THE DRAMATIC FUNCTION OF POETIC AND MUSICAL FORMS IN A SAVOY OPERA Prototype

VOLUME I

DISSERTATION

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree Doctor of Philosophy in the Graduate School of the Ohio State University

By

Jaropolk Lassowsky, B.M., M.A.

************

The Ohio State University

1981

Reading Committee:

Dr. William Poland

Dr. Gregory Proctor

Dr. A. Peter Costanza

Approved By

William Poland

Adviser

Department of Music
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to express my sincerest and deepest gratitude to Dr. William Poland, whose profound erudition, brilliant analytical observation, and unfailing personal kindness puts me in his debt forever.

Likewise, I would like to thank Professor Donald R. Glancy, whose artistry as a theatre director is as inspiring as his superb scholarship is enlightening.

I also acknowledge with great pleasure the encouragement and guidance given to me by Dr. Norman Phelps.
VITA

October 17, 1941 . . . Born - Lwiw, Ukraine


1972-1976 . . . . Teaching Associate, School of Music, The Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio

1977 and currently . . Assistant Professor of Music, The Clarion State College, Clarion, Pennsylvania

FIELDS OF STUDY

Major Field: Theory of Music

Studies in Advanced Analysis. Professor William Poland

Research Project in Opera Orchestration. Professor Norman Phelps

Studies in Classical Theories of Theatre Criticism; Studies in Comparative Melodrama. Professor Donald R. Glancy

iii
TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.............................................. ii
VITA.......................................................... iii
LIST OF FIGURES............................................. vi
GLOSSARY...................................................... xiii
INTRODUCTION.................................................. 1

Chapter

I. GENERAL BACKGROUND................................. 13
   Some Generic Considerations....................... 13
   The Composer and the Librettist................. 37

II. BEFORE THE CURTAIN............................... 50
   The libretto: Sources, Plot, and Characters..... 50
   The Overture........................................... 63

III. No. 1: INTRODUCTION AND OPENING CHORUS..... 92
   The Introduction; Structural Redundance Turned to Functional Advantage...... 92
   Characterization; the Shanty and the Dibrach... 131

IV. No. 2: RECITATIVO AND ARIA; THE JOLLY PEDDLER... 146

V. Nos. 2a, 3, and 3a: RECITATIVO AND SCENA; THE OPPRESSED HERO..... 171
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>VI. No. 4: RECITATIVO AND CHORUS</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAPTAIN AND CREW</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII. Nos. 4a, 5: RECITATIVO, BALLAD, DIALOGUE;</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE EXPOSITION COMPLETED</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII. Nos. 6, 7: BARCAROLLE AND QUODLIBET;</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LADIES AND SAILORS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Quodlibet: Spectacle Enhancement and</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>an Indication of Stylistic Heritage</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX. THE COMPLICATING ELEMENT AT WORK</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nos. 8, 9: An Ostinato Answer to a</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ceremonious Greeting</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 10: Glee and Hornpipe; Flattery and Pre-Jingoistic Fervor</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 11: Duet; Emboldened Gullibility and Feigned Hauteur</td>
<td>345</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X. No. 12: FINALE OF ACT I</td>
<td>365</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Josephine's Revelation, Ralph's discovery, Reversal of the Lovers'</td>
<td>365</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fortunes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quartet: Rejoicing for Soprano, Alto, and Tenor, Disgruntled Foreboding</td>
<td>406</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in Bass</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scheming in Hockets, Reassurance in Patter, Menace in Recitativo</td>
<td>432</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quadrille: Disarming a Potential and Premature Apotheosis through</td>
<td>447</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deliberate Privolity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elements of Shape in the Largest Dimension of the Finale I: Linear</td>
<td>486</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scope in Music as a Function of Dramatic Magnitude</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF FIGURES

All figures refer to numbers from Gilbert and Sullivan's *HMS Pinafore*.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>&quot;Allegro, Andante,&quot; <em>Overture</em>, mm. 1-71.</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>&quot;Allegro Vivace, Exposition,&quot; <em>Ovt.</em>, mm. 71-131.</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td><em>Overture</em>, Fabric and Texture Outline.</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Act I, No. 1, <em>Introduction</em>, mm. 1-63.</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Act I, No. 1, <em>Opening Chorus</em>, mm. 63-110</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Act I, No. 1, Phrase/Measure Patterns.</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Act I, No. 1, Form-of Outline, RVC pattern in half-phrases</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Act I, No. 3a, <em>Ballad.</em></td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>Act I, No. 4, <strong>Recit. and Chorus</strong>, RVC patterns.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>Act I, No. 4a, <strong>Recitativo</strong>.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td>Act I, No. 5, <strong>Ballad</strong>.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.</td>
<td>Act I, No. 5, <strong>Ballad</strong>, Melodic Contours, RVC Patterns.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20.</td>
<td>Act I, No. 6, <strong>Barcarolle</strong>.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22.</td>
<td>Act I, No. 7, <strong>Entrance of the Female Relatives</strong>, mm. 39-66.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23.</td>
<td>Act I, No. 7, <strong>Double Chorus and Closing Section</strong>.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24.</td>
<td>Act I, No. 7, Phrasing and RVC Patterns, Sections A and E.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25.</td>
<td>Act I, No. 7, Phrasing and RVC Patterns, Sections A₁+B₁.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27.</td>
<td>Act I, No. 8, Conclusion, mm. 20-51.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28.</td>
<td>Act I, No. 8, Recurrent Melodic Pattern in Subphrases.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29.</td>
<td>Act I, No. 9, <strong>Song and Chorus</strong>.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30.</td>
<td>Act I, No. 9, Phrasing and RVC Patterns.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31.</td>
<td>Act I, No. 10, <strong>Glee</strong>, First Verse, mm. 1-20.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32.</td>
<td>Act I, No. 10, <strong>Glee</strong>, Second Verse, mm. 21-53.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure</td>
<td>Act I, No. 10, Melodic Contours, RVC Patterns in Half-Phrases.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>33. P. 362</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>34. Act I, No. 11, Duet, Josephine and Ralph. 363</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>35. Act I, No. 11, Phrasing and RVC Patterns. 364</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>36. Act I, No. 12, Finale I, mm. 1-56. 468</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>37. Act I, No. 12, Fin I, Melodic Contours, Phrasing and RVC Patterns, mm. 1-56. 469</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>38. Act I, No. 12, Finale I, mm. 57-89. 470</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>39. Act I, No. 12, Fin I, Melodic Contours, Phrasing and RVC Patterns, mm. 57-89. 471</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>40. Act I, No. 12, Finale I, mm. 89-132. 472</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>41. Act I, No. 12, Fin I, mm. 132-152. 473</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>42. Act I, No. 12, Fin I, Melodic Contours, Phrasing and RVC Patterns, mm. 89-132. 474</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>43. Act I, No. 12, Fin I, Mel. Cont., Phrasing. RVC Patterns, mm. 132-149. 475</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>44. Act I, No. 12, Fin I, mm. 153-177. 476</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>45. Act I, No. 12, Fin I, mm. 177-195. 477</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>46. Act I, No. 12, Fin I, Melodic Contours, Phrasing and RVC Patterns, mm. 177-195. 478</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>47. Act I, No. 12, Fin I, mm. 195-209. 479</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>48. Act I, No. 12, Fin I, mm. 210-256. 480</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>49. Act I, No. 12, Fin I, Melodic Cont., Phrasing, RVC Patterns, mm. 210-256. 481</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>50. Act I, No. 12, Fin I, mm. 256-282. 482</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51. Act I, No. 12, Finale I, mm. 282-350.</td>
<td>483</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52. Act I, Fin. I, Melodic Contours, Phrasing and RVC Patterns, mm. 256-282.</td>
<td>484</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54. Act I, No. 12, Finale I, Shape Delineation in the Largest Dimensions: Elements of Unity and Contrast.</td>
<td>491</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55. Act I: Framing Function of Intermediate Discrete Structures Within the Act.</td>
<td>492</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56. Entr'acte.</td>
<td>531</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>57. Act II, No. 13, Captain's Song, mm. 1-25.</td>
<td>532</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58. Act II, No. 13, mm. 25-58.</td>
<td>533</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59. Act II, No. 13, Mel. Cont., Phrasing and RVC Patterns.</td>
<td>534</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60. Act II, No. 14, Duet (Verse), mm. 1-42.</td>
<td>556</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61. Act II, No. 14, Duet (Refrain and Coda), mm. 43-60.</td>
<td>557</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>62. Act II, No. 14, Duet, Mel. Cont., Phrasing and RVC Patterns</td>
<td>558</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>63. Act II, No. 14, Duet, Fabric, Texture, Tonal Weight.</td>
<td>559</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64. Act II, No. 15, Scena (Recitativo).</td>
<td>613</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65. Act II, No. 15, Scena (Recit.), Mel. Cont., Phrasing, RVC Patterns.</td>
<td>614</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure

66. Act II, No. 15, Scena (Cabaletta), mm. 1-25. 615

67. Act II, No. 15, Scena (Cabaletta), mm. 25-55. 616

68. Act II, No. 15, Scena (Cabaletta), mm. 55-88. 617

69. Act II, No. 15, Scena (Cabaletta), Melodic Contours, Phrasing and RVC Patterns, mm. 1-25. 618

70. Act II, No. 15, Scena (Cabaletta), Mel. Cont., Phrasing and RVC Patterns, mm. 25-55. 619

71. Act II, No. 15, Scena (Cabaletta), Mel. Cont., Phrasing and RVC Patterns, mm. 55-88. 620

72. Act II, No. 16, Trio, mm. 1-49. 644

73. Act II, No. 16, Trio, (Coda), mm. 49-84. 645

74. Act II, No. 16, Trio, Mel. Cont., Phrasing and RVC Patterns, mm. 1-49. 646

75. Act II, No. 16, Trio, Mel. Cont., Phrasing and RVC Patterns, mm. 49-84. 647

76. Act II, No. 17, Duet, Captain and Deadeye. 665

77. Act II, No. 17, Duet, Mel. Cont., Phrasing and RVC Patterns. 666

78. Act II, No. 18, Soli and Chorus, mm. 1-27. 742

79. Act II, No. 18, Soli and Chorus, Mel. Cont., Phrasing and RVC Patterns, mm. 1-27. 743

80. Act II, No. 18, Soli and Chorus, mm. 28-44. 744
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>81. Act II, No. 18, <strong>Soli and Chorus</strong>, mm. 44-76.</td>
<td>745</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>82. Act II, No. 18, <strong>Soli and Chorus</strong>, Mel. Cont., Phrasing and RVC Pattern mm. 28-44.</td>
<td>746</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>83. Act II, No. 18, <strong>Soli and Chorus</strong>, Mel. Cont., Phrasing and RVC Patterns, mm. 44-76.</td>
<td>747</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>84. Act II, No. 18, <strong>Soli and Chorus</strong>, mm. 76-101.</td>
<td>748</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>85. Act II, No. 18, <strong>Soli and Chorus</strong>, Mel. Cont., Phrasing and RVC Patterns,</td>
<td>749</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>86. Act II, No. 18, <strong>Soli and Chorus</strong>, mm. 102-122.</td>
<td>750</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>87. Act II, No. 18, <strong>Soli and Chorus</strong>, mm. 122-131.</td>
<td>751</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>88. Act II, No. 18, <strong>Soli and Chorus</strong>, Mel. Cont., Phrasing and RVC Patterns, mm. 102-131</td>
<td>752</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>89. Act II, No. 18, <strong>Soli and Chorus</strong>, mm. 131-167.</td>
<td>753</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90. Act II, No. 18, <strong>Soli and Chorus</strong>, Mel. Cont., Phrasing and RVC Patterns, mm. 131-167.</td>
<td>754</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>91. Act II, No. 18, <strong>Soli and Chorus</strong>, mm. 167-183.</td>
<td>755</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>92. Act II, No. 18, <strong>Soli and Chorus</strong>, mm. 183-204.</td>
<td>756</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>93. Act II, No. 18, <em>Soli and Chorus</em>: Component Discrete Elements and Plot Correlation.</td>
<td>757</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95. Act II, No. 19, <em>Octet</em>, Mel. Cont., Phrasing and RVC Patterns.</td>
<td>792</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>96. Act II, No. 19, <em>Recitativo</em>.</td>
<td>793</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>97. Act II, No. 20, <em>Song</em>.</td>
<td>794</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>98. Act II, No. 20, Song., Mel. Cont., Phrasing and RVC Patterns.</td>
<td>795</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100. Hierarchy of Structural Elements in Text and Music in Small, Middle, and Large Dimension in a Synoptic Presentation.</td>
<td>807</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>101. Homogeneous Elements' Grouping and Procedural Recurrence as Determinants of Shape in the Largest Dimensions.</td>
<td>808</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>102. Linear Scope and Triangular Model of Dramatic Shape, HMS Pinafore, Acts I and II.</td>
<td>809</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
GLOSSARY

Elements of Drama according to Aristotle's Poetics (the order of presentation is not alphabetic; it reflects Aristotle's organizational hierarchy of dramatic elements):

**Plot:** the manner in which the drama's action is organized; "character in action."

**Character:** defined by appearance, speech, action, and reactions of others to the *dramatis persona* in question. Ranges from one- to multi-dimensional depending on author's style and purpose.

**Thought:** the intellectual and emotional range(s) of the *dramatis personae*.

**Diction:** the vocabulary of the *dramatis personae*; a vehicle for characterization and presentation of thought.

**Music:** the total auditory material of a play (not applicable in its original definition to this study).

**Spectacle:** the total visual aspect of a play.

The plot (see above) is articulated through the organization of the following elements:

**Exposition:** the presentation of the principal characters and their relationship to one another.

**Point of Attack:** the first complication* of the plot that creates a disequilibrium to be balanced in the denouement.

xiii
Discovery: the recognition by the *dramatis personae* of the difference between appearance and reality or between expectation and occurrence.

Reversal: ideally, merged with discovery; a change of fortune in the play's action to the opposite state of affairs.

Foreshadowing: the making of future action plausible and expected through the previous insertion of relevant clues.

Complication: a new force introduced into a play that affects the direction of the course of action.

Climax: the culmination of a course of action; the point of maximum disequilibrium.

Crisis: often used interchangeably with climax*, with which it may occur simultaneously. A clash of interests and the facing of momentous alternatives by the protagonist.

Denouement: a resolution of all the difficulties raised through the complications; a return to equilibrium.

Unity of Time: the Aristotelian injunction to restrict the plot's time to approximately twenty-four hours.

Unity of Place: the Classical custom of confining the action to a single locale (non-Aristotelian).

Unity of Action: the confinement of the plot to a single course of events and the avoidance of a serio-comic mixture; historically, observed as often as disregarded.
Prosodic Nomenclature according to standard usage (see Harry Shaw, Dictionary of Literary Terms and Bernet, Berman, Burto, A Dictionary of Literary, Dramatic, and Cinematic Terms).

Anacrusis: an unstressed syllable or group of syllables beginning a line of verse without being counted in the first foot; note musical homonym in context.

Anaphora: the repetition of a word or words at the beginning of two or more successive lines of verse.

Caesura: a pause or break in a line of verse that may be semantic or syntactic, or both.

Catalexis: the omission on the last unstressed syllable or group of syllables in a line of verse.

Closure: a semantic, syntactic, or prosodic delimitations of stanzaic structures a posteriori; often all three above mentioned qualities are reunited in a closural function (Ernst Haublein, The Stanza).

Epiphora: the repetition of a word or words at the end of two or more successive lines of verse.

Foot: basic unit of poetic measurement consisting of two or more syllables, one of which is stressed; the principal groupings are:

iamb:  /  trochee:  /  anapaest:  / / / 
dactyl:  / /  spondee:  /  dibrach:  / 

amphibrach:  /  /   amphimacer:  / / / 

* the symbols / and  represent, respectively, stressed or long syllables and unstressed or short syllables.

** the dibrach is also known as the pyrrhic foot.
**Hypermeter:** supernumerary unstressed syllables at end of a line of verse; the anacrusis* is a form of hypermeter.

**Meter:** number of feet in a line of verse, e.g., a pentametric line has five poetic feet.

**Scansion:** the metrical analysis of poetry based on the quantification and qualification of syllabic stress pattern, feet, line length, rhyme scheme, and stanzaic structure; feet may be scanned accentually or quantitatively: long/short in the former manner corresponds to strong/weak in the latter.

**Stanza:** the organization of verse lines into a pattern with a fixed number of lines, a prevailing meter, and a consistent rhyme scheme; this grouping may constitute the division of a poem or a discrete poem by itself.
The study adheres to standard musical nomenclature; in some cases, however, the terms used are neologisms, and therefore subject to an explanation (see the *Harvard Dictionary of Music*, 2nd ed., marked H, *Guidelines for Style Analysis*, marked L, and *Musical Form and Musical Performance*, marked C):

**Dimensions**: large dimensions concern entire discrete pieces, movements, or in some cases successions of movements with a unifying factor; middle dimensions concern structural elements larger than, and inclusive of, a single phrase or equivalent element up to their combination into the whole of the piece; small dimensions concern the smallest structural elements from motivic to subphrase level (L).

**Elision**: a manner of articulation in which the concluding bar of a phrase serves as the beginning bar of the following phrase (L).

**Frame, Frames**: enclosing elements of, and in, a piece of music; may occur in all dimensions; in the largest dimensions as external frames and the smaller dimensions as delimitators of linear components of internal structure (C); the concept may be extended verbatim to poetic form.

**Forms, -in and -of**: form-of refers to the scheme that determines the overall structure of a musical composition; forms-in are structural elements and procedures in all dimensions of that composition (H).

**Lamination**: a substantial contrast in articulation between two or more strata of a piece's structure; a natural result of polyphonic procedure and a source of sophisticated variety in a homophonic procedure (L).
Manners of Growth: Recurrence, Variation, and Contrast, abbreviated RVC, applicable in all dimensions* (L).

Negative Variation: a variant that precedes the theme; such variants are numbered accordingly in a negative fashion, with the decreasing numerals indicating the relative linear proximity of the variants to the theme, e.g. A-3, A-2, A-1, A; (William Poland, oral communication).

Scope, Linear and Dynamic: linear scope concerns itself with duration; dynamic scope with orchestrated or indicated volume; both may be used synonymously with the Aristotelian concept of magnitude.
INTRODUCTION

The choice of a Savoy opera prototype as the object of a multi-dimensional study in the optimal relationship between text and music is based on two perceptions. The first perception concerns the smallest and most numerous structural element in the opera: almost every word of the text is set to music so that the vocal line is phonetically realistic. The second perception concerns the opera's largest structural aspect: favorite numbers notwithstanding, one virtually must listen to an entire Savoy opera to derive an aesthetic satisfaction comparable to that elicited by a homogeneous, discrete work.

This last perception is somewhat paradoxical in a number opera, especially in view of the pleasure derived from listening to excerpted operatic arias of the standard repertoire. A plausible answer to the paradox is that in this case the whole may be different from the sum of its parts as a consequence of the manner of organization of these parts.
The test of the first perception's validity determined the scope of the study. The close relationship of words and music evidenced respectively at the syllabic and motivic levels in each medium became the basis for a thorough analysis of this relationship at every structural level in every discrete number of the opera. The test of the second perception's validity is a logical conclusion to that of the first, since it is based on the relationship between the largest components of the text and the setting; the linear disposition of plot elements and of discrete numbers of a certain conventionally affective character. The recurrence of procedural methods in the largest dimensions of the musical setting is similarly relevant to the perception of structural unity in the opera's largest dimensions.

Gilbert's versification adheres to classical prosody in all structural dimensions. Therefore, it was examined in the light of traditional poetic practice. The classicist approach at stanzaic level so examined prompted an analysis of the text's largest structural dimensions in similarly neo-classical terms. Therefore, Aristotle's Poetics, the first source of classical theatre criticism, were applied as parameters to the Savoy opera's plot structure.¹

Since Gilbert's libretti for the Savoy operas are parodies of Romantic drama,\(^2\) the Aristotelian analytic parameters were complemented by references to aesthetic theories and corresponding structure models of the above mentioned style period. Thus, the method of Gustav Freitag, colloquially known as "Freitag's triangle," a plot model based on the linear disposition of principal tension and release elements and proposed in his *Technik des Dramas* (1863),\(^3\) was applied in the determination of the Savoy prototype's plot shape. Likewise, the method of heterogeneous recurrent grouping used by Alfred Lorenz in his analysis of Wagner's *Tristan und Isolde* (1926) was applied to the determination of shape in the largest dimensions of both words and music.\(^4\)

It is possible to discern three principal attitudes towards the relationship of words and music in the historical period containing the development of opera into its present form. The first, which may be described as divergent, is exemplified by the advocacy of a complete independence of text and music by Gioseppo

---


Zarlino (1520-1591) so that poetry and music may retain their individual characteristics. The second attitude, an antithesis to the first, was expressed in the same transitionary period between Renaissance and Baroque by Zarlino's aesthetic opponent, Vincenzo Galilei (1520-1591). Its synthesizing imperative demanded that music must follow the principles of declamation and meld with the text instead of obscuring it with complicated polyphony.

The monodic speech-song of Galilei and the Florentine camerati became the prototype of the recitativo when Claudio Monteverdi (1567-1643) integrated it into the complex procedure he called stile molle, concitato, e temperato. Monteverdi's approach, evidencing the third attitude which may be termed symbiotic, reunited melodic, harmonic, rhythmic, and timbral devices in the illustration of dramatic poetry.

This symbiosis of parallel devices carefully balanced with each other and unified by a single aesthetic purpose did not remain untouched by the High Baroque love of ornamentation. In fact, the rejection of the elaborate polyphony of the previous style period allowed for a rather unrestrained floridity of the principal vocal parts with

6. Ibid.
7. Ibid., 59-60.
the consequent neglect of the poetic text. This may be seen as an exaggeration of the divergent attitude, detrimental to one of the two major components of the genre. A reaction against this excessive ornamentation and a return to a symbiotic attitude may be exemplified by the writings of Francesco Algarotti (1712-1764) and the works of Christoph Willibald von Gluck (1714-1787), that oppose Baroque luxuriance with Classical simplicity and dramatic relevance in music.

An instance of the synthesizing attitude, if only in theory, is exemplified by the prescriptions of André Grétry (1741-1813) regarding the total merging of words and music, if only within the brief, discrete numbers of Grétry's genre, the opera comique. Gretry's espousal of this attitude reflects in principle that of the Florentine camerati, and foreshadows Wagner's grand design of unity in the arts, expressed in his Gesamtkunstwerk concept, promulgated in the essay Oper und Drama (1851). At the core of this concept Richard Wagner (1813-1883) placed a fusion of word and melody which he called Versmelodie. This procedure, presumably returning the word to a


primal vowel state prior to its blending with a musical sound, was to produce an emotionally heightened sound-synthesis kernel. A melody would be spun out of this kernel spanning the entire dramatic plot continuum without any interruptions by discernible discrete structures in the music, and without any conventional stanzaic and metric features in the text that may obscure the fusion of word and sound.  

This quest for a synthesis of all elements at all levels created an operatic ideal quite different from the hitherto prevailing symbiotic type. The degree of approximation to this new ideal became an indicator of aesthetic excellence towards the end of the 19th century and the beginning of the 20th among a Wagnerian cult of enormous proportions. Even France, a bastion of anti-Wagnerism, had come under the spell of Wagner's works and aesthetic theories. In this aesthetic climate, the number opera with spoken dialogue was as far from the Wagnerian ideal as any variety of the operatic genre could be. In England, with a sizable contingent of Wagnerites who -- as it is often the case with the faithful of any


persuasion -- were more orthodox than their prophet, the number opera with spoken dialogue had reached its nadir in the estimation of the musical establishment. This was diametrically opposite to the sub-genre's highly favored status as a British national art form from the Restoration up to that point: Peter Motteux, writing in the first issue of the Gentleman's Journal in 1692, stated that "... our English genius will not relish that perpetual singing," alluding to the newly imported Italian and French style of thoroughly sung opera. 14

The Victorian exponents of the sub-genre were attacked by the Edwardian critics Ernest Walker and Rutland Boughton as unworthy of the attention that they received through their collective work. Walker, a historian and a scholar, described Sullivan as "the idle singer of an empty evening . . . a popularity hunting trifler;" 15 Boughton, a composer and a self-avowed social realist, accused the two Savoyards of luring away the public from worthier forms of opera through the easy charm of their works. 16


As the Wagnerian cult waned and was replaced by a more objective appreciation of Wagner's works, the spoken dialogue opera in general, and the Savoy operas in particular, benefited from a more catholic aesthetic outlook towards music drama. The artistic virtue of the Gilbert and Sullivan works was recognized by scholars and artists the 20th century in the same unreserved manner as their entertainment qualities were recognized by the Savoy habitués all along. Admiring appraisals by scholars such as Sir Jack Westrup, 17 Percy Young, 18 and the light-opera scholar Gervase Hughes, 19 were complemented by unrestrained praise by Igor Stravinsky, who, acquainted with the Savoy operas from 1912, spoke admiringly in 1968 about their sophisticated simplicity, comparing it favorably to the deliberate intricacy of Richard Strauss' Der Rosenkavalier. Furthermore, Stravinsky found the Savoy operas remarkably undated and ever-fresh to the listener. 20


Stravinsky's opinion regarding the endurance of the Savoy operas' aesthetic qualities is consonant with an earlier opinion by a musician of similar stature: Claude Debussy. The French composer, personally acquainted with Sullivan, maintained that the *comedy operas* (sic) of the two Englishmen were a unique phenomenon in the history of music reuniting artistic integrity, popular appeal, and a degree of universality that ensured their survival far beyond the mores they satirized, unlike the *opéras-bouffes* of Jacques Offenbach.  

Although time has been somewhat kinder to Offenbach (1819–1880) than predicted by Debussy, the latter's comparison of the French composer to the Savoyard pair in terms of universality invites a comparison between Offenbach's and Sullivan's respective approaches to word-setting within the context of the brief retrospective of the text-and-music relationship outlined earlier. Offenbach frequently disregarded both prosody and semantics in his settings, and would often order texts from Meilhac and Halevy to fit already existent music. By contrast,


Sullivan's word-setting, amply documented in contemporary memoirs and his own sketchbooks,\textsuperscript{24} usually began with a rhythmic sketch with several alternative outlines based on a realistic syllabic accentuation rather than on standard poetic scansion. After determining which departures from the poetic scansion best reflected the meaning of the text Sullivan started work on the méloïdic outline of the setting and a preliminary harmonic plan.\textsuperscript{25}

Thus, Sullivan's extreme care in the realistic rendition of the text's smallest identifiable unit, the word and its syllabic components, in terms of a semantic context may be seen as a meeting point between the symbiotic approach to music drama and the synthetic concept of Richard Wagner. In both cases the fusion of word and musical sound creates the substance of the play's music. The divergence between the two approaches appears at a much higher level of that substance's organization: the synthesizing attitude requires a continuum of thematic transformation in order to represent in music the basic articulation of the plot; the symbiotic attitude places the basic elements of plot articulation within discrete musical numbers of a conventionalized affective character.


\textsuperscript{25} Hughes, \textit{Music of Arthur Sullivan}, 28-29.
in a organizational procedure at the musical drama's intermediate dimensions. Historically, the procedure spans the three centuries between Monteverdi and the current Broadway musical.

The choice of *HMS Pinafore* (1878) for the Savoy opera prototype in this study was based on both objective and subjective considerations. The objective considerations determined the rejection of Gilbert and Sullivan's first collaboration, *Trial by Jury* (1875); the piece is a one-acter without spoken dialogue. The subjective considerations determined the rejection of *The Sorcerer* (1877); although its two-act format, spoken dialogue, and cast of characters are prototypical of the later works; its music sounds too much like the sentimental melodramas it is supposed to parody without the showy vocal writing of the latter. Michael Balfe's *Bohemian Girl* (1843) and William Wallace's *Maritana* (1845) may have been naive, and in quite a few spots banal, but at the very least their naivete and banality were of the stage and not of the parlor variety. By contrast, *HMS Pinafore*'s limitations are of the quantitative order, not of the qualitative; the relative restraint of music's technical scope is matched by the overall linear scope of the entire opera and of its discrete components as well. Its predecessor's somewhat artificial sentimentality gives way to the sophisticated simplicity of the Savoy operas to follow.
In addition to the Freitag and Lorenz models of dramatic structure, a model of plot resolution was used that modified the Aristotelian concept of catharsis through vicarious suffering or tragic justice. Since the Savoy plots resolve like those of most rescue operas to the satisfaction of almost every character concerned, and since such an ending is characteristic of folk-tales as well, the concept of euphazard replaces the classical catharsis. This concept, extensively discussed, and, one may add, just as extensively applied, by J.R.R Tolkien, describes the feeling of satisfaction and relief that a character experiences directly and a listener vicariously at the final escape from some danger crucial to the plot. 26

CHAPTER I: GENERAL BACKGROUND

Some Generic Considerations

HMS Pinafore, like the other Savoy operas, belongs to the opéra comique variety of the number opera sub-genre. This classification is based on its episodic structure, which consists of closed musical numbers interspersed with spoken dialogue.

Slightly less widespread through 18th and 19th century Europe than Italian opera, the French opéra comique lacked that royal patent that institutionalized most of the Arts in the Académie des Beaux Arts,¹ the Académie Française,² and the Académie de Musique (this last created so that gentlefolk could perform in the musical theatre without detriment to their social standing³). Since its establishment in 1672, this last institution was supported impartially by the Bourbons, the Revolutionary regimes, and by Napoleon. Originally dedicated to the performance of

2. Ibid., 129.
tragédies lyriques of Lully and Rameau, the Académie remained faithful to its tradition of serious drama even when the distinction between comique and grand, originally similar to that between buffa and seria, became one of procedure — recitativo versus spoken dialogue — rather than of ethos.  

However, the Gallic penchant for a centralized organization of every cultural manifestation did not overlook the more frivolous of such manifestations while establishing the grandiose institutions described earlier: in 1715 the musical entertainment booths at the Parisian fairgrounds, the Fêtes Foraines, restricted at the time to musical pantomimes with caption posters by order of the Comédie Française, at once their licensing agency, main competitor, and target of their parodies, emancipated themselves from that institution. Their entrepreneurs petitioned, and obtained, a collective transfer under the jurisdiction of the Académie de Musique (i. e. the Opéra); with one of the conditions of the transfer being the consolidation of all the diverse troupes under a single manager.  


The musical entertainments at the Fêtes Foraines at the beginning of the eighteenth century were brief skits with topical songs put together by miscellaneous hacks using a common fund of musical motives called frédons, which had acquired standardized connétions, such as scepticism, fear, defiance, mockery, and joy.\(^6\) Alternately, the same hacks would parody Italian opera by using its airs with a topical French text. The piece using frédons was called comedie vaudeville or simply vaudeville, and was more often than not bawdy, like its ancestor, the ballad from the Vaux de Vire in Normandy. The operatic parody was known as the comedie-á-ariettes, and was more decorous than the vaudeville. One of the works produced in 1715 after the consolidation of the fairgrounds troupes bore a new subtitle: opéra comique. The piece was a parody of an epic romance by Fénelon - Télémaque - and had a libretto by Le Sage with music by Gilliers, a violinist at the Comédie Française.\(^7\) The term found quick acceptance as a designation for both vaudeville and comedie-á-ariettes, and for an eventual merging of both genres later in that century, which did not differ much from a putative common ancestor in the

---


thirteenth century: the Fleming Adam De La Halle' s entertainment Le Jeu de Robin et Marion, written in 1283 for a Norman court at Naples. Both the ancestor and the descendant were episodic, eclectic to the point of derivativeness, and naive— with the farcical ribaldry of the vaudeville replacing the pastoral quaintness of the Jeu. 8 The extreme topicality and indiscriminately borrowed or imitated music of the early opéra comique were Kitsch of the most obvious kind. However, some libretti in those early days of the form showed more universality and higher literary taste—notably those of Alain-Rene Le Sage. 9

A very considerable improvement was due to the collaboration of the litterateur Charles Simon Favart (1710-92) and the composers Egidio Duni (1709-75), Pierre Monsigny (1729-1817), and the chess-master and musician Andre Danican Philidor (1726-95): Favart replaced the episodic melanges of coarse gags with well constructed comedies of manners, placing relevant lyrics at appropriate junctures of his plots, while Duni, Monsigny, and Philidor set these lyrics to music that was never less than skillful and elegant, with artistic originality eventually prevailing over the customary borrowing, which survived only as a

8. Cooper, I0.
9. Ibid., 18.
device of satire. 10 The final transformation of the genre from a loose assortment into a structurally integrated art form was effected by an event that in itself was a discussion on a moot point, generated by one of the periodic flareups of box-office and patronage rivalry between local French and imported Italian theatre troupes in Paris. This rivalry, dating back to the first engagement of an Italian troupe by their compatriot, Cardinal Mazarin, in the 1650's, 11 provided impetus and a ready combat ground for the Enciclopédistes and their reaction against the rigid conventions of French serious opera, which they denounced by extolling the seemingly natural affective and dramatic expressiveness of the current style in Italian opera—the essence of which seemed to be found in one of the many Neapolitan intermezzi, Pergolesi's La Serva Padrona (1733), by that fire-breathing amateur Jean-Jacques Rousseau. His attacks on the tragédies lyriques—directed chiefly at Rameau, most often ad hominem, sometimes ad rerum—kept the "War of the Bouffons", as the dispute was called, alive long enough to introduce a new, but not necessarily Italian, manner into operatic writing.


11. Cooper, 14.
in France: a style more syllabic than the old manner, and therefore closer to folk songs, and henceforth presumably closer to nature as defined by the prevailing aesthetics of the time. In practice, such a change allowed for a relatively unhampered perception of the text— a feature quite consonant with the postulates of the Florentine camerati. The deeply perceptive Rameau—who bore the brunt of Rousseau's invectives as the representative of old style—declared that were it not for his old age he himself would go to Italy to study the new style, even after his adherents burned Rousseau in effigy for his affronts to the master. 12

Yet, it was not the vociferous Rousseau with his puerile Devin du Village (1753) who became the musical embodiment of the French Enlightenment's aesthetic thought, but the Belgian-born and Italian-trained Andre Grétry (1742-1813). His works reflect the same yearning for sentimental simplicity that prompted the jeunesse dorée of France's ancien régime to don pastoral garb and play at being Arcadians. The notable difference between these two manifestations was that Grétry's style was not contrived like the jaded courtiers' imitations of pastoral life, but emanated from a desire for realistic musical rendition of the poetic text.

12. Burney, 970.
Exegetically, Grétry's own description of his style reflects the naive pre-Comtian positivism of the age. He formulated an entire prescriptive system of affective characterization distinguished by a pigeon-holing categorization of stock devices, whose redeeming feature was its subordination to the human voice. Word-setting, the core of the system, ought to follow declamation patterns just as painting ought to study anatomy and perspective, Grétry declared. The resultant melody must the become the shaping element and, along with the text, the most perceivable feature in music drama.  

The naive prescriptiveness of Grétry's system does not invalidate it entirely: its underlying principles are clearly traceable to Monteverdi, Lully, Rameau, and Gluck, and its influence extends beyond Wagner to the musical theatre of our times. His works, while of a limited scope and formal sophistication, ushered in a pervasive affective characterization into a genre rescued from the purveyance of cheap carnival entertainment by Duni (1709-1775), Monsigny (1729-1817), and Philidor (1726-1795) and paved the way for Cherubini (1760-1842) and Mehul (1763-1817). The genre reached its zenith in the collaborations of the supreme craftsman of the "well-made" libretto, Eugene Scribe (1791-1861) with Daniel Auber (1782-1871).  

13. Cooperc, 40
Louis Hérold (1791-1833), and Francois Boieldieu (1755-1834). After these composers, whose works struck a box-office pleasing balance between elegant craftsmanship and perceptual accessibility, the spoken-dialogue opera in France bifurcated into serious and comical varieties, not unlike the Singspiel in Germany, witness Mozart's Magic Flute (1791) and C.M. von Weber's Der Freischuetz (1821).

The comic variety had as its principal exponent Adolphe Adam (1803-1856) whose Postillon de Longjumeau (1836) is the most celebrated of his fifty works in the genre. Antoine-Louis Clapisson (1808-1866) and Louis Maillart (1817-1871) were lesser lights in the genre, however successful in their day. 14 The serious variety of the genre was not shunned by such luminaries as Charles Gounod (1818-1893) (who also tried his hand, unsuccessfully, at the comical variety 15), Georges Bizet (1838-1875), and Ambroise Thomas (1811-1896).

It appears that the expressive qualities of the recitativo stromentato, which replaced completely the secco variety at the beginning of the 19th century, drove the spoken-dialogue opera almost exclusively into comedy by the middle of that century. The most prominent works


15. Grout, 337.
in this genre -- Charles Gounod's *Faust* (1859) and Georges Bizet's *Carmen* (1875) -- had their spoken lines promptly replaced by *stromentati*, of original authorship in the first instance, and by Ernest Guiraud in the second. A similar fate befell earlier works of this kind whose serious nature warranted a revival in the *grand* manner: Etienne Mehul's *Joseph* (1807) was fitted with *stromentati* in 1856 by Sir William George Cusins, organist of Queen Victoria's Private Chapel, for a performance at Windsor Castle, and also much later by the French folk-music scholar Bourgault-Doucoudray.\(^{16}\) Outside of Germany the redoubtable Freischutz also had its spoken dialogue replaced by recitatives - in 1824 by Hector Berlioz for a production in Paris,\(^ {17}\) and by Michael Costa in 1850 for one in London.\(^ {18}\)

In general, the status of the spoken dialogue genre during the second half of the nineteenth century varied with national and geographic factors: in those countries where the national spirit was -- in the words of Johann Gottfried von Herder -- submerged under the culture of the subjugator, the spoken genre became an expedient medium for the cultivation of a language and a sense of historic and

---

16. Cooper, 47.


cultural particularity enhanced by music based on folk tunes. Among the Czechs, Bedřich Smetana -- a composer of far more than local caliber -- chose this genre for at least two of his operas: The Bartered Bride (1866) and Two Widows (1874). Subsequently, he added recitativos to both -- for a performance outside of his country in the first case, and in a fit of pique at being compared to Offenbach in the second.\textsuperscript{19} Another great Czech composer, Antonín Dvořák, was quite explicit about his reasons for writing light opera: he did not write it seeking easy popularity for himself, but rather out of conviction that this was an art form most beneficial to his people.\textsuperscript{20} The Ukrainian composer Mykola Lysenko (1842-1912) in effect abandoned a promising career as a pianist in order to compose works on Ukrainian texts, out of a desire to maintain the use of that language in the only guise -- belles-lettres -- permitted by the Valuiev (1862) and Bad-Ems (1876) decrees of the Czarist government.\textsuperscript{21} This choice limited the performance opportunities of these works, since the overzealous application of these decrees by the

\textsuperscript{19} Hughes, Composers of Operetta, 154.

\textsuperscript{20} Otakar Šourek, Antonín Dvořák, His Life and Works (Prague: Orbis, 1952), 99.

imperial censors made the imperially owned or controlled theatres (i.e. most theatres) often unavailable for Lysenko in spite of ready financial backing. These operas, with the exception of *Taras Bulba* (1890) and the miniature *Nocturne* (1912), were all written in some form of the spoken dialogue genre; *Natalka Poltavka* (1861) and the *Black Sea Kozaks* (1872) are ballad operas, perhaps the last chronological exponents of the genre, both with substantial overtures and intermezzi of original authorship; *Christmas Night* (1873) was originally an *opera comique*, but was rewritten in 1883, recitativos and ariosi taking the place of dialogue; *May Night* remained an *opera comique*, and so did *The Aeneid* (1909), a parody of Virgil, and a satire on the Czarist regime. With the exception of the two ballad operas Lysenko's works are characterized by a synthesis of folk idioms and a cosmopolitan style acquired at the Leipzig Conservatory in the years 1867-69 under Reinecke, Moscheles, Richter, and Papperitz, who had taught Grieg and young Sullivan among others in the previous decade.

The German *Singspiel* faced no imperialistic repression. But, it had to contend with considerable opposition in its own land because of the Italianate tastes

---


of German princes dictating the repertoire chosen by the Herren Intendanten of their court theatres. This penchant for things Italian was replaced by an equivalent fondness for things French in the 1830's and 1840's, in particular for the pleasant mediocrities of Adolphe Adam and Louis Hérold - hardly a superior choice over the local contemporaries Heinrich Marschner and Gustav Lortzing. The earlier success of Der Freischutz was rather an exception, and it was due not only to musical excellence but in equal measure to its artistic expression of the most recondite as well as the most explicit manifestations of the Herderian Volkgeist, which was immediately felt by the Berlin audiences in 1821. 

By contrast, the Swedish relative of the German Singspiel -- the rococo Sångspel -- enjoyed both popular and royal support. It introduced folk songs and dances in an artistically integrated manner -- the Swedish Polka as a companion to the Minuet and the Gavotte is a case in point -- and became the precursor of the nineteenth century Sägospel, a Romantic opera form based on musical and literary folklore, not unlike the operas of the


Slavic national schools. A similar status was accorded in Denmark to the *Syngespiel* after its successful championing by the celebrated national playwright Holberg against the Italian mediocrities of Sarti and Scalabrini.

The Spanish *zarzuela*, perhaps the most folkloric of all musical theatre forms in Europe of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, was eclipsed after its two-century success by the ubiquitous Italian opera. When it returned to popular favor in the mid-nineteenth century, its original *pasticcio* of popular and folk songs and dances was replaced by an Italianate style of music, still imbued with elements of Spanish folklore, but considerably more sophisticated. The original spoken lines, often unrelated to the tenuous plot line, but concerning some topic of the day, were replaced by dramatically pertinent dialogue. The *zarzuela* in its new guise became known as the *genero grande*, and the *pasticcio* reappeared in the *genero chico*. The former, literally "grand genre," ranged in theatrical style from comedies of manners to melodrama; the latter, literally "little genre," was confined to low comedy.

---

One of the most skillful and inventive composers in the predominant comic variety of the spoken-dialogue opera of the 19th century, as well as the most popular and successful in the genre during the second half of that century was Jacques Offenbach (1819-1982). He made his operettas the paramount musical entertainment of France's Second Empire, and practically fostered the growth of what is known now as the Viennese operetta through the strong influence he exerted on Johann Strauss the younger (1825-1899) and Franz von Suppé (1819-1895), his chronological contemporaries.\(^\text{31}\)

The element of ribald frivolity was a dominant trait in the libretti of Offenbach's operettas, written by Meilhac and Halevy, a team whose only departure from this kind of work was the adaptation of Prosper Merimee's Carmen for Georges Bizet. These libretti were subject to Offenbach's approval and revision, and the final product generally showed a strongly Dionysiac manner of lampooning classics and satirizing contemporary mores.\(^\text{32}\) This aspect of Offenbach's works frequently overshadows the effective orchestration, the attractive melodies,\(^\text{33}\) and the elegant

\(^\text{31}\) Grout, 339.

\(^\text{32}\) Hughes, Composers of Operetta, 22.

\(^\text{33}\) Ibid., 45.
treatment of the popular dances of the day - resembling the Baroque incorporation of popular contemporary dances into art music en suite. By contrast, such a result was not achieved in the operettas of Johann Strauss, except for Der Fledermaus (1874) and Der Zigeunerbaron (1885), which only too obviously serve as vehicles for his incomparable waltzes and polkas.34 However gratuitous and even corrupting it may have seemed to Offenbach's critics, his lampooning ribaldry was -- consciously or not -- a very real link with the comédies vaudevilles of the previous century, and just as the incipient opéras comiques of the 1750's mocked tragédies lyriques and opéras seria, Offenbach in his opéras bouffes mocked the bourgeois sentimentality and the melodramatic clichés of the opéra comique became a national institution.36 On the other hand, there was also a démi-monde aspect to the theatres managed and owned by Offenbach - the Bouffes-Parisiens and the Théâtre des Variétés - since beside their thespian function they also served as exclusive houses of assignation to such démi-mondaines as Hortense Schneider, who also sang very well,37 and to the notorious Cora Pearl, who did not, as well as gathering an entire coterie of hetairae of the Second

Empire on either side of the footlights.\textsuperscript{38} The reputation for licentiousness of Offenbach's milieu extended an aura of demi-monde over light opera and operetta in countries with greater outward restraint in social mores than the French Second Empire, as the French variety of the genre gained popularity and notoriety in Europe. Consequently, those entrepreneurs in Victorian England who aimed at the family audience bowdlerized the risqué texts of Offenbach, Audran, Lecoq, and others beyond recognition, while those who reckoned with the Music Hall trade augmented the original ribaldry with countless improprieties of their own—perhaps in an attempt to compensate for the inept translations, just as a dishonest wine merchant conceals the watering down of his stock with a dose of raw spirits— centering the spectacle on the invariable abundance of femmes deshabillées.\textsuperscript{39} In both cases the aesthetic result was Kitsch, one bowing to pruridity, the other appealing to pruriency. An exception to the last instance were the operettas of Hervé, which were elegant and only slightly risqué.\textsuperscript{40} Even so, their extreme intellectual light weight combined with music of the most perfunctory character consigned them to prompt

\textsuperscript{38} Sacheverell Sitwell, \textit{La Vie Parisienne} (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1938), 35.

\textsuperscript{39} Mackinlay, 227.

\textsuperscript{40} Ibid., 220.
oblivion after an initial box-office success. In this respect, the ultimate fate of Hervé’s works resembled that of the majority of British Music between the death of Henry Purcell in 1695 and the emergence of the Gilbert and Sullivan partnership in the 1870’s: the musical life in England during this period, spanning nearly two hundred years, contrasted with those of France, Germany, and Italy by the nearly total absence of a native composer of any consequence, with the possible exception of William Boyce (1710-1779) and Thomas Augustine Arne (1710-1778). The former is celebrated for his orchestral works as well as for the patriotic song "Hearts of Oak" from Harlequin’s Invasion (1759), and the latter for a wide range of opera styles, from comic opera in Singspiel style, ballad opera, and masques, to Metastasian opera seria. Like Boyce’s "Hearts of Oak", Arne’s "Rule, Britannia" from the masque Alfred (1740) is often cited as the quintessence of English musical spirit, which had an identity of its own before Handel (and which actually influenced that composer, rather than vice-versa, as it is often, and erroneously, maintained).

41. Hughes, Comp. of Operetta, 72.
43. Ibid., 323-4.
Another kind of British national music -- the ballad opera -- had a different bearing on Handel's career. Its most celebrated example, The Beggar's Opera (1728), successfully competed with Handel's Italian-style opera at the box office, while ridiculing the mannerisms of that genre and its interpreters. The Beggar's Opera, written by John Gay (1685-1732) and furnished with music of varied provenance, ranging from simple folk-ballads to arias by Purcell, Bononcini, and Handel himself, acquired a certain degree of musical unity through the arrangement of this motley assortment by John Christopher Pepusch (1667-1752), a quondam violinist at the Drury Lane Theatre, a scholar of ancient music, and an Oxonian Doctor of Music. The parodic manner of the Beggar's Opera falls somewhere in between those of the French vaudevilles and comédies-à-ariettes because of its utilization of both high and low musical styles, while the satire is confined to the text and the structure of the play with its contrived deus-ex-machina reprieve as the final reversal, mocking the happy ending of operatic heroics, not only in Handel but also in such kitsch, contrived to


suit the royal taste as Albion and Albanus (1685) composed to Dryden's text by Louis Grabu, a French favorite of Charles II.46

The sharpest criticism of the dramatic faults in opera seria in England was that of Joseph Addison (1672-1719), who took to task both Handel and Torquato Tasso, as well as the performers, for what he justly considered to be lapses in dramatic characterization, speech, and even spectacle.47 However, Addison's criticism did not generate the same kind of creative ferment in England as Rousseau's diatribes in La Nouvelle Héloïse against similar histrionic nonsense generated in France.48 After the caustic Beggar's Opera, partly inspired by Jonathan Swift,50 the humor in English comic operas became much gentler - which was first apparent in the operas of Arne and Bickerstaffe, and then in the sentimental comedies of Thomas Linley (1733-1795), Samuel Arnold (1740-1802), William Shield (1748-1829), and Steven Storace (1763-1796), in which the occasionally deft musicianship did not compensate for the incidental

49. Coberman, xvi.
relationship between music and libretto.

The beginning of the 19th century in England saw cognates of the ballad opera whose principal attraction was spectacle. The Aquatic Theatre of Charles Dibdin, the younger, son of the celebrated naval songwriter, had a tank built below the stage. This tank's dimensions, ninety feet long, twenty feet wide, and five feet deep, allowed the realistic presentation of battles and disasters at sea, with the attendand martial heroism and impossible rescues.51

Dibdin Jr.'s works were transitional ballad operas, with their music gradually turning from borrowed material to original compositions. Still, the music retained a folk character in its overall simplicity and reliance on melodic appeal and recognition by the audience. The naval setting and the spectacular peripeties within it also held a broad appeal to the mass audience of a seafaring nation who just had been treated to the real-life heroics of Nelson at Trafalgar.52

After Dibdin, the ballad opera was supplanted by Italianate opera, chiefly by Henry Bishop (1786-1855).


52. Mackinlay, 197.
principally remembered for the song "Home, Sweet Home" from the opera *Clari, or the Maid of Milan* (1823), Michael Balfe (1808-1870), whose *Bohemian Girl* (1843) is the only one of his twenty-nine operas not completely forgotten, and Vincent Wallace (1812-1865), whose *Maritana* (1845) enjoyed an initial success quite disproportionate with its subsequent fate. The last and very late representative of this melodramatic genre was Sir Julius Benedict (1804-1885) with his *Lily of Killarney* (1862). In spite of naive rescue plots, one-sided characterization, and impossibly stilted dialogue, these early and mid-Victorian operas were much more deserving of the name than their late eighteenth century predecessors. Single musical authorship provided stylistic cohesion and allowed the music to reflect the affective elements of the play, resulting in a greatly increased musico-dramatic continuity.  

If the rescue melodrama thrived in the early and middle Victorian years, the same thing can hardly be said about comic opera. After a promising start in libretti and a rudimentary one in music during the eighteenth century, the English comedy in music settled for its least original forms—travesty and episodic burlesque—in the nineteenth.


After the textually satirical but musically neutral Beggar's Opera there appeared in England several works intentionally juxtaposing trivial text against music of a solemn character, thus achieving a satiric effect generated by the anticlimactic effect of such a procedure. Among the most notable works of this kind were Dr. Arne's Opera of Operas (1733), based on Henry Fielding's Tragedy of Tom Thumb (itself a spoof of Jacobean melodrama) and The Dragon of Wantley (1737), written by Henry Carey (1690-1751) with music composed by John Fr. Lampe (1703-1751) who also composed other mock operas, such as Pyramus and Thisbe (1745). According to its authors, The Dragon of Wantley purported "to display in English the beauty of nonsense, so prevailing in Italian operas", while contemporary chroniclers described its music as "made as grand and pompous as possible, to heighten the contrast between that and the words". While such comments hardly compare with Gluck's exegetic preface to Alceste, they do show a fundamental understanding of musical satire based on a skillful travesty of familiar affective devices. The hundred years which separate these comic operas from Victoria's accession to the throne of England in 1837 did not see, however, a development similar to that in

55. Mackinlay, 205.
contemporary France, whose national operatic style in the Romantic period had its origin in the popular vaudeville of the early and middle eighteenth century. If anything, the history of English comic opera in those hundred years shows a diametrically opposed development to its French counterpart: while the French burlesque developed through satire into high comedy, only incidentally sharing its outer structure or form -of with melodrama, the English satire of Gay, Arne, and Carey was succeeded by episodic burlesque, well exemplified by the 1831 Olympic Revels, a piece by J.R. Planché, produced at the Olympic Theatre managed by Madame Vestris. This entertainment consisted of loosely connected skits interwoven with songs and dances travestying classical myths as well as less ancient lore, such as Perrault and D'Aulnoy tales. Its popularity went undiminished for the next half-century, in spite of the puns, which, starting out as clever adornments, became in time an excruciating mannerism of the form. The mid-Victorian Planché, Gilbert a'Beckett, Francis Talfourd, and the brothers Brough were succeeded as purveyors of burlesque libretti by Frank Burnand, H.J. Byron, and ultimately William Schwenk Gilbert in the métier during the 1860's. Though still relying on the ubiquitous pun,

56. Mackinley, 206.  
57. Ibid., 21-214.
Gilbert discarded the then current practice of fitting burlesque lyrics to the most popular Music-hall tunes - clearly a formal link with the ballad opera of an earlier age - and turned to operatic travesty, which, however unoriginal musically, provided *ipso facto* musical unity to the piece. The first of such travesties written between 1866 and 1860 was one of *The Bohemian Girl*, retitled as *The Merry Zingara*, or the *Tipsy Gipsy* and the *Pipsy Wipsy*, followed by *L'Elisir d'Amore* -- retitled *Dulcamara*, or the *Little Duck and the Big Quack* -- and under their original titles *Maritana*, *La Fille du Régiment*, and *Robert le Diable*, this last one for the opening night of John Hollingshead's Gaiety Theatre. Gilbert's last conventional burlesque was a travesty of *Norma*, again retitled as *The Pretty Druidess*. This piece, premiered in 1870, concludes with an apology and a prediction in verse, that accurately describes the next phase of Gilbertian comedy:

Forgive our rhymes;  
Forgive the jokes you've heard a thousand times;  
Forgive each breakdown, cellar flap and clog,  
Our low-bred songs, our slangy dialogue:  
And - above all - oh, eye with double barrel,  
Forgive the scantiness of our apparel.

60. Baily, 99.
The Composer and the Librettist

William Schwenk Gilbert (1836-1912) and Arthur Seymour Sullivan (1842-1900) were born to circumstances as different as their lives and personalities.

Sullivan was born into the poor family of a musician, Thomas Sullivan, who later became the Professor of Brass at the Royal School of Military Music.61 From his early teens, Arthur had no doubts about a future profession. Admitted to the Chapel Royal with the best possible recommendations,62 he won the coveted Mendelssohn Scholarship to the Leipzig Conservatory in 1858. His graduation from this institution three years later placed Sullivan in the mainstream of British musical life.63

Gilbert was born into the family of a well-to-do physician and author, attended the Great Ealing School, alma mater to Thackeray and Huxley, was admitted to the Bar, and dabbled in law until an inheritance freed him from financial care and enabled him to dedicate himself totally to playwrighting, humorous verse, and cartooning.64

61. Young, Sullivan, 4.
62. Ibid., 7.
63. Ibid., 26.
64. Pearson, 19-32, passim.
While the *quondam* barrister W.S. Gilbert was making a name for himself as a dramatist, a cartoonist, and a writer of light verse in London of the 1860's, Sullivan, having returned from his three-year sojourn in the Leipzig Conservatory, launched a successful career as a choral and orchestral conductor and as a composer. His conducting engagements in that decade included such prestigious events as the Birmingham Festival, the Norwich Festival, and appearances with such luminaries as Jenny Lind. By 1870 Sullivan had written, beside the drawing room ballads which brought him popularity and an assured income, several serious works of considerable magnitude which were promptly premiered and well received: the incidental music to Shakespeare's *The Tempest*, premiered at Leipzig in 1861 and at London's Crystal Place in 1862, *L'Ile Enchantée*, a ballet produced at Covent Garden in 1864, the masque *Kenilworth*, produced at the Birmingham Festival in 1864, the Symphony in E, a Concerto for 'cello, the overture *In Memoriam*, all premiered at the Crystal

65. Baily, 92.


69. *Ibid.,* 60.
Palace in 1866, the *Marmion* Overture premiered by the Philharmonic Society in 1867, and the *Di Ballo* Overture, premiered at the Birmingham Festival in 1870. In addition to these large works, pot-boiling sentimental parlor ballads, and a substantial amount of hymns, part songs, and *morceaux de salon*, Sullivan attempted to compose a comic opera - *The Sapphire Necklace* - in 1863 to an extremely poor text by H.P. Chorley. If Chorley was a calamitous choice from a literary standpoint, he surely was an excellent one from the standpoint of social and professional advancement, since Chorley's position as critic for *The Atheneum* made him England's main arbiter in matters of musical taste. This was rather typical of Sullivan's meticulous pursuit of friendships with the highly placed and the influential. In the decade under description he counted among friends and acquaintances such literary giants as Dickens and Tennyson, such movers and shakers as Disraeli and Gladstone, and such prominent figures in the Arts as George Grove, Jenny Lind and her husband Otto Goldschmidt, the extremely popular songwriter Fred Clay, and the then controversial -- albeit successfully so -- John Everett

70. Sullivan and Flower, 268, *passim*.
71. Pearson, 73.
73. *Ibid.*, 76.
Also, the end of that decade saw Sullivan begin what was to become a lifelong friendship with the Duke of Edinburgh, through whom Sullivan was admitted to the friendship and attention of his older brother, the Prince of Wales, and to the favor of their mother, Queen Victoria, who requested a complete collection of Sullivan's works from the author in 1869 - a signal honor for one still in his twenties. This was not Sullivan's only acquaintance with royalty in that time: in 1870 he was introduced to the recently deposed Empress Eugenie and her husband Napoleon III. Coincidentally but significantly, Gilbert lambasted that royal pair in a political satire in the magazine *Fun* at about the same time Sullivan was bowing and scraping before them.

At the beginning of the following decade, Sullivan became the leading composer in England, however relative such a distinction may have been at that point in his country, and thus began to fulfill the desires of his establishmentarian well-wishers who regarded him as the white hope of English music - and, indeed the unofficial

78. Baily, 82.
79. Sullivan and Flower, 71.
80, Ibid., 66. 81. Pearson, 29.
82. Young, *Sullivan*, 93.
composer-laureate of the realm, who, as such, was expected to produce grandiose works of a serious nature that would "be destined to uplift British music" as Her Gracious Majesty the Queen Victoria herself put it, referring to Sullivan's 1873 oratorio *The Light of the World*. On a more popular level Sullivan's image as the bard of the Victorian Empire was affirmed through his quickly disseminated hymn *Onward, Christian Soldiers*, also dating from the early 1870's. The foundations of such a career lay not only in Sullivan's indisputable talent, in his ability to express in music the spirit of his times, and in his social graces and pleasantly gregarious character, but also in his first musical steps being taken as a Royal Chapel chorister, and in his subsequent studies in Leipzig with the long lived Karl Reinecke (1824-1910), who taught composers from Grieg and Sullivan to Frederick Delius, and who was the star among a most renowned faculty. Approval of Sullivan's earliest works by such influential musicians as Ludwig Spohr and Ignaz Moscheles also contributed to the rapid acceptance of his compositions by the aesthetic arbiters of a society in which Mendelssohn had joined Handel as the object of establishmentarian musical worship.
Sullivan's first experience with comic opera, if The Sapphire Necklace is to be discounted, was a very casual one for such a thorough and earnest professional as he. A friend, Frank Burnand, an editor of Punch and a writer of burlesque comedy, asked Sullivan to provide the music for a little one-act opera based on Morton's farce Box and Cox. Renamed Cox and Box by Burnand, the little one-acter was to be performed by amateurs as a benefit for the family of a deceased Punch staffer, and consequently the composer was asked, and graciously agreed to work gratis.\(^{88}\) The work was performed in 1866, one of the leads being sung by George du Maurier of Punch caricatures and future Trilby fame, and to the surprise of the composer, turned out to be a great success.\(^ {89}\) This unpretentious money-maker prompted Sullivan and Burnand to write a full-length comic opera and to seek a producer for it. Thus, in the same year, they offered The Contrabandista to the German Reeds, who had developed their Gallery of Illustration — a family entertainment initially consisting of humorous sketches — into well staged, well sung, and attractively produced comic opera, offering an alternative to the coarseness and vulgarity of the average London burlesque.\(^ {90}\) The piece was produced.

88. Sullivan and Flower, 63.  
89. Ibid., 64.  
90. Pearson, 88.
with all the skill and care for which the German Reeds—a team of husband and wife enterpreneurs—were justly famous, but it did not enjoy the success expected by its authors, and Sullivan returned to serious music until his introduction to Gilbert in 1869.\textsuperscript{91}

The first remark of Gilbert upon meeting Sullivan was to ask the composer about

"the simple tetrachord of Mercury . . . [ being able to express a musical theme as well as] the more elaborate dis-diapason (with the familiar four tetrachords and the redundant note) which, I need not remind you, embraces in its simple consonance all the single, double, and inverted chords."

Sullivan admitted that it was a nice point and promised to ponder it. Twenty years later he was still pondering it, according to Gilbert.\textsuperscript{92} Gilbert's deadpan lampooning of the profession of a person just introduced to him and Sullivan's lame attempt at an equally humorous but gentler riposte are typical of the divergence between the partners.\textsuperscript{92} Gilbert emerges as a prankster, and Sullivan as the soul of suave urbanity. At worst, these traits showed up in Gilbert's disregard of tactful conventions, tantrums, and long-held grudges against all offenders, real or imaginary,\textsuperscript{93} and in Sullivan as an unctuous sybaritism.\textsuperscript{94}

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{91} Pearson, loc. cit.
\item \textsuperscript{92} Baily, 98.
\item \textsuperscript{93} Pearson, 212.
\item \textsuperscript{94} Ibid., 134.
\end{itemize}
At their best, both men were generous, gregarious after their own fashions, and loyal in their respective friendships. Both were abundantly skilled in their respective métiers, Sullivan's first-rate musical education being complemented by Gilbert's classical schooling, law degree, and considerable success in innovative theatrical production. 95

The first Gilbert and Sullivan collaboration was a short comedy of the format which then customarily closed an evening's entertainment after the principal feature. This play, billed as a grotesque opera, was called Thespis, or the Gods Grown Old, and it was commissioned by John Hollingshead in 1871 to follow H.J. Byron's comedy Dearer Than Life. 96 It was a burlesque on classical mythology — a sort of miniature model of Offenbach's Orphée aux Enfers (1858) — but with one fundamental difference, which Gilbert himself described at a speech delivered on the occasion of a dinner at the O.P. Club in 1906 celebrating the revivals of the thirteen Gilbert and Sullivan collaborations that followed Thespis: the a priori determination by both authors to avoid the then prevailing extremes of both bowdlerization and frank impropriety. They resolved that their plots "... however

95. Mackinlay, 226.
96. Ibid., 223.
ridiculous, should be coherent; that the dialogue should be void of offence; that on artistic principles no man should play a woman's part, and no woman a man's. Finally, we agreed that no lady of the company should be required to wear a dress that she could not wear with perfect propriety at a private fancy ball..." 97 This, at first glance seems like the classic response of the Victorian stereotype to the opera bouffe's racy double-entendres and femmes déshabillées. However, in a larger sociological context such an attitude was consistent with Gilbert's lifelong endeavor to elevate his art from the status of a craft, as evidenced by his annoyance at the term playwright, which he considered a semantic slur, 98 and to eradicate the conviction of the average middle-class Victorian that the theatre backstage hardly differed from a brothel and that the actresses were to be purchased. 99 Such an attitude antedates, consciously or not, today's rejection by enlightened women of the sex-object role, and paradoxically, shows the contradictions in Gilbert's character when contrasted with his attitude towards higher education for women, as shown in Princess Ida (1884). 100

97. Mackinlay, 227.
98. Pearson, 301.
99. Ibid., 150.
Like The Contrabandista, Thespis failed at the box-office, and was used by Sullivan in later operas, some of its music finding its way into The Pirates of Penzance in 1879. Incidentally, Thespis was the only Gilbert and Sullivan collaboration in which they did not live up to their self-set standards of spectacle propriety by allowing "trouser"—or rather "tights" roles in it.101 Four years after Thespis the then manager of the Royalty Theatre in Soho, Richard D'Oyly Carte (1844-1901), asked Gilbert to provide the customary after-piece for Offenbach's La Perichole (1868) — the music to be composed by Sullivan. Premiered in March 1875, Trial by Jury became a sensational success, eclipsing La Perichole in spite of its secondary billing, with Gilbert crediting a substantial share of the success to Sullivan's brother Frederic for his superb portrayal of the Judge.102 This miniature opera was a nineteenth-century equivalent of the eighteenth-century operatic intermezzo. It shared with its buffo counterpart a comic character, an absolute fidelity of music to text—evidenced by profuse affective devices of characterization, predominantly major keys, and even the ancillary function to a larger form.103 However, the most salient trait of

101. Hughes, Composers of Operetta, 190.
102. Pearson, 91.
103. Grout, 248, passim.
this piece is the elegant economy of resources with which Sullivan provides musical analogues for Gilbert's Daumier-esque wit; mock-Handelian counterpoint characterizes the Judge, and a trivialized barcarolle shows the frivolity of a breach-of-promise Defendant; the harmonies are of the utmost simplicity, and the syllabic setting totally predicates the melodic patterns on the inflections of the text. Except for its lack of spoken dialogue and largely through-composed character, this miniature opera presages through its synthesis of satire and musical scholarship the style of the comic operas to follow from the pen of the two partners. It featured the most significant attribute of the Gilbert and Sullivan style: an intimate approximation of the music to the declaimed word, an achievement equal within its genre to that of Richard Wagner in his, and one attained within miniature forms—of that echo the concise expressiveness of Schumann, Chopin, and Grieg in works of corresponding scope.

In the autumn of 1876 the London impresario Richard D'Oyly Carte organized the Comedy Opera Company underwritten by several financiers with musical and theatrical interests. This syndicate commissioned a

104. Forsyth, 191.
105. Young, Sullivan, 81.
two-act musical comedy from Gilbert and Sullivan, who were not members of the syndicate, for a fixed initial fee plus royalties after the thirty-third performance. The new piece was a satire on British country life, squire to clodhopper, and a parody on supernatural melodrama, called *The Sorcerer*. In casting for it, Gilbert and Sullivan formed a company which provided the prototypical cast of characters for the following eleven comedy operas.\(^{108}\) Gilbert's insistence on the matter shaped the stock company as an ensemble of singing actors rather than of operatic singers, \(^{109}\) and the opera opened in November of 1877. Its initial run of 175 performances was respectable, \(^{110}\) but the pair's following endeavor, *HMS Pinafore*, premiered on May 25, 1878. and, after a deceptively slow start, took the English-speaking world by storm.\(^{111}\) The 700 performances in its two first seasons in the British Isles were considerably augmented by performances in Australia, fully licensed, and in the United States, mostly pirated.\(^{112}\) However, pirated or not, *Pinafore* generated a veritable mania in the 1879-80 season in the United States, which contributed to the enormous success, artistic and financial,

---

110. Ibid., 145.
111. Ibid., 159-160.
112. Ibid., 170.
of the D'Oyly Carte touring company on that season. The company, playing to full houses in New York, Philadelphia, Washington, Boston, and Baltimore, was headed by Gilbert and Sullivan themselves.\textsuperscript{113} The author and the composer, after a rather heated litigation with the syndicate, had become partners with D'Oyly Carte, and were reaping the fruits of their talents bountifully with \textit{HMS Pinafore}.\textsuperscript{114}

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{113} Sullivan and Flower, 104-105.
\textsuperscript{114} Pearson, 111.
\end{flushleft}
CHAPTER II: BEFORE THE CURTAIN

The Libretto: Sources, Plot, Characters.

Gilbert based the plot of *HMS Pinafore* on several of the humorous poems he wrote for the magazine *Fun* in the early 1870's. These poems, which he also illustrated, are collectively known as *The Bab Ballads*, and are parodies of the traditional balladic genre - being by turns mock-heroic, pseudo-melodramatic, or, less often, paradoxical.¹ It is the pseudo-melodramatic variety that Gilbert chose as a source of preliminary sketches for the Savoy libretti, and thus, the ballads *Captain Reece*,² *The Martinet*,³ *General John*,⁴ *The Rumbboat Woman's Story*,⁵ *The Baby's Vengeance*,⁶ and *Joe Golightly and the First Lord's Daughter*,⁷ all appear, although somewhat transformed, in *HMS Pinafore*. This opera parodies and satirizes one particular variety of Victorian melodrama, which was justly popular in a seafaring nation, and consequently a goldmine to enterprising hacks—the nautical play or ballad opera.

A very popular example of this genre was Douglas Jerrold's *Black-eyed Susan* (1829) with Jack Tar stereotypes as sailors, all-good heroes, and all-bad villains. The diction of the play was overwhelmingly fulsome, and the hand of the playwright never too subtly concealed in the timely extractions of heroes and heroines from arbitrary contrivances of the pretty pickle variety. The title of the play links it with an eponymous sea song, *Sweet William's Farewell to Black-eyed Susan* -- the only borrowed number in the last ballad opera of any consequence -- Thomas Dibdin and John Moorehead's *The Naval Pillar* (1799), a patriotic piece with topical allusions to British naval heroes of its day. The original ballad was written by John Gay, who used it subsequently in *The Beggar's Opera* with a different set of lyrics. The love story of a sailor and his sweetheart, central to the original ballad and the two abovementioned plays, is the foundation of both the plot and the subplot of *HMS Pinafore*, outlined in the ballads *The Bumboat Woman's Story* and *Joe Golightly* and *The First Lord's Daughter*, and announced in the play's

---


subtitle, The Lass That Loved a Sailor. This subtitle is an almost literal quote of a toast ascribed to Charles Dibdin: "But the standing toast that pleased me most was - the wind that blows, the ship that goes, and the lass that loves a sailor." The other cited Bab Ballads provide elements of complication and characterization.

Briefly outlined, the plot of HMS Pinafore unfolds thus. The ship's commander, Captain Corcoran, hopes to marry his daughter Josephine to Sir Joseph Porter, the First Lord of the Admiralty. However, she hesitates between filial duty and the love for a simple but gallant sailor - Ralph Rackstraw - who, emboldened by Sir Joseph's demagogic egalitarianism, dares to declare his love to Josephine. When she, however reluctantly, rejects his proffered love Ralph threatens suicide, and Josephine, encouraged by the crew and Sir Joseph's female relatives, accepts him. The lovers, aided by the crew and relatives, plan to elope, but their elopement is foiled by the Captain, who has learned about the scheme from Dick Deadeye, a disgruntled misfit among a naively optimistic crew. As the plotters are intercepted by the Captain he upbraids the lot, and losing his temper utters the fatal word 'damme' which is overheard by Sir Joseph, who places the Captain under

cabin arrest for disregarding Sir Joseph's ban of strong language in the Navy. Sir Joseph's discovery of the reason for the Captain's anger makes him drop all democratic pretence, and he restores the Captain to his post while imprisoning Ralph in the ship's dungeon. Just then, Little Buttercup, a bumboat woman secretly in love with the Captain, reveals that while working in a nursery (baby farming in the original) she mixed up the baby of the Corcorans with that of the Rackstraws, which resulted in the Captain and Ralph growing up in the wrong social stations. The ensuing exchange of identities allows Ralph to marry Josephine, who is rejected by Sir Joseph when he decides that love does not level all ranks quite enough for Josephine now that her father is a common sailor. The Captain, free from class constraints, marries Little Buttercup, whom he had too loved in secret, and Sir Joseph is finally snared into matrimony by his cousin Hebe.

HMS Pinafore features one-dimensional characters when such a treatment serves a satirical purpose. Ralph is both naive and oppressed, reuniting in one person the passive qualities of the traditional oppressed hero and the naive heroine of the Pixerecourt melodramas and the opera comiques of Favart. Sir Joseph combines the characteristics of the mischievous Arlecchino, especially

---
the bumbling Venetian variety of the character—Giovannni
or Zanni (anglicized to 'zany' after its arrival in England
via France) with the pompousness of Pantalon, and the
lack of amatory prowess of Pagliaccio. These commedia
dell'arte traits become apparent in Sir Joseph's self-
described roguery in the song "When I was a Lad," 14 in
his demagogic egalitarianism when addressing the assembled
crew for the first time, and immediately placing himself
outside his own egalitarian rules,15 and his ultimate
loss of Josephine—whose love he never possessed—in the
denouement of the play.16 Dick Deadeye is a caricature
of the stock villain of melodrama. His deformed body and
single eye are an obvious mélange of Victor Hugo's Quasimodo
and Triboulet—this last one familiar to opera audiences
as Verdi's Rigoletto. The spectator's perception of these
features is reinforced by Dick's allusions to his short-
comings, both physical and spiritual,17 and by the punning
manner in which Gilbert named him, alluding both to his
sightless eye and to his occupation, a dead-eye being a
type of pulley on a ship's rigging. The other sailors,

13. Luigi Barzini, The Italians (New York: Atheneum,
1964), 307.


15. Ibid., 54  16. Ibid., 157.  17. Ibid., 15.
Bill Bobstay and Bob Becket, are stalwart British tars, loyal and true, Bill being a bit on the chauvinistic side with his paean to the glories of being an Englishman. The one-feature character delineation is a technique useful to both the satirical writer and to the cartoonist, and Gilbert practiced both métiers, illustrating his own humorous verse for the magazine Fun. The consistent use of one dimensional characters in the Savoy prototype may thus be seen as a phenomenon of technique transference between totally different media.

In contrast to the male characters, the women are considerably less stereotyped and caricaturized. In order of increased realistic portrayal, Cousin Hebe’s sentimental support of the lovers’ plight acquires a more selfish cast when it becomes apparent that she will catch Sir Joseph when Josephine marries Ralph; Little Butteroccup appears as a jolly peddler, described first by the Boatswain as "the rosiest, the roundest, and the reddest beauty in all Spithead," and then by Captain Corcoran as "a plump and pleasing person," in respective outbursts of alliterative admiration. Depth is added to her character

21. Ibid., 29
by the foreshadowing utterance "Remorse, remorse!" in the exposition of the play, indicating that all may not be well with the conscience of the jolly peddler. Her transition from meekness to an offended foreboding manner upon having been rejected by the Captain also adds depth to Buttercup's characterization.

Josephine, in spite of certain naive traits, evidenced in her initial appraisal of Sir Joseph as a possessor of a "mind of no common order" considering that lesser person would not dare to teach her father "to dance the hornpipe on the cabin table," is not nearly as naive as Ralph. She soon realizes the true worth of Sir Joseph, and what is more interesting, becomes aware of the possible consequences of her elopement with Ralph: drudgery and squalor, seen by her with a quasi-Dickensian starkness.

Captain Corcoran, the only multi-dimensional male character in the play, is delineated in a manner similar to that of his daughter. Her hesitation between filial duty and true love finds an equivalent in the

22. Ibid., 16.
23. Ibid., 101.
24. Ibid., 116.
25. Ibid., 124-125.
Captain's dilemma pitting his daughter's happiness against a marriage of convenience advantageous to his career. 26 The probability of Josephine being in love with a social inferior is reinforced by her father's regret of the difference in social stations between him and Little Buttercup for whom he shows undeniable affection. 27

The attraction of both Corcorans, father and daughter, to social inferiors may be perceived as a function of foreshadowing, since in the denouement they are revealed to be of humble origins. 28

The lack of unified thought in Pinafore, evident in the different gradations of character depth, is balanced by the plot's concern with a single course of events taking place aboard ship between noon and midnight. This is a close observance of the classical unities of time and place, 29 well matched by the total integration of plot and subplot. The former is represented by Josephine and Ralph and the latter by the other couples, Little Buttercup and the Captain, and Hebe and Sir Joseph, respectively.

Thus, Sir Joseph's actions and dicta delineate his character and also provide situational ethics for

26. Ibid., 106-7
27. Ibid., 122.
Ralph's declaration of his love for Josephine. Similarly, the Captain's reluctant rejection of Little Buttercup's love provides her with motivation to reveal her secret and thus cut him down to her size, while reuniting the young lovers and making amends to Ralph for her mistake.

Corcoran's downfall and Ralph's elevation are predicated on Sir Joseph's false professions of equality, and thus, this trait of the First Lord should be perceived as the main element of complication in the plot, rather than the nefarious acts of the putative villain Deadeye. *HMS Pinafore* parodies melodrama as a genre through diction. Ralph's imprisonment in the ship's dungeon, a favorite device of melodramatic terror-and-pity evocation from Lesueur and Dalayrac to Cherubini and Beethoven (the spectacle of *Fidelio* centers on a dungeon), is followed by a humorously disarming description of that truculent place as lacking a telephone.

Sir Joseph's punishment for his unsettling actions also mocks melodrama. Instead of the shattering end of the evildoer so abundant in the Pixérécourt melodramas, models of their genre, Sir Joseph is forced


32. Smith, 183.
to marry, only half-reluctantly, his pretty cousin. Such
disarming juxtaposition of the truculent elements of
melodrama with deliberately incongruent comic elements
creates a unity of action through its consistent applica-
tion.

The Gilbertian irony underlying the Captain's
wish for an advantageous union between his daughter and
the parvenu Sir Joseph is rather dated. While it must
have seemed droll to Victorian audiences that an officer
of the Royal Navy, certainly not impecunious, and of good
birth to boot, would strive for what amounted to a
misalliance for his daughter, to subsequent generations
such a union would have seemed less and less astonishing.
An irony of greater universality is Sir Joseph's rise to
the highest level of incompetence through political and
bureaucratic acumen. In a description of hierarchic ascent
that anticipates the well-known Peter Principle by almost
a century, and echoes Samuel Pepys' indictment of mis-
management in the Royal Navy two centuries earlier,


Gilbert attacks the awarding of sinecures to incompetent party minions.\textsuperscript{36} The actual target of this satire was W.H. Smith, a Disraeli appointee, who, eventually nicknamed Pinafore Smith, ended up wearing the proverbial shoe, which happened to fit extremely well, Gilbert's disclaimers notwithstanding.\textsuperscript{37}

This social criticism is the only prominently realistic element of the plot. The already described parody of melodramatic violence is hyperbolized to the point of absurdity, and the dénouement with Buttercup's chronologically incredible revelation, is an absurd hyperbole directly beholden to Lewis Carroll or to Edward Lear. Theatrically, this absurd ending is a direct spoof of innumerable happy-ends of operatic melodrama effected by a \textit{deus-ex-machina}.\textsuperscript{38} In terms of historical continuity of style, it is intimately related to the unexpected reprieve of Captain Macheath in The Beggar's Opera (1729). This reprieve is effected without any logical development; it takes place because the beggar contends that the piece must end happily according to current operatic custom.\textsuperscript{39}

\textsuperscript{36} Gilbert and Sullivan, \textit{HMS Pinafore}, 46-53, \textit{passim}.
\textsuperscript{37} Baily, 152.
\textsuperscript{38} Smith, 196.
HMMS Pinafore requires a cast of the following voices: Josephine, soprano; Little Buttercup, contralto; Cousin Hebe, mezzo-soprano; Ralph Rackstraw, lyric tenor; Captain Corcoran, baritone; Dick Deadeye, bass; Sir Joseph Porter, light baritone; Bill Bobstay, bass-baritone; and Bob Becket, bass. The designation of light baritone for the lead comedian is a D'Oyly Carte Company tradition, harking back to the very limited vocal resources of George Grossmith, the excellent comedian engaged by both authors for the title role in The Sorcerer, who stayed on to create every leading comedian's role in subsequent Savoy operas. It is worth noting that beside such followers of the Grossmith tradition as D'Oyly Carte's Henry Lytton, Martin Green, and the contemporary John Reed, there are performances of the Grossmith roles by such an unlikely singer as Sir Geraint Evans, a dramatic baritone principally known for his interpretations of Verdi roles. These performances, conducted by Sir Malcolm Sargent, who was a pioneer in the restoration of Sullivan's original orchestrations before World War II, demonstrate that the Savoy operas have very much to gain from a cast of genuine

41. Baily, 143.
43. Baily, 439.
singers, as opposed to the vocal hopefuls that seem to be engaged with increasing frequency by the current D'Oyly Carte Opera Company. The character of the voices required by the Savoy scores, with a few exceptions, is one di grazia, rather than one di forza. In this respect these works approximate the pre-1840 operatic practice—barring coloratura—with its emphasis on clarity and balance. A certain amount of dancing ability is required of the chorus and principals in every Savoy opera. HMS Pinafore requires it in two instances: a sailors' horn-pipe in the first act, and a general dance at the close of the same act.

HMS Pinafore contains two hundred and ninety spoken lines, or approximately eight pages, in a vocal score of one hundred and sixty-seven pages. Ten of these spoken lines were originally a recitativo preceding the second-act Finale. Restoring this recitativo (Fig. 42) may render the rhymed couplet closing the last dialogue less incongruous in relation to the rest of the prose.


46. Gilbert and Sullivan, Pinafore, 61. 47. Ibid., 96.


The Overture

The overture of *HMS Pinafore* consists of material from four numbers in the opera: the jig-like chorus "Then give three cheers" from the Finale I, the second section from the duet "Refrain, audacious tar;" the verse and chorus from the trio "Never mind the why and wherefore," and the hornpipe-like coda from the Finale I. These excerpts are organized into an Allegro-Andante-Allegro sequence, with the last two fragments cited functioning as the first and second subjects of the closing section. At first glance, the overture appears to be a potpourri because of the relative independence of its episodes and their thematic provenance. It is said to have been compiled by Hamilton Clarke (1842-1912), Sullivan's assistant and later a composer of operetta, who also prepared the *Pinafore* medley that propelled along the great success of the opera's initial run.50 A comparison of the overture with its sources shows a few small additions, most of them functioning as framing and transitional devices. The first such device is a timpani roll followed by a bass drum beat at the very beginning of the overture (Example 1, p. xx). The second addition is a seven-measure cadential extension that bridges the Allegro and the following

Andante (Example 2). The third and fourth additions are the sequentially ornamented introduction and bridge to recapitulation in the closing Allegro section. Both are variants of a scalar passage on the dominant in a retrograde relationship to each other (Ex. 3, 4, resp.)


Example 2. Ibid., mm. 45-51.

Example 3. Ibid., mm. 72-78

Example 4. Ibid., mm. 126-131.
The initial perception of a potpourri is strongly supplanted by the Fast-Slow-Fast linear organization of the overture's largest components. This design, spanning three movements of independent internal organization, is reinforced by the tonal scheme in the largest dimensions: the two enveloping Allegri are in E flat major, whereas the middle Andante is in A flat major. Examined in a historic perspective, this structure is beholden to the Italian overture of the Alessandro Scarlatti prototype whose three Fast-Slow-Fast sections of upper-voice busyness over simple harmonic formulas introduced the preclassical style in the Late Baroque period.\textsuperscript{51} In the nineteenth century the scheme reappears in several important works, notably the overtures to Rossini's Guillaume Tell (1829) and Verdi's La Forza del Destino (1862). The former overture features a Fast-Slow-Fast Structure preceded by a brief slow introduction for cello and bass septet.\textsuperscript{52} Its initial Allegro is an abbreviated variant of the storm music in the fourth act,\textsuperscript{53} and it is connected by a brief transition to a pastoral piece, the Andante Ranz des Vaches.\textsuperscript{54} The brilliant Allegro Vivace that closes the overture is a sonata-allegro without

\textsuperscript{51} Grout, 183.  
\textsuperscript{52} Gioacchino Rossini, William Tell Overture (Schott), mm. 1-47.  
\textsuperscript{53} Ibid., mm. 48-175.  
\textsuperscript{54} Ibid., mm. 176-225.
a development section, a common enough occurrence in operatic overtures. Its principal and second subjects have similar rhythmic structures, an element of thematic unity (Examples 5 and 5a). The tonal plan of the overture in the largest dimensions, that is, corresponding to the Fast-Slow-Fast scheme, is E minor-G major-E major, which introduces modified recurrence into these largest dimensions.

Example 5. Gioacchino Rossini, William Tell Overture (Schott), mm. 243-247.

Example 5a. Ibid., mm. 259-262.

Verdi's overture to La Forza del Destino, written a third of a century after Guillaume Tell, still retains the Fast-Slow-Fast basic structure, and a startlingly similar tonal plan, E minor-G major-E major, congruent

55. Ibid., mm. 226-475.

with the major tempo divisions. However, the presence of the principal theme variants in each of these major sections imparts a cyclic character to the piece. Thus, the initial theme (Example 6) links an Allegro, an Andantino and Andante Mosso, and a Presto and Allegro Brillante.


The overture to HMS Pinafore is closer to the Rossinian model, since it has no shared thematic material among its discrete components.

The opening Allegro in 6/8 (Figure 1, p. 88) features an internal structure resembling a truncated rondo form that may be outlined as A B C A A1 (Coda). Its harmonies (analyzed in detail in Figure 21, p. 312) are quite simple, presenting the following outline of tonal levels by phrase (Example 7).

58. Ibid., mm. 51-82.
59. Ibid., mm. 83-263.

A
frame x (mm. 1-4)  a (mm. 4-8)  a1 (mm. 8-12)
I  I ------V  I -------I

B
b (mm. 12-16)  b1 (mm. 16-20)
VI -------V/V VI -------V/V V (HC)

C
c (mm. 20-24)  c1 (mm. 24-28)
V dominant drone pedal --------------V/V V (HC)

A (see A above, mm. 28-36)

A1 (Coda)
a2 (mm. 36-40)  a3 (mm. 40-44)
I tonic bass pedal --------------------- (FC)

Cadential Extension (mm. 45-51) a3 motivic fragmentation.
V VI (DC)  II6/IV  IV6  IV6/IV  V7/IV
V/IV pedal in bass
transition to the subdominant level

The reiterated jig-like rhythmic pattern of this opening E flat major section \( \begin{array}{c}
\text{\textbf{|}} \\
\text{\textbf{|}} \\
\text{\textbf{|}} \\
\text{\textbf{|}} \\
\text{\textbf{|}} \\
\end{array} \) functions as a foreshadowing of the opera's nautical setting, an element of spectacle.
The middle-section Andante, a lyrical interlude, is as simple harmonically as the preceding Allegro (see detailed analysis in Figure 15, mm. 17-30, p.242.). Its tonal levels, in a subdominant relationship with the enveloping sections, present the following outline by phrase (Example 8, and Figure 2, mm. 52-71, p. 89).

Example 8. Ibid. mm. 52-71.

A flat major (letter symbolizations are discrete, and thus, unrelated to their counterparts in Example 7)

A
a (mm. 52-55)  a1 (mm. 55-58)
I tonic pedal (FC)  I------------(FC)

B
b (mm. 58-61)  b1 (mm. 61-64)
I -------II (QC)  V/V -------V (HC)

A1
a (mm. 64-67)  a2 (mm. 67-71)
I tonic pedal (FC)  I------------(FC)

The formal outline of the Andante shows an A B A1 scheme, that is, a ternary form—of with a modified return enhancing the closural quality of the last phrase.

The closing section is longer and considerably more complex than its predecessors (Figures 2 and 3, pp.89 and 90). Its internal organization is a sonata-allegro
without a development, as in the cited Barber of Seville overture (ff. 56). The place of the development is taken by a connecting phrase between the expository and the recapitulative sections (see Example 4, p. 64). The thematic material of this closing Allegro originates, as mentioned, in the Finale I and in the Bell trio, analyzed in detail further in this study. Specifically, the thematic material from the Bell trio’s verse (see Figure 72, mm. 8-31, p. xxx) is used in the first subject of the sonata-allegro, and the thematic material from its chorus is used as a second subject of this movement (see Fig. 29, mm. 31-49). The thematic material from the Finale I (see Fig. 51, mm. 290-350, p. 483) is used in the brief codettas of the exposition and the recapitulation and, in a literal orchestral adaptation, as the Coda that closes the movement.

The entire overture is framed by its timpani opening frame and the closing fanfare in an antecedent/consequent fashion, with the timpani’s implied I V figure answered at the end of the piece by the cornet fanfare on the tonic triad (Example 9).

Example 9. Ibid., Frames in the Largest Dimensions, mm. 1-4, 210-214.
The utter simplicity of the strictly functional harmonies is balanced by the sophisticated linear organization of the thematic material in the closing Allegro. The second of the three thematic elements in the first subject group of the abbreviated sonata-allegro exposition is a negative variant of the principal thematic element of the second subject group (Figure 2, periods b-1 and b, mm. 95-102 and 110-117, respectively, p. 89). This may be perceived as an element of unity balancing the episodic character of the multithematic overture.

There are three fairly prominent tonal digressions from the principal tonal levels of the rather unadventurous tonal plan of the Allegro. The first two are transitionary elements on tertiary and secondary tonal levels, respectively (see Fig. 2, mm. 95-102, and Fig. 3, mm. 145-153, pp. 89 and 90); the third functions as a closural indicator in the largest dimension of the Allegro, since it occurs immediately before the final Coda. Its preclosural function is greatly enhanced by a metric augmentation that is the only departure from the regular four-measure phrasing continuum of the piece (Fig. 3, mm. 178-193). The tertiary digression mentioned above is simply a transition to the dominant carried a step further up the circle of fifths and anchored by an authentic cadence on the dominant of the dominant's dominant. The return to the dominant level is accomplished by a Phrygian inflection.
resolving on that level's dominant (Fig. 2, mm. 102-110, p. 89). The secondary digression in the recapitulation is a transposition of the tertiary one in the exposition one step closer to the main key on the circle of fifths. It links the first and the second subject groups through the same Phrygian inflection in the appropriate tonal level (Fig. 3, mm. 153-162, p. 90.). The exposition of the Allegro Vivace may be outlined as follows by period and subject group (Example 10, and Figure 2).


Key of E flat major

A (1st subject group)
c-1 (mm. 72-78) a (mm. 78-86) a1 (mm. 86-94)
V7 -------------- I------V ---------------II

b-1 (mm. 95-102) a2 (mm. 102-110)
III ---- V/V V/V N6/VI V/V VmT V/V (Phryg. Infl.)

B (2nd subject group)
b (mm. 110-117) c (mm. 117-126) c1 (mm. 126-131)
V -------------- II --V-------- V----------7

A similar outline can be made for the closing movement's recapitulation and coda, again based on the period and subject group symbolizations (Example 10a, and Figure 3).
Example 10a. Ibid., Recapitulation Outline, mm. 131-214.

A (1st subject group) Main Key: E flat major
a3 (mm. 131-139) a4 (139-144) b1 (mm. 145-153)
I ---------V V/V ------V V----------V/V V

a5 (mm. 153-162)
N6/II V ImT V (Phrygian Infl.)

B (2nd subject group)
b2 (mm. 163-170) c2 (mm. 170-178)
I ----------I I----------I

c3 (mm. 178-193)
I----------metric augmentation coincides with
greatest harmonic activity of piece.
closural IV6 V N6/II V/N6/II N6/II V7 ImT
indicator: ____________

full cadential progression; elision to coda:
I6 dVII/V V7 I

Coda (mm. 194-214)
d (mm. 194-201)
I V I V I---- reiteration of preceding full auth. cadence
elision to
d1 (mm. 202-209)

I plagal ornamentation of tonic chord -VI V7 I.
y (mm. 210-214)
I fourfold reiteration of tonic chord in a fanfare.
The orchestration of the overture makes use of the full scoring of the opera in its outer Allegro movements, and of strings, woodwinds, and horns in the middle Andante. The scoring requirements for the entire opera are: two flutes, one doubling on piccolo, oboe, two clarinets, bassoon, two horns, two cornets, two trombones, timpani, snare drum, bass drum and cymbals, triangle, and strings. The percussion parts are so arranged as to enable a single player to perform them. 60

The orchestration is extremely mindful of the problems in dynamic balance inherent in a pit ensemble with fewer strings than the well-provided opera house. The Savoy theatre orchestra's string section seldom exceeded four first violins, two seconds, two violas, two cellos, and a single double-bass. 61

Procedural contrast in the orchestration of this overture may be perceived as an element of shape delineation at the periodic level. Thus, the opening period of the initial Allegro is assigned to the Grand Tutti, all-doubled in such a manner that the four-part homophonic fabric is presented complete in each of the orchestral sections.


woodwinds, brass, and strings (Example 11, p. 79, and Figure 1, mm. 4-12, p. 88). By contrast, the following two periods (Figure 1, mm. 12-20 and 20-28, respectively) are assigned to woodwinds, strings, and horns, in two slightly different procedures of sectional specialization (Examples 11a and 11b, p. 80). The returning initial period and its concluding variant (Fig. 1, mm. 28-36 and 36-44) feature the Grand Tutti orchestration again (see Ex. 11).

The first and second periods of the ternary Andante (Fig. 1, mm. 52-58 and 58-64, p. 38) consist of a polarized melody/accompaniment fabric in the oboe and strings (Example 12, p. 80). The third period, a modified recapitulation of the first (Fig. 1, mm. 64-71), is orchestrated in a manner that emphasizes its modified character: the melody is given to the first violins, doubled in the two lower octaves by the flute and the celli in that order; the accompaniment is distributed among the second violins divisi, the violas, and the bass (Example 12a, p. 80).

The orchestration of the closing Allegro Vivace adheres to the pattern of periodic contrast established in the preceding two movements. The exposition with its three distinctive thematic elements and their respective variants organized into the first and second subject groups features a change in orchestrating procedure in each of the contiguous variants. Thus, thematic contrast is
enhanced by orchestration procedures ranging from parallel section doubling (Example 13, p. 81) through a combination of partial doubling and sectional specialization (Example 13a, p. 81), sectional contrast by the half-phrase (Example 13b, p. 81), sectional specialization (Example 13c, p. 82), and parallel doubling among two sections combined with specialized half-phrase framing in a third section (Example 13d, p. 82). The last example cited is the first Grand Tutti period in the exposition (Figure 2, mm. 117-131, p. 89) after the initial Grand Tutti chord in the Allegro Vivace introductory frame (see Example 3, p. 64). The accreted volume and timbral complexity of the procedure at this point are coincident with the closure of the exposition, and therefore function as an internal frame in the largest dimensions of the Allegro Vivace.

Except for the theme a in the first subject group of the recapitulation (Figure 3, mm. 131-144, p. 90) which is orchestrated as an all-doubled Grand Tutti, the returning thematic material of the recapitulation features the orchestration of its initial statement. The Grand Tutti presentation of the principal theme (Example 13e, p. 83) may be perceived both as an internal frame similar to the closure of the exposition (Example 13d) and as a function of modified recapitulation (compare Ex. 13e to Ex. 13). This last stylistic aspect is consonant with the Romantic composers' attitude towards thematic recurrence. They
treated it as a framework for continuing thematic transformation. It is interesting to observe that this procedure did not necessarily entail substantial changes in harmony, melody, or rhythm. Quite often, a new accompaniment figure or a different instrumental treatment effected the modification of the returning material. The recapitulative procedure in this case belongs to the last category. The return of the second theme of the first subject group (Figure 3, mm. 145-153, p. 90) features a much less considerable modification, exchanging the partial sectional specialization of the initial statement (see Ex. 13a, p. 81) for total sectional specialization (Example 13f, p. 83).

The coda (Figure 3, mm. 196-214, p. 90) is orchestrated to match the Grand Tutti frames of the exposition (see Examples 3, 13d, and 13e, pp. 64, 82, and 83, resp.). It is the most extensive Grand Tutti section in the third movement of the overture, which provides this movement with a closural frame. Since the opening section of the first movement of the overture (Figure 1, mm. 1-44, p. 88) is also a Grand Tutti, the coda may be perceived also as a closural frame in the largest dimensions of the overture. Two different treatments of the Grand Tutti lay-out may be

discerned in the coda: one, involving a certain amount of sectional specialization, begins the coda (Example 13g, p. 84). The other, featuring massive parallel doubling between the three principal orchestral sections (Example 13h, p. 84), takes the coda to the resolution of its final cadence. The final chord is extended by reiteration in a return to partial sectional specialization (Example 13j, p. 85). This extension of the final chord into a brief fanfare frames the closing Allegro movement, since its beginning consists, like the closing fanfare, of a sectional unison juxtaposed against a Grand Tutti chord. A cognate element, both in a functional and a structural context, is the internal frame bridging the exposition and the recapitulation in the Allegro Vivace (see Examples 3 and 4, p. 64), since it also consists of a sectional unison punctuated by Grand Tutti chords.

The first and second violin parts of the Allegro Vivace feature an optional figuration in the measures 117-120 and 170-185. This optional figuration is much less idiomatic for strings than the double figures of the first alternative, but has the advantage of covering both upper voices in a linear, broken-chord, fashion. The assignment of this broken-chord figuration to both first and second violins has a balancing and compensatory effect in an orchestra with an exceedingly small string section (Example 13k, p. 85).
Example 11. Sullivan, Overture to HMS Pinafore, set of orchestral parts, D'Oyly Carte Opera Co. facsimile (Kalmus), mm. 4-12, passim.

Example 11a. Ibid., mm. 12-20, passim.
Example 11b. Ibid., mm. 20-28, passim.

Example 12. Ibid., mm. 52-64, passim.

Example 12a. Ibid., mm. 64-71, passim.
Example 13. Ibid., mm. 78-94, passim.

Example 13a. Ibid., mm. 95-102, passim.

Example 13b. Ibid., mm. 102-110.
Example 13c. Ibid., mm. 110-117, passim.

Example 13d. Ibid., mm. 117-126, passim.
Example 13e. Ibid., mm. 131-144, passim.

Example 13f. Ibid., mm. 145-153, passim.


The fabric and texture outline of the overture shows a homophonic texture throughout the opening Allegro (Figure 1, mm. 1-44, p. 88). The simple and heavy texture of the outer periods a, a', and a1 (Figure 1, mm. 4-12, 28-36, and 36-44, respectively) encloses the lighter and slightly more complex texture of the inner periods b and c (Fig. 1, mm. 12-20 and 20-28, respectively). This organization of textural contrast enhances the perception of the opening Allegro's repeat form outline in its largest dimensions (see Example 7, capital letter symbolizations, p. 68).

The fabric of the Andante (Fig. 1, mm. 52-71) is polarized between the melody and the accompaniment. Its texture is very light throughout, and simple in the first and second periods (Fig. 1, mm. 52-58 and 58-64, resp.). The complexity of the fabric is somewhat increased in the third period by the more elaborate orchestration (see Ex. 12a, p. 80), and may be perceived as one of the elements of recapitulative modification. The overall textural weight and complexity of the Andante are the lightest and the simplest of the overture's three movements. This feature is congruent with the I IV I tonal plan and the Fast-Slow-Fast tempo structure of the overture in its largest dimensions (see Figures 1, 2, and 3, pp. 88, 89, and 90, respectively).
The fabric of the closing movement's exposition is polarized between melody and accompaniment in the first subject group (see Examples 13, 13a, 13b, p. 81) and homophonic in the second subject group (see Examples 13c and 13d, p. 82). Both types of fabric have some admixture of sectional specialization. The recapitulation features a similar distribution of polarized and homophonic fabrics, with the important difference that its homophonic fabric section extends into the rather substantial coda (Figure 3, mm. 194-214). This increase in the scope of the homophonic section, placed at the very end of the recapitulation frames not only that section, but also the entire movement, in view of a similar but shorter framing procedure in the exposition. In an even larger context, the homophonic coda frames the entire overture, since the beginning of the overture is also homophonic (see Examples 11, 13g, and 13h, pp. 75 and 84, respectively). The texture of the Allegro Vivace is mostly of a medium complexity. Its weight varies from medium with brief increases and decreases in the exposition to heavy with brief decreases of various degrees in the recapitulation -- a function of recapitulative modification (Figure 4, p. 91).
Allegro (letter symbols indicate recurrence only within movements)

4 mm. phrases 7
2 mm. periods 7

Figure 1. Arthur Sullivan, "Allegro, Andante," Overture to HMS Pinafore, mm. 1-71.
Figure 2. Sullivan, "Allegro Vivace, Exposition," Overture to HMS Pinafore, mm. 71-131.
Figure 3. Sullivan, "Allegro Vivace, Recapitulation." Overture to HMS Pinafore, mm. 131-214.
Figure 4. Sullivan, *Overture to HMS Pinafore*, Fabric and Texture Outline.
CHAPTER III

No. 1: INTRODUCTION AND OPENING CHORUS

The Introduction: Structural Redundance Turned to Functional Advantage

The opening number of the opera begins with an orchestral prelude of greater length and complexity (Fig. 5, p. 142) than the chorus it introduces (Fig. 6, p. 143). Since it follows a full-length overture (Chapter II, Figures 1, 2, 3, pp. 88-90) such a prelude may seem somewhat redundant. Furthermore, the complexity of the introduction's middle section (Fig. 5, section B) in combination with the material it shares with the chorus (Figure 5, outer sections A and A1) has a tendency to overwhelm the very number it ought to announce. This formal awkwardness resulted from the post-hoc addition of an overture to the finished opera, and the subsequent unwillingness to excise it in view of the popularity of the work in toto. However, some elements of the prelude are absent in the overture: the middle section of the introduction (Fig. 5, section B) foreshadows the plot's disturbing elements through its mode and key contrasts, textural complexity and timbral variety. The section B is

in effect a symphonic development, such as might have
gaced the overture. The thematic material of section B
in Table 2 consists of modified quotes from the entrance
numbers of Josephine, Little Buttercup, and Captain
Corcoran (Examples 14, 14a, 15, 15a, 16, and 16a).

Chorus," HMS Pinafore, mm. 20-22.

Example 14a. Gilbert and Sullivan, "No. 5, Ballad,"
HMS Pinafore, 30, mm. 5-7

Example 15. Sullivan, "Introduction and Opening Chorus,"
HMS Pinafore, mm. 28-31.

HMS Pinafore, 12, mm. 8-10.
Example 16. Sullivan, "Introduction and Opening Chorus,"
**HMS Pinafore**, mm. 39-40.

Example 16a. Gilbert and Sullivan, "No. 4, Song,"
**HMS Pinafore**, 24, mm. 1-2.

Figs. 5 and 6 (pp. 142-3) an symbol outlines in them (Example 13, p. 81) show a three-part (A B A1) and a two-part (A A1) structure in the Introduction and Chorus, respectively. The structural differentiation in the threepart Introduction is achieved both through total thematic contrast and thematic variation, the former occurring between sections A and B, and the latter between sections A and A1 in Fig. 5. In the Chorus, the structural differentiation is brought about through thematic variation alone at the sectional level (sections A and A1, resp. in Fig. 6, p. 143) with thematic contrast occurring only at periodic level (periods a, b, b1, a1+b2, and a2).

In the Introduction (Figure 5) the contrasting sections are arranged in a symmetrical fashion. Thus, the outer sections A and A1 (mm. 1-20 and 52-62, resp.) feature static harmonies, confined to the tonic and
dominant in period a, with the addition of the subdominant in period b of section A, and to the tonic, dominant, and the dominant of the dominant in periods a2 and b1 of section A1. The lack of harmonic digression in these sections is emphasized by a tonic pedal in the bass under the entire section A, except for its last two measures, which form a transition to section B by modulating to the mediant (mm. 19-20). A similar tonal anchoring appears in section A1, which has a dominant pedal in the bass underlying it in its entirety. This replacement of a tonic pedal by a dominant one without any transpositions in the melody between a and a2 transforms the entire section A1 into a dominant indicator by making its predominant tonic components in the melody and chordal accompaniment in lower middle instruments function as I6 elements. The pedals also reflect the upward shift along the circle of fifths of the harmonies in the two abovementioned sections: from I-V-IV in section A to I-V/V-V in section A1.

The orchestration of sections A and A1 features massive doubling. The melody/chordal accompaniment fabric is distributed between the corresponding treble, middle-range, and bass instruments in the different choirs as follows: melody - flutes, oboe, clarinets, violins, unison and octave doubling; mid-range accomp. - cornets, horns, trombone I, violas divisi; bass - cellos and basses in octaves, trombone II with cellos, bassoon with
basses in octaves. The timpani play a melodically undifferentiated tonic pedal, whereas the tonic pedal in the other bass instruments is melodically differentiated into stressed quarter notes (Example 17).

Example 17. Gilbert and Sullivan, "Introduction and Opening Chorus," HMS Pinafore, set of orchestral parts, mm. 4-6.

This interchoric doubling prevents the perception of individual instrumental colors, which matches the static character of the harmony in sections A and A1. The wisdom of Sullivan's choice of cornets rather than trumpets as the brass treble becomes apparent in this instance: the softer tone of the cornet allows it to blend well with horns and violas. This manner of orchestration also enhances through its composite, and hence homogenized
texture the homophonic fabric of the sections A and A1. The dynamic level of these sections is, as may be expected from the Grand Tutti orchestration, fortissimo, and it is indicated as such.

The metric hierarchy in sections A and A1 is established very forcefully by the active continuum, which consists of the surface rhythms $\text{ABA}$ and $\text{ABA}$ (periods a and b, respectively) and the uninterrupted pattern $\text{ABA}$ in the accompaniment, reinforced by the previously mentioned tonic and dominant pedals (Example 17, p. 96). The congruence of the stressed elements in the surface rhythmic patterns with those in the continuum results in a homorhythmic fabric, which, in turn, matches the total timbral blend, the homophonic fabric, and single dynamic level of the sections under consideration.

Section B (Figure 5, mm. 20-53, p. 142) features an increase in harmonic activity, a variety of timbral textures as a result of a more heterogeneous orchestration, and a divergence between the established continuum and the surface rhythmic patterns. It is interesting to note a symmetrical construction within section B itself: its homophonic fabric is replaced by a polyphonic one at z+a1 (mm. 39-46), that is, at the central period of the section. This period is followed by y1, which returns to a homophonic fabric (mm. 46-52). The dynamics
are indicated piano in the periods w, y, and z+a1; as well as in almost all of y1, except for the last four measures of that period (mm. 49-52), which are indicated molto crescendo. The dynamic characteristics of section B may be charted in the following manner (Example 18):

Thus, Example 18 shows the section B as an orchestrated crescendo by virtue of the progressive additions of instrumental texture layers with the resultant increase in volume. In terms of instrumental color, the section progresses from a juxtaposition of individual timbres against a contrasting sectional accompaniment (levels 1 and 2, Example 18) to a juxtaposition of sectionally specialized textures (levels 3 to 7, Example 18), culminating in a fully doubled Grand Tutti (level 8, Example 18).

The divergence between the established rhythmic continuum and the surface rhythmic patterns in section B is greatest in the period w (Fig. 5, mm. 20–27, p. 142), whose eighth-note triplets in the melody create a polyrhythmic effect against an accompaniment of eighth-note duplets. The effect is enhanced by the contrasting timbres assigned to the divergent elements. The divergence decreases in the periods y and y1 (Fig. 5, mm. 28–38 and 45–52, respectively) because the combination of a syncopated surface pattern and an augmented continuum pattern in the bass result in a perception of the rhythmic continuum proper (Example 19), hocketed, as it were.

Example 19. Small dimension rhythmic pattern interaction, Introduction and Opening Chorus, H.M.S. Pinafore, mm. 20–27, passim.
The surface rhythmic patterns of the period z+a1 are congruent with the continuum; the contrasting element in this period (Figure 5, mm. 39-44, p. 142) is its contrapuntal fabric, which stands out boldly against the predominant homophony of the piece.

The manner in which the rhythmic continuum is presented in the piece is worth a separate observation. Its assertive ostinato character in section A, its subsequent weakening through textural thinning and melodic differentiation into an Alberti bass pattern (periods, x, y, y1) and through polychoric fragmentation into a quodlibet (Fig. 5, sect. B, period z+a1, p. 142), and its return to the initial assertiveness in section A1 parallels the symmetrical arrangement of the other structural elements in the piece. (Example 20).


Sections A and A1, mm. 3-19 and 52-62, resp., passim.

Section B, mm. 20-51, passim.
Example 20 shows the manner in which the metric continuum is constantly emphasized in the piece: the presence of the emphasizing element (even eighth-notes) is constant, but its intensity is variable according to indicated and orchestrated dynamics.

Taking into account all the enumerated structural elements of the piece and the manner of their arrangement, its overall symmetrical outer form may be outlined as follows:


Introduction sections:

A

Binary periodic structure
Homophonic fabric only
Static harmonies
Homogeneous mixed timbre
single dynamic level (f)
Metric continuum emphasized
major mode throughout

B

Chainlike per. structure
Homo/poly/homo fabric
modulatory harmonies
heterogeneous timbres
orchestrated cresc.

Metric continuum
subdued
50% minor mode

section A1 has the same above features as section A.

The symmetry of the piece is not as complete as that of a Da Capo form of the eighteenth century Italian opera with its literal restatement of the first part following the second. 2 The return of the initial section

---

shows considerable variation; the two identical phrases of period a are replaced in period a2 by a combination of the original first phrase and a variant of the second phrase, which extends the first two notes of the fourth half phrase over a secondary dominant absent in the exposition (Example 22).

Example 22. Sectional variation, periods a and a2. Introduction and Opening Chorus, *HMS Pinafore*. mm. 4-12 and 52-60.

The period b of the exposition is compressed into a half-phrase in the recapitulation. This passage, labeled b1, consists almost exclusively of a reiteration of the characteristic anacrustic pattern \( \overline{3/4} \), which first appears in every other measure of the period a, twice, once, and three times, respectively, in every measure of the period b (Fig. 5, periods a and b, p. 142), and finally, with greatly increased rhythmic density, closes the Introduction in the half-phrase c1. (Example 23).

Example 23. Increase in anacrustic pattern incidence, periods a (a1, a2), b, and b1, Table 1, p. xxx.
Other variations in the return of the initial material in section A₁ are insertions of secondary dominants before each dominant at phrase ends in the period a₂ (see Example 22), and the already mentioned shift from a tonic pedal in the bass to a dominant one. This dominant pedal, which prepares the final cadence in a forceful manner, also shows an alteration in the Timpani part: in the period a₁ the Timpani underscore the metric continuum, whereas in the period a₂ they alternate between this function and the underscoring of the surface rhythmic pattern (Example 24).

Example 24. Timpani part, periods a₁, a₂, Introduction and Opening Chorus, HMS Pinafore, mm. 3-16, and 53-60, respectively.

\[\text{Example 24. Timpani part, periods a₁, a₂, Introduction and Opening Chorus, HMS Pinafore, mm. 3-16, and 53-60, respectively.}\]

\[\text{A significant variation in the half-phrase b₁ is the emphasis in the accompaniment of the continuum macrocomponents } N/N/N \text{ rather than the pattern } N/N/N/N.\]

This agogic stress occurs together with a $V_7$ and marks the culmination of a dominant pedal in the bass with $I_6$, $V$, and $V/V$ harmonies above it. The imminent presence of a final cadence, announced by these devices is intensified further by the extended leading tone character of the melodic pattern in the half-phrase b₁, which in turn is intensified by the already described reiteration of the
anacrusic pattern $M$, itself a highly differentiated microcomponent of the metric continuum. As these variants occur in conjunction with the culmination of a dominant-tonic progression, they may be considered as structural framing devices together with the resolution into I, which marks the overlapping end of the Introduction and the beginning of the Chorus (Example 25).

Example 25. Structural variances as framing devices, Introduction and Opening Chorus, HMS Pinafore, mm. 61-63.

The tonal frames determined by the cadences ending each period of the outer sections A and A1 show a distinctly symmetrical pattern in terms of harmonically open or closed linear structures. (Example 26).

Example 26. Tonal frames, Introduction and Opening Chorus, HMS Pinafore, mm. 1-63, passim.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a</td>
<td>w, y, a1+z, y1</td>
<td>a2 half-phrase b1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>closed open</td>
<td>modulatory</td>
<td>I open V closed I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Binary form---</td>
<td>Var. +chain form</td>
<td>Abbrev. binary form</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Example 26 shows a linear organization of thematic material combining binary and ternary features. At periodic level there are two binary structures, sections A and A1, and a hybrid combination of chain form and altered recurrence in section B (periods w, y, z+a1, and y1). Sectional symbolizations suggest a ternary form—of. Its altered recapitulation (Fig. 5, section A1, p. 89) shows a procedure favored by the Romantics. However, in keeping with the modest durational scope of the piece, the alteration of the thematic material is concurrent with a change of harmonic function in the same key (I to I6, and V to V/4 rather than with the radical key changes of the Romantics.3

The origin of the multiple themes in section B is to be found, as discussed earlier, in the entrance numbers of Josephine, Little Buttercup, and Captain Corcoran (Examples 14 through 16a, pp. 93-94). The provenance of the thematic material in sections A and A1 is not so remote: section A is a literal instrumental version of the section A in the Opening Chorus (Fig. 6, section A, periods a and b, p. 143). While the rhythmic and tonal modifications of the original thematic material in section B make an analysis of prosodic influences on that material irrelevant unless it be in the context of the original numbers, the thematic material of sections A and A1 shows

a direct relationship between textual scansion and surface rhythmic patterns as it anticipates note by note the outer sections of the choral number it precedes.

The Chorus: a Flattering Self-Description and Characterization by Genre

Gilbert's lyrics for the Opening Chorus are cast in a quatrain and a tail-rhyme sestain of iambic trimeters. The initial quatrain (Ex. 27) with a rhyme scheme of abab\textsubscript{3} is a standard variant of the ballad stanza: the so-called Half Metre.\textsuperscript{4}

Example 27. W. S. Gilbert, "We Sail the Ocean Blue;"
HMS Pinafore, Act I.

\[
\begin{align*}
1. & \quad \text{We sail the ocean blue,} \\
2. & \quad \text{And our saucy ship's a beauty;} \\
3. & \quad \text{We're sober men and true,} \\
4. & \quad \text{And attentive to our duty!}
\end{align*}
\]

The sixain that follows features a codeed\textsubscript{3} rhyming scheme (Example 29, p. 110). The resultant tail-rhyme stanza ought to be perceived as an extension of the preceding balladic quatrain rather than an independent instance of the rime couée.\textsuperscript{5}

\textsuperscript{5} Ibid., 26.
The nominally isometric character of the text's iambic trimeters is varied by metric irregularities. The initial quatrain features a second and fourth lines that are both anacrusic and hypermetric, that is, they begin and end on a supernumerary unstressed syllable (Example 27). The quatrain was set by Sullivan in a manner that varies a predominantly accentual approach through the introduction of quantitative elements at the end of each line. The accentual setting, which matches stressed and unstressed elements of the text with corresponding musical elements of equal duration, reflects the prevalent poetic pronunciation in English. The quantitative treatment of the last stressed syllable in each line, a procedure clearly derived from the classical Greek prosody, enhances the stanzaic structure of the text, delineating the surface melodic patterns against the metric continuum at the same time. Additional contrast is introduced into the word-setting manner by Sullivan through the occasional neumatic treatment of a vowel in the predominantly syllabic setting. Paradoxically, this procedure provides the vocal line with diversity while contributing to the uniformity of the surface rhythmic patterns; the first syllable of


7. Ibid., 93.
the initial iamb in the first line is set neumatically \( \text{ɪ} \), whereas the two unstressed syllables of the anapaestic anacrusis beginning the second line are set syllabically \( \text{ɪ} \) \( \text{ɪ} \) \( \text{ɪ} \) \( \text{ɪ} \) \( \text{ɪ} \) \( \text{ɪ} \) \( \text{ɪ} \). (Example 28, p. 109.). The setting of the third and the fourth lines follows the same pattern (Fig. 6, mm. 68 and 70, respectively, p. 143).

The assignment of a longer note value to the last syllable of every line results in a syncopated ending in the hypermetric second and fourth lines, since they end on a unstressed syllable. This contrasts with the simple elongation of a stressed syllable in the first and third—half-phrase framing elements—and provides additional elements to whole-phrase framing. Thus, the larger structural unit is framed by increased complexity (Ex. 28).

The harmonic rhythm in this period, as in the corresponding initial period of the Introduction (Example 13, p. 81), is rather static, since its harmony alternates between tonic and dominant over a tonic pedal in the bass within each musical phrase \( \text{I-V-I} \). The melodic character of the period A is markedly triadic, with the second half-phrase being a tonal variant of the first one (Fig. 6, mm. 67-68 and 71-72, with corresponding anacrases, respectively, p. 143). The melodic triads that make up each half-phrase are embellished by the upper neighbor of the fifth in the first half-phrase and by the upper neighbors of the third and the fifth in the second. In the first half-phrase the
melody rises from and falls back to the tonic, while in the second half-phrase the melody rises from the dominant triad’s third and falls back to the dominant itself before rising again to the tonic on the phrase’s largest melodic interval in congruence with the described agogic frame and syncopated ending (Example 28).

Example 28. Opening Chorus, HMS Pinafore, mm. 64-68.

The next six lines of the text are fitted by Sullivan into the same amount of measures (nine) as the preceding four lines, with the resultant increase in rhythmic density created by the much more frequent textual events within the same amount of rhythmic continuum of the music (Fig. 6, periods a and b, respectively, p. 143). The prosodic irregularities which manifested themselves as anacrustic and hypermetric syllables in the second and fourth lines (Example 27, p. 106) appear in the following six lines as anapaestic feet with the
same frequency as the nominally predominant iamb (Example 29). It is interesting to observe the subtlety with which these anapaests are introduced into the text. At first, they appear as the already mentioned supernumerary syllables in the anacruses of the second and fourth lines. At that point their anapaestic character is underplayed both by their anacrusaic function and by the lack of congruence between their stressed syllables and the semantic structure of the lines: "And our sau-. . . And atten-. . . ." By contrast, the anapaests in the remaining six lines appear both at the beginning of the line (Example 29, first, second, fourth, and fifth lines) and in its middle (Example 29, first, third, fourth, and sixth lines). In two instances they appear in both manners in the same line, substituting the iambic trimeter by an anapaestic dimer (Example 29, first and third lines).

Example 29. W. S. Gilbert, "We Sail the Ocean Blue, HMS Pinafore, Act I.

When the balls whistle free, c
O'er the bright blue sea, c
We stand to our guns all day; d
When at anchor we ride e
On the Portsmouth tide, e
We've plenty of time to play. d
The anapaests are set by Sullivan with the same figure he used in the period a for the anacrusae. \( \overline{\text{\textdollar\textdollar}} \). Naturally, the increased incidence of the anapaests results in an increased appearance of this anacrustic figure in the music. This procedure shows parallel processes used by both authors, with both the textual anapaest (Ex. 27, p. 106, and 29, respectively) and the anacrustic figure \( \overline{\text{\textdollar\textdollar}} \). (Example 30) progressing from minor structural elements in period a to major ones in period b. The use of the figure \( \overline{\text{\textdollar\textdollar}} \) by Sullivan is a particularly pithy and elegant manner of variation, since its being the only musical motive with a higher rhythmic differentiation than a mere multiple of the continuum \( \overline{\text{\textdollar\textdollar\textdollar\textdollar}} \) eases its recognition by the listener as an element of variation and unity at once.

Example 30. Motivic relationship between periods a and b, Opening Chorus, *HMS Pinafore*, mm. 63-80, passim.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period a</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>( \overline{\text{\textdollar\textdollar}} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( \overline{\text{\textdollar\textdollar}} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( \overline{\text{\textdollar\textdollar\textdollar\textdollar}} )</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period b</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>( \overline{\text{\textdollar\textdollar}} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( \overline{\text{\textdollar\textdollar\textdollar\textdollar}} )</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The increase in rhythmic density caused by the reiteration of the anacrustic figure, which differentiates
period b from period a, is matched in period b by a denser melodic activity evident in the shift from triadic structure in period a (Example 28, p. 109) to a scalewise structure with greater melodic excursions and wider range in period b. Also, there is an increase of the neumatic element in the period b, consisting of the reiteration of the pattern independently of the anapaests which it delineates as its primary function (Example 31).


Other structural features in period b also contrast with their correspondents in period a. The tenor-bass unison of the first period is replaced by an octave treatment (mm. 72-74), followed by a division into three-part harmony (tenor I, II, bass) in the second half-phrase (mm. 75-76) in the second period. The harmonies in period b become gradually more active, with the tonic bass pedal, a carry-over from period a, ending together with period b's first phrase (Fig. 6, m. 76, p. 143), as if clearing the way for the forthcoming modulation to the mediant in the fourth half-phrase of period b (Fig. 6, mm. 79-80).
The periods a and b of the Opening Chorus (Fig. 6, mm. 63-80, p. 143) feature a complete setting of the libretto's ten-line poem, without any textual repetition or fragmentation. The period b1, which both concludes the section A and provides a transition to section A1 (Fig. 6, mm. 80-87), is set to a reiteration of the fifth, sixth, and seventh lines of the text, slightly modified and preceded in the first two reiterations by the traditional nautical call "Ahoy!" (Example 32) interpolated in the manner of a runaway yell, a frequent feature of sea shanty refrains (Example 33).

Example 32. Opening Chorus, HMS Pinafore, mm. 80-87.


The partial reiteration which extends the text from period b to period b1 is matched by the musical procedure setting it. The closing cadence of period b (III\textsuperscript{4} \textsubscript{7/III} - III) and to a certain point the corresponding melodic pattern provide the basis for the harmonic and melodic structure of period b1 (Example 34).

Example 34. Opening Chorus, HMS Pinafore, mm. 79-80 and 80-82, respectively.

![Music notation]

The melodic and cadential patterns of the first half of the period b1 are such that there may be two possible phrases of two measures each discerned in the first four measures of period b1 (Fig. 6, mm. 80-82 and 82-84, respectively, p. 143), in contrast to the corresponding single four-measure phrases of periods a and b (Fig. 6, mm. 64-68 and 72-76, respectively). The halved phrase length, the minor mode of the mediant tonal level, and the scalewise melodic structure (Example 34) are the principal elements of contrast between period b1 and the preceding periods, which are in the major mode at the tonic level, and whose melodic structure progresses from triadic in period a (Example 28, p. 109) to a mixture of leaps and
hexachords in period b (Example 31, p. 112). The scalewise character of the first two phrases in period b1 besides providing one of the above mentioned elements of contrast may be seen as the culmination of a growth progression in melodic density from triadic to scalewise. This is reinforced by the similar but not entirely congruent progress in rhythmic density which reaches its high point in the period b (see pp. 113–114), and remains at this level of intensity throughout period b1 (Example 32, p. 113). The rhythmic density of the period b1 may be ascribed to a relationship between text and music similar to that of period b (Figure 6, p. 143), since the reiterated text of the period b1 shows the same metric irregularities (Example 32, p. 113) as that of period b (Example 31, p. 112), treated with a similar alternation of syllabic and neumatic elements.

The hexachordal structure of the first two phrases in period b1 gives way to a melodic ostinato on a minor third, and this static melody coincides with a decrease in rhythmic density. The decrease is gradual and at its least dense becomes congruent with the metric continuum (Example 35).

Example 35. Opening Chorus, HMS Pinafore, mm. 84–87, transition to recapitulation.
In addition to providing a contrasting element to the preceding periods, the first half of period b1 may be seen as a framing device. This function is perceivable in several of its interrelated forms—in, directly in some instances, indirectly in others. The most direct framing function may be discerned in the doubled incidence of authentic cadential patterns in both harmony and melody at the local tonal level, with the concomitant halving of phrase-length and increase in melodic density (Example 35, p. 115). The more indirect framing functions consist of forms—in and procedures that enhance by contiguity the above mentioned cadential patterns, while contrasting with their own preceding counterparts. Thus, the manner of vocal setting of the runaway yell interpolation "Ahoy!" introduces a new texture into the piece by assigning the "Ahoy!" to the tenors and the alternating textual reiterations to the basses (Example 32, p. 113) in a linear fragmentation reminiscent of the medieval procedure of hocketing; in particular of the hocketed chaces; or hunting songs, with their interpolated hunting cries (Example, 36).

Example 36 Excerpt from a 14th Century French Chace, in Gustave Reese, Music in the Middle Ages (New York: W.W. Norton, 1940), 335.
The hocketing itself merely calls attention to the other framing devices through textural contrast. However, the textual and generic implications of the runaway yell "Ahoy!" constitute a framing device by themselves, since the runaway yell usually announces a concluding section in sea shanties (Example 33, p. 113).

While the formal function of the first two phrases in period b1 is one of framing, the remainder of the period functions as a transitionary device. Its melodic activity diminishes to an ostinato on a minor third, and its rhythmic density decreases to a gradual congruence with the continuum pulse (Example 34, p. 114). This melodic and rhythmic effacement coincides with an increase in harmonic activity which begins as an alternation of III chords with VII₆/VII over a III pedal in the bass (Fig. 6, mm. 84-85, p. 143). and rises to the highest level of harmonic activity with the progression V₂ VI₄ V₆ VII₆ VII₆/II V₇ over every continuum pulse in the last two measures of the transition (Table 2a, mm. 86-87). These harmonies weaken the local tonal level established by the preceding authentic cadential patterns on the mediant (Figure 6, mm. 80-84) and so prepare the recapitulation on the tonic (Figure 6, m. 88).

The return of period a marks the beginning of the section A₁, a recapitulatory variant of section A. The restatement of the period a is identical to the initial presentation in every aspect except its orchestration
and its choral treatment. The orchestration of the restatement is much fuller than that of the initial period a, and the doubling of the basses by the tenors at the octave in the restatement matches the new orchestration's volume and brilliance (Example 37, a and b).

Example 37. Opening Chorus, **HMS Pinafore**, mm. 63-66, and 87-89, respectively.
This Grand Tutti orchestration contrasts with that of the entire section A, which consists of partial tuttis, and may be outlined as follows:

Example 36. Outline of the orchestration, Opening Chorus, 
_**HMS Pinafore**, mm. 63-87.

![Orchestration Diagram]

It is worth noting that the period b1, which contrasts with the previous two periods in every aspect of text setting (Fig. 6, per. b, 143), also contrasts in orchestration. The juxtaposition of the tenor voices with the bass voices and the consequent timbral contrast is enhanced by the corresponding juxtaposition of the doubling woodwinds. This feature, coupled with an overall lightening in texture, contrasts subtly but effectively with the massive doubling
of the semi-tuttis in periods a and b (Example 40).

Example 40. Opening Chorus, HMS Pinafore, mm. 80-82.

The restated period a is followed by one combining the rhythmic pattern of motive a \( \frac{3}{4} \) with the repetitive anacrusic pattern \( \frac{3}{4} \) of period b. This period, designated \( a_1+b_2 \) (Fig. 6, section A1, p. 143), resembles the period b1 in its textual handling and phrasing pattern; it is set to reiterations of the previous period's text and its three phrases have the same quantitative measure pattern as those of period b1 plus one more measure in the third phrase (Example 41).

Example 41. Opening Chorus, HMS Pinafore, mm. 80-87 and 95-104, respectively.
The textual repetition in the period \( a_1+b_2 \) is an irregular inversion of the line order in the period \( a \). Consequently, the last line of the chorus set to music is "We sail the ocean blue!" which is also the initial line of the chorus. The text in the musical setting thereby attains a certain symmetry, absent in the original poem, somewhat reminiscent of the poetic rondeau. The word-setting in the period \( a_1+b_2 \) is based strictly upon accentual scansion, and it is completely syllabic. This allows the self-characterizing descriptions of the text to be perceived clearly and repeatedly by the listener.

The only exception to the accentual setting comes on the very last two feet of the poem: the words "ocean blue" are set to a sustained note spanning two measures and a full measure, respectively, over the final cadence of the chorus. This change of scansion is enhanced by the orchestral accompaniment, which changes over from the continuum \( \uparrow \uparrow \uparrow \downarrow \downarrow \) to its macrocomponent \( \uparrow \downarrow \downarrow \) (Fig. 6, mm. 102-4, p. 143). This agogic procedure, coincident with authentic cadential elements, is a framing device which resembles the transition and frame between the Introduction and the Chorus: with a similar handling of the macrocomponents (Example 25, p. 104). In both instances, the sudden absence of the continuum figure, present almost everywhere else in the piece, is the most readily perceivable single element in a compound framing device.
The choral treatment in the period $a_1+b_2$ is in the sixth-chord style, reminiscent of the fauxbourdon technique. The orchestration of the period up to the last three measures is fashioned around these parallel sixth-chords, and the resultant homophonic fabric contrasts with the melody/accompaniment fabric in the rest of the piece. The parallel sixth-chord structure is distributed over a three-octave span among the oboe, the bassoon, two horns, violas, cellos, and basses. The top voice of the sixth-chord passage is melodically ornamented with a fivefold reiteration of the anacrusis pattern $\text{I}$. This ornamentation is assigned to the second flute, clarinets, first and second violins, in unison, the entire passage being doubled by the first flute at the octave, which imparts additional brilliance to it. The brass and timpani join the passage at the end of the shortened phrase, enhancing both the cadential resolution and the hypermetric syllable of the line. (Example 42).

Example 42. Opening Chorus, *HMS Pinafore*, mm. 95-97.
As in the period b1, the two halved identical phrases of a1+b2 are followed by a phrase of prevalent length (Example 41, p.120), and, as in period b1, the longer third phrase is of a transitionary character ending on an authentic cadence in the tonic. But, the latter’s cadence resolves in a metrically stronger manner, while the former’s is dovetailed with the initial anacrusis of the following period. The orchestration of both closing phrases in the periods cited above reflects both their differences and their similarities: both feature an increase of volume due to added instruments. The resultant increase in volume thus achieved is gradual in b1 because of the indicated crescendo, and it is only two measures long. The instruments chosen for this addition to the already playing strings are the oboe and the bassoon, whose relatively moderate loudness makes this crescendo a subtle one. By contrast, the increase in volume in a1+b2 is sudden and much more dramatic, since it consists of the addition of two cornets and two trombones to the rest of the orchestra. This terraced increase in volume is five measures long, and consequently it contrasts with the preceding shorter phrases, rather than contrasting with the first half of the phrase in which it occurs, as in b1. All these differences may be seen as elements of diverse framing functions. The period b1 closes the first section of the piece and provides a transition to the second section, and therefore is constructed
in a manner that creates a deliberate impression of imperfect finality by avoiding the congruence of rhythmic and tonal closing elements in its final two measures (Example 43). The congruence of these very elements in conjunction with other framing devices described earlier (p. 123) provide a greater sense of finality in the third phrase of period a1+b2 which ends the Chorus (Example 43a).

Example 43. Closing elements, period b1, Opening Chorus, HMS Pinafore, mm. 86-87.

Example 43a. Ibid., mm. 100-104.
After the very strong conclusion of the textual setting in the period a1+b2 (Example 43a), the instrumental reiteration of an abbreviated period a (Figure 6, sect. A, period a2, mm. 104–108, p. 143) may seem redundant in view of its previous fourfold appearance in the Introduction and Chorus combined. However, such a perception, valid at the local level, disappears in a larger context. This last reiteration provides a third period to the section A1 in the Chorus, balancing it against the preceding three-part section A. Also, it provides the Chorus with a modified symmetrical form—of similar to that of the preceding Introduction (see p. 110). In an even larger context, the closing three measures of the Chorus (Fig. 6, frame x2, mm. 108–110), along with the opening four measures of the Introduction (Fig. 6, frame x, mm. 1–4), frame both the Introduction and the Chorus as one large form—of. This is achieved through the resemblance that these frames bear to each other (Example 44) and the contrast in which they stand to the rest of the Introduction and Chorus (compare the orchestration in Examples 17, p. 96; 18, p. 98; 37, p. 118, 40, p. 120, 42, p. 122, and 43, to Example 44).

Example 44. Outer framing devices, Introduction and Opening Chorus, HMS Pinafore, mm. 1–4, and 108–110, resp
Based on the preceding observations, a certain ambiguity may be admitted in the form-of delineation of the Introduction and Opening Chorus. The agogic frames that end the Introduction and the Chorus respectively (Examples 25 and 43a, pp. 104 and 124, resp.) outline two successive discrete forms-of, additionally differentiated by their contrasting instrumental and vocal/instrumental media. This differentiation is enhanced by an arch-like structure manifested by different means in each of the above mentioned forms-of. (Example 45 and Example 21, p. 101).

Example 45. Outline of the Introduction and Opening Chorus as two discrete pieces, H.M.S. Pinafore.

**Introduction:**

```
A a b | B x y z+a1 y1 A1 a2 b1
I III V/III flat VImT β I
20 35
```

**Chorus:**

```
A a b b1 a Chorus and Orchestra (Second Tutti) a1+b2 a2 (x2)
I III I
22 24
```

*Roman numerals indicate tonal levels; detailed harmonic analysis in Tables 2 and 2a.

** Sectional and periodic symbolizations indicate common thematic material in both Intro. and Chorus. Numerical subscripts indicate variants within each form-of only.
The manners of growth at sectional level in the two form-of possibilities outlined in in the Ex. 45 combine recurrence, contrast, and variation (A B A1) and recurrence and variation (A A1), respectively. The arch-like structure is readily evident in the Introduction where it appears at the sectional level; almost every significant form-in of the section B contrasts with its corresponding element in the surrounding sections (Example 21, p. 101). In the Chorus the arch structure is found at the periodic level, and it is confined to timbral contrast: the central period a features the fullest orchestration of the piece with the tenors and basses in octaves (Ex. 37b. p. 118).

Besides the outlined formal possibilities, the framing devices x and x2 (Ex. 44, p. 125) encompass what may be considered a single, fairly complex form-of based on the outlines in Ex. 45: A B A1 A2 A3. Such an outline would indicate a predominance of variation at sectional level in the procedural mixture of recurrence, variation, and contrast. Contrast would be confined to a single section. The outline itself appears to be an extended retrograde of the AABA form, a structure whose use ranges from the Minnesingers Repristenbar to today's popular song. 9

---

The contrast in sound between the orchestral Introduction and the choral-orchestral Opening Chorus may be seen in terms of the ambiguity mentioned earlier. At first glance, the contrast helps delineate the two discrete forms-of (Example 45, p. 126), but a closer look at the entire number reveals the same contrast as the determinant of a lopsided arch structure in a single form-of, since the Chorus ends with an instrumental coda (Figure 8, per. a4, p. 145) The symmetrical relationship between the frames x and x2 and the periods they respectively precede and follow introduces an arch-like element into the structure of the composite number: x, A---------, x2.

The perception of this number as a single form-of is reinforced by the pattern of departures from the phrasing continuum expectation set in the initial section A: 4(2+2)/4+4/4+4/. These departures from the continuum are most frequent in the section B, which consists mostly of two-measure phrases. However, the 2:1 relationship between the metric continuum and the irregularities in combination with the uninterrupted incidence of these irregularities in periods w+x1, y, z+a1, and y1 tend to reduce them to a local function by creating a micro-continuum of its own within the section B (Figure 8, sect. B). On the other hand, the phrasing irregularities in the section A variants (Fig. 8, sections A1, A2, A3), which are not as frequent and not contiguous to each other as
those in section B, may be perceived as functions of sectional, and hence, strophic, variation in a single form-of (Fig. 8, sect. A1, A2, A3, phrase/measure pattern chart, p. 145). Besides contributing to strophic variation, the location of the phrasing irregularities in the sect. A and subsequent variants makes them sectional frames. The first one occurs in the sect. A1, per. a2 before the transitional variant b1, separating the Introduction from the Chorus along with a melodic and harmonic transition (Ex. 22, p. 102). The second irregularity occurs in the section A2 of the Chorus, per. b2 (also in sect. A, per. b1 in Fig. 5, p. 142) along with a similar melodic and harmonic transition (Ex. 34, p. 114) to the next section A3 (sect. A1 in Fig. 5) also featuring a phrasing irregularity combined with thematic variation in per. a3. This last phrasing irregularity precedes the instrumental coda that closes the number. This coda shows a phrasing irregularity that is an exact reverse halving of the introductory period which matches the symmetrical relationship between outer frames outlined earlier (see p. 127): x,a= 4(2+2)/4+4/ mm.; a4, x2= 4/2. An interesting, although not very prominent, aspect of phrasing irregularity is the 2+2 mm. pattern in the accompaniment (xj) straddling a 4+4 mm. pattern in the melody (Figure 5, period w, mm. 24-27, p. 142; also Figure 7. 4th line, p. 144).
As mentioned earlier (p. 126), the sectional symbolizations of either form-of possibility - A B A1 and A A1, or A B A1 A2 A3 - readily point out the shaping procedures of the piece: recurrence, contrast, and variation; this last being indicated by the numerical subscripts. These procedures are also indicated at periodic level by the same means. Also, the indication of these procedures at phrase and sub-phrase level requires a separate nomenclature. Thus, the Figure 8 shows them abbreviated as R, C, and V, with lower case letters indicating the less prevalent mode in a procedural mixture, Rv, for example, indicating recurrence with an admixture of variation. The R, V, C chart in Figure 8 (p. 145) shows the following frequency in the incidence of recurrence, contrast, and variation, and their combinations at phrase level:

Contrast: 14 times
Recurrence: 8 " "
Recurrence + variation: 8 " "
Variation: 6 " "

It is significant that the greatest incidence of recurrence, occasionally modified by variation, appears in section B, in which half-length phrases predominate. This juxtaposition of an acceleration of events with repetitious material is a function of both internal balance within section B, and a softening of its contrast with the A sections, and therefore a function of stylistic unity.
Characterization: the Shanty and the Dibrach

The most recurrent thematic element in No. 1 is the period a (Fig. 8, p. 145). To an English audience familiar with its folk music the period a will sound very much like a pump, windlass, or rolling shanty whose tonal characteristics it shares (Examples 46, 46a, 46b).

Example 46. Gilbert and Sullivan, Introduction and Opening Chorus, HMS Pinafore, mm. 4-8.


Thus, the period a, as well as the runaway yell "Ahoy!" in the period b† (Example 32, p. x21) may be seen as elements of characterization by genre in addition to their respective structural functions.
Characterization by genre both parodies the one-sided characterizations of early and mid-Victorian opera,¹⁰ a procedure traceable to the German Singspiel,¹¹ and parallels the imitation of historical period styles in the institutional architecture of Sullivan’s time, a procedure that attempted to convey function through conventionalized form. Churches were built in an imitation Romanesque style reflecting the Age of Faith, Government or Justice buildings assumed the stately Graeco-Roman lines analogous to the Western Civilization’s patterning of its laws after Justinian’s code, and opera theatres luxuriated in Rococo ornamentation reminiscent of the genre’s aristocratic patronage in its beginnings.¹²

There is, however, an element of characterization pervading the entire piece that is subtler than the outright use of an obvious genre. The eighth-note accompaniment, congruent with the metric continuum (Ex. 20, p. 100), is a reiterated pyrrhic foot or dibrach, a poetic foot connoting strife or warfare in classical prosody. It was identified as such by Claudio Monteverdi who used it

---


in his stile concitato, at once an attempt to restore a classical procedure and a reaction to the pallid and expressionless monody of the Florentine Camerata. This monody was also an attempted restoration of what the Camerata’s principal theoretician, Vinzenzo Galilei, stated to have been the monodic practice of the classical Greek theatre theatre. While the claims of Galileo’s Dialogo della musica antica e della moderna (1581) are mere conjectures based on a Platonic tenet, Monteverdi’s dibrach, not being a complex procedure subject to encoding imperfections like the supposedly rediscovered monody, may very well have survived intact as an element of poetic declamation in a language still alive in the Byzantine Empire. It is very significant that less than two hundred years before Monteverdi’s first application of the stile concitato in the dramatic cantata Il Combattimento di Tancredi e Clorinda (1624) Greek scholars and theologians met with their Florentine counterparts at the 1439 Council of Florence with far better results in linguistics than in theology.


Many of the Greek scholars who attended the council remained in Italy teaching their language and literature. Therefore, it is plausible to assume that the dibrach survived the two centuries between this Byzantine influx and Monteverdi's years of apprenticeship.

The metamorphosis of the Monteverdian dibrach (Examples 47, 47a, 47b) into the conventional string tremolo needs no description. But, its original form does merit a more extensive mention because of its very frequent association with warfare and warriors, in contrast with the tremolo's general association with unsettling dramatic elements. This specific form of the dibrach is found in such works as Verdi's Aida (1871), Wagner's Gotterdammerung (1876), and even in Lerner and Loewe's Camelot (1960), shown in Examples 47, 48a, 49, and 50.


Example 47a. Ibid., [13].

Example 47b. Ibid., "Guerra (Warfare)," m. 17 after 27.

Example 48. Giuseppe Verdi, "Scena, Grave cagion...," Aida (Milano: Ricordi), Act I, No. 3, mm. 13-14 after P.

Example 48a. Ibid., "Nume, custode e vindice...," No. 4, 10.
Example 49. Richard Wagner, "Siegfried's Funeral March,"
Die Gotterdammerung (London: Eulenburg), Act III.

Example 50. Lerner and Loewe, "Guenevere," Camelot, orch.
R. Russell Bennett (New York: Chapell, 1962), 33,
mm. 69-72, passim.

The Examples 47 through 49 show the dibrach both
as an isolated unit (Examples 48 and 49) and as a steady
background (Examples 47, 47a, 47b, 49, and 49). All of
them show warfare or strife in earnest: the Monteverdi ex-
cerpts are references to a duel; the excerpts from Aida
illustrate a declaration of war and an invocation to a
god of war, respectively; Siegfried's Funeral March evokes
the slain warrior's deeds; and the lyrics of the Camelot
excerpt describe Lancelot's charge to Guenevere's rescue.

Not all dibrachic characterizations in the lyric
theatre are evocative of terror, pity, and strife. In
Weber's Der Freischütz (1821) the unsuccessful marksman
is mocked by a chorus of villagers in a dibrachic ensemble
juxtaposing continuous and fragmented elements (Ex. 50) and
Don Quixote's comic duel with a rival for Dulcinea's affections and his charge at the windmills are rendered in dibrachs in Massenet's 1910 opera *Don Quichotte* (Examples 52 and 52a).


Example 52a. Ibid., "Les Moulins," p. 123, mm. 1, 2, and passim.
Thus, by presenting generic characteristics associated with sailors and warriors, the Introduction and Opening Chorus matches by musical means the textual self-description of the crew (Examples 27, 29, pp. 106, 110, respectively). Little Buttercup's salutation confirms this by hailing the crew as man-o'war's men (Example 56, p. 146). In later Savoy operas, Sullivan occasionally delineates Gilbert's version of the Plautian braggart warrior by means of the dibrach: the soft-hearted buccaneers in The Pirates of Penzance attempt to kidnap the Major General's daughters to a dibrachic accompaniment (Example 53), the hulking trio of milites gloriosi in Princess Ida describe their vocation to a much louder version of the same device (Example 54), and the Duke of Plaza-Toro's catalogue of self-preserving heroics ends on a dibrachic coda (Example 55).

Example 53. Gilbert and Sullivan, "Here's a first rate opportunity," The Pirates of Penzance (New York: Kalmus), Act I, No. 11, mm. 22, passim.

Example 54. "Bold and fierce," Princess Ida (London: Chappell), Act 1, No. 5, m 41 to end.

Example 55. "In enterprise of martial kind," The Gondoliers (New York: Kalmus), Act I, No. 3, mm. 35 to end.

In sum, the predominant major mode, the driving dibrachic rhythm, and the brisk tempo of the opera's opening number evoke a feeling of vigorous contentment reflecting the self-assurance of the words. The kinship between most of the number's thematic material and the appropriate variety of sea shanty also illustrates and enhances the text in a manner that may have been quite consonant with the punctilious realism of Gilbert's original production. While in Portsmouth, Gilbert sketched the decks and rigging of HMS Victory, Nelson's flagship, and modeled HMS Pinafore's setting faithfully after it. The uniforms used in the

18. Baily, 152.
production were equally realistic, having been ordered from a naval contractor. 19

The sea-shanty character of the number's thematic material and the recurrence of this character in other numbers of the opera (Act I, Nos. 9, 10, Finale, letter J to end; Act II, No. 17) may be viewed not only as an obvious device of characterization and spectacle but also as an element of a national style. This feature, a function of characterization by genre in a narrow context, places *HMS Pinafore* in the same category of national music as most works of Sullivan's contemporary and Leipzig classmate Edvard Grieg (1843-1907) and the slightly earlier *Bartered Bride* (1866) of the Czech Bedřich Smetana (1824-1884), both composers who combined folkloric elements with a rather solid pan-European style of the times, learned in German conservatories. The national element in this opera is also an element of social satire. The self-assured sailors (it is very tempting to designate them as *nautes gloriosi*, a sub-species of the Plautian *miles gloriosus*) are quite jingoistic and vehement in their glorification of naval battles as an alternate activity with shore leave (Figure 6, periods b and b1, p. 143). The use of the sea-shanty leaves no doubt as to their citizenship. The subject of the satire, unlike that of Offenbach's

19. Ibid., 153.
Orpheé (1858), La Grande Duchesse de Gérolstein (1867), and La Perichole (1868), as well as Gilbert and Sullivan's own subsequent Princess Ida (1884), The Mikado (1885), and The Gondoliers (1889), is set in the time and place of the authors. It satirizes national mores, or better yet, imperial mores, in a national style, mocking the waves that Brittania rules with the songs that Brittania sings.
Figure 5: Act I, No. 1, Introduction and Opening Chorus - Introduction
Figure 6: Act I, No. 1, Introduction and Opening Chorus - Chorus
Fig. 7: Act I, No.1, Intro. and Opening Chorus
Phrase/Measure Patterns
Figure 8: Act No. 1, Introduction and Opening Chorus, Form-Of Outline, Phrasing Pattern, Recurrence, Variation, and Growth at the Half-Phrase Level
CHAPTER IV

NO. 2: RECITATIVO AND ARIA: THE JOLLY FEDDLER

Following the Opening Chorus, Little Buttercup's recitativo reinforces the self-characterization of the crew. The Recitativo's text consists of two couplets in iambic pentameter. The choice of the heroic couplet aabb₂₅ as the recitativo's stanzaic form imbues it with a loftiness traditionally associated with this stanza,¹ providing additional characterization through literary genre.


A

Hail, menwives' men, safeguards of your nation

B

There is an end at last, to all privation

You've got your pay, spare all you can afford

¹ Haublein, 22.
In the recitativo there are two discernible sections, and they may be symbolized as A and B respectively, due to contrasting characteristics. The main element of structural differentiation between these two sections is an anapaestic pattern played by the string section. In addition to a framing function, the anapaestic pattern, traditionally indicative of heightened emotion or solemnity (Examples 57 and 57a), completes the characterization of the crew as "safeguards of /their/ nation."


Example 57a. Aida, "Judgement Scene," Act IV, No. 9, letter M.

The use of the anapaest was hardly limited to music of Sullivan's time, such as the above examples. One of the most salient aspects of the Gallicization of the Florentine Giambattista Lulli was the patterning of his
stage music after the declamatory style of the 17th century 
Comedie Francaise,\(^1\) especially after its leading actress 
Marie Champmeslé's interpretations of Racine's dramatic 
verse with its predominantly anapaestic feet.\(^2\) It is 
possible to surmise that the emotional heightening of 
the dramatic text was achieved then by declamatory means not 
dissimilar from those of the 20th century French urban bal-
ladeer (for example Maurice Chevalier with his much parod-
ied "Every little breeeeeze seems to whisper Louiiize!") Other 
performers of the melodramatic ballad genre in the Romance 
languages, such as Argentine tango singers will in-
vitably render a standard tango notation \(\frac{9}{8}\) as 
\(\frac{9}{8}\) substituting quantitative anapaests 
for the notated accentual iambs. Jean Baptiste Lully's 
adaptation of this quantitative anapaest resulted in both 
a distinctive French musical style with its characteristic 
dotted rhythms,\(^4\) and in the association of the quantitative 
anapaestic pattern in music with dramatic elements ranging 
from pomp and solemnity to sorrow and strife, indicative 
of the device's theatrical origins.

---

W. W. Norton, 1947), 156.


4. Thurston Dart, *The Interpretation of Music* (New York: 
In Sullivan's time the device was in use in both Italian (Examples 57 and 57a, p. 147) and German opera (Examples 58, 58a, b, c, and d):


Example 58a. —, "Hunding's leitmotiv," The Valkyrie (London: Eulenburg), passim.

Example 58b. —, "Siegrinde's Cry of Victory," The Valkyrie, Finale, Act I, passim.

Example 58c. —, "Fricka's wrath leitmotiv," The Valkyrie, Act II, passim.

Example 58d. —, "Annunciation of Sigmund's Death," The Valkyrie, Finale, Act II, passim.
The cited examples from the Ring of the Nibelungs (1869-76) as well as those from La Traviata (1853) and Aida (1871) contain plot elements of a serious or awesome nature (see p. 147). The Examples 57a (p. 147), 58a, and 58d (p. 148) in particular illustrate moments capable of eliciting the classical terror and pity mentioned by Aristotle.5

The solemnity thus associated with the anapaestic pattern in music indicates the high esteem in which Little Buttercup holds the crew of the Pinafore and contrasts effectively with the rather neutral string background of sustained harmonies that accompany Buttercup's following reference to herself (Example 56, section B, p. 146). This contrast is also the main element of formal structure as described earlier: a clear instance of symbiosis between musical form and theatrical function. The order in which these two structural elements appear, majestic anapaests followed by a lyrical cantabile (Example 56, sect. B) provides a logical transition from the martial Opening Chorus to the lyrical self-introductory arietta of Buttercup (Figure 9, p. 169). This arietta (actually subtitled Aria), the preceding recitativo and the Introduction and Opening Chorus are all in the key of C major. Monotony is avoided by the Introduction's modulations

to remote keys in combination with thematic and textural diversity (Fig. 5, section B, p. 142), the Chorus' digression to the mediant (Fig. 5, period b1, p. 142), and, finally, by the digression of Buttercup's Aria to the submediant (Fig. 9, section B, mm. 25-40, p. 169).

The text in Buttercup's Aria is cast in a variant of the popular ballad's stanzaic form: $a_4b_3a_4b_3$. The variation consists in the substitution of dactylic feet for the customary iambics. Scansion reveals another possible variation within the traditional ballad form: the caesura in each odd-numbered line and the omission of the unaccented syllables (catalexis) in the even-numbered ones suggest very strongly a dipodic procedure, that is, a verse whose metrical unit is comprised of two feet. This perception is reinforced by internal rhymes: "... Buttercup-Buttercup," in the first stanza, and the more sophisticated rhymes "... tobacco-jacky," "... laces-faces," "... toffee-coffee," "... conies-polonies," in subsequent stanzas (Figure 9, phrases b through c1, p. 169). Sullivan must have given priority to this metric interpretation because his melodic contouring forms hypermeasures congruent with the dipodic feet. The hypermetric setting is confirmed by cadential

---

6. Häublein, 22.

framing occurring regularly every eight measures (Example 60, p. 153 and Fig. 9, passim, p. 169. Gilbert's own typography also confirms such a function of the internal rhymes, which, incidentally, could be superficially scanned to give the stanzaic pattern $a_2a_2b_2/a_2a_2b_2$. The shorter even-numbered lines may be defined as catalectic (missing one unstressed syllable) in the Ballad meter and brachicatalectic (missing a complete foot or more) in the dipodic scansion (Example 59).


Double stress marks dipodic scansion.

I'm called Little Buttercup-dear Little Buttercup,

Though I could never tell why, brachicatalectic (dipodic)

But still I'm called Buttercup-poor Little Buttercup,

Sweet Little Buttercup II brachicatalectic (dipodic)

With the exception of catalectic-endings, the text presents no metric irregularities such as those in the Opening Chorus (Ex. 27 and 29, pp. 106 and 110, resp.); the verse adheres faithfully to dactylic feet. This regularity is emphasized by the totally syllabic and accentual setting (Figure 9, in toto, p. 169). The inherent monotony of a word-setting procedure in which every melodic element is congruent with the metric continuum $\frac{3}{4}$ is avoided in this case through the composer's adherence to the poet's
subtle shift in catalectic patterns. While the setting of the first stanza (Example 60) does not differ metrically from the setting of the second stanza (Example 60a), the melodic patterns in these stanzas suggest a different contour based on a shift in catalectic patterns in the lyrics (Example 61).

Example 60. Gilbert and Sullivan, "I'm called Little Buttercup," HMS Pinafore, No. 2, Aria, Act I, mm. 8-16.

Example 60a. Ibid., mm. 24-32.

Example 61. Ibid., second stanza lyrics; pattern repeated in third stanza.

I've snuff and tobaccy, and excellent jacky,
I've scissors, and watches, and knives.
I've ribbons and laces to set off the faces
Of pretty young sweethearts and wives.
The text's shift from simple catalexes and anacruses in the first stanza to a more sophisticated pattern in the second results in a sort of linkage between all lines of the stanza. The catalexis at the end of the first line forms an additional dactylic foot with the anacrusis of the second line, linking both lines metrically. The catalexis at the end of the third line is linked in a similar manner to the anacrusis of the fourth line, and the metric link is accompanied by a semantic one, which produces an elegant enjambement or run-on line (Example 61. p. 153).

The musical setting responds to this with a very subtle alteration of the predominant phrase-frame pattern: while the first stanza is set so that each half-phrase consists of two full measures preceded by a single up-beat (Example 60), the second stanza's setting shortens the half-phrases by one beat, so that each one of them begins on a single beat anacrusis. Furthermore, while the accompaniment preserves the tonic/dominant pattern of the hypermeasure (albeit on a secondary tonal level), the melody is embellished by appoggiature which occur without exception on the internal rhymes "...tobaccy/jacky, ..." as well as on "...laces/faces..." and thus enhance them (Examples 60a and 61). The catalexes at the end of each phrase are enhanced by the setting which allows the accompaniment to complete the missing feet of the voice,
thus presenting the full prosodic pattern of the text in timbral contrast (Example 62)

Example 62. Ibid., mm. 15-17, and 22-24.

This procedure also reaffirms the hypermetric character of a setting conforming to the croyodic meter of the text.

The harmonies of the setting of the first stanza (Fig. 9, section A, mm. 1-24, p. 169) are arranged in a symmetrical fashion that places the furthest harmonic digression from the tonic in the linear center of the section: I V I V IV I V6 II V7 I I V7 I. This central digression, the dominant of the supertonic, marks the beginning of the second hyperphrase, thus assuming a framing as well as a harmonic function (Fig. 9, mm. 17-18). Outlining a much larger structural unit is the digression to the relative minor by the entire section B. The minor mode in this instance goes hand in hand with the already described shift in prosody/word-setting. Both procedures provide a strong, if economical element of contrast into the piece. It is important to observe that both the Opening
Chorus, the following Recitativo, and the Aria are in the key of C major. The inherent monotony of this tonal scheme is relieved by the different tonal levels to which the Opening Chorus and the Aria digress: the Chorus' periods b and b₁ are on the mediant while the Aria, as mentioned, digresses to submediant (Figure 9, mm. 24-40, p. 169). These contrasting harmonies may be considered digressive rather than modulatory because of their close relationship to the main key. Thus, the strongest element of harmonic contrast from the very beginning of the opera (minus overture) to this point is the modulatory section of the Introduction with its remote harmonies (Figure 5, mm. 20-52, p. 142).

The section B of the Aria introduces the submediant level abruptly after a full cadence on the tonic (Fig. 9, mm. 22-23, p. 169). By contrast, the return to the tonic is gradual, effected through the subdominant-root relationship between the submediant and the dominant of the dominant in the main key: VI MT IV/VI (V/IV) V (Fig. 9, mm. 37-39). This return to the main key's dominant at the end of a harmonically and thematically contrasting section in a simple da-capo form such as this piece seems to be in almost every respect would certainly indicate the return of the initial section, literal or slightly varied. In this case, however, the return is only harmonic; the thematic material returns an entire section later in
a manner that is analogous to the deceptive cadence in harmony. This provides the piece's structure with one more contrasting section, which for the sake of unity features appoggiature similar to those in the preceding section and an identical anacrusic pattern in the half-phrases (Example 63).

Example 63. Ibid., mm. 41-45.

This procedure, which expands the basic ABA scheme into a ABCA pattern, not unlike a truncated rondo, provides Little Buttercup with additional material to hawk her merchandise without becoming thematically repetitious. The sophistication of this procedure also contrasts in a subtle manner with the apparent lack of sophistication in the congruence of the accentual/syllabic dactyls of the setting with the metric continuum (see p. 152). This congruence, in turn, serves as an unobtrusive, yet ever present device of characterization: Little Buttercup's dactyls evoke the simple patterns of a lowly barrel-organ waltz, which points clearly to Little Buttercup's humble position in society. Other features, notably melodic contouring, complete the characterization of Little Buttercup in the same vein (Examples 68 - 70, pp. 162, 165).
The elements of recurrence, variation, and contrast in this number, viewed in diverse dimensions, appear in the following fashion. At the sectional level the scheme a-1 ABCA a-1 (Figure 10, capital and lower case frame symbolizations, p. 170) indicates an identical amount of recurrence (A), contrast (B and C), and variation, the latter consisting of the a-1 frames. At the periodic/hyperphrase level the predominant procedure is variation, as evidenced in the lower case letter symbolizations a, a1, b, b1, c, c1, and reprise of a (Fig. 10) at the subphrase/hypermeasure level the element of variation must be qualified as sequential variation due to Sullivan's manner of handling it in this particular instance. The relationship between the first and second subphrase/hypermeasure shows an equal amount of recurrence (five times, in a-1, a, and their reprises, and c; Fig. 10) and sequential variation (five times, in a1 and its reprise, b, b1, and c1). Sequential variation also occurs between the first subphrases of a and a1 with a tonal alteration (Figure 10). The third and fourth subphrases all contrast with those preceding them, and all conform to the rhythmic pattern with several variants of a melodic cadential formula.

The harmonic structure of the piece shows recurrent patterns in a manner similar to the melody. It is simple, and thus the smallest digression from the
main tonal level is capable of creating harmonic contrast. Such contrast occurs when Little Buttercup's text changes from self-introduction to the description of her wares (Figure 9, sections B and C, p. 169). The predominant chordal relationship in this piece is a tonic-dominant one, shown in the following chart:

Example 64. Harmonic structure, "I'm called Little Buttercup," HMS Pinafore, Act I. No. 2 (Key of C major).

A a-1 I V I V I V7 V -----  
  a I V I V I IV6 I 4 I -----  
  a1 V6/II II V7 I I V7 I -----  
B b VI V7/VI VI V7/VI VI 6 V/VI-----  
  b1 VI V7/VI VI V7/VI VI V7/V V -----  
C c V7 I V7 I V6/IV IV V6/IV IV  
  c1 V6/V V V6/III VII7/II V6 V7/V V -----  

The reprised a-1, a, and a1 are identical to the corresponding items above.

The orchestration of this piece, scored for woodwinds (2-1-2-1), 2 horns, and strings, matches the simplicity of the harmonic and melodic elements with a deliberate unobtrusiveness, achieved by the juxtaposition
of sectionally specialized textures. Except for the frames a-1 with their massive melody/ accompaniment interchoric doubling (Example 65), the sections of the orchestra are assigned diverse structural functions. The strings carry the primary burden of accompaniment, which has four different patterns. The first three are congruent with the metric continuum (Example 66, a, b, and c), but the fourth, which occurs in the recapitulating section A, alternates the continuum pattern with sustained harmonies (Example 67). This feature, along with a deviation from the metric continuum in the vocal line (Figure 9, m. 69, p. 169), is the only element of recapitulative alteration in the piece. Previous deviations from the continuum congruency in the vocal line have an affective, rather than a structural significance, since they enhance agogically the adjectives 'succulent' and 'excellent' with which Little Buttercup describes her wares (Figure 9, mm. 46 and 53). On two occasions the first violins abandon their accompanying function and double a fragment of the vocal line (Fig. 9, mm. 27-28 and 34-36, respectively).

However, such a fragmented doubling is really the domain of the woodwinds. Observe the bassoon (Fig. 9, mm. 24-28), the oboe (Figure 9, mm. 49-53), and the flutes and clarinets in octaves (Figure 9, mm. 56-69). It is in keeping with the deliberate unobtrusiveness of the orchestral accompaniment that the longest vocal
doubling is assigned to the relatively less penetrating flutes and clarinets, rather than to the double reeds.

Example 65. 'I'm called Little Buttercup,' *HMS Pinafore*, mm. 1-8.

Example 66, a, b, c. *Ibid.*, accompaniment patterns, passim.


The horns alternate between sustaining harmonies and doubling the upper string's accompaniment figure (Example 66a, above).
The combination of sophisticated procedures such as sequential variation in the melody, variation in accompaniment patterns, and delicate underscoring of the vocal line in the orchestration, with extremely simple harmonies, confined to tonic-dominant relationships, and a repetitive melodic structure, manage to characterize Little Buttercup as a person of low condition without sounding out of place in the operatic genre. The melodic structure of the aria may be compared to that of several well-known examples of forebitter or forecastle shanties. (Examples 68, 68a, b, and c).


Example 68c. "Blow the man down," halyard shanty, Ibid., 76.

The formal similarities between the cited sea shanties and Little Buttercup's aria allowing characterization by genre may be observed at several structural levels. The most obvious similarity between them is the accentual/syllabic text treatment whose smallest melodic units are overwhelmingly congruent with the metric continuum and its triple pattern of stress, determined by the dactylic regularity of the text. The congruence of the melodic contour elements with those of the metric continuum makes any deviation from it stand out in relief against the predominant regularity. This allows notes of increased duration to function as phrase and sub-phrase frames (Figure 10, last two measures in every hyperphrase, p. 170., and Examples 68, 68a, b, and c.

The melodic frames coincide with full or half cadences, which are the pivotal points of a harmonic scheme limited to essentials - primary colors, so to speak. (Example 64, p. 159., and Examples 68, 68a, b, and c). Sullivan's transposition of the original tonic-dominant alternation into secondary levels (Example 64) ought to be perceived not only as a function of strophic variation, but also
as the musical manifestation of the aesthetic principle of *idem in alio*. This classic tenet holds modification as an indispensable ingredient of art as an imitation of reality. It is the essence of the imitated object, entity, or phenomenon, that must be projected through the prism of the artist's individuality, rather than its outward manifestations, and modification is the only perceptible evidence of this projection.8 The transposition of the harmonic patterns of a utilitarian work song into secondary tonal levels, a procedure non-existent in strophic real models, is, in effect, sameness in another guise: *idem in alio*.

The phrase structure of the aria resembles that of the Examples 68 and 68a (p. 162); shanties and *aria* do not have an agogic delineation of the subphrases, relying on melodic contour and implied or explicit (Fig. 9, p. 169) harmonies, sharing the following phrasing pattern: \[ \begin{align*} \text{d.} & \quad \text{d.} \\ \text{d.} & \quad \text{d.} \\ \text{d.} & \quad \text{d.} \end{align*} \]

In this respect the first two cited shanties and the aria differ from the third and fourth shanties cited (Examples 68b and c, p. 162), which have an agogic delineation of the subphrases, not unlike a caesura in a long poetic line. However, the melodic contour of the *aria* resembles more

---

those of the third and fourth shanties cited (Examples 68b and c, p. 162):

Example 69. Melodic contours, aria "I'm called Little But-
tercup," shanties "La Pique," and "Blow the man down."

The first two of the cited examples (Ex. 68 and
68a, p. 162) have slightly different melodic contours:

Example 70. Melodic contours, shanties "Spanish Ladies," and Cawsand Bay."

Whatever the differences in the alternation of contour
types in the aria and four cited shanties, all share a
feature related to melodic contour: the hypermetric re-
gularity is a function of melodic contouring. The choice
of a 3 meter spelling rather than of the contour-congruent
6 may be explained as an attempt to avoid a meter signature
traditionally associated with the jig.\(^9\) Such a signature combined with the repetitive melodic and rhythmic patterns of the piece would strongly suggest a tempo of performance compatible with the character of a jig. This tempo would be much faster that desirable for the forebitter shanty, a sea song associated with lighter tasks, leisure time, or customary, but not official, farewell and greeting ceremonies.\(^10\) Little Buttercup's aria functions as a greeting, however businesslike, and this accounts for its moderate tempo and forebitter character.

In addition to indicating Little Buttercup's humble social station, the barrel-organ congruence of the accentual/syllabic elements with the metric continuum reinforced by the waltz-like accompaniment and the regularity of the arch-like melodic contours within the hypermeasures may be discerned as the characteristic features of a cabaletta of the early type. In the operas of the period between Gluck and Rossini, that is, late eighteenth century to early nineteenth, the cabaletta was a song in a relatively popular style characterized by a repetitious pattern in melody and accompaniment and overall simplicity and

---


briefness. Eventually, the cabaletta became the closing 
stretto of scene, providing an effective contrast to the 
slower and more complicated aria or cavatina that preceded 
it and the recitativo that occasionally separated both. In this case, the earlier type is preceded by a brief 
recitativo (Example 56, p. 146), which provides a sort 
of rudimentary two-part construction without obliterating 
the kinship between the shanty-like chorus and the street-
song waltz characterizing the sailors and the peddler. 
Besides the short rhythmic patterns and arched melodic 
contours common to both the Opening Chorus and Little 
Buttercup's Aria, the melodic kinship between these two 
numbers is evident at a more basic level: the melodic 
kernel sol-la-do in the Aria's framing and recapitulating 
hyperphrase a seems to be an abbreviation of the motive a 
do-mi-sol-la-sol-mi-do in the Opening Chorus (Example 71).

Example 71. Melodic relationship, Motives of initial 
phrases, Opening Chorus and Little Buttercup's 
Aria, Act I, Nos. 1 and 2, mm. 64-66 and 8-9, resp.

12. Grout, 360-1, passim.
The structural scheme ABCA₁, which features a slightly modified recapitulation (see modified orchestration, section A and A₁, Figure 9, p. 169) is a more sophisticated structure than its forms-in would seem to warrant. Indeed, the simplicity of the thematic material and of the accompaniment would seem to set up the expectation of a strophic form—of rather than the through-composed irregular arch or abbreviated rondo evident in the analysis (Fig. 10, p. 170). The modifications of the recapitulation are subtle. The most extensive modification consists in a fuller orchestration, as indicated above: the string accompaniment of the initial section A is assigned to violas, cellos, basses, bassoon, and horns; the flute and the clarinet in 8vs double the vocal line, and the violins sustain a dominant pedal in the middle high register (Figure 9, mm. 56–72). An even subtler modification is the introduction into the returning vocal line rhythmic variant of dactylic foot first found in the section C (Fig. 9, mm. 46, 53, and 69, resp., all outlined by squares)

This combination of simplicity and sophistication, represented respectively by elements of a popular style and by an elegant structural organization of these elements is an instance of the artistic principle of idem in alio,¹³ applied to realistic imitation in musical theatre.

---

¹³. De Quincey, loc. cit.
I'm Called Little Butter-cup, dear, Little Butter-cup, though I could never tell why.

Strings only (accomp.)

I'm called Little Butter-cup, dear, Little Butter-cup, Sweet Little Butter-cup.

Note: sections (capitals) consist of hyperphrases. The hyperphrase equals a period in other figures.

Frame

Freewheel and te-har, and on col-lant jack-y, she sat down, and watched, and played.

Five chimes and te-xen to get off the force of pretty young sweethearts and wives.

Clarinet and French horns, accompaniment.

Emphatic variance of bass clef.

Vocal doubles voice to

E.V. mm 40-56

Action to

V.

Frame

Modified orchestration in recapitulation.

Upper strings sustain harmonies to end.

Horns, E.T.C., violins, cellos, basses, accompaniment to end.

Figure 9 Act I, No. 2, Aria "I'm Called Little Buttercup."
Figure 10: Act I, No. 2, Aria "I'm called Little Buttercup;"
Phrasing Pattern, Recurrence, Variation and Contrast.
CHAPTER V

Nos. 2a, 1, and 3a; RECITATIVO AND SCENA: THE OPPRESSED HERO

In the spoken dialogue following Buttercup's Aria she foreshadows the final denouement and the crew describe Dick Deadeye in a very unflattering manner, thereby setting up the probability of his later betrayal. The recitativo that follows introduces Ralph Rackstraw. Its text is a quatrain in iambic pentameter. Like the previous recitativo (Example 56, p. 146), this one makes use of literary genre implications for characterization purposes through the heroic quatrain abab₅, a stanzaic form associated with lofty subjects.¹


¹ Haublein, 24.
The combination of spoken dialogue and *recitativo s trọngtato* between musical numbers is a stylistic inconsistency and a functional redundancy. Neither of these shortcomings is apparent in the previously analyzed numbers, which are quite pithy in their appositeness to the dramatic function of their texts. Therefore, it is possible to infer some sort of practical reason for such a discrepant procedure. Indeed, the modulation in the *recitativo*, while not needed in a strictly musical sense since the preceding key feeling is neutralized by the spoken dialogue, provides a musical reflection of an unsettling thought. The progression which starts in C major and ends in a secondary dominant of Ab major parallels the textual events: Buttercup's matter-of-fact description of the lovesick Ralph begins on the C major tonic, but ends on the dominant seventh of the supertonic (Example 72, mm. 1-2). This allows a resolution on D minor, thus underscoring the Boatswain's concern about "... smartest lad in all the fleet..." (Ex. 72, mm. 3) through the simple expedient of a change of mode.\(^2\) Buttercup's abrupt reaction to Ralph's name, which foreshadows her central function in the denouement (p. 171), is underscored by an equally abrupt shift in the harmony through the use of a common

---

tone from the D minor chord to a, so to speak, tertiary dominant: the subdominant seventh of the subdominant (Example 72, m. 4, p. 171). The vocal line presents its own reflection of Little Buttercup's emotions by means of an octave displacement on the words "Ralph! that name!" and "Remorse, remorse!" which uses the range extremes of the contralto voice in the portrayal of agitation. The use of a flat upper neighbor of the chord's root in the vocal line makes these very same words stand out further through melodic contouring, while suggesting a diminished ninth chord on the dominant of the dominant in Ab major. This provides both a harmonic introduction to the next musical number, and additional enhancement of the unsettling element by traditional harmonic means.

Thus, the sacrifice of stylistic unity is justified by dramatic necessity. There is a textual frame in the recitativo delineated by the rhymes of its first and fourth lines (course/remorse) which separates by prosodic means the text of the recitativo from that of the previous spoken dialogue. The first rhyming line diverts the attention of the listener from Dick Deadeye towards Ralph Rackstraw, and consequently provides a semantic as well as a syntactic dividing line which minimizes the abruptness of the contrast between the spoken and the set lines.
The musical number introduced by the modulating recitative of Little Buttercup and the Boatswain characterizes Ralph Rackstraw by textual and musical means. Designated by Gilbert as a madrigal, the text has all the imagery, lyricism, and sorrows-of-love references of madrigalesque poetry, but the music presents none of the characteristics of the homonymous musical genre.

The poetic forms in featured in the text show Ralph to have been cast in a finer mold than his shipmates. The prosody of the madrigal is much more sophisticated than that of the preceding sea shanty and ballad: its meter is quite irregular, the five-line stanza consisting of two sets of alternating iambic dimeters and trimeters and a closing trimeter. The scheme is \(a_2b_3a_2b_3b_3\) in the first stanza and \(a_2c_2a_2c_3b_3\) in the second, not unlike Sullivan's use of recurrence and variation in musical settings (Figure 7, p. 144). A sixth line with a \(b\) rhyme is added to the stanza by the repetition of the soloist's fifth line in the chorus. This heterometric quintain (not counting, of course, the repeated line) presents a metric proportion inverse to that of the ballad stanza, and thus its shorter first and third lines tend to stand.


out against the more numerous longer lines. Most of the
lines feature a free consonance on the liquid sound \l\, which adds considerable mellifluousness to the text's
diction, and consequently contributes to Ralph's genteel
image. Such an image is also established by the overall
elegance of the diction, with such refined devices as the
prosopopoeic references to the nightingale's pining for
the moon's ray and the vale's unrequited love for the
mountain. These devices also refer in an allegorical man-
ner to Ralph's supposedly unrequited love for Josephine,
completing his textual characterization (Example 73).

Example 73. Gilbert, "Madrigal," HMS Pinafore, Act I.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rhyme Scheme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lamie Dimeter</th>
<th>The Nightingale</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Sighed for the moon's bright ray,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. And told his tale</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. In his own melodious way!</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. He sang &quot;Ah, well-a-day!&quot; (chorus rep.)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimeter</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6. The lowly vale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. For the mountain vainly sighed,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. To his humble wall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. The echoing hills replied.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. They sang &quot;Ah, well-a-day!&quot; (chorus rep.)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\l\, consonance lines 3, 6, 8, 9, primarily.
\l\, analeptic foot
The slight prosodic irregularity of the heterometric stanzaic structure 2-3-2-3-3 (3) in the Madrigal is somewhat augmented by the interpolation of dactylic and anapaestic feet as hypermetric elements in the second, fourth, seventh, and eighth lines. The musical setting reflects the increase in textual sophistication evident in the above mentioned irregularities and in the elevated diction (Example 73). The four-measure introduction (Fig. 11, mm. 1-4, p. 212) begins with the syncopated strings' accompaniment figure that predominates in this function throughout the piece. In contrast to the accompaniments of the preceding numbers; the Madrigal's accompaniment tends to obscure, rather than to enhance, the metric continuum of the piece. Over this string background in the introduction, the flute is assigned an anacrustic figure echoed by the oboe, that anticipates twice the anacrustic beginning of the vocal section (Example 74), in a manner slightly reminiscent of the motto device of the pre-classical opera composers.\footnote{Marc Pincherle, Vivaldi, trans. Christopher Hatch (New York: W.W. Norton, 1957), 162.}

Example 74. "Madrigal," HMS Pinafore, mm. 1-6, passim.
The quantitative syllabic setting of the Madrigal assigns an equal number of measures to each line of text regardless of the line's length (Fig. 11, section a, mm. 5-6, and 7-8, respectively, p. 212). Consequently, the trimetric lines 2, 4, 7, and 9 of the text result in a greater syllabic density in the musical setting than the dimetric lines 1, 3, 6, and 8. This syllabic density is increased further by the interpolated hypermetric feet in lines 2, 4, and 7 (Example 73, p. 175). The repetition by the chorus of the soloist's last line of text in an altered melodic setting creates the effect of a stanzaic sestet in place of the original quintain (Fig. 11, sect. b, mm. 15-17).

The phrasing pattern of the piece tends to break away from the four-measure (or hypermeasure in the case of Little Buttercup's aria) pattern predominating in the two preceding numbers. The four-measure orchestral introduction (Fig. 11, section a-1, mm. 1-4) is followed by a four-measure phrase in the vocal line expanded to six measures through the addition and harmonic dovetailing of a two-measure orchestral subphrase (Fig. 11, section a and frame x, mm. 5-8, and 8-9, resp.). The same phrase structure is repeated in the following phrase a1 (Fig. 11, section a1 and frame x1, mm. 10-12 plus anacrusis, and 12-13, resp.). Since the phrase is the largest structural unit of the formal whole, these phrase extensions may be
considered as sectional frames (Figure 11, frames x and xl, mm. 8-9, and 12-13, resp., p. 212). This function is enhanced by the sound characteristics of these subphrases: their distinguishing flute and clarinet solos make them stand out against the surrounding vocal line. They also feature tone painting that illustrates the text of the first stanza (Example 73, lines 1-5, p. 175). The nightingale thus imitated bears an unmistakable resemblance to Beethoven's songbird, with warbling suitably abbreviated in consideration of the piece's modest length (Examples 75 and 75a).

Example 75. "Madrigal," HMS Pinafore, mm. 8-9, and 12-13.

Example 75a. L. van Beethoven, Symphony No. 6 in F major, II, flute part, mm. 129-130.
The phrase b returns to the four-measure pattern, which may be perceived as a framing element in the largest dimension, since the introduction a-1 is also a four-measure phrase. Furthermore, the internal organization of the phrases a-1 and b is also similar: both consist of two rhythmically identical two-measure subphrases (Fig. 11, sections a-1 and b, mm. 1-2 and 3-4, and 13-14 and 15-17, resp., p. 212). These frames surround two large phrases, a and a1, which share the same rhythmic pattern and, again, the same subphrase structure, described earlier. Thus, the procedure of rhythmic recurrence in surface patterns is first seen at subphrase level, then at phrase level, and finally at subphrase level again. Along with strophic repetition, this pattern of recurrence may be outlined as the following double arch:

Example 76. Contrast and recurrence in rhythmic phrase patterns, "Madrigal," HMS Pinafore, Act I.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>sect.</th>
<th>a-1</th>
<th>a</th>
<th>a1</th>
<th>b</th>
<th>a</th>
<th>a1</th>
<th>b</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>mm. (quant. in phrase)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mm. (subphrase distrib.)</td>
<td>2+2</td>
<td>4+2</td>
<td>4+2</td>
<td>2+2</td>
<td>4+2</td>
<td>4+2</td>
<td>2+2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rhythmic surface patterns (lower case, subphrases; capital let., phrases)</td>
<td>rec</td>
<td>REC</td>
<td>rec</td>
<td>REC</td>
<td>rec</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CONTRAST CON. CON. CON.
Besides the contrast in phrasing patterns, the procedural differences in harmonic structure provide an element of contrast in large dimensions. The introduction’s harmonic scheme $\Delta \text{V} \overline{\text{VI}}/\text{V}$ over a dominant pedal in the bass relegates the intervening secondary dominant to an auxiliary or passing function, and the procedure is repeated, sequence fashion, in the following phrase with the harmonies $\Delta \text{I} \overline{\text{VII}}/\text{I}$, a tonic pedal relegate the seventh chord, again, to an auxiliary function (Fig. 11, sect. a-1, a, mm. 1-4, and 5-9, resp., p. 212). This gives the effect of a $\text{V-I}$ cadence at phrase level, allowing the more active and digressive harmonies of the phrase $\text{a1}$ contrast with those of the preceding phrases and to balance through this contrast the inherent monotony of the $\text{a}$ and $\text{a1}$ rhythmic phrase pattern recurrence. The progression $\text{I} \overline{\text{VI}} \text{V/VI} \overline{\text{V6/IV}}$ in $\text{a1}$ also contrasts with the closed structure of that in phrase $\text{a}$ by ending on a secondary dominant resolving on the subdominant of the next phrase (Figure 11, section b, m. 14).

The harmonic scheme of phrase $\text{b}$ underscores its arsis/thesis character, delineated by the two rhythmically identical subphrases, assigned respectively to the soloist and the chorus of sailors. The soloist’s harmonies are $\text{IV} \overline{\text{V}}$, and the chorus answers with $\overline{\text{I6}} \text{V/7 I}$, signaling unequivocally the end of the piece through rather obvious means (Fig. 11, sect. b, mm. 14-17).
The harmonic scheme just described may be outlined as an assymetrical arch, with its amplitude representing harmonic varying degrees of harmonic activity and digressiveness (Example 77).

Example 77. Harmonic outline, "Madrigal," HMS Pinafore, Act I.

```
\[ V \text{ dVII} / \text{V} \text{ a} \text{ VII} \text{4} \text{ I} \text{ a1} \text{ VI} \text{ V/VI} \text{ V7/IV} \text{ b} \text{ IV} \text{ V1} \text{6} \text{ V7} \text{ I :} \text{I} \text{ a} \text{ pedal} \text{ enhance} \text{ cadential} \text{ relationship} \text{ bet. a-1 and a.}
```

Additional framing is provided by the placement of the piece's only authentic full cadences on the tonic between the introduction and the first vocal phrase and at the very end of the piece (Table 4, mm. 4-5, and 16-17, resp.). An authentic half cadence on the subdominant has a similar, albeit subordinate function, introducing the closing section b (Figure 11, mm. 13-14, p. 212).

The thematic and structural symbolization at the phrase/section level: a-1 || a a1 b || shows variation to be the predominant procedure at that level. At the same level, contrast assumes a framing function and recurrence is a function of strophic repetition. At the subphrase level melodic variation and rhythmic recurrence balance each other in the phrases a-1 and b, whereas contrast is the only relationship between the subphrases in phrases a and a1. This contrast at subphrase level is balanced
at the phrase/section level by the almost literal re-
iteration of the a rhythmic pattern in a (Fig. 11, re-
currence in rhythmic patterns indications, p. 212), and
the overall similarity between the frames x and x1 in the
same sections (Fig. 11, mm 8-9 and 12-13), the latter
being a transposed version of the former with a slight
substitution in woodwind tone color (clarinet for flute).

Variation and recurrence at motivic level ought
to be seen in the context of a larger structural function.
However, the syncopated accompaniment figure, whose im-
mediate effect seems to be the masking of the metric
continuum, may be perceived as a variant of the anacrustic
figure based on the vocal line's first motive, and thus
a motivic variation without a sectional or subsectional
structural function. In a larger context its function may
be perceived as that of an element of unity, given its
quasi ostinato frequency of appearance throughout the
piece. (Example 78).

Example 78. Accompaniment figure as motivic variation,
"Madrigal," HMS Pinafore, Act I.
The melodic contours of phrases a and a1 may be described as barely interrupted descending lines. The phrase a1 is contained within a pentachord with its top note ornamented by an upper neighbour and its bottom note by its lower. The second phrase, a1, is extended to a similarly ornamented hexachord. The third phrase, b, has a more elaborate melodic contour: both its first and its second subphrases consist of descending pentachords whose compasses overlap. The anacruses to both pentachords are placed below the pentachords' first notes, providing a brief ascent before the longer descending pattern of the main line (Example 79).

Example 79. Melodic patterns in the vocal line (solo and chorus), "Madrigal," HMS Pinafore, Act I.

The predominance of unidirectional penta- and hexachords in this piece's melodic structure contrasts markedly with the succession on subphrase and hypermeasure melodic arches found in the preceding two numbers (Examples 46, 46a, 46b, p. 131 and Example 69, p. 165). The contrast between this number and that of Little Buttercup immediately preceding song is particularly significant in terms of characterization. Buttercup's short arch-like melodic patterns, contained within hypermeasures, match
neatly the brief textual descriptions of her wares in the fashion of street vendors' cries. Conversely, the longer melodic lines in Ralph's song reflect the elegant poetic diction of the text in a sweep that does not return to the starting note. A similar contrast exists between Ralph's song and the opening shanty of his shipmates (Example 80).


Opening Chorus

Buttercup's Aria

Madrigal

The avoidance of such popular or folk music patterns as those that characterize the first two numbers enables the Madrigal to establish the probability of Ralph's noble birth discovery by musical as well as by textual means. The procedure is reminiscent of the characterization by genre traditionally found in the German Singspiel, and of the procedure used by André Grétry in many of his operas, whereby peasants were assigned short metric patterns and persons of noble birth longer ones.

---

capable, according to Grétry, of expressing statelier rhythms than the rustic 2/4 and 6/8.\footnote{Martin Cooper, \textit{Opéra Comique} (New York: Chanticleer Press, 1949), 40.}

The predominant fabric in the piece is one of melody/accompaniment, the only exception being the homophonic fabric of section b, which enhances by contrast the framing function of this section. the replacement of the solo tenor by the three-part male chorus in the second subphrase of section b provides an element of contrast without abandoning the homophonic fabric.

The Madrigal is scored for flute, oboe, two clarinets, and strings. The use of woodwinds exemplifies Sullivan's accompanying orchestration at its most discrete: out of a total of thirty measures (seventeen plus thirteen repeated), the oboe plays a single measure with an anacrusis as a tonal variant to the flute's motto (Fig. 11, m. 2 and anacrusis, p. 212). Both instruments are used in their most expressive registers. The similarly ranged tone-painting of the clarinet and the flute (Example 75, p. 178) take only two measures each, repeated strophically. Finally, both clarinets double the chorus in the last three measures of the piece, along with the strings. The strings accompany at all times, providing a subtle aura of sound without impinging on the voice or the
woodwind tone painting. A significant factor in Ralph's musical characterization is relationship between the ever present string accompaniment and the key of the piece, Ab major. This key virtually precludes any sympathetic open-string resonance, especially that of upper strings in the violins. It produces a sectional sound that is both subdued and homogeneous. Besides contrasting with the brighter string sound of the preceding C major numbers (Figs. 4, 5, and 9, pp. 91, 142, and 169, resp.), this choice of key and instrumentation matches in sound the text's mellifluousness, resulting from its consonance on the liquid letter l (Example 73, p. 175). The characterization in this instance also functions as foreshadowing, again emphasizing the lyrical aspect of the piece which may be easily associated with gentle birth.

Again, it is interesting to compare Sullivan to Grétry. The Victorian eclectic, who never expostulated on musico-dramatic exegesis (well, hardly ever... he once made a remark to Ethel Smyth which summed up his attitude towards the craft of composition: "An artist has got to make a shillingsworth of goods out of a penn'orth of material, and here you go chucking away sovereigns for nothing") makes use of tonality contrast as a device

of characterization as a matter of pragmatic, if not of fortuitous, choice. The factors presumably considered in Sullivan’s choice are the linear context of the preceding and possibly following number’s tonalities, the tenor’s expressive vocal range and tessitura, and the acoustical implications of standard string tuning, all subordinated to textual requirements. On the other hand Grétry’s simplistic adaptation of the doctrine of affections assumes that each key possesses intrinsic affective meaning applicable a priori to corresponding elements of the libretto.

Grétry’s prescriptions are not always off the mark. Hardly anybody would deny the melancholy implications of the minor mode or the opposite effect of the major, but the assignment of noble qualities to C major, bellicose to G major, and brilliant to D major, as if these keys could not express all of the above qualities in combination with other pertinent elements - melodic contours, harmony, dynamics, rhythm, tempo, and timbre is, in fact, positivistic hair-splitting of a naive, pre-Comtian kind. This comparison of Grétry’s prescriptiveness with Sullivan’s serendipitous pragmaticism is significant as an exegesis of aesthetics, since the latter represents the twilight of the spoken dialogue opera, and the former, born a century

before Sullivan, was the first composer to apply the aesthetic thought of the Enciclopedistes to the spoken dialogue genre in works of considerable craftsmanship and magnitude, placing the prosodically correct word-setting at the core of musical composition for the theatre.¹¹

The sectional outline symbolizations of the Madrigal present what may be described as an AAB Bar form,¹² modified through sectional variation and strophic repetition into an a-1 ||: a a1 b || structure (Fig. 11, p. 212). The Madrigal, its recitativo,¹³ and the following Ballad are designated as such in the vocal score.¹⁴

Yet, the set of original parts designates all three as a scena and air, without the above mentioned subtitles.¹⁵ This designation points out the cavatina-recitativo-cabaletta character of the above mentioned pieces,¹⁶ which defines the Madrigal as a cavatina in a contextual or functional aspect. The previously described forms-in of that piece corroborate such a classification:

---

¹¹ Cooper, Ibid., 41.
¹² "Bar Form," Harvard Dict. of Music, loc. cit.
¹³ HMS Pinafore, vocal score, no. 3. ¹⁴ Ibid., no. 3a.
¹⁴ Ibid., no. 3a.
¹⁵ HMS Pinafore, set of orch. parts, No. 3.
¹⁶ Grout, 361.
the setting is syllabic, there is almost no textual repetition, and the tempo is moderate. These features and modest scope of the piece define it as a cavatina formally, just as its placement in a scena defines it functionally.17

A modulating recitativo (Figure 12, p. 213) connects this cavatina with the following Ballad (Fig. 13, p. 214). Its text begins with a heroic quatrain: iambics in a stanzaic scheme abab₅₆, again a function of characterization through literary genre (see Ex. 72, p. 171). The stanza enjams with a classical stichomythia (Ex. 81, 81a).


Ralph: I love - and love, alas, above my station!
Buttercup: He loves - and loves a lass above his station!
All: Yes, yes, the lass is much above his station!


Queen: Hamlet, thou hast thy father much offended.
Hamlet: Mother, you have my father much offended.
Queen: Come, come, you answer with an idle tongue.
Hamlet: Go, go, you question with a wicked tongue.

In addition to stichomythia, the recitativo's text also

17. Ibid., 212.
contains a pun on the words "alas," "a lass," and "the lass," an element indicative of Gilbert's early endeavors in burlesque, a genre rather partial to paronomastic excesses. The pun in question tends to remain on paper, an experience shared by many Gilbert and Sullivan performers, from this writer to the eminent Savoy chorusmaster, William Cox-Ife. It is quite possible that Gilbert himself realized the incompatibility of punning, a device based on sound interplay, with even the most discreet musical setting. All punning in subsequent Savoy operas is relegated to spoken dialogue (Examples 82, 82a, 82b, 82c).


-Maj. Gen.: Stop, I think we are getting confused. When you said "orphan", did you mean "orphan" - a person who has lost his parents, or "often" - frequently?
Pirate King: Ah! I beg pardon. - I see what you mean - frequently.
-Maj. Gen.: Ah! you said often - frequently.
Pirate King: No, only once.
-Maj. Gen. (irritated): Exactly - you said often, frequently, only once.


Yum-yum refers to the severity of the law that punishes flirting with death...
Yum-yum: Still, that does not make it right.
To flirt is capital.
Nanki-Poo: It is capital.
Nanki-Poo simply finds flirting very pleasant.


Duke of Plaza-Toro: ... You must impress your Court with your importance. You want deportment - carriage -
Giuseppe: We've got a carriage.

All in all, Gilbert shows considerable restraint in the use of the pun. The above examples comprise all the punning in the Savoy operas, and thus, they, in effect, represent the twilight of the calembour anglais in Victorian comedy. The pun on "alas" coincides with a melodic variation on the notes Bb-Ab-G, which enhances the modified reiteration of the stichomythic text. The Bb-Ab-g melodic pattern first appears in a descending melodic line preceding a cadence (Fig. 12, mm. 4-5, p. 213), then as part of a cadence (Fig. 12, mm. 8-9) with the same pitches. The first melodic variation appears with the second textual reference to Josephine's station (Fig. 12, m. 11), and the second variation with the chorus' reiteration of this statement (Fig. 12, m. 13). In both cases the melodic pattern coincides with the cadence and
enhances it melodically by introducing a neumatic pattern on the word "station" into an otherwise syllabic passage. The melodic variation Bb-Ab-G, Bb-A-G, and B-A-G consists of the most salient surface elements in the modulation from Ab major to C major underlying the recitativo, thus providing an element of unity to the passage (Example 83).

Example 83. Melodic recurrence pattern, "Recitativo;"--
*HMS* Pinafore, Act I, No. 3.

\[ \text{Musical notation} \]

The Ballad which ends the *scena* has a text that is much more direct in the description of Ralph's feelings than the allegorical text of the Madrigal. The first stanza describes a beautiful maiden and the high station her suitors. The second stanza introduces the hopeless love of a poor swain of lowly birth for the maiden, and
the third stanza reveals their respective identities: Josephine and Ralph. This directness of the Ballad may be seen as a function of plot development, since this principal complication of the plot is introduced gradually in the scena: the Madrigal merely hints in prosopopeic fashion at love sorrows while presenting the lyrical nature of Ralph's character, thus enhancing his believability as an oppressed hero. The recitativo describes his hopeless love without disclosing its object, and finally the Ballad, as mentioned above, introduces all elements of the complication, but one: Josephine's reciprocation of Ralph's love.

The iambic trimeter of the text is cast into an isometric six-line stanza with an aabcc\vspace{2pt}b rhyming scheme. This stanza, originated in the medieval Latin versus caudatus and the French rime couée, figures prominently in English poetry from the 16th century drama to Wordsworth, Browning, and Swinburne. The last line of Ralph's stanza is repeated by the chorus, in a manner identical to the Madrigal. In both cases the musical setting by dint of solo-ensemble contrast merely frames the six-line stanza, instead of extending it into a seven-line one, as it would seem at first glance in the libretto.

The framing function of the repeated line is additionally enhanced through an added unstressed syllable. This hypermetric procedure ends the line with a feminine rhyme, contrasting with the other lines which end on a masculine rhyme (Example 83).

Example 83. Gilbert, "HMS Pinafore," Ibid., 104.

Ralph: A maiden fair to see,  a
     The pearl of minstrelsy;  a
     A bud of blushing beauty;  b fem rhyme
     For whom proud nobles sigh,  c
     And with each other vie.  c
     To do her menial duty.  b " "

All: To do her menial duty. (b) Repeated line

Except for the hypermetric third and sixth lines with the concomitant feminine rhyme, the text's prosody is remarkably regular. The musical setting reflects the metric regularity in particular through a syllabic and accentual approach that produces a repetitive rhythmic pattern < repeats predominate throughout the Ballad (Fig. 13, passim, p. 214). The few quantitative exceptions to the accentual setting occur at the ends of phrases, and therefore have a framing function (Ex. 84).

Example 84. Accentual phrase frame, "Ballad," Act I, No. 3a, HMS Pinafore.
Strictly speaking, the only quantitative element in the phrase ending is the first long note following the succession of even eighth-notes, that is, the first syllable of "... blushing beauty." The other syllables are set in even values twice as long as those earlier in the phrase. Thus, the accentual character of the setting is preserved through proportionally augmented values, which also function as a framing element at phrase level.

A completely accentual setting without the augmentation would place the feminine rhyme with its unaccented last syllable on the last eighth-note of the phrase's third measure. This would not allow for a conventional four-measure phrase and would call for a metric shift of the next phrase's anacrusis or for a full measure gap in the vocal line between the two phrases of a period.

Neither solution would provide the simple regularity expected in a cabaletta, and the Ballad, although somewhat slower than the typical cabaletta of Classical and Romantic opera, functions as such by virtue of its placement as the last discrete component of a cavatina-recitativo-cabaletta unit. The entire scena, Madrigal, recitativo, and Ballad, scaled down to match the durational scope of the opera, may be compared structurally to the Ah fors' e lui - Follie, follie and Sempre Libera

number in Verdi's *La Traviata*. The already mentioned moderate tempo, untypical for the usually fast-paced ca-
baletta, may be seen as an element of gradual plot develop-
ment and characterization: Ralph's introductory *Scena* is
eminently lyrical, reinforcing through this gentle quality
the credibility of his image as a satire on both the op-
ressed heroes and naive heroines of melodrama and opera
comique. Subject to Sir Joseph's demagoguery, evident
in the pompous Glee composed by Sir Joseph for the sailors
(Fig. 31, p. 360), Ralph declares his love to Josephine
in the passionate duet "Refrain, Audacious Tar" (Fig. 34,
p. 367). Thus, he progresses from a restrained lover's
lament to a four-square stolid martial tune and then to
a passionate outburst, which makes his suicide threat in
the Finale of Act I a logical increment of previous be-
havior (Fig. 37, mm. 22-23, p. 469). The intervening
lyrical interludes in both the abovementioned duet (Fig.
31, section B) and the Finale I (Fig. 37, mm. 1-17)
provide Ralph's characterization with a unifying element
by consistently emphasizing his mild nature. The already
mentioned suicide threat and the defiance of the Captain's
ire in the second Act (Fig. 52, mm. 1-30, p. 484), in
contrast with this element, increase the depth of Ralph's

character, however incidental this depth may be, since it is generated by Sir Joseph's demagoguery acting upon Ralph's gullibility.

At this early junction, however, Ralph is not ready to defy anyone; hence the lyrical treatment of a form usually presented con brio. The other attributes of the cabaletta, overall simplicity, rhythmic uniformity, and, as mentioned, a closing function in a scena, are certainly evident in the piece: a repetitive rhythmic pattern is almost ubiquitous in the solo vocal line (Example 85), and the sectional frames in the the chorus also show a uniform pattern (Example 86).

Example 85. Recurrent rhythmic pattern, "Ballad," Act I, No. 3a, HMS Pinafore. Also refer to Table 6, phrases a, a1, b, b1 literally, c, and c1 with some variation, p. xxx).

Example 86. Rhythmic pattern, sectional frame, Ibid. Also refer to Table 6, frames y, y1, 2, and 3.

The melodic contours and structure of the Ballad, although not as deliberately simple as the arch-like half-phrases and hypermeasures of the previous two numbers (Examples 45, 45a and b, and 68, pp. 126 and 162, resp.), consist primarily of ornamented tetra- and pentachordal
patterns revolving around a single tonal center with a brief digression to the submediant (Example 87).

Example 87. Melodic Outline, Ibid.
Also refer to Figure 13, p. 214, for full melody; phrase designations in this example and above figure are coincident.

The characteristic rhythmic pattern of the solo voice sections (Example 85) arises from a faithful setting of the stanza with its intervening feminine rhyme (Example 83, p. 192). The equally characteristic choral frames are, as mentioned before, also a result of the composer's close adherence to scansion (Example 86). There is a slight
deviation from the predominantly syllabic setting procedure in the middle section's aorogic treatment of the stanza's feminine rhyme b: the two initial syllables of the phrase frame are set neumatically (see augmented quantitative frame, Example 84, p. 194, and Fig. 13, phrase b, m. 17, p. 214).

The harmonic structure of the piece shows digressive rather than modulatory harmonies (Example 88), entirely in keeping with the simplicity of the cabaletta. The only instance in which the tonal center of the piece shifts away from the C major of the main key occurs in middle section which cadences on the submediant (Table 6, mm. 21-22). This brief modulation, differentiated from the surrounding secondary dominants by a VI6 V7/VI VI progression, enhances affectively the underlying text which mentions lovesick sighing. Structurally, this modulation is at once the point of greatest excursion from the tonal center of the piece and the beginning of a return to the main key and the modified recapitulation of the initial section. Its location approximately halfway through the piece gives symmetry to the harmonic scheme of the Ballad, which in turn reinforces the overall symmetry of the piece found in the repeated thematic material, including the largest-dimension frames x (Fig. 13, mm. 1-4 and 37-40, respectively).
Example 88. Harmonic Outline, "Ballad," Act I, No. 3a, 
HMS Pinafore.
Also refer to Table 6 for pertinent section and phrase designations.

Introduction (phrase x)

I \text{V} / \text{II} \ II_{6} \ I_{6} \ V_{7} \ I

Section A

phrase a

I \text{V}_7 \ II_{6} \ I_{6} \ V_{7} \ I \ V_{7/II} \ II \ V_{6} \ V_{7/IV} \ V

sectional frame y

V_{7/IV} \ V

Section B

phrase b

V_{7} \ \text{app.II}_{6} \ \text{app.V}_{7} \ VII_{2/III} \ V_{7/IV} \ IV \ VI_{6} \ V_{7/VI} \ VI

sectional frame y

VI_{6} \ V_{7/VI} \ VI \ V_{6}

Section A1

phrase a

I \text{V}_7 \ II_{6} \ I_{6} \ V_{7} \ I \ V_{7/II} \ II \ dII_{6} \ I_{6} \ V_{6} \ V_{7} \ VI \ V_{6}

Coda

phrase c

I \text{V}_{7/II} \ dII_{6} \ I_{6} \ V_{2/IV} \ V_{7} \ I

Instrumental postlude: a literal reiteration of Intro. x.

At first glance, the repeated rhythmic pattern throughout the piece suggests variation as a procedural clue to its formal structure. However, a second look at the piece's melodic outline (Example 87, p. 198) discloses
an A B A¹ scheme. The inherent symmetry of this ternary scheme is enhanced by the opening and closing frames (Fig. 13, phrases x, mm. 1-4 and 37-40, p. 214). The inner frames provide an element of variation, better perceived in the context of a variation, contrast, and recurrence tabulation of the piece’s melodic elements (Example 89).

Example 89. Variation, Contrast, and Recurrence Patterns, "Ballad," Act I, No. 3a, HMS Pinafore.
Also refer to Table 6 for pertinent period and phrase designations.
The preceding Example 89, in addition to the variation, contrast, and recurrence tabulation in the melody, shows a four-measure phrase pattern interrupted by two-measure extensions and a final five-measure phrase. This last extension is a written out rallentando, since it occurs on the final cadence of the vocal setting (Fig. 13, m. 36, p. 214). The following phrasing pattern may be outlined on the basis of Example 89:

Example 90. Phrase/Measure Pattern, Ibid.

Section A: a  a1  frame y
       4 mm.  4 mm.  2 mm.

Section B: b  b1  frame y2
       4 mm.  4 mm.  2 mm.

Section A1: a' c  c1
       4 mm.  4 mm.  5 mm.

*the outer frames x consist of 4 mm. each.

The melodic excursions of the vocal setting may be seen as functions of linear symmetry. The melodic contours of the outer sections A and A1 feature phrase-long descending lines, whereas the melodic contours of the middle section B feature an ascending line in its first phrase, and a descending one in the second, achieving thus a central arch-like structure (Example 91). The point of highest melodic excursion, along with the ascending hexachord which precedes it, is placed in the highest expressive part of the tenor's range. This enhances
the text's description of Ralph's oppressed and seemingly hopeless condition (Fig. 13, mm. 16-17, p. 214). This heightening of the piece's emotional level through the abovementioned affective device is followed by an already described affective device, also illustrative of Ralph's lamentations: a modulation into the minor mode.


The minor mode is used in a similar manner to enhance the text's repeated reference to Ralph's predicament in the Coda, after the words "...Oh, pity, pity me..." However, this time the affective device is not modulatory: a single supertonic chord preceded by its dominant supplies the pertinent minor (Fig. 13, mm. 29-30 and 33-34). This minor chord is followed by its diminished form, which, being the only one of that kind in the entire piece,
calls further attention to Ralph's lamentations while functioning as a dominant indicator in the harmonic structure, and consequently as part of the formal frame in the largest dimensions (Fig. 13, mm. 30 and 34, resp., p. 214).

The orchestration of the Ballad-cabaletta is as discreet as that of the Madrigal-cavatina, a feature quite consistent with the traditional simplicity of both forms and the lyricism of this particular scena. However, the resemblance ends there: tone painting is the most salient feature of the cavatina's orchestration (Example 75, p. 178), whereas the orchestration of the cabaletta is completely devoid of any conventionally descriptive elements. This contrast may be perceived as a reflection of the respective manners of poetic diction in both numbers. The tone painting in the cavatina illustrates the prosopopeic allegories of its text (see p. 165) literally, while the deliberately unobtrusive musical setting of the cabaletta's text allows for a clear perception of its direct statements (see pp. 184-5). The section A (Fig. 13) features a melody/metric-continuum accompaniment fabric whose respective elements are assigned to the solo voice and the strings, in that order (Example 92). The sectional frame y is, in contrast to the preceding section, homophonic, with clarinets and lower strings doubling and complementing the three-part chorus (Example 93). The middle
section B reunites both aforementioned fabrics in its first phrase: the solo voice and the strings continue with the melody/accompaniment fabric, while the flute and two clarinets provide a three-upper-parts harmonic doubling to the solo voice (Example 94)

Example 92. Fabric and Orchestration. "Ballad," section A, Act I, No. 3a. HMS Pinafore. mm. 4-12, passim.

Example 93. Fabric and Orchestration, Ibid., sectional frame y, mm. 12-14.

Example 94. Fabric and Orchestration, Ibid., section B, mm. 14-18.
The doubling in section B (fig. 13, mm. 14-22, p. 214) parallels rhythmically the syllabic setting of the text, and therefore juxtaposes with the metric continuum figure of the string accompaniment the continuum's eighth-note microcomponents in the woodwinds. The resultant increase in volume, rhythmic density, and textural complexity complements the increase in affective intensity created by the rising melodic line of the phrase b (Example 94), which in turn reflects the pathos of the text (see p. 193). After the peak reached by the aforementioned elements at the end of phrase b, the melodic line begins to descend in an undulating fashion towards the end of the phrase b1 (Example 94). This is paralleled in the orchestra first by the replacement of the flute by the oboe, marking the beginning of a new element of linear structure with a new timbre, and then by an orchestrated decrescendo in the last three measures of the phrase, which returns to a melody/accompaniment fabric assigned again to voice and strings. The decrescendo in volume, the homogenization in timbre, and the descending melodic line are enhanced further by a decrease in the rhythmic density of the accompaniment, which consists at this point of block chords longer than the metric continuum figure of the preceding accompaniments (Example 94, last three measures).
The orchestration of the sectional frame y1 (Fig. 13, mm. 22-24, p. 214) is identical to that of the first sectional frame y (example 93). The following section A1 (Fig. 13, mm. 24-32) true to the principle of modified recapitulation applied to earlier numbers of this opera (see p. 142), begins with a restatement of the initial phrase a that is literal in the topmost melodic line, but features an upper-three-parts harmonic doubling identical to that in the first phrase of section B (Example 94, p. 205) and an orchestration fuller than that of the its eponymous phrase a (Example 92, p. 205). The three-part doubling with its homophonic harmonization of every micro-component of the continuum is assigned to the violins and violas, while the cellos, basses, two horns, and bassoon provide a waltz-like accompaniment similar to that of the piece's beginning (Example 92, p. 205). The stressed bass note of this figure is assigned, of course, to the low strings, while the horns and bassoon play the unstressed chords on the second and third beats (Example 95).

Example 95. Fabric and Orchestration, Ibid., section A1, phrase a, mm. 24-28.
The second phrase of the section A1 (Fig. 13, phrase c, mm. 28-32, p. 214) returns to a simpler melody/accompaniment fabric than that of its predecessor (Ex. 95). The orchestration reflects this simplicity: the strings sustain the harmony, and since the harmonic rhythm at this point is trochaic \( \uparrow \downarrow \) the dactylic pattern \( \uparrow \uparrow \downarrow \) of the piece's metric continuum is considerably deemphasized. The solo voice is doubled by the oboe in the first two measures of the phrase, providing a timbral contrast with the previous phrase in this ancillary melodic function, and the doubling is dropped in the last two measures of the phrase, providing the third level in a subtle orchestrated decrescendo: the volume of the first two measures of phrase c is less than that of the preceding phrase a due to their respective orchestrations (strings plus horns and bassoon, and strings plus oboe), and the volume of the last two measures is reduced further by employing the string section alone homophonically with the solo voice (Example 96).

Example 96. Fabric and Orchestration, Ibid., section A1, phrase c, mm. 28-32.
The Coda, a modified restatement of the phrase c (Fig. 13, mm. 32-37, p. 214) has no solo voice doubling at all. Instead it features a homophonic accompaniment that consists of sustained harmonies in the chorus, with the strings doubling only the attack of those sustained chords (Example 97).

Example 97. Fabric, Orchestral and Choral Timbres, Ibid., Coda, mm. 32-37.

The outer formal frames x enclose the piece both thematically (Fig. 13, mm. 1-4 and 37-40) and timbrally: they are the only instances that reunite all the instruments for which the piece is scored in the same Tutti. The frames x also contain a brief hint of polyphonic treatment in their first two measures, again a useful fabric contrast in terms of their framing function (Example 98).
Example 98. Fabric and Orchestration, Ibid., frames x, mm. 1-4 and 37-40.

After examining the orchestration and the concomitant fabric of the cabaletta, its timbral and textural variety appears to be quite considerable (Example 99). There are two important functions that may be ascribed to this variety: enhancement of the elements of linear structure, since the shifts in timbre and texture coincide with section, phrases, and half phrases, and contrast with the rather static harmonies (Example 88, p. 200) and regular phrase structure of the piece (Example 90, p. 202).

Example 99. Timbral and Textural Alternation, Ibid.
The alternating woodwind sonorities tabulated in Example 99 have a function of timbral contrast. Conversely, the strings provide timbral continuity, therefore contributing to stylistic unity. The C major key of the cabaletta makes for a more resonant, and consequently brighter, string sound. This feature contrasts aptly with the cavatina's more subdued string sonority (see p. 186) and matches in overall sonority the more marked rhythmic character and ultimately the more direct character of the lyrics (see p. 193). All in all, the cavatina-recitativo-cabaletta within the scena may be seen as foreshadowing the thought that eventually prompts Ralph's actions by progressing from allegorical to direct in the text and from a languid cantabile to a rather rhythmic ballad with brighter sound and more orchestrated volume in the music. This particular scena differs from the traditional cavatina-cabaletta in that it lacks the usual abrupt contrast between its two discrete components. This feature evidences the composer's attention to character development in music rather than to the immediate effect of a musical coup de théâtre which would unduly emphasize the inherently episodic nature of the discrete numbers.
Figure No. 11: Act I, No. 3, Madrigal.
Figure 12: Act I, Recitativo, Nos. 3 and 3a.
Figure 13: Act I, No. 3a, Ballad
CHAPTER VI

NO. 4: RECITATIVO AND CHORUS: CAPTAIN AND CREW

Once again, spoken lines separate two discrete musical numbers. When the boatswain and the crew commiserate with Ralph and agree with his pessimistic appraisal of the chances he has to win Josephine's hand and heart, Dick Deadeye also agrees with them in a simple, straightforward, manner. However innocuous his remarks, and however consonant with the sentiments of the crew, they nevertheless bring him scorn and vituperation from his shipmates. This absurdly gratuitous reaction by the crew to Dick's remarks parodies the conventionality of the melodrama villain by hyperbolizing the artificiality of the villainy. Also, the abuse of Dick by the crew provides additional motivation for his later betrayal of the elopement (Fig. 47, p. 479).

Similarly to the first dialogue, this one precedes a recitativo, creating a potential functional and structural redundance. The functional redundance is minimized by the spoken lines' ability to dispel key feeling, obviating the need for a modulatory transition between the C major Scena and the A major recitativo stromentate that follows. The structural redundance is minimized by a close integration of the recitativo with the song it precedes. This is
achieved through the initial outer frame of the entire piece, its orchestral introduction, which places the recitativo between a quotation from the song's first theme and the song itself. This procedure, separating through drastic media contrast the spoken lines from their recitativo cognates, is somewhat reminiscent of the Baroque motto or devisen-aria. ¹ Also, it provides the piece with a sort of false start (Fig. 14, mm. 1-4, p. 214).

The text of the recitativo in which Captain Corcoran and his crew greet each other is written in unrhymed iambic pentameter. The use of the standard prosodic medium of English drama heightens the comical effect of the exaggerated politeness in these greetings, whose ceremonial diction is out of place in the mouths of simple Jack Tars. A similar comical effect is produced by the recitativo, whose unobtrusive string accompaniment and conventional melodic contours resemble the recitativo secco. This deliberate anachronism characterizes the relationship between the Captain and the crew through musical means, by evoking the courtliness of the Rococo period's gallant style (Examples 100 and 101). The cumulative effect of the recitativo's textual diction and musical style as characterization devices acquires particular relief in contrast with the shanty-like Opening Chorus.

Example 100. W. A. Mozart, "Recitativo," Don Giovanni, Act II, Scene I, passim.


An additional comical effect is obtained by the crew's choral unison in their recitativo lines, which underscores the snapping to attention and saluting on every line prescribed by Gilbert.

The recitativo's simple harmonies progress from the tonic to a half-cadence on the dominant (Fig. 14, mm. 18-19, p. 241). An orchestral introduction reappears, this time
based on the forthcoming song's refrain, preceding the song itself. The song's text is largely stichomythic: the exchange of compliments between the Captain and the crew that began in the recitativo is continued in the song. Gilbert's typography follows the stichomythic pattern, and thus forms a stanza with the scheme \( x_5 \ a \ a \ a \ a \ a a_3 \) with a single rhyme in lines two through eight. The meter appears to be a predominantly iambic trimeter with occasional anapaestic anacrases (Example 102).


Capt.: I am the Captain of the Pinafore.
Crew: And a right good Captain, too!
Capt.: You're very, very good,
And be it understood,
I command a right good crew.
Crew: We're very, very good,
And be it understood,
He commands a right good crew

The second stanza features a different rhyme scheme, a larger number of typographic lines, and a considerable variety in line length. This heterometric stanza may be outlined as \( ccc \ d d_3 \ e e_1 e_2 c_4 \). The stichomythic section, which in the first stanza is placed at the beginning, occurs at the end of the second stanza, creating an arch-like construction in the text. The metric variety within the line is also greater in this stanza: lines one through six are iambic with occasional irregular feet,
seven and eight are amphibrachic, nine is trochaic, and
the tenth line is, again, iambic (Example 102a).

Example 102a. Ibid., second stanza.

Capt.: Though related to a peer,
I can hand, reef, and steer,
And ship a seavager;
I am never known to quail
At the fury of a gale,
And I'm never, never sick at sea!

Crew: What, never?
Capt.: No, never!
Crew: What, never?
Capt.: Hardly ever!
Crew: He's hardly ever sick at sea!

These rather oddly structured stanzas are closed
by a rhymed tetrametric couplet. Its first line is strictly
iambic, and its second line has an anapaestic anacrusis
(Example 102b).

Crew: Then give three cheers and one cheer more,
For the hardy Captain of the Pinafore!

Two additional stanzas with a slightly modified
rhyme scheme but almost identical metrics follow. The sti-
chomythic procedure is applied in the same manner, with the
stichomythia in the fourth stanza reiterating the one in the
second almost literally. In this stanza the Captain declares
that he never uses a "...big, big D," thereby foreshadowing
his angry utterance of the fatal word "Damme!" which precipitates the false reversal in Act II.

The already mentioned odd stanzaic structure may be perceived to be considerably less so if the poem is scanned without regard to its typography, basing line division on the strongest syntactic pauses combined with exact rhymes (Example 103).

Example 103. Ibid. Alternate scansion.

I am the Captain of the Pinafore, and a right good Captain, too! Rhyme a.
You're very, very good, and be it understood, I command a right good crew. Rh. a.
We're very, very good, and be it understood, he commands a right good crew. Rh. a.
Though related to a peer, I can hand, reef, and steer, and ship a selavage, Rh. b.
I am never known to quail at the fury of a gale, and I'm never, never sick at sea. Rh. b.
Then give three cheers and one cheer more! Rhyme c
For the hardy Captain of the Pinafore. Rh. c

Thus rewritten, the first two stanzas and the couplet form an octave stanza. The rhyme scheme aaabbbccc is somewhat unusual in a traditional octave, but the summary character and the shorter lines of the closing couplet are quite reminiscent semantically and prosodically of
the correspondent closural elements in the ottava rima, one of the most prominent stanzaic forms in English poetry.² Scanned in the conventional syllable-stress metric, the lines thus rewritten seem excessively long by traditional English poetry standards, which rarely admit meters longer than the hexameter: even Swinburne's superb septenary tends to break into trimeters and tetrameters.³ However, scanning the rewritten stanza as strongestress verse, a possible predecessor and subsequent variety of sprung rhythm verse,⁴ it is possible to discern considerably shorter line meters. The tercets aaa and bbb became pentametric and the closing couplet cc dimetric. However unusual the rhyming scheme, the metrics in aaabbb5cc2 approximate the stanza to the traditional octaves of English poetry.⁵ An interesting poetic device consisting of two different meters appearing in the same line, called counterpointing by Gerald Manley Hopkins,⁶ may be discerned in practically every line of the rewritten stanza. The concluding feet of every line except the

2. Haublein, 29.


5. Haublein, loc. cit.

seventh abandon the strong-stress for a syllable-stress metric. The seventh line, being dipodic, that is double-iambic, may be scanned in either metric. In lines one through four these concluding feet are predominantly iambic, but in the lines five through eight the strong-stress metric is simply replaced by an amphimacer on the last three syllables without a previous shift to syllable-stress. The lines one through four present an additional ambiguity by shifting metrics twice: once from strong-to-syllable-stress, and then from the iambics of the syllable-stress to a final amphimacer. The amphimacric endings are enhanced syntactically and confirm the octave structure of the rewritten stanza (Example 103a).

Example 103a. Ibid., syllable-stress and amphimacric endings.

1. ... and a right good Captain, too!
2. ... I command a right good crew.
3. ... he commands a right good crew.
4. ... and ship a selvagee;
5. ... sick at sea!
6. ... "" "" ""
7. ... one cheer more
8. ... \textit{Pinafore}!

It interesting to note that the strong-stress sections coincide with the rhymes made internal by the transcription of the original stanzaic structure (Ex. 103).
The characteristic rhythmic patterns of the vocal setting arise from the prosodic variety of the text. The composer makes a quantitative differentiation between the settings of the accented feet and the unaccented ones in the strong-stress sections. The syllable-stress sections are set with the same quantitative values as the principal feet in the strong-stress sections. However, the stress alternations within each of the three metric varieties, strong-stress principal, strong-stress secondary, and syllable-stress, are treated accentually (Example 104).

Example 104. Gilbert and Sullivan, "Recitativo and Song," 
HMS Pinafore, Act I, No. 4, mm. 27-30.

The setting is predominantly syllabic, but Sullivan uses neumatic elements on occasion in order to reiterate literally certain rhythmic and melodic patterns without disturbing the equal syllabic duration of the accentual elements (Example 104, above). Other instances of neumatic treatment occur at phrase frames: the contrast of this procedure with the prevailing syllabic one enhances the cadential points melodically at the ends of several phrases (Example 105).
Example 105. Ibid., neumatic groups at melodic cadences, mm. 34, 38, 42; respectively.

The two most characteristic rhythmic patterns arising from the word-setting are found in the phrases a and b motives (Example 106).

Example 106. Ibid., Rhythmic patterns: mm. 28, 32, passim.

The first of these patterns marks the beginning of the song. The second is the most frequent throughout the song, and therefore the most conspicuous. The patterns are mirror images of each other, and thus, at least from a rhythmic standpoint, the second is a variant of the first. The initial appearance of the first pattern in the song is twofold, and it is followed by a single appearance of the second pattern. All this occurs in the first phrase (Fig. 14, phrase a, mm. 28-31, p. 241), which, again in
a rhythmic context, makes that phrase contain the kernel for the entire piece's development. It is worth noting that the cadential patterns of the last two phrases of the vocal part take their rhythmic shape from the first and the second patterns respectively, framing the song with the two principal rhythmic elements of the piece (Example 107).

Example 107. *Ibid.*, Rhythmic patterns at cadences, mm. 54, 57, respectively.

Other characteristic rhythmic patterns derived from a close relationship between the textual prosody and the musical setting are the amphimacric phrase endings (Example 108).

A four-measure phrasing pattern is maintained throughout the piece almost without exception. The only discrepancy between the surface melodic and rhythmic patterns and the established four-measure phrasing continuum occurs in the extension phrase b4 (Fig. 16, p. 243). The half-cadence that ends the phrase b3 (Fig. 14, mm. 46-47, p. 241) is extended melodically through a pattern once augmented, and harmonically through a reiteration of the dominant half-cadence over a dominant pedal in the bass (Fig. 15, mm. 47-54, p. 242). This extension takes up six measures, and the following phrase containing the motive b4 proper is compressed into a two-measure half-phrase so that the resultant 6+2 mm. internal construction of the extended phrase returns to the continuum quite unobtrusively. The phrasing irregularity coincides with other elements that, along with it, may be perceived as framing devices within the piece's largest structural components. The text of the phrase b4 is stichomythic, emphasizing an arch-like relationship with the initial stichomythia, bothocket style (Fig. 14, phrase a, mm. 28-30) and line repetition (Fig. 14, phrases b and a1+b1). The double phrase ends on a dominant seventh, the only phrase to end in such manner (Example 108, p. 225). Both predominant rhythmic patterns (Example 107, p. 225) are absent from the first six measures of the extended phrase reappearing in the dominant seventh ending, which both
enhances the dominant seventh ending and relates the phrase's structure to that of the following closing choral couplet (Fig. 15, phrases c and c1, mm. 54-62, p. 242). The setting of the closing couplet returns to the four-measure phrase pattern, and, as mentioned, features the rhythmic patterns 1 and 2 in the phrases' last two measures.

The patterns of recurrence, variation, and contrast within each phrase tend to divide the phrases into a 1+1+2 measure structure, the two-measure unit consisting of the already described cadential patterns (Example 108, p. 225). The first two measures are either identical (Fig. 16, phrases a+b−1, a1+b1, and c+a2, p. 243) or close variants of each other (Fig. 16, phrases b, b2, b3, and c1+b5). The contrast occurs between the closing two-measure unit and the one-measure literal or modified reiterations (Fig. 16, passim). The cadential constructions resemble each other very closely, introducing a recurrent element of unity at middle dimensions frame level (Fig. 16, passim, and Examples 105-108, pp. 243, 225, respectively). An exception in cadential patterning occurs in the phrase c+a2: the final stress in shifted a half-measure forward, and the dominant measure features the rhythmic pattern 1, in contrast to all other cadences (Example 108, p. 225). The final cadence of the vocal setting features the rhythmic pattern 2, which is closely
related to the cadential patterns throughout the piece (compare item 2 in Example 107 to items 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, and 8 in Example 108, p. 225).

The harmonic structure of the piece is simple and the harmonic rhythm rather static. The frequent reiteration of the I-V progression or of its secondary equivalent weakens the phrase-framing potential of the harmonic cadences in this number, shifting the framing function towards the already described melodic and rhythmic cadential patterns. An outline of the harmonies shows at its most general a I V I structure in the piece, and the shift towards the central dominant is effected through repeated use of the V/V harmonies (Example 109).


\[
\begin{align*}
\text{a+b-1} & : & I & V_7 & I & V_7 & I & V_7 & I \\
\text{b} & : & \text{IV}6 & I & \text{VII/III} & 4 & \text{I} & \text{V6} & \text{V}7/V & \text{V} \\
\text{a1+b1} & : & V_2/V_0 & V & V_2/V & V & V_6 & V_{7/V} & V \\
\text{b2} & : & \text{IV} & \text{II} & \text{VI/VI} & \text{VI} & \text{VII/VI} & \text{V} & \text{V6} \\
\text{b3} & : & I & V/V & V_6 & V_6 & \text{V/III} & \text{V6} & \text{V}7/V & \text{V} \\
\text{b4} & : & V_{7/V} & V & \text{V4/V} & \text{V6} & \text{V} & \text{V} \\
\text{c+a2} & : & I & I & V_{7} & I & \text{I} & \text{(c1+b5 harmonies identical)}
\end{align*}
\]
The melodic contours of the piece's phrases feature a variety of shapes (Example 110).

Example 110. Ibid., Melodic Contours, letter symbols in reference to Tables 7 and 7a.

These melodic contours alternate between the short arches similar to those in the Opening Chorus (Example 46, p. 131) and in Little Buttercup's Aria (Example 69, p. 165) and the long unidirectional lines that predominate in Ralph's Scena (Examples 79, 80, and 91, pp. 183, 184, and 203, respectively). The short arch shapes occur in the initial stichomythic passages (Fig. 14, phrases a+b-1 and
a1+b1, p. 241). The long-line contours occur mostly in
the Captain's passages (Fig. 14, phrase b, Fig. 15, phrases
b2 and b3, pp. 241 and 242, respectively). The extension
phrase b4 (Fig. 15) again features short-arch contours.
However, this time their amplitude is greater as a result
of the phrase's more abrupt melodic excursions in the first
six measures. The closing couplet combines a static melodic
line with a descending line of equal length (Fig. 15,
phrases c+a2 and c1+b5, mm. 47-54).

The differentiation in melodic contours between
the Captain and the crew may be perceived as a device of
characterization consistent with previous procedure: the
shanty-like melodic arches again reflect the humble social
station of the crew, whereas the longer melodic lines of
the Captain indicate through musical sophistication an
aristocratic lineage. However, in order to indicate that
Corcoran is a seaman, too, his first half-phrase is part
of the shanty-like motive (Fig. 14, m. 28). The sea-shanty
as a general device of characterization by genre is quite
evident in the piece. It is most prominent in the theme
and its variants and in the melodic cadence of the phrase
c. The former is quite similar to the mainstream composers'
representations of sea song, with their four-square rhythms
softened by neumatic groups (Examples 111, 111a, 111b).
The latter is a faithful reproduction of the traditional
hornpipe's cadential formula (Examples 112, 112a, b, and c).


Another characterization device that is constantly present in the piece is the dibrachic accompaniment pattern ..., that is, similarly to that in the Opening Chorus, congruent with the piece's metric continuum. Its presence at this point provides not only characterization and an element of formal unity in this number; its reappearance gives continuity to the musical progression of Act I and consistency to the group characterization of the male chorus as *milites gloriosi* (Example 113).

In addition to a constant dibrachic pattern in the accompaniment (Example 113), the choral couplet (Fig. 14, phrases c and c1, p. 241) and the second orchestral introduction derived from it (Fig. 14, mm. 19-27, p. 241) also feature a dibrach in the melodic surface of the first two measures of their phrases. This dibrach, coinciding with a text that praises the Captain's somewhat less than perfect hardiness and politeness ("What, never? ...Hardly ever!"), extends the nautes gloriosus characterization to him. It is interesting to note that the text calling for "... three cheers and one cheer more..." is matched by four dibrachic patterns in the music (Example 114).

Example 114. Ibid., mm. 54-55.

The pervasive presence of the dibrachic pattern in the accompaniment combined with an almost equally frequent surface rhythmic pattern 2 give the piece considerable stylistic unity. The potential monotony of this procedure combined with the rather static harmonies (Example 109, p. 228) and the steady four-measure phrasing pattern (Fig. 16, passim, p. 243) is countered by the asymmetrical internal organization of the phrases,
with their 1+1+2 measure structure (Fig. 16, RVC symbolizations, p. 243). A function of both rhythmic contrast and characterization by genre may be discerned in the metric shift of the amphimacric ending in the phrase c+a2 (Fig. 15, mm. 57-58, p. 242). The half-measure shift of the amphimacer "Pinafore" contrasts with every phrase ending in the piece (Example 108, item 7 and on, p. 225) and brings out the amphimacer metrically, prosodically, and semantically. The cadential formula ended by the above-mentioned amphimacer is a typical outer frame of the traditional hornpipe (compare item 7 in Example 108 to Examples 112, 112a, b, and c, p. 231-2). It introduces additional nautical elements into the number in a manner long since adopted by countless stage and movie productions: witness the use of the celebrated College Hornpipe as the signature tune for Popeye the Sailor (Example 115).


\[ \text{amphimacer} \quad \text{amph.} \quad \text{amphimacric cadence} \]

As in previous numbers, the overall effect of the orchestration is closely connected with the key choice. The key of A major allows ample open string resonance in
the upper strings, resulting in a bright sound that matches in character the vigorous tempo and driving dibrach of the piece. The number is scored for the full orchestra used in the opera: two flutes, oboe, two clarinets, bassoon, a pair each of horns, cornets, and trombones, and timpani. The Grand Tutti described above appears only in coincidence with the outer and strophic frames of the recitativo and song (Example 113, p. p. 232, Fig. 14, mm. 1-4, 19-27, Fig. 15, mm. 62-66, pp. 241 and 242, respectively). The overwhelming majority of the accompaniment is assigned to the string section, with an occasional single woodwind doubling the solo voice and two woodwinds in octaves doubling the choral unisons (Example 116).


The phrases b2, b3, and part of the extension phrase b4 are accompanied by the string section alone re-
iterating the dibrachic pattern, which allows for an un-
encumbered perception of the vocal line and the text.
A contrasting timbre is used in conjunction with digressive harmonies and a sostenuto bass line to underscore the crew's sudden incredulity in the extension phrase b4 (Example 117).

Example 117. Ibid., mm. 50-52

The Grand Tutti that closes the number does not appear abruptly. It is preceded by a terraced increase in dynamics effected by additive orchestration in the choral couplet phrases c+a2 and c1+b5 (Example 118).

Example 118. Ibid., mm. 54-62 and 62-66, passim.
In general, timbral contrasts in this number are limited to linear juxtapositions of Grand and sectional tutti, without resorting to alternations of relatively unmixed instrumental colors. Sullivan also eschews the obvious expedience of the latter procedure in the setting of the stichomythic passages: in the initial stichomythia the oboe doubles the solo voice and the oboe and bassoon in octaves double the hocketing *enjambement* of the choral unison (Example 116, p. 235). The use of kindred instruments (double reeds in this case) in hocketing approximates a model much more recent than the medieval prototype of the device: the *Durchbrochene Arbeit* (lit. "through-broken work" in German). This device, descended from the hocket and incorporated into the orchestral vocabulary by the Mannheim school,7 appears also at the apogee of the Viennese school of symphonic music (Example 119).

Example 119. Ludwig van Beethoven, "Allegro con brio," Symphony No. 5, op. 67 (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Hartel), mm. 6-9 in string section.

---

The Figure 16 (p. 243) shows variation as the predominant procedure of continuation between phrases and sufficient varied reiteration throughout the piece to identify this procedure as the main feature of continuation in the piece. However, the grouping of phrases, albeit thematically mixed, is such that three main periods of three phrases each, preceded by one of two phrases, may be discerned in the Introduction II/Song unit (Example 120).


Introduction I Recitativo
instrumental vocal
a-1 X
I I-V

Intro II Song
C-1 A B C
C-2 c-1 a+b-1 b a1+b1 b2 b3 b4 c+a2 c1+b5 (c1+b5)
((c+a2)(1+b5))

I------I I------V IV-V/X-V I------I I----I

Note: the lower case letters indicate phrases of four measures each except the phrase b4, which is eight measures long.
The capitals indicate three-phrase periods.
The recitativo is fourteen measures long.

Periodic outline with strophic repetition (Intro. II and Song):

C-1 ABC ABC

---
The Song's periodic outline with strophic repetition reveals a slightly asymmetrical double arch structure C-1 A B C A B C (Example 120). The double arch is reinforced by the framing effect of the orchestral Grand Tuttis which occur at C-1 and at the end of each period C (Figs. 14 and 15, pertinent letter symbolizations, pp. 241 and 243, respectively). While the periodic symbolization may indicate contrast as the only procedure of continuation, the phrase symbolization indicates, as mentioned, variation as the predominant procedure in this function. Thus, the capital letters ought to be perceived as indicating the predominant thematic material in a period without excluding secondary thematic material. At phrase level the secondary thematic material symbol is always preceded by a plus sign linking it with the primary symbol. As a whole, the entire structure appears to combine contrast and strophic reiteration in an arch form along with variation at period and phrase levels, respectively. This structural sophistication is elegantly concealed under what appears to the listener as a eminently singable sea-shanty.

An interesting variation in the traditional Recitativo and Aria procedure is the already mentioned false start in the Recitativo's introduction (Fig. 14, mm. 1-4, p. 241) which provides a much greater measure of unity between the Recitativo and the following Song than the usual dominant harmonic relationship does in the
generic prototypes, such as Mozart's *stromentati*, and, closer to Sullivan's time, Verdi's *recitativi ed arie*.

The dramatic function of this number, besides the introduction and initial characterization of Captain Corcoran, may be described as negative in the sense that empty space within a sculpture is termed negative space. The return of the text and the music to a jovial mood helps to frame by contrast the crisis foreshadowing generated by Ralph's preceding *Scena* and the further development of that crisis in the following two numbers.

8. W. A. Mozart, "Don Ottavio, Son Morta... Or Sai Chi l'Onore," *Don Giovanni*, Act I, No. 10, mm. 1-69 and 70-140, resp., *passim*.

Figure 14: Act I, No. 4, Recitativo and Chorus, mm. 1–39.
Figure 15: Act I, No. 4, Recitative and Chorus, mm. 39-66.
Figure 16: Act I, No. 4, Song, Phrasing Patterns, Recurrence, Variation, and Contrast at Half-Phrase Level
CHAPTER VII

Nos. 4a, 5: RECITATIVO, BALLAD, DIALOGUE: THE EXPOSITION COMPLETED

Thus far, the Opening Chorus and Little Buttercup's Recitativo and Aria (Chapters and , passim) with their cheerful folksiness provide both a realistic musical setting and a contrasting background for the foreshadowing of Buttercup's second recitativo (Example 72, p. ) and the plot's point of attack which follows in Ralph's Scena.

Ralph's unrequited love parodies both the classical injustice, adike, and fatal pride, hubris, in that Scena. The former is parodied through the denial of happiness to the "... smartest lad in all the fleet..." (Example 72, p. 171), and the latter by Ralph's falling in love with a girl far above his social station. Also, foreshadowing, as mentioned in Chapters V (p. 171) and VI (p. 215), may be seen in the crew's abuse of Deedeve.

The Recitativo and Song (Chapter VI) that introduce the Captain return to the jolly mood of the first two numbers, thus creating again a contrast with the disturbing elements of the following Recitativo (Fig. 17, p. 270), Ballad:

1. Aristotle, Poetics, 1452a, 2.
2. Ibid., 1453a, 16.

244
(Fig. 18, p. 271) and the following dialogue, which complete the plot's exposition.

This completion is initiated in the Recitativo (Fig. 17, p. 270) by the revelation of the Captain’s apprehension about his daughter’s possible rejection of Sir Joseph’s suit, Little Buttercup’s sympathy towards his predicament, the discovery of Buttercup’s own secret unrequited love, and the Captains’s growing fondness of her in spite of Buttercup’s lowly social station. The Recitativo is written as a dialogue between the Captain and Little Buttercup. Its lines are unrhymed iambic pentameters, and, as before, the blank verse of English drama enhances through genre association the dramatic function of the text. It may be conjectured that Gilbert’s choice of a poetic meter over prose for this dialogue prompted Sullivan to set it to music. Again, the redundancy of this procedure in the spoken-dialogue opera is minimized by the ability of the music to underscore the key plot elements presented in the recitativo while providing a modulatory transition between the Captain and crew’s Song in A major (Fig. 14 and 15, pp. 241-2) and Josephine’s melancholy Ballad in F minor (Fig. 18, 271).

The Recitativo is accompanied by the strings in the traditional stromentato fashion, and the grouping of staccato and sustained elements in the string accompaniment both emphasizes textual elements and delineates a rudimentary
variation structure a b+a b1+a, in which the symbolization a indicates staccato chord punctuation, b sustained string harmonies, and b1 sustained string harmonies with some melodic differentiation in one of its parts. The harmonic scheme of the Recitative shows three tonal levels, A major, F major, and F minor. The F major level appears abruptly at the completion of a deceptive cadence that ends the A major level, and the F minor level follows in a manner that would seem too obvious were it not for the textual requirements of a minor mode (Example 121 and Fig. 17, mm. 12-17, p. 270:).


\[
\begin{array}{cccccc}
& \text{Buttercup's Quatrain} & & \text{Captain's Sinrin} \\
I & V6/ IV & IV & V & \text{dec. cad. to} & \ldots & I & V2/ V & V & VI & V/ V \\
5 & & & & & & \\
& \text{A maj.:} & & \text{F maj.:} \\
& (b+a) & & \text{b} & & (b+a) & & \text{b} & & 2^\text{nd Quatrain with Captain's closure} \\
V & I6 & VI & V & I6 & VI & \text{V} & VI & dVII/ V & V \\
7 & 4 & 7 & 4 & 5 & VI & & \\
& \text{F min.:} & & & & & & & & & & \\
\end{array}
\]

The A major tonal level encompasses a blank verse quatrain sung by Little Buttercup, in which she points out the Captain's apprehensions in a very sympathetic manner. Her first two lines of iambic pentameter, set in a free-meter bar, are framed by a single staccato chord (Fig. 17, m. 1, p. 270). Similar chords mark the ends of the third and fourth lines (Fig. 17, mm. 2 and 3, respectively).
The more frequent incidence of these punctuating frame chords in the second half of Buttercup's quatrain hastens the pace of the *Recitativo*. The entire quatrain is set as a recitativo secco, with unaccompanied vocal recitation interrupted at syntactically appropriate moments by spare chords without any melodic figuration. The quatrain is ultimately framed by a deceptive cadence, which also announces the Captain's reply. The cadence's double function is enhanced by its increased dynamic level, longer duration, and a dibrachic pattern preceding the two punctuating chords of the resolution (Fig. 17, mm. 4 and 5, p. 270).

The dibrachic pattern is consistent with the previous characterizations of the Captain and his crew (Chapters III and VI, pp. 143 and 241, respectively). The Captain's reply, always in unrhymed iambic pentameter, is a sixain. Its first line is framed by a single chord, but the following two lines are unbroken by such punctuation. This retards the *Recitativo*'s pace by the reverse handling of the same elements that hastened it in the preceding quatrain. The slowed-down recitativo is not framed this time by a punctuating chord. A sustained string background is subtly introduced by doubling the melodic peak of the vocal line on an *appoggiatura* (Fig. 17, m. 7). The continuing string *sostenuto* under the vocal line in mm. 7 through 9 contrasts with the simple, secco-like, setting of the preceding text. The increase in tonal volume
and the sudden presence of sustained instrumental color call attention to the introduction of another principal plot element, Sir Joseph's suit of Josephine's hand. The importance of the statement is further underscored by the manner in which the sostenuto section is framed—two staccato chords instead of the hitherto prevalent single chord (Example 122).

Example 122. Ibid., mm. 7-9.

The following reference of Josephine's refusal, a complicating element of plot, returns to the secco manner while retaining the double punctuation chords (Example 122a).

Example 122a. Ibid., mm. 10-11.
The return of the Captain's lines to the secco manner of accompaniment creates an arch-like shape in the setting of the Recitativo's central sixain. Buttercup's closing quatrain which follows reveals her love sorrows. This mood is reflected in the setting's sudden turn to the previous key's parallel minor. Buttercup's agitation is also emphasized by the increased melodic figuration in the bass: a repeated pattern revolving around the dominant (Fig. 17, mm. 12-15, p. 270). The first two lines of this quatrain are framed by two staccato chords (Fig. 17, m. 17) which mark the return to the secco manner, continued in the setting of the last two lines (Fig. 17, mm. 18-22). Buttercup's characterization of the approaching Josephine, her leave-taking of the Captain, and his alliterative remark about Buttercup, "... A plump and pleasing person," are all framed by single-chord punctuation. The harmony, although still at the F minor tonal level, turns briefly to that level's submediant D flat major on Buttercup's mention of Josephine, enhancing the latter's characterization through the major mode (Fig. 17, mm. 18-20). The Captain's last remark returns to the dominant of F setting up a cadential formula which resolves to the first chord of the following number, Josephine's Pallad (Fig. 17, mm. 22 and Fig. 18, m. 1, p. 272). The Recitativo, obviously through-composed, and apparently cast in a chain form, has some characteristics of repeat forms.
The alternations of a gecco style of accompaniment with a stromentato one shows the already mentioned pattern of a b+a b1+a, contained within the measures 1-6, 7-11, and 12-22 respectively (Fig. 17, p. 270). The harmonic scheme is definitely a chain form (Example 121, p. 246), but the mode alternations show a major-minor-major pattern, contained within the measures 1-11, 12-17, and 18-22 respectively (Fig. 17). The text, although unrhymed, is assigned to Buttercup and the Captain in such a manner that their speeches form a quatrains, a sixain, and a quatrains again, forming an ABA stanzaic pattern in iambic pentameter lines. This stanzaic pattern coincides with the major tonal levels of the Recitativo (Fig. 17, tonal level indications, p. 270), creating a parallel between mode and stanzaic structure.

The resolution of the Recitativo's last chord makes the end of that number overlap with the beginning of the following Ballad (Fig. 18, m. 1, p. 271). Despite Gilbert's designation of Josephine's introductory number as a ballad, its text does not have the stanzaic structure usually associated with that poetic genre. Instead, the scheme ababcc4 brings to mind such stanzaic forms as the pentametric sixain in Shakespeare's Venus and Adonis.


and even more the tetrametric sixain in Wordsworth's poem "I Wandered Lonely as a Cloud." This stanzaic form is also associated with Petrarchan canzone, minnesinger and meistersinger poems, and the two closing tercets of the Shakespearean sonnet. Such sophisticated stanzaic kinship is consistent with Ralph's earlier description of Josephine as "the pearl of minstrelsy -- at whose exalted shrine a world of wealth is sighing." (Example 82, p. 190). The procedure is also similar to that with which Gilbert characterizes Ralph (Chapter V, p. 175).

As before, there are substantial departures from the prevalent iambic meter in the Ballad (Example 123).

Example 123. Gilbert, "Ballad," HMS Pinafore, Act I.

```
daCTYL  JAMB
       SORRY HER LOT WHO LOVES TOO WELL,      IAMBIC LINE (a)
dACTYL  HEAVY THE HEART THAT HOPE BUT VAINLY,  TROCHAEIC LINE (b)
daCTYL  SAD ARE THE SIGNS THAT OWN THE SPELL,  IAMBIC LINE (a)
daCTYL  UTTERED BY EYES THAT SPEAK TOO PLAINLY;  TROCHAEIC LINE (b)
      HEAVY THE SORROW THAT BOWS THE HEAD  IAMBIC LINE (c)
      WHEN LOVE IS ALIVE AND HOPE IS DEAD!  IAMBIC LINE (c)
```

The most frequent metric irregularity in the stanza are the dactylic feet appearing at the beginning of each line.


In the fifth line two such dactyls appear at the beginning, and in the sixth line an anapaest replaces the second iamb instead of the established dactylic irregularity. The prevalent stress pattern is reversed in the second and fourth lines: initial dactyls are followed by trochees instead of iamb throughout the line. The second and third line feature alliteration: *heavy*, *heart*, *hopes*, and *sad*, *sighs*, *spell*, respectively. This procedure enhances the most meaningful words of the text in a pithy manner. The text is much less ornate and consequently much more direct than Ralph's corresponding introductory *Madrigal* with its prosopopeia and allegory (Fig. 11, p. 212). This directness also establishes the probability of Josephine's impulsiveness in most of her decisions. The second stanza is as melancholy as the first, and slightly more allegorical, using the setting of the sun and the coming darkness as a poetic background for Josephine's sorrow. Metrically, it is an exact replica of the first one, with a closing couplet that is a literal re-iteration as well.\(^6\) This closural reiteration enhances the stanzaic unity of the *Ballad*, and reinforces the listener's perception of the epigrammatic and summary character of the couplet "*Heavy* the sorrow that bows the head/when love is alive and hope is dead!"

---

The prosodic and epigrammatic discreteness of the couplet is clearly accounted for in the structure of the Ballad's musical setting: the quatrain abab is set in the minor mode as an open section ending on the dominant, whereas the couplet cc is set in the parallel major as a closed section (Fig. 18, sections A and B, respectively, p. 271). Plain strophic repetition is avoided by means of a varied recapitulation (Figures 7 and 13, pp. 144 and 214, and e1, respectively), a procedure already used in two previous numbers (Figures 7 and 13, pp. 144 and 214, respectively). It is interesting to observe that in this case the section B, whose text is repeated literally, is the one whose music varies, and the section A with a new quatrain is treated as a strophic reiteration: unity and variety are achieved at once at the largest dimensions by very simple, though not unsophisticated means.

The number opens with a four-measure orchestral introduction that is a negative variant of the section B's main motive (Example 124).

The linear bimodality of the entire piece is anticipated very subtly in the introduction's melody; while the underlying harmony is predominantly on the parallel major of the F minor signature key, the surface melody in the third measure progresses from an A natural, the parallel major's mediant, to an A flat, the minor's equivalent degree. The subtlety of the procedure becomes apparent in the absence of a primary chord of the minor mode under this flat mediant. Instead, the flat mediant in the top voice becomes the seventh of a diminished seventh chord of the dominant, neutralizing the minor mode implication in the melody by a strong dominant indicator in the harmony (Example 124 and Fig. 18, phrase d-1, mm. 1-4, p. 271).

The implication of bimodality occurs within a passage of contrasting dynamics and timbre but it is not exactly congruent with the change in orchestration and dynamic indications effecting the contrast. The first two measures of the introduction, which progress from the parallel major tonic to the dominant over a tonic pedal in the bass, are scored for the piece's full ensemble of two flutes, oboe, two clarinets, bassoon, two horns, and strings, and indicated forte. The following two measures, indicated piano, became so by orchestration as well: they are assigned to the oboe supported by two clarinets and a bassoon, a drastic reduction of ensemble size and volume, and an abrupt timbral contrast with the fully doubled Tutti. Whereas the described contrast occurs between the
second and third measures of the introduction, the note which implies a mode change in the melody occurs two beats later (Example 124, third beat, m. 3, p. 253). However incongruent the changes in mode and timbre may be, the assignment of the changing mediant to a solo oboe in the treble cannot but enhance it, coming as it does after a fully mixed timbre.

The introduction ends on the dominant, which in turn resolves to the minor tonic (Fig. 18, mm. 4-5, p. 217) at the beginning of the vocal setting's string accompaniment (Example 125). This figure establishes a \[\frac{3}{4}\] metric continuum which is maintained in the orchestra throughout the piece, either in its initial form (Ex. 125) or in micro-component variants (Example 126).

Example 125. *Ibid.*, mm. 5-13, *passim*.

The vocal line thus introduced and accompanied takes some time to become totally congruent with the 3/4 metric continuum established by its accompaniment. The quatrain abab (Example 123, p. 251) is set in a compound 9/8 meter. This accommodates the dactylic irregularities of the text's prosody while allowing considerable freedom in the alternation between quantitative and accentual scansion within a four-measure phrase delineated by the harmonic structure (Example 127).

Example 127. Ibid., mm. 5-9.

The superimposition of a 9/8 vocal line over a 3/4 accompaniment does not realize at first the potential polyrhythmic effect of such a combination. At best, the utter simplicity of the accompaniment suggests a polymetric effect through the juxtaposition of different rhythmic densities rather than through the simultaneous presentation of divergent stress patterns. The contrasting elements in this case are the harmonic rhythm of the 3/4 and the second metric continuum of the piece set by the accentual dactylic anacrusis of the vocal line.
The convergence of stress patterns in the first two phrases (Fig. 18, phrases a and b, mm. 5-13, p. 271) is replaced in the third phrase (Fig. 18, phrase c, mm. 14-17) by a true polyrhythmic and polymetric effect. This is achieved by the introduction of duple continuum micro-components into the 3/4 accompaniment while retaining the triplets of the vocal line's own metric continuum (Example 128).

Example 128. Ibid., mm. 14-17.

The polyrhythmic and polymetric character of the third phrase may be perceived on several functional levels: the text is a reiteration of the two initial lines of the quatrains, therefore its increase in the density of the polyrhythmic fabric may be seen as a function of affective intensification. Going a bit further into affective reflection, the above complexity may be considered an accurate tone-painting of Josephine's conflicting emotions. However, from the structural standpoint the combination of incongruent elements may be seen as a logical synthesis
of antithetical elements and therefore a function of formal unity. A salient aspect of this unity through synthesis is the anticipation of the section B dibrach-like accompaniment in the last phrase of the section A; the Alberti bass of the former may be viewed as a negative variant of the latter (Example 126, p. 255).

The increase in the rhythmic fabric's complexity is paralleled by a corresponding quickening of the harmonic rhythm (Example 129).

Example 129. Ibid., Harmonic Outline.

Section A (key signature F minor)

phrase a1

phrase a2

phrase c

Section B

phrase d

phrase e

phrase e1 (variant in recap.)

phrase d2 (see d-1).

* the strophic sequence is ABAB.
** the vertical bars indicate measures.
The increase in rhythmic and harmonic density reflects both the emotional qualities of the text and a certain stylistic aspect of it: Josephine's love sorrows are enumerated in the manner of a traditional ballad's incremental repetition. After setting the initial quatrains without any stanzaic alterations (Fig. 18, sect. A, phrases a and b, p. 271) Sullivan reiterates the quatrains' first two lines in a modified setting. This is, of course, the phrase that contains the musical intensification (Fig. 18, phrase c). By avoiding the repetition of contiguous text Sullivan frames the incremental quatrains and provides a transition to the modally contrasting setting of the epigrammatic couplet (Fig. 18, section B).

The incremental enumeration and the reiteration of the first lines are also reflected in the types of melodic contours found in the setting of the quatrains. The cadential pattern of the harmonic scheme delineates four-measure phrases (Example 129). The melodic contours within those phrases are quite varied: the first phrase features a sequential construction composed of two pairs of descending tetrachords with the second tetrachord beginning a step below the first in both pairs.

---

The pattern thus delineated appears first on the tonic in the first half-phrase and on the subdominant in the second. There is a dominant relationship within each half-phrase which delineates in turn its internal structure. It is emphasized by the broken descent of the melodic line resulting in the above mentioned tetrachords. Without this break in the descent of the melodic line the half-phrase contour would consist of a pentachord descending from the dominant to the tonic and from the tonic to the subdominant respectively. This pattern with its second pentachord written an octave lower shows a practically unbroken descent. The melodic contours of the second phrase are somewhat simpler, descending in both half-phrases from the supertonic to the dominant in a practically unbroken line. The last notes of each half-phrase are ornamented by auxiliary tones and by a brief neumatic figure based on the dominant triad, respectively. The third phrase, which reiterates the text of the first, features a different manner of melodic contouring based on the reiteration of the interval of a third, first minor, then major. The melodic center of the phrase, which moves harmonically from the mediant to the dominant, is the main key's dominant note. The melodic line consists of brief excursions a third up and down from this melodic center. All these melodic features reflect the incremental character of the text (Example 130, p. 261)
Example 130. *Ibid.*, Melodic Contours, Section A, mm. 5-17.

The setting of the closural couplet (Fig. 18, section B, mm. 18-30 and Example 123, 5th and 6th lines, p. 251) contrasts markedly with that of the preceding quatrains. In addition to the change from minor to major mode in a parallel key, the polyrhythmic and polymetric music becomes monometric and monorhythmic (Example 131).

This convergence of previously divergent rhythmic elements signals by musical means the gathering of Josephine's sad thoughts into one epigrammatic statement, and, similarly to the couplet's rhyme, provides a contrasting closural element to the piece. The last line of text is repeated in the couplet (Fig. 18, phrases e and e1, mm. 25-30 and pertinent repeat mm., p. 271) which provides a unified procedure in the closural settings of both sections (Fig. 19, phrase c, mm. 14-15). The closural feeling is considerably enhanced in the piece's last phrase by a melismatic figure in the voice occurring over the final cadence's dominant. The second variant of the last features an additional and shorter melisma at its beginning (Example 132).

Example 132. Ibid., mm. 25-30, plus vocal line variant.

The text repetitions and the melismatic figures may be perceived also as elements of characterization by genre. Along with the juxtaposition of modes and the rhythmic variety these features introduce Josephine at a more sophisticated level than that of the previous numbers including Ralph's Scena with its cavatina and
cabaletta combination (Chapter VI). The higher register of the melismatic figure in the second ending provides both a varied recapitulation and an additional framing element through timbral brilliance.

The melodic contours of the couplet’s setting are, like its other structural elements, different from those of the quatrain’s setting. The first two phrases of the couplet (Fig. 18, section B, phrases d and d1, mm. 18-21 and 22-25 respectively, p. 271) feature a double reverse arch. The closing phrase and its variant (Figure 18 sect. B, phrases e and e1, mm. 25-30) show a downward arch with an irregular descent followed by a long ascending line with an abrupt final drop to the tonic (Example 133).

Example 133. Ibid., Melodic Contours, Section B, mm. 18-30.
An overall examination of the melodic contours in the piece (Fig. 19, p. 272) shows an initial preponderance of brief descending patterns in the initial quatrain’s setting. These patterns delineate melodically both the half-phrase and the quarter phrase. Such a minute fragmentation of the melodic line reflects, as mentioned, Josephine’s agitation, while preserving structural unity through the uniformity of the tetrachordal pattern. In turn, the incremental nature of the quatrain is reflected by the expansion of the descending tetrachords into a pentachord and a heptachord successively. An element that may be considered a reflection of both affective turmoil and structural unity is the setting of the dactylic irregularity: the triplet in the 9/8 vocal line recurs often enough to supply the latter and shifts metrically to represent the former. The metric shifts of the dactylic figure take it from an anacrustic position in the first phrase to a quantitatively extended strong part of the measure followed by a return to the anacrusis in the second, and finally to the stressed beat in both halves of the third phrase (Fig. 19, dactylic pattern outlined in horizontal brackets). The recurrence, variation, and contrast patterns in the piece’s structure show a predominance of variation as a function of linear growth in the overall melodic outline and more or less equal amounts of all three in contouring (Fig. 19).
As in the previous number (F. 14, 15, pp. 241-2) the orchestration makes use of the full scoring (fl. ob. 2 cl. bsn. 2 hrn., strings) only in the strophic frames (Fig. 18, phrases d-1, d2, and motive d3, mm. 1-4, 30-33, and 60-61, resp., p. 271). Even then, the frames d-1 and d2 feature full scoring only in their first half, the second being assigned to a woodwind quartet led by the oboe (Example 124, p. 253).

The vocal setting is accompanied by the strings at all times, and almost exclusively so in the setting of the initial quatrain where the strings provide the polyrhythmic element in juxtaposition with the vocal line (Examples 125 through 128, pp. 255-257). The dactylic figure is highlighted by being doubled at the octave by the flute in the last phrase of this section. The addition of a new timbre to the vocal line at the end of a large structural unit may be ascribed a framing function since it enhances the last appearance of a principal rhythmic figure with previous recurrence (Example 134).

Example 134. Ibid., mm. 14-17.
The final step of the transitional phrase c (Fig. 18, m. 17, p. 27) is assigned to the viola section alone. The descending figure that effects this transition is a melodic variant of the duple accompaniment pattern (Example 135).

Example 135. Ibid., Transition Figure, viola part, m. 17.

The setting of the couplet which, as previously shown, contrasts with the preceding quatrains in every significant formal aspect, also differs from it in orchestration. Woodwinds and horns are added to the accompanying strings, the former partially doubling the vocal line and the latter sustaining part of the full harmony realized in the strings' continuum micro-components accompaniment. The manner in which the woodwind soli double the voice is at once timbrally varied and subtle; timbres alternate on half-phrases, which enhances the melodic contours since they also are congruent with the half-phrases (Fig. 19, phrases d through e1, and Example 133, pp. 272 and 263, respectively). At the same time, the coincidence of these timbral changes with caesural elements in the text and with the above mentioned structural units is a measure of subtlety (Example 136).
Example 136. Ibid., Doubling of the Vocal Line, mm. 18-25

Both variants of the closing phrase (Fig. 18, phrases e and e₁, p. 271) feature increased doubling. This manner of orchestration matches the change in texture from melody/accompaniment to homophonic in the closing phrase e and its variant e₁ (Example 137).

Example 137. Ibid., mm. 25-30 and reprise.
The homophonic texture with upper strings and voice doubled at the octave by two flutes and supported by two horns sostenuto provide an anticipation of the final frame in addition to a similar effect caused by the melismatic figure in the vocal line (Fig. 18, mm. 19-30 and 60-61, p. 271) that end the vocal setting. The altered treatment of the phrase e in the stanzaic repetition results in a modification of the strophic procedure used in the piece. The Ballad's form-of may thus be outlined as A B A B1, indicating an altered recapitulation.

All in all, the Ballad and the following dialogue between the Captain and his daughter complete the plot's exposition. A crisis is revealed: the cheerful crew, jolly peddler, and self-assured and popular Captain are not quite as happy as their initial characterizations may indicate. The peddler seems to have both a guilty secret (Chapter V, Example 72, p. 171) and an unhappy love (Fig. 17, b1+a, p. 270), the Captain's plans for his daughter's marriage to the First Lord of the Admiralty seem to threatened by her preference for a common sailor, and the best crewman is pining with unrequited love for the socially unattainable daughter of his Captain (Chapter V, Fig. 13, section A1, p. 214).

The accretion of all these disturbing elements not only provides the plot with the classical plunge in medias res, but also makes the expository crisis so complete as to obviate Sir Joseph's actual appearance in it. Even if Sir Joseph were not the Captain's choice for son-in-law, Ralph's suit would be rather hopeless in view of the social difference between him and Josephine, and, by the same token, her love for a lowly tar, later identified as Ralph, would be still unacceptable to her father. Little Buttercup's remorse is triggered by Ralph's name, and the foreshadowing abuse heaped upon Dick Deadeye is satirically gratuitous. Thus, Sir Joseph is incidental to the crisis, rather than one of its causes. This frees him for a function of equal importance, and Gilbert makes him assume it in high, wide and plentiful manner: Sir Joseph appears as a Complicating Element.
Figure 17: Act I, No. 4a, Recitative.
Figure 18: Act I, No. 5, Ballad
Figure 19: Act I, No. 5, Ballad, Melodic Contours, Recurrence, Variation, and Contrast Patterns
CHAPTER VIII

Nos. 6, 7: BARCAROLLE AND QUODLIBET: LADIES AND SAILORS

Sir Joseph Porter, Knight Commander of the Bath, First Lord of the Admiralty, is presented in a manner resembling a second plot exposition: the music and the text return both literally and affectively to the pre-crisis cheerfulness of the opera’s opening. After a brief boat-song the opening chorus is reprised with some structural modification (compare Fig. 6, Chapter III, p. 143 to Fig. 21, p. 311) and eventually combined with an equally cheerful and appropriately graceful chorus of Sir Joseph’s sisters, cousins and aunts (Fig. 22, p. 312). This is followed by the appearance of Sir Joseph himself, deftly characterized in numbers 8 and 9 of the first act as pompous and picaresque, respectively.

Perhaps fortuitously, the double, or more exactly, tandem expository procedure resembles that of the classical concerto with its two distinct and complementary expository sections.¹ Such a focusing on the complicating agent and leading comedian leaves no doubt as to the satirical nature of the play.

---

The brief Barcarolle that opens this second expository section (Fig. 20, p. 310) functions exclusively at the spectacle level and it does so thanks to its generic characteristics. Sung off-stage by the sopranos and altos with string accompaniment it conveys a gentle boat-and-waves motion through its placidly moderate tempo in a 9/8 meter and its monotonous accompaniment of quantitative trochees (Fig. 20, frame x and on). The predominantly major mode of the number reinforces the effect of serenity achieved by the abovementioned forms-in.

However brief and uncomplicated, the Barcarolle is not devoid of a certain subtle sophistication: Its text, which matter-of-factly describes the manner of the salutes to Sir Joseph in his official capacity, consists of a single six-line stanza rhymed in couplets with a closural altered reiteration of the initial couplet. The sixain thus obtained features heterometric lines and many irregularities among its predominantly trochaic feet: the first line starts on a dactyl and ends on a catalectic trochee, the second line also ends on a catalectic foot, the third line reverses its stress pattern to iambics, and the fourth line, still iambic, starts with a spondee. The fifth and sixth lines repeat the metric characteristics of the first and second lines (Example 138).


Over the bright blue sea (calmness) a
Comes Sir Joseph Porter, K.C.B. (cal.) a
Wherever he may go 6
Bang-bang the loud nine-pounders go! 6
Shout o'er the bright blue sea (calm) a
For Sir Joseph Porter, K.C.B. (cal.) a

The \(a_2 a_5 b_3 b_4 a_3 a_5\) stanza is a rather awkward sixain whose breakdown into its component couplets is prevented by the closural quality inherent in the altered repetition of the initial couplet. The closure by repetition is a rudimentary device, the alteration of the repetition is not. It is quite possible that the altered repeat form of the musical setting is a direct reflection of this textual feature.

As in Josephine's introductory *Ballad* (Chapter VII, Fig. 18, p. 271) the choice of a compound meter for the text's setting allows a treatment of prosodic irregularities that avoids the metric displacement of phrases while providing rhythmic variety within the measure. In addition to the tone painting provided by the monotonic string accompaniment there is a more direct illustration of the text in the piece: on the onomatopoetic words "Bang-bang" which describe the artillery salute to Sir Joseph Gilbert uses a spondee, itself a reinforcing
element, and Sullivan reinforces it by doubling the voices with a bass drum pianissimo (Example 139).


Just as subtle is the underscoring of Sir Joseph's name and title done through a variation in the accompaniment pattern, the only such variation in the entire piece, it may be added (Example 140).

Example 140. Ibid., mm. 11-13.

The harmonic and modal scheme of the piece seems to suggest an altered repeat form (Example 141).

```
section-phrase a  b  a1(I-level)
I ------------ VI V/VI VI IV I V4 I
```

Accordingly, the overall structural scheme shows a combination of repeat and variation form with a repeated and altered recapitulation: a b a1 a1, which is a retrograde of a traditional folk-song formula, or of a rounded binary form. Since the repeated section is the one containing the words "Shout o'er the bright blue sea," and the only one containing a forte (Fig. 20, mm. 10-11, p. 310), it may be surmised that its reiteration is not so much a function of formal balance, as the resultant two piano and two forte sections may suggest, but of spectacle, representing a twofold cheer or announcement. The placement of the sopranos and altos as an off-stage chorus is also a function of realistic spectacle, giving credence to the opening words of the next number; "Sir Joseph's barge is seen..." (Fig. 21, mm. 2-4, p. 311). The orchestration is of the utmost simplicity. The strings accompany throughout with the trochaic figure assigned to the violins and a drone-like bass to the violas and cellos (Example 139, p. 276). The only exception in

---


this legato-cum-drone accompaniment is the staccato figure in violins and violas that underscores the mention of Sir Joseph's name and title. It should be noted that stylistic unity and structural continuity are well served in this instance through the momentary substitution of the otherwise ubiquitous drone bass by a legato trochaic figure in the cellos (Example 140, p. 276). The bass drum enhancement of the onomatopoeic "Bang-bang" occurs over the prevalent legato accompaniment (Example 139, p. 276).

The Barcarolle is followed by a modified reprise of the Opening Chorus (Fig. 21, p. 311). The modifications in the text are variations of the nautes gloriosi characterization, adding a preening attitude to the already shown pride in the crew's martial qualities: "We hope he'll find us clean, and attentive to our duty... We're smart and sober men and quite devoid of fear, In all the Royal N.(navy) None are so smart as we are." The modifications in the reprised setting consist of a function reversal, an excision, and the replacement of the original concluding section by a modulatory transition (Fig. 21, period b, mm. 10-18 and 18-21, respectively and period x, p. 311; compare to periods b, b1, a1+b2, and a2 in Fig. 6, p. 143). The function reversal consists of the assignment of a di-brachic pattern to the four-part male chorus reinforced by strings under the thematic material b played by the clarinet and the bassoon in octaves (Example 142).

The excision eliminates both shortened phrases in the period b1 (Fig. 6, mm. 80-84, p. 143). This is justified by the absence of the runaway yell "Ahoy!", which would be out of place as a greeting of highly placed visitors. The replacement of the concluding section a1+b2 and the coda a2 (Fig. 6, mm. 95-110) is not related to any of the thematic material in either the initial Opening Chorus or its reprise (Fig. 21, section X, mm. 29-31, p. 311). The principal feature of the section X is the fluttering character of the string figure (Example 143).

Example 143. Ibid., mm. 31-39.
This string figure introduces Sir Joseph's female relatives who are instructed to enter dancing. The collective portrayal of happy young women thus achieved shows a favorite procedure of Sullivan in the Savoy operas whenever the libretto calls for such a representation. While other manners of representing such **dramatis personae** are also employed in the Savoy operas, the fluttering string figure with an accompaniment of bass/treble duplets recurs most frequently (Examples 144, 145, 146, 147, 148).

Example 144. Gilbert and Sullivan, "Comes the Broken Flower," Trial by Jury, No. 6, mm. 18-25.

Example 145. "Climbing Over Rocky Mountain," The Pirates of Penzance, Act I, No. 5, mm. 1-8
Example 146. "Towards the Empyrean Heights," Princess Ida, Act II, No. 8, mm. 57-59 and 65-68.

Example 147. "Comes a Train of Little Ladies," The Mikado, Act I, mm. 1-9

It is interesting to note Sullivan's frequent use of the modifier *grazioso* after most of the cited Allegri and Allegretti, leaving no doubt as to what predominant feature of young womanhood he intended to portray.

The text of the following chorus is stichomythic. The two single-rhyme quatrains of trochaic tetrameter are distributed in couplets among the ladies and the sailors. Besides the change of rhyme after four lines, aaaa, bbbb, internal rhymes in the first and fifth lines serve as additional stanzaline frames. A similar case could be made on grammatical grounds: the a rhymes are all participles while the b rhymes are all adverbs. This feature also functions as the unifying element in the stichomythic procedure (See Chapter V, Examples 81 and 81a, p. 189). The regular trochees of both stanzas contrast markedly
with the irregular iambics of the reprised Sailor's Chorus whose lyrics (Figure 21, text throughout, p. 311) are a metric replica of the Opening Chorus' text (Chapter III, Examples 27 and 29, pp. 106 and 110, respectively). A certain effect, akin to alliteration, is created by the respective participial and adverbial rhyme endings in each stanza, which thus outline the stanzaic structure of the lyrics. The recurrence of the words "shipping" and "politely" in the couplets' closures has a double function: it outlines the stanzaic structure semantically and transforms the line exchange between the sailors and the ladies into a classical stichomthia (see Chapter V, Examples 81 and 82, p. pp. 189-190, and Example 149).

Example 149. Gilbert, "Chorus of Female Relatives,"
HMS Pinafore, Act I, f09.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relatives</th>
<th>Sailors</th>
<th>Gaily tripping, lightly skipping, a (internal rhyme)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Flock the maidens to the shipping, a</td>
<td>Flags and guns and pennants dipping, a</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All the ladies love the shipping. a</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relatels</td>
<td>Sailors sprightly, always rightly, b (internal rhyme)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welcome ladies so politely. b</td>
<td>Ladies who can smile so brightly, b</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sailors</td>
<td>Sailors welcome most politely. b</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Regular toothess throughout
The most salient feature of the vocal setting is the alternation of syllabic and neumatic elements in the women's chorus and the use of a single neumatic element as a frame of an otherwise syllabic half-phrase in the men's chorus (Example 150).


The predominantly accentual setting allows the gradual emergence of an underlying dibrach in the men's chorus: the first phrase of the tenor-bass unison combines the dibrachic pattern with a rising melodic line, whereas the melodic line of the second phrase assigned to these voices is completely static in the half-phrases except for the neumatic frames. These static melodic lines allow the accentual elements with their dibrachic character to dominate the phrase. This provides unity in characterization and a contrasting element with the sequential treatment of neumatic elements in the women's chorus (Ex. 151).
Example 151. Ibid., mm. 47-51 and 56-59.

The recurrent neumatic element consistently ornaments the ladies' melody in contrast to the more severe line of the sailors' syllabic lines (Examples 150 and 151). This contrast may be viewed as a function of characterization, illustrating the playfulness of young girls on an outing and the martial demeanor of the Pinafore's crew, respectively.

The modification of the Opening Chorus' reprise which precedes the entrance of Sir Joseph's relatives influences the reprise's form-of: instead of the original variation form A A1 /a b b1; a a1+b2 a2/ (Chapter III, Fig. 6, p. 143), the reprise becomes a simple A B A Da Capo form, since the original a and b variants and coda are respectively excised and replaced by a modulatory transition (Fig. 21, period x, mm. 29-39, p. 311). This transition, which takes up abruptly a new key, must be considered outside of the entire quodlibet's major sections. It is thematically unrelated to any of them, although a tenuous case could be made for a slight
resemblance between the neumatic elements in the following ladies' chorus (Fig. 22, p. 312, mm. 39-47, passim) and the very beginning of the A major transition (Fig. 21, mm. 32 and 36, p. 311). The beginning of this instrumental interlude breaks away from the predominant four-measure phrase pattern through a two-measure motto anticipating the anacrustic figures of the period x. This creates a frame within a frame, as it were, since the motto separates the transition from the initial reprise chorus and the transition separates the larger section A and B from each other (Fig. 24, p. 314).

The section A of this composite number is, as mentioned, a Da Capo form (Fig. 21, p. 311). The section B (Fig. 23, p. 312) has a more complex structure based on two contrasting four-measure phrases, c and d (Fig. 22, p. 312, mm. 39-43 and 47-51, resp.), and their variants. The resultant c c d c1 d1 c2 scheme (Fig. 22, periodic structure symbolizations, passim) shows this increase in complexity when compared to the a b a symbolizations of the discrete section A (Fig. 22, periodic symbolizations, passim). The structural complexity is paralleled by an increase in timbral contrast: the theme c and its variants are assigned to the female chorus in two parts, whereas the theme d is assigned to the male chorus in unison. Both the contrast and the variation may seen as elements of a setting that both enhances the textual stichomythia
and provides an element of unity through the manner of variation: the variants of the phrase c feature a gradual diminution of the neumatic element, approximating them in melodic outline to the phrase d and its variants which feature a single neumatic element as half-phrase frame (Fig. 24, neumatic element indications, p. 314).

The introduction of syllabic elements into a theme initially neumatic (Fig. 24, neumatic element indications, p. 314), an otherwise syllabic theme (Fig. 24, phrase d) reinforces the stichomythic effect of the words "shipping" and "politely" and creates an effect of musical convergence of two contrasting themes.

The following section, symbolized as A1+B1 on account of its simultaneous presentation of preceding thematic material (Fig. 23, p. 313), features a linear complexity equal to that of the preceding section B. Its discrete scheme shows no reiteration without alteration: a+c d2 c3 c4 d3 a/instrumental/ (Fig. 23, phrase and period symbolizations, p. 312). However, its texture shows a considerable increase in complexity as the two principal thematic and characterizing periods of the piece are presented simultaneously (Fig. 23, period a+c, mm. 66-74).

This increase in complexity contrasts effectively and suddenly with the preceding choral writing which is, with the exception of the period b in the section A, limited to alternations of two-part soprano and alto phrases with
tenor and bass unisons of approximately the same length (Figs. 21 and 22, pp. 311 and 312, resp.)

The first period of the section A1+B1 reaches a peak of textural complexity through the use of four-part harmony and a fortuitous kind of counterpoint. It also achieves a peak in volume through both indicated and orchestrated dynamics, since it reunites the sonorities of the partial tutti doubling the initial presentations of its constituent periods (Examples 152, 152a, and 152b).

Example 152. Ibid., mm. 2-10, passim.

Example 152a. Ibid., mm. 39-47, passim.
Example 152b. Ibid., mm. 66–74

These examples also show the orchestration of the piece up to its climactic point: the sailors' reprise features the vocal unison doubled by the clarinet and bassoon in octaves and accompanied with a four-part dibrachic pattern in the strings, a pattern adopted for subsequent phrases assigned to the male chorus alone. Exceptionally, the reiteration of the reprised chorus at the end of the C major initial section (Fig. 21, mm. 21–29, p. 311) features a Grand Tutti doubling, identical to that of the ff passages in the Opening Chorus (Chapter III, Example 37b, p. 188). The ladies' entrance after the change of key features a bit more doubling over the same dibrachic accompaniment in the strings: its two-part female chorus is doubled in thirds by flutes and clarinets aided by an oboe on the syllabic fragments. Departures from this pattern are slight: the upper strings occasionally double the tenor-bass unison, and ornament with smaller
values the syllabic eight-notes of the sopranos and altos (Examples 153 and 153a).


The thematically composite double chorus (Example 152b) adheres to the predominant functional distribution in the piece's orchestration: the strings accompany with the continuum-establishing dibrachic pattern, while the flutes and clarinets double the female voices in thirds and the two horns and bassoon double the tenors in unison. The textural complexity peak reached through the double chorus is the first of its kind in the piece. The dynamic peak is the second of its kind, the first occurring in the reprise as a frame (Fig. 21, mm. 21–29, p. 311).
Having reached these peaks of textural complexity and dynamics, Sullivan winds down the musical representation of the visitors' initial hustle and bustle by thinning out the orchestral fabric and simplifying the choral texture immediately following the double chorus (Fig. 23, phrase d2, mm. 74-78, p. 313; and Example 154).

Example 154. Ibid., mm. 74-78.

This wound-down phrase is followed by a variant of the ladies' chorus theme in the strings and woodwinds, which treats the modified motive sequentially. The variant is accompanied by sustained four-part harmonies in the chorus which are a chordal treatment of a melisma on the word "politely." This is the first substantial divergence of the vocal line from the metric continuum \( \frac{4}{4} \) and the first substantial digression from the simple tonic/dominant harmonies in the piece. The underlying harmonies of the passage consist of a sequence of secondary dominants preceding a cadence on the tonic. The digressive sequence is, as mentioned a melismatic vocal passage. The tonic cadence, on the words "so politely," is syllabic. The
contiguous presentation of the same textual fragment set in highly contrasted harmonic and melodic manners calls considerable attention to it. Gilbert's original mise-en-scene called for the ladies to curtsy at this point; the excitement of the entrance comes to a repose on a formal gesture (Fig. 23, p. 313, extended phrase c3, mm. 78-84 and Example 155).

Example 155. Ibid., mm. 78-84.

The choral unison and the melismatic passages (Examples 154 and 155) also abandon the otherwise ever-present dibrachic accompaniment in the strings, featuring a chordal sostenuto and a broken-chord, continuum congruent, fabric, respectively. The dibrach returns in the next phrase both in the accompaniment and the chorus. Its return in the chorus, however, is a variation on that characterizing element and an element of unity as well; since a single dibrach also happens to coincide rhythmically with the

syllabic fragment of the ladies' chorus principal motive. This dibrachic combination is presented in conjunction with a reiteration in the violins and flutes of the ladies' chorus principal motive in its entirety alternating with a close variant. Harmonically, the phrase is a reiterative extension of the V I cadence that ends the preceding hyperphrase (Fig. 23, phr. c4, mm. 84-88, p. 313, and Ex. 156).

Example 156. Ibid., mm. 84-88.

A textual modification serves as a frame to the vocal setting: the original closing line "Sailors welcome most politely" is augmented to "Sailors always welcome ladies most politely." The framing or closural potential of this prosodically extended line is enhanced by the musical setting. The semantic aspect of the line is allowed to come through the melodic treatment, which is syllabic and accentual up to the last two syllables of the line. At this point the setting becomes quantitative and neumatic introducing a framing device that coincides with a (IV) I6 V7 I cadence. The quantitative
phrase extension allows for another curtsy like that on
the earlier melismatic passage (Example 155, p. 292).
The entire passage is treated a capella in four-part
harmony, and the contrast of this sound with the overall
sound of the piece may also be seen as a framing device
(Fig. 23, phrase d3, mm. 88-93, p. 312). The piece ends
on an orchestral reiteration of the theme a, extended by
the addition of a plagal cadence to its original authentic
one (Fig. 23, phrase a1, mm. 93-98). The Examples 154
to 156 show a slight increase in the independence of
certain orchestral section, notably violins and flutes,
owing to the increase of simultaneous thematic diversity.

In general, the orchestration of the number
is representative of Sullivan's economic use of the or-
chestra. The number is scored for the opera's full orches-
tral ensemble, with timpani and triangle in the percussion.
However, the Grand Tutti is used only in nine measures
out the piece's ninety-eight (Fig. 21, mm. 29-31) and
mm. 21-29, p. 311). The timpani appear only in those nine
measures introducing the phrase with a crescendo roll and
emphasizing every subsequent down-beat in it. The triangle
is used just as sparingly: it emphasizes the down-beats
in the transitionary period x (Fig. 21, mm. 29-31) and
it enhances the cadential rhythmic pattern of each phrase
(Fig. 21, mm. 35 and 39). It does not reappear again
until the period a+c in the section A1+B1 (Fig. 23).
in which it emphasizes down-beats, a function that a less
delicate orchestrator may have assigned to the timpani in
view of the rather full sonority of the almost-grand Tutti.
As it is, the triangle emphasizes the metric continuum's
macrocomponents without obscuring the polyphonic texture.
Again, its judicious use emphasizes the contrast between
a motive and its variant in the melismatic hyperphrase
as well as the syllabic cadence of that hyperphrase
(Example 155, p. 292).

The thematic and harmonic structure of the piece
may be outlined thus (the harmonic symbols indicate tonal
levels; Figs. 21-23 contain complete analysis... (pp.; 311-12).


Section A  a a b  a
key of C:  I I IV III V I
transition x
key of A:  V I V I -->

Section B  c c d  c1 d1 c2
  I I VI III II I V V ImT V

Section A1+B1  a+c d2  c3 c4  d3 a1
  I  IV V/VI (sec.dom.  VI...I V I I (IV I)
sequence)
The thematic symbolizations show a variety of structuring procedures in the large and middle dimensions of the piece. The harmonically closed section A with its internal aaba structure may be described as a rounded binary form-of. The harmonically open section B may be seen as a combination of the Classical Da Capo form with a variation form: ccodc1 plus d1 c2. The closing section A1+B1 appears to combine the features of an rondo-like arch form with a variation procedure similar to that in the preceding section. In the largest dimensions there may be discerned an irregular arch structure due to the framing positions of the phrase a: aaba/ccdc1+c2/a+c,a+cd2c3c4d3a1, and finally a variation of the Da Capo form with reversed proportions, that is, a repeat form whose reiterated section is longer and more complex than the initial statement. Thus, A B A1+B1 instead of AABA.

The harmonic structure has no repeat feature. The key of C major is abruptly replaced by A major in the transition to the second section and the piece ends in this key. The harmonies, as mentioned, are simple, with the most digressive harmonies appearing before the threefold cadential structures that end the piece (Compare harmonies in hyperphrase c3 to those in phrases c4, d3, and a1, Fig. 23, mm. 78-98, p. 312). Less digressive than the above-mentioned passage, but more so than the piece's norm are the transition from the period b to the recapitulation
of the period a and the transition x (Fig. 21, mm. 18-21 and 31-39, respectively, p. 311). The tonic pedal in the bass is used to reinforce the main key perception: it appears only at the respective tonic levels of the three major sections (Fig. 21, mm. 1-15, 21-29; Fig. 22, mm. 39-47; Fig. 23, mm. 66-74, 84-88, and 93-97, pp. 311, 312, and 313, respectively).

The melodic outlines of the reprised material are, of course, identical to those in the Examples 28, 30, and 31 (Chapter III, pp. 109, 111, and 112). The melodic outlines of the new material, introduced in sections B and A1+B1, show the following features:

Example 158. Ibid., Melodic Outlines, mm. 39-66.

* The transition 6, theoretically unrelated to any other material, features a static line followed by a leap, and a descending line, similar to 6.
Example 158a, Ibid., Melodic Outlines, mm. 66-68.

(a+c) Present simultaneously the contours of the Opening Chorus (Ex. 22, 34, 31) and those of the phrase (a) of Ex 158.

(d1): see (a+c) above; note on theme (a) of Opening Chorus.

The allocation of small and large melodic excursions in the small arches of (c4) delineates a half-phrase, with the largest excursion—a leap—being a phrase frame in this context.

A considerable variety of melodic contour types may be seen in the piece (Examples 158 and 158a). In the section B the contour types feature small motivic arches arranged sequentially, large arches delineating the half-phrases in sequence, reiterated leaps combined with irregular large arches, static lines followed by upward leaps in a half-phrase sequence, and broken downward lines which may be seen as a framing element descending to a half-cadence.
After the simultaneous presentation of the periods a and c the melodic contours in the section A1+B1 begin with broken upward lines, and follow with a return to the small arch sequence juxtaposed with a descending chromatic line. In turn, they are followed by a series of small arches of alternating amplitudes, and finally by an ascending line leaping down to an arch on the tonic note.

The great variety of melodic contour types parallels the thematic variety of the piece. Both these features are balanced by the pervasive presence of a dibrachic continuum \[\text{\n}\] in almost all accompaniment and in a significant part of the vocal line as a result of syllabic/accidental setting procedures. The uniformity of the continuum-congruent elements is in turn reinforced by the regularity of the four-measure phrase pattern: there are only five departures from this pattern in the ninety-eight measures of the piece. The first such irregularity occurs at the abrupt change of key between the reprised chorus and the ladies' entrance (Fig. 24, half-phrase x, p. 314). The second irregularity allows the return of the phrasing pattern to the prevalent anacrustic beginning after a half-measure shift (Fig. 24, phrase d1, p. 314). This shift and subsequent return coincide with a change in harmonies from the supertonic to the dominant level which ends the section B and
introduces the closing section (Fig. 22, phrases d₁ and c₂, mm. 56-61 and 61-66, respectively, p. 312). The next three irregularities are all extended or augmented cadences: the first of them is a seven measure hyper-phrase that coincides with the most digressive harmonies of the piece (Fig. 23, phrase c₃, mm. 78-84, p. 313, and Fig. 25, phrase c₃, p. 315) culminating on an authentic cadence on the tonic, and the other two are an augmentation of a cadential pattern and a plagal addition to an authentic cadence, respectively (Fig. 24, phrases d₃ and a₁, respectively, p. 314).

The recurrence, variation, and contrast patterns identified in Figures 24 and 25 (pp. 314 and 315, resp.) show a predominance of contrast as a growth procedure, not surprising in view of the thematic diversity in the piece. Recurrence and variation appear less often than contrast: while contrast between phrases is used 14 times, recurrence and variation are used four times each. However, variation between half-phrases is used thirteen times in the piece. It is significant that contrast between phrases appears most often when the contrasting phrases are alternately assigned to male and female voices (Figure 22 throughout, p. 312, Fig. 24, phrases c through c₂). This procedure enhances the polite exchanges between the ladies and the sailors assigning a theatrical function to a musical procedure.
In the context of a larger dimension, the recurrence of the first phrase in each of the three sections A, B, and A1+B1 provides a framing element at sectional level (Figs. 24, 25, pp. 314 and 315, resp.).

An outline chart of the principal sound elements broken by phrase shows a rather complex orchestration procedure used to achieve the piece's predominant sound: a polyhachoric distribution of diverse structural elements is balanced by the high incidence of a moderate overlapping of function assignments (Examples 159, 159a, 159b).

Example 159. Ibid., section A, transition x, Sound Characteristics Outline.
Example 159a. Ibid., section B, Sound Characteristics Outline.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period A (repeats)</th>
<th>Phrase D</th>
<th>Phrase C1</th>
<th>Phrase D1</th>
<th>Phrase C2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>mm. 31-47</td>
<td>mm. 47-51</td>
<td>mm. 51-55</td>
<td>mm. 56-61</td>
<td>mm. 61-66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>melody/accomp.</td>
<td>(mel/accomp.)</td>
<td>(mel/accomp.)</td>
<td>4-part Homophony</td>
<td>Coda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sopr. Alto in Imp</td>
<td>Text, bass, Cl-Bsn.</td>
<td>7-B. union —</td>
<td>4 sung</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Fl. 2 C.l. ob.</td>
<td>Violin (melody)</td>
<td>2 H. Bsn.</td>
<td>accompanied</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Horn, Pbb. in Strings</td>
<td>Broken chord accomp.</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>broken chord</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in parallel octaves</td>
<td>acc. in Strings</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>accomp.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mm. 47-51</td>
<td>mm. 51-55</td>
<td>mm. 56-61</td>
<td>mm. 61-66</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(mel/accomp.)</td>
<td>(mel/accomp.)</td>
<td>4-part Homophony</td>
<td>Coda</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Text, bass, Cl-Bsn.</td>
<td>Violin (melody)</td>
<td>2 H. Bsn.</td>
<td>accompanied</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Violin (melody)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>broken chord</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broken chord acc. in Strings</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>accomp.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(mel/accomp.)</td>
<td>(mel/accomp.)</td>
<td>4-part Homophony</td>
<td>Coda</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Text, bass, Cl-Bsn.</td>
<td>Violin (melody)</td>
<td>2 H. Bsn.</td>
<td>accompanied</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Violin (melody)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>broken chord</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broken chord acc. in Strings</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>accomp.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Polyphonic overlap</td>
<td>Polyphonic by parts</td>
<td>Polyphonic overlap</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Homophonic fabric</td>
<td>Polyphonic by parts</td>
<td>Polyphonic overlap</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motion Texture</td>
<td>Slightly louder</td>
<td>Lighter Texture</td>
<td>Lighter Texture</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thicker fabric</td>
<td>Thinner, softer</td>
<td>Thinner, softer</td>
<td>Thinner, softer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Example 159b. Ibid., section A1+B1, Sound Charact. Outline.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period A+C</th>
<th>Phase D2</th>
<th>Phase C3</th>
<th>Phase D4</th>
<th>Phase D3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>mm. 66-74</td>
<td>mm. 74-78</td>
<td>mm. 78-84</td>
<td>mm. 84-91</td>
<td>mm. 88-95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24 = Melody 1</td>
<td>Melody/Accomp.</td>
<td>Motivic figure (a)</td>
<td>Motivic figure (a)</td>
<td>Coda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.A. F.C. Ob.</td>
<td>(Double Scale)</td>
<td>Dom. 7th &amp; 9th</td>
<td>Dom. 7th &amp; 9th</td>
<td>Dom. 7th &amp; 9th</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T.B. + Bsn.</td>
<td>(Accomp.)</td>
<td>Sustained chords</td>
<td>Sustained chords</td>
<td>Sustained chords</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Double Scale)</td>
<td>in Strings</td>
<td>(Accomp.)</td>
<td>in Strings</td>
<td>(Accomp.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strings/Accomp.)</td>
<td>Ind. Piano</td>
<td>Ind. Piano</td>
<td>Ind. Piano</td>
<td>Ind. Piano</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ind. Piano</td>
<td>Ind. Piano</td>
<td>Ind. Piano</td>
<td>Ind. Piano</td>
<td>Ind. Piano</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texture</td>
<td>Homophonic Texture</td>
<td>Homophonic Texture</td>
<td>Homophonic Texture</td>
<td>Homophonic Texture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thick, Loud</td>
<td>Thinner, softer</td>
<td>Thinner, softer</td>
<td>Thinner, softer</td>
<td>Thinner, softer</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase A4</th>
<th>Piano overlap</th>
<th>Minimal Polyphony</th>
<th>Slightly thicker, louder</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>mm. 43-49</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(mel/Accomp.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 C.l. Str.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(rhythms)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Component Contrast</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Homophonic Texture</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thinner, soft fabric</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Plagal cadence
In terms of dramatic function, the *quodlibet* is a device of spectacle. Viewed from a standpoint of 19th century theatre styles, its relatively realistic representation of two or more groups of characters in a mass scene stops short of the late Romantics' quest for naturalism. This is a consequence of the obvious artifice necessary to combine two or more discrete musical elements within the boundaries of mainstream tonal characteristics of the period.
The Quodlibet: Spectacle Enhancement and Indication of Stylistic Heritage

The section A1+B1 of the ladies and sailors' initial chorus features a free contrapuntal procedure known as a quodlibet, Latin for "what you please" (fig. 23, period a+c, mm. 66-74, p. 313). The theatrical value of this procedure, which allows the combination of two or more unrelated melodies and, whenever applicable, texts, ¹ is obvious: it portrays a crowd scene in a musical play without resorting to the extreme realism of non-musical devices. In this case it allows the representation of the recently arrived ladies mingling with the crew.

This is also the first of Sullivan's double choruses in the Savoy operas, and it is as much a hallmark of Sullivan's Savoy style as the celebrated patter songs. Although the immediate impression of the quodlibet procedure may bring to mind a musical equivalent of the clever word games of which the Victorians were so fond,² its stylistic and historical implications show non-insular roots and a heritage dating from much earlier times. The origins of the quodlibet are very ancient, indeed. Less ancient uses of the procedure point out Sullivan's stylistic debt to Leipzig and its polyphonic tradition.

1. "Quodlibet," The Harvard Dict. of Mus., 713.
Straddling the ancient German duchy of Saxony and the Thuringian valley, the city of Leipzig was a repository of these regions’ musical traditions. One of these traditions was the widespread singing of quodlibets, comparable in local popularity to the glees and catches in 18th century England. A mark of the esteem in which the quodlibet was held by amateur and professional musician alike is its regular practice as a musical pastime during the annual gatherings of J. S. Bach’s family, Thuringers in origin, Leipzigers by residence. J. S. Bach himself did not shun the procedure in a more serious context, although a certain element of humor may be detected in his combination of a lyrical popular song, a humorous popular song, and the harmonic structure of the thirty Goldberg Variations’ main theme in the final, quodlibet, variation of that exemplary work (Example 160).


Quite probably, this procedure was adopted by Sullivan through his studies with Carl Reinecke at Leipzig. Reinecke’s two-piano *Variations on a Gluck Gavotte* end, in imitation of the Goldberg Variations, on a *quodlibet* combining the main theme with Bach’s *Musette* from the third English suite. This *quodlibet* was highly regarded by Victorian scholar as a contemporary example of the form.  

Interestingly, another Reinecke student, the Ukrainian composer Mykola Lysenko (1842–1912) used the same procedure for a similar musical stage effect. In his opera *May Night* (1883) gathering groups of villagers returning from the fields are portrayed in this very manner (Example 160a).


---


In an earlier opera, *Christmas Night* (1877), Lysenko uses a *quodlibet* of borrowed music: approaching groups of carolers are portrayed by a simultaneous presentation of two Ukrainian Christmas carols (Example 161).


The standard terminology recognizes three types of *quodlibet*: polyphonic, successive, and textual. The polyphonic type consists, of course, of the simultaneous presentation of independent melodies. The successive type is for all practical purposes a *pot-pourri*, presenting its independent melodies in succession, as its name indicates. The third type does not involve any melodic independence of its musical parts, containing instead a variety of independent texts, presented either simultaneously or successively.  

7. "Quodlibet," *Harvard Dict. of Mus.*, 713.
Sullivan's quodlibets in the Savoy operas re-unite the features of all three types: their independent melodies are presented consecutively at first, and then simultaneously. Thus, the first part, which familiarizes the listener with the main elements of the polyphonic quodlibet to follow, is successive. The second part is, as stated, polyphonic. Both parts use at least two texts, and therefore the quodlibet is also textual. In all Savoy operas the quodlibet components are remarkably independent of each other as evidenced by their contrasting melodic and rhythmic characteristics (Examples 161, 161a, 161b, 161c, and 161d).

Example 161. Gilbert and Sullivan, "Duet and Chorus." The Pirates of Penzance, Act I, No. 10, mm. 1-6 after letter F.


Example 161c. "Chorus: Welcome, Gentry," Ruddigore, Act I, No. 12, mm. 54-60.

Example 161d. "Double Chorus," The Yeomen of the Guard, Act I, No. 2, mm. 117-120.
Accompaniment pattern in Strings (tonic pedals in bass predominated)

L. A.
SOPRANOS & CONTRALTOs

Over the bright blue sea — Comes Sir Joseph Porter, K. C. B.

Wherever he may be — Bang, bang, the loud nine-pound-ers go!

Shout over the bright blue sea — For Sir Joseph Porter, K. C. B.

Transition to $I^\sharp$:

Figure 20: Act I, No. 6, Barcarolle
Figure 21: Act I, No. 7, Reprise of Opening Chorus and Transition to Ladies’ Introductory Chorus.
Figure 22: Act I, No. 7, Ladies' Introductory Chorus
Figure 23: Act I, No. 7, Double Chorus and Closing Section
Figure 24: Act I, No. 7, Phrasing and Recurrence, Variation, and Contrast Patterns, Sections A and B
Figure 25: Act I, No. 7, Phrasing and Recurrence, Variation, and Contrast Patterns, Sections A1 and B1
CHAPTER IX

THE COMPPLICATING ELEMENT AT WORK

Nos. 8 and 9: an Ostinato Answer to a Ceremonious Greeting

The subdued ending of the otherwise effervescent Allegro choruses in the preceding number (Chapter VIII, Figs. 21 through 25, pp. 311-315) creates a lull providing a negative enhancement to the Captain's greeting of Sir Joseph. Gilbert's couplet of regular iambic tetrameters which opens the number, "Now give three cheers, I'll lead the way/ Hurrah! Hurrah! Hurrah! Hurray!" is modified in the musical setting by the replacement of the first and third iamb's in the first line by spondees. This introduces a ponderousness usually associated with the spondaic foot that reflects appropriately the pomp and ceremony of the occasion and the Captain's consciousness of the dignity of his rank. The broad string chords paralleling the syllabic structure of the Captain's line enhance the solemnity by their location in a low register. The second line's iamb's are treated with a quantitative exaggeration which brings out the word "Hurrah!" reinforced by a choral unison. The spare underlining of the spondees in the first line gives way to a motto-like anticipation of the following song's accompaniment in the second, which matches the anticipatory character of the "Hurrah!" ascending
perfect fourth (Example 162).

Example 162, "Song and Chorus," HMS Pinafore, Act I, No. 8, mm. 1-6.

The text of the following Song and Chorus consists of three stichomythic verses. Each of them is a quatrain with a repeated fourth line. The basic rhyme scheme of the tetrametric quatrain is aabb, and the feet of the first three lines are iambic. The fourth line, however, features a strong-stress metric. This gives the fourth line a strong closural quality and prevents the perception of the quatrain aabb as two couplets. The stichomythic distribution among the characters, patterned aab/b/b, also prevents the stanza's breakdown into couplets. It is a mark of Gilbert's artistic economy that the same elements that give variety to the stanza provide its closure and stanzaic unity. The second and third stanzas are metric replicas of the first one. However, the repeated closural line in the third stanza is followed by a textual extension of a strong-stress
tetrameter with an internal rhyme and a closural diameter ending on a b rhyme (Example 163).

Example 163. Gilbert, "I Am the Monarch of the Sea," 

Sir Joseph.

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{I am the monarch of the sea,} & \quad a \\
\text{The ruler of the Queen's Navee,} & \quad a \\
\text{Whose praise Great Britain loudly chants.} & \quad b
\end{align*}
\]

Cous. Hebe

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{And we are his sisters, and his cousins,} & \quad b \\
\text{and his aunts!} & \quad b
\end{align*}
\]

Relatives.

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{And we are his sisters . . .} & \quad . . .
\end{align*}
\]

Closing line:

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{His sisters, and his cousins,} & \quad \text{internal rhyme} \\
\text{Whom he reckons up by dozens,} & \quad \text{s-stress}
\end{align*}
\]

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{And his aunts! (5 streses)}
\end{align*}
\]

Sullivan's setting of the tetrametric lines follows natural speech patterns rather than standard scansion, and therefore the first iamb is reduced to an anacrustic structure in music. Since the syllabic and accentual setting establishes a duple metric continuum based on the iambic lines and uses submultiples of the continuum elements for the strong-stress lines, the anacrustic figures at the beginning of the iambic lines approximate them to the strong-stress line.

This also adds relief to the word "monarch" by placing
it in the first stressed position of the vocal line
(Example 164).

Example 164. Gilbert and Sullivan, "I Am the Monarch of the Sea," H.M.S. Pinafore, Act I, No. 8, mm. 7-14.

That Sir Joseph is the comic lead is reflected in the music: immediately after the Captain's greeting the music turns into a grotesque quasi-monotone supported by an ostinato. With the exception of the tetra-chordal anacruses at the beginning of the vocal line (Fig. 26, mm. 6-9, p. 355) and the scalewise passage that ends the song's first section (Fig. 26, mm. 17-18), the vocal line is limited to two notes: the tonic and the dominant. This ascending perfect fourth, anticipated in the choral cheers (Fig. 26, mm. 3-6), is organized into a recurrent pattern with the dominant in an anacrusic position coinciding with the initial iamb of each stanzaic line. Some rhythmic variety is introduced into the vocal line by the submultiples of the everpresent metric continuum figure of the ostinato accompaniment. These submultiples are the result of the strictly syllabic
treatment of the supernumerary unstressed syllables which distinguish the strong-stress metric from the iambic (see Ex. 164, p. 319).

The melodic pattern's manner of recurrence creates anacrustic hypermeasures—twice as long as the pattern of recurrence in the accompanying ostinato. This discrepancy between surface and underlying patterns introduces a measure of variety into the already mentioned monotony of the strictly sol–do melody and the repeated I IV I₆ II₇ harmony accompanying each sol–do pattern. In fact, the recurrent melodic pattern creates an ostinato of its own, juxtaposing two dimensions of the same procedure (Example 165).

Example 165. Ostinato Patterns, Ibid., mm. 7-44, passim.

The grotesque character of this procedure, as mentioned, underscores Sir Joseph's comic function. The text leaves no doubt as to his character: it begins with pomp and pride, "I am the monarch of the sea," but follows with descriptions of landlubberly cowardice:
"When at anchor here I ride, my bosom swells with pride
. . . but when the breezes blow, I generally go below."
That Sir Joseph is a braggart warrior of the nautical
persuasion is underscored by the dibrachic *ostinato* of
the accompaniment (Example 165) linking him to the
*nautes gloriosi* introduced before (Chapters V and VIII,
the dibrach, pp. 213 and 316).

The monotony of the *ostinati* at all levels
is somewhat relieved by the irregular measure/phrase
structure: the rebarring of the piece's vocal line along
with a cadential phrase delineation throws this irregular-
ity into relief (Example 166).


The assignement of Sir Joseph's part to a
singing character actor rather than to a "legit" voice,
a choice made by Gilbert and Sullivan after patterning
the *dramatis personae* in *HMS Pinafore* on the stock
company of *The Sorcerer,* ¹ probably determined the subdued orchestration of the number: the *ostinato* is scored for strings alone, without octave doubling in the bass. The resultant textural lightness lets the satiric text to be perceived unhindered (Example 165, p. 320.). The monochrome of the homogeneous instrumental sound matches the deliberate monotone of the repetitious melodic pattern and the accompaniment *ostinato.*

The main feature of growth in the piece is recurrence, since such elements that could be considered as variants do not differ enough from the fundamental thematic pattern at sub-phrase level. In this case the term *sub-phrase* is more applicable than the more usual *half-phrase,* since the cadentially delineated phrases in this number consist of more than two of the so-called *half-phrase* elements (Fig. 28, p. 357, and Example 166, p. 321). However, a significant amount of harmonic divergence may be found at sectional level to consider the middle section a variant of the first, and enough variation in the cadential pattern of the third section to consider it also a variant of the first instead of a literal recapitulation (Fig. 27, sections A1 and A2, mm. 20–32 and 34–51, resp. p. 356). The sectional divisions, with their corresponding tonal levels

---

1. Baily, 143.
on the tonic, the dominant, and again, the tonic, are
delineated by melodic and harmonic cadential formulas.
These framing devices are reinforced by an increase in
volume and a change in sound resulting from the entrance
of the entire choral ensemble after the solo voices.
They are differentiated among themselves not only by
their harmonic and melodic characteristics, but also
by the differences in their respective fabrics. Thus,
the frame of the section A features a choral unison,
the corresponding frame of section A1 two-part harmony
distributed among female and male voices in contrary
motion, and the frame of the section A2, which also
closes the entire piece, four-part harmony in a mixed
chorus (Fig. 26, mm. 14-18; Fig. 27, mm. 30-33 and
44-51, pp. 355 and 356).

No. 9: From Bureacratic Parvenu to a

Nautes Gloriosus

The rather grotesque introductory song and
chorus on which Sir Joseph makes his first appearance
is followed by a song whose text is of a classically
picaresque character: it is the description of a clerical
rogue's progress that antedates the Peter Principle
by almost a century. In contrast to the previous

2. L. Peter, R.J. Hull, loc. cit.
number, this one features full orchestra scoring (2121, 222, triangle, strings). The loud orchestral introduction combines dibrachic elements in its accompaniment with a melodic hornpipe ending formula, completing Sir Joseph's nautes gloriosus characterization begun by the ostinato in the previous number (Example 165, p. xxx and Example 167).

Example 167. Ibid., Act I, No. 9, mm. 1-8, passim.

The text of the song which describes Sir Joseph's advancement from office boy to the First Lord of the Admiralty consists of six verses with identical metric characteristics and stanzaic structure. This is the longest such structure in the entire opera and is probably the reason for an unequivocally strophic setting. The strophic setting, again the longest, and along with the No. 17 Duet in the second act, the only true example of its kind in the opera, may be seen also
as an element of characterization by genre. The relative lack of sophistication associated with strophic settings is indicative of Sir Joseph's equally unsophisticated origins.

The basic stanzaic pattern of the song's text is a sixain. Its four-stress lines feature iambics, an occasional anapaest, and strong-stress feet. This metric variety is unified by the above mentioned four-stress pattern. The rhyme scheme of the tetrametric sixain is aabbcc₄. The ironically aphoristic closing couplet of each stanza is reiterated by the chorus (Example 168).


Sir Joseph

RHYMES

[ ]

\[
A \quad \text{when I was a lad I served a term}
\]

\[
\text{As office boy to an attorney's firm,}
\]

\[
B \quad \text{I cleaned the windows and I swept the floor}
\]

\[
B \quad \text{And I polished up the handle of the big front door!}
\]

\[
C \quad \text{I polished up the handle so carefully!}
\]

\[
C \quad \text{That now I am the Ruler of the Queen's Navel!}
\]

Chorus

\[
C \quad \text{He polished up that handle so carefully!}
\]

\[
C \quad \text{That now he is the Ruler of the Queen's Navel!}
\]
Given the recurrent stanzacic structure and the identical prosody of all six stanzas, the already mentioned strophic setting appears to be a logical choice. The setting is totally syllabic (Fig. 29, p. 358) and the phrase length, with one exception, is a regular four-measure throughout the piece (Fig. 30, p. 359). When these elements of unity and regularity are juxtaposed with the metric variety of the text the combination results in an increase of metric density in the music that is used by Sullivan in melodic phrase frames. The melodic characteristics of these phrase frames is that of the hornpipe ending, the resolution of the cadence coinciding with the last three syllables of the textual lines, which happen to be strong-weak-strong, and therefore an amphimacer (Example 169).

Example 169. Gilbert and Sullivan, "When I Was a Lad," Act I, No. 9, mm.

Amphimacer:
- melodic hornpipe formula
- increase in rhythmic density enhanced by melodic differentiation
Besides providing an element of formal organization through frequent recurrence at harmonic cadence points, the amphimacric hornpipe ending serves as a device of characterization through its association with the eponymous sailors' dance. Moreover, it links Sir Joseph thematically, or rather stylistically, with Captain Corcoran, who was characterized in the very same manner (Chapter VI, p. 225). In fact, both the Captain and Sir Joseph are characterized by a combination of the dibrach and the amphimacer, the former through a simultaneous presentation of both elements (Chapter VI, pp. 233 and 235), and the latter through a dibrachic introduction (Example 162, p. 317).

The amphimacric hornpipe endings are reinforced by being reiterated in the full chorus and Grand tutti orchestra (Fig. 29, mm. 18-20 and 27-28, p. 358). These maximum scored-volume frames delineate the largest structural elements of the piece, the sections A and B of the two-part strophic unit (Fig. 29). The form of that emerges from this may be described as non-recurrent binary. Its tonal plan is of extreme simplicity, as if matching the lack of sophistication of the strophic setting: the first section begins on the tonic level and ends in a half-cadence on the dominant, and the second section returns to the tonic (Fig. 29, mm. 1-20 and 21-32, respectively).
However, in consideration of the orchestral introduction, whose eight measures are almost as long as the other sections (Fig. 29, mm. 1-8, p. 358, it is possible to designate the form of as A+B A B, since the introduction consists of one a phrase and one b. The entire strophic outline, of course, would have to read A+B ♩ A B ♩ ♩ (Fig. 29).

While the sectional symbolizations A and B indicate contrast, the phrase symbolizations within the sections indicate variation as the main procedure on that level (Fig. 30, p. 359). The associated melodic contours of the respective phrases reflect this procedure (Fig. 30). The sections and their component phrases may be outlined as follows, based on the Fig. 29.

Example 170. Sectional and Phrase Outline, Ibid., harmonic symbols indicate tonal levels of sections in reference to detailed analysis in the Figure 29, p. 358).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Intro.</th>
<th>Vocal Setting</th>
<th>Orch. Frame</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A+B</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a-1 b-1</td>
<td>a a1 a2 b b1</td>
<td>b2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I V I</td>
<td>I----------V--(V) I-------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6 verses strophically repeated

mm. 1-8

mm. 9-18 (detailed phrase/measures in Fig. 13)

mm. 28-32
The orchestration features sharp contrasts between the bass/treble string accompaniment of the solo voice and the **Grand Tutti** doubling of the choral section endings. The manner of interchoric doubling in the orchestral **tutti** is worth noting as an elegant way to achieve a homogeneous sound by assigning separate melody/accompaniment functions to woodwinds and brass, respectively, and then distributing the strings among these two functions (Example 171).

No. 10: Glee and Hornpipe: Demagogic Flattery
And Pre-Jingoistic Fervor.

In the dialogue following Sir Joseph's self-descriptive songs (Nos. 8 and 9), he gives vent to his demagogic views on equality and prissy ideas about nautical politeness. In doing this Sir Joseph be-littles the Captain and exalts the rank-and-file seamen. After singing a paean to his ideal of politeness, the use of the expression "if you please" after every com-mand, Sir Joseph and his relatives retire to their cabins (No. 9a, reprise of No. 8). The sailors comment with admiration on Sir Joseph's democratic attitude to the annoyance of Dick Deadeye who disagrees with them. The crew, in a consistently exaggerated reaction to Dick's plain logic "when people have to obey other people's orders, equality's out of the question . . . " is hor-rified, and when he disagrees with their support of Ralph's determination to reveal his love to Josephine, they sing a song that they expect to improve Dick's gloomy manner. The song, composed by Sir Joseph for the edification of the common sailor in the Royal Navy, enumerates the ideal qualities of that worthy, with independence of thought and resolution of action being

paramount in this list of heroic qualities. (full text in Table 14, p. xxx). The text is a parody of such fervently patriotic sea songs as "Sir Sidney Smith" by Charles Dibdin (1745-1814), whose hero is "... a man of such kidney/ he'd fight every foe he could meet/ Give him one ship for two, and without more ado/ He'd engage if he meet a whole fleet, he would..." 5 and "The Snug Little Island" by Thomas Dibdin (1745-1841) which warned Napoleon's Army of England that the British will "... Give them enough of the island / Invaders should just - bite once the dust/ But not a bit more of the island." 6

Gilbert's text consists of two eight-line stanzas of considerable metric variety and a rhyming pattern $a_4b_3c_4b_3ddee_4$. The rhyming pattern is a variant of the ababccdd octave found in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, for example in Fletcher and Beaumont's "Lovers Rejoice" from Cupid's Revenge. 7 The stanza actually breaks down into two quatrains because of the contrast in meters and rhyming patterns combined.


The first quatrain features the alternation of tetrametric and trimetric lines characteristic of the ballad metre. Gilbert varies this traditional stanza by introducing a third line that does not rhyme with the others but features an internal rhyme instead, and that exchanges the predominant iambics of the other lines for a strong-stress meter with its numerous weak syllables between the four main stresses. The following quatrain with the rhyming pattern ddee is prevented from breaking into its component couplets by the pattern of metric variety, which, while preserving four stresses in the line, shifts from the predominant iambics to strong-metrics in the last line. The shift is made gradual by an increase in metric irregularities from the single anapaest in the first two lines to two anapaests in the third line, and finally strong-stress metrics in the last. Thus, the 2+2 rhyming pattern is balanced by the 3+1 metric, which also provides an adequate stanzacic closure; metric variety and stanzacic unity arise from the very same element.

The increase in syllabic density generated by the gradual introduction of additional anapaestic irregularities into the iambic lines is somewhat reminiscent of the incremental enumeration of folk ballads, an effect reinforced by the text's cataloguing
of Jack Tar's ideal qualities (Example 172).


**Tric:**

\[
\text{A British tar is a soaring soul,} \quad a
\]

\[
\text{As free as a mountain bird,} \quad b
\]

\[
\text{His energetic fist should be ready to resist} \quad c
\]

\[
\text{A dictatorial word.} \quad b
\]

\[
\text{His nose should pant and his lip should curl,} \quad d
\]

\[
\text{His cheeks should flame and his brow should furl,} \quad d
\]

\[
\text{His bosom should heave and his heart should glow,} \quad e
\]

\[
\text{And his fist be ever ready for a knock-down blow.} \quad e
\]

**Chorus:**

His nose should pant, etc.

The setting of the *Glee* is overwhelmingly syllabic; the rare neumatic element serves as a melodic phrase frame through its contrast with the predominant syllabics and, as mentioned, its parsimonious use. The metric variety, anapaestic irregularities within the prevalent iambics and strong stress-lines, is accounted for by a scansion that places the self-contained irregularities in a quantitative relationship to each
other but treats their internal components accentually. The only exception to this are the quantitative elements that frame the phrases and half-phrases in the iambic settings (Example 173).


Besides determining the overall rhythmic outline of the piece's melodic line, this approach to scansion uses the supernumerary unstressed syllables of the strong-stress closing line to produce the characteristic and characterizing amphimacetic hornpipe ending (Ex. 174).

Example 174. Ibid., mm. 19-20.
This rhythmic and melodic pattern is not only a function of local characterization. It also provides continuity in the musical articulation of the plot by identifying consistently the complicating elements of the plot, starting with the Captain (Chapter VI, Examples 103, 108, 112, 112a, b, c, pp. 220, 225, 231, and 232, respectively), then Sir Joseph (Examples 168 and 169, pp. 325 and 326, resp.), and finally the flattered crew (Example 174).

After an introductory orchestral phrase (Fig. 31, phrase a-1, mm. 1-4, p. 360) Ralph, the Bos' un, and the Carpenter, tenor, baritone, and bass, respectively, open the number with an unaccompanied homophonic double phrase, corresponding to the text's first quatrain (Fig. 31, mm. 4-12). This is the only part of the number that conforms to the traditional definition of a Glee, an unaccompanied chordal song for three or more male solo voices that was, along with the ballad opera, a national art form in 18th century England.\(^8\) The use of such a form, however archaic, may be seen as an element of a national style, similar to the use of the sea shanties and the hornpipe.

The second quatrain's setting is also unaccompanied, but it is not an authentic Glee anymore:

---

the homophony is succeeded by a two-part free counterpoint in which the upper part is hocketed among the tenor and the baritone along and the lower part assigned to the bass in a continuous line. The hocket ends on the first amphimacric ending of the piece (Fig. 31, m. 20, p. 360). The hocketing converts the second stanza into a stichomythic sequence, although such a thing was not specified by Gilbert in the libretto. The adjective "his" that precedes each enumerative line (Example 172, lines ddee, p. 333) provides the repetitive element necessary for a stichomythia. The bass line contrasts markedly with the hocket in the rhythmic treatment of the text's prosody: whereas the latter maintains a scrupulously faithful rendition of normal speech inflections as reflected in the text's prosody, the former features a capricious a alternation between accentual and quantitative scansion and a deliberate lack of congruence between the textual lines and its musical phrase and half-phrases. Needless to say, the bass is totally incongruent with the hocket. This feature is a function of comic characterization: the Carpenter, a simple sailor, 'is not very good at sight-reading, and evidences this by starting earlier than his companions, wandering off in his merry way, anticipating the first part of the hornpipe ending, and finally arriving to the complete hornpipe-amphimacer
ending one measure later than his companions. When he finally arrives at the proper ending, the chorus comes in with the new homophonic section, overlapping his resolution of the half-cadence on the dominant with a full cadence on the tonic (Fig. 31, mm. 12, 17, 20–21, p. 360, and Example 175).

Example 175. Ibid., mm. 12–20.

The brackets in the upper voice indicate half phrases and textual lines (hocket in dotted lines).

The brackets in the lower voice indicate textual lines, slurs indicate musical phrases.

The Hornpipe chorus (Fig. 32, double phrase b, mm. 21–28, p. 361) is a Vivace reiteration of the upper part of the double phrase b−1 (Fig. 31, mm. 12–20), this time minus hocket, homophonically harmonized, accompanied by strings, and on the tonic level. Its harmonies are the most static of the entire piece, and they are firmly anchored by a tonic pedal in the bass.
The choral hornpipe, classified as such because of its characteristic ending, resembles other types of nautical music as well, such as windlass or pump sea-shanties, which broadens its characterization by genre (Examples 176 and 176a).


The choral hornpipe is followed by an instrumental one (Fig. 32. double phrase c, mm. 28-36, p. 361). It consists of an ornamented anacrustic figure whose melodic underpinning resembles closely the main motive of the Opening Chorus (Fig. 33, period c, p. 362). The ornamentation is that of a standard fiddling hornpipe popular among English speaking peoples of both hemispheres (Examples 177 and 177a).


The harmonies of the instrumental interlude are as static as those of the preceding chorus, and equally anchored by a tonic pedal in the bass. However, besides the obvious contrast in the medium, there is a contrast in the texture, as the instrumental segment abandons chordal homophony for a melody/accompaniment texture (Example 177 above).

After the instrumental hornpipe there is a repeat indicated for the Glee itself (Fig. 31, m. 4, p. 360) reprising the music and setting the text of the second verse up to, but exclusive of, the instrumental hornpipe which is replaced in the reprise by a pair of
deceptive cadential figures. These precede the final authentic cadence of the vocal setting (Fig. 32, per. cl, mm. 37-44, passim; p. 361). The chordal reiterations in the chorus are ornamented by an eighth-note figure in the violins and flute that resembles the instrumental hornpipe of the 1st ending (compare periods c and cl in Table 14a). The piece closes with a Grand Tutti orchestral reprise of the choral hornpipe (Fig. 32, mm. 21-28 and Example 178).


The most significant feature in this closing segment is the combination of the already heard sea-shanty melody and the amphimacric hornpipe ending with a dibrachic accompaniment figure. This provides consistency and continuity in characterization through a cumulative procedure (see the Opening Chorus, Chapter III, Ex. 20, p. 100, The Shanty and The Dibrach, pp. 131-141; Captain's Song and Chorus, Chapter IX, Ex. 113, p. 232; Sir Joseph's Song and Chorus, Example 167, p. 324).
The harmonies of the entire piece are very simple as befits a popular, not to say, utilitarian propaganda song. The most active harmonies are in the slower initial section A (Fig. 31, mm. 1-20, p. 360). The Vivace section A1 is for the most anchored to the tonic level by a bass pedal combined with an alternation of tonic and dominant chords. The harmonic activity increases slightly in its closing period (Fig. 32, per. cl, mm. 37-44, p. 361) and this may be perceived as a framing function. The only significant harmonic digression occurs in the contrapuntal a capella period b-1 (Fig. 31, mm. 12-20), which subtly underscores the contrasting polyphonic fabric.

The orchestration features a terraced crescendo effected through sectional addition. Just as the tempo alternation is Slow-Fast-Slow-Fast, the dynamic levels alternate in a manner that prevents an unbroken linear increase in volume. The sequence of dynamic levels ranges from that produced by a trio of solo unaccompanied voices to that of an orchestral Grand Tutti with cymbals and Bass Drum. The orchestral frames (Fig. 31, phrase 1, mm. 1-4, and Fig. 32, period b2, mm. 44-53, pp. 360 and 361) stand in a piano-forte relationship to each other, but the vocal line they enclose starts at a lower volume than that of the piano frame (Example 180, p. 343).
The principal procedure of growth in the piece is variation at the half-phrase level (Fig. 33, p. 362). The predominant melodic contour is an arch within the short span of a two-measure half-phrase. This feature, besides reinforcing the regular four-measure phrase structure and establishing a hypermetric continuum of \( \phi \quad \text{!!!} \quad \text{!!!} \), approximates the overall character of the piece to that of the sea-shanty, similarly to previous instances of characterization by genre (see Chapter IV, Examples 69 and 70, p. 169).

The following form-of outline may be obtained from the phrase and period symbolizations in Figs. 31, 32, and 33, showing a combination of variation, recurrence, and chain form (Example 179).


Moderato /a-1/ a/b-1/ b c a/b-1/ b c l b2
Vivace

I tonic level—V dom. level—\( \text{Tonic \text{ feudal}} \) in Bass— II— V— III— IV—

form-of symbolizations:

A

*Roman numerals indicate tonal levels; detailed analyses of A and AI in Figures 31 and 32, respectively.*
The Slow-Fast alternation of the piece's component section is paralleled by several other elements capable of reflecting the gradual infatuation of the crew with the demagoguery of Sir Joseph's little opus. Thus, the piano sections of the soli trio present the ideal description of the British sailor in a contrapuntalocket which enhances every described feature. The forte section reiterates these descriptions in loud choral homophony, and the vigor of the tempo acceleration along with the increase in volume reflect the enthusiasm with which Sir Joseph's demagoguery is received. The key of E major allows the E strings of the violin section to resonate sympathetically, adding brightness to the piece.
The orchestration of the piece as such is extremely economical and simple, ranging from single-section scoring to partial doubling to polychoric doubling (Example 181).

Example 181. Ibid., Procedures in Orchestration.
No. 11: Emboldened Gullibility and Feigned Hauteur

The Glee, an enthusiastic reaction of the crew to Sir Joseph's flattery of the rank and file, emboldens Ralph to the point where he declares his love to Josephine. His love is proffered in an outburst of purple prose capped by a sonorous non-sequentur, which, however incongruous at first, may be seen as a reflection of Sir Joseph's previous demagoguery: "Josephine, I am a British sailor (sic), and I love you!" She rejects him dutifully, but her feigned anger alternates with her true feelings in the Duet that follows.

The text consists of two initial quatrains of iambic tetrameter alternately rhymed: ababcdcd. Each even-numbered line ends on a supernumerary unstressed syllable, which makes the b and d rhymes feminine. The two quatrains are followed by an additional pair with identical prosodic characteristics. The first pair of quatrains is assigned to Josephine and the second to Ralph. The verses recapitulate in a poetic form the content of the preceding dialogue, with direct address expressing Josephine's supposed annoyance and Ralph's pride, and asides expressing their true tender feelings towards each other (Example 182).


Josephine. 

Refrain, audacious tar,  
Your suit from pressing,  
Remember who you are,  
And whom addressing!  

(Aside) 

I'd laugh my rank to scorn  
In union holy,  
Were he more highly born  
Or I more lowly!

Ralph. 

Proud lady, have your way,  
Unfeeling beauty!

e etc.

The assignment of prosodically identical stanzas to two or more persons is an expansion of the stichomythic procedure described earlier in Ralph's introductory *Scena* (Chapter V, Example 81, p. 189). This expansion may be designated as strophomythia through procedural analogy: stichomythia is an exchange of lines or similar stanzaic components; strophomythia is an exchange of stanzas. Both procedures achieve variety through semantic contrast and unity through prosodic recurrence. However, when they are subject to a musical setting they become elements of different dimensions: stichomythia is the textual base
of forms-in, whereas strophomythia in most cases is the
textual procedure underlying a strophic form of in music.

Sullivan's setting heightens immediately the
emotional content of the text by agotic and melodic means.
The agotic heightening of Josephine's indignation consists
of a two-level quantitative scansion: the setting of the
first iambic foot is twice as long as that of the fol-
lowing feet, the framing elongation of the half-phrase
notwithstanding. The corresponding melodic figure consists
of an an abrupt leap from dominant to tonic and a steady
descending figure on the tonic triad whose minor mode
identifies the number from the very beginning as one
corresponding to an unsettling plot element. This creates
a precipitous effect by accelerating the rhythmic elements
through diminution towards the half-phrase frame. Having
delineated the half-phrase agogically, Sullivan proceeds
to delineate the entire three-measure phrase by giving
the syllabic phrase a neumatic frame in coincidence with
the dominant chord of a full cadence. The odd-numbered
textual line's masculine rhyme is the prosodic equivalent
of the half-phrase frame and the even-numbered line's
feminine rhyme bears the same relationship to the phrase
frame. The regular recurrence of these prosodic and musical
frames sets up a phrasing continuum throughout the piece
(Example 183).

The same acceleration that may be observed at the half-phrase level occurs as a contrasting element between phrases: the motivic structure is diminished from the rhythmic outline in Example 183 to in the next contrasting phrase (Fig. 34, phrase aa, mm. 9-12, p. 363). This shortens the predominant three-measure phrase length to two measures, which reflects quite accurately Josephine's agitation. Also, it provides the rhythmic basis for the accompaniment figure aa-1 which begins the piece, serves as an ostinato accompaniment to the section A, and recurs in motivic fragmentation in the accompaniment throughout the piece (Fig. 34, mm. 1-3, section A, and passim). The shortened phrases aa and al create a precipitous effect similar to that of the first half-phrase which progresses melodically towards the tonic. However, this time the accelerated
progress is in a much larger dimension as the shortened phrases hasten the piece towards the half-cadence that links the contrasting mode sections (Fig. 35, p. 364).

Although two main sections are delineated by the piece's change from minor mode to the parallel major in the section A1 (Fig. 34, mm. 18, p. 363), its form is not binary, at least not from the standpoint of thematic development; the predominant feature of growth in all dimensions appears to be variation (Fig. 35). The mode contrast between sections and the partial recurrence of the accompaniment figure aa allows to discern three sections, one minor with an ostinato accompaniment, one major without the ostinato accompaniment, and one major with a shortened accompanying ostinato (Fig. 34, sections A, A1, and A2, mm. 1-17, 17-30, and 30-48). The letter symbolizations with numerical subscripts confirm the perceptions of growth procedure at all levels from half-phrase to multi-phrase section (Example 184).

Example 184. Ibid., Form-of Outline, symbolization letters from Figure 34, repeated sections reflect strophic form structure: (aa) indicates incidence of ostinato accompaniment pattern $\text{M}_1$ $\text{M}_2$

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A(aa)</th>
<th>A1</th>
<th>A(aa)</th>
<th>A(aa)1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>aa-1/a/aa/a1/</td>
<td>a2/a3/a4/</td>
<td>a/a2/a3/a4/</td>
<td>a5/a6/a7/a2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>m</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
mode-------- -------- -------- -------
The melodic contours of the piece's phrases show marked deviations from the predominant broken arch or descending line contour at sectional boundaries. Thus, the longest unidirectional line ascends to introduce the entire number, the greatest melodic excursion separates the minor mode section from its major mode neighbor, and the melodic arch of greatest amplitude and marks the beginning of the strophomythic reiteration (Example 185).

The contrast between the stormy first section with its driving dotted rhythm accompaniment and the lyrical second section corresponds to the sudden change of feeling in the text (Example 182, p. 341). This is reflected in the piece's alternation between the major and minor modes. The first section is in the key of F minor (Fig. 34, section A, mm. 1-17, p. 363), and the second section in the parallel major (Fig. 34, section A1, mm. 17-30). The closing section (Fig. 34, section A2, mm. 30-48) is also in the parallel major, but a minor subdominant chord figures prominently in it along with fragments of the first section's driving dotted rhythm patterns. This thematic recurrence underscores the reiteration of the seemingly indignant opening lines at that point (Fig. 34, section A2, mm. 30-48; and 32-35). The harmonic rhythm is somewhat static, with chord changes and phrase and half-phrase outlines being coincident for the most part. The most active harmonies occur in the phrases a3, a6, and a7 (Fig. 34, mm. 24-30, and mm. 36-48). These phrases contain textual reiterations and therefore the contrast in harmonic procedure with the rest of the piece may be seen as balancing the textual reiterations.

The Duet is scored for pairs of flutes and clarinets, oboe, bassoon, pair of horns, and strings. Except for brief instances the piece's texture is polarized
between melody and accompaniment. The orchestration reflects this polarization through sectionally specialized functions. Other than in the homophonic measures in the phrase aa and the homophonic phrase a3 (Fig. 34, mm. 10-12, and 24-27, p. 363), the strings accompany throughout and the woodwinds double the vocal lines, either in complete phrases or at structurally significant points such as the neumatic phrase frames. Horns reinforce the return of the ostinato in fragmented form (Example 186).

Example 186. Ibid., Orchestration Procedures.
The modified return of the impassioned beginning theme, distributed among the two vocalists in stichomythic manner, features the most diversified orchestration of the piece with fragmented interchoric doubling of the vocal line in the woodwinds (timbral contrast emphasizing the half-phrases), and the highest emphasis of the entire piece on the ostinato figure in the horns (Example 185, p. 350). The outer frames of the piece reflect the order of the piece's affective elements: the introductory frame aa-1 (Fig. 34, mm. 1-3, p. 363) consists of the rhythmic outline of the stormy dotted rhythm ostinato and a driving melodic ascent on the tonic level which contrasts very effectively with the accelerating descent of the vocal line's first half-phrase (Example 183, p. 348). The frame is orchestrated forte, with parallel doubling in the entire ensemble. By contrast, the closing frame a2 (Fig. 34, mm. 45-48) which is a slightly modified reprise of the lyrical aside a2 (Fig. 34, mm. 17-20), is orchestrated piano, with sustained chords in the strings accompanying the melody assigned to a flute and a clarinet in octaves. The choice of these contrasting frames in this particular order concludes the duet on a wistful note that is representative of the one-sided discovery: Josephine has reacted to Ralph in a manner that he could have predicted, but Ralph's
confession to Josephine genuinely surprises her by responding to her own secret feelings, predisposing her, and the audience, towards the events to come in the following Finale of the first Act (Example 187).

Example 187. Ibid., Outer Frames.
Figure 26: Act I, No. 8, Introduction, mm. 1-19.
Figure 27: Act I, No. 8, second verse, mm. 20-51.
Rhythmic density increases with ringing of strong stresses in the text.

Extension to a half cadence.

Extension to a full cadence.

Extension to a full cadence.

Figure 28: Act I, No. 8, Recurrent Melodic Patterns at Sub-Phrase Level
Figure 29: Act I, No. 9, Sir Joseph's Song.
Figure 30: Act I, No. 9, Melodic Contours, Phrasing Patterns, Recurrence, Variation, and Contrast at Phrase Level
Figure 31, Act I, No. 10, Glee, mm. 1-20.
Figure 32: Act II, No. 10, Glee, mm. 21-53
Figure 33: Act I, No. 10, Melodic Contours, Recurrence, Variation, and Contrast at Half-Phrase Level
Figure 34: Act I, No. 11, Duet, Josephine and Ralph
Figure 35: Act I, No. 11, Recurrence and Variation Patterns at Phrase Level
CHAPTER X

No. 12: FINALE OF ACT I

Josephine's Revelation, Ralph's Discovery,
Reversal of the Lovers' Fortunes

After Josephine's rejection, Ralph announces that life without her love is unbearable and therefore he will end it then and there. Moved by such a proof of love, Josephine reveals her true feelings towards Ralph. The crew and the ladies, who have witnessed Ralph's suicide attempt, praise her resolution, rejoice with the lovers, and join them in their planning for an elopement. Dick Deadeye provides a menacing note by reminding the plotters of the Captain's anger were he to discover their plans, and of the social disparity of the lovers. He is shouted down and chased away by the entire ensemble, who express their approval of the lovers' decision in song and dance.

The text containing this series of events, the plot's first discovery and reversal, a foreshadowing element, and a deliberately premature apotheosis, comprises the Finale of Act I. Despite its content of several more or less discrete poems, the Finale's text
features a certain unity arising from Gilbert's choice of iambic tetrameter as the predominant meter, and of the iamb as practically the only foot. This uniformity is balanced by variety in the stanzaic configuration of the various poems in this Finale.

Ralph's *recitativo*, which opens the Finale, is an isometric iambic quatrains with an aabb₄ rhyme scheme: a form of quatrains favored by Elizabethan and Jacobean poets for love lyrics.¹ The syntactic organization of this stanza, allotting the first three lines to an impassioned rhetorical question and the fourth to its emphatic answer, prevents it from disintegrating into its component couplets (Example 188).


```
Can I survive this overbearing
Or live a life of mad despairing?
My preferred love despised, rejected?
No, no, it's not to be expected!
```

Having soliloquized his determination, Ralph summons his crewmates to inform them of his decision. They arrive with the ladies and Ralph addresses them.

¹ Maublein, 25.
He does so in iambic dimeters, and the halved length of the lines creates an effect of urgency by the consequent increase in rhyme frequency. This device reflects Ralph's agitation and the ensemble's eagerness to find out the reason for his summon.

The rhyme scheme of this stanza, \( \text{ababcccb}_2 \), is unusual for an octave. The rhyme \( b \) is the only element besides the purely quantitative aspect that preserves stanzatic unity. The stanza may be perceived also as a couplet followed by a sixain, ab and abcccd, respectively. This perception is reinforced by the stichomythic distribution of the text among Ralph and the crew and ladies: Ralph's call is the couplet and the ensemble's answer is the sixain. The three-fold reiteration of the rhyme \( c \) within the ensemble's sixain enhances the above mentioned agitation (Example 189).


\[
\begin{align*}
\text{Ralph:} & \quad \text{Messmates, ahoy!} \\
& \quad \text{Come here, Come here!} \\
\text{All:} & \quad \text{Aye, aye, my boy,} \\
& \quad \text{What cheer, what cheer?} \\
& \quad \text{Now tell us, pray,} \\
& \quad \text{Without delay,} \\
& \quad \text{What does she say} - \\
& \quad \text{What cheer, what cheer?}
\end{align*}
\]
Ralph’s description of his plight before the entire ensemble returns to an iambic tetrameter quatrain, but this time its rhymes are alternate, abab₄, which reinforces the stanzaic unity. Just as Ralph’s initial quatrain (Example 188, p. 366) is followed by an irregular octave (Example 189, p. 367) his second quatrain is followed by an unrhymed single line of iambic dimeter in the chorus, commiserating with him. This, in turn, is followed by an iambic tetrameter couplet in which Dick Deadeye gloats over Ralph’s predicament (Example 190).

Example 190. Ibid., 118.

Ralph: The maiden treats my suit with scorn, rejects my humble gift, my lady; she says I am ignobly born, and cuts my hopes adrift, my lady.

All: Oh, cruel one. (unrhymed amphibrachus)

Dick: She spurns your suit, Oho! Oho! I told you so, I told you so.

The chorus returns to the alternately rhymed iambic quatrain and extolls the British sailor, echoing Sir Joseph’s exaltation of the rank and file. This paean is interrupted by Dick’s pessimistic sarcasm, cast in a stanza prosodically identical to the preceding (Ex. 191).
Example 191. Ibid.

All: Shall we submit? Are we but slaves? a
Love comes alike to high and low - b
Britannia's sailors rule the waves, a
And shall they stoop to insult, No! b

Dick: You must submit, you are but slaves a
A lady she, Oho! Oho! b
You lowly toilers of the waves, a
She spurns you all - I told you so! b

The even numbered lines of the above stanzas rhyme with Dick's first derogatory couplet (Example 190, p. 368) which introduces a measure of unity into the metrically and stanzaically varied text.

Ralph's final resolution is presented in an iambic quatrain that returns to couplet rhymes. The quatrain features an heterometric closural procedure since its iambic trimeter gives way to a pentamer in the last line. The stanzaic unity provided by the scheme aab_4b_5 is reinforced by an enjambement or run-on between the third and fourth lines. The iambic tetrameter of the first two lines is hypermetric because of feminine rhymes and the fourth line is pentametric. This slight metric elongation approximates the couplets to the iambic pentameter, which may be seen as characterization by
genre, since the iambic pentameter couplet, or heroic couplet, is traditionally associated with lofty subjects in English literature. The stanza is reiterated by the chorus literally, with the appropriate pronoun changes (Example 192).

Example 192. Ibid.

Ralph: My friends, my leave of life I'm taking; a
For oh, my heart, my heart is breaking. a
When I am gone, oh, prithee tell b
The maid that, as I died, I loved her well. b

All: Of life, alas, his leave he's taking (etc.)

The words that Ralph intends to be his last are shortened to iambic trimeters cast in an alternately rhymed quatrain. However, the last line of the quatrain is assigned, again in stichomythic fashion, to Josephine, who confesses her love at this point. The chorus and Ralph are given respectively affirmative and incredulous reiterations of Josephine's line in a single-rhyme stichomythia. This stichomythic reiteration, comical as it may be, underscores the plot's first discovery and reversal: Ralph discovers that Josephine loves him and

2. Haublein, 22.
his fortunes are reversed. A certain element of realism
is introduced in the stichomythic extension of this stanza
through the replacement of the predominant iambic trimeter
by two trochees assigned to Ralph and Josephine respect-
ively. The change of meter emphasizes his disbelief and
her reaffirmation. The fourth line of the stichomythia
returns with the full ensemble to the iambic trimeter
(Example 193).

Example 193. Ibid., 119.

Ralph:  Be warned, my messmates all
        Who love in rank above you -
        For Josephine I fall!

Josephine: Ah, stay your hand! I love you!

All:     Ah, stay your hand - she loves you!

Ralph:   Loves me?
        (stress reversal
        (trochees for iambics)

Josephine: Loves you!

All:     Yes, yes - ah, yes, - she loves you!

This moment is the culmination of a series of
complications presented throughout the first act: Ralph's
love for a social superior and Josephine's corresponding
fondness for a social inferior, complicated further by
Sir Joseph's demagogy which prompts Ralph to alter the
status quo.
Sullivan's setting of these lyrics (Figs. 36, and 37, pp. 468 and 469, respectively) shows considerable departures from standard poetic scansion. As before, these departures are justified by their enhancement of the text's dramatic content and by their approximation to normal speech inflection. Ralph's opening recitativo (Fig. 36, period x, mm. 1-9) alternates between quantitative and accentual scansion, and begins with a simultaneous juxtaposition of both manners of scansion. The initial iamb of the text as set by Sullivan may be perceived both as a quantitative iamb and as an accentual trochee: \( \text{C} \downarrow \text{etc.} \) which contains at once a strong-weak (trochaic) pattern and a short-long (iambic) pattern. The cumulative result of such a juxtaposition is neither trochaic nor iambic, but rather spondaic, composed of a dynamic and an agogic stress. The juxtaposition of the accentual and quantitative elements in the rest of the recitativo is strictly linear. The contrast between the long and the short elements of the quantitative scansion increases to mark the peak of the arch-like melodic contour of the recitativo. The peak comes towards the end of a long asymmetrical arch and coincides with the end of a rhetorical question, reinforcing it. The deliberate ambiguity in the setting scansion reflects Ralph's agitation. The agitation is also reflected by more conventional musical
means: the harmonies of the recitativo progress towards its final chord on the main key's (Eb major) dominant from a diminished seventh of the submediant through a sequential alternation of secondary dominants and diminished sevenths. The total effect is completed by the underlying string tremolo. This descendant of Monteverdi's stile concitato, rather overworked by Sullivan's time, makes here the first of two brief appearances in the opera. Sullivan's use of this device is extremely spare and dramatically consistent: in both cases, the present and Josephine's second act Scena (Act II, No. 15, Fig. 66-68, mm. 24-27, P. 615-7) it reflects the feelings of the troubled protagonists at the brink of a momentous decision (Example 194).

The melodic contour of the recitativo may take two different shapes, depending on the tenor's ability and willingness to sing the optional high B-flat on the word expected (Fig. 36, period x, m. 9, p. 468). The first possibility, without the optional high note, is quite similar to the closing melodic formulae of classical recitativo secco (see Example 100, Chapter IX, p. 217). It results in a melodic contour in the shape of an irregular arch peaking near its end. The second possibility, much more dramatic than the first, results in a broken ascending line which drops from its highest point to its lowest at the very end (Example 194a).

Example 194a, Melodic Contours, Ibid.,

The following Allegro con Brio begins with a motto-like statement of the forthcoming chorus' main motive. What follows is a set of negative variations on the thematic material of the chorus (Fig. 36, motto a-2, periods a-1, b-1, mm. 10-11, 13-19, and 30-33, resp., p. 468). There is a thematically independent cantabile
intercalated into the set of negative variations (Fig. 16, period y, mm. 19-27, p. 468). However, its thematic independence is somewhat limited by the secondary motivic elements that set the line-framing exclamations "my lady" and serve as phrase frames as well (Fig. 36, mm. 23 and 27). These may be linked motivically with the anacrustic second half of Ralph's call and its quantitative iambic setting (Example 195).


The principal motive (Figure 36, mm. 10, 14, 34, 46, 47, and 49) derives its characteristic rhythmic shape from the spondaic treatment in the setting of an iambic foot in the text and a quantitative enhancement through a dotted pattern of the next iamb (Example 196).

As its designation indicates, the principal motive is the single most recurrent element of its kind in the *Allegro con Brio* (Fig. 36, mm. 33-56, p. 468). Its incidence is patterned in such a manner that it delineates a three-part form—of following the set of negative variations already described. The periods a and a1 (Fig. 36, mm. 33-41 and 48-56, respectively) are identical to each other save for a *parlando* added to the latter. These periods consist of two phrases each. The first phrase contains the principal motive in three out of its four measures. By contrast, the second phrase features the principal motive only as a frame in its last measure (Example 197).


Separating the two a-periods there is a contrasting period b. Its setting does not vary from the poetic scansion of the text at first. The accentual treatment gives way briefly to a dotted and therefore quantitative enhancement of the iambic feet, delineating thus the phrase. By contrast, the second phrase starts with a
spondaic setting of a textual iamb, and only then resumes the accentual setting with a quantitative frame that characterizes the preceding phrase. An element of unity is introduced into the three-part structure by two-measure transition from the period \( b \) to the period \( a \), which features the rhythmic pattern of the principal motive (Example 198).


The harmonic character of the piece is rather simple. The most active harmonies are those of Ralph's opening recitativo and of Dick's bitter remarks (Fig. 36, periods \( x \), \( b-1 \), and \( b \), mm. 1-9, 28-33, and 41-47, respectively, p. 468). The greatest digressions from the home key of Eb-major are found also in these periods, as well as in the cantabile setting of Ralph's lament (Fig. 36, period \( y \), mm. 19-27). The harmonic simplicity of the period \( a \) and its variants is underscored by their tonal level which remains always on the tonic. The harmonic outline of the Finale I up to Ralph's suicidal decision leading to the first discovery and reversal shows the
following tonal levels at corresponding periods and phrases (Example 199).

Example 199. Ibid., Harmonic and Form—of Outline (mm.1-56).

Allegretto Moderato (recit.): key of Eb major.

x (mm. 1-9)


Allegro con Brio

a-2 (mm. 10-11) a-1 (mm. 12-19)

I tonic level throughout; deceptive cad. from V to

y (mm. 19-27)

flat III; flat mediant maintained to end of period.

b-1 (mm. 28-33)

modulates from flat mediant to the dominant (bIII - V)

a, first phrase (mm. 33-36) second phrase (mm. 37-41)

I V/ V V IV V7 I

b, first phrase (mm. 41-42) second phrase (mm. 43-45)

I G V I V7/III III

phrase extension, motivic anticip. of a (mm. 46-47)

V/VI VII2/III V2/II V/VI VI6 VII2/II V7

al (mm. 48-56) see a for harmonic outline.

* Detailed harmonies in the Table 16.
The affective connotations of the harmonic plan just outlined are quite representative of the text in a plainly conventional manner. The ceremonious, march-like, period a and its major variants appear invariably in the main key's major mode with static harmonies whose only digression is a V of V delineating the first phrase in the periods a and al (Fig. 36, mm. 36 and 51, resp., p. 468). The text, set in such a manner, is a close paraphrase of the celebrated refrain in T. A. Arne's song and chorus from the masque *Alfred* (1740) "Rule, Britannia": the 18th-century patriotic text by James Thomson (1700-1748) ends every stanza on a couplet that praises the country's naval power (Example 200).


Rule, Britannia! Britannia rules the waves!
Britons never will be slaves.

Gilbert reverses the order of these sentiments:


Shall we submit? Are we but slaves?
... 
Britannia's sailors rule the waves,
... 
(Full stanza in Example 191, p. 369).
The recurrence of the self-assured ditty patterned after "Rule, Britannia" in the Allegro con Brio provides it with a framework around which the unsettling elements are arranged. The ditty also serves as a reminder of the continuing complicating function of Sir Joseph's demagogic exaltation of the rank-and-file which dissuades Ralph from the passive resignation that characterized him at the beginning of the act.

As mentioned, the Finale I begins with a recitativo accompanied by tremolando strings, whose ambiguous harmonies underlie a chromatically ascending melodic line. These devices represent Ralph's agitation in an extreme degree relative to the settings that follow. As the recitativo's harmonies progress towards the main key's dominant the music seems to converge with the cheerful entrance of the chorus, the first negative variant of the period a preceded by a motto (Fig. 36, a-2 and a-1, mm. 10-19, p. 468). This variant is followed by Ralph's lament, a cantabile whose remote tonal level (flat mediant) is introduced as the resolution of a deceptive cadence (Fig. 36, mm. 19-20). Its harmonies are rather static at the local level, and its mode is perforce major. The only conventional representation of unsettled emotions in the cantabile are its octave-drop phrase frames and their breathless halving of the predominant quarter-note per syllable (see Example 195, p. 375). The aforementioned
deceptive introduction of a remote tonal level and the driving dibrachic accompaniment are, by contrast with the recitativo and the frames of the cantabile, subtler and less conventional ways of representing agitation. All in all, the cantabile presents Ralph in a mood of quieter resolution, as if the cheerful choral answer to his call had steeled his determination.

The harmony's return to the tonic level at the period a begins after a choral extension of the cantabile (Fig. 36, period y and extension, mm. 19-27 and 28-29, resp., p. 468). The extension's text reaffirms the ladies and crew's support of Ralph; its harmonies still linger on the cantabile's tonal level while providing a link with the modulatory period b-1 (Fig. 36, period b-1, mm. 30-33). This period's tonal characteristics provide a conventionally apt representation of Dick Deadeye's sarcastic gloating over Ralph's plight while progressing towards the main key in an unobstrusively elegant manner. Dick's melodic line is a descending hexachord in the main key's parallel minor, which is also the erstwhile tonal level's relative minor: G-flat major to E-flat minor to E-flat major.

This return to the main key introduces the three-part structure that ends the E-flat major opening section of the Finale I. The Da Capo form—of contains a
choral affirmation of the rank-and-file's pride, its
elegation by Dick Deadeye, and a reaffirmation of both
sentiments juxtaposed with each other (Fig. 36, periods
a, b, and al, mm. 33-41, 41-47, and 48-56, respectively,
p. 468). The harmonies of the period a and its recapitu-
lation variant are, as described, in the main key, and,
as shown in Example 199, limited to the major chords of
that major tonality. The period b, however, after de-
lineating its first phrase with a cadence on the dominant
of the dominant, ends an otherwise similar second phrase
with a cadence on the mediant, thus introducing a minor
mode into the otherwise major three-part form (Fig. 36,
period b, m. 45). The minor mode here is contiguous with,
and representative of, the menacing sarcasm of the text
with which Dick vituperates his naive shipmates (see
Example 191, second quatrain, p. 369).

The phrase structure of the recitativo and
Allegro con Brio consists of two-measure phrases, four-
measure phrases, and one-plus-one measure structures
in the cadential extension following the period y and
the motivic anticipation preceding the period al (Fig.
36, mm. 28-29 and 46-47, respectively). The introductory
recitativo, although rhythmically patterned in two-measure
units, may be perceived as a 1+6+2 structure in terms of
its surface melodic patterns and as a nine-measure hyper-
phrase delineated by its harmonic progression and cadence:

Harmonic basis for a nine-tone mm. hyperphrase perception instead of above.

\[ \begin{align*}
\text{III}^6_3/7, & \quad V_6/3, \quad \text{III}^4_3/7, \quad V_6/3, \quad \text{III}^1_7/4, \quad I_4, \quad V_7 (I) \\
\end{align*} \]

The manner of phrase delineation is not entirely uniform: sometimes it depends on melodic and rhythmic cadential factors, sometimes on conventional harmonic cadences. The motto a-2, Ralph's call, and the crew's answer in the variant a-1 are two-measure phrases whose reiteration of strong rhythmic and melodic patterns prevents them from being perceived as half-phrases. Rhythmically, the motto a-2 could be perceived as 1+1, but its I IV I harmonies prevent this perception (Example 202).

Example 202. Ibid., mm. 10-16.
The setting of the crew's answer is a four-measure phrase, delineated through a melodic cadence reinforced by a chord change, in contrast to the preceding two phrases which do not budge from the tonic chord (Ex. 202). The setting scansion of this four-measure phrase also differs from that of its two-measure predecessors: the latter are quantitative, while the former combines accentual and quantitative scansions in equal proportions. The accentual scansion is presented in values twice as short as the predominant long syllable in the quantitative scansion. Since the setting is strictly syllabic, this procedure creates an effect of acceleration, quite appropriate for the mounting curiosity of the crew. This halving of syllabic values and the concomitant acceleration match the prosodic event acceleration that occurs at this point when the rhymes in the text change from alternate to single (Example 189, p. 367, and Example 203).

Example 203. Ibid., mm. 16-19.

Quantitative Setting

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Principal Motive</th>
<th>Principal Motive</th>
<th>Intercalated Motif Fragment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Principal Figures</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

 transcribe your text here
The two identical four-measure phrases of the flat-submediant cantabile (Fig. 36, period y, mm. 19-27) are fully delineated in a conventional manner through an authentic cadence in the local tonal level whose resolution is enhanced by an abrupt melodic excursion. The scansion alternates by measure between accentual and quantitative. The anacrustic element is quantitative which is a function of unity through motivic recurrence beginning with the second part of Ralph's call (see Fig. 36, secondary motivic elements, and Example 204).

Example 204. Ibid., mm. 19-27, passim.

The cadential extension (Fig. 36, mm. 28-29) is a two-measure phrase delineated by a harmonic progression from the local subdominant to the local tonic followed by an appoggiatura chord resolving again to the local tonic with an overall plagal effect. The setting replaces the text's iambics with a scansion that overlaps a spondee with an amphimacer. This procedure raises the emotional pitch of the choral response to Ralph's lament by providing a substantial agogic stress on the phrase's opening exclamation "Oh!" (Example 205).

Prosodic accents (conventional scansion)

\[
\begin{array}{cccccc}
\hat{v} & \hat{v} & \hat{v} & \hat{v} & \hat{v} & \hat{v} \\
\text{Spondaic} & \text{Spondaic} & \text{Spondaic} & \text{Spondaic} & \text{Spondaic} & \text{Spondaic}
\end{array}
\]

The phrase delineation in the period a and its recapitulative variant a is of such classical simplicity as befits a song of institutional pride in the mid-18th to mid-19th centuries in Western Europe. The period consists of two phrases of four measures each. The first phrase, whose text poses the rhetorical question "... Shall we submit, are we but slaves?" progresses from the main key's tonic to a half-cadence on the dominant. The second phrase, whose text answers the rhetorical question, progresses from the subdominant to a full cadence on the tonic. The initial iamb of each line is set as an accentual spondee whose customary prosodic weight adds a majestic character to the music. The rest is set, always syllabically, in a quantitatively fashion faithful to the text's prosody. The only exception to this fidelity is the reiteration of the final word "No!" which calls for an accentual diminution of the prevalent syllabic values.
in the setting of the preceding words in order to preserve the regular phrase length, which by now has been firmly established in a two- and four-measure pattern (Fig. 37, p. 469). This compression results in a set of two accentual fragments in the line "And shall they stoop to insult?" which stand in a quantitative relationship to each other. The first of the two fragments creates an acceleration representative of the ensemble's curiosity similar to that in the phrase al (Example 203, mm. 16-17, p. 384). The pause that precedes the setting of the twin negative exclamation shifts the vocal line of the final cadence to an anacrusic position resulting in a negative-space enhancement of the negation's vehemence (Example 206).

Example 206. Ibid., mm. 33-41.

The phrase b with its digressive harmonies returns to the two-measure phrase pattern. This is a function of syllabic element acceleration: the note values assigned to each syllable are again halved in
relation to the stressed values of the previous period. The acceleration in this case is quite representative of Dick Deadeye's scornful anger and excitement evident in the text. Each phrase is set accentually with a quantitative frame. The second phrase is a close variant of the first, differing from it principally through harmonic direction and the spondaic treatment of its initial iamb. The harmonies of the first phrase progress from the tonic to a half cadence on the dominant, which is a reiteration of the harmonic scheme in the preceding period's first phrase (Ex. 206, p. 387). In the second phrase of the per. b, however, the harmonies, which have returned to the tonic, progress to a cadence on the mediant. This places the second quantitative phrase frame in the minor mode which has been consistently used up to this point to represent or foreshadow unsettling plot elements. The above mentioned spondaic treatment of the second phrase's initial iamb occurs on a melodic reiteration of the preceding phrase's highest pitch, enhancing agogically a feature already prominent by its pitch, linear placement, and simple repetition (Example 207).

Example 207. Ibid., mm. 41-45.
Except for the addition of Dick Deadeye's parlando, which may be linked by its dotted rhythm to the principal motivic elements in the piece (Fig. 36, q.v., p. 469), the period 1 is identical to the period a. Thus, a prominent element of dramatic function, the parlando reiteration of Dick's admonitions, also provides the necessary ingredient for a modified recapitulation, a procedure observed repeatedly in earlier numbers of this opera.

Altogether, the phrasing structure of the Allegro con Brio may be outlined as follows, preceded by the recitativo:

Example 208. Ibid., mm. 1-56.

Recit. x:
1+6+2 (mel./rhythm.) 9 (harmonic)

Allegro con Brio:
\[ \begin{array}{cccccc}
a-2 & a-1 & y & b-1 & a & b \\
2 & 2+2+4 & 4+4+2 & 2+2 & 4+4 & 2+2/1+1/4+4 \\
cad. ext. & transition & \\
\end{array} \]

The excursions and returns that determine the melodic contours within the piece are consistently contained in two-measure units, be they phrases or half-phrases. In the absence of an overarching presentation of a metric continuum element, this melodic contouring takes its place by delineating equal segments of duration.
While the duration units of this contouring are an element of unity, its melodic features are an element of variety: the shapes range from simple ascending fourths (Fig. 37, contours 1, 2, and 4, p. 469) to staggered descending lines in penta- and hexachords (Fig. 37, contours 3, 13, and 14), descending and ascending lines ending on abrupt changes of direction combined with large excursion (Fig. 37, contours 6 and 8), arches of varying length and irregularity (Fig. 37, contours 5, 9, 10, 11, and 12), and a cambiata-like structure in the cadential extension of the period y (Fig. 37, contour 5).

The patterns of recurrence, variation, and contrast show an almost equal amount of variation and contrast as procedures of growth in the half-phrases (12/11 ratio between the former and the latter), with recurrence being kept to a minimum (Fig. 37, left. col., RVC markings).

The orchestration and fabric/texture features may be observed together: the alternations between light and heavy textures correspond to alternations between Grand Tuttis and sectional groups of smaller size. With the exception of the period y, whose fabric is polarized between melody and accompaniment, the Recitativo and the Allegro con Brio feature a homophonic four-part
fabric throughout. The only exception in the four-part fabric is a unison in the second phrase of the period b-1. The change in fabric at this point serves to balance through variation the almost literal reiteration of the previous phrase's melodic line (Fig. 36, mm. 30-33, p. 488). The indicated dynamics are almost identical to the orchestrated dynamics, and therefore, are shown together (Example 209).

Example 209. Ibid., Outline of Orchestration, Texture, Fabric, and Dynamics, mm. 1-56.
The vigorous reassurances of the chorus fail to dissuade Ralph from his conviction that life without Josephine is not worth living. He bids farewell to the assembly and prepares to take his own life while protesting his love for Josephine. The text of this declaration, a quatrain repeated by the chorus (Example 192, p. 370), is set as a brief arioso and chorus (Fig. 38, mm. 56-72, p. 470). The scansion of the strictly syllabic setting is quantitative with varying durational differentiations between long and short syllables. The stressed syllable of the initial iamb in the first two lines is enhanced agogically through a duration double the length of the other stressed syllables. In the third line the agogic stress moves to the middle of the line on the word "gone" and the exclamation "oh", respectively. The former, a substantial elongation of a naturally stressed syllable, enhances the meaning of a word alluding to Ralph's Ralph's seemingly impending demise. The latter, resulting from a spondaic treatment of a textual iamb, produces the effect of a sigh appropriate to the emotions expressed in the text. The spondee does not occur in the otherwise identical setting of the choral reprise, since the sigh "oh" is replaced in it by the pronoun "we" (compare the mm. 61 and 69 in Fig. 38). This return to a regular scansion in the reprise may be seen as an indication of a
meticulous approach of Sullivan to theatre music (Example 210).

Example 210. Ibid., mm. 56-72, passim.

The arioso and chorus are in the key of Ab minor which is the minor subdominant of the preceding Finale I segment (Fig. 36, p. 468). In terms of a progressing dominant relationship, the abovementioned initial segment in Eb major may be perceived as resolving through a full cadential effect to the Ab minor of the Poco piu Lento (Example 211).

Example 211. Ibid., mm. 55-57.
The perception of the Allegro con Brio as a dominant of the Poco piu Lento is confirmed by the recurrence of the former’s tonal level as a dominant seventh under the stichomythic recitativo following the latter (Fig. 38, mm. 79-88, p. 470). In turn, this dominant resolves again into Ab--major this time-- at the Allegro Vivace Quartet (Fig. 40, m. 89, p. 472). The traditional affective connotation of the minor mode is reinforced in the Poco piu Lento by previous contiguity with the unsettling elements of the plot (see Ex. 18, Choater III, p. 98, and also Fig. 18, Chapter VII, p. 271, and Fig. 34, Chapter IX, p. 363).

All phrase-defining elements in the eight-measure arioso and its choral reprise (Fig. 38, periods a and a1, mm. 56-64 and 64-72) are congruent with each other in delineating a 2+2+4 phrase/measure pattern (Fig. 39, p. 471). Melodic contours are sequential in the first four measures and the rhythmic patterns replicate the first two measures. These elements are supported by a primary chord structure I V7 I ending the phrase on a full cadence. The third phrase, a four-measure unit, avoids the melodic sequencing and rhythmic reiteration of the preceding phrases. Instead, its features a four-measure melodic arch contour and a half-phrase rhythmic delineation obtained through the use of a recurrent
anacrustic figure. This increase in the melodic and rhythmic scope of the phrase is paralleled by more digressive harmonies with a secondary dominant progression delineating the first half-phrase, and a progression to a full cadence on the tonic delineating the second:

\[ V_7/III \quad III \quad I_6 \quad I_6 \quad V_7 \quad I \quad (\text{Fig. 38, mm. 59-64, p. 470}). \]

The feminine rhymes that end the first two lines of text, the enjambment between the third and fourth lines, and the penultimate stressed syllable in the last line of the quatrain are all set as appoggiature (Fig. 38, mm. 58, 60, 62, 63). These stressed dissonances contribute to the two-measure phrase delineations by coinciding with the other phrase-defining elements mentioned before. In addition to the enrichment of the piece's simple harmonies, the appoggiature enhance the textual meaning, since all four of them occur on verbal forms of sentence predicates which convey the action: "... my leave of life I'm taking," "... my heart is breaking;" "... tell the maid ..." "I loved her well!" This musical representation of poetic pathos is a mainstream device of 18th and 19th century opera (Examples 212, 213, 214, and 215). By the 1850's its affective connotation made it virtually independent of a contiguous text: the pathetic effect it could produce made it a welcome guest on both sides of the Alps
(Examples 216 and 217).


Example 213. W. A. Mozart, "Canzonetta," *Don Giovanni* (1787), Act II, No. 16, mm. 4-6 and 24-26.

Example 215. Vincenzo Bellini, "Ah, Non Credea Mirarti!" *La Sonnambula* (1831), Finale, Act II, mm. 9-11 of the vocal line.


There is no significant melodic, harmonic, or scanning contrast between the tenor's arioso and its choral reprise (Fig. 39, p. 471) except for the appropriate pronoun changes in the text and the consequent restoration of an iambic setting in the reprise on the syllable corresponding to the spondaic "oh" in the arioso (Fig. 38, mm. 61 and 68, p. 470). However, there are considerable differences between the arioso and its reprise in fabric, texture, scored dynamics, and orchestration. The period a is assigned to a solo voice (tenor) accompanied by an arpeggiato figure in the dark chalumeau register of the clarinet punctuated by anacrusic string chords. The resultant polarized melody/accompanyment fabric is lightly textured. By contrast, the period al features a four-part harmonization of the reprised
melody with the soprano doubled in the oboe and the arpeggiato accompaniment assigned to the clarinet, bassoon, and violas in unison. The anacrustic punctuation in the strings is retained literally. The result is a juxtaposition of a homophonic choral fabric with a polarized melody/accompaniment fabric in the orchestra with a texture that is heavier and more complex than that of the arioso.

The orchestration is as discreet as that of other lyrical passages earlier in the Act (see Chapter V, Examples 92, 93, 94, p. 205, Example 96, p. 208, and Fig. 11, p. 212). The clarinet’s chalumeau register alone at first and in combination with the equally dark violas and bassoon later, enhances the melancholy mood created by the lugubrious lyrics and the minor mode of the setting. The whole tone color scheme is reinforced by the key choice, Ab minor with its seven flats, which prevents completely any open string resonance in the accompaniment (Examples 218 and 218a).

Example 218. Gilbert and Sullivan, "Finale I," HMS Pinafore, Act I, No. 12, mm. 55-72, BASSIM.
The choral reiteration of Ralph's arioso is followed by a quatrain running on to a stichomythic passage. In it Ralph, blaming Josephine for his impending death, unwittingly forces an admission of her true feelings (see Ex. 193, p. 371). This presentation of the plot's first discovery and reversal is set as one more arioso for Ralph, followed by a recitativo for the two lovers and the sympathetic chorus (Fig. 38, periods t and t₁, mm. 72-88, p. 470). The arioso represents the beginning of a rapid sequence of events. The 2+2+4 phrase structure of the previous two periods (Fig. 39, periods a and a₁, p. 471) is replaced by a 4+2 structure in the arioso (Fig. 39, period t, mm. 72-78). The scansion of the arioso's setting alternates between extreme quantitative differentiation and accentual scansion. The quantitative differentiation provides an agogic enhancement of the word "beware" while the rhythmic persistence of the accentual syllables imparts a certain sententious weight to the rest of Ralph's injunction against misdirected love. (Example 219).

Example 219. Ibid., Setting Scansion, mm. 72-78.
The melodic contour of the *arioso*’s longer first phrase reflects both the mounting agitation and the rhetorical force of Ralph’s injunction: the former is represented by the abrupt leap at the beginning of the phrase, and the latter by the following long descending line to the cadence on the tonic. The shorter second phrase is a diminution of the first. It is based on the latter’s first four pitches, and its truncated nature is a vivid representation of Ralph’s life about to be cut short (Fig. 38, mm. 77-78 and Fig. 39, contours of period t, pp. 470 and 471, respectively).

The harmonic delineation of the *arioso*’s first phrase is rather conventional: a progression embellished at the beginning by a borrowed chord ends on a full cadence on the tonic. This potentially strong progression, $V/IV\ II_{2}\ VI_{6}\ V_{2}\ I$, is rendered static by a tonic pedal in the bass throughout the phrase (Fig. 38, mm. 72-76). By contrast, the truncated second phrase progresses to the dominant without any tonal anchoring, the strong $V_{5}/IV\ IV\ V$ progression providing an apposite harmonic background for Ralph’s determination (Fig. 38, mm. 77-78).

However, the most agitated element of the *arioso* is its dibrachic accompaniment, which links it with Ralph's previous *arioso* (Example 204, p. 385) and
at the same time produces an ominous effect through its transformation: the first dibrach is supported by affectively neutral multiples of the metric continuum (Example 220), whereas the second occurs over a tonic pedal in the low register of the cellos with a first-beat reinforcement in basses pizzicato (Example 220a).

Example 220. Ibid., mm. 19-27.

---

A certain stylistic unity produced by the alternation of accentual and quantitative scansion in both instances above, as well as by the described dibrach, ought to be perceived also as a function of consistent characterization along with the dibrach.
A function of stylistic and characterizational unity may be ascribed to the metric and rhythmic kinship between the arpeggiato accompaniment of Ralph's arioso with chorus with its metric continuum figures (Example 218, p. 399) and the dibrachic accompaniments described in Examples 220 and 220a. Similarly, the last dibrachic figure (Example 220a) anticipates the brief tremolo in the strings that represents the action's precipitation towards the discovery and reversal (Example 221).

Example 221. Ibid., mm. 78-79.

\[ \text{\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{example221.png}
\caption{Example 221. Ibid., mm. 78-79.}
\end{figure} } \]

Having reached the dominant chord at the end of what are presumably Ralph's last words the harmony remains there until the last five measures of the stichomythic recitativo (Fig. 38, period t', m. 78 and period t1, mm. 79-83, p. 470). The dominant function of the Eb-major tonal level is confirmed by the addition of a seventh to the chord (Fig. 38, m. 81) and confirmed in the last five measures (Fig. 38, mm. 84-88) by a progression that moves through several borrowed chords over a dominant pedal in the bass: \( V \ II_2^{\text{VII}} \ VII_2^{\text{VII}} \ V \ VII_5^{\text{II}} \ V_7 \)
The described progression's last chord resolves through a full cadence into the Ab major of the next discrete section of the Finale I (Fig. 40, m. 89, p. 472).

The static harmonies that predominate in the period t1 (Fig. 38, mm. 79-88, p. 470) allow the unimpeded perception of the stichomythic recitativo presenting the discovery of Josephine's love. The declamatory character of the recitativo in combination with the static harmonies put a momentary halt to the hitherto steady flow of more or less discrete forms of in quadruple meter representing the plot's development. This procedural hiat's reflects appropriately the astonishment of the entire assembly at Josephine's revelation. The progression in the last five measures of the recitativo enhances the choral reassurances directed at Ralph and signals the end of the collective astonishment represented by the totally static harmonies at the beginning of the transitory period t1 (Fig. 38, mm. 79-82).

The recitativo in the above mentioned period is discreetly accompanied by strings. It features two reiterated rhythmic patterns and a closing augmentation of the first pattern that coincides with the resumption of harmonic activity. This augmentation adds rhetorical weight to the last choral reassurance of Ralph which is obviously effective (Example 222).
Example 222. Ibid., mm. 79-88.
Quartet: Rejoicing in the Soprano, Alto, and Tenor; Disgruntled Foreboding in the Bass.

Josephine's revelation is followed by the lover's rejoicing in their newfound love. They are joined in this by Cousin Hebe, a pretty and clever relative of Sir Joseph. Her sympathy towards the lovers' cause is a subtle foreshadowing of her eventual marriage to Sir Joseph (Fig. 99, p. 796). These sentiments are expressed in a ten-line stanza of iambic feet with a rhyming and metric scheme aabb_4c_3ddee_4c_3 (Example 223).

Example 223. Gilbert, "Ensemble," HMS Pinafore, p. 119

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{Oh joy, oh rapture unforeseen} & \quad a_4 \\
\text{For now the sky is all serene;} & \quad a_4 \\
\text{The god of day - the orb of love -} & \quad b_4 \\
\text{Has hung his ensign high above,} & \quad b_4 \\
\text{The sky is all ablaze} & \quad c_3 \\
\text{With wooing words and loving song,} & \quad d_4 \\
\text{We'll chase the lagging hours along,} & \quad d_4 \\
\text{And if I (we) find the maiden coy,} & \quad e_4 \\
\text{I (we) 'll murmur forth decorous joy} & \quad e_4 \\
\text{In dreamy roundelay's!} & \quad c_3
\end{align*}
\]

The faintly neo-classical imagery of the text, deifying the sun and symbolizing love through its light, contrasts with the preceding text in the Finale I, which, in spite of some purple patches about breaking hearts, is
rather forthright (Examples 188 through 193, pp. 366 through 371). The structure of the ten-line stanza is somewhat reminiscent of a rondeau because of the recurrent trimetric line with its c rhyme. The first trimeter delineates the tetrametric couplets, and the second trimeter provides a closural element for the entire stanza. Gilbert seems to indicate a deliberate imitation of the rondeau genre by ending the stanza with the words "We'll murmur forth . . . in dreamy roundelays", roundelays being a general term for rondeaus, rondels, roundels, and similar stanzaic forms.

This particular stanza differs from the typical rondeau by featuring four couplet rhymes instead of the traditional two, one line in the refrain instead of the self-contained couplet of the rondeau's rentrement, a mere rhyming and metric similarity instead of the rentrement's literal return, and ten lines instead of the customary fourteen. Gilbert's variant of a traditional form seems to be, not unlike Sullivan's treatment of the corresponding aspects of music, a miniaturization and a reduction to the most recognizable essential features. In Sullivan, this may be exemplified by the consistent modification in the recapitulation of the miniature ABA'
form-of throughout the opera: an obesance to the mainstream style of Western art music of the time. The miniaturization through reduction to essential features may be perceived as a function of scope at the discrete form-of level, and as a function of order and proportion in the largest dimension of the play's magnitude.

There is a second stanza, prosodically identical to the first, in which Dick Deadeye expresses his discontent with the recent turn of events and predicts the impending crisis (See Fig. 40, section B text, mm. 112-132, p. 472). The musical setting of the ensemble ends on a recapitulative section whose text is fashioned out of the first five lines of the first stanza and out of assorted excerpts of the second stanza (Fig. 41, passim, p. 473).

The first rondeau-like stanza is set so that the fifth and tenth lines which function as the ren- trement of a conventional rondeau coincide with a half-cadence on the dominant (Fig. 40, period a, mm. 98-99, p. 472) and with a full cadence on the tonic (Fig. 40, period b, mm. 111-112), respectively. This thoroughly conventional tonal plan underscores the stanzaic unity of the aabb_4cc_3dde_4c_3 stanza. The treatment of the setting is overwhelmingly syllabic with only one fioritura marking the end of the stanza's setting in framing fashion.
(Fig. 40, p. 472, per. b, mm. 108-9). The scansion shifts between accentual and quantitative: the period a, which sets the opening stanza's first five lines, features an accentual scansion with quantitative elements on the beginning of each half-phrase and on the resolving part of the period's closing half-cadence (Example 224).


The period b, which sets the remaining five lines of the first stanza, places the quantitative elements in the second half of the first two half-phrases, reversing the initial rhythmic motive from $\text{ quantitative }$ to $\text{ accentual }$.

This procedure delineates agogically the pertinent half-phrases in the same manner as that in the period a, and also places an agogic stress on the highest note of their arch-like melodic contours (Example 225).

Example 225., Ibid., mm. 99-103
The remainder of the period features a quantitative setting that first triples the incidence of the dotted pattern within the half-phrases and then greatly expands the adjective "dreamy" before cadencing on a less expanded and spondaically treated "roundelay" (Example 225).

Example 226. Ibid., mm. 103-112.

The setting of the second stanza (Fig. 40, sec. B, periods b and c, mm. 112-132, p. 472) is totally syllabic and predominantly accentual. Quantitative elements appear as anacrustic structures and agogic enhancements of both textual and cadential elements in the period c, and as agogic textual enhancements in the period d (Example 227).

Example 227. Ibid., mm. 112-132.
The modified recapitulation (Fig. 41, sect. A1, mm. 132-152, p. 473) features the scansion of the expository fragments it repeats plus a parlando of Dick Deadeye that is accentual in itself, but bears a quantitative relation to the longer syllabic values in the three upper voices. (Example 228).

Example 228. Ibid., mm. 132-152.

The phrase structure of the piece presents a conventional four-measure pattern with significant deviations at framing points. The deviations consist of half-phrase additions at half-cadences and full phrase additions at full cadences that occur at the respective ends of periods and sections. Another feature of variety that balances out the inherent monotony of the four-measure phrase structure is the procedural diversity in the delineation of phrases and half-phrases.
The phrase structure of the period a (Fig. 40, mm. 89-112, p. 472) consists of a 4+4+2 measure aggregate (Fig. 42, 1st and 2nd phrases, p. 474). The first of these phrases is composed of two half-phrases that are delineated by rhythmic pattern recurrence and melodic sequence over a static harmonic underpinning on the tonic chord relieved by an appoggiatura to its second inversion (Fig. 40, mm. 89-93 and Fig. 42, 1st phrase). The second phrase's two halves are identical in every respect, which contrasts with the combination of recurrence and variation of the preceding phrase. The harmonies of the second phrase are slightly more active than those in the first as they alternate between dominant and tonic. An interesting element of unity in the harmony and melody of both phrases is the appoggiatura occurring on the second beat of the first measure in each half-phrase (Fig. 40, mm. 90, 92, 94, 96). Actually, its unifying function extends beyond melody and harmony, since it marks the boundary between accentual and quantitative scansion in the setting of the two initial couplets of the text. The two-measure phrase extension (Fig. 40, mm. 97-99 and Fig. 42, 2nd phrase, 3rd line) contrasts with the preceding half-phrases by a greater melodic excursion, a half-measure shift of the dotted-pattern quantitative syllables, and a harmonic digression with a dominant half-cadence.
The half-cadence on the dominant that ends the period a is conventional to the point of triteness when taken by itself. However, viewed in terms of the stanza it sets, its utter simplicity acquires an elegance bordering on irreplaceability. The rondeau variant of the text (Example 223, p. 406) consists of two couplets followed by a unrhymed line describing the joyous present and of two more couplets of contrasting rhymes to the first set to describe the equally joyous future. Closure is provided by an additional line rhyming with the hitherto unrhymed delineator. Digressing to any tonal level other than the dominant may have been interesting and beautiful, particularly in the hands of Sullivan, but would not have provided the setting with a powerful element of stanzaic unity. Seeing that the stanza aabbc ddeec is easily broken into two cinquains, its recurrent rhyme notwithstanding, any tonal plan not setting the rentrements line first in the dominant and later in the tonic (Fig. 40, mm. 108-112, p. 472) would have a divergent stanzaic effect on the large stanza. As it is, the dominant-tonic relationship between the setting of the rentrements lines (Fig. 40, mm. 97-99 and 108-112, respectively) has a convergent effect that matches the prosody and semantics of the text in a perfect, if thoroughly conventional, way.

Having arrived at the dominant level at the cadence ending the period a, the harmonies remain there in the following phrase, which anchors a dominant-tonic chord alternation by a dominant pedal in the bass (Fig. 40, period b, mm. 99-103, p. 472). This phrase is the first of the three-phrase aggregate that constitutes the piece's second period b. Its static harmonies force one to look elsewhere for phrase and half-phrase delineation: the arch-like melodic contour and the dotted rhythmic pattern delineate the half-phrase, and their literal reiteration delineates the phrase (Fig. 42, 3rd phrase, p. 474). At this point it is possible to begin perceiving the dotted pattern which arises from quantitative scansion as an element of both unity and variety. This pattern's recurrence is a function of unity; its metric shift within the half-phrase culminating in its multiplication within it (Fig. 42, 4th phrase) is a function of variety (Fig. 42, dotted pattern shift indicated by vertical solid lines, passim). The two identical half-phrases are contained within a four-measure phrase.

The second phrase of the period b is also a four-measure one, but its harmonies and its half-phrase relationship contrast with the corresponding elements of the first phrase. The harmonies of the second phrase begin on the tonic chord, marking simply but effectively the end
of the preceding phrase with its dominant pedal. The tonic chord is followed by the most active and digressive harmonies of the first section: The harmonies of the second half-phrase form a freely treated sequence to the harmonies of the first phrase: $V_r I_{app} \overline{V_n} d \overline{V_n} \overline{I}$ followed by $\overline{V_N} \overline{\overline{V}}_{app} \overline{\overline{V}}_{nn} \overline{\overline{V}}_{n} \overline{\overline{V}}_n$ (Fig. 40, period b, mm. 103-105 and 105-107, p. 472). The melodic surface of these harmonies is a chromatic sequence and a literal restatement of the rhythmic pattern (Fig. 42, 4th phrase, p. 474). These active harmonies in an ascending sequence delineate the half-phrases very strongly and progress equally strongly to dominant. A half-cadence effect, similar to that which ends the first period (Fig. 40, mm. 98-99), is avoided with pithy elegance through the simple expedient of placing the half-cadence's resolution in a weak metric position (Fig. 40, m. 107).

The melodic surface of the above mentioned resolution is, in effect, an anacrusis to the next phrase. This phrase, a third full phrase in contrast to the half-phrase extension of the preceding period, is a progression ending on a full tonic cadence. Its five-measure length with a 2+3 measure structure emphasizes through contrast and scope the closural weight of the cadence that ends it and the section A. The contrast arises chiefly from the melodic characteristics of the phrase, which abandon the hitherto prevalent pattern recurrence in the delineation
of half-phrases for a irregular double arch in the melodic contouroing of the entire phrase and a complete contrast in the rhythmic structure of the subphrases thus delineated (Fig. 42, 5th phrase, p. 474). The variet introduced by the phrasing irregularity and the momentary replacement of a syllabic setting by a fioritura (see Example 226. p. 410) is balanced by the extreme familiarity of the conventional $I_6 IV_6 I_6 V_9 I$ cadential progression (Fig. 40, period b, mm. 108-112).

The text of the first stanza expresses nothing but joy, and the key of Ab major provides the conventionally appropriate major mode representative of such expression in the section A (Fig. 40, p. 472) and a parallel relationship to the Ab minor of the pre-discovery arioso and chorus (Fig. 38, p. 470) with its melancholy text. The tonal representation of the plot's development is carried further with a turn to the relative minor of the piece's main key at the Section B (Figure 40, period c, mm. 112-122) which represents in a consistently conventional manner the unsettling nature of Dick Deadeye's dire predictions. The first phrase of the period features harmonies that alternate between a melodic implication of the submediant and its fully realized dominant chord. This local tonic-dominant progression provides the harmonic outline of the first phrase's two half-phrases which are identical to each other
in every other respect as well (Fig. 40, mm. 112-114 and 114-116, respectively, p. 472). The melodic and rhythmic features of the first half-phrase are repeated literally in the second (Fig. 42, 6th phrase, p. 474). The delineation of the half-phrases in the second phrase of the period c (Fig. 40, mm. 116-120 and Fig. 42, 7th phrase) is procedurally identical to that of the penultimate phrase in the period b (Fig. 40, mm. 103-107, and Fig. 42, 4th phrase). The rhythmic patterns of both half-phrases are identical and melodically the second half-phrase is a chromatic sequence of the first. The harmonies underlying the phrase reflect the sequential treatment of the melodic surface: \( V_7/III \ V_6/VI \ V/I \ V_4/VI \) followed by \( VI_6 \ II_6/VI \ V/III \ VI_6 \) (Fig. 40, mm. 103-107, and 118-120, respectively). These harmonies are the most active in the piece: the digressive borrowed chords are not anchored this time by primary level pedals.

The imperfect closural effect of a cadence resolving to a first inversion chord is used here to extend the second phrase of the period c by another two measures. Thus, the \( VI_6 \) chord which could have ended the regular phrase had it been written in root position is used as a pivot to introduce a new tonal level: the mediant. The introduction of the mediant at this point in the section B corresponds to the half-cadence on the dominant in the
section A. However, the half-cadence that ends the latter's first period (Fig. 40, mm. 98-99. p. 472) does not produce the complete closural effect of the mediant half-cadence that ends the period c since it resolves on a minor chord. The closure produced by the mediant is literally and figuratively a half-step away from being a conventional half-close on the dominant of the main key's parallel minor, but this time Sullivan avoids the conventional and does not raise the mediant chord's third. Other elements in the two-measure extension reinforce the already powerful framing effect of the VI₆ II₆/III IV₇/III III progression: the dotted pattern present in the two preceding half-phrases is expanded to the next larger values and the melodic contour ends on a downward leap hitherto used only in the full close of the section A (Fig. 42, compare the 7th phrase extension to 5th phrase ending, p. 474).

Such a setting does not preserve the stanzaic unity of the ten-line rondeau to the extent of the previous section since the closural strength of the mediant cadence tends to emphasize the rondeau's component cinquains. However, Sullivan's departure from the tried and true is not without purpose: he does not forswear fidelity to the text, but merely switches allegiance from prosody to semantics by keeping most of Dick's unsettling remarks in the minor mode.
The period c, closed by a strong cadence on the mediant, is followed by period d (Fig. 40, period d, mm. 122-132, p. 472) whose tonal character is its predecessor's opposite: the harmonies in the period d progress from secondary dominants on the supertonic level to the dominant seventh of the main key. This open ending of the section B is a conventional indicator of the recapitulative procedure that follows (Fig. 42, section A1, mm. 132-152, p. 474).

The first phrase of the period d is delineated by two melodically, rhythmically, and harmonically identical half-phrases (Fig. 40, mm. 122-126, Fig. 42, 8th phrase). As in the first phrase of the period b (Fig. 40, 3rd phrase), the single dotted pattern of the quantitative element is shifted towards the end of the half-phrase. However, the similarity ends there: the former's melodic contour forms a regular arch over each half-phrase whereas the latter's melodic contour is an inverted arch of a considerably larger amplitude and an irregular shape biased towards a larger initial descent. This descent is a bit of tone painting in a somewhat archaic manner, reminiscent of Baroque practice in the genre (Ex. 229 and 229a, p. 420). Both the Baroque example and the representation of Dick's predictions address their literal musical rendition to the figurative meaning of their respective texts.

---


---

The first phrase of the period d also contrasts with the other phrases of the piece by being the only one whose melody features chordal motion as opposed to the formers' scalar melodic motion (fig. 42, compare 8th phrase to the rest, p. 474). The chordal motion in the first measure of the half-phrase implies a diminished seventh on the mediant or a diminished supertonic of the supertonic. This implication of the unison passage gives way to a fully harmonized diminished seventh of the supertonic in the second measure (fig. 40, mm. 122-124, p. 472). This embarrassment of diminished riches, concentrated in a single half-phrase and reiterated for emphasis reinforces the mood of apprehension created by the minor mode. Again, a conventional affective device,
used very sparingly hitherto, continues to evoke by traditional musical means what the texts states explicitly.\textsuperscript{6} The contrasting elements of this phrase in the context of the largest dimension are balanced by its adherence to the phrasing continuum of the piece through its four-measure length and its identical half-phrase delineation.

The final phrase of the period d, which completes the transition to the main key's dominant seventh, features a completely accentual setting which is the only instance of the unmodified metric continuum appearing as the sole agent of rhythmic differentiation in the piece. This is one of the many transitionary and framing attributes of the middle section's last phrase. The former quality is chiefly represented by its harmonies, progressing as described from supertonic to dominant seventh. The latter, beginning with the aforementioned accentual scansion, frame the section through procedural contrast. Thus, the melodic contours of the phrase feature an uninterrupted ascending line with sequential ornamentation, in turn framed by a single reversed dotted pattern and an abrupt octave drop: the piece's largest melodic excursion. The reversed dotted pattern, a Scotch snap, familiar also as \textit{stile lombardo}, is used here in a traditionally English

fashion. Since the 17th century's Purcell and Blow the inverted dotting has been used by English composers to render faithfully the vernacular's disyllabics with an accented but short first syllable, as the word "many" in this case. The dotted pattern returns to the accustomed long-short in the next two syllables, producing a quantitative frame in the surface rhythm that is procedurally identical to the two-measure extension on a dominant half-cadence framing the piece's first period. The similarity between these two frames is carried further by the placement of the second half-cadence on the dominant in a two-measure extension of a regular four-measure phrase. The intervening half-cadence on the mediant is also placed in a similar two-measure extension. Thus, structural unity is well served by simple procedural recurrence (Fig. 40, mm. 98-99, 121-122, and 131-132; Fig. 42, 2nd, 7th, and 9th phrases, pp. 472 and 474, resp., and Example 230).

Example 230. Gilbert and Sullivan, "Finale I," HMS Pinafore, mm. 126-132

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unison sequences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(II)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 mm. extension</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HALF CAD.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The intervallic sequences' upward drive is achieved through an alternation of descending thirds with ascending fourths. The quality of the intervals, as opposed to their kind, is not sequenced, major, minor, augmented, and diminished forms being predicated on tonal requirements and secondary leading tones. The latter are so used as to create a V/v effect in the unison passage leading to the dominant seventh. In the penultimate measure of the extension the unison gives way to a two-part harmony containing the principal resolving elements of an augmented sixth chord. The two-part texture is achieved by having the vocal line break out of the sequence a measure earlier than the strings (see Ex.-230, p. 422). The unison thus framed is a powerful expression of Dick's anger, since no harmonization or counter-element distracts the listener from the headlong rush of the brief chromatic sequences towards the phrase's highest note. This note, in turn, is ornamented by a chromatically altered upper neighbor. Since the note thus ornamented is the dominant of a major key, the flattening of its upper neighbor strongly suggests the parallel minor with the conventional affective connotations.

The return of the initial section is considerably modified: the first two phrases of the period a, with a tonal modification in the second half-phrase of the second phrase (compare Figs. 40 and 41, mm. 96 and 139, resp.,
pp. 472 and 473) are followed not by the original two-measure extension, but by the four-measure third phrase that ends the second period (compare Figs. 40, 41, mm. 98-99 with 141-145). This period, designated a1 (Fig. 41, mm. 132-145), is followed by a variant of the expository period b (Fig. 41, period b1, mm. 145-152). The variant consists of the first initial phrase, harmonized so that the original half-phrase underpinning $V_7$ app.16 is reversed to $I \, 6 \, V_4$ under the same melodic surface (comp. 4 3 7 Figs. 40, 41, mm. 99-101 and 145-146, respectively) followed by a totally new figure closing the piece in four measures. This last phrase is an acceleration of the dominant tonic cadence that underlies the preceding phrase, such an increase in the frequency and speed of a $V - I$ progression being an utterly conventional closure in the period of common musical practice under survey (Example 231, 231a).


There is a positive correlation between the cadential articulation of the piece's tonal plan and the augmentative deviations from its four-measure phrase pattern. Furthermore, the relative scope of these deviations is proportional to the closural weight of the cadence with which they coincide. Thus, the two-measure phrase extensions coincide with half-cadences, whereas the full cadences coincide with a five-measure extended phrase. The framing function of this phrase is further enhanced by its assymetrical non-reiterative half-phrase structure, the only such throughout the piece (Example 232)


SECTION A
Period a 4+4+2 Half Cadence on V
Period b 4+4+5 (2+3) Full Cadence
SECTION B
Period c 4+4+2 Half Cadence on III
Period d 4+4+2 Half Cadence on V
SECTION Al
Period al 4+4+5*(2+3) Full Cadence
* the 5 mm. phrase verbatim from period b in the exposition.

Period bl 4(2+2)+2+2(1+1)
Sectional and period designations according to Figures 40 through 43, pp. 473-475.
The consistent increase in phrase length that coincides with the harmonic cadences and enhances them in the process may be seen as a process combining recurrence and variation. The recurrence of the two-measure addition and the five-measure hyperphrase is balanced by the variant deviation of these elements from the clearly established four-measure phrasing continuum. On a smaller structural level the relationship between half-phrases shows a similar, but decidedly not identical, process of growth: the Figs. 42 and 43 (pp. 474 and 475, resp.) present a 5:11:11 ratio in the incidence of recurrence, variation, and contrast among the half-phrases of the piece.

The four-measure phrase continuum along with its additions and extensions is reinforced by the alternations of several types of sound, predicated principally on a variety of orchestral sectional layering, and in a lesser measure, on fabric and textural contrasts. The congruence of the alternation between these sound elements and the linear phrase structure is consistent and complete. The only possible exception may be perceived in the timbral delineation of the 2+3 measure sub-structure in the five-measure phrase. It is interesting to observe that this delineation of the full-cadence five-measure phrase features a piano-forte dynamic outline in the initial statement and a reverse forte-piano outline of its 2+3
measure structure in the recapitulative section, a consistent application by Sullivan of the already described device of modified recapitulation. The scored and the indicated dynamics are not totally congruent; the former tend to change with the phrases, and the latter with the sections. This is an obvious, but not always heeded, indication to allow the vocal section to control the relative dynamic level of the piece. (Examples 233, 233a, and 233b).

Example 233. Ibid., mm. 89–112, Sound Layers, Fabric/Texture, Dynamics.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section A</th>
<th>The vertical proportions represent scored volume in an arbitrary fashion.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Period</td>
<td>a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phrase</td>
<td>a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fabric</td>
<td>Mel./Accomp. + Str. Harmonic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ind.dyn.</td>
<td>p</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ord.dyn.</td>
<td>p</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>f</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A square equals 1 measure.

8. Cone, loc. cit.
Example 233a. Ibid., mm. 112-132, Idem.

Example 233b. Ibid., mm. 132-152, Idem.
The orchestration of the Quartet is spare and unobtrusively effective. The scoring is for a pair of each flutes and clarinets, an oboe and a bassoon, a pair of horns, and strings, the kind of partial Tutti that carries most of the opera's burden. The contrasting procedures in the orchestration may be exemplified as follows (Examples 234, 234a, 234b, and 234c).

Example 234. Ibid., mm. 89-95, passim.

Example 234: Ibid., mm. 112-119, passim.

Note the drastic contrast between indicated and scored dynamics.


C*larinets and violins provide a countermelody to the three-part vocal setting.*

Of particular significance and prominence is the treatment of the Alberti bass pattern in the accompaniment in the sections A and Al. Its melodic differentiation is in the order of the metric continuum's immediate submultiples. Left in this state,
the accompaniment pattern would have been affectively neutral. However, Sullivan assigns it to the strings in a double bowing, which generates a sense of urgency pressaging the impending plotting through the simple expedient of moving to the next smaller submultiple of the metric continuum (Example 235).

Example 235. Ibid., mm. 89–112 and 132–145, passim.

This perception of its affective qualities may be confirmed by the presence of this accompaniment pattern throughout the outer sections, whose text (Example 223, p. 406) expresses the joy of the reversal, and, conversely, by its absence in the middle section, whose text contains the foreshadowing of the crisis (Fig. 40, mm. 112–132, p. 472). From the standpoint of the entire Finale's structural unity, the pattern's quadrupale eight notes in an alla breve duple meter anticipate the dibrachic ostinato of the following ensemble (Fig. 44, mm. 153–165, p. 476).
Scheming in Hocket; Reassurance in Fetter; Menace in Recitativo.

The Quartet that embodies the positive reversal of the lovers' fortunes is followed by an ensemble comprised of four solo voices, Josephine, Cousin Hebe, Ralph, and the sympathetic Boatswain (SATB), and a four-part mixed chorus. (Figs. 44 and 45, pp. 476 and 477). This ensemble shares several elements with the preceding number: both have the same metric continuum \( \frac{1}{2} ! ! ! ! ! \) and its submultiple \( \frac{3}{2} ! ! ! ! ! \), eventually expanded to \( \frac{3}{2} \), and both have the same tonic, albeit not the same mode. The sharing of the metric continuum is along fairly general lines. The melodic differentiation of the continuum figure in the Quartet (Example 235, p. 431) is absent in the following ensemble, where the above mentioned figure appears as a diatonic ostinato predicated on the extremely static harmonies (Example 236).

The common tonic between the two aforementioned numbers allows for an effective modal contrast between them. Just as the Ab-minor *arioso* and chorus (Fig. 38, p. 470) is succeeded by the Ab-major Quartet (Figs. 40 and 41, pp. 472 and 473, respectively) indicating the improvement of the lovers' fortunes, the ensemble following the Quartet returns to the parallel minor to suggest a mood of stealthy scheming.

The text of the ensemble is written in iambic dimeters. The briefness of this meter is eminently suited for the stichomythic treatment which distributes the lines among the four solo voices. The stanzatic form of the text is an abcabc₂ sixain, repeated as defdef₂. This manner of rhyming in a sixain, two internally unrhymed tercets rhyming each other's corresponding lines, is unusual in Gilbert's predecessors and contemporaries. It is quite extensively used by such relatively modern poets as Yeats, Joyce, Berryman, and Dylan Thomas.⁹ The closure of the first stanza is effected by grammatical means: the entire sixain is a single sentence with an adverbial clause constituting each of the first five lines and the subject and predicate contained in the last line. The closure in the second stanza is achieved with a similar simple elegance: the first tercet contains a semantic antecedent

---

⁹ Haublein, 27.
and the second its consequent. The rhetoric and semantic structure thus matches, the stanzacic shape (Example 237).


Jos. This very night, a
Hebe. With bated breath, b (Regular prose throughout)
Ralph. And muffled oar - c
Jos. Without a light, a
Hebe. As still as death, b
Ralph. We'll steal ashore c
Jos. A clergyman d
Ralph. Shall make us one e
Boat. At half-past ten, f
Jos. And then we can - d *enjambement*
Ralph. Return, for none - e *enjambement*
Boat. Can part them then! f
All. This very night, etc.

A closural effect for the two-stanza unit is provided by the *enjambement* or run-on lines between the fourth and fifth and fifth and sixth lines of the second stanza. The complete regularity of the metrics generates a strong rhythmic drive through pattern repetition.
The through-composed setting of the vocal line is totally syllabic and totally accentual. This treatment of the metrically regular text results in a dibrachic effect, again a classical application of the pyrrhic foot, whose traditional connotation included swiftness as well as warfare. The text is repeated four times, each time in a different setting. The differences between the settings range from variation to contrast. The first setting of the complete two stanzas features a hocketing treatment of the stichomythic text and a dibrachic pattern ostinato in the string accompaniment that is a submultiple of the dibrach generated by the accentual/syllabic setting of the regular iambics. The addition of a second timbral/metric dimension to this affective device provides a very apposite background to the hocketing fragmentation of the text, in itself quite representative of plotting and scheming (Example 238).


The phrase delineation in this first setting is achieved almost exclusively through melodic contours since the harmonies are extremely static (Figure 44, section A, periods a and b, mm. 153-159 and 159-165, resp., p. 476). The two periods that form the first section of the initial setting consist of two identical phrases each, and the phrases are four-measure ones (Example 239).

Example 239. Ibid., Phrase Delineation Through Melodic Contours.

While melodic contours are the most evident indicators of shape at the phrase level, harmonies, however static, take over this function at the periodic level. Thus, the period a is actually on the tonic whereas the period b is on the dominant (Fig. 44, p. 476, periods a and b). Such a harmonic plan results in a complete textual setting that is not tonally closed
at sectional level, in turn allowing for the piece's effortless, if totally conventional, continuation.

The tonally open section A is followed by a melodically identical section Al, with an identical hocketing treatment of the vocal line and even simpler harmonies than those of its predecessor (Fig. 44, sect. Al, periods a1, b1, mm. 159-171 and 171-177, resp., p. 476). The differences between the sections A and Al consist of the submultiple dibrachic ostinato being replaced by a metric continuum-congruent pattern in both chorus and orchestra, and of substantial string and woodwind doubling of both hocket and dibrachic accompaniment (Example 240).

Example 240. Ibid., 159-177, passim.
The section A1, like the opening sect. A, ends on the main key's dominant. This time the dominant resolves into the major tonic, as if the initial apprehension of the plotters had dissipated with the repeated verbalization of their daring plan (Fig. 45, mm. 177-178, p. 447). The section thus introduced contrasts drastically with its predecessors: the meter changes from 2/2 to 3/2, and the metric continuum, hitherto emphasized by melody and accompaniment alike, is rather obscured by the patter-like halving of the syllabic values (Fig. 45, mm. 177-187). This is the first instance of the famous Gilbert and Sullivan patter, and as first appearances go, it is extremely carefully prepared: the text has been presented twice before the actual patter in a much slower, and hence intelligible, tempo. It is also the only choral application of the patter technique adopted and judiciously adapted through scope reduction from Rossini's Italian operas.11

However contrasting at first glance, the hocket (Fig. 44, p. 476) and the patter (Fig. 45) sections are thematically related. The beginning motive of the latter is a diminution of the corresponding element in the former, and the first half of the diminution is a retrograde of the original (Example 241).

11. Francis Toye, Rossini (New York: Norton, 1963), 244.
Example 241. Ibid., Thematic Relationship, mm. 153-154 and 177-178, respectively.

The timbral complexity, and orchestrated volume, which show a significant increase from section A to section A1, increase again in the section A2, and again in the closing section A3, which then closes with a sudden decrease in volume and timbral complexity (Example 242).

Example 242. Ibid., mm. 153-195, passim.
It is interesting to note the variety of treatment in the choral patter section A3 (Fig. 45, mm. 177–187, p. 477): The patter appears first as a single vocal line in the sopranos (Example 242c) and then assigned to the entire SATB ensemble in four-part homophony (Example 242d). The total effect of the steady increase in volume and speed is in the manner of Rossinian crescendo, scaled down to the modest proportions of a Savoy opera's two forty-five minute acts.

The effect of the Rossinian crescendo is reinforced by the melodic contouring procedure which at first outlines phrases (Fig. 45, sections A and A1, p. 477) and then, at the change of meter, begins to outline half-phrases, and continues to do this till the end of the ensemble (Fig. 45, sections A2 and A3). The harmonies of the piece are among the opera's most static, being generally limited to two principal chords per phrase in the section A, and only one chord per period in the section A1, with a local dominant ornamenting the single chord in the period B1. The section A2 is less static than A1 but more so than A with one chord per phrase. Furthermore, it is anchored on the tonic by a pedal in the bass. As if responding to the ongoing increase in volume and speed, the harmonies become active, albeit belatedly, in the period
a3 of the section A3. However, this sudden activity at
the harmonic level is quite balanced by the least active
melodic contour of the piece (Fig. 45, phr. 12, p. 477).

The orchestration of the ensemble, scored for
the same Woodwinds, Horns, and Strings combination as
the preceding Quartet, retains the unobstrusive quality
that has characterized it so far (Example 242, p. 439).
The only instances of relatively unmixed instrumental
colors occur in the initial submultiple dibrachic pat-
tern (Example 242a) and in the closing instrumental post-
lude (Example 242d). Thus, a certain amount of procedural
framing is provided to a piece whose principal element of
growth is variation with a consequent non-recurrent in-
ternal organization (Fig. 46, Recurrence, Variation, and
Contrast Patterns, p. 478).

Another factor which balances the cumulative
drive of the non-recurrent structure is the predominantly
regular measure/phrase structure, which manages to main-
tain the same amount of pulses in the phrase despite a
meter change between the sections A1 and A2 (Fig. 46,
phrases 8, 9). The only deviations from the phrasing con-
tinuum occur at full cadential points as two-measure ex-
tensions of a conventional phrase (Fig. 46, extensions
I and II).
The ensemble closes on a soft orchestral postlude (Fig. 45, period a4, mm. 190-195, p. 477). The dynamic and tone color contrast between this postlude and the preceding Grand Tutti with chorus creates a certain lull which provides negative enhancement to the forthcoming recitativo (Example 243).

Example 243. Ibid., Closing Period, mm. 190-195, passim.

The recitativo thus preceded consists of Dick Deadeye's gloomy injunction against the lovers' plans, rude reminder of the social differences between them, and the assembly's predictably angry reaction to these grumblings. Dick's remarks are contained within two couplets of iambic pentameter. This stanzaic form, known in English literature as the heroic couplet, adds a certain awesome quality to the foreboding text through generic association. The ladies and crew answer Dick in two trimeters with a spondee and an amphibrachys. These metrics and repeated text create a sense of angry

---

12. Haublein, 22.
impatience. The spondee that begins both lines of the trimetrical couplet adds prosodic weight and affective emphasis to the crew’s riposte through its double stress (Example 244).

Example 244. Gilbert, "Finale I," HMS Pinafore, Act I, 120.

Dick. Forbear, nor carry out the scheme you planned;
She is a lady - you a foremost hand!
Remember, she’s your gallant captain’s daughter,
And you the meanest slave that crawls the water!

All. Back, vermin, back, nor mock us!
Back, vermin, back, you shock us! (\textit{ud}).

Dick’s mounting anger at what he considers to be a gross breach of the existing order is well portrayed by the progressive introduction of large melodic excursions at the phrase frames of the recitativo. These phrase frames contrast effectively with the very beginning of the recitativo and its descending chromatic melody. The setting alternates between two dimensions of accentual scansion in Dick’s lines and a combination of quantitative and accentual scansion in the choral riposte. The quantitative relationship between the two accentual levels of duration in Dick’s lines functions as a phrase and half phrase delineator (Example 245). The accentual intercalations within the quantitative scansion of the choral riposte
frame the shortened phrases, emphasize the commanding rhetoric of the text through their relative abruptness, and are reinforced in turn by the phrases' greatest melodic excursion: a sudden drop of a fifth (Example 245a).


Example 245a. Ibid., mm. 205-209
The recitativo's harmonic plan is such that it creates a transition between the Ab major key of the middle sections and the return of the initial Eb major key. In a strictly harmonic sense, this transition is quite superfluous, since the relationship between the above mentioned keys within the largest harmonic dimension of the Finale I is that of a I IV I progression. Thus, it is necessary to look for an illustrative or enhancing function assigned to the rather digressive harmonies of the recitativo.

These harmonies, which progress enharmonically from Ab major to the mediant level of G major (Fig. 47, mm. 195-199, p. 479), generate an ambiguous tonal feeling. This ambiguity, along with the following diminished seventh chords (Fig. 47, mm. 202-203) and the wide and abrupt melodic excursions of the vocal line (Fig. 47, mm. 201, 203, 204), enhances musically the disturbing thoughts expressed in the text. Having reached the key of G major, Sullivan does not allow the major mode to remain unalloyedly so: the lowest melodic excursion of the text which occurs on the tonic note of the above mentioned key is ornamented by a flat upper neighbor, eliciting a feeling affectively akin to that of a

Neapolitan sixth with its melancholy connotations (Fig. 47, m. 204, p. 479). The harmonies of the choral riposte contain equally unsettling elements: the I V I implication of the melodic line is modified into I dVII4 I in the accompaniment (Fig. 47, mm. 205-209).

The orchestral treatment of the accompaniment is classically conventional. The string section alone reinforces and punctuates the sentiments expressed in the text. This affective enhancement is achieved by very economical means: the chromatic beginning of Deadeye's line is reinforced by a string unison but the half-phrase is framed by a sudden bifurcation into four-part harmony. The abrupt appearance of the four-part frame also enhances the concurrent chromatic modulation (Example 245, mm. 195-199, p. 444). The following phrase's command "Remember!" is enhanced by a string sforzando in four-part harmony, and sustained harmonies accompany the rest of the phrase. However, the end of the phrase is punctuated by staccato chords (Ex. 245, mm. 199-204). The choral response is also punctuated by staccato chords coincident with the quantitative first half of the phrase (Example 245a, p. 444).

A Quadrille: Disarming a Potential and Premature Apotheosis Through Deliberate Frivolity.

The soft instrumental postlude that ended the ensemble "This Very Night" (Fig. 45, period a4, and Example 243, pp. 477 and 443, respectively) created, as mentioned, a lull between the ensemble and the following recitativo (Fig. 47, p. 479). The recitativo itself with its ambiguous harmonies, non-returning formal organization, and discreet string accompaniment, furnishes a lull in a larger dimension through contrast with the dynamic and linear scope and returning or variational manner of continuation in the surrounding numbers. Just as the recitativo is enhanced negatively by a preceding lull, the return of the Eb major tonal level, a major feature of the Finale I formal organization, is enhanced by the recitativo.

The text that closes the Finale I begins with a quatrain of iambic tetrameters with an abab rhyme scheme. The stanzaic unity of the abab4 structure is tenuously preserved by the distribution of two parallel sentence clauses among the component couplets, creating a sort of run-on effect between the second line of the first couplet and the first line of the second couplet. The regularity of the quatrain's metrics is interrupted twice: a supernumerary syllable is inserted before the
penultimate iamb of the first and last lines, turning them into anapaests, and before the first iamb of the last line providing the latter with an anacrusis (Example 246).

Example 246. Gilbert, "Finale I," HMS Pinafore, 120.

All. Let's give three cheers for the sailor's bride

Who casts all thought of rank aside -

Who gives up home and fortune too

For the honest love of a sailor true!

The quatrain is followed by a partial reprise of the Glee's text (Fig. 31 and 32, Chapter IX, pp. 360 and 361, respectively, and Example 246a). The reprise of the Glee's text is dramatically justified, since it celebrates an action prompted by the very same demagoguery embodied in the first appearance of the Glee. It is interesting to note that Gilbert's reprise of lyrics is not literal but modified in the manner of Sullivan's modified recapitulations. The beginning of the reprise is, as before (Example 172, Chapter IX, p. 333), a modification of the ballad stanza with its alternation of tetra- and trimetric lines, in that order. The text is that of the originally initial four lines. This balladic quatrain is followed by the two couplets that close the original Glee. These two closing couplets of tetrametric iambs
with their strong-stress closure are strongly reminiscent of the mock-heroic hudibrastic verse, which, introduced first by Samuel Butler (1612-1680) in his satiric poem Hudibras, consists of iambic tetrameter couplets with doggerel-like irregularities. In this case, the irregularities may be found in the strong-stress area with its random number of unstressed syllables. The semantic aspect of Gilbert’s couplets is hudibrastic par excellence, as it continues to characterize the British sailor as a miles (or rather nautes) gloriosus (Example 246a).

Example 246a. Ibid.

```
\[
\text{\small For a British tar is a soaring soul}
\text{As free as a mountain bird!}
\text{His energetic fist should be ready to resist}
\text{A dictatorial word!}
\text{His foot should stamp and his throat should growl,}
\text{His hair should twirl and his face should scowl,}
\text{His eyes should flash and his breast protrude,}
\text{And this should be his customary attitude}
\]
```

GENERAL DANCE

ENQ OF ACT I

Whether in pure octosyllabic form or altered by metric irregularities, the iambic tetrameter dominates the metric structure of the Finale I text. It appears in various prosodic functions: as a component of independent and subordinate couplets (Example 188, last two lines of Example 244, and Examples 246 and 246a, pp. 366, 443, 448, and 449, resp.) and as a component of quatrains (Examples 190, 191, and 223, pp. 368, 369, and 406). Aside from the satiric connotation through association with the hudibrastic genre, the pervasiveness of the iambic tetrameter unifies the text of the Finale I with its many discrete stanzaic forms on a purely prosodic level. Along with the semantic aspect of the Finale's text, which obviously is a function of plot development, the above mentioned prosodic unity delineates a discrete structure in the text whose scope is intermediate between a single discrete poem, delineated semantically and stanzaically, and an entire first act, delineated by plot progression from exposition to climax.

The recitative ends on the tonic note of G major and this note becomes the common tone in an abrupt modulation to Eb-major. The device became a rather overworked mannerism in other Savoy operas. However, at this point it provides a return to Eb major that combines the modicum

of unity present in a tonic/flat-submediant relationship with the tonal contrast needed to underscore the change of mood in the text (Fig. 47, m. 208; Fig. 48, m. 210, pp. 479 and 480, respectively).

The return of the tonality on which the Finale I started is actually the only recurrent feature of any considerable scope. The 6/8 meter of the tonal return is the first compound meter of the opera used in any length beside the triple compound Barcarolle (Fig. 20, Chapter VIII, p. 310). The duple compound meter and the dactylic implications of its \( \frac{\text{p}\text{.p\text{.p}}}{\text{p}} \) rhythmic pattern are the result of a quantitative setting based on an iambic text and its metric irregularities, respectively. The jig-like setting is preceded by an orchestral introduction motivically related to the first phrase of the setting and to the second refrain theme (Examples 247, 247a).


The obvious similarity between the setting of the laudatory quatrain (Examples 246, 247, pp. 448 and 451, respectively) and the halyard shanty (Example 247a) is a function of continuous characterization (Examples 46, 46a, 46b, Chapter VI, Examples 68, 68a, 68b, Chpts. III, IV, pp. 131 and 162, resp.) The quatrain's text is set once without repetitions in a predominantly syllabic setting with neumatic elements being recurrences of the dotted dactylic pattern generated by metrically irregular supernumerary syllables (Example 247, p. 451). This quatrain and the preceding instrumental introduction (Fig. 48, per. a-1, a, mm. 210-217, 217-225, p. 480). are on the tonic level of Eb major and their simple harmonies are rendered even more static by a tonic pedal in the bass that predominates throughout these periods. Having set a quatrain with a distinctively independent melody, Sullivan was momentarily left without a text for a refrain because of the following text's reprised nature (Example 246a, p. 449). Rather than leaving a new musical idea
of well defined shape formally undeveloped, which would have been quite inconsistent with previous procedure in the Finale I (see Fig. 36, 38, 40 and 41, 44 and 45, pp. 468, 470, 472, 473, 476, and 477, respectively), he fashioned two contrasting periods following the first on the neutral syllables "tra-la" (Fig. 48, periods b and c, mm. 225-233 and 233-240, respectively, p.480). The first of these refrain periods is a bit more ambitious harmonically than a sea shanty ought to be; it progresses from the submediant level to the dominant through a relatively profuse amount of secondary dominants and a total absence of the pedal tones with which Sullivan often renders whole chord progressions into broadly delineated passing tones (Fig. 48, mm. 225-233). The second period of the refrain is as simple as any folk-music purist could wish, musette drone and all. The musette drone, represented by a tonic pedal in the bass and its fifth in a middle voice, accompanies the treble's sequential melody in the manner of a sailing ship's fufu band of improvised instruments.  

The harmonies are appropriately simple and made motionless by the double pedal (Fig. 48, mm. 233-340, p. 480). However, the motionless double pedal is balanced by a countermelody.

in the inner voices creating a distinct melodic pattern. This produces two simultaneous dimensions of growth within the period: the surface melody is reiterated with a slight variation at phrase level but sequenced at measure level, whereas the countermelody is reiterated with a similarly slight variation at phrase level only (Example 248).


Since the period c adheres strictly to the dominant level, the following reprise of the period a on the tonic needs no preparation (Fig. 48, period a reprise, mm. 240-248, p. 480). The jig-like chorus is framed by a literal reprise of its instrumental introduction (Fig. 48, period a1, mm. 248-256). The resultant form of is a combination of variation and an expanded ternary form. The almost perfect symmetry of the outline a-1 a b c a a1 is precisely that because of the double refrain: the omission of either period b or c would have resulted in a mirror-like outline. The reason for the slight assymetry may be found in the
harmonic outline of the piece based on the predominant
tonal level of each period (Example 249).


mm.: 210 217 225 233 240 248-256
period: a-1 a b c a a1
tonal level:I-------VI---V----I----------

If the harmonies outlined above are considered as a simple
progression, then the outline I VI V I appears to be con-
siderably better articulated and hence aesthetically more
satisfying than the rudimentary I V I or I VI I. Thus,
the lopsided arch of a-1 a-b c a a1 outline.

The phrasing pattern adheres totally to the
four-measure phrase continuum, the phrases being delineated
both harmonically and through melodic contouring (Fig.
49, p. 481).

The fabric of the 6/8 *Allègre con Brio* is pre-
dominantly four-part homophonic, the only exception being
the period c which features a melody/accompaniment fabric.
The texture, heavy and complex in the periods a-1, a and
their reprises, is considerably lightened and simplified
in the period b, with the period c constituting an inter-
mediate level of complexity and weight between the former
and the heavier periods a and a-1 (Example 250).
The orchestration in this case may be seen as a function of texture and dynamics: the periods a and a-I and their reprises feature a Grand Tutti scoring: pairs of each flutes and clarinets, oboe, bassoon, pairs of each horns, cornets, trombones, bass drum and cymbals, and strings, doubling the four-part mixed chorus. The same chorus is doubled only by the woodwinds in the period b, and in the period c the flute, oboe, and clarinet double the soprano melody in octaves while the strings, horns, and bassoon sustain the chordal and drone accompaniment. The fabric and texture distribution with the resultant dynamic levels may be outlined as an ABB'A pattern, with B and B' representing the periods b and c.
The 6/8 jig-like Finale I segment is followed by an alla breve duple Vivace that is a modified reprise of the closing hornpipe in the Glee (Fig. 32, Chapter IX, p. 361). Its text, as described earlier (Example 246a, p. 449) is hudiibrastic mock-heroic verse, and therefore it is well illustrated by the reiteration of such previously introduced elements of nautes gloriosi characterization as the amphimacric hornpipe ending (Example 251), the dibrachic accompaniment congruent with the metric continuum (Example 252), and the melodic ostinato within a dibrachic continuum associated with Sir Joseph (Example 253).

Example 251. Ibid., mm. 278-280.

(see Ex. 174, p. 334)

Example 252. Ibid., mm. 272-345, passim.

(see Ex. 178, p. 349)

Example 253. Ibid., mm. 321-324.

(see Ex. 165, p. 320)
The reprise of the hornpipe begins with a negative variant of the original theme; the former features a chordal melodic structure with scalar elements relegated to the function of passing tones, whereas the latter is completely scalar with a sequential melodic structure. The alternation of quantitative and accentual scansion that accounts syllabically for metric irregularities in the original is interspersed with neumatic elements coincident with the passing tones in the variant. This opening negative variant is tonally open, beginning on the tonic and ending on a dominant half-cadence. The dominant level thus introduced is prolonged through the introduction of another negative variant, designated as such solely on the basis of its firm dominant character. The contrast between the syllabic and neumatic settings in the respective variants acquires characterizing relief through the assignment of the neumatic elements to the sopranos and altos in unison, and the syllabic ones to the tenors and basses in the following phrase. Such a characterizing procedure echoes the first juxtaposition of sailors and ladies (Quodlibet, Act I, No. 7, Figs. 21 and 22, passim, Chapter VIII, pp. 311-312) in which the neumatic treatment of the melody adds a certain conventional grace to the female chorus and the syllabic treatment enhances the dibrachic element in the male voices (Fig. 50, periods-hyperphrases a-1, a-1, p. 482).
The orchestration of the accompaniment is lightly textured, leaving no doubt as to the nature of the melody/accompaniment fabric. There are, however, some significant differences in the rhythmic and dynamic features of the respective variants' accompaniments that produce both a crescendo effect through sectional addition and an accelerando effect through the increased incidence of continuum-congruent elements (Examples 254 and 254a).

Example 254. Ibid., mm. 256-272, passim

Example 254a. Ibid., mm. 272-280, passim
The harmonies of both variants are static, with an increase in harmonic activity immediately preceding a cadence, in this case the two half cadences that end the respective variants (Fig. 50, mm. 269-272 and 278-280). The phrases are regularly composed of four hypermeasures, the variant a-2 consisting of two such hyperphrases, the first delineated by a melodic cadence, the second by a harmonic half-cadence on the dominant as well. The variant a-1 consists of only one hyperphrase, and therefore creates an accelerating effect that enhances its dibrachic pattern through an assymetrical phrase ratio 2:1 between the two variants. This 2:1 phrase ratio is reinforced by the half-cadence that ends the second negative variant, framing it in the same manner as a similar half-cadence frames its longer predecessor. A framing element that delineates the entire two-variant unit is the melodic pattern of the last half-cadence: its hornpipe/amphimacric character provides a more recognizable and better defined closure than any cognate melodic element in the preceding three phrases (Fig. 52, p. 484).

Instead of a second phrase in the variant a-1 there is a brief cadential extension (Fig. 52, p. 484) that converts the dominant resolution of the previous cadence into a dominant seventh of the main key, Eb major since the beginning of the 6/8 jig (Fig. 48, p. 480). The addition of several instruments to the little extension
creates an orchestrated crescendo that, along with the dominant seventh harmonies, introduces the Grand Tutti Coda which closes the Act I.

The Grand Tutti Coda, scored for full ensemble, pairs of flutes, clarinets, oboe, bassoon, pairs of horns, cornets, and trombones, bass drum and cymbal, four-part chorus, SATB quartet of soli, and strings, begins with a single hyperphrase reiteration of the original hornpipe (Fig. 51, mm. 282-290). Following its hornpipe/amphimacric ending, there appear a series of cadential extensions whose principal characteristic is the amphimacric ending $\frac{3}{4}$ with its octave drop in the bass (Fig. 51, solid and dotted brackets, p. 483). The extreme motivic fragmentation of the cadential extensions is enhanced by aocket-like treatment dividing them between the quartet of solo voices and the chorus (Example 255) and balanced by the long cadential expansions that follow every two-fold appearance of theocket-like figure.

Example 255. Ibid., mm. 290-312, passim.
Theocket-like figure also features an interesting contrast between the syllabic treatment of the text in the chorus and the neumatic figures of the solo voices (Example 255, above), the syllabic treatment enhancing the cadential character of the amphimacric figure.

Motivic fragmentation notwithstanding, the phrasing continuum remains hypermetric, with the first hyperphrase delineated by a full harmonic cadence and a hornpipe/amphimacer in the melodic line (Fig. 53, 1st hyperphrase, p. 485), the second hyperphrase delineated by a cadential expansion ending on a full cadence (Fig. 53, 2nd hyperphrase), and the third phrase delineated through both a harmonic digression on the Neapolitan of the supertonic ending on a full cadence and an augmentation from the continuum's four hypermeasures to six hypermeasures (Fig. 53, 3rd hyperphrase; Fig. 51, mm. 305-312, p. 483). The closural strength of the harmonic digression progressing to the full cadence imparts a certain discrete character to the fragmentary section a1 (Fig. 51, mm. 290-312, p. 483), and therefore the return of a slightly modified hornpipe (Fig. 51, hyperphrase a2, mm. 313-319, incl. repeat) has a rounding-off, recapitulative effect on the piece. This recapitulation, however minute, calls for a closural section of its own, duly represented by a reprise of Sir Joseph's *ostinato* (Fig. 51, mm. 319-329) which ends the vocal setting. However, the libretto
calls for a general dance (Example 246a, p. 449), and consequently Sullivan reiterates, this time in the orchestra only, the modified recapitulation just ended as a2 (Fig. 51, hyperphrase a3, mm. 330-345, p. 483). Since this extra recapitulation seems to need a coda of its own as well, a brief fanfare-like figure in the orchestra is provided, closing through its repetitive simplicity the Finale I (Example 256).

Example 256. Ibid., mm. 346-350.

The orchestration of this closing section of the Finale I is massive, featuring sectional doubling appropriate to the fabric that is predominantly four-part homophonic with rudimentary ornamental differentiation on the melodic surface and occasional linear juxtapositions of sectional timbres (Examples 257 and 257a). The juxtaposition of timbres is a function of both the hocketing procedure and the alternation of chorus and orchestra on complete textual lines.
Example 257. Ibid., mm. 282-312, passim.

Example 257a., Ibid., mm. 313-319, passim.
Considered all together, the closing hornpipe reprise and the preceding two negative variations may be outlined as follows


mm.: 256 272 282 290 312 329
per./hyperphr.: a-2 a-1 a a1 a2 a3 FRAME
tonal level: I---V----7 I ⅔---I-N6-I----------I

\[ \text{N6/} \]
\[ \text{V7/N6/} \]
\[ \text{V7} \]
\[ \text{ImT 6 I6 V7} \]
\[ 4 1 \]

*detailed harmonies in Tables 22 and 22a.

The predominant procedure of growth in the closing segment of the Finale I at motivic fragment level is contrast, followed by variation, and reiteration. The ratio in the frequency of appearance of these procedures is 13:10:10 in the order given above (Figs. 52 and 53, respectively, pp. 484 and 485). The periodic/hyperphrase structure a-2 a-1 a a1 a2 a3 points out, obviously, to a variation form.
The relationship between the last two segments of the Finale I (Fig. 50 and 51, pp. 482 and 483, resp.) may be perceived as much more sophisticated than the sharing of a common key. The 6/8 jig followed by the 2/2 hornpipe bear a close resemblance to the Quadrille, a mid-19th century popular dance of Parisian origin, whose music, borrowed from current favorites in all genres, alternated between 6/8 and 2/4. However speculative, the notion that Sullivan closed his first act with a quadrille rather than with a apotheotic celebration of the new-found love may be supported by Gilbert's request for a general dance (Example 246a, p. 449) and by the dance's preempting of a premature apotheosis through its relative frivolity. At the same time, the fast tempo, sustained high volume, both orchestrated and indicated, and relentless repetition of strongly outlined rhythmic motives of the very last Vivace (Fig. 51, p. 483), closed with a vigorous cornet fanfare punctuated by Grand Tutti chords, manage to create an effect quite similar to the conventional tornado curtain of Scribe and similar 19th century melodrama playwrights. The device proper consisted of a fast curtain falling on a climactic disturbance, creating suspense out of an artificially and deliberately truncated emotional peak. Quite often, the device would be enhanced further by a

"stop-motion" tableau with an effect not unlike that of its cinematographic descendant.19 There is no such tableau in HMS Pinafore, but the fanfare stops the dance and allows through its four-fold pattern for the traditionally British "three cheers and one cheer more" to be given by the company.

Figure 36: Act I, No. 12, Finale I, mm. 1-56
Fig. 37: Act I, No. 12, Fin. I, Phrasing and Melodic Patterns, Recurrence, Variation, and Contrast
Figure 38: Act I, No. 12, Finale I, mm. 57-89
Figure 39: Act I, No. 12, Finale I, Melodic Contours, Phrasing Patterns, Recurrence Variation, and Contrast at Half-Phrase Level
Figure 40: Act I, No. 12, Finale I, mm. 89-132
Figure 41: Act I, No. 12, Finale I, mm. 132-152
Fig. 43: Act I, No. 12, Finale I, Melodic Contours, Phrasing Pattern, Recurrence, Variation, and Contrast at Half-Phrase Level
Figure 44: Act I, No. 12, Finale I, mm. 153-177
Fig. 46: Act I, No. 12, Fin. I, Melodic Contours, Phrasing and Recurrence, Variation, and Contrast Patterns at Half-Phrase Level
Figure 47: Act I, No. 12, Finale I, mm. 195-209
Figure 48: Act I, No. 12, Finale I, mm. 210-256
Fig. 49: Melodic Contours, Phrasing Pattern, Recurrence, Variation, and Contrast at Half-Phrase Level
Figure 50: Act I, No. 12, Finale I, mm. 256-282
Figure 51: Act I, No. 12, Finale I, mm. 282-350
Fig. 53: Act I, No. 12, Finale I, Melodic Contours, Phrasing and Recurrence, Variation, and Contrast Patterns
Elements of Shape in the Largest Dimension of the Finale I: Linear Scope in Music as a Function of Dramatic Magnitude.

In terms of classical plot progression, the Finale I contains those climactic actions that place it at the highest point of the rising tension caused by the complicating element acting upon the initially unsettled situation. These actions, expressed in closed stanzacic forms in the text, are coincident with discrete musical forms of in the setting.

Thus, the Finales' opening Allegretto Moderato (Fig. 36, p. 468) contains Ralph's expressions of indignation at Josephine's rejection of his love and the reassurances of the company that goad him to further action. The following Più Lento (Fig. 38, p. 470) contains Ralph's self-destructive enactment of his previous thoughts, which in turn elicit Josephine's disclosure of her true feelings, effecting the plot's first and climactic discovery and reversal. The positive reversal of the lovers' fortunes is presented in the next Allegro Vivace (Figs. 40 and 41, pp. 472 and 473, respectively) with some foreshadowing from the villain in the form of stern warnings about the rashness of the impending misalliance. These warnings fail to prevent a further complication: the entire company plans an escape and elopement (L'istesso Tempo, Figs. 44 and 45, pp. 476 and 477, respectively). A repeated warning
from Dick Deadeye (Recitativo, Fig. 47, p. 479) fails to deter the lovers and the company from carrying out their plans, and their strengthened resolution is expressed in the joyful, quasi-apotheotic, Allegro con Brio (Fig. 48, p. 480) and Vivace (Figs. 50 and 51, pp. 482 and 483, respectively) that close the Finale I and the first act in a merry quadrille of jig and hornpipe.

Beside the relatively easy to recognize affective and generic elements of characterization, such as the minor mode in the former category and the amphimacric hornpipe, the dibrach, and the jig in the latter (see Examples 251, 252, 253, and 247, pages 457 and 451, resp.) the following features are perhaps the most readily perceivable in the Finale I at first hearing: its discrete form-of-structures are thematically non-recurrent among each other; its overall tempo varies considerably from discrete segment to segment with various fast tempi predominating over the slow tempi. Its simple harmonies are overwhelmingly confined to two neighboring tonal centers with relatively little digression within them.

These perceptions may be described as functions of contrast, variation, and recurrence, in that order, and be included in a synoptic list of other procedures of growth and continuation in the Finale I (Example 259 and Fig. 54, p. 49).
**Example 259. Synoptic Presentation of RVC Factors in the Largest Dimensions.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recurrence</th>
<th>Variation</th>
<th>Contrast</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I harmonies</td>
<td>mode alternation within the IV level</td>
<td>IV harmonies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>procedural frames with negative variation</td>
<td>Tempo variation in thematically related material</td>
<td>new thematic material in discrete linear segments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>recapitulated and varied thematic material within discrete segments</td>
<td>larger linear scope of outer segments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>recurrent tempi</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>orchestrated volume</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>linear scope of discrete segments</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Ratio of Procedural Incidence in Manner of Growth:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recurrence</th>
<th>Variation</th>
<th>Contrast</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* the perceptual impact of the discrete components as a function of contrast is considerably underrepresented in this synoptic chart and resultant ratio.
The high ratio of recurrent and varied elements shown in the Example 259 balances the perceptual weight of the non-recurrent structure based on discrete segments. The organization of the recurrent, variant, and contrasting elements at the largest structural levels produce several layers of linear shape in the largest dimension (Example 260).


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Shape Determinants</th>
<th>Resultant Outlines</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Discrete forms of:</strong></td>
<td><strong>A B C x E D</strong> (chain form)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tonal Plan:</td>
<td><strong>A B A</strong> (IIVI) or <strong>A B B B B A</strong> (IIVIIVIIVI) (Ternary Form)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Tempo:**

- **A,A-1, A1, A-2, A1, A2** (positive subscripts indicate tempo faster than A; medium-fast; negative subscripts indicate tempo slower than A - numbers correspond to degrees of speed) Variation from

**Meter:**

- **A A, A B A A** (**C & C & C & C** (variation + expanded Ternary Form)

**Orchestral Volume (vertical scope):**

- **A B C C B A** (**A = ∞, B = φ, C = m** (Rondoid)

**Linear Scope:** (horizontal scope)

- **4: 3: 3: 3: 1: 2: 3** (**A B B B C A** (anything) (Rondoid) less than A; is its variant)
The most prominent element of formal cohesiveness in the Finale I setting is the harmonic plan in the largest dimension. This feature complements the prosodic unity of the text centered on the predominance of the octosyllabic line or a tetrametric equivalent described earlier (Ex. 188, 190, 191, 223, 244, 246, 246a, pp. 366, 368, 406, 443, 448, and 441, respectively). Thus, the scope of the Finale I as a composite musical number is delineated by the above mentioned and other, less obviously perceivable elements, matching the magnitude of the text and enhancing its pivotal function in terms of plot development (Fig. 55, p. 492).
Notation symbols: precipitate action → discovery/reversal → screening → final showdown, resolution and climax

Tempo

Medium Fast (A)
Slow (A-1)
Fast (A2)

Orchestrated Volume Frame
Grand Tuttis: 2 flutes, 2 clar. Bsn.
2 harps, 2 stbs, 2 bass
Strings: 1st, 2nd, 3rd, 4th
Timpani, celesta, tambourine

Cello

Ex. 1.53
1st strain
2nd strain
3rd strain
4th strain

Fig. 54: Act I, No. 12, Finale I, Shape in Largest Dimensions
The Minotaur represents the Minotaur, a major element of plot calculation.

The Magnitude (time) of the Minotaur creates a durational frame at the plot's climactic point. The unity of this frame is preserved through elements outlined in Table 2.3.

Figure 55: Act I, Framing Function of Intermediate Discrete Structures within the Act.
THE DRAMATIC FUNCTION OF POETIC AND MUSICAL FORMS IN A SAVOY OPERA PROTOTYPE
VOLUME II

DISSERTATION

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree Doctor of Philosophy in the Graduate School of The Ohio State University

By

Jaropolk Lassowsky, B.M., M.A.

**************

The Ohio State University

1981

Reading Committee:

Dr. William Poland
Dr. Gregory Proctor
Dr. A. Peter Costanza

Approved By

William Poland

Advisor
Department of Music
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>XI. ACT II: ENTR'ACTE, SONG, AND DUET:</td>
<td>493</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECAPITULATION AND FORESHADOWING...........................................</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entr'acte: Foreshadowing by</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thematic Reminiscence........................................................</td>
<td>493</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 13: The Captain's Song; a</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catalogue of Current Troubles</td>
<td>499</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in the form of a Cavatina................................................................</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 14: Duet; Portentous Platitudes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From a Woman Scorned......................................................................</td>
<td>535</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XII. No. 15: SCENA; THE NAIVE HEROINE'S PRAGMATIC SELF-DOUBTS...........</td>
<td>560</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIII. TRIO AND DUET: FINAL COMPLICATION AND BETRAYAL......................</td>
<td>621</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 16: Trio; Demagogy Hoist by its Own Patuous Petard....................</td>
<td>621</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 17: Duet; the Betrayal.......................................................</td>
<td>648</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIV. No. 18: CONCERTED PIECE; A SERIES OF PERIPETIES CULMINATES ON A FALSE REVERSAL AND A PREMATURE APOTHEOSIS....</td>
<td>667</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorus and Soli: the Elopement Attempted......................................</td>
<td>668</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorus and Soli: the Elopement Foiled and Authority Defied...............</td>
<td>677</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solo and Chorus: Boatswain and Sailors Glorify Ralph in the First Premature Apotheosis</td>
<td>699</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soli and Chorus: the Fatal Word Effects a False Reversal.................</td>
<td>712</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solo and Choruses: an Admonitory Reprise and a Second Premature Apotheosis</td>
<td>737</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XV. Nos. 19, 20, 21: OCTET, SONG, ENSEMBLE; AFTER A FINAL FALSE REVERSAL COMES THE TOPSY-TURVY EUCATASTROPHE.</td>
<td>758</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 20: Song and Chorus: Little Buttercup's Confession Effects the Denouement and the Final Reversal</td>
<td>770</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 21: Finale II; Epigrammatic Promises, Joyful Declarations, and a third Apotheosis Mark the Happy End with Reprises</td>
<td>785</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>797</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>810</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER XI

ENTRACTE, SONG, AND DUET: RECAPITULATION AND FORESHADOWING

The Entracte: Foreshadowing Through Thematic Reminiscence

Having progressed from a skillfully delayed point of attack to an open defiance by the romantic lead of prevailing social mores, paternal wishes, and navy regulations, Gilbert's plot proceeds to descend from this defiance's emotional peak to the complete release of the tension at the final denouement. This descent takes place in the play's second and final act and is impelled by a series of discoveries and reversals. The feeling of descent is enhanced by a simple expedient, apparent in the simple quantification of the acts' most obvious elements: the amount of discrete components in each act and the relative duration of both acts. Both show a shorter second act: there are sixteen discrete numbers in the first act and nine (ten, including the En'träcte) in the second. The respective durations of the two acts are in a closer ratio to each other; nevertheless, the second act is shorter. The collective musical settings of each act stand in a 3:2 ratio to each other, and the musical numbers along with the associated dialogues similarly grouped show a 2.5:1.5 ratio. Besides showing a perceptual manipulation through the proportioning of the
plot's largest linear components, both above mentioned ratios evidence the authors' careful distribution of spoken dialogue. The solely musical ratio of duration between the acts may be expressed as 9:6, whereas the total timing of speech and music shows a durational ratio of 10:6 between the two acts. The 9:6 and 10:6 figures are multiples of the previously cited 3:2 and 2.5:1.5 ratios, converted for the sake of a common proportional.1

The second act is preceded by an entracte that is an almost literal orchestral reprise of Little Buttercup's introductory aria (Fig. 9, Chapter IV, p. 169). The entracte's linear modifications consist of a four-measure introduction replacing the original eight-measure variant of the first vocal phrase and the omission of that variant closing reiteration (compare mm. 1-9 in Fig. 9 to mm. 1-4 in Fig. 56 as well as the pertinent closing sections in these tables, pp. 169 and 531, respectively).

The simple harmonies and attractive melodies of the waltz-like aria are given an unobtrusively elegant orchestral treatment that both enhances sectional contrast and provides recapitulative modification. The latter is so distinctive that the timbral linear structure of the piece is at considerable variance with the thematic outline:

whereas the original aria's timbral characteristics, small variations at the recapitulation notwithstanding, are congruent with the thematic recurrence and contrast pattern ABCA1 (see modified orchestration, Fig. 9, p. 169), the corresponding timbral elements in the reprise are presented in an uninterrupted orchestrated crescendo from the beginning to the end of the piece. This contrasts vividly with the truncated-rondo thematic outline (Fig. 56, p. 531) and produces a certain tension whose release must of necessity occur beyond the frame of the piece. Thus, the entracte functions as a second overture. It is the only such structure in the Savoy operas: all of them, except HMS Pinafore, of course, feature second act openings that either resolve into the stage number, or are part and parcel of that number as open-ended orchestral introductions. The Pinafore entracte in its thematic discreteness is musically less sophisticated than the subordinated preludes. However, the latter, while providing musical cohesiveness at a local level, are limited to that level in terms of dramatic function. By contrast, the former, though less sophisticated as a purely musical procedure, acquires a dramatic function of foreshadowing at the largest plot dimension, since its thematic material points out the agent of the final denouement.

2. Meyer, 32.
The simple harmonies and the attractive waltz-like tune of Little Buttercup's aria are transposed into the key of G major, which allows for the use of a more extended range of orchestral registers than the original C major would have: after a pizzicato introduction (Example 261) the original vocal line's first period is assigned to the first violins in their lowest register doubled by two clarinets in unison. This rather rich melodic line is accompanied by strings pizzicato and weak-beat chords in the bassoon and horns (Example 261a).

Example 261. Gilbert and Sullivan, "Entracte," HMS Pinafore, Act II, mm. 1-4

Example 261a, Ibid., mm. 5-21, passim.
The following period contrasts timbrally with its predecessor through the assignment of the melody to the flutes and oboe in octaves in an upward extension of the orchestral range hitherto used in the piece. A measure of unity is provided by the continuation of the accompaniment in the strings pizzicato, and a slight variation in the timbre of the inner voices is provided by the substitution of horns by clarinets in the weak-beat chords (Example 261b).

Example 261b. Ibid., mm. 21-37, passim.

The closing period, which recapsitulates the first period's thematic material, features an increase in volume generated by its orchestration as well as an increase in the textural complexity of the continuing melody/accompaniment fabric. The melody is assigned to the first violins doubled at the octave and at unison by two flutes.
with the unison subsequently reinforced by the initially static oboe. The accompaniment is, so to speak, multi-layered, with an eight-note arpeggiato unison in the two clarinets, an off-beat half-note chord in the pairs of cornets and trombones, off-beat quarter-notes in the second violins and violas pizzicato, metric continuum-congruent quarter-note arpeggios in the celli, over a second and third beat bass in the double basses and bassoon. The bass-drum and cymbals pianissimo emphasize the down-beat of each measure with a corresponding de-emphasis of the hypermetric nature of the piece (Example 261c).

Example 261c. Ibid., mm. 36-52, passim.
No. 13: The Captain's Song: a Catalogue of Current Troubles

in the Form of a Cavatina

The extract is immediately followed by Captain Corcoran's recapitulation of all the unsettling events that have occurred since the inception of the play. His lament is set in four alternately rhymed quatrains of iambic trimeter, with the fourth quatrain being a literal reprise of the first. The trimetric designation of the meter is rather nominal, since Gilbert varies the line structure with the introduction of many irregularities such as hypermeter resulting from feminine rhymes, and replacement of iambic by other feet, sometimes throughout an entire line. As mentioned, the text is cast in an arch-like form based on the enclosure of a stanza between two identical ones. Thus, the relative lack of sophistication in the alternately rhymed quatrains is offset by the hyperstanzaic closural characteristics of the scheme \( ABA_3B_4\) and by the stanzaic closures effected through the longer last lines of the trimetric first and second stanzas and the shorter corresponding line of the tetrametric third stanza. This reversal in the proportion between the closural line of the third stanza and the four preceding lines produces an inner framing effect, as if to announce the return of the first stanza, whose reiterative nature is symbolized in the above scheme by capitals (Example 262).

Fair moon, to thee I sing,  
Bright regent of the heavens,  
Say, why is everything  
Either at sixes or at sevens?  
I have lived hitherto  
Free from breath of slander,  
Beloved by all my crew—  
A really popular commander  
But now my kindly crew rebel,  
My daughter to a tar is partial,  
Sir Joseph storms, and, sad to tell,  
He threatens a court martial!

Fair moon (etc.)  

ABA_3B_4 (as above)

Sullivan's setting of the text is a sophisticated combination of quantitative and accentual scansion. Both component scansion are employed in a manner calculated to enhance certain semantic elements without departing too far from natural syllabic accentuation, the latter taking precedence over regular metrics. The very beginning features a quantitative, and therefore agogic, enhancement of the
initial iamb which converts it in the musical setting into a spondee. Such an agogic enhancement shows Sullivan to be more responsive in this case to the figurative aspect of the poem than to its meter: the first quatrains is an apostrophic exhortation to the moon, and the spondaic treatment of the words "Fair moon" pithily and elegantly underscores the apostrophized object. The treatment of the rest of the line may be perceived also in terms of semantic weight: the preposition "to" gets the shortest syllabic duration of the half-phrase, the indirect object "thee" and the subject "I" are durationally congruent with the $\frac{1}{4}$ metric continuum, but enhanced with neumatic passing tones that, incidentally, convert a chordal melodic outline into a scalar realization of that outline. Finally, the verb "sing" is allowed as much duration as each of the spondaic components of the initial iamb, a procedure both consistent with its semantic importance and with the simple agogic framing of a half-phrase. A similar procedure may be observed in the second half-phrase which sets the first quatrains second line: the adjective "bright," still in reference to the apostrophized moon, is enhanced agogically through extended duration. The rest of the subordinate clause contained in this line is first compressed into a brief accentual fragment which is followed by a framing extension of the stressed syllable in the line's last word.
The remaining two lines of the first stanza are set within the song's second phrase in the same combination of quantitative and accentual scansion as the first phrase, with the slight difference of a single neumatic syllable framing the half-phrase instead of the previous agogic procedure. The dactylic beginning of the quatrains' last line allows for an equally slight difference in the rhythmic pattern of the quantitative-accentual third measure of the phrase, which otherwise is identical to that in the corresponding measure of the preceding phrase. Sullivan repeats the last two lines of the first quatrains for reasons better left to the forthcoming harmonic and structural analysis. The third phrase thus obtained both reunites and varies the handling of the prosody in the preceding two (Example 263).

Example 263. Gilbert and Sullivan, "Fair Moon," HMS Pinafore, Act II, No. 13, mm. 6-17.
The metric irregularity in the text's prosody that begins the second quatrains, two anapaests replacing a line of three iambs, are set in a faithfully quantitative manner. This results in a characteristic rhythmic pattern that provides the motivic framework for a thematically contrasting section (Example 264).

Example 264. Ibid., mm. 17-18.

\[ \text{Quantitative Anapaests} \]

The remaining lines of the second quatrains are set in a manner almost identical to that of the first quatrains, with an upward octave leap enhancing the quantitative underscoring of the adverb "really" which in turn emphasizes the Captain's self-description as a "popular commander" (Example 264).

Example 264a. Ibid., mm. 23-25.

\[ \text{Quantitative contrast between different dimensions of accentual fragments} \]

An octave leap enhances the adjective "really".
The setting of the third quatrain features
the already examined combination of quantitative and ac-
ccentual scansion in its first phrase, but relies ex-
clusively on quantitative scansion in the second phrase,
elongating the weak syllable of the verb "threatens" at
the expense of the following article "a" as part of
a musical and prosodic frame completed with the familiar
agogic phrase frame (Example 265).

Example 265. Ibid., mm. 25-33, passim.

The setting of the reiterated first stanza,
contained in the modified return of the initial section,
does not differ in any fundamental scansional manner from
that initial presentation (compare Fig. 57, section A,
mm. 5-16 to Fig. 58, section A1, mm. 33-45, pp. 532
and 533, respectively. The only significant difference
in setting appears as a framing device in the largest
dimension: the vocal line ends on a coloratura that is
the largest neumatic element in the whole song (Ex. 266).
Example 266. Ibid., mm. 44-45.

The original key of the piece, as evidenced by the vocal score in several editions, Schirmer's, Chappell's, and E.F. Kalmus', is D major. Even if the baritone chooses to forgo the closing fioritura (Ex. 266 above), thereby reducing the vocal range, the tessitura may still be uncomfortably high if the baritone chosen for the part has a heavier voice than the extremely light baritone usually found in the D'Oyly Carte Company. The choice of a more substantial baritone may be a very happy one from the characterization standpoint; after all,


6. __, op. cit., performed by the D'Oyly Carte Opera Co. (London A4234).
even Verdi with his liking for a high baritone tessitura, inclusive of repeated high As, lowers these peak tones when representing fatherly figures such as Germont in *La Traviata*. The Glyndebourne Opera Festival performance recorded under Sir Malcolm Sargent, a Savoyard of note, features such a baritone and transposes the number a step down to C major. That such a singer was occasionally employed in the role by the D'Oyly Carte Opera Company in contrast to the very light baritone in the current recordings is attested by the C major key of this number in the orchestra parts which are facsimiles of parts used probably still within Sullivan's lifetime.

The piece opens with a motto-like four-measure introduction which both functions as an element of spectacle and as a negative variation of one phrase length (*Fig. 57, phrase a-1, mm. 2-5, p. 532*). The element of spectacle consists in a conventionalized ship's horn call, rather obviously assigned to the horn. The call is twofold, each appearance framed by a single string chord pizzicato.

8. __, "Di Provenza," *La Traviata*, Act II, No. 6, m. 43.
11. op. cit., orchestral material facsimile, No. 13.
The second horn figure is rhythmically identical to the first, but its melodic structure differs from the first single-pitch call by dropping down a fourth on its last note. Just as the reiteration of the rhythmic pattern provides half-phrase framing in the four-measure introductory phrase, the melodic drop at the end of the second horn figure frames the entire phrase (Example 267).

Example 267. Ibid., mm. 1-4.

The horn call cited above (Ex. 267) rather conforms to the mainstream manner of evoking things nautical in the late Classical and Romantic periods. Its melodic construction is quite similar to the Dutchman’s motive from Richard Wagner’s Flying Dutchman (1843), and both rhythmically and melodically to the horn and trumpet calls in Felix Mendelssohn’s concert overture The Hebrides (1830), a rendition of the composer’s impressions of Scotland’s Fingal’s Cave, the ebb and flow of the tide in it, and distant ship’s horns. There is an even closer resemblance
between the *Pinafore* horn call and the opening measures of Joseph Haydn's last symphony, the most famous of all the *London* symphonies and the only one to be popularly known by that name (Examples 269, 269, 270).


Example 269. Felix Mendelssohn, Overture to *The Hebrides* (London: Eulenburg), mm. 116–119.

Example 270. Joseph Haydn, Symphony in D major, No. 104, 1st movement, mm. 1, 2.
There is no explicit reason to associate the opening of this 1795 work of Haydn with things nautical. As mentioned, the sobriquet "London" belongs to all twelve of Haydn's last symphonies and indicates the origin of their commission and premieres by the Salomon Concerts. However, by Haydn's own admission, he incorporated street tunes of contemporary London into these works, particularly in the cited symphony. This was done, again by Haydn's admission, in order to compete for the public's attention against Haydn's erstwhile pupil Ignaz Pleyel (1757–1831) who began a series of his own concerts overlapping with those of his former master.\(^{12}\)

In consideration of this admitted "sounds of London" venture, it is possible to speculate that Haydn, fond of tone painting in earlier symphonies, for example the celebrated *Farewell* (1772), and later oratorios such as *The Creation* (1798) and *The Seasons* (1801),\(^{13}\) chose to open this symphony with something that reminded him of the Channel crossing: a ship's horn signal.


The periodic structure of the Captain's song reveals a form—of that may be outlined as ABCAl (see Figs. 57 and 58, capital letter periodic symbolization, pp. 532 and 533, respectively). This abbreviated or truncated rondo form contains a firmly established metric continuum, represented by its immediate submultiples in the Alberti-type accompaniment in the violins pizzicato throughout the piece (Example 271).


The regular four-measure phrase, appearing without exception throughout the piece, firmly establishes a regular four-measure phrasing continuum. Most of the phrases feature a neatly delineated half-phrase structure. This delineation is achieved predominantly by contrast in the 2+2 measures unit with the exception of the phrases in the period C. The first phrase of this period (Fig. 59, phrase c, p. 534) is differentiated through a rhythmically retrograde variation, and the second phrase of the same period has no half-phrase differentiation at all, since it avoids
deliberately any strong caesural elements (table 25b, phrase cl. p. 534). This contrast in the internal phrase structure between the period C and the other periods may be seen as part of the transitionary character of the entire period C which bridges the contrasting period B and the modified return of the initial period A (see Fig. 57, periods A and B, mm. 5-17 and 17-25, resp., p. 532, and Fig. 58, periods C and A1, mm. 25-33 and 34-45, resp., p. 533).

The lack of a caesural 2+2 structure in the second phrase of the period C (Fig. 58, mm. 29-33) is, in effect, a break in the inner phrase structure continuum described above; one that produces, as mentioned, an inner frame in the largest dimensions of the piece. Other continuum-producing elements have no interruption: the Alberti-bass accompaniment in the strings not only illustrates Gilbert's stage directions requiring that the Captain accompany himself on a mandolin, but also reminds the listener of the metric continuum by means of steadily reiterated pulse submultiples (Ex. 27;1, p. 510); the continuous four-measure phrasing pattern carries the dulce character of the metric continuum into the phrasing continuum after the briefly interrupted 2+2 half-phrase pattern. The duple phrasing pattern does not continue into the next largest linear dimension. The piece's periodic
structure of the piece is such that the outer periods A and A1 consist of three four-measure phrases each, and the inner periods B and C of two phrases of that length (Fig. 59, p. 534).

The phrase/period structure of 3+2+2+3 is a negative arch, if quantitative diminution of linear components is symbolized as a negative or inverted span. The size of the outer segments in the 3+2+2+3 structure is increased by the outer frames a-1 (Fig. 57, mm. 1-5, p. 532) and a6 (Fig. 58, mm. 45-48, p. 533). These orchestral phrases, a pre- and a postlude, respectively, are thematically related to the outer periods, and therefore the 3+2+2+3 phrase/period structure ought to be expressed by a 4(1+3)+2+2+4(3+1) formula (Example 271).

Example 272. Ibid., Negative Arch Structure Based on Thematically Grouped Phrases.
Were it not for the marked differences between the rhythmic and melodic features of the periods B and C (compare mm. 23-25 in Fig. 57 and mm. 25-29 in Fig. 58, pp. 532 and 533, respectively), the piece's form—of could be described as a miniature sonata-form, with the middle periods forming a single development section. The linear phrase/period scope structure (Example 272) would be consequently modified to read 4+4+4, representing the periods A, B+C, and A1, consisting of four phrases each. The formal functions of the periods A and A1 would be those of exposition and suitably modified Recapitulation, respectively, and the B+C aggregate would function as the Development.

The harmonic scheme of the piece is somewhat less amenable to such formal ambiguities. Whereas a traditional sonata- or cognate form would feature an expository section that is harmonically open, the period A, after arriving at a half-cadence at the end of its second phrase (Fig. 57, mm. 12-13, p. 532), is followed by an additional final phrase which ends in a full cadence on the tonic, thereby closing the period A (Fig. 57, mm. 16-17) and approximating it stylistically to the Da Capo aria whose returning section needed no modification in order to remain within the key. In a sense, the song reunites the features of a Da Capo aria and of a sonata-form: its expository or initial section's first phrase functions as a main subject on the tonic. The second
phrase, a variant of the first, may be viewed as a rudimentary second subject area, somewhat in the manner employed occasionally by Haydn in which the second subject of a sonata form would be replaced by the reiteration of the first transposed into the dominant. In this case, the putative second subject is a rhythmic and melodic variation of the first, which begins in the tonic and in the dominant.

It would seem that the return to the tonic in the third phrase of the first period would preclude any elegant continuation of the piece by its closural nature. However, such is not the case, because Sullivan, taking advantage of the common tones between the tonic triad and the mediant, begins the second period at the latter tonal level. Since the main key is a major one, the mediant level introduces the minor mode, which is affectively representative of the text: the Captain, who is a gentleman and an officer, and therefore keeps a stiff upper lip as evidenced by the quiet restraint of the song and its monotonous Alberti-bass accompaniment, is beginning to feel sorry for himself. After apostrophizing the moon in the first period, the Captain states that his conduct thus far has been blameless, and his life justly rewarding.

These protestations are not made in the smooth *cantabile* manner of the period A, but are interrupted, and therefore affectively enhanced through textural and timbral contrast, by woodwind imitations of the period's principal motive (Fig. 57, period B, mm. 17-25, p. 532). That these woodwind imitations occur a step higher than the preceding figure in the vocal line reflects handily the Captain's mounting agitation (Example 273).


After beginning in the minor mode, the period B progresses to the dominant level, returning thus to the major mode (Figure 57, mm. 22-25). Affectively, this represents the Captain's remembrance of the pleasant relationship between him and his crew that occur in the text. Functionally, this is the arrival at the tonal level that a simpler procedure would have introduced at the end the the initial period's second phrase without the tonic and mediant detours. The harmonies of the following
period C start predictably on the tonic, since the pre-
ceeding period ends on a dominant half-cadence. What is not
predictable about it is that it is the tonic minor that
the harmonies return to. Functionally, this delays the re-
capitulation. Affectively, the parallel minor of the tonic
reflects well the arrival of the text to the crux of the
matter: the Captain's enumeration of his current troubles
(Fig. 58, period C, mm. 25-33, p. 533). This section
also contains the furthest harmonic digression from the
main key in the entire piece: using the parallel minor
as a starting point, Sullivan digresses to its own mediant
in the second phrase of the period C (Fig. 58, mm. 29-33).
The return from F major to D major is simpler than getting
from the later to the former: the dominant of the parallel
minor functions as a dominant half-cadence reached for the
third time. The dominant thus reached resolves into the
main key's tonic as the piece recapitulates at the begin-
ning of the period Al (Fig. 58, mm. 33-34). It must be
added that these digressive, and, within the context of
the overall harmonic simplicity of the piece, ambiguous
harmonies, are concurrent with the piece's only deviations
from the established phrasing continuum. These deviations,
described earlier in conjunction with the piece's levels
of continua, along with the above mentioned harmonies en-
hance quite vividly the Captain's agitation and distress
presented in the text (Example 274).

The vocal line derives from the prevailing half-phrase designation

Harmonies in reference to the relative minor:

The vocal line derives from the prevailing half-phrase designation

after the preceding period's ending on the dominant seventh
(Fig. 58, mm. 32-33, p. 533). The first phrase of the recapitulation is identical to the correspondent one in the exposition (compare phrase a in Fig. 57, mm. 5-8 and phrase a3 in the Fig. 58, mm. 34-37, pp. 532-3). The second phrase, however, is melodically and harmonically modified: the expository phrase a1 (Fig. 57, mm. 10-11) begins on the tonic and ends on the dominant seventh; the recapitulating phrase a4 (Fig. 58, mm. 38-41) also begins on the tonic, but, unlike the former, ends on a deceptive cadence that substitutes the tonic by the submediant at the resolution (fig. 58, mm. 40-41). The third phrase of the recapitulation, like its expository counterpart, progresses towards a full cadence on the tonic.
However, the former's progress towards the tonic is made through slightly more elaborate harmonies that are an appropriate match for the more ornate melodic line ending on a fioritura (fig. 58, m. 44, p. 533). The orchestral postlude that follows the last vocal phrase adds a plagal cadence to the authentic full cadence that ends the setting (Fig. 58, mm. 46-47). This is somewhat out of character with the classical cast of the overall harmonies (Example 275), and somewhat redolent of the hymn-book. As such, it ought to be perceived as a characterization device representing the Captain's genteel ways.

Example 275. Ibid., Outline of Tonal Levels, mm. 1-48.

A (mm. 1-17) Key of C major.

\[
\begin{align*}
&\text{a1} \\
&I \text{ dVII/ V I V}_{7} I IV6 V6 & I \text{ mT V6 ap.VII/II V/V V}_{2} \\
&a2 \\
&I_{6} V_{4} I \text{ dVII/ V I6 V I} \\
&\text{b1} \\
&III V6/5 III III VI ap.V/V V \text{ VI6 V7/V V} \\
&C (mm. 25-33) \\
&I6mT V D ImT IV_{7} V/_{7} III III III/III dVII/II IV/II II/II V \\
&\text{d} \\
&IMT V4 I +5 IV V6 I V4 I6 ap.dVII/V I6 V_{7} ap.ch.II6 VI \\
&\text{a4} \\
&D: I \text{ 3} I6 V6 V_{4} I IV6 V7 I I IV6 I \\
&\text{a5} \\
&V6/IV +5 IV V6 V_{4} I IV6 V7 I I IV6 I \\
&\text{a6}
\end{align*}
\]
Perhaps the most salient, and at the same time broadest, stylistic observation that can be made of the Captain's song is that the elements of unification predominate over those of contrast in it. Whereas contrast is the predominant mode of half-phrase delineation (Fig. 59., half-phrase indicators, p. 534), the predominant manner of growth above the latter level is variation, as indicated by the phrase symbolizations within each period (Figs. 57 and 58, pp. 532 and 533, respectively).

The third phrase of the first period shows a particularly elegant manner of variation: it incorporates the elements of inner contrast from the preceding two phrases as its respective half-phrases (Example 276).

Example 276. Ibid., mm. 6-17.
Beyond the inner structure of the periods the elements of unification may be found in the similarity of the framing procedures within each period and its component phrases (Example 277).

The melodic contours of the vocal setting show twelve half-phrases with an ascending melodic pattern (F. 59, in phrases 2, 4, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, p. 534), six half-phrases with descending melodic patterns (Fig. 59, in phrases 3, 5, and 6), and seven arch-like patterns (Fig. 59, in phrases 3, 4, 5, and 8). The arch-like pattern appears invariably in the second half of these phrases. Thus, it may perceived as a local closural element. The last two phrases consist exclusively of ascending half-phrases, and the cumulative effect of this procedure may also be seen as a closural device enhancing the very same property of the dominant tertachords it contains (Fig. 59, phrases 11 and 12).

The predominance of unidirectional melodic patterns over fully or partially returning arches may be seen as an element of characterization through style and genre, particularly when considered along with a through-composed setting, sophisticated digressions within the classically simple harmonic plan, and the Rococo elegance of the Alberti bass accompaniment. This last element, quite reminiscent of Don Giovanni's serenade, and Cherubino's canzonetta "Voi Che Sapete," is the most obvious of the above devices in presenting the Captain as a member of the upper class. Therefore, the designation of the cavatina "Fair Moon: as a song is a terminological anomaly, especially in view of a similar anomaly in Act I, which designates
Little Buttercup's introductory number as an *aria*. The latter, with its barrel-organ waltz tune consisting of arch-like phrases (Fig. 9, p. 169, Example 69, p. 165), fits the designation of the former much better. It is interesting to observe that Buttercup's introductory number characterizes her as what she is: a peddler, whereas the Captain's opening number ('Fig. 14 and 15, pp. 241-242) introduces him to the same strains as his crew, characterizing him through the same genre as the sailors. This hornpipe (Examples 111 through 112c, pp. 231, 232) duly emphasizes by musical means the rapport between commander and crew, as expressed in the pertinent text. By contrast, when the Captain is alone, suspicious of a conspiracy, and resentful of the rift between himself and the crew caused by Sir Joseph's demagogy (Fig. 58, phrases c and cl, mm. 25-33, p. 533), the music presents him as a prim and proper aristocrat, who even in moments of despair expresses himself with elegant restraint.

The orchestration of the *cavatina*, and the song ought to be designated as such in view of the features examined earlier, is delicate and understated, as befits its restrained lyricism. It is scored for woodwinds (2-1-2-1), a pair of horns, and strings. The strings are employed throughout the number in a pizzicato accompaniment, with the sole exception of the closing postlude in which the violins carry the melody doubled by the flute and oboe
over harmonies in the clarinets, bassoon, and horns, and pizzicato accompaniment in the lower strings (Example 278).

Example 278. Ibid., mm. 45-48.

After the opening horn-call (Example 267, p. 507) the vocal setting of the first stanza is accompanied by the strings alone until the last phrase of the pertinent section (Fig. 57, phrases a and a1, mm. 6-13, p. 532). The inner framing function of the third phrase in that section is enhanced by sustained harmonies in the clarinets, horns, and bassoon (Example 279).

Example 279. Ibid., mm. 14-17.
The middle sections B and C (fig. 57, mm. 17-25 and fig. 58, mm. 25-33, pp. 532 and 533, respectively) feature an increase in the alternations of instrumental colors. The flutes and clarinets in thirds alternate with a characteristic motivic figure in the voice (Example 278) and the entire section B is framed at its end by a doubling of the voice by the oboe and a simultaneous countermelody in the bassoon (Example 278a).

Example 278. Ibid., mm. 17-23, passim.

Example 278a, Ibid., mm. 23-25.
The section C returns to a *pizzicato* string accompaniment joined gradually by sustained harmonies in the clarinets and bassoon. The latter creates an orchestrated *crescendo* followed by an indicated *decrescendo* that frame the middle sections B and C and announce the return of the section A (Example 279).


The recapitulating section A1 (*Fig. 58, mm. 34-45, p. 533*) features the fullest orchestration of the piece in its first phrase (*Fig. 58, mm. 34-37*). In view of the latter being the only literally recapitulating element, the increased volume and changed color of the scoring ought to be perceived both as underscoring a thematic return and as a modification of that return (Example 280).
Example 280. Ibid., mm. 34-37.

The following two phrases of the recapitulating section (Fig. 58, mm. 38-45, p. 533) show an orchestrated reduction in volume. The reduction is greatest in the section's second phrase which returns to the pizzicato accompaniment without any winds doubling or sustaining (Example 281).

Example 281. Ibid., mm. 38-41.
The orchestration of the last vocal phrase, the recapitulating section's third, is slightly fuller than that of the preceding one (see Example 281). The string pizzicato is reinforced by sustained harmonies in the clarinets and bassoon. This ensemble is augmented by the two horns on the penultimate measure of the phrase, which enhances the resolving chord of the full cadence that ends the vocal line (Example 282).

Example 282. Ibid., mn. 42-45.

The four-measure orchestral phrase that closes the piece (see Example 278, p. 523.), although indicated piano, is orchestrated as a substantial woodwind, horns, and strings Tutti. The relatively fuller sound of this procedure matches its contrast with the introductory phrase's horn solo punctuated with strings' pizzicati (see Example 267, p. 507.). The non-reiterative character of the piece's framing elements in the largest dimension reflects aptly the through-composed style of the cavatina. The relative complexity and heaviness of the closing
phrase's texture makes it an appropriate foil for the melodic complexity of the vocal line at the cadential point immediately preceding (see Example 266, p. 505).

The fabric throughout the entire piece remains polarized between melody and accompaniment. The variations in texture are for the most part determined by the subtle changes in orchestration, and may be diagrammed to show an increase in textural heaviness and complexity largely confined to the closing section of the piece. The only departure from the melody/accompaniment fabric, and a very slight one, occurs at the beginning of the phrases b and b1 (Fig. 57, mm. 16-18 and 21-22, p. 532). This departure consists of a rudimentary imitation (see Example 278, p. 523) obtained by splitting the melodic line in hocket fashion and ornamenting the imitating fragments with a broad-line harmonization in parallel thirds. The placement of the contrasting fabric occurs in the section immediately preceding the most digressive harmonies of the piece, and thus may be seen as a subtle device of growth or progress towards a modified recapitulation, again emphasizing the through-composed aspect rather than the recapitulative.

In general, there is a balance between symmetrical and non-symmetrical elements in the piece. The symmetrical distribution of the returning thematic elements at sectional and phrase level is balanced by the modification of the returning elements by tonal, rhythmic, and timbral means.
Thus, the lower case and capital letters in the outline A(a, a1, a2)B(b, b1)C(c, c1)A1(a3, a4, a5) along with the outer frames a-1 and a6 (Fig. 57 and 58, pp. 532 and 533, respectively) represent a relatively symmetrical thematic construction, whereas their numerical subscripts represent a recapitulative variation that contrasts with the above-mentioned symmetrical distribution of middle and large dimension linear components. There is a certain rough symmetry in the text as well, since Gilbert repeats the first stanza. This is quite apposite dramatically, since such a repetition emphasizes the Captain's lack of resolution at this juncture: instead of taking some sort of action, he ends his lament in the same gently pathetic apostrophizing that started it. This allows Dick's forthcoming betrayal to further the plot's development, and to continue characterizing the Captain as a exceedingly patient man, apt to do rash things when that patience is finally abused.

The timbral differences between the expository section A and the recapitulating section A1 are such that the gentle pathos of the repeated anastrophe to the moon is emphasized through increased volume and textural complexity. The relationship between the outer orchestral frames of the piece, described earlier, also emphasizes the somewhat apothecary effect created by a recapitulation of greater tonal magnitude than the exposition (Ex. 283).
Suspected missing page 530.
Figure 56: "Entr'acte," HMS Pinafore
Note: This table is based on the original D major of the vocal score; the examples in the present text are excerpted from the orchestral material and have been given in the root key of C major.

Figure 57: Act II, No. 13, Captain's Song
Figure 58: Act II, No. 13 (Conclusion)
Fig. 59: Act II, No. 13, Captain's Song, Melodic Contours, Phrasing and Recurrence, Variation, and Contrast Patterns at Half-Phrase Level

A measure of vamp ing accompaniment occurs between the 1st and 2nd phrases, displacing the phrasing pattern by one measure.
While the Captain apostrophizes the moon in his melancholy cavatina, Little Buttercup, who has remained on board after the curfew, gazes sentimentally at him and listens to his song. After the song, the Captain notices her and chides her gently for not going ashore with the other visitors, since that would have been the proper thing to do. She replies that it was his sad appearance that prevented her from leaving; she wanted to see a smile on his face. This admission is a much more specific indication of Little Buttercup's feelings than her statement in the first act declaring that she knows "... too well the anguish of a heart that loves but vainly!" (see Fig. 17, mm. 12-17, p. 270). The Captain's feelings also are revealed in a more explicit manner than his initial description of Little Buttercup as a "plump and pleasing person" (Fig. 17, mm. 21-22): he admits that if he were to give his heart again (this, incidentally, seems to portray him as a widower, since his sense of propriety would preclude any other connubial possibility) it would be to someone like Buttercup. However, the Captain's acute sense of social station takes precedence over his feelings. He rejects Little Buttercup in order not to stoop to a misalliance. She is understandably hurt, and, summoning the powers of divination stemming from her gipsy ancestry
predicts a change in store for the Captain. He is left to infer what manner of change is forthcoming from the first four lines of the next song. The first line simply states that "things are never what they seem...,” but the following three imply that someone of inferior quality passes for his superior. These hints consist of rather traditional proverbs arranged into a sixain along with the opening statement and a closing stichomythic counlet provided by the half-puzzled agreement of the Captain to Buttercup's string of adages (Example 284).


Buttercup: Things are never what they seem, a
Skim milk masquerades as cream; a
Highlows pass for patent leathers; b
Jackdaws strut in peacock's feathers, b

Stichomythia

Capt. (puzzled) Very true, c
So they do. c

The pattern of this trochaic sixain occurs two more times with catalexes on every line, not just the first two as initially. Since the first stanza in the preceding example is symbolized as aabb_4cc_2, and the following stanzas are almost identical prosodically, the
latter may be symbolized as $ddee_4ff_2$ and $eeeg_4hh_2$, respectively. The closural couplet in all three stanzas is assigned to the Captain stichomythically. This enhances the closural function of the metrically shortened couplets.

The three sixains are followed by an isometric trochaic septenary of complete metric regularity, possibly a shorter meter variant of a septenary developed by John Donne out of Surrey's *Happy Dames.*\(^{15}\) This stanza is followed by a return of the couplet $cc_2$, which provides closure and unity to the entire stanzaic agglomeration (Example 285).

**Example 285. Ibid.**

Capt. Though to catch your drift I'm striving, J

Full measure It is shady - it is shady; K

Trochaic I don't see at what you're driving. J

Tetrameters Mystic lady - mystic lady. K

Mystic lady - mystic lady.

Stern conviction oe're me stealing, L

That the mystic lady's dealing L

In oracular revealing. L

Capt. and Yes, I know - C

Buttercup delete or

That is so! C

\(^{15}\) Haublein, 28,
The assignement of the septenary \( jkjklll_4 \) to the Captain in response to the previous three sixains of proverbial hints by Little Buttercup is a stropho-mythic procedure, a device similar to stichomythia, but occurring at a higher level: the stanza. The whole scheme \( aabb_4cc_2/ddee_4ff_2/gggg_4hh_2/ijijkkkk_4cc_2 \) is repeated with the line and stanza assignments reversed: the Captain is assigned the three sixains and Buttercup their closural couplets, and then Buttercup takes up the responding septenary. The closing reiterated couplet is again assigned to both. The stage directions that follow require Little Buttercup to exit melodramatically,\(^{16}\) and thus sum up the general tenor of the musical setting.

This duet is set in the key of D minor with a parallel major Coda. Since the text consists exclusively of foreshadowing portents, the minor mode, used previously only in concomitance with the unsettling elements of plot development (see Figs. 18, 34, and 38, pp. 271, 363, and 470, respectively), is used here with affective consistence. The melodic aspect of the setting's principal motive may be perceived as a further element of characterization, since, when reduced to its simplest scalar form it shows a descending minor pentachord containing a typical "gipsy" or Oriental augmented second (Example 286).

---


The treatment of the text's prosody is totally syllabic, with the exception of two pairs of syllables in the refrain (Example 287).

Example 287. *Ibid.*, mm. 44-46

The scansion is completely accentual in the first period of the setting (Fig. 60, period A, mm. 3-10, p. 556), but becomes quantitative with an accentual admixture in the following periods (Fig. 60, periods B and C, mm. 25-34 and 35-42, respectively, and Fig. 61, periods D and B1, mm. 43-51 and 52-60, resp., pp. 556-557). The manner of accompaniment provides an element of unity to balance the contrast introduced by the change of scansion. This unifying element consists of the various manners of presentation of the metric continuum, and thus may be seen as an element of variation as well (Ex. 288).
Example 268. Types of Scansion, Ibid., passim.

Period A (accentual - mm. 3-21)

Things you never that they seem
Strings in unison and 1st, 3rd beat chords

Per. B
(mm. 25-32)

Quantitative relationship
"Walking bass is continuous congruent"

Per. A1
(mm. 35-42)

The to catch your drift I'm still singing. It is shady (etc.)

Broken-chord accompaniment is continuous congruent

Per. B1
(mm. 43-48)

Quantitative accentual

Stein convictions over him stealing

Quant. Rel.

Per. B2
(mm. 52-57)

Quant. Bei held somewhat

I find no more tone you follow

Str.
The settings of the closural short-meter couplets show melodic variation, scansional contrast, and recurrence in harmonic procedure throughout the piece. The frames a2 and a3 are set as quantitative trochees in a descending pentachord and a diminished descending tetrachord, respectively (Fig. 60, frames a2 and a3, mm. 11-13 and 33-34, p. 556). The frames a6 and a7 are identical to each other and are set as quantitative anapaests in sharp contrast to their predecessors. Their melodic contour is a cambiata variant of the descending tonic tetrachord in the parallel major of the main key (Fig. 61, frames a6 and a7, mm. 49-51 and 58-60, p. 557). The harmonic structure of the frames remains a V-I progression at the pertinent tonal level, and the final fortissimo-tutti chord in all frames but a3 emphasizes the resolution of these cadences (Example 289).

The process of growth in small dimensions is furthered predominantly through variation between half-phrases (Fig. 62, v symbolizations throughout, p. 558). The growth in middle dimensions is likewise furthered through variation between phrases (Fig. 62, sequential variation indications at phrase level). The process of growth in large dimensions is furthered both by variation and contrast, as evidenced by the form-of scheme ABA1B1/ABA1B1/B2 (Figs. 61 and 62, periodic symbolizations, capital letters, pp. 557 and 558, respectively).

The process of growth in the largest dimensions may be correlated with the diverse stanzic forms of the text: the first two sixains, aabb₄cc₂ and ddee₄ff₂, are set to the very same music (Fig. 61, period A, mm. 3-13 and 14-24). The third sixain, gggg₄hh₂, as its rhyming scheme shows, is slightly modified through the use of a single rhyme in its tetrametric lines (Example 290).

Example 290. Ibid., Third Verse.

But. Drops the wind and stops the mill; \(g\)
Turbo\(t\) is ambiticus brill; \(g\)
Gild the farthing if you will, \(g\)
Yet it is a farthing still. \(g\)

Capt. Yes, I know. \(h\)
That is so. \(h\)
The prosodic modification of the third sixain enhances the end of Little Buttercup's enumeration of proverbial shams through the persistence of a single rhyme. The setting emphasizes this single rhyme by placing it at the end of each two-measure half-phrase in an ascending sequence encompassing overlapping melodic elements over a span of eight measures, or two full phrases, in contrast with the rest of the piece: except for the above-mentioned period B and its approximate retrograde B2, the sequential melodic contours are directionally confined within the half-phrase (Fig. 62, melodic contours, periodic symbolizations in capital letters, p. 558).

The contrast between the periods A and B is mostly melodic and harmonic: the melodic consisting of the contour/sequence change described above, and the harmonic consisting of a change in tonal levels from the tonic to the mediant. Since the tonic key is minor, the introduction of the mediant level is also a change in mode. These elements of contrast are well balanced by elements of unity represented by common or similar features in the periods A and B: the setting in the period A is syllabically congruent with the metric continuum, and the setting in the period B deviates very slightly from this congruence through the spare introduction of quantitative elements into an otherwise accentual setting (see Example 288, periods A and B, p. 540).
The four-measure phrasing continuum, maintained in the period A by melodic sequence/contouring (Fig. 60, mm. 3-10, 14-21) reappears in the period B. However, it does so not on the melodic surface which is broken up, as mentioned, into two-measure half-phrases by the overlapping sequence/contouring, but in the harmonic scheme. The progression underneath each of the period B's two phrases divides it evenly into two four-measure phrases ending on a local full cadence and a local half-cadence, respectively. It is interesting to observe that the sequence/contouring follows the semantic unit comprised by each line-proverb, whereas the harmonic scheme underscores the stanzaic construction by arriving at a half-cadence at the end of the single-rhyme quatrains, and reinforcing that cadence through reiteration on the closural short-meter couplet (Example 291).

Example 291. Ibid., mm. 25-31.
While the contrast between the periods A and B is a subtle one, the contrast between periods B and A1 is much more marked. Still on the mediant level, the period A1, so designated because its characteristic motivic element is a melodic retrograde of that in the period A (Fig. 60, mm. 3 and 35 plus indicating arrows and figures, p. 556), introduces two levels of accentual scansion that contrast syllabic continuum elements with their sub-multiples (see Example 288, period A1, p. 540). This contrasting setting is concomitant with another stanzaic variation, since it sets the first four lines of the text's closing septenary (Example 285, p. 537). The setting prevents a conflict with the stanzaic unity of the septenary by remaining tonally open through a progression from the mediant, or local tonic, to the dominant of the main key (Fig. 60, period A1, mm. 35-42). Thus, the setting of the septenary's remaining tercet is linked to the preceding quatrain by beginning at the resolution of the latter's setting on the parallel major of the main key (Fig. 61, period B1, mm. 43-51, p. 557). This tercet, as well as the reiterated-rhyme closural short-meter couplet that follows remain in the parallel major of the main key. The period B1 is a rhythmic variant of the period B. Its quantitative syllabic scansion is ornamented with neumatic elements in the second measures of the first two half-phrases, an additional function of variation (see Example 288, p. 540).
The period B2, which appears after the preceding periods have been repeated, functions as a Coda (Fig. 61, mm. 52-60, p. 557). It remains, like its immediate predecessor, in the parallel major of the main key. It is another variant of the period B, combining the quantitative scansion with an accentual admixture of the period B and purely accentual elements in a duet ostinato (see Example 288, p. 540). Its text is a closural reiteration of the strophomythic return of the septenary's last tercet and short-meter couplet.

The harmonies of the piece are, like those of the preceding number, simple and elegant. The harmonic scheme balances contrast with variation by progressing from the tonic minor to the mediant and returning to the tonic major. The periods that are not on the tonic level of either mode end on half-cadences and therefore may be seen as elements of continuation in the largest dimensions; their open character, coupled to the increase in harmonic activity and complexity evidenced by digressions to secondary levels, creates a tension in the middle section of the piece that is well balanced by the outer discrete sections. In the formal scheme |: A A B A1 B1 :| B2 | (Fig. 60 and 61, periodic symbolizations/capital letter, pp. 556 and 557) the periods B and A1 contain these digressive and transitory harmonies. It is worth noting that the opening period A, the only one in the minor mode, is repeated
immediately after its initial appearance. This provides additional scope for the minor mode section which is the prime characterizing element in the setting, foreshadowing the forthcoming peripeties (Example 292).

Example 292. Ibid., Harmonic Outline.

A (mm. 1-13-24) Key of D.
a-1 (mm. 1-2)
I V₆ I IV₆ V
D minor
a (mm. 3-6) a₁
I------ II V₆/III VI/III V/III I III₆/III VI₇ V
a₂ (mm. 11-13)
I V₇ I :)

B
b (mm. 25-28) b₁ (mm. 29-34)
III dIII₆ 5/III V/III III I VI V/V/III V/III IIImT V₇/III
(a open
sect.)
A₁
a₄ (mm. 35-38) a₅ (mm. 39-42)
III dVII/V/III V₆/III (dVII/VI VI₆) VI₆ VI₆ VI₆ VI₆ V

B₁
b₂ (mm. 43-46) b₃ a₆
I +5 IV II₇ V +5 I VI III IV I₆ dIII₆ I₆ V₇ I
D major

B₂
b₄ (mm. 52-57) a₇ (mm. 58-60)
VI III₆ V IV₆ I dVII₄ VII₆ ap. I dIII₆ I₆ V₇ I
5 4
3/V
The harmonic underpinning of the period B, as described earlier (Ex. 291, p. 544.), prevents its perception as a sequence of two-measure half-phrases as delineated by its melodic structure and rhythmic pattern. The period B2, which functions as a coda, features a similarly sequenced melodic structure. However, its harmonic underpinning does not preserve the four-measure phrasing pattern through a cadential progression. The harmonies in this case progress for six measures towards the piece's final full authentic cadence, as if pointing out the imminence of a largest-dimension frame through a break in the four-measure phrase pattern that, while not absolute, prevails in the piece (Fig. 62, phrase/measure indications, p. 558, and Example 293).

Example 293. Ibid., Closing Period, Melodic Sequence and Harmonic Underpinning.
As mentioned, the phrasing continuum of the piece is based on a four-measure phrase pattern. There are, however, significant deviations from this pattern. The pattern of incidence of these deviations places them at junctures of structural articulation, defined by other framing or transitional elements. Thus, periodic frames are abbreviated phrases, two- or three-measures long with an internal single-measure pattern reiteration (see Example 289, p. 541). The transitional aspect of the departures from the phrasing continuum is evident in the period B, where a process of lamination juxtaposes a sequence of four melodic half-phrases without any four-measure delineation against harmonies with a cadential pattern congruent with the phrasing continuum (see Example 291, p. 544). The closing period B2, the piece's coda, has no such ambiguity in its departure from the phrasing continuum: its melodic and harmonic elements are congruent with each other in the delineation of three half-phrases leading to the final frame (see Example 293). The overall measure/phrase structure of the periods shows the following pattern (Fig. 62, p. 558, and Example 294).


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>A1</th>
<th>B1</th>
<th>B2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a-1</td>
<td>a a1 a2</td>
<td>b</td>
<td>b1</td>
<td>a3</td>
<td>a4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>4 4 3</td>
<td>2+2</td>
<td>2+2</td>
<td>2+2+2+2</td>
<td>4+4 harm.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>closed</td>
<td>III</td>
<td>open</td>
<td>open</td>
<td>elision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(V)</td>
<td>IMT----</td>
<td>IMT----</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<p>| | | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>b2</td>
<td>b3</td>
<td>a6</td>
<td>b4</td>
<td>a7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2+2+2+3

2+2+3

elision
A combination of framing and transitionary functions may be discerned in the period B1. Its first phrase conforms to the four-measure continuum, but its second phrase is truncated in its middle and combined with the framing variant of the principal motive. Since the internal measure structure of the framing sub-phrases is 2+1, the truncated phrase retains the appearance of a four measure phrase with a single measure cadential extension. Just as the ambiguity of the period B announces a change, the strophomythtic answer of the Captain to Buttercup's string of proverbs, and the breakdown of regular phrase delineators announces the final cadence in the period B2, the truncation of an expected phrase growth in the period B1 announces the return of the preceding periods (Fig. 61, period B1, mm. 43-51, and Example 295).

Example 295. Ibid., Internal Frame in the Largest Dimension, mm. 43-51.
This duet is scored for the same orchestral ensemble as the preceding number: woodwinds, horns, and strings, with the addition of a cymbal/bass drum unit. The strings bear the burden of continuous accompaniment in the predominantly polarized fabric, the woodwinds both sustain harmonies and double the vocal line, and the horns sustain harmonies. The usually circusy cymbal/bass drum combination is used very parsimoniously to enhance the fortissimo single chords in the Grand Tutti punctuation of the sectional frames. The only frame without this device, reminiscent of Haydn's "Surprise" Symphony, is the frame a3 (Fig. 60, mm. 33-34, p. 556) which is the only one occurring in the middle of a tonal level rather than at either end, and the only one to introduce a transitional rather than a tonally discrete period (Ex. 296).

Example 296. Ibid., Grand Tutti Punctuation, passim.

17. Joseph Haydn, Symphony No. 94, in G, II, m. 16.
As mentioned, the strings bear the burden of accompaniment whenever they are not playing with the voice, either in unison or in four-part homophony. The latter two procedures begin the piece after the opening frame a-1, which features the dynamic and tonal contrast of the subsequent frames (Example 297).

Example 297. Ibid., mm. 1-10, passim.

As the piece progresses the string accompaniment is augmented by sustained chords in the woodwinds at first, and then the vocal line is doubled by the woodwinds as well. Thus, a layered effect is gradually achieved.
Example 298. Ibid., mm. 25-33 and 35-42, passim.

The two-layer accompaniment is followed by a single accompaniment combined with a harmonized doubling of the melody in the woodwinds and a ostinato-like ornamentation of the harmonized melody in the strings (Example 299).

Example 299. Ibid., mm. 43-48, passim.
After the strophomithic repetition of the periods A, B, A1, and B1 (Figs. 60 and 61, periodic symbolizations, pp. 556 and 557), the Coda B2 (Fig. 60) features again a layered accompaniment consisting of four-part sustained harmonies in the woodwinds and broken chords in the lower strings. The free counterpoint between the voices (see Example 293, p. 548) is joined by a violin countermelody, providing the Coda with the greatest tonal weight and textural complexity of all the periods in the duet (Example 300).

Example 300. Ibid., mm. 52-57, passim.
The different orchestral treatments of the basically polarized, and sometimes homophonic fabric result in an alternation of various structural units with different degrees of textural weight and complexity. The uninterrupted presentation of any one textural quality is never shorter than a full phrase, and at the outset of the piece it takes up an entire period's length. Both the textural complexity and the tonal weight increase with the progress of the stanzac unit's setting. The strophomythic repeats provide this apparent crescendo with a dynamic lull in the middle of the entire aggregate of A A B A1 B1 A A B A1 B1 B2 (Fig. 63, p. 559).
Figure 60: Act II, No. 14, Duet (Verse)
Buttercup (Inside)

Stern convictions stir him stealing
That the mystic la dy's dealing

[D: I 45]

F.C. on new mode

Violas, sempre legato

'The mystic tone you borrow, I shall learn the truth with care, now, here to-day and even to-morrow,

Tonic Pedal in Bass to End of Line —

Hyperphrase is delineated by Tonic Pedal to the Full Cadence (6+2+1 phrase/measure structure)

Fig. 61: Act II, No. 14, Duet (Refrain, Coda)
Fig. 62: Act II, No. 14, Mel. Contours, Phrasing and Recurrence, Variation and Contrast Patterns
Fig. 63: Act II, No. 14, Fabric, Texture
CHAPTER XII

No. 15: SCENA: THE NAIVE HEROINE'S PRAGMATIC SELF-DOUBTS

After the Captain's recapitulation of his current troubles and Little Buttercup's somewhat bitter forebodings, it is Josephine's turn for an introspective soliloquy. This monologue, set in the form of a recitativo and cabaletta, unlike the immediately preceding numbers, does not recapitulate or foreshadow anything, but rather concerns itself with the crisis at hand and Josephine's pondering of the very real consequences of her recent decision to cast her lot with Ralph.

The poetry in which she expresses her self-doubts begins with a single quatrain of iambic tetrameter with alternate rhymes abab. The feminine rhymes on the even lines, in contrast with the regular masculine rhymes of the even lines, create an effect akin to the alexandrine line, an iambic hexameter, by emphasizing the semantic and syntactic unity of both lines in each pair of trimeters. Scanned either way, the quatrain contrasts metrically with the long series of iambic pentameters that follows it (Example 301).

Josephine.

The hours creep on apace,  a
My guilty heart is quaking  b from rhyme 4
Oh, that I might retrace  a
The step that I am taking  b from rhyme 4

After admitting her apprehension, Josephine begins to enumerate a series of consequences that are much too realistic for the naive heroine of melodrama stock. This trait may be viewed not only as a departure from the single-dimension characterization for the sake of a more complete delineation, but also as an element of satire. Since such a heroine is not supposed to view a misalliance realistically because love conquers all, precisely this kind of transgression against the latter truism spoofs the gullible prototype. The prosody of her text is stylistically consonant with the descriptions of the Corcoran ancestral home and with Josephine’s high-mindedness. It is all cast in iambic pentameters, arranged in rhyming patterns of heroic couplets and quatrains. The arrangement of couplets and quatrains is such that there are two possible stanzaic patterns to be discerned in the text. One consists of a heroic couplet preceding two Venus and Adonis sixains: aa/5/bb/cd/5/ef/ef/ef/5, and
another consisting of a sixain separated by a couplet
from a second sixain with a rhyming pattern mirroring that
of the first stanza (Example 302).

Example 302. Ibid., 125.

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{Its folly it were easy to be showing,} & \quad \text{a} \\
\text{What I am giving up and whither going.} & \quad \text{a} \\
\text{On the one hand, papa's luxurious home,} & \quad \text{b} \\
\text{Hung with ancestral armour and old brasses,} & \quad \text{b} \\
\text{Carved oak and tapestry from distant Rome,} & \quad \text{c} \\
\text{Rare "blue and white" Venetian finger glasses,} & \quad \text{c} \\
\text{Rich oriental rugs, luxurious sofa pillows,} & \quad \text{d} \\
\text{And everything that isn't old, from Gillows.} & \quad \text{d} \\
\text{And on the other, a dark and dingy room,} & \quad \text{e} \\
\text{In some back street with stuffy children crying,} & \quad \text{f} \\
\text{Where organs yell, and clacking housewives fume,} & \quad \text{e} \\
\text{And clothes are hanging all day a-drying.} & \quad \text{f} \\
\text{With one cracked looking-glass to see your face in,} & \quad \text{g} \\
\text{And dinner served up in a pudding basin!} & \quad \text{g}
\end{align*}
\]

The syntactic arrangement of the poetic imagery
favors the first scheme of stanzaic patterning, with the
expressions "On the one hand . . . ! And on the other . . . ."
beginning each sixain.
The heroic meter of the preceding lines, traditionally associated with lofty subjects, and therefore appropriately reflective of Josephine's upbringing and social station, gives way to two quatrains in ballad meter, alternately rhymed: $a_4b_3a_4b_3/c_4d_3c_4d_3$, and a sixain whose feet remain iambic, but whose lines, rhymed in couplets, gradually progress from a regular tetrametric pair through a hypermetric pair of the same nominal length to a closural pentametric couplet: $ee_{4}ff_{4}gg_{5}$. This return to the heroic measure of high style may be seen as a function of characterization: the folk-like balladic quatrains are limited to a description of Ralph (Example 303), the first two couplets of the sixain give a reason for loving Ralph, and the closural heroic couplet contains an invocation to the respective deities of love and reason (Example 303a).

This particular device may be viewed as a parodic element spoofing the much abused expletive "0, Numil" an inadvertent neo-paganism forced on Italian opera by anxious Papal censors in observance of the second Commandment. The diction of the text is appropriately elevated, and thus matches the characterization provided by the poetic genre and meter, the latter being reminiscent of Grétry.

2. P. J. Smith, 197.
3. Cooper, 40.
Example 303. Ibid.

A simple sailor, lowly born,
Unlettered and unknown,
Who toils for bread from early morn
Till half the night has flown!
No golden rank can he impart -
No wealth of house or land -
No fortune save his trusty heart
And honest brown right hand!

Example 303a. Ibid.

And yet he is so wondrous fair
That love for one so passing rare,
So peerless in his manly beauty,
Were little else than solemn duty!
Oh, god of love, and god of reason, say!
Which of you twain shall my poor heart obey!

The setting of the Scena treats the initial quatrain (Example 301, p. 561.) and the first couplet of the subsequent heroic meter stanzas (Example 302, lines 1, 2, p. 562) as a recitativo stromentato (Fig. 64, mm. 1-18, p. 613). The setting of the remaining pair of
sixains (Example 302, lines 3-14, p. 562) is also a recitativo, but not of the conventional operatic kind that precedes it. The reliance on a single recitation tone encompassing two lines of text and ending on a cadential elision as a surface of a harmonized homophonic fabric is more reminiscent of Anglican chant than of the operatic stage (Fig. 64, section R1, mm. 19-28, p. 613) and Example 304). This type of recitativo appears in a simplified, monophonic, and unaccompanied form in the Pirates of Penzance (1879), Pinafore's immediate successor (Example 305). The recitativo in the subsequent Savoy operas is limited to the operatic stromentato style.


It is interesting to speculate the reasons for Sullivan's use of this "churcgy" recitativo manner in close vicinity or in direct juxtaposition with the operatic kind. The former is considerably less inflected than the latter, and while the singer has some leeway as to dynamics and agogics, the melodic contour remains totally flat for a substantial portion of the text. Such a procedure may tend to emphasize, by default as it were, certain elements of the text's syntax and stanzacic structure, but overall it is less expressive by its neglect of melodic variety. Neither inability not indolence on the part of the composer can be the reasons for this "cut-rate" procedure with the reciting tone: Sullivan's other recitativos are models of that recitativo stromentato which actually suspends disbelief with a deceptive ease, allowing the perception of a most artificial procedure as natural speech.

The most likely reason for the chant-like style in some of the recitativos may be a desire on Sullivan's part to leave the pan-European style of the stromentato for something more British, and what could have been more British to a former chorister of the Chapel Royal and a proud citizen of Victoria's Empire than Anglican chant. This could be corroborated from the standpoint of genre characterization: the only common trait between Pinafore's Josephine and the country cops of the Pirates is nationality. Sullivan may very well have been motivated by example:
after all, this was the age of nationalism in music, and he could not been unaware of the strong national or folkloric elements in the music of such composers as von Weber, Liszt (whom he met as a Leipzig student,\(^4\) and entertained in London as a royal favorite and therefore a cicerone to high society\(^5\)), his contemporary Dvořák (1841-1904), and his Leipzig classmate Grieg (1843-1907). The subsequent total neglect by Sullivan of this recitativo manner was probably due to his dissatisfaction with the limitations of the procedure and its stylistic clash with the conventional recitativos. As to the presence of national elements in music, the sea shanties, part-songs, glees, hornpipes, and other such folk genres in Sullivan's music function in that capacity much better than the adapted chant.

The recitativo begins in the minor mode with the first two lines of the initial quatrain separated from each other and the following two lines by a sequential woodwind figure. The vocal line is supported by harmonies in the strings creating along with the above mentioned woodwind figure a linear polychoric effect (Example 305). The third and fourth lines of the opening quatrain are set without such an orchestral interruption, thus quickening the pace in reflection of Josephine's mounting agitation.

\(^4\) Daily, 47-48.

and presenting the two tetrametric lines almost as an iambic hexameter, an alexandrine, whose traditional metric weight calls attention to its content, framing the quatrain by the musical setting. The lines one and two of the quatrain are set sequentially, and three and four in a reiterative fashion. The setting is overwhelmingly syllabic with one neumatic element appearing on the appoggiatura of the third phrase, as if the composer had placed it there retrospectively in order to fit both the regular and the hypermetric feminine rhymes into the same melodic pattern (Example 305a).


Example 305a. Ibid., mm. 6-12.
The conventional *recitativo stromentato* ends with a setting of the initial heroic couplet. This setting is also predominantly syllabic, with a neumatic figure framing the end of the *stromentato*. The scansion, as in the preceding phrases (Examples 305 and 305a, p. 568), is quantitative, with the length of the stressed syllables varying in accordance with structural and semantic function (Example 306).


The remaining lines of heroic meter, describing the luxury of Josephine's ancestral home in the first of the two Shakespearean sixains, and the squalor of her future with Ralph are set in the chant-like *recitativo* described earlier. The setting is necessarily syllabic, with the scansion following the natural speech inflections of the performer. The feminine rhymes that add a supernumerary unstressed syllable to the second, fourth, fifth, and sixth lines of both sixains (see Example 302, p. 562) and the preceding stressed syllables are set as a trochee by the composer, introducing an accentual frame into the
otherwise undefined scansion of the recitativo. The incidence of the frame is placed at ever shorter intervals of time, as defined by syllabic density, which creates a sense of urgency through acceleration. The procedure is similar to that in the preceding stromentato section in which the initial phrase is expanded by means of sequential inserts in the woodwinds after each half-phrase (see Example 305, p. 568) and is repeated in the setting of the second sixain. The two sixains are separated by a rudimentary melodic frame that ends the first one's setting (Example 307).

Example 307. Ibid., mm. 19-28.
The melodic contours of the four-measure phrases that make up the recitativos begin with descending lines in the first phrase. The instrumental inserts that extend the phrase feature arch-like melodic contours, and the second phrase combines a predominantly ascending contour with a recurving pattern. The two halves of the third phrase have contrasting contours: the first half-phrase consists of a descending line and the third of an irregular arch pattern. The fourth phrase begins the chant-like recitativo and features a melodic ascent that parallels the quatrain-plus-couplet stanzaic structure of the sixain it sets, framing the former structure with an abrupt descent at the very end of the phrase. The fifth and last phrase of the recitativo has a similar structure to that of its immediate predecessor, but without the drop; its unbroken ascent provides a frame contrasting with the descending contours of the initial phrase and, again, represents well the mounting agitation in the text leading to the impassioned cabaletta (Fig. 65, p. 614).

The harmonic plan of the recitativo shows its dominant function in relation to the key of the following cabaletta in Eb major. Its Bb tonal level includes significant digressions to that key's relative and parallel minor. These digressions are functions of dramatic characterization through mode contrast: the apprehensive beginning
expressing Josephine's self-doubts starts the recitativo on the mediant level reinforced by its secondary chords (Fig. 64, section R, mm. 1-12, p. 613). The last phrase of the conventional recitativo cadences on the dominant of the dominant in the main key, establishing it through a phrygian cadence: $V/\gamma$ II6 $V/\gamma$ (Fig. 64, mm. 17-18, p. 613, with all the affective implications of pathos traditionally associated with this device. 6

The chant-like recitativo that follows (Fig. 64, mm. 19-28) has two clearly defined tonal levels, contained within two phrases. The first phrase is in the major mode of the main key. It is harmonically closed and rhythmically framed (Fig. 64, mm. 19-23). The second phrase is in the parallel minor, and its harmonic digressions ultimately lead to the dominant of the forthcoming Eb major cabaletta (Fig. 64, mm. 24-28). The modal contrast between the two phrases enhances in a conventionalized manner the contrasting images of paternal luxury and connubial squalor presented respectively in the first and second sixains of the chant-like recitativo. Thus, this procedure has a double function of semantic enhancement and stanzatic delineation (Ex. 302, 1. 3-8, 9-14, p. 562 and Fig. 64, mm. 19-23, 24-28, resp.)

Except for the initial extended phrase, which is scored for strings and woodwinds in polychoric juxtaposition (Example 308), the recitativo is scored in a Classical manner for strings alone. In the recitativo stromentato the strings mostly sustain the harmonies underneath the vocal line. This function is abandoned briefly for a hyperanapaestic punctuation announcing the closing half-phrase of the section (Example 308a).

Example 308. Ibid., mm. 1-6.

Example 308a. Ibid., mm. 6-18, passim.
The orchestration in the first phrase of the chant-like recitativo is essentially similar to that of the preceding phrase, except for the punctuation, which frames the entire phrase, rather than indicating a forthcoming frame. The uninterrupted *sostenuto* of the strings emphasizes the pomposity of the major mode homophony representing Josephine's current position. The second phrase feature a small but affectively significant change: the very same homophony is presented *tremolando* in the strings, which, combined with the digressive harmonies and the minor mode, reflects Josephine's agitation in view of the squalid prospects of her heart's choice (Example 309).

Thus we see that the recitativo's melodic contours, harmonic plan, and orchestration are subordinated to the conventionalized representation of the textual content as well as, in a smaller measure, its prosodic characteristics. Its phrasing patterns, with the exception of the extended first phrase, are nominally based on a four-measure phrasing pattern, delineated cadentially in harmony and melody (Fig. 65, p. 614). However, the inherently free treatment of the durational values in any recitativo by the performer makes these four-measure units unperceivable as proportioned structural elements. It is rather the sequential treatment of certain melodic and rhythmic elements that provides a sense of progress along with the contrast between unrelated structures (Fig. 64, RVC patterns).

The Bb major chord on which the recitativo ends begins a four-measure introduction to the cabaletta. This introduction, already in the new Allegro con Spirito tempo, consists of an extended figuration over a dominant seventh chord in the new key. The rather substantial length of this single-chord phrase is an appropriate beginning and an equally appropriate culmination for an extended progression to the cabaletta's dominant contained within the recitativo. This shared function may be perceived as an elision in the Scena's largest dimensions.
The setting of the two balladic quatrains followed by the tetrametric couplets and the closing heroic couplet (Examples 303 and 303a, p. 564.) that comprise the text of the cabaletta is predominantly syllabic (Fig. 66, 67, 68, pp. 615-617). The infrequent incidence of neumatic or fioritura elements occurs at structurally significant points: a turn precedes the half-cadence introducing the major recapitulating section (Fig. 67, m. 36), and textual repetitions comprising the coda are given a neumatic treatment, having been presented in a syllabic manner initially (Fig. 68, mm. 67-68, 77-80, and 83-84).

It is interesting to observe that in this particular setting the contrast between accentual and quantitative scansion is used to articulate the inner phrase structure. Thus, the first phrase of the vocal line features two half-phrases of similar melodic contours and general rhythmic pattern whose free sequential relationship is given contrast by the absence of a dotted pattern in the second half-phrase (Example 310).

Example 310. "Allegro con Spirito," Ibid., mm. 5-9.
The second phrase shows a similar structural articulation applied to an extended phrase. The initial two-measure half-phrases contrast with each other in the same manner as the corresponding halves of the preceding phrase. (see Example 310, p. 576). However; the two-measure extension, which sets a textual reiteration, reunites the accentual and the quantitative scansions of its respective predecessors. This provides a synthesized element of unity, and therefore balances the departure from the four-measure phrasing continuum caused by the two-measure extension of the second phrase (Example 311).

Example 311. Ibid., mm. 9-15.

The third and fourth phrases of the vocal line are predominantly accentual with quantitative elements providing agogic enhancement to cadential points that delineate phrase and sub-phrase structure. The same type of agogic enhancement is provided by a quantitative element
to the highest point of the longest ascending line that marks the end of the first section of the cabaletta and provides a central point for another extended phrase (Example 312).

Example 312. Ibid., mm. 15-25.

The section of central contrast (Fig. 67, section B, mm. 25-41, p. 616) features a mixture of both accentual and quantitative scansion in the setting of the text. The mixture appears first as a juxtaposition of both settings with their respective syllabic units bearing the same relation to the metric continuum (Example 313). Then the mixture changes to one where the quantitative elements remain largely unchanged in their relation to the metric continuum, but the accentual elements appear both as multiples and submultiples of the $\frac{4}{4}$ metric continuum (Example 313a). The multiple of the metric continuum is, in effect, a spondaic setting of an iambic foot. Occurring as it does on the word "solemn," it functions as a generic
characterization through the spondaic connotation of majesty and solemnity. The ornamental turn following the spondee is the most elaborate of the several neumatic cadential indicators (Example 313b).

Example 313. Ibid., mm. 25-32, passim.

Example 313a. Ibid., 32-41, passim.

Example 313b. Ibid., mm. 33-37.

The recapitulative section of the cabaletta features the same scansion of the material it repeats (compare phrases a, a1, a3 in Fig. 66, mm. 5-25, to phrases a2, a4, a3 in Fig. 67, mm. 41-55, pp. 615 and 616, respectively).
The scansion of the coda (Fig. 68, mm. 55-88, p. 617) is not unlike that of the central contrasting section (Fig. 67, mm. 25-41, p. 616). The text of the coda is a reiteration of the text in the last phrase of the central contrasting section (Fig. 67, mm. 37-41), and therefore the former's return to the mixture of quantitative and accentual scansion elements of the latter may be seen as a function of procedural unity. However, like most of the recurrent structural elements in large dimensions throughout the opera's numbers, this return is not unmodified; the spondaic treatment of iambic feet in the text is used to extend a phrase (Example 314) rather than as a semantic enhancer (see Example 313a, p. 579) and the quantitative scansion elements also appear in a variety of ratios to the metric continuum (Example 315).

Example 314. Ibid., mm. 55-63.
The neumatic and *fioritura* elements in the coda are much more prominent by dint of scope and frequency than those elsewhere in the *cabaletta*. The first of these, a *fioritura* on the word "say!" enhances the apostrophic character of the exhortation to the gods of love and reason (Example 316). The second, a group of six syllables treated neumatically, represents Josephine's despair at her own indecision by introducing "weeping" *appoggiature* on every other syllabic unit in the group (Example 316a).

Finally, there is a spondaic hyperextension of the corresponding iambic immediately preceding, as well as on,

---

7. See Examples 212-217 and associated text on *appoggiature* in Chapter XIII, pp. xxx-xxx.
the resolving chord of the piece's final cadence. This spondee may be substituted, and traditionally is, by a neumatic figure on each spondaic syllable (Example 316b). This substitution is consistent with the previous use of neume and fioriture as cadential indicators in an otherwise syllabic vocal line (see Example 313b, p. 379, as well as 316, 316a, 316b).

Example 316. Ibid., mm. 66-68.

Example 316a. Ibid., mm. 76-80.

Example 316b. Ibid., mm. 82-85.
The principal manner of growth in the *Scena*, excepting the infrequent half-phrase reiteration or contrast, is variation. This may be observed in the small and middle dimensions in both the recitativo and the Allegro cabaletta (Figs. 65, 69, 70, and 71, RVC patterns, pp. 614-620). The same perception may be confirmed in the large dimensions (Figs. 64, 66, 67, and 68, phrase and section letter symbolizations, pp. 613-617). The following form-of outline may be abstracted from the latter symbolization letters (Example 317):


Recitativo

R (mm. 1-18) R1 (mm. 19-28)

harmonies progress from mediant to dominant seventh with considerable digression.

Cabaletta

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A (mm. 1-25)</th>
<th>A1 (mm. 25-41)</th>
<th>A2 (mm. 41-55)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>x a a1 a2 a3</td>
<td>a4 r a5 r1</td>
<td>a' a6 a3'</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Expository Section

Brief Variation in place of development

harmonies on tonic level.

harmonies progress from Submediant to Dominant level.

A3 (mm. 55-71) A4 (mm. 71-88)

a7 a8 x1 a9 y y1 x2

Extended Variation as second development or Coda I

Reiterated ornamentations and extensions of the authentic full cadence; Coda II.

tonic harmonies with submediant digressions harmonies on tonic level, deceptive cadence provides caesural element.
The thematic scheme resulting from the outline in Example 317 is R R1 A1 A2 A3 A4. Although the recitativo and the caballetta share the lower case r as a phrase symbol, this is not to be taken as an indication of thematic recurrence. The r is merely a mnemonically convenient symbolization for recitativo-like passages.

However unrelated thematically and differentiated by key signature (B-flat and E-flat, respectively) the recitativo and the caballetta should be considered as a single harmonic entity. The recitativo's harmonies constitute a long and functionally digressive progression towards the Allegro's dominant seventh (Example 318). The digressions are functions of characterization (see Examples 310 and 302, pp. 561 and 562, respectively, and text, pp. 562, 564). The harmonies of the Allegro-caballetta (classified as a caballetta because of its uniform rhythm, fast tempo, and uncomplicated harmonic and melodic characteristics) are much less digressive. The expository section remains in the main key, and therefore in the major mode. Its only harmonic digression of any scope is a central half-cadence on the dominant, preceded by a quarter cadence on the mediant. The latter is the only instance of minor mode use in the section. Its very brief appearance may be perceived as illustrating the
textual reference to Ralph's hardships (Fig. 66, mm. 12-13. p. 615, and Example 319, p. 586).

Example 318. Ibid., Harmonic Outline, Recitativo.

Functions in terms of Eb major; signature in Bb major.

R  
\[ r \ (mm. \ 1-8) \]
\[ \text{III ap.VII}_4^{3/III} \text{ III III apV}_2^{4/III} \text{ III VI}_6^{9/VI} \text{ ap.Vo VI} \]
over local tonic pedal in bass (III) id. (VI) -----
\[ \text{VI ap.VII}_4^{3/VI} \text{ ap.VI} \]
modified reiteration of semi cadence over VI pedal in bass.

\[ r^1 \ (mm. \ 9-12) \]
\[ \text{IV}_6 \text{ ap.dVII}_4^{3/IV} \text{ IV}_6 \text{ ap.dVII/VII} \]

\[ r^2 \ (mm. \ 12-18) \]
\[ \text{III}_6 \text{ I dVII/II V/V} \text{ II}_6^{4/IV} \text{ V/V} \]

R1  
\[ r^3 \ (mm. \ 19-23) \]
\[ \text{V V}_6 \text{ VI V}_6 \text{ III/V VI}_6 \text{ I dVII/II V} \text{ V/V V} \]
\[ 5/VI^{5/III/V} \]

\[ r^4 \ (mm. \ 24-28) \]
\[ \text{II/IV dV}_4^{3/IV} \text{ N}_6/V \text{ V}_6 \text{ IV/IV V}_4^{5/IV/IV} \text{ V/V V} \]
\[ 3/V \]

Key of Eb major

\[\begin{align*}
A \\
x \text{ (mm. 1-4)} \\
V_7 \\
\end{align*}\]

a (mm. 5-9)
\[\begin{align*}
I &+5 IV6 mT \\
4 & \\
\end{align*}\]

a1 (mm. 9-15)
\[\begin{align*}
I &+5 III6 V/III III dVII6 V6 V_7/V V \\
5/II & 4 \\
\end{align*}\]

a2
\[\begin{align*}
V_7 \text{ ap.I} & 6 V4 \\
3/IV & 7 IV \\
\end{align*}\]

a3 (mm. 19-25)
\[\begin{align*}
V_2 I & 6 V6 V_2/II II V4 II V6 VII_7 I dVII_7/V V_7 I \\
3/II & 5/V \\
\end{align*}\]

The brief contrasting section, actually a remote variant of its predecessor based on the principal motive's dotted pattern, introduces the minor mode in a more substantial manner. The change of mode in the music coincides with a change in the text: the description of Ralph's social condition is succeeded by a description of the qualities for which Josephine loves him (*Fig. 67*, mm. 25-32, p. 616). This is entirely in keeping with the
previous characterizations of the lovers' plight. The abbreviated and modified return of the initial section with the pertinent text brings back the main tonal level and the major mode associated with it (Example 319a).

Example 319a. Ibid., mm. 25-55.

Key of Eb major

\[ A1 \]
\[ a4 \text{(mm. 25-29)} \]
\[ r \text{(mm. 29-32)} \]
\[ 2X(VI ap.V7/VI) \]
\[ \text{elision VI VII6 V7/III III} \]
\[ + 5/III \]
\[ \text{lamination} \]
\[ a5 \text{(mm. 32-36)} \]
\[ r1 \text{(mm. 36-41)} \]
\[ VI4 6 V7/7 \]
\[ \text{elision V 6 ap.V7 6 V7} \]

\[ A2 \]
\[ a1'' \text{(mm. 41-45)} \]
\[ I +5 IV6 V7 \]
\[ 4 \]
\[ a6 \text{(mm. 45-49)} \]
\[ I +5V7/IV IV V7/IV IV \]
\[ a3''' \text{(mm. 49-55)} \]
\[ V2 I6 V6 V6 II V4 II6 V6 V II7 I dVII/V V7 (I) \]
\[ 4 5/II 3/II 5/V \]
\[ \text{elision} \]

The first coda's harmonies (Fig. 68, mm. 55-71, p. 617) progress from a submediant level to a full cadence on the tonic. This procedure is quite similar to that in the section A1, the first variant (see Ex. 319a). The minor
mode in this case sets a texts that expresses a hesitation between reason and feeling, again, love sorrows. The end of the first coda is a full cadence melded by elision with the beginning of the second coda, whose harmonies consist almost exclusively of elaborations and ornamentations of the V - I cadence. The phrase y (Fig. 68, mm. 75-80, p. 617.) is the most complex instance of these procedures, featuring respectively a chordal melody on the tonic chord and a sequence of secondary dominants resolving on a deceptive cadence on the subdominant. This resolution on the relative minor may be perceived as the last musical reference to the lovers' plight.

The piece closes predictably in the major mode on a full authentic cadence with a twofold appearance of the V - I progression. This reiteration of the major-mode establishing elements, presented in the most conventional of mainstream endings, is a kind of foreshadowing. Its vigorous character (Fig. 68, phrases y1 and x2, mm. 80-88. p. 617) belies the hesitation presented in the text, by anticipating Josephine's resolute actions after Sir Joseph's forthcoming last complication.

From the structural standpoint, the appearance of a substantial submediant element in the first coda provides balance and unity to the overall harmonic scheme of the cabaletta by introducing an alternately recurring contrasting feature (Example 319b).
Example 319b. Ibid., mm. 55-88.

A3
a7 (mm. 55-63)
I VI b III6 \dVII7/VII \[4 \dVII7/V \ v6 \ I dVII/V \ v9 \ ? I
app. 5
chord to

a8 (mm. 63-71)
I +5 VI +5 VI7 \dVII/II \[4 \dVII/III \ v6 \ I dVII/V ap. V7 I

A4
x1+a9 (mm. 71-75) y (mm. 75-80)
\[4 V6 5 9 6 9 \[4 I I \ susp.V6 \ v7/III \ v7/VI \ v7/II \ v/V ap.

y (mm. 75-80)
I susp.V6 \ v7/III \ v/V \ v7/II \ v/V ap.V7 VI

y1+x2 (mm. 80-88)
ap:IV\#7 I6 VII \[4 V7 I V I
ant.

V in bass
The quadruple meter of the cabaletta is well in evidence throughout its entirety. This is effected by a steady string accompaniment almost always congruent with the metric continuum or its submultiple elements and by the accentual scansion elements in the vocal line (Examples 320 and 321, respectively).


The most characteristic pattern of the quantitative scansion, the dotted quarter and eighth-note, also tends to emphasize through repetition the submultiples of the metric continuum (Example 322).


The rather monotonous effect of this procedure is balanced by structurally significant deviations from the four-measure phrasing continuum. This relationship between the metric and the phrasing continua ought to be perceived as a balance between two degrees of structural magnitude or two linear layers. Such a balance is neither perceived nor necessary in the *recitativo*, whose four- and six-measure phrases have two-measure sub-phrases like the *cabaletta*, but whose free tempo all but obliterates the feeling of regularity established by cadential framing (Figures 64, 65, phrase symbolizations, half-phrase contours, pp. 613 and 614, respectively). In the *cabaletta*, by contrast, the equidistant cadential or caesural points
determined as such by their regular incidence over a steady tempo allow an easy discernment of their non-equidistant correspondents.

These deviations from the phrasing continuum in the *cabaletta* are related by contiguity with other structural elements of the piece, notably the full, half, and deceptive cadences that delineate the largest dimension components of the piece. The phrasing continuum of four-measure phrases features an extremely prominent and frequent submultiple: the two-measure half phrase. It is against this sub-unit that the phrasing scheme is best measured, with the presence or absence of caesural devices (see Figures 64, 70, and 71, pp. 618-620) determining the inner structure of the phrases (Example 323)

The scheme in Ex. 323 shows that the primary elements of mainstream conventional tonal structure, the half- and full cadences, coincide with an atypical inner structure of the phrase that contains them. This enhances their framing character and, as mentioned earlier, contrasts with the steady presence of metric continuum elements that make the piece a cabaletta. The contrast is also a function of the classical proportion by balance distinctive of Sullivan at his best. Another example of a balance between two diametrically opposed procedures is the reversal of hyperphrase/main cadence congruence in the second coda (Fig. 68, section A4, phrases y1 and x2, mm. 81-88, p. 617). This reversal, which assigns the final reiterated full cadence to two four-measure phrases comes immediately following an eight-measure hyperphrase (Fig. 68, section A4, phrase y, mm. 75-82), in turn preceded by four full cadences on the tonic, three of them contained in a hyperphrase, and one in a regular phrase (see Example 323, p. xxx). The reversal of a hitherto prevalent procedure serves as an elegant and pithy framing device in the largest dimension and as an element of variety in the repetitive presentation of the full cadence characteristic of the coda.

Another procedure that contributes to the closural character of the coda by creating a stretto effect is the diminution of the characteristic quantitative pattern †.."
The reverse of this procedure extends some of the phrases from the conventional four measures to hypermetric length (Example 324).

Example 324. Ibid., Augmentation and Diminution, passim.

The half-phrase two-measure units are delineated by melodic contours in addition to durational caesuræ. The predominant type of contour is a unidirectional line, ascending or descending, followed closely by the irregular arch, that is, an arch that does not return to the initial pitch, thus enhancing the melodic continuation in the piece. Less frequent is broken direction line, which introduces a desirable contrast into the melodic contouring at the smallest dimension. The ratio between the three procedures outlined above is 16:13:11, respectively, including the recitativo before the cabaletta (Figures 67, 69, 70, and 71, pp. 616, 618, 619, and 620)
A polarized melody/accompaniment fabric, for the most part light-textured, prevails throughout the cabaletta. Occasional departures from these sound types may be perceived as enhancers of framing devices or their indicators, depending respectively on a relationship of congruence or contiguity. This sound-based framing ranges from the middle to the largest dimensions: the cabaletta is introduced with an orchestrated crescendo that features a slight increase in textural weight and complexity in its second half culminating in a Tutti (Example 325). The vocal line thus introduced begins with only a string accompaniment in the first phrase and continues with a gradual addition of woodwinds doubling the voice in unison and thirds, respectively, in the second phrase. The resultant terraced increase in dynamics and textural complexity combined with timbral contrast enhances the half-phrase framing and points out the hypermetric character of the phrase by outlining differently each of its three sub-phrases. The crescendo also serves as an additional indicator or propellant towards the half-cadence on which it ends (Example 325a).

The third phrase of the vocal setting features a decrease in textural weight with an increase in textural complexity: its fabric combines a free imitation between the voice and the bass with a melody/accompaniment in the upper strings in a dibrachic pattern in the first
subphrase. The second subphrase returns to a polarized melody/accompaniment fabric, lightly textured. The timbral contrast between the half-phrases just described consists of the flute and clarinet in octaves replacing the oboe in doubling the vocal line (Example 325b).

Example 325. Ibid., mm. 1-4.

Example 325a. Ibid., mm. 5-15.

Example 325b., Ibid., mm. 15-19.
The hypermetric character and full cadential ending of the vocal setting's fourth phrase provide a frame to the expository section of the cabaletta (Fig. 66, mm. 19-25, p. 615). Accordingly, the phrase features a substantial textural and fabric contrast between itself and its predecessor. The change from the preceding lightly textured melody/accompaniment to the fully doubled homophony of the full cadence is gradual. The transition consists of a lightly textured, single-timbre, main-stress accompaniment in the strings that may be perceived as a middle ground between homophony and chordal accompaniment (Example 325c).

Example 325c. Ibid., mm. 19-25.
The variant section (Fig. 67, section A1, mm. 25-41, p. 616) begins, like the preceding section, with voice and strings. However, the similarity between these sections is limited to lightness of texture and relative homogeneity of timbre. The fabric in the new section is homophonic, with the four-part layout featuring an occasional divergence between the voice and the first violin part resulting in a five-part setting. The obvious timbral contrast between the soprano voice and the strings enhances the harmonic aspect of the divergence since the latter begins on appoggiature (Example 326). The homophonic phrase is followed by a recitativo-like phrase, which is in effect a return to a polarized fabric since the vocal line is punctuated with string chords in the fragmented accompaniment characteristic of traditional recitativo (Example 326a). This is succeeded by a brief return to homophony, this time four-part with hardly a digression in the doubled top voice. However, the return is not unmodified: the voice parallels the top part of a woodwind quartet playing alone providing marked timbral contrast with the preceding phrases (Example 326b). The phrase just described ends on a half cadence whose resolution on the dominant is extended and modified into a dominant seventh in order to prepare for a recapitulative section (Fig. 68, mm. 32-41, p. 417). The continuity of the procedure is enhanced by the recurrence of the
fabric type and the new phrase is framed by timbral contrast as strings replace woodwinds in it (Example 326c).

Example 326. Ibid., mm. 25-29.

Example 326a. Ibid., mm. 29-31.

Example 326b. Ibid., mm. 32-36.

Example 326c. Ibid., mm. 36-41.
The recapitulative section (Fig. 67, mm. 41-55, p. 616) preserves literally all the features of the phrases and half-phrases it brings back. The modification typical of Sullivan’s recapitations consists here of excisions and substitutions, as described earlier.

The first coda (Fig. 68, section A3, mm. 55-71, p. 617) announces a closural section by a drastic change in fabric: the hitherto prevalent polarization or the slightly less frequent homophony are replaced by a rudimentary $2+1$ counterpoint, pitting a free imitation between voice and a horn pair in thirds against a re-iterated sequential ostinato in the bass. There is a slight increase in textural complexity and weight, since the ostinato of the cellos and basses is doubled in the bassoon, involving three timbres in the orchestra (Example 327). The second half of the first coda’s initial hyper-phrase replaces this $2+1$ fabric with an interesting combination of homophony and melody/accompaniment procedures: the setting is basically one in four homophonic parts, but whereas the harmonies are assigned in block form to the oboe, clarinets, bassoon, cellos, and basses, they appear in the upper strings within the characteristic syncopated accompaniment pattern. The vocal line diverges slightly from the block chords, and the textural weight and complexity are predictably increased (Example 327a).


The second hyperphrase of the first coda is a close variant of its counterpart in the preceding hyperphrase (compare phrases a7 and a8, mm. 55-58 and 63-66, respectively, in Fig. 68, p. 617). It returns to the latter's 2+1 fabric, but in a considerably more complex texture and timbral diversity: the 2+1 core of voice, horns, and bass is complemented by sustained harmonies in the clarinets, doubled by strings tremolo, the oboe's doubling of the vocal line, and the bassoon's doubling of the cellos and basses (Example 327b).
The second half of the above mentioned hyperphrase is not as ambiguous in terms of fabric as its preceding counterpart with both homophonic and polarized elements. Its four-part homophony is presented in block chords, with the top orchestral voices and the vocal line totally congruent. The setting is fully doubled in the orchestra, resulting in a completely mixed orchestral timbre and a simple, heavy texture. The flutes double only the last two measures of the hyperphrase, thus adding some timbral variety and brilliance at a cadential juncture. The contrast in sound between this Grand Tutti and practically all the preceding sections of the piece and the first incidence of a four-measure duration of a tutti contribute to the closural function of the piece through contrast framing in large dimensions. (Example 327c).
The homophonic Gran Tutti with full doubling is carried over through elision to the second coda (Fig. 68, section A4, mm. 71–88). The first phrase of this section features a texturally heavy homophonic fabric of fully mixed timbre in its first half-phrase's brief dibrachic figure in the orchestra alone. This figure alternates with a vocal strettto, very lightly accompanied by the clarinets, bassoon, horn, cellos and basses, and doubled by a single flute. The timbral complexity is all but hidden by the lightness of the texture and the staccato main-stress accompaniment. This procedure outlines the half-phrases rather boldly through extreme dynamic and textural contrast reiterated literally, and outlines the repetition of the full cadence by the respective coincidence of the dominant and tonic chords with the partial and Grand Tutti fragments (Example 32a).

The following hyperphrase progresses from a multi-timbral unison fabric to a polarized melody/accompaniment fabric. The former consists of the vocal line doubled by the oboe, clarinets, bassoon, and horn, and the latter of the vocal line, doubled at first by the oboe, clarinets, and bassoon, and then by the oboe and the bassoon, with sustained harmonies in the flutes and clarinets and chordal punctuation on metric continuum multiples in the strings. The horns dynamically enhance the resolution to the I\(_{6}^{4}\) that closes the phrase (Example 32\textsuperscript{a}a).

The two closing phrases progress from a brief monophony to sustained harmonies in the winds punctuated by string chords and then to a homophonic, all-doubled, *Grand Tutti*. This *Grand Tutti* closes the piece by framing it with the second Coda's dibrach (Examples 32\textsuperscript{a} and 32\textsuperscript{a}a).
Example 328a. Ibid., mm. 75-81.

Example 328b. Ibid., mm. 81-88.
However impassioned, the **cabaletta** shows a certain restraint in the portrayal of emotional agitation. This affect is represented by a driving rhythm, a prevalence of **forte** dynamics, and the judicious use of conservative extremes of the vocal range at climactic points. This approximates the **cabaletta** to an earlier style, one still beholden to classical models. It is, therefore, interesting and instructive to compare representative and characteristic samples from this **cabaletta** to a similar piece from *Der Freischütz* (1821). The similarities between the two **cabalettas** are considerable: both portray a young girl's amorous expectations combined with a certain degree of apprehension, and both occur before a pivotal plot juncture; Weber's takes place before the hero's near-fatal visit to the Wolf's Glen and Sullivan's before the final complication and the precipitation of peripeties towards the denouement. Both are written for a soprano voice in a very similar range and tessitura, and scored for a nearly identical combination of woodwinds, horns, and strings (Examples 329, 330).

Thus, the orchestration of the **Scena**, amply discussed and sampled earlier in connection with the fabric and texture of the piece (Examples 308 and 308a, p. 573 and Examples 325 through 328, pp. 596-604), features none of the abrupt and drastic dynamic contrasts or coloristic instrumental effects favored by Sullivan's contemporaries
in the portrayal of similar plot elements (Examples 331, 331a).

Example 329. *Ibid.*, *passim*

Example 330. C.M. von Weber, "All' Meine Pulse Schlagen."
Der Freischütz, Act II, cabaletta from *Scena* No. 8, mm. 108-198, *passim.*

See *orchestration* in Ex. 329, from the 3rd meas.

Example 331a. op. cit., 8 mm. before letter K.

Contrast the overwhelming ff of this passage with the moderate ff of the Pinafore Scena (relative mass of the respective Grand Tuttis).
The fabric and texture of the Scena's opening recitativo show a considerable amount of variety: the recitativo begins with a homophonic fabric, lightly textured, whose basic simplicity is ornamented by a linear polychoric treatment contrasting the voice and accompanying strings with a woodwind quartet. The top voice of the woodwind quartet is assigned to the oboe in its most expressive register, which enhances the plaintive melody, and therefore introduces an element of affective characterization (see Example 305, p. 568). The rest of the recitativo consists of a timbrally simpler stromentato, whose first half's fabric is polarized between a monodic vocal line and a punctuating and sustaining accompaniment (Example 308a, p. 573) and whose second half is homophonic (Example 307, p. 570). The lightly textured recitativo ranges from a modest timbral complexity linearly presented at its beginning to an extreme simplicity in the voice and strings sections. The only timbral variety in the latter is derived from a juxtaposition of idiomatic elements in the closing phrase of the recitativo: the top line of the homophonic fabric is sustained in the vocal line doubling an analogous part in the strings tremolo. The orchestrated dynamics range from sectional piano to a moderate forte of the string Tutti. These elements may be shown in chart form (Example 332).

A similar chart of the cabaletta shows a predominance of a simple medium-light texture, and a polarized melody/accompaniment fabric. The most frequent departure from these characteristic features of sound is a homophonic fabric, rather heavily textured. A less frequent departure from the polarized fabric is a 2+1 polyphony over an accompaniment. This element is a prominent function of contrast despite its relatively infrequent incidence: its complexity makes it stand out in relief. The closural character of the second coda is enhanced by an increase in textural heaviness and in the frequency of fabric contrast. A Grand Tutti of totally mixed timbre and homophonic fabric closes the piece (Ex. 333, p. 611).
Example 333. Ibid., cabaletta, texture/fabric outline, mm. 1–88.

**Exposition Section**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fabric:</th>
<th>Homophonic, Textured</th>
<th>Full</th>
<th>All Textured</th>
<th>All Double</th>
<th>Fortissimo</th>
<th>Fortissimo</th>
<th>Homophonic, Textured</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Textures:</td>
<td>Light, Medium</td>
<td>Heavy</td>
<td>Light, Medium</td>
<td>Heavy</td>
<td>Heavy</td>
<td>Heavy</td>
<td>Light, Medium</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**A2 Recapitulation Section**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fabric:</th>
<th>Polyphonic, Textured</th>
<th>Full</th>
<th>All Textured</th>
<th>All Double</th>
<th>Fortissimo</th>
<th>Fortissimo</th>
<th>Homophonic, Textured</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Textures:</td>
<td>Light, Medium</td>
<td>Heavy</td>
<td>Medium, Heavy</td>
<td>Medium, Heavy</td>
<td>Heavy</td>
<td>Medium, Heavy</td>
<td>Light, Medium</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**A2 2nd Exposition**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fabric:</th>
<th>Homophonic, Textured</th>
<th>Full</th>
<th>All Textured</th>
<th>All Double</th>
<th>Fortissimo</th>
<th>Fortissimo</th>
<th>Homophonic, Textured</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Textures:</td>
<td>Medium to Heavy</td>
<td>Heaviest</td>
<td>Medium to Heavy</td>
<td>Medium to Heavy</td>
<td>Medium to Heavy</td>
<td>Medium to Heavy</td>
<td>Medium to Heavy</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The chart in Example 333 shows an almost continuous presence of the string section, a spare use of wind instruments in various sectional combinations, and even more parsimonious use of the Grand Tutti. The manner in which these elements are presented shows an orchestration in which the string section provides timbral and functional unity by an almost uninterrupted accompaniment congruent with the metric continuum. The woodwinds and horns provide timbral variety, and the Grand Tuttis provide frames in the middle and largest dimensions (see Examples 320, 325, 325a, b, c, 326, 326a, b, c, 327, 327a, pp. 590, 596, 597, 599; and 601, respectively).

The cabaletta may well serve as a representative sample of Sullivan's writing in a high style combining the syllabic simplicity of his period with the harmonic and metric simplicity of an earlier one in a through-composed treatment of a dramatic soliquy.
Figure 64: Act II, No. 15, Scena (Recitativo)
Figure 65: Act II, No. 15, Scena (recitativo), Melodic Contours, Phrasing and Recurrence, Variation, and Contrast Patterns at Half-Phrase Level
Introduction: Anticipation of Upper Strings / Precedent Accompaniment

Accompaniment Pattern

\( \begin{align*}
&\text{(mm. 1-4)} \\
&\text{(mm. 5-9)} \\
&\text{(mm. 10-19)}
\end{align*} \)

A) Grand Tutto Allegro con Spirito

X Pattern

\( \begin{align*}
&\text{(Ebs)} \\
&\text{(Dominant Pedal in Bass)}
\end{align*} \)

Tonic Pedal in Bass

\( \begin{align*}
&\text{Who rolls for bread from early morn Till half the night has flown. Till half the night has flown}
\end{align*} \)

\( \begin{align*}
&\text{Their bread is as his trusty heart, And brown right hand, his true right hand.}
\end{align*} \)

Chords on Stressed Beats: Homophonic

\( \begin{align*}
&\text{Commenced Coda: Adagio}
\end{align*} \)

A) Grand Tutto: doubling

\( \begin{align*}
&\text{Anticipate in Bass}
\end{align*} \)

Figure 66: Act II, No. 15, Scena (cabaletta, exposition)
Coda 2 (Grand and partial Tutti orchestration to the end)

Full cadence approached from submediant level; secondary chords expand phrase → Full cadence

God of love, god of season, say, Which of you twain shall my poor heart, my poor heart e-buy: 55-63

Full cadence approached from submediant

God of love, god of season, say, Which of you twain shall my poor heart, my poor heart e-buy: 53-71

A4 Coda II

Full cadential progression at tonic level → Tonic Pedal

Secondary dominant

Codetta

Tonic Pedal

Full cadence

Figure 67: Act II, No. 15, Scena (Coda)
Fig. 69: Act II, No. 15, Scena (cabaletta) Melodic Contours, Phrasing and Recurrence, Var., and Contrast Patterns at Half-Phrase Level (mm. 1-25)
Fig. 70: Act II, No. 15, Scena (cabaletta), Melodic Contours, Phrasing and RVC Patterns (mm. 25-55)
Fig. 71: Act II, No. 15, Scena (cabaletta),
Mel. Cont., Phrasing, RVC Pat. (mm. 55-88)
CHAPTER XIII

TRIO AND DUET: FINAL COMPLICATION AND BETRAYAL

No. 16, Trio: Demagogy Hoist by Its Own Fatuous Petard

Josephine's unresponsiveness to Sir Joseph's suit is noticed by him and duly impressed upon the Captain. The latter, anxious to please the First Lord of the Admiralty and to become his father-in-law, ascribes Josephine's attitude to awe before Sir Joseph's exalted rank. On the Captain's advice, Sir Joseph reassures Josephine that love levels all ranks. This platitude effects the culmination of the plot's complicating element: Sir Joseph's affected egalitarianism ends up assuaging his promised bride's fears of eloping with a social inferior.

The Captain rejoices in the forthcoming fulfillment of his wishes, Sir Joseph condescendingly beams upon father and daughter, and Josephine reflects with pride on both her honest lineage and her true marital choice. These sentiments are summed up in a trio, popularly known as the Bell Trio, because of the refrain's reference to bells' ringing as an indication of joyous news. The text of this number contains both strophophymytha and stichomythia. The former consists of three sixains functioning as the verses...
and the latter is found in the second of three quatrains functioning as the chorus (Example 334). Each of the strophomythic sixains is followed by the three-quatrain chorus (Example 334a).


Capt.  ~ Never mind the why and wherefore ~  A
Love can level ranks, and therefore,    ~  B
Though his lordship's station's mighty,  ~  C
Though stupendous be his brain, (es.)
Though your tastes are mean and flighty,  ~  D
And your fortune poor and plain, (es.)

Capt.  ~ Ring the merry bell on board-ship, ~  D
and
Sir Jos.  ~ Rend the air with warbling wild. (es.) ~  E
For the union of his/my lordship
With a humble captain's child! (es.)

Capt.  ~ For a humble captain's daughter ~  F
J-ne.  ~ For a gallant captain's daugther ~  F
Sir Jos.  ~ And a lord who rules the water ~  F
J-ne.  ~ And a tar who plows the water!

All.  ~ Let the air with joy be laden, ~  G
Rend with songs the air above,
For the union of a maiden
With the man who owns her love!
Example 334a. *Ibid., Second and Third Verses.*

Sir Jos. Never mind the why and wherefore, A
Love can level ranks, and therefore, Aa
Though your nautical relation (alluding to Capt.)
In my set could scarcely pass,
Though you occupy a station
In the lower middle class -

All as before.

J-ne. Never mind the why and wherefore, A
Love can level ranks, and therefore Aa
I admit the jurisdiction;
Ably have you played your part;
You have carried firm conviction
To my hesitating heart.

All as before.

* . . . . . . . . . . . . . .
And a tar who plows the water!

J-ne. Let the air with joy be laden. G
Capt. Ring the merry bells on board-
and D
Sir Jos. ship -

J-ne. For the union of a maiden - Gg
Capt. and D
Sir Jos. For her union with his
lordship

All. Rend with songs the air above H
For the man who owns her love! Hh
In the closing stanza the quatrain is followed by a couplet, which in effect converts it into a tail-rhyme sixain. This stanzaic form is both the retrograde and the mirror inversion of the opening sixain, and thus prosodic variation provides frames in the largest dimension with elegant simplicity. The closural character of this last stanza is enhanced by stichomythia, which both contrasts with the closural quatrains of the inner sections and echoes the stichomythia of their middle quatrains. The strophomythia, that is the assignment of prosodically identical but semantically different stanzas to two or more characters, is greatly enhanced by the literal reiteration of the lines A and Aa "Never mind the why and wherefore, Love can level ranks, and therefore . . . ."

This enjambed or run-on couplet also contains the essence of Sir Joseph's demagogic egalitarianism, just as the opening sixain of the last verse reveals its effect on Josephine (Ex. 334a). The entire text is cast in trochaic tetrameters almost devoid of irregularities. The only metric element classifiable as such may be found in several catalectic line endings. These, along with run-on lines, relieve somewhat the triphammer monotony of the isometric trochaics. The predominant rhyming feature is the alternating rhyme, both as a component of sixains and of quatrains. Some variety is introduced by couplet and single rhymes, the former functioning as sixain components and
middle and large dimension frames, and the latter as stichomythic enhancers.

Overall, the text may be described as an expanded *rondeau* structure with hyper-stanzaic reiterative elements. It may be charted as follows, with lower-case letters indicating the rhyming scheme and capital letters indicating literal reiteration as well as rhyme:


A Aa b c b c
A Aa i j i j
A Aa k l k l

Sullivan's setting is overwhelmingly syllabic and largely accentual. The relatively infrequent quantitative elements, displayed against an accentual background, have a significant structural function. They provide the characteristic rhythmic pattern of the *Galop*, a popular dance of 19th century Europe, while the accentual elements provide the strong rhythmic motor, also characteristic of that dance. The latter are totally congruent with the piece's duple metric continuum (Example 335).

---


The only neumatic element in the entire piece occurs in the non-reiterative closing section of the vocal setting. It ornaments a subdominant chord immediately preceding the tonic six-four of the final cadential progression, and thus may be perceived as part of the largest dimension frame (Example 336).

Example 336. Ibid., mm. 61-68.
Besides providing the characteristic Galop rhythmic pattern, the quantitative treatment of certain words provides agogic frames to half- and full cadential endings of the largest structural sections (Example 337).

Example 337. Ibid., passim.

These agogic enhancements of cadential elements result in considerable departures from the seemingly prevailing four-measure phrasing pattern established by the orchestral introduction (Figure 72, mm. 1-8, and Figures 74 and 75, throughout, pp. 644 and 646-647, respectively). This irregularity is not limited to sectional endings: the very first phrase of the vocal setting is expanded into a hyper-phrase through lamination in the melody, by the avoidance of any strong cadential elements in both melody and harmony until its eighth measure, and by multi-dimensional melodic sequencing (Example 337).
Example 337. *Ibid.*, mm. 8-22.

It is quite consistent with Sullivan's meticulous attention to prosodic detail that the enjammed or run-on lines of text are set in a hyperphrase. The latter with its avoidance of conventional phrase boundaries at the established linear lengths enhances the presentation of subordinate clauses starting with the word "though" up to the last clause.

Just as the accentual elements may be seen as functions of unity and the quantitative as functions of variety at the syllabic/metric continuum level, the regular and the irregular phrase lengths may be seen as their respective correspondents in those functions at
the phrase and section levels. The contrast between
the accentual and quantitative syllabic elements is also
a function of affective text enhancement: certain adverbs,
adjectives, and nouns that are pivotal to the description
of the situation at hand receive an asemantic accent in the
setting (Example 338)

Example 338. Ibid., passim.

The harmonic structure of the piece (Examples
339 and 339a) is one of the least complex in the opera.
Its only departures from primary progressions in the tonic
are to the dominant, first in the form of half-cadence
figure 72, section A, m. 22, p. 644), then as a discrete
section on that level (Fig. 72, section 3-1, mm. 2331),
and then as a twofold Phrygian inflection functioning as
a dominant indicator in a returning transition to the
tonic (Figure 72, section A1, mm. 31-40).
Example 339. Ibid., Harmonic Outline, Reiterative Strophomythic Sections, mm. 1-49.

Key of E major
B-2 (instrumental introduction)
  b-4 (mm. 1-4)  b-3 (mm. 5-8)
  2X(I V7)  2X(I V7) I
over tonic pedal in bass ---

A
a (mm. 8-16)
  2X(ap.I ap.6) 2X(v4 ap.7) I v4 dVII7/III I6 IV I6 V
  4 3
  a1 (mm. 16-22)
  ap.v4 ap.V ap.6 ap.dVII7/II V6 V/V Half Cadence
  3/V
  B-1
  b-2 (mm. 23-26)  b-1 (mm. 27-31)
  4 4
over root-and-fifth dominant pedal ---------

A1
a2 (mm. 31-35)  a2' (mm. 35-40)
  N6/4 I V6 Im7 V7 Phrygian inflections ---id.

B
b (mm. 41-44)  b1 (mm. 45-49)
  2X(I V7)  I V7 I 6 ap.V7 I Full Cadence (repeat 2X from A)

B1
b' (mm. 49-52)  b'' (mm. 53-56)
same as b2  same as b2

B2
b2 (mm. 57-60)
  I VII6 ap.VII/III I6 IV I6 V7 I
inner tonic pedal ---------

b3 (mm. 61-68)
  I6 III VI6 IV I6 5 V7 I
Example 339a. Ibid., Harmonic Outline, Instrumental Coda, mm. 68-84.

Key of E major
A2
a' (mm. 68-76)
2X(ap.I ap.6) V4 ap.7 ap.V6 ap.7 I II dII, I6 IV I6 5 V
4 3

a3 (mm. 76-84)
2X(ap.I ap.6) V7 ap. ap. ap. I II I6 IV I6 V I Full Cad.
4

One feature that is readily noticeable in the harmonic outline is the relatively high incidence of appoggiature. The most obvious function of these ornaments is to introduce some variety into the number's rather limited harmonic scheme. A less obvious, but structurally more significant function of these appoggiature is one of linear unity in the melodic line of the Trio's main theme, which is developed sequentially out of a two-note kernel (Example 340).

Example 340. Ibid., mm. 8-16, passim.
The contrasting second theme exchanges the appoggiature for unaccented passing tones while retaining the sequential melodic structure of the main theme. This preserves the balance between contrast and continuity that characterizes the material examined so far and represents one of the salient aspects of Sullivan’s style (Example 341).

Example 341. Ibid., mm. 41-49, passim.

There is a transitional thematic structure located between the first and second themes. It has the rhythmic pattern of the latter and one half the incidence of appoggiature of the former (Example 342).

Example 342. Ibid., mm. 23-31, passim.
The first variant of the principal section contains the first stichomythia of the piece. It consists of two statement/response phrases, assigned by half-phrases to the Captain and Josephine, and to Sir Joseph and Josephine, respectively. The two phrases comprising this section are identical to each other (Fig. 72, section A1, phrases a2 and a2', mm. 31-35 and 35-39, respectively, p. 644). Both end on a Phrygian cadence that is the culmination of a parallel minor approach to the dominant chord (Fig. 72, mm. 34-35 and 38-39, resp., and Example 339, section A1, p. 630). This Phrygian inflection, traditionally associated with elevated expressions of sorrow, is used here in a slightly different context: it underscores Josephine's pride in both her ancestry and her love choice. This device of harmonic characterization acts synergistically with the agogic stress of the quantitative elements in the setting (Example 343).

Example 343. Ibid., mm. 31-39, passim.

2. Kimmel, loc. cit.
The Phrygian inflection, occurring as it does in a threefold strophomythia, provides variety in contrast to the unity provided by the overall simplicity of the harmonic scheme. This balance of antithetical elements is similar to that of the varied stanzaic and rhyming forms versus the regularity of the foot and line limited respectively to trochaic tetrameters (Examples 334, 334a, and 334b, pp. 622, 623, and 625) in the text, and to the analogous balance between irregular phrase lengths and the strongly delineated monometric continuum present in the submultiple accompaniment (Examples 344 and 344a, respectively).

Example 344. Ibid., Phrase/Measure Outline, mm. 1-84.

**strophomythic section**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>B-2</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B1</th>
<th>A1</th>
<th>B</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>b4</td>
<td>b3</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>a1</td>
<td>b-2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1+1+2</td>
<td>1+1+2</td>
<td>2+2+4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**non-reiterative concluding section**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>B1</th>
<th>A2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>b' (b'')</td>
<td>b2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1+1+2</td>
<td>1+1+2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2+5</td>
<td>2+2+4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Measure/phrase ratios in reference to the Figures 74 and 75, pp. 646-7, for the strophomythic and the concluding sections.*
Example 344a. Ibid., Metric Continuum Patterns in Accompaniment, passim.

The predominant manner of growth at the sub-phrase level is contrast which exceeds variation as the next significant manner of growth at that level in a 9:14 ratio (Figures 74 and 75, pp. 646 and 647, respectively). The melodic contours vary from short unidirectional or recurred patterns to long unidirectional or simple and complex arch patterns. The latter coincide with phrase and sectional cadential points and therefore may be ascribed a framing function (Figures 74, 75).

An additional manner of genre characterization may be discerned in the orchestral introduction to the Trio: while the entire setting is accompanied by a polarized treble/bass chordal fabric, the orchestral introduction (Figure 72, section 8-2, mm. 1-8, p. 644) consists of a melodic surface over a dibrachic fabric (Example 345).
The fabric and texture contrast in the piece is correlated with thematic contrast at section level. Thus, the section A and its variants A1 and A2 feature a polarized melody/accompaniment fabric, generally lightly textured, except for the closing variant A2, which has a heavy texture as befits a framing Grand Tutti. The section B and its variants feature a homophonic fabric with some sectional specialization in pedals and ostinato figures and a texture ranging from medium to heavy. The textural complexity of all variants tends to increase with the progress of the piece, and therefore is not thematically correlated. The linear increase in complexity and additive volume of the individual section is nullified by the three-fold presentation of A B-1 A1 and B (Example 346).
Each square represents a single measure on a horizontal scale.

**B-2**

- **Texture**: Heavy
- **Texture**: Simple
- **Harmony**: Homophonic
- **Harmony**: Polyphonic
- **Harmony**: Sections or specialization
- **Harmony**: Sections or specialization

**B-1**

- **Texture**: Light
- **Texture**: Light to medium
- **Texture**: Simple to medium complex

**B**

- **Texture**: Polyphonic
- **Texture**: Homophonic
- **Texture**: Sections or specialization
- **Texture**: Sections or specialization

**A1**

- **Texture**: Medium heavy
- **Texture**: Simple

**A2**

- **Texture**: Heavy
- **Texture**: Medium
- **Texture**: Heavy

**Grand Tutti**
The Trio’s orchestration ranges from the all-doubled Grand Tuttis that frame the piece in its largest dimensions (Example 347) to the single-section accompaniment. The latter occurs both with and without a doubling of the vocal line by an instrumental color contrasting with the accompanying section (Examples 348, 348a, 348b, and 348c). The sectional specialization and the concomitant polychoric contrast and functional polarization that appear in so much of Sullivan’s operatic orchestration (Examples 348c and 349) are also functions of textural complexity (see Example 346, p. 637). Most of the accompaniment is assigned to the strings, which in this case places most of the metric continuum submultiples in this orchestral section. These elements consist of a polarized bass/treble broken chord pattern in the theme A and its variants on the one hand, and of dibrachic block chords in the theme B and its variants on the other (see Example 347). The dibrachic figure repeated in the B variants finds a harmonic equivalent in the pedal points that seem to anchor these variants in the local tonic. Also, the pedal points seem to produce a hypermetric phrasing pattern by spanning two phrases delineated by melodic and rhythmic patterns (Figs. 72 and 73, phrases b-4, b-3; b-2, b-1; b, b1; b’,b”., pp. 644 and 645).

The triangle is the only percussion instrument in the piece. It outlines every measure in the framing
Grand Tuttis (see Ex. 347) and in the main section B and its subsequent variants, except one. Interestingly, the only B variant without the pealing of the triangle is the one where the text commands "Ring the merry bells on boardship..." This has a sophisticated effect of negative enhancement of the cited words (see Example 348b).

Example 347. Ibid., mm. 1-8, 68-94, passim.

Example 348. Ibid., mm. 8-16, passim.
Example 348a. Ibid., mm. 16-22, passim.

Example 348b. Ibid., mm. 23-31, passim.

Example 348c. Ibid., mm. 49-56, passim.
Example 340. Ibid., mm. 31-40, passim.

Woodwinds sustain harmonies.

Example 350. Ibid., mm. 31-40, passim.

Two phrases delineated by melodic contouring.

Funic pedal in bass, reinforced by fifth above

Single hypermetric phrase with caesura melodic caesura,

delineated by full cadence.
The choice of key for the piece is E major, and the harmonic scheme's adherence to its primary tonal areas allows a free resonance of the violin section E strings. This makes for a bright orchestral sonority, especially since the scoring for woodwinds, horns, and strings is such that strings are not doubled. The orchestration's sonority is quite in keeping with the energetic rhythmic character of the piece, generated by the motor potential of the metric continuum submultiples in both the syllabic vocal line and throughout most of the section A and its variants' accompaniments as well as by the reiterative appearances of the quantitative dotted pattern in the section B and its variants. The overwhelmingly predominant major mode of the piece also reinforces its jubilant tone, however premature such rejoicing may be.

The major determinant of the form- of in this case seems to be the strophomythic character of the three prosodically identical sixains of the text. Thus, the setting's organization of its largest subordinate components may be outlined thus:


2X(B-2 A B-1 A1 B) B-2 A B-1 A1 B1 B2 A2
A1 and B1 are stichomythic sections.

* Outline in reference to Figures 72 and 73 (pp. 644-5).
The form-of outlined in Ex. 352 (p. 642) shows a procedural combination of variation and recurrence in the largest dimensions. The variation aspect is particularly sophisticated in the use of negative or anticipatory variants of the secondary theme. The long instrumental coda, a variant of the main theme, frames the piece in conjunction with the much shorter instrumental introduction, a variant of the secondary theme. This enhances the alternating manner of thematic organization over any arch-like perceptions arising from the B-1 introduction and the B2 closural section of the vocal setting. Also, the magnitude of the instrumental coda allows for a dance, quite appropriate in view of the joyous feelings of the characters concerned and the Gallop characteristics of the piece itself.
Figure 73: Act II, No. 16, Trio, mm. 49-84.
Fig. 74: Act II, No. 16, Trio, Melodic Contours, Phrasing and Recurrence, Variation, and Contrast Patterns (mm. 1-49)
Fig. 75: Act II, No. 16, Trio, Mel. Contours, Phrasing and RVC Patterns (mm. 49-84)
No. 17, Duet: The Betrayal

The Captain's joy is shortlived: Dick Deadeye interrupts his ecstatic soliloquizing about the forthcoming marriage between Josephine and Sir Joseph and reveals the former's plans to elope with Ralph. Dick's betrayal of his shipmate is a logical consequence of his sullenly realistic appraisal of Sir Joseph's demagoguery and a sober acceptance of the social status quo. It is well foreshadowed by the treatment that who abhor him.

The betrayal is presented in a strophomythic duet with some stichomythic elements interspersed as functions of hyperstanzaic unity. The basic stanzaic structure of the text is an alternately rhymed quatrain of iambic pentameter traditionally known as a heroic stanza. The choice of such a high style prosody may be seen as a characterization by genre of a moment of pivotal importance to the plot. The duet is, in effect, the discovery that begins the final series of reversals leading to the dénouement. The heroic stanza is somewhat modified by the epiphoric repetition of its last line, which creates a refrain with a tetrametric closure. The literal recurrence of this line in every stanza creates a refrain, whose modification in the

last stanza frames the entire poem. Since the two interlocutors exchange stanzas of identical prosody and considerable semantic recurrence, the strophomythia is rather evident. A bit more subtle is a certain manner of hidden stichomythia, represented by the internalized anaphora at the beginning of every even-numbered line Sing Hey. This anaphoric exhortation is also a generic feature similar to the Way-Hey of the sea shanty, quite apposite to the singers' naval profession. The anaphora Sing hey, the epiphoric refrain, and the literal recurrence of the second anaphoric line in an epiphoric fashion are functions of both stanzaic and hyperstanzaic unity. The epiphora in the last stanza is a function of local stanzaic unity and of hyperstanzaic closure, as mentioned above. The literal recurrence of the fourth line of the first three stanzas suggests a rondoid structure (Example 352), instead of the verse and chorus apparent at first sight (Example 352a).


Capitals indicate literal recurrence; Roman numerals indicate modified recurrence; numerical subscripts indicate regular iambic metrics.

1st stanza 2nd stanza 3rd stanza 4th stanza
a b a B_5 BI_4 c bi c B_5 BI_4 d bII d B_5 BI_4 e bIII e bIV_5 bV_4


Dick. Kind Captain, I've important information.

[Sing hey, the kind commander that you are,]

About a certain intimate relation,

[Sing hey, the merry maiden and the tar.

Both. The merry maiden and the tar.

Capt. Good fellow, in conundrums you are speaking.

[Sing hey, the mystic sailor that you are;]

The answer to them vainly I am seeking;

[Sing hey, the merry maiden and the tar.

Both. The merry maiden and the tar.

Dick. Kind Captain, your young lady is a-sighing.

[Sing hey, the simple captain that you are,]

This very night with Rackstraw to be flying;

[Sing hey, the merry maiden and the tar.

Both. The merry maiden and the tar.

Capt. Good fellow, you have given timely warning.

[Sing hey, the thoughtful sailor that you are,]

I'll talk to Master Rackstraw in the morning;

[Sing hey, the cat-o-nine-tails and the tar. (producing a "cat")]

Both. The merry cat-o-nine-tails and the tar!
The setting of this text is one of the opera’s simplest: Sullivan treats the strophomythic stanzas as a strophic song with the same music for the four verse-and-chorus units. The setting’s scansion is quantitative throughout with a two-dimensional approach to the procedure: the prevailing 2:1 ratio between stressed and unstressed syllables is presented in an augmented fashion in order to frame the phrase agogically (Example 353).


The regular four-measure phrases coincide with the lines of the basic quatrains, which is emphasized even further by a half-cadence on the mediant (Figure 76, mm. 17-18, p. 665). The secondary level of this closure indicates the subordinate character of the section it delineates, and thus allows for a logical transition into the setting of the epiphoric chorus. The latter acquires additional scope through textual reiteration and closural quality at the largest dimension through its progression towards the final full cadence (Figure 76, mm. 29-30). It also introduces contrast in middle and large dimensions.
by abandoning the two-phrase sequencing pattern of the verse, and adopting a half-phrase sequencing pattern in its first phrase, the only such structure with a central caesura in the song (Example 354).

Example 354. Ibid., passim.

The strophic simplicity of the setting is well balanced by the sophisticated relationship between the phrase frames and their correspondents in the largest dimensions (Example 355 and Figure 76), solid single line rectangular markings, p. 665).
The most characteristic melodic element within the phrases, a scalar setting pattern, provides unity through its pervasiveness (Example 356 and Fig. 76, double line boxes). An element of contrast with the scalar melodic line is provided by the chordal derivation of the inner and outer frames' melodic structure. This very same feature provides unity in the framing functions (see Example 355 above) in a synthesis of functionally and structurally antithetical elements.
An additional element of unity may be found in a recurrent melodic pattern preceding the closure of the first phrase in each section of the verse setting and preceding the final cadence of the vocal line in the chorus (Fig. 76, mm. 4-5, 13-15, and 23-25, p. 665). The pattern is a inverse arch, which contrasts effectively with the framing arches of the closural phrases in two periods of the verse setting (Fig. 76, phrases b and b1). Thus, the unity provided by the recurrence of the melodic pattern mentioned above (Fig. 76, double broken line rectangular markings) is balanced by its contrast with the closural phrases (Example 357).

The entire verse and chorus unit is framed by descending melodic figure in the orchestra which leads to a closing variant of the initial frame, again an amalgam of unity and variety at the largest dimensions (Example 358).

The arch shape predominates in the phrases' melodic contours (Fig. 77, p. 666). This feature is associated with the absence of mid-phrase caesural elements in the setting of the verse (Fig. 77, phrases a through b1). By contrast, the setting of the refrain features a strongly delineated caesura stemming from a sequential half-phrase structure in the first phrase (Fig. 77, phrase a2). The following two phrases, which close the vocal line and the entire piece, respectively, have melodic contours whose long descending lines preclude any caesural features (Fig. 77, phrases a3 and a4). Thus, the mid-phrase caesura of the refrain's opening phrase may be perceived as an internal frame in the largest dimensions, pointing out, as it were, the beginning of a refrain or chorus stanza. Along with the opening frame (Fig. 77, frame x), this opening of the refrain is the only departure from the four-measure phrasing continuum in the piece. All other frames (Fig. 77, x variants) are integrated into the linear span of the regular phrases they help to delineate (Example 359).

Example 359. Ibid., Phrasing Pattern.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>A1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>phrase/measure:</td>
<td>2 4 4 4 4</td>
<td>2+2 4 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sub-phrases in large dimension framing function,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The overall characteristics of the duet resemble those of several well-known quantitative, minor-mode, sea shanties and ballads. Among the former, the duet may be compared to the capstan shanty "Haul Away" (see Example 32, Chapter III, p. 113). As for the latter, the ballads "Rude Boreas" and "High Barbaree," both of literary origin and both dating from the 18th century, may serve as models. The first was composed by G.A. Stevens in 1754, and the second was written by Charles Dibdin, also in the 18th century (Examples 360 and 361, respectively).

Example 360. G.A. Stevens, "Rude Boreas," in Huzill, Songs of the Sea, 144.

Chorus follows

All three shanties cited are in the minor mode, which enhances the resemblance between them and the piece at hand in a circumstantial manner. The minor mode has no affective significance in "Haul Away," but it does in the other two, since "High Barbaree" describes a fierce sea battle and "Rude Boreas" a fierce tempest. The minor mode in the duet has both affective significance in a local context and structural function in the largest dimensions of the opera. Its position in the second act mirrors that of the duet between Ralph and Josephine (Fig. 34, Chapter X, p. 367); its function in the opera recapitulates it: the Ralph-Josephine duet begins a series of discoveries and reversals leading to plot's climax (Chapter XIV, passim), whereas the Dick-Captain duet begins a series of similar peripeties leading to the plot's dénouement. Both are in the minor mode, and both digress to the major, albeit the former does it sectionally to the parallel major and the latter in a harmonic arch peaking on the relative major and returning to the tonic minor.

The harmonic scheme of the duet seems extremely simple at first sight, and it is so, indeed, at phrase level. The chordal progressions within the phrases are limited to primary relationships within the two predominant levels, tonic and mediant. However, this simplicity ends with the melodically and rhythmically delineated phrase: the quarter-cadence and the half-cadence that frame the
first period and second period of the first section, respectively (Fig. 76, section A, mm. 8-9 and 17-18, p. 665). show a sub-surface sophistication far greater than that of the genre the piece imitates so successfully. The quarter and the half cadences of the first section direct the setting of the verse from the tonic to the mediant level (Fig. 76, mm. 1-18). The setting of the refrain progresses in retrograde fashion from the mediant back to the tonic (Fig. 76, mm. 18-30). This results in an arch-like harmonic structure, spanning two tonally interdependent sections: a true binary form, whose mid-point dominant has been replaced by a mediant. The replacement of the dominant by the mediant is strongly reminiscent of a procedure found in Classical sonata-allegro movements in a minor key: witness the relationship between the first and second subjects of the first movement's exposition in the Symphony No. 40 of Mozart, 5 Symphony No. 5 of Beethoven, 6 and Symphony No. 8, The Unfinished, of Schubert. 7

The cadential pattern of the verse's setting also suggest a hypermetric phrasing scheme. Thus, the phrases a and b would become a single hypermetric phrase with a

7. F. Schubert, Symphony No. 8, The Unfinished, I, mm. 1-8, 44-53.
central caesura, framed by the dominant of the mediant (Fig. 76, mm. 1-9, p. 665). The following phrases a1 and b1 would constitute another hypermetric or double phrase, framed by the mediant (Fig. 76, mm. 10-18).

The second hyperphrase thus outlined is a tonal complement to the first through its harmonic resolution (V/III to III) and a sequential variant through its melodic and rhythmic characteristics. In this context, the setting of the epiphoric refrain becomes a closer variant of the preceding hypermetric phrases than in the analysis based on the four-measure phrase. The contrast that provides a closural element is still there through sub-phrase sequencing and the linear transposition of motivic elements within the phrase, but the perception of all the six phrases of the vocal line as three hyperphrases of equal length produces a different formal outline at the largest dimensions (Example 362).

Example 362. Ibid., Formal Outline Ambiguities.
The harmonic outline of the piece is thus presented against these two formal possibilities (Example 363).

Example 363. Ibid., Harmonic Outline.

Key of C minor
A (first section - verse)
A (first hypermetric phrase)
x (mm. 1-2) a (mm. 2-6) b (mm. 6-9)
(I V I I I I I ------) V I III III III --- V7/III Q.C.

second period of A
A1 (second hypermetric phrase)
a1 (mm. 10-14) b1 (mm. 14-17) x1 (mm. 17-19)
(V I I I I I I) III6 V7/III ap.V7/III III (V/III III) H.C.

A1 (second section - refrain)
A2 (third hypermetric phrase)
a2 (mm. 18-22 baritone, mm. 19-23 bass)
III V/III IV I VI

a3 (mm. 26-26 baritone, mm. 23-26 bass; mm. 25-26 are x2)
IV III V I
x3 (mm. 27-30)
I VII6 I6 IV I6 V7 I
 4  4  4  4  F.C.

* The double symbolizations in the capital letters indicate the two form-of-possibilities generated by the ambiguity of the cadential pattern.
Thus far, the two-fold analytic approach shows two possible form-of outlines: A A1 and A A1 A2 (Examples 362 and 361, pp. 660 and 661). An examination of the duet's fabric yields a third possibility. The verse alternates a unison with a polarized melody/accompaniment fabric, while the setting of the refrain replaces the single melodic line of the verse with a two-part counterpoint while retaining the accompaniment. Besides contrasting the strophomythia of the verses with the joint presentation of the refrain, this contrast in fabrics between the two main stanzaic components, viewed in the hypermetric phrase context, produces a third form-of outline possibility. The latter may be symbolized as A A B, or a traditional bar form, its sections consisting of the three hypermetric phrases of the vocal line (see Example 362, symbols A, A1 and A2, p. 660). The underlying accompaniment may be perceived as an element of unity in the largest dimensions (Example 364).

Example 364. Ibid., passim.
Fabric and texture contrast in the middle dimensions are correlated with the same alternation of thematic material that delineates the phrasing pattern in the metric context and the sub-phrasing pattern in the hypermetric one. The thematic structure a and its variants in the setting of the verse feature a unison fabric of voice and strings minus the bass octave; the thematic structure b and its variants in the same setting feature a polarized melody/accompaniment fabric with an octave doubling of the bass. The contrast in octave doubling of the bass between the two thematic structures results in a slight increase of textural weight in the latter structure just as the fabric contrast gives it an increase in textural complexity. The setting of the refrain is merely framed by a two-measure unison, featuring, as described earlier, a combination of two-part counterpoint with an accompaniment. Its texture is, therefore, the heaviest and most complex of the piece. The framing phrase a4 returns to a polarized melody/accompaniment fabric, simply textured, with some weight added in the treble by a piccolo doubling of the violin melody (Example 365).

The piece is scored for strings, alternately doubling the vocal line in unison and accompanying it chordally emphasizing the phrasing pattern (Ex. 364). The closing tag doubles the violins with a piccolo (Ex. 366).

Occasional unison defines the inner and outer frames of the vocal setting.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STR.</th>
<th>2 (BASS)</th>
<th>BASS</th>
<th>+ C.BASS</th>
<th>SIZE + REG.</th>
<th>FL.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>STR. Voice</td>
<td>x1</td>
<td>x2</td>
<td>x3</td>
<td>x4</td>
<td>TOTAL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FABRIC</td>
<td>UNISON</td>
<td>POLAR.</td>
<td>POLAR.</td>
<td>POLAR.</td>
<td>POLAR.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MET/ACC.</td>
<td>MET/ACC.</td>
<td>MET/ACC.</td>
<td>2+1</td>
<td>1+1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TEXTURE</td>
<td>LIGHT</td>
<td>MEDIUM</td>
<td>MEDIUM</td>
<td>MEDIUM</td>
<td>MEDIUM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EASIEST</td>
<td>SIMPLE</td>
<td>SIMPLE</td>
<td>SIMPLE</td>
<td>SIMPLE</td>
<td>SIMPLE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COMPLEX</td>
<td>SIMPLE</td>
<td>SIMPLE</td>
<td>SIMPLE</td>
<td>SIMPLE</td>
<td>SIMPLE</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fig. 76: Act II, No. 17, Duet, Captain and Deadeye
Figure 77: Act II, No. 17, Duet, Melodic Contours, Phrasing and Recurrence, Variation, and Contrast Patterns at Half-Phrase Level
CHAPTER XIV

No. 18, CONCERTED PIECE: A SERIES OF PERIPETIES CULMINATES
ON A FALSE REVERSAL AND A PREMATURE APOTHEOSIS.

The succession of brief discrete musical numbers
interspersed with spoken dialogue that hitherto made up the
second act is broken by a large composite number at this
point. This number is almost as long as the Finale I, the
longest number in the opera (Ch. X, Figures 36 through
50, pp. 468-482). Like the latter, the former consists of
smaller, structurally independent, pieces. Unlike it, it
does not have an overarching harmonic underpinning (see
Chapter X, Example 260, p. 484): it is organized around
two smaller harmonic arches on relatively independent
levels. Thus, the harmonic symmetry and corresponding
closural effect in the largest dimensions of the first act
Finale's I IV I structure which mark the peak of plot's
action are avoided. The chain-like juxtaposition of the
two arches in the largest dimensions of the present com-
posite piece avoids any obvious dominant relationships
in these dimensions through a flat mediant relationship
(Figures 78 through 92, pp. 742-756).

667
Since this number contains the final series of peripeties, discoveries and reversals, but stops short of the denouement, the lack of a harmonic rounding-off may be perceived as a subtle structural reflection in the largest dimensions of the number's transitional dramatic function.

Chorus and Soli: The Elopement Attempted

The first of the series of discrete components in the concerted piece is a chorus and soli ensemble for the crew and every character with the exception of Hebe and Sir Joseph. Its text consists of a quatrains and a sestain, reiterated prosodically. There is considerable ambiguity in the identification of the latter stanza as a sestain. While the opening quatrains is unequivocally delineated through alternately rhymed lines of trochaic tetrameter whose only irregularities consist of catalexes at the end of the second and fourth lines, abab₄, the following heterometric sestain cddc₂dd₂ presents considerable prosodic ambiguities. The first four lines may be scanned as a tetrametric couplet whose internal rhymes have been placed in contiguous lines, and the closural trimeters considered an epiphoric stichomythic couplet in either instance. The rather peculiar rhyming scheme of either the quatrains cdddd or the sestain cddcddd can be readily justified by the text enhancing provided by the resultant stichomythia and
epiphora (Example 367).


All. Carefully on tiptoe stealing, a
Breathing gently as we may, catalexis b
Every step with caution feeling, a
We will softly steal away. catalexis b

(The Captain stamps)

All. Goodness me - catalexis c
Why, what was that? d
Dick. Silent be, catalexis c
It was the cat! d
All. It was - it was the cat! d
Capt. They're right - it was the cat! d

(The Captain produces a cat-of-nine-tails)

The setting of the text is the familiar combination of a accentual syllabic procedure with quantitative and neumatic elements functioning as frames in the first period (Figs. 78. phrases a and a1, mm. 2-10, p. 742), and a quantitative syllabic procedure in the second period (F. 78, phrases a2 and a3, mm. 10-18). The former procedure is used to describe the current action in a matter-of-factly manner; the latter procedure with its agogic enhancement of
the stressed syllables is used as an affective enhancement of a text which presents the company's agitation at hearing suspicious noises (Example 368).

Example 368. Gilbert and Sullivan, "Ensemble: Carefully on Tiptoe Stealing," HMS Pinafore, Act II, No. 18, mm. 2-18, passim.

The closing period is also a combination of the accentual and quantitative procedures in both simultaneous and successive fashions (Example 369).

Example 369. Ibid., mm. 18-27, passim.
The character of the ensemble's principal motive resembles closely that of the Italianate choruses from Michael Balfe's operas (Examples 370 and 370a).

Example 370. Ibid., mm. 2-4.


The four-square metric character of the piece is reinforced by the regular four-measure phrasing pattern. The latter is delineated both by melodic contouring (Fig. 79, p. 743) and by cadential incidence (Fig. 78, Full, Half, and Quarter Cadence initials, p. 742). The regularity of the phrasing pattern is further enhanced by the half-phrase caesural symmetry in every phrase (Fig. 79). The striding congruence of the syllabic elements and the accompaniment in the first period with the metric continuum may be perceived as a tone-painting illustration of the tip-toeing mentioned in the text (Example 371).

The piece's principal manner of growth at half-phrase level is variation. This may be seen in the 1:7:2 ratio between recurrence, variation, and contrast at that level (Fig. 79, RVC markings, p. 743). In the larger dimensions the manner of growth is also variation, duly reflected in the phrase and section symbolizations (Fig. 76, lower and upper case letter A markings with numerical subscripts, p. 665). The section A (Figure 76, mm. 1-18) is repeated strophically, the section A1 (Fig. 76, mm. 18-27) is not. This results in an arrangement not unlike the AAB bar form, except that the closural section is a variant and not an contrasting one. The simple harmonic structure subtly stresses the unifying element in the variational procedure by providing an identically digressive two-part underpinning to both the repeated initial section and the closural variant. The digression from the piece's G major main tonal level is to the flat mediant level. This choice
of a secondary level provides a Phrygian inflection in
the melody without abandoning the major mode. Thus, the
music reflects again the apprehensiveness of the text in
a traditional manner, without resorting to the minor mode
in an outright fashion (Fig. 78, mm. 10-15, 22-27, p. 742,
and Example 372) thus saving it for a more acute event.

Example 372. Ibid., Harmonic and Form-Of Outline.

Key of G major

A

a (mm. 1-6) a1 (mm. 6-10)

over tonic pedal in bass

a2 (mm. 10-14)

5: [IVm7 V7/III III 6 IVm7 V7/III III (III of ImT reflects
Phrygian inflection in melody)

a3 (mm. 14-18)

β ap. β G, [I6 V7 I

A1

a4 (mm. 18-22) a5 (mm. 22-27)
I V7 I V7 I dII6 I6 I (dII reflects Phrygian inflection
over tonic pedal in bass 5 4 in melody)

1. Kimmel. loc. cit.
The piece is scored for two clarinets, bassoon, two horns, and strings. The orchestration is a simple as the harmonies, with the metric continuum-congruent accompaniment assigned to the strings, the horns, and the bassoon, and the doubling of the unison male chorus to the two clarinets. The instruments are kept in their low registers, the clarinets perforce using their chalumeau notes. The resultant dark instrumental color provides an excellent musical illustration of the moment's stealth (Example 373). The dynamics of the piece are predominantly pianissimo, with crescendi preceding closural half-phrases, and with brief fortissimo chords representing the Captain's stamping and cracking of the whip, and framing the repeated sections (Examples 374 and 374a). When the chorus divides into four-part homophony, the clarinets, horns, and bassoon abandon their previous, and predominant, function and double every part of the chorus (Example 375).

Example 373. Ibid., passim.
Example 374. Ibid., mm. 8-10, passim.

Example 374a. Ibid., strophic repeat.

Example 375. Ibid., mm. 18-22, passim
The piece ends with an *a capella* four-part treatment of the last cadential half-phrase. The *pianissimo* ending provides a dynamic lull that contrasts very effectively with the forthcoming transition *fortissimo* to the next discrete segment (Figure 80, mm. 28–30, p. 744). An anticipation of this *fortissimo* may be seen in the **chords that are reinforced by the bass drum and cymbal (see Example 374a).**

The piece's fabric is mostly of the polarized melody/accompaniment type, and the texture ranges from medium to light. There is some sectional specialization in the doubling of the vocal lines by the winds, and the steady accompanying function of the strings. The textural complexity increases slightly throughout the piece, and this may be perceived as reflective of the conspirators' progress. (Example 376).

**Example 376. *Ibid.* Fabric and Texture Outline.**
Chorus, Solo, Duet: the Elopement Foiled and Authority Defied

The Captain makes his appearance from concealment as the lovers aided by the crew prepare to leave the ship. He addresses his daughter in a sarcastic manner, barely restraining his anger, with a rhetorical question pointing out to her the impropriety of socializing with his crew. The immediate reaction comes not from either Ralph or Josephine, as may be expected, but from the crew, who, still primed with Sir Joseph's demagoguery, repeat the Captain's undemocratic words with incredulous indignation. The text consists of three brace quatrains, with the third being a strophomythic reiteration of the second with some modifications. The metric scheme of the stanzas is irregular, as if reflecting through abrupt stress pattern changes the agitation of the Captain and the subsequent indignation of the crew. All lines in the three quatrains are dimetric, but the quality of their feet varies considerably: the anapaest is the predominant one, but it is often supplanted by iambics and amphibrachys. Both the anapaests and the amphibrachys are occasionally augmented by a hypermetric feminine rhyme. The amphibrachic lines do not appear until the second stanza, and this gradual introduction of longer feet creates an additive effect parallel to the Captain's mounting anger (Example ???).

After the crew's reaction comes Ralph's, and, as in previous outpourings, he speaks in terms oddly discrepant with his humble origins. His lofty diction is cast into the heroic stanza: an alternately rhymed quatrains of iambic pentameter. This is followed by two similarly rhymed quatrains of iambic tetrameter, in which Ralph is joined by Josephine. The shorter meter here underscores the growing agitation of the lovers, and the stress and rhyme pattern unifies these two quatrains with the preceding
heroic stanza. The tone is one of defiance: Ralph has looked above his station on the strength of his nationality. He is and Englishman, and the complicating function of Sir Joseph's demagoguery again rears its silly head (Example 378).

Example 378. Ibid., 130.

Ralph. Proud officer, that haughty lip uncurl! a
Vain man, suppress that supercilious sneer, b
For I have dared to love your matchless girl, a
A fact well known to all my messmates here! b

Ralph and Josephine
I/He, humble poor, and lowly born, c
The meanest in the port division -
The butt of spaulleted scorn -
The mark of quarter-deck derision -
Have/Has dared to raise my/his wormy eyes e
Above the dust to which you'd mould me/him (c)
In manhood's glorious pride to rise, e
I am/He is an Englishman - behold him/me! f
The transition from the initial G major ensemble to the following D major soli, chorus, and duet, is effected through a three-measure fortissimo Grand Tutti of pairs of flutes and clarinets, oboe, bassoon, pairs of horns, cornets, and trombones, timpani, and strings. The Grand Tutti, sustained and tremolando, is preceded by an upward triplet run in the violins. The chord itself is a dominant seventh of the dominant in the old key of G major and consequently the dominant seventh of the new key of D major (Example 379).

The Captain is assigned the exclamation "Hold!" on the root of the Grand Tutti chord. However, this exclamation is traditionally shouted and not sung. The Grand Tutti culminates on two punctuating chords on the same dominant seventh, and the Captain begins his reproaches. His dimetric brace quatrains are set in rapidly changing scansion; the initial anapaestic lines are set quantitatively, with the gradual appearance of hypermetric syllables and amphibrachys treated accentually. The return of the regular anapaest at the end of each quatrains is marked by a return to quantitative scansion in the setting. This makes for a procedural arch, quantitative/accenual/quantitative, in each quatrains setting. Since each of the stanzas coincides with a four-measure phrase, harmonically and melodically delineated, the phrases are also quantitatively framed (Example 380).

Example 380. Ibid., mm. 30-44, passim.
The regular four-measure phrasing pattern is broken up by the linear insertions of orchestral frames at the end of the first and third phrases (Fig. 80, mm. 34-35 and 43-44, p. 744). The frames consist of motivic material derived from the quantitative anapaestic setting (Example 381).

Example 381. Ibid., Instrumental Phrase Frames, passim.

Thus, the phrasing continuum of $4+4+4$ measures is expanded to $4+1+4+4+1$ measures, or, in consideration of the strong caesure, to $2+2+1/2+2/2+2+1$. The melodic contours confirm the caesural perception. They are varied, and include broken descending lines and irregular arches, one of them inverted. At the same half-phrase level, variation predominates slightly over contrast as a manner of growth (Fig. 82, p. 746).

The harmonic scheme of the solo and chorus is extremely simple: the customary digression to the dominant at the end of the first section is devoid of a $V/V$. Instead, the dominant chord is approached from a $I_6$. The rest of the phrases, and here they are synonymous with sections, end
on the tonic. The three phrases are practically limited to alternations of tonic and dominant chords, with an initial diminished supertonic seventh serving as an appoggiatura chord to the tonic, and a non-dominant supertonic seventh replacing the subdominant in the tonic cadential progressions (Example 382).

Example 382. *Ibid.* Harmonic Outline, mm. 28-44.

Transition: key of G major to key of D major (mm. 28-30)

\[
\begin{array}{ccc}
G & I \\
D & IV & V_7
\end{array}
\]

A

a (mm. 30-35)

\[
2X(dII_6 \text{ ap. chord to I}) \text{ ap.}\ V_7 \ I \ I_6 \ V \ I_6 \ V \ I_6 \ V \ I_6 \ V
\]

a1 (mm. 35-39)

\[
V_2 \ I_6 \ V_7 \ I \ V_7 \ I \ II_6 \ V \ I_6 \ V
\]

a2 (mm. 39-44)

see preceding phrase -- final tonic D becomes mediant of the forthcoming tonal level

Of course, the extreme harmonic simplicity should be viewed in conjunction with the briefness of this section and the Allegro tempo indication. In this context, it helps to establish the tonic rather firmly before the contrasting
section on the flat mediant, which sets Ralph’s reply to the Captain’s berating of Josephine (Fig. 81, mm. 44-53).

The strophic mythic aspect of the textual reiteration is fully carried over into the setting: the crew, tenors and basses, repeat the Captain’s second phrase note by note (Fig. 80, phrases a1 and a1’, mm. 35-39 and 39-44, p. 744). This may be perceived also as an additional factor in the establishment of a main tonality.

Ralph’s heroic quatrain, introduced abruptly on the flat mediant level of B-flat major, features a sharp contrast between the settings of its first and second lines on the one hand and its third and fourth on the other. The first two lines are set accentually with quantitative frames that outline the iambic tetrameters in the text and the two-measure half-phrase in the music. The two half-phrases thus outlined are sequentially related, but the sequential procedure is varied elegantly by the alteration of one note in the melodic cadence of the second half-phrase (Example 383 and Fig. 81, mm. 44-53, p. 746).

Example 383. Ibid., mm. 44-48.
The third and the fourth lines of Ralph's heroic quatrain abandon the accentual setting of their predecessors for a quantitative setting with accentual outer phrase frames. The caesural element, which was quantitative, and therefore agogic, in the preceding two lines (see Example 383) is now provided by melodic contour. The closing frame is a variant of the frames in the Captain's preceding arioso and chorus (see Example 381, p. 682). It is worth noting that the earlier frames are instrumental, whereas the frame of Ralph heroic stanza is a setting of the Captain's exclamation "Oh, horror!" Thus, the former have an anticipating function of the latter in addition to their immediate structural function (Example 384).

Example 384. Ibid., mm. 48-53.

The Captain's exclamation concludes the harmonically contrasting section, and, just as it was introduced by means of pivot tone D, the return to the main key is effected in the same manner, through the same note (Fig. 81, mm. 44 and 54, p. 745).
The returning pivoting tone is given added prominence by its extreme elongation. This produces a spondaic effect in the first syllable on which Josephine joins Ralph. In fact, she anticipates him by half a measure, an effect both coloristic and characterizing. The latter, of course, reflects Josephine's courage, while the former enhances the structural function of the pivoting tone.

The duet that follows Ralph's heroic quatrain is set as a vocal obbligato to an orchestral reiteration of the anapaestic Captain's arioso and chorus (see Fig. 80, p. 744). While the orchestra reiterative variant resembles the original very closely, subdominant digression notwithstanding, the vocal obbligato is thematically unrelated to anything preceding it, except in the accentual pairs of eighth-notes that frame its two phrases (Example 385).

Example 385. Ibid., mm. 54-62.
The quantitative elements of the vocal obbligato that sets the first quatrains of the duet serve as the motivic material of the following quatrains's setting. The melodic contours of this setting consist of ascending half-phrase sequences, a step apart from each other. The persistent repetition of the dotted quantitative pattern heightens the affective character of this impassioned declaration, further intensified by a soprano/tenor octave doubling of the vocal line. The sequential treatment also delineates the half-phrases. The phrases, by contrast, are delineated by accentual frames. The last phrase's frame is, like the half-phrase in which it occurs, augmented, and its increased scope frames the entire piece and provides continuity of the framing procedure. The augmentation and the frame are coincident with a full cadential progression and the resolution, which occurs on the final frame is enhanced by the traditional expedient of an appoggiatura on the exclamation "behold him!" (Example 386).

Example 386. Ibid., mm. 62-72.
The full authentic cadence that ends the duet is followed by a plagal cadence in the male chorus that sets an epiphoric repetition of the duet's last line "He is and Englishman!" (Fig. 81, mm. 72-74, p. 745). The solemn character of the latter, usually associated with the liturgical Amen, is underscored by a further and greatest augmentation of the quantitative elements of the setting. The plagal cadence is followed by another epiphoric repetition of the cited line, this time by the Boatswain, and on a half-cadence in the dominant (Fig. 81, mm. 74-76). While the plagal cadence solemnly frames the duet and the preceding arioso, both harmonically and through the volume of its Grand Tutti orchestration (see Example 379, p. 680), the following half-cadence introduces the next discrete component of the big Scena, a song and chorus in praise of the Englishman.

The harmonic scheme of Ralph's heroic stanza and his following duet with Josephine complements that of the preceding arioso with chorus. The flat mediant level that brings out the heroic stanza through tonal contrast is followed by the main key's return in the modified recapitulation. Overall, the harmonies of the contrasting section (Fig. 81, section B, mm. 44-53) and the modified recapitulation (Fig. 81, section A1, mm. 54-68) are simple. It is the closing section that introduces harmonic digressions, coinciding with the mounting excitement of the
quantitative augmentation and the rising sequential treatment of the half-phrases (Fig. 81, section C, mm. 62-72, p. 745). Thus, the closural increase in harmonic activity has both a structural and a characterizing function (Examples 387 and 387a).

Example 387. Ibid., Harmonic Outline, mm. 44-62.

```
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>B</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>b</td>
<td>(mm. 44-48)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D:</td>
<td>flat VI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eb:</td>
<td>I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>V7 I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IV6 I ap. IV6 I IV I6 dVII4 V7 I</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>c1+a1 (mm. 54-58)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eb:</td>
<td>V/II</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D:</td>
<td>IV dV ap. IV V6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IV IV6 I</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>c2+a3 (mm. 58-62)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>IV</td>
<td>dV ap. IV dVII2 I6 ap. V7 I</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
```
Example 387a. Ibid., Harmonic Outline, mm. 62-76.

C
c3 (mm. 62-66)
V_2/IV IV_6 VII_6/IV IV V_2/V VII_6 V_4/IV VII_6/V II/IV

c4 (mm. 66-74)
V_2/VI VII_6

Full Cad.

The phrasing and sectional symbolizations in the Figures 80 and 81 (pp. 744 and 745, respectively) show an A B A1 C outline in the largest dimensions. This outline is a procedural combination of contrast and modified recurrence. The middle dimensions show a similar procedural combination with closural contrasting material deriving in effect from the obbligato in the modified recapitulation
(compare phrases c1 and c2 in the section A1 with the phrases c3 and c4 in the section C, Fig. 81, mm. 54-68, p. 745). The section and phrase structure of the piece may be outlined as follows (Example 388):

Example 388. Ibid., Form-Of Outline, Phrase and Section Symbolization, mm. 28-76

A     B     A1     C
a a1 a1' b c a2+c1 a3+c2 c3 c4

* Capital and lower case symbolizations in reference to measures in the Figures 80 and 81, pp. 744 and 745, respectively.

The phrase/measure relationship in the heroic quatrain and the following duet adheres closely to the four-four-measure phrasing continuum, more so than the preceding arioso and chorus. The latter's steady supernumerary bars within a four-measure framework are replaced in the former by a framing extra measure in Ralph's quatrain, containing the Captain's exclamation (Fig. 81, mm. 52-53) and by a metric augmentation of the half-phrase preceding the final cadence (Fig. 81, mm. 69-72). The phrasing pattern thus obtained groups its measures in the following fashion:

2+2/2+2+1/2+2/2+2+2/2+4. The transition to the Boat-swain's laudatory song (Fig. 84, p. 748), which laminates a half-cadence with the preceding duet's plagal cadence in antecedent/consequent fashion (Fig. 81, mm. 72-76),
is a strongly caesured four-measure phrase with the resultant 2+2 measure half-phrase structure (Fig. 83, p. 747).

The slight predominance of variation over contrast in the preceding Captain's *ariose* and chorus (Fig. 82, p. 746)' is replaced in the following heroic quatrain and duet by an equally slight predominance of contrast over variation in the same function (Fig. 83). The combination of vocal *obbligato* and a modified recapitulation in the returning variant section (Fig. 81, section A1, p. 745) is an instance of contrast and variation juxtaposed in the largest dimensions (also see Example 385, p. 686).

After the Captain reveals his presence and bars the way of the conspirators on the *Grand Tutti* chord (Ex. 379, p. 686) the orchestration returns to a more modest scoring. The *ariose* of the Captain is accompanied by the strings from the second violins downwards, and his vocal line is doubled at the octave by the first violins, doubled in turn at the higher octave by one flute (Example 389).

The polarized melody/accompaniment fabric of the Captain's *arioso* gets a different treatment in its reiteration by the chorus. The broken-chord accompaniment is assigned exclusively to the strings and the melodic line is doubled in unison and the two octaves above by all woodwinds. The string accompaniment is reinforced in its upper part by the two horns on a dominant inner pedal. The horns tend to blur the contrast between the two choirs' sectional specialization (Example 390).


The *fortissimo* orchestral frame is given to the woodwinds, horns, and strings in an all-doubled, homophonic four-part figure (*fig. 80, mm. 43–44, p. 744*). It is the framing culmination of the two preceding phrases' orchestrated dynamics, progressing from *piano* and *mezzo forte* (Example 390, above) to the brief *fortissimo* in the partial
orchestral *Tutti* (Example 391).

Example 391. *Ibid.*, mm. 43-44.

The setting of Ralph's heroic quatrain that follows retains the sectional specialization of the preceding section, albeit in a reduced scoring: the broken chord accompaniment is relegated to the strings alone without the erstwhile horn reinforcement and the voice is doubled by the solo oboe instead of the entire woodwind section. (Example 392).

The duet of Ralph and Josephine returns to the orchestration of the Captain's *arioso* melody in the first violins, doubled by the flute at the octave, and accompaniment in the rest of the strings. The one marked difference between the original statement of this thematic material in the *arioso* and its recapitulation in the duet is that the recapitulation begins on the subdominant and is completely orchestral (Example 393).

Example 393. *Ibid.*, mm. 54-62.

The closing section that sets the second stanza of the duet features again a sectionally specialized orchestration. Its character differs from the previous such procedure (Example 390, p. 693) since none of the sections is used to double the vocal line: the two clarinets and the horn sustain the harmonies while the strings provide an Albert-bass accompaniment to the vocal unison line
up to the final cadence (Example 394).

Example 394. Ibid., mm. 62-68.

At the final authentic cadence woodwinds and horns sustain the harmonies over a dibrach in the strings. A string arpeggio leads from the authentic closure to the plagal epiphora in the full chorus and orchestra (Example 395).

Example 395. Ibid., mm. 69-74.
The composite piece's fabric is predominantly of the polarized melody/accompaniment kind. The predominant texture is light and simple (Example 396).

Example 396. Ibid., Fabric and Texture Outline, mm. 28-76.
The brief appearances of a four-part homophonic fabric among the vastly predominant polarization of melody and accompaniment have a framing function; they occur at the very beginning, at the end of Ralph's *arioso*, and at the very end, on the plagal cadence. The predominantly light texture is likewise interrupted by instances of a heavy texture, which also may be seen as a framing procedure, since these increases of textural weight occur at both ends of the piece as well as at the end of the Captain's *arioso*. The two external frames of textural weight coincide with the external homophonic fabric frames, while the internal frames do not. This may be perceived as an adventitious balance of unity and contrast. The textural complexity shows a slight increase from the initial, and predominant, simplicity. This complexity is a function, respectively, of reiterative variation in the choral reprise of the Captain's *arioso*, and of modified recapitulation in the Ralph and Josephine duet (see Example 396 and Examples 390 and 393, respectively, pp. 693 and 695).
Solo and Chorus: Boatswain and Sailors Glorify Ralph in the First Premature Apotheosis.

The epiphoric reiteration of the duet's last line that closes the composite **arioso-chorus-arioso-duet** is picked up by the Boatswain in a transitionally half-cadence that sets up the introduction of an entirely new discrete number in the same key as its predecessor (Example 397).

Example 397. *Ibid.*, mm. 72-76.

The text of this song and chorus is a laudatory description of Ralph's intrinsic worth as an Englishman. It is a parody of such patriotic verse as that of the British poetaster Eliza Cock (1817-?), whose poem "The Englishman" has an epiphoric ending in every stanza that reminds the readers of the superb qualities of the Englishman (Example 398).

'Tis the star of earth, deny it who can,
The island home of an Englishman.

Its honor is stainless, deny it who can,
And this is the flag of an Englishman.

'Tis a rich rough gem, deny it who can,
And this is the heart of an Englishman.

For a glorious charter, deny it who can,
Is breathed in the words "I'm an Englishman."

These fulsome sentiments are a direct echo of the celebrated "Rule, Britannia!" by James Thomson (1700-1748) set to music by the redoubtable Dr. Arne. Gilbert's parody is set in three quatrains with a closural reiteration of the last stanza. The epiphoric reiteration of certain lines among the stanzas imparts a rondoid character to the entire poem providing the brace-rhymed quatrains with hyper-stanzaic unity. There is considerable metric variety in every quatrain: the basic iambics are often replaced at the beginning of a line with an anapaestic anacrusis, and at the end of a line with a hypermetric feminine rhyme in the guise of an amphibrachic foot. In fact, the anacrustic beginning outnumbers the regularly iambic. The hypermetric line ending occurs only in the inner lines of the brace
quatrain, which underscores this particular rhyming pattern (Example 399).


Boat. "He is an Englishman! by parallelism
For he himself has said it, by m.
and it's greatly to his credit,
That he is an Englishman!

All. "That he is an Englishman! h.m.

Boat. "For he might have been a Roosian,
A French, or Turk, or Proosian,
Or perhaps Italian!

All. "Or perhaps Italian!
But in spite of all temptations
To belong to other nations,
He remains an Englishman!

All. For in spite, etc.

It is, of course the rhyme and line a (capital A when reiterated literally or with slight modifications) that binds the three quatrains into a rondoid structure AbbA1: A1cca adda 3.
The enumeration of different nations to which our hero could belong, but wisely chose the British, is reminiscent of the enumeration of ancient heroes who do not quite compare to the British Grenadiers in the eponymous song (Example 400).


Some talk of Alexander,
And some of Hercules,
Of Hector and Lysander,
And such great names as these.

But of all the world's brave heroes
There's none that can compare
With a tow, row, row, row, row
To the British Grenadiers.

The apothecary parody is set as a solo song with epiphoric reiterations by the chorus (Fig. 84, p. 748). The setting is predominantly syllabic with neumatic half-phrase frames, and an extensive fioritura functioning as a closural device in the largest dimensions. The scansion is predominantly accentual, with quantitative elements appearing in anacrustic figures, and therefore complementing the framing function of the closural neumes in the half-phrases. The closural half-phrase combines a quantitative anacrusis with two isometric, and hence accentual, neumes, and a terminal fioritura that is a quantitative exaggeration of the amphimacric word "Englishman" (Example 401).

For he himself has said it, And it stands by his head:

That he is an English-man, That he is an English-man!

Or perhaps J.-fa-li-an or Fa-li-an!

But in spite of all imp. hind to return to oth. or - mon.

He is none an English-man

An ad - mony an Eng - -- - - lish-man!

Chanted Introitus.
The song's closural fioritura are quite reminiscent of similar ornaments in the setting of the verse in the already cited "Rule, Britannia." However, in the latter they occur mostly as tone painting rather than as frames (Example 402).

Example 401. Thomas Arne and James Thomson, "Rule, Britannia," from the masque Alfred (1740), mm. 4-16.

The phrasing pattern is based upon a regular four-measure phrase with a strong caesura providing linear symmetry in the half-phrases. The only departure from the resultant 2+2 phrasing continuum is coincident with the closural fioritura and has, therefore, a framing function in the largest dimension of the piece. The predominant manner of growth at the half-phrase level is contrast in a ratio of 6:4 with recurrence. The incidence of variation at this level is negligible (Fig. 85, p. 749).
The regularity of the phrasing pattern may be perceived as a larger-dimension correspondent of the syllabic elements' coincidence with the metric continuum (see Example 401, p. 704). This is further reinforced by a strongly delineated "walking" figure in the bass, also congruent with the metric continuum and the syllabic elements (Example 402).

The harmonic scheme of the piece matches its anthem-like simplicity. Its only digression is a middle section on the dominant level that creates a I V I structure in the largest dimensions (Example 403).

Example 403. Ibid., Harmonic Outline.

Key of D major
A
a (mm. 76-80)  
I 6 ap.V₇ I V₆ I₆ V₆ I₆ ap.V₇ I V₆ I₆  
all phrases with closural elisions.

b (mm. 80-84)
(I) IV ap.IV₆ I 6 V₄ I V₆ V₄ V  
3/₃/V

A₁ (on the dominant level)
a₁ (mm. 84-88)
V₆ 2X(VII₆/V V₉/V III₇ V₆ V₆ V₆ 5) literal reiteration in half-phrases.

b₁ (mm. 88-92)  
2X(I V₆ ap.V₇/V V)  
"" ""

A₂
a₂ (mm. 92-96)
see harmonies in phrase a above.

b₂ (mm. 96-101)
(I) IV ap.IV₆ I 6 V₇ I VI I₆ V₄ I 6 ap.V₇ ant.I  

The uninterrupted major mode of the piece produces a feeling of content solemnity in combination with the stately tempo and strongly delineated elements of a march-like meter.

The cadential pattern in the harmonic scheme is such that the half- and full cadences (Fig. 84, mm. 83-84, 91-92, and 100-101, p. 748) encompass two phrases at a time. This hypermetric phrase framing is entirely consistent with the sentence structure of the text: the first phrase of the pair so delineated always contains a subordinate clause, and the second phrase the corresponding main clause (Example 404).

Example 404. Ibid., mm. 76-101, passim,
The phrases' thematic symbolizations indicate a combination of variation and contrast as the principal manner of growth in the largest dimension. The sectional symbolizations indicate strophic variation when perceived in juxtaposition with the text. Thus, an ABA harmonic scheme underlies an A A1 A2 A2' thematic structure (Example 405).

Example 405. Ibid., Form-Of Outline, mm. 76-101.

A (mm. 76-84) A1 (mm. 84-92) ∥:A2 (mm. 92-101):∥
a b a1 b1 a' b2
I V I

The considerable similarity between theme a and theme b may provide an additional perception of the song as a monothematic, spun-out, structure (Example 406).

Example 406. Ibid., mm. 76-84, passim.
The orchestration is as uncomplicated as befits the four-part homophonic fabric and the simple texture of the piece. Any substantial changes in orchestration are dictated by corresponding changes in textural weight, in turn coincident with solo and choral passages, respectively (Example 407).

Example 407. Ibid., Predominant Orchestration Types, passim.

The solo passages are scored for strings, with the slightly differentiated surface part assigned to the first violin. The choral unison in the reiterative phrases is supported by the continuing four-part homophony in the strings, doubled fully in the woodwinds and horns. The flute doubles the upper voice at the octave, and the D major key allows for a resonant string section. From the structural standpoint the increases in textural weight and mixed sonority effected by the choral and orchestral tutti have a framing function. The second half-phrases of the
phrases b and b1 frame the sections A and A1, respectively, through such an increase in dynamic and timbral scope. The entire section A2 with its closural fioritura and phrasing irregularity is given additional framing quality by the linear increase of the larger dynamic and timbral scope in its choral reprise (Example 408).

Example 408. Ibid., Fabric and Texture Outline, mm. 76-101.

There is a slight discrepancy between the vocal score and the set of orchestral parts in the returning phrase a'. The latter features a clarinet solo in canon inc imitation with the vocal line;¹ the former recapitulates

literally the initial phrase. The canonic imitation also demands a small change in the harmonies of measure 94. Stylistically, the canonic imitation and the attendant harmonic change may be perceived as a modified recapitulation, very much in keeping with previous procedure in this opera and with period practice in general (Example 409).

Example 409. Ibid., mm. 92-96.

In terms of dramatic function, the Boatswain's song and crew's chorus foreshadow the final apotheosis and set up the probability of the impending false reversal. The apotheosizing itself is another consequence of Sir Joseph's demagogy.


3. Cone, loc. cit.
Soli and Chorus: the Fatal Word Effects a False Reversal.

The Captain is momentarily astonished by the crew's support of the eloping lovers, and Sullivan allows for stage business to this effect by the simple expedient of a General Pause. In the vocal scores the General Pause is allowed an entire measure; in the orchestral parts only one beat. This analysis includes the full measure of the vocal score in its measure count, since it is the vocal score that is readily available to readers. In performance, the fermata is likely to render moot any question of notational preference (Fig. 86, m. 102, p. 750).

Regaining his voice, if not his usual composure, the Captain begins to berate Ralph anew. He starts out with some restraint, but the awareness of Ralph's daring gets the best of him and he closes his tirade with an oath. The text of this tirade is cast into two balladic quatrains with a two-fold epiphoric reiteration of the last line. The alternating tetrametric and trimetric lines, typical of the balladic format, are iambic and, for the most part, regular. There are hypermetric endings in each of the tetrametric lines, since they end on feminine rhymes, and the last tetrametric line begins with an anapaestic anacrusis. The additional syllables at either end of the penultimate line allow the Captain to build his rage before the closural line containing the fatal expletive "Dammel!"
The epiphoric reiteration of the line containing the oath makes things only worse: the sisters and cousins and aunts, who have entered during the initial commotion, are treated to the full effect of the Captain's "big, big D..." that he disclaimed so vehemently in his opening song (see Chapter VI, Fig. 15, mm. 46-47, p. 242). Deadeye joins the Captain in the last epiphoric line, having attained at last his dastardly goal (Example 410).


Capt. | In uttering a reprobation |
--- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
To any British tar, | a | b |
I try to speak with moderation, | a | b |
But you have gone too far. | c |
I'm very sorry to disparage | d |
A humble foremost lad, | d |
But to seek your captain's child in marriage, | d |
Why damme, it's too bad!

All. | Oh!
--- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
Capt. | Yes, damme, it's too bad! | d |
All. | Oh!
--- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
Capt. and Dick. | Yes, damme, it's too bad! | d |
The epiphoric reiteration makes for a three-fold utterance of the fatal oath. This makes it rather similar in number and manner of utterance to the three cheers given by the Captain and crew when greeting Sir Joseph on board (Chapter X, Fig. 26, No. 8, mm. 1-6, p. 355). The rather symmetric placement of these two occurrences, approximately midway through the first and second acts, respectively, has both structural and functional significance in the plot. The structural aspect may be perceived in the linear framing of the Captain's progression from urbanity to rage; the functional aspect in his change of behavior apparent in these frames.

The immediate response of Cousin Hebe, extended in the setting to the complete chorus, is one of horrified surprise expressed in a quatrain that retains the rhyming pattern of its immediate predecessors, but assumes dipodic strong-stress metrics (Example 411).

Example 411. Ibid.

Hebe.

Did you hear him - did you hear him?
Oh, the monster overbearing!
Don't go near him - don't go near him -
He is swearing - he is swearing!

a  a  a  a

b

dipodic
quatrain
The dipodic strong-stress pattern in Cousin Hebe's reaction to the Captain's oath allows for a greater amount of syllabic density around the stress nucleus than that of the classic metrics. This elegant device portrays Cousin Hebe's agitation and shock at the Captain's breach of etiquette. Sir Joseph enters upon the scene and, having heard the oath, expresses his disapproval of the Captain's conduct, and, without listening to the latter's reasons, punishes him with cabin arrest. Sir Joseph's lines are cast again in a quatrain. In fact, this stanza may be perceived as a fundamental element of prosodic unity in the entire number (see Examples 367, 377, 378, 399, 410, 411, pp. 669, 678, 679, 701, 713, and 714). The metric features of Sir Joseph's alternately rhymed quatrain are such that the first and third lines are iambic trimeters and the second and fourth lines are dipodic strong-stress verse (Example 412).

Example 412. Ibid., 131-132.

Sir Jos. [My pain and my distress, ]
   [I find it is not easy to express; ]
   [My amazement - my surprise - ]
   [You may learn from the expression of my eyes! ]
It is interesting to note that the ratio between line lengths in Sir Joseph's quatrains (Example 412) is the reverse of the Captain's and Cousin Hebe's quatrains (see Examples 410 and 411, pp. 713 and 714, resp.). It is as if the Captain and Hebe started out with an outpouring contained in the longer first line, and then checked their emotions a bit in the shorter second line, repeating the procedure in the third and fourth lines, respectively. By contrast, Sir Joseph begins with a certain laconic circumspection in the shorter first line, as befits his exalted position, and seems to blurt out more than expected in the longer second line. The procedure is repeated in the third and fourth lines.

The Captain tries to reason with Sir Joseph, and does so in the measured cadences of the heroic stanza, an alternately rhymed quatrain of iambic pentameter. The stanzaic choice may be perceived as an indication that the Captain has regained his composure (Example 413).

Example 413. Ibid., 132.

Capt. My lord - one word - the facts are not before you,

The word was injudicious, I allow - But hear my explanation, I implore you,

And you will be indignant too, I vow!
Sir Joseph, consistently and foolishly headstrong, ignores the Captain's explanations and, as mentioned before, places him under cabin arrest for his unseemly treatment of a sailor. He does so in two alternately rhymed quatrains of iambic trimeter. There are some metric irregularities in the iambics: the even-numbered lines end on two super-numerary unstressed syllables, and there are two anacrustic beginnings. These irregularities are considerably less prominent than the alternations strong-stress and classical verse in Hebe's and Sir Joseph's initial reactions (see Examples 411 and 412, pp. 714 and 715, respectively and Example 414).

Example 414. Ibid.

Sir Jos. I will hear of no defence, 
Attempt none if you're sensible That word of evil sense Is wholly indefensible. Go, ribald, get you hence To your cabin with celerity. This is the consequence Of ill-advised asperity!

All. This is the consequence, etc.
The recurrence of the rhyme a in the two consecutive quatrains provides hyperstanzaic unity. In effect, it creates a rather unusually rhymed octave ababacac₂. This variation on the predominant quâtrain stanza may be perceived as a closural indicator: indeed, Gilbert ends the composite number by reprising Sir Joseph's entrance number with appropriately changed text (Example 415, compare to Example 163, Chapter IX, p. 318) and the apotheotic paean to the Englishman (Example 399, p. 701), this time directed at Sir Joseph.

Example 415. Ibid.

Sir Jos. For I'll teach you all ere long,
To refrain from language strong
For I haven't any sympathy for ill-bred taunts!
Hebe No more have his sisters, not his cousins, nor his aunts.
All. For he is an Englishman, etc.

The Captain retires in shame to his cabin, while the company glorifies Sir Joseph. This second premature apotheosis marks the completion of a false reversal: Sir Joseph will discover to his chagrin the real reason for the Captain's anger, and drop all pretense of democracy.
The setting of the Captain's tirade (Example 410, p. 713) is predominantly quantitative in sharp contrast to the preceding material. This change in scansion results in the agogic enhancement of stressed syllables, and reflects the Captain's mounting agitation. The regularity of the iambic text's agogic rendition is broken by both accentual elements and exaggerations of the quantitative procedure. These irregularities may be perceived as tone painting devices portraying the Captain's gasping invective (Example 416).

Example 416. Gilbert and Sullivan, "In Uttering a Reprobation," HMS Pinafore, Act II, No. 18, mm. 102-122, passim.
The stressed syllables of the text coincide with the longer note values of the 6/8 \( \frac{1}{4} \) setting. In turn, these longer values coincide with the duple metric continuum of the compound meter, imparting a strong rhythmic drive to the entire setting (Fig. 86, mm. 102-122, p. 750). The rhythmic persistency is matched in the middle dimensions by the consistently regular phrasing pattern: the four-measure phrase with a central caesura does not vary throughout the Captain's quatrains (Fig. 88, half-phrase and phrase patterns, up to Transition, p. 752). The melodic contours, however, feature considerable variety ranging from an arch to broken ascents and descents. The longest ascent precedes the fatal word "Dammel!" which occurs on the peak of that ascent, and is followed by an abrupt descent and two shorter ones containing reiterations of this dramatically crucial oath. Thus, the dramatic peak of the text is marked with the greatest melodic excursion of the setting (Fig. 88, phrase a3).

The harmonic scheme of the Captain's tirade is very simple. The setting is in F major, which is in a flat mediant relationship with the preceding chorus' D major (Fig. 84, p. 748). The procedure is quite reminiscent of the harmonic contrast in the discrete segment preceding the apotheotic chorus just mentioned (see Figs. 80 and 81, mm. 44 and 45, respectively, pp. 744 and 745).
the flat submediant is used as an element of central contrast in the largest dimensions. In both cases, the common tone between the new remote level and the established tonic is used as a pivot. All phrases are cadentially delineated except for the first one, which merely ends on the dominant seventh in lieu of a vamp-like introduction. The other phrases cadence on their respective tonal levels: the second phrase progresses from the tonic to the dominant through a half-cadence, the third phrase begins on the submediant level as the relative minor of the dominant just attained with a quarter-cadence on the former tonal level closing it locally, and the fourth phrase progresses from the dominant to the tonic, ending on a full cadence. The fifth phrase is merely a reiteration of the cadential structure of the preceding phrase. Except for the digression to the sub-mediant on the third phrase and the conventional half-cadence, the harmonies are limited to the tonic and dominant chords of the main tonal level. This extreme economy of the harmonic palette allows the diminished seventh of the dominant that announces the Captain's faux pas to stand out boldly (fig. 86., m. 117, p. 750).

While the surface thematic organization shows an open chain of variants (a a1 a2 a3 a4), the harmonic underpinning is a closed structure whose tonal levels may be translated from I I III I I to A A B A A as shape symbolizations (see Example 417, p. 417).

Key of F major: phrase delineations by tonal level and cadential pattern.

\[
\begin{array}{cccccc}
  a & a_1 & a_2 & a_3 & a_4 \\
  I & V_7 & I & V & III & I-----
\end{array}
\]

HC QC FC FC

Form-of symbolizations in reference to Figure 86, p. 750

Key of F

a (mm. 102-106)

\[
\begin{array}{cccccc}
  I & 6 & I & 6 & V_4 & 9 & 6 \\
  4 & 4 & 3 & 9 & 5
\end{array}
\]

a1 (mm. 106-110)

\[
\begin{array}{cccccc}
  V_7 & I & 6 & I & VI_7 & V_6 & ap.V_7/V & V \\
  4 & 4
\end{array}
\]

a2 (mm. 110-114)

2X(ap.V_7/III III)

a3 (mm. 114-118)

\[
\begin{array}{cccccc}
  V & I & V_4 & I & 6 & dVII_7/V & I_6 & ap.V_7 & I \\
  3 & 4 & \frac{1}{4}
\end{array}
\]

cadential reiteration forms the next phrase

a4 (mm. 118-122)

2X(dVII_7/V I_6 V_7 I)
Just as the diminished seventh of the dominant functions both as a closural indicator and as a device of traditional affective characterization, the minor mode in the third phrase (Fig. 86, mm. 110-114, p. 750) serves characterization in the same conventional manner: at that point there is a lull in the Captain's rage in which he regrets his abuse of Ralph. The cadential reiteration that forms the last phrase in the setting is a faithful reflection of the text's ephiphoric single-rhyme closure (see Example 410, p.

The orchestration is extremely simple and transparent, consisting of string chords on the duple elements of the metric continuum (Example 418). The exclamations of the crew and ladies are reinforced by a woodwinds and horns chord, an example of Sullivan's parsimonious effectiveness (Example 419).

Example 418. Ibid., passim.

The fabric of the piece features melody/accompaniment, polarization, and its texture is light and simple. The brief exclamations of the assembly are heavily textured and their placement before the final cadence may be perceived as a closural indicator (Example 420).

The setting of Cousin Hebe's reaction to the Captain's unseemly language (Fig. 87, p. 571) serves as a transition between the Captain's tirade and Sir Joseph's lengthier reaction to the same transgression (Figs. 89 and 91, pp. 753 and 755, respectively).

Hebe's initial shock is represented by a frantic figure in the horns: the pivoting tone between F major and D minor is repeated in octaves on the compound meter's triple submultiples of the metric continuum (Example 421).

Example 421. Ibid., mm. 122-123.

The introduction of triple submultiples announces a setting of higher rhythmic density than the preceding segment. Cousin Hebe's question "Did you hear him?" is set over a choral **ostinato** in canonic imitation that repeats in shocked disbelief the words "he said damme," in treble and bass. The setting is predominantly accentual with quantitative frames and both manners of scansion are totally syllabic. The accentual elements are given a sort of quantitative spacing in each voice by the insertion of rests between melodic sequences and reiterations within the half-phrase, but the cumulative effect of the **stretto-like**
passage up to its quantitative frames is one of maximum syllabic and accentual density congruent with the triple submultiples of the metric continuum (Example 422).

Example 422. Ibid., mm. 122-131, passim.

The phrasing pattern of the transition is, like that of the preceding segment, cadentially delineated. The cadence that delineates these regular, centrally caesured, four-measure structures (Fig. 88, transition, p. 752) creates a Phrygian inflection effect, since its diminished seventh of the mediant in F major-resolves on the major form of that mediant: the dominant of the relative minor. The melodic surface and the harmonic progression of the transitory setting of Cousin Hebe's reaction are clearly Phrygian (Example 423), an apt introduction to the forthcoming setting of the voice of doom that, however prissy, appears in the menacing minor mode (Fig. 89, phrases a, a', a1, a2, p. 753).
The orchestration of the transition is as simple as that of the preceding segment. After the horn signal (Example 421, p. 725) the strings accompany the choral ostinato imitation of the soloist with the triple submultiples of the compound metric continuum (Example 424).

Example 423. Ibid., Harmonic Outline, mm. 122-133.

Functions in F major terms:

T

t and t' (mm. 122-127 and 128-131, respectively).

2X (ap.V6 7 ap.VI 6 ap.dVII/III V/VI)

Surface: 

Two-phrase melodic contour (6 and 7 above)

Example 424. Ibid., passim.
The transition's fabric is a combination of the continuing melody/accompaniment polarization with a two-part counterpoint in the melodic function. The texture is, therefore, complex, but light, thanks to the transparent accompaniment (Example 425).

Example 425. Ibid., mm. 122-133, Fabric and Texture Outline.

Sir Joseph's minor mode rebuke to the Captain is a logical resolution of the Phrygian transition (34a and Fig. 89, phrases a and a', mm. 131-139, pp. 751 and 753, resp.) His initial quatrains is set in a totally syllabic combination of accentual and quantitative scansion with a diminution in the accentual elements setting the strong-stress multisyllabic lines. The quantitative elements provide initial frames to the settings of the regular iambic lines and pre-closural frames to the settings of the strong-stress lines (Example 426).
Example 426. Ibid., mm. 131-139.

The Captain's reply is also set in a combination of accentual and quantitative scansions. The quantitative scansion with its longer stressed values is used to represent the Captain's deferential manner of addressing Sir Joseph, and the faster accentual scansion with its increased syllabic density to portray the urgent vehemence of the Captain's pleas (Example 427).

Example 427. Ibid., mm. 139-147.
Sir Joseph's haughty rejection of the Captain's excuses is set as a modified reprise of his initial reaction to the latter's oath (see Example 426, p. 729). These modifications arise from the text's avoidance of the strong-stress verse found in Sir Joseph's first reaction (see Example 412, p. 715) and its replacement by iambics with relatively few metric irregularities (Example 414, p. 717). The irregularities that are most relevant to the setting are the hyper-feminine rhyme endings: they are treated by Sullivan as amphimacers, and therefore bring to mind the initial characterization of Captain Corcoran and Sir Joseph as Royal Navy men, the latter sui generis, of course (see Chapter VI, Examples 112, 112a, b, and c, and Chapter VI, Examples 169 and 174, pp. 231, 232, 226 234, 236, and 334). The hornpipe-like endings also serve as phrase frames (Example 428).

Example 428. Ibid., mm. 147-155.
Sir Joseph then decrees the Captain's punishment in two sequentially descending phrases whose only links to the preceding phrases are their amphimacric endings. The setting of these phrases features accentual elements in two dimensions within a predominantly quantitative setting. The accentual scansion allows for considerable agogic enhancement of semantically important elements in the text: the command "Go!" the dactylic treatment of the demonstrative "This is the consequence..." and the adjectival "ill-advised..." when describing the Captain's asperity. The mixed chorus that repeats epiphorically the last two lines of Sir Joseph's text provides a third sequential phrase. However, it is the word "consequence" that receives the agogic stress in this repetition rather that the original original "ill-advised" (Example 429).

Example 429. Ibid., mm. 156-167
Sir Joseph's minor mode rebuke and subsequent rejection of the Captain's excuses are in D minor, that is on the submediant level of the F major on which the Captain began berating Ralph after the first premature apotheosis. They enclose the Captain's excuses which are on the local dominant level, and therefore in the major mode. This modal contrast underscores the anger of Sir Joseph and the forced composure of the Captain (Fig. 89, mm. 131-155, p. 753 and Example 430).

Example 430. Ibid., Harmonic, Form-Of Outline, mm. 131-155.

Key of F major (discrete structure at the submediant level)

A

a and a' (mm. 131-135 and 135-139, resp.)

\[2X(VI \ 6 \ V/VI \ VII \ 7 \ V/VI)\]

B

b (mm. 139-143)

\[V_7/III \ V/VI \ V_6 \ V/VI \ V_6 \ 4/III \ V_7/VII \ V/III\]

b1 (mm. 143-147)

\[V_7/III \ V/VI \ V_6 \ V/VI \ V_6 \ 4/VI \ V_7/III \ V/VI\]

A1

a1 (mm. 147-151)

\[VI \ 6 \ V/VI \ V/VI \ V/VI\]

a2 (mm. 151-155)

\[V_7/II \ V_6 \ V_6 \ V/VI \ V/VI\]
The rebuke-excuse-rejection setting is, in effect, a discrete ternary form-of with the familiar modified recapitulation. The I V I local harmonic scheme (see Example 430) provides a clearly outlined underpinning for the structure described above. Sir Joseph's decree about the Captain's cabin arrest and its epiphoric reiteration by the chorus are harmonically outside of this structure (compare sections A, B, A₁ to section T in Fig. 89, p. 753). The decree and its epiphora are a transition to the forthcoming reprise (Fig. 91, p. 755) and harmonically they are a return to the tonal level of F major (Example 431).


T (return to the tonic level)

\[ t (\text{mm. 156-159}) \]

\[ V^0_{9/II} \quad I^6 \quad V^0_{9/II} \quad I^6 \quad dVII_2 \]

\[ t_1 (\text{mm. 160-163}) \]

\[ V_7 \quad I^6 \quad dVII/V \quad V \]

\[ \text{over dom. ped.} \]

\[ \text{-----Phrygian inflection} \]

\[ t_2 (\text{mm. 164-167}) \]

\[ 2X(I^6mT \quad V_7) \]

\[ \text{-----Phrygian inflection} \]
The harmonic scheme of the transitional section may be perceived in a characterizing function as well as in a structural one; the first phrase of the sequence is on the supertonic of F major, and therefore in the minor mode; the second and third phrases cadence on the dominant of the impending F major level, but do so with a Phrygian inflection (see Example 431 and Fig. 89, section T, mm. 156-167, p. 753). The traditional associations of the minor mode and the Phrygian inflection with unsettling elements are quite in place here since the Captain's fortunes have reverted for the worse.

The orchestration of this segment, as that of its immediate predecessor, is extremely simple. It is confined to the string section which accompanies very discreetly the stanzatic exchanges between Sir Joseph and the Captain (Example 432).

Example 432. Ibid., Orchestration, mm. 131-163, passim.
The fabric of this D minor segment and the following transition progresses from a slight polarization between the melody and the accompaniment in Sir Joseph's stanza to an extreme one in the Captain's. The return of Sir Joseph's setting that creates a ternary structure in this exchange of stanzas (see Example 430, p. 732) is also a return to the less extreme polarization in the fabric. The transition introduces an element of contrast through the homophony of its four-part fabric. The texture is light and simple throughout, with the lightness and simplicity increasing in the last phrase of the transition, assigned to the chorus a capella (Example 433).

Example 433. Ibid. Fabric and Texture Outline, mm. 131-167.

The phrasing of this discrete segment does not deviate from a regular four-measure pattern. The only differentiation between sections that makes any use of phrasing variety is the avoidance of the hitherto present caesural
"For He Is An Englishman" that follows. The first reprise is scored for strings, two solo voices, and chorus (Fig. 91). The addition of the massed voices is gradual, effecting a scored crescendo up to the second reprise. Its fabric progresses from a polarized melody/accompaniment to a combination of an ostinato accompaniment with a homophonic four-part fabric in the chorus. The texture, consequently, progresses from simple to complex and from light to heavy (Example 434).

Example 434. Ibid., Fabric and Texture Outline, mm. 167-183.

In contrast to the first reprise, the second is considerably modified: while its melody and fundamental harmonies remain unchanged (compare Figs. 84 and 92, pp. 748 and 756, respectively), its dynamic scope and ornamental figuration are greatly increased. The former is a function of scoring and orchestration; the reprise is scored for mixed chorus and full orchestra in contrast with the initial woodwinds, horns, strings, and male chorus; the latter is a function of an increase in the rhythmic density
elements in the transitional section. The principal manner of growth at half-phrase level is contrast in the discrete segment and variation in the transitional section. The melodic contours of the half-phrases are varied in the discrete section A B A₁, ranging from irregular arches to a closural unbroken descent. The transitional section seems to enhance its closural potential in terms of melodic contouring by being restricted to unbroken descents in a sequential arrangement (fig. 90, p. 754).

**Solo and Choruses: An Admonitory Reprise and a Second Premature Apotheosis.**

The Phrygian inflection in the transition just described encloses along with a similarly inflected passage a series of unsettling events (see fig. 87, p. 757). Having prepared a resolution on the tonic level in F major, which is the key in which the Captain began to effect his own downfall (see fig. 86, p. 750), the music turns to a reprise of Sir Joseph's original entrance with a text appropriately modified to express his distaste for, and proscription of, "... language strong..." (fig. 91, p. 755; for a detailed analysis see Chapter IX, pp. 316-320, and Figs. 26 and 28, pp. 355 and 357). The reprise of the "I am the Monarch of the Sea" song is an apt transition to the larger scope reprise of the apotheotic chorus.
of the "walking" bass figure throughout the piece (see Fig. 92, bass line throughout, p. 756, and Example 435).

Example 435. Ibid., Orchestration, Scoring, mm. 183-204, passim.

The reprise's harmonies may be outlined thus:

Example 436. Ibid., Harmonic Outline, mm. 183-204.

Key of F major:
introductory half-phrase t (mm. 183-187)
I VI v4 V Half Cadence
3/V

a (mm. 187-194)
V6 I 6 ap.V7 I 6 V 6 6 I 6 ap.V7 I V
passing tones on almost every weak beat of each measure.
as a result of "walking" type of ornamentation in bass.

b (mm. 195-204)
I6 IV 6 double IV6 I v4 I6 V V7 VI I6 IV I6 v4 ant. I
4 3
passing tones: see above.
The notation of the reprise makes for hypermetric phrasing patterns, at least on paper, since there are twice as many measures in the alla breve reprise as in the 4/4 original presentation. The reprise is also somewhat abbreviated, since there is no choral repetition of the solo verse. This makes for a simple binary AB form—of preceded by a half-cadential introduction (Fig. 92, p. 756). The fabric of the piece is homophonic over a figured bass, except in the introductory half-cadence, where it is simply homophonic. The texture of the piece is heavy and timbrally complex, because of the all-doubled orchestration. Again, the half-cadential introduction is somewhat lighter in texture, as if it were providing a step-up transition between the lighter first reprise (Fig. 91, p. 755) the heavier second reprise, which is the timbral and dynamic peak of the composite piece (Example 437).

Example 437. Ibid., Fabric and Texture Outline, mm. 183–204.
Just as the first premature apotheosis glorifies Ralph for his defiance of the Captain and society’s conventions (Figs. 81 and 84, pp. 745 and 748, resp.), the second apotheosis, equally premature, glorifies Sir Joseph for supporting Ralph and punishing the abusive Captain. Both apotheoses are premature, since they do not follow a eucatastrophically satisfactory denouement, but merely enhance two false reversals (Figs. 80 and 89, pp. 744 and 753, respectively). The second of the false reversals, in spite of its imminent cancellation by Sir Joseph’s discovery of the real reason for the Captain’s anger, does foreshadow the final and true reversal. The timbral scope of the Grand Tutti in the second premature apotheosis has a characterizing function: it glorifies the agent of the plot’s main complication.

Structurally, the initial perception of the composite number’s double-arch organization in the largest dimensions is confirmed by the analysis of the tonal levels of its discrete components: a brief “conspiration” chorus (Fig. 78, p. 742) serves as a subdominant introduction to the first arch-like component (Figs. 80 and 81, pp. 744-755). The latter is an arch both harmonically and thematically, and its recurrent harmonic level is extended into the next independent thematic component (Fig. 84, p. 748).

4. Tolkien, loc. cit.
The second arch of the structure contains a smaller arch located in the center of its structure. The outer arch may be perceived as such only in harmonic terms; the inner arch in both harmonic and thematic terms (Figs. 86, 87, 89, 91, 92 on the one hand, and Fig. 89 on the other, pp. 750-756). The recurrent harmonic level of the outer second arch is, like that of the first, extended into the next independent thematic component (Fig. 92). Both arch extensions contain the premature apotheoses, which links musical form with dramatic function. Likewise, the Grand Tutti that briefly but loudly announces the Captain's foiling of the lovers' plans frames the entire series of peripeties after the initial "conspiracy" chorus up to the closural apotheosis with its equally loud and longer Grand Tutti. Of the three Phrygian inflections in the composite number, the first had a purely affective, and therefore characterizing function, whereas the other two serve as harmonic transitions from one discrete component to another in addition to framing both peripeties and the closural false reversal. The harmonic scheme in the largest dimensions shows a flat-midian relationship between the two major arches and a flat-submediant central element in the first arch that anticipates the main tonal level of the second arch in a manner recapitulative of the subdominant relationship between the initial chorus and the first arch (Fig. 93).
Figure 78: Act II, No. 18, Soli and Chorus (mm. 1-27)
Fig. 79: Act II, No. 18, Soli and Chorus (mm. 1-27), Melodic Contours, Phrasing, and Recurrence, Variation, and Contrast Patterns at Half-Phrase Level.
TRANSITION FROM PREVIOUS SECTION:

C.T. CAPTAIN: "HOLO!

String

V7

A Allegro
(a) Captain

Pretty daughter of mine, I insist upon knowing Whence you may be going With these arms of the bride

I (id.) \ \ V I 6 V I 6 V

Text in bass

for my dearest love, Though foes, they could thump an y, Are scarcely fit company, My daughter, for you.

V2 I 6 V I (id.) \ \ V I

CHORUS

Tutti: fransX

Now, look at that, del Thou dost we could thump an y, We're not too fit company For a lady like you

V1 I 6 V I (id.) \ \ V I

Figure 80: Act II, No. 18, Soli and Chorus (mm. 28-30)
Figure 81: Act II, No. 18, Soli and Chorus (mm. 44-76)
Fig. 82: Act II, No. 18, Soli and Chorus (mm. 28-30), Melodic Contours, Phrasing, and Recurrence, Variation, and Contrast Patterns at Half-Phrase Level.
Fig. 31, Act II, No. 18, Mel. Contr., Phrasing and RVC Pat., mm. 44-76
Figure 84: Act II, No. 18, Solo and Chorus (mm. 76-101)
Fig. 85: Act II, No. 18, Soli and Chorus (mm. 76-101), Melodic Contours, Phrasing, and Recurrence, Variation, and Contrast Patterns at Half-Phrase Level.
Figure 80: Act II, No. 18, Soli and Chorus (mm. 102-122)
Figure 87: Act II, No. 18, Solo and Chorus (mm. 122-131)
RVC Patterns

4 mm (1+2) phrasing pattern throughout.

Melodic Contours

Fig. 88: Act II, No. 18, Melodic Contours, Phrasing, and Recurrence, Variation, and Contrast Pattern at the Half-Phrase Level (mm. 102-131)
Figure 89: Act II, No. 18, Soli and Chorus (mm. 131-167)
Fig. 90: Act II, No. 18, Melodic Contours, Phrasing, and Recurrence, Variation, and Contrast at Half-Phrase Level (mm. 131-167)
Figure 91: Act II, No. 18, Sir Joseph's Reprise (mm. 167-183)
Figure 92: Act II, No. 18, Choral Reprise of the Boatswain's Song (mm. 183-204)
Fig. 93: Act II, No. 18, Component Discrete Elements and Plot Correlation
CHAPTER XV

Nos. 19, 20, and 21: OCTET, SONG, ENSEMBLE; AFTER A FINAL FALSE REVERSAL COMES THE TOPSY-TURVY SUCATASTROPHE.

After basking in the glory of the false apotheosis, Sir Joseph, fairly oozing with benevolence, asks Ralph what prompted the Captain to such unseemly behavior. Ralph's purple-prose admission of his love for Josephine causes Sir Joseph to drop all pretense of equality, and he orders Ralph seized. Josephine's pleas for the man she loves make matters worse: the rejected suitor orders Ralph to be loaded with chains and thrown into the ship's dungeon. This is another false reversal, arising logically from Sir Joseph's belated discovery. The delay of this discovery is also a logical development based on Sir Joseph's imperious disregard of his subordinates: note his disregard of the Captain's excuses in Number 18 (Fig. 89, Chapter XIV, p. 753). At this point it is interesting to observe the care with which Sir Joseph's character is delineated: his hypocrisy is revealed when the punishment meted to Ralph is compared to that meted to the Captain. The former is chained and thrown into a dungeon for successfully rivaling Sir Joseph in love; the latter is merely
confined to his cabin for transgressing Sir Joseph's foremost rule. Ralph bids farewell to Josephine on his way to imprisonment, Sir Joseph is adamant, and the others commiserate with Ralph in an octet. The closural pitying is expressed in a manner reminding listeners that this is a comedy, unsettling elements notwithstanding (Ex. 438).


Ralph.

Farewell, my own,  
Light of my life, farewell!

For crime unknown  I go to a dungeon cell.

Josephine.

I will atone.

In the meantime farewell!

And all alone

Rejoice in your dungeon cell!

Sir Joseph.

A bone, a bone  I'll pick with this sailor fell;

Let him be shown

At once to his dungeon cell.

Bo's'un, Dick and Hebe.

He'll hear no tone  Of the maiden he loves so well!

No telephone

Communicates with his cell!
The rather descriptive character of the four cited verses changes in the fifth: Little Buttercup anticipates the final reversal by declaring that Ralph will be free when her secret is told (Example 438a).

Example 438a. Ibid., 134.

Little Buttercup. But when is known

The secret I have to tell, Wide will be thrown

The door of his dungeon cell

Thus, the text consists of five alternately rhymed quatrains, unified through the recurrence of the same two rhymes. The predominantly iambic metrics have several trochaic and anapaestic irregularities, and the lengths of the lines feature an interesting variation of the traditional ballad stanza: instead of the accustomed alternation of tetrameters and trimeters, Gilbert alternates dimeters with trimeters, both a reversal and a diminution of the balladic model. The first two quatrains feature a closural run-on line; the following quatrains double the incidence of the run-on lines. This may be perceived as a prosodically realistic representation of the bried, emotional exchanges between Ralph and Josephine on the one hand, and the more descriptive comments of the subplot characters on the other.
Instead of the traditional epiphoric chorus closure, the last two lines of the opening stanza are reiterated by the octet in arch-like fashion, which enhances the hyperstanzaic unity provided by the recurrent rhyme pair.

Sullivan's setting of the text combines accentual and quantitative scansion in such a way that the metric irregularities of the text are fitted into a regular four-measure phrasing pattern (Figs. 94 and 95, pp. 791 and 792, respectively). This procedure treats most of the internal line irregularities as accentual dactylic units, and some of the opening iambic feet as quantitative spondees. The result of the latter procedure is theagogic enhancement of such affectively significant expressions as "Farewell, my own..." or "I will atone" (Example 439).

The piece is in the key of C major, and the major mode in this case portrays resignation in sorrow, a much subtler affective device than the traditional minor mode. This is quite reminiscent of such celebrated scenes of major-mode sorrow in operatic literature as "Numi, Pieta," \(^1\) "O, Patria Mia," \(^2\) and the closing duet "O, Terra Addio," \(^3\) from Verdi's Aida, and the letter reading from La Traviata of the same composer. \(^4\)

The setting begins with an introductory half-phrase in the orchestra in the manner of a motto (Fig. 94, mm. 1-2, p. 791). The predominant manner of growth at the half-phrase level is contrast in a 12:7 ratio with variation (Fig. 95, p. 792). In larger dimensions the predominant manner of growth is variation, as shown in the phrase and period symbolizations (Example 440, and Fig/94, throughout).

Example 440. Ibid., Form-Of Outline.

\[
\begin{array}{llll}
\text{(mm. 1-18)} & \text{(mm. 18-34)} & \text{(mm. 35-42)} & \text{(mm. 43-57)} \\
A & A_1 & A_2 & A_3 \\
a-1 & a & a_1 & a' & a_2 & a_3 & a_4 & a_3' & a_5 & a_6 & a_7 & a'' & a_8 & a_9 \\
I & VI & (V) & \text{ImT} & (V) & I \\
C \text{ major} & & & & & \\
\end{array}
\]

Roman numerals: tonal levels; Parentheses: partial closure

2. Ibid., Act III, let. C-H.  
3. Ibid., Act IV, let. X.
4. , La Traviata, Act III, scene IV, mm. 1-16.
An interesting feature of the growth in large dimensions is the alternation of recurrent and variant phrases in the sections A and A1, an example of Sullivan's balance of unity and variety (Fig. 94, phrases a and a', a3 and a3', mm. 1-29, p. 791). The closural variant (Fig. 94, section A3, mm. 43-57) resembles most closely the closural period of the opening section (Fig. 94, section A, phrases a', a2, mm. 11-18). This feature may be perceived as a modified recapitulation, a procedure quite consistent with earlier ones. The modification is both linear and timbral. The latter will be discussed further on; the former consists principally of a phrase extension which provides a closural element through its contrast with the four-measure phrasing continuum (Fig. 95, phrase a8, p. 792).

The harmonies of the piece are simple but appositely effective: the major mode of the lovers' farewell (Fig. 94, section A) is followed by the relative minor, portraying Sir Joseph's vengeful mood (Fig. 94, section A1). In turn, Little Buttercup foreshadows the dénouement in the parallel minor (Fig. 94, section A2). The piece closes with the return of the major mode on a a capella ensemble that recapitulates both musically and textually the situation at hand (Fig. 94, section A3). Thus, a ternary structure may be perceived in the tonal organization of the piece (Example 441).

Key of C major

A

motto a-1 (mm. 1-2)
I6 ap.V7 I
\[\text{a (mm. 3-6) } \quad \text{a1 (mm. 7-10)}\]
\[\text{I dII6 I I V7 I} \quad \text{IV6 I dII6 I V7 I6 V} \quad \text{4} \quad \text{5} \quad \text{4} \quad \text{4}\]

a' (mm. 11-14)
see phrase a above

A1

a3 (mm. 18-22)
a4 (mm. 23-26)
VI III IV VII6 V/VI
\[\text{VI} \quad \text{a5 (mm. 31-35)} \quad \text{VI VII6/V} 6 \quad \text{ap.V7/V} V \quad \text{2}\]

A2

a6 (mm. 36-39)
a7 (mm. 40-43)
C: I6 p.t. 4 V7 4 I6 p.t. V I V/III III (V) VII6 4/V V7 \[\Delta\]

A3

a'' (mm. 44-47)
a8 (mm. 48-54)
C: I dII2 I I V I IV I6 IV I6 V4 I6 V7 I
\[\text{a9 (mm. 55-58)} \quad \text{I dII2 I V dVII4 I}\]

over tonic pedal in bass.
The four-measure phrasing pattern features caesurae in every phrase except those ending on full or half-cadences. The latter phrases also feature recurving melodic contours which may be perceived as structural frames along with the lack of caesural elements and the partial or full cadences (Fig. 95, p. 792).

The orchestration of the piece is extremely spare: the sections A, A1, and A2 (Fig. 94, mm. 1-42, p. 79) are scored for voices, solo and ensemble, with string accompaniment, the section A3 is assigned to the vocal octet a capella, which, incidentally, may be seen as a function of recapitulative modification (Fig. 94, mm. 43-53), and the closing instrumental phrase a9 (Fig. 94, mm. 54-47) is assigned to the brass, bassoon, and timpani (Example 442).

Example 442. Ibid., Orchestration, passim.
A single flute is used to double Josephine's answer to Ralph's farewell. The doubling is in unison, and it is possible to surmise that its function is more ancillary than coloristic, since the phrases lie in a somewhat uncomfortable tessitura (Example 442a).

Example 442a. Ibid., mm. 11-18, passim.

The fabric of the piece is polarized melody/accompaniment up to the a capella octet. At this point the fabric becomes homophonic, and continues to be so to the end of the piece. The texture of the piece is predominantly simple and light. The only instance of textural heaviness and timbral complexity occurs in the closural phrase a9, and so it may be seen as a framing device. The homophonic fabric of the phrase just described also functions as a framing device, since the opening half-phrase to which it is thematically related is homophonic as well. The linear distribution of the two fabric varieties in the piece is two-thirds polarized, one-third homophonic, in that order, and therefore the homophonic section may be ascribed a closural function (Example 443).
Example 443. Ibid., Fabric and Texture Outline.

The contemplative farewell octet is immediately followed by two brusque spondaic chords in the parallel minor which announce the reprise of Sir Joseph's admonitory recitativo (Fig. 96, n. 58, p. 793). This reprise is much shorter than the original (Fig. 89, chapter XIV, p. 753) and leads directly to a recitativo whose beginning is a modulation to E minor through its subdominant (Example 444).

\[ R \]

\[ r (\text{mm. 58-62}) \quad r' (\text{mm. 62-66}) \]

\[ c: \underbrace{\text{I} \text{V} \text{I} \text{II6} \text{V}}_{5} \quad \underbrace{\text{I} \text{V} \text{I} \text{II6} \text{V}}_{5} \]

\[ r_1 (\text{mm. 66-70}) \]

\[ \emptyset \text{V V VII4 M7} \]

\[ c: \underbrace{\text{II4}^3}_{3/\text{IV}} \quad \text{V/IV} \]

\[ r_2 (\text{mm. 70-75}) \]

(V) IV (VII I V)

unison - implied harmonies on new key.

The rather abrupt modulation to a remote key, C minor to E minor, announces an unexpected turn of events. The continuation of the minor mode, albeit on a different tonal level, is consistent with the previous foreshadowing which Little Buttercup provided throughout the opera beginning with her exclamation "Remorse, remorse!" immediately following the first mention of Ralph's name (Example 72, Chapter V, p. 171. The announcement by Little Buttercup of her own impending confession is made in a descending melodic line over a dominant progression in the key of E minor (*fig. 96, mm. 70-75, p. 793*), which is, in effect, a Phrygian inflection. Thus, her foreshadowing function is enclosed musically by a reiteration of the same Phrygian procedure (Examples 445 and 445a).
Example 445. ____ "Recitativo," HMS Pinafore, Act I, No. 2a, passim.

Example 445a. ____ "Octette," HMS Pinafore, Act II, No. 19, mm. 70-75.

The enclosed foreshadowing elements in Little Buttercup’s part, all in the minor mode, are her recitativo with the Captain (see Chapter VII, Fig. 17, mm. 12-17, p. 270), her duet with him (see Chapter XI, Fig. 60, p. 556), and her recent foreshadowing in the octet (Fig. 94, mm. 35-42, p. 791).

The fabric and texture of the recitatives of Sir Joseph and Little Buttercup are respectively polarized melody/accompaniment and lightly simple. The latter feature is a function of the single-section accompaniment being
assigned to the strings (Example 446).

Example 446. Ibid., Fabric and Texture Outline, mm.

Song and Chorus: Little Buttercup's Confession Effects
the Denouement and the True Final Reversal.

Gilbert's absurd, or rather, paralogical, spoof of melodramatic dei-ex-machina provides the denouement to the hitherto logical and, within the bounds of satirical hyperbole, realistic plot. Little Buttercup confesses that in her youth she worked in a baby nursery with the Captain and Ralph being babies in her charge. Accidentally, she mixed them up, and they grew up in each other's families. Thus, Ralph should have been the aristocratic naval officer and Corcoran the humble tar.

Little Buttercup's confession is cast in eight quatrains unified in rondoid fashion by the epiphoric reiteration of the poem's opening line. The structure of
the presentation is symmetrical, with the first four stanzas leading up to the disclosure (Example 447).

Example 447. Gilbert and Sullivan, "A Many Years Ago,"
  _HMS Pinafore_, Act II, 134.

Buttercup. A many years ago,
  When I was young and charming. a (A)

As some of you may know,
  I practised baby-farming.

All. Now this is most alarming!
  When she was young and charming,
  She practised baby-farming,
  A many years ago.

Buttercup. Two tender babes I nussed:
  One was of low condition,
  The other upper crust,
  A regular patrician.

All. Now, this is the position:
  One was of low condition,
  The other a patrician,
  A many years ago.

The second half of the poem begins with the confession of the initial mix-up, and ends up by disclosing the identities of the inadvertently switched babies (Example 447a).

Buttercup.  
Oh, bitter is my cup!  
However could I do it?  
I mixed those children up,  
And not a creature knew it!

All.  
However could you do it?  
Some day, no doubt, you'll rue it,  
Although no creature knew it,  
So many years ago.

Buttercup.  
In time each little waif  
Porsook his foster-mother,  
The well-born babe was Ralph -  
Your captain was the other!!!

All.  
They left their foster-mother,  
The one was Ralph, our brother,  
Our captain was the other,  
A many years ago. (*A, see line 1, Ex. 447) rondoid closure.

The entire poem is written in iambic trimeters with a feminine ending on the second rhyme of every stanza. This hypermetric element is the only metric irregularity throughout the text. The use of recurrent lines and two rhymes in both verse and chorus creates a hyperstanzaic structure of eight lines with strongly rondoid characteristics (Example 447b).

But.  
A many years ago,  
When I was young and charming,  
As some of you may know,  
I practised baby-farming.

All.  
Now this is most alarming!  
When she was young and charming  
She practised baby-farming,  
A many years ago.

Hyperstanzaic Rhyming and Metric Scheme:

A B a B1 b B B1 A3

Capitals indicate recurrent lines, lower case letters indicate recurrent rhymes.

The recurrent line "A Many Years Ago" provides, as mentioned, a unifying element beyond the rondoid octave in Example 447b. It also provides frames in the largest dimensions (Examples 447 and 447a, first and last lines, respectively, pp. 771 and 772).

The text's setting is in the minor mode, totally syllabic, and predominantly quantitative. This last feature results in a 6/8 metric notation, which in combination with the key of E minor is strongly reminiscent
of the celebrated "Stride La Vampa" aria of the Gypsy Azucena in Verdi's *Il Trovatore*. The resemblance is more than coincidental, since both arias refer to fundamental plot elements involving mistaken identities of infants.

The quantitative setting features accentual elements in both affective and structural functions. The former function portrays Buttercup's initial words as somewhat hesitant, the latter emphasizes the cesural point between the half-phrases and provides a corresponding closure to the full phrases (Fig. 97, p. 794 and Examples 448 and 448a).


The phrases thus delineated form a regular, four-measure, phrasing continuum, whose component phrases are divided into symmetrical half-phrases by a strong caesura, delineated rhythmically and through melodic contouring. The only exceptions to this 2+2 measures internal phrase structure occur in the opening and closing orchestral-frames, which are uninterrupted (Fig. 98, p. 795).

The predominance of variation as a manner of growth at the half-phrase level is overwhelming (Fig. 97, p. 795). A procedural unity may be perceived in the carry-over of this manner of growth into the larger dimensions: the phrase and sectional symbolization indicate a series of variations in the setting of the first four quatrains leading up to the disclosure. The following four stanzas repeat the musical setting in a strophic manner (Fig. 97, p. 794). There is also a definite correlation between the verse-and-chorus structure of the text and the tonal levels and cadential pattern of the setting: the first quatrain coincides with a harmonically closed two-phrase section (Fig. 97, section A, phrases a and a1, mm. 1-12, p. 794). The second quatrain, a choral answer to Little Buttercup's stanza, is on the mediant level, and ends on a quarter cadence, dominant of the mediant (Fig. 97, section A1, phrases a2 and a3, mm. 12-20), which allows for the following section, another verse of Buttercup (Fig. 97, section A2, phrases a4 and a5, mm. 20-23).
to continue as its resolution on the mediant level and to return and cadence on the tonic through a sequential procedure. The following section is a chorus whose textual recapitulation is set as an extended progression to the final cadence on the tonic level (Fig. 97, p. 795, phrases a6 and a7, mm. 28-36). The phrase and sectional symbolizations along with their corresponding tonal levels may be used to delineate the following form-of:

Example 449. Ibid., Form-Of Outline.

A (mm. 1-12) A1 (mm. 12-20) A2 (mm. 20-28) A3 (mm. 28-29)  
X a a a a  
a2 a3 a4 a5 a6 a7 a8

I TONAL LEVELS

III I I

ABA IN TONAL LEVELS

The harmonies of the piece show an ABA structure delineated by the main tonal levels. There considerable contrast in the closural procedures: the expository section closes with a Neapolitan Sixth, whereas the orchestral postlude closes with a sequence of appoggiature ornamenting an underlying IV-V-I cadential progression (Example 450).
Example 450. Ibid., Harmonic Outline.

Key of E minor
frame x (mm. 1-4)
I scalar ascent, chordal descent over tonic pedal.

A
a (mm. 4-8) a1 (mm. 8-12)
I VII I V6 I V I V I6 N6 V7 I

A1
a2 (mm. 12-16) a3 (mm. 16-20)
III6 VI II6 6 VmT I V/III III II6/V V III
(VII6/V/III)

A2
a4 (mm. 20-24)
V7/III camb. III6 V7/III camb. ap.III

a5 (mm. 24-28)
V I6 I6 V7/V I6 V7 ap.I

A3
a6 (mm. 28-32) a7 (mm. 32-38)
2x(V I6 V7) I V/III III II6 I6 V7 I

frame y (melodic pattern adapted from descending half
+ a8
of a7)
I ap.V2/IV ap.IV6 ap.V7 I

harmonies over a tonic pedal in bass, to end.
The Neapolitan Sixth cadence and the final cadential progression with its sequential appoggiature (Fig. 97, mm. 11-13 and 36-39, respectively) are the principal elements of affective enhancement by conventionalized harmonic means in the piece. The Neapolitan Sixth is equally apposite to the texts of both verses in the strophic setting: in the first verse it underscores the relevance of Little Buttercup's former occupation to the plot's denouement, a function of local foreshadowing, and in the second verse it illustrates Buttercup's concealment of her mistake, an even more localized function of semantic enhancement by contiguousness. The appoggiature have a function of affective illustration similar to the latter example cited: they come after a full unornamented cadence in the chorus, whose chagrin is represented by the minor mode of the main tonal level, and thus reinforce the mood created by the entire piece.

The minor mode and the cadential formulas just described are complemented by an affective device in the melodic structure of the piece. The device consists of a durationally small but intervallically substantial melodic excursion immediately preceding the final cadence of the solo voice. The upward octave leap that begins this departure from the predominantly scalar melodic structure proceeds to the highest note of the solo voice's range in the setting and then drops to the lowest note. The latter
note occurs frequently in the piece, being the bottom of the vocal line's tessitura as well as range; the former note occurs only once in each strophic unit. Fortuitous or deliberate, the affective contiguity is very effective: the first time the leap enhances the textual description of the social difference between the two babies in Buttercup's care, and the second time it enhances the actual denouement (Example 451).

Example 453. Ibid., mm. 24-28.

![Musical notation]

The piece is scored for oboe, clarinets, bassoon, horns, timpani, and strings. The orchestration is spare but effective through a correlation between the varied treatment of the orchestral sections, the chorus, and the solo voice and the phrase and section delineations. Thus, after the orchestral introduction, the vocal line is accompanied by detached string chords up to the first choral refrain (Example 454).
Example 454. Ibid., mm. 4–12, passim.

The first phrase of the choral refrain is set a capella. The following phrase's first half is doubled by the clarinets, bassoon, and horns, and its second half, containing the section's half-cadence is accompanied by detached string chords. This procedure emphasizes both the phrase's caesural elements and the closural aspect of its cadence (Example 455).

Example 455. Ibid., mm. 12–20, passim.
A procedure similar to the one just described may be perceived in the next solo voice section: the two-phrase section is accompanied by strings up to its third half-phrase, at which point the woodwinds and horns enter with a forte chord on the high note of the piece's greatest melodic excursion. The strings alone accompany the full cadence that follows (Example 456).

Example 456. Ibid., mm. 20-28, passim.

The following choral section, which closes the complete unrepeated setting, features a treatment that is roughly the reverse of the first choral section (see Ex. 455): in its first phrase the four-part chorus is presented against sustained harmonies in the clarinets and horns, whereas in the second phrase the oboe, clarinets, and bassoon double the chorus in the first half and leave the chorus a capella in the second (Example 457). This manner of procedural mirroring is particularly elegant in view of the retrograde relationship between the thematic material of pertinent sections (Example 457a).
Example 457. Ibid., mm. 28-36, passim.

Example 457a. Ibid., passim.

A retrograde relationship, similar to the one just described, may be perceived in the largest dimension frames, albeit only in a melodic aspect. The introductory orchestral phrase (Fig. 97, frame x, mm. 1-4, p. 794) features a scalar ascent that arches downwards at the last minute; the closing orchestral phrase (Fig. 97, phr. a8,
mm. 36-39, p. 794) features a scalar descent beginning with a very slight ascent (Example 458). The similarity ends there: except for a pianissimo timpani roll, both a reinforcement of the tonic pedal and an affective device providing an ominous cast to Little Buttercup's revelation (ominous for the Captain, at any rate), the frames differ in orchestration. The introduction's ascending melodic figure is given to the cellos, basses, and bassoon, with the tonic pedal in the oboe, clarinets, horns, and upper strings tremolo (Example 458). By contrast, the postludial phrase's melodic line is assigned to the violins, doubled by a clarinet in unison and the oboe at the octave (Example 459). The former orchestration, aided by a chromatic element, stresses the ominous aspect of the minor mode figure in the bass instruments; the latter imparts a more plaintive character to the descending tonic hexachord in the treble instruments.

Example 458. Ibid., mm. 1-4.
The piece's fabric is evenly distributed between polarized melody/accompaniment and four-part homophony in the textual setting. The orchestral frames are homophonic with figurate bass and soprano, respectively (see Examples 458 and 459). The initial choral section also features a linear polychoric fabric, whereas the second choral section features a slight sectional specialization. The texture of the piece is predominantly light with medium-weight frames delineating the closural points of the choral sections, and it is predominantly simple, with a slight increase in complexity delineating the above mentioned closural elements as well. The relative congruency of the fabric and texture elements in the piece may be outlined as an $b_{-1}A\ B\ A\ B\ b_{1}$ linear arrangement, A being the polarized fabric and B the homophonic, with an increase in textural complexity and weight associated to the latter (Example 460).

Finale II: Epigrammatic Promises, Joyful Declarations, and a Third Apotheosis Mark the Happy End With Reprises.

The discovery that his prospective father-in-law is a common sailor by birth takes the remainder of whatever egalitarian stuffing had been left out in Sir Joseph's shirt after his treatment of Ralph; he declares that while love may level all ranks "... it does not level them as much as that." He hands Josephine to Ralph, who now has exchanged ranks, and uniform, with Captain Corcoran, and starts a dialogue whose semantics are totally apposite, but whose prosody is rather puzzling: the preceding prose gives way to a slightly irregular unrhymed iambic pentameter, blank verse in the Elizabethan manner, closed by a heroic couplet, a closural device of the same period (Example 461).

Sir Joseph (handing Josephine to Ralph). Here—take her, sir, and treat her kindly.

Ralph and Jos. Oh, bliss, oh rapture!
Capt. and But. Oh, rapture, oh, bliss!
Sir Joseph. Sad my lot and sorry,
What shall I do? I cannot live alone!
Hebe. Fear nothing—
While I live I'll not desert you.
I'll soothe and comfort your declining days.

Sir Joseph. No, don't do that.
Hebe. Yes, but indeed I'd rather—

Sir Joseph (resigned) To-morrow morn our vows shall all be plighted,
Three loving pairs on the same day united!

Thus, Ralph gets his Josephine, the social obstacles between the Captain and Little Buttercup have dissipated, age difference notwithstanding once an absurd precedent has been set in the denouement with the ages of Ralph and the Captain, and Sir Joseph gets his Hebe, or rather Hebe gets him. The explanation to the incongruous blank verse with the closural couplet, an unnecessary third stylistic element in an already heterogeneous symbiosis of
speech and song, may be found in an old Chappell vocal score of the opera: the entire versified portion of dialogue dialogue is set as a recitativo (Fig. 99, p. 796). This amply vindicates Gilbert's sense of stylistic purpose, and shows Sullivan's usual attention to detail in the miniature motivic elements reprised for the sake of complete musical characterization, as well as provides a conventional introduction to the Finale II.

The Finale II is anticlimactic at first sight: it is brief, and consists of abbreviated reprises with appropriately modified texts. These are rather epigrammatic in character, describing either current joy or promising future behavior in a poetically concise manner (Examples 462, 462a, through d).


Jos., Hebe, Ralph, Dick. Oh, joy, oh rapture unforeseen, The clouded sky is now serene, (literal reprise of text in Table 18, Finale I)

Example 462a. Ibid.

Capt. For he's the Captain of the Pinafore. . . . . . . . . . . . . . . .
I shall marry with a wife
In my humble rank of life!
And you, my own, are she -
I must wander to and fro;
But wherever I may go,
I shall never be untrue to thee!

All. What, never?

Capt. No, never . . . . (etc.)

But.

For he loves Little Buttercup,  
Dear Little Buttercup,  
Though I could never tell why;


Sir Joseph.  
I'm the monarch of the sea,  
And when I've married thee (to Hebe)  
I'll be true to the devotion that  
my love implants,
Hebe.  
Then good-bye to his sisters, and his  
cousins, and his aunts,  
Especially his cousins,  
Whom he reckons up by dozens,  
His sisters, and his cousins,  
and his aunts!


All.  
For he is an Englishman,  
And he himself hath said it,  
And it's greatly to his credit,  
That he is an Englishman!

CURTAIN

The music of the reprises is reiterated literally from the corresponding numbers (Figs. 40, 14 and 15, 9, 26 and 27, and 92, in that order). The only additions in the potpourri, or successive *quodlibet*, are a two-measure introduction, and an equally long transition from the A flat major of the Captain's reprise to the C major of Little Buttercup's (Examples 463 and 463a). The key relationship between the other contiguous reprises is such that no modulatory devices are needed for a smooth transition.

Example 463a. Ibid., mm. 57-58.

An addition which is irrelevant to the overall perception of the Finale II in itself, but of the greatest significance to the framing of the entire opera is the brief cornet fanfare that appears at the end of the Finale I (Fig. 51, mm. 346-350, 423). It appears at the end of Finale II as an extension of the tonic chord of F major that ends the apothegmatic reprise (see Fig. 97, p. 756). It also appears at the end of the post hoc overture (see Fig. 3, mm. 213-217, p. 169), thus framing the entire plot structure, delineated by the overture-opening chorus beginning, peaking at the very extensive Finale I, and descending to the denouement through the large composite Scena "Carefully On Tiptoe Stealing" (Example 464).
Example 464. Ibid., Set of Orchestral Parts, closing measures, Finale II.

The limited scope and unsophisticated chain-form of the Finale II may be perceived respectively as features of functional and structural imperatives: the linear scope limitation prevents a disproportionate distribution of large musical numbers near the end of the opera in consideration of the large preceding Scena which contains the two premature apotheoses; the seemingly unsophisticated pot-pourri or successive quodlibet procedurally recapitulates the pot-pourri features of the overture (Figures 1-3, pp. 88-90) and the similarly structured orchestral introduction to the opening chorus of the first act (Figure 5, p. 142).
Figure 94: Act II, No. 19, Octet
Figure 96: Act II, No. 19, Recitativos and Chorus (mm. 58-75)
Figure 97: Act II, No. 20, Song.
Recitativo preceding Finale II (discarded by Sullivan).
Conclusion

The multi-dimensional analysis of text and music in this study has demonstrated the infinite care an skill of the composer in setting the dramatically apposite and prosodically sophisticated text of the playwright. The particular virtue of Gilbert's verse is that it sounds natural without abandoning rhyme and meter for a speech-like cadence. This effect is achieved through the avoidance of hudibrastic doggerel and excessive poetic license, and, more positively, through an extremely wide variety of metric and stanzaic devices of Classical prosody.

Similarly, the particular virtue of Sullivan's setting is its emphasis of a speech-like cadence through a phonetic approach that goes beyond Gilbert's scansion towards natural phonetics. This setting procedure that approaches realistic speech through the manipulation of accentual and quantitative scansion may be perceived as a function of naturalism in art that stops short of the expressionist Sprechstimme. It is an interesting combination of a mainstream style that harks back to Gluck and Gretry and looks forward to Richard Strauss and Benjamin Britten.
This intimate combination of words and music begins in the smallest dimensions of both elements and carries through the entire hierarchy of structural devices as a procedural correspondence (Figure 100, p. 807). The smallest dimension's basic unit consists of Sullivan's overwhelmingly syllabic treatment of the equivalent metric units in Gilbert's prosody. The latter is predominantly a bi-syllabic foot, most often an iamb, sometimes a trochee. Once established in a metric continuum, these units are often replaced by tri-syllabic irregularities such as anapaests, dactyls, and amphimacers, as well as by poly-syllabic strong-stress verse and sprung rhythm. Sullivan's melodic departures from the already mentioned one-note, one-syllable approach are rare. When they occur, their interruption of the setting's syllabic continuum by a neumatic element is perceived rather strongly, which enables this irregularity to assume either a structural or a characterizing function through contrast or genre association, respectively.

Sullivan's syllabic scansion of Gilbert's verse alternates between accentual and quantitative. Usually, the elements of the accentual scansion are congruent with the setting's metric continuum, its multiples, or its submultiples. By contrast, the
elements of quantitative scansion provide both an
effect of lamination with the metric continuum and
agogic stress to the syllable or word thus set through
the difference in linear scope between the stressed and
unstressed syllables. Similarly to the neumatic elements' 
framing potential in a syllabic setting, the quantita-
tive elements in an accentual setting acquire the same 
property. Thus, the juxtaposition of syllabic versus 
neumatic elements on the one hand, and the juxtaposition 
of accentual versus quantitative elements on the other 
represent one of the most prominent procedures of 
framing and articulation in the middle dimensions of 
the discrete components of a Savoy opera prototype.
They are structurally and functionally complemented 
by such affectively connotative devices as mode, 
harmonies traditionally associated with a particular 
emotion, and timbral features with similar affective 
connotations.

Some of these middle-dimension devices carry
over into the largest dimensions of a discrete number, 
notably quantitative scansion and the minor mode.
Given the fact that the major mode and the accentual 
scansion predominate as main tonal features of the 
prototype's discrete components, the minor mode and the 
quantitative scansion are ideally suited to point out
the actual articulation of the plot, which progresses from one unsettling event to another. Just as certain conventionalized harmonic devices and brief agogic accents effected by quantitative scansion elements emphasize semantic textual elements in the small and middle dimensions of the discrete numbers, the totally quantitative scansion and minor main key of an entire discrete number emphasize and illustrate the entire text of that number and its dramatic function in terms of plot development.

Gilbert's plot structure matches the Aristotelian model (see Glossary, pp. xi and xii) very closely. The extremely streamlined plot deals with a single course of events occurring in a single day and all dramatis personae act upon each other's destinies. The only illogical element is the manner in which the denouement is effected, but that is the prerogative of the satirical parodist. The action rises to a climactic point at the end of the first act. The rise is propelled by complications, which in turn give way to a falling action in the second act, propelled by a series of discoveries and reversals. The complications, discoveries, and reversals, collectively known as peripeties, are emphasized in the largest dimensions of the discrete musical numbers that set them by quantitative scansion and minor mode.
These large-dimension characteristics in the discrete components may be perceived as intermediate structures within the largest dimension of the entire opera, as their relevance by contiguity and connotation to the plot elements is obvious. The numbers that are assigned this double function of characterization and delineation of shape in the largest dimensions of the opera are: Nos. 3, 5, 11, 15, 17, 18, 19, and 20 (see Figures 18, p. 271; 20, p. 310; 38, p. 470; 67-68, pp. 615-616; 79, p. 665; 86, p. 750; 94, p. 791, and 97, p. 794). These numbers, featuring quantitative scansion and minor mode contain the following sequence of peripeties: Ralph's hopeless love (Fig. 13, No. 3a, p. 214), Josephine's hopeless love (Fig. 18, No. 5, p. 271), Josephine's discovery of Ralph's love and her forced rejection of this love (Fig. 34, No. 11, p. 363), Ralph's lament and suicide threat (Fig. 38, No. 12, p. 470), Josephine's recitativo in her second act hesitation scene (Fig. 64, No. 15, p. 613), the diminished chords on the Captain's fatal word (Fig. 86, No. 18, p. 750), the ensemble's and Sir Joseph's reactions to it (Figs. 87, 89, No. 18, p. 751, 753), and finally, Little Buttercup's revelation of her secret (Fig. 97, No. 20, p. 794).
The enumerated discrete structures provide a unifying element through functional and structural recurrence in the largest dimensions of the entire opera. By contrast, there are equally prominent elements that recurre only within each act. They are the amphimacric hornpipe formula in the first act and the reprised apotheosis "For he is an Englishman" in the second. From the standpoint of dramatic function, the former is an element of characterization by genre, and the latter and element of foreshadowing anticipating the happy end. Structurally, they emphasize the AB shape of the two-act play, by bringing out the internal unity and external contrast of each act. The AB shape is delineated further by the pot-pourri procedural framing of the Overture, the Finale I, and the Finale II, and by the framing fanfare (see Example 464, p. 790). The initial characterization device, the dibrach, also contributes to the functional delineation of the first Act in contrast to the predominance of foreshadowing reprises in the second. This grouping of homogeneous devices within acts, with the consequent heterogeneous structure in the largest dimension is a corollary of Alfred Otakar Lorenz' grouping of similar forms—in the first and third act of the three-act Tristan und Isolde. He obtained an ABA form—of in the largest
dimensions of the Wagner work (Example 465).


Recurrent elements in Acts I and III of the three-act opera are musical themes and specific instances of dramatic action. The act II is the contrasting section containing almost no common elements with the two enclosing acts.

Act I
Unaccompanied sailor's song.  
Act's beginning: large ascending intervals (5ths).  
Act's middle: numerous triplets.  
Tritone effect next to folk-like melody.  
Main motive (the sea) this act only.  
Brangaene looks over the sea.  
Isolde is awakened by sailor's song.

Act III
Unaccompanied "Alte Weise."  
------------- id. (6ths)  
------------- id.  
------------- id.

Main motive (Life's anguish) this act only.  
The shepherd looks over the sea.  
Tristan is awakened by "Alte Weise."  
Not suspecting hero's true thoughts, Brangaene sings a simple diatonic song  
2nd appearance of sailor's song over a tremolo in Basses.  
Isolde's long narrative of past sorrows.

Act III "Liebestod" functions as a Coda.
The Lorenz grouping (Example 465, p. 803), used in corollary form for the Savoy prototype shows an AB structure, delineated through external contrast, internal recurrence, procedural and motivic framing, unified through a symmetrical distribution of minor mode and quantitative scansion numbers throughout both acts (Figure 101, p. 808).

In addition to a rather strict adherence to the Aristotelian plot model, the Savoy prototype also adheres faithfully to a model of plot articulation that usually proves to be excessively prescriptive: Gustav Freitag's triangle or pyramid. Freitag's drama model consists of five steps: 1) introduction, 2) rise, 3) climax, 4) return or fall, 5) catastrophe.\(^1\)

Gilbert's adherence to the Freitag model is enhanced by the relative linear scope of the discrete numbers containing the principal plot elements. Thus, the climax of the plot is contained in the Finale I, the longest number of the opera (see Figures 36-54, pp. 468-485), and also the only one centrally located, so to speak. The roughly triangular shape of the piece may be plotted on a time scale, and the resultant chart will show

---

1. Freitag, 79-95.
a slightly faster descent from the climax than the ascent to it. This particularly gentle, but effective, skewing of a symmetrical structure is the work of the composer, since it is he who has the ultimate control over the final durational features of this kind of piece. The deviation from a symmetrical pattern shows Sullivan's sense of theatrical timing by precipitating the descent to the denouement; the degree of deviation, a very slight one, shows his predilection for order and proportion. Another factor that emphasizes the symmetrical aspect is the harmonic unification of the Finale I in its largest dimensions (Fig. 54, p. 491) which converts many brief independent pieces into the largest discrete number of the opera, providing a durational peak to the action's climax (Figure 102, p. 809).

This study shows that it is possible to achieve realistic word setting without abandoning traditional musical elements, and that it is possible to achieve structural coherence in a heterogeneous large form without renouncing a considerable degree of independence in the component discrete units. Future analyses of this sort may find the list of principal elements in the text and the music and their relationship to each other useful as a point of departure. But, more important than the
mere contiguity or the mechanical unity apparent in
this list (Figure 100, p. xxx) is the synthesis of
antithetical elements and their balance with each
other. Far from blurring each other's features, the
elements of such a balance ought to create a controlled
tension comparable to the forces latent in an archi-
tectural arch brought under elegant control by the
hand of a master builder.
Figure 101: Homogeneous Elements Grouping and Procedural Recurrence as Determinants of Shape in the Largest Dimensions.
Figure 102: Linear Scope and Triangular Model of Dramatic Shape, *HMS Pinafore*, Acts I, II.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


_____. The Age of Louis XIV. New York: Simon and Schuster.


Tovey, Donald F. Essays in Music Analysis. London: Oxford University Press, 1935.


Scores.


_____.* Symphony No. 104 in D major.* Leipzig: Breitkopf und Hartel, n.d.


Recordings

Gilbert, William S. and Arthur Sullivan. HMS Pinafore, performed by the Glyndebourne Opera Festival, conducted by Sir Malcolm Sargent. Angel Stereo 3589 B/L.

HMS Pinafore, performed by the D'Oyly Carte Opera Company, Isadore Godfrey, conductor. London A 4234.

The Mikado, performed by the Glyndebourne Opera Festival conducted by Sir Malcolm Sargent, Angel Stereo 3573.