A CROSS CULTURAL ANALYSIS OF
JAPANESE ART CRITICAL WRITINGS AND
AMERICAN ART CRITICAL WRITINGS

A Thesis

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for
the Degree Master of Arts in the
Graduate School of The Ohio State University

By

Hisayo Yoshida, B.A.

*****

The Ohio State University
1998

Master’s Examination Committee:

Dr. Robert L. Arnold, Adviser
Dr. Christine Ballengee Morris

Approved by

[Signature]

Adviser
Department of Art Education
ABSTRACT

This study examines Japanese contemporary art criticism in its cultural context and clarifies certain differences in its methods and styles from those of American art criticism. Japanese art criticism has its own methods and styles, which have developed in Japanese culture. However, for non-Japanese art critics and educators, its uniqueness causes some cultural miscommunications; for example, one American art critic criticized Japanese art criticism as not criticism but art commentary. This comment indicates that there are different perspectives and expectations of art criticism between Japanese and Americans. Considering that American art critic's comments, this study recognized the importance of the cultural analysis of Japanese art criticism.

The research part of this study is divided into two; one is a literature review and the other is content analysis. The literature review focuses on several cultural components such as Japanese language, journalism, social systems, and education, particularly those of which may affect the nature of Japanese contemporary art criticism. The content analysis examines six sample writings, three American’s and three Japanese, which are reviews of the well-known photo journalist Sebastiao Salgado’s project “WORKERS.”
Even though the literature review reveals the uniqueness of Japanese culture, such as the vagueness of descriptive expressions in the Japanese language, which are different from those in the English language, the research data of the content analysis did not show any significant difference between Japanese and American art critics' writings. There are differences and similarities among the six sample writings, but any characteristic tendency of either American or Japanese art critical writings was not found. Moreover, the data indicated that the art critic's preferences and sometimes the media's expectations have more effect on the direction of the writings.

This study should interest those wanting to add to their knowledge of Japanese culture, the issues of art criticism across cultures, and methods under experiment such as contextual analysis of cross-cultural metacriticism. Suggestions for related cross-cultural research are included.
To My Parents,
who made me love learning and
whose total support throughout my return to academia made it all possible.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to express my great appreciation to my adviser Dr. Robert L. Arnold, for his patience and guidance, and to Dr. Christine Ballengee Morris, the second thesis committee member, who offered insights and suggestions for my thesis. I am grateful to Dr. Sydney Walker, whose instruction about the content analysis method was invaluable. These three scholars are in the Department of Art Education at The Ohio State University. I also would like to give special thanks to Dr. Ann Mae Barbosa in particular, who is a professor at the University of Sao Paulo, and was a visiting scholar of the Department of Art Education during the 1996-97 academic year, for giving me very insightful suggestions and highly useful information about Sebastiao Salgado. Special appreciation also goes to Dr. Louis Lankford and Dr. Patricia Stuhr, who encouraged me to complete my thesis. I would also like to thank Dr. Diane Belcher of the Department of English, the director of English as a Second Language Program at The Ohio State University for keeping me on the right track regarding the comparative study of Japanese and English languages. For the translation of the Japanese texts into English, I would like to thank Stephanie Lewis, who really worked hard for this project.

Finally I would like to thank Gregory R. Knepper, my English proofreader, whose patience and encouragement also made this thesis completion possible.
# VITA

April 22, 1961............................... Born - Tokyo, Japan

1980 - 1984................................. Assistant Film and Video Editor, Japan Broadcasting Corporation (NHK)

1982 - 1983................................. Exchange student, School of Journalism, Columbia University, New York, New York

1984........................................ B.A. Journalism, Bunkyo University, Saitama, Japan

1984 - 1990 ................................. Magazine Editor of "Commercial Photo" at Genko-sha Publishing Co., Ltd., Tokyo, Japan

1990 - 1993 ................................. Editorial Director and Producer of "Shiratori Shintaro," (a photography book) Kyoto-shoin, Kyoto, Japan

1994 - 1996................................. Graduate Research Assistant, the Department of Art Education, The Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio

1996........................................ Presenter, National Art Education Association

1996 - 1997................................. Graduate Research Assistant for the Web project at the Department of Chemistry, The Ohio State University

February, 1998 - .......................... Customer Education Director, Hewlett-Packard Co., Asian Division, Tokyo, Japan

## FIELDS OF STUDY

Major Field: Art Education

- Studies in Journalism, Photography, Commercial Art, Comparative Studies, Computer Graphics, Industrial and Systems Engineering, Computer Science
AUTHOR'S NOTE

When I saw Sebastiao Salgado’s documentary photography in "Other Americas" for the first time, maybe in 1983, I was an exchange student of The School of Journalism, at the Columbia University in New York. At that time, I dreamed of becoming a photojournalist like Robert Capa and W. Eugene Smith, and so studied photojournalism both in America and Japan. Probably one of the instructors introduced Salgado as the W. Eugene Smith Award Recipient in 1983 in the classroom. My first impression of Salgado’s photography was something like “high contrast, strong black and white beautiful photography, humanistic, sad, similar approaches to the subject matter as those Eugene Smith used, etc.” Actually I was very moved by the people’s sad eyes which Salgado captured in Latin American peasants for his project “Other Americas,” and also I felt some jealousy of his talents being both a brave photojournalist and artist.

There are many different types of documentary photographers in the world. And unfortunately all of them do not have ability to capture both strong social issues and aesthetic value in their works. Of course, many photojournalists argue, “why does documentary photography needs aesthetic value?.” Basically I agree with this. The most important thing is telling the truth of the world to audience through photography, but still I am impressed by a
beautiful documentary photography. Sometimes I was just moved by the beauty regardless of the social messages contained in the photography.

There are some relevant stories: I gave up becoming a photojournalist and started working at a broadcasting company as a video and film editor in Japan, and later on became a photography magazine editor. The photo magazine dealt with mainly commercial photography, but sometimes feature art photography, too. In 1990, I had a second chance to review Salgado’s photography. There was a kind of retrospective exhibition of Salgado’s in Tokyo. The chief editor of the magazine asked me to find a good art critic who could write a good review of the exhibition. I assumed my boss considered my writing was not good enough to review such a world famous photographer’s retrospective works. So, I missed the chance to write about one of my favorite photographers’ works.

Several years later, when I had to find some art critical writings for my thesis research, the first idea that came to my mind was writings about Sebastiao Salgado’s photography. There were many other possibilities to satisfy the selection criteria for this study, such as review articles of Robert Mapplethope, Cindy Sherman, Richard Avedon, and Irving Penn. Those artists’ works have been reviewed both in America and Japan, published in many art magazines; I have found that art educators may prefer those artists to Salgado. Sebastiao Salgado is more popular as documentary photographer than as artist in the real world.
My study does not aim to convince people Salgado is a great artist; however, my motivation to choose Salgado’s works (actually reviews of his works) for my thesis research is coming from the aesthetic value of his beautiful photography as well as his strong social message.

I could not become a photojournalist like Salgado; I can not shoot impressive photography like Salgado’s; I missed the chance to write about his works in a photo magazine...... These things also may very well have influenced my decision to select Salgado’s works for this study.

Dr. Ann Mae Barbosa, a visiting scholar from Brazil, encouraged my decision in the middle of the writing stage of this thesis. A piece of news which I heard from her made me very happy: Sebastiao Salgado will be invited for one of next year’s (1998) biggest art events in Brazil as an artist and photographer.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract ................................................................................................................... ii
Dedication .............................................................................................................. iv
Acknowledgments ................................................................................................. v
Vita ........................................................................................................................... vi
Author's Note ......................................................................................................... vii

Chapters:
I. Introduction
   1. Background of the research problem ............................................................... 1
   2. Purpose of the study ........................................................................................ 7
   3. Design of the study -- Methodology of the research ............................................ 7
   4. Significance of the study ................................................................................... 14

II. Literature survey of Japanese contemporary art criticism and related issues
   1. Introduction ..................................................................................................... 15
   2. Japanese art critical writings and their social environment .................................. 17
   3. Art criticism and Japanese contemporary culture .............................................. 23
   4. The social environment of Japanese art critics ................................................. 31
### III. Content analysis and comparison of Japanese and American art critical writings

1. Selection of art critical writings ................................................................. 39
2. Data analysis -- Six sample writings ......................................................... 44
3. Synthesis and comparison of writings ....................................................... 101

### IV. Summary, Conclusion, and Reflections

1. Goals of the study .................................................................................... 117
2. Summary and Conclusion of the study .................................................... 118
3. Recommendations .................................................................................... 123
4. Questions and further study .................................................................... 124

### References ............................................................................................... 126

### Appendix

Translators of Japanese articles for Chapter III ........................................ 130
CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

1. Background of the research problem

1-1. Personal Perspectives

This study examines Japanese contemporary art criticism in its cultural context, and proposes that Japanese art commentary, which many American art critics understand as only commentary, is actually art criticism, simply having a different style from American art criticism. This primary research question comes from my seven year work experience as a photography magazine editor in Japan, and also as an art education graduate student who has been studying art criticism in an American university. While studying art criticism and related subjects in the U.S., I always have to find a balance between my understandings of art criticism and the art criticism which is discussed in American academia. I have been very hesitant to write about art in America, because I have gradually recognized that there is an important difference between American art criticism and Japanese art criticism. And I still struggle to define what makes their methods and/or characteristics different.

First, I will describe my work experience as a magazine editor and writer in Japan. While working for one of the well-known monthly photography
magazines (the name is “Commercial Photo” by Genko-Sha Publishing, Inc.) in Japan, I wrote approximately 300 articles about commercial photography, commercial films, and contemporary art works. Even though I did not have strong art history, aesthetics, or literature backgrounds in my undergraduate studies, (I studied journalism, instead) I was hired by that magazine and continued writing for about seven years before I resigned from that job to pursue my master’s degree. I was never called a professional art critic, but I was recognized as a professional art journalist. Many considered my articles to be a kind of art critical writing. I knew a few famous professional Japanese art critics and several times asked them to review art works. Their writing styles were varied; however, and I could not find any significant differences between their writings and my own. The only real difference was that such famous critics could be closer to artists because of their social status.

Secondly, I would like to disclose something about my experience of studying art criticism as a graduate student in an American university.

When I was in the second quarter in my graduate program, I confronted a problem in that my understanding of art criticism and critical writing was very different from American art criticism. My writing about contemporary photography for an art criticism class assignment was entirely rejected in the classroom. I implemented almost the same method which I previously used for the Japanese photo magazine. The reactions to my writing from the instructor and classmates were like “the writing is not art criticism, just an introduction of the artist and the use of medium and techniques.” Throughout that class, I
learned from the instructor that art critical writings should be for the reader, not for the artist. I also learned that writers do not need to be concerned about artists' intentions or their use of techniques or medium.

Contrary to the instructor's method of art critical writing, the method which I learned through my work experience was that writers should confirm artists' intentions, their use of medium and techniques, and their biographies as much as possible. Both Japanese artists and art journalists, including most Japanese art critics, understand that interpreting art works from their own point of view or guessing artists' intentions without confirmation from their creators may spread inaccurate information about the art work and the artists themselves among general audiences. Several times I was forced to show the draft writings to artists and exhibition producers and curators. Throughout such experiences, I myself was confirmed as a news journalist in the art world. And not only I, but also my Japanese colleagues, art professionals, and readers understand that magazine articles are categorized as one type of art critical writing.

I have also found that there is another critical view of Japanese art criticism, which has been published in one of the famous American art magazines, *Art in America*. Several scholars have quoted that article in their doctoral dissertations to criticize the Japanese art world. For this Japanese art journalist, their comments on Japanese art criticism are hardly acceptable.

In the next section, that American art critic's view of Japanese art criticism will be introduced and then the miscommunication between Americans and Japanese will be defined.
1-2. One American art critic’s views of Japanese art criticism

When I was confronted with the problem of differences between American and Japanese art criticism, my friend, who studied Japanese contemporary art, showed me one American art critic’s comments on a Japanese art critics’ writings. The critic Janet Koplos (1989) states “For Western curators and critics, the single most frustrating aspect of the Japanese art world may be the noticeable lack of information available about just what is going on within it. And not only in English.....even in Japanese...” (p. 103). Koplos used to work at an English newspaper company in Japan and reviewed many Japanese art exhibitions. Her review articles were published in the English paper. According to her self-introduction from one of her articles, she understands both English and Japanese and knows the contemporary Japanese art world well. She lived in Japan for a decade before coming back to the U.S., so she might understand, or at least know the uniqueness of Japanese culture, including its uniqueness of language. So, why is she so frustrated with Japanese art critics’ writings?

At that time I assumed that both my trouble with American art criticism methods from an American instructor and Koplos’s frustration with Japanese art criticism methods are due to unfamiliarity with cultural differences between Japan and America. This assumption leads me to the further comparative study of two different types of art criticism in two different cultures.
Art communication is neither a one-way street to Japan from America nor to America from Japan. Both countries’ art journalism covers the current news of both the American and Japanese art worlds. The American academic study of Japanese contemporary art has also been increasing. The core part of these studies uses art critical writings, published in newspapers and art magazines in both Japan and America. Considering this situation, I am afraid that the lack of American understanding of Japanese art criticism in terms of its style and method as well as its social and educational influence on Japanese culture may limit their perceptions of the whole picture.

In this study, I would like to portray contemporary Japanese art criticism in its cultural context and its influence on the Japanese art world as well as on Japanese art education. Also, by clarifying the differences between Japanese and American art criticism, I would like to tell people who may have a certain bias about Japanese art critics' writings and Japanese art news that there is a Japanese art criticism.

Before proceeding to a deeper study, I have another concern about the comparative study of American art criticism and Japanese art criticism: to what extent can Western philosophy, theory, and previous studies of Japanese culture, which have been done by non-Japanese scholars, be applied to studying the nature of Japanese art criticism. In the next section, this issue will be briefly discussed.
1-3. Western theory vs Japanese theory: the problem of comparative study

Recently, some Japanese art historians and anthropologists claim that Japanese need to re-study their own cultural movements, activities, and artifacts through Japanese points of views (Hamaguchi, 1995; Amano, 1992, et al.). They argue that the use of Western philosophy and theory, through Westerners’ points of views for studying Japanese culture sometimes bring unacceptable outcomes for native Japanese scholars.

Similar discussion can be found in one of the American art educators’ doctoral dissertation. Janet Montgomery (1995), who studied Japanese Contemporary Women Artists in the art education field, writes “It can be argued that using Western concepts of art to apply to Japanese artists is ethnocentric. Similarly, using art education curriculum theory to examine any aspect of Japanese art education might be biased.” (p. 5) This problem is still open to debate. Even though Japanese art professionals are strongly influenced by Western concepts in many aspects from art history and aesthetics to school curriculum and teaching methods (Kondo, 1990; Montgomery, 1995), Japanese have modified those concepts in their own ways, not all but many, and adjusted them to their society (Kodama, 1984; Mita, 1995). Therefore, in this study, both Japanese and Western scholars’ former studies of Japanese art criticism and the related issues will be used to clarify the nature of Japanese art criticism.
2. Purpose of the study

The aim of this study is to examine the nature of Japanese art criticism in its cultural context and clarify the differences of its methods and styles from those of American art criticism. The focus of this study will be on art critical writings, written by art critics and art professionals, published in newspapers and/or magazines. By studying the cultural environment of these published writings, this study could reveal the uniqueness of Japanese art criticism. The goals of examining the content of Japanese art critical writings are

1. to investigate how Japanese art critics see works of art,
2. to determine how Japanese art critics consider what kinds of information are most important and helpful to readers in enjoying and understanding art works.

3. Design of the study -- Methodology of the research

3-1. Overview of research methodology

In this study, first, I collected both Japanese and American art critical writings, which were published in newspapers and magazines for general audiences. Second, a content analysis of those writings was conducted in a style derived from qualitative (philosophic) content analysis. Marchall and Rossaman (1989) write “Making inferences about literal, historical, or social events requires competence in analyzing all forms of communication. Content analysis is a technique that allows examination of data to determine whether or
not the data supports hypothesis” (p. 98). Thomas (1993) says philosophic analysis investigates ideas and purposes in search of hidden meanings and assumptions. German sociologist and cultural critic Kracauer (1953), who opened the door for qualitative research methods in the field of mass communication research, argued that the content of a text should be conceived as “a meaningful whole,” and therefore it is important to involve an act of philosophical consideration and interpretation in textual analysis.

Prior to the selection of the research method for this study, I also referred to other similar studies, such as a metacritical analysis of art critical writings. One of the recent ones is Sun-Young Won Lee’s doctoral dissertation (1988) “A metacritical analysis of contemporary art critics’ practices.” In her study, she used philosophic analysis of three professional critics’ writings, asking questions such as “What do the critics do? ....For example, describing, defining, analyzing, interpreting,...” (p. 35).

In this thesis, there are six steps to the philosophic content analysis:

1) categorize the type of information written, i.e., description, interpretation, and evaluation of art work, related topics to the art work, artist’s biography, or other;
2) categorize in more specific topics, like aesthetic concern, historical concern, and so on;
3) list all main and sub categories and segment all text information (sentences) into a certain category;
4) calculate the volume of information of each category in each writing;
5) interpret the data outcome of each writing. In this stage, I also refer to the type of mass media which publishes the writing and the biographical background of art critics who write the article in order to interpret the data;

6) compare, synthesize and evaluate writings in order to derive specific characteristics of critical writings.

This study investigated explicit characteristics of Japanese art criticism which were different from American art criticism and attempted to find tools to help non-Japanese readers understand the nature of Japanese art critical writings. A content analysis would display the uniqueness of Japanese art critical writings. This study would also reveal specific characteristics of the Japanese way of thinking, which are reflected in those art critical writings.

3-2. Selection of sample writings

There are many types of art critical writings in Japan, including journalistic reporting of the arts, which may not be considered as art critical writing by Koplos. Daily newspapers, weekly, monthly, and non-periodic magazines, community papers, and art exhibition catalogues feature art related articles. The coverage varies, e.g. from fine arts to performing arts. In this study, however, I selected four Japanese art critics' writings which reviewed one photographer's work. Also for the comparison of Japanese and American art criticism, I selected three American art critics' writings. These writings reviewed the same photographer's same work. These sample writings are categorized as photography criticism. Photography criticism is one type of art criticism (Barrett,
1990), and for the data interpretation, I was able to use my work experience as a photography magazine editor.

The criteria used for selecting sample writings are:

1. review a single work or project of one photographer;
2. the writings are published in major newspapers and magazines for general audiences;
3. the selected photographer’s work or project does not have any strong relations to either Japanese or American culture. Hence, both countries’ art critics take the same neutral stance toward photographer’s work in terms of cultural interpretations;
4. selected photographer and his/her work or project have certain respect and recognition in the art world. (it means this study tries to avoid any extraordinary case study);

Based upon these criteria, I selected review writings about Sebastiao Salgado’s project “WORKERS.” In the next section, I briefly describe Salgado’s biography and his reputations in both the art world and the art education field.

3-3. Sebastiao Salgado and his project “WORKERS”

Sebastiao Salgado is a well-known documentary photographer. He has become very famous as a photojournalist since the 1970s, and recently his works have been considered art photography by the art world. Salgado, born in Brazil, 1944, currently lives in Paris. He is the recipient of the 1982 W. Eugene
Smith Award in Humanistic Photography for the work "Other Americas" and was one of the core members of the world famous photo agency "Magnum." (He resigned from the membership in 1995). His project "WORKERS" is a documentary of manual labor workers in mostly developing countries, and this project was published as Salgado's third photography book, titled "WORKERS - An Archaeology of the Industrial Age" (Salgado, 1993) in 1993. Along with the publication, the exhibition "WORKERS" traveled around the world, including France, America, Germany, Great Britain, Japan, Brazil, and other countries. In America, this exhibition was held in several different cities, and mostly at fine art museums. One of them was the Philadelphia Art Museum. In Japan, Bunkamura-The Museum, one of the famous contemporary art museums, located in the center of Tokyo, also exhibited "WORKERS." Previously in Japan, Salgado's other famous project "Other Americas" was exhibited at the National Modern Art Museum in 1992.

Salgado has a very unique background as a photojournalist. He first studied economics both in Brazil and France. While a university student in Brazil, Salgado joined some political groups, which were actually against the Brazilian government at that time and he was exiled from his home country to France. At the University of Paris, he finished his Ph.D. degree in economics. Later he started working at the International Coffee Organization and he visited Africa as an economist. Besides his research on the economic situation of the coffee plantations in Africa, he also documented plantations and the workers with his camera. His career as photojournalist started in 1973 at the age of 29;
his first report on the famine in Niger was published in several news magazines. Since then, he has worked for various news magazines, newspapers, and some humanitarian organizations, reporting on social and political events such as the devastation wrought by the famine in Sahel, the independence of Angola, and the Landless Workers Movement in Brazil.

Since the 1980s, Salgado’s photographs have been featured in various art and photography magazines and attracted art critics’ eyes. And very recently some fine arts museums have started exhibiting his works. Besides exhibition catalogues, Salgado has published three photography books and the forth one will be coming out soon. His latest project is a documentary on Brazilian peasants who are forced to leave their lands; the title is “The Dispossessed.” This project will turn into his fourth photography book, to be published in June, 1997.

Among Salgado’s various documentary projects, “WORKERS” is the biggest one, and he spent five years shooting, traveled to 25 countries, and worked two years on publishing. The theme of “WORKERS” is “the phasing-out of manual labor on a global scale” (Salgado, 1993, p. 397). Salgado documented manual labor workers from Latin America, Europe, and Africa to Asia. This book was published by Aperture as a 400-page, oversized book in 1993.
3-4. Salgado’s photography and cross cultural study - A Brazilian art educators comments on his works

In the middle of the writing stage of this thesis, I had an opportunity to interview a Brazilian art educator, Dr. Ann Mae Barbosa, who was a visiting scholar of the Ohio State University, Department of Art Education, from 1996-97. She knows Sebastiao Salgado’s works very well and she often covered his photography in her cross-cultural art education class at the University of Sao Paulo. She believes that Salgado’s documentary photography is very good material in which to study cross cultural issues. His photography represents both domestic (Brazil) and international social issues, and also his works can be used to study artistic forms, lighting and use of colors in photography. She says even though Salgado was forced to leave Brazil at one time, his works have been accepted by the people in Brazil and now the Brazilian government welcomes his visits. Salgado visited the University of Sao Paulo and his lecture was filled with university students, who were not only art majors, but also science majors. Dr. Barbosa also comments that Salgado’s works are good materials for interdisciplinary study. In his works, teachers can find elements of social science, history, geography, art, and even other countries’ cultures. Finally, she adds, “I’m very proud of Salgado, who was born in and studied in my country.”
4. Significance of the Study

Earlier studies suggest that the Japanese art system is very different from that of America (Ippolito, 1994; Montgomery, 1995). The methods of art criticism in both countries may be found to be different as well. On the other hand, there may be many similarities in terms of the social and educational functions of art criticism in both countries.

This study would explore explicit characteristics of Japanese art criticism which are different from those of American art criticism. Also, this study should find similarities between Japanese art criticism and American art criticism. And the study could find a way to help non-Japanese readers understand the Japanese art criticism method. By avoiding bias against the Japanese art criticism method, future researchers and art journalists who need to know Japanese contemporary art through writings by Japanese art critics, could understand its nature and characteristics broadly. And this study should contribute to the field of art education in that Japanese art critical writings could be a type of learning material to help a foreigner understand Japanese culture as well as Japanese art world.
CHAPTER II

LITERATURE SURVEY OF JAPANESE CONTEMPORARY ART CRITICISM AND RELATED ISSUES

1. Introduction

The study of Japanese contemporary culture and society as well as art and literature has been receiving increased interest in many academic fields like social science, anthropology, history, art history and education. This study, however, will examine a problem that does not arise so much from earlier scholars' studies, but rather more from a lack of literature directly related to it. The subject is the study of Japanese contemporary art criticism in its cultural context. There is very little written about Japanese art criticism in the field of Japanese art education. Academic research and studies which focus on Japanese art criticism, especially Japanese contemporary art criticism and/or Japanese criticism in general, are very few as well. For a literature search for this thesis, I went back to Japan in Summer 1996 and visited the Tokyo Metropolitan Public Library. I used their library database system to find art criticism- and art education-related books and journals, but found nothing specific. I also explored Kinokuniya Bookstore, one of the biggest bookstores in Tokyo and asked for staff assistance in finding such books and journals, but the
result was the same. Later I figured out that most Japanese art education journals are only circulated among Japanese art teachers and art educators and those journals are not accessible through the public library in Tokyo. Those specific academic journals are sometimes subscribed to by university libraries, so I asked several Japanese university libraries for references of such journals; they did not allow me to access to their libraries because I was not a student at those schools. Contrary to the American universities' library database systems, Japanese universities' are far behind in accessibility. There are only a few universities which open their library database to the public. Even though their databases systems are accessible to outsiders through the Internet, I was not allowed to borrow books, even to make a copy of journals because I am not a Japanese student and the current resident. They also do not accept any interlibrary loan requests from America. Therefore, I could not find any written resources about Japanese art criticism in Japanese art education.

I also utilized many electronic literature search systems, such as OASIS, ERIC, Gopher, WWW, Dissertation Abstracts, and Art Index, up to April 1997. In those systems, there were no listings of Japanese art criticism in the area of art education. In such circumstances, this proposed study has to form a theoretical framework by adopting studies from fields other than art education.

There are two purposes of reviewing related literature for this study:

1) to investigate the relationship between Japanese culture and Japanese contemporary art criticism, and
2) to explore explicit characteristics of Japanese contemporary art criticism which are different from American art criticism.

For these purposes, I have divided the literature review into the following topics, and each topic is also divided into subtopics that will be discussed precisely. Some of the topics will not include Japanese contemporary art criticism directly; however, those topics will provide a bigger theoretical framework to understand contemporary Japanese culture which exists in the background of Japanese contemporary art criticism.

• Japanese art critical writings and their social environment
• Japanese art criticism and Japanese contemporary culture
• The social environment of Japanese art critics
• The social and educational roles of art criticism in Japan

2. Japanese art critical writings and their social environment

2-1. The media in which art critical writings are published

Art critical writings appear in many printed media in Japan such as daily newspapers, art magazines, popular periodic magazines, academic journals, books, art exhibition catalogues, and now Web pages. Except for some special papers and magazines, almost all general purpose printed media feature art related news. In those features, art critical writings and art related news articles sometimes are mixed; however, Japanese categorize such writings as “art critical writings” in general.
I do not find any official statistical data which indicates how many Japanese newspapers have an art section page; however, as far as I know, three major daily newspapers: Asahi, Mainichi, and Yomiuri have 1-2 page art sections both in the morning and evening papers. Those art section pages deal with every kind of art from fine arts, music, theater, performing arts, to movies, music records and sometimes computer games. And for the most part, very famous artists and/or culture critics do the reviews and write for these papers.

In the book *Journalist ni Narutame no Guidebook* (1994) (The Guidebook for Future Journalists), one of the authors writes "...general readers expect daily newspapers to be comprehensive; the papers should deal with not only social, political, and economic news, but also sports, arts, health, education, and entertainment news." (p. 24) Art critical writings are considered as one of the necessary parts in Japanese newspapers.

Several popular weekly magazines such as Weekly-Asahi, Weekly-Bunya, -Gendai, -Hoseki, and -Shincho, also feature art related news and critical writings regularly. In these magazines, sometimes non-professional art critics, like artists, musicians, and movie stars write about arts. Most of the readers of these magazines do not expect anything highly philosophical and informative, but rather more entertaining. However, the columns which feature non-professional art critics' writings have names like "Geijutsu Jihyo" (Critical review of art). Three monthly magazines: *Bijutsu Techo*, *Geijutsu Shincho*, and *Gekkan Bijutsu*, are well-known fine art magazines in Japan. Many famous art
critics' writings are published in these magazines and many upcoming art critics are trying to obtain regular columns in these magazines, too.

2-2. The relationship between art critical writings and journalism

As described in the previous section, most Japanese daily newspapers and popular magazines regularly feature art related news, which are considered art critical writings in Japan. And the writing styles as well as approaches to art work vary depending on the specific characteristics of each paper and magazine. Major newspapers always ask well-known professional art critics to review and write about art works, but several popular weekly magazines ask certain celebrities, who are non-professional art critics, to write about arts. To professionals, those non-professionals' writings may look "amateur," but the publishers title those non-professional writers' columns with headings like "critical review corner." In Japan, any kind of writings about art works, published in major papers and magazines as well as books, may be recognized as "art critical writings."

In comparing art criticism with journalism, American art educator Barrett (1990) comments that good art critics should be independent from journalism and not be influenced by artists and journalists. Lee (1988) also describes the criteria for selecting good art critics as "the independence of their point of view.....Working within the limiting format of journalistic articles, they have all managed to expand the conception of criticism beyond that of journalistic reporting" (p. 32). If this criteria is applied to the selection of art critics in this
I doubt how many so called "good" art critics there are in Japan. One of the editorial team members of Asahi Newspaper's art section page describes how they select art critics and the relationships between the team and the critics (Y. Otomo, personal communication, September 2, 1996). The team selects art critics annually, makes one-year contracts with them, and asks them to review art works and write articles on a weekly basis. The criteria for selecting art critics are that they must, first, be acclaimed professional art critics in Japan, second, have high quality writing skills, which are suitable to the majority of readers of the Asahi newspaper, and finally, be fans or at least readers of the paper. The team selects a specialist who is qualified to review works and has already received a certain respect in a specific category such as fine arts, music, or others. Depending on the type of art work, sometimes the team enlists non-contracted critics, too. According to his explanations, art critics are definitely concerned about readers' expectations and the news value of their writings as well as the quality level of the newspaper itself. Since their writings would be published in 8.2 million circulating daily newspapers, every critic has to recognize the social power of the paper in the Japanese society. In other words, if art critics were becoming more independent writers, who were not concerned with the characteristics of the newspapers, they would probably be fired.

The photography magazine *Commercial Photo* which I was employed for for several years, also has certain criteria for selecting contributing art critics. We selected them using the following criteria: 1. The contributing art critics should know the magazine readers' expectations and knowledge level, 2. They
should be willing to follow the editors' direction from selection of art works and exhibitions to the contents of the writing. They must cooperate with the editors who may revise their writings for some editorial purpose. The majority of readers of this photography magazine are professional commercial and fashion photographers, so technical information of art works such as the use of materials and creative processes are necessary parts of the articles on the critical review page. Not all art critics agreed with the editors' direction, so only a limited number of art critics worked with us.

Almost all art critical writings written by professionals are published in mass circulated print media in Japan, and those writings are edited and sometimes their contents are changed by editors. In sharp contrast with the American approach to art criticism, the Japanese editor has the power to select art critics and also to affect the art critics' views as well as the written contents.

2-3. Japanese journalism - Newspapers and Magazines

In Japan, art critical writings are influenced by the editors' direction. There is a certain hierarchy between art critics and editors. Later I will examine the social environment of Japanese art critics, but before that, I will give an overview of Japanese journalism briefly in this section.

Sociologist Tadashi Fukutake (1981) describes Japanese mass communication in his book Japanese society today. About newspapers, he writes "A few large newspaper companies have established what amounts to hierarchies of control over other media by means of ownership of and affiliation
with a great many subsidiary or related companies. Consequently, these newspapers have achieved a position of dominant control over much of the mass media” (p. 100). Also he comments “Newspapers are dependent more on advertising than on subscriptions for their revenue, the ratio being about 6 to 4” (p. 102). About magazines, he says that since 1956 the number and variety of periodicals has increased tremendously. “Weeklies (weekly magazines) have surpassed monthly magazines not only in circulation but also as an important medium of mass communications. They contain miscellaneous short articles catering to popular tastes and can be thrown away upon being read” (p.100-101).

There is another study of contemporary Japanese journalism by scholars in journalism, Arai and Uchiyama (1983). They comment that most Japanese newspaper articles are descriptive in order to satisfy readers’ preferences. There are few articles which are critical and/or express one’s own idea. Also they says Japanese journalism is becoming more commercialized and the editorial direction always depends on readers’ tastes and also clients’ demands. Several Japanese mass media critics and journalism scholars discuss the situation of Japanese journalism in the book Gendai Journalism: Journalists (Contemporary journalism--Journalists) (1974, pp. 180-214): Japanese journalists, editors, and critics have little enthusiasm to express their own critical views and ideas to the public. They are more interested in catering to the majority movements. Washington Post correspondent William Hall (1995) once commented that there are few Japanese journalists, editors, or critics who
can lead public opinions. He criticized especially Japanese journalists for their weak power.

Japanese journalism consists of three major media: newspapers, broadcasting, publishing; and other smaller media like on-line magazines. Among a population of 124 million, a total of 53 million daily newspapers and 480,000 publications are circulated in one year (Japan News Association, 1996). The big three newspaper companies, Asahi, Mainichi, and Yomiuri dominate Japanese mass communication. Each of the three have their own broadcasting company and magazine publisher, like Time Warner Communication in the U.S. The characteristics of each newspaper company are slightly different, for example, in political views. However, most of them are likely to be general, or in middle-of-the road, in order to satisfy their readers’ expectations. In Japan, there are few journalists, editors, or critics who have great individual influence on the public opinion.

3. Art Criticism and Japanese Contemporary culture

3-1. Criticism and Japanese people

In the previous section, I wrote about the social environment of art critical writings, especially focusing on the relationship between art criticism and Japanese journalism. In this section, my study expands to the discussion of Japanese criticism in general.

The English term criticism is generally translated into the Japanese term "hyoron." This Japanese term is considered as somewhat a negative act in
Japanese culture. Shinji Kohmoto, a curator of the National Museum of Modern Art in Kyoto, explains how criticism is recognized in Japan:

"Criticism in a real sense cannot survive easily in Japan. A critical statement often is understood as an attack on a person's humanity. If one wishes to keep a critical posture, s/he faces a fight at both the individual and societal level. Since this is an abhorrent situation for a Japanese person, the safest way to express a critical view is simply to go around the subject" (Kohmoto, p. 22, 1989).

The term criticism is sometimes considered as a negative judgment in America, too (Barrett, 1990), and "critics do not want to be called critics because of the negative connotations of the term" (Barrett, p. 1, 1990); however, their writings include more judgments to stimulate their readers' interests in art works than Japanese critics' writings. About the Japanese critics' attitude toward work as well as toward their writing style, Koplos (1989) is frustrated and commented that Japanese critics are not outspoken and that they hesitate to comment too directly about artists' works. She also refers to their writing style and says "it is easier to be vague than specific in Japanese, and more poetically descriptive than analytically precise" (Koplos, p. 104, 1989).

The lack of analytical precision in Japanese critical writings is also pointed out by several other scholars and journalists (Ippolito, 1994; Sonoda, 1997). Among several discussions about Japanese criticism, Ippolito (1994) quotes a Japanese sociologist Fumio Nanjo's comments on the unique structures of Japanese society in order to find the answer why Japanese avoid
a direct critique and prefer poetical descriptions. Nanjo’s comments are

“If you are too critical or controversial, you are threatening the harmony and accord of the village society; people are very, very careful about this, and try not to do too much damage to other people. For us, concern for our interpersonal relations is of higher importance than our need to strictly maintain our own opinions even if we know that we are right” (Nanjo, p.22, 1989). Nanjo’s analysis is that Japanese culture is based on the sense of the village or closed community, and the social structure has great influence on the style and way of criticism. Ippolito basically agrees with Nanjo’s analysis and also refers to the aspect of Japanese language which affects Japanese critical writings as well. In the following section, I expand my study to Japanese language and critical writings.

3-2. Japanese language and critical writings

Since Japan developed its economic strength in the world, many scholars such as anthropologists, historians, sociologists, political scientists and economists have been attracted to studying Japanese culture and its social structure. Even though their study focuses are different, many of them briefly or sometimes strongly emphasize the uniqueness of Japanese language and its influence on Japanese society.

Vogel (1980) says Japanese is one of the most difficult languages to learn because of not only the use of three different types of characters, but also because of the complex context contained in one sentence, and even in one
Sociologist and linguist Mizuta (1993) studies Japanese language in the contemporary Japanese social context. In his book *The Structures of Everyday Life in Japan in the Last Decade of the Twentieth Century* he points out one of the complexities of Japanese language by comparing it to English, “One of the difficulties an American may feel in being polite with a Japanese is the way the Japanese speaker sounds -- as if he or she will never come to the point. American English, in this context, comes to the point much quicker than Japanese” (p. 12). Also he says that the most difficult aspect in studying Japanese for a foreigner is to understand the emotional and/or personal meaning of an expression properly. He adds “By the emotional meaning of a word, I mean a mass of associations - likes, dislikes, and various degrees of attachment. A non-native speaker, through his experience, has not attained them, simply because he is alien to the culture” (p.12).

Mizuta (1993) introduces one example of how American students are sometimes puzzled by expressions in Japanese literature. This case study was observed by a Japanese literature professor Ikeda (1973). Professor Iwata teaches modern Japanese literature to American students. She used Yasunari Kawabata’s famous phrase from his book *Yama no Oto* (The sound from Mountains) (1960) in her class. Yasunari Kawabata is the 1967 Novel Prize in Literature winner and his novels have been translated into various languages. The phrase which was used in Iwata’s class was “Hachigatsu Tooka mae daga, mushi ga naku” (It is not quite the tenth of August yet, but the insects churr). To the Japanese, this phrase is very well known. Iwata found out that American
students had difficulties in understanding the implications of this sentence. They could hardly catch its lexical meaning beyond the sentence. American students’ general recognitions of “insects” and “the sense of the season” are different from those of Japanese. Mizuta restates Iwata’s observation and writes “the students (American students) immediately associated mushi or insects with fleas or flies, not with crickets or “bell-ring” insects. ......the students could not figure out what the churring insects had to do with the tenth of August. The tenth of August is about the time one feels a touch of autumn in Japan, where the four seasons are so distinct” (P.13). He concludes that “Professor Ikeda observes that her American students generally failed to comprehend the manner of being aware of seasonal transition, the insects and autumn association” (p.13). He briefly sums up that a visual, suggestive, and emotional approach to nature and reality are predominant in Japanese literature. Art critical writings and literature are considered to be different types of writings; however, many descriptive expressions about art tend to be literary as well.

Related to Japanese language, there is another interesting discovery regarding the physiology of language, which was done by a brain researcher, Tsunoda (1978). According to his experiment, while Caucasians recognize vowels and white noise in the right sphere of the brain, which is known as the emotional sphere, Japanese perceive them in the left sphere of the brain, which is known as the intellectual part. He summarizes that the combination of intellectual and emotional aspects of situations has important value in the Japanese way of thinking.
Even though there are many different studies about the characteristics of Japanese language and they come to different conclusions, many insist that Japanese language is unique and complicated. Learning any language is difficult for a non-native speaker because it requires first a study of the culture which is behind the language. Ippolito (1994) agrees with this idea and says that Japanese language affects the nature of Japanese criticism; hence, to understand Japanese critical writings requires both language study and cultural study. She also further studies the relationship between the Japanese way of thinking and aesthetics and criticism. In the next section, by following Ippolito’s study, I review this aspect of the Japanese way of thinking.

3-3. The way of thinking in contemporary Japanese culture and its effects on Japanese art criticism

How Japanese see, think, and act in business, in politics, or just in everyday life: this question seems to be a core part of Japanese study. To generalize the way of thinking or acting of over a billion Japanese sounds preposterous, but many researchers bravely conclude the Japanese way of thinking is "sociocentric," (Kiefer, 1976) "feeling-oriented," (Smith, 1983) "emphasizing vertical relationships," (Nakane, 1975) and so on. As an ordinary Japanese person, I sometimes want to disagree with some of their over-simplified conclusions, because our society is changing over time. Our life style is very different from place to place as well as from the young generation to the old generation, especially from pre-war generation to post-war generation.
However, many studies generalize that Japanese people have different tastes and characteristics in their way of thinking from those of Westerners. In this section, I review some of those studies which especially relate to the nature of Japanese art criticism.

Anthropologist and sociologist Robert J. Smith studied 60's and 70's contemporary Japanese society along with the analysis of many other Japanese studies, previously done by hundreds of researchers. His book *Japanese society* was published in 1983. Even though this book is already 14 years old, his inquiry is still recognized as the most comprehensive in the field of Japanese studies. Smith first examined several former studies of Japanese society, like done by Kiefer (1976). The following comments were written by Kiefer, quoted by Smith (1983): "Compared with Western urbanities, Japanese tend to be more particularistic- and situation-, sociocentric-, and feeling-oriented. Particularism and situationality refer to the tendency of the Japanese to alter their perceptions and values according to the immediate social demands of the situation....(p. 279). Seventeen years later, a Japanese sociologist Mizuta (1993) gives similar comments to Kiefer. He writes "In the analysis of the Japanese language, the use of honorific and polite expressions, turns out to be a sociopsychological characteristic......Here, other-person-oriented thinking is apparent. It can be interpreted in many contexts: to avoid confrontation, to avoid telling factual truth, to avoid cut-and dry dichotomization" (pp. 370-371). Such discussions actually can be found throughout many
Japanese studies and they are actually the dominant understanding of the
typical Japanese way of thinking.

Smith’s (1983) arguments; however, are more far-reaching and basically
he disagrees with the oversimplified characterization of the Japanese way of
thinking as “sociocentric.” He sees the Japanese postwar generation prefering
a more self-oriented way of thinking and the influence of the Zen-like spirit
vanishing. But, while admitting the generation change in Japan, he also points
out the tendency of Japanese to maintain and adapt at the same time: “It has
always seemed to me that the Japanese are very conscious of the way their
society works and that they have shown great creativity and aptitude for change
within the limits set for them by it (p 104).

In conclusion, there are many criticisms of Japanese tendencies ranging
from “too domestic,” to “categorizing themselves as unique people and not
opening their minds,” to “society-obedient” and so on. I think some of these
criticism may hit the mark, but not all. Since art criticism is a part of cultural
activities in Japan, social preferences and demands may very influence the
direction of art criticism. As previously discussed in section 2 about newspaper
companies and magazine publishers, they have more power than the individual
art critic. If only focusing on this point, “sociocentric” and “other-person-oriented”
thinking greatly affect the style of Japanese art criticism. If non-native scholars
there still write comments like “a sociocentric way of thinking does not conform
to real criticism,” I would like to say “Japanese criticism is just different.”
4. The social environment of Japanese art critics

4-1. Their working circumstances

In the first section, I briefly referred to the relationship between Japanese art critics and journalism. In this section, I focus on more Japanese art critics’ working environment.

The working environment of Japanese art critics is introduced in the book *Tanoshii Bijutsubon Guide* (A fun guide of art books for art enthusiasts), published by one of the biggest Japanese art publishers, Bijutsu Shuppan-sha, in 1994. According to this book, most Japanese art critics work for print media such as newspapers and magazines. They have many opportunities to write about art because not only art and photography magazines, but also general daily newspapers and also entertainment magazines like Vanity Fair, have art sections. However, several well-known art critics dominate the Japanese art world and seize opportunities to write for major print media as well as for art exhibition catalogues. For a new writer, there are few opportunities to review major exhibitions and write for mass print media. As I wrote in the first section, major daily newspapers prefer acclaimed critics to new writers.

One of the well-known art critics Junji Ito (1990) recalls his efforts for his major debut in mass media. He says he started his critical career by reviewing a friend’s private art exhibition. He commented on his friend’s works at the opening party for the audience and wrote a review article for the press release. Gradually he expanded his network in the Japanese art world and was offered a small art column in an art magazine. It took him almost 10 years to become
one of the acclaimed art critics after he finished his master's degree in Western Modern Art History at the University of Tokyo. His published books range from modern art history to critical reviews of recent media arts, and now he is working on daily newspapers, a major weekly magazine, one of the best three art magazines, and a photography magazine. He frequently appears on TV art programs, and his name can be found in various contemporary art exhibition catalogues. Another major role Ito performs is that of an associate professor at the Musashino Art College, which is recognized as one of the best private art institutes in Japan.

Many acclaimed Japanese art critics also have teaching positions at Japanese universities and art colleges. They teach art history, aesthetics, and art criticism to the students besides their critics career. In the book Japanese Arts College Guide '95 (Bijutsu-techo, 1995), many art colleges introduced themselves with their celeb-faculty members. Those celebrity faculty frequently appear in mass media and their names sound familiar to the public. In order to attract new students, universities and colleges are willing to hire those famous figures, and well-known art critics are also included. In Japan, university professor is one of the most respected people in its society, hence having teaching position at university and college gives higher social status to professional art critics.

Several art museum directors are also art critics. Shuji Takashina, now the director of the National Western Art Museum in Tokyo, as well as a professor emeritus of Department of Philosophy and Aesthetics at the University of Tokyo,
is one of the pioneers who performed two professional roles, that of art critic as well as professor in Japanese art world. Since 1960’s Takashina has been recognized as one of the most influential art critics in Japan, not only because of his establishments in art criticism, but also because of his social status as a professor at the University of Tokyo. Art critics sometimes organize art exhibition as a guest curator. Toshiharu Ito planned and curated a contemporary photography exhibition at the Tokyo Metropolitan Photography Museum, and he also wrote about this exhibition for several art magazines.

On one hand, acclaimed Japanese art critics have opportunities for teaching at colleges and planning art exhibitions, and by working as professor and exhibition planner, their names become better known to the public. Then, they could play influential role in the Japanese art world. On the other hand, new writers face to many limitations to start their career in mass media. They usually write their critical review articles for a community paper and small magazine, but there are few chance to write for major papers and magazines. Unfortunately, Japanese mass media is unlikely to offer debut opportunities to newcomers.

4-2. Educational background of Japanese art critics

A design magazine Design no Genba (Design Workplace), 1994 Autumn issue features the article about the relationship between art professionals and their school backgrounds. Art professionals include artists (fine art), commercial photographer, graphic designer, art critics, museum director, curator, and so on.
That magazine article says that the field of art criticism is "dominated by the graduates from Department of Aesthetics at the University of Tokyo" (p. 48). The article mentions several well-known art critics, who have strong influence on the Japanese art world: Shuji Takashina, Toshi Kaida, Toshiharu Ito, Junji Ito, and others. According to this article, professor Takashina has a dominant power in the field of art criticism and his students could use his networks to publish their articles in mass media. In the program of Department of Aesthetics, the students learn mostly Western art history and German aesthetics. The details of their program content will be described in the following section.

In general, most Japanese art critics have art history and aesthetics background. Some have fine art or art education background. There is not any official track to become an art critic in Japan, but at least college degree is demanded. It is not common, but some start their career as an art journalist at newspaper companies or magazine publishers, and then became professional art critics. Their study background vary from journalism to computer science, but most of them work for art related sections in print media for ten more years.

4-3. Art education and art criticism in Japan

Japanese art education, K - 12, mainly focuses on teaching studio art. Japan has not adopted the idea of something like Discipline Based Art Education (DBAE). In Japan, it is strongly recommended that all schools, elementary through high school, public schools and private institutes, follow the national teaching guidelines, which are provided by the Ministry of Education.
This is a national rule, so all art teachers create their teaching curriculum along these guidelines.

Art class is compulsory in grades 1-9 in Japan. The Ministry of Education sets the minimum class hours for all Japanese schools. The class hours vary, depending on grade level, but at least 70 hours are required in both the elementary and middle schools.

In high school, students can choose one of four elective courses such as fine arts, music, Japanese calligraphy, and crafts. The minimum class hours are 40 in one academic year.

Even though there are few scholarly studies about art criticism and teaching art criticism in Japanese art education, analyzing the national guidelines for art education could clarify how studio art is stated as the mainstream of art instruction, and how art criticism is marginalized. The national guidelines only apply to 1-12 education; higher education is a different story. In this section, first I analyze the national guidelines for art education, and second I overview teaching art criticism in higher educational settings.

The Ministry of Education revises teaching guidelines every five years. According to the most recent review (Japan Minisitry of Education [JME], 1995), the term "art criticism (Bijutsu Hyoron), the term "criticizing art," (Bijutsu Sakuhin wo Hyoron Suru), and other words related to art criticism were not mentioned. Instead of art criticism, "art appreciation" is referred to in all grade levels.

First, for example, at the elementary school level: in grades 1-2, the art teacher stimulates students' interests in art; in grades 3-4, students are trained
to see differences in art works compared with other works; in grades 5-6, students are required to increase their sense of art appreciation and to appreciate art in depth.

Second, at the middle school level; in grade 7, students are asked to appreciate artistic forms of works as well as artists’ intentions and techniques of expression. Also the teacher teaches the importance of appreciating Japanese not only traditional, but also contemporary art, design, and craft. All of those have important value in inheriting Japanese culture; in grades 8-9, students are trained to appreciate art in its cultural context. Especially they study the relationship between art and culture, art and human beings.

Third, at the high school level: in grades 10-12, students study World art history, mostly European Art till French Impressionism and practice appreciating so-called masterpieces of art. The guidelines recommend that students have certain aesthetic experiences through art learning. In spite of the fact that the Ministry of Education advises art teachers to teach aesthetics and art history, most art classrooms concentrate on studio art. Japanese art educator Sumiya (1971) says that high school art classroom is a leisure time to students. Most students do not consider art learning to be valuable to their everyday lives, because the entrance examinations of Japanese colleges and universities do not require students’ abilities of art creativity and appreciation, except for the examination for art college (Ippolito, 1994; Montgomery, 1995; et al.). In some schools, art class is replaced by other subjects like math and language. In the guidelines for high school level art education, some recommended teaching
content slightly resembles art criticism. The National guideline says “Students are trained to express their ideas critically and logically when talking about art” (JME, p. 65). But most high school art classrooms do not have time to do such practice (Shields, 1989).

Finally, let's turn our eyes to art education at the college level. Except for fine art colleges, other Japanese ordinary colleges do not require learning art history, studio art, aesthetics, or art criticism of students. In general education courses, some of these subjects are contained, but all are elective courses. In terms of major studies, art history and aesthetics are recognized as independent subjects. Aesthetics sometimes belongs to the philosophy department or art history department, or in some schools belongs to the literature and cultural study department.

As I briefly described in the previous section, many well-known Japanese art critics studied aesthetics at the University of Tokyo. The university, the most competitive university in Japan, has an independent department of aesthetics, its conjunct with history of art courses. Their course curriculum (1995-96) focuses on the study of German aesthetics and their approaches to art works are based on formalism. Some of the students who studied at this department for example Shunji Ito, Masahau Kaida, became influential art critics, and still dominate Japanese art world now. In the course curriculum, there is no class to teach art criticism or to criticize art criticism.

Another college which has an independent department of aesthetics in its graduate school is the University of Tokyo Fine Arts (UTFA). This school does
not strongly concentrate on German aesthetics, but formalistic approaches are mainly taught. UTFA course curriculum (1994-95) shows that art criticism is not included in their courses. Different from the University of Tokyo, the UTFA contains a class of contemporary art and trains students to appreciate contemporary art works based on Modernism.

Most well-known, influential Japanese art critics are educated at the University of Tokyo or the University of Tokyo Fine Arts. Their views of art appreciation are based on formalism and modernism. At this point, I assume that Japanese art criticism is mainly constructed by them and represents modernist-based art criticism to the public.
CHAPTER III

CONTENT ANALYSIS AND COMPARISON OF JAPANESE AND AMERICAN ART CRITICAL WRITINGS

1. Selection of art critical writings

1 - 1. Criteria of sampling

The purpose of this study is to compare the contents of Japanese and American art critical writings and to find if there are different approaches to art criticism in the two cultures. For this purpose, I have selected both American and Japanese sample writings about the same work or project by the same artist. The comparison would not be as meaningful if I used writings which criticize different art works. So, first, I searched for an artist whose works were reviewed in both countries. Although many artists were considered, such as Jasper Johns, Andy Warhol, Ansel Adams, and Robert Mapplethope, I chose a photographer who is neither American nor Japanese. There are two reasons:

1) I was a Japanese photography magazine editor and I know many Japanese photography critics and therefore am more familiar with photography.
2) If the selected artist was an American, American art critics would have a certain advantage in interpreting the artist's works by sharing the same cultural
background and the same for Japanese. If the selected artist is neither American nor Japanese, both countries' art critics would be able to comment from a more objective position.

I found several photographers who were French, Italian, or Brazilian. Among them, I picked a Brazilian photographer, Sebastiao Salgado. His recent project "WORKERS" was exhibited both in America and Japan, and there are many available critical reviews of his works. In America, the following library database systems were used for this article search: Art Index, Lexis/Nexis, Newspaper Abstracts, and Periodicals Abstracts. I also found three articles published in daily newspapers.

In Japan, there is no comprehensive library database system, so I called several newspaper companies and art magazine publishers and asked for published articles about Salgado's "WORKERS." I found only one article from a daily newspaper and only two articles from two photography magazines.

Those combined Japanese and American selected sample writings are:

1. *Images of the Human Landscape* by Steve Appleford, LA Times
2. *Photography That Is Immune From the Romance of Labor* by Vivien Raynor, NY Times
3. *WORKERS* by Jody Kolodzey, Christian Science Monitor
4. *Salgado's WORKERS* by Hiromi Nakamura, Commercial Photo
5. *Seinaru Te no Hanran* by Ryuta Imafuku, Asahi Camera
Six art/photography critics' writings about Sebastiao Salgado's "WORKERS" were used for this study. Three of the six are American art critics' writings and the other three are Japanese art critics' writings. In this section, those art critics' biographical backgrounds are provided.

I was able to contact five of the art critics and obtain their biographical information. Only Jody Kolodzey was not reachable and I could not find her information. I sent an inquiry letter to the Christian Science Monitor, in which Kolodzey wrote her article about Salgado, but the newspaper said that they could not help this research. I also used several database systems through the Internet, such as Yahoo's People Search and Lexis/Nexis for finding her contact address, but there was nothing.

Hence, this study can only introduce two American art critics and three Japanese art critics' biographical information here.

The Two American art critics:

A. Vivien Raynor

Ms. Raynor was born in Great Britain and studied art at the Royal College of Art in London. She has been working in America for twenty years and has worked mainly as an art critic. She also exhibited her paintings once and wanted to be a professional artist, but because of financial difficulty, started her career as an art critic. She has written review articles for the New York Times, the Washington Post, and several
art magazines such as *Connoisseur*. She said she could not remember all the different newspapers and magazines she has written. Her clients do not strictly instruct her regarding contents of her writings, but sometimes they make their preferences known in subtle ways and she knows how to express her own thoughts while also keeping her clientele happy. She does not have a specific lens through which to view art works, such as modernism or post-modernism, but is simply more interested in surviving in the field of art.

**B. Steve Appleford**

Mr. Appleford has been a regular contributor to the Los Angeles Times for seven years. He thinks of himself as more journalist than art critic, but he writes mainly on photography as well as other types of arts for the newspapers. He studied English and Journalism at California State University at Northridge, with an emphasis on writing. He writes about photographers who belong to the well-known photo agencies like Magnum, and has also reviewed the works of famous photographer Richard Avedon and Annie Leibovitz. Appleford says he is open to any style of art and does not have specific tastes in criticizing art. He likes "creative photojournalism" as well as "subjective styles" of documentary photography.
The three Japanese critics:

**A. Hiromi Nakamura**

Hiromi Nakamura is a photography critic as well as a freelance photography exhibition coordinator. She studied photography at the Fine Arts Department of Nihon University, and first started her career as a photo coordinator at one of the leading photo agencies in Japan. After organizing several photo exhibitions, she was asked to write articles about those exhibitions and gradually she came to work as a photography critic. Now she is writing review articles for Commercial Photo magazine frequently, and also writing for photo exhibition catalogues.

**B. Tokumi Sawamoto**

Tokumi Sawamoto has been one of the well-known photography critics in Japan for decades. He is a professor at Nihon University, and teaches photography criticism, aesthetics, and photography history to Fine Arts - Photography major students. His photography review articles are published in major newspapers and art magazines almost monthly. He also organizes many photography exhibitions for certain private art museums. He has published several books about contemporary photography history as well as critical reviews. He is very well known, especially among students who study photography.
C. Ryuta Imafuku

Ryuta Imafuku is a professor of archeology at Chukyo University in Japan, but is also becoming known as an art critic, as well. He is a good writer, and once a number of his review articles of a certain photographer’s works published in his university journal attracted a photo magazine editor’s eye. Then he was asked to write about photography for that photo magazine. His points of view on photography are based on his specialty, Archeology. Salgado’s photo project contains many archeological issues, so it would appear that Asahi Camera, the most popular photo magazine in Japan, made a wise choice in asking a professor like Imafuku to review Salgado’s works. He is not considered a photography critic among professional art and photography critics in Japan, but general audiences consider him to be a professional writer, especially in the field of photography. His writings were frequently published in several daily newspapers as well as art magazines, and because of his explicit writing style, has become a popular photography critic.

2. Data Analysis - Six Sample Writings

2 - 1. The Coding and Analytical Process of Sample Writings

This study utilizes a qualitative textual analysis method in order to analyze six sample writings. As already referred to in Chapter 1, German sociologist Kracauer (1953) said that the content of a text should be conceived of as “a meaningful whole,” and therefore it is important to involve an act of philosophical consideration and interpretation in textual analysis. Grant-Davie
(1992) comments "In order to interpret any kind of data, some form of coding is necessary (and indeed unavoidable)" (p. 270). He also suggests three important factors of data coding processes: 1. Identifying coding units, 2. Classifying units into categories, and 3. Testing coding systems for reliability. So, this study includes the following textual analysis and coding steps.

1. Three Japanese art critics' writings were translated into English by an English-Japanese bilingual speaker. Ms. Stephanie Lewis, a Japanese Literature major with an International Business Marketing minor, and a senior at the Ohio State University, completed this task.

2. Four main categories of coding were determined: Description of the artwork, Interpretation of the work, Evaluation of the work, and Miscellaneous.

3. Each of the six writings were broken into paragraphs.

4. Sentences and/or parts of sentences that fit the four pre-determined categories were chosen.

5. After the first coding step, all sentences were examined in order to make sub categories under each of the four pre-determined categories.
6. After this examination, the study discerned that the four pre-determined categories were too broad to analyze textual data precisely. There were many sentences which fit several categories. Therefore, the following eight main categories were created:

- Cultural Context
- Subject Matter
- Aesthetic Issues
- Documentary Issues
- Artist
- Comparisons of Salgado's works with other selections
- Evaluation
- Interpretation

7. Then, under the above eight categories, several sub categories were created:


In this category, the writer shows readers various kinds of cultural information about the countries documented by Salgado. The information is not directly represented in Salgado's works, but is more general background information about those countries.

In this category, the writer refers to various kinds of subject matter which are represented in Salgado's works.

• Aesthetic Issues -- a. Form and Subject Matter, b. Book Design and/or Presentation Context, c. Techniques and Medium.

In this category, the writer points out aesthetic issues which are represented in Salgado's works. This category is subjective and does not involve judgment or evaluation.


In this category, the writer points out documentary issues which are represented in Salgado's works. This category is subjective and does not involve judgment or evaluation.

• Artist -- a. Biography, b. The artist's Intention.

In this category, the writer gives the reader information from Salgado's biography and his intent in creating his works.
• Comparison of his works with -- a. Literature, b. Historical Records, c. Artistic Images, d. Contextual Non-art connections, e. Connections to Western culture, f. The writer’s own experiences or their personal responses, g. Art Critic’s views.

In this category, the writer compares Salgado’s works with literature, other artistic images, non-artistic images, Western culture, and the writer’s personal experiences.


In this category, the writer evaluates Salgado’s works from these three different perspectives.

• Interpretation

There are no sub categories here. The writer interprets Salgado’s works.

8. All sentences were listed under specific categories. There were no exceptions.

9. Statistics were calculated:

• number of responses for main categories as well as sub categories were counted

• total responses for all categories were counted
percent for each main category as well as for each sub category was calculated

10. A chart for each critic's writing, and then two charts for three American critics' writings and three Japanese critics' writings were made for comparison.

11. The findings for each critic's writing were discussed.

12. Category findings for each individual writing are described and analyzed.

13. The Critics' writings are grouped by country and described and analyzed as a whole.

14. Finally, American writings are compared and contrasted with Japanese writings.

This study prepared the following questions and used them for the analytical process: No.'s 12, 13, and 14.

- What is the main focus of the writing: the artist, the art works, the social context, or the use of techniques?
- Is the writer more intent upon evaluating the works or describing the works?

- How does the writer characterize Salgado's works, as aesthetic objects or documentary objects?

- Are there any significant differences between the Japanese and American art critics' writings? Does the data show the difference?

These questions were based on the assumptions, previously identified in the literature review. For example, Japanese are likely to avoid direct criticism, and Salgado is more widely known as a documentary photographer than as an artist.

2 - 2. Content analysis of Steve Appleford's article

Underlined phrases represent each specific category.

_Code Category I : Cultural Context_

The writer shows readers various kinds of cultural information about the countries documented by Salgado. The information is not directly represented in Salgado's works, but it is more general background information about those countries.

_I-a : Geographic_
I-b : Political

I-c : Economic

I-d : Historical

I-e : Values, Attitudes, and Beliefs

I-f : Ethnographic

I-f1 = Ethnicity

I-f2 = Life Style

I-f3 = Technology

Code Category II : Subject Matter

The writer refers to various kinds of subject matter which are represented in Salgado's works.

II-a : Geographic

II-b : Political
Il-c: Economic

Example: Salgado’s massive eight-year "Workers" project, which documented the final days of manual labor, before machines and computers finally took over production, is the subject of at least five museum and gallery shows touring the world.

Il-d: Values, Attitudes, and Beliefs

Il-e: Historical

Il-f: Ethnographic

Il-f1 = Ethnicity

Il-f2 = Life Style

Example: Salgado’s 1986 series on the workers of Serra Pelada, Brazil, for example, reveals an ocean of 50,000 grime-covered men laboring like drones in an open-pit gold mine, and dramatizes the extreme hardships humans can withstand while retaining some measure of dignity.

Il-f3 = Technology

Example: Salgado’s massive eight-year "Workers" project, which documented the final days of manual labor, before machines and computers...
finally took over production, is the subject of at least five museum and gallery shows touring the world.

**Code Category III : Aesthetic Issues**

The writer points out aesthetic issues which are represented in Salgado's works. This category is subjective and does not involve judgment or evaluation.

**III-a : Form and Subject Matter**

Example: Another photograph, of a small, painfully malnourished child being wriggled on a scale in Ethiopia is agonizing to see, but somehow poetic in its composition.

This aesthetic commitment to an emotional, romantic, even spiritual view of the developing world has earned some criticism.

**III-b : Book Design and/or Presentation Context**

**III-c : Techniques and Medium**

**Code Category IV : Documentary Issues**

The writer points out documentary issues which are represented in Salgado's works. This category is subjective and does not involve judgment or evaluation.
IV-a: Morality

Example: This aesthetic commitment to an emotional, romantic, even spiritual view of the developing world has earned some criticism.

IV-b: Social Benefit

IV-c: Historical Record

IV-d: Contemporary Issues

Code Category V: Artist

The writer gives the reader information from Salgado’s biography and his intent in creating his works.

V-a: Biography

Example: The Brazilian-born photographer, whose work can be seen at the Fahey/Klein Gallery through Sept. 3, seems relaxed and fit enough this morning in his Paris loft, surrounded by black-and-white prints, posters and magazines featuring some of his epic, emotionally rich images of beauty and profound suffering.
He was already working as an economist, and just finished work on a doctorate degree, when his wife, architect Lelia Wanick Salgado, bought a 35mm camera in 1970 for her work.

\textit{V-b : The artist's Intention}

Example: But Salgado rejects standards often used by some fine arts critics, which tend to focus on one single image at a time as an independent art object.

"For me, this is a completely wrong way to look inside of the work."

\textit{Code Category VI : Comparisons of his works with other selections}

The writer compares Salgado's works with literature, other artistic images, non-artistic images, connections to the Western culture, and the writer's personal experiences.

\textit{VI-a : Literature}

\textit{VI-b : Historical Records}

\textit{VI-c : Artistic Images}

Example: His tradition is that of the "concerned photographer," epitomized by W. Eugene Smith, who helped define the expressive power of the photo-essay in the pages of the original Life magazine.
VI-d : Contextual Non-art Connections

VI-e : Connections to Western Culture

VI-f : The Writers' Own Experiences or Their Personal Responses

VI-g : Other Art Critics' Views
Example: In a notorious 1991 New Yoker magazine piece, Ingrid Sischy suggested Salgado's immense reputation was exaggerated, and wrote that his "beatification of tragedy results in pictures that ultimately reinforce our passivity toward the experience they reveal."

Code Category VII : Evaluation
The writer evaluates Salgado's works from these three different perspectives.

VII-a : Aesthetics
Example: The Brazilian-born photographer, whose work can be seen at the Fahey/Klein Gallery through Sept.3, seems relaxed and fit enough this morning in his Paris loft, surrounded by black-and-white prints, posters and magazines featuring some of his epic, emotionally rich images of beauty and profound suffering.

VII-b : Moral Inspiration
VII-c: Social Benefit

Code Category VIII: Interpretation
The writer interprets Salgado’s works.

2 - 3. Content analysis of Jody Kolodzey’s article
Underlined phrases represent each specific category.

Code Category I: Cultural Context
The writer shows readers various kinds of cultural information about the countries documented by Salgado. The information is not directly represented in Salgado’s works, but it is more general background information about those countries.

I-a: Geographic

I-b: Political

I-c: Economic
Example: Much of what they do is dehumanizing work, and sometimes their own cultures liken the workers to animals.

It is striking how often workers blend with their environments.
1-d : Historical
1-e : Values, Attitudes, and Beliefs

1-f : Ethnographic
1-f1 = Ethnicity

1-f2 = Life Style

1-f3 = Technology

Code Category II : Subject Matter

The writer refers to various kinds of subject matter which are represented in Salgado's works.

II-a : Geographic

II-b : Political

II-c : Economic

Example : In Dhanbar, Bihar, India, a woman's hand steadies a baby on the back of her husband as he pushes a cart home from the coal mine.
Close by a fern-covered slope at Kawah Idjen, Indonesia, a worker hews chunks of sulfur from the crater of the volcano, a shirt pulled over his head and across his face to protect him from the poisonous fumes.

**II-d : Values, Attitudes, and Beliefs**

Example: Even for those who appear to be subsumed by their machines - shipyard welders in asbestos suits - the robotics facade is consistently broken by an eye or a smile.

**II-e : Historical**

Example: The exhibition is arranged to reflect a historical progression from the preindustrial occupations of agriculture and fishing through such hybrid enterprises as textiles and meatpacking and then into the full-blown industrialization of the steel age.

**II-f : Ethnographic**

II-f1 = Ethnicity

II-f2 = Life Style

Example: In Dhanbar, Bihar, India, a woman's hand steadies a baby on the back of her husband as he pushes a cart home from the coal mine.
Salgado observes that in Serra Pelada, where he took some of his most disturbing images, "men who work in the mud and dig for gold are called mud hogs, like pigs who work in dirt and slime."

\textit{II-f3 = Technology}

Example: From there, the camera's course is revolutionary, recording the detritus of all this industry: ship breakers in Bangladesh, undoing what is being done on the opposite wall, and firefighters in Kuwait undoing the damage of the Gulf war.

In the steel factories of France and Ukraine, Salgado found a worker called "the ratman: his job is to smell gas, to look for leaks beneath red-hot cauldrons.

\textit{Code Category III : Aesthetic Issues}

The writer points out aesthetic issues which are represented in Salgado's works. This category is subjective and does not involve judgment or evaluation.

\textit{III-a : Form and Subject Matter}

Example: For Sebastiao Salgado, hands are as expressive as faces, and the Brazilian-born photographer zooms in on them.
The 250 photographs in the exhibition are the fruits of a seven-year project that took Salgado to some 50 locations, mostly in the third world.

_III-b: Book Design, Page Layout, and/or Presentation Context_

Example: The exhibition is arranged to reflect a historical progression from the preindustrial occupations of agriculture and fishing through such hybrid enterprises as textiles and meatpacking and then into the full-blown industrialization of the steel age.

The prints in the exhibition are several different sizes, enhancing the visual impact, and all of them are black and white, Salgado's preferred medium.

_III-c: Techniques and Medium_

_Code Category IV: Documentary Issues_

The writer points out documentary issues which are represented in Salgado's works. This category is subjective and does not involve judgment or evaluation.
IV-a: Morality

Example: Some of the photographs are candid and journalistic, others are exercises in portraiture, showing the self-conscious pride and vulnerability of the workers.

IV-b: Social Benefit

IV-c: Historical Record

IV-d: Contemporary Issues

Code Category V: Artist

The writer gives the reader information from Salgado’s biography and his intent in creating his works.

V-a: Biography

Example: For Sebastiao Salgado, hands areas expressive as faces, and the Brazilian-born photographer zooms in on them.

Salgado, who has won numerous awards for his work and was twice named "Photojournalist of the Year" by the International Center of Photography in New York, originally trained as an economist.
V-b: The artist's Intention

Example: Salgado subtitled the exhibition "An Archaeology of the Industrial Age" because he wanted to show how the nature of work has hanged along with concepts of production and efficiency.

In the catalogue that accompanies the exhibition, he writes: "The developed world produces only for those Th. consume - approximately one-fifth of all people...."

Code Category VI: Comparisons of his works with other selections

The writer compares Salgado's works with literature, other artistic images, non-artistic images, connections to the Western culture, and the writer's personal experiences.

VI-a: Literature

VI-b: Historical Records

VI-c: Artistic Images

Example: At times, the photographs evoke paintings - there are elements of Salvador Dali in a Gdansk shipyard, where the head of a man poking through a porthole in the foreground dwarfs the bodies of three CO-workers in the background all in the same plane of focus.
An image of a family of Brazilian cocoa pickers relaxing in a glade with their dog recalls Paul Gauguin.

VI-d : Contextual Non-art Connections

VI-e : Western Connections

VI-f : The Writer's Own Experiences or Their Personal Responses

VI-g : Other Art Critics' Views

Code Category VII : Evaluation

The writer evaluates Salgado's works from these three different perspectives.

VII-a : Aesthetics

Example: In one of the most beautiful photographs, taken at a textile-processing plant in Kustanai, Kazakhstan, loosely wound bales of raw wool echo the swirls in a woman's skirt as she moves among them.

The print quality is exquisite, the fine grain and hard contrast emphasizing texture and prompting the viewer to linger and look more closely.
**VII-b : Moral Inspiration**

Example: In Salgado's photographs, however, *they are all too human*, with a stalwart dignity that transcends the mud and the coal dust.

**VII-c : Social Benefit**

Example: The print quality is exquisite, the fine grain and hard contrast emphasizing texture and *prompting the viewer to linger and look more closely*.

*Salgado has succeeded in chronicling this new, if precarious, order, and the older order that underlies it.*

**Code Category VIII : Interpretation**

The writer interprets Salgado's works.

2 - 4. Content analysis of **Vivien Raynor's** article

Underlined phrases represent each specific category.

**Code Category I : Cultural Context**

The writer shows readers various kinds of cultural information about the countries documented by Salgado. The information is not directly represented in Salgado's works, but it is more general background information about those countries.
I-a: Geographic

Example: Alternatively, there is, maybe, a fortune to be made prospecting for gold at the Serra Pelada gold mine, in the photographer’s native country, Brazil.

I-b: Political

I-c: Economic

Example: At the port of Chittagong, in Bangladesh, for instance, there are beached ships to be demolished manually by blowtorch and sledgehammer.

I-d: Historical

I-e: Values, Attitudes, and Beliefs

I-f: Ethnographic

I-f1 = Ethnicity

I-f2 = Life Style
I-f3 = Technology

Example: It seems to be getting closer, the utopian heaven in which machines do all the work, leaving people free, as it were, to produce art or go sport fishing.

Code Category II : Subject Matter

The writer refers to various kinds of subject matter which are represented in Salgado's works.

II-a : Geographic

Example: In Java, livings are made harvesting sulfur from the lake boiling in the crater of a volcano.

During the relatively dry winter, 50,000 men descend daily into this strip-mine-sized cavity.

II-b : Political

II-c : Economic

Example: Among the Cannel Tunnel shots is one of the workers on the English side that is noteworthy for including Australians but no one from the African or Caribbean part of the Commonwealth.
France, Poland, Russia and Ukraine are represented by heavy industry: the conveyor belt in the picture reproduced moves coal and iron ore to Dunkirk.

II-d : Values, Attitudes, and Beliefs

II-e : Historical

II-f : Ethnographic

II-f1 = Ethnicity

II-f2 = Life Style

Example : But with the seven-hour climb up to the crater and the return trip loaded down with 155 pounds of the mineral, not to mention the fumes encountered on the way, each gleaned has to test two days for every one worked.

One of the many homosexuals working in this hell hopes to find the nuggets that will get him to Paris for the silicone breasts that, he says, are the best in the world.
Example: Yet, to judge from Sebastiao Salgado's photographs at the Philadelphia Museum of Art, hard labor is still the lot of the majority.

Looking like dung beetles from afar, they fill sacks with earth and lug them back up to the top by way of ramshackle ladders.

Code Category III: Aesthetic Issues

The writer points out aesthetic issues which are represented in Salgado's works. This category is subjective and does not involve judgment or evaluation.

III-a: Form and Subject Matter

Example: He delivers his points laconically and, unlike many photojournalists with a mission, seems immune to the "romance" of labor and, far from inciting his viewers to mount the barricades, leaves them to infer what they will.

III-b: Book Design and/or Presentation Context

Example: Hefting this eight-pound paperback is basic training for any of the occupations documented by the photographer.
III-c: Techniques and Medium

Example: Still, it is hard to imagine him making the same impact with his writing as he does with his black-and-white pictures.

Although the photographer is said never to pose them, his compositions are astonishingly clean-cut, and at least one, the scene of Cuban cane cutters resting, looks like a movie still.

Code Category IV: Documentary Issues

The writer points out documentary issues which are represented in Salgado’s works. This category is subjective and does not involve judgment or evaluation.

IV-a: Morality

Example: He delivers his points laconically and, unlike many photojournalists with a mission, seems immune to the “romance” of labor and, far from inciting his viewers to mount the barricades, leaves them to infer what they will.

Although the photographer is said never to pose them, his compositions are astonishingly clean-cut, and at least one, the scene of Cuban cane cutters resting, looks like a movie still.

IV-b: Social Benefit
**IV-c: Historical Record**

Example: *One thinks not only of the terror coursing through their plump bodies but also of concentration camp inmates getting their "last shower" in the gas chambers.*

**IV-d: Contemporary Issues**

**Code Category V: Artist**

The writer gives the reader information from Salgado's biography and his intent in creating his works.

**V-a: Biography**

Example: *Alternatively, there is, maybe, a fortune to be made prospecting for gold at the Serra Pelada gold mine, in the photographer's native country, Brazil.*

Mr. Salgado's art is informed by his early training as an economist; his comments about the wealth made on commodities exchanges versus the wages paid for the growing, extracting and processing of these raw materials are most enlightening.
V-b : The artist's Intention

Example: In the catalogue, Mr. Salgado mentions fears that are often voiced in pubs but seldom in conventional news coverage: "For the first time since 1066, the English have been invaded from the Continent - from France, no less" - and by a tunnel bringing "barbarians."

The photographer believes that English sandhogs "cannot admit that deep down they feel like accomplices to a frightening defeat."

Code Category VI : Comparisons of his works with other selections

The writer compares Salgado's works with literature, other artistic images, non-artistic images, connections to the Western culture, and the writer's personal experiences.

VI-a : Literature

VI-b : Historical Records

VI-c : Artistic Images

Example: More than anything else, the prints have the look of early 19th century French Realist painting - there is even a "Carmen" making Cuban cigars - and it may be this that prompts criticism from younger, less successful photographers.
Still, it is hard to imagine him making the same impact with his writing as he does with his black-and-white pictures.

The writer evaluates Salgado's works from these three different perspectives.

There is also beauty bordering on the picturesque, as in the well-known scenes of Texans cleaning up the oil disaster in Kuwait - an omen of "the fire next time" if ever there was one. Though many of the photographs are ostensibly about nothing but beauty - the view of razor-sharp peaks on the island of Reunion, for example - this huge exhibition is guaranteed to leave its beholders as alarmed for the globe as for its insatiable inhabitants.
VII-c : *Social Benefit*

Example: Mr. Salgado's art is informed by his early training as an economist; his comments about the wealth made on commodities exchanges versus the wages paid for the growing, extracting and processing of these raw materials are most enlightening.

Though many of the photographs are ostensibly about nothing but beauty - the view of razor-sharp peaks on the island of Reunion, for example - this huge exhibition is guaranteed to leave its beholders as alarmed for the globe as for its insatiable inhabitants.

*Code Category VIII : Interpretation*

The writer interprets Salgado's works.

Example: How could there not be with subjects like the woman laboring over a canal in northern India who hacks at desert, her upraised arms with bangles from wrist to elbow?

2 - 5. Content analysis of *Ryuta Imafulu's* article

Underlined phrases represent each specific category.

*Code Category I : Cultural Context*

The writer shows readers various kinds of cultural information about the countries documented by Salgado. The information is not directly represented
in Salgado’s works, but it is more general background information about those countries.

1-a : Geographic

1-b : Political

1-c : Economic

Example: For instance, several years ago, cacao producers from the northeastern side of Brazil were forced to give up harvesting cacao beans due to a drop in the world price, which in turn resulted in the decay of cacao beans.

Even though they themselves are capable of catching tuna fish, the Japanese product companies sit waiting to dismantle the fish with their electric powered knives.

1-d : Historical

1-e : Values, Attitudes, Beliefs

1-f : Ethnographic

1-f1 = Ethnicity
Code Category II : Subject Matter

The writer refers to various kinds of subject matter which are represented in Salgado's works.

II-a : Geographic

II-b : Political

Example : Hence, it is this colonialism and the damage it has done to people's lives that Salgado has documented.

II-c : Economic

Example : As we are already aware, it is those immense manual labor fields which deeply connect the market systems of the world.

At the same time, Salgado shows his reverence for manual labor which has began to diminish in the contemporary world.

II-d : Values, Attitudes, Beliefs
II-e : Historical

II-f : Ethnographic

II-f1 = Ethnicity

II-f2 = Life Style

Example: The visual world of Sebastiao Salgado's "WORKERS" portrays the most primitive human productive act, brought about by hands which come into contact with the external world.

A few Sicilian fishermen who have inherited the traditional medieval style of fishing are today still working in parts of the Mediterranean sea.

II-f3 = Technology

Example: Depicted is a place where bare hands can come into direct contact with some of the most fundamental materials such as, soil, minerals, leaves, fruit, animals, timber, fiber, clay, glass, concrete, steel, and so forth and so on.

Such tools may be distinguishable between mare farm implements and precision tools.
The limited numbers of tuna fish which have been carelessly captured by high-tech modern fishing methods such as methods where a helicopter and detector are used, are the same fish that the Sicilian fisherman catch with the use of only a fish net and skill.

*Code Category III : Aesthetic Issues*

The writer points out aesthetic issues which are represented in Salgado's works. This category is subjective and does not involve judgment or evaluation.

*III-a : Form and Subject Matter*

Example: It is when dirty irritated hands hold such standard tools that the tools begin to obtain a dynamic beauty that sometimes has organic-like strength.

Salgado captures the moments when a workers' sacred hands encounter the real "nakedness" of the external world.

*III-b : Book Design and/or Presentation Context*

* III-c : Technique, Medium
Code Category IV: Documentary Issues

The writer points out documentary issues which are represented in Salgado's works. This category is subjective and does not involve judgment or evaluation.

IV-a: Morality

Example: Prompted by a passion and sympathy for the laborer, Salgado's pictures capture and sustain this type of ill-balanced economic system.

IV-b: Social Benefit

IV-c: Historical Record

IV-d: Contemporary Issues

Example: Although the ill-balanced economic system is hidden by the mechanization of labor, Salgado painstakingly unveils it with his scientific documentary approach.

Code Category V: Artist

The writer gives the reader information from Salgado's biography and his intent in creating his works.

V-a: Biography
V-b: The artist's Intention

Example: With veneration, Salgado is able to capture such acts.

Although the ill-balanced economic system is hidden by the mechanization of labor, Salgado painstakingly unveils it with his scientific documentary approach.

Code Category VI: Comparisons of his works with other selections

The writer compares Salgado's works with literature, other artistic images, non-artistic images, connections to the Western culture, and the writer's personal experiences.

VI-a: Literature

VI-b: Historical Records

VI-c: Artistic Images

VI-d: Contextual Non-art Connections

VI-e: Connections to Western Culture

VI-f: The Writer's Own Experiences or Their Personal Responses
VI-g : Other Art Critics' Views

Code Category VII : Evaluation
The writer evaluates Salgado's works from these three different perspectives.

VII-a : Aesthetics
Example: Even though the manual labores have become involved with recent market theories, one should not ignore moments when the world is changed beautifully by another hands.

VII-b : Moral Inspiration

VII-c : Social Benefit

Code Category VIII : Interpretation
The writer interprets Salgado's works.
Example: Salgado's approach to the subject seems to be not only scientific but religious as well.

Salgado believing the power of one's hands in changing the world, highlights the fact by documenting the fields of manual labor.
2 - 6. Content analysis of Hiromi Nakamura's article

Underlined phrases represent each specific category.

Code Category I : Cultural Context

The writer shows readers various kinds of cultural information about the countries documented by Salgado. The information is not directly represented in Salgado’s works, but it is more general background information about those countries.

I-a : Geographic

I-b : Political

I-c : Economic

I-d : Historical

I-e : Values, Attitudes, Beliefs

I-f : Ethnographic

I-f1 = Ethnicity

I-f2 = Life Style
Code Category II : Subject Matter

The writer refers to various kinds of subject matter which are represented in Salgado's works.

II-a : Geographic

II-b : Political

II-c : Economic

Example : The most impressive aspect of this project is Salgado's honest, serious approach to his subject, the workers, who devote all of their time to tough manual labor, never giving up their lives or hopes for the future.

II-d : Values, Attitudes, Beliefs

II-e : Historical

II-f : Ethnographic

II-f1 = Ethnicity
II-f2 = Life Style

II-f3 = Technology

Code Category III : Aesthetic Issues
The writer points out aesthetic issues which are represented in Salgado’s works. This category is subjective and does not involve judgment or evaluation.

III-a : Form and Subject Matter

III-b : Book Design and/or Presentation Context

III-c : Techniques and Medium

Code Category IV : Documentary Issues
The writer points out documentary issues which are represented in Salgado’s works. This category is subjective and does not involve judgment or evaluation.

IV-a : Morality
Example : The most impressive aspect of this project is Salgado’s honest, serious approach to his subject, the workers, who devote all of their time to tough manual labor, never giving up their lives or hopes for the future.
Salgado has humanistic eye for those workers which fill with his sympathy and humanism.

IV-b : Social Benefit

IV-c : Historical Record

IV-d : Contemporary Issues

Code Category V : Artist

The writer gives the reader information from Salgado's biography and his intent in creating his works.

V-a : Biography

Example: Unlike other photographers, Salgado had a unique background in education and the working field while pursuing his career as a photographer.

In 1982, he received the Eugene Smith Award, an award for the most distinguished humanistic photographer and his work.
V-b : The artist's Intention

Example: "I want to neither criticize the world politically, nor to satisfy my own artistic demands."

Salgado has humanistic eye for those workers which fill with his sympathy and humanism.

Code Category VI : Comparisons of his works with other selections

The writer compares Salgado's works with literature, other artistic images, non-artistic images, connections to the Western culture, and the writer's personal experiences.

VI-a : Literature

VI-b : Historical Records

VI-c : Artistic Images

VI-d : Contextual Non-art Connections

VI-e : Connections to Western Culture

VI-f : The Writers' Own Experiences or Their Personal Responses
VI-g: Other Art Critics' Views

Code Category VII: Evaluation

The writer evaluates Salgado's works from these three different perspectives.

VII-a: Aesthetics

VII-b: Moral Inspiration

Example: From Salgado to the Audience, the communication process is bolstered by Salgado's strong ideal, therefore, the process appears dramatic.

VII-c: Social Benefit

Example: From the beginning record of his work, Salgado evokes emotions in his viewers leaving with strong impressions.

Finally, the audience can find words which represents Salgado's philosophy through his photography.
Code Category VIII: Interpretation

The writer interprets Salgado’s works.

Example: From Salgado to the Audience, the communication process is bolstered by Salgado’s strong ideal, therefore, the process appears dramatic.

2 - 7. Content analysis of Tokumi Sawamoto’s article

Underlined phrases represent each specific category.

Code Category I: Cultural Context

The writer shows readers various kinds of cultural information about the countries documented by Salgado. The information is not directly represented in Salgado’s works, but it is more general background information about those countries.

I-a: Geographic

I-b: Political

I-c: Economic

Example: Since the beginning of the Industrial Revolution which began in Great Britain at the end of the eighteen century, a great number of
people could have been enjoying many of those privileges include
obtaining and/or consuming certain goods and valuables.

Statistical data shows that the affluent countries consisting of one-fifth of the world's total population consume two-thirds of its resources, of which a significant proportion is wasted.

1-d: Historical

Example: The industrial revolution, or "Industrial Civilization" as it could also be referred, contributed to the overall spread of goods to the general public.

However, up until present, only those few individuals living in highly developed countries have repeated any real benefits from the Industrial revolution, while the vast majority is left unable to obtain any such benefits.

1-e: Values, Attitudes, and Beliefs

1-f: Ethnographic

1-f1 = Ethnicity

1-f2 = Life Style
The writer refers to various kinds of subject matter which are represented in Salgado's works.

**II-a: Geographic**

Example: Mostly Salgado's photographs capture manual labors who have been isolated from industrialization as well as "civilization" for quite some time.

**II-b: Political**

Example: Photo-journalist Sebastiao Salgado has gathered information from the news media from more than twenty five countries where physical labor still dominates the working environment.

Salgado's subject matter consists of actual "workers" working in environments from the desert to the coal mine, all of whom are exposed to dangerous and severe working conditions.

**II-d: Values, Attitudes, and Beliefs**
II-e : Historical

Example: The audience upon viewing such a photograph may be somewhat surprised by the fact that even today some sites still employ certain human wave tactics when mining for gold.

II-f : Ethnographic

II-f1 = Ethnicity

II-f2 = Life Style

Example: Mostly Salgado's photographs capture manual labors who have been isolated from industrialization as well as "civilization" for quite some time.

II-f3 = Technology

Example: The distinguished factor of Salgado's sharp photographic images is the absence of modern machine tools.

In the absence of such precision tools, the workers, like silent busy ants carrying up heavy sacks to the dumping ground's are recognized as tools themselves.
Code Category III: Aesthetic Issues

The writer points out aesthetic issues which are represented in Salgado's works. This category is subjective and does not involve judgment or evaluation.

III-a: Form and Subject Matter

Example: One of Salgado's most shocking pictures portrays the gold mine workers of Serra Pelada, Brazil.

The distinguished factor of Salgado's sharp photographic images is the absence of modern machine tools.

III-b: Book Design and/or Presentation Context

Example: The exhibition titled "WORKERS" consists of over two hundred fifty photographs which reveal the actual economic situations between the developed versus the developing countries of the world.

III-c: Techniques and Medium

Example: Salgado uses black-and-white film to portray and record the sharp images seen in "WORKERS."

Code Category IV: Documentary Issues

The writer points out documentary issues which are represented in Salgado's works. This category is subjective and does not involve judgment or evaluation.
IV-a: Morality
Example: This aesthetic commitment to an emotional, romantic, even spiritual view of the developing world has earned some criticism.

IV-b: Social Benefit
Example: The exhibition titled "WORKERS" consists of over two hundred fifty photographs which reveal the actual economic situations between the developed versus the developing countries of the world.

IV-c: Historical Record
Example: The audience upon viewing such a photograph may be somewhat surprised by the fact that even today some sites still employ certain human wave tactics when mining for gold.

IV-d: Contemporary Issues

Code Category V: Artist
The writer gives the reader information from Salgado's biography and his intent in creating his works.
V-a : Biography

Example: After having obtained his Ph.D., he began his professional career as an economist at the International Coffee Organization located in London.

When he first began his trips to Africa, he was already very much interested in the value of photography not only in terms of its documentary aspects but in its persuasive power as well.

V-b : The artist's Intention

Example: With the Serra Pelada project, Salgado may include in his messages the idea that such manual labor will someday cease to exist in the world.

Salgado employs such effectiveness by depicting certain details of the workers environment in an attempt to make viewers recognize the essence of his intention.

Code Category VI : Comparisons of his works with other selections

The writer compares Salgado's works with literature, other artistic images, non-artistic images, connections to the Western culture, and the writer's personal experiences.
Example: It was Salgado who shot the shocking scene of an oil-plant laborer who had lost consciousness due to an oil well gas leak.

The oil well had been vandalized during the Gulf War and the worker had attempted to put a stop to the leaking gas, which resulted in him being covered by oil.
VII-a : Aesthetics

Example: The images of these thousands of unrecognizable mud soaked men often evoke in viewers inexpressible impressions.

The images of Salgado's sharp photographs show detail which other visual media cannot depict on such a deep level.

VII-b : Moral Inspiration

VII-c : Social Benefit

Code Category VIII : Interpretation

The writer interprets Salgado's works.

Example: A question can be raised as to why he creates such beautifully sharp photography for this project.

The answer may be simply that Salgado recognizes the effectiveness that well regulated tone not only comforts but also satisfies the viewers.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content Area</th>
<th>Appleford</th>
<th>Kolodzey</th>
<th>Raynor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Category I - Cultural Context</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>l-a: Geographic</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>l-b: Political</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>l-c: Economic</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>l-d: Historical</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>l-e: Values, Attitudes, and Beliefs</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>l-f: Ethnographic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- f1: Ethnicity</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- f2: Life Style</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- f3: Technology</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Category II - Subject Matter</strong></td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II-a: Geographic</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II-b: Political</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II-c: Economic</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II-d: Historical</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II-e: Values, Attitudes, and Beliefs</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II-f: Ethnographic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- f1: Ethnicity</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- f2: Life Style</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- f3: Technology</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Category III - Aesthetic Issues</strong></td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III-a: Form and Subject Matter</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III-b: Book Design and Presentation Context</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III-c: Techniques and Medium</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Category IV - Documentary Issues</strong></td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV-a: Morality</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV-b: Social Benefit</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV-c: Historical Record</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV-d: Contemporary Issues</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Category V - Artist</strong></td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V-a: Biography</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V-b: The artist's Intention</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Category VI - Comparisons with</strong></td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI-a: Literature</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI-b: Historical Records</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI-c: Artistic Images</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI-d: Contextual Non-art Connections</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI-e: Connections to Western Culture</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI-f</td>
<td>The Writer's Own Experiences</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI-g</td>
<td>Art Critics' Views</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII-a</td>
<td>Evaluation</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII-b</td>
<td>Aesthetics</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII-c</td>
<td>Moral Inspiration</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII</td>
<td>Social Benefit</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: The data of content analysis of three American art critics' articles
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content Area</th>
<th>Imafuku</th>
<th>Nakamura</th>
<th>Sawamoto</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Category I : Cultural Context</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I-a : Geographic</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I-b : Political</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I-c : Economic</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I-d : Historical</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I-e : Values, Attitudes, and Beliefs</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I-f : Ethnographic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-f1 : Ethnicity</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-f2 : Life Style</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-f3 : Technology</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category II : Subject Matter</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II-a : Geographic</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II-b : Political</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II-c : Economic</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II-d : Historical</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II-e : Values, Attitudes, and Beliefs</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II-f : Ethnographic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-f1 : Ethnicity</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-f2 : Life Style</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-f3 : Technology</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category III : Aesthetic Issues</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III-a : Form and Subject Matter</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III-b : Book Design and Presentation Context</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III-c : Techniques and Medium</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category IV : Documentary Issues</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV-a : Morality</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV-b : Social Benefit</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV-c : Historical Record</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV-d : Contemporary Issues</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category V : Artist</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>83%</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V-a : Biography</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V-b : The artist's Intention</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category VI : Comparisons with</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI-a : Literature</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI-b : Historical Records</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI-c : Artistic Images</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI-d : Contextual Non-art Connections</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI-e : Connections to Western Culture</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category</td>
<td>Aesthetics</td>
<td>Moral Inspiration</td>
<td>Social Benefit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI-f: The Writer's Own Experiences</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI-g: Art Critics' Views</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category VII: Evaluation</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII-a: Aesthetics</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII-b: Moral Inspiration</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII-c: Social Benefit</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category VIII: Interpretation</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: The data of content analysis of three Japanese art critics' articles
3. Synthesis and Comparison of Writings

3 - 1. Analysis of each of the three American art critics' writings

Each of the three American writings about Sebastiao Salgado's latest photography exhibition "Workers" is analyzed. All three writings were published in major newspapers such as The New York Times and The Los Angeles Times. Salgado's photos were being exhibited at the same time as the publication of his book by the same title, "WORKERS." Some articles refer to both Salgado's photography book and his exhibition.

A. Steve Appleford's Article

Steve Appleford's writing appears in The Los Angeles Times, entitled "Images of the Human Landscape." In this article, Appleford spends most of article introducing Sebastiao Salgado (Biography takes up 54% and Artist's Intention 37%). This focus on the artist occupies 90% of the writing. Appleford acknowledges the beauty of Salgado's photography, for example ".....in his Paris loft, surrounded by black-and-white prints, posters and magazines featuring some of his epic, emotionally rich images of beauty and profound suffering" or "Another photograph, of a small, painfully malnourished child being weighed on a scale in Ethiopia is agonizing to see, but somehow poetic in its composition. This aesthetic commitment to an emotional, romantic, even spiritual view of the developing world has earned some criticism" After this sentence, he refers to an art critic's negative views of Salgado's works. Throughout his writing, Appleford portrays all of Sebastiao Salgado, as
photographer, artist, and even photojournalist. He doesn't really evaluate Salgado's works (Evaluation only 2%); however, by describing Salgado himself, he attempts to evaluate Salgado as a great artist. Appleford's approach to criticism in his writing looks more like an art commentary, but his readers could understand what type of photographer Salgado is.

B. Jody Kolodzey's Article

Jody Kolodzey's article, entitled "Workers" appeared in The Christian Science Monitor. Throughout her article, Kolodzey expressed her views that Salgado's photography is fine art. She spends much of her article describing of Salgado's subject matter (51%). Most of her descriptive writings about Salgado's photographs are related to aesthetic issues. There are many examples; for instance, she started her article with "For Sebastiao Salgado, hands are as expressive as faces," and she continued "There are the gloved hands of shipyard workers in Brest, France......" "Hands are one of the recurring themes in "Workers," "The exhibition is being billed as a celebration of manual labor, but it is a lot more than that." She acknowledges journalistic value of his works (devoting about 3% of her article to Documentary issues, 3% to Moral issues, and 8% to social benefit in the Evaluation), but she emphasizes aesthetic value more than others (26% to aesthetic issues, and 10% to aesthetic value in the Evaluation. For instance, she writes "Some of the photographs are candid and journalistic, others are exercises in portraiture, showing the self-conscious pride and vulnerability of the workers." Additionally, she refers to two
well-known artists, Dali and Gauguin to describe Salgado's photography. She discovers some similar thematic components and subject matter in those two artists' paintings which relate to Salgado's work. Most elements in her writing have some relation to aesthetic issues. In order to explain the artist's intention, she quotes Salgado's own comments about his seven-year "WORKERS" project in addition to her own comments. Raynor praises Salgado's efforts, and she also evaluates his ability which can capture "the dusk of manual labor."

C. Vivien Raynor's Article

Raynor's writing was published in The New York Times. The article title is "Photography That Is Immune From the 'Romance' of Labor." She may believe that Salgado's photographs have considerable aesthetic value since she spends 13% of her article evaluating his works and among her evaluating comments, the aesthetic aspects take up to 7%. Overall, 57% is used for describing Salgado's subject matter in which she attempts to seek aesthetic value in his photography. The following sentences are typical examples: "There is also beauty bordering on the picturesque, as in the well-known scenes of Texans cleaning up the oil disaster in Kuwait - an omen of "fire next time" if ever there was one." "...."the scene of Cuban cane cutters resting, looks like a movie still." She also refers to other artistic images like "More than anything -else, the prints have the look of early 19th-century French Realist painting - there is even a 'Carmen' making Cuban cigars - and it may be this that prompts criticism from younger, less successful photographers." (Artistic Images make-up 3% of her
Comparison section) Like those sentences, most of her article focuses on the aesthetic value of Salgado's photography. She concludes her writing with this sentence "Though many of the photographs are ostensibly nothing but beauty--the view of razor-sharp peaks on the island of Reunion, for example - this exhibition is guaranteed to leave its beholders as alarmed for the globe as for its insatiable inhabitants."

3 - 2. Analysis of three American art critics' writings

In this section, the three American art critics' writings are compared and analyzed. To do this, this study uses the four prepared questions, which are explained in the previous section 2 - 1.

Q1: What is the main focus of each of the writings: the artist, the art works, the social context, or the use of techniques?

Answer: Among the three American critics, Appleford's approach is very different from the other two critics. Appleford spends a total of 90% on the introduction of Salgado, while Kolodzey and Raynor spend more than 50% describing Salgado's photography. Kolodzey writes of the beauty of Salgado's photography throughout her article. She spends 26% of her article describing aesthetic issues of Salgado's photography and 10% evaluating aesthetic values. Raynor's approach is similar to Kolodzey. Raynor spends 23% of her article describing aesthetic issues and she
also refers to Salgado’s use of techniques. Appleford mainly focuses on Salgado himself; Kolodzey focuses on Salgado’s expressiveness; and Raynor focuses on two aspects of Salgado’s photography as art and documentary.

Question 2: Is the writer more intent upon evaluating the works or describing the works?

Answer: In Kolodzey and Raynor’s articles, "Description" occupies about 50% of the writings. By describing Salgado’s subject matter, Kolodzey attempts to describe the beauty of Salgado’s photography and Raynor portrays Salgado as an extraordinary photographer with artistic expressiveness and a strong social message. Kolodzey spends 51% on description and Raynor 57%. On the other hand, in Appleford’s article, the "Description" part does not occupy much space. Appleford describes Salgado himself more than his photography. Description of Salgado’s subject matter is just a complement to portray the artist (13% in his whole article).

Two of the writers, Kolodzey and Raynor, spend 13% and 29% respectively on evaluation; Appleford spends only 2%. Kolodzey evaluates the aesthetic value of Salgado’s photography (10%) more than the documentary (3%). She also refers to social benefit (8% in the Evaluation category). By evaluating the social benefit of Salgado’s
works, Kolodzey distinguishes his works from other documentary photographer’s works. She indicates that Salgado’s works include historical, cultural, and aesthetic value. She says that those valuable aspects can help viewers understand contemporary social issues.

Question 3: How does the writer characterize Salgado’s works, as aesthetic objects or documentary objects?

Answer: Among the three critics, Kolodzey apparently considers Salgado’s photographs to be fine art (Aesthetic 26% vs Documentary 3%). From the beginning to the end, she evaluates Salgado’s expressiveness. She doesn’t reject him as a documentary photographer and acknowledges his works as an important historical record, but she emphasizes aesthetic value more than others (in Evaluation Section, Aesthetic 10% vs Moral 3%).

Raynor also considers Salgado’s works to include great aesthetic value. But her statement is not as clear as Kolodzey’s. Raynor spends 57% of her article describing Salgado’s subject matter. Her descriptions proclaim Salgado’s keen expressive ability. She is very careful not to categorize Salgado as an artist or documentary photographer. On the one hand she appreciates the beauty of Salgado’s photography and admires his courage in taking photography in dangerous areas; on the other hand she raises a moral issue of whether
Salgado's approaches to his subject are intentional or unintentional. Probably she believes that documentary photography should not be intentional. But on the whole, her statement is positive about Salgado.

Appleford's writing differs from the other two writers. His focusing point is Salgado himself. Most his writing is spent introducing the artist (90%). Appleford portrays Salgado as a great photographer in terms of both art and documentary. Throughout his writing, he explores all aspects of Salgado, including the artist's appearance, and stimulates the reader's curiosity about this extraordinary photographer.

3 - 3. Analysis of each of the three Japanese art critics' writings

Each of the three Japanese writings about Sebastiao Salgado's "Workers" is analyzed. All three writings are published in major daily newspapers and art magazines such as Asahi Shinbun and Asahi Camera.

A. Ryuta Imafuku's Article

Ryuta Imafuku's article appears in Asahi Camera, which is one of the leading camera magazines in Japan. Imafuku is a professor of archeology at the Chukyo University, and although he is known as a photography critic to the public, he insists that his profession is archeology. With his knowledge background, Imafuku appreciates Salgado's works as a source of cultural study. Imafuku devotes 36% of his article to explanations of the current economic situation in the Third World, which is one of the core themes of Salgado's
"WORKERS." Imafuku does not refer much to Salgado's specific photographs. But provoked by Salgado's photography, Imafuku explains the culture of the third world in general, like "For instance, several years ago, cacao producers from the northeastern side of Brazil were forced to give up harvesting cacao beans due to a drop in the world price, which in turn resulted in the decay of cacao beans." Salgado documented Brazilian cacao peasants, but his photography showed nothing about their facing the problem of falling cacao bean prices. Throughout Imafuku's article, he tends to promote information about the real situation of the third world, which is actually an unfamiliar field to ordinary Japanese. Imafuku does not seem very interested in Salgado himself, because he does not refer to Salgado's background. On the other hand, Imafuku does evaluate the aesthetic value of Salgado's works (3% of the article), but emphasizes much more the social situations which surround the people who are documented by Salgado.

B. Hiromi Nakamura's Article

Hiromi Nakamura's article appears in Commercial Photo magazine. Nakamura spends most of the article on the introduction of Salgado's biography (70%). She focuses more on Salgado than on Salgado's photography. Nakamura appreciates Salgado's works which inform people about the real story of people doing manual labor and the current economic crisis in the Third World. So, she emphasizes the great social benefit and moral inspiration (total 13% of her article) of his works. She comments, "Salgado's visual world is
consistent: he sticks to 'the record' of the real world. Salgado’s works evoke emotions in his viewers leaving them with strong impressions by .” and “Finally, the audience can find words which represent Salgado’s philosophy through his photography.” Instead of writing much about Salgado’s photography, Nakamura emphasizes Salgado as a human being.

C. Tokumi Sawamoto’s Article

Tokumi Sawamoto’s article appears in Asahi Shinbun, one of the most popular daily newspapers in Japan. Sawamoto spends 41% of his article introducing Salgado, and also adds observations about Salgado’s subject matter, e.g. “Mostly, Salgado’s photographs capture manual laborers who have been isolated from industrialization as well as ‘civilization’ for quite some time,” and “The distinguishing factor of Salgado’s sharp photographic images is the absence of modern machine tools.” Sawamoto spends 27% of his article referring to Salgado’s photography, and he focuses three times more on aesthetic issues than on documentary issues. He introduces Salgado to his reader with Salgado’s most well-known news photography, taken at the Persian Gulf during the Gulf War. Sawamoto’s focus is more widely distributed among the categories about Salgado’s photography.
3 - 4. Analysis of the three Japanese art critics' writings

In this section, the three Japanese art critics' writings are compared and analyzed. To do this, this study uses the four prepared questions, which are explained in the previous section 2 - 1.

**Question 1 : What is the main focus of the writing: the artist, the art works, the social context, or the use of techniques?**

**Answer :** There are enormous differences between these Japanese critics' points of view. For example, while Imafuku spends a total of 70% on the explanations of cultural background of Sebastiao Salgado's photography, Nakamura spends 83% on the introduction of Salgado himself. Imafuku focuses less on Salgado as photographer, and Nakamura focuses less on the contents and the related cultural issues of Salgado's photography. These two critics' points of view are quite different. On the other hand, Sawamoto refers to both Salgado's photography and Salgado himself. The balance of these aspects is almost equal in Sawamoto's writing.

**Question 2 : Is the writer more intent upon evaluating the works or describing the works?**

**Answer :** Among the three Japanese art critics, Nakamura spends a larger percent of her article evaluating Salgado's works than the other
two do. Nakamura emphasizes the social benefit of Salgado’s works. For example, she appreciates how much Salgado’s photography has power to make people’s eyes turn to the workers doing manual labor. Her evaluation takes up 13% of her article. Imafuku and Sawamoto, on the other hand, refer to the aesthetic value of Salgado’s works with only one or two sentences in their writings. These two critics spend more of their articles describing Salgado’s photography and explaining the cultures which exist behind Salgado’s works.

Question 3: How does the writer characterize Salgado’s works, as aesthetic objects or documentary objects?

Answer: The three Japanese art critics do not categorize clearly Salgado’s photography into art or documentary photography. All three critics appreciate the characteristics of Salgado’s visual world and they comment that his photography would move the viewers’ emotion, but they avoid any direct comment as to which aspects --aesthetic or documentary-- of Salgado’s photography do so. All three Japanese critics appreciate the beauty of Salgado’s photography, which gives strong visual impressions to his viewers, and also the social value of his photography, which can tell his viewers about the existence of manual laborers, especially in the Third World.
3-5. Synthesis and Comparison of American and Japanese art critics’ writings

Based on the previous discussions about each of the American and Japanese art critics’ writings, in this section, this study summarizes the similarities and differences between the two countries’ art critics’ approaches.

1. Among the three American art critics; Appleford, Kolodzey, and Raynor, Appleford’s main focus regarding Salgado’s works is totally different from the other two. While Kolodzey and Raynor spend more than half of their articles describing Salgado’s photography, Appleford spends 90% of his writing introducing the artist and the artist’s intentions. When looking in detail, we also find that Raynor’s and Kolodzey’s point of view are different, too. Kolodzey tries to portray the aesthetic beauty of Salgado’s photography in her descriptive writings. Raynor raises issues of the importance of aesthetic value in documentary photography. Appleford also mentions the aesthetic value in documentary photography in one sentence, but he does not expand this discussion in more depth. In terms of evaluation, Appleford writes very little at all, although his comment: “…..emotionally rich images of beauty and profound suffering” shows Appleford’s positive views of Salgado’s works. Both Kolodzey and Raynor more directly express their positive evaluation, especially of the beauty of Salgado’s photography, in their articles.

At this point, it is difficult to find a very salient tendency of all three American art critics’ writings, even though all the three have positive views of Salgado’s works.
2. There is a similar phenomenon among the articles of the three Japanese art critics, Imafuku, Nakamura, and Sawamoto. Nakamura’s main focus regarding Salgado’s works is totally different from the other two. The same as Appleford, Nakamura spends 83% of her writing introducing the artist and the artist’s intentions. Basically all of the three are very positive to Salgado’s works, but while Imafuku, an archeologist, explains the cultural subjects which exist behind Salgado’s photography, Sawamoto, an instructor of photography aesthetics, refers to not only the cultural subject of Salgado’s works, but also to his use of techniques and medium, and then furthermore introduces Salgado himself. In this comparison, it is also difficult to find a very salient tendency of all three Japanese art critics’ writings.

3. All three American critics compare Salgado’s photography with artistic images such as paintings, but none of the Japanese do. Only Sawamoto refers to Salgado’s other photography in another project, and it is not really a comparison with the other subject.

4. Even though the volume is different, both American and Japanese art critics write about more aesthetic issues than documentary issues, except for Japanese art critic Nakamura. All of the three American critics basically view Salgado’s photography as art. Kolodzey emphasizes the beauty of Salgado’s photography in both her description and evaluation. She devotes about seven times more of her article to aesthetic issues than to documentary issues. Raynor
also writes more about aesthetic issues than documentary issues, but she acknowledges the social benefit of Salgado’s photography as photojournalism, too. Throughout her article, Raynor often points out Salgado’s artistic approaches to his subject matter and the conflict between documentary and artistic expressions. Raynor considers that, because of the beauty, Salgado’s photography is more art than journalism. While these two American art critics clearly express their idea that Salgado’s photography is art, the other American art critic, Appleford, does not clearly categorize Salgado’s photography as either art or documentary. The data shows that Appleford spends 2% more of his article on aesthetic issues than on documentary issues, but his comments “emotionally rich images of beauty and profound suffering” strongly suggests that he views Salgado’s photography as art.

Imafuku and Sawamoto write more about aesthetic issues than documentary issues, and they also evaluate the aesthetic content of Salgado’s photography, but their writings not explicit like Kolodzey’s and Raynor’s. Their writings on both aesthetic issues and evaluation are very subtle.

On the other hand, Nakamura writes more on documentary issues than aesthetic issues, and discusses more the social benefit of Salgado’s photography than the aesthetic value of his works. Throughout her writing, Nakamura emphasizes the great world photojournalist Salgado.

5. Kolodzey and Raynor both evaluate the aesthetic value of Salgado’s works, and there is a consistency between their descriptions of Salgado’s
photography and their evaluation standpoint regarding aesthetics. On the other hand, although Imafuku and Sawamoto refer more to aesthetic issues than documentary issues, they do little actual evaluation of the aesthetic content of Salgado’s. As reviewed in the literature (Chapter II), Japanese tend to avoid direct evaluation in writings and conversation. The two Japanese art critics’ writings support this tendency.

6. Contrary to what this study had originally hypothesized, the American critics do very little interpretation of Salgado’s works, but the Japanese art critics provide a fair amount. This study originally had totally opposite assumptions about interpretations. It was expected that, while American critics would interpret art works and express their own ideas clearly, Japanese critics would less interpret the works and write more about the artist’s own comments.

7. Regarding cultural context, both Imafuku and Sawamoto write more about the current economic situation of the Third World than about other issues. On the other hand, Kolodzey and Raynor refer to the technical changes in the Third World.

8. Except for Nakamura, the other five critics refer to technology issues which are represented in Salgado’s photography. They detect in Salgado’s photography that he tries to capture the transformation of the world with improvement of technology.
9. All three American art critics and Nakamura describe Salgado's intentions in his project. Their comments are not their interpretations. Some of them actually interviewed Salgado (Appleford, Kolodzey, and Nakamura), and Raynor quotes Salgado's comments from his book "WORKERS."
CHAPTER IV

SUMMARY, CONCLUSION, AND REFLECTIONS

1. Goals of the Study

The purpose of this study was to examine the nature of Japanese contemporary art criticism in its cultural context and clarify the differences of its methods and styles from those of American art criticism. The primary question of this study arises from one American art critic's view of Japanese art criticism. Janet Koplos evaluates that Japanese art criticism is not real art criticism, but merely art commentary (Koplos, 1989). As a former photography magazine editor and writer, I personally disagree with Koplos, because her comments on Japanese art criticism seem to lack cultural perspectives. Since Japanese art criticism is written in the Japanese language, for a Japanese audience, and is written by Japanese professional art critics, who publish in the Japanese media; to examine Japanese art criticism, it is necessary to refer to Japanese language, society, education, and journalism. The above mentioned in "cultural context" means these cultural aspects.

This study, also compared both Japanese and American art critical sample writings by using a content analysis method and found differences as well as similarities in their styles of art critical writings. Through the data
analysis, this study always referred to the cultural background of those writings, for example, the art critics' professional and educational backgrounds, and the character of the media which published those writings.

Throughout this study, I tried to find a way to help non-Japanese readers understand the characteristics of Japanese art criticism and to confirm that Japanese art critical writings is type of learning material that can help a non-native understand Japanese culture as well as the Japanese art world.

2. Summary and Conclusion of the study

By studying the cultural backgrounds of Japanese art criticism through various components such as language and social systems, this study finds that Japanese people have a certain preference to avoid direct and negative evaluation when criticizing art works and literature. This tendency can be seen in art columns and book reviews in daily newspapers, magazines, and even in TV programs. Hence, most Japanese understand critical writing as a lineup of facts with little interpretation and evaluation by the writers and/or speakers. Many Japanese art critics, including art journalists, are afraid to give "wrong" information to the readers by interpreting and evaluating works of art from their own view. These art critics see and understand art work in specific ways, but such critics' own views are often different from the views of the artists themselves. So, "wrong" sometimes means different from that of the artist, and from the artist's standpoint, the information is "wrong." Even though art critics do not have intentions to attack artists themselves by interpreting and evaluating
their art works, the artists and also the readers can sense the critics' negative attitudes toward or views of the artists through the negative comments on the art works. It is not easy for artists and readers to distinguish between comments on art work and comments on the artist. This vagueness is a well recognized component of Japanese culture. This study found similar discussions about this tendency in the fields of literature, sociology, and archeology, done by non-Japanese scholars, and many of them claimed that this vagueness is one of the typical characteristics of Japanese culture and can cause miscommunication between Japanese and non-Japanese people (Kohmoto, 1989; Nanjo, 1989, et al.).

This tendency strongly affects the direction of Japanese art journalism. In such circumstances, the editors and publishers must be careful about publishing articles which contain any negative comments. They want to avoid conflicts between the artist and the art critic and also between the artist and the publishers. Therefore, most articles published in newspapers and magazines are likely to be positive or neutral toward art works as well as toward artists. In other words, if an article contains some negative comment and the comment seems to cause a conflict between the artist and the writer, the editor may ask the writer to change the content or the editor may decide not to publish the article.

This study supported this phenomena through the content analysis of three Japanese art critics' articles, published in major newspapers or magazines. None of the three writings contain negative views. Giving
information to the readers about the artist and the art works as well as related subjects is the main focus of the three writers. From their articles, it is almost impossible to imagine any conflicts between the artists and the writers. The three writings were typical critical writings published in Japanese newspapers and magazines. This study also found a number of differences (described in Chapter 3) between the three articles, like Imafuku refereed to various cultural issues, documented by Salgado while Nakamura mostly wrote about Salgado himself. Hence, this study cannot find any explicit characteristics representative of Japanese art criticism. In the beginning, I assumed that this study would find typical characteristics of Japanese art critical writings such as descriptions and introductions of artist, and little interpretation and evaluation. But such assumptions were unfounded. Obviously, evaluation and interpretation are more important aspects of the writings of those three Japanese critics than I had suspected.

I also assumed that American art critical writings would contain more interpretations and evaluations, and less descriptions and introduction of artist. These assumptions came from the American art critic Janet Koplos’ comments on Japanese art criticism. Koplos (1989) reviewed Japanese art critical writings and criticized them as art commentary. She claimed Japanese art criticism should not be categorized as art criticism. From an American professional art critic’s viewpoint, she is not be able to accept the fact that Japanese art criticism is called art criticism. This study also examined three American art critics’
writings in order to find distinguishing differences between American art criticism and Japanese art criticism.

The result was that this study could not find evidence of this assumption among the three American critical writings, either. This study cannot find any typical tendency in the three American art critical writings. Two of the American critics wrote on many aesthetic issues including descriptions of photography while the other American art critic spent most of the article on an introduction of the artist. The three writings were published in major American newspapers and the three art critics have been working as professional art critics for years. Their articles have been published in other major daily newspapers and art magazines, as well.

Moreover this study found similarities between American and Japanese art critics' writings, for example, both Nakamura and Appleford focused more on the artist than the photography, and Sawamoto and Raynor wrote more an aesthetic issues than documentary issues. This further demonstrates that both Japanese and American art critical writings have important similar characteristics, and this in turn refutes Koplos' erroneous overgeneralization.

Concerning the background of the six art critics, this study interviewed five of the six. Raynor and Nakamura have fine art backgrounds and are now working as professional art critics. Sawamoto studied photography, aesthetics, and art history and is now on the faculty of an art department in a Japanese university teaching photography aesthetics while also working as an art critic. Imafuku is also a professor of a university and teaching archeology. His
specialty is not photography and criticism, but he reviews photography with an archeological point of view and is recognized as a professional photography critic in Japan. Finally, Appleford studied English and journalism and he considers himself as more art journalist than art critic.

The relationship between the six art critics and their media also vary. All three American art critics’ articles and Sawamoto’s writing were published in major newspapers, and Imafuku’s and Nakamura’s articles were published in photography magazines. All six art critics contracted with their media as “freelance” and none of them belonged to specific papers or magazines.

By interpreting all data outcomes, this study states that the analyzed data indicates neither typical tendencies of American art critical writing styles nor of Japanese art critical writing styles. The assumptions which this study previously made were not founded either. Instead of those assumptions, the data shows the following two things: each art critic’s preferred style had more influence on their writing styles, and none of the six critics made negative judgments.

Hence, inductively this study concludes that summarizing and judging Japanese art criticism as criticism or not criticism in itself by examining limited numbers of sample writings does not make sense. Koplos’ comment on Japanese art criticism lacks information about the frame of reference of Japanese art critical writings, so this study cannot support the discussion point projected by Koplos. Admittedly, this study did not investigate how many Japanese art critical writings Koplos reviewed, what kind of analysis methods she used, or how she reached her conclusion that Japanese art criticism is not
criticism. But, if Koplos reviewed only some Japanese art critics' articles and jumped to her conclusion without references to the cultural background of Japanese art criticism as well as to the art critics' intentions, and she published her idea in one of the well-known art magazines in America, this study hopes that her idea has not been adopted as a stereotype of Japanese art criticism.

Through this study, it can be said, depending on the readers' preferences, the publishers' and editors' preferences, and the writers' own preferences, the contents and directions of writings are determined. To criticize Japanese art criticism, it is important to study why those preferences have been made. And there are many cultural factors which affect those preferences. Therefore examining art criticism in its cultural context is a useful study.

3. Recommendations

The following recommendations are made based on selections from the literature review and findings from the six art critics' articles.

I. Art criticism is a part of cultural activity and its nature is influenced by various cultural aspects like language, social system, education, and so on. Criticizing a type of art criticism different from that of one's own culture without any cultural concerns is ethnocentric. Cultural comparative perspectives are necessary factors of cross-cultural metacriticism. Therefore they should be included in any such observations or analysis.

II. Professional art critics, who work for mass media find it difficult to be very independent from the publishers' and editors' preferences. They must also
consider the expectations of the readers. On the other hand, as professionals, they have to have certain specific knowledge and techniques to write about art. In this sense, when examining published art critical writings, it is important to research the characteristics of the papers and magazines as well as the art critics' professional backgrounds in order to understand the contents in depth.

III. Art critical writings can be considered a good resource for cultural comparative study not only in the field of art education, but also in humanities studies. Art critical writings reflect a certain culture's characteristic ways of seeing and thinking about a given artifact or activity.

4. Questions for further study

In addition to the above recommendations, a number of unanswered questions arise from this study.

I. This study used a qualitative content analysis method to examine six art critical writings. If it had used a different research method, for instance, quantitative content analysis, would different research outcomes have been brought out?

II. This study used art critical writings, which are writings about photography. If the subject were not photography but another type of art such as painting, music, or performing arts, would research outcomes have been different from those in this study?

III. This study selected sample articles from America and Japan, which write about neither American nor Japanese artists' works. If for example,
Japanese art critics had written about Japanese or American artists, would their critical approaches have been different?

IV. This study referred to certain Japanese cultural subjects, such as Japanese journalism, language, and education which exist behind Japanese art criticism. There may be other significant cultural subjects which can be used to examine Japanese art criticism. What other kinds of subjects could be added to the study?

V. This study used six sample writings. If scholar will conduct similar research by using a large number of samples, would research outcomes have been different from those in this study?
REFERENCES


APPENDIX

TRANSLATIONS OF JAPANESE ARTICLES FOR CHAPTER III

1. Tokumi Sawamoto's article

This article was published in ASAHI SHINBUN, a Japanese paper evening issue, May 26, 1994

Salgado's penetrating eye for the manual labor - Sebastiao Salgado Photo Exhibition "WORKERS"

Since the Industrial Revolution at the end of 18th century, originated from the Great Britain, numbers of people could have held privileges to obtain consumption goods and valuables which used to be kept by only the limited upper level class. The industrial revolution, or it might be said as industrial civilization contributed to spread consumption goods in the general public.

However, the benefit has been only enjoyed by people who live in highly-developed countries by now. The numbers are few. Most of the rest still are not able to get such privileges. Statistical data shows that with only one-fifth of the world's population, the rich countries consume two-thirds of its resources, of which a large proportion is wasted.

Photo-journalist Sebastiao Salgado gathered news sources from more than twenty five countries in which physical labor still dominates in the working environment. With his big concern for physical workers, most of whom are working in developing countries, Salgado portrayed them and has exhibited his
works in many countries. The exhibition, titled "WORKERS" consists of over two hundred fifty photographs and shows the real situation of economic power-relationships in the world to the viewers.

Many viewers might recall his name, Salgado, with his recent works at the gulf. He shoot the shocking scene that oil-plant worker lost his conscious by erupted gas from an oil well. The oil well was vandalized during the gulf war and the worker attempted to stop the leaking gas, being covered by oil cake.

Salgado is born in Brazil in 1944. He studied economics at university in Brazil and the U.S. Then he worked at the Ministry of Finance in Brazil and later he pursued his Ph.D. degree at University of Paris. After he got the degree, he started his professional career as economist at the International Coffee Organization in London. While working there, he traveled to African countries several times to research and train coffee farms. He became interested in the social problems (political, economic, etc.) in those countries.

In 1973, Salgado investigated into the famine in Africa and on the condition of migrant workers in Europe. When he went to Africa, he had already been interested in the value of photography in terms of the documentary and the persuasive power. Since then Salgado has worked as freelance documentary photographer, based on Paris. In 1984, he was elected as full member of MAGNUM, which is well-known international photojournalist agency, also in 1983 he received the Eugene Smith Award in Humanistic Photography. He received numbers of other photographic awards of international level and his name has become famous.
Among his two hundred fifty photographs, Salgado precisely depicts workers who are working in industrialized, so-called developed countries, but these are just a small part of his project. Mostly Salgado captures physical workers who has been isolated from industrialization and civilization for long time. Salgado's subject matter is the real "workers," working in desert, coal, and oil rocks, all of whom are exposed to the dangerous and severe working conditions.

One of the most shocking pictures of Salgado's works is the one which portrays the gold mine workers at Serra Pelada in Brazil. In this picture, Salgado captures numbers of mud men who are unrecognizable each other, carrying up the soil by using slippery slopes and wooden ladders to reach the top from the mine bottom. The viewers might be surprised the truth that until now some sites still use a human wave tactics when mining for gold.

The distinguished thing that within Salgado's sharp picture, viewers cannot find any kinds of modern machine tools. Without any precision tools, only the tool is their bodies, the workers carrying up heavy sack from the plot to the dumping ground on top silently look like a busy ant. The figures of thousands of unrecognized mud-soaked men could give viewers inexpressible impressions.

Salgado himself calls these photographs and the following project, taken in Serra Pelada as "the last days of manual labor." With this project, Salgado might include his message that such manual labor will disappear in the world.
Salgado captures, portrays and records "workers" within sharp black-and-white photographic images. Here one question raises "Why does he create such beautifully sharp photography for this project?"

The beautiful photography with well-regulated tone makes viewers comfortable and satisfy. Salgado might know such effectiveness.

He fully uses the effectiveness by depicting details of the real things of workers' environment and attempts to make viewers recognize the essence of his intention. Salgado's sharp still photographs show details of the contents which other visual media cannot depict such deeply level.

2. Ryuta Imafuku's article

This article was published in Asahi Camera, a Japanese photo magazine, May issue 1994

For Sebastiao Salgado Photo Exhibition "WORKERS"

Here is the place in which hands could touch the most basic materials, such as soil, minerals, leaves, flutes, animals, timber, fiber, clay, glass, concrete, steel, and so on. Naked hands directly touch such various kinds of materials. Within the physical relationships between the materials and human body, the original scene of human act which is described as "manual labor" shows up.

The hands, also can expand and strain the physical function by themselves with many kinds of tools, a scythe, sickle, net, rod, rudder, anchor, knife, drill, hammer, pickle, loom, sewing machine, iron pipe, handle, wheel, etc. When the dirty, agnailed hands hold such standard tools, the tools become
obtaining dynamic beauty and sometimes having organic-like power. And the tools might be distinguished from a merely tool as a farm implement and precision tool. By coming closely to the workers' body, the tools seem to be the best partner of the workers' hands which suffer from hard work and loneliness.

The visual world of Sebastiao Salgado's "WORKERS" shows the most primitive human productive act, only caused by the hands which contact the external world. Salgado captures the act with his veneration. As we have already known, those big manual labor fields deeply connect to the world market system. One of the distortions of the economic system now is that among the world population, only one-fifth people can afford to consume produces and products, but the rest of four-fifth people cannot afford, even though they are producers. So-called greatly advanced countries monopolize resources and wealth which come from the place where so-called poor people live. Hence, in the manual labor fields which are documented by Salgado, the colonialism have deeply damaged to people's lives. This is the truth that the third world such as Caribbean, South American, African countries cultivate and produce sugarcane, tea, coffee, cotton, cacao, etc. and directly sent these produces to the markets in developed countries, in which nobody turn out these produces only one ounce. The developed countries markets determine the price of the produces. In this sense, the third world just obey the world market mechanism and sometimes are treated as slave. From labor fees to the market price, everything should be subordinate somewhat whimsical market theory which is controlled by only advanced countries.
For instance, several years ago, cacao producers at northeast side of Brazil gave up harvesting cacao beans because of big drop of the world cacao price. The producers made cacao beans decay on the trees. This tragedy threatened their daily lives but they barely survived with mango and dorian which were planted in order to give shade for cacao trees. On the other hand, the market price of chocolate have not gone down and every year cacao beans are consumed as chocolate in Swiss, France, America, and other countries. The consumption is ten times as much as the volume in Brazil.

There is another example: tuna fishing at Sicily in Italy. A few Sicilian fishermen who inherit the traditional medieval style fishing are still working in a few part of the Mediterranean sea. The limited numbers of tuna fishes, which have been recklessly fished with high-tech modern fishing method by using a helicopter and detector are also fished by Sicilian fishermen who use fish net with their mastership. Even though they can catch tuna, when they back to the sea port, Japanese marine product company wait them and the company staff members immediately take tuna fishes to pieces with electric knife. Then the pieces are shipped to Japan by air. Sicilian only can get the viscera, head, and tail, all of which have no values.

There is always ill-balanced economic system in manual labor fields. Salgado’s pictures are sustained by his passion and sympathy for manual labor. also by his anger to the dominant market system. Although the ill-balanced economic system is hidden by labor mechanism, Salgado painstakingly unveils it with his scientific documentary approach. At the same
time, Salgado shows his reverence for the manual labor which become diminishing in contemporary world. Salgado's approach to the subject seems to be not only scientific but also religious. For Salgado, when a gleam penetrates in the dark and shows a stalk with volumes of smoke at the iron and steel factory in Brazil and Ukraine, the scenery becomes a holy place.

Salgado captures the scene when workers' sacred hands encounter and touch the real "naked" external world. Even though the manual labors are involved in the recent market theory and concealed, we should not ignore a moment when the world is changed beautifully by the hands. Here, the naked hands criticize abstract scientific beliefs. Salgado may believe the power of the hands which could change the world order, so he makes himself convince the fact by documenting manual labor fields.

3. Hiromi Nakamura's article
This article was published in Commercial Photo, a Japanese photo magazine, July issue 1994

Sebastiao Salgado Photo Exhibition "WORKERS"

Sebastiao Salgado, one of the members of the internationally well-known photo agency "MAGNUM," and a photographer who has taken distinguished and progressive documentary photography. His name itself, and photography have been widely known in Japan since his solo exhibition at the National Contemporary Art Museum several years ago.
Salgado was born in 1944 in a tiny Brazilian village isolated due to the rainy season. Unlike other photographers, Salgado had a unique background in education and the working field while pursuing his career as a photographer. During his youth, he was a student protester in military controlled Brazil. Salgado strongly believed that the Resistance could change the world order and keep justice; however, his beliefs conflicted with the government. Hence, he lived in exile in Paris, France. After, sometime, he began his career as an economic projects as an economist, Salgado recognized the difficult and tragic situations which existed in the world, he then gradually become interested in the work of journalists.

It was during 1973 that Salgado began his life as a freelance photographer. His first recognized work is the reportage of famine in Sahel, Africa. Later, he published a collection of his work, entitled Sahel. While working for such world news agencies as SIGMA and GANMA, he traveled to many countries documenting the situation the world is in based on humanistic understanding.

In 1982, he received the Eugene Smith Award, an award for the most distinguished humanistic photographer and his work. After becoming an official member of MAGNUM, he began to document more actively those events which address both his humanism and humanitarianism winning him a number of awards. One of his larger projects, Other Americas, published in 1986, which documented the lives of farmers in Latin American Countries for a couple of
years, is widely acclaimed for its documentary and aesthetic quality in not only the field of photography but the art world in general.

"I want to neither criticize the world politically, nor to satisfy my own artistic demands. I wish only to see and learn many things." Following this discipline, the theme Salgado finds for his next project is "WORKERS." The most impressive aspect of this project is Salgado's honest, serious approach to his subject, the workers, who devote all of their time to tough manual labor, never giving up their lives or hopes for the future. Salgado has a humanistic eye for those workers which fills with his sympathy and humanism.

From the beginning record of his work, Salgado evokes emotions in his viewers leaving with strong impressions. Finally, the audience can find words which represents Salgado's philosophy through his photography. From Salgado to the Audience, the communication process is bolstered by Salgado's strong ideal, therefore, the process appears dramatic.