ANALYSIS OF CHARACTERISTIC FACTORS
OF BEGINNING READING PROGRAMS
Volume I

DISSERTATION
Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree Doctor of Philosophy in the Graduate School of The Ohio State University

By
NAOMI SIMMS, B. A., A. M.

The Ohio State University
1956

Approved by:

[Signature]
Adviser
Department of Elementary Education
Three published studies dealing with detailed descriptions of various methods were found. Dr. Mila B. Smith, in *American Reading Instruction*, presented (1934) probably the most extensive study in this general field. She states her purpose as follows:

The story of American reading instruction is a fascinating one to pursue. It is a story of old readers which have moved in long procession from the schoolroom to the garret, from noisy popularity to silent oblivion. It is a story which reflects the changing religious, economic, and political instructions of a growing and progressive country. It is a story shot through with glimpses of advancing psychologies, of broadening and more inclusive philosophies, of ever-increasing attempts to apply science to education.

This evolutionary progress in reading has been marked by a series of emphases, each of which has been so fundamental in nature as to have controlled, to a large extent, both the method and the content of reading instruction during the period of its great intensity. This book has been written for the purpose of pointing out these periods of emphasis, tracing the background influences which have brought about, and briefly discussing their efforts upon reading instruction.³

Paul Klapper's publication, *Teaching Children to Read*, (1914) considered basic methods of teaching primary reading. He states his purpose in the following manner: "This book is given solely to the task of aiding teachers, who are seeking a method that has stood the pragmatic test, and that may, therefore, help them in their day's work."⁴ His study


Therefore, phonetic methods relate to articulate sounds; as, a phonetic alphabet.

A phonogram is a graphic character symbolizing an articulate sound.

A syllable is "a single or articulate vowel sound; that which is uttered in a single vocal impulse; also the character or letters that represent such a sound, a word, or a part of a word, that is capable of separate and complete enunciation by one voice impulse. A sound ending with a vowel is called an open syllable; one ending with a consonant is called a closed syllable."\(^{12}\) An example of a syllable in the word "syllable" is "syl."

Monosyllable words are words of one syllable, while polysyllable words are words which have several syllables, especially of more than three.

Vowels are the characters a e i o u. The sound values are: a (artistic) \(\bar{a}\) (hard); a (bat); \(\bar{a}\) (stand); a (ask, glass); e (met); \(\bar{e}\) (met); \(\bar{e}\) (fate, great); i (sit) \(\bar{I}\) (police); o (obey); \(\bar{o}\) (boat); o (not); \(\bar{o}\) (Moss); u (full); \(\bar{u}\) (rule); u (but); u (burn); ai (aisle); au (sauerkraut); in (superior) i\(\bar{u}\) (cute); and oi (oil).\(^{13}\)

The consonants are the remaining alphabetical letters. The consonant sound is not easily uttered without a vowel.

\(^{11}\)Ibid., p. 853. \(^{12}\)Ibid., p. 1138. \(^{13}\)Ibid., pp. vii-ix.
When two consonants are written together such as bl, sl, th, they are frequently referred to as a consonant combination or blend. "These consonant combinations are in order of their importance, st, th, sh, gr, br, wh, pl, fl, sp, ch, bl, sw, tr, cr, cl, sl, sn, sm, and tw."¹⁴

Description of the Phonic Method

In this method rather than have children begin with "naming the letters of the alphabet, as A, "ay"; B, "bee"; C, "cee" and so on reading was introduced through the phonemes or sound elements. These sound elements were introduced with much drill on sound-values of letters and letter combinations. Planned efforts were made to prevent children from "naming the letters as letters of the alphabet" and to identify them as sound-symbols. Thus, A was "ah" or "aye"; B was "beh" or "buh"; H was "huh" rather than "aich"; and M was signified by closed lips "m-m-m" rather than by enunciated "em."

Special emphasis was also given to the sound vowels and diphthongs or vowel digraphs as: ae, ai, au, ie, ea, oi, er.

Systems of phonic presentation. Phonics have been presented by many systems. The five major systems are:

1. The initial blend
2. The final blend

3. A combination of the initial and final blend
4. The non-separation system
5. The individual letter sounding system.

The initial blend: This technique joins the vowel to the preceding consonant, as sa-t, be-d. In the initial blend method of teaching phonics there are two parts of the word for the child to learn to recognize, the initial consonant blended with its following vowel.

Several criticisms have been made concerning this procedure. The two major ones are (1) the tendency to add an extra vowel sound to the consonant, kuh-at, thus making blending most difficult, and (2) the difficulty of application beyond words of one syllable.

The final blend: This technique emphasizes the initial consonants, as s-un, s-ing. In this system there are two parts of words for the child to learn to recognize, the initial consonant of the word and the final consonant blended with its preceding vowel. This system encourages the use of "family" words. Theoretically the final blend has the following disadvantages:

1. When using this blend it is almost impossible to avoid vocalizing the voiceless stops p, t, b, into puh, tuh, buh. . . . Thus the word band becomes buh-and and the word back becomes buh-ack.

2. It is beginnings of words and not endings which one hears and stresses in the pronunciation of words.
3. By the initial blend method the child is taught to look first at the beginning of a word as one does naturally in reading while by the final blend the child looks first at the end of the word for the familiar "family."  

A combination of the initial and final blend: This technique emphasizes each of the above, as they occur, regardless of whether the consonant occurs before or after the vowel, as nu-t, h-and, gr-and, ba-g.  

The advantages suggested for this method is that certain words fall into a definite pattern as a result of the general visual configuration of the word.  

The non-separation: This technique is based on the idea that separate letters should be given a minimum of emphasis as sounds, preferably no emphasis at all, because sounding letters separately causes vocalization of sounds, as cuh, luh, duh. In such a case the child finds it difficult to blend buh-ow to make bow, because he tries to put back into the word spoken (or read) a sound different from the approved sound for that word.  

To a certain degree this method is analytic as the child begins with a whole word, such as cat into ca-t or c-at and later he may separate sounds, such as c-a-t.  

Each letter is sounded separately: In this method emphasis is placed on the sounding of each letter. A good  

---

description of how to introduce blending by this method has been given by Stanger and Donahue.

The letters m-a-t are put before the child. He is asked the sound of the first letter, then the sound of the second, and then of the third. Then he is told to make the sound of the first letter, and to hold onto it till he joins it to the sound of the second letter. It sometimes aids this blending process if the first letter can actually be moved close to the second letter, and then those two up to the third letter. This process of holding on to each letter till it joins the next sound is repeated, each time a little faster, until mat comes as a whole word. In the very early stages of this work, the wise teacher will not let the beginner become too discouraged or impatient. If he has given the individual sounds correctly, she may help him in the final blending into an actual word.16

There is, however, great danger that the child will add extraneous sounds, as for the word cat, the child learns cuh-a-tuh.

**Scheme of presentation.** There is considerable disagreement in regard to the sequence in which phonic elements should be taught and research lacks sufficient data to indicate the best order of presentation. Numerous schemes have been suggested of which those of Monroe,17 Stanger and Donahue,18 and T.G. Hegge, S.A. Kirk and W.A. Kirk19 are perhaps the best known.

18 Stanger and Donahue, op. cit.
The sequence for teaching phonic units which has been worked out by Hegge, Kirk, and Kirk is as follows:

Part I. **Introductory Sounds**
- All consonants; the short vowels a e i u; ee; sh; oo; ch; and tch; ar; ay and ai; or; old; short e, ea; oa; ck; ow and ou; long vowels with final e; ing; all; ight; th, wh, and qu; er, ir, and ur.

Part II. **Combinations of Sounds**
- An, in, and un; en and on; ink, ank, and unk; ing, ang, ong, and ung; and, ound, and est; all, ill, and ell; pl, cl, fl, bl, gl, and sl; pr, cr, fr, br, gr, tr, and dr; sp, st, sc, sm, and sw; spl, spr, str, and scr.

Part III. **Advanced Sounds**
- Aw, au, and ew; ook, ind, oy, and oi; final y, ly, le, and ed; ge, ce, ci and cy; aught, ought, pro, and other; re-, be-, de-, and pre-; -sion, -tion, -ation, and -ution.

Part IV. **Supplementary Exercise**
- Exception: ea, ow, th, ive. Configurations not previously taught: kn; gn; ur; ph; ould; alk; alm; ex-, con-, and dis-; -ous and -ful, wor; war; air and are; eigh, ie; monosyllables ending in y or ie; oll; ol; o and e as endings.
- Word Building Exercises and Compound Words: ever, under, sea, post, school, house, some, come, where, and there, as parts of compound words; final e in compound words; plural words ending in y; plurals.
- Exercise for letter confusions: b, d, and p; m and n.\(^{20}\)

\(^{20}\)Ibid.
Monroe advocates the teaching of five or six consonants at a time and then combining them with the short vowels. In her system, long vowels and blends were introduced after the short vowels and consonants have been studied and formed into words.

Stanger and Donahue suggest the following sequence:

Set 1 - a, b, m, s, l, t, i
Set 2 - h, e, th, r, ec
Set 3 - sm, tr, thr, sh
Set 4 - o, er
Set 5 - c, k, f, ch
Set 6 - p, y, w, wh
Set 7 - g, u
Set 8 - n, oo
Set 9 - j, v
Set 10 - x, z
Set 11 - d
Set 12 - ing, ang, ung, ink, ank, onk, unk.

Basic assumptions of the Phonic Method. The Phonic Method appears to be based upon three false assumptions. The first resulted from the impression given by professional phoneticians in regard to the extent to which the English language is phonetic. Studies by Gates have shown that the reading vocabulary, especially on beginning levels, is far from being consistently phonetic. The second assumption was that reading instruction should progress from the parts to the whole. The third assumption was that, since small amounts

21 Monroe, op. cit., Chap. V.
22 Stanger and Donahue, op. cit.
of practice in sound syllable analysis was helpful, increasing amounts of practice would result in correspondingly increased efficiency.

If one implies by reading a concept of reading as a process of thought acquisition, the Phonic Method of teaching beginning reading is not a method, but rather a systematized attempt to give the child a master of the mechanics in the reading process. Jagger states that:

The Phonic Method teaches the mechanics of reading first, and assumes that the mechanics is the recognition of letters and the association of them with vowels and consonants; it further assumes, as a later technique, that the separate words of the sentence must be habitually recognized and associated with their sounds.24

Using the Phonic Method as a Reading Technique

In order that the formality and regimented procedure can be better understood, the following classroom drama is presented.

(The teacher has called the children to the reading class and the reading lesson begins.)

Teacher: "Listen to this word - box. Name all the objects you can think of beginning as box does."

Susie: "Board."

(The teacher writes the word board on the board.)

(The children continue to name words which begin as box and the teacher writes the different words.)

---

Teacher: "With what sound do all these words begin?"
Class: "Buh."
Teacher: "Find the part of the word that says buh . . . Al?"
(Al goes to the board and frames "b.")
Teacher: "Find your word in the list. Tell me how it begins and give me the word, Barbara Jo."
(Barbara Jo points to and gives the sound of b and pronounces the word bat. This continues until all children have an opportunity to participate.)

(Several days later, the following lesson takes place:)
Teacher: "Now, let us fold our hands. I will place a card on your desk. Do not look at it until I tell you."
(The teacher quickly places letter-cards face down on desk.)

"Look at your card carefully; when I call on you give the letter sound on your card . . . Mary?"
Mary: "Buh."
(This continues until each child tells the sound represented on his card. If he is unable to respond such hints as: "What does the dog say?" "What does the cow say when she cries?" etc.)

(Weeks later the class may have a lesson to develop the ability to recognize words formed by adding s to the root forms.)
Teacher: "Watch! I am going to write something on the board."
(She writes toy.) "Who can tell me what this word says?"
Stella: "Toy."
Teacher: "Yes; let’s say it slowly so we can hear the sounds."
Class: "Tuh oie."
Teacher: "Now, watch." (She adds s to the end of the word.) "What does it say now?"

Class: "Toys."

Teacher: "Yes. You have good eyes. What is the sound of this letter?" (writes s.)

Class: "Sisss."

Teacher: "What is this word?" (She writes car - cars.)

(The children respond in the same manner to the words: boat - boats, dog - dogs, cat - cats.)

Teacher: "My, this was an excellent lesson, and you were good readers! Now, let us work on our arithmetic."

---

Reading Programs Based on the Phonic Method

Many reading programs developed which were based on the Phonic Method of teaching beginning reading. Although these programs vary in detail techniques, they present many common factors.

These modified phonic programs are based upon the following mechanistic principles of learning: (1) that learning goes from the part to the whole, (2) that learning is based on repetitious drill on isolated parts, and (3) that learning takes place in a piecemeal manner.

Learning goes from the part to the whole. The numerous modified phonic programs stress the elements of words and promote reading as the ability to call words rather than the concept that reading is a thought getting process. The procedures in the phonic programs are designed to teach the
classifies basic methods of teaching reading as synthetic and analytic and provides a descriptive analysis of various programs following these two classifications of methods.

The third published manuscript, The Materials of Reading, was written by Dr. Willis L. Uhl and published in 1924. The author states:

Every supervisor and teacher of reading and literature is required to select and organize content for his courses. Even if a course of study is uniform for a city or state, the successful teacher must supplement and reorganize the prescribed content to meet the needs of a particular class. The purpose of this book is to facilitate such selection and organization by presenting an interpretation of the experiences of thousands of teachers and the conclusions of many investigators. . . .

The standards formulated in the last section of this book are based upon the scientific investigations and classroom experiences discussed in the earlier sections.5

This publication describes several beginning reading methods and programs and sets up a standard for organization of materials, but does not indicate descriptively or numerically the comparative value of one method to another.

The writer's study will include many of the methods discussed in the three works cited above. However, in this study an attempt will be made to show a comparative analysis of characteristic factors of beginning reading programs.

pupil to read by focusing attention upon separate parts and after the elements are mastered, synthesizing or combining them into meaningful groups or wholes.

**Learning is based on repetitious drill on isolated parts.** These methods encourage a teaching procedure which promotes the use of supplementary devices. These devices are employed in drill exercises usually in separate periods or in brief yet distinct periods during the reading lesson. Gates says that these devices represent

... the specialized, intensive dumbbell, barbell, and similar practice in special acts as part of the training of a football or tennis player, the intensive drill on certain runs or chords in the development of a musician, the separate drill on ovals, loops, and other figures in the beginning writing, and special formal or supplementary practices in other types of learning.  

However, studies in transfer of training fail to show the value of such training.

**Learning takes place in a piecemeal manner.** The Phonic Method is often combined with other methods, such as the word, sentence, or story. As these methods are not fully integrated, the reading program is often disjointed and little relationship is seen between the phonic word-recognition technique and the reading of words, sentences, and stories. This arrangement is inconsistent with the organismic concept of learning. This concept of learning declares that parts have

---

meaning only because of their relationship to wholes, and that learning does not take place through the memorization of disconnected parts.

Since it is impractical, if not impossible, to cover all the phonic programs, consideration will be given only to two methods which illustrate contrast in detail techniques.

**The See and Say Series**

The See and Say Method is not a Word Method as the name may imply, but rather a program of beginning reading which is based upon a phonic process and on the belief that all reading is independent word recognition. To teach word recognition the procedures of instruction and organization of materials are directed toward teaching the child the sounds of letters, so that accurate pronunciation can be developed.

**Historical development.** The See and Say Program was written by Sarah Louise Arnold, Elizabeth C. Bonny, and E. F. Southworth. The readers for this program were called See and Say Series and were published by the Iroquois Publishing Company.

**Description of the See and Say Series.** In describing this method Klapper says:

The procedures suggested are those found in the earliest methods. It perpetuates the traditional blunders in the teaching of phonics; it forces the child to read A-lice for Alice, in order to isolate the letter a; it is devoid of
all ear training; it synthesizes phonograms into
groups of letters that are either no words at
all or very unusual words...26

The teaching procedures of the See and Say Series are
organized in the following manner: The introductory lessons
are devised so that the child learns to associate such sounds
as moo, cho, sho, etc. with pictures, stories, first letters
of words, and the symbols. For example, the child is shown
a picture of a cow, and the teacher tells a story about the
picture. Then discussion and drill follow so that the child
learns to associate the picture with the sound of m. Later
association is made with the letter. These associations are
developed into further drill exercises which list words that
begin with the same sound. After these extensive drill
exercises the child is encouraged to recite such sentences
as "The cow says m, and m is the first letter in moon."

The reading materials of the See and Say Series
neglect interest or literary content. Not a story nor a
rhyme is presented for study. Book I is a picture book to
teach the alphabet and the initial sounds of the letters.
Book II introduces the long vowels, silent e, and the third
sound of a, e, i, o, u.27Book III encourages correct spelling.

Manuals accompany these books and each lesson is
provided with detailed suggestions for teaching the lesson;

26 Paul Klapper, Teaching Children to Read (New York:
27 Ibid., p. 225.
however, no new technique is introduced as a device for teaching letter sounds.

The Flesch Reading Program

The Flesch Reading Program has been described as "one of the most extensive and difficult of the many phonetic schemes that have been presented during the last two centuries." Flesch's program requires children to learn to read by a complex and synthetic procedure which begins with the child first learning the vowel sounds. Intensive synthetic training continues until the child can recognize, name, and sound all letters as well as sound a large number of phonograms, such as, lk, nt, ai, dgi, locate these elements in each of several hundred words and blend the sounds into words.

Historical development. The Flesch scheme of teaching was developed by Rudolf Flesch and discussed in his "best seller," Why Johnny Can't Read, published by Harper Brothers, New York, 1955.

J. W. Wadovick gives the following origin of the Flesch method:

Sometime back, Author Flesch offered to give a friend's 12-year old son some "remedial reading." He discovered that the boy was not slow or maladjusted - he had merely been "exposed to an ordinary American school."

---

Author Flesch decided to investigate how reading is taught in the United States, and last week he published his findings in a book, "Why Johnny Can't Read - and What You Can Do About It."29

While most teachers and educators concern themselves with beginning methods based on larger thought units, Flesch has gained many supporters.

**Description of the Flesch Program.** Dr. Flesch defines reading in the following manner: "By reading I mean getting the meaning of words formed by letters on a printed page, and nothing else."30

He interprets this definition with the following story:

Many years ago, when I was fifteen, I took a semester's course in Czechoslovakian. I have since forgotten everything about the language itself, but I still remember how the letters are pronounced, plus the simple rule that all words have the accent on the first syllable. Armed with this knowledge I once surprised a native of Prague by reading aloud from a Czech newspaper. "Oh, you know Czech?" he asked. "No, I don't understand a word of it," I answered, "I can only read it."31

Thus, if first graders pronounce three, four, or five-syllable words without an inkling of their meaning, they are reading. Phonics are defined in the following manner:


31 Ibid., p. 23.
We mean phonics that is taught to the child letter by letter and sound by sound until he knows it. . . . We mean phonics as a complete systematic subject - the sum total of information about the phonetic rules by which English is spelled. We mean phonics as it was taught in this country some thirty years ago, and as it is taught all over the world today.\(^3\)\(^2\)

According to the author this method of teaching reading is based upon the following assumptions: (1) reading is the mechanical process of putting together combinations of letters, (2) that the cause of all reading difficulties is lack of phonetic understanding, (3) that the Flesch Method is the "perfect" method of teaching reading, (4) that this method is based on Gestalt psychology, and that (5) scientific findings prove the superiority of the phonetic methods.

Reading is the putting together of combinations of letters. Reading is much more than the putting together of letter-sounds. "Real reading" is fundamentally the comprehension and reconstruction of ideas that have been expressed in printed form."\(^3\)\(^3\) Try reading the following: Ib de dabaja. According to phonetic sounding you can make these words talk, but the saying of these printed symbols does not give them meaning. These are nonsense words; they express no meaning. According to Flesch you read this gibberish, but according to Saucier and other educators Ib de dabaja could not be read

\(^3\)\(^2\)Ibid.

as there can be no comprehension and no reconstruction of ideas.

The cause of all reading difficulties is lack of phonetic understanding. If it is logical to interpret that all "poor" reading is caused by lack of phonetic understanding, would it not be logical for doctors to interpret that all belly-aches are caused from eating green apples? The teacher would give a dose of phonics; the doctor, castor oil and in either case the treatment may be detrimental.

Robinson suggests that there is no one cause for reading failure, but many causes such as unsuitable teaching methods, lack of readiness, physical defects, emotional problems, and other factors. The cause of reading deficiency is an individual matter.

The Flesch Method is the perfect method. The claims made for the "Flesch Phonic Program" sound like the labels on patent medicine - good for everything from dandruff to bunions, but the usual base for such a "cure-all" was "90 proof" and the effects were not long lasting.

As Gates has pointed out, children's learning to read without any training in phonics is evidence that a conventional course in phonics is "rarely, if ever, indispensable to learning to read."

---


The Flesch Method is based on Gestalt psychology. Flesch says that this method of teaching reading is based on Gestalt psychology and gives the following reason:

You see in this system of psychology the only thing that counts is structure, how a thing is put together, the unique way the parts make up the whole. So, if you want to teach a child how to read the word chicken, using a Gestalt psychology approach, you would try to make him "see" at a glance that the c and h belong together, making up the ch, that ck also is a close letter combination, that the i before the ck necessarily must be a short vowel, and that the en is just an unaccented ending. You would definitely not try to make the child swallow the word chicken as a whole - in a lump, so to speak - without making him understand the way it is built.

The key to Gestalt psychology is the sudden moment of insight, the flash, the click, the psychological experience of having everything fall into place. A phonics-trained reader learns chicken that way, and elephant, and hippopotamus, and internationalism, and every other word in the English language.36

The school of Gestalt psychology stresses that the whole is not merely the sum of its parts. "It flatly denies that elements pieced together, blended, fused, or associated in any way give the perceptions we actually experience.37 A symbol is not a collection of parts; it is a unit, and it is immediately sensed as such.

Wheeler and Perkins, ardent followers of Gestalt psychology have stated:

36 Flesch, op. cit., p. 125.
in a text of this type the detailed psychology of reading cannot be discussed. On the other hand, the general procedures can be pointed out. First, the method of teaching reading depends entirely upon going from the wholes to parts, if the method is to be effective. Where this procedure is not formally adopted, and learning to read does take place, it takes place in spite of, not because of, the formal method of instruction. . . . Second, the teaching process depends upon beginning with a relatively simple whole and permitting it to expand and differentiate. Many primers are based, whether deliberately or not, upon these principles and more so now than formerly. 

Scientific findings prove the superiority of Phonetic Methods. Flesch defends his method by stating that in all research studies made the Phonic Method was found to be superior to the Word Method. However, in 1938, A. I. Gates and D. H. Russell studied the relative merits of the different teaching methods and concluded that excessive amounts of phonics should be avoided.

He also attempts to prove the superiority of this method by describing in detail the teaching method and results obtained by Mary Hletko's first-grade class at the W. W. Walker School in Bedford Park, and the fact that he tried out his system twice and it worked. The limitations of this proof is its lack of cases studied, and the fact that Flesch states


that although the first grade children in the Bedford Park School could "read" the newspaper, they did not understand what they had mouthed.

Reading procedure. In this method of reading, instruction begins by showing the child a card on which the letter A is presented in print and in cursive writing, accompanied by pictures of an apple and an arrow, under which is the name of these objects. Then, the child is instructed to make the sound when the letter is designated and to point to the letter or write the letter when the sound is made. This type of exercise follows for the letters and words e - egg, elephant; i - ink, Indian; o - ox, ostrich; u - umbrella, Uncle Sam; b - ball, bed; d - dog, door; f - fish, fork; g - gun, gate; h - hand, house; j - jack-in-the-box, jump rope; l - lamp, leaf; m - moon, mouse; n - nose, nest; p - picture, pear; r - ring, rose; s - sun, soldier; t - table, tent; v - vase, violin; w - window, wagon; y - yard, yawn; z - zebra, zipper.

The vowels a, e, i, o, u are taught first followed by the consonants, blends, and phonograms such as lk, nt, ear, ai, etc. Then the children are expected to translate each of several hundred words into their sounds and recite or write them as wholes.
The Need for the Study

As a result of the varying viewpoints and divergent opinions concerning reading practices in primary grades this study appears necessary because of (1) the importance of reading in a democratic society, (2) importance of reading in the school curriculum, (3) the various methods used and the lack of understandings concerning the basic assumptions underlying beginning reading programs on the part of teachers, administrators, and the public.

The importance of reading in a democratic society.

The social significance of reading has been augmented greatly during the past decades, owing to the complexity of living in an atomic age with its increased inter-dependence of people in the economic, political, and social environment. Citizens of a democracy must read to gain increased knowledge of various social, industrial, political, and international affairs in order to participate adequately in society. This important relationship between reading and worthy membership in a democracy is reviewed by Helen M. Robinson in the following quotation:

The complexity of our society demands, as never before, that readers understand the printed page. They must not only comprehend the literal meaning, but must also be able to read between the lines, derive inferences, evaluate, accept, and reject ideas presented, and use the information gained to improve personal and social affairs.6

---

Advantages of the Phonic Method

In general phonic sounding teaches the basic phonic elements of our language pattern, teaches mechanics of reading, and develops one of the techniques of word recognition.

Teaches the basic phonetic elements of our language pattern. Phonic training does focus children's attention on common visual factors such as syllables and phonograms and shows that those elements often have the same sound in different words.

This method helps the child understand that there are common and distinctive characteristics of words. It provides him with a "mind set" favorable to further insight into make-up of words.

It teaches him one method of attack which may be adapted helpfully in the varied activities of reading, word-study, spelling, and writing.

Teaches mechanics of reading. Because of the very nature of the reading process printed symbols must be recognized quickly and accurately; so obviously, learning to identify printed symbols is an important process; however, any program in reading which is concerned primarily with word recognition and neglects meanings, evaluation, interpretation, and application is inadequate.

This program does provide basic training in mechanics of reading, such as word recognition and the left to right
process of reading, but such should be considered as a means to an end and not an end within itself.

Teaches one technique of word recognition. It is more logical to teach the functions of the letters than the names. The child reading c-a-t does not have the same advantage as the child who upon seeing the printed symbol cat can think of the letter sounds and phonetic principles. It provides a degree of independence in word recognition. It is unwise to disregard entirely any instrument designed to utilize syllables and phonograms in developing techniques necessary for independence in word recognition. What is needed is a common-sense balance in the teaching of beginning reading that would place an equal emphasis on the necessary mechanics and the thought processes involved in the reading process. Knowledge of word elements is useless to the child unless he can synthesize or blend those elements, recognize the word, and call up the appropriate meaning.

Limitations of the Phonic Method

The major limitations of the phonic method of teaching beginning reading are: (1) Many sounds of the English language have little relation to letter forms. (2) The mechanics of reading are stressed rather than reading for understanding.

Many sounds of the English language have little relation to the letter forms. The violation of rules in
cases of many words is not only seriously confusing but has
not been satisfactorily explained.

This lack of uniformity between sounds and letters
creates many words that cannot be identified by phonetic
analysis:

The child you teach will want to know
The why of sew, and sow, and foe.
Said and maid don't rhyme you'll say
Then how explain say and weigh.
And flood and food, how can it be
That sounds are not like what you see.

The following facts concerning phonograms serve to
illustrate the complexity of phonetic analysis in the English
language:

1. The most frequent phonograms are often found
   in different parts of the words - the beginning,
   the middle or the end (observe, sab, saber).

2. Many phonograms are types which cannot be seen
   readily and are not pronounceable units (deceive).

3. Large numbers of phonograms occur in words in-
   cluding other elements of infrequent occurrence
   (such as ep, ip, ub).

4. The most frequently encountered phonograms con-
   sist of letter combinations possessing, on the
   average, two other quite different sounds (such
   as apple, ape, applaud).

Teaching the "more common" or the most useful phono-
grams is mainly applicable to the common monosyllable words

40 Miles Albert Tinker, Teaching Elementary Reading

41 Arthur I. Gates, New Method in Primary Reading,
   pp. 133-146.
in the early grades, but of little use in unlocking most polysyllables. Skill in syllabification is much more useful with the longer words.

The problem of monosyllables is a serious one. In polysyllables, such as in-cor-po-rate, most of the units are simple, rarely having more than one consonant, and frequently having a consonant on only one side of the vowel. But monosyllables, which constitute most of the words in the primer and early reading material, not only have all the vowel variations but have consonant blends on both sides - for example, black, quick, speak, whale.

In teaching beginners to read by the Phonic Method the vowel sounds are most difficult to teach, as the vowels, a-e-i-o-u, can be expressed in many different ways, for example ɔ is found in float, yeoman, sow, sew, soul, sole, beau, and owe.

Numerous silent letters, such as those represented in calm, knife, rogue, and combinations of letters which represent one elementary sound, such as thin, foot, and caught, create problems in teaching beginners to read by a Phonic Method.

The mechanics of reading are stressed rather than reading for understanding. An adequate technique of word recognition does not guarantee comprehension of what is read. Thus, training in effective methods of identifying unfamiliar
words must be closely associated with concepts or meanings. It is the word and combinations of words rather than the elements of the words which express a coherent meaning.

Over emphasis on phonic analysis and mere word recognition encourage the development of "word callers." The child's attention is directed to the letters and syllables of a word rather than to the thought of the unit, and, as a result, the act of reading may become slow and laborious. Progressing by too small a unit may lead to inappropriate habits of eye-movements, speed, and comprehension. To read sentences fluently requires the development of adequate eye-movement habits; thus if the child is taught to examine each word critically for sound elements, he fails to develop the habit of a large perceptual eye span.

As Gates has pointed out, the fact that children do learn to read without any training in phonics is evidence that a conventional course in phonics is "rarely if ever, indispensable to learning to read."

Phonic analysis is only one of several word-recognition techniques. Those listed by Russell are: (1) the general pattern, or configuration, of the word, (2) the special characteristics of the appearance of the word, (3) the similarity to known words, (4) the recognition of familiar parts in

---

longer words, (5) the use of picture clues, (6) the use of context clues, and (7) the phonetic and structural analysis of the word.  

Present Status of the Phonic Method

The Phonic Method was regarded as an inferior reading method by the judges who rated the method according to the established criteria. Examination of this rating indicated 26 items in which there was complete agreement and only one item (provision for use of picture clues) in which there was disagreement. In this item two judges indicated that the Phonic Method did not provide for the use of such; while three judges rated this method as providing for such but in an inadequate manner.

A critical study of the rating indicates that this method of teaching reading failed to provide:

1. A method based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn.

2. Word attack techniques such as: general configuration, striking characteristics of words, and content clues.

3. The development of the ability to comprehend, interpret, evaluate, draw conclusions, apply information, vary reading speed, read silently, and acquire depth of word meaning.

4. The development of reading readiness.


Appendix, p. 327.  

Ibid., p. 328.
The postponement of reading until readiness has been developed.

Emphasis upon reading as a thought process.

Easy reading materials with interesting content.

For developing permanent interest in reading.

For individual differences.

An appropriate balance for recreational informational, and work type materials.

The correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use and skills in reading.

A planned program of evaluation.

Continuous progress toward the objectives of reading.

The rating sheet also shows that this method provided, though in an inadequate manner, for the following facets of an adequate reading program:

1. Phonetic analyses
2. Syllabification
3. Oral reading.

Thus it appears as if the Phonic Method is a supplementary facet of a reading program and should not be considered as the major aspect of the procedures and organization of materials.
Section II

The Phonetic Method

Much confusion exists over the use of the terms phonetic and phonics. Writers often fail to distinguish between the two terms or frequently use them synonymously. This causes confusion. For example, the Pollard Synthetic Method of teaching beginning reading is classified as a phonetic method by Nila Smith,¹⁴⁶ and Klapper¹⁴⁷ while Huey,¹⁴⁸ Adams and others,¹⁴⁹ classify the Pollard Method as a phonic method.

And even more confusion results when the same author writes: "The Pollard method was the forerunner of several other reading systems which heavily stressed phonetics"⁵⁰ and the "Pollard method was the forerunner of several reading systems which heavily stressed phonics as an approach to reading."⁵¹ This is not offered as a criticism, but to show the perplexed pattern of interpretation of the terms.

¹⁴⁷ Klapper, op. cit., p. 61.
⁵⁰ Nila B. Smith, op. cit., p. 132.
Klapper states, "The only difference between a phonic and a phonetic method is the "fixing signs," or the diacritical marks." Accepting this as the major difference, this section will deal with those methods of teaching beginning reading which are related to articulate sounds, as a phonetic alphabet or diacritical markings.

In an attempt to advert the criticism of the Phonic Method, primarily, the variability of the function of the letters, the Phonetic Method of teaching reading was suggested and accepted by many educators. In this method of teaching reading the basic principles and many of the general procedures of the Phonic Method were built into a complex system of letter sounding. It was assumed that children would gain meaning from their reading if they could translate the printed symbols to oral sounds. In consequence numerous techniques were developed to aid the child in translating printed symbols to a pronunciation medium. The most frequently used techniques were: (1) an extended alphabet and (2) diacritical marks.

Extended alphabet. In order to assign each sound its own characteristic sound, elaborate alphabets were contrived. The characters for the various sounds were kept similar in general appearance, but differed in detail. This procedure proved difficult as it was hard on the eyes, distracted from

---

52 Klapper, op. cit., p. 42.
attention to meaning, demanded unusual type, and forced the child to learn two forms for a single pronunciation, thus increasing the child's task of memorization.

**Diacritical marks.** This technique did not attempt to reconstruct print but to place marks over or on the letters to indicate the sound intended. It was claimed that such marks helped the pupil to pronounce words with silent letters as well as others with various vowel and consonant values.\(^5^3\) Perhaps the reason that extensive use has not been made of this system is the fact that books are not printed with them. If they were, such symbols might serve a purpose. Even ardent supporters state that these markings should be done away with as soon as may be practicable; therefore, if such should be dispensed with quickly, why should they be taught?

**Historical Development**

Early in educational history the Phonetic Method was presented as a reading system by the Jansenists in the Port Royal Schools, but it failed to become accepted as a major method.

In 1790 Thornton, head of the Patent Office in Washington, proposed that letters be named as they sound, and as there were more sounds than letters, he introduced new letters to supply deficiencies, developing a phonetic alphabet such as

---

M. A. Tinker stresses the significance of reading in order to participate diligently in the patterns of everyday living, such as in vocational and avocational pursuits. He has written:

To know how to read is essential, in modern life, for everyone who wishes to make a good adjustment in both his work and his recreation. The need for reading appears in all walks of life.7

The need for greater insight into many aspects of the teaching of beginning reading is urgent for many people are not able to read printed materials effectively. The following quotation tends to support the preceding statement.

Over one hundred and fifty colleges have established reading clinics to teach remedial reading to thousands of high-school graduates who cannot read with the speed and comprehension that is necessary to carry on the not-too-strenuous work of young adults in college. . . . The blame for inability to read does not rest upon low intelligence alone.

These demands for efficiency in reading to achieve dominant social needs, such as world, economic, and academic security have directed increased attention to how reading is taught in the public schools. The efficiency of present methods has been challenged. It is frequently claimed that reading programs are inadequate in teaching the mechanics


as we have seen in recent years. Other elaborate phonetic alphabets were developed. Some of these schemes departed entirely from our traditional habits of writing, such as Bell's Visible speech (1845-1912) and Jespersen's Alphabetic Notation. However, most phonetic alphabets are modifications of the traditional alphabet. There are many of this type. Some are comparably simple such as the form of phonetic alphabet which appears in the "keys of pronunciation" of most dictionaries; others are more detailed, such as Olivier's analysis which provides about four hundred sounds, starting from a vowel basis and differentiating to the more dependent consonants.

In this country Leigh (1870-1875) advocated that a simple phonetic alphabet be used in teaching beginning reading. The purpose of his phonetic scheme was to decrease confusion caused by the presence of silent letters and sounded letters represented by more than one sound. Thus, additional characters were invented to represent the other sounds after one sound has been assigned to the twenty-six regular letters.

54 Edmund Burmeister, op. cit., p. 259.

55 The symbols of this alphabet are simplified and conventionalized diagrams of the vocal cord in position for the utterance of various sounds.

56 An Alphabetic system which made use of Greek and Latin letters and Arabic numerals to indicate lip positions.

57 G. Stanley Hall, How to Teach Reading, pp. 4-5.
In Leigh's scheme of teaching reading, the word, presented in phonetic print, was slowly pronounced by the teacher until their elementary sounds were associated with the letters. The basic assumption of this method was that "Drill in this sound analysis trains the articulation, trains the ear and the ability to sound the letters of any new words, and gives the power to pronounce it by blending the sounds suggested. . . ."58

This idea of the Phonetic Alphabet, sometimes referred to as the "Scientific Alphabet," was further refined to include diacritical marks and presented in the Funk and Wagnall's Standard Readers.59 The reading material of this series of readers was presented in both ordinary and phonetic form of print.

Diacritical marks came into wide popularity a generation or two ago. For one thing it was claimed that they helped the pupil to pronounce words with silent letters as well as others with various vowel and consonant values.60

One of the earliest attempts to promote the use of diacritical marks was probably made by William Bullokar, who lived during the time of Queen Elizabeth. In 1585 he published . . .

58 Huey, op. cit., p. 266.
60 Patterson, op. cit., p. 33.
a translation of Aesop's Fables in the script that he had devised and in the Preface wrote: "No new nor unaccustomed letter (is) brought in; but the whole supply made by adding a little strike or turning to or neere one of the olde letters, most agreeing for conference with the old printing."61

Since Bullokar's time many attempts have been made to advance the use of diacritical marks for the teaching of reading. One of these later attempts was made by A. E. Hayes, who advocated Phonoscript. This system modifies the twenty-six letters of the alphabet into one hundred twenty-eight characters (counting the silent values), and had only nine exceptional words. This method claimed that in six or seven weeks the child could read any word in the language as the system involved no contradictions, no rules, the present spelling is observed, and the child did not develop reading habits that later would have to be disregarded.

During the second and third decades of the twentieth century, several phonetic methods of teaching beginning reading flourished. According to Nila B. Smith63 the impetus which promoted the promotion of an extreme synthetic method

---

61 As quoted by Jagger in The Sentence Method of Teaching Reading, p. 78.


63 Nila Banton Smith, American Reading Instruction, p. 130.
was provided by a growing dissatisfaction with the word method of teaching reading.

The Pollard Program (1889) was the forerunner of several reading programs which stressed the phonetic approach to reading. Other such programs were The Ward, The Beacon, and The Gordon.

Description of the Phonetic Method

The Phonetic Method of teaching beginning reading attempted to teach children how to render printed symbols into sound. Supporters of this method advocated that teachers should make the child conscious of the fact that in every word he speaks there are phonetic elements and thus, they sought to develop a "mouth consciousness." Frequently drills were provided in vocal positions and a few phonetic systems even classified sounds according to the vocal organs which produced them and children were instructed concerning the position of lips, teeth, and tongue and were often asked to describe in detail such positions.64

Believing that tremendous power in word sounding could be developed through a study of the phonetic elements, teachers gave extensive training in auditory discrimination and visual perception.

Techniques used to develop ability in auditory discrimination were (1) to have children listen and identify different animal cries, songs, piano tones, bird calls, musical instruments, etc., (2) to listen for specific vowel or consonant sounds, such as a at the beginning of such words as apple, act, or t as in tip, top, tell, (3) to provide words with a specific vowel or consonant sound.

Parallel with these exercises in auditory discrimination the pupils were provided training in visual perception, as a child may have very good ability in auditory discrimination but be weak in visual discrimination. Techniques used to develop visual perception were pictures, which provided clues to oral or printed letter sounds, visual presentation of symbols, with auditory letter sounds, and sentences composed of words representing the phonetic elements, such as Sam sat in the sun.

The teacher began the teaching of reading by having the children learn to hear and to recognize in print the short vowel and initial sounds. In describing the Phonetic Method Edward Dolch has written:

First, the child is taught the idea of the vowel sound as distinct from the sound of the whole word, and he finds it relatively easy to hear the vowel alone or to produce it himself. Then we try to get him to hear the consonants.  

---

After the short vowels and consonant sounds have been learned, the child was taught to blend the phonetic elements.

The usual method used in teaching blending was to have the child sound the separate letters of the unknown word and then say them closer together and more quickly so that the whole word sound appeared. For example, in introducing this concept of blending, the teacher might have the following exercise on the board: m followed by a, e, i, o, u. The children then produced the sounds represented as she provided such symbols as ma, mi, me, etc. This type of exercise was continued for other consonants and developed into exercises that would teach phonic families and phonograms, such as lash, plash, splash. Thus, it was presumed that phonetic ability is the capacity to recognize the particular phonograms already met.

Using the Phonetic Method as a Reading Technique

The following lesson was developed by the teacher:

(1) to teach the initial sound t,
(2) to teach the printed symbol, t,
(3) to help the child associate the sound of t and the symbol, t.

Teacher: "Children, I am going to say five words. Listen carefully to hear how they begin."

(The teacher says the following words, top, tap, tell, turn, took, elongating slightly the initial letter sounds.)

"What did you notice about the way they all began?"

Albert: "They all begin alike."
Teacher: "Can you give me other words that begin with the same sound?"

Bill: "Tom."

Susie: "To."

(In turn several children provide words that begin with the initial sound t.)

Teacher: "Now, watch." (She places the following words on the chalkboard: take, top, to.) "In what way do all these words look alike.

Class: "They all begin alike."

Teacher: "Yes, all of the words begin with the sound T. Can you sound it?"

Class: "Tuh."

Teacher: "Good, but let me hear you sound it, Bill?"

Bill: "Tuh."

Teacher: "Where was your tongue?"

Bill: "Up by my teeth... I guess."

Teacher: "Yes, let's all say it softly and find out where our tongue is when we make this sound."

Class: "Tuh."

Teacher: "Charles?"

Charles: "Against my front teeth."

Teacher: "We say that this sound is a voiceless explosive called a "surd," that means we really do not say it, but it explodes from our mouth. Let's all say it again."

Class: "Tuh."

Teacher: "Let us read all these words on the chalkboard."

Class: "Take, top, to."
Teacher: "What is this sound?" (She points to the letter, t.)

Class: "Tuh."

Teacher: "Where do you put your tongue?"

Edgar: "Against our front teeth."

Teacher: "What kind of a sound is it?"

Louis: "T is a voiceless explosive."

Teacher: "That is fine. That is all the time we have now, you may take out your arithmetic books."

Reading Programs Based on the Phonetic Method

Numerous beginning reading programs based on the Phonetic Method have been developed. In order to provide the reader with a depth of understanding regarding how basal readers and classroom procedures may evolve around this synthetic approach, three of the best known phonetic reading programs are presented.

The Pollard Reading Program

This scheme was one of the most detailed of several reading programs which stressed phonetics as an approach to beginning reading. It is intensely artificial and adult in its conceptions. In this program the teaching of phonetic elements precedes the word and the word precedes the sentence. The procedures recommended in this method emphasized the memorization of long lists of word families, sounds of letters,
and letter combinations, diacritical marks, games, pictures, and personification of letters. The major objective of this reading program is to make children independent in word pronunciation.

**Historical development.** As has been stated, the Alphabet Method is perhaps the oldest of the reading methods. This method in turn was followed by the Alphabetic-Phonic and Phonic Method. In 1840 and 1860 Bumstead and Webb respectively published readers based on the Word Method. The word-method approach was used by a minority of schools from about 1840 and 1890. In time the Word Method was subjected to severe criticism, and as a result of this, a group of educators recommended extreme phonetic reading programs.

In answer to the question of how to increase reading efficiency at the upper grade level Miss Pollard in 1889 advocated the method which became known as the "Pollard's Synthetic Method Reading and Spelling."

Several other systems followed Miss Pollard's method; however, none was so extreme.

**Description of the Pollard Program.** This method is based on the principle that combinations of sound elements will give the word which is the unit of utterance. Miss Pollard has declared:

---

Instead of teaching the word as a whole and afterward subjecting it to phonetic analysis, is it not infinitely better to take the sounds of the letters for our starting point, and with these sounds lay a foundation firm and broad, upon which we can build whole families of words for instant recognition.

The method is organized around (1) manual signs, (2) voice signs, (3) sound elements, and (4) word recognition.

Manual signs are used to illustrate that "motion signs" have meaning. The first prereading lesson serves to illustrate that signs are used to convey meaning. The teacher says nothing about reading, but dramatizes the meaning of the word come. After the teacher's dramatization she asks the child what it means. The child in turn answers, "It means 'come.'" The teacher then dramatizes the words, go, yes, no, raise the window, etc.

The purpose of these exercises is to provide children with an opportunity to learn that symbols like signs have meanings; however, it fails to develop a direct association between printed symbols and meanings as it stops when meaning is established between manual signs and vocal symbols.

Voice signs are used to promote correct pronunciation. The techniques used to promote proper articulation are: making of voice signs such as laughter, pain, sorrow. The

---

of reading and unsuitable for promoting the understandings, attitudes, and interests essential in contemporary life. Thus, there appears to be a need that reading methods be critically appraised and changes made wherever needed.

The importance of reading in the curriculum. Traditionally teaching children to read has been the first responsibility of the elementary school. For a long time the three "R's" constituted the entire curriculum, and today, as in past decades, reading seems to receive much attention. In 1915, H. W. Holmes wrote: "It was readily found that the elementary reading course was receiving approximately sixty percent more recitation time than any other school subject." Data supplied by Sears (1916), Kirk (1923), and Reinoehl (1924) support Holmes' findings in regard to time spent in teaching reading.


10J. B. Sears, "Time Allotment in the Schools of Salt Lake City," Education Administration and Supervision, II (March, 1916), 137-150.


voice signs also serve the purpose of introducing phonetic facts as the children later are questioned about voice sounds made by cats, dogs, pigs, etc. To what extent the learning from this situation transfers to learning of consonant and vowel sounding may be debated. Psychological studies indicate that the most economical way to master any skill is to practice that skill, not to practice some other skill and hope for a transfer. 68

Phonetic elements are taught by means of such directions as, make scales, mark and sound, tie, memorization of equivalent consonants, door knobs, back door keys, front door key; and drill promoted by the Rotary Board and the Johnny Story.

The above mentioned terms have the following meanings:

Make Scales means to print the letters of the family names eight times upon the board, for the purpose of singing up and down - as on the scale of C.

Mark and Sound means to place a diacritical mark above, below or through a letter. . . .

Tie means to connect proper diphthongs by a curved line below; also to connect consonants, in the same manner, for front and back door keys.

Equivalent Consonants are those whose sounds are indicated by diacritical marks . . . ; as c = k, g = j, s = z, x = gz, n = ng, ph and gh = f.

Door Knobs are the single consonants found at the end of words or syllables. . . .

Back Door Keys consist of consonants that follow the last vowel of a word; as and; bank.

Front Door Keys. consist of the consonants that precede the first vowel of a word; as, crab, strap.

Rotary means the Rotary Board. On this board family words are printed on the inner section of a circle and initial consonants upon the outer section.69

The presentation of the phonic facts progress from isolated letter sounds to families of words. Consideration is also given to singular and plural forms, past tense, and compound words.

The isolated letter sounds are presented by associating the sounds of the letters with the objects suggested in the "Johnny Story" and phonetic songs.

Word recognition: In order that children learn to recognize words, "families" of words are presented.

The family of ap is introduced first. The children are asked for the cross dog's growl and as they give the sound the teacher prints the letter in front of ap and ask the child to first sound and then say quickly rap.

The ap family is then placed on the Rotary Board so additional drill can be provided.

Singular, plural, past tense, and compound words are built through a series of lessons that promote synthesis of sound elements.

Procedures: The general procedures advocated by Miss Pollard are as follows:

69 Pollard, op. cit., pp. 24-25.
First: Oral instructional excerpts from Johnny Story, using stencils and songs when teaching sounds; talk about the new sound; developing words by families; reason for marking, etc.
Second: Blackboard drill, which should include the marking on the board by pupils, in turn, of all the letters, words, and sentences given in the lesson.
Third: Independent marking of the lesson by pupils at their seats.
Fourth: Writing, from the teacher's dictation, the letters, family names, words, and keys of the lesson.
Fifth: Recitation; pupils pronouncing the words and reading the sentences of the lesson.

The Ward Reading Program

The Ward Reading Program, frequently referred to as the Rational Method of teaching reading, attempted to reconcile the Word and the Phonetic Method. It was developed upon the principle that a word is recognized by its appearance as a whole, but that words are also the unit of oral speech and thus phonetic sounds and diacritical marks need to be stressed. This method has been classified as a Sentence Method; however, the author states, "The Rational Method is a peculiar combination of the word and the phonetic method."71

Historical development. Following the pattern established by Miss Pollard, but not to such an extreme degree, Edward G. Ward, Superintendent of Public Instruction in Brooklyn, New York, introduced the Ward Rational Method of teaching reading in 1894.

70Ibid., p. 24.
Description of the Ward Program. The general plan of teaching beginners to read by this method is: (1) teaching of a sight vocabulary, (2) providing phonetic instructions, (3) reading from books, and (4) writing and spelling.

Basic sight vocabulary: Eighty basic sight words have been selected to be presented in script on the blackboard in short sentences. These sentences are unrelated and are merely used to introduce the sight words. This type of instruction continues for several weeks and it is claimed by the author that at the end of this period the child can read the words from lists on the blackboard, from flash cards, or in sentences.

Phonetic instruction: After the children are able to recognize the basic sight words, phonetic elements are introduced. These elements are presented through ear training. Auditory discrimination is ushered into the teaching procedures at various places in stories told by the teacher. After the child has had opportunities to manipulate word sounds, he is supposed to be ready for the next step. This stage is a period of intensive visual phonetic training. The phonograms, introduced first, are presented either by presenting isolated initial sounds or through analysis of a basic sight word, for example, /f/ is written on the board and the child is told its sound or the sight word fold is analyzed into its two parts, /ff/ and /old/. After the children are acquainted with the
basic initial sounds they are taught to blend these into words. This intensive training in phonetics is carried over to the reading material by means of diacritical marks. The use of the diacritical marks continues until the end of the second year.

Book reading: In the beginning all reading symbols are presented in script on the blackboard, and association is made later between script and print. This is accomplished by presenting the sentence in script and print at the same time. The children read the script and are told the print. The printed symbols are learned by the Look-and-Say Method. After numerous drill exercises of this type it is believed that an association is made between the script and printed symbols. This technique is carried on through the first three grades; however, in the early part of the second grade when all the phonetic forms have been taught, supplementary readers are introduced.

The reading material as presented by Ward in his primers is dull and inane. The following quotations are submitted for the purpose of illustrating the mechanical and meaningless content.

I see the dog.
Does the dog see me?
Dog, Jack does see you.
Look at me well, dog.
The dog looks at me.
Does the dog see me? 72
The dog sees me well.

After numerous exercises as this the child then reads:
The ram did not butt Otto.
But Otto could not take all the corn. 73

Writing and spelling: Simultaneously with reading
the child learns writing and spelling. Although the basic
vocabulary and phonetic words are correlated with the teaching of writing and spelling the procedures are laborious as those used in the teaching of the reading.

The Beacon Reading Program

The Beacon Method was the last widely used system based on an elaborate systematized phonetic process.

The chief features of this phonetic system are summarized in the following words: Its aim is "to offer a set of easy reading lessons, worked out in connection with a series of graded exercises in phonetic drill." The purpose of these reading lessons is "to acquire the power of word getting and word mastery."74

The phonetic exercises did not compose the entire reading program as a selected group of words; basic sight words, were taught by the Look-and-Say process coincidently

72 Ibid., p. 3. 73 Ibid., p. 116.

74 James H. Fassett, The Beacon Readers, as quoted by Paul Klapper in Teaching Children to Read, p. 220.
with the phonetic drill procedures. The analyses of word elements was an independent part of the reading system and not an integrated part of the reading lessons.

Historical development. James H. Fassett, Superintendent of Schools at Nashua, New Hampshire, was the author of the Beacon Reading Program. This program for teaching reading appeared in the Beacon Readers, published by Ginn and Company, Boston, in 1912 and 1913. These books were accompanied by a reading chart and a phonetic chart; however, a Teacher's Manual written by Fassett and Norton was not published until 1922.

Description of the Beacon Reading Program. Fassett attempted to develop a system of teaching beginning reading that would be based upon the phonetic and word methods. The two methods were synchronized; a period to develop techniques of analysis and a period to develop reading of words and sentences.

Teaching phonetic elements: An examination of the primer shows that the first fifteen pages are composed of phonetic tables, which contain lists of words of from three to five letters. These words were organized according to certain vowel or consonant combinations, such as camp, lamp, damp, bump, jump, dump. 75

75 Smith, American Reading Instruction, p. 138
The phonetic tables were learned in the traditional manner of repetitional drill. The drill was formal and was not an outgrowth of words learned while reading interesting content. The phonetic concepts were introduced and studied in situations unrelated to the initial reading lessons and appear to be supplementary to the reading activities.

Teaching the reading of words and sentences: The content of the reading material is artificial. It is composed of meaningless word repetition which lacks any interesting plot. Here is a typical example of the content:

I have a doll.
I have a doll, mama.
See my doll.
See my doll, mama.
See my doll, kitty.
I like my doll. 76
I like my kitty.

The actual reading of this meaningless content is by the look-and-say process. Chart work precedes the reading of the primer pages and serves as a medium for word study. The child is first introduced to the sentences See Mama. See kitty. Mama, see kitty, in chart form. The words and their meanings are studied by such techniques as matching words and pictures, words and words, sentences and sentences, finding specific sentences and words, and chart reading. After these introductory lessons the child reads sentences such as, See Mama. See kitty, etc. from the primer.

76 Fassett, op. cit., p. 19.
As an aid in learning to read, to develop meaning, and to provide interest, the Beacon Readers made use of pictures.

Advantages of the Phonetic Method

The Phonetic Method has the following advantages:
(1) it contributes to fluency and accuracy in word recognition;
(2) it provides clues which aid in word pronunciation;
(3) it encourages better speech articulation; and
(4) it frequently aids foreign speaking children and certain children who are backward in reading for a variety causes to learn to read.

Aids in word recognition. The ability to see similarities and differences among letters and to translate these letters or letter combinations into sounds and to combine these sounds into word sounds have been recognized as useful reading skills. The investigations of Buswell, and Currier and Duguid showed clearly that training in phonetics contributes to fluency and accuracy in word recognition. Of course, it is a serious error to devote an entire reading program to the teaching of this one tool, but obviously pupils should be taught to employ phonetic analysis in conjunction with other word-attack techniques.

77 Guy Thomas Buswell, "Fundamental Reading Habits: A Study of Their Development," Supplementary Educational Monographs No. 21, Chicago, 1922, pp. xiv + 150.

McKee supports this statement with the following declaration:

In spite of its faults, however, a knowledge of phonetic elements and principles is so basic to any person's identification and recognition of practically all printed words that phonetic analysis is an essential part of an adequate program in independent identification of words. 79

Phonetic elements should be presented as an integrated part of a reading program, the nature and amount to be determined by individual needs and readiness. A program of phonetic analysis must be intrinsic. Russell has said:

The memorizing of word lists just because the words are similar phonetically is a sterile, unprofitable practice. In modern programs the first practice in phonetic analysis is conducted with known words and later practice with words important in the child's basic vocabulary. Phonics is essentially a system of generalizing about the sounds of words; and before the child can generalize, he must know a number of word samples which illustrate the generalization. As with sounds and analytic techniques, he may apply his skill to new words; but ability to do so successfully is a culmination, not a beginning part of the program. 80

Provides clues for word pronunciation. Another merit of the Phonetic Method of teaching reading is that it provides clues for word pronunciation. For example, knowing the so-called "long a" sound is usually represented by the letters a, ai, ay, the "silent e" at the end of the word or the rule

80 Russell, op. cit., p. 213.
W. S. Gray summarizes the tendencies in regard to the time allotted to reading instruction as follows:

. . . . (1) Schools in the large cities are giving more time to reading in each grade than are schools in the smaller cities or country schools. (2) More time is given to reading in the first grade than in any other grade. (3) The amount of time given to reading decreases more or less from the first grade to the eighth grade. (4) There are very wide differences among cities and within school systems as to the amount of time devoted to reading in any given grade. (5) There is a distinct tendency to give less attention than formerly to arbitrary daily time allotments. This is particularly true in the seventh and eighth grades.13

This statement has been made that in the modern school reading constitutes about 80 per cent of the study of elementary school pupils and about 75 per cent of the study of high school pupils.14 Thus, schools devote a large amount of time to the teaching of reading.

**Relationship of reading achievement and school success.** There appears to be a positive correlation between the ability to read and success in other academic areas. Tilton15 notes

---


when two vowels go walking one does the talking; aids the child in knowing how to say words.

At one time in the developmental history of reading programs there was an emphasis of "no word analysis at all." In an evaluation of this trend Adams writes:

Many feel that this period of "no word analysis at all" is responsible for the number of students in our junior high schools, high schools, and colleges who are almost totally insecure when dealing with words. Too large a number, quite helpless when faced with an unfamiliar word, must either ask someone what it is, skip it ignominiously, guess at it nervously, or turn continually to the dictionary.

Encourages better speech articulation. Besides providing children with a major means of unlocking words and clues of pronunciation; Phonetic methods of teaching reading give training which promotes better speech articulation. Unless the child hears the words correctly he is often unable to reproduce them and thus transition from auditory to the visual form is difficult. For example, the child who says halp for help may be aided by reference to a number of words beginning with the "he" sound as well as those beginning with the "ha" sound. Broom and others declare that better articulation and enunciation may develop if the teacher can and does show the child how to hold his mouth in making various

81 Adams, Gray, and Reese, op. cit., p. 327.
sounds. "The child who says tarred for tired may be shown how to open his mouth lengthwise instead of like an oval when he says this word." 83

Aids foreign children and others to learn to read. It is claimed by some educators 84 that foreign speaking children are greatly aided in learning to read by the phonetic method. Furthermore, Schmitt 85 pointed out that elaborate phonetic drills proved very effective in the case of certain pupils who were backward in reading "for a variety of causes." Although these findings are not conclusive, they indicate that certain pupils can profit by instruction based upon the phonetic method of teaching beginning reading.

Limitations of the Phonetic Methods

An analysis of the organization and procedures suggested by the Phonetic Method shows that this method of teaching beginning reading develops from the sound elements to the sentence. In this method emphasis is placed upon mastery of word-recognition and the smallest component parts of words. However, reading is not the mere calling of words or the applying of sound elements to letters or groups of letters but a "thought-getting" process.

83 Ibid.
84 Currier and Duguid, op. cit., pp. 448-452.
Reading should be regarded as an activity of thought, requiring the use of the creative intelligence and making an effective contribution to the development of the personality as a whole. Recognition of the symbols, understanding of their value and rapidity of perception are insufficient. The most important thing is the individual's reaction to what is read - reflection of ideas, their critical evaluation, and awareness of the interconnection of these ideas - in a word, reading is thinking.

The major disadvantages of this method are: (1) the children are forced to learn two sets of symbols, (2) the lack of interesting reading content, (3) the tedious and artificial procedures used to facilitate reading instruction, (4) the neglect of word-recognition techniques other than that of phonetic sounding, and (5) the extended period needed for learning the mechanics of reading.

Two sets of symbols. The sound-indicating shapes added to the letters made it necessary for children first to decipher them, then to recognize the alphabet symbols, and finally to see the new letter combinations as words. The dia-critical marks or the phonetic alphabet are merely an accessory in getting thought, and no technical training in vocal intonation can be successful unless the meaning is thoroughly grasped.

The sound-indicating shapes serve the same purpose as an adult would who immediately tells the pronunciation of an unknown word. They do not provide a direct means for

---

developing a word-attack system such as a system which would explain an unknown sound value in comparison with a known sound; such as an analysis of met and meet.

The sound symbols used within or adjacent to every letter create the problem of reteaching the reading material without the markings. This step is necessary as our reading matter is not presented to the public with such markings. It merely adds another step to a process which is normally most complex.

The lack of interesting content. The reading materials as found in readers, such as, the Pollard, Beacon, and Ward, which presented the Phonetic Method of teaching reading lacked suitable content. The content used proved that even groups of sentences could be quite uninteresting. The formal presentation and extreme repetition of words as used in these readers are inadequate for training in comprehension and interpretation. Reading material should be selected so that reading can be developed with meaningful and interesting content. Pennell and Cusack wrote: "When a child has a purpose for reading of sufficient interest, this purpose not only furnishes the drive or motive power for reading, but guides the process and keeps the mind occupied with the purpose until the end point is reached."87

The child taught by the Phonetic Method first memorizes a jungle of sound elements for the first several months and then is provided with a group of unrelated sentences. Thus, little opportunity is provided for a child to regard reading as a "thought-getting" process and such a presentation of reading often develops an attitude that reading is a distasteful task.

Tedious and artificial procedures. To secure the greatest interest and growth in reading, instruction should have a purpose, motivate, and provide materials and activities which encourage reading as a thought process. The materials and activities should be rich and meaningful and not mere devices and tricks in an attempt to attach associations for remembering sounds and words. The Phonetic Method provided repetitious word and phonetic drill procedures but failed to take into consideration interest, needs, purposes, or motivation of children or the true function and purposes of reading.

Neglect of word-recognition techniques other than that of phonetic sounding. One of the objectionable characteristics of the Phonetic Method which Adams and others call attention to is the fact that one technique of word-recognition is developed. They wrote:

In the old form, phonics also caused neglect of context clues instead of working hand in hand with them as does the program of phonetic analysis today. Confronted with such an elliptical series
as Fan can. Can Dan? the child is given little aid from context clues, either to pronunciation or meaning, because of the notable absence of context.  

This is especially true of reading programs based upon a Phonetic Method of teaching beginning reading.

Extended period of learning to read. On the average when children enter the first grade they show interest in learning to read. The child needs the pleasure of achievement in reading or this interest may lag; however, the Phonetic Method required a year or even two years for the learning of the mechanical elements of reading. The learning of the mechanics of reading became the end rather than a means to an end.

Although the period of learning to read is extended, readiness for reading is ignored. The concept of reading readiness is based upon the child's total development, not on his ability to achieve mastery of one small facet, such as learning phonetic elements. Thus, the idea of using phonetics as the only answer to the problem of preparing the child to read is incomplete.

Present Status of the Phonetic Method

Evaluating the Phonetic Method of teaching beginning reading in terms of the established criteria, the judges consulted concluded that the Phonetic Method is not a complete

---

88 Adams, Gray, and Reese, op. cit., p. 325.
method of reading instruction but merely a word-analysis technique.

An analysis of the rating as provided by the judges show that although this method provides for the following facets of a beginning reading program it does so in an inadequate manner:

1. Picture clues
2. Phonetic analysis
3. Syllabification
4. Silent reading
5. Oral reading
6. Provision for the development of readiness for reading.
7. Increase in vocabulary and content.

It is well to note that in this method picture clues were used to aid the child in associating the printed symbol with the sound, but not with word meaning. Phonetic analysis and syllabification were taught as a synthesizing of sound into words, i.e., a process which goes from the parts to the whole, not from whole to part. Silent and oral reading was not purposeful and the reading materials were not of interesting content. Reading was merely the mouthing of speech sounds. Reading readiness is a total growth process and not merely a learning of the mechanics of reading. A reading readiness program should consider the physical, mental, social, and emotional growth of each individual and should provide learning situations and experiences to promote such growth. Increase in vocabulary and content was provided by increasing

\[^{89}\text{Appendix, pp. 330-331.}\]
the word syllable count, but this does not necessarily contribute to a demand for growth in reading ability. For example, a child can remember words such as *elephant* and *hippopotamus* much easier than he can *saw* and *was*.

The judges also indicate that no consideration was given to such factors as (1) child growth and development, (2) individual differences, (3) interest, (4) needs, (5) purposes, (6) postponement of reading until readiness had been developed, (7) extensive reading, (8) development of permanent interest, (9) balanced reading program, (10) evaluation, or (11) reading as a thought process to be used as an integrated part of all the child's activities.

**Section III**

**Linguistic Methods**

The Linguistic Method of teaching beginning reading is another method of reading based upon the belief that knowledge of phonetic sounding aids children in "unlocking" most of the words which he meets and that independent word recognition can be achieved through phonetic drill.

**Basic assumptions.** This method of teaching reading is based upon the following assumptions: (1) Sounding is the basic recognition clue of printed symbols and (2) Linguistic comprehension is basic to the understanding of words and ideas in reading.
Sounding is a basic recognition clue: In the process of normal reading, word recognition results from a combination of clues. Visual clues are stimulated as the eyes fixate across the line. Auditory clues develop from sounding, either aloud or subvocally, the words and phrases visualized. Intellectual, or meaning clues, are secured from the contextual setting in which a given word is perceived. According to the Linguistic Method most children need specific practice in visual discrimination and sounding at the same time so that they "think the meaning," to gain real skill in reading. Of the three types of clues, visual, auditory, and intellectual, the auditory or language clue is considered by some authorities to be the most important. Hildreth⁹⁰ states that printed symbols are more easily remembered when they are linked with the sounds associated with the words, and suggests the explanation that when printed words are spoken the child is more likely to use them in conversation and, consequently, become more familiar with them than with words not enunciated. It is generally a recognized fact, she states, that all readers except the deaf retain "inner speech" while reading, even in adulthood, although the vocal movement made during reading may be very slight. It is also thought that the sounding of a word gives additional practice in visual analysis and is an

effective means of measuring detailed attention to word structure.

Linguistic comprehension is basic to understanding of words and ideas in reading: Hildreth further points out that when a child begins to read, he is already accustomed to the sentence structure, idioms, and cadence of his native language. He has used such phrases as "Go for a ride," "Catch the bus," and "Get a drink of water," so many times that they come easily to consciousness and to tongue. Such familiar expressions provide an easy introduction to reading, for the meaning of the print is easily associated with his vernacular meanings.

Thus, in the beginning stages of reading the child should deal with words familiar to him, as learning to read is primarily considered the process of establishing connection between the oral symbol, the visual symbol, and the meaning.

Historical Development

The Linguistic Method of teaching beginning reading was developed by Leonard Bloomfield. This method appears to have developed as a result of criticism directed against the Word and Phonic Methods. Bloomfield, himself, criticized these methods in the following manner:

\[91\text{Ibid.}, \text{p. 146.}\]
Intercorrelations between scores made by fourth grade pupils on the various sections of the *Unit Scales of Attainment* which lead him to the conclusion that ability to read in any one area is more or less consistent with general ability to learn. Other studies which provide data to support the existence of a relationship between reading achievement and academic success have been made by Barrett, Preston and Botel, Pitts, and McQuarry. However, the findings further show that the relationship varies between school subjects and that many other factors influence academic progress.

Results of these and similar investigations show clearly that reading is intimately related to the study of such elementary subjects as geography, history, science, health, arithmetic, and many other subjects. Assignments in


17 Ralph C. Preston and Morton Botel, "The Relation of Reading Skill and Other Factors to the Academic Achievement of 2,048 College Students," *Journal of Experimental Education*, XX (June, 1952), 363-371.

18 Raymond J. Pitts, "Relationship Between Functional Competence in Mathematics and Reading Grade Levels, Mental Ability, and Age," *Journal of Education Psychology*, XLIII (December, 1952), 486-492.

Nothing could be more discouraging than to read our "educationalists'" treatises on methods of teaching children to read. . . . The primers and first reading books which embody these doctrines, present the graphic forms in a mere hodge-podge, with no rational progression. At one extreme, there is the metaphysical doctrine which sets out to connect the graphic symbols directly with "thoughts" or "ideas" as though these symbols were correlated with objects and situations and not with speech-sounds. At the other extreme are the so-called "phonic" methods, which confuse learning to read and write with learning to speak, and set out to train the child in the production of sounds - an undertaking complicated by the crassest ignorance of elementary phonetics.92

In an attempt to advert these criticisms he suggested two plans for teaching beginning reading. One of the plans suggested was to first teach the child to read a phonetic transcription and to turn to traditional print after the mechanical skills had been developed. The second suggested plan was for the teaching of beginning reading to begin with graphs that contain only one phonetic value for each letter - and to postpone other graphs until the elementary reading habits have been established or to introduce them in some planned program.

The Linguistic Method was developed according to the second plan. Under this system the first reading material shows each letter in only one phonetic value. The next stage introduces regular spelling with double consonants and other digraphs (well, shine), semi-irregular spelling (line), two

---

sylable words with consistent spelling (butter), and irregular spelled words (cough). In regards to this plan Bloomfield has declared: "The children will learn in a much shorter time and they will read more accurately, more smoothly, and with better understanding of the content."93

Description of the Linguistic Method

When the child enters school he has mastered about two or three thousand words. He understands more words than he uses in his speech pattern, thus during his pre-school years he has already developed a hearing and speaking vocabulary. As language ability develops, children are likely to recognize needs for information which will help them control their environment and at this point, learning to read has value.94 Advocates of the linguistic approach recognize this as a factor in motivating reading. To parallel the building of certain skills, those using this method set up situations in which reading becomes an adjunct of oral language and a necessary part of the child's effort to communicate in receiving ideas as well as in getting them.

Thus, it appears as if the facility of speech should be used advantageously. To do this:

94 Francis P. Robinson and William E. Hall, "Concerning Reading Readiness Tests," Ohio Conference on Reading, Bulletin No. 3 (Columbus: Ohio State University, 1942), p. 11.
The first stage in teaching reading, from this point of view, is to enable the child to think the proper sound when he sees the word, or, to state it psychologically, to enable him to match auditory mental images to visual perceptual images. . . .

The second stage. . . is a "short-circuiting" of this process.95

In order to enable the child to match auditory mental images to visual perceptual images, phonic teaching has necessarily an important part.96 In regard to this concept, the author of the Linguistic Method has written: "In order to read alphabetic writing one must have an ingrained habit of producing the sounds of one's language when he sees the written marks which conventionally represent the phonemes."97

This method of teaching reading follows six developmental stages. The first stage deals with teaching the letters; the second stage develops the ability to read from left to right; the third stage introduces the child to phonemes, unit speech sounds; the fourth stage takes up words of regular spelling and double consonants and other digraphs; the fifth stage teaches semi-irregular spelled words; and the last stage develops the ability to recognize irregular words.

Learning the letters. The child is taught to respond to each letter of the alphabet during the first stage of this

95Dolch, op. cit., p. 28.
96Ibid., pp. 69-70.
reading method. Although the child's first reading will not be composed of words which contain each and every letter of the alphabet, Bloomfield states that this is necessary to ward off upsets by the appearance of unfamiliar shapes. The technique of instruction used at this time is intensive drill exercises, with special attention given to the confusing letters b and d, p and q, and y and g. This aspect of reading is accomplished when the child can name each letter shown to him.

Learning that reading is from left to right. In this method of teaching beginning reading care is taken so that the child learns that reading is a left to right process and that this order corresponds to his speech pattern. An exercise provided for the building of this concept is for children to name each letter in a group of letters, reading from left to right.

Introduction to phonemes. After the child can respond to each letter of the alphabet and name a group of letters in a left to right order, the child is presented with disconnected and senseless syllables to read. The purpose of this type of exercise is to teach the child to read the phonemes, unit speech sounds. Bloomfield declares: "We need not fear to

\[98\textit{Ibid.}, \textit{p. 185}.\]
use disconnected words and even senseless syllables, and, above all, we must not, for the sake of a story, upset the child's scarcely formed habits by presenting him with irregularities of spelling for which he is not prepared. 99

Under this system the first reading material presents each letter in only one phonetic value. If the words in the English language were pronounced as they are spelled and spelled as they are pronounced this would be an easy task, but this is not true, for our twenty-six letters stand for more than forty different sounds. In giving instruction for the use of this method the author warns:

Our first reading material must show each letter in only one phonetic value; thus, if we have words with g in the value that it has in get, got, gun, our first material must not contain words like gem, where the same letter has a different value; similarly, if we have words like cat, can, our first material must not contain words like city. . . . should contain no words with silent letters (such as knit or gnat) and none with double letters, either in the value of single sounds (as in add, bell, call) or in special values (as in see, too), and none with combinations of letters having a special value (as th in thin, or ea in bean). The letter x cannot be used, because it represents the phonemes (ks or gz), and the letter q cannot be used, because it occurs only in connection with an unusual value of the letter u (for w). 100

This type of "reading" continues until the child is thoroughly trained and is reading sentences such as, Nat had a hat.

99 Ibid., p. 186. 100 Ibid., p. 184.
Regular spelling. At this stage of teaching reading the child is taught words whose spelling is regular in form, but which may contain double consonants and other digraphs such as well, shin, chin, see, sea. It is also recommended that a few words of irregular spelling be introduced, such as is, was, the, so that more interesting content be developed.

Semi-irregular spelled words. After the child is able to respond to the regular spelled words, instruction is provided for the study of such words as bone, stone, pole. These words are defined as semi-irregular spelled words. Also at this time the child studies two syllable words as summer, winter, but not as father, mother, and the irregular verbs be and have.

Irregular spelled words. In the last stage, irregular spelled words are introduced and as each word presents a new pattern, each word is a separate unit to be learned by sight. To facilitate learning only words familiar to the children are used, and opportunities are provided to acquaint the child with the content of the story. The reading vocabulary is selected because of its phonetic value.

Using the Linguistic Method as a Classroom Technique

The teacher had selected a story for the day's lesson. The chief characters were a little boy and his dog and a little girl and her kitten. The general theme was that the little girl was very polite, as was the little boy. The boy had trained his dog to be polite also. The girl's kitten
tried to be polite but, imitating the dog, had not learned the proper way to speak, ask for milk, etc. After shaming its mistress and being scolded, the kitten goes out in the neighborhood to learn proper manners. It meets a duck, a chicken, a pig, a cow, and a turkey. Each one tells the kitten how to speak and how to ask for milk politely. The kitten is much confused by the variety of sounds. Finally, it meets a nice old cat who explains the differences and tells the kitten that "Meowl Meowl" is the suitable sound for a polite kitten.

In preparation the teacher had analyzed the story for linguistic elements. She had made lists of the key words. After each word she had written it according to sound-syllable analysis. For special practice material, the teacher had made separate lists of initial consonant and vowel sounds and related words, as quacks, queen, quick, queer, quink, oink.

Teacher: "Has anyone read the story or looked through it?"

Children: "Yes, I've read it." "Part of it." "A little bit." etc.

Teacher: "Do you remember what the story is about?"

Children: "About a kitten." "About a dog and a boy." etc.

Teacher: "What was the kitten trying to do?" (Using the answer to this and other judicious questions, the teacher helped the children develop a consistent idea of the plot and story sequence. She then led them into part-reading.)

"Would you like to take the parts and read the story that way?"

Children: "Yes! I want to be the dog!" "I want to be the kitten, boy, girl, etc."

Teacher: "Let's look through the story and see how many different parts there are. Then we will see who knows the sounds they make. We can let every body who wants to play a part make the sounds. We will listen to them and then decide. Shall we do it that way?"

Children: "There's a pig in it. Who wants to be an old pig - oink, oink, etc."
(The children and teacher go through the story, looking for characters. The teacher reads much of it, various children, other parts. The teacher adds names to list on the chalkboard as new characters are found.)

Teacher: "Now, here's the little boy. What is his name?"

Children: "John."

Teacher: "Yes, Juh-ohn, John. Now, how do you say it, Billy?"

Billy: "Jawn."

Teacher: "Is that correct? Can anyone else make it sound different? Sam, will you try?" (Sam tries several times, then others try. The class listens and decides that Tommy should take the part of John.)

Teacher: "Who can make a sound like the cow does?"

Children: "Moo-Moo!"

Teacher: "What other words do you know that sound like that?"

Children: "Moon, move, etc."

Teacher: "I'll write the words on the board. Then we can practice, so we can make the sounds when we read the story."

(Using her previously prepared list as a source of suggestions, the teacher also accepts suggestions from the children and develops a list of sound words on the chalkboard. This list is then used in extensive drill on the various sounds. Approximately one half of the reading period is spent on this work, in the form of a socialized recitation. The story is then read twice, first with one group of children as the cast of characters, then with a second group. In this way, each child in the group has a chance to take an active part in the reading.)

(For the following reading lesson, these same sounds will be studied in review, before a new selection is taken up for study. For example, "What sound does a duck make?" "How does a turkey talk?" "What other word begins with the same sound that 'quack' does?")
Advantages of the Linguistic Method

This method of teaching beginning reading has the same advantages as attributed to the Phonetic Method. These advantages are that the method aids word recognition, pronunciation, and articulation.

Probably the greatest benefit of the linguistic approach is not in the reading lesson as such - but preferably in the "speech-improvement" class period. In such a period directed by special teachers professionally trained in speech and phonetics, the correction of speech defects and the general improvement of oral English may be considerable.

Another advantage of the Linguistic Method is its use with children who are "word deaf." Although their hearing tests show normal there are occasional children, who by observation, appear to be lacking in auditory acuity. They suffer from poor auditory memory and lack of discrimination between sounds and words. Koehler\textsuperscript{101} in a description of children weak in auditory discrimination advises stress on such practices as telling stories in small groups, oral vocabulary language work, analysis and synthesis of language elements in spelling, and a program of general enrichment of personal experiences and language background.

All too often immature pupils fail to develop an adequate method of word-recognition because they have not been provided with proper ear training exercises. Therefore, the special emphasis on the development of auditory perception is very important. Special care has been taken so that the activities prescribed by the Linguistic Method not only form a bridge from auditory to visual perception, but also emphasis is placed on consistent day-by-day guidance in combining auditory and visual clues in the recognition of new words.

No defense can be given for the use of unrelated drill exercises, tricks, and games. However, each child must be guided to see: (1) that words are made up of symbols - single letters and clusters of letters such as, a-way, (2) that these symbols are associated with sound, and (3) that every reader must understand this association between sound and symbol.102

Limitations of the Linguistic Method

Although extreme forms of word-perception methods are sometimes desirable for teaching reading to certain children, it is unwise to place too much confidence on a reading method which emphasizes only one word-attack technique, as a versatile system is needed. Besides the limitations of presenting

these various areas demand that the reader must have the ability not only to recognize words but also to comprehend, evaluate, interpret, and to draw valid conclusions from given data or statements.

Lack of reading ability has been found to be the cause of much of the failure of retention in the primary grades. Gates in his book, *The Improvement of Reading*, has written:

About ninety-nine percent of the first grade pupils who are retained in the first grade are marked as failures in reading. In the second grade the percent drops to ninety percent, in the third grade, to sixty-eight percent, and in the fourth grade to fifty-six percent.

The results often obtained in reading, we must frankly admit, are not satisfactory. The results are not proportional either to the time devoted to the subject or to the importance of the subject for school success. Therefore, because of the highly important role of reading in school achievement every effort should be made to improve instruction in this field and to increase the reading efficiency of pupils. This may be partially accomplished by a comparative analysis of various reading methods and programs in order to point out needed changes, improve the breadth and quality of reading programs, and reading efficiency of pupils.

---

only one pattern for word-attack the Linguistic Method appears to have the following disadvantages: (1) promotes lip reading, (2) promotes word-naming, (3) promotes the learning of the mechanics of reading rather than comprehension of material, (4) provides an indirect manner of perceiving meaning, and (5) teachers often lack the needed professional training.

**Promotes lip reading.** It has been suggested that excessive emphasis on linguistic elements, enunciation, and pronunciation in oral reading would fix habits of vocal-cord response and lip reading would result. This is refuted by Dolch who claims that lip reading is an effect of slow reading rather than a cause of it, or of the approach to reading through language. Regardless of method, anyone becomes a silent reader as soon as his mental process of comprehension moves too fast for his pronouncing to keep pace.

**Develops word-namers.** As with the Alphabet, Phonic, and Phonetic methods, children taught by a method which primarily emphasizes language are likely to remain "word-namers," needing to vocalize and hesitate after each word as they read to themselves. The more intelligent and linguistically gifted children may make the transition to rapid thought getting through visual channels with a minimum of vocalization. The

less fortunate will continue to have their eyes hobbled by
their tongue, as they read.

**Emphasizes mechanics of reading rather than comprehension.** The Linguistic Method places emphasis on word-recognition rather than on meaning. Hildreth has declared:

> Everything else (besides thought-getting) in the reading process is subordinate to meaning - the thought associations stimulated by words and phrases and the ideas and emotions they arouse. Any other partial process from which the child does not derive ideas - word pronunciation exercises, or phonics, articulation or language drill - is not reading. These activities may facilitate reading, but they do not in themselves constitute reading. If this fact were more clearly understood by teachers, there might be less artificiality in the mechanical aspects of reading instruction and more emphasis on comprehension of reading text.\(^{104}\)

A valid reading program recognizes these facts and attempts to provide the conditions and kinds of guidance needed for best results.

**Provides an indirect manner of perceiving meaning.** Since ears are unable to convey meaning as rapidly as the eyes Werner\(^{105}\) has noted, the reader, trained in the Linguistic Method or in any other approach predominantly oral in character, must adjust his rate of reading to the ability his cerebration centers literally to "listen to inner speech." Intelligent children, impatient at the slow rate of reading

\(^{104}\)Hildreth, op. cit., p. 121.

resulting from a method based on "silent talking to one's self," make more or less successful efforts to reduce the number of steps required to get meaning from the printed symbols. That is, they tend to eliminate the two middle steps pronouncing the words to themselves and of mentally listening to the sounds of the words, moving to the direct method of visual perception and mental interpretation of printed words. As they succeed in these efforts, their speed of silent reading increases. Continued insistence upon following the Linguistic Method makes such efforts somewhat more difficult.

Teachers often lack the needed professional training. Most teachers are unable to distinguish between sounds and letters. Recently a teacher had asked her students to circle every ow having the sound as in owl in the following words: owl, cow, grow, brown, low, clown, snow, and growl. When she was asked to pronounce first owl, cow, brown, clown, growl, and then grow, low, snow; her response was "Oh, I didn't know! They don't sound alike. I never had phonics when I went to school."

The above example is provided only to illustrate the complex pattern of phonetic elements. A few facts that are involved in this complex pattern are: (1) different spellings for the same vowel sound, (2) different sounds for the same spelling, (3) various sounds for the vowels, (4) silent letters, and (5) single sounds and blends.
Never having learned to discriminate between the visual and auditory perception of words teachers are unable adequately and correctly to teach beginning reading by the procedures demanded by the Linguistic Method and are the first to admit it.

Present Status of the Linguistic Method

Assuming the probable effectiveness of a regular program based upon the criteria established for this study, these principles were applied to identify the strengths and weaknesses of the Linguistic Method. The results of such a comparative analysis showed this method negative in most characteristics; however, the criteria are not ultimate; some general principles of learning can not be precisely applied to a particular situation, and the variable factors in any reading program are the students, their purposes, and the teacher's skills and personality. The ultimate criteria of a reading program are measures of changes in the students as they participate in the reading program.

According to the opinion expressed by the judges asked to evaluate this method, the Linguistic Method, was negative in the following characteristics prescribed for an adequate reading program.

---

106 Appendix, pp. 333-334.
1. Understanding of the nature of how children learn.
2. Provision for study of general configuration, striking characteristics of words, picture clues, interpretation and evaluation of material, drawing conclusions, application of information, speed determined by purpose, silent reading, and depth of word meaning.
3. Provision for postponement of reading until readiness has been developed.
4. Emphasis from the beginning on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to thoughtful, meaningful interpretation.
5. Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content.
6. Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading.
7. Provision for developing permanent interests in reading.
8. Provision for individual differences in ability, needs, and interest.
10. Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading.
11. Use of a planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs.

There was, however, complete agreement that provision, thought inadequate, was made for:

1. Use of content clues, phonetic analysis, syllabification, oral reading.
2. Provision for the development of readiness for reading.
3. Increase in vocabulary and content.
4. Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading.
Section IV

Other Synthetic Methods

Of the synthetic methods the Alphabetic, the Alphabetic-Phonic, the Phonetic, and Linguistic are perhaps the best known; however, other synthetic methods of teaching beginning reading have been developed. Of these the Phonoscript, the Dale, and the Sonnenschein are worthy of mention.

The Dale and Sonnenschein Methods

The Dale Method is an elaborate phonic system, which demands the sounding of individual letters; while the Sonnenschein Method of teaching beginning reading is a definite and well worked out syllabic system in which the syllable is taken as the unit of language and analysis stops short at the syllable.

The organization and procedures of instruction designated in reading programs based on these methods offer nothing new to the numerous devices developed for use in other synthetic reading programs.

Winch\textsuperscript{107} attempted to evaluate the merits of the Dale, the Sonnenschein, and the Alphabetic spelling system and concluded after careful testing of well-matched groups, that

the Dale Method ranked first, Alphabetic second, and the Sonnenschein third in regard to the degree of successful reading ability developed. Nevertheless, he believed the rate of reading very slow in the Dale Method and declared that every word seemed to be a problem. "Sounding of the component letters did not, by any means, give the word, and not often the syllabic constituents of it."\textsuperscript{108}

It appears as if these two methods are seriously limited in value as they do not take into consideration that reading is a thinking process and the fundamental aim or goal of reading is to derive meaning from the printed page. Also, the synthetic unit of word study is so small that it often fails to provide adequate means of determining the pronunciation of the word. This is especially true in the Dale Method. Sound the word "utility" letter by letter without syllables, and then try to pronounce the word.\textsuperscript{109}

The Phonoscript Method

Another of the less known synthetic methods of teaching beginning reading is the Phonoscript Method developed by A. E. Hayes. This method is an elaborate and definite system of teaching beginning reading which attempted to refine the Phonic Method.

\textsuperscript{108} Ibid., p. 15. \textsuperscript{109} Ibid.
The Phonoscript Method differs from the Phonic Method primarily in that it was based on a new enlarged alphabet with the sounds built into the letters. Mr. Hayes suggested that diacritical marks be used within or adjacent to every letter, thus each letter would be assigned a distinct character for each simple sound of speech. Silencing marks were also developed for certain letters. The silent letters, called lazy letters by the teacher when explaining them, such as k in know were presented by having a short line under them whenever they occurred, the mark being erased after the word had been explained.\textsuperscript{110}

The reading material was presented by means of words or sentences. These words or sentences were carefully selected so that phonetic elements could be presented in a systematic order. In the beginning the reading selections contained only the "short" vowel sounds and consonants. As progress was made in the reading of these elements, the "long" vowel sounds, the double o (oo) as in good, the au sound as in taught; the ou sound as in how; the ea sound in teach were presented for study.

\textsuperscript{110}Ibid., p. 87.
Section V

Research Findings

Numerous studies have been made to determine the status of synthetic methods of teaching beginning reading. A few of these studies have attempted to provide answers to the following questions: Is English a phonetic language? Does isolated drill on phonetic concepts provide the most effective method of teaching reading? Do synthetic methods encourage skillful reading techniques, such as speed and comprehension?

A survey of the literature shows many experiments which provide data to aid in answering these questions. Space limitations prevent giving a complete review of such findings, thus consideration will only be given to a few.

Is English a phonetic language? In a survey made to determine the phonetic elements of the English language, Burbank reports that an overwhelming majority 86.9 percent of the words and syllables in English are phonetic.

Regardless of the above findings the use of phonetic elements as a basis for a method of teaching beginning reading cannot be determined unless the specific vocabulary to be taught is known, as it would be futile if phonograms taught did not appear in the reading books and if the phonograms selected were a key to only a few words, such as or in parlor.

---

The relative value of letter sounds and combinations have been investigated by Osburn. His investigation consisted of a phonetic analysis of the first 2,500 words in the Thorndike List. In his study it was found that of these 2,500 words, 186 were non-phonetic, such as have, once, sugar, sew, etc. The remaining words could be unlocked by means of a knowledge of phonetics.

Recognizing that a child who is unable to sound out unfamiliar words is handicapped in his independent reading, but questioning this as justification for the usual phonic methods of instruction, the introduction of initial sounds in the first grade and completion of the teaching of phonetic elements in the third grade, Dolch pointed out that the basis of phonics in the primary grades should be upon monosyllables, including inflectional endings such as ed, us, ing, etc.

Reasoning that the child will as his vocabulary grows, be forced to adopt his knowledge of phonics learned from one-syllable words to polysyllabic words, Dolch also investigated the type and amount of transfer of learning necessary. His findings indicated that phonograms were contained as

---

112 Worth James Osburn, Remedial and Follow-Up Work Bulletins in Silent Reading (Bloomington, Ill.: Public School Publishing Co., 1922).
114 Ibid.
The various methods used in teaching beginning reading and the lack of understanding concerning basic assumptions. In our schools beginning reading is taught by a diversity of methods. Factors which appear to contribute to this fact are the very complexity of the reading process, the search for standardized methods which might have universal application and which might be taught in a mechanical fashion, and certain changes in the school curriculum resulting from the changing concept of how children learn. Decisions as to which method of beginning reading is to be used will be influenced by first grade teachers particularly as they become professionally competent to present a case for the method they prefer. Primary teachers will have some influence, as well as will teachers at intermediate grade levels. Principals and supervisors of elementary schools also will exert influence as to methods used as they are intimately associated with the problems and practices of teaching reading throughout the grades. Teachers in the secondary schools exert more influence than is generally recognized, although their reactions are usually negative. That is, they take the position of consumers of the reading skills which they assume to be rather completely developed in the elementary grades. Since children continue to be normal and exhibit a variety of abilities, interests, weaknesses, and disinterests, the skills of reading never are completely developed in the
syllables in only 11.6 per cent of the polysyllables and that in the other words, the syllables broke-up or cut-across phonograms. This would indicate that teaching phonograms was of little help in learning polysyllables. Therefore, Dolch concluded that teaching letter phonics was more useful than work on phonograms as phonograms do not correspond to syllables in polysyllabic words, for example the word "important" divided by phonograms becomes im-p-or-t-ant.

Carrying his vocabulary study one step further, Dolch identified 1,255 different syllables in the total of 8,509 syllables composing the sample of 14,000 running words. A frequency list showed ing used most often, occurring in 240 words, while tween occurred twenty times although appearing only in the word "between" which came up that number of times in the list of running words. Since frequency of a syllable may result from repetition of a word, Dolch suggested that such unusual syllables not be separately analyzed but the containing words be learned at sight.

Making a list of the one hundred syllables of most frequent occurrence when each word was used only once, Dolch again found ing most frequent, occurring in 135 different words. The next three syllables in frequency of occurrence were ed, in 90 words, a in 74 words, and ly, in 72 words. He observed that many prefixes and suffixes considered important in sounding-out polysyllables and emphasized in teaching do not occur frequently.
It is clear that the teaching of syllables is inconsistent with the realities of pronunciation. The great number and variety of syllables occurring in reading material make formal instruction on syllables as separate forms quite unrealistic. Thus, Dolch concluded that competence in identifying both common and unfamiliar syllables is the child's best resource in meeting the many polysyllables he will inevitably face in reading.

Does isolated drill on phonetic concepts provide the most effective method of teaching reading? Donald Agnew conducted an experiment covering a three year period to determine the effect of varied amounts of phonetic training on reading ability in the primary grades in the schools of Raleigh and Durham, North Carolina. From data collected Agnew concluded:

The answer to this question can be given only when the purposes of teaching primary reading have been agreed upon. If the basic purpose in the teaching of primary reading is the establishment of skills measured in this study (namely independence in word recognition, ability to work out the sounds of new words, efficiency in word pronunciation, accuracy in oral reading, certain abilities in silent reading, and the ability to recognize a large vocabulary of written words), the investigation would support a policy of large amounts of phonetic training. If, on the other hand, the purposes of primary reading are concerned with "joy in reading," "social experiences," the present interests, et cetera, the investigations reported offer no data as to the usefulness of phonetic training.115

Thus, according to Agnew's report reading is a complex process, which is more than pronouncing words; and in evaluation of methods, consideration must be given to such factors, as purpose, the student, the teacher's personality and skill.

In an attempt to answer this question Harry Tate conducted two carefully directed parallel studies using controlled groups. These studies were designed to secure evidence of the influence of formal phonic instruction on silent reading ability at the first grade level. The experimental and control groups were selected by an alphabetic-odd-even technique at the time of the home room assignments. This division of pupils worked rather well since test results showed that although the control group began the experiment with a very small advantage in I.Q. it was so slight that the experimenter stated it was "statistically negligible."

In conducting these experiments both groups were divided into two sections. The experimental group was provided with a special fifteen minute period for special instruction and formal drill in phonics plus a fifteen minute period in which the Phonic Method was used with basic and supplementary material.

116 Harry L. Tate, "The Influence of Phonics on Silent Reading in Grade I," Elementary School Journal, XXXVIII (June, 1937), 752-763.
In the control group the use of the Phonic Method was rigidly avoided. Their thirty minute reading period was spent in three ten minute periods devoted to intensive work on recognition of words, phrases, and word meanings.

Extensive data were collected on both groups throughout the experiment, including test results, daily samples of work and progress charts, lesson plans, parent's reports, and daily log or diary, and teachers' observational notes and comments. On the basis of an analysis of all the data, Tate reached the following conclusions:

1. The Phonetic Method is superior to the Word Method, or Look-and-Say Method, as a technique for developing the ability to recognize words independently.

2. There is some evidence to indicate that the Word Method is more effective than the Phonetic Method in developing comprehension of the meaning of sentences.

3. There is conclusive evidence that the Word Method is superior to the Phonetic Method as a means of promoting ability to comprehend paragraphs.

4. While the data are not conclusive, they indicate that regular drill periods in phonics are undesirable.

5. Analysis of the evidence indicate, tentatively that phonics should be used as a corollary tool rather than as subject-matter in beginning reading.

6. A strong inference from the data is that overemphasis on phonics retards and even hinders speed and completeness of comprehension.

Three years later Tate conducted a follow-up study. The purpose of this investigation was to determine the effect of the complete omission of instruction in phonics.
The experimental and control groups were selected and matched on the composite basis of mental age, readiness, and maturity. The experimental groups (three in number) were taught by the Word Method with careful avoidance of all phonic concepts. The control groups followed the Word Method modified by the addition of phonic instruction as a supplementary aid, that is with the teachers introducing essential elements of phonics incidentally.

Data from this study showed:

1. Reading performance equal to the norms of accepted standardized tests can be achieved by the Word Method without any modification to include phonics, whether such modification be formal or informal.

2. The Word Method modified by incidental use of phonics is more effective than the formal method in developing ability to recognize words and to comprehend sentences and paragraph meanings.

Analysis of the data from both parts of the experiments conducted by Tate indicate that the modified Word-Phonetic Method is more adaptable for use by teachers in their daily work than is the rigid interpretation of either the Phonetic or Word Method. If the Word Method by the planned use of phonics in an incidental fashion may be termed a separate method, a further generalization may be reached. This further extension of Tate's conclusion is that the combined Word-Phonetic Method is superior to both the Word Method (non-phonetic) and the Phonetic (non-word) method in developing comprehension. There seems little doubt that a child who
cannot sound out new words for himself is handicapped in his independent reading.

**Do synthetic methods encourage skill reading techniques?** From an analysis of investigations concerning the use of phonics in beginning reading Smith reached conclusions which may be summarized in the following manner: It appears that instruction in phonics is a handicap only if presented as formal drill, isolated from reading, and in long practice periods. Programs for teaching reading should include instruction in means of attacking unfamiliar words, such as: finding a small word within a large word, analysis and synthesis of compound words, sounding out syllables of polysyllabic words, comparison of words with corresponding pictures, using other known words in sentences to obtain clues from context. Instruction in phonics helps children attack new words, but readiness for phonics normally does not develop until children are in the second grade. Hence, the benefit of phonics is more obvious when such teaching is somewhat delayed. The most effective procedure is to use phonics as a supplement to other methods, teaching children enough phonics so that they can attack any word by sounding out its separate letters. The functional approach to phonics, using sounds of letters and syllables informally

---

and incidentally, is more effective than either the Phonetic Method or the Word Method when the latter methods are used in their "pure form" without modification.

To compare the eye-movements of children taught by phonic and non-phonic methods Buswell made photographic records of the eye-movements of children taught with strong emphasis on phonic analysis. This study showed that the eyes proceed across the lines in regular fashion, methodically attacking and pronouncing each word as it is met and experiencing little confusion from non-recognition of words. However, it was observed that they had little concern for the meanings of the content. In other words, they were doing syllable sounding and word reading. The records of children taught by non-phonic methods disclosed many regressive movements, long pauses as a result of confusion in ways of attacking new words, and irregular eye-movements across the lines. Additional checks, however, showed that these readers were vitally interested in the meanings of what they had read.

The Newark Phonics Experiment, a controlled experiment to test the value of phonetics in the beginning reading, was conducted in eight schools in Newark, New Jersey, from September, 1924 to February, 1927, under the leadership of

---

118 Buswell, op. cit., pp. 103-105.

Elmer K. Sexton. The general design of the experiment was that the two IB grades (first half of the first grade) of the same school would be used. One teacher would provide phonetic training while the other teacher would eliminate such from her reading program. At mid-term promotion the same teaching techniques would continue but under different teachers and the teachers who introduced the study would take two new IB grades but reverse their teaching procedure. This study involved 1,000 pupils and 7,000 test papers were evaluated.

The results showed that: (1) early introduction of phonetic concepts was of little value, (2) the value of ability to analyze words through phonetic sounding increased with grade level and at the second grade level it was of great value, (3) there was immeasurably less difference between classes taught without phonics than between schools, and (4) the quality of the teacher's ability played an important part on the results - good teachers secured "good" results regardless of method used.

Using matched groups in each of the first three grades in Franklin and Telton, New Hampshire, Currier and Duguid experimented for five years with the effects of teaching phonics. Their conclusions were:

---

120 Currier and Duguid, op. cit., pp. 286-287.
1. Children trained in phonics generally read with less speed, with less interest, with greater fatigue, and with confusion of ideas.

2. Children having no drill in phonics read with greater interest, increased speed, and with more expression. Fatigue was much reduced; remembrance and reproduction of stories very good. These children were careless in pronunciation and used more or less word substitution.

3. Children with speech impediments, those with previously formed bad habits of pronunciation, and those with foreign language backgrounds were much helped by phonic training.

4. Children who were expressionless, hesitant, or habitually slow in reading were not helped by phonics, but were greatly helped by quick-perception (flash card) methods and by sense-content (sentence and story) methods.

5. In sight work - attacking new words - there was little difference between the average ability of those having phonetic training and those not having it.121

Arthur I. Gates in two experiments, using the equivalent group technique of investigation in the Horace Mann School and four groups of children in the New York Public School, concluded that: (1) the children taught by a Phonic Method had a better knowledge of the phonetic elements of the language, (2) the non-phonic group showed superior ability in word recognition, (3) the perceptual span of the non-phonic group was larger, (4) there was no difference in accurate pronunciation displayed, and (5) the non-phonic group showed superior attainment in comprehension of reading material.

Mr. Gates draws the following implication from this study: "If it were necessary to choose between the two different forms of training studied, the non-phonetic training would be selected."

Storm and Smith summarize the data obtained from experimental evidences regarding the value of the Phonetic Method of teaching reading in the following manner:

1. Investigation has shown that a very small percentage of the general rank and file of first-grade pupils in public schools develop and apply the ability to generalize and blend sounds unaided and without training.

2. Children who possess this natural phonetic sense, which they develop of their own accord and independently apply, should be excused from practice and given exercises designed to develop reading abilities other than word recognition.

3. An overemphasis of phonics establishes such harmful habits as progressing in small units, narrow eye-voice span and a too explicit articulation and comprehension.

4. Training in word-analysis should constitute only one part of a well-balanced program, a program which also makes provision for the development of appreciation, comprehension, interpretation, speed, and good-habits of eye-movements.

5. The teaching of phonics should be deferred until pupils have developed a desire to read, have acquired a fairly good vocabulary of sight words, have had practice in reading narrative material, and have begun to notice likenesses and differences in words.

6. The work in word analysis should have a close connection with needs arising in the reading lesson.

\[122\] Ibid., pp. 225-226.
grades. Hence, those secondary-school teachers, who expect a generally high level of reading performance, but avoid responsibility for building it, find it easy to blame the elementary school, and the criticism tends to filter down to beginning reading methods. And, whatever method of beginning reading is being used, the implications are, humanly enough, that the method is at fault.

Ultimately, however, definite decisions must be made. Policy-making decisions of far-reaching character must be made by the superintendent. In the nature of our school advancement policy, few superintendents are familiar with the technical details of methods of teaching beginning reading. They are not to be blamed, for who has heard of a school superintendent who had taught first grade? More often than not, his experiential background includes high-school subject-matter, coaching, or guidance duties. Nevertheless, he is the one who makes the decisions, whether or not he knows the research field, the comparative strengths and weaknesses of the methods, or the curriculum pattern involved in the selection of any one method.

It seems inescapable that, in view of the realities of public-school practice, the primary teachers themselves must accept responsibility for thoroughly understanding the "methods of their trade," for reaching sound decisions based upon careful comparisons of methods, for providing school
7. Such training should proceed from the larger units to the smaller ones and from the known words or elements to the unknown, or new, words or elements.

8. Pupils should be taught both to blend the preceding consonant with the succeeding vowel, and the succeeding consonant with the preceding vowel, according to the frequency with which the different combinations are found.\textsuperscript{123}

\textsuperscript{123}Storm and Smith, \textit{op. cit.}, pp. 248-249.
CHAPTER VI

ANALYTICAL METHODS

Somewhat contradictory to the synthetic or part methods, the analytical or whole methods introduce the learner to whole units, such as words, phrases, or sentences, or a story, as the point of departure in learning to read. The central idea is to help the learner to develop as rapidly as possible the ability to gain ideas from reading. After the basic ability to read has been acquired the learner's attention is directed to analyzing the wholes, breaking them down into elements for further study. In this group may be placed the following methods: (1) the Word Method, (2) the Sentence Method, (3) the Story Method, (4) the Intrinsic Method, (5) the Silent Method, (6) the Picture-Story, and (7) the Non-Oral Method.

Basic Assumptions

The analytical methods of teaching beginning reading are based on the following assumptions:

1. The physical act of reading is a visual function.


3. Reading by words, phrases or sentences increases both speed and comprehension of reading.
4. Words or whole sentences are easier to read than syllables or letters.

5. Individuals perceive the whole before they analyze the whole into parts.

The physical act of reading is a visual function. In the act of reading English printed symbols the eyes move in a "jerky" manner across the page in a left to right direction. The words are commonly recognized as wholes by their general configuration. The individual visual characteristics of words are most important as the number of tall or short letters, double letters, and the tails of the g, j, p, and y are often the determiners of identification.

Many children learning to read remember the main characteristics of visual stimuli, but ignore the details; thus was is read saw and the words on and no are frequently confused. Any abnormal vision or immature perceptual ability may result in a vague and incorrect image of words.

When the reader fails to recognize a word by its general pattern, he must stop and analyze it. This process usually involves first a visual study for any peculiarities of size and form or a known part, and second a search for phonetic or syllabic elements to aid him in fusing the parts into wholes.

Visual discrimination develops earlier than auditory discrimination. Some writers\(^1\) have recommended that

---

\(^1\)Edward W. Dolch and M. Blooms ter, "Phonic Readiness," Elementary School Journal, XXXVIII (November, 1937), 201-205.
instruction in phonics postponed until the child has reached a mental age of seven years and six months. Although most children enter school with well-developed speaking and hearing vocabularies and can distinguish readily between different sounds, several letters are so similar that unless hearing is acute and well-trained they may be used incorrectly. Therefore, the child should have considerable experience with oral communication before he is introduced to the task of associating speech sounds with the letter sounds.

Reading by words, phrases, or sentences increases both speed and comprehension. Procedures which emphasize letter-calling or phonetic sounding causes the child to make numerous eye fixations as he attempts to read a line of print. Consequently such procedures complicate and slow-up the reading process and subordinate reading for thought to the mechanics of reading. The reader becomes so intent in attempting to recognize the parts that often the meaningful whole is neglected. The following sentence, presented as it would be taught in alphabetic, phonic, and sentence methods, serves to illustrate this viewpoint:

S-e-e- t-h-e- c-a-t.
S-ee th-e cuh-at.
See the cat.
Words or whole sentences are easier to read than syllables or letters. Proponents of the analytical methods of teaching beginning reading claim that words and whole sentences are easier to read than syllables or letters because of contextual clues presented.

Using the tachistoscopic or short-exposure technique, Cattell found that the reader does not ordinarily read by letters but by the whole-word unit and that the average adult reader could apprehend equally well three or four unrelated letters, two unrelated words (up to about two letters), or a short sentence of four words (approximately twenty-four letters).²

Individuals perceive the whole before they analyze the whole into parts. This assumption is based on Gestalt psychology. The classic illustration which is basic to this concept is the phenomenon which was propounded by Wertheimer; it is illustrated by a moving picture show; we do not see separate frames, but a continuous moving picture show. A person sees a car and says "car." He identifies the car by its total shape before he studies the details of the design to determine its make and model. Similarly the reader perceives the whole word before he analyzes it into its parts.

Pedagogical Principles

Based upon the assumptions of the analytical methods, teaching procedures observe two principles. These principles are:

1. The association of the written symbol with the ideas represented by the symbols.
2. The decomposing of the written symbols into parts to help recognition.

The successive stages in presentation of reading as a process should be: the ideas or thoughts to be considered, the symbols conveying the ideas or thought, and finally the individual sounds and letters.

The methods represent marked progress in understanding the nature of learning and adapting procedures of teaching reading more consistent with principles of learning. Thus, reading taught by analytical methods should be more meaningful and hence easier to learn.

Despite the improvements over the synthetic methods, the analytical methods have serious limitations. Three major limitations are:

1. There is the assumption that meaning resides in the words, rather than in the persons reading.
2. It seems as if it is assumed that learning to read is largely a mental process which can go on without physical activity. This reflects the old physical idea of dualism or separation of "mind" and "body."
3. These methods tend to ignore the principle of learning that the learner's interest is basic to his efforts, or assume that consistent application of a formal method will result in the pupil's learning to read regardless of his interest in the materials presented to him.
Thoughtful students of instruction in reading found increasing causes for criticism of the effectiveness of methods in use. Constructive analysis of the weaknesses of the Alphabetic and Phonetic methods resulted in the conclusion that children could learn more easily and faster by focusing attention upon words before studying their separate letters or the sounds of speech units. Advancing this trend of thought, Samuel Worcester in 1826 outlined the Word Method of teaching reading in his Primer of the English Language.

The Word Method gained wide acceptance although not completely replacing earlier procedures. Many teachers simply incorporated the newer method into their practices, thus using a hodge-podge of three methods: Alphabetic, Alphabetic-Phonic, and the Word Method.

The Word Method is sometimes called the Look-and-Say or Sight Method. The various names for this method point to the two major characteristics of the procedure: its emphasis upon reading as a visual process and its consideration of the word as the basic unit of reading. Some writers designate it as the Word Method because individual words are presented and studied separately, one at a time, before words are put together as phrases or sentences. Other writers term it the Sight Method because sight recognition of a pre-selected
basic vocabulary is emphasized, primarily through flash-card drills, while a few refer to it as the Look-and-Say because children are encouraged to examine the word and pronounce it.

Historical Development

John Amos Comenius, born March 28, 1592 in Nivnitz, Moravia, is given credit for the development of the Word Method of teaching beginning reading.

In the beginning when Comenius was perfecting his method, he corresponded with other writers interested in school reform. Perhaps he received more help from Vogel than from other educators of his day.

Vogel, who was head-master of the Paedagogium at Göttingen, had developed a program for teaching Latin which began instruction by teaching an alphabetical list of simple words with their corresponding German meanings. After these words had been learned they were to be combined into sentences. This system was probably in Comenius's thoughts when he developed his program.

Although Comenius altered his system numerous times the usual procedures were for instruction to be graded according to difficulty and to begin with objects. These objects were to be discussed in the vernacular, Latin being the

---

academic language; so that understanding would be assured. The beginning of reading was to be by means of recognition of isolated words.

After the learning of long lists of words, sentences were constructed which used these words. These sentences were presented first in the vernacular and then in the Latin. The presentation of the Latin should adhere to the following procedures: First, they were translated by the teacher, so the pupils would completely understand them; second, they were read and reread by the children and then they were to be memorized. After this study, grammar would be considered and the reading of Latin material.

It is apparent that Comenius's method demanded almost as much preparation for reading as the Alphabetic and Phonic methods, but he did contribute to education the introduction of an analytic method of instruction, the concepts that instruction must be carefully graded, and that meanings between symbols and objects should be developed.

Others, who advocated the Word Method of teaching beginning reading, were Jacotot and Decroly. The procedures suggested by these French educators involved presenting the child first with a few individual words. The words were so selected that they could readily be arranged into sentences and small stories.
Although forms of the word method were used by a few teachers from the days of Comenius, the basic idea of the Word Method was not proposed in America until 1828 when Samuel Worcester published his Primer of the English Language. Smith cites Worcester's idea as follows:

It is not, perhaps very important that a child know the letters before he begins to read. It (the child) may learn first to read words by seeing them, hearing them pronounced, and having their meanings illustrated, and afterwards it may learn to analyze them or name the letters of which they are composed.4

While Worcester's suggestion attracted some notice the Word Method received scant attention until the Bumstead and Webb's readers appeared.5

Like many another development in education, the Word Method gained the support of thoughtful students of the learning process but was accepted slowly by the classroom teachers. Smith6 states that the major change was limited to the first few weeks of beginning reading when children learned whole words. As soon as a small word-vocabulary was built, attention was shifted to part-learnings. Teachers drilled children on phonic elements and spelling with as much emphasis as did those using the Alphabetic-Phonic Method.

---

5Ibid., p. 87. 6Ibid., p. 90.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The author is indebted for assistance in preparing the manuscript to Dr. Lowry W. Harding for his stimulating encouragement, helpful advice, and aids of many kinds; to Dr. Sidney L. Pressey, Dr. Wilda Rosebrook, and Dr. Kenneth Arisman for many helpful criticisms and suggestions.

Acknowledgment is due also to Mrs. Esther J. Bone, Reference Assistant, Kent State University, who has graciously and efficiently supplied me with materials; and to the five judges, members of Kent State University, who kindly gave their time to evaluate the various reading methods.

And finally, an incalculable debt of gratitude is due my father, for his constant and inexhaustible supply of help, faith, and inspiration.
administrators with data essential for wise decisions on methodology, and for guiding changing practice through sound but simple interpretations of method to the lay public.

Now administrators and teachers have reason to be proud of the reading materials and methods used in most of our schools. However, too many educators are unable to help parents understand the method of instruction being used in helping children read. Teachers and administrators can only interpret their reading programs to members of the community as they understand the principles, techniques, and basic assumptions which underlie the teaching method. In order to provide this information to the public it appears that many educators need an analytical study of characteristic factors of programs in beginning reading.

The Procedures

The organization of this study was designed in the following steps. First, a survey of the literature was made to determine the various beginning reading methods and programs. Second, the methods were classified as belonging to one of the following schemes: synthetic, analytical, or functional. Third, the criteria were set as an aid in comparing the value of the various methods. Fourth, the various methods and programs were compared. Last, a summary and interpretation of data were presented.
Description of the Word Method

This method of teaching beginning reading is based on the psychological principle that objects are recognized as wholes before, or rather than by, discrimination and identification of parts. A person sees an animal — says "elephant." He identifies the elephant by its total shape before picking out tail, trunk, large palm-leaf ears, and other details. Similarly a reader sees the word "crocodile" and thinks a mind-picture of a large lizard-like animal or says "crocodile," before pausing to identify the c, r, o and other individual letters in the word.

The aim of the so-called Word Method is the mastery of the word, which is presented and learned as a whole. Laing has remarked that this method of teaching beginning reading does not deal with the reading process: it aims primarily at word mastery.

In the Word Method of teaching beginning reading consideration is given to word introduction, drill, review, sentence, and story reading as well as to the development of a core vocabulary and word lists.

Introduction of words. The teacher writes a word on the chalk board and pronounces it. After the class has heard the word, they are asked to look at it carefully and then say

---

It. This type of exercise continues until the children can give the correct response to the several words on the board. Each word presented on the board is also written on a small card. These cards are kept in stacks and frequently are the content for drill exercises. They are later used to form short sentences, which the children read.

Drill. The technique used in these drills is for the card to be held up for all to see, blank side to the children. As it is "flashed" i.e. turned word-side to the children, they speak its name. Hence, the term "flash card." Flash card drill occupies a prominent place in the method. The purposes of such an activity are to build speed in visual recognition and accuracy in attaching correct "names" to the words.

Review. Word games are used frequently as a means to provide "content" for extensive repetition of words and motivation for drill. Although the specific design for the games may vary, they generally are built on the following themes:

- **Word-picture game** in which two sets of cards are presented to the child. On one card is a word; on another, a picture which describes it, and the children are encouraged to match picture and word.

- **Chalkboard game** in which words are on the chalkboard. A typical game is "Climbing the ladder." The teacher draws a ladder putting a word on each rung, easier words at bottom, harder ones at top. One child at a time is asked to "climb" the ladder by identifying the words.
Flash-card games: Typical of this type of game is "Choose a Word." The teacher stands a number of flash-card words on the chalk-tray and asks the children one at a time, to get a word he knows, bring it to her and tell her what it is.

Games involving physical play: This type of game is usually based on flash-cards also, or the teacher's writing the words on the chalkboard. Typically is "streetcar." The children are seated in a semicircle before the teacher. One child is conductor, who stands behind the first chair in the semicircle. The teacher flashes a word car and the "conductor" tries to say it before it is named by the child seated in the chair. If the "conductor" wins he moves behind the next chair; if not, the seated child becomes the conductor.

The use of games as a motivating factor has several disadvantages. One of the dangers is that the intense competitive atmosphere developed by such games promotes emotional tension which may hinder rather than aid the child's learning to read. Also the mere calling of a word name does not indicate the child is reading. Therefore, such practices must be evaluated in terms of what they may teach.

Reading sentences and stories. As the children learn to recognize words as wholes, the words are used to form sentences and stories.

The general procedures used for the presentation of the sentences and stories are as follows: (1) the new words in the reader are presented by means of blackboard and flash-card drill, (2) the words are presented to the children in sentences usually on the blackboard, and (3) the sentences
containing these words compose a story which is presented to the children in a reader. As a result of the limited words that can be used in developing the sentences and stories, the material in the primers is often dull, meaningless, and inane.

**The core vocabulary.** As a means of reducing the reading difficulty of materials used in the primary grades, it is frequently advised that the basal and supplementary readers selected for use contain related materials in similar vocabularies. That is, have similar stories written in a restricted vocabulary, with high frequency of repetition of words. Sounds good, if stimulus-response behaviorism were the whole story. Then learning to read would be a matter of reading stories with the same few words repeated over and over, cutting brain-grooves deeper and deeper. Unfortunately for this approach, "naming" the words apparently is not enough. Meanings must be developed through association with appropriate related experiences. But the idea is so logical, so easy to follow, that it dies hard.

**Word lists.** For the teacher to determine accurately reading growth, as well as to select words which are sufficiently important for planned use in vocabulary building, reference to an appropriate word list is necessary. The following word lists should be especially useful for these purposes:

This list is one of the most widely used by writers of reader-texts for the beginning levels. It includes 1811 words selected by frequent distributions from reading materials in use in the primary grades. The tabulation is presented in groups of 500 words, each group selected on the basis of relative frequency of occurrence.

A Core Vocabulary for Pre-Primer Reading, R. G. Langston, The Elementary School Journal, XLI (July, 1941), 766-773.

This is one of the most useful lists available for first-grade teachers, especially for those teachers who use the experience method, as it is brief and practical for guidance in constructing reading charts. It is composed of only 79 words, representing the most frequently used words in thirty-two pre-primers.


This is a compilation of words from an analysis of representative reading material, and includes 220 words which, on the basis of the sampling, make up fifty per cent of the running words in elementary school readers. According to the author's studies, the words in this list should be recognized at sight by children at the third-grade level.


The list includes 2164 words selected by a word count of books at each reading level from pre-primer through third reader, with twenty-one books being analyzed for each level. An additional analysis was made of other word lists. With each word is included the textbook reading level, as pre-primer, primer, first reader, et cetera. This list is useful for identifying the vocabulary level of any given group of children, according to the grade level at which the writers of reader-texts think various words should be known.

Based upon an analysis of 369 readers, this list contains 1957 words. The readers analyzed were pre-primers, 84; primers, 69; first readers, 84; second readers, 85; and third readers, 47. The numbers of words included at various grade levels are: pre-primers, 57; primer, 157; first reader, 334; second reader, 509; and third reader, 901. The criterion for selection of words was inclusion in at least one-third of the books at pre-primer and primer levels; in at least one-fourth of the books examined at first, second, and third reader levels.


The original volume is the familiar Teachers Word Book, which includes 10,000 most frequently words. A revision doubled the number of words and this latest version adds an addition of 10,000. It is based on a count of ten million words, part of which are in children's books and part from books written for adult reading. For each word a special symbol indicates its frequency rank according to a scale by thousands. Words in the list of five thousand most frequently used are further marked to show whether they occur in the first or second half of the thousand. The list is so comprehensive as to be unwieldy, and only the special markings of words in the five thousand most frequently used are likely to make this reference useful to classroom teachers. It is widely used as a master list, for reference in research and for guidance in textbook writing.


This list contains more than 19,000 words, presented in alphabetical order, with grade-placement indicated by special markings. The frequency rating on the earlier Thorndike list, grade-placement according to an association formula made by the authors, and the placement according to eight-word lists are given. This list is especially useful for showing clearly the confusion or lack of agreement regarding grade-placement of reading vocabulary.

This is one of the briefest and most useful of word lists, as far as the teacher's planning and guidance of daily work is concerned. The list is composed of 100 words selected from reading materials designed for use with various methods of beginning reading. Kyte attempted to collect words that would serve as a basic core reading vocabulary, useful in all aspects of school activities. The 100 words in Kyte's list are as follows:

| 1  | go   | all   | that   |
| 2  | a    | went  | name   |
| 3  | the  | her   | school |
| 4  | and  | when  | are    |
| 5  | my   | for   | much   |
| 6  | to   | you   | out    |
| 7  | is   | has   | much   |
| 8  | we   | very  | much   |
| 9  | in   | little| much   |
| 10 | like | they  | Santa Claus | 80 party |
| 11 | it   | good  | said   | am |
| 12 | he   | had   | then   | going |
| 13 | on   | snow  | father | sister |
| 14 | was  |      | time   | man   |
| 15 | me   | some  | snowman|      |
| 16 | play | day   | new    |      |
| 17 | with | can   | toys   |      |
| 18 | dog  | got   | so     |      |
| 19 | she  | baby  | will   |      |
| 20 | of   | him   | every  |      |
| 21 | too  | do    | saw    |      |
| 22 | Christmas | house | big   |      |
| 23 | doll | there | home  |      |
| 24 | one  | his   | every  |      |
| 25 | two  | likes | nice   |      |

The writers of literary materials for children have not yet sacrificed their ideas of plot and artistic modes of expression to any standardized conception of which few hundred words should be introduced in grades, one, or two, or three.
They are still creating stories for children and writing their stories in words that seem most fitting for the story they carry. For these children who have been fortunate enough to enjoy rich experiences with many beautiful books of literary quality, a standardized vocabulary list is as good a fit as a wooden shoe for a ballet dancer.

Using the Word Method As a Classroom Technique

The purpose of the following lesson is to develop (1) the immediate recognition of the following words: cat, dog, see, the, and; (2) an understanding that reading is a left to right process.

Teacher: "Every eye this way! Watch! The chalk is going to write something." (The teacher writes the word cat on the chalkboard) . . . "Look carefully. This word is cat. . . . Now, class, tell me what this word is?"

Class: "Cat."

Teacher: "Yes. George, what is this word?"

George: "Cat."

Teacher: "Now, the chalk is going to say another word." (She writes dog) . . . "This time the word is dog. . . . Let's say it together."

Class: "Dog."

Teacher: "This word, Patty?" (She points to the word cat.)

Patty: "Cat."

Teacher: (She writes the word see on the board.) "This word says see. Look at it carefully. What does it say?"
"See."

"Now, close your eyes. Can you see it in your mind's eye?"

"Yes."

"Open your eyes and say the word." (She points to see.)

"See."

(This type of presentation continues for the words the and and.)

"This time the chalk will tell you something. . . . Watch." (She writes See the cat.) . . . "Who can read it? . . . Billy?"

"See the cat."

(The following sentences are developed in the same way: See the dog. See the dog and cat.)

"That was good reading. . . . We have a few minutes to see how many apples you can pick."

(She now pulls down a chart on which a large apple tree has been drawn. On the apples the following words have been written: dog, cat, the, see, and.)

"How many can you pick, Tom?"

"Dog, cat, the."

"Tom picked three. How many can you pick, Susie?"

"Dog, cat, see, the, and."

"Susie picked all of them. Who else thinks he can pick all the apples?"

(This game continues until each child has had a turn.)

"That was fine. Tomorrow we will learn some more words. Now, we must take our seats. Please go back to your seats as quietly as you can."
Reading Programs Based
Upon the Word Method

The underlying assumption of reading programs based upon the Word Method approach to reading is that the child "sees a word as a whole." Thus, the teaching procedures used in these reading programs are for the teacher to pronounce the word and direct the child to look carefully at the word. The child then says the word and through extensive drill learns to recognize the word immediately and later to read it in sentences and short stories. The name of the word is supposed to be associated with the whole-word form.

Early reading programs which advocated such an approach to beginning instruction were those proposed by Bumstead, Webb, Tower, and Summers.

The Bumstead Reading Program

In 1840 Bumstead published a little book entitled My Little Primer. In defending his approach to reading he stated:

The general practice has been to begin with the alphabet, and drill the child upon the letters... until he is supposed to have acquired them. This method [the alphabetic], so irksome and vexatious to both teachers and scholar is now giving place to another, which experience has proved to be more philosophical, intelligent, pleasant, and rapid. It is that of beginning with familiar and easy words, instead of letters.9

---


Classification of methods. The various methods of teaching beginning reading were classified as synthetic, analytic, and functional.

**Synthetic methods** are those systems which proceed from letters or sounds to words, sentences, etc.

**Analytic methods** are those systems which proceed from the whole (the word, sentence, or story) to smaller elements.

**Functional methods** are those systems in which the art of reading is developed in a purposeful manner and the procedures or techniques employed are developed to merge the process of learning to read and reading to learn.

Establishing the criteria. The criteria were developed to supply an element of definiteness in the comparison of the values of various methods which could not be fully supplied by non-quantitative descriptions. In the development of the criteria the following steps were taken:

Step one - A definition of reading was stated as a basis for the criteria of an adequate reading method.
Bumstead introduced reading material by means of a word list. These words were selected on the basis of being meaningful to the child and were organized according to related meanings. For example, Lesson One, enumerated parts of the human head, while Lesson Two listed parts of the human body.

The Webb Reading Program

In 1846 John Russell Webb, a graduate of New York State Normal School in Albany, published a primer which he called The New Word Method. By 1855 he had completed his entire series of Normal Readers. This reading program was organized around word recognition and sounding of letters.

The Tower Reading Program

During the early introduction of the Word Method in America one of the popular texts was the Gradual Primer. Its author, David B. Tower, was at one time the principal of Eliot Grammar School in Boston. His series of readers was among the first written by professional workers in elementary education.

In common with a number of others, Tower "straddled the fence" on the question of Alphabetic Method versus Word Method and avoided comment on the place of phonics as it is

\[10\] Lila B. Smith, op. cit., p. 94.
very human characteristic to guarantee the plum, no matter which pudding it is in, and hope that which ever was merely dough would at least not cause any indigestion. He explains his position in these words:

Amid the conflicting opinions of the best methods of teaching a child to read, whether letters or words shall take precedence, the author hopes that his new plan, while it escapes the objections advanced against either, will be found to embody the advantages of both. . . .

The wisdom of forcing down a whole unmeaning alphabet at once may be well questioned; but that the remedy hitherto applied is less objectionable, needs practical confirmation.

The new feature in this little book consists in giving the child only a few letters before he is called upon to read words composed of those few letters. Thus the child is taught words long before he has mastered the whole alphabet; and yet no words are given him, of which he has not previously learned the letters.11

The Summers Reading Program

The Summers Program is praiseworthy in its intention, but in practical application it lacks natural and interesting content and encourages meaningless drill.

The method is based upon the following principles:

1. The thought aspect of language depends upon clear and vivid images.
2. In acquiring knowledge the mind moves from the vague whole to the parts and then back again to the clarified whole.

11 David B. Tower, The Gradual Primer, p. 6 (as quoted by Nila B. Smith, American Reading Instruction, p. 10.)
3. The child is an active, creative agent, vitally concerned in adjusting himself to his physical and spiritual environment.12

**Historical development.** The Summers' Program of teaching beginning reading was developed by Maud Summers and published by Frank D. Beatty's Company, New York in 1908.

**Description of the Summers' Program.** This program of reading is organized in an analytical manner which stresses word recognition and reading for thought. The teaching procedures recognize the value and use of concrete experiences, referred to as *First Images*; word recognition, developed from the Whole to Part; dramatic and creative activities; the Self-Activities; and Elements of Reading.

*First Images:* Miss Summers believed that in order to learn, a child must be provided with an opportunity to develop images of his environment and the numerous objects and conditions mentioned in reading matter; and without these "first images" children can not learn the printed symbols, which represent them. Thus, the materials and content matter of nature study, handicraft, and art aid in providing these images.

*Wholes to part:* Accepting the principle that the teaching of reading should progress from the whole words to word parts, Miss Summers expressed this thought in a most

interesting manner when she wrote: "When we wish to make known to a child a coat, for instance, we do not show him separately the sleeves, the lapels, the pockets, the buttons. We hold up the whole garment and say, 'Here is a coat.'"\textsuperscript{13}

Self-activity: This concept is in accordance with data supplied by psychology research and studies in child development. It is the activity of the child and the continued expression of his self-activity which will determine not only the thought he acquires, but also the mastery of symbols that will be developed.\textsuperscript{14} Provision for self-activity was promoted through dramatizations and other creative activities, which not only promoted activities but served as evaluative techniques.

Elements of reading: The Summers' Reading Program was organized around the following "elements of reading": (1) the thought element and (2) the symbol element.

The thought element: Comprehension is of vital importance and is, according to the author, the foundation on which this method is based. In learning to read, the child must be taught to establish permanent association between the printed or written symbols and the thought which they represent. The bonds of association between symbols and thoughts

\textsuperscript{13}Ibid., p. 6.

\textsuperscript{14}Paul Klapper, \textit{Teaching Children to Read} (New York: D. Appleton and Company, 1922), p. 64.
are strengthened as the materials presented are meaningful, vital and important to the child. Thought is emphasized through: (1) action words and sentences, (2) nursery rhymes, (3) stories, such as fables, fairy lore, and myths, and (4) observation lessons correlated with nature study, handicrafts, and art.

The symbol element: The Summers Program in its endeavor to attain a literary level did not neglect the mastery of phonetic units. The method emphasizes auditory and visual training, drills in phonic word analysis, practice in synthesizing known phonograms, and careful gradation and repetition in word building.

The purpose of the phonic exercises is to aid the child in associating the sound elements with the symbol. The phonic facts are presented in periods separated from the reading lessons in the following order: (1) vowel sounds, (2) consonants, and (3) phonograms. These elements are taught by analyzing sight words into phonic elements which are then combined to form new words and learned through repetition.

Critical examination of the "Summers Method" shows that regardless of the verbal emphasis given to the concept that beginning reading instruction should provide association between the idea and printed symbols by means of worthy experiences it begins by teaching children a list of sight words, such as jump, run, play, and hop. The repetitious
drill suggested as a means of teaching these words promotes a weary word method. However, the later content of the materials presented does provide interesting and natural content.

The Short-Exposure Reading Program

The last of the reading programs based on the emphasis of immediate word recognition to be discussed is the Short-Exposure Method. At the present time this reading method is in an experimental stage.

Basic assumptions underlying this method are: (1) visual perception of the whole word and its parts are essential to rapid and accurate reading, (2) training is necessary to assure perception of the total configuration and awareness of detail and (3) once accurate perception has been acquired, reading can be taught in the same manner.

Historical development. Although the Word Method of teaching beginning reading stressed the rapid presentation of flash cards as a technique of drill to stimulate word recognition, it was several decades before such a technique was advocated as a method of teaching beginning reading. In 1941 Mildred E. Sherwood presented a brief description of this method.

---

method; however, it was Samuel Renshaw's\textsuperscript{16} studies of perception which stimulated the use of the Short-Exposure Method of teaching reading, especially as a method of teaching non-readers.

**Description of the short-exposure reading program.** Essentially, this method of teaching reading calls for the exposure of simple forms to be flashed by means of a tachistoscope to the child. After these forms have been perceived by the child, the form is withdrawn and the child is asked to reproduce it. Exposure speed varies from a second to a hundredth of a second.

The forms: Numbers, words, phrases, and short sentences are the forms presented for recognition. The form of each increases in complexity as soon as the rate of exposure has been decreased. For example, the lesson begins by exposing one digit which may be increased until the child can successfully reproduce eight or nine, allowing an exposure rate of a hundredth of a second.

Word recognition: Once this training is under way unfamiliar words are exposed and copied from memory. Then, the teacher will name the word and if necessary discuss its meaning. As soon as isolated words are learned, several may be exposed at once to teach phrase or sentence recognition.

\begin{center}
\end{center}
Book reading: During this period of learning words the child is also introduced to book reading. The procedure for book reading is for the teacher and children to select a story. The teacher reads the story to the children as they follow the print with their eyes. When the child recognizes a word he names it. Gradually more words are recognized and soon the child is doing most of the reading. As his ability to read increases the child is instructed how to use contextual clues and simple phonics.

Advantages: It appears as if this method of teaching beginning reading may develop (1) an attentive attitude, (2) recognition of similarities and differences in words, and (3) a wide and accurate perceptual span.

Limitations: The major limitations of this method appear to be (1) the child's attention is not focused on meaning, (2) words are presented in isolation, thus word-callers may develop, and (3) additional training is necessary to develop forward movements and accurate return sweeps of the eyes.

Evaluation: This method has been used successfully with seriously retarded readers and adults, who desire to develop greater reading speed, but only a few experiments have been made, and so far the results have not been published. A true evaluation can not be given until further experimental evidence is collected.
Advantages of the Word Method

The Word Method, as a means of teaching beginning reading, is recommended for a number of reasons:

The Word Method develops a workable reading vocabulary early. Pronouncing a word while looking at the printed symbol is the first step in learning to recognize the word later from visual presentation alone. In the beginning a word appears as a whole without details; however, looking at the printed form forces the child to notice the similarities and differences of words and aids him in discriminating word forms. Thus, instead of having a child learn the word monkey as m-o-n-k-e-y six different facts or mon-key two different facts, the child could learn monkey, one fact, and thereby save time in learning to respond to printed symbols.

Huey says:

Children learn the name of a word about as quickly as that of a letter, and recognize the whole word about as quickly as they recognize a single letter. A word is not a sum of letter-names, anyway, nor even merely of letter-sounds. Its visual appearance, indeed, is not a sum of letter-appearances, but has a character of its own. So the word method short-circuits the whole process of word learning.

---

17 Gertrude Hildreth, "Getting Acquainted with Words," The Reading Teacher, VIII (December, 1954), 96.

Meaningful reading materials can be used much sooner than with the Alphabetic and Phonic methods. The synthetic methods, the Alphabetic and Phonic, demanded a period of a year to two years for the child to learn the mechanics of reading. During this extended period the child spent countless hours responding c-a-t, cat or "a ssing" or "a choing" like a steam engine going up grade. These acts were not reading. In the Word Method it is assumed that the individual reads by viewing each word as a whole, considering its meaning, seeing the next word, deciding on its meaning, and finally completing the sentence. In this way the whole-word form is said to be associated with the corresponding whole-word sound and word meaning. Thus, word-recognition is supposed to be made more rapid, accurate, and simple.

Confidence is developed. With the words that constitute his sight vocabulary the child is able to read any material which contains these words, and as these words are usually within the pupil's listening vocabulary, he understands that which he reads. When a child can look at a printed page and interpret the symbols presented there, he knows he is reading. Thus, as the child reads he builds meaning and background, increases his reading interest, and learns the value of reading.
Step two - Statements were developed as a means of interpreting the concepts and activities necessary for reading instruction to meet the requirements as expressed in the definition.

Step three - Evaluation of the validity of the criteria was established. The criteria were submitted to five judges, all members of Kent State University faculty, for critical examination. These judges were asked to consider each statement in the light of necessary concepts and activities provided in an adequate reading program to meet the stated definition of reading.

Step four - Reconstruction of the criteria was made in the light of suggestions made.

Comparison of the methods. In order to determine the relative value of the various beginning reading methods five judges, all members of Kent State University, were asked (1) to read carefully a description of the method and (2) to check those concepts and activities, which were provided in the method being described.

Summary and interpretation. The data provided by this procedure was summarized and interpreted in a descriptive-analytical manner in an effort to show the degree of effectiveness and limitations of the various methods of teaching beginning reading.
Limitations of the Word Method

This approach to the teaching of beginning reading has important implications in dealing with the education of young children; however, such a scheme also has several limitations. The major disadvantages of the Word Method appear to be:

1. The extensive number of words needed for reading makes the memorization of individual words a Herculean task.
2. Extensive time is required to teach vocabulary words.
3. Emphasis of word recognition without reference to meaning subordinates reading as a thinking to reading as a mechanical technique.
4. Continuous and extensive use of visual discrimination is the major technique of learning words.

The extensive number of words needed for reading makes the memorization of individual words a Herculean task. There are too many words used in even the simplest reading materials for the memorization of individual words to be an efficient method. MacLalchy and Wardwell\(^{19}\) from a word county of forty-two different pre-primers, found the sum of words used at least once as 1,929 with two hundred eighty-nine different words used. A further study of twenty-eight primers in the various textbook series including the pre-primer revealed that one hundred four words were used in five or more pre-primers and in four or more primers.

Familiarity with such a useful group of words will increase the learner's confidence and encourage him to attempt to read new books with assurance. But, the child's difficulty in learning even the one hundred four words used in five or more pre-primers by sight-recognition method without support from experience, story sequence, and sentence structure may be sensed from inspecting the list quoted below:

The Number of Primers in Which Each of the 104 Pre-Primer Words Is Used20

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>In 28 Books</th>
<th>In 27 Books (Cont.)</th>
<th>In 25 Books (Cont.)</th>
<th>In 20 Books</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a</td>
<td>get</td>
<td>saw</td>
<td>run</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and</td>
<td>have</td>
<td>they</td>
<td>three</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>are</td>
<td>here</td>
<td></td>
<td>In 19 Books</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>at</td>
<td>my</td>
<td>father</td>
<td>thank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>for</td>
<td>she</td>
<td>home</td>
<td>toy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>go</td>
<td>this</td>
<td>laugh</td>
<td>you</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>good</td>
<td>too</td>
<td></td>
<td>In 18 Books</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>we</td>
<td>two</td>
<td>ride</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in</td>
<td>went</td>
<td></td>
<td>In 23 Books</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>is</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>In 22 Books</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>it</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>In 21 Books</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>like</td>
<td>In 26 Books</td>
<td>down</td>
<td>In 17 Books</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>little</td>
<td>am</td>
<td>make</td>
<td>ball</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>look</td>
<td>away</td>
<td>was</td>
<td>jump</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mother</td>
<td>he</td>
<td>where</td>
<td>kitten</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>not</td>
<td>me</td>
<td></td>
<td>who</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>on</td>
<td>one</td>
<td>blue</td>
<td>In 16 Books</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>said</td>
<td>out</td>
<td>into</td>
<td>funny</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>see</td>
<td>play</td>
<td>oh</td>
<td>her</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the</td>
<td>ran</td>
<td>something</td>
<td>school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to</td>
<td>up</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>In 15 Books</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>will</td>
<td>want</td>
<td></td>
<td>airplane</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with</td>
<td>what</td>
<td></td>
<td>baby</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>In 27 Books</th>
<th>In 25 Books</th>
<th>In 21 Books</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>big</td>
<td>did</td>
<td>dog</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>can</td>
<td>find</td>
<td>fun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>come</td>
<td>house</td>
<td>good-by</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>do</td>
<td>red</td>
<td>help</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\[20\] Ibid., p. 203.
The Number of Primers in Which Each of the 104 Pre-Primer Words Is Used (Continued)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>In 14 Books</th>
<th>In 12 Books</th>
<th>In 10 Books</th>
<th>In 8 Books</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>boat</td>
<td>fast</td>
<td>cake</td>
<td>chair</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>stop</td>
<td>morning</td>
<td>car</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>walk</td>
<td>pony</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In 13 Books</td>
<td>In 11 Books</td>
<td>In 9 Books</td>
<td>In 5 Books</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>store</td>
<td>under</td>
<td>brown</td>
<td>cap</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>name</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>puppy</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Extensive time required to teach vocabulary words.

The various versions of the word method require enormous amounts of time and energy for vocabulary development. For example, in a representative state Woody\(^{21}\) found teachers in the primary grades spending an average of thirty-eight per cent of the total reading time on "word study" in order to prepare children to read the required materials. One-fourth of the teachers spent forty-eight per cent or more of the reading time on word study. Similar expenditures of time may be expected in any method or system that requires children to "cover the ground" in a reader-text. From any valid definition of reading it should be evident that it is poor psychology to drill children on abstract words so they can "name the words" as they meet them in going through a reader.

---

Emphasis on word recognition without reference to meaning subordinates reading as a thinking process to reading as a mechanical technique. Zirbes has declared:

Apprehension of meaning is impeded, delimited, and distorted by attention to one word at a time, particularly when words are isolated from context. Consequently, procedures which employ word drill and emphasize recognition without continuous reference to contextual meaning not only complicate and slow up the reading process, but subordinate contextual thinking and meaning to mechanics.\(^2\)

That teachers often do this conscientiously in the name of efficiency does not alter the effects.

Continuous and extensive use of visual discrimination as the major technique of learning words. The intensive use of the Look-and-Say technique for word study may prove inadequate. Some children are able to learn to respond to visual stimuli rapidly and accurately; however, a few children need material presented to them not only visually but also by means of auditory and kinaesthetic stimuli. Causes of inadequate visual perception may be defective vision, inadequate background of experiences, lack of mental maturity, and special language disabilities, such as defects in visual memory for words and associating meaning with symbols.\(^3\)

When the child is a poor observer of likenesses and

---

\(^2\) Laura Zirbes, "What Is a Modern Reading Program?" Educational Method, XX (December, 1940), 151-155.

\(^3\) Emmett Albert Betts, Foundations of Reading Instruction (New York: American Book Company, 1946), 333-335.
differences, he is likely to have considerable difficulty in acquiring a stock of sight words when the initial reading instruction depends almost entirely on a flash-card drill of word presentation and study.

Present Status of the Word Method

The summation of the evidence provided by the ratings given the Word Method of teaching beginning reading by five judges indicated that this method had certain qualities which are in harmony with the items as suggested in the established criteria. In regard to those factors dealing with "word attack techniques," the Word Method of teaching beginning reading provided in a superior manner for the use of (1) general configuration and (2) striking characteristics of words. Also it was indicated that the provision was made for the use of picture clues although in an inadequate manner. Thus, the Word Method makes use of three techniques of word attack; general configuration, striking characteristics, and picture clues. Furthermore it is well to recall that certain reading programs based on the Word Method provide for the use of phonics, phonetics, and syllabification.

According to the rating value, the judges disagreed

---

\(^{24}\text{Appendix, p. 336.}\)  \(^{25}\text{Appendix, p. 336.}\)  \(^{26}\text{Appendix, p. 336.}\)
as to the degree in which the Word Method was based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn; however, all ratings on this factor were positive. Four of the judges declared that this method was based upon an accepted principle of how learning took place, but the opportunity for such development was inadequate; while one judge believed that such was provided for in an adequate manner.

The five judges also agreed to the fact that this method provided for but in an inferior manner (1) significant increase in vocabulary and content and (2) continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading.

All other factors as suggested in the established criteria were rated as negative or as not provided for in the Word Method.

Section II

The Sentence Method

Paralleling the resurgence of the Phonetic Method, a much larger group of teachers pursued the advantages they saw in the Word Method and sought to further improve and expand it. Their efforts resulted in the expansion of the Word Method into the Sentence or Phrase Method. The logic behind this movement went something like this: The word is the smallest single unit for representing a thought. But single words are seldom able to convey thoughts especially when used
as written symbols. Hence, since the purpose of reading is to gather thoughts and ideas, larger groups of thought-symbols or words must be used as the comprehension-unit. Thus, from his first introduction to reading, the child's attention should be focused upon the phrase or sentence.

The usual procedure, in teaching according to this method, is to present phrases or sentences by means of flash cards. The groups of words on each card are carefully selected to deal with familiar things, to represent consistent spelling, and to be easily pronounced. The phrases or sentences are arranged and grouped as to length and order of difficulty. The pupils are drilled on each small group of flash cards until the phrases or sentences are recognized on sight.

Following the achievement of "sight mastery" of each group of flash cards, the phrases or sentences are broken down into the separate words of which they are composed. Some teachers cut up the flash cards which have been written for the first step. Other teachers preserve a permanent collection of cards and a separate file of corresponding word cards. While the latter practice saves work and material the former results in "fresh" materials which are adapted to the understanding of each group of children. Work on the separate word cards is related to the use of each word in the phrase or sentence. That is, the words composing one phrase or sentence are studied together and then separately before
the words composing another phrase or sentence are presented.

As the Sentence or Phrase Method had to compete with other systems already accepted, numerous compromises were made. In some programs extensive amounts of practice in word discrimination were included. The technique used to insure this drill procedure was pages of phrases and sentences in which "basic" words were used over and over again in different combinations. Meaningful reading, the platform on which the method was advocated, was largely neglected. This, however, is only another illustration of formalism destroying the flexibility and effectiveness of an educational methodology.

Eventually, advocates of this method threw off the restraining compromises with the Word Method. The meaningless repetition of "key" words was abandoned in favor of using nursery rhymes, folk tales, and animal stories. These served to identify the Sentence Method with the "cultural era" of educational development. The use of literary materials for the cultural development of the youths of America was a tremendous improvement over isolated and meaningless words or sentences. The literary materials were meaningful, interesting and often stimulating to further reading. Again, however, the tendency to go to extremes became evident and the

28 Nila B. Smith, op. cit., p. 128.
beginning reading materials soon carried such a heavy vocabulary and added new words at such a rapid rate that children had difficulty incorporating them in their sight vocabularies. The results were that, again teachers of beginning reading devoted excessive amounts of time to word drill rather than carrying out the basic principles of the Sentence Method.

The essential idea of the Sentence Method has endured and in modified versions forms the basis of instruction advocated by several present-day series of reader-texts.

Historical Development

Early advocates of the Sentence or Phrase Method were Jacotot and Decrolcy. Dr. Decrolcy, Professor of Psychology at the University of Brussels, promoted the use of the Sentence Method in his school, L'Ecole pour la vie par la vie. Mademoiselle Hanaide, Decrolcy's assistant, wrote that at the school an active attempt was made to employ those techniques by which a child learns oral communication. The child learns to comprehend oral communication through the association of sounds and objects, and, after hearing these sounds many times, learns the proper significance of them. As reading is a visual process the child needs numerous repetitions of the visual symbol not in the form of letters

or letter sounds or words but in the form of commands which he understands. Thus, from the very start the child learns to associate meaning with the written word. The visual symbol presented to him is a command to do something, and the child performs the action every time. In this method the child is taught first the sentence, then the words, and finally the phonetic elements of the words.

Jacotot, also, advocated the use of the sentence as the "unit" for teaching children to read. In his plan of presentation of reading material, the children learned the sentence by repeating it after the teacher word by word until the whole sentence was learned. After the child could vocalize the sentence from the visual symbols he then wrote it from copy. "Here we have the germ of present day methods which begin with a literary whole and proceed to letter and sound."30

Although advocated early, the Sentence Method was seldom used in this country until 1885. At this time the experiments in the schools of Binghamton, New York, and the publication of the book, The Sentence Method of Teaching Reading, by George L. Farnham popularized the method. 31


CHAPTER I

THE NATURE AND PROCESS OF READING

The act of interpreting printed symbols is no simple thing. It is a complex consisting of a number of distinct processes. It appears helpful for the teacher to know the character of these specific operations, as a knowledge of the constituent psychophysical processes of the reading complex may offer cues for guidance in the teaching of reading. In this chapter a brief discussion of the nature and process of reading will be attempted. This discussion is based upon evidence as offered by scientific investigations.

The act of reading consists of two major processes, the physiological and psychological. Mainly the physiological process is the ocular adjustment necessary to perceive words as visual symbols. The psychological consists of the arousal of the mental associations necessary to give meaning to the visual symbols.

**Physiological Factors**

Nature has endowed human beings with a visual sense possessing unique facilities for seeing and performing visual tasks. Inasmuch as the eyesight of children is of much
Description of the Sentence Method

The Sentence Method is based upon the assumption that while the word is a unit of designation, the sentence is the unit of meaning. Thus, the materials for beginning reading instruction should be the grouping of words in sentence form, rather than the letter, the letter sound, or isolated words, so that the child's attention can be focused upon the thought expressed.

Farnham organized reading instruction with that approach, systematized it, and offered logical and psychological support for it as a superior method in beginning reading. Farnham's basic argument in favor of the sentence method may be understood from his statement:

The first principle to be observed in teaching reading is that things are recognized as wholes. Language follows this law. Although it is taught by an indirect process, still, in its external characteristics, it follows the law of other objects.

The question arises, "What is the whole or what is the unit of expression?" It is now quite generally conceded that we have no ideas not logically associated with others. In other words, thoughts, complete in their relations, are the materials in the mind out of which the complex relation are constructed.

It is being admitted that the thought is the unit of thinking, it necessarily follows that the sentence is the unit of expression. . . .

A second principle is: we acquire a knowledge of the parts of an object by first considering it as a whole. Repeated recognitions reveal the characteristics of the whole, so as to separate it from other things. . . .
The sentence when properly taught, will in like manner be understood as a whole, better than if presented in detail. The order indicated is, first the sentence, then the words, and then the letters. The sentence being first presented as a whole, the words are discovered, and after that the letters composing the words. 32

These principles appear to be based upon concepts developed by the Gestalt School of Psychology, as this psychology adheres to the concept that (1) the natural way to learn the parts is by an analysis of the larger whole and (2) that the whole is greater than the sum of the parts.

The Sentence Method proceeds from the whole to the part by teaching the sentence first and then progressing to the phrase, the word, and the letter. This method also by accepting the sentence as the thought-unit appears to accept the concept that the whole is greater than the parts. For example, the words he, she, has, run, tell us very little, but a grouping of the words such as, He has a run or She has a run presents us with two different thought-units - baseball run and a run in a stocking. The meaning of a sentence is a function of relationship between words. Referring again to the sentences He has a run and She has a run, our culture patterns help determine the relationship between words and supply the logical relations. Thus, the whole is greater than the sum of the parts.

32 Ibid., p. 17.
Reading instruction. The major features which distinguish this approach to beginning reading are that (1) a thought basis for reading is developed and (2) the children learn to associate the thought idea with the printed symbols. In this method of teaching beginning reading consideration is given to: (1) developing a thought basis, (2) associating the thought idea with the printed symbol, (3) recognizing individual words, (4) writing, (5) reading in books, and (6) developing ability in word analysis. For the purpose of clarity the method is presented in various stages, but it must be understood that there is a great deal of overlapping between the stages.

Developing a thought basis for reading. The objective of this stage of reading instruction is to develop understanding of oral communication. Jagger explains the purpose of such activities as follows:

"... the sentences are to be adapted to the child's stage of mental development; each of them should contain an image, because the thought of little children of five and six consists principally of images. It is improbable that an image will appear in the child's mind unless there is some appeal to his interests, for there is a strong connection between feeling and imagery." 33

In order to provide this experience George L. Farnham suggests the use of the following technique:

Let the teacher and each pupil take an object in hand. The teacher will call upon one of the pupils to tell what he has, and in reply the pupil will probably hold up the object and pronounce its name.

This done, let the children change objects and repeat the exercise, telling what each one has.34

Assuming the thought idea with the printed symbol. This stage of instruction attempts to aid the child in recognizing printed sentences and to understand their meaning. An object, picture, or command is given to the children, and, as the teacher or child presents the interpretation, the teacher writes the printed symbol on the board to be read by the children.

Farnham,35 Jagger,36 and Luke37 each suggest different devices for helping the child form this association between the printed symbols and its meaning.

Farnham suggests the following technique:

The teacher goes to the board and in a clear bold hand writes a sentence as: "I have a knife." The pupils see the writing, but of course do not know what it means. The teacher will call a pupil and put a knife in his hands, and the pupil in response to the impulse which is the result of previous training will instantly hold up the knife and say, "I have a knife,".


Ibid.

Jagger, op. cit.

The teacher will proceed in the same way until several children have objects in their hands, representing as many sentences upon the board.

The teacher will next call upon the first child to point out and read his sentence, which he will readily do, as he holds the object in his hand.38

Jagger suggests the use of pictures:

The stage may be divided into three parts.
A. The sentence is introduced by means of a picture: a story is told to the class about the picture. Then according to circumstances, a sentence is printed at the side of the picture, read by the teacher, and repeated collectively and individually by the children. . . .
B. The association between picture and sentence is weakened: the children match the sentences with their pictures. . . .
C. The pictures are withdrawn, and the children are required to read the sentence to the teacher.39

Edith Luke suggests that commands such as: Open the door, Draw on the board, etc. be used as an introduction to beginning reading.

After revising the commands orally the teacher produces the large placards, explaining to the children that she is not going to tell them what to do, but that the cards are now going to tell them. She then holds up one of the placards.

The children, at first, have no means of knowing what the placards say, but the teacher does not tell them. She encourages a child to volunteer to carry out one of the commands. If he does the wrong one, she simply says, "No, that is not right," and encourages him to try again. . . .40

38 Farnham, op. cit., p. 30.
Recognizing individual words. Soon after the child begins to read sentences, it is found that he recognizes individual words. When this readiness is shown he is asked to find and identify individual words in sentences. Labels for objects in the classroom are also used, so that children can become familiar with the appearance of words representing the names of all the objects in the room.

Writing. The children are encouraged to copy what they see written upon the blackboard. In regard to this technique Farnham says: "The efforts will be directed to copying what they see written upon the board, but as the thought expressed is present in their minds they are in reality writing to express their thoughts." Thus, the children learn their letters in an indirect manner.

Reading in books. When the children can immediately recognize numerous sentences when presented on the blackboard, the teacher may assume that the child is ready to read from books. At this time the teacher should select a book and carefully examine it to find the words that the pupil may not know. These words are then presented on the board. In a conversational manner the teacher promotes interest and develops understanding of the new words used. After the

---

41 Farnham, op. cit., p. 34.
42 Ibid., p. 35.
books are presented to the children the lesson proceeds in
this manner:

Let all the members of the class look at the
first sentence, and when ready let each one raise
his hand. Should a familiar word not be recog-
nized in its printed form, the teacher will write
it on the board.

When all are ready the teacher will call upon
one to "tell what the book says." The sentence
will probably be correctly read.43

From then on general preparation for book reading
includes:

First - The teacher acquaints herself with
the lesson.
Second - The pupils will look over the lesson
for unfamiliar words, and will indicate them to
the teacher.
Third - The pupils will then close their books,
and the teacher will develop the meaning of each
word by questions and familiar conversation.
Fourth - The pupils will use the new words in
the construction of sentences, each one expressing
a familiar thought.
Fifth - The new words, as their ideas are
developed, will be written upon the board, so that
the pupils may become familiar with their written
forms.
Sixth - Pupils look over each sentence care-
fully to see if they can understand the thought
expressed.
Seventh - The pupils read.44

Developing ability in word analysis. The Sentence
Method of teaching reading has not developed a phonic system
of its own, but suggests that any one of the numerous system-
atic phonic systems be used. It is suggested that such a
program (1) present the word first as a whole and then the

43 Ibid., p. 40.  44 Ibid., pp. 41-42.
phonetic elements, (2) that this type of exercise be presented to the children in a separate period, and (3) the individual assignments be given as all children do not need an equal amount of such drill to become proficient in word attack skills.

This method also recognizes the fact that phonic analysis is only one of the many means of word attack and stresses the fact that children should be encouraged to use pictures, context clues, and the dictionary as techniques of word analysis.

Using the Sentence Method as a Classroom Technique

The following classroom situation was developed upon the assumption, "A short sentence should be the smallest unit presented to the child in beginning reading. Later, attention may be called to its phrases, words, and finally parts of words."45

(The teacher and the children have discussed the different types of work done by each member of the family. On the chalkboard is the following story:

Mother
See Mother and Baby.
Mother works.
Baby works.
Mother and Baby work.

45Mary E. Pennell and Alice M. Cusack, How to Teach Reading (New York: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1922), p. 54.
Teacher: "If any one has bright eyes this morning he can see our story. . . . Tommy sees it and I can tell he is trying to read it. . . . Listen. . . . I will read it to you." (She reads the story.) . . . "Isn't that a good story? I would like to have you read it to me."

(The teacher and the children read the story together.)

Teacher: "Mayme, would you read the first sentence?"

Mayme: "See Mother and Baby." (As Mayme reads the teacher moves the pointer under the sentence.)

(This type of reading continues for each sentence. If the child hesitates, he is asked to repeat the story from the beginning.)

Teacher: (She holds up a card on which has been written - See Mother and Baby.) "Who can find where it says this in our story? Myron?"

(Myron finds the sentence, See Mother and Baby, and holds the card under it and reads it.)

Teacher: "That was fine." (She then presents each sentence in content sequence and a child finds it and reads it.)

Teacher: "This time we will do something hard." (She now presents the sentences out of sequence; the children find them and read each one.)

Teacher: "Watch what the chalk says." (She rewrites the same group of sentences in a scrambled sequence and reads them to the children.) "Now, who can match two sentences that say, See Mother and Baby? . . . Will? (Will connects the two sentences that say See Mother and Baby."

(Other children are then called upon to connect identical sentences.)

Teacher: "That was very good. Now, who can find the word that says (She holds up a card on which is printed the word Mother) and tell what it says? . . . Susie?"
(Susie takes the card and matches it with the words on the board that says "Mother" and pronounces the word.)

(This type of matching continues for the words, Baby, works, see, and. If the child cannot recall the word he is asked to repeat the sentence or story so that the word can be recognized through content.)

Teacher: "We have just time to read the story once more. . . . Ready?"

(The class reads in unison the sentences as the teacher runs the pointer under each line.)

Teacher: "Now you may return to your seats."

Reading Programs Based upon the Sentence Method

Following the publication of Farnham's suggested procedures, the Sentence Method enjoyed unparalleled popularity, and numerous reading programs developed which were based upon this method.

The chief purpose of these systems was to help the child associate meanings with printed symbols. In each system efforts were made to introduce reading materials to the beginners by means of sentences.

These reading programs stressed that learning proceeds from the whole to the part and endorsed the following pattern of presentation: (1) introduction of the reading content through sentence units, (2) analyzation of the sentence into separate words, and (3) application of phonetic principles as a technique of word study.
importance from the viewpoint of reading, the function of the eyes should receive consideration.

Interest in the scientific study of reading as a visual task began in Germany and France about 1850. The problem which commanded major attention was primarily the study of perception and eye-movement.¹

As early as 1844 an alert investigator named Valentine studied the perceptual process and concluded that a reader perceived three or four letters simultaneously in one hundred thousandths of a second to two hundred and seventy thousandths, but he interpreted this to mean that each letter was identified separately in reading.²

Impressions Received upon the Retina

The fundamental facts about seeing throw a great deal of understanding on the reading process. The eye works upon the same principle as the camera. The retina is the photographic plate, the pupil of the eye is the point of entrance for the rays of light, and the lens brings the rays of light to focus on the retina or photographic plate.³ There is in

¹William Scott Gray, Summary of Investigations Relating to Reading (Chicago: University of Chicago, 1925), p. 2


The McMurry Reading Program

Lida Brown McMurry in her book, *A Method for Teaching Primary Reading*, published by the Macmillan Company, 1914, discusses a beginning reading program which is based on the Sentence Method. Believing that the establishment of two habits namely, (1) the habit of looking at words, phrases, or sentences, and (2) the habit of attacking words through knowledge of sound letters, to be essential for the development of effective reading, the reading program suggested by McMurry gives equal consideration to reading as a thought process and to the study of phonic techniques of word attack.

The following suggestions are given to aid in promoting these habits:

1. Playing games from oral directions.
2. Playing games from written directions.
3. Making new words which are within the child's vocabulary and which the pupils learned, and having the pupils get these words by sounding the letters.
4. Using the new words in new games or in additional directions.

**Playing games from oral directions.** The first game suggested is an activity which is designed to stimulate the child to respond to oral commands. For example, the teacher says:

I say, sit.
I say, skip.
I say, tap.
I say, rap.
I say, hop.

---

(No child should move to follow a command that is not pre­
ceded by "I say.")

**Playing the game from written directions.** The second step substitutes written directions for the oral directions of the introductory game. The teacher says, "I say" and writes **sit** upon the board. In order to help the child recognize this printed symbol, the teacher points to and sounds each letter in turn - **s i t**. At the close of the period rapid drill is given on the sounds of the three letters **s i t**, and this drill is repeated at the beginning of the next reading class. The next word to be introduced in a similar manner is **skip**. This word contains only two new letters to be taught by sound. The pupils give the sounds for **s** and **i** and the teacher supplies the sound for **k** and **p**. Gradually the other directions are taught in the same manner.

The objective or aim for the above described drill is to develop the ability to recognize the eight words and the sounds of the following letters: **d, f, h, j, k, m, n, p, r, s, t, a, i, o, u, y**. (Diacritical marks are not used.)

To supplement this drill exercise two sets of small cards are used: **Set One** - written on one side and printed on the other are the letters, the sounds of which are to be given by the children. **Set two** - the words **sit, stand**, etc. are written and the pupils perform the stated act as each card is presented.
Making new words which are within the children's vocabulary and which contain letters the sounds of which the pupils have learned, and having the pupils learn these words by sounding the letters. It is suggested by the author that the pupils can sound out the following words from the sounds of the letters which they now know. (These words are classified for the convenience of the teacher only.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nouns</th>
<th>dot</th>
<th>fan</th>
<th>fun</th>
<th>hat</th>
<th>ham</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>doll</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hand</td>
<td>hill</td>
<td>jam</td>
<td>lap</td>
<td>lamp</td>
<td>land</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>lip</td>
<td>lot</td>
<td>lump</td>
<td>man</td>
<td>mat</td>
<td>mill</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>milk</td>
<td>mop</td>
<td>mud</td>
<td>nap</td>
<td>nut</td>
<td>pan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pin</td>
<td>pump</td>
<td>rat</td>
<td>sand</td>
<td>sky</td>
<td>skin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>stamp</td>
<td>spot</td>
<td>strap</td>
<td>sun</td>
<td>tin</td>
<td>trap</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pronouns</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>him</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>it</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>my</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Adjectives</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>dry</td>
<td>dull</td>
<td>fat</td>
<td>hot</td>
<td>pink</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>silk</td>
<td>soft</td>
<td>still</td>
<td>stiff</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Verbs</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>am</td>
<td>did</td>
<td>dip</td>
<td>drink</td>
<td>dry</td>
<td>fill</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fry</td>
<td>had</td>
<td>hit</td>
<td>hum</td>
<td>hunt</td>
<td>kill</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>lift</td>
<td>let</td>
<td>pat</td>
<td>puff</td>
<td>ran</td>
<td>sat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sift</td>
<td>lay</td>
<td>stamp</td>
<td>stop</td>
<td>tip</td>
<td>try</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Adverb</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>not</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Prepositions</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>in</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>on</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>from</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conjunction</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>and</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These words are to be presented in meaningful situations. The author suggests the following techniques to aid

in associating meaning with the printed symbols.

1. The following directions are given in part orally with the underlined words placed on the board and sounded out by the pupils.

Play dip up some milk.
Play drink milk.
Fill your hand with sand. 48

2. The following questions are given in part orally with the underlined words placed on the board and sounded out by the pupils.

Who has a doll?
Has it a hat?
Can the doll drink milk? 49

3. A third method might be a story such as:

One day a little boy wanted some fun, so he made a snow man. It was a fat man. The boy made red lips for him. etc. 50

Using the new words in new games or in additional directions. Other games suggested are: 51

1. Playing Store: In this game the following commands are given -

Get a stiff hat.
Get a fan.
Get some nuts.
Etc.
Buy a mat.
Buy a hat.
Etc.

2. Simon Says: The following directions are given first orally and then with underlined words written on the blackboard -

48 Ibid., p. 9.
49 Ibid., p. 10.
50 Ibid.
51 Ibid., p. 43.
Simon says, "Thumbs in."
"Thumbs out."
"Thumbs up."
"Thumbs down."
"Thumbs wiggle-waggle."

(This exercise encourages the recognition of the sounds ou, ow, w, g.)

3. Picture Store Play:

Get a gun.
Get a dog.
Etc.

4. Spin the Platter Game: In this game the children are given the name of one of the following animals:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>cat</th>
<th>hen</th>
<th>owl</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>cow</td>
<td>hog</td>
<td>pig</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dog</td>
<td>horse</td>
<td>rabbit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>frog</td>
<td>mouse</td>
<td>rat</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When the animal is called by the teacher, the one assigned that name jumps up and attempts to catch the platter. The oral presentation is followed by the learning to respond to the printed symbol and then the sounds, c, b, e.

Numerous other games such as Riddles to Guess, Things to Do, and Action Sentences are used as teaching techniques until the teacher tells and the children read parts of the story, The Little Red Hen and the Grain of Wheat:

Once upon a time there was a little red hen. She lived in the farmyard with a cat, a rat, and a pig.

One morning as she was scratching for her breakfast she saw a grain of wheat. Etc.

The presentation of the story is made as follows:

As the story is told by the teacher the underlined words are written on the board and read by the pupils. At the end of
the story the children are directed to erase the name of one of the animals, the color of the hen, etc.

The author claims the following advantages for this method:

1. The children can recognize at a glance a great many words in script and in print.
2. They read quite fluently.
3. They form the habit of reading for meaning.
4. They know the sounds of the following letters and combinations of letters (fifty-nine in all):
   (a) Vowels ā, ē, ĩ, ĵ, ū, ĭ, ē, ēe, ĩ, ĵ, ēu, ēy, ēo, ēo.
   (b) Consonants b, c, d, f, ĝ, ĝ, h, j, k, l, m, n, p, r, s, ĝ, t, v, w, y, z.
   (c) Combination of letters: ai (pail), ar (car), all (ball), ch (chicken), ck (pick), ea (eat), er (her), ing, ir (girl), om (some), ow (grow), ou (house), or (horse), ow (how), oy (boy), qu, sh (insh), th (their), (fur), wh, wa (water).
5. They are able to pick out for themselves any words in their spoken vocabulary, providing it be composed of the above sounds.
6. Reading is a pleasure; by it the pupils learn many things which they wish to know.
7. The reading lessons grow out of the interests of the children, of making the words large, of having the attention of every pupil directed to the same spot and of having the words appear as wholes (not broken up into separated letters as in print).
8. The reading from a chart is a preparation for reading from a book.
9. The method can be used as a supplement to any basal readers.
The Luke Reading Program

This program of teaching beginning reading is divided into the following stages: (1) the command stage, (2) the matching stage, (3) the chart story-book stage, (4) the word stage, (5) the letter stage, (6) the word building stage, and (7) the book reading stage.


The author states that this reading program is the result of a four year "experiment" of teaching beginners to read by the Sentence Method in the Demonstration School attached to the Training College, Dundee. The situation and procedures are described by the author in the following manner:

The beginners' class is composed of forty children whose average age is five years. The majority of these children have been in the Baby Room for about a year, but have done no formal work in the 'Three R's.' The babies have only a forenoon session from 9:30 till 12:15, and their time is fully occupied with the formation of good habits in conduct and speech . . . when many of the children have reached their fifth birthday and they are ready for something fresh, a few reading lessons are introduced. These are only given two or three times a week and simply break ground for the next year's more formal work.
At the beginning of the following session regular reading lessons by the Sentence Method are begun with the five-year olds.\textsuperscript{52}

**Description of the Luke Reading Program.** As already described this reading program is composed of seven stages of development. For the purpose of clarity the method is described in terms of each stage; however, it must be understood that there is a great deal of overlapping between successive stages.

The command stage: The materials needed for this stage of instruction are: a rocking horse, a black cat, and a lion which roars when a string is pulled.

The first commands to be read by the children are:

- Open the door.
- Play the piano.
- Stroke the cat.
- Ride the horse.
- Make the lion roar.
- Draw on the board.\textsuperscript{53}

The techniques are:

1. The teacher gives the commands orally and children dramatize them.

2. The teacher presents the commands in printed form.

   (She does not tell them the meaning of the printed symbols, but permits the children to learn them by trial-and-error method.)

3. A child does what the sentence says.


\textsuperscript{53} *Ibid.*, p. 3.
4. A child reads the sentence as a whole.

5. The children copy the printed card just as they would copy a drawing.

Parallel with the command stage the children are learning other words by means of labels and by picture-name cards.

The matching stage: At this stage the children are provided with an opportunity to match sentences, phrases, and words. This is accomplished by providing each child with an envelope which contains small cards on which have been printed commands. The usual procedure is for the teacher to hold up a card bearing a command. One of the children is called upon to carry out the command, and then all find the corresponding command or sentence from among their cards. This may vary by having a child hold up a card, by having a child dramatize a command, or by having duplicate sets of labels prepared so to be matched.

As children progress at different rates in learning to read, individual work is provided. Materials to be used for such individual activities are: (1) nursery pictures and titles to be matched with titles presented on separate cards, (2) nursery rhymes to be matched with identical rhymes, (3) children's drawings to be matched with correct title, and (4) the matching of objects with their names.

Chart story book: A Big Book or a chart is made by the teacher after the majority of the children learn the
first set of commands. This book is made by presenting on chart paper the learned commands. They are then read and dramatized by the children. It is claimed by Miss Luke that these consecutive lines of print introduce the children to eye-movement habits necessary for reading a page.

Other activities engaged in at this stage of the reading program are:

1. The reading of individual books made by the teacher. The reading content of such booklets are the commands written by the teacher on the top line of each page. These exercises also furnish material for writing as the child writes the command under the form furnished by the teacher.

2. The reading of a Class Reading Book. The reading content of such a book is developed once a week through teacher-pupil discussion concerning any interesting piece of news.

The word stage: At this stage the commands are cut into words, and exercises similar to those used for matching sentences are continued. The writing and newspaper activities are continued.

The letter stage: It is claimed by Miss Luke that at the end of the fourth month the children are ready to learn to recognize letters and their sounds. They learn first similar beginning sounds by auditory stimuli then by visual presentation. Usually a page of a chart is devoted to each letter of the alphabet. Each day two or three words are...

54 Ibid., p. 35.
the back part of the retina a little depression about one-fifth of a millimeter in diameter called the fovea, in which is closely packed a large number of cones. Beyond this area are found both rods and cones. These rods and cones are highly developed nerves and are for the reception of light stimulations, but it is the cones which provide us with the ability to perceive distinctly. Therefore, it is evident that the area of distinct vision is that area of depression in the back part of the retina which includes three-fourths of the retinal image and limits distinct vision to no more than three or four words. The eye, of course, sees more than this, but three or four letters are all that the eye can see distinctly. Beyond this limit the retinal images become less distinct and it is only the outstanding characteristics of letters or words that can be seen. Thus, the biological factors in seeing are the processes by which light waves enter the eye through the pupil, pass through the lens, and are focused on the retina. The retina is the true receptor of visual stimuli.

It appears that in reading we are using the nerve ends in a horizontal strip across the center of the retina. A line of type stimulates this strip and the impression upon it is the same for both eyes. Both good and poor readers see this impression; however, good readers see more of this strip than poor readers for they have trained a greater number of
given by the teacher beginning with the sound required, and the children supply others.

The word building stage: In a period separate from the reading class the children are provided with an opportunity to learn phonetic analysis of words. In the study of word analysis, beginning consonant sounds are presented first, followed by the teaching of the short vowel sounds.

All words are given by the children, and those containing the correct sounds are printed on the blackboard by the teacher or a child. Suggested activities to stimulate the learning of letters and letter sounds are the use of picture-cards, name-cards, and letter games.

Luke describes these activities in the following manner:

A set of cards is prepared with simple drawings of five objects, the names of which all begin with the same sound. There is also a box containing the five words, and a box containing all the letters required for building these words. The children are shown how to match the words with the picture and study them carefully. Take the letter box and build up words opposite their respective pictures.55

Book reading stage: At the beginning of the second year, the child reviews the first year's work, the digraphs are introduced, and new reading and writing books are begun.

Experience stories are also developed by the teacher and pupils. These stories provide opportunity for the child

55 Ibid., pp. 45-46.
to increase his ability to communicate, to read, and to write as these stories are expressed and copied by the child into a Writing Book; and, in turn, these booklets are used as Reading Books. This book and other supplementary readers are used in the following manner:

The children are told to read the first sentence to themselves. . . . After all have read the sentence to themselves, one is asked to read it aloud. The whole page is gone over in this way; during the silent reading anyone is at liberty to ask help . . . but no stumbling or hesitating is allowed in oral reading. If a child fails and requires to be helped he has to start his oral reading again from the reading of the sentence.

It appears that the continuous repetition of monotonous commands in the early development stage of this program may prevent the development of teaching reading as a thought-process and promote the teaching of reading as a memorization process.

The Finger Play Reading Program

In this scheme the reading activities progresses from the known rhyme to the parts, the phrase, word, letter sound, and then to the reconstruction of the whole. Although the author stresses that the main purpose of this method is to help children develop reading independence through an understanding of phonics, the organization of the content, five poems presented in Book One, is such that the mechanics of

56 Ibid., p. 58.
reading and the thought process are taught in a parallel manner. This correlation of phonics and meaning is interlaced into a reading program which may be described as a Phonic-Sentence Method.

**Historical development.** John W. Davis, District Superintendent of Schools, New York and Fanny Julien, first grade teacher, Public School 8, The Bronx, New York City, developed the Finger Play Method of teaching beginning reading.

**Description of the Finger Play Method.** In this reading program the author states that:

The purpose of the book is not to gain memorized reading, but to acquire independence through power in phonics. . . . There should be a many-sided presentation and a many-sided development. The work should include, therefore, much more than phonics. Phonics lead to word-getting, words lead to thoughts; thoughts, to character; and character, to service-giving.57

As the name implies the content of the reading material presented in this reader are finger plays, such as the child either has been taught at home or in the kindergarten. The selection of the phonic elements is carefully graded and words are selected which use these elements.

Reading instruction: The introduction of the reading material is accomplished by means of a picture or an object used with the intention of promoting a common interest

pattern to supplement and motivate text book reading. For instance, the teacher's manual suggests that the first lesson on the "Bee" and its accompanying picture will lead to the following experiences:

1. **Discussion**

   A. The Bee's work: Collecting the honey, collecting the pollen which he packs into the pocket shown on the hind leg; kneading the bee-bread for the food of the babies; the home building made of the wax which exudes from the bee's body; the nursing of the children; and the service to the queen.

   B. The Bee's character: The bee is a queen who must preserve her colony, or an industrious worker, or a drone.

   C. The Bee's appearance: Four wings, six legs, big eyes, and hairy body.

   D. Man's industry in connection with the bee.

2. **Motor activity**

   The motor-activity of children is employed by securing correlation between the free, swinging movement in writing, and the various forms of the Finger Play exercises.

3. **Phonic development**

   A. Let the children separate the sight word just gained into its phonograms: bee, b ee. Now write on the blackboard for phonic practice:

   \[
   \begin{align*}
   b & \quad e \quad e \quad s \quad b e e \\
   b & \quad e \quad e \quad b & \quad e \quad s \quad b e e s \\
   b & \quad e \quad e \quad h i v e & \quad b & \quad e \quad e \quad h i v e s & \quad b e e h i v e s \\
   b & \quad e & \quad e & \quad s & \quad b e e s
   \end{align*}
   \]

   Let the class sound these words together. Help them if necessary. Do not let the class say the words. After each sounding, let volunteers tell the word.

   B. Always supplement written blends by oral blends. For instance, for B we should give familiar words by lip-movement, letting the children guess them as b oy, b ite, b ack, b oot, b ill, etc.
For the phonogram ee: s ee, tr ee, fr ee, kn ee, etc.
For the phonogram a: boy a, girl a, pin a, needle a, eye a.

The daily lessons are presented through oral discussion, the finger play rhyme, written lessons, phonics, games, chart reading, drawing lessons, and textbook reading. The materials necessary for presenting the Finger Play Method are: phonic cards, word cards, line cards, pictures, and songs from Poulsson's "Finger Play."

Teaching techniques: In order to present devices of instruction as used in this method of teaching beginning reading, the following classroom procedure is presented.

(The teacher has written the following verses on oak-tag):

Five little chickadees
Peeping at the door;
One flew away,
And then there were four.
Chickadee, chickadee,
Happy and gay,
Chickadee, chickadee,
Fly away.

Teacher: "Let us all sing this song."

(The class sings as the teacher points to the words.)

Teacher: "This time let's make the motions. Can you make the chickadees fly away? ... Will you do it for us, Bea?"

(Bea sings the song and goes through the motion.)


59 Suggestions for this lesson come from Davis and Julien, Finger Play Readers, Teacher's Edition, pp. 54-58.
Teacher: "Who can read this?" (She holds up the first line of the verse.) ... "Andy?"

Andy: "Five little chickadees."

Teacher: "Yes."

(She then proceeds to hold up each line in sequence and the children "read" it.)

Teacher: "Our next lesson is hard. Let's put our feet flat on the floor - heads up - eyes this way." (She now holds up a card which reads One flew away.) "Who can find where it says this? ... all right, Guy?"

(Guy goes to the chart and finds it and reads it.)

(This type of exercise continues until each child has a turn.)

Teacher: "You certainly are hard workers. Just like the bees we studied about ... Point to any word that you know on the chart, Louis?"

(Louis goes to the board and points and says the word fly.)

(Other children are given an opportunity to find and tell a word they recognize.)

Teacher: "What is this word?" (She writes the word sit on the blackboard.)

George: "Sit!"

Teacher: "Yes. What is this word?" (She writes sitting on the blackboard.) ... "Pat?"

Pat: ... 

Teacher: "What is this sound?" (She prints s.)

Pat: "s s s."

Teacher: "Now this?" (She writes it after the letter s.)

Pat: "It."

Teacher: "Now put them together."
"sit."

"Now," (she points to the original word).

"sit'ing."

"What is the same about these words?" (She writes peeping and sitting.) . . . "Boyd?"

". . . inpire!"

"What does the steam car say?"

"ch ch ch!"

"Yes," (she writes ch on the board). "Now, what have I written (she writes ch ick).

. . . Does any one know? . . . Will it help you if I tell you this much says ick? . . . Yes, Leroy?"

"ch ick."

"Now say it faster."

"chick."

"Try this one?" (She writes ch ip.) . . . "Diane?"

"chip."

(This exercise she continues using the words ch in, ch ee r, ch ee ss, ch oo ss, ch ar t.)

"We had a wonderful lesson. I can hardly wait for the next lesson."

The Aldine Reading Program

This reading program is commonly referred to as the Aldine Method. The author states:

The method of teaching children to read, which is here presented . . . cannot be adequately characterized in a single word, like "phonic," "rhyme,"
"dramatic," "word," "sentence," "thought," "action."
It contains something of all these ideas and more.60

However, as the reading material is analyzed from sentences into phrases, words, and phonic elements, it appears to represent a modified version of the Sentence Method of teaching reading and has been so classified by such experts as Klapper61 and Smith.62

Historical development. The Aldine Series of readers were written in 1907 by Frank E. Spaulding, Superintendent of Schools at Newton, Massachusetts and Catherine T. Bryce, supervisor of primary schools in that system.

Description of the Aldine Reading Program. The organization of the teaching procedures, as suggested by Spaulding and Bryce, can be divided into five basic elements. These basic elements are: (1) the story which introduces the rhyme, (the rhyme is not of the Nursery Rhyme variety, but such as Come away. Come and play. Run with me. To the tree.), (2) the reading of the rhyme, (3) the picture study, (4) dramatization, and (5) phonic analysis.

The story: The purpose of the story which is told by the teacher is to motivate and provide background for the

61Klapper, op. cit., p. 61.
62Nila B. Smith, op. cit., p. 141.
understanding of the rhyme; however, the rhyme itself is not mentioned at this time.

The reading of the rhyme: After the children have heard and enjoyed the story, the rhyme is presented. The rhyme is to be memorized and then "read" from the blackboard, printed cards, and from cards placed in the hands of the children. The author of this reading program gives the following reasons or purposes for such a technique:

1. The procedure encourages a rapid growth of sight words.
2. The procedure encourages the learning of words in relation to other words and in a situation which has meaning to him.
3. The procedure enables the child to help himself for by repeating the entire rhyme he can recognize the unknown word.63

In order that understanding and comprehension of the script be vividly developed, each lesson has a picture, representing the rhyme under consideration, for the children to study in an attempt to infer the story. The method used in studying the picture is a question-answer technique to stimulate oral composition and to provide opportunity for the children to interpret that which they see.

Dramatization: The purpose of having the children dramatize each rhyme is (1) to make reading more natural and (2) to prevent stilted classroom presentation. The children's first dramatizations are of the rhymes and the stories told

63Spaulding and Bryce, op. cit., pp. 4-7.
by the teacher in introducing the rhyme. After they have become able to read with some fluency, they are encouraged to read and then dramatize the rhyme. In the early beginnings, dramatization is used as a preparation for the reading, later as a culminating exercise.

Phonic analysis: During the activities mentioned, the children have learned numerous sight words, and these sight words are now analyzed and become the basis for phonic drills.

The phonic drills consider the consonant sounds separate from the vowel sounds and attempt to associate each consonant sound with a sight word. The usual means by which this is done is to provide flash card drill. Each flash card has a sight word on one side and on the reverse side the symbol for the consonant sound. For example, a card may have the word \text{run} on one side, and on the other side \text{R}. Thus, if the child cannot sound R he is shown the reverse side of the card.

The vowels are not taught alone, as a result of their variation in sound patterns. From the sight words the children build a list of words, thus, \text{ome} of \text{ome} gives them \text{some}; and \text{run} gives them \text{fun}, \text{gun}, \text{sun}. Opportunity is also provided for the children to analyze new words after this basic understanding has been developed.
nerve endings to work together and therefore we say that they see more at a glance. Dolch\textsuperscript{4} in his book \textit{Psychology of Teaching} suggests that if an adult would turn his book upside down he would appreciate the situation in which the child learning to read finds himself, for then the adult would be using a group of nerve endings which are not trained to work together. He will find that he can see the vague shape of entire words along the line. He will also find that in order to read the words on the line he will read more slowly and will look most carefully for he is using only the central point of the retina where as a result of practice, the nerve centers are able to recognize single letters even in unusual positions.

The conclusion, therefore, must be that in order to promote skill in reading, opportunity must be provided so that the retinal nerve endings may learn to work together.

Perception. In Warren's \textit{Dictionary of Psychology} perception is defined as "the awareness of external objects, qualities, or relations, which ensues directly upon sensory processes, as distinguished from memory or other central processes."\textsuperscript{5} Perceiving like all other types of learning is


Materials of instruction: The equipment necessary in the teaching of this method are: (1) the reading chart, (2) the readers, (3) word cards, (4) phonic cards, (5) consonant cards, (6) phonic chart.

The reading chart: This is a reproduction in large print of the material presented in the Primer. It is used as visual aid at the beginning rather than the Primer, as the teacher can more readily direct and hold attention. After the first twenty-one pages of the chart have been presented, the primer should be used. The first fifty-five pages of the Primer are identical to the first twenty-one pages of the chart, thus the beginning pages in the Primer can be "read" rapidly.

When the Primer is completed, the children study the remaining pages of the Reading Chart, that is from page twenty-one. The last two rhymes in the chart are identical to the first two in The First Reader.

Two types of cards are recommended, Word Cards and Consonant Cards. The set of Word Cards contains all the words used in the Primer. Each card contains one sight word, both in script and print. The Consonant Cards contain the following consonants and combinations of consonants: b, c, d, f, g, h, l, k, m, n, p, qu, r, s, t, v, w, y, ch, sh, th, wh. On one side of the card is the consonant in two forms, capital and small letter. On the other side is the
word from which the consonant was learned. It is suggested that these cards be used for the purpose of promoting immediate recognition of the consonant sound and also that much concert work can be done to advantage.

The Phonic Chart: This type of chart is used after the first thirteen pages of the First Reader have been studied and continues to be used throughout the first year. The Phonic Chart contains one hundred and sixty-seven "family" words. They are so arranged that children can immediately see the phonic element. Besides the one hundred and sixty-seven "family" words there are thirty-three series of miscellaneous words, each series based on a common vowel with a uniform sound. In total the chart presents over two thousand different words. The purpose of the Phonic Chart is to aid the child in pronouncing and analyzing sounds with certain letters. The chart is used when an initial or sight word appears in the reading lesson that represents a "family" or series produced on the chart. The phonic words are presented for study by means of concert responses, individual construction of sentences using the designated word or words being studied, and spelling.

Advantages of the Sentence Method

Advocates of the Sentence Method generally support their position with the following contentions:
Meanings are emphasized. From the very beginning attention is focused on the meaning. The use of sentences for introducing reading induces the right attitude toward reading, since it makes it possible for the work of comprehension to begin at once. Spontaneous interest can be created, while word forms are being learned through the repetition of the old vocabulary in new relations.

When too great a stress is placed on the mechanics of reading, the meaning is forgotten. This neglect of the content results in dull, monotonous reading, which is frequently termed "word-calling." The learning of mechanics becomes the end, and recognition of both content and word is blocked. The treatment prescribed by the sentence method is to direct attention to meaning and develop a more direct association between the words and meanings.

A unit is recognized as a whole. This method is in accord with the Gestalt concept of learning that in reading as in all perception, a unit is recognized as a whole and not a synthesis of its composing elements. The Gestalt psychologists believe that to discover the part, it is necessary to analyze from the larger whole. Anderson and Dearborn in discussing the Sentence Method and assumption of Gestalt psychology present their opinion in the following manner:

Learning consists, then, in the refinement of the total pattern of response into a specific response. The sentence offers an interesting
analogy. The sentence, to begin with, constitutes an undifferentiated whole. The discovery of the individual words is in the nature of the differentiation which these notions call for at least in theory.

This method of teaching beginning reading is also in accord with another Gestalt principle. This second concept is that the whole is greater than the sum of its parts. Thus, in reading, it is the sentence that is the whole, for it is the group of related words which tell the meaning. For example: 'What is the meaning of the word tumbler?'

1. I have a glass tumbler.
2. He is a tumbler.
3. The tumbler in the lock is broken.
4. He rode in a tumbler. (light cart)
5. He has a tumbler. (a breed of domestic pigeons)

The major objective of the Sentence Method is to develop the meanings of a sentence from the very beginning.

Encourages left to right eye-movement. Through the use of sentences as materials of reading, the child learns that interpretation of printed symbols demands a movement of the eyes from left to right. When extensive time is spent in drilling isolated words, such as suggested in the Word Method, by means of such devices as "climbing ladders," "jumping rocks," or "picking apples," the idea may develop that reading demands a "hit and run" eye-movement rather than a continuous left to right process across the printed page.

---

Encourages the use of contextual clues. Bond and Bond\textsuperscript{65} declare that the use of context clues is one of the most important, if not the most important, means of word recognition. This method of word recognition is rapid and effective. The Sentence Method encourages the use of this vital means of word recognition as from the very beginning it provides a sentence, a meaningful situation and by so doing limits the unknown word to a specific few which would fit into the meaning of the passage being read.

Another factor to be considered in estimating the value of the use of contextual clues in reading is that such clues increase the child's ability to remember words, for example - "Jack ran to Mother" is more rapidly recalled than the isolated words: ran, Jack, Mother, to.

Promotes word recognition. Proponents of the method further argue that it has the advantages of the following principles of recognition.

1. The individual gradually becomes more and more aware of detailed appearances of words.

2. The awareness of details will function subconsciously, resulting in quicker and more accurate recognition.

3. The individual letters of the alphabet are learned later, after the pupil has made sufficient progress in word recognition to prevent confusion and avoid the slowing down of his reading rate to "spell out" each word.

Limitations of the Sentence Method

In the Sentence Method the sentence is recognized as a whole and afterwards analyzed into words. In theory the procedures are carefully graded, and the sentences selected for study are those that promise the most interesting reading for the child with the introduction of the fewest possible new words. In criticism of this Klapper has declared:

The daily lessons lack system and gradation, the sentences are insipid and absolutely unrelated to the child's life... The sentence method teaches us that correct reading is for thought, but in its practical application it becomes as uninspirational as the Word Method, but without the compensating skillful and careful gradation. In the final analysis the method is merely an introductory device, for it must soon fall back on phonic drill in its endeavor to teach independent word recognition. 67

It, thus, appears that the Sentence Method may not present the most interesting reading content to children, and that there is doubt whether the method is a complete method of teaching reading, for sooner or later, as Klapper has pointed out, attention has to be given to individual words and techniques of word analysis.

Other disadvantages of the Sentence Method are:

1. The child does not read by phrases.

2. The child may not notice the individual words of the sentence.


67 Klapper, op. cit., p. 50.
3. The child may make a wrong association between meaning and symbol.

The child does not read by phrases. The Sentence Method rests upon the misconception that, since expert adult readers "read by phrases," the child can and should do so. Actually, only oral reading is done by phrases. In silent reading, the expert's eye perceives each line in four or five fixations which divide the line into approximately equal sections. These may include groups and sections of words, but not a system of sentences, since the eye does not know where a phrase will end until its gaze reaches there. Too much time spent on teaching phrases is wasteful. The specific phrases are of no value in later reading, since the words will be met in new, different arrangements.

There is a false analogy to a false assumption. The child is supposed to be able to read by phrases because a good reader can. But the phrasing is done by the "consciousness," rather than by the eye. The adult can read several words at once because he knows the individual words so well that he does not need to consider each separately.

The method "puts the cart before the horse." Perception of phrases is based upon and results from understanding perception of individual words. That process, performed with sufficient rapidity that the words are blended into phrases, is a mature level of reading. The young child does not have such skill in perception and blending of individual words,
and cannot perform at that level. He can only appear to do so by depending on memory of text.

The method confuses silent and oral reading. The smoothness is acquired only through practice, since children must get one word at a time. The repetition necessary to achieve smoothness may result in recitation rather than reading. Thus, the child is forced to play the role of a parrot. Such exact repetition of the thought is an uneducative way of providing review of words.

The child may not notice the individual words of the sentence. A child may learn the sentence "See the ball roll" and be able to "read" it, naming each word correctly. But then show him the sentence: "The ball is round." Usually he will fail to recognize "ball" because it is in a new sentence-situation. If the sentence is read in a way to help convey the thought, he may then recognize the word. Wheeler and Perkins suggest that young children may use a word many times in a sentence, where the context gives them the meaning, before they are able to identify the word alone. From this they conclude that "the memorization of words through flash-cards is an ineffective procedure."

The child may make a wrong association between meaning and symbol. Dolch, in his critique of the Sentence Method,

declares that children frequently fail to associate correctly the sounds and symbols:

When any story or other material is gone over a second time, and if there are several repetitions some children will memorize whole pages. Then to "read" he will run over in memory the familiar material, pointing at one word after another. Children doing this often make amusing mistakes when in the memorizing of the story they have dropped out a word and thus fail to match correctly. Or they may not be careful about pointing at the words and may match most of the sounds to the wrong ones. 69

Thus, one of the major limitations of this method of teaching beginning reading is inadequate training in tying down eye-movement. In the early development stage of reading, little supervision and training is provided to encourage the child to read here when he is reading that specific word in a sentence.

Present Status of the Sentence Method

The ratings 70 as supplied by the judges, who evaluated the Sentence Method by the established criteria, show that the opinions varied.

The following outline lists the characteristics according to ratings received:

Not provided for:

1. Speed determined by purpose.

69 Dolch, op. cit., p. 43.
70 Appendix, pp. 339-340.
2. Provision for the development of readiness for reading.
3. Provision for postponement of reading until readiness has been developed.
4. Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading.
5. Provision for developing permanent interests in reading.
6. Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials.
7. Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading.
8. Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs.

Provided for, but inadequately:

1. Understanding of the nature of how children learn.
2. Use of picture clues.
3. Use of syllabification.
5. Opportunity for silent reading.
7. Depth of word meaning.
8. Significant increase in vocabulary and content.
9. Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading.

Provided for adequately:

1. Use of general configuration.
2. Use of striking characteristics of words.
3. Use of content clues.
4. Opportunity to interpret material.

Besides the above mentioned characteristics with which there was complete agreement in regard to the degree to which the Sentence Method provided for the different facets of an adequate reading program, there were several other characteristics in which the judges' ratings show disagreement concerning the degree for which the method provided for
developed through repeated experiences. Other things being equal, by the time the child enters school, he has learned to perceive and to attend closely to those elements in his environment which have meaning to him. This ability to make visual discriminations is a basic reading ability. Thus, instruction in visual discrimination becomes one of the responsibilities of the teacher.

How words are perceived in reading. The psychologists have not only discovered how the eye sees, but also how words are perceived. A number of studies suggest how word recognition takes place in reading. David Russell reviews this process in the following manner:

The first step seems to be observation of the whole word or phrase in terms of general shape, or configuration. The arrangement of the consonants determines the general shape and serves as a primary perception clue. The length of the word is important for whole-word recognition. Perception clues of the beginning and end of words, and especially the beginning are more important than those in the middle of the words. The relation of the word to the rest of the sentence or paragraph, the context clue, helps to determine recognition. When the general shape of the word fails to bring recognition and when the context clue is vague, the reader may resort to some form of word analysis. . . . The next step may involve sounding the first letter, or

---

the traits. These characteristics and pattern of disagreement are shown in the following table.

TABLE I
CHARACTERISTICS AND PATTERN OF DISAGREEMENT CONCERNING FACETS OF THE SENTENCE METHOD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics</th>
<th>Number of Judges</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Provision for phonetic analysis</td>
<td>3 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for comprehension</td>
<td>4 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for evaluation of material</td>
<td>1 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for drawing conclusions</td>
<td>3 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for beginning reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading</td>
<td>2 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>2 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual differences in ability, needs, and interests</td>
<td>1 4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A critical analysis of this table will show that although disagreement is presented in regard to the degree of
provision made for certain characteristics, there is more agreement than disagreement. Each characteristic received a majority of votes in regard to the manner in which the Sentence Method provided for that facet of the reading program. For example, three judges declared phonetic analysis was provided for in an adequate manner, while two declared that such was provided for in an inadequate manner.

In the light of these criteria a valid reading program should provide many types of experiences and guidance in reading. The present evaluation of the Sentence Method shows that according to the opinion of the selected judges this method has definite limitations, but certain techniques as suggested may aid a child gain certain word attack techniques such as the use of general configuration, striking characteristics, content clues, and other facets important in learning to read.

Section III
The Story Method

The use of stories in literature as materials for teaching reading had been gradually introduced. The influential events were Herbartian's doctrine of concentration, the desire to develop conformity in cultural and language patterns, and the acceptance that reading was the broadening of experience by means of thought derived from printed symbols.
The Story Method of teaching beginning reading is an analytic method. Children learn to read by first concentrating on the theme of a story and then on phrases, words, and letter sounds. Thus, in the Story Method, printed symbols are presented in a meaningful situation, understanding is developed, and teaching procedures proceed from the whole to functional parts.

Historical Development

Between the years 1909-1918 academic objectives and textbook content were greatly influenced by an attempt: (1) to assimilate the various foreign cultural patterns represented in the United States and (2) to develop a "feeling" for and an understanding of Americanism. It was during this period (1909-1918) that the Story Method of teaching beginning reading became an active method of instruction.

In 1913 educational theory supported the hypothesis that the process of reading and writing could be reduced to a series of associations repeated so frequently as to become a habit. As the Story Method provided a means of cumulative repetition through the use of rhymes and folk stories, this method was probably the most consistent exposition of the stimuli-response theory of learning.

---


72 Nila B. Smith, American Reading Instruction, p. 141.
The Story Method became very popular as a reading method and was applied as the basis for numerous reading textbook series.

Description of the Story Method

In this method the general procedures are: The teacher tells a story or rhyme to the children. It is re-told by the children, discussed, and dramatized until the entire group has become very familiar with it, and many have memorized it. The children, with the teacher's assistance, then read and analyze the selection into phrases and separate words. Much of this is chalkboard work. The next stage is applying phonics in the sounding out of words. The use of phonics is not strongly emphasized, and is restricted to a supporting role, with primary emphasis continuing to be upon sight recognition of words and upon sentence meaning. The final step is re-reading the entire selection.

The reading of the story or rhyme. The objective of reading the story or rhyme to the children is to furnish the child with a knowledge of the story, to enrich the child's general culture, and to develop within the child a desire to read the story.

The stories selected should possess some of the following characteristics:
There should be a strong predominance of action in the story and it should be told in narrative form. Children are more attracted by movement and respond to this element more quickly than they do to inactive elements, such as descriptions of things and places. As they are more interested in the present than the past or the future, the action should take place in the present time and be told in a conversational manner so that the children can more quickly identify themselves with the action. This seems to be in character with their tendency to vocalize their thought processes.

The story must develop step by step and come to a well-defined and definite climax. An adult has the ability to keep up interest and dispose of unrelated parts, but not the child. Children have short attention spans, and if they are not held in suspense, their attention will wander and they will become restless and inattentive to the story. The story should be expansive in detail and possess literary value.

The content of the story should deal primarily with things that interest children. The language used in telling the story should be child-like in character and in the child's experience so that he can understand and appreciate the story being told.

After the story has been selected it must be told in an interesting and exciting manner. The teacher must study
the story carefully and determine what parts of the story should be developed, and an outline should be made so that the story lines progress toward the climax in a logical, interesting, and comprehensive manner. Also, consideration should be given to the value of such technique as: self-activity, group participation, gestures, voice tone, and concrete objectives in presenting the story.

After adequate plans have been made for presentation of the story, attention is given to the child's physical comfort. The introduction of the story is much more than the telling of the title; it is a time when the knowledge already possessed by the children is explored and developed to aid in the interpretation of the story.

The story is then told by the teacher in a clear expressive voice, so they can enjoy it with her.

Retelling the story or rhyme. After the children have heard the story, they should be provided with opportunities to discuss the story, dramatize it, construct objects and characters in the story, and retell it. The oral reproduction should be vivid in detail with expressive words and correct enunciation. However, the teacher should not interrupt the story telling process for the purpose of correcting errors in English. This should be done merely by supplying the correct word and permitting the child to continue. "Do not try to teach correct forms during this period."

---

73 Goldwasser, op. cit., p. 95.
Reading and analyzing the story or rhyme into words.

After the children have experienced many rich experiences reproducing the story orally, the story is reconstructed for blackboard or chart reading. It may be all of the story or a part or an outline of events. However, it must be developed through teacher-pupil planning. As there is agreement of the sentences to be used, the teacher writes the line on the board or chart. When the whole story or selected part has been reproduced in print, the children read it as a whole in unison and then individually. Then, attention is first directed to matching identical lines and later words. At first the children will not be able to read the matched lines or words, but with adequate repetition will learn to discriminate word forms. The lesson is always ended by having them reread the story as a whole.

The rereading of the story or rhyme. According to the procedures suggested by the Story Method the children are now ready to read the story or rhyme and should do so with great joy and expression. The reading of the story may be silent or in an audience situation.

It appears, however, that the reading of the story might be an anti-climax after such a long period of preparation. It also seems that there might be a tendency for the children to repeat from memory rather than read, and thus many words may be omitted or added in the process. The
suggestion of an outline developed by the teacher to guide the blackboard reading is a technique employed by some teachers to overcome or react against this last criticism; however, no provision is made to "save" the element of surprise for this last stage.

The application of phonic analysis. The phonic analysis of the words does not occur until the children are thoroughly acquainted with a large number of sight words. The time of presentation and procedures for this stage varies with different systems of the Story Method.

Using the Story Method as a Classroom Technique

The first few minutes of the reading period are spent in recalling main points in the story read the day before. The characters are named and described, the plot is outlined briefly through volunteered comments of children and the skillful corrections, modifying comments, questions, and suggestions by the teacher. Throughout the discussion the teacher works to "bring out" the quiet children and to get contributions from those who have difficulty remembering what was read.

When the children are relaxed, "in the swing" of discussing the story and evidencing a group feeling, the teacher brings out the books to introduce the lesson for the day.
"You are going to like the story we have today. It is called 'Peter Visits Grandmother,' and I think it is even better than the one about Mary and Peter picking apples. How many of you have grandmothers?"
(Most of the children raise their hands.)
"Oh, good. And do some of you have grandmothers who live in another town? In a big city? In the country? (Various answers, which the teacher accepts, but keeps brief.)
"Yes. Well, that's fine. Where does Peter live? Do any of you know?"

"In a village."

"Is that the same Peter we read about yesterday?"

"Yes, this is the same Peter."

"On the farm."

"You are right. Peter does live in the country on a big farm."

(Various comments are made by the children about the trees on a farm, horses, and cows, and so on.)

"Peter's grandmother - the one he is going to visit - lives in a big city. The city is a long way from Peter's home. How do you suppose Peter gets over to visit her?"

"Could he walk?"

"On a bus?"

"On a train?"

"His dad took him in the car."

These are pretty important questions. We'll have to read the story to find out. And we want to know why Mary didn't go; and how long Peter stayed with his grandmother. What else do we want to know about Peter's visit?"

"Yes, why didn't Mary go along? Did Peter take any apples to his grandmother? Did he have anybody to play with there? Did he have to go to school?"
Miss Telltail: "Oh, those are fine questions. I'll read some of the story and we'll see what we find out. Would you like that? . . . All right, good!"

(The teacher reads three paragraphs, pausing at important points, such as receiving the letter from grandmother inviting Peter, the school's Thanksgiving holiday, etc. to emphasize them in the children's thinking. Brief discussion accompanies the teacher's reading.)

Miss Telltail: "This sounds interesting, doesn't it? Would you like to read the whole story yourselves now?"

(The children agree, of course. Sometimes a few rugged individualists do not agree. The teacher then has a further sales job, with large demands on the chorus department, or abandons the cooperative approach and "lays down the law" according to the best authoritarian tradition.)

Miss Telltail: (Passing out the readers.) "Our story begins on page 27. Open your books to that page, please. Would it be a good idea to begin reading at the first of the story? . . . That way, you will know the story better." (By rereading the portion the teacher read aloud, the children get off to a good start.)

(For about ten minutes the children read silently, occasionally asking for help with a word. When most of them were through the second page the teacher stopped them. She asked several to tell the story of what they had read. She then recognized three or four volunteers who offered corrections and supplementary detail. The teacher then asked a series of questions from a list she had prepared earlier. What time of year did Peter go? What clothes did he take? When did he leave home? Who went to the station with him? etc.

Miss Telltail: "Would you like to read to the others? Alice would? Jerry? Sam? Mary and Sue? Good. Alice, will you read the first paragraph?"

(The children read orally until (a) they reach the end of the material read silently or (b) the time draws near its limit. The teacher then reads the remainder of the story and proceeds with discussion as above. If there is not enough time to complete the story enough of it is saved for the next day's lesson.)
dividing into syllables, or attempting phonetic analysis, depending upon previous teaching methods. Such analysis must be followed by synthesis of the word parts.⁷

Thus, the integrative act of word perception includes all or parts of the following patterns of recognition: (1) general word form, (2) special characteristic of the word, (3) similarities to known words, and (4) recognition of familiar word elements.

Scientific Findings

The research findings of Cattell, Erdmann and Dodge, Dearborn, Huey and more recently of Judd, C. T. Gray, Schmidt, W. S. Gray, Buswell, and others have contributed much to the understanding of how words are perceived.

Nature of perceptual ability (total form of words): Smith⁸ declares that Cattell, one of the first to carry on extensive investigations in this field, concluded that larger units could be perceived as quickly as single letters.

After a study of perception, in which conditions were so set that the distance of the words from the subject tested prevented letter recognition, Smith⁹ further states that Erdmann and Dodge declared that there was a tendency to

---

⁹ Ibid., p. 141.
Reading Programs Based on the Story Method

Essentially, the reading programs based upon the Story Method consist of memorization of a story or rhyme, analyzing the story into sentences, phrases, and words, and applying phonetics for the sounding of words. Gates\(^4\) describes a modified version of the Story Method, which he calls the Cooperative, Cumulative Story Method. The essence of this approach to the Story Method is that the teacher analyzes the selection to be studied to determine which words, phrases, and ideas may be new or difficult. Through pre-reading discussions, a background essential to free and fluent comprehension is developed. In the discussion, ideas related to the story are introduced, experiences similar to those in the story are explored, key words are included and interpreted. In some cases the teacher may then guide the children in making up stories, shared orally, which use the new words and ideas. In other cases the teacher may suggest titles for a group story, or several smaller groups may compose stories, announcements may be thought up and worded, or letters written. The children work together as a room-group; then, on occasion, in smaller groups but still under the teacher's guidance. As suggestions are made by the teacher

or various children, they are discussed and adopted, modified, or discarded. Ideas, phrases, and sentences suited to the topic are repeated, modified as necessary, and written on the chalkboard. The work is continued until a "story" of satisfactory length, vocabulary level, and content, has been completed. By this stage the children have thought about, heard, and said the various words until they can easily read the composition. These exercises with sufficient variety to maintain interest, continue until the children are adequately prepared to read the story in the reader-text without undue difficulty.

Numerous reading programs developed using either the approach of developing the content through the telling of the story theme or the establishing of relations by means of conversation. Reading programs based upon the Story Method which emphasizes the telling of the story are: (1) The McCloskey, (2) The Natural, and (3) The Progressive Road to Reading; while (1) The Edson-Laing, (2) The Merrill Readers, and (3) The Elson-Runkel are based upon the approach which establishes relationship through conversation. These are by no means all the reading programs based upon the Story Method; however, they appear to be most representative of this method.
Reading Programs Whose Approach
Stresses Telling the Story

The McCloskey Reading Program

In this reading program the presentation of the reading material is organized around the following steps: (1) motivation and readiness for the story, (2) the presentation of sight words drawn from the text of the story, (3) phonetic study, (4) reading the story.

The motivation and readiness for the story. The teacher is encouraged to make every possible effort to awaken the children's interest. Such techniques as pictures, reading stories, dramatization, and telling and retelling of the story may be used. However, it is the oral treatment of the story which is used most frequently. The oral treatment was supposed to promote clarity and interest in the story.

Under this plan the folk story was told, retold, dramatized, memorized, and read from a wall-chart. C. A. McMurry gives the following reason for this detailed presentation:

The reality of the surrounding conditions and difficulties is presented so that a child transports himself by the power of sympathy and imagination into the scenes described. There is no way by which this result can be accomplished in early years except by the oral presentation of stories.75

---

75 Charles A. McMurry, Special Method in Reading in the Grades (New York: The Macmillan Company, 1908), pp. 3-4.
The general aims for the oral presentation of the story are:

1. To give the children a knowledge of the story.
2. To create an interest in the story.
3. To provide models of correct enunciation.
4. To promote content for other stories.

After the story has been dramatically told to the children, they are provided with an opportunity to retell the story and frequently are encouraged to dramatize and to construct from paper objects or persons represented in the story.

The presentation of the sight words. In the presentation of sight words, every device which will promote immediate recognition should be used. After the children have been introduced to the story through oral presentation and related activities, the children are directed to a series of reading lessons. In these lessons the teacher recalls the story and asks for statements concerning the content of the story. The teacher, from their answers, selects a sentence and writes it on the blackboard. Each child reads it and points to each word. This type of exercise continues for several sentences. As new words are presented, they are mixed up on the board with the known words and quick and varied drill on the words in sentences or in isolation are provided. A few words may be used for phonetic analysis, at this time. "In short, the sentence, word, and phonetic methods are all used in fitting alternation, while originality and variety of device are
necessary in the best exercise of teaching power."

The short sentences as developed through teacher-pupil participation provide an outline of the story. This outline content of the story is now written on a chart or blackboard so that it may be used for several days. Several of the outline content stories can be used to make a book.

The reading lesson just described is entirely separate from the oral presentation; yet the oral telling of the story furnishes interest and motivation for this part of the reading program.

Phonetic study. As an important aim of the teaching of reading is to make children independent in word recognition, the children are instructed in phonetic sounding of words. Goldwasser calls the phonetic technique used in the McCloskey Reading Program as a "content-to-form" method. 77

This method proceeds as follows: After the children have developed a sight vocabulary of about fifty words, phonetic exercises are introduced. Using the known basic sight words, all phonetic elements are studied analytically. Thus, in the first step of the phonetic program, assurance is made that the child sees the symbol, hears the sound, understands the meaning, and meets it in story content.

76 Ibid., p. 116.

77 Goldwasser, op. cit., p. 15.
The word to be studied for sound elements is presented as a whole. The word is pronounced slowly until it is completely separated into separate letters, for example, man to m-a-n. The children are then aided to associate the sounds they have heard with the letters. Correlated with this exercise is instruction in writing.

The second technique is the use of a series of "family" words which are written on the blackboard. The teacher pronounces and points to each word a number of times. She then calls upon the children to tell the sound that is similar in all the words. All guessing is discouraged; if the child hesitates, the teacher repeats the list. For the next step the teacher rewrites the list, this time leaving a small space between the initial consonant and the final group-sound. After a child has again identified the group-sound, it is circled and explained by the teacher.

After these introductory lessons, a combination of the two methods is used for all phonic sounds. "The essential point of difference (in the content-to-form method) is that the initial sound is presented not as the result of an articulatory separation by the teacher, but as the result of a process of comparison and discrimination on the part of the children."78

---

78 Ibid., p. 18.
In this method, all sounds and elements should have been taught by the end of the third year, and the children beyond this year should concentrate upon the correct pronunciation of words.

Reading. The oral study and the presentation of the sight words plus phonetic analysis of functional words set the stage for book reading. As the children are thoroughly acquainted with the story content the reading from a book will be easy and develop naturally.

The realm of folk-tales provide numerous stories that can be used. In each grade there should be several sets of readers which can be used as needed.

The Natural Reading Program

In this reading program the child begins to learn to read by memorizing:

A, B, C,
Tumble Down D
The cat is in the cupboard
And can't see me.79

In fact this reading program attempts to develop the art of reading by presenting a content exclusively of nursery rhymes. These are presented in such a manner that complexity of content and vocabulary increases gradually.

79 Hannan T. McManus and John H. Haaren, The Natural Readers, as quoted by Paul Klapper, op. cit., p. 233.
Procedures. This reading program emphasizes the following sequence of procedure: (1) recitation by the teacher, (2) repetition by the pupils, (3) dramatization, (4) word study, (5) blackboard reading, and (5) phonics teaching.

The Progressive Road to Reading

In regard to this reading program, Klapper declared: "A system of reading unanimously praised by those who use it is the 'Progress Road to Reading.' Like the 'Natural Method' (Culture Primers), it is an extended and systematic application of the principles and organization as worked out in the Story Method of Margaret McCloskey."

Description of the program. The procedures used in presenting the reading material and mechanics of reading are developed according to the following facets of the method: (1) the teaching of the story, (2) the development of phonetic concepts and, (3) the correlation of reading and writing.

The telling of the story. The teacher first tells the story which is then made the subject of conversation and dramatization. This oral presentation is then followed by

---

82 Klapper, op. cit., pp. 75-76.
(1) printing each sentence of the story on the board, (2) studying individual words by position in the sentence, (3) drilling words in isolation, and (4) constructing new sentences using identical words.

Phonics. In this facet of the Progressive reading program the sight words are used as a means of teaching phonics. The sight words are analyzed, the parts are studied, and then blended. Thus, family words such as pen, ten, den, and men are developed from the study of the word hen.

The correlation of reading and writing. Learning to write is an integrated part of this reading program as the children are provided with an opportunity to imitate the teacher's writing. For example, "A word it is put on the board, explained, written again and again, erased, and then the children imitate it." After enough words have been learned, sentences using these words are studied in the same manner.

Reading Programs Whose Approach Stresses the Establishment of Relation Through Conversation

The Edson-Laing Reading Program

This reading program is advocated by Andrew W. Edson and Mary L. Laing and was published in The Edson and Laing Readers by the Benjamin H. Sanborn Company in 1913. The

---

83 Ibid., p. 77.
approach to reading instruction is through teacher and pupil discussion. This program attempted to develop the following objectives: (1) to develop immediate recognition of words, (2) to develop correct reading habits, and (3) to develop an appreciation of literature. Suggested classroom procedures were (1) the explanation of the story, (2) the telling of the story by the teacher and pupils, (3) recitation and question, (4) dramatization, (5) word drill, (6) the reading of the story and (7) phonetics.

The explanation of the story. The teacher with the cooperation of the children discussed the words, characters, customs, and facts essential to develop the theme and understand the story. Besides the verbal explanation, educational devices, such as objects and pictures, could be used to further comprehension and motivation.

The telling of the story by the teacher and pupils. As in the other reading programs based on the Story Method, the story is told and then retold by the children until memorization is acquired.

Recitation and questions. In order that the child has complete mastery of the theme of the story, numerous opportunities are provided for the story to be recited and many questions asked to determine his knowledge of characters and facts represented in the content.
perceive the objects of everyday experiences primarily as wholes - analysis being a secondary factor - and that there is no reason why perception in reading should constitute an exception.

In order to test this theory thoroughly, Dearborn\textsuperscript{10} photographed the eyes during tachistoscopic reading and concluded that this data simply brought out the fact that the span of attention varies for individuals, and the reader who recognizes wholes has no need of synthesis.

In making an experimental analysis of total word form Huey found that the first half of the word is of considerably greater importance for perception than the latter half.\textsuperscript{11} Further analysis of data provided by his study indicated that the same is true of the upper part of words as compared with the lower. Although this study stressed the importance of characteristic letters and letter complexes, Huey did not advocate that we perceive words letter by letter. To quote directly:

\begin{quote}
However, while the experiments of these investigators indicate the special part which dominant letters and letter groups play in setting off the word recognition, we need by no means suppose that the former are always or usually apperceived as distinct letters in performing their function or special sign. . . .
\end{quote}


**Dramatization.** The presentation of the story through drama is used to "speed-up" the memorization of the story theme, to aid the teacher's evaluation of the child's understanding of sequence of events, and to keep interest alive. It does seem as if the authors believed that interest, like a cat, has nine lives.

**Word drill.** After this extensive treatment of the thought background, the child's attention is directed to word recognition. This is accomplished by the teacher's reciting the sentence in which the word or word occurs, writing it on the board in script, and then reproducing the word or words to be learned several times. Following this activity, the whole story is presented on the board for drill.

**Reading.** After several weeks have been spent developing the theme and the learning of the words, the children read the same story from books.

**Phonetics.** Phonetic instruction is not introduced until the child has mastered a basic sight vocabulary of about sixty words. At that time phonetic instruction is presented after the usual reading lesson. The method suggested by the authors is the development of "phonetic families"; thus, the word *sell* is synthesized into the parts *s e ll*, and such words as *tell*, *Nell*, *bell*, etc. are developed. In the study of vowel sounds diacritical marks are used to aid the child in learning the various vowel sounds.
The Merrill Reading Program

This reading program attempts to develop the reading vocabulary from the speech patterns of children. The program was suggested by Franklin B. Dyer and Mary J. Brady and presented by the Charles E. Merrill and Company in 1915 in the Merrill Readers. The reading content of this reading series includes Mother Goose rhymes and other rhymes in the Primer, folk tales and fables in Book One, and favorite stories in prose, verse and dialogue in the Second Reader.

Description of the Program. The children are introduced to the reading content by discussing a picture showing two children on a "see-saw." As the children tell about the picture, the teacher introduces orally and visually the words: see-saw, up, down, etc. until all the words in the following rhyme are presented:

See-saw! See-saw!
Here we go up and down.
See-saw! See-saw!

This rhyme is then memorized by the children. The jingle is now played, dramatized, recited, and sung. In the lessons that follow the teacher places selected phrases and sentences, such as, Here we go, and up and down on the board and the children learn them by locating them in original verse. After such phrases and sentences can be recognized, the children are directed to locate individual words.

Ibid., p. 212.
Phonic analysis is introduced through ear training. The rhymes provide the material and children are asked by the teacher to tell rhyming words and to construct original rhymes. After such lessons have been provided to develop ear training, initial sound, phonograms, and vowel sounds are presented visually and learned by comparative auditory analysis of sound elements.

The Elson-Runkel Reading Program

In this reading program developed by William H. Elson and Laura E. Runkel, reading is defined as the art of interpreting the thought of a printed page. 85

Description of the program. The procedures used in developing reading instruction in the Elson-Runkel Reading Program are similar to those suggested in the Merrill and the Edson-Laing programs. First the teacher tells a longer story to develop a readiness, motivation, and content for word introduction. The oral presentation of this story is followed by dramatization, sentence, word, and phonetic analysis.

Phonetic instruction is an integrate part of the word recognition study. Klapper describes it in the following manner:

The first time a word is seen it is taught as a sight word. Thus, if *can* is a sight word, the next word having the same phonetic characteristics, viz., *an*, will be taught in comparison with the original, and the phonogram *an*, is thus made known. Children then read sentences after they give evidence that they have attained sufficient power with words and phrases.\(^{86}\)

The next and last step in this reading program is the reading of the story in the primer.

**Advantages of the Story Method**

McKee\(^{87}\) has declared that instruction in beginning reading must be of such a nature that the child learns to look upon reading as a process of making meaning, that selections read should be interesting, and that his experiences in associating meaning and language be based on his past oral language.

Theoretically, the Story Method attempts to introduce reading as a thought process, provide interesting and meaningful material, and base beginning reading instruction on the past oral experiences of the child.

**Reading as a thought process.** As long as the teaching of beginning reading is confined strictly to the identification of letters, sound-elements, or words, only one aspect of a larger issue is being considered. This issue is mechanics of reading.

\(^{86}\text{Ibid., p. 219.}\)

The fundamental purpose of reading is to derive meaning from the printed page. Words are meaningful only when they represent ideas. In order that attention be directed upon meaning, it is necessary in the beginning of reading instruction to refrain from detailed synthetic drill of word elements. When interest in the content is genuine, the child will be aided in seeing word-configuration and phonetic elements in words. The study of word perception must take into consideration word-meanings, as used in content, such as suggested in the Story Method.

Reading for thought as the child does in the Story Method, he naturally learns to anticipate certain words in context and is able to associate the correct verbal sound with its meaning. Thus, he can independently form new associations and build a sight vocabulary instantaneously and directly with meaning. It does appear, however, that this reading vocabulary can be developed in a more direct and vivid manner if the stories used are short and are related to his experiences.

The Story Method from the very first, places emphasis upon the thought-unit in the form of a rhyme or a story. Unlike the Alphabetic and Phonetic methods this method does not require the expenditure of extensive time on word analysis. It postpones the learning of this skill until children have developed a readiness for it and until it can be understood
as an aid in reading. The secondary place assigned to phonics in this method helps assure the teacher that phonics is a means to an end and not an end in itself. The Story Method does not depend upon the transfer of a skill learned in a word-drill situation to a thought-getting situation. It makes an active attempt to integrate word recognition skill and comprehension.

Provides interesting and meaningful material. If a child is to develop and maintain his interest in reading, the material presented must be interesting and meaningful to him. It is claimed by the supporters of this method that the use of cumulative stories and rhymes as material for beginning reading promotes and provides meaningful content, as the child has learned to "love" these stories through hearing them many times.

Besides the use of cumulative stories and rhyme the Story Method uses other interesting and meaningful materials. For example, the Elson Readers\textsuperscript{88} covered the following topics: cultural background, nature and science, transportation and communication, history, biography, citizenship, industry, invention, adventure, humor, travel, and world friendship.

Thus content used for reading instruction not only emphasized interest patterns, but also meaningful and functional materials.

\textsuperscript{88} Nila B. Smith, \textit{American Reading Instruction}, p. 151.
The use of realistic subject matter increased the awareness of and opportunities for integration of reading and various content subjects. The reading courses could become an integrated part of English, history, geography, health, and science and could be used as a means to break down rigid course lines. This method illustrated that reading could become an integral part of the school curriculum rather than an isolated subject to be taught from 9 to 9:30. It greatly influenced the acceptance of the concept of reading to learn rather than learning to read.

Beginning reading instruction is based on the oral experiences of children. The child not only needs to be interested in the content of the story, but often an academic background is needed to understand the meanings of the new words he will meet in the story. In the Story Method of teaching beginning reading particular attention is focused upon oral experiences to provide this needed background. As the child's past experiences in associating meaning and language have been oral, the reading process is motivated and stimulated by the teacher and children orally expressing the content of the reading material before such is presented in visual form.

Oral expression, however, is limited to such activities as the teacher's telling and the children's retelling or dramatizing the theme of the story being studied. Thus, the
start is made with the unit of oral expression which lends itself to reading for meaning.

Limitations of the Story Method

This is an extension of the Sentence Method and as such suffers the same limitation, i.e., it is not a complete method, for sooner or later attention must be given to word recognition and to letter sounds. Anderson and Dearborn have said:

Memory reading may best be regarded as representing merely a stage of learning to read by the sentence and story methods, just as word-by-word reading may represent a stage of learning to read by the word and phonetic methods. A real problem develops only when the children are hung up in these stages. 89

Besides the limitation of omission to provide a means of developing word-attack techniques, the Story Method of teaching beginning reading appears also to have the following limitations:

1. The oral presentation of the whole story may destroy a desire to read it.

2. Familiarity with the content may encourage "poor" habits of concentration.

3. The repetition of familiar material is in conflict with the way people learn.

4. The emphasis on memorization may postpone the teacher's recognition of individual weaknesses.

89Anderson and Dearborn, op. cit., p. 255.
5. The Story Method fails to develop proper eye-movement habits.

6. Slow and laborious analysis of a story fails to develop literary appreciation.

The oral presentation of the whole story may destroy the desire to read it. As has already been explained, the main approach to reading by this method is for the teacher to tell the story and then have the children repeat the content, until the theme and the words have been completely memorized. After this extensive preparation for reading, what is the child's attitude toward the story and the reading of it? Is there anticipation? Usually no, because before the child is permitted to read, the story has become an old, old story. How many adults do you know, who when returning from the theater stop and buy the book they have just seen portrayed. It appears that the initial complete oral presentation of the whole story is not a functional technique for motivating the desire to read.

Gates\textsuperscript{90} points out that, although this type of preparation does make adequate vocabulary preparation, it is deficient in almost every other count. It completely destroys the interest and joy of reading the story independently.

\textit{Familiarity with the content may encourage "poor" habits of concentration. Reading the same selection three or more times encourages poor habits on concentration. Why

\textsuperscript{90}Gates, op. cit., p. 82.
should the reader be concerned about what happens? They always know the end. The telling, the retelling, and the memorization is similar to the "friend" who in the middle of a psycho-dramatic play whispers, "He did it!" Try as you may, the plot loses its tensions and becomes a repeated performance or a well-known "who-done-it."

The repetition of familiar material is in conflict with the way people learn. Kirkwood\(^1\) investigated association of pictures and books which resembled each other. Her subjects were 180 preschool children. The data provided by this study showed that the learning curves based upon the number of correct associations exhibited a rapid rise and then flattened. This flattened section of the curve is termed a plateau of learning and indicates a lack of growth in the ability being considered. As indicated, continuous repetition may result in a learning plateau or a period of little or no learning. This plateau may be caused by a number of factors, one of which is "lack of interest."\(^2\) If this is the case, the teacher should reconstruct her teaching method, so that learning can continue rather than to follow a pattern in a slave-like manner.


# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. THE PROBLEM AND ITS SETTING</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Purpose of the Study</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statement of the Problem</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earlier Studies in the Field</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Need for the Study</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Procedures</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. THE NATURE AND PROCESS OF READING</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physiological Factors</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychological Processes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning to Read</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. THE FOUNDATIONS AND CLASSIFICATIONS OF READING METHODS</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Philosophical Concepts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Major Psychological Theories</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Assumptions in Teaching</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classifications of Methods of Teaching Reading</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. SYNTHETIC METHODS OF TEACHING BEGINNING READING</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Alphabetic Method</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Alphabetic-Phonic Method</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. SYNTHETIC METHODS (CONCLUDED)</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Phonic Method</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Phonetic Method</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Linguistic Method</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Synthetic Methods</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. ANALYTIC METHODS</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Word Method</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Sentence Method</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Story Method</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX</td>
<td>312</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

iii
With some readers, however, and perhaps with all of us for many words, the total form, word length, etc. seem to characterize the word and are apparently the first factors in its recognition.\(^\text{12}\)

These investigations are important because they contribute to an understanding of the visual processes involved in reading.

**Nature of perceptual ability (detailed features).**

Gates and Boeker\(^\text{13}\) secured striking evidence of the fact that children learn to recognize words by noting detailed characteristics of words. For example, *pig* was remembered because of the 1, and *box* because of the x.

Bowden's study showed that words were remembered because "it may be the length of the word, the initial letter, the final letter, a characteristic letter, the position of the word in the sentence, or even the blackness of the type as a cue."\(^\text{14}\)

These and other findings illustrate that while the general word pattern is important in word recognition, words are often remembered and recognized by detail features of the word.

\(^{12}\)Ibid., pp. 109-110.

\(^{13}\)Arthur I. Gates and Eloise Boeker, "A Study of Initial Stages in Reading by Pre-School Children," Teachers College Record, XXIV (November, 1923), 469-488.

\(^{14}\)Josephine Horton Bowden, "Learning to Read," Elementary School Teacher, XII (September, 1911), 32.
The emphasis on memorization may postpone the teacher's recognition of individual weaknesses. It is difficult for the teacher to determine whether the child is reading the print or retelling the story from memory. The child has been encouraged to perform this memory feat. When unable to tell the word he is instructed to "read" the story until he comes to that word. Thus, evaluation of his reading becomes fogged for the question becomes "Is he reading or merely verbalizing?" This aspect of memorization continues in paper and pencil evaluative techniques used in this method. For example, the child is often asked to match sentences. Does the child truly read the words or does he search for a general configuration pattern. Following is a group of sentences to illustrate:

The boy had a little toy dog.       Run.
(length clue)
See me run!
(punctuation clue)
See me run!
Run.  
(shortness clue)
The boy had a little toy dog.
Dick and Tom saw Bill. 
(tall letters clue)
Dick and Tom saw Bill.

Also it is most difficult to evaluate his ability to read by depending upon True or False, completion statements or similar objective testing techniques. In these, as a
result of the number used and the selection of only two choices in completion when testing primary children, the children are presented with a fifty-fifty chance of selecting the correct response.

The Story Method fails to develop proper eye-movement habits. A vital objection to the use of the Story Method is that it encourages wandering eye movements rather than correct habits of wide perceptual span and a regular rhythmical swing of the eyes. In a previous section it was pointed out that young children needed guidance in learning to read in a left to right direction. Also, the investigations of modern psychologists have shown that the eye movement consists of a series of pauses and jerks, and it is only during the pauses that the eye really perceives.

Buswell\(^3\) found that children taught by the Story Method permitted their eyes to move over the page without regard to the printed page. The children had a tendency to repeat the selection from memory rather than to ascertain the meaning from the printed symbols. This was true in both silent and oral reading.

Slow and laborious analysis of a story fails to develop literary appreciation. Although some authorities

\(^3\)Guy Thomas Buswell, "Fundamental Reading Habits: A Study of Their Development," Supplementary Educational Monograph No. 21 (Chicago: The University of Chicago, 1922), pp. 64-73.
state that this method provides literary appreciation, it is doubtful. Appreciation of literature is not taught by making it a subject for prolonged drill but by reading it freely for enjoyment and information. Slow and laborious analysis of a story into its elements may develop a dislike for the story involved. At the present time many adults are allergic to Shakespeare's, Tennyson's and Emerson's writings as a result of the extensive amount of repetitious drill by which they were taught the classic literature.

Present Status of the Story Method

According to the opinions as shown by the rating provided by five judges, this reading method falls short in the following characteristics:

1. Concept of how children learn.
2. Provision for use of picture clues.
3. Provision for seed determined by purpose.
4. Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content.
5. Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading.
6. Provision for individual differences in ability, needs, and interests.
7. Lack of appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials.

The value given to the above listed facets of an adequate reading program indicates that in the opinion of the

---

\(^{94}\)Appendix, pp. 342-343.
judges such were not provided for in the Story Method.

They were, also, in agreement that the following characteristics were provided for but in an inadequate manner:

1. Provision for evaluation of material.
2. Provision for drawing conclusions.
4. Provision for silent reading.
5. Provision for oral reading.
6. Provision for the development of readiness for reading.
7. Provision for postponement of reading until readiness has been developed.
8. Provision for developing permanent interests in reading.
9. Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skill in reading.
10. Provision for increase in vocabulary and content.
11. Provision for a planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs.
12. Provision toward the objectives of beginning reading.

Analysis of the rating sheet provided information which shows that the following characteristics were provided for in an adequate manner:

1. Provision for the use of content clues.
2. Provision for phonetic analysis.
3. Provision for syllabification.
4. Provision for comprehension.

5. Provision for interpretation of material.

There was disagreement concerning the degree in which the method provided for the following facets of an adequate reading program:

Four judges stated that in their opinion the Story Method provided for the study of general configuration and striking characteristics of words in a most satisfactory manner; while one judge indicated that such was provided for but in an inadequate manner.

There was a difference in opinion regarding the provision made for the teaching from the beginning of reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to thoughtful, meaningful interpretation. Three of the judges indicated that the degree was adequate while two of the men showed that according to their interpretation it was only to the extent that such was provided for in the method.

This rapid survey shows that the faults of this reading method lie more in its omissions than in its commissions.

Research Findings

With the growing importance of analytical methods of teaching beginning reading, it was only natural that these methods would be reflected in reading textbooks and would be subjected to scientific investigation.
Word recognition. In regard to the child's ability to recognize a whole word rather than first viewing individual letters, Cattell's study reported in 1885 is a landmark. In his study it was found that the average adult could in ten ms. of exposure time, apprehend three or four unrelated letters, two unrelated words (up to about twelve letters), or a short sentence of four words. Thus, it appears that we do not read by letters but by word units. Erdman and Dodge confirmed these results in a study made in 1898.

In regard to the assumption that words are recognized as wholes rather than individual letters, Bowden found that all beginners tested by her paid little attention to the total word form. They read words which were presented upside down and words in which letters were transposed. Meek in a similar study also concluded that for children learning to read striking characteristics of words, such as, certain letters, small groups of letters, or double letters, such as oo, were the chief clues of recognition. Gates and Boeker

95 Anderson and Dearborn, op. cit., p. 212.
96 Ibid., p. 213.
99 Arthur I. Gates and Eloise Boeker, "A Study of Initial Stages in Reading by Pre-School Children," Teachers College Record, XXIV (November, 1923), 469.
also found that beginning readers recognize words more frequently by unique letters than by word forms. These findings, however, do not imply that children need know the letter name before recognition takes place. Analytical methods may permit the eyes to move at random, seeking whatever feature stands out and as a result inaccurate word perception may result.

**Ability to cope with new words.** Judd investigated the reading habits of a group of children, who had been trained largely according to the Word or Sentence Method supplemented by some training in phonics. Photographic records were made. An analysis of such data shows that difficulties in word recognition were encountered and that when such occurred, eye-movement across the page was interrupted. These complicated series of eye-movements suggest that the child was exploring the letters in words. In interpreting these findings Gray has written:

The final conclusions of this phase of the study were that pupils should be taught to read for content, that words should be accepted as the unit of recognition at the outset, and that analysis or phonetic training should be introduced.

---

later when it is needed to keep the word units clear.101

The investigations of Buswell102 and Currier and Duguid103 showed clearly that although children taught by the Phonetic Methods could not interpret well what they read, such training did contribute to fluency and accuracy in word recognition.

Investigations made by Gates,104 Valentine,105 and Currier106 further point out that not all phonetic drills were equally effective for all children.

Although the value of practice in word recognition has been demonstrated, the types of training which would meet


102Buswell, op. cit.


individual needs most effectively should be considered.

Value of contextual clues. Numerous experiments show that words are recognized more quickly if they are presented in content rather than in isolation. Cattell showed that when sentences or phrases were exposed they were either grasped as wholes or not at all. In an experiment to determine the number of exposures necessary for a child to learn a Greek alphabet, a meaningless syllable, a word with definite content, and a sentence, Boggs\textsuperscript{107} concluded that the process of learning words in the early reading exercises will be facilitated by presenting them in sentences.

Nemec and Losenski\textsuperscript{108} in a vocabulary study, using the second and third grades of a large number of Wisconsin elementary schools, concluded that in developing a reading vocabulary the teacher may depend upon context clues but must build a stock of sight words. On the basis of that study, they recommend the Dolch list as a means of discovering children who are prone to depend too much upon context clues.


In contrast, Edgerton concluded that the ability to recognize a word does not constitute complete understanding; that the children must pay attention to the context and to the concepts involved. Sentence length and other factors of construction affect difficulty of construction recognition and comprehension. Most studies indicate that words can and should be learned through context, but that there is danger in depending entirely upon this clue of word recognition.

A Phonic Method versus a "Look-and-Say" or Word Method. Raymond Mosher and Sidney Newhall conducted an investigation from September, 1926 to May, 1928 to compare the reading habits resulting from two methods of teaching beginning reading. The two methods compared were a Phonic and a "Look-and-Say" Method.

The Phonic Method used was described as a system which provided for systematic drill on the phonetic qualities of words. The formal instruction in phonics was limited to a period of fifteen minutes per day for one school year.

The Look-and-Say Method employed sought to attach meaning to the printed symbols without training in analytical techniques; thus, printed symbols were presented in meaningful wholes.


Nature of perceptual ability (similarity to known words and familiar word elements). The investigations of Buswell\(^{15}\) and Currier and Duguid\(^{16}\) show clearly that training in phonetics contributes to fluency and accuracy in word recognition. However, Valentine\(^{17}\) reported that training in phonetics is not equally effective in case of all types of pupils. As the disadvantages of phonetics will be discussed in detail in another section reference at this time is only made to the study of phonetics as an aid in word recognition.

Summary. The scientific facts as presented here can be summarized in the following manner:

1. The ability to perceive and to discriminate visually develops through experience.

2. In reading, the unit of perception is the word, phrase, or sentences rather than the letter.

3. The manner in which the individual word is recognized varies with different individuals.

4. Accurate word recognition involves a number of perceptual processes.


In both methods the initial procedures of reading were very similar. The teacher provided time and interest so that children could and would experience stories dealing with such activities as home and school experiences. The vocabulary was suggested by the children, but was subjected to reasonable guidance by the teacher.

The children used for this study were those enrolled in three elementary schools connected with the State Normal School, New Haven, Connecticut. In each school one group was taught by the Phonic Method, another by the Look-and-Say Method.

To evaluate the reading progress made by the six groups, data were selected concerning eye-movement as well as scores made on informal silent and oral reading tests, whose objectives were to determine speed of reading and comprehension of material.

As a result of this experiment the authors concluded that:

1. The measures of speed, fixation pauses, and comprehension seemed to show both individually and collectively no essential differences.

2. The children trained by the look-and-say method read as quickly and as effectively as those trained by the phonic method.

3. In general, the added time devoted to phonics would not appreciably increase reading skill and therefore phonic training is not especially to be recommended as a device for that purpose.\[\text{\textsuperscript{111}}\]

\[\text{\textsuperscript{111}}\text{Ibid.}, \text{p. 506.}\]
It appears that these findings cannot be accepted as concrete evidence concerning the reading results obtained by the two methods. Numerous limitations of the study can readily be seen, (1) the lack of the establishment of two specific programs, (2) the lack of specific procedures, (3) the initial use of chart stories, (4) the children selected for the study, and (5) the evaluative techniques.

A Sentence Method versus a Phonetic Method: Aldine Method Research Findings. Gray reports the results of a study to determine whether the Aldine Method or the Ward Method secured the more effective results in the mechanics of teaching reading. The Aldine Method represents a method which emphasizes reading as a thought process and gives recognition of the sentence as the whole or thought-unit. The Ward Method represents an attempt to reconcile the Word Method and the Phonetic Method. The introduction promotes the learning of sight words by means of unrelated sentences; however, this type of exercise is followed by intensive phonetic training, which carried over into reading materials by means of diacritical marks.

In this investigation forty-four schools were studied: twenty-six used the Aldine, seventeen schools used the Ward,

and one school was unclassified as to method used in teaching reading. Examination of the data supplied by this study shows, (1) differences in method were not accompanied by uniform differences in achievements, (2) the average scores for the two groups were approximately equal, and (3) that there appear to be other factors which influence reading achievement besides specific reading method.

In reality, the question as to which method was the more effective for developing the mechanical aspects of teaching reading was not answered. However, the investigation does illustrate the importance of the teacher's personality, the economic level of the pupils, pupil nationality, and the amount of supplementary reading material.

A Word Method versus a Story Method. In an attempt to provide data concerning the following problems: (1) the development of a proper reading attitude, (2) the growth of the fundamental elements of span of recognition, speed of recognition, and regular procedure along the printed lines, (3) the problem of word recognition, and (4) the development of a rhythmic expression of interpretation in thought units as contrasted with the mechanical pronunciation of words. Buswell\textsuperscript{113} compared the reading habits of two groups of children.

\textsuperscript{113}Buswell, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 64.
One group was taught by a method which emphasized word mastery. In this group the procedure for reading instruction was: (1) the teacher told the story in her own words, (2) the new words were presented on the chalkboard, (3) phonic drill was provided in a period separate from the regular reading time, (4) the children read the story orally, and (5) after the oral drill, extensive drill was provided for finding certain sentences or lines.

The second group was instructed in reading by an adaptation of the Story Method. Their reading program was based on the following plan: The method was to proceed from the whole story to lines and phrases. First, the teacher read the story in the exact words of the book. Second, the story was retold with the teacher displaying certain phrases or words which were of major importance in the story. Third, the story was reconstructed by the teacher and children and written on the chalkboard for practice in sentence and word recognition. Then, the children read the story and studied individual lines.

For both groups the story used for study and evaluation of reading habits was *The Little Red Hen*. Eye-movement records constituted the chief means of evaluation.

The results of this study reveal that the children who had been taught by the Story Method had a tendency to permit their eyes to rove at random over the page and to
recite the words of the original story rather than those presented in print. This was particularly pointed out when on one of the tests Buswell used a modified edition rather than the original version. The author of this study has declared:

In many cases the pupils get from this method, not an attitude of regarding a sentence as the expression of a single thought, but rather a habit of first learning the sentence or story from hearing the teacher tell it, and then reciting it from memory while their eyes roam at random over the page. They do not develop habits of following the words in their regular order. They get a bird's-eye view of the printed lines and fail to learn that a fused meaning of a sentence can only be secured from noting the particular combination of the words.¹¹⁴

This, indeed would indicate that the children had memorized the story and were not reading. On the other hand, it was found that the children who had been taught by a method which emphasized word recognition, followed the lines accurately and read the material as presented. However, they tended to read in a mechanical and expressionless manner.

Buswell has summarized these findings in the following manner:

If the primary emphasis is placed upon word-recognition the outcome is the ability to follow the printed line, to pronounce all the words, but to display no vital concern for the content. It produces what is familiarly called word reading.

This is not the complete attitude of the mature reader. The method goes far in the development of word recognition, an element which all pupils must ultimately develop. . . .

On the other hand, when emphasis is placed upon the thought and the story is memorized the pupils do develop a vital concern for the content, but develop more slowly in word-recognition and in ability to follow the lines.¹¹⁵

Actually, both methods of teaching beginning reading have merit.

¹¹⁵Ibid., p. 72.
APPENDIX

Volume I
In an attempt to appraise reading programs, the need arises for valid criteria to serve as a basis for evaluation. In this study the selected criteria represent characteristic features of a well-balanced, developmental reading method.

Basic assumptions underlying the development of the criteria. It is assumed that since reading is a continuous process, the broad generalizations underlying all human development would apply to learning to read and that reading is a process of attaching meaning to immediately recognized visual impressions registered on similar areas of the retina of the two eyes, and the interpretation of these impressions through associations of experiences to these stimuli and the manipulation of the resulting thought process according to the writer's intent, so that behavior patterns are reconstructed.

The procedures used in developing the criteria. In the development of the criteria the following procedure was followed:

1. A definition of reading was stated as a basis for the criteria of a reading method.

2. Statements were developed as a means of interpreting the concepts and activities necessary for reading and reading instruction to meet the requirements as expressed in the definition.

3. Evaluation of the validity of the criteria was established. The criteria as developed were submitted
to five judges, all members of Kent State University faculty for critical examination.

These judges were asked to consider each statement in the light of concepts and activities necessary to provide an adequate reading program to meet the stated definition of reading.

4. Reconstruction of the criteria was made in the light of suggestions made.

5. Reconstructed criteria submitted to the judges for consideration and suggestions.

The criteria for appraising reading methods as submitted to the judges for evaluation and criticism.

Directions: Please read the following definition of reading carefully and appraise each of the following statements in the light of concepts and activities necessary to provide an adequate reading method to meet the generalizations as stated in the definition of reading.

Definition: Reading is a process of attaching meaning to immediately recognized visual impressions registered on similar areas of the retina of the two eyes, and the interpretation of these impressions through associations of experiences to these stimuli and the manipulation of the resulting thought processes according to the writer's intent, so that behavior patterns are reconstructed.

Appraisal technique: If the statement is adequately expressed and is in agreement with the stated definition of reading place a + sign before the statement; if it is inadequate for any reason place a - sign before the statement and on the back of the form write out suggestions and/or comments.
The Criteria for the Appraisal of Reading Methods

The following criteria have been developed to aid in determining the relative values of various reading methods.

1. Is the method based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn?

2. Is there provision for word attack techniques?

3. Is there provision for the development of readiness?

4. Is there emphasis from the beginning on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to thoughtful, meaningful interpretation?

5. Is there adequate provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content?

6. Is there adequate provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading?

7. Is there adequate provision for developing permanent interests in reading?

8. Is there provision for individual differences in ability, needs, and interests?

9. Is there appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials?

10. Is there provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of skills in reading?

11. Is there significant increase in vocabulary and content?

12. Is there a planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs?

13. Is there continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading?
5. The word is first perceived as a whole, but recognition is reinforced by specific characteristics, similarity to known words, and familiar word elements.

These facts appear to have greatly influenced the prevailing present-day methods of teaching children to read.

Eye-movement in Reading

Apparently Javal and Lamare (1879) were the first to observe and record the fact that, during the act of reading the eyes move across the pages in a series of fixations. However, it was Dearborn in 1906 who made the first systematic study. Since these early studies numerous investigations have been made regarding the process of eye-movement.

Analysis of eye-movement. To read, the eyes must be pointed in the right direction, and be focused for the right distance. These two adjustments are made by different sets of muscles. The pointing is a voluntary action, controlled by brain impulses and thus must be taught while focusing is involuntary and is an unconscious act. The function of vision requires that the involuntary and voluntary systems work together simultaneously.

In reading the eyes make a series of quick left to right movements across a page with brief intervening pauses; however, frequently the eyes move in a reverse direction

---

Reconstruction of criteria in the light of evaluation and criticism. It was the opinion of the judges that statement two (Is there provision for word attack techniques?) was most inadequate. The judges suggested that the various techniques of word attack be listed for consideration. It was also suggested that statement number three (Is there provision for the development of readiness?) be written thus, "Development of reading readiness," and the statement, "Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed," be added, and that all characteristics be stated in a positive manner.

Reconstructed criteria. Taking into consideration the suggestions made by the judges, the following criteria for the evaluation of reading methods were reconstructed. Table II shows the resulting evaluative device.
TABLE II
CRITERIA FOR THE EVALUATION OF READING METHODS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Values*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>5 2 1 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*(3) most satisfactory, (2) satisfactory, (1) provided for but in an unsatisfactory manner, and (0) not provided for.
Numerical values assigned to the rating form. To show the degree to which the various methods provided for the different facets of an adequate reading program, the following numerical values were assigned. Three (3) provided for in a most satisfactory manner; two (2) provided for in a satisfactory manner; one (1) provided for but in an unsatisfactory manner; and zero (0) not provided for in the method.

To determine numerical evaluations, tables representing each method were constructed to show the number of judges who indicated the degree to which the facet was provided. Thus, if all five judges stated that in their opinion Method X did not provide for reading readiness a total of five (representing total number of judges) would be placed under (0) representing the assigned specific value.

In order to assign a total numerical value to each of the basic methods of teaching beginning reading the following mathematical formula was used: (the specific value rating assigned) x (the number of judges assigning that value).
EVALUATION OF READING METHODS

Directions. Read the description of the reading method carefully. Then, check the numerical value after each statement which indicates the extent that the method provides such experiences.

Interpretation of numerical values. Three (3) provided for in a most satisfactory manner; two (2) provided for in a satisfactory manner; one (1) provided for but in an unsatisfactory manner; and zero (0) not provided for in the method.
Description of the Alphabetic Method. This method of teaching beginning reading begins with teaching the letters in alphabetical order. After the student can fluently repeat the names of the letters from memory and recognize the letters in both small and capital form, he proceeds to learn to spell words and to read them. The child spells out loud, each new word as the way of learning to read it. Actually the child is taught to read through spelling.
### TABLE III

**EVALUATION OF THE ALPHABETIC METHOD**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Values*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* (5) most satisfactory, (2) satisfactory, (1) provided for but in an unsatisfactory manner, and (0) not provided for.*
### TABLE IV

**ASSIGNED NUMERICAL VALUES OF THE ALPHABETIC METHOD**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Numerical Values *</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Total Numerical Value** 10

*Numerical Value equals sum total of the number of judges x assigned value for each facet.*
Description of the Alphabetic-Phonic Method. In the Alphabetic-Phonic Method the general procedures of the Alphabet Method were used. The chief difference was that children were now required to learn the sounds of the letters. In this method the children were made familiar with the alphabet and the letter sounds and then vowels, consonants, and vowel-consonant combinations moved rapidly to the syllabarium. Two letter syllables were introduced and developed up to six syllable words. The "alphabet verses" were included for interest and as an aid in learning the letters of the alphabet. After the children were thoroughly acquainted with the letters and letter sounds, emphasis was placed upon drill of "family words" and correct pronunciation.
TABLE V
EVALUATION OF THE ALPHABETIC-PHONIC METHOD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Values*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*(3) most satisfactory, (2) satisfactory, (1) provided for but in an unsatisfactory manner, and (0) not provided for.*
TABLE VI

ASSIGNED NUMERICAL VALUES OF THE ALPHABETIC-PHONIC METHOD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Numerical Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total Numerical Value 20

*Numerical Value equals sum total of the number of judges x assigned value for each facet.*
between fixations. These reverse directions may occur at any point along the printed line: these movements are known as regressive movements. The regressive movements may be thought of as a corrective mechanism as they often result from inaccuracies in comprehension. The eyes make a return sweep when they reach the final fixation point near the right end of the line of print.

The actual reading takes place only during the time that the eyes are at rest. The terms most frequently used to describe this period of rest are eye-pause and act of fixation.

Scientific Findings

These facts are supported by numerous painstaking investigations. Taylor classifies the methods used in such investigations as methods which use: (1) direct observation, a technique which employs a telescope or microscope, mirror, or a peep hole apparatus; (2) mechanical and electrical recording, a technique which employs a microphone attached to the upper eyelid so that the sound made by the eye-movement may be recorded, various attachments to the cornea so that the movements of the eyes are recorded on smoked paper, pneumatic capsules so that the movement of the eyeball compresses the capsule and a tambour attached to the capsule by a tube moves and records any motion of the eyes; and (3) photographic

\[19\] Ibid., pp. 48-55.
Description of the Phonic Method. In the Phonic Method of teaching beginning reading the unit of reading is the letter sound. Identification of words is based on the phonic parts blended together to make words. The procedures used in this method are: (1) sound elements are introduced with much drill on sound-values of letters and letter combinations, (2) pictures are often used to help associate sounds and visual symbols, (3) systematic guidance is provided in discriminating between words, in comparing and sounding the words that begin or end alike, (4) phonetic elements are blended, (5) sounds are associated with appropriate letter symbols and blended into a word whole and (6) the reading of words, sentences and stories.
### TABLE VII

**EVALUATION OF THE PHONIC METHOD**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Values*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>3 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>4 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*(3) most satisfactory, (2) satisfactory, (1) provided for but in an unsatisfactory manner, and (0) not provided for.*
### TABLE VIII

**ASSIGNED NUMERICAL VALUES OF THE PHONIC METHOD**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Numerical Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total Numerical Value 22

*Numerical Value equals sum total of the number of judges x assigned value for each facet.*
Description of the Phonetic Method. In the Phonetic Method it is assumed that children would gain meaning from their reading if they could translate the printed symbols to oral sounds. In consequence numerous techniques are used; such as, the phonetic alphabet and diacritical markings, to aid the child in translating printed symbols to a pronunciative medium. As a knowledge of the phonetic elements is received through the auditory and visual senses extensive training in auditory discrimination and visual perception is provided. Techniques used to develop ability in auditory discrimination were: (1) to have children listen and identify different animal cries, songs, piano tones, bird calls, (2) to have children listen for specific vowel or consonant sounds, (3) to have children list words with a specific vowel or consonant sound.

The teacher begins reading instruction by having the children learn to hear and to recognize in print the short vowel and consonant sounds. After these have been learned attention is given to the blending of phonetic elements and then word pronunciation.
# TABLE IX

## EVALUATION OF THE PHONETIC METHOD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*(3) most satisfactory, (2) satisfactory, (1) provided for but in an unsatisfactory manner, and (0) not provided for.*
TABLE X

ASSIGNED NUMERICAL VALUES OF THE PHONETIC METHOD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Numerical Values*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Numerical Value</strong></td>
<td><strong>30</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Numerical Value equals sum total of the number of judges x assigned value for each facet.*
Description of the Linguistic Method. This method of teaching beginning reading is based upon the belief that knowledge of phonetic sounding aids children in "unlocking" most of the words he meets, and that independent word recognition can be achieved through phonetic drill.

This method of teaching reading follows six developmental stages. The first stage, deals with teaching the letters; the second stage, develops the ability to read from left to right; the third stage, introduces the child to phonemes, unit speech sounds; the fourth stage, takes up words of regular spelling with double consonants and other digraphs; the fifth stage, teaches semi-irregular spelled words; and the sixth develops the ability to recognize irregular words.

The techniques of instruction used are extensive drill exercises with special attention given to letter form and sounding, and discussions to familiarize the children with the story content.
**TABLE XI**

EVALUATION OF THE LINGUISTIC METHOD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*(3) most satisfactory, (2) satisfactory, (1) provided for but in an unsatisfactory manner, and (0) not provided for.*
### TABLE XII

**ASSIGNED NUMERICAL VALUES OF THE LINGUISTIC METHOD**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Numerical Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Total Numerical Value** 35

*Numerical Value equals sum total of the number of judges x assigned value for each facet.*
Description of the Word Method. This method of teaching beginning reading is based on the psychological principle that objects are recognized as wholes before the parts are recognized. In this method consideration is given to word introduction, drill, review, sentence, and story reading, as well as the use of a core vocabulary and word-lists.

In presenting the reading materials the teacher writes a word on the chalkboard and pronounces it. After the class has heard the word they are asked to look at it carefully and then say it. Each word presented in this manner is also written on small cards and used for drill and game exercises to facilitate the learning of a sight vocabulary. Later these "sight words" are used to compose sentences and stories.

As a means of reducing vocabulary burden a core vocabulary is frequently used. Often this core vocabulary is selected from either basal or supplementary readers or word-lists.
methods which employ either kinetoscopic photographs or mirror-recording or corneal reflection.

In the early part of this century, Dodge, Huey, and Dearborn made studies of eye-movements.

Recent research findings in regard to eye-movements and its relationship to reading ability have been made by Morse, Ballatine and Dixon, and Ledbetter.

Morse, Ballatine and Dixon in a volume entitled Studies in the Psychology of Reading describe three comprehensive doctoral studies concerning the behavior of the eyes in reading. These studies have considered: (1) the eye-movements of fifth and seventh grade pupils when reading material of corresponding difficulty, (2) age changes in measures of eye-movement in silent reading, and (3) eye-movement in reading of university professors and graduate students. An analysis of the findings show: (1) the fifth grade did not perform as efficiently as the seventh grade pupils when the materials were differentiated according to reading status of the pupils, (2) eye-movement improved during the intermediate grades, and (3) familiarity of material may be regarded as a factor in reading performance.

---

20 William C. Morse, Francis A. Ballatine, and W. Robert Dixon, Studies in the Psychology of Reading, April, 1951, pp. ix + 188.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*(3) most satisfactory, (2) satisfactory, (1) provided for but in an unsatisfactory manner, and (0) not provided for.*
### TABLE XIV

**ASSIGNED NUMERICAL VALUES OF THE WORD METHOD**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Numerical Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Total Numerical Value**

51

*Numerical Value equals sum total of the number of judges x assigned value for each facet.*
Description of the Sentence Method. The Sentence Method commences the teaching of reading with complete sentences and descends to words, sounds, and letters. In this method consideration is given to: (1) developing a thought basis, (2) associating the thought idea with the printed symbol, (3) recognizing individual words, and (4) developing ability in word analysis.

The sentence is frequently introduced by means of an action, a picture, or a story. An association is then made between the sentence and the meaning by having the children dramatize the meanings or match the pictures and the sentences. Later the introductory devices are withdrawn and the children are required to read the sentences that they know. The teacher then indicates separate words and provides exercises and games to encourage recognition of individual words. After an adequate sight vocabulary has been learned the children are taught certain word analysis techniques, which (1) present the word first as a whole and then the phonetic elements, (2) are presented in a separate period, and (3) are not given to all children in equal amounts but as individual needs arise.
TABLE XV
EVALUATION OF THE SENTENCE METHOD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Values*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>3 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>4 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>1 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>3 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>2 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>2 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>1 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*(3) most satisfactory, (2) satisfactory, (1) provided for but in an unsatisfactory manner, and (0) not provided for.*
TABLE XVI

ASSIGNED NUMERICAL VALUES OF THE SENTENCE METHOD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Numerical Values*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total Numerical Value 121

*Numerical Value equals sum total of the number of judges x assigned value for each facet.
Description of the Story Method. This method of teaching beginning reading is an analytic method. The general procedures are: the teacher tells a story or rhyme to the children. It is re-told by the children, discussed, and dramatized until the entire group has become very familiar with it, and may have memorized it. The children, with the teacher's assistance, then read and analyze the selection into phrases and separate words. Much of this is accomplished by matching similar sentences, phrases, and words. The next stage is applying phonics in the sounding of words. The use of phonics is not strongly emphasized, and is restricted to a supporting role, with primary emphasis continuing to be upon sight recognition of words and upon understanding of meaning. The final step is the re-reading of the entire selection.
TABLE XVII

EVALUATION OF THE STORY METHOD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Values*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>4 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>4 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>3 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*(3) most satisfactory, (2) satisfactory, (1) provided for but in an unsatisfactory manner, and (0) not provided for.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Numerical Values *</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Total Numerical Value** 146

*Numerical Value equals the sum total of the number of judges x assigned value for each facet.*
ANALYSIS OF CHARACTERISTIC FACTORS
OF BEGINNING READING PROGRAMS
Volume II

DISSERTATION

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements
for the Degree Doctor of Philosophy in the
Graduate School of The Ohio State
University

By

NAOMI SIMMS, B. A., A. M.

The Ohio State University
1956

Approved by:

Adviser

Department of Elementary Education
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>VII. ANALYTICAL METHODS (CONCLUDED)</td>
<td>344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Silent Reading Method</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Picture-Story Method</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Non-Oral Method</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Intrinsic Method</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII. FUNCTIONAL OR CONJUNCTIVE METHODS</td>
<td>443</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Kinesthetic Method</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Experience Method</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Purposeful Method</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS</td>
<td>538</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Survey of Literature</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classification of Methods</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comparative Analysis</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX</td>
<td>561</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>585</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Data furnished by Frances Gresham Ledbetter's study of the eye-movements of eleventh-grade pupils in four subject-matter fields warrants the following conclusions: (1) that there were differences, as revealed by eye-movement measures and comprehension scores, in the reading of material from various subject matter fields, (2) the number of fixations, regressions and the span of recognition seemed to point to a qualified conclusion that the students' best orientation came in the reading of the second hundred words, (3) that speed in reading was not always accompanied by high comprehension scores in individual instances, but the general trend was a positive relationship between speed and comprehension and, (4) not only does a difference exist in reading ability between selections but also differences in reading the parts of each section.

These and other investigations have provided practical knowledge which is of value in developing good habits of reading.

**Summary.** The investigations of eye-movement appear to support the following conclusions:

1. The eye moves in a series of sweeps or jerks across the page from left to right, returning to the beginning of the next line in an unbroken sweep (in our culture).

---

# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>XIX.</td>
<td>Characteristics and Pattern of Disagreement Concerning Facets of the Non-Oral Method</td>
<td>407</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XX.</td>
<td>Characteristics and Pattern of Disagreement Concerning Facets of the Kinesthetic Method</td>
<td>477</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXI.</td>
<td>Evaluation of the Purposeful Method</td>
<td>502</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXII.</td>
<td>Characteristics and Pattern of Disagreement Concerning Facets of the Purposeful Method</td>
<td>532</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXIII.</td>
<td>Basic Methods of Primary Reading</td>
<td>539</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXIV.</td>
<td>Reading Programs Based on Synthetic Methods of Teaching Beginning Reading</td>
<td>540</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXV.</td>
<td>Reading Programs Based on the Analytic Methods of Teaching Beginning Reading</td>
<td>541</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXVI.</td>
<td>Reading Programs Based on Functional Methods of Teaching Beginning Reading</td>
<td>541</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXVII.</td>
<td>Summary of the Numerical Value Assigned to Each Basic Reading Method</td>
<td>554</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXVIII.</td>
<td>Evaluation of the Silent Reading Method</td>
<td>563</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXIX.</td>
<td>Assigned Numerical Values of the Silent Reading Method</td>
<td>564</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXX.</td>
<td>Evaluation of the Picture-Story Method</td>
<td>566</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXXI.</td>
<td>Assigned Numerical Values of the Picture-Story Method</td>
<td>567</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXXII.</td>
<td>Evaluation of the Non-Oral Method</td>
<td>569</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXXIII.</td>
<td>Assigned Numerical Values of the Non-Oral Method</td>
<td>570</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
XXXIV. Evaluation of the Intrinsic Method ............ 572
XXXV. Assigned Numerical Values of the Intrinsic Method .................................................. 575
XXXVI. Evaluation of the Kinesthetic Method ........ 576
XXXVII. Assigned Numerical Values of the Kinesthetic Method .............................................. 577
XXXVIII. Evaluation of the Experience Method ...... 580
XXXIX. Assigned Values of the Experience Method ... 581
XL. Evaluation of the Purposeful Method .......... 583
XLI. Assigned Numerical Values of the Purposeful Method ..................................................... 584
CHAPTER VII

ANALYTICAL METHODS (CONCLUDED)

Section I

The Silent Reading Method

The wide use of the Sentence and Story method of teaching beginning reading was accompanied by a diversity of adaptations and variations. Comparisons of various techniques, used in the Sentence and Story methods, and analysis of materials stimulated interest in professional studies concerning the purposes and skills of reading. It was inevitable that such studies would focus upon the importance of comprehending meaning, as the key of successful reading.

The Sentence Method had already centered attention upon the sentence as the unit of thought. The work of Pestalozzi, Herbart, and Froebel accentuated the important role of motor expression in learning. Hence, the idea that "thought results in action" was applied to the problem and as a result the Action or See and Do or the Silent Reading Method developed.

This method differed completely from all previous methods. Earlier methods had depended entirely upon oral
communication as the vehicle for introduction, explanation, instruction, directions, and evaluation. The Action Method or Silent Reading Method put emphasis almost exclusively upon procedures of silent reading and dramatization of interpretation.

Another way of explaining the differences is by terming the earlier methods "indirect" and the Silent Reading Method "direct." The Alphabet and Alphabetic-Phonic methods, Phonic and Phonetic methods, the Word, Sentence, and Story methods are indirect; that is, speech or oral communication is emphasized as a means of helping the child learn the meanings attached to printed symbols. The child learned meanings of printed words indirectly, by way of vocalization. By contrast, the Action Method or Silent Method is a system devised to eliminate the intermediate step of "sounding out" words. Comprehension of meaning was to be achieved directly from the printed symbol.

Historical Development

In the early methods of instruction emphasis had been placed upon oral reading. However, between 1918 and 1925 an era in educational practices began when great consideration was placed on silent reading procedures.

Some of the influencing factors which contributed to this new emphasis were the increasing demand that educational policies stress meaningful and functional procedures; the
educational concepts of Rousseau, Pestalozzi, Herbart, and Froebel; the application of the principle of motor expression (expression helps thought, and thought is necessary for expression); the plans of reading instruction as submitted by Francis W. Parker; data furnished by scientific investigation; and the introduction and use of standardized reading tests.

Acceptance of the new Action Method or Silent Reading Method was helped by the analyses of frontier thinkers, such as, Francis W. Parker, Edmund B. Huey, William S. Gray, and W. W. Theisen and by reports of experiments in the scientific movement sweeping the country during the period from about 1910 to 1930. Methods of beginning reading which

---


had been based upon oral communication did not lend themselves to measurements by standardized instruments. With the introduction of the Silent Reading Method experimenters succeeded in isolating specific aspects of the reading process in which problems could be attacked. For example, factors such as speed and comprehension were testable aspects of reading which test makers soon identified. By 1915 Starch had devised a usable test of silent reading based on the following analysis:

The chief elements in reading are: (1) the comprehension of the material read, (2) the speed of reading and (3) the correctness of pronunciation. The first two are the most important as far as reading is strictly concerned, since we learn the skills of reading for our own individual use. For this reason such factors as intonation, expression, pauses, and the like are relatively insignificant. We use silent reading rather than oral reading in practical life.

The arguments supporting the Action Method or See-and-Do Method, or Silent Reading Method, as this approach was variously termed, were succinctly stated by Gray:

First, rapid silent readers can be developed much earlier in the grades than is usually done at the present time. Second, silent reading exercises can be substituted to advantage for oral reading.

Further assistance of a more material nature rapidly followed the theoretical and experimental explorations of


Gray, op. cit., p. 29.
the Silent Reading Method. Professional educators prepared books explaining the method and appropriate techniques in teaching. Classroom teachers teased their brains and challenged their ingenuity to devise exercises for children to use and for instruments for checking progress. Textbook writers and publishers produced a flood of readers based on the direct method. Manufacturers of school materials developed silent-reading exercises of a seat-work character, such as construction work, cut-out and paste designs, matching and completion sentences, and so on. With a vast supply of ready-made materials, those teachers who were less well prepared, less ingenious, or less energetic, were willing to try the method, and the direct approach to beginning reading almost superseded all other methods.

Description of the Silent Reading Method

Dolch attaches two meanings to silent reading, inaudible reading and eye reading. "Inaudible reading" is that type of reading which there is no lip movement or faintly whispering of sounds. It is like oral reading for auditory images are being used. "Eye-reading" is that type of reading in which auditory images are not used as far as the reader is consciously aware. In regards to this Buswell says:

---

Silent reading is more than noiseless reading. Silent reading is not mere non-vocal reading. It is the complex process of getting thought from the printed page and involves an entirely new pedagogy. Silent reading objectives will never be attained by oral reading methods.9

In the Silent Reading Method of teaching beginning reading no overt pronunciation of words is encouraged. The development of comprehension is the major concern. As it was believed that the process of learning to read was a case of associative learning, children could be taught to read by making definite active responses to printed symbols to show understandings rather than by learning to associate printed symbols with a verbal response to stimulate meanings. Thus, learning to read by the Silent Reading Method follows the pattern of printed symbol → meaning; not the indirect pattern of printed symbol → vocal pronunciation → meaning. Here we have a short-circuiting process which attempts to eliminate auditory imagery and verbal responses.

Assumptions underlying the Silent Reading Method.
An inspection of this method shows that it is based on two major assumptions: (1) that learning to read by the Silent Reading Method will eliminate articulation or "inner speech" in later silent reading, and (2) that silent reading is more economical and effective for comprehending printed symbols.

The Silent Reading Method helps eliminate articulation or "inner speech." John O'Brien defines articulation or "inner speech" in the following manner:

The reader apparently not only visualizes or perceives the printed words, but says them to himself. This combination of motor and auditory elements constitutes the so-called "inner speech" of silent reading.10

It is assumed that "inner speech" influences speed of reading and comprehension. For many years little attention was given to the value of speed in reading and consequently little was attempted to require it. In the teaching of oral reading association was made between the printed word and the sound. It was believed by supporters of the Silent Reading Method that this recourse would lead to the acquired habit of "inner speech." Thus, "inner speech" is a learned reflex action. Accepting this hypothesis they argued that there is no reason why the visual form of words should be associated with their sound in order to convey meaning. They claimed that it is possible to connect meanings of words to their printed form through the direct medium of visual imagery.11

From the assumption that articulatory speech is not necessary, and the acceptance of the hypothesis that "inner

11 Ibid., p. 112.
speech" is a learned behavior pattern, the advocates of the Silent Reading Method developed a program which they believed would eliminate articulation by emphasizing, (1) dramatization of meaning, (2) interesting reading material, (3) preparation or readiness of the children for the thought expressed, (4) speed, and (5) training in visual perception.

Silent Reading is more economical and effective than oral reading: The second assumption on which the Silent Reading Method is based, that silent reading is more economical and effective for comprehending printed symbols, is supported by the following findings:

It now seems a well established fact that fast readers comprehend better than slow readers.12 These and other research findings have been summarized by W. S. Gray in the following manner:

1. When adults read at their normal rate or rapidly, there is positive correlation between speed and comprehension, although this relationship is by no means invariable.
2. The degree of correlation between speed and comprehension varies widely among groups of adults.
3. Mature readers, on the average seem to grasp more of the ideas of a passage at single reading if they read slowly than if they read at their normal rate. On the other hand, they secure a larger number of ideas per unit of time when reading rapidly.13

---

12 Husey, op. cit., pp. 170-173.
2. Perception occurs during the fixation process.

3. Almost the entire reading time is consumed by the period of fixation.

4. An efficient reader will show relatively few fixations to a line, indicating a broad span of recognition.

5. The fixation time of an efficient reader is of short duration.

6. The type of reading material influences the duration and number of fixations per line; however, the speed of the rapid reader is greater proportionately than that of the slow reader under the same conditions.

7. We are limited in the amount we read during the fixations because of the structure of the eye and the inability of the mind to interpret but so many unrelated impressions at once.

8. Good reading in the lower grades is characterized by a large number of pauses per line.

9. Progress through the grades is characterized by a constantly decreasing number of pauses per line.

10. Number and duration of eye fixation varies with the individual.

11. In many cases regressive movements are merely corrective adjustments, made because of inaccuracies in perception.

**The Psychological Processes**

The processes of reading and personality development are interrelated. Emotional disturbances may prevent a child from learning to read and it is equally true that often failure to learn to read contributes to emotional disturbances. As a child reads, he reacts physically, mentally, emotionally, and socially to the total situation; and his behavior is
Thus, superior speed promotes ability to comprehend the printed page. This is partly due to the fact that slow readers receive ideas in isolation. The slow reader is frequently a word caller, and a single word presents only a part or one aspect of the total meaning.

The investigations of C. H. Judd, W. S. Gray, and others have shown that oral reading and silent reading have different functions. The function of oral reading is to inform, entertain, or otherwise influence an auditor or audience. Silent reading has for its function the obtaining of knowledge from the printed symbols by an individual. These two functions demand different eye-movement techniques, direction of attention, speech patterns, type of comprehension, and other factors.

Studies of transfer of training show that training in one ability, either oral or silent reading, does not necessarily transfer to the other. A survey of reading habits


show that fewer than five per cent of the people contacted read aloud on other than very infrequent occasions. Therefore, it is agreed by proponents of the Silent Reading Method that it is more economical to train children in that function which will be most helpful in adult life.

Materials of instruction. The materials used in the teaching of reading by the Silent Reading Method include besides textbooks, supplementary readers, perception cards, flash cards, and seat work activities in which the children read silently and follow directions in regard to cutting, pasting, questions, and similar exercises.

Instructions for teaching silent reading were elaborately explained in Teacher’s Manuals, which accompanied each readers. For example,

As this Manual is a silent reading manual, the method presenting the work is quite different from that of the usual basic text.

To insure the correct application of the method, the teacher should read carefully the full directions for teaching a lesson before presenting the lesson. This is especially necessary for the lessons given for speed and comprehension tests. For these lessons she must master the entire plan of teaching and testing before presenting even a page of a lesson.\textsuperscript{17}

A few specific techniques suggested in this and other teacher’s manuals were:

1. Riddles -
   I am little.
   I say mew - mew.
   I am ________.

2. Directions -
   Color one ball red.

3. Mixed sentences -
   The little girl home ran.

4. Dramatization.

5. Speed tests.


   This agitation for silent reading led to the development of plans in which there was an attempt to introduce reading as a functional activity. The method frequently used in teaching silent reading to first grade children was that of presenting sentences which required action responses.

   **Devices of instruction.** To develop a sight → meaning response to printed symbols there is need for much repetition. Repetition was provided by means of numerous teaching devices. Many of these devices are: lists of commands, questions, pictures to be colored, action sentences, yes and no tests. Also applications of handwork, classroom games, riddles, and focal interest projects are made.

   **Procedures of instruction.** Emphasis upon silent reading procedures was responsible for the publishing of numerous new reading textbooks, professional books, and

   __________

   18 Dolch, op. cit., p. 168.
courses of study. In general, procedures for using The
Action or Silent Reading Method are essentially similar to
those described below.

The first step in beginning reading instruction is
to teach children to receive an idea from printed words. It
is, therefore, important from the very first lesson that
children act promptly upon reading. It is suggested by sup­
porters of this method that oral explanation not be used
until all other techniques have failed. For example, the
teacher prints short action sentences on the chalkboard or
a chart. These sentences should be short (even one word at
first) and may be such as these: Run
Jump
Come to the class.
Open your book.

The teacher introduces the words on the chalkboard
by talking informally to the children. "What I have written
here (pointing) tells you to do something. If any child in
the room can read it, do what it says." If no child can read
the first word (in this case "run"), the teacher explains it
to one child privately by whispering or by dramatizing the
meaning of the word to the class. Then, a child runs a few
steps to illustrate the meaning of the symbol. Several other
children are then designated by the teacher writing on the
chalkboard, "Run, Ann; Run, Donald." Each child demonstrates
his reading by performing the action as he sees his name
written after the verb.
With longer sentences the introduction is much the same, but must be elaborated with further explanation. For example, the teacher explains as she points to the sentence, *Come to the class*, "This sentence, whenever you see it, tells you to leave what you are doing and go to the corner where the little chairs are. This sentence, *Open your books*, tells you what to do when you get there." (At this point the teacher dramatizes the meaning of the sentence.) "Now let's see if you can read them." The teacher then selects a child, points to each sentence in sequence, and the child carries out the actions indicated.

The teacher erases the sentence. Again she writes the sentence on the board. Those who remember the meaning of the words *Come to the class* read it to themselves and go to the circle of chairs. The other children follow their lead and will be helped - by their imitating - to learn to read. After all are at the circle, the teacher writes *Open your book*. The mature, quick-learning children will have remembered to get their books, others will not have done so. The teacher then reads the sentence, explains to the immature children just what it means.

*Word analysis.* In the Silent Reading Method phonics have been placed in a subordinate role to comprehending meaning. Introduction of phonics is delayed until children
have a good start in the basic habits of silent reading and after they can recognize and understand the meaning of numerous words. Theoretically, this would mean that with average groups of beginners, the children would not be exposed to phonics until mid-year or until late in the second semester. In practice it meant that teachers, exhibiting their normal insecurity, tried everything in the medicine cabinet early in the case. That is, they tended to introduce phonics within the first three or four weeks of beginning reading, and put considerable emphasis upon it throughout the primary grades.

*Reading Programs Based on the Silent Reading Method*

The emphasis upon silent reading resulted in the writing of a vast number of professional books. A few such publications were: J. A. O'Brien, *Silent Reading, with Special Reference to Speed* (1921); C. E. Germane and E. G. Germane, *Silent Reading, A Handbook for Teachers* (1923); Emma Watkins, *How to Teach Silent Reading to Beginners* (1922); Clarence R. Stone, *Silent and Oral Reading* (1922); H. G. Wheat, *The Teaching of Reading*; and Nila B. Smith, *One Hundred Ways of Teaching Silent Reading* (1925).

Of these publications the book, *How to Teach Silent Reading* by Emma Watkins, was devoted to a description of a

19

teaching approach to silent reading. The publication provided a detailed account of action-response silent reading exercises which Miss Watkins had used in teaching beginners to read. As her suggestions are representative of materials found in courses of study and in the numerous teachers' manuals published at this time, it is presented as a typical reading program based on the Silent Reading Method.

The Watkins Program of Teaching Silent Reading

The reading program as developed by Miss Watkins stressed silent reading. In the introduction to Emma Watkins' book, *How to Teach Silent Reading to Beginners*, Dr. Horn has written:

> It must not be thought that Miss Watkins would limit the teaching of reading to this sort of exercise. It is not intended that these exercises take the place of instruction in literary appreciation. There is also a necessity of reading, silently, a great deal of easy material such as is found in our best primers and first readers. Neither are the exercises expected to supplant the teaching of phonics. 20

Miss Watkins describes her reading program in the following manner:

> A Name-Card containing the word to be taught is prepared. The child is told what the word in question is. The card is then withdrawn and replaced with other cards, and the child is told to watch

---

for it when it reappears. Cards are shown one by one, and when this particular word reappears, the children will indicate their recognition of it in a predescribed manner (by actions of various kinds). The word is then printed on the blackboard and shade, and a word related to the original word is printed on a name-card and held opposite the word on the blackboard. The children are taught by the similarity or differences.21

Procedures of instruction. The materials necessary for teaching beginners to read in this reading program are rather simple in form and most, if not all, can be made by the teacher.

The most fundamental materials is the "Name-Card." These are cards of varying size on which words, phrases, or sentences are printed in large letters.

A "Shade" or curtain, which can be raised and lowered is of great value. This shade provides surface space on which learned words can be printed and when needed reviewed.

Other necessary materials are hectograph, calendars (large and small), clock dials (large and small), bulletin board, color cards (complete set of eleven colors for each child), and animal silhouette cards.

This method is organized around the following steps: (1) presentation of the sight words and (2) study of phonic elements of words.

Presentation of sight words. Sight words are presented to the children in lessons dealing with the following activities:

21Ibid., pp. 20-21.
These lessons are usually introduced by presenting the words to be learned on flash cards or on the chalkboard and explaining by means of verbal communication or dramatization the word meanings.

For example, the Come to Class Lesson which is used when the children are beginning the school year is developed in the following manner.

The teacher prints the words Come to the Class on the chalkboard and orally tells the children the meaning of the words. This is done by the teacher saying: "What I have printed here (indicating) means that all of you are to rise whenever you see this and come to this place where the little chairs are. I call this place 'the class.'"
After this the command is erased and rewritten on the chalkboard. If a child does not respond with the correct action, he is again told what it means.

When all the children are seated the command Go to Your Seats is written, explained, and dramatized by the children.

This is repeated several times until the teacher is assured by their actions that the children understand the meaning of the two sentences.

The study of phonic elements. Miss Watkins states that any standard method of teaching phonics may be applied to this program of teaching reading. She does, however, suggest the following points to be emphasized:

1. A regular time on the daily program for phonics.
2. Drill upon Word-Cards and Phonetic Cards be kept entirely separate.
3. While "working out" words, phonetically, the child should be trained to think the sound and pronounce the word as a whole, without lip movement.
4. Use the same method in presenting phonics as in presenting new words in the Silent Reading Method. (a) Have the child's undivided attention. (b) Present the symbol . . . at the same time that the sound is given. (c) Perform actions, when symbol is shown. . . . (d) Play games to stimulate the interest of the children. (e) Do individual work entirely. (f) Insist upon the proper position of the organs of speech. (g) Work for speed. . . . (h) Put as much spirit into the phonetic lesson as in the reading lesson.22

22 Ibid., pp. 126-127.
modified in some degree. The child's physical, social, and emotional condition interacts with and affects his progress in learning to read. If he is physically, emotionally and socially mature, he probably can learn to read effectively. If on the other hand, his hearing or eyesight is defective, if he is socially immature or inadequate, if he is emotionally unstable, or if he is physically or mentally undeveloped, the child and his teacher meet serious difficulties in reading activities.

Definitions of Reading

The Thirty-sixth Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education reviews the definitions of reading in the following manner. The oldest and the narrowest view of the reading process is that reading is the act of perceiving and identifying printed or written symbols. Following this conception in teaching reading, one would emphasize accuracy in visual recognition of words, the span or amount of text visualized at each fixation, the rate of speed at which words and phrases are identified, the rhythm of eye-movement along the lines, and the regularity of return from

---


It is further suggested that phonic training should begin as soon as the children are assigned to reading groups. This aspect of the Watkin Reading Program has one major objective. "The sole aim of teaching phonics is for instant recognition of words as wholes." 23

Using the Watkins Program in a classroom situation.

(To illustrate the procedures used in a classroom situation the Animal Lesson has been selected. In this lesson the children are taught to associate the names of animals and their pictures as well as learn interesting facts about the animals.)

The vocabulary list to be presented is:

- cow
- horse
- lion
- bear
- robin
- dog
- hen
- camel
- duck
- rat
- turkey
- pig
- rabbit
- donkey
- goat
- rooster
- sheep
- fox
- elephant
- mouse
- frog

(The materials needed for this lesson are a set of word cards, picture cards and characteristic cards. The word and picture cards correspond to the words in the vocabulary lists, while on the characteristic cards are written the following phrases):

gives milk
hibernates
lays eggs
gnaws
has pink eyes
crows
has a long trunk
neighs
chirps
has two humps
says gobble
has long ears
has wool
 squeaks
roars
barks
says quack
grunts
butts
is sly
croaks

23 Ibid., p. 126.
(The teacher has arranged the picture cards around the chalkboard ledge in view of the children. The words selected from the vocabulary list for this lesson are: dog, cow, sheep, duck, and elephant.

Teacher: (Holds before the class a card that says, Come to the class.)

Teacher: "Children, this word (holding so all can see the word-card that says dog) says dog. Who can place this word by the picture of the dog? Lucille?"

(Lucille takes the card and finds the correct picture.)

Teacher: "Look at this word. It says cow. Ben, find the right card."

Ben: "What does it say?"

Teacher: "Cow. Look at it carefully."

(Ben finds the corresponding picture card.)

Teacher: "This tells us the name of a very large animal. It says elephant."

Sally: "I see the picture!"

Teacher: "Good, you may place the card in front of it."

(Sally does.)

(This type of exercise continues until the words, selected for the day, have been presented. The teacher then gathers the picture cards leaving the word cards.)

Teacher: "What do you see on this card?" (Holds up picture.)

Wendell: "A duck."

Teacher: "Now, who can find the card that says duck . . . Jimmy?"

Jimmy: "... Is this it?"
Teacher: "Yes, that was good work. Here is a picture of the sheep. Find that card that says sheep, Walt?"

(Walt does.)

(This exercise continues until all have been matched.)

Teacher: "That was just fine. Who can tell me what the cow gives us?" (She prints the word cow on the blackboard.)

Mary: "Milk."

Teacher: "That's right, the cow gives us milk." (She writes several spaces away from the word cow, gives milk.)

Teacher: "What does the dog (prints dog) do?"

Julia: "Eats."

Teacher: "What else?"

Don: "Sleeps."

Teacher: "But, what kind of a noise does he make?"

Charles: "Barks!"

Teacher: (Prints the word, barks.)

(This continues until the children have discussed that the sheep - has wool; the duck - says quack, quack; and the elephant - has a long trunk.)

(Then the teacher holds up the picture card of the animal and the children find the corresponding description of the animal.)

Teacher: "Now, we are going to play the Animal Game. Listen, and I will tell you how it is played. If you notice, all the picture cards are on the blackboard. As I flash the cards describing the animals, you are to reach quickly for the correct picture. We will see who gets the most cards. We must remember not to make any noise. We will have three children try at a time. The children in the chairs must watch if someone grabs the wrong word, let me know by holding up your hand. Do you understand?"
Class: "Yes!"

Teacher: "Suppose we select the first three by pulling out their name card. Lea, will you select three name-cards?"

(Lea pulls out three name-cards and after the children look at each card Lois, Robert, and Carolyn take their places in front of the picture cards and the game begins.)

(This continues until all have played the game.)

Teacher: "That game was too easy. Let's see if you can do what this says?" (She prints the following on the board: Which animal gives milk?"

(A child responds by handing her the picture.)

Put the dog behind the door.

(A child does it.)

Put the animal that has wool on my desk.

(If no one volunteers to respond a name-card is selected; then that child dramatizes the word meaning. However, if he is unable to do so he is told what it says and a short time later is asked to respond to the same command.)

Advantages of the Silent Reading Method

The use of pictures and dramatic actions to interpret meaning is perhaps the major advantage of the Silent Reading Method. The presentation of the picture or dramatization stamps a vivid pictorial image upon the mind. Judd declares:

... the psychological process which really occurs is substantially this. The picture of the apple arouses the interest reactions and experiences which the pupil has thus had with apples. The writing of the word on the board at the same time serves to carry over to it all the awakened experiences and vivid reactions of the pupil, who has handled, tasted, chewed, and
played with apples at various previous times. The word 'apple' has thus become a dynamic symbol charged with vital interest, and clothed with interpretative experience. 26

Other advantages appear to be:

1. The Silent Reading Method provides training in a reading medium which is of utmost importance in daily life.

2. The Silent Reading Method provides an opportunity in which pupils are trained to study.

3. The fundamental factors of speed, comprehension, and organization are emphasized.

4. Silent reading is, as a rule, a more economical and effective instrument for the assimilation of thought.

Disadvantages of the Silent Reading Method 27

L. C. Pressey and S. L. Pressey have shown by an experimental study that there is no general silent reading ability. A person who may read one kind of material well may have difficulty reading a different type of material. Thus, it seems that silent reading is not a new subject to be added to the curriculum but rather as an integrated part of a total language program. Therefore, it appears as if consideration should not be whether to teach silent or oral reading, but how to provide a reading program that would balance the oral and silent procedures in a functional manner.

26 Judd, op. cit., p. 315.

One extreme method is as unnecessary as the other. Anderson and Dearborn declare that oral and silent reading have the following common elements.

1. There is a tendency for children who read with efficient eye movements in oral reading to read with efficient eye in silent reading, and for the individuals who read with inefficient eye movements in oral reading to read with inefficient eye movements in silent reading.

2. There is a tendency for good silent readers to make significantly fewer oral reading errors than the poor silent readers.

3. There is a tendency for good readers to read with more accuracy both orally and silently than poor readers.

Present Status of the Silent Reading Method

The present rating assigned to the Silent Reading Method indicates that many procedures necessary for an adequate reading program were not provided. Besides not supporting procedures which show understanding of how children learn, according to the five judges consulted this method fails:

1. To provide for oral reading.

2. To postpone reading until readiness has been developed.

3. To provide for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading.

---


29 Appendix, pp. 563-564.
4. To provide for developing permanent interests in reading.

5. To provide for individual differences in ability, needs, and interests.

6. To provide an appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials.

7. To provide for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading.

Provision, though inadequate was made for:

1. A study of general configuration and striking features of words.

2. The study and use of picture clues, phonetic analyses, syllabification, comprehension, application of information, silent reading, and depth of word meaning.

3. The provision for the development of readiness for reading.

4. The emphasis from the beginning on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to thoughtful, meaningful interpretation.

5. The provision for increase in vocabulary and content.

6. The continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading.

The judges did not agree to the degree in which this method provided for:

1. The use of content clue.

2. The interpretation of material.

3. The evaluation of material.

4. The speed determined by purpose.

30 Appendix, p. 563.
Before concluding it should be made clear that this evaluation is based upon the opinion of five judges, and also in planning a reading lesson, as in planning all teaching activities, the teacher should consider all suggestions and procedures which exist for use or improvisation which may meet the needs of a specific child.

Section II

The Picture-Story Method

Another attempt to develop a silent reading approach to beginning reading was the Picture-Story Method. This method attempted to eliminate the following criticisms: (1) the unrealistically wide vocabularies of beginning materials advocated by the Sentence Method, (2) the extensive drill required in the Word Method, (3) the difficulty to maintain a regular rate of progress with either the Sentence or Story Method, and (4) the difficulty to buy or construct materials of instruction needed for the Silent Reading Method.

This was the first consistent plan for teaching beginning reading that recognized and made provision for individual differences, enabling the teacher to allow each child to proceed at his own rate of speed.

The Picture-Story Method is based on the assumption that meaning of the printed symbol can be developed through matching the printed symbol with the corresponding picture.
Thus, the picture is used to stimulate meaning, then the sight of the printed symbol serves to stimulate response to picture and attention to the word seen. Anderson and Dearborn illustrate this assumption with the following diagram.  

![Diagram showing the sequence of events from picture to word recognition and response.](image)

**Historical Development**

First introduced in 1921, the Picture-Story Method was a rather unique contribution to practices in teaching beginning reading during the period when silent reading techniques were being developed rapidly. Despite many improvements attained by earlier systems the Picture-Story Method was the first which was based completely upon the use of reading as a tool in self-directed purposeful child activity.  

Another idea new to practices in beginning reading was the use of a picture dictionary to provide self-help for children in independent recognition of new words.

The Picture-Story Method was developed by Stuart A. Courtis and Nila B. Smith and published in "Picture-Story...

---

31 Anderson and Dearborn, *op. cit.*, p. 150.

32 N.B. Smith, *op. cit.*, p. 175.
Reading Lessons" by the World Book Company, Yonkers, New York, 1921. The special teaching materials were prepared by the Detroit school system for local use.

Description of the Picture-Story Method

This method of teaching beginning reading is very similar to the Silent Reading Method. Emphasis is placed on speed and comprehension of reading. The Picture-Story Method encourages a purely visual reading. Communication is discouraged, as a technique for developing word understanding, with pictures being used as a medium to develop meaning.

Materials of instruction. As described briefly by one of the co-originators of the Picture-Story Method, the first series of materials intended for the beginning stage of reading, includes these items: (1) a pad on which are printed instructions, solid pictures for cut-outs, and outlined pictures or "frames," from which the child is able to construct a picture independently; (2) a picture dictionary, which the child uses as a reference when needed for interpreting new words; (3) a primer type booklet, "My Story Book," which contains a story for each reading lesson and a miniature copy of the complete picture which the child constructs in his work pad.

The second series of materials for the Picture-Story Method includes: (1) a story-book containing short literary
the end of one line to the beginning of the next. This definition of reading is correct as far as it goes, but ends with the mechanics of the process.

A later and broader definition of reading includes the mechanical process and accurate recognition of words but extends beyond these abilities to the consideration of ideas. Reading is selecting the appropriate meanings of words, phrases, and sentences by content and combining these into a sequence of ideas. Where the first definition ended with accuracy and rate, this adds comprehension.

The third conception of the reading process adds to accuracy, rate, and comprehension, the activities involved in reflection on the significance of the writer's ideas. According to this concept, an effective reader not only identifies printed symbols accurately and rapidly, comprehends their meanings, and selects the meaning intended by the writer, but he also appraises the ideas, integrates them into his previous knowledge, and applies them to the solution of problems to which the ideas are pertinent.

Numerous definitions have been given for reading. David Russell defines reading in the following manner:

Reading is a subtle and complex act. It involves, more or less simultaneously, the following: sensation of light rays upon the retina of the eye reaching the brain, perception of separate words and phrases, functioning of the eye muscles with exact controls, immediate memory of what has just been read, remote memories based on the reader's
selections, each of which is followed by instruction for dramatization and directions for drawing scenes for plays; (2) a picture dictionary which contains self-helps for words not recognized.

Procedures of instruction. The use of pairs of pictures, with words printed on labels on only one picture of the pair, are used to encourage the child to learn the words functionally, through matching corresponding parts of the pictures. In the next stage of progress, the child cuts out printed words and phrases and pastes them on the second picture to correspond to the labels of the first.  

Each picture in the primer "My Story Book" is accompanied by a short "story" just below it composed of brief sentences about the picture. These sentences are composed of words that have been introduced in the picture study activities. The child reads the story orally to the teacher after completing his picture and self-checking his reading of directions. This oral reading to the teacher serves as a quick check on recognition of words studied. Thus, this procedure provides for silent reading not only to come first in each exercise, but to occupy a large part of each lesson. It also provides an opportunity to assist with pronunciation and

inflection of voice. The following of the instructions and
directions by the child serves as a check on comprehension.
To some extent, the dramatization and sketches of scenes also
provide evidence of the child's literary appreciation, a
major goal of the earlier Sentence Method.

The child can use as clues, the pictures, context
sentences, and phonetic similarities and differences. As
children develop independence in attacking new words and
acquire larger vocabularies of sight words, the use of pic­
tures is gradually reduced.

Providing for individual differences. In this method
of teaching beginning reading, grouping of children according
to reading ability is encouraged. Two groups of pupils are
formed. One group consists of capable children, who progress
independently step by step in developing the picture-story
after the story has been introduced and words studied. The
second group, made up of children who need to work under the
teacher's guidance, studies one picture at a time.

Using the Picture-Study Method
in a Classroom Situation

The teacher or one of the children take the books to
the reading circle. Before the children open their books the
teacher attempts to build up interest and a background of
information for better understanding. The picture-story is
"Fluffy's Friends," the characters are a goose, a duck,
a turkey, and a chicken. The teacher asks how many children have chickens at home; have ever seen a live turkey; know the difference between a duck and goose; etc. To strengthen her teaching and to make the reading lesson easier, the teacher has brought from her picture-file a variety of pictures of fowls. These are face down on a chair by her side, for display and discussion at appropriate points in the reading. The lesson proper is begun after most of the children have a general understanding of the subject matter of the story.

Teacher:  "We have a nice story about a chicken, and her friends. It is called "Fluffy's Friends." There are four characters in it. Open your books to page 43." (She opens her book and holds it up facing the children.) "See the chicken? Can you recognize her friends?"

Children: "There's a duck!" "No, it ain't. That's the goose, I betcha!" "And I know this is a turkey!" are typical comments.

Teacher: After suitable encouraging responses to the comments, "The chicken's name is Carrie. See it under the picture? Can you say it?" (All say Carrie, Carrie Chicken.) "The duck's name - see the duck - is Donnie. Can you read it? 'Donnie Duck!' Can any of you read the names of the goose and the turkey?"

Children: Several wild guesses, some correct answers. The names are "George Goose" and "Tillie Turkey."

Teacher: Utilizing the confused and erroneous guessing as a basis for closer study of the printed names. "If we look at their names closely, to see what each printed name looks like; we will know them next time. If we look carefully at the picture, that will help us to remember the name. Look, the goose even looks like his name! His head sticks up high in front of him just like the first part of his name!" . . . "Here
is a list of the names."

(She displays a chart on which the name of the four foul friends are printed about six inches apart. Opposite each is a line drawing of the foul. Further discussion follows. The teacher has several children read the names from the chart.)

**Teacher:** Holding up one of her pictures from the chair, "What is this?"

**Children:** "A turkey!"

**Teacher:** "Correct now go to the chart and pick out turkey." (Further work of this kind continues.)

**Teacher:** "I think we are ready to read the story. If you have trouble, study the picture. It may give you a clue, so you will know what the words say. But, if you still can't get the word, raise your hand. Try to read all of the first page."

**Children:** All begin to read silently. A hand goes up here and there. The teacher moves around, pointing to picture clues (a pencil point touches on a few raindrops and the child nods - the new word is "rain"), asking a guiding question ("Did they go for a run? They went for a walk - that's right"), supplying a needed word (a lovely day, lovely).

**Teacher:** "Have you all read the first five sentences? Good! Ann, read the first sentence that explains what the Fluffy's Friends did." (Ann reads, "They went for a walk!") "That's fine. Who knows what the next sentence tells?" (Several answers). One of the pictures tells us. Let's look again. The one showing the pond? Yes. They walked to the pond. Bill, will you read that sentence for us?"

**Bill:** "They . . . went . . . for a . . . walk."

**Teacher:** "Thank you, Bill, but that isn't your best reading. Can you do better, if you read it again?"

**Bill:** "They went . . . for a walk."

**A Child:** "I know what the turkey said when he got to the pond!"
(The teacher rewards this aggressive interest with a smile and nod of recognition.)

Teacher: "Has anyone else read as far as Laura?" (Two others have. The three read aloud, in turn, as far as they have gone in silent reading.)

(The teacher aids the children in telling the story, as far as they have read. The pictures, closely following the text, are used in remembering the story. All unfamiliar and new words are written on the chalkboard. For seatwork, after the reading lesson, the children are to look for pictures illustrating the words. They are also to draw several of their own and copy the words.)

Reading Programs Based upon the Picture-Story Method

Many of the features introduced by the Picture-Story Method appeared in other readers during later educational periods. In modified form, this method is still used by some first grade teachers in Detroit and other places. Some of the materials of the Intrinsic Method, the Non-Oral Method, and the Experience Method are similar in certain principles to the basic ideas of the picture-story system. Many pre-reading and beginning reading work books utilize the labeling, cuttings, and matching ideas as suggested by Courtis and Smith.

Advantages of the Picture-Story Method

There were a number of distinct advantages in the Picture-Story Method. These appear to be:

---

1. Reading was a work tool rather than a dramatic performance.

2. Rates of progress were adjustable to strengths of individuals.

3. Independence of word-recognition was fostered.

4. Use of the dictionary as a self aid was encouraged.

5. Accurate, honest, self-appraisal was an integral part of the method.

6. Attitudes of friendly cooperation were developed, with a reduction in competition.

7. Unwholesome pressure for speed or "ground covering" was avoided or, at least, was not a part of the planned program.

8. Ability to read developed naturally, as a by-product of purposeful activity, according to Meriam's maxim that "the best way to teach reading is not to teach it."

Limitations of the Picture-Story Method

In common with other approaches to beginning reading, the Picture-Story did not succeed in eliminating all disadvantages.

1. The readiness or pre-reading period presented some problems of whole-group activities, since all materials were individualized.

2. The amount of cutting and pasting is disproportionate to the number of words learned through these activities.

3. The prepared materials involve only vicarious experiences. Direct personal experiences, considered so essential in later periods, were not so recognized at the time the Picture-Story Method was introduced. While the method is capable of modification in this regard the teacher would have to provide the "bridge."
4. The amount of time during which the children are required to sit at work may be longer than is now considered desirable or suitable.

5. The socialization influences of group work are not part of the method, although they could be provided by the teacher before or after the reading exercises.

6. The teacher's originality and ingenuity are given little opportunity for expression, as the materials of each series must be taken in sequential order and followed closely.

7. The method is directly connected to special materials for teaching. Like an automobile motor which cannot be removed from the car body, the Picture-Story Method cannot be used without tailor-made teaching materials nor the materials used without the method. A certain inflexibility of teaching inevitably results.

Present Status of the Picture-Story Method

The Picture-Story Method, initiated by Courtis and Smith about thirty-five years ago, has been evaluated by five judges with the following results:

In their opinion this method provided for a study of word recognition by content clues in an adequate manner. However, there was disagreement in regards to the degree in which two important facets of a reading program were provided. These facets were (1) provision for the study of general configuration of words and (2) postponement of reading until readiness has been developed. Four of the five judges believed that the study of word configuration was provided for in an

35 Appendix, pp. 566-567.
adequate manner; however, one judge rated such as provided for but not adequately. In respect to postponement of reading until readiness had been developed the ratio was reverse; one judge expressing the opinion that this facet was provided for adequately; while four judges were of the opinion that the element was not provided for in a satisfactory manner.

The characteristics, which in the opinion of all the judges were provided for but not adequately, are:

1. Understanding of how children learn.
2. Study of striking characteristics of words, picture clues, comprehension, interpretation and application of material read, silent and oral reading.
4. Emphasis from the beginning on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading.
5. Provision for individual differences in ability, needs, and interest.
6. Provision for increase in vocabulary and content.
7. Provision for a planned program of evaluation and continuous progress toward the objective of beginning reading.

According to the present rating form the following characteristics were not included as an integrated part of the Picture-Story Method:

1. Provision for the study of syllabification, evaluation of material, drawing of conclusions, speed determined by purpose, and depth of word meaning.

36 Appendix, p. 566.
2. Provision for the extensive easy reading and wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading.

3. Provision for developing permanent interest in reading.

4. Provision for an appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type material.

5. Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of skills in reading.

Section III

The Non-Oral Method

Variations in practice have occurred from time to time in the procedures recommended for teaching reading by the silent reading approach. The most extreme form has been the Non-Oral Method advocated by McDade. This method utilizes what may be termed a "look-and-comprehend" technique. It attempts to make the connection between the word and meaning direct by emphasizing association between the printed word and meaning. This method accepts the hypothesis that reading does not involve saying the words, but immediately comprehending the visual symbols.

From the very first an attempt is made to eliminate the sight→sound→meaning process and to substitute in its


38James E. McDade, "Examination of a Recent Criticism of the Non-Oral Beginning Reading," Elementary School Journal, No. 6, XLIV (February, 1941), 15.
place the direct method of sight → meaning process. The "intelligence" learns to associate word meanings directly with the visual symbols.

Historical Development

The idea of the Non-Oral Method of teaching reading may have developed from the procedures used by Samuel Gridley Howe as he attempted to teach Laura Bridgman, a deaf, dumb, and blind inmate of the Perkins Institution in Boston. Howe, director of the Institution, devised a kinesthethic approach; endeavoring to approach her intelligence through the sense of touch. Howe summarized his method as follows:

The first experiments were made by taking articles in common use, such as knives, forks, spoons, keys, etc., and pasting upon them labels with their names printed in raised letters. These she felt of very carefully, and soon of course, distinguished that the crooked lines of the spoon, differed as much from the crooked lines of the key, as the spoon differed from the key in form. Then small detached labels, with the same words printed upon them were put into her hands and she soon observed that they were similar to the ones pasted on the articles. She showed perception of this similarity by laying the label upon the key, and the label spoon upon the spoon.39

Howe then advanced the method another step by suggesting: "Instead of labels the individual letters were given to her on detached bits of paper: they were arranged

39 Samuel G. Howe, as quoted by James E. McDade, Next Steps in Non-Oral Reading, pp. 8-9.
experiences, interest in the content read, and organization of the material so that finally it can be used in some way.\textsuperscript{24}

While Harrison defines reading as:

\ldots a process of recognizing symbols which serve as stimuli to the recalling and construction of meaning, accompanied by the manipulating of the resulting meanings in thought processes according to the purposes of the reader, and applying these meanings to his purposes so that his ensuing reactions are modified as a result of reading.\textsuperscript{25}

However, Saucier's\textsuperscript{26} definition that "Reading is essentially thinking as a result of stimulation from the printed page" more strongly stresses the belief that reading is a thinking process, comprehension, and reconstruction of ideas.

In summary it appears that reading may be defined as a process of attaching meaning to immediately recognized visual impressions registered on similar areas of the retina of the two eyes, and the interpretation of these impressions through associations of experiences to these stimuli and the manipulation of the resulting thought processes according to the writers' intent, so that behavior patterns are reconstructed.

\textsuperscript{24} Russell, op. cit., p. 74.


side by side, so as to spell book, spoon, key, etc., then they were mixed up in a heap, and a sign was made for her to arrange them herself.  

McDade points out, in connection with Howe's method, that the steps are easily recognizable to any classroom teacher using the Non-Oral Method. He further suggests that Anne Sullivan, the partially blind student in Perkins Institution, who successfully taught Helen Keller, used Howe's Method in ways strongly resembling the present non-oral procedure.

In the fall of 1935 James E. McDade, who at that time was assistant superintendent in Chicago, introduced the Non-Oral Method of teaching reading in one first-grade class in that city. In the year 1937, he wrote the following statement concerning the results obtained at the end of the first year of the study: "The average reading score of the class exceeded the course of study requirements by seven and one-half months. There were no failures."

By 1944 with the assistance of William H. Johnson, Superintendent of the Chicago Schools, seventy thousand children enrolled in one hundred thirty-seven or a little more than 36 per cent of the schools in Chicago had been taught

---

Ibid., p. 9.  
Ibid.

to read by this method. After a continuous program for five years the following results were reported in the publication, Essentials of Non-Oral Reading:

In a study of 178 children, who began non-oral and individual reading in September, 1936, the following results are reported at the end of the school year 1937-1938. Grade placement, 2.9 (end of the ninth month of second grade). Average grade score, 3.4 (end of fourth month of third year). . . . Forty-three percent of the children were reported as "undetermined" because the test ceiling was too low. . . . The non-oral and individual reading plan, the report concludes, eliminates inner speech, provides for individual differences, reduces retardation, and far exceeds the requirements of the course of study in the actual mastery of the fundamental reading skills, speed, accuracy, and comprehension. Five years' experience in hundreds of classes and numerous unpublished studies have supported these findings.

Description of the Non-Oral Method

The essence of the Non-Oral Method is that direct association was to be made between the visual symbol and meanings, without intervening activities of oral pronunciation. McDade has declared: "In non-oral reading we avoid at the beginning sandwiching speech between the print (V) and meaning (M), as oral reading does. Instead we persistently and undeviatingly associate visual print (V) directly with . . .


meaning (M). Nothing is permitted to separate them. Care is taken to bind them together always as with loops of steel in their easy and simple form. 45

The basic assumption underlying the Non-Oral Method. This method is based on the assumption that beginning reading is analogous to an adult's learning of a foreign language and of the infant's learning oral vernacular. The infant learns the vernacular by listening and imitating his parents and other speakers. He learns to hear and talk by hearing and talking. Similarly the child is to learn to read by watching and imitating communication in writing. He learns appropriate responses to print by observing the teacher's response to the same print. No spoken language is used in this process. The situations and the vocabulary to be employed are not rehearsed in advance in spoken language since advocators of the method believe such may develop habits of "inner speech" which become firmly entrenched and in the majority of cases are never completely overcome.

McDade states that the oral and non-oral work of the classroom should proceed independently, each in its normal way. "... to devote one day's work to preparation for the next day's non-oral is a sure method of defeating the purpose of both." 46

46 McDade, Next Steps in Non-Oral Reading, p. 7.
Basic principles underlying the Non-Oral Method.

Although the sight-sound meaning associations in reading may be aided by the child's memory and by content; the sight words themselves must suggest meaning if rapid, comprehensive, reading is to be achieved. This word recognition or word perception process is believed to be the key to effective reading. The two basic principles of recognition are: (1) to bring details into consciousness, and (2) through purposeful practice submerge details into semi-consciousness. These principles may be illustrated by the way the wartime aircraft recognition-training worked. An individual wanted to learn to recognize many airplanes rapidly. He had the drive or motivation to concentrate, to put forth effort. He viewed several planes as wholes, associating several with their names. Others, which he did not readily associate, were studied in some detail. These were again viewed as wholes, under simulated flight conditions. The student memorized no more detail than was necessary. Once the plane was recognized, or became a familiar identity, the detail design elements dropped from consciousness. The plane was seen as a unit-whole, the only way it could be recognized at flight-speeds.

Procedures of instruction. McDade has established two cardinal rules: (1) The positive rule is: There must always be an association of the printed word with its meaning. . . . (2) The negative rule follows from the positive
rule: There must never be an association of the printed word with the oral word.\textsuperscript{47}

A variety of materials and procedures are used to convey the meanings of words, phrases, and sentences. The teacher guides children in acting out, without conversation, printed directions, such as, "Stand up," "Walk to the table."

Individual seatwork to provide opportunities for vocabulary building, word study, and meaningful silent reading is provided. Basic readers are read silently, then discussed orally, after printed questions and directions have been used.

\textbf{Setting the stage for instruction.} This method stresses the fact that children should learn to read in life situations in which print really functions. The use of topics, projects, or centers of interests, such as home, farm, a birthday party, are used to promote reading situations.

The following guide is given to help the teacher select adequate and worthwhile materials for beginning reading:

1. Something to be read - a word, phrase, or sentence.

2. A dictionary (if needed) which the child can consult for the meaning of any word he does not know.

3. An object or objects, or a person or persons, constituting a situation toward which, or in which the reading child acts.\textsuperscript{48}

\textsuperscript{47}McDade, \textit{Essentials of Non-Oral Reading}, p. 15.

\textsuperscript{48}\textit{Ibid.}, p. 18.
Numerous techniques may be used to promote reading situations. A few suggested techniques are:

1. It will be easier for the child to learn the meanings of new printed words, if an oral language period is provided so that readiness and comprehension of the words can be developed.

2. Use only words that are functional: Confusion can result if the phrases or sentences are padded with meaningless words.

3. Yes-No cards: This material promotes comprehension when they are used to answer such questions as: "Is the sun shining?" "Is your dress red?"

4. Split sentences: This technique operates by having the child complete sentences. Two packs of cards are given to each child or the class room can be divided into two teams. Split sentences such as, The dog (barks, gives milk) can be used. The objective of the lesson is to have the sentences correctly completed.

5. Individual work: Directed individual reading in the form of properly designed seatwork should be used from the very first day. For example, the children can match phrases and sentences to pictures.

6. Do not teach a vocabulary list in order but continually use situations in which action goes on, so that meaning can be developed.


8. Living pictures: This technique is something like dramatization as the children play-out the meanings of words, such as, Put the ball on the table, under the table, etc.

Materials of instruction. The materials of instruction are: flash cards (word, phrase, and sentence), dictionary (chart, picture, picture-symbol), miniature objects, pictures, Yes-No cards, and books.

49Ibid., p. 23.
Use of materials. In order that there is a direct association of the printed word with its meaning objects, models, pictures, dictionary, and cards are used in the following manner:

Suppose the teacher desired to teach the immediate recognition of the word **apple**. Rather than putting the printed symbol for **apple** on the chalkboard and telling the children the word, four objects such as a book, a pencil, an apple, and some paper are placed on a table. The child is asked to put on each of the four a printed card bearing its right name. One card at a time is handed to the child; if he does not know which object to place the card on his attention is directed to a "dictionary," on which pictures and the printed symbols representing the objects have been drawn or pasted. Thus, the child is able to interpret the symbol on the card independently without oral communication between him and the teacher.

If the child says, "I don't know this word," a word not listed in the dictionary the teacher is not to tell him, but (1) have him close his book and talk over the text, (2) dramatize the word, or (3) with book closed discuss the actual word.

**Techniques of instruction.** Printed words are used from the beginning in situations which make their meanings clear and require responses from the children. Unfamiliar
situations or meanings are explained by the teacher or child showing the pupils the appropriate action or picture. Many symbols whose meaning are not clear alone can be easily understood by presenting a companion symbol of contrasting meaning, such as go-come, up-down. Changing situations also provide varied opportunities for the evocation of differing shades of meaning, and also acquisition of new words to modify familiar ones as well as conveying still different shades of meaning as: cat, black cat, small black cat. The various social situations can make clear the meanings and appropriate uses of pronouns and adverbs, of prepositions, conjunctions, adjectives, and interjections. Such words as I, you, and me; if and but, when and where; here and there, can be illustrated in concrete situations which require the particular word to complete written meaning, as "Where is the door?"

In working with new vocabulary, accuracy is stressed, and time is allowed for close discrimination. After a group of words are reliably known, there follows a stage of practicing the use of the familiar words in varying combinations of phrases and sentences. During this stage the time allowed for recognition of meaning is systematically shortened. The purpose of this procedure is to develop speed in reading and correct perceptual reading habits of maximum eye-span and minimum fixation time.
In regard to correcting inaccurate reading, McDade has said that errors or misconceptions may be eliminated by showing what the correct response should have been. "Repetition with continual variation will make comprehension quick and certain."\(^{50}\)

The dictionary is introduced at the very beginning. The teacher refers to it frequently in working with the class and encourages the children to use it.

Providing for individual differences. An ancient but widely held view, even now, is that children in the beginning grades are incapable of learning except in class periods directly with the teacher. Two-thirds of the children sit at semi-recreational jobs such as coloring mimeographed outline figures, gluing letters on sheets opposite printed words to make a matching word, and drawing lines connecting corresponding pictures or words. Such activities are sometimes called "hand-and-eye" training. More often, it is a slicked-up version of old-time "busy work," although the term is in disrepute, and of course, is carefully avoided. While two-thirds of the children are killing time with busy work, the remaining third goes forward to sit in a semi-circle before the teacher. There, each opens his reader to the same page and the teacher hands out to each his spoonful of reading

---

\(^{50}\) McDade, *Next Steps in Non-Oral Reading*, p. 7.
like a mother bird sitting on the edge of the nest doling out
worms to the baby birds surrounding her. The children respond
by reading a little, talking a little, answering questions.
McDade argues that this type of teaching encourages forma-
tions of habits of articulation, subvocalization, or "inner
speech," and retards the development of rapid comprehensive,
silent reading.

He also suggests that failure to utilize the possi-
bilities of the individual work time is perhaps the chief
obstacle, at present, to the rapid and successful attainment
by children of satisfactory reading achievement. There is a
point here which every experienced teacher of beginning read-
ing will recognize. There simply is not time in the class
period for the teacher to give to every child the extensive,
varied, and meaningful practice which he must have if he is
to become a competent reader. In individual work the rapid
are not held back by the slow, nor are the slow reprimanded
or urged to keep up with the rapid. Each child resumes an
unfinished job the next period or when he has spare time, or
even the next day, and so his learning is continuous until he
has complete mastery of the job. In regard to this McDade
has said:

In individual work the child practices on a
given exercise until he masters it. He works un-
disturbed, without embarrassing pressure to stampede
him. Insistence on having all seatwork, move on
## LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Characteristics and Pattern of Disagreement Concerning Facets of the Sentence Method</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Criteria for the Evaluation of Reading Methods</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. The Evaluation of the Alphabetic Method</td>
<td>321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Assigned Numerical Values of the Alphabetic Method</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Evaluation of the Alphabetic-Phonic Method</td>
<td>324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. Assigned Numerical Values of the Alphabetic-Phonic Method</td>
<td>325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII. Evaluation of the Phonic Method</td>
<td>327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII. Assigned Numerical Values of the Phonic Method</td>
<td>328</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX. Evaluation of the Phonetic Method</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X. Assigned Numerical Values of the Phonetic Method</td>
<td>331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XI. Evaluation of the Linguistic Method</td>
<td>333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XII. Assigned Numerical Values of the Linguistic Method</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIII. Evaluation of the Word Method</td>
<td>336</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIV. Assigned Numerical Values of the Word Method</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XV. Evaluation of the Sentence Method</td>
<td>339</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XVI. Assigned Numerical Values of the Sentence Method</td>
<td>340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XVII. Evaluation of the Story Method</td>
<td>342</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XVIII. Assigned Numerical Values of the Story Method</td>
<td>343</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Association of Meaning to Symbols

It is difficult to imagine a common task more exacting and involved than that of reading, even assuming that vision is normal. How can a collection of symbols, static and formal themselves, create dynamic thought in the mind of the child?

Symbols themselves have no meaning. Most young children believe that writing or print has some mysterious or independent meaning of its own. This idea is illustrated by the following occurrence, rather typical of pre-school children. Ann, a five-year-old with a brother just learning to read and write, was much interested in her brother's school activities. Much of her dramatic play, imitative in character, centered about school. One evening, as her brother was writing a letter to a sick schoolmate, Ann busily covered a sheet of paper with penciled scrawls. As her brother completed his letter, Ann ended her composition, also. After the brother had read his letter aloud, Ann took her "writing" to her father. "Read this, Daddy," she asked, "and tell me what it says."

In regard to this same idea Stuart Chase has written, "I find it difficult to believe that words have no meaning in themselves, hard as I try. Habits of a life time are not lightly thrown aside."[27]

---

an 'even front' is wasting the one part of school work that is capable of being individualized. Class work must move on an even front. This failure to use the opportunity for individual work is one reason for the large percentage of failures, especially in the lower grades. When the work is individual, the slow child can do a piece of work over and over until he can do it without help. In the case of a vocabulary unit, for example, after he has done it he tips the words off the sheet, mixes them up, and tries, as far as he can, to do it without the dictionary. When he can do it without the dictionary, he proves it by putting the dictionary in his desk, and then doing it for credit under observation.51

The description McDade gives of a period of individual work is enough to smooth away the worry-lines around the eyes of many a harassed teacher. "When the work is going properly," he explains, "every child is in his seat and absorbed in his own work, the room is quiet, and there is no confusion. The teacher must give time to supervision, in view of the importance of the work. If the child has made mistakes, the teacher or a capable pupil, indicate the wrong responses and leave the worker to do the job correctly."52

To escape time consuming "busy work" the materials used in the Non-Oral Method should be self-administering in form and prepared for easy access in a vertical file. Teachers using the method must plan to collect and devise abundant workable materials of adequate range and difficulty, and work out a complete installation of the individualized procedures.

51 Ibid., p. 15.  
52 Ibid.
The role of phonics in non-oral reading. McDade urges that phonics or any phonetic procedures should be strictly avoided. He declares that it is not an adequate defense to say that phonic or phonetic work prepares the child to get better meaning at some future time. The use of such word study as part of the beginning method turns the child's attention away from meaning at the most significant time, when long lasting habits are being formed. To quote McDade, "Thus, it shatters the child's earliest reading perceptions into a chaos of meaningless fragments, so numerous as to exceed many times over the twenty-six of the old alphabet method."^53

The final argument against the use of phonics in the Non-Oral Method of teaching reading is an important one and had better be presented in the words of the plan's chief designer. In the following statement, McDade is apparently using the term "phonetics" to include methods of teaching reading by sounds - a process called "phonics" - as well as the science of sounds of symbols, frequently called "phonetics."

Phonetics may well be useful to older children as a means of dealing with an occasional puzzling word, if their habit of reading for meaning is already well established, but at the beginning the effect on the child's reading can be only harmful. Even the beginnings of reading can not be taught to the child alone. Inexorably, two other things are being taught with the phonetics. One is preoccupation with the meaningless

^53 Ibid., p. 9.
constituents of single printed words, and in the case of at least some children the habit of finding a kind of satisfaction in the trick of combining them into spoken words, a habit of piece-meal reading that diverts their attention from meanings, and thus may be harmful for life. Another, and a natural consequence of the first, is that the pupils are having their first experience of reading, and are not finding in it a sense of release and adventure. If it is desirable that children should love to read, and that libraries should be used more freely and intelligently, every reader's first experience in reading should be made meaningful and consequently pleasurable.\footnote{Ibid., pp. 9-10.}

The use of books in the Non-Oral Method. In this method teachers do not begin reading instruction by placing a book in each child's hand. McDade declares:

The book ties the child down at the critical time when he needs to learn the meanings of print. The referents (the things the printed words refer to) are out there in the room, so the pupil should be free to move out there, touch the objects, handle them, and act out the meanings of the words he reads. Then he more than just knows meanings; he actually experiences them.\footnote{James E. McDade, "Non-Oral Helps," No. 1, February, 1946 (mimeograph material).}

The views of McDade concerning basal text in reading are of interest to every first-grade teacher, regardless of the method of beginning reading which is used. He sets forth his findings as follows:

The usual plan of preparing the children for some basal text is likely to be definitely harmful for the reason that this conception of beginning reading stems from the traditional oral-reading
procedure. The book prepared for is almost certain to be an oral reader, and that fact forces the preparation, the vocabulary, and the oral reading pattern. The class reading situation in which all the pupils have the same book open at the same page is so artificial as to be educationally sterile, and can have no place in beginning non-oral reading. 56

According to the plan as developed by McDade, some of the beginners will acquire a sufficient reading vocabulary in a few weeks to enable them to find in books ideas they can understand. This is greatly facilitated, of course, by the presence of abundant easy reading material in the library corner. As they gain power in visual perception of a printed vocabulary, children enjoy quiet reading in books and find these materials strengthening their individual and group work. One of the most powerful stimulants of the drive to improve reading ability is the child’s discovery that he can read in books.

Writing begins with reading. Writing is learned as a process coordinated with reading. McDade declares, "Non-oral reading is one half of a complete language, of which the other half is writing or printing. This is the reason for having pupils learn writing and reading together, as the two-year old learns together the two phases of oral language, speaking and comprehending speech." 57

56 McDade, Next Steps in Non-Oral Reading, p. 17.
In the first vocabulary work, to promote interest in writing, the teacher may use word cards, with letters at least two inches tall, and with a small picture at the end to illustrate meaning. Opportunity is provided for the child to write these words. As words are learned, pictures may be pasted on the backs of the card for checking, rather than on the front. With the aid of an assortment of picture-word cards, the child can very soon write on the chalkboard any word he wishes; with a clear awareness of its meaning gained from the pictures. If there is a corresponding file of picture-cards without words, other children can demonstrate their ability to read words and phrases from the chalkboard by picking out the correct pictures. Thus, these exercises are not mere practice, but function as communication. Through such experiences as these, writing and reading constitute a two-way street, with children expressing ideas in print as well as gaining them from print. McDade cautions that "There should be no writing of words for mere practice, which would be a violation of the principle that the use of printed words apart from their meanings either in writing or reading has the effect of denuding them of meaning."\(^{58}\)

\(^{58}\) McDade, *Next Steps in Non-Oral Reading*, p. 18.
Using the Non-Oral Method in a Classroom Situation

(The teacher calls the children to the reading class by holding up a card that says, Come to the class. After the children are seated their attention is directed to a card that says:)

Open your books.
Read the story,
The Boy and His Boat.

(The children read silently. The teacher watches closely so that no one moves his lips. Sally raises her hand, which indicates she does not know a word. Miss Silenton goes to her, looks at the word indicated by the child. Then, she writes the word on a card and directs the child to the picture dictionary and watches as Sally matches the word with the proper picture.)

(Billy then raises his hand. The teacher looks at the word, then closes the child's book.)

Miss Silenton:  "Billy, do you have a toy boat?"
Billy:  "Yes, Miss Silenton."
Miss Silenton:  "What does your boat do?"
Billy:  "It goes in water."
Miss Silenton:  "When a boat goes in water, what do we say it does?"
Billy:  "Sail."
Miss Silenton:  "Yes, now do you know the word?"
Billy:  "Yes."  (He opens his book and continues to read.)

(Finally the teacher sounds a bell and holds before the children a card which says, "Close your books." She then gives to each child two cards, one on which is written the word "Yes," on the other the word, "No.")
(She then holds up a card which says, "Billy, the boat is red." Billy responds by holding up his "No" card as the boat in the story is blue.)

(As quickly as possible the teacher flashes the following sentences):

The boat was blue.
Baby was funny.
The boat ran.
The boat sailed.
The boat was in the water.
The boat was on the water.
The boat was under the water.

(Each child is called on by the teacher displaying a word-card on which is written his name. If the child is unable to answer the statement, he is referred to the picture dictionary, watches another child dramatize the answer, or a discussion of the situation after all printed material is out of sight.)

(Finally the teacher prints, "Give Charles your book.")

(The children do.)

(Then, the command is printed: Go to your seat.)

Advantages of the Non-Oral Method

A critical analysis of the Non-Oral Method approach to beginning reading shows that such a method has the following advantages: (1) meaning is likely to be assured, (2) provision is made for individual differences, and (3) comprehension is speeded and increased.

The Non-Oral Method is likely to assure meaning. Learning to read implies more than the mere pronunciation of words. Children can learn to pronounce words when taught reading by either the Look-and-Say or Phonetic methods through
imitation without an understanding of the meanings conveyed. Print does not suggest meanings or ideas to the reader. However, if the child must dramatize the action demanded by the word or match the word to its corresponding picture, it is almost a sure sign that he understands the meaning of the word. Anderson and Dearborn support this opinion.

Action sentences and dramatization are always good, as giving meaning to the printed symbols. Oral discussions preceding the reading lesson, as in McDade's method, are an excellent means of preparing the child for the vocabulary of a story.\(^\text{59}\)

Thus, the non-oral approach to teaching reading reassures the development of word meanings through its devices of dramatics, pictures, and discussions.

**Provision made for individual differences.** The use of factual materials, as suggested in the silent reading approach, promotes recognition of individual instruction. Children can progress according to their ability rather than be forced into reading situations which are too difficult or which cause them to experience failure.

Teachers, who insist on having all children do the same work at the same time, are making a serious mistake. Work should be geared to individual differences so each child in the room is assured progress in learning. Individual progress is lost if all seatwork is the same and expected to

\(^{59}\text{Anderson and Dearborn, op. cit., pp. 173-174.}\)
be finished at the same time. In individual work, as suggested by the Non-Oral Method, the child is to practice until he masters the assignment. As he works alone he is not embarrassed because Joe and Bill are not doing the exact task he is. He learns to compete with himself and by so doing is consistently gaining a vocabulary and learning to read.

Comprehension is speeded and increased through direction of all meanings into non-oral channels of thought. Hildreth has declared:

A skilled silent reader usually has difficulty in oral reading because he is accustomed to sweeping his eyes more swiftly across the page than comprehensible oral reading permits - the reader cannot enunciate aloud as rapidly as his eyes can perceive the printed or written material. A gifted child said, "I can read to myself fine, but I get the words wrong if I read out loud." The oral reader tends to examine the symbols in greater detail than the silent reader. He takes time to articulate sounds which he does not need for comprehension. His articulation of every word he reads may actually get in the way of comprehension.

It is a well established fact that there are more fixations, more regressive, and longer pauses in oral reading than in silent reading. The cause of this is that the rate of oral reading is reduced to the rate with which the individual can call words. In the child's endeavor to read orally without error, he may become so preoccupied with the articulation of the words that meaning is not considered. In

---

60 Gertrude Hildreth, Learning the Three R's (Revised edition; Minneapolis: Educational Publishers, Inc., 1947), pp. 139-140.
methods which stress the silent reading approach, the child is placed in genuine situations which provide meanings. This eliminates a weakness of oral methods of beginning reading - their dependence on spoken words to convey meanings. Thus, with attention directed to meaning comprehension is speeded and increased.

Limitations of the Non-Oral Method

It is possible to teach reading without involving the spoken word. This is well shown by the reading ability of certain deaf individuals. Printed symbols are merely a visual representative of speech sounds and speech sounds in turn are vocal tones assigned to represent objects. Objects, of course, can be presented by means of dramatization and pictures. Thus, children can get meanings through dramatic presentations and pictures as well as from spoken words. However, such a method of teaching reading to "normal" children has certain disadvantages. The major limitations appear to be: (1) all words are not easily depicted, (2) the silent reading approach may not eliminate "inner speech," (3) lack of an adequate supply of materials, and (4) failure to take advantage of the past language experiences of children.

All words are not easily depicted. Many of the words in the English language can neither be dramatized nor pictured for the child. Words such as a, an, the, than, and
Previous experiences in themselves are inadequate to furnish total meaning. As the symbols themselves do not contain meaning it has been assumed by many that meanings develop from within the individual. The symbols are merely the stimuli which evoke the responses which are closely conditioned by previous experiences. The idea that meaning is in the experience and intelligence of the reader is illustrated in an unusual fashion by the case of a young physician's response to a dinner invitation. A kindly matron, having invited the newly-established physician to a dinner party, received in reply a totally illegible note. "I must know whether Dr. Brown has accepted or rejected my invitation, before I invite a dinner partner for him," she explained to her husband.

"Take Dr. Brown's note to Green, the druggist," he suggested. "Those pharmacists can always read a doctor's handwriting, no matter how much of a scrawl it is."

Appreciative of any suggestions which would save her embarrassment of admitting to the physician that she could not read his writing, the would-be hostess took the note to the druggist.

The pharmacist, in reply to the request, "Will you read this for me?" studied the paper, answered, "Just a few moments, Ma'am," and went into a rear room of the drug store.

---

many others are difficult to teach by the silent reading approach as they do not blend to dramatic presentation or to picturesque design, but demand an understanding of the relationship of words in a sentence for the interpretation of idea or ideas expressed. This concept is upheld by Anderson and Dearborn, who have declared: "... not all words can be easily depicted in pictures, which is to say nothing about the difficulty of portraying relationships between words."61

A single picture can also be interpreted in many ways by children. A picture of Spot may be called dog, puppy, or Butch depending upon the child's background and past language experiences. In the Non-Oral Method there is little, if any, control of the child's response; however, in the Look-and-Say Method the child's response pattern is "set" for he gives what he has heard.

In regards to the use of pictures as a teaching device Newmayer has offered this warning:

In beginning word recognition, and using of visual aids like pictures, they should contain only the object being taught. If the word is "baby," the picture should be only a baby and not a dog clinging to the child's dress. The visual discernment of a beginner is readily upset by complex pictures. Too many visual impulses, or served too rapidly, may distract even the matured individual.62

61 Anderson and Dearborn, op. cit., p. 151.

The above quotation calls attention to the fact that picture materials needed for teaching beginning reading by the Non-Oral Method should be selected most carefully or supplied by firms specializing in such equipment.

The Non-Oral Method may not eliminate "inner speech." The presentation of words by means of dramatization and pictures does not automatically rule out vocalization or "inner speech." The child may say the name of the action or picture which is the cue of the word. Research shows that deaf-mutes fall back on some substitution for speech when it comes to such "mental" activities as reading.63

The encouraging of silent reading techniques may cause children to hide or suppress their tendency to react verbally to printed symbols. Suppression, because of fear or embarrassment, of overt thinking is well illustrated by children when learning addition and subtraction combinations. Close observation of such children will show slight muscular movements of the fingers, tongue movement, or even toe wiggling. This is similar to a sub-vocal response in reading which is shown by movements of the "Adams-apple" when reading silently.

The child's use of "inner speech" techniques is most difficult to determine. A simple test easily administrable

by the teacher, has not yet been developed for determining whether or not a child is acquiring the non-oral reading skill and is practicing it.

**Lack of an adequate supply of materials.** Individualized seatwork to provide opportunities for vocabulary building, word study, and meaningful silent reading demands abundant amounts of individual materials. In regard to such a supply of materials Buswell has stated:

The materials . . . had to be constructed by the teachers, since no ready-made supply was available. . . . The children participated in the preparation of much of the material needed, thereby getting training in art, handwriting, and composition, as well as in reading. 64

Unless the teacher gives much time and consideration to the selection and preparation of the reading materials, the materials developed may be nothing more than a coloring, cutting, or pasting activity, such as, an outline picture of an apple, ball, cat, and dog, with the words red, green, black, and brown beside them. The reading knowledge demanded is the ten seconds necessary to identify the drawings and to recognize the words. Teachers often prepare such activities due to crowded classrooms, lack of time, or the necessary insight and creativity demanded by the Non-Oral Method.

Failure to take advantage of the past language experiences. As most children enter school with a well developed speaking vocabulary, it would appear feasible that beginning reading instruction should attempt to capitalize on this ability, to determine interest patterns, past experiences, and word meanings. These interests, experiences, and meanings can serve as a focal center in an effort to help the child associate the printed symbols with meanings. Learning to read should be a facet of the child's total language development.

The Present Status of the Non-Oral Method

A study of the information, presented by the five judges consulted, indicates that in their opinion the Non-Oral Method of teaching reading is an inferior method when rated according to the established criteria. It was their belief that this method did not provide for most adequately or adequately any facet of a balanced reading method. According to the ratings provided there was also complete agreement that the Non-Oral Method provided for but not adequately the following characteristics:

1. Provision for study of the general configuration of words.
2. Provision for study of the striking characteristics of words.

---

65 Appendix, pp. 569-570.
3. Provision for the use of picture clues.
4. Provision for the comprehension of material.
5. Provision for interpretation of material.
7. Provision for speed determined by purpose.
8. Provision for developing depth of word meaning.
9. Emphases from the beginning on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to thoughtful, meaningful interpretation.
10. Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content.
11. Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading.
12. Provision for individual differences in ability, needs, and interest.
13. Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials.
14. Provision for continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading.

The ratings also indicate that all the judges believed that no provision was made for the following characteristics:

1. The manner in which children learn.
2. Provision for the study of phonetic analysis and syllabification.
3. Provision for oral reading.
4. Provision for the development of readiness for reading.
5. Provision for postponement of reading until readiness has been developed.

66 Appendix, p. 569.
6. Provision for a planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs.

Disagreement was expressed concerning the degree to which provision was made for:

1. Evaluation of material.
2. Drawing conclusions.
3. Developing permanent interest in reading.
4. The correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading.

The following table shows the differences as expressed by the judges regarding the degree which the method provided for (1) evaluation of material, (2) drawing conclusions, (3) the development of permanent interest in reading, and (4) the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading.

**TABLE XIX**

CHARACTERISTICS AND PATTERN OF DISAGREEMENT CONCERNING FACETS OF THE NON-ORAL METHOD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics</th>
<th>Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>4 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>4 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>4 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>4 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*(3) most satisfactory; (2) satisfactory; (1) provided for but in an unsatisfactory manner; (0) not provided for.*
Section IV

Research Findings Regarding the Silent Reading Approach to Reading Instruction

The silent reading approach to reading instruction is represented by three major reading methods: the Silent Reading Method, the Picture Story Method, and the Non-Oral Method. These methods attempted (1) to develop ability in effective rapid reading, (2) to develop ability to comprehend quickly and accurately, and (3) to eliminate articulation or the habit of "inner speech."

In view of a decided need for competent advice and assistance in the evaluation of the effectiveness of the silent reading approach to beginning reading instruction, the following research findings are provided to foster objective thinking.

Speed in Silent Reading

Results of investigation have proven conclusively that children and adults can read more rapidly silently than orally. Many adults read from three to five times more rapidly silently than they do orally. The greater speed of silent reading is explained by the fact that, in oral reading each word must be pronounced audibly. It is a physical impossibility to read faster than the vocal organs can say

\[67\text{Huey, op. cit., p. 175.}\]
the words. In silent reading the eyes may sweep along unimpeded by vocalization.

Huey determined that: "The average rate of the twenty students when reading silently was 5.63 words per second at their ordinary speed and 8.21 at their maximal, while in reading aloud they averaged 3.55 words per second at their ordinary speed and 4.58 at their maximal." This finding was also supported by the findings of Pintner and Gilliland and Schmidt.

Vocalization during silent reading also has a tendency to retard rate. In a study using adults Quantz concluded that lip reading in any degree retards the rate of reading and the stronger the tendency, the slower the rate. This study would indicate that silent reading is faster than oral reading and that habits of "inner speech" or subvocalization should be eliminated.

---

68 Ibid.
It was further shown by Swanson and Fairbanks that poor silent readers were also poor oral readers. Swanson's subjects were a group of poor silent readers from among college freshmen. These subjects turned out to be extremely poor oral readers. The error categories in order of frequency of occurrence of errors, were substitutions, repetitions, omissions, insertions, mispronunciations, and miscellaneous.

Fairbanks used both a group of good and poor silent readers from a college freshman class. His results show that good silent readers were found to make fewer oral reading errors than the poor silent readers.

Comprehension

It is frequently assumed that oral reading contributes more to understanding of content than silent reading. It is the purpose of this section to summarize the results of a few studies which deal specifically with the relationship between speed and comprehension.


A number of studies, some very early, demonstrated that on the whole silent reading results in better comprehension. This conclusion results from the fact that in silent reading it is not necessary for the reader to pay attention to the mechanics of oral reading such as, voice control, audience response, and the like. Hence, he can concentrate entirely upon meanings.

Cyrus D. Mead, Professor at the University of Cincinnati, conducted an experiment to evaluate the percentage of possible points remembered during silent and oral reading. For his experiment Dr. Mead used five groups of sixth-grade children. These children were provided with material which consisted of stories from "Alice in Wonderland." Six tests of two minutes each were given to the pupils of the five sixth grades to evaluate the number of facts remembered after silent and oral reading. The silent reading tests were given as group tests; while the oral reading tests were administered as individual tests. The directions for the silent reading tests were - begin, stop, and write all you can remember. In order that the material read for each test

---


75 Cyrus D. Mead, "Silent Versus Oral Reading with One Hundred Sixth-Grade Children," The Journal of Educational Psychology, VI (June, 1915), 345-347.
Returning in a few minutes, the druggist placed a small brown bottle on the counter. "That will be two dollars, please," he said in his usual professional voice.

Meanings depend upon experiences, organization and manipulation of concepts. Meanings in reading do not come from the printed symbols nor entirely from experiences of the individual, but also from the reader's ability to recall and manipulate the concepts he possesses. To read adequately one must grasp the meanings intended by the writer. The written or printed symbols serve as cues to the reader who must organize an understanding of what is intended. The reader recognizes the symbols, appraises the ideas, integrates them into his previous knowledge, and applies them to the solution of the problem to which the ideas are pertinent. That one has to learn to get ideas from reading, as well as learn to recognize printed symbols is illustrated by the story of the lady who put on her coat to leave the theater after the first act. When asked by her host why she was leaving, since she obviously enjoyed the play, she replied, "Why? Just read the program. It says here. 'Act II, same as Act I.'"

Most of what we learn comes to us through vision which starts in the eyes, and develops as interpretation, evaluation, manipulation and summarization takes place. Paul McKee has stated:
would not become isolated content and to insure story continuity, the teacher read to the class the story between the points of the slowest and most rapid reader of the previous test. The oral reading test was designed so that each child read separately, the number of lines being noted by the teacher. The children then departed to another room to write the facts remembered.

The statistical data was reported in class averages. Thus, the significance of individual rate differences in the two methods were not taken into consideration. From this study Dr. Mead reported the following summary:

From the results with these five classes we are more convinced than ever that our schools devote altogether too much time to oral reading and too little to silent. Not only does the pupil as a rule show us he can gather more thoughts by the silent than by the oral, but by too much oral work we are fixing bad habits of articulation which will prove a hindrance in after life when it comes to silent reading.76

Another similar study was made by Gilliland.77 In his study fifty college students were asked to read a number of paragraphs and then to reproduce the content in writing. Directions were given to read rapidly, at a normal rate, and slowly. The comprehensive score of each test was the sum of ideas reproduced. The scores obtained in this study

76Ibid., p. 345.

showed that, on the average, the reader secured more ideas from a paragraph when reading slowly than when reading rapidly; however, when the results were interpreted in the number of ideas per second, the readers were more effective when reading rapidly than when reading slowly. In regard to this study, W. S. Gray raises the question: "Is accuracy in interpreting a given passage at a single reading or the total number of ideas gained during a given unit of time the more valid index of comprehension in investigations of the relation between speed and comprehension?" This appears a valid question and should be given consideration.

In an experiment which involved extreme groups of good and poor silent readers, selected from a college population, Rogers found that the good readers read with 87 per cent accuracy both silently and orally; while the poor readers obtained only 60 per cent accuracy in silent reading and 58 per cent accuracy in oral reading. This study not only provides data to support the hypothesis that rapid readers comprehend better but also indicates that poor readers may comprehend more when reading silently. Although the difference in accuracy scores of poor readers in silent and oral

---


reading is not significant for a conclusion but does detect
a need for further study.

Elimination of Articulation

Although one of the basic assumptions of the Non-Oral
Method is that such a method eliminates inner speech, the
complete elimination of articulation or "inner speech" is
doubtful. Jacobson's experiment in which the action-
potential technique was used indicates that implicit speech
unquestionably accompanies other acts of verbal thinking.
Thus, Dearborn and Anderson reason that "the results ought to
be the same for silent reading, which can be classed as a type
of verbal thinking although the proof is not conclusive." 81

Max supported the findings of Jacobson by his experi­
ments with deaf mutes. The tests used by Max included adding,
multiplying and dividing mentally; reading and selecting
appropriate sentences in multiple-choice tests. Evidence of
motor responses was recorded by means of an action-potential

80 Edmound Jacobson, "The Electro Physiology of Mental
Activities," American Journal of Psychology, XLIV (October,
1932), 677-694.

81 Anderson and Dearborn, op. cit., pp. 160-161.

82 Louis William Max, "Experimental Study of the Motor
Theory of Consciousness: IV. Action - Current Responses in
the Deaf During Awakening, Kinaesthetic Imagery and Abstract
technique, which used twin circuits to the right and left arm of the subject. Data provided by this study show that in 86 per cent of tests 18 deaf mutes recorded hand movement; while 31 per cent of 16 normal controls reacted in a like manner. These findings would indicate that deaf mutes do their abstract thinking with their hands; while some of the normal controls do mental arithmetic with the aid of their hands.

For eliminating the habit of inner speech Pintner and Secord recommended the use of other vocal activities. Such methods would appear unnecessary if Hollingworth's assumption of cue-reduction is accepted. Cue-reduction is not accomplished by substituting another activity, but through practice by wide reading of easy, interesting materials.

Studies Comparing the Achievements of Silent Reading Methods

An experiment to determine the value of two different reading methods was conducted by Leah K. Dice. This was a

---


controlled experiment comparing a direct approach (rather similar to the Non-Oral Method developed by McDade) with the typical indirect or preparatory approach. In the direct approach, reading was presented as direct activity, which associated meanings with the corresponding printed symbol, in contrast with the indirect method, which is characterized by extensive oral conversation and general preparation for reading.

Using ten first grade groups with matched controls statistical data were provided which compared the effectiveness of the two methods. The findings indicated that the direct method is slightly superior to the indirect preparatory approach in developing skill in word recognition of vocabulary of reading tests and of general primary reading materials; that it is significantly superior in developing ability to comprehend and interpret sentences; and that children taught by the direct approach were more competent in attacking new words.

From 1935 to 1945 the Chicago public schools carried on an unusual and significant experiment with the Non-Oral Method of teaching beginning reading. The experiment is noteworthy for the method employed, the scope, and the length of time over which the administration maintained experimental conditions.
This experiment is reported in detail by G. T. Buswell in his report, "Non-Oral Reading: A Study of Its Use in the Chicago Public Schools." From data supplied by McDade's experiment Buswell concluded:

1. The program of oral reading would suffer no way by being postponed until effective silent-reading habits are established. Most of the functional purposes of oral reading, except those of showing off, are not needed until the child leaves the primary grades. (p. 39)

2. Phonics can be related to oral language rather than to reading without any loss and probably with considerable gain. (p. 42)

3. There was more lip reading seen in the non-ororal group than "should be expected in view of the fact that the suppression of vocalization is one of the crucial factors in this method." (p. 21)

Harris\(^88\) says in reference to the favorable results reported from Buswell's careful comparisons: "One may well question whether the Non-Oral Method works because of, or in spite of, its non-ororal provisions." He points out that many features of the non-ororal procedure, such as extensive use of individualized seatwork, interesting games, and many motor activities, are valuable in themselves and may be responsible for much of the good results obtained by the total method, rather than the non-ororal aspect of the method. Harris strongly questions the assumption that, if the child is

---

\(^{87}\)Buswell, "Non-Oral Reading: A Study of Its Use in the Chicago Public Schools," \textit{op. cit.}

\(^{88}\)Harris, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 74.
prevented from developing oral responses to printed stimuli, he develops a direct meaningful response to written words without any need for subvocal speech. He argues the likelihood that most children, if prohibited from saying words out loud while reading, simply repeat the words mentally (to themselves). It is further pointed out that, if the theory is carried to its logical conclusion, deaf mutes should have an advantage over children of normal learning reading. This overstates the objection of course, since normal children have the advantages of the rich meanings already built up through spoken language, as well as oral communication all day at school except during the reading period.

Section V

The Intrinsic Method

The "Intrinsic Method" includes a rather original treatment of the ever-present problem of what to do with phonics. The creator of this method endeavored to combine the advantages of the Word Method, the Sentence Method, and the emphasis on meaning contained in the Story Method with the essentials of phonics.

The system, as devised by Gates, utilizes phonics as an intrinsic part of silent-reading procedures. In the Intrinsic Method the use of phonetic elements and phonic exercises are blended continually with a sight-recognition of
words and silent-reading for comprehension, thus the name Intrinsic Method for Gates' system.

Other aims of the Intrinsic Method are to prevent children's tendency to confuse words, to assist in attracting attention to common elements in words, to develop habits of using both word form clues and context-meaning clues in perception, pronunciation, and comprehension.

Historical Development

As a result of careful analysis of the shortcomings of the phonic and other artificial forms of word analysis, Gates concluded that in beginning reading children do not learn first by word parts or sounds, but, rather by larger units of meaning such as, words, phrases, and sentences. Making a study of children's work in learning to read through nursery rhymes, phrase-cards, sentence-cards with pictures, and other devices, Gates devised a method of teaching beginning reading which he claims avoids the weaknesses of completely analytical approaches.

Gates explained this system of teaching reading in his book, *New Methods in Primary Reading*, published by Teachers College, Columbia University in 1928. The author has also used the terms work-play method or contextual method to describe his suggested reading method.
This method of teaching beginning reading is based upon extensive investigations conducted by Gates which began in 1918. These investigations provided data which support the belief that:

1. The [reading] course should provide materials in which the vocabulary burden is light enough to enable the pupils to master the recognition of new words adequately.

2. The [reading] course should develop the reading vocabulary by means of abundant reading of senseful material, instead of by means of phonetic drills and other types of isolated word study.

3. The [reading] course should provide an abundance of reading material in which the pupil is unhampered by difficulties in word recognition, so that the various habits essential to fluent, accurate, full, and enjoyable comprehension may be developed.

4. The [reading] course should contain an abundance of materials of the type, or containing the elements, found to make a strong appeal to pupils' interest.

5. The [reading] course should not be restricted to mere story reading or any other one type.

6. The [reading] course should make provision for using each type of material in the way in which it proves to be most useful and interesting.

7. The [reading] course should not treat reading as an activity to be isolated from other enterprises.

8. The [reading] course should not consist of a mere aggregation of disconnected activities.

---

Thus, Gates concluded that training for comprehension and word mastery should not be separated into two projects but be developed as a uniformed system. Comprehension is of primary importance in reading, and skills in word mastery are significant only as they function to facilitate understanding. The mechanical tools should be developed in meaningful activities.

Description of the Intrinsic Method

The Intrinsic Method appears to be a composite method which makes use of Phonic, Word, Sentence, and Story methods of teaching reading. The work begins with a few words which may be readily arranged into phrases, sentences, and paragraphs. The larger units are introduced as soon as the pupil is able to handle them without undue difficulty and confusion. There is no necessity for a longer period devoted exclusively to reading words. "After the pupil has learned a few words - on the third day . . . he is able without much difficulty to read phrases and sentences composed of these words. In the first week he may be introduced to all types of reading matter - words, phrases, sentences, paragraphs, stories, and other compositions . . . it is in this sense not a word, sentence, or story method exclusively but a composite of these."\(^{90}\)

Thus you read, not only with your eyes, but with your experiences, with what you have seen, heard, done, tasted, smelled, felt, and with what has happened to you; with your emotions, including your hopes and fears, your likes and dislikes, with your prejudices and your ideals, with your observations and the conclusions you have drawn from them.

Learning Visual Word Forms

How does a child associate a meaning with the appropriate symbol? A principal law often referred to as The Law of Association declares that when two stimuli operate to produce responses that are contiguous in the child's experience, these responses may become connected with the result that on future occasions the presence of one will arouse the other. The well-known experiments by Pavlov and the "drooling dog" illustrate this principle. In learning to read, the child is directed to make an association between the visual and the known auditory stimuli. For example, the child is shown the printed symbol cat and at the same time it is pronounced. After a number of repetitions the child will think the word cat, and form a mental picture of it when he sees the visual symbol, cat. The material for the appropriate mental pictures is drawn from the child's previous experiences. Thus, learning to read is learning to form connections between visual and oral symbols and certain meanings. To gather meanings

The basic assumptions underlying the Intrinsic Method. The basic assumption underlying this method, according to its originator, is that the child learns to read by reading and by participating in activities directly associated with reading, rather than through any variety of experiences that are relatively unrelated to that process. In other words, the attitudes, comprehensive habits, and skills necessary to successful reading are directly involved - are intrinsic - in the reading activities through which the child is guided.

A second assumption underlying the Intrinsic Method of teaching beginning reading is that: "the pupil should, if possible receive his training in recognizing common word elements, in seeing significant similarities and differences, in utilizing these clues as a means toward perceiving unfamiliar words, not during a special period and with special materials and drills but during the process of normal reading work."\textsuperscript{91}

Materials of instruction. The materials according to Gates\textsuperscript{92} consist of "a number of exercises arranged wholly to stimulate reading, to secure the thought, and a number arranged not only to emphasize comprehension but also to demand accurate discrimination of words and phrases." The practice exercises are of various types, including matching, true-false, completion, selection, and direction following.

\textsuperscript{91}Ibid., p. 40. \textsuperscript{92}Ibid., p. 51.
The materials developed are similar to the comprehension exercises (seatwork of the Story Method). Special words, phrases, and sentences were selected and arranged so as to require the child to make choices from words and phrases, which were much alike in appearance. The close similarity forces the child to identify differences as a basis for discriminating and making choices. In many cases the choice was to be made on the basis of phonetic elements.

The materials necessary for teaching beginners to read by the Intrinsic Method are: word-picture cards for introducing the first few new words, a word-picture dictionary containing the words used during the first half-year period, a workbook containing exercises to promote comprehension and word-attack techniques, basal readers, unit books, and supplementary books.

The "word-picture cards" are used to develop word meaning and ability to use the dictionary. On one side of the card is the printed word and on the other a picture corresponding to the printed symbol. The picture serves as a clue to the meaning of the word. These cards may be used in the following manner. To match object to object, to match object to word, and to match word to word. They also may serve as material for such games as: Getting the Mail, Going to Jerusalem, Fish Pond, Spinning Game, etc.
The "Word-Picture Dictionary" aids the child in learning new words, is a means of helping him remember words previously taught, and is material for teaching initial letters.

The "Work-Book" consists of a series of exercises, which aid in developing comprehension and word mastery skills, as well as objective tests to aid in evaluating the child's reading progress. The objective of such exercise material is to "remove the frequent hesitations and inhibitions in reading caused by the difficulty which a pupil would encounter in attacking reading matter containing new words, phrases, and context without some form of preparation for it."^93

The "Reading Text Book" provides interesting and meaningful materials for silent and oral reading. All words used in the "Reading Text Books" have been learned through exercises provided in the Work Book, thus the reading of Text Book material is fluent and easily understood by the child. The "Reading Text Book" is studied alternately with the "Work Book" exercises.

"Unit Books" are provided at each of the primary levels. Each unit book is a complete story to be introduced at a critical point in the "Basal Reader." As these books contain a few new words the reading content is easy, and the child gains confidence as he reads.

93Ibid., p. 207.
After the child has studied the Basal Reader, "Supplementary Books" are introduced. These are similarly free of vocabulary and other difficulties. The purposes of the supplementary books are (1) to provide easy enjoyable reading material and (2) to broaden and enrich areas of interest developed in the Basal Readers.

Suggested use of materials. Gates has suggested three procedures by which the reading materials may be presented. Outlined, these procedures are:

Method One
1. Stating the topic or purpose of the exercise.
2. Silent reading of the selection.
3. Silent reading and completion of the exercise.
4. Scoring the exercise.
5. Oral reading, discussion, dramatization, drawing, constructive activities, etc.
6. Remedial or additional instruction, if necessary.

Method Two
1. Stating the topic or purpose of the exercise.
2. Silent reading of the selection.
3. Silent reading and completion of exercises.
4. Discussion of selection.
5. Scoring of exercise.
6. Further discussion, dramatization, reading, etc.
7. Remedial or additional instruction, if necessary.

Method Three
1. Silent reading of selection.
2. Oral reading, discussion, etc., of selection.
3. Silent reading and completion of exercises.
4. Scoring and discussion of results.
5. Dramatizing further reading, artistic activities, etc.
6. Remedial or additional instruction, if necessary.

94 Gates, Interest and Ability in Reading, pp. 242-243.
Teaching procedures. Teachers who use the Intrinsic Method as their approach to beginning reading are largely dependent upon the sets of material especially prepared for this method. The first stage is use of the preparatory book or work book which is designed to develop such abilities and powers as eye-control, eye-hand coordination, ability to follow precise directions sequentially, and familiarity with the idea of communication from the printed page.

The next stage involves a pre-primer, a simple and very easy little book which contains pictures, word-pictures, matching games, picture-story episode matching, and other devices for utilizing a variety of responses in reading. The reading exercises involve drawing, crayoning, cutting, and pasting. Each word in the brief, simple stories has been previously introduced through the various preparatory exercises.

The work books also are used as a part of the method in the later stages of progress. The use of work books, while confining the teacher to a rather close adherence to printed materials provided, is said to promote highly individualized instruction. This individualized instruction might be achieved within the limits of the workbooks and reader texts by allowing mature children to read without completing all parts of the accompanying work-book exercises, by working privately with certain less-advanced children, by having the class divided into several reading groups, and by encouraging
the most capable children to help the less able. A few of the children might be guided in going ahead largely "on their own," as the materials are designed to be self-teaching to some extent.

The objectives of the workbooks are the developing of abilities of word discrimination and the building of increasingly useful sight vocabulary through practice exercises—such as circling the word, appearing in several sentences, which describes a picture (The ball is red. The ball rolls.); underline a designated word (The boy has a dog, doll, cat); et cetera.

Provision for phonics. Gates endeavors to make "training in word recognition an intrinsic aspect of 'thought-getting activities'" and to make this skill a "natural and necessary result" of the reading experiences. The prepared materials are arranged with the purpose of emphasizing the characteristics of word-forms and leading the child to "familiarity with the more common visual and phonetic elements." Through use of the materials, the young reader is supposed to develop gradually an insight into word-form structure. He gradually becomes more familiar with frequently-appearing syllables and phonograms such as at, in, ing, th, er, etc. and more capable of identifying them.

95 Gates, Reading for Public School Administrators, pp. 66-68.
Gates has stated ". . . now and then, the teacher should point out, for example, the common and distinctive features in bring, sing, thing, and ring; show how the first may be seen as composed of br and ing, how each of these has a definite sound value, and how each appears in other words." \(^{96}\)

**Follow-up activities.** Reading selections are arranged under a series of topics, such as "Familiar Animals," "Fairies and Elves," and "The Farm." After reading such a story as "Fairies and the Cook," the child is given a set of exercises to check the completeness and accuracy of his comprehension. Other purposes of the exercises are to encourage further thinking and discussion, and to provide motivation for re-reading the selection.

**Using the intrinsic method in a classroom situation.**

(The lesson as presented here represents the reading materials of the first unit, pages 1-4, of *Off We Go.* \(^{97}\) This unit consists of a picture story which tells of home experiences familiar to all children.)

(The children have already been instructed on how to handle and care for a book, and have had an opportunity to "leaf" through and enjoy the pictures.)

**Teacher:** "Today we have a story told in pictures. It begins on page one. Let's turn to page one.

(The teacher helps the children find the beginning page.)


Teacher: "What do you see in the picture? The boy's name is Jim. (She prints the name on the blackboard.) The girl's name is Judy. I will put her name on the blackboard, too. (She prints Judy on the board.) Listen to the names again. . . . Jim . . . Judy . . . They start alike in sound but do not end alike . . . Would you say them, Garry?"

Garry: "Jim . . . Judy."

Teacher: "Which one says Judy, Lita?"

(Lita goes to the blackboard and points to the word that says Judy.)

Teacher: "What pet do these children have? Rory?"

Rory: "A dog! I have one."

Donald: "I have one, too. His name is Trouble - 'cause Mother says that's all he is."

Teacher: "Yes, I have seen your dog, Donald . . . This dog's name is Tags. I will put the name of the dog on the blackboard. (Prints Tag.) Does it sound like Jim and Judy?"

Class: "No."

Teacher: "What meal is the family having? Bess?"

Bess: "Breakfast."

Teacher: "Why do you think it is breakfast?"

Bess: "'Cause they have eggs and I always have eggs for breakfast."

(Other children also tell why they think it is breakfast.)

Teacher: "I do, too . . . Turn to page 2. It follows page 1."

(This type of participation continues until the pages 1 through 14 have been discussed. There is an attempt made to help the children associate themselves with the characters portrayed in the pictures.)
(After this the children may tell the entire story again beginning on page one and following the pictures as they retell the story.)

(Through group discussion a simple text may be developed for the story. The text may be printed on the blackboard. A suitable story would be something similar to this):

This is breakfast.
Father says good-by.
Jim and Judy help Mother.
Mother and the children go to market. . .
Etc. 98

(The teacher reads this story to the class, demonstrating the correct left-to-right eye direction by guiding her hand under each line. She does not teach the children the words.)

Lesson 2

(The teacher has read to the children the story, "Fun at Happy Acres" by Barlow and Martinson.)

Teacher: "Open your Work Book to page 19. Look at the first picture and see what is shown. Now, look at the sentence. (She reads - This is a __________) Can anyone tell me what the new word is? . . . Sandy?"

Sandy: "Farm."

Teacher: "Now look at the picture again. It really shows a farm, doesn't it? This word means farm."

(The children discuss the picture.)

Teacher: "Now, let's look at the next exercise. Look at the picture. Who will read the sentence? . . . Yes, Tom."

Tom: "This is a car."

Teacher: "Yes, it reads This is a car. The picture tells us what the word is. Now look at the new words. (She prints farm and car on the board.) Which is car? Which is farm? . . . Ken, point to the word that says farm."

(Ken does so.)

98Ibid., p. 52.
Teacher: "Leonard, what is this word?"

Leonard: "Car."

Teacher: "Our next exercise is fun. It is the sentence picture game. Who can tell me how we play it?"

Stan: "We look at a picture and find the sentence that tells about it."

Teacher: "No, first we read the sentences and then find the picture." (She supervises to see that all children have the correct place and understand the directions.)

Exercises such as this continue on pages 20, 21, 22, and 23. The Teacher's Manual also suggests alternate preparatory activities and enrichment activities which may or may not be presented to the class.

Lesson 3

Teacher: "Boys and Girls, open your book to page 31. Look at the picture. It will tell something about the stories we are going to read. What do you think these stories will be about?"

Sadie: "Grandpa's farm."

Teacher: "Yes, I think they will be about the farm . . . Look at the picture and find all the animals that you can. . . . What animals do you see? Jack?"

Jack: "A cow."

Sandy: "A horse."

(The children continue to name the animals in the picture. As the children name the animals, the teacher writes their names on the blackboard.)

Teacher: "What other things do you see in the farm picture?"

(The children name the objects and the teacher lists them on the board.)
through reading it is necessary: (1) to recognize printed symbols quickly and accurately, (2) to recall familiar concepts, (3) frequently to combine familiar concepts to form new concepts, (4) to examine critically the new concept and to evaluate its implications, and (5) to reconstruct experiences in the light of the new concept.

**Beginning stage.** An early developmental stage of reading is the interpretation of objects. A small child is reading when he names all objects which have four legs, a head, and a tail, a dog. Later he is able to accurately label each four-legged animal as a cat, dog, cow, etc. and still later he is able to classify according to type.

**The second stage.** The beginning level of reading symbols starts in the interpretation of pictures. A child, who pats a picture and says, "pretty," is reading. At a later level the child recognizes pictures and interprets them in the light of his own experiences. A picture of a woman is read as his mother, while a picture of a dog becomes Butch, Ned, or whatever may be the name of his own dog. It is well to note that this personal interpretation is often carried over to printed symbols. The following story illustrates this fact. Sam, having heard a great deal about his new cousin Peter, wanted to see him, but never had, as a result of the distance between his and Peter's homes. Finally when Sam's mother told him Peter and his family were coming for a visit,
Teacher: "Who can read the title on page 31?"

(One child does and the lesson continues in this manner):

Teacher: "Who are in the picture?
Who will read the title?
Now let us all read the story silently.
Who will read the title again?
Who will read the first line?
Who will read the next two lines?
Who will read the last two lines?
What do you think they will do next?
Perhaps the next page will tell us. 99

(The other pages of the story are read in a similar manner. After the children read as far as page 35, the students are instructed in work activities found on pages 35-37 of the Work Book.)

Reading Program Based on the Intrinsic Method


It is claimed by the authors that in this reading program
1) the vocabulary progresses in difficulty through the grades,
2) readiness is developed at every level for every lesson,
and (3) a wealth of reading material is provided at every level.

The Macmillan Program

The basic materials at each grade level are: (1) The Preparatory Books, (2) The Macmillan Readers, (3) Supplementary

99Ibid., p. 83.
The Preparatory Books: The purpose of the Preparatory Books is to develop readiness for successful reading in the Basal Readers. It is claimed that the exercises presented in the Preparatory Books help the child solve reading problems in advance; thus letting the Basal Reader be a reading book rather than a study book.

Every new word in the readers in the first two grades is introduced, discussed, and studied in the Preparatory Book. These words are presented in sentences and each sentence is accompanied, whenever possible, with a picture. The sentence is then repeated in stories. The story is to be used as a base for other exercises and to provide opportunities for word recognition in content, development of word meaning, and evaluation of comprehension.

The tools of successful reading are introduced gradually. These books provide materials for such skills as phonetic skills, word recognition, word meanings, pronunciation, prefixes, suffixes, phonograms, syllables, vowel forms, continuous diagnosis, and appraisal.

The Macmillan Readers: The readers provide an opportunity for children to read for enjoyment as the skills necessary for easy reading have been introduced and studied. The selections in each Basal Reader are organized around certain
centers of interest. Thus, many kinds of reading materials—literary, informational, and biographical—are provided.

**Supplementary Readers:** In addition to the Basal Readers, this system of teaching reading provides a variety of supplementary reading materials. This includes a Supplementary Pre-Primer, at each level, a Supplementary Reader for each grade level, and a series of Unit Books.

**Unit Books:** Each "Unit Book" represents a complete story. Each is introduced at a designated point in the Basal Readers. These Unit Books contain few new words and thus encourage reading for fun. The Supplementary Readers follow the same plan, but are to be read by the children after the completion of the Basal Readers. These readers are intended to complement and enrich the information and stories of the Basal Readers.

**The Teacher's Manuals:** The authors provide teacher's manuals at each level which give specific suggestions for daily reading lessons and for enrichment activities related to the unit topics. Detailed plans are included in the Manual for teaching either with or without the Preparatory Book.

**Advantages of the Intrinsic Method**

A survey of literature dealing with descriptions, research findings, and basic assumptions underlying the Intrinsic Method provides the following list of advantages for this method:
1. Provides specific practice in such important reading skills as following directions, word recognition techniques and comprehension.

2. Provides for reading as a functional skill.

3. Provides children with greater independence from the teacher's spoken directions than do earlier "extrinsic" methods.

4. Provides teachers with materials which enable her to make rapid and almost continuous diagnosis of children's strength and weaknesses, since the reader applies the material read in filling out forms, writing words in blanks, etc.

5. Encourages self-appraisal of success and progress, since the child can readily determine which materials were filled in correctly or incorrectly.

6. Provides a means for incorporating, in the reading material, devices which may be useful in developing vocabulary, independence in word recognition, fluent reading, and habits of re-reading. These and other fundamental skills are usually sought through using supplementary "extrinsic" drills and exercises such as isolated word study, phonics, unmotivated rereading, formal oral reading, question-and-answer recitation on material read, and the like.

7. Provides a useful preparation for the types of study-reading "essential to enjoyable and productive work in arithmetic, history, and other subjects."

8. The intrinsic method, when used with materials especially designed for that method, enables the teacher to provide both "minimum essentials" and some freedom for individual creative work.

9. Eliminates or reduces the need to resort to oral reading as the only means of finding out how well a child can read and which words he recognizes and comprehends. That this is a desirable goal is obvious, as a result of studies of the transfer of training, which have made it clear that practice in oral reading often has a deleterious effect on silent reading.\(^{100}\)

\(^{100}\)Ibid., p. 33.
Disadvantages of the Intrinsic Method

The major disadvantage of the Intrinsic Method is that although the drill is intrinsic to the reading material, both the drill and the reading may be extrinsic to the child's own goals and interests.

Other obvious disadvantages presented by the Intrinsic Method are:

The Intrinsic Method lacks flexibility of instructions. A certain inflexibility is unavoidable in this method, since the checks on comprehension, practice exercises, etc. are "built in" the reading materials; i.e., the materials and exercises are so closely interrelated that they should be used together. 101 The originator of the method states that it is advisable to secure the materials that are products of people of recognized authority and experience, avoiding materials developed by those disposed to publish materials without conscientious investigation of their offerings.

Encourages regimented instruction. As the materials are not of the usual or "conventional" recreational and informational types, but must be written or reorganized to include devices of the tests, diagnostic, and direction-following kinds; they have been developed and published in the Preparatory Book or the Teacher's Manual. These definite

directions have had a tendency to establish an instructional pattern of regimentation. Teachers force each child to participate in the same exercises regardless of his needs. What may be one child's meat will be another child's poison. Some children will succeed in initial reading activities which involve the Word Method, while others need such techniques as are suggested by the Phonic, Phonetic, Sentence, Kinesthetic, etc. Also, all children do not need the same amount or kind of drill exercises.

Present Status of the Intrinsic Method

In the opinion of the judges consulted, Gates has developed a method of teaching beginning reading which has made phonetic instruction an intrinsic part of the reading program, but has neglected to make the reading act itself intrinsic. The materials of reading and the objectives of the method are extrinsic to the child's goals and interests.

According to the rating score sheet the Intrinsic Method provides for phonetic analysis and syllabification in a most satisfactory manner. A critical analysis of the rating sheet also shows that there is complete agreement that the following characteristics are provided for satisfactorily:

1. General configuration
2. Striking characteristics of words

102 Appendix, pp. 571-572.
3. Picture clues
4. Content clues
5. Evaluation of material
6. Drawing conclusions
7. Silent reading
8. Oral reading
9. Depth of word meaning
10. Specific provision for the development of readiness for reading.

The opinion is also expressed that though none of the characteristics of an adequate reading method is neglected, much is desired in the degree and procedure of presentation. Those characteristics provided for but in an unsatisfactory manner are:

1. An understanding of the nature of how children learn.
2. Comprehension.
3. Interpretation.
4. Application for information.
5. Speed determined by purpose.
6. Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed.
7. Emphasis from the beginning on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to thoughtful, meaningful interpretation.
8. Provision for easy reading with interesting content.
9. Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading.
10. Provision for developing permanent interest in reading.
11. Provision for individual differences in ability, needs, and interests.
12. Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials.
13. Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading.
14. Provision for a planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs.
15. Provision toward the objectives of beginning reading.
Research Findings

In 1923-24 and in 1925-26 investigations were undertaken by Arthur I. Gates for the purpose of appraising the results of two systems of teaching reading - the Intrinsic Method vs. the Phonetic Method.

The Phonetic Method used was developed by Dr. Gates and several specialists in reading. It was their opinion that the system selected was equal to any existing in published form. In the method selected the phonetic elements were presented as parts of selected "key" words. The procedure was to present the word visually as a whole and then orally present the sound units, such as sun - s - un. Later "family" words were introduced. This was accomplished by presenting a phonogram and then blending to it an initial sound; for example, at was written on the chalkboard, and the children practiced in blending the s just given. The exercises which followed were (1) presenting the word as a whole, (2) covering the initial sound and saying the phonogram, (3) changing the initial sound unit.

"The phonetic elements were taken up in approximately the following order: a, at, t, ell, b, f, v, r, et, it, ot, ut, m, an, hard c, g, un, h, th, sh, an, in, ar, p, d, ed, e, ad, id, od, un, l, y, n, ch, ee, oo, ag, eg, ig, og, ug, qu, ill, ack, eet, and, ake, ound, ank, etc."103

103 Gates, New Methods in Primary Reading, p. 50.
The group being taught by the Phonetic Method was instructed by an above average teacher. 104

The Intrinsic Method represented a first effort to organize this method of teaching reading. The materials used were of two sorts, a number of exercises to stimulate comprehension and a series of exercises to emphasize comprehension and word attack techniques. This material was organized so that only a part of each period was spent in training for word perception. Most of the comprehensive exercises were of the true-false and completion types.

In order to reduce the variables as near as possible the pupils were studied in regard to:

1. Age.
2. Stanford Binet Mental Age.
3. Intelligent quotient.
4. The teacher’s judgment of scholastic aptitude.
5. The teacher’s judgment of aptitude for reading.
6. Ability to recognize and pronounce words - Gates Graded Word Pronunciation Test.
7. Oral reading ability - Gray’s Oral Reading Passages.
8. Time and errors in reading 52 printed capital letters.
9. Time and errors in reading 52 lower-case letters.
10. Ability to perceive and identify words. . . .
11. Ability to perceive and identify geometrical figures. . . . (2 tests)
12. Ability to discriminate digits. . . .
13. Speed and accuracy in learning unfamiliar words in association with pictures which represent the meaning of the words. . . . 105

The two experimental groups entered school September 20th and the study began November 10th. The daily instruction period during this time averaged about 25 minutes.

104 Ibid., p. 46. 105 Ibid., p. 47.
Two series of tests were given during this time. One series administrated from January 28th to February 8th and the other appraisal during the month of May. From data collected by these tests Gates concluded that:

1. The intrinsic group excelled the phonetic group in oral reading.
2. More phonetic attack appeared among the pupils trained in phonetics.
3. The children trained by the phonetic method had more of a tendency to halt and to labor over unfamiliar words.
4. The children trained by the intrinsic method read more fluently and strived harder for comprehension.
5. The children trained by the intrinsic method were more disposed to guess at the unfamiliar words on the basis of context clues.
6. The intrinsic exercises, crude as they were, exerted a more favorable influence upon ordinary reading, silent and oral, than the phonetic training.106

The second investigation followed in the school year 1925-26. In this experiment improvement of instruction was developed for both the Phonetic and Intrinsic method. The Phonetic Method was built more in accord to the standards recommended by the National Committee.

The main characteristics of the new improved Intrinsic Method were:

1. All the work required intelligent comprehension of printed material. There were no exercises extrinsic or supplementary to comprehension, no work on printed material purely for the purpose of drill in the mechanics of the reading process in which comprehension of the thought was not engaged.

106 Ibid., p. 58.
Sam was almost too excited to contain himself. Dashing to the door ahead of his mother when the car drove up, he looked up expectantly at the lady holding the bundle of blankets. She bent down, smiling, to show the baby's face. After gazing intently at the baby, Sam Burst into tears. "Mama!" he wept, "We read at school that Peter was a rabbit."

**Third stage.** Reading in its more abstract form is the reading of printed or written symbols. In our language we refer to these symbols as printed words. Meaning of what is read arises or develops as the reader interacts with the symbols he perceives in an effort to meet needs, find information leading to the solution of a problem, or develop desired skills.

**Learning to Read**

The development of teaching reading is a continuous process and the following steps develop in a parallel manner:

1. Recognition of word configuration.

2. Recognition of speech-sounds representing the written words which need not be pronounced.

3. Grouping of word symbols and speech sounds, so that the essence of meaning can be easily and quickly understood.

4. Association of past experience with printed symbols.

5. Recognition of what is intended in the content.
2. No phonetic drill of any kind was included.
3. No devices, such as methods of dividing words into syllables, breaking a word into parts and the like, were taught, either in the materials or at other times by the teacher using the materials.
4. The devices used to stimulate sharp perception of words, to disclose similarities and differences, to emphasize common elements, and to encourage the use of context clues in perceiving unfamiliar words, were of the same general character as those used in the first experiment.107

The results of this experiment were similar to the findings of the first experiment. Near the completion of the first half of the second school year, two groups of twelve pupils each of the original group were selected for study. Data supplied by this investigation showed that although the phonetic group was, on the average, of somewhat higher intellectual status, the pupils trained by the Intrinsic Method were superior in reading ability, especially in paragraph reading.108

107 Ibid., p. 64. 108 Ibid., p. 93.
CHAPTER VIII

FUNCTIONAL OR CONJUNCTIVE METHODS

The Functional Methods or Conjunctive Methods place the major emphasis upon the learner in the process of acquiring the ability to read. The purpose and the materials used must be useful to him. The term "conjunctive" is used to suggest the merging or connecting of the learner's work in reading with his interest in his own problems, the joining of his activities in achieving his own goals with his activities in learning to read. The meanings are considered to result from the interaction of the learner with his environment, rather than being in the words used or in the person reading. The (1) Kinesthetic Method, (2) Experience Method, and (3) Purposeful Method may be classified in the category of "functional" or conjunctive methods. These approaches have the following characteristics:

1. Reading is based upon the learners' own interests, needs, and purposes. From the first lesson, reading is a process of developing such ideas from printed pages as will help in answering questions, solving problems, meeting needs - including recreation.

2. Materials for beginning reading are based upon and developed from the learners' personal or group experiences. "Experience charts" are typical of the "raw" or "school made" materials
as contrasted with the "finished" or "factory made" reading materials used in other methods. Such "raw" materials are desirable so that, in their early reading experiences, the learners may read reports of their own experiences and material relating to their own goal-seeking, purposeful activities.

3. Specific skills in reading are developed in their natural environment - the content fields, and through work on activities and projects in which the learners are engaging. In other words, reading skills are gained as the learners need such skills to accomplish their purposes.

4. Multi-sensory aids are used when needed, but always are subordinate to the overall purpose of reading as communication. Breaking down of words, analysis of syllables and letters, etcetera, are employed as needed by the learners in developing independent ability. Such work is for short periods only, and introduced only at the point and time of need. No word or sound drills are engaged in for the sake of drill.

The point of view that reading should be considered as part of classroom activities has been well-presented by Zirbes. From an extensive and perceptive study of classroom practices, that author listed hundreds of activities in which reading is a normal part of individual and social-group work. Helpful, practical descriptions of teaching procedures give evidence of the efficiency of the functional or conjunctive methods.

---

1Laura Zirbes, Comparative Studies of Current Practice in Reading (New York: Bureau of Publications, Teachers College, Columbia University, 1928).
Section I

The Kinesthetic Method

Many of the methods used in teaching beginning reading depend upon either visual or auditory stimuli. Those depending upon visual stimuli for instructing beginners in reading, use words, word groups, or phonograms, in a written or printed form. These methods emphasize the visual factor in reading. Such systems are frequently classified as Word, Phrase, Sentence, and Phonic methods. Those methods depending upon auditory stimuli consist of systems which encourage auditory stimuli, such as saying the ABC's, and oral sounding of letters and letter combinations. Such systems are frequently classified as Phonetic and Linguistic methods.

There is, however, another method which emphasizes neither the use of visual nor auditory stimuli. This method makes use of motor activity (writing) and is referred to as a Kinesthetic Method. In this method the essential techniques are (1) the discovery of some means by which the child can learn to write words correctly, (2) the motivating for such writing, (3) the reading by the child of the printed copy of what he has written, and (4) extensive reading of materials other than their own composition.²

The Kinesthetic Method is based upon three basic instructions - first look at the word, then say it, then write it. Thus, the child is encouraged to study the word by means of visual, auditory, and kinesthetic stimuli.

Historical Development

The Kinesthetic Method was first described as a complete method by Fernald and Keller in 1921. One of the authors, Fernald, had spent many years developing the kinesthetic approach to help slow learners and non-readers and has reported her use of the method in remedial teaching.

Although it was through the efforts of Fernald that the Kinesthetic Method became an established method for the teaching of beginning reading, the Kinesthetic Method had been used previous to this time. Plato (427-347 B.C.) described such a method when he wrote: "When a boy is not yet clever in writing the masters first draw lines, and then give him the tablet and make him write as the lines direct."

Other early educators who reinforced learning by

---


4 Fernald, Remedial Techniques in Basic School Subjects.

5 H. L. Freeman, Schools of Hellas (London: Macmillan and Company, Ltd., 1908), as quoted by Grace Fernald, ibid., p. 27.
motor activity were: Horace⁶ (65 B.C.), who suggested that children eat letters made of pastry; Seneca⁷ (3 B.C. to 65 A.D.), who suggested guiding the child's hand over written material; Quintilian⁸ (about 68 A.D.), who suggested tracing with a pen letters engraved on ivory tablets; St. Jerome⁹ (403 A.D.), who suggested that the child play with a set of letters made of boxwood or ivory and later guide the hand or furnish patterns when writing. Charlemagne taught himself to read by tracing the outline of characters.¹⁰ The Gingerbread Method¹¹ was also an early form of the kinesthetic procedure applied to the Alphabet Method. It became quite popular in England and was used in Germany and the United States. In parts of Germany school bakers were instructed to bake the letters for the children's breakfast. Three weeks was thought enough for even the most backward to learn their letters through their mouths.

Locke (1632-1704) was essentially the founder of a psychology based on the application of scientific investigation to the study of the mind and set forth at some length and with much detail the disciplinary conception of the educational process. One of the implications of his "doctrine of formal discipline" was that education was not information but the strengthening of the faculties, so that they can meet new situations more effectively than before. Applying his psychological concepts to the teaching of reading he suggested:

Get a plate graved with the characters of such a hand as you like best . . . let several sheets of good writing paper be printed off with red ink, which he has nothing to do but go over with a good pen filled with black ink, which will quickly bring his hand to the formation of these very characters, being first showed where to begin, and how to form every letter.\(^\text{12}\)

In suggestions made by Montessori the tracing method was used most extensively. Montessori, however, only used the tracing technique for a limited time. To her it was not a method. It was a supplementary technique. One of Montessori's principles is that a child only needs material to manipulate when he can not think without so doing; therefore, her technique of finger tracing is to serve as an aid to thinking and to stimulate visual discrimination.

J. M. Mackinder, a follower of Montessori, describes the reading method in the following manner:

The child takes a letter from a box containing the alphabet, each letter on a separate piece of wood, and walks round the room with this letter in his left hand until he find a letter on the frieze which is like the one he holds. . . .

He pronounces the name of the object depicted beside the letter, on the wall, and emphasizing the initial sound of that name, discovers the sound of the letter shown. . . .

. . . When he has discovered the sound of this letter he writes it, takes the written letter to his teacher, and pronounces it.\(^{13}\)

Special methods, closely related to the Kinesthetic Method, have been developed for teaching the blind, the hard-of-hearing, the children in sight-saving classes; but details of such methods are beyond the scope of this study.

Description of the Kinesthetic Method

It is a rather frequent occurrence, especially in the beginning stages of reading, for certain words and phrases to remain undifferentiated in perception for an indefinite period. For example, the child may confuse "toy" and "boy" or regularly see "saw" as "was," especially if one of the words was learned first. Wheeler and Perkins\(^{14}\) point out that in many of these cases the behavior-pattern involved in reading requires

---


Intensified and diversified stimulation before further differentiation will develop and state that such increased stimulation is often effective when given through kinesthetic channels. The use of the Kinesthetic Method in aiding beginning reading has been tried successfully by DeBusk in a form of creative writing. Since plain drill spelling and writing of the words confused and proved futile, DeBusk asked the children to draw a picture or select one from a group and to write a story about the picture. Such creative writing helps them to develop a feeling for words, phrases, and sentences. The enriched self-expression develops greater sensitiveness to meaning. This, combined with keener perception, bolstered by kinesthetic approaches, increased vocabulary range and improved reading ability develops.

The Kinesthetic Method as organized by Grace Fernald recognizes the factor that some children confuse "on" and "no"; "tree" and "three"; "be" and "he" because they do not see the differentiated parts of the word. They may not see these differences because of alexia (word-blindness) or simply for the same reason that a writer does not see his mistakes when he proofreads his paper. However, the failure may be due to: vision or hearing, illness, poor emotional stability.

lack of adequate schooling, lack of comprehension of the printed material, inversions, reversions, etc.

Regardless of the cause, this lack of word-perception power may occur and if it does a reading disability either of a total or partial degree will develop. Thus, there is a need for a definite technique which will encourage children to look discriminatingly at the word and see it as it is.

The tracing technique of the Kinesthetic Method forces the child to direct his attention to the specific configuration of the word and yet presents the word as a whole. The tracing of the word, the saying of the word, the writing of the word without looking at it, and the using of the word in a story provides increased stimulation.

Classroom procedures. The Kinesthetic Method as recommended by Grace Fernald proceeds in the following manner:

1. The child selects a word he wants to learn to read.
2. The word is written for the child with crayola on a large sheet of paper.
3. The child traces the word with finger contact, saying each part of the word as he traces.
4. He writes the word without looking at it.
5. The using of the words in sentences or stories.

Selecting the reading words. In presenting this method the initial step is to create in the child a desire to read; so rather than force a child to read or try to read a
Recognition of word-configuration. The act of reading written or printed symbols starts when the reader sees the word and recognizes its appearances. The reader, as a rule, sees and recognizes printed symbols as wholes. He does not, in the process of reading, look for all the different letters in each word and then put the letters together to form the word.

However, the child must become progressively conscious of more and more detail of a word's appearance, so that the proper response be given to such words as saw and was, bed and bead, and red, read, reed and so through practice these details of attention decrease and function only in the unconscious mechanism of perception.

Grouping of word symbols and speech sounds so that the essence of meaning can be easily and quickly understood. In listening to a story, it is the relationship of the ideas to each other, the words in logical sequence, the episodes resulting from earlier happenings which make the separate statements understandable to the child. He does not understand that the story is "built" of serialized ideas, nor does he pay attention to the sequence of words. When he expresses an idea, the child may use subject, predicate, object, and explanatory adjectives without knowing the grammatical mechanics of a sentence. He constructs sentences without needing to know. His though process, as a unit, determines where he
specific selection he is asked what word do you want to learn to read. He may select any word regardless of length as long as he has an interest and a desire to learn that word, for words that have pleasant association have a tendency to be more easily recognized and remembered by children. Hildreth discovered a child who found "automobile" and "ice cream" easier to remember than "one," "work," and "they." She also showed, in the same study that emotionalized attitudes toward words affect the ease of learning. For example, one boy learned "mother" with no difficulty, but had trouble recognizing and remembering "father." Investigation of the child's home environment and emotional balance revealed causes of this difficulty. The same boy easily remembered "candy" but even after many presentations of "carrots" was uncertain in identifying it correctly. He practiced the word "street" for several weeks before he could identify it readily in reading. He lived in a narrow, traffic-crowded street, and had been warned strenuously never to cross the street. "Engine" and "automobile" were easy for him to learn, apparently because he was interested in mechanical things.

Tracing the word. After the child has selected his word, it is written for him by the teacher in script on a

large sheet of paper, and he then traces the word with his finger, saying each part of it either to himself or orally.

In order that he may benefit from visual, auditory, and kinesthetic stimuli, emphasis is placed upon the child sounding the word as he traces it with his finger. He repeats this as many times as necessary in order to write it from memory. In case of error or interruption when writing the word from memory, the child is to start again and write it as a whole. As he progresses the number of times necessary for him to learn the word by tracing decreases.

The following outline illustrates the decreasing emphasis in motor activity as suggested by this method:

Stage I  Child learns by tracing the word.
Stage II Child learns by studying the word visually and orally expressing its meaning before writing it.
Stage III Child learns the word by merely looking at it and saying it to himself before he writes it.
Stage IV Child is able to recognize the new words from their similarity to words or parts of words he has learned.  

Reading the words in sentences and stories. After isolated words have been studied, the student and teacher develop a sentence based on the child's interest using the known words and introducing new words. The child then learns or reviews the words comprising the sentence by the process of tracing, saying, and writing the word from memory.

17 Fernald, Remedial Techniques in Basic School Subjects, pp. 35-55.
After the learning of the words and the study of a few sentences, a story using these words is composed by the child or he selects a story to read. Grace Fernald gives the following directions for the reading of the first paragraph:

The first paragraphs read were worked over in the following manner. Before the reading, each word which had not already been learned was exposed through an adjustable slit in a piece of cardboard. If the child failed to read the word it was pronounced for him. He pronounced and then wrote the word (as before without looking at the copy). If he had difficulty in writing the word after seeing it in print, it was written for him and taught from the script as in the case of the first word.\(^{18}\)

**Word and phrase drill.** After this type of reading experience, attention is given to word and phrase drill. In these drill exercises the new words and phrases are flashed to the child for immediate recognition. The child keeps a card file of all words learned. The objectives for this file are to provide a record of the words studied, to provide the child with a visual means of seeing his progress, and to provide material for individual drill study.

After this extensive study to develop immediate word recognition, the child is encouraged to read the material containing the studied vocabulary for comprehension.

Recognition of new words from similarity to known words or parts of words. When the child has developed an adequate sight vocabulary and has gained in word-perception power, the tracing of words is omitted in the word study period and such are learned by simply looking at the new word in script, saying the word subvocally, and then writing it. After the child has had numerous experiences in which he has learned without the aid of motor activity, his attention is directed to the specific configuration of words so that recognition can be gained from their similarity to known words or parts of words already learned.

The place of phonics in the Kinesthetic Method. The author of this method has declared. "The child is never made to sound the word when he is reading nor is it sounded for him by his teacher." 19

Detailed word study is provided by having the word written by the method already described. The writing helps the child recognize the word in print; and as such serves its purpose. If the child wants to sound the word he is given an opportunity to do so before he starts to read the material.

Book reading. As soon as the child has developed the ability to generalize and to "unlock" new words from their resemblance to words already known, he is allowed to read as

19 Fernald, Remedial Techniques in Basic School Subjects, p. 53.
much as he wants to about anything that interests him. At
this stage some children find interest in books and magazines
while others prefer stories. This material must be carefully
selected for as Fernald has declared: "In all cases it is
essential that the content of the reading material be such
that the child will continue to read what he wants to know,
whether this is the mechanism of an engine or the fate of a
hero." During this stage of development the child is never
read to, and unknown word meanings are told to him. Often
if the selected material is difficult the child is asked to
glance over the material and to indicate any word he does not
know by drawing a light line under it. The study procedures
for these words are organized according to the following
pattern:

At first the child retains new words better
if he pronounces them and writes them after he is
told what they are. At this stage he does this
very rapidly. He repeats the word as he looks at
it, turns to a piece of scrap paper, writes the
word, and goes on to the next one. His retention
of words learned in this way is 88 to 95 percent.
Eventually the child is able to retain the meaning
of the word if he is simply told what it is.21

In reading stories, however, the child reads along as
he wishes. Unknown words are told as needed, but recorded
for later study, if they are common enough to merit study.

20 Ibid., 51. 21 Ibid., p. 52.
Using the Kinesthetic Method
in a Classroom Situation

(A child and a teacher are seated before a table. In front of them is a large sheet of paper.)

Teacher: "Frank, we certainly have been learning a lot of new words. I wonder how well you remember the words we learned yesterday. Would you like to find out?"

Frank: "Yes."

Teacher: "Here is your card file. Let's try."

(Child takes the cards from a box and as he does so he says each word.)

Frank: "Mother
Father
Baby
look."

Teacher: "That is very good. What word would you like to learn to read today?"

Frank: ". . . work. You see I have a job now. I work after school."

Teacher: (Writing the word work on the sheet of paper.) "My, that is nice. What kind of work do you do?"

Frank: "I work for Mr. Jim, the grocer. I deliver orders."

Teacher: "That is interesting work. Do you need to know how to read to find where people live?"

Frank: "No, Mr. Jim tells me."

Teacher: "Let's try to read this word." (With her finger she traces over the word work and as she does so she repeats the word.) "Now, you try it."

(Child traces over the word several times and says the word each time.)

"When you think you can read the word tell me and we will try."
(Child continues to trace and to say the word orally.)

Frank: "I think I can now."

(He takes another sheet of paper and writes the word without copy.)

Teacher: "Have you thought of another word?"

Frank: "Mr. Jim."

(Teacher writes and says Mr. Jim and the child repeats the activity several times, then writes the word from memory.)

Teacher: "You have now learned two new words today."

(She writes work and Mr. Jim on the paper.)

"Can you think of another word you would like to learn?"

Frank: "Grocer."

(The teacher writes this word and pronounces the word. The child traces the word five times and while doing so orally says the word.)

Teacher: "Are you ready to write the word?"

Frank: "I think so."

(The child writes gro . . . and then stops.)

Teacher: "Let me help you this time." (She holds his hand while they write the word together. After this the child continues tracing and saying the word.)

Frank: "I really think I can do it now."

Teacher: "I know you can."

(The child writes the word from memory.)

"Would you like to tell me a story about your work? It would make an interesting story to read."
Frank: "That sounds like a good idea. What can I say?"

Teacher: "What would you like to say?"

Frank: "... Mr. Jim has a grocery store."

(The teacher writes as the boy tells his story.)

"I work for Mr. Jim. Last night I delivered groceries. When I came back to the store Mr. Jim had me put cans on the shelves."

Teacher: "Here is your story." (Hands Frank the copy of the story that she has written.) "Can you read it?"

(Frank looks at the story.)

Frank: "Some of it."

Teacher: "Let me hear you try."

Frank: "I work for Mr. Jim."

Teacher: "Last..." (She underlines the word last.)

Frank: "Last night I..."

Teacher: "delivered. ..." (Underlines word.)

Frank: "Last night I delivered groceries. When I came... back to the store Mr. Jim had me... put... cans on the..."

Teacher: "shelves." (Underlines word.)

Frank: "shelves."

Teacher: "That was very good. What shall we call your story?"

Frank: "My Work." (Teacher writes the title.)

Teacher: "Frank, you had a little trouble with some of the words. Would you like to practice them?"

Frank: "Yes."
Teacher: "I have underlined each word that gave you trouble. Here they are, last, delivered, when, shelves."

(The teacher points at each word. Then she writes the word last, says it for the boy. Frank traces and says the word orally until he can write the word without copy. This same procedure is done for the words delivered, when, and shelves.)

Teacher: "Would you read me your story again, Frank?"

Frank: "My Work.
I work for Mr. Jim.
Last night I delivered groceries.
When I came back to the store Mr. Jim had me put cans on the shelves."

Teacher: "Would you write this story for me all by yourself?"

(Frank does so accompanied by much chewing of the pencil.)

"Fine. Just look at all the words you can read."

Frank: (Looks at the story for a long time.)
"I have used 31 words in my story."

Teacher: "That many?"

Frank: "Yes, and I just bet I can say everyone from the cards tomorrow. Want to bet?"

Teacher: "I bet you can, too."

Reading Programs Based on the Kinesthetic Method

The Kinesthetic Method has been used with individual children, with small groups of children, and with children in a classroom situation. In all situations the pattern is similar to that already described, which is representative
of the individual program. When used in a small group or classroom situation, the reading material is an outgrowth of individual or small group projects with each child learning words and progressing in his own way.

Each child works on a topic that is of interest to him. Reading instruction may start by the child selecting a word, writing a story, drawing a picture for a story, or sketching a diagram to be labeled. He is encouraged to work in his own way. However, at all times supervision and help is given as needed. A reading vocabulary is built by the child studying words kinesthetically. Opportunity is provided for each child to share his work, materials, and knowledge gained, so that all the language art skills, such as, grammar usage, listening, spelling, oral communication, and writing are experienced.

Specific reading programs based on the Kinesthetic Method of teaching beginning reading are the Craig and the Calvert methods. These are briefly described below.

The Craig Method

This beginning reading program is a modified kinesthetic approach to reading. The program has been described by Grace E. Bird as used in the Henry Barnard School, an

places the parts of speech. In both cases, attention is focused upon the whole, and the meaning as a whole.

When attention is focused upon meaning, children learn to read efficiently without even knowing that the alphabet exists, just as one may enjoy and secure meaning from pictures without being familiar with pigments, oil paints, the silk-screen process, or brush work. Words are identified and distinguished one from another by characteristics of total configuration without detail differences, such as letters, being analyzed. This is verified in adult experience through such actions as hailing a friend from a distance and later noticing his new suit or recognizing the make and model of a car speeding by without being able to state positively a single identifying mark. Wheeler and Parker state that "differences between wholes are recognized long before characteristics which make them different are recognizable." Then as recognition of the differences emerges, the gross differences come first, such as length, bigness, one word with a big letter at the beginning, and another not. Hence, reading skill develops as growth of ability to recognize wholes - words and ideas, or sentences - and to organize them into meanings. Knowledge of the alphabet is not necessary until the child faces the problem of writing. 30

experimental and demonstration school of the Rhode Island College of Education.

Description of the program. The Craig Method may best be described as a tactual-kinesthetic-visual-auditory method. This infers that the child learns to read through touching, moving, seeing, and hearing. This method is based upon the following principles: (1) that each initial stage of a desired habit should be thoroughly understood by the learner, (2) that each desired habit should be developed in a practical situation, (3) that transfer of learning increases as relationships are taught. 23

This method places great emphasis upon individual growth and endeavors at all times to promote individual growth rather than class standards. Belief in this has developed a program of instruction which considers each child as an individual and provides activities which meet his needs and promote his growth. The readiness and ability of each child determines his introduction to instruction and acceleration; as a result grade levels are broken down and learning becomes a continuous process.

Materials of instruction. The equipment necessary for teaching reading by this method is large script letter

23 Ibid., p. 539.
and word forms made by the teachers by dusting carborundum powder on melted glue applied to cardboard with a brush, flat models of such common objects as birds, animals, and household articles, movable alphabet primers, and typewriters.

Using the materials of instruction. The equipment is used as a stimulation or motivation for reading and as aids in the teaching of reading. The large letter and word forms, made by dusting carborundum powder on melted glue applied to cardboard, are placed around the room in an attractive manner. These serve as an open invitation to the children to begin using them spontaneously. After a short time of free play the children are taught how to move the first two fingers lightly over the carborundum letters and words. Anderson and Dearborn state: "The method begins to look like the efforts which were once made to teach children their ABC's by having them trace letters made of velvet or sandpaper."21 As the children trace the letters or words they are taught to observe the word carefully, trace precisely, and at the same time say the word distinctly. Thus, this method takes advantage of stimuli provided by touch, muscular movement, vision, and auditory sound.

Although this method uses isolated letters Bird states: "The one letter stage is a simple and brief entrance

into a procedure which begins almost immediately to deal with larger units." Thus, the tracing of the letters progresses to the construction of words and sentences with a movable alphabet as individual sounds are taught.

Writing is taught with the reading. The introduction to writing is made by having the children trace around patterns of graded difficulty in the form of flat models of birds, animals, etc. Then with crayons they color the pictures. The objective of these exercises are (1) to develop the necessary motor control for writing and (2) to direct the scribbling tendency to appropriate form.

Soon after the tracing of letters, words, and models the children are provided with an opportunity to write on the blackboard. Bird reports the following sentences to be written by children under six years:

I read my book last night.
I am glad Christmas is coming. I want a doll and a carriage.
If I am good I think I will get them.
I am going to be good.
(Underline word indicates the teacher helped with the spelling.)

These sentences are the results of children expressing their own thoughts. After the children have had numerous experiences of writing their thoughts on the blackboard, they are provided with primers which contain both print and script.

---

25 Grace E. Bird, op. cit., p. 539.
26 Ibid., p. 540.
Research findings. Bird's study provided data which showed that:

1. Children of kindergarten age read an average of six books before they reached the first grade.  

2. The composite medians, the sum of the standard medians, of the Battery of Gates Reading Tests were:

   Grade 1, 51; Grade II, 21; Grade III, 20;  
   Grade IV, 7; Grade V, 15; Grade VI, 20;  
   Grade VII, 16; Grade VIII, 8.  

3. The scores of the Standard Achievement Test given to Grades IIB - VIIIA inclusive, in June, 1929, and the comparison of such results with scores made by pupils, who had entered from other schools, showed that the children taught by the Craig Method were superior in all areas except one - dictation-spelling in one grade.

The Calvert Method

This reading program was developed by Hillyer and is now incorporated in a remedial reading service established by the Calvert School, Baltimore, Maryland. There is great similarity between this reading program and the Craig program as it too offers the same opportunities for developing strong kinesthetic feelings for words.

The Calvert Method is based upon a hypothesis that writing should begin at the same time as reading; however, it fails to account for the fact that although most beginners can read all they write, they cannot write all they read.

\[27^\text{Ibid., p. 542.}\]  
\[28^\text{Ibid.}\]  
\[29^\text{Ibid., p. 543.}\]
Advantages of the Kinesthetic Method

This method has been used successfully with seriously retarded readers, but only a few experiments have been made with primary-grade children. The real value of this method has yet to be determined; however, it does appear to have several advantages. These advantages are:

1. The Kinesthetic Method often succeeds when other methods have failed.
2. The Kinesthetic Method aids children who have visual or auditory defects.
3. Reading instruction in the Kinesthetic Method is based upon the child's interest pattern.
4. In the Kinesthetic Method emphasis is placed directly upon reading as a thought process.

The Kinesthetic Method often succeeds when other methods have failed. Hildreth provides the following reasons for its success:

1. The Kinesthetic Method is a new approach under novel circumstances.
2. The Kinesthetic Method uses specific materials and methods which are tailor-made to meet needs of individual children.
3. In the Kinesthetic Method learning begins with meaningful material.
4. In the Kinesthetic Method the linguistic meaning has already been acquired and used.
5. In the Kinesthetic Method the child is freed from embarrassment of failure and "silly" (to him) words, since each word relates to his own interests and purposes.
6. In the Kinesthetic Method motivation is strong, since the child indicates words he wants to know.
7. In the Kinesthetic Method attention is strengthened by the child's purpose.
8. In the Kinesthetic Method memory is reinforced by auditory, visual, and neuro-muscular impressions.\footnote{30}

The Kinesthetic Method aids children who have visual or auditory defects. Many children have little difficulty with retention of word recognition when taught by a method which emphasizes visual or auditory or visual and auditory stimuli. However, children do not all learn alike - and one of these differences is in the ability and in the manner in which they learn words. The Kinesthetic Method as developed by Grace Fernald stresses not only visual and auditory stimuli but also kinesthetic movement. Dr. Betts encourages the use of this method for children who have been diagnosed as "word blind." He writes:

This technique is a valid and legitimate one to use for children who are diagnosed as "word blind." . . . When Dr. Fernald's tracing technique is used, these children learn to read up to the limits of their mental ability. They become skilled and versatile readers. They learn to read through this type of approach when all other approaches have failed.\footnote{31}

There are also others this method may help; those having trouble recognizing saw and was or calling here, where and where, here.


Hildreth\textsuperscript{32} states although differences in strength of imagery may be recognized among children, there is no evidence to substantiate that there are separate imagery types - auditory, kinesthetic, visual. However, it seems safe to assume that in any learning done by a child of normal sensory capacities, reinforcement from all three types is superior to results from one sensory approach alone.

Reading instruction in the Kinesthetic Method is based upon the child's interest pattern. By permitting the child to learn words in which he has an interest regardless of difficulty, the learning of such words stimulates his interest. Interest and motivation play an important part in learning to read. "A number of experiments agree in showing that material which a learner considers pleasant or likes is learned most readily, and unpleasant material less effectively, while that which arouses no feeling at all is remembered least."\textsuperscript{33}

In the Kinesthetic Method emphasis is placed upon reading as a thought process. The child's attention is directed toward the detailed parts of the word through the process of neuro-muscular activity, seeing it, and hearing it

\begin{footnotes}
\end{footnotes}
pronounced. The tracing of the word forces the child to look at it closely, and thus he sees the difference between such words as big and pig, no and on, and other similar words. Since the child learns the words in content, his attention is directed to the meaning of what he reads. In the beginning stages the basic reading materials are developed by the child and therefore the plot contains those concepts which express his experiences or interests. Since the context is familiar to him the mechanics of reading are subordinated to thought-getting.

Limitations of the Kinesthetic Method

An appraisal of the Kinesthetic Method shows the following limitations:

1. This method fails to provide a technique which aids in the developing of independent reading; i.e., word attack techniques.

2. This method fails to provide opportunities for the child to increase his perceptual span. It encourages the child to see letter-by-letter and word-by-word.

3. This method fails to promote reasonable speed in reading.

Lack of word attack techniques. Although the Kinesthetic Method takes advantage of the study of (1) specific and general configuration of words, (2) similarity of the unknown word to the known word, and (3) use of reading content to stimulate word recognition through meaning, no consideration
is given to instruction which promotes understanding of phonetic and structural analysis of words. Teachers should not consider phonetic and structural analysis as a total reading program; however, it may have values in combination with other methods. David Russell has declared:

... phonetic analysis is not even the whole of the word-recognition program, since, ... children learn to recognize words by general pattern, by similarity to known words, by context clues, and by peculiarities in the words. However, for most children it is one of the methods by which they can learn to recognize new or partly known words.  

The Kinesthetic Method may encourage word calling. The ability to interpret a phrase, sentence, or paragraph is a different mental process from the consecutive recognition of each word. In reading phrases, sentences, and paragraphs consciousness is focused upon thought content; in recognition of words attention is directed to mere word calling. Experimentation has demonstrated that it is possible to perceive a number of complete words at a time if attention is focused upon the chain of thought and not individual words. Word tracing has a tendency to emphasize the importance of word recognition rather than the interpretation of ideas presented.

There is also danger that the kinesthetic tracing may become a "crutch" which may carry over after the kinesthetic training has stopped. Newmayer cites a case in which a child was brought from a test I.Q. of 105 to 112 and to a rating of superior intelligence after nine months of special training. The influence of the kinesthetic approach persisted because as the investigator reported "Although she can now read with comprehension, she resorts to sounding or tracing as a method of word recognition."36

The Kinesthetic Method fails to promote reasonable speed. In the Kinesthetic Method consideration is not given to speed as determined by purpose of reading. Instruction for reading either informational material or stories is the same. When reading new material, regardless of the content, the reader is first to study the material and mark each word that is not recognized. This type of study encourages numerous fixations per line which in turn decreases the rate of reading. This may become a habit.

Huey is of the opinion that the number of eye pauses per line do become a habit. He states:

The number of pauses per line varies greatly, but is greater for the slow readers and when reading slowly. The eye readily falls into a brief

When the child is introduced to reading, he begins with wholes. If the child is reading for meaning, he can carry in his consciousness "as a single expanding unit" a train of thought with a beginning, a direction, and an end. Lamoreaux and Lee write that:

Reading should be a thought expression process in which pupils first learn to associate their ideas with a group of symbols, then later learn to identify individual symbols. Sight vocabulary develops as a result of the interpretation of the story. In the early stages of reading, word recognition must grow out of and be fitted into the reading content.

It is not the length or shortness of a word which determines whether a word is easy or hard, but it is easy or difficult as it expresses an idea, which is easy or difficult for a child to understand.

Association of past experiences with printed symbols. Reading depends on experience. The individual must bring to the printed page a knowledge of the meanings of words and a command of concepts if he is to read successfully. The ability to read and to comprehend results is influenced by the reader's experiential background. A story which illustrates how our experiences determine to a large extent our vocabulary skill, command of concepts, and comprehension of printed symbols is:

31Lillian A. Lamoreaux and Doris May Lee, Learning to Read Through Experience (New York: D. Appleton-Century Company, 1943), p. 120.
"motor habit" of making a certain fixed number of pauses per line, for a given passage, independently of the nature of the subject matter.37

It is in general an advantage to read a given line with the smallest number of pauses as by decreasing pauses, or periods of fixation, the rate of reading can be increased. Cruze says that, "Continued experience with any situation will lead to the development of characteristic forms of behavior, usually termed habits."38 Therefore, it appears that consideration should be given to opportunities for children to read at various reading rates, so that adequate reading habits can be developed to fit the child's reading needs.

Research Findings

Investigations in regard to the Kinesthetic Method have been concerned with its value as a remedial reading technique.

Children differ in the uses they are able to make of their mental processes for learning words. Many children learn to read regardless of the method used for initial reading instruction. On the other hand, there are children who have not learned to read by such methods as visual (story or sentence), auditory (phonetic), or visual-auditory (phonic),

and need another approach to beginning reading. If the child appears deficient in auditory or visual associative skills, instructional procedures must be differentiated to meet his needs. 39

Although the causes of reversal tendency are uncertain, it is claimed that such frequently occurs when children are learning to read and with those who are often retarded in reading. Davidson, Teagarden, and others have found that about sixty per cent of beginning first grade children make errors of this kind, and only about ten per cent or less of the retarded readers are characterized by reversal errors.

After an extensive study concerning the reversal tendencies of poor readers Gates and Bennett concluded:

Known visual defects, therefore, existed with twice the frequency in the Reversals as in the Non-Reversals. Further study of the degree and type of visual defects of such pupils is indicated as a promising means of revealing causes of reversal tendency. Indeed, considering merely these bare data, it would appear that visual defects of some sort or sorts is the most conspicuous characteristic of the Reversal Group thus far found. 42

39 Betts, op. cit., p. 585.
Although the authors of this study did not suggest a kinesthetic approach to beginning reading for such children, it may be desirable as the visual attention given the word during the tracing period aids in a close examination of the word pattern or configuration.

Poor auditory ability is considered one of several causes for poor reading. Bond found in a study concerning the auditory and speech characteristics of poor readers that there were significant differences in hearing between good and poor readers in the second and third grades. His data also supported the conclusion that partly deaf children were seriously handicapped when beginning reading instruction was by a method which stressed auditory-visual techniques. Thus, these children need an approach to beginning reading which gives consideration to their physical handicap. The Kinesthetic Method may be helpful, as during the tracing period the child pronounces the word. This has a tendency to aid the child to associate the auditory sounds of the letters with the visual symbols.

Although Orton and Dearborn have expressed conflicting hypotheses concerning the cause of mixed or converted dominance, both express the opinion that with mixed dominance or a lack of consistent preference for either side, the child will have great difficulty in learning to read.

Recent investigations showed that reading disability is less common among children who are consistently right-sided dominated than among those showing consistently left-sided, mixed or converted dominance. Many other studies have reported negative results.


45 Walter F. Dearborn, "Structural Factors Which Condition Special Disability in Reading," Proceedings of the American Association for Mental Deficiency, XXXVIII (1933), 266-283.


In regard to the effectiveness of the kinesthetic approach to reading for such children Grace Fernald has declared, "The fact that we find a normal or superior learning rate with complete success as the end result in sixty-two cases of total disability that we have studied seems to indicate some specific peculiarity of brain structure and function in the case of these individuals."48

The Present Status of the Kinesthetic Method

Although the Kinesthetic Method has been found definitely helpful with children who have not been able to learn by the visual or auditory methods, in the opinion of the present judges consulted it appears inadequate as a complete classroom procedure.

The five judges49 checked the following characteristics of an adequate reading program as not provided for in the Kinesthetic Method:

1. Provision for (a) picture clues, (b) phonetic analysis, (c) syllabification, (d) interpretation and evaluation of materials, (e) drawing conclusions, (f) application of information, (g) speed determined by purpose, silent reading.

2. Specific provision for the (a) development of readiness for reading, (b) postponement of reading until readiness has been developed.

According to data provided by the judges50 this method

---

48 Fernald, Remedial Techniques in Basic School Subjects, p. 160.
49 Appendix, p. 575-576.
50 Appendix, p. 576.
of teaching reading provided for but not adequately these characteristics:

1. Study of general and striking configuration of words.
2. Provision for oral reading.
3. Emphasis from the beginning on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to thoughtful, meaningful interpretation.
4. Adequate provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content.
5. Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials.
6. Increase in vocabulary and content.
7. Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs.
8. Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading.

TABLE XX
CHARACTERISTICS AND PATTERN OF DISAGREEMENT CONCERNING FACETS OF THE KINESTHETIC METHOD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics</th>
<th>Values*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Provision for use of content clues</td>
<td>4 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for comprehension of material read</td>
<td>1 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>1 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>1 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual differences in ability, needs, and interests</td>
<td>1 4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*(3) most satisfactory; (2) satisfactory; (1) provided for but in an unsatisfactory manner; (0) not provided for.
Although there was complete agreement concerning the degree of provisions made in regard to the above listed characteristics, the table on the preceding page illustrates areas of instruction where differences in degree of provisions were expressed.

Betts seems to have expressed the opinion of the present judges when he said:

The Fernald-Keller technique is one means of helping children who have certain types of difficulties. This approach is not recommended for all children by the writer.51

Section II

The Experience Method

In this method the daily experiences of the children became the content of the reading material. The reading material is prepared and selected by the children under the guidance of the teacher.

The Experience Method is based upon the following educational principles:

1. Learning is a doing process.
2. Learning progresses from the known to the unknown.
3. Learning is a complex process which does not develop in isolation.

In this method, reading begins with experiences and enriches experiences by serving as a stimulus to creative

expression. It concerns itself with content as well as skills, with abiding interest in books, and with the abilities of individual children.

The Experience Method fits appropriately into modern educational practice. It is psychologically sound, harmonizing with the current Gestalt-Organismic emphasis, with an integrative curriculum, and with elementary school organization. It provides a flexible, democratic type of program, which is generally accepted as desirable. For the school administrators, the Experience Method can be almost a "shot in the arm" as an aid in improving parent-school relations and interpreting modern practices to the public.

Historical Development

At the turn of the present century, experiences and activities became the keynote of a new educational method. This method was based upon the theory of organismic psychology, which stresses the interaction of the organism and his environment.

Many educators accepted the principle of this psychology and attempted to adjust the basic assumptions of this psychology to a beginning reading program. Attention was given to aspects of general child development, and reading instruction was provided as the need grew from the children's interest, problems, and activities. The teacher's responsibility was to create an environment that promoted worth while,
challenging activities so that a child would have a need and a purpose for learning to read.

Because of the emphasis on personalized experiences, the name Experience Method attached itself to this method of instruction. Early educators who applied this theory to general practice were Dewey (1896), Francis W. Parker (1901), and J. L. Merian (1904).

Part I of the Nineteenth Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education was one of the early publications which presented this beginning reading method to the public.

Many schools in various parts of the country have used this method for the purpose of introducing children to the beginning reading program; however, few have used it through an academic year or through the elementary grades. Of the various methods of teaching beginning reading, probably none has been used less as a method and more as a supplementary activity than the Experience Method.

Description of the Experience Method

The Experience Method of teaching beginning reading developed as a result of efforts to build reading programs

---


around knowledge already possessed by children, their needs, and their interests, and driving purposes. In this method reading proceeds from a common group experience to intellectualizing of the experience, the remembrance and reorganization of high points of interest into a related sequence of ideas and refinement of the ideas into sentences which tell the story.

Introduction to reading. In this method the introduction to reading is a continuous process and is commonly referred to as reading readiness. Reading readiness is developed through a program which provides opportunities for experiences, communication, listening, planning and sharing experiences, story telling, and games. These activities aid in the developing of auditory and visual discrimination and attention span. Attention is also given to activities which develop ability to follow directions, distinguish similarities and differences, and left-to-right-eye-sweep.

Reading instruction. The reading process is taught as an integral part of the total school program. It is functional and is taught in relation to a need. The need is developed by means of a unit or activity which promotes purpose for reading. As the children are participating in the activity numerous experience charts are written. These charts furnish the core of the reading program.
When stationed in Tokyo, I was taken by a Japanese friend to a baseball game. Before the game started, the opposing teams faced each other near home plate and exchanged deep bows. I mentioned to my friend that this pre-game ceremony would certainly startle an American crowd.

A few days later, I met him and he pulled out a newspaper clipping and handed it to me with a smile. "Evidently American baseball teams have adopted Japanese customs since you left the States," he said.

The clipping was a headline from the sports page of the Nippon Times: "Giants Bow Twice to Dodgers." 32

Actually, the influences affecting an individual's comprehension at any one time extend back into childhood experiences. Words become meaningful to us through our experiences. If a word has no root in our experience, it must be made meaningful by showing or illustrating its relationship with familiar words. Part of the teacher's responsibility in the teaching of beginning reading is to broaden the experiences of his student. This may be accomplished by providing first hand experiences for those children with meager experiential backgrounds or involving interpreting pictures, telling stories, dramatization, demonstrations, experiments, and numerous audio-visual aids.

Recognition of what is intended in the context. A word usually indicates several ideas, depending upon its use and the other words used next to it. When a word is used in a certain place or context it evokes one meaning; when used

32Reader's Digest, May, 1955, p. 52.
**Experiences.** The Experience Method of teaching reading relates beginning reading to group and individual experiences. The teacher and pupil share in planning projects which furnish the reading materials. The fundamental purpose of the project, however, is not merely to provide reading materials, but to help children develop adequate concepts while participating in meaningful worthwhile activities. These social and academic activities often demand that the child learn by reading and thus, the act of reading becomes a thought-getting process rather than mere word recognition and pronunciation.

It is apparent that one achieves meaning in reading only as he has concepts or meanings to associate with printed symbols. Printed symbols do not give meaning to the reader, they merely supply a stimulation for the recall of familiar concepts. The reader then uses these familiar concepts and/or combines them to build new concepts and thus develop meanings. The quality of the meaning depends upon the richness and accuracy of concepts the individual possesses. Since one's concepts are the source of meaning in reading, the most fundamental task in the developing of adequate reading skills is the building of many accurate concepts.

**Experience charts.** After the children have participated in an experience, which may be one or several of a number of activities, such as: a trip, dramatization,
discussion and planning, evaluating, a science experiment, art work, sharing, reflective thinking, an experience chart or story which expresses in a logical and interesting manner the content of the experiences is developed. These charts are developed cooperatively by teacher and pupil discussing, planning, and evaluating the content to be expressed in written form.

These experience charts may take the form of:

1. A story
2. A scientific experiment
3. Diary of events
4. Objectives of behavior
5. Vocabulary or dictionary chart
6. Direction chart
7. Counting chart
8. Room helpers
9. Plans - such as What We Know, What We Want to Learn
10. Charts - such as temperature, time needed for plants to grow, weights, etc.
11. Daily events
12. Spelling chart
13. Local news
14. Color chart
15. Creative writings
16. Log of activities.

At the beginning of the year, short experience stories containing only two or three short sentences of a few words are appropriate. As the children from their own experience stories begin to understand what the reading process involves and recognize individual words, the stories become more complex.
Selecting and developing the story: Principles of chart construction are:

1. The story should develop from an area of interest to the children.
2. The content of the story should result from cooperative teacher-pupil planning.
3. Common ideas should result from an analysis of group information.
4. The story should be balanced - that is having a beginning, middle and ending and be complete.

Organizing the story:

1. The content should be child-like in expression.
2. Each statement should be a complete sentence.
3. Content should be academically correct.
4. Ideas should be expressed clearly and in correct English form.

Construction of the chart:

1. Charts should be attractive from the standpoint of
   a. Neatness
   b. Balance - In the beginning charts are composed of one-line sentences. These sentences should all begin evenly on the left-hand side of the paper. Later each sentence takes a paragraph form; then the indentures are in line and the balance of the sentences which follows on the return sweep begins evenly on the left-hand side. This keeps the same form as that followed when the child is able to read longer paragraphs.
   c. Illustrations - Illustrations are placed at the top or bottom of the page. They may be pictures from the magazines, teacher or pupil illustrations. They should contribute to the enjoyment or ease of thought-getting of the chart. It is important that the center of attention in the illustration be in or near the center of the

picture. If it is too near the right of the picture it has a tendency to carry the eye and therefore the attention out of the picture. Simple mountings or border lines add to the attractiveness of the illustration and balance of the chart.

d. Subject matter - Charts should deal with children's recognized interests and needs. It is important that the concepts expressed grow out of children's emerging experiences. They must be appealing to the age group using the chart.

2. Charts should be sound in composition by
   a. Being child-like
   b. Being complete in sentence structure
   c. Expressing accuracy of ideas
   d. Expressing clearness of ideas
   e. Appealing dynamically through movement, color, sound, rhythm, and ideas.

3. Charts should facilitate the establishment of the mechanics of reading by being careful of, and consistent in, the use of
   a. Thought phrases
   b. Position of return sweep
   c. Context and picture clues
   d. Dynamic interest factors
   e. Repetition of vocabulary, phrases and concepts.

Suggested mechanics of chart construction: If the chart is to be hung on the wall and used by the children as they sit in their seats . . . the type should be between one and one-half and two inches in height. If the chart is to be used in the group, the type should be about one inch in height, and if the chart is used at closer range, print one-half or three quarters of an inch may be used.

1. Place illustrations at the top or bottom of the story or, as in dictionary charts, to the right side.

2. Place the title three inches from the top and well-centered.
3. Begin the first sentence three inches from the title.
4. Leave a one and one-half to two inch margin on the left-hand side of the chart. Keep the right-hand side even and uncrowded.
5. Leave three inches between each line when first beginning chart work; later it may be desirable to decrease that space.
6. Space words one inch apart.
7. Consider each sentence a paragraph and indent as a regular paragraph. As a child gains reading skill, longer paragraphs are desirable.
8. In the beginning break lines between phrases only. Since charts are used primarily for oral reading, phrase ideas just as the child naturally talks.
9. Words should be undivided.
10. Beginning teaching charts should be printed.
11. If using manuscript writing be careful of the proportion and spacing of the letters. See a good manuscript manual for guidance.

Developing sight words: A resourceful teacher can give help to children in acquiring a meaningful stock of sight words. The following suggestions have been made by Artley.

1. Underline the new word as it is included in the reading chart.
2. Use different colored ink or crayon to set the word off in quotation marks or parentheses.
3. Follow the word with a synonym, as "A caterpillar or fuzzy worm."
4. Include appropriate similes in the sentence or following sentence, as "The kite flew like a bird."
5. Add a phrase which interprets the meaning, as "Fishermen haul a seine, a long net."
6. A short explanation can be included in parentheses or a footnote, as "We saw a ram (father sheep)."
7. Avoid ambiguous or abstract words.
8. Select such accompanying words that the meaning of the new word is directly clear, as "The sail is a large cloth that holds wind."

55A. Sterl Artley and Lena M. Horton, Your Child Learns to Read (Chicago: Scott, Foresman and Company, 1953).
9. Explain the word directly in the following sentences as, "The submarine is a boat. It can move under water."

10. Use pictures, models, and verbal explanation.

Through the Experience Method of teaching beginning reading, a wealth of meanings may be acquired from even one short trip, a single experience with finger paint, or weighing a guinea pig. Quite an extensive vocabulary may be developed in relatively short time as successive experiences are discussed, organized, and written in chart form. A major advantage of the Experience Method, pointed out by many specialists in reading, is its adaptability to local needs and interest.

**Word recognition techniques.** The Experience Method does not recognize one technique as the most effective method of word attack but several. The methods by which the child identifies partially-known words are numerous and the techniques used not only vary between individuals, but combinations of methods may be used by the individual.

**Book reading.** Besides the reading of experience charts the Experience Method emphasizes the use of various books. This method does not require a class to read all of any one basal reader. Sometimes a whole book is read but more frequently only parts of various books are read. Extensive reading is done as selections are found which lend themselves to individual or group activities.
Children are introduced to books as soon as they show a readiness for book reading. From the beginning the child is encouraged to look at books; if he finds a few words he can read in these books, he is asked to read them to the class and is praised for his ability.

Book reading is introduced in the following manner: Preliminary to the reading of a book a chart story is printed on 12" x 18" paper. This reproduced chart then can be held in the lap and read as it is difficult for a child to master the art of holding a book, turning pages, and interpreting printed symbols, when such an act is suddenly demanded of him. After the children have mastered the skills necessary to handle such material, the teacher may introduce a book. The content of the book is most often related to the unit being studied. The teacher might show the class such a book (or a group of books), the title of which indicates that it is concerned with the unit. The children are encouraged to read the title. They discuss what the book might say and a desire is created to read the book. The teacher and pupils then discuss the pictures.

Techniques often used to assure reading success are:

1. a series of charts is used to introduce the material,
2. the charts developed as a result of an experience which parallels the subject-matter content of the book are placed
in booklet form and read before the children attempt to read the book, (3) a copy of the book may be taken apart and each page which may prove troublesome is placed on a chart in the position of a picture. Later the pages may be duplicated and read and compared with the original page.

After a certain fluency in reading has developed, readers and different books are used for general class activities. The material read by individual children may be read to the class to answer a question, or for pleasure, be dramatized, serve for speed or comprehensive tests, provide material for a written or oral report, supply resource information needed for planned projects, etc. Thus, the children are provided with an opportunity to secure facts in regard to a particular problem, analyze material to select main points, compare various statements, reorganize content, arrive at conclusions, summarize or outline.

No basal text book: In the Experience Method the reading materials do not depend upon a textbook, but numerous books and written individual and group reports of experience. Thus, individual differences in interests and ability are provided for by the content of the material written and books which supplement this material.
Using the Experience Method
in a Classroom Situation

(The children have a guinea pig in their room which they feed, water, care for, and observe. Phrases of this experience are used as the basis of this story. Many other experience stories are created around "Sammy" and many other experiences provide the occasion and the material for other stories.)

Teacher: "Now that the committee has taken care of Sammy's needs for the morning, would you like to make a story about what they did?"

James: "Yes, I know something to put in it!"

Irma: "I know something, too.

Bill: "No, let's work on our town." (A model village the children are building is in a corner of the room.)

Jack: "No, I think we should make a story about Sammy. The second grade made a story about their pet."

Susie: "They fed him!"

Donna: "Let's write about the time Sammy ran away!"

Teacher: "We will write about taking care of Sammy now and later do these other things. . . . What shall we call our story?"

(There are many suggestions, some good, some irrelevant. The teacher writes several of the most suitable on the chalkboard, reads them, engages in discussion with the children about them.)

Connie: "Let's call it, 'Taking Care of Sammy.'" (A majority agree. The other titles are erased and discussion centers on what to say first in the story.)

Teacher: "How about starting by telling who Sammy is?"
(The children consider this, agree, and begin by offering suggestions. The teacher considers all, refers them to the group, occasionally re-wording to make sentences more clear, brief, and direct, and guides the children to a choice.)

"Are we agreed now?"

(Writes "Sammy Is Our Guinea Pig.")

Edgar:  "We always give him fresh water first."

Teacher:  "I believe that's right. How can we say that so it is easy to read, but says what we mean?

(Several suggested revisions are offered and considered. A reversion is agreed upon and the teacher writes, "Sammy needs clean fresh water. We give him fresh water every morning."

Several Children:  "We clean out his pen."  "Yes, 'n we've fed him, too."  "He likes cabbage."  "And lettuce!"  "I think he ought to eat more carrots."  "Au, who likes ole carrots."  "They're good raw."

(The discussion rapidly moves off on several tangents. The teacher begins to retrieve it.)

Teacher:  "How often do we clean out Sammy's pen?"

(Various responses are recognized. After discussion, it is agreed to write):  "We clean Sammy's pen. Sometimes we clean it every day."

Several Children:  "And we feed him."  "Yes, we don't have nothin' in there 'bout feeding him!"

(And similar comments. The teacher guides the consideration of the various proposals, then writes):

"Sammy eats lettuce. He eats carrots, too. We feed Sammy every morning."

Paul:  "I like Sammy. I think that ought to be in it."

(The idea is discussed; the "I" is changed to "We" and the teacher writes:  "We like Sammy. He likes us. We feed him. We give him clean water. We clean Sammy's pen." The chart now reads):
CHAPTER I

THE PROBLEM AND ITS SETTING

For the past fifty years, at least, there has been active consideration of strengths and weaknesses of reading methods, particularly in reference to programs of beginning reading. Great changes have occurred in the psychology of learning, and vast numbers of researches in reading have been done. As research yielded new data on reading processes, as definitions of reading were broadened, and as conceptions of the psychology of learning advanced, different methods of teaching reading were developed to satisfy them. One difficulty has been that the new methods have not replaced the old, but have existed side by side. Today a greater diversity in methods of teaching reading is represented in school practices than ever before.

The Purpose of the Study

Lack of agreement concerning methods of teaching reading is most pronounced in programs of beginning reading. David Russell reports that a summary of responses of one hundred twenty-five well-known reading specialists to a questionnaire on the primary reading program indicates more
In another context it suggests or evokes another meaning. For example, consider what happens to the word dog when one puts the word hot in front of it.

When words are put together in a sequential order, as in a phrase or sentence, a certain definite meaning is intended. The purpose of the reader is to secure or identify the meaning. Thus, the reader must be thinking all the time he is looking at the words. This thinking includes reviewing the several possible meanings of each word, comparing them with the meanings of the previous words in the phrase or sentence, selecting the most likely or reasonable meaning, and fitting it into the context. At the same time, the reader decides what meaning is intended and prepares for the next words and ideas of the text. If the meaning is familiar, recognition of the words and sentences is easy, rapid, and accurate. If the words are not in the reader's vocabulary, the basis for identification of meaning is small, indeed, for the reader must estimate from content. Context determines the meaning of words equally as much as recognition of the words determine the meaning of the context. The difference between what a mature reader sees and what he recognizes in meaning is supplied by his remembered experience and the thoughts focused upon his reading. "Some one has well said that words are like panes of glass, to be looked through, not
Taking Care of Sammy

Sammy is our guinea pig.
Sammy needs clean fresh water.
We give him fresh water every morning.
We clean Sammy's pen.
Sometimes we clean it every day.
Sammy eats lettuce.
Sammy eats carrots, too.
We like Sammy.
He likes us.
We feed him.
We give him clean water.

(The teacher reads the chart through; calls on various children to read as much as they can, offering help where needed. The different words are written in another section of the chalkboard. A number of children are asked to read single lines, identify particular words, etc. Later the children draw pictures to illustrate the story. The teacher copies the story in manuscript writing on large chart paper, makes a duplicate chart to cut into strips for use in a chart container (the slotted strip holder is called a Garboard Chart or Plymouth Chart) and puts a miniature copy in manuscript on a stencil, to make a copy for each child. These may be illustrated and filed to be made into individual books later.)

Reading Programs Based upon the Experience Method

It appears as if the Experience Method of teaching reading is extensively used as an introduction to the reading process, though few schools continue this method through the elementary level. Most primary teachers use the experience charts for reading instruction before introducing the assigned Basal Readers to the class. After this introductory procedure, experience charts are often discontinued.
Numerous schools, however, make use of experience charts at all levels to develop readiness, motivate study, and supplement reading material. At the various grade levels experience charts are used to express such ideas as:

1. What we know about the subject being studied.
2. What we want to find out.
3. Materials needed.
4. Committee lists.
5. What we want to make.
6. Directions for making a project.
7. Where we want to go.
8. What we want to see.
9. Questions to ask on an excursion.
10. Rules for good behavior and study habits.
11. Work plans.
12. Record of events.
13. Diary or daily development of activities.
14. Reports of information gathered.
15. Scientific experiments.
16. Class newspaper.
17. Color and number charts.
18. Picture dictionary.
19. Spelling words.
20. Progress report.
21. Creative work.
22. Weather reports.
23. Room helpers.

There appears to be an increasing emphasis being placed upon teaching reading through meaningful experiences. Instead of a single reader-text for every child, a wide range of reading materials is provided so that each child may be suited in ability, interests, and needs.

Advantages of the Experience Method

The Experience Method of teaching beginning reading has many values. The chief advantages are: (1) reading is emphasized as a thought process, (2) the relationship between
oral language and reading is emphasized, (3) reading is directly related to other areas of the curriculum, (4) correct reading habits are established, (5) correct reading attitudes are encouraged and, (6) informal appraisal of individual readiness for systematic instruction in reading is provided.

Emphasis is placed on reading as a thought process. When words stand for events or things which have been experienced, children understand from the first that reading is getting the thought from the printed page. Thus, learning to read is developed in a natural order, i.e. from facts or experiences to symbolization. 56

Emphasis is placed on relationship between oral language and reading. Experience stories emphasize the relationship between oral language and reading. The child is introduced to reading in a natural and relaxed manner through oral communication. The early chart stories, whose content expresses individual and group experiences, are composed by the children. As these early charts are expressed in the vernacular speech pattern of the child, the child's basic reading vocabulary is composed of expressive, meaningful words rather than uninteresting and often meaningless words taken from a so-called basic vocabulary list.

56 Betts, Foundations of Reading Instruction, p. 423.
Reading is directly related to other areas of the curriculum. In the Experience Method the reading activities are definitely related to other areas of learning. Reading is recognized as a part of all activities and becomes an integrated part of the school's total curriculum. The topics included in the charts cover a wide range of experience and provide such integration that the child is helped to see the relationship of his various school subjects as well as relationship between academic knowledge and everyday living experiences. In the Experience Method the child reads to learn. In consequence he acquires much information in this learning process which can be applied to many fields of academic learning such as, map reading, oral and written reporting, observation, art in making a frieze or clay model, etc.

Emphasis is given to correct reading habits. Correct habits in the mechanics of reading are established at the beginning. The use of charts develop such skills as left to right eye-movements, accurate return sweeps from the end of one line to the beginning of the next, the reading process from top to bottom of a page, sentence sense, auditory and visual discrimination, association of meaning with the printed symbols, and the reorganization of ideas in the light of new concepts gained.
Well-made charts also reduce near-point reading. There are some data to substantiate the notion that excessive book reading tends to induce near-sightedness and to interfere with the development of efficient two-eyed seeing habits.  

Emphasis is placed on correct reading attitudes. Wholesome attitudes toward reading are encouraged. Methods of teaching beginning reading which stress mere word recognition fail to develop the attitude that reading is a purposeful and meaningful activity. Experience charts which develop from activities make reading pleasant and useful. Through the study of such materials children learn that reading is a thought getting process. The child can experience early success in reading interesting and yet simple material which is meaningful to him. Thus, children readily comprehend the connection between printed text and knowledge he already possesses. It also provides an understanding of when reading may be used profitably as a learning aid. The child learns to share his experiences with other children. As this cooperation is encouraged, the children have an opportunity to help and learn from each other.

Provision is made for continuous informal appraisal. The development of the experience stories, and the preliminary discussion to writing the charts, provides the teacher with an opportunity to make first-hand evaluations of the child's

57 Ibid., p. 424.
readiness, oral language facility, social and emotional adjustment, visual discrimination ability, memory and eye-habits.

Limitations of the Experience Method

What are the arguments against experience reading? According to its opponents this method (1) utilizes content that is too restricted and difficult, (2) the average teacher is unable to produce desirable materials, (3) the vocabulary is too extensive, (4) memorization rather than reading is encouraged and, (5) spelling is disregarded.

Restricted and difficult content. Restriction of content to immediate activities may make reading less profitable - by postponing book reading. This delay may result in a problem in the transition from chart to book reading.

As the beginning reading materials are developed by the teacher and pupils from common experiences and activities, there is the limitation that the child will read only familiar content. McKee describes experience charts as being "insipid and dull to the great majority of pupils. It merely retells the child an experience he has had. It tells him nothing he does not already know quite well."\(^{58}\)

A second limitation of the beginning reading material is that the content expressed is frequently factual material.

---

Bond and Bond state this criticism in the following manner: "Another danger is the tendency to have the program somewhat over-balanced toward fact getting materials and thereby neglecting imaginative literary materials." 59

**Teachers are often not prepared.** It appears as if too much depends on the quality of "tailor made" reading materials prepared under the direction of teachers, some of whom may not be competent. It is claimed that the average teacher may not have the technological knowledge, the resourcefulness, and the time required to produce the materials needed.

**Extensive vocabulary.** The vocabulary is often too extensive without ample repetition of words already learned. Betts has declared: "The average beginner will have his capacity taxed almost to the limit if he adds four to six new words to his reading vocabulary every day." 60

Experience charts are developed through teacher-pupil planning. The words used to organize the sequence of events represent the speaking vocabulary of the class; however, as it is a cooperative enterprise it often represents the speaking vocabulary of the most linguistic children. The speaking vocabulary may exceed the reading vocabulary of the child by

---


60 Betts, Foundations of Reading Instruction, p. 425.
three or four years. Also, the vocabulary employed in the development of a given experience may not be practical or helpful when the child attempts to read beginning books.

**Encourages memorization.** The idea of sharing experiences and recording events and stories may promote memorization rather than recognition of words. "The use of experience charts is questionable to the extent that the child is encouraged to recite words from memory and to call that act reading." However, as the content represents familiar meanings the child can learn easily that printed symbols stand for ideas, and thus his task of associating sounds with the correct printed symbols is made easier. The child's first attempts in learning to read are not made more difficult by the necessity of learning the pronunciation of the words as well as the recognition of the printed word.

**Disregards spelling.** The charge is frequently made that the Experience Method of beginning reading tends to develop rapid, comprehensive readers at the expense of spelling. This is a spurious argument, but is so often heard that analysis of it should be made here. Basically, it is not an "either-or." The abilities needed to recognize, identify, and remember the appearance of words are common to both reading and spelling, but finer discrimination of parts of words and single letters is needed more in spelling than in sight

---

61 McKee, op. cit., p. 223.
reading. In most cases, the child who has difficulty in recognizing words he meets in reading is certain to have even greater trouble remembering the sequence of the letters when he attempts to spell it. On the other hand, a child who is a skilled and rapid reader may also have difficulty in spelling if his auditory discrimination is poor and he utilizes context to a great extent in reading. Peake has reported that correlations between scores on spelling tests and on reading tests consistently fall between .80 and .85, which is rather high.\textsuperscript{62} Such close relationships indicate that good readers tend to be good spellers and that poor readers tend to be poor spellers, regardless of the method of beginning reading.

Present Status of the Experience Method

The present evaluation of the Experience Method indicates that the use of a unified activity program is effective as a vehicle for teaching beginning reading. A limitation of this program as shown by the judges\textsuperscript{63} was in the area of evaluation. The scoring showed that although provision is made for evaluation it is inadequate. Also criticism is directed toward: (1) vocabulary development, (2) progress

\textsuperscript{62}Nellie Peake, "Relations Between Spelling Ability and Reading Ability," Journal of Experimental Education, IX (December, 1940), 192-193.

\textsuperscript{63}Appendix, p. 580-581.
toward objectives, and (3) balance of recreational, informational, and work type reading activities. Because of the superior rating received by this method, Table XXI on the following page, is presented.

Research Findings

The most-quoted direct criticism of the Experience Method is that of Stone, who charged that "there is abundant evidence in research studies" to show that the Experience Method is "producing non-readers and seriously retarded readers in such numbers as to cause real concern to those who are willing to look facts in the face. . . ." Stone further stated, "I know of some schools where the plan has been tried with unsatisfactory results." However, he cites only one research study whose results he interprets as negative to the experience-activity approach. That study, carried on by J. Murray Lee, was a survey of activity-reading programs in selected first-grades in California schools. Lee concluded that children in first-grade in "schools reporting a great deal of activities" were definitely retarded in reading. Smith later analyzed the study and pointed out a number of

---


to be looked at." In identifying the words in reading, the reader's intelligence supplies what eyes fail to see and in many cases, do not need to see. Recognition and identification are mental activities. To be a successful reader, one needs a broad, rich background of experiences in order to build a store of meanings, and much practice in deducing words from content clues. Words like persons are known by the company they keep.

---

TABLE XXI
EVALUATION OF THE PURPOSEFUL METHOD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Values*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* (5) most satisfactory, (2) satisfactory, (1) provided for but in an unsatisfactory manner, and (0) not provided for.
defects, chief of which were that the sample was not representative, the quality of teaching was not controlled, and that judgments on method based upon the first year's work alone are premature. That judgments at the end of the first year are not valid is supported by a tremendous amount of experimental research. The weight of evidence is against Lee, showing that a program of delayed formal reading, based upon direct personal experience, results in children being below standard norms at the end of the first year, below or equal to norms in second and third, and above standard norms in the intermediate and upper grades. Lee, exercising the right to change one's position in light of additional evidence, came out strongly in favor of a readiness program and the experience approach in a later book.

That some cases at the end of the first year show the superiority of the experience approach, with delayed formal reading over the conventional practice of immediate work with books, is evidenced by a carefully conducted experiment in Public School 500, Manhattan, New York. Gates and Russell


compared matched groups of first-grade children with I.Q.'s between 75 and 95. Group 1A was given conventional book-reading upon beginning school. Group 2B was given an admirable activity program adjusted to the interests and needs of the pupils, but devoid of formal instruction in the school subjects as such for the first semester. During the second semester the experimental group was given formal instruction in reading, corresponding to the methods used with the control group. Appraising the experiment at the end of the year, the authors concluded: "In general, it is clear that as a group the pupils who had the advantage of a half-term of pre-reading schooling reveal a superiority at mid year which becomes more pronounced at the end of the year." In further support of the value of social experiences in building a foundation for beginning reading in these children with below-average I.Q.'s, Gates and Russell state:

The writers, in the light of all the limitations and special needs of these children, are inclined to think that a full year of time might profitably have been spent in activities designed to help these handicapped pupils understand and adapt themselves to each other, their homes, parents, and companions and the complex city environment in which they lived, and to their school, without formal instruction in the skill subjects.

Children with average and superior intelligence benefit even more than the intellectually handicapped, from

---

69 Ibid., p. 326.  
70 Ibid., p. 328.
readiness experiences and informal methods. This has been shown by a number of studies of which the research by Loomis is typical. To avoid the influence of non-controlled factors, especially the effects of instruction by Alphabetic, Word, and other part methods of teaching reading, Loomis limited her selection of cases to eighty-one children who had attended the elementary school of the Ohio State University Schools from kindergarten through grade six. All the children had been taught reading by the Experience Method, involving many trips, construction activities, and other direct experiences in the pre-reading program and in beginning reading. The continuing emphasis was upon learning to read by reading, for individual information and recreation, and in group activities. Summarizing the data Loomis stated: "Taking only the group of children with I.Q.'s from 90-110, their average reading achievement by the end of the sixth grade was (grade) 7.6." The child who was weakest in reading of all eighty-one cases had attained the fifth grade norm by the end of grade six. Loomis further concluded that, with adequate and appropriate experience in reading, "slow learners typically find themselves before they leave the intermediate grades."

---

72 Ibid., p. 178.
73 Ibid., p. 182.
Numerous scientific studies have been made concerning the vocabulary burden and range. Harris\textsuperscript{74} reports that, from his word count of the two tabulations (made by Lamoreaux and Lee when comparing experience charts and pre-primers), a total of 180 new words were introduced in twenty-six charts. This is an average of almost seven (actually 6.92) new words per reading chart, in contrast to an average of one new word per page of the pre-primers. Further comparisons disclosed that of the 180 words in the reading chart, 101 did not appear in any of the pre-primers, 19 occurred in only one pre-primer, leaving only 60 words that were included in the charts and two or more pre-primers. However, since the new-word rate was very low in the pre-primers, the charts contained most of the words that were used in the pre-primer vocabulary.

Lamoreaux's and Lee's tabulation\textsuperscript{75} of all words used in the twenty-six charts and those used in six pre-primers, \textit{Nip and Tuck}, \textit{Spot}, \textit{Tom's Trip}, \textit{Mac and Muff}, \textit{Tom and Don}, and \textit{Going to School}, found that of the 198 words used in the experience charts and the six pre-primers only 19 of the pre-primer words did not appear in the experience charts, but of the 177 words used in the experience charts 46 or about 25 per cent appeared in three or more of the pre-primers.

\textsuperscript{74}Harris, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 76.

\textsuperscript{75}Lamoreaux and Lee, \textit{op. cit.}, pp. 156-168.
The experience-reading charts selected for word count by Lamoreaux and Lee may be assumed to represent a sampling of the best applications of the method. Thus, indications are that teachers with less competence in preparation of experience-reading materials — such as selection of suitable trips and activities, recapitulating episodes, organization of plot sequence, and choice of words to tell the story — might have an even wider range of vocabulary. On the other hand, it is relatively simple and easy for teachers to make a master word-list from the published materials they plan to use, and to guide children's activities and story construction so that the charts do contain fewer words and repeat them more often. Most experienced teachers do that, with modifications to fit the special interests and needs of specific groups of children from year to year.

Once the teacher's thinking is lifted out of the text-reader rut, and rolls along the ground of individual children's processes of getting meaning, rigid vocabulary control appears much less important or desirable. This point of view is expressed clearly by Sister Richardine and Frank Wilson, who say: "In real life situations, where interests are natural and motive learning, the need for repetition is

largely supplanted by intensity of experience, and by much more extensive associations and integrations resulting from deeply satisfying experience." The authors of that statement were not merely theorizing in a philosophical vein, without reference to the difficult realities of classroom teaching. The statement was made on the factual basis of extensive experience using the method and after careful tabulation and study of words used in diaries and experience charts. Richardine and Wilson found the number of new words greater and the repetition much less in their experience charts than in any of the primers or first readers, as did Harris, and Lamoreaux and Lee. Differing from Harris, but in agreement with Lamoreaux and Lee, Richardine and Wilson saw no problem in the extensive beginning-reading vocabulary, because the words directly grew out of personal experience of high interest value, and because their meanings were deeply rooted in the experiences.

Many examples have been cited to show that the words used in experience charts are beyond the vocabulary level commonly used by any one child. No detailed scientific study could be found which investigated this assumption; however, numerous isolated incidents could be found. The example given by Bond and Bond illustrates the findings:
A group of 5 1/2 year-olds entered school for the first time. They set out to learn about the people who helped run this school. . . . They summarized their findings in this chart which the teacher wrote:

Florence is the cook.
She cooks good food for the children.
Mr. Ferguson is the janitor.
He makes fires in the big furnaces.
Gladys is the maid.
She helps clean our room.
Miss Bailey is the principal.
She answers the phone.

. . . there are five words which are probably beyond the sight vocabulary of children of seven or eight years. The word janitor is listed in the ninth thousand most frequently used words, as rated by Thorndike—so that children far up in the grades of the elementary school might be expected to have difficulty in reading the word janitor in reading material.

Studies regarding the superiority of the Experience Method over other methods have been attempted by many investigators. The following experiments cited appear to be a representation of the findings.

Gray summarized an experiment by Gates, Batchelder, and Betzner designed to compare an "opportunistic method" with a "modern systematic method" of teaching beginning reading. They used twenty-five matched pairs of first-grade


79 William S. Gray, "Summary of Reading Investigations (July 1, 1925 to June 30, 1930)," Elementary School Journal, XXVII (February-March, 1927), 456-466 and 495-510.
children and administrated an extensive battery of preliminary and final tests. The progress of the children was determined in reading, spelling, arithmetic, drawing, general information, and social, emotional, ethical, and other attitudes and habits. The data indicated that the "modern systematic method" resulted in superior achievement in silent and oral reading. On the other hand, the "opportunistic method" was superior in the development of interests, personal initiative, determination, and other personal and social attitudes and traits. The conclusion would appear to be that a systematic method of beginning reading consistently related to supplementary activities and continuing encouragement of wide reading would be more beneficial for the "whole" development of the child rather than either an "opportunistic method" or a "modern systematic method."

Wiedefeld, in an experimental study compared progress of two fourth-grade groups in knowledge and ability to read history. One group was taught by the usual textbook method, the other by liberal and flexible procedures similar to those of the broad unit, that is, the procedures designed to improve vocabulary, thought patterns, and background for concept development including discussion—planning periods, use of

pictures, play ground projects, brief walking trips and extended trips, outlining, note-taking, and the like. She found that the "experience approach" enabled the experimental group to advance more easily than the group taught by direct use of the textbook.

Wiedefeld's experimental findings are in agreement with Young's summary of a series of research articles which supported the conclusion that reading in social studies materials increases in meaning for a child after he has adequately related experiences to develop understandings of concepts implicit in those materials.

Section III

The Purposeful Method

Modern trends in education are concerned with general child development and with the maximum development of every child in accordance with his interests, needs, and ability.

The Purposeful Method of teaching reading is in accord with this educative concept. In this method special emphasis is placed upon reading as a purposeful activity. It attempts to meet each child at his level of development by providing reading instruction in connection with a central theme based on activities or problems, which promote personal interest,

81William E. Young, "Recent Research in Reading in the Social Studies," Education, lx (September, 1941), 18-26.
CHAPTER III

THE FOUNDATIONS AND CLASSIFICATIONS
OF READING METHODS

The variation and disagreement in beginning reading programs demand that consideration should be given to the foundations and classifications of the various methods so that consistently effective directions of the program can be determined. The following analysis may provide some aid in understanding the fundamental assumptions which affect methods and furnish materials for a sound reconstruction of reading programs.

Basic Philosophical Concepts

Philosophy has been defined as that "branch of learning which investigates the ultimate nature of existence, of knowledge, and of good—comprising ontology, epistemology (nature and validity of knowledge), and ethics." Thus, it appears that the function of philosophy is to consider "What is knowledge?" Educators' philosophical concepts regarding


control attention, and stimulate learning through the use of a wide range of interesting materials.

The method does not employ the use of any one basal set of readers, but instructional materials vary with the interests and maturity of each group of children. Reading is concerned with much more than the learning of basic skills. The Purposeful Method stresses not only word recognition but also such facets of reading as: comprehension, interpretation, analysis, and application of information.

Historical Development

Since the beginning of the twentieth century the pragmatic philosophy of education has brought about a new trend in educational thought concerning school organization.82 This new philosophy stresses reading as one aspect of a language art program and the utilization of methods of teaching which are consonant with this interpretation. Ideas often require a long time to grow into acceptance. As early as 1912 Gesell, the noted pediatrician, urged that "reading in the primary grades be an illuminating accompaniment to all the other subjects in the curriculum."83 He urged that

---

reading be presented in such ways that the child regard it as a means of explaining some of the interesting activities with which he comes in contact in an outside school.

The most influential professional volume which introduced this broader concept of reading to teachers and administrators was The Twenty-fourth Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education, Part 1 - Report of the National Committee on Reading. This yearbook pointed out that, from the standpoint of the child, reading instruction should:

1. Provide rich and varied experience.
2. Develop permanent interest in reading.
3. Develop the habits and skills essential in effective silent and oral reading.

Another yearbook which directed attention to the need for an interpretation of the reading process as a meaningful act, demanding clear comprehension of different types of presentation, interpretation, and application of facts according to purpose of reading, was published in 1937. The authors of this publication declared:

... a much more comprehensive program of reading instruction than has been provided in the past. It will not be sufficient to plan merely for the development of habits that underlie


accurate recognition, speed, and comprehension in silent reading, and fluent oral reading. Equally, if not more, important is the need for the development and refinement of habits of interpretation, critical evaluation, and the application of the facts apprehended.

This Yearbook Committee listed the following desirable trends: (1) increased interest in reading instruction, (2) responsibility of every teacher as a teacher of reading, (3) correlation of reading instruction with all subjects, (4) development of reading readiness instruction, (5) enrichment of reading program through the use of supplementary materials, (6) flexible organization of materials into units or areas of interest, (7) emphasis upon reading to learn rather than learning to read, (8) recognition of the child's interests and developmental needs.

Critical and purposeful reading was also emphasized by Witty and Kopel, William S. Gray, and Glenn M. Blair. It appears as if the acceptance of the principles of the integrated curriculum and broad units of experiences implies

86 Ibid., p. 28.  87 Ibid.
88 Paul Witty and David Kopel, Reading and the Educational Process (Boston: Ginn and Company, 1939).
the adoption of the Purposeful Method of teaching reading for such a program demands the teaching of reading as a functional process. Modern principles of learning indicate that much of the information should be obtained through self-directed reading for achievement of group goals, such as topics in broad units and through recreational reading. The aim of teachers using this method is not merely to teach children to read so they "cover ground" in the adopted reader text. Their aim is to teach children to read so they may feel at home, not only in a well-worn and familiar "reader," but with any book, magazine, or newspaper within their comprehension levels.

The Basic Assumptions Underlying the Purposeful Method

The Purposeful Method of teaching beginning reading is based on the assumption that reading involves a variety of functions which require that it be closely related to other activities and subjects. This means that there should be an organized program with the development of reading definitely planned. The curriculum should be arranged to provide favorable conditions for genuine use of reading skills and incentives for special development of those skills without isolating reading from other subjects in which it is used.
Description of the Purposeful Method

The organization of reading instruction suggested by the Purposeful Method evolves around the following facets: (1) the broad unit type of experience, (2) purposes of reading, (3) individual differences, and (4) materials of instruction. These are described in the following sections.

The Broad Unit. In the Purposeful Method of teaching reading the program is organized around every-day experiences. These experiences sometimes referred to as units, problems, centers of interest, projects, or broad units of experience. The activities developed in such frames of reference are carefully organized so that materials at various reading levels can be used in each grade level. The units are introduced through teacher-pupil planning in order: (1) that the interest patterns motivate learning activities, (2) that the needs of the children be considered and provided for, and (3) that purposes for reading be real to the child.

Under the Purposeful Method, both group and individual mental, social and emotional growth patterns are considered in arranging instruction in reading.

Definition of a Unit. There are both narrow and broad definitions of the term "unit." In the narrow sense the term designates a school activity of limited scope, such as a poem, a family of words, or a geographical region. In the broader sense the term implies an "educative situation
responsive to a felt (recognized) need in the child's life. Thus, a unit may include many topics related to a problem or a central idea.

The Dictionary of Education gives the following definition: "A significant, practical unit of activity having educational value and aimed at one or more definite goals of understanding; involves investigation and solution of problems and, frequently, the use and manipulation of physical materials; planned and carried to completion by the pupils and teacher in a natural, "real-life" manner."

Accepting the broad definition, a unit should be a study related to something that is of interest to the child, which promotes group and individual growth, and which yields personal and class satisfaction in accomplishment.

Characteristics of the broad unit. Burr, Harding, and Jacobs have listed ten major characteristics of a broad unit. These characteristics are:

1. It is centered upon a problem of living or area of experience worthy of careful study.
2. It develops in such ways as to be challenging, and vital to all the children.
3. It corresponds to the development and comprehension levels of the group.
4. It provides a variety of rich, first-hand experiences as well as vicarious experiences.

---

5. It includes a range of activities suitable to individual children, to small groups, and to the group as a whole.

6. It provides for and encourages socialization of the children, with sharing of uniquely individual learnings and with many learnings achieved in common.

7. It includes research type that can be done by children in the group.

8. It suggests and furthers the exercise of creative abilities.

9. It is a regular, essential part of the school's curriculum plan.

10. It provides for systematic though flexible practice in the basic skills through genuine application of significant problems and topics.

Children read for many purposes. The statements of two hundred and fifty teachers in different cities, summarized by Gray show clearly that children have a need to read in carrying out many purposes. Ten of the most frequently mentioned purposes for which reading is used are:

1. Associating ideas read with previous experience.
2. Finding answers to thought-provoking questions.
3. Finding the author's aim or purpose.
4. Finding the most important idea of a paragraph or selection.
5. Selecting important points and supporting details.
6. Drawing valid conclusions from materials read.
7. Selecting facts which relate to a problem under demonstration.
8. Judging the validity of statements.
9. Discovering problems for additional study.
10. Remembering and reproducing what is read.

---


It has been emphasized by experienced teachers that merely assigning lessons to be read by children is no guarantee that their comprehension will be increased. The child must have some reason of his own which directs his attention clearly to the meaning of the content. And, he must have some means of his own for determining whether he has secured the complete thought from a selection. Organizing his findings from reading and comparing them with the judgment of other children can be effective means. Among the motives for reading, the following developed from a careful study seem justifiable.

Searching for information: After group agreement upon a topic, committees are formed to work on related subtopics. Each child accepts an assignment to locate information for his committee. He organizes and reports his findings to the committee, which prepares intermediate or progress reports and final reports. Various committee members are chosen, by agreement of children and teacher, to present succeeding reports.

Sharing independent readings: Individual children occasionally present summaries of individual reading on a topic of personal interest. From reading at home or in the

---

95 Storm and Smith, op. cit., p. 45.
96 Ibid., pp. 46-47.
library, as well as in the homeroom reading corner, children learn interesting ideas. A sharing-discussion period should be set aside to share information gained.

Following directions: For a number of reasons, children need to read directions - plans for construction, as a bookcase or hobby horse; instructions for detailed drawings, as a doll, toy, or wigwam; stage directions for dramatizing a story or playlet; carrying on a process, as making butter or candles.

Answering specific questions: After discussing a problem and listing questions, the children read to find answers to those items. They may make notes of source and page where they found answers, copy the information, make abbreviated notes or outlines, write one-sentence answers, remember and tell answers orally.

Reproducing in artistic or dramatic form: The children, having decided to make a diorama or mural, single pictures or models, or to develop a play, read for background knowledge.

Creating and solving puzzles: Near the end of study on a topic, children read to find suitable pictures, sentences, and words for making puzzles and tests. After selecting and organizing suitable items, they read again to rearrange mixed sentences, fill blanks of completion exercises, rearrange and classify words under various headings, cross out or circle
words in multiple-choice exercises, lengthen word lists by adding more of the same classification, match pictures and riddles, rearrange events or processes in correct sequence.

Entertaining and recreational activities: The children find, in homeroom, school, or public library, or at home pleasure reading which they enjoy. Periods are set aside for them to share this reading in any way they wish. Some may read short passages orally, some may act-out enjoyed episodes, others may tell the story they have read.

Provision for individual differences. Even when children in a given grade level are sectioned on the basis of scores on both intelligence and achievement tests, the range of achievement in reading among children in the same section is large. No classification plan can secure homogeneity of reading ability among children in groups as large as the typical classroom enrollment. Hence, it is necessary that the method of instruction be adaptable to the range of ability actually existing, rather than being inflexibly applied with the assumption that all children are equally competent. One of the chief advantages of the Purposeful Method is its flexibility. While groups are busy with research, the teacher may join a small group of children whose needs are greatest and offer direct help. Committees may be organized on the basis of reading ability and needs, as well as because of common purposes. Various children may follow
the nature of knowledge are significant because such concepts are reflected in the conduct and objectives of school systems, attitudes of teachers, treatment of children, and courses of study. Mr. Chesterton in the preface of *Heretics* expressed the same idea when he wrote:

There are some people - and I am one of them - who think that the most practical and important thing about a man is still his view of the universe. We think for a landlady considering a lodger, it is important to know his income, but still more important to know his philosophy. We think for a general about to fight an enemy it is important to know the enemy's numbers, but it is still more important to know the enemy's philosophy. We think the question is not whether the theory of the cosmos affects matters but whether in the long run anything else affects them.\(^3\)

As far as beginning reading is concerned, two major philosophical concepts are important - theories of knowledge and applications of these theories to questions of value. The purpose here is to present a few historical facts which will help educators to understand the basic philosophical concepts underlying the various beginning reading programs.

Idealism, realism, and pragmatism may be considered the major classifications of philosophical theories.

**Idealism.** This system of philosophical thought makes the ultimate reality of the universe expressible only in terms of ideas. Values were superimposed by a Supreme Being merely to be discovered by man and be handed down to the succeeding

---

\(^3\) William James, *Pragmatism* (New York: Longmans, 1907), p. 3.
special programs of work which fit their needs. Different children can thus contribute ideas and facts, or read orally various materials at their levels which relate to the unit.

**Materials of instruction.** To adopt and develop the Purposeful Method, schools must be amply supplied with reading materials of reference, recreational, and supplementary types. Suitable materials are story books, books on history, books of adventure and travel, biography, geography, informational books on industrial processes, sources of supply, etc.

**Using the Purposeful Method in a Classroom Situation**

(The children through teacher-pupil planning and discussion had decided upon the problem: *How We Get Our Food.* On the basis of earlier committee work, outlines were developed. Committees were formed to read and work according to a master outline. The major objectives in reading as the teacher viewed them, were: to follow directions, to comprehend facts; to find answers to questions; to organize ideas; to read, think independently, interpret, and draw conclusions; to reproduce material read. Needless to say, these reading objectives were not announced to the children. Such a responsibility would merely add to their load. They had their own purposes.)

(Today the committee on farming was reporting. The seven children on the committee had brought books, pictures, and drawings.)

**Miss Purport:** "When you are ready, go ahead. We are waiting."

**Committee Chairman:** "Well, we all have been looking around, looking at pictures, and reading..."
Bill: "And we've been talking to people. I talked to my Grandfather. He has a farm."

Miss Purport: "My, this sounds interesting! Doesn't it, children?"

(All agree. Several immediately raise questions. "What does your Grandfather raise?" "Does he have any cows?" "Chickens?")

Miss Purport: "Oh, my! Just a minute. Let's have one question at a time. Better yet, we ought to let the committee go on with their report. They will tell us what they found out from their study. Then, we can ask questions. Many of us will want to read more ourselves about some of the questions."

Committee Chairman: "Bill looked for farm animals. Janet read about fruit. Ruth and Laura read about wheat and things like that."

Miss Purport: "That's a good idea, to organize them that way. If Ruth and Laura read about corn, oats, and such things, you would call their topic 'grains.'" (She prints the word on the chalkboard.)

"And what did they find out?"

Bill: "I found some pictures." (He passes around several pictures of dairy farms. These pictures are later put in a scrap book and under each is printed a sentence or two which has been dictated by the committee.)

Committee Chairman: "Go on and tell 'em what you read."

Bill: "Well . . . I read this book." (He holds up Grandfather's Farm.) Betty's grandfather lived on a farm. She visited him and saw cows, pigs, chickens, and a baby cow. She is called a calf. Then . . . there were sheep. Sheep have wool and also give us meat. Cows give us milk . . . and chickens give us eggs.

---

97 Helen S. Read and Eleanor Lee, Grandfather's Farm (Boston: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1928).
Miss Purport: "You have learned a lot, Bill. Did you read all that?"

Bill: "Well, I read some. But there were lots of hard words. I looked at pictures. Then I guessed. I guessed."

Miss Purport: "If you copy the words you can't read, some others in the class may know them ... I'll be glad to help, too. Remember that story you thought the class would like to read, would you like the class to read it now?"

Bill: "Yes."

(Bill had found a story about *Farm Babies*. The teacher had mimeographed copies of this story. These were distributed to the children and they read, first silently but helping each other with new words, then several children read orally selections they thought most interesting or an answer to a specific question.)

Miss Purport: "Now, Bill, what have you told us?"

(Bill tells a few facts. This is written on the chalkboard by the teacher and then read, discussed, and added to by the class. Several words are discussed. The teacher helps with additional explanations and illustrations. She then refers back to the committee chairman. He calls on several other children who present brief reports. The teacher notices that Gus, who is a non-reader, had found a picture book. On the other hand, Janet had found a selection from a fourth grade book. Both are encouraged to share their information.)

(Suggestions were given to the "farming" committee for further work. It was agreed that this committee would continue their report Tuesday at which time Ruth and Laura would show their seed collection and discuss how the plants were growing.)

(The teacher wrote on the chalkboard the names of several selections - at various reading levels - recommended by the "farming" committee for all to read. It was agreed that everyone would make a list of words he did not know - later to be put in a "master" list for class study.)

---

98 Oliver S. Hamer and Anna M. Hamer, *Our Farm Babies* (Bloomington, Illinois: McKnight and McKnight, 1934).
Advantages of the Purposeful Method

The major advantages of the Purposeful Method are:
(1) that it avoids the limitations of isolated word study and
(2) that reading is purposeful to the child, developing from
his interests and drives.

Avoids the limitations of word study methods. Gates\(^99\) has pointed out that word study methods are defective in
terms of principles of education as well as in terms of how
children learn. "Words learned in isolation are rarely
learned as well and as useful as words learned in context."
He further points out that study of isolated words can rarely
"without uneducative artifice," be made as interesting as the
learning of words in meaningful context. Study of separate
words in isolation violates the psychological principle of
concomitant or related learnings, of "killing several birds
with one stone." The results of non-purposeful rote learning
of isolated words is shown by the following story. To develop
vocabulary meaning, children were studying a list of words
and their definitions, then writing sentences illustrating
their use. Included in the list was the word "pregnant" with
the definition "carrying a child." After much puzzled thought
one child triumphantly solved the dilemma of showing its

meaning by a sentence. He wrote: "The fireman ran up the ladder to the burning home and came down pregnant."

Almost all words have relational meanings; that is, their meanings are clear only in relation to their verbal situational setting. Words are easier to learn when met in reference to a topic or task with which the learner is concerned. The job itself, the energetic interest of the child, and the context clues, all help the child to learn the word, to recognize and remember its form, pronunciation, and meaning.

Reading is purposeful to the child, developing from his interests and drives. Rather than following a vocabulary list slavishly, limiting the number of new words by diluting a story or by dull repetition, the vocabulary load is eased by using a reasonable number of new words in a series of selections. These reading materials - recreational stories, information essays and articles, and poems - are used from the very first introduction to reading. Amounts and proportions of each type, as well as difficulty, are varied on the basis of ability and interest. While free reading of a recreational nature is continually emphasized and provided for, the largest proportion of the material and attention would be related to a central topic or unit. For example, work on the topic "Neighbors Who Help Us," would involve reading informational selections, recreational or play-type
selections in a humorous or imaginative vein, poems and songs, and original compositions — both informational and imaginative — written by the children.

Locating and providing suitable reading material may seem a formidable task. And it is, especially to those who are unimaginative or lacking in initiative. No doubt, it is much easier and simpler to assign words from a vocabulary list and direct the children in a page-to-page plodding through a reader text than to locate materials which are really pertinent to the children's needs. While reading materials of the short, single-topic type are not available in unlimited quantities they are being provided in increasing variety by a number of publishers. The American Education Press has been a pioneer in the development of inexpensive pamphlet libraries.

Other important advantages of the Purposeful Method of teaching reading are:

1. The organization of children's reading around topics encourages children to start reading on the basis of their own interests and to further develop interest in a fundamental subject, rather than passing over superficial aspects.

2. The center-of-interest or broad-unit organization of the group's work enables the children to explore a subject with enough thoroughness to develop real understanding and genuine interest in it. If available, reading materials are sufficiently abundant and stimulating, the children's interest and activity is cumulative and usually carries them into a wide range of activities and projects.
3. Basing the reading upon significant topics and problems provides motives of real value for the reading of informational materials.

4. Since a large part of each child's reading is for the purpose of advancing the work of the group, the result is an encouragement to investigate thoroughly, read carefully, and discriminate carefully.

5. Working on the same topic for a long period of time, several weeks to a month or more, there is time for a variety of related activities which strengthen interest such as: contributing experiences and personal anecdotes, writing letters for information, bulletins, etc., writing original compositions, making booklets and poster displays, planning and presenting plays, constructing murals and dioramas, building models.

6. A high degree of flexibility is provided by the correlated or unit-type of organization. When a topic for study is agreed upon and accepted by the group it is carried on as a group enterprise. Outlining the topic divides responsibility and allows each child to contribute from reading at his own level.

7. More time is released for the teacher to work with individual children and with small groups. When reading is restricted to a single book, all the children tend to do the same thing at the same time. The teacher "hears" reading lessons in three groups of about a dozen children each, makes hurried corrections of mistakes or simply passes the reading to the next child who can do it - while keeping one eye on those doing "seat-work." The Purpose Method, well organized, eliminates the "busy work" and makes reading real and meaningful.

Limitations of the Purposeful Method

The major limitation of the Purposeful Method is that it requires much time, skill, and effort to select and adapt superior materials to the needs of individual children.
It is difficult for the busy classroom teacher to guide children in selecting good topics for units, organize, and supervise child committees, direct the many children in their varied activities, locate, arrange, and present appropriate reading materials, select the appropriate vocabulary, develop effective settings for introducing new words, provide adequate review, and satisfy needs of individual children for growth in all fundamental reading skills.

However, tailor-made materials prepared by skillful teachers have greater advantage in that they are adjusted to specific vocabulary and concept level of the group. They relate directly to the interests and goals of the children. They include local settings and events. With a little experience, creative teachers can develop "homemade" materials into "tailor-made" to fit the vocabulary needs, the interests, and the purposes of the children. An effective plan is to use both published and teacher-made materials. Rather than spend all the available funds on identical reader-texts for every child in a group, distribute the funds in purchasing a variety of materials, such as, enough basic readers so all may have some reading in common and which can stimulate discussion, and enable teachers to determine approximate reading level of each child; also supplementary books on a wide variety of topics, and chart paper and hectograph and mimeograph equipment.
S. W. Patterson\textsuperscript{100} reviews the limitations of the Purposeful Method in the following manner:

1. Requires extensive, careful, insightful planning; otherwise the necessary degree of definiteness will be lacking.

2. Frequently subject to the human tendency to become concerned with the entertainment of children rather than with their education in the sense of developing specific abilities and skills and of cultivating constructive attitudes toward learning.

3. Any looseness of organization, if not thoughtfully watched and sensibly guided, may lead to problems of disciplinary kinds which disturb learning.

4. Maintaining an educative balance between freedom, responsibility, and order is fundamentally necessary in democratic education, but requires a competent, mature teacher.

5. As a result of dilettante or amateurish interpretation by some teachers and critical jibes of others who, because of ignorance or vested interest, oppose it, in some quarters the method has become synonymous with time-wasting. However, as has been aptly said: "There is no reason why a good method should develop the status of a classroom rite." Intelligent teachers can adapt the method to their own strengths and the peculiar needs of their children.

Present Status of the Purposeful Method

According to the opinion of the judges consulted, the Purposeful Method of teaching reading provides for the majority of the characteristics of an adequate reading program in a most satisfactory manner. The characteristics provided for most adequately are:

\textsuperscript{100}Patterson, \emph{op. cit.}, pp. 208-209.

\textsuperscript{101}Appendix, pp. 583-584.
1. Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn.
2. Use of general configuration.
3. Use of striking characteristics of words.
4. Use of picture clues.
5. Use of content clues.
6. Emphasis on comprehension.
7. Emphasis on interpretation of material.
8. Provision for evaluation of material.
10. Application of information.
11. Reading speed determined by purpose.
13. Provision for oral reading.
14. Emphasis on depth of word meaning.
15. Provision for the development of readiness for reading.
16. Emphasis from the beginning on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to thoughtful interpretation.
17. Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading.
18. Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content.
19. Provision for developing permanent interests in reading.
20. Provision for individual differences in ability, needs, and interests.
22. Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading.
23. Provision for increase in vocabulary and content.
24. Provision for a planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs.
25. Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading.

In regards to the degree to which the method provided for (1) phonetic analysis, (2) syllabification and, (3) postponement of reading until readiness has been developed, there was disagreement. The following table illustrates the evaluation assigned to these characteristics:
generations. Plato, an extreme idealist, believed that in order for any material object to exist, man first had to have a mental image of it. Thus, to be consistent, Plato would have had to conceive the Christian God as the creation rather than the creator of man's mind. However, it was Aristotle's belief that ideas are the result of the existence of material objects and that God was the creator of all things, including the mind of man. This point of view became the cornerstone of Christian education and greatly influenced man's concept of mind and learning.\textsuperscript{4}

L. W. Harding states that the central idea in this philosophical doctrine is that matter must be moved and directed by a non-material agent. "To seek knowledge is to aspire to reproduce the thoughts of the Divine Mind."\textsuperscript{5}

Idealism regards education as a means and not as an end in itself. The end, according to this philosophy, is the increasing realization of the Absolute Idea for the individual and society. Education is the perfecting of humanity in the image of the divinity.\textsuperscript{6} Education was for life, not in this world but in the world to come. It was narrow in its scope and ignored the needs of the common man.


\textsuperscript{5}Harding, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 26.

TABLE XXII
CHARACTERISTICS AND PATTERN OF DISAGREEMENT
CONCERNING FACETS OF THE PURPOSEFUL METHOD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics</th>
<th>Values*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Provision for phonetic analysis</td>
<td>3 1 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the use of syllabification</td>
<td>3 1 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for postponement of reading until readiness had been developed</td>
<td>4 1 0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*(3) most satisfactory; (2) satisfactory; (1) provided for but in an unsatisfactory manner; (0) not provided for.

It appears as if this method has much to offer as a means or method for teaching beginning reading; however, it must be remembered that at all times the most important factor in any teaching situation is the teacher.

Research Findings

As has previously been said, the organization of reading instruction suggested by the Purposeful Method evolves around the following facets: (1) the broad unit of experience, (2) purposes for reading, (3) providing for individual differences in ability, and (4) meaningful materials of instruction. In regards to each facet, research has presented the following information:

Unit experience. The unit is organized around everyday experiences and provides an opportunity for each child to
study meaningful materials in circumstances which stress related areas of knowledge and applications of information. Although more research is needed several studies have shown that the unit approach of teaching is more effective than the traditional subject centered curriculum. Seagoe\(^{102}\) studied two eighth grade classes and found that the class using a unit approach to history and geography content was superior in retention and initial learning to a class taught by an isolated subject-matter curriculum. In regards to developing interest, attitudes, and basic skills, Collings\(^{103}\) found the fused program to be superior. In an extensive investigation involving two thousand students in Grades IV and V, Oberholtzer\(^{104}\) reported that students in a half-day fused program maintained not only higher ratings in the basic skills, but also rated higher in social skills than did children when taught in a "traditional" social studies class.

**Purpose for reading.** The Purposeful Method does not teach reading as an end within itself, but as a means to an end. Reading ability is developed in significant settings.

\(^{102}\)May V. Seagoe, "Qualitative Wholes: Classroom Experiments," *Journal of Educational Psychology*, XXVII (November, 1936), 612-620.


Research has shown that a number of important reading skills are not adequately developed by mere reading of stories and information. Such skills as reading to carry out our precise directions; to interpret maps, graphs, and tabulations; to outline arguments; to locate facts bearing on specific topics and practical problems; to analyze causes and effects; separate fact from propaganda; and the like requires specific practice motivated by the child's own reasoned interest.¹⁰⁵

Cruze has declared, "Motives are the cause of behavior, the why of activity." Many studies have been made in attempts to discover the relative efficiency of various types of incentives used in the classroom. The experiments of Hurlock¹⁰⁷ and Gates and Rissland¹⁰⁸ show the value of praise as an incentive for learning.

Besides the use of recognition or praise as a means of encouraging learning, research indicates that materials

¹⁰⁵ Gates, op. cit., p. 17.
¹⁰⁶ Cruze, op. cit., p. 269.
whose meaning is understood by the learner are not only learned more rapidly but also better retained. Ebbinghaus found that it required 16.6 readings to memorize a list of twelve nonsense syllables, and forty-four readings to memorize twenty-four syllables. Doubling the amount of nonsense material more than doubles its difficulty. However, doubling the amount of meaningful material does not quite double its difficulty. This was reported by Lyon, who found an average of six repetitions necessary to memorize two stanzas; five stanzas required 15.67 repetitions; ten stanzas required nineteen repetitions, twenty-five stanzas required nineteen repetitions, and thirty-five stanzas required twenty-six repetitions.

Learning is motivated to the degree that personal and group needs are satisfied. To promote learning, the learner must be permitted to help establish the goals to be achieved. Purpose not sheer repetition is the significant fact of learning. Numerous educators support this concept.

Reading which develops from practical activities -


social, constructive, artistic, dramatic, demonstrates the value of the skills of reading as useful tools for everyday use. As materials for reading are assembled and used by the children to attain their goals, the readers gain independence from the teacher's oral directions.

Providing for individual differences. In the Purposeful Method materials and activities are selected with reference to maturity levels and individual interest and needs. In any classroom children not only vary in abilities and interests but show marked differences within their own personal make-up. Among the most extensive growth studies which support this concept are the Berkeley Growth Study at the Institute of Child Welfare at Berkeley, California; the Harvard Growth Studies; and the Fels Research Institute at Yellow Springs, Ohio.

Materials. Meaningful materials are much easier to learn than unrelated meaningless material. By merging study, activity, and recitation, the teacher can promote pupil learning by making the material more meaningful. Ebbinghaus, as a result of his classic study of memory, established that the learning of nonsense syllables was only ten per cent as efficient as the learning of the same number of syllables of poetry in their natural setting.
English and his associates\textsuperscript{111} also found that meaningful materials are not only easier to learn but also are retained better than materials learned by rote. To be effective the teacher should provide children with an opportunity to understand and comprehend the meaning of the materials, as well as the relationships and applications of knowledge gained. Over emphasis upon verbalization often produces inaccuracies and errors in the use of concepts and generalizations. Numerous studies support this statement.\textsuperscript{112}


CHAPTER IX

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

The major problem of this study was to assemble in convenient space available information summarizing various primary reading methods and to provide evidence which may be useful in examining programs of beginning reading. The organization of the study was: First, a survey of the literature was made to determine the various beginning reading methods and programs. Second, the methods were classified as belonging to one of the following schemes: synthetic, analytical, and functional. Third, criteria were set up as an aid in comparing the values of the various methods. Fourth, various methods were compared.

Survey of the literature. A critical examination of educational literature dealing with reading methods and instruction identified fifteen methods of teaching beginning reading and numerous programs based on each of the fifteen basic methods. The basic methods were:

1. Alphabetic
2. Alphabetic-Phonic
3. Phonic
4. Phonetic
5. Linguistic
6. Word
7. Sentence or phrase
Classification of methods. The above listed methods were grouped under three major classifications, the synthetic, the analytic, and the functional methods. The subdivisions of these major classifications can be seen by studying the following table.

**TABLE XXIII**

**BASIC METHODS OF PRIMARY READING**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Synthetic</th>
<th>Analytic</th>
<th>Functional</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alphabetic</td>
<td>Word</td>
<td>Kinesthetic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alphabetic-Phonetic</td>
<td>Sentence or Phrase</td>
<td>Experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phonic</td>
<td>Story</td>
<td>Purposeful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phonetic</td>
<td>Silent Reading Approach</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linguistic</td>
<td>Picture Story</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dale</td>
<td>Non-Oral</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sonnenschein</td>
<td>Intrinsic</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Numerous reading programs are based upon these major reading methods. Those included in this study, classified according to basic methods of teaching beginning reading, are presented in Tables XXIV, XXV, and XXVI.
TABLE XXIV

READING PROGRAMS BASED ON SYNTHETIC METHODS
OF TEACHING BEGINNING READING

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alphabetic Phonic</th>
<th>Alphabetic-Phonic</th>
<th>Phonics</th>
<th>Phonetic</th>
<th>Linguistic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Horn Book</td>
<td>The American Spelling Book</td>
<td>The See-and-Say Series</td>
<td>The Pollard Bloomfield Reading Program</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The New England Primer</td>
<td>The McGuffey Readers</td>
<td>The Flesch Program</td>
<td>The Ward Reading Program</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The Beacon Reading Program</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comparative Analysis

As stated before, the test of any method is how effectively it sets the conditions for learning to read. To apply the principles of learning to the selection of a method of teaching beginning reading would involve the examination of the materials necessarily attached to the method and examination of the instructional procedure inherent in the method. Rejected would be those methods which require all children in the group to maintain an "even front" or make uniform progress. There is at least one year, probably a year and a half, and frequently four years difference in the mental ages of children in the normal first grade. It is a physical impossibility for all the children to progress at the same rate.
### TABLE XXV

READING PROGRAMS BASED ON THE ANALYTIC METHODS
OF TEACHING BEGINNING READING

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Word</th>
<th>Sentence</th>
<th>Story</th>
<th>Silent</th>
<th>Picture</th>
<th>Non-Oral</th>
<th>Intrinsic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bunstead</td>
<td>The Mo</td>
<td>McCloskey</td>
<td>Watkins</td>
<td>Curtis</td>
<td>McDade</td>
<td>The</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading</td>
<td>Murry</td>
<td>Program</td>
<td>Program</td>
<td>Smith</td>
<td>Program</td>
<td>Macmillan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Readers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Webb</td>
<td>Luke</td>
<td>Natural</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading</td>
<td>Reading</td>
<td>Reading</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program</td>
<td>Program</td>
<td>Program</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tower</td>
<td>Finger-</td>
<td>The Pro-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading</td>
<td>Play</td>
<td>gressive</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program</td>
<td>Program</td>
<td>Program</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summers</td>
<td>Aldine</td>
<td>Edson</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program</td>
<td>Program</td>
<td>Laing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short-Exposure</td>
<td>Merrill</td>
<td>Reading</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program</td>
<td></td>
<td>Program</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Elson-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Runkel</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Program</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### TABLE XXVI

READING PROGRAM BASED ON THE FUNCTIONAL METHODS
OF TEACHING BEGINNING READING

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kinesthetic Experience</th>
<th>Purposeful</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fernald Program</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Craig Program</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Beginning reading taught on this assumption would be primarily an abstract exercise. The basic teaching technique employed would be the presentation of letters and words in abstract, with little or no attempt to relate symbols and objectives. Understanding was the result of using innate ability in order to understand the Truth.

Realism. This philosophy was inspired by the progress of the physical sciences. It is a philosophical theory of the universe and man's place in it. It implies determinism, that man's behavior is governed by laws of nature, and that the Universe is an infinite machine. It presupposes a purely mechanistic view of life; however, the precise knowledge of the behavior of atoms leaves their intrinsic nature transcendental for our concept of a machine is essentially that of an instrument; it is not a creative power.

In this view, knowledge is the response of the individual to an object. In regard to the learning process it was assumed that the mind of the infant is a blank page (tubla rosa) and that every experience leaves its peculiar impression upon it. All such experiences come through the senses, and these mental impressions so change the character of the mind that following sensations are modified by them, but no sensory impression is ever lost. The more experiences made, the greater the impressions that will be built up in the "mind" in a chainlike manner.
Any method based on that assumption has failure for some children "built in" the system. Rejected also would be those methods which include public or direct comparison of achievement of children in the group as on a chart or graph, or public reading from common material. Such procedures tend to retard those very children who are in most need of success. Favored would be those methods or combination of methods providing sufficient flexibility that each child both proceed at his own rate and remain a contributing member of the social group. The method must contribute to self-respect on the part of each child and enable each child to identify his achievement and feel successful.

In order to evaluate each method of teaching beginning reading the following descriptive and numerical summaries of the basic characteristic factors of the synthetic, analytic, and functional methods are provided.

Descriptive Summary

The purpose of the following descriptive summary is to review the basic assumptions, principles, and techniques of instruction underlying the various methods of teaching beginning reading.

Synthetic method. In the many years that have elapsed since the synthetic method was first introduced in America a great deal has been learned about its use. First, the ability
to name and to recognize letters has little if any value in learning to read. Second, there are numerous similar sound elements in the English language. Third, over emphasis upon synthetic parts may deteriorate into a merely mechanical process of reading, devoid of meaning. Fourth, phonic skills should be kept close to the situation in which the skill is actually used. Fifth, reading is a complex process and phonetic analysis is only one technique of word analysis. Sixth, in order that consideration be given to individual differences and needs only those pupils who can profit from the use of phonetic analysis should be taught the necessary techniques. Seventh, a word-analysis approach should be used rather than the synthesizing of sound into words.

Theories of learning, developments in educational psychology, data from educational experimentation, ideas from child study programs, as well as the influence of teachers in leading public school systems, all indicate that mechanical methods will have a steadily smaller group of adherents until such methods are no longer used to teach beginners in reading. The Alphabet Method is even now an anachronism - incongruous and inappropriate in modern pedagogy. One recognizes the method with a sense of shock, when visiting an elderly teacher in a remote and isolated school. One then observes the teacher's personalized techniques in "spelling-out" the reading much as he would the technique used to crank a Model T
car, or a backwoodsman load a flint-lock rifle. All three -
the flint-lock rifle, the Model T, the Alphabet Method -
belong to a bygone era. That does not mean, however, that
teachers will not be asked to restore the Alphabet Method
to the classroom. For another generation or two at least,
parents will speak with nostalgic favor of the ABC method, as
they do of the McGuffey Readers, the Little Red Schoolhouse,
the old time school master who could teach everything (there
was so little to teach), the "mind-training" values of Latin,
especially as a means of learning English (because English
had been so poorly taught - and based on reading by the
Alphabet Method), and how valuable corporal punishment was in
character building - when thinking of an enemy who received
the whipping.

Many teachers, trained in a mechanical approach a
number of years ago, and uncertain of their competence in
modern methods, seem to suffer a sort of retroactive inhibi­
tion when invited to compare the various metho which have
developed. Some educators, guiding the professional prepara­
tion of prospective teachers, tend to resort to a kind of
strategic obfuscation as a means of escaping the penetrating
and troublesome questions of their more intelligent students
regarding the strengths and particularly the weaknesses of
certain favored methods.
All too often supervisors and administrators, somewhat necessarily engrossed in questions of security, develop a bipolar orientation with regard to mechanical and organic, silent and oral, direct and indirect, structured and unstructured, meaning and rote, whole and part, methods of learning reading. They tend to adopt a policy like that of the colonial schoolmaster applying for a position. As the schoolmaster was being interviewed and given an oral examination by the good burghers, one school trustee asked a shrewd question: "Do you teach that the world is round, or that it is flat?" The schoolmaster, both wanting and needing the school, thought rapidly. Deciding that the questioner was a fundamentalist, but that some members of the board had accepted the views of Galileo and Columbus the schoolmaster gave his answer: "I teach both systems," answered he, in a tone of unbiased conviction.

The supporters of every method of beginning reading that has been developed have argued that its efficiency as a method has been vitiated by compromises with earlier methods. Fortunately, most children persist in learning to read, in some fashion, whatever method is used and whoever teaches them. Sometimes, no doubt, they learn to read despite the method and the teacher. But there can be little question that more beginners would learn to read easier and better if all teachers of beginning reading developed their techniques,
selected their materials, and chose their testing instruments with consistent regard to scientific data on the relative efficiency of the various methods.

**Analytical method.** This method of teaching beginning reading is based on the assumption that repetition of experiences with the same word or group of words is learning or will inevitably result in learning if the repetitions are continued long enough. It has been pointed out by no less an authority than Thorndike, in whose name much "practice material" has been assigned, that "Repetition of a connection in the sense of mere sequence of two things in time has very, very little power, perhaps none, as a cause of learning."¹

Choices of methods should include consideration of the maturity of the child, the limits of their energy, and the effective length of their attention spans. An analytical method, which demands long periods of sitting at physically-passive tasks, lengthy stretches of listening to explanations, or extensive drill of monotonous character, is inconsistent with the known facts of physical maturation, mental hygiene, and the nature of learning. The span of children's attention is short. Time spent on any one aspect of reading should be brief for any given activity. Repetition should be spaced in

time to provide a rhythm of the child's work, relaxation, and play.

The ancient notion that "the mind" could be active and successfully "learn" while the body was passive or restrained continues to hang on and die a lingering death. Despite vast accumulations of data demonstrating that "mind" is a function of body, that learning is an organic process, and that memory and intellectualization are merely specialized functions of the higher brain center, children are still required to "sit still and study" to remain passively in their seats while sound-syllables are enunciated at them, while word-cards are endlessly flashed. After such long periods of passive "reception" the children are supposed to "read."

The wise selection of a method of beginning reading is based on the principle that learning is an active and continuing process, that the entire organism is involved in learning, and that true learning includes reorganization of ideas for use in new situations to meet new needs.

The case against rote procedures and against methods of learning reading which involves drill is clear. Less well recognized are the objections to drill methods for mentally retarded children. Typically, the teacher identifies those children making a slow beginning in reading or advancing much less rapidly than the average and immediately puts them in a "slow" group. For that slow group the teacher then prescrib
increased amounts of formal drill, with fewer books - even as little as one text - and a sharply limited vocabulary. This treatment is like putting an undernourished child on a more restricted diet; finding a child with rickets and bad teeth from a diet of corn pone, collards, and pork, and taking away the greens. These children do not need increased drill promoted by reading programs based on analytical methods. They should have physical defects therapeutically treated, emotional balance corrected, mental maturity strengthened, and positive optimistic attitudes toward reading developed through suitable experiences and simple materials which provide recognized success. The method of beginning reading finally adopted should be adaptable to many interests and uses; should allow and require extensive physical activities and motor responses; should utilize the goal-seeking behavior of its subjects.

A study of the basic assumptions, underlying principles, and characteristics of the Word, Sentence, Story, Silent Reading Approach, Picture Story, Non-Oral, and Intrinsic methods, shows that although aspects of such reading programs have advanced from the Model T, they have not yet reached push button control. These methods fail to provide for purposeful reading activities. They demand that the child fit the reading program, not the reading program the child. They demand a passive child with an abnormal memory ability.
The functional method. The most important factors in acquiring new words are insightful understanding of the word, and the comprehension of the various uses of the word or phrase. The child's useful possession of words in his reading vocabulary can be facilitated through providing a variety of occasions and settings for the word, so that new contextual relations, new meanings, additional associations of experiences with particular words are assured. Purposeful repetition with variety of clear contexts is the approach.

Almost all teachers agree that children learn to read something, rather than merely learning to read. That is, children should begin reading on the basis of its being a process of acquiring meanings rather than a process of naming word symbols. To achieve this would mean presenting interesting activities, ideas, and problems together with reading.

Surely everyone has observed that people tend to like those activities in which they are successful and to dislike and avoid activities in which they are unsuccessful. The "success theory" has been repeatedly verified as sound. The findings of experiments uniformly support the conclusion that achievement and praise are more effective than frustration and criticism or punishment.  

---

which involve extensive rote "learning" prior to comprehension of meaning violate this principle of learning. Those approaches, such as the functional methods, which utilize children's needs to secure information and to exchange or record information are in agreement with the nature of learning.

Children's learning is encouraged, made easier, and more rapid when it occurs in relation to a situation which is meaningful to them. It is desirable that the teacher so guide the situation that the materials of learning, in this case reading, be presented in terms of the larger meanings - a personal experience, a unified episode, a set of directions - so that the process of reading be clearly related to the logical whole. The approach may be modified later, for adjustment to special needs of individual children. This principle of learning is logical, as well as supported by experimental evidence.³

Children gain more meaningful associations of what they already know with the new words, contextual clues, and topic ideas being presented, when they can discuss their reading material as they study it; that is, before and after silent reading. The recitation, interpreted as socialized

activity involving use of the materials connected with the reading, encourages reorganization of skills and further integration of information helpful in reading. Motivation for effective reading in the Purposeful Method is provided by the social situation, and by feelings of group participation rather than by the teacher acting as a force outside the group.

From kindergarten to college, from reading about art or zymurgy, the school system is levelled to the mental powers of the "average." The conventional system is efficiently synchronized, with everything fitting into everything else. The flaw in perfection is the child. By definition only forty to sixty per cent are "average" and suitable for the logically organized, controlled-vocabulary, graded-reader program. The other half of the children are misfits and cause the gears to clash. But the trouble such children cause the school is as nothing in comparison with the difficulties such schools cause the children.

With the Functional Method of beginning reading, and with the upward extension of provisions for individual variations in reading and other abilities, a new type of student may be expected. One will be the child of less than average ability who is curious, sensitive to literature and to other art forms, informed in a number of subjects, and constructively aware of his own and some of society's problems. He will
This doctrine implies that reading is a mechanical process. "The realist would introduce the child to reading words as symbols having fixed, objective meanings. These would not be changed by the child's experiences with the printed symbols or the things represented." Learning to read was a matter of habit formation.

**Pragmatism.** The basic factors established and developed by the pragmatic philosophy is that truths are to be tested by the consequence of experiences. It implies that learning takes place through experience, but that thought guides and determines the action needed to bring forth or divert the consequence. Stress is placed on the interaction of an organism and his environment. The individual acting with an aim is acting intelligently. Hence, purposeful activity becomes an essential part of an individual's relationship to his problems. Purpose grows out of a situation that challenges interest, and interest is the drive that carries the individual on to a solution of his problem. The function of the mind rather than its definition is important. "Mind is precisely intentional purposeful activity controlled by perception of facts and their relationship to each other."  

It is then the province of the teacher to manipulate the

---

7 Harding, op. cit., p. 27.

have self-respect, self-confidence, and a socially effective personality. Being respected for the abilities he possesses and not having had his trust in the school betrayed, this "below average" child will "like school" and will grow to greater social usefulness in its guidance. Another will be the child of superior mental powers who is neither ashamed nor egotistical about his brilliance, who has not learned to loaf or "get by" scholastically, and who joyously uses his abilities in his own development and in enriching the understanding of his fellows. For such children as these, a good program of beginning reading will be a beginning in many other ways as well.

Numerical Summary

In order to determine the relative values of the various methods of teaching beginning reading criteria were developed to supply an element of definiteness. A jury of five experts were asked to indicate to what degree, (3) most satisfactory, (2) satisfactory, (1) provided for but not in a satisfactory manner, and (0) not provided for, the following characteristics were provided for in each method.

1. Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn.
2. Use of general configuration.
3. Use of striking features of words.
4. Use of picture clues.
5. Use of content clues.
6. Use of phonetic analysis.
7. Use of syllabification.
8. Opportunity for comprehension.
10. Opportunity to evaluate material.
11. Drawing conclusions.
13. Reading speed determined by purpose.
15. Opportunity for oral reading.
16. Development of depth of word meaning.
17. Development of reading readiness.
18. Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed.
19. Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation.
20. Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content.
21. Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading.
22. Provision for developing permanent interest in reading.
23. Provision for individual needs, interests and ability.
25. Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading.
26. Significant increase in vocabulary and content.
27. Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs.
28. Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading.

The following table shows the numerical values assigned to each of the fifteen methods considered in this study.
### TABLE XXVII

**SUMMARY OF THE NUMERICAL VALUE ASSIGNED TO EACH BASIC READING METHOD**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Numerical Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alphabetic</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alphabetic-Phonic</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phonic</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phonetic</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linguistic</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Word</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sentence</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Story</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silent Reading Method</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Picture Story</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Oral</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intrinsic</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kinesthetic</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience</td>
<td>395</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purposeful</td>
<td>413</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The numerical values represent the sum total of the various points assigned to each method, as derived by multiplying the number of judges by the value indicating the expressed degree in which the method provides for each facet of an adequate reading program. Such numerical value implies that methods assigned the highest numerical terms provides for the greater number of features assigned to an adequate reading program.

According to the numerical values assigned to each method, the following list shows the rank order assigned to each method in respect to how each provided the greater number of facets assigned to an adequate reading method.
Conclusions

The intent of this study was to develop a descriptive, comparative analysis of the basic assumptions, principles, and techniques of instruction underlying various methods of beginning reading. It was hoped that such an analysis might be helpful as an aid in interpreting reading programs to interested persons, in selecting a reading program which is in accord with basic principles of learning and child development, and in organizing reading instruction to meet group and individual needs and abilities.

Interpreting. These findings may furnish the basis of fruitful parent meetings and intelligent discussions among study groups. It may, however, be necessary to devise simple, ordinary terms for explaining such information to some individuals. Explanations which use the "language of the street" avoiding technical educational terms or "pedagese" and utilizing analogies similar to life-experience of the general
population are usually effective. For example, possibly Robinson's findings regarding why children fail in reading could be interpreted most clearly by the simple analogy of "breaking in" a new automobile. A mere tyro among auto drivers knows that of two new cars, even of the same make, the one that is broken in gradually and driven slowly for several hundred miles is the one which runs smoother and faster after the breaking-in period is over. The new car that is immediately speeded and made to pull hard usually shows the effects in its later service.

And of course, the analogy can be carried further. There are Fords, Dodges, Studebakers, Nashes, Packards, and Cadillacs among first graders. The same power and performance is not built into every child. Some auto makers have developed methods of "pre-conditioning" motors so the cars need no breaking in after delivery. The biological processes of parents are not yet so mechanically efficient! But good schools can reach one achievement to which industrial technology can point no parallel. Given the understanding cooperation of parents, financial support to provide reasonable pupil teacher ratio and adequate materials, and adequate coordination of curriculums at higher grades, the school can improve and increase the efficiency of the "human machines" in its care.
Selecting and organizing a reading program. This study indicates the following trends in the teaching of primary reading.

1. Increased flexibility in methods of teaching, techniques, and materials.

2. Instruction by "whole" methods - word, phrase or thought - rather than "part" methods - letters, sound, syllable, or other logical, analytical methods.

3. Reading increasingly considered a functional skill rather than a formal exercise.

4. Reading activities and instruction becoming more integrated with the entire school curriculum.

5. The single basic text for all pupils of grade-group having less place in the reading program than formerly.

6. A great increase in number and variety of books, magazines and newspapers used in teaching reading.

7. More and more teachers delaying reading until children show sufficient maturity to profit from direct instruction in reading.

8. Uniform assignment of same amount in same book for all pupils of grade-group, regardless of ability or other factors being displaced by individual assignments to meet individual needs and interests.

9. Individualized instruction increasingly used, especially with children at both extremes of ability range.

10. Less formal "driving" of pupils over artificial vocabulary.


12. Oral reading now generally recognized as essentially a dramatic performance, rather than "reading."

13. Silent reading coming into greater emphasis, as most-used type of reading.
14. Phonics, once seriously over emphasized, now falling into proper place, used as one practical aid in word analysis when needed.

15. Increasing efforts to stimulate and encourage children's interests which will lead to reading and be partially satisfied by reading.

16. Increased use of children's own experiences as referents for reading.

17.儿童's own speaking and creative writing increasingly used as reading material.

18. Programs of reading instruction more flexibly adjusted to daily program of the child in the group.

19. Increased attention to concepts, meanings, comprehension.

20. Achievement goals and standards in reading set up for children being increasingly practical and sensible.

21. Developing acceptance of policy of preventing difficulties in reading, as well as setting up remedial programs.

These trends may prove helpful in selecting a reading program which is in accord with basic principles of learning and child development. They are not limited in scope to a specific method, but are eclectic in nature. In regards to the value of a reading program which embraces many methods Gesell has declared:

There is no simple method of learning or teaching reading. There are multiple methods - visual, auditory, manual (kinesthetic) and phonetic - which should be used freely and variously and separately and in combination to suit the fluid psychology of the school.
beginner, and to do justice to the individual differences which prevail among all school beginners. 4

Recommendations

This study indicated the following problems which need further study and experimentation:

1. Will children learn faster when the vocabulary burden is kept relatively light or when it is made relatively heavy?

2. What are the relations of differences in intellectual power to types and amount of vocabulary in beginning reading?

3. What are the best methods for developing a sight vocabulary?

4. What significant relations are there between types of intelligence and types of method in recognizing word symbols?

5. What kind of errors are related to various aspects of phonic instruction?

6. What common, basic factors are involved in learning to read, or are the skills used in reading actually separate powers?

7. What interrelations exist between training in various reading skills? (Instruction in reading for detail may have a negative effect upon ability to scan for locating information or upon reading for comprehensive understanding.)

8. What skills in reading, if any, are beyond children of certain levels of intelligence?

9. What differences are there in the sensory imagery of different children reading the same material? What are causes and effects of these differences?

10. What methods of teaching are effective in developing and guiding imagery from reading?

11. What are the effects upon beginning reading to other media of experience in learning situations?

12. What are the relationships between reading and language? Reading and thinking? How are methods of teaching influenced by these relationships?

13. What are the difficulties of various kinds of reading materials?

14. What kinds of measuring devices are effective in making valid appraisals of comprehension and application of reading?

In addition to the above listed problems which need further experimentation, it is recommended that further study be conducted concerning the topic of this study, "An Analysis of Characteristic Factors of Beginning Reading Programs" because of the following factors limiting the present study: (1) the use of subjective evaluation in the interpretation of values of the various reading methods, (2) the difficulty of drawing clear distinctions between personal educational philosophy and simple statements of facts in the literature, (3) the number of judges used in evaluating the concepts and procedures presented by the various methods. A final reason for recommending further study of methods of teaching beginning reading is the continuing existence of contradictory research findings regarding the value of the numerous reading methods.
factors in the child's environment so that his interactions will be such that his interest is challenged. Then the teacher, in the role of counselor and friend, guides the child in his learning process.

Basic assumptions of this philosophical theory are:

1. That subject matter should be organized in large integrated units.
2. That opportunities should be provided for creative expression.
3. That the child learns by doing.
4. That opportunities should be provided for problem solving.
5. That activities should harmonize with the purpose of the learner.
6. That provision should be made for care of individual differences, needs, and interests.
7. That provision should be made for the developing of social and cultural understandings.
8. That skills should be taught in meaningful situations.
9. That evaluation is a continuous process.
10. That education is life.

In the learning processes this theory suggests that "... the relations that connect experiences must themselves be experienced relations, and any kind of relation experience must be accounted as 'real' as anything else." Knowledge became the tested result of experiences - each individual builds his knowledge through experiencing.

The selected criteria represent characteristic features of a well balanced reading program. Judges were asked to indicate the degree to which the various methods provide for the different facets.¹

Description of the Silent Reading Method. This method places emphasis almost exclusively upon procedures of silent reading, as no overt pronunciation of words is encouraged.

The materials suggested by this method include textbooks, supplementary books, perception and flash cards, and seat work activities.

The suggested teaching procedures are: the word or sentence is presented on the chalkboard or flash cards and its meaning explained to the children. They respond by picture-word matching; word, sentence, and story matching; sentence completion; and following directions.

The introduction of phonics is delayed until the children have developed a basic sight vocabulary. No definite program is given; however, it is suggested that any standard method which develops word sounding ability through the study of known words be used.

TABLE XXVIII

EVALUATION OF THE SILENT READING METHOD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Values*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>3 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>1 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>2 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>2 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>1 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*(3) most satisfactory, (2) satisfactory, (1) provided for but in an unsatisfactory manner, and (0) not provided for.*
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Numerical Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Total Numerical Value | 109 |

*Numerical Value equals sum total of the number of judges x assigned value for each facet.*
Description of the Picture-Story Method. By this method a story is told and illustrated by pictures. The children reproduce the story on a pad and then dramatize it. Words are studied by means of matching pictures and words, words and words, contextual clues, dictionaries, and silent and oral reading.

In this method after the story has been introduced and the words studied, two groups of pupils are formed: one an independent group of the more capable children, who progress at their own rate in building the picture story; and another, a dependent group, who will study one picture at a time under the guidance of the teacher. After a silent study of a story it is read orally to the teacher.

Phonetics are taught after the children have had reading experiences and serve as a means to an end; the end goal is reading silently for thought.
TABLE XXX
EVALUATION OF THE PICTURE-STORY METHOD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Values*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>4, 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>1, 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*(5) most satisfactory, (2) satisfactory, (1) provided for but in an unsatisfactory manner, and (0) not provided for.*
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Numerical Values*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Numerical Value</strong></td>
<td><strong>95</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Numerical Value equals sum total of the number of judges x assigned value for each facet.
Description of the Non-Oral Method. In this method from the very first an attempt is made to eliminate the sight-sound-meaning process and to substitute in its place the sight-meaning process. The intelligence learns to associate word meaning directly with the visual symbols. The child learns appropriate responses to print by observing the teacher's dramatization to the same print or by matching the printed symbol to its appropriate picture. No spoken language is used in this process. The materials of instruction are: flash cards (words, phrase, and sentence), dictionary (chart, picture, picture-symbol type), miniature objects, pictures, yes-no cards, and books.

Teachers using this method must plan to collect and devise abundant workable materials of adequate range and difficulty; and work out a complete installation of the individualized procedures. In individual work the child practices on a given exercise until he masters it.

Neither a phonetic or phonic program nor a beginning reading book is suggested in this method for beginning reading instruction. According to McDade's plan the child should be provided with an abundance of easy reading materials and writing is learned as a process coordinated with reading.
**TABLE XXXII**

**EVALUATION OF THE NON ORAL METHOD**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Values*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>4 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>4 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>4 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>4 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*(5) most satisfactory, (2) satisfactory, (1) provided for but in an unsatisfactory manner, and (0) not provided for.*
TABLE XXXIII

ASSIGNED NUMERICAL VALUES OF THE NON ORAL METHOD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Numerical Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total Numerical Value 101

*Numerical Value equals sum total of the number of judges x assigned value for each facet.*
Description of the Intrinsic Method. In this method the use of phonetic elements and phonic exercises are blended continually with a sight-recognition of words and silent-reading for comprehension. The reading activities begin with a few words, which may be readily arranged into phrases, sentences, and paragraphs to furnish materials for study which emphasizes common word elements, similarities and differences, and contextual clues during the process of normal reading work.

The materials of instruction are word-picture cards, word-picture dictionary, a preparatory book, basal readers, and supplementary books.

As the teaching procedures are set up the child is supposed to have seen, used, and understood each word in the Preparatory Book before reading the actual story in the Basal Readers, Unit Book or Supplementary Readers.

The reading selections of the Basal Readers are arranged under a series of topics which are supposed to stimulate reading interests and motivate related language activities and the re-reading of the selections.

The Preparatory Books also offer an opportunity to review and check comprehension after reading the textbook material as well as introduce new words.
In this school, a program of beginning reading stresses reading to learn rather than learning to read. "Reading would be introduced to children as a means by which they can achieve their own goals. They would gain skill with it through their own experiences and in such ways as it improved the quality and satisfaction of those experiences."  

Summary. The basic assumptions underlying methods of teaching beginning reading according to either the idealistic or realistic concept of learning are that (1) reading is an end in itself, (2) that the teacher is responsible for the pupil's acquiring knowledge, and (3) that children must be coerced into learning to read; while the assumptions underlying pragmatism implies (1) that reading is a means to an end, (2) that the student learns only that which he is interested in learning, and (3) an individual learns best when he is free to create his own responses to a situation.

Major Psychological Theories

From where do educators receive the principles of learning which they apply to programs in beginning reading? To answer this question the methods of teaching need to be considered in terms of the assumptions that support them. The assumptions basic to methods appear to be interpretation of psychological concepts in regard to how we learn. Unquestionably, an inventory of several schools of psychology

---

10 Harding, op. cit., p. 28.
### TABLE XXXIV

**EVALUATION OF THE INTRINSIC METHOD**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Values*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*'(3) most satisfactory, (2) satisfactory, (1) provided for but in an unsatisfactory manner, and (0) not provided for.*
TABLE XXXV

ASSIGNED NUMERICAL VALUES OF THE INTRINSIC METHOD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Numerical Values*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Numerical Value</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Numerical Value equals sum total of the number of judges x assigned value for each facet.
Description of the Kinesthetic Method. This method is based upon three basic instructions - first look at the word, then say it, then write it. The Kinesthetic Method as recommended by Grace Fernald proceeds in the following manner: (1) the child selects a word he wants to learn to read, (2) the word is written for the child with crayola on a large sheet of paper, (3) the child traces the word with finger contact, saying each part of the word as he traces, (4) the word is written without copy, (5) the word is used in original sentences and stories to be read.

The stories are to be developed around a central theme, studied and read in the following manner: Before the reading of each paragraph, each word which has not already been learned is exposed through an adjustable slit in a piece of cardboard. If the child fails to read the word, it is studied by the tracing manner. This type of study activity is followed by flash card drill using the new words and phrases. The child keeps a card file of all words learned, thus, the file provides the child and teacher with a record of all words studied.

After this extensive study the child is encouraged to read the material containing the studied vocabulary for comprehension. When an adequate sight vocabulary has been developed the tracing of words is omitted and a look-and-say
Description of the Kinesthetic Method (Cont.)
procedure is followed. The child at this stage is directed to specific characteristics of words and to recognize new words from similarity to known words or parts of words. Phonetic or phonic drill is not provided. As soon as the child has the ability to unlock words he is encouraged to read any story or factual information that interests him.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Values*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>3 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>4 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>1 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>1 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>1 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>1 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*(3) most satisfactory, (2) satisfactory, (1) provided for but in an unsatisfactory manner, and (0) not provided for.
TABLE XXXVII

ASSIGNED NUMERICAL VALUES OF THE KINESTHETIC METHOD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Numerical Values*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total Numerical Value 81

*Numerical Value equals sum total of the number of judges x assigned value for each facet.
Description of the Experience Method. This method of teaching beginning reading is based upon the following educational principles: (1) learning is a doing process, (2) learning progresses from the known to unknown, and (3) learning is a complex process which does not develop in isolation.

Reading instruction provides for (1) experiences, (2) readiness, (3) reading to learn, and (4) word attack techniques.

Experiences - A need for reading is developed by means of experiences or activities that promote a purpose for reading. As the children participate in experiences, numerous reading charts are written. These charts furnish the core of the reading program.

Readiness - The readiness program is a developmental approach that provides readiness for reading at all levels and in all subject-matter content. At the primary level it aids in learning to read in a left to right manner, encourages vocabulary growth, visual and auditory discrimination, and comprehension of printed symbols.

Reading - Besides the reading of experience charts this method introduces the child to books as soon as a child shows a readiness for book reading.
Description of the Experience Method (Cont.)

Word attack techniques - This program provides that children learn to use the following word recognition techniques: special configuration of words, similarity to known words, recognition of familiar parts, picture and context clues, phonetic and structural analysis.
TABLE XXXVIII

EVALUATION OF THE EXPERIENCE METHOD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Values *</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* (3) most satisfactory, (2) satisfactory, (1) provided for but in an unsatisfactory manner, and (0) not provided for.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Numerical Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total Numerical Value 395

* Numerical Value equals sum total of the number of judges x assigned value for each facet.
should help us ascertain the psychological assumptions underlying programs of beginning reading.

**Behavior.** This school of psychology has been concerned only with phenomena that could be observed objectively, and this observation had to be made by another person, thereby excluding any treatment of conscious experiences of the individual. J. B. Watson began this formal school in 1913.

The outline of behaviorism is (1) the subject-matter of psychology is behavior, (2) only objective methods are accepted as valid, (3) psychology has several objective methods at its disposal: observation, psychological tests, and verbal reports as possible symptoms of the conditions of an individual's reaction system.  

According to this doctrine "the brain serves to connect the sensory with the motor nerves and so link the sense organs with the muscles. Nerve impulses coming into the brain by the sensory nerves are instantly transmitted to the motor nerves . . . all behavior is sensori-motor. Thus, in this school of psychology, thinking is reduced to implicit motor behavior, and learning is the result of a conditioned response mechanism.  


13Harding, *op. cit.*, p. 29.
Description of the Purposeful Method. In this method of teaching reading, special emphasis is placed upon reading as a purposeful activity. This method is based on the assumption that reading involves a variety of functions which develop as an outgrowth of reading to learn. It attempts to meet each child at his level of development by providing reading instruction in connection with a central theme or unit. The objective of the unit approach is to control attention and stimulate learning through the use of a wide range of interesting materials, such as pictures, charts, bulletin boards, discussion periods, projects, and reference and recreational books.

Instruction is organized according to group and individual needs in relation to (1) the unit, (2) purposes of reading, (3) individual differences, and (4) materials of instruction.
## TABLE XL
### EVALUATION OF THE PURPOSEFUL METHOD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Values*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>3 1 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>3 1 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>4 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*(3) most satisfactory, (2) satisfactory, (1) provided for but in an unsatisfactory manner, and (0) not provided for.*
### TABLE XLI

**ASSIGNED NUMERICAL VALUES OF THE PURPOSEFUL METHOD**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of an Adequate Reading Program</th>
<th>Numerical Values*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Based upon an understanding of the nature of how children learn</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of general configuration</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of striking features of words</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of picture clues</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of content clues</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of phonetic analysis</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of syllabification</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for comprehension</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for interpretation</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to evaluate material</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of information</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading speed determined by purpose</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for silent reading</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for oral reading</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of depth of word meaning</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading readiness</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponement of reading until readiness has been developed</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on reading as a thought process with subordination of the mechanics of reading to a thoughtful, meaningful interpretation</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for extensive easy reading with interesting content</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for wide reading as a means of learning to read by reading</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for developing permanent interest in reading</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for individual needs, interests and ability</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate balance of recreational, informational, and work type materials</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for the correlation and integration of subjects and activities for improving the use of and skills in reading</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant increase in vocabulary and content</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned program of evaluation for securing and using data concerning individual and group abilities and needs</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous progress toward the objectives of beginning reading</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Numerical Value</strong></td>
<td><strong>413</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Numerical Value equals sum total of the number of judges x assigned value for each facet.*
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books


Cason, Eloise B. Mechanical Methods for Increasing the Speed of Reading: An Experimental Study at the Third-Grade Level. New York: Bureau of Publications, Teachers College, Columbia University, 1943.


Hamer, Oliver Stuart, and Hamer, Anna M. *Our Farm Babies.* Bloomington, Illinois: McKnight and McKnight, 1934.

disagreement about methods of teaching than there were about general organization of a reading program, content and use of readers, and accessories such as preprimer and workbooks.\textsuperscript{1}

The intent of this study is to develop a descriptive, comparative analysis of the basic assumptions, principles, and techniques of instruction underlying various methods of beginning reading. Such an analysis should be helpful in at least three ways: as an aid in interpreting reading programs to interested persons, in selecting a reading program which is in accord with basic principles of learning and child development, and in organizing reading instruction to meet group and individual needs and abilities.

Statement of the Problem

The problem. It is quite ordinary to find schools in neighboring towns using different reading methods. It is not unusual to find schools within the same system using different methods. Parker once declared that "In the history of education there are more theories and methods of teaching reading than of teaching any other subject."\textsuperscript{2} These differences are actually wholesome for only by experimenting with methods and modifications of methods and comparing results can teachers

\textsuperscript{1}David Russell, "Opinions of Experts about Primary Grade Basic Reading Programs," \textit{Elementary School Journal}, XLIV (June, 1944), 602-609.

\textsuperscript{2}Francis Parker, \textit{Talks on Pedagogies} (Chicago: A. S. Barnes and Company, 1894), p. 204.
Connectionism. This school of thought, frequently referred to as Modern Associationism, maintains that the mental processes consist of the functioning of native and acquired connections between situations and responses (S-R bond). "Mind" is the sum total of connections made between the stimulus and response. The spirit of connectionism found its way into education through Thorndike's "Laws of Readiness, Exercise, and Effect." By applying the concepts as expressed by these laws teachers would be able to determine the patterns of learning and drill.

Functionalism. This psychological school emphasized the biological role of mental phenomena, i.e., their utility to the organism in its adjustment to the environment. Functionalism as a new school can be said to have been initiated in the year 1896, with Dewey's article on the Reflex Arc. In this article thinking was regarded as an organism reacting as a whole, and behavior was directed toward the satisfaction of needs.

The prime factor of functional psychology is that it teaches that evolution can be applied to the mind as well as to the organism. "Mind is the sum total of mental functions."  


15 Harding, op. cit., p. 29.


McBroom, Mary Alice Allen, Duncan, Dorothy Emig and Steuber, Josephine. 


McCullough, Constance, Strang, Ruth M., and Traxler, Arthur E. 
Problems in the Improvement of Reading. New York: 

McDade, James E. Essentials of Non-Oral Beginning Reading. 
Chicago: The Plymouth Press, 1941.

McDade, James E. Next Steps in Non-Oral Reading. West Palm 
Beach, Fla.: Palm Beach Press, 1946.

McKee, Paul. The Teaching of Reading in the Elementary 

McMurry, Charles A. Special Method in Reading in the Grades. 

McMurry, Lida B. Methods for Teaching Primary Reading. 

Needleman, Morriss H. A Manual of Pronunciation. New York: 
Barnes and Noble, Inc., 1949.

Newmayer, S. Weir, M.D. First Aids in Reading Difficulties. 


O'Brien, John Anthony. Silent Reading. New York: The 
Macmillan Company, 1921.

Orton, Samuel T. Reading, Writing, and Speech Problems in 
1937.

Osburn, Worth James. Remedial and Follow-Up Work Bulletins 
in Silent Reading. Bloomington, Ill.: Public School 
Publishing Co., 1922.

Parker, Francis W. Talks on Pedagogies. Chicago: A. S. 
Barnes and Co., 1894.


Partridge, Leila E. *Notes of Talks on Teaching given by Francis W. Parker at the Martha's Vineyard Summer Institute, July 17 to August 19, 1882*. New York: E. L. Kellogg and Company, 1882.


Smith, Nila B. *One Hundred Ways of Teaching Silent Reading.* Silver, Burdett and Company, 1925.


Stone, Clarence R. *Stone's Graded Vocabulary for Primary Reading.* St. Louis, Missouri: Webster Publishing Company, 1941.


Vincent, William S. (Director). What Schools Can Do, 101 Patterns of Educational Practice. New York: Metropolitan School Study Council, 525 West 120th St., 1947.


Articles


Adams, Agnes L. "Eliminating the Need for Some Types of Remedial Work in Reading," Childhood Education, XII (January, 1936), 163-167.


Barnes, Melvin W. "Root Words and Current Meanings," *School and Society*, LVI (December 19, 1942), 610-611.


Gestalt Psychology. This school of psychology took issue with the atomistic theorists and claimed that not all behavior is composed of elements or a quilt-work of small experiences. They contend that experience presents itself in a very structured form, and this pattern is more pronounced than the elements that compose it.

Its basic contention is that thinking is the organizing and reorganizing of patterns, since wholeness and organizations are features of such processes from the start.

Structuralism. Wundt is considered to have given us this viewpoint, and E. B. Titchener was the outstanding disciple in this country. This theory states that after a person is properly trained, he can contemplate and reflect upon an experience during the actual occurrence or from memory and then give a description in terms of its elements and attitudes.

L. W. Harding states that in this school of psychology "'Mind' is the sum total of conscious experiences; 'thinking' is the manipulation of remembered experience."16

Psychoanalysis. As developed by Freud this psychology attributes behavior to factors that have been repressed in the unconscious part of the mind. This depth psychology assumes that all individuals have conflicts that are out of the reach of the conscious part of the mind, and the conflict

---

16 Ibid., p. 29.
Betts, Emmett A. "Reading Instruction: Traditional versus Modern," National Elementary Principal, XXIV (December, 1944), 40-43.


Bowden, Josephine Horton. "Learning to Read," Elementary School Teacher, XII (September, 1911), 21-33.

Bradley, Martha H., Cahill, Loretta A., and Tate, Harry L. "Acquisition of a Reading Vocabulary," Elementary English Review, XVIII (January, 1941), 19-21, 32.


Challman, Robert C. "Personality Maladjustments and Remedial Reading," Journal of Exceptional Children, VI (October, 1939), 7-11.


Cordts, Anna D. "And It's All Known as Phonics," Elementary English, XXXII (October, 1955), 376-378.

Cordts, Anna D. "Facts for Teachers of Phonics," Elementary English Review, III (April, 1926), 116-121, 125.


Dearborn, Walter F. "Professor Cattell's Studies of Reading and Perception," Archives of Psychology, IV, No. 30 (April, 1914), 34-45.


Dolch, Edward W. "How Much Word Knowledge Do Children Bring to Grade One?" *Elementary English Review*, XIII (May, 1936), 177-183.


Gates, Arthur I., and Bolker, Eloise, "A Study of Initial Stages in Reading by Pre-School Children," Teachers College Record, XXIV (November, 1923), 469-488.


Gray, William S. "Phonic Versus Other Methods of Teaching Reading," The Reading Teacher, No. 2, IX (December, 1955), 102-106.


Gray, William S. "Summary of Reading Investigations (July 1, 1925 to June 30, 1930)," Elementary School Journal, XXVII (February, March, 1927), 456-466, 495-510.


Huck, D., and Young, D. "Many Methods and Materials," Childhood Education, XXX (October, 1953), 76-83.

Hunnicutt, C. W. "Reading of Children in Activity and Regular Schools in New York City," Elementary School Journal, XLIII (May, 1943), 530-538.


Jensen, Milton B. "Reading Deficiency as Related to Cerebral Injury and to Neurotic Behavior," Journal of Applied Psychology, XXVII (September, 1943), 535-545.


Klemm, Eugene. "Improving Reading Instruction for Gifted Children," The Reading Teacher, No. 4, IX (April, 1956), 197-200.


Kopel, David. "Reading Textbooks and the Reading Program," *English Journal*, XXXII (September, 1943), 34-36.


that is predominant at the moment shall control our conduct. The emphasis in this school has been on the process of unlearning rather than on learning and teaching.

**Purposivism.** According to this viewpoint the purposes, goals, or needs which are sought by an individual are the effective determinants of all behavior. W. McDougall and E. C. Tolman are two proponents of this group.

This theory lays stress on the interaction of an organism and the environment. The individual acting with an aim is acting intelligently. Purposing then becomes an all-important element in learning. Hence, purposeful activity becomes an essential part of an individual's relationship to his problem. Purpose grows out of a situation that challenges interest, and interest is the drive that helps the individual reach a solution of his problem. Thinking can not be defined in merely static terms, but as activity consciously directed toward a goal.

**Personalistic and organismic, or holistic psychologies.** These psychological schools study the individual as a unit, a whole. This group does not represent a unified school. Woodworth quotes Adolf Meyer as writing "... Mind ... is a sufficiently organized living being in action and not a peculiar form of mind-stuff."\(^{17}\) "Thinking is a total activity of an organism having certain capacities and needs, continually

---

\(^{17}\)Woodworth, *op. cit.*, p. 232.


Mead, Cyrus D. "Results in Silent Versus Oral Reading," *Journal of Educational Psychology,* VIII (June, 1917), 367-368.

Mead, Cyrus D. "Silent Versus Oral Reading with One Hundred Sixth-Grade Children," *Journal of Educational Psychology,* VI (June, 1915), 345-348.


Meriam, Junius L. "Avoiding Difficulties in Learning to Read," *Educational Method,* IX (April, 1930), 413-419.


Murphy, Helen A., and Jenkins, Kathryn M. "Increasing the Rate of Learning in First Grade Reading," Education, LXII (September, 1941), 37-39.


McDade, James E. "Examination of a Recent Criticism of the Non-Oral Beginning Reading," Elementary School Journal, XLIV, No. 6 (February, 1944), 343-351.


McDade, James E. "The Two Basic Reading Skills," Chicago Schools Journal, XXIII (September, 1941), 26-30.


McKee, Paul. "Reading as a Problem for Most Teachers," Ohio School, XVI (February, 1938), 74-75.


Olson, W. C., and Davis, S. I. "The Adaptation of Instruction in Reading to the Growth of Children," Educational Method, XX (November, 1940), 71-79.


O'Rourke, Everett, and Mead, Cyrus D. "Vocabulary Difficulties of Five Textbooks in Third-Grade Arithmetic," Elementary School Journal, XLI (April, 1941), 683-691.

Orton, Samuel T. "An Impediment in Learning to Read - a Neurological Explanation of the Reading Disability," School and Society, XIV (September, 1928), 286-290.

Orton, Samuel T. "The Sight Reading Method of Teaching Reading as a Source of Reading Disability," Journal of Educational Psychology, XX (February, 1929), 135-143.


Peake, Nellie L. "Relations Between Spelling Ability and Reading Ability," Journal of Experimental Education, IX (December, 1940), 192-193.


Pitts, Raymond J. "Relationship Between Functional Competence in Mathematics and Reading Grade Levels, Mental Ability, and Age," Journal of Educational Psychology, XLIII (December, 1952), 486-492.


Preston, Mary I. "The School Looks at the Non-Reader," Elementary School Journal, XL (February, 1940), 450-458.

Preston, Ralph C., and Botel, Morton. "The Relation of Reading Skill and Other Factors to the Academic Achievement of 2,048 College Students," Journal of Experimental Education, XX (June, 1952), 363-371.


Robinson, Frank B. "Phonetics or Phonics," The Reading Teacher, No. 2, IX (December, 1955), 84-88.


Russell, David H. "Opinions of Experts about Primary Grade Basic Reading Programs," Elementary School Journal, XLIV (June, 1944), 602-609.


Sears, J. B. "Time Allotment in the Schools of Salt Lake City," Education Administration and Supervision, II (March, 1916), 137-150.


Sheldon, William D. "Can We Improve Reading by Using Mechanical Devices," The Reading Teacher, VIII, No. 8 (April, 1955), 219-223.


Smith, Nila B. "Shall We Teach Phonics?" Elementary English Review, XX (February, 1943), 60-67.


Stone, Clarence R. "The Vocabularies of Twenty Pre Primers," Elementary School Journal, XLI (February, 1941), 423-429.


Tate, Harry L. "Influence of Phonetics on Silent Reading in Grade One," Elementary School Journal, XXXVII (June, 1937), 752-763.

Tate, Harry L., Herbert, Theresa M., and Zeman, Josephine K. "Nonphonic Primary Reading," Elementary School Journal, XL (March, 1940), 529-537.


Tinker, Miles A. "Recent Trends in Reading Instruction," Journal of Educational Research, XXXVI (February, 1943), 468-480.
Tinker, Miles A. "Speed Versus Comprehension in Reading as Affected by Level of Difficulty," *Journal of Educational Psychology*, XXX (February, 1939), 81-94; XXXI (October, 1939), 559-560.


Washburne, Carleton, and Morphett, Mabel V. "When Should Children Begin to Read?" *Elementary School Journal*, XXXI (March, 1931), 496-503.

Westerman, E. "What's Happened to the ABC's?" Todays Health, XXXIII (March, 1955), 24-25.

Whipple, G. "Questions and Answers about the Teaching of Reading," National Educational Association, (September, 1952), 345-347.


Young, William E. "Recent Research on Reading in the Social Studies," Education, LXII (September, 1940), 18-26.

Zirbes, Laura. "What Is a Modern Reading Program?" Educational Method, XX (December, 1940), 151-155.

Reports


challenged by the environment and always seeking to come
to terms with that environment so as to achieve optimum
performance."

Applications of Psychological
Concepts to Learning

There are not only different schools of psychology,
but also extensive differences within each school. This
would seem to indicate that there is disagreement concerning
how learning takes place. The question of how we learn will
probably be answered. However, teachers cannot wait. They
must continue the educational process, and in so doing they
are forced to adopt a theory of how we learn.

It appears as if these various "schools" of psychology
can be classified under two major headings, the atomistic and
the organismic. The following outline serves to illustrate
the conflicting viewpoints:

Mechanistic vs. Organismic Concepts\(^{19}\)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Mechanistic Concept</th>
<th>The Organismic Concept</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Human behavior follows the same laws as machines.</td>
<td>1. Human behavior follows the pattern of growth of living organisms.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Learning is an additive process.</td>
<td>2. Learning is a growth process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Parts come first.</td>
<td>3. Wholes come first.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^{18}\)Ibid., p. 236.

\(^{19}\)Amos L. Heer, Education 429, 1956. (Mimeographed material.)


Davidson, Helen P. "An Experimental Study of Bright, Average, and Dull Children at the Four-Year Mental Level," Genetic Psychology Monographs, No. 9. March, April, 1931, pp. 119-289.


Dearborn, Walter F. "Structural Factors Which Condition Special Disability in Reading," Proceedings of the American Association for Mental Deficiency, XXXVIII (1933), 266-283.


Miscellanea


Heer, Amos L. Education 429. (Mimeographed material.)


McDade, James E. "Non-Oral Helps," 1946. (Mimeographed material.)

I, Naomi Simms, was born in Portsmouth, Ohio, January 26, 1915. I received my secondary school education in the public schools of Portsmouth, Ohio. My undergraduate training was obtained at Rio Grande College, Rio Grande, Ohio, and at Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio, from which I received the degree of Bachelor of Science in 1943 and the Master of Arts degree in 1948.

After receiving the degree of Master of Arts from Ohio State University, I studied at Florida State University, Tallahassee, Florida, and Northwestern University, Evanston, Illinois.

I returned to Ohio State University for work on a Doctor of Philosophy degree. While in residence, I acted in the capacity of assistant to Lowry L. Harding for two years.
The Mechanistic Concept

4. Parts have meaning in isolation.
5. Learning represents the formation of specific bonds or connection in the nervous system.
6. Learning is the result of repetition.
7. Learning is piecemeal.
8. Mental growth follows a set of laws different from those governing physical growth.
9. The learner reacts to a single stimulus from the environment.
10. Facts and skills are learned by drill on isolated parts.

The Organismic Concept

4. Parts have meaning only because of their relationship to wholes.
5. Learning involves the whole organism.
6. Learning is the result of in-sight, maturation, and differentiation.
7. Learning is unitary.
8. Physical and mental growth follow the same laws.
9. The learner reacts to a configuration or field of stimuli.
10. Facts and skills are learned in connection with meaningful activities of which they are integral parts.

Thus, programs of reading which stress the learning of reading as an end within itself adhere to the mechanistic concept, while reading programs that emphasize reading as a means to an end are supported by organismic concepts of how we learn.

Basic Assumptions in Teaching

Pedagogical assumptions upon which methods of beginning reading are based include the acceptance of a philosophical system and a theory of learning.

Other factors which influence the selection of methods of teaching beginning reading are (1) the curriculum and the
organization of the school, (2) the materials of instruction, (3) provision for individual differences and, (4) appraisal of progress.

L. W. Harding has declared:

Beyond acceptance of some theory of knowledge and of the learning process there are a number of educational questions on which some position must be assumed if teaching is done. Among the most important problems, in their influence upon practices in beginning reading are these:
1. The purpose or social philosophy of the school.
2. The nature and type of curriculum.
3. The organization of the school.
4. The materials of instruction.
5. The methods of teaching.
6. The provisions for individual differences.
7. The appraisal of progress.

Thus, it is readily seen that the beginning reading program is an outgrowth of all aspects of the school.

Classifications of Methods of Teaching Reading

The various programs of teaching beginning reading may be identified as of three principal types. These are (a) synthetic, (b) analytic, and (c) functional methods.

The synthetic methods. These systems emphasize the primary elements of the language, such as the letters or sounds of the alphabet as a starting point for learning to read. The procedures used for teaching beginning reading are designed to teach the pupil to read by focusing his attention

---

20 Harding, op. cit., p. 33.
upon separate parts and then combining the parts into meaningful groups or wholes.

In this group are the Alphabetic, Alphabetic-Phonetic, Phonic, Phonetic, and the Linguistic Methods and their variations. These methods are based on a logical approach - from the simplest to the most complex. The central idea is to lead children progressively from the part to the whole.

The analytic methods. In the analytical type of reading programs, the child is introduced to the reading process by means of units which can be broken down into smaller parts. The shift from letter or sound recognition to emphasis on the thought-unit marks the transition from the synthetic to the analytical methods in teaching beginning reading.

In the analytic methods, the learner begins in much the same way as he learns to speak and to understand his mother tongue. He is taught to identify a few pre-selected words, phrases, or short sentences, and then to analyze the whole into elements for further study.

In this group may be placed the Word, Phrase or Sentence, Story, Silent Reading, Picture-Story, Non-Oral, and Intrinsic methods. The central idea in the analytic methods is that children can learn larger units, such as words and sentences, more easily than they can learn the visual or auditory
elements. Hence, these methods emphasize taking larger language units apart, rather than building up smaller units. All methods of this type assume that reading is primarily a thought-getting process. The basic objective is to help the child develop as rapidly as possible the ability to gain ideas from reading.

The functional or conjunctive methods. In this method a combination of the synthetic and analytic methods of teaching is used. The functional methods of teaching beginning reading begin with words and sentences. The pupil memorizes the words or sentences presented to him in a meaningful situation. He analyzes and compares words, breaks them down into smaller elements and synthesizes the parts into words or sentences more or less simultaneously. Proponents of this approach argue that in so doing, the pupil becomes acquainted with the elements of the language in the desired order. In most applications, these methods become primarily a combination of the Phonic and Look-and-Say methods.

The functional methods are systems of teaching beginning reading in which the art of reading is developed in a purposeful manner, and the procedures or techniques employed are developed to merge the process of learning to read and reading to learn. The contents of the material presented to the child are based upon his own problems and activities. In these methods reading becomes a "tool" and the artificial
process of naming printed symbols is eliminated for the practical process of getting ideas and facts from the printed page in order to achieve a self-selected goal or goals.

The conception of reading as thinking is basic to these methods. The child, rather than the material he is reading, is the center of attention, and the procedures are child-centered rather than teacher-centered. These methods are based upon modern theories of psychology and child development which emphasize: (a) that learning is an active process, (b) that learning is not an additive experience but a remaking of experiences, (c) that every child learns in his own way, (d) that the pupil learns only that which he is interested in and desires to learn, (e) that learning is largely an emotional experience as self-esteem, security, and success strongly influence the learning process.

Functional methods are composite or electric. They utilize the best features of the synthetic and analytic methods, with emphasis upon first one feature, then another, as the special needs of individual children indicate. The procedures or techniques are built around the children and their own reasons for reading rather than on a system of forcing them into a formal reading program. All special features, however, are used as tools and are regarded as means not ends. It is recognized that word mastery and word analysis are necessary to the accurate reader; however, the
meanings are considered to result from the interaction of
the learner with his environment rather than being in the
word or in the person reading.

The Kinesthetic, the Experience, and the Purposeful
methods of teaching beginning reading may be classified as
functional methods.

Summary. The following words written by G. S. Hall
appear to summarize this chapter:

It is the inveterate vice of the pedagogue's
mind to forget that all methods are only means
and never ends, for the pupils, that the highest
art is to conceal art; that method in teaching,
as in philosophizing, is only "an arch overhead
in tunnelling" a hill, which serves to keep off
the falling sand, that the work may go on effec-
tively beneath; that it is not unlike the bony
skeleton giving form and effectiveness to the
body, but ghastly if exposed.21

This limited review of philosophical psychological,
and pedagogical assumptions as well as the classifications of
the methods of teaching reading is merely to illustrate the
framework of the "arches" under which various beginning
reading programs are developed.

21G. Stanley Hall, How to Teach Reading (Boston:
ultimately determine the most desirable method. However, variations in practice may cause concern when first grade teachers in the same building emphasize different methods, if their different approaches are not part of a planned program. Dissimilar programs within a school are dangerous because often their different approaches are: (1) not part of a planned program, (2) not a part of a systematic search for accurate information about the methods being used, (3) not part of a planned program for adjustment to the needs of the child. There is also real cause for concern in cases where the same teacher uses several different methods which, like the Rh positive and Rh negative blood types, clash so sharply as to handicap normal growth. All too often teachers, supervisors, and principals of such school systems are not aware of what methods are being used, of the strengths and weaknesses of each, or of the inconsistencies. Such practices in teaching children to learn to read remind one of Stephen Leacock's oft-quoted line about "The man jumped on his horse and rode off in all directions."

The problem of this study is to assemble in convenient space available information summarizing various primary reading methods and to provide evidence which may be useful in examining programs of beginning reading.

Definition of terms. In the study two terms will be used which, were they not defined, might be variously
CHAPTER IV

SYNTHETIC METHODS OF TEACHING BEGINNING READING

The synthetic methods of teaching beginning reading have been defined as those methods which develop the reading process from the part to the whole or from the simple to the complex: "simple" being, in this case, the letters of the syllables and the "complex" being words, phrases or sentences. The Alphabetic, Alphabetic-Phonetic, Phonetic, Linguistic methods and their modified programs are examples of the synthetic method of teaching beginning reading.

Section I

The Alphabetic Method

This method, as the name implies, begins by teaching the letters in alphabetical order. After the student can fluently repeat the names of the letters from memory and recognize the letters in both small and capital form, he proceeds to learn to spell words and to read them. The child spells aloud each new word as the way of learning to read it. Actually, the child is taught to read through spelling.
Historical Development

The beginning of teaching reading through first learning the alphabet is lost in antiquity; however, it appears to have been developed from the thinking of ancient times, when individual symbols were meaningful because each represented an independent idea. "A" no longer represents an ox head, as it did in the Seirete-Sinaitic system of writing.\(^1\) Today it must be joined with other letters, or be used in conjunction with a series of words, to become a meaningful symbol. Its function has changed. However, despite the change in the function of the symbol reading continued for many years in a manner which emphasized a separate recognition-and-synthesis of individual letters of the alphabet.

For centuries it was assumed that, when one read, his eyes looked at each letter in turn, that the letters were reported to his brain, and that his "mind" put the letters into words and eventually organized the words into thoughts.

Although there is no record when the Alphabetic Method was first used, Quintilian (A.D. 68) in his plan for Roman education advocated that first letters be taught, then syllables, then words, and finally sentences. The child was not to be permitted to attempt the reading of words until he

could read and write all syllables, nor to read sentences until he was familiar with words.  

The Greeks, also, made use of this method of teaching beginning reading. Storm and Smith report that a wealthy Greek bought a number of slaves and named each for a letter of the alphabet - Alpha, Beta, etc. - and assigned them as playmates for his son with the idea that his child could then learn the alphabet more easily.  

A study of European reading methods reveals the fact that this method was used in Europe well into the nineteenth century. Here numerous modifications of the method appeared, for example, Buno (1650) introduced a special device, letters printed in the form of animals, to facilitate the learning of the ABC's. However, it was Basedow (1723-1790) who truly "sugar-coated" the method. He suggested the use of alphabet blocks, songs, pictures, games, rewards, and cookies, and his procedures became known as the "gingerbread method." This method has been vividly described as follows:  

3 Grace E. Storm and Nila B. Smith, Reading Activities in the Primary Grades (Boston: Ginn and Company, 1930), p. 4.  
4 Joseph S. Taylor, Principles and Methods of Teaching Reading (New York: The Macmillan Co., 1917), Chapter V.
To Master John the English Maid
A horn book gives of gingerbread,
And that the child may learn the better,
As he can name he eats the letter.
He spells and gnaws from left to right.  

Regardless of this attempt to provide extrinsic motivation it is well to note that the use of the Alphabetic Method was forbidden by law in Prussia (1872) and several other states shortly followed.  

The Alphabetic Method was introduced in this country by the early English settlers. The fundamental objective for teaching reading during this period was to develop the ability to read for religious information and instruction. Such a purpose tended to give education an important religious status and greatly influenced the reading materials used.

The materials used for instruction in reading were chiefly (1) the Bible . . . parts of the Scripture, (2) The Horn Book, (3) The New England Primer by Benjamin Harris, and (4) the Psalters. The influence of these texts resulted in the continued dependence upon the Alphabetic Method of teaching beginning reading in America.

Description of the Alphabetic Method

The design of presentation of reading materials in this program can be described as a synthetic method, for the

---


6G. Stanley Hall, How to Teach Reading (Boston: D. C. Heath and Co., 1897), p. 4.
teaching began with the letters and built up to words and sentences.

**Procedures.** This method may be divided into three elements: (1) memorization of letter names and recognition of printed letters, (2) prolonged drill upon spelling and pronunciation of letter combinations (ab, ib, ob), syllables (la, li), monosyllabic words (so, no), and (3) syllabic material combined into longer and longer words, and finally the reading of sentences.

The method is abstract in nature as the letter names alone have no meaning or associative connections. "A letter is worth nothing as an instrument to read until it is already in a word." When taught by this method the child learns to identify the letters; he does not learn to read the word. The sequence in learning to read becomes sight-spelling-sound meaning, instead of the shorter sight-sound-meaning series.

By the method of sight-spelling-sound-meaning, reading and spelling are taught as one skill because reading is taught as spelling. The letters were first learned separately, then put together to form syllables. After common syllables were learned, they were put in simple words. The putting of words symbols together in sentences and the translation of sentences

---


into spoken language and mental ideas was the final step.

Basic principles of the Alphabetic Method. The underlying principal of this method is that the combination of letters will give the word. This combination was thought to be developed through indirect association. Rather than encouraging direct association of the word and printed form, the child first made an association between the spoken names of the letters and printed letters, then between the printed letters as they are combined into words, and finally between spoken and printed words.

Using the Alphabetic Method as a Reading Technique

Even today teachers are asked: "Why hasn't my child been taught his ABC's?" "How can he learn to read when he can't even say his alphabet?" What would be the classroom procedure if the Alphabetic Method of teaching beginning reading were used today? Perhaps a visit to Miss A. B. See's room will answer this question.

Teacher: "Suppose we play our little game to see if everyone is here."

Frankie: "Oh, not that again."

Teacher: "Now, Frank, none of that! You know in order to read you must know your ABC's. . . . I'll call the roll and you answer by saying the alphabet."

(Each child answers the roll by saying the ABC's.)

Teacher: "Now we are ready for our reading lesson. . . . I will say a letter; then you come to the board and find it. Ready?"

(Each letter of the alphabet is pointed to and a child names it.)
Several weeks later after the children have learned numerous sounds such as ab, ad, etc., the following lesson occurs:

Teacher: "Children, turn to page three."

(On page three the children find the following lesson):

so he it go to
in is at up
we at do as

So we go in.

He is at it.

We do go up so as to go to it.

"Now, let us read the words."

(The class recites the words in unison, spelling each word first, then individual children spell and say the word.)

Teacher: "Wonderful! Let's read the sentences, Susie."

Susie: "S - o, so; w - e, we; g - o, go; i - n, in."

(The second and third sentence is then read in the same manner.)

Advantages of the Alphabetic Method

A critical study of the method shows the two following advantages:

This method demands a critical examination of each word. The child's acquaintance with the alphabet may prevent or reduce much of the confusion that arises from a too hasty and un细心ed glance at a printed word. Word recognition is aided because this method forces the child to look at individual letters. For example, there are children who often
read saw when it should be was. A more critical look would show them the difference. Even adults resort to spelling when attacking difficult words.

This method correlates the teaching of reading, spelling, enunciation, and pronunciation. The child learns to spell simultaneously with learning to read. It is claimed that most children develop clear enunciation, correct pronunciation, and ability to spell. Huey concluded that "The value of the practice (naming letters in words) in learning to spell doubtless had much to do with binding teachers for centuries to its uselessness for reading words and sentences." 9

Limitations of the Alphabetic Method

The Alphabetic Method appeared to be logical from the adult's point of view, but in reality it gives no consideration to the way in which children actually learn. The emphasis upon mechanics or reading as isolated segments of letters is not only irrelevant to reading but may handicap progress.

Much criticism has been directed toward this method of teaching beginning reading. These criticisms mainly emphasize the following limitations:

Letter names alone have no meaning and often do not produce the correct sound. Bumstead's criticism humorously illustrates this fact that letter names alone have no meaning

---

9 Huey, op. cit., p. 266.
or associative connections and that the letter sounds do not say the words:

A little boy, plodding his dreary way through the alphabet, had finally reached the columns of three-letter syllables. When, one morning (the first snow of winter having fallen during the night) on rising from his bed, and looking out of the window, he exclaimed with ecstasy. "Hurrah! There's a sleigh! S-l-a, sleigh."

"John," said his father, "S-l-a doesn't spell sleigh."

"Don't it? What does it spell, sir?"

"O, I don't know - it doesn't spell anything."

"Why, father! Then, what is sla in my book for?"

This method of teaching reading is a slow and laborious process. This method can only produce slow, ponderous readers as it causes the child to examine each word critically in order that each component of the word can be analyzed into letters and these letters synthesized into words. The techniques employed become most tedious to the child as they disregard content and afford little contact with the needs and interests of children.

Because of the tremendous difficulty at the beginning stages, the average child did not progress very rapidly. "Today a child who has been in the first grade of a good public school for six months can probably read better than his father could after twelve months in one of the better schools thirty years ago."11

10 Josiah F. Bumstead, My First School Book (Boston: Perkins and Marwin, 1844), p. 3.

Heinicke\textsuperscript{12} said that it (the Alphabetic Method) required thousands of superfluous associations and that no child ever really learned to read by it; but when seeming to have done so, had, in fact, unconsciously translated names into phonic signs; "spelling," he feels, is a child-torture greater than the Inquisition. . . ."

This method is thoroughly unpedagogic, beginning with the unknown rather than the known. It was a most inadequate technique since it stressed the names rather than the function of the letters. A child hears words not letters yet by this method dog becomes d-o-g and as Klapper\textsuperscript{13} has written "a combination of letters d-o-g will give dee-ooo,gg," for the sequence of letters in a word seldom suggests its pronunciation. When taught by this method the child learns to identify the letters; he does not learn to read the words. The fragments of the words presented are unnecessary, uninteresting, and meaningless and afford little contact with the needs of the child.

This method fails to promote the concept that reading is a "thought-getting" process. The extensive and meaningless drill demanded by the Alphabetic Method in learning to read delays the idea that reading is a thought-getting process.

\textsuperscript{12}As quoted by Hall, op. cit., p. 3.

\textsuperscript{13}Paul Klapper, Teaching Children to Read (New York: D. Appleton and Company, 1922), Chap. V, pp. 36-41.
interpreted by different individuals. In order that the same meaning may be given the two terms used, they are here-with defined as used in this study.

The term reading program will be used to refer to a pre-arranged plan or course of proceedings; a prospectus; a systematic arrangement of reading instruction based upon a specific reading method or combinations of reading methods.

The term reading method denotes a comprehensive process, an authoritative procedure designed as a course of action by which reading is taught. The various methods of teaching beginning reading may be identified as of three principal types. These are synthetic, analytical, and functional methods.

Delimitations of the study. In view of the numerous methods of teaching beginning reading consideration will be given only to the major methods for teaching beginning reading in the schools of the United States. Other limitations of the study are: (1) the use of subjective evaluation in the interpretation of values of various reading methods rather than a mechanical or objective technique, (2) the existence of contradictory findings regarding the value of the numerous reading methods, (3) the difficulty of drawing a line between a personal educational philosophy and a simple statement of facts, and (4) the limited number of judges used in evaluating the concepts and procedures presented by the various methods.
For hours and days - yes, months, the youth responds to printed symbols with verbal responses such as A-B-D, etc; or ai, ae, etc; or c-a-t. These responses are mere soundings and carry no meaning. They are not a part of his verbal communication pattern nor can the teacher explain or show him their meanings, as they have none. Knowledge of the alphabet is not necessary in a beginning reading program.

This method interferes with the development of quick perception of word-forms necessary to fluency and speed in reading. One measure of the effectiveness of reading instruction is the amount of time during which each pupil is actually engaged in reading and the depth of understanding derived from a specific selection. A child who has been so instructed that he looks at letters rather than wholes reads slowly, and, often because of this slow process, fails to comprehend the meaning of the selected reading. For example, take a sheet of paper and cut out a small section no larger than the size of a printed symbol. Now, time yourself as you read the above sentence by moving the sheet so only a letter at a time is seen. What was the required time? What was the thought of the sentence?

The Alphabetic Method retards the development of speed and quick perception of word forms. The movements of the eyes in reading a line of print are interrupted by a succession of short pauses. Speed is developed when motor
habits have been formed so that there are few fixations per line and a minimum of time required for each fixation.

Comprehension is also retarded by the ABC method of teaching reading because attention is focused on letter form rather than on the functions of the letters. The functions of letters and words are most important, for the meaning of a word can change and does change. If the reader is to understand the deeper and peculiar expressive value of words neither the seeing and hearing of letters nor the identification of words is sufficient. The process of teaching reading by stressing letters appears to teach the child not to think.

Present Status of the Alphabetic Method

In an attempt to determine the relative values of the Alphabetic Method of teaching beginning reading five judges were selected to evaluate this method in respect to the developed criteria. The ratings of these judges showed that according to the established criteria the Alphabetic Method was most inferior, receiving only a total of ten (10) points. Five points were rated for each of the following characteristics: (a) phonetic analysis and (b) oral reading. All other items received zero points.

If the basic assumption, that reading is a continuous

14 Information concerning the development and use of these criteria is provided in the Appendix, pp. 321-322.
process is accepted, and if the criteria developed are valid, the Alphabetic Method of teaching reading provides few if any instructional procedures and activities designed to contribute to developing reading ability.

Research Findings

We do not have adequate experimental evidence in regard to the effectiveness or lack of effectiveness of the Alphabetic Method, as objective measurements of reading achievement have been developed only since 1930. However, certain conclusions have been reached by means of records from courses of study of material read and subjective evaluation.

Horace Mann wrote the following subjective evaluation of the Alphabetic Method in 1838.

... I have devoted especial pains to learn, with some degree of numerical accuracy, how far the reading, in our schools is an exercise of the mind in thinking and feeling, and how far it is a barren action of the organs of speech upon the atmosphere. My information is derived, principally, from the written statements of the school committees of the respective towns. ... The result is, that more than eleven-twelfths of all the children in the reading-classes in our school, do not understand the meaning of the words they read; that they do not master the sense of the reading lessons, and that the ideas and feelings intended by the author to be conveyed to and excited in, the reader's mind still rest in the author's intention, never

---

15 Brooks, op. cit., pp. 3-4.
having reached the place of their destination. And by this it is not meant that the scholars do not obtain such a full comprehension of the reading lessons, in its various relations and bearings, as a scientific and erudite reader would do, but that they do not acquire a reasonable and practicable understanding of them. It would hardly seem that the combined efforts of all persons engaged could have accomplished more in defeating the true objects of reading.  

In 1896 the schools of one county in Connecticut made a survey of the oral reading method. The following quotation from the 1896 report of the Connecticut Board of Education illustrates the procedure for teaching reading used by 75 per cent of the teachers in this country.

Being without a good method the teacher makes the children study the "reading lesson." If any one practice be well established, it is the practice of "studying" the reading lesson. Let this incident, taken from an ungraded school in the county, be given in illustration. Teacher severely, "What did you call that word when you read it over?" Child evidently did not call it. Teacher, still severely, "Well, when you come to a word you can't pronounce, I want you to raise your hand." The purpose of raising the hand is, that the teacher, no matter what he is doing, may pause, nod to the child, who proceeds to spell the word which the teacher promptly pronounces.

The results of this survey show that of the 2,800 children tested 64 per cent could read at sight, whereas 36 per cent could not read. Almost a fourth of the non-readers were more than eight years of age.


17As quoted by Fowler D. Brooks, The Applied Psychology of Reading, pp. 4-5.
More recently Arthur I. Gates\textsuperscript{18} has studied the value of the Alphabetic Method. In his study 47 pupils, who depended chiefly upon the spelling method in recognizing new words, were used. Of the forty-seven students 12 were beginning pupils who were taught, under experimental control, to depend primarily upon the ABC Method, and 35 were found among several thousand pupils, who depended chiefly upon the Alphabetic Method. The results of this study show that half of these pupils experienced grave difficulty in word recognition and reading, and a fourth, though more competent, were hampered in some degree by what appeared to be innate limitations of this procedure.

Extensive investigations concerning perception and eye-movements have demonstrated the basic assumption of this method is false, for more units, printed symbols, can be perceived when they convey meaning than series which lack meaning and organization. Thus, the reader tends to see total word or phrase configuration rather than series of separate letters.

These research findings would indicate that the Alphabetic Method is inadequate as (1) a large per cent of primary children taught by this method are unable to read, (2) children taught by this method often show grave difficulty in word recognition, and (3) develop inadequate eye span.

Section II

The Alphabetic-Phonetic Method

The Alphabetic Method of teaching beginning reading was used in America from the time of the earliest settlements through the Revolutionary War and until 1790, when Noah Webster's three reading books were published of which The American Spelling Book, familiarly known as the "Blue-back Speller" was the most popular. The American Spelling Book, Horace Mann's editorials, the works of various textbook writers, and political factors stimulated a strong tendency to emphasize the sound of letters. As might be expected, a great many teachers decided to use both letter names and sound units as the initial unit in teaching reading. This dual emphasis or combined approach was "neither fish nor fowl." However to follow the simile, it retained both scales and feathers and hence seems most appropriately termed the Alphabetic-Phonetic Method.

Historical Development

Smith has pointed out that method during colonial times was incidental to the aim of religious instruction and Bible reading, and that memorization was a logical correlate of the religious material used as the basis of teaching. However, during the years which followed

---

19 Nila B. Smith, American Reading Instruction (New York: Silver Burdette Company, 1934), p. 34.
the writing of the Constitution of the United States, reading objectives stressed an understanding of and an appreciation of nationalism. Reading materials were used to overcome sectionalism, to prepare the youth of the country for the duties of citizenship in a republic, and to maintain the spirit of liberty, while reading methods emphasized correct word pronunciation and enunciation.

The same general procedures of the Alphabetic Method were used. The chief difference was that children were now required to learn the sounds of the letters and syllables as well as the letter names. Webster, who first introduced the idea of teaching beginning reading by an Alphabetic-Phonetic Method, merely added the teaching of letter sounds to the Alphabetic Method.

Description of the Alphabetic-Phonetic Method

In this method the children were made familiar with the alphabet and the initial letter sounds, then the vowels, consonants, and vowel-consonant combinations moved rapidly to the syllabarium. Two letter syllables were introduced and developed to six-syllable words. The "alphabet verses" were usually included for interest and as an aid in learning the letters. After the children had a thorough understanding of the letters and their major sounds, emphasis was placed upon drill of "family words," such as back, talk, etc. and oral reading for providing correct pronunciation.
Using the Alphabetic-Phonetic Method as a Reading Technique

Although the Alphabetic-Phonetic Method of teaching beginning reading was developed by an additive method - letter sounds being added to the teaching of the letter names - the classroom procedure varied. The following descriptive dialogue is presented so that the application of this method to a classroom situation can be better understood.

The teacher selected the word at from the reading lesson - wrote it on the chalkboard. The boy who recognized it first was chosen the "father" of the family and the first girl to identify it the "mother."

**Teacher:** "Let us find out today how many children Mr. and Mrs. At had."

(The children in turn, went through the alphabet sounding the "first name" of the letters and giving the letter equivalents of the names of Mr. At's children.)

(After the consonant sounds b, c, f, g ("gat" is ganster - colloquial, but read in comics and heard in movies, hence used in the drill) h, m, n, p, r, s, t, and v had been given, the teacher put the list on the chalkboard.)

**Teacher:** "Now, children, who can read the first name and last name together for Mr. At's first child? . . . Jill?"

**Jill:** "bat."

**Teacher:** "No, Jill, say the first name and then the last name."

**Jill:** "buh at."

**Teacher:** "Now, you can be one of the 'at' children. You may sit on this chair. (Twelve chairs have been placed under the chalkboard.)

(Various children in turn, read "bat," "cat," "fat," and so on, and, upon giving the correct "name" joined Mr. and Mrs. At in the row of chairs.)
Teacher: "Let us see if each one of Mr. and Mrs. At's children can write his name."

(Each member of the family wrote his "name" on the board above his head.)

(Several children were called upon and each child who could read all the words became a relative of the family - an aunt, uncle, cousin, etc. Finally, each remaining child who could read any of the names became a friend of the family. Those children who could read a few of the words, or who could not sound them correctly were directed to copy missed words in notebooks for subsequent drill.)

Reading Programs Based on the Alphabetic-Phonetic Method

Many programs of the Alphabetic-Phonetic Method of teaching beginning reading have been developed. However, due to numerous limitations such as time and available reference material as well as the almost impossible task of describing all programs only two will be considered. These two programs were published in The American Spelling Book and the McGuffey Readers. These two readers were selected on the basis of their popularity as determined by ascertaining the number of references made to them by experts in the field of reading.

The American Spelling Book. Noah Webster attempted to combine the Alphabetic and Phonetic Methods of teaching beginning reading. In the preface is the following quotation:

Among the defects and absurdities found in books of this kind hitherto published (speller-readers), may rank the want of a thorough investigation of the sounds in the English language, and the powers of the several letters. . . . In attempting to correct these faults it was necessary
to begin with the elements of the language and explain the powers of the letters.\textsuperscript{20}

The emphasis of Webster and others upon articulation and pronunciation resulted in an important change in the methods of teaching reading. Attention was given to teaching the sounds of the letters as well as their names. Webster refined the alphabetic-phonetic syllable lists and word lists according to numbers of letters each contained and to their similarity of sound. The phonic modification of the alphabetic approach is clearly shown by the first lesson:

The following columns are to be read downwards: All the words (syllables) in the same columns being sounded alike, when a child has a sound of the first the others will naturally follow. They may then be read across the page. [Probably to emphasize the sound of the consonant.]\textsuperscript{21}

Lesson I

\begin{tabular}{cccccccc}
\texttt{ba} & \texttt{be} & \texttt{bi} & \texttt{bo} & \texttt{bu} & \texttt{by} \\
\texttt{ca} & \texttt{ce} & \texttt{ci} & \texttt{co} & \texttt{cu} & \texttt{cy} \\
\texttt{da} & \texttt{de} & \texttt{di} & \texttt{do} & \texttt{du} & \texttt{dy} \\
\texttt{fa} & \texttt{fe} & \texttt{fi} & \texttt{fo} & \texttt{fu} & \texttt{fy} \\
\end{tabular}

\textbf{The McGuffey Readers.} William H. McGuffey published a complete set of graded readers between 1836 and 1844. He was the first textbook writer to develop a series of clearly differentiated and strictly graded readers, with a separate text for each grade of the elementary school. These books surpassed other readers in popularity for many years. This

\textsuperscript{20}Noah Webster,\textit{ The American Spelling Book} (Boston: Isaiah Thomas and Ebenezer Andrews, 1798), p. vi.

\textsuperscript{21}\textit{Ibid}, p. 36.
The basic assumptions of the study. First, it is assumed that reading is a process of development, and the broad generalizations underlying child growth and development and principles of learning should be the basic foundation of a beginning reading method. Thus, a method should be in accord with these generalizations and should be characterized by (1) providing continuous growth in reading skills, (2) being an integrated part of the school curriculum, (3) providing for individual differences in capacity and learning ability, and (4) the extension of needs for reading. Second, it is assumed that at the present time there is no perfect method of teaching reading. Each method has certain limitations, and the best method is that method which teaches a child to read to the best of his ability. Third, it is assumed that the beginning stages of reading are most important since attitudes and patterns formed at the primary level strongly influence later development in reading. Fourth, it is assumed that there is lack of understanding by teachers, administrators, and the public concerning the basic assumptions and techniques underlying beginning reading programs.

Earlier Studies in the Field

Numerous periodical articles and books concerning reading methods have appeared in educational literature. The more important and pertinent of these are listed in the bibliography.
complex set of graded readers was entitled *McGuffey's New First Eclectic Reader.*

The word "eclectic," according to the first definition given in Webster's Dictionary, means "selecting, choosing from various sources or systems." Hence, McGuffey's title was appropriate for the method represented was a composite of the Alphabetic, Phonetic, and Sentence Methods.

The alphabet in both capital and lower case letters was presented on page one. This was interpreted and explained by a picture-alphabet covering the next three pages. The first "reading lesson is presented on page four, carefully limited to two-letter words." Phonetic elements, selected for use as drill, were included regularly and apparently were major consideration in building the sentence content. Thus, it seems that McGuffey built his series of readers upon a combination of the Alphabetic, Phonic, and Word Methods. Adherents of each method could find in them suitable material. This may be an important part of the explanation for the immediate and wide acceptance of the series.

Other reasons, more justifiable, were clear type, improved bindings, and large size. McGuffey started a trend in decreasing the number of new words presented on each page and eliminating unfamiliar words from review pages. He was the first author of readers who made specific provision for repetition of new words in several sentences, and for a regular rate of increase in vocabulary from page to page.
Advantages of the Alphabetic-Phonetic Method

Although this method appears to fall short of developing thoughtful reading in the primary grades, it provided instruction in the mechanics of pronunciation and spelling. The purpose of the phonetic drill exercises in the Alphabetic-Phonetic Method was to enable the reader to develop ability to attack new words and to recognize and work out the pronunciation of words whose printed forms were unfamiliar.

Limitations of the Alphabetic-Phonetic Method

The limitations of the Alphabetic-Phonetic Method are very similar to the disadvantages as listed in regards to the Alphabetic Method. The Alphabetic-Phonetic offered little change from the Alphabetic Method. It merely added the learning of isolated letter sounds. This in reality had little if any value as phonetic interpretation of a printed symbol is an accessory in developing meaning, and no technical training in letter sounding can be successful unless the letter is expressed in a thought unit. In fact the emphasis upon the mechanical sounding of symbols often prevented the child from developing the ability to gain understanding of the reading content.

The method assumed that children would gain meanings from their reading if they could translate the printed words
Into correct pronunciation. This may be true if the words used had been in the experiences of the learners, but in this method vocabulary was not controlled, and the drill on syllables tended to distract from teaching reading as a thought-getting process.

Present Status of the Alphabetic-Phonetic Method

In order to provide a numerical evaluation of the Alphabetic Method, a description of such was subjected to the same judges, experts in elementary education, to determine its total points as scored by them on the established criteria.²²

The numerical value assigned to this method by the judges was twenty. A critical study of the ratings showed that in their opinion this method provided for the following features: (1) phonetic analysis, (2) syllabification, (3) oral reading, and (4) increase in vocabulary. Nevertheless, as only one point was designated to each of these features they believed the provision was developed to an inadequate level.

Research Findings

A somewhat detailed survey of the literature has failed to locate scientific studies of the relative merits of the Alphabetic-Phonetic method of teaching reading.

²²Appendix pp. 324-325.
Therefore, consideration cannot be given to data provided by research concerning the value of this particular method, but it appears that the conclusions reached by research concerning the relative value of the Alphabetic Method may be applied, for as Huey has written:

\[\ldots\text{in dealing thus constant with the letters and their combinations, the pupils necessarily acquired a familiarity with the sounds represented by each letter, whether purposely taught or not. And thus this method (alphabet) always combined something of phonics as well.}\]

These conclusions appear to be:

1. A large percentage of the children in the primary grades were not able to read.

2. Frequently children taught by the Alphabetic-Phonetic Method of reading experienced grave difficulty in word recognition.

3. Numerous children developed inadequate eye span when taught by the Alphabetic-Phonetic Method.

\[\text{Huey, op. cit., p. 266.}\]
CHAPTER V

SYNTHETIC METHODS (CONCLUDED)

Refinement in the Alphabetic and Alphabetic-Phonetic methods produced a stabilized set of letter-sounds for the letter-names. As these letter-sounds were systematized into a method of teaching reading, the name Phonic Method was applied to that teaching method. This method requires that the child be instructed in how to sound out the letters. After the names and sounds of the individual letters were mastered the child progressed to combinations of letters, vowels, consonants, and blends. In reality there was little really new in the change of emphasis from letters to sounds, for the teaching procedure was still a synthesizing of small word elements, the parts being taught before the word.

Section I

The Phonic Method

As the name implies the Phonic Method of teaching beginning reading was characterized by the teaching of phonics as the chief and frequently the only aid to word recognition taught. The phonic elements were developed through regimented drill on the blending of letter sounds and phonograms into words.
Historical Development

Methods which approached reading through the sounds of the letters did not come into common use in America until 1870. However, this method had long been advocated in isolated instances and had been used for centuries.

One of the early writers to protest against the Alphabetic Method was Ickelsamer. In 1534 he published a primer whose content was based on a Phonic Method of teaching reading. To help children learn the letter sounds Ickelsamer provided each letter with a picture of an animal whose voice or cry represented the letter sound.

Taylor reviewed Ickelsamer's method of teaching beginning reading in the following manner:

Instead of the name of the letter, the child first learned its sound; and the author printed with each letter the picture of an animal whose voice or cry resembled the sound of the letter. Thus m was accompanied by a cow, r by a dog. The oral word was analyzed, and the pupil pointed to the pictures which represented the various sounds of the word.

Little attention was given to this method until 1800 when Pestalozzi, attempting to psychologize teaching, suggested that all instruction should proceed from the simple to the complex, and that reading be introduced with a single letter.

---


2 Ibid., p. 116.
and by prefixing letter and sound symbols, words be developed. To the ideas of Ickelsamer (letter sounding) and Pestalozzi (prefixing letter and sound symbols) J.M.D. Meiklejohn in 1869 added the idea of "word families." This was the arrangement of words in lists such as, ox, box, and so forth.

In the United States probably Horace Mann was the first educator to advocate a complete break from the Alphabetic Method and the use of phonics as a complete and independent method of beginning reading. Advocating the adoption of methods he observed in Prussia, Mann explained:

Here the names of the letters were not given as with us, but only their powers, or the sounds which those letters have in combination. The letter h was first selected and set up in the reading-frame (an adaptation of the abacus idea), and the children instead of articulating our alphabetic h (aitch), merely gave a hard breathing - such a sound as the letter really has in the word horse. Then the diphthong au (the German word for house is spelled haus) was taken and sounded by itself in the same way. Then the blocks containing h and au were brought together and the two sounds were combined. Lastly, the letter s was first sounded by itself, then added to the others, and then the whole word was spoken.

---


However, the death knell to the Alphabetic Method was sounded with Mann's penetrating criticism of the psychological weakness of the ABC Method of teaching beginning reading:

Compare the above [Phonetic] method with that of calling up a class of abecedarians, - or what is more common a single child, - and while the teacher holds a book or card before him, with a pointer in his hand, says, a; then b, and the child echoes b; and so on until the vertical row of lifeless and ill-favored characters is completed, . . . Not a single faculty of the mind is exercised excepting that of imitating sounds; and even the number of these imitations is limited to twenty-six. A parrot or an idiot could do the same thing. As a general rule, six months are spent before the twenty-six letters are mastered, . . . 6

The Phonic Method has had a long history in America, and during its history the method has undergone many changes. In the earliest of the Phonic Methods the letters of a word were spelled by their elementary sounds. Then the elementary sounds were blended into words. This method proved inefficient as no provision was made for silent letters or several letters grouped to represent a single sound. In order to overcome the above mentioned criticism, phonic reading programs developed which emphasized the use of syllables as a basis for sounding. The syllables, however, proved an inflexible unit which often did not correspond to the way the word was pronounced. Other phonic programs made use of the phonogram unit. As this procedure offered a longer more flexible and more natural way of sounding words, it quickly

6Ibid., p. 117.
supplanted the syllabic method. This method separated words on the basis of sound, treated unphonetic words as sight words, and encouraged children to see the largest sound unit in a word. Nevertheless it was a mechanical process and, as such, if emphasized extensively, might detract from the meaning of the content.

Monroe summarizes the evolution of phonics in the following manner:

. . . (1) These methods are chiefly synthetic at the start, but tend to become an analytic-synthetic method. . . . (2) The unit for handling sounds grows larger: letter, syllable, phonogram, sight word. (3) There is a decreasing artificiality in the teaching devices employed; note the abolition of diacritics, marks, etc. (4) The use of larger units and more natural methods frees the child's attention from mere phonetic translation and permits it to focus in larger degree on the meanings he is trying to obtain from his reading.

At one time phonics claimed the major part of the time and emphasis during the beginning stages of learning to read. At the present time, phonics is used in a supporting role to other methods of general instruction. Phonograms are seldom used. When a new sound element is met, the sound is decided on the basis of acquaintance with several words already known which contain the elements. The usual procedure is to emphasize sight recognition with meaning, utilizing a

---

8 Ibid.
minimum of phonics to achieve correct pronunciation and clear
enunciation, and to aid in attacking unfamiliar words.

Definition of Terms

As the meaning of a word depends upon its total in­
cidence in the past experiences of writer and reader and upon
the situation in which it is being used, it appears advan­
tageous to define certain terms which will occur frequently
in this chapter.

The terms to be defined are: phonics, phonetics,
phonogram, syllables, monosyllable words, polysyllable words,
diacritical marks, vowels, consonant, and consonant combinations.

Occasionally there is some confusion between the
meaning of the terms Phonic and Phonetic. According to the
definition given in Webster's Dictionary, phonics is the
study and application of elementary phonetics as a method
of teaching beginners to read or to enumerate. Therefore,
by the Phonic Method the pupil is trained directly to associ­
ate the separate elementary sounds of which the oral language
consists with the characters of printed symbols.

Phonetics is defined as the "science of speech
sounds and presupposes an understanding of linguistics."10

9A. Merriam Webster, Webster's New International
Dictionary of the English Language (Second edition, unabridged;

10Funk and Wagnalls, College "Standard" Dictionary of
the English Language (New York: Funk and Wagnalls Co., 1946),
p. 853.