offered, on the whole, analysis rather than opinion. He has used enough detail and has arranged his ideas clearly enough to communicate his ideas rather specifically. The verbal context is clear; and the student has, for the most part, avoided slanting and two-valued orientation. The response leaves an impression of fairness.

These responses, as the present writer has indicated, are not without flaws. The errors occur, however, less frequently, and therefore impair communication to a lesser degree, than in the answers discussed earlier in this portion of the chapter.

In the preceding detailed analysis, certain difficulties and errors stand high: dead-level abstraction; high-level abstraction, with some detail but with sweeping generalizations; high-level abstraction, with looseness of thought; use of forms of to be, with high-level abstractions; use of forms of to be, with connotation; personal connotation, with high-level abstractions and generalizations; and slanting, with connotation. The writers of the last group of responses have, to a large extent, avoided these difficulties. They have, on the contrary, tried to be
specific and objective, to express ideas clearly and effectively, and to remain at the descriptive rather than the inferential level.

We may now turn to the responses in history which also have been analyzed in some detail, the findings summarized, and examples of superior or excellent answers offered. The following section is devoted to a presentation of recommendations, based on the findings, for use in the teaching of history.

As before, the recommendations concern procedures within the six classifications—Abstraction, Symbols, Contexts, Uses of to be, Two-valued orientation, Referential and emotive language—serving as the basis for the analyses; and comments and suggestions which apply to all the areas considered in the study—social studies, English, and professional education—will be found at the beginning of Chapter VIII. It may be noted, too, that, occasionally, combinations of linguistic and semantic errors in responses in history are similar to groups of errors in the answers analyzed in the section on economics. Under such circumstances, the procedures recommended are similar.

Let us consider, first of all, the responses analyzed under the heading Abstraction.

ABSTRACTION

The reader will recall that answers analyzed under the above heading are grouped as follows: (a) dead-level abstraction, with vagueness and ambiguity; (b) high-level abstractions, with
some detail but with sweeping generalization; (c) high-level abstractions, with looseness of thought. These types of error appear more frequently in the papers of beginners than in those of more advanced students.

The following proposals are submitted:

**Dead-level abstraction.** Though the discriminating and effective use of technical terms appears to constitute less of a problem in the responses in history than in those in economics, instruction and practice in definition (especially by means of examples and details and by operational definition) of such terms as "labor unrest," "industrialization," and "special interests"—in the contexts identifying the meaning to be emphasized—may well be given.

As the dead-level abstracting in the responses is on a consistently high level, study and discussion of such an answer as the following may be conducted. The students might be shown that, though the first two sentences constitute the basis for a tenable answer, the sentences which follow reveal some unsureness in grasp and vagueness in communication of ideas. In the discussion, too, emphasis would be placed on the attainment of increased concreteness and substantiation of statements through the use of brief phrasal explanation of such passages as "not enough public force and emphasis on conditions," "skipped over such measures when enforcing their programs," and "poor conditions."
Question (History 422). Explain why the United States was somewhat slower than European nations in adopting social legislation.

History answer 73. The U. S. was very slow in comparison to other countries, in adopting social legislation. This was due mainly to the fact that while the governments of European countries were promoting such legislation, any attempts here were purely on the state and local levels. Even these attempts were not successful because there was not enough public force and emphasis on conditions. Government officials said action would be taken, but they skipped over such measures when enforcing their programs. It was only when certain individuals perceived the poor conditions and wrote factual reports of them that the public became aware of them and began to clamor for improvement.

Using several questions and discussion topics as a basis for his work, the instructor, by means of brief presentations along with blackboard demonstrations, may suggest (a) tentative organization of materials (through suggestions for outlining), and (b) possible examples which might be used. He may also include an explanation of why certain types of definition are more effective than others. Such questions as the following lend themselves well to the procedure described above:

Explain why the United States was somewhat slower than European nations in adopting social legislation.

Discuss the results of Harding's belief that what the country needed was "more business in government and less government in business."

Using similar, suitable subjects, students may be asked to imitate for concreteness such passages as the following:
From the standpoint of posterity the revolution in industry, mining and transportation was even more important than that in agriculture. The progress in manufacturing since the Civil War, according to the United States industrial commission in 1902, was "probably the most rapid change in the methods of industry observable in any time in history."

Through the substitution of machinery for men, the widespread introduction of steam for water power, and the application of a minute subdivision of labor to the processes of manufacturing, along with other favoring conditions, factory production advanced at an unparalleled pace. The records of the patent office shed some light upon the role played by invention. With less than 62,000 patents granted in all the years before 1865, the number during the remainder of the century reached nearly 638,000. Until the 1880's farming continued to be the chief fount of national wealth, but the census of 1890 gave first place to manufacturing, and ten years later the value of manufactured products was over twice that of agricultural. From less than two billion dollars in 1860, the output of American mills and ships grew more than double in a decade and from 1860 to 1880 trebled. The share of labor-saving machinery in this advance appears in the fact that, though from 1860 to 1890 the number of factory hands increased threefold, the total product increased fivefold. The rate of growth in particular industries was even more astounding. By 1894 the United States had leaped from fourth place, her rank as a manufacturing nation in 1860, to first in all the world. At that time her output exceeded the total for both Great Britain and Germany.

The chief development took place in the East, where southern New England, eastern and southern New York and large sections of Pennsylvania and New Jersey became thoroughly industrialized. New England excelled in textiles, the finer grades of paper, and boots and shoes; Pennsylvania in tanning and iron and steel products;
New Jersey in silks; New York in the bewildering variety and total value of her wares. At the same time factories spread into the Midwest in such numbers as to cause the center of manufactures in the nation to shift from western Pennsylvania in 1860 to northeastern Ohio (near Canton) in 1890. Broadly speaking, industrial enterprise in Middle America turned to the fabrication of farm implements, railway supplies, building materials, furniture, prepared foods and drinks. Chicago, the center of a great network of transportation facilities, possessed nearly eight hundred woodworking establishments, machine shops and metal works by 1880, besides more than a hundred breweries and distilleries.13

High-level abstraction, with some detail but with sweeping generalization. Exercises in using various methods of developing materials in paragraphs and series of connected paragraphs may be employed. The errors revealed in the analyses suggest that practice in using the three methods listed below (with illustrative passages) may prove helpful.

a. Repetition

It is quite obvious that no single factor, neither climate, terrain, economics, religion, the frontier, nor any other, is all-important in influence; and I have in the course of this volume ventured to suggest that, because the frontier does not bring about the same reactions with other races and in all other places as it brought about in the United States, we must therefore allow for other factors as well. The frontier is no complete explanation, but it has assuredly been a most important element. We have had not

merely one frontier to be settled before an older civilization became established, but such a succession of them as might almost be numbered by hundreds. We can check the factors involved in one and the influences radiating from it by comparing them with those in a continuous succession of others. It seems to be incontrovertible that the frontier has exerted much the influence on our life which has been noted thus far in this volume.\textsuperscript{14}

b. Obverse internation.

Recently a distinguished historian has minimized the importance of the end of the frontier by stating that he does not find that it made any difference in the "fundamental rhythm of American life," a somewhat vague phrase. He adds that in fact the frontier did not come to an end, as the government stated, claiming that the number of acres taken out under the Homestead Act since 1890 greatly exceed the number patented before. He admits that his figures are misleading, as they take no account of the railroad or State grants. How misleading they are is indicated by the fact that the railroad grants were 130,000,000 acres and the State grants probably several tens of millions more. This goes far toward invalidating his argument, but what he apparently fails to see, when he speaks of the large amount of land taken up after 1890 and even of the "cheap abandoned farm lands in the East and the South that go begging for buyers," is that such lands do not constitute a "frontier." The genuine frontier was not merely a staked claim to a farm; it was a state of mind and a golden opportunity. The men and women who trekked westward, advancing the edge of civilization from over the Alleghenies across the three

thousand miles of continent—empty, except for Indians—to the Pacific, came under influences entirely different from those of a man of to-day who, tired of being a laborer or clerk, tries the experiment of buying an abandoned farm on some New England hillside within easy reach of the village and the whole of modern American civilized life. The latter has none of that feeling of vast open space, of pushing ahead of the van of older civilizations, of empire building, of a freer and better chance, of a more democratic ordering of his society, of the possibility of rapidly rising in a new community, or of the opportunities which come with the develop­ ment of a wholly new country where cities may spring up almost overnight and make him rich and a leading citizen in wealth or political power. To take up a bit of land today, East, South, or West, is for the most part simply to change one's residence or perhaps one's occupation. It is to become an ordinary farmer, not to share in a great adventure of State building and to have golden dreams of a possible future if one has the luck to strike it right. The psychological conditions are wholly different. 15

The chief transforming influence in the open-air life of the people, however, was a new mechanical marvel, the self-propelling motor vehicle. As far back as 1893 ingenious young mechanics—C. E. Duryea in Chicopee, Massachusetts, Henry Ford in Detroit, R. E. Olds in Lansing—had devised crude gasoline--
driven cars, but European inventors had anticipated them and, for over a decade, the French and English produced more and better cars than did Americans. As American manufacturers made progress in standardizing the processes, however, and resorted

15Ibid., pp. 304-305.
increasingly to mass production, the price was steadily brought within reach of the average purse, and the automobile swung into a tremendous popularity. The number in use rose from 300 in 1895 to 78,000 in 1905 and to 2,156,000 in 1915. The motor car ceased being a luxury of the rich—of the "automobility," as a wag put it—and rapidly became a part of the normal equipment of American life. The social effects were incalculable. Not only did it restore the forgotten delights of the open country to growing numbers of urban dwellers, not only did it help break down provincial barriers and mitigate rural isolation, but it built up a whole new cluster of industries, provided employment for millions, gave a new push to the good roads movement and, in countless ways, increased the momentum of American civilization. The widespread introduction of the self-starting device in 1913 and 1914 insured that the future would see women vie with men as drivers of cars.

Also suggested is analysis of several responses for (a) quality of the evidence offered—its accuracy, typicality, relevance, and adequacy; (b) caution in formulation—the use of qualifying words or phrases; (c) objectivity. Such a passage as the following may be so analyzed.

Question (History 423). What are the similarities between the British domestic policies of the thirties and the policies of the New Deal?

History answer 171. The similarities in England and the United States are twofold.

16 Schlesinger, op. cit., p. 366.
1. Similar backgrounds of reaction and conservative control leading up to the world reaction.

2. Similar over-all plan to solve the depression: i.e., raising prices to increase buying power. Thus the British nationalization of industry and crop schemes corresponded to our attempts to regulate agriculture and let industry regulate its prices. Doles to the unemployed and public works projects also were similar. The British created their inflation by devaluating the pound (under a Labor M. P.). This increased export income, raised prices, cut wage earners' buying power, and balanced the budget (which was necessary for a French loan). Thus the United States and Britain used economic techniques which had no relation to human need: i.e., creating inflation and scarcity first to increase buying power.

High-level abstraction, with looseness of thought.

Instruction and practice in the organization of materials may be used. Such instruction and practice may involve (a) work with topic and sentence outlines; (b) the use of transitional expressions; (c) the effective use of parallel structure. Students should be encouraged to formulate and use a number of plans.

The training and review suggested above may well involve, furthermore, exercises in developing paragraphs and groups of connected paragraphs by the following methods (illustrated by brief passages):

a. Comparison and contrast

So, as the new century dawned, a demand for more legislation against the trusts arose on all sides. Having in mind western farmers, southern planters, people of the smaller towns, and workingmen of the cities, Democratic chieftains with a
radical cast of thought inveighed against the trusts as a matter of course and conviction. Socialists hailed the new giants as proof that competition destroyed itself and prepared the economic structure for the inevitable Marxian transition. Feeling the solid earth tremble under their feet, Republican leaders spoke in favor of cutting away the "evils" of the trusts by regulation. Even the astute Hanna, on whom fell the burden of collecting campaign funds in "the high places of Wall Street," thinking that the Republicans should break their reticence in 1900, approved a cautious anti-trust plank drafted by Senator Foraker for the party platform of that year. Unwittingly, therefore, Theodore Roosevelt, raised to the presidency by a stroke of Atropos, was furnished a canonical text for many prolix messages and impetuous speeches on the trust question and given the color of justification for instituting several prosecutions against corporations accused of restraining trade. His successor, Taft, pressed forward along similar lines and in 1911 actually secured at the hands of the Supreme Court a dissolution of the Standard Oil and the American Tobacco companies into several individual but friendly concerns.

Still the Democrats were not appeased. Their spokesman, Woodrow Wilson, in proclaiming the New Freedom, promised to restore the old and happy days of competition when every person with a little capital could go into business and taste the wine of liberty—and profits—for himself. So on coming to power, the Democrats proceeded to enact the Clayton anti-trust law of 1914, an elaborate measure which in letter at least threatened to tear apart all combinations large enough to control prices in their respective areas. But the mild fright that it immediately caused in business circles was allayed in time by a decision of the Supreme Court, to the effect that so great a giant as the United States Steel Company was not proscribed by the terms of the law.

In truth, grave doubts existed in many places as to whether pains and penalties of
any kind could restore the era of petty industry and unrestrained competition. Though appealing to the masses, the Democrats came to think more kindly of federal regulation; for they supplemented the Clayton Act by a bill which contemplated the control rather than the destruction of huge industrial combinations. Besides declaring unfair methods of competition illegal, the law in question created a federal trade commission and authorized it to co-operate with businessmen in establishing equitable practices. 17

b. Cause and effect

In the light of earlier history the war was significant chiefly because it marked the final expulsion of Spain from the Western Hemisphere. From a prospective point of view, however, it signalized a momentous departure in American policy. The United States, for the first time, became a colonial power in the New World and, through acquiring the Spanish holdings in the Pacific, besides Hawaii and Tutuila, it became an Asiatic power as well. The nation took under its wing nearly a million subjects of Spanish and Negro blood in Puerto Rico. It was master and protector of seven and a half million people in the Philippines, ranging from the civilized Tagalogs of Manila to the primitive Moros of the Sulu Peninsula and the head-hunting Igorots of northern Luzon. Like the Great Powers of Europe, the United States had at last chosen the path of empire. 18

In the examination of reports and responses, emphasis may be on (a) consideration of how the unqualified high-level abstractions—on which much of the meaning depends—may be


18 Schlesinger, op. cit., pp. 304-305.
interpreted in their contexts; (b) the use of examples and operational definitions to clarify the high-level abstractions—to connect words and experience; (c) the meaning and the use of descriptive and inferential levels of communication. Such responses as the following may be so considered.

**Question (History 403).** Discuss the major platform planks of the Republicans in 1860, stressing the shift of that party from a single-idea movement in 1856 to a successful sectional movement in 1860.

**History answer 2.** The major platform planks of the Republican party were to abolish slavery and unite the different sections into one section united together. Because the party was out to form a government where the people were a part, they had the people's vote. The party was successful in its platform, and Jefferson was made president. His works and planks were carried out to the best of his ability. He was out to abolish slavery, and after much hard work and time he finally succeeded. Slavery was abolished.

**SYMBOLS**

The responses analyzed under *Symbols* are classified as follows: (a) word-magic, with high-order abstractions and loose thinking, with restricted analysis and evaluation and with circular reasoning (shown, for the most part, in the work of students in the middle group, but still at the 400 level); (b) word-magic, with two-valued orientation, with antitheses and stereotypes (with beginning students having more trouble here than the others have); (c) word-magic, with connotation and metaphor (with more errors in the work of students in the 403 and 421-422-423 group than in the
responses of students at the 500 level.

The following recommendations are submitted:

Word-magic, with high-order abstractions and loose thinking.

Explanation—or review—of the major principles of the Ogden-Richards Triangle of Reference may be undertaken. In such a discussion, the instructor may well be chiefly concerned with (a) showing the lack of direct connection between the symbol and the referent; (b) explaining the relationship between the reaction to symbols and the experiential background of the listener or reader; (c) pointing out how confusion of symbol with object often leads to signal reactions.

In addition, studies of instances of such implicit acceptance of word-magic may be made. During the discussion of the response quoted below, attention may be drawn to (a) the use of repetition (the employment of "the frontier" five times in a brief response) and (b) the way in which the magic in "the frontier" has prevented the student from carefully analyzing the situation under consideration—for instance, from considering such aspects of the influence of the frontier as emphasis on utility, material success, physical strength, and optimism.

**Question (History 422). Discuss the frontier as a distinctive influence in American life.**

*History answer 70. The frontier was an important influence in American life. The frontier was an entirely new experience for the American people. It led to conditions never before encountered, at least for a number of centuries, for in Europe there*
was no frontier.

The frontier shaped American government, American policy, and American people. In this country where men had no titles, each helped the other. The frontier inspired nationalism. The frontier was America. In the Turner thesis, Mr. Turner says that this new way of life was made by the people and its influence on America can never be fully realized.

In such studies—and they may well be detailed, involving a number of possible interpretations of a given symbol—the instructor may stress (a) how belief in word-magic is shown (the idea that the use of a given symbol will influence events in the extensional world, and that repetition of the symbol will necessarily result in clarification); (b) how the symbol may be defined by means of examples and details and by operational definitions (including comments on how vagueness about a concept can contribute to looseness of thought in writing).

After the analyses and discussion suggested above, revision of the responses may be considered. Emphasis should be placed on (a) the adequacy of the evidence submitted (the amount, the sources, the adequacy of the sampling, and the relevance); (b) the caution and reserve shown in the presentation of evidence; (c) logical sequence of ideas. The use of index numbers and of dates is suggested.

Word-magic, with two-valued orientation. Such terms as "the common man," "the rich," "the poor," "a man of the people," "the simple common Westerner" may be defined—in various contexts—by
means of examples and details and of operational definitions. The various definitions may be considered from the standpoint of connection with experiential background and of stimulus to signal reaction.

Practice in using the descriptive level may be afforded by requesting the students to submit written responses to such questions as the following:

In what ways did the question of the Bank of the United States versus Jacksonian democracy illustrate the political and social philosophy of Jackson's party? In your answer, discuss such items as (1) Jackson's message vetoing the recharter of the Bank, (2) the role which the controversy played in the presidential campaign of 1832, (3) Jackson's actions relating to the Bank after that campaign.

In this procedure, the stress may well be on the sources of evidence offered, and the criteria used for evaluating the evidence.

Word-magic, with connotation and metaphor. Analysis of the use of such terms as "laboring man" and "free" may be made—for instance, in connection with such responses as that quoted below.

Question (History 422). Describe the teaching of Karl Marx, and discuss their significance.

History answer 72. Karl Marx's teachings consisted of the fact that he believed that the laboring man was being cheated. He said that the laboring man received only a small fraction of the value of products that he produced. He thought everything, such as railroads, power plants, and all other property, should be owned by the state. The laboring man, he thought, should have an equal chance. Churches and schools should
be run by the state. This arrangement should make the laboring man more free, and he would have less to worry about.

Marx and Engels brought the Communist Party out and made it known. Before they joined, it consisted of a few exiled Germans in France. The growth of this party made it bad for the monopolists and good for the laborer.

The discussion, which may help to show the nature and the results of confusion of word with object or idea, may be followed by suggestions concerning the organization of ideas and the use of qualifying terms. Students may well be requested (a) to substitute terms for such symbols as "laboring man" and "free"; (b) to maintain objectivity in the discussion; (c) to avoid the use of metaphor as a means of attempting to prove assertions.

The instructor and the class may consider possible connections between what James Harvey Robinson calls "rationalization" and belief in word magic. Such discussion would help students better to understand the relationship between confusion of word with object or idea, and signal reactions.

CONTEXTS

The following classifications are included under Contexts:
(a) shifts in meaning of key terms, with high-level abstraction (shown, for the most part, in the work of beginning students);
(b) shifts in meaning, with connotation and two-valued orientation (with students in the 421-422-423 sequence appearing to have more difficulty than do those in the more advanced classes).
The following recommendations may be helpful:

**Shifts in meaning of key terms, with high-level abstraction.**

It is suggested, first of all, that the meaning of such words as "freedom" be ascertained in various contexts. The following sentences may serve as examples:

1. The first amendment to the Constitution guarantees **freedom** of speech.

2. The prisoner was granted the **freedom** of the yard.

3. After acquittal, the man was given his **freedom**.

4. The dictator took away their last **freedom**.

5. The pioneers had the **freedom** of the frontier.

Second, students may be asked to ascertain the meaning of "freedom" in such responses as the following:

**Question (History 422).** Discuss the frontier as a distinctive influence upon American life.

**History answer.** The frontier was a definite influence upon American life. Once people were left on their own in a wilderness, they realized their responsibilities. Most important, they realized their freedom. Out on the frontier, there were no social classes. Even the women stood side by side with the men, whether it was working in the fields or fighting for their homes. Out of this life came a new spirit of freedom and equality that influenced American life greatly. It made the American people more freedom conscious and more ready to accept someone else as equal.

Class discussion should show how the meaning of "freedom" shifts from "civil liberty" to "personal liberty" to "exemption from external
"control" to, perhaps, "the absence of ceremony."

Such an answer as the following may be used for contrast:

Question (History 422). Discuss the Frontier as a distinctive influence in American life.

History answer 79. The frontier was the region in the United States where settlement ended and wilderness and free land began. It is defined as the area having at least two and no more than six people per square mile. The frontier promoted social equality—no man had to work for anyone else; there was no class distinction, and land was cheap and easy to get. It promoted political democracy—all individuals had equal rights; there was economic independence, a feeling of security and individualism. The frontier helped to bring about such democratic reforms as universal manhood suffrage, woman suffrage, and direct election of senators. It promoted nationalism. There was a feeling of self-sufficiency; and the idea of democracy sprang up; the people looked toward the national government for aid in internal improvements. With the emergence of the frontier, old prejudices were erased. There were individual rights and liberty for everyone. Also with the emergence of the frontier, the United States was no longer so dependent upon Europe. The frontier furnished the industrial cities with natural resources, etc.; it provided a good market for goods from the East; and it provided a place for the investment of surplus capital.

The instructor may point out that examples and operational definitions might have been used to clarify such high-order abstractions as "prejudices" and "individual rights and liberty," but that the majority of the high-order abstractions have been qualified and limited.
Shifts in meaning, with connotation and two-valued orientation. Students may be asked to examine such a passage as the following for the use of such words as "conflict" and "free," and the use of two-valued orientation.

But on the way to this present greatness and security the American people passed through one phase of dire conflict. The river steamboats, the railways, the telegraph, and their associate facilities, did not come soon enough to avert the deepening conflict of interests and ideas between the southern slave-holding states and the free industrial north. The railways and steamboats at first did but bring into sharper conflict an already established difference. There was a profound difference in spirit between the two sections of the United States, and the increasing unification due to the new means of transport made the question whether the southern spirit or the northern should prevail an ever more urgent one. There was little possibility of compromise. The northern spirit was free and individualistic; the southern made for great estates and a conscious gentility ruling over a dusky subject multitude. The sympathies of British liberalism and radicalism were for the north; the sympathies of the British landlords and the British ruling class were for the south.19

The instructor and class may wish to consider, in contrast, the following passage on the same topic:

The formation of the black belts in the Southwest . . . destroyed the unity of the transappalachian country; differences in

climate, soil, economic interest, and social
class characteristics gradually divided the
Mississippi Valley into opposing parts.
Instead of the small frontier farm, the
great plantation became the unit of
economic and social life in the Southwest.
The center of cotton cultivation shifted
from the South Atlantic states. In 1824 the
annual cotton production of the seaboard
states was almost double that of the
interior South, but by 1841 this ratio was
reversed. From this time on, it is safe to
regard the South, from the Atlantic to the
Mississippi River and even beyond (save for
the inarticulate poor white element) as a
compact political unit agreeing on all
fundamental policies affecting cotton culture
and slavery, though still superficially
divided in allegiance between the two great
national parties. The northern states did
not undergo a similar welding process, the
frontier farming regions of the Northwest
and the manufacturing and financial districts
of the older states differing in interests at
several points.20

Such student-written responses as the following may be
analyzed:

Question (History 422). Explain why the
United States was somewhat slower than
European nations in adopting social
legislation.

History answer 84. The United States was
not as industrially inclined as European
countries to start with. More farmer groups
than labor groups, and it is the labor
group which first presses for social
legislation. Because of less laborers in
the United States, and more farmer class,

20Homer Cary Hackett. Political and Social Growth of the
American People, 1492-1865. New York: The Macmillan Company,
1949, pp. 615-616.
a higher wage was paid for labor. There was no monarchy or royalist group to fight with in America—and thus no existing class struggle, just what developed with industry and labor. There were more philosophers and ideologists in Europe, such as Karl Marx and Engels, who were striving for social legislation.

The students would be asked to discuss the various possible interpretations of the answers, and to examine the nature and the validity of the evidence offered in support of the statements made.

**FORMS OF TO BE**

The responses considered under the above heading contain, as the reader will recall, (a) the is of identity and the is of classification, with high-level abstraction (with most of the responses the work of students in the 421-422-423 sequence); (b) forms of to be, with connotation (shown, for the most part, in the work of students in the 421-422-423 group).

It is believed that the following suggestions may be helpful:

Is of identity and is of classification, with high-level abstraction. Through the substitution of other words for forms of to be in such sentences as the following, the instructor can explain—inductively—the principle of equivalence and the need for limited rather than final identification or classification.

1. 1918 was the most disillusioned year of World War I.

2. The retreat to Boston was a disastrous one.
3. The unity of the colonies was a unity for peace and freedom.

4. By some standards, the level of American education is high, but if one considers what that education might be, the United States is an uneducated country.

5. The strength of the Jacobins was that they were unencumbered and forthright.

6. The last half of the nineteenth century was a period of quick advance in education throughout all Europe.

7. At first, Owens's socialism was not democratic.

8. Slow judgments are the best judgments.

9. The Treaty of Versailles was hard to make and impossible to enforce.

10. The basic condition of freedom is the free communication of ideas.

After an explanation of (a) the connection between confusion of levels of abstraction and the unskillful use of forms of to be, and (b) the usefulness—in terms of avoidance of projection and of unlimited evaluation—of "appears . . . to me" and "may be classified as," the instructor may ask students to revise a number of sentences containing undiscriminating use of the is of identity and/or the is of classification ("He was an aristocrat through and through." "In the 1920's, everything was O.K. It was the perfect age. People were happy." "Unemployment was a big problem."). Such revision—involving the use of examples and details and of operational definitions—would stress the attainment of increased precision and less certitude.
Analysis of passages from the work of professional historians may serve to show students how competent historians state ideas with clarity, objectivity, and reserve. The following passage may serve as an example:

The campaign of 1832 was opened by the Anti-Masons. This party was new to the national political scene. It had originated under strange circumstances. In 1826, William Morgan of Batavia, New York, a former member of the Masonic order, had published a pamphlet purporting to reveal its secrets. Soon afterwards he was abducted by certain overzealous members, who carried him as far as Niagara Falls; what befell him thereafter has never been revealed. The belief spread like wild fire through the rural districts of New York, Pennsylvania, and New England that he had been murdered, and all the latent democratic prejudice against exclusive secret societies was galvanized into active hostility. Churches took up the matter, deprived Masonic clergymen of their pastorates, and expelled Masonic laymen from membership. Other secret organizations were involved only in less degree; the honorary scholarship society, Phi Beta Kappa, founded in 1776, felt obliged to abandon its secret character at this time.

The movement quickly found its way into local and state politics, and Anti-Masonic parties were formed in several states. So popular did the new issue seem that certain astute young political leaders believed they might use it as a rallying point for the forces opposed to Jackson. Under the direction of such men as William H. Seward and Thurlow Weed of New York and Thaddeus Stevens of Pennsylvania, the party was organized on a national basis. At a national convention held on September 26, 1831, candidates were nominated and a platform adopted. William Wirt, former Attorney-General, was named for the presidency notwithstanding his statement to the convention that he had joined the Masons early in life.
and would not favor any "blind and unjust proscription" of the order.21

**Forms of to be, with connotation.** In analysis of such answers as the following, emphasis may well be on organization of ideas, inclusion of steps in logic, limitation and qualification of statements, inclusion of details and examples to illustrate statements, and maintenance of objectivity.

**Question (History 423).** Describe the teachings of Karl Marx and discuss their significance.

**History answer 86.** The teachings of Karl Marx were based on the belief that economics is a major part in government. Economics is the mainstay of the nation; and without production and manufacturing, a nation could not be successful. Thus the working class is very important. Marx thought that the working class was constantly being exploited, being paid poor wages and working overtime. He thought a change should be brought about in order to better their lot.

Marx's influence has been brought about in three fields: economics, history, and politics. In economics, a definite new class has been recognized, and some of its aims are being carried out. In history, the theory of economics is being stressed much more than it was before Marx's time. In politics, the rise of a new party has been very apparent. This party is becoming more and more influential in many nations, and will stop at nothing to gain its ends.

Rewriting—with revision of outlines and with expansion and clarification of statements compressed by means of forms of to be—may be helpful here.

Passages from the work of professional historians may be appraised for clarity of organization and the maintenance of objectivity. The following excerpts are instances of such material:

Since socialists of various kinds, moderate and radical, have become a very important element in European politics, it is necessary to sketch the rise of socialism. However they may differ in the matter of policy, all socialists hold that "the means of production" should belong to society and not be held as the private property of individuals. "The means of production" is a very vague phrase and might include farms and gardens as well as tools; but when the socialist uses it, he is generally thinking of the machines which the Industrial Revolution brought into the world and of the factories and mines which house and keep them going, as well as of the railroads and steamships which carry their products. In short, the main idea of the socialists is that the great industries which have arisen as a result of the Industrial Revolution should not be left in private hands. They claim that it is not right for the capitalists to own the mills upon which the workingman must depend for his living; that the attempt of labor unions to get higher wages does not offer more than a temporary relief, since the system is wrong which permits the wealthy to have such a control over the poor. The person who works for wages, say the socialists, is not free; he is a "wage slave" of his employer. To remedy this the socialist would turn over the great industries of the capitalists to national, state, town, or "guild" ownership, so that all may have a share in the profits. This ideal state of society, which, they say, is sure to come in the future, they call the Cooperative Commonwealth.
The great teacher of this modern doctrine of socialism was Karl Marx, a German writer who lived most of his life in London. He was a learned man, trained in philosophy and political economy, and he came to the conclusion from a study of history that just as the capitalists had replaced the feudal nobles, so the working class would eventually replace the capitalists. By "working class" he meant those who depend upon their work for a living. The introduction of the factory system had reduced the vast majority of workmen to a position in which the capitalist was able to dictate the conditions upon which this work should be done. Marx, in an eloquent appeal in 1847, called upon the members of this "proletariat" (or body of wage earners), "who have nothing to lose but their chains," to rise and seize the means of production themselves.

Marx later wrote a learned book called Capital, in which he sought to prove by history that socialism was bound in time to prevail. This book has exercised a very great influence on European socialists and has become for them a sort of Bible. There are, however, many kinds of socialists, and some of them do not agree with a number of Marx's conclusions.22

The fundamental doctrine of Marx's economic system, and the central theme of Das Kapital, is known as the theory of "surplus value." In brief, the following is a statement of this theory: Commodities are produced in order to be sold. They vary in size, in physical properties, and in many other ways, but they all have one thing in common; namely, they are produced by human labor. According to Marx, the exchange, or market value of a commodity depends upon the amount and degree of labor necessary to produce it. He defines a commodity as a "mass of congealed labor-time." Labor is,

---

therefore, the source of value. It is likewise the measure of value, as "commodities in which quantities of labor are embodied or which can be produced in the same time have the same value." By "labor" Marx means, not that of an individual but "socially necessary labor time" that is required to produce a commodity under normal conditions; it includes the labor of highly paid managers as well as that of poorly paid operatives.

What does the laborer receive? Not the full product of his toil, but just enough to maintain himself and reproduce his kind. Marx accepts the theory of wages, formulated by the classical economists, according to which the laborer can get only his mere sustenance under existing conditions. Only part of the work day is devoted to producing what the laborer gets; what he produces during the remainder of the day, "surplus value," is confiscated by the capitalist in the form of profits. Surplus value is, therefore, the difference between what the laborer produces and what he gets. Wages, declares Marx, are the illusion of the free laborer that he is paid for a full day's work; in reality he is paid only for a part of the day. Machinery brings no benefit to the laborer; it merely increases the "surplus value" of the capitalist by making the laborer more productive. As the capitalist contributes nothing to the creation of value, what then is his function? It is to bring about the cooperation of labor by assembling it in large quantities in order to operate modern industry. Under the capitalist system, asserts Marx, labor is systematically exploited for the benefit of the capitalist, but under a just system of distribution to be created by socialism; the workingmen would receive the full product of their toil; exploitation would cease, as all value created by labor would go to labor.23

TWO-VALUED ORIENTATION

The groups under the above heading include (a) two-valued orientation, with antitheses and high-level abstraction (appearing, for the most part, in the work of beginning students); (b) oversimplification, with high-level abstractions and connotation (with the work of students in the two most advanced groups well represented).

The following proposals are suggested as potentially useful:

Two-valued orientation, with antitheses and high-level abstraction. As was suggested in the section on economics, in connection with a group of responses in which similar errors are found, the instructor and the class may undertake analysis of the relationship between the development of two-valued orientation and the use of antitheses. The analysis would involve not only definition and illustration but also explanation of the advantages and the limitations of the use of this rhetorical device.

In the analysis of such passages as the following, emphasis should be placed on the unsure grasp of basic ideas ("On the plantation, the Negroes were to learn everything which would prepare them for anything ever expected of them"); on the effect of the use of unexplained high-order abstractions ("right," "wrong," "educate"); on the narrowness of the orientation; and on evidences of belief in accuracy of interpretation and formulation of judgments ("For the work expected of them, this was sufficient"). (Other possible
approaches to the discussion topic, furthermore, may well be considered.)

**Question (History 403).** Explain and comment on W. B. Phillips's statement that the plantation was a school for the training of the Negro.

**History answer 26.** Since there were no schools for the Negro children, the mistress of the Big House would read to them from the Bible. She had much to do with teaching them right from wrong. On the plantation, the Negroes were to learn everything which would prepare them for anything ever expected of them. They had only to learn to do their work well, and to obey, and everything was provided—housing, food, and medical care. Only the Negroes stayed on the plantation and learned manual labor. For the work expected of them, this was sufficient. There was no need to educate them, since they might possibly have rebelled against their lot.

**Oversimplification, with high-level abstraction and connotation.** It is suggested that the instructor conduct a pointed review of the nature of signal reaction. Through the discussion of student-written answers, he may demonstrate the results of combining signal reaction and highly connotative words. He may also consider the effect of the vagueness and elasticity of unqualified high-level abstractions on the oversimplification which often accompanies two-valued orientation.

A discussion of superior or excellent responses may also be helpful. (The answer quoted below may serve as an example.) This discussion should emphasize such items as the following: (a) careful qualification and limitation of statements, as in the first
paragraph; (b) clear, orderly arrangement of ideas (shown especially in the first three paragraphs); (c) the effective use of examples and details (as in the third and fifth paragraphs); (d) the maintenance of objectivity (shown in mist of the response, with the possible exception of the final paragraph).

Question (History 537). What were some of the major results of World War I on American economic life?

History answer 188. One of the major effects of World War I on American economic life was the change in the status of the United States from a debtor nation to a creditor nation as the result of its loans to the Allies, and its business activities. Instead of stimulating world trade after the war, however, as a creditor nation should do in order to insure repayment of its investments, the United States continued to erect high trade barriers. Business with Europe did continue after the war through the 1920's, not because world trade was flourishing, but because American government and firms loaned Europe the money with which to buy.

During the war, when production was of prime importance, anti-trust action stopped; and this progressive movement was not resumed at any time during the 1920's. As a result business expansion and consolidation increased considerably after the War.

The prosperity of the war years was maintained in part by this consolidation; semi-monopolistic businesses were able to control production and prices. Unfortunately, the agricultural economy did not maintain this artificial level; farmers did not control their production, and farm prices after the War dropped sharply. The farmers who had gone heavily into debt during the War on new machinery and acreage, felt this price drop keenly and urged measures like the (unsuccessful) McNary-Haugen Farm Bill.
One of the major effects of the War on labor was the virtual destruction of radical groups, such as the I. W. W., within the labor movement.

Union membership grew tremendously during the War, but was to drop again during the 1920's. One of the benefits of the War to labor was the almost universal acceptance of the 8-hour day (except in the steel industry). Also, as the result of trends which were stimulated by the War, the labor force now included many more women and Negroes.

As a result of the War and its negative effect on the idealism and progressivism of the early 1900's, the whole economic attitude of the United States again shifted. Big Business and independent businessmen were again to become the "heroes" of American life; labor and business reforms were forgotten for another decade.

Careful consideration should be given to the ways in which the writers of such responses have avoided finality and maintained objectivity. The amount and the nature of the examples and details included should also be noted.

**CONNOTATION**

The groups under Connotation include (a) personal connotation, with high-level abstraction and generalization (shown in the work of students at the 403 and the 421-422-423 levels); (b) connotation, with metaphor and forms of to be (with students in the first quarter of the 421-422-423 group appearing to have more difficulty here than do beginners in 403 or the more advanced students in 537).

It is believed that the following suggestions will be useful to teachers working toward a solution of these problems:
Personal connotation, with high-level abstraction and generalization. Because implications and associations, rather than objective analysis, are found in this group of responses, it may be helpful to have the students list the personal and the general connotations of such words as "cruel," "overly tyrannical," "forced," and "right" in the following (or a similar) context:

**Question (History 421).** Explain what Palmer means when he says that the American Revolution was not a local event, but that its consequences affected all the peoples of the Western world.

**History answer 50.** The American Revolution was not a local event. It was caused by the cruel, overly tyrannical rule of England. England thus forced all the people of the colonies to turn to battle. Had they allowed more rights here, an understanding could have been worked out . . .

Instruction in the meaning and the use of descriptive and inferential levels of communication may also be given, through comparison and discussion of student-written answers and reports. A contrast may be drawn, for instance, between (a) a brief explanation of the connection between Hamilton's proposal for a privately-owned Bank of the United States—which would prevent unregulated banks from issuing depreciated currency—and his intention of providing the country with a currency which would not fluctuate in value, and (b) such a comment as "Under Hamilton, it the Federalist Party gave the nation a sound financial policy."

Inasmuch as a number of high-level abstractions—with little or no qualification—serve as the basis for generalization, a review
of the principles of valid generalization—including the size of
the sample, the method of sampling, and the treatment of negative
instances—may be helpful.

Connotation, with metaphor and forms of to be. Such
passages as the following may be used for practice in revision:

Now surely here was opportunity such as
never came to man before. Here was a position
in which a man might well bow himself in fear
of himself, and search his heart, and serve
God and man to the utmost. The old order of
things was dead or dying; strange new forces
drove through the world seeking form and
direction; the promise of a world republic
and an enduring world peace whispered in a
multitude of startled minds. France was in
his hand, his instrument, to do with as he
pleased, willing for peace, but tempered for
war like an exquisite sword. There lacked
nothing to this great occasion but a noble
imagination. Failing that, Napoleon could do
no more than strut upon the crest of this
great mountain of opportunity like a
cockerel on a dunghill. The figure he makes
in history is one of almost incredible self-
conceit, of callous contempt and disregard
of all who trusted him, and of a grandiose
aping of Caesar, Alexander, and Charlemagne
which would be purely comic if it were not
caked over with human blood. Until, as
Victor Hugo said in his tremendous way,
"God was bored by him," and he was kicked
aside into a corner to end his days, explaining
and explaining how very clever his worst
blunders had been, prowling about his dismal
hot island shooting birds and squabbling
meanly with an underbred jailer who failed
to show him proper "respect."

24Wells, op. cit., pp. 934-935.
Students may be asked to rewrite the above passage, using referential language, and avoiding a combination of connotation and metaphor to produce name-calling.

In analysis of such responses as the following, students may be asked to examine the passage for the use of highly connotative words, for appropriateness of the metaphors used, and for employment of forms of to be. They may also be requested to suggest items of evidence that might well have been included.

**Question (History U21).** Explain what Palmer means when he says that the American Revolution was not a local event, but that its causes were largely European and that its consequences affected all the peoples of the Western world.

**History answer 52.** After the Revolution, the United States set itself up as an example of a free and strong nation with a government which was based on the principles of democracy. America was an idol in the eyes of foreign nations, and it did some toward strengthening the spirit of revolution in France.

**METAPHOR**

The classifications under Metaphor include (a) metaphor, with finality resulting from the use of forms of to be (shown in the work of intermediate and advanced students); (b) metaphor, with connotation and vagueness (with the work of students in the upper group represented).

The following proposals are submitted:
Metaphor, with finality resulting from the use of forms of to be. Instruction in the fitting and effective use of metaphor may be given. Stress may be placed on the criteria of appropriateness and relative accuracy, and on the danger in using metaphor of giving the impression of identity rather than similarity. It may well be pointed out that metaphor is inexact, that it is subordinate, and that its use is not desirable in passages which may be termed "reports," written on the descriptive level.

Detailed analysis of such a response as the following is suggested:

Question (History 537). Discuss the circumstances which led to our rejection of the Treaty of Versailles.

History answer 176. One of my two book reports was on The Great Betrayal, by Thomas Bailey. This was written almost entirely about Wilson and the treaty, and, therefore, I believe I can give much more detail than was covered in lectures or in the text.

In my report, I maintained the fact that the Treaty of Versailles was largely a Wilson-constructed document, and that the League Covenant of the Treaty, Article X, is attributed solely to Wilson. I also concentrated on the feeling between Wilson, a Democrat, and the Senate Republican majority, which led to the defeat of the treaty. At this time it might be better to say something about some of the general conditions which led to the rejection of the treaty.

There are several other factors, besides politics, which led to the defeat of the treaty. During a war, the President has the powers of a commander-in-chief,
and is disposed to make many decisions on
the spur of the moment for the good of the
nation. Many of these policies and
decisions would, in peace time, come from
the floor of the Senate. Consequently,
there was a move by the Senate, after the
war, to obtain some of its former prestige.
This meant giving the President a few
setbacks. It happened that rough drafts
of the Treaty of Versailles, a supposedly
well-guarded document, were made available
to the Senate and read on the floor before
its completion. Certain clauses were found
to be objectionable, namely, Article X; and
when President Wilson returned to the United
States from France to read the Treaty before
the Senate, he found them with the barriers
up, having an insight on secret material.

Even though the treaty which Wilson
brought back was much different from the
cles which the Senate had reviewed, they
still objected. This is more understandable
when one remembers that the Senate was making
a bid for its old position, and that the
Treaty was a Presidential measure.

Another point which eventually turned
the Senate against Wilson was his failure
to appoint a quota of Senators to the
Treaty council. Needless to say, in
fighting the treaty, the Senate related
every controversial issue to it, and dug
up a lot of old political footballs to
kick around and fool the people. Note that
we have essentially the same plan in effect
today, which almost proves the measure
wasn't bad, or are we that changeable?

The analysis should concern (a) the appropriateness of the metaphors
(the basis of the analogy suggested, and the meaning of the
metaphor in its present context); (b) the quality of the thinking--
and the amount of personal opinion--behind the use of metaphor. The
instructor and the class, then, will take into consideration the
way in which the metaphors used show the attitudes of the students,
and the way the certitude is strengthened by the use of forms of to be.

Metaphor, with connotation and vagueness. An explanation of such metaphors as the following (a) "American idealism had been raised high under forced draft," (b) a representative . . . has become a mere mouthpiece," (c) "the parties have come to dodge the real issues"—in such passages as this—may be requested:

For a while, during the war, American idealism had been raised high under forced draft, and the Prohibition and Woman's Suffrage Amendments, after they had been ratified by the necessary number of State legislatures, were declared parts of the Constitution in 1919 and 1920 respectively. Both had been long before the public as issues, but their incorporation in the Constitution was due to the general psychology of the time, although the second of the Amendments would probably have not been long in coming. With regard to the moral, legal, and other difficulties into which Prohibition plunged us, it may be noted that it was symptomatic of the breakdown of genuine party government not only with us but everywhere in that neither party, for ten years, dared to take a strong stand on what was unquestionably one of the most discussed issues of the time. Largely owing to the change in our conception of government, according to which a representative has ceased to be expected to use his own mind and has become a mere mouthpiece to express the surmised opinions of a majority of his constituents, the parties have come to dodge the real issues which may be counted on to divide public opinion, instead of seeking for them.25

The emphasis may be on the use of metaphor to illustrate rather than to prove, and on the effects of the combination of metaphor and

and highly connotative words.

Analysis of metaphors found in advertisements and political articles may be illuminating and helpful. Such analysis, as previously suggested in the section on responses written in classes in economics, should be concerned especially with the basis of the suggested similarity, the subordination of metaphor, and the purpose of the writer, as shown in the passage. Expansion of the metaphors—involving outlining of the passages and rearrangement of materials—is suggested for better grasp of sequence of ideas.

**SLANTING**

The answers analyzed under the above heading are grouped as follows: (a) slanting, with connotation (shown in the work of students in the \texttt{421-422-423} sequence, as well as in that of beginners) (b) slanting, with oversimplification and confused thinking (with third-quarter students in the survey course appearing to have more difficulty here than beginners or more advanced students).

The following recommendations to teachers are proffered:

**Slanting, with connotation.** The instructor and the class, in their analysis and discussion of a slanted newspaper article, may consider carefully (a) the inclusion—on omission—of all facts of equal significance; (b) the effect of the use of connotative words on the inclusion of necessary and relevant detail; (c) the clarity of organization. Students should be encouraged to furnish reasons
for apparent difficulties and misinterpretations.

Such a response as the following, combining slanting (shown in the emphasis on the features of the Agricultural Adjustment Administration which resulted in its failure, and in the omission of any listing of the achievements of the agency) with the use of highly connotative words ("instigated," "failure," and "doomed") may be used for (a) discussion of errors, (b) an exercise in slanting the opposite way. A review of the nature of invective and of the interaction of slanting and connotation may be helpful.

Question (History 423). Discuss agricultural problems and agricultural legislation under the New Deal.

History answer 112. Agriculture suffered from an over-production and an under-normal purchasing power, in addition to having their very life mortgaged to the very hilt. The New Deal of President Roosevelt brought some legislation in the farmers' favor. The A. A. A. was instigated in an attempt to buy up the surplus for a nominal fee, store it up until the market was up and so were prices, and then put it back on the market for sale. The idea was sound, but in too short a time, all the funds were used up and the problem was not alleviated. Another idea was to pay the "poor" farmer to cut down his acreage in return for additional remuneration. It was indeed a noble plan, but it was also doomed to bitter failure just as its predecessors. The farmers cut down the acreage, but technological advances in fertilizers made this new acreage's yield greater than before. About all these plans proved was the ease with which the federal government could give away the taxpayers' money, and how eagerly the "poor" farmer took it. Will the poor farmer ever be aided by the government?
Slanting, with oversimplification and confused thinking.

After a brief review of the significance and the place in reflective thinking of (a) careful, cautious analysis of a given problem, (b) formulation--based on observation--of a tentative hypothesis, and (c) testing the hypothesis, the class may proceed to a consideration of the relationship between the expression of judgments not based on evidence, and the influence of predetermined conclusions on the ideas advanced. Here, as suggested before, the instructor may well call attention to the connection between slanting and the process of abstraction.

Careful consideration of acceptable answers to such questions as the following may be carried on:

How and why was our tariff policy changed between 1930 and 1940?

Emphasis may well be on careful, logical organization of materials--including review of the elements of outlining--preservation of proportion in the presentation of ideas, and maintenance of objectivity; and indication of other possible approaches.
Responses have been analyzed from courses in economics and in history. We may now consider student-written discussions in sociology, the last of the areas in the social studies with which we shall be concerned in this study. The course descriptions are given below.

Sociology 507. Fundamentals of Sociology. A study of the nature of society and the factors affecting its development; culture, personality; groups and institutions; selected social problems.

Sociology 604. Race Problems. A study of the problems arising from the contacts of people who differ as to race and culture.

Sociology 622. Social Factors in Personal Adjustment. Nature of human nature; process of socialization; social changes and individual demoralization; social roles in conflict situations; re-direction of social activity.

As the writer noted earlier in the chapter, responses to true-false, multiple-choice, or other objective-type examinations have not been included in the analysis. The predominance of such tests in sociology is mentioned here to explain the use of responses from three courses rather than from a larger number.

Let us consider, first, responses in which abstraction plays a major part in complicating or obscuring interpretation.

Abstraction. The first group of responses (Sociology answers 7, 26, 32, 36, 49, 57, 64, and 77, which follow) is one in which dead-level abstracting appears frequently.

Question (Sociology 507). How would you assess the importance of culture in accounting for one's personality?

Sociology answer 32. Personality is affected by interpersonal relationships, mass communication, biological heredity, culture,
and geographic environment. I would say that one's culture is very important in determining one's personality. The culture one lives in, the nationality, etc., form the ideas about one culture or nation being "superior" and all others "savages." When one has interpersonal relationships, he attains the culture traits from these individuals. The folkways and mores of his environment or local community affect him, and mass communication is nothing more than a mass medium for diffusing culture traits, etc. Ethnocentrism and having certain ideals about the proper way of life, religion, sex, etc., are also factors of culture that affect one's personality.

One may be reasonably certain that such terms as "interpersonal relationships" were clearly defined in class discussion, and a limited, fairly specific meaning agreed upon. A recurring question comes to mind, however: Can the reader be certain that the student has used these terms in the senses agreed upon? The doubt is not settled in the course of the response, for the student has remained on a high level of abstraction. In lines 4-6, first of all, an assertion is made concerning the importance of culture in determining personality; the assertion, however, is not adequately explained by the repetition of "culture" or by the use of quotation marks. The faulty sentence structure, moreover, makes the meaning difficult to follow. Second, the student attempts, in lines 11-13, to explain his statement, in lines 9-11, concerning interpersonal relationships and the attainment of cultural traits. The paraphrase, however, is on the same high level of abstraction. No explanation is offered, furthermore, for the statement in lines 15-18, though further explanation seems needed. All in all, the student seems to have failed to come to grips with the question.
The use of forms of to be enters here, as it does in several answers in this group. In line 5, the use of "is" results chiefly in an impression of certitude; in line 11, in a finality of definition that comes close to two-valued orientation. The same impression is given in line 18; as usual, the use of a form of to be takes the place of analysis and explanation.

Question (Sociology 604). Discuss briefly the topic, "The Reduction of Prejudice."

Sociology answer 49. The reduction of prejudice presents quite a problem because there is much disagreement as to how it can be brought about. Some advocate education, but surveys have proved that education does not have too noticeable an effect on attitudes regarding prejudice. Some say that legislation eliminating discrimination and segregation will result in the lessening of prejudiced attitudes. Who is right it is hard to say.

The attitude of prejudice is difficult to eliminate. It is formed early in life through assimilation from others. Some people that are prejudiced don't discriminate, but I don't care to associate with the disapproved group.

I think prejudice is an attitude that is connected with a person's economic and social well being. People who are insecure usually blame their insecurity on a person or thing. Since a racial or cultural characteristic may be easily ascertained, it can serve as the basis for their disapproval. I think that as long as there are inherent differences in people, there will be prejudiced attitudes.

The meaning of the response depends largely on six high-order abstractions, not one of which is clarified and explained. In line 4, the student uses the word "education," but beyond repeating the word in the next line, does little to explain the kind of education he is
referring to or to show clearly why the undefined education will not affect the vague "attitudes regarding prejudice." Instead, he hedges behind "Surveys have proved...." "Education," in this context, might mean anything from poster campaigns to formal lectures; and "surveys," from door-to-door questioning to competently planned analyses based on mathematical formulas. Second, "legislation" (line 8) seems to need explanation, probably through an example of laws concerning admission of Negroes to restaurants and theaters, for instance, or to public-school systems. In line 8, the student merely uses the word "discrimination" and passes on, without comment or explanation about the nature of the unfair treatment to which he is apparently referring. "Economic and social well being" (lines 19-20) may mean a minimum wage of $20,000 a year or it may mean forty acres and a mule; the phrase itself is pleasing but vague, and is closely connected with the "insecurity" mentioned in line 21. The student does not reveal anything about the nature, the extent, or the seriousness of this major lack. Finally, the phrase "inherent differences" (line 26) might well have been briefly explained.

The lack of explanation resulting from the use of unexplained high-level abstractions is aggravated by the use of the is of classification (lines 10, 12, 15, and 20). The student ignores other possible classifications, pigeonholes unqualified abstractions through using forms of to be, and is content with marginal treatment of the question.

Question (Sociology 622). Write an essay which reveals what you think the main principles developed in the course are.
Do not simply list them, but write an essay about them which tries to indicate the relationship among them, something of their importance, etc.

Sociology answer 77. The principles that I am familiar with all seem to revolve about the "ego security" concept. We must protect our egos. We do this in many ways. One principle is substitute responses. When we can't respond in the way we want, we substitute another response. The Negro who can't show his aggression overtly shows it in other ways.

We manifest these aggressions toward the objector; we retract, perhaps we identify with ourselves these feelings of aggression. In any type of group, whether connected with class, sex, or color, circular reinforcement is in operation. If there is great interaction within the group, and the members circulate very little outside of the group, the characteristics of the group become stronger and more dominant. This principle greatly encourages prejudice.

When an individual belongs to the group but attempts to leave it, he becomes a marginal man. Usually he would be an unauthentic person, a person who accepts the stereotype and sets about to prove that it's wrong.

We all have a concept of self. This concept is formed by our early primary experiences. This concept influences our actions, attitudes, and values. Another thing we know in relation to the development of personality is that frustration leads to aggression. When we have been thwarted, we will react in some form of aggression. All these concepts seem to revolve around our ego and how it is satisfied.

Here, too, the student remains well up on the ladder of abstraction. He writes, first, that we must protect our egos by using the principle of substitute responses (lines 3-5), and explains the statement by using the words, "We substitute another response."
Though the comment in lines 7-9 partly explains the student's comment, he might have defined "aggression" more clearly had he, for instance, related how Negroes have intentionally elbowed white people off sidewalks in some of our cities. Second, "interaction within the group" and "circulate" (lines 16-17) seem hardly sufficient to explain the abstraction "circular reinforcement." The student may refer to such matters as housing, automobiles, dress, and schooling; he is not specific, however, and the reader is unsure of the meaning. Furthermore, he is not told just how "circular reinforcement" stimulates the growth of prejudice. Here, again, one finds the question-begging often noted as a result of dead-level abstraction. The matter under consideration—at least supposedly—is assumed to be proved. Now, "unauthentic" (line 24) may be simply an unfortunate choice of words, but "early primary experiences" (lines 28-29) seems vague if not ambiguous. The term may apply, for instance, to schooling or to physical age. Finally, the comment that "frustration leads to aggression" (lines 32-33) impresses the reader as being both unclear and repetitious.

**Question (Sociology 507). How would you assess the importance of culture in accounting for one's personality?**

**Sociology answer 36.** Culture is one of five interweaving factors which determine a person's personality. These five are culture, geography, heredity, interpersonal relations, and mass communication. All five play a very important part, but culture is one of the most important. It is by a person's culture that he learns all of his attitudes and beliefs in life. He acquires all of his prejudices and habits, his morals and beliefs. One cannot forget the role played

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>11</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
by the other four factors, but it would be fairly safe to say that culture is the most important in accounting for one's personality. The difference between cultures accounts for the difference between people. A person born in one culture has entirely different attitudes, views, habits, and characteristics from one born in another.

The respondent, after deciding (in lines 6-7) that culture is "one of the most important" of the factors, begins to explain the reasons for the assumption. The difficulty in lines 7-11 seems to be that "attitudes and beliefs in life," "prejudices and habits," "morals and beliefs" are on an equally high level of abstraction. Brief examples—concerning, for example, obedience to traffic ordinances, respect for other members of the family, tolerance toward members of other races, belief in the immortality of the soul—might have helped to show more clearly the intended meaning. Instead, in lines 11-19, the student has recourse to repetition in an attempt to clarify and to support the statements. Instead of defining and explaining, the writer of the answer insists on the validity of ideas phrased in broad, vague terms, and makes that insistence more noticeable by using (in lines 1, 3, 6, and 13) forms of to be.

Question (Sociology 622). Write an essay which reveals what you think the main principles developed in the course are. Do not simply list them, but write an essay about them which tries to indicate the relationship among them, something of their importance, etc.

Sociology answer 64: The effect of skin-color judgment on personality is interesting because of the direct connotation which it has shown to take on. The fact of light-ness in itself exemplifies a more positive sign of nobility. There is a notion of
relativity which ties in with the personalities involved values — and which in turn affects his judgment to societal factors with respect to judgment and self-concept involvements. Another factor involved is that of self-fulfilling prophecy and can best be shown by race and the relative aggressiveness of the Negro, which in certain cases would well fulfill the "well-deserved reputation" idea...

First, there is little explanation of the "direct connotation (line 3) — apparently of "skin-color judgment." The next sentence, apparently intended to explain the comment, is on the same high level of abstraction, as is shown by the puzzling use of "nobility." In lines 6-11, however — containing "relativity," "personalities involved values," "societal factors," and "judgment and self-concept involvements" — one finds an example of the way in which the unskillful use of technical terms can result in obscurity. No attempt to use lower levels of abstraction is made, though the concepts — and the sentence structure — are involved. Finally, the "relative aggressiveness of the Negro" is likewise allowed to stand without further explanation. In this discussion of some esoteric aspects of race and social differences, the judgments are not supported; and the meaning is clouded.

Question (Sociology 507). While all societies have the same basic social institutions, such institutions vary greatly. How do you account for this fact?

Sociology answer 7. There are several reasons to be found for the variations in the social institutions of different societies. These reasons may be traced to cultural, hereditary, and geographical factors. The first factor (cultural) probably has the greatest influence, as the other two have limitations as to their effect. Geographical factors may determine
what cannot be or what may be, but they cannot determine what must be [dead-level abstraction]. Hereditary factors are a subject of much question, but must lend some definite effect upon the situation [dead-level abstraction]. Cultural factors would seem to be the major determinant of what a social institution shall be or shall not be. For in this category are found the traditions, symbols, and ideals which are passed on from generation to generation. Age-old customs are still used in man's societies regarding social institutions [dead-level abstraction]. Then, too, social institutions are ever changing if one checks closely enough. Religion, economics, and family relationships—all feel the effect of present-day innovations [dead-level abstraction]. It would be difficult to persuade an island aborigine or a Hindu that his manner of abode, religion, or other social institution is not the correct one. And who is to say that it may not be? This social pride or ethnocentrism is characteristic of almost all societies and can be traced to the culture which is passed down through the years [dead-level abstraction].

Question (Sociology 604). Discuss briefly the topic, "The Reduction of Prejudice."

Sociology answer 57. Since we defined prejudice in class as an emotional bias and discrimination as overt, unequal behaviour, I definitely feel that this present generation have diminished the emotional bias of our fathers' age [dead-level abstraction]. It seems to me that friendship with people whose company you enjoy is more important to the youth of today than what origin they are before association. I do think, however, that even though there is acceptance [dead-level abstraction], discrimination will continue because of strong "intermarriage" mores. This factor is one of the strongest ties to the deep-rooted prejudice of yesteryear [is of identity, with abstraction and finality.
Question (Sociology 507). What relation do you see between the culture and the so-called drives?

Sociology answer 26. The drives are inborn, such as the sexual drive and the hunger drive. These drives are brought about by the culture of the society. What the society has as its rules, attitudes, and beliefs, influence what the people do. Some of the drives can be repressed; others can be brought out in the open. When a person goes ahead and does something that his culture forbids, then he is either thrown in jail, or ridiculed. The relation between drives and culture is strong. The drives will most times be brought out by the rules and beliefs of the society in which one lives. The drives will also be repressed by the rules and beliefs of the society. The biological and hereditary cultural drives, though inborn, will not take place unless society and the culture in which one lives allow them to take place.

In the responses which we have just considered (Sociology answers 7, 26, 32, 36, 49, 57, 64, and 77), the reader finds repetition rather than definition of terms. Sometimes the students have used paraphrasing, but that paraphrasing is on the same level of abstraction as the terms to be defined. The few examples used suffer from the same trouble: Often, in the examples, the students use the term supposedly under consideration, and then use words equally abstract to define the term. Second, hedging appears in these answers. The vagueness and elasticity of high-level abstractions encourage the students to suggest, hint, and then use the equivalent of "on the other hand." Finally, the use of forms of to be enables students to combine the vagueness of abstraction with the certainty of
identification and classification. In the responses as a whole, there is a distinct tendency to assume that the use of forms of to be obviates the necessity of presenting evidence.

The writers of several other responses (Sociology answers 6, 11, 12, 13, 30, 47, 53, 69, and 70, to follow) have combined the use of unqualified high-level abstractions with somewhat confused thinking.

Question (Sociology 507). While all societies have the same basic social institutions, such institutions vary greatly. How do you account for this fact?

Sociology answer 6. Although all societies have the same basic institutions, they vary greatly because of folkways, mores, attitudes, beliefs, and usages which make them up. Take, for example, religion, which every society has, is basically the same in every society because everyone believes in some supernatural power which has an effect on them; but the institution varies greatly from one society to another because of the people's beliefs, symbols, attitudes, folkways and mores of the different societies which are related to this institution. I therefore believe that the reason for this great variability are the folkways, mores, attitudes, beliefs, symbols, and usages which go together to make up certain institutions in a society.

The reader notices, first of all, that the student has used "folkways, mores, attitudes, beliefs, and usages" three times in the course of a short discussion. The phrase is a combination of words whose meanings are carefully limited and defined in sociology ("folkways," "mores") and broad, indefinite terms (attitudes, "beliefs," "usages") much more difficult to pin down. As a result, this group of words produces an impression of breadth, overlapping, and obscurity. Second, two parts of the student's explanation of why
religion varies from one society to another seem open to some question: (1) the statement that religion is basically the same in every society (with finality through the is of classification) and (2) the assertion that "everyone believes in some supernatural power which has an effect on them" (lines 7-9)—a judgment which might be questioned on the grounds of clarity and of validity. Some further elucidation seems essential in order that the grounds for the student's position are made clear. The reader cannot tell whether or not the student has seen, for instance, the broad distinction between religions that are in the main based on the relation of man to nature, and those based on ethical ideas—a concept fundamental to clear understanding of the matter he is considering. Finally, without further analysis or definition, the student returns, in the second paragraph, to folkways, mores, attitudes, beliefs, and usages, apparently feeling that the use of the phrase amounts to an answer to the question.

Question (Sociology 604). Why do the biological scientists disagree as much as they do in their classification of mankind into races?

Sociology answer 47. No one as yet has come up with a clear-cut and unchallengeable definition of races. The biological scientists themselves disagree because they cannot qualify each "racial group." The biggest and most widely used is the three-category system of Mongoloid, Caucasoid, and Negroid. These classifications are broad themselves. Peoples have been studied from all parts of the world, but there is, as yet, no agreement between the scientists. One would come up with a theory, and another tried to disprove it. There are so many trying to classify, that a definite agreement cannot be made. There is not a true meeting of the minds of concept of man. Some people believed in the Freudian theory, of how the human being
was developed, and others believe what is in the Bible.

Biologists have made classifications by blood type, by color, by facial and body features, so that the time comes for classification, no one knows which road to follow.

The writer of the foregoing response, in his realization of the need for agreement on the bases of classification of "races," seems to have a clue to the solution of the problem posed in the question. The listing of three categories often used seems defensible as an example of one method of classification. But to write, as the student does, that the reason for the disagreement among biological scientists is the presence of a number of theories, seems to explain little. Moreover, the sentence, "There is not a true meeting of the minds of concept of man" (lines 15-16) seems unclear, impossible to prove or to disprove, and redundant. The phrase "a meeting of the minds" is, in itself, clear enough, but, in this context, not especially meaningful. Furthermore, one wonders just how doctrines concerning the causes and treatment of neurotic and psychopathic states, as well as of the interpretation of dreams, fit into a discussion of the classification of mankind into races. Finally, the reader notices that without warning the student returns, in the second paragraph, to examples of methods of classification. The answer as a whole, then, appears to be based on half-understood ideas, unclearly defined and explained. The thinking behind the assertions is not precise, the sequence of impressions not clear.

Question (Sociology 622). Write an essay which reveals what you think the main principles developed in the course are. Do not simply list them, but write an essay about them which tries to indicate the relationship among them, something of their importance, etc.
Sociology answer 69. Differences among people are either innate (biologically determined) or they are culturally determined. So many differences which appear to be innate are actually brought about by differential social treatment.

There are certain facts we can learn from tests, but actually too much faith cannot be put in them, since they are class-bound, (or sex-bound, or color-bound, or whatever may be the case). This introduces the problem of "cultural relativism."

Class (and color, sex, and age) intrude into many institutional situations, resulting in personality impact and disorganization, however, varying degrees and types of disorganization, depending upon the first factor. The deviates from any expected behaviour pattern are looked upon with much disfavor in our culture. (Such as homosexuals, etc.)

In this answer, the student, first of all, stays on a rather high level of abstraction. The citing of an example or two of "difficulties which appear to be innate" (lines 4-5) would have helped the reader considerably in following the meaning and in deciding whether the student was referring, for example, to thinking processes or to manner of dress. Second, the student does not reveal the nature of the facts which one may learn from tests. An understanding of these facts seems necessary, in view of the statement that "too much faith cannot be put in them" (lines 8-9). Third, the phrase "personality impact" (line 16) conveys no idea of the nature or the extent of the impinging. The use of "disorganization" communicates a little of what the student has in mind, but the phrase is so general as to be almost meaningless.

The use of unqualified high-order abstractions is accompanied by rather disconnected, unsystematic thinking. In the second paragraph,
exactly what introduces the problem of "cultural relativism"? There is little connection apparent between the unexplained results of unnamed tests (line 8) and a major problem in sociology— or between the comment on "personality impact" (line 16) and the attitude of most people termed "deviates" from the accepted pattern of behaviour. Last, there is a large gap in thinking between the fourth paragraph and the rest of the answer. The relationship of ideas is not at all clear. Too much is left to the ingenuity of the reader.

**Question** (Sociology 604). Why do the biological scientists disagree as much as they do in their classification of mankind into races?

**Sociology answer 53.** Biological scientists disagree as much as they do on racial classification because classification is difficult indeed because of overlapping and the appearance of groups which do not seem to fit former classifications. Many times biologists approach the problem with different points of view on race which might have been tempered by their backgrounds. Some might say that classification of races actually has little import in regard to what we want to know about human relations. Mixtures cannot be classified easily, and present problems to the scientist who wishes to place them in a category where they can be studied. Many times this results in the scientist's putting such mixed breeds in an entirely new classification. Scientists are generally now coming to the hypothesis that for most practical purposes man can be called Negroid, Caucasoid, and Mongoloid. To be sure, there remain groups who do not fit into these three groups.

First, the student makes a statement which is undeniable but which is designed to disarm criticism: that "classification is difficult indeed" (lines 3-4)—a statement which is echoed in the
last sentence of the answer. There is, it will be observed, no comment on the nature of the different points of view, or on the ways in which these points of view have been affected by the background of each individual concerned. No mention is made of the major theories of racial difference, the multiple origin and the unitary origin theories. Second, in view of the fact that race, next to age and sex, stands as one of the major bases of social differentiation, the comment in lines 10-13 seems to be not only tangential but misleading. In the answer as a whole, the student seems somewhat unsure of his ground; therefore, he fails to answer the question directly and accurately, and he tends to belittle the significance of the issue involved.

Question (Sociology 507). While all societies have the same basic social institutions, such institutions vary greatly. How do you account for this fact?

Sociology answer 11. The institutions vary in different societies because the societies are varied. A social institution is a pattern [is of identity, with finality and high-level abstraction] of non-material culture traits, folkways, and beliefs. These will differ from society to society somewhat. Different societies have different ideas as to what should be important [high-level abstraction, with looseness of thought], and they differ as to what is the best way of life [high-level abstraction, with looseness of thought]. Different environmental conditions force one society to stress certain aspects [high-level abstraction] while in another society, this may be entirely absent. The environment plays an important part [high-level abstraction] in the way social institutions are constructed. The social institutions are "geared" to meet the needs of the society.
Question (Sociology 622). Write an essay which reveals what you think the main principles developed in the course are. Do not simply list them, but write an essay about them which tries to indicate the relationship among them, something of their importance, etc.

Sociology answer 70. ...Child training has a big effect on personality. In every case, religion, or group [high-level abstraction, with looseness of thought], there are problems in the family, or child-rearing problems which, some people say, affect the child's adulthood [high-level abstraction, with looseness of thought].

Question (Sociology 507. While all societies have the same basic social institutions, such institutions vary greatly. How do you account for this fact?

Sociology answer 13. The institutions vary because cultures likewise vary. Concepts, ideals, needs, and folkways and mores vary greatly from one culture to another. Institutions vary in (1) structure, (2) function, and (3) value, e.g., (1) religion in America consists of more or less regular church attendance, singing of hymns, praying to one God. In India we might see natives fall on their faces before a sacred cow. These same people might worship other inanimate objects or have a widespread belief in ghosts, spirits, etc.

Function - to ease the restlessness of the spirit or soul of man [high-level abstraction, with looseness of thought].

Value - In America we place a premium upon love for fellow men. Our aspect of the human life is much higher than that of the Hindu [high-level abstraction, with looseness of thought]. In America, religion is supposed to make for tolerance, for it is in reality morality, which makes for tolerance, not salvation [high-level abstraction, with looseness of thought].
Question (Sociology 507). While all societies have the same basic social institutions, such institutions vary greatly. How do you account for this fact?

Sociology answer 12. While all societies have the same basic institutions, such institutions vary greatly because different societies emphasize the basic institutions differently. One society might emphasize religion more than it does politics, which would cause the institutions of politics to vary greatly with that of other societies [high-level abstraction, with looseness of thought]. One society might emphasize a strong family interrelationship, and not put a great emphasis on religion. This would cause the beliefs of this society's religion to differ from others along with the difference in the family institution [high-level abstraction, with looseness of thought]. Since the basic institutions of societies grow out of a group's needs, the amount of emphasis on institutions would depend on the development from the amount of need for it [high-level abstraction, with looseness of thought]. It is quite possible that the need for a strong political institution is necessary [high-level abstraction, with looseness of thought]; and therefore this society may have more political policy, beliefs, and ideas, than a society which does not have such a great need for a strong political institution. The institution of marriage and family interrelationship differs greatly in many societies, but yet all societies have some beliefs, mores, and folkways which include these institutions. Education is yet another institution which to some societies may seem foolish and not needed; to others it is very important and carried out to its full extent [high-level abstraction, with looseness of thought].
Question (Sociology 507). How would you assess the importance of culture in accounting for one's personality?

Sociology answer 30. On the basis of information gathered during this quarter, as a - ahem - student of sociology, it is shown very clearly that culture is again a direct and important influence upon personality. To cite the example of the children who had been kept in isolation during the first five or six years of their life. They were proven, if not conclusively in the one case, to be affected by the culture, which they did not know until discovery and exposure to the same [high-level abstraction, with looseness of thought].

Also, a song hit, from a few years back, gives ample evidence to the most unlearned that culture is definitely of vital importance to one's personality [high-level abstraction, with looseness of thought]. "Civilization" it was entitled. Remember?

We see, in reading Sociology answers 6, 11, 12, 13, 30, 47, 53, 69, and 70, that the use of a series of unexplained high-level abstractions often has a cumulative effect of breadth, overlapping—often of obscurity. The reader cannot be sure that the thought behind these impressive tones is precise. The students sometimes seem to base their comments on half-understood ideas of the solution to the problems posed in the examination questions. Lack of systematic thinking, then, plus the use of high-order abstractions, defeats the intentions of the students to offer valid explanations. Instead of expressing ideas clearly and exactly, the students tend to jot down ideas and impressions, and leave the reader to work out the relationship—and the validity—for himself.

In several responses (Sociology 33, 58, and 80, considered
below), the use of unexplained high-order abstractions is accompanied by sweeping generalization.

**Question (Sociology 604).** Discuss briefly the topic, "The Reduction of Prejudice."

**Sociology answer 58.** Prejudice, which I think is the emotional thought for or against something, is reducing with time. Today's people are more educated on the subject of prejudice than were the people of days gone by. Thus, light is being thrown on the subject of prejudice everyday, which accounts for the growing concern on this subject.

More than mere education on the subject is needed, though. The people will have to practice what they have learned on the reduction of prejudice. If they don't practice what they have been taught, all is lost.

Prejudice will not fade completely away. There is prejudice in everyone, even though many are afraid to admit it. I think a person grows up with prejudice. He learns it from his environment. If his environment can be reduced of prejudice, the individual will be reduced of it.

The student first concerns himself with education about prejudice (lines 4-6). The wording gives no hint of the source or the extent of the "education" (also referred to in line 10). The term might refer to coursework in social studies in the public schools; to editorials and news articles in newspapers and magazines; to the teachings of religious groups; or to the campaigns of such organizations as the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People. Further analysis and more evidence seem needed here. "The reduction of prejudice" (line 13) is general and vague, and gives no idea of what the student means—friendship, co-operation, or the
avoidance of race riots, for instance. Another high-level abstraction used is "environment" (line 21). To what aspects, what parts of the aggregate of surrounding conditions and influences is the student referring? The term is all embracing.

Along with these abstractions, a number of generalizations are used in this response. The statement that prejudice "is reducing with time" (lines 3-4) needs considerable detailed proof; statistical evidence, for example, would be helpful. The assertion may be true; but the reader is given no basis for making a decision. Next, the statement that "if the people don't practice what they have been taught, all is lost" (lines 14-15) does not convey accurately the idea which the student apparently has in mind. Racial prejudice can result in lynchings, for example; but to say that "all is lost" seems to amount to considerable extrapolation. The reasoning in the third paragraph, furthermore, is interesting; but it is based on broad assumptions which require more analysis and care than the student has given. To say that the individual learns prejudice from his environment seems, in a sense, fairly safe, because no one really knows exactly what the student means. Nothing is told about the causes, the amount, or the seriousness of the often-referred-to prejudice. The student simply maintains that the individual acquires the unfavorable ideas from his world.

Question (Sociology 507). How would you assess the importance of culture in accounting for one's personality?
Sociology answer 33. Let us see first what one's personality is composed of.

There are five factors which affect personality: mass communication, interpersonal relations, biological heredity, natural environment, and culture. We also have three psychological factors which influence our personality; these are sensations, which is the response given to any applied stimulus; drives, which we have discussed in the previous section; and capabilities. There are more or less inborn traits which are later shaped by our culture. The group we belong to bears great weight in formulating one's personality. For example, the sex, race, social class, occupation, or nation all tend to shape our attitudes, beliefs, reactions, biases, etc., which in effect is our personality.

My final statement will be that there is a very great importance between culture and personality, for 99% of what we are we obtain from our culture. Man does not shape culture; rather, culture shapes him.

First of all, the high level of abstraction in the first twelve lines will be noted. The eight "factors" are listed without comment and without explanation. Second, the "traits" mentioned in line 13 are not even listed. Now in line 14, the student begins to answer the examination question directly. He apparently intends that the sweeping statement in lines 14-16 shall be supported and explained by the following sentence. That sentence (lines 16-21), however, containing a succession of such unqualified high-level abstractions as "social class" and "attitudes," is on as high a level of abstraction as the sentence which it is intended to clarify. The combination of vagueness and assurance is further complicated by the repetition found in lines 21-26.
Question (Sociology 622). Write an essay which reveals what you think the main principles developed in the course are. Do not simply list them, but write an essay about them which tries to indicate the relationship among them, something of their importance, etc.

Sociology answer 80. Every person seeks to adjust to the prevailing social cultural situation. In finding his place, his class, sex, age, and membership may impede his placement, as every person reflects the culture from which he is derived. His ease of adjustment is determined somewhat by the flexibility and diversity of his social techniques derived culturally [high-level abstraction]. We should note the importance of training and the absence or presence of factors which facilitate this training, such as material rewards for learning, characteristically lacking in lower-class families.

The minority adapts majority values, which places a great burden on those who racially or religiously cannot conform too [high-level abstraction, with sweeping generalization]. A danger is that in adapting these values there the individual may become what he is said to be.

Social pressure is put to bear on any individualistic way of acting or thinking [high-level abstraction, with sweeping generalization], thereby assuring the prevailing culture of continuity, a kind of circular reinforcement. Failure to adjust results in frustration and may result in breakdown. Our culture, for example, does not provide for the sex deviate, who very frequently pays the price in psychic disorder.

This desire to be a part of the social-cultural situation results in a kind of average position (neutral emotional content) [high-level abstraction, with sweeping generalization].

The high-order abstractions used in Sociology answers 33, 58, and 80, then, communicate vague, general impressions because the terms are not qualified. Often, in using such words, the students omit
significant and relevant aspects of the meaning of the terms. Under these circumstances, there is an opportunity—if not a temptation—to use broad statements which seem profound and final. In these generalizations, as in the abstractions, the reader finds oversimplification, often exaggeration. These qualities can probably be attributed to signal reaction to ideas and words—a reaction which often seems present in these responses.

**Symbols.** As has been noted before, in the use of symbols, word is confused with object. In the responses considered below, however, the confusion of word with object is not explicit. There is, though, the implicit assumption that the symbol will refer to what the student wishes it to refer to, and that the use of such a symbol will solve problems and influence events.

In Sociology answers 35, 55, and 60, to follow, symbols are used with unqualified high-level abstractions.

**Question (Sociology 60u). Discuss briefly the topic, "The Reduction of Prejudice."**

**Sociology answer 60.** It is hard to discuss prejudice without bringing discrimination into the discussion. The two seem to go hand in hand, but don't always do so. There are four types of people: (1) the non-prejudiced non-discriminator; (2) the non-prejudiced discriminator; (3) the prejudiced non-discriminator; (4) the prejudiced discriminator. The ideal situation would be, to my way of thinking, the first type of person on the list; that is, the non-prejudiced non-discriminator. I think eventually this may come about. I think it is possible for everyone in the
world to live free, equal, and happy.  
This can be brought about only by time  
and education, I think. By education,  
I mean education in the democratic  
process, the democratic way of life. It  
will come about only by educating our  
children and our children's children,  
and, in turn, their children, that all  
peoples have the right to freedom,  
equality, and happiness. We must teach  
them to be open-minded and to think for  
themselves. We must teach our children  
to be flexible in their thinking, to  
believe in the facts until new facts  
are found and proved to be facts, then  
to change their beliefs to these. We  
must teach them to have the scientific  
mind and point of view. If we can teach  
them this, there is no doubt in my mind  
but that prejudice will be reduced and  
in time even obliterated.

In using the phrase, "the democratic process, the democratic way of life" (lines 20-21), the student offers no explanation. His attitude appears to be that the use of the phrase will solve the problem under consideration and will influence events. The quoted group of words may have a definite significance for the student, but—because the referent is not clear—not for the reader. Because the phrase goes beyond the idea of a form of government in which the people rule themselves either directly or through representatives, and involves major ideas in political science and in philosophy, questions of meaning may arise. The referents of "freedom, equality, and happiness" (lines 25-26) are no clearer than that of "the democratic process." Since there are no such observable phenomena in the experiential world, the reader has some difficulty in knowing with any degree of precision what the student has in mind. Repetition alone
does not necessarily result in clarification.

Question (Sociology 507). How would you assess the importance of culture in accounting for one's personality?

Sociology answer 35. It has been shown, as with the deaf mutes in the outside readings, that culture is a much more powerful determinant upon one's personality than both geographic and hereditary factors. Climate may easily be changed; one inherits only the tendencies toward a certain impediment or disadvantage. But socialization is an entirely different matter. Every contact which is made becomes forever affixed to the subconscious or the "inner man" as it is referred to in Ephesians, 3:16. Just now psychologists are beginning to realize the true import of the subconscious.

Our culture is a continuous cycle of frustrations imposed upon us by the restraints of folkways, mores, beliefs, etc. A well-rounded personality is one that is able to adjust to these frustrations with little trouble, whereas inability to cope with these restraints causes malformation of the personality and maladjustments of it.

I might say that as far as I am concerned, none of these are hereditary:

1. Feeblemindedness
2. Deafness, dumbness
3. Tendency to mania
4. Any kind of mental deformity

The Scripture points out that these are not hereditary, and this has been affirmed, at least in the one instance in the outside readings, by sociologists and psychologists.

In this answer, the meaning seems to depend largely on "subconscious" and "frustrations." The respondent apparently intended to define the first of these by using the reference in line 13. Now, in the verse specified, Paul prays that God "would grant you, according to
the riches of his glory, to be strengthened with might by his Spirit
in the inner man." This attempt to define one high-order abstraction
by identifying it with another high-level abstraction blurs the
meaning of both terms. Moreover, through the is of identity, "culture"
is defined as a series of "frustrations" imposed by "restraints."
"Frustrations," however, is not defined, but is repeated in line 22.
These terms are employed as if their use—by and of itself—would
answer the question posed.

It will be observed, furthermore, that the sequence of ideas is
not entirely clear, especially from line 9 on. Weakness in transition
is accompanied by inclusion of apparently irrelevant material, as in
lines 26-36.

Question (Sociology 604). Discuss briefly the topic, "The
Reduction of Prejudice."

Sociology answer 55. I have tried a
1 Little reducing of prejudice myself.
2 Unfortunately, I took the wrong kind of
3 person, a man of 52, set in his ways.
4 After much preaching, he looked at me
5 with pity in his eyes and said, "It
6 isn't your fault you have these ideas;
7 it's the way they are teaching nowadays."
8 This 52-year-old man is not an ignorant
9 man; he is a well-respected doctor with
10 a large practice. You might look at the
11 situation and think that only the older
12 generation are so awfully prejudiced,
13 but then you talk with your peers, and
14 they argue and think they end the final
15 point by saying, "Would you want your
16 daughter to marry a Negro?" This I can't
17 say. I have no daughter; so I don't know
18 how to think about it. People say that
19 to reduce prejudice, educate. I think
20 you must not only educate, but most
21 important, understand, come into
22 contact, exchange ideas. Start your
23
children right away with healthy attitudes toward racial and ethnic groups; let the school and churches handle the situation in the right way so as not to promote prejudice [symbols, with unqualified high-level abstractions]. If the family, school, and church work together, surely there would be a reduction of prejudice.

In Sociology answers 35, 55, and 60, symbols are repeated without explanation and without hesitation. The use of these terms without referents leaves the reader without a ground for understanding. For example, "Let the school and churches handle the situation concerning race prejudice in the right way so as not to promote prejudice" (response #55, lines 26-28) might mean to the student, an avoidance of ideas that might be labeled "controversial"; it might mean to the reader, on the other hand, a clear understanding of similarities and differences among people of different social and ethnic groups, as well as of related potential problems and of feasible solutions. The use of such terms alone results, then, in hazy communication. Equally significant, it shows the student's belief in the virtue of the words themselves.

Contexts. In the responses under this heading, unexpected shifts in meaning occur. In Sociology answers 14 and 25, which follow, such shifts are accompanied by the use of unexplained high-order abstractions.

Question (Sociology 507). While all societies have the same basic social institutions, such institutions vary greatly. How do you account for this fact?
Sociology answer 14. These institutions vary greatly, I believe, because they have different societies to serve in, and different means of service. The modern religious institution varies greatly from the primitive religious institution because the societies and culture are so different, although in this case the institution serves the same end in both.

The folkways and mores of the particular society and culture in which the institution exists have much to do with the variability. No society has all the same folkways and mores; therefore not all institutions in all societies can be exactly similar, and the services will vary.

Variability is one of the characteristics of social institutions.

In this discussion of social institutions, the meaning of "serve" and "service" appears to shift considerably. In line 3, "serve" seems to mean "have existence in"; but in line 9, "works toward." "Service" (line 4) means, as far as can be told, "helpfulness" or "beneficence"; on the other hand, in line 17, the significance appears to be the general one of "good works." The "services" of the varying institutions are not revealed.

These shifts in meaning are accompanied by the use of a rather high level of abstraction in the discussion of the folkways and mores (lines 11-18). The student asserts, with little explanation, that there is a connection between folkways and mores and the variation in institutions -- and disarms criticism by using "exactly" (line 17). The last two lines merely paraphrase a part of the examination question.
Question (Sociology 507). What relation do you see between culture and the so-called drives?

Sociology answer 25. The different cultures have brought different means for accommodating the various drives. Our ideas and methods of indulging our drives [Shifts in meaning, with high-level abstraction. See also lines 14, 17-18] will vary as our culture varies. Example: Sex among young people (junior and senior high school age) is frowned upon in the United States. However, in many of the Pacific Islands, sex is indulged in at a very early age. Therefore, I would say that the culture has a direct relation with the satisfaction of the drives. The folkways and mores which are a part of the culture play an important part in the approval or suppression of the various drives.

The psychological as well as the verbal contexts seem faulty in Sociology answers 14 and 25. The shifts in meaning shown in these responses indicate uncertainty, if not haziness, in thinking, as is evidenced by occasional hedging and lack of coherence. Moreover, the students seem to desire to cover as much ground as possible in their discussions, even at the risk of overlapping and repetition. The changes in point of view, then, are revealed in the thinking as well as in the words.

Uses of to be. The careless use of forms of to be brings with it many difficulties and problems, such as projection, the apparent attainment of finality in analysis and evaluation, and differences in impressions caused by the use of high-level abstractions after forms of to be.
In the responses in the first of the two groups under this heading (Sociology answers 9, 23, 68, 51, and 86, to follow), one finds the pseudo-finality mentioned, combined with a number of unqualified high-level abstractions.

Question (Sociology 507). What relation do you see between culture and the so-called drives?

Sociology answer 23. I do not see any relation between culture and drives because culture is a learned behaviour and drives are inborn. Drives are inborn and hereditary and are not brought about by the culture of a society, whereas culture is learned and passed-on behaviour and is not inborn like instincts. Culture is only taught to a child by someone who has already attained it and can pass it on to the next generation.

A drive, such as the sex drive, etc., is born into a person, and this person does not have to be taught this certain drive, but it is passed to them through their parents' germ plasm.

It will be noted that the student has used the is of identity to equate "culture" and "learned behaviour" (line 3), and the is of classification to describe "drives" as "inborn" (line 4). After adding to the description of drives by using "hereditary" (line 5)—again employing the is of classification—the student, instead of adducing evidence, simply reiterates, in lines 7-9, the comment about the nature of culture. Moreover, the statement in lines 9-12 seems to be more of a paraphrase than an explanation; it seems as abstract as the response as a whole. One cannot, after all, help admiring persistence: In the second paragraph, the student has an opportunity to analyze, to explain, to illustrate. Instead, he
repeats the second of the two ideas on which the answer is based:

that drives are inborn.

**Question (Sociology 622).** Write an essay which reveals what you think the main principles developed in the course are. Do not simply list them, but write an essay about them which tries to indicate the relationship among them, something of their importance, etc.

*Sociology answer 68.* ...

**Circular reinforcement** is a basic principle in everything we have studied. If people don't know how other cultures live, they are content and don't care to change, but if they do know and are disappointed, then they cause trouble within the culture.

Cultural determinism is a basic principle. People do as other people do as a result of learning from the teacher and parents, and culture is the determinant of what people do.

The confidence that the student feels in the validity of his judgments shows throughout the discussion. The is of classification is used repeatedly (lines 2, 5, and 6) and seems especially noticeable in the statements about circular reinforcement and about cultural determinism (lines 1-3 and 9-10). The reader will note that no exceptions are made in the first sentence, and that the comprehensive term "basic" appears in lines 2 and 9. The student uses the is of identity nearly as often as he employs the is of classification: in line 9, to identify "cultural determinism" with "principle," and in line 12, to equate "culture" with "determinant." Finally, then, is noticeable throughout the discussion; other choices, other approaches, are ruled out.
Question (Sociology 604). Discuss briefly the topic, "The Reduction of Prejudice."

Sociology answer 54. Research indicates certain things in our efforts to reduce prejudice. Although they are only the best current information we have, they can only be applied even if they leave many conclusions to be desired.

1. Auditory rather than visual aids are most effective.
2. Printed matter is not as effective as the spoken word.
3. If propaganda comes at the receptive thought from all instruments of communication, it is most effective.
4. Cultural stereotypes are the result of ignorance and irrationality.
5. The spoken word is more effective in smaller groups rather than in larger ones.

First, in lines 3-4, the finality resulting from the use of the is of identity is increased by the employment —perhaps sarcastic— of "only." The student furnishes no support for this somewhat confused statement. Second, it will be observed that forms of to be are used in each of the five sentences (lines 7-18). The combination of the is of identity, the is of classification, and the clipped, authoritative phrasing gives these statements an impressive certitude. The reader finds, however, no explanation of either the assertions or of the nature of the "auditory and visual aids" referred to in line 7, or of the "propaganda" mentioned in line 11. The student contends without clarifying or substantiating.

Question (Sociology 507). While all societies have the same basic social institutions, such institutions vary greatly. How do you account for this fact?

Sociology answer 9. Two people, upon being presented with the same problem, would probably solve it differently. This also
holds for the groups which make up our society.

I believe that the social institutions are manifestations of man's needs. He has designed them to help him have a desirable existence on earth [dead-level abstraction].

The most basic of all man's needs, such as hunger, thirst, shelter, sex, are universal, and hence the basic social institutions are the same throughout the world [is of classification, with finality and high-level abstraction]. The variance lies in man factors.

First of all, it is obvious [is of classification, with finality] that every man will not solve a given problem the same. Each man on earth has been brought up differently, no matter how hard you try to subject them to the same conditions.

The factors accounting for this are the person's hereditary, environmental, and cultural factors [is of identity, with high-level abstraction and finality]. No two persons are born with the same hereditary factors. This affects the person and in turn society. The environmental conditions of two men may be similar but can never be exactly alike; so this affects man and society. Cultural factors differ from place to place and vary from time to time so that they play an important role in the aspects of society. Hence the variance of these factors throughout the societies of the world has much to do with the variance of social institutions. These factors affect man, and the institutions in turn are affected by man.

The institutions change with time even within one society or group to meet the changing needs of the people [dead-level abstraction]. They are not static but dynamic to the will of the people [is of classification, with finality and high-level abstraction].

An institution may grow up for a specific need and later lose that purpose. It is these institutions that are usually abolished. A new one may take its place.
Question (Sociology 622). Write an essay which reveals what you think the main principles developed in the course are. Do not simply list them, but write an essay about them which tries to indicate the relationship among them, something of their importance, etc.

Sociology answer 86. I think that I say in relation to class and personality that people just don't pick their friends because of class but because of attitudes, values, etc., which are related to class. It appeared as though we could see this in friendship scores that were tabulated. According to which class you belonged, you know there are certain child-rearing habits, but we cannot actually say that they directly affect the personality. Erickson's study on child rearing showed us that.

From Davis and Dallard's chapters we could see that different variables can lead to the same type of personality [dead-level abstraction]. They both had the same type of personality, but they got this way from different backgrounds.

We could say that another principle is that various physiological disorders, according to Reusch, have a correlation with parent-child relationships.

Minorities are what they are mainly because they are made this way by the majority groups [finality, with high-level abstraction]. They are forced to be clannish since they can't always be with the majority group.

In middle-class schools, there seems to be circular reinforcement of regards for teacher, family, and clique, according to Davis and Dallard.

In relation to sex and age, we can say that role and status vary according to various cultures - Margaret Mead. In other cultures the role may be so entirely different for a woman than it is in ours. At various times our roles change, and there is a variation from our adjustment to these different roles. There is a relation to clarity, consistency, and compatibility. In changing to new roles, there is a connection between whether it
is related to our goals, how much, and
how much we have seen it in practice
[finality, with high-level abstraction].
This is part of Cottrell's proposition.
Women are not necessarily frail, and it
has been shown in spite of definite
physiological differences that they can
take on "masculine tasks."

There is definite contrast of what
is expected of our age-sex roles in
adolescence and in adulthood [finality,
with high-level abstraction]. Benedict
shows us this. Queener relates to us
about the sex variable in relation to our
roles and age groups.

From all these readings, you can get
principles, but these are about the main
things in relation to class, minorities,
and age and sex.

Consideration of Sociology answers 9, 23, 54, 68, and 86
indicates that the students feel certain that their judgments are
tenable— in fact, unquestionable. That assurance is shown time after
time in assertions made by means of the is of identity and the is of
classification. These statements, practically without exception, are
expressed in highly abstract terms, and are therefore difficult to
interpret and to evaluate. The certitude thus shown is further
emphasized by repetition, usually of one or two ideas which the
students seem especially attached to and which they consider funda-
mental in the discussions.

In a second group of responses (Sociology answers 59, 61, and
67, which follow), the use of forms of to be is accompanied by high-
level abstractions and by looseness in thought.

Question (Sociology 604). Why do the biological scientists
disagree as much as they do in their classification of
mankind into races?
Sociology answer 59. Biological scientists have found that it is difficult to pigeonhole man. Races do not fit in categories specifically as do material items. The differences and traits are dynamic and not static. The differences vary to a great extent and are too slight, and a fine line of division is difficult to draw. After they are able to get a majority of the races into a class, there are still a large number that don't fit any of these groups, such as the Australian aborigines. They will have some that are Caucasians, some Negroid, and some predominantly of the others, so that it is difficult to fit in a set pattern. All the differences overlap a great deal also. Another great hindrance to biologists in categorizing the races is that it is difficult to determine what factors to attribute to race and what not to.

In a comparatively brief discussion, the student has used the phrase "difficult" (lines 2, 5, 7, 8, 16, and 20). The repetition of the phrase apparently constitutes in the student's mind an adequate and satisfactory answer to the examination question. In spite of the assurance behind the phrase, however, several questions remain unanswered; and the thinking as a whole appears unsystematic. The student might well have explained, for example, how the differences which "vary to a great extent" (line 7) are too slight for purposes of classification, as well as how the differences "overlap a great deal" (line 18). Through most of the discussion, moreover, the student stays on a high level of abstraction. He gives no hint, for example, of what he means by "dynamic differences and traits" (lines 5-6).
Question (Sociology 622). Write an essay which reveals what you think the main principles developed in the course are. Do not simply list them, but write an essay about them which tries to indicate the relationship among them, something of their importance, etc.

Sociology answer 67. ...Western culture seems to magnify the presence of status and roles. It seems that whatever doubt is shown in these primitive societies, etc., western culture determines whether behaviours are correct or not, and this is the source of the differences. The whites are the majority group; so whatever they give of minority groups or of certain roles which are played, they are correct, and the minority is supposed to sit by and act by the definition.

In looking over the passage, the reader will note, first of all, that the reference of the pronoun this (line 6) is not clear. He will also observe that, though the statement seems to involve major concepts in sociology, anthropology, history, political science, and philosophy, no evidence is given. The assertion in lines 6-7 remains unsupported. The finality resulting from the use of the is of identity is accompanied, paradoxically, by obscurity. Lines 3-6, with their opposition of "doubt" to the determination of correctness of behaviour, seem practically incoherent, as do lines 8-10. "Whatever they [the whites] give of minority groups or of certain roles which are played" does not appear to convey a clear, unmistakable meaning; nor does the comment, in lines 11-12, concerning the vague submission shown by the undescribed minority. The reader is left with only a vague idea of what it is that the student is so certain about.

Question (Sociology 604). Why do the biological scientists disagree as much as they do in their classification of mankind into races?
Sociology answer 61. The research on race classification is valid. The men who have done this research have decided that though people are different in intelligence, they are certain that there is no pure race. The categories of race are useful as statistics only. It is difficult to classify them in any other way. The bases for classification are indefinite [forms of to be, with high-level abstraction and looseness of thought].

Sociology answers 59, 61, and 67, like the responses in the preceding group, reveal the certitude of the students, and contain the vagueness—sometimes, the obscurity—that results from unskillful use of forms of to be with high-order abstractions. But in numbers 59, 61, and 67, the thinking seems markedly unclear. To the reader, the discussions seem disjointed and repetitious. The students are inclined to cling to a few words and use them repeatedly, then jump to another aspect of the examination question or discussion topic. In these responses, the reader will note this combination of the use of verbal counters—symbols—and the lack of systematic thinking.

Two-valued orientation. In the first group of responses (Sociology answers 19, 22, 31, and 81, to follow), one finds, besides two-valued orientation, high-level abstraction, the use of forms of to be, and emotive language.

Question (Sociology 507). Many experts say that the trouble with the family institution is that it has steadily lost its function. What would you say to this?

Sociology answer 22. The functions the experts consider are those such as child education, care of old persons, making of clothing, etc. Although it is true
that the family has lost these functions, I don't believe that their loss is the family's trouble. The family institution has taken on many new functions for the ones it has lost. In our present day, the man of the house may not grow his own family's food, but he must work elsewhere to provide money to purchase food. The women of the house don't make the clothing any more, but they must go to a store to buy it. Therefore, it is evident that for every function the family loses, new ones appear.

The two basic functions, satisfaction of the spouse's sex drives, and the bearing and rearing of children, are still those of the family institution. While these two basic functions are still attributable to the family institution, I don't think the real family will have too much trouble. I'd like to clarify my idea of a real family. By this I mean a man and wife who really want to make a go of their marriage. The real trouble with the family institution is that it's too easy to say "quits." You just trot off to Reno and get a divorce. Another trouble is birth control. The most number of divorces occur in childless unions. If people would have more children to think about, they wouldn't have time to think about reasons for getting separated.

I believe the experts at present are looking more and more towards these two points as the real reason for conflict in the family institution.

The student has built the two-valued orientation on two sets of diametrically opposed ideas: (1) the "man and wife who really want to make a go of their marriage" (lines 27-29) as contrasted with those who say "quits" too readily (line 31); (2) a husband and wife who have a number— the student does not specify how many— of children "to
think about" (lines 35-36) as contrasted with married couples who
"have time to think about reasons for being separated" (lines 37-38).
The student seems to have made no allowance for such matters as
temperament, finances, and degrees of intelligence, or for the theory
that in a close relationship such as marriage, sincerity alone may not
be enough for the maintenance of a successful marriage. Men and women,
it has been said, are a little lower than the angels.

The black-and-white opposition that constitutes the two-valued
orientation is strengthened by the certainty expressed through the use
of forms of to be and of connotation, as well as of high-order
abstraction. Examples of the use of the is of classification and the
is of identity will be found in lines 6 and 22. Even more authori-
tative seem the statements combining forms of to be with connota-
tive terms, as in lines 4 and 30. Finally, the statements that a
"real family" will not have "too much trouble (lines 24-25) and that
"it's too easy to say 'quits!'" (lines 30-31) seem, because of their
high level of abstraction, to need clarifying details.

Question (Sociology 622). Write an essay which reveals
what you think the main principles developed in the
course are. Do not simply list them, but write an
essay about them which tries to indicate the relation-
ship among them, something of their importance, etc.

Sociology answer 81. ...It seems obvious
that our whole culture needs revisions.
Because we do not provide for the deviates
we get homosexuality. Because there is
such a cleavage between male-female
roles, there is confusion and frustration
in this society. Because each class
prescribes the behaviour for its members
which is often contrary to the actual
practice, we turn out confused,
frustrated individuals. Because the minority group accepts the definition the majority group gives them and does nothing constructive about erasing this definition, we are going around in a vicious circle. Perhaps we, the educated, civilized people could take lessons from the poor uncivilized peoples concerning how to meet the needs of the individuals in our society.

In lines 3-4, the respondent has oversimplified a difficult problem. The meaning of "provide for" is not clarified here or in the succeeding lines of the answer. Lines 4-7 seem to be equally final, as well as repetitious. Conviction is accompanied by connotation, as shown in the use of "confusion and frustration" (line 6), echoed in "confused and frustrated" (lines 10-11, terms which are unqualified and unexplained. Moreover, forms of to be are used in lines 4 and 6, and add to the finality of the comments. Here, then, one finds not only the black-and-white presentation that constitutes the two-valued orientation but a consistently high level of abstraction, emotive language, and assurance.

Question (Sociology 507). How would you assess the importance of culture in accounting for one's personality?

Sociology answer 31. The culture in which we live plays a very important part in the forming of our personality. The personality of a poor boy in the United States, with its culture of material needs and wealth [dead-level abstraction] would have one type of personality, while a poor boy in our culture where there is no emphasis on material wealth will have quite another type of personality [two-valued orientation, with high-level abstraction]. Many of the taboos which we know in our cultures on the different drives which cause frustration and maladjustment in the
personality are absent in the cultures [dead-level abstraction, with the is of classification]. I feel that culture has a direct relationship to our personality.

Question (Sociology 507). Many experts say that the trouble with the family institution is that it has steadily lost its function. What would you say to this?

Sociology answer 19. The fact that the family institution has lost most of its functions is true to a certain extent, but this is not the only reason the family is less stable.

In the first place, laws concerning divorce have become so lax that anyone who wants a divorce badly enough can get one. Secondly, laws were made for woman suffrage. This was a mistake, for this led to other things that give women as much power as the men, thereby taking them away from their homes [finality, with high-level abstraction, forms of to be, and connotation]. This factor is only made worse when one finds that most of the women usually vote the way their husbands do, and don't show a mind of their own in that respect. In the third place, many modern conveniences have been invented to ease the household worries of the woman. So, the woman is given more time to do as she pleases. Therefore, the fact that the family has lost most of its functions (such as education, farming, etc.) cannot be the fundamental cause of the declining family institution, for many of the original functions are still present, even though they may not be prominent [finality, with high-level abstraction, forms of to be, and connotation].

Study of Sociology answers 19, 22, 31, and 81 shows that the two-valued orientation contained therein may be classed as overt rather than implicit. The students who have written these discussions are certain that they have the truth; they have phrased
their judgments in flat statements, unmodified by hesitation or qualification, no matter how profound or complicated the problem under consideration. (Such flat statements can be most easily expressed on a fairly high level of abstraction: "No harm can come to a good man.") In the second place, the use of forms of to be in these responses comes as no surprise, for the is of identity and the is of classification do not lend themselves readily to qualification. The connotative terms used—often linked, too, with primary certitude—reveal the emotion back of many of these responses.

A second group of responses (Sociology answers 21, 24, and 65, which are considered below) show two-valued orientation in a slightly different manner.

**Question (Sociology 507).** What relation do you see between culture and the so-called drives?

**Sociology answer 24.** To me, the inter-relationship between the culture and the so-called drives consists of the bases that determine what social institutions shall be. Our desires for sex, association, shelter, food, etc., all stem from drives and result in the institutions of marriage, community, family, and production. The origin of religion, possibly, does not fall in this category. The family seems most exemplary of this interrelationship. For if it were not for the sex drive, would our family exist as it does? I think not. The very definition of a social institution proves this relationship. It is supposed to satisfy basic human wants and needs. And basic human wants stem, for the most part, from drives.

The two-valued orientation appears in this response, though much less openly than in the answers just considered. The student,
in his comment on the existence of the family (lines 11-14) offers a
restricted choice—and weights it with the phrase "as it does" (line
14), as well as with the form of a rhetorical question. Second, in
defining "social institution" and in commenting on "human wants," the
student shows in the use of "the very definition" (lines 14-15 and
"It is supposed" (lines 16-17)—as well as in the clipped sentences—
that he is certain that he has the right interpretation. Third, the
oversimplification—also based on abstraction—in lines 5-9 shows
implicit two-valued orientation: Desires stem from drives and result
in institutions. The sentence referred to appears to be a shorthand
version of a complicated matter; and such oversimplification often
lends additional assurance to a student attempting to analyze a
difficult problem.

Question (Sociology 622). Write an essay which reveals what
you think the main principles developed in the course are.
Do not simply list them, but write an essay about them which
tries to indicate the relationship among them, something of
their importance, etc.

Sociology answer 65. If an individual
deviates from the norms of his group, he
finds himself an outsider. Thus, a person
with the social standards of a lower-
class member and the economic status of
an upper-class member tends to find
himself in a void. He must bring these
values to a state of equilibrium or else
find another person who is in the same
position...

In lines 7-10, one finds an example of two-valued orientation,
stated quietly but unmistakably. The reader may wonder just how
undescribed "values" may be brought to an unknown "equilibrium"; but
he is not enlightened. The choice remains: "equilibrium" or
"finding" another person who is in the same position; no middle ground is offered. The language appears to be moderate; but only two opposed choices are offered. Second, in lines 1-3, one who "deviates from the norms of his group" will find himself an "outsider." No information about the "norms" or the meaning of "outsider" is supplied; and lines 3-7, in which the student apparently intends to explain the first sentence, are on the same high level of abstraction. Thus the student, certain of the validity of the two alternatives, has neither explained nor qualified them.

Question (Sociology 507). Many experts say that the trouble with the family institution is that it has steadily lost its function. What would you say to this?

Sociology answer 21. The family institution has lost most of its functions because of the urbanization of modern life brought about by an increased population, a wide assortment of job opportunities, better schooling, a greater variety of social ties, and various other reasons. It is through this urbanization that people have become interdependent with one another, while a century and a half ago, the family was almost a self-supporting unit. They raised their own livestock and plants from which they made their food. Their clothing was woven from these same sources, and their shelter was built from the forest. Likewise the educational and religious functions were performed by the family institution because of the poor transportation facilities.

We thus see that the original statement cannot be made because this uprooting of the family institution is an inevitable result of urbanization ["two-valued orientation, with high-level abstraction and primary certitude"].
In the comments on the answers in the first group under the heading *two-valued orientation*, the writer stated that such an orientation was explicit in the responses. In Sociology answers 24, 65, and 21, on the other hand, two-valued orientation seems to be implicit—present in the psychological context as much as in the verbal context. Now, the reduction of problems to simple terms of correct and incorrect, good and bad, may be considered to be the essence of two-valued orientation. Back of that reduction, in the responses just quoted, appears the assurance necessary to such oversimplification, and the use of abstract terms which assist in the process. Even though the students *appear* to maintain objectivity, they reveal their conviction that their answers are the *only* tenable ones.

**Connotation.** In the first group of responses (Sociology answers 16, 20, and 28, which are considered below), the use of connotative terms is combined with high-order abstractions and confusion in thought.

**Question (Sociology 507).** Many experts say that the trouble with the family institution is that it has steadily lost its function. What would you say to this?

**Sociology answer 16.** The family is definitely becoming smaller and less stable. They might say that it is not performing one of its basic functions of rearing children well any longer. There...
is less care of the aged and less respect for elders in America. The home is no longer the center of recreation. The members go outside to seek more modern and exciting modes of recreation. The home is no longer a self-sacrificing economic unit. The emphasis on religion is declining. The politics of the home are changing. The mother is gaining in her prestige. Many mothers are now in industry and don't perform the motherly tasks of yesterday. More and more, education is left to be gotten outside the home.

There are all definite changes in the family institution, but I don't feel that it has lost most of its function or is declining. The whole world is dynamic and changing, and if all the aspects would not change with it, it would be in the same predicament as a "cultural lag." I feel that this is primarily an adjustment to the new ideas and situations that we are confronted with. If this institution did not change with the times, it is liable to lose its usefulness and may drop out of the culture. Since it is based on the basic drive of sex and perpetuation of the species, man makes sure that it is up to date so that it will remain in the culture. These two basic principles of the family just mentioned could be performed outside of the family, but man has found this the most acceptable and one of the best ways of performing them.

The family has been modernized.

In this response, the student first describes the family as "less stable" (lines 2-3), probably referring, as later comment indicates, to the results on family life of the growing "prestige" of women, and of the increasing number of women working outside the home. The comment that "the home is no longer a self-sacrificing unit" (lines 10-12) is not clarified. After these negative remarks, the student uses a series of connotative words and phrases, on which much
of the meaning of the discussion depends. First, in his description of the world as "dynamic and changing" (line 24), the student apparently refers obliquely to "cultural lag," the continued existence of obsolete institutional ideas and forms. Two other terms, both used in connection with the family, are especially connotative: "up to date" (line 36) and "modernized" (line 42). Here, the reader is placed in a dilemma: He must be on the side of the new family look, or be numbered among those who believe in the old—or what the student seems to believe is the passé.

The thinking behind these connotative words may arouse some doubts as to its validity. According to the student, all the "aspects" (line 25) should change with the world. Yet one does not know what is changing, how it is changing, or whether the alteration is logical, appropriate, or expedient. There are simply too many variables in his statement. Second, the change in the family is termed an "adjustment"; but in order to evaluate properly, the reader needs to know much more than the rather abstract comments in the first paragraph, plus the fact that the family is adapting to change. Finally, in asserting that the family is based on the sex drive and that man therefore makes certain that the family is "up to date" (lines 33-37), the student seems to have worked out something of a non sequitur.

Question (Sociology 507). What relation do you see between culture and the so-called drives?

Sociology answer 28. The text says that institutions of our cultures are inter- woven with the drives. Drives give rise
to institutions which may in time grow burdensome and cumbersome, not fulfilling the purpose or original intent — as are our modern-day so-called Christian churches established to point the way to salvation, but which have taken on several other material functions, practically eliminating the original plan of the Church.

Drives may be biological or psychic, both multitudes of institutions which play a most important part in our culture.

The sex drive is a very powerful force for bringing about the institution of marriage, although not solely responsible.

The religious drive, according to the text, is responsible for religion. But please leave salvation out of religion. "Religion," says Matthew Arnold, "is morality touched with emotion."

The Scriptures tell us that salvation is of the Lord. Salvation is the gift of God, not of works (morality) lest any man should so boast.

Man can do nothing to achieve salvation, although he may have a sincere desire to do his best to achieve satisfaction for his religious needs.

All drives must have an outlet, and it is the duty of the culture to produce this outlet.

First, the student maintains, in lines 3-5, that "drives give rise to institutions which may in time grow burdensome and cumbersome." He does not explain, however, how the drives cause the development of the institutions; and the example of the development of the Christian churches seems unclear because the "other material functions," as well as the "original plan of the Church," are not revealed. Instead, the student seems to have depended on the associations of "burdensome," "cumbersome," and "original" as a substitute for explanation and support. This same reliance on connotation is shown in the second and
third paragraphs: "important" (line 15) and "powerful" (line 17).

Confusion in thinking is also shown in the student's determination to write about salvation -- the theme dominates lines 23-34, though the application does not seem altogether clear -- and in faulty organization of ideas in the response as a whole. Adequate transition, especially, is lacking. The answer contains more sincere emotion than clear logic.

Question (Sociology 507). Many experts say that the trouble with the family institution is that it has steadily lost its functions. What would you say to this?

Sociology answer 20. The family institution, according to the text, has two distinct functions:
1. Sexual satisfaction of male and female
2. Care and rearing of children

Insofar as the family is concerned, if either of the two is missing, then the family is not helping its role in society [connotation, with high-level abstraction].

Most divorces have been shown to stem from sexual incompatibility, the first function and, according to the Scriptures, the primary one [connotation, with high-level abstraction and looseness of thought].

Even though care of children is relatively less important, the family would have difficulty functioning adequately without, as in the case of animals, replenishing their kind.

In the responses considered above (Sociology answers 16, 20, and 28), a comparatively large number of connotative words are used. These terms are vague, often highly abstract; and their elasticity of meaning leads easily to confused thinking as well as to signal reaction. The use of such terms overrides argument and analysis. Second, the thinking in these responses is based on reaction to words rather than
to ideas in the experiential world. The discussions seem disjointed, and indicate a lack of clear knowledge as well as of objectivity on the part of the students.

Connotation is combined with high-level abstraction and two-valued orientation in Sociology answers 17, 48, and 51, which are considered below.

Question (Sociology 604). Discuss briefly the topic, "The Reduction of Prejudice."

Sociology answer 48. In referring to the term prejudice, I must first state that it can have both good and bad connotations. In this case, I am taking the term to have a bad connotation. In other words, I will refer to prejudice as being connected with discrimination and inequality.

I think all of us want to reduce prejudice in this sense. One people can live peacefully with another, although the customs may differ. An example is the peoples of Switzerland. One way of reducing racial relations and problems is by different people getting together and having open and free discussions of their problems. Groups must attempt to understand the problems of other groups. Forced aggressive change resulting in bloodshed may be fast, but I don't think it solves the problem. Education is of prime importance in learning more of others. People may mix more and borrow the good of others' cultures. A powerful weapon in gaining equality is by the use of the ballot and elections.

We can bring up our children at home so that they will accept all people as being equal. With properly trained teachers in the schools, some reduction of prejudice will take place. It is important that people mingle more with others to better understand. Stand on our own feet and see for ourselves, instead of accepting the biasness of others that have no foundation.
Though in the first paragraph, the student has clarified to some extent his interpretation of "prejudice," he has encountered, in the remainder of the response, several difficulties in connection with the use of connotation. First, after using "open and free discussion" (line 15), the student hints at the social importance of such discussion in a republic, but remains rather abstract. One learns little of the nature of the "groups" or of the depth of understanding which they may attain. Second, "forced aggressive changes resulting in bloodshed" (lines 18-19) is cumulative in its effect, and evokes images of revolutions and disastrous change. The communication is impressive without being sufficiently detailed for clarity. Third, though social equality is probably meant in line 24, the verbal context of "equal" (line 29) is so broad that the reader is not at all certain of the meaning which the student intended—whether equality before the law, or rights to life, liberty, and the pursuit of happiness. Finally, "biasness" (line 35) in the context quoted, seems to indicate mistaken opinions; the student does not explain further.

The problems caused by the use of connotation are increased by the two-valued orientation and high-level abstraction. "Stand on our own feet and see for ourselves" (lines 33-34) is placed in direct opposition to "accepting the biasness of others" (lines 35-36), with no other possible choices even hinted at. Even though the preceding material has, to some extent, clarified the first of these quoted statements, the antithesis results in oversimplification. Then, too, the student uses such terms as "education" and "to better understand" with little or no explanation. It appears that in the response as a
whole, the student has not left a rather high level of abstraction.

Question (Sociology 507). Many experts say that the trouble with the family institution is that it has steadily lost its function. What would you say to this?

Sociology answer 17. The family has indeed lost many of its functions. This, however, should not be construed as a criticism of the family institution. The increase in employment, easier means of transportation, has made it more desirable for members of the family to leave and go elsewhere to work and find employment. Through the practice of birth control, families have become smaller, but this is a most desirable thing, regarding the individual concerned, at least, since they are better provided for. Entertainment, education, close companionships can be found more readily outside the family than was previously the case.

In spite of the shift of functions from the family to other institutions, the family still remains as the institution for rearing children, for companionship, love, etc. The shifts have come about in response to the dynamic essence of the institution. Previously the family took care of its sick and aged; the baby was born in the home. Now, with the increase of hospitals, advance in technology, and a change in the political institutions, the function of the family has been reduced and can be better provided by others.

The associations of "desirable" seem to have caused the respondent some trouble. First, in line 7, the term is used in connection with employment. In the incomplete comparison, no reason is given for the increased desirability, and the reader is left wondering whether the reference is to feasibility or to increased income. "Desirable" is used again, in line 11, in which the student asserts that the decrease in size of families "is a most desirable
thing." Apparently—though one is not told—the members of smaller families are "better provided for" in terms of food, clothing, and shelter; for, in lines 14-17, the statement is made that "entertainment, education, close companionship can be found more readily outside the family than was previously the case."

The student has not only depended unduly on evocative terms; he has also oversimplified complex problems. Some children in small families are neglected; on the other hand, many large families are closely knit groups, providing the "companionship" and "love" mentioned in lines 21-22. Finally, though some detail is used, as in lines 4-6, the student has recourse to such high-order abstractions as "the dynamic essence of the institution" (lines 23-24), a phrase only partially explained by the lines which follow.

Question (Sociology 604). Discuss briefly the topic, "The Reduction of Prejudice."

Sociology answer 51. Prejudices are very difficult to get rid of. We can educate the people about majority-minority group status, but we will not eliminate them now. It has been proven that the college graduate is the least prejudiced, this being due to his education [connotation, with high-level abstraction and two-valued orientation].

We can go out and lecture, discuss fully with the people the problems affecting their neighborhoods, families and backgrounds.

The new immigrants should be educated, immediately, on costumes, languages, written and oral, and laws of the land, so they can begin to understand their new heritage.

The exchange of ideas amongst people will further relations and cut down prejudice [connotation, with high-level abstraction and two-valued orientation].
Once a person has a free, open mind and
is willing to at least try to understand
another group, then he is on his way to
eliminate his prejudices. Education and
understanding are what is needed for the
people. Education through the school,
literature, radio, lectures, and even
posters will help. Understanding comes
through the education [connotation, with
high-level abstraction].

In the responses just considered (Sociology answers 17, 48, and 51), one finds a number of problems. Words which are evocative and associative are used in conjunction with highly abstract terms which may mean nearly anything or practically nothing. As we have seen, this combination often occurs in the responses; but in the three answers under consideration, two-valued orientation, with its opposition of two approaches, augments the problems. As a result of this combination, the reader often finds in these answers not only vagueness but also oversimplification.

Metaphor. As the writer has mentioned, the user of metaphor intends to suggest analogies. The reader, however, is as much concerned with the accuracy of the metaphor used as with its vividness. Metaphor, by nature, cannot be entirely accurate; it can, however, be appropriate and illuminating.

In Sociology answers 75 and 76, considered below, metaphor is accompanied by high-level abstraction and by slanting.

Question (Sociology 622). Write an essay which reveals what you think the main principles developed in the course are. Do not simply list them, but write an essay about them which tries to indicate the relationship among them, something of their importance, etc.
Sociology answer 76. When an individual deviates from the core culture, pressure is brought to bear. Pressure may be exerted on him by the primary group until he acts like the "good little man" demanded of his middle-class culture. Later, pressure is brought to bear by his age-mates, teachers, and society. He is taught by a system of punishment and reward the ways his culture wants him to act. The greater the variety of ways he has learned to adjust to his society, the better adjustment he will be able to make. By greater flexibility, he can change from roles of father, husband, son, without creating conflict. By his reacting to these varying social stimuli, the individual represents the culture to which he belongs.

The majority set the cultural role; the minority group accept this role, thereby running into conflict as these characteristics of minority groupness will keep him out of the majority group.

In this response, the use of metaphor is closely connected with the employment of connotation and of abstraction. The first of the metaphors (and perhaps the most explicit of the three in the answer) concerns the individual who is influenced to "act like the 'good little man' demanded of his middle-class society" (lines 5-6). Here we have not only metaphor but also the image of someone too good for this world and trying to live up to what the student seems to feel are rather stupid ideals. Perhaps, the phrasing hints, he may be hypocritical. In lines 14-16, the student combines the abstract and connotative term "flexibility" with the metaphor of a quick-change artist, who has several parts to play. Here, the attitude of the student, in using metaphor, is favorable. The person must have "flexibility," an abstraction with good connotations, in this context.
He must avoid "conflict," equally abstract but with unfavorable connotations here. The ubiquitous "conflict" is involved in lines 20-24; here, the image seems to be of a sort of abstract but undesirable steam roller striking an equally abstract stone wall. There is disagreement, to speak euphemistically; and the indefinite "him" is excluded.

As has been mentioned, the level of abstraction appears to be, in places, high. In lines 16-20, the reader is not informed clearly of the manner of reacting to the "social stimuli" or of the manner or extent of the representation. Vaguely described reactions are cited as a cause of an indefinite representation. The same type of breadth without clarity is shown in lines 20-24, in the use of "conflict" and of "minority groupness." In both of the passages mentioned, faulty sentence structure increases the difficulty of the reader in following the meaning.

Question (Sociology 622). Write an essay which reveals what you think the main principles developed in the course are. Do not simply list them, but write an essay about them which tries to indicate the relationship among them, something of their importance, etc.

Sociology answer 75. ...Minority groups and, I believe social classes and sex groups all accept the stereotype put forth by either the majority group or another group which exerts strong influence. We have studied it in relation to minority-majority group relationships, but here I would like to venture out on my own and use it in reference to sex stereotypes. We all know that aside from the emancipation business in regard to women's status, the prevalent notion is still that of a naive, delicate, domestic type high-level abstraction, with connotation] who take care of the children, the house, etc. Here is where I can say that many women have
accepted this stereotype and many have acted upon it (which would make them inauthentic). They have gone overboard to be like the stereotype or have done the opposite — gone out to seek careers, intellectual pursuits to prove they can "beat" the stereotype and to prove that all women fit it [metaphor, with high-level abstraction and connotation].

In Sociology answers 75 and 76, then, the metaphors, though fairly explicit, do not seem to be particularly appropriate or illuminating. The students tend to forget the risks inherent in the use of metaphor, and to indulge in hobby-horse riding, as the student did in #75, even while writing about what sociologists call stereotypes. In their use of metaphor, the students shift unpredictably from revelation of mild annoyance — or pleasure — to vagueness and to stock responses. Personal connotation and lack of coherence further hinder accurate interpretation by the reader.

In Sociology answers 71 and 85, to follow, one finds distortion of meaning through mixed metaphors, with high-level abstraction.

Question (Sociology 622). Write an essay which reveals what you think the main principles developed in the course are. Do not simply list them, but write an essay about them which tries to indicate the relationship among them, something of their importance, etc.

Sociology answer 85. ...Belonging to social class one can have great prestige. Also through the occupation in which one is employed. The social status falls onto the shoulders of the male. It is he who has the responsibility for setting the roles and status for his wife and children. The struggle for recognition in a society has led to peripheral leadership. In this, the member of a minority group is trying to enter into the majority group and has to go through the socialization of the majority group.
In the first of the three metaphors in the response, there is the figurative mantle falling on the shoulders of the elect (lines 4-5). The reader, however, may wonder whether an abstraction—even though it is partially defined—should fall on anyone or anything. After all, one may feel a responsibility, but one assumes a task. Then, in line 8, the person on whom this status has fallen enters into an undefined "struggle." This skirmish, fight, or battle evidently is not for beliefs, but for an abstract "recognition." Whether this "recognition" means fame and fortune or open-minded acceptance into a social group, the reader is not told. Third, in lines 10-13, the student uses a metaphor which seems to concern someone entering a strait and narrow gate. There is a change in tone here; the individual has to be examined before he can be received. He must undergo a process called "socialization," apparently a comprehension and acceptance of the ways of life of the individuals in a specific group. This detail, however, is not explained by the student. The metaphors, then, seem inappropriate and vague. The reader gathers an impression that someone has a broad responsibility, faces a fight of some kind, and wants to enter a large group. (Whether the individual in the third metaphor is the same person as the one in the first and second figures of speech, is not clear.) The lack of clear relationship among the metaphors serves to emphasize the distortion of meaning.

Question (Sociology 622). Write an essay which reveals what you think the main principles developed in the course are. Do not simply list them, but write an essay about them.
which tries to indicate the relationship among them, something of their importance, etc.

**Sociology answer 71.** ...Overlapping all three of the areas we have studied we find the frustration-aggression principle.

Frustration may occur in the sex roles in the culture definitions of age and sex roles in discriminations against minority groups, or in the striving of upward mobility in the social classes and will lead to aggression [distortion of meaning resulting from the use of mixed figures and high-level abstractions], whether it be forceful or quiet striving.

A study of Sociology answers 71 and 85 indicates, first of all, that the individual metaphors are not particularly appropriate or vivid. In spite of the claim that metaphors are often used for clarification, the figures of speech employed in these three answers do not help the reader very much—whether the metaphors are considered individually or collectively—in understanding the students' discussions. This clouding of meaning results largely from the combination of (1) vagueness from high-level abstractions in the metaphors and in the verbal contexts; (2) connotation linked with—and resulting from—metaphor; (3) the inaccuracy and the mixed nature of the figures of speech used.

**Slanting.** The responses considered below (Sociology answers 15 and 52) contain connotation and high-order abstraction, as well as the selection of details to support an opinion previously reached.

**Question (Sociology 507).** Many experts say that the trouble with the family institution is that it has steadily lost its function. What would you say to this?
Sociology answer 15. Many experts seem to think that the family has lost many of its functions and that in a short time it will disintegrate, but this is not true, because the family is still the basic institution in which the culture of the society is brought its new members, and this is the only institution which can perpetuate the species and therefore will never disintegrate as some people believe.

The family is also where your basic personality traits are formed and where you learn the folkways and mores of a society. It is true that the family has lost many of its old functions, such as making bread, making clothes, etc., but it still is the only place a person can get companionship, security, recognition, and protection. I think these experts are very nearsighted when they say the family institution is disintegrating, because if it were doing this, all our other institutions would be showing the effects of this breakdown, but this is not true.

Take for example our economic institution, which is rising all the time, and the author states that the variation of one institution will affect all the ones around it, but this is not happening; therefore the family institution must not be breaking down but only shifting some of its functions to other institutions.

Slanting is shown in lines 17-19 and 22-24. First, the student maintains that only in the family can one find companionship, security, recognition, or protection. He has not chosen to mention that many an individual finds some measure of most of these within himself, in his work, and among his friends and associates. Second, in lines 22-24, he takes the stand that the family cannot be breaking down, because other institutions are not showing the effects of such a hypothetical disintegration. His use of the broad term "economic institution"
(line 25) might conceivably raise some questions about the effect of changes in the family on, for instance, commercialized amusements or the automobile industry.

Though the student, in his discussion, has included some statements which seem to be valid, the use of high-level abstraction in lines 27-29 appears more striking than even that in lines 17-19 and 22-24. Just what are "basic personality traits"? Moreover, the student has used the abstract, connotative term "true" three times (lines 17, 11, and 21) and has thus edged toward two-valued orientation, especially with his use of this word in conjunction with the is of classification. The student clearly shows his attitude; he states his belief; he includes some valid ideas which are useful in supporting his contentions; finally, he makes some flat assertions which are judgments, subject in their present form to searching questions.

Question (Sociology 604). Discuss briefly the topic, "The Reduction of Prejudice."

Sociology answer 52. The first thing to reduce prejudice is through education. The more people know about other people the less prejudiced they are against them. They would look at the problem more objectively.

Economic security would help reduce prejudice because prejudice stems from these three things: economy, religion, social causes. If people took more of a dynamic point of view, and saw it as a world-wide situation that could be bettered, they might come to realize the significance of non-discrimination.

The fair-employment acts should help people get to know other races better, but above all education for the minority groups as well as the majority will help reduce prejudice.
First, the student's position is stated in lines 3-6. The statement is flat and final; no mention is made of the idea that knowledge of the problems of others may lead to some reduction of prejudice in some people. To many persons, charity and tolerance remain high-level abstractions, remote from behaviour. Moreover, the more objective appraisal mentioned in lines 5-6 may occur; but the student does not mention, for example, that in the South — where the so-called "Negro problem" is ever present and is understood by many people — considerable racial prejudice continues to exist.

Finally, in the second paragraph (which seems to be an elaborate repetition of the first) "dynamic point of view" (line 11) is partly clarified by lines 11-13; but the idea is not made specific or definite. The student has made up his mind; ideas which seem to support his assertions are included in his answer.

In Sociology answers 15 and 52, the reader notes, first, the stubborn insistence of the students on the validity of the statements — both the fundamental ideas and what might appear to be corollary statements. These students, quite evidently, have made up their minds. Second, many of the ideas and statements appear to be sound and acceptable, subject, of course, to further examination and evaluation; but the students, after selecting these ideas, repeat and re-state them, and return to them by means of circular logic. Instead of inspecting and evaluating, they paraphrase. Finally, in using such terms as "nearsighted" and "objective" in referring to people who disagree with the students' views, the students approach the use of invective.
In summarizing the results of the analysis of the responses in sociology, the writer will present, first, a comment on the examination questions (with reference to the use of abstraction and emotive language); second, figures showing the frequency and classification of errors; and third, examples of superior or excellent answers.

As in economics and history, some of the examination questions and discussion topics involve the consideration of theories about which there is widespread disagreement. On the one hand, because of the breadth of sociology (which may be defined as the science of human society), it may not come as a surprise that some of the questions are concerned with abstract ideas and concepts, such as, for instance, analysis of the relations between social institutions and the "drives." Other questions or topics, however, such as that dealing with the reduction of race prejudice, may be more apt to cause the use of emotive language. It may be noted, too, that the 500-level course is concerned with the factors affecting the development of society; one 600-level course, with race problems; and the other, with the relationship of social factors to personal adjustment.

The enrollment figures (for the academic year 1952-1953) for the courses in sociology are appended:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course</th>
<th>Enrollment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>507</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>604</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>622</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Let us proceed to a summary of the classifications under the six major headings, the first of which is Abstraction.
## ABSTRACTION

### 1. Dead-level abstraction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course</th>
<th>Number of Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>507</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>604</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>622</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These responses are written on a high level of abstraction. The students tend to repeat rather than to use low as well as high levels of abstraction; even when paraphrasing, they stay on the same level. The hedging in the responses seems to be not a matter of reserve or of qualification, but of trying to avoid analysis and definition. This vagueness and hedging is, at times, combined with the certainty resulting from the unskillful use of forms of to be. This combination of difficulties was noted in responses written at all three course levels, with a rather surprising number in Sociology 622. The subject matter under discussion apparently caused them to yield to the tendency to stay on high levels of abstraction and to avoid limitation and definition through the use of illustrative materials.

### 2. Looseness of thought, with high-level abstractions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course</th>
<th>Number of Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>507</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>604</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>622</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Here, a large number of unqualified high-order abstractions are used, and the sequence of ideas is unclear. These errors occur more
frequently in the 500-level course than in either of the more advanced classes. The answers indicate that beginning students have noticeable difficulties in the task of (1) understanding and observing limitations on the significance of terms often used in sociology; (2) of proceeding systematically in analysis; and (3) of indicating clearly to the reader the steps in the discussion.

3. High-order abstractions, with sweeping generalization

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
<th>507</th>
<th>604</th>
<th>622</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In these responses, the students, using high-level abstractions frequently, have failed to analyze clearly and to support adequately. The use of such contracted symbols and those noted in the responses has, understandably, often led these students to signal reaction and to oversimplification through generalization. Students at all levels have reacted quickly, sometimes rather unreflectively, and have written in broad terms instead of using precision and due reserve.

SYMBOLS

1. Symbols with unqualified high-level abstractions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
<th>507</th>
<th>604</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The reader of these responses notes the repetition of symbols. Because these symbols have no clear referents, the reader has no ground for accurate understanding of the meaning. This difficulty is
largely caused by the students' belief in the inherent virtues of symbols to select appropriate referents and to influence events. Beginning and advanced students are represented here. The students appear to have had marked difficulty with a major problem in the use of words--a problem involving confusion of word with object or idea, as well as a lack of precision.

CONCEPTS

1. Shifts in meaning, with high-order abstraction

507

Here, the psychological and verbal contexts seem faulty. The difficulty results from the vagueness of unqualified abstractions and the students' efforts to make the answers broad and inclusive. The numerous judgments are not clearly phrased. Beginning students appear to have had more trouble than advanced students in discussions involving definitions of words and systematic thinking on the descriptive level.

FORMS OF TO BE

1. Finality, with high-level abstractions

507
604
622

A study of these responses shows that each of the students has repeated a few ideas. Nearly all these ideas are expressed in highly abstract terms which are set down with little or no explanation and
are equated through the use of the *is* of identity and the *is* of classification. Thus, finality and oversimplification work together. All course levels are represented here. It seems rather surprising that advanced students should not see the need for resisting the temptation to reduce complex problems to their simplest terms and to insist on the validity of such oversimplification.

### TWO-VALUED ORIENTATION

#### 1. Finality, with high-level abstractions, forms of to be, and connotation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
<th>507</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>622</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

One finds in these responses not only finality but also vagueness. Repetition of a few symbols takes the place of explanation; and the answers, consequently, lack clarity of organization. Advanced groups seem to have more difficulty here than does the beginning class. The subject matter, and the somewhat careless use of terms often employed in sociology, might help partly to explain the difficulties of the students in coping with this combination of vagueness, assurance, and poor organization. These students, however—even with all the equitable discount made—place too much dependence on the reader by trusting that he will have the same image that the students have for each of the high-level abstractions and symbols used.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
<th>604</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>622</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### 2. Forms of to be, with high-level abstraction and looseness of thought

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
<th>604</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>622</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The finality in these responses, indicating that the student writers are untroubled by doubt or hesitation, is increased by the use of the *is* of identity and the *is* of classification, and is complicated by loss of objectivity, shown in the use of emotive language. The problem here appears to be another aspect of oversimplification: These students seem to think that there are, inevitably, only two sides to a question, two solutions to a complex problem—good and bad, desirable and undesirable. The work of beginning students is well represented here. It is probable that they are less accustomed than more advanced students are to examining bases of judgment, and to looking at many aspects of a problem before deciding on an evaluation or a solution.

2. Two-valued orientation, with high-level abstractions and primary certitude

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>507</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>622</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Two two-valued orientation in these responses appears more difficult to detect than in the answers considered above. In the answers under consideration now, the implicit two-valued orientation is based on an attitude of primary certitude—thus involving the psychological as well as the verbal context—plus unqualified high-level abstraction. Certainty shows through the seeming impartiality. Here, the work of both beginning and more advanced students is represented. The students appear to have had difficulty in using low levels of abstraction as well as high ones and in maintaining objectivity.
Under the sixth major heading, emotive language, there are three subheadings: connotation, metaphor, and slanting. We may now turn to the first of these.

CONNOTATION

1. Connotation, with high-order abstractions and looseness of thought

   Number of responses inspected
   507 3

   In these responses, the unqualified high-order abstractions interact with the loss of objectivity involved in the use of connotation, to facilitate signal reaction and the use of the inferential rather than the descriptive level. Communication is further hampered by lack of coherence. A study of the answers indicates that beginning students have difficulty not only in clarifying ideas but also in making their relationships apparent.

2. Connotation, with high-level abstraction and two-valued orientation

   Number of responses inspected
   507 1
   604 2

   One finds in these answers a combination noted several times before: the use of an almost unrelieved high level of abstraction, along with many words trailing associations and images—words revealing emotion and at the same time appealing to it. Because, in addition, two-valued orientation is explicit in these answers, the problem involves differences in interpretation of abstractions, loss of objectivity, and oversimplification. The work of advanced as
well as of beginning students is represented here. It seems surprising that those in upper-level classes should fall into this combination of major errors.

METAPHOR

1. Metaphor, with high-level abstraction and connotation

   Number of responses inspected

   622  2

   The metaphors used in these responses do not seem to be particularly illuminating, except as they reveal the feelings of the students. The figures of speech are unrelated, and the use of personal connotation further emphasizes the lack of clear sequence of ideas. The work of advanced students is well represented here. The subject matter may be considered to be partly responsible: The students, aiming at brevity and conciseness, forgot that metaphors should be appropriate.

2. Distortion of meaning resulting from the use of mixed figures and high-level abstraction

   Number of responses inspected

   622  2

   In these answers the metaphors — many of them rather connotative — seem neither vivid nor appropriate. Moreover, they appear unrelated; and the difficulty of ascertaining the meaning intended is increased by the use of several high-order abstractions. Advanced students appear to have had considerable trouble with this complex combination of abstraction and emotive language.
1. Slanting, with connotation and high-level abstraction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>507</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>604</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The selection of ideas is accompanied by oversimplification. The students repeat a few ideas, and use unqualified high-order abstractions and connotative words to set up—through insistence on the soundness of the statements—what is, in effect, two-valued orientation. The students tend to project feelings rather than to analyze. It will be noted that the work of both beginning and advanced students is represented.

The following portion of the chapter will be concluded with a few responses which may be considered superior or excellent.

**Question (Sociology 507).** While all societies have the same basic social institutions, such institutions vary greatly. How do you account for this fact?

**Sociology answer 1.** The great variation in the structure, function, and value of the basic social institutions of different societies can be attributed chiefly to the variations in the geographical, cultural, and hereditary factors from society to society.

The geographical environment dictates what may be done and what may not be done. For instance, if the geographical conditions of a particular region are suitable for farming, the inhabitants of that region might build their economic institutions around farming. They don't have to, but they can. At any rate, if game isn't plentiful in that particular area, the geographical environment prevents the people from
building their economic institutions
around hunting.
Culture too is a prime factor in
causing variations in social institu-
tions among societies. People who have
accumulated very little culture, and who
consequently have a small culture, have
an economic system characterized by a
vast machine complex. Furthermore, the
beliefs and attitudes which make up
part of a society's culture make the
people of that society more susceptible
to certain ways of doing things than
they were of others. For instance, the
Dakota Indians do not believe in the
private possession of food. Thus,
according to their economic belief, if
one person has plenty of food while
another has none, the person with plenty
will share his food. So we see how a
belief arising from the culture of a
society can modify the economic
institution.

The reader will see that this response has its weaknesses. First,
the third paragraph is written on a rather high level of abstraction—
especially lines 23-27, where faulty psychological context combines
with high-order abstraction to make the meaning somewhat obscure.
Second, in line 21, the student has used the is of identity, with
resultant finality.

Yet this answer, in the opinion of the present writer, may be
considered commendable for several reasons. In the first place, the
student has used three examples (lines 10-15, 16-20, and 32-38) to
clarify his use of abstract terms and his statements concerning them.
Second, the student has maintained objectivity throughout the dis-
cussion; in particular, he has avoided the use of highly connotative
words. Finally, the organization seems orderly and logical. The
student has attempted—with a large measure of success—to present
a carefully considered, clear analysis.

The second of the responses is as follows:

**Question (Sociology 60h)**. Why do the biological scientists disagree as much as they do in their classification of mankind into races?

Sociology answer 39. Biological scientists disagree so much over the classification of mankind into races because there is no way or method of classification that holds true for all people. There are always exceptions to whatever standards are applied, and some groups seem to defy classification. There is a preference or leaning among scientists toward the threefold system of Caucasoid, Mongoloid, and Negroid; yet there are groups which do not fall under any of these headings.

Perhaps the main reason for difficulty in classifying and agreement is that these secondary, physical hereditary attributes which the scientists have chosen as a basis for classification are usually continuous and not discrete. This means that instead of being placed in a distinct group because of, for instance, color, that all people should be arranged on a continuum ranging from very black to white, with all others in between.

Perhaps this should suggest to us that the peoples of the earth were not meant to be classified as races on the basis of physical characteristics at all.

Another difficulty lies in an aspect mentioned before--the fact that these characteristics or attributes are secondary and usually only pertain to outward visible structure. The basic anatomy of all humans is the same, and a doctor that practiced his dissection on a Negroid corpse would be able to carry over his knowledge fully to a white or Mongoloid person. Human beings seem to be more alike than unlike.
Moreover, these characteristics have little survival value. Therefore, the biological scientists disagree because there is no universal method of classification, and it becomes an arbitrary judgment or decision as to which method they use or prefer.

Two faults may be noted here. First, further explanation—on a low level of abstraction—seems needed for clarification and substantiation of the statement in lines 41-42. Second, lines 26-29 seem somewhat irrelevant.

In this response, however, the student, by using qualifying words and phrases effectively, has, for the most part, avoided sweeping generalizations (though he occasionally displays a tendency toward finality in the use of forms of to be). In citing examples, furthermore, he has been careful to use low as well as high levels of abstraction. On the whole, too, he has managed—with the possible exception of "true" (line 5), "defy" (line 8), and "arbitrary" (line 46)—to remain objective and to avoid the use of emotive language.

The final example of a creditable answer comes from a section of Sociology 622.

Question. Write an essay which reveals what you think the main principles developed in the course are. Do not simply list them, but write an essay about them which tries to indicate the relationship among them, something of their importance, etc.

Sociology answer 73. The fact with which I would like to start a discussion of generalizations derived from this course is the fact of hierarchical differentials or dichotomies in role and status. These differentials, whether they are physiological, biological, or social, are sanctioned by the society in terms of
reward and punishment, or, in other words, through the distribution of prestige symbols.

To document these two generalizations, there are the studies of social class by Hollingshead and Cook and Seeman, which show that children of the upper classes are more popular than lower class children, and also tend to be better adjusted on standard personality tests. The minority group studies of Seeman and Marks indicate this differential according to skin color, and that of Lewin and Powdemaker document categorical discrimination against Jews and Negroes. The comparative culture studies of Mead and Benedict point up the sex-wide variable, and Persons and Kublin document differential treatment according to age. That the culture sanctions this differential treatment is illustrated by Mead and Benedict, but also by Davies in his discussion of the school system, and by Reusch in his implication about the emphasis which our society places on upward mobility.

A third generalization I would like to make is that the conceptions of self which the child develops are related to role and status, and that the development of the concept of the self takes place in the family situation. This is implied but not proved by Davis and Havighurst and Persons, and by Benedict. Davies talks about internalizations of the cultural patterns in the socialization process, and Reusch brings up the hypothesis that the role behaviour which is learned in the parent-child situation will determine the adjustment made to the status situation. Benedict's discussion of continuities also stresses the parent-child relationship. This leads me to another generalization concerning the cultural and unique roles, as Linton and Cottrell call this distinction, or commonalities and specific factors, as we referred to them, or particulars and universals. We have indicated that there are certain patterns
of role behaviour which represent an
average of all behaviours for a certain
position, and that there are deviant
behaviours. In the development of the
personality, the individual will be
affected both by the behaviour specific
to his sex-age-minority group and
class status as well as by the values
of the larger society.

The next generalization that appears
to me is that differential perspective
will be developed in the persons
according to the groups with which he
identifies. This is illustrated in
Center's study of socio-economic status
and socio-political attitudes, Davis's
report of the different ways in which
people see the class structure according
to their own position, the differences
in male and female adjustment which
Seeman found, and the ratings of
popularity which Marks discovered
connected with skin color.

Another generalization concerns the
matter of the meaning of change in
status of transition from one role to
another. The hypothesis of Reusch
suggests that mobility in our society
is related to illnesses, and the papers
of Komarovsky and Persons indicate that
undefined roles lead to confusion and
isolation. The same thing is suggested
by Lewin and Powdemaker, and the whole
idea of marginal man is applicable here.

Related to the principle above is
another idea, that adjustment is some­
thing which must be defined with
reference to a particular role or to a
particular individual. The work of Auld
and Gough shows that differences can be
obtained for particular items because
of the fact that tests are culture­
bound, and this same thing is evident
when we are studying the sex-wide
variables, where Seeman got better
adjustment for girls on a test which
is apparently in favor of females.

What should logically have
followed principle 2 above is the idea
that some societies provide sanctions
for regression or alternatives to frustrations in role. In Western society we have no "class struggle" because the American cultural ideal is for upward mobility. Negroes who cannot escape categorical discrimination can fight among themselves, as Powdermaker suggests, and females who cannot attain prestige for themselves can be good companions and entertain the boss to help their husbands "get ahead," as Persons implies.

My next principle is one of multiple effects. In all these studies we see role behaviour as a combination of many factors operating at one time. It is difficult to know the weights to be assigned to minority groupness, maleness, low socio-economic status, and youth, when evaluating a person like Chester, or when comparing Negro rates of mental illness with white rates. It is also difficult to know what subtle differences which we do not see are there.

My final principle is that of the self-fulfilling prophecy, as you call it. The idea that people who are treated in a certain way and are expected to respond in that way leads to behaviour of the kind expected is related to the conception of self and the sanctioning of these behaviours by society.

Summary:

1. Differentials according to role and status operate.
2. Differentials are sanctioned and institutionalized.
3. Transition leads to tensions and strains.
4. Outlets are provided to prevent social disruptions.
5. Differential perspective
6. Conception of self-developed in connection with role
7. Cultural relativity
8. Multiple effects
9. Adjustment is relative to the group (preferable to the term "culture" in my system).
10. Self-fulfilling prophecy

The reader of this response, seeing such terms as "hierarchical differentials" (line 4) and "differential perspective" (line 70), will probably feel that the discussion is written on a high level of abstraction. The student, however, in his use of documentation, illustrates and supports such terms, and succinctly clarifies them for the reader. This long and involved answer seems notable, too, for its thoroughness and for the effort made to communicate meaning as clearly as possible. The objectivity shown throughout the response may be considered another commendable quality. The student has written thoughtfully and clearly on a complex topic.

In these responses, then, considered to be superior or excellent, the reader finds many of the errors which appear in the answers discussed earlier in the chapter. As the present writer has noted before, however, these errors occur less frequently and hamper communication of meaning much less than in the representative responses.

The analysis and summary indicate that certain errors stand high: dead-level abstracting; looseness of thought with high-level abstractions; finality; symbols, with high-level abstractions; and two-valued orientation, with high-order abstractions, forms of to be, and connotation. The present writer believes that the last group of students has largely avoided these difficulties. They have sought to analyze carefully and evaluate objectively; to write precisely rather than impressionistically; to communicate rather than to convert.

An analysis of responses in sociology, the summary of findings, and examples of superior or excellent answers have preceded. The
section which follows is devoted to a presentation of recommendations, based on the findings, for use in the teaching of sociology.

As in the corresponding sections on economics and sociology, the recommendations concern procedures within the six classifications which serve as the basis for the analyses. Second, when combinations of errors in answers in sociology are similar to combinations in answers in economics and/or in history, similar procedures are recommended. Finally, suggestions and comments referring to all the areas with which the present study is concerned will be found at the beginning of Chapter VIII.

It should be emphasized again that no suggestion is intended that all of the semantic materials included in this section— or in the other corresponding sections in Chapters V, VI, and VII— are intended to be used in any one class or by any one teacher. The principle of selection is implicit and explicit in the body of suggestions included in this study.

Moreover, in the investigation as a whole, semantics is thought of as a tool. The basic idea is to use the semantic approach to aid in the attainment of greater precision in verbal communication in the three areas with which this study is concerned.

We may now turn to the responses analyzed under the heading Abstraction.

ABSTRACTION

The answers analyzed under the above heading are grouped as follows: (a) dead-level abstraction, with repetition and vagueness
(noted in responses written at all course levels); (b) looseness of thought, with high-level abstraction (occurring more frequently in the 500-level course than in either of the more advanced classes); (c) high-order abstractions, with sweeping generalization (appearing more often in the work of beginning students than in the answers of students in more advanced courses).

The following proposals are submitted for consideration:

Dead-level abstraction. The instructor may request the students to define—chiefly through examples and details or by means of operational definitions—such terms as "interpersonal relationships," "discrimination," "aggression," "acceptance," and "relative aggressiveness." Students may well be reminded that these two methods of definition encourage the use of lower levels of abstraction along with the higher levels.

In addition to using examples and details, as well as operational definitions, students may be asked to substitute other words for forms of to be in such sentences as the following, to reinforce understanding of the principle of equivalence rather than identity:

1. One's culture is very significant in determining one's personality.
2. People who are insecure usually blame their insecurity on a person or thing.
3. Another thing we know in relation to the development of personality is that frustration leads to aggression.
4. This factor ["strong intermarriage mores"] is one of the strongest ties to the deep-rooted prejudices of yesteryear.
5. The relation between drives and cultures is strong.

Because the deal-level abstraction ("culture," "education," "discrimination," "economic and social well being," "aggression") in the responses is on a high level, analysis of such a passage as the following—written on a consistently high level of abstraction—may serve to show clearly the results of dead-level abstraction. The analysis would involve consideration of the use of such unqualified terms as "cultures," "inferiority," "lower class," "upper class," and "opportunities for mental development."

The continuation of functional differences reacts upon cultures and results in inferiority so far as members of the lower class are concerned. They become less adapted to performing the functions of the upper class. They also lack the opportunities for mental development. Thus they are not given the chance to obtain the training for doing effectively the functions of the upper class.

Brief passages from the work of professional writers in the area of sociology may be used to show how both high and low levels of abstraction may be skillfully and effectively used. In this procedure, the instructor, emphasizing methods and results, may show how such terms as "emancipation of women" and "general social position of women" have been used with consciousness of abstracting and with reference to lower levels. Such a passage as the following may be used:

The so-called emancipation of women has been greatly exaggerated and misinterpreted in much contemporary discussion. Yet there is no doubt that women in the United States have a relatively great amount of freedom. The disappearance of formalized chaperonage is in itself an important indication of emancipation. Our statutory laws have greatly modified the older common-law conceptions in the direction of equalizing the formal rights of husband and wife. Married women may make contracts, own property, make wills, and sue or be sued in their own right. Some
court decisions now even affirm that the husband and wife may sue each other. The legal status of such husband-wife suits is still confused and ambiguous, but they mark a radical move not only toward equality of rights in law but also toward an individualization ("atomization") of the legal structure of the family.

Besides legal rights, American wives hold a remarkable set of customary or conventional intrafamilial rights that, although less rigid and explicit, are hardly less common or less important. Not even in theory is the wife expected to render unquestioning obedience to her husband, much less in actual practice. The marriage relationship most commonly held up as a model is one in which joint decisions are reached. It remains true that general consensus still holds that in the last resort the husband should be "head of the house," but it is felt that only in rare circumstances will "patriarchal" rather than "democratic" processes be desirable.

Many discussions of the position of women in our social order have failed to make certain essential distinctions. Probably the most frequent and important source of confusion is failure to distinguish among the evaluation of women, the formal rights of women, and the roles expected of women. It is possible to have a society in which women are highly valued, yet do not share many of the formal rights exercised by men or play masculine roles. In early America, for example, women did not lack a place of high honor and esteem, although they were confined to distinctly feminine roles and were without many legal rights that have been since acquired. Similarly, formal "equality of legal rights" turns out to be a question-begging term unless distinguished from the broader patterns of sex roles. Thus the failure of the husband to provide economic support for the wife is a criminal or quasi-criminal offense in every jurisdiction except Mississippi. Under a principle of strict equality, the wife would bear a corresponding obligation, and seventeen jurisdictions have specified that the wife is required to support the husband under certain conditions. Nevertheless, that the law presupposes differential sex roles is clearly demonstrated by the legal status of alimony, which generally is still considered to be a continuation of the husband's obligation to support the wife — an assumption that obviously does not correspond to the facts in a great many contemporary divorce cases.

Probably the most obvious change in the general social position of women has been a blurring of the feminine sex role in the masculine direction. Some specific evidences may be briefly enumerated:

1. Legal rights: women vote, hold public office, practice professions, hold and dispose of
property, etc.

2. Occupational role: women participate in paid work outside the home on a large scale; they have entered traditionally male occupations.

3. Educational participation: there are coeducational school systems, colleges, and universities; graduate studies are sometimes open to women.

4. Recreational patterns: women participate in active sports, patronize drinking places, etc.

5. Courtship behaviour: women have a kind and degree of freedom and initiative in courtship not before sanctioned.

6. "Symbolic" evidences: women emulate men's clothes in their slacks, tailored suits, etc.26

High-level abstraction, with looseness of thought. The present investigator recommends, first, that the instructor give the students relevant instruction and practice in the analysis and organization of materials. In addition to using outlines, the students may study the types and uses of transitional expressions, and the requirements and the advantages of parallel structure. Emphasis may well be on proceeding systematically in analysis and on indicating clearly to the reader the steps in the discussion.

The procedure recommended above may involve exercises in developing paragraphs and groups of connected paragraphs by the methods listed and illustrated below.

a. Comparison and contrast

In the writer's study, it was found that an overwhelming proportion of the alcoholics had sexual experience prior to marriage. In the "organized" non-alcoholic group,

less than half had such sexual experiences. What can be the meaning of this difference? Since alcohol and brothels have long been associated, and since in several instances the sexual experience had been with prostitutes, one may raise the question as to whether this relationship might not have furnished the social situation for the onset of the drinking. Such a connection was not borne out, however, as none of the subjects either directly or indirectly linked the two together. Furthermore, the age at first sexual experience was invariably given as several years earlier than the onset of the drinking. Both, it is true, are symbols in our culture of masculinity and strength. Perhaps the only conclusion that one is justified in making here is that there is significant evidence that the alcoholic group showed to a much greater degree the urge or necessity for trying to establish through overt expression their strength and masculinity than did the other groups.27

b. Cause and effect

The mechanization of the city, the impersonal, categoric contacts between persons, and the dominance of pecuniary values have combined to make social interaction largely a matter of cold calculation. Among the things that are emphasized in the city are punctuality, precision, and accuracy. So inter-dependent are the parts of the metropolis that the urban organization, if it is to function harmoniously, must discipline its members to punctuality. The result is that the metropolete reduces his life largely to a routine process. His very existence is scrupulously measured: he rises and retires by the clock; he leaves home in the morning at an exact time in order to begin work promptly; at noon and in the evening he stops, along with his fellow-workers, at a given hour; and since his leisure time is determined by his working hours, he pursues his pleasures according to the clock — or the calendar. Virtually all the organized activities of the city, whether of work or play, are geared to the basis of time. The eight-hour day, six-day week, 7:37 train, and overtime are more than mere abstractions to the city person; they are realities that shape the major outlines of his occupational activities.28


In the analysis of responses and reports, students may be concerned with the following aspects of the use of high-order abstractions:

1. awareness of the limitations of terms often used in sociology (for example, "folkways," "mores," "attitudes," "personality impact");
2. consideration of how such high-level abstractions may be interpreted in given contexts; and
3. discussion of the need for using details and examples, as well as operational definitions, to clarify these abstractions. The following response is an example of passages which may be so considered:

**Question (Sociology 507).** While all societies have the same basic social institutions, such institutions vary greatly. How do you account for this fact?

**Sociology answer 12.** While all societies have the same basic institutions, such societies emphasize the basic institutions differently. One society might emphasize religion more than it does politics, which would cause the institutions of politics to vary greatly with that of other societies. One society might emphasize a strong family interrelationship, and not put a great emphasis on religion. This would cause the beliefs of this society's religion to differ from others along with the difference in the family institution. Since the basic institutions of societies grow out of a group's needs, the amount of emphasis on institutions would depend on the development from the amount of need for it. It is quite possible that the need for a strong political institution is necessary and therefore this society may have more political policy, beliefs, and ideas, than a society which does not have such a great need for a strong political institution. The institution of marriage and family interrelationships differs greatly in many societies, but yet all societies have some beliefs, mores, and folkways which include these institutions. Education is yet another institution which to some societies may seem foolish and not needed; to others it is very important and carried out to its full extent.

**High-order abstractions, with sweeping generalization.**

In recommending the use of exercises in the development of materials in paragraphs and series of connected paragraphs, it is suggested that
emphasis be placed on clarity of analysis and on adequate support of statements. The methods of development listed and illustrated below may be used in following this procedure:

a. Repetition

In addition to releasing the military class from the necessity of labor, the work of the slaves also provided leisure and surplus for the development of the fine arts, scientific pursuits, and philosophic speculation. The higher culture is a most tender plant, especially in its earlier days. Without leisure and resources beyond the immediate needs of existence, men do not pursue it. Odin and Ward have shown that productive artists, literary men, scientists, philosophers have almost always come from those classes in the population who have been supported by the laboring classes. The higher culture, like stable government and willingness to labor regularly, seems to have been purchased at a large cost of suffering and unrequited toil on the part of those who have labored with their hands. The specialization which produces the higher achievements of the mind has come exceedingly slowly. It would seem that the human race has with difficulty realized the value of such work. The artist and the thinker have never found the market for their wares among the general public that have the producers of more material goods. If that is true today when appreciation of spiritual values has become more generally possible through popular education, how much more was it true when the race was struggling to acquire a firm grip upon the bare necessities of life, and upon the elements of social organization. The privileged overlord and master who used a part of his ill-got surplus to nourish art and science and philosophy builded much better than he knew. Human life has been made richer and completer because many toiled painfully, they knew not why, and a few were privileged thereby to dream and think. 29

b. Obverse iteration

Unlike the industrial corporation, the holding company

is not usually directly interested in production. The holding company is mainly concerned with "milking" the productive corporations which it controls by skimming off the profits made by these corporations and diverting them to the coffers of the holding company. The latter, through its control, compels the controlled corporations to pay unearned dividends on holding-company securities out of corporate earnings. The holding company rarely renders any important service to the corporations it controls, though it may provide them with common directors and common legal services. Particularly is this true when the controlled companies are engaged in a similar enterprise, as in the New England Electric System. The holding company may also provide management of a quality higher than that which would be available to the individual companies. It is possible for a superholding company to secure the controlling interest in other holding companies. This complicated legal structure is known as a financial or paper pyramid.30

c. Illustration

Insurance adjusters and casualty companies are also guilty of abusing justice. Frequently, an insurance adjuster hurries to the bedside of the accident victim, sometimes racing against the ambulance-chasing lawyer. The adjuster then offers a sum of money to the victim if the latter will sign a release from court action; or, if he cannot obtain a release, the adjuster may try to get the injured person to make a written or oral statement of the way the accident occurred. Such statements, often given while the victim is in pain or in a serious nervous condition, do not furnish a true picture of the situation, but they may later be used against the unfortunate person in court.31


31Ibid., p. 468.
As, in these responses, the use of contracted symbols has led to signal reactions, a review of signal and symbol reactions is suggested. The instructor may contrast these two types of reaction and point out the dangers of signal reaction. Examples and diagrams may be used to clarify these ideas and to show the relationship between signal reactions and confusion of the levels of abstraction. The incident cited by Lee, for instance, would serve as an instance of signal reaction:

There is the experience of the man who went to sleep in a hotel room. Waking during the night, he felt warm and in need of fresh air. In the strange surroundings, because he was unable to find the light, he sought the window, and after some fumbling, found a glass but could not get it to open. His patience worn, he broke the glass, took a deep breath, felt instantly better, returned to bed, and slept soundly. Upon waking in the morning, he discovered the window closed tightly and the glass in a bookcase across the room broken to bits. The facts of temperature and humidity, though unaffected, were as nothing to one who is relieved by making inferences about them.32

SYMBOLS

As the reader will recall, the answers analyzed under the above heading contain symbols, with unqualified high-level abstractions (shown in the work of beginning and of advanced students).

The following procedures are recommended:

Symbols, with unqualified high-level abstractions. For clarification of the relationship between symbol, thought, and referent, explanation of the Ogden-Richards Triangle of Reference is suggested.

Examples may be used and practice given to show the need for finding the referent of a given word and to emphasize the lack of direct connection—except when gestures are used—between symbol and referent.

Because the referent of such a symbol as "the democratic process" or "the democratic way of life" is not entirely clear in and by itself, practice in definition, through the use of examples and details and of operational definitions, may be helpful. The use of index numbers and dates is recommended for the attainment of greater precision and for a common ground of understanding between writer and reader. Here, as with the procedures involving the Triangle of Reference, the instructor may well stress the relation between individual experience and individual interpretation.

Because, in these responses, students have used repetition, apparently in the belief that clarification would result, consideration may be given to the nature and the use of repetition. Through instruction and class discussions, the teacher may show the connection between repetition and confusion of word with object or idea; and the dangers in believing (1) that a given symbol will mean what the user wishes it to mean and (2) that the use of a symbol will influence events. He may also strive to show the students how definitions—including the use of lower levels of abstraction—can amplify and can illuminate an idea from several points of view. The instructor may also consider the possibility of using contrast to show what is not meant as well as what is meant. It should be remembered that in these responses, the difficulties result not so much from inability
to use technical terms carefully and discriminately as from a belief in the inherent virtue of symbols.

**CONTEXTS**

The responses grouped under the above heading contain shifts in meaning, with high-order abstraction (with beginning students apparently having more trouble here than do advanced students).

The following recommendations are suggested:

*Shifts in meaning, with high-order abstractions.* The meaning of such terms as "culture," in such varying contexts as the following, may be discussed.

1. What, then, is culture?
2. Culture, says Arnold, is contact with the best that has been said and thought in the world.
3. The biologist decided that the culture was not successful.
4. The farmer's culture was, for a change, wisely planned.
5. The results of Greek culture are well known.

Second, students may be asked to ascertain the meaning of "culture" in such passages as the following. (The shifts in meaning of the term in the sixteen lines of the answer quoted below should be brought clearly to the attention of the students.)

**Question (Sociology 507).** What relation do you see between culture and the so-called drives?

**Sociology answer 25.** The different cultures have brought different means for accommodating the various drives. Our ideas and methods of indulging our drives will vary as our culture varies. Example: Sex among young people (junior and senior high school age) is frowned upon in the United States. However, in many of the Pacific Islands, sex is indulged in at a very early
age. Therefore, I would say that the culture has a
direct relation with the satisfaction of the drives.
The folkways and mores which are a part of the
culture play an important part in the approval or
suppression of the various drives.

In the analysis of a number of student-written answers, such as
the one quoted below, the students may be asked to examine contexts,
to see what the writers mean by the use of such terms as (in this
answer) "serve" and "service."

Question (Sociology 507). While all societies have the
same basic social institutions, such institutions vary
greatly. How do you account for this fact?

Sociology answer 14. These institutions vary greatly,
I believe, because they have different societies to
serve in, and different means of service. The modern
religious institution varies greatly from the primitive
religious institution because the societies and cultures
are so different, although in this case the institution
serves the same end in both.

The folkways and mores of the particular society and
culture in which the institution exists have much to do
with the variability. No society has all the same folk-
ways and mores; therefore not all institutions in all
societies can be exactly similar, and the services will
vary.

Variability is one of the characteristics of social
institutions.

It is suggested, furthermore, that the instructor call attention to
the interaction between shifts in meaning of key terms ("serve" and
"service") and the use of unqualified high-level abstractions
("much to do with the variability," "not all institutions in all
societies can be exactly similar").

FORMS OF TO BE

The responses analyzed under the above heading contain
(a) finality, with high-level abstractions (with all course levels
represented); (b) forms of to be, with high-level abstraction and looseness of thought (shown, in large part, in the work of advanced students).

It is believed that the following suggestions may be helpful:

**Finality, with high-level abstractions.** The instructor may ask the students to substitute other words for forms of to be in such sentences as the following:

1. Political parties are the indispensable instrument of democracy.

2. The family is the basic primary social group.

3. Personality is the product of group life.

4. Overt cynicism is neither expedient nor popular.

5. Old-age assistance is necessary and justifiable.

6. Authority is an essential part of social organization.

7. The older person is tolerant, sympathetic, and understanding.

8. The loss of function is by far the most significant of the adjustments of the family to the conditions of the city.

9. The workingman is independent, hard-headed, and self-supporting.

10. Democracy is a way of protecting individual freedom.

The instructor, using the inductive method—and demonstrating the need for the use of lower-order abstractions to clarify the terms linked by forms of to be—may explain why the user of the is of identity and the is of classification should remain conscious of the dangers and limitations involved—including that of projection—in the use of these forms. Even though "may be classified as" and
"appears...to me" are not written out, the students should be aware of the significance of the principle of equivalence.

After a review of the process of abstraction and of the problems resulting from confusion of the levels of abstraction and from undiscriminating use of the is of identity and the is of classification, careful revision of sentences (taken, for the most part, from the writings of students) may be undertaken. Such sentences as the following may be profitably used in this procedure:

1. Circular reinforcement is a basic principle in everything that we have studied.
2. Culture is the determinant of what people do.
3. The basic social institutions are the same throughout the world.
4. Cultural stereotypes are the result of ignorance and irrationality.
5. Minorities are what they are mainly because they are made this way by majority groups.

There may well be emphasis on the use of lower levels of abstraction (the use of examples and details and of operational definitions) and on clear, careful organization of ideas.

Analysis of passages, such as the one quoted below, from the work of recognized sociologists, may help students to see how lower-level abstractions may be used effectively to clarify and substantiate high-level abstractions; how, through consciousness of the risks and limitations involved in the use of forms of to be, primary certitude can be avoided.

Next to age and sex, race stands as probably the most important basis of social differentiation. If we are comparing the peoples of two nations or nation-states
constituted of differing ethnic stock, we are confronted with a marked difference in the culture manifested. Institutions, mores, laws, ideals, habits of daily life—all show marked dissimilarities. If we have under consideration different ethnic elements within the same state, we may have one of three different situations. In one, the different races may constitute separate national groups as in the old Austro-Hungarian Empire, where a great variety of national groups with differing ethnic qualities maintained a somewhat separate existence within the same political machinery. They tend to congregate in particular geographical areas, but, even when somewhat indiscriminately mingled, the different ethnic elements maintain a more or less distinct culture. This situation generally carries with it a political supremacy of one or two of the groups. The ruling family will represent one particular racial group and all the important offices will be filled by members of the same and possibly one other group. But with this exception, there is more nearly an equality of rank between the different races in this situation than in the other two.

Another situation is that in which the different races occupy the same geographical area, but are on distinct levels of right or social class. Negroes and Whites in the United States illustrate this type. Such a situation is developed from the conquest or enslavement of one group by the other, and the lower class may occupy any rank ranging upwards from a slavery through serfdom to a station of nominal equality, as in the United States.

A third situation is that in which amalgamation has taken place to such an extent that the majority of the population has some of all the different race elements in their blood, but here and there particular families show a marked preponderance of one stock or even may have maintained an almost complete freedom from the amalgamation process. Central and South America show many populations of this type. In such a situation there is likely to be also a distinction of social class between those showing different degrees of particular ethnic strains.33

Forms of to be, with high-level abstraction and looseness of thought. First of all is suggested a review of the causes, the nature, and the results of (1) projection, with consideration of confusion of levels of abstraction; (2) the maintenance of a high level of abstraction, with attention given to the dangers in believing that the reader

will have the same image for unqualified high-order abstractions that the writer has in his mind; (3) repetition, with discussion of repetition as a means of clarification or as a means of staying on a high level of abstraction.

Analysis of such responses as the following is recommended.

Question (Sociology 604). Why do the biological scientists disagree as much as they do in their classification of mankind into races?

Sociology answer 61. The research on race classifications is valid. The men who have done this research have decided that, though people are different in intelligence, they are certain that there is no pure race. The categories of race are useful as statistics only. It is difficult to classify them in any other way. The bases for classification are indefinite.

It is suggested that in the analysis, stress be placed on development of understanding of the semantic principles involved in the use of the is of identity and the is of classification rather than attempting to prohibit the use of forms of to be.

After several such responses as the one quoted above have been considered, re-writing may be planned and carried out. Such re-writing may involve outlining, with suggestions and demonstrations by the instructor. Revision should be continued until the rewritten versions are acceptable to the instructor.

TWO-VALUED ORIENTATION

The responses containing two-valued orientation are grouped as follows: (1) finality, with high-level abstractions, forms of to be, and connotation (with the work of beginning students well represented); and (2) two-valued orientation, with high-level abstractions and
primary certitude (shown in the responses of both beginning and more advanced students).

The following proposals are offered:

**Finality, with high-level abstractions, forms of to be, and connotation.** Beginning students, especially, may benefit from a careful review — by means of the analysis and discussion of such a response as the following — of (1) signal reactions resulting from confusion of levels of abstraction ("the United States, with its culture of material needs and wealth"); (2) interaction between the hasty and emotional nature of signal reactions and the unskillful use of highly connotative words ("Many of the taboos which we know in our culture on the different drives which cause frustration and maladjustment in the personality are absent in the cultures"); and (3) the relationship between the resultant projection and two-valued orientation ("A poor boy in our culture where there is no emphasis on material wealth will have quite another type of personality").

**Question (Sociology 507). How would you assess the importance of culture in accounting for one's personality?**

**Sociology answer 31.** The culture in which we live plays a very important part in the forming of our personality. The personality of a poor boy in the United States, with its culture of material needs and wealth would have one type of personality, while a poor boy in our culture where there is no emphasis on material wealth will have quite another type of personality. Many of the taboos which we know in our cultures on the different drives which cause frustration and maladjustment in the personality are absent in the cultures. I feel that culture has a direct relationship to our personality.

The following procedure in planning, writing, and analyzing may be used: First, the instructor and class may consider possible
approaches to such a question as the following:

Many experts say that the trouble with the family institution is that it has steadily lost its function. What would you say to this?

After the discussion and appraisal of the approaches suggested, the students may proceed to the writing of answers to the question. In the analysis of responses for two-valued orientation, attention may well be given to the ways in which personal connotations are shown and in which prejudices are revealed.

Two-valued orientation, with high-level abstraction and primary certitude. Comparison and contrast of responses containing two-valued orientation with others in which multi-valued orientation has been used may be considered. Two answers are quoted below as illustrations of the type which may be so used.

**Question (Sociology 507).** What relation do you see between culture and the so-called drives?

**Sociology answer 24.** To me, the interrelationship between the culture and the so-called drives consists of the bases that determine what social institutions shall be. Our desires for sex, association, shelter, food, etc., all stem from drives and result in the institutions of marriage, community, family, and production. The origin of religion, possibly, does not fall in this category. The family seems most exemplary of this interrelationship. For if it were not for the sex drive, would our family exist as it does? I think not. The very definition of a social institution proves this relationship. It is supposed to satisfy basic human wants and needs. And basic human wants stem, for the most part, from drives.

**Question (Sociology 507).** What relation do you see between culture and the so-called drives?

**Sociology answer 3.** Drives can be defined as inner urges toward certain general kinds of behaviour. A particular
drive can be satisfied in a variety of ways. For instance, the hunger drive can be satisfied equally well by a great variety of ways. For instance, the hunger drive can be satisfied equally well by a great variety of diets, from eating hair lice, which are a delicacy among the Witatos of northwestern Amazonia, to eating steak at the Stork Club. The relationship between drives and culture is twofold. To begin with, the culture determines just how the individual's drives are to be satisfied. That is to say, using my previous example, the culture of the society decrees whether one eats hair lice or steak. A further example can be furnished from the satisfaction of the sex drive. The Nayar culture allows rather free sexual relations among people, while our culture forbids them and sanctions sexual relations only between married individuals. The second connection between culture and drives lies in the fact that culture can suppress drives to some extent. Catholic nuns, for example, are supposed to lead a life of celibacy.

The discussions may be concerned with (1) the differences between explicit and implicit two-valued orientation; (2) analysis of the evidence adduced, with suggestions for other items and types of evidence which might have been included, as well as comments on possible improvements in summary and explanation; (3) distinction between possibilities, probabilities, and certainties.

Under the supervision of the instructor, writing on such topics as the following may be conducted:

Many experts say that the trouble with the family institution is that it has steadily lost its function. What would you say to this?

In his comments and suggestions to the class, the instructor may well indicate the dangers of substituting for analysis a search for arguments for believing as one already does believe. He may also explain—with examples—the need for indicating, supporting, and explaining judgements formulated in the course of the written discussion. Other
examples should be employed to clarify the instructor's discussion of real and of assumed restraint and objectivity.

**CONNOTATION**

As the reader will recall, the responses under the above heading are grouped as follows: (1) connotation, with high-order abstractions and looseness of thought (shown chiefly in the writing of beginning students) and (2) connotation, with high-level abstraction and two-valued orientation (with the work of advanced as well as of beginning students represented here).

The following recommendations are submitted:

**Connotation, with high-order abstraction and looseness of thought.** First, analysis of such responses as the following is suggested. The teacher may wish to emphasize that (1) the use of unqualified high-order abstractions ("the politics of the home") and (2) the loss of objectivity involved in the use of highly connotative words ("I feel that this is primarily an adjustment to the new ideas and situations that we are confronted with") facilitate the formulation of such judgments as "The family has been modernized." In this connection, too, he will point out the need for clarification and substantiation of such statements as "More and more, education is left to be gotten outside the home."

**Question (Sociology 507).** Many experts say that the trouble with the family institution is that it has steadily lost its function. What would you say to this?

**Sociology answer 16.** The family is definitely becoming smaller and less stable. They might say that it is not performing one of its basic functions of rearing children well any longer. There is less care of the aged and less
respect for elders in America. The home is no longer the
center of recreation. The members go outside to seek more
modern and exciting modes of recreation. The home is no
longer a self-sacrificing economic unit. The emphasis on
religion is declining. The politics of the home are
changing. The mother is gaining in her prestige. Many
mothers are now in industry and don't perform the motherly
tasks of yesterday. More and more, education is left to be
gotten outside the home.

These are all definite changes in the family insti-
tution, but I don't feel that it has lost most of its function
or is declining. The whole world is dynamic and changing,
and if all the aspects would not change with it, it would
be in the same predicament as a "cultural lag." I feel
that this is primarily an adjustment to the new ideas and
situations that we are confronted with. If this institu-
tion did not change with the times, it is liable to lose
its usefulness and may drop out of the culture. Since it
is based on the basic drive of sex and perpetuation of the
species, man makes sure that it is up to date so that it
will remain in the culture. These two basic principles of
the family just mentioned could be performed outside of the
family, but man has found this the most acceptable and one
of the best ways of performing them.

The family has been modernized.

Following such analyses, exercises in planning responses to
such questions as the following may be conducted. After evaluation of
several possible approaches, outlines may be constructed.

What relation do you see between culture and the so-
called drives?

Connotation, with high-level abstraction and two-valued
orientation. Careful analysis of such a passage as the following may
be conducted, with major consideration given to the use of highly
connotative words to influence the opinion of the reader.

The modern city, growing up around the factory and serving
as a trade center for a wide area, provided the necessary
conditions for the development of the distinctive characteris-
tics of the American family. It still further promoted the
equality of family members and their democratic interrelation-
ships, initiated and fostered to a certain degree by the rural
pioneer environment. In the urban community the family lost
the extrinsic functions which it had possessed from time immemorial and which continued, although in steadily diminishing degrees, in the rural family. The urban family ceased to be, to any appreciable extent, a unity of economic production. This change made possible a relaxation of authority and regimentation by the family head. Then, too, the actual or potential employment of wife and children outside the home signified their economic independence and created a new basis for family relations. In the city the members of the family tended to engage in recreational activities separately, in their appropriate sex and age groups. Each generation witnessed a decline of parental control over children.34

Students should be assisted to understand how such terms as "equality," "democratic interrelationships," "regimentation," "economic independence," and "parental control" appeal—in the above context—to emotions and deeply felt beliefs, and result in oversimplification leading to two-valued orientation.

Students may benefit from a comparison of referential and emotive writing. It will be helpful if the discussions are on the same topic. For instance, a passage written by Barnes and Reudi about Negro suffrage may be compared with newspaper items or magazine articles on the same subject.

When the Supreme Court declared the grandfather clause unconstitutional in 1913, other devices were found to keep the Negroes away from the polls. One such device is to set up such elaborate tests and qualifications for registering voters as will operate to the disadvantage of Negroes. Another much debated method of preventing or discouraging the Negroes from voting is the poll tax or head tax, which Negroes are often unable to pay. Many efforts have been made to pass Federal legislation outlawing the poll tax, but they have all been blocked by filibustering southern Congressmen. Interestingly enough, it has been estimated that the poll tax legally

disqualified more than twice as many whites as Negroes—about 7 million whites to 3 million Negroes. But the fact that whites have not paid their poll tax is often overlooked at the polls.

Another way of nullifying the political power of Southern Negroes has been to keep them away from the primaries, since the primaries are far more important than the election in most Southern states, which are usually safely in the Democrat column. Though the Negroes make up about 47 per cent of all persons of voting age in Mississippi, it is estimated that only between 1,000 and 3,000 Negroes voted in the primary elections in that state in July, 1942. Some states, including Texas, made the primaries a sort of "association" or "club" and denied the Negroes membership. The United States Supreme Court, in the Louisiana primary case in 1941 and the Texas primary case of 1944, ruled that primaries are an integral part of the election procedure and declared the club ruse unconstitutional. Following this decision, some other southern states dropped their restrictions on Negroes at primaries. South Carolina has been able to take care of the matter of Negro exclusion or intimidation by refusing to adopt the secret ballot. There has been a notable increase in the number of qualified Negro voters in the South since 1940; for example, between 1940 and 1947, the number rose from 1,000 to 47,000 in Arkansas, from 20,000 to 125,000 in Georgia, from 20,000 to 80,000 in Tennessee and from 30,000 to 100,000 in Texas. There has been a considerable increase since 1947.

Discussion should be planned to show clearly that most problems have more than the proverbial two sides, and that accounts may differ in purpose and in effect.

METAPHOR

The responses under Metaphor are grouped as follows:

(1) metaphor, with high-level abstraction and connotation; and (2) distortion of meaning resulting from the use of mixed figures and high-level abstraction. (These difficulties appear, in large part, in the work of advanced students.)

---

The following suggestions may be helpful to those working toward a solution of such problems.

**Metaphor, with high-level abstraction and connotation.** Comparison and contrast of such responses as the following may be conducted. In these discussions, the comparison and contrast should involve such matters as the following: overt, explicit use of metaphor; the degree of accuracy in the figures of speech used; the connection between the metaphors used; the revelation of the students' attitudes toward the matters under consideration; and the use of personal connotation. Attention may well be called, on the other hand, to the use of illustration and definition of terms, to the degree of thoroughness exhibited in the responses, and to the maintenance of objectivity. Such comparison and contrast will serve to show (1) how such high-level abstractions as "hierarchical differentials" and "differential perspective" can be succinctly illustrated, supported, and clarified, and (2) how complex ideas can be clearly organized and objectively presented.

**Question (Sociology 622).** Write an essay which reveals what you think the main principles developed in the course are. Do not simply list them, but write an essay about them which tries to indicate the relationship among them, something of their importance, etc.

*Sociology answer 75.* ...Minority groups and, I believe, social classes and sex groups all accept the stereotypes put forth by either the majority group or another group which exerts strong influence. We have studied it in relation to minority-majority group relationships, but here I would like to venture out on my own and use it in reference to sex stereotypes. We all know that aside from the emancipation business in regard to women's status, the prevalent notion is still that of a naive, delicate, domestic
type who takes care of the children, the house, etc. Here is where I can say that many women have accepted this stereotype and many have acted on it (which would make them inauthentic). They have gone overboard to be like the stereotype or have done the opposite—gone out to seek careers, intellectual pursuits to prove they can "beat" the stereotype and to prove that all women fit it.

**Question (Sociology 622).** Write an essay which reveals what you think the main principles developed in the course are. Do not simply list them, but write an essay about them which tries to indicate the relationship among them, something of their importance, etc.

**Sociology answer 73.** The fact with which I would like to start a discussion of generalizations derived from this course is the fact of hierarchical differentials or dichotomies in role and status. These differentials, whether they are physiological, biological, or social, are sanctioned by the society in terms of reward and punishment, or, in other words, through the distribution of prestige symbols.

To document these two generalizations, there are the studies of social class by Hollingshead and Good and Seeman, which show that children of the upper classes are more popular than lower-class children, and also tend to be better adjusted, and also tend to be better adjusted on standard personality tests. The minority group studies of Seeman and Marks indicate this differential according to skin color, and that of Lewin and Powdermaker document categorical discrimination against Jews and Negroes. The comparative culture studies of Mead and Benedict point up the sex-wide variable, and Persons and Kublin document differential treatment according to age. That the culture sanctions this differential treatment is illustrated by Mead and Benedict, but also by Davies is his discussion of the school system, and by Reusch in his implication about the emphasis which our society places on upward mobility.

A third generalization I would like to make is that the conceptions of self which the child develops are related to role and status, and that the development of the concept of self takes place in the family situation. This is implied but not proved by Davis and Havighurst and Persons, and by Benedict. Davies talks about internalization of the cultural patterns in the socialization process, and Reusch brings up the hypothesis that the role behaviour which is learned in the parent-child situation will determine the adjustment made to the status situation. Benedict's discussion of continuities also stresses the parent-child relationship. This leads me to another generalization
concerning the cultural and unique roles, as Linton and Cottrell call this distinction, or commonalities and specific factors, as we referred to them, or particulars and universals. We have indicated that there are certain patterns of role behaviour which represent an average of all behaviours for a certain position, and that there are deviant behaviours. In the development of the personality, the individual will be affected both by the behaviour specific to his sex-age-minority group and class status as well as by the values of the larger society.

The next generalization that appears to me is that differential perspective will be developed in the person according to the groups with which he identifies. This is illustrated in Center's study of socio-economic status and socio-political attitudes. Davis's report of the different ways in which people see the class structure according to their own position, the differences in male and female adjustment which Seeman found, and the ratings of popularity which Marks discovered connected with skin color.

Another generalization concerns the matter of the meaning of change in status of transition from one role to another. The hypothesis of Reusch suggests that mobility in our society is related to illnesses, and the papers of Komarovsky and Persons indicate that undefined roles lead to confusion and isolation. The same thing is suggested by Lewin and Powlemaker, and the whole idea of marginal man is applicable here.

Related to the principle above is another idea, that adjustment is something which must be defined with reference to a particular role or to a particular individual. The work of Auld and Gough shows that differences can be obtained for particular items because of the fact that tests are culture-bound, and this same thing is evident when we are studying the sex-wide variables, where Seeman got better adjustment for girls on a test which is apparently in favor of females.

What should logically have followed principle #2 above is the idea that some societies provide sanctions for regression or alternatives to frustrations in role. In western society we have no "class struggle" because the American cultural ideal is for upward mobility. Negroes who cannot escape categorical discrimination can fight among themselves, as Powlemaker suggests, and females who cannot attain prestige for themselves can be good companions and entertain the boss to help their husbands "get ahead," as Persons implies.

My next principle is one of multiple effects. In all these studies we see role behaviour as a combination of many factors operating at one time. It is difficult to know the weights to be assigned to minority groupness, maleness, low socio-economic status, and youth, when
evaluating a person like Chester, or when comparing Negro rates of mental illness with white rates. It is also difficult to know what subtle differences which we do not see are there.

My final principle is that of the self-fulfilling prophecy, as you call it. The idea that people who are treated in a certain way and are expected to respond in that way leads to behaviour of the kind expected is related to the conception of self and the sanctioning of these behaviours by society.

Summary:
1. Differentials according to role and status operate.
2. Differentials are sanctioned and institutionalized.
3. Transition leads to tensions and strains.
4. Outlets are provided to prevent social disruptions.
5. Differential perspective.
7. Cultural relativity.
8. Multiple effects.
9. Adjustment is relative to the group (preferable to the term "culture" in my system).
10. Self-fulfilling prophecy.

After the comparison and contrast discussed above, students may be asked to restate in their own words such a response as #75. In introducing this activity—which would involve interpretation, including definition of terms—the instructor may emphasize (a) the maintenance of objectivity, with stress on clear explanation and on avoidance of the use of metaphor as proof; and (b) the use of examples and details and of operational definitions to clarify and to substantiate.

Distortion of meaning, resulting from the use of mixed figures and high-level abstractions. It may be helpful, through the use of examples and details, to explain and to apply Hayakawa's statement concerning metaphors: "Metaphors are not 'ornaments of discourse'; they are direct expressions of evaluations and are bound to occur
whenever we have strong feelings to express."

The instructor may wish to show that these "direct expressions of evaluations" are legitimate in literature, but that they are somewhat out of place in writing intended to be objective. For instance, using such examples of effective and appropriate use of metaphors as those found in Wordsworth's "Sonnet Written on Westminster Bridge," he may demonstrate how metaphor is employed to convey impressions and build moods. He may go on to explain that, on the other hand, since metaphor is inexact and emotive, students must be extremely careful in using it in discussions supposed to be objective and detached. He may point out that when a student is asked to show the relationships among principles of sociology and to appraise their relative significance, the expression of strong feeling is not involved.

Also suggested is the analysis of such a response as the one quoted below. In the analysis, emphasis may well be placed on (a) the validity of the analogy suggested, and the literal meaning of the metaphor in the given context; (b) the maintenance of appropriate tone and subordination in the use of metaphor; the accuracy shown in both the analysis and the synthesis. Thus, students may be helped to understand better the relationship between careful analysis and discriminating use of figures of speech.

Question (Sociology 622). Write an essay which reveals what you think the main principles developed in the course are. Do not simply list them, but write an essay about them which tries to indicate the relationship among them, something of their importance, etc.

---

Sociology answer 65. ...If an individual deviates from the norms of his group, he finds himself an outcast. Thus, a person with the social standards of a lower-class member and the economic status of an upper-class member tends to find himself in a void. He must bring these values to a state of equilibrium or else find another person who is in the same position.

SLANTING

The work of beginning and of advanced students is represented in the responses analyzed.

The following procedures are suggested:

Slanting, with connotation and high-level abstraction.

Through instructor comments and class discussions consideration may be given to the functioning—and the results—of selection in (a) the process of abstraction, (b) two-valued orientation, and (c) slanting. After such a discussion, the class may analyze a slanted newspaper item. The instructor may ask for suggestions for items or for examples and definitions which might well have been included; he may also help the students in analyzing the material for the use of repetition. Finally, he may turn to a discussion of the comparative validity of the ideas included in the newspaper item.

An analysis of such a response as the following, in which slanting is combined with the use of high-order abstractions and of connotation, may be conducted. This analysis may include consideration of the nature and results of the use of invective, and of the ways in which the undiscriminating use of highly connotative words encourages slanting. Furthermore, in the discussion of errors in the answer, practice in outlining may be useful, both as an aid in the writing of a more
objective discussion or—as suggested previously—in the writing of
a response slanted the opposite way.

Question (Sociology 604). Discuss briefly the topic, "The
Reduction of Prejudice."

Sociology answer 52. The first thing to reduce prejudice is
through education. The more people know about other people,
the less prejudiced they are against them. They would look
at the problem more objectively.

Economic security would help reduce prejudice because
prejudice stems from these three things: economy, religion,
social causes. If people took more of a dynamic point of
view, and saw it as a world-wide situation, they might come
to realize the significance of non-discrimination.

The fair-employment acts should help people get to know
other races better, but above all education for the minority
will help reduce prejudice.

The above suggestions are based on the principles (noted in
Chapter III) which may be of help in arriving at a solution of the
problems considered in that portion of the study and analyzed in
some detail in the present chapter.

In the next two chapters, the same procedure will be followed
with responses in English and in professional education.
IMPROVEMENT IN COLLEGE TEACHING THROUGH MORE
EFFECTIVE INTERPRETATION OF LANGUAGE

VOLUME II

DISSERTATION

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements
for the Degree Doctor of Philosophy in the
Graduate School of The Ohio State
University

By

HARRY SHERIDAN WILDER, B.Sc. in Ed., A.M.

******

The Ohio State University

1958

Approved by:

[Signature]
Department of Education
TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME II

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER</th>
<th>TECHNIQUES FOR IMPROVING THE TEACHING OF ENGLISH</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td>THROUGH THE INSPECTION OF INTERPRETATIONS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Analysis of Responses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Summary of Findings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Recommendations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII</td>
<td>TECHNIQUES FOR IMPROVING THE TEACHING OF COURSES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IN PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION THROUGH THE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>INSPECTION OF INTERPRETATIONS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Analysis of Responses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Summary of Findings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Recommendations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII</td>
<td>SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Summary of Findings for All Areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conclusions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Summary of Specific Recommendations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>General Recommendations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Suggestions for Further Study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Part I: General References</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Part II: Philosophies of Higher Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Part III: General Semantics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Part IV: The Teaching of the Social Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER</td>
<td>PAGE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economics</td>
<td>873</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>874</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sociology</td>
<td>874</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part V: The Teaching of English</td>
<td>875</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part VI: The Teaching of Professional Education</td>
<td>876</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part VII: Books Suggested for the Use of Instructors</td>
<td>877</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER VI

TECHNIQUES FOR IMPROVING THE TEACHING OF ENGLISH
THROUGH THE INSPECTION OF INTERPRETATIONS

In this chapter, the writer proposes to analyze, for accuracy and completeness of interpretation, student-written responses to topics and questions in undergraduate courses in English.

First in this chapter, the courses in which the responses were written will be listed. The second portion of the chapter will consist of analyses of responses written by students in the courses involved, and of a summary of the findings. Finally, with these findings as a basis, techniques for improving the teaching of English will be proposed.

The course descriptions which follow will, it is hoped, prove helpful to the reader in following the analyses.

English 430. Introduction to Literature. A course primarily for first-year students, designed to develop intelligent appreciation and enjoyment of literature and to encourage the growth of good taste and judgment through intimate contact with good literature. Special attention will be given to developing a basic knowledge of literary techniques as displayed in prose fiction, drama, and poetry.

English 540. Masters of Modern Literature. An introduction to modern poetry, drama, and fiction through the study of five or six of the following authors as artists and thinkers: Shaw, MacLeish, Frost, Galsworthy, Conrad, T. S. Eliot, E. A. Robinson, Yeats, Porter, Hemingway.

English 563. Masterpieces of English Literature. A course designed to lead the student to an appreciative understanding of some of the great poetry and prose written before 1675. Sections will be taken from three or four of the following: Beowulf, Chaucer's Canterbury Tales, Spenser's Faerie Queene, Bacon's Essays, the King James version of the Bible, Milton's Paradise Lost and Samson Agonistes.
English 564. *Masterpieces of English Literature.* Selections for reading and class discussion will be drawn from the work of the following writers: Pepys, Swift, Pope, Boswell, Dr. Johnson, the Romantic poets, Carlyle, Tennyson, Browning, Arnold. In addition, more cursory reading will be done in the novels of the period.


It may be noted here that in the analysis of the responses in this chapter, the present writer believes that materials of the kind listed in some detail are needed to make the criticized responses semantically and substantially acceptable. He does not mean to imply that all of the materials listed could be expected to be included in the students' responses.

We may now turn to the first of the six headings, which are, it will be recalled, as follows: Abstraction; Symbols; Contexts; Uses of to be; Two-valued orientation; Emotive language.

Abstraction. The responses in the first group in this classification (English answers 25, 29, 31, 66, 69, 92, 94, 96, 106, 153, 193, which follow) contain considerable dead-level abstraction.


English answer 31. As writers of the sonnet, Wordsworth and Milton both have that melancholy flavor, but in different subjects. Wordsworth dwells upon nature, and Milton upon the psychological aspects of life.

First of all, the phrase "that melancholy flavor" (line 2) evokes impressions of gloom, pensiveness, thoughtfulness, or dejection. The student, however, has not amplified his statement, nor has he taken
into account, apparently, such sonnets as "When the Assault Was Intended to the City," "To a Virtuous Young Lady," "Composed in the Valley near Dover, on the Day of Landing," or "Alfred." It appears, then, that the student's statement is in need of (a) supporting evidence and (b) qualification. Second, the division of topics in lines 3–4 appears somewhat oversimplified when one considers that Milton wrote about, for instance, a nightingale, women, the siege of a city, the writing of treatises, and political events; Wordsworth, on political conditions in England and in France, as well as about Venice, Toussaint L'Ouverture, and the Church.

The response is based on the two ideas considered above. The student, ignoring the second sentence in the question and reacting in what may be termed a stock response, has stayed on a high level of abstraction, and in doing so has given vague and somewhat misleading information. The connotations of "melancholy" and "nature" serve to increase the difficulties of both the student and the reader.

Question (English 563). What have you found in the Old Testament comparable to Chaucer?

English answer 24. The Old Testament is comparable to Chaucer in that the author of the Old Testament contains stories of many phases of life as did Chaucer. The poetry of the Old Testament could be compared to that of Chaucer.

The meaning of this somewhat repetitious response seems to hinge on "stories of many phases of life" (line 3) and "poetry" (line 4); but the student offers neither explanation nor evidence. In using the phrase, he may be referring, for instance, to width of range; he might well then have cited—with appropriate comments—the "Nun's Priest's
Tale" and the "Reeve's Tale," and the books of Genesis and Nahum. The same procedure—the use of lower levels of abstraction—would be helpful, whether the student's reference was, for example, to vivid coloring, to pity, or to a sympathetic understanding of human motives and actions. In the second place, the word "poetry" (line 4) probably refers to sweet and majesty of style: the student might have mentioned, for instance, the book of Job, and the "Pardoner's Tale." Instead, he has been content to stand on the seven words quoted above.

The is of classification in line 2 lends an air of finality to the vagueness noted above. In the last three lines, furthermore, the student is begging the question rather than analyzing and answering it.

Question (English 564). In what respects does "Dover Beach" (lines 1-14) differ from "Tintern Abbey" (lines 1-18)?

English answer 153. Arnold seems to lack the spontaneous overflow essential to Wordsworth. "Dover Beach" seems to have an almost sad or tragic overtone to it, while Wordsworth's "Abbey" was more of a pleasant selection.

In lines 1-2, the student refers to Wordsworth's definition of poetry, but forgets to cite the remainder of the definition: "of emotion recollected in tranquillity." As a result, the words "spontaneous overflow" in the answer communicate exuberance rather than controlled, mellowed, reflective emotion. Second, vagueness and oversimplification combine to cloud the meaning of the differences mentioned in lines 3-4. The reader is given no explanation of why Arnold's poem has "an almost sad or tragic overtone"; no hint is given of the symbolism or of the setting of the tone for the reflection of an individual's tremendous, tragic adjustment. The loss of faith cannot
ordinarily be considered merely a little sad. "Tintern Abbey," on the other hand, is termed "more of a pleasant selection." The adjective may be appropriate for the clear description, the enjoyment of nature, the circumstances under which the poem was written; yet "pleasant" hardly covers the nostalgia, the regretful looking back, in the lines under consideration.

The student, in using these three general phrases, has tried to make broad comments do the work of painstaking, precise analysis. Specific ideas may be implicit in the student's response; they are, however, not clearly revealed to the reader.

**Question (English 61). In what respects is this passage [lines 217-242, "The Eve of St. Agnes"] romantic?**

**English answer 193.** This passage is typical of the romantic era because it possesses imagination and emotion. It shows the belief of spiritual insight. It is not artificially or formally written.

First of all, in using the phrase "imagination and emotion" (line 3), the student concerns himself with such profound matters as (a) the power to form mental images or concepts of what is not existent in the experiential world and (b) human feelings—joy, grief, love, hate, and so on. In using these high-order abstractions, the student offers no qualification or explanation for the depth or the control of either imagination or emotion. Qualities which may be found in all literature seem to be considered to be peculiar to the writing of a particular literary period. Second, in line 4, the student asserts that "The Eve of St. Agnes" "shows the belief of spiritual insight." This phrase is applied as a symbol here—broad, non-committal, practically meaningless. Ranging into religion, ethics,
philosophy, and art, the group of words covers a multitude of ideas, and communicates little, if any, exact meaning. Finally, in stating that "The Eve of St. Agnes" is "not artificially or formally written," the student, besides being unaware — as far as the reader can see — of the fixed form and the craftsmanship in the poem, and of Keats' love of sensuous detail and of imagery, appears to ignore the famous dictum that the basis of all art is selection. In view of the balance and proportion in the poem, the connotations of "artificially" hardly seem justified.

Question (English 430). Why is Keats' "Ode on a Grecian Urn" "a picture, and experience, and a creed"?

English answer 47. Keats' "Ode on a Grecian Urn" is "a picture, an experience, and a creed" because the figures of lovers have place there and for ages have remained near enough to touch if they could but move. The figures must just stand by while the rest of the world goes on about their way. The creed might be, live while you have life; don't sit and watch the world go by; join it while you can.

Lines 3-5 indicate that the writer of the foregoing discussion sees only motionless figures on an urn; he has missed entirely both the presentation of the enduring beauty of the urn and the yearning for the serenity of which the urn is a symbol. Second, the hedonism sketched in lines 8-10 indicates that the student has not comprehended Keats' presentation of his idea that beauty is the most significant part of human life. Instead of analyzing, the student has clung to preconceived ideas and has remained on a consistently high level of abstraction.

Question (English 430). Why does Wordsworth address Milton in "London, 1802"?
English answer 54. Wordsworth addressed Milton in "London, 1802," because he was complimenting him or paying him a tribute. Wordsworth was himself a great critic and poet of his time. To so pay such a tribute was indeed very gracious and of such a great writer himself.

In the first place, the writer of the response has begged the question. He has submitted something of a paraphrase of the question, plus repetition of the one idea set forth in lines 1-3. There is no hint of the stagnation or the selfishness mentioned in the sonnet, or of the plea for Milton's help in giving again to the English people "manners, virtue, wisdom, power." Instead, the emphasis is on the graciousness of Wordsworth in paying this tribute to Milton. The student has paraphrased and repeated; he has not explained.

Question (English 563). What have you found in the Old Testament comparable to (a) Beowulf and (b) Chaucer?

English answer 92. The writing is the main point of comparison. Chaucer's "fair and pertinent" language of the Middle Ages had its immediacy and its allegorical and other illustrative usages of the English language make for excellent comparison of the Old Testament from a "writing" point of view.

The student begins his discussion with the unarguable statement that "the writing is the main point of comparison" (lines 1-2). Unfortunately, however, he does not develop this idea beyond commenting that Chaucer's language had its "immediacy." Here, the respondent appears to have remembered a word, and, although not certain of the context (or of the meaning of the word itself) uses it anyway. No further explanation is offered. In lines 4-5, he writes of Chaucer's "allegorical and other illustrative usages of the English language," and, again, seems
content with mention instead of explanation. The use of such examples as the allegory in the *House of Fame* and of the understatement in *Beowulf* might have been helpful here. (*Beowulf*, it will be observed, is ignored completely.) A subjective, supported answer would be in order here; instead, the student has offered a vague, partial response.

**Question (English 563).** In what respects do the sense impressions (sight, sound, etc.) and figures of speech (metaphors, similes, etc.) in the Song of Songs differ from those in the Psalms? Quote examples.

**English answer 96.** While in the Psalms one finds simplicity and directness, one finds the story of Songs to be very elaborate in many ways.

In this answer—though the question is specific—the student has avoided any use of detail. He has sidestepped the question by using "simplicity," "directness," and "very elaborate in many ways." Neither the suggested contrast nor the terms are explained or developed. The writer of the foregoing response might well have used such passages as the following in planning—and phrasing—his answer: "And he shall bring forth thy righteousness as the light, and thy judgment as the noonday" (*Psalms* 37:6): "For lo, the winter is past, the rain is over and gone" (*Song of Solomon* 2:11). Instead of an objective, exact enumeration, the student offers, in one sentence, generalities.

**Question (English 563).** How does the book of *Job* appear "modern" in content and point of view?

**English answer 98.** The noble conceptions, exalted people, sensitive appreciation of the physical world, its profound thought, illumination of human experiences, sureness of style, independence of thought, familiarity with the natural world, and great imagination—all these reveal a modern content in *Job*.
Here, the respondent, faced with a question which calls for careful analysis and supported judgments, has taken refuge in eight lines of broad, unexplained terms. He has ignored almost completely the attitude of questioning behind the book—the attitude of investigation, of the search for reasons for the existence of physical and mental suffering. He has also ignored Job's uncertainty, his attitude of revolt after the loss of property and health, as reflected in such verses as the following: "Man that is born of woman is of few days, and full of trouble" (Job 1:1); "Wherefore do the wicked live, become old, yea, and mighty in power?" (Job 21:7). The maintenance of a high level of abstraction makes this response a list rather than an explanation.

Question (English 6h). Cazamian's definition of Romanticism: "An accentuated predominance of emotional life, provoked or directed by the exercise of imaginative vision, and in its turn stimulating or directing such exercise." Test the validity of this statement with reference to Wordsworth.

English answer 180. Wordsworth's fundamental ideas of love of Nature, men must grow to goodness and happiness, his devotion to the natural and the mystical, adhere to Cazamian's Romantic definition. Also Wordsworth's exhibited originality, imagination, emotion, simplicity in his writings.

In writing of Wordsworth's "love of nature" and of his "devotion to the natural and mystical," the student might well have mentioned Wordsworth's idea that contact with nature helps to bring out feelings of kindliness and love. The comment in lines 2-3, furthermore, brief as it is, does not do more than hint at the poet's belief in the value of mystical insight—dependence on intuition rather than on reason. In the last three lines, the terms "originality, imagination, emotion, simplicity" are all high-level abstractions, unexplained and
unqualified. Mention, for instance, of Wordsworth's reaction against so-called "poetic diction," of the emotion in the "Ode on the Intimations of Immortality," and of his selection of the language of common men under the influence of powerful emotion, might have helped to clarify the meaning of these terms.

Question (English 430). What does the nightingale song suggest to Keats in the "Ode to a Nightingale"?

English answer 25. The nightingale's song suggests to Keats in the "Ode to a Nightingale" the freedom and beauty that nature possesses [dead-level abstraction].

Question (English 430). What are the chief limitations or defects of character in (1) Creon and (2) Othello?

English answer 29. Creon and Othello had a tremendous lack of insight [dead-level abstraction]. This led both of them to their ruin.

Question (English 540). In your own words, state an example of irony from "Memorial Rain."

English answer 66. In "Memorial Rain," it is ironic that a man should feel as being as much a stranger as a dead man in a grave [dead-level abstraction].

Question (English 540). In your own words, state an example of irony from "Lines for an Interment."

English answer 69. "Interment has much irony. Despite all that has happened, the world has continued to move on [dead-level abstraction].

Question (English 641). Cazamian's definition of Romanticism: "An accentuated predominance of emotional life, provoked or directed by the exercise of imaginative vision, and in its turn stimulating or directing such exercise."

Test the validity of this statement with reference to Wordsworth.
English answer 173. Wordsworth was, in a sense, a spiritualist. He believed that if you allowed yourself to fall into the right mood, intuition, or spiritual insight, would flow into you. Cazamian implies the Romantic spirit is an action taken by the author (it is an active behaviour)
[dead-level abstraction]. Wordsworth would imply that it is passive behaviour.

Question (English 671). Cazamian's definition of Romanticism: "An accentuated predominance of emotional life, provoked or directed by the exercise of imaginative vision, and in its turn stimulating or directing such exercise." Test the validity of this statement with reference to Keats.

English answer 177. The definition given applies more to Keats than to the others named. However, the definition does not do justice to the idealism held by these authors, their high ideals held toward life [dead-level abstraction]. They sought reality and truth, were not confined to dreams.

Question (English 671). Cazamian's definition of Romanticism: "An accentuated predominance of emotional life, provoked or directed by the exercise of imaginative vision, and in its turn stimulating or directing such exercise." Test the validity of this statement with reference to Keats.

English answer 182. Keats was truly a Cazamian romanticist because he was emotional and imaginative in a very sensuous way [dead-level abstraction, with is of classification]. He believed in beauty for beauty's sake [dead-level abstraction], and that beauty and truth are permanent. He used sensuous images, musical words, idealized love and the supernatural. He is quite correctly called the young people's poet, because of these romantic tendencies.

Let us summarize briefly: In English answers 25, 29, 31, 47, 54, 66, 69, 92, 94, 96, 98, 153, 173, 177, 180, 182, and 193, one encounters a significant problem in the use of abstraction: being
stuck on a high or on a low level. The problem, then, consists of failure (a) to use high levels of abstraction to give significance to details and (b) to use lower levels to explain and clarify high-order abstractions. These students remain on the high levels, as, for instance, in the use of "simplicity" (#91), where the student offers no details to explain, qualify, and substantiate. Apparently believing that high-level abstractions will always evoke in the mind of the reader images or concepts similar to those in the mind of the writer, these students, by remaining on a high level of abstraction, have given their discussions an air of breadth, of certainty—and of vagueness.

In five responses (English answers 83, 97, 103, 105, and 201, to follow), the unskillful use of high-order abstractions results in lack of communication.

**Question (English 563).** In what respects do the sense impressions (sight, sound, etc.) and figures of speech (metaphors, similes, etc.) in "The Song of Songs" differ from those in the Psalms? Quote examples.

**English answer 103.** The "Song of Songs" are 1 in a broader sense mere sayings. They in 2 turn illustrate a greater degree of depth 3 in the thinking necessary to present them. 4

First of all, the use of "in a broader sense" (line 2) poses two problems. The significance of "broader" does not seem altogether apparent: The student may mean, for instance, "extensive," "open," "liberal," "general," or "clear." Furthermore, because the comparison is incomplete, the reader may find it rather difficult to follow the meaning of the first sentence. In the second place, the student appears to believe that "The Song of Songs" is a series of proverbs or apothegms. In view of the subject matter and the structure of the work,
the student's comment needs some clarification.

The second sentence reveals additional difficulties. In using "in turn" (lines 2-3), the student, in not explaining why the phrase is used, has omitted significant steps in logic. He does not explain how the "depth" is shown in what he has described as "mere sayings." Finally, he has done nothing to relieve the apparent obscurity of the last five words of the response.

Question (English 641). In what respects are lines 78-97 of "The Sensitive Plant" typical of Shelley?

English answer 201. Beauty and sense impressions of heavenly joy, and rapture - 2 nature. Belief in perfect ideals of beauty. 3

Here, as in #98, the reader observes a combination of high-order abstraction and incoherence. "Beauty" (line 1)--which ranks with "justice" and "duty" as far as difficulties in definition are concerned--is not explained in the text of the response. The phrase linked to "beauty"--"sense impressions of heavenly joy"--seems, by definition, contradictory if not meaningless. Much depends, of course, on what the student means by "heavenly"; he is probably making a somewhat confused reference to the "unsustaining wings" and "ministering angels" that Shelley writes of in these lines. The reader, however, cannot be certain. "Rapture--nature" (lines 2-3) communicates little; the student may be referring, for instance, to transcendentalism, deism, or an understanding of the indestructible courage of nature. Last, in using "perfect ideals of beauty" (line 3), the student returns to the high-level abstraction in line 1, and complicates the problem by using "ideals." He does not mention, for instance, that the winds, the insects, the dew and the "vapours of dim noontide" were "ministering
angels" to the Lady, or that Shelley was less interested in nature than in the Lady's "gentle mind." The student depends on "beauty," "sense impressions," and "ideals" to convey his meaning; the result does not seem clear.

Question (English 540). In what respects do the sense impressions (sight, sound, etc.) and figures of speech (metaphors, similes, etc.) in The Song of Songs differ from those in the Psalms? Quote examples.

English answer 105. In the book of Psalms there is little use of figures of speech, but rather use of the familiar and concrete terms of the everyday being of the Hebrews to illustrate the case as it may be.

First, the student—evidently forgetting about, say, the Twenty-third Psalm—states that there is "little use of figures of speech" in the Psalms. Lines 3-4 may be intended to qualify the first statement; instead, they contradict it. The writer of the answer was probably—and correctly—thinking that "thy rod and thy staff" were "familiar and concrete terms" to the Psalmist and to his people; but the student apparently does not perceive the symbolism behind the words. The last line effectively obscures the meaning of the rest of the sentence. This writer has given little, if any, specific information; instead, he has "written around" half of the examination question.

Question (English 563). What have you found in the Old Testament comparable to (a) Beowulf and (b) Chaucer?

English answer 27. Even perhaps the amused tolerant look toward life in its fullness [high-level abstraction] can be seen in the beauty of the world [high-level abstraction] and its place in the recreative activities and joy of mankind [high-level abstraction] in the Song of Songs.
Question (English 540). In your own words, state one example of irony from "Eleven."

English answer 83. Irony could be associated with the child's rebellious attitude towards thought and sounding of think["high-level abstraction"].

In English answers 83, 97, 103, 105, and 201, communication breaks down almost entirely as a result of the use of unqualified high-order abstractions. When the writer of #105, for instance, comments on the Psalmist's use of "the familiar and concrete terms of the everyday being of the Hebrews to illustrate the case as it may be," the reader, already somewhat surprised to learn that the writer of the Psalms makes little use of figures of speech, is altogether uncertain about the nature and identity of the words and objects significant in what is termed the "everyday being" of these people. Examples and details are needed—in this as in each of the other four responses in this group—to convey the additional information necessary for comprehension. The errors in diction, as well as in sentence structure, indicate that in each instance, the major concepts involved are not clear in the student's mind.

In another group of responses under the heading Abstraction (English answers 6, 51, 61, 77, and 134, which follow), looseness of thought, as well as the maintenance of a high level of abstraction, is shown.

Question (English 430). Why is Keats' "Ode on a Grecian Urn" a picture, an experience, and a creed?

English answer 51. In all Keats' poems he is known for his realism. He was a sick man and tried to find escape from the outside world by projecting himself into
his poems. He gives tribute to the beauty and gracefulness of this Grecian urn. He talks about the urn in harmony with music. He had the ability to make anything seem to live or come alive. A creed is something that you believe in. Keats believed in everything he wrote about. In his "Ode to a Nightingale," he speaks of the flight of the nightingale and how he envies his freedom to fly the world over. In his "Ode to a Grecian Urn," even though he was talking about a piece of pottery that really seems cold and lifeless, he can make it seem beautiful to us.

The first of the difficulties in this answer is caused by the use of two high-level (and connotative) abstractions: "realism" and "find escape from the outside world." Now, "realism" has many widely varying meanings—for example, Sophocles' statement, "Euripides paints men as they are..." or the doctrine that universals have a real objective existence. The student appears to believe that Keats made the sorrow and pain of human life the chief theme of his poetry. In using "find escape from the outside world," however, the student—without any indication of Keats' sincerity and inner strength—hints that the poet dodged the struggle to which most men are destined. Second, no explanation is offered for the statements in lines 8-9 and 17-18, whether in terms of diction, imagery, philosophy, or sheer force of personality.

Furthermore, the relationship between these unexplained statements seems unclear. In lines 6-7 the student asserts that Keats "talks about the urn in harmony with music." The connection of the statement with the first five lines of the answer is not clear; nor is the assertion itself easy to understand. Again, though the student contends that "Keats believed in everything he wrote about," (lines 10-11), he offers
no details or evidence to clarify the meaning of the comment—a comment which does little to substantiate the preceding sentence in the response. The answer as a whole appears to be jerky and disjointed.


English answer 134. Tennyson, in his famous "The Lady of Shalott" (my favorite) assumes the supernatural. The poem is definitely out of the ordinary. The girl is under a spell—cannot contemplate reality through the mirror. All of this denotes mystery. Tennyson tells the poem as a story as if it could happen, but actually it couldn't. Through his development of the story, he makes nature seem mysterious. Moods change in accordance with the development.

The first of the problems here is caused by the apparent equating of the mysterious with the supernatural—though the faulty verbal context renders anything like certainty of comprehension almost impossible. Moreover, the student observes that "moods change in accordance with the development" (lines 11-12). The verbal equation here has too many unknowns: Even though the reader knows the development of the story, he does not know what the moods were in the beginning or what the "danger" amounted to. Some confusion in thought is also shown in lines 1-3 and 9-11. In the first of these passages, does the student mean by "assumes" (a) "takes on the aspect of," (b) "takes for granted a belief in," (c) "builds up an atmosphere in which there is, as Coleridge says, 'a willing suspension of critical disbelief'"? The reader, then, misinformed of the exact meaning of the first sentence, is placed at a further disadvantage by lines 9-11. Just how, in what ways, and to what extent is nature made to "seem mysterious"? And what does the
student mean by "development of the story?" The statement may be valid; but explanation and details are needed. The student, for instance, might have cited "the storm-cast wind" and "the river's dour expanse." In this answer, there is not only a lack of explanation, but also failure to show connection between the somewhat unclearly expressed statements.

**Question (English 430). What are the chief limitations or defects of character in (1) Creon and (2) Othello?**

**English answer 6.** Creon and Othello both lack insight [high-level abstraction]. Because of this and their loyalty to the state, [high-level abstraction, with looseness in thought], they brought about their own destruction [high-level abstraction].

**Question (English 540). In your own words, state one example of irony from "Memorial Rain."**

**English answer 77.** The irony in this poem is that Americans are buried in a foreign country. The thoughts are contrasting between the Ambassador and the Americans.

First, the student asserts that the irony is "that Americans are buried in a foreign country." (Apparently, he is not familiar with Brooke's "The Soldier." He seems to have missed entirely the significance of the blurring of Ambassador Puser's words by the blowing of the wind, the scraping of ants, and the shifting of sand. His statement that "the thoughts are contrasting," moreover, reveals little grasp of such lines as the following, to which he apparently refers:

I had not slept for knowing
He too, dead, was a stranger in that land
And felt beneath the earth in the wind's flowing
A tightening of roots and would not understand,
Remembering lake winds in Illinois,
That strange wind. I had felt his bones in the sand
Listening.
-Reflects that these enjoy
Their country's gratitude, that deep repose,
That peace no pain can break, no hurt destroy,
That rest, that sleep -

In this disjointed answer, the student has only indirectly and partially alluded to the above ideas. He has remained on a high—and confused—level of abstraction.

Question (English 540). In your own words, state one example of irony from "Eleven."

English answer 61. In "Eleven" it is ironic
that the human child who is supposed to
learn to use his mind and to compete in the
world of people would much prefer to be one,
like a leaf or a root [high-order abstrac-
tion, with looseness in thought].

Five responses (English answers 6, 51, 61, 77, and 134) have been considered. First of all, the respondents have used such high-order abstractions as "reality" without adequate referents; the writers of the discussions appear to have forgotten that high-level abstractions have breadth as well as depth. Second, clarification, through the use of lower levels of abstraction, is not accomplished. Third, the thinking is unsystematic: Ideas are not only unclear, but frequently contradictory. Steps in logic are often omitted—steps an understanding of which is necessary for clarity.

In three responses (English answers 129, 157, and 165), the use of high-level abstractions is accompanied by the use of connotative words.

Question (English 564). Restate the content of lines 18-32, "Ulysses," in your own words.

English answer 157. All experience but
indicates the direction of future activity,
the goal of which is to be sought only as an orientation point. Goals function as landmarks along a never-ending path of constructive living. To pause after some achievement is so unsatisfying and wasteful. Every hour before death must bring satisfaction from productive living, must bring unique sensation and new insights. Even in senility, knowledge is to be sought despite that fact that a vast part of the whole of knowledge remains always beyond one's immediate grasp. Indeed some knowledge can never be grasped.

In this response, the unskillful use of high-level abstractions and of connotative terms results in wordiness, change in tone, and some shift in emphasis in ideas from the original. First, "future activity" (line 2) and "orientation point" (line 4) seem rather colorless and uninformative. When connotation enters, however, in such phrases as "constructive living" (line 6) and "productive living" (line 9), one may feel that the student, instead of trying to discover the meaning, is attempting to influence the reader through the association of words. In lines 6-8, furthermore, a high level of abstraction, much connotation, and the finality of the is of classification are combined; the passage reveals more about the student's attitude than about the poem under consideration. Finally, it may be noted that the student has missed the idea of the transience of human life, and does not seem to have perceived the courage of Ulysses.


English answer 129. Wordsworth sees everything in nature. He feels that unless a person is close to nature he is doomed. He sees nature above man, and through nature one can appeal to God. He feels that only the more intelligent
people are near God - intelligent in that they have the insight to see the greatness of nature. He considers closeness to nature as the only way of being saved.

After stating that Wordsworth "sees everything in nature," the respondent describes him as feeling that "unless a person is close to nature, he is doomed." Lines 4-5 and 7-8 partially clear up the meaning of "close to nature," but "insight to see the greatness of nature" and "through nature one can appeal to God" do not communicate clearly Wordsworth's concept of the humility and imagination needed for the "insight," or the poet's idea that the close observer might find in the phenomena of nature, visible expression of the divine—manifestations of His power and His nature. The way in which Wordsworth sees nature "above man" is not explained. In this rather disjointed and repetitious response, the student has depended upon broad, emotion-laden phrases to communicate ideas which seem to have been only partly understood.

**Question (English 56d).** Lines 1-14, "Dover Beach." To which poet, Pope or Wordsworth, is this passage nearer in content and diction? Why?

**English answer 16.** This passage is nearer to Wordsworth in content and diction. Wordsworth stressed the theme that man should live in closer contact with nature. He used imaginative figures of speech and sense impressions, but had universal appeal by using everyday language and subjects. This passage of "Dover Beach" describes a part of nature using imaginative but common language in figures of speech and sense impressions giving you a slight feeling of mysticism [high-level abstraction, with connotation] and also the feeling you could dash outdoors to play on a sandy beach where the tide is going out. Pope's poems are quite different; they are mock heroic.
poems using elaborate flourishing language [high-level abstraction, with connotation].

In English answers 129, 157, and 165, the use of unqualified high-level abstractions results in roundaboutness and lack of precision and clarity. When these abstractions are connotative, or are linked with highly connotative terms, objectivity is lost, and the reader perceives an effort to influence and persuade, rather than to analyze and record. The reader of these responses looks for facts; instead, he finds numerous judgments usually handed down with considerable assurance.

Symbols. In the three groups of responses considered under this heading, one finds implicit confusion of words with objects or ideas. This belief in word-magic is often complicated by the use of unqualified high-order abstractions and of highly connotative words, two-valued orientation, and over-simplification.

Let us turn to English answers 16, 99, 128; and 151, in which word-magic is accompanied by high-level abstraction and by connotation.

Question (English 56). Lines 18-32, "Ulysses." Restate the content of the passage in your own words.

English answer 151. Through experience one sees a greater possibility for discovering the true purpose of life, and catches a glimpse of the soul's nature and of God's divine purpose.

In using "true" with "purpose of Life" and with "soul's nature" (lines 3-4), the student reveals his belief that repetition of this word will satisfy the need for analysis of the problem and for communication of ideas. No explanation of the meaning here is given, even though "true" and "truth" have many widely varying meanings, the diversity of which has caused considerable disagreement. The question
of Pontius Pilate indicates the degrees of symbolism and connotation here: "What is truth?" In the student's discussion, then, there seems to be something of a signal reaction. The meaning of the symbols— and the response to them—may be clear in the student's mind; but there is little meaning communicated to the reader. And when "true purpose of life" and "soul's true nature" are joined with "God's divine purposes," the meaning becomes even more difficult to follow.

Question (English 563). How does the book of Job appear "modern" in content and point of view?

English answer 99. The point of view of Job's friends is modern—they tell him what to do and what not to do, because they are not in his situation. They are just undependable friends.

Now, "modern" appears to be a symbol, charged with association. The application of the term to the book of Job was undoubtedly considered in class discussions; yet the student, apparently somewhat out of sympathy with his own time, seems to be more interested in revealing his reaction to the symbol than in analyzing the problem at hand. As far as one can gather, "modern" means to him "undesirable" or "bad." No mention is made, for instance, of the persistent questioning, the attempts to understand, the probing into such problems as the existence of sorrow and suffering in human life. Instead of directly answering the question, the student has arbitrarily shifted the referent of "modern" and included abstract comments on selfishness and indifference.

Question (English 430). Compare Wordsworth with Milton as writers of the sonnet.

English answer 16. Wordsworth is primarily a nature poet, but many of his sonnets are also quite serious. He usually tries to put his
point across by a comparison with nature, or he makes a poem more beautiful with a nature description. "The World Is Too Much With Us" expresses that idea of the goodness of nature as compared with worldliness. "Upon Westminster Bridge" presents a charming picture of London by dawn.

First, Wordsworth is described as "primarily a nature poet" (lines 1-2). Now to the student, "nature poet" may mean a poet with a talent for writing vivid descriptions of land, sea, and sky—Byron, for instance, with his descriptions of the sea; to the reader, on the other hand, "nature poet" may mean a writer of poetry who links the recollection of a landscape with philosophy, and finds in the remembered scene a revelation of divine purpose and law—as Wordsworth linked them in "Tintern Abbey." The student's faith in the power of symbols to select appropriate referents also appears in the comment that Wordsworth "makes a poem more beautiful with a nature description" (lines 5-6). Apparently, the use of the word "nature" is expected to be sufficient explanation of the method and the effectiveness. Finally, "the goodness of nature as compared to worldliness"—an example of the unskillful use of symbols and of high-order abstractions—communicates only vaguely the sense of sorrow and of loss in Wordsworth's words.

For this, for everything we are out of tune. Throughout the response, the student has depended unduly on the word "nature," in various combinations, to convey the meaning which he has in mind.


English answer 128. I think I would choose "The Rape of the Lock" by means of satire.
It's a natural thing for a boy to want a lock of a girl's hair, but Pope plays up the mysterious parts of it by use of sylphs for spirits, different names for everyday names; gods and goddesses in explanation of machinery, to mention a few [word-magic, with high-level abstraction and connotation]. And he also makes the fight between the two factions look ridiculous by making it seem like the gods are at war. All these things have a mysterious quality to them when you're reading the poem [word-magic, with high-level abstraction and connotation].

In English answers 16, 99, 128, and 151, then, one notes a lack of exact communication. A symbol may have one meaning for the student, and a quite different one for the reader. For instance, in #128, the student, in lines 3-5, opposes "natural" to "mysterious"; but "natural" to him seems to mean "consonant with the character of. ("Mysterious" remains unexplained.) Yet to the reader, "natural" might imply lack of artificiality. In his attempts to stretch these terms to fit "The Rape of the Lack," the student has rendered rather difficult the task of ascertaining the intended meaning. Second, belief in the virtue of symbols is shown in the use of such words as "true," "modern," and "nature"; the students seem to have forgotten that symbols are arbitrary and, in themselves, powerless.

Two responses (English answers 174 and 192, considered below), show a combination of word-magic and two-valued orientation.

Question (English 641l). Lines 217-242, "The Eve of St. Agnes." What is the quality of the diction as compared with Wordsworth's?

English answer 192. Wordsworth usually, with the exception of such poems as "Tintern Abbey," uses the language of common men. Poetic diction is not characteristic of his work.

First of all, in line 3, the student uses the phrase "the language
of common men" with no explanation. No hint is given that Wordsworth's use of the "real language of men" involved selection for simplicity, accuracy and lack of adornment, and that "a certain colouring of imagination" modified the whole. Second—and this aspect of the response seems especially significant—"poetic diction" is, to the student, a symbol, arousing a signal reaction. To him, the phrase seems to mean ornate, affected diction, artificial and hackneyed. The student, then, misinterpreting or ignoring the meaning, in context, of "poetic diction," has set up two-valued orientation. He has not only misunderstood but also reacted without adequate analysis.

Question (English 641). Cazamian's definition of Romanticism: "An accentuated predominance of emotional life, provoked or directed by the exercise of imaginative vision, and in its turn stimulating or directing such exercise." Test the validity of this statement with reference to Byron.

English answer 174. Byron tried to visualize things as they are. He found reality to be distasteful and became a revolutionist [word-magic, with two-valued orientation]. Thus his romanticism springs partly from intelligence, not wholly from emotionalism [word-magic, with two-valued orientation].

In English answers 174 and 192, the writers use such terms as "poetic diction," "reality," and "romanticism" as counters which, in the opinion of the students, will mean whatever they want the words to mean. Analysis and explanations are not proffered; yet the reader finds an air of assurance, if not insistence, in these answers. Moreover, the reader, noting the use of two-valued orientation in both responses—the student's position being tenable, the other naturally and obviously illogical and incorrect—feels that he is being urged to agree blindly—to have faith rather than to comprehend.
One finds that in English answers 28 and 36, which follow, word magic is accompanied by over-simplification and by looseness in thought.

Question (English 430). Explain the importance or non-importance of (1) the lyrical elements and (2) comic relief in Antigone and in Othello.

**English answer 28.** The lyrical element in any play is very important. The movement and rhythm of the lines in Antigone and Othello make the plays even more beautiful. The fact that Shakespeare's plays are written in iambic pentameter shows the importance of the rhythmic and lyrical qualities.

Here, the student has difficulty with "lyrical element" and "lyrical qualities." He seems to believe that "lyrical" refers to meter, and that, in some way, "lyrical" can be connected with "the movement and rhythm of the lines" (lines 2-3) and with the use of iambic pentameter. (No mention is made, it will be noted, of the odes in Antigone or of the songs in Othello.) In the second place, the sequence of ideas in lines 2-4 is not apparent; the statement—so general that it means very little—is probably irrelevant. The same comment holds for lines 4-7: The student has a hazy idea of the meaning of the symbol "lyrical elements"; therefore, he has made an effort to give that symbol a somewhat elastic significance. Finally, repetition and marginal treatment have not resulted in clear explanation.

**Question (English 430).** Why is Keats' "Ode on a Grecian Urn" a picture, an experience, and a creed?

**English answer 36.** In Keats' "Ode on a Grecian Urn," he describes the picture on the urn. We see a maiden and her love; he is probably playing his lute or harp. In real life he would come closer to her, but here on the urn he is stationary forever. No matter how hard Keats would try, he realizes "his lovers" would never move.
Because of this the "Ode" is an experience and picture [word-magic, with oversimplification and looseness in thought]. I feel the creed may have something to do with Keats [word-magic]. He was a sick man, as expressed in the "Ode to a Nightingale." He was afraid he would die before he could write. The creed has to do with Keats' feeling of love and the time element (how long he could live) [word-magic, with oversimplification and looseness in thought].

The students who wrote English answers 28 and 36, then show the same belief in word magic that appears in the other responses considered under Symbols. The writers of the two answers which we are discussing now, however, appear to have a somewhat hazy understanding of the meaning of the symbols which form the basis of the discussions, and depend largely on repetition to clarify the meaning for themselves and the reader. This failure to comprehend clearly the significance of symbols leads to considerable disjointedness and incoherence. It also leads, paradoxically, to oversimplification: The students tend to show signal reactions to the symbols and to take what is probably thought of as "a firm stand." The result, as can be seen in the two responses above, is disjointed, oversimplified interpretation.

Context. In four responses under this classification (English answers 50, 125, 148, and 158, which follow), shifts in meaning are combined with high-level abstractions.

Question (English 1430). Compare as to verse-form Milton's sonnets with Wordsworth's.

English answer 50. Milton's verse-form had an influence on Wordsworth's writing. The verse-form is closely related.

In this response, "verse-form" does not seem to have the same
meaning in line 1 as in lines 2-3. In using the term the first time, the student seems to refer to the manner of arranging the parts of a literary composition for a pleasing and effective result. The meaning, so far as it can be discovered, is general, not applied to the structure of the sonnet. In lines 2-3, however, "verse-form" has reference, apparently, to set order of words—perhaps to meter; but the reference is so vague that the meaning is difficult to discover.

The use of high-level abstractions further complicates the problem. The reader may decide that "influence" (line 2) means an undefined action exerted by the somewhat vague "verse-form" on Wordsworth's "writing." The shift in terms may be noted here; for "writing" is even broader than "verse-form." In line 4, moreover, the student states that "the verse-form is closely related." He does not, however, record the closeness of the relationship. No comment is made, for instance, on Wordsworth's observance of the rules for the Petrarchan sonnet, or of Milton's modification of that type.


English answer 125. Tennyson shows his Lady's desire for the beauty of nature, and how she 1 is stopped by supernatural forces. One might 2 say that Tennyson is telling us here that 3 one may live with nature only as long as he 4 remains within the limits of his capabilities 5 as determined by nature. Lancelot's capabili-

In line 2, "nature" appears to refer to the physical phenomena and objects of the experiential world; in line 5, in a broad sense, to the material world, surrounding man and existing independently of his
activities; and in line 7, to the total of the forces at work in the universe. Though the discussion topic concerns "nature" in the first sense, the student, as has been noted, has shifted ground, and has thereby noticeably obscured the meaning. Requested to write a technical analysis of one aspect of Tennyson's work, the student has branched into a discussion of the "moral" of "The Lady of Shalott." Moreover, his changing use of the highly abstract term "capabilities" adds to the confusion. Because of the inadequate verbal context, the reader is uncertain of the meaning—and, to some extent of the relevance.

Question (English 564). Lines 18-32, "Ulysses." Re-state the content of the passage in your own words.

English answer 148. He has been through some remarkable circumstances, and from every experience he has learned; but the more he learns the farther away seems the answer. In Tennyson's time, men's faith was being tried by a little knowledge. Tennyson knew peace of mind again when he had learned enough to see the end. To Tennyson, to stand still is to die. You must always keep learning or you have no purpose to sustain your life.

In using "learn" four times (lines 4, 5, 8, and 10), the student has unexpectedly shifted the meaning of the term from "profiting from experience" to "adding to his store of knowledge" to "developing insight" to "maintaining an open mind." The writer of the answer shows more than a glimpse of Ulysses' discontent with his idle life on the barren island; but the shifts in meaning of a major term in the response cloud the meaning of what was supposed to be a paraphrase.

Furthermore, the reader is not told the nature or the significance
of the problem to which Ulysses failed to find the "answer" (line 5) or the type of "knowledge" which was trying men's "faith." Brief reference to Tractarianism, the "higher criticism," or the work of Darwin and Huxley might have clarified the somewhat cryptic comment.


English answer 158. "Eternal silence" refers to infinity after death; in effect, immortality [shifts in meaning of key terms, with high-level abstraction]. "Three suns" is his way of understanding a specific period of time. Tennyson uses "gray spirit" in the place of elderliness or agedness.

Major difficulties in these responses (English answers 50, 125, 148, and 158) result from unexpected shifts in the meaning of key terms. Now, words have multiple meanings—as, apparently, a part of the price of using verbal language—but there is an urgent need for a common ground for understanding. These students appear to have a faulty grasp of major terms, and to make, in consequence, multi-phased attempts to meet the demands of the examination questions. These approaches, to the bewilderment of the reader, are usually made without warning. Closely connected with these errors in contexts is the use of high-order abstractions which, in their present verbal contexts, may mean much—or little.

In another group of responses (English answers 44, 115, and 156, which follow), confused contexts appear, together with the use of highly connotative words.

Question (English 564). Lines 1-14, "Dover Beach." In what respects does this passage differ from lines 1-18,
"Tintern Abbey"?

English answer 156. To me these passages differ very little except in content. The mood is the same in both (or nearly so). One is sadness and the other a kind of sadness brought about by nostalgia. I feel that one would have trouble telling which poet wrote which poem if one was familiar with only the poets and not these particular works.

In line 4, the significance of "sadness" is not adequately explained by the is of identity. In the same line, moreover, the differentiation does not seem clarified by the use of "a kind of..." or by the brief mention of the cause. In neither passage does the student give more than a hint of the meaning of "sadness"—whether slight, temporary unhappiness, pensiveness, resignation, sorrow, or deeply felt grief. "Nostalgia" alone cannot clarify the meaning which the student evidently wishes to convey. Yet he implies a differentiation. The wavering verbal contexts, the connotations of "mood" and "sadness," and the failure to use sufficient illustrative material, make the meaning obscure.

Question (English 430). Compare as to verse-form Milton's sonnets with Wordsworth's.

English answer 154. Milton often used heroic couplets, as in Paradise Lost. Wordsworth did not use the verse form but rather preferred the sonnet style or, in some cases, something more on the order of blank verse but not quite that extreme. Wordsworth used quatrains.

The term "verse form" in conjunction with "sonnets" seems to have baffled the student. He refers to the "heroic couplets" used in Paradise Lost, but does not allude to such sonnets as "On His Blindness" or "On the Late Massacre in Piedmont." One gathers that Wordsworth
did not use heroic couplets but "preferred the sonnet style"; but there is no mention of, for instance, "Composed upon Westminster Bridge" or "It Is a Beauteous Evening, Calm and Free." The remainder of the sentence seems to be at least as involved and obscure as the first part; and the last sentence adds nothing to the information already imparted.


English answer 115. The Lady of Shalott is simple and rustic, yet Tennyson has given her a fairy-like nature [confused contexts, with connotation]. She is not pursued, but she loves in vain. She too is alone except for shadows which she sees. She is yearning for the realistic rather than the simple [confused contexts, with connotation].

In English answers 564, 115, and 156, then, the students seem insecure and hesitant in the use of key terms. They seem to juggle such words—to use them with noticeable and unexplained changes in significance. Besides this lack of clear understanding of the meaning, one notes faulty organization. The students indulge in some circumlocution; and, apparently assuming that the reader can follow the often complicated ideas, they omit steps in thinking, and fail to use examples to clarify meaning. The use of highly connotative words—"extreme," for instance, in 564—brings loss of objectivity; the student, instead of making an analysis, indicates a reaction.

Forms of to be. The projection and the apparent finality in analysis which often result from the unskillful use of forms of to be are accompanied, in English answers 1, 116, 160, and 166 (considered
below), by the use of unqualified high-level abstractions.

Question (English 430). Explain the importance or non-importance of (1) the lyrical element and (2) comic relief in Antigone and in Othello.

**English answer 1.** The lyrical element in

**Antigone** is not very noticeable as in

**Othello.** It is not important because the

play is very simple and short, so that the

significance would not stand out and be

noticed.

The lyrical element in Othello is very

important to the play because the songs

Desdemona sings, and the way the rhythm of

the play goes, all add up to a very good

play. It makes Othello a very dramatic

play, and that's what I think Shakespeare

had in mind when he wrote it.

In this answer, finality is especially noticeable in the first paragraph, in which the student has used the *is* of classification three times: in lines 2, 3, and 4. He exhibits considerable assurance, when, without mentioning the odes, he contends that the lyrical element in Antigone is "not very noticeable as in Othello" and that it is "not important" (lines 2-3); and when he asserts—in spite of the complexity of the characters and the profundity of the problems in Antigone—that the play is "simple and short."

The use of the *is* of classification, in line 7, with resultant finality, is accompanied by a sustained high level of abstraction, and by faulty sentence structure. The reader may be puzzled about the student's understanding of the lyrical element in Othello; he may be equally uncertain about what the student means by "rhythm of the play" (line 10). (He might mean, for instance, the meter, the credibility, or the location of the climax.) The unfortunate use of "dramatic" in line 12, as well as the faulty sentence structure, results in obscurity
as well as high abstraction. The non-committal comment in lines 11-13 helps little in clarifying the rest of the discussion.


English answer 116. "The Lady of Shalott" represents the sentimental. She is a highly romantic character and is strictly feminine. She is highly idealistic and cannot cope with reality. She is the type that is apt to fall in love at first sight. Although strictly feminine, she is not as sophisticated as one would expect of a person of her standing. She is not particularly close to nature, as she is not very aware of its beauty. She is so romantic she is willing to die for love.

The student has used the is of identity and the is of classification to term the Lady "romantic" and "idealistic." She is less "sophisticated" than he thinks she should be and "cannot cope with reality." The reader perceives the student's assurance, but feels somewhat baffled by the series of highly abstract terms so confidently set forth. "Sentimental," for instance, might refer to A Sentimental Journey, or to such a person as Marianne Dashwood; and the same charge of vagueness may be justifiably made for the other words listed above. This series of unexplained adjectives neither reveals the differences in portrayal nor clearly describes the individuals.

Finally, though the reader is told twice that the Lady is "strictly feminine" (lines 3-4 and 7), he may not be prepared for the non sequitur in lines 7-9 or for the verbal jump (concerning "romantic") from line 3 to line 11.
Question (English 564). Lines 1-14, "Dover Beach." In what respects does this passage differ from lines 1-18, "Tintern Abbey"?

**English answer 166.** The first eighteen lines are more elevated than the lines from "Dover Beach." The sense impressions and figures of speech are better. The mood which is set by Wordsworth seems to be more profound, and his method of setting this mood seems to be on a higher level.

First, the student states, through the use of the is of classification, that the first eighteen lines of Wordsworth's poem are "more elevated" than the passage from "Dover Beach." He seems to have forgotten that while Wordsworth said, "No poem of mine was composed under circumstances more pleasant for me to remember than this," Arnold was writing of the loss of his old faith. The term "elevated" seems out of place, if not nearly meaningless, in this context. Moreover, in lines 3-4, the statement is made that "the sense impressions and the figures of speech are better." The comment is not supported by examples or details; but the student might well have pondered the significance behind Arnold's description of the waves:

Listen! you hear the grating roar
Of pebbles which the waves draw back, and fling,
At their return, up the high strand,
Begin, and cease, and then again begin,
With tremulous cadence slow, and bring
The eternal note of sadness in.

In keeping with the finality and assurance shown in the first two sentences, the respondent maintains that the mood of Wordsworth's poem "seems to be more profound" and the method of setting the mood "on a higher level." No explanatory comment is added, though there does appear to be a difference between a pleasant return to a beloved scene, and a record of melancholy, through the use of a symbol. The
student, asked to state differences, has submitted a list of unsupported judgments.

Question (English 561). Lines 1-14, "Dover Beach." To which poet, Pope or Wordsworth, is this passage nearer in content and diction? Why?

English answer 160. It is more like Wordsworth.  
Its subject is the beauty of nature [is of identity, with high-level abstraction]; both Wordsworth and Arnold admired nature and derived comfort from it. In diction, both Wordsworth and Arnold were content to say things simply [is of classification, with high-level abstraction], both concentrating on what they were saying more than on the style or form.

In the four responses examined (English answers 1, 116, 160, and 166), the respondents, through establishing identification and classification through the use of forms of to be, indicate their belief that they have attained finality in analysis and evaluation. This finality is accompanied by the use of unexplained high-level abstractions. The students express their judgments—combining certitude and words with multiple meanings and wide range—with a terseness that may arouse questions in the mind of the reader. Moreover, the writing in these responses, it will be noted, remains on a high level. The combination of conclusiveness and vagueness, finally, is sometimes complicated by faulty sentence structure.

In another group of responses (English answers 3, 4, 5, 19, 149, 150, 155, 163, and 204, which follow), the reader finds the unskillful use of forms of to be combined with connotation and confusion in thought.

Question (English 430). Compare (or contrast) as to (1) character and (2) dramatic function Ismene (Antigone) and Emilia (Othello).
English answer 19. They were both used as minor characters. Both Ismene and Emilia really were weak minded. Both of them were afraid to go against the wills of others. An example of this is when Ismene wouldn't help Antigone bury her brother because the king said it was wrong. Emilia, who was married to Iago, didn't do anything on her own will. Iago generally told her what to do. An example of this is how Emilia obeys Iago when he told her to put the handkerchief in Cassius's room. In conclusion, I would like to say that they were not very democratic, because they were weak characters. They were put in by the authors just to help him carry out the plot.

In this answer, the student appears to be as certain of the validity of his statements as are the writers of the responses considered above. In seventeen lines, the student has used the is of identity twice; the is of classification, four times. Though he has used examples (lines 5-7 and 10-12), he has escaped one difficulty only to fall into another: the inappropriate use of emotive language. In lines 3, 4, and 8-9, one finds "weak minded," "afraid," and "didn't do anything on her own will." The student was asked to write an objective comparison; he has, instead, indulged in what closely resembles name-calling. Finally, some confusion in thought is shown in the combination of the is of classification, connotation, and non sequitur in lines 12-15, and in the vague and--in view of the use of "carry out"--somewhat unflattering comment (lines 15-17) on the function of these minor characters.

Question (English 564). Lines 1-14, "Dover Beach." To which poet, Pope or Wordsworth, is this passage nearer in content and diction? Why?
English answer 155. The passage is undoubtedly Wordsworthian in tone, diction, and content.

It would not be Pope for several reasons: (1) The word choice is not flowery enough; (2) the content is not right; there is not enough satire, no humor.

It is Wordsworthian in tone because (1) the diction is simple and direct; (2) the content is a feeling of life. This is much like Wordsworth's poem. "It is a beauteous evening, calm and free."

In this response, three types of difficulty—two of them connected with the unskillful use of forms of to be—appear. The first of these is shown in lines 6, 7, and 9: "the word choice is not flowery enough"; "the context is not right"; "the diction is simple and direct." By "flowery," the student seems to mean "ornate," "elaborate"; he was probably thinking in terms of conceits; yet the use of the term is designed to influence the reader rather than to state a criterion.

"Right," though partly explained in line 7, may be classified as abstract as well as connotative. The use of this word, as of "flowery," constitutes a judgment, not an analysis. The comment in line 9 may be justified, but the student has given no references or examples to support the statement—as, for example, "On the French coast the light/Gleams and is gone..." Second, the statement in lines 11 and 12 seems dogmatic and in need of explanation: How and why are the two poems alike: These two lines, though probably meant as a climax, seem open to discussion. Last, in line 10, the student writes that "the content is a feeling of life." In seven words, the student has combined the is of identity, high-level abstraction, considerable connotation, and more than a touch of two-valued orientation. The confused clause gives no hint that the student has perceived the sadness and disillusionment in
Arnold's lines.

Question (English 641). Lines 217-242, "The Eve of St. Agnes." What is the quality of the diction as compared with Wordsworth?

English answer 204. ...Keats is very colorful, especially in descriptive passages. Wordsworth is more descriptive in relating poems of nature. Keats is more ornate in his figures of speech. Also, Keats's passages are more musical than Wordsworth's, due to Keats's use of association and alliteration; i.e., he said her clothes creep rustling to her knees and compares her to a mermaid in seaweed.

In this response, the student has used forms of to be to persuade the reader through the forthright use of a series of associative dicta. First, the respondent writes that Keats is very "colorful" (line 1). The adjective has favorable and appealing connotations, but gives the reader little real information. One might justifiably expect some "color" in "descriptive passages"; references to lines would be helpful. "Ornate" seems slightly more specific, but the term has associations of the rococo and the baroque. The reader learns little except that the student's convictions show in the written words. After "musical" (line 6) the reader finds some attempt at explanation; but the comment in lines 6-10 seems confused and inconclusive. As in lines 2-4, the faulty sentence structure reveals confusion in the student's mind; and the unfortunate use of "association" hints rather than precisely indicates. The conviction in this response cannot be said to be equalled by its detail or its precision.

Question (English 430). Compare Wordsworth with Milton as writers of the sonnet.
Here, the student asserts that Milton was "the more serious of the two writers" and that he was "sad because of his blindness" (lines 1-3). The writer of the foregoing discussion might well have considered, for instance, Milton's pride in having lost his eyesight in the cause of Liberty ("To Cyriack Skinner") or the pathos in the use of the Parable of the Talents ("On His Blindness"). Second, the comments on Wordsworth seem confused. "If he had not been so busy, he would have had more time for poetry," besides contradicting the first sentence in the paragraph (lines 5-7), seems practically meaningless. The last sentence appears to be the result of a confused recollection of "London, 1802"; but one is interested in learning just how the student intends to apply it to Milton.

Question (English 564). Lines 1-14, "Dover Beach." To which poet, Pope or Wordsworth, is this passage nearer in content and diction? Why?

English answer 150. The content is universal and human. Nearly everybody has at some time seen a sight quite similar to that of "Dover Beach." This, too, is a characteristic of Wordsworth and not of Pope. Some of Pope's work could be applied to only one situation.

The reader finds here the beginning of a valid, defensible answer. The second sentence is evidently intended to support the first
(which has considerable finality); but the ideas in lines 2-4 are not developed. The student has considered neither the diction nor the content; instead, he has relied on the is of classification (lines 1-2) and the is of identity (lines 4-5) to convince the reader. Lines 5-7 show the same assurance—and omission. The sentence might have been phrased somewhat differently if the student had taken into consideration the Dunciad and the Essay on Man.

Question (English 430). What are the chief limitations or defects of character in (1) Creon and (2) Othello?

English answer 3. Creon can see no other way of doing things except his. He is set in his ways [is of classification, with connotation] and does not care whom he hurts. He has no true religion [word-magic, with connotation]; his is in the state [is of classification, with connotation].

Othello is an extremely jealous person [is of identity, with connotation], who can be talked into anything.

Question (English 56h). Lines 1-14, "Dover Beach." To which poet, Pope or Wordsworth, is this passage nearer in content and diction? Why?

English answer 163. Nearer in content and diction to Wordsworth, because (1) these words are simple yet used imaginatively [is of classification, with connotation]. Pope used elevated [connotation] words to describe ordinary things; (2) these phrases are not ordinary; they are beautiful and symbolic [is of classification, with connotation]. They would not be suitable for Pope's drawing room [is of classification, with connotation]; (3) Pope is not concerned with nature; Wordsworth is. This poem has the element of nature [confusion in thought]; (4) This poem is original. Pope is not original [is of classification, with connotation], except in phrases of speech he uses for common words [confusion in]
thought]. Here is where Pope's imagination lies;

(5) Pope never thought that seriously he was not romantic or mystical [is of classification, with connotation and confusion in thought].

Question (English 430). Explain the importance or non-importance of (1) the lyrical element and (2) comic relief in Antigone and in Othello.

English answer 5. There was some comic relief in Antigone and none in Othello. The only comic relief in Othello was his complete belief in Iago [is of identity, with connotation and confusion in thought]. This element was to give the audience a little relief from the serious and dramatic play, however; it was not very effective in either of these plays [is of classification, with connotation and confusion in thought].

Question (English 564). Lines 1-14, "Dover Beach." To which poet, Pope or Wordsworth, is this passage nearer, in content and diction? Why?

English answer 149. Nearer to Wordsworth, because its mechanics are a natural phenomenon. Arnold is here describing the scene of the ocean breaking on shore. Such subjects are the technique of Wordsworth [is of identity, with confusion in thought]. Pope was not concerned so much with natural occurrences. The diction is Wordsworthian—simple words [is of classification, with connotation]. Pope would have used extravagant words to describe such a simple scene.

These responses (English answers 3, 4, 5, 19, 149, 150, 155, 163, and 204) contain a noticeable amount of the assurance that often accompanies the unskillful use of forms of to be. That certitude—the impression given that the whole discussion may be handled through the is of identity and the is of classification—contributes to a specious directness in the writing. The certitude and the appearance of
directness and simplicity are strengthened by the use of such highly connotative words as "simple," "natural," and "beautiful." In their writing, the students seldom hesitate, question, or qualify. This combination of specious certainty and near-inventive reflects considerable confusion in thought, resulting largely from failure to analyze with care and with reserve.

Two-valued orientation. In two responses (English answers 72 and 7½, to follow), oversimplification appears.

Question (English 5¾O). In your own words, state one example of irony from "Memorial Rain."

English answer 72. In "Memorial Rain" the bitter irony is that the people say that they are grateful for what the soldiers have died, but what have they done for them to show their thanks?

An explanation of irony, with the contradiction between the literal and the intended meaning, may tend to promote two-valued orientation. The student, however, in his anxiety to show the difference between what people say and what they do, both oversimplifies and overinsists. He misses the stateliness of Ambassador Puser's language, the desire of the dead for peace in a strange land, and the healing powers of what is termed "nature." The general and somewhat confused comment in the last two lines poses a direct two-valued orientation, and shows, as well, some lack of both perception and precision. The writer of the answer has mistaken certainty and opposition of terms for understanding analysis.

Question (English 5¾O). In your own words, state one example of irony from "Memorial Rain."
English answer 108. When it begins to rain, the  
people scatter from the field during the  
speech given for the dead; yet the boys who  
died for them did not run away when something  
"unpleasant" occurred [two-valued orientation,  
with oversimplification].

In English answers 72 and 74, the oversimplification found in  
the responses results largely from the students' failure to perceive the  
depth of the irony—to comprehend the contradiction between the literal  
and the intended meaning, to see the difference between what is said and  
what is implied. They have compensated for the lack of careful, under-  
standing analysis by making frequent use of broad and unsupported  
opposition of ideas, and by giving an impression of assurance. These  
examples of irony have not been carefully limited or clearly stated, but,  
instead, have been chosen on the basis of impression rather than  
thorough comprehension. Breadth, rather than clarity, is shown.

In another group of responses (English answers 7, 108, 147, 205,  
and 206, considered below), two-valued orientation, high-order abstrac-

tion, and connotation are found.

Question (English 563). What important differences are  
there between the story of Ruth and that of Samson?

English answer 108. ...Samson appears to be  
a folk legend, with parts of it based on the  
power of God. Samson recognises his power,  
though, which is somewhat pagan. There is much  
exaggeration in Samson, too. Ruth is a simple,  
believable tale which is based completely on  
demonstrating godlike ways.

The examination question asks for a statement of major differen-
ces; it presupposes careful analysis. The student, however, has omitted,  
or left unclarified, steps in his logic. Differences are mentioned, but  
much of the time the reader is left to his own resources and is unable
to decide whether or not the student's comment is justified and valid. The term "exaggeration," for instance, in line 5, means little without some—however brief—explanation. The statement that parts of the story of Samson are "based on the power of God" (lines 2–3) is equally abstract and connotative. The student gives no hint about what parts of the story he refers to, or in what ways these unspecified sections of the story are based on divine power.

The use of forms of to be contributes to the difficulties in the answer. The reader notes in line 6 the vague reference of "which," and the finality of the is of classification, reinforced by the bluntness of the assertion. Moreover, the logic in lines 6–7 does not seem clear: No information is given concerning why the student believes that the story of Ruth is "believable."

Question (English 641). In what respects are lines 73–97 of "The Sensitive Plant" different from (a) Coleridge, (b) Byron?

English answer 206. The underlying thought of the poem differs from Byron, because Byron usually didn't have one. In this part there is quite a bit of original imagery, while Byron was not original. Byron uses many myths in his description, while here there aren't any.

In this answer, the two-valued orientation built by the student is complicated in line 3 by an attempt—without justification and without proof—at what the student doubtless thinks is wit. The statement—concerning a part of the ability of Byron—seems out of place as well as gratuitous. The attitude of the student is further revealed in the use of the is of classification with "original" (lines 4–5)—a comment which seems to need explanation if not defense. Moreover, no instances of the
"myths" mentioned in line 5 are cited to support the statement in the response. The answer as a whole consists of forced two-valued orientation, plus what amounts to invective. The student has felt, rather than considered.

Question (English 1*30). Compare Wordsworth with Milton as writers of the sonnet.

English answer 7. Wordsworth was a nature poet, and he tried to relate human nature with nature. Milton was a more realistic poet, and he dealt with human nature itself.

In the first lines, the writer of the response describes Wordsworth as a "nature poet," which, in conjunction with "tried to relate human nature with nature," seems to classify him as predominantly a painter of natural scenery. Consideration of such sonnets as "On the Extinction of the Venetian Republic," "To Toussaint L'Ouverture," and "Composed upon Westminster Bridge" might have resulted in both qualification and increased accuracy. Milton, on the other hand, is "a more realistic poet" dealing with "human nature." In wording the contrast, the student neglects to explain "more realistic" and seems to have forgotten the wide range of public and private interests shown in Milton's sonnets—"On His Having Arrived at the Age of Twenty-three," "When the Assault Was Intended to the City," "On the Late General Fairfax, at the Siege of Colchester," "To Mr. Lawrence," and "On His Deceased Wife," for instance. The connotative terms, such as "realistic," and the consistently high level of abstraction serve to accentuate the two-valued orientation explicit in the answer.

Question (English 564). Lines 1-14, "Dover Beach." In what respects does this passage differ from lines 1-18, "Tintern Abbey"?
English answer 147. The lines of Wordsworth are more refined and refer to nature in a peaceful, quiet way [two-valued orientation, with high-level abstraction, connotation, and is of classification]. He makes use of few visible symbols, and the imagination displayed in Wordsworth does not come into effect here. Rather, he is merely describing a scene as he remembered and observed it. Arnold, on the other hand, makes use of visible symbols and imagination.

Question (English 641). In what respects are lines 78-97 of "The Sensitive Plant" different from (a) Coleridge, (b) Byron?

English answer 205. ...Byron describes nature artistically, giving form, line, and color; but he is more intellectual in his attitude, rather than physical, and reflective rather than emotional [two-valued orientation, with high-level abstraction, connotation, and is of classification], unlike Shelley.

In English answers 7, 108, 147, 205, and 206, the reader sees that contrast may be expected, in view of the nature of the examination question. He finds, however, that many of the differences enumerated seem exaggerated, arbitrary, or untenable. The majority of them are unsupported and unexplained, and reveal more about the state of the students' emotions than about understanding of the poems under consideration. Though explanation and clarification are lacking, however, the students show their determination to find—or to make—differences. In these five responses, then, support for assertions is lacking, logic is unclear, and statement is equated with proof.

Connotation. In the first group of responses (English answers 33, 109, 141, 130, and 133, which are considered below), the use of connotative terms is combined with high-level abstraction and with
generalization.

**Question (English 430).** Compare Wordsworth with Milton as writers of the sonnet. Why does Wordsworth admire Milton ("London, 1802")? Why does Milton admire Cromwell ("To Oliver Cromwell")?

**English answer 33.** It is difficult to compare these men as writers because they are not so radically different. Milton, however, seems to have a better style than Wordsworth. Wordsworth seems to be somewhat weaker than Milton as a writer of sonnets. Milton seems to express things more clearly to me than does Wordsworth...

Two expressions used in this answer have what might be termed a high connotation index. First, in lines 5-6, the student describes Wordsworth as "weaker than Milton as a writer of sonnets." This statement, which involves such matters as diction, the use of rhetorical devices, and insight, seems weighted as well as vague. The comment on clarity (lines 7-8), moreover, involves intelligibility as well as insight; but the statement—in which the student seems to have forgotten such sonnets as the one written on Westminster Bridge—is made no clearer by the use of the indefinite word "things."

Besides such use of connotation, the reader finds high-level abstraction and the unhesitating use of generalization. The student, in asserting that Wordsworth and Milton are "not so radically different" (lines 2-3), may have in mind concepts of distinctness, dissimilarity, or contrast; but the nature and extent of the minimized differences remain unrevealed. Whether he is referring to, for instance, point of view, style, approach, or technique, the reader is not informed. Furthermore, in his comment on "better style" (line 4), the student combines unclarified high-order abstraction with unsupported judgment.
In using a term which refers to mode of expressing thought, the student may be thinking of Swift's "proper words in proper places" or Milton's "Who would be a poet must himself be a true poem"; but the reader is as unsure of the concept which the student has in mind as of the criteria used to evaluate. Even under such circumstances, however, the student, as in lines 1-3, uses generalization impressive in its breadth.


**English answer 130.** As far as Pope and "The Rape of the Lock" are concerned, except for a vehicle to carry the satire to the Victorians, reality doesn't seem to enter the poem. Pope's idea is to awaken the public by inflating such a trivial matter of stealing a lock of hair to a major military operation. The theme of this (Pope's) compared to the other three, in the sense of some relation to reality, doesn't quite seem to fit, except maybe in some sense. The Victorians over-emphasized and exaggerated the facts and therefore obscured reality by their petty and prudish attitudes.

The student first indicates (line 5) that the public was sleeping, but the connection of this statement with the rest of the discussion does not seem clear. There may be somewhat greater justification for the use of "inflating," "trivial," and "major military operation" (lines 5-7) in that the theme of "The Rape of the Lock" may be less significant than that of the Iliad. Instead, however, of formulating an objective statement concerning the mock-heroic style, the student has mingled ideas of distension, insignificance, and war. In the second place, the writer of this discussion, in a somewhat alliterative passage, accuses the Victorians of over-emphasis and exaggeration, of pettiness and prudishness. The details, however, of what Chesterton called "a working compromise" are not given.
Closely connected with these connotative terms are high-order abstractions. "Reality" is used three times (lines 4, 10, and 13) without explanation, even though the problem of the meaning of "reality" is central in human life. Definition seems urgently needed here, so that the discussion may be made more easily understandable. Again, the reader can only guess what "facts" are referred to in line 12. The reference may be to the ideas of the Pre-Raphaelite group, for instance—or to the theories of Charles Darwin. The level of abstraction remains as high as in the uses of "reality." In the last sentence, furthermore, the generalization seems as confused in thought as sonorous in wording.

**Question (English 563).** What important differences are there between the story of Ruth and that of Samson?

- English answer 109. ...Ruth is rewarded by a happy marriage for her faithful services, and I believe this is a more modern concept of religion, while Samson's strength is returned by God in order to avenge the Philistines for putting out his eyes.

The use of "faithful" in line 2 gives the reader little idea of Ruth's devotion to Naomi, her care in gleaning, or the significance of the kinship of Ruth and Boaz. The vague reference of the pronoun "this" (line 3) also makes the meaning difficult to follow, especially in conjunction with "a more modern concept of religion." The meaning of "modern" in this context is not revealed, nor is one told in what ways "this" is more "modern." The comment does not seem altogether relevant, though it should be noted that the confused statement in the last three lines hints at the relationship. "Faithful" and "modern," it will be observed, are abstract as well as connotative.

English answer 11h. Pope, by means of
mythical allegory - fairies, sylphs, etc. - lends a supernatural atmosphere to the
natural situation of Belinda's loss of lock
[connotation, with high-level abstraction and generalization].

Make a list of differences in the portrayal of the young woman.

English answer 133. "The Forsaken Merman,"
main character Margaret. Margaret loves the merman, but loves mankind more, whereas the Lady of Shalott loves Lancelot mainly with her work and song. Belinda, in "The Rape of the Lock," is concerned with the loss of her locks rather than the intentions of any man.

In the previous answers, we have the general character of each woman in each of the four poems. However, each woman is so different from the others. Besides the differences in character, there are the differences in situation. Belinda, in "The Rape of the Lock," is in a dilemma over the loss of her prize locks. Pope uses as his device satire. In "The Solitary Reaper" the woman portrayed is to be regarded as an example of a simple peasant girl who is conscientious in her work. Her status is much lower than the other three women in the poems. The Lady of Shalott lives in a dream world, not daring to face reality. Margaret, in "The Merman," faced reality from her dream world.

In concluding the differences of the women in each of the four poems, I will say that each is very different. Each woman has a problem; each one solves her problem in a different way; each woman had different personalities and character. Their attitudes were on different levels [connotation, with high-level abstraction and generalization].
In the above responses (English answers 33, 109, 111, 130, and 133), much of the meaning depends on the comparatively large number of highly connotative words used. The difficulties are increased because many of these terms are abstract as well as vague; yet most of them are left unexplained through the use of details and examples. Moreover, these words lend themselves easily to the formation and writing of judgments, handed down without hesitation and without proof—as well as to the making of generalizations, many of which, so far as the reader can tell, are based on confused or cloudy impressions.

In five other discussions (English answers 21, 152, 119, 120, and 181, to follow), one finds the unskillful use of connotation accompanied by high-level abstraction and forms of to be.


English answer 21. Milton was a better writer of the sonnet than Wordsworth. Milton was easier to understand than Wordsworth. He painted a clearer picture. Milton was a brilliant man and wrote about what he firmly believed in.

First, the student states that "Milton was a better writer of the sonnet than Wordsworth" (lines 1-2), but—even if the next three sentences are carefully scrutinized—gives no clear idea of the criteria or the evidence used in arriving at this decision. Now, Everyman may be his own critic; but the answer was supposed to be an evaluation rather than a judgment without qualification. Next, the student attempts to amplify the comment in the second sentence—that Milton was easier to
understand—by asserting that he "painted a clearer picture" (line 4).

Here, the reader finds a combination of connotation and abstraction, as well as an explanation on the same high level as the term to be defined. There is no communication of what is easier to understand—or why.

The unskillful use of connotation, as well as of high-order abstraction, is combined with the finality often resulting from the use of forms of to be. Three of the four sentences, it will be noted, contain the is of identity or the is of classification. Questions involving clarity, intelligence, and mastery of technique are settled to the satisfaction of the student in a series of final classifications.

Question (English 564). Lines 30\textsuperscript{1}-31\textsuperscript{1}, The Passing of Arthur, In Memoriam? In what respects does this passage differ from section cxx\textsuperscript{1}, In Memoriam?

English answer 119. In one respect, the In Memoriam passage differs from the King Arthur passage in word and tone. In Memoriam is a slow, depressing poem, with sort of a gray clouding, while the passage from Arthur moves fast and lightly and has sort of a crystal glow to it. They also differ in style, with the rhyming poetry of In Memoriam.

In using "depressing" (line 4), the student suggests ideas of dejection and lack of spirit. In his consideration of the record of a man's thinking—his gropings and his solutions—the respondent does not explain how an expression of belief in a benevolent God and an immortal soul can be "depressing." The phrase "gray clouding" (lines 4-5), suggesting overcast skies and coming darkness, contains, if it does not strengthen, the associations of "depressing." "Slow" (line 4) and "fast" (line 6) involve such matters as diction and line length; yet the writer of the response merely uses words suggesting a contrast of
heaviness and grace. Tone and mood may be difficult to analyze and appraise, but the student has employed association and antithesis rather than accurate, supported analysis and evaluation.

The use of a high level of abstraction, as well as of the is of classification, will also be noted here. One finds the phrases "sort of a gray clouding" (lines 4-5) and "sort of a crystal glow" (lines 6-7) unclarified by any explanation in the form of quotations or specific references. Comments of this sort may be unanswerable; they can hardly, however, be called precise. Finally, in the face of "Behind thee comes the greater light," the student bluntly and finally characterizes In Memoriam as depressing. The finality in line 4 contrasts startlingly with the use of suggestions and hints in the remainder of the response.

Question (English $6b$). Lines 304-311, The Passing of Arthur. In what respects does this passage differ from section cxxi, In Memoriam?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English answer</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Basically, the response seems valid. Instead of giving some idea of the content and mood of the two passages, however, the student has depended on "an intensely personal emotion" and "a sincere and profound appeal to man" (lines 2, 5-6) to describe the nature of the section from In Memoriam; and on "part of an epic" and "a vivid description" (lines 4, 7) to describe the passage from The Passing of Arthur. Detailed enumeration and discussion do not seem to be called for, but
allusion and/or quotation would have helped to clarify and substantiate the discussion of the differences. For instance, the student might have mentioned the "arm clothed in white samite" brandishing the sword Excalibur, or have quoted the following lines:

Sweet Hesper-Phosphor, double name
For what is one, the first, the last,
Thou, like my present and my past,
Thy place is changed; thou art the same.

Question (English 641). Cazamian's definition of Romanticism:
"An accentuated predominance of emotional life, provoked or directed by the exercise of imaginative vision, and in its turn stimulating or directing such exercise. Test the validity of this statement with reference to Byron.

English answer 181. Byron certainly lives up to the definition since he was superficially Wordsworthian. He mimicked Wordsworth's nature love and admired whatever was really true, good, and beautiful. He was light and gay, used very descriptive words and phrases, wrote romances which were emotional and imaginative — bringing him up to the true definition of Romanticism.

The statement, expressed by means of the is of classification, that Byron "was superficially Wordsworthian" (lines 2-3) gives little idea of the poet's admiration for the mountains and the sea, and shows little basis for the use of the term "superficially." A similar comment may be made concerning the passage "whatever was really true, good, and beautiful" (lines 4-5)—in which the vagueness of the three adjectives is augmented by the word "really." Moreover, an example or two of "very descriptive words and phrases" (line 6) might have helped to make the statement more specific, just as the mention of The Corsair and Don Juan, at least, might have aided in substantiating the statements in lines 7 and 5. Dependence on connotation to communicate
clearly has made this answer a series of unsupported judgments.

**Question (English 564).** Restate the content of lines 18-32, "Ulysses," in your own words.

**English answer 152.** Each experience, instead
of drawing one closer to an "end," merely
opens infinitely into more knowledge, more
activity, and more desire to go onward
[connotation, with high-level abstraction].
Life is not existence; life is living
[connotation, with high-level abstraction
and forms of to be], and he considers
every hour precious and "a bringer of new
things." He considers it vile to allow his
body to rest because he would be imprisoning
his spirit, which is striving to reach
the "end of the infinity."

In reading English answers 21, 119, 120, 152, and 181, one
notes the unsystematic thinking reflected in the careless use of
evocative words—words which, without considerable painstaking clarifi-
cation, are often waver ing and inexact. Interpretation is rendered
difficult when persuasion is substituted for exposition. The vagueness
resulting from the use of unqualified high-order abstractions—many of
which are connotative as well—further increases the chances of
inaccuracy in communication. Paradoxically, however, certainty is
shown in these answers in the use of forms of to be. The basis for
that assurance, though, is communicated in terms of emotion and ab-
straction—or of silence.

**Metaphor.** In two responses (English answers 34 and 162) the
use of mixed figures of speech and of unqualified high-order abstrac-
tions results in noticeable distortion of meaning.

**Question (English 430).** Why does (1) Milton address Cromwell
in "To Oliver Cromwell"? (2) Wordsworth address Milton in
"London, 1802"?
English answer 34. Wordsworth pays tribute to Milton in "London, 1802." He wishes Milton could arise and break the stagnation. Wordsworth was a great naturalist, and in this era people were more concerned with men and force. He thought Milton was a cure.

The student appears to have an indistinct memory of Wordsworth's description of England as "a fen of stagnant waters." The unfortunate image of breaking an intangible, however, obscures the idea--implicit though it may be--that Wordsworth appealed to Milton, who "traveled on life's common way in cheerful godliness" to give England "manners, virtue, freedom, and power" again. The writer of the discussion does not mention, for instance, that the appeal was the more natural because Wordsworth's political and social ideals were largely based on those of Milton and Burke. The image of Milton as a "cure" (line 6) begins an explanation. One learns little about the nature or the methods of the remedy--or about the affliction which was to be cured.

The difficulties of interpretation are increased by the high level of abstraction in lines 4-5: "In this era people were more concerned with men and force." Little light is thrown on what Wordsworth terms "the mischief engendered and fostered among us by undisurbed wealth"; and the misuse of "naturalist" (line 4) does not help the reader.

Question (English 56b). Lines 18-32, "Ulysses." Restate the content of the passage in your own words.

English answer 162. A piece of one's heart is affected by each thing experienced. Through one's experience one can see and guide what lies beyond [distortion of meaning resulting from the use of mixed metaphors and of high-level abstraction]. That which should be active and useful will deteriorate if left
to rest in the shade. And such little time remains, but it should be used to pursue learning further, to bring new things into his life. He has rested too long in retire-
ment when he should have been, and wanted to be, absorbing all that can be known to man, until his last breath [distortion of meaning resulting from the use of mixed metaphors and of high-level abstraction].

In English answers 34 and 162, the analogies suggested by the metaphors seem neither appropriate nor accurate. "I am a part of all that I have met" may be figurative, but it is patently much more clear and concrete than "A piece of one's heart is affected by each thing experienced" (#162). Second, the lack of clarity--as well as of vividness--in the metaphors used in the answers indicates a need for precision in thinking; both are approximate rather than exact. The students seem to hope that metaphors will be considered to be explanation. The vagueness resulting from the use of unexplained high-level abstractions further obscures the meaning and adds to the difficulties facing the reader.

In two other responses (English answers 187 and 197, which are considered below), the reader finds metaphor combined with connota-
tion.

**Question (English 641).** In what respects are lines 78-97 of "The Sensitive Plant" different from (a) Coleridge, (b) Byron?

**English answer 187.** Shelley differs in the main from Byron by this prime factor: He is able to maintain a normal, flowing style through the poem and is quite regular. Byron, on the other hand, is a past master in the art of incongruous gymnastics and at times is liable to inject almost anything into his poems. Byron is much more able to appeal to the masses as he portrays a nature very reliably and in terms
that are familiar. Shelley roars, rhapsodizes, which I like; but too much candy sometimes destroys the craving for sweets. Byron has been known also to stray into the forbidden ground for poets. Shelley was more the conformist in his prison of societal mores than Byron.

First, one finds a reference to Byron as "a past master in the art of incongruous gymnastics" (lines 5-6). The reader cannot decide on the accuracy of the analogy suggested between poetry and physical exercises designed to promote flexibility, strength, and agility, until he knows a little more about what the student is referring to. Perhaps, for instance, the writer of the answer was startled by some of the rhymes in "Julia's Letter," or by the high satiric content of Don Juan as a whole. Again, in lines 11-12, the idea of satiation seems clearly brought out; but the metaphor cannot be considered specific, since no titles or lines are mentioned. Third, the metaphor used in lines 13-14—perhaps a suggested analogy with the story of the Garden of Eden—seems somewhat unclear. No information is given concerning what is forbidden, or in what ways Byron broke the rules. Finally, in view of Shelley's publication of a pamphlet at Oxford, and of his marital difficulties, the reader may wonder slightly at the use of the metaphor "prison of societal mores" (line 15), though the student protects himself by writing "more of a conformist."

The writer of the answer approaches slanting with his use of highly connotative words. In line 3, one finds the comment that Shelley is able to maintain "a normal, flowing style." In using this phrasing, the student has not defined the term, cited criteria, given examples, or made comparisons. The use of "regular" in line 4 seems
open to the same criticism. The word has pleasing connotations, but the reader is not at all certain of the meaning here. Finally, in line 6, the student uses the adjective "incongruous" to describe Byron's "gymnastics." He offers no evidence, however, to clarify and support the judgment; as a result, the term appears to be more of an epithet than an analysis.

Question (English 641). In what respects are lines 78-97 of "The Sensitive Plant" different from (a) Coleridge, (b) Byron?

English answer 197. ...Shelley and Coleridge were probably more rational (Shelley more than any of the three) in their contemplation of nature [metaphor, with connotation], while Byron was too subject to emotional attacks of beauty in nature [metaphor, with connotation and is of classification].

The reader of English answers 187 and 197 will note that some of the analogies suggested ("incongruous gymnastics," for instance, in 137) are rather strained, if not inappropriate. Others are somewhat vague, as in 127, in which the student writes of Byron's "emotional attacks of beauty in nature." Such a statement, with its surprising analogy, may possibly be valid, but until more exact information about poems and lines is made available, judgment must be reserved. Moreover, connotative terms are used with some lack of care. The comment in English answer 197, that Shelley is "more rational" in the contemplation of nature than either Coleridge or Byron is, needs both explanation and proof. Whether the student, in using "natural" means "poised," "reserved," "restrained," or something similar is not at all clear. The use of highly connotative words under such circumstances confuses rather than clarifies the metaphors employed.
Slanting. In seven responses (English answers 18, 20, 26, 30, 63, 68, and 101, which follow), one finds slanting, with the use of highly connotative words.

Question (English 430). What are the chief limitations or defects of character in (1) Creon and (2) Othello?

English answer 30. Creon and Othello seem to be used too much as tools. Instead of their actions reflecting on the other characters, the characters inflict their actions on Creon and Othello. These two are not outstanding enough nor dynamic.

First, two connotative words appear to be of major significance in the selection of ideas and of impressions. "Reflecting on" is probably used here in the sense of "influencing" or "having effect on"; but the use of "inflict" in line 4 is more puzzling. That the writer of this answer meant "to impose something that must be suffered" seems doubtful. Specific examples—references to lines and to incidents—would have helped to clarify what seems to be the student's contention: that these men, instead of being forthright, strong-minded, and aggressive, were greatly influenced by the attitudes and actions of those about them. The emotional content of these two words, however, clouds the meaning considerably. Slanting also appears in lines 1-2 and 5-6: How does one determine the point at which men are "used too much as tools" and at which individuals are sufficiently "outstanding" and "dynamic"? No basis seems to exist for either decision or evaluation; the student has used statements that seem to simplify but that do not explain. Finally, by "outstanding" the student may mean, for instance, "prominent," "conspicuous," or "striking"; by "dynamic," "energetic,"
"active," or "forceful." Instead of being precise and specific, the student has used loaded words which embody unsupported judgments.

It may be noted, too, that "actions" is highly abstract, merely communicating the idea of something done, and that the use of classification in line 5 seems, by its finality, further to augment the difficulties arising from the use of emotive language and slanting.

Question (English 540). In your own words, state an example of irony from "Memorial Rain."

English answer 68. "Memorial Rain." In this poem, MacLeish uses irony to show the way an old windbag continues to feed the same old tripe.

By selecting ideas and by using two words, both with unfavorable connotations, the writer of this answer has described Senator Puser as an empty, voluble, pretentious talker, whose speeches are, of course, worthless. Instead of stating the example in his own words—as he is specifically requested to do—the student prejudges the matter by means of connotation. A paraphrase of the lines "This little field, these happy, happy dead/Have made America," with some explanation of the context, would have been more illuminating than the use of slanting and of invective. It may be added, too, that the use of "continued," with its suggestion of lack of insight, serves to show how the student has avoided writing directly and objectively on the discussion topic.

Question (English 563). What important differences are there between the story of Ruth and that of Samson?

English answer 101. Samson was boastful in his strength and what he could do. He was a schemer to try and keep the wife's people from guessing the riddle—certainly not humble as Ruth was.
In five lines, the writer of this brief response has classified Samson, Ruth and the two stories. No explanations are offered for the use of "boastful" (line 1), with its connotations of pride, vanity, and exultation; the student has apparently chosen to disregard Samson's words to the Lord, "Thou hast given this great deliverance into the hand of thy servant." Moreover, the underhanded plotting and the intrigue suggested by "schemer" (line 3) might be considered, by some readers of the story, as legitimate, natural reticence on the part of Samson. The antithesis achieved through the use of "humble" in line 4 serves to emphasize the slanting. The student has not commented on the charm and the simplicity of the story of Ruth, or on the mixture of folk tales and mythical motives in the story of Samson. He has made up his mind and selected his ideas to fit his opinions.

Question (English 430). What are the chief limitations or defects of character in (1) Creon and (2) Othello?

English answer 20. Both Creon and Othello possessed a strong belief in what they thought was right. Both characters, however, were blind to so many obvious faults. They did not realize the real truth until it was too late. 1 2 3 4 5 6

No explanation of what the student terms "so many obvious faults" is offered. The respondent does not point out, for instance—with supporting evidence—that Creon seems somewhat narrow in his often-mentioned devotion to the State, and his insistence on rigid enforcement of the laws, or that Othello appears to be credulous and direct, a soldier rather than a philosopher. The comments, like the statement (lines 4-6) that "they did not realize the real truth until it was too late," need quotations and specific references to support them:
Nothing you say can touch me any more.
My own blind heart has brought me
From darkness to final darkness.

It is the very error of the moon.
She comes more near the earth than is her wont
And drives men mad.

Question (English 430). What are the chief limitations or
defects of character in (1) Creon and (2) Othello?

English answer 26. Creon's chief defect of
color is his insufferable pride [slanting,
with connotation and the is of identity],
which led to his downfall.
Othello's chief defect of character is
lack of insight and his sense of honor
[connotation, with is of identity] which,
when played upon by Iago [connotation], creates
the tragedy.

Question (English 430). What are the chief limitations or
defects of character in (1) Creon and (2) Othello?

English answer 18. Creon's chief defect is
stubborn, unrelenting pride. Othello is
cursed with a passionate nature aroused by
jealousy [slanting, with connotation].
He is also a poor judge of character [is of
identity, with connotation].

Question (English 520). In your own words, state an example
of irony from "Memorial Rain."

English answer 63. In this poem, Puser is
telling the gathering of the happy dead that
are buried there in a foreign country. But
the irony of these words is that no dead
could be happy in a strange, foreign land
[is of classification, with connotation].
The orator also gives out the same old
common speech concerning dead heroes, and
Macleish feels that his dead friend has
been slighted [slanting, with connotation].

In the seven responses which have been considered (English
answers 18, 20, 26, 30, 63, 68, and 101), the reader finds little
analysis, detail, or supporting evidence. Instead, the writers of
these discussions have prejudged the matters supposedly under consideration. In their comments, the respondents use numerous evocative words which reveal—and appeal to—emotion. Both favorable and unfavorable connotations are used, as in #26, in which the student writes of Creon's "insufferable pride" and of Othello's "high sense of honor," rather than explaining in what ways Creon is proud or under what circumstances Othello seems ingenuous and impetuous. Such emotional classification may appear to be succinct; it is, however, inexact and often unclear. Objectivity is lost, and persuasion takes the place of analysis.

In a second group of responses (English answers 131, 135, 143, 145, and 195, to follow), one finds slanting accompanied by high-order abstraction and by over-simplification.


English answer 135. ...Pope satirizes his Belinda for being the paragon of vanity. He also adds a touch of mystery by comparing her dressing and putting on make-up to a pagan ritual. Of all the young women mentioned in the above sentences, Belinda stands out as the most finely developed in character. Her divine-like beauty, her queen-like manners, and her insane-like ravings over a lock of hair give her a very rich character.

The student has apparently decided that "Belinda stands out as the most finely developed character," and has selected his ideas and comments accordingly. It will be observed, first, that he is not answering the question directly, but is defending rather than analyzing. "Finely developed in character" (line 7) both begs and
oversimplifies the question. The quoted statement is supported, in the judgment of the student, by "divine-like beauty," a comment which seems valid until one realizes that the student has largely missed the point of "mock heroic." The listing of "queen-like manners" would seem to be largely nullified by the "insane-like ravings" mentioned in line 9—though the student was probably thinking of

Then flashed the living lightning from her eyes,
And screams of horror rend th' affrighted skies.

The reader may not fully understand, however, how the qualities and actions listed by the student give Belinda "a very rich character"—especially if the possession of desirable qualities is meant.

Though the student appears to make an attempt to use lower levels of abstraction for clarification and support, the reader sees that a consistently high level is maintained. Even if it is granted that the student knows exactly what he means by "finely developed in character" and by a "very rich character," he does not show clearly the relationship of the comments in lines 7-9 to these statements, nor does he use details or examples. The response, especially from line 4 to line 10, remains a series of largely unrelated judgments.

**Question (English 6,1). Lines 217-218, "The Eve of St. Agnes." Discuss the connotation of colors in this passage as compared with those in lines 208-209 of "The Sensitive Plant."

*English answer 195.* In this listing it is
clearly and easily seen that Keats used colors in his passage to bring about a mood, a feeling, and a wonderful rainbow of thoughts and impressions; whereas Shelley used the colors only in their simplest form, making only a simple and narrow interpretation possible. Keats brings the mood to life through color,
so that it surrounds the reader. Shelley only 9
paints a picture before the reader. 10

In using the expression "clearly and easily seen" (line 2), the
student is begging the question. Now, the reader may—or may not—
clearly and easily understand the concepts sketched; he justifiably
expects analysis—requested in the examination question—in the answer.
Instead, the student assumes that the question supposedly under con-
sideration is already settled. Second, the respondent asserts that
"Shelley used the colors only in their simplest forms" (lines 5-6).
He apparently has not observed the connotations of "And white with the
whiteness of what is dead" and is intent only on maintaining the
position upon which he had previously decided. The idea in lines
5-6 is repeated in lines 9-10: "Shelley only paints a picture before
the reader"—in spite of the fact that the question concerns the nature
of that picture.

In writing of the "wonderful rainbow of thoughts and impressions"
(lines 4-5), the student goes into no more detail than he does in his
statement that Shelley's use of colors makes "only a simple and narrow
interpretation possible," or in the comment that "Keats brings the
mood to life through color" (lines 7-8, 8-9). One is told nothing
about the spectrum, the interpretation, or the mood. The level of ab-
straction remains high.

Question (English 564). Lines 1-11, "Dover Beach." In
what respects does this passage differ from lines 1-18,
"Tintern Abbey"?

English answer 145. "Dover Beach" differs 1
most conspicuously from the selected lines of 2
"Tintern Abbey" in that, as compared to Arnold, 3
Wordsworth says all but nothing (slanting, with 4
oversimplification]. The eighteenth line of "Dover Beach" has the reader well into the theme, and thinking of "human misery," while the eighteenth line of "Tintern Abbey" has one merely arrive at another period describing the close of another willy-nilly passage about the babble of brooks and the song of birds [slanting, with oversimplification].

Arnold's diction is much more direct than Wordsworth's [is of classification, with high-level abstraction]. He (Arnold) doesn't make his reader chase him around circle after circle [slanting, with high-level abstraction and oversimplification]. And I think "Dover Beach" far superior to "Tintern Abbey" for these reasons. With the exception of several of his sonnets, I find Wordsworth most tiresome.


English answer 131. Wordsworth paints a picture of nature with one human figure in it. This seems to represent a survival of the fittest idea. Nature is the touchstone between man and God. It is through love of beauty and the natural that one may be in touch with God. But by placing the girl alone it is questionable and odd as to how she will survive. Nature is beautiful, but is also nowhere to remain alone as the girl does. In some of the answer—lines 4-6—the student seems to understand some aspects of Wordsworth's attitude toward nature—the idea, for instance, that man, approaching nature with humility and imagination, might come to understand himself better and might come to live in harmony with the laws governing the universe. But the idea of the "survival of the fittest" (lines 3-4) seems incongruous here. It will be observed, however, that the writer of the answer returns to this idea in lines 7-10. He has not altogether disregarded the discussion
topic, but he has planned his answer so that his idea will be prominent and so that its validity will not appear to be challenged by opposing evidence.

Question (English 564). Lines 18-32, "Ulysses." Restate the content of the passage in your own words.

English answer 143. Ulysses, though an old man, wants to further explore the world, still seeks knowledge, wishing to follow its guidance to the utmost [slanting, with oversimplification and high-order abstraction.]

Actually, he desires and seeks only that which all men do - perfection, and that perfection which is the Divine [slanting, with oversimplification and high-level abstraction]. On earth it is never realized.

In English answers 131, 135, 143, 145, and 195, then, assertions are made on the basis of conclusions reached before analysis of the problem and evaluation of the evidence. The student writers, having thus decided on the stand to be taken, use selected evidence which will tend to support that position. They omit— or overlook— ideas or aspects which might tend to modify or to contradict the statements made in the responses. Moreover, the evidence— as well as the major contentions— is on a high level of abstraction. Consideration of this group of answers indicates that the students not only select but also fail to communicate clearly and precisely the versions upon which they have decided.

In summarizing the results of the analysis of the responses in English, the writer will offer, first, an observation on the subject matter of the questions (with reference to the use of abstraction and of emotive language); second, figures showing the frequency and
classification of errors; and, third, examples of superior or excellent answers.

Some of the examination questions and discussion topics involve consideration of ideas and theories about which disagreement is as deep and sincere as the diversity of opinion concerning some theories in the social studies. On the one hand, some of the questions and topics are concerned with abstract ideas and concepts, such as, for instance, discussion of the modernity of the book of Job. Other questions, however, such as one dealing with an explanation of why the "Ode on a Grecian Urn" is "a picture, an experience, and a creed," may be more apt to cause the use of emotive language. It may be noted, too, that the 400-level course is concerned with types of literature; one 500-level course, with modern literature; two others, at the same level, with masterpieces of English prose and poetry; and the 600-level course, with the Romantic Period.

The enrollment figures (for the academic year 1952-1953) for the courses in English are appended:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Enrollment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>600</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Let us proceed to a summary of the classifications under the six major headings the first of which is Abstraction.
ABSTRACTION

1. **Dead-level abstraction**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>600</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The writers of those discussions remain on a high level of abstraction, and, by means of the use of broad statements, deal with difficult, often profound, problems. Occasionally, the reader is misled because of the paucity of qualification in the responses. The students in the 400 and 500-level courses appear to have more difficulty here than do those in the more advanced courses. The latter are probably more experienced in careful analysis and in the use of evidence to clarify and to support statements.

2. **Lack of communication**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>600</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Here, communication breaks down almost entirely as a result of the unskillful selection and arrangement of high-level abstractions. The problem is chiefly one of the inclusion of details and examples, and of their selection for relevance, accuracy, and clarity. It seems rather surprising that students in the middle and the advanced groups appear to have more difficulty here than do those in the 400-level classes.
3. High-order abstraction, with looseness in thought

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In these answers, the high-order abstractions, which are basic to the discussion, remain undefined and unexplained. In addition to this lack of explanation essential for clarity and accuracy, there is failure to show definite, precise relationships between the statements set forth. Students at the lower course levels seem to have trouble with the use of both high and low levels of abstraction, and with the logical organization of ideas.

4. High-level abstraction, with connotation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

First, in these answers, the use of unqualified high-order abstractions results in vague and circuitous writing. The unskillful use of highly connotative terms, moreover, brings loss of objectivity, so that the reader finds not only clouded or confused meanings but also judgments backed chiefly by emotion. These students, then, without being either precise or clear, have attempted to persuade. It is somewhat surprising that students in the 500-level courses appear to have more difficulties here than do beginners.
SYMBOLS

1. Word-magic, with high-level abstraction and connotation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
<th>400</th>
<th>500</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the four responses listed above, belief in the power of symbols to influence events leads to the use of repetition instead of analysis and clear communication of ideas. In addition, the significance assigned—often rather arbitrarily and uncritically—to the symbols is frequently considerably clearer to the student than to the reader. As one considers the problem presented, involving the consistent use of high levels of abstraction, of confusion of word with object or idea, and of the employment of personal connotations, it may not be surprising that advanced students appear to have fewer difficulties here than do those at the 400 and 500 levels.

2. Word-magic, with two-valued orientation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
<th>600</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In these responses, the use of symbols is marked by lack of precision. The students have not analyzed or defined the symbols used; instead, they appear to have tacitly waived questions of validity and accuracy. In phrasing the judgments that constitute a large part of these answers, the respondents have used antithesis, which combines
with the loose use of symbols to set up and to emphasize two-valued orientation. Advanced students appear to have more trouble in using symbols accurately and analytically than do those in the beginning or the middle groups.

3. Word-magic, with oversimplification and looseness in thought

Here, one finds not only confusion of word with object or idea but also rather hazy comprehension of the symbols which form the basis of the responses. This incomplete grasp of major concepts leads to noticeable oversimplification, as well as to incoherence. Such terms as "creed" (#36) and "lyrical elements" (#28) are dealt with quickly, and the complex problems of a writer's philosophy are solved in a few well-weighted words. Students at the 400 level seem to have more difficulty than do the others in analyzing meanings carefully; in weighing, evaluating, and communicating evidence; and in avoiding belief in the inherent virtues of symbols.

CONTEXTS

1. Shifts in meaning of key terms, with high-level abstraction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONTEXTS</th>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The reader of these responses, in considering the shifts in meaning of major terms, notes that apparently contradictory or irrelevant material is often included, and that ideas are frequently implicit rather than explicit. These errors in verbal communication indicate a faulty grasp of major ideas. The use of unexplained high-order abstractions, with their multiple meanings, increases the difficulties of accurate interpretation. In this problem, involving analysis and the explanation of relationships, students in the beginning and middle groups seem to have more difficulty than do those in advanced classes.

2. Confused contexts, with connotation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the three answers listed above, the lack of explanation or clarification of shifts in meaning of key terms indicates the students' uncertainty in the use of these words. That lack of security, it will be noted, results in the circumlocution and unclear organization which mark these responses. The difficulties of expression and of interpretation are increased by the use of highly connotative words; thus, in this group of answers, emotional reactions are often vividly but usually unsystematically expressed. Students in the beginning and middle groups appear to have more trouble than those at the 600 level in working with multiple meanings and in expressing ideas with clarity.
FORMS OF TO BE

1. Is of identity and is of classification, with high-level abstraction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Class</th>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Here, the equating of different levels of abstraction through the use of forms of to be is emphasized by the noticeable amount of projection: These students confidently and easily ascribe qualities—most of them abstract and unexplained—to writers or to works of literature. Thus, the reader of these answers finds a combination of finality and oversimplification. In this problem, which involves the need for careful qualification, the work of students at the 400 and 500 levels is represented.

2. Forms of to be, with connotation and confusion in thought

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Class</th>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>600</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

First, one notes the assurance in the dicta confidently handed down—the lack of hesitation, of qualification, in the comments on problems which may justifiably be considered to be rather complex. Yet (perhaps not surprisingly) confusion in thought—shown in faulty sentence structure and in lack of coherence—is often present. Perhaps to compensate, probably to persuade, the respondents use numerous
highly connotative words, many of them persuasive—and many close to name-calling. Students at the 400 and 500 levels appear to have more difficulty than those in the more advanced group, in clarifying and qualifying statements and in maintaining objectivity.

TWO-VALUED ORIENTATION

1. Two-valued orientation, with oversimplification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In these responses, certainty is noticeable. Without definite limitations or explanation, considerably oversimplified ideas are placed in direct opposition to each other. Yet one finds in these discussions failure to analyze closely, to see the full implications of irony. One is reminded of Fowler's comment that irony has for its audience an inner circle. It is rather surprising that students at the 500 level appear to have more difficulty here than do beginning students.

2. Two-valued orientation, with high-level abstraction and connotation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In these responses, the enumeration of differences is marked, first, by oversimplification, chiefly through exaggeration and generalization and through the use of unexplained high-level abstractions. The evident determination to record differences often results
in rather forced two-valued orientation. Second, the connotative terms used lend themselves to the expression of broad emotion-based judgments, rather than to the objective recording of the results of careful analysis and arrangement of ideas. The work of students at all three course levels, it will be noted, is represented here.

The sixth major heading, emotive language, has three subheadings: connotation, metaphor, and slanting. Let us turn to the first of these.

**CONNOTATION**

1. Connotation, with high-level abstraction and generalization
   - Number of responses inspected
   - 400
   - 500

   By using many associative and evocative words, the writers of these discussions have set forth emotional reactions rather than considered, supported analyses and evaluations. The vagueness and breadth, rather than depth, resulting from the unskillful use of connotative words is increased by the use of several high-level—and sometimes seemingly irrelevant—abstractions. It may not be surprising, then, that these responses contain generalization marked by lack of explanation and of supporting evidence. The work of students in the 400- and 500-level classes is represented here. The more advanced students appear to have less trouble.
In their careless use of connotative words, with unclear referents and with little or no explanation, the students reveal their confusion of the descriptive and the inferential levels. This confusion is combined with the vagueness resulting from the use of unqualified high-order abstractions. The reader will note, moreover, an expected but—in these responses—somewhat baseless finality resulting from the use of forms of to be. As the listing indicates, students at all three course levels have trouble with this linguistic problem.

METAPHOR

The strained analogies used in these answers cloud meaning rather than clarify it. The distortion of meaning resulting from such inaccuracy is augmented by lack of specificity stemming from the use of unqualified high-level abstractions. The problem, then, involves (1) close examination of metaphors for accuracy and appropriateness, (2) careful use of details for clarity and support. Advanced students
seem to have less trouble here than do those in the courses at the 400 and 500 levels.

2. **Metaphor, with connotation**

| Number of responses inspected | 600 | 2 |

The metaphors used in these answers appear to be more vivid than explanatory. The reader is not given enough information to enable him to do much more than guess at the meaning intended. The vagueness of the images evoked by these analogies is further complicated by those called up by the connotative terms used. Advanced students seem to have more trouble with this combination of vagueness and persuasion than do those in the beginning or the middle groups.

**SLANTING**

1. **Slanting, with connotation**

| Number of responses inspected | 400 | 4 |
|                              | 500 | 2 |

The examination questions for the responses listed above involve specific matters which can be enumerated, explained, verified. The respondents, instead, have chosen to select evidence and to indulge in name-calling by means of the use of connotative words. They have simplified, with a specious terseness; they have also rationalized. The reader will note that the work of students in the middle group, as well as of beginners, is represented in this confusion of the descriptive and the inferential levels.
First, the matters supposedly under consideration have been prejudged. Before analysis or examination of evidence, the students have decided on the stand to be taken. They therefore tend to be more concerned with the defense of that stand than with objective analysis. The development of this attitude and this procedure is facilitated by the lack of detail and by the use of broad, colorless expressions. Students at the upper levels (500 and 600) seem to have more difficulty here than do beginners.

The following portion of the chapter will be concluded with a few responses which may be classed as superior or excellent.

Question (English 430). What are the chief limitations or defects of character in (1) Creon and (2) Othello?

English answer 441. Creon and Othello were alike in some ways. Creon was the antagonist, but could very easily have been the protagonist. Othello was the protagonist. Both men were heroes, more or less, and both lacked one important thing: Neither had an "insight" into what was happening around him. Many of the people wanted the body buried because it was one of their strict duties and they feared the gods. The death of his son and wife were necessary before his eyes were opened. Throughout the play we can see Othello's plight, but there didn't seem to be a way for him to realize the conditions. If he hadn't lacked every quality of insight, he might have become aware of Iago's dishonesty.

I haven't decided definitely, but I think both men took the affairs of state too seriously. I suppose it was common in that day and age to be a soldier and only a soldier,
or a king and only a king. Neither seemed to have the family ties that we know today. Othello never gave his wife the "benefit of the doubt" or never put the question directly to her and let her give her rebuttal. He didn't place his trust in the right people. Creon seemed to have no feeling for his son or for Antigone. The state was all that counted. I could see some excuse for his action had the law been in effect before he himself put it in effect. It was against his religion and against his family. I can't see that it gained a thing for the city.

The reader will note that one weakness seems to be a lack of smooth transition; the discussion as a whole seems somewhat disjointed. Second, forms of to be are used (lines 1 and 4) with resultant finality, though, by using brief phrases, the student has qualified the is of identity and the is of classification.

However, the student has attempted—with considerable success—to enumerate and to explain the matters under consideration. The apparent hesitation, as in line 17, does not appear to be the result of insecurity, but rather, to be the outcome of careful consideration. Second, much of the material is concrete and specific: The respondent has tried—as in lines 7-11, 15-16, 23-26, 27-28, and 30-33—to use examples to clarify major statements in the discussion. Finally, to a large extent, he has avoided attempts at persuasion through the use of connotative words.

**Question (English 540).** In your own words, state one example of irony from "Memorial Rain."

**English answer 153.** There is irony in the contrast between Ambassador Puser's thoughts of his country being the resting place of Americans that they were restful and at peace—in contrast to the thoughts of the American who felt that this earth away from home was waiting and listening for him.
Though the parallelism is faulty, the student shows, first, that he understands the subtle rhetorical device called irony, with its contradiction between the literal and the intended meaning. Second, in the use of "earth away from home" (line 6), he shows comprehension of a major aspect of the irony in the poem. (It may be noted that the four words quoted above are a close paraphrase of a passage in "Memorial Rain.") Implicit, too, in line 6 are the words, "He rests, he is quiet, he sleeps in a strange land." This answer is offered as an example of a direct, clear statement, without noticeable weakening through the unskillful use of high-level abstractions or of connotation.

Question (English 564). Lines 1—14, "Dover Beach." To which poet, Pope or Wordsworth, is this passage nearer in content and diction? Why?

English answer 169. It is definitely closer to Wordsworth in both content and diction. In content, he describes the beauty of nature, which is very typical of Wordsworth. The last line

And bring
The eternal note of sadness in

is a sign of transcendentalism. As Wordsworth did, he sees a deeper meaning than just the reality of the senses. In looking at the sea, he shows a contemplative spirit. Pope, on the other hand, is an expert in satire. He speaks of the social faults of man, and not at all of beauty or higher values. Pope's poetry is worldly; Wordsworth's and Arnold's is the opposite. Arnold, as does Wordsworth, creates a mood in his description of nature — makes it personal. In diction, these lines of Arnold's are comparable to Wordsworth's sonnets "It Is a Beauteous Evening" and "Composed upon Westminster Bridge." They are truly using Wordsworth's theory of "language of the common man in a state of vivid sensation." The words are simple, but are arranged
There are, it appears, two weaknesses in this response. First, the student has oversimplified—especially in the last eight lines of the answer—through the use of the is of classification. Second, the employment of highly connotative terms, usually in connection with forms of to be, increases that oversimplification.

On the other hand, the student has made an effort to clarify high-level abstractions: He has (in lines 10-12, 16-19, and 20-23, for instance) used specific references, and has employed direct quotation. Second, in clarifying and supporting his explanation, he has avoided two-valued orientation. Third, the respondent has made a sincere—and, in the opinion of the writer, largely successful—effort to answer the question directly and concisely.

The final example of a creditable answer is from English 641.

Question (English 641). Lines 78-97, "The Sensitive Plant."

In what respects is this passage typical of Shelley?

English answer 198. In form these stanzas are typical of Shelley because of their lightness and melody. The words are light; the music murmurs; the beams dart; the "plumed" insects are swift and free.

Shelley's imagination is here indicated; the poet of the sky uses his ethereal images often and well—images such as stars, clouds of dew, the sun riding high, spirit among spheres, clouds, vapors, angels, etc. Shelley soars and leaves mundane existent behind. His poetry has many...
The reader of this response will notice, first, that specific references to lines and images might well have been used more often—though lines 3-4 and 8-11 contain such references. Second, the use of the is of classification in line 3 gives an impression of finality.

The student, however, has effectively limited his treatment of the topic, and the sequence of ideas is clear and logical. He has, moreover, made effective—though, perhaps, somewhat elaborate—use of metaphor. In the analysis and evaluation, he has presented a tenable interpretation, backed by considerable knowledge and comprehension.

In these responses, the reader will find various errors which occur in the answers discussed earlier in the chapter. These errors occur less frequently, however, and therefore impair communication less, than in the representative responses.

The analysis and summary indicate that certain difficulties and errors stand high: dead-level abstraction; use of forms of to be, with connotation and confusion in thought; and slanting, with connotation.

The writers of the last group of responses have succeeded in largely avoiding these difficulties. They have, on the contrary, tried to use both high and low levels of abstraction; to avoid the impression that the use of the is of identity and of the is of classification tells the whole story; and to remain on the descriptive level.

An analysis of responses in English, the summary of findings, and examples of superior or excellent answers have preceded. The concluding portion of this chapter will consist of a presentation of
recommendations, based on the findings, for use in the teaching of English.

As before, the techniques suggested are within the framework of the classifications serving as the basis for the analyses (Abstraction, Symbols, Contexts, Uses of to be, Two-valued orientation, Referential and emotive language). Moreover, at the beginning of Chapter VIII will be found suggestions and comments applying to all the areas considered in this study.

The responses analyzed under Abstraction may now be considered.

ABSTRACTION

The answers analyzed under the above heading are grouped as follows: (a) dead-level abstraction (with students in the 400- and 500-level courses appearing to have more difficulty here than do those in the more advanced classes); (b) lack of communication (shown largely in the work of students in the middle and the advanced groups); (c) high-level abstraction, with looseness in thought (appearing in the writing of students at the three course levels); (d) high-level abstraction, with connotation (evidenced, in large part, in the work of students in the 500-level courses).

It is the opinion of the writer that the following suggestions will be useful to teachers working toward a solution of these problems.

Dead-level abstraction. The difficulties in these responses involve (a) the use of such technical terms as "romantic," as well as more general words, such as "imagination and nature"; (b) evaluation, especially in the form of comparison and contrast of literary works,
and of analysis of character; (c) clear, accurate communication of facts. It is suggested, therefore, that students be given instruction and practice in defining such terms as "imagination and nature," "the freedom and beauty that nature possesses," and "simplicity and distinction" through the use of examples and details, as well as of operational definitions. Second, during lectures and discussions introducing the writing of evaluative comments, the instructor may demonstrate how Coleridge's formula (What has the author tried to do? How has he done it? Was it worth doing?) can be used as the basis for evaluative writing. Then, after a review of judicial, impressionistic, and historical criticism—as types—students may be requested to label the evaluative comments in their own responses.

Through the use of an opaque projector or of mimeographed pages, the instructor may analyze a passage to show the results of dead-level abstraction. Such a passage as the following—on a consistently high level of abstraction, as are the responses under consideration—may serve for such a demonstration:

In Arnold's poetry, a sense of clearness and proportion is found. Readers may find some of his poetry too intellectual, even including "Dover Beach," which shows some sadness over his loss of faith, resulting from the pressure of modern ideas.

Questions and discussion topics, moreover, may be used as a basis for a demonstration of ways of organizing materials (involving suggestions for outlines) and of examples which may be used in writing responses to the questions and discussion topics. It may be helpful, too, to explain why certain kinds of examples will clarify and support more effectively than will other kinds. Such questions as the
following may be used for this procedure:

In what respects does "Dover Beach" (lines 1-14) differ from "Tintern Abbey" (lines 1-18)?

What does the nightingale's song suggest to Keats in the "Ode to a Nightingale"?

In what respects do the sense impressions (sight, sound, etc.) and figures of speech (metaphors, similes, etc.) in the "Song of Songs" differ from those in the "Psalms"? Quote examples.

Lack of communication. Exercises in paraphrasing of prose or verse may be helpful. Such practice, with its emphasis on clarity in explanation, requires both attention and analysis in reading. In his introductory remarks about the procedure, the instructor may stress the retention of the tone of the original, and the use of clarity as a criterion for decision as to whether to retain some words or to substitute others.

It is suggested, furthermore, that the students be given practice in the revision of their paraphrases. Specific suggestions for changes in wording of answers will have been made on the papers and during conferences; and the revision may well be done in class, with the instructor available for consultation. The students may be requested to use examples and details and operational definitions. The employment of the how-what-when test, of index numbers, and of dates may help to make the students more aware of the level of abstraction used.

High-level abstraction, with looseness in thought. Students may profit from instruction in ways of being specific in their comments about works of literature. They may be shown how to formulate
statements expressing the distinguishing quality of the piece of literature under consideration, and to illustrate such statements by references to passages in the work. Discussions concerning these matters of approach and technique may be accompanied by study of such passages as the following:

This is war, and the wreck and rebuilding that follows it, told entirely from the woman's angle. We have had other novels about the Civil War by women, including Mary Johnston's excellent ones and Evelyn Scott's remarkable The Wave. But I don't know of any other in which the interest is so consistently centered, not upon the armies and the battles, but upon that other world of women who heard the storm, waited it out, succumbed to it or rebuilt after it, according to their natures. It is in the diaries and the memoirs—in Letitia Macdonald and Mrs. Roger A. Pryor and a dozen more. But it has never been put so completely in fiction before. And it is that which gives Gone With The Wind its originality and its individual impact.

It is a long book and a copious one, crowded with character and incident, and bound together with one consistent thread, the strong greediness of Scarlett O'Hara, who was bound to get her way, in spite of the hampering ideal of the Perfect Southern Gentlewoman and the ruin that follows men's wars. She didn't, quite, in the end, though she got a great many other things—including money and power—but the tale of her adventures and her struggles makes as readable, full-bodied, and consistent a novel as we have had in some time—a novel which, in certain passages, as in the flight from burning Atlanta, rises to genuine heights. Miss Mitchell knows her period, her people, and the red hill country of North Georgia—she knows the clothes and the codes and the little distinctions that make for authenticity. Tara is a working plantation, not a white-porched movie set—and Atlanta is itself an individual city, not a fabulous combination of all the first-family features of Richmond, Charleston, and New Orleans. The civilization of the antebellum South was something a little more than a picturesque gesture in gentility—and to a public a little surfeited with wistful reminiscence of the cape-jessamine side of it, Miss Mitchell's rather more realistic treatment should come as a decided relief.¹

Furthermore, instruction and practice in effective organization is urged. Students may be shown the need for planning carefully the sequence of ideas, and for considering the relative weight which will be given to these ideas. This instruction may well include practice in writing outlines. Moreover, review of the use of transitional devices may help students to indicate clearly to the reader the planning and the logic behind their words.

The training and review suggested above may be accompanied by exercises in the writing of single paragraphs and groups of connected paragraphs by the methods listed and illustrated below.

a. **Comparison and contrast**

Browning, then, was of the tribe of Shelley; Tennyson... belonged to that of Keats; and this was only one of a multitude of differences which separated the two poets. Never, perhaps, have two great writers of the same age differed more widely. They were as unlike in personal appearance as in their work. Tennyson looked every inch a poet. One observer, perhaps with a touch of malice, likened his head to that of "a dilapidated Jove"; but probably the most vivid thing ever said of him was the remark of Sydney Dobell: "If he were pointed out to you as the man who had written the Iliad, you would answer, 'I can well believe it.'" But if Browning had been pointed out as the author of the Iliad, the answer would have been an ejaculation of surprise. He impressed the observer as a capable and successful man of the world, a man distinguished for good sense rather than for imagination. Until he met Browning, Jowett "had no idea that there was a perfectly sensible poet in the world." But the two poets were different in points far more important than outward appearance. While Tennyson at the start sometimes sank to triviality, Browning's designs were always ambitious and daring, even to excess. Browning is uniformly "dramatic in principle"; but there is not much in literature that is less dramatic than Tennyson's early poetry. Browning chisels out his work with the daring strokes of a Michael Angelo; Tennyson cuts with the fineness needed for a cameo. The one depends upon broad effects, the other upon minute beauties.²

b. Cause and effect

The fact that Keats died so young, yet left us so many poems of supreme loveliness, is apt to give rise to the impression that perfection must have been natural and easy to him. As a matter of fact, however, a considerable part of his work was feeble or uneven, and he learned to master his art only through intense effort and after many missteps. He had to teach himself not only to overcome his own faults but also to recognize those of the writers whom he admired at the outset of his career, and he succeeded in doing so with astounding rapidity.

Of these the chief was Leigh Hunt, who, in the years when the young Keats fell under his spell, was engaged upon the Story of Rimini. In the preface of that poem, Hunt, with the best of intentions, pleaded that the heroic couplet should be used in a much freer form than that to which the Neo-Classicists confined it: There should not always be a pause in the sense at the end of a line or couplet, run-on lines should be permitted, as well as occasional triplets, double rhymes, feminine rhymes, half-lines, and Alexandrines. And the diction of poetry ought to be much more natural and familiar than customary. Although Hunt's theory was perhaps sound, in practice it led him into mannerisms which were to have an undesirable influence upon his disciple. Too often Hunt confused with the natural what was merely the imprecise, loose, obscure, and common language of careless and thoughtless talk. He was too fond of nouns like "doings" and "measurings"; adjectives like "rooty" and "scattery"; and adverbs like "poutingly" and "smilingly." And he was capable of such stylistically vulgar phrases as that which he wrote concerning Dante's noble Francesca—"she had strict notions on the marrying score." Such expressions seemed to contemporaneous critics to justify the charge that the Cockney School was ill-bred. What was perhaps worse, Hunt's poetry was superficial in observation and thought. All these weaknesses left their impress upon some of Keats' earlier poems.

The most important of the poems in the volume of 1817 are "I Stood Tip-toe Upon a Little Hill," "Sleep and Poetry," and the sonnet on Chapman's Homer...In the first two, Keats showed his fealty to the Huntian romantic couplet, but used its freedom rather cautiously. The motto of "I Stood Tip-toe" was appropriately taken from the Story of Rimini...; and the sentiment which rather loosely united the descriptive passages, was that what gave rise to poetry was the beauty of nature. Its loveliness had stimulated the imagination of the ancient Greeks to create their beautiful myths, and its movements and tones had suggested the rhythms and harmonies of verse. Between man and nature there was the instinctive sympathy of kinship, he being a part of nature distinguished
from it only by his powers of self-consciousness and expression.  

High-level abstraction, with connotation. In view of the loss of objectivity, as well as the use of unexplained high-order abstractions, it is recommended that a review of the nature and use of the descriptive and inferential levels be conducted. Such a review—involving comments and demonstrations centered about the appropriate and effective use of emotive language—may be accompanied by analysis of such a response as the following, to show not only the causes and the effects of unskillful handling of a combination of high-level abstractions and connotative words, but also ways of solving the problems.


English answer 179. Wordsworth sees everything in nature. He feels that unless a person is close to nature he is doomed. He sees nature above man and through nature one can appeal to God. He feels that only the more intelligent people are near God—intelligent in that they have the insight to see the greatness of nature. He considers closeness to nature as the only way of being saved.

Recapitulation (and demonstration) of the rules for paraphrasing—with its emphasis on clear analysis and explanation—may also be helpful. It may be well, in passing, to call attention to Richards¹ warning concerning the dangers in the paraphrasing of poetry: the

---

use of circular logic, and the substitution of poor prose for the
poem. Because Richards believes that a single paraphrase will in-
cate only one aspect of a poem, he suggests the use of one form of
paraphrase to set forth the sense, another type to suggest feeling.

The first [type] requires only an intelligent use of the
dictionary, logical acumen, a command of syntax, and
pertinacity. The second demands qualities of sensitive-
ess and imagination, the power to use remote experience
and to create metaphors, gifts which may seem to belong
by birthright to the poet alone.5

Revising of responses is recommended. In the revision, emphasis
may be placed on the attainment of clear, effective organization
(probably involving work in outlining and in analysis and evaluation of
various suggested revisions) and on maintenance of objectivity.

SYMBOLS

The responses analyzed under Symbols are grouped as follows:
(a) word-magic, with high-level abstraction and connotation (shown
chiefly in the answers of students at the 400 and 500 levels); (b) word-
magic, with two-valued orientation (appearing, for the most part, in the
work of advanced students); (c) word-magic, with oversimplification and
looseness in thought (with beginning students appearing to have more
trouble here than do the others).

4I. A. Richards. Practical Criticism. New York: Harcourt,

5Ibid., p. 224.
The recommendations are as follows:

**Word-magic, with high-level abstraction and connotation.**

Through discussions and analyses of materials, the instructor may recall to students the difference between (a) the repetition of words or phrases in parallel construction, used with the object of increasing clarity and emphasis, and (b) repetition, the use of which stems from belief in the power of symbols to select appropriate referents and to influence events. Such a passage as the following may be used in the analysis, with comparison and contrast, suggested above:

> In good truth, we know what a man is like by the things he finds laughable; we gauge both his understanding and his culture by his sense of the becoming and of the absurd. If the capacity for laughter be one of the things which separates men from brutes, the quality of laughter draws a sharp dividing-line between the trained intelligence and the vacant mind. The humour of a race interprets the character of a race, and the mental condition of which laughter is the expression is something which it behooves the student of human nature and the student of national traits to understand very clearly.\(^6\)

> In a review of the causes, nature, and results of signal reactions and of symbol reactions, the instructor may clarify for the students the connection between the emotional nature of signal reactions and the use of personal connotations, not only through the false-to-fact world built up by signal reactions but also by the spurious finality engendered.

Moreover, analysis of a response, such as the following, may be undertaken. During the analysis, students may be asked to make

---

suggestions for improving the organization of ideas; for using relevant, valid evidence; and for employing qualifying terms. The members of the class may also be requested to substitute words for such symbols as "nature," and to maintain objectivity in their writing.


English answer 16. Wordsworth is primarily a nature poet, but many of his sonnets are also quite serious. He usually tries to put his point across by a comparison with nature, or he makes a poem more beautiful with a nature description. "The World Is Too Much With Us" expresses that idea of the goodness of nature as compared to worldliness. "Upon Westminster Bridge" presents a charming picture of London by dawn.

Word-magic, with two-valued orientation. The students may be given practice in defining such terms as "poetic diction," "reality," and "romanticism" in various contexts, by using examples and details and operational definitions. The definitions formulated by the members of the class may be considered from the points of view of connection with experiential background and of stimulation to signal reaction.

Because the use of the operational definition with high-order abstractions may seem somewhat difficult, it may be well to recall Rapoport's comment:

In discussing operational definitions of abstract physical concepts, Philipp Frank says:

These sentences [operational definitions] contain the abstract words of the physical principles like "current"...also the words of the everyday English language. Obviously, they contain words like "wire" and other words which describe the apparatus by which the intensity of a current is actually measured.

Note how the operational definition works. One cannot point to an ampere of electric current (the most one could
point at would be the wire that carries it). But one does not dodge the issue by defining a word with other words without bothering to determine whether they are any closer to experience. One gives a set of directions, in words, to be sure, but words almost certainly closer to experience than the word defined (wire, magnet, etc.). If one follows these directions, one has the experience summarized by the words "one ampere of electric current."

Sometimes a definition that sounds like an Aristotelian one performs the job of an operational definition. If I say "Acrophobia is a mental disturbance characterized by a fear of high places" I seem to be making an Aristotelian definition. But it can easily be translated into an operational one: "Question a great many people on how they feel about high places, and you will find that a certain percentage of them will declare that they are 'afraid' of high places. Furthermore, if such a person happens to be on a roof or a mountain-top, he usually exhibits a quickening of heart beat and expresses a desire to get down. Such people are said to suffer from acrophobia."

Let us see what happens when we apply an operational definition: "A vampire is a person who habitually sucks other people's blood." If we attempt to translate this definition into an operational one, we would have to say something like this: "Have a great many persons watched at night, and you will find that some go abroad and suck blood out of sleeping people, usually from a small lesion in the neck. Such people are called vampires." This operational definition is formally as good as the one of acrophobia except for one thing: you will probably not find any people with blood-sucking habits.?

Furthermore, the writing of responses to such a question as the following will afford practice in using the descriptive level:

Lines 217-242, "The Eve of St. Agnes." What is the quality of the diction as compared with Wordsworth's in "She Was a Phantom of Delight"?

Emphasis may be placed on the nature of the sources of the evidence offered—experience, first-hand or vicarious; factual reports from

---

reading or listening; opinions of authorities; (b) the trustworthiness, clarity, and relevance of the evidence; (c) the objectivity shown in presentation of ideas, as well as the avoidance of such an antithesis as that shown in the following passage:

Wordsworth usually...uses the language of common men. Poetic diction is not characteristic of his work.

Word-magic, with oversimplification and looseness in thought.

After a brief review of the major principles of the Ogden-Richards Triangle of Reference, studies of implicit acceptance of word-magic may be made. An example of the type of passage which may be used for such analysis is the following:

**Question (English 430). Why is Keats' "Ode on a Grecian Urn" a picture, an experience, and a creed?**

**English answer 36.** In Keats' "Ode on a Grecian Urn," he describes the picture on the urn. We see a maiden and her lover; he is probably playing his lute or harp. In real life he would come closer to her, but here on the urn he is stationary forever. No matter how hard Keats would try he realizes "his lovers" will never move. Because of this the Ode is an experience and picture. I feel the creed may have something to do with Keats. He was a sick man as expressed in the "Ode to a Nightingale." He was afraid he would die before he could write. The creed has to do with Keats' feeling of life and the time element (how long he would live).

In the analysis and discussion, such items as the following may be included: (a) A discussion of the various possible interpretations of a given symbol in its context may be helpful. (b) The students should be shown how belief in word-magic is exhibited in the passage under consideration—specifically the idea that repetition will necessarily result in explanation and clarification.

Following the analysis and discussion suggested above,
revision may be undertaken. The instructor may require an outline.
He may wish to stress (a) the sources, the amount, the adequacy of
sampling, and the relevance of the evidence submitted; (b) the reserve
shown in the presentation of the evidence adduced; (c) coherence. To
keep students conscious of the levels of abstraction used, the instruc-
tor may recommend the use of index numbers and of dates.

CONTEXTS

The responses grouped under Contexts contain (a) shifts in mean-
ing of key terms, with high-level abstraction; (b) confused contexts,
with connotation. These difficulties appear, for the most part, in the
answers of students in the beginning and middle groups.

The recommendations in this connection are as follows:

Shifts in meaning of key terms, with high-level abstractions.

Students may be asked to discuss the meaning of such words as "nature"
in various contexts. Such sentences as the following may be used:

1. He acted according to his nature.
2. There are still one or two unanswered questions about the
   nature of atomic energy.
3. This book is of the same nature as the others.
4. He enjoyed contemplating quietly the beauty of nature.
5. The back-to-nature movement is a hardy perennial.

Then, examination of the interaction between contexts and high-order
abstractions may be helpful. For instance, the class may try to ascer-
tain the meaning of "nature" in the following response:

Question (English 56h). "The Forsaken Merman," "The Lady of
English answer 125. Tennyson shows his Lady's desire for the beauty of nature, and how she is stopped by supernatural forces. One might say that Tennyson is telling us here that one may live with nature only as long as he remains within the limits of his capabilities as determined by nature. Lancelot's capabilities were much greater than the Lady's.

During the course of the discussion, the instructor may help the students to realize that the meaning of "nature" shifts from (a) reference to the physical objects and phenomena of the experiential world, to (b) the material world, surrounding man and existing independently of his activities, to (c) the total of the forces at work in the universe.

In the discussion of such a response as the following, contrast may be used (as, here, with #125 above).

Question (English 56b). Lines 1-14, "Dover Beach." To which poet, Pope or Wordsworth, is this passage closer in content and diction? Why?

English answer 169. It is definitely closer to Wordsworth in both content and diction. In content, he describes the beauty of nature, which is very typical of Wordsworth. The last line

And bring
The eternal note of sadness in

is a sign of transcendentalism. As Wordsworth did, he sees a deeper meaning than just the reality of the senses. In looking at the sea, he shows a contemplative spirit. Pope, on the other hand, is an expert in satire. He speaks of the social faults of man, and not at all of beauty or higher values. Pope's poetry is worldly; Wordsworth's and Arnold's is the opposite. Arnold, as does Wordsworth, creates a mood in his description of nature - makes it personal. In diction, these lines of Arnold's are comparable to Wordsworth's sonnets "It Is a Beauteous Evening" and "Composed Upon Westminster Bridge." They are truly using Wordsworth's theory of "language of the common man in a state of vivid sensation." The words are simple, but are arranged imaginatively to give clear and beautiful sense impressions. Although they are simple, they are elevated. They are musical. They are clear, lucid, unadorned, sublime in their simplicity. The diction is comparable only to Wordsworth's best. His poorer poems are prosaic and forced. Pope's diction, on the other hand, to match
his satire, is full of epic conventions - elaborate, ostentatious, artificial.

It may be pointed out, for instance, that the writer of the response has made an effort to answer the question directly and concisely, and that, through the use of specific references and of direct quotations, he has clarified most of the high-level abstractions. He shows, moreover, a clear grasp of the major concepts involved.

Confused contexts, with connotation. In the examination of such passages as the following, students may be asked to note carefully the differences in the use of such terms as "perfection" and "defect" and in the organization of the materials. Through the use of comparison and contrast, and through discussion of various possible interpretations, the meaning of basic concepts may be clarified.

Now it must be admitted that to avoid such exceptions has been, for most poets who have attempted the sonnet, impossible. Even for some poets who have excelled in the sonnet the absence of such shocks has clearly proved impossible. Indeed, that is the whole point of the sonnet — its incessant demand for perfection: and perfection is not for man. It is because the sonnet demands perfection that all true poets feel themselves challenged to attempt it; and there is perhaps not one of those who have attempted it, since it was first happily imported into this island not 400 years ago, who does not bitterly regretting this expression, that line, in some sonnet of his which he has hammered at in vain and failed to repair.

If Wordsworth, for instance, has, through religious prejudice, been over-praised (though certainly he proved himself upon occasion a master of the sonnet) yet in one of his best ("The world is too much with us," etc.) he thrusts right into the living organism of the thing, the horrid, wounding deadness of "standing on this pleasant Lea." Nor is the phrase "getting and spending" up to the mark....

Well, then, here is Milton's chief defect in the matter: he thinks it indifferent whether the sonnet have a waist or no. All the genius of English verse clamors for dualism in this form, but Milton does not feel the
necessity for it, though he is a high-priest of the English tongue. Is this the effect of Spenser on him, or Petrarch, or is it an original blemish? 6

Most sonnet writers, while regarding the form as in the abstract something almost sacred, have felt free to mould it in some measure to the immediate demands of their subject — not all, however, with the same success. For the sonnet demands perfection, a single flaw almost cripples it; and few have the absolute command of language necessary to forge a single idea without irrelevance and without omission according to so strict a pattern. Those who are too subservient to the form weaken their poetic thought; those who, like Wordsworth often, are disobedient to the form, produce a poem which is imperfect because it is neither a sonnet nor not a sonnet. Few have come as near the true balance as Milton at his best. "A hundred Poets, says Sir William Watson,

A hundred Poets bend proud necks to bear
This yoke, this bondage. He alone could don
His badges of subjection with the air
Of one who puts a king's regalia on.

And yet Milton, while preserving the rime scheme, generally disregards the thought divisions, and in half of his sonnets has the pause, not after the eighth line but within the ninth. Commenting on this division Wordsworth says: "Now it has struck me, that this is not done merely to gratify the ear by variety and freedom of sound, but also to aid in giving that pervading sense of intense unity in which the excellence of the sonnet has always seemed to me mainly to consist. Instead of looking at this composition as a piece of architecture, making a whole out of three parts, I have been much in the habit of preferring the image of an orbicular body — a sphere or dew-drop." 9

---


An exercise in definition and organization may be conducted, with the students planning and writing answers to such topics as the following:

Compare as to verse-form Milton's sonnets "On His Blindness," "On the Late Massacre at Piedmont," and "When the Assault Was Intended for the City" with the following sonnets by Wordsworth: "The World Is Too Much With Us," "Composed Upon Westminster Bridge," and "It Is a Beauteous Evening."

In his introductory comments, the instructor may emphasize the need for definition of terms, by means of examples and details, specific reference, or quotation; and logical arrangement of ideas. The writing of first drafts may be followed by class analysis of several responses.

FORMS OF TO BE

The answers analyzed under the above heading are grouped as follows: (a) is of identity and is of classification, with high-level abstraction; (b) forms of to be, with connotation and confusion in thought. In both classifications, the work of students at all three course levels is represented.

The writer submits the following proposals:

Is of identity and is of classification, with high-level abstraction. Such sentences as the following may be used as a basis for an explanation of equivalence, tentative and qualified, as opposed to final identification or classification. The discussion accompanying the substitution of other expressions for forms of to be may help to develop an increased realization of the need for reserve,
qualification, analysis.

1. The obvious answer is that each writer is expressing a truth.

2. Truth is what criticism is seeking.

3. It is characteristic of this man that he cannot learn the lesson of submission to the inevitable.

4. This writer's didactic humor is very unfortunate.

5. This answer, this condemnation, is completely unjustifiable.

6. To Wordsworth, contemplation was the goal.

7. The fact is that Keats made no effort at sociological analysis.

8. All ideas are capable of being expressed in prose.

9. A novel is a direct impression of life.

10. A poem is the image of life expressed in truth.

Along with an explanation of the connection between confusion of levels of abstraction and the finality and projection often accompanying the unskillful use of forms of to be, careful revision of a number of sentences may be undertaken. All or most of these sentences may be taken from the work of students. The following are examples:

1. The lyrical element is not important because Antigone is very simple and short.

2. The Lady of Shalott is a highly romantic character and is strictly feminine.

3. The first eighteen lines of "Tintern Abbey" are more elevated than the first fourteen lines of "Dover Beach."

4. In diction, both Wordsworth and Arnold were content to say things simply, both concentrating on what they were saying more than on the style or power.

5. Keats was typical of the Romantic movement, nature, beauty, and the lyrical presentation of same.
In the revision suggested above, emphasis may well be placed on the need for the use of lower levels of abstraction and of careful qualification.

Analysis of passages from the work of well-known, competent critics may help students to see how ideas can be stated with due reserve and with clarity.

It has long seemed to me that the burst of creative activity in our literature, through the first quarter of the century, had about it in fact something premature; and that from this cause its productions are doomed, most of them, in spite of the sanguine hopes which accompanied and still do accompany them, to prove hardly more lasting than the productions of far less splendid epochs. And this prematurity comes from its having proceeded without having its proper data, without sufficient materials to work with. In other words, the English poetry of the first quarter of this century, with plenty of energy, plenty of creative force, did not know enough. This makes Byron so empty of matter, Shelley so incoherent, Wordsworth even, profound as he is, yet so wanting in completeness and variety. Wordsworth cared little for books, and disparaged Goethe. I admire Wordsworth, as he is, so much that I cannot wish him different; and it is vain, no doubt, to imagine such a man different from what he is, to suppose that he could have been different. But surely the one thing wanting to make Wordsworth an even greater poet than he is, — his thought richer, and his influence of wider application, — was that he should have read more books, among them, no doubt, those of that Goethe whom he disparaged without reading him.

But to speak of books and reading may easily lead to a misunderstanding here. It was not really books and reading that lacked to our poetry at this epoch; Shelley had plenty of reading, Coleridge had immense reading. Pindar and Sophocles, — as we all say so glibly, and often with so little discernment of the real import of what we are saying, — had not many books. Shakespeare was no deep reader. True; but in the Greece of Pindar and Sophocles, in the England of Shakespeare, the poet lived in a current of ideas in the highest degree animating and nourishing to the creative power; society was, in the fullest measure, permeated by fresh thought, intelligent and alive. And this state of things is the true basis for the creative power’s exercise, in this it finds its data, its materials, truly ready for its hand; all the books and reading in the world are only valuable as they are helps to this. Even when this does not actually exist, books and reading may
enable a man to construct a kind of semblance of it in his own mind, a world of knowledge and intelligence in which he may live and work. This is by no means an equivalent to the artist for the nationally diffused life and thought of the epochs of Sophocles or Shakespeare; but, besides that it may be a means of preparation for such epochs, it does really constitute, if many share in it, a quickening and sustaining atmosphere of great value. Such an atmosphere the many-sided learning and the long and widely combined critical effort of Germany formed for Goethe, when he lived and worked. There was no national glow of life and thought there as in the Athens of Pericles or the England of Elizabeth. That was the poet's weakness. But there was a sort of equivalent for it in the complete culture and unfettered thinking of a large body of Germans. That was his strength. In the England of the first quarter of this century there was neither a national glow of life and thought, such as we had in the age of Elizabeth, nor yet a culture and a force of learning and criticism such as were to be found in Germany. Therefore the creative power of poetry wanted, for success in the highest sense, materials and a basis; a thorough interpretation of the world was necessarily denied to it.10

Forms of to be, with connotation and confusion in thought. In the analysis of such a response as the following, the instructor may emphasize clear arrangement of ideas, limitation and qualification of statements, and maintenance of objectivity. (The connection between primary certitude and spurious directioness may also be considered.)

Question (English 564). Lines 1-11, "Dover Beach." To which poet, Pope or Wordsworth, is this passage nearer in content and diction? Why?

English answer 163. Nearer in content and diction to Wordsworth, because 1. These words are simple yet used imaginatively. Pope used elevated words to describe ordinary things.

2. These phrases are not ordinary; they are beautiful and symbolic. They would not be suitable for Pope's drawing room.

3. Pope is not concerned with nature; Wordsworth is. This poem has the element of nature.

4. This poem is original. Pope is not original, except in phrases of speech he uses for common words. Here is where Pope's imagination lies.

5. Pope never thought that seriously he was not romantic or mystical.

Revision of several such answers is suggested, with the writing of outlines and with clarification and expansion of statements given terseness if not depth through the use of the is of identification and the is of classification.

It is also suggested that excerpts from the work of recognized critics be examined (and compared) for skill shown in the use of forms of to be, for clarity of organization, and for maintenance of objectivity.

Such passages as the following may be so analyzed:

Arnold struck the characteristic note of his critical thought in the Preface to the 1853 edition of his poems. In that remarkable essay, he undertook to explain why he had suppressed his long dramatic poem, "Empedocles on Etna." He quotes Schiller as saying that all art is dedicated to joy, and thenremarks the strange human ability to find joy in the literary representation of terrible calamitous events — in tragedy, he says, "The more tragic the situation, the deeper becomes the enjoyment, and the situation is more tragic in proportion as it becomes more terrible." But, he goes on, modern practice and theory have evolved a kind of representation of calamitous situation which is unlike tragedy in that "the suffering finds no vent in action." In these representations "a continuous state of mental distress is prolonged, unrelieved by incident, hope or resistance" and "there is everything to be endured, nothing to be done." In such representations there is, Arnold says, "inevitable something morbid," and because "Empedocles on Etna" fell into this class he withdrew it. And in his Inaugural Address, "On the Modern Element in Literature," Arnold reserves the word "adequate" for that literature which, while it truthfully represents the calamitous
conditions of life, gives us at the same time the sense of the mental and emotional energy with which calamity may be met.11

It must have struck any attentive reader that his Arnold's definitions of criticism of poetry, and of culture are singularly alike. "Poetry," he declares in one place, "is a criticism of life." "The business of criticism," he says elsewhere, "is to know the best that is known and thought in the world." And enlarging upon this statement, he concludes that "culture is a pursuit of our total perfection by means of getting to know, on all the matters which most concern us, the best which has been thought and said in the world; and through this knowledge, turning a stream of fresh and free thought upon our stock notions and habits." In short, culture and poetry are merely two different applications of the critical spirit. Culture is criticism turned upon the conduct of life and poetry is criticism turned upon the spectacle of life with a view to its representation. The aim of culture is to understand what we are about; the aim of poetry is to interpret the various forms in which human activity manifests itself. "The grand business of modern poetry," to quote his own words, is "a moral interpretation, from an independent point of view, of man and the world." And this curious resemblance or identity - for so it strikes us at first - between culture, poetry, and criticism is inherent in Arnold's conception of criticism. For if criticism consists in the formation and application of general ideas, then it is clear that criticism applies to life and conduct as a whole, as far as life and conduct are intelligible; that is, as far as they are subjects to be understood. And that they are so in the main cannot be doubted. Even our feelings and emotions are to be understood, romanticism notwithstanding; and we recognize as educated that man who does understand himself and that man as uneducated who does not. Culture, then, consists for Arnold in enlightenment, and so does poetry.12

---


TWO-VALUED ORIENTATION

In the responses analyzed under the above heading, one finds (a) two-valued orientation, with oversimplification (appearing chiefly in the responses of students at the 500 level; (b) two-valued orientation, with high-level abstraction and connotation (with the work of students at all three course levels represented).

The following proposals are submitted:

Two-valued orientation, with oversimplification. In a review of the consequences of oversimplification, the disregard of gradation and of the effects of change may be stressed, as well as the resultant largely false and deceptive pictures of the world and of humanity. Such a review may be accompanied by an explanation of such terms as "humor," "wit," "satire," "invective," "irony," and "cynicism." (Uncertainty concerning the meaning—and the use—of these terms seems to constitute a considerable problem.) The inductive method may productively be used, and, through the use of examples—from the work of Swift and Twain, for instance—the literal-minded may be enabled to perceive that when irony, for instance, is employed, the real meaning is hidden or contradicted by the terms used.

Through comparison and contrast of such responses as those quoted below, students may gain better understanding of the need for close analysis of such subtle rhetorical devices as irony, and for careful limitation and clear statement of examples.

Question (English 540). In your own words, state one example of irony from "Memorial Rain."

English answer 72. In "Memorial Rain" the bitter irony is that the people say that they are grateful for what the soldiers have died, but what have they done for them to show their thanks?
Question (English 540). In your own words, state one example of irony from "Memorial Rain."

English answer 153. There is irony in the contrast between Ambassador Puser's thoughts of his country being the resting place of Americans, that they were restful and at peace—in contrast to the thoughts of the American who felt that this earth away from home was waiting and listening for him.

In the discussion, the instructor may wish to emphasize, in considering #153, the understanding of the term irony, the comprehension of a major aspect of the irony in "Memorial Rain," and—with the exception of the faulty parallelism—the clarity and the directness of the answer.

Two-valued orientation, with high-level abstraction and connotation. It is suggested that the instructor explain the consequences of confusion of levels of abstraction, including (a) disregard of the flexibility of language and (b) the development of signal reactions. He may also wish to show the interaction of connotation with such confusion of levels of abstraction, and to show how the use of highly connotative words, under such circumstances, encourages the formulation of unsupported judgments.

First, a recapitulation of the principles of valid generalization may be helpful with particular reference to the size of the sample, the method of sampling, and the treatment of negative instances. Then, through direct instruction and discussion, the teacher may consider possible approaches to such questions as the one quoted below. In his remarks, he may wish to emphasize the maintenance of objectivity and the documentation of evaluative comments.

What major differences are there between the story of Ruth and that of Samson?
Work on outlining may be followed by the writing—in a laboratory situation—of answers to the questions.

CONNOTATION

As the reader will recall, the classifications under Connotation are as follows: (a) connotation, with high-level abstraction and generalization (shown in the work of students in the 400- and 500-level classes); (b) connotation, with high-level abstraction and forms of to be (appearing in the responses of students at all three course levels).

The writer offers the following recommendations:

Connotation, with high-level abstraction and generalization. Inasmuch as emotional reactions (based on connotation and implication), rather than considered, supported judgments, are found in this group of responses, it is suggested that students list the personal and general connotations of such words as "inflating," "trivial," "major military operation," "petty," and "prudish" in the following (or a similar) context:


English answer 130. As far as Pope and "The Rape of the Lock" are concerned, except for a vehicle to carry the satire to the Victorians, reality doesn't seem to enter the poem. Pope's idea is to awaken the public by inflating such a trivial matter of stealing a lack of hair to a major military operation. The theme of this (Pope's) compared to the other three, in the sense of some relation to reality, doesn't quite seem to fit, except maybe in some sense. The Victorians over-emphasized and exaggerated the facts and therefore obscured reality by their petty and prudish attitudes.

Many of the connotative terms used are also high on the ladder of
abstraction. Such words—most of them unqualified in the responses inspected—lend themselves easily to the making of generalizations. It is believed, therefore, that a review of the principles of valid generalization—including the use of qualification and the evaluation of evidence—may be helpful.

Connotation, with high-level abstraction and forms of to be.

Through comparison and contrast of responses, instruction in the meaning and the use of the descriptive and inferential levels of communication may be given. For instance, a contrast may be drawn between a brief account of Byron's concreteness and use of satire in Don Juan, as well as his dislike for Wordsworth's writing (shown in "English Bards and Scotch Reviewers"), and such a comment as "Byron certainly lives up to the definition of Romanticism, since he was superficially Wordsworthian."

Such a passage as the following may be used for practice in revision:

Byron bitterly resented control. This attitude was as admirable as his love of liberty. Byron fought for liberalism, and, consequently, was popular in Europe. He was emotional, erratic, disillusioned, unpredictable, and—occasionally—sincere. The force of his personality was one of his most important attributes.

In the revision, students may be asked to be careful to use referential language, to employ lower levels of abstraction as well as higher ones, and to avoid finality with forms of to be.

METAPHOR

The responses analyzed under Metaphor are grouped as follows:

(a) distortion of meaning, resulting from the use of mixed metaphors
and of high-level abstraction (with advanced students appearing to have less trouble here than do those in the courses at the 400 and 500 levels); (b) metaphor, with connotation (shown more in the responses of advanced students than in the answers of those in the beginning or the middle group).

The following proposals are submitted:

**Distortion of meaning, resulting from the use of mixed metaphors and of high-level abstraction.** Examples of the appropriate, effective use of metaphor—as in literature—may be examined and discussed. The following passage, from one of Lamb's essays, is an example:

At what precise minute that little airy musician doffs his night-gear, and prepares to tune up his unseasonable matins, we are not naturalists enough to determine. But for a mere human gentleman—that has not orchestra business to call him from his warm bed to such preposterous exercises—we take ten, or half after ten (eleven, of course, during this Christman solstice), to be the very earliest hour at which he can begin to think of abandoning his pillow. To think of it, we say; for to do it in earnest requires another half hour's good consideration. Not but there are pretty sun-risings, as we are told, and such-like gawds, abroad in the world, in a summer-time especially, some hours before what we have assigned; which a gentleman may see, as they say, only for getting up. But having been tempted once or twice, in earlier life, to assist at those ceremonies, we confess our curiosity abated. We are no longer ambitious of being the sun's courtiers, to attend at his morning levees. We hold the good hours of the dawn too sacred to waste them upon such observances; which have in them, besides, something Pagan and Persic. To say truth, we never anticipated our usual hour, or got up with the sun (as 'tis called), to go a journey, or upon a foolish whole day's pleasuring, but we suffered for it all the long hours after in listlessness and headaches; Nature herself sufficiently declaring her sense of our presumption in aspiring to regulate our frail waking courses by the measures of that celestial and sleepless traveller. We deny not that there is something sprightly and vigorous, at the outset especially, in these break-of-day excursions. It is flattering to get the start of a lazy world; to conquer death by proxy in his image. But the seeds of sleep and mortality are in us; and we pay usually, in strange qualms
before night falls, the penalty of the unnatural inversion. Therefore, while the busy part of mankind are fast huddling on their clothes, are already up and about their occupations, content to have swallowed their sleep by wholesale; we choose to linger a-bed, and digest our dreams.\textsuperscript{13}

Such examination and discussion should be accompanied, however, by warning against the use of metaphor in discussions intended to be objective and precise. A student writing on such a question as the following, for instance, might well be expected to be impartial and exact.

Why does (1) Milton address Cromwell in "To Oliver Cromwell"?

(2) Wordsworth address Milton in "London, 1802"?

Students may be reminded that metaphor may illustrate, in an appropriate context, and that it may even seem to give concreteness—but that metaphor is only broadly comparative.

Detailed analysis of several responses, of which the following is illustrative, may be undertaken.

Question (English \textsuperscript{56h}). Lines 18-32, "Ulysses." Restate the content of the passage in your own words.

English answer \textsuperscript{162}. A piece of one's heart is affected by each thing experienced. Through one's experience one can see and guide what lies beyond. That which should be active and useful will deteriorate if left to rest in the shade. And such little time remains, but it should be used to pursue learning further, to bring new things into his life. He has rested too long in retirement when he should have been, and wanted to be, absorbing all that can be known to man, until his last breath.

In his discussion, the instructor may be concerned with the accuracy and appropriateness—in the given context—of such metaphors as "A piece of one's heart is affected by each thing experienced," as well as with the

need for the use of lower levels of abstraction to clarify such high-order abstractions as "learning," "new things," and "absorbing."

Metaphor, with connotation. Members of a class may be asked to explain the metaphors in such a passage as the following:

Shelley loved the People; and respected them as often more virtuous, as always more suffering, and therefore more deserving of sympathy, than the great. He believed that a clash between the two classes of society was inevitable, and he eagerly ranged himself on the people's side. He had an idea of publishing a series of poems adapted expressly to commemorate their circumstances and wrongs. He wrote a few; but, in those days of prosecution for libel, they could not be printed. They are not among the best of his productions, a writer being always shackled when he endeavors to write down to the comprehension of those who could not understand or feel a highly imaginative style; but they show his earnestness, and with what heartfelt compassion he went home to the direct point of injury—that oppression is detestable as being the parent of starvation, nakedness, and ignorance. Beside these outpourings of compassion and indignation, he had meant to adorn the cause he loved with loftier poetry of glory and triumph; such is the scope of the Ode to the Assertors of Liberty. He sketched also a new version of our national anthem, as addressed to Liberty.\(^{14}\)

In such explanation and discussion, the emphasis may be on (a) the use of metaphor to illustrate, not to prove, and (b) the effects on clarity and precision of combinations of metaphor and highly connotative words.

Advertisements and political articles may be used as materials for analysis of metaphors. (The advertisement and the paragraphs from an article which are quoted below are illustrative.) In the discussion, the students may be concerned with purpose of the writer, the consistency of tone, and the accuracy of the images evoked by the metaphors.

The discussion may be followed by expansion of the metaphors and by re-arrangement of materials.

Tuck this Typhoon unit air conditioner into a closet, or into a corner of the basement. You don't have to scrap the house plan to put in Typhoon air conditioning. It takes up less floor space than any other unit made. But it's a giant in performance...complete air conditioning, summer and winter, with one central unit.

The world revolution of our time is not communism, fascism, the new nationalism of the non-Western peoples, or any of the other "isms" that appear in the headlines; they are reactions to the basic disturbance, secondary rather than primary. The true world revolution is "made in U. S. A.," and its principle is the mass-production principle. Nothing ever before recorded in the history of man equals in speed, universality, and impact the transformation that modern industrial organization has wrought in the foundations of society in the forty years since Henry Ford developed the mass-production principle to turn out the Model T.

Though "made in Detroit," the impact of the new principle is neither confined to the United States nor to the old industrial territory of the West. Indeed, the impact is greatest on pre-industrial civilizations. Mass-production technology undermines and explodes those societies which have no resistance to the new forces, no background of industrial life to cushion the shock. In China, the mass-production principle, swept into the hinterland from the coastal cities by the forced migration of industries during the Japanese invasion, is destroying the world's oldest and hitherto most stable institution: the Chinese family. In India, industrialization has begun to corrode the Hindu caste system: ritual restrictions of proximity and intercourse between castes simply cannot be maintained under factory conditions. Russia uses the new mass-production principles to try again where Byzantium failed; to mate Europa and the Bull, the technological fruits of Western thought and Oriental despotism, to produce a new world order which will claim to be the legitimate heir to both West and East. In our own country, the region hitherto least touched by industrialization, the rural Old South, is speedily being "tractored off." Indeed, conversion of the Southern farm into a rural assembly line seems about to "solve" the Southern race problem in a manner never dreamed of by either Southern liberal or Southern reactionary by pushing the Negro off the land and directly into the industrial

SLANTING

The answers analyzed under the above heading contain (a) slanting, with connotation, (with the work of students in the middle group represented, as well as that of beginners); (b) slanting, with oversimplification and high-order abstraction (appearing chiefly in the answers of students at the upper levels).

The following recommendations are proffered:

Slanting, with connotation. An analysis of a slanted article, such as the one quoted below, may be conducted. In such an analysis, the instructor may wish to consider (a) the nature, and the number, of the items of equal significance in the topic under consideration which have not been included; (b) the extent of the use of words charged with emotion—"plain realism" and flexible method," for instance—with comments on the use of favorable and unfavorable connotation; (c) the effect of such emotional classifications on clarity and exactness.

To put aside the pressing problems of the day and to speculate about the America of 1980 is a challenging exercise of the imagination. Given the fabulous inventiveness of our country, and the promises of technology, the America of 1980 might be even more recognizable to us today than is the America of twenty-five years ago. But without world peace as a foundation of the future, rational predictions about the next quarter-century are utterly impossible. Moreover, advances in technology alone do not and cannot solve the great questions of social arrangements and social justice. These are questions not of technology but of morals, not of science but of wisdom.

Plain realism dictates, therefore, that our thinking about the America of the quarter-century ahead must be limited to goals rather than to predictions. Yet long-range goals, if they are meaningful, originate in the world of today, and are shaped by one's tradition, and one's philosophy. In a single man's lifetime, twenty-five years is a long time, perhaps half the span of his mature, vigorous life. Institutions, and the men who reflect them, have a longer perspective than individuals alone, and in the A. F. of L. our tradition and our philosophy have emerged from an experience of seventy-five years. Our goals can be understood only in terms of that experience. Moreover, the goals of a future but a quarter of a century away will not appear so unreal when measured against a philosophy hammered out by millions of Americans over the course of three-quarters of a century.

Our goals as trade-unionists are modest, for we do not seek to re-cast American society in any particular doctrine or ideological image. We seek an ever-rising standard of living. Sam Gompers once put the matter. When asked what the labor movement wanted, he answered, "More." If by a better standard of living we mean not only more money but more leisure and a richer cultural life, the answer remains, "More."

But how do we get "more"? Imperfect in many details as our system may be, this country has adopted a flexible method for increasing the standard of living while maintaining freedom. It is the method of voluntary collective bargaining, of free decision-making outside the coercions of government, in the solution of economic disagreements. And it is through the give-and-take of collective bargaining that we seek to achieve our goals.17

Such a response as English answer 68, quoted below, may be used as material for another procedure. After discussion of the errors, the class may be given a review of the principles of objective summary—and paraphrase. The writing of summaries and paraphrases may follow such a review.

Question (English 540). In your own words, state an example of irony from "Memorial Rain."

English answer 68. "Memorial Rain." In this poem, MacLeish uses irony to show the way an old windbag continues to feed the same old tripe.

Slanting, with oversimplification and high-order abstraction.

After reviewing for the class the nature and use of descriptive and inferential levels, the instructor may wish to discuss with the students the interaction of slanting and the use of unqualified high-order abstractions. Such a discussion may well involve consideration of the causes and the results of question-begging, and of the substitution of defense for analysis.

The writing and analysis of several acceptable answers to such topics as the following may be undertaken.

Make a list of the differences in the portrayal of the young women as found in the following poems: "The Forsaken Merman," "The Lady of Shalott," "The Solitary Reaper," and "The Rape of the Lock."

The emphasis may well be on logical organization of materials (with, perhaps, practice in outlining); presentation of a balanced discussion, with proportion in the presentation of ideas; and on maintenance of objectivity.

The principles noted in Chapter III, and the findings in the analyses presented in preceding sections of Chapter VI, have served as the basis for the recommendations submitted above.

In Chapter VII, the same procedure will be followed with responses in professional education.
CHAPTER VII

TECHNIQUES FOR IMPROVING THE TEACHING OF COURSES IN PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION THROUGH THE INSPECTION OF INTERPRETATIONS

In this chapter, the writer is concerned with the analysis of student-written materials in courses in professional education.

First, the courses in which the responses were written will be listed. Then, as in Chapters V and VI, the second portion of the chapter will consist of analysis and discussion of the responses, and of a summary of the findings. Third, with these findings as a basis, recommendations for improving the teaching of courses in professional education will be offered.

For the convenience of the reader, the course descriptions are given below.

Education 536. Student Teaching in the Secondary School. [536 N: English]. Observation, participation, responsible teaching, individual and group conferences.

Education 669. Literary Materials for English and the Social Studies. The course is designed (1) to acquaint English teachers with a wide variety of novels, short stories, poems, plays, biographies, and essays which are especially suitable for pupils in junior and senior high school, and (2) to familiarize teachers of history and social studies with literary selections which serve to illuminate typical subjects of study in these fields. Consideration will be given to standards for the selection of literary materials and the use of these materials in the secondary-school curriculum.
Emphasis is given to such matters as the objectives of the high-
school literature program; criteria for the choice and grade-
placement of literature in high school; specific methods suitable
for teaching the various types of literature; the correlation
of the activities in literature with those in the language
aspects of the English studies; the interrelationships between
literature and other phases of the curriculum.

Education 671. Teaching the English-Language Studies in the
High School. Emphasis is given to such matters as the
objectives of the English-language studies in high school; the
teaching of the various types of oral and written composition;
the role of the school as a whole in promoting students' language competence.

Education 677. The Teaching of the Social Studies. I. An
examination of different theories of the role of social-studies
materials within the learning process, with particular
attention to their impact upon the beliefs, attitudes, and
values of secondary-school students. Illustrative materials
will be drawn primarily from history, with some attention to
the other social studies. Special emphasis is given to the use
of social-studies material in classifying the contrast between
authoritarianism and democracy, to the function of information
within the reflective process, and to the possible contributions
of the social-studies teacher within the core curriculum.

Education 678. The Teaching of the Social Studies. II. A
continuation of Education 677. The illustrative materials will
be drawn primarily from the fields of economics, sociology,
and political science, with some attention to geography and
anthropology.

It may be mentioned here that in the detailed analysis of the
responses, the present writer is presenting examples of the kind of
materials needed for clarification and substantiation. He does not
mean that all the material must have been included in the students' answers.

We may now turn to an examination of responses in which
abstraction plays a significant part.

Abstraction. In the responses in the first group in this
classification (Education answers 14, 17, 48, 55, 72, 97, 138, and 146, which follow), one finds considerable dead-level abstraction.

**Question (Education 536N).** What objectives have you tried to achieve in the teaching of literature?

**Education answer 14.** I have tried to make my students aware of the pleasure that can be gained through the reading of literature. I also tried to help them realize that reading is a suitable and worthwhile activity to turn to in leisure time.

The reader will notice several unexplained high-order abstractions. First, in using the term "pleasure," the student may mean, for instance, "delight," "justification," or "enjoyment of satisfaction derived from that which is to one's liking." The respondent does not mention that individuals read for sheer enjoyment of character portrayal, as in *Tom Jones*; or of setting, as in "The Fall of the House of Usher"; or of plot; as in "The Speckled Band." They may read for factual information, in, for instance, *The Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire*; or for the touch of such great personalities as Sophocles, Shakespeare, and Dante. Second, the ideas of "fitting" or "appropriate" and "such as to repay one's time and attention" sketched in line 5 are on an equally high level of abstraction. The breadth and oversimplification of "a suitable and worthwhile activity" in this context is augmented by the use of the is of identity in line 4 and by the connotative and all-inclusive "leisure time" (line 6). Brief phrasal qualifications, as indicated, might have made the comment more clear and more accurate.
Question (Education 669). Choose any three of the following types of literature: biography, travel and history, poetry, essays and miscellaneous prose, drama, fiction. For each type selected, list the author and title of any four books suitable for high-school students, and describe in a paragraph the nature and quality of each book.

Education answer 17. Stephan Zweig, Marie Antoinette. This is the biography of Marie Antoinette, wife of Louis XVI, King of France during the late 1700's. The book, though written much like a novel, still gives the reader a clear picture of the political and social affairs of this period. I would recommend this book for senior high school students because the writing is done in such a manner so that they can easily understand it and enjoy it, and find it useful as a reference book to augment their textbook study of the Revolution.

Looking over the four broad statements which make up the basis of this answer, the reader notes, first, the assertion that Marie Antoinette is "written like a novel" (line 5). The student is probably thinking about qualities of style; he might have mentioned, for instance, the flowing prose of Flaubert, or the quiet, edged writing of Thackeray. Again, if he were thinking in terms of structure, his comment might have been clearer if he had cited, for example, the breadth and scope of War and Peace; the understanding of human strength and weakness of Tom Jones; or the interpretation of the society of a period in Pere Goriot. The phrase "the political and social affairs of this period (lines 7-8) is equally broad and non-committal. The reader is told nothing about the approach or the emphasis; he does not know whether Zweig writes about such matters as unequal taxation and the vast and ill-defined
powers of the King, or about people, as Dickens writes of, for instance, Madame Defarge in *A Tale of Two Cities*. In lines 9-11, the student returns to the thought in line 5, but repeats the judgment instead of explaining the idea. Such matters as comprehension and enjoyment are, after all, relative. Finally, particular aspects of the book which may make it valuable as a reference remain undisclosed. The student has written a series of judgments, elastic and inexact.

**Question (Education 677).** Illustrate from the subject matter:

Changes in social arrangements
generally leave some people with
more freedom and some people
with less freedom than they had before.

**Education answer 97.** A Negro in the South is under a social arrangement which tends to limit his freedom; Negroes in the North, due to social arrangement, have a great deal more freedom. This has nothing to do with the law, only with the social way of life in a given area.

The student has been requested to illustrate a generalization—to use lower levels of abstraction. However, treating the Southern racial problem in three lines, he does not clarify his discussion by mentioning, for instance, the growth of the plantation system and of Negro slavery; the Reconstruction period; or the development of dual public-school systems. In lines 3-4, moreover, he might have referred to the smaller number of Negroes in the North, and to integration in the public schools. In the second place, the use of "freedom" (lines 3 and 5) seems inconsistent, with
emphasis on the large opportunity given for the exercise of the individual's rights and powers; but this word is so abstract and connotative that the reader cannot be certain of the exact meaning which the respondent intends to communicate. Remaining on a high level of abstraction, with repetition and with paraphrase on an equally high level of abstraction, the student has written an undeveloped, vague antithesis rather than a carefully considered analysis.

Question (Education 671). In two or three sentences indicate whatever values you may see in the book [which the student had selected and read during the preceding two weeks] for an English teacher.

Education answer 55. Mr. Adler's book is of value to the prospective English instructor in that he clearly sees the positive value of comprehensive reading to learning and thus to the whole process of education. He ascertains the relation of cumulative educational practice with a maturing reading power and sees reading as a primary instrument to secondary and higher education— which is the interest of the high-school English instructor.

First, a brief phrasal explanation of the meaning of "comprehensive reading" might be useful. Though a detailed discussion does not seem to be needed, the term—which involves both speed and comprehension, as well as the identification, interpretation, and evaluation of facts—needs to be made more specific in this context. The same high level of abstraction is maintained in lines 6-8. The respondent may be referring to developing the ability to concentrate, to building vocabulary, to finding and
organizing information, and to attacking and solving problems; but the reader, after considering "the relation of cumulative educational practice," is not certain. The repetition in lines 9-10 does little to clarify the meaning.

**Question (Education 677).** Illustrate from the subject matter:
- Changes in social arrangements generally leave some people with more freedom and some people with less freedom than they had before.

**Education answer.** Sometimes freedoms granted to a group of people may at the same time limit freedom for some members of the same group.

Instead of following the instructions, the student has substituted "freedoms" for "changes in social arrangements" and has given no information about the "freedoms." In his discussion, he might have used such an example as the following passage from Magna Carta:

> No freeman shall be taken or imprisoned or disseised or exiled or in any way destroyed, nor will we go upon him nor will we send against him except by the lawful judgment of his peers or the law of the land.

The change meant that all freemen were given protection against the King's officers and that they were given the right to a fair and legal trial. Thus, the sweeping power—in this particular regard—of the head of the state and his officers to imprison or condemn without trial was sharply curtailed. The writer of the foregoing discussion, however, has used no examples or details to make his comment clear and definite.
Question (Education 671). Treat the following item briefly but pointedly:
"Since we are chiefly concerned with the thought of a pupil's written composition, it is silly to bother about his punctuation and capitalization." How do you stand on this matter?

Education answer 72. Written composition simply cannot be well or correctly done without a knowledge of capitalization and punctuation.

Here, the student has begged the question. Instead of pointing out and explaining briefly the need for continuous, cumulative, school-wide instruction in English—and referring to the connection between accurate thinking and the use of capitalization and punctuation in accordance with accepted rules—he has assumed that the matter supposedly under consideration is settled. Though he has attempted to guard himself by using "well or correctly," he does not more than hint at the reasons for his statement.

Question (Education 670). On the basis of the class discussion and lectures and your reading, treat the following topic in such a way as briefly and concretely to indicate (a) what you conceive to be sound viewpoints and (b) your reasons for the position you have taken:
The criteria you would employ in the choice and grade-placement of literature in the secondary-school program.

Education answer 48. The criteria of literature should be pretty much the same for every area—the play, the novel, poetry, or the short story. Any criteria which we set up must be in keeping with the goals of a particular school or education in general. We must, in other words, base our criteria on the needs of the pupils. Our criteria
must be flexible and must change from time to time.

Aside from the over-all goals of a given school, we must decide on goals for a given literature program. As we discovered in class, these goals should and do to a high degree overlap the goals of education. Some of these goals include the desire to help pupils discover, develop, and heighten their own reading tastes and abilities by presenting flexible reading programs and through the aid of diagnostic tests which give us a clue to pupils' present reading status. Another literature goal which is worth mentioning is that of helping pupils to enrich their experiences by providing suitable materials and ample opportunities to do [dead-level abstraction]; and certainly every teacher should be desirous to help pupils increase their language skills by augmenting their activities that will encourage them to become more conscious of language effectiveness [dead-level abstraction]. There are still more worthwhile goals that may help us to teach pupils in a manner that corresponds with the goals of a literature program, but now it is necessary to name more criteria upon which our choice and grade-placement of literature can be based.

We must present materials which are within the grasp of pupils in a given class. When teaching any subject, the teacher must consider the capabilities of the pupils, their background, interests, needs, age, and grade level. The teacher should not go beyond the experiential or intellectual range of his pupils. We must begin where the pupils are and present meaningful material which they are capable of interpreting and comprehending.

And last of all but not the least, we must be aware of the mores and customs of a given group of pupils and the community in which they live so as not to present materials which would affront their mores or customs. Pupils come in contact with all types of literature which may depict stereotyped or biased views concerning various human beings and their behaviour.
Question (Education 677). Illustrate from the subject matter:

Changes in social arrangements generally leave some people with more freedom and some people with less freedom than they had before.

Education answer 146. The Federal Bill of Rights, the first ten amendments to the Constitution, limits the government in its powers while the people are given certain freedoms [dead-level abstraction].

Using numerous unexplained and unqualified high-level abstractions, such as "freedom" and "education," the writers of Education answers 14, 17, 48, 55, 72, 97, 138, and 146 have remained on a high level of abstraction. Asked to be concrete, specific, illustrative in their writing, they have been repetitious. Instead of analyzing and illustrating, these students have set forth a series of judgments, in which complex matters are considerably oversimplified. The reader, realizing the breadth and multiplicity of meanings of the abstractions forming the basis of these responses, has, consequently, little chance to know the exact meanings which the students may have had in mind.

In several other responses (Education answers 5, 12, 28, 70, 11, 140, 153, and 156, which follow), the use of unexplained high-order abstractions is accompanied by connotation.
Question (Education 536N). What were your primary objectives in the teaching of literature and reading?

Education answer 12. One of my primary objectives in the teaching of literature and reading has been to increase the reading interests of the pupils—to promote more reading on their own. This, I feel, is one of the major goals for which we should strive. Along with this objective is the one which tends toward making the students more discerning in their reading and of what they read. This promotion of their reading will not be very beneficial unless they read something that is worthwhile—something that will add rather than detract from their development.

In the teaching of literature and reading, I have striven to help the students to view objectively the characters of people in their reading. This objective viewing of their characters, along with pertinent discussions of the same, may help the pupils untangle some of the webs which surround them. I hope that it will also make them more aware of the patterns of our society and some of the elements which are involved in the pattern.

In this teaching, I have tried, too, to acquaint the pupils with better examples of literature and writing, and to make them more discerning in their judgment of the same.

In mentioning as his first objective "to increase the reading interests of the pupils" (lines 3-4), the student may be referring to diversity, as represented in, for example, Will James's Smoky, Pearl Buck's The Big Wave, Madeleine Goss's Beethoven, Master Musician, and De La Mare's Come Hither. Yet what is apparently meant as an appositive ("to promote more reading on their own," lines 4-5) confuses rather than explains, because it is a different idea, and emphasizes desire to read rather than scope in reading material. Second, in lines 8-9, the student touches on the idea of appreciation. He seems to be referring to the development
of the ability to comprehend and enjoy, say, *Emma*, *David Copperfield*,
and *Quentin Durward*. This part of the discussion, however, is not
clarified by the use of "worthwhile" in line 12, for the reader is
given no criteria: The student does not state, for instance, whether
one should read for enjoyment, for information, or for contact with
great personalities. Third, he appears to believe that pupils should
be assisted in developing the ability to analyze characters in
literature carefully and understandingly. Brief examples are needed
here, to explain "pertinent discussions" (line 18) and "webs"
(line 20). The connection, moreover, between "objective viewing"
of characters and "the patterns of our society" (line 22) remains
unexplained. Finally, in lines 24-27, the respondent reiterates
rather than clarifies, apparently trusting that the connotations of
"better" and "discerning" will serve as explanation.

Question (Education 677). Illustrate from
the subject matter:
Even within the thinking of a single
individual, two or more cherished values
are often thrown into conflict.

Education answer III. In the field of world
history, to be more specific, in the field of
foreign relations between two or more nations,
one being democratic (supposedly), there is a
conflict when the democratic advocates say they
practice what they believe and yet foreigners
tell you that our democratic nation does not
practice what it preaches. In other words,
sometimes different people say that we are
exploitative; that means to use others for
your own gains and advantages. Which point
of view will you uphold?

The student, first of all, neither defines "democratic"
(line 4) nor reveals what he means by the parenthetical "supposedly"
in the same line. He may have been thinking of the influence of labor unions on state and national legislators, of bribery among lawmakers, or of the errors of uninformed and uncaring voters; he does not specify. In lines 4-5, moreover, the student has the "democratic advocates" maintain that they "practice what they believe"; but until one knows that these people do believe—that integration in the public schools is defensible, for example—the question of adhering to beliefs will remain an open one. In the third place, the use of the abstract "democratic nation" in line 7 is followed by the emotive "practice what it preaches." Here one finds the transfer of the terseness of a proverb, plus the connotations of the virtue of consistency, to an unclarified attitude. The vagueness and the emotional content of the response are increased by the connotations of "exploitative," with the associations of selfish use for personal "gain and advantage."

At this point, the writer desires to insert an explanation concerning the examination questions and discussion topics in Education 678. These questions and topics—which follow—form a part of a hypothetical business letter designed to elicit student responses. (The letter is quoted in full below.) Answers to individual questions and topics incorporated in the letter are scattered throughout the pages (and categories) which follow.
Pumpkin Creek, Ohio
December 11, 1952

Dear ______:

Miss Vesey of the Appointments Office of The Ohio State University has sent me your credentials with reference to a social-studies position in our school system. There are two such positions open for next year. One opening is in the junior high school, teaching seventh-grade American history and eighth-grade civics. The other position is in the senior high school, teaching tenth-grade world history and twelfth-grade P. O. D.

Our beginning salary for the B. A. degree and no experience is $3750.00. We give a $200 increment for each year of teaching experience in the system, up to a maximum of ten years.

Pumpkin Creek is a town with a population of 12,000. There are two large canning factories in the town, a grain elevator, and a glass factory. The surrounding country is devoted to general farming.

Our junior high school building has been built since the War, and it is quite modern. Both the junior and senior high schools are well equipped with visual and auditory aids. Our school library is fair, possibly a little weak on recent and current periodicals.

Two-thirds of our student body comes from the town, and the remainder consists of children from the rural area. Most of our people are old-stock Americans, but approximately one-sixth of the children are second- and third-generation Americans whose ancestors came from southern Europe and work in the glass factory.

If you are interested in either position, will you write to me, indicating which position you prefer and giving me the following data:

1. What you see as the major objectives of the social-studies program in the secondary school and why. Discuss these objectives with special reference to the courses which you would be teaching in our school.

2. What you believe to be the proper role of the social-studies teacher with reference to the teaching of controversial issues. State rather specifically how you would handle controversial issues in our community.
3. We are interested in making our students more sensitive to the current issues. Will you indicate the methods that you would employ in considering current events in the classroom?

4. Some parents in our community have been critical of our testing program in the classrooms. Outline in some detail the testing program which you would carry out in the social-studies classes.

5. We have followed the practice of adhering rather closely to a single text in our social-studies classes. What is your attitude concerning the use of collateral readings? Indicate the types that you would use and why, and the methods you would employ.

6. Our Curriculum Committee is considering the introduction of a core program in both the junior and senior high school. If this plan is adopted, three years hence, the social-studies teachers will be expected to operate within the framework of a core. Will you give your views upon the strengths and weaknesses of the core as compared with a straight subject-centered curriculum?

Sincerely,

Question (Education 678). What do you believe to be the proper role of the social-studies teacher with reference to the teaching of controversial problems? State rather specifically how you would handle controversial problems in our community.

Education answer 156. My purpose in teaching social studies is to clear up confusion and dispel indifference, and through the "educational process" within a classroom free individuals from ignorance, tradition, habit, authority, and prejudice, thus enabling them to build an independent outlook on life, to evolve their own patterns, their own philosophy, and their own pattern of living.

What to think is not the problem facing our youth. I think it is how to think. With the substitution of intelligence for authority and
tradition and the development of critical and reflective thinking, we can instill in our young people the attitude of open mindedness; thus they won't worry about what to think because they will know how to think.

This would be true especially in teaching controversial issues where good reflective thought is necessary. Open-mindedness is an attribute without which discussion of these issues cannot take place. Since your school is fairly well equipped with audio-visual aids, I find I will have at my disposal a vast indispensable item. Many fields can be enlightened and broadened through the use of these materials.

Outside speakers, maybe even some from local industry, can add much light to controversial issues.

The handling of controversial issues runs hand in hand with current events. We must be very careful not to indoctrinate, but we must help students gain the insight needed to "look into" the situation so they can think creatively about problems and apply principles they have.

A rough procedure which can be followed:

1. Present problem.
2. Formulate hypothesis.
3. Check resources, material.
4. Discuss material or evidence found for or against problems or issues.
5. Draw some conclusions.
6. Check these conclusions carefully.

Reflective thought enters into all processes and is necessary.

In this response, apparently built around ideas of substitution and release, the student writes of clearing up confusion and dispelling indifference (lines 2-3). The idea seems commendable; yet additional explanation is needed: The student may be referring to practically any idea within the area of the social studies—to, for instance, the consequences of the battle of Cannae, the rise of laissez faire, or the breakdown of the family as an institution. Such explanation is not afforded by the use of the
imposing series of high-order abstractions in lines 5-6, which involve general ideas of lack of knowledge, the handing down of beliefs and legends, tendencies to act in certain ways, accepted sources of information, and preconceived opinions or feelings. The respondent continues his use of unqualified high-level abstractions with "intelligence" (line 12) and "open-mindedness" (line 20). The ideas, however, of understanding and the capacity for adaptive behaviour, and of readiness to consider new arguments or ideas--these concepts mean little until one knows more about their nature and significance than the student has revealed, even though the so-called "scientific method" is sketched in lines 37-44.

The breadth and tenuity of these ideas is augmented considerably by the use of several connotative words. "Free," in line 4, suggests release from the shackles of erroneous precedent. "Add much light" (line 29) is metaphorical as well as connotative, and merely hints at the results of the disinterestedness and impartiality of the "outside speakers." Finally, "think creatively" probably refers to the systematic, thorough, analytical application of human intelligence to a given problem; the adverb conveys only the general idea of evolving from one's thought. The student has outlined and repeated, rather than explained.

Question (Education 678). What do you see as the major objectives of the social-studies program in the secondary school? Why? Discuss these objectives with special reference to the courses which you will be teaching in our school.

Education answer 153. I see as the main
objectives of the social-studies program in
the secondary school an aid in the creation
of generations of Americans who are aware of
themselves as a part of the world in which
they are going to take a major part. I don't
believe it is as important to make sure they
know dates in world history as it is to try
and make it easier for them to meet the
problems (which will be different from
anything concrete which it might be in my
power to teach) of their changing world.

In teaching world history, I think an
intelligible correlation of past and
present is helping them to see today's
problems is good, and this is how I would
handle it. In the P. O. D. class, I
think it would probably be easier to work
with strictly problem situations even more
of the time than eighth grade because the
pupils have more subject matter at their
command and, at this point in their career,
realize that they soon will be faced with
these in a very real and vital fashion.

It may be remarked here that the above response well
illustrates the relation between clarity of thought and lucidity
of expression. First, instead of concise, systematic enumeration
and discussion of objectives, the reader finds a comment on how a
social-studies program might help in the attainment of an abstract
and connotative ideal, and in the solution of equally abstract
problems (lines 1-6, 13-16). He finds, in lines 17-22, an outline
of procedure, rather than a consideration of objectives. The
expression mirrors the inaccurateness in thinking: In lines 8-12,
the reader finds awkward, unduly involved construction; in lines 1-6
and 13-17, incoherence. The student has answered the question
neither directly nor clearly.
Question (Education 671). The following item is to be treated briefly but pointedly:

What is meant by: "The vocabulary develops with the individual much more truly than the individual develops the vocabulary?"

Education answer 70. The vocabulary grows with and through experience. As the student's extent of experience broadens, his vocabulary will expand with it. The vocabulary the student develops is apt to be artificial and one that he will seldom use naturally.

In the first three lines, the student begs the question. Though he repeatedly uses the word "experience," he does not state clearly the connection between active, usable vocabulary and scope of experience and interests. (A brief comment on the significance of "The style is the man" might be relevant, too.) In lines 4-6, moreover, the writer does not make clear the circumstances under which his statements would be true. He might well have commented on the use of word lists, containing many words foreign to the interests of students, and therefore not becoming a part of the active vocabulary. Instead, the student has oversimplified, largely through the use of "artificial" and "naturally."

Question (Education 670). Treat the following item very briefly—in a single pointed sentence if possible:

Why will the type of preparation we provide a class prior to reading a Shakespearian play depend upon the species of play it is?

Education answer 28. The type of preparation which we provide a class prior to reading a Shakespearian play must depend upon its type because of the familiarity or unfamiliarity our students have with the crucial items,
ideas, emotions, etc., with which they will come in contact.

After repeating the question, the student depends almost entirely on the words "familiarity and unfamiliarity" and "crucial" to convey the meaning intended. Instead of referring—even very briefly—to matters of characterization and plot structure, in relation to the question, the student is content to rely on the almost non-committal phrasing in lines 5-7. Only a vague idea of preparation depending on receptiveness is communicated.

Question (Education 677). Illustrate from the subject matter:
Changes in social arrangements generally leave some people with more freedom and some people with less freedom than they had before.

Education answer 140. If we look at unions more closely, we can see that they are a form of organized body, which, as such, must in some ways be uniform [high-level abstraction]. The system must be set up in such a manner as to provide the maximum for all [high-level abstraction, with connotation]. Unions grew out of the desire to maintain rights [high-level abstraction, with connotation] for workers of various kinds.

Question (Education 536N). What are the advantages of a functional program in English?

Education answer 5. I believe in a functional program in the teaching of English, one based on the pupils' needs, interests, and abilities, rather than the teacher's preordained formative program [high-level abstraction, with connotation]. A functional program makes for economy: No time is spent on that which the pupils already know; it sustains interest in that
irrelevancies [high-level abstraction] are omitted. It is practical [is of classification, with connotation] capable of being used.

In Education answers 5, 12, 28, 70, 111, 140, 153, and 156, the students, first, largely base their answers on unexplained high-level abstractions, broad in scope but vague as to meaning. The use of these terms in this way affords no common ground for interpretation; there is no assurance that the reader will find the referents which the students have in mind. Second, the writers of the answers seem to believe that the use—often, the repetition—of connotative terms will serve not only to persuade but also to explain. The revelation of feeling through "snarl words" and "purr words" serves to increase considerably the obscurity resulting from the unskillful use of such high-order abstractions as "rights" (#131) and "the problems . . . of their changing world" (#144).

In three responses (Education answers 53, 91, and 118, which follow), the use of unqualified high-level abstractions is combined with looseness in thought.

Question (Education 671). On the basis of the class discussions and lectures and your reading, treat the following topic in such a way as briefly and concretely to indicate (a) what you conceive to be sound viewpoints, and (b) your reasons for the position you have taken:

How to determine what materials to include in an intensive remedial unit in any given fundamental of language usage.

Education answer 91. The materials which should be included in an intensive remedial unit in any given fundamental of language usage should be the material for which pupils make the most frequent and persistent errors. The teacher can
also determine what materials should be used by asking what are some frequent errors, and by diagnostic tests. Definite methods should be established for measuring a teacher's effectiveness. Her judgment should not be hypothetical.

In the first sentence, one finds the beginning of an adequate answer to the examination question—though lines 4-5 are somewhat confused and repetitious. In using "asking" (line 7) the student may be referring to the English teacher’s securing specific information from colleagues in other subject-matter areas—by means of conferences and written reports—concerning pupils' errors in English usage. It will be noted, too, that diagnostic tests are merely mentioned; no comment concerning their limitations is included. This lack of clarity and of specificity, however, becomes much more noticeable from line 8 on. Here the student comments, unexpectedly and irrelevantly, on criteria for "merit rating" of teachers; in doing so, he uses the very general and unqualified term "effectiveness." The "definite methods" remain undisclosed. In line 10, the respondent turns to criteria for grading, but "hypothetical" helps little to reveal the intended meaning. The discussion remains disconnected and obscure.

Question (Education 677). Explain why the following statement is or is not true:
In the United States, the political party which is in power nationally favors a very liberal interpretation of the Federal Government's powers, while the party out of power becomes the defender of "states' rights."
Education answer 118. What about the party of Thomas Jefferson? He was a "states' rights" man.

In this brief comment, the student has the beginning of an explanation. Unfortunately, the response remains an undeveloped example. The writer might have gone on to describe briefly the creeds of the Federalists and the Republicans, and to cite, as a relevant and illuminating example, the disagreement between Hamilton and Jefferson over the question of chartering the United States Bank, including at least a mention of the doctrine of implied powers. Instead, the student has depended, for the most part, on the phrase "a 'states' rights' man" to communicate his meaning.

Question (Education 671). The following item is to be treated briefly but pointedly:
"Since we are chiefly concerned with the thought of a pupil's written composition, it is silly to bother about his punctuation and capitalization." How do you stand on this matter?

Education answer 53. This is a backward statement [is of classification] because the mechanics of writing--punctuation and capitalization--help to guide an individual's thought [high-level abstraction, with looseness in thought]. One glance at the definition of punctuation can help to validate the fact that it cannot avoid incorrect use and omission of punctuation and capitalization [high-level abstraction, with looseness in thought] (a set of symbols used to indicate thought relation between and among words). These are so important that the pupils should master all the rules concerning them by the time they reach the ninth or tenth grade and certainly before they leave high school.
The reader of Education answers 53, 91, and 118 will note, first, that the high-order abstractions used are, for the most part, unexplained. The few examples which are used are ineffective because of the students' incomplete or inaccurate understanding of major ideas under discussion. Second, that lack of clear comprehension and systematic thinking is shown in the incoherence that marks the three responses. The sequence and the relationship of ideas are not clear; and, as the reader will see, irrelevant material is included. These responses lack both precision and clarity.

Symbols. As we turn to the use of symbols, it will be noted that implicit confusion of word with referent occurs in all the answers considered under this heading. In Education answers 56, 107, 130, and 157, to follow, the belief in word-magic is accompanied by the use of high-order abstractions and of connotative words.

**Question (Education 671).** Reply to this statement:
"I can't be bothered with pupils' English. My business is to teach history."

**Education answer 56.** Instruction must be 1
continuous, cumulative, and school-wide. 2
English is a basic skill necessary to all 3
situations in which the English language is 4
employed. True education is not departmental-
ized; it must be integrated, school-wide. 5

It should be said, first of all, that the student, in his mention of "continuous" and "cumulative" (line 2) has the beginning of a valid answer to the discussion topic. His use of
"school-wide," however, in lines 2 and 6, is one of the keys to the difficulties in the response. There is no mention, for instance, of the need for interdepartmental co-operation through conferences and reports, or of the responsibility of every teacher to give language instruction pertinent to the students' success in the subject concerned, and to support the instruction given in the English classes. Though the student mentions the need for skill in verbal communication, he repeats rather than explains. Belief in word-magic is especially noticeable in the use of the highly abstract and connotative "true education" (line 5). The student seems to believe that the use of this phrase--loaded and indefinite as it is--will solve the problem posed in the discussion topic. Instead, the employment of the quoted words serves to arouse questions rather than resolve doubts, even when it is used with the abstract--and controversial--"integrated."

Question (Education 677). Illustrate from the subject matter:
Institutions tend to persist long after the purposes for which they were created have ceased to operate.

Education answer 130. Such an institution would be the school in which at first they were established to give the students subject matter or factual information, such as "Columbus discovered America in 1492," etc. This made parrots out of the students as they prepared for the next day's lessons either by lectures or by the teacher or reading assignments. There was no real learning taking place. Today we are striving and achieving to make people think objectively and reflectively. This is by raising doubts, causing him to be anxious.
to learn, think, and solve—not just all parrot information.

Here, the use of two symbols makes accurate interpretation difficult. The first of these is "parrot" (lines 6 and 15). The term, as used here, seems to connote meaningless repetition without comprehension. The simplicity of the problem—as seen by the student—is shown in the repetition of the word. The writer of the response has made no allowance for the need for drill, for accurate knowledge, or for assurance in one's understanding of the background of an area of human knowledge. The problems are increased, too, by the use of "real learning" (lines 9-10). The student has thus simplified and condensed to a brief phrase major portions of the numerous philosophies of education; but the referent, if not unknown, remains unclear. Apparently, as dimly indicated in the context, the student is referring to the "scientific method," including analysis of evidence and the use of hypotheses; but the high level of abstraction in lines 10-13 makes the reader unsure. Finally, the repetition of "think" (lines 11 and 14) does not clarify, nor does the use of "anxious" (line 13) explain how the students are to be stimulated to solve the unnamed and unclarified problems.

Question (Education 677). Illustrate from the subject matter:
It is much easier to unite against something than it is to unite for something.

Education answer 107. Look how far labor as a whole has progressed symbol, with connotation in the last twenty years. Wasn't a lot
of this progress due to unions and organization of labor [symbols, with high-level abstraction and connotation]?

Question (Education 678). What do you believe to be the proper role of the social-studies teacher with reference to the teaching of controversial issues? State rather specifically how you would handle controversial issues in our community.

Education answer 157. . . . As far as teaching controversial issues, I would attempt to handle the topic in the same manner as I would any other topic. I would not place any particular emphasis on the controversial issue as such, for I feel it would tend to reduce the students' ability to handle the topic fairly and squarely [symbols, with connotation]. I feel students to be of mature enough development to discuss controversial issues openly and maturely [symbols, with high-level abstraction and connotation]. Above all, I would not attempt to stifle opinion [connotation, with metaphor]; in fact, I would encourage it.

In Education answers 56, 107, 130, and 157, then, one notes the belief that a symbol will necessarily evoke the same image in the mind of the reader as it does in that of the student writer. That belief results in a lack of precision—in the use of such approximations as "progress," which may mean, for instance, higher wages or the state socialism of Bellamy's Looking Backward. These difficulties are considerably augmented by the breadth of unexplained high-order abstractions and by the emotional content and appeal of highly connotative terms, such as "parrot" in #121. Moreover, belief in the virtue of symbols is shown in the use of such terms as "true," "real," and "openly and maturely." The students seem to consider
these verbal counters as absolute quantities in communication, rather than variable, arbitrary combinations of letters.

Three responses (Education answers 30, 113, and 141, considered below), show combinations of word-magic with connotation and two-valued orientation.

Question (Education 670). In not to exceed a page, react candidly to the central and unifying viewpoint of "Our Novel Stock-in-Trade."

Education answer 30. I frankly agree to the indictment above. For too long, teachers have based choices of literature upon the sanctity of the past, upon what will teach a moral, upon adult standards, and upon what will be good for these young, tender minds. As teachers, we have failed to be realistic in our teaching and have been too complacent about purveying the same old stock year in and year out. There is much in contemporary literature that would enrich life and living for our pupils, and we should draw upon these rich resources in striving for balance in our programs. If I were to sloganize my reaction to this "dusty" stock-in-trade, I would say, "More modern literature for modern youngsters."

First, the student uses, in lines 3-4, the phrase "sanctity of the past" with no explanation. Judging as well as one can from the context, it is probable that he is thinking about unquestioning and unprofitable worship of the work of such literary giants as Tolstoy, Balzac, Dickens, Hawthorne, Mark Twain, and Jane Austen. No hint is given, however, as to whether the phrase is to be interpreted in a broad or in a narrow sense. The present, on the other hand, is thought of in terms of "rich resources" (line 13)—a phrase which does not seem adequately clarified by the highly
abstract comment in lines 10-12. The respondent, then, through the use of these symbols, has not only shown implicit confusion of word with idea but also set up two-valued orientation. Only briefly, in line 13, does he approach the idea of the attainment of balance, of proportion, through the use of both old and new books. He seems to have missed the ideas of pupil participation in the selection of novels to be read by the class, and of the fact that the whole class need not read the same book at the same time.

In addition, through the use of "tender" (line 6), "realistic" (line 7), "complacent" (line 8), and "dusty" (line 15), he has attempted to persuade the reader through the use of associative terms. The student has used vague symbols to clarify an artificial opposition of ideas, and then has tried to support—or defend—his position with appeals to emotion.

**Question (Education 677).** Illustrate from the subject matter:

It is much easier to unite against something than it is to unite for something.

**Education answer 1-1.** We regard things "that are" as things "that ought to be"
and are willing to fight against changes.
We feel that we are a part of things that are, and any change will trespass on our rights.

Though the meaning of the response depends, to a large extent, on the meaning of "change," the respondent makes no attempt to clarify the meaning which he has in mind; the nature and the extent of the "change" are not given. It will be observed, furthermore, that
"to fight against" in line 3, in conjunction with "will trespass" (line 5) sets up two-valued orientation, and that the is of classification (line 3) reinforces the resultant oversimplification.

Question (Education 677). Illustrate from the subject matter:

It is much easier to unite against something than it is to unite for something.

Education answer 113. Labor unions do not prevent their members from progress [word-competition connotation, with two-valued orientation]—and in many instances provides more workers with better living. orientation—and in many instances provides more workers with better living.

This is in keeping with democratic principles of "The greatest good for the greatest number—for the greater period of time" [word-magic, with connotation]. There are times when labor unions tend to rob employers by causing them to pay inferior workers the same as superior ones [connotation, with two-valued orientation].

In Education answers 30, 113, and 141, one finds something close to stereotypes in the use of such words as "change," "progress," and "the past"—terms that may have a fairly specific meaning to the student but not to the reader. Such a use of symbols does not grow out of a desire to be evasive, but from the conviction that symbols will stand for whatever the users want them to signify. Instead of explanation, moreover, one finds the use of emotive language, augmenting the assurance accompanying the unskillful use of symbols. The personal, as well as general, connotations revealed in these responses facilitate the establishment of two-valued
orientation, with its unnecessary limitation of choices for the reader.

Two other responses (Education answers 116 and 149, which follow) contain a combination of word-magic, unqualified high-level abstraction, and confusion in thought.

**Question (Education 677).** Explain why the following statement is or is not true:
Quality in teaching comes only from training and experience.

**Education answer 116.** A teacher—like the doctor, who takes the oath of Hippocrates—should be more or less devoted to his job, and no matter what the pay should be, and waste times, do as good a job on low pay as he could do on high pay.

First of all, in using the somewhat elastic phrase "more or less devoted to his job," the student appears to refer to the idea of the "dedicated" teacher, who lives teaching, who has a thorough knowledge of the subject matter in his area of specialization, who has effective methods of transmitting information, and who has communicative enthusiasm. "Do as good a job on low pay as he could on high pay," even more vague than "more or less devoted to his job," conveys something of the idea of conscientious, enthusiastic performance of teaching duties. Moreover, the high level of abstraction shown in "low pay" and "high pay"—terms which might mean salaries from $600 to $15,000 a year—tend to nullify the effectiveness of the assertion so confidently based on the analogy drawn between the physician and the teacher. The looseness in thought apparent in the incoherent
passages in lines 4-5 increases the confusion. The reader can only

**guess** at the meaning which the student has in mind.

**Question (Education 677).** Illustrate from

**subject matter:**

Even within the thinking of a

single individual, two or more

cherished values are often thrown

into conflict.

Education answer 1149. I might feel that,

as Lincoln said, "All men are created equal"

and deserve equal freedoms [word-magic, with

high-level abstraction]. Yet I still might

uphold that those people with high education

and ambitions [high-level abstractions] be

the ones that earn more money and have

more freedoms [word-magic, with high-level

abstraction].

In lines 4-8 of #1149, it will be noted, the student has not

made clear the relationship between considerable education,

unspecified ambitions, improved earning power, and "freedoms."

Lack of clarity in thought is reflected in accurate expression.

In Education answers 116 and 1149, the responses show a

belief that the use of such symbols as "devoted to his job" and

"freedom" will somehow communicate the ideas which the students

have in mind and that the use of the words will influence events

in the extensional world. Moreover, evidence of incomplete

comprehension of the meaning of such symbols is shown in the

maintenance of a consistently high level of abstraction—-with a

tendency toward the use of glittering generalities, in the use of

repetition, and in the lack of coherence in paragraphs and

sentences.
Contexts. In Education answers 16 and 21, considered below, unexpected shifts in the meaning of key terms are accompanied by the use of unqualified high-order abstractions.

Question (Education 669). Choose any three of the following types of literature: biography, travel and history, poetry, essays and miscellaneous prose, drama, fiction. For each type selected, list the author and title of any four books suitable for high-school students, and describe in a paragraph the nature and quality of each book.

Education answer 16. Whitman, Leaves of Grass. This book contains mostly poems, but there are also a few essays in it. I do not think that junior high school students can get the meanings the author has put into his poems and essays, but I am sure that no literature class on the senior high school level would omit some of Whitman's poems and essays, for they hold a lot of meaning and are very enjoyable reading.

First of all, "meanings" in line 5 seems to refer to levels of meaning, and to the idea that differences in intellectual and experiential backgrounds will account for the amount of perception of and insight into the levels of meaning. In "Out of the Cradle Endlessly Rocking," for instance, some readers might find more than an indication of the results of Whitman's interest in the work of Bryant, as well as of the former's thoughts on death. The problem is complicated by the high level of abstraction: The student does not mention any of the "meanings," or explain why the students cannot comprehend them. "Meaning" in line 9, however—in contrast to the use of the word in line 5—seems to denote "signification" or "import," "that which is intended to be expressed
or indicated." The statement that Whitman's poems "hold a lot of meaning" (lines 8-9) does nothing to limit or to describe the term. The use of such examples as "Cavalry Crossing a Ford" as a war poem, and "O Captain! My Captain!" as a tribute to a leader, would have helped to restrict the significance of the central term and to combine low with high levels of abstraction.

Question (Education 669). Choose any three of the following types of literature: biography, travel and history, poetry, essays and miscellaneous prose, drama. For each type selected, list the author and title of any four books suitable for high-school students, and describe in a paragraph the nature and quality of each book.

Education answer 21. Brink, Lad with a Whistle. This is the charming story of a young man who mysteriously becomes the guardian of two wealthy orphans. It is a romantic [shifts in meaning of key terms; also in lines 8, 10, 12] story: In the end of the story, the children's father returns to them, and the greedy servants of the house are romantically discovered by Rob, the lad with a whistle. The story is simple and romantic, but it would be enjoyed by junior high school students who like mystery, romance, and suspense. Also, the fact that goodness wins out over badness [high-level abstractions] makes the book more appropriate for youngsters.

In Education answers 18 and 21, then, terms which are crucial in accurate interpretation of a passage shift unexpectedly in meaning. The psychological context must be guessed at; and the reader often has the impression that he is trying to decipher a private language. Moreover, largely because lower levels of abstraction are not used--examples and details to define and
explain such words as "meaning" and "social arrangement"—the verbal context is inadequate to enable the reader to decide with certainty exactly what these students are attempting to communicate.

**Uses of to be.** In four responses (Education answers 16, 34, 46, and 131, to follow), the reader finds unskillful use of forms of **to be**, with high-level abstractions.

**Question (Education 677).** Illustrate from the subject matter:
Even within the thinking of a single individual, two or more cherished values are often thrown into conflict.

**Education answer 131.** A basis for democracy is economic freedom; and if everyone is permitted economic freedom, he will tend to deny it to some of the smaller businessmen.

In the flat, final statement in the first two lines, two high-order abstractions are equated through the **is** of identity. Neither term, however, is limited or defined in any way; the reader, therefore, with impressions of the equality of men and of the doctrine of public welfare, is at a loss without more detailed explanation and less assurance. The student has apparently extended the ideas in lines 1–2 to form the foundation of the response; yet the relationship between the ideas in the four lines seems obscure. Finally, one is not told how the undefined economic freedom will be denied to the undescribed small businessmen. Writing a discussion without details and without clear sequence of ideas, the respondent has done little more than confidently assert.
Question (Education 670). On the basis of the class discussions, lectures, and your reading, treat the following topic in such a way as briefly and concretely to indicate (a) what you conceive to be sound viewpoints and/or teaching processes and (b) your reasons for the position you have taken:

Having clearly in mind what literature is, the intellectual, social, emotional, and ethical outcomes the reading and discussion of books might well attain.

Education answer 46. Literature is writing which portrays and interprets life. Desirable outcomes of the reading and discussion of books help to discover students' special abilities. This is of great help to the teacher in order that he may better find interests of students and thus stimulate each one individual.

Another outcome is the habit of reading, which is certainly desirable since reading is an enjoyable pastime of adults as well as of children. Respect for language develops through the reading of good books and should help students improve their own usage and vocabulary. An interest in current publications should be an outcome of the literature course. If students are to carry an intelligent conversation, they should be familiar with current affairs and contemporary authors. Literature can be honestly integrated with life and other studies. Integration with literature and life helps students to find insight into certain problems and human motivation. This reason holds true for another outcome, which is standards of social conduct. Education is meant to teach students better ways of meeting problems of life; so certainly literature, which is life, teaches social conduct. The final outcome of association with literature is vicarious experience. Through books students can find experiences like their own, or they can find new experience with people and places and ideas.

First of all, in lines 8-11, the student equates "outcome"
with "the habit of reading." Now, as a result of painstaking effort, careful planning, and sincerity and enthusiasm on the part of the teacher, the development of the habit of reading might well be an outcome of such reading and discussion of books. The respondent, however, is employing the is of identity, shows a lack of care in phrasing so that he may express precisely the meaning which he may have had in mind. In lines 23-25, moreover, the combination of finality and a high level of abstraction is even more apparent. Words necessary for clear understanding have been omitted; but the student is probably referring to assistance in the formulation of acceptable standards of social conduct. He might have pointed out, for instance, that contact with the personalities and ideas of great writers—Dickens's fierce hatred of injustice, Thackeray's irony, Jane Austen's keen observation—may add depth and breadth to the personality of the reader, may help him to face the joys and sorrows of life more calmly, if not more wisely. Perhaps the most serious error in the use of forms of to be, however, occurs in lines 27-28, in which the student identifies literature with life. He gives no hint that literature is usually considered to be a written portrayal and interpretation of life. Such a delineation and analysis involves selection; the artist has to decide how he may shape his material to attain the desired end. Thus, finality and vagueness combine to lessen the effectiveness and the precision of major portions of the response.
Question (Education 669). Choose any three of the following types of literature:
biography, travel and history, poetry, essays and miscellaneous prose, drama, fiction. For each type selected, list the author and title of any four books suitable for high-school students, and describe in a paragraph the nature and quality of each book.

Education answer 16. Phyllis Whitney, Linda's Homecoming. This is a story for girls. I don't believe boys would enjoy it. The story is so true to life that I myself can remember feeling much the same way Linda did when I was her age.

In line 2, the book is classified as "a story for girls," with the comment in the next sentence, "I don't believe boys would enjoy it." Perhaps a brief reference to the theme or the plot would have given the reader the information necessary to an understanding of the classification and the assurance. Second, the reader is not told the ways in which the book is true to life. (Perhaps the verisimilitude lies in the characterization; if so, the use of an example would be helpful here.) Finally, the confusion in thought in the last sentence is mirrored in the sentence structure. In the response as a whole, the reader is told little about either the nature or the quality of the book. One finds, instead, considerable certainty and vagueness.

Question (Education 670). In not to exceed a page react candidly to the central and unifying viewpoint of "Helping Pupils Enjoy Short Stories."

Education answer 3¼. Short stories are almost "custom made" for the high school literature class. The above-mentioned qualities assure them of success. The short
As we have seen, the unskilful use of forms of to be gives the impression that the matter under consideration has been solved with dispatch and with finality. Such rigid interpretation is found in Education answers 16, 34, 46, and 131; it is combined with the breadth and lack of precision resulting from the use of unqualified high-level abstractions. Projection and certitude mark the equating and the classification of these broad-multiphased words through the use of forms of to be. The use of judgments is facilitated by the maintenance of a consistently high level of abstraction.

In a second group of responses (Education answers 96, 98, and 158, which are considered below), the reader finds the careless use of forms of to be accompanied by two-valued orientation.

Question (Education 678). What do you believe to be the proper role of the social-studies teacher with reference to the teaching of controversial issues? State rather specifically how you would handle controversial issues in our community.

Education answer 158. There are two definite views as to the handling of controversial
issues and one other view which would not handle them at all. I feel that controversial issues are the only issues that a school can study because anything which is not controversial is not an issue. If we don't study issues, then we must study facts for facts' sake, or study nothing at all. I see no value in facts which have no application to life; so I would study issues. There is the method of assuming that issues have been solved or that you have the solution, even though there are many people who haven't realized it yet. If this view is taken, the issues no longer are real issues because they can be treated as facts and taught as such. I have never found any issues about which I was absolutely sure I had the right answer. Therefore, I have never felt that I could teach this second way, either. The third alternative is to provide opportunity for every student to bring as much information to bear on the problem as possible and then for all viewpoints to receive a hearing. This is the way he should face issues outside of the classroom, and I can see little excuse for shielding the student from thinking in the school where thought is supposed to be an objective. I would try to handle problems or issues that were actually problems to the student, rather than maybe the problems of Euclidean geometric theory which, although controversial, would probably be foreign to the interests of a social-studies class. I would also steer clear of problems which I was not prepared to handle, but if enough interest was shown, I would make myself prepared as soon as I possibly could. All in all, I would say that controversial issues which seem to have meaning, which interest the students, and which I am capable of handling, would be the meat of my classroom work.

Here, as with all the responses, analysis and evaluation involve consideration of (1) the pressure of time in an examination situation—a situation in which some students become nervous and apprehensive, and have difficulty in organizing ideas; (2) the
the resultant and often-warranted assumption on the part of the
student that the professor will follow the meaning of statements
that are not clear to others.

In the light of the preceding considerations, Education
answer 158 seems to be, as a whole, a creditable one—well organized
and carefully thought out. A few suggestions, however, concerning
wording for greater precision and clarity, may be offered.

First, the statements in lines 4-7 and 25-29 appear to be
valid, and the first of these is illustrated in lines 30-35. In
lines 4-7, the student might, perhaps, have mentioned uncertainty,
ambiguity, or alternatives, to make his idea of "issues" clearer.
In lines 30-35, for clarification and for the maintenance of the
descriptive level, "benefit" might be substituted for "excuse," and
"the development of methodical, analytical thinking is usually held
to be an objective" for "thought is supposed to be an objective."
Second, in lines 9-11 and 15-17, the respondent might well have used
brief examples to clarify statements and to avoid giving an impression
of finality. In the first of these, "facts which have no relation
to life" might be illustrated by a brief reference to the teaching
of the "rules" of formal grammar, as those "rules" are sometimes
taught. In the second (lines 15-17), the probably unintentional
finality resulting from the terseness and compression of the
sentence (especially the words "the issues are no longer issues")
might be lessened by a reference to, for instance, the attitude of
the supporters of the Townsend Plan toward what they view as problems
solved, and others see as issues—age limits, extent of financial assistance, and so on.

Question (Education 677). Illustrate the following by citing situations in school:
Even within the thinking of a single individual, two or more cherished values are often thrown into conflict.

Education answer 96. One big part of believing in democracy is believing that all men are created equal. This you believe, and yet you do not play with a Negro boy that sits beside you in school [forms of to be, with two-valued orientation].

Question (Education 671). On the basis of your readings and class lectures and discussions, treat the following topic in such a way as briefly and specifically to indicate (a) what you conceive to be sound viewpoints and/or teaching processes and (b) your reasons for the position you have taken.

The teaching of language fundamentals in connection with all writing and speaking.

Education answer 96. The memorization of rules for usage before attempting to write or speak is a waste of effort and time [form of to be, with finality]. There is no need [form of to be, with finality] to teach the correct usages which the students already know and have been using.

In #96, the use of brief examples—and the citing of reasons—would have helped to clarify and support this basically sound response.

In Education answers 96, 98, and 158, the reader finds certitude based on projection resulting from the unskillful use of the is of identity and the is of classification. Through equating
or classifying by means of forms of to be, the students give the impression of concurrent exhaustiveness and brevity. Here, too, the finality is strengthened by forced two-valued orientation; by the use of examples which appear to be exaggerated or irrelevant; and by the use of such question-begging terms as "real" and "actually." These responses, then, are marked not only by finality but also by oversimplification.

Two-valued orientation. In six responses (Education answers 33, 49, 73, 112, 152, and 155, to follow), the reader finds two-valued orientation, with oversimplification and connotation.

Question (Education 671). The following item is to be treated briefly but pointedly:

What is your response to the following statement? "Only by means of employing a prescribed language program can we be certain that pupils will be given complete instruction in the language fundamentals."

Education answer 73. If a set amount of work is designated for each year, this work will be the minimum amount carried. But if we teach on a flexible program, it enables us to teach to the needs of our students.

In the above answer, the two-valued orientation rests, first of all, on the opposition—without qualification—of "will be" (line 2) and "enables" (line 4). Instead of being content with "may be" and "will help," the student, disregarding the relativity of achievement, the ability and training of the teacher and of the members of the class, has made his assertion inflexible. The same narrow orientation is shown in the opposition of "a set amount of
work" (line 1) and "a flexible program" (line 4). Now, the first of these terms might refer, for instance, to an understanding of the types of sentences, and of paragraph development by description, by comparison or contrast, and by example or illustration; the second, to adaptation—based on information gathered from questionnaires, reading records, and conferences—of reading programs to the interests and capacities of individual pupils (guided individual reading). Instead of explaining, however, the student has depended on the associations of "flexible," "enables," and "needs." The explanation which is begun is rendered unconvincing as well as vague by antithesis and high emotional content.

**Question (Education 677). Illustrate from subject matter:**

It is much easier to unite against something than it is to unite for something.

**Education answer 152.** If a person really desires to get ahead, isn't it possible for him to do it, despite labor unions? Perhaps labor unions are protecting their own big men when the statement is made. Who is considered superior and inferior by the unions? By the employers?

In this response, the two-valued orientation is built on the opposition of two ideas: (1) the wish of the individual to "get ahead" (line 2), and (2) the protection of "their own big men" by the labor unions. In the first place, "desire to get ahead" has a high emotional content: Images of a gruelling race and of "the survival of the fittest" are evoked. The nature and meaning of the "getting ahead" are thus suggested but not revealed. In the second
place, the comment in lines 3-5 concerning the protection by the labor unions of "their own big men" carries with it a suggestion of unfairness and favoritism. Moreover, the student does not show whether, in the use of "big men," he is referring to such matters as intelligence, potential political power within a given labor group—or to such traits as affability and generosity. Here, too, connotation takes the place of precision. In the response as a whole, the two-valued orientation seems forced: Rhetorical questions are overused; the thinking is vague and confused; and tangential material (lines 5-7)—with the connotative and indefinite "superior" and "inferior"—is included.

Question (Education 670). In not to exceed a page, react candidly to the central viewpoint of "Our Novel Stock-in-Trade."

**Education answer 33. . . .** Frankly, the only reason why a teacher would use the same books over and over would be, in my estimation, that the teacher didn't know of any other novels or just didn't want to take the trouble of getting into less familiar material.

Through the use of two-valued orientation, based on "only" (line 1) and "just" (line 5), the student reduces the possible choices to (a) lack of knowledge, (b) lack of ambition. He does not mention, for instance, that some teachers may have enjoyed such novels as Ivanhoe and Silas Marner in school—or that other teachers may be seeking a type of revenge for what they suffered during the reading and discussion of such novels. Nor does he point out, for example, that some teachers may have a genuine liking for these books, and want pupils to share that feeling. Now, in view of the
discussion topic, the student should not necessarily have mentioned
(1) pupils' participation in choosing novels for class reading, (2)
advantages in abandoning the requirement that every pupil read the
same book at the same time, (3) use of contemporary as well as older
novels. But in the rigidity of his interpretation, the respondent
has disregarded the flexibility recommended in the article under
consideration.

The unskillful use of connotation increases the over-
simplification shown in the response. "Use the same books over
and over" (lines 2-3) gives an impression—possibly justified—of
monotony, and hints of futility. "Didn't want to take the trouble"
(line 5), as has been noted, leaves an impression that the
hypothetical teacher was actuated by laziness rather than by
insecurity. These phrases—as well as, of course, the previously
mentioned "only" and "just"—have a tendency, through their appeal
to emotion, to induce signal reactions.

Question (Education 678). What do you believe
to be the proper role of the social-studies
teacher with reference to the teaching of
controversial issues? State rather specifically
how you would handle controversial issues in
our community.

Education answer 155. In teaching controversial
issues, I would not express my personal opinion
at all. I would attempt to handle the subject
as objectively as possible on my part, but as
for the students, I would let them set their
own pace and express their own opinions. I
would make sure each student saw both sides
of the problem in today's world. By using
outside materials, I would hope to emphasize
objective thinking in all problems attacked.
The reader probably reacts favorably to the use of "objectively" (line 4) and "objective" (line 10). These terms, with their reference to the use of referential language, and to the avoidance of intentional appeal to emotions, have favorable connotations. But two-valued orientation is developed through (1) the use of the phrase "set their own pace and express their own opinions" (lines 5-6), with no hint of observance of, for example, the limits of relevance, or of guidance by the teacher; (2) the use of "both sides of the problem in today's world" (lines 7-8). Now, the "problem" is not named; the student does not seem to remember that more than two approaches are possible in analysis and solution of problems. The thinking back of the words runs counter to the usual concept of the application of the scientific method in an infinite-valued world.

In lines 8-10, moreover, the student has oversimplified. He has not revealed either the types or the purposes of the "outside materials"; nor has he shown the reasons for his expressed hope to "emphasize objective thinking in all problems attacked"—a somewhat inclusive aspiration.

Question (Education 670). On the basis of the class discussions, lectures, and your reading, treat the following topic in such a way as briefly and concretely to indicate (a) what you conceive to be sound viewpoints and (b) your reasons for the position you have taken:

The criteria you would employ in the choice and grade-placement of literature in the secondary-school program.
Education answer 49. The literature I would choose for the various grades would fall into the following categories: First, the piece should comply with the goals of the overall education program. That is, it should, as much as possible, help students understand other people appreciate worthy American ideas, be integrated with other school subjects, and help them to be socially and intellectually acceptable. [The student discusses goals rather than criteria. The material is irrelevant.]

Next, it should coincide with the goals of the literature program itself. That is, the piece under consideration should be contemporary writings in part, not all old works [connotation]. Students can more easily understand the people in their times than people of ancient times [two-valued orientation, with connotation and oversimplification].

Question (Education 677). Explain why the following statement is or is not true:
Quality in teaching comes only from training and experience.

Education answer 112. Salary scales need not be a discouraging factor for any "real teacher" [connotation]. Are teachers supposed to be like any workers just legally employed? [In this context, the use of connotation results in ambiguity, if not in incoherence.] Or are teachers to do service to the students involved, rather than teaching for the teaching, or for the sake of employment? [two-valued orientation, with connotation and oversimplification.]

In Education answers 33, 49, 73, 112, 152, and 155, the students exhibit a tendency to use absolute terms, often in antithetical constructions. The resulting lack of flexibility reveals conscious or unconscious disregard of the process of change, and failure to make allowance for other approaches to the problems under
consideration. Moreover, instead of explanation, the students have recourse to words which evoke associations and thus appeal to beliefs and prejudices. For instance, in using the expression "any real teacher," the respondent in #112 may mean a teacher who knows and enjoys the subject he teaches, who has a liking for and an understanding of students, who has a functioning sense of humor, and who possesses enthusiasm and determination; but in this context, the adjective "real" merely suggests two classifications without giving much information about either one. In these answers, then, the students show considerable faith in the accuracy and the validity of their comments, as well as an unwillingness to qualify their judgments. The answers in this group seem to have more simplicity than accuracy.

In another group of responses (Education answers 1, 114, 119, 136, 148, and 151, which follow), the reader finds two-valued orientation accompanied by high-level abstraction and connotation.

**Question (Education 677).** Explain why the following statement is or is not true:

Quality in teaching comes only from training and experience.

**Education answer 119.** If this were true, how can you account for the fact that some of the best teachers have been those who have received small monetary compensation?  
1  
2  
3  
4

First of all, the student, in writing his comment of four lines, has practically disregarded the discussion topic. He has set up two-valued orientation, with one part expressed, the other implied. He uses the phrase "some of the best teachers" (lines 2-3),
but does not explain or support the judgment. Instead of adducing evidence concerning such matters as personal appearance, sense of responsibility, breadth of interests, and knowledge of teaching methods and of subject matter, the respondent—using criteria unknown to the reader—generalizes broadly. The exact significance of "small monetary compensation" (line 4) is likewise difficult to ascertain: The phrase might denote a salary of $1500 a year in a small Southern town, or of $10,000 a year in a metropolis. Second, the student implies that some of the less capable teachers receive what he would probably call "large monetary compensation." The implication, while interesting, seems difficult to prove or to disprove, and appears to have little direct relationship with the discussion topic. Instead of explaining—as he was requested to do—the student has used a rhetorical question; instead of being clear and exact, he has been content to use vague words and to attempt to appeal to the emotions of the reader.

Question (Education 677). Illustrate the following statement by citing situations in school:

Changes in social arrangements
generally leave some people with
more freedom and some people with
less freedom than they had before.

Education answer 136. We have talked about
our core program in letting student have
absolute control over what they want to study.
This would certainly give students more
freedom, wouldn't it? But it would at the
same time take freedom away from the teachers
by the fact that they would have little
opportunity to help direct students in their
learning.
In using the phrase "absolute control" (line 3), the student has either misunderstood or has intentionally distorted the concept of broad teacher-student planned units of work in terms of the expressed wishes of the group. This concept involves (1) the active, continuing guidance of the teacher and (2) the use of criteria decided on by the group as a whole—whether the project is re-decorating a schoolroom or staging a play. Second, the positively stated but incomplete comparison in lines 4-5 increases the difficulties of interpretation, because the student does not state the other possibilities involved. The question "More freedom than what?" remains unanswered. Finally, the student has mentioned "absolute control" (line 3), "freedom" (lines 5-6), and "little opportunity to help direct students in their learning" (lines 7-9). The ideas, though a trifle confused, are expressed in terms of opposed ideas. There is a need here for qualification and explanation. The student might well have specifically stated just what this "freedom," under these circumstances, means; and, too, he might have pointed out that the amount of effectiveness—as well as of "freedom"—depends on the personality and skill of the teacher and on his working relationship with the class.

Question (Education 677). Explain why the following statement is or is not true:

In the United States, the political party which is in power nationally favors a very liberal interpretation of the Federal Government's powers, while the party out of power becomes the defender of "states' rights."
First of all, the student has failed to approach the topic directly. Instead of explaining specifically and precisely why the quoted statement is not true, he has restricted his comments to remarks about one political party at a specific time. Second, it will be noted that in the discussion topic, "liberal" is used in the sense of "not strict or rigorous" and is specifically related to the interpretation of the Constitution. The respondent, however, appears to use "liberal" (lines 3 and 5) with the significance of "favorable to change or reform." With this indirect and indefinite approach, he then uses a brief and considerably oversimplified example—for Senator Taft, even though often called "Mr. Republican," can hardly be said to represent all shades of opinion within the Republican Party—to support the generalization implicit in the rhetorical question. Finally, in lines 7-10, one finds the use of dead-level abstractions, with connotation. The rhetorical question, without details but with circular logic, remains nearly meaningless. Two-valued orientation, however, is suggested through the repetition of "conservative" after the use of "liberal" in the first paragraph.

Question (Education 536N). What teaching techniques did you find effective?
Education answer 1. I tried to make the class word-conscious, pointing out by precept and illustration how sentences could be improved, made clearer and more pictorial by discerning use of words. I did not stress "big" or spectacular words. I stressed the use of meaningful words where appropriate to do so.

First, the phrasing of the sentence "I did not stress 'big' or spectacular words" suggests that the use of long words is undesirable. The student may have been thinking, for instance of "fine writing" ("disastrous conflagration" for "fire"), or of the use of an approximate word ("unsophisticated" for "primitive").

The use of examples would have aided the reader in ascertaining the meaning. In this sentence, the use of high-order abstractions—which are also connotative—establishes two-valued orientation.

Moreover, "discerning use of words" (line 5) might well have been clarified by means of an example, such as the following:

The changes wrought by death are in themselves so sharp and final, and so terrible and melancholy in their consequences, that the thing stands alone in man's experience, and has no parallel upon earth. It outdoes all other accidents because it is the last of them.  

Question (Education 677). Explain why the following statement is or is not true:

Faith in a democracy requires us to go along with and uphold the decisions of the majority, so long as we are left free to work for a change in that decision.

---

Education answer 118. This statement is contradictory in itself [is of classification, with finality]. If we are left free to work for a change in the decisions of the majority, then we aren't going along with and upholding the decisions of the majority [two-valued orientation, with high-level abstraction and connotation]. This does not necessarily mean that we don't have a democracy. If a government required us to go along with a majority without the right to disagree, it would not be a democracy [two-valued orientation, with high-level abstraction and connotation].

Question (Education 677). Explain why the following statement is or is not true:

Prices in the United States are maintained by free competition and the operation of the law of supply and demand.

Education answer 114. Throughout most if not all of the "New Deal" era, this was not so, for though no national emergency existed, nor war [question begged; two-valued orientation implicitly, still the government subsidized an A. A. A. program which prevented surplus and oversupply of products [connotation, with finality and oversimplification] by subsidizing farmers' destruction or non-production of various foods, etc., such as potatoes, pigs, cotton, etc.

In Education answers 1, 114, 119, 136, 118, and 151, the reader finds that the expression of the two-valued orientation seems incomplete. Instead of being clearly stated, the alternatives are suggested through the use of high-order abstractions ("without the right to disagree," for instance) or of highly connotative words ("take freedom away"). The breadth of the statements, both expressed and implied, makes the exact meaning difficult to
ascertain. Under these circumstances, the reader may not be surprised to find oversimplification in these responses; but he notes also a lack of precision in grasp and interpretation of the examination questions and discussion topics. That incomplete comprehension is closely connected with the narrowness of interpretation and the distortion of meaning noted above.

**Connotation.** In eight responses (Education answers 45, 106, 117, 133, 139, 147, 150, and 154, considered below), the use of highly connotative words is accompanied by high-order abstractions and by sweeping generalization.

**Question (Education 677).** Illustrate from subject matter:

- It is much easier to unite against something than it is to unite for something.

**Education answer 106.** Take Communism, for example. Here in the United States, we have no trouble uniting against it, because we believe it's no good. If we were in Russia, we could as easily unite against our "system of democracy."

First of all, the student, in generalizing through the connotative "no trouble," ignores such matters as the questions of some citizens about their obligation to answer questions asked by members of duly constituted legislative committees. Moreover, he continues the negative position, as well as the generalization, in the use of "no good" to serve as an explanation for the unity. Instead of explaining that nearly all Americans unite against an ideology that involves, for example, the use of secret police, the
forcible collectivization of farms, and political rule by a small minority, the student has used an emotive phrase which—though it arouses agreement in the reader—does not communicate the bases for the unity.

The response as a whole seems to be tangential, vague, and indefinite, chiefly because of the appeals to emotion in the phrases mentioned. These qualities are accentuated by the high level of abstraction of "Communism" (line 1) which may mean any system of social organization in which goods are held in common, and of "democracy" (line 6) which refers to a form of government in which the supreme power is held by the people and either exercised directly or through a system of representation. The breadth of the concepts serves to increase the vagueness previously noted.

Question (Education 677). Illustrate from subject matter:

Even within the thinking of a single individual, two or more cherished values are often thrown into conflict.

Education answer 117. A man who loves his country, who is very patriotic, and believes whole-heartedly in his country, may have conflicting values if he also does not believe in war to the extent that he would refuse to fight in a war. Therefore, he loves his country—he does not believe in war. What will he do if the country which he loves so dearly becomes involved in a war and he is needed in the army to help defend his country?

Here he has two conflicting values:
whether he should fight for the country which he loves, or whether he should stand by his convictions of not killing other people in a war.
Here, the unskillful use of connotative words, as well as of unexplained high-order abstractions, lessens the accuracy and the effectiveness of a response that is basically sound. First, in lines 1-3, the respondent writes of a man "who loves his country" (an expression used four times in the response) and "who believes whole-heartedly in his country." The phrasing suggests respect for traditions of protection of the rights of the individual—freedom of speech, for instance—and of the society of which that individual is a part—salus populi suprema lex. He may be thinking of an affection based on comprehension of what the country stands for, rather than of an unreasoning love. The phrasing, however, becomes more emphatic and uncompromising in "he would refuse to fight in a war" (lines 5-6), with its direct, emphatic determination not to accept what is proposed. The use of connotation oversimplifies the matter: The individual might hesitate; he might decline; few would definitely refuse. The process of oversimplification is continued in "should stand by his convictions" (lines 13-14). The abstract idea of consistency is used here; yet consistency may mean inflexibility. Some conscientious objectors did, after all, join the Medical Corps. Finally, the highly abstract and connotative "He does not believe in war" (line 7) does not tell the reader much about the beliefs. One may believe that war poisons society; one may also believe that, occasionally, fighting may mean standing by one's convictions. On the whole, instead of clearly and objectively stating the illustration, the student
has blended oversimplification and appeals to the emotions of the reader.

Question (Education 678). What do you see as the major objectives of the social-studies program in the secondary school? Why? Discuss these objectives with special reference to the courses which you would be teaching in our school.

Education answer 154. Through the teaching of social studies we can help establish desirable and happy personal and social relationships with age-mates and adults and develop a social pattern which will give purpose and direction to their (the students') lives.

This can only be achieved by promoting the following: reflective and creative thought; develop desirable social attitudes, work habits, and study skills; and develop a broad pattern of co-operativeness and responsibility towards society as a whole.

In a course in P. O. D. where I would be dealing with students who are almost finished with school, there would be hundreds of chances of furthering the above. Life is a dynamic sort of thing that is ever changing and ever progressing; so it is for these kids that I want to help in their quest for "understanding" of society, and its implications upon them as individuals. It is the individual that makes an efficiently operating group, and I am interested in bettering the group through understanding of processes; thus I hope in the end to better the group.

In his discussion, the student relies largely on a combination of connotative words and high-order abstractions for the communication of ideas. He writes, in lines 2-6, of the effort to "establish desirable and happy personal and social relationships with age-mates and adults" and "to develop a social pattern which will give purpose and direction to their (the students') lives." In the
first of these related passages, the student may have been thinking of such virtues as sympathy, tolerance, understanding, and humility; he might have clarified such ideas by means of examples--from the story of the Good Samaritan, for instance, or from the life of St. Francis of Assisi. The second passage touches on the problem that every human being faces: that of evolving a philosophy of life, a working compromise with the world in which he lives. The abstract "social pattern" and the connotative, as well as abstract, "purpose and direction" do little here to limit or to show the student's conception of a problem that has been considered at some length by such men as Koheleth, Socrates, St. Thomas Aquinas, and Havelock Ellis.

Furthermore, just how the teaching of social studies can give such "purpose and direction" is not clearly shown in lines 7-12. Examples--the painstaking, incisive thinking of Galileo or Newton on specified problems; the civic oath which every Athenian took--might have helped to restrict and clarify "reflective and creative thought," "desirable social attitudes," and "broad patterns of co-operativeness and responsibility towards society." Finally, the reader notices that in lines 21-26, words essential to clear understanding have been omitted. The student has depended on "efficiently operating"--with the general ideas of competency, capability, and adequacy--to communicate his meaning. The phrase alone, however, seems insufficient for precision: After all, the Gestapo was, in one sense, an efficiently operating group. In lines 23-26, the
respondent does not indicate the extent or the nature of the betterment in which he expresses interest, or the types or significance of the "processes." Objectivity, detail, and limitation of terms are needed to render this discussion clear and definite.

**Question (Education 671).** On the basis of your reading and the class lectures and discussions, treat the following topic in such a way as briefly and specifically to indicate (a) what you conceive to be sound viewpoints and/or teaching processes, and (b) your reasons for the position you have taken.

The function and use of thought-provoking discussion topics in group treatment of literature.

**Education answer 45.** Thought-provoking discussion topics in group treatment of literature are good to allow students to see the main points in the work under consideration. These will give average (and really all) students something tangible to look for in their reading of the suggested literature piece.

I say this because we want students to get the "marrow" from the works used, and it'll help them in making their summaries of each, briefly, too.

Here, the student has relied unduly on connotation and high-order abstraction: "something tangible to look for" (lines 6-7) and "marrow" (line 10). He might well have pointed out, for instance—with brief examples—that thought-provoking discussion topics should focus attention on major elements—people, ideas, problems—in the literature being read; that they should serve as a basis for the discussion to follow; that they should be
based on the interests and capacities of a given class; and that the number of topics should depend on the literary item under consideration. In this answer, however, ideas are suggested rather than clearly developed.

Question (Education 677). Explain why the following statement is or is not true:
  Democracy is the right way, if the majority rules in a democracy.

Education answer 133. The idea of the truce in Korea forces us to go along with it because of our faith in democracy and democratic principles [connotation, with high-level abstraction and sweeping generalization]. But some senators have the right idea [connotation] when they maintain that stronger methods are needed to really keep the peace seriously [connotation, with high-level abstraction and sweeping generalization]. Also it can be said that our faith in democracy has enabled us to sacrifice the lives of our own youth to preserve democracy [connotation, with high-level abstraction and sweeping generalization] in another area of the world where we actually had no physical ties.

Question (Education 677). Illustrate from subject matter:
  Institutions tend to persist long after the purposes for which they were created have ceased to operate.

Education answer 147. One illustration is the Confederacy of the South. In 1864, the Confederacy was dissolved by a military defeat at the hands of the North. This, however, did not dissolve the emotional feeling, or feeling in regards to the government in Washington [connotation, with high-order abstraction and generalization]. The Dixiecrats have voted in a block in
many elections because these men feel the
South's aim can be achieved only if a
united front is presented.
Some of the conditions that caused the
Civil War may still exist in the South.
The economic poverty in some cases, a
franchise for Negroes are two examples
that have caused these institutions to
remain. Prejudice and bigotry belief on
the part of some politicians in the South
continually revive the "spirit of the old
South." [connotation, with high-order
abstraction and generalization]. The people
of the Confederacy felt very strongly
about their position, strongly enough to
fight a war. So those who have to be taught
or told of the South stand a deep
admiration and love and cannot leave a
Confederacy of the past.

Question (Education 677). Illustrate from
subject matter:
Changes in social arrangements
generally leave some people with
more freedom and some people with
less freedom than they had before.

Education answer 150. By admitting
Mexicans into the country and allowing them
to work here, we have raised their standards
and given them freedoms, while the United
States Americans will suffer in wages and
also in safety [connotation, with high-
level abstraction and generalization].

In Education answers 45, 106, 117, 133, 139, 147, 150, and
154, the students rely, consciously or unconsciously, on the
emotional appeal of such words as "wholeheartedly" and
"conscientious." The loss of objectivity, which is both a cause
and an effect, is combined with the impressiveness and vagueness
of such words as "democracy" and "processes"--terms which are
employed without recourse to lower levels of abstraction for clarification. This combination of emotive language and unqualified high-level abstraction facilitates the setting forth of generalizations which seem to be both surprising and inaccurate. Occasionally, too, faulty sentence structure adds to the difficulties of ascertaining the meaning.

In another group of responses (Education answers 22, 87, 103, and 110, considered below), the use of highly connotative words is combined with forms of to be and with two-valued orientation.

**Question (Education 669).** Choose any three of the following types of literature: biography, travel and history, poetry, essays and miscellaneous prose, drama, fiction. For each type selected, list the author and title of any four books suitable for high-school students, and describe in a paragraph the nature and quality of each book.

**Education answer 22.** Galsworthy, *Loyalties.* This is a play of conflict, the conflict of loyalties. It touches, too, upon the problem of race prejudice. This play, too, is presented very straightforwardly. Mr. Galsworthy's treatment of the subject is good. He develops the theme quite adequately and arrives at a very logical conclusion. It likewise is a very thought-provoking play.

First, "straightforwardly" (line 5) gives an impression of directness and candor, but conveys little idea of Galsworthy's moderation, tolerance, compassion—and irony. In line 5, moreover, the use of "adequately" to describe the development of theme communicates little of Galsworthy's theories concerning drama (as
discussed in *Some Platitudes Concerning Drama* or of the architectural qualities of his plays. Third, instead of using the *is* of classification to describe the play as "thought-provoking" (line 9), the student might have mentioned the playwright's sincerity, his sympathy with the underdog, and the fact that the action of *Loyalties*—for the most part intellectual—stimulates the reader to consideration and examination of such statements as "Loyalties cut up against each other sometimes."

Two-valued orientation seems implicit in two comments, one made by means of the *is* of classification. In the first place, the comment that "the treatment of the subject is good" (lines 6-7) tells little of Galsworthy's efforts to be impartial, or of the significance of the combination of understatement and detachment. Second, in asserting that the playwright "arrives at a very logical conclusion," the student does not mention that the problem—as is usual in Galsworthy's plays—is illuminated but not resolved. The respondent has missed the point of Margaret's speech at the end of the play: "Keep faith! We've all done that. It's not enough."

**Question (Education 677).** Illustrate from *subject matter:*

It is much easier to unite against something than it is to unite for something.

**Education answer 103.** We can use as an example the movement for rehabilitation. People could argue about the bad effect of drink, and the economic and physical causes. What type of argument could you use in favor of it? It is very easy when you are against something to paint the picture blacker than it is.
First, "bad effect" in line 3 seems to be a broad term, with suggestions of having an unfavorable or injurious effect. Though detailed discussion of the psychological and physiological results of the overuse of alcoholic beverages does not seem necessary, "bad effect" in this context seems neither enlightening nor objective. The next sentence continues the process of oversimplification: The use of the rhetorical question results in the brushing aside of any different ideas which might have been suggested—including the idea that moderate drinking may result in personal enjoyment and in increased sociability. Finally, the cliché in the last lines (5-7)—whether an afterthought or an effort to show the relevance of the response to the discussion topic—reinforces the two-valued orientation seen in the somewhat loosely organized answer.

Question (Education 677). Explain why the following statement is or is not true:
Labor unions rob their members of a chance to get ahead when they prevent the employer from rewarding merit by paying higher hourly wages to superior workers and lower wages to inferior workers.

Education answer 110. It usually works out that the worker who is superior will get promoted and receive the higher-paying position.

Now, perhaps the student does not need to explain his concept of "superior," though much of the significance of the response depends upon the meaning—"intelligent," "adaptable," "ambitious," for instance—which he has in mind. Nevertheless, the connotative
content of the term seems to be increased by its use with the is 
of classification (line 2). Second, the student has avoided, or, at 
least indirectly approached, the discussion topic. Labor unions 
are not mentioned; instead, the student has assumed that unspecified 
excellence will bring its own reward. The two-valued orientation 
thus implicit does not appear to be markedly lessened by the use of 
the broad, non-committal "usually" (line 1), which does no more 
than hint at such matters as office politics and personality 
clashes. Instead of analyzing, the student has taken refuge in a 
judgment backed by the connotations of "superior" and "promoted."

Question (Education 671). On the basis 
of your readings and the class lectures 
and discussions, treat the following 
topic in such a way as briefly and 
specifically to indicate (a) what you 
conceive to be sound viewpoints and/ 
or teaching processes, and (b) your 
reasons for the position you have taken. 
The varieties of oral composition 
in which all pupils should gain 
some insight and experience as part 
of their English program.

Education answer 87. The varieties of oral 
composition in which all students should 
gain some insight are those for which he will 
have the most use [two-valued orientation, 
with connotation; note also line 12] in life 
situations, such as conversation, telephoning, 
making introductions, informal public 
speaking, etc. It is certainly useless [is 
of classification, with connotation] to 
waste valuable class time on some of the 
more formal elements of oral composition 
which the students are likely to rarely, 
if ever, have a use for, if they need to 
gain experience and knowledge in those 
forms which are so important [is of
classification, with connotation in the life of everyone.

Let us summarize briefly: In Education answers 22, 87, 103, and 110, emotional reactions are shown. The students use words embodying unsupported judgments--words which by their nature will appeal to the emotions and beliefs of the reader. Moreover, some of these connotative words--"useless," for instance, in #87--seem, in context, to be more emphatic than necessary; and this over-emphasis reveals not only loss of objectivity but also failure to discriminate among words on such bases as accuracy and appropriateness. The finality of connotative words and of judgments is increased by the linking of the is of identity and the is of classification with connotative words and by the narrowness of two-valued orientation set up by the unskillful use of evocative words. At best, the reader has a restricted choice. These answers are made up of highly subjective, loaded groups of comments. It may be noted that these responses are written in answer to questions requesting calm, objective analysis.

Metaphor. In the first group of answers under this heading (Education answers 23, 35, 159, to follow), one finds mixed metaphors combined with high-level abstractions and forms of to be.

Question (Education 669). Choose any three of the following types of literature: biography, travel and history, poetry, essays and miscellaneous prose, drama, fiction. For each type selected, list the author and title of any four books suitable for high-school students, and describe in a paragraph the nature and quality of each book.
Education answer 23. Shakespeare's sonnets.

I think it is valuable for high-school students to be given a good dose of Shakespeare, not enough to make them choke, but at least enough to let those who will derive benefit from it do so. I also feel that it will prove beneficial to the student to do some memorizing, and that Shakespeare's sonnets lend well to this in their brevity, their variety, and their literary worth. The topic, of course, of these sonnets is a variety of expressions of devotion of a man and a woman acquaintance of his.

After noting the student's impression that the reading of the sonnets will, in itself, in some unexplained way facilitate the attainment of the aim hinted at in "valuable" and "derive benefit" (lines 2 and 5), the reader observes the analogy drawn between the sonnets and a sort of spring tonic. The student's use of the metaphor indicates his belief (a) that every high-school student should read these poems, (b) that such reading will build up "mental discipline"—an idea emphasized by the comment on memorization. No provision is made, it will be noted, for selection and placement based on clear criteria, including the intellectual and experiential whereabouts of the students, nor is allowance made for the sharp limitations placed on "transfer of training" as a result of the discrediting of faculty psychology. The metaphor seems to be not only mixed up but misleading.

Furthermore, in spite of the inaccuracy of the metaphor, the vagueness of "benefit" (line 5), and the irrelevance of such material as that in lines 10-14, the respondent, through the use of forms of to be, presents his ideas with confidence and with little
hesitation. In the response as a whole, that confidence seems as noticeable as the inaccuracy.

Question (Education 678). What do you believe to be the proper role of the social-studies teacher with reference to the teaching of controversial issues? State rather specifically how you would handle controversial issues in our community.

Education answer 159. I believe that controversial issues are the cutting edge of democratic advance. They are conceived by the democratic process of orderly change. The teacher who does not realize this must be lacking.

In using the phrase "the cutting edge" (line 2), the respondent may be thinking of the well-known "thin entering wedge"—or of the beneficial effects of training in analytical thinking and in analysis of propaganda on the voting habits of citizens and on the development of republican government at all levels. Now, metaphors illustrate rather than prove; but the analogy of a razor edge does not seem to illustrate clearly. The metaphor is complicated by the use of "democratic advance," a phrase which is at once highly abstract and quite indefinite. The student may be referring to the development of a government which would become the administrator of the social purposes of its people, undertaking complicated social and economic tasks ranging from school-lunch programs to flood control, and from farm subsidies to regulation of the sale of stocks and bonds. The mixture of metaphor and abstraction makes the meaning difficult to follow. Second, "democratic process of social change" (lines 3-4) may refer to slow,
quiet change under law, in contrast with rioting or insurrection—and with the volatility of French politics, for instance. Finally, in line 5, the student, without warning, resorts to invective. Instead of analysis, he offers two-valued orientation.

Question (Education 670). In not to exceed a page react candidly to the central and unifying viewpoint of "Our Novel Stock-in-Trade."

Education answer 35. Just as brush salesmen have the same old hairbrushes and backbrushes to present to their customers, and the same old sales talk, so do teachers become accustomed to presenting the same books in the same manner to their students. This falling into routine is dangerous to the value of the literature program and also to the attitude with which pupils will approach the class.

The associations of patter and persistence accompanying the use of "brush salesmen" are strengthened by "same old" in lines 2 and 3-4, by "same" in line 5, and by "falling into routine" in line 6. The metaphor leaves the impression that teachers follow, without thought and without sincerity, the established pattern. Second, the comment in lines 6-9 seems intrinsically sound; but the extended metaphor does not show—except in a limited, repetitious way—the dangers of such procedure. No allowance is made for some teachers' sincere liking for certain books often used in high-school classes, or for the pressure exerted by administrators or boards of education by prescribing the use of detailed, often nearly inflexible, courses of study. Through his use of metaphor, mixed and obscure, the student seems to show teachers as taking the easiest way out—the way of the salesman.
In the responses considered above (Education answers 23, 35, and 159), the reader finds little analysis and evaluation. The terseness and compactness of metaphor have made each of these students believe in the validity and the finality of his particular approach. This assurance is augmented considerably by the unhesitating use of forms of to be. Second, confusion in thought is shown in the mixed metaphors—"controversial issues are the cutting edge of democratic advance," for example, in #159—and in the inclusion of distantly related or completely irrelevant material. The reader also notices confusion in thought as he observes the use of such unexplained high-order abstractions as "democratic advance." These responses seem to exhibit vividness without either accuracy or clarity.

In Education answers 129 and 135, which follow, the reader finds the use of metaphor accompanied by highly connotative words.

**Question (Education 677).** Explain why the following statement is or is not true:

Faith in a democracy requires us to go along with and uphold the decisions of the majority, so long as we are left free to work for a change in that decision.

Education answer 135. Our Supreme Court is an institution which we have in our country largely to combat such a belief as this. We must have some control which is rational in its doings. We as humans are likely to jump at conclusions and begin something that we will later be sorry for.

First, the word "combat" (line 3) evokes an image of armed encounter to settle a dispute. One finds also a suggestion of
victory, with a hint of the rightness of the cause, an impression strengthened by the phrase "some control which seems rational in its doings" (lines 4-5). Now, "control" may mean, for instance, "restraint," "curb," or "check"; the respondent has personified an evocative word and has then complicated the discussion further by linking it with an equally emotive term which, in this context, may mean "reasonable" or "justifiable." The reader, at this point, may be somewhat uncertain about the nature of the restraint, as well as that which is under the hypothetical curb; he may suspect, however, that the significance of "rational" may be equated with the beliefs of the student. Moreover, the cliché in lines 5-6 is complicated by the use of the emotive term "sorry." The student may have been thinking of, for example, excess-profits taxes; the growth of public power, as in the Tennessee Valley Authority; or the ramifications of such legislation as the Sherman Act and the Clayton Act; he seems content, however, to have written a sentence which can be termed not only metaphorical but also unclear.

Question (Education 677). Explain why the following statement is or is not true:

Faith in a democracy requires us to go along with and uphold the decisions of the majority, so long as we are left free to work for a change in that decision.

Education answer 129. The fight against "McCarthyism" has grown like a rolling snowball. We say these anti-McCarthyites are liberals. However, there are some liberals who see some merit in screaming. Their followers
are few. The idea of "mass hysteria" might be an illustration. "People are led like sheep" is another. These indicate a lack of reflective thinking on the part of many individuals.

In the response as a whole, the student (a) has disregarded the discussion topic, (b) has, to a large extent, expressed his ideas by using metaphors and highly connotative words. The first of these metaphors (lines 1-3) gives the reader an impression--not based on any evidence offered in the answer--of growing size and power. In the second of the figures, about the "screaming" of "some liberals" with "few followers," the reader is left with ideas of infantilism, uncontrolled temper, and lack of understanding and of maturity--but with no examples to support the statement. (The repetition of "liberals"--a highly abstract and connotative word--does very little to clarify or to define.) The student continues, in his metaphor about sheep (lines 7-8), to demonstrate his dependence on, and confidence in, unsupported assertion. This metaphor is intended, perhaps, to explain "mass hysteria" in line 6. The last three lines of the response, a general comment based on an indefinite reference, shows how the student has gone further and further from the discussion topic. In a disjointed response, he has depended on metaphor to relate and to convince.

In Education answers 129 and 135, then, the metaphors seem to be neither appropriate nor revealing. These figures of speech hint and suggest rather than draw clear, justifiable analogies. The connotative words, with their appeals to emotion, complicate,
rather than at least partially solve, the problems. The questions under consideration are begged through vagueness and loss of objectivity. Finally, the reader sees a tendency in these responses—as in the others considered under Metaphor—to generalization, made without clear analysis of the grounds for the statements and without realization of their breadth.

Slanting. In Education answers 94, 105, and 134, which follow, the students combine slanting with the use of highly connotative words.

Question (Education 677). Illustrate from subject matter:

Even within the thinking of a single individual, two or more cherished values are often thrown into conflict.

Education answer 134. An example would be

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>perhaps your belief that the United States has never committed any act which would be considered a detriment to peace. Now look closely at the Spanish-American War. Our two governments had an agreement practically made, but the majority of the people clamored for a fight.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The process of selection is begun with the apparently serious presentation of the hypothetical belief set forth in lines 2-4. Such a belief would, of course, disregard such matters as the invasion of Mexico by American forces under Generals Taylor and Scott in 1846, or the filibustering expedition of the Virginius in 1873. Perhaps more significant is the slanting shown in lines 5-8. The student writes that the governments of the United States and Spain "had an agreement practically made"; he thus disregards the
events from March 29 to April 19, including Spain's acceptance of the terms of President McKinley's note of March 29, and of the change in attitude shown in the President's message to Congress on April 16. Again, the assertion is made that "the majority of the people clamored for a fight." He does not mention that most Americans did favor war with Spain—after the publication of the De Lome letter and the blowing up of the Maine. The false impression given by such selection of facts is increased by the use of "look closely," a clause which suggests that an interpretation different from that of the student is hasty, superficial, and unfounded. Finally, in his efforts to reach his predetermined conclusion, the student has largely disregarded the point of the discussion topic.

Question (Education 671). On the basis of your reading and the class lectures and discussions, treat the following topic in such a way as briefly and specifically to indicate (a) what you conceive to be sound viewpoints and/or teaching processes, and (b) your reasons for the position you have taken.

Why would you (or would you not) give incidental instruction in oral composition in all situations in which pupils speak?

Education answer 91. I wouldn't give instruction in oral composition in all speaking situations because I don't think it's necessary. However, I would give instruction when pupils gave informal talks or reports to the class. I would mention the need of poise, a good voice, preparation, and organization. Then in connection with an oral-composition unit
I would intensify those instructions. By mentioning these factors of good speaking on several occasions, there would be a transfer to the other occasions. But I would stop before I gave instruction for all speaking situations because I certainly don't want my pupils to be little Lord Fauntleroys. I certainly want them to be healthy-free-speaking American children.

If they would have to keep in mind the rules for formal oral composition in all of the speaking situations, I fear that they would soon become interested in their expression for fear that "it isn't polite to say this or that in such a way." Let them talk the way they want to (up to a point) in their informal speaking situations, but let them know how to give good oral composition when the need arises.

First of all, the student, instead of writing a direct, supported answer to the question, has decided (as shown in lines 3-4) that such instruction is not "necessary" and then has attempted to explain the comment by referring to the possibility of pupils becoming "little Lord Fauntleroys" and--as far as one can tell--the risk of undue stress on rules for formal oral composition resulting in strain and artificiality. Instead of depending heavily on selection and connotation, the student might well have given examples of types of speaking situations, and might have made some reference to the teaching of conversation.

**Question (Education 677).** Explain why the following statement is or is not true:

Faith in a democracy requires us to go along with and uphold the decisions of the majority, so long as we are left free to work for a change in that decision.
Education answer 105. The best way I know to work for a change in decision is by good strong opposition [connotation].
If the majority decide to disarm our country, cut the Army, the Navy, and the Air Force down, I would not think those against the decision should be required to uphold the decision. Isn't it possible for those in power not to be representative of the majority opinion on all issues that are decided [slanting, with connotation].

In these responses (Education answers 94, 105, and 134), the students were expected to analyze, to illustrate, and to support their statements. However, the respondents have omitted and oversimplified facts and the interpretation of facts. Instead of illustrating or explaining, they have evaded or unnecessarily restricted the point at issue, as, for example in lines 8-10 of #105. The inaccuracy caused by the selection of facts is increased by the use of words, such as "good, strong opposition," which reveal the feelings of the students and which appeal to the beliefs and opinions of the reader. In these answers, inferences and judgments have taken, to a large extent, the place of reports.

Three other responses (Education answers 99, 124, and 132, which are considered below) show the use of slanting, with high-level abstraction and with confusion in thought.

Question (Education 677). Illustrate the following statement by citing situations in school:
Changes in social arrangement generally leave some people with more freedom and some people with less freedom than they had before.
Education answer 99. Negro people in the South are sometimes treated very badly. This is because a long time ago, the Negroes in the South were the white men's slaves. In the North, the people are treated a great deal better because they do not have this great resentment for the Negro.

In the first place, the student, in lines 1-4 of his discussion, has given only one very general reason for the treatment of the Negro in the South. He has omitted any mention of such illustrative detail as the number of Negroes in such States as Mississippi and Alabama, and the existence of such groups as the Ku Klux Klan. In the second place, the student, in lines 5-6, has used the unqualified phrase "treated a great deal better"—a group of words which tells the reader nothing about the ways, the circumstances, or the number of people involved. In these lines, too, the assertion is made that people in the South feel "resentment" toward the Negro. The abstract word remains unexplained; the respondent gives no hint that the excesses of the Reconstruction period may have some connection with the attitude of many Southern people toward the Negro. In the context of the response, "resentment," because it is unmodified and very broad, seems practically meaningless—as much so as "treated very badly" in line 2.

Furthermore, the discussion as a whole lacks coherence. The student has generalized without making clear the sequence of ideas, and has combined assurance and vagueness. In addition, he has shown disregard of the discussion topic and has made an arbitrary
selection of the material and of the treatment.

Question (Education 677). Explain why the following statement is or is not true:
In the United States, the political party which is in power nationally favors a very liberal interpretation of the Federal Government's powers, while the party out of power becomes the champion of "states' rights."

Education answer 132. In the United States we basically have the two-party system, and it is only right that one acts as a check on the other one. We have basically in our government the executive, legislative, and judicial branches, each having checks and balances on one another. If this country was a one-party system—with no checks or balances by another party—and they took a liberal political interpretation of the government's powers, the states' rights which the country has been founded on—stated that those powers not given to the Federal Government by the Constitution shall be states' rights. This might hinder economic, judicial, and other functions of our country. We greatly need two parties to check and balance each other.

The student appears to maintain that either a "liberal interpretation of the government's powers" or a one-party system might have some detrimental effect on the functioning of the United States Government. After mentioning checks and balances (lines 6 and 8)—in a sentence showing disregard of the question—the student uses the phrase "liberal interpretation" (line 10), but does not reveal the meaning which he has in mind. He may be referring, for instance, to the "welfare state," to Social Security, to Federal aid for schools, or to flood-control programs. It may be noted, too, that the reference to the Tenth
Amendment (lines 12-14) is somewhat confused. The sentence as a whole is disjointed and inconclusive. Second, the student, after neglecting to make specific the reference of "this" (line 14), does not show how the unspecified action, attitude, or interpretation would hinder. The conclusion evidently previously reached in the mind of the student is not clearly communicated to the mind of the reader. The respondent believes in his ideas, and has arranged the evidence; but the ideas are not coherently stated. The thought is not only confused but also— as shown in the last sentence— repetitious.

Question (Education 677). Illustrate from the subject matter:

It is much easier to unite against something than it is to unite for something.

Education answer 124. During World War II
the United States fought against Japan,
Germany, and Italy. Since the war, they
have been allied against the Russians to
fight Communism [slanting, with connotation].

In Education answers 99, 124, and 132, one notices, first, omission. These students solve a problem or illustrate a generalization by using one reason or assertion, which is worded broadly and offered without explanation or qualification. Other reasons are not considered, though they may be of major significance in the analyses expected of the students. Second, unqualified high-level abstractions increase both the vagueness and the breadth of the comments. Finally, faulty sentence structure further increases the difficulties of interpretation.
In summarizing the results of the analysis of the responses in courses in professional education, the writer will present, first, an observation on the subject matter of the questions (in relation to the use of high-level abstractions and of emotive language); second, figures showing the frequency and classification of errors; and third, examples of superior or excellent answers.

In Chapters V and VI, the present writer has mentioned that some of the examination questions and discussion topics concern ideas and theories about which there is considerable disagreement. It may not be surprising, then, that the above statement applies to courses concerned with the teaching of English and of the social studies. Some of the questions concern abstract concepts, such as the effects of changes in social arrangements on freedom. Other questions, involving obsolescent but surviving institutions, and the place of a minority in a republic, may be more apt to cause the use of emotive language. It will be remembered that Education 536N is concerned with student teaching; 669, with literary materials for English and the social studies; 670 and 671, with the teaching of English; and 677 and 678, with the teaching of the social studies.

The enrollment figures (for the academic year 1952-1953) for the courses in professional education are appended:

- 536N: 10
- 669: 10
- 670-671: 35
- 677-678: 55
We may now proceed to a summary of the analyses under the six major headings, the first of which is Abstraction.

**ABSTRACTION**

1. **Dead-level abstraction**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>536N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>669</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>670-671</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>677-678</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

   In these answers, the use of unqualified high-level abstractions results in oversimplification and vagueness. Paraphrase, when used, helps the reader little, for it is on a consistently high level of abstraction. The students tend to substitute repetition for evaluation, and judgments for analysis. This combination of difficulties is noted in responses at all course levels, even though the examination questions and discussion topics call for careful, supported analysis, illustration, and evaluation.

2. **High-level abstraction,**
   **with connotation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>536N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>670-671</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>677-678</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In these answers, the students have sketched major ideas. Because the high-order abstractions upon which much of the meaning depends are left unexplained, there is little common ground for accurate communication. The repetition of connotative words emphasizes the lack of precision resulting from the unskillful use of high-order abstractions. Thus, these students not only have failed to indicate referents accurately but also have set forth emotional reactions.

3. High-level abstraction, with looseness in thought

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
<th>670-671</th>
<th>2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>677-678</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Here, one finds the use of unqualified high-level abstractions combined with faulty organization of ideas. Lack of definition is accompanied by failure to show clearly relationships between ideas. These students, then, have difficulty with a problem involving (a) adequate comprehension of the significance of major terms, (b) separation of the inferential and the descriptive levels, (c) systematic analysis, (d) coherent presentation of ideas.

SYMBOLS

1. Word-magic with connotation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
<th>670-671</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>677-678</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In these answers, the students substitute repetition of symbols for analysis. Such a procedure results in oversimplification of problems and in lack of precision. Yet, paradoxically, the respondents, ignoring multiple meanings, seem to depend on symbols as absolutes, with power to communicate accurately in and of themselves. Students in these advanced groups appear to have trouble with this problem, which involves the maintenance of a high level of abstraction, belief in word-magic, and loss of objectivity.

2. Word-magic, with 
   connotation and 
   two-valued orientation

   670-671
   677-678

   Number of responses inspected
   1
   2

In these answers, the students' use of symbols appears to be based on the belief that the referents of the symbols will necessarily be the same for the writer and the reader. Little or no explanation or evidence is offered; instead, the writers of these discussions use antitheses based on evocative words. Thus, two-valued orientation is emphasized. In their responses, these students show not only implicit confusion of word with object or idea but also lack of care in analysis.

3. Word-magic, with high-
   level abstraction and 
   looseness in thought

   677-678

   Number of responses inspected
   2
In these answers, unclear comprehension of the symbols used is shown, as well as belief in word-magic. The high level of abstraction maintained emphasizes further the haziness and vagueness shown in the often-faulty wording. These advanced students, working with abstract and somewhat controversial material, have difficulty in carefully analyzing meanings, in using sufficient explanatory material, and in arranging ideas in an orderly fashion.

CONTEXTS

1. **Shifts in meaning of key terms, with high-level abstractions** Number of responses inspected

   669 2

The reader of these answers finds that the meaning of major terms is not made clear. The psychological and verbal contexts appear to be faulty: Many significant explanatory and supporting details are omitted; others are irrelevant. Difficulties in interpretation which arise from unexpected shifts in meaning of major terms are augmented by the use of unqualified high-order abstractions. In this problem, involving lack of care in analysis, unclear grasp of major ideas, and the consistent use of high levels of abstraction, these students in advanced courses appear to have difficulty.
FORMS OF TO BE

1. Forms of to be, with high-level abstraction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>669</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>670-671</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>677-678</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Here, the equating of high-order abstractions through the use of the is of identity is accompanied by certitude unsupported by explanation. Projection appears in the listing, without hesitation and without detail, of qualities of pieces of literature (in 669, 670). Often, too, words necessary for clarity have been omitted. In these discussions, in which one finds finality as well as oversimplification of complex problems, the work of students at the upper course levels is represented.

2. Forms of to be, with two-valued orientation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>670-671</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>677-678</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Here, the students use the is of identity and the is of classification to set up contrasts, often forced and usually unexplained. Repetition takes the place of explanation, and the students display little hesitation in setting forth their judgments. In such discussions as these, requiring careful weighing and considering of ideas, as well as due reserve in
expression, students at the upper course levels have difficulty.

**TWO-VALUED ORIENTATION**

1. Two-valued orientation, with oversimplification and connotation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Numbers</th>
<th>Responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>670-671</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>677-678</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In these answers, the students exhibit an attitude of primary certitude. Without noticeable hesitation or comment, they place terms, many of which are connotative, in convenient but unconvincing opposition. Instead of explanation, one finds dependence on words with high emotional content. The way is thus prepared for oversimplification. Students in the advanced groups appear to have difficulty here.

2. Two-valued orientation, with high-level abstraction and connotation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Numbers</th>
<th>Responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>536N</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>677-678</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Here, two-valued orientation seems implicit rather than explicit; yet the attitude behind the highly abstract and connotative terms appears to be one of certainty. Generalization and the overuse of such devices as the rhetorical question indicate the unclear grasp of terms basic to the discussions, as well as the oversimplification one finds in all these responses.
Under the sixth major heading, **Emotive Language**, there are three subheadings: **Connotation**, **Metaphor**, and **Slanting**. We may now turn to the first of these.

**CONNOTATION**

1. **Connotation, with high-order abstraction and generalization**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>670-671</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>677-678</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In these answers, instead of illustrating or explaining, the students have phrased judgments in words which reveal and appeal to emotion. The resulting inaccuracy is accompanied by oversimplification: Major implications of such words as "conscientious" are by-passed. Unsupported generalizations further complicate the problem, which has given advanced students some trouble.

2. **Connotation, with forms of to be and two-valued orientation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>669</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>670-671</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>677-678</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The loss of objectivity resulting from the unskillful use of connotation is accompanied in these responses by what appears to be a lack of sensitiveness to emphasis and impact in using connotation. Loaded and overemphatic words are used to set up
explicit two-valued orientation, and the resulting oversimplification is augmented by finality arising from the use of forms of to be. All students in these course levels have difficulties with this complex problem.

METAPHOR

1. Distortion of meaning resulting from the use of mixed metaphors, with high-level abstraction and forms of to be

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
<th>669</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>670-671</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>677-678</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The analogies drawn in these answers, while vivid, seem largely inappropriate. The meaning is distorted by the unskillful choice of metaphor and by the confusion in thought shown in that choice. Ideas are hinted at through the use of unexplained abstractions; but the use of forms of to be reflects the assurance of the writer. In these discussions, involving careful selection of metaphor for appropriateness, as well as the use of supporting detail, the work of students in advanced courses is represented.

2. Metaphor, with connotation

| Number of responses inspected | 677-678         | 2 |

Here, as in the responses just considered, the students have
employed metaphor for vividness, without careful consideration of the appropriateness and accuracy, as well as vigor. As a result, the reader is often uncertain of the meaning intended. The use of connotative words increases the vagueness and results in question-begging and in generalizations open to question. These advanced students seem to have difficulty with this combination of faulty metaphor and use of persuasion.

SLANTING

1. Slanting, with connotation 

   Number of responses inspected

   670-671
   1
   677-678
   2

   Instead of explaining and illustrating—as they were specifically requested to do—the respondents, through the omission of significant related ideas—use broad, oversimplified statements. Overemphasis and suggestion resulting from the use of connotative words further complicate interpretation. Unnecessary restriction of major ideas, as well as misplaced emphasis, results.

2. Slanting, with high-level abstraction and with confusion in thought

   Number of responses inspected

   677-678
   3

   In these responses, conclusions previously reached are phrased in broad statements, with little or no illustrative detail, often with the use of unqualified high-order abstractions. The
certitude and the vagueness facilitate the making of generalizations which are questionable in thought and in expression.

The following portion of the chapter contains several responses which may be classed as superior or excellent.

**Question (Education 536N).** What are the chief weaknesses in mechanics evidenced in your pupils' written work?

**Education answer 6.** My students, a 10-2 English group, have shown a great weakness in sentence structure. With the exception of one or two students, these boys and girls seem to have difficulty in building a sentence. Usually, this weakness shows in the run-on sentence. I recall one paper, written by a rather bright girl, which contained only two sentences. The thought behind the paper was good, but the effectiveness of the final paper was marred by many "and"s and "but"s, which were used to connect the ideas. Also, along this same line, these students write many incomplete sentences; that is, they write a phrase and punctuate it as if it were a complete sentence.

These boys and girls also have shown a weakness in the matter of paragraphing. For instance, on a written exercise which may find the student discussing at length a number of varied ideas, all these ideas will be lumped together into one paragraph. Most of the papers I received during the first two or three weeks consisted of these paragraphs. They seem to have no conception of the idea that a paragraph develops a single topic.

Capitalization gives several of my students some trouble. The tendency seems to be to overcapitalize. Some of my students capitalize almost every word of a sentence. The extreme overcapitalization comes from one or two of my poorest students, but the weakness is more or less class-wide. As I read papers, it seems to me that students sometimes use capital letters for words they wish to emphasize.
Punctuation is one of the students' weaknesses. Actually, they use very little punctuation; so the mistakes are almost errors of omission. They do not experiment with the less common marks of punctuation in their writing—although they will use them correctly in a given exercise on a certain mark of punctuation.

Errors in usage are frequent and usually involve the irregular verbs, which they frequently use incorrectly. The errors seem to come from a desire to use an auxiliary verb with the past tense, and not use one with the past participle. Pronouns and their antecedents also cause some confusion, particularly the indefinite pronouns.

The case of pronouns, particularly the possessive case, gives these students difficulty in their writing.

These students seem to have difficulty when writing a paper, in finding some way to introduce their topic. Usually, they plunge right into the middle of the essay, with no introduction of any kind.

The organization of the first set of papers I received was very poor. The boys and girls were to write a description of an unusual person, and most of the descriptions were so brief that no ideas were developed at all.

This trouble, I believe, stems from giving little thought to the written work. The work—no matter how much time they have to prepare it—always seems to be done in a hurry without too much care.

It will be seen that this response has its weaknesses. The absence of adequate transition, first of all, makes the discussion seem somewhat disjointed. Then, too, the use of the is of identity and the is of classification (lines 37 and 45) results in finality; but the student has used qualifying phrases in adjacent phrases or sentences.

The respondent has, however, made a consistent effort to use
low-order abstractions along with high-level ones: Examples and
details are found in lines 7-12, 18-24, 29-33, 38-40, and 47-52.
Furthermore, in his efforts to enumerate and to explain, he has
kept on the descriptive level; with the possible exception of the
last paragraph, he has avoided the use of emotive language.

Question (Education 669). Choose any three
of the following types of literature:
biography, travel and history, poetry,
theses and miscellaneous prose, drama,
fiction. For each type selected, list the
author and title of any four books suitable
for high-school students, and describe in
a paragraph the nature and quality of each
book.

Education answer 20. Blackmore, Lorna Doone.
Lorna Doone is a historical novel, set in the
late seventeenth century, about the Doones--
"all forty thieves"--in Doone Valley in
Devonshire; Lorna Doone, the captive and the
pride of the group; and the great John Ridd,
noted for his strength. Eventually, all ends
happily: The villain, Carver Doone, is killed,
and Lorna and John are married. The story
gives an impression of spaciousness, with the
broad Exmoor fields, and, in the background,
the grim Lord Chief Justice Jeffreys
crushing the Monmouth Rebellion. The hero,
John Ridd, with his gentleness and strength,
domains the book. Because the novel has
considerable action and excitement--such as
the attack on the Doones--it would probably
appeal to most high-school students. I
believe that girls would enjoy reading the
novel as much as boys would.

Here, the student has written, for the most part, objectively,
an analysis of the type and of the quality of this novel. The
strength of the response lies largely in the use of specifics--
names, places, events, as in lines 3-7 and 15-17--to clarify and
so substantiate. The response as a whole shows careful analysis and organization. Moreover, without the use of emotive language, he has supplied evidence for his belief that *Lorna Doone* will appeal to most high-school students.

**Question (Education 670).** On the basis of the class discussions and lectures and your reading, treat the following topic in such a way as briefly and concretely to indicate (a) what you conceive to be sound viewpoints and (b) your reasons for the position you have taken:

Having clearly in mind what literature is, the intellectual, social, emotional, and ethical outcomes the reading and discussion of books might well attain.

**Education answer 36.** Reading and discussion of books can attain increased ability of students to understand and appreciate good literature—including (1) ability to read for central ideas, (2) understanding and insight into people involved, (3) understanding of the purpose of the author and his skill in communicating, (4) familiarity with many, varied, and increasingly better types of literature. These are intellectual outcomes which I believe we can attain if teachers include as method (1) formulating a summary of central ideas, (2) use of thought-provocative discussion topics which emphasize insight—interpretation instead of facts, (3) discussion with the class of the author's purpose—pointing out effective methods of communicating, and encouraging pupils to do so in papers, and (4) a flexible, varied program which meets the interests of students and allows development and individual reading.

Literature can help pupils attain the social outcome of understanding the motives behind people's actions and can encourage knowledge of our own culture's ideals and traditions and those of other countries, if we include in our selection pieces which emphasize or provide opportunities for
discovery of these motives, ideals, and 30
traditions, and then emphasize these in our 31
discussions and guidance.

An emotional outcome we can attain is 32
increased sensitivity to feelings and problems 33
of others and ourselves. Teachers bring these 34
out and make them personal by contrasting 35
and comparing with our own and others'
experience.

Ethically, reading of books can help 36
pupils to formulate for themselves individual 37
standards of conduct to guide their lives by 38
if teachers bring out in the reading others'
standards of conduct and help pupils to apply 39
these to their own everyday experience.

Since literature is the written portrayal 40
and interpretation of life, teachers, by 41
emphasizing the different phases of life each 42
work shows, can, by proper methods, help 43
pupils to use their insights for the 
intellectual, social, emotional, and ethical 44
concerns of their lives.

The reader of this response will note that the student
might well have included brief examples and details to clarify such
statements as those in lines 33-38 and 39-44.

On the other hand, the respondent has maintained objectivity,
and has used a multi-valued approach to the problem under
consideration. The clear organization, moreover, shows his grasp
of major ideas, and his ability to relate them and to draw
conclusions from them. This answer is offered as an example of a
direct, concise discussion.

Question (Education 671). The following item
is to be treated briefly but pointedly:

Reply to this statement: "I can't
be bothered with pupils' English,
my business is to teach history."

Education answer 58. There is no doubt in my 1
mind that this teacher's statement represents 2
the feeling of many teachers. However, it should be, I feel, the job of all teachers to teach English, regardless of the other subject matter being taught. In all classes, the students are constantly employing English, their native tongue, and if they are to employ it correctly, correct habits of usage must be taught continuously. English is not just a course that is taught one period a day, but a course that should be taught every hour of the day. This teacher of history should be responsible for seeing that the students use correct English in their oral and written work, and he should work closely with the English teacher, informing him of persistent errors. English instruction should be the business of all teachers, not just the English teacher.

This answer, it appears, has two weaknesses: First, it is somewhat repetitious, as in lines 4-5 and 18-20. Second, the use of detail seems to be uneven.

The respondent, however, appears to understand the need for the use of lower as well as higher levels of abstraction, and has made an effort, as in lines 6-10, to adduce evidence for his statements. Second, he has remained objective in his discussion: He has tried to evaluate rather than persuade. In the majority of his statements, he has avoided finality and slanting.

Question (Education 677). Illustrate from subject matter:

Institutions tend to persist long after the purposes for which they were created have ceased to operate.

Education answer 125. In the case of government protection in the form of tariff for small businesses (so that they could get a start, for instance), the tariff has remained although the businesses, in many instances, have grown.
very large.
Another example concerns the subsidies paid to farmers during war time when there were rewards for increasing crops. The war shortage ceased. There is now a surplus, but the farmer, in many cases, still receives a premium for raising this surplus.

The student seems to have oversimplified slightly in "so that they could get started" (lines 3-4). One may feel, too, that an example would be helpful in the reference (lines 5-6) to the growth of the businesses.

It will be noted, however, that the student has maintained objectivity, and has taken pains, through the use of such expressions as "in many instances" (line 5) and "in many cases" (line 11) to qualify his statements. Furthermore, the two illustrations—especially the second—seem carefully chosen and illuminating. The use of brief specifics, as indicated would have helped to make this response as admirable in exactness of communication as in implicit grasp and insight.

Question (Education 678). What do you see as the major objectives of the social-studies program in the secondary school and why? Discuss these objectives with special reference to the courses which you would be teaching in our school.

Education answer 145. Is more pay the only evidence that indicates getting ahead? Aren't there promotions in terms of work, amounts of responsibility, etc? Can't a person work himself up to a better job in the same organization by doing a conscientious piece of work? How does the foreman or superintendent of a department get his job?

This student, through the use of rhetorical questions—
indeed, the response consists of four—shows a tendency to oversimplify.

However, he also shows considerable insight in analyzing and evaluating the oversimplification—chiefly accomplished through the use of connotative words—in the discussion topic. He achieves this analysis and evaluation by citing specific situations. The student is, perhaps, less objective than he might well have been, but he has written clearly and with conviction—and perhaps with the understandable intention of balancing the emotional content of the discussion topic.

Question (Education 678). What do you see as the major objectives of the social-studies program in the secondary school and why? Discuss these objectives with special reference to the courses which you would be teaching in our school.

Education answer 160. To me, the social-studies program in the secondary school should be aimed at giving the student a better understanding of the world he lives in and of his relation to it. If we can help the pupil—through the aid of history, economics, sociology, etc.—to see the causes of man's problems and how he has resolved the problems in the past or attempted to adjust to them, we may give him a frame of reference to codify more clearly the problems he as an individual and citizen will meet in present-day society. If we can stimulate the student to think and analyze his ideas and beliefs when they are brought into conflict with opposing values (a problem situation), he will be more prepared to live as an individual in the world, to think through the problems he encounters, and to solve them on a basis of rational testing rather than an emotional approach.

In connection with world history, I believe it is one of the richest fields for
the social-studies teacher to operate. My objective would be to help the student better to understand the beliefs, opinions and ideas of the society in which he lives and help him become more aware of the processes that have formed his own personal opinions and judgments. In studying man's religions, political, social, and economic problems throughout history, the student may become aware of the role of conflicting values, and see the influences that history brings to bear on the problems of his own world. It seems to me that world history offers an excellent opportunity for the student to see the role of philosophy, music, art, and science in man's life and how they have at times played a major and minor role in his cultural growth.

In the P. O. D. course, the student may be given the opportunity to directly inform himself about the problems of current interest and importance to him. The instructor may here attempt to bring the pupils into direct contact with democracy. As citizens they will share the responsibility of solving its problems. Through P. O. D. the students may find the problems of democracy and attempt to solve them by means of testing the knowledge they bring to bear on the problem in terms of its adequacy as a solution.

One perceives two weaknesses in this response: the maintenance of a fairly high level of abstraction, and a tendency to wordiness.

In spite of these weaknesses, however, the answer has considerable merit. First, the student has made a consistent and largely successful effort to remain objective. He has also avoided finality through the use of two-valued orientation and/or the use of forms of to be. Second, in his presentation, he shows a sense of the relationship of ideas, and has, on the whole, stated his position in an orderly fashion.
The foregoing "good" responses, as the present writer has indicated, exhibit weaknesses. These deficiencies, however, occur less frequently and, therefore, impair communication less than in the responses considered earlier in the chapter.

Moreover, it may be noted here that, in the opinion of the present writer, the chance selection of responses in the area of education seems inexplicably to have furnished fewer decidedly defective answers than has previously been the case.

* * *

In the detailed analysis in the first portion of the chapter, certain errors and weaknesses stand high: dead-level abstraction; high-level abstraction, with connotation; word-magic, with connotation; two-valued orientation, with oversimplification and connotation; two-valued orientation, with high-level abstraction and connotation; and connotation, with high-level abstraction and generalization. The student writers of the last group of responses have tried, it will be noted, to be specific and definite; to use a multi-valued approach in the analysis and evaluation of problems; and to write clear, accurate reports rather than judgments based largely on emotion and belief in the magic of words. They have sought to record rather than to persuade.

Responses in professional education have been analyzed in some detail, the findings summarized, and examples of superior or excellent answers offered. Next will follow recommendations, based on the findings, for use in the teaching of courses in professional education.
As in Chapters V and VI, the proposals concern procedures within the six classifications which serve as the basis for the analyses. Moreover, comments and suggestions which apply to the social studies and to English, as well as to professional education, will be found at the beginning of Chapter VIII.

First, the responses analyzed under the heading Abstraction may be considered.

**ABSTRACTION**

These responses are grouped as follows: (a) dead-level abstraction (noted in responses at all course levels); (b) high-level abstraction, with connotation (shown in answers in all the courses); (c) high-level abstraction, with looseness in thought (appearing in the writing of students in the Education 670-671 and 677-678 groups).

It is believed that the following recommendations may be helpful:

**Dead-level abstraction.** As the reader will recall, the difficulties in these responses arise not so much from the misunderstanding and misuse of technical terms as from the undiscriminating employment of such high-level abstractions as "pleasure," "freedom," and "education." Therefore, instruction and practice in definition of such terms as these—especially definition by means of examples and details and of operational definition—may be undertaken.

Second, the study and discussion of such a response as the one quoted below is recommended. The class may consider (a) examples
which might profitably be used (the growth of the plantation system, the Reconstruction period, and aspects of integration in the public schools); (b) the effects of repetition without explanation ("social arrangement").

**Question (Education 677).** Illustrate from the subject matter:

Changes in social arrangements
generally leave some people with more freedom and some people with less freedom than they had before.

**Education answer 97.** A Negro in the South is under a social arrangement which tends to limit his freedom; Negroes in the North, due to social arrangement, have a great deal more freedom. This has nothing to do with the law, only with the social way of life in a given area.

It is also suggested that, using similar, suitable subjects, students imitate for concreteness such passages as the following:

If in a lyric the idea is not quite the most significant phase, it is at least the hub without which the spokes have neither meaning, use, nor value. The idea is not all of the poem, in other words, but it is that phase which gives significance to all the rest. A lyric without an idea is only a verse exercise; it is not a poem. (Some of Poe and more of Swinburne fall into this category.) Often the idea in the lyric is in the form of an illustration, a short narrative, an episode. In these cases, however, story is of importance secondary to theme. The poet wants us to get the meaning of the story rather than merely to note the details of the incident. The story here is a means, not an end. This, moreover, is just as true of the romantic lyricists as it is of their predecessors. "Lucy Gray" tells a story to illustrate an idea. So do "The Soldier's Dream," "The Recollection," "Rosabelle," "The Mermaid Tavern," "Stanzas Written in Dejection near Naples," "After Blenheim," and "La Belle Dame Sans Merci," to mention only a few well-known examples. More
often the poet merely states his idea, however, either in his title, the first few lines, the last lines, or by implication throughout his poem. The remainder of the poem is devoted to illustrating the theme, explaining it, applying it, observing its significance, or in playing happily and beautifully with it, as Wordsworth does in "To the Daisy" and "To the Cuckoo," as Shelley does in "To a Skylark," or as Milton does in "L'Allegro."  

Biography can, on the whole, be made more historical by making it more biographical, by grouping men about events rather than events about men, and by studying men first of all as men. Take the American Revolution. Surely not even George Washington himself is a sufficiently embracing center for making this movement intelligible. Nor is there any other hero of the revolutionary period who sums up in himself the characteristics of his age sufficiently to make his life the life of the times. There were many leaders and many different points of view. What were the determining views? Who were the advocates of them? What were the chief events in the struggle? Who were the men associated with them? There were Otis, John and Samuel Adams, Hancock, Franklin, Hamilton, Patrick Henry, Jefferson, Washington, Pitt, Grenville, Lord North, and George III. What manner of men were they? What kind of homes did they come from? What educational advantages had they enjoyed? What was their social position? What were their personal characteristics? What was their occupation? Were they successful in private life? Were they good neighbors? Were they seekers after public office? Did they hold public positions? Who were their friends? Who were their enemies? What were their personal controversies and grievances? Up to this

---

point the aim is merely to know the men as men, to think of them much as we think of our personal acquaintances. When now we turn to the principles and acts of the Revolution and meet our acquaintances, some on one side and some on the other, the whole movement is humanized for us. We see in the conflict between England and the colonies opposing principles, but we see also opposing personal tastes, interests, ambitions, and hopes. We see the cost to some and the gain to others, among those who took sides.  

High-level abstraction, with connotation. First, a review of the nature and use of the descriptive and inferential levels is suggested. Such a review would include discussion—with examples—of the appropriate, effective use of emotive language, and would be accompanied by analysis of such a response as that quoted below. Attention may well be drawn to the vagueness and high emotional content of such expressions as "to provide the maximum for all" and "the desire to maintain rights."

Question (Education 677). Illustrate from the subject matter:  
Changes in social arrangements generally leave some people with more freedom and some people with less freedom than they had before.

Education answer 140. If we look at unions more closely, we can see that they are a form of organized body, which, as such, must in some ways be uniform. The system must be set up in such a manner as to

---

provide the maximum for all. Unions grew out of the desire to maintain rights for workers of various kinds.

The review and analysis suggested above may be followed by revision of responses. The instructor may wish to stress (a) the attainment of clear, effective organization of materials (including, perhaps, practice in outlining and in appraisal of suggested revisions); (b) the maintenance of objectivity.

High-level abstraction, with looseness in thought. The writers of these answers have difficulty with a problem involving (a) inadequate comprehension of the significance of major terms, (b) failure to separate the inferential and the descriptive levels, (c) unsystematic analysis, and (d) unclear presentation of ideas. (It will be observed that students in courses in economics, history, sociology, and English have trouble with the same problem.) First, instruction and practice in the analysis and organization of materials is recommended. The instructor may wish to include the writing of outlines; review of the ways in which clear, smooth transition may be attained; and recapitulation of the principles of parallel structure. He may also wish to emphasize logical sequence of ideas, and clear indication to the reader of the planning and the logic behind the words.

Such training and review may be accompanied by exercises in developing paragraphs and groups of connected paragraphs by the methods listed above and illustrated below.
a. Comparison and contrast

As I have said, the presentation of material ought to be economical and skillful. A fruit-packer prides herself upon the skill and rapidity with which she can sort and pack apples. Any intelligent factory makes economy, speed, efficiency, its watchwords. If English teaching were one half as intelligent as industry, English teachers would pride themselves upon their specific skill. You would hear one say: "I spend one forty-minute period on participles and gerunds. After that the class knows the difference between them," or "Miss Jones can teach the principles of adjective and adverb clauses in thirty minutes so that they are as clear to a class as one-word modifiers and as immediately recognized." Why do we not hear such comments? Because we clutter our own minds and our pupils' minds with unnecessary material. Because we are not content to teach functional grammar. Because we are not yet able to recognize it as the best way of implanting the habit of writing decent sentences. Because we have a lazy man's attitude toward inventing what, for us, is the best and easiest inclined plane upon which to slide information, unobstructed, into the minds of average pupils.

b. Cause and effect

To teach pupils what to think or to teach them how to think are not the only alternatives suggested in social education. Those who wish to build civic loyalty and to control public opinion not infrequently choose a very different program. They pin their faith to emotional conditioning, to blind habituation, or to the use of slogans, stereotypes, symbols, and taboos. Merriam, reviewing the methods of civic

instruction used in the principal western nations, says, "Nationalistic education is often on the ceremonial level, and prefers the flights of jingoism and self-glorification, as if it feared the more sober examination of the alleged advantage or traits of the particular state or area or group." The power of symbols and stereotypes is attested by the success of their use in all lands--by the statesman, by the reformer, by the church, and by the press. And while it may be true, as Macaulay said, that

"... Wise men... have always been inclined to look with great suspicion on the angels and daemons of the multitude...", these same wise men, when they have wished to control public opinion, have not hesitated to avail themselves of such potent devices. 5

Finally, in the analysis and discussion of such a response as the one quoted below, the instructor may wish to consider (a) the meaning and the use of the descriptive and inferential levels of communication; (b) possible interpretations of such high-level abstractions as "effectiveness" in their contexts; and (c) the use of examples and details and of operational definitions to clarify such high-level abstractions as "hypothetical."

**Question (Education 671).** On the basis of the class discussions and lectures and your reading, treat the following topic in such a way as briefly and concretely to indicate (a) what you conceive to be sound viewpoints, and (b) your reasons for the position you have taken:

How to determine what materials to include in an intensive remedial unit in any given fundamental of language usage.

---

Education answer 91. The materials which should be included in an intensive remedial unit in any given fundamental of language usage should be the material for which pupils make the most frequent and persistent errors. The teacher can also determine what materials should be used by asking what are some frequent errors, and by diagnostic tests. Definite methods should be established for measuring a teacher's effectiveness. Her judgment should not be hypothetical.

SYMBOLS

The answers included under the heading Symbols are grouped as follows: (a) word-magic, with connotation; (b) word-magic, with connotation and two-valued orientation; (c) word-magic, with high-level abstraction and looseness in thought. (Students in the 670-671 and 677-678 classes appear to have more difficulty here than do members of the 536N and 669 groups.)

The following proposals are submitted:

Word-magic, with connotation. First, some discussion of the uses of repetition may be helpful—specifically (a) repetition involving parallel structure—of words or groups of words with clarification and emphasis as ends in view; (b) repetition resulting from belief in the power of words to evoke the same image in the mind of the reader as in that of the writer, and to influence events. Such a passage as the following may be used, with comment on the repetition of "methods" and on the parallel structure in the examples ("methods that are as wasteful . . . ," "methods that are downright subversive of societal living").
Few persons today are so naive as to suppose that all values are "good" values, or that all methods of securing adherence to values are "good." By no means. Everyone can cite methods of securing adherence that are as wasteful of energy as it would be to call out the army to catch a mouse; methods that are downright subversive of societal living, such as unscrupulous, deceitful propaganda; methods that secure conformity at the cost of later disillusionment, as is true of so many of the methods used today to "train" children. Any consideration of "economy of devices" should range not only over those that should be used but also over those that should not be used.6

Another suggested procedure is the analysis of such a response as that quoted below. The instructor, using the inductive method, as well as Socratic questioning, may consider with the class the meaning of such terms as "parrot" and "real learning" in the given contexts. He may also wish to call attention to the high emotional content of these words, and to emphasize the need here for the maintenance of objectivity. Then he may ask the students for suggestions for qualifying words and phrases for reserve and precision.

Question (Education 677). Illustrate from the subject matter:

Institutions tend to persist long after the purpose for which they were created have ceased to operate.

Education answer 130. Such an institution would be the school in which at first they

6Marshall, op. cit., p. 163.
were established to give the students subject matter or factual information, such as "Columbus discovered America in 1492," etc. This made parrots out of the students as they prepared for the next day's lessons either by lectures or by the teacher or reading assignments. There was no real learning taking place. Today we are striving and achieving to make people think objectively and reflectively. This is by raising doubts, causing him to be anxious to learn, think, and solve—not just all parrot information.

Word-magic, with connotation and two-valued orientation.

The inductive method may be used in analyzing the use of such phrases as "sanctity of the past" and "unwarranted cut-throat competition." Consideration of the meaning of the phrases may be followed by work with organization of ideas, including elements of outlining and the use of qualification as a means of attaining increased accuracy, as well as of holding to multi-valued orientation.

Some discussion of the nature and purpose of antithesis—and of the dangers in its use—may also be undertaken. The instructor may wish, for example, to point out that thought is occasionally distorted in order to achieve impressive antithesis—and that, under such circumstances, errors in interpretation may result. He may wish to emphasize the idea that antitheses based on evocative words should not be substituted for careful explanation and the submission of valid evidence.

Word-magic, with high-level abstraction and looseness in thought. It is suggested that several responses be analyzed to implicit acceptance of word-magic. In discussing the response
quoted below, the instructor may wish to draw attention to (a) the apparent belief that the use of such terms as "equal freedoms," "high education and ambitions," and "more freedom" will somehow communicate the ideas which the writer has in mind; (b) the connection between the vague grasp of such concepts—as well as of "cherished values"—and the failure to make clear the relationship between considerable education, unspecified ambitions, and "freedoms." Emphasis may also be placed on consideration of various possible interpretations of a given symbol and on definition of symbols by means of examples and details and by operational definitions.

Question (Education 677). Illustrate from subject matter:

Even within the thinking of a single individual, two or more cherished values are often thrown into conflict.

Education answer 149. I might feel that, as Lincoln said, "All men are created equal" and deserve equal freedoms. Yet I still might uphold that those people with high education and ambitions be the ones that earn more money and have more freedoms.

Revision of responses may follow the analysis and discussion suggested above. Such revision may involve (a) consideration of the adequacy of the evidence adduced (the amount, the sources, the adequacy of the sampling, and the relevance); (b) the reserve shown in the presentation of evidence; (c) clear, orderly presentation of ideas; and (d) the use of dates and of index numbers.
The answers included under the above heading contain shifts in meaning of key terms, with high-level abstraction (shown chiefly in the work of students in the 669 group).

The following suggestions are offered:

Shifts in meaning of key terms, with high-level abstraction.

First, the meaning of such terms as "romantic" may be ascertained in various contexts. The following sentences may serve as an example:

1. The student was interested in reading about romantic adventure.
2. The long-haired dreamer had romantic ideas.
3. Romantic movements in literature may be said to be perennial.
4. Shelley had many romantic ideas.
5. The classical is opposed to the romantic.

The teacher may then ask the students to ascertain the meaning of "romantic" in the response quoted below. Class discussion should serve to show how the meaning of the term shifts from "pertaining to the world of marvellous achievements" to "fanciful" to "sentimental."

Question (Education 669). Choose any three of the following types of literature: biography, travel and history, poetry, essays and miscellaneous prose, drama, fiction. For each type selected, list the author and title of any four books suitable for high-school students, and describe in a paragraph the nature and quality of each book.
Education answer 21. Brink, *Lad with a Whistle.* This is the charming story of a young man who mysteriously becomes the guardian of two wealthy orphans. It is a romantic story: In the end of the story, the children's father returns to them, and the greedy servants of the house are romantically discovered by Rob, the lad with a whistle. The story is simple and romantic, but it would also be enjoyed by junior high school students who like mystery, romance, and suspense. Also, the fact that goodness wins out over badness makes the book more appropriate for youngsters.

In the analysis of such a response as that quoted below, the members of the class may be asked to examine contexts, to see what the writer means by the use of such a term as "meaning." The students will observe that while in the first part of the second sentence "meanings" seems to refer to the idea that differences in intellectual and experiential backgrounds will account for the amount of perception and insight into the various ideas in the volume, near the end of the sentence "meaning" seems to denote "signification" or "import," "that which is intended to be expressed or indicated." Attention should be drawn to the interaction between shifts in meaning of a key term, such as "meaning," and the maintenance of a high level of abstraction (the student does not mention any of the "meanings" or explain why the students cannot comprehend them).

Question (Education 669). Choose any three of the following types of literature: biography, travel and history, poetry, essays and miscellaneous prose, drama, fiction. For each type selected, list the author and title of any four books suitable for high-school students, and describe in
a paragraph the nature and quality of each book.

Education answer 16. Whitman, Leaves of Grass. This book contains mostly poems, but there are also a few essays in it. I do not think that junior high school students can get the meanings the author has put into his poems and essays, but I am sure that no literature class on the senior high school level would omit some of Whitman's poems and essays, for they hold a lot of meaning and are very enjoyable reading.

FORMS OF TO BE

The responses considered under the above heading contain, as the reader will recall, (a) forms of to be, with high-level abstraction; (b) forms of to be, with two-valued orientation. In both of these groups, the work of students at the upper-course levels is represented.

Some procedures which may be helpful are listed below.

Forms of to be, with high-level abstraction. The substitution of other words for forms of to be in the following sentences may be used in an inductive explanation of the principle of qualified equivalence, as opposed to final identification or classification. The need for careful, accurate qualification should be stressed.

1. Developmental tasks are necessary learnings.
2. Effective participation in our democratic society is essential.
3. Historical knowledge is practical knowledge.
4. A critical attitude toward historical development is desirable.
5. A thorough knowledge of formal grammar is practical.

6. The idea that art is to be appreciated without special training is a popular fallacy.

7. Imagination is the ability to receive the ideal as the true.

8. The classics are free from sentimentality.

9. Civilization is the acceptance of conditions.

10. Good writing is wholesome and sane.

In the second place, the instructor, after an explanation of the connection between confusion of the levels of abstraction and the finality that frequently accompanies the unskillful use of forms of to be, may ask the members of the class to revise a number of sentences—all or most of which may be taken from the work of students—containing undiscriminating use of the is of identity and the is of classification. In the revision, emphasis may be placed on the need for the employment of lower levels of abstraction, chiefly through the use of examples and details and of operational definitions. The following sentences may serve as examples:

1. A basis for democracy is academic freedom.

2. Another outcome is the habit of reading, which is certainly desirable since reading is an enjoyable pastime of adults as well as of children.

3. Literature, which is life, teaches social conduct.

4. The story is true to life.

5. Short stories are almost "custom made" for the high-school literature class.
Moreover, analysis of passages from the work of well-known, competent writers on professional education may serve to show students how ideas can be stated with clarity, objectivity, and reserve. The following passage may serve as an example:

Therefore teaching is inseparable from learning. Every good teacher will learn more about his subject every year—every month, every week, if possible. If a girl chooses the career of teaching French in school, she should not hope to commit the prescribed texts and grammars to memory and then turn her mind to other things. She should dedicate part of her life to the French language, to the superb literature of France, to French art and history and civilization. To become a good teacher of French, she will build up a growing library of her own French books, spending one year (for instance) reading Balzac, the next year reading Proust, the next with Moliere, and the next with Giradoux, Cocteau, Romaines, and the other modern playwrights. She will visit France, if and when she can save up enough money to do so—which will be fearfully difficult with salaries at their present low level. She may take summer courses in French at a university. Certainly she will see every available French film, and learn to enjoy Raimu's rich Marseills accent, to guffaw with Fernandel. For it will not be all serious work and planned self-improvement. It will be living, and therefore it will contain enjoyments, and even frivolities, like the latest records by Lucienne Boyer and Charles Trenet. But it will be learning at the same time, and it will make better teaching.  

Forms of to be, with two-valued orientation. In the first place, the members of the class may be to expand statements

compressed by means of forms of to be. The instructor may wish to stress (a) comprehension of the tentativeness of what is termed "knowledge," (b) maintenance of balance and restraint in the presentation of ideas.

It may also be advantageous to undertake the analysis of such a passage as the following for balanced setting forth of ideas. During the discussion, the students should be made aware of how the author defines "realism" by means of examples, and how both favorable and unfavorable aspects of realism (the penetration and authenticity, as well as the sadness and distortion often found in realistic works) are presented. Attention should be called, too, to the use, for explanation and support, of quotations from the work of other writers, such as the following:

In many ways realism is the opposite of romanticism. As the term realism itself implies, it is based upon the real, the actual. The first and sometimes the only demand it makes is, "Is this person, is this event, true to life?" Realism deals with the here and the now. It describes the usual everyday happenings and the ordinary everyday people of common everyday life. It does not seek to entertain by telling a pleasant story, to thrill by telling an exciting story, or to startle by telling a weird story. It strives merely to paint men and women and things as they are. Its chief interest is not plot, but the careful, accurate delineation of character.

There is no glamour, no glitter in realism. Its chief aim is to be true to life, even if the truth is disagreeable. At its worst realism is sad, cynical, distorted, and depressing. In the vigorous words of one critic: "The great province of the novel—to illuminate experience—and to inspire by the beauty of life nobly endured and nobly portrayed is a barren country
over which the weeds are sending a new growth and around which rotting fences mark off sterile soil. The modern novel, and I speak now in general terms, has reiterated the same barren facts of sex life and drab realities of average living until it has lost its audience through its own dullness. A tale which used to open magic casements now lets rusted screen doors flap and admit a few sickly flies."

This is the dark side of the picture. On the other hand, at its best, realism is penetrating, suggestive, authentic, and creative. Walt Whitman forcefully stated the case for realism in these words: "I will not have in my writings any elegance or effect or originality to hang in the way between me and the rest like curtains. I will have nothing to hang in the way, not the richest curtains. What I tell I tell for precisely what it is. Let who may exalt or startle or fascinate or soothe, I will have purposes as health or heat or snow has and be as regardless of observation. You shall stand by my side and look in the mirror with me."¹

**TWO-VALUED ORIENTATION**

In the responses precedently analyzed under the above heading, one finds (a) two-valued orientation, with oversimplification and connotation (shown chiefly in the work of students in the 670-671 and 677-678 groups); (b) two-valued orientation, with high-level abstraction and connotation (with students in the 677-678 classes appearing to have more difficulty here than do the others).

The following proposals are offered:

**Two-valued orientation, with oversimplification and**

connotation. The instructor may wish to conduct a brief review of the consequences of oversimplification, with emphasis on the disregard of gradation and of the effects of change. Through a discussion of student-written answers, the teacher may demonstrate the consequences of combining forced, unqualified opposition of ideas, and highly connotative terms.

The class may also undertake the discussion of a superior or excellent response, such as the one quoted below. This discussion should emphasize such items as (a) the use of multi-valued orientation, as in the last paragraph of the answer; (b) maintenance of objectivity, as in the final sentence of the first paragraph; (c) grasp of major ideas, as shown in the clear organization of the answer.

Question (Education 670). On the basis of the class discussions and lectures and your reading, treat the following topic in such a way as briefly and concretely to indicate (a) what you conceive to be sound viewpoints and (b) your reasons for the position you have taken:

Having clearly in mind what literature is, the intellectual, social, emotional and ethical outcomes the reading and discussion of books might well attain.

Education answer 36. Reading and discussion of books can attain increased ability of students to understand and appreciate good literature—including (1) ability to read for central ideas, (2) understanding and insight into people involved, (3) understanding of the purpose of the author and his skill in communicating, (4) familiarity with many, varied, and increasingly better types of literature. These are intellectual outcomes which I believe we can attain if
teachers include as method (1) discovering a summary of central ideas, (2) use of thought-provocative discussion topics which emphasize insight—interpretation instead of facts, (3) discussion with the class of the author's purpose—pointing out effective methods of communicating, and encouraging pupils to do so in papers, and (4) a flexible, varied program which meets the interests of students and allows development and individual reading.

Literature can help pupils attain the social outcome of understanding the motives behind people's actions and can encourage knowledge of our own culture's ideals and traditions and those of other countries, if we include in our selection pieces which emphasize or provide opportunities for discovery of these motives, ideals, and traditions, and then emphasize these in our discussions and guidance.

An emotional outcome we can attain is increased sensitivity to feelings and problems of others and ourselves. Teachers bring these out and make them personal by contrasting and comparing with our own and others' experience.

Ethically, reading of books can help pupils to formulate for themselves individual standards of conduct to guide their lives by if teachers bring out in the reading others' standards of conduct and help pupils to apply these to their own everyday experience.

Since literature is the written portrayal and interpretation of life, teachers, by emphasizing the different phases of life each work shows, can, by proper methods, help pupils to use their insights for the intellectual, social, emotional, and ethical concerns of their lives.

Two-valued orientation, with high-level abstraction and connotation. By means of the analysis and discussion of the following response, the students may be given a review of (a) signal reactions resulting from confusion of levels of abstraction ("letting
students have absolute control over what they want to study"; (b) the relationship between the use of highly connotative words under these circumstances and the formulation of unsupported judgments ("But it would at the same time take freedom away from the teachers by the fact that they would have little opportunity to help direct students in their learning").

Question (Education 677). Illustrate the following statement by citing situations in school:

Changes in social arrangements generally leave some people with more freedom and some people with less freedom than they had before.

Education answer 136. We have talked about our core program in letting students have absolute control over what they want to study. This would certainly give students more freedom, wouldn't it? But it would at the same time take freedom away from the teachers by the fact that they would have little opportunity to help direct students in their learning.

The following procedure in analyzing and writing may also be used. The members of the class may consider possible approaches to such a discussion topic as the one quoted below. The discussion and appraisal of the approaches suggested may be followed by the writing of responses, with emphasis on the use of general connotations—if connotative words must be used—and on objective, accurate statement of ideas.

Explain why the following statement is or is not true:

Quality in teaching comes only from training and experience.
CONNOTATION

The answers analyzed under the above heading contain (a) connotation, with high-order abstraction and generalization (shown, for the most part, in the answers of students in the 670-671 and 677-678 classes); (b) connotation, with forms of to be and two-valued orientation (with students in the 600-level courses having difficulty here).

The following suggestions may be useful to teachers working toward a solution of these problems:

Connotation, with high-order abstraction and generalization. In these answers, one finds implications and associations rather than objective analyses and supported judgments. It may be helpful, therefore, for the students to list the personal and the general connotations of such words as "desirable," "happy," "purpose and direction," "co-operativeness," and "responsibility" in the following (or a similar) context:

Question (Education 678). What do you see as the major objectives of the social-studies program in the secondary school? Why? Discuss these objectives with special reference to the courses which you would be teaching in your school.

Education answer 154. Through the teaching of social studies we can help establish desirable and happy personal and social relationships with age-mates and adults and develop a social pattern which will give purpose and direction to their (the students') lives.

This can only be achieved by promoting the following: reflective and creative thought; develop desirable social attitudes, work habits, and study skills; and develop a broad pattern
of co-operativeness and responsibility towards society as a whole.

In a course in P. O. D. where I would be dealing with students who are almost finished with school, there would be hundreds of chances of furthering the above. Life is a dynamic sort of thing that is ever changing and ever progressing; so it is for these kids that I want to help in their quest for "understanding" of society, and its implications upon them as individuals. It is the individual that makes an efficiently operating group, and I am interested in bettering the group through understanding of processes; thus I hope in the end to better the group.

Many of the connotative terms used in this group of answers are also high on the ladder of abstraction ("purpose and direction" and "a broad pattern of co-operativeness and responsibility towards society as a whole"). Because such terms serve as the basis for generalization, a review of the principles of valid generalization— including the size of the sample, the method of sampling, and the treatment of negative instances—may be helpful.

**Connotation, with forms of to be and two-valued orientation.**

Such a passage as the following may be used for practice in revision. The students may be asked to rewrite the passage, avoiding especially the use of such terms as "kind," "cultured," "cruel," and "petty," as well as the employment of the is of classification (shown in such passages as "In discussing segregation Southerners are not only of one opinion; they reach their opinions through mental grooves as well worn as those of a phonograph record").

It's all true what they say about Dixie—all of it. The people are kind and hospitable and generous and cultured; they are also
ignorant and cruel and grasping and petty. Swamps and shacks and kerosene lamps; brand-new factories and cloverleaf intersections; grinning Negroes and hard-mouthed whites; Negroes drunk on Saturday night and while men mocking them; the Klan, the shouting church, and Charleston's gentility; the ignorant red neck and the patrician paternalistic planter—Dixie is almost a caricature of itself. In discussing segregation Southerners are not only of one opinion; they reach their opinion through mental grooves as well worn as those of a phonograph record. They accuse the North of treating the Negroes worse; declare their own love for Negroes; recall the horrors of Negro rule during Reconstruction; denounce desegregation as a Communist plot and unconstitutional invasion of states' rights; and in the end without a single exception they come around to sex; school desegregation leads to close association, and close association leads to miscegenation, amalgamation, mongrelization. An NAACP leader in Georgia said, "I guess I'd resist too if everything I'd built my life on was threatened." Talking to Southerners, one feels that both whites and Negroes have hold on a problem and can't let go. Both are bound together by the inextricable web of apartness of the races; neither knows how to escape; and the ripping done by the Court decision has merely set them to repairing the web, not escaping.9

The analysis of such a response as the one quoted below may also be considered. Students may be asked to examine the passage for the use of such highly connotative words as "straightforward" and "adequately," and for the use of the is of identity ("It likewise is a very thought-provoking play"). They may also be

asked to suggest items of evidence that might advantageously have been included.

**Question (Education 669).** Choose any three of the following types of literature: biography, travel and history, poetry, essays and miscellaneous prose, drama, fiction. For each type selected, list the author and title of any four books suitable for high-school students, and describe in a paragraph the nature and quality of each book.

**Education answer 22.** Galsworthy, *Loyalties.* This is a play of conflict, the conflict of loyalties. It touches, too, upon the problem of race prejudice. This play, too, is presented very straightforwardly. Mr. Galsworthy's treatment of the subject is good. He develops the theme quite adequately and arrives at a very logical conclusion. It likewise is a very thought-provoking play.

**METAPHOR**

The classifications under Metaphor include (a) distortion of meaning, resulting from the use of mixed metaphors, with high-level abstraction and forms of to be (with the work of students in the 600-level courses represented); (b) metaphor, with connotation (appearing, for the most part, in the answers of students in the 677-678 classes).

The following proposals are submitted for consideration:

**Distortion of meaning, resulting from the use of mixed metaphor, with high-level abstraction and forms of to be.** First, the members of the class may consider examples of the effective, appropriate use of metaphor in the following passage ("as a general marshals his troops for attack or defense," "like holding a ship
On the other hand, it is not enough not to be diverted. A deadly and fanatic consistency is not our goal. Concentration does not mean fixity, or a cramped arrest or paralysis of the flow of suggestion. It means variety and change of ideas combined into a single steady trend moving toward a unified conclusion. Thoughts are concentrated, not by being kept still and quiescent, but by being kept moving toward an object, as a general marshals his troops for attack or defense. Holding the mind to a subject is like holding a ship to its course; it implies constant change of position combined with unity of direction. Consistent and orderly thinking is precisely the achieving of such a change within a given subject matter. Consistency is no more the mere absence of contradiction that concentration is the mere absence of diversion—which exists in dull routine or in a person 'fast asleep.' All kinds of varied and incompatible suggestions may sprout and be followed in their growth, and yet thinking be consistent and orderly, provided each one of the suggestions is viewed in relation to the main topic and the main end to be filled.10

The students should be cautioned, however, concerning the use of metaphor in discussion intended to be objective and accurate; they may be reminded that metaphors—vivid as they often are—illustrate rather than prove. For instance, a student writing on the following question would be expected to be objective and accurate:

Choose any three of the following types of literature: biography, travel and history, poetry, essays and miscellaneous prose, drama, fiction. For each type selected, list the author and title of

any four books suitable for high-school students, and describe in a paragraph the nature and quality of each book.

Detailed analysis of responses may also be undertaken. (The answer quoted below may serve as an example.) The analysis should concern (a) the basis of the analogy suggested, as well as the meaning in the present context ("the cutting edge"); (b) the subordination of the metaphor to the major idea (it will be noted that in #159, the metaphor is emphasized); (c) the accuracy of the thinking behind the metaphor (the reader sees how communication is hampered by the combination of the somewhat confused ("cutting edge" with "democratic advance").

**Question** (Education 678). What do you believe to be the proper role of the social-studies teacher with reference to the teaching of controversial issues? State rather specifically how you would handle controversial issues in our community.

**Education answer 159.** I believe that controversial issues are the cutting edge of democratic advance. They are conceived by the democratic processes of orderly change. The teacher who does not realize this must be lacking.

**Metaphor, with connotation.** The instructor may ask his students to explain such metaphors as "looking outward to nature" and "thinking which is relational and which searches for cross bearings between areas" in the passage quoted below. The emphasis may be on the use of metaphor to illustrate rather than to prove, and on the effects of the combination of metaphor ("throw up his hands in despair") and highly connotative words ("sentimentalist," "mystic").
Effective thinking, while starting with logic, goes further so as to include certain broad mental skills. Thus an effective thinker is a man who can handle terms and concepts with skill and yet does not confuse words with things; he is empirical in the widest sense of the word, looking outward to nature. He is not satisfied merely with noting the facts, but his mind ever soars to implications. He knows when he knows and when he does not; he does not mistake opinion for knowledge. Furthermore, effective thinking includes the understanding of complex and fluid situations, in dealing with which logical methods are inadequate as mental tools. Of course thinking must never violate the laws of logic; but it may use techniques beyond those of exact mathematic reasoning. In the fields of the social studies and history, and in the problems of daily life, there are large areas where evidence is incomplete and may never be completed. Sometimes the evidence may be also untrustworthy; but, if the situation is practical, a decision must be made. The scientist has been habituated to deal with properties which can be abstracted from their total background and with variables which are few and well defined. Consequently, where the facts are unique and unpredictable, where the variables are numerous and their interactions too complicated for precise calculation, the scientist is apt to throw up his hands in the air and perhaps turn the situation over to the sentimentalist or the mystic. But surely he would be wrong in so doing; for the methods of logical thinking do not exhaust the resources of reason. In coping with complex and fluid situations we need thinking which is relational and which searches for cross bearings between areas; this is possible to reach an understanding of historical and social materials and of human relations, although not with the same degree of precision as in the case of simpler materials and of recurring events. As Aristotle says, "It is the mark of an
educated man to expect no more exactness
than the subject permits.\textsuperscript{11}

Analysis of metaphors found in political articles may also
be helpful. (The passage quoted below is illustrative.) In this
analysis, the students should be concerned with the validity of
the suggested analogy, the subordination of the metaphor, and the
purpose of the writer. Expansion of the metaphors and rearrangement
of materials may follow the discussion.

"Then you gathered left-handed," quoth
he. "But of course I understand your point
of view about education, which is that of
times past, when 'the struggle for life,'
as men used to phrase it (i.e., the struggle
for a slave's rations on one side, and for
a bouncing share of the slaveholders'
privilege on the other), pinched 'education'
for most people into a niggardly dole of not
very accurate information; something to be
swallowed by the beginner in the art of
living whether he liked it or not, and was
hungry for it or not; and which had been
chewed and digested over and over again by
people who didn't care about it in order to
serve it out to other people who didn't care
about it."\textsuperscript{12}

\textbf{SLANTING}

The answers analyzed under the above heading are grouped
as follows: (a) slanting, with connotation (shown in the work of

\textsuperscript{11}Report of the Harvard Committee. \textit{General Education in
a Free Society}. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1946,
pp. 66-77.

\textsuperscript{12}William Morris. \textit{News from Nowhere}. New York: Vanguard
Press, 1926, p. 80.
students in the 670-671 and 677-678 classes); (b) slanting, with high-level abstraction and with confusion in thought (with those in the 677-678 group appearing to have more difficulty here than do students in the other classes).

It is believed that the following recommendations may be helpful:

Slanting, with connotation. In the analysis and discussion of a slanted article from a magazine or newspaper, the teacher and class may consider (a) the inclusion—or the omission—of facts necessary for a balanced, supported discussion; (b) the use of such connotative words as (in the passage below) "obsession," "lazy," and "enthralled," and the effect of the use of these words on the inclusion of detail; (c) clarity of organization.

Whence our feverish search for the easy way; our obsession with the opiate dream? Is it that we have no faith except in the infallibility of machinery and so stand incredulous when the airplane falls? Has ours become a culture from the periphery of the eyelids outward, lacking inner content? Are we, despite our physical energy, an intellectually lazy people, satisfied to take shadow for substance, package for contents, and black or white for truth because we are too lethargic to search out the nuances where truth, ever elusive, lies? Has some malign enchantment unfitted us to face life as it is, so that its essence escapes us and we face eventual destruction from within or from without? Is the high point of our civilization reached when a radio announcer screams to a nation enthralled, "That's right. Mrs. Deffenbaugh!" while $20,000 worth of things, including a houseboat and a wall can-opener, drop into the lap of the lucky winner?13

---

In the answer quoted below, one finds slanting (shown in the last sentence, in which the student disregards a number of events, including Spain's acceptance of the terms of President McKinley's note of March 29, and the change in attitude shown in the President's message to Congress on April 16) combined with the use of highly connotative words ("look closely"). This response may be used for discussion of errors, as well as for an exercise in slanting the opposite way.

Question (Education 677). Illustrate from subject matter:
Even within the thinking of a single individual, two or more cherished values are often thrown into conflict.

Education answer 13. An example would be perhaps your belief that the United States has never committed any act which would be considered a detriment to peace. Now look closely at the Spanish-American War. Our two governments had an agreement practically made, but the majority of the people clamored for a fight.

Slanting, with high-level abstraction and with confusion in thought. The instructor may wish to comment on the place in reflective thought of (a) controlled, systematic analysis of a given problem; (b) formulation—based on observation—of a working hypothesis; (c) tests of the hypothesis. Such comments may be followed by a review of the descriptive and inferential levels of communication, with consideration of the interaction of slanting and the use of unqualified high-order abstractions.

Second, the writing and analysis of several acceptable
answers to the following question may be undertaken. In this procedure, the emphasis may be on clear, systematic organization of materials (perhaps involving review of elements of outlining); on proportion in the presentation of ideas; and on the maintenance of objectivity.

Illustrate the following statement by citing situations in school:
Changes in social arrangement generally leave some people with more freedom and some people with less freedom than they had before.

Chapters V, VI, and VII, student-written materials from classes in social studies, English, and professional education have been analyzed, the evaluations summarized, and recommendations (based on the findings) offered.

The final chapter of the study will contain a quantitative summary; a limited number of conclusions; and comments and suggestions for all three areas with which the investigation is concerned.
In this study, the writer has been concerned with (a) ascertaining the extent to which the written work of university students exhibits inaccurate and incomplete interpretation of language and (b) the nature of this inaccurate interpretation. After a discussion of the goals of higher education, he first has considered in some detail the following major aspects of semantics: abstraction, symbols, contexts, forms of "to be", two-valued orientation, and emotive language. He has then discussed the ways in which semantics may assist in promoting the objectives of higher education. Next, he has analyzed student-written answers on the basis of the aspects of semantics listed above. In the light of the findings, he has suggested ways in which a university may assist its students in more accurately interpreting language and thus more effectively communicating ideas.

It may be noted here that semantics is considered as a tool rather than as an end in itself, and that the various techniques and procedures submitted are formulated as recommendations. Moreover, cognizance has been taken of examination tension and of the limitations of time in examinations. In the detailed analysis of the responses, furthermore, examples are submitted of the kind of material needed for clarification and substantiation. The writer does not mean that all the material commented upon illustratively
should have been included in the students' answers.

It will be recalled, too, that a detailed statistical evaluation of a pattern of errors in proportionate series is not an objective of this study. The material represents, rather, a cross-section of the work of undergraduates in the designated areas. The problem is restricted to higher education, to the areas of social studies, English, and professional education, and to class papers written by students for these courses.

In this chapter, which concludes the study, will be included a quantitative summary, for over-all consideration of the detailed investigation preceding; a limited number of conclusions; specific proposals; general recommendations for the areas included in this study; and suggestions for further investigation.

We may now turn to the first part of the quantitative summary.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course level</th>
<th>Number of responses written</th>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
<th>Representative responses analyzed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Economics</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
<td>661</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>600</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>403</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>421</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In the following tabulation, the findings are summarized in the various groups under the six major headings: Abstraction, Symbols, Contexts, Forms of to be, Two-valued orientation, and Referential and emotive language. The figures indicate the number of responses inspected and accepted for grouping.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course Level</th>
<th>Number of responses written</th>
<th>Number of responses inspected</th>
<th>Representative responses analyzed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>422</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>423</td>
<td>390</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>537</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sociology</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>507</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>604</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>622</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
<td>270</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
<td>295</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>600</td>
<td>270</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>536N</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>669</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>670-671</td>
<td>265</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>677-678</td>
<td>459</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### ABSTRACTION

1. **Dead-level abstraction**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economics</th>
<th>History</th>
<th>Sociology</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(400) 18</td>
<td>(403) 3</td>
<td>(507) 6</td>
<td>(400) 9</td>
<td>(536M) 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(500) 4</td>
<td>(422) 6</td>
<td>(604) 2</td>
<td>(500) 11</td>
<td>(669) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(600) 5</td>
<td>(423) 6</td>
<td>(622) 6</td>
<td>(600) 6</td>
<td>(677-678) 6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| (537) 3   |

2. **Looseness of thought, with high-level abstraction**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economics</th>
<th>History</th>
<th>Sociology</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(400) 5</td>
<td>(403) 3</td>
<td>(507) 6</td>
<td>(400) 2</td>
<td>(670-671) 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(500) 2</td>
<td>(421) 2</td>
<td>(604) 2</td>
<td>(500) 5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(600) 1</td>
<td>(422) 2</td>
<td>(622) 2</td>
<td>(600) 1</td>
<td>(677-678) 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. **Lack of communication**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economics</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(400) 6</td>
<td>(500) 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(600) 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. **High-level abstraction, with some detail but with sweeping generalization**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>History</th>
<th>Sociology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(423) 6</td>
<td>(507) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(537) 2</td>
<td>(622) 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5. **High-level abstractions, with connotation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(500) 3</td>
<td>(536N) 2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(670-671) 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(677-678) 6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**SYMBOLS**

1. **Word-magic, with high-level abstraction**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Sociology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(400) 1</td>
<td>(507) 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(500) 1</td>
<td>(604) 2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. **Word-magic, with two-valued orientation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(403) 3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. **Word-magic, with oversimplification and looseness in thought**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(421) 2</td>
<td>(400) 2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(422) 2</td>
<td></td>
<td>(677-678) 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. **Word-magic, with high-level abstraction and two-valued orientation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(400) 2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5. Word-magic, with two-valued orientation, connotation, and metaphor

Economics

(400) 2

6. Word-magic, with connotation and metaphor

History

(403) 1
(422) 1

7. Word-magic, with connotation and two-valued orientation

Education

(670-671) 1
(677-678) 2

8. Word-magic, with high-level abstraction and connotation

English

(400) 1
(500) 3

CONTEXTS

1. Shifts in meaning of key terms, with high-level abstraction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>History</th>
<th>Sociology</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(403) 1</td>
<td>(507) 2</td>
<td>(400) 1</td>
<td>(669) 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(422) 1</td>
<td></td>
<td>(500) 3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(537) 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2. Shifts in meaning of key terms, high-level abstraction, slanting

Economics
(400) 5
(500) 1

3. Confused contexts, shifts in meaning, high-level abstraction, connotation

Economics
(400) 2
(500) 1

4. Shifts in meaning, with connotation and two-valued orientation

History
(421) 2
(422) 1

5. Confused contexts, with connotation

English
(400) 1
(500) 2

FORMS OF TO BE

1. Is of identity and is of classification, with high-level abstraction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economics</th>
<th>History</th>
<th>Sociology</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(400) 6</td>
<td>(421) 3</td>
<td>(507) 2</td>
<td>(400) 1</td>
<td>(669) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(500) 1</td>
<td>(423) 3</td>
<td>(604) 2</td>
<td>(500) 5</td>
<td>(670-671) 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2. Combination of errors, hinging on the use of the is of identity and the is of classification

Economics
(600) 2

3. Forms of to be, with connotation

   History
   (622) 2
   (623) 3

4. Forms of to be, with high-level abstraction and looseness of thought

   Sociology
   (624) 3
   (622) 1

5. Forms of to be, with connotation and confusion in thought

   English
   (400) 4
   (500) 5
   (600) 1

6. Forms of to be, with two-valued orientation

   Education
   (670-671) 1
## TWO-VALUED ORIENTATION

1. **Two-valued orientation, with high-level abstraction and connotation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>History</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(423)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>(400)</td>
<td>(536N) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(537)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>(500)</td>
<td>(677-678) 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(600)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. **Finality, with antithesis and high-level abstraction**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Economics</th>
<th>History</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(400)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>(403)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(500)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>(423)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(600)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. **Two-valued orientation, with high-level abstraction and primary certitude**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Economics</th>
<th>Sociology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(500)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>(507) 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(600)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>(622) 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. **Finality, with high-level abstraction, forms of to be, and connotation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Sociology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(507)</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(622)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5. Two-valued orientation, with oversimplification

   English
   (500) 2

6. Two-valued orientation, with oversimplification and connotation

   Education
   (670= 671) 5
   (677= 678) 3

CONNOTATION

1. Connotation, with high-level abstraction and generalization

   History    English    Education
   (403) 2    (400) 3    (670= 671) 1
   (421) 5    (500) 7    (677= 678) 9
   (422) 3
   (423) 3
   (537) 1

2. Connotation, with high-level abstraction and two-valued orientation

   Economics   History    Sociology
   (400) 7    (537) 1    (507) 1
   (500) 2    (604) 2
   (600) 1
3. Connotation, with forms of to be and two-valued orientation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economics</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(400) 1</td>
<td>(669) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(500) 1</td>
<td>(670-671) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(600) 1</td>
<td>(677-678) 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Connotation, with metaphor and forms of to be

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>History</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(421) 3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. Connotation, with high-level abstraction and looseness of thought

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sociology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(507) 3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6. Connotation, with high-level abstraction and forms of to be

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(400) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(500) 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(600) 3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

7. Connotation not clear, though effort has been made to clarify high-order abstractions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(400) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(500) 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(600) 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
METAPHOR

1. **Distortion of meaning resulting from the use of mixed figures and high-level abstractions**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sociology</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(622) 2</td>
<td>(400) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(500) 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. **Metaphor, with connotation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>History</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(537) 3</td>
<td>(600) 2</td>
<td>(677-678) 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. **Oversimplification, with distortion of meaning resulting from the use of mixed metaphors**

   Economics
   
   | (400) 1   | (500) 1   | (600) 1   |

4. **Metaphor, with finality resulting from the use of forms of to be**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>History</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(421) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(537) 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. **Metaphor, with high-level abstractions and connotation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sociology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(622) 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6. Distortion of meaning resulting from the use of mixed metaphors, with high-level abstractions and forms of to be

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(669) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(670-671) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(677-678) 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

7. Metaphor, closely connected with slanting

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economics</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(400) 2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(500) 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**SLANTING**

1. Slanting, with connotation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economics</th>
<th>History</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(400) 1</td>
<td>(403) 2</td>
<td>(400) 4</td>
<td>(670-671) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(600) 2</td>
<td>(423) 3</td>
<td>(500) 3</td>
<td>(677-678) 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. Slanting, with high-level abstraction and with confusion in thought

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(500) 4</td>
<td>(677-678) 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(600) 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3. Slanting, with oversimplification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economics</th>
<th>History</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(400) 2</td>
<td>(403) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(500) 1</td>
<td>(423) 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Slanting, with connotation and high-level abstraction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sociology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(507) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(604) 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Detailed summaries for each type of inaccurate and/or incomplete interpretation in the areas under consideration have been made in preceding chapters. These summaries indicate that certain difficulties loom large in each of these areas. In economics, they are as follows: dead-level abstraction; and connotation, with high-level abstraction and two-valued orientation. In history, the list is the same. Two problems seem prominent in the responses written in classes in sociology: dead-level abstraction; and looseness of thought, with high-level abstraction. In English, the following combinations seem troublesome: dead-level abstraction; and connotation, with high-level abstraction and forms of to be.

Finally, in professional education, the list is as follows: dead-level abstraction; and connotation, with high-level abstraction and generalization.

The following analysis by course levels is another aspect of the quantitative summary. The tabulation indicates the problems
which the various groups in social studies, English, and professional education appear to have found especially troublesome.
(The writer is relying on evidence afforded in the analysis of answers, as well as on numerical frequency.)

ECONOMICS

400

Abstraction

Dead-level abstraction
Looseness of thought, with high-level abstraction
Lack of communication

Contexts

Shifts in meaning of key terms, high-level abstractions, slanting

Forms of to be

Is of identity and is of classification, with high-level abstraction

Referential and emotive language

Connotation, with high-level abstraction and two-valued orientation

500

Abstraction

Dead-level abstraction

600

Abstraction

Dead-level abstraction
Referential and emotive language

Connotation, with high-level abstraction and two-valued orientation

HISTORY

403

Referential and emotive language

Connotation, with high-level abstraction and two-valued orientation

421-422-423

Abstraction

Dead-level abstraction

Referential and emotive language

Connotation, with high-level abstraction and generalization

537

Referential and emotive language

Metaphor, with connotation

SOCIOLGY

507

Abstraction

Dead-level abstraction

Looseness of thought, with high-level abstraction

604

Forms of to be

Forms of to be, with high-level abstraction and looseness of thought
Abstraction

Dead-level abstraction

Forms of to be

Is of identity and is of classification, with high-level abstraction

Referential and emotive language

Connotation, with high-level abstraction and generalization
Connotation, with high-level abstraction and forms of to be
Abstraction

Dead-level abstraction
High-level abstraction, with connotation

Contexts

Shifts in meaning of key terms, with high-level abstractions

Abstraction

High-level abstraction, with connotation

Two-valued orientation

Two-valued orientation, with oversimplification and connotation

Abstraction

Dead-level abstraction
High-level abstraction, with connotation

Referential and emotive language

Connotation, with high-level abstraction and generalization

From the analyses and the summaries, certain conclusions may be drawn:

1. Weakness is shown in the use of systematic, controlled thinking in the analysis of a given problem. This weakness involves
(a) inability to analyze a problem without oversimplification and
finality; (b) failure to differentiate between—and to use
effectively—inductive and deductive reasoning; (c) lack of
understanding of the use of the rules of valid generalization;
(d) inadequate grasp of sources and trustworthiness of evidence
adduced.

2. In the verbal communication of ideas, lack of
comprehension of the potentialities and limitations of words is
shown. Accuracy and objectivity are reduced by (a) the use of the
inferential level and of highly connotative words; (b) unskilful
use of definition and classification, with lack of examples and of
operational definitions, as well as failure to realize the
possibility of several classifications; (c) the maintenance of
consistently high levels of abstraction, resulting largely from
lack of understanding of the partial account communicated by words
and of the process of change; (d) disregard of contexts, especially
verbal and psychological.

3. Effectiveness of communication is lessened by (a) lack
of orderly, systematic presentation—undiscriminating selection of
detail (when present at all), inadequate transition, and failure
to maintain balance of ideas; (b) unclear grasp—and application of—
the difference between facts and judgments. These difficulties, it
will be noted, are cumulative: More than the skeleton of unity,
coherence, and emphasis is involved. In their writing, many of
these students reveal that they do not have a clear understanding of
how to analyze a problem, of how to work within the limitations of language, or of how to organize ideas in a precise, orderly manner.

4. Insufficient interdepartmental co-operation is indicated. The English department cannot do the task alone; in addition, it is possible that many members of English departments are unaware of how to cope with these problems. There is, in short, need for more emphasis on procedures which will enhance effectiveness of communication, and for better techniques for teaching them. Such closer co-operation would improve the quality of thinking and of verbal communication.

Before we turn, in the light of these conclusions, to a summary of the specific recommendations, a comment or two may be offered. First, as has been said, when combinations of linguistic and semantic errors in, for example, English, are similar to those in, for instance, sociology, similar procedures are recommended. Second, no claims, implicit or explicit, of finality or all-inclusiveness are made concerning the recommendations submitted. The writer is aware of the administrative difficulties which may accompany the application of various of these suggestions, and of the limitations of time. The writer believes, however, that with selection and planning, these difficulties may, at least to a significant degree, be overcome.

The summary will follow the grouping that has been used in the analysis and the recommendation: Abstraction, Symbols, Contexts,
Forms of to be, Two-valued orientation, and Referential and emotive language.

ABSTRACTION

1. Dead-level abstraction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economics</th>
<th>History</th>
<th>Sociology</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>(403) 3</td>
<td>(507) 6</td>
<td>(400) 9</td>
<td>(536N) 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>(422) 6</td>
<td>(604) 2</td>
<td>(500)11</td>
<td>(669) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>(423) 6</td>
<td>(622) 6</td>
<td>(600) 6</td>
<td>(670-671) 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(537) 3</td>
<td></td>
<td>(677-678) 6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The maintenance of a high level of abstraction appears at all three course levels in the areas under consideration. In history and in education, however, one finds an undiscriminating use of high-level abstractions rather than misunderstanding of technical terms. The recommendations include (a) (for all areas) definition, especially by means of details and examples and of operational definitions, of such terms as "free enterprise," "labor unrest," "discrimination," "romantic," and "freedom"; (b) (for all areas) analysis of passages—including student-written answers—to show the results of dead-level abstraction; (c) (for economics and sociology) the use of excerpts from the work of professional writers to show the skillful employment of both high and low levels of abstraction; (d) (for history and education) assignments requiring the imitation of passages for concreteness; (e) (for
history and English) blackboard demonstrations—with questions and
discussion topics as a basis—of possible organization of
materials and of possible examples which might be used; (f) (for
sociology) the substitution of other words for forms of to be in
sentences, to reinforce understanding of the principle of
equivalence; (g) (for English) demonstration of how Coleridge's
formula for criticism can be used as the basis for evaluative
writing.

2. **Looseness of thought, with high-level abstraction**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economics</th>
<th>History</th>
<th>Sociology</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(400) 5</td>
<td>(403) 3</td>
<td>(507) 6</td>
<td>(400) 2</td>
<td>(670-671) 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(500) 2</td>
<td>(421) 2</td>
<td>(604) 2</td>
<td>(500) 5</td>
<td>(677-578) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(600) 1</td>
<td>(422) 2</td>
<td>(622) 2</td>
<td>(600) 1</td>
<td>(500) 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The proposals include (a) (for all areas) written and oral
practice in the selection and arrangement of abstractions, with
instruction in outlining and in the use of parallel structure; (b)
(for history and education) instruction in the meaning and the use
of descriptive and inferential levels of communication, with
comparison and discussion of responses; (c) (for history, sociology,
English, and professional education) exercises in developing
paragraphs and groups of connected paragraphs by means of (1)
comparison and contrast and (2) cause and effect; (d) (for sociology)
exercises in clarification of such terms as "mores" and "personality
impact," with practice in interpretation of such terms in given
contexts; (e) (for English) instruction in ways of being specific
in comments about works of literature—the formulation and
illustration of statements expressing the distinguishing qualities
of the piece of literature under consideration.

3. **Lack of communication**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economics</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(400) 6</td>
<td>(500) 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(600) 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is suggested (a) for students in both areas, that revision
of answers be undertaken in class, with specific suggestions given
for changes in wording, and with insistence on the use of terms in
the senses and with the meaning agreed upon in lectures and class
discussions; (b) (for economics) that comparison and contrast of
definitions of such terms as "mercantilism" and "scarcity" be made;
(c) (for English) that exercises in paraphrasing verse and prose
be considered, with emphasis on retention of the tone of the
original.

4. **High-level abstraction, with some detail but with sweeping**
   **generalization**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>History</th>
<th>Sociology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(423) 6</td>
<td>(507) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(537) 2</td>
<td>(622) 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The procedures suggested include (a) (for both history and
sociology) exercises in developing paragraphs and series of connected
paragraphs by means of repetition, obverse iteration, and illustration,
with stress on clarity of analysis and adequate support of statements; (b) (for history) analysis of responses for quality of evidence offered, for caution in presentation, and for objectivity; (c) (for sociology) review of signal and symbol reactions, including the use of examples and diagrams to clarify these concepts.

5. High-level abstraction, with connotation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(500) 3</td>
<td>(536N) 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(670-671)</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(677-678)</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The techniques listed are as follows: (a) (for both groups) review of the nature and use of the descriptive and inferential levels, with demonstration—including analysis of responses—and instructor comments centered about the appropriate and effective use of emotive language; (b) (for both English and professional education) revision of responses, with emphasis on the attainment of clear, effective organization and on the maintenance of objectivity; (c) (for English) recapitulation (and demonstration) of the rules for paraphrasing.

SYMBOLS

1. Word-magic, with high-level abstraction
The writer suggests (a) (for economics and sociology) definition—by means of details and examples and of operational definitions—of such terms as "complete faith in government" and "the democratic process," "the democratic way of life," with the use of index number and of dates; (b) (for economics and sociology) explanation—with numerous examples—of the Ogden-Richards Triangle of Reference, with oral and written practice in its use; (c) (for economics) practice in analysis, involving points of emphasis, suggested division, limits of the question, and kinds of explanation desired; (d) (for sociology) consideration of the nature and the use of repetition, with attention given to the connection between repetition and confusion of word with idea.

2. Word-magic, with two-valued orientation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>History</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(403) 3</td>
<td>(600) 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The techniques proposed are as follows: (a) (for history) analysis of the use—in various answers—of such terms as "laboring man" and "free," with suggestions concerning the organization of ideas and the use of qualifying terms; (b) (for history) consideration of possible connections between rationalization and belief in word-magic; (c) (for English) practice in defining such
terms as "poetic diction" and "romanticism" in various contexts, by using examples and details, operational definitions; (d)
(for English) for practice in using the descriptive level, the writing of responses to specific questions, with emphasis on sources, trustworthiness, clarity, and relevance of evidence submitted, and on objectivity in presentation of ideas.

3. **Word-magic, with oversimplification and looseness in thought**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>History</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(421) 2</td>
<td>(400) 2</td>
<td>(677-678) 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(422) 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The recommendations (for history, English, and professional education) follow: (a) after a brief review of the major principles of the Ogden-Richards Triangle of Reference, studies of implicit acceptance of word-magic, with emphasis on possible interpretation of a given symbol in its context, and on explanation of how belief in word-magic is shown in the passage under consideration; (b) revision, with, perhaps, the writing of outlines, and with emphasis on the sources and the adequacy of the sampling and the relevance of evidence; the reserve shown in the presentation of evidence; and coherence.

4. **Word-magic, with high-level abstraction and two-valued orientation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(400) 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Suggested procedures include (a) practice in defining, by means of details and examples and by operational definitions, as well as in using evidence, with consideration of the sources of evidence and of criteria used for evaluating evidence; (b) consistent, closely controlled practice in using such terms as "laissez faire"; (c) review of the principles of valid generalization, including consideration given to the size of the sample, the method of sampling, and the treatment of negative instances.

5. Word-magic, with two-valued orientation, connotation, and metaphor

Economics

The writer suggests (a) besides practice in definition, analysis—with the use of the inductive method as well as Socratic questioning—of such phrases as "restore confidence," with stress on analysis of the meaning of the phrase, on organization of ideas, and on the use of qualifying words for precision; (b) a study of the nature, purpose, and dangers of antithesis, with attention given to explanation of the danger of errors in interpretation if thought is distorted to achieve an impressive opposition of ideas, and on a consideration of the need for multi-valued orientation and the maintenance of the descriptive level.

6. Word-magic, with connotation and metaphor

History

(403) 1
History

(422) 1

The use of the following techniques may be considered: (a) analysis of the use of such terms as "laboring man" in given contexts, with suggestions concerning organization of ideas and the use of qualifying terms; (b) consideration of possible connections between rationalization and belief in word-magic.

7. Word-magic, with connotation and two-valued orientation

Education

(670-671) 1

(677-678) 2

The following recommendations are submitted for both areas: (a) the use of the inductive method in analyzing the employment of such phrases as "sanctity of the past," with consideration of the use of such phrases followed by work with organization of ideas; (b) discussion of the nature and purpose of antithesis, and of the dangers in its use, with caution against the substitution of antitheses based on evocative words for careful explanation and the submission of valid evidence.

8. Word-magic, with high-level abstraction and connotation.

English

(400) 1

(500) 3
The proposals include (a) analysis of passages, with comparison and contrast, to show clearly the difference between repetition of words or phrases in parallel construction, used for increasing clarity and emphasis, and repetition used because of the student's belief in the power of symbols to select appropriate referents; (b) review of the causes, nature, and results of signal reaction and of symbol reactions; (c) analysis of responses, with discussion of possible ways of improving organization of ideas, the use of evidence, and the employment of qualifying terms.

CONTEXTS

1. **Shifts in meaning of key terms, with high-level abstraction**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>History</th>
<th>Sociology</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>403</td>
<td>507</td>
<td>400</td>
<td>669</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>422</td>
<td></td>
<td>500</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>537</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The recommendations include (a) (for the four areas) analysis of the meaning in various contexts—individual sentences and responses—of such words as "freedom," "culture," "nature," and "romantic," with discussion of unexpected shifts in meaning of these terms; (b) (for history and English) the use of good or excellent answers for contrast; (c) (for sociology and professional education) examination of a number of student-written answers, to see what the students mean by their use of such terms as "service" and "meaning." Consideration may be given to the interaction between shifts in
meaning of key terms and the use of unqualified high-level abstractions.

2. Shifts in meaning of key terms, with high-level abstraction and slanting

Economics
(400) 5
(500) 1

The following suggestions may be considered: (a) examination of responses to see what students mean by their use of such terms as "production"; (b) consideration of shifts in meaning of key words, such as "economy," in a passage, with discussion of the various interpretations possible; (c) examination of definitions written by professional writers on economics, to see the use of details and examples and of operational definitions—in rather involved contexts—to limit and to clarify.

3. Confused contexts, shifts in meaning, high-level abstraction, connotation

Economics
(400) 2
(500) 1

The proposals listed are as follows: (a) for analysis of such terms as "laissez faire" and "private enterprise," the writing of a discussion (based on an outline), with emphasis on effective transition, on careful selection of examples, and on maintenance of objectivity; (b) explanation of the results of repetition,
including a review of types of contexts, with consideration of the idea that repetition may result in added emphasis—or in increased confusion.

4. Shifts in meaning, with connotation and two-valued orientation

History

(421) 2

(422) 1

The writer has suggested the following procedures: (a) examination of passages for the use of such words as "conflict" and "free" and for the use of two-valued orientation, with consideration of other passages in contrast; (b) analysis of student-written responses, with discussion of various other interpretations of the answers, and examination of the nature and the validity of the evidence offered in support of the statements made.

5. Confused contexts, with connotation

English

(400) 1

(500) 2

First, passages may be compared and contrasted, with careful notation of the differences shown in the use of such words as "perfection" and in the organization of the materials. Second, an exercise in definition may be used, with students planning and writing answers to selected questions. Emphasis may be placed on definition of terms by examples and details, on specific reference
or quotation, and on logical arrangement of ideas.

FORMS OF TO BE

1. Is of identity and is of classification, with high-level abstraction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economics</th>
<th>History</th>
<th>Sociology</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(400) 6</td>
<td>(421) 3</td>
<td>(507) 2</td>
<td>(400) 1</td>
<td>(669) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(500) 1</td>
<td>(423) 3</td>
<td>(604) 2</td>
<td>(500) 5</td>
<td>(670-671) 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(622) 2</td>
<td>(600) 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(677-678) 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The recommendations include the following: (a) substitution of other words for forms of to be in sentences, with the inductive method used to explain the principle of equivalence; (b) explanation of the connection between confusion of levels of abstraction, followed by revision of sentences (taken from class papers) containing undiscriminating use of forms of to be; (c) analysis of passages from the work of professional writers, with special attention given to the use of definitions, avoidance of finality, and clear organization of involved, technical materials.

2. Combination of errors, hinging on the use of the is of identity and the is of classification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(600) 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It may be helpful for students (a) to expand statements compressed by means of forms of to be, with emphasis on grasp of the tentativeness of all "knowledge," on balance in stating ideas,
and on objective presentation of sufficient, unweighted evidence;
(b) to write précis, with instruction in selection of the essential
ideas, maintenance of proportion, and adherence to the original.

3. Forms of to be, with connotation

**History**

(422) 2

(423) 3

It is suggested that (a) analysis of responses be conducted,
with emphasis on organization of ideas, inclusion of steps in logic,
qualification of statements, inclusion of details and examples, and
maintenance of objectivity, with, perhaps, rewriting of answers; (b)
appraisal be made of passages from the work of professional
historians, for clarity of organization and maintenance of
objectivity.

4. Forms of to be, with high-level abstraction and looseness of
thought

**Sociology**

(604) 3

(622) 1

It is suggested (a) that a review of the causes, nature, and
results of projection; of the maintenance of a high level of
abstraction; and of the undiscriminating use of repetition be
undertaken; (b) that analysis of responses be considered—with
emphasis on the development of the semantic principles involved in
the use of forms of to be; (c) and that, after discussion of such
responses as those mentioned in (b), rewriting, including outlining, with suggestions and demonstrations by the instructor, be carried out.

5. Forms of to be, with connotation and confusion in thought

First, analysis of responses may be undertaken, with emphasis on clear arrangement of ideas, qualification of statements, and maintenance of objectivity. Revision may be included, with review of outlining and with expansion of statements compressed through the use of forms of to be. Second, classes may examine and compare excerpts from the work of recognized critics, noting skill in the use of forms of to be, clarity of organization, and objectivity.

6. Forms of to be, with two-valued orientation

The suggestions include (a) the expansion of statements compressed through the use of the is of identity and the is of classification, with emphasis on balance and restraint in the presentation of ideas; (b) analysis of passages for balanced setting
forth of ideas, with class members looking especially for skill in definition of major terms, for balanced presentation, and for the use of quotations for explanation and support.

TWO-VALUED ORIENTATION

1. Two-valued orientation, with high-level abstraction and connotation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>History</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(423) 2</td>
<td>(400) 1</td>
<td>(536) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(537) 1</td>
<td>(500) 2</td>
<td>(677-678)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Suggested for students in history are, first, review of the nature of signal reactions, with demonstration—through discussion of student-written answers—of the results of combining signal reaction and highly connotative words; second, discussion of superior or excellent answers, with emphasis on careful limitation of statements, orderly arrangement of ideas, effective use of examples and details, and maintenance of objectivity. For students in English, it is recommended that an explanation be given of the consequences of confusion of levels of abstraction, with demonstration of the interaction of connotation with such confusion. A recapitulation of the principles of valid generalization, with analysis of possible approaches to related questions and discussion topics, may also be helpful. The recommendations for members of classes in professional education are as follows: (a) review—through the analysis and discussion of responses—of signal
reactions resulting from confusion of levels of abstraction;
(b) discussion of the relationship between the use of highly connotative words under these circumstances and the formulation of unsupported judgments.

2. **Finality, with antithesis and high-level abstraction**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economics</th>
<th>History</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(500) 1</td>
<td>(403) 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(600) 2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The following suggestions are submitted: (a) analysis of the relationship between the development of two-valued orientation and the use of antithesis, involving definition and illustration, and consideration of the dangers attendant upon the use of antithesis; (b) analysis of passages for precision in thinking and evaluation, with attention drawn to opposition of ideas, to the use of unqualified high-order abstractions, and to the assurance implicit in the answers.

3. **Two-valued orientation, with high-level abstraction and primary certitude**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economics</th>
<th>Sociology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(500) 1</td>
<td>(507) 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(600) 2</td>
<td>(622) 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The recommendations are as follows: (a) comparison of student-written answers exhibiting two-valued orientation with others
in which multi-valued orientation is used, with discussion of the results of failure to observe the rules of valid generalization and of methods of detecting spurious generalization; (b) writing—in a laboratory situation—on selected topics, with consideration given to the nature of rationalization and to the need for indicating and supporting judgments formulated in the written discussions.

4. **Finality, with high-level abstraction, forms of to be, and connotation**

Sociology

(507) 3

(622) 1

The proposals include (a) review—through analysis and discussion of responses—of signal reactions resulting from confusion of levels of abstraction, of interaction between signal reactions and the unskillful use of highly connotative words, and of the relationships between the resultant projection and two-valued orientation; (b) consideration of possible approaches to questions or discussion topics—with attention drawn to ways in which personal connotations are shown in which prejudices are revealed—followed by the writing of answers.

5. **Two-valued orientation, with oversimplification**

English

(500) 2

For students at the intermediate level in English, a review
of the consequences of oversimplification is proposed, with stress on the accompanying disregard of gradation and of the effects of changes, and with inductive explanation of such terms as "wit" and "irony." Moreover, comparison and contrast of responses may aid in bringing about a better understanding of the need for close analysis of such subtle devices as irony, and for care in the limitation and statement of examples.

6. Two-valued orientation, with oversimplification and connotation

First, a brief review of the consequences of oversimplification is suggested, with demonstration of the consequences of combining forced opposition of ideas with highly connotative words. Second, analysis of superior answers may be used to show the use of multi-valued orientation, maintenance of objectivity, and grasp of major ideas.

CONNOTATION

1. Connotation, with high-level abstraction and generalization
The procedures suggested for all areas include (a) listing of personal and general connotations of emotion-charged words in the contexts of responses; (b) review of the principles of valid generalization, including the use of qualification and the evaluation of evidence. For history, it is also recommended that, through comparison of responses, instruction in the meaning and use of descriptive and inferential levels be given.

2. **Connotation, with high-level abstraction and two-valued**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economics</th>
<th>History</th>
<th>Sociology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(400) 7</td>
<td>(537) 1</td>
<td>(507) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(500) 2</td>
<td></td>
<td>(604) 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(600) 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The recommendations for the three areas include (a) close analysis of emotive passages from textbooks or articles, with major consideration given to the use of highly connotative words to influence opinion; (b) the use of passages from the work of professional writers to illustrate the maintenance of objectivity and the analysis and explanation of related ideas.

3. **Connotation, with forms of *to be* and two-valued orientation**
The proposals listed for both areas are as follows: (a) the use of passages containing a large number of highly connotative words, for practice in revision of objectivity; (b) oral or written analysis of responses, during which the students would suggest items of evidence that might well have been included, and would note the effect of the use of unfavorable connotation and the is of identity and is of classification.

4. Connotation, with metaphor and forms of to be

History

(421) 3

The suggestions are as follows: (a) the use of passages from histories for practice in revision, in which the students are to use referential language and to avoid a combination of connotation and metaphor to produce name-calling; (b) analysis of answers for the use of highly connotative words, for appropriateness of the metaphors used, and for the employment of forms of to be.

5. Connotation, with high-level abstraction and looseness of thought

Sociology

(507) 3
The following suggestions are made: (a) analysis of responses, with emphasis on the way in which the use of unqualified high-level abstractions and the loss of objectivity involved in the use of highly connotative words facilitate the formulation of unsupported—and often vague—judgments; (b) exercises in planning answers to selected questions, with the evaluation of several approaches to be followed by the construction of outlines.

6. **Connotation, with high-level abstraction and forms of to be**

The writer recommends (a) instruction—through comparison and contrast of responses—in the meaning and the use of descriptive and inferential levels of communication; (b) the use of illustrative passages for revision, in which the students are to use referential language, to employ lower levels of abstraction as well as higher ones, and to avoid finality with forms of to be.

7. **Connotation not clear, though effort has been made to clarify high-order abstractions**

Economics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(400)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(500)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(600)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
It is recommended, first, that students be asked to list the personal—and the general—connotations of such words as "reasonable" and "dangerous" in given contexts; to compile lists of synonyms for such words; and to use these words in conformity with general connotations, in paragraphs. Second, a review of the nature of factual, objective enumeration and explanation—in connection with selected discussion topics—may be helpful. Stress may well be placed on the idea that explanation and enumeration do not necessitate expressions of emotion.

METAPHOR

1. Distortion of meaning, resulting from the use of mixed figures and high-level abstractions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sociology</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(622) 2</td>
<td>(400) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(500) 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The proposals include (a) (for sociology) explanation—through the use of examples and details—of the nature and use of metaphor, with consideration of the inexactness and the emotional content of metaphor, and of the need for care in using figurative language in discussions intended to be objective and detached; (b) (for sociology) analysis of selected passages, with stress on the validity of the analogy suggested, on the maintenance of appropriate tone and subordination in the use of metaphor, and on the accuracy shown in the analysis and the synthesis; (c) (for English) examination and discussion of the appropriate, effective use of metaphor—as in
literature—accompanied by warning about the use of metaphor in discussions intended to be objective and precise; (d) (for English) detailed analysis of several responses, with major consideration given to the accuracy and appropriateness of metaphors in given contexts, and to the need for the use of lower levels of abstraction to clarify high-order abstractions.

2. Metaphor, with connotation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>History</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(537) 3</td>
<td>(600) 2</td>
<td>(677-678) 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The following recommendations for the three areas are made: (a) explanation of metaphors in responses, with emphasis on the use of metaphor to illustrate rather than to prove; (b) analysis of metaphors found in advertisements and political articles, with consideration of the basis of the suggested similarity and of the subordination of metaphor; (c) expansion of metaphors, with outlining of passages and rearrangement of materials.

3. Oversimplification, with distortion of meaning resulting from the use of mixed metaphors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(400) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(500) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(600) 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The following recommendations are offered: (a) consideration of examples of the effective and appropriate use of metaphor, with
discussion of the loss of the vividness and emphasis resulting from
the skillful use of metaphor, when figures of speech are used in
reports; (b) detailed analysis of several student-written responses,
with attention given to the basis of the analogy suggested, the
meaning of the metaphors in their present context, the subordination
of the metaphor to the major idea, and the accuracy of the thinking
behind the use of metaphors.

4. **Metaphor, with finality resulting from the use of forms of to be**

History
(421) 1
(537) 1

The writer suggests (a) instruction in the fitting and
appropriate use of metaphor, with attention given to the criteria
of appropriateness and relative accuracy; (b) detailed analysis of
responses, involving consideration of the ways in which (1) the use
of metaphor reveals the attitudes of the students; (2) certitude is
strengthened by the use of forms of to be.

5. **Metaphor, with high-level abstractions and connotation**

Sociology
(622) 2

The procedures include (a) comparison and contrast of
responses, involving explicit use of metaphor, the degree of accuracy
in the figures of speech used, the connection between the metaphors
used, the revelation of the students' attitudes towards the matters
under consideration, and the use of personal connotation; (b) restatement, in the students' own words, of the inferior responses, with emphasis on the maintenance of objectivity and on the use of examples and details and of operational definitions for clarification and substantiation.

6. **Distortion of meaning resulting from the use of mixed metaphors, with high-level abstractions and forms of to be**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(669)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(670-671)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(677-678)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is believed that the recommendations listed below may be helpful: (a) consideration of effective, appropriate use of metaphor in selected passages, as well as discussion of questions and discussion topics which would require objective, detailed discussion; (b) detailed analysis of responses, with consideration of the basis of the analogies suggested, the subordination of metaphors to major ideas, and the effects—so far as clarity and certitude are concerned—of the use of forms of to be.

7. **Metaphor, closely connected with slanting**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economics</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(400)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(500)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The following procedures may be used: (a) explanation by students of passages from the work of professional writers on economics, with emphasis on the use of metaphor as aids to, and illustration of, the thought; (b) analysis of a series of metaphors taken from advertisements and political articles, involving discussion of the basis of the implied analogies and of the relationship of the major ideas to the metaphors; (c) expansion of metaphors to show what major ideas have been omitted in the original.

SLANTING

1. Slanting, with connotation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economics</th>
<th>History</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(400) 1</td>
<td>(403) 2</td>
<td>(400) 4</td>
<td>(670-671) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(600) 2</td>
<td>(423) 3</td>
<td>(500) 3</td>
<td>(677-678) 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The following techniques are listed: (a) (for economics, history, English, and education) analyses of slanted newspaper articles, with consideration of what facts necessary for a balanced, supported discussion have been omitted, of the use of highly connotative words, and of the effectiveness of organization; (b) (for economics, history, and education) consideration of responses which combine slanting with the use of numerous highly connotative terms, with attention drawn to the interaction between slanting and connotation, and with discussion of errors followed by slanting of the responses in the opposite direction; (c) (for English) discussion
of errors in answers containing slanting and connotation, followed by a review of the principles of objective summary and paraphrase, and the writing of summaries and paraphrases.

2. Slanting, with high-level abstraction and with confusion in thought

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(500) 4</td>
<td>(677-678) 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(600) 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The writer offers the following suggestions: (a) (for English) review of the nature and use of the descriptive and inferential levels of communication, followed by discussion of the interaction of slanting and the use of unqualified high-order abstractions; (b) (for professional education) discussion of the place in reflective thought of (1) systematic analysis of a given problem, (2) formulation of a working hypothesis, and (3) testing of the hypothesis, followed by review of the descriptive and inferential levels of communication; (b) (for English and professional education) writing and analysis of several acceptable answers to appropriate topics, with emphasis on logical organization of ideas, on presentation of balanced discussions, and on maintenance of objectivity.

3. Slanting, with oversimplification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economics</th>
<th>History</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(400) 2</td>
<td>(403) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(500) 1</td>
<td>(423) 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The recommendations include for both areas (a) consideration of the relationship between systematic, precise thinking, the formulation and expression of judgments, often without evidence, and the selection of details to cause favorable or unfavorable reactions in the reader—with attention given to the connotation between slanting and the process of abstraction; (b) oral discussion of acceptable answers to questions, with stress on careful, logical organization of materials, on maintenance of proportion in the presentation of ideas, and on indication of other possible approaches.

4. Slanting, with connotation and high-level abstraction

Sociology

(507) 1
(604) 1

The following recommendations are offered: (a) consideration of the functioning and the results of selection in the process of abstraction, in two-valued orientation, and in slanting, followed by analysis of a slanted newspaper item, with suggestions for items or for examples and definitions which might well have been included, and with analysis of the use of repetition; (b) discussion of responses in which slanting is combined with the use of high-order abstractions and of connotation, with consideration of the nature and results of the use of invective, and of the ways in which the undiscriminating use of highly connotative words encourages slanting.
The writer has submitted a resume of the specific proposals set forth in detail in Chapters V, VI, and VII. The following general recommendations, applying to responses in all three areas—social studies, English, and education—are now offered.

First, it may be noted here that the emphasis in college teaching is passing from the recall of factual material to stress on mental training to assist students to handle factual material with understanding of the steps in analytical thinking; with ability to organize factual material clearly and effectively; and with comprehension of the potentialities and the limitations of language as a means of communicating ideas.

Therefore, the writer recommends, first, training in logic, which may be defined as the investigation of principles concerning correct or reliable inference. In the first place, students should comprehend, and have practice in, the steps in analytical thinking. They should know the elements of deductive reasoning, including the use of the syllogism. That is, all, or nearly all, of the following concepts should be clear to them: three terms must be included in a syllogism; the middle term must be included in at least one premise; a negative conclusion must be drawn if either premise is negative; no conclusion may be drawn if both premises are negative; a positive conclusion may be drawn if both premises are affirmative; no term which has not been distributed in the premise in which it occurs may be distributed in the conclusion.

Moreover, the students should understand the elements of the
inductive method, including the examination of as many instances as possible which are relevant to the hypothesis. They should realize that with generalization, what is found in the evidence is applied in the conclusions; and that, after examination of specific cases, a conclusion is drawn on the basis of the constancy of instances. In the formation of a hypothesis, on the other hand, the evidence, rather than being implied in the hypothesis, explains it. Students should also realize the need for considering the similarity of a whole number of a class—including the necessity of accurate definition—and for examination of the universality of the conclusions. The example of crime detection through clues—of Holmes, for instance, finding and analyzing clues, and building a hypothesis on the basis of these clues—might be used as an example of the use of the inductive method.

Students should also have an understanding of such abuses of logic as glittering generality, transfer, begging the question, arguing from analogy—since the function of analogy is to illustrate, rather than to serve as the basis for argument—oversimplification, and slanting. (As has been noted, such errors appear in the responses analyzed.)

The writer also recommends instruction, whether formal or informal, in major aspects of semantics: abstraction, symbols, contexts, forms of to be, two-valued orientation, and referential and emotive language. (It is recommended that all teachers secure and study standard books on semantics, such as Lee's Language
Habits in Human Affairs or Hayakawa's Language in Thought and Action.) Such instruction will help to bring to the students an understanding of the limitations, as well as of the potentialities, of language, including a better grasp (1) of the relationship between words and the experiential world, (2) of problems of interpretation, (3) of means of increasing the accuracy of interpretation for both the writer and the reader.

Such training in logic and in semantics might be given in a one-year course, in which the co-operation of personnel from the philosophy, English, and science departments would be enlisted. Attention would be given to methods and procedures, with special emphasis on the relevance of rhetorical and logical reading skills.

The writer also suggests the use of analysis of items from books, magazines, and newspapers—editorials, news items, letters to the editor—for accuracy in thinking and in expression. These items—whether ostensibly factual reports about current affairs or editorials about the national budget—might profitably serve as subjects for logical and semantic analysis.

Moreover, the wide use of charts, diagrams, and graphs, when possible, may be helpful. It should be said that such devices are, at present, used to a considerable extent in the teaching of economics, to define such terms as distribution and laissez faire. In addition, such terms as these should be carefully and thoroughly defined—preferably through the use of examples and of the operational approach—and the instructor might well insist that the
students, in speech and in writing, observe these limitations.

Finally, examples of direct, accurate answers might well be used. The employment of audio-visual aids, including the opaque projector and the mimeograph or the direct-process hectograph, will help students to link what they have been taught and what is expected of them.

It seems appropriate, at this point, to submit the following suggestions for further investigation:

1. Studies similar to the present one may be made in areas not touched on in this investigation—in philosophy, in political science, in literary criticism, in science. Such research would serve to supplement and further illuminate the findings and the recommendations contained in the present study.

2. Analysis of the relationship between rhetoric—specifically, the use of such devices as anticlimax, hyperbole, dilemma, antithesis, and personification—and difficulties in communication may be conducted. In such an investigation, emphasis may well be placed on the idea that although rhetoric is based on logic and grammar, there is a danger, in using rhetorical devices, of stressing form at the expense of precision.

3. Careful study may be made of the articulation between instruction in accurate interpretation of language, in the secondary schools and such instruction in colleges and universities. Ascertaining the amount and effectiveness of such teaching might aid in the improvement of such training at both levels.
4. Consideration may be given to the possibility of controlled experiments, involving (a) a group given such instruction as that indicated in the specific and the general recommendations, (b) a class with no such instruction. Such a study might be extended over a period of several years.

In the course of the analysis of the student-written answers, the writer has cited examples of words used for varying purposes. In "Dover Beach," for instance, one finds a restrained, poignant record of a man's loss of his old faith; on the other hand, in a paragraph on the campaign of 1832, one finds in the writing of Professor Hockett the austere detachment of the historian. The examples may seem extreme; yet, no matter what the purpose of the user, the word remains the vehicle of thought.

Under these circumstances, and in view of man's proneness to error, there appears to be need for clearer understanding of what words can and cannot do. There is a need for remembering not only purpose when words are used but also for making the verbal map correspond to the extensional world.

In this study, the writer has been concerned with problems of meaning and accuracy in the use of words. He has proposed a method of improving instruction at the college level. He does not suggest in any way that the use of these techniques will solve all problems or answer all questions. He believes, however, that the use of the procedures will help students to communicate ideas with greater understanding, clarity, and precision.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Part I: General References


Part II: Philosophies of Higher Education


Part III: General Semantics


Part IV: The Teaching of the Social Studies

1. Economics


2. History


3. Sociology


Part V: The Teaching of English

An advertisement of the Typhoon Air Conditioning Co., Inc.
In House and Home, V (March, 1954), 182.


Rapaport, Anatol. "What Do You Mean?" In Leary, William G.,
and Smith, James Steel (eds.), Thought and Statement.

and Brothers, 1932.

Richards, I. A. Practical Criticism. New York: Harcourt,

Walker, Hugh. The Literature of the Victorian Era. Cambridge:

Part VI: The Teaching of Professional Education

Cohn, David. "Moonlight and Poison Ivy." The Atlantic Monthly,
CLXXXIII (January, 1949), 36-38.

Dewey, John. How We Think. New York: D. C. Heath and
Company, 1933.

Hight, Gilbert. The Art of Teaching. New York: Alfred
A. Knopf, 1951.

Horn, Ernest. Methods of Instruction in the Social Studies.

Company, 1940.

in the Social Studies. New York: Charles Scribner's
Sons, 1936.

Martin, John Bartlow. The Deep South Says Never. New York:

Mirrieeles, Lucia B. Teaching Composition and Literature.

Press, 1926.

Report of the Harvard Committee. General Education in a Free

---


---

**Part VII: Books Suggested for the Use of Instructors**


I, Harry Sheridan Wilder, was born in Ashtabula, Ohio, June 11, 1905. I received my secondary-school education in the public schools of Ashtabula, Ohio. My undergraduate training was obtained at The Ohio State University, where I received the degree Bachelor of Science in Education in 1929. In 1931, I received the degree Master of Arts from the University. I taught at The University of Michigan from 1931 to 1933; at Cathedral College from 1933 to 1937; and at Western Maryland College from 1938 to 1941. During the years 1942-1946, I was a teacher in the public schools of Maryland. I taught at Wittenberg College from 1946 to 1950. Since 1953, I have been a member of the English Department at Long Beach State College.