A COMPARISON OF MUSIC CRITICISM
IN PRESS AND RADIO

A Thesis Presented for the
Degree of Master of Arts

by

Muriel Sizer Anstaett, B.S.

THE OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY

1946

Approved by:

[Signature]
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am indebted to Dr. M. Emett Wilson for the many helpful suggestions he gave me while I was collecting materials and writing this thesis. I want to thank Dr. Riley, Professor Wagner, and Mrs. Ardis Wheeler for their kind assistance in locating reference materials. I am most grateful to George Palmer of WSAI and Bob Merryman of WLW for their radio scripts.

I would like to extend a word of appreciation to the following who answered my requests for information for this theses:

Mr. Kenneth Baker, Director of Research, NAB
Mr. Ernest LaPrade, Director of Music Research, NBC
Miss Jean Emery, Secretary to the editor of Musical America
Miss Claire Montmarquet, Public Service Department, New York
Mrs. Gertrude G. Broderick, Radio Education Specialist, U.S. Office of Education
Miss Anne Harding, Service Division, CBS
Mrs. Enneking, Women's Division of the Cincinnati Symphony Orchestra
CONTENTS

CHAPTER I -- MUSIC CRITICISM 1
CHAPTER II -- MUSIC CRITICISM IN THE PRESS 10
CHAPTER III -- MUSIC CRITICISM ON THE AIR 22
CHAPTER IV -- RADIO COMMENTATIONS AND PROGRAM NOTES 28
CHAPTER V -- MUSIC FORECAST 39
CHAPTER VI -- QUALIFICATIONS OF THE MUSIC CRITIC 55
CHAPTER VII -- THE FUTURE OF MUSIC CRITICISM 58

BIBLIOGRAPHY 60
CHAPTER I

MUSIC CRITICISM

As a profession, very little has been written about music criticism. Even the public criticism of music which is an over-worked subject of discussion amongst those interested in the art and now engages many professionally, has a tendency to be nothing more than biased opinions of individuals.

In our survey, no extensive literature about music criticism as a science, an art, a branch of aesthetics, or of theory was found. This is the more curious when it is considered that virtually every expression of opinion concerning music or its performance, spoken as well as written, is a form of music criticism and that whosoever talks or writes about music is, in a sense, a music critic. Though the term has its particular application today to a specialized branch of practical journalism, music criticism also has its place in books on theoretical musical subjects, in biographies of musicians, in analytical studies of the form and content of particular compositions, and in writings on aesthetics, art trends, and sociological aspects of music.

At the present time, a distinction is drawn between the musicologist and the critic, though in the flesh he may be one and the same man. Musicology is concerned much more with factual and historical research, criticism with descrip-
tion and evaluation. However, in practice musicology tends
to ally itself with research, criticism with journalism.
Criticism is much more personal and at the same time much
less ordered or subject to ordering.

Samuel Johnson (1709-1784), the great lexicographer,
divides those who criticize into three classes:

...the first are those that know no rules but pro-
nounce entirely from their natural taste and feel-
ings; the second are those that know and judge by
rules; and the third are those who know but are a-
bove the rules...These last are those you should
wish to satisfy. Next to them rate the natural
judges; but ever despise those opinions that are
formed by the rules.  

In the last two hundred years, music critics have fallen in-
to one or more of these categories. Some were successful,
others were not. A brief resume of the beginnings of music
criticism aids in the understanding of the art itself.

One might name Philodemos as the earliest critic of mu-
ic, who in the First Century B.C. wrote a diatribe on the
uselessness of music. Pythagorus left no writings, but "the
Timaios of Plato, the Harmonics of Aristotle (now lost), and
of Aitozenos of Tarentum, are writings of the ancients per-
taining to the budding science of music."  

Harmonic manuals were numerous in the early Christian
era, and the Middle Ages had a considerable literature de-
voted to the plain-song, counterpoint, intervals, consonances,
dissonances, and the like; but it was only when these reached

1 Johnson, Letters to Fanny Burney with notes by C. B. Tink-
2 Thompson, International Cyclopedia of Music and Musi-
cians, p. 1203.
the stage of vigorous disputes, with a good deal of attacking back and forth, as was the case in the Sixteenth Century, that some groundwork was laid for music criticism. The Eighteenth Century was an age of the critical spirit. Writers began to approach music from a literary or speculative angle. As a public expression of personal opinion it is, of course, much older. Considered as a profession, music criticism may be said to have started with the establishment of the first music journals in the middle or late 1700's.

The serious criticism of current musical activities began in Germany with Johann Mattheson's (1681-1764) sheet called Musica Critica from 1722 to 1725. Lorenz Mizler (1711-1778) published a monthly called Bibliothek which ran from 1736 to 1754, and Johann Adolph Schiebe's (1708-1776) weekly Der Critische Musikus, from 1737 to 1740. These German critical publications promoted the idealistic, philosophical, and polemical tendencies of the German temperament along with their love for music.

E.T.A. Hoffmann (1776-1822) wrote a striking book On Purity in Music to which Robert Schumann referred in his Advice to Young Musicians. Schumann told these struggling adolescents to "read it often as you grow older." His own Neue Zeitschrift fur Musik began in 1834 with an article praising Chopin and in 1853 his last contribution was one on Brahms.

Vienna. He served as critic of various papers from 1848 to 1895, and his support of Schumann and Brahms is noteworthy, while his opposition to Liszt and Wagner is notorious. Hanslick's book The Beautiful in Music is written in a brilliant style and is of permanent value. He upheld the theory of "pure" music, maintaining that the beauty of music is entirely self-contained and not dependent on any extraneous, poetic, or descriptive factors.

The Guerre Des Bouffons, the "War of the Comedians", was the beginning of active musical criticism in France. The war soon became one of pamphlets, for the best intellects of this period (1751-72) devoted themselves to the discussion of music because of this Parisian quarrel which broke out in 1752.

The issue in question was whether to favor Italian opera or French opera. In the theatre the national (French) party sat under the King's box, and the Italian party under the Queen's, so they became known as the 'King's Corner' party and the 'Queen's Corner' party.

Jean Jacques Rousseau (1712-1778) wrote in a letter on French Music (Lettre sur La Musique Francaise) in 1753, that

there is neither measure nor melody in French music, because the language itself is not susceptible of either... From all which I conclude that the French have no music, and never can have any, or, if they ever have, so much the worse for them.²

¹Hanslick, The Beautiful in Music, Chapter VI.
Monsieur Monnet, director of the Opéra Comique in 1753, perpetrated a fraud, by having an opera written which he announced as by an Italian composer. After it was warmly approved by the anti-national (Queen's Corner) party, he admitted that it was written by a Paris poet and composer. So the attacks of the anti-nationalists had acted as a tonic to the nationalistic school.

From 1776 to 1779, musical criticism received a fresh stimulus from struggles between the Gluckists and Piccinists. Feuds between the followers of the two eminent composers enlivened the musical activities of the city and provided its inhabitants with a source of division almost as sharp as those of politics and religion. The same thing happened between Bononcini and Handel, and Brahms and Wagner.

Joseph Addison (1672-1719), the English essayist, and Sir Richard Steele (1672-1729), British author, dealt wittily and satirically with the Italian opera of their time in their writings for The Tatler, The Spectator, and The Guardian. They were concerned with opera as a social phenomenon rather than as an art form. For them one opera was like another, and all were similarly fit for ridicule along with the castrati and the women of high degree who swarmed about stage doors for an opportunity to see these pampered creatures enter or leave the theatre.

Sir John Hawkins (1719-1789), born the year of Steele's death, was a historian like Dr. Charles Burney (1726-1814),
if not similarly a traveler and chronicler of contemporary events outside his native land. Aside from the critical comment in his five-volume General History of the Science and Practice of Music, Mr. Hawkins qualifies in a secondary way as a music critic in the modern sense by reason of some of his contributions to the Gentleman's Magazine. Burney's General History of Music is full of criticism, including extended comment on Italian operas which no one is likely to hear in the theatre again.

The gossipy writings of the Earl of Mount-Edgcumbe (1764-1839), a younger contemporary of Dr. Burney, present the opinions of a dilettante; but they show how criticism developed in the period between Burney and Henry Fothergill Chorley (1808-1872). In his articles for the London Athenaeum, Chorley was a full-fledged professional critic.

Edward Gibbon (1737-1794) the English historian who is noted for his Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire, says there are three kinds of criticism, the analytical, the merely explanatory and the one he finds in the author, when he "tells me his own feelings, and tells them with so much energy that he communicates them." Percy Scholes insists that in certain instances any less personal sort of criticism becomes patently absurd; examples of widely differing types of music about which critics have always differed, as in Beethoven's "Grosse Fuge" for string quartet (Op. 133) and

Gibbon, The Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire, 18th Century - Longinus.
the finale of his "Choral Symphony" the only helpful criticism is the frankly subjective. Professional differences of opinion exist not only among critics of literature and painting, but also among medical, legal, and military authorities. It would be absolutely boastful and dogmatic of music critics to claim that they know the way to "simple, impersonal truth".

Max Graf, himself a critic in Vienna from 1890 to 1938, records the two hundred years of conflict between the composers and the critics in his new book Composer and Critic. The first battle, according to Graf, was between Bach and Johann Schiebe. Schiebe was wrong when, because he was the exponent of an age that preferred clarity to exuberant fancy, he found Bach's music intricate and over-elaborate.

"The musician was the greatest composer of the Baroque period; the critic was one of the leading German exponents of the Age of Reason, an age which had moved away from the frenzied extravagance of Baroque art."

The conflict between Bach and Schiebe is typical of the disagreement which results from historical development. In Bach's time it was the conflict between rationalism and Baroque imagination; at the beginning of the Nineteenth Century, it was the struggle between the classicism and romanticism. Fantasy and reason are forever endeavoring to over-

\[1\] Scholes, op. cit., p. 240.
\[2\] Max Graf, Composer and Critic, p. 70.
throw the other.

In 1847, Moritz Hauptmann, the distinguished theorist reputed for the delicacy of his aural perception, wrote that he did not believe a single one of Wagner's operas would survive him. Ten years later the New York Times' critic made the wonderful discovery that "Lohengrin" does not contain a dozen bars of melody, and another critic, when Gounod's "Faust" had its first performance in New York, declared there was only one real melody in it!

Mr. Graf favors the notion that a critic should be a composer. He reasons that if he possesses this creative power he is better qualified to judge the works of others. The Romantic Period produced a series of composers who were also writers. Mendelssohn composed letters as gracefully as scores. Liszt and Berlioz were examples of the high artistic and literary culture of the Romantic composers.

Berlioz (1803-1869) lived the eccentric rôle of the temperamentally musician. He was a great writer and could relate a story in his own temperamentally way. His ardor shines in his writings:

...Handel is a barrel of pork and beer....Palestrina has no spark of genius, but....Beethoven's genius in his adagios...soars aloft like the colossal bird above the snowy summit of Chimborazo.¹

Robert Schumann (1810-1856) was a born music critic. He fought for Mendelssohn, Berlioz, Chopin, and Brahms, and

¹ Berlioz, Evenings in the Orchestra, originally published as Les Soirées de l'Orchestre, 1854.
sent the manuscript of his criticism of Brahms' debut to the father, enclosing the note: "To make his first entrance into the world easier."

Occasionally implications of violence and bitterness are discerned in Carl von Weber's articles. He was another leader of the Romantic movement, but his outspoken criticism produced a like response from his readers. One of these informed Weber that controversies are of no interest to readers—they afford nothing but amusement.

This development of musical criticism in Europe stages the setting for its growth in the United States. So our scene shifts across the waters to continue the story of Music Criticism.
CHAPTER II

MUSIC CRITICISM IN THE PRESS

The first American newspaper The Boston News Letter began printing issues in 1704. Records show that the earliest public concert in America was in Boston in 1731, and the first opera was performed in Charleston in 1735. News notices of these concert and opera performances were run in the newspaper, but there was little or nothing of what we today call music criticism. However, the critical spirit was very actively applied to music during the Eighteenth Century, but it appeared in pamphlets and books, not in the periodical press.

Music criticism writing, worthy of the name, began in the tea-party town, for here lived the intelligentsia, the poets, philosophers, and artists. People became music conscious when musical societies were initiated. The Pierian Sodality came into existence in 1808 and the Handel and Haydn Society gave a complete performance of the "Messiah" in 1818. The beginning of choral singing in the city's public schools occurred in 1837. Harvard's Department of Music was inaugurated in 1862 where John Knowles Paine lectured on the history and theory of music. The formation of the Boston Symphony Orchestra in 1880, culminated Boston's musical evolution. From Henschel to Koussevitsky, this or-

-10-
chestra has maintained a position as one of the world's greatest. The American Broadcasting Company carries their hour program on Tuesday evenings from 9:30 to 10:30 P.M.

John Sullivan Dwight (1813-1893), the father of serious musical criticism in the United States, had little difficulty in maintaining his high, ethical standards in this environment. He was the leading spirit of the Harvard Musical Association and the first who succeeded in interesting musically untrained and indifferent readers. Although the American Musical Magazine (New York, 1786) and Gilbert's Musical Magazine (1790) preceded Dwight's Journal of Music (1852-1881), this organ was considered the highest-toned musical periodical of its day, all the world over.

Dwight was at his best in his analyses of Beethoven and Mozart. He estimated Chopin, Mendelssohn, and Schumann highly, but he took Hanslick's view (the Viennese critic discussed in the first chapter) concerning Berlioz, Wagner, and Liszt. It is interesting to note that at the time of Dwight's Journal none of the newspapers in Boston had a specialist writer on music, so in his later life Dwight himself served as critic of the Boston Transcript.

William Foster Apthorp (1848-1913) and Philip Hale (1854-1934) furthered Dwight's idealism of criticism. Apthorp wrote for the Boston Evening Transcript in the manner of the classical English essayist, although one can detect the
French style of personal criticism in his writings. His articles tend to set people thinking, which is one of the tests of good criticism.

Apthorp wrote program notes for the Boston Symphony Concerts, but they were surpassed by those of Philip Hale, who performed this task from 1901 to 1934. His annotations supplied the historical, biographical, and bibliographical information rather than analysis. Supplementing this factual knowledge, Mr. Hale, through extensive learning, was capable of writing glibly about facts of all the arts in a fascinating literary style. He frequently mentioned Juvenal, the Roman satiric poet, Samuel Johnson, the English author, and Sir Charles Napier, the British general, to illustrate Saint-Saëns; the mystic English painter, William Blake and the American poet, Walt Whitman were referred to in illustrations of Schubert. Effervescing with descriptive and colorful adjectives, Mr. Hale never hesitated to lighten musical instruction with diversion and wit.

Hale's poetical criticism of Debussy's Afternoon of a Faun depicts his deep admiration of the work:

A masterpiece of imaginative poetry in tones;
...there is the suggestion of forest and meadow dear to fauns and nymphs.1

His response to Iberia is warm and colorful:

There is the suggestion of street life and wild strains, heard on bleak plains or savage mountains; of the music of people; of summer nights, warm and odorous;............

1 Hale, Boston Symphony Programme Notes, p. 119.
of tangos. of gypsies with their spells brought from the East; of women with Moorish blood.\(^1\)

The honor of being recognized as one of the most brilliant and learned of American critics is justly due Philip Hale.

Two New York music critics, Henry T. Finck (1854-1926) and Richard Aldrich (1863-1937), had been pupils at Harvard of John Knowles Paine. Thus the idealism of Boston's musical leaders had an influence on their formative years. Finck and Aldrich were a part of the "Great Five", a group of music critics during the classical age of New York musical criticism which began in 1880. The other three members were Henry Krehbiel (1854-1923), William James Henderson (1855-1937), and James Gibbons Huneker (1860-1921).

The age of industrial expansion had transformed New York from the provincial town of two-story houses into the capital of a new empire. The general public was being educated toward an appreciation of serious music. Such men as Leopold Damrosch (1832-1885), the conductor of the Oratorio Society, Theodore Thomas (1835-1905), conductor of the New York Philharmonic at this time, Anton Seidl (1850-1898), the conductor of Wagnerian music, and Franz Kneisel (1865-1926), violinist of the famous Kneisel Quartet, started New York on its way to becoming one of the world's great musical centers.

The music of Berlioz, Liszt, and Wagner, which had not been appreciated up to this time (Hanslick and Dwight pre-

\(^1\) Hale, op. cit., p. 127.
viously condemned it) was presented. Now the merits of Richard Wagner were discussed in every household. More space was given to music in the newspapers, and the music critics assumed the position as leaders of public taste. The voices of the "Great Five" sounded words of learning and experience.

Henry Finck wrote for the New York Evening Post in a vivid and enthusiastic manner. He delighted in the art of praising, and firmly opposed the kind of rudeness which retarded the progress of either the performer or composer.

Richard Aldrich served at different times as music critic for the Providence Journal, the Washington Evening Star, and the New York Times. He liked to correlate the arts in the manner of Hale and Hanslick. His review of the concert of the Boston Symphony Orchestra, November 8, 1918, includes:

The evening ended with Debussy's "Iberia", with the Spain of Velasquez, El Greco or Goya, but a subtilized Spain in which the stark realism of Zuloaga is sifted through silken veils...

Debussy's "Iberia" seems to send minds searching to other arts for comparisons. The French Impressionism in his music creates different impressions upon different listeners. However, Mr. Aldrich used the matter-of-fact attitude in his criticisms and did not deal in the noble art of praising as Henry Finck did.

Henry Krebbiel was a stern and dogmatic critic who made a great impression on his readers. He aimed to lead them into the paths of musical righteousness and to educate them.

---

through his books, his daily criticisms, and his program notes for the New York Philharmonic Society's concerts. His efforts put the profession of musical criticism upon a higher plane of knowledge and competence than it had ever occupied in America before his day.

, Oscar Thompson dedicated his Practical Musical Criticism to William James Henderson, whom he says was the greatest music critic America has ever produced. Mr. Henderson's verdict on singers was considered the most authoritative of all American critics. Thompson was the cultivated, fine, warm, considerate critic, who took up the cause of Wagner with more understanding than Henderson.

James Gibbons Huneker was the most fascinating personality among New York's "Great Five". He was a colorful writer, inserting his bits of knowledge of art and literature in his musical criticisms as a virtuoso of style. His gift for brief, striking, and often surprising characterizations makes his writings brilliant. Here are some excerpts:

Handel's music is like a blow from a muscular fist...Mozart, the sweetly lyric, the mellifluous and ever gay Mozart, made sonatas as God carves the cosmos....Mendelssohn's music was Bach's watered for general consumption......

Grieg built his nest overlooking Norwegian fjords and built it of bright colored bits of Schumann and Chopin. He is the bird with the one sweet, albeit monotonous note.....

A personal, bull's-eye expression is in every sentence, yet a profound judgment.

1 Graf, op. cit., p. 317.
Mention must be made of Lawrence Gilman (1878-1939), who reminds one of the deeper tones of Huneker. He admired flamboyant language and perhaps because he had wanted to be a painter before he began his career as a music critic on Harper's Weekly in 1901, his colorful criticisms synonomize a dipping of his pen into a painter's palette. Gilman was the author of the New York Philharmonic Society's program notes from 1921, and music critic of the Herald Tribune from 1923, until the time of his death in 1939.

A view of the current music criticisms frames our picture of this chapter. Theodore Presser's Etude, the New York Evening Post, Philip Hale's Musical World, Pierre Key's Musical Digest, all have eschewed sensationalism and trash down through the years. While not avoiding anecdotes, personal details, and biographic romances - these publications have influenced the musical education of the American public.

James Francis Cooke, now editor of the Etude, has the ideal editor's gift of getting out of a contributor the best that is in him. Edward Smith in his reviews for The Musical Digest does not mince words:

A sloppy, totally uninteresting performance, the Metropolitan's repeat of "Lucia", completely lacked life and vitality, except for a few scattered moments throughout the evening.¹

What would Mr. Finck, the kindly writer of the "Great Five" think of this:

Her voice wavered dangerously at times and she was consistently flat in the middle-upper register. The voice itself is much too small for the part and her acting equaled her poor singing.¹

"The poor things," Mr. Finck would say, "who always hope and believe that the critics will write flattering notices about them which can be reprinted in circulars and used to pave the way in other cities and towns in which there is not such a glut of music as in the metropolis."²

Every metropolitan paper has a musical editor, some have two. At present there are sixteen reviewers of musical events writing under their own by-lines in the eight daily New York newspapers which provide regular concert coverages - The New York Times, the Herald Tribune, the Journal-American, the New York Post, the World Telegram, the Sun, PM, and The Brooklyn Eagle. In a typical musical season more than 550 New York recitals are given by individual vocalists and instrumentalists in the city's four principal auditoriums devoted to such events - Carnegie Hall, Town Hall, the Carnegie Chamber Music Hall, and the New York Times Hall.

The opinions of Olin Downes and Virgil Thomson, as the senior critics respectively of the venerable New York Times and Herald-Tribune, carry the greatest weight throughout the musical profession. The works of Ernest Newman and Bernard Shaw have already been embalmed in books. Mr. Shaw, with his ¹

¹Smith, loc. cit.
²Finck, Success in Music and How it is Won, p.4.
usual frankness says "Musical criticism, like sermons, are of low average quality simply because they are never dis-
cussed or contradicted." His statement does not entirely correspond with the facts of American life. But we must admit, after reading the articles in the Musical Courier, "New York Critics and How They Function", that the feeling of the great critics is that they are responsible for the development of musical culture and public taste in a country that is making its first strides towards leadership in music.

The late William Apthorp, who was the leading musical critic in Boston in his day, was a kindhearted man, but he refused to coddle young musicians simply because they had worked hard to win success....Performers experience off-nights. Mr. Smith of the Musical Digest speaks of the operatic soprano Lily Djanell, as "repeating her vulgar conception of "Carmen", singing some phrases explosively but well, and in others deviating from pitch." That was on February 22, 1946 in New York. This summer at the Cincinnati Opera, Mr. Howard Hess of the Cincinnati Times-Star, raves - "Djanel is a singing artist who is also an actress... I wonder if any has been more capable than Djanel."

Theodore Thomas, who gave his whole life to the object of educating the American public, was often treated by cri-

1 Shaw, Dramatic Opinions and Essays
3 Howard Hess, Cincinnati Times-Star, July 10, 1946.
tics as if he had been a pirate or a Hun. His wife relates that all his life he was keenly sensitive to unfriendly or even unintelligent press criticism, and to read an antagonistic or indifferent notice of one of his concerts would depress his spirits for twenty-four hours afterwards.

Oscar Thompson, who organized and taught the first class in music criticism at the Curtis Institute, Philadelphia, in 1923, opens his chapter on "Appraisal of Performances", with "The greater part of the newspaper critic's labor is concerned with the quality and character of performances." Thompson admits that our musical life has become more and more a cult of the interpreter. It is the singers, a dramatic soprano and a high tenor, and not Richard Wagner, who receive the praise for "Tristan and Isolde".

Audiences worshiping at the feet of a "marvelous" conductor easily forget Beethoven's contribution to his own score, and eulogize the grandeur of a particular director's rendition of the "Ninth Symphony". But if the critic is the good journalist he ought to be, he will remember that simple reporting is an important part of his function; that each concert has its place in the news.

Dorothy Bersin, of the Musical Courier gives us a sample of journal reporting:

Michael Rosenker, violinist, was the soloist with

---

Oscar Thompson, Practical Musical Criticism, p.77.
the Philharmonic Symphony on Feb. 3's matinee, playing the Glazounoff "Concerto in A Minor", Op. 82. He gave the work an enjoyable performance, able from the mechanical standpoint and poetic in expression, although his intonation was not always meticulous. The orchestral numbers were the Brahms' "Third Symphony" and Bartok's "Concerto for Orchestra", both repeated from the preceding Thursday.

Samuel Wilson, music critic of the Columbus Dispatch, describes an evening of the Cincinnati May Festival, 1946:

...The Handel chorus was magnificently sung. Performance of the "Magnificat" was not too well integrated and lacked the precision and cleaniness of other years. The line of the Beethoven music occasionally wavered and climactic moments hadn't always their customary lift and power...Miss Roman and Mr. Moscona were towers of strength in the soloist ranks and the chorus, at its best, proved that it has no peers in this country.2

Both of these examples demonstrate the fact that the critic approaches a recital or concert in the spirit of the reporter looking for facts. He finds most of his facts in the manner of the performance. He draws on all the technical knowledge he has acquired through accumulated experiences of trying to determine these facts.

Only thirty-five per cent of the United States' population achieve a seventh or eighth grade education. This is the apex of the educational attainment given by the United States' Bureau of the Census, 1946. Four and a half per cent reach the third year in colleges which parallels the other base of three and eight-tenths per cent who receive no

education whatsoever.

Thus a considerable part of the public has not developed sufficient reading skill to read on a serious subject. This public failing is a barrier to the communication of serious subject matter. For these, radio is the tool of communication, since its use does not require a special skill on the part of the recipient. So the conclusion is made that the preference for radio over print increases with the decreasing educational status, therefore the majority of listeners prefer information from the radio for it can be heard without appreciable mental effort. So informal musical analyses and discussions in the scope of the average listener teach the unlearned and review for the more intelligent. The writer's project - Music Forecast - is such a study and will be fully discussed in Chapter V. But first let us survey the development of MUSIC CRITICISM ON THE AIR.

---

1 World Almanac and Book of Facts for 1946, p. 579.
CHAPTER III

MUSIC CRITICISM ON THE AIR

The first music criticism on the air was found in the educational broadcasts. Radio chose the medium of the schools in its first attempt to open the minds of the future generation towards more serious music. Print did not raise the intellectual standard of living just because it was invented, but because it was used by educational institutions such as schools, and promoted by cultural agencies as libraries and publishers. So, in the same manner, serious broadcasting became linked to the whole plexus of educational and cultural institutions before it contributed substantially to the enlightenment of the American community.

In 1928, Dr. Walter Damrosch inaugurated the first network series of music broadcasts for schoolroom listeners, the NBC MUSIC APPRECIATION HOUR. The broadcasts consisted of four sub-series each of which pertained to a definite musical project, such as the presentation of orchestral instruments, the explanation of musical forms and the correlation of lives and works of great composers. In Mr. Wiebe's and Mr. Church's survey, the Educational Music Broadcasts for 1941, they reported that the purpose of the Damrosch programs was not important in the lives of the intended audience, the musical selections and commentary were too mature, and the program
Suspected no page 23.
showed signs of inadequate preparation. They recommended that with the ample facilities of the NBC Symphony Orchestra and Dr. Damrosch's unique personality, a more significant teaching of music appreciation could be presented.

The CBS AMERICAN SCHOOL OF THE AIR in 1940 became the official, nation-wide classroom radio institution of the National Education Association of the United States. A daily half-hour program on school days at 5:00 P.M., planned for school-family listening, is still in existence. On Tuesdays, "Gateways to Music", a series devoted to the appreciation of music is given.

Inaugurated in July 1942, the NBC UNIVERSITY OF THE AIR has as its objective, the presentation of a broadcast series in a carefully selected range of subjects of interest to adult listeners and students. The programs were devoted to historical, musical, and literary subjects of the Western Hemisphere during the first two years, but beginning in 1944, Europe, Asia, Africa were added with the Americas. The systematic as well as the casual listeners are included in the planning of these shows. Mr. Gilbert Chase, supervisor of music of the NBC UNIVERSITY OF THE AIR, emphasizes that:

...the horizons of musical experience, as they present themselves to the radio listeners, can be tremendously widened by utilizing...all the resources that the music libraries of America can offer.\(^2\)

\(^1\) Wiebe and O'Stein, Damrosch Music Appreciation Hour, Bulletin No. 39, p.2.

\(^2\) Chase, Radio Broadcasting and the Music Library, p.4.
More than fifty colleges or universities in California, Oregon, and Washington have used the STANDARD OIL'S RADIO BROADCASTS FOR STUDENTS either in connection with the work in grade schools, in teacher-training, musicology, radio-writing and drama, or extension courses. An art-correlation illustration with a center spread in full color appears on each page of the student's notebook. The superior manner in which these manuals are printed, the quality of the paper, the colorful illustrations, the high caliber of the scripts, helped win first award for this program in 1945.

THE ROCHESTER SCHOOL OF THE AIR radio concerts by the Rochester Civic Orchestra are presented through the facilities of radio station WHAM. The music notebook, prepared by Howard N. Hinga, assistant director of music of the Rochester Public Schools, includes simple and explicit annotations. Mr. Hinga's comments on Mozart's "Eine Kleine Nachtmusik" helps put the children in a receptive mood:

A little night music -- just before we go to bed. Nothing loud and exciting to keep us awake, but soft, tender music to give us sweet dreams.1

Many other cities have programs for the elementary children. Lillian Baldwin and Kaye Hall of Cleveland produce shows acquainting the children with the Cleveland Symphony Orchestra Concerts over WBOE.

Miss Thomas in MUSIC TIME for the first three grades, and Miss Slawson's TIME FOR MUSIC for the fourth, fifth and

1 Hinga, Notebook for THE ROCHESTER SCHOOL OF THE AIR.
sixth grades, are programs broadcast over WOSU at the Ohio State University. They are part of the program of the OHIO SCHOOL OF THE AIR. The following is an excerpt of the script written by the author of this thesis when she was a member of Miss Slawson's class, the program was broadcast March 20, 1946:

The English people have enjoyed singing stories to one another for a long time, so there are many old English ballads...One of the favorite characters in these ballads was Robin Hood, a nobleman. ...One of Robin Hood's men, Little John, asked him to dance before the Queen....Join us in singing our ballad about Robin Hood. Ready--

Sing - "Robin Hood, Robin Hood, Said Little John."1

Controlled educational broadcasting has taken a definite place in school systems. 1941 statistics show that one-half of the 2500 Ohio schools had radios, and that, while the radio is not a substitute for the teacher, it is a device which extends the work of the good teacher.

There is a grave danger that commercial stations and networks may look upon the establishment of FM educational stations as relieving them of the obligation to engage in public-service and educational broadcasting. Devoting all time to entertainment and commercialism would be the greatest imaginable mistake for educators and commercial broadcasters alike. The establishment and support of educational FM stations depend upon a national income that can afford to spon-

1 Radio Script for Time for Music, March 20, 1946.
sor mass education by radio through appropriations to universities, colleges, and school systems.

The four major networks - American, Columbia, Mutual, and National, broadcast in 1945 a combined total of 28,684 program hours. The statistics which M.H. Shapiro compiled in his Programs of 1945 show that "three out of the four webs broadcast music to the extent of approximately 30 per cent average, with drama and news in second or third place, depending upon the network." With so much music at our disposal it is easy to turn on the radio and listen to music, popular or majestic, or just plain noise, whichever befits the present motion. To follow a program which requires mental labor, is much more difficult. But one has the opportunity of becoming as much acquainted with good music in a year by listening to the radio as he would with painting on a year's tour 'round the famous art galleries of the world.

The radio commentator furthers the radio as an instrument of culture as well as a public servant by exposing serious music to all listeners. If the listener is enticed into still further listening to good music and attends concerts, the writer of program notes continues to satisfy his quest for more information. So Chapter IV discusses RADIO COMMENTATIONS AND PROGRAM NOTES.

---

1 M.H. Shapiro, Programs of 1945 - A Network Picture, Radio Annual, 1946, p. 41.
CHAPTER IV

RADIO COMMENTATIONS AND PROGRAM NOTES

Radio commentary on music is analysis or criticism. The commentator who gives the setting for a piece of music to be played is a music critic. Giving just the name and composer of a composition has become obsolete; transitions and explanations are required. Usually some description of the work or interesting data about the performer precedes the rendition. The commentator's criticism may please people with no standards of judgment or others with specific, individualistic interests. However, the one who uses a simple language and stresses human interest in a likable voice tends to raise the standards of serious musical interests.

Deems Taylor, the well-known radio music commentator, possesses all of these qualities. His humorous, chatty, and informal commentations for the New York Philharmonic Sunday afternoon broadcasts and the opera broadcasts from the Metropolitan Opera House have propagated his large radio audience. Taylor has the rare faculty of making a subject universally interesting without "talking-down" to a mythical man-in-the-street. The great and the near-great men of music become living, breathing human beings who, to a greater or lesser extent lived (like Wagner) "under the torment of the demon of creative energy, struggling, clawing, scratching to be re-

-28-
leased." In the introduction of his *Of Men and Music*, which is based on a series of radio talks for the New York Philharmonic Symphony Orchestra, Mr. Taylor notes:

...that behind every musician lurks a man, who is fully as interesting as the trade he follows; that music is written for our enjoyment, and only incidentally for our edification...that many a potential music lover is frightened away by the solemnity of music's devotees. They would make more converts if they would rise from their knees.

After he had devoted one intermission to a discussion of Wagner's character which appears in the chapter "The Monster", a fan who was moved to write about it ended her letter with "you are a liar, a traitor, a snake, and a moron." But Mr. Taylor insistently stresses...

What if he (Wagner) was faithless to his friends and to his wives? He had one mistress to whom he was faithful to the day of his death: Music...
There is not a line of his music that could have been done at all, even by a great genius. Is it any wonder that he had no time to be a man?  

There is a charm accompanying a variety of depth of thought which distinguishes all of Deems Taylor's works.

His diagnosing of the fear of enjoying modern music "hit the nail on the head" when he expressed it as:

...a sort of "I'm glad-I-don't-like-lemonade-because-if-I-did-I'd-drink-it-and-I-hate-it" attitude. We're really afraid of getting to like this new stuff, for fear that it might destroy our taste for the older music that we've known and loved all our lives.

And the writer heartily agrees with him in "Der Doppelganger".

---

2 Ibid., xvii-xviii.
3 Ibid., p. 100.
One of the crying needs of this generation is a school for teaching opera singers how to play upon dummy orchestral instruments. Never yet have I seen a tenor who achieved the faintest illusion with his harp-playing in the scene of "Tannhauser". No matter what the real harp was playing — solid chords, after-beats, or arpeggios — he stuck to a relentless, creaklike stroking motion that might have served to soothe an airedale, but would never have extracted much cooperation from a harp.¹

In the first section of his The Well-Tempered Listener, Mr. Taylor allows himself some provocative conjectures on what sort of careers Bach, Beethoven, and their contemporaries would have, were they living today. Would Bach be a famous organist at some Fifth Avenue Church? Would the broadcasting networks sign him up for a fifteen-minute sustaining program? Applying data to present-day situations promotes good listening, and accounts for Deems Taylor's enthusiastic following.

Another music commentator of merit is Edwin Olin Downes, who was born in Evanston, Illinois in 1886. He commented on the Sunday programs of the New York Philharmonic Symphony Orchestra over the Columbia Broadcasting System. He gloried in disclosing intimate facts about composers, which sometimes aids our interpretations of their music. His musical taste does not run exclusively to the classics. Along with every other critic in New York he waxed enthusiastically over the music in "Oklahoma", praising Agnes de Mille's choreography for that production. He has long been an admirer of the late George Gershwin.

¹ Taylor, op. cit., p.222.
Milton Cross, the current commentator of the Saturday afternoon operas, has never missed a Metropolitan broadcast since Christmas Day, 1931, when he put "Hansel and Gretel" on the air for NBC. He has brightened the programs with personal reminiscences and has filled in the long stage waits with painstaking descriptions of the plot, costumes, and scenery. In 1942, the Metropolitan Opera Association through the Metropolitan Opera Guild presented him a handsome scroll for his contribution to music.

However, in the larger stations and over the national hook-ups, the announcers read scripts for the musical broadcasts that are written by the continuity departments. All of the fifth floor of WLW in Cincinnati is continuity department. Heads of these departments are experienced musical authorities, as Gilbert Chase, supervisor of music for the NBC University of the Air, who plans and prepares the series in collaboration with Ernest LaPrade, of the NBC Music Department (Director of Music Research), and Charles Sidney Freed, Producer-Director, Music Division of the CBS, although he announces the "Gateways to Music" programs himself. It is unusual for one person to be so versatile. Lilla Belle Pitts, professor of Music Education at Teachers' College, Columbia University, is on the National Board of Consultants for the CBS American School of the Air.

The Broadcast Music, Incorporated, a New York organization, furnishes continuity on a commercial basis for programs.
The writer secured a copy of the "Diminutive Classics", a fifteen-minute program of familiar and melodic music. Their setting for "Anitra's Dance" is very well written:

...After deserting his lovely bride Solveig, Peer Gynt wanders over the face of the earth. His steps finally lead him to the desert where he meets the Bedouin dancer, Anitra. As she dances for him he falls completely under her spell and forgets his home, his wife, and his mother. Mr. Barlow and the orchestra now offer "Anitra's Dance" from Edward Grieg's Peer Gynt Suite.¹

The Broadcast Music Incorporation also furnishes transcriptions. This statement headed the script - "The tenth of a series of 15 minute programs utilizing the BMI Bonus Transcriptions." Provision is made for commercial announcements at opening and close spots. Each part of the program is accurately timed.

Announcers with well-modulated voices and an ability to interpret the script with correct inflections and accurate pronunciations enhance the appreciation and enjoyment of the coming number. Ben Grauer, with Charles Kettering's assistance, aptly handles the continuity of the General Motors Symphony of the Air. William Harrison's word settings of the Berkshire Festival at Tanglewood this past summer were very effective. Ken Banghart and Robert Merrill are with the RCA Victor Show, and Alfred Drake (ABC) is with the Ford Sunday Evening Hour. Miss Harding, manager of the service division of CBS, sent the following list of announcers for

the programs over the Columbia Broadcasting System (1945-46):

Wayne Nelson - Philharmonic
Stuart Metz - CBS Symphony
Harry Clark - Cimarron Tavern
Charles Sydney Freed - Gateways to Music
Norris West - Philadelphia Orchestra
John Allen Wolf - American School of the Air
Harry Marble -
David Ross - Great Moments in Music
Alexander Scott - Music of André Kostelanetz

The writer glanced through Bob Merryman's script for the commentations on the Cincinnati Summer Opera Broadcasts, July, 1946. Mr. Merryman related the story of the opera, told anecdotes of the stars, and interviewed prominent personnel during the intermissions. He handled the situation nicely, but there were many unpardonable errors. The evening "Faust" was given, he told us Act III was in progress instead of Act IV, and on July 28, 1946, while "Mignon" was running, Act III was mentioned while they were still singing Act II. This is very disconcerting to the listener who is following the score. When Mr. Emerson Kimball substituted during Mr. Merryman's vacation, the trend of thought was lost at times because of his floundering for words. After knowing of all the assistance utilized in the preparation of data for a performance, such errors seem inexcusable.

The anecdotes of the stars are little, personal stories, as this one of Stella Roman:

Stella Roman has linked her roving about the globe to her hobby, a rather unusual one. She collects water. She has a special black-leather traveling bag for the collection... Everywhere she goes,
she carries a bit of the Mediterranean, the Nile, the Atlantic, the Black Sea...and our own Niagara Falls...you'll find the Ohio represented in the collection.¹

At WSAI, another Cincinnati station, the author visited this summer, the only musical program with commentary was "Evening Concerts". Mr. George Palmer was the writer and commentator who adds a bit of personal comment to his continuity. On the Fourth of July program, the holiday spirit entwined his remarks:

"Evening Concerts" tonight includes this imposing schedule....for a holiday evening: Beethoven's mighty "Fifth Symphony", the so-called Victory Symphony; and in the same mood - that of patriotism, we shall have Tschaikowsky's "1812 Overture" which depicts the successful overthrow of Napoleon's armies by the Russians....

Is it any wonder then...that this magnificent music has been taken into the hearts of people around the world --its symbol -- the V was scratched upon wall and hillside and window-pane--for fine music complements the mood--whether that mood be an individual's or a nation's, or a group of nations."²

A nice handling of thoughts, the writer put into words spontaneous ideas alluring his audience. So the commentator, whether he is reading the output of the continuity department or his own composition, has the responsibility of creating a greater desire for more good music.

After the radio announcer or the music commentator has

1 Bill Meredith, Radio Script for Cincinnati Summer Opera Broadcast, WLW, July, 1946.
²George Palmer, Radio Script for Evening Concerts Broadcast, WSAI, Cin., 0., July 4, 1946.
the program notes has the opportunity of furthering the listener's understanding. Reading permits a person to dwell upon the material, to reread it. He may want to stop and meditate, especially if the material occasions difficulties in vocabulary, terminology, or sentence structure. An understanding of the material may require more reasoning especially if the ideas are mentioned too rapidly or if unfamiliar references are used.

The intellectual apprehension of music aids some listeners, although many fully enjoy music without a bit of musical educational background, so it is not absolutely essential but is helpful for those who desire it. Reading the notes in the programs at the concert hall is one of the ways to acquire this knowledge.

Composers, themselves, sensed this medium as a help in the understanding of their music. Johann Kuhnau (1660-1722), who preceded Bach as director of the choristers of the St. Thomas Schule, is considered to be one of the pioneers in the composition of program music. He called his piano sonatas "Fresh Piano Fruits", and wrote "Musical Representations of Some Stories of the Bible", "The Combat between David and Goliath" being the most famous. Works of program music may be found among the writings of Bach, Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven. But the whole question of understanding the meaning of orchestral music blossomed during the Romantic Movement. The suggestion through music of beauties of nature, the ex-
pression in tone of some poetical or literary idea, and the 
musical narration of legendary tales or fanciful subjects be-
came the vogue. Weber's "Invitation to the Dance", Tschai-
kowsky's "Nutcracker Suite", and the "Sorcerer's Apprentice" 
by Dukas are interesting examples.

Beethoven wrote into the score of his "Pastoral Sym-
phony" and Berlioz went a step further, specifying that a 
detailed narrative program be printed and distributed to the 
public as they entered the hall, so that they might clearly 
follow the story of his "Fantastic Symphony". Carrying the 
idea a little too far, enthusiastic commentators bestowed 
flowery and sometimes fantastic programs on simple and unpre-
tentious works. At the peak of this romantic craze, well-
meaning listeners devoted more time and energy to reading 
their programs than to listening to the actual music.

The writer of program notes may attempt to place the 
audience in the particular mood the composer has injected on 
the score, or he may write simple, factual material about the 
nature and background of the composition, or follow the 
movement of a symphony, giving the plan of each. Here are 
some illustrations:

Jean Clymer writes of Chausson's "Symphony in B Flat 
Major", Opus 20:

Chausson's music has been called the music of 
a dreamer, one who dwelt with Nature and much of 
the feeling of Nature does exist in the score -- 
but there is no program to this work....

---

1 Clymer, Program Notes for Columbus Philharmonic Orches-
tra, November 18, 1946, p.9.
Comments about the "Gambling Songs" sung on Mr. Gilliland's faculty recital October 22, 1946, were:

Reelfoot Lake, the background of the "Gambling Songs" lies mostly in Tennessee (its northern tip being in Kentucky) and is one of the world's best fishing grounds. Formed by an earthquake in 1811, the lake is surrounded by country abounding in characters who seem to have walked out of the pages of folklore. According to legend the earthquake was caused by the steamboat "New Orleans" when it made the first steam-powered journey down the Mississippi River.1

Mr. D. Talmadge Crawshaw described each movement of the "Jupiter Symphony" of Mozart's:

The development begins in light humor with charming counterpoint....The second movement is the finest of all the composer's slow movements..... The whole final movement is of a broadly poetic conception which is more Greek than Gothic...this last phase with its rumbling energy from the very forges of the gods themselves has caused this great work to be known as the "Jupiter Symphony".2

Rabbi James G. Heller, writer of the program notes for the Cincinnati Symphony, cleverly injects the conductor's opinions:

Mr. Goossens says, that in his own little way, Bach was something of a modernist. And that if his music is carefully followed, there will be discovered certain small quips and quavers of harmonic arrangement - and disarrangement - quite of the modern way of doing things differently in music.3

Stilted, copied comment is passé:

This 'indeterminate Brahmsian Moll-dur character is

1Program Notes for Faculty Recital, October 22, 1946, OSU.
2Crawshaw, Program Notes for The Columbus Civic Concert Orchestra, November 17, 1946.
3Heller, Program Notes, Cincinnati Symphony Orchestra, January 26-27, 1946, p. 448.
audible in the first movement with its almost excessive wealth of themes which are so carefully amalgamated into a united whole.

Even though symphony notes contain excellent, authentic data, they should not be copied verbatim. Historical data is essential but must be presented in an interesting manner to help illustrate an idea.

The writer of program notes sets the stage for the concert by giving information to the industrious listener who reads his comments before the program. As in our illustrations, dainty tidbits about composers or past performances may arouse interest. The general character of the number is sometimes given, the story the composer had in mind, interesting instrumentation, excerpts of themes, - all are included. This very information may be given over the air preceding concerts; too little advance information about good music in the coming concerts is made available to the general public. So the scene shifts, although the setting remains the same, as we proceed to the next chapter, MUSIC FORECAST, the radio program for which the writer has been responsible during this past year over WOSU.
CHAPTER V

MUSIC FORECAST

The production and personnel managers of WOSU, the radio station operated by the Ohio State University, requested Dr. M. Emett Wilson of the music faculty to coach the production of the Music Forecast Program. So in January, 1946, the writer was assigned to assist with the preparation and rendition of the fifteen-minute weekly radio broadcast as the project of this thesis.

Musical organizations sponsoring concerts seek radio publicity. The assigned members of the publicity committees contact the radio stations by telephone and mail, requesting the announcers and commentators to mention their particular concert. For example, the sponsors of the Rose Bampton concert, the Metropolitan opera star, sent a letter stating that Miss Bampton was prepared to appear on a Woman's Program in an interview about "How to Mix Two Careers in One Home." The following organizations have mailed publicity material to be used for the plugging of their programs:

Columbus Philharmonic Society
Women's Chamber Music Society
American Guild of Organists
Symphony Club
Hast-Amand Civic Concert Series
Summer's Music Course
Faculty Recitals - Music Departments of OSU and Capital U.
Cleveland Metropolitan Opera Co.
Cincinnati Summer Opera Co.
Gymanfa Ganu (American-Welsh) Song Festival Association
American Federation of Bands
Ohio State Fair Music Committee
Columbus Civic Concert Orchestra
Columbus Gallery of Fine Arts Programs Committee
University and College Concerts Publicity Departments

These organizations are anxious for radio plugging and
will go to any length to help find material for the Fore-
casts. Two of the local music stores had girls searching
diligently for records and music of selections on the coming
concerts. This material was liberally given the writer to
use on her program. Press tickets for the concerts with
admission are sent to the station upon request.

Since WOSU is promoted and operated by an educational
institution, the policy of not permitting any commercial pub-
licity is strictly followed. So our program strives to ac-
quaint the general public with good music, stimulating its
desire to hear serious and unfamiliar music at near-by con-
certs, thus developing aesthetic ideas which make for happier,
fuller, richer living.

In order to secure material for a broadcast, a thorough
search for information about all coming concerts is made in
the daily newspapers. A comparison of this material with
that received through the mail, the campus and community e-
vents listed in the monthly Ohio State University Calendar,
and the postings on bulletin boards throughout the campus
helps to spot the highlights. To make this and other ma-
terial easily available, a filing system has proved valuable.
The process is then simplified by merely pulling out the material which deals with concerts occurring during the week following the broadcast, which always comes on Monday evenings. If it is possible to contact the performer himself, or to attend rehearsals of the group giving the concert, or to hear a resume of a coming concert at an organization's meeting, as the Women's Music Club or the Columbus Philharmonic Society, less research in libraries is necessary.

The nature of the program is usually sensed as the material coagulates. At times numbers are duplicated in concerts. The Columbus Federation of Bands' Concert played airs from La Bohème the same week the opera was being sung at Cincinnati. So a recording from La Bohème was a nice link between the discussions of the two events. Transitions like this one need to be worked out for smooth effects.

An interview with a performer or someone directly connected with the organization lends a personal touch to the usual commentary. Mr. Robert Buchsbaum, first oboist with the Columbus Philharmonic Orchestra and operator of the Philharmonic Recording Studio, brought his own recording of Carpenter's "Krazy Kat" for the September 9, 1946 Music Forecast Program. He explained his process of fine quality reproduction of sound, for he gave a program illustrating his recording equipment the following Thursday at the Columbus Gallery of Fine Arts. Coincidentally, he had a co-worker record our broadcast, so we enjoyed hearing ourselves played back at his
The Columbus Civic Orchestra has been recently developed. Mr. William Halley, the publicity manager, offered to tell the history and purpose of this new orchestra and also told us the numbers they were preparing for their opening concert. Murray Lockhard, an ex-GI student, told us of his experiences as a returned veteran on the OSU campus and his relationship with the University Glee Club on another broadcast. He sang an excerpt of one of his solos that he was to sing in the coming Glee Club concert.

In studying the appeal of a program, an analysis of the program content is of primary importance. Each program must be a complete show within itself. Well-organized, well-balanced, and well-timed programs are three goals worth striving for. For instance, in the following program the music predominates; but the interest of the listener is held by selecting various instrumentations in the recordings and inserting piano excerpts. This program was given November 18, 1946:

Piano excerpts of the first theme and orchestral tutti of Schumann's "Concerto in A Minor" (minutes) followed with the recording up to the second theme. (cello solo)

Second Movement of Chausson's "Symphony in Bb" (orchestral number)
Vocal recording of Hugo Wolf's "In Dem Schatten Meiner Locken". 1:50

Duet of "Bess, You is My Woman", from Porgy and Bess. (vocal duet) 1:30

Here was music that would appeal to all types of people.
The selections began with a 'cello solo, then a symphony rendition, a soprano vocal solo, and closing with the semi-classical, very popular vocal duet (soprano and baritone). The nine minutes of varied music did not over-balance the set-up.

However, the program given on September 23, 1946, had only 3:35 minutes of recorded music, with about 50 seconds of piano playing. The broadcast was devoted to music heard at the football games, for the opening Ohio State football game was the next Saturday afternoon. Much of the history and development of the Ohio State All Brass Band was given. Since the recordings and piano numbers were brief, the commentary outweighed the music, but the effect was pleasing.

A careful differential analysis of the various groups who listen is a way to find out what a program means to people. WOSU has a large rural audience because of the University's agricultural set-up. Deems Taylor, in his "International Exchange Program" stressed that his fan mail has proved that musical culture has no hinterland, there are no more people who "live in the sticks" for automobiles and radios have aided the astonishing growth of musical taste of all America. There is some indication that the number of active church members is especially high in rural districts,

*Sticks - As used by theatrical and baseball people, "the sticks" are the small towns, the rural districts. Holt - Phrase Origins, p. 299.
districts (Batavia, Wilmington, and Maple Heights, Ohio were heard from) to the Music Forecast program given April 15, 1946.

Since this program preceded Easter, a discussion of the services for Holy Week for all faiths was planned:

...Christians and Jews of the world are poised for observance of their annual holy weeks. For members of the Christian communion, the few days between Palm Sunday and Easter, this very week, is Holy Week. For those of Jewish faith, the Passover or Festival of Freedom will be observed this year, beginning Monday evening with Seder services....

In the bulletin of St. Joseph's Cathedral, we read of the Tenebrae services for Wednesday, Thursday, and Friday nights...On Easter Sunday, when the white vestments are worn, the old staunch tune "Faith of Our Fathers" (piano played the first phrase) is heard all through the Mass, and "Rock of Ages" (piano excerpt) is played while leaving the service....

The program continued with a discussion of the music prepared for Holy Week Services in other churches, and closed with a recording of the Lutheran Chorus's "O Sacred Head, Now Wounded."

Audience surveys of WOSU show that the local, urban listener is reached during the dinner hour - the reason for the 6:30 time for our Forecast. Our program may influence the evening's or week's activities as they are planned while the whole family is around the table. This careful differential analysis of the various groups who listen helps picture for the commentator the actual setting on the other end of the wave-length. The manner of approach to the microphone becomes more informal and intimate if this is kept in mind throughout the broadcast.
Mr. Lazarsfeld's book "Radio and the Printed Page", which is a gratification study of the reactions of twenty people on informational programs, showed that fifteen people said that informational programs added to their enjoyment, 1 while all twenty considered the program educational. Nicholas Murray Butler's distinction between the two educational ideals, "knowing something about everything" and "knowing everything educational about something", must be remembered in the planning of these programs.

The main body of listeners are grammar and high-school graduates who prefer diversified information due to the teachings of the American educational system. These listeners have never known the educational ideal of specialization and have no longing for it. So some part of the program must be planned for the unspecialized listener who may have the ability to increase his musical culture if he once becomes interested. That is the reason for the sprinkling of excerpts of Kern's or football songs.

Upholding or enhancing one's social status is another reason why people like a program. They obviously want to know more because this extended range of knowledge provides greater possibilities for carrying on conversations in which they may display this newly acquired knowledge. The broadcaster can do much to appeal to this type of listener by incidentally emphasizing data that has conversational value.

Lazarsfeld, Radio and the Printed Page, p.74.
During the summer broadcasts the operas given in Cincinnati were reviewed. A neighbor startled her bridge club friends with her knowledge about these operas. She finally admitted she had received her information from Music Forecast. All of the members of the club are now tuning in on Monday evenings.

Last June, three children in one family were practicing to play in their first piano recital. On the Music Forecast planned about student recitals, these three tots carried on a little conversation with the writer and played their piano trio. This broadcast aroused interest among the younger listeners who called the writer for appointments for their radio debuts.

Some folk may like the program because it is a substitute for reading, for it takes less effort to listen than to read. On the other hand, the program may make reading worthwhile, for some may wish to quench their thirst for more knowledge. However, appealing to the audience is the predominant aim of any radio program. The environment, interests, requests for further educational information which may fulfill the wish for a higher social status - all are to be considered in the preparation of a show.

After the audience appeal has been fully ascertained, a detailed study of the techniques used in an effective performance of Music Forecast should follow. A careful check-up of the records used in a broadcast in very important. Re-
cordings available to all the students at the University in the music library, and those used for bridges on all programs at WOSU may be too scratchy for an effective transcription. A loud, annoying scratch accompanying faded music is far from enjoyable.

In handling the records, it is best to keep them in the folder. The composer, title of the composition and the number of the record, if it is in a folio, are written on the instruction sheet to the engineer. For instance, the excerpt which was played from Schumann's "Concerto in A Minor" was on the fifth record in the folio. If just part of the record is to be played, designate what part. The duet of "Bess, You is My Woman" is about an inch from the end of the record. If this information is given, the engineer is able to play just the part that is wanted.

Searching for scores has been more difficult, especially vocal scores. The music and the main libraries on the campus have a limited selection; however, in desperation, a purchase of the number from a music store has solved the problem.

Piano excerpts played from the score or taken from a recording create interest. Attention is renewed when the ear catches the excerpt in the recording, an example of learning through repetition. If excerpts are used with the correct interpretations and played well, the analysis of the composition can be explained. The form of a composition can be quickly detected by the listeners, if the excerpts are recog-
nized in the recordings, as in Percy Grainger's "London-derry Air." Calling attention to the odd progressions in a piece, such as Roy Harris's "Little Suite," and analyzing chord formations help the listener to appreciate this new music.

Asking questions before and after the number is played promotes the conversational manner of broadcasting. For instance, after playing excerpts from three movements of a Mozart number, the question "Did you notice the change of rhythm in each movement?" was asked. If excerpts are played before a recording, both the excerpt and recording should be in the same key for smooth listening. The average listener will not be able to follow if keys are changed; and immediately his confidence in the performer's authority wanes.

A live rendition of a number is a treat to the audience. But when explaining while playing, an inclination towards the microphone is necessary if the voice is to be heard over the piano.

The bond between the listener and the radio voice is strengthened when personal experiences and opinions are given informally. Incidents which happen to the commentator seem to be of interest to the listener, perhaps they help him to picture the person at the mike. Many comments were received on the opera forecasts for the Cincinnati Opera last summer. One morning, in the beauty parlor, a woman under the dryer told the operator that she was going to Cincinnati to the
opera. She had not been to one in ten years, but the lady over the radio got her so enthused she was leaving that very afternoon. Then she proceeded to relate what had been given on Music Forecast the previous evening. Excerpts taken from notes of that broadcast July 15, 1946, are:

...I heard Samson and Dalila's rehearsal with Rise Stevens and Raul Jobin last Wednesday afternoon. Thursday, the "Love of Three Kings" will be repeated. It is a drama which takes place in a remote castle in Italy in the Tenth Century. Archibaldo, the barbarian blind king, who has conquered that part of Italy, has forced a local princess to marry his son Manfredo......

I chuckled over an editorial in a Cincinnati paper headed "Acrobats and Opera", which said that the blind king literally mopped up the stage with a horribly gurgling princess. That grisly episode followed a love duet where practically nothing was left to the imagination, and was succeeded by a climax, in which the old king slung the corpse of the princess over his shoulder and carried it, with arms dangling wildly and hair dragging the floor, off the stage. The gasps of horror from the audience were genuine. I was afraid he really hurt her, but she reappeared for curtain calls.

Talking in an informal manner to form a closer relationship between the audience and the broadcaster is inherent. An extemporaneous manner is excellent, just using notes which consist of a brief outline of the broadcast. The woman's voice is cautioned to be kept at a lower pitch than the average female speaking voice; the lower voice carries better on the air. A note of enthusiasm in the voice tends to keep the program moving, although the voice must be distinct and clear without a hurried feeling.

There are certain procedures which become automatic with a little experience. Since the program is not a timed, writ-
ten reading from a script, there must be a final check with
the announcer before the program for the amount of time he
needs to put the show on and to take it off. A slight pause
between the announcer's opening and the beginning of the
program is effective. To accomplish this the broadcaster
should hear the announcement as it is made. The program
moves fast, and there is no time to manipulate papers once
the broadcast has begun. Therefore, the material should
be placed on the piano in the sequence it is to be used
as the program progresses. Pages in scores should be well-
marked and the cards with notations should be in order.
During the playing of incidental recordings, a second check
may be made, but it is well to follow the score or to lis-
ten for places for cutting the record. A definite signal
to the engineer should be given when the recordings are to
begin and to be cut, if desired.

When there were no concerts scheduled for the week, in-
teresting topics were discussed. Last June 17th, predictions
were made as to the trends of music for the coming season.
The topic was left open for further comment, and when the
same situation arose again, another program was built con-
tinuing the thought.

Seasonal subjects fit well in this type of program, such
as the broadcast Easter week, and the summer band concert
program June 16th. The writer received favorable comment on
the following discussion about the development of the concert
military band:
The concert military band has reached its greatest development in the U.S. where it appears to have evolved from the Independence Day concerts held annually on the Boston Common...The fifth number on the program of one of these Boston Jubilees was the "Anvil Chorus" from "Il Trovatore," which was sung by the full chorus, with organ, orchestra, military band, drum corps, 100 anvils, all the bells of the city in the chime, and cannon accompaniment. (The anvil part was performed by 100 members of the Boston Fire Department)...And these 100 firemen, each in his belt, helmet, and red flannel shirt, carrying a long-handled blacksmith's hammer at right shoulder shift, like a musket, marched into the hall and on to the stage in two files of 50.... The cannon accompaniment came from two batteries of well-served guns stationed at a short distance from the building and a gun was fired off by electricity on the first beat of each measure.... If ever Welkin rang, it did then!

In collecting material for this thesis, requests were sent to fifteen people who were in some way connected with radio music broadcasts, for information about programs similar to Music Forecast. Mr. Kenneth Baker, director of research of the National Association of Broadcasters, replied that no survey has been made of such programs in the United States, but Mr. La Prade, director of music research for the National Broadcasting Company, responded with:

...we have no programs similar to your "Music Forecast" on NBC at the present time. It seems unlikely that we should ever have broadcast such a program on the network, since it would be of interest only to a single community....

In fact, my first experience with radio consisted of giving a preview of the New York Symphony Orchestra concerts over Station WRNY about 1926, and I believe similar previews of the New York Philharmonic Symphony concerts have been broadcast more recently, either over WABC or the Nu-

Harvey Whistler, Theodore Thomas, Ph.D. Dissertation, ASU.
Musical America, the music journal, said they were sorry that they could not be of any great assistance. Miss Montmarquet, of the New York Public Service Department, sent five samples of scripts of the NBC University of the Air, Concert of Nations' Programs. The dramatic works are expertly written for an entirely different type of program. The musical contents are complete in the program, but they do not refer to any coming concert.

Mrs. Broderick, radio education specialist at the U.S. office of education in Washington D.C., sent a script of an "Answer me Please" Song Series, similar to Mrs. Enneking's "Information, Please," which the women of the symphony group put on in Cincinnati. These two shows pattern round-table discussions, although the Cincinnati shows discuss music of coming symphony programs.

Miss Harding of the service division of the Columbia Broadcasting System in New York, sent some publicity material on the New York Philharmonic Symphony, and the American School of the Air, which has been previously discussed, sent some of their programs.

At the 1943 Institute for Education by Radio, Mr. Burton Paulu, of the University of Minnesota, told of his radio course in Music Appreciation over WLB. That year the course consisted of musical material to prepare listeners for con-

LaPrade, Letter written August 6, 1946 in answer to request from writer.
certs in that station area as well as material of general interest. Several artists who performed in Minnesota and St. Paul were interviewed, and a series of programs on the instruments of the orchestra was included. In addition to giving biographical notes, circumstances of compositions, and music analysis, Mr. Paulu used sparingly the device of talking while the records were being played, pointing out entrances of instruments, checking themes, etc. The listener usually has difficulty in following such a procedure, comments before and after the recording have received a more satisfactory response.

Mr. Borowski, writer of the Chicago Symphony Notes, mentioned giving radio programs before their symphony concerts in the same style as his program notes.

The following article is a write-up for the WOSU bulletin for MUSIC FORECAST, and may serve as a summary for Chapter V.

Time was when people sought for musical entertainment and looked futilely for some new musical event. Now times have changed, radio brings this to us. Although the newspapers contain detailed accounts of new events, it is still difficult to choose which concerts to attend. MUSIC FORECAST helps us to decide when and where to go.

The policy of this fifteen-minute weekly broadcast is to disclose informally the musical productions which comprise these coming programs. Piano excerpts, recordings, and interviews assist the discussions. A familiar number and one not so well-known is included on each program, thus enlarging the musical repertoire of the average listener. Bits of appealing information about the composition or performer being discussed are related, but the emphasis is always placed on the music. The listener's understanding of music
should be broadened by this program but the primary purpose is to enjoy more music more.

Dr. Ewing, personnel manager of WOSU, planned an Evening School of the Air during the Spring Quarter, 1946. The programs were scheduled from 6:30 to 7:30 P.M. Monday through Friday evenings. MUSIC FORECAST was the first broadcast of the week as part of the music course. When the chart showed that the highest number of listeners were on Monday evening, MUSIC FORECAST was happy to be a part of the musical agenda.
CHAPTER VI

QUALIFICATIONS OF THE MUSIC CRITIC

The completely qualified critic does not, cannot exist. He would be the sum total of human knowledge and human experience. If he knew all there is to know about music, that would be but a beginning. If he knew everything about literature, about painting, about sculpture, about the dance, and about the theatre, he would be a superman; but there would be much more for him to learn.

In many places music criticism is assigned to a reporter who has bare knowledge of music and who is really at home in an altogether different field. On the other hand, the reviews of famous critics, past and present, frequently bear the stamp of presumption and arbitrariness rather than of integrity and knowledge.

Perhaps Calvocoressi has come closest to the establishment of a general method by outlining three main considerations which enter into the mental activity of the critic (1) predispositions (2) direct data, and (3) indirect data. The first of these is the critic himself, his personality, temperament, experience, biases, etc. The second is the composition or broadcast as written and performed. The third category includes numerous accessory facts, such as knowledge previously acquired about the composer from other compositions or through outside information; about his posi-
tion within the general development of music or within a particular school; about the relationship of the composition to others of the same composer, etc. To separate these considerations and to avoid the prevalence of the personal pre-disposition "over the factual data" is the foremost task of the critic.

Summarizing, here are twelve qualification of the music critic:

1- It is essential for the music critic to acquire an extensive knowledge of the technique of music and of musical literature.

2- The music critic must be able to read scores and be able to play an orchestral or vocal score on the piano. The faculty of being able to examine a score and to draw some conclusions as to its nature and its craftsmanship when there is nothing to give it sound, is very helpful in analyzing compositions.

3- The critic must be well read, he should absorb all the book knowledge possible in all the arts.

4- He should be able to adapt this acquired knowledge to the subject he is discussing.

5- The critic needs to evade emotional instability, runaway enthusiasms, for these may be momentary expressions. He should not be swayed or aroused easily by antagonisms.

6- He must try to develop a mind of exceptional fluidity, which through experience may be able to recognize and
separate the essentials from the non-essentials.

7- The critic reviews concerts in all kinds of weather, he needs to be strong and healthy, filled with physical vitality and blessed with steady nerves.

8- The experienced critic must develop a power to reason about music, and he finally acquires a taste, with the musical knowledge and the technique of writing and talking he possesses.

9- The critic needs a fluent vocabulary, a multiple choice of words, for the more the reviewer knows, the more there is he knows he can never know.

10- He should hear much music, and not comment on a program if he has not actually attended it, for he cannot judge without hearing.

11- While the critic is developing a taste which prospers with experience, he must always be fair, openminded, and courteous.

12- Philip Hale's and DeemsTaylor's "gift of gab" should be a goal to strive for, a dire necessity to the critic is the cultivation of a love of words.

Even more important, perhaps, than theories and methods of music criticism, is the establishment of a living tradition inaugurated by men of outstanding qualities and perpetuated by others who try to emulate them. The outstanding trait of the specific critical talent is the ability to sense the new, the valuable, and the important.
CHAPTER VII

THE FUTURE OF MUSIC CRITICISM

The close connection between the development of musical criticism and the general development of ideas is prevalent down through the ages. The critic of the Age of Reason differed from the Romantic critic, who in turn had ideas unlike those of the modern technical and industrial age critic. There can be no doubt that the coming epoch will shape its own type of critic, who will be different from the contemporary variety.

Serious music programs can surely be made much more adequate socially than they are now. It will always be the task of social planning, to induce people to listen to serious broadcasts. Technological improvements change our cultural life not by their mere existence but because they are used for cultural purposes. Making such use of radio means not only putting on desirable musical programs, but also making sure that they are listened to - the responsibility of the radio music critic or commentator.

The modern critic is subjective, he writes down his impressions, letting his intelligence shine for the moment on the musical performance. Musical criticism may lose some of the glamour and virtuosity that are inherent in subjective criticism now that the world is enjoying peace, and the sub-
jective critic may become as out-of-date as the dogmatic critic was in the Nineteenth Century. But the loss will be compensated for the growth of a feeling of responsibility for general culture.

Perhaps more simplicity and unadorned objectivity in criticism may lead the critics to assume the attitude of teachers who are responsible for the enlightenment of society. The rift which began to separate artist and public in the Nineteenth Century may once again disappear, and the critic may take his destined place as the interpreter of musical creation to society.

The development hoped for will not end all errors and weaknesses inherent in criticism produced by human beings. Fontanelle reminds us that wherever there are human beings, there are follies, and forever the same follies. The morality of criticism will be higher, and the relation among the creative, critical, and receptive parts of musical society will be more just, and in better balance.

Radio presents an interesting paradox - it is listened to by the largest audiences that ever assembled, and at the same time, is the most intimate form of entertainment in the world. With its help, the music critic may perform the difficult task of helping to make life and art the common property of all.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books


*World Almanac and Book of Facts for 1946*.

**PERIODICALS**


**NEWSPAPERS**


**UNPUBLISHED MATERIAL**

**Pamphlets**


Wiebe and O'Stein, Alton. *A Study of the Damrosch Music Appreciation Hour*, Bulletin No. 39, Copyright 1942 by Evaluation of School Broadcasts, Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio.

**Program Notes**


Program Notes for OSU Faculty Recital, October 22, 1946. "Gambling Songs."

Radio Scripts


Meredith, Bill, Radio Script for Cincinnati *Summer Opera*, WLW July, 1946, Cincinnati, Ohio.


*Time for Music* script - Ohio School of the Air, March 20, 1946, WOSU, Columbus, Ohio.


LaPrade, Ernest. Letter written to writer in answer to request for information regarding thesis, August 6, 1946.