SAXTON STREET:
THE RECONSTRUCTION OF A RED LIGHT COMMUNITY, 1906-1913

A Thesis
Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for
the degree of Master of Arts in the
Graduate School of the Ohio State University

by
Elizabeth Jane Greiner, B. A.

* * * * *
The Ohio State University
1987

Master's Examination Committee: Approved by
Barbara Reeves
Warren Van Tine

John C. Burnham
Department of History
Copyright by
Elizabeth J. Greiner
1987
To Don Radcliffe

ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

When I first began this study five years ago, my adviser, John C. Burnham, told me to read a few issues of the Canton newspapers and see if I could find anything on local prostitution. If not, I could go back to my original topic of interest, the Socialist Party in Canton during the Progressive era, from which, strangely enough, my interest in prostitution grew. Much to my surprise—and his—the newspapers were loaded with arrest reports, anecdotes, and innuendo. My mind raced back to the early 1970s when I was traffic manager for a large steel hauling company, and one of the favorite pastimes was to sit around and talk about "the good old days" of "Little Chicago," which anyone who lived in town for any length of time knew meant Canton. This was the first time I heard the name Mamie Lee, who is a part of this study, and to this day, is still talked about. Even back then, I was intrigued with the idea of writing a history of prostitution in Canton, but prostitution then was not a respectable topic at home or the classroom. But times change. I am most grateful to Dr. Burnham for his support, wisdom, and endurance during this project he thought would never end. Without him, his insight, ideas, and dedication, this study would never have reached fruition. I am eternally thankful to him. I also am grateful to my committee members, Dr. Warren Van Tine for
his thoughts on the relationship between prostitution and labor and Dr. Barbara Reeves for her astute editorial comments.

The main body of research sources—newspapers—were available to me only between the hours of 9:00 AM and 5:00 PM on Saturdays at the Ohio Historical Society. I want to thank the staff of OHS for cheerfully hauling out for me approximately 4,460 newspapers both bound and on microfilm for more than a year. I would also like to thank Penny Marshall and Mary Piero Carey of the main branch of the Stark County Public Library for their assistance.

Much of the other source material came from city and county offices where employees, mostly women, are already overworked with the day-to-day business of keeping up with the paperwork. They don't need historians to come around and bother them. Nonetheless, when they learned my topic, the women in the Stark County Recorder's office and Probate Court, took time from their workload to teach me the intricacies of tracing down indices, deed transfers, abstracts, wills, appraisal records, and literally how to climb the walls and pull down ledgers without falling off the ladder. I especially thank Janeen Hughes, formerly of the Probate office for her assistance.

One of the most fascinating sources of information were trial documents stored in the maze of boxes in the basement of the Stark County Courthouse. Again the staff—this time in the personage of Ed Karoue—came to my rescue. Despite a bad back, Ed lifted dozens of boxes as we searched for divorce petitions and law suit records.
His hard work and sense of duty make this study much more complete than it would have been otherwise.

My good friend Jane Vignos, Assistant Director of the Stark County Board of Elections and her boss, Director Tom Carr were good enough to let me go through voting records and scrapbooks stored in their office. For years they have shown a support and interest which goes beyond civic duty.

I also want to thank North Canton Bureau Chief of the Canton Repository, Jim Hillibish, for the files of the American Social Health Association and Richard "Bix" Bixler, news photographer, for the bits and pieces and especially for our all-night ride through Canton where he filled my mind with crime and corruption and showed me the hot spots—past and present. I also thank John Oliver, Jr., Associate Professor of History, Malone College, who introduced me to localized history and permitted me to share my findings and research skills with his senior research seminars. I also acknowledge the support of Dr. Alan Woods, member of the Board of The Contemporary American Theatre, who was kind enough to ask me to share my findings on juvenile prostitution in a symposium sponsored by the Ohio Humanities Council during the run of CATCO's production of Orphans.

Much of the expenses for this study were paid for by a Small Grant from the Ohio State University Center for Women's Studies, a windfall which enabled me to travel easier and pay for much of the copying of newspaper articles and legal documents.
On a personal note I want to thank Jan Cain who put me up at her house on many occasions, sometimes for days at a time and wanted to know what I was doing every step of the way; John Cain who tolerated me; and Shayna Cain who was a good girl.

Others who have helped in one form or another are John Baum, formerly of the Canton Civil Service Commission; Robert Blocker, Dr. Firman H. Brown, Jr., the Honorable Stanley J. Cmich, Cows in Flight (Fred Ardrie, Mike Dittmer, and Elizabeth Ann James), Ocelean Davis, Gordon Firman, Craig Hamilton, the late Price Janson, Nick Lattavo, Gail Malmgreen of the Eugene Debs Society; C. David Morgan, Pastor, Calvary Presbyterian Church; Scotty McKinney, Steve Nelson, Judge William R. Quinn, Jr, Dianne Schuring, Carl Schnovell, Dr. Yvonne Shafer, the late Eva Sparrowgrove of the Stark County Historical Society, Bill Summitt, Anna Turnbull, the Honorable Carl Wise, and the old Canton NOW bunch who always wanted to know more.

Finally, I would like to thank three special people:

1) my mother, Jane Hunt Greiner who for years has consistently asked two questions: a) "aren't you done with that paper yet?" and b) "if you wanted to write about women, why didn't you write about suffrage?";

2) Kevin Hayes for our five-year-plus friendship;

3) Chris Ryan (Chris the A) for suffering through the last year.

One final acknowledgement is due to the women of Saxton Street --Ollie Schnovell, Alice Barnes, Jennie Connors, Nellie Callahan
Schwinn, Fannie Schmidt, Trixie Bell, Mamie Lee, Mary Smith and all the other named and unnamed women who lived the fast live and somehow survived and Elizabeth Brown, who didn't. You are not forgotten.
VITA

October 20, 1945 ............... Born - Toledo, Ohio
1969 ......................... B. A., Malone College, Canton, Ohio

PUBLICATIONS

"The Day That Alice Came to Town," Timeline (4) February-March, 1987), 17-25.


FIELD OF STUDY

Major Field: American History
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ........................................ iii
VITA .......................................................... viii
LIST OF FIGURES ........................................... xi
INTRODUCTION .............................................. 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. THE MOVEMENT TOWARD REFORM: SOCIAL WORKERS, POLITICIANS, AND PREACHERS</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. SEXUAL COMMERCE IN THE PROGRESSIVE ERA: THE NEW PROSTITUTION AND AMERICA</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. THE POWER ELITE: SAXTON STREET SOCIETY</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. GOOD GIRLS GONE BAD: THE WOMEN OF SAXTON STREET</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. PRIVATE SCARS AND PUBLIC FACES: HAZARDS OF THE TRADE</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. A CITY ON TRIAL: FRIENDS IN HIGH PLACES</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSION</td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AFTERWORD</td>
<td>278</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

APPENDICES

A. Map of Ohio Showing Canton in Relation to Other Ohio Cities ................. 296
B. Map of the Tenderloin in Relation to Canton, Ohio .......................... 297
C. Map of the Tenderloin ........................................... 298

ix
D. Alleged Prostitutes in Canton, Ohio, 1906-1913 ........................................... 299

E. Impeachment Petition Brought Against Arthur J. Turnbull, November, 1911 ................. 305

F. Charges Brought Against H. W. "Jimmy Smith, December, 1912, and Disposition of Charges, January, 1913 ......................................................... 308

BIBLIOGRAPHY ................................................................. 312
LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURES

1. Map of Ohio Showing Canton in Relation to Other Ohio Cities ........................................ 296

2. Map of the Tenderloin in Relation to Canton, Ohio ......................................................... 297

3. Map of the Tenderloin ............................................................ 298
INTRODUCTION

From the 1920s through the early 1960s, the South Cherry Street area of Canton, Ohio, was synonymous with vice. Houses of prostitution, gambling "dens," and speakeasies honeycombed the near downtown. By the mid 1920s, the town, once famous as the home of William McKinley, and the site of his famous 1896 front porch campaign, became known throughout the country as "Little Chicago," after Daily News editor and publisher Don Mellett was ambushed and killed in the midst of his campaign to expose municipal corruption. Canton's reputation, however, preceded the Prohibition era by at least twenty years. South Cherry Street, actually, was part of a vice district that flourished as early as 1905 when William A. Couch, a writer for the Cleveland Plain Dealer, described Canton as "a lurid little city." ¹ Canton was, in fact, a rapidly growing urban center. By 1910 the population had grown to over 50,000 people (up 20,000 from the previous census) based on a steel and steel-related industry which had made the city the world-wide center for the production of electric furnace alloy. ²


²E. T. Heald, The Stark County Story: Industry Comes of Age. (Canton: Stark County Historical Society, 1952), 1-2. Steel and steel related companies included Timken Roller Bearing, Diebold Safe, Stark Rolling Mill, American Rolling Mill, Republic Steel,
The first serious attempt to shut down the vice district, known variously as "the Jungle," "the Tenderloin" or "Saxton Street" occurred between 1911 and 1913, at the end of the third term of Democratic Mayor Arthur J. Turnbull. Turnbull, originally elected in 1906 as a quasi-reform candidate, permitted vice—especially prostitution—to prosper during his years in office. Reformers saw the social evil, (as they called prostitution), as an easy target since they perceived it as a product of "women's lust" and the greed of a few "bad men." While they recognized that prostitution was a national and international problem, these local reformers did not particularly see it as part of a complex network of the entrenched, male-dominated entrepreneurial system of female prostitution and profit that began to spread into urban areas across the country in the latter part of the nineteenth century. The eradication (or at least the attempted eradication) of prostitution in Canton, they believed, would lead to the elimination most of the political graft that accompanied the local vice industry.

While reformers were incorrect in their naive assumption of the causes of prostitution, they were correct in their belief that prostitution in Canton, unlike that in larger cities, was indeed a local operation. While cities such as New York, Chicago, San Francisco, Philadelphia, St. Louis, and New Orleans could boast a cosmopolitan "menu" of foreign, child, and teenage prostitutes, specialty houses, openly advertised red light districts, and the Canton Stamping and Enameling, and Union Metal.
male-dominated system of brothels and white slavery, prostitution in Canton basically retained the older female-controlled system of sexual commerce. While men generally owned and operated saloons in the red light district and offered support and protection to the women, who worked out of them, brothels operated and controlled by women were the main unit of operation. In addition, unlike bigger cities where large numbers of prostitutes were foreign-born and made up an ever-changing prostitute population, prostitutes in Canton more often than not were American-born, (or considered themselves "American" rather than "foreign"), with a high percentage of women born in Ohio and surrounding states. Some prominent madams and many "working girls" were born in Canton and attended local schools. Some married; a few had children, but nearly all, although they maintained ties through family and friends to the larger community, remained within the confines of Saxton Street. This stable, "home grown" prostitute population, then, by virtue of their local roots, left behind evidence of their existence (i.e., legal documents, family records, and detailed newspaper reports) that enable the historian to reconstruct the fast life in Canton during the Progressive era and differentiate it from that of larger cities where entrepreneurial prostitution had taken hold or was an overlay on originally local activities.

* * * * *

Three major obstacles exist in the research of prostitution in any time, culture, or geographical area, including Canton. First, most information about prostitution and prostitutes comes from
sources outside of prostitution: newspaper articles, police reports, second and third person accounts, and apocryphal stories. In the Progressive era, in which this study takes place, information has generally come from reformers and their recorded activities: municipal vice reports, speeches, and articles in contemporary social and health journals. Although sometimes sympathetic to the plight of prostitutes, these documents reflect a class and reform bias which mirror the notions of reformers and do not necessarily portray "the life" as it actually was lived.³

Second, unlike literate middle class women who left diaries and letters that enable the historian to offer new perspectives into the experience of women, the "inarticulate and illiterate" prostitute rarely left such documents. This lack of personal documents keeps the historian from, in the words of Carl Degler, "getting into the heads of those who lived in the past and are now dead" and prevents a sense of what prostitution was and is about. Unfortunately, the published memoirs of prostitutes, which should give depth and clearer understanding to their experiences are, for the most part, inauthentic. In her introduction to The Maimie Papers, a collection of authentic correspondence between a former prostitute and a Boston society matron, editor Ruth Rosen stated that she believes most "memoirs" were written by reformers much in the way sensational slave accounts were written by abolitionists in

the nineteenth century. Finally, prostitution in specific cities was well-documented only when it was regulated by municipal authorities, as was the case in some European and American cities in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Because of the nature of the documentation, only knowledge of the low status offender—the woman and her associates involved in arrest, scandal, or other public deviant behavior—has come to light. The activities of clandestine, part time prostitutes, as well as of higher-status prostitutes is difficult to detect.

While numerous sociological studies of prostitution have been made for many years, little scholarly history until recently was written on the topic. According to Rosen, this omission was happened because reliable accounts of "ordinary" and "powerless" people (including the majority of women), were neglected in preference to the "high drama" provided by "powerful elites." Prostitution in particular was ignored because prostitutes made up the most devalued female class in society. Historians tended to see prostitution as a permanent and unhappy aspect of society and neglected to recognize the different roles that "the world's oldest profession" played throughout history.

---


5Bullough, "Problems and Methods," 244.

6Rosen and Davidson, The Maimie Papers, xiii; Ruth Rosen, The Lost Sisterhood: Prostitution in America, 1900-1918 (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1982) xv; Lucie Cheng Hirata, "Free, Enslaved, and Indentured Workers in Nineteenth Century
John C. Burnham, in his essay "American Historian and the Subject of Sex," offers another observation. While Burnham does not deny that prostitution and other sexually-related subjects have been ignored by historians, he says that the study of sex has not been necessarily neglected but instead has been confined within other larger topics. "Sex comes in only as part of a larger subject, or it shows up in a parallel," he writes, "as for instance, the comparison of public morals with private morals in the Gilded Age."^7

Sociologist Marion Goldman says that the study of prostitution is "compelling" because it combines "the most basic elements of life—work and sexuality" but implies that for that very reason, many scholars have shied away from the topic. Sex is seen as a deeply personal part of the human experience; work as a public, personal experience. In prostitution, however, sex and work are one. Goldman sees prostitution, then, as fascinating and frightening because it represents the fusion of two "necessarily differentiated parts of the human experience." Anne M. Butler, another historian of prostitution, points out, however, that scholars have recently begun to recognize that prostitution represented in many cultures and times an important "societal ingredient", heretofore unrecognized. (Sociologist Lucie Cheng Hirata, for instance, points out that prostitutes in China were

generally not seen as "fallen women" but as daughters who obeyed
the wishes of the family).  

With the development of social and women's history as well as
feminist scholarship over the past two decades, prostitution, along
with sex and gender studies, have now become recognized as
legitimate fields of study for historians. Early on, historians
such as Vern and Bonnie Bullough, Fernando Henriques, and Richard
Symanski, along with sociologists with historical interests such as
Charles Winick and Paul M. Kinsie, utilized a survey approach to
the subject (i.e., world-wide prostitution, prostitution in western
society, prostitution in the United States, cultural attitudes
towards prostitution), which covered a broad range of time,
geoanography, and activity.  

Other historians, such as feminists
Judith Walkowitz and Ruth Rosen, and Marc Connelly, John C.


Burnham, Edward Bristow, Egal Feldman, Roy Lubove, Francesco Cordesco, and Frederick M. Pitkin continued to use this method, but adjusted and narrowed this approach to focus on prostitution as it related to such various topics as Victorian England, Progressive America, class and gender, reform, health, white slavery, culture and immigration.10

In addition to the actual study of prostitution, scholars have also investigated changes in attitudes about prostitution. Relevant to this study are the work of Leslie Fishbein and Robert R. Reigel, who have documented the various strains in changing ideas about prostitution and prostitutes (victimization versus free choice; sin versus social necessity versus crime; arguments for regulation, segregation, toleration, and eradication; economic and

psychological interpretations) which prevailed in the years preceding the Progressive era and during the Progressive era itself.\textsuperscript{11}

While these historians and sociologists have made invaluable contributions to the study of prostitution—particularly in the overview they have created by which to measure the effects of prostitution on people and communities involved in it—their survey approach tends to limit the subject simply by the atypicality created by the broad area covered. Ruth Rosen's seminal study of prostitution in *The Lost Sisterhood: Prostitution in America, 1900-1918*, for instance is an excellent place from which to start a further study of prostitution in the first part of the twentieth century. The breadth of her study, however, has forced her to generalize and make assumptions which blur the fact that although prostitutes shared some common experiences, all prostitutes did not suffer the same conditions or degree of conditions. The fast life in New York, Chicago, San Francisco, or even Pittsburgh was not the same as the fast life in Indianapolis, Albany, or Canton. The majority of Americans and American prostitutes did not live in large metropolitan areas with large immigrant populations, urban poverty, and male-dominated brothel systems. What happened in big industrial or commercial cities was not necessarily typical of the rest of the country.

Yet a second skein of historical methodology on prostitution has emerged. The most prominent of these is Marian Goldman's Gold Diggers and Silver Miners, a socio-historical account of prostitution on Nevada's Comstock Lode in the mid-nineteenth century. Such studies have "localized" prostitution—that is, placed it within a local culture and environment and have shown how communities and the prostitutes who lived in them responded to one another. This approach, while it borrows from knowledge found in historical surveys, is much more flexible in that it allows the historian to create a more complete picture and, consequently, analysis of a given area. That, in turn, can help create a more accurate picture of what constitutes prostitution, what comprises the life of prostitutes in a given historical period and place and, consequently, what different roles prostitution can play in various societies.

While studies in localized prostitution have gained in number (and some were written before prostitution was considered a legitimate interest of historians), they have been limited not by research materials and resources available—(sources abound in practically every town) but by the interests of historians themselves. Certain geographical areas and time periods have caught the attention of historians and various studies have emerged. The most popular of these is the American West. While technically not localized, Anne M. Butler's Daughters of Joy, Sisters of Misery: Prostitutes in the American West, 1865-1880, is a succinct study of prostitutes' lives in the West, often in small,
obscure towns, which can be used as a model for the formulation of other localized histories. Jacqueline Baker Barnhart has studied prostitution in San Francisco's formative years in *The Fair But The Frail*. Numerous scholarly articles have been published on the West which cover topics that range from prostitution in Kansas cattle towns, to prostitution and drugs in New Mexico, to Chinese prostitution in the West. Prostitution in Montana has taken the fancy of at least three historians.12

Another popular but less extensive area of interest is New Orleans. *Storyville, New Orleans: Being an Authentic, Illustrated Account of the Notorious Red Light District* by Al Rose is a well-researched, popular account of jazz and prostitution New Orleans. Articles include a short study of how prostitution influenced politics (and vice versa) before the Civil War and an account of

how the federal government shut down Storyville during the First World War.\textsuperscript{13}

The Lost Sisterhood should have whetted the appetite of historians to move beyond New York and the West and South to further research prostitution in any number of cities, especially smaller cities, during the Progressive era, but so far none have materialized. In addition, except for a handful of articles on limited topics (some written before The Lost Sisterhood), no detailed study of commercialized prostitution in the midwest for any historical period has been forthcoming.\textsuperscript{14} The purpose of this study, then, is to reconstruct the fast life in one small midwestern vice district—Canton, Ohio's Saxton Street—during the Progressive era. Caught in the midst of social and economic change and growth, Saxton Street prostitutes nevertheless stayed mainly in the pre-Progressive era pattern of female control, which may in fact be the pattern that many red light districts maintained well into the Progressive era. Therefore, conditions in Canton were


often at odds with what has previously been described as supposedly
typical of the Progressive era, and the findings are a challenge to
previous held views of Progressive era prostitution. This study is
limited to the Saxton Street area (although clandestine and higher
class prostitution probably occurred in other parts of the city)
because the district represents the organized, commercial aspects
of prostitution. This study is also a reconstructed portrait of
the women, some foreign, but many of them local, who chose not to
cut their hometown roots and for various reasons remained in Canton
and pried their trade within the confines of Saxton Street.

* * * * * *

Although reformers in Canton sometimes claimed that the town
was a major center for the traffic in women in the Midwest, nothing
about Progressive era Canton appears in contemporary or modern
literature related to prostitution. The study of prostitution in
Canton and the subsequent reconstruction of the Tenderloin, then,
must come from local sources. The greatest sources of information
on the social evil in Canton come from the two newspapers, the
conservative Repository and the liberal and often activist Morning
News (later the News Democrat and the Daily News). Since Canton
was "wide open," the editors of both papers, especially the News,
did not hesitate to print colorful descriptions of life on Saxton
Street. Although the majority of news articles dealt with periodic
raids, arrests, trials, and reform attempts, along with the
pronouncements of preachers, a surprising number of reports are
anecdotal and describe day-to-day workings of life in the
Tenderloin. These reports, by their very nature, however, like legal documents, are almost always limited to the activities of working class and flagrant prostitutes and low status offenders. The activities of high class, clandestine prostitutes, consequently, have been left unrecorded.

The editor of the Repository was staunchly Republican. The paper was founded in 1806 by Joseph P. Saxton, (the grandfather of William McKinley's wife), for whom ironically Saxton Street was named. The string of editors for the News were either Democrats or Progressives, often allied with local liquor interests.

The politically opposed points of view of the two papers meant that incidents—especially those involving election fraud and graft tied to Tenderloin personalities—were reported in often detailed but contrasting ways. They often, however, reported the same story; thus, certain facts can be verified. Corroborative evidence, such as U. S. Census reports and city directories (both sometimes unreliable), deed transfers, wills, birth and death certificates, legal documents, and City Civil Service Commission minute books are available and serve to expand information about events and personalities into a narrative. Unfortunately, many public documents, chiefly police records, court transcripts, a reported police register of prostitutes, coroner's reports, tax receipts, and many deed transfers can no longer be located, although it is possible that some remain uninveteried and packed away in the Courthouse basement or annex. In some cases, records were never kept or apparently have been destroyed. Furthermore, no
diaries, letters, or other memoirs of local prostitutes have been located.

Numerous cities in the first years of the twentieth century published vice commission reports. Conditions in dozens of other cities were written about extensively by other sources. No report or investigation, however, was prepared about Canton. Consequently, many questions regarding the substructure and political framework which permitted prostitution to flourish in Canton are difficult to answer. Much of the knowledge of the political underpinning of the social evil in Canton, then, comes from the testimony of individuals during the Canton Civil Service Commission hearing of Police Chief H. W. "Jimmy" Smith who, in late 1912, was charged with dereliction of duty, corruption in office, and public drunkenness after Socialist mayor Harry Schilling defeated Democratic incumbent Arthur J. Turnbull in a challenged election. The police officers, prostitutes, and city officials who testified against (and sometimes for) Smith had much to lose, and their descriptions of the role city officials played in the maintaining of a viable vice community does much to illuminate the size, structure, and flavor of prostitution in Canton.

In addition to local resources, contemporary studies and reports dealing with prostitution on a national level are also important to an accurate and well-rounded picture of Canton prostitution. As stated above, cities issued vice commission reports, and many other cities were studied and written about by outside investigators. These reports, such as those from New York,
Philadelphia, Atlanta, Cleveland, Little Rock, and Portland, Oregon, written with a reform bias, nonetheless are important since they give specific information about individual circumstances in diverse areas of the country. These reports are also important in that they display discrepancies between reformers' preconceived notions about women and prostitution and what was actually found in the investigations. Contemporary social welfare and health journals, including Survey, Current Literature, Current Opinion, The Journal of Social Hygiene, and popular magazines (various issues of McClure's Magazine) also contributed numerous weekly or monthly commentaries and reports on urban vice, particularly prostitution.

Needless to say, present-day studies and interpretations of prostitution, vice, and sexual ideology have also been consulted. Many of them have been mentioned above and others will be found in the bibliography. These present-day studies, however, do not necessarily reflect what contemporaries called prostitution during the Progressive era and are not relevant to activity of the same name many decades earlier. In utilizing these materials, the researcher must be careful not to mix present-day ideology with historical reality.

***

This study starts in Chapter One with the view traditional in most history, that of the reformers. It is therefore an overview of the reform movement in Canton during the final years of the
Turnbull administration and the response of reformers to the perceived menace of Saxton Street. Chapter Two is an overview of the "new prostitution" in the United States, in which individual prostitution gave way to diversified male-controlled entrepreneurial prostitution—a circumstance which had yet to affect prostitution in Canton to any large extent. Chapter Three presents the women and men involved in Saxton Street prostitution, their connections with one another and the local power structure, and the actual physical description of the area. Chapter Four covers the lives of specific Saxton Street madams and prostitutes and includes ethnic background, parentage, race, marriage, family life, and the reasons women claimed they entered the life. Chapter Five presents the hazards of the trade: violence, disease and other medical problems, alcohol and drug addition, and suicide, with an emphasis on the everyday problems of survival. Chapter Six is a return to the reform movement and the disclosures made during the "trial" of Jimmy Smith. The conclusion ties together the previous chapters and summarizes the "Saxton Street System" and how vice was able to endure and profit within the social and geographical confines of the Jungle.

* * * * *

Prostitution in the Progressive era represented a marked change from traditional sexual commerce. Prostitutes, especially in large metropolitan areas, lost autonomy. Once largely the sole owners of their trade, and often prostitutes only in time of
temporary economic need, these women were displaced by a force of full-time, sexual workers. These workers were frequently under the control of second and third party interests (to some extent always a component of prostitution) which included, but were not inclusive of, male resort operators and neighborhood police and politicians who saw vice as a passageway to profit and political power.\textsuperscript{15}

In Saxton Street, however, the older traditional female-controlled prostitution, with local peculiarities and contemporary modifications, continued to operate. Ingrained with a vice tradition, Saxton Street was more of a neighborhood than a unit of outside exploitation. The district operated as a community where people joined in a loose network of independent business women and men in a mixture of legitimate and illegitimate enterprises, people who were intent on making a living the best way they could. To reformers, Saxton Street represented a "cesspool for criminals," To those who lived and worked there, the district was a place where people gathered in a community grounded in poverty, vice, and hope.\textsuperscript{16}

\begin{flushleft}
\end{flushleft}

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{16}(Canton) \textit{Repository}, January 3, 1910, 1, 8.
\end{flushleft}
CHAPTER 1

THE MOVEMENT TOWARDS REFORM:

SOCIAL WORKERS, POLITICIANS, AND PREACHERS

Around 1907, two distinct social reform movements organized in Canton. These movements had little in common with each other and leaders of the two groups were often at odds with one another regarding tactics and priorities. The first movement consisted of middle class, church-based women, sometimes joined by municipal social workers and other Progressive thinkers. These people sought not only to eradicate but to prevent the social evil, which they saw as a threat to the home and the family. They planned to do away with vice through the vigorous enforcement of the law as well as the humanization (or feminization) of the law and the subsequent establishment of a court system that would take into account the special problems and needs of women. Like similar groups elsewhere, members of these charitable women's groups focused their attention on the salvation and reformation of individual women. The members of these groups viewed prostitution as a tragic moral problem with class, economic, and gender overtones and believed that the social evil could be eliminated by moral uplift.

The second reform movement was made up of leading ministers and local politicians, who for diverse religious and political reasons
made an uneasy alliance to try to remove Arthur Turnbull from the mayor's office. (Although prostitution and other moral issues were clearly on the minds of church leaders, opposing politicians seem to have been more interested in simply gaining political control of the city rather than actually "cleaning up" the town.) Between 1910 and 1913, these men led a campaign to wipe the Tenderloin off the map of Canton. Unlike many female reformers who saw "fallen women" as a moral and/or economic problem, churchmen believed that prostitutes were a blight on the community, while politicians treated them as expendable pawns in the political game.

One of the first women's reform groups, The Crittenden Circle, was organized in December, 1908. As an outreach of the Florence Crittenden Homes, the group was established to rescue errant women in resorts, hospitals, and prisons and to see that seduced girls received proper care through the auspices of the Crittenden Homes. Reports of organizational meetings printed in local newspapers indicate that members of this "rescue department" were to be given identification badges and were expected to stop suspected prostitutes on the street or actually join police in raids on brothels and saloons. Newspaper reports of raids over the next five years, however, suggest that the "rescue department" never materialized and that such militant activities, popular in larger cities, never caught on in Canton. Instead, the Crittenden Circle seems to have acted as a philanthropic church group that met
frequently and assisted individual women but did not take an active part in the actual rescue of women from prostitution.\footnote{Canton Morning News, December 10, 1908, 1. No Crittenden Home was ever established in Canton; the closest one was twenty-three miles away in Akron.}

Another of the women's groups, the Women's Christian Temperance Union, was a much older organization (started locally in 1877), but it became involved in the issues that surrounded sexual commerce in the early part of the century as part of a larger program to promote temperance and clean living. Members met regularly at the Stark County Workhouse and city jail for religious services with inmates. The WCTU also operated a home with kitchen and laundry facilities for young working women who lived apart from their families. In 1910, members announced plans to investigate conditions in the Tenderloin and in 1911, with the Crittenden Circle, called for the enforcement of Canton's curfew law, which was supposed to keep girls and boys from "running the streets" at night. In December, 1912, as the Schilling administration shut down the Tenderloin, the WCTU became embroiled in an organizational controversy that made newspaper headlines when anti-suffrage members attempted to evict a seventy-five-year-old pro-suffrage charter member from the Union Home because several years earlier she had unknowingly rented a house to a convicted prostitute.\footnote{John Lehman, A Standard History of Stark County, vol. II, (Chicago: The Lewis Publishing Company, 1918, 411-412; (Canton) Repository, April 27, 1910, 1; (Canton) Morning News, April 27, 1910, 8; Repository, March 25, 1911, 1; (Canton) Daily News, December 14, 1912, 1; December 19, 1912, 9; December 21, 1912, 1; Repository, December 15, 1912, 1; December 16, 1912, 1; December 18, 1912, 1.}
More popular and successful than these generalized efforts were the two attempts to establish rescue homes in Canton. In early 1907, Rebecca Carver opened The Door of Hope located on South Market Street, on the outskirts of town. Carver, a missionary and charity worker, became interested in rescue work through her church group visits to the Workhouse, where she befriended several female prisoners who expressed an interest in a new life but had no idea of how to start over. Little is known of Carver's efforts, except that while at the home the women were given the opportunity of "making themselves useful, working at whatever they are best adapted to." The program was probably strongly oriented toward individual Christian salvation rather than to vocational training, and Carver required the residents to attend Sunday and mid-week church services at the home. Carver reported that local businessmen offered financial assistance to her project, and grocers donated food. The bulk of financial aid, however, came from the United Brethren and Wesleyan Churches and the Children's Aid Society. One of the first women to pass through The Door of Hope was Nellie McDougal, accused of being a wine room lounger. Five years later, McDougal ran a brothel on Cherry Street. After 1907, no reference to The Door of Hope can be found.3

Not until May, 1911, was any type of formal rescue home organized to which courts could send errant girls and women instead of to jail. Called Beth-Shan, the home was sponsored by the Wesleyan Methodist Conference and was located on Dueber Avenue, in

3Repository, January 13, 1907, 3; January 22, 1907, 4.
a quiet residential neighborhood a mile or two northwest of the Tenderloin. Probate Court Judge C. C. Bow and Police Court Judge William Quinn, who had recently spoken of the need for a local rescue home, were guest speakers at the dedication. The newly purchased, remodeled, twelve-room house cost between $5,000 and $6,000 and was nearly debt free when the home opened. The home accepted girls and women between the ages of twelve and thirty-five. Rooms were made as attractive and home-like as possible. According to Methodist officials, Beth-Shan's charges would be reformed through "influence instead of education," although "proper education" would be provided. At the end of four months of operation, the director of the home was able to report that four girls between the ages of fifteen and twenty, one with a baby born at the house, had been cared for and that a meat market, bakeries, and several individuals had donated food baskets, vegetables, and fruit to the home.\footnote{Repository, April 5, 1911, 1; (Canton) News Democrat, April 7, 1911, 10; May 10, 1911, 1; May 16, 1911, 5; Repository, May 16, 1911, 3; News Democrat, October 11, 1911 5.}

Beth-Shan seems to have become a community project and was a favorite charity of young society women who frequently brought books and candy to the inmates and often stayed for the afternoon to make a pan of fudge with the girls. Some of the women and residents even became close friends. In December, 1912, the fifteen women who lived at the home were surprised with a Christmas party planned by their benefactors, at which the residents all received gifts in the parlor that was decorated with a huge
Christmas tree with lights. Cora, "the baby of the house," a fourteen-year-old girl in pigtails, who had been at the home almost since it opened, was reported to be especially thrilled to find a long-awaited doll under the tree for her.5

The home received the moral support of many of the women it served. A prostitute who tried to leave the life told a reporter for the Daily News in 1913 that she and women like her would go to a rescue home run by "some of the persons who are real friends; women who have tried to help us before . . . . They know us and know how we feel and sympathize with us." Included in that small list was "Mother Jones," the matron of Beth-Shan. 6

Beth-Shan remained financially solvent and received a good deal of financial and material support from local churches, businesses, and women's groups. In 1913, the home was moved from Dueber Avenue to larger facilities on Harrisburg Road in the northeast part of the city. There, a hand laundry operated by the residents brought in money that not only helped to operate Beth-Shan but paid small salaries to the women. Beth-Shan was so successful that in 1912 the Mennonite Mission announced that it would work with the Methodists to open another home, but no evidence can be found to indicate that the Mennonites were successful in their plans.7

Beth-Shan Home filled a need in the community but was not suitable for everyone. Because of the home's conspicuously

5Repository, December 22, 1912, 8.
6Daily News, December 12, 1913, 1, 2.
7News Democrat, October 2, 1912, 1; Repository, May 7, 1912, 13.
Christian orientation, many women stayed no longer than was necessary to please the courts, and sometimes inmates left earlier than scheduled. Clara Bighouse, for instance, was returned to jail after a short visit to the home. Authorities reported that the woman was "obstreperous." Lola Watkins and Belle Mingers "escaped" from Beth-Shan with the assistance of an express wagon driver, but the pair returned later with no explanation of their activities.8

Beth-Shan, nonetheless, was preferable to court fines (the most common form of punishment) and jail sentences. During the Turnbull administration (1906-1913), 231 prostitution arrests were made. Out of this number, 191 were women and forty were men. This number does not include at least one hundred more arrests for liquor-related offenses, con games, street fights, and other petty criminal activities that took place in the Tenderloin over that same period. Prostitutes were fined anywhere from $1.00 to $50.00 plus court costs. Lower fines were levied on prostitutes with no previous arrest records or on prostitutes who agreed to leave town or to stop leading immoral lives.9 In raids, ordinary working prostitutes in brothels traditionally were less likely to be arrested than were the women for whom they worked. When madams Alice Williams and Jennie Connors were arrested in 1911 on warrants

8News Democrat, August 30, 1911, 1; October 4, 1911, 10.

9Figures taken from reported arrests between 1906 and 1913. Judges were given great leeway under municipal ordinances in deciding fines which could go as high as $50.00 and jail sentences which could not exceed thirty days for each offense. The Revised Ordinances of the City of Canton Compromising The General Ordinances and Certain Special Ordinances, 1906, Section 222-224. These laws were in effect during the Turnbull years.
sworn out by reformers, both women said that they were relieved to learn that the warrants were for them only and not "the girls."¹⁰

Madams and saloon keepers who ran particularly obnoxious establishments, who made trouble for police, who over-stepped the bounds of tolerable activities and social mores, or who were arrested during reform drives or election campaigns received heavier fines. Madam Anna Ward was fined $100.00 after her conviction just before the 1911 municipal election. Pearl King, Fannie Schmidt, Trixie Bell, Nellie Callahan Schwinn, and Jennie Connors received similar fines in 1912.¹¹ Although many fewer men were arrested on morals charges than women, fines or jail sentences appear to have been equitable or even heavier than those of women. In 1906, for example, J. D. Frasben was fined $25.00 and sentenced to thirty days in the Workhouse after he was arrested for "bringing people into a disorderly house," while the women arrested with him received the same fine but were given suspended jail sentences. In 1910, Rose Hoslcer was given fifteen days in the Workhouse for immoral behavior. While her gentleman caller was let go, the owner of the barbershop in which the incident took place was also given a fifteen-day sentence. Bernie Strapp and Edwin Forrest, arrested in


¹¹ News Democrat, October 2, 1912, 1; October 7, 1912, 1, 7.
1911 and 1912, respectively, and charged with being the keepers of houses of assignation, were each fined $100.00 and costs.\textsuperscript{12}

Jail sentences, usually of thirty days, were occasionally given to prostitutes, but these sentences were often suspended. Only five women and one man are known to have gone to jail in 1910; and in 1911 and 1912, at the height of reform movement activity, although thirty-nine arrests for prostitution were made, no one went to jail. Prostitutes or other disreputable women, however, were likely to receive some type of Workhouse sentence for non-sexual crimes such as disturbing the peace or petty theft—crimes outside the bounds of sexual commerce and municipal supervision.\textsuperscript{13}

Police Court Judge William Quinn, before whom many prostitutes appeared, was reluctant to send women to the Workhouse, and he became a major supporter of Beth-Shan when it opened. A man of humor and compassion, Quinn recognized human frailty and often, to the dismay of police, dismissed cases, gave out minimum fines and sentences, or granted probation in cases he felt were superfluous to the order and peace of the community. As Quinn reluctantly sentenced Marie Whitmire and Bessie Reto ("The Wandering Tramp") to thirty days in the Workhouse for loitering in wine rooms, the judge bemoaned the lack of facilities for female offenders in the county. "I don't like to send women to the Workhouse," he declared. "I wish

\textsuperscript{12}\textit{Morning News}, January 25, 1906, 2; \textit{News Democrat}, October 9, 1912, 1; \textit{Repository}, June 9, 1910, 11; \textit{Morning News}, June 11, 1910, 2; \textit{Repository}, February 6, 1912, 7; \textit{News Democrat}, March 9, 1911, 1; February 6, 1912, 1.

\textsuperscript{13}Figures taken from reported arrests and court appearances between 1910 and 1913.
I could send them some place where they might learn something and have a better chance to reform."\(^{14}\)

Quinn's reluctance to send women to the Workhouse was based, in part, on Workhouse conditions. Resembling a fortress in the style of many prisons built at the time, the Workhouse was located in the northeast section of the city and although built in 1890, by 1910 was already old and outmoded. Mary Stern, president of the Stark County Board of Visitors, reported after the Board's annual evaluation of the jail in 1911 that conditions were "terrible." Male prisoners slept on mattresses in three-foot wide corridors while tubercular prisoners were kept in a tent on the grounds of the Workhouse infirmary. Women were apparently informally separated from male prisoners, although a special women's section had been built but was not yet opened. Female prisoners worked in the jail laundry. While a matron was employed at the Workhouse, women prisoners seem to have been guarded much of the time by male turnkeys.\(^{15}\)

City jail conditions were, if anything, worse. Stern reported that the jail was a "disgrace to Canton" and that the women's quarters were "vile, cramped, and unsanitary."\(^{16}\)

As early as 1901 or 1902, the WCTU urged the Republican city administration to hire a police matron for the city jail, but the request was denied as "the expense would be too great." In 1906,

\(^{14}\)Repository, April 5, 1911, 1

\(^{15}\)Repository, May 25, 1911, 1; April 13, 1910, 1

\(^{16}\)Repository, May 25, 1911, 1, 11.
the group brought the issue to the attention of Mayor Turnbull.
The mayor, open to the idea, nevertheless believed that a matron
was unnecessary at that time because hearings were held for nearly
all female prisoners as soon as they were arrested, and their cases
were either dismissed or the women were sent to the workhouse. If
held for any length of time, Turnbull said, women prisoners were
kept in separate quarters and not permitted to mingle with men. If
a woman prisoner had to be searched, Turnbull explained, "one of
her sex was sent for."  

Not until 1912, then, as the city jail began to hold an
increasing number of female prisoners, was Catherine Priest
employed as the first jail matron. Priest, hired in part because
she had "such a motherly face," fit the description of the type of
woman a police matron should be, according to a juvenile authority
from Des Moines, Iowa, who assisted the mayor and city council in
the search for a matron. The consultant warned against a "white-
ribbon or blue-ribbon woman who commences to preach charity to an
old rounder of ten years's experience." The matron, instead,
should be "a diplomat and a strong arm, an unbending spirit, and
yet a woman who sympathizes with all unfortunates." Priest had
both the strong arm and the sympathy. When she showed a writer for
the Repository a badly bruised arm she got when she put a woman
back in a cell, she told the reporter, "you have to be kind in

17 Repository, December 30, 1906, 3.
treat all women prisoners, but you've got to know where to fix the limit of your kindness." 18

While the Crittenden Circle, WCIU and police matron showed "kindness and sympathy" toward fallen women, Canton politicians and ministers sought reform through much harsher measures in their attempt to bring moral and political change to the city.

* * * * *

After the election of William McKinley to the presidency in 1896, Canton and Stark County became a bastion of Republicanism. Democrats, however, were not entirely without influence. According to the Cleveland Plain Dealer commentator, William S. Couch, the local Democratic Party "degenerated into a patient, passive, plodding outfit that loved its ease." The Republican machine, content with easy power, was secure enough to throw bits of patronage to its brothers in the Democratic machine, who in turn did as little as possible to act out the role of an aggressive minority safeguard against majority party control. Satisfied with the status quo, members of neither party made any serious attempt to get the vote out.19

In 1905, however, an unaccountable political misjudgment took place. The Republican mayor, W. H. Smith, "a personally clean man" but one blind to local vice interests, ordered a gambling arrest.

18 News Democrat, October 23, 1911, 1, 5; Repository, July 7, 1912, 3.

In retaliation, local gamblers, spoiled by the previous lack of police interference, withdrew their support from the Republican administration and went over to the Democrats. Coincidence or not, that year Smith lost the election by twenty-one votes to a young, English-born contractor, a serious but not especially reform-minded politician by the name of Arthur J. Turnbull.20

Turnbull as a matter of community goodwill initiated measures to shut down the Tenderloin as soon as he got into office. (Probably as a political payoff, gambling rooms were ignored and continued to be ignored except in time of political crisis, such as elections). Within a month, twenty-eight prostitutes were arrested, and most left town rather than do time in the Workhouse. By the end of 1906, fifty-three women had been charged with prostitution, including some of the biggest operators in the district at that time, such as Luna Foster and Caroline Studer. Even James "Jumbo" Crowley, James J. "Tal" Sullivan, and William Parker, the most powerful saloonkeepers in the Tenderloin, were forced to close their doors temporarily.21

By April, when women began to return to the streets, however, Turnbull began to believe that his attempt to shut down Saxton Street had been useless. After he appointed H. W. "Jimmy" Smith as Chief of Police in June, 1906, the arrest rate began to decline.

20 Ibid., 128; Repository, November 8, 1905, 1.
21 Figures taken from reported arrests for 1906; Repository, February 25, 1906, 1; Morning News, February 28, 1906, 6; Repository, March 5, 1906, 11; March 6, 1906, 8; Morning News, March 7, 1906, 7.
The two men, in fact, had secretly agreed that the district, while impossible to eradicate, could at least be controlled. As will be seen in Chapter Six, after Turnbull and Smith studied similar situations in other cities, they devised a plan for the city administration to oversee the area. While raids still occasionally occurred, in 1907 the arrest rate fell to twenty-one and in each of the following years to thirteen.\textsuperscript{22}

Despite the visibility of prostitution and vice culture in the Tenderloin, no serious criticism was levied against Turnbull's toleration policy until nearly a year and a half later when in October, 1907, Reverend E. P. Herbruck of the Trinity Reformed Church, in a letter to the \textit{Repository}, chastised the mayor for not enforcing the laws against Sunday liquor sales—laws that were ignored to one degree or another nearly everywhere in the state.\textsuperscript{23} Reformers, yet unorganized and probably reluctant to align

\textsuperscript{22} \textit{Repository}, January 23, 1913, 1, 8, 9; Figures taken from reported arrests between 1907 and 1909. Smith's appointment as chief of police was controversial from the start and remained so throughout his seven years in the post. Turnbull appointed Smith, who in 1906 was a fourteen-year veteran patrolman, to the position over the head of Captain Robert Patterson, who was next in line for the job and at the time was Acting Chief of Police. Although City Solicitor William L. Day warned Turnbull that Smith was required to take a competitive Civil Service examination mandated under the Ohio Municipal Code, Smith never did take the test, and no one in the city government, not even the City Solicitor, apparently cared to challenge Turnbull on his decision. Patterson was demoted to his former rank of Captain, \textit{Repository}, June 22, 1906, 1, 9, 19. Patterson and Smith apparently had a stormy relationship for the next six years and during Smith's Civil Service Commission hearing in January, 1913, Patterson testified that Smith had severe drinking problems during his tenure as Chief of Police. See Chapter Six.

\textsuperscript{23} \textit{Repository}, October 28, 1907, 1.
themselves with brewers, missed a prime opportunity to attack the city administration in September, 1908, when Turnbull took on the Secret Service Department of the Ohio Brewer's Association Vigilance Bureau. The Vigilance Bureau, in a state-wide attempt to rid Ohio of the "dive saloon," had recently brought individual charges of selling intoxicants in a brothel against Nellie Callahan and Gig Hahn. Turnbull refused to hear the cases in Mayor's Court. Complaining of the hypocrisy of the charges brought by people who for years sold intoxicants to saloon keepers of low repute and later formed an organization to run these same saloonists out of business, Turnbull declared that the arrest of Callahan was the "most disgusting case" he had ever heard and dismissed the charges. The mayor could not contain his anger in court and warned the brewers:

I have a good police force and I have confidence in it and the State Brewer's Association cannot send out a lot of ________ into this town to clean it up who are hired with money taken from the saloon keepers. I want to say that the State Brewers' Association cannot run this court and clean up Canton with their ________ while I am mayor.24

Then, in 1909, in the midst of a local crime wave, the normally pro-Turnbull Morning News ran a series of articles arguing that "thugs, pickpockets, burglars, crackers and highwaymen," protected by the police, were running loose in the city. With headlines like "Men and Women Knocked Down in Heart of City; Their Assailants Escape," "Carnival of Crime Continues, But Police Can Only Find One

24Morning News, September 24, 1908, 2, 3.
Poor Crook Suspect," and cartoons that showed policemen wearing blinders and earmuffs and drinking beer in saloons while a woman is knocked down by street ruffians, the Democratic paper, while not blaming Turnbull, urged the mayor to reorganize the police department.25 A few days later, Republican Municipal Court Judge Henry Harter added fuel to the controversy when he called for a special Grand Jury to investigate Turnbull after the mayor permitted a prize fight between Cleveland boxers Tommy and Johnny Kilbane to be held at City Auditorium the day after New Year's. The Stark County Ministerial Association, already critical of Turnbull's toleration of Saxton Street vice and the spectre of the "carnival of crime," not only backed Judge Harter's request but called for the impeachment of the mayor.26

In answer to the barrage of accusations, Jimmy Smith met with police and ordered the officers to report to him whatever happened on their beats or "to look for other work." "Gambling rooms, wine rooms, and houses of ill fame must be reported and officers are expected to collect any evidence which will lead to the conviction of guilty parties," Smith warned his men, according to a reporter. The collection of evidence, however, did not include "taking nips and lounging around saloons and places of ill-repute." or "loafing about" the police booth on the square—privileges that had recently

25Morning News, December 9, 1909, 1; December 10, 1909, 1, 4; December 11, 1909, 1, 4; December 13, 1909, 1; December 16, 1909, 1, 4.

26Morning News, January 3, 1910, 1; Repository, January 3, 1910, 1.
been abused by men on duty. Almost immediately, Smith had slot machines and gambling paraphernalia removed from hotels, cigar stores, and confectioneries with no discrimination between "the big and little fish," even though some of the owners complained that they would lose up to seventy-five dollars a week with the machines "turned to the wall." Proprietors in Whiskey Alley (the city's gambling district) shut down for a few days rather than risk arrest. As for the Tenderloin, Smith announced that he intended to curb houses of ill fame. The chief said that every woman in the district would be required to furnish a photograph of herself as well as a short autobiographical statement to police. "Some of these women will stay, but there are many others which we don't want and will not tolerate," Smith told the press.

Heated by the fever of reform, long-silent ministers and church-related organizations opened fire on Turnbull's and Smith's re-organization scheme. The Canton WCTU passed a resolution that condemned Smith's toleration of Saxton Street and called for the "extermination of such places, knowing that they are sources of much evil in the community." Later the Simon WCTU announced plans to visit the district and meet with individual madams and prostitutes to ascertain true conditions of the area.

---

27 Repository, January 4, 1910, 1; Morning News, January 4, 1910, 1; January 5, 1910, 1; Repository, January 6, 1910, 1; Morning News, January 6, 1910, 1.

28 Repository, January 5, 1910, 10.

29 Repository, January 8, 1910, 1; April 27, 1910, 1; Morning News, April 27, 1910, 8.
Avenue Methodist Church Men's Brotherhood said that they were ready to "unite with all law and order loving citizens to prevent Canton from being used as a dumping ground for the refuse of other towns and cities." Reverend Floyd Beckwith of the First Baptist Church declared from the pulpit that "the city administration is so lax that anything goes," and E. P. Townsend, the new pastor at Calvary Presbyterian Church, would who soon become the most vocal of all the reformers, called Canton "a cesspool for criminals." Even Pearl Welshimer, many years later Turnbull's pastor at the First Christian Church, bemoaned the lack of backbone demonstrated by Cantonians and declared, "There is not a city from ocean to ocean any blacker than Canton for its size . . . ." 30

The most publicized denunciation of the city administration occurred on January 2, when Reverend J. S. Reager of the Dueber Avenue Methodist Church delivered a sermon entitled, "Where is My Wandering Boy Tonight: A Peep Into the Dark Holes of Canton," which reprised a night the clergyman claimed he had recently spent prowling through Saxton Street. Reager told his congregation, "If you could take the cover off a certain region of this city and look down you wouldn't think there was necessity for another hell. There is hell enough in Canton to damn the souls of thousands of men." The pastor described Saxton Street brothels as "places designated by crimson lights where gaily bedecked girls sell

---

30 Repository, January 8, 1910, 1; January 3, 1910, 1, 8; January 4, 1910, 1, 8.
themselves to the lusts of men." While Reager showed some concern for the fallen women of the Tenderloin, his chief worry was the danger the district presented to young men. He urged that the area be closed down so that a young man could walk safely on the street without being accosted by prostitutes or men "familiar with the red light district who would assist him as he takes in the sights and the sights take him in." The pastor ended his report by accusing city officials of accepting bribes from Tenderloin gamblers and proprietors and suggesting that city official take a two-thirds cut in pay so that Cantonians could see for themselves just who was sincerely interested in public service and who was in city government to collect graft.31

In response to the sermon, Chief Smith denied that he or anyone in the city administration took money from women in the Tenderloin. Within the week, to prove his point, Smith ordered a series of raids on houses of prostitution. On January 27, Mamie Lee and her partner Grace Craig were arrested on charges of keeping a house of prostitution, and three weeks later, Marie Martin and three inmates at the old Phoenix Hotel, one of the most notorious brothels in town, were arrested on similar charges. A few days later, Florence Walker and three women were arrested for running a house of ill repute, but the "girls" were fined only $10.00 each since this was their first local arrest. In March, Jumbo Crowley and his brother Edward were arrested and later fined $100.00 each for keeping a

31News Democrat, January 25, 1910, 5; Repository, January 24, 1910, 1, 8.
house of assignation. Then, in mid-March, Whiskey Alley was raided and gamblers Jake Frailey, William Fishel, and Butch Wagner were charged with running game rooms.\textsuperscript{32}

While inexperienced reformers expected these raids to eradicate vice in the city, by May "business was usual" but cautious in both Saxton Street and Whiskey Alley. The reform movement, so intense only a few months earlier, seemed exhausted, as defeated reformers retreated to their churches. Charles L. Smith, the newly appointed pastor of the First Methodist Church, and an experienced civic reformer, admonished his fellow churchmen that "reform is not the work of the minister, physician, banker, machinist laborer," but of 'good citizens' who must assert their leadership at the ballot box."\textsuperscript{33} Reformers, outwardly defeated, listened to Smith's ecclesiastical advice and began to gather forces for the next municipal election only a few months away. In the meantime, local politicians opposed to the Turnbull machine planned an election strategy built on the foundation of the young moral reform movement, which they hoped would overturn the Turnbull machine and fortuitously create a new and morally clean Canton.

\textsuperscript{32}\textit{Morning News}, January 25, 1910, 5; \textit{Repository}, January 24, 1910, 1, 8; \textit{Morning News}, January 27, 1910, 5; February 19, 1910, 5; \textit{Morning News}, February 22, 1910, 2; \textit{Repository}, March 14, 1910, 1; \textit{Morning News}, March 14, 1910, 8; \textit{Repository}, March 13, 1910, 6; \textit{Morning News}, April 6, 1910, 6.

\textsuperscript{33}\textit{Repository}, March 14, 1910, 1; \textit{Morning News}, March 14, 1910, 8.
The Republicans officially opened the municipal election campaign on the evening of October 12, 1911 at a meeting of the McKinley Club. Although serious public health and safety problems existed in the waterworks and street departments, the toleration and maintenance of the Tenderloin quickly became the major issue of the campaign. Republican Party campaign manager E. L. Mills told the gathering that Arthur Turnbull and Assistant County Prosecutor Herbert C. Pontius were guilty of corruption in office and accused the Democratic administration of taking money from contractors and gamblers. Sounding more like a candidate than did the actual Republican nominee, Clifton D. Burns, Mills told the audience that the prosecutor had no excuse for ignoring open gambling in the downtown area. "If he but look out the back window of his office, he can see movements and hear the rattle of chips in a gambling room," Mills declared. "It is not one hundred steps from city hall," Mills then charged that Turnbull had solicited campaign funds from Saxton Street prostitutes but offered no evidence to substantiate his claim.34

During the next few days, Turnbull and Democratic Party officials denied, then ignored Mills' accusations. Stark County

---

34Repository, October 13, 1911, 1, 11. On October 26, attorney Walter Ruff, Republican City Chairman, made a similar association in a speech at the Young Men's McKinley Club. He said in part, "... show me another city in the state of Ohio where an assistant prosecuting attorney can look out from his window and see the gamblers at table, where the prosecuting attorney can hear the rattle of the chips and the jingle of the coins from his rear window, and where all this is within the shadow of the court house and the city hall, then I will show him the second greatest wonder of the world." Repository, October 27, 1911, 1, 21.
Prosecutor Charles Kritchbaum, however, in a speech to the Democratic Club, deviated from official party policy and admitted that prostitution and gambling did exist in Canton but only because such activity was impossible to eradicate from any community. Kritchbaum ignored the current public disillusionment with the status quo and suggested that the best way to solve the problem was to re-elect Turnbull and "keep the city administration in good working order." Democrats, as a whole, however, ignored attacks on the party and instead began an innocuous campaign that continued through election day. Cantonians were reminded that their city was a great place in which to live and that the mayor supported "equal treatment for all classes and creeds." As Turnbull promised to expand the park system and refused to debate the Socialist Party candidate, Harry Schilling, and his campaign manager, Allen Cook, on civic problems, Republicans and Independents, with Rhodes Gregory as their candidate, became conspicuously unable to campaign effectively against an incumbent who refused to let them define the issues.35

Then, on October 27, Reverend E. B. Townsend, the reform-minded pastor of the Calvary Presbyterian Church, broke the campaign open by swearing out warrants against three suspected game room operators in the downtown area. At the request of Townsend, Stark County Sheriff Adam Oberlin by-passed Jimmy Smith's authority and conducted four raids on the rooms. At one South Cherry Street

---

35Repository, October 24, 1911, 1, 12; Turnbull's statements taken from various political advertisements published during the campaign.
address, literally at Prosecutor Pontius' back door as Mills had described, two bushel baskets of poker chips as well as gambling equipment valued at $2000.00 were hauled away in two moving vans. A writer for the News Democrat argued that the raids were "pulled off as part of the movement to elect Rhodes Gregory mayor."

Townsend and his "moral crusade," as the movement came to be called, avoided identification with all candidates and parties, however, preferring to be considered the moral watchdog of all candidates.

As soon as the raids were made public, Townsend announced that as far back as July, Pinkerton agents, hired by private citizens, had worked under cover in Canton and that the raids were the first fruit of the investigation. According to a report published in the News Democrat, some members of the city administration had believed that the "sleuths" were in town "in the interest of Billy Sunday" who planned a forty-day crusade in Canton at the first of the year. Others thought the detectives were Federal investigators, while a third group were convinced that the detectives were "a commission from Columbus." The investigators, according to Townsend, stayed at the Barnett House Hotel where they kept a close watch on Democratic Party headquarters and the Young Democratic Club, both located at the hotel, and spied on Democratic Party conferences. A "natt[ily] dressed and well appearing female detective" visited saloons, and police who followed her reported that she carried a Kodak camera with her and that she took "snap shots" of saloons and other public places.
Turnbull's reaction was typically evasive. The mayor simply announced that the raids were a political publicity stunt since the gambling dens had been shut down earlier by Jimmy Smith. (Two of the rooms had actually been shut down in March, 1910, but had re-opened the following May). Turnbull correctly pointed out that the raids had taken place after hours and that no arrests had been made on the premises even if the building owners and lessees were charged with various offenses. The gambling rooms, decorated with heavy red curtains, colored linoleum floors, and neatly-framed pictures of hunting scenes, and furnished with roulette wheels, chuck-a-luck games, and cloth-covered poker tables, however, did not look as if they were in storage. The rooms were probably temporarily closed because of the up-coming election. The proprietors pled guilty to charges of conducting gambling rooms—confessions Turnbull did not acknowledge. 36

On October 28, the night following the gambling raids, Townsend and Oberlin struck again, this time at the heart of the Tenderloin. Houses run by Alice Williams, Jennie Connors, and Anna Ward, a relative newcomer to the district, were raided, and the women were charged with operating immoral resorts. Williams and Connors took their arrests in stride. Connors joked with deputies that her arrest "was not so bad." When a deputy sheriff read the warrant to Williams, the madam answered, "These preachers again. I was

36News Democrat, October 28, 1911, 1; Repository, October 28, 1911, 1, 4; According to Rev. C. David Morgan, present pastor of Calvary Presbyterian Church, the membership of the church in 1912 was only about three-hundred. Interview with C. David Morgan, Calvary Presbyterian Church, Canton, Ohio, March 24, 1987.
looking for it but not so soon." Both arrests were made so quietly that inmates and visitors at the houses did not know that they had taken place.

The arrest of Anna Ward was a little more difficult. Deputies had to walk through a front room full of "several girls and a score of young men lined up at the bar" to reach Ward in the backroom of her establishment. Clearly upset at the charges brought against her, Ward began to cry and told deputies, "This is awful. I've never been arrested before in my life, and I've got a divorce suit pending."

Since the arrests conveniently took place late Saturday night, no magistrate was available to set bond, so the three women were forced to spend the rest of the weekend in jail. Subjected to the "sweating process" led by Townsend and aided by Reverend LeRoy DeHays of the First Church of God, and their attorney Lorin E. Souers, the women were expected to break and tell all they knew about corruption in city hall. Instead, Alice Williams only became indignant and refused to be interrogated. Jennie Connors was described as "more yielding," but as an experienced madam and the wife of James "Tip" O'Neil one of the town's leading criminals, she knew her way around reformers and the law and told the men virtually nothing. The interrogation remained a private affair between reformers and madams, and at no time were city police, the
Sheriff, city or county prosecutors, or defense attorneys involved in the questioning. 37

Anna Ward was in a more uncomfortable position than were Williams and Connors. In the Tenderloin only a few months and worried about her divorce as well as a brother in the city jail awaiting trial on a misdemeanor charge, Ward lacked the experience that sustained the other two madams. 38 Consequently, Ward buckled under the interrogation and in return for a suspended sentence and a $100.00 fine (Williams and Connors, in fact, received the same sentences and fines without helping Townsend), she told reformers what they wanted to hear. Ward told interrogators, and later swore in an affidavit before Lorin Souers, that she had received permission from Jimmy Smith to open her resort. After the house opened, she said that Henry Paulus, the mayor's clerk, came to her house and gave her a form to fill out that asked for a description of each girl who lived at the brothel. Ward claimed that after she "registered" with the police department, patrolmen, and on one occasions Smith himself, dropped by "to see how business was and if everything was quiet." On October 9, Ward said she met Paulus on the corner of Cherry and East Seventh Streets and the clerk told

37 Repository, October 29, 1911, 1, 20; News Democrat, October 29, 1911, 1, 5.

38 Ward filed for divorce on October 27, 1911, only two days before her arrest, and the divorce was granted on July 29, 1912. Stark County Clerk of Courts, Appearance Docket, Case No. 21730, Anna Ward v Willis Ward. The actual divorce petition cannot be located in the storage files. Ward was represented by W. J. Piero, who as will be seen later, was an attorney for many of the leading madams in Saxton Street.
her he wanted to talk to her privately at her house. When she asked him why, Paulus replied, "Well, we've been pretty good to you, and we would like to have about $50.00 for the [election] campaign." Since Ward did not have that much money on hand, Paulus agreed to take a partial payment. Ward said she paid him $25.00 in person two days later and an additional $25.00 by mail the following week. About a week after the second payment was made, the madam said that one of her "girls," Marie Warment, saw Paulus on the street and he told her, "Tell Anna I received that all right." Two more affidavits, signed by Warment and another inmate of the Ward house, corroborated the original statement.

Henry Paulus and Arthur Turnbull immediately denied the charges. Turnbull, in a rare display of political mudslinging, declared, "I do not propose to suspect him [Paulus] unless someone with a better reputation than the Ward woman comes forward with facts. As I understand it, she resides in a Saxton Street house rented to her by Attorney Burris, the brother-in-law of Candidate Burns." The Republicans remained silent while Townsend, DeHays, and Souers began to discuss the possibility of impeaching Turnbull if he were re-elected.39

The once cool campaign heated up. Numerous complaints were suddenly filed against Sunday liquor sales. On November 2, Emma Miller, who under the name of "Mrs. Brown," operated a resort for Trixie Bell, one of the leading madams in the district, was

39 Repository, October 30, 1911, 1, 7; October 31, 1911, 1, 3; News Democrat, October 31, 1911, 1, 4; November 1, 1911, 1, 5.
arrested. Mills, Burns, and Rhodes Gregory all claimed they had received numerous letters from wives of men engaged in vice, which said they had begged Turnbull to close down saloons, gambling rooms, and brothels, and although the mayor had promised to do so, he had not. Burns and Gregory, in separate campaign rallies, read a copy of an affidavit signed by Grant Brown, a private citizen with no known political connections to any candidate, and released to the candidates by Lorin Souers, in which Brown stated that two years earlier he had seen Turnbull and Chief Smith visit a resort operated by his former neighbor Jennie Lee. (Brown later claimed that he had signed the statement under pressure from Souers and that his identification of the two was a mistake.) Representatives from the Gregory camp accused Turnbull of being carried home drunk from a cockfight. Several months later, in a public confrontation at a Billy Sunday rally he was attending with a group of Masons, Turnbull told Townsend that the stories circulated by the minister and his reform supporters during the campaign had nearly cost the mayor his marriage.40

* * * * * *

The strongest attack and subsequent counter-attack between reformers and the Turnbull administration came the weekend just before the election. For some time, Pearl Welshimer, pastor of the First Christian Church, had rented the City Auditorium for Sunday

40 News Democrat, November 2, 1911, 1; Repository, November 2, 1911, 1; News Democrat, November 3, 1911, 1; November 5, 1911, 1, 21; November 16, 1911, 1; Repository, January 26, 1912, 1; March 26, 1912, 1, 17.
services while his new church was under construction. As election day grew near, Welshimer, in cooperation with other pastors, called for a "union meeting" of reform congregations for the November 6 evening service at the auditorium. The meeting was to provide a forum for pastors and congregations concerned with the local moral climate and the coming election.

When Canton City Service Director Ray Harbert learned of the nature of the union service, he informed Welshimer that the church would be held in violation of its contract with the city. "The meeting has the earmarks of a political gathering," Harbert said, "and I do not propose to permit a political meeting to be held under a church contract." Welshimer argued that "we are going to talk on moral conditions here and that is a matter which church men discuss and which concerns the moral welfare of the city . . . . We talk on such things in all of our churches every week." The argument left Harbert unconvinced, and although he did not ban the meeting, he told Welshimer that if it were held in the auditorium, the church would be in violation of its contract and that the city would forfeit the contract.41

The union meeting was quickly transferred to the United Brethren Church, which could hold over 2800 persons. People came early and took every seat in the auditorium, balcony, and Sunday School rooms. Long before the meeting was scheduled to start, entrances were jammed. Three or four hundred people were moved to the basement where a second meeting was planned. Still more people

41Repository, November 6, 1911, 1, 4.
came and a third meeting was hastily organized at the nearby First Baptist Church. Soon, that auditorium was also filled with people standing two and three deep in the back. The speakers, Reverends Townsend, DeHays, Welshimer, Recard, Jackson, and Edwards, and reformed gambler John Quinn, were forced to push their way through to the pulpits of each church as they travelled from one church to the other and back again.

Just as Recard was about to address the congregation at the United Brethren Church, Fire Chief Robert "Fighting Bob" Mesnar, probably under orders from Ray Harbert, pushed his way to the front of the auditorium and announced that he had just received word that the balcony had cracked and "there is danger from the people upstairs." Recard smiled and asked the congregation if any of them had heard the balcony crack. Church Music Director, Dr. C. E. Exline, was the first to answer. "The crack's at the city hall," he shouted from the choir loft. Then another man stood up and declared, "I want to say that that balcony will hold every one of the city officials and all they have done, besides the people that are up there. I built that balcony and I ought to know." The congregation laughed and applauded its approval and Mesnar, according to a report published in the Evening Repository, "went away red in the face and much vexed."

Townsend, DeHays, and the other speakers denied that the moral crusade was a political campaign. "We did it," Townsend declared, "to throw around the homes of Canton, the boys and the girls, the young men and women, the protection properly afforded by the laws
of the city and state." Despite the denial, most of the speeches that evening contained the color of the political campaign. J. C. Record referred to the town as "beautiful, beer-soaked bummy" Canton and was particularly vehement when he compared Canton to two other cities with less than virtuous reputations, Pittsburgh and Chicago:

The town is so rotten that if you sat it down in the center of Pittsburgh in the morning, half of the people in it would be pinched by night. . . . Our detectives told us this town had dives so rotten the wouldn't let them exist even in Chicago.42

While politicians were mudslinging and moral crusaders were agitating for municipal regeneration and revival, the Socialists were equally fervent in their gospel of salvation through economic redistribution. Harry Shilling and his campaign manager, attorney Allen Cook, proposed municipal ownership of utilities, ice and coal plants. They endorsed the initiative, the referendum, and the right to recall elected officials, all of which were important issues throughout the state that election year. Equal pay for women, the eight-hour work day for city employees, free hospital care and legal advice for the poor, and classes for the study of scientific municipal government were also parts of the Socialist platform. Although the Socialists could not avoid the moral issues in the campaign, Schilling and Cook side-stepped the subject as much as possible. Cook, who did most of Schilling's talking for

42Repository, November 6, 1911, 1, 4.
him, rejected the notion that church-backed reform would clean up the city, since "vice and crime flourish in the profit system." The attorney defended Tenderloin women as "impoverished, underpaid women of the working class." More importantly, Schilling and Cook refused to take part in the attack on Turnbull, and they instead consistently stressed issues of public health and safety rather than the morality (or immorality) of the Democratic administration. In reference to the "dirty tricks" campaign of Republicans, Independents, and reformers, Cook told a rally of 2,500 at City Auditorium a few days before the election, "I come here with a feeling of pity under the charges which have come against Herbert Pontius and the mayor. They have crawled into their holes and I don't believe in kicking a man when he is down." In the Socialist Party's attempt to rise above the muck of the campaign, politicians and both newspapers virtually dismissed Schilling as a serious threat to the Turnbull administration. Schilling, with his issue-oriented campaign, however, was not dismissed by the electorate. On November 7, 1911, in the watershed year of Socialist electoral power nationwide, and amid widespread reports of voter fraud from all sides, Harry Schilling defeated Arthur Turnbull by three votes, with Burns and Gregory receiving relatively few votes.43

43 Repository, November 8, 1911, 1; November 6, 1911, p. 3. Stark County Board of Elections, Abstract of Votes in Canton, 1911. Turnbull received a total of 399 votes in the Fourth Ward, where the Tenderloin was located, as compared to 299 for Schilling, 155 for Burns, 60 for Gregory, and 5 for a Socialist Workers Party candidate who did not campaign. Turnbull received 157 votes, the largest number of votes in Precinct D, in the heart of the Tenderloin, while Schilling received only 61. Likewise, Democratic candidates won the majority of votes in Ward Four, Precinct D for
Reformers were obviously disappointed in the outcome of the election and were the first to remind Schilling of his supposed debt to them. In an open letter to the Repository just after the election, Townsend and DeHays warned lawless elements in the community that the anti-vice crusade would continue and cautioned Schilling that should he fail to effect moral and economic reform, he might expect "no kinder treatment at the hands of the people in the future than were accorded Mayor Turnbull on yesterday." 44

Art Turnbull, on the other hand, was a gracious loser. Upon his defeat, the mayor, perhaps in gratitude for the clean Socialist campaign, immediately congratulated Schilling, called him "a fine clean-cut fellow," and then announced his own retirement from politics. 45 Two days later however, Turnbull decided that he had not fought his "last political fight" and asked for an immediate recount. At the same time, in a separate announcement, Ray Harbert accused at least fifteen election judges of intoxication while counting ballots in a precinct where Schilling was given a large majority. Allen Cook answered the claim by accusing Turnbull of "colonizing seventeen floats who had no home and were living out of the Oak Saloon and Jumbo Crowley's Place." 46

44 Repository, November 8, 1911, 6.


46 Repository, November 10, 1911, 1; News Democrat, November 11, 1911, 1.
A few hours later, with the recount completed, the election was declared a tie to be settled by the flip of a coin, since under Ohio law ties could only be settled by lottery. The usually pragmatic Turnbull refused "to gamble for the election" and Cook, equally reluctant to gamble, called for a new election at public expense to settle the issue. When his proposal was turned down, Cook then suggested that the Socialists and the Democrats split the cost of a runoff election, but this request was denied also. Reluctantly, Cook and Turnbull agreed to the lottery while at the same time each threatened to take the other to court if he lost.

Cook later denied that he agreed to the lottery although he reportedly suggested that the more sophisticated "bean or corn" method replace the flip of the coin which both parties considered "a rather trivial way to decide an election." The procedure was simple. A large cup of corn was held over the head of an unnamed election official while Election Board Chief Emil Kaufmann dipped a small silver cup into it. Allen Cook suggested that if the number dipped out were odd, Schilling would be the new mayor; if even, Turnbull. Silently, 110 small yellow kernels of corn were counted out on the table, and Art Turnbull was back in office more quickly than he had left.48


48Repository, November 11, 1911, 1, 21. Stark County Board of Elections, Minutes of Meetings, Board of Deputy State Supervisors and Inspectors of Elections, Stark County, Ohio, November 11, 1911, 38-41.
Safely back in City Hall, Art Turnbull ordered Jimmy Smith to clamp the lid on the Tenderloin. Police were told to enforce all laws against Sunday liquor sales, gambling, and prostitution. Pool rooms were ordered closed on Sunday, and turkey and duck raffles were outlawed. By the second week of December, eighteen plain clothes officers, fourteen patrolmen, and four detectives were assigned, according to Turnbull, to scout saloons for illegal Sunday sales, but by the end of the year, no arrests initiated from the mayor's office had been made.\footnote{News Democrat, November 13, 1911, 1; November 14, 1911, 1; November 27, 1911, 1; November 29, 1911, 1; Repository, December 11, 1911, 1.}

Reformers did not remain silent during Turnbull's attempt to keep the lid on. On November 29, Townsend and DeHays travelled to Columbus and presented a nine-point impeachment petition against Turnbull to Governor Judson Harmon, which included the charge that the mayor had permitted Henry Paulus and Jimmy Smith to collect protection money from dive keepers and gamblers.\footnote{News Democrat, November 14, 1911, 1, 2; November 20, 1911, 11; Repository, November 20, 1911, 1, 10; News Democrat, November 23, 1911, 1; November 24, 1911, 1, 8.} (See Appendix E for a complete list of charges).

Less than a week after the petition was delivered, Townsend and DeHays filed affidavits against resort operators and gamblers. On November 25, Jennie Connors and two serving girls at her brothel were arrested for illegal beer sales. The following day, reformers filed civil charges against the owners of Connors' brothel as well.
as against another madam, Anna Stoffer, under provisions of the Winn Law with the hope of generating $1,050.00 for the reform crusade treasury.\footnote{51} Two days later similar suits were brought against Emma Miller, Cora Kashner, and the proprietor and owners of the Colonial Hotel.\footnote{52}

While Governor Harmon considered the impeachment petition, Townsend took the helm of the crusade and continued to claim that Turnbull's lid was nothing more than a sham intended to fool the electorate. "We know positively," Townsend declared in a sermon delivered on the evening of December 17, "that many times when complaints have been sent to headquarters . . . . the police have been sent around not to arrest the offenders but to tip them off to

\footnote{51}The Winn Law was a liquor tax law, which, in part, made it unlawful to sell or give away intoxicants in a house of ill fame. Furthermore, anyone found guilty under the law could be assessed, in a civil action, $350.00 for each offense. The owner(s) of the building where the offense occurred could also be fined if the court believed that the owner(s) knew that the building was used for immoral purposes. One-third of the assessment (in the case of Connors and Stoffer, $350.00 for each case) would be given to the plaintiff causing the action (Townsend's "moral crusade") while the balance would be placed in the county treasury. \textit{Ohio General Code}, Section 6193-6201. The liability of the owner of the premises was decided in \textit{State ex rel., Maloney}, 4 O.N.P. 197, 6 O.D. Stark County Clerk of Courts, Case No. 21819, \textit{State of Ohio on relation to LeRoy DeHays v Annie Stoffer}; Stark County Clerk of Courts Case No. 21821, \textit{State of Ohio on relation to Edwin B. Townsend v Jennie Connors and Michael Rocco and Thomas Rocco}. At the same time, Townsend also filed a similar affidavit against the proprietors of the Colonial House Hotel, Case No. 21821, \textit{State of Ohio on relation to Edwin B. Townsend v James W. Piero and Lewis Hartung}. Also see Case No. 21825, \textit{State of Ohio on relation to Edwin B. Townsend v Cora Kashner}.

\footnote{52}Repository, November 17, 1911, 1; \textit{News Democrat}, November 27, 1911, 4; November 28, 1911, 10; Repository, November 28, 1911, 1, 14; November 29, 1911, 1, 3; \textit{News Democrat}, November 30, 1911, 4.
look for 'Mr. Blank' as he was trying to make trouble for them." Townsend claimed that when one of his operatives went to a saloonkeeper and asked him what he should do to open a sporting house in Canton, the saloonkeeper reportedly replied, "Go direct to the mayor. Don't see anybody else." A prostitute, according to Townsend, "told another operative that police were sent around to tell them when it will be safe to do street work." Townsend publicly complained about "a score or more of wine rooms that catered to young girls—many of them under the age of sixteen—who congregated at the side door of the saloons where they met young men." Convinced that "Canton's best people" were behind his reform movement, Townsend called for a permanent committee of two thousand or more to direct private detectives in an effort to clean up Canton. The next day, Townsend and DeHays filed prostitution charges against madams and suspected madams Ann (Dutch Mary) Lieber, Ella Arnold, Mabel Harris, Mary Ann Bailey, Sadie Richards, and Helen Weyant.53

As Turnbull and reformers continued their moral battle, Harry Schilling fought his own protracted legal battle to regain City Hall. Less than a month after Turnbull returned to office, Schilling and Allen Cook filed suit in the Court of Appeals in Youngstown to overturn the election.54 Several weeks later,

53Repository, December 18, 1911, 1, 8; News Democrat, December 20, 1911, 9; December 21, 1911, 1.

54Only one of the disputed ballots in the election was cast in Ward Four, Precinct D. Board of Election Minutes, November 9, 1911, 32-37.
however, Cook and the Socialist local ordered Schilling to drop his legal action on the grounds that his suit "would be an irreversible surrender of the party's revolutionary principles to political opportunism." Schilling refused to cooperate with party leaders and along with a few of his supporters was expelled from the party. Although Schilling staunchly maintained his socialist principles, his political battle against Turnbull was almost immediately taken up by Republican businessmen W. H. "Pete" McCurdy and W. W. Timken, president of The Timken Roller Mill Company, who apparently disliked the Turnbull machine more than they feared socialism or an ex-socialist. Over the next year these men financed Schilling's attempt to become mayor. Republican campaign manager E. L. Mills was soon hired to replace Allen Cook as Schilling's lawyer when the Socialist attorney backed the party's expulsion of Schilling.55

* * * * *

After the wave of arrests that followed the November election, the reform movement appeared to stagnate once more. In January, Billy Sunday arrived in town for his forty-day crusade at City Auditorium, and as a matter of courtesy, the evangelist visited Art Turnbull in City Hall. To the dismay of reformers, the two men became fast friends. Sunday called the mayor "a prince" and "a corker" and agreed to give a sermon on hypocrites, the mayor's "pet aversion." Sunday also accepted Turnbull's invitation to speak at a Scottish Rite banquet at the Masonic Lodge the following Friday.

55Repository, March 11, 1912, 1; March 12, 1912, 1; March 18, 1912, 14; March 19, 1912, 1.
evening. A little over a month later, while Townsend and other
reformers were out of town, Turnbull, who had not attended church
for twenty years, "found the Lord," and publicly converted at a
Sunday evening service at the First Methodist Church. Billy Sunday
sent him a congratulatory telegram and, in return, Turnbull
credited Sunday (along with the Sermon on the Mount) with his
conversion. "Billy Sunday," the mayor declared, "showed me how a
man could be a church member and still a man—how a man could
belong to church and still be a manly man." Turnbull promised to
enforce anti-vice laws, particularly Sunday liquor sales and
gambling ordinances. Confused by this unexpected turn of events,
Townsend announced that the mayor's conversion might cause the
moral crusade to drop the impeachment charges.57 The charges, in
fact, were dropped by Governor Harmon shortly afterward. In the
meantime, Turnbull confused the issue even more by bolting the
Democratic Party and joining the Progressives.58

Throughout the Spring and Summer of 1912, as Schilling's case
dragged on, occasional reform-backed gambling raids took place and
a few prostitution arrests were made. On May 5, nine people were
arrested on warrants sworn out by Townsend and DeHays after the
reformers claimed Turnbull had refused to investigate suspected
gambling rooms. Turnbull answered by claiming that he had told

56 Repository, January 19, 1912, 1, 10.

57 Repository, February 26, 1912, 1, 4.

reformers to report their complaints to Jimmy Smith, and if they received no satisfaction from him, to report back to the mayor's office. Smith, however, claimed that neither Townsend nor DeHays had ever contacted him. In July, DeHays and gambler-turned-private detective Kenneth Miller were charged with perjury after they gave untruthful or mistaken information about a former pool hall operator during an anti-slot machine crusade. The charges against DeHays were ignored by the Stark County Grand Jury after the minister resigned his pastorate and moved to a new church in Findlay. Attorney Lorin Souers slowed down the reform movement even more when just after the arrest of DeHays he resigned from the moral crusade, claiming that crusade leaders had never paid him for his legal services six months earlier. 59

Then, in late September and early October, just as the moral crusade seemed to lose its energy, Townsend and his new assistant, W. C. Knowlton, a private investigator from Pittsburgh, began a series of raids led by the Sheriff's Department, intended to cut the heart out of the Tenderloin. 60 In seventeen days, twenty-two arrests were made of leading madams and saloon keepers. Tension between city officials and reformers became intense. Knowlton, Recard, and Jimmy Smith clashed verbally on several occasions.

---

59 Repository, May 5, 1912, 1, 20; July 20, 1912, 8; News Democrat, July 21, 1912, 1.

60 According to the Daily News, unnamed Pittsburgh authorities denied knowing anything about Knowlton, which raised the question of whether or not Knowlton was indeed a private detective. Daily News, January 8, 1913, 1. Apparently the question was dropped since nothing more about it was mentioned in the press.
During a reform-led investigation of a suspected house of prostitution in "one of the best residence parts of the city," Knowlton warned Smith to stay out of the investigation. "... if anyone starts any violence with us we will clash and we will show them that we are able to take care of ourselves." Knowlton told the press. "No hired thugs and ruffians will be able by violence to deter us from our work and we will do whatever is necessary to protect ourselves."  

The dispute reached a crisis early in the morning of November 7 when a bomb exploded at the northwest corner of Townsend's Calvary Presbyterian Church—the center of reform activity. Although the explosion was heard a mile away, little damage—only about $100.00 worth—was actually done to the small wooden structure. The front steps of the church were torn away, weather boarding was shattered, one stained glass window was damaged, and a hole was blown in the cornerstone. Twelve windows at a house adjacent to the church were also shattered. Although Townsend was sure that the explosion was set off by local criminal elements affected by the moral crusade, he refused to name names. He did reveal, however, that the explosion was the latest in a series of threats he had recently received. Only three weeks earlier, the pastor had received two threatening letters that read:

61 News Democrat, September 26, 1912, 1; September 27, 1912, 16; Repository, September 27, 1912, 1; September 28, 1912, 1; News Democrat, October 2, 1912, 1; Repository, October 3, 1912, 1; October 6, 1912, p. 7; News Democrat, October 6, 1912, 12; Repository, October 7, 1912, 10, News Democrat, October 9, 1912, 1; Repository, October 10, 1912, 1.
If you don't leave town by 9 o'clock tonight we'll get you sure.

Black Hand—Maybe

and

This is your last chance. If you don't get out of town tonight sure you will be a dead man.

While the explosion literally could have blown the church off its foundation, Townsend and city police pointed out that the bomb had been misplaced and was probably the work of an amateur. The rear of the church, in fact, had offered a much better opportunity to cause damage since the foundation in the back of the building was loose and the bomb could have been placed under the floor of the church. The explosive device (there was a question of whether the bomb was made of dynamite or powder since evidence of both were found at the church) had been placed on the ground and had not been covered or tamped to give it an explosive force. When the bomb went off it met no resistance, and the charge was virtually wasted.

Although city police arrived at the church only a few moments after the explosion, Townsend announced that he intended once more to by-pass Jimmy Smith's authority and request that Sheriff Oberlin investigate the bombing. This time, however, the sheriff refused to cooperate with reformers. Claiming that spectators had already disturbed the scene of the explosion and that "many people had been walking around the church when I got there," he said that his bloodhounds would have been useless in tracking down the bomber. Although Oberlin would not handle the case he had no doubt about who was behind the bombing. "I would not be surprised if it should
become known," the sheriff announced, "that the dynamiting was done by someone hired by women and others connected with houses of ill fame on which Revrend Townsend has been waging war," an accusation which should have been taken more seriously than it was, since as will be seen in Chapter Six, leading Saxton Street madams had recently joined together in a protective society or "union" to fight the reform movement. Jimmy Smith had another opinion. At the scene of the bombing he told the press, "It might have been a frame-up."62

Reaction to Smith's statement was fierce but predictable. Reverend A. W. Higby of St. Paul's Episcopal Church called Smith "contemptible." James Lawrence, pastor of the First Presbyterian Church virtually compared his fellow clergyman, Townsend, to Christ:

If the chief of police is correctly reported as saying that he believes the one who made the attempt was a reformer trying to arouse sympathy for his cause, the remark is not original. The Pharisees, in trying to discredit the work of Christ by saying that he did his miracles by the power of Bezeelbub, already said the same thing.

In the most vicious language of the long moral crusade, George E. Jackson pastor of the First Baptist Church declared that the Turnbull administration had been marked and noted for its "frightful moral putridity no sane person can for a moment doubt." The pastor attacked Turnbull both politically and personally:

The mayor .... was sworn to enforce our laws. .... He has the means to reach and the

62News Democrat, November 8, 1912, 1; November 11, 1912, 1, 3.
authority and power to drive from the community every man and woman who breaks the law. Now the fact that he has not done so forces me to conclude either that he is an imbecile and ignorant weakling or that he is a law breaker and a scoundrel himself. Those of you who know him know that the first supposition is not true.63

Immediately after the bombing, Townsend sent a statement to the News Democrat and Evening Repository:

For any chief officer to infer that any officer or member of that [reform] committee would ever think of such a diabolical plot, let alone stooping to perpetuate such an outrageous deed, certainly proves the ignorance and pitiable low moral standard of the one making the statement or shows up his bad blood and guilt.

The question I desire to submit to the people of Canton is, who in their honest estimation, is most guilty of this deed, any man or men who are fighting professional vice and protected lawlessness, or the administration that permits such conditions of lawlessness vandalism to exist?

Even Turnbull was forced to publicly rebuke his chief of police.

"I cannot believe that anyone with the reform movement would do such a thing." he said. "I believe that Reverend Townsend and all the rest of the reformers are honorable gentlemen." The mayor then announced that he would see that the police department "would not rest until it has brought to justice the person who was responsible for the deed." Jimmy Smith answered, "I prefer to make no more comment on the matter.64

63Repository, November 7, 1912, 1, 9; News Democrat, November 7, 1912, 1, 6.

64News Democrat, November 11, 1912, 1; November 7, 1912, 1, 6; Repository, November 8, 1912, 1.
Within forty-eight hours of the bombing, however, an even more significant event occurred. On November 9, after eleven months of deliberation, Judge W. T. Barnum of the Court of Common Pleas in Youngstown ruled that five votes given to Turnbull and three to Schilling were illegally cast, thus giving Schilling a two vote majority—and the election. For the next week Turnbull's attorneys argued that three of Schilling's votes should have been ruled invalid, but Judge Barnum refused to re-open the case. Turnbull's attorneys then filed suit in the Court of Appeals, but the action could do nothing in the meantime to keep the former Socialist from taking office at the earliest possible date.65

On November 18, Townsend and his partner W. C. Knowlton swore out a warrant against Jimmy Smith on charges of taking a $25.00 bribe from madam Fannie Schmidt. Later that afternoon Smith was arrested by a deputy sheriff as the police chief stood on a street corner near his home. He was taken before a magistrate and was immediately released on a $300.00 bond.66

The next morning Harry Schilling was sworn into office and within half an hour of taking office he fired Jimmy Smith and replaced him with Socialist patrolman Saranus "Ed" Lengel.67 The new mayor announced that in less than a week the Tenderloin would

65_Repository, April 26, 1913, 1. I have used this reference instead of the contemporary references cited because it gives a concise summary of the protracted election and is consistent with primary materials.

66_Repository, November 19, 1912, 1.

67_News Democrat, November 19, 1912, 1.
be shut down. Unlike the moral crusaders and his rival politicians, however, Schilling wanted no raids or wholesale arrests unless absolutely necessary. By announcing his plans in advance, he hoped that Tenderloin women and saloonists would simply "close up shop." Along with Cora Rackle, secretary of the Associated Charities (the forerunner of the Welfare Department), and reporters, Schilling toured the Tenderloin and met with madams and prostitutes. Remaining true to his socialist beliefs that prostitution was caused by low wages and a general exploitation of women, Schilling offered to find legitimate work for prostitutes who wanted to leave the life.68

While Schilling's methods might have been considered unorthodox in the eyes of many reformers and political rivals, his reinstatement as mayor, in fact, was seen by them as the turning point in the moral regeneration of Canton. This time Townsend and the moral crusaders issued no warning to Schilling that he would receive "no kinder treatment" than did Turnbull and Smith if he failed to initiate reform. From his pulpit at the First Baptist Church, George Jackson urged not only his congregation but all Cantonians to disregard party loyalty and to support the new mayor. "The thing for all good people to do is to get behind the new mayor and give him the assurance of your support to a new program of cleanliness and decency for our city."69 Cantonians, while they

68 Repository, November 20, 1912, 1; November 26, 1912, 1; Daily News, November 27, 1912, 4; Repository, November 27, 1912, 1, 10.

69 News Democrat, November 11, 1912, 3.
generally commended Schilling's actions as good for the community, saw little permanent change. 70

Encouraged by the removal of Jimmy Smith and the subsequent re-organization of the police department, as well as of a scheduled Grand Jury investigation of vice and municipal corruption, reformers did cooperate with Schilling. In December, Townsend and Knowlton dropped their cases against eight women recently charged with prostitution. An attorney for the reform movement explained that the decision was made to "allow the Schilling administration to correct conditions in the city." A few days later the Grand Jury began its investigation. One hundred witnesses, including madams Maude O'Brian, Ella Arnold, Mamie Lee, Trixie Bell; gamblers Jake Frailey, Butch Wagner, and Link Andrews; reformers E. B. Townsend and W. W. Stephens, as well as police officers and attorneys were subpoenaed to testify before the hearing, but after several days of secret testimony, the Grand Jury refused to bring back any indictments. Since Grand Jury hearings are held confidential, no record of the testimony is available. At the end

70Repository, December 1, 1912, 6. Several prominent women of various political persuasions were asked what they thought of the Jungle cleanup. Most felt that although the idea was good, the methods were not. Cora Rackle, who accompanied Schilling on his tour of Saxton Street felt that many of the Tenderloin women were "victims of circumstances," the wives of drunken husbands, and lacked training "along any line to earn a living." Socialist Harriet Powell felt that legislation, which would "make it unnecessary for girls to earn their living in that way" was the only way to bring about social reform and to rid the town (and country) of vice. Mrs. G. A. Kelly thought the best solution would be "to go to the men who support those houses and make it necessary for those girls to be there."
of the session, the jury reported simply that it "did not find sufficient evidence to substantiate . . . . charges which the anti-vice crusade committee asked to have investigated." Strangely enough, only a few days before the announcement, the Repository printed a rumor that the Grand Jury was considering perjury indictments against witnesses whom they believed had withheld information and made false statement concerning graft and vice in canton. Prosecutor Kritchbaum refused to comment, and no perjury indictments were forthcoming. Given what is publicly known about the reform movement and the large amount of evidence that Townsend and his reformers had collected over the past two years, no reasonable explanation for the decision of the Grand Jury not to indict can be found, except that it chose not to do so in order to protect the reputations of various prominent landholders, merchants, and politicians.\(^71\)

Disappointed but undaunted in his effort to weed out municipal corruption, during the early part of January, Schilling brought Jimmy Smith to "trial" in a Civil Service Commission hearing which he believed would permanently remove Smith from the police department. As police, politicians, and prostitutes alike came forward, their testimony pieced together a mosaic of small town corruption and red light life as revealing as any contemporary New York or Chicago vice report, but one that also showed that prostitution in Canton still held on to many of the traditions of

\(^{71}\) Repository, December 13, 1912, 1; News Democrat, December 12, 1912, 1; Repository, December 17, 1912, 1, 2; Daily News, December 17, 1912, 1; December 4, 1912, 1, 4.
the nineteenth century fast life and had not yet joined in the "new prostitution" which plagued larger areas.
CHAPTER 2

SEXUAL COMMERCE IN THE PROGRESSIVE ERA:

THE NEW PROSTITUTION AND AMERICA

Prostitution in a given time and place cannot be stereotyped. While certain factors such as poverty, run-down neighborhoods, and alcohol and drug abuse may be a common denominator, what was common in one town might be rare in another. Nonetheless, a general view of Progressive era prostitution, generated from vice reports and investigations can give an overview of the components of commercialized vice seventy-five years ago. The broad description that follows serves to permit a comparison of commercialized vice in general in the United States to specific commercialized vice in Canton. Important differences in the structure of vice and the vice community in Canton will be apparent throughout this study and will continually challenge the assumptions of historians who have researched prostitution on a broader scale.

According to social historians Arthur W. Calhoun, Mary P. Ryan, Gerda Lerner, and Carl Degler, with the advance of the Industrial Revolution, the traditional American economic structure moved from the subsistence farm to the commercial marketplace. Likewise, the traditional patriarchal framework of the family began to change.
Women's work in the home gradually transferred to the outside workplace, diminishing not only women's partnership in the traditional family economic structure but female status and influence in the home. By the mid-nineteenth century, most families, native-born and immigrant, had ceased to function as self-sufficient economic units, suggesting that the question was not if poor women would enter the permanent outside workforce, but when. As the economic base of the country changed, some traditional female jobs, such as market vendor, were taken over by men, while women in turn took low-level male-defined factory jobs. Married women were not barred from mill work, and wives often came to the mills to help pay off their husbands' farms. Other women came to mill towns to open boarding houses and provide other services needed by male and female factory workers. By the first half of the nineteenth century, women made up two-thirds, three-fourths, and even as much as nine-tenths of the workforce in factories.

These women, excluded from heavy industry and the accompanying higher pay, were, in many cases, separated from traditional family protection and social restraints. They faced sexual exploitation as well as low wages. Some turned to prostitution as a supplement if not an alternative to miserable pay and working conditions. Some women could find no other work but prostitution. Women, for the first time, no matter what their social and economic positions, found themselves representing an individual economic and social
unit outside of the family, important to the commercial growth of the country.¹

Some early mills (particularly in Lowell, Massachusetts) were healthy places in which to work and were highly moral in nature, with girls subject to chaperones, education, and religious training. Most factories, however, were incredibly severe places, with twelve to fifteen-hour work days, low pay, and crowded dormitory conditions.²

No wonder, then, that some women, many away from home for the first time and enticed by the mill operator’s promise of "very neat work, high wages, and the belief that they could dress in silk and spend half the time reading," became disillusioned and took up prostitution as an alternative to the miseries of factory life. Prostitution to some of these women was neither a sign of social disorder nor a symbol of sexual exploitation. Instead, they viewed their trade simply as a form of work—a means of economic survival that sometimes afforded a small degree of upward mobility. These


²Degler, At Odds, 370; Calhoun, American Family, Vol, 2, 175, 179, 187-188; Ibid., Vol. 3, 88-91.
prostitutes lived in or near the town in which they worked at legitimate jobs and were able to move in and out of "respectable" life when economic problems forced them into occasional prostitution. Prostitution was considered by them and by the public at large as a personal, not commercial vice—a temporary state of sin rather than a permanent occupation—and nineteenth century commentaries on prostitution emphasized personal choice and responsibility on the part of both prostitutes and patrons.  

By the late nineteenth century, substantial numbers of women moved from part-time prostitution to full time sexual commerce. These women became part of a permanent and fulltime class of prostitutes who searched for customers in areas where large numbers of unattached males worked, such as lumber and mining camps and manufacturing centers. As Jacqueline Baker Barnhart points out in The Fair But The Frail, her study of prostitution in the archtypical male community of Gold Rush San Francisco, these prostitutes recognized the loneliness of these men and the financial rewards available to themselves if they could exploit this loneliness. As a result they took advantage of the suspension of social and moral restraints which usually existed in these male enclaves and were often able to make a comfortable living at prostitution. Prostitutes increasingly attached themselves to saloons and vice districts that working men frequented. Concurrently, politics gradually pushed the women into

---

tolerated or "segregated" vice districts where the traffic in women was under the scrutiny and control of police and grew into a complex, commercial business that involved the political, economic, and cultural life of the city. These vice areas such as the Levee in Chicago or Saxton Street in Canton, were located in older parts of town where strong neighborhood and family organization (group controls) were disintegrating and being replaced by what Eric H. Monkonen calls an unregulated, though temporary, bachelor class of working men with no permanent ties to the community. Prostitutes sometimes offered these men companionship as well as sex and many prostitutes probably viewed themselves simply as working women rather than deviants or victims. In addition to this new class of men, commercial enterprises moved into these deteriorating residential areas. Residents had little political power and were unable to halt the flow of vice into their neighborhoods. The powerlessness of residents in these areas was summed up by Morris Behman, a physician in New York's East Side, in 1899, when he described the situation in his neighborhood: "I presume it is because the district is managed from a political rather than from a civic standpoint. There is a boss in the district . . ." 4

---

As a result of this incursion, prostitution, once the domain of women, who had usually worked as individual "artisans" or for another woman—a madam (although pimps had always existed), began to pass into the hands of men. Women, who earlier owned their own businesses such as lodging and boarding houses or saloons, increasingly found themselves, especially in metropolitan areas, working directly or indirectly for men who acted as landlords, proprietors of disorderly houses, or procurers. Large establishments where liquor was served and a high potential for rowdiness existed were likely to be controlled by men simply because men could enforce order where women could not. While these profiteers earned money through prostitutes, the relationship between vice operators and prostitutes was based mainly on economic exchange rather than on sexual or emotional intimacy. Often some of the most important men in the business community of a given town owned the buildings in which houses of prostitution and bawdy saloons operated, but unlike the madams, prostitutes and pimps whom they "employed" they were free from the stigma attached to the vice community. In large cities, the men who profited from prostitution hardly knew the names of the women who occupied their

Sociological Analysis," The American Journal of Sociology 32 (1926), 165. Goldman points to Virginia City, Nevada as an extreme example of the "temporary bachelor class" of population, reporting that in late 1860 only 30 women lived in the town with a male population of 2,206. Ten years later the ratio was 2,323 women to 4,725 men and in 1975, 6,116 women to 13,415 men. Francesco Cordesco and Thomas Monroe Pitkin, The White Slave and the Immigrants: A Chapter in American Social History (Detroit: Blaine Ethridge Books, 1981), 12.

5Rosen, Lost Sisterhood, 4, 70.
buildings. Financial obligation and mutual economic profit defined the relationship. Early vice reports from Little Rock, Chicago, Philadelphia, Massachusetts, and New York City stressed the growing male investment in, and impersonal management, of prostitution. Members of the Philadelphia Vice Commission in 1913 published a scathing indictment of male-controlled vice interests that concluded:

The whole system is one of commercialized vice, in which by far the greater part of the profit finds its way into the pockets of men. To the women it means perhaps a living wage but certainly a ruined character at an early age.

In 1912, Chicago reformer Kate J. Adams, who spent years investigating the Levee, wrote that two hundred of the better known houses of prostitution in Chicago were held by the "South Side Trust," made up of twelve men and headed by early organized crime figure Jim Colosimo and his clerk and successor, John Torrio. Male entrepreneurship was even prevalent in Little Rock where


7Philadelphia Vice Report, 15-16.
investigators reported finding nineteen (white) houses, all run by women but owned by well-known prominent male citizens. In Canton, however, as will be seen, men held a minority interest in the bawdy house circuit and individual female owners/operators/practitioners remained the standard unit of operation, although men did operate most of the saloons in Saxton Street.

In 1913, John D. Rockefeller, Jr., (who headed a special Grand Jury investigation of prostitution in New York City) and the Bureau of Social Hygiene sponsored the most thorough investigation of commercialized vice of the era. The results of this investigation were published under the title *Commercialized Prostitution in New York City*. The author of the report, George Kneeland, presented a detailed picture of exploitation and degradation in New York's vice districts. Kneeland described a "combine" of fifteen or more men who conducted thirty houses of prostitution:

They buy and sell shares in these houses among themselves, and it is seldom that an outsider, unless he be a relative, can "break" into the circle and share in the profits. The value of the shares depends upon the ability of the owners to maintain conditions in which the houses, being unmolested, are permitted to make large profits. The man who proves himself capable of achieving this through business sagacity and political pull

---

is called the "king." Upon him falls the responsibility of "seeing" the "right individuals."9

The right individuals whom Kneeland mentioned were police, judges, lawyers, and politicians. Mary Goode, a madam who testified before a New York City Grand Jury in 1913, claimed that 35,000 prostitutes worked in the city and that keepers of houses of ill fame paid anywhere from $60.00 to $1000.00 a month for police protection. In Pittsburgh, 281 disorderly houses reportedly paid out $1,700,000.00 in protection money over a three-year period. In 1910, a Chicago "vice lord" reportedly paid police $5,000.00 for permission to open a house on the Levee, and a few years later one Chicago police inspector was supposedly offered $2,200.00 a month to keep the Morals Squad out of the district.10 Such extravagances, however, were limited to large commercial centers. Such large-scale bribes would have been impossible in Canton if for no other reason than the low standard of living most madams and prostitutes experienced.


Rank and file police had little professional or economic interest in enforcing laws against prostitution, and the close contact between some police and various criminal elements was reinforced by low police pay. Graft, in fact, was little more than an agreement between individual police officers and brothel and saloon keepers, a practice clearly illustrated in the situation in Canton where the police chief reportedly took small, steady payments from madams. Moreover, the daily workings of the traffic in women smoothed the way for good relationships with law enforcement officers. A "landlady" in Portland, Oregon, explained: "if you are a good fellow, set up drinks and cigars and throw in a little [sexual] business on the side, there will be no trouble with the policeman on the beat . . . ."11 That beat police in Canton enjoyed the favors of prostitutes is debatable, but evidence suggests that Chief of Police Jimmy Smith was occasionally entertained in at least one resort.12

Arrests for prostitution as well as gambling, liquor law, and narcotics violations throughout the country were basically proactive in that they were dependent on a willingness of the police to sanction such activities. Generally, police were not willing to make vice arrests a priority since protection of vice meant not only higher income for police but also helped maintain

11 Rosen, Lost Sisterhood, 75; Goldman, Gold Diggers and Silver Miners, 107; Citizens Committee of Portland to Investigate the Social Evil, Report of the Vice Commission to the Mayor and City Council of the City of Portland, Oregon, January, 1913 (Portland: Henry Russell Talbot, 1913), 38, 114.

order and stability in vice districts. Many police chiefs held that the role of police was that of social control, not law enforcement and crime prevention. Furthermore, police saw little use in enforcing laws, such as liquor control statutes, which were unpopular in their own communities. In other words, many police officials, including Jimmy Smith in Canton, supported the idea of a tolerated vice district simply because a tolerated area was easier to control than one that was not overseen.13

Although payoffs to politicians, police, and judges were common, officials in smaller towns, although not in Canton, found "indirect license" or the "fine system" an easier and more efficient way to reap the benefits of vice while at the same time controlling the situation. In Little Rock, for example, keepers of houses were required at various times to pay the city a $25.00 quarterly "license fee" in order to operate a bawdy house or to sell liquor in a house of prostitution. In addition, each inmate of a house of prostitution was assessed a $5.00 per month "fine". Unless other violations of the law occurred, these houses were permitted to operate unmolested. Between 1897 and 1901, Minneapolis authorities automatically "arrested" brothel keepers once a month

---

and "fined" them $100.00 each. In 1902, police made "arrests" only every two months; later the practice was declared "unjustifiable and immoral" and was abandoned. In October, 1908 a reported $5,000.00 was paid to the City of Seattle in prostitution assessments—$10.00 from each prostitute in the city—and in 1914, the Wisconsin Vice Commission reported that the city of Superior actually depended on the returns from segregated vice to help pay municipal expenses. The monetary proceeds, then, from prostitution financed numerous municipal governments. Although evidence suggests that Jimmy Smith and Art Turnbull solicited campaign funds from madams in Saxton Street, and that Smith probably privately collected periodic bribes from at least some madams, there was apparently no "official" or institutionalized "licensing" of houses in Canton.

Segregation (the open operation of vice in a specifically restricted section of a community), regulation (the registration and medical and police supervision of prostitutes and prostitution), and toleration (the toleration of prostitution as long as it remained free of public disorder), in fact, had become

14 Little Rock Vice Report, 10; Vice Commission of Minneapolis, Report to the Vice Commission to His Honor James C. Haynes, Mayor (Minneapolis: 1911). 23-25. In 1900, Minneapolis was able to collect $41,000 in vice revenue, but the figure dropped to $29,100 in 1901 after police quit "arresting" brothel keepers each month.

increasingly unpopular in most American and European communities by
the second decade of the century. In 1913, a writer for the Chicago
Inter-Ocean deplored the legal ramifications of a segregated system
that forced municipal governments into sanctioning and regulating
the illegal business of prostitution. Joseph Mayer, writing in The
Journal of Social Hygiene three years later, pointed out that
segregation had never really segregated vice from the respectable
community and that medical inspection had been a total failure,
with red light districts being the center for the spread of
venereal infection. He rightly observed that vice districts
enabled vice to organize and flourish on a large scale, breeding
only more vice. "Segregation," he wrote, "corrupted the police
force, stimulated illegal sale of liquor, increased crime and
debauchery, and fostered sexual perversion."16 Without the
collusion of vice interests and municipal authorities, prostitution
would not have gained the visible foothold it held in so many
cities during the Progressive Era.

"Indirect licensing" actually did little to halt private
payoffs to authorities, and police in large and small towns alike
were notoriously selective in reporting vice conditions to

16Kneeland, Prostitution in New York City, 103-106; 207-209;
John C. Burnham, "Medical Inspection of Prostitutes in The
Nineteenth Century: The St. Louis Experiment and It's Sequel,"
Larry Shumsky, "Vice Responds to Reform, San Francisco, 1910-1914,"
Journal of Urban History 7 (1981), 32-33; "Vice and Graft," 62;
of Social Hygiene 4 (1918), 197-198. The Minneapolis Vice
Commissioned issued a detailed report on the failure of
segregation. See Minneapolis Vice Report, 84-96.
superiors or in making arrests. For example, Kneeland reported that between January 1 and August 1, 1914, the New York City police reported the existence of 112 "disorderly places" in the city while between January 24 and November 15 of that same year, his Social Hygiene investigators discovered 808 such places.\(^{17}\)

Enormous profits—for some—were made in commercialized prostitution. During the last decade of the nineteenth century, real estate investors in San Francisco were reportedly able to make an annual profit of $3,000,000 on their Barbary Coast properties.\(^{18}\) A member of the Chicago Vice Commission pointed out in 1911 that "a girl represents a capitalized value of $26,000 as a professional prostitute or more than four times as much as she is worth as a factor in the industrial and social community." That same year, investigators estimated that in Chicago, $15,000,000 worth of business revolved around the commerce in women, and the following year the Philadelphia Vice Commission estimated that prostitutes earned over $6,000,000 in that city alone.\(^{19}\)

Little of this money went to the women who worked in brothels or in the streets. Besides the large amounts of money siphoned off to police, politicians, judges, and municipalities, more was funneled into the pockets of a class of men who formed around

\(^{17}\)Kneeland, *Prostitution in New York City*, 143.

\(^{18}\)Barnhart, *Fair But Frail*, 78. For instance, The Empire House, a house that cost $8,000 to build paid out $127,750 a year on the investment. *Social Evil in Chicago*, 32, 87-88.

\(^{19}\)"Organized Vice as a Vested Interest," *Current Literature* 52 (March 1912), 292-294; *Social Evil in Chicago*, 71, 104; *Philadelphia Vice Report*, 15.
prostitutes—cadets and pimps. Although the terms were sometimes used interchangeably, the roles of cadets and pimps were different. Cadets "sold" women into brothels and received a commission from the owner or madam but did not continue to live off the earnings of these women. Pimps, on the other hand, parasitically attached themselves to prostitutes, often as lovers, protectors, or even husbands, and continued to live off these women's earnings. Pimps were not permitted to live in brothels, but madams sometimes split the earnings of inmates with them. In the case of streetwalkers, pimps confiscated most of their income. Until the shutdown of brothels in the United States around the time of the First World War, pimps were a conspicuous but not central component of the vice community—but were nearly non-existent in Canton.20

* * * * *

The brothel was the center of much of commercialized vice. Half of the 3,311 prostitutes interviewed by investigators in Philadelphia said they either lived or worked in brothels—otherwise known as parlor houses.21 Cleveland police chief Fred

20Rosen, Lost Sisterhood, 76; Charles Winick and Paul M. Kinsie, The Lively Commerce (Chicago: Quadrangle Books: 1971), 109-114; Social Evil in Chicago, 184. Jacqueline Baker Barnhart takes the controversial view that prostitutes, by paying pimps for sexual services and protection, actually switched the balance of power, since prostitutes were enabled to become the "buyer" rather than the "seller." Fair But Frail, 80.

21Kneeland, Prostitution in New York City, 3; Woolston, Prostitution in the United States, 132; Philadelphia Vice Report, 6, 9. According to George Kneeland, the parlor house was a building used exclusively for prostitution and received its name from the fact that the inmates gathered in the parlor to receive guests. Inmates usually lived on the premises and paid rent and/or a percentage of their earnings to a madam or "landlady."
Koehler estimated that not more than 400 prostitutes (excluding streetwalkers) were located in the city's segregated vice district. He claimed that none of the sporting houses was operated by men or connected with saloons since prostitution was "regulated" by the city. The Minneapolis Vice Commission summed up the importance of the brothel by reporting that "... in a large city it [the brothel] creates a community of such places, a district devoted to the practice and promotion of commercialized vice." In other words, the commission believed that without the brothel, commercialized vice and the accompanying red light district could not exist.\(^{22}\) Brothels in Canton, as stated earlier, were the main unit of operation.

In the largest cities, blue books—published guides to prostitution—were available. One of these publications, a directory of the Storyville section of New Orleans, carried the slogan, "Order of the Garter: Honi soit qui mal y pense (Evil to Him Who Evil Thinks.") In Chicago, the guide was called, The Sporting and Club House Directory, Chicago: Containing a Full and Complete List of All Strictly First Class Clubs and Sporting Houses. These books described each house in the district, listed prices, and specified the particular service and "stock" offered. The following advertisement of LuLu White's "Mahogany Hall" brothel in New Orleans is typical of advertising found in blue books:

---

\(^{22}\) Cleveland Baptist Brotherhood, Report of The Cleveland Baptist Brotherhood (Cleveland: Cleveland Baptist Brotherhood, 1911), 12-13 Minneapolis Vice Report, 39.
... Aside from being a handsome woman, her mansion possesses some of the most costly oil paintings in the Southern country. Her mirror parlor is also a dream. There's always something new at Lulu White's that will interest you. "Good Time" is her motto. There are always ten entertainers who get paid to do nothing but sing and dance.  

In less populated municipal vice districts, brothel keepers found other ways to advertise their goods. Boys were paid to stand on street corners and distribute cards that advertised a particular house. Prostitutes in low-priced brothels often indicated their availability by standing in windows and calling out to potential customers. No matter if the district were New Orleans' Storyville, Chicago's Levee, San Francisco's Barbary Coast, or Canton's Saxton Street, the best advertisement was the vice district itself. "The lighted street, the sound of music, the shrill cries, and suggestive songs of the inmates and entertainers ... tend to bring the business to the attention of the public ... ."  

* * * * *  

Brothels like every other social institution, reflected class distinctions and served budgets and economic interests of different clienteles. High class $5.00 and $10.00 parlor houses existed in nearly every town and attracted influential men who often used the houses as social clubs. In the comfortable atmosphere of exquisite


food, wine, and women, politicians and the economically powerful
could make political deals and do business informally. An
investigator in Portland, Oregon, described a high-priced brothel in
that city:

I learned that there are fourteen rooms in the
house, located on the second and third floors.
On the second floor is a private parlor which
the madam has handsomely furnished. On the
same floor is another room fitted up with
Dutch furnishings, which she calls her Dutch
room. It contained a handsome rug, large lib-
rary table, as assortment of steins, and around
the entire room is a plate rail on which she
has numerous Dutch steins of various designs.
A large sum of money has been spent fitting up
this room, and the madam told me it was used
for a very exclusive class of men who spend
much money for wine and such as that. On the
other side of the hall is a long room furnish-
ed with a pianola and a Victrola and adorned
with gorgeous draperies and several pictures.
The madam said it cost her several thousand
dollars to furnish that one room. On the third
floor are located the rooms of the three sport-
ing girls that she has . . . . .25

A Milwaukee madam was, if possible, even more extravagant. Her
forty-two-room double house, located across from City Hall,
included a Roman room with a sunken floor, splashing fountains, and
marble baths; a Japanese room, a Moorish room; and another room in
the style of Louis XIV with a raised dais (for public
consummations) and an ornate golden throne.26 If such
establishments existed in Canton, they certainly were not located
in Saxton Street since madams could not afford such luxuries.

25Portland Vice Report, 44–45.

26Richard M. Bernard, "The Night The Lights Went Out on River
Street," Milwaukee Magazine (December, 1983), 58.
Descriptions of middle-class brothels are rare, possibly because investigators found the extremes in high-class bordellos and low-priced tenements more interesting to investigate. Bertha Thompson—the legendary Box Car Bertha—writing of her brief career as a prostitute in a mid-range house in Chicago, recalled that she had expected life in a brothel to be exciting. "Instead," she found, "I was surprised to learn how quiet it was." Houses catering to the needs of "all those men who figured the cost of their spending . . . . the clerk, the wagon husky, the logger, the husband who wasn't getting it properly at home," lacked the glamour and ostentatiousness of the expensive brothels, and prices ranged usually from $1.00 to $2.00 a visit (the typical price of a Saxton Street house). The reception room of The Globe, where Box Car Bertha worked, was no more than a large well-lighted room, "full of mirrors with a linoleum floor." 27 Although some customers may have requested sexual services refused them at home, most customers, unlike those in some higher class brothels in Europe and in America, were interested only in "straight sex." 28

Most low-priced tenement brothels, without the wealth exhibited in the best brothels, or the comfortable ambiance of the middle-priced sporting houses, contained only a few old leather couches or wooden benches in a small receiving room. Describing a tenement


brothel in New York, George Kneeland wrote that the rooms, formerly a manufacturing loft, were:

partitioned off by means of curtains. The curtains over the windows are of dark, heavy material, almost shutting out the light and air. The entire interior is in a condition of decay . . . . 29

In cribs—the most degraded type of house—conditions were worse than in big city tenements. Cribs contained anywhere from fifteen to 160 rooms, no more than six by eight feet, which were built specifically for prostitution. Some were run like hotels, where women rented rooms for the night. Others had a manager who recruited prostitutes and often sat stationed in the front of the reception room. Rooms were often locked and the only key was held by the manager, and the sexual coercion of prostitutes was a likely component of crib work. Prostitutes worked in the back in crib rooms which usually contained only a small water basin, a washstand, and a bed with a strip of oil cloth at the end of it. Women who worked in cribs more than likely had been turned out of brothels because of age, unstable conduct, race, or excessive competition. A crib job was considered a permanent demotion. 30

* * * * * *

In the nineteenth century, and to some extent in the early part of the twentieth century, madams in high status brothels possessed

29 Prostitution in New York City, 16; Prostitution in The United States, 136.

a high degree of managerial skill. In some ways they ironically fit the nineteenth century ideology of womanliness since they played "mother" to their "girls," wielded influence, and used their sexuality behind the scenes. Madams seldom overtly used the power they possessed. The better the house the more duties they was obligated to perform. Higher-status madams lodged and fed inmates, while low-status madams only lodged them. Women who operated the best houses organized meals, sent out laundry, supervised servants, kept financial records, befriended as well as disciplined prostitutes, and humored customers and police. To be truly successful at her trade, a madam also had to possess a high degree of political tact and diplomacy. Madams received either a percentage (usually one-half) of their prostitutes' earning or a flat fee. In lower-status houses, madams usually received half of the brothel income, but often in addition took a commission plus rent from inmates. Inmates were sometimes required to purchase clothing and furniture from high-priced peddlers who in turn paid a commission to the madam, which actually gave the madam more than her straight fifty percent commission. This "company store" plan kept some prostitutes in economic bondage from which they could not escape. Madams were women who usually "came up through the ranks" of prostitution but rarely competed with their employees for customers since to do so would have put them in competition with their "girls" and could cause dissent among them. The relative chastity of madams enhanced their status in the vice community but not in the respectable community. While ordinary prostitutes could
be viewed as fallen women or "soiled doves," madams, because of their business shrewdness and expertise, were seen as the antithesis of proper womanhood and were often blamed for luring girls into the fast life.31

A madam, however, when she no longer controlled her own business, which happened with more frequency in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, was often as exploited as the women who worked for her and was one of the most vulnerable members of the vice community. Unless the madam owned her own establishment, which was increasingly unlikely, she was employed by a male owner to operate his property. The madam rented or sublet the house (usually at an inflated rent) and understood that in case of arrest, she would be held responsible for any illegal activities on the premises.32

* * * * *

Other individuals or groups surrounded prostitutes and directly or indirectly demanded their share of the profits. Saloon keepers,

---

31 Rosen, Lost Sisterhood 76, 87; Fair But Frail, 27; Goldman, Gold Diggers and Silverminers, 75; Kneeland, Prostitution in New York City, 92; Woolston, Prostitution in The United States, 67, 94; Social Evil in Chicago, 77-78; Dillingham, Importing Women for Immoral Purposes, 58, 73-74. Mary Murphy, "The Private Lives of Public Women: Prostitution in Butte, Montana, 1978-1917," Frontiers 7 (1984), 31. Murphy also points out that although the madam and the pimp played the same basic role in the lives of prostitutes, i.e., they procured customers, protected prostitutes from violence inflicted on them by persons other than themselves, and established an emotional bond of some permanence between them, popular culture has tended to romanticize and sometimes even admire the madam, while the pimp is a most hated figure.

32 Kneeland, Prostitution in New York City, 95.
brewery owners, and anyone else involved in the sale and
distribution of liquor demanded a cut, and at least one critic
believed that prostitutes would be "stupid and spiritless" without
liquor. Brewers sometimes forced indebted saloon keepers to make
prostitutes available in their saloons to stimulate drinking, and
women usually received a small commission on drinks sold. Saloon
keepers and hotel keepers also permitted their rooms to be made
available to prostitutes and their customers and returned a
percentage of the room rental to the women.\(^{33}\)

---

\(^{33}\)Ibid., 13-14, 40, 55-56. Walter Clarke, "Prostitution and
states that the sale of alcohol was vital to the maintenance of
prostitution. For instance, he cites a conversation between the
Chief of Police of Cincinnati and himself in which the chief
claimed that half of the houses in Cincinnati closed after liquor
was removed. Clarke also cited the 1914 Wisconsin Vice Commission
Report which claimed that business in the red light district
decayed fifty percent after liquor was eliminated from the houses.
Woolston, Prostitution in the United States, 99-101; Social Evil
in Chicago, 83; White Slave Traffic, So Called, 23-24. Drug usage
in red light districts, which will be discussed further in Chapter
Five, was not unusual, but during the early part of the twentieth
century drugs of all kinds, especially opium derivatives, morphine,
and cocaine were prescribed for the general public and were easy
for anyone, not just the underworld, to procure. David
Courtwright, Dark Paradise: Opiate Addiction in America Before
1940 (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1982), 62. While two
general "drugs and prostitution" theories have developed: (1)
prostitutes take drugs to "cope" with the life, and (2) female drug
addicts become prostitutes to support their habits, not much has
been written about the type of drugs used in relation to the class
of prostitute who takes the drugs and for what purpose these drugs
are used. Sociologist Paul J. Goldstein, in his study, Prostitution
and Drugs, writes that marijuana and cocaine, for instance, tend to
enhance prostitute/client sociability, a desirable attribute for a
higher class prostitute who sells companionship and sociability as
well as sex but a characteristic not necessary for lower class
prostitutes who simply sell sex. Stimulants also tend to be used
by higher and middle range prostitutes to enable them to keep up
with long and arduous hours which many of them experience. Lower
class prostitutes, however, may indeed be prostitutes because of
addiction to such drugs as heroin, and the addiction alone is
In the Progressive era, at least, beauty shop operators, druggists, and doctors, who gave superficial health examinations and clean health certificates for high fees, all received cuts. An information network of bartenders, bellhops, elevator operators, barbers, bootblacks, businessmen, newsboys, checkout men, clerks, waiters, messenger boys, chauffeurs, and taxi drivers also derived income from vice. According to Kate J. Adams, writing in 1912, the network of organized vice as it existed in Chicago (and certainly in many other cities), extended deeper into the community than busboys and doctors. "The houses are required to patronize certain grocery stores in the immediate vicinity to take out all their insurance in company represented by a powerful politician." As a consequence of this diversion of monies, prostitutes, for the most part, were unable to achieve any kind of genuine financial independence and remained trapped within the confines of the vice district. By the beginning of the second decade of the twentieth century, prostitution had become a diversified industry having little to do with individual deviance but much to do with political

enough to keep women working in the trade. Lower class prostitutes may also use heroin to deaden their condition as well as to fight off withdrawal. Both higher and lower levels of prostitutes use depressants. Goldstein points out that historically drugs and prostitution seem to be related to each other through demographics: "street prostitutes, saloon keepers, and narcotics dealers tended to work in similar parts of cities and to be acquainted with one another." Paul J. Goldstein, Prostitution and Drugs (Lexington: Lexington Books, 1979), 69, 135. Only cursory mention of drug usage is found in Progressive Era vice reports.
and economic control and profit from sexual vice and the whole "system." 34

* * * * *

During the first part of the twentieth century, American social scientists, ministers, reformers, medical authorities, journalists, and men of letters attempted to discover the reasons that women entered prostitution and so to get to the cause of the social evil. Researchers cited low wages, generational conflict between children and parents of immigrant families, conditions under which the poor lived, and even physical and mental degeneracy as reasons women entered "the life." Many Americans with middle class assumptions about female purity and the belief that no woman would voluntarily enter prostitution were uncomfortable with these social and economic realities. Consequently, the idea of "white slavery" caught the popular imagination of the American public. White slavery, to Progressives, meant the selling of women's bodies for the purpose of prostitution, with the use of intimidation or force to bring them into and keep women in prostitution. To some, the term implied the existence of a national vice syndicate with international connections who used force or deception to entrap their victims. To others, however, white slavery meant only the system of commercialized vice which involved the saloon, the disorderly house, the dance hall, and other businesses and social institutions which profited from sexual commerce. Definitions,

34 Rosen, Lost Sisterhood, 75, 77-78; Reckless, Vice in Chicago, 28.
therefore, were often confused and one cannot always be sure if reformers were describing actual sexual slavery or forms of prostitution in which women exercised a degree of choice in their situation. Some reformers, and later exploitive novelists and early film makers, tended to sensationalize and exaggerate the extent of the white slavery threat to American women as well as the naivete of middle class girls who were supposedly victimized by professional procurers. Consequently, the credibility of reformers' arguments not only with the public but with future historians was eroded with this sensationalism. The belief in a white slave conspiracy also ran parallel to the popular acceptance of the "Black Hand" and added hostility to the "new" immigration, particularly against Jews and Italians.35 As will be seen, white slavery or coerced prostitution was extremely limited in Canton.

* * * * *

According to contemporary reports, the majority of women entered prostitution because they saw the life as a way to achieve

35 Roy Lubove, "The Progressive and the Prostitute," The Historian 24 (1982), 314-315; Prostitution in The United States, 160; Rosen, Lost Sisterhood, 112-113. Rosen cites emphasis on environmental factors mentioned in many vice reports. See Philadelphia Vice Report, 22-24; Atlanta Vice Commission, Report of the Vice Commission (Atlanta: 1912), 11-12; "A Study of Prostitutes Committed from New York City to the State Reformatory for Women at Bedford Hills, chap.in Prostitution in New York City, 173-262; Edward J. Bristow, Prostitution and Prejudice: The Jewish Fight Against White Slavery, 1870-1939 (New York: Schocken Books, 1985), 36-37. Bristow states that the term "white slave" in the context of prostitution, originally was defined as the entire apparatus of state regulated vice in Europe. By the end of the 1870s, however, reformers, altering their focus, amended the definition to include only "enforced prostitution," in order to strengthen their weak abolition cause. Barnhart, Fair But Frail, 68; Cordesco and Pitkin, White Slave Trade and Immigrants, 24.
certain economic, social, and psychological needs. Many were relatively helpless in their day and had little social or even personal autonomy. Social workers surveyed prostitutes in reformatories and prisons, and although information gleaned was not always accurate (prostitutes and pimps were notorious for lying to social workers), enough consistent information was found to give the researcher insight into some of the conscious motives of women who entered prostitution. Taking the figures from eight studies made of prostitutes between 1911 and 1916, and using no controls, Ruth Rosen concludes that economic factors and social and personal problems experienced in family life (such as generational conflict and emotional deprivation) were major causes of women entering the fast life.36

36Rosen, Lost Sisterhood, 145-147. Although poverty was an overriding factor in the decision of many working class women to enter prostitution, contemporary researchers also found that prostitution symbolized upward mobility for many young women. Reformer Maude Miner, in an article published in Survey, quoted a young prostitute as saying, "I thought I'd get style like the other girls do ... I saw them dress swell and make nice money." An unemployed sixteen-year old prostitute who lived at home told the interviewer that, "it [prostitution] was the easiest way to get money and fine clothes." Maude Miner, "Two Weeks in The Night Court," Survey 24 (1911), 231. Another reformer pointed out that dance halls were popular with working class women because they offered the opportunity to meet college men who were "sowing their wild oats." "Wayward Girls," Survey 25 (1911), 13, 14. The Massachusetts Vice Commission reported that teenage girls who loitered in public places resented the "suggestion of direct pecuniary reward for immorality, but they expected to be taken to supper or to the theatre." White Slave Trade, So Called, 44. See Lubove, "Progressives and the Prostitute" 308-331 and Egal Feldman, "Prostitution, the Alien Woman, and the Progressive Imagination, 1910-1920," American Quarterly 19 (1967), 192-206 for more detailed accounts of the Progressive attitude toward prostitution.
The average weekly wage of working women in 1916 was $6.67 (the majority of women working in men's ready-to-wear, glass, cotton, and silk factories made less than $6.00 per week) according to The Summary of the Report o Conditions of Women and Children Wage Earners in The United States, a report issued by the United States Labor Bureau. Most experts believed, however, that women, especially those who lived alone, required a weekly wage of around $9.00. The Chicago Vice Commission condemned the low wages of women stating "many girls do live on even $6.00 and do it honestly, but we can affirm that they do not have nourishing food, or comfortable shelter, no warm clothes, or any amusement, except perhaps free public dances, without outside help . . . . is it any wonder that a tempted girl who receives only $6.00 per week working with her hands sells her body for $25.00 per week when she learns there is a demand for it, and men are willing to pay the price?" In 1913, the Philadelphia Interchurch Federation cautioned girls "not to be led into going into big cities unless they have been assured of honest employment at more than $8.00 a week." A Baptist publication, The Watchman, reiterated the warning, publishing an essay that said that a minimum of $7.50 a week (with no provision for illness, frills, or savings) was "absolutely necessary to enable a self-supporting woman to maintain a bare existence in a respectable part of [any] city and live above the danger line."

That same year, the Illinois Senate Vice Commission laid the blame
for the growth of prostitution largely at the door of employers.\(^{37}\) Women's wages in Canton were often much less than the national average not to mention the recommended minimum.

In answer, some businessmen raised women's salaries, and Cyrus McCormick, president of International Harvester, instituted a weekly minimum wage of $8.00 for all 800 of his female employees. Unions and most employers, however, refused to train women for the high paying skilled jobs, and most industrialists claimed that women need not receive higher wages since most worked only for "pin" money and were supported by husbands or other family members. Some working class women resented the implication that low wages caused prostitution. "It's a lazy girl that goes wrong, a female upholstery worker in New York responded. "It makes my blood boil to hear women say that the women who have fallen to the streets were nearly all hard working girls. It's not true. They were lazy girls, or weak girls or foolish girls."\(^{38}\)

---


\(^{38}\)"Are Low Wages Responsible for Women's Immorality?" *Current Opinion*, 54 (1913), 402.
Many employers naturally backed these kinds of statements and accused reformers of sacrificing the integrity of working women to a profit motive. "Will the sum of $2.00 more or less, or $3.00, or ten times that save a girl who is determined to go wrong?" asked Henry Segal, who employed more than 6,000 women in his department stores in New York and Boston. Others, like socialist Max Eastman, rejected a simply economic critique of the cause of prostitution and argued that the minimum wage issue was "mean and niggardly." Eastman believed that the limits of reformers' sympathy for the prostitute were the living wage. He wrote,

This minimum wage once nationally established will give the moral people in the community a comfortable feeling (the same they had before vice was discovered by William Rockefeller in the year 1912), that if any girl goes wrong it's her own fault. She had a chance to go to heaven on a Minimum Wage and she went to hell on a toboggan.39.

Yet, the fact remained that large sums of money could be made by individual prostitutes, as long as they kept their health. Howard B. Woolston, in *Prostitution in the United States*, published in 1919, claimed that $30.00 to $50.00 a week was the average income of a prostitute, although some made as little as $10.00 or $15.00 a week, while others could earn a weekly income of up to $200.00. In Portland, Oregon, an individual prostitute could make as much as $30.00 a night. The Syracuse Vice Commission estimated that the weekly average earnings of a prostitute in a dollar house

---

(where one dollar per visit was charged) was $83.30. Woolston offered figures which indicated that women who combined legitimate work with part time prostitution made over three times as much at prostitution as they did at their "day" jobs.\textsuperscript{40}

Some prostitutes saw little difference between prostitution and other "women's work" such as dance hall hostess, waitress, department store clerk, factory worker, or domestic worker. A waitress-turned-prostitute told the Illinois Vice Commission that if she were not pleasant to male customers and did not go out with them, she would be fired for driving business away. At a weekly salary of $3.00 plus tips, picking up a "little money on the side" was the way this woman and many like her chose to survive on their own.\textsuperscript{41} Maimie Pinzer, the former prostitute who carried on a correspondence with a Boston society matron and political activist for twelve years, articulated the feeling of many prostitutes who chose the fast life over monotonous factory and domestic work when she wrote, "I just cannot be moral enough to see where drudgery is better than a life of lazy vice."\textsuperscript{42} Women often chose

\textsuperscript{40}Prostitution in the United States 65-66; Portland Vice Report, 65.

\textsuperscript{41}Social Evil in Chicago, 819.

\textsuperscript{42}Maimie Papers, xv-xxvi, Letter 2, p. 4; Letter 4, p.6-7. Besides wages and "women's work," prostitutes who wished to leave the life for "respectable" employment were further hampered by the lack of letters of reference from friends or former employers. Since subsistence wages usually could not support women living on their own, and prostitutes did not feel that they could return to their families, prostitution became the only employment most prostitutes could retain.
prostitution, then, as an alternative to an even more unpleasant means of survival: unskilled factory work or domestic service.

Financial need alone, however, does not explain why some poor women entered prostitution while the majority of poor women did not, (or why some middle class and even a few upper class women entered the life). A contributing factor, recognized even in contemporary vice reports, was troubled family relationships. Lack of family cohesiveness, the result of conflict or death, did little to enhance the self-esteem of women who became prostitutes. Many women sought love and companionship from young men who later abandoned them. Families already at odds with rebellious daughters frequently disowned the girls. New friends in saloons and brothels in vice districts filled the emotional void. As one madam testified before the Illinois Senate, women became prostitutes because of low wages and having been "thrown out in the world without a home. They haven't any companionship and they naturally fall into prostitution for the sake of company and companionship." Marion Goldman, in her study of prostitution in Nevada's silver lode territory in the mid-nineteenth century, points out that at that time prostitutes lived together, traveled together, fought and reconciled, protected each other, and in some cases, loved each other. That many madams were called "Mother" was probably no coincidence; the brothel in effect created a substitute family and an illusion of a better life than many prostitutes had, or thought they had experienced.43

43Illinois Vice Report, 328; Goldman, Goldiggers and Silver Miners, 120; Mainie Papers, 333. For a more detailed account of the subculture of prostitution in the Progressive era and the
Prostitutes, isolated from the respectable community, according to tradition, developed friendships and exhibited forms of solidarity and concern for one another in times of danger or crisis. Allusions to lesbianism are plentiful in accounts of brothel life as some prostitutes sought the comfort, affection, and nurturing relationships with women that they could not find with men in their professional and personal lives. Too much, however, may be made of the supposed friendships among prostitutes that researchers such as Ruth Rosen have emphasized in their studies. In the open marketplace of sexual commerce, friendships could not always overcome competition. As will be seen in Canton, prostitutes, and especially madams, did not seem to maintain close friendships with other prostitutes and madams.44

In at least some places and in at least some periods, a complex class system existed, however, inside the institution of sexual commerce, and this stratification served as a means of defining the status of individual prostitutes. Some scholars have separated these classes by the "degree of visibility" practiced by prostitutes: flagrant, semi-flagrant, semi-clandestine, and

development of women's interpersonal relationships in it, see Rosen, Lost Sisterhood, 106-107

44Murphy, "Private Lives of Public Women," 33; Rosen, Lost Sisterhood, 104, 163; Butler, Daughters of Joy, Sisters of Misery, 41, 45.
clandestine. These classifications are helpful but are limited and do not go far enough in explaining the vast difference in status among prostitutes. Furthermore, they do not explain the purposes this stratification served. Marion Goldman has, however, taken these basic classifications and re-worked them into a more realistic interpretation of stratification. Although these classifications reflect Goldman's study of fast life in the Comstock Lode of the 1860s-1880s, other scholars have believed that they are relevant to the study of prostitution in other times and places. According to Goldman, prostitution can be ranked from high to low status, depending upon whether the woman was: (1) clandestine or flagrant in soliciting customers; (2) subtle or open about obtaining payment; (3) selling talents or services other than straight, impersonal sex; (4) involved with few or many men; (5) expensive or cheap; and (6) patronized by rich or poor men.

These criteria were interrelated but together determined the status and class within prostitution to which a woman belonged. In some cases, women could combine lower and higher status attributes.

45Winick and Kinsie, Lively Commerce, 28-29; Goldman, Gold Diggers and Silver Miners, 73-74; Maimie Papers, Letter 27, p. 77). Maimie Pinzer clearly illustrated the stratification among prostitutes in a letter to Panny Howe when she wrote, "... you need never fear that I would get into some public place! I don't have to do that; I wouldn't ever have to do that. As long as I have my mind and can use my tongue, such extreme measures are unnecessary. I never did that before, never did anything even one-tenth as low, and consider that the last gasp. I never associated with low women—I don't think I ever met, to talk to the second time, a woman who was publicly known to live other than she should. I shun such people. Even girls who did no worse than I, couldn't claim acquaintance with me. So, you see, it is never to be feared that I should do anything of that sort. If I may say, it, I am too smart for that."
and since, as Anne Butler writes, these levels were not stringently rigid, at least in the West, variations in these classifications were quite common so that strict classification is impossible. Goldman says, however, that most specific forms of prostitution existed despite differences which occurred within each rank. Using the criteria, Goldman named four classes or levels of prostitution: elite, middle rank, working class, and slave or vagrant (the latter not usually relevant to the Progressive Era, as noted above, and certainly it did not apply to Saxton Street).\(^46\) Furthermore, the identities, much less activities of elite prostitutes in Canton, is impossible to detect and their existence can only be inferred; in fact, there may have been virtually none.

Internal stratification reflected divisions and attitudes within the respectable community. These class divisions regulated the work roles of prostitutes, limited competition among prostitutes and entrepreneurs, and accommodated customers who usually prefered certain classes or types of prostitutes. Prostitutes, divided into the various strata, were able to learn the specific norms and customs of their work roles. Once a prostitute learned her narrow role, she was able to work in the parlor house circuit. She had the resources and ability to move into a strange town and, even without contacts, find a place for herself in her own level of prostitution.

\(^{46}\) Goldman, Gold Diggers and Silver Miners, 76, 81-82; Butler, Daughters of Joy, Sisters of Misery, xii.
Stratification encouraged employee loyalty to individual brothels and saloons and allowed for differentiated labor pools to be developed. Bawdy saloons, therefore, did not attract high class prostitutes, and working class women did not attempt to enter the ranks of $10.00 houses.

* * * * * *

The average age of prostitutes interviewed by investigators prior to World War I was between twenty and twenty-three. Nearly all studies made during that period indicate that women practiced prostitution for usually no more than five or six years. Few data exist, however, to indicate what happened to prostitutes during their late twenties and thirties. Some prostitutes certainly died from the occupational hazards of the fast life: venereal disease, drug or alcohol addiction, and suicide. Others, as they lost attractiveness, were forced out of the better brothels and into the fifty-cent houses or the streets. These adversities, however, do not account for the many prostitutes who simply disappeared from the marketplace. Ruth Rosen, using the accounts of Maimie Pinzer, successful former madams, and a study of prostitutes in Copenhagen, Denmark, speculates that many prostitutes, given the options of marriage and unskilled menial work at subsistence pay (and further given prostitutes' attitude toward work in general) found economic refuge in marriage.47

47Woolston, Prostitution in The United States, 41; Rosen, Lost Sisterhood, 144-145. Rosen used vice reports from Hartford, Kansas, and Chicago and points out that the age of girls in smaller rescue homes ranged in age from fifteen to twenty-two with older girls found in correction facilities.
Reformers, both religious and political, sought ways to curtail the return to the streets of women arrested for prostitution. Chief among Progressive reform goals, then, was the abolition of the fine system through which prostitutes were usually punished and frequently controlled, as discussed earlier. Instead, since fines did little more than informally license prostitutes and force them to continue their prostitution to pay their fines, and short jail sentences did little more than "teach" girls the "tricks of the trade," reformers urged "rehabilitation" in newly created women's reformatories, none of which had been built yet in Ohio. Despite the much publicized "model" institutions such as Bedford Hills, New York, where inmates were taught reading, writing, arithmetic, nature study, music, physiology, and sex hygiene, rehabilitation in reformatories (like that of their sister rescue homes such as The Door of Hope and Beth-Shan, which had sprung up all over the country usually under the auspices of denominations), generally stressed moral uplift as the solution to the social and emotional difficulties which led to inmates joining the fast life. Young inmates, then, were exposed to evangelical Christian values, middle class expectations and morality, and the "vocational skills" suited to their class and gender—cooking, sewing, scrubbing—tasks held in particular distain by prostitutes—to ready them for respectable domestic service or marriage. Household training, which could have been beneficial for some, however, was minimal and usually did not go beyond routine chores necessary for upkeep of reformatory
cottages and personal hygiene, and basically gave girls and young women something to do while their virtue was being protected.

Maimie Panzer, writing of her year at the Magdalen Home in New York City at the age of thirteen, recalled that she received no school training whatsoever. Brighter and more educated than the other inmates (her father had been a prosperous merchant and she had received a formal education up until the time of his death), she passed the time teaching girls four years older than herself "their alphabets and simple sums.\(^48\)

* * * * * *

Besides keeping prostitutes, especially repeat offenders off the streets, reformers clearly saw that strong, legal measures aimed at the vice interests that invested in and operated commercialized vice were needed to stamp out prostitution once and for all. The pioneering 1909 Iowa Injunction and Abatement Law which allowed individuals to file complaints against residents of a

particular building used for prostitution, then confiscate and sell all personal property found in that building if the residents or owner were found guilty of keeping an immoral house, acted as an anti-prostitution model for other states to follow. Ohio’s Dow Tax Law and and Winn Tax Law were Iowa-type laws used to confiscate and sell the property of disreputable persons. Although prostitutes and panderers tended to "scatter" into residential neighborhoods as opponents had argued they would, disreputable people also had difficulty in obtaining living quarters, and according to Howard Woolston hundreds were driven from Buffalo, Chicago, Indianapolis and Los Angeles in search of more amenable cities.\textsuperscript{49} Less drastic measures to expose landlord exploitation of prostitution also took place. In 1913, in Portland, Oregon, for example, the Tin Plate Ordinance was passed, which required a tin plate bearing the owner’s name and home address to be placed on every building in town. Other cities soon followed suit. More importantly, however, at this same time, most states passed laws against third party exploitation of prostitutes, and, procuring, pandering, keeping a disorderly house, and keeping a house of assignation became illegal. Laws prohibiting liquor sales in dance halls were enacted. Connecting rooms and small booths used for prostitution in saloons were outlawed. The age of consent was raised in many

states, and minimum wage laws for women began to be seriously considered.50

* * * * * *

Numerous similarities were shared among all vice districts and personnel in the United States during the Progressive Era, but each district was also unique in structure, culture, environment, and atmosphere. The above description, therefore, is a broad portrait of urban prostitution in the Progressive Era and serves to permit a comparison of commercialized vice in general in the United States to specific commercialized vice in Canton. While cities such as New York, Philadelphia, and San Francisco, for instance, represented a cosmopolitan and thus atypical view of sexual commerce, vice in Canton, with its accompanying indigenous customs and personalities, which were adapting themselves to the industrial growth of the area, represented, in a national period of economic 

50 Ibid, 264; Woolston, Prostitution in the United States, 32, 243. In 1913, Massachusetts passed the first minimum wage law in the country to take effect in July, 1914. That same year the National Retail Dry Goods Association financed a survey on the minimum wage question and a majority of respondents favored federal minimum wage legislation. Retail dry goods merchants in San Francisco and Tennessee also supported the minimum wage. Those opposed to the measure argued that more money would only enable a girl to "go wrong" more easily by dressing "to attract attention and to be more frequently in public places of amusement." "Are Low Wages Responsible for Immorality?" 402; "Minimum Wage Discussed by Retail Associations", Survey 30 (1913), 260-261. For a discussion of early age of consent battles, see David Pivar, Purity Crusade: Sexual Morality and Social Control, 1868-1900, (Westport: Greenwood Press, 1973), 139-146
and social flux, a more typical and stable structure of prostitution in America's heartland. The Saxton Street System, which will be detailed in the following chapters, challenges both contemporary and present-day notions about prostitution and the lives of prostitutes, and illustrates that vice districts could be self-disciplined in order to retain as autonomous condition as possible. Madams, gamblers, saloonkeepers, and small merchants, not male "trusts" and panderers, were the power elite in Canton's Tenderloin. With the benign assistance of municipal authorities, this group maintained individual interests with little interference from the entrenched, organized structure prevalent in larger cities. This power elite was the core of Saxton Street, and without their stability Saxton Street could not have survived as long as it did.
CHAPTER 3

THE POWER ELITE: SAXTON STREET SOCIETY

In the Spring of 1910, business was booming in Canton, with industrial production far ahead of the preceding year. Despite soaring business profits, wages for factory workers remained low. While local plumbers earned at least $3.00 a day for an eight-hour day, men at the Timken plant made as little as $1.80 or $2.00 a day for a ten-hour day. Wages for women were even much lower, and some female Timken employees in the inspection department earned only $6.00 a week. Women painting toys and novelties at Gibbs Manufacturing made only $4.00 a week, although skilled decorators reportedly could get up to $1.74 a day. Female employees of the Dueber Hampton Watch Case Company were better off, earning $9.00 to $12.00 a week, and the Sells Horse Goods Company reportedly paid as much as $12.00 a week to women workers. Some manufacturers claimed to pay higher wages to factory women living away from their homes and families. Office workers were paid less than factory laborers. An experienced stenographer, for instance, at the local Prudential Insurance Company, could expect to start out at $8.00 a week. Domestic service was advertised at $6.00 a week plus a room. By 1913, the situation had not changed. The Daily News reported
that hundreds of young, unskilled women workers, barred from unions and the skilled, higher paying trades, lived on as little as $4.00 or $5.00 a week—several dollars below the weekly wage of $9.00 recommended by government and social welfare experts. Even more disturbing was the report issued by Cora Racle, secretary of the Associated Charities, on the plight of female cooks and housekeepers in "foreign boarding houses." According to Racle, some of these women were paid only $3.50 a month (or eleven cents a day) to cook for a house full of men. Often housekeepers were not even given their own rooms and were forced to share living and sleeping quarters with several men.¹

Low wages, however, did not discourage foreign and American working men and women from entering the expanding industrial work force—dominated by the steel industry—in Canton. The largest wave of foreign migration to Canton came between 1910 and 1920, filling the town with Germans, Austrians, Hungarians, Swiss, Rumanians, and Italians, along with smaller numbers of Greeks, Russians, German and Russian Jews, Syrians, and Lebanese. (In 1910, 11,512 or about twenty-three percent of the city's population were foreign born.) American-born workers were also plentiful. Many of

¹E. T. Heald, The Stark County Story: Industry Comes of Age (Canton: Stark County Historical Society, 1952), 210, 591-592; (Canton) News Democrat, March 19, 1911, 1, 2; (Canton) Daily News, April 11, 1913, 4; March 13, 1913, 1, 7. In March, a female reporter for the Daily News wrote of her attempt to live on $6.00 for one week and concluded that "it takes the brains of a financier, the constitution of a colt, and a wonderful self-sufficiency in the way of amusement to do it." (Canton) Daily News, March 13, 1913, 1, 7; (Canton) Repository, September 5, 1913, 1, 7.
the new arrivals were unattached and tended to rent rooms in boarding houses or private homes near their plants and/or in ethnic neighborhoods. Inevitably, as elsewhere, these working men sought out saloons and dance halls and frequently visited the town's most notorious district, The Tenderloin.

The district was geographically small, consisting of a tiny strip of land known as "The Saxton Street area" just southeast of the Courthouse. Like vice areas in other cities, the district was situated in an old, working class neighborhood that was changing from a residential to a commercial and industrial section. No particular ethnic group dominated the area, although a number of Italian, Slavic, and Russian surnames appeared in the city directory. The district, located in the southeast part of the Fourth Ward, was bounded on the west by South Cherry Street, north by East Tuscarawas Street, east by South Saxton Street, and south by East Tenth Street, and frequently spilled over into neighboring streets. The Lake Erie & Wheeling tracks ran along East Tenth, and the Pennsylvania Station was close by, making the city's resorts one of the first attractions visitors encountered.

\[2\] E. T. Heald, *The Stark County Story: A Free People at Work* (Canton: The Stark County Historical Society, 1955), 13. Also see separate sections on local ethnic communities in *Free People*, that describe the formative years of various groups in Canton, including housing patterns.

\[3\] Although the center of activity in the Tenderloin through the years shifted from street to street within the area itself, it was never far from the original Pennsylvania Station. Even though the district probably began to develop as a vice district around the 1880s and a new train depot was built south of the original location, the district remained in tact until the early 1960s when urban renewal cleaned out the area leaving little more than empty
Market Avenue, which divided Canton east and west, lay "Whiskey Alley," the part of South Court Avenue located behind the Courthouse and near City Hall, where most of the city's gambling dens operated—sometimes openly—and always, as noted above, with the knowledge of city officials. Saloons with game rooms in the back or upstairs, operated by Jake Fraily, Rox Aultman, William Fishel, Butch Wagner, and Linc Andrews, although separated from Saxton Street by several blocks, served as an adjunct to the Tenderloin and did much to enhance Canton's reputation as a wide open town. Like most cities with disreputable districts, Blue Book or other open advertising was unnecessary. The "white lights and sound of music" coming from the district served as advertisement enough for the fast life.

The densest area of activity was on Saxton and Cherry Streets, which ran parallel to each other, and at the streets they intersected. Ten out of eleven addresses on Saxton were either parlor houses (brothels) or saloons with "Ladies Entrance" signs painted above side doors, in which prostitutes gathered and

lots, deserted storefronts, and a few industrial warehouses. In October, 1982, Jim Hillibish, North Canton bureau chief of the Repository, sent the author a copy of a "Saturday night rumination of a bored police reporter not allowed to print what he knows" dated April, 1951, which he located in the "crime file" in the newspaper morgue, in which the anonymous writer gives a short, sometimes apocryphal, historical description of the Tenderloin, including mention of the district's early years. Hillibish, who has an extensive background in Canton and Stark County history believes, however, that the article is not totally the product of the author's imagination and has "some insights."
sometimes lived. Cherry\(^4\) and East Tuscarawas Streets were lined with saloons and hotels, as well as a few legitimate businesses. Alice Barnes and her daughter Ollie Schnovell (who also ran a string of neighborhood saloons), operated the City Hotel in the 500 block of Cherry. Up the street, Hyman Bobrof's Highball Cafe had gained the reputation as an establishment where according to one judge, "more trouble than any other place in the city occurred." South Cherry Street was also the site of Tal Sullivan's "Cottage" and Jumbo Crowley's "Tavern." (Sullivan and Crowley may have been cousins.) The Tavern was probably the most popular hangout for Canton's growing underworld. By 1906, the saloon was nationally known as a "gun joint" where "boys on the road" could hide out in return for money and good behavior. Crowley, an unpretentious small, dapper, well-read former boxer handled payoffs to police and city officials. (Reportedly he was called "Jumbo" because of his small size.) Like his counterparts in larger cities, Crowley was instrumental in getting out the "right" vote on election day and, in return, his operations (mostly gambling) were left unmolested by police. By virtue of his position as "go-between," Crowley, for many of his nearly forty years in Canton, was one of the most politically powerful "men behind the scenes" and was called by at least one newspaper reporter the first "king pin" in a long line of organized crime figures in Canton. Certainly the Tenderloin would not have existed as it did without Crowley, but his influence on

\(^4\)The term "Cherry Street" will signify South Cherry Street throughout this study unless otherwise signified.
prostitution in Canton is extremely difficult to determine. While he was known mainly as a gambler, and during Prohibition as a major bootleg operator, he survived, as a reporter for the New York Times wrote, "by keeping someone else between him and 'the finger,' meaning the law." so his role in the operation of prostitution, at least in the early part of the century, is open to question. Other Tenderloin saloons were operated by Dominic Bisciglia, Charles Bruner, Louis Bivenour, August "Gig" Hahn, and Crowley's sometime business partner, Bernie Strapp.5

5Crowley's mother's last name was Sullivan; State of Ohio Certificate of Death, No. 62863, October 15, 1935. Jumbo Crowley and Tal Sullivan had a long history of business association. Between 1906 and 1917 they either operated saloons side by side, or worked together, and lived at Sullivan's saloon on East Tuscarawas. (Canton) Morning News, February 13, 1907 p. 3; February 14, 1907, 2. According to Price Janson, former Director of the Stark County Board of Elections, who knew Crowley well, Crowley's places were not only saloons but training camps for boxers and basically a hangouts for local and visiting boxers. Conversation between Price Janson and author, April 23, 1980, Canton, Ohio. After the 1906 murder of a Columbus policeman, convicted killer Fred Caster, a member of The Canton Gang, an early crime ring who felt he had been betrayed by the Canton underworld, talked extensively of the connection of Jumbo Crowley and local gambler Jake Frailey in Canton vice and political corruption activities. Morning News, February 13, 1907, 1, 3; February 14, 1907, 1, 2, 4; February 16, 1907, p. 1, 4; February 19, 1907, p. 5; Repository, February 12, 1907, 5; February 15, 1907, 5; (Columbus) Dispatch, February 13, 1907, 5; February 15, 1907, 2. See ms, p.127 for an account of Caster's attempted prison break engineered by "Tip" O'Neill, husband of Canton madam Jennie Connors. Also see John G. Green, "Sensational Case Retold by Ex-Editor," Repository, April 18, 1976, p. 1, 12; John L. Eddy, Jr., "Canton Murder Reveals 'Jungle' Rule," New York Times, July 25, 1927, vii, 3; and "Stench" Time Magazine, August 26, 1926, 8 for other views of Jumbo Crowley and his activities in Canton. See Humbert Neill, The Business of Crime: Italians and Syndicate Crime in the United States (New York: Oxford University Press, 1976), p. 112-113 for a description of early organized crime bosses.
East Seventh, Eighth, and Tenth Streets, which intersected Saxton and Cherry Streets, contained a few saloons, several resorts, and the Central Hotel (also known The U. S. Hotel and the Wayne Hotel), run by the Studer family, who for two generations played a major role in Canton’s lucrative crime industry. Individuals and families with little or no direct involvement with vice also lived in the numbered streets but usually to the west of the Saxton/Cherry intersections.

Arrest accounts suggest that many of the houses in the Tenderloin were parlor houses. As elsewhere, if prostitutes did not live in a brothel they often rented rooms above a saloon, although saloon residences, at least in male-operated saloons, seemed to decline in use after the 1908 murder of prostitute Elizabeth Brown, who lived at Parker’s Place and associated with women living at The Cottage and The Tavern. Again, as elsewhere, streetwalkers rented hotel rooms when necessary. Unlike some cities in the south and southwest, no evidence exists of cribs in Canton.

Newspaper reports suggest that probably eleven parlor houses were located on East Seventh, Eighth, and Tenth Streets, with others on Saxton and Cherry Streets. Nothing particularly different set them apart from regular residences, except perhaps "the closely drawn blinds in the windows of the houses." Saloons and wine rooms were used mainly for assignation (meeting purposes). Newspaper articles, city directories, and court testimony of
prostitutes indicates that parlor houses averaged no more than four or five inmates each.

Buildings in the Tenderloin were generally neither expensive nor elaborate (at least on the outside), reflecting the run down and oppressive environment upon which reformers frequently commented. While Cherry and East Tuscarawas Streets extended outside the city limits and contained "good" neighborhoods outside the confines of the Tenderloin, Saxton Street was just three narrow, short blocks with houses or saloons on only the west side of the street. Old factory buildings, torn down by 1912, were located on the opposite side.

Some houses in the Tenderloin, while obviously dwelling places, doubled as small retail establishments, cigar stores, or confectionerries. Signs reading "Soft Drinks and Cigars" were often painted on the windows. When Anna Ward's confectionery was raided in 1911, police reported that several men and women were lined up in front of a soft drink bar. John Quinn, the reformed gambler who worked with reformers, told a church gathering about a grocery store on Cherry Street where upstairs rooms were rented to married couples. "If a man goes there and rents a room and has no wife, they will send out and get him a soul-mate."  

Towards the end of 1911, reform leaders presented a "lantern (slide) show" purported to illustrate the Tenderloin and thus call the community to action. One picture, reportedly of a house on Saxton Street, showed windows covered with wire screen and iron

---

6(Canton) News Democrat, November 10, 1911, 8.
bars and was clearly meant to prove that women and girls were held in the house against their wills. The audience was told that within the last few days, "a wan, pale face" was seen gazing from one of the windows, suggesting that an unwilling inmate was being held. Due to local sanction and municipal condonation of prostitution (which, however, did not always rule out the possibility of sexual slavery) and the lack of other evidence of cribs in the Tenderloin, the allegation is highly unlikely. Houses were kept tightly locked, however, with as many as six locks and bolts on a door. As one prostitute said, "We need lots of locks in this district." At Fannie Schmidt's cigar store, attached to her home, customers could enter only when she pushed a button hidden under the counter, which electronically unlocked the door.\(^7\)

Indoor plumbing was not a Tenderloin amenity. On one occasion, prostitutes were routed from their sleep when small boys set off a string of firecrackers in an outhouse behind Rosa Davis's resort on Saxton Street, consequently setting the house on fire.\(^8\)

A house on East Seventh Street (possibly operated by Alice Williams), was known by reformers as "the toniest place in the city." In contrast to the Saxton and Cherry Street resorts that seemed to attract lower income, working class clientele, reformers claimed that at this house, "every evening automobiles are a

---

\(^7\) Repository, November 27, 1912, 1, 10; October 29, 1911, 20; September 12, 1912, 5.

\(^8\) Repository, November 10, 1911, 1, 2; November 27, 1912, 1; Daily News, June 24, 1913, 1.
familiar sight before its door," an indication that the proprietor catered to a well-to-do clientele.⁹

The Tenderloin was a high rent district. Madams Mary Miller and Mary Smith each reported paying $50.00 a month rent, Miller for a sixteen-room house on East Seventh Street (an unusually large house) and Smith, for a dilapidated six-room house on Saxton Street. When Harry Schilling toured the Tenderloin in November 1912, shortly after he became mayor, he told reporters that rents should have been no more than $10.00 a month. A young Austrian woman living in the Smith house told the mayor that since the house was no longer a resort she hoped to convince the unnamed landlord to let her take in boarders and lower the rent to $10.00 a month. Mary Miller agreed that the rent was too high. "We can get a lower rate now," she told Schilling, "but how in the hell am I going to pay for my furniture?"¹⁰

Miller's concern for her furniture was not unusual, as was noted above. In every city good furniture reflected the success and status of the madam, her business, and her clientele and made an otherwise unattractive house more comfortable and congenial. Miller's parlor, for instance, was furnished with heavy leather chairs and davenports, which according to a reporter for the Daily News, looked out of place in the otherwise shabby room. Jennie Connors' resort on Cherry Street was described as having

⁹Repository, November 10, 1911, 8.

¹⁰Daily News, November 27, 1912, 1; Repository, November 27, 1912, 4.
elaborately furnished rooms where girls in short dresses met customers. In 1912, when Connors was sued under provisions of the Dow Tax Law for selling liquor in a brothel, the Stark County Auditor and Treasurer estimated her furniture to be worth several thousand dollars.\textsuperscript{11} Likewise, in a messy 1911 civil law suit between madams Emma Shaw and Trixie Bell involving a chattel loan mortgage of $1,400 worth of Shaw's furniture, over two typed, single-spaced legal pages of furniture is listed including iron beds, leather rockers, cuspidors, lace curtains, linoleum floors, pictures, mirrors, a refrigerator, commodes, bedding, clocks, and chiffoniers.\textsuperscript{12}

The Inventory and Appraisal Record of the estate of Alice Williams, who died in 1915, also suggests how brothels in the Tenderloin were furnished. Williams and her son Clyde operated a resort on East Seventh Street for several years, and in 1913 they moved to nearby Massillon, where they opened a saloon. Household goods from the Canton house were stored in a back room at the saloon residence and in an adjoining house. Among goods listed in the inventory are leather covered rockers, several wooden and iron

\textsuperscript{11}Daily News, November 27, 1912, 1; News Democrat, April 12, 1912, 16; Repository, November 27, 1912, 1; William Herbert Page and John Jay Adams, The Annotated General Code of the State of Ohio, 1910 (Cincinnati: W. H. Anderson, 1912), Section 6193-6201. The Winn Law and the Dow Tax Law were lumped together.

\textsuperscript{12}Stark County Clerk of Courts, Case No. 22040, Emma Shaw v Lillian Bell and Rose Nagle. Bell apparently accepted Shaw's furniture as collateral for a loan which was to be repaid to her at $30.00 a week. Although Shaw claimed she made her payments on time, Bell turned around and sold the furniture to Rose Nagle, another madam, for $1,500—a one hundred dollar profit for Bell.
beds, settees and davenports, maple chiffonniers, dressers, eight mattresses, twenty bundles of bedding, a large pasteboard box of pillows, twenty-five heating and cooking stoves, hotplates, electric fans, two sewing machines, dressers and night stands. Williams' own bedroom included a brass bed, marble top stand, chiffonnier, gramophone and records, a large mantel clock, one large bevel mirror, and a patent safe. Her sitting room was furnished with a mahogany leather davenport and chairs, another davenport, and an oak mirror. Two slot machines were also located in the house.

The inventory list also included furnishings in the saloon (most resorts also maintained a small bar in the front room). A cash register, ice box, rockers and straight chairs, two bar counters with a back bar and mirror were located in the saloon. In a room behind the bar, Williams kept a bookcase, her jewelry, a marble top work stand, and a clothes hamper.13

* * * * * *

Definite, yet confusing, housing and ownership patterns developed in the Tenderloin, creating an almost incomprehensible maze of relationships and continuity. Brothels and saloons changed management, if not ownership, almost casually. Some owners and residents seemed to move in an informal circuit, with a few persons periodically returning to a "base of operation," while many others simply moved a few houses away or a block over from previous

13Stark County Probate Court, Inventory and Appraisement Record 37/577.
residences. Nearly all prostitutes, once they established themselves in the Tenderloin, remained in the district. A handful of male saloon or brothel proprietors, however, lived outside of the Tenderloin, most of them close by; a few lived on the other side of town, but they never moved their businesses outside of the confines of the district.

Information found in U. S. Census reports and city directories is not wholly reliable but gives an overview of the housing patterns that existed in the Tenderloin as well as demonstrates the inner-district transiency of the population. Typical was a resort located at 701 East Seventh Street. Originally a saloon run by Fanny Willis, the house was taken over by Alice Williams in 1909. The following year Williams was joined by Mamie Lee and Jessie Lawson. By early 1913 these women had moved out and were replaced by Mary Miller and her husband.14

Mamie Lee, after leaving the Williams house, maintained two addresses at the same time, one at 523 East Eighth Street and another at 311 Saxton Street. Toward the end of 1923, Lee was sent to jail but returned to the district around 1926 where she opened a restaurant on the site of Mary Smith's old resort on Saxton Street, where, incidently, Lee's friend Jessie Lawson, lived in 1914.15

14 Canton City Directory, 1905-1907; U. S. Manuscript Census, 1910; Canton City Directory, 1910.

As early as 1905, Caroline and Joe Studer ran the Central Hotel, but in 1910 the hotel was taken over by Gig Hahn and Harry Winters. In 1916, however, the Studers were back, this time calling the hotel the Canton House. The family remained at the hotel off and on until 1922.\footnote{U. S. Manuscript Census, 1900; Canton City Directory, 1901-1922.}

Between 1905 and 1906, Maude O'Brien, operated a saloon at 815 East Seventh Street. In 1907, she left this address, moving two blocks south to the old Luna Foster place. A year later O'Brien moved to a saloon on East Tuscarawas, formerly run by Anna Stoffer, where she stayed for two years. In 1910, O'Brien once again moved, this time settling into a saloon at 715 East Seventh Street. Four years later she returned to the Foster saloon, recently operated by Tena Wise.\footnote{Canton City Directory, 1906-1917.}

Anna Stoffer ran one saloon on East Seventh Street and two others saloons on East Tuscarawas (one of which was later a bar run by Jumbo Crowley's brother, Ed, and still later by Alice Williams). Jennie Lee once ran a brothel at Tal Sullivan's Cottage when Ed Crowley and his wife rented rooms for a year at the saloon.\footnote{Ibid., 1902-1912; U. S. Manuscript Census, 1910.}

Alice Barnes, Ollie Schnovell, and Fanny Schmidt each operated the same cigar store on Cherry Street at different times between 1907 and 1910. Emma Miller lived in Fanny Schmidt's brothel (the same cigar store) in 1910 and then moved down a few houses to
Trixie Bell's saloon, where she worked as a madam under the name of "Mrs. Brown." At the same time she also worked at Cora Kashner's resort on Commerce Street.  

Although the population of the Tenderloin, as mentioned earlier, was transient by nature, a number of long-time residents maintained homes and businesses in the district. Alice Barnes, born just outside of town, spent her entire life in Canton. Her daughter, Ollie Schnovell, except for a short time in nearby Alliance, also spent her life in Canton. Trixie Bell and her husband operated several saloons from 1899 until her death in 1914. In 1909 the couple was able to maintain an upper middle class home on Shorb Avenue while continuing to run their saloons in the Tenderloin. Jennie Lee kept a house on Cherry Street for eight years before moving to Saxton Street for another eleven years, and "Mother" Ella Arnold operated houses on East Seventh and Eighth Streets for nearly twenty-five years. Jumbo Crowley kept continual residence in Canton, despite several "banishments," from the time he arrived in 1889 until 1927, when he opened a roadhouse in Wooster, Ohio, in the wake of his involvement in the murder of the Pulitzer Prize-winning news editor, Don Mellett. A few years later, Crowley returned to Canton. Gambler Jake Frailey (Alice Barnes' brother) had little documented connection with prostitution, but, according to Akron police, he was a partner in Crowley's fencing operation. Frailey spent his entire life in

---

19Canton City Directory, 1907-1910; U. S. Manuscript Census, 1910; Repository, November 2, 1911, 1; Canton City Directory, 1912.
Canton and saw his daughter graduate from the prestigious Hathaway Brown School in Cleveland, become one of the earliest social workers in town, and marry into a socially prominent family.  

Mayme Franklin came to Canton in 1907 and was active in prostitution until her death in 1969. Other women, such as Jennie Connors, Mary Smith, Fanny Schmidt, Jessie Lawson, and Anna Ward, were in Canton at least ten years. Ward's family was considered poor but highly respectable. Mamie Lee operated small parlor houses around 1910, but later was reputed to be the most politically powerful madam in Canton, with high-ranking connections in City Hall. In 1926 she was peripherally involved in the Mellett murder.  

Other prostitutes, like the Kate sisters, floated in and out of town for several years despite numerous arrests and their involvement in the suspicious death of Harry Bliss, the son of a state official.

These people, along with a few others, were the principal "partners" in the vice community. Some were independent business

---

20 Daily News, February 28, 1913, 1; November 14, 1913, 1, 14; Repository, March 1, 1913, 4.


22 News Democrat, January 1, 1912, 1; January 3, 1912, 1; Repository, January 2, 1912, 1; January 3, 1912, 1.
men and women, simply trying to earn a living under less than favorable circumstances. At the same time, however, they were members of a network made up mostly of saloon and brothel keepers who acted in concert but, contrary to stereotype, did not centrally control the operation of local prostitution. This pattern of independent involvement conforms to that of organized crime elsewhere, in that criminals, especially male criminals, preferring to stay away from dangerous street crime, began to operate in temporary non-hierarchical, flexible organizations where managerial techniques, contacts with influential persons, and large profits could be found.23

Men, of course, operated and presumably owned saloons in the Tenderloin. The 1910 city directory listed twenty-seven saloons located in the red light district. Only four, at most, were probably under the control of women (Minnie Andrews, Alice Barnes, and Trixie Bell). In 1912, twenty-six saloons were listed in the same area with three probable female proprietors (Alice Barnes, Trixie Bell, and Ollie Schnovell). At least two other women, Anna Stoffer and Maude O'Brien, owned saloons in the Tenderloin but were not listed in the directories. Further, in 1912, Anna Ward converted a saloon on Saxton Street into a soft drink bar brothel.

Property and tax records are extremely difficult to locate. Much of the red light district was held by real estate companies or individual brokers and frequently changed hands. Men, such as realtor Orrin Barber (William McKinley's nephew), owned the

23Nelli, The Business of Crime, 1
building in which Parker's Place, later known as Bivenour's Saloon, was located. The vice president of the Canton Incandescent Light Company owned the old Luna Foster resort. Mayor Arthur Turnbull and his wife's father and brother, George Oliver, Sr. and Jr., purchased prime land on East Tuscarawas.24

During the 1913 Civil Service Commission hearing of Police Chief Smith, prominent real estate and insurance agent W. H. "Pete" McCurdy, who was outraged when a "sporting house" opened next to his own home and the police refused to do anything about it, first denied, then later admitted, that he owned Fannie Schmidt's resort at 606 South Cherry Street. In his attempt to explain his confusion, he told Smith's attorney that when he learned that Schmidt's house was being used for immoral purposes, he attempted to "get her out" but that she bought the house from him. (McCurdy did not explain why he agreed to sell the property to Schmidt if he were so distressed at her occupation.) He went on to explain that because she purchased the property on a land contract for $12.00 a month, he still held the deed.25

Michael and Thomas Rocco owned at least three pieces of property on South Cherry Street, including the Rocco & Strapp Saloon, which housed the Standard Athletic Club in the back and a resort operated by Jennie Connors upstairs. On October 28 and


25Daily News, January 21, 1913, 1, 2; Repository, January 21, 1913, 1, 21, 9. McCurdy was the same man who along with William Timken helped finance Shilling's election appeal.
November 24, 1911, the Sheriff's Department raided the Connors house, and she was charged twice with keeping a house of ill repute and once with selling liquor in a brothel. Jennie Connors had been a well-known prostitute and madam for at least eight years. She was married to Tip O'Neil, a leading figure in the Canton underworld, who was charged with, but later acquitted of sending an assortment of explosives "that would have made an outfit for a Russian anarchist" to a condemned police killer, Fred Caster, a member of the "Canton Gang" in the Franklin County Jail. The couple also had ties to Jumbo Crowley, and Crowley had operated his Tavern saloon in the Rocco building. Shortly after Connors' second arrest, attorneys for the local reform movement filed civil action in Canton Common Pleas Court against the Rocco family, asking for $2,000 and costs under stipulations of the Winn Law, which held the owner of a building equally responsible with the lessee for illegal liquor sales.26

Jumbo Crowley, with his control of the underworld and his ties to the police, had some type of relationship with at least the main, if not all, houses of prostitution in the Tenderloin. Although Crowley had no convictions between 1908 and 1913 except for disturbing the peace, nearly every professional criminal enterprise in Canton can be connected in some way with him. When

26Repository, October 29, 1911, 1, 20; News Democrat, October 30, 1911, 1, 15; Morning News, January 24, 1906, 5; Repository, November 27, 1911, 1, 14. Ohio Revised Code, Section 6193-6201; Stark County Clerk of Courts, Case No. 21821, State of Ohio on relation to Edwin B. Townsend v Jennie Connors and Michael Rocco and Thomas Rocco.
Jennie Connors and Alice Williams were arrested in October, 1911, Crowley and his attorney, former Democratic mayor W. J. Piero (1881-1885), met them at the police station and attempted to post their bonds. Likewise, Crowley was first on the scene on New Year's morning, 1912, when Erma and Emily Kate awoke to find Emily's lover, Harry Bliss, in an adjoining bedroom, dead from a gunshot wound in the head. Crowley advised the sisters to contact police at once and then acted as a witness on their behalf. The Coroner ruled that the Kate and Crowley stories "tallied," and Emily was cleared of all suspicion in the death, which was then ruled a suicide. 27

Crowley's attorney Piero, and his law partner Fred W. Crankshaw, defended numerous women arrested on vice charges, and in 1913 Crankshaw was accused by anti-vice crusaders of soliciting protection money from Fannie Schmidt—a charge that was later dismissed. Piero was also secretary of the Morning News and the News Democrat, which from 1907 to 1912 was controlled by unnamed liquor interests and the editor of which opposed many actions of

27 Harry Bliss was said to be "worried" the night of his death after he fought with Emily Kate. Kate, in fact, showed signs of being beaten around the mouth when she appeared at the police station. Bliss was also having problems with his probation officer. Although Bliss was the son of an respected state official he was no stranger to the police. He was probably on probation for an incident that occurred in late 1910 when he and a friend stole a watch and $15.00 from a guest at the McKinley Hotel. Bliss' claim that they stole for a "lark" went unheeded in court. Repository, January 16, 1911, 8. For accounts of Bliss' death and the involvement of the Kate sisters, see News Democrat, January 1, 1912, p. 1; Repository, January 2, 1912, p. 1, 9; January 3, 1912, p. 1; News Democrat, January 3, 1912, p. 1; State of Ohio Bureau of Vital Statistics, Certificate of Death, No. 67037, January 2, 1912.
the reform movements that had sprung up. In 1911 and 1912, Piero
was also vice president of the Canton Distilling Company and at one
time, he was also a business partner of Arthur Turnbull's in the
Turnbull and Piero Contracting Company.28

Other types of men who attached themselves to vice districts—
cadets, pimps, and white slavers—held virtually no influence and
were barely noticeable in the Tenderloin, although reform groups
consistently stated that the town was a center of prostitution
traffic in the Midwest. Men from out of town were occasionally
arrested for taking girls to resorts or putting young women on the
street, but although some cadets must have existed, there are no
documented cases of their working in Canton to any extent. Cases
of girls being lured away to brothels regularly appeared in the
local newspapers, but the accusations were dismissed as the tales
of wayward girls trying to talk their way out of trouble. When
reporters or police heard these stories, they tried to check them,
but of the numerous cases reported in the newspaper, no connection
to Canton was found. A typical report related that a young woman
arrested for loitering or disorderly conduct in another town
claimed that a stranger lured her away from her home in Canton with
promises such as a stage career, only to put her into a brothel.

The Canton police maintained an anti-pimp policy which was
probably established in 1906 when the Tenderloin was set aside for

28Heald, Industry Comes of Age, 535; Canton City Directory, 1912. E. T. Heald, The Stark County Story: The American Way of
vice purposes. Jimmy Smith at his Civil Service Commission hearing was not asked about, nor did he comment on, pimps, but a statement made by Anna Ward fifteen months earlier suggested that Smith did not want pimps in the Tenderloin. In an affidavit signed shortly after her arrest in October, 1911, Ward said that Smith:

> came into my place and said I shouldn't have any fellows around the place that didn't work or allow any of the girls to have fellows who didn't work because he didn't want any G__ D____ pimps lying around here.29

Although male hotel and saloon keepers were arrested during periodic anti-vice crusades on charges of keeping disorderly houses or houses of assignation, no pimps were reported rounded up. Similarly, no pimps were reported in connection with major brothels or professional prostitutes, although a few did exist. Art Turnbull, when presiding in Mayor's Court during his first months in office, left no doubt of his opinion of pimps. Saving his most vitriolic comments for them, he called pimps "desolate men who live off the lust of women."30

The absence of an organized pimp system does not mean that pimps did not operate in Canton, only that organized procurement was not an important part of the Canton system. For instance, as in other cities, men who were married to casual or part-time prostitutes sometimes sold their wives' favors, according to newspaper reports. James Hammers was sent to the Workhouse on charges filed by his sister-in-law who claimed that he had forced

---

29 *News Democrat*, October 31, 1911, 1, 4.

his wife into the streets. The most noteworthy and tragic case involved John H. Smith, who, after refusing to work full time, invited men to drop by his house to be "entertained" by his wife, Hortense. When she gave birth to a daughter he claimed was not his, Smith threw his wife out of the house and told her she could not return unless she got rid of the baby. Mrs. Smith abandoned the two month old baby on a snowy porch step but later came forward and claimed her. A few months later the child died at the Smith residence of malnutrition. 31 Neither of these women was an habitual prostitute, nor was either connected with Tenderloin brothels, although Mrs. Hammers frequented saloons in the district.

* * * * *

Liquor and brewery interests in the Tenderloin are also difficult to trace, yet fragmentary evidence suggests clandestine, large-scale investment in the vice district, typical of the national pattern. The purchase and sale of land was often transacted through third-party real estate agents or by brewery owners themselves under their individual names and frequently involved prominent businessmen and politicians. The largest financial transaction uncovered involved City Lot Number 90, the lot on which Jumbo Crowley's Place (another Crowley saloon) was located. In 1910, Philip Wild, a wine importer and liquor

---

31 Hammers case: Repository, January 1, 1913, 4; January 2, 1913, 1. Smith case: Repository, January 1, 1911, 1, 8; January 3, 1911, 1, 4; January 5, 1911, 1; January 6, 1911, 1; News Democrat, April 10, 1911, 1; State of Ohio Bureau of Vital Statistics, Certificate of Death 24058, April 10, 1911; News Democrat, May 17, 1911, 1.
distributor, sold part of this lot to Arthur Turnbull, who three months later sold it for $24,000 to the Mutual Manufacturing Company, which the mayor also owned. Mutual Manufacturing then resold the property for $23,000 back to Wild.32

The largest brewery in Canton was the Stark Tuscarawas Brewery, operated by the Rommel family.33 The company was incorporated in 1906 with a capital investment of $1,500,000, locally equaled in value only by the United States Steel Corporation and surpassed in value only by the Canton, Youngstown & Wheeling Railroad. In December, 1907, William Rommel publicly announced that as president of the brewery and as a member of the Ohio Brewers Association, he whole-heartedly supported the efforts of the association to eliminate objectionable features in the liquor traffic. He urged the "suppression of dives and all salons with wine rooms or where women congregate." This position, however, did not stop either Rommel or his family from investing in such dives, and four transactions have been discovered. In 1907, Trixie Bell purchased a saloon from the brewery. Although located several miles north of the Tenderloin, the saloon was considered "one of the worst dives" in the city. In 1911, the brewery purchased the Bertoni Saloon for $4,200.00 This saloon, was the home of several prostitutes, but the business was not a major source of vice in Canton. The same

32 Stark County Recorder, Deed Transfers 489/1; 489/36; 497/52.

33 Emma Rommel, the daughter of Stark-Tuscarawas founder William Rommel married Police Court Judge William Quinn in 1910, Canton City Directory, 1910; correspondence from Judge William Quinn, Jr to author, September 30, 1980.
year, William Rommel, under his own name, sold the "old Phoenix Hotel," one of the largest and most infamous houses of prostitution and a former Crowley saloon to Louis Esber, about whom nothing can be found. Sometime between 1915 and 1919, the brewery purchased Mamie Lee's house on Saxton Street, in which she continued to work and live.\textsuperscript{34}

Liquor interests also held strong political connections to city government outside of the mayor's office. Joseph Munter, Jr., vice president of the Home Brewing Company, was a member of the Canton Civil Service Commission. He was also vice president of Turnbull's Mutual Manufacturing Company. One of Munter's duties while on the commission was the hiring and firing of police officers, and he and his fellow commission members successfully postponed the hearing of Jimmy Smith until after July 15, 1913, when all three men were out of office.\textsuperscript{35}

* * * * * *

Men clearly had lucrative financial interest in the Tenderloin, but women maintained influence, if not control, in many of the everyday aspects of Tenderloin life. At least twenty women were major forces in the district. Most were madams, but a few worked independently of the brothel. Because of their status as madams,

\textsuperscript{34}Canton City Directory, 1907; Repository, December 15, 1907, 10; December 22, 1907, 1; Stark County Recorder Deed Transfers 469/309; 513/563; 509/438. No transfer record is available for the sale to Mamie Lee; notation found in miscellaneous notes in the office of The Stark County Engineer.

\textsuperscript{35}Canton City Directory, 1912; Canton Civil Service Commission Minutes, November 24, 1912; December 2, 1912; December 12, 1912; January 15, 1913.
their significance is easier to determine than that of the women who worked for them. On the one hand, these madams were small business entrepreneurs, owning and operating their own businesses. On the other hand, they were vulnerable to the political structure of the city and to the political strategies of reform groups and opposing politicians, just as were madams in other cities. By virtue of their gender and social position they did not hold the political clout of a Jumbo Crowley. Madams were forced almost to depend on Crowley for protection and legal advice, but nothing indicates that he actually "owned" part of the business (except for prostitution in which he was occasionally involved, especially in his early years in Canton when he was a bartender). Crowley may, in fact, have acted as a "big brother" to madams, offering financial and legal protection and advice (probably for a price) when needed but certainly staying out of the everyday business affairs of individual madams. Madams, then, were basically independent business women on their own in fending off reformers, handling regular police payoffs, and running their businesses.

Using financial rewards as a partial gauge to judge success in the Tenderloin, the six most successful women in the district were Alice Barnes, Ollie Schnovell, Ella Arnold, Caroline Studer, Trixie Bell, and Alice Williams.36 Alice Barnes' husband Frank was an

36 Other leading, but less successful women in the Tenderloin included Jennie Connors, Anna Joseph, Cora Kashner, Emily Kate, Erna Kate, Jessie Lawson, Jennie Lee, Mamie Lee, Anna "Dutch Mary" Leiber, Kitty Martin, Mary Miller, Nellie McDougal, Nellie Morgan, Maude O'Brien, Nellie Callahan Schwinn, Fannie Schmidt, Mary Smith, Nellie Shear, Anna Stoffer, and Tena Wise.
industrial laborer until his death from pneumonia in 1895, and Barnes herself had no obvious connection with prostitution until around 1906 when she took over operation of Nosack's Saloon on Cherry Street. Although according to an article in the Morning News in August, 1910 that said that Jake Frailey purchased the City Hotel, deed transfers show that Barnes actually purchased the hotel from George and Clara Hendricks for $12,250. Before that year she also purchased Tenderloin and residential lots. For several years Barnes was involved in complicated land transactions among herself, her gambler brother and sister-in-law John and Mamie Fraley (the brothers spelled their names differently), and Ollie and John Schnovell (Ollie's second husband who owned a saloon near the Tenderloin). Her name was connected with disreputable events in the Tenderloin, but she was charged only once with keeping a house of prostitution. The disposition of the case cannot be found.37

Ollie Schnovell was married three times, the first time to the brother of the Adjutant General of the Ohio Militia, a marriage that will be discussed later. As a young woman she worked at the Dueber Hampden Watch Case Company and sold dinner china. Between 1910 and 1913, according to city directories, Schnovell ran every saloon and hotel on the east side of the 500 block of Cherry Street. She also owned a boarding house on South Walnut. From 1908 to 1916, Schnovell and Alice Barnes traded both the Walnut

37 Stark County Death Records, Vol.2 No. 41; Morning News, August 1, 1910, 5; Stark County Recorder Deed Transfer 501/407.
property and residential property outside the Tenderloin between themselves, suggesting some financial problems for the younger woman. In 1912, Barnes placed property worth at least $3000 in the custody of John Fraley to be held in trust for Schnovell until John Schnovell ceased to be her husband or died.\textsuperscript{38}

By 1912, Ollie Schnovell was successful enough to hire Nellie Callahan Schwinn to run a brothel for her at 524 South Cherry Street. When arrested only a few days after taking the job, Schwinn complained to police that Schnovell had promised police protection to her. When Schnovell refused to post bond for her employee, Schwinn, a successful businesswoman herself, put up jewelry, which according to police was worth $1,200.00 Schnovell was arrested at least three times between 1906 and 1912 for keeping an immoral house.\textsuperscript{39}

"Mother" Ella Arnold ran a quiet house on East Seventh Street. In 1903 she purchased land on East Tuscarawas Street for $1,800.00 and a few years later sold the property for $10,000. W. J. Piero acted as the attorney for the transaction. Arnold also owned property used as a right-of-way for the East Ohio Gas Company and other land near the present city hall. Arnold was arrested several

\textsuperscript{38}Stark County Probate Court Marriage License Application 2525, Canton City Directory, 1910-1913. Stark County Recorder Deed Transfers 420/557; 466/543; 541/262; 563/453; Repository, October 6, 1912, 7.

\textsuperscript{39}Repository, October 6, 1912, 7.
time for liquor law violations but only once for running a house of prostitution.  

Caroline Studer did not lead the relatively quiet life of Ella Arnold. Studer and her husband Joe were involved not only in prostitution but in counterfeiting and dealing in stolen property. Besides spending several years in prison on white slavery charges, Mrs. Studer was arrested several times for keeping a house of ill fame. When Caroline Studer died of a stroke in 1918 at the age of sixty-one, she left an estate worth over $27,000, including the U. S. Hotel and an adjoining house, two-hundred forty acres in Montgomery County, Alabama, and a city lot in Ardmore, Oklahoma.

Trixie Bell and her husband, James, operated two saloons on Saxton and Cherry Streets between 1909 and 1914, as well as The Stag Hotel, a dive on West Tuscarawas Street. Although well-known by police, Mrs. Bell was arrested only twice, in 1905 on white slavery charges that were dismissed and in 1912 for keeping a house of prostitution. When she died intestate in 1916, James Bell inherited his wife’s half of five pieces of property located in

---

24*News Democrat*, December 21, 1911, 1; Stark County Recorder, Deed Transfers, 419/322; 565/51; 554/279.

25For arrest records of Caroline Studer, see *Repository*, September 16, 1905, 6; October 24, 1905, 1; December 26, 1905, 2; *Morning News*, January 26, 1906, 3; *Repository*, May 25, 1906, 15; June 26, 1906, 1; *Morning News*, June 27, 1906, 1; *Repository*, October 9, 1906, 3; June 15, 1910, 18; *Morning News*, July 16, 1910, 3. For record of Joe Studer, see *Morning News*, June 18, 1906, 1; *Repository*, December 5, 1909, 1; *Morning News*, December 18, 1906, 1; Stark County Probate Court, *Inventory and Appraisement Record*, 44/22.
Canton and Stark County, including the Shorb Avenue home mentioned above, where the couple shared the neighborhood with lawyers and businessmen. 42

Alice Williams owned five pieces of property in Massillon and another piece of land in downtown Canton near the Tenderloin. According to her Inventory and Appraisement Record, this land was valued at just over $17,000.00. Williams also owned a 110-acre farm in Rush Township, Tuscarawas County, Ohio, but no value was assigned to this property. All but $600.00 of the proceeds of the estate were left to Williams' son, business partner, and bartender, Clyde. The remaining amount was divided equally among Mrs. Williams' other three children. 43

These six madams maintained influence, respect, and a modicum of financial success within the disreputable community. These benefits, however, were limited to the narrow confines of the community. While men such as Jumbo Crowley and Jake Frailey used the district as a springboard into politics, legitimate business, and the local power structure, and became relatively well-to-do and even respected outside of the Tenderloin, madams, by virtue of their trade and gender, could not extend their interests and influence beyond the Tenderloin. Socially trapped by Saxton Street, these madams and their less successful counterparts were forced to remain stigmatized in the sexualized Tenderloin ghetto.

42 Stark County Probate Court, Inventory and Appraisement Record 41/145.

43 Stark County Probate Court, Inventory and Appraisement record 37/577.
Trixie Bell and Alice Williams never left that ghetto—at least spiritually—and died while the district was still intact. Alice Barnes and Ollie Schnovell survived the Tenderloin, however, both re-marrying in the early 1920s and moving within blocks of each other in homes located about a mile north of the district. When Alice Barnes died in 1933 she left only two pieces of property worth a little over $4,000.00 The remainder of her Tenderloin property and residential lots had been sold off years earlier.\textsuperscript{44} Ollie Schnovell shared a similar fate. After her third marriage, Schnovell apparently gave up her Cherry Street businesses and retired from the disreputable life. Upon the death of her husband in 1940, however, Schnovell, at the age of sixty-seven, became a waitress at Scotty's Cafe, a small bar located next to her home. When she died five years later, the only remaining property was her home, appraised at less that $9,000.00\textsuperscript{45}

The Tenderloin thus existed as a limited area in which women and men joined together in interdependent, yet independent, relationships in order to further individual interests—usually economic—frequently with the indifferent or clandestine assistance of a system of local investors, businessmen, and politicians. On the one hand, women dominated much of the business in the district and remained inside it and rarely attempted to operate outside of its geographical limits. Men, on the other hand, were able to

\textsuperscript{44}Canton City Directory, 1940; Stark County Probate Court, Inventory and Appraisement Record 87/322; Will No. 31/501.

\textsuperscript{45}Stark County Probate Court, Inventory and Appraisement Record 138/494.
legitimize their business operations in the Tenderloin and extend their influence outside of the district, creating both individual financial success and personal power. The Tenderloin, then, was clearly a ghetto—a permanent workplace and home for the women who operated businesses and found acceptance and success within its street.
CHAPTER 4

GOOD GIRLS GONE BAD: THE WOMEN OF SAXTON STREET

Little specific personal information about women who lived and worked in the Tenderloin is available. The disreputable nature of the fast life, even in the open environment of Saxton Street, allowed most prostitutes to remain anonymous. Except for occasional incidents involving crime, violence, scandal, or other notoriety, the general public showed little interest in the private or public lives of prostitutes. Most information, then, about prostitutes (social class, ethnic background, employment, family life, and even the causes of individual prostitution) once again comes from U. S. Census reports, newspaper articles, city directories, and legal documents. Although incomplete and sometimes unreliable, these records still provide a basis for describing the overall—and sometimes specific—view of the women of Saxton Street.

No accurate count of women working in the Tenderloin is possible. Newspaper reports and the city directory permit a calculation that one-hundred five prostitutes were located in or near the Tenderloin in 1912. This figure is certainly low because there is no way to know how many other Tenderloin women were not
involved in activities worthy of newspaper coverage. The number of women coming into the Tenderloin on a casual basis is also impossible to figure. Furthermore, there is no way to gauge the accuracy of the city directory.

Prostitutes in the Tenderloin generally were working class women with working class backgrounds. Some combined low-paying women's jobs, such as domestic service or table waiting, with their prostitution, while others practiced prostitution exclusively. Some women who worked in brothels and disreputable saloons were not prostitutes at all, but hired help living on the premises as cooks, maids, and housekeepers. Prostitutes did not want their names associated with their occupation, especially in government records, and census takers, perhaps were reluctant (or not even permitted) to list "prostitute," "brothel," and "bawdy saloon" on the census rolls. Instead, census takers recorded that the majority of prostitutes who responded to the questionnaire were unemployed "boarders" living in rooming houses.¹

Madams were more likely to identify specific occupations for the census or the city directory listing than were working prostitutes. In 1900, for instance, Ella Arnold called herself a "milliner" and rented rooms out to three men (a bartender, an opera performer, and a laborer), and one unemployed woman. By 1910, however, Arnold had no occupation according to the census rolls, but she rented rooms to two unemployed women. Other madams, like Jennie Lee, Alice Barnes, and Anna Stoffer, simply called

¹U. S. Manuscript Census, 1900, 1910.
themselves "landlady" or "boarding house keeper." In 1900, one
prostitute, Emma Kauffman, said she was a "housekeeper" at Mike
Cavanaugh's Saxton Street saloon, but by 1910 she was a "barber."
According to the 1900 census, Trixie Bell was a "housekeeper" at
her dive on West Tuscarawas, while her husband, James, was a
watchmaker at the Dueber Hampden Watchworks, and two
"seamstresses" and one cook lived at the resort. That same year,
Ollie Schnovell, not yet married to her first husband, was a
saleslady. In 1907, Fannie Schmidt was the proprietor of a cigar
store.2

In 1900, the largest number of women living in the Tenderloin
who identified themselves as employed in legitimate occupations
said that they were seamstresses or dressmakers (seven). One woman
each said she was a cook, hotel servant, and servant. By 1910,
however, the number of women who claimed to work in domestic
service was greatly increased, while seamstresses and dressmakers
virtually disappeared from the scene. Thirteen Tenderloin women
are listed in the 1910 census as servants, four as cooks, and seven
as waitresses. Domestic service, generally repudiated by
prostitutes, may have been an entryway into prostitution, as well
as a way to guarantee at least a minimum income and in some cases
served as a convenient cover for women who wanted to hide their
activities from families, usually living in other towns. After the
beating death of Elizabeth Brown in 1908, for instance, her mother
told police that Elizabeth had originally come to Canton to work at

2Tbid; Canton City Directory, 1907.
the Conrad Hotel, and, in fact, had worked in several hotels before her death. Lena Goodman, a prostitute who later became a Cherry Street madam, worked for a time as a servant at Kitty Martin's "boarding house." In 1912, a group of young women was arrested during an all-night party at the Opera Cafe after a recently-fired bartender complained to police that the saloon was an assignation house. Aspiring to higher callings, three of the women claimed to be respectively a nurse, a seamstress, and a waitress, but none of their names appears in the city directory for that year or for the preceding and following years. Epha Skerett, convicted of streetwalking in 1913, may also have been the musician she claimed to be, since her father was pastor of St. Paul's AME Church.3

While some women mixed prostitution with low paying work, others may have been exactly what they claimed to be: non-prostitutes who happened to work as domestics in brothels. Women who claimed to be "good girls" offered a variety of explanations as to why they were living or working in brothels. Although the veracity of their stories can be questioned, plausible explanations were given and sometimes believed. Helen Weyant, for instance, charged in 1912 with keeping a resort with Fannie Schmidt, was acquitted after she convinced the court that she was nothing more than the housekeeper. Two less believable cases involved runaway girls. Caroline Ackerman, a girl whom Trixie Bell was accused of

3U. S. Manuscript Census, 1900, 1910; (Canton) Repository, January 7, 1908, 10; January 8, 1908, 10; U. S. Manuscript Census, 1910; Repository, February 24, 1912, 1; March 1, 1912, 1; Canton City Directory, 1912; Repository, March 12, 1913, 3.
"luring into a life of shame" in 1906, claimed she performed only housework at the Bell establishment and left after learning that the saloon was also a brothel. (Ackerman, in fact, did not leave until arrested.) In 1912, Yetta Cohen, a runaway from Cleveland, similarly claimed she worked only as a kitchen and cleaning helper in Anna Joseph's house. Cohen, when discovered by police and her father, said that she had been treated "very nice" by Joseph but begged to be taken out of the resort since she had never been in "such a place like this before." 4

When Harry Schilling shut down the Tenderloin in 1912, part of his long-range goal was to obtain legitimate work for prostitutes—a plan that met with little enthusiasm in the Jungle. When Schilling tried to assure Ella Arnold that the city administration wanted to help—not persecute—inmates, the madam asked him, "You surely don't expect the girls to ask for work, do you?" One madam refused Schilling's assistance outright, saying, "I kin get all I want to do. I'm some cook." Anna Joseph said she might consider doing housework in a private home but added that if she obtained a position with a respectable family who later found out about her past, "they wouldn't have me." 5

Joseph's remarks, whether a legitimate concern or only an excuse not to work, nevertheless rang true. Respectable people

4 (Canton) News Democrat, March 1, 1912, 2; Repository, January 6, 1906, 6; News Democrat, September 15, 1912, 9; Repository, September 15, 1912, 9; Repository, September 15, 1912, 24.

5 (Canton) Repository, November 26, 1912, 1; November 27, 1912, 1, 10; (Canton) Daily News, November 27, 1912, 4.
simply did not want prostitutes—or former prostitutes—working in their homes. A year after the Tenderloin was closed, a young prostitute, discouraged in her attempt to find legitimate work, contacted a reporter from the Daily News who had recently written about the need for a new rescue home in the area. The woman, who remained anonymous, told of her efforts to find work after she saved up enough money to leave her resort. "I went to the home of one of the women who were praising the rescue home in Thursday's Daily News," the woman said. "She asked me for references, I had none. 'If you haven't any references, you can't work in my house,' she declared." The girl then attempted to rent a room at the WCTU home for working girls and was also turned away.6

* * * * *

The nativity of prostitutes found in any town is dependent on the migration pattern to that area. Figures on five selected cities in a study made by the Department of Justice in 1916 indicated that just under eighty-two percent of the prostitutes found in these cities were born in America, while various studies in New York City and State, (the major immigration center of the country), indicated a lower figure of about sixty-eight percent of prostitutes were born in the United States.7 Although thousands of foreign-born men immigrated to Canton to work in mills and factories, the overwhelming number of prostitutes whom they met in

---

6Daily News, December 12, 1913, 1, 2.

Canton, just as in these other cities, were born in the United States of American-born parents. Out of eighty-three prostitutes and madams associated with the district between 1910 and 1913, whose birthplace can be identified, seventy (nearly eight-five percent) were born in the United States, making Canton just above the national average. Thirty-six of these women (a little over forty-two percent) were born in Ohio, fourteen (twenty percent) in Pennsylvania, with eight others born in Michigan, Indiana, Illinois, West Virginia, New York, and Louisiana. Twelve others stated simply they were born in the United States. Only thirteen (nearly sixteen percent) of the women in the Tenderloin for those years, whose nativity is known, were foreign born: four born in Hungary, three in Russia, and others born in Germany or Bohemia, Austria, France, England, Canada, and Switzerland. No Latin American or oriental prostitutes were found in Canton.

Out of the twenty-four prominent madams in the Tenderloin, the birthplaces of seventeen can be identified. Eleven madams out of this group (a little over sixty-four percent) were born in the United States and six (thirty-five percent) were born in Europe, (Germany, Austria, Hungary, England, and Switzerland). Because of the lack of birth and parental data available on five other madams, these lower percentages, both for the national average and the accumulated average of all prostitutes in Saxton Street may indicate nothing more than a lack of data. No matter what the country of origin, however, nearly all of madams the and

---

8U. S. Manuscript Census, 1900, 1910.
prostitutes in the Tenderloin had received some formal education and were literate.  

Out of seventy-three prostitutes whose parental birthplace can be identified, forty-nine (sixty-seven percent) either simply called themselves "American" rather than "European" or "foreign" or clearly stated that both parents were born in the United States. Other prostitutes said they were of mixed American parentage such as Scotch-American or German-American. Others had parents whom they said were both born in countries like Russia, Italy, Switzerland, Germany, Hungary, Ireland, and Poland, while others, again, were of mixed European parentage such as German-Russian and Swiss-German. Two cousins were Gypsies.  

Prostitutes, no matter what their backgrounds, did not want their families to know how they earned their living. Police Matron Catherine Priest claimed that the universal plea of women in jail was, "Don't let Mother find it out." Recounting her first year as matron, Priest, a tough but sympathetic woman, said of the women in her charge, "Many of them seemed hardened beyond all redemption but I have seen women apparently lost to all sense of shame break down and sob when someone mentions their mother."  

* * * * * 

For the most part, brothels and saloons in the Tenderloin were operated by white women and men for a white clientele. One of  

---

9Ibid., Repository, September 1, 1912, 20.  
10Ibid.; Repository, September 1, 1912, 20.  
11Repository, April 3, 1913, 2.
Arthur Turnbull's first acts as judge in Mayor's Court early in 1906 was to order black madam and saloonist Luna Foster out of the city after she and four other women, including her sister, Mabel Foster, were arrested during Turnbull's moral crusade to "clean out the houses." 12

After 1906, black brothels and most black prostitutes were generally confined to the Sheridan and Collins Avenue areas just southeast of the Tenderloin, but a few blacks filtered up into the district with no apparent objection from either Saxton Street society or city officials. In 1910, for instance, three black women and one unemployed black man moved into a Saxton Street "boarding house," formerly operated by Mary Smith, who had moved a few houses up the street. According to the census records, one woman was the "housekeeper," while the other two women were boarders who worked as private family servants. That same year, Mrs. Golar Hill, who usually lived in Sheridan Street and sometimes shared rooms with Mayme Franklin, was also in Saxton Street. In 1913, after living outside of Saxton Street, she returned to operate a "boarding house" in the same former Smith resort.

Another black incursion into the Tenderloin occurred in 1913 when Charles Cain and his wife Sadie Turner took over the Charles Bruner Saloon on Cherry Street. Between 1910 and 1913, probably only a few black prostitutes called the Tenderloin their home, but, more

12 (Canton) Morning News, January 15, 1906, 1; January 16, 1906, 1. Newspaper reports of Saxton Street life did not routinely mention the race of persons involved in the incident being reported unless these persons were non-white. The only exceptions seem to be when parties were of different races.
than likely, more frequented the district. From the few records available, the majority of black prostitutes appeared to have been involved with white men, and, according to Bessie Mitchell, a black prostitute and madam in Youngstown and Canton from 1927 to the present, black-operated houses and prostitutes almost always catered to white clients. White prostitutes, however, did not usually accept black customers and strenuously objected to and denied these allegations when accused of such activities. Those very few white women arrested with black men were considered by the courts as particularly suspicious persons and were likely to receive more severe verbal reprimands from the court than were white women arrested with white customers, although they did not receive stiffer fines or jail sentences than white prostitutes.13

* * * * *

The few available pictures of Tenderloin prostitutes suggest that the women were ordinary looking—attractive but not beautiful—reflecting middle class propriety and values. Fannie Schmidt, looking directly into the camera with a slightly superior smile, resembles any other efficient, Austrian-Jewish hausfrau, and a

13 U. S. Manuscript Census, 1910; Canton City Directory, 1910, 1913; Daily News, July 28, 1913, 1; July 29, 1913, 1; (Akron) Beacon Journal, November 14, 1982, 1, 16; News Democrat, September 18, 1912, 1; September 23, 1912, 2; Repository, September 13, 1913, 5. A few years later, the Tenderloin may have become more segregated. In 1926, the Daily News published pictures of the Cherry Street area, originally printed in the Pittsburgh Post. Included is a picture of a large brick house, described as the "headquarters" of Val Cook, a leading underworld figure at that time, "where it is believed he takes care of both black and white customers. . . . the brick structure is said to be for his 'white' customers and the wooden shack (behind the house) is for negroes." Daily News, July 19, 1926, 2.
reporter from the Daily News once described her a "comely little German woman of about fifty, who speaks in broken English."

Hortense Smith, forced into prostitution by her husband, is square-jawed, a little plump, and has a flower in her hair. The murdered Elizabeth Brown, with a large bow on top of her head, her face still showing signs of baby fat and innocence, could easily be mistaken for a high school girl. Only Bessie Race, a fourteen-year-old runaway, prostitute, and wine room lounger, exudes any real personality for the camera. Shown standing in front of an American flag with her younger sister, Marie, Bessie's slender, pretty features and mischievous smile subtly suggest a worldly independence and knowledge beyond her years.¹⁴

Reporters, sometimes taken by a particular woman, offered physical descriptions or descriptive anecdotes. Katie May, an alcoholic prostitute with a long arrest record, was described with "her mass of red hair hanging down her back in a bewitching manner." Another reporter referred to her hair as "brickdust blond." Babe McCoy-Carpenter was described by a writer for the Repository, as "a woman of the world" who was "pretty and attractive when togged out in her finest." When she "took too much of the stuff that cheers," however, she became "ugly and abusive." When McCoy-Carpenter was arrested for public drunkenness, she was so stylishly dressed in pink silk that on-lookers, according to the

¹⁴Daily News, November 19, 1912, 1, 2; Repository, November 21, 1912, 1; January 2, 1911, 1; January 7, 1908, 1; January 16, 1911, 1.
reporter, mistook her for a "society belle" arrested for speeding.15

Nicknames suggested physical appearance, ethnic background, or other personal characteristics. "Red Nell" Thompson and Rhetta "Red" Dougherty most certainly had red hair. Anna Lieber, known as "Dutch Mary," was German. Older madams Alice Barnes and Ella Arnold frequently had their names prefixed with the title "Mother." Prostitutes sometimes changed their names or occasionally used aliases. Kitty Davenport was also known as Blanche Bates, Edna Carl used the name Dora Lippincott; Eva Rowe adopted her mother's maiden name of Keller; Babe McCoy-Carpenter was Ora Weiser, Elizabeth Brown sometimes used the name Pearl Miller; Mamie Lee was Bertie Lee; Hagnan Starwick was May Stevens, Nina Moffett was Amanda Wilson and Goldie Boyce was Clara Patton. Nellie Callahan Schwinn was originally Nina Eastman and Fannie Schmidt was known as Fannie Stine, Fannie Stein, and occasionally Fannie Smith, and Mary Smith was occasionally known as Mary Schmidt. Other women sported improbable, exotic, or provocative names such as Ella Pleasure, Narrow Gage, Pearl Tempest, Pearl Wing, Dorothy LeFay, and Rea LaVern.16

* * * * *

Almost all working women in the Tenderloin of which there are records claimed to be over the age of eighteen, the age of consent

15Morning News, February 27, 1907, 1; October 26, 1908, 7; April 28, 1906, 5.

16Names taken from numerous newspaper articles published between 1905 and 1913.
in Ohio. Out of fifty-four prostitutes whose ages are known, only
three were between the ages of thirty-five and forty; most were
between the ages of twenty-one and twenty-eight with the average
being just under twenty-five, making them a little older than the
prostitutes researched by contemporary investigators prior to the
First World War. Madams were usually, but not necessarily, older
than working women. In 1910, Alice Barnes, at fifty-four, was well
into middle age and was the oldest madam in the district, followed
by Caroline Studer, fifty-three; Elizabeth Bowers, fifty-two, and
Jennie Lee, fifty-one. Ollie Schonell and Trixie Bell were both
under forty. The youngest madam was Emma Miller, who was only
twenty-one.17

The Tenderloin was an adult district. While some underage
girls visited Saxton Street and nearby areas, only a handful worked
in brothels as prostitutes. By and large, an agreement seems to
have been struck (probably when the district came under the
"supervision" of the city) between brothel and saloon keepers and
police that underage girls would not be permitted in resorts.
Police often searched brothels for missing girls and were sometimes
actually welcomed by madams. There were, however, exceptions. The
most serious cases (at least for madams) occurred in 1906 when
Trixie Bell and Caroline Studer were charged in separate incidents
of "luring young girls into a life of shame." While Bell's case

17U. S. Manuscript Census, 1900, 1910.
was dismissed on a technicality in a Wooster, Ohio, court,\textsuperscript{18} Studer was not so fortunate. She was sentenced to four years in the Ohio Penitentiary for hiring two New Philadelphia girls to work as prostitutes at the Central Hotel. In her appeal to the Ohio Supreme Court, handled by local attorney Atlee Pomerene, who in a few years would be Lieutenant Governor of Ohio, a U. S. Senator, and a Special Counsel during Teapot Dome, it was argued that Studer’s arrest had all been a “misunderstanding.” Pomerene asserted that Studer, on a visit to New Philadelphia, had told another hotel proprietor that she was looking for some girls to work as prostitutes at her hotel since “good help is hard to find.” The third party had not informed the girls that they were to be prostitutes and instead the two had come to Canton expecting to be hired as domestics. Studer lost her case.\textsuperscript{19} Another serious offense was the 1912 case, where Katherine Puzinni, formerly of Pittsburgh, “her hair just out of braids and her skirts just recently lowered to her shoe tops,” brought charges against John De Luca, whom she claimed forced her into prostitution and threatened

\textsuperscript{18} \textit{Morning News}, January 6, 1906, 6. The judge ruled that Bell’s indictment was faulty since it had not stated that the underage women found in Bell’s dive were actually “female.”

\textsuperscript{19} See footnote 40 in preceding chapter for history of Caroline Studer; \textit{Studer v State of Ohio}, 9 O. C. C. (N.S.) 185, 19 O. C. D. 33 (affirmed without report 74 O. S. 159); E. T. Heald, \textit{The Stark County Story: Industry Comes of Age} (Canton: The Stark County Historical Society, 1952), 687–692. Under Ohio law anyone convicted of “inducing, decoying, or procuring” a girl under the age of eighteen to have sexual intercourse or to enter a house of assignation or house of ill fame could be sentenced to a state penitentiary for one to five years. \textit{O. G. C.}, Section 13027.
to "knife her" if she left him. DeLuca was charged under the Mann Act, but the final disposition of the case is unknown. 20

Other less serious cases involved Alice Williams, who in 1908 was charged with letting Rea LaVern, seventeen, and Almo Johnson, fifteen, stay at her house. In 1912, fourteen-year-old Cleo Eyster, from nearby Navarre, was arrested on a delinquency charge after she was found in Jennie Connors' place. Although both Williams and Connors were charged with allowing minors in their houses, sentences (although they cannot be located in either court records or newspapers) seem to have been light since both women continued to run their brothels. 21

Florence Bonsky, fourteen, spent her evenings in the Tenderloin and was eventually arrested for incorrigibility. After her arrest, she furnished enough information to the Stark County Grand Jury to bring indictments and convictions against eight saloonkeepers in the district on charges of selling and furnishing liquor to a minor. Although Bonsky's testimony was expected to cause "a sensation" in town that would shut down the Tenderloin, no revelations were forthcoming, and the girl was sent away to the Crittenden Home in Akron for rehabilitation. 22 The youngest girl known to have been involved in prostitution, but not actually a

20 Daily News, December 5, 1912, 3; Repository, December 5, 1912, p. 1.

21 Morning News, June 11, 1908, 1; News Democrat, September 26, 1912, 1.

22 Morning News, January 15, 1910, 5; January 20, 1910, 8; Repository, January 11, 1910, 1; January 18, 1910, 10; January 19, 1910, 9; March 25, 1910, 5. Articles cover the entire Bonsky affair.
prostitute, was Edith May, twelve, who for four years acted as a lookout while her mother, Maise May, and another woman "entertained men". Jimmy Smith tried to find a hotel room for the girl to stay in while her mother awaited trial, but since Edith had chickenpox no hotel would accept her, and Smith made up a cot for her to sleep on outside her mother's cell.  

The most notable case of juvenile prostitution involved Bessie Race, fourteen, and Bethel Deater, fifteen, and tells as much about generational conflict as it does of spurious accounts of white slavery. Bessie Race, according to her mother, ran away from home at least once, and had been going around with girls whose friendship the woman did not want her to have. According to Bethel Deater, she and Bessie met two Italian men at a dance hall and asked them to leave town with the girls "for a good time," a request the men declined. A few days later, however, the four met again, stayed together in town for several days, and then took a train to Youngstown, where they all moved into a resort. The girls soon found "more agreeable admirers" and the men were forced to move out of the house. Deater said she soon became tired of "the life" and returned to Canton with a mill worker she met at the resort. When Canton police arrested her for vagrancy shortly after her return, she informed authorities of Bessie's whereabouts. When

23Daily News, August 10, 1913, 1; August 11, 1913, 4; August 12, 1913, 2; Repository, August 10, 1913, 1; August 11, 1913, 1. A month later, Edith May was charged with truancy after she was found in a moving picture show instead of school. She was probably sent to the Fairmount Children's Home in Alliance, Ohio, for rehabilitation. Daily News, September 18, 1913, 1.
arrested in Youngstown, Race claimed she was a nineteen-year-old Clevelander and refused to leave the resort. Later she changed her story and said she had been drugged and forcibly taken to Youngstown. Deater denied her friend's charges, and declared that although she (Deater) did not like brothel life, "with Bessie it's different. She likes to live this way." Race was eventually sent to The Home of the Good Shepherd, a rescue home in Cleveland, where she was expected to mend her ways, but by 1913 she was back in juvenile court in Canton, this time for visiting wine rooms. Her younger sister, Marie, in the meantime, had also been picked up on a similar charge.24

Juvenile Probation Office C. E. Yutzey held the traditional view that moral values in girls were formed at an early age and that little could be done to save an erring girl after the age of

24 The disappearance of and search for Bethel Deater and Bessie Race was "sensational" and both newspapers gave it extensive front page news coverage for several days. Authorities were particularly anxious to locate Deater since almost as soon as the girl left home her mother died, and the coroner could do nothing with the body until the next of kin (in this case, Bethel Deater) could be located. Repository, January 12, 1911, p. 1; January 16, 1911, p. 1; January 25, 1911, 1, 10; January 26, 1911, 1, 4; January 27, 1911, 1; January 28, 1911, 1; News Democrat, January 25, 1911, 1, 4; January 26, 1911, 12; March 21, 1911, 1. The two men involved in the Race-Deater affair were convicted of rape and sent to prison. Repository, May 9, 1911, 4; News Democrat, May 15, 1911, 1, 8. Race's wine room visit is covered in Daily News, May 19, 1913, 10. Marie Race's problems are documented in Repository, October 16, 1912, 6. Sande Packe, one of the men who went to prison over the Race-Deater affair had had earlier trouble in Canton. In 1909, the mill worker and professional musician was accused but later exonerated in the shooting death of a young man who tried to stop a fight between Packe and another man and a group of "Americans" who verbally harassed Packe, chased him down the street, and then beat him because he was Italian. Morning News, June 15, 1909, 1, 2.
sixteen. He told members of the local Crittenden Circle at the First Baptist Church, "Place a boy on his honor and the chances are he will reform. When a girl goes wrong she has little hope. They have a total disregard for anything then." Police Matron Catherine Priest, however, took a sympathetic but stern attitude toward youthful and adult female offenders. Priest saw incorrigibility and prostitution partially the result of parents who could not or would not respond to the needs of adolescent daughters. She frequently visited the homes of girls on the "road to ruin," advised mothers on how to handle their daughters, and offered counseling to troubled girls. One particularly noteworthy case occurred in October, 1912, when Priest arrested fifteen-year-old Maple Cain after she was found loitering in Waterworks Park and picking up men. Cain told Priest that her parents had told her, "get out and hustle, make a living the best way you can." Priest went to Cain's residence as well as another girl's home and found that the story was true. "The blame can all be placed on the parents," Priest told a newspaper reporter. "They are responsible for their daughters' actions.\(^{26}\)

\(^{25}\)Repository, January 13, 1910, 4. Typical of this attitude is a statement by Martha Falconer, superintendent of Sleighton Farms, a women's reformatory in Pennsylvania: "Work with neglected girls and women is always more difficult. It is a sex problem." Martha Falconer, "Industrial Schools for Girls and Women," Journal of Social Hygiene 3 (1912), 330.

\(^{26}\)Repository, April 13, 1913, 2; News Democrat, October 3, 1912, 1; October 4, 1912, 1; October 5, 1912, 1; Repository, June 8, 1913, 1.
Public response to reported juvenile prostitution was conservative. While Canton's lively reform movement was involved in an on-going moral crusade to rid the town of the social evil, and there was genuine concern for the moral welfare of children, very little seems to have been mentioned by religious or political reformers about juvenile prostitution. When the Superintendent of Schools complained in a speech to the YMCA about seeing "little girls" in the streets at night, the WCTU's only response was to ask that the city ring a curfew bell to warn girls and boys under the age of sixteen that they had to be home. With municipal "supervision" of Saxton Street, in fact some of the worst aspects of prostitution, such as cribs and an organized pimp system simply did not exist, and it is safe to assume that by and large an agreement was in force between brothel and saloon keepers and police that underage girls would not be permitted in resorts. Response, then, to juvenile prostitution in Canton during these years suggests that it was not a specific concern among reformers, was not a part of the regular operation of the district, and probably did not not exist except in isolated incidents.

* * * * *

Women entered prostitution for various reasons. While Catherine Priest believed that family problems contributed to the waywardness of women, like many reformers she placed the ultimate blame on low wages. "What about plain downright hunger as a

27Repository, March 20, 1911, 1; March 21, 1911, 1, March 25, 1911, 1.
reason?" she rhetorically answered a question put to her by a reporter from the Repository who asked her the cause of prostitution. The police matron strongly believed that given comfortable surroundings, wholesome food, and good companionship, a decent living wage would be enough to keep nearly all young women out of the clutches of prostitution.28

Although Elizabeth Brown died just after New Year's Day in 1908 and never publicly discussed her life as a prostitute, her background suggests that family poverty and her desire for a better life were the reasons she left home and became a prostitute. Brown's life could, in fact, serve as a case study illustrating the reasons that some young women preferred the fast life over respectability. Brown's father, a German immigrant, was an invalid who suffered from heart and liver trouble from spending his entire working life in Stark County-area coal mines and stone quarries. Brown's mother took in wash to support the family while a fifteen-year-old brother worked in a factory. Another sister was married and lived away from home. The family, which most certainly had seen more prosperous days, lived in a sparsely populated neighborhood on the outskirts of Massillon, about seven miles west of Canton. Two small buildings, battened on the exterior, standing a few feet from one another, served as their home. One of the buildings, the size of small room, acted as the kitchen and dining room, and the other contained sleeping quarters. The buildings sat on a large lot used as a chicken yard. Brown was born and educated

28Repository, April 13, 1913, 2.
in Massillon and as a girl was active in the local Catholic Church. At the age of twenty-one, ten months before her death, she left her family to take a job at the Conrad Hotel, a reputable lodging house in downtown Canton. Apparently soon after her arrival in Canton, Brown began to earn her living as a prostitute, and she sent part of her income home to her parents. She seems to have made good money at the trade, dividing her business among The Cottage, The Tavern, and Parker's Place, where she usually lived. According to a prostitute at Parker's, Brown always carried large sums of money with her and on two occasions was robbed of $60.00 and $100.00 respectively.

Until two months before her death, the Brown family had no idea of how Elizabeth earned her living. At that time, however, Mrs. Brown visited her daughter at Parker's after the girl fell and broke her ankle. Shocked by the surroundings, Mrs. Brown begged her daughter to return home, and even her landlord, William Parker urged the young woman to leave. Elizabeth promised to return home, but did not, although she apparently kept warm feelings toward her family and her past, as suggested by a set of photographs tied in a ribbon, found in her trunk after her death, which included baby pictures and a portrait of her First Communion. Mrs. Brown seems to have been able to forgive her wayward daughter, but Elizabeth could not be so generous with herself—or perhaps was reluctant to give up her lucrative business. Less than a week before her death,
Brown told a Saxton Street acquaintance, "This is the saddest Christmas I ever spent."

A handful of prostitutes did openly discuss the reasons they entered and stayed in the fast life, and nearly all of these reasons were related to the need to earn money. When Harry Schilling visited the Tenderloin in 1912, Bessie, a twenty-two-year-old Russian prostitute, told the mayor that poverty had forced her into prostitution. She said that after she arrived in the United States she lived in Boston for a short time, but came to Canton when she was unable to support herself through legitimate means. "There seemed to be nothing else for me to do but go into a house," she told the mayor. A young Austrian woman, a childhood friend of madam Mary Smith's, told Schilling that upon her arrival in Canton she entered Smith's house because she was not strong enough to perform heavy labor, and her poor command of English prevented her from undertaking shop work. A Saxton Street madam complained to Schilling that lack of money had forced her to stay in Canton after the recent reform crusade. According to the woman, she had kept her house open after the district was plagued by raids a few weeks earlier because she had to pay off a $105.00 fine and then lacked the money to leave town. Bertha, a thirty-year-old prostitute who supported a son in the East, told Schilling that she entered the fast life because "it seemed an easy way to get money." Babe Smith, an eighteen-year-old inmate at Erma Kate's resort on Saxton Street, told Juvenile Court Judge Kritchbaum, upon

29 Repository, January 7, 1908, 1; January 8, 1908, 10.
her release after she was mistakenly arrested as a juvenile, "I'm going back. I need the money. I can earn it that way. I can't any other way—it's all I can do and I need the money." Saxton Street women clearly pictured themselves as workers not fallen women or victims of deviant behavior. The men they attracted, according to the short list of customers who were arrested and had their names printed in the newspapers and were traceable through the City Directory, were all factory workers.

* * * * *

While many prostitutes were isolated in the Tenderloin from family and friends, others, usually madams, were able to maintain a sense of family life. Just over half of the prostitutes and madams who worked in the Tenderloin between 1910 and 1913 were married or had been married and were divorced or widowed. A few had children. Of those madams who lived with their husbands, virtually all were married to men who supported and participated in their wives' brothel business.

Both Trixie Bell and Caroline Studer were married to presumably loyal business partners. In 1906, when Trixie Bell was accused in nearby Wooster of procuring underage women for her resort in Canton, her husband, James, travelled there with her to face the charges of which, as mentioned above, she was acquitted on a technicality. When Caroline Studer was charged in Tuscarawas County that same year on a similar charge, her husband, Joe, although

---

30 Repository, November 12, 1912, 1, 10; Daily News, November 27, 1912, 4; December 10, 1913, 1, 4.
under indictment in Muncie, Indiana on counterfeiting charges, accompanied her to New Philadelphia, Ohio, where the trial was held. She was sentenced to approximately four years in the Ohio Penitentiary, jumped bond, and disappeared from the area. Mrs. Studer was eventually found in New Orleans. After she served three years in prison, the couple resumed their marriage and their hotel business. The Studers had one son, Carl, who as a young man was arrested at least once for contributing to the delinquency of a minor. A daughter, Leona, married Chuckie Burns, a low level racketeer. Little is known of a second daughter, Carrie Stump, except that a man described by a newspaper reporter as her "lover," informed police of Caroline Studer's whereabouts in New Orleans after he argued with the younger woman. She was not included in the wills of either Studer.  

Some husbands took an even more active interest in their wives' businesses than did James Bell and Joe Studer. Tom Martin, a plumber-turned-panderer, was charged with white slavery after he procured a "mentally defective" Akron woman for a brothel operated by his wife, Kitty. Fannie Schmidt's husband, Jacob Stine, may have introduced his wife to prostitution. He operated a brothel in

---

31 Morning News, See footnote 17 this chapter for Studer trial references; Canton Civil Service Commission Minutes, September 26, 1926. Also see various Mellett studies; Repository, June 15, 1910, 18; Morning News, July 16, 1910, 3; Repository, December 4, 1913, 1. Stark County Probate Court, Inventory and Appraisement Record, 44/22 and Stark County Probate Court, Will No. 14383.
Canton around 1906 or 1907 before he was sent to prison for pandering. The couple had one child who died.  

Other partners in crime were Nellie Callahan and Louis Schwinn, a disreputable couple who married in 1908. After the marriage, Callahan continued to run her saloon on East Tuscarawas and in the early part of 1909 was arrested for selling intoxicants in a brothel as well as for operating a house of ill fame. Shortly after her arrest, Callahan's "former lover and bartender" complained to police that Louis Schwinn knocked him down while Nellie kicked him in the face because the couple believed he had reported Callahan's activities to the authorities. A few months later, the Morning News reported the rumor that Callahan, "a woman who was once beautiful and was queen of them all in Youngstown," had previously been married to a prominent man in Youngstown whose family had settled $8,000 on her to divorce him.  

While the Schwinn were the most colorful couple, the most notable pair were Ollie Schnovell (then Ollie Barnes) and her first husband, Andrew T. Weybrecht, son of a wealthy Alliance, Ohio businessman. Their courtship, legal battles with the Weybrecht family, and their eventual marriage in 1902, made headlines in the Canton newspapers (the Alliance News remained as silent as possible) and brought scandal upon a family that until that time  

32U.S. Manuscript Census, 1910; News Democrat, August 8, 1911, 1; August 9, 1911, 2; Repository, August 8, 1911, 4; Daily News, January 22, 1913, 4; Repository, July 27, 1907, 6.  

33Stark County Probate Court, Marriage Application No. 22/104, 1908; Morning News, March 24, 1909, 6; May 7, 1909, 4.
had been identified only with successful business enterprises, military heroism, and the Democratic Party.

Andrew Weybrecht was the third and youngest son of J. T. Weybrecht, a contractor and lumberyard operator, who immigrated to the United States from Alsace in the mid-1850s. By the end of the Civil War, the elder Weybrecht had literally built three-quarters of the structures in Alliance, including Alliance College and most of the town's public buildings. Andrew's oldest brother, Benjamin F. Weybrecht, was a well-known orator, Democratic politician, and former member of the Ohio Legislature. At one time he had been considered as a serious contender for the governorship. Andrew's other brother, and major opponent to his marriage to Ollie Barnes, was Colonel Charles C. Weybrecht, organizer and commander of Company K ("Weybrecht's Bulldogs"), the Third Section of the Eighth Regiment of the Ohio Volunteer Infantry that took Santiago during the Cuban campaign of the Spanish-American War. Later, based on his military record, the Colonel was appointed Adjutant General of the Ohio Militia under the Harmon administration. Colonel Weybrecht's war record, his participation in the defeat of General Taral at Santiago, and his compassionate handling of his troops and refugees during the Cuban Yellow Fever epidemic after the war, made him not only a war hero but a powerful force in the Alliance legal and social community—a role that helped him nearly terminate the romance between his younger brother and Ollie Barnes. 34

34 John Danner, Old Landmarks of Canton and Stark County (Logansport, IN: B. F. Brown, Publishers, 1904), 1055-1057; E. T. Heald, The Stark County Story: The McKinley Era (Canton: Stark
Not much is recorded about Andrew Weybrecht, who was probably viewed by Alliance residents as the black sheep of the family—a perception due at least in part to the attitude taken by the Weybrecht family toward him. According to public record, Andrew served as a Second Lieutenant in Weybrecht's Bulldogs, where he acted as his brother Battalion Adjutant and saw some action, although his exploits never reached the proportion and fame of his brother's. In August, 1898, he contracted malaria, a sickness which Colonel Weybrecht later claimed turned the younger man into "a shadow of his former self," and explained, for the Colonel, Andrew's infatuation with Ollie Barnes.\textsuperscript{35}

While little is recorded of Andrew's public life, even less is known of his private life, except that sometime in 1900 he fell in love with and desperately wanted to marry Ollie Barnes and refused to let his family and their social position and prejudices stand in the way of that love. Ollie, who at the time of her eventual marriage to Andrew claimed to be twenty-six but was nearly thirty,\textsuperscript{36} may have been seen by the Weybrechts as a fortune hunter


\textsuperscript{36}Ollie Barnes was born out-of-wedlock to Alice Frailey in 1872, and her mother did not marry Frank Barnes until the girl was about two years of age. Throughout her life, Ollie subtracted several years off her age, a practice perhaps started by her mother. Stark County Probate Court, Marriage Application No. 2523; Marriage Application, no number, September 24, 1874 (Frailey-Barnes); Ohio Department of Health, Bureau of Vital Statistics,
or merely a working class woman trying to marry into local wealth and society. (Andrew Weybrecht, in fact, was reportedly worth only $100.00, his inheritance being controlled by his widowed mother, who later claimed that because of his malaria, as well as epileptic seizures as a child, her son was incapable of holding a job). There is also the possibility that Ollie Barnes may have already gained an unsavory reputation in Canton, although nothing at this date suggests this. Furthermore, the fact that Ollie's two uncles, John Fraley and Jake Fraley were well-known local gamblers probably did not help the couple win the Weybrecht family blessing. Any one of these factors alone was probably enough to convince the Weybrechts to take steps to separate the couple. Colonel Weybrecht, in fact, became so outraged by his brother's relationship with Barnes that at one point he stopped a carriage in which the pair was riding, demanded that Andrew "throw her out of the buggy," and then threatened to do so himself if Andrew did not comply. In February, 1901, when Andrew Weybrecht and Ollie Barnes attempted to take out a marriage license in Canton, they were kept from doing so when the Colonel called the Probate Court and told the judge that his brother was "dissipated to such a degree that he was not able to take care of his own property." Shortly after that incident, the family took the younger Weybrecht on a "pleasure trip" to several Southern states, claiming that he had asked them to remove him from

Certificate of Death No. 49041. Even this death certificate is difficult to read since the date of birth seems to have been written over. Ollie Schnowell's tombstone in Westlawn Cemetery in Canton lists her year of birth as 1872.
the "baleful influence" of his fiancée. Andrew's daily letters home to Ollie Barnes, however, told a different story. In them, Weybrecht declared this love for her and claimed that the family would not allow him to return to Alliance, that they had deprived him of all funds, and that he had even been reduced to stealing postage stamps with which to mail his letters. When Andrew finally did return to Alliance, he learned that the Colonel had convinced the Probate Court judge that the younger man, despite his war record with Weybrecht's Bulldogs, was an "imbecile and a drunkard, incapable of handling his own affairs," and as a consequence, the Colonel had been made his legal guardian.37

A little more than a week after Colonel Weybrecht became his brother's guardian, Ollie Barnes brought a $10,000 lawsuit against the Colonel, charging him with preventing the fulfillment of the marriage contract between herself and Andrew. At nearly the same time, Andrew Weybrecht filed suit against his brother, claiming that Colonel Weybrecht had taken guardianship action without Andrew's prior knowledge, thus, preventing him from defending himself against the accusations. Colonel Weybrecht countered the charges stating that he had looked after Andrew's interests with "all the tender solicitude that a brother's love could suggest," and even claimed that he had encouraged his younger brother's military career with "a view of bettering his condition." In defending his charge that Andrew was incapable of handling his own

37 *News Democrat*, December 2, 1901, 3; December 6, 1902, 6; December 9, 1902, p. 5.
affairs, the Colonel claimed that although the younger man had been employed by his brother at the family planing mill, nearly all of his wages had "fallen into unworthy hands." The Colonel further stated that Ollie Barnes cared only for the money she received from Andrew, and not for Andrew himself, although "Colonel Weybrecht is not the man to attack her character or do her the slightest injustice." 38

By the time the joint suits reached court in January, 1902, the Weybrecht family had been subjected to such humiliating publicity, which included a public threat from Barnes' attorneys to air some "sensational and racy disclosures even at the expense of their client's reputation," that the family was ready to concede defeat. This decision was aided by a letter written by the Colonel to Andrew Weybrecht, and held by the latter, in which the older man stated that if Andrew wished to marry anyone else, no objection would be offered. Andrew Weybrecht brought several prominent area physicians to testify on his behalf, including Henry Eyman, the highly respected Superintendent of Massillon State Hospital. The family, however, dropped their case before anyone could testify. The younger Weybrecht was restored to his full rights as well as given his horse and carriage from the Cuban campaign as part of his settlement. Ollie Barnes agreed to drop all charges against the Colonel in return for $350.00 to cover her court costs. Two days later, Ollie Barnes and her fiancé were married by a Justice of the

---

38 *News Democrat*, December 2, 1901, 3; *Review*, December 19, 1901, 5.
Peace. On their marriage license, the groom said he was a merchant, the bride claimed to be a housekeeper in Alliance—perhaps in Andrew's home—and for the next few years the couple lived in a small, unluxurious home across town from the Weybrecht mansion in Alliance.  

In May, 1906 Andrew Weybrecht filed for divorce, charging his wife with adultery, and the divorce was granted in March, 1907. Ollie returned to Canton where she opened a cigar store on Cherry Street and operated a saloon located in The City Hotel. In November, 1907 she married John Schnovell. On the marriage application, Ollie claimed to be twenty-eight but was thirty-five. Her new husband said he was a thirty-eight year old divorced German immigrant who made his living as a baker. The couple lived in a Walnut Avenue boarding house that Ollie acquired in 1906. If John Schnovell was a baker before his marriage, he seems to have abandoned his profession and joined his wife's growing business interests in the Tenderloin. About two years later, the couple

39News Democrat, December 6, 1901, 6; January 3, 1902, 2; Stark County Probate Court, Marriage Application 2623; News Democrat, January 4, 1902, 1; Repository, January 4, 1902, 1.

40Stark County Clerk of Courts, Appearance Docket, Case No. 17660, Andrew J. Weybrecht v Ollie Weybrecht. The case folder for the Weybrecht divorce cannot be located in the storage files and no newspaper reports were published, so details of the case are unknown.

41Stark County Probate Court, Marriage Application No. 8552, Although John Schnovel claimed to be a baker by trade, he was probably also a saloon keeper. Toward the end of 1905, a telephone lineman committed suicide in an Eighth Street saloon, and the death was erroneously reported by the press to have taken place at "Schnovell's Saxton Street saloon, across from the Pennsylvania Station;" Repository, November 29, 1905, 1.
adopted a son, Carl Raymond, born in 1909, but by 1911 or 1912, the marriage was over. At about that same time, John Schnovell, probably in the wake of his separation and in the need of money, opened his own saloon on North Cherry Street, a few blocks north of the Tenderloin, while Ollie operated three saloons on South Cherry. The separation was not amicable, since in 1912, as discussed in the preceding chapter, Ollie Schnovell and Alice Barnes placed the younger woman's property in trust with John Fraley to keep it out of the hands of John Schnovell. After 1914, the whereabouts of John Schnovell is unknown, but Ollie Schnovell did not recover her property from Fraley until 1920, after she was safely married to her third husband, John Shertzer.

Ollie Schnovell's marriage to John Shertzer was her final attempt at a "good" marriage. The Shertzer family, while not as wealthy and socially prominent as the Weybrechts, were well-to-do, respectable horse dealers. John Shertzer seems to have kept his hand in the family horse business but occasionally worked for another family-owned operation, the Duell-Shertzer Construction Company. At other times he worked for the County, the Alloy Steel

---

42 In April 1913, John Schnovell was sued by the Stark-Tuscarawas Brewery after he defaulted on a $150.40 bill. Stark County Clerk of Courts, Case No. 23623-B, Stark-Tuscarawas Brewery v John Schnovell.

43 Canton City Directory, 1907-1914; Stark County Recorder, Deed Transfer 541/261 and 696/512. It was during her years with John Schnovell that Ollie Schnovell operated all of the saloons on the east side of the 500 block of Cherry Street and was arrested three times on charges ranging from keeping a house of ill repute to possession of a gumball machine—a device considered under local ordinance as a gambling machine—as well as being publicly connected by the press to disreputable activities in general.
Company, and even sold automobiles. The two may have first met in 1914 after Shertzer, then a county inspector, divorced his first wife and moved into Schnovell's boarding house which seems to have been her actual home and a legitimate residence. The couple married in 1919, when Ollie was close to fifty and apparently seeking retirement from her saloon-keeping duties as well as perhaps seeking some stability for her son. They moved to Twelfth Street, NE., away from the red light area, and Ollie sold her Tenderloin and residential property. The Shertzers remained married for twenty years until John Shertzer died in 1939. Ollie survived her husband by six years and died of cancer of the liver in 1945 at the age of seventy-two.

While Ollie Schnovell lived out her retirement in a presumably stable marriage, her mother's second marriage, mentioned in the previous chapter, was not so successful. After twenty-seven years of widowhood and nearly a lifetime in the Tenderloin, in 1921, at the age of sixty-four, Alice Barnes married Gust Joseph, who was listed in the city directory as a "salesman," but who in fact ran a gambling club and was a friend of Jumbo Crowley. Like her daughter, Barnes seems to have sold all of her Tenderloin and residential property and moved two blocks west of the Shertzers on

44Canton City Directory, 1907-1914; Stark County Clerk of Courts, Case No. 24237, John Shertzer v Ida Shertzer. Shertzer divorced his wife on grounds of willful absence and gross neglect after she for "no cause" moved to Chicago in 1910 and refused to return to Canton.

Twelfth Street, NE. By 1929, however, the couple was separated, and in 1932, Mrs. Joseph was once more using the surname of Barnes although her legal name remained Joseph. In 1933, Alice Barnes died at the Shertzer residence of abdominal cancer.46

* * * * *

Marital discord, violence, and divorce were not uncommon among Tenderloin habitues, especially among casual prostitutes. Several husbands filed divorce petitions against their wives, complaining that the women visited wine rooms and resorts, consorted with disreputable people, committed adultery, used drugs, were habitual drunkards, and were unfit mothers. John Hossler, a contractor, divorced his wife, Rose, after she was found by police in a Cherry Street barbershop with a house painter at 3:00 AM, engaged in "conduct that seemed to warrant arrest." Adam Scherrer divorced his wife, Esther, because she "threatened to shoot him, refused to cook his meals and tend the baby, and went out at night and stayed with other men." Esther counter-sued saying that her husband was a drunkard, had refused to support her and their child, and had committed adultery with prostitute Idella Westwood.47 Another

---

46 Canton City Directory, 1920–1933; Daily News, September 8, 1926, 4; Stark County Probate Court, Inventory and Appraisal Record No. 87/322; Ohio Department of Health, Bureau of Vital Statistics, Certificate of Death No. 12023, March 3, 1933; Repository, March 4, 1933, 9.

47 Repository, February 3, 1912, 1; Stark County Clerk of Courts, Case No. 21994, Adam Scherrer v Esther Scherrer. Mrs. Sherrer, although she filed a countersuit against her husband, did not appear in court (probably because she had just taken a new job at the Shanafelt factory and could not get off work), and Adam Scherrer won the case by default. Their daughter was permanently placed with Mrs. Scherrer's mother, where she was already living,
distraught husband, Homer Haines of Alliance, divorced his wife, claiming that she had committed adultery in Alliance and Canton with both her former husband and saloonist Tal Sullivan. The day Haines filed his petition, his wife was arrested with Sullivan for disorderly conduct and was given a fifteen-day suspended sentence.\footnote{Morning News, June 9, 1910, 4; June 11, 1910, p. 2; September 29, 1910, 3; News Democrat, April 2, 1911, 2, 3; Repository, April 4, 1911, 1.}

While most respectable wives whose husbands sought entertainment in the Tenderloin preferred to suffer in silence rather than risk humiliation in court, a few filed for divorce and did not hesitate to expose their husband's activities or to name a female correspondent. One wife, for example, filed for divorce on the grounds that her husband gambled away his wages and consorted with an immoral woman.\footnote{Morning News, April 21, 1910, 8.} In October, 1912, the most notable case, the Ackerman alimony suit, was filed by Grace Ackerman when her husband, Lawrence, to whom she had only been married two years, left home and moved in with Saxton Street madam Mary Smith. Upon reading a short newspaper article about the suit, a self-styled reformer, impersonating a police officer, visited the Smith resort and threatened to arrest Smith for unlawful co-habitation with Ackerman unless she returned the man to his wife. Suspicious of the "officer," who in fact, was W. W. Stephens, a prominent real estate agent, Smith contacted the police and when Stephens returned and Mr. Scherrer was ordered to pay $2.50 a week child support.
later to see if Ackerman was going to return home to his wife, Stephens was greeted by Chief of Police Jimmy Smith (no relation to Mary Smith), who arrested him for impersonating an officer. Stephens, in turn, threatened to sue the city for false arrest, saying that he never actually told the Smith woman that he was from the police. Stephens also claimed that he was held incommunicado in the city jail for thirty-six hours and was released only after he managed to contact his business partner, reform politician Rhodes Gregory, who also happened to be a member of the Canton Civil Service Commission. Stephens was tried a few days later for impersonating a police officer, but the jury was deadlocked and a second trial never took place. A few months later, the charges against Stephens were dismissed. The true story of the Stephens affair, then, was never revealed, but the entire incident, falling as it did in the midst of the first serious effort by reformers to shut down the Tenderloin, was an unhappy commentary on the state of the city police and administration and greatly contributed to the climate that permitted the closing of the Tenderloin a few weeks later.50

Prostitutes sometimes initiated divorce proceedings or other legal action against their husbands. Hortense Smith, after she publicly accused her husband of forcing her into prostitution, divorced him. Caroline Studer's daughter, Carrie Stump, who lived

50News Democrat, October 12, 1912, 12; October 25, 1912, 1; November 2, 1912, 1; November 3, 1912, 1, 4; Repository, October 25, 1912, 1; November 2, 1912, 1, 4; November 3, 1912, 1, 15; November 4, 1912, p 4; April 23, 1913, 4.
in the family-owned Central Hotel and was certainly familiar with the fast life, although no evidence suggests that she was ever a prostitute, also became involved in her own marital dispute when she had her estranged husband's mistress arrested for living unlawfully with him. 51

* * * * * *

As in the respectable community, family arguments usually did not spill over into public view and were, instead, fought and settled behind closed doors. While newspapers reported a continual stream of police calls and court cases involved in wife and child beating, incest, assault and battery, and domestic quarrels in general in the respectable community, relatively few cases were reported from the Jungle, probably because of the disreputable nature of the district. One notable exception was saloonkeeper Belle Sawdy, who had a long history of marital discord and violence with her husband Ralph Sawdy, a bartender and the stepson of George Hendricks, the original proprietor of The City Hotel. In 1905, Sawdy, described as weighing 225 pounds, was arrested for assault and battery not only against his wife but against a patrolman called to break up a family argument. In February, 1907, Sawdy was again arrested, this time for beating his wife and breaking "a small bone in one of her limbs." Two months later he was back in

51 Canton City Directory, 1912; Repository, April 27, 1906, 16. The mistress, Nina Miller, was divorced June, 1906. Her husband, Walter Miller, charged that she committed adultery with David Stump in the home of her father, and that she also burned his (Miller's) clothing, refused to clean house, and beat the children. Morning News, June 12, 1906, 2.
jail, arrested on a peace warrant sworn out by Belle, after he threatened to beat her and demolish her furniture. Sawdy was released from jail after signing an agreement to "behave himself." Domestic tranquility was short-lived, however, since three days later, Belle Sawdy filed for divorce on grounds that her husband was an alcoholic and threatened to kill her. The suit was dropped, but from 1910 on, Belle Sawdy seems to have lived at various Tenderloin addresses without her husband. 52

Nellie Callahan and Louis Schwinn were not immune to marital disharmony, either. Only a few months after they were arrested for beating Callahan's former bartender, the couple was apprehended behind a house on East Seventh Street engaged in a street brawl, each carrying a revolver. 53

Domestic disturbances in the Tenderloin were not limited to husbands and wives and often included other family members as well as brothel inmates. As in the respectable community, these arguments did not command public attention, although police were called occasionally to settle arguments and arrest the offending party if warranted. Ella Pleasure, for instance, complained to police that her sister, Luna Foster, tossed her through a closed window at the Foster place during a family disagreement, and the Julius sisters (madam Susan Reed, Florence Follis, and Martha

52 Stark County Probate Court, Marriage Application No. 20/114, U. S. Manuscript Census, 1900; Repository, March 13, 1905, 1; February 28, 1907, 6; Morning News, April 13, 1907, 8; October 15, 1907, 8.

Lewis), were arrested after they engaged in fisticuffs at their mother's Sheridan Street home. Ella Arnold and her relatives were not as straightforward in their disputes as were the Julius sisters. In 1910, Arnold claimed that her niece and the girl's husband drugged her while she was ill, robbed her of $500.00 and a diamond ring, and tried to force her to sign a will the couple wrote, making them chief beneficiaries of Arnold's estate.54

As in the traditional family, domestic discord between the substitute family of the brothel—madams and inmates, and among prostitutes themselves—mostly went unrecorded with women simply settling differences among themselves. Sometimes, however, the police and courts were called upon to settle disputes. Madams on friendly terms with police did not hesitate to call in the authorities if inmates became defiant, abusive, or simply difficult. One Saxton Street madam called police when a woman entered her resort, removed her clothing, and refused to leave. "Garbed in little more than a smile," the woman was forcibly removed from the brothel by police. In another case, Jenny Gould and Rachel Smith, inmates at Ella Arnold's resort, argued with the madam one evening and moved to a rival resort, only to get, as a newspaper reporter called it, "immediately soused on Saxton Street spirits." When the two returned to Arnold's house, their former

54 Repository, October 6, 1905, 7; May 18, 1905, 5; News Democrat, December 6, 1910, 4.
employer not only refused to let them in but called police and had them arrested.55

Inmates sometimes stole household goods or clothing from women with whom they worked or from their madams, and employers occasionally prosecuted such cases. Madams, from time to time, however, found themselves in trouble with police after disgruntled inmates complained about unethical practices in the brothel, such as the "company store" plan, mentioned above, in which madams forced prostitutes to purchase unwanted goods and clothing at inflated prices, forcing the women to turn over their earnings to their employers. One notable case occurred in 1913 when two young women from Indiana, arrested for loitering, told police that they wanted to return to their homes but could not because their employer, Rosa Davis, refused to turn over their clothing, purchased from her, to them. "She bought us clothes for which we had no use," one of the women told police, "and made us pay her several times what they cost." The women accused Davis of refusing to give them their clothing until they paid her rent for living in the resort.56

55Repository, January 24, 1910, 4; Morning News, July 30, 1906, 3.

56Mary Addison was charged with stealing a coat worth $15.00 from an inmate at Trixie Bell's, Repository, November 4, 1905, 7. In 1906, Lulu Gordon was mistakenly arrested for stealing $41.00 worth of clothing from her employer, Jennie Lee. Two months later, Florence Douglass was arrested in the same case, but charges were dropped due to lack of evidence. Repository, June 8, 1906, 15; Morning News, August 20, 1906, 2; Daily News, August 18, 1913, 1.
Fist fights, street brawls, and hair-pulling matches in the Tenderloin were occasionally reported and were probably a fairly frequent part of life in the district. Fights were reported only when they happened in public places or got out of hand in the brothel. Nellie Brenner and Mary Hammers spent the night in jail after Hammers made an insulting remarked about the other woman during dinner in a Tenderloin restaurant. The Morning News reported that "hats, rats, and other personal adornments were soon scattered over the street" as the women hurled fists and epithets such as "cat" and "huzzy" at each other. During the nationwide heat wave in July, 1911, Saxton Street resident Irma Lytle was sentenced to thirty days in jail for disturbing the peace after she started a "hand-to-hand and hair pulling conflict with another inmate of Italian extraction." In another case, Diana Reep, complained to police that Pearl Wing struck her. After they investigated the incident, police arrested a madam, and two female "visitors" at the resort as well as Wing. More violent means were sometimes used to settle disputes, although no serious injuries were reported. In one incident, Edna Carl, "a common prostitute" with a long arrest record, accused another prostitute of cutting her face with a broken beer bottle.57

* * * * *

Despite "family" quarrels and disruptions, prostitutes shared common experiences and backgrounds and must have developed

57 Morning News, April 17, 1912, 1; Repository, May 18, 1912, p 4; News Democrat, July 6, 1911, 1; Daily News, November 14, 1913, 13; Morning News, November 27, 1906, 6.
friendships and informal support networks that helped dull the harshness of the district. Unfortunately, no evidence can be found to throw light on relationships that certainly must have developed. The only exception to this are the newspaper reports about the formation of the "dive keepers union," an informal mutual aid or protective association some of the leading Saxton Street madams formed in 1912 to fight the moral crusade, which will be discussed later.

Friendships did not make newspaper headlines, and letters and diaries seem to be non-existent. Ollie Schnovell and Alice Barnes had an obviously close mother-daughter relationship but in personal matters depended upon John Fraley and other family members, not Tenderloin women, for support and assistance. Carl Schnovell, now retired and living in Massillon, has no information about his mother's and grandmother's business or personal relationship. Similarly, Alice Williams, Trixie Bell, and Caroline Studer all seem to have had close ties with husbands or sons and did not seek close relationships outside of the family, particularly with other madams or prostitutes. People who knew Mamie Lee are willing to talk about her but know nothing of her personal life. Instead, Lee is mainly remembered for her involvement in the Don Mellett murder and her reportedly fashionable bordello in the 1920s and 1930s where a young man could always get a drink and spend an evening

---

58 Correspondence from Carl Schnovell and the author, March 9, 1985.
with friends and fast women. Ordinarily working prostitutes seem to have left no record of their experiences.

* * * * * *

Women in Saxton Street shared certain backgrounds, values, and experiences. Most were born in America and many did not have to travel very far to enter the organized fast life, with the majority coming from Ohio and nearby states. Some had been married and were widowed or divorced. Undertrained, and in many cases undereducated, barred from skilled trade by virtue of gender, some claimed to have entered prostitution because it offered them an "easy" way to live, but most admitted that the need for decent money and living conditions for themselves and dependent family members drew them into prostitution.

The economic consequences of abandonment, divorce and widowhood often forced women into prostitution simply so that they could support themselves. Marriage was still an option to be pursued, and represented the fulfillment of a type of female American dream where few economic alternatives were open to women. Marriage, however, did not guarantee respectability. Some madams such as Trixie Bell, Caroline Studer, and Nellie Callahan Schwinn,

---

59 Conversations with Nick Lattavo, Scotty McKinney, and Robert Blocker, 1972-1984. Although Mamie Lee may be remembered for her "fashionable bordello," police testimony taken during her 1922 trial on suspicion charges suggests a less romantic setting. Lee, by her own account and that of police, was arrested in her Savannah Avenue house while canning grapes and peaches in the kitchen. Police attempted to go upstairs to search the house but returned shortly after complaining that they could not climb over the pile of old shoes that blocked the stairwell. Stark County Clerk of Courts, Case No. 37413, City of Canton v Mamie Ehlers.
(despite the violence sometimes connected to her marriage), found a sort of stability in marriage to men who supported and often assisted their wives' occupation and lifestyle. Ollie Schnovell's three marriages may, in fact, illustrate her attempt to create a stable environment and respectable life despite a "sordid" past. On the other hand, married, casual prostitutes apparently rejected that stability and seemed to visit the Tenderloin not particularly for financial gain but for emotional support, attention, and the momentary affection of strangers.

Life in Saxton Street was generally marked by isolation from family and the respectable community. Despite this isolation, a form of extended family life—a community—flourished, full of common experience, friendship, conflict, and as will be seen further in the next chapter, violence and other shared adversities, which bound prostitutes to the brothel and to the confines of Saxton Street.
CHAPTER 5
PRIVATE SCARS AND PUBLIC FACES:
HAZARDS OF THE TRADE

Prostitutes in the Tenderloin were subjected to numerous hardships, some specific to the fast life while others were common to women, especially working class women. Male dominated exploitation and violence were daily threats to the well-being and physical safety of prostitutes. Health problems such as birth control, abortion, venereal disease, and alcohol and drug addiction were enemies faced daily by prostitutes, but suicide, a last resort for some big city prostitutes, was a rare occurrence in Saxton Street.

Suitors, customers, Tenderloin-area merchants and residents, and even male brothel and saloon employees were the most troublesome human factors for women in the Tenderloin, sometimes upsetting the domestic peace of the brothel as well as its business and causing uncomfortable, if not dangerous situations for madams, inmates, and customers. Shopkeeper and part time Tenderloin-area saloonist Rachael Goldstein, for instance, accused her son, Manny, of stealing hair nets, skirts, kimonos, and a fancy purse, for Laura Underwood, an inmate in a Saxton Street brothel, and had the two arrested. Underwood insisted that she had given the younger Goldstein the money to purchase the items and he corroborated her
testimony but admitted that he never turned the money over to his mother. Nevertheless, both were found guilty and sentenced to thirty days in the Workhouse; Goldstein for theft and Underwood for receiving stolen property. Jeanette Russell, who worked for Alice Williams, also suffered at the hands of a suitor. Russell told police that she gave George Wall $500.00 worth of diamonds to take to Cleveland to be cleaned and reset, but when he returned the gems to her, she discovered they were "just glass."  

While some incidents were no more harmful than those listed above, others were violent acts, specific to the disreputable community, and had few comparisons in the "outside" world. These acts marked the extreme vulnerability of prostitutes, especially, but not always, when they were outside of the protection of the brothel. A potentially dangerous situation, for example, occurred when Peter Capsules, angered over Saxton Street prostitute Gertrude Carroll's indifference to his affection, pulled out a revolver and threatened to kill her. Capsules was sent to the Workhouse for thirty days, and Carroll said she would probably leave town when her attacker was released. Other, even more serious, incidents occurred. Arthur Bolton, a bartender at Trixie Bell's, threw an inmate in Bell's dive to the ground and shot her in the hand during an argument. Ida Burke's "lover," Tobe Pullen, was sent to jail after he beat Burke and stole her clothes. After his release from

1 (Canton) News Democrat, August 4, 1911, 1; (Canton) Repository, August 4, 1911, 12; September 24, 1911, 1.

2 News Democrat, July 29, 1911,1; Repository, September 7, 1905, 10.
jail, Pullem returned to Burke's residence where he again beat her, as well as her landlady, and terrorized the household until someone escaped and called the police. Rhetta "Red" Dougherty, was beaten repeatedly by George Tindall, the man with whom she lived. After one incident, a city patrolman said that the room looked "like a slaughterhouse." Tindall, one of the most violent men in the Tenderloin, was later charged in the beating death of a Columbus, Ohio, actor. Dolly Richardson, an inmate at Anna Joseph's resort, was beaten unconscious and had several teeth knocked out after spending an afternoon with friends at the Meyers Lake Biergarten. Another prostitute, Nina Moffett, who killed herself in 1912, was once shot in the neck.

Sometimes prostitutes defended themselves legally or otherwise from obnoxious or aggressive men. Mamie Lee once had a customer arrested for disturbing the peace. Jessie Lawson and Margaret Johns took more desperate action against bartender Arthur Bolton, when he broke into their resort. They shot him.

Women, of course, were not the only victims of male violence in the workplace. Scuffles, fist fights, and occasional shootings frequently marred the peace of most Saxton Street establishments.

---

3Repository, December 29, 1905, 10; (Canton) Morning News, January 2, 1906, 2; January 3, 1906, 2; February 5, 1906, 5.

4Morning News, May 9, 1908, 2; July 25, 1908, 2; December 16, 1909, 1.


6Repository, January 29, 1912, 1.

7Repository, April 12, 1910, 12.
In 1906, the notorious Palm Garden Saloon was shut down after a shoot-out that involved a female employee and two men. Police throughout the district were constantly on the lookout for drunk and disorderly conduct inside and outside saloons.  

Drunk and/or depressed men occasionally chose brothels or Jungle saloons as a setting in which to end their lives. In 1906, for instance, a man suffering from cancer of the stomach, and under the influence of pain killers, attempted to kill himself in Charles Witsch's Saxton Street saloon. The following year another man drank a vial of carbolic acid at The Cottage. A Swiss farmhand living at Susan Reed's house passed his time by shooting his gun in the air and then at passersby, with apparently no reaction from either neighbors or police. Finally he shot himself in the head. The most publicized Tenderloin male suicide was that of Harry Bliss, whose suicide at the Kate Sisters' flat was discussed earlier.

Elizabeth Brown, discussed in the previous chapter, was the only local prostitute murdered in Canton during the early part of the twentieth century. During the first week of January, 1908, Brown was found dead on East Seventh Street, her head lying in a pool of frozen blood and her skull crushed by several hammer blows. Since Brown was known to carry large amounts of cash, and no purse or money were found on her body, the motive seemed to be robbery.

---

8Morning News, July 11, 1906, 1; July 12, 1906, 1.

9Morning News, May 4, 1906, 1; Repository, March 12, 1907, 7; June 16, 1912, p. 1; Ms, p. 128.
Her accused killer, Albert Lukens, was described by some of Brown's friends as her fiancé, although other friends claimed that just before her death, she had vowed never to marry "that man." Lukens, recently released from the Mansfield Reformatory for killing a Cincinnati woman (a murder he always denied) was well-known in the Tenderloin and was the only real suspect the police ever publicly acknowledged, although George Tindall and a companion were held for a short time on "general principle." Lukens was tied to the crime not only because of his romantic involvement with Brown, but because the claw hammer used to kill her belonged to his landlord. While several witnesses claimed to have seen a middle-aged man with Brown on the evening of her murder, as well as a few days earlier in Massillon, others placed Lukens with the woman at The Tavern as late as 5:00 PM that day. The suspect, however, claimed to have spent the evening at the Nickelodeon Theatre with the cook from The Tavern, and the cook, under intensive interrogation, corroborated the story. Lukens even offered the opinion that "the killing was the work of some Negro in the East Seventh Street district."10

Lukens never denied his association with Elizabeth Brown. Although he wore a ring that belonged to her, he told the Stark County coroner that he knew the woman only "like the other fellows." Lukens admitted he donated $1.00 towards a three-foot flower wreath some saloon women sent to the funeral, but he confessed he missed the funeral because he overslept. He did not

---

10 Repository, January 7, 1908, 1; January 8, 1908, 1; January 9, 1908, 1, 6; January 10, 1908, 1, 18; January 11, 1908, 1.
argue with the coroner's statement that the official had seen Lukens at Parker's Place during the initial investigation when police went to the saloon to look through Brown's belongings or that Lukens had identified himself at that time as "Al Brown." Lukens' own mother added to the growing circumstantial evidence when she told police that although her son earned $60.00 a month, on the night of the murder he gave her $20.00 and three days later handed over another $40.00 to her—$60.00 she did not believe was his pay.11

Despite the mounting evidence against him, Lukens steadfastly denied killing Elizabeth Brown but showed no outward sign of remorse at her death. The suspect did not immediately hire an attorney after his arrest, but Jimmy Smith said that the man "knew the way of the law and his nerve is remarkable." Lukens' nerve was so remarkable, in fact, that he refused to show any emotion except "a trembling hand" when Smith, in a sensational move aimed at getting a confession, handed the prisoner the purported skull of Elizabeth Brown, wrapped in a muslin cloth, and asked him to identify it.12

According to newspaper reports, thousands of people lined the streets of downtown Canton to watch Lukens be escorted from the county jail to the courthouse for his preliminary hearing, while hundreds more jammed courthouse hallways to catch a glimpse of the accused brutal killer. While the number may be exaggerated,

---

11Repository, January 19, 1908, 1, 18; January 11, 1908, 1.
12Repository, January 10, 1908. 1, 8.
interest in the case was not. For the first time, except for the 1906 investigation that followed the attempted jail bombing and jailbreak in Columbus engineered by Tip O'Neil on behalf of fellow Canton Gang member, Fred Caster, the workings of Canton's criminal underworld were exposed to public scrutiny. Over twenty witnesses were called to testify at the preliminary hearing, including several friends of Elizabeth Brown's from The Tavern and The Cottage. Under oath, the women admitted to "living a life of impropriety." They also admitted knowing Albert Lukens, but none could place the couple together on the evening of the murder. No one, in fact, actually identified Lukens as the man seen with Elizabeth Brown on the night she died. As soon as the testimony was finished, city officials charged Brown's saloon friends with being inmates in a house of ill fame, fined them $25.00 each, and sent them to the Workhouse for thirty days.\textsuperscript{13}

The day after the hearing the \textit{Morning News}, in a rare editorial, ironically questioned the very existence of Saxton Street:

\begin{quote}
These places are publicly known as hot beds of vice and if there is a scintilla of sincerity in the profession of certain interests in purifying the saloon business, these two slum holes [The Tavern and The Cottage] should be excellent places to begin work. As a matter of fact, there are many who have no more faith that such will be done than they believe that the gambling rooms in the "alley" will continue to remain closed.\textsuperscript{14}
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{13}\textit{Repository}, January 14, 1908, 1, 14; January 18, 1908, 1, 3; \textit{Morning News}, January 18, 1908, 1.

\textsuperscript{14}\textit{Morning News}, January 20, 1908, 4.
As if in response to the editorial, the following day, Jumbo Crowley and Tal Sullivan were charged by Mayor Turnbull with conducting houses of ill fame and given ninety day suspended sentences if they closed down their saloons and left town. Both agreed to shut down their businesses, but neither, having vested interests in the Tenderloin, left town. The arrest of Crowley and Sullivan reportedly shocked Saxton Street society. A reporter for the *Morning News* wrote of the reaction in the district:

> Turnbull's action surprised many since the two places are considered as uncurable blemishes for years. The denizens of Canton's underworld were "aghast" at the move made by authorities as they, too, felt that there was one spot in this section of the state where they could always find a welcome and the closing of the two places sent out of existence resorts that had been known from one end of the country to the other by a certain class of underworld inhabitants.¹⁵

The sensational aspects and municipal reaction to the murder obscured the slim possibility that Albert Lukens did not kill Elizabeth Brown, or if he were guilty, was paid off in some manner to keep quiet about what he knew of the murder and more importantly, of Saxton Street activities. While Lukens' criminal record, his romance with the dead woman, and his accessibility to the murder weapon made him a likely suspect, the Stark County Grand Jury after several months of publicized investigation, refused to indict him on grounds of insufficient evidence. Lukens, however, was not released. Instead, he was spirited away from town and

---

¹⁵Ibid., January 21, 1908, 1, 6.
returned to the Mansfield Reformatory for unspecified parole violations.\textsuperscript{16}

That underworld figures, perhaps with the help of some police officials and with the assistance of Lukens, (guilty or not), covered up certain aspects of the murder in order to keep the "lid" on a full scale investigation of Saxton Street, is a distinct possibility, despite the temporary turmoil and unwanted publicity the murder investigation caused Tenderloin operators. No real investigation of the murder of Elizabeth Brown was made after Lukens was picked up by police, although authorities, because of the brutality of the murder, appeared sincere in their desire to solve the crime. Police, however, never explained a sufficient motive for the murder. Authorities handled the murder as a combination robbery and lovers' quarrel, although no real evidence was presented by police to suggest that Lukens robbed Brown or that the couple had argued intensely enough to provoke murder.

Elizabeth Brown's relationship to the Tenderloin and the men she "dated" was ignored by police and never determined, as if she had led a "normal" life in the respectable community. The middle-aged man Brown reportedly was seen with on at least two occasions was not located and questioned, and no other men came forward to admit that they knew her. While robbery may have occurred, the isolated brutality of the murder seems, from the evidence presented, more of a crime of passion than of robbery. The coroner reported that Brown was probably knocked down by the first hammer blow and may

\textsuperscript{16}Ibid., May 18, 1908, 1, 8; May 19, 1908, 2.
never have known what hit her, and then two more blows went
completely through her skull into her brain, leaving holes the size
of twenty-five cent pieces in her cranium. A large fracture
extended nearly all the way across the base of her skull.
Virtually all street robberies in Canton at the time were done with
a minimum of violence (the victim was usually knocked to the ground
or pockets were picked). Footpads in Canton simply did not beat
and kill people on the streets of Canton—not even prostitutes. 17

Evidence suggests that Albert Lukens probably did murder
Elizabeth Brown. His silence, however, protected Saxton Street
proprietors from a detailed public investigation that could have
possibly linked them to city and police officials, which in turn
could have led at the least to the public disgrace of "respectable"
citizens and to a permanent shutdown of brothels and saloons, and
possible jail terms for the less respectable. If he did not kill
Brown, then Lukens served as a scapegoat for police unable to track
down the real killer. In any event, Lukens' arrest ended a
potentially dangerous investigation of Saxton Street. When he was
returned to the Mansfield Reformatory, the sad life and death of
Elizabeth Brown disappeared from the newspapers and memories of
Cantonians.

* * * * *

Generally more problematic than sporadic male violence inside
and outside of the brothel were the everyday issues of birth

17 Various accounts of street crime reported by the local
press, 1905-1908.
control, child bearing, and venereal disease, since no prostitute could escape the risks of pregnancy and disease. No record of birth control techniques used by prostitutes in Canton is known, but presumably the women used every method available to them (pessaries, condoms and other rubber devices, vaginal sponges, cotton tampons, douches, and the regular use of opiates). Working class prostitutes, especially, however, were limited in the methods they could choose since they could not use the most popular contraceptive practices of the day, coitus interruptus, condoms, and the rhythm method, which would intrude upon customers' wishes and comfort, as well as be economically unfeasible for commercial sex.\textsuperscript{18} Some customers, however, did use condoms, but probably only for prophylactic purposes. In 1913, Walter J. Bolender, the president of Bolender Drugs, a major pharmacy located on the edge of the Tenderloin but which served the entire community, was secretly indicted by the Stark County Grand Jury for "selling an article banned by law" to a private detective. Bolender never denied selling the unnamed item and declared that he sold it to an undercover agent for legitimate purposes, although the article could also be utilized for an unlawful use.\textsuperscript{19}


\textsuperscript{19}Repository, May 13, 1913, 1.
Prostitutes could not make a living while obviously pregnant, and no account of individual births in the Tenderloin is available, although such births certainly took place. While some prostitutes claimed to have children "back East" or living with other family members, "Little Edith" May, Carl Schnovell, and the Studer children were among the few children known to have lived in brothels or to have had mothers engaged in prostitution. (Hortense Smith had two sons besides her "illegitimate" daughter but was not engaged in Tenderloin prostitution). Occasionally, abandoned infants were found in yards, in hedges, or on doorsteps, but in the few cases where mothers were traced, the women were found to be "good girls" and, in some instances, married women, betrayed by unfaithful, fickle suitors or husbands. Only two or three infanticides were reported, and those cases went unsolved.

Little is known about the extent to which abortion was practiced in the Tenderloin, and the Canton Board of Health and the present-day Stark County Medical Society have no records of abortions that may have been reported by local doctors. In the late 1880s, however, a group of local physicians reported that "hundreds of criminal operations" were performed each year among all classes of women, usually for a high fee, a belief which goes along with studies which report that about twenty percent of all pregnancies in the mid 1880s ended in abortion. In 1889, members

---

20 Letter from Nancy L. Adams, Stark County Medical Society to author, September 16, 1982; Letter from Lelia J. Anderson, Canton Department of Health to author, September 22, 1982. In addition, these letters also cover records for venereal disease, which also do not exist.
of the Stark County Medical Society called for and got a special
Grand Jury investigation and some physicians, including prominent
members of the Society, were reported to be "badly scared" by the
findings, although the findings were never made public. The hoped-
for abortion prosecutions were not forthcoming, since under Ohio
law, a woman who had an abortion was particeps criminus (equally
guilty) with her physician, and therefore was unable to testify,
even if she wanted to, against her doctor, without incriminating
herself. The Medical Society hoped to counteract this setback in
halting abortion by expelling offending members but learned that
Society members could be held both individually and collectively
criminally liable for any lawsuit brought by an expelled physician.
To protect themselves, members voted to dissolve the Medical
Society and form a new organization that barred from membership
physicians who performed abortions. Upon the founding of the new
group, the records of the Medical Society disappeared and were
probably destroyed.

---

21 Repository, October 3, 1888, 5; January 8, 1889, 5; January
9, 1889, 4; January 19, 1889, 5; January 22, 1889, 4; January 23,
1889, 5; Stark County News Democrat, October 9, 1888, 1; January 9,
1889, 1; January 24, 1889, p. 1; Carl Degler, At Odds: Women and
the Family in America from the Revolution to the Present, (New
York: Oxford University Press, 1980), 231-232; William Herbert
Page and John Jay Adams, The Annotated General Code of the State of
Ohio, 1910 (Cincinnati: W. H. Anderson, 1912), Section 12412.
Although this law is cited in the 1910 O. G. C, it, in fact,
predates that law by several decades. In the 1910 O. G. C.,
however, the "equally guilty" clause has been amended to permit the
woman to testify against her abortionist without any penalty to
her. O. G. C., 1910, Section 12412-1.

22 Repository, March 6, 1889, 5; E. T. Heald, The Stark County
Story: The Suburban Era, 1917-1950 (Canton: Stark County
Historical Society, 1959), 627.
Abortion, of course, did not disappear. At least two doctors in the early part of the century were sent to prison for performing illegal operations, and at least one home-remedy abortion (the drinking of two ounces of oil of wintergreen) resulted in the death of a "good girl" and the prosecution of her fiancé. Just one abortion in the Tenderloin was reported in the newspaper, and that was mentioned only casually during the 1913 Civil Service Commission hearing of Jimmy Smith. At the hearing, a patrolman told of his investigation of a bizarre suicide attempt by a young man who drank a bottle of carbolic acid after paying a local doctor $35.00 to "treat" a woman. When the officer reported the incident to Smith, the police chief effectively stopped any investigation of the case by saying, "Forget it. I know the doctor."23

***

Venereal disease, more than pregnancy and abortion, was the major occupational hazard of Tenderloin women. As with abortion data, the Canton Health Department did not maintain records on venereal disease or its victims, and little can be found about the magnitude of the problem. The overall plan to regulate prostitution in the Tenderloin included mandated weekly medical examinations of brothel inmates for venereal disease as well as the isolation of women found to be diseased. This policy was quietly maintained (though to what extent is unclear) by the City Physician. No one openly discussed venereal disease except in

23 *Morning News, January 4, 1906, 1; News Democrat, April 12, 1912, 1; Repository, January 22, 1913, 10.*
general, moral, or hygienic terms. Only once, except for a
discussion of medical examinations during Smith's hearing, was the
topic publicly addressed. That was in 1910 when Babe Van Kirk was
released from local custody and sent to Cleveland for medical
treatment when a municipal court judge decided that the woman was
too diseased to be sent to jail.  

* * * * * *

In addition to the obviously sex-related occupational health
hazards found in the Tenderloin, prostitutes were victims of what
Marion Goldman calls "the invisible enemies"—alcohol and
narcotics. Alcohol consumption and the liquor business, as shown
earlier, were an integral part of the commercialized sex system,
and liquor was central to the lives of prostitutes who drank with
customers in saloons and brothels and lived in saloons. Drug usage
and addiction while not as prevalent in the Tenderloin as
alcoholism, and not yet specifically tied to prostitution in
Canton, was a growing problem.

In 1912, 159 saloons, twenty-six of them located in the
Tenderloin, were operating in Canton, bringing in over $39,000 in
tax revenue to the city for the previous year, making the retail
liquor business one of the most lucrative enterprises in the

---

24 See footnote 19 for correspondence to Stark County Medical
Society and Canton Department of Health regarding records of
reported venereal disease; Repository, January 22, 1913, 1, 10; May
25, 1910, 10; Morning News, January 8, 1911, 1. Also see John C.
Burnham, "Medical Inspection of Prostitutes in America in the
Nineteenth Century: The St. Louis Experiment and Its Sequel,"

25 Goldman, Gold Diggers and Silver Miners, 131.
city. Disreputable women were frequently arrested for intoxication, disorderly conduct, disturbing the peace, and other liquor-related misdemeanors, and alcohol was responsible for innumerable barroom brawls and shootings. Madams seem to have avoided personal drinking problems for the most part but were often prosecuted for illegal liquor sales and liquor tax law violations. Between 1905 and 1913, sixty-eight known arrests were made of madams, prostitutes, and disorderly women for alcohol-related offenses in Canton, and some prostitutes had extensive arrest records.27

Clara Bighouse became a joke in the local newspapers for her many arrests and was the first person prosecuted under the city's "common character and pest" ordinance.28 Katie May, who "boasted a large acquaintance in Canton," was arrested several times for intoxication in her own home and was once charged with "beating up" her estranged husband at his own small brothel on the outskirts of town.29 Marie Lewis was arrested at least eight times over an

26 Repository, January 12, 1912, 1. Two-hundred-ninety-seven saloons operated in Stark County with a tax revenue of $147,020.32. In 1909 274 saloons in Stark County brought in a tax revenue of $169,328. 93 of which $35,698.46 went to the city of Canton, Repository, January 19, 1910, 12. Monies collected from saloon taxes were divided 50-50 between individual municipal police funds and general revenue funds.

27 Figures compiled from available arrest accounts between 1905 and 1913.

28 News Democrat, April 10, 1911, 4; Repository, May 22, 1911, 10; News Democrat, August 30, 1911, 1; June 18, 1912, 1; June 29, 1912, 1.

29 Repository, November 13, 1905, 5; Repository, May 1, 1906, 7; February 22, 1907, p. 1; October 26, 1908, 7.
eight-year period for intoxication and related offenses. Setting the record, however, was Edna Carl, arrested four times in 1906 for drunk and disorderly conduct, which included one instance of intoxication and indecent exposure at Meyers Lake. In September of that year, her alleged marriage was postponed when she and her "fiancé" were arrested and jailed for being drunk in a Commerce Street "hovel."

While the newspapers handled these events as humorous diversions from the everyday headlines of wars in the Far East or the latest "bucket shop" scandal, the alcoholism of women in the Tenderloin was a matter of concern for welfare workers. Charles R. Frazer, Officer for the Canton Humane Society for thirty years, recalled numerous cases of child abuse, neglect, and abandonment by prostitutes and alcoholic women living in the slums. One woman, he recalled, often gave her three-year-old a "large dose of paregoric" and left it alone for the night while she went out drinking. In another instance, Frazer told of a young working class father, unable to rear his child alone, who asked the Humane Society to take custody of his two-year-old. According to the man, the child's mother took the baby to neighborhood saloons every night where it slept in chairs while she drank. Catherine Priest, the City Police Matron, claimed that most of the women brought to the

---

30 Repository, August 9, 1905, 6; November 17, 1905, 22; Morning News, April 17, 1906, 3; Repository, April 12, 1910, 1; News Democrat, March 14, 1911; Repository, July 17, 1912, 2.

jail were under the influence of alcohol or drugs and were extremely difficult to handle, especially when they suffered from alcohol or drug withdrawal. "It's no pink tea job being a police matron," Priest declared, in discussing her day-to-day relationship with alcoholic and drug-addicted women.32

While public drunkenness, as well as liquor tax revenue figures were often published in the newspapers, reports of drug usage were practically negligible. As a consequence, very little can be discovered about the prevalence of drugs in Saxton Street, especially since drugs which today are considered "dangerous" and addictive were regularly prescribed (despite some controversy regarding appropriateness) to the general public, as nearly everywhere in the country, by local medical doctors. In Canton, popular drugs like cocaine and morphine, for instance, were available in various forms to the general public through prescription. Those who sought drugs for non-medical purposes could often illegally purchase them over-the-counter in drug stores and even in some saloons with minimal legal penalties for the sale.33 In addition, by the early part of the century, heroin, introduced just a few years earlier as a cough suppressant, was growing in popularity as a euphoric agent and substitute for

32 Repository, September 8, 1912, 5; July 7, 1912, 12.

33 Courtwright, Dark Paradise, 62; O.G.C. 1910, Section 12662 provided for a penalty of not less than ten dollars nor more than fifty for each separate offense of the sale of various poisons including chloral hydrate, cannabis, and opium (not to be confused with smoking opium) by anyone other than a physician, veterinary surgeon or dentist licensed by the State of Ohio. Section 12674 provides a similar penalty for the illegal sale of cocaine and morphine.
cocaine and smoking opium and was available in prescription and patent medicines alike with legal penalties aimed not at those who sold the drug illegally but at those who mislabelled medicines.\textsuperscript{34} Smoking opium (opium especially prepared for smoking and which had no medicinal value), however, was more difficult to locate due to the federal Opium Exclusion Law of 1909 which banned the importation of all opium, other than for medicinal purposes, into the United States.\textsuperscript{35} The "official" scarcity of smoking opium, however, did not stop an investigator for the federal revenue service in Cincinnati in 1912 from finding that numerous women and men in Canton were "hitting the pipe" in four "opium joints" located in rooms either above or in the rear of saloons. The investigator, disregarding the Smoking Opium Exclusion Act of 1909 erroneously believed that federal laws were not being violated by the joints, and since he was only interested in finding out where opium was manufactured for smoking purposes and did not consider it his duty to prosecute persons "for smoking dope", he did not turn

\textsuperscript{34}Dark Paradise, 87, 95, 96. O. C. G. 1910, Section 5784 declared that drug packages must contain the quantity or proportion of various substances, including grain or ethyl alcohol, morphine, opium, cocaine, heroin, and chloral hydrate. There was no law specifically prohibiting the sale of heroin. Heroin began to grow in popularity after the passage of the Smoking Opium Exclusion Act of 1909 which banned the importation of smoking opium. Although smoking opium could still be found on the black market, it was expensive. Cocaine, likewise, was coming under restrictive legislation (though not yet in Ohio). Heroin, then, became a cheap alternative to cocaine and smoking opium.

\textsuperscript{35}Courtwright, Dark Paradise, 78-83.
over this information to federal authorities. Instead, he forwarded the addresses of opium joints to local authorities since state and local laws were probably being broken. While the investigator went to three Chinese laundries and a Japanese restaurant unsuccessfully looking for opium, just one man, Joe Young, the Chinese proprietor of a "chop suey joint" on East Eighth Street, near the Tenderloin, was arrested on drug charges. Young claimed he was guilty of no crime since the smoking opium "outfit" was for his personal use.

36Repository, December 29, 1912, 1, 13; Daily News, December 29, 1912, 2; January 3, 1913, 1; Courtwright, Dark Paradise, p. 83. The Smoking Opium Exclusion Act of 1909, in fact, did make the possession of smoking opium a crime. The law banned all importations of the drug except for medicinal purposes and provided for fines ranging from $50.00 to $5,000 and imprisonment of up to two years for the possession of smoking opium. According to Courtwright, "the mere possession of smoking opium was sufficient to warrant conviction 'unless the defendant shall explain the possession to the satisfaction of the jury' . . . . anyone caught with smoking opium was presumed guilty, because there were theoretically no more legitimate imports in circulation." While "smoking dope" may technically have not been illegal then, the possession of the substance was illegal.

37As to the matter of State laws being violated, Section 12679 of the O. G. C. specifically stated that whoever maintained a place where opium or any of its preparations are sold, given away, or smoked could be fined not more than five hundred dollars or imprisoned in the county jail for not more than three months, or both.

38No disposition of Young's case can be located. Since the possession of opium was a federal offense under the Exclusion Act, his defense that his "outfit" was for his own personal use would, probably, be thrown out of court, since although the investigator said that anyone could manufacture opium with gum opium legally purchased from a druggist, the mere possession of it was generally considered a violation of Federal law. Generally, then, smoking opium in Canton, as elsewhere, would have been considered by authorities as an illegally obtained substance (through the black market) and was therefore illegal.
At about this same time, a recently released convict from the Ohio Penitentiary complained to police that cocaine was available in a Cherry Street saloon. Again, since no record can be found of any investigation or arrests, the matter was apparently over-looked by authorities.39

Nearly a year later, the editor of the Daily News received a letter, sealed in a letterhead envelope from the office of two local attorneys, in which the anonymous correspondent protested that while the city administration was busy closing down houses of ill fame and prosecuting illegal liquor sales cases, they shut their eyes to the drug traffic that flourished in Canton. "There is more cocaine, morphine, and heroin sold and used in the city of Canton to my knowledge than in any other city its size in the United States, and I have been to nearly all of them," the writer stated and then went on:

Young girls will buy this stuff and sit in their rooms and "sniff it" and take "a shot in the arm," and it is not long after the victim starts using this stuff until they are in worse condition, both physically and morally, than liquor could ever bring a man.40

While the accusation that Canton was flooded with drugs may be exaggerated, the letter was written in an intelligent and knowledgeable manner and verified the statement made earlier by the federal revenue investigator that opium manufacturers (and probably other drug merchants) were moving into small towns after they were

39Repository, January 4, 1913, 2.

run out of larger cities.\textsuperscript{41} But more to the point, with Canton's growing reputation as a center of criminal activity, and the propensity of drug usage to flourish in the criminal underworld, drugs most likely were becoming a part of the local criminal subculture as they were in other urban areas.\textsuperscript{42}

Drug trafficking and usage may then have been a little known but growing activity in Saxton Street. Except for the newspaper revelations of the revenue investigator and the anonymous correspondent, only a few instances of drug abuse and addiction were revealed in newspapers. In 1906, Hazel White, eighteen, a visitor to local wine rooms, was committed to Massillon State Hospital for several months after a probate court judge ruled that her mind had been "dethroned" by cocaine and other drugs.\textsuperscript{43} Six years later, Harley Blaine, a bartender at the Courtland Hotel, filed a divorce petition against his wife, Daisy, on the grounds of habitual intoxication, infidelity, and morphine addiction.\textsuperscript{44} That same year, Nina Moffett, a twenty-nine-year-old morphine addict, who lived just outside the Tenderloin, was found dead of a drug overdose.\textsuperscript{45}

\* \* \* \* \*

\textsuperscript{41}Repository, December 29, 1912, 1, 13.

\textsuperscript{42}See entire text of Courtwright, \textit{Dark Paradise} for a study of the links between organized crime and drug usage.

\textsuperscript{43}Repository, January 3, 1906, 3.

\textsuperscript{44}News Democrat, August 5, 1911, 3; Stark County Clerk of Courts, Case No. 21537. The case was later dismissed.

\textsuperscript{45}Repository, January 29, 1913, 1.
Suicide was not unusual among prostitutes ravaged by the fast life. While newspapers throughout the country printed sensationalized accounts of prostitutes' suicides, as suggested earlier, Saxton Street women demonstrated an extremely low rate of suicide and attempted suicide. No deaths by suicide of prostitutes in Canton were reported between 1905 and 1911, and only three suicide attempts by prostitutes are known for that same period. In 1912, however, three prostitutes and one madam killed themselves and one other prostitute attempted to take her life. Almost twenty-nine percent of the female suicides reported for 1911 and 1912 (the figures were released in two-year increments by the Stark County Coroner in January, 1913, so the rate was even higher) or eight percent of all fifty suicides recorded in the county for those two years are thus attributed to prostitutes and make an alarming deviation from the past, when local prostitutes simply did not act out their unhappiness in such a manner.

The Stark County Coroner, F. W. Gavin, in his 1913 report of area suicides for the previous two years, reported that the majority of all suicides were due to broken romances. Newspaper reports, similarly, often mentioned despondency over failed romances and broken engagements and marriages in general as motives for suicide, including the suicides of prostitutes. News reports, while not trivializing these deaths, treated the suicides of prostitutes as if the women led middle class lives and suffered from no more than impulsive but fatal lovesick despondency and were victims of sentimental Victorian novels. No connection was made
between the hardships of the fast life in Saxton Street and suicide. The deaths, especially the suicide "epidemic" of 1912, nonetheless, reflect the observation made by Maimie Pinzer during her depressions that "when the seasons change as they are doing now, I feel the smallness of my life and I get terribly discouraged. For need of many things makes me wonder if, after all, is it worth to struggle as I do?"

A small number of suicide attempts were little more than ploys to gain attention or sympathy and cannot be taken seriously as legitimate attempts at self-destruction despite the pathos underlying the attempt. Rosie McNabb, for instance, in a blatant attempt to gain sympathy over a broken romance, put on her good white dress, pinned a spray of flowers to her breast, sniffed a small bottle of chloroform, and lay down on the sidewalk near the railroad tracks, and "waited for the end." Passersby, disturbed by the sight of the prostrate woman, called police, who removed her to the nearby home of her sister Nora Abel, where McNabb quickly recovered and accused Abel of "interfering with her lover and herself."

More typical of the serious attempts of suicide was the 1907 case of Ray Blackman, a part time working class prostitute at the Central Hotel. Blackman, who according to news reports, was

46Numerous studies conclude that social class and suicide or linked.


48Morning News, June 25, 1910, 1; June 28, 1910, 8.
despondent over her faltering marriage, drank a bottle of carbolic acid while she ate lunch with a friend at Clark's Cafe, a Tenderloin saloon. She was prevented from swallowing the entire contents of the bottle when Henry Paulus, Mayor Turnbull's clerk, who was eating lunch at a nearby table, knocked the vial from her hand. Blackman recovered, but her face was permanently scarred by acid burns.49

Blackman's dose of carbolic acid was not uncommon. Despite public awareness that the chemical caused an extremely painful death, the "carbolic cocktail" was a popular method of suicide, probably because the substance was inexpensive and easily available. The coroner attributed fifteen suicides to carbolic acid and another six to other poisons such as the corrosive sublimate tablets taken in the unsuccessful attempt of Carolyn Keuble in 1912 to take her life.50

Little attention was paid to Keuble's attempted suicide. Similarly, little attention was paid to the probable suicide earlier that year of Hagnan Starwick, a prostitute at Alice William's house.51 The press, however, extensively covered the suicides in January, March, and November, 1912 of Nina Moffett, Eva Rowe, and Anna Stoffer, a leading madam in the Tenderloin.

Nina Moffett, as noted earlier died of a drug overdose in 1912. The Repository reported that the woman had recently attended the

49Repository, August 30, 1907, 14.

50Repository, January 19, 1913, 1; December 12, 1912, 26.

51Repository, January 29, 1912, 1.
Billy Sunday rally at City Auditorium, which seems to have profoundly affected her. Within a few days of seeing the evangelist, Moffett took an overdose of morphine (a large supply of morphine was also found in her room) amid a large collection of picture postcards of Sunday. 52

Eva Rowe was born in Benton, Ohio, in 1887, and while working as a prostitute used her dead mother's name of Keller. Her father, a butcher in Holmesville, southwest of Canton, was separated from Rowe's stepmother and stepsister who lived in Akron. Other family members may have lived in Cleveland. She probably had no close family ties. Rowe lived, worked, and died in Fannie Schmidt's Cherry Street dollar house where she made no more than a subsistence living. The dates of her employment at Schmidt's are unknown. Little is also known of Rowe's personal life in Canton except that she was in love with Warren Duran, a resident of Akron, and the number of letters from Duran found in her room after her death suggests that the couple had carried on their relationship for some time. Rowe became upset with Duran in mid-March when he broke a date with her in order to attend a dance in Akron. Despondent over the incident (which was probably a culmination of problems in the relationship), Rowe became depressed, but not suicidal, according to her friends at Schmidt's resort. On the evening of March 18, however, Rowe began to drink heavily and around 10:00 PM locked herself in her bedroom. A half-hour later, Schmidt heard the woman groan, then fall to the floor. By the time

52 Ibid., 5.
the madam was able to break into the room, Rowe was unconscious.
Schmidt immediately put the woman to bed and called a doctor, who
just before midnight declared Rowe dead from drinking a bottle of
carbolic acid.\textsuperscript{53}

While Eva Rowe was a typical casualty of the fast life, Anna
stoffe was another story. Born Anna Trotter in London, England,
in 1864, Stoffer and her husband Charles, a steelworker, lived at
220 Cherry Street, next to what later became The Tavern. Although
the couple (and later Anna herself) moved somewhat frequently, they
remained in the Tenderloin area. Charles Stoffer died some time
around the turn of the century, and his widow supported herself and
her two daughters, Blanche and Charlotte, by operating saloons on
East Seventh, and later various locations on East Tuscarawas
Street. She was a member of the Trinity Reformed Church, one of
the city's "better" churches," and although no will can be located
to support the claim, Anna Stoffer was believed to be "well-off."
If Stoffer were "well off", however, her daughters did not spend
their inheritance on her funeral. Stoffer is buried on an unmarked
gave in an modest section of Westlawn Cemetery. \textsuperscript{54}

While accounts in the newspapers made Stoffer sound like a
respectable business woman, she did not have a sterling reputation

\textsuperscript{53} \textit{News Democrat}, March 19, 1912, 1; \textit{Repository}, March 19,
1912, 1; \textit{State of Ohio, Bureau of Vital Statistics, Certificate of
Death No. 48242, March 12, 1912.}

\textsuperscript{54} \textit{Canton City Directory}, 1889-1912; \textit{Daily News, November 24,
1912, 1}; \textit{Repository, November 24, 1912, 10}; \textit{Daily News, November
25, 1912, 1}; \textit{State of Ohio, Bureau of Vital Statistics,
Certificate of Death No. 664, November 25, 1913.
to those familiar with Saxton Street society. In 1906, Stoffer was arrested for keeping a house of ill fame and also for Sunday liquor sales, a charge of which she was never convicted only because authorities could not determine if she actually sold liquor on her premises or just opened the door that divided her living quarters from her saloon and was merely drinking with friends. In 1911, Stoffer was assessed $1050.00 under the Winn Law for owning a brothel where liquor was sold. By the end of 1911, however, Stoffer may have simply been the "passive" owner of a saloon where immoral men and women congregated. Stoffer was not arrested in the reform sweep of 1912, nor was she involved in the "prostitutes' union" organized to fight reformers. Her name, nonetheless, did not remain clean, and two months after her death, Stoffer was accused by the mother of teenage prostitute Bessie Race, during the Civil Service Commission hearing of Jimmy Smith, of being on good terms with Smith, of keeping very "young women" at her resort, and of harboring Bessie when she ran away from home two years earlier.55

The severe depression that preceded Stoffer's suicide in November, 1912, if not a product of organic disease, probably was due in part to the massive raids in Saxton Street. The official motive for her suicide, however, was not the reform sweep but a broken romance. According to Blanche Stoffer, her mother had

55Morning News, October 12, 1906, 8; Repository, November 18, 1911, 1, 4; November 27, 1911, 1; News Democrat, November 28, 1911, 10; Stark County Clerk of Courts, Case No. 21819, State of Ohio on relation to LeRoy Dehays v Annie Stoffer; Repository, January 22, 1913, 1, 10; News Democrat, January 22, 1913, 1, 2.
recently been jilted by a married man. After a foiled suicide attempt, a few days earlier, on March 23, Anna Stoffer, left alone for a few minutes, away from the watchful eyes of her daughter and housekeeper, lay down on the floor in her parlor, removed a steak knife she had concealed in her clothing, and slashed her throat so deeply that she nearly severed her head from her body.56

The following year, 1913, was marked by two possibly spurious suicide attempts by Ella Wise, a mentally disturbed woman, who was arrested in March after she stole $9.00 from James Geisinger as the two talked behind a saloon on the corner of Cherry and Buecher Streets. Arrested shortly after the robbery, Wise struck Geisinger in the face as a patrolman escorted the two to the police station for questioning, and Wise was charged not only with theft but with assault. An hour after being locked up, Wise attempted to hang herself in her cell with strips of cloth torn from her undergarments. The make-shift noose broke under her weight, and the turnkey who found her cut her loose and sternly lectured her on the consequences of her act. The following morning, undaunted by threats, Wise set fire to her skirts and was saved only because Catherine Priest, who had just walked into the women's section of the jail, managed to extinguish the flames. When taken to court, Wise begged Judge Quinn to release her because her husband had recently died and she had a small baby who needed her care. When Quinn learned that the baby was in good hands, he found the woman

56 Daily News, November 24, 1912, 1; Repository, November 24, 1912, 10.
guilty of assault against Geisinger. In response, Wise threw herself to the floor "fighting, biting, and clawing . . . with arms and legs whirling like flails." Finally subdued by Jimmy Smith, another police officer, and Catherine Priest, Wise was returned to her cell and ordered to undergo psychiatric testing.57

Laura Wagner, the housekeeper at Ollie Schnovell's Walnut Avenue boarding house, was the only known successful Tenderloin suicide in 1913. The forty-six-year-old divorced woman had worked for Schnovell for two months after coming from the Wayne (Central) Hotel where she had worked as a waitress and chambermaid. While possibly not a prostitute, she had lived in the heart of the fast life of the Tenderloin. Schnovell reported to police that she had gone out shopping and when she returned home at about 4:00 PM, she had been unable to find her housekeeper. Searching the house, she finally discovered Wagner's body lying across a bed, her hand clutching an empty bottle and her mouth burned by carbolic acid. Wagner left no suicide note, but Coroner Gavin believed that she had killed herself over ill health. He told a reporter for the Daily News that Laura Wagner was "just another woman tired of living."58

* * * * *

57Daily News, March 9, 1913, 6; March 10, 1913, 3; March 11, 1913, 2.

"Just another woman tired of living," summed up the attitude of many Saxton Street women, battered physically and emotionally by the fast life. Victims of violence, disease, and depression, most nonetheless, continued their struggle for a better life. If nothing else, the women who lived and worked in the Tenderloin persevered in their struggle against the human and environmental factors that exploited their vulnerability as working class women and as prostitutes. The tragedies in the Tenderloin were "little tragedies"—individual tragedies—of women unable to cope with the roughness of Saxton Street—concealed inside the collective tragedy of women left with few alternatives. While ministers, politicians, women's groups, and the judicial and corrections system, all for their own reasons, attempted to raise prostitutes from the "moral abyss," they offered few realistic alternatives to the fast life, with reform usually meaning little more than covering up unpleasant aspects of city life, ignoring the economic and societal causes of prostitution, and forcing prostitutes to seek their fortunes elsewhere but in the same way—through the selling of their bodies.
CHAPTER 6

A CITY ON TRIAL:

FRIENDS IN HIGH PLACES

As recounted in Chapter One, on November 19, 1912, when Harry Schilling officially became the mayor of Canton, his first act in office was to charge Police Chief Jimmy Smith with corruption in office, incompetency, and public drunkenness and to replace him with Socialist patrolman Ed Lengel.¹ While Smith's dismissal was inevitable under any reform administration, the hearing that took place later to investigate the charges was not typical in that the initial charge of corruption was brought against Smith not by Schilling or the reform movement but by Cherry Street madam and saloonist Fannie Schmidt, a woman who had nothing to gain and everything to lose by exposing Smith's and her own activities to the public. Schmidt's subsequent testimony, as well as the testimony, both for and against Smith, of other prostitutes, businessmen, private citizens, city and police officials and even Smith's own daughter, Helen, painted a picture of the inner workings of Saxton Street that no reform preacher or politician could have accomplished and which ultimately proved stronger than any reform movement.

¹See Appendix F for a complete list of charges against Jimmy Smith and their eventual disposition.
As described in Chapter One, Fannie Schmidt, along with nearly
two dozen other prominent members of Saxton Street society, were
arrested on various vice charges when Reverend E. B. Townsend and
his partner, private detective W. C. Knowlton by-passed ineffective
city police and swore out warrants with the Sheriff's Department
against vice operators. Schmidt was arrested twice in a short
period of time and was fined $100.00 and costs, a high but not
unusual fine. Angry and resentful because of what she felt was a
betrayal of trust between herself and Jimmy Smith, whom she claimed
had promised her immunity from prosecution if she paid protection
money to him, Schmidt went to reformers and told them that the
chief of police, in collaboration with the Turnbull administration,
had been taking bribes from Saxton Street operators. 2

On November 18, the day before Harry Schilling took office and
dismissed Jimmy Smith, Schmidt told Townsend and Knowlton that for
the last five years she had been paying Chief Smith $25.00 every
two or three months for police protection of her Cherry Street
dive. Later that day she told a reporter for the News Democrat, ".
... I have paid him sums of from $15.00 to $25.00 in his private
office at the police station."3

In her testimony before the January, 1913, Canton Civil Service
Commission hearing, which was called to investigate Smith's
activities, Schmidt elaborated on her relationship with Smith,

2 (Canton) News Democrat, November 12, 1912, 1; November 19,
1912, p. 1.

3 (Canton) Repository, November 18, 1912, 1; News Democrat,
November 19, 1912, 1, 2.
saying that she to had begun to pay him protection money in 1908 when she moved her resort from Saxton Street to Cherry Street. Up to that time, she said, Smith had never asked her for money, although he often visited her Saxton Street resort, "having fun" with the girls. After her relocation on Cherry, however, she claimed that Smith came to her and asked for regular payments to enable her to run her business unmolested. She said she made these payments "to get on his good side."

A transcript of the hearing does not survive, and the minutes recorded by the Stark County Commissioners present only a sketchy description of the hearing. Large, detailed reports, however, appeared in both the Daily News and Repository. In these surviving accounts, Schmidt said that when she was short of cash for her payments, she frequently made appointments with Smith to discuss the matter in his office at City Hall. Her appointments were apparently no secret to other police officers. Under cross-examination by one of Smith's attorneys, Luther Day, (son of U. S. Supreme Court Justice William R. Day), Schmidt was asked how many times she paid Smith. "Lots of times," she replied. "I paid him in his private office. People saw me going in . . . . The Captain sometimes. Many times I asked him if the Chief were there." In later testimony, the Captain (Smith's old police adversary Robert Patterson) denied he ever saw Schmidt in the police station and claimed that he had only known her "for the last sixty days."4

4(Canton) Daily News, January 22, 1913, 1; News Democrat, November 19, 1912, 1, 2.
Testimony from several men who frequented Saxton Street verified that Smith was occasionally seen in resorts, which would not have been surprising if the district were under police jurisdiction. Hershal Hall said he was well acquainted with Fannie Schmidt and visited her resort six or seven nights a week, an admission that was met with an outburst of laughter from spectators. He told the commission that he saw the police chief there one time about three years earlier. Abe Rider, a regular customer at Mary Smith's dive, testified that he went to Smith's resort one evening for the purpose of writing a letter for her. The woman told him that Jimmy Smith was there and that she could not write the letter that evening. Rider said he did not know the chief so he could not identify him. Meyer Rider, his brother, backed up the testimony, but said he too did not know Jimmy Smith by sight and could not substantiate the truth of Mary Smith's statement.

Frederick Bowen, a painter and paper hanger, testified that while working at Jennie Connors' place above the Rococo & Strapp Saloon in October or November, 1911, he saw the chief, along with police officers he identified as Detectives Brisbin and Hub Reed, go into the back room followed by a girl with a tray of drinks. He testified he heard Smith say, "She [Connors] needn't go out of town for trouble." Edward Hambach, an electrician working with Bowen, testified that from his perch on his stepladder he saw Chief Smith
pass through the room with two detectives, but he did not know why they were there.5

Other witnesses claimed that Jimmy Smith had refused to help them remove houses of ill fame from their neighborhoods. Real estate agent W. H. "Pete" McCurdy, the Schilling election backer who held the deed to Fannie Schmidt's Cherry Street resort, complained to the commission that he had repeatedly asked Smith to shut down a sporting house operated by Belle Sawdy, which was located next to his home on East South Street, near the Tenderloin. When Smith refused to act, McCurdy said he went to the Driving Park Association, a local horse racing group, and told them he wanted some protection. "I said they couldn't have their races if they didn't protect me," he testified, although he did not explain how he could stop the races. Getting no results from either Smith or the Driving Park group, McCurdy next wrote to Governor Judson Harmon, who in turn, referred him to Stark County Prosector Kritchbaum, who referred him back to Smith. After Kritchbaum talked to Smith, former Sheriff Frank Wilson approached McCurdy and asked him "to let up." "You're the only stumbling block to the races," he said. McCurdy tenaciously replied, "I won't have a sporting house beside my home." In a last attempt at getting some justice, McCurdy filed an affidavit against Sawdy for running a

5Daily News, January 22, 1913, 1, 2; Repository, January 22, 1913, 10.
house of ill repute, but the judge dismissed the complaint. Sawdy eventually moved out of the house in the early part of 1913.6

Jay Lehman reported to the commission that he told Chief Smith about a house of ill repute located near Collins and McGregor Streets (outside the Tenderloin area) early in the summer of the previous year. He claimed that Smith told a detective who was with him at the time of the conversation, "Go see about it." When nothing was done by the following winter, Lehman again complained to Smith and again was told, "I'll tend to it, Sonny, I'll tend to it." When Lehman moved that winter, the house was still operating.7

Max Rudner, a junk dealer on the outskirts of town, had a similar complaint. Rudner told the commission that he reported the existence of houses of ill fame on Cherry Street to Smith, but that no action had been taken. "He said he'd tend to it," Rudner reported, "but he never did and the houses of ill fame accumulated." Rudner then said that he had seen Smith come out of

6Daily News, January 21, 1913, 2; Repository, January 21, 1913, 2. McCurdy, in contacting Governor Harmon, may have intended to ask him to initiate action to remove Chief Smith from office under a series of statutes enacted by the 1902 Ohio Legislature which permitted oversight, censure, and removal from office of elected or appointed municipal officials who would not comply with certain laws. On the other hand, McCurdy may have just been complaining to a "higher court." See Stanley Swart, "Early Efforts at State-Level Law Enforcement: The Failure of Ohio's Supervision of Local Authorities, 1902-1925," Ohio History, 90 (1981), 142.

7Morning News, January 23, 1913, 2; Repository, January 23, 1913, 8.
Trixie Bell's house on Cherry on one occasion and Fannie Schmidt's house on another. 8

One of the most damning testimonies to come out of the hearing was given by Mrs. Aaron Race, mother of runaway Bessie Race. She testified to an incident involving herself and Smith in December, 1911, shortly after her daughter disappeared from home. She told the commission that she called Smith and asked him to look for Bessie. Getting no satisfaction from her telephone conversation, she went to Smith's office and asked him to send an investigator to a resort run by Anna Stoffer where Bessie reportedly had been seen. Race described her experience with Smith:

The chief told me that he did not have an officer that he could send. I told him I did not think he was doing his duty, and he told me he didn't propose to allow any old woman to dictate to him.

Later Smith changed his mind and took Race to three houses. At two there was no response, but at the third house:

We went into a place and the chief chucked the woman who came to the door under the chin. He asked if my girl was there and the woman said she had been there but had gone away.

Race was plainly shocked at what she saw in the sitting room of the resort. She found three girls, one of whom she believed to be no more than sixteen or seventeen, "lounging scantily dressed on couches, and one girl sat on a man's lap with her arms thrown around his neck." No one spoke to her, the woman accompanying her

---

8Daily News, January 22, 1913, 2; Repository, January 22, 1913, 10.
or to Jimmy Smith. Race insisted they search the house, and reported:

We looked in a bedroom and I thought that the bed looked as though there was someone in it with the covers pulled up over their heads. When we left the house I asked the chief if he thought he had done his duty, and he said he did. He asked me what I wanted with my daughter and asked me whether I wanted to start a rooming house with her.

Later when she heard that her daughter was in an Italian place on Madison Street (probably the DeSantis Saloon), she begged police to search for the girl, but Smith refused to help her. City and police officials also testified about the local sanction of vice.

One particularly prominent witness was S. B. Post, the former city physician, who stated that he made weekly medical examinations of inmates in five or six places in Cherry, East Seventh and East Tenth Street while employed by the city. Post said that the purpose of his examinations was to ascertain if any inmates were diseased, and he added that if they were not diseased, he customarily issued them certificates of good health. Although he admitted that Jimmy Smith asked him to make these examinations, he denied making them because of Smith's request. Post and Oscar Abt, another one of Schilling's attorneys held the following vague exchange:

Post: Chief Smith asked me if I would do it and I accepted. I went out once a week . . .

---

Daily News, January 22, 1913, 2; Repository, January 22, 1913, 10.
Abt: [Did you usually go because the women called or the chief sent you?]

Post: I don't remember.

Abt: Was this while you were city physician?

Post: As city physician I never made an examination at the instance of Chief Smith.

and a little later:

Abt: Just to refresh your memory, didn't you testify before the probing commission [set up by Schilling to investigate Smith's activities] that you went at the instance of Chief Smith?

Post: I don't remember.¹⁰

Smith later testified that physicians other than Post made regular medical examinations in the Tenderloin, but he did not give names, nor did anyone come forward with such testimony.

Patrolman James Lindesmith, a six-year veteran of the police department, also gave testimony regarding Smith's role in the maintenance of the Tenderloin.¹¹ Although the police officer testified that he never saw Smith coming out of houses of ill repute, he related one occasion on which he found him "very drunk" at Gig Hahn's Saloon.¹² Lindesmith claimed that during his tenure

---

¹⁰Daily News, January 22, 1913, 1; Repository, January 22, 1913, 1; January 23, 1913, 8, 9; Daily News, January 23, 1913, 2.

¹¹Just a year earlier, Lindesmith had been suspended by Smith after the patrolman was accused of taking $5.00 to release a man he arrested on his beat. Although Smith investigated the case, it was apparently dismissed since Lindesmith remained on the police force. Repository, January 23, 1912, 1.

¹²Jimmy Smith's drinking habits were a major question throughout the hearing. Besides Lindesmith's testimony that he had seen Smith "very drunk" at Gig Hahn's, other witnesses, including
of duty in Saxton Street he knew of twelve to fifteen houses of ill
fame that operated in the area. When asked to name three, he
answered: "Mother Arnold's, Alice Williams', Dutch Mary's, Fannie
Schmidt's, and Trixie Bell's." He agreed with Attorney Abt that
Nellie McCougal Morgan, Laura Porter, and Maude O'Brien also openly
ran joints in the district.

Abt questioned Lindesmith about Sunday liquor sales and then
asked if the patrolman ever received any orders regarding houses of
prostitution. Lindesmith replied he had no orders so he made no
arrests. During cross-examination, Lindesmith admitted to Luther
Day that nothing could have stopped him from making arrests if he
desired to do so. Lindesmith defended his position to both Abt and

police officers and Pete McCurdy, who claimed he "didn't have it
in" for the chief, claimed that Smith was often intoxicated in
public both on and off duty. Three witnesses testified that Smith
"was too far gone to do much" on an all night train ride between
Columbus and Canton. One witness caused an uproar in the hearing
room when he described Smith's condition at that time as "he had a
pretty good slam on . . . he wiggled his old carcass around . . .
."
The most damaging testimony came from Smith's old enemy,
Captain Robert Patterson who testified that he had seen the police
chief actually drunk ten or twelve times on duty and that during the
past two years while Patterson worked the desk at police
headquarters, Smith had been under the influence of alcohol "about
half the time." Patterson related one incident when Smith
stationed various men in "dark places" around the city one night to
stop a robbery that no one else seemed to know anything about.
Patterson refused to comment on another story that had Smith
drinking and going to one of the local cemeteries where he exhumed
a grave. Repository, January 21, 1913, 2; Daily News, January 21,
1913, 2, 10; Repository, January 23, 1913, 7. Later in the
hearing, Smith was recalled to the stand where he told the
commission that twenty years earlier he had taken "the cure for
drink." Several defense witnesses also testified that they had not
seen Smith intoxicated on the occasions he had reportedly been
publicly drunk. Repository, January 24, 1913, 1, 17.
Day by saying, "It was my impression, and the general impression among policemen, that they [houses] be allowed to run."13

John Webber, who served on the police force for four years, backed up Lindesmith's impressions that vice was to be tolerated in the city. Webber told the commission that as long as resorts were quiet he was not to disturb them. In answer to a question about an incident in which Webber and Patrolman Knobbe were reprimanded by Jimmy Smith after they were found in a resort, Webber replied that Smith told him, "Well—the houses were tolerated by the administration" but that Webber and Knobbe had no business being in them.

Abt: Were you ever on the beat which includes the red light district?

Webber: Yes, about four or fives times.

Abt: What orders did you have?

Webber: We had orders to go and look through the houses, and if there was anything wrong to bring them in.

Abt: If they were quiet would you let them alone?

Webber: Yes, sir.

Abt: From whom did you get your orders?

Webber: The chief.

Patrolman Knobbe substantiated the Webber testimony.14

---

13Daily News, January 22, 1913, 1, 2; Repository, January 22, 1913, 1, 10.

14Repository, January 23, 1913, 1, 2.
On January 23, Jimmy Smith took the stand in his own defense. After answering questions about his drinking habits, the police chief entered into a lengthy discussion about the vice segregation policy practiced by the Turnbull administration. Oscar Abt and City Solicitor Blake attempted to stop the testimony on the grounds that Smith, as "chief conservator of the peace" was bound by the laws of the State of Ohio and the City of Canton and not by the orders of the mayor or other city officials and could not, therefore, defend his part in the toleration of prostitution, gambling, and illegal liquor sales in the community. Given permission by the commission to speak, Smith went on to explain his brief and unsuccessful attempt to shut down vice in Saxton Street. "As soon as we sent them out one way they came in from the other direction," he testified. Turnbull finally called the chief into his office to discuss ways of controlling the growing vice menace. "He [Turnbull] believed the proper thing to do would be to segregate the vice district from the rest of the city," Smith said. To that end, Smith devised a plan to separate the vice district

---

15Smith denied the testimony of prosecution witnesses who claimed they had seen him drunk in Gig Hahn's saloon, on a train, and in the police station. He did admit, however that he did drink on the job occasionally. Smith said he got to work anytime between 7:00 and 8:30 in the morning and usually left the police station between 4:30 and 5:00 in the evening. Around 4:00 or 4:30 in the afternoon he said said he'd have a few beers in one of the local downtown saloons and then go home. He usually returned to his office between 6:00 PM and 7:00 PM and stayed until 9:00 PM. Sometimes, if a friend came by the station, the two would go out for another drink or two. Smith also said the he went one or two months at a time without a drink and that he had not touched alcohol since Billy Sunday had come to town a year earlier. Repository, January 23, 1913, 1, 8, 9.
geographically from the rest of the city. His plan was not difficult to implement since the Tenderloin already was isolated from the city by virtue of its commerce and trade. The toleration of Saxton Street as an officially, though not publicly, designated vice district was only the recognition of a long standing custom. When Oscar Abt asked the chief what effect allowing "prostitutes to run the streets" unsupervised would have on the city, Smith responded, "The same effect as now [under the Schilling administration]. They would be holding up every man that came along." This reply met with loud applause and the commissioners had difficulty restoring order.

Smith listed his rules for keeping an orderly disorderly district. "Prior to that time (the segregation plan), there had been holdups and disturbances in the places and we gave them to understand that if anything like that happened we would close them up." he stated. Piano playing was to cease, also. Smith willingly backed up Post's testimony regarding medical examinations in brothels and explained how these examinations were part of an overall system of control. "We also told them that they must be clean . . . . there was to be no disease in any of the houses." he testified. He said that on instructions from City Safety Director T. W. "Tuck" Dunwoodie, he requested Post to make weekly examinations in the houses, and "if any of the girls were found diseased they were taken out." Dunwoodie and Smith, the chief stated, in fact, had been given complete control over policy-making in the Tenderloin after Turnbull's disputed election in 1911. From
that point on, according to Smith, the mayor made only infrequent suggestions on the administration of the vice district and took direct action on red light issues only if a complaint was filed directly with him.

Smith did not deny visiting resorts on a regular basis and claimed that he had probably visited all of them at one time or another. He defended his actions, not unreasonably, by saying that his visits were strictly of a business nature—the same as his frequent visits to saloons. "Sometimes to make inquiries after girls that had been reported missing," he said. "Sometimes I went after other information when I wanted to know who people were and what they were there for." He added that he believed that Detective Ryan visited some, but not all of the houses, on a daily basis. He denied going to Fannie Schmidt's or Jennie Connors' places regularly, but admitted that, although he did not see the Rider brothers at Mary Smith's dive, he might have been there when they claimed they saw him. He also admitted that Fannie Schmidt sometimes came to his office at the police station but only to make inquiries about her husband "who was in some trouble out west." In countering the Bowen/Hambach testimony that he had been seen visiting and drinking at Jennie Connors' place, Smith said that he had indeed been there when the two workmen saw him but for no other reason than to find someone for whom the police were searching. He denied taking a drink at the house or making indecent remarks while there. He added that his personal policy regarding visits to
resorts was always to take at least one police officer with him, although on rare occasions he may have broken his rule.

Smith gave the impression while answering the McCurdy charges that McCurdy's complaints about Belle Sawdy's reported house of ill repute were only part of an ongoing dispute between the two men. Smith said that after McCurdy came to his office and urged him "to pinch the place," he had police investigate the charge and "we couldn't figure out how it was a disorderly house." After McCurdy threatened to hold up the Driving Park races, Smith said he went to the owner of the Sawdy house and bluff ed him into evicting the woman. Smith's opinion that no evidence existed to show that Sawdy was running a resort can be partially refuted (but was not at the hearing) by the local reputation of Belle Sawdy and her estranged husband, Ralph. Smith similarly dismissed the charges made by Max Rudner with, "Max came to me so often with so many complaints about all sorts of things that I can't remember what I did with them."

Smith, echoing the sentiments of proactive police elsewhere, said he told his officers to arrest prostitutes no matter who ran their places if they were not orderly but stressed that his job was not to file affidavits against the houses. He acted on complaints at his own discretion. "It depended upon whether or not the person making the complaint was a reliable person," he claimed. He did not define "reliable person" and Attorney Abt did not pursue that line of questioning.16

---

16Daily News, January 23, 1913, 1, 2; Repository, January 23, 1913, 1, 8, 9.
Smith was recalled to the stand several times, but in between his testimony several witnesses were called to testify to the chief's sobriety, reliability, and fitness for office. Among those called were prominent contractors, businessmen, merchants, and police officers, as well as saloon keepers, street peddlers, and fellow members of the local Knights of Pythias lodge of which Smith was longtime treasurer. Two star witnesses were Arthur Turnbull and former Safety Director Tuck Dunwoodie, who according to Oscar Abt, "came in here and gave each other a little bath."

Turnbull reiterated Smith's statements that early in the mayor's first term of office he determined the futility of keeping prostitutes out of Canton: "... we started a system of cleaning them up. But it didn't work out well. They would always come back if you drove them out." Turnbull let the commission know that the decision to segregate vice in the city was not an easy decision and that the conditions in other cities were thoroughly studied before the Turnbull policy was set:

As we couldn't kill them or drive them into the creek, we came to the conclusion that segregation was the only solution of the problem. We investigated the condition in other cities of the country; and we decided that the only thing we could do would be to confine them to a certain district. And that's the only practical way to handle this problem. You never can drive them out and keep them out successfully.

He also repeated Smith's testimony that in the beginning of 1912 the duty of controlling the Tenderloin was turned over to Safety Director Dunwoodie and Smith. The former mayor stressed that Smith carried out orders pertaining to the arrest of
prostitutes. "He wouldn't have been chief very long," Turnbull stated, "if he had not carried out orders."

Tuck Dunwoodie told a similar story regarding Saxton Street, although he unaccountably set the date of segregation at January 1, 1912, the day he and Smith took over the direct administration of the Tenderloin:

The mayor had been directing the police in connection with this matter for quite a while and he had been unable to get the number of such places decreased and he told me to see what I could do. I talked it over with the chief and told him I thought the best thing to do was to get the places all together, so that we could control them.

Detective Thomas Brisbin took the stand after Dunwoodie and testified that he had been on the police force for seventeen or eighteen years and for the past four years he had seen Chief Smith nearly every day. During that time he had never seen the chief drunk or under the influence of liquor. He did say, however, after being directed to do so by the commission, that he occasionally took a drink with the chief while on duty. He recalled visiting Jennie Connors' place with Smith on the occasion that Bowen and Hambach testified but said they had no drinks at that time.

Patrolman and former city detective Edward Bour testified after Brisbin. He told the commission that Smith had ordered him to arrest Sunday liquor sales violators and gamblers as well as "to keep order in the houses of ill repute." He, too, remembered visiting Jennie Connors' place with Smith but said, "the chief told
her he had been receiving complaints about her place, and she would have to close up and get out of town."  

* * * * *

Probably the biggest sensation of the Smith "affair" was the testimony about the formation of the "dive keepers' union" or protective society, the short-lived effort by Tenderloin women to unite against local reform forces. Cantonians first learned of the union the day after Harry Schilling took office. Fannie Schmidt told reformers that shortly after the October raids, "twenty-five or thirty [women] organized to get on the inside plans of reformers." She claimed that the women met in the F. F. Field & Company Detective Agency located in the Harter Bank Building, and that Fred Field, the owner, promised to get one of his detectives on the payroll of the reform group in order to keep the women posted on what reformers intended to do. She said attorney Fred W. Crankshaw was present at the meeting and drew up the contract. Schmidt claimed that the women were charged an "initiation fee" of $25.00 and dues of $6.25 every week. She seemed to believe, however, that at least part of the fee was going as a bribe to Jimmy Smith. After her second arrest in November, Schmidt said she paid Field and Crankshaw another $20.00 but then decided to go to reformers with her complaints against Smith rather than continue to pay for protection she did not receive.

---

17Daily News, January 24, 1913, 1, 21; Repository, January 24, 1913, 1, 11, 13, 17.
Crankshaw told a reporter for the Repository that he indeed had been present during the organizational meeting of the union and had written the contract, but he denied knowing about the $25.00 initiation fee. He said he knew only of the $6.25 which was to be paid by each member to the Field Agency for services rendered. As for the $20.00 Schmidt paid him a few weeks earlier, he revealed that this was for furnishing a surety company bond of $500.00 when Schmidt was arrested. Record of the bond was on file in the Probate Court office. Later Crankshaw, in his capacity as co-counsel for the defense in Smith's hearing, told the Civil Service Commission that after the raids in late 1911, a group of Tenderloin women came to him and his law partner, J. W. Piero, saying they had been "framed." Crankshaw said that he suggested the women hire a detective to find out who was "perjuring themselves" against them. At that time they hired a man from the Burns Detective Agency in Cleveland. Learning, however, that a local agency [Field] was opening an office and "wishing to patronize a home institution," the women, at Crankshaw's suggestion, turned the case over to Fred Field for $100.00 per week.19

Fred Field, saying he had nothing to hide, agreed with the testimony of Schmidt and Crankshaw. "Our agency was hired by them to investigate and ascertain the names of the detectives in the employ of the anti-vice crusade committee," Field told a Repository

---

18 News Democrat, November 19, 1912, 1, 2; Repository, November 29, 1912, 1, 9; January 25, 1913, 1, 3.  
19 Repository, January 25, 1913, 1, 3.
reporter. Field went on to reveal that Helen C. Smith, a recent graduate of a business course and Jimmy Smith's daughter, was employed by the agency "to look after our banking, sign checks, and the like," because Field had other agencies in Chicago and Pittsburgh and was not always in Canton.  

Reformers Townsend and Knowlton went after Field immediately, filing affidavits in Probate Court that charged the detective with soliciting money from Fannie Schmidt and Trixie Bell, whom Schmidt implicated in the bribery charges. Later, Bell was accused of, but never formally charged with, being a co-conspirator with Smith and Field in the operation of their "extortion operation" to collect "graft" from madams. The reformers claimed that by soliciting protection money from the two women (Bell and Schmidt), Field had encouraged them to continue working in prostitution. Attorney Crankshaw posted bond for Field, who in turn promised to have the anti-vice leaders arrested, although he failed to name the charges he planned to bring against them. Field also denied taking money from Trixie Bell and quoted her as saying that she never gave statements to the reformers in regard to taking money.

That same day, Fannie Schmidt charged Field and his detective Walter J. Bell (no relation to Trixie Bell) with assault after they allegedly "laid hands" on her during an argument that stemmed from Schmidt's testimony to the reform committee. Schmidt, Townsend, and Knowlton claimed that the detectives tried to forcibly get Schmidt to leave town.

---

20Repository, November 20, 1912, 1.
The detectives, however, had a different story, which was never contradicted in court or in the newspapers. Fred Field told a reporter for the Repository that on November 20 he received word from an employee of the Coshocton Distillery that Schmidt had said she was "sick of the whole business" and was leaving town. Field called Crankshaw, who was holding Schmidt's bond, who in turn contacted Sheriff Oberlin who had arrested Schmidt earlier. Oberlin, ready to leave town for a few days, informed Field that he had deputized Field's own detective, Walter J. Bell, and suggested that Bell be sent to Schmidt's dive to take her into custody. When Field and Bell arrived at the house they were met with "profane language" from the woman, who refused to go with them. Just as the argument erupted, a private detective hired by Knowlton arrived, and after a scuffle with Field and Bell he went to the Sheriff's office and was informed that Oberlin had just left the city. Crankshaw and the anti-vice detective discussed the situation and then Bell agreed to take all responsibility for Schmidt. Later, Bell reported to Field that when he checked up on Schmidt after the scuffle, he found Knowlton sitting in the rear of Schmidt's store and later saw him buy three cigars with "a big bill too large for her to change, saying he would pay her "some other time."

A few days later, reformers dropped all complaints against Fred Field, Walter J. Bell, Fannie Schmidt, Trixie Bell, and four other

---

21 Daily News, November 21, 1912, 1; Repository, November 21, 1912, 1, 12; November 22, 1911, 1. By the time of the hearing, Walter J. Bell had abandoned his job as private detective and had become a bartender in Cherry Street.
women recently charged with prostitution, and "turned all future law violations over to the new city administration." The six women agreed to pay the court costs incurred in their arrest and prosecution, and little more was mentioned about the "sporting union" until the Civil Service hearing in January.\textsuperscript{22}

The main purpose of the prosecution's argument against the union was not moral outrage, however, but the more practical attempt to show that Jimmy Smith, Fred Field, and Fred Crankshaw had entered into a conspiracy, under the guise of a protective association, to extort money from prostitutes. Prosecuting attorneys rejected the idea that Tenderloin women had taken the initiative to form their own organization and introduced the idea that the women at the instigation of Trixie Bell, who supposedly worked for Field, had been duped into forming a league to fight reformers for a exorbitant fee. Going a step further, Oscar Abt went on to place the blame for the existence of the Tenderloin solely in the hands of Jimmy Smith, saying that the police chief was responsible to the laws and the people of the community or state and to the city administration for which he worked. Ignoring the testimony of Arthur Turnbull and Tuck Dunwoodie, Abt told the commission, "His [Smith's] policy brought to Canton a new kind of union, a union of prostitutes and harlots."\textsuperscript{23}

\textsuperscript{22}Daily News, December 4, 1912, 1, 4; Repository, December 4, 1912, 1, 4; Daily News, December 12, 1912, 1.

\textsuperscript{23}Repository, January 24, 1913, 17.
Curiously enough, the question of who bombed the Calvary Presbyterian Church never came up in any investigation. The bombing, in fact, was never solved, and the present pastor can find no record of the event in the church archives. An hypothesis, based on what is known of the prostitute's union however, can be presented which suggests that this group—or at least an inner circle—with the knowledge of the rest—was responsible for it.

As stated earlier, Fannie Schmidt testified that twenty-five or thirty women organized the union in the early part of October. She later claimed that Fred Crankshaw collected $6.25 dues each week from fourteen or fifteen madams in addition to the initiation fee of $25.00. Using Schmidt's low figure of fifteen madams, that means that $375.00 was collected in initiation fees and another $93.75 in weekly dues which would have been just about enough to cover Field's $100.00 a week fee. (Crankshaw told the commission that he personally collected $262.00 in dues which he turned over to Field.) The union operated for four or five weeks until Harry Schilling took office, which means that somewhere around total of $375.00 was collected in weekly dues over that period, making a total of $850.00 in the account. As will be seen later, Fred Field's bookkeeper, Helen Smith, testified that the first deposit she made for the agency was $300.00 in cash and a personal check from Field, which might have been the collected initiation fees of

24 Interview with E. David Morgan, Calvary Presbyterian Church, Canton, Ohio, March 24, 1987.

25 Repository, January 25, 1913, 3.
several madams. More likely however, is that the $300.00 could have represented receipts from other clients since Field operated several agencies and seems to have been fairly well-known in the midwest. Fred Crankshaw, moreover, denied any knowledge of the $25.00 initiation fee. Crankshaw may have been lying, of course, but at this point in his soon-to-be checkered legal career, he still represented a large and respectable local clientele, who trusted him as an honest attorney. Possibly then, this $25.00 assessment was made outside of the purview of Field and Crankshaw and was possibly collected by Trixie Bell for the purpose of accelerating the destruction of the reform crusade. Bell and other madams would have had easy access to local underworld figures who would have been more than happy to write threatening Black Hand letters to an interfering preacher not to mention to actually bomb his church. The failure of the bomb blast, however, suggests that whoever arranged it did not contact a reliable go-between like Jumbo Crowley and instead made the arrangements herself. The bombing fiasco and subsequent waste of money may explain the underlying hostile tone toward Trixie Bell that can be read into the testimony of madams whenever the subject of the union was brought up in questions at the hearing.

* * * * *

One of the first prosecution witnesses called before the Civil Service commission was Helen Smith. She brought with her the books of the Field Agency (now operated by W. H. Osborn, one of Field's detectives, since Field had disappeared before the hearing began).
These books inexplicably had not been subpoenaed by the Schilling administration either for the earlier Grand Jury investigation of Smith or for the Civil Service Commission hearing. Oscar Abt attempted to prove Jimmy Smith's connection to Field, and, consequently, the prostitutes' union by showing that Smith placed his daughter in Field's office. Luther Day argued during this line of questioning and throughout the entire proceeding, "It is not a question of connecting Smith and Field. You must connect him with this women's association." Throughout the hearing the chief did not, in fact, ever deny his friendship with Field—he only argued that they were not involved in an extortion conspiracy.

Helen Smith told the commission that her father had introduced her to Fred Field because the detective was looking for a person to keep the books in the office he had recently opened in the Harter Bank Building. The bank account for the agency was put in her name, and the first deposit she made was $300.00, half in cash, and the other half in a check signed by Field. Luther Day objected to Abt's line of questioning, arguing that the prosecutor must first show that a conspiracy existed among Field, the police chief, and Trixie Bell before asking questions regarding the business of the Field Agency. Abt and Solicitor Blake argued that that was just what they were attempting to do. The commission apparently overruled the objection because the questioning continued.

Abt continued to get Helen Smith to say that her father and Field were involved in a business relationship:

**Abt:** How many times was your father there [in the office]?
Smith: He used to drop in every couple of days to see me.

Abt: Were you ever there at night?

Smith: No.

Abt: Did your father and Field talk together in the private office, away from your presence?

Smith: No, sir.

Abt: Where did you get these books?

Smith: I got them from Mr. Osborn. I went to the office and got them.

Abt: You had no interest in the books, did you?

Smith: The only interest I had in them is that they would show that my father was not interested in the agency.

Smith went on to say that she had not been present when the protective organization was allegedly formed in Field's office.

Abt asked if she had any record of money being paid to Field by Laura Porter, Mamie Lee, Jessie Lawson, Nellie McDougal, Trixie Bell, Maude O'Brien, Rose Nagel, Mary Miller, Tena Wise, and Nellie Callahan Schwinn. She answered that she did not, but that she has seen "some women there [at the office] but I didn't know what kind they were."²⁶

Bill collector Oliver Streeby gave perhaps the most bizarre testimony in the prosecution's attempt to link Jimmy Smith to the

²⁶Daily News, January 22, 1913, 1, 2; Repository, January 22, 1913, 1, 10.
"conspiracy" when he told the commission that in November, 1912, he was approached by a deputy sheriff who asked him to "shadow" the chief of police one evening. Streeby, who apparently did not question why he should spy on the chief of police, did as requested and reported that Jimmy Smith and the manager of the Nickelodeon Theatre left Smith's home at 6:45 PM, went to the Nickelodeon for a few minutes, and then walked over to the Harter Bank Building where they took the elevator to the second or third floor. The pair remained in the bank for about an hour, then Walter J. Bell, followed by Smith, left the building.

Even slimmer evidence of conspiracy was offered by Lester Deweese of the News Exchange and Theodore Hiller, manager of the metal furniture department of Berger Manufacturing Company. Both men testified that Jimmy Smith, on separate occasions, introduced Fred Field to them and told them Field was looking for an office desk for the detective agency he planned to open.27

Several madams were called for the prosecution but gave Apt little help in his attempt to connect Jimmy Smith to the prostitutes' union. Although Fannie Schmidt readily testified that she paid bribes to Smith, she did little to elaborate on the formation of the union. She admitted she attended three organizational meetings, two at Field's office at the bank and one at Nellie McDougal's house. She said she went to the meetings because Trixie Bell told her "to go to see Crankshaw at Field's."

27Repository, January 23, 1912, p. 8; Daily News, January 22, 1913, p. 2; Repository, January 22, 1913, p. 10.
She testified that Field and Crankshaw personally collected the $6.25 weekly assessment directly from fourteen or fifteen women but offered no opinion about Smith's alleged connection with the union.

Mary Smith, who just a year earlier had been involved with the chief over the W. W. Stephens false arrest case, admitted that she, too, attended an organizational meeting at Field's office. When asked by Abt to tell who else attended, she answered, "A bunch of women." She declined to name any of these women except for Trixie Bell who "said most about it" [the union]. She made no mention of Jimmy Smith.

Another madam, Nellie Shearer, was called to testify about what happened at the first meeting in Field's office, but the commission ruled that unless proper groundwork were laid that connected Smith directly to the union, the testimony was irrelevant to the case. Oscar Abt took exception to the ruling and made two attempts to read into the record that he was attempting to prove that Field told the women that "they [the Field Agency] had an arrangement whereby they would protect them [the women] in the operation of their houses of prostitution" and that Smith was working with Field in this "arrangement." The commission refused to let Shearer answer Abt as to whether she had been "disturbed" by police after the formation of the union. She, like the others, made no connection between Smith and the union.²⁸

---
²⁸Daily News, January 22, 1913, p. 2; Repository, January 22, 1913, p. 10.
Laura Porter, who for three years operated a brothel in the back of a house on Cherry Street, admitted she attended the meeting, but the commission sustained Luther Day's objection to the question. Abt then read off the names of those he believed were at the meeting: Field, Crankshaw, Trixie Bell, Maude O'Brien, Tenny (Tena) Wise, Nellie Callahan Schwinn, Mary Smith, and Nellie McDougal. Again, like the rest of the women who previously testified, she admitted no relationship between Smith and the union.

Mamie Lee, then a madam on East Eighth Street, was asked to testify, but she did not come to the hearing. She informed the commission instead that she was ill, and when the hearing was transferred to her home, her doctor informed the men that Lee had had eye surgery and had not yet recovered from the anesthetic. Abt insisted that she was an important witness for the prosecution, and her testimony was postponed for a day. Lee, however, never testified.\textsuperscript{29}

Another prostitute, Mayme Franklin, refused to cooperate in any way with the investigation. The \textit{Repository} reported that shortly before the hearing opened, Acting Police Chief Ed Lengel, using the name "Paddy Jones," travelled to Youngstown to try to convince Franklin, who had temporarily left Canton during the shutdown, to return to testify against Smith. Franklin not only refused to

\textsuperscript{29}Daily News, January 23, 1913, p. 2; Repository, January 22, 1913, p. 8.
return to Canton but claimed that she had never seen Smith or any
other member of the police force with prostitutes.\textsuperscript{30}

* * * * * *

While the prosecution paraded hostile prostitutes before the
Civil Serviced Commission, potentially strong witnesses were
unaccountably ignored. Reform leaders E. B Townsend and W. C.
Knowlton, who for years had gathered an enormous amount of
information tying the former city administration to corruption,
were not called to testify before the commission. Moreover,
neither were ten madams who went before the special Grand Jury a
month earlier; nor was Jumbo Crowley; nor was Trixie Bell, who was
accused of working with Smith and Field. According to Fred
Crankshaw, Bell continued to operate her dive saloon throughout the
hearing, unmolested by police.\textsuperscript{31} Oscar Abt, nonetheless, willingly
accepted superficial second-hand and hearsay evidence about Bell
from other witnesses. Toward the end of Abt's interrogation of
Jimmy Smith, the attorney asked the chief if he had ever arrested
Bell, and Smith answered that he was not sure. (Bell, in fact, had
been arrested in 1905 and 1906, although Smith may not have
arrested her personally). Fred Crankshaw, accused by reformers as
a co-conspirator in the organization of the protective society, did
not testify either but acted as co-counsel, with Luther Day, for

\textsuperscript{30}Repository, January 14, 1913, 1.

\textsuperscript{31}Repository, January 25, 1913, p. 1, 3.
the defense and frequently spoke in his own defense during closing arguments.\textsuperscript{32}

Crankshaw, in his closing arguments, stated that some of the women arrested for prostitution in the past year believed that they had been "framed," and he expressed sympathy for all the women pulled into what he called a politically motivated "inquisition" to remove Jimmy Smith, the last vestige of "Turnbullism," from City Hall:

And here we have the spectacle of Abt shaking his fist under the noses of these women, calling them liars, and raising the crucifix in unholy hands and compelling them to swear to tell the truth.\textsuperscript{33}

* * * * * *

After five days of testimony, the commissioners closed the hearing for the weekend to make their decision. The following Wednesday, January 27, they ruled that Harry Schilling had not proven any of the charges against Smith. The commissioners were especially critical of Schilling for firing Smith within the first hour of taking office. "But the evidence does not show," the commissioners wrote, "that Mayor Schilling even instructed H. W. Smith to carry out [the mayor's] policies, dismissed him and we do not feel like dismissing H. W. Smith because he obeyed the orders of his superior officers . . . ." They further criticized the new

\textsuperscript{32}Repository, January 24, 1913, 1; January 23, 1905, 6; January 25, 1913, 1, 3.

\textsuperscript{33}Repository, January 25, 1913, 1, 3.
mayor for bringing the matter before the commission, saying that
the hearing caused "additional and unnecessary expense to the city
and taxpayers and unnecessary disgrace to Smith's family."

Earlier in the week, Schilling made a public promise that even
if Smith were exonerated of all charges, he would not be reinstated
as chief of police. Despite this pledge, the chief returned to
duty later that same afternoon. Schilling explained the reversal
by saying that a recent Ohio Supreme Court decision (City of
Columbus v Carter) mandated the return of a police official to his
post, with back pay, if charges against him were not proven. Smith echoed the sentiments of the commission and told the press
that he would follow any policy ordered by Schilling, including the
suppression of Saxton Street.

The following Monday, however, the Daily News reported that
Smith did not have full control of the police department and that
Schilling had, in fact, ordered the chief so stay out of the
mayor's office and away from the Safety Building. Smith, according
to the article, was told he would hold no power within the police
department, which was now to be run by Safety Director Koehler, a
former Socialist who had been thrown out of the party for his
support of Schilling. Schilling posted an order at police
headquarters that declared that former Acting Police Chief Ed
Lengel would be in charge of the department from 6:00 AM to 6:00
PM. Night duty would be taken over by Robert Patterson. Chief

34City of Columbus v Carter is not indexed in West's Ohio
Digest, and cannot be otherwise located in other digests and reporters.
Smith would work only on "special assignments, which according to an additional statement by Schilling would include, "going out and looking for street walkers," which in effect made Smith little more than a beat patrolman. Smith issued a counter order (Order No. 1) declaring that officers were to take orders only from him. No one seemed in charge of the police, and the next day Smith, Schilling, and Abt met in secret session at City Hall to settle "misunderstandings." Their discussion was unrecorded, but by late afternoon, "so that the interests of the city will not suffer," and the police department would not be further demoralized, Smith was fully reinstated as police chief.35

* * * * *

At the height of the reform drive in November and December, 1912, Schilling announced that approximately two hundred prostitutes had left the city. These figures were certainly inflated, and newspaper reports and interviews with prostitutes who stayed in town suggest that most prostitutes did not leave town at all but, following the usual pattern in times of suppression, ceased working in the Tenderloin and moved into residential areas. Others moved to Akron and Wooster.36 Following Smith's

35Daily News, January 29, 1913, 1, 4; Repository, January 29, 1913, 1, 3, 9; January 23, 1913, 1; Daily News, February 3, 1913, 1, 3; February 4, 1913, 1.

36Repository, November 24, 1912, 21; November 27, 1912, 1, 3; November 28, 1912, 1; January 7, 1913, 1. The Akron Times reported that "Akron officials are taking steps to prevent that city from being what they called a 'dumping ground' for the women who have been driven from the red light district of Canton." Daily News, December 3, 1912, 4.
reinstatement to the police force, a few morals prosecutions took
place, mainly of street walkers unprotected by the brothel system.
A few prostitutes were arrested because of activities not directly
connected with prostitution, such as a shooting at Jessie Lawson's
house on East Tuscarawas. Smith, with the support of the local
WCTU, adopted a short-term policy of ordering his officers to keep
girls under the age of sixteen off the streets at night and out of
wine rooms, while other reformers crusaded against public dances.37

When in April, 1913, a second Court of Appeals ruled that Harry
Schilling had not received a majority of votes in the 1911
election, Turnbull was returned in City Hall and Tuck Dunwoodie was
reinstated as Safety Director. One of Turnbull's first acts was to
order Jimmy Smith to suppress the red light district, which still
operated on a less visible level. The remainder of 1913 stayed
relatively quiet. A few arrests were made in the Jungle for morals
and liquor law violations, and street walkers were occasionally
picked up by police. "Babe" Smith, a young prostitute, made news
when she attempted to leave the fast life and told reporters some
of the inner workings of parlor house life. Toward the end of the
year, the Sheriff's Department staged a gambling raid on Jumbo
Crowley's new Stark Athletic Club, supposedly at the request of a
"sorehead gambler." Turnbull, after an arduous two years in and
out of office, decided to retire from politics, saying, "There's
nothing in politics. It disorganizes all one's business

37Repository, March 12, 1913, 3; April 6, 1913, 12; May 7,
1913, 1. Soon after the anti-wine room crusade began, Bessie Race,
now 16, was charged with visiting Bivenour's Saloon.
connections. You just fool your time away." The following year Jimmy Smith retired after twenty years of police service but not before he endorsed the new course of action proposed by the incoming mayor, Charles Stolberg, to prosecute the owners of houses of prostitution—not the prostitutes themselves.38

** * **

Harry Schilling's attempt to close Saxton Street, rid the police department of Jimmy Smith and "Turnbullism", as well as the subsequent public Civil Service Commission hearing, did little to damage the vice community permanently. Although the testimony at the hearing exposed some highly questionable practices of municipal authorities, the prosecution chose to emphasize the supposed conspiracy of Smith, Fred Field, and Trixie Bell to "extort" protection money from prostitutes. The real issue, why the city permitted the segregated vice district to exist, was not addressed, probably because segregation was still a common method of vice control throughout the country and was considered a reasonable way by which to regulate the social evil. The prosecution, although it

38 Repository, May 2, 1913, 1, 13; Daily News, December 10, 1913, 1, 4; December 12, 1913, 12; December 14, 1913, 4; Repository, November 18, 1913, 1, 10; Daily News, November 19, 1913, 1, 12; Repository, November 19, 1913, 1, 8; November 2, 1913, 20, December 21, 1912, 1. Stolberg, a Progressive, was reportedly backed by Art Turnbull. As soon as he took office the new mayor began a well-publicized campaign against vice by which he hoped to "gradually eliminate" prostitution and disease from Canton. Stolberg, in opposition to Schilling's short warning to women to leave the Tenderloin, announced in the early part of January, 1914 that he did not intend "to place bombs under the immoral houses and blow the girls all over the county". Instead, he said he would give the girls and women in the Tenderloin time "to get legitimate employment here or elsewhere" before he shut down the Jungle. Repository, January 12, 1914, 1, 14.
claimed to have solid evidence against Smith and other city officials, for the most part called witnesses with weak testimony. No one from the reform crusade was asked to testify, nor were witnesses from the recent Grand Jury investigation called. The prosecution, instead, relied upon the testimony of Fannie Schmitt, who felt she had been betrayed by Jimmy Smith; disgruntled police officers; and people who were displeased with the service given by the police department. While Schilling seems to have been sincere in his attempt to shut down Saxton Street and help the women who worked in it, the politicians who took control of his effort were simply interested in getting rid of Turnbullism. While Jimmy Smith and other police and city officials were probably guilty of misdeeds, no evidence was presented to indicate that the city was supported by the proceeds of vice or that large scale payoffs to police were made.

Business in Saxton Street slowed down but did not shut down. Some prostitutes left town, some moved to other parts of the city, but many stayed. Madams "closed up shop" for awhile, but since many had a vested interest in the district, they did not leave. A year later, many were still at their same addresses or as, following the typical movement pattern, were down the street or around the corner. The tradition of Saxton Street was rooted deep and refused to fade away.
CONCLUSION

This study of commercialized prostitution in Canton falls under three historical disciplines: women's history, urban history, and localized history. These disciplines neatly overlap to create a portrait of Progressive era prostitution, which is taken out of its usual large environment and placed into a transitional, small environment in which rapid industrial and urban growth were occurring, but in which individual sexual entrepreneurs and practitioners still had control over their environment. The portrait of Saxton Street that emerges, then, tends in many respects to be opposed to the portrait of prostitution and prostitutes that has been painted by other historians in their attempt to analyze prostitution in larger areas. As a result, the components that make up a Progressive era vice district can be seen as unique to any given community. As women's history, this study expands the knowledge we have of prostitutes and their role in individual communities. Although clearly limited by gender and class, prostitutes managed to control, to a large extent, their working and (in this case) living environment. As urban history, this study illustrates the tension between traditional community values (both the disreputable and reputable) and how they interacted to maintain the Jungle—which itself was clearly a neighborhood community with a set standard of behavior. Finally,
as localized history, it places a national phenomenon
(commercialized prostitution) within a local culture and
environment, while at the same time linking the Saxton Street
experience to the rest of the country.

Canton carried the reputation of "Little Chicago"--a wide open
town until the early 1960s. The roots of this reputation lie in
turn-of-the-century Saxton Street. A considerable amount of
research concerning local politics and its connection to gambling,
liquor traffic, and other disreputable activities is needed,
however, to explain fully how Canton became a Midwestern center for
organized crime and vice as the century continued. Prostitution
was clearly an integral part of this system and was the heart of
the Jungle.

* * * * *

The study of prostitution in Canton, despite the large amount
of newspaper material available, is a difficult task. Since
personal records and accounts by Saxton Street prostitutes
themselves are not available, the researcher is forced to rely upon
secondhand accounts and hearsay evidence of individuals and
institutions which are frequently at odds with prostitution. In
other cases, evidence that is offered by prostitutes (or other vice
interests) is often limited by the prostitutes themselves since
they were skillful in hiding, or at least altering, facts to meet
their own ends. While certain facts, such as place of birth,
domestic relationships, arrest records, or records of reform drives
can be documented, "getting into the heads" of the women of Saxton
Street is not really possible. This does not preclude, however, the development of a realistic reconstruction of Saxton Street life and of the Saxton Street System—a pattern of standards, customs, order, and law—which enabled the district to operate successfully and profitably. Certain skeins of experience do emerge from accounts and public records concerning prostitution during the Turnbull years. They suggest that, although Canton prostitutes shared many of the problems of working class prostitutes in larger metropolitan areas, such as broken families, poverty, disease, depression, and violence, they lived and worked in a vice district where prostitute-workers and madams had a good deal of control over exploitative working conditions. In other words, Canton prostitutes, even in a time of industrial and economic transition for the area, maintained a pre-Progressive era system of operation.

1. The Saxton Street System was basically a balanced managerial system of self-discipline and police oversight, (but with extravagances on both sides), which usually permitted the district to operate with a minimum of legal interference.

After a brief attempt in early 1906 to "clean out the houses," Canton city officials determined that the eradication of prostitution was impossible. Control, however, was not impossible. Municipal authorities drew up a set of guidelines that Tenderloin proprietors were expected to follow, and Saxton Street Society, generally boosted by the knowledge that gratuities to police and public officials would insure the continued existence of the
district and their livelihood, acquiesced to certain standards of behavior.¹

According to Jimmy Smith, police officers, including himself, frequently visited disreputable resorts and saloons on "official business" which ranged from routine police checks to specific inquiries about suspicious persons or runaway girls, like Bessie Race.² Madams, aware that friendly relations with police eased the difficulties of the profession, reportedly cooperated to one degree or another. Gratuities, financial (and probably sexual) to authorities were commonplace, and they permitted Saxton Street to operate in a well-oiled manner.³ Madams clearly trusted police enough to call upon them to remove unruly customers or inmates and to settle other domestic and criminal problems related to their business.⁴

¹(Canton) Morning News, February 29, 1906, 6; (Canton) Repository, March 5, 1906, 11; March 6, 1906, 8; Morning News, March 7, 1907, 7; (Canton) News Democrat, January 23, 1913, Repository, January 23, 1913, 1, 8, 9.

²(Canton) News Democrat, January 23, 1913, 1, 2; Repository, January 23, 1913, 1, 8, 9.

³Practically any vice report issued during the Progressive discusses the problem of municipal graft and corruption which made bribery a way of life in any vice district. Besides vice reports see, "The Problem of Vice and Graft," The Literary Digest 46 (1913)61-62; Walter Reckless, Vice in Chicago (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1933), 83; Ruth Rosen, The Lost Sisterhood: Prostitution in American, 1900-1918 (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1982) 75. Although little is known of the possible sexual gratuities of which Canton police may have been the recipients, Jimmy Smith possibly was entertained in at least one brothel. Daily News, January 22, 1913, 1.

⁴Numerous accounts of madams who called police to quell disturbances at their homes or resorts are found in this manuscript. The list is too long to enumerate in a footnote but
The Saxton Street System, aided by the tradition of female-control in the district, precluded some of the worse aspects of large, metropolitan vice districts. White slavery, forced prostitution, pimps, and cribs were virtually non-existent in Canton. Brothel and saloon keepers were hardly law-abiding citizens, and breaches of the system such as liquor sales to minors, petty theft, diseased women, and loud music must have occurred daily. Graft, of course, guaranteed that these breaches, as long as they were not flagrant, did not spill over into the reputable community, or were not serious criminal offenses, were handled on a one-on-one basis, often in private. Resort proprietors operated within the loose boundary of standards established by custom and police supervision. Their adherence to the standards permitted Saxton Street to remain a vice district within the limits of the law. Naturally, all agreements could be cancelled during municipal elections or anti-vice crusades when vice and its professional practitioners became expendable.

2. *Prostitution was dominated by individual female entrepreneurs and practitioners with the limited involvement of male interests.*

While men (disreputable or otherwise) may have owned some of the actual buildings in which brothels operated, the brothel "business" itself appears to have been female controlled. Alice Barnes, Ollie Schnovell, Ella Arnold, Mamie Lee, and Fannie Schmidt (on a land reasons include domestic arguments between inmates and madams, unruly female and male visitors, abusive customers, petty theft, and domestic arguments between madams and other family members.
contract) owned the houses or hotels in which prostitution occurred. Although Caroline and Joe Studer and Trixie and James Bell co-managed the U.S. Hotel and Stag Hotel respectively, the property itself was held in the names of the women, who appear to have been the actual managers. Furthermore, the Inventory and Appraisal record of the estate of Alice Williams indicates that she owned a saloon in Massillon where prostitution probably took place, although at the time of her death she did not hold land located in the Tenderloin. Jennie Lee may also have owned her own home, since although no property records can be located, she maintained two separate residences for eight years each on Cherry and Saxton Street respectively.\(^5\)

Women who did not "own" their own businesses tended to work in female operated brothels. Independents and street walkers met men in saloons, restaurants, and other public places, and brought them back to rooms that they maintained in Tenderloin hotels, rooming houses, or apartment buildings. Men are seldom mentioned, except as customers, in the workings of Saxton Street.

The Turnbull administration tolerated the Tenderloin as a designated vice district. The administration, however, did not tolerate the existence of cadets and pimps. As noted in Chapter Three, Anna Ward's affidavit of October, 1911, clearly stated that Jimmy Smith did not want any pimps or "fellows who didn't work"

\(^5\)Stark County Recorder, Deed Transfers: 469/309; 513/563; 509/438; 466/543; 541/262; 563/453; Stark County Probate Court, Inventory and Appraisal Records: 37/577; 44/22; Stark County Engineer's Office, miscellaneous notes; Daily News, January 21, 1913, 1, 2; Repository, January 21, 1913, 1, 21.
hanging around houses of ill fame, and in the extensive newspaper
coverage of Tenderloin activities, pimps were seldom mentioned.\textsuperscript{6}
When they were mentioned they were treated as extraordinary
individuals, quite alien to the area. With few exceptions, the men
arrested for pimping represented women outside of the Saxton Street
System—part time prostitutes who lacked the security of the
brothel and the neighborhood network that supported the brothel.\textsuperscript{7}

The influence of men in the Tenderloin, however, cannot be
discounted. The majority of saloons where prostitutes congregated
were owned and operated by men. Saloonists like Dominic Bisciglia,
Charles Brunner, Gig Hahn, and Hyman Bobrof were first and foremost
businessmen who lived in or near the Tenderloin. They permitted
prostitutes to work out of their saloons but usually did not permit
actual sexual commerce to take place on the premises. During
reform sweeps these saloonists, as well as disreputable hotel
keepers, were liable to be arrested for running a house of
assignation or a disorderly saloon, but no saloonist was ever run

\textsuperscript{6}News Democrat, October 31, 1911, 1, 4.

\textsuperscript{7}Repository, January 6, 1911, 1, 18; News Democrat, January
16, 1911, 1; Repository, January 1, 1913, 4; January 2, 1913, 1;
Daily News, December 5, 1912, 3; Repository, December 5, 1912, 1.
James Hammers, John Smith, and John De Luca all worked outside of
social boundaries of Saxton Street. Occasionally other husbands
were accused of white slavery by their wives in less sensational
cases such as that of Anna Shaw and her common-law husband William
Henderson. Henderson was accused of "suggesting" that Shaw earn
her keep through "immoral practices" and Shaw never denied the
accusation. She was given a 30 day suspended sentence and returned
home to Pennsylvania, while Henderson was sentenced to thirty days
in the workhouse. News Democrat, July 7, 1912, 5. Another case
involved Esther Rastino, a former prostitute who moved to Canton
to get away from her husband. News Democrat, August 10, 1912, 1.
out of business on a morals charge. Undoubtedly, these owners received some type of remuneration for their hospitality, but whether they received a cut of the proceeds, sexual favors, or simply enjoyed the increased profits that prostitutes brought to their saloons is not known.

William Parker, Tal Sullivan, and Jumbo Crowley, three of the most influential men in the Tenderloin, did permit prostitution to occur in rooms above Parker's Place, The Cottage, and The Tavern. Housing patterns suggest, however, that after the 1908 murder of Elizabeth Brown who lived at Parker's Place, prostitutes seem to have moved out of saloons and into brothels or private apartments or rooms, although they continued to visit saloons and wine rooms.8

Jumbo Crowley appears to have been a "special friend." It is significant that the Kate sisters, Jennie Connors, and Alice Williams called him for assistance when they were in trouble, and, as the go-between with the Canton police, Crowley was probably frequently called upon for legal and business advice and favors.9 Crowley's direct connection to prostitution, however, is difficult to ascertain. Although as a young Tenderloin bartender he was involved in a limited amount of prostitution, his name, for forty years, was specifically connected to gambling and liquor (a teetotaler, he liked to say) "liquor isn't made to drink; it's made

8Canton City Directory, 1906-1913.

9News Democrat, January 1, 1912, 1; Repository, January 2, 1912, 1, 9; January 3, 1912, 1; Repository, October 29, 1911, 1, 20; News Democrat, October 29, 1911, 1.
to sell)—and not prostitution. As Canton's first "king pin of organized crime", however, he did have an interest in prostitution as far as it related to his other interests. A further investigation into early organized crime in Canton—particularly the rule of Jumbo Crowley—could perhaps reveal deeper male involvement in commercialized prostitution than has so far been discovered. At this time, however, all evidence suggests that men, although they may have played a small crucial role, did not play a major role in the management of prostitution in the Jungle.

3. Prostitutes in Saxton Street developed no lasting friendships or relationships with other prostitutes; they depended instead on family members to assist them in legal and personal matters.

Prostitutes and madams alike do not seem to have maintained loyalty to each other. Housing data between 1906 and 1913 indicates that prostitutes moved frequently within the district and never stayed for more than a year or two in the same location, (madams tended to maintain longer residencies), although some made a regular parlor house circuit. Prostitutes seemed to have made no lasting friendships with other prostitutes, and no names were consistently connected to one another. In her early years, for instance, Namie Lee lived for one year with Grace Craig and another year with Jessie Lawson, but Lee, Craig, and Lawson went their separate ways. Lee became a highly successful madam, while Lawson

---

operated a brothel for a few years, and Craig disappeared from the records.\textsuperscript{11}

Alice Barnes and Ollie Schnovell had a close mother-daughter relationship, but their business dealings were handled by Barnes' brother, John Fraley. The husbands and/or sons of Caroline Studer, Kitty Martin, Nellie Callahan Schwinn, Trixie Bell, and Alice Williams were business partners—not other women. Of the few wills located, none mentioned prostitutes as beneficiaries or executors.\textsuperscript{12} The prostitutes' union is the only indication that a business relationship of any type ever existed between prostitutes—and that was a political expediency.

4. Prostitution was a local activity, practiced for the most part by women with roots in the community.

Prostitution was not "run" by outsiders. Many of the prostitutes who lived in Saxton Street, and a number of madams, were either area natives or had local ties inside and outside of the Jungle. Alice Barnes and Ollie Schnovell both were born in the Canton area, and other madams may have been from Stark County or adjoining counties. Others, like Caroline Studer, Trixie Bell,

\textsuperscript{11}Canton City Directories, 1906-1913.

\textsuperscript{12}Lillian Bell died intestate and the Probate Court named her husband James Bell as the administrator; see Stark County Probate Court, Inventory and Appraiserment Record, 41/145; Ollie Schnovell named Eva Byrman, a relative, as the Executrix of her will; see Stark County Probate Court, Inventory and Appraiserment Record 138/494; Joe Studer handled the estate of his wife, Caroline, see Stark County Probate Court Inventory and Appraiserment Record 44/224. Alice Williams left the bulk of her estate to her son Clyde, who was her business partner in her Massillon saloon; see Stark County Probate Court, Inventory and Appraiserment Record 37/577.
Jennie Connors, Nellie Callahan Schwinn, Mamie Lee, Kitty Martin, and Anna Ward had husbands or other family members in Canton, and these family members served as a link to the larger community. These madams, as mentioned above, held property which also linked them to the community through the benefits and responsibilities of proprietorship. Working prostitutes probably came from nearby areas, and large numbers of prostitutes claimed to have been born in Ohio or nearby states. Elizabeth Brown, for instance, was from nearby Massillon. Catherine Priest's statement that prostitutes in jail did not want their mothers to know what had happened to them suggests that besides this natural desire for anonymity, there was also a strong possibility that parents were near enough to Canton to learn about their daughters' profession.13

The women of Saxton Street had a vested interest in the district through economic, social, and family ties. Although a certain amount of transience among prostitutes is found in any prostitute population, a stable core of women, especially madams, with community ties, was responsible for the consistent and continual operation of Saxton Street.

5. White slavery and forced prostitution were not part of the Saxton Street System.

As discussed above, since the Tenderloin was a controlled vice district, a modicum of standards was maintained in order to insure its continued existence. One of these standards was the lack of

genuine forced prostitution and white slavery in the vice community. While the rate of coerced prostitution nationwide may have been at least seven to ten percent, the rate in Canton appears to have been much lower. When coercion did take place, it seems to have involved women who worked outside of the protection of Saxton Street society.  

True white slaves, of course, are difficult to locate in Canton (or anywhere), since they had no means by which to express their status. A handful of cases—usually involving husbands, common-law husbands, or boyfriends are on record, and police and the courts seem to have responded to such cases with a sense of moral outrage that is absent from their usual attitude of uninvolveg. No proven cases of forced prostitution inside of local brothels have been revealed.  

Although the Crittenden Circle, rescue homes, and even the Schilling administration were available to help women who wanted to leave the life, numerous newspaper accounts describe women who are not interested in improving their lot. Arrest accounts show prostitutes who were arrogant, angry, and often abusive toward  


15See footnote 7 this chapter.  

16When Harry Schilling visited the Tenderloin shortly after he took office, he was met by women who simply refused to leave the life and said they would move to another town before they took legitimate employment. Daily News, November 23, 1912, 1; November 27, 1912, 1; 4.
police and court officials. Furthermore, when prostitutes did complain publicly, they complained about the treatment they received from a specific madam, not about prostitution and the conditions under which they lived and worked. This does not mean that prostitutes were happy with their lives, only that they saw few viable economic and social options. While Anna Joseph believed that no one would hire her if they knew of her past, other women believed prostitution offered an easier life than did factory or domestic work. When eighteen-year-old Babe Smith said that "it [prostitution] is all I can do and I need the money," she was probably speaking for the great majority of under-educated and under-trained prostitutes (except for the mentally retarded) who made a conscious choice to sell their bodies.  

7. Commercialized juvenile prostitution was not a part of the Saxton Street System.

Preachers, the WCU, and other civic-minded groups and individuals liked to decry the sight of "girls running the

---

17 Bessie Race, for instance, clearly did not want anything to do with reformation when she was taken out of her Youngstown resort, and her friend Bethel Deater was quoted as saying, "She likes to live this way." Repository, January 25, 1911, 1, 10; January 26, 1911, 12; One particular case of disinterest involved Pearl Tempest, May Curtiss and Grace Cook, all of whom were arrested as they tried to "catch the attention of a proprietor" to get free drinks. When taken the court the women were loud, boisterous and commented to Judge Quinn when he pronounced a ten day workhouse sentence on them, "Well, ain't he the limit?" News Democrat, January 23, 1911, 1; Repository, January 23, 1911, 1. Ella Wise was probably the most violent detainee. During her court hearing she threw herself on the floor, and bit and clawed at police who tried to subdue her. Daily News, March 9, 1913, 6; March 10, 1913, 3.

18 Daily News, November 27, 1912, 4; December 13, 1913, 1, 4,
streets." The reform crusaders, who so meticulously investigated and reported Tenderloin activities, however, made only scant reference to teenage prostitution, which implies that underage girls were not a part of the Saxton Street System. This does not mean that teenage girls did not visit the Jungle, only that like pimps, they were not a part of it.

Newspaper accounts of underage girls in the Tenderloin suggest that they lived in other neighborhoods and visited saloons and wine rooms, often in groups or with boys their own age or a little older. The girls were not known as prostitutes, but they may have been promiscuous, and they may, of course, have taken money or other gratuities for sexual favors. Young men who became involved with underage wine room loungers were in danger of arrest for "a serious offense." Saloon keepers who catered to the younger crowd were also in danger of arrest for liquor violations, as eight barkeeps learned when they served drinks to Florence Bonsky. Louis Bivenour, a saloonist who did not hesitate to let prostitutes congregate in his saloon, refused to permit underage girls in his establishment and was commended for his stand by the

---


20. News Democrat, August 15, 1911, 1; George Zanibone and Sande Packe spent nearly two years in prison on statutory rape charges for their involvement with Bethel Deater and Bessie Race. Numerous other cases where men resulted in grand jury investigations, indictment and workhouse sentences are found in Repository, August 17, 1911, 1; News Democrat, October 18, 1911, 10; October 20, 1911, 1; October 22, 1911, 1; Daily News, November 14, 1913, 1, 4.
courts. Other teenage prostitutes, such as Maple Cane, did not particularly visit the Jungle and worked elsewhere in the city.21

After the arrest of Caroline Studer prior to Art Turnbull's election, and of Trixie Bell in the early days of Turnbull's term, (both for "luring girls into a life of shame"), little was heard of commercialized teenage prostitution. A handful of underage girls, such as Rea LaVern, Cleo Eyster, and Almo Johnson, were found in Tenderloin brothels, but newspaper reports do not indicate that the girls were actually prostitutes in the resorts. When fourteen-year-old Bessie Race was found in a resort in Youngstown, however, reports clearly stated that both Race and her friend Bethel Deater did work as prostitutes. Whether the under-age girls found in brothels were actually prostitutes, or staying in resorts in some other capacity, then, questionable.22

With the municipal supervision and tolerance of the Tenderloin, commercialized teenage prostitution was most likely "outlawed" by municipal authorities and therefore was not part of the Saxton Street System. Underage prostitution occurred then in isolated incidents and was outside of the purview of Tenderloin and municipal control.

21 Repository, January 11, 1911, 1; Daily News, May 15, ,1913, 1; Repository, May 19, 1913, 10; News Democrat, October 3, 1912, 1.

22 Repository, October 24, 1905, 1; Morning News, January 1, 1906, 3; June 11, 1908, 1; News Democrat, September 26, 1912. 1; Repository, January 25, 1911, 1, 10.
7. Prostitutes, when found guilty of vice charges were usually fined; they were seldom sent to rescue homes, and if sent to jail, the sentences were minimal.

Nearly all of the women arrested for prostitution were given fines, which ranged from $1.00 in the early days of the Turnbull administration to $10.00 to even $100.00, (depending on the seriousness of the offense) in the later years. Some prostitutes, again especially in the early years, were given small fines and suspended jail sentences if they promised either to stop living the fast life or to leave town—promises that were readily made but were not always kept. Furthermore, judges critical of poor city jail and workhouse conditions hesitated to send women to them. This hesitation suggests that beyond the poor conditions, police and the courts to a large extent still viewed prostitutes as fallen women and a nuisance, not as criminals, and that they viewed themselves as law keepers, not reformers.²³

The institutionalized system of women's reformatories, detention homes, rescue homes, night courts, indeterminate sentences, social workers, and female police and guards had little influence on the Canton courts and penal system, as it had in some areas of the country. To be sure, Catherine Priest was hired as police matron, and The Door of Hope and Beth-Shan Home operated to help girls and women who wanted to leave the life. These homes, however, were limited in size and scope, were evangelical in

₂³Figures taken from published reports of arrests in the Tenderloin, 1906-1913. Repository, April 13, 1910, 1; May 25, 1911, 1.
nature, and were often voluntary. Neither home had official standing with the courts. Underage girls arrested for suspected prostitution or promiscuity were usually given into the custody of their parents, who sometimes sent them to the Home of the Good Shepherd in Cleveland or the Florence Crittenden Home in Akron.

Jail sentences were minimal—but even at the height of the 1911-1912 reform crusade, no one was actually sent to jail, and most prostitutes and madams just paid their fines and continued with their business. More than likely if a prostitute went to jail it was for a non-vice offense such as public drunkenness or disorderly conduct. Madams were more likely to go to jail than were ordinary prostitutes, and Caroline Studer was the only madam to be actually sent to prison and not the local jail.

8. Saxton Street was a working class vice district where madams and prostitutes alike were constrained by gender, class, and background.

Saxton Street was located in the poorest section of Canton near industrialized concerns and offices. As a transitional, run-down, ugly neighborhood, the Tenderloin was typical of other vice districts throughout the country. The men whom Saxton Street attracted were working class men from nearby neighborhoods and factories, according to the few newspapers accounts that listed the names of men caught in raids. (More often, however, men's names were not listed, but readers were teased with phrases like "police have promised to reveal the names of prominent men connected with
"a promise that consistently went unfulfilled). Reformers claimed that Alice Williams' house was "the toniest place in town." Although she may have furnished the rooms expensively, no evidence suggests that the inmates who worked for Williams (or any other Saxton Street madam) were remotely qualified with the social graces, experience, and professional standards to work in a genuine upper class brothel. Saxton Street houses may have been the meeting ground for political cronies and the place to cut into municipal graft, but because of the run-down location, the lower class inmates, and the lower class clientele they usually attracted, and the actual smallness of the town itself, Tenderloin parlor houses were not the places where local power brokers and businessmen could meet.24

As mentioned above, the known backgrounds of both Saxton Street prostitutes and madams indicate that they were from working class and lower middle class urban and rural backgrounds, and their status did not appreciably change while in the Tenderloin. Little is known of the wages earned by working prostitutes in Saxton Street except that they were low. Fannie Schmidt's resort was a dollar house, and her rate was probably competitive with neighboring establishments. Some prostitutes were able to combine prostitution with low-paid legitimate work. Although their wages were low, in an area where women's wages in some cases were half

---

that of the recommended minimum wage for women, prostitutes probably lived above a subsistence level.\textsuperscript{25}

Madams by virtue of their experience and entrepreneurial talent, were, of course, better off. Several owned their own saloons and resorts, and even property outside of the Tenderloin. They handled payoffs to police and other city officials and formed the short-lived prostitutes' union. Unlike a contemporary Dayton madam, Lib Hedges, who ran an exclusive bordello for the town's leading male citizens, owned one hundred parcels of land in Dayton, donated $2,000 for the 1913 flood relief, and bought a 16-plot grave for her family and "girls,"—Saxton Street madams did not reap large financial rewards. Some estates, while they could be considered "comfortable" by contemporary standards, were not large —and the bulk was not in readily convertible assets but in land.\textsuperscript{26}

Few if any Saxton Street madams and prostitutes sought life outside of the district. Their experience did not permit them to see much beyond the borders of the Jungle. (Those who did leave went with husbands). Limited by gender, social class, and profession as well as the constraints of their roots in the area and perhaps by inclination, the women of Saxton Street lacked the


\textsuperscript{26}(Dayton) \textit{News and Journal Herald}, September 20, 1986, 26. See footnote 12 this chapter for references to estate holdings.
expertsise to move upward; they therefore, enjoyed only a small amount (if any) of upward mobility.

* * * * *

The 1912 effort to shut down the Tenderloin was the first serious attempt to rid Canton of commercialized vice. While the movement coincided with the efforts of other reform-minded municipalities throughout the country, in the end it did little actually to extirpate prostitution from the community. Unlike municipal governments in some cities, city officials in Canton, with the exception of Harry Schilling, who saw prostitution as only one symptom of a larger economic and social malaise, seem to have paid no more than lip service to the idea that the eradication of vice was their moral or civic duty.

The Turnbull machine was not alone in its habitual disregard of commercial sex. Republican and Independent politicians used the toleration of vice and the subsequent police and political corruption that reportedly followed this scheme as a weapon against the Democratic machine without ever acting upon it, just as the Democrats had done prior to coming to office in 1906. Vice, then, was filed away along with free cigars and tent meetings in the tactical filing cabinet and every two years was pulled out and spit shined six weeks or so before the municipal elections. 27 Opposing politicians, in fact, were silent even during the 1909 Morning News

attack on lax police protection. At no time did they officially align themselves with religious reformers except to endorse general reform statements in an obvious attempt to appropriate reform ideas as their own.

Religious reformers rightly seem to have mistrusted their political counterparts and instead cast themselves as the moral watchdogs of all parties involved in the campaign. They refused to align themselves publicly with either Republican or Independent candidates, and any alliance with the Socialists in 1911 was clearly out of the question. The open letter to Harry Schilling from E. B. Townsend, published the day Schilling was elected, clearly implies hostility toward the new mayor, ostensibly because Schilling and the Socialists had not supported the type of repression that Townsend and DeHays endorsed, but, more than likely, simply because Schilling was a Socialist. Reform leaders, Townsend and DeHays, seem privately to have supported Independent candidate Rhodes Gregory, and Gregory's more than adequate defeat at the hands of the combined strengths of Turnbull and Schilling must have seemed like a unequivocal defeat to reformers and their agenda. Later, Gregory's own dedication to reform must have also been questioned since after Jimmy Smith's dismissal from the police force, the former candidate was able to postpone the Civil Service Commission hearing until he was safely out of office.28

28Repository, November 8, 1911, 6; Canton Civil Service Commission Minutes, November 24, 1912, December 2, 1912, December 12, 1912, January 15, 1913.
While reform was certainly a popular issue on the surface, the lack of real reform support raises the question of just how much Cantonians actually cared. Although they had no real commitment to reform themselves, politicians clearly saw reform as a crucial tool in the breakup of the Democratic machine. Religious reformers, however, had the sincerity and probably the numbers (in their individual congregations) which cut across denominational, political, and economic lines. Their failure, however, to publicly align themselves with a given candidate greatly reduced the chance of a reform victory with enough power behind it to push the radical reform in the community to shut down Saxton Street permanently. When Townsend and DeHays left Canton, the core was cut out of the reform movement. In the hands of less experienced pastors, former gamblers, and private detectives on the payroll of the committee the pastors left behind, the reform ideal so quickly disintegrated that by the time that Jimmy's Smith hearing was held, the movement was virtually silent.

Reform activities, outside of permitting church leaders to expose and condemn openly very real corruption and vice, seem also to have served as a form of popular entertainment, in much the way as did the "soapboxing" of various individuals (including Socialist leader Allen Cook) who gathered Saturday evening crowds to the steps of the courthouse where they preached on a large range of topics to anyone who would stop and listen. While Townsend and DeHays could boast that thousands attended the Union meeting held the Sunday before the election, those thousands (excluding women
who only had the School Board franchise) did not flock to the polls to vote a reform ticket. The Union meeting turnout, and a subsequent meeting in which over 3,000 attended to view a lantern show of purported local bordellos, in fact, seems to have been nothing more than an evening's entertainment. The reporter who covered the event for the News Democrat reported that although school age children were barred from the meeting, many (especially girls of "tender age") managed to sneak in and smirk and giggle their way through the presentation. Even worse were the men who shouted out names and addresses of brothel and saloon proprietors during the lantern show, which was intended to educate the audience.29

Mainstream politicians and reformers either lacked the genuine interest or the strength to introduce reform. Harry Schilling, as mayor, then, was the only person of power, albeit small, to dismantle Saxton Street. Unfortunately, Schilling was an idealist—an outsider expelled from his own party and unwilling to join another. Although he had the partial support of the power structure, (the industrialists who financed his appeal) he seemed to be unaware that he was of use to them only as long as he could prevail against the dreaded "Turnbullism" which seemed to have more to do with party power than with commercialized vice. (Schilling's term of office actually served as a foot-in-the-door for Republican party politicians and functionaries who "helped" the mayor when he

29News Democrat, October 28, 1911, 1; Telephone interview with William Summitt, Canton, Ohio, April 2, 1978; News Democrat, November 10, 1911, 1, 8.
took office). Without strong party support and protection and/or the collaboration of religious reformers, the underpinnings of Schilling's own agenda, which included the humane treatment of prostitutes and ultimately included the redistribution of community power, was too weak to support itself. 30

The Civil Service Commission hearing that was intended to end Jimmy Smith's police career was a fiasco. While more than enough evidence seemed to be presented to show that major problems existed in city government: lax enforcement of existing city laws, disregard of Cantonians who sought relief from activities they believed illegal and immoral, and accusations of public drunkenness and malfeasance in office on the part of the Chief of Police, the commission refused to take seriously any of the evidence brought to them, even when corroborated by police. The Commissioners, as the language of their final decision clearly indicates, resented Harry Schilling, and by extension the reform movement, and the implication that the former city administration had done any

30Repository, January 25, 1913, p. 1, 3. Fred Crankshaw consistently argued throughout the hearing that the dismissal of Jimmy Smith was politically, not morally, motivated, and by implication, influenced by the Republicans who backed Schilling's appeal. In his closing argument, Crankshaw pointed out that Oscar Abt and Walter Ruff served as Schilling's attorneys during the appeal. After Schilling was named mayor, Abt was then appointed chief legal consul for Schilling's attempt to oust Smith, and Walter Ruff became Service Director. Crankshaw also said that the new Safety Director, George Koehler, was a former gambler whose gambling den, The Royal Blue Cigar Store, was on Ed Lengel's beat when the new chief of police was still a patrolman. Crankshaw claimed that before his dismissal, Smith had ordered Lengel to investigate the cigar store but that no report had ever been made.
wrong. Evidence of corruption came for the most part from a convicted brothel keeper and police officers and local residents with long-standing grievances against Smith—and appears to have been seen as prejudicial testimony not to be trusted. Since toleration of prostitution was still a legitimate form of vice control in much of America, the commissioners perhaps saw little use in changing the system that had worked relatively well locally for several years, especially when important members of the established order had clandestine economic interests at stake. With only six months in office, Harry Schilling never had the opportunity to fulfill his promise. Art Turnbull, badly hurt both personally and politically by the reform attacks on him in 1911, and astute a politician not to have realized that Smith's hearing had opened a floodgate of doubt in the minds of many Cantonians, could see no way clear to continue to support the toleration of prostitution. Moreover, Turnbull seemed to have genuinely respected Harry Schilling as a political opponent and as a man. When the Court of Appeals returned Turnbull to office, he apparently saw little use in reversing the reform that Schilling had initiated.

* * * * *

Commercialized prostitution in Canton during the Turnbull years was marked by three clear phenomena: a system of segregation which was maintained through police oversight but balanced by Saxton

---

31Daily News, January 29, 1913, 1; Repository, January 29, 1913, 1. Also see Appendix E.
Street's own self-discipline, which set standards and perimeters of behavior and consequently blocked out many of the worst aspects of the "new prostitution:" an autonomous female organization of madams who worked in concert with male vice elements to create a viable, balanced disreputable community; and a political system in which each major political party utilized vice not only as a means of profit and political power, but as a political tool against the other at appropriate times.

A reporter for the Daily News wrote in 1926 that "Canton is not the wickedest city in America. It is but a way station, or possibly what railroad men would call a division point, on a national highway to crime." Although written more than a decade after the first serious attempt to shut down the vice district, the statement describes the Tenderloin of earlier years when Saxton Street was the centerpiece of a disreputable community that was moving towards criminal consolidation and national notoriety.32

AFTERWORD

Dismal vistas of cafes, Greek coffee houses, barbershops, hotels, garages, all dusty, dilapidated and suggestive of something beyond their outward appearance . . . . this is "the Jungle" of Canton, Ohio . . . .

This was the Canton described by New York Times feature writer John L. Eddy, Jr., in 1926.¹

Thirteen years after the first serious effort to rid Canton of vice, not much had really changed. People like Alice Williams, Gig Hahn, and Caroline and Joe Studer had passed into history. Others like Ollie Schnovell and Alice Barnes had married and left the Tenderloin. Not surprisingly, a large group of women, including Ella Arnold, Jennie Connors, Fannie Schmidt, Nellie Callahan Schwinn, and numerous lesser known figures who had patched together the crazy quilt that was Saxton Street, had simply faded into oblivion as male encroachment spread through the Tenderloin and displaced the women who had once wielded so much control. As will be seen, however, others still continued to live and often prosper, often under the new conditions of Prohibition, in the district that had been Saxton Street. Several were key figures in the investigation of the murder of Daily News editor and publisher Don Mellett in July, 1926, which culminated Mellett's year-long effort


278
to expose publicly the link between local organized crime and city and police officials.

** * * * * * *

On January 1, 1914, the name Saxton Street disappeared from the map of Canton, when street names throughout the city were changed to accommodate the growth of the city. At the request of the Saxton family, Saxton Street became Savannah Avenue, SE, the name by which it is known today. Although East Tuscarawas Street and Cherry Street retained their names, East Seventh became Second Street, SE; East Eighth Street became Third Street, SE, and East Tenth Street became Fifth Street, SE. The business of Saxton Street, however, did not disappear. In July, 1926, shortly after the murder of Don Mellett, *Time* magazine reported that 108 bawdy-houses, many of them in the old district and the rest nearby, were operating openly in Canton.

**Jumbo Crowley.** Jumbo Crowley, the most prominent man or woman to come out of Saxton Street, continued to expand his influence over the Jungle during next decade. By 1926 he controlled a loose network of bootleggers, gamblers, resort owners, and prostitutes. Exclusive gambling rights, which he is said to have controlled, could be purchased for $30,000 a year. One of Crowley's lieutenants ran a string of resorts in the southeast end of the city and reportedly controlled five hundred votes in the Fourth

---

2*(Canton) Repository, January 1, 1913, 1; (Canton) Daily News, January 1, 1913, 1.

3"Corruption" *Time Magazine* July 25, 1926, 10.
Ward. During the investigation of Mallett's murder, Crowley supposedly told an informant that he had "framed every mayor of Canton except one in the last twenty years." Harry Schilling, undoubtedly, was the one who got away. Although Crowley denied he had made the remark, contemporary observers credited him with swinging the mayoral election of C. C. Curtis, a mayor who in 1924 was removed from office for corruption and malfeasance in office by Governor Vic Donahay after he was found guilty by the Ohio Senate. In addition to his political interests, a source who knew Crowley well in the 1920s and 1930s claims that during that period Crowley entered a business partnership with Moshe Annenberg, then publisher of *The Racing Form*, but who later founded the Annenberg publishing empire.4

Naturally Crowley was one of Mallett's targets, and in the early part of the the murder investigation, a major suspect. Despite his control of vice and his national reputation, however, Crowley reportedly grew indignant over the "taking a human life by a 'Jungle man' or anyone else" and considered murder "the poorest sort of work." "Reporters from all over the country converged on Canton to cover the story of the Mallett murder and Crowley thrived in the limelight. He held press conferences where he plied his "twinkling humor and affable manner" on reporters who were looking for a good story. Although he was cleared of all connection to the murder, two of the four men indicted for the murder were members of

---

Crowley's "circle": Louis Mazer and Ben Rudner—the robber, bootlegger son of Max Rudner who thirteen years earlier had so vociferously objected to the way Jimmy Smith controlled local vice.\(^5\)

Despite the money that Crowley's rackets must have brought in, he lived in a large, unpainted, ramshackle house on North Cherry Street. He made his living ostensibly by running a garage owned by his brother, Ed. Five out of the six cars in the garage, however, belonged to him. One of them, a pre-World War I Pierce Arrow—the largest touring car in Canton in the mid 'twenties, comfortably seated nine and was referred to all over town as "the Box Car."\(^6\)

As Crowley grew older, he became known as a sportsman and philanthropist, the "benefactor of the fellow who wanted a dime for a cup-of-cawfaee." According to one source, during the Depression Crowley financed the college education of at least a dozen boys from poor families, the source's brother being one of them.\(^7\)

After the Mellett murder, Crowley moved temporarily to Wooster, Ohio. He continued, however, to control his Canton vice operation. In Wooster, he opened a roadhouse on Lincoln Highway (Route 62), just west of the city, and today the roadhouse is the El Rancho Grande Restaurant and Lounge. Crowley returned to Canton


permanently in the early 1930s. In August 1935, his house was
bombed during a slot machine war that had resulted, a week earlier,
in the shooting death of a small-time racketeer. The bedroom
windows of the adjoining house were shattered. The tenant was Earl
Sawdy, the brother-in law of Belle Sawdy. One month later, at the
age of sixty-two, after he returned to town from a fishing trip on
the Walhonding River, Crowley died in his sleep of a coronary
occlusion. Before his death he had given away nearly all of his
money to charity.\textsuperscript{8}

\textbf{Mamie Lee.} Mamie Lee haphazardly prospered after the Turnbull
years. Sometime before her 1917 marriage to Harry Ehlers, a
factory worker at United Alloy, she purchased a home on Broad
Street, NW, one of the best Canton neighborhoods at the time (and,
coincidentally one block south of Don Mallett's home). According
to her testimony during a 1923 trial on a suspicion charge, Lee said
that although she maintained a room for herself at the Broad Avenue
address, shortly after she purchased the home she returned to her
run-down house on Third Street, SE, in the old Tenderloin, because
she liked the neighborhood. She further told the prosecuting
attorney, when questioned about the odd arrangement, that she saw
nothing peculiar about keeping two residences in the same town.
Around 1920, Mamie Lee and Harry Ehlers separated but seem to have
stayed on good terms, at least for awhile. Around 1922, while

---

\textsuperscript{8} \textit{Repository}, October 15, 1935, 1, 2; Various conversations with
Robert Blocker, Canton, Ohio, 1980–1987; \textit{Repository}, August 3, 1935,
1, 3; \textit{Beacon Journal}, 1; State of Ohio, Bureau of Vital Statistics,
Certificate of DeathNo. 62863, October 15, 1935.
Ehlers was spending the night with his estranged wife, her house was bombed and the sleeping couple were reportedly blown through the bedroom floor into the room below. Later that year, Lee filed for divorce and charged her husband with habitual drunkenness and failure to support her for two years. Harry Ehlers brought a countersuit and was granted a divorce in late 1923.\textsuperscript{9}

During Christmas week of 1923, Lee was sent to the Marysville Reformatory for Women after she was convicted of leasing a house she owned to a known madam. An editorial written by Don Mellett in the \textit{Daily News} suggests that she was sent to prison—or at least she was kept in prison—not so much for her illegal activities as but because she refused to cooperate in the prosecution of C. C. Curtis during his Columbus trial. Later, she reportedly was an informant for Mellett when he went after city police in his newspaper crusade against police corruption. Since Mellett had a stable of policemen, private detectives, bootleggers, prostitutes, and other underworld figures he used as informers, it is possible that Lee was an informant, particularly since ten days after Mellett's death, she defied police hostile to Mellett and spoke

\textsuperscript{9}\textit{Canton City Directory}, 1922. Although the 1922 Directory is the first listing of the Broad Avenue address, according to Lee's court transcript, she moved there in 1917. Stark County Clerk of Courts, Case No. 36143, Bertie Ehlers v Harry Ehlers; Case No. 37413, City of Canton v Mamie Ehlers; Case No. 41128, Harry Ehlers v Mamie Ehlers.
privately with the reform police chief appointed shortly after the murder.\textsuperscript{10}

After her release from prison, Lee opened a lunch counter, and, at least according to Mellett, tried "to make an honest living." Canton attorney and former Civil Service head Price Janson, however, remembers things differently. Fifty years after the fact, Janson recalled a "blonded up" Mamie Lee who had "the biggest whorehouses in Canton and was "the best known woman in Canton since Mrs. McKinley."\textsuperscript{11}

After the Mellett murder, Mamie Lee used her lunchroom experience and joined Jumbo Crowley as his business partner in his roadhouse in Wooster.\textsuperscript{12}

\textbf{Carl Studer.} Caroline Studer died in 1917; her husband Joe in 1923. Their influence on their son Carl, however, did not die with them. By the mid 1920s, Carl Studer, described by the press as "debonair," had grown from juvenile delinquent into "King of Canton's vice ring," which suggests that he was just a step below Jumbo Crowley in importance in the Jungle. Studer was a well-known bootlegger and owned a bawdy house on Fourth Street, NE. For all intents and purposes he made his living from the Lyceum Pool Hall


\textsuperscript{11}Daily News, February 18, 1926, 1, 5; Interview with Price Janson, May 23, 1980; Sam Link, "He Blew Up Everything, Repository, April 18, 1976, 1.

on East Tuscarawas Street, one of the most disreputable joints in
town and possibly the location where Mellett's murder was first
planned. His chief lieutenant was Mellett co-conspirator Louis
Mazer, and Mazer supervised Studer's prostitution interests. As a
result of the Mellett murder investigation, Studer was indicted on
three local and state charges: one count of keeping a house of
prostitution, for which he was sentenced from one to three years in
the Ohio Penitentiary, and two counts of perjury. He was also
under Federal investigation for violation of the Volstead Act.
Although widely believed to have been a wealthy man from the
proceeds of his rackets, he hid his wealth well (if it did indeed
exist) and was declared indigent before his trial, after
prosecutors could find no evidence of his bank accounts or property
holdings. While Studer and Mazer were in the Workhouse awaiting
trial, Mazer's girlfriend, Doll Carey, referred to by the press as
"the fat prostitute," moved in with Studer's wife, Pearl. When
sentenced to prison, Studer reportedly wept and asked if he could
have a job with the prison chaplain.13

Studer returned to Canton in 1929, where he ran a lunchroom for
a few years and lived in an apartment owned by Jake Frailey.
Eventually he became president of The B. Moyer Company, a roofing
company, and later opened his own business, Stark Siding and
Roofing. In the 1950s he moved out of the old Tenderloin and into

13Daily News, August 17, 1926, 10; July 21, 1926, 2; July 19,
1926, 2; Canton Civil Service Commission Minutes, September 13, 1926;
State of Ohio v plaintiff v Louis V. Mazer, No. 7939, Statement of
Louis Mazer, Saturday Morning, March 5, 1927, np; Daily News,
October 6, 1926, 1, 3; May 12, 1927, 1.
the northwest section of town. In 1962 he moved just outside of
Hills and Dales, an exclusive suburb of Canton. The old U. S./Wayne
Hotel continued to operate as a house of prostitution until it was
torn down in 1965. Carl Studer died in 1972.\textsuperscript{14}

\textbf{Saranus "Ed" Lengel.} One of the most unlikely people to become
involved in the murder of Don Mellett was Saranas "Ed" Lengel,
Harry Schilling's Socialist Chief of Police. After Schilling left
office, Lengel drifted away from socialism but not from the police
department. By the mid-1920s, he was once more head of the Canton
Police. Described as "stubborn and vindictive, but personally
honest" Lengel had only a few months to go before retirement when
Mellett attacked him during the winter of 1926. Four days after
Mellett claimed that Lengel had framed the star witness against two
bootleggers, the chief was dismissed by the Mellett-supported
reform mayor. In retaliation, a police captain arrested a \textit{Daily
News} agent without a warrant and read documents in the agent's
possession. The captain was suspended from the force for thirty
days along with other officers friendly to Lengel, including
Detective Floyd Streitenberger who was later found guilty in the
death of Mellett. Lengel took his case to the Civil Service
Commission and was reinstated by a vote of two to one. When
Streitenberger and his friends returned to duty, they were demoted,

\textsuperscript{14}Canton City Directory, 1929-1976. American Social Health
Association, \textit{Commercialized Prostitution in Canton, Ohio, and
Environ}, March, 1961 (New York: American Social Health
Association) 1. In 1961 an investigator for the American Social
Health Association interviewed madam Mamie Mitchell, who gave one of
her addresses as 538 Fifth Street, SE, the the address of the old
U.S./Wayne Hotel.
and four men friendly with Mellett replaced them. Then the mayor charged the two commissioners who supported Lengel with neglect of duty and dismissed them in the hope of getting men in office who would get rid of the chief of police. On July 16, the day after their hearing was to begin, Don Mellett was shot in the head from behind as he left his house to put his car in the garage.

Lengel did little to solve the case and never even went to the scene of the shooting. Although he questioned known criminals, their statements were never put in writing, and some underworld characters even hung around the police station as they had before the murder. A life-long friend of Ben Rudner's, Lengel, who was still not a suspect in the murder, testified for the defense in Rudner's February, 1927, trial. In June, however, after Floyd Streitenberger and Louis Mazer were found guilty (a third defendant Pat "Red" McDermott, the designated hit man, had already been convicted as had been Ben Rudner), they testified before a new grand jury and on June 8 Lengel was indicted for murder. One month later he was convicted and sentenced like the others, to life in prison.

Many people who knew Ed Lengel consider him the tragic figure of the case and believe his conviction to be a miscarriage of justice. The only evidence brought forth at his trial to link him to the murder was that Lengel had told Louis Mazer that Mellett should be "beat up;" that Lengel knew hit man Pat McDermott sometime in the past, and that Lengel at told Streitenberger he would help him however possible after the detective was found
guilty. Lengel also was supposed to have told Streitenberger that if he had known Mellett would be murdered he would never have gotten mixed up in the affair. On his retrial a year later, held in another venue, Lengel was acquitted. City officials agreed to let Lengel return to his post as chief of police for one day so he could collect his pension.15

Mary Smith. In 1917, Mary Smith married her live-in brothel lover, Lawrence Ackerman. He continued to work as a molder and she continued to run her resort. In the early 1920s she was sent to the Marysville Reformatory on a prostitution charge. According to Don Mellett, unlike Mamie Lee, Smith agreed to help police prosecute Mayor Curtis and she reportedly testified against him in Columbus. After her release from prison she returned to the street. In 1926, the Daily News published a picture of her resort on Rex Avenue, NE, which was described as "an unmolested headquarters of vice." Smith lived in the house until her death in 1945.16

Harry Schilling. A half an hour after he left office, Harry Schilling was sworn in as a special (volunteer) deputy sheriff. He asked Sheriff Oberlin to keep the appointment a secret, but word leaked out within hours. When asked if he intended to "watch" saloons and other places for law violations he answered, "No, I'm


not in the crusade businesss . . . . the police are paid to do that." When pressed further for his reasons for volunteering his time to the county he only answered, "You couldn't guess in a thousand years." Nothing is known of his time as a deputy. Although Schilling had a degree in law and worked as a printer, he followed neither trade. For the next twenty-five years he is listed in the city directory as a salesman. In 1936 his name disappeared from the ranks of Cantonians. 17

Arthur Turnbull. Art Turnbull went back to his beloved business world where he continued to prosper, this time with The Canton Chaplet Company. According to former Canton mayor Carl Wise (1952-1957), who knew Turnbull, Turnbull's office faced the Tenderloin and from his window he had a direct view of "dozens" of houses of prostitution. In 1932, "Citizen Art" re-entered politics and served a two-year term as mayor.

A biographer of Turnbull describes him as "a man of marked ability, sterling integrity and high ideals. Absolute fidelity to principle has characterized his life and he has stood as an exemplar of the highest civic virtues." No mention is made of the 1911 campaign. Stanley J. Omich, former Canton Mayor (1963-1980) who as city Safety City Director under Carl Wise in the 1950s finally broke up the Jungle, laughs when Turnbull's name is mentioned and says he was "some fellow." Turnbull's sister-in-law, Anna Turnbull, had a similar reaction. When told about his

17 Repository, May 2, 1913, 1; May 3, 1913, 1; Canton City Directory, 1913-1936.
problems in the early part of the century, she answered, "Art? You've got to kidding!" Legal and business papers stored in Mrs. Turnbull's basement, which might have given valuable information about his years as mayor, were destroyed when the tail-end of Hurricane William hit Canton in 1982 and flooded her basement. Turnbull died in 1944 at the age of seventy-eight.18

Rhodes Gregory. Rhodes Gregory became the Harold Stassen of Canton, continually seeking office but never finding it. According to Price Janson, Gregory became the leading Democrat and for many years "was always running for mayor."19

Mayme Franklin. Mayme Franklin, the prostitute who refused to testify before the Civil Service Commission in 1913, returned to Canton. She married Norman Henson, her junior by nine years, joined the Second Baptist Church, and continued to live and work in the Jungle until her death in 1969. In 1963 an investigator for the American Social Health Association interviewed Franklin and described her as "notorious."20


19Correspondence from Price Janson to author, February 20, 1980; Tape recorded interview with Price Janson, Canton, Ohio, May 23, 1980.

Gig Hahn. Saloonist Gig Hahn was murdered in 1921 at the age of fifty-one in a poker game at a cottage near Meyers Lake. Initial reports suggested that a gang of Italian "thugs" raided the cottage and told everyone to put their hands up. Hahn was shot three times at close range when he ducked under a table when another man was shot. Later reports, however, indicate that the story was a cover-up for something else, and the murder was never solved. A writer for the Daily News fondly remembers Hahn as a "'square' gambler who met unflinchingly the uneven chance and took what was dealt by the cards of fate." Like Jumbo Crowley, Hahn was known as a friend to the down and out. "He was generous and open-handed, always with a great sympathetic heart for the derelicts who drifted to his port of temporary refuge." He was survived by his wife and a four-year-old daughter, Evelyn Margaret, who was said to be the joy of his life.21

Fannie Schmidt. Fannie Schmidt, the madam who told all, went back into business after the Civil Service hearing. In May, 1913, after Jimmy Smith had full power of the police department, she and an unnamed man were arrested on a "statuary offense," which although never defined in the newspapers, was undoubtedly connected with prostitution. Jimmy Smith said that a warrant had been out on Schmidt for some time and denied that the arrest had anything to do with the charges she brought against him. "There is no more significance in the arrest of Fannie Schmit than there would be in the arrest of any disreputable woman Smith told the press. "The

21Daily News, August 3, 1921, 1, 16.
officer was merely doing his duty." Coincidentally, the officer was "special policeman" W. J. Osborn, the private detective who took over Fred Field's Agency after Field left town.

At her trial a few days later, Osborn told the court a jumbled story of whom he worked for, first saying that Art Turnbull, as part of the new municipal anti-vice program had hired him to watch for streetwalkers and then saying that he was hired by "T. L. Finch," whom he had never seen before and knew nothing about, to shadow Schmidt. Over the past two months Osborne said that he had observed men enter Schmidt's "little store" and act suspiciously and that on several occasions he had tried the door to her place but that it was always locked. When he finally got into Schmidt's house and arrested her, Osborn said that she screamed, "I got no girls! I got no girls!" and then called a man in from the backroom who tried unsuccessfully to pay her fine with a roll of bills. Schmidt's bond was placed at $100.00 and was finally paid by Pete McGurty. The trial ended in a hung jury, and the police prosecutor eventually dropped the case.22

Fred Crankshaw. The lawyer accused of being in the conspiracy to collect protection funds from madams was exonerated of all charges. He was, however, eventually disbarred and went to Columbus where he was arrested on bad check charges. In 1926 he returned to Canton to help Don Mellett.23

22Repository, May 18, 1913, 1; Daily News, May 19, 1913, 2; Repository, May 23, 1913, 1, 9; Daily News May 23, 1913, 1, 2; Daily News, June 10, 1913, 2.

23"Don R. Mellett of the 'Canton Daily News," 162,
Vice was as resilient as those who lived by it. Open prostitution and speakeasies flourished through the 1920s and 1930s in the Jungle, and Cherry Street became known nationwide as the center of fast life. Unlike the controlled prostitution of Jimmy Smith’s days, prostitutes reportedly stood in windows (or even came outside) dressed only in short robes or sometimes less. A retired printer who worked in the district as a teenager recalls that "the girls got pretty brazen," especially when "the Burlesque season was on," and often would run out in the streets and try to pull men into their houses if they seemed the least bit interested.24

In 1946, twenty years after Don Mellett was murdered and thirty-five years after Saxton Street reigned, Harper’s Magazine sent John Bartlow Martin to Canton to investigate what changes—if any—had appeared since the Mellett murder. What he found there were wide-open-gambling rooms—some within two blocks of the police station; old bootleggers with liquor licenses; and prostitution. A cab driver told Martin:

Women? There's a million whorehouses Most of of them's where they always been on the southeast side. Nice look'n women, too. Oh, the town's not quite so rough as it used to be, maybe. No kill- ings in a while now. But as far as bootleg joints and whores goes, its the same as always. Little Chicago, they call it.25

24Tape recorded interview with Craig Hamilton, Louisville, Ohio, July 16, 1983.

In November, 1951, exactly thirty-nine years after Harry Schilling tried to shut down Saxton Street, Carl Wise was elected mayor on a "Good Government" platform. Immediately after taking office, Wise ordered his safety director to begin a full scale war against vice. Forty-eight houses of prostitution which operated in the old Tenderloin were reportedly padlocked, and ninety gambling resorts were run out of business. In 1954, the National Municipal League named Canton an "All-America City."  

Despite the improved reputation, regular reports by investigators for the American Social Health Association through the 1950s and early 1960s describe a town, which although "tight as a drum," was also a place where taxi drivers and bellhops could often direct any man to a resort or a bar where women are willing to sell their bodies if the price were right. The reports concede, however—and the prostitutes and barkeeps interviewed by investigators verified, that the town's fast life was in decline.  

Saxton Street and its antecedents, Cherry Avenue and Rex Avenue, continued into the 1960s on a reduced scale. In July, 1963, Mamie Mitchell, a longtime Rex Avenue madam, told an investigator for the American Social Health Association when he went to her house, "Don't have anybody . . . . Couldn't tell you


where to go today . . . The whole town is closed.” In the early 1960s, city officials armed with urban renewal plans and federal funds did what E. B. Townsend would have liked to have done: bulldozed old Saxton Street into the ground. Today, what is left silent and dusty—tall industrial warehouses that block out the sunlight and deserted buildings with shattered windows. At one end are railroad tracks seldom used and fields engulfed in weeds. Overhead, the Cherry Street overpass of Interstate 77 connects the north and south sides of the city. At the other end is East Tuscarawas Street, where Jumbo Crowley ruled. Jumbo Crowley's Place is now a bargain basement furniture store, but most of the other buildings have either been torn down or are empty. Only two buildings on what was Saxton Street still stand. The south end of what was once Ollie Schnovell and Alice Barnes' Central Hotel is now the Datesh Grape Press—a dilapidated building that looks deserted but is not. Next to it, covered with weeds, guarded by junk cars and a sharp toothed German shepherd are the Sugarman Apartments, built in 1912. A few prostitutes once lived there, but the building was never an important source of prostitution.

The old Tenderloin streets are narrow, grey and claustrophobic. Walking through old Saxton Street, which seems more of an alley than a street, one is surprised at the tininess of it and the knowledge that so many people were jammed into it. The white lights have gone out, the pianos are silent—just as Jimmy Smith ordered. No one comes here any more.

---

APPENDIX A

FIGURE 1

MAP OF OHIO SHOWING CANTON IN RELATION TO OTHER OHIO CITIES
FIGURE 2
MAP OF THE TENDERLOIN IN RELATION TO CANTON, OHIO
FIGURE 3

MAP OF THE TENDERLOIN
## APPENDIX D

**ALLEGED PROSTITUTEs IN CANTON, OHIO, 1906-1913**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kate Abe</td>
<td>Bessie _____</td>
<td>May Brooks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caroline Ackerman</td>
<td>Blanche Bates</td>
<td>Stella Brooks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgia Ackerman</td>
<td>Carrie Ben</td>
<td>Anna Brown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary Addison</td>
<td>Clara Bighouse</td>
<td>Bessie Brown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nellie Addison</td>
<td>Charlotte Black</td>
<td>Elizabeth Brown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emma Albert*</td>
<td>Katherine Black</td>
<td>Julia Brown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May Alexander</td>
<td>Margaret Black</td>
<td>Anna Buck</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nina Allard</td>
<td>Ray Blackman</td>
<td>Kate Bordella</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs. Anderson*</td>
<td>Pauline Blake</td>
<td>Anna Burke</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minnie Andrews*</td>
<td>Anna Boldcock</td>
<td>Ida Burke</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ella Arnold</td>
<td>Florence Bonsky</td>
<td>Billie Burns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Becky Aultman</td>
<td>Elizabeth Bowers*</td>
<td>Ida Cahill</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary Ann Baily*</td>
<td>Hettie Boyer</td>
<td>Maple Cane</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clementine Banker</td>
<td>Peggy Brady</td>
<td>Edna Carl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alice Barnes*</td>
<td>Nellie Brenner</td>
<td>Gertrude Carroll</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anna Barnett</td>
<td>Babe Brooks</td>
<td>Lulu (Louie) Cavey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lillian (Trixie) Bell*</td>
<td>Helen Brooks</td>
<td>Alma Chaney</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

1Names taken from newspaper articles (1906-1913), Canton City Directories, 1906-1913, and U.S. Manuscript Census, 1910. (*) denotes alleged madams.
Doras Clarke
Yetta Cohen
Edith Combs
Minnie Concha
Jennie Connor*
Belle Cookensider
Mrs. Corbet
Annie Crowley
Ruth Courtney
Grace Craig
Vera Dale
Ellie Davis
Fay Davis
Helen Davis
Jessie Davis
Rosa Davis*
Zelma Day
Emma Dean
Bethel Deater
Hazel Dice
Rhettie Dougherty
Florence Douglass
Lillian Drillard
Helen Durkin
Bertha Eckley
Hattie Edwards
Ruth Ensign
Cleo Eyster
Grace Date
Margaret Feinagle
Lucy Ferrington
Myrtle Fisher
Fanta Fisher
Fanta Ford
Grace Foster
Luna Foster*
Mabel Foster*
Nettie Foy
Mayme Franklin*
Beatrice Fuller
Narrow Gage
Alice Gailing*
Rose Gardner
Helen Garman
Bertha George
Irma George
Hattie Gerhart*
Ruth Giddings*
Jo Ginsburg*
Lena Goodman*
Anna Gordon
Dolly Gordon
Emily Gordon
Lulu Gordon
Violet Gordon
Jenny Gould
Ethel Gray
Eva Gray
Nellie Gray
Elsie Green
Lillian Grey
Ida Greyson*
Theresa Grobach
Flossie Gruber
Maude Guido
Ida Hasse
Katie Hall
Stella Hall
Elsie Hamilton
Helen Hamilton
Mary Hammers
Emma Hann*
Pearl Hanna
Maud Hans
Della Harper*
Mabel Harris
Lillian Hayes
Grace Hayes
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Minne Head</th>
<th>Jeannette Jones</th>
<th>Jessie Lawson*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gretta Heath</td>
<td>Lillian Jones</td>
<td>Anna Lee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marie Heisler</td>
<td>Mable Jones</td>
<td>Jennie Lee*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hazel Henderson</td>
<td>Minnie Jones</td>
<td>Mamie Lee*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lillian Henderson</td>
<td>Rose Jones</td>
<td>Nellie Lee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Golar Hill</td>
<td>Anna Joseph*</td>
<td>Dorothy LeFay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ann Hoffman</td>
<td>Ida Kahill</td>
<td>Pearl Leffel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eva Hogue</td>
<td>Anna Kaley</td>
<td>Alice Lewis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bertha Holloway</td>
<td>Laura Kaiser</td>
<td>Marie Lewis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rose Hosslar</td>
<td>Cora Kashner*</td>
<td>Nellie Lewis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Florence Howard</td>
<td>Emily Kate*</td>
<td>Anna (Dutch Mary) Leiber*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Loretta Howard&quot;</td>
<td>Erma Kate*</td>
<td>Dorothy Lorraine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winnie Humphrey</td>
<td>Emma Kaufmann</td>
<td>Battie Lorraine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minnie Irwin</td>
<td>Bernetta Keene</td>
<td>Irma Lytle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Addie Jackson</td>
<td>Caroline Keuble</td>
<td>Fannie Mack</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ellie Jackson</td>
<td>Olivia King</td>
<td>Linetta Mahaffey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laura Jackson</td>
<td>Pearl King*</td>
<td>Marie Maier</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mamie Jackson</td>
<td>Elizabeth Kirsch*</td>
<td>Grace Manley</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marie James</td>
<td>Kate Kline</td>
<td>Madine Marshall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Margaret Jackson</td>
<td>Kate Kuffer</td>
<td>Adeline Martin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Almo Johnson</td>
<td>Ida Kohl</td>
<td>Hazel Martin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethel Johnson</td>
<td>Clara LaBord</td>
<td>Kitty Martin*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gertrude Johnson</td>
<td>Dorothy LaFay</td>
<td>Hazel Martin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Margaret Johns</td>
<td>Margaret Lamborn*</td>
<td>Minnie Martin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary Johnson</td>
<td>Agnes Langanke</td>
<td>Tootsie Martin*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estella Jones</td>
<td>Rea LaVerne</td>
<td>Charlotte Mason</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Julia Matters
Mrs. May
Katie May*
Maisie May
Bertha May Mesnar
Della Meyers
Minnie Meyers
Anna Miller
Blanche Miller
Edna Miller
Ella Miller
Enaline Miller
Emma Miller
"Grace Miller"
Harriet Miller
Mabel Miller
Mary Miller
Nina Miller
Verna Miller
Bessie Mitchell
Emily Moffit
Belle Moore
Grace Moore
Gertrude Moore
Ollie Moore
Mary Morrow
Margaret Mowry
Carry Myers
Nina Myers
Bertha McCall
Stella McCammon
Babe McCoy-Carpenter
Nellie McDougal
Bessie McIlherson
Charlotte McVern
Fay McWeigh
Nellie Morgan*
Rose Nagel*
Bertha Natzel
Lillian Neal
Grace Nelson
Jernie Ney
Angella Norman
Gertrude O'Brien
Maud O'Brien*
Rose O'Dell
Alice Ogier
Lula Parker
Clara Patton*
Edna Phillips
Ella Pleasure*
Laura Porter*
Rose Priest*
Lillian Purdue
Katherine Puzzini
Mattie Quigley
Mary Rabner
Bessie Race
Marie Race
Viola Reaves
Stella Redenor
Susan Reed*
Diana Reep
Lizzie Reifsnider
Ida Richards
Sadie Richards*
Dolly Richardson
Maud Robinson
Sadie Robinson
Nora Roden
Thelma Rosen
Eva Rowe
Lizzie Ruff
Goldie Russell
Jeanette Russel
Rose Saline*
Belle Sawdy*
Clara Schaffer
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ollie Schnovell*</td>
<td>Nellie Smith</td>
<td>Ida Vail</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anna Schwartz</td>
<td>Pearl Smith</td>
<td>Babe VanKirk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nellie Callahan Schwinn*</td>
<td>Rachael Smith</td>
<td>Gertrude Waisner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edna Shade</td>
<td>Sadie Smith</td>
<td>Bessie Walker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May Shaum</td>
<td>Helen Speisinger</td>
<td>Florence Walker*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anna Shaw</td>
<td>Bessie Staffon</td>
<td>Lillie Walker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irma Shaw</td>
<td>Myrtle Stahl</td>
<td>Anna Ward*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emily Sherman</td>
<td>Elizabeth Stantz</td>
<td>Mental Ward</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jessie Sherwood</td>
<td>Hagnan Starwick</td>
<td>Marie Warment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sara Shessley</td>
<td>Emma Steele</td>
<td>Mamie Welsh*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dorothy Shuman</td>
<td>Alice Stevenson</td>
<td>Idella Westwood*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emma Simler*</td>
<td>Ruth Steves</td>
<td>Helen Weyandt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Margaret Simler</td>
<td>Marie Steward</td>
<td>Alice White</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Epha Skerrett</td>
<td>Anna Stoffer*</td>
<td>Pay White</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agnes Smith</td>
<td>Ida Stoldt</td>
<td>Hazel White</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alice Smith</td>
<td>Caroline Studer*</td>
<td>Marie White</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Babe Smith</td>
<td>Mary Stull</td>
<td>Grace Wicks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bessie Smith</td>
<td>Carrie Thomas</td>
<td>Alice Williams*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Esther Smith</td>
<td>Hilda Thayer</td>
<td>Anna Williams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethel Smith</td>
<td>Orptha Thoman</td>
<td>Bessie Williams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fanny Schmidt*</td>
<td>Goldie Thomas</td>
<td>Ina Williams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hortense Smith</td>
<td>Nellie Thompson</td>
<td>Ruth Williams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mabel Smith</td>
<td>May Thorp</td>
<td>Fanny Willis*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Margaret Smith</td>
<td>Susanna Tollman</td>
<td>Anna Wilson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marie Smith</td>
<td>Julia Truman</td>
<td>Dollie Wilson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary Smith*</td>
<td>Laura Underwood*</td>
<td>Edna Wilson</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Flo Wilson
Maude Wilson
Rose Wilson
Viola Wilson
Pearl Wing
Emma Winella*
Bessie Wise
Rose Wise
Stella Wise
Tena Wise*
Rose Wiseman
Sadie Woodfield*
Mabel Young
Mary Zuze
APPENDIX E

IMPEACHMENT PETITION BROUGHT AGAINST ARTHUR J. TURNBULL
NOVEMBER, 1911

The undersigned, citizens and electors of the city of Canton, Ohio, on behalf of themselves and other citizens and electors of said city, respectfully show to your Excellency and hereby charge that Art J. Turnbull, mayor of the city of Canton, Ohio, while serving as mayor of said city, has been guilty of misconduct in office, gross immorality and gross neglect of duty in the following particulars, to wit:

Said mayor has been guilty of misconduct in office in that he has wrongfully and unlawfully permitted and caused his clerk and chief of police to levy tribute in money from keepers of gambling houses, saloons, and houses of ill-fame in return for protection thereof.

Said mayor has been guilty of misconduct in office in that he has appointed to and retained in office as chief of police of said city one H. W. Smith, well knowing said Smith to be grossly immoral and that said Smith habitually and knowingly permitted and protected the violation of laws of the state and ordinances of said city, and particularly those relating to gambling, houses of ill fame, cockfighting, and the regulation of the liquor traffic, said Smith himself aiding and abetting such violations upon frequent occasions by his personal presence and patronage, and permitting extensive gambling resorts to operate openly and notoriously within two hundred feet of his office and elsewhere in said city.

Said mayor has been guilty of misconduct in office in that upon the occasion of a raid by the sheriff of Stark County upon gambling houses within the block adjacent to the city hall and police office, in October, 1911, he instructed the chief of police, if called upon by said sheriff for assistance, to refuse such assistance, directing said chief to tell the sheriff to go to hell.

Said mayor has been guilty of misconduct in office in that he has wrongfully and unlawfully granted permits for the holding of prize fights in the city auditorium, the public property of said city knowing that said prize fights were unlawful and brutal exhibitions, one of such fight being so bloody and disgusting as to cause many persons in attendance thereon to leave the building and another resulting in a knockout, and said mayor well knowing that said club was organized for the sole purpose of evading the law and

\(^1\) (Canton) Repository, November 24, 1911, 1.

305
was officered by known criminals and open and defiant violations of other laws of the state.

Said Mayor has been guilty of gross immorality in this to wit: that on May 1, 1908, at a banquet at the Hotel Windsor, in the city of Akron, Ohio, where said Mayor was invited and present as Mayor and official representative of the city of Canton, said Mayor was guilty of grossly indecent and obscene conduct and language in the presence of both men and women, by obscene actions and the telling of filthy and vulgar stories, the proposing of indecent toasts and making of grossly vulgar and insulting remarks and proposals to the waitresses while at the table, both said conduct and language being so unspeakably lewd and obscene as to be utterly unfit to set out in a public paper, and such that the members of the dining room in disgust and the waitresses were obliged to leave the room. Said conduct being so scandalous that complaint of unmasonic conduct was made against the Mayor by the Past Commanders and Eminent Commander of Akron Commandery, Knights Templars, to the Canton Commandery, upon which, however, no action was taken because of the political prominence and power of said Mayor: and which conduct held up the city of Canton to public scandal, disrepute and ridicule. Of all the foregoing facts detailed proof in proper time will be submitted to your Excellency.

Said Mayor has been guilty of gross immorality in that on or about ____ he, while a passenger on an interurban car of the Northern Ohio Traction & Light Co., bound from Akron to Canton, in full view of the passengers on said car, held upon his lap two women in no wise related to said mayor, and with them and another man carried on in loud and boisterous manner an indecent conversation with said women engaged in such conduct as to shock the other passengers in said car and to become a public scandal.

Said mayor has been guilty of gross immorality in that he has repeatedly and notoriously visited houses of ill-fame in said city of Canton and been repeatedly intoxicated in public places.

Said mayor has been guilty of gross neglect of duty in that he knowingly permitted gambling rooms to be operated openly and publicly in all parts of said city and has made no attempt to prevent the same, although frequently by citizens apprised thereof and admonished with regard thereto that he has knowingly permitted saloons to be kept open and intoxicating liquors to be sold upon Sundays and election days throughout said city and has made no attempt to prevent or check the same although frequent complaints and specific violation of law in this regard have been made to him by citizens of said city. That he has knowingly permitted houses of prostitution and assignation to be kept and conducted in open and notorious violation of law and has permitted lewd women to frequent the streets of said city and openly solicit men to engage in illicit intercourse with them: that he has knowingly permitted well known and notorious criminals to conduct saloons and houses of ill-fame and to harbor therein habitual gamblers, prostitutes and criminals of all classes and citizens who have sought to lay before him knowledge and complaints concerning the violation of laws and his non-enforcement of laws in said city.
Your petitioners further represent that the attendance and testimony of proper deposition of competent witnesses to prove the foregoing charges will be procured and furnished by them without subpoena or legal process and without cost to the state of Ohio.

Wherefore your petitions pray that for the relief of said city and the citizens thereof from the aforementioned condition, and to the end that the laws of the State of Ohio and the ordinances of said city may be enforced in said city and the rights and persons of the citizens of said city may be protected, you excellency remove from said office Art R. Turnbull, mayor of said city.

Respectfully submitted,

Edwin R. Townsend
Leroy DeHayes

State of Ohio, Stark Co.

The following specifications were duly subscribed in my presence by the above named Edwin R. Townsend and Leroy DeHayes, and it was by them sworn before me that the facts therein set forth are true as they verily believe.

Loren E. Souers
Notary Public
APPENDIX F

CHARGES BROUGHT AGAINST H. W. "JIMMY" SMITH
DECEMBER, 1912
and
DISPOSITION OF CHARGES, JANUARY, 1913

SPECIFICATION 1: That said chief of police has been guilty of habitual drunkenness for at least four years past.

DISPOSITION: No proof that for four years Smith has been an habitual drunkard.

SPECIFICATION 2: That H. W. Smith, while acting as chief of police, has been drunk so frequently and continuously as to render said H. W. Smith inefficient, incompetent, and unable to perform the duties of his office.

DISPOSITION: This combined with No. 3, charges that Smith was drunk so often as to render him inefficient in office, not proven because of prejudice of witnesses and contradictory testimony.

SPECIFICATION 3: That Smith has been drunk while on duty, so frequently that it would be for the best interests of the police department of said city that said chief be removed.

DISPOSITION: See No. 2.

SPECIFICATION 4: That Smith has been guilty of misconduct in that it was his habit to invite policemen while on duty, to drink with him in saloons.

DISPOSITION: No evidence that chief invited policemen to drink with him in saloons while on duty.

---

1Daily News, January 17, 1913, p. 1, 4; Repository, January 29, 1913, p. 1, 4; Canton Civil Service Commission, Minutes, November 25, 1912.
SPECIFICATION 5: That Smith while acting as such chief, had been
guilty of gross neglect of duty in that he has knowingly permitted,
allowed, and consented to the operating in said City of houses of
prostitution, known as the Emma Hans place, Tootsie Martin place,
Trixie Bell place, Emma Miller place, Nellie McDougal place, Nellie
Schwinn place, Maud O'Brien place, Tina Wise place, Jessie Lawson
place, Mary Miller place, Fanny Schmidt place, Pearl King place,
Nannie Lee place, Rose Nagle place, Sadie Richards place, Nellie
Morgan place, Mother Barnes place, and Mother Arnold place.

DISPOSITION: Charge that he consented to the operation of houses
of prostitution. "To dismiss him in this case would be to dismiss
him for obeying orders of superiors."

SPECIFICATION 6: Says that during the latter half of the year
1910, Smith frequently visited a house of prostitution in said city
operated by one Fannie Schmidt; on one occasion he visited a house
of prostitution operated by Trixie Bell; that he visited a house of
prostitution operated by one Jennie Connors; and that he has been
guilty of gross immorality by consorting with lewd and indecent
women.

DISPOSITION: No testimony to show that chief's visits to houses of
ill fame were not upon business of the department.

SPECIFICATION 7: That Smith has been guilty of malfeasance in
office in that it was fixed policy of said chief not to molest or
interfere with saloons that violated the Sunday closing law.

DISPOSITION: Smith gave each officer orders to keep saloons closed
on Sunday. Eighty-one arrests were made. If a saloon was open it
was the fault of patrolman on beat.

SPECIFICATION 8: That Smith has been guilty of malfeasance in
office in that it was fixed policy not to molest or interfere with
the operation of gambling houses and slot machines.

DISPOSITION: Officers testified that Smith gave strict orders to
suppress gambling.

SPECIFICATION 9: That Smith has been guilty of malfeasance in
office in that it was his fixed policy not to molest or in any way
interfere with the operation of houses of ill fame.

DISPOSITION: This specification considered with No. 5.
SPECIFICATION 10: That Smith is a silent partner of the Fred F. Fields & Company, a pretended detective agency, which said agency is engaged in the unlawful business of protecting and fostering the business of prostitution in the city of Canton.

DISPOSITION: This combined with No. 11. These were dismissed at the end of plaintiff’s case as there was no evidence to connect Smith with Fields Detective Agency.

SPECIFICATION 11: That a so-called detective agency was organized in the city during the middle of October of the year 1912 with offices in the George D. Harter bank building, which said agency operated under the name of Fred F. Field & Company; that one Fred F. Field, holding himself out as a detective is the man after whom said alleged company was named; that said Fred F. Field, H. W. Smith, chief of police, and Trixie Bell, and others whose names are unknown conspired together to obtain money from keepers of houses of ill-fame by promising said keepers of said houses to protect them in the conduct and operation of the unlawful business of prostitution; said conspirators succeeded in inducing to join said association one Emma Hans, Tootsie Martin, Emma Miller, Nellie McDougal, Mary Smith, Laura Porter, Nellie Schwinn, Maud O'Brien, Tina Wise, Jessie Lawson, Mary Miller, Fanny Schmidt, Pearl King, Mamie Lee, Rose Nagle and Sadie Richards, and others whose names are unknown said women all being keepers of houses of ill fame in said city; that it was understood and agreed that said women should pay into said detective agency, an initial fee of $25.00, and in addition, certain weekly dues variable in amount, the amount of said weekly dues depending upon the number of persons said conspirators succeeded in inducing to join said association; it being understood, agreed, and arranged that the total of said weekly dues should equal one hundred ($100.00) dollars per week; that in consideration of this amount of money paid to said agency, said conspirators promised said women that said agency would aid and assist them so that they might operate their places unmolested and in the event that any of them are arrested, to aid and assist them in their defense.

DISPOSITION: See No. 10.

SPECIFICATION 12: That Smith has been guilty of malfeasance in office in that some time during the past summer, on two particular occasions he hired an automobile from one J. H. Wilson and on being presented with the bills for the same by said Wilson, said chief intimidated and suggested that he should not be required to pay for the use of said automobiles because of the fact that he was chief of police; whereupon and because of said suggestion, said Wilson receipted said bills to said chief of police without having
received any money for the use of said automobiles; that said chief hired an automobile from said Wilson some time later during the past summer and upon presenting the bill to said H. W. Smith, said Wilson was met with the same suggestion that he should not be required to pay for the use of said automobile, but said Wilson insisted upon the payment being made; said chief did pay for the use of said automobile; that immediately thereupon Smith instructed a policeman to watch said Wilson or his automobiles in order that the chief might find an opportunity to file charges against Wilson for violation of the automobile ordinances or the state law with references to automobile licenses; that within a short time Smith filed an affidavit in the police court of the city of Canton against Wilson, charging Wilson with non-compliance with the state license law upon which charges Wilson was found not guilty.

DISPOSITION: Concerning receipting of a bill against Smith by A. H. Wilson, garage proprietor. Without any proof.

SPECIFICATION 13: That some time during December of 1911, there was a suicide in a place known as the Tremont house; that the matter was investigated by James L. Lindesmith, a police officer; that Smith was guilty of malfeasance in office in connection with this affair for the following reason: that in the course of investigation, Lindesmith learned that a certain doctor had unlawfully administered medicine to a girl who was connected with the affair; that Lindesmith informed the chief of the fact, whereupon the chief ordered Lindesmith to withdraw from the investigation for the reason that he, Smith, knew who the doctor was, and that he put no other officer on to follow up said matter.

DISPOSITION: That he protected doctor in suicide case. Patrolman Lindesmith had been suspended by Smith for misconduct and also admitted he had been drinking.

SPECIFICATION 14: That said chief of police was guilty of malfeasance in office in that during the fall of 1909 he twice knowingly permitted and actively acquiesced in and sided and abetted the commission of a crime known as cock fighting which took place in a certain hall in said city known as Teutonia Hall.

DISPOSITION: If Smith had intended to permit cock fighting at Teutonia Hall he would have given police orders to stay away rather than look after it.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books, Pamphlets


---


---


---


---


---


---


---


---

Canton Civil Service Minute Book, 1912, 1913, 1926.

---


---


---


---


---


Stark County Board of Elections. Abstract of Votes in Canton, 1911.

Stark County Board of Elections. Minutes of Meetings, Board of Deputy State Supervisors and Inspectors of Elections, Stark County Ohio, 1911.

Stark County Board of Elections Scrapbook, 1912.


United States Manuscript Census, 1900.

United States Manuscript Census, 1910


**Articles**


"Corruption" *Time Magazine*, July 25, 1926, 10.

Eastman, Max, "Knowledge and Revolution: Investigating Vice, Masses 4 (May, 1913),


"Financing a City by Returns from Vice." *Survey* 31 (1914): 512-514.


Link, Sam, "He Was Just a Muckraker, He Blew Everything," (Canton) Repository, April 18, 1976: 1.


Miner, Maude, "Two Weeks in the Night Court." Survey 24 (1911): 231.

"Minimum Wage Discussed by Retail Associations." Survey 30 (1913): 260-261


Miner, Maude, "Two Weeks in the Night Court," Survey 24 (1911) 229-234.


"Nationwide Attention to Vice and Low Wages." Survey 29 (1913): 897-898.


"The Vice Investigation by the Illinois Senate." Survey 29 (1913): 897.


Newspapers

(Akron) Beacon Journal, 1935
(Alliance) Review, 1901
(Canton) Daily News, 1912-1913, 1926-1927
(Canton) Morning News, 1905-1910
(Canton) News Democrat, 1910-1912
(Canton) Stark County Democrat, 1888
(Columbus) Citizen, 1905-1906
(Columbus) Dispatch, 1905-1906
(Columbus) Ohio State Journal, 1905-1906
(Columbus) Post Press, 1905-1906
(Dayton) News Herald Journal, 1986

Unpublished Sources


Schuring, Dianne, The Mellett Murder, Work in-progress


Government and Social Agencies

Canton City Council
Canton Department of Health
Canton Police Department
Stark County Board of Elections
Stark County Clerk of Courts,
Stark County Engineer's Office
Robert Blocker
Stanley J. Cmich
Coelean Davis
Craig Hamilton
Price Janson
Nick Lattavo
C. David Morgan
Scotty McKinney
Dianne Schuring
William "Cooney" Soloman
William Summitt
Anna Turnbull