THE NON-JEWISH CHOIR DIRECTOR

IN THE

AMERICAN REFORM JEWISH TEMPLE

A Thesis

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree
Master of Arts

By

NORMAN STAIGER, B. Sc. in Ed.; M. S.

The Ohio State University
1958

Approved by

[Signature]
Adviser
School of Music
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The writer wishes to express his grateful appreciation to Louis H. Diercks and Rabbi Jerome D. Folkman for their valuable help and guidance as well as genuine friendship.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The problem</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Importance of the problem</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scope and limitations</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procedure</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. THE HISTORY OF REFORM JUDAISM</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judaism abroad</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judaism in the U.S.A.</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sociological implications</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. TERMS</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reform; Orthodox; Conservative</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Church; synagogue; temple</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Talmud; Torah; Haftarah</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ashkenazim; Sephardim</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cantor; chazzan</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goyim; shiksa; shegitz</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER</td>
<td>PAGE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. THE JEWISH YEAR</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. THE JEWISH SERVICE</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hymnody</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General service format</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiple membership</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transliteration</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parallels</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate music</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good liturgical composers</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suggestions</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

The problem. It has been charged that the music in American temples is dominated, and to some extent, created by incompetent non-Jewish musicians who are quite ignorant in matters of the Judaic idiom.\(^1\) The author of the accusation is the Musical Director of Temple Emanu-El, New York City, not only the oldest but certainly one of the most influential temples in the United States. Lazare Saminsky does add, however, that in fairness to these musicians, one must admit that appropriate Jewish music is secured and used when its existence is revealed.\(^2\)

The writer can certainly attest to the substance of this indictment. Friends have approached me saying, "I've just been appointed cantor and choir director at our town's temple. What do I do now?" Nationally known organists of my acquaintance with absolutely no knowledge of the liturgical music of

---


\(^2\) *Loc. cit.*
Judaism have assumed the choir responsibilities of the High Holydays.

**Importance of the problem.** If the importance of the problem is not obvious may I quote the Director of Synagogue Activities for the Union of American Hebrew Congregations:

So far as I know there are no accurate statistics regarding the number of choir directors in our congregations who are not Jewish. My own observations over the past 15 years would lead me to hazard a guess that not less than 80% are Christian.

The only places in which you will find Jewish choir directors are a) the large metropolitan centers and b) new small congregations in which the choir is a volunteer choir led by one of the members. 3

It has long seemed propitious that a handbook for non-Jewish musicians be in evidence; it is the hope of the writer that this thesis will be a contribution in this respect.

**Scope and Limitations.** One must agree quite completely with C. Hugo Grimm of the Isaac M. Wise Temple in Cincinnati (himself a non-Jew) that the main problem of the non-Jewish choirmaster is not a choral one. It is rather the possession of an understanding, sympathy, and respect for the liturgical service of Reform Judaism. 4 To promote these attributes we shall study some history as well as the necessary service

---


4 C. Hugo Grimm, (Letter, Cincinnati), 1957.
materials for a successful administration. Suggestions and conclusions will follow.

Procedure. The history of Reform Judaism will be traced with special emphasis on musical developments. Terms will be defined and the Jewish 'church' year established for the novitiate. The importance of the feasts and festivals will be detailed along with their Christian parallels. Hymnody will be studied and the actual service format discussed briefly with suggestions for the music to be employed. Also one of the more bewildering problems for all temple directors will be investigated, that of the multiple membership congregation; suggestions from rabbis and cantors over the country will be divulged. The conclusions will attempt to offer some practical suggestions and a suggested procedure.
CHAPTER II

THE HISTORY OF REFORM JUDAISM

Judaism abroad. Without some knowledge of the history of Reform Judaism it is quite impossible to understand the basic problems of the thesis. Most of us assume that Jews are an ethnic group with some racial elements. It is much more important to understand that in essence they are not a race but rather a people, a population. And spiritually, we should always be aware that to the Hebrews, both generically and as individuals, we are eternally indebted for the most penetrating search for an adequate experience of God.\(^5\)

Jewish history begins literally with the Creation itself. As the true beginning of time, ancient Jews settled upon a date corresponding to 3761 B.C., a year still traditional with modern Jews.\(^6\) (The Jewish year 5719 would correspond to the year of this thesis, 1959. It should also be understood that the phrase Common Era—C.E.—is often used by Judaism in lieu of A.D.)

An important time in history occurred about 1000 B.C. as King Solomon's Temple was completed. Solomon's father, David, had never achieved the noble ambition of erecting the great


Temple to the worship of God because of wars.\textsuperscript{7} 

The grandeur of the Temple is not our concern here but some remarks should be made about the music. There is a legend that when Solomon married Pharaoh's daughter, she brought with her a thousand varieties of musical instruments. The "orchestra" included stringed instruments in tremendous variety but only one cymbal!\textsuperscript{8} Two species of winds were present. The first included the flutes and the pipes. The second were the signaling instruments; here were the trumpets (Chatzotzera) but of greater importance, the ram's horns (Shofars).

The Shofar is the only instrument that we find in the synagogue throughout the Medieval Ages up to the present day.\textsuperscript{9} It is literally a beautifully polished ram's horn. Inasmuch as no accurate musical tones (nagen) are possible, melodic lines are quite out of the question. As found in the Bible two utterances are heard: (1) a blowing—"tekia" i.e. long notes and (2) a shouting—"teruè," short staccato or tremolo notes.

One needs only to peruse the Bible, especially the Books


\textsuperscript{9} \textit{Ibid.}, p. 10.
of Chronicles to see the importance of the human voice in David’s time. The Talmud details the role of the boy singers in the Second Temple; the chorus singers in the First Temple, except on secular occasions, were all male.

A.Z. Idelsohn epitomizes the next few centuries as being somewhat of a struggle against heathen music. (Greek music, following the pattern of Greek art and culture, became obscene and carnal.) Judaism and Christianity fought such music with the result that both synagogue and church used practically no instrumentation for centuries; the human voice was heard almost entirely in modal song.  

Another type of instrument did appear about the beginning of the Common Era, a type of pipe organ called a magrepha but it was used for the sole purpose of calling the priests and Levites to their duties.

Regarding the use of an organ in Temple we should note that even to-day communities in Europe are divided into Orthodox and Progressive or "Organ" congregations. Especially when used merely for the support of the choir voices, it would seem

10 Ibid., pp. 92-96.

11 Ibid., p. 14

12 Ibid., p. 244
that the Jewishness of Temple music is unaffected either by the presence or the absence of an organ.

Saul Meisels, in his February, 1953 lecture-recital at the Columbus, Ohio, Hillel Foundation said, "Ancient temple music was approximately the same as Gregorian chant, accompaniment for all temple music was insignificant until the present century."\(^{13}\)

Inasmuch as Gregorian chant as such will not be studied here it should be noted that about sixty percent of Gregorian chant, the authentic music of the Catholic Church, is of Jewish origin.\(^{14}\) All church musicians should be cognizant that the earliest type of church song had its origin in the temple and synagogue services of the Jews.\(^{15}\)

During the Middle Ages, the Dark Ages circa 500 to 1450 C.E., little need be said except that recitatives were introduced into the synagogue and some modal music was formulated. Of course, many influences were felt upon Jewish music. But its central core, the cantillation of Bible readings and the modal prayer chants, was carefully guarded by a strict oral

\(^{13}\) Saul Meisels, 1953 Lecture-Recital.


tradition. Here we have one of the real enigmas in authenticating our contemporary "traditional" music. The Jew, being Semitic, is really part of the Oriental world; unwrhythmic improvisations have always been quite accepted. Yet to-day most Reform Jews (I'm delighted to report) would consider such vagarious music quite antiquated.

Lest these remarks seem uncalled-for, let us listen again to Vinaver:

For the Jew segregated within a community shunning the secular music of concert and opera, the synagogue sometimes constituted a source of musical entertainment as well as a divine service. Similar things of course occurred in the Church, and complaints to that effect were heard in Palestrina's time and earlier. About 1500 C.E. the Ghetto was affected by the Renaissance and, of course, the Protestant Reformation. But the attitude of the liberal Protestants was little better than that of the Catholic Church and German Jews especially were in no better social position. At this time, however, there was a movement that truly gladdened Jewish music, that received the Sabbath with joy and pleasant hymns. This was the system of Jewish philosophical mysticism, the members of which were Cabalists. Inasmuch as some of their traditional tunes took

---

17 Ibid., p.18.
18 Idelsohn, op. cit., p. 177.
over an hour to sing; however, one wonders at the duration of their services. It could be said that the Protestant cantata or religious concert which appeared at this time also suggested a more joyous religion.

In contrast, we find that one of the great Jewish scholars observes that in the 16th century masses and motets, "...people saw the purist embodiment of an ideal church music --- unearthly, freed from all passion, seraphic."\(^{19}\)

The first great individual name in Jewish music was that of Salomone Rossi who lived during the latter half of the 16th and early 17th centuries. Musician at the Court of the Dukes of Mantua in Italy, he was the first to introduce harmony and even polyphony into the synagogues. The style was too Renaissance, however, and soon the old traditional songs were back.

More than two centuries were to elapse before harmony was to be received favorably in the synagogue. The genius who had much to do with its acceptance was the great cantor of the Vienna Temple, Salomon Sulzer. His principal contribution was to dignify the music by insisting that the chazzan (cantor) cease his improvisations. He also introduced classical harmony

in four parts... he even used four clefs. Several great Christian musicians gave Sulzer the initiative for these musical creations. Unfortunately, the warmth of Jewish sentiment was negated by his penchant for Catholic Church song. But the name of Sulzer will be found many times in connection with the average temple music program even to-day.

During the 18th century an Eastern European sect of Jewish mystics came into being with the brotherhood of man as one of its tenets. The birth of Chassidism is but a sympathetic wave of the same spiritual ether that underlies the Christian piétist current of the eighteenth century. Its achievement was to deny despair and to serve God in joy.

"...To the Chassidic mystic, song was 'the ladder to the throne of God'. Minkin reminds us that such contemporaries as Lazare Saminsky, Ernest Bloch, and Joseph Achron use Chassidic music in the creation of great compositions. The color and rhythm of their work contrasts sharply with the Hazamut or cantorial style.

In the nineteenth century a tremendous movement took

---

20 Saminsky, op. cit., p. 36.

21 Vinaver, op. cit., p. 20.

place. Quoting Idelsohn:

Those extremely modernized Jews who with Heine considered Judaism 'a calamity' ...deserted their faith and went over to the Christian Church... Others, whose Jewish consciousness was stronger, could not take this step; and therefore came upon the idea to reform their Judaism, by which they meant to cut away exotic, Semitic-Oriental parts, and retain only that part of Judaism which was of general religious and ethical nature.23

These excisions and concomitants were, of course, to lead to what we understand as Reform Judaism; we shall investigate the movement more thoroughly in the 19th century material.

One of the great early names in Reform music was that of Louis Lewandowski. His contributions in the Jewish community of Berlin (the cradle of the Reform movement) were to create a cantabile style from old material and to assign a specific role to the organ other than mere choir support. He carefully avoided the "taint" of Catholic or Protestant style.

Judaism in the U.S.A. With this background we are now ready for that which is more contemporary.

The bulk of the Jewish settlers arrived in the United States circa 1880. Inasmuch as they did not have to endure a dark, oppression period, the psychological effect was to induce a lower standard of worship. There being very few Jewish organists and singers, non-Jewish church organists were engaged and commissioned to secure church choristers and to set prayers to

23 Idelsohn, op. cit., p. 233.
Christian music. In 1845 the first large Reform congregation appeared, the B'nai-El Congregation in New York City. In 1872, the great power in the Reform movement, Isaac Mayer Wise, promoted the formation of the Union of American Hebrew Congregations and shortly after effected the establishment of a theological seminary, the Hebrew Union College in Cincinnati. Later he also abetted the formation of the rabbinical association, the Central Conference of American Rabbis.

Two names in early American temple music should be remembered for contemporary purposes. The first, Sigmund Schlesinger, was the only Jewish musician to become widely popular. (Unfortunately, he remains so in some quarters but we shall deal with this subject later!) When he wrote vigorously his work was acceptable. But he inclined toward Italian sentiment and his overly simplified harmonies are quite offensive to some of us today.

The other musician was Edward Stark. Here was a man with a fine modern harmony. Utilizing an oratorio style, his cantor solo parts are excellent. The choir director should not assay Stark's services, however, unless his soloist possesses a very good voice.

The contemporary composers will, of course, be studied later. But it would be well to remember now that the most
important effect of the moderate Reform movement was to reduce the amount of modal recitative and to make the rhythmical forms predominate.

Sociological implications. To conclude this brief historical sketch a few sociological implications are included. At present writing there are approximately 5 million Jews in the United States, about 3.3% of the American people. Furthermore, 40% of all American Jews are in New York City and about 75% are to be found in five metropolitan communities.24

It would seem, therefore, that the areas in which the non-Jew could labor for Judaism are fairly small indeed. But self-identification spiritually is most important to the American Jew. The establishment of more synagogues and the increase in temple affiliation following World War II is a natural result. A very real problem of the temple congregations in the United States is quite evident, however, in that the principal time of worship service as established by the Jewish Sabbath is quite against the culture of the country. It is obvious that the twenty-four hour period from 6 p.m. Friday evening to 6 p.m. Saturday evening is definitely in competition with business and entertainment of all kinds viz. concerts, sports, motion pictures and TV. Some temples such as Temple Israel of Columbus, Ohio

are experimenting with supplementary "week-day" services on Sunday morning at which time both parents and children are in temple for worship; the results so far have been quite gratifying. A coffee hour just before the service and an occasional workshop on some specific festival are excellent stimulants to attendance.
CHAPTER III

TERMS

At first it would seem that the following material might better be placed in an appendix; its inclusion here, however, is intentional. The substance is far too valuable to the non-Jewish musician to risk its omission through lack of reference.

Reform; Orthodox; Conservative. It is of prime importance that we understand the general position of Reform Judaism in the spiritual realm. Judaism is a continuum with the Reform Jew at one end, the Orthodox Jew at the other, and the Conservative Jew somewhere between. The various tenets and practices are, of course, a study in themselves. Since we are concerned entirely with Reform Judaism, only the briefest detail of the other congregations is here presented.

In Orthodox synagogues the singing is done largely by a male cantor. His efforts are in Hebrew and unaccompanied, since organs are not allowed.25 The synagogue might be called "Agudas Achim" meaning congregation or band of brothers.

The Conservative synagogue may be a "Tifereth Israel" temple, meaning the pride of or the glory of Israel. Conservatives

differ considerably in such reforms as the organ, the mixed choir, English prayers and sermons, and the covering of the head. However, they all retain Hebrew prayers and some reference to the afterlife. 26

Reform Judaism is somewhat self-definitive. But to ascertain exactly what the Reform Jew believes is akin to asking the Unitarian to explain his faith or the free churchman to justify his liturgy. One must, of course, experience at least the whole church year even partially to understand the faith.

In brief, the goal of Judaism is Shalom, the dynamic peace in this world. It is then taken for granted that God will forgive, and that men should forgive. To most modern Reform Jews the concepts of a personal Messiah, angelology, and the sacrificial cult are quite in disregard. The idea of heaven is also subordinate even though such a luminary as Alfred Einstein has been known to use the phrase "heaven knows." 27

Church; synagogue; temple. The word church means the house of the Lord; the classified pages of the telephone directory often list: Churches—Jewish. It is preferable, however, to use the two terms synagogue and temple for the building in which all Jews worship and study; the latter term is the more

26 Idelsohn, op. cit., p. 335.
27 Einstein, op. cit., p. 30.
desirable as the congregation approaches the Reform end of the continuum, inasmuch as Reform Jews hold disaffection to reconstruction in Jerusalem. Synagogues (Greek etymology) came into being at the time of the Second Temple when the need for a house of assembly was strongly felt. "This organization...was instituted to enable the people to participate in the cult of the Temple."  

Talmud; torah; haftorah. Dr. Follman, in his lecture at Temple Israel, Columbus, Ohio, said:

The Talmud is a survey of the studies, thoughts, reflections, problems, and conclusions of the teachers and students of the rabbinical academies of Palestine and Babylon from Ezra to the sixth century of the common era... Through halakah (law) Biblical principles are applied to immediate needs; through haggadah (story) the spirit of Bible is preserved for all future generations.

A torah is a parchment scroll containing the Pentateuch and is read in Hebrew. When the reading is done in a chanting style (rarely in Reform temples), we have cantillation. The Haftorah (from the Prophets) is an appendix which takes leave of the Scriptures.

Ashkenazim; Sephardim. Ashkenazim are the central and Eastern European Jews after the exilic dispersion and include their descendants in such areas as America and Africa.

29 Jerone D. Follman, What You Should Know About Talmud.
30 Loc. cit.
Sephardim are the Jews who were found in Spain and Portugal before the Inquisition and, of course, their descendants; among the Sephardim we find most of the Jews in modern Israel.

Cantor; chazzan. It is a very real error for a non-Jew who sings in temple to call himself a cantor. Even a Jew must exercise understanding in adopting this title inasmuch as being a cantor requires a philosophy and a great deal of study; it is actually a way of life. The writer has utilized the phrase "cantorial soloist" for his own situation and has yet to hear an objection to its usage. During the Italian Renaissance and earlier a cantor was a musical director e.g. Claudio Monteverdi at the Cathedral of St. Mark in Venice. Originally in the synagogue and in the Church, both a reader (lektor) and a singer (cantor) were officially recognized. But the professional combination now seems to be confined to the temple where the trained individual receives the name chazzan.

Goyim; shiksa; shegitz. Technically, this thesis is written for goyim inasmuch as a non-adherent to Judaism is called a goy. The term is not necessarily a derogation anymore than are the terms, shiksa and shegitz, which most Jews consider less reprehensible. Any non-Jewish woman is a shiksa (the word does not connote a domestic as is so often implied.) If a Jewish woman marries a non-Jew, she has married a shegitz.
CHAPTER IV

THE JEWISH YEAR

The Jewish year is based on the natural day or light time which varies with the season of the year. In ancient times, for example, the month was established by the actual observation by witnesses of the rise of the new moon over the horizon of the sea. Announcement of the new month was made by a blast of the shofar. 31 It will be observed that the Jewish Sabbath is the seventh day of the Jewish week and is a rest day; it begins at 6 p.m. Friday and lasts until 6 p.m. Saturday evening.

The first day of the Year is Rosh Hashonah. Services are held on New Year's Eve and also New Year's Day Morning at which time the shofar ceremony occurs. This Holyday (comparing with the civil New Year) begins a period of ten days of penitence, the conclusion of which is the Day of Atonement (Yom Kippur), an entire day of prayer and meditation. The great significance of this day can be understood when we realize that the Ark of the Covenant in King Solomon's Temple was visited but once each year by the High Priest on the Day of Atonement, to make atonement for the sins of the people. 32 Modern rabbis encourage charity at this time rather than the blood offerings of earlier days. The parallel Christian day is Good Friday.

Shortly after Yom Kippur, the Reform Jew celebrates the first Festival of the Year for a period of seven days. This is the Feast of Tabernacles or Succos. A booth or suko is heaped with bountiful harvest products for this ancient festival. The Pilgrims patterned Thanksgiving Day after this celebration.

Chanukah is the Feast of Lights and of Dedication, and is symbolic of the conquest of darkness by light and of the victory of the Maccabees. Certain dedicatory ceremonies in the church such as paying off the mortgage would be a parallel.

The concept of Shabbas Shirah, the Sabbath of Song, is found in the 15th Chapter of Exodus. The Haftorah reference is the 5th Chapter of Judges. The tradition is that quails fed Moses and the children of Israel in the wilderness. Both because of the song of Moses and the association with song of nature's birds, this Sabbath often becomes the outstanding musical occasion of the Jewish Year. Temple Israel in Columbus, Ohio has the nationally known Ohio State University Symphonic Choir as its annual visitant.

Purim, the Feast of Lots, is next in sequence. In the Book of Esther we find the story behind this jolly holiday; the parallel Christian holiday is probably Christmas but obviously only because of the atmosphere of general merriment.
Next occur the other two Festivals of the Year, Passover and Pentacost. The first, the Festival of Liberation (Pesach) commemorates the emancipation of the Israelites from Egyptian bondage. A ceremonial supper called Seder is held the first day of the seven day Reform celebration. Christians incorporated some of these "Spring festivities" into Easter. It should be noted that The Lord's Supper, though continuous in time with the Feast of the Passover, breaks from it with the declaration of forgiveness.33

The second festival, the Feast of Weeks (Shabuoth) is celebrated for one day and marks the 50th day after Passover at which time mankind's first set of ethical rules was given to the people through Moses. The parallel is, of course, the birthday of the Christian Church.

The Reform Year closes with a Confirmation Service of great beauty and significance.

33 Gibson, op. cit., p. 69.
CHAPTER V
THE JEWISH SERVICE

Practically all of the liturgical procedures are to be found in the two volumes of The Union Prayerbook: Part II contains the services for New Years and the Day of Atonement; Part I contains all the remaining services for the temple Year. In other words, both Morning and Evening Services are found in Part I for the Sabbath, for weekdays, and for the three Festivals. In addition the special insertions for all the Feasts are present. One needs to be quite familiar with the Prayerbooks, therefore, in order successfully to implement all the Services. It should be noted that each service must have two elements: Praise (Shevah) and Prayer (Tefilla).34

Hymnody. Probably the most controversial part of the temple worship service is the Jewish Union Hymnal. Let us see why.

It is true that many church tunes became synagogue hymns. Lazare Saminsky reveals that the German melody Grosser Gott, wir loben dich (italics in the original) became the traditional En Kelohenu (None is like our God); a German ditty about "Louise" was employed in Sulzer's Havon t'hamizenu (italics in the original), the hymn closing the Yom Kippur afternoon service.35 Even the traditional Hanukkah hymn, Rock of Ages,

---

34 Idelsohn, Jewish Liturgy, p. xv.

Moos Tsur (italics in the original) is from Martin Luther's chorale "Lohn freut Euch, Ihr liebe Christen" (italics in the original) according to Idelsohn. 36 The writer has illuminated this example below:

Dear Christians, let us all rejoice (Lohn freut euch lieben Christen) Martin Luther (1523) Benedict Ducis (1480-1544); edited H.N.L. 37

Measures 1-5 Tenor voice

Measures 9-13 Tenor voice

Rock of Ages

adopted from the Ger. of Leopold Stein Old synagogue melody Moos Tsur

Union Hymnal- Third Edition No. 207 p.234

36 Idelsohn, Jewish Music, p. 171.

Likewise Jewish chants and tunes were taken over by the church. A Hebrew chant appeared centuries later in Milan as a great Catholic hymn *Te Deum Laudamus* (italics in the original).\(^{38}\) Leon Singer became Leoni, the opera star. His *Yiddish* (italics in the original) was arranged for the church by Thomas Olivers and became a selection found in many Protestant hymnbooks, "The God of Abraham, Praise."\(^{39}\)

In essence the above examples reveal the cause of the disputations among Jewish musicians. There is some resentment because the Jewish Union Hymnal is not primarily a Jewish effort. Furthermore if one studies the entire Hymnal he will find the usual harmonizations; these four-part choruses are quite unsatisfactory for congregational unison singing.

The criticism of Orthodox and even Conservative Jews should be disregarded principally because their faiths look somewhat askance at the employment of a hymnal. The criticism of Reform musicians is essentially that the hymns are not Jewish enough in both text and melody. Without belaboring the point it is sufficient to detail that not until the Third Edition (used in temples at the time of this writing) do we find even

\(^{38}\) Seminsky, *op. cit.*, p. 3.

\(^{39}\) Idelsohn, *Jewish Music*, p. 220.
one-fifth of the total hymns based on traditional synagogal chants. And of the new hymns written or adapted by Jewish composers, the writer can find little that is truly laudatory. Those hymns that attempt a specific cantillation mode are perforce associated with feasts or festivals. The many hymns that depart from the major mode, especially those featuring the augmented second, seem to do so in order to sound "Jewish." The writer suggests that these devices are merely an attempt to placate the Reform Jews who have not yet abandoned their Orthodox emotions and who feel that the old 'wailing through the nose technique' of expression was really the proper way in which to worship.

It might also be mentioned that inasmuch as each congregation in Judaism is autonomous, the rabbi's desires are very important; if he prefers hymns that the congregation knows in order to encourage their participation, then the good old-timers are the hymns that probably will be used.

Before leaving the subject of hymns it should be emphasized that attempts to stimulate and encourage congregational singing are quite prevalent in temples and, to some extent, synagogues as well as in all denominations of the Christian church.

---

40 Stevenson, op. cit., p. 181.
General service format. As previously stated the Sabbath Evening and Morning Services are quite completely detailed and controlled by The Union Prayerbook (Part 1.) The opening of the service is invariably an organ prelude which should cause the worshipers to think of spiritual matters; quite often Jews arrive early at Temple for meditative reasons. The Evening Service may then present an appropriate hymn. Some temples use "Shalom Alaychem" as a traditional opener and not without considerable merit. According to Talmudic lore two angels accompany every Jew on his way home from temple on Sabbath eve. Upon entering the home, the good angel blesses the household, providing it is found in good order; the evil angel is forced to consent to the blessing. If, however, the home is not properly prepared, a curse is invoked by the evil angel and the good angel must say 'Amen.' 41 Inasmuch as this legend is typical of the home material often brought into temple, its musical setting makes for a fine traditional opener.

As a closing hymn the writer would advocate such sturdy tunes as Adon Olom or Yigdal rather than the banal material of an Ayn Kaylohaynu.

We should observe that The Union Prayerbook uses the term 'anthem' quite indiscriminately for a hymn, choral chant,

41 Vinaver, op. cit., p.217.
or even a motet. A.Z. Idelsohn says, "The idea and style of the 'Anthem' is Christian and was especially developed in the English Church." No one would question the authority who has just spoken but the implication should be challenged.

Some of us have used Robert Baker's "Let all the world in every corner sing!" and especially his "O Lord God unto whom vengeance Belongeth" with great success in both temple and religious festivals. (Dr. Baker is the Organist at New York City's Temple Emanu-El and is a non-Jewish musician.) There are good settings of one of the great human experiences with God as revealed by the eighth century prophet Isaiah: "In the year that King Uzziah died...Then said I, Here am I; send me." There are scores of authoritative settings of the Psalms, both solo and choral, which are admirably suited for the music after the rabbi's sermon. And let us hear from the Musical Director of the above-mentioned Temple:

At the Temple Emanu-El of New York, whose music I have the honor to direct, we use for the hymn placed by the Union Prayer Book before...the Adoration, the fine chorals of Bach, Handel, Arcadelt, Purcell, Palestrina together with Jewish religious songs, traditional with the various branches of Jewry. That hymn before the Adoration is the natural and the best place for singing appropriate choral works by the great classical masters, including, of course, the great Jewish composers, Meyerbeer, Mendelssohn, Halevi, Rubenstein.43

42 Idelsohn, Jewish Liturgy, p. 379.
Multiple membership. The problem previously alluded to will now be investigated. It is to be remembered that Judaism is a continuum. Furthermore one's faith is not necessarily discrete by subscription to creeds as in the Christian faiths. It is possible and not at all improbable that a Jew might belong to three congregations (Orthodox, Conservative, and Reform) although dual membership is the more likely. This is to say that a given family may desire the traditions and reforms found in a Conservative congregation but much prefer the social and educative procedures of the Reform congregation. In this case, the family will support and worship in both situations.

It becomes obvious that meeting the musical needs of such worshipers is almost an impossibility. To ascertain whether choir directors in this general area of the country were attempting a solution to this problem, the writer contacted twelve rabbis and/or choir directors. Their names were the recommendation of Jacob Marcus, Director of Archives at Hebrew Union College, Cincinnati. Synagogues and temples were chosen where the problems of multiple membership might be the more prevalent. (Incidentally, Dr. Marcus was quite sure that no such investigation had ever been made.) The results are reported as a discourse rather than a tabulation.
Only one rabbi or choir director made any attempt to control his music on the basis of his constituency and this only because the Congregation was an amalgamation of a Reform and an Orthodox congregation. Even here the music utilized was almost entirely of Reform character.  

Dr. Eric Werner, Professor of Liturgical Music at The Hebrew Union College, had the following to say: "The problem of music for a congregation of multiple or dual membership can only be solved on the spot. No theoretical thesis, however intricately contrived, can do the trick."  

Of the remaining contacts, Jason Tickton was quite emphatic in proclaiming that it did not matter to him whether a member belonged to another congregation or not. He picks the music for his choir's and his own satisfaction. Morris M. Hershman stated that regardless of the fact that traditionally inclined Jews were affiliated with his Temple, no regard was taken thereof in the selection of the music for the worship service.

44 David Raab, (Letter, Terre Haute, Indiana), 1957.
45 Eric Werner, (Letter, New York City), 1957.
46 Jason Tickton, (Letter, Detroit, Michigan), 1952.
47 Morris Hershman, (Letter, Cedar Rapids, Iowa), 1957.
It would seem that the results of this investigation quite completely corroborate the thinking of Dr. Marcus in that the problem of music for the dual or multiple membership congregation may be present but that as such, it is not an issue. As we shall see later our chief recommendation would be that the music utilized is never predominate but rather always in the service of the totality of the liturgical idea.

**Transliteration.** By now it has been noted that no attempt has been made to give the pronunciations involved in the transliterations of the Hebrew texts. Frankly, they are quite simple and can be easily secured from any reasonably cognizant Jew; the hymnal is aimed at the typical English vernacular of American congregations, the majority of whom would employ the Ashkenazic method. Above all, one should not be unduly concerned with his inability to read the actual Hebrew—few Jews in temple achieve this laudable state. The important thing is to have a genuine sympathy and understanding of what this great faith is attempting to do.

**Parallels.** Many relationships exist between Christianity and Judaism; some were included in the discussion of the Jewish Year. Inasmuch as the first Christians were Jews, they continued Jewish celebrations. Jesus of Nazareth regularly attended
synagogue on the Sabbath and observed other festivities of his people. "He was entirely a Jew, in his breeding as well as his predilections and racial allegiance." It is pleasant to note that on the cultural level many Jews accept Christmas and that correspondingly, the Jewish New Year is becoming a time of mutual exchange of felicitations.

Of great significance to the writer is the probable source of some of the concepts held by the more liberal churches to-day. For example, the relationship between God and Israel, as between father and children, entitled every one to pray to God without priestly mediation. Yahveh (italics in the original) is 'Our Father' and occurs first in Isaiah; 'Our Father in Heaven' was a common Palestinian expression about the time of Christ.

---

43 Saminsly, op. cit., p. 206.
49 Gibson, op. cit., p. 40.
50 Idelsohn, Jewish Music, p. 102.
CHAPTER VI
CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Appropriate music. It has probably been made rather clear by now that the writer leans strongly toward the Judaic idiom rather than the Hebrew. The former, even with an alien melody, is much better suited to our modern temple requirements; its harmonic and rhythmic components are more attuned to our times. Why some of the most energetic prayers like the Kedushah (Holy, Holy, Holy!) should be set in lachrymatory modes is beyond comprehension. It is true that the main theme of "Hear, ye Israel" from the Mendelssohn Elijah has the sound which most people associated with Jewish music. But here we have corroboration of the basic tragedy of the Jewish composer; most listeners think that he should sing 'the song of Zion in exile.' Happily, the tendency today is towards the acceptance of the sturdier and more dynamic modes.

Again, to most Jews the great Kol Nidrei melody is the typical sound of Jewish music. (This selection opens the service on the eve of Atonement.) Yet the melody is not at all contemporary among Sephardic Jews. They possess an entirely different

51 Saminsky, op. cit., p. 74.
traditional melody of their own and one which does not have the same melodic interest.\textsuperscript{52} The point is that the very tune which most Jews think of as typically Jewish did not come from the secret cellars of Spain but more likely from the minnesingers or even the Gregorian area.\textsuperscript{53}

As an indication of what some choir directors consider inappropriate music let us discuss the Schlesinger service. Here is prime material if one wishes to recognize the Orthodox element of his congregation. Throughout the High Holyday services, Rabbi David Raab of the United Hebrew Congregation of Terre Haute, Indiana, utilizes the emotional status of Schlesinger.\textsuperscript{54} Usually in a tearful mode, this material appears even in the Atonement Music of so advanced a congregation as Fairmount Temple of Cleveland, Ohio.\textsuperscript{55} The writer concurs quite heartily with Robert Baker of Temple Emanu-El of New York City, who shuns Schlesinger completely.\textsuperscript{56} Bezalel Silberberg, Cantor of Congregation Shaarey Zedek, Lansing, Michigan, believes the service under discussion to be a parody of liturgical music, and of poor

\footnotesize
\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{52} Israel Rabinovitch, \textit{Of Jewish Music}, (1952), p. 68.
\item \textsuperscript{53} Loc. cit.
\item \textsuperscript{54} Raab, op. cit.
\item \textsuperscript{55} Rueben Caplan, (\textit{Letter, Cleveland, Ohio}), 1957.
\item \textsuperscript{56} Robert Baker, (\textit{Interview, Columbus, Ohio}), 1957.
\end{itemize}

33
operatic attempt. There is no indication of its inclusion in any of the Atonement music of the Atlanta, Georgia, Hebrew Benevolent Congregation.

This tirade against the Schlesinger-type will conclude by observing that one of the great non-Jewish authorities in the country to-day, C. Hugo Grimm of the Isaac M. Wise Temple of Cincinnati, Ohio has "carefully hidden all the Schlesinger material."

The above has not been merely tangential. It is an earnest appeal to all concerned (especially the Jew) to decide whether the tearful mode and the lyric tenor chazzan with the nasal quality are actually the means of identity that is desired by the modern Reform Jew. It is suggested that such is really not the case. Much to be preferred is the Judaic idiom as the generator of both rhythmic and harmonic material rather than the older and less flexible Hebraic style.

Good liturgical composers. The contemporary composers and directors of Jewish music are now considered with recommendations confined to those who have been within the experience of the writer.

58 Emilie Spivey, (Letter, Atlanta, Georgia), 1957.
59 Grimm, op. cit.
Jacob Beimel, Leo Low, A.W. Binder, Zavel Zilberts, Henry Gideon, Max Graumann, and Darius Milhaud are competent and enthusiastic Jewish musicians. The non-Jewish composers J.H. Rogers, W.H. Neidlinger, and Robert Baker as well as the Conservative Jewish composers M. Halpern and the Goldfarbs all have excellent material available.

"Frederick Jacobi bears the least pronounced Hebrew profile in spite of his devoted interest in Hebrew culture."60 Joseph Achron, on the other hand, insists on representing his 'race' regardless of his environs. Both of these men have fine Sabbath Evening Services in print.

Regarding Max Spicker, who is quite a standard in many temples, we find his successor saying that he was an earnest and noble human being, devoted to his duty but possessing no real knowledge of Jewish music.61

The writer's own preferences lean strongly toward the recent endeavors of Max Helfman, Lazare Saminsky, Julius Chajes, and Isadore Freed; here is the very essence of Reform Jewish music. For the New Year's Services one can always elicit fine congregational response with the Edward J. Stark settings as well as with Lazare Saminsky's Holiday Services.

If one elects the unusual, he can do no better than to

61 Saminsky, Music of the Ghetto and Bible, p. 175.
employ the recent Sacred Service transcription by the last named composer of the music by the great Salomone Rossi.

Inasmuch as service material is often difficult and sometimes impossible to find in many of our country's areas two of the leading publishers are here mentioned:

Bloch Publishing Company, New York City

Transcontinental Music Corporation, New York City.

It is also desirable to know "Publications for Judaism," Cincinnati, Ohio; for the shrewd director, The Jewish Song Book, Third Edition, can be an almost limitless source of varied material.

The writer has spent many hours at the Music Library of The Hebrew Union College, Cincinnati; research performed at this source as well as at the above publishers will prove most rewarding.

Suggestions. First, a plea is made for some unaccompanied singing, especially in the Service where a response is desired following the Silent Devotion. The net effect is so desirable, the spiritual results quite discernible. If the choir singers fear that they are unable to maintain pitch, try to convince them that this ideal is over-emphasized and probably a by-product of our respect for instrumental accuracy. A moderate departure by all the harmonic parts is hardly catastrophic. 62

Second, it is obvious that on many occasions the great leaders of Reform Judaism had to part with some of their long

cherished ideas and traditions in order to create and adopt the newer prayerbooks; why should not the individual worshiper attempt to release some of his ancient ties regarding "traditional" concepts of music. It should be the choir director's desire and responsibility to effect such changes. When he is considering the use of certain service materials let him keep the music unified in terms of basic style by using only the traditional, the Chasidic, or the modern. Let the non-Jewish choir director study diligently such efforts as this thesis-handbook. He may refer to such volumes as In the Choir Loft\textsuperscript{63} but he should remember that is obviously slanted away from him as one would quite properly expect from the Professor of Liturgical Music of Hebrew Union College.

Third and lastly, let the non-Jewish choir director realize that there is no unique Jewish musical sound! The Jew performs and creates in the culture of his environs. Ernest Bloch's music is usually deemed "Jewish" inasmuch as it possesses an abundance of augmented steps and heavy melancholy. But these are not exclusively Jewish. In program notes written by Bloch himself:

\begin{quote}
\ldots It is rather the Hebrew spirit which interests me, the complex, ardent, restless spirit which I feel pulsating throughout the Bible... the fierce love of the Hebrews for justice, the despair in the book of Ecclesiastes.\textsuperscript{64}
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{63} Eric Werner, In the Choir Loft, (1957).

\textsuperscript{64} Sam Horgenstern (ed.), Composers on Music, (1956), p. 413.
It is somewhat presumptuous for the writer to mention a composition of his in juxtaposition with one of Bloch's but the anecdote is worthy of inclusion.

At the Ohio State University Festival of Religious Music several years ago, the Rabbi of Temple Israel, Columbus, Ohio, was greeted enthusiastically by sons visiting rabbis following the Temple Israel Choir's performance of a setting of "V'shom'ru." Upon hearing their assertion that the composer must have a fine Chassidic background, Dr. Jerome Pollman replied that as a matter of fact, the composer was a Presbyterian (more correctly, an Episcopal-Unitarian).

We have merely met Jewish music, literally a laboratory for the testing of many tonal patterns. To study it and to become associated with it can be one of life's great rewards.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

A. BOOKS

Davison, Archibald T., Choral Conducting. Boston: Harvard University Press, 1940


Robinovitch, Israel, Of Jewish Music. Montreal: The Book Center, 1952


Stevenson, Robert H., Patterns of Protestant Church Music. Duke University Press, 1953


B. INTERVIEWS

Baker, Robert, *Interview*. Columbus, Ohio: The First Community Church, November 18, 1957. Dr. Baker is the Organist at Temple Emanu-El, New York City

Neisels, Saul, *Recital-Lecture*. Columbus, Ohio, Hillol Foundation, February 1, 1953

C. UNPUBLISHED MATERIALS; LETTERS

( Personal letters to the writer or lecture notes.)

Caplin, Ruby, *Letter*: October 22, 1957. Mr. Caplin is the Choir Director at Fairmount Temple, Cleveland, Ohio.

Pollman, Jerome D., *What You Should Know About Talmad*. Lecture notes, Columbus, Ohio, Temple Israel, April 5, 1957

Grimm, C. Hugo, *Letter*: October 20, 1957. Dr. Grimm is the Musical Director of the Isaac M. Wise Temple, Cincinnati, Ohio


Spivey, Emilie, *Letter*: October 22, 1957. Mrs. Spivey is the Director of Music for The Hebrew Benevolent Congregation, Atlanta, Georgia

Tickton, Jason H., *Letter*: January 2, 1958. Mr. Tickton is the Music Director for the Congregation Beth-El, Detroit, Michigan

Werner, Eric, *Letter*: December 26, 1957. Dr. Werner is the Professor of Liturgical Music at The Hebrew Union College

40