ADULT ARTS EDUCATION
A DELPHI STUDY FORECASTING THE ROLE OF THE ARTS
IN A LIFELONG LEARNING SOCIETY

DISSERTATION

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for
the Degree Doctor of Philosophy in the Graduate
School of The Ohio State University

By

Sue Anne Lafferty, M.A.

****

The Ohio State University
2002

Dissertation Committee:
Professor James Hutchens, Advisor
Professor Patricia Stuhr
Professor David Stein

Approved by

Advisor
Art Education Graduate Program
Copyright by

Sue Anne Lafferty

2002
ABSTRACT

As we deal with a rapidly aging population, the arts education and arts policy community needs to take an active role in providing insight into policies that address adult choices. This includes defining the role of the arts beyond K-12 education, intergenerational opportunities, and identifying connections with 'general well-being' age-based policies from leisure, recreation, and aging in the United States.

The Delphi Technique Method was used to identify what actions need to be taken to serve older adults and forecast the role of adult lifelong learning in the arts, as well as address the attitudes to such programming on the national, state, and local policy level. The anonymous Delphi - a qualitative forecasting method that is a structured group process that outlines the pros and cons of an issue, with the goal of identifying priorities of personal values and social goals - was sent to national stakeholders in arts policy, arts education policy, and gerontology. The stakeholders were chosen due to experience in their field, an exhaustive literature review, and recommendation from their colleagues. The data collected from this group identifies an overview of the attitudes, beliefs, knowledge of, and objectives and goals in serving the needs of adults and older adults in and through the arts. This research will provide insight into the characteristics and identify, if any, future predictions of local, state, and national initiatives of adult arts education.
Using the Delphi method, it was possible to develop a theoretical framework based on experts' vision, multiple perspectives, and comprehensive insight to address the role of the arts in a lifelong learning society. As we enter the twenty-first century, we are engaged in a wide-ranging process of redefining the character of the arts' common purpose. The door is open for the arts to become an important ingredient in the public purpose by involving the many adult learners of the twenty-first century. In order to take advantage of this opportunity and to accommodate the changing aging demographics, lifelong learning in the arts beyond K-12 education must be redefined.
Dedicated to my parents: my mother Judy and in loving memory of my father, Gary, for all you have done and for the example I aspire to be. To my siblings and their families, for your unconditional support and love. I truly am a better person due to your influences in my life. To Justin, thank you for your patience and numerous gifts of encouragement and understanding, but most of all for your unconditional love.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I wish to thank my committee members for their valuable contributions, guidance and on-going support during this process. I am extremely grateful to my advisor, Dr. Jim Hutchens, for encouraging this study and my intellectual growth over the past four and a half years. My work has made great strides under his guidance and never-ending support. I would like to thank Dr. Pat Stuhr for her enlightenment on the broader art education field and her constant support. Her contributions to my research will live on and I treasure the influence. I am indebted to Dr. David Stein for walking me through the hard times from start to finish. I thank him for providing the framework for my studies both in methodology and adult education. I have learned a great deal from each of them and my future successes are due to their efforts and time with my work.

I would also like to thank Donn Vickers of the Academy of Leadership and Governance and Christy Farnbauch and Wayne Lawson of the Ohio Arts Council for their support of my dissertation, consultant work, and friendship.
VITA

1992 .............................................. B.A. American Studies, Franklin College

1993 .............................................. Certificate, Arts & Culture, Florence, Italy
                      Richmond College

1993 – 1994 ...................................... Arts and Culture Coordinator, Franklin College,
                      Franklin, IN

1994 .............................................. J.F. Kennedy Center for the Arts
                      Adult Arts Education Intern

1994 - 1996 ...................................... Creative Learning Coordinator, Indiana Memorial
                      Union, Indiana University

1996 .............................................. M.A. Arts Administration, Indiana University

1997 - 1998 ...................................... Arts Educator, Music Center of the North Shore,
                      Winnetka, IL

1998 - 2001 ...................................... Research Associate, The National and Local Profiles
                      of Cultural Support, Arts Policy and Administration,
                      Art Education Department, The Ohio State
                      University

1998 – present .................................... Ohio Arts Council, Community Development Consultant,
                      Columbus, Ohio

1999 .............................................. Aging Specialization, Office of Geriatrics & Gerontology,
                      The Ohio State University, Columbus, OH

1999 – 2000 ...................................... OSU Preparing Future Faculty Participant, Capital1
                      University, Adult Degree Humanities Program

2001 .............................................. Editorial and research assistant, The Public Life of the
                      Arts, edited by Joni Cherbo and Margaret J. Wyszomirski,
PUBLICATIONS

Research Publication

2. The Arts and an Aging Society: Guide to Literature and Issues in Adult Arts Education. Occasional Papers #16, Arts Policy and Administration, Department of Art Education, The Ohio State University, Columbus, OH.


5. Defining the Arts and Cultural Universe: Early Lessons from the Profiles Project (co-authored with Therese Filicko). Occasional Papers #3, Arts Policy and Administration, Department of Art Education, The Ohio State University, Columbus, OH.


FIELDS OF STUDY

Major Field:   Art Education
Specializations in Arts Policy and Administration, Adult Education and Aging
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract........................................................................................................ii

Dedication.......................................................................................................v

Acknowledgments.........................................................................................vi

Vita................................................................................................................vii

Chapters:

1. Introduction and Purpose of Study.........................................................1

2. Background Literature............................................................................18

3. Description of the Project Methodology................................................80

4. Analysis of the Delphi Study.................................................................112

5. Summary, Conclusions and Recommendations.................................204

List of References.......................................................................................212
## LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Key Theme Percentages</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Arts Role, Arts Education and Arts Learning</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Higher Education/ Professional Organizations</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Defining Adults, Older Adults</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>Public Policy – Funding for Adult Arts Education</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>Partnerships</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>Participation</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>Arts in Healing/Art Therapy</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>Intergenerational</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.10</td>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF APPENDICES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>APPENDIX</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>Delphi Rounds Timeline</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>Advisor’s Pre-notice Letter</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.</td>
<td>Invitation Letter; Packet</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Introduction to Study</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Consent Form</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Geographic and Professional Role Form</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.</td>
<td>Description of Stakeholders Roles and Geographic Region</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E.</td>
<td>Delphi Pilot Outcomes</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F.</td>
<td>Final Top Five Votes</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.</td>
<td>Round III Responses – Questionnaire 3: Final Responses</td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H.</td>
<td>Themes of Importance</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.</td>
<td>The Voting Ballot Responses</td>
<td>285</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J.</td>
<td>Description of Voting Ballot by Role – Ranks and Themes</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K.</td>
<td>Final Votes of Stakeholders (based on Role)</td>
<td>325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L.</td>
<td>Final Ranks for Themes</td>
<td>331</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF ATTACHMENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ATTACHMENT</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Delphi Pilot Corrections for Final Questionnaires</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Initial Format of Questionnaires: Rounds I, II, III &amp; IV</td>
<td>336</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION

The purpose of this study was to identify the role of the arts in adult lifelong learning and the actions that should be taken to capture the adult, aging society. How does the arts community view lifelong learning, and how does its perspective impact older adult arts education? Since community arts development is experiencing great growth, it is important to turn our attention to adult education, particularly in relation to arts policy. Other questions considered in this study include:

- What common themes carry over between the arts and adult education?
- What conclusions can be made to inform arts policy and administrative practice about adult education in the arts?

This Delphi study was conducted to "forecast" the role of lifelong learning in the arts in an effort to inform arts policy, arts education and administrative practice. As Manheimer et al (1995) points out in *Transforming Older Adult Education*, "...the largest percentage of people over fifty-five involved in education is found in noncredit, continuing education..." (p. 11). Community arts organizations have responded to this demand by offering informal, amateur and avocational\(^1\) community programs for lifelong

\(^1\) Informal arts organizations are found throughout our communities. At times, these organizations are referred to as "unicorporated" activities. They are often the outlets for avocational arts; that is, they provide opportunities for professionals and amateurs alike to engage in arts activities. The American Assembly (1997, p. 10) describes the unincorporated arts as a "range of citizen-based" – community, avocational, traditional or folk arts, the indigenous arts in their many manifestations (Fillicko and Lafferty, 1999).
learning adults\(^2\). Research shows that amateur and avocational arts programs bring aesthetic experiences to adult learners. Such programs are based in arts and cultural organizations, parks and recreation organizations, community centers, senior centers, libraries, museums, zoos, etc. Adult learners and society in general have accepted these programs “as sharing a rightful place in the educational continuum...[pervading] all aspects of the lives of adults, including their careers, religious, recreational, cultural and social roles, as well as in the workplace” (Charters, 1999, p. 4). Yet, we must more clearly identify the benefits of non-accredited, informal\(^3\) learning programs, as well as the steps to achieve those benefits, such as leveraging the support of libraries, museums and other arts-related organizations.

Through previous professional work and studies in adult education, museum and community arts programming I have developed a strong interest in lifelong learning and belief that the arts should be a larger part of adults’ daily lives in our society. As a practitioner and scholar in the arts, my focus has been on adult learning in museum education, adult arts education [administration and program development] and community development. In addition, (for five-plus years) I have served as a personal fitness trainer for adults and master athlete adults, which has further piqued my interest in holistic wellness programs.

My desire to teach and to continue on my research path led me to this research stage. My professional goals have evolved to include; offering the average layman a

\(^2\) Such programs offer individuals links to art to form their conceptions of themselves and their worlds; leisure time art makers who spend parts of their lives in the nonprofessional production of art (Lapiere et al,1992-93).

\(^3\) Wain (1987) breaks down the philosophy of lifelong informal education to be considered “truly lifelong process whereby every individual acquires attitudes, values, skills and knowledge from daily experience
chance to gain insight into arts performances and art forms; encouraging personal growth and development of adults; and supporting greater community awareness and involvement in and through the arts. As an educator, I believe it is important to provide for the interests and needs of individuals, while keeping a balance between the internal and external needs of the arts and our communities.

Through my efforts to understand how the arts might better serve the needs of adult learners, I have become a strong advocate for alternative approaches and policies for adult education. Over the last several years, I have gained insight into the connections between arts policy, with its broader public purpose, and lifelong learning (for instance, in workforce education and wellness). I plan to continue working at the university and community level in adult education, both as a scholar and practitioner, to advocate the involvement of the arts in our aging society.

The biases I bring to the table include the belief that everyone is creative, and I assume that one’s creativity is linked to one’s wholeness and development as a person. The definition of the arts is broadening and now we need to answer the call for arts education for all. This research calls for a renewal of our commitment to lifelong arts education and practice. We need to be concerned with creating new arts education opportunities to offer the opportunity and capability to create and to speak in the voices of our diverse cultural groups, specifically as we age.

Questions that have arisen out of my professional experience have provided the conceptual structure of my study. How do policy makers at the local, state and federal level regard adult arts education? Are arts organizations and agencies prepared to serve and the educative influences and resources in his or her environment – from family and neighbors, from
the baby boomers as they age, an aging society? What policy mechanisms and funding systems in arts and adult education need to be addressed? This research is an exploratory look into adult arts education to move the issue forward.

Adult arts education is not a priority in arts policy-making, and in fact, it is often neglected by public arts agencies (Pankratz, 1990). According to many in the arts community, with the constant struggle for the arts in K-12 formal education and pressure to allocate scarce resources within organizations, the responsibility for adult arts education is left to local initiatives and the private sector. Yet, as Wyszomirski (2000, p. 55) has argued, "At the end of the twentieth century...we are engaged in a wide-ranging process of redefining the character of our common purpose." The door is open for the arts to become an important ingredient in the public purpose by involving the many adult learners of the twenty-first century. However, in order to take advantage of this opportunity, lifelong learning in the arts beyond K-12 education must be redefined.

To address the role of the arts in our everyday life, arts policymakers and educators need to realize the potential lifelong learning holds for enhancing the quality of life in our communities by providing support for value[s] of recreation, entertainment, leisure activity (Wyszomirski, 2000, p. 72). Longer life expectancy and longer life after retirement encourages participation in avocational activities that offer new experiences and contributions to society and learning (Fisher, 1998, p. 55). Lifelong learning, beyond K-12 education, needs to be on the arts policy agenda, providing encouragement to adults who are open to new educational experiences as well as those who need more urging. Arts policy support will ultimately validate the need for lifelong learning in our society, work and play, from the market place, the library and the mass media" (p. 52).
thus enhancing the individual’s quality of life as well as his or her contribution to our society.

The Rationale

It is important to understand how the arts policy and arts education policy communities define the role of the arts beyond K-12 education. In addition, there is a need to identify 'general well-being' age-based policies as we examine the topics of leisure, recreation, and the aging. We must take an active role in providing insight into policies that address adult choices as we face an aging population. The aging of the baby boom generation presents a number of policy dilemmas concerning the future of public pensions, healthcare programs, employment- and age-discrimination laws, and other emerging issues. This socioeconomic mix will affect the debate surrounding these issues, creating political and cultural variables (late retirement, increased immigration, sharply increased public and private saving) that make it difficult to predict outcomes. Aging is not only biological, but it also includes social, psychological, physical, and physiological processes. Given the challenges facing our society due to its rapid pace of an aging population, partnerships with aging specialists and carefully considered action on issues and reforms is needed for the arts to adequately address the aging Baby Boomers and beyond – we are all aging.

The average age of retirement is 64 years, but life expectancy is approximately seventeen additional years. By the year 2020, one in four individuals will be age 60 and over. My focus in on the population age 65-plus, a group currently composed of about 34.7 million (13% of the population), but is projected to double over the next three decades to nearly 70 million people (20% of the population). The Census Bureau projects
the 65-plus populations to be 39.4 million in 2010, 53.2 million in 2020, and 69.4 million in 2030 (U.S. Census Bureau, www.census.gov). Recently, the United Nations released a figure close to 600 million persons age 60 and older in the world by 2050. Currently, women reaching age 65 can expect to live 19.2 more years (to age 84) on average, and men, an additional 15.9 years (to nearly 81) (National Vital Statistics Reports, Vol. 47, No. 19; AARP, Administration on Aging, Agency for Health Care Policy Research, National Center for Health Statistics, The National Council on the Aging, National Endowment for the Arts (SPPA 1994), U.S. Bureau of the Census).⁴

According to a recent survey by the National Council on Aging, 67 percent of adults 65-plus years old state they are in the happiest time of their lives. And approximately $300 billion dollars a year are spent in health-care expenditures for older adults. Despite the fact that the majority of older adults suffer from at least one chronic disease, they believe by maintaining their health and well-being, they are successfully aging. This percentage will most likely increase with the Baby Boomer generation, as they are healthier, better educated, and have more disposable income. Thus, one of the major policy initiatives to address is maintaining their quality of individual and community life over the long term in and through the arts.

The workforce is another aging issue. Older adults are not retiring, they are "transitioning." Some are taking new, full-time jobs or switching to part-time employment; and some are exploring online learning, voluntary simplicity, spiritual practices and so on. This new cohort of "unretirees" impacts our workforce and lifelong learning programs within communities. Naturally, the economic, cultural, technological

⁴ According to Scripps Geronotology Center, Miami University, the number of Ohioans 65 or older will
and demographic changes are contributing to the growing interest in the notions of a learning society and lifelong learning. Currently, older workers (60 years and over) comprise 2.8 percent of the U.S. workforce. This number is predicted to rise significantly in the next decade, up to 35%. Corporate businesses have started to address this issue by implementing retiree hiring policies (Stein, 2000). The age-dependency ratio is expected to increase almost 70% between 2000 and 2030, reducing the number of workers to support retirees, so it is important that we recognize the phenomenon of retiring Baby Boomers and encourage them to remain active in some capacity (AARP, Administration on Aging, U.S. Bureau of the Census). The National Association of State Arts Agencies (NASAA) reports that “Businesses believe that the arts are an important component in building a well-educated workforce...[and that] their arts support is essential to educating children in their communities” (NASAA News, 2000). What about adults? As the focus on education and training comes to the forefront to sustain a competitive workforce, what role do the arts play? Can we incorporate art education into workforce education to increase creativity and cognitive skills – benefiting individuals and society?

The active involvement of many retirees in our society has had a remarkable impact on the stigma of aging. Retirement does not mean withdrawal from active life and society. The aging Baby Boomers are not anxiously awaiting retirement so they can sit idle and simply receive Social Security and Medicare. They are ‘revising’ the face of aging and are an important audience to target both in participation and enjoyment of the arts. Thus, this study is "...a challenge to the widespread assumption that development is
something that happens only to young people and that once we reach maturity we can settle into a nice, stable selfhood" (Breytspraak, p. 97).

Specifically, the following three references initially support this study's challenge to the assumption that development ceases once we reach adulthood: 1) the 1995 White House Conference on Aging, which summarized activities relating to the arts and humanities; 2) Bonnie Sachatello-Sawyers (1995) study on adult programs in museums; and 3) "Aging in Arts Policy" by Pankratz in Pankratz and Morris (1990), The Future of the Arts. Three major professional organizations, the National Art Education Association's Lifelong Learning Affiliate (NAEA LLL), the American Society on Aging (Lifetime Renewal Network) and the National Council on Aging have provided guidance in lifelong learning issues and adults and older adults programs nationwide. In particular, the NAEA's Lifelong Learning Affiliate has provided a broad framework for the majority of my research. Since its beginnings in the mid-1970s, the affiliate has been "concerned with the quality of art education "from womb to tomb"", but in practice, it is focused on adult art education outside the formal educational system" (Jones, 2000-1, p. 8).

Additionally, my own literature reviews on adult learning in the arts (1995, 2000) have provided a wealth of information on adult arts education programs, older adults and the arts, and the importance of recognizing lifelong learning and the arts. Furthermore, dissertations by Brockett (1982), Estrin (1985), and Henry (1989) object to the view that learning ends with formal K-12 education.

---


Research on arts participation indicates that "...regardless of income, there is an overall substantial decline in arts participation for people born prior to 1946" (Terry, 1997). The Baby Boomers made up a large percentage of the 76.2 million adults who attended performing arts events or exhibitions in 1992 (Robinson, 1993). However, recent studies of this generation have shown a decline in arts participation. Attendance rates are not as high as anticipated prior to the SPPA 1992 survey (Love, 1995; Orend and Keegan, 1996; Peterson, R., et al., 1996). Since boomers have more years of education, they were expected to have higher arts participation, but they are not attending as they mature into mid-life. Though the adult rates are lower than expected, for most arts administrators succeeding generations, such as generation X, cause higher concern for the future and draw the focus away from aging adults.

What activities are older adults pursuing instead of the arts or arts education? Reports point to the widespread use of television, radio and cassettes, videotapes, and CDs as the possible culprit. Changes in socio-economic and demographic characteristics make it imperative that arts education, particularly, community arts organizations, address opportunities to encourage aging Baby Boomers to become involved in the arts. The demographic data projections, used with audience profiles within communities, can help arts organizations target their aging audiences and reexamine their operations to change and encourage interaction (support, audience development, volunteering, etc) with this cohort. There is an opportunity to reach older adults with time on their hands to benefit all involved.

The arts can provide circumstances for lifelong learning and service to others. With increased leisure time, aging adults’ participation can include mutual benefits: (a)
volunteerism; (b) increased consumers and users of service; (c) self-expression
opportunity amidst loss (jobs, spouses, health, income, etc.), reengagement, etc.; (d)
contributions and resources to other generations (inter-generational workshops). The
arts, in general can aid this and future generations by valuing their independence,
interdependence and promoting their quality of life.

Purpose of This Study

As we face an aging population, the arts education and arts policy community
needs to be proactive in providing insight into policies that address adult choices.
Policies that should be examined include defining the role of the arts beyond K-12
education and identifying connections with ‘general well-being’ age-based policies from
leisure, recreation, and aging. In this study, I provide an overview of the arts field’s
attitudes, beliefs, knowledge and objectives and goals in serving the needs of older
adults. Beyond creating an inventory of issues and themes in adult arts education, the
overall outcome of this study is to measure support across arts policy makers and
educators and to evaluate the next steps to impact adults and older adult arts education
programs. This exploratory study will contribute to the growth and development of adult
arts education by serving as a resource on adult lifelong learning in the arts.

Qualitative methods, specifically the Delphi technique, will contribute to the
overall framing of this study -- as "...qualitative methods are notably suited for grasping
the complexity of the phenomena we investigate...the 'everyday' phenomenon of aging in
our society" (Peshkin, 1988, p. 416). Content analysis and the historical method was

---

7 There are several audiences for such a guide: the cultural policy community, specifically arts agencies and
organizations interested in adult arts education in their communities; the scholarly community in cultural
policy, arts education, and the nonprofit sector; adult education scholarly and practitioner communities; the
used to gather information on the history and current status of policy in older adult and arts education. I reviewed archives of public arts agencies, adult education programs, parks and recreation organizations, and arts education departments; past studies, surveys, and conferences; and websites of community-based programs to gain an understanding of the historical background of older adults arts education. My historical research focused on current and past older adult arts programs and adult, older adult learning styles.

For the purposes of this study, the literature review includes: arts policy, arts education, aging policies, older/adult education, community development, leisure and recreation, creativity, and psychology. I also focused on historical research of adult arts programs and adult learning styles. Key questions addressed through this representative literature review that help outline the broad role the arts play in everyday life include: (1) how is education defined by adult and arts educators; (2) are there significant differences between, in and through the arts programs that serve adult learners and if so, how do they differ in their theories and programs; and (3) what types of adult arts programs, formal, informal, and avocational are offered by arts organizations, universities, and other community organizations? I utilized ERIC, the Arts and Humanities Index, and other research databases to locate literature sources of practice and theory-based articles outlining key ideas that relate to formal or informal adult arts education in a community or university setting. This research focuses specifically on connecting adult arts program
examples found in the representative search, as well to inform practice in outlining where stand in adult arts education and to forecast future arts policy decisions.

I have reviewed and identified more than eighty-five dissertations, beyond the representative literature search of journal articles and books, dealing with adults and the arts. The dissertation topics I found related to my study include the following areas: adult education, art education, creativity, music education, sociology, recreation, and gerontology. The majority of dissertation abstracts support the need for further study in adult arts education and lifelong learning. Several dissertations have provided additional literature sources and frameworks; however, I have yet to find a study that identifies lifelong learning and adult arts education in a policy sphere, or that suggests policy initiatives for community-based adult programs in relation to a forecasting model.

After reviewing a variety of articles, books, dissertations, etc., it is clear that although the development of general adult arts education has been sporadic, the life-long learning concept in not new. What is new is the kind of approach and attitude arts policy leaders and arts educators need to take toward adult leisure and educational activities – a multi-disciplinary approach.

Theoretical Framework

The framework for this study is grounded in the policy concerns and themes of arts policy, arts education, and adult education as they relate to lifelong learning. Influences from the broader spheres also include leisure in education; Third Age Universities; and the general well being of our society. The current trends and issues that coincide on the policy front for each of these areas share the following components:

---

8 This literature review will be expanded, as well as developed into a resource guide in partnership with
community development; quality of life; avocational programs; underserved populations; and increase in leisure-time.

The Delphi method makes it possible to develop a theoretical framework based on the visions, multiple perspectives and comprehensive insights of arts policy, arts education policy, adult education, and gerontology stakeholders. This framework addresses lifelong learning in the arts by identifying: (i) adult lifelong learning issues; (ii) common themes between the arts and older adult education; and (iii) connections with 'general well-being' age-based policies from leisure, recreation, and aging. I chose the Delphi Method technique because (a) this issue does not lend itself to precise analytical techniques, but can benefit from subjective judgments on a collective basis, and (b) the role of lifelong learning can be viewed as a complex/broad issue -- as it does not have a history of adequate communication within the arts community on this topic, and (c) the stakeholders represent diverse backgrounds with unique experiences and knowledge.

The stakeholders chosen reflect leaders in their field: art education, arts policy, adult education, and gerontology -- ranging from researchers to practitioners to older adults themselves -- who may or may not have a specific interest in adults. They were chosen due to experience in their field, from the literature review, and recommendations by their colleagues, as well as my Advisory Committee. Their contributions to their field and community in general is important to maintain a wide distribution and diversity within the participants. The normal process of the Delphi Method includes four phases (Rowe and Wright, 1999; Linestone and Turoff, 1975; Leirman, 1996; Murray and Hammons, 1995) which serve as the objectives for this study: (1) Exploration of the subject, in this
case older adult arts education; (2) Identification of group views on this issue, including agreements and disagreements; (3) Exploration and evaluation of disagreements; and (4) Analysis of all information and evaluations fed back to the group for further consideration. The overall goal is to have the stakeholders arrive at a general agreement on the priorities so that this study provides insight for decision-makers to act and initiate long-term planning of the arts’ future role in a lifelong learning society.

The research questions that form the conceptual structure of the entire inquiry are examined in Chapter Two. They include: What current educational literature concerning general adult and art education has relevance to this study and how does it apply to the interpretation of my data; Why art education? What are the values associated specifically with education and human development in and through the arts; What are the policy implications of lifelong learning in adult education and its link to the concept of lifelong learning in arts education; And, how do the policy perspectives of aging and adult education connect with adult arts education? How does this support the argument that adult art education merits a place on the national arts policy agenda? Chapter Three presents the Delphi process and a description of the present study. Chapter Four presents an analysis of the Delphi group’s results in relation to current literature and movements in arts education, arts policy. What were the top five issues for these stakeholders? What are the key themes and ideas to move this issue forward? In conclusion, Chapter Five presents a summary of the study and recommendations.

My research findings will contribute to the collective action for adult lifelong learning policy development. The timing for this study coincides with the re-shaping and re-definition of age-based policy and arts policy for ‘society as a whole’ policies. With
constant debate and issues of Social Security, Medicare, and Medicaid at the heart of age-based policy, how are the arts involved in the movement of successful aging? In addition, the arts policy and arts education policy communities are challenged by the growth in leisure and its effects on age-based public policy. This framework lends itself to a forecasting study that can provide insight into how the arts need to address the educational, demographic, and social trends of the 21st century through lifelong learning. Today, arts policy and arts education policy seldom address adult arts education. This research will be a call for a renewal of our commitment to lifelong learning in arts education. We should be concerned with creating new arts education opportunities that are filled with context, meaning, and the opportunity for human growth in our communities.

Significance of the Study

What current community-based adult arts education programs are offered at the state and local level and what is their general policy on supporting such programs, if any? "Approximately 200 federal programs, 50 state arts agencies, and nearly 4,000 local arts agencies are engaged in cultural policy issues ranging from funding concerns to regulatory issues to public/private partnerships and investment incentives" (Cherbo & Wyszomirksi, 2000). Where does adult arts education fit in this scheme? In addressing this question, my research will examine adult education initiatives, as well as current strategies, theories and policies that address adult programming within our communities. Thus, my research is grounded in the school of thought that such programs can be viewed both as practical and philosophical commitments to the arts and the community. Lifelong learning has become a topic of interest for many arts organizations and is continuously
mentioned as a long-term vision for community-based programs. However, the lifelong learning focus is often only present in discussions or time-based programs and/or projects, and is not put into consistent practice. Also, lifelong learning does not mean through one’s lifespan. The issue of our communities’ quality of life through avocational programs continues to be on the agenda.\(^9\) Avocational programs are community-based and exemplify the state's commitment fostering arts and culture for the well being of current and future generations. The state support of amateur and avocational programs serves as a reassurance of the socioeconomic benefits of the arts, which is the current vehicle for building future support for the arts at a local, state and federal level. The educational value of the arts is an important component in any search for democracy and excellence. Yet, adult education is not a major focus area for arts programs, nor is it a priority in the allocation of grant money.

As the aging population continues to affect the leisure learning market, this study will provide insight into arts initiatives for an aging society. There are many opportunities for arts programs to reach their full potential for engaging the adult population. This study will identify opportunities for educators to serve the diverse needs and interests of their adult audience. There is much room for further investigation of adult education in community-based art programming. Though most avocational adult learning is centered on encouraging personal growth and development, it also supports community involvement. The arts community needs to encourage the opportunity for human growth, in or through the arts. Such programs are instrumental in engaging adults with intrinsic and extrinsic outcomes. McRae’s (1994) *The World in 2020: Power*,

\(^9\) The 1997 American Assembly outlined avocational and informal arts as one of the five public purposes of
Culture, and Prosperity looks to artistic expression, specifically creativity, as the vital asset for the future for both groups and individual.

This study will contribute to the growth and development of adult arts education by serving as a resource on lifelong learning in the arts, describing national, state, and local initiatives, as well as future policy decisions and outcomes affecting such programs. Though this study defines the target population of 65- plus, forecasting the rise in our aging population -- it is a call for lifelong learning for all and for continued learning along one's lifespan. Involvement of the arts community in adult education can serve the communities of this nation with a societal benefit that can produce positive results that are economic, cultural, ecological, spiritual, and, of course, educational. As we move into the twenty-first century, communication among adult educators, gerontologists, art educators and policy-makers will become important ingredients in achieving a new role for the arts in aging ‘for all’ policy, leading to new directions and powerful, positive results.
CHAPTER 2
LITERATURE REVIEW

This chapter presents a review of literature in four key areas: (1) general adult and art education; (2) the value of art education; (3) lifelong learning; and (4) current arts policy in relation to adult education.

Adult Education and Art Education

This section addresses adult and art education literature that has provided insight and guidance to my understanding of the state of adult arts education today. Educational gerontology is also noted, due to pertinent information on the aging adult learner.

Adults, in general, look for ways to gain perspective, find enjoyment and overall, enrich their lives. As independent learners, adults often search for education programs that relate to personal interests and to acquiring skills or understanding that will help answer their immediate questions about daily tasks, issues and/or life, in general. Whatever their reasons for seeking education, adults have an abundance of options for achieving their learning objectives. Although learning may not be the ‘most desired outcome’, it is the ‘most sought after’ (Pierce, 1980; Ragheb, 1980; Hawes, 1978). The arts have an opportunity to develop and expand their programs to the needs of an adult audience. As we age, we collect information through our experiences, and from this base of knowledge we build more knowledge – resulting in what Collins (1981) calls
"crystallized intelligence." Adults therefore, are often motivated to undertake education with the hope or expectation of learning something that will take their current knowledge to a higher level and further enhance their lives.

Due to the large growth and development of adult education and recreation in the 1980s, the 1990s called for assessment of programs in the leisure learning market and their effect on society as a whole. Adult education is imperative to arts education. Based on available research, how should the arts address an aging society? What criteria, if any, are used to make policy decisions affecting leisure choices, particularly in arts education for adults?

**Aging.** To understand the concepts of adult and art education, we must first address the phenomenon of aging and its effects on the adult learner. Our society equates aging with disease, frailty, social isolation, adversity and loss, but that is not aging today. Aging involves the social, behavioral, and life stage changes that occur over time as one grows older. It is obvious that there is no single cause of aging, but multiple causes. Some age-related changes may be unavoidable, like senescent\(^\text{10}\) features are out of our control. But some changes could possibly be avoided due to lifestyle choices or accommodations/compensations to system capacity losses and function changes.

Age-related changes may be considered as changes in physiology, structure, or function that show an increase in probability of occurrence with increasing age, but may not manifest in all individuals at the same time age or even occur in all prior to death...[whereas] age-determined changes as better viewed as changes

\(^{10}\) Senescence is the biological process of becoming older, which the "progressive degeneration following a period of development and attainment of maximum reproductive potential that leads to an increased
that are invariable and universal aspects of a species' life history. (Crews, forthcoming, p. 11)

Through research on how productive and continuous activity and leisure choices enhance the environments in which people are aging, we can continue to break down the mystery of aging and counter the stereotype of difficult old age. This is just one area to address in a proactive policy stance in an aging society.

In addressing the age-old question of why people become old, the goal of aging is not to find the fountain of youth, but to understand the aging process and improve the quality of life for the growing numbers of aged. Redefining the 'problem' – the condition of aging – better, allows for different policy options and emphasis. Is there one theory that answers the myth of aging? Is to become old a loss of power, both financial and physical? Is it to lose one's independence and one's flexibility and potential for growth? Is there a loss or stagnation of intelligence?

Looking at the nature of adult intelligence, how intelligence in adulthood is assessed and what happens to intelligence as people age, most current research supports that adult intelligence appears relatively stable, at least until the sixth or seventh decade. If a decline in functioning does exist, it appears to apply primarily to the maximum versus average levels of functioning (Baltes, 1993; Dixon et al, 1984; Cattell, 1979; Cross, 1981; Knox, 1977; Thorndike, 1928). In addition, Shuldiner (1992) states that the "readiness of older adults to learn may be more often a function of previous learning experiences than of age-related cognitive (dis)abilities" (p. 443). In fact, there are still questions today about the popular standard measures in testing adults. Is verbal better
than performance? Are we paying attention to designing tests that take into consideration the different stages, as well as experiences, over the lifespan? Life situations and goals of adults need to be considered. According to Botwinick (1978), there are four key factors in reviewing age and intelligence: 1) one's definition of age or aging; 2) definitions of intelligence; 3) types of tests used to measure intelligence; and 4) effect on learning ability still not known for later adulthood beyond the Terminal drop\textsuperscript{11} in intelligence within a few years of death. Thus, intelligence is multifaceted with some abilities declining while others remain stable or even increase – varying with each individual. Therefore, an assumption can be made that in adjusting to the aging process, older adults choose those areas of the intellect they wish to enhance and thus engage in efforts to compensate, enhance or even master these abilities.

Over time, aging has been constructed as a problem, a burden for society. As we become more aware, through science and development progress, we can gain a better sense of how to define aging. We need to look beyond using biological theories only to describe the aging process.

There are multiple biological and sociological theories of aging, but in particular, a couple that relate to the topic of lifelong learning and my study: Selyes Adaptive Energy Biological Theory and Ashley’s Continuity Social Theory of Aging. Selyes theory refers to psychoneuroimmunology\textsuperscript{12} (how stressful social situations can cause suppression of the immune system) and wear and tear (break down due to over use). Selyes focuses on maintaining moderation and adapting to stress. Due to our long, hard-

\textsuperscript{11}Terminal drop refers to extreme drop in intelligence many aged experience right before death.

\textsuperscript{12}Crews (2000); also Borysenko (1987); Pert (1987); Miller (1996).
working lives, we face ‘wear and tear’ issues and extreme stress on our aging systems. He identifies three stages. First, alarm and stress increase and our bodies react to stress. We are exposed to so many stressors in a lifetime. Over a period of time, we lose our original balance of stress and we have an energy depletion. Second, the resistance stage, which is the adaptation to stress. This depletes over time and the recovery is slow. Thus, life becomes a series of adjustments – adjustments between stress response and utilization of energy and adapting to our lifestyle. Third is the exhaustion stage. If we continuously experience high stress, eventually our bodies are worn down and there is a breakdown of the immune system. Now one is exposed to illness and disease, and there is no recovery time due to prior depletion of resources (1980). Selyes’ argument is that stressors lead to negative behavior and that if we can change from irrational to rational, one can prolong a healthy life. What we do today predicts our ‘shape’ in the continuum of life. This theory relates to Ashley’s Continuity social theory. Ashley’s theory relates to a common activity theory\(^\text{13}\) that was initially proposed by Havighurst (1968). Successful aging is related to higher levels of life satisfaction, which is characterized by continual development and application of roles and activities to apply to life’s changes (Howe, 1987). The key components include role activity and self-esteem as they relate to one’s aging. According to Ashley (1989), “In making adaptive choices, middle aged and older adults attempt to preserve and maintain existing internal and external structures…by continuing to learn external and internal coping strategies and applying those familiar strategies to different arenas of life.” Thus, the theory is based on developing coping strategies throughout life to adapt to the aging process.

\(^{13}\) Staying involved and having a social support network leads to engagement, greater health versus
Each theory, biological and sociological, refer to the nature of the society in which individual aging occurs, the influence society has on its aging and the impact aging has on society. This relates to the ‘general well-being’ emphasis in lifelong learning. The roles\textsuperscript{14} that adults choose to be involved with are an important component of retirement and of their health status. With the ever-changing roles in adulthood, learning activities provide “some continuity, enjoyment, and belongingness as [older adults] accept their new identity as a retiree” (Wapner, 1985, p. 291-315).

Incorporating the above mentioned theories into my study relates to helping persons of later years adapt to old age and aging, and recognition of how social roles can intervene and assist the individual with re-connecting with society and themselves. The aging process is shaped by social contexts, history, cultural meanings and location.

There is much to be gained by viewing the concept of aging as a byproduct of culture – its values, institutions, and forms of thought. In this sense there is no ‘natural course of aging’. To define natural aging as a form of ‘biological decline’ is itself an outcome of our cultural values and beliefs at a particular time in history. And it is this realization that invites us to enrich the conception of aging. This is not only to say that we are free to reconceptualize what we have hitherto called ‘biological decline’. For example, is ‘slowing down’ necessarily a decline, or could we begin to appreciate such bodily changes as an opening to new dimensions of tranquility? (Gergen and Gergen, 2002).

\textsuperscript{14} Wapner (1985) identifies four modes of adapting to retirement: 1) transition to old age (winding down of sorts); 2) new beginning (freedom to pursue own interests); 3) continuation (less-pressured way, wants vs. have to); and 4) imposed disruption (sense of loss and frustration of new role).
Our everyday life creates, maintains the social meaning of aging through the societal norms that affect our choices. Thus, the realities of aging are socially constructed. Fortunately, we are seeing our society challenge the negative attitudes and stereotypes of aging. There is a need for persons of later years (PLYs) and the aging process, in general, to be valued and accepted in our communities. Successful aging – conscious aging – is possible in constructive, creative ways that benefit the individual and society. With a multi-disciplinary aspect of aging, we need to direct research to the “relative well-being and life satisfaction of older persons in our society” (Myers, 1996, p. 2).

**Adult Development and Implications to Art Education.** To understand the contribution of art education episodes to adults, a review of types of adult learning programs and different adult learning styles is crucial. Cognitive development in adulthood describes the thinking patterns that change over time -- interaction of social and cultural variables. Piaget (1972), though he specifically studied children to adulthood, his research relates to adult cognitive developments. He identified the different ways of making sense, understanding, and constructing knowledge of the world. His contributions include: active versus passive role of learner in constructing knowledge; and the conception of mature adult thought termed as formal operations. Labouvie-Vief (1990) identified that there may be variables related to one's social context rather than to one's age that account for particular developmental gradients in cognition. Goodnow and Warton (1991) build on a similar framework that gives more attention to acquisition of values, the concepts and principles adults bring to interactions, and how the social context may or may not be affected.
In looking at research of older adults and productivity, most adults have the desire and the potential to be productive. In community-based informal arts education programs, there is value in older adults' artistic exploration – knowledge for its own sake. The older adult participants bring with them a "social intelligence," which "...is a verbal comprehension that has been developed over a lifetime of social interaction and discourse...[social interaction is] experiential knowledge that comes with the "praxis" of social relationships, of living in the world..." (Shuldnner, 1992, p. 443). This 'intelligence' that older adults bring with them, their personal experience, becomes the "touchstone" for their learning. The learner has an active role in transferring this knowledge in a manner they desire (i.e. self-directed). The majority of community adult arts programs are self-directed and are pursued according to one's own interests, whether personal, professional, etc. Because the learner chooses what and when to learn, he or she is in control of the learning environment, which only increases the benefits gained from the experience.

Humanistic and social Learning theories are commonly applied to the informal learning episode. They are humanistic in the manner that an older adult participates as "a personal act to fulfill potential...It is a self-directed, autonomous choice" (Merriam & Caffarella, 1997, p. 138). The focus is often on the individual and self-development, although most are social in that the interaction of others and the experience of the social context contains a "locus of learning: interaction of person, behavior, and environment" (Merriam & Caffarella, 1997, p. 138). The informal learning experiences offer a positive learning episode and the opportunity to fulfill a personal objective, as well as increase awareness of social issues. Society as a whole benefits whenever individuals become knowledgeable and desire to use that knowledge to affect a positive change in their lives.
Wilson's (1993) quest for a more "accurate understanding of how adults learn," identifies the activity within its context as the focus. Wilson reflects Edgar Dale's (1969) Cone of Experiences, which lists stimulated experiences as the most concrete and high level of involvement and permanency of learning. Dale's real-life situations relates to Wilson's situated cognition in that it is the interaction within the setting that is key. Wilson takes it a step further and views "interaction with the setting itself in relation to its social and tool-dependent nature that determines the learner" (p. 73). The adult learner's own life experiences become valued within the learning experience. Wilson looks to Rogoff and Lave (1984) and Lave (1988) to support his claim in that "cognition is a social activity that incorporates the mind, the body, the activity, and the ingredients of the setting in a complex interactive and recursive manner" (1993, p. 72).

Reviewing the community-based learning episodes, some definitely fall into this type of learning. Of course, having prior knowledge [tools] and life experiences is not a prerequisite for positive learning experiences. The majority of programs reviewed accommodate all types of learners, from novice to expert. Sometimes simply the 'interaction' amongst the participants is key to the outcomes of a learning episode. The sharing of experiences, not the 'actual' activity, supports a learning experience. The understanding of the cognition tools and the dynamics of interaction set the tone. Bandera's theory of reciprocal determinism also recognizes the multiple interacting variables, such as personal, behavior, and environment, which affects one's beliefs, actions, and interpretations in a learning setting (Bruning et al, 1995). This relates to a model used in museum visitor behavior Falk and Dierking (1992) recommend, which
takes into consideration different points of views, as well as personal, social and professional contexts presented.

The constructivist theory incorporates the knowledge and motivation that adults bring with them to learning episodes. It has been popular in adult museum education programs, as well as the novice-expert paradigm in art education\textsuperscript{15}. It is based on the idea that learning is best when information or new knowledge is built on what is already known – and it is actively “constructed” by the learner (Prawat, 1994). Constructivism measures change in knowledge, the depth and mastery of a subject. Using this theory, adult art educators first must have a sense of their adult participants, then build on this input and create programs that connect them with the subject matter. Constructivism builds on the past cognitive developmental stages Piaget identified from childhood to adulthood, of interpreting and understanding constructively by using their own resources. By recognizing the learner’s potential and motivation, there is active involvement and strengthening of knowledge-base. As arts organizations and/or arts programs are being challenged as never before to confront complex social issues and to assume a more active role in improving the texture of everyday life, they are reaching out into the community as a resource. The constructivist theory is a major factor in achieving a wide range of alternative offerings to the adult public that will fit individual needs, experiences, and circumstances. It works well with adults due to the store of information from life experiences that they bring with them and the connections they can make with new ideas. Through this type of ‘meaning-making’, adults are engaged in active inquiry, rather than passive received information. One creates the possibility to learn for him or her self. The
choice/volunteer atmosphere of older adult arts programs creates a non-threatening environment that can be enhanced when art educators understand who their participants are and recognize the store of information that both novices and experts have constructed from their past experiences, knowledge-base. Guildford (1950) reinstates this thought in addressing creativity: "...a knowledge of the functions is important. No creative person can get along without previous experiences or facts: he never creates in a vacuum or with a vacuum...our main objective [is] to teach students how to think, and this means also to think constructively" (p. 448).

The constructivist theory has been valuable for adult educators incorporating multicultural programs. It requires the educational format to be structured in relation to the values and beliefs of the learners: the socio-cultural factors. Constructivism is centered on an adaptation model – new knowledge is constructed through negotiation and interpretation of ideas from older learners and the facilitator (instructor). Recognition of the store of information that participants have constructed from their past experiences, their knowledge base, creates a give and take environment.

Koroscik (1997b) takes this approach a step further by identifying what each person brings into an experience, the necessary “tools” for interpretation, to examine the differences between the way novice (unskilled) and expert (highly-skilled) visitors view artwork and the ‘reconstructions’ that take place, thus, enhancing one’s own creative potential, moving from novice to expert. Because there are multiple interpretations in understanding artworks, Koroscik looks at three facts of cognition to help art educators set goals for learning. The three stages are the knowledge base (what one brings),

15 Efland (1993) labels constructivism under ‘knowledge-base, strategies, and dispositions’ for learning and
knowledge-seeking (guides new knowledge, new understandings), and disposition (motivation/willingness to learn) (1997b, p. 6). Disposition is what many adult educators consider in reviewing participation in choice programs. It is intrinsic, for one’s own sake. It is important to recognize there are many driving forces behind adult motivations in learning.

In adult learning there is some stress on the importance of emotion and its link to learning. The most common trait is one learns when one feels secure, comfortable, and is enjoying oneself. When an adult is able to establish relationships and/or a bond with an art style or actual work, learning is more effective and positive. As Koroscik explains in her work, with novices, it is almost automatic to look for relation to themselves in looking for meaning. By building a personal connection, learners can reconstruct their knowledge base and search for new underlying meaning. The aesthetic experience offers the same thrill of discovery whether a novice or an expert (Chambers, 1989). Individuals learn in different ways, and interpret information through their own personal knowledge, experiences, and beliefs. This is how adults personalize the experience, whether museum, opera, or amateur choir at church. It is dictated by their individual needs. Allowing opportunities to address their needs, such as aiding adult novices who are unable to identify the challenges offered by works of art, there is a greater chance that a ‘transfer’ will occur. In order for a transfer to take place, the learner must be able to retrieve his or her knowledge base when searching for new knowledge, perceive information to be conducive to the maintenance or enhancement of self, and have the desire to learn (Koroscik, 1997b; Nichols, 1984). In general, community adult education teaching implications for arts educators.
programs are characterized as personal enrichment opportunities. Through the use of the constructivist theory [or other ‘facilitated’ learning theories], a learner’s context can be enhanced with new ways of inquiry and discovery, rather than just passively receiving information. By building on the learner’s connections, learners can reconstruct their knowledge base and search for new underlying meaning and enjoy the creative process.\(^{16}\) What is crucial in any learning style, whether situated cognition or constructivism, is the connection of the subject matter with the learner’s world – both as an individual and a part of society. Adult art education programs have the capability to contribute to adult learning at different stages of life – enhancing the process of learning that is a continuation throughout life. Each adult brings a new addition and layer of meaning, thus further consolidating existing ideas and information. Such interpretation, whether at a museum or community recreation center offers the opportunity for voluntary and self-motivated learning, creating a more welcoming place for adults. With adults, learning is a personal journey. With constructivism, it is an active engagement of the learner (Koroscik, 1997b; Mayer, 1996). To develop ways of sharing information both for the adults who need structure and guidance to find meaning in the subject matter and for those who do not – its about involving the learning as a process: a search for meaning and a continuation of the commitment to learn.

In dealing with adults’ fears about art – drawing and the creative process – the cognitive approaches offer schemas for dealing with this problem. Using an objective

---

\(^{16}\) The Denver Museum of Art has used the novice-expert paradigm to enhance their adult visitors’ experiences by recognizing the potential and motivation adults bring with them in relation to their specific collections and incorporating more interpretive-based approaches for voluntary and self-motivated learning, thus creating a more welcoming place for adults (Lafferty, December 1996, Masters Thesis: Adult Learning in Museum Education: Case study on four sites: Dallas Museum of Art, Denver Museum of Art, Cleveland Museum of Art, and Terra Museum of American Art.)
and subjective approach or some other method, motivation is still a vital issue in the
cognitive process. Without the desire, students are going to be resistant to attempts to
engage in art or some creative act. It is a challenge with older adults. Creativity is an
organic impulse that is inherent to each person, but it is often impeded, blocked, or
stifled. Some common adult barriers include fear, lack of confidence, self-criticism, and
lack of emotional support. A trick that is common among adult educators to dissolve
some of the fears expressed by the adults is to remind them that there is always an
element of risk involved in the creative act and that having to face a blank canvas can
certainly be a frightening thing. There is a need to broaden the definition of creativity, or
art, for many of the adult participants to encourage the artist within them – that they are
capable of creating. Fostering creativity and enhancing the experience, the ‘joy of
creating’, should be the ultimate goal. It is important to allow for opportunities to create;
to encourage stimulating environments; to support students’ creations, as well as to
enable them to have various experiences to build creative works upon. It is part of the
creative process that the students [adult or child] learn the skills to be able to create what
they want at any given time. “The arena of human development is where an arts program
can have the greatest impact on community development. The power of the arts is to
unleash a person’s creativity, to give him/her a voice, to open up a channel for a person to
succeed and thrive in hitherto unknown and unpredictable ways” (Tresser, 1997, p. 1). If
students are not given the opportunity to enhance their skills and knowledge to create
then their own creativity will not blossom. There is a need for creativity to be taught and
fostered in the classroom, workshop, or program.
Literature on adult education suggest that there is no one way within any learning activity that dictates how cognition is acquired. If we choose to imitate the actual activity or apply it to a similar or different situation, the ability to adapt one's knowledge and experience enhances growth and development. Such an approach complements Gardner's (1990) holistic view of cognitive development that is, knowing when and how to apply and adapt learning to other situations that arise. The contribution of different forms of learning should be celebrated and accepted.

General Arts Education. In the pursuit of lifelong learning in the arts, there are many options available. These include informal and formal education experiences, depending on an individual's desire and needs, as well as the arts organization or community organization's mission.

The common theme between K-12 and adults and older adult focus is that art(s) education has as opportunity to develop and expand programs to the needs of their audience by including sociological and personal meaning aspects (Basting, 1994; Durr et al, 1992; Clements and Barret, 1992; Roberts, 1988; and Shuldiner, 1992). By recognizing the needs and wants of learners, we can integrate the arts into their daily lives to help them find meaning in their world.

According to Perrin (1994), on all education levels, "the arts is one avenue for learning that we should explore... 'artists' of every stripe are people who share qualities such as imagination, the capacity to work hard, and personal vision -- qualities that will be sorely needed in the globally oriented and fast-changing century that lies ahead" (p. 452). Supporting this view, and taking it even further are Neperud and Krug (1995) who examine "the process of making and valuing...in the context of social, artistic, and
aesthetic categories in an attempt to situate them in the broad context of human activity (p. 142). Like Perrin, there is a challenge to "high and low" visual cultural practices and products and focuses on looking for phenomenon in everyday life of these individuals who make things. Many community adult art education classes cater to those who show an interest in creating meaning out of materials, and an exploration of self and aesthetics, which allows for them to move out of their solidified identities as bankers, lawyers, housewives, or wage earners. Though many classes become change agents, it is not a mission within organizations' program goals – the transformation is on their own.

The main focus of the literature reviewed is the adult participants' interests and definition of their process, versus the institutional definition of art. Relating to this theme, Houle (1980) takes a brief look at different reviews of arts in adult education, specifically through a cultural development lens, which connects with Neperud and Krug's idea of "cultural context". Informally and formally, the arts provide educational, spiritual, personal and social experiences that are heightened by the mission of the program and/or organization. Neperud and Krug also offer implications for arts education research in addressing the importance of understanding the artist as a person in relation to his/her culture. Sets of values and the actual process offers insight into their meanings, belief systems, and social structures. This helps us understand the meaning of art and its making, regardless of formal or informal arts programs.

The discussion of general art education and adult education literature serves multiple purposes beyond identifying 'common themes' echoed in the literature. It also highlights the key research areas and will add to the interpretation of my own data. The aging and adult education literature calls for intervention programs and more qualitative
research into learning and leisure choices of older adults. Identifying the value, ranging from recreational to professional, in adult's artistic exploration, is key for connecting my data with the call from the fields. The arts [and community] benefit from adults' contributions. We, as an arts community need to offer opportunities that:

- Take advantage of the experiences of the learners;
- Actively engage the learner in inquiry;
- Allow for options -- educational and entertainment;
- Build new ideas on the store of information they already have due to their experiences/learning to be life-centered (Clements and Barret, 1992; Durr et al., 1992; Roberts, 1988, and Walker, 1980).

Integrating such experiences, the arts can help in the search for meaning in the everyday lives of adults. The arts can help people find their place in the present. Determining one's place, one's changed role in society is a common issue among persons of later years. With the arts an adult:

- Has the creative tools to understand and order inconclusive events in his/her life;
- Can find order/purpose and design to the past; even beauty;
- Can face the loss of personal powers and approach [future challenges], knowing himself and appreciating life (NEA, 1998).

Painting, drawing, etc. programs offer intellectual and technical challenges, and room to take chances and explore themselves and aesthetics. Also, the arts will benefit from older adults' contributions -- telling what it is like to be old; showing us how to continue growing; and sharing their unique perspectives on life.
The Value(s) of Art Education

This section will review the values associated specifically with education and human development in and through the arts.

To argue that there is greater value in art adult education than another form of adult education, one must examine art theory. Definitions of art often include aesthetic engagement in everyday experiences and with each other, rather than strictly from the works of art themselves (Ashbee, 1999; Perez-Carreno and Wollheim, 2000). Belz (1999/2000) argues that this exploration takes the study of art to a deeper level of content -- form, quality, and context, -- over value judgments. The engagement and appreciation of the artist's work is heightened with the discourse of defining art. Regardless of the infinite definitions, the basic power of art, human understanding [or misunderstanding], results in exploration and discovery of meaning of one's self and one's place in society (Estep, 2000). When dealing with community-based arts programs, are the values associated with education and human development in the arts the driving goal, intreinsic value, or is art strictly the 'means' for other types of experiences (social, personal, spiritual, etc.) through the arts, of extrinsic value? Are these experiences separate from art? These questions come to mind when dealing with community-based programs in art education because of the tone of 'leisure' and 'recreation' in the majority of literature.

Often the 'outcomes' of older adult arts education programs are focused on personal and/or social transformations through the arts, rather than an understanding of art theory. Does this lessen the value of art for adults? The humanistic approach to art -- using art and art making as coping mechanism and vehicle for social change -- reflects today's world. Its value is echoed throughout the literature. However, art's basic role in
education is important in comprehending the opportunities community programs, whether through art making, critiquing, or other means, brings to the adult learner. Art offers the “unique potential to enrich our lives simply because it has the power to delight us, to shock our sense...savoring of art in its purely aesthetic layer...Learning about art, its role in a variety of contexts and its relationship to life in a society, needs to be complemented by opportunities to experience art in direct, intense, and highly individual ways” (Kindler, 2000, p. 41-41).

The significance of my study is the analysis of adult arts education programs offered for multiple purposes, in numerous community settings. Community-based programs usually introduce and engage persons of later years with art[s] activities for the first time. There is a freedom of [and in] expression in informal classes that serve various adult utilities. Open, expressive attitudes toward art often serve as the initial steps in feeling comfortable with art, and can lead some older adults to pursue formal art education. Naturally, defining the value of adult art education relates to an important debate in arts education about the use of arts-related or non-arts-related settings, in place of or in conjunction with formal education, for the study of art (Gee, 2000, 1999a, 1999b; Davis, 1999; Hope, 1999).

Winters (1998) refers to this as the current tension in aesthetic appreciation: 1) understanding of art, and 2) the enjoyment of art. The ‘socially active’ versus ‘interpretation of works of art’ argument is too important to be handled so briefly, but it is important for arts administrators and educators at the community level to be informed of the debate. Most programs at the community level are offered in addition to K-12 formal art education. The challenge is that “When the arts are viewed by the public as
simply enjoyable rather than necessary, as occupying the leisure part of life, then it
follows that the arts should occupy the leisure part of education...” (Koroscki, 1997, p.
8). Adult programs assist in encouraging involvement and exposure to art. Art education
was not routinely offered or available during primary and secondary education for the
Baby Boomers and those born before them. For this reason, art was not a familiar vehicle
of expression. The broad and flexible approach of the arts public purpose has been used
to involve the arts at the community level to raise awareness of the ‘formal’ benefits of
art. As there are no guidelines in arts education, policy or otherwise, on adult education,
the role of the arts is dependent on the community center, program, or administration’s
view of adult learning. Overall, arts education's aim is to develop community belief in
the value of the arts. Beyond organizations’ missions and objectives, common themes in
the literature include arts programs’ ultimate goal as providing lifelong learning in the
arts to maintain and improve the quality of life of their participants via offering creative
outlets. Thus, this study hopes to address the question of the ‘place’ of adult education
and the guidelines to alert and prepare future arts educators to take adult arts education to
a higher level so the true value of art is carried through from informal to formal learning
episodes. Community adult arts education offers plentiful occasions for the adult learner
to experience the personal and social value of art through quality, intellectual formal and
informal programs.

Most community programs follow McDonald’s (1987) ‘Com-model’, which
focuses on developing a sense of community and broader appreciation for existence. His
model reinforces the core values art provides in human development. “What education in
the arts offers...is a way to move across...hard boundaries...to grapple with the essential
human questions concerning who we are, where our place is in the larger culture, and what our opportunities are for expanding our ways of communicating and developing our imagination, perceptions and judgments about the world we live in…” (Details, 1999).

As the practice of informal, avocational arts programs has grown over the years, the issue of "fine arts" versus "leisure activity" continuously comes up, as there are both formal and informal classes offered in and through the arts.\(^{17}\) The literature often makes distinctions between education and learning as it is made in adult education. Education is viewed as systematic, organized events that are intended to bring about learning, whereas learning is embedded in life experience. Whether defined as ‘education’ or ‘learning’, most programs incorporate the basic skills of art – the vehicle of human understanding to open up opportunities for creativity through acts of self-expression. Programs provide an appreciation and awareness of art and its value through the enjoyment and challenge of art.

**Creativity and Cognition.** I targeted creativity in my literature review specifically due to recent studies of its relationship with art, which together can produce therapeutic benefits during the stressful life-changing events adults often face. In Allison’s book, *Play, Leisure and Quality of Life*, she states, "One of the most essential characteristics of a meaningful life is that of joy -- joy brought about by a spirit of playfulness [attributing play as the basis for art, philosophy, poetry knowledge, law, war and most features of culture]." Play is often referred to as a didactic tool in developing creative thought. Thus,

\(^{17}\) Within the literature of adult arts education, there is a distinction made between in and through the arts. *In* means a program that is strictly focused on art(s), art education, and offered through an arts-oriented organization or school. *Through* the arts defines the numerous offerings of the arts in our communities, like parks and recreation, health education, etc. Within the program, the arts is the tool, not necessarily the focus.
as Wysomirski (2000) notes, a current and future challenge for the arts sector is how the public interest in creativity is perceived (p. 78).

Cognitive approaches are valuable systems to promote the capacity for reflection and critical thought, and at the same time encourage creativity based on an adequate emotional and social equilibrium and a positive self-image. Much of the literature supports the objective of art education to strengthen creative expressiveness, a common characteristic of all individuals that can be developed. The current cognitive approaches in art education focus on personal development through creative expression. Lankford (1992) reminds us that cognitive development is not only the act of receiving information, but also includes how one processes – organizes, connects, interprets, and builds on past and future information to adapt and apply it (p. 36). There are some pertinent cognitive approaches in art education that apply to adult education. Early research on creativity and adults has reported a decrement model, that is a peak in creativity in younger years followed by a steep decline across the remainder of the lifespan.\(^{18}\) More recent research indicates that creativity maintains or increases across the lifespan. Creativity can be encouraged at any age, through any discipline, in any setting. However, development of creativity through cognitive approaches in art not only fosters creativity, but can also be a means of transformation that benefits our society.

Gardner’s (1990) studies identify multiple intelligences. In particular, Project Zero (1989, 2000) has conducted studies to gather information on the development, psychology and philosophy of art. In relation to creativity, Project Zero identifies the relationship between cognition and artistic expression and society’s influence on

\(^{18}\) Referring back to early works, such as Lehman (1954) and Dennis (1966).
students’ ability, measuring ability for “free, abstract expression” versus restricted responses. Davis’s curve-shaped pattern marks the true artist(s) as surviving the “U” and the remaining laymen taper off halfway, making an “L”. Thus, the challenge for art educators and programmers is to create a “U” experience for students. It is a drastic reference, but it is important to connect the “free, abstract expression” opportunity with adults. What a connection it would be to look at adults and measure when the “free, abstract expression” hits and/or does ageism or adult barriers, etc. stop it before it gets beyond an “L”? Are we allowing the experience to happen? This relates to Csikszentmihalyi’s (1996) flow experience, the importance of the social conditions that foster creativity. He reminds us that creativity is not held within, but is the interaction between one’s thoughts and their social context, making it “systemic rather than an individual phenomenon” (p. 23). Encouraging exchanges and opportunities for art to become the vehicle for expression to understand and deal with life changes in persons of later years is important. As the arts field in general is broadening the definition of the arts, the methods of art(s) education has to broaden to keep up with the growing role of the arts in our lives and our communities.19 Such an approach, viewed directly relates to adult education and so, connecting with the learner and the images, arts, that interact and become part of their daily lives, experiences. Creativity is the most important resource a people or a nation can have, and art education can be the most effective tool for bringing out this quality in people.

This review looks specifically at educational programs in the arts and through the arts. The goal is to synthesize information on programs relating to the central issue of

19 Important work(s) by Fredman, Stuhr have noted this in recent policy discussions at NAEA conventions.
lifelong learning and to identify the key concepts that keep reappearing in this bridge-
building of two disciplines: arts education and adult education. The overall consensus in
the literature was toward inclusion, a broadening of arts definition in order for it to
become a larger part of our daily lives, beyond K-12 education.

Lifelong learning must be a continuum that complements the formal, K-12
educational structure with ongoing opportunities in informal settings. It should
reflect new understandings of brain development and educational psychology,
studies that emphasize the social nature of learning and the need for personal,
intrinsic motivation. It should be flexible, efficient, readily available and
embedded in daily life. (IMLS, 2001, p. 5).

Pankratz and Morris (1990), Goldman (1966), and Jones (1999), address defining
what is included in adult arts education programs. The diversity is evident in their views
on adult education:

Adult education programs...appear in various combinations in almost every art
museum in the U.S. ...symphony orchestras, opera companies, and theaters, as
well as some dance companies, offer some sort of adult education programming --
lecture series, performance talks, post performance discussions, extended program
notes, or cooperative programs with educational institutions. Programs in non-
traditional settings could also be termed adult arts education. These include artist
residencies, workshops, and art exhibitions at retail centers, lunchtime at sites of
corporate art collections, as well as arts classes in parks and recreation, YMCA's,
YWCA's, Jewish community centers, and continuing education settings.

(Pankratz, 1990, p. 181)
...If today coordination of activities in a community or differentiation of function is needed to serve artistic needs, it may be up to the university to initiate and help carry out the tasks -- not necessarily to do the job by itself, but to see that it gets done...to educate the audience for art, to prepare citizen-patrons who know not only how to understand art, but also how to support it. (Goldman, 1966, p. 66)

...[A] range of activities which can be included in this category of provision which is not essentially arts education but somehow relates in a direct way to aspects of arts education...examples from health education, local history, urban regeneration schemes, community development and leadership training...oral history projects, political education, transformative education, women education, racial awareness training or environmental education, to name but some of the ways in which the arts are used. (Jones, 1999, p. 2)

Both Goldman and Jones look to informal arts education programs as a means to build audiences for ‘true’ arts events and experiences. While Jones feels that the arts are lessening the values of creativity by including through the arts education, Goldman feels it is necessary for the public to ‘come up’ to the standards of traditional art. Both views could be considered elitist or Modernist. In both opinions, the need to celebrate the arts does not mean “inclusion” of anything that uses the term arts or creativity. There is a definite distinction between informal and formal. However, both Goldman and Jones stress the changes in arts education and the need to reevaluate definitions and inclusion of
arts programs in order to provide quality adult education programs in the arts. Goldman goes a step further and identifies the changes in leisure and the possible need to broaden the definition of art to keep it in the public eye (p. 62). Pankratz does not make a distinction, necessarily, but he does differentiate education through the arts as a means to make the arts more accessible, supporting Jones and Goldman's view that education through the arts is a means to audience development and the general well being of our society:

Audience education implies a comprehensive program that offers to the adult population of a community an opportunity to pursue personal cultivation in depth while studying how to broaden the artistic life of the community...Audience education means taking the audience up to the 'life' of the work of art. (Goldman, 1966, p. 67-68).

...we have those classes whose primary purpose is to encourage people to engage with the arts...the aims will be to do with a healthy community, a new self awareness, more creative businessmen or a new community spirit." (Jones, 1999, p. 3)

Such an avenue for the arts echoes the K-12 focus in arts education, as well as the field as a whole, in looking for ways to 'involve' the arts into everyday lives – situating art education within everyday concerns and experiences of community life (Green, 1999).

This current review of the discourse in the arts and adult education identifies the range of activities and programs included in the area of adult arts education, such as health education, urban redevelopment, community development, professional
development, and reminiscence projects. The wide range of activities naturally leads into the dichotomy often referred to as the “crafts versus fine arts” argument. Overall, the research support a broader definition of the arts in the area of lifelong learning to include: leisure, recreation, and gerontology. This need has come about due to the growing trend of our aging society -- which is healthier and more mobile -- to seek out learning experiences (Barret, 1995). The overarching goal is to keep the "dialogue" of art education looking beyond K-12 to include the entire spectrum of life. Thus, this representative review supports the calls for more research into participation in the arts for enjoyment and enhancement of well-being.

Lifelong Learning

The policy implications of lifelong learning in adult education and implications for lifelong learning in arts education are discussed in this section of the literature review.

Informal, avocational adult arts programs help broaden the public’s understanding and awareness of the role that the arts can play in their lives. Overall, successful adult arts education have both aspects of sociological and personal meaning. But is providing personal meaning and awareness likely to be seen as a suitable public purpose for the arts? Or should this be considered in terms of general well-being and quality of life issues? What is the arts’ role in a lifelong learning society? Such questions need to be addressed.

As adults face more stresses and multiple tasks in their lives today, this study can reinforce the need for greater understanding of and research into informal, non-accredited learning. Such learning provides opportunities for strengthening people’s identity, growth and development, creativity, and ability to cope with everyday life.
Lifelong learning’s development and strategy over time has been to “draw from and build upon democratic traditions of individual and collective self-help” both here and abroad (Fryer, 1999, Section 7, p. 1). Today, beyond the United States, adult learning is on national agendas. These agendas include lifelong and work-based learning, making programs available to the public, which will in turn contribute to a better educated workforce, capacity building, economic efficiency, independent living, and social cohesion. For the United States, lifelong learning has been focused on adults, specifically education and training to meet market needs. Although there are several informal movements focused on ‘well-being’ of individuals, the policy focus has been on a competitive workforce, which is emphasized by Al Gore’s remarks from the Lifelong Learning Summit (January, 1996) that focused on creating a “knowledge-based economy” through lifelong education (p. 2). Is it mainly a question of human capital? Is it a debate between training versus learning? While the political focus may be on “skills”, there are several other arenas that are focusing on personal development courses, and/or recreational learning, and continuing higher education. There have been several pivotal conferences discussing the definition and role of lifelong learning as a general well-being, quality of life focus. For example, these include: First Global Conference on Lifelong Learning (1994); A National Learning: Vision for the 21st Century. Washington, DC: Commission for a Nation of Lifelong Learners (1997); Executive Summary: The National Education Goals Panel (1996). 1994’s Goals 2000: Educate America Act highlighted lifelong learning as one of the 8 national education goals. And Congress legislated the “Adult Literacy and Lifelong Learning” goal to promote literacy for every adult and provide every adult with the knowledge and skills to compete in
today’s society, as well as the 1998 Lifetime Learning Credit to encourage learning experiences (Notice 97-60, 2000). Though there is recognition and discussion on personal growth and development, the focus is on education and training to address today’s competitive global marketplace and to deal with the current problems of society (Club of Rome, 1979). “…Lifelong learning is essential to assuring the human capacities and skills to function as a citizen and a worker in our complex society” (Walshok, 1999, p. 21). From its early beginnings, lifelong learning in adult education has been linked to economic development and fixing unemployment above everyday life issues. It has been viewed as the vehicle to make up for the “definite loss” in initial education, such as basic education or work skills. This focus is even greater today as competition and technology flourish and society’s learning capacity needs are not supported by current adult education policy.

Lifelong learning’s role in adult education has had a journey of sorts through time, adapting the average layman to change, civic education, community development and social action, social change, to meet the challenge of social exclusion and an information society (Bogard, 1994; Titmus, 1989). What does all this mean? Do we have a working definition for lifelong learning? Is it possible to come to a coherent policy for lifelong learning in adult education? What can we learn from international perspectives? Do we acknowledge informal learning in the scheme? Is lifelong learning the new framework for addressing society’s challenges? First we must look at the formulation, founding definitions and international influence to properly define lifelong learning.
Definitions. What do the multiple terms mean -- ‘learning society’; ‘lifetime learning’; ‘learning culture’ and ‘learning age’? Are these interchangeable? The general consensus of the literature agrees with Titmus (1989) that lifelong education is a continuous process that does include “intentional and incidental learning experiences (p. 548). For Wain (1987), education is a lifelong process and embraces all stages of education, with the goal being to ‘maintain and improve the quality of life’ (p. 38). Manheimer et al (1995) see a new paradigm in adult education on lifelong learning, which encompasses lifelong learning, leadership and community service: “Lifelong learning, leadership and community service form the triad of purposes that create the model of education in later life and close the gap between institutional objectives and the personal motives of older adults” (p. 32). Blaxter and Tight (1995) have identified six focus areas, reviewing literature from US, Europe and Australian, on lifelong learning in adult education: 1) life cycles (changing needs, roles in adult life); 2) labour market (education and training, workforce); 3) career development (patterns, career paths); 4) motivation (expectations, motivations for participation); 5) participation (quantitative accounts); 6) performance and attrition (successes and failures due to participation). For the most part, life cycles and motivation are the areas to which my study relates, although the others do factor in.

The term, lifelong learning, arose from international launches of ‘lifelong education,’ ‘recurrent education,’ and ‘continuing education’. The following quotes show the diverse and multiple avenues this term has taken over the years.

UNESCO (1976, ch. 1): …the entire body of organized educational processes, whatever the content, level and method, whether formal or otherwise,
or whether they prolong or replace initial education, in schools, colleges and universities, as well as an apprenticeship, whereby persons regarded as adult by the society to which they belong develop their abilities, enrich their knowledge, improve their technical or professional qualifications, or turn them in a new direction and bring about changes in their attitudes or behavior in the two-fold perspective of full personal development and participation in balanced and independent social, economic and cultural development.

UNESCO, *The Faure Report* (1972): The conceptual framework with respect to policy identifies the UNESCO approach from the outset as one in which lifelong learning is a way of thinking about educational policies of (member) states. [It] represents a humane vision of society and international order that could only be achieved by the state through a process of policy, strategy and planning (Griffin, p. 333 – need #!)

OECD (1973): “education opportunities should be spread over the individual’s lifetime, as an alternative to the ever-lengthening period of continuing education for youth”

UNESCO, *Learning: The treasure within*, “We must stop regarding the different forms of teaching and learning as independent from one another and, in a sense, as superimposable or even competing; we must try, on the contrary, to enhance
the complementary character of the stages of modern education and the environments where it is provided. (Delors 1996, p. 100)

Specifically, these two approaches to lifelong learning come out of a progressive social democratic approach that includes education over the total lifespan, including leisure and retirement. Looking at the definitions, there is not much change in the past twenty years from UNESCO’s 1972;6 and 1996 report except a more encompassing concept of education, including cultural dimensions. And Delors (1996) breaks it down to four steps of learning 1) to live together; 2) to know; 3) to do; and 4) learning to be. Lifelong learning, which “cannot [solely] be a matter for government responsibility,” is understood as a form of education policy (Griffen, 1999, p. 331). But it is not just a social democratic approach to policy, but also a strategy to address current trends of society (Griffen, 1999; Fryer, 1999; Dohmen, 1996).

**International Perspective.** The United Kingdom has provided lifelong learning’s purpose in a ‘risk society’ as the nation prepares for social change. Although, it is termed and housed differently, we can learn from the United Kingdom’s extensive work and wide development of lifelong learning principles. The United Kingdom’s lifelong learning goals include:

- Greater emphasis upon consumption and its pleasures, including some democratization of inventiveness and creativity;
- More focus upon choice, lifestyle and individuality;
- Supporting the pervasive and growing role of information and knowledge in many areas of economic, social, political and working life;
- [To provide] Evidence of the growth of social exclusion, despair and even a
sense of hopelessness, resulting from the impact of multiple deprivations

(Fryer, 1999, p. 7).

The United Kingdom has requested their government to “instigate a multi-faceted campaign to promote lifelong learning and the development of learning cultures” through different avenues (Fryer, 1999, p. 13). These avenues include: social inclusion; K-12 schools building a lifelong learning foundation; promotion of learning cultures; and access, to name a few. United Kingdom also recognizes the importance of including informal learning opportunities and emphasizes a multi-level, multi-stranded policy approach, capacity building and community development initiatives to promote lifelong learning (Fryer, 1999; Griffen, 1999; Gass, 1996). Thus, the United Kingdom has a local focus.

Neighborhoods are the backbone of a community and are an integral part of the overall quality of life in a community. The aim is to create an environment, rooted in the neighborhood’s social and cultural values, in which each resident will have an opportunity to enhance his or her well-being, as well as that of his or her family, community, and society. The main focus of such community programs is to support the most basic human rights – adequate housing, proper nutrition, health care, and education – and building from there. These goals have been established to provide general direction and guidance for Europe’s vision of a lifelong learning society: to improve the overall quality of life and to strengthen the position of the residents through education, cultural, and employment programs. These goals and objectives are to reflect the input of the local and state members of the advisory board, neighborhoods, community leaders, education administration and the public. This approach strives to identify mutual goals of
the community, center participants and potential users, which will support diversity and
strengthen opportunities within each community. The United Kingdom’s work is focused
on basic needs, like expanding job opportunities or providing housing maintenance to
instill pride and connectedness to the neighborhood and one's place within it.

In most of Europe, lifelong learning it is about making opportunities available and
popularized. Education and training can make lifelong learning more of a reality. There
is a ‘fear’ of social exclusion in modern society. Therefore, education becomes the
“instrument for integrating individuals into society and the economy, but also the nursery
of the democratic freedoms – cultural creativity -- by whose exercise the individual
citizen can influence the shape of things to come”(Gass, 1996, p. 7).

As mentioned previously, lifelong learning is clearly not a new “system”. It is
instead the approach the adult education sector identifies to address adults’ learning
opportunities and processes that go beyond our existing formal education structures. It is
important to recognize that there is another movement, or approach, within lifelong
learning in adult education that looks to schools and universities to lay the foundations of
lifelong learning. Is an overhaul of our education system plausible? With the current
focus on assessment and proficiency exams, this is a tall order, though one that is
imperative to incorporate lifelong education for all. Has the civic education movement
returned? This movement promotes self-awareness and community and nation through
citizen involvement (Buhyoff and Brown, 1975; Boggs, 1991). While cultural values are
embedded in the rituals of daily lives of most Europeans, here at home it is necessary to
address the arts [and humanities] outright. We must be reminded that education should
not only be limited to survival needs but also include aesthetic values that add meaning and purpose to life and living for all.

With the multiple definitions of lifelong learning, there is an acceptance today of the adult education sector’s challenge to support the role of learning and self-help in persons of later years (Fisher, 1998; Wolf, 1998; Blaxter and Tight, 1995; Dohmen, 1996; Titmus, 1999; and Wain, 1987). Identifying the role of lifelong learning in our aging society sets the stage for policy information and formation to handle and create healthy communities. As demonstrated, consistency across the literature, healthy communities aim to address: 1) a knowledge and information-intensive society; 2) inequalities of income/social cohesion; 3) enhancing the adaptive capacity of societies; and 4) the aging society phenomenon (Titmus, 1989; Hiemstra, 1992). Lifelong learning is integrated into multiple policy areas – healthcare, workforce, social services, and aging policy. All have staked a claim to the term. It has yet to be seen what is the more effective vehicle for policy. Education, adult and general, seems the obvious choice. As the longevity revolution continues, access to learning will be at the core of this debate, as well as finding the right paths to action.

For the purpose of this study, lifelong learning is the term to signify ‘continued’ education and learning for adult learners. The center of attention for adult education is the identification of characteristics and needs of adult learners. Once identified, the focus shifts to how adult education is going to apply and encourage curriculum and teaching approaches to address and target the learners (and target the various venues for learning). Much has been done, but it is an ongoing process as our society further defines the role of aging and the necessary steps to deal with lifelong learning in initial and adult education.
For now, lifelong learning in adult education has two goals to improve economic and social standards of living: 1) education and training of the workforce; and 2) creating a learning society (Wolf, 1998; Blaxter and Tight, 1995; Gass, 1996; Titmus, 1989; Delors 1996; Griffen, 1999). It is important that the adult education sector recognize the value of personal growth and development, in addition to employment needs. With the population growth of maturing adults and longer life expectancy, many adults, if they are not already, will be looking to continue or start new careers beyond our traditional retirement age of 65 years. National education goals must encourage the motivation to learn. The increase in self-directed learning, intervention programs and coping mechanisms will endorse a lifelong learning society. It would seem that the overriding view is that “…lifelong learning is as much a matter of personal fulfillment and being enabled to participate in the exercise of the rights of citizenship as it is a matter of attaining economic objectives” (Gass, 1996, p. 5). The challenge is in how to incorporate the diversity of lifelong learning – learning in and for the workplace, learning in and through formal and informal education and training, and community-based opportunities and networks. This relates to the role of informal, avocational arts in arts policy. Do we place value in community adult arts education programs? How can we work together to further engage the field and inform future educators and administrators to meet the needs and interests of community adult learners? The role of human development and quality of life is crucial in any lifelong learning society (Tuijman and van der Kamp, 1992; Fisher, 1998; Wolf, 1998; Blaxter and Tight, 1995). How will aging in America affect policy development in arts policy? How will arts policy better meet the needs of the aging population? Without facing the issue of aging, we are not prepared for tomorrow.
The literature in adult education that defines and interprets the lifelong learning movement provides justification for adult arts education. The arts can facilitate successful aging – combating ageism – by widening arts opportunities for learning in the tradition of democracy via creative self-help for the individual, hence, the collective whole.

The aged are not fully utilized. According to Mintz (1998), there are six criteria people consider when choosing leisure time activities: educational possibilities; need for a challenge; a worthwhile experience; a participatory experience; opportunities for socializing; and comfort and ease (p. 49). To unite with the lifelong learning market, it is essential that the arts become proactive to address the older adult population. This leads to policy implications and a need to identify the role of lifelong learning in arts education.

**Current Policy Arenas: Aging and Arts Policy**

This section identifies current and projected conditions for this issue to inform the Delphi process and project how the policy arenas – the arts, aging, and education – might be expected to interact.

After reviewing the value, personal and social meaning of older adult arts education programs and the connecting themes with lifelong learning in adult education, what are the policy connections? How does the current movement of avocational arts in communities in arts policy and the quality of life focus in aging policy relate? Reform is about improving responsiveness to individual and community needs, to social and economic processes of change. Where and how are the decisions about adult education – conventional and non-conventional – being made? What policies are shaping the interaction of developmental and socialization processes in people’s lives and where do
the arts fit in creating a positive, productive environment for aging adults? Can a holistic approach to learning succeed into a framework for change? Arts education, lifelong learning in adult education, and aging are all dealing with enhancing the quality of life of older adults through consumer education, workforce development\(^{20}\), and acceptance of informal settings and learning episodes as quality educational opportunities. This leads to a broad conceptual frame for policy development of adult arts education that integrates all three areas – arts education, adult education, and aging in arts policy [see Diagram].

Shared trends in the three areas include:

- Evaluating effectiveness of services;
- Updating long-range plans;
- Exploring ways to become involved with other community organizations;
- Use of ‘survival’ programs – human services that encourage job training, skills development, professional development;
- Encouraging programs that reflect socio-economic, cultural, and racial diversity within communities;
- Monitoring changes in community values and beliefs, as well as trends in education, the labor force, population and income;
- Providing learning experiences in environments free of intimidation; and
- Recognition of participants and community members as essential to the decision-making process (having a voice).

\(^{20}\) With the adult education focus on workforce development, the partnership, collaboration with the arts, arts education seems a natural and progressive step. Recent reports have highlighted the positive affect, impact of arts education on the workforce (NGA [National Governors Association and the National Endowment for the Arts, with assistance from the National Assembly of State Arts Agencies], 2002; Galligan, 2002). As the national attention to enhancing a lifelong learning society continues, this is just one avenue for the arts to capitalize and further involve themselves.
Naturally, building relationships and partnerships with the adult and aging community requires new and productive ways to address the mentioned trends. For instance, one strategy is integrating with other community programs and resources to explore new funding sources and expanding opportunities for community and individual cultural development. Persons of later years are increasingly the larger proportion of the total population and have more vitality in the years ahead. The arts need to get more involved on all angles and address the growing challenges and opportunities of an aging society.

As mentioned in the introduction, demographics paint a very diverse and growing 60 and over population. By the year 2020, one in four individuals will be age 60 and over, doubling its current status of 13 percent (34.7 million) of the population. The social and cultural differences within communities must also be recognized. "Demographic data unequivocally document an increasingly diverse society...By 2020, the black, Latino, and Asian populations of the United States will have doubled...[this data] provide[s] an accurate snapshot of the next century, they give us a road map to the future" (Mintz, 1998, p. 47), we have yet to adequately deal with the economic, marketing, and political implications of our regionally growing ethnic markets (Frey and DeVol, 2000). Let alone the implications this has on aging older adults of diverse ethnic backgrounds. The arts can provide a way to meet social and cultural needs in the lives of older adults by becoming powerful catalysts for connecting older adults with their community. Sharing cultural heritages through the arts serves as 'common ground' for understanding differences. Beyond demographics, economics and technology are interrelated with aging policy. The changes in economics and technology are
incorporated in demographic studies, providing insight into the shifts of this learning society. Some of the mature adult shifts, as previously mentioned, include: revision of ‘retirement’; a changed nature of work and workforce, global economy and competition, and technological advances.

This study is exploratory in nature. The focus is on informing and interpreting the multiple areas that are interconnected to shape future arts public policy. The major public policy issues facing today’s older adults include: prescription drugs, which is considered a short-term issue; Medicare, which to-date, does not address long-term care or serve as the umbrella reform for prescription drugs; Social Security, a major issue that will take several years to address (current proposals include maintaining status quo, some structural changes, such as increasing age of benefits to 67 years, and privatization at different levels – stock options, etc). Other popular issues include family care giving and home healthcare. With such critical issues on the agenda, the importance of education to serve as prevention and intervention methods for health and well-being need to be implemented.

This study’s framework relies on 1) interrelating the personal and social development of adults across the lifespan, 2) the influences of social, cultural, and economic environments, and 3) to identify the role of policy in shaping the arts opportunities and outcomes for an aging population in adult education, art education, and educational gerontology. The common theme echoed in all three sectors is the call to encourage productive, secure, and healthy aging for all. Health is commonly referred to as an integrated approach to overall well-being, a life course perspective. Naturally, the arts and education fall into these categories under personal growth and development and
social interaction. For older adults, enhancing one’s well-being and mental state, is based on maintaining self-worth, autonomy, and a contribution to society. Educational programs – quality learning opportunities – offer older adults a chance to be involved and remain active. Research has shown over time that there is no question older adults can continue to be productive – it is a question of how not if! Encouragement for persons of later years to continue involvement and to receive the necessary support and tools is necessary. Our society is faced with a challenge to ensure education as a lifelong process – including all life stages – through legislation. Today the common dependencies for older adults in retirement include pensions and Social Security, while local and private sources are the sole sources for human capital. With increased longevity and the potential for continued productivity, there is definite need for redesigning educational offerings, “a complete rethinking of policies and procedures” in order to deal with the current and future aged (Walshok, 1999, p. 23). Learning has become both a ‘public necessity and a public responsibility’ through two options: the individual and society (Fisher, 1998; Wolf, 1998).

How is the need for more programs, availability, and quality of services going to come about when government funding continues to get tighter than ever? Current government programs for older adults respond to people in immediate need, and even that is not enough. Health care, nutrition, long-term care, and crime prevention are all top-of-the-list concerns for the government and the public. There needs to be a proactive movement in social policy for older adults to encourage productive, successful aging. We tend to focus on ‘accommodating’ chronic illness versus encouraging and promoting intervention and prevention programs. Education offers an alternative. It is considered a
way to serve older adults beyond just a leisure-time activity, to help them maintain meaning or purpose in their lives.

When healthy communities are discussed, the arts are included. The arts are involved in tourism and economic development in communities. On the local front, older adult arts education programs offer an integral part of the overall quality of life in a community by: responding to neighborhood issues and concerns; meeting personal and societal needs of participants; and/or providing an opportunity to enhance the well-being of the community, thus society.

There is overarching agreement between the general public, Congress, and the Administration, that action needs to be taken in aging policy. The issue of aging has ‘proximity’ to us. It has personal relevance — “it hits close to home or directly impinges on a person’s interest” (Rochefort and Cobb, 1994, p. 21). The process is the dilemma now at hand. Where do the arts fit in?\(^{21}\) As we move into the twenty-first century, the communication roles among the general public and Congress become the important ingredient in the success of policy. It is necessary to develop current and new avenues to shape a future in which older adults points of view are given voice as societal values change. It is important that we look long-term and identify the impact of the current and future trends. The arts advocacy movement for older adults at the national level is a familiar one for arts educators. There is a ‘looming’ vagueness in how to look beyond program descriptions for older adults. Are we missing an opportunity to share the value of art education with adults? The arts have an opportunity to develop quality formal and

\(^{21}\) It's important to recognize that museums have played a vital role here and abroad in lifelong learning – like libraries, they are often partners with education to deliver community programs. Like NEH, museums and libraries have outlined strategic and operational proposals for lifelong learning. se.
informal programs incorporating the serious study of art in community programs. We need to look beyond program descriptions and listings and tackle funding allocations.

Using Kingdon's model (1984, 1995), it is important to recognize the participants in agenda setting (organizations, direct stakeholders, general public, and media), and the three streams: 1. Problems (focusing on events, feedback from current programs); 2. Policies (ideas floating around that will most likely stay, like community development, well-being, quality of life); and 3. Politics (composition of the government – national mood and interest group pressures, such as successful aging and pressure from AARP, etc). When the three streams are lined in place, a policy window appears. The issue of addressing the aged, the future aged (Baby Boomers) with the means for productive, successful aging is the current policy window. The common values related to community, education, health, social, prevention and intervention services influence the 'climate of opinion' and enhance this 'window of opportunity'. Today's policies for older adults are determined mostly by age rather than actual condition or ability as the basis of applications. Individual differences or needs do not define a person's place in society. There is discussion on moving from age-based policies to individual needs on differences defined by a person's place in society: taking into account well-being among older adults to rational for age-related benefits (Hudson, 1994). The argument is that if we can feel better about ourselves, then naturally we would feel better about our society 'when age is irrelevant and the basic needs of all persons are properly addressed' (Hudson, 1994). This probably will not happen but gradually there may be a window of opportunity based on educational needs of older adults in certain life stages and places in society. Aging policy's strategy for the last decade has been to continue to implement
policies that help our contemporary society connect with its own aging, and its aging members. Achenbaum (1988) identifies four developmental stages in aging policy over time: 1) Gestational period, 1797-1935; 2) Formative years, 1935 to 1950; 3) Federal expansion, 1950 to 1972; and 4) Incrementalism and cost containment period, 1972 to present.

Recognizing this, timing for formal policies affecting older adult arts education – acting alone – may be too early to-date. Prevailing social attitudes of the federal government’s role in providing for general welfare has not extended to providing for individual citizens. However, with the changing view of ‘public responsibility’, there is a good chance that by partnering – connecting with common, shared goals – with the Aging Network and adult education’s lifelong learning movement we can improve the possibilities for action. A policy cannot gain support unless its potential supporters have a common base of values. Both information and values constantly intermingle as policies are debated and implemented. Thus, it is important to identify current initiatives in aging and arts policy and expose the shared values.

Policy has been shaped by perception and definition of a problem or an opportunity by the various actors involved. The political actors in the aging policy process over time (involved in intervention, education purposes) have been: Wilbur Mills, an Arkansas Congressman known for his lack of support for a federal health plan; Claude Pepper, a Florida Congressman who has led numerous improvements in programs and opportunities for older persons; American Association of Retired Persons (AARP), a
large organization that has held a leadership role over time and is still very powerful\(^{22}\); Gray Panthers, founded by Maggie Kuhn, has been a small, but powerful force over time, especially in intergenerational issues; and the National Council on Aging (NCOA), which has served over time as the leading membership organization in aging policy. Some key players for aging and the arts include: NCOA, AARP (community programs), Administration on Aging, Agency for Health Care Policy Research, and the National Endowment for the Arts (NEA). More recently, the American Society on Aging's Lifetime Education Renewal Network has taken the lead role in arts and aging by establishing the Center on Creative Aging, which is discussed in detail later. Depending on the local area, some other key political actors may include: local and state Offices for the Aging, senior center representatives, Council of Senior Centers, Generations United, state-wide intergenerational coalitions and networks, nursing home administrators, Mental Health Association, Alzheimer's Association, Board of Education staff, and university or college continuing higher education programs. Other potential federal partners in both policy and funding initiatives involve the Office of Community Services, the National Institute on Aging, the Department of Education, and the Department of Interior’s National Park Service\(^{23}\). To truly understand involvement of some key players and the focus for aging policy, I will first review some landmark events in aging policy, then arts policy.

\(^{22}\) AARP leading the way in addressing Baby Boomer needs, marketing to their 'youthfulness' and 'options'.

\(^{23}\) The Leisure and Recreation national organization, NRPA, has become a leader in intergenerational programs and have multiple national initiatives to address older adults.
AGNG POLICY. Taking into consideration what has already been mentioned in relation to aging policy, there are four broad issues: 1) How to achieve the widest possible use of resources in aging and resource-limited society; 2) How to use our growing numbers of older citizens productively; 3) Identifying responsibility for meeting the new social needs population aging creates; and 4) Identifying what constitutes equity among the generation, and how it is achieved (Pifer, 1986; Binstock, 1994; Hudson, 1994). With the definition of aging constantly changing, the current push for ‘successful aging’ reflects current values and attitudes. Overall, the movement in contemporary society is to reach a point of ‘ease’ with aging, as it is inescapable for all of us. The policy process in aging services has been determined both by need and entitlement. With the shift in power and leadership due to the Baby Boomers, the attitudes of the aged have been changing and pushing for more entitlement services. With the elderly already consuming 35% of the budget and projections of 84% of budget outlays by 2050, how much is too much (Peterson, 2000)?

A recent international conference has become a key focus for aging policy makers – the 2002 World Assembly on Ageing (Madrid). This approaching event has offered an international view on aging. The first World Assembly on Ageing (1980s) established a framework that has been used to develop the current focus for 2002. The initial focus for the first international conference on ageing was to ‘alert’ nations to the aging phenomenon and economic development ramifications. The most important outcome from the 1st World Assembly was a resolution commitment – a resource document that

---

24 Aging policy refers to elderly, older persons or people, the older population, aging members of society, the aging, older Americans, elderly constituents, the aging population, the aged, the disabled, and lately, persons of later years.
legislators could build aging policy from. Nations realized they needed to assess what was going on at home. For the majority, this was the first comprehensive look at aging. Several nations responded with national aging statements. However, overall, the Assembly was received with apathy and critiques worldwide. Without the enthusiasm or interest on aging, in general, and it not being a major press issue at that time, it was not the major overhaul expected or desired by participants. Regardless, bridges were built and the stage for an international commitment to quality of life for all was set in motion.

The United Nation's Social Development Committee oversees the Program of Ageing (including underdeveloped to developed countries). In the past, the UN's focus has been on social and economic development, as well as demographics. Today, it is looking beyond the number of older adults and taking into consideration their roles (social, psychological, spiritual, educational, etc.) in everyday life. The absolute goal is to promote active involvement of all ages in society. This is an incredible international statement. The whole life of an older person is valued! The positive direction of this movement is echoed in the five main principles UN outlines to achieve this for the World Assembly on Ageing 2002: independence, participation, care, self-fulfillment, and dignity. Three major areas to address the five main principles include:

1. Sustaining development in an ageing world.

   A) Policy to create environment for betterment of society by recognizing the resources older adults provide & to support productive ageing – ability for them to support themselves through:

   □ Opportunities to continue in workforce;

---

25 The US is one of the last nation to use the spelling 'aging' versus 'ageing'.
Supporting lifelong learning – education and training;

Furthering intergenerational ties.

2. Advancing health and well-being in old age by promoting good health throughout the life-cycle. Need to focus on health promotion from young to old.

A) Equity in primary community healthcare – delivery and availability. Access is a major issue seen across developed to developing countries and needs to be focused. This includes gender issues – older women are the largest ageing group, but least served. In developing countries most women ‘enter’ old age already suffering from at least one chronic illness.

3. Ensuring, enabling, supporting environments: community, family, institutions.

Need to have support services, whether income support or social protection (elder violence & abuse).


It's important to notice that the three goals follow the path many older adults take, moving from active participant in society to dealing with health changes, challenges, adaptations, then possibly needing more health care (home, nursing, etc). This is a crucial step that internationally, there is recognition of identifying, addressing the stages seen in everyday life. The ‘unveiling’ of the international plan will take place in Madrid, 2002. Like the White House Conferences on Aging in the US, this opportunity is a time to bring forth

---

nation(s)' issues to address global ageing factors. The specific recommendations for implementation, the next steps for the World Assembly include:

- National action by governments to use the plan and create coordinating systems;
- Research agendas established for policy information;
- Education and training to be addressed, both adult and continuing education and professional development in the aging field; and,

This international conference is a step in the right direction. It focuses on older adults as social resources through empowerment and integration and raises the importance of health and education. Most of all, human rights, not just human capital is on the agenda!

US initiatives that relate to the common set of international values in aging policy are individual responsibility and free-market economy, and collective responsibility and government intervention (Pifer, 1986, p. 391). These include the Older Americans Act (OAA) (HR2107, 1997, 2000), and Healthy People 2010. The OAA was reauthorized in November 2001 with a new focus on family care giving. Traditionally, the OAA is known for what it does not do for older adults, but it is hoped that with reauthorization, long-term care and home healthcare will get more attention and dollars. The OAA has served as the vehicle for services and needs of the elderly, specifically for nutrition, social, and employment services. The OAA has relied on policy strategies that emphasize service to those in the ‘greatest social and economic need’; search for other sources of funds; and reduce in programs that would have long-range benefits through supporting wellness (prevention) measures. Enter Healthy People 2010: Healthy People
in Healthy Communities! Following past policies in aging, this initiative has two overall goals: 1) Increase quality and years of healthy life; and 2) Eliminate health disparities. It identifies ten leading health indicators for the nation: 1) physical activity; 2) overweight and obesity; 3) tobacco use; 4) substance abuse; 5) responsible sexual behavior; 6) mental health; 7) injury and violence; 8) environmental quality; 9) immunization; 10) access to health care. This study outlines the goals for the next decade and a guide for states to design their own plan to use health promotion and intervention to create healthy communities (www.health.gov/healthypeople). Current studies that are contributing valuable information into productive aging also include:

**The Health and Retirement Study.** A Cooperative Agreement between the National Institute on Aging and the University of Michigan. This longitudinal, cross-sectional study is a sample of more than 20,000 older adults (50+) interviewed every year from 1992-2005. This study looks at retirement issues, studying the health and economic circumstances older Americans face.

George Cohen (forthcoming), at George Washington University, in 2001 launched a three-year study looking at the positive implications of older adults involved in creative expression through the arts. This is the first longitudinal study of this nature.

*Research Study of the Informal Arts,* Chicago Centre for Arts Policy at Columbia College in Chicago will wrap up in December 2001. This multi-year ethnographic study has been investigating the social impact of adult participation in the informal

---

27 Healthy People is managed by the Office of Disease Prevention and Health Promotion, US Department of Health and Human Services.

28 This initiative builds on AARP's (1998) characteristics for a wellness lifestyle for persons of later years: 1) diet/eat well; 2) exercise; 3) regular checkups; 4) no smoking; 5) get immunized; 6) healthy attitude; and 7) involvement – get involved!
arts. It will provide additional information on informal arts and activities for policy making.

Each study contains the recurring theme of ensuring productive, secure and healthy aging for all. Learning performance does decline, moderately, over time, but can be compensated for intervention and education. This is the most accepted school of thought to-date. However, the myths of aging still fester in our society, which has not adjusted to include older adults in future societal plans. Encouraging their ‘continued’ involvement through supportive legislation is a must. My research falls under the aging community’s call for research, community-based interventions, and networks, partnerships.

Now that we are coming to grips with aging and its stages, there should be wider acknowledgement and support for educational programs. The argument is that as we start to change the myths of old age and promote education to enhance life – young and old – policy will be shaped as such. With the change in education to a focus on ‘learning’ and ‘socioeconomic policy’, a window of opportunity for involving the arts in ‘lifelong learning’ appears in:

- Public/private partnerships, demonstrating communities’ commitment to and support for lifelong learning;
- Social services networks and special programs, encouraging full participation in the benefits of the programs; and,
- Community development projects, to name just a few.

Aging policy focuses on economic security, health, shelter, and quality of life for all. There is a push for equity among all generations. Today’s approach to aging is more
pragmatic by reaffirming support and evaluating existing programs. Will these programs be able to ‘survive’ and ‘support’ future generations? The 1995 White House Conference on Aging (WHCA) listed the following principles to deal with aging Americans today and tomorrow: value of independence; promote personal security; encourage personal responsibility; recognize interdependence; provide a ‘safety net’ to support vulnerable populations; recognize and respond to America’s growing diversity; and ensure the quality of life of all Americans as they age (WHCA, 1996, p. 16). These principles relate to lifelong learning for arts education and adult education, and it is from within this framework of shared valued that this study was built.

Economic security, health, and social well-being are essential for people of all generations to live productive lives. Their attainment lies at the heart of the challenges facing all of us. As such, a national aging policy must address the issues inherent in each of these three areas and their potential impact on people.

For although people are the foundation of any community…these issues, and the manner in which people deal with them…give a community its shape and moral character. (WHCA, 1996, p. 23)

Since Baby Boomers are eager for reforms, there is urgency for valuable data to inform decision-making on the above issues. The window of opportunity comes into vision with multiple disciplines connecting to deal with the phenomenon of our ageing society. It is essential to link the arts with the lifelong education and aging movement – to adament at widening arts opportunities for learning in the tradition of democracy: individual and collective creative self-help. The WHCA (1996) outlined 45 Final Conference Resolutions. I have listed only a quarter of them that undoubtedly outline the
ways in and through the arts programs can improve well-being and promote lifelong learning.

- Providing positive image of aging
- Addressing/promoting intergenerational issues
- Expanding workforce opportunities
- Offering prevention/wellness throughout one’s lifespan
- Expanding older volunteer opportunities
- Promoting innovative strategies for housing, long-term care services (arts in health-care)
- Maintaining personal choice and autonomy (p. 124-6).

**Arts Policy.** Beyond the National Endowment for the Arts’ (NEA) reports of adult participation (through surveys of attendance at performing arts events and museums), the arts policy movement has been targeting those outside the margins – the usual arts universe definition. A much broader view or definition of the universe is the focus – expanding beyond the core.²⁹ Adult lifelong learning falls into the unincorporated arts sector: embedded arts activities in and outside of the arts, and informal and avocational arts (as mentioned). By further identifying the arts universe, resources will help to provide greater public understanding and involvement of the arts in multiple ways.

What steps in legislation have been taken to further the progress of arts and aging policies? According to Blancata (1995):

²⁹ The National and Local Profiles of Cultural Support, OSU, Wyszomirski and Filicko.
Although the Older Americans Act does not yet address the arts for arts sake, it does include arts therapy. Title IV, Section 422 of the Act recognizes and supports programs to advance the understanding of the "efficacy and benefits of providing music therapy, art therapy, or dance-movement therapy to older adults" through projects that study and demonstrate the provisions of this type of therapy to older individuals who are institutionalized or who are at risk of being institutionalized. It provides music, art, and dance therapy in nursing homes, hospitals, rehabilitation centers, hospices, and senior centers, and Title III provides the same to disease prevention and health promotion service programs, in-home service programs, multi-generational activities, and supportive services, along with gerontological training to therapists.

The 1995 WHCA was a breakthrough affair for the arts in many ways. Jane Alexander (then NEA Chiarmman) addressed the conference, which was the first time an arts person did so at a major aging conference, let alone a WHCA. The arts involvement was an unprecedented opportunity. Alexander addressed the important role of the arts in the quality of life of older adults through 3 areas: 1) Key avenues to involve young and old through intergenerational arts programs as a way of sharing of cultural heritage; 2) Ways to counter older adult isolation and bring them a sense of belonging; and 3) Remembering that art knows no age (Alexander, 1995). The arts allow older adults to continue to be productive by intellectually stimulating their minds. This conference offered a chance for the arts community to network and form initial older adults initiatives.
Beyond the 1995 White House Conference on Aging agenda on quality of life, which directly addressed the arts and humanities with a national symposium on "The Arts, The Humanities and Older Americans," (April 10-11, 1995), most of the movement has been geared toward national guidelines, versus states and local community action (Blancato, 1995; Jones, 1998; Pankratz, 1995). "Groups of older people have tended to direct political activity at the national, rather than the state, level...few organizations stressed attempts to achieve change through state government" (Peterson and Masunaga, 1998, p. 57). The National Association of State Arts Agencies (NASAA) and the National Endowment for the Arts have adopted a number of shared goals recently for local and state arts agencies, such as access to the arts, enhanced partnerships between the public and private sectors, preservation of our cultural heritage and community building through the arts (NASAA News, Brown, 2000). However, again, 'older adults' are not specifically listed in the goals or for direct local and state action. It is going to take a collaborative strategy with state and local government, the public sector, the Aging Network, and others to ensure programs are available for persons of later years.

The framework for older adults arts policy has been outlined by federal agencies, such as National Council On Aging (NCOA) and the already mentioned National Endowment for the Arts (NEA). However, it requires further connections to aging and adult education policy. In addition, the goals need to be implemented and shared at the state and local level for true action. NCOA has had a positive influence, supporting and advocating policies and developed programs for older adults in the arts, humanities, literacy, and retraining for the workplace. Yet such efforts need support and involvement from the mainstream arts community. The arts field needs policy to meet the 'age-wave'
and this new ‘stage of aging’. The National Council on Aging (NCOA) looks to lifelong learning and the arts as ‘an investment in the well-being of older adults and the vitality of our whole society’:

The importance of education does not fade with age; it remains vital for older Americans in the workplace, in continuing good health, in enabling full contributions as citizens and volunteers, and in discovering and expressing the deepest satisfactions in our lives and culture…and the arts…Best efforts in these areas require full partnership between the federal government, state and local governments, agencies serving older adults, and older Americans themselves.

(NCOA, 2000)

Today the National Endowment for the Arts (NEA) has identified grass roots advocacy and professional development as key ingredients in furthering the adult education arts movement. They recognize the importance of sensitizing educators and administrators to working with older adults and the opportunities. The extent of involvement of NEA includes a chairman report to the Special Committee on Aging to inform on national programs that encourage “all” citizens to share in wealth of the arts. Older adult programs fall under the Office for AccessAbility, currently managed by Paula Terry. This office makes arts programs more available to underserved segments\(^\text{30}\) of our citizenry. Current initiatives include: accessibility conferences; universal design programs (designs to incorporate special accommodations to be used for everyone throughout their life span); and a national database on arts programs involving older Americans. The NEA states that lifelong learning is a major goal of the Endowment.

---

\(^{30}\) Serving people with disabilities, older adults, veterans, and people living in institutions.
Yet, when talking with arts practitioners, many are unaware of the mandates focused on adults! In the past, such programs have had the stigma of ‘craft-oriented’ and defining adults, specifically, older adults as frail and unhealthy. Paula Terry recently noted in conversation that older adult arts education is a very important investment that can be made at the local and state level. This echoes the funding shift of the ninety’s – state funding exceeding federal funding. State governments on the whole have improved and increased public funding of the arts. Funding of grants to support arts activities that benefit older adults are granted yearly in dance, folk and traditional arts, leadership initiatives, literature, media arts, museums, music, opera, theater, and visual arts.31

Another grant opportunity of the NEA, the Challenge America Leadership Initiative, also encompasses older adults in its ‘challenge’ to communities “to build partnerships and expand understanding about the vital role of the arts in enhancing national creativity, community spirit, and the preservation of our living artistic cultural heritage” (NEA, 2000). Historical markers in the older adults arts education movement consist of:


---

31 This is an area that needs more attention – to actually trace, outline giving – specific monies for older adults & arts.
1979 – Elders Share the Arts founded, which is now one of the leading centers for older adults in arts. In 1985 it was named the outstanding organization in the United States in the field of arts and aging by the NCOA (www.elderssharethearts.org).

1981 White House Conference on Aging, first Mini-Conference including arts and humanities: *Policy symposium on the arts, the humanities and older Americans* (February 1-3). Sponsored by National Endowment for the Humanities and the National Endowment for the Arts, Philadelphia, PA.

1998 – Launch of the Center for Creative Aging (CCA) to train professionals nationwide in gerontology, education, and the arts in the theoretical framework and hands on methods for transforming memory into art (living histories, oral histories; reminiscences).

The CCA has recently partnered with the American Society on Aging to conduct annual Summer Institutes for arts professional training for gerontologists, educators, healthcare workers, etc. Last year, the CAA formed the National Center for Creative Aging to expand their organization nationwide. The initiative of the Center is to foster an understanding of the relationship between creative expression and healthy aging and to develop programs that build on this understanding (CAA, 2000). Current initiatives for the National Center include: Summer training institutes nationwide; partnering with NEA to monitor and house the National Database on Arts and Aging; local and regional professional trainings – the Center has established four regional sites: Colorado, NY, Philadelphia, and San Francisco. Currently, this Center serves as the ‘think tank’ for research and policy and technical assistance for older adult arts programs.
The Next Steps. I have identified the existing data on older adults and the arts. There is not a clear definition nor parameter on the issue, and the multiple stakeholders and decision makers fuel the uncertainty. Therefore, there is a call to shed light on the situation, the policy opportunity. The framework of this study is supported by the need to identify the major information needs and research strategies in order to communicate usable information for decision makers. The goal is to define the ‘policy envelope’ of this issue: the boundaries and insight for future action (Haas and Springer, 1998). What questions can be addressed to inform and guide expert input and discussions on the desired, future conditions for the arts and older Americans?

Beyond the literature in aging, arts policy and adult arts education already mentioned, several articles have provided insight and guidance for interpreting a multidimensional study. Hendricks (1996) refers to this view as “logic of inquiry that recognizes the inseparability of theories of human behavior and method of inquiry” (p. 52). The validity of such research is that the data, collection of materials is put into the context [the 'myths'] of everyday life. Thus, bringing some truth to real life experiences and, relevance of my study. According to Myers (1996), "inadequate research has been directed to studies of the relative well-being and life satisfaction of older persons in our society…” (p. 2). He reminds us of the extreme need of studies with policy relevance to the aged and, the aging process. The lack of research again emphasizes the importance of art education’s involvement in partnering with gerontology and adult education.

An additional component in the connection between the literature and my own interpretation of data is the outlook of different conceptual frameworks, specifically the forecasting method’s use and under-use. "...There is relatively little attention given...to
the general issues of social science forecasting" (Myers, 1996, p. 8). In order to prepare and respond proactively, we need to be involved with societal interventions. Schultz (1998) states that most intervention research is repeatedly targeted at individuals (p. 11). The aging 'society as a whole' needs to addressed. The goal of a forecasting tool is to build consensus on an issue that will lead to policy information, then hopefully development and implementation. Though only small percentages participate, the interpretation of data is intended to serve a broader public purpose. Usually, community-based programs are not openly referred to as interventions. In fact, using adult education terminology, most programs refer to words like self-fulfillment, transformation, and self-directed learning instead of labeling programs 'interventions'. Yet, such forms of adult learning are interrelated-incorporated in intervention. The literature identifies descriptive, observation studies as the typical method in intervention studies. Continuing education literature available on successful aging is also descriptive and often observation studies. These studies provide 'snapshots' of programs, allowing the reader to understand the phenomenon of this particular event and setting, thus gaining insight into the actual process of the intervention. The purpose of intervention aging programs is based on "improving or maintaining the older adult's physical health or functioning, mental health or social functioning, or cognitive functioning" (Schultz, 1998, p. 8). However, like many research articles on adult arts education, program descriptives are the outcomes. "Less commonly, investigators have examined the effects on the older adult's overall quality of life or sense of control of such methods as engaging in reminiscence and life review, participating in intergenerational programs" (Schultz, 1998, p. 12). Reminiscence and life review programs are very common in adult arts education,
as mentioned above. The challenge is for my intervention-of-sorts study findings to inform and impact public policy. Successful aging is both an individual and societal responsibility. Arts education has demonstrated the intervention-quality of programs offered on the individual basis. The quality of life of our communities, young and old, is at stake and we can take a proactive role by taking a multidisciplinary view of aging and the arts and contribute to policy information.

Qualitative research includes a broad spectrum, with a consistent theme of seeking understanding and meaning in our experiences. The perceptions people have of the world and how the meaning of practices and procedures affect us leads to true investigation of the lived experience. Thus, in my research I intend to strengthen the arts’ role in identifying one’s self-identity, social identity and social relationship in the aging process. The literature has provided a basis, an argument for taking a multiplicitic approach in my study, which will definitely affect the interpretation of my data. A window of opportunity has come available in taking this cross-disciplinary approach:

The discovery that each field has its own way of talking about certain phenomena, and that [the arts education, adult education, and gerontology education]…fields have some shared interest in a given phenomena [aging], suggest what Kuhn (1970) calls “point of entry discourse”. Here it becomes possible to open a dialogue around mutual interests and to begin an exchange of terms and meanings, references and interpretations. Such a discourse allows fields with seemingly competing paradigms to talk to one another and to forge more holistic notions of compelling phenomena. Likewise, identification of ideas which exist in separate fields, but converge in certain ways, offers
yet another avenue for discourse and intercommunity dialogue. (LaPierre and Zimmerman, 1997, p. 188)

What next? What are the opinions and views of key stakeholders? What does it take to heighten the importance of adult arts education? What do these national stakeholders in the arts, adult education, and gerontology think will push this issue forward? What are the key steps, ideas, and overriding themes to steer this boat? I will next discuss the methodology, The Delphi Method Technique, and my reasoning for choosing it as the best possible procedure to solicit stakeholders’ views on adult arts education.
CHAPTER 3

DESCRIPTION OF THE PROJECT METHODOLOGY

This chapter (1) discusses the Delphi Technique as a qualitative research method and why this technique is appropriate for generating images of the future in adult lifelong learning in the arts, and (2) describes the project methodology.

As we face an aging population, the arts education and arts policy community needs to take an active role in providing insight into policies that address adult choices. Such as, defining the role of the arts beyond K-12 education, and identifying connections with ‘general well-being’ age-based policies from leisure, recreation, and aging. The Delphi Technique Method was chosen to identify what we are currently doing to serve older adults and forecast the role of adult lifelong learning in the arts, as well as address the attitudes about such programming on the national, state, and local policy level.

The Delphi Technique Method is a qualitative forecasting method that per Linestone and Turoff (1975), is

...a method for structuring a group communication process so that the process is effective in allowing a group of individuals as a whole to deal with a complex problem...[through] delineating pros and cons associated with potential policy options...developing casual relationships in complex economic or social phenomena...[and] exposing priorities of personal values, social goals. (p. 3-4)
This is echoed in pertinent literature for using the Delphi to gain insight and written recommendations, discussions from stakeholders about the likelihood of future factors, influences and their impact (Leirman, 1996; Murray and Hammons, 1995; Rowe and Wright, 1999; and Cookson, 1986).

The Delphi Method worked well for this study because I wanted to identify what we are currently doing to serve adults and forecast the role of lifelong learning in the arts, as well as address the attitudes to such programming on the national, state, and local policy level. There are four components that apply to my study: (1) I am interested in specific adult programs that are offered and if this is met nationwide to identify policy implications; (2) My group of interest is well-defined and includes stakeholders in the field who are aware of current and future trends and issues in their respective fields; (3) I want to know the prospects of further serving an aging society and predictions in redefining this role; and (4) To secure the desired information I directly sent the Delphi via email and post mail to 34 invited stakeholders in arts policy and arts education policy, which were chosen due to experience in their field, literature review, recommendation by their peers, as well as my Advisory Committee.

Procedure. There's a need in my study for the Delphi Method as (1) the problem does not lend itself to precise analytical techniques, but can benefit from subjective judgments on a collective basis, and (2) the role of lifelong learning can be viewed as a complex/broad problem as it does not have a history of adequate communication within the field[s] on this topic, and (3) the stakeholders represent diverse backgrounds with respect to experience or expertise. According to Linstone and Turoff (1975, p. 5-6), the normal process of the Delphi Method includes four phases: 1) Exploration of subject; 2)
Identification of group views on this issue, specifically their agreements and disagreements; 3) Exploration and evaluation of disagreements; and 4) Analysis of all information and evaluations fed back to group for further consideration.

The main goal of the process is to keep the original study's objective of gaining the most reliable ‘general agreement’ of the group of stakeholders. As the Delphi forecasting tool is an open-ended framework that facilitates the negotiations of realities, through this process of inquiry, the data can be conceptualized into the right model to inform the field and decision-making. “...The three most popular areas for Delphi applications are education, business, and health care...Some problems areas...addressed using Delphi include policy and trend analysis, policy formulation, market research...and curriculum development” (Gupta, 1996, p. 188-9). Thus, using this method, it is possible to develop a theoretical framework based on stakeholders' vision, multiple perspectives, and comprehensive insight to address lifelong learning in the arts: to identify alternative ways of viewing the situation at hand that may arise in developing new policy.

**Delphi – what does it include?** From the literature, the common Delphi includes anonymous group interaction and responses; three to four rounds of questionnaires, in which the researcher controls the statistical group responses and feedback; and lastly, a presentation of statistical group responses that will inform policy (Leirman, 1996; Murry and Hammons, 1995; Rowe and Wright, 1999; and Cookson, 1986). “It is particularly appropriate when the purpose of the study is to elicit subjective opinions and responses from a group of individuals who are geographically separated from one another and when precise statistical analysis cannot be utilized because of the nature of the study” (Murry and Hammons, 1995, p. 433)
The initial round starts “an anonymous brainstorming session” and each round from then on out is recorded and returned for the panel of stakeholders to “consider, to rank and/or rate, to edict, and to comment upon the responses developed” (Murry and Hammons, 1995, p. 432). Anonymous responses are returned and frequency distribution shows the collective responses, rates, and comments from each round, leading to the goal of achieving consensus or stability in responses. When that is achieved or at least convergence to move on, usually in the third or fourth round, the Delphi is done.

Through this process I want to develop an overview of the field’s attitudes, beliefs, knowledge of, and objectives and goals in serving the needs of adults and identifying the role of the arts in an aging society. Because this is a field study, I asked the stakeholders to provide the data and I had no effect on the data being collected, beyond my status as the researcher and the re-sorting of the anonymous responses and sharing the responses of each round with the stakeholders.

Why the Delphi Method for this particular study? The Delphi Method reflects critical issues to address and strategies developed to influence future directions by generating lists of key issues the field will be facing in the future. The method also identifies the focus for an issue: where adult education and the arts together in a lifelong learning society in the 21st century. This technique was chosen because it creates “the universe of possibilities and then through an interactive process develops consensus about priorities...designed to obtain consensus regarding the relative importance of critical issues confronting the profession and ‘potential for impact’ in dealing with the issues” (Lindeman, 1981p. v). By having stakeholders with multiple perspectives and approaches, the results provide a forecast of the future. Delphi is most effective when the
issue can “benefit from subjective judgments on a collective basis”; and the stakeholders “represent diverse experience or expertise” (Murry and Hammon, 1995, p. 427). Thus, the goal is to have the stakeholders arrive at a general agreement on the priorities so that this study provides insights for decision-makers to act and initiate long-term planning of the arts’ future role in a lifelong learning society. Ideally, the group will not just come to a ‘consensus’ but rather they will attain what Rowe and Wright (1996) call ‘group confidence’. With group confidence, there are actual strategic plans for taking the issue to the next level of implementation.

So who are the stakeholders involved and why? There is no set ‘limit’ per se of the panelists, however, most of the literature recommends at least ten members (Murry and Hammons, 1995; Brockhoff, 1983) and a maximal number of thirty (Delbecq et al, 1975; Brooks, 1979). Thus, I have chosen 34 stakeholders to invite to be able to account for loss of participants through the rounds. As stated, the stakeholders will be chosen due to their expertise in arts policy and arts education policy and adult arts education. The stakeholders chosen to gain future predictions and alternatives on this issue are just part of one population parameter of the field. The data collected from this group will provide insight into the key areas and identify future predictions of local, state, and national initiatives of adult arts education. Gaining a collective opinion from a panel of stakeholders is an important advantage of the Delphi. Other advantages include group solutions of open-ended and creative aspects of a multiplistic problem. The Delphi is one of the few forecasting techniques that has a fair to good prediction accuracy over different time horizons” (Gupta, 1996, p. 186-187). Murry and Hammons (1995) gives four important advantages that include: 

84
(1) Anonymous controlled-feedback procedures are often more accurate than face-to-face discussions; (2) Opinions…received from a group of experts…geographically separated from one another; (3) Consensus…reflects reasoned opinions because the Delphi process forces group members to logically consider the problem under study and to provide written responses; [and] (4) Group responses can be described statistically. (p. 426)

In a sense, a group of stakeholders far outweigh one or two making decisions or informing policy. It is more valid due to the number involved and that they are considered stakeholders in the field (Murry and Hammons, 1995; Leirman, 1996; Rowe and Wright, 1999; and Cookson, 1986).

Yet, there are some disadvantages to using a Delphi. As in any study, if there is poor design and execution or poor choice of stakeholders, the study will have flaws and major limitations from the start. Each round is dependent on the first and there needs to be concise procedures and directions followed each time. In addition, panelists “can inadvertently or deliberately promote desired outcomes or influence future decisions thus raising questions about the use of group consensus as a stopping criterion” (Gupta, 1996, p. 187). Thus, there is a heavy burden on the researcher to be aware of common mistakes and to take great care in organizing the study. It is important to make sure the purpose and questions are understandable, especially since interaction is not face-to-face. There is no room for error in directions about their contributions. Picking stakeholders is another ‘pitfall’ for many studies and because the reliability, value of the study depends on these stakeholders, great care must be taken in defining stakeholders, and choosing them (Gupta, 1996; Murry and Hammons, 1995). Time is another disadvantage of this
method. For two reasons: 1) participants may drop out after initial and/or second round because it is too time-consuming; or 2) it can take up to four or five months, therefore it is geared toward long-term future planning versus immediate issues (Murry and Hammons, 1995, Cochran 1983. Each of the disadvantages noted were accounted for during the creation of my own instrument and are addressed in the description later in this chapter.

**Future.** As lifelong learning and quality of life are hot topics on the national political agenda today in terms of education for older adults, why is this study being used? The futuristic nature of the study implies that we are dealing with an issue that will take hold five to ten years down the road. And we are. Adult arts education is not of immediate concern to arts policy and art education policy, whereas meeting standards and keeping art as a primary subject in our primary and secondary schools is. However, the Baby Boomers are going to change our focus, so we need to now address the role of art(s) in adult education. Are we going to take an active stance and be involved at the table in educational policy for adults? I have outlined multiple studies on the benefits and value of art education for adults, however, we have yet to answer the policy calls from the field to address – come to a consensus – on an aging society. In order to address the educational, demographic and social trends, forecasting needed to answer the trends. “...Future impacts may necessitate the revision of existing policies, the formulation of new policies, or changes in decision-making processes” (Pankratz, 1990, p. 267). The Delphi study’s forecasting framework allows brainstorming and outlining of alternatives, options, and views to proceed on policy issues in the future. “Exploratory policy research may be able to shed light on an emerging problem or policy opportunity...could establish
whether a knowledgeable group believes a problem exists or reveal group’s knowledge and percepts of a particular problem” (Haas and Springer, 1998, p. 27-28). Though judgments from the present are used, it allows for group reflection and discussion on what is important for the field and where the issue of “aging” fits. Much of the literature (Judd 1972; Linstone and Turoff, 1975; Uhl 1983; Leirman, 1996) identifies the contribution to forecasting in education by developing goals and objectives; improving curricula; assisting in strategic planning; and developing criteria for arts educators, arts administrators and policy makers to move forward.

Through the Delphi we can gain a sense about the probability of future events and their consequences. Thus, we can create proposals for new policy based on ‘solid information and co-operative discussion’, allowing the arts community to take an active role toward furthering the arts role in the everyday lives of our communities. The study will define the ‘policy envelope’ of adult arts education. It will identify “which aspects of the problem are policy manipulable, and which are beyond the scope of the decision maker’s authority or influence,” as well as what future action needs to be taken (Haas and Springer, 1998, p. 30). The Delphi offers a chance to contribute to the store of knowledge addressing the public purpose of the arts for all.

Description

The Delphi procedure used in this study consisted of three questionnaire rounds and one voting round. The study was based on a five-month period. Round I started on October 8, 2001, and Round IV completed on February 5, 2002 (Appendix A: Delphi Rounds Timeline). Data collection used the ‘Dillman’ multiple-contact technique. On October 8, 2001, 34 national stakeholders in the arts, adult arts education, and
gerontology were sent a formal announcement of the upcoming study and request for their participation from my advisor, Dr. James Hutchens (Appendix B: Pre-notice Letter). A formal invitation to participate from the researcher, myself, followed several days later. This letter accompanied a packet of information that included a study rationale and Delphi Technique introduction, as well as two forms to return in the enclosed stamped envelope: 1) Consent Form signed and dated; and 2) Geographic and Professional Role Form (Appendix C: Invitation Letter; Packet: Introduction to Study, Consent Form and Geographic and Professional Role Form). By returning these forms, the participants confirmed their willingness to participate and Round I: Questionnaire I was sent to them promptly via email.\footnote{\label{fn:rounds}If questionnaires were not returned on the deadline date, follow-ups for each correspondence followed two weeks in postcard format to remind participants of initial invitation.} Two more rounds followed this first round. The rounds were based on a three to four week turn around, with questionnaire inquiries and results in the following two weeks. This allowed for the first three to four months to be interaction with the stakeholders and implementation of the Delphi method, including compiling data and follow-up inquiries for each round. The last two months were devoted to interpretation of the third round and the final voting round.\footnote{The timeline was revised after my pilot; 8 – 10 peers in the fields of adult education, arts administration, and gerontology from the Midwest -- Ohio, Indiana, and Illinois -- who were chosen based on prior involvement with author in adult arts education and arts policy capacity. This trial run determined the accurateness and effectiveness of the Delphi instrument, plans for distribution, and receipt of materials. The pilot was in proportion of the target sample that participated in my study and the time necessary to complete the rounds (See Appendix E: Delphi Pilot Outcomes).}

The questionnaires were sent through my student email account, as well as U.S. postal service and the research was conducted from The Ohio State University (See Attachment B: Questionnaire Format I, II, III).\footnote{Additional opportunities for further directions or assistance via email and telephone were available to participants if they inquired beyond the questionnaire.} For the second and third rounds, I did
use a combination of post- and e-mail. An off-campus post office box was used for post mail receipt. I do think a combination of sending both a questionnaire and receiving results through post mail allowed the participants to fit their needs. Several commented that they preferred to work off-line and printed out the material versus re-entering responses onto email attachment. Originally, I thought of using a computer automated format, such as real-time computer questionnaire on a web-site. Due to strain on time and finances, this was not a possibility. It is also not a format that has a lot of research on it. I did not feel there was enough background to proceed at that stage. I was able to research email studies, and surveys and feel that I am informed on this format. Therefore, I proceeded with using email. According to Dillman (2000), *Mail and Internet Surveys: The Tailored Design Method*, the following are key points for a successful email questionnaire (p. 367-71) that I followed:

i. *Multiple contact strategies – prenotices are crucial when using email:* As mentioned, two prenotices, invitations, were sent to each participant prior to receipt of their first Questionnaire. Nothing was sent to any of the stakeholders unless they had confirmed in writing by returning the necessary signed consent form.

ii. *Personalize email contacts versus using a mass mailing:* For my pilot study, I used blind copy: BCC, which is also accepted, though I understand the necessity for “personalizing” each message. Thus, for my final study, each e-mail was personalized and sent directly to each participant one at a time. I kept complete documentation of additional communication with the participants and each Round responses.
iii. Keep cover email brief so first question of each questionnaire is visible on the screen:

I experienced this first-hand in the pilot. Several participants could not open the attachments, so I would put the questionnaire in the text of their directions/cover letter. However, one participant could not see the questionnaire because she did not scroll down and we had another email exchange where I put it first, and directions second. In addition to enclosing the text of the questionnaires (with directions, etc.) in the email, each questionnaire was attached as a word document. This again, allowed the participants to choose the more agreeable format in which to respond. Few used the attachments, in which those cases resaved their responses and then returned the document as a new attachment.

iv. Provide alternative ways for participants to respond – hitting “respond” and using email OR printing out questionnaire and sending it directly to me via service mail:

Again, I experienced this first-hand. Several of my participants printed out their questionnaires to work on them and then they would re-enter the information and send via email or post-mail. Six respondents were sent via post-mail for the second round, and the majority were returned via post-mail in the provided self-stamped envelop I included with the third and final rounds. Several participants noted their appreciation for having the choice. The following is the example of how I set up each round: There are two ways to respond to this questionnaire:

(1) Touch “Reply” command on your computer, enter your response, and touch “Send”; OR
(2) Print this message and return it with your answers to...(my address and fax number)”. Again, this suggestion came from Dillman (2000, p. 364).

v. Include a replacement questionnaire with the reminder message: I did this repeatedly with any follow-up messages. My participants were grateful and it was successful in getting them to return the questionnaires. This definitely helped keep three individuals involved, thus maintaining a low mortality rate.

vi. Decrease likelihood of wrap-around text (limit questionnaire to about 70 characters): With the design of my questionnaire, this was not a problem. Participants stayed within the margins and followed the simple and straightforward format, versus responding in a manner that would cause wrap-around text. Since the respondents were returning their responses to me, I could also re-format, if need be, to fit the set margins. This was not an issue, for the most part, in relation to wrap-around text.

vii. Begin with simple-to-answer question: Naturally, with brainstorming, this is quite open, and simple. I did use directive questions that were broad and overarching, which were perceived as simple statements that encouraged discussion by the participants (Appendix E: Delphi Pilot Outcomes).

viii. Have respondents mark “X” in brackets when making choices: This did not relate to my design of the questionnaires nor the Voting Ballot. The questionnaires for Rounds I, II, and III followed the same written format with the idea written out and clarification, strengths and weaknesses underneath. Respondents entered their responses under the necessary section and any changes, additions were added under clarification. For the Voting Ballot, respondents marked their vote by putting the idea number and theme it came under in the designated ranks, 5 to 1, for that item.
ix. Consider limiting scale lengths and making other accommodations to the
limitations of e-mail to facilitate mixed-mode comparisons when response comparisons
with other modes will be made: Because respondents had the option of printing, the form
stayed intact and there were two different types of questionnaires though mixed-mode.
For me, I used a vertical format, listing items below each item versus all of them in a
series. Dillman (2000) sees this as “encouraging respondents to see items individually
rather than as part of a larger group…may therefore produce mode differences” (p. 371).
However, with the breakout of themes and opportunity to format questionnaire under a
series of headings, respondents are still aware of the overall series of items. And since
this is more ‘brainstorming session’ and ‘consensus-building’, there are not skip options
or specific response categories, so it cancels itself out. The format did lend itself to be
long, due to the large number of responses (115 items in Round I and II, and 76 ideas in
Round III).

Each Round took on average one to two hours to complete, depending on how
involved a participant wanted to be (Note: several participants commented they spent
three-plus hours on Round III due to its importance). As noted in the literature, the
length of such a study is a disadvantage to using the Delphi. I was very appreciative of
the level of participation and involvement from start to finish of my participants. Thus, I
rewarded the stakeholders, upon receipt of their final voting round, with a token of
appreciation. The gifts were medium-sized Passion Flowers, which are made from
recycled aluminum and hand painted by Passion Work Artists. The gifts are unique in
that the organization that produces them, Passion Works (Athens, Ohio), creates art
opportunities and employment for adults with disabilities.
The coding system for the analysis that I used was pre-determined upon design of the Delphi questionnaire and outlined based on the pilot successes and challenges. Upon receipt of the initial round, a number was assigned to each participant and it appeared on all of the data collected. There was no matching of names of participants with the data they provided, nor any of the materials sent out to them. Each participant was sent an individual letter and/or email and all verbatim responses were listed anonymously. The follow-up procedures that I used with this method included: emails and additional mailings of hard copies of the questionnaires if requested, maintaining records on my distribution and receipt of the questionnaires, and email requests for uncompleted and unreturned questionnaires post the specified deadline(s).

The Stakeholders

Thirty-four national stakeholders were invited to participate. Twenty-one of the stakeholders consented to participate by returning the necessary consent and professional and geographic role forms. The following is the breakdown of why non-participants, sixteen at the start of the study, were unable to participate:

- 1 returned invitation – unknown person at address;
- 1 on sabbatical and unable to participate;
- 6 had “no time” to participate, though via e-mail and phone messages, expressed interest in the study and results;
- 1 person out-of-town and received invitation too late to participate;
- 7 “no responses” to initial and follow-up mailings.

Overall, sixteen stakeholders completed all four rounds (See Appendix D: Description of Stakeholders Roles and Geographic Region). Two (2) participants dropped out during the first two rounds due to time constraints: one left town for the winter months and did not have computer access; and the second left due to length of time commitment for this study, and the final two (2) participants declined to ‘vote’ in the
final round. The last two to drop-out of this study felt that they had engaged in the process and did not want to put a 'rank' to only five issues.

As mentioned previously, the stakeholders were chosen due to their contributions to policy, research, and practice within their respective fields: the arts; gerontology; and/or adult arts education. The group was inclusive even with the number of respondents unable to participate. Throughout the process there was distribution within the represented fields. Sixteen stakeholders represented a respectable coverage, according to the Delphi literature (Murry and Hammons, 1995; Brockhoff, 1983; Delbecq et al, 1975; and Brooks, 1979). The majority of participants sent an adjoining letter with their consent form, expressing the need for this study. In addition, the respondents welcomed the opportunity to discuss this issue and share their opinions and views on this issue with anonymous colleagues.

_The Process_

**Round 1: Identification of issues.**

Questionnaire 1 asks each participant to engage in individual brainstorming, generating as many ideas as possible to deal with exploring the issue of involvement of older adults and the arts. There were two key discussion points to which the panel was to relate the issues:

- _In an aging society, what role does adult arts education play?_

  And

- _What action could be taken to involve older adults in the arts?_
Responses were listed in a concise manner as a brief sentence or phrase. As stated on the questionnaire, the ideas were not to be fully developed and needed no justification at this time. Responses were combined and were returned anonymously.

**Round II: Builds on ideas, issues generated in Round I.**

Questionnaire 2 was created based on the responses to Round I: Questionnaire 1. Again, there were the same two key discussion points the participants were to refer the responses to:

- *In an aging society, what role does adult arts education play?*

  And

- *What action could be taken to involve older adults in the arts?*

In addition, participants were given space under each idea to:

- Clarify, refine each idea they offered, as well as others;
- Comment on strengths and weaknesses to address the issue; and
- Identify any new ideas.

This round offered participants a chance to expand on their ideas and clarify any questions or reply to strengths and weaknesses expressed by other participants. Again, responses were listed and shared anonymously.

**Round III: Arriving at consensus on importance/crucial areas to highlight.**

Questionnaire 3 was created by summarizing all of the responses, and any additional ideas, from Round II/Q2 and asked for clarifications, strengths, weaknesses, and new ideas.

Upon completion of Round III, each participant then received the Final Round Voting Ballot, which used an ordinal ranking -- "voting method." The purpose of this
ballot was to gain votes for the five best ideas based on the anonymous responses generated from Round I, II and III that deal with this issue of adult arts education. Each participant identified the top five ideas with the higher the number, the greater the importance or likelihood of impact: a rank of 5 to the most promising idea, rank of 4 to the next most promising, and 3, 2, and 1 ranks to the third, fourth, and fifth-best ideas.

For each of the top five ideas the participants also answered the following two questions:

- **How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade? And,**
- **What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?**

Votes were returned to me, tallied, and results reported in rank order of ideas based on total frequency. The frequency distribution showed the number of ranks for each idea.

In Chapter Four the data is further reviewed and I identify the top five ideas, main themes and the recommendations from this group, as well as highlight key research areas and implementation to practice and policy.

*Summary of Responses*

The questionnaires used to obtain the responses are included in Attachment B:

Initial Format of Questionnaires: Rounds I, II, III, IV instruments. The initial round, Round I, was answered by 18 of the 21 participants that returned the ‘consent-to-participate’ form. Round I served as the brainstorming session for the group. Round I resulted in 115 ideas: 48 of the ideas expressed concerned the role of adult arts education, and 67 ideas addressed actions to be taken to involve adults and the arts.

The verbatim Round I responses on the generated ideas are given below.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>In an aging society, what role does adult arts education play? (48 ideas)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Regardless of whether this is an &quot;aging society,&quot; adult arts education is part of the continuum of lifelong learning and development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>It supports the idea of self-expression as a need throughout life, particularly in the second half of life.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Arts Learning is a life-long pursuit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>I am not sure what percentage of elders might even be interested in the arts...unless they had some earlier involvements, how does one open up that door? No answer from me at this time.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Involvement in art/craft activities provide a means for creative expression, exploration of various materials and concepts, development of one's perception and art knowledge, the expression of one's feelings, and development of aesthetic taste and avoid being bored! It gives them a goal, something to do.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Art gives us the permission to ask or consider the tough questions and seek aesthetic answers or expressions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Arts education can help older adults develop new methods of expression or &quot;voice&quot; with which to engage in meaning making and integration of life experiences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>How can people even know how wonderful arts involvement can be when in their earlier years they were untouched...so getting started earlier is certainly worth attempting. This is where we've failed!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>In our diverse society, arts can serve as a bridge over the chasm of cultural misunderstanding and appreciation. Helps us better appreciate our shared heritage. Reminds us that we've been through challenging times before and not only survived them, but found meaning in them.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Art adds life to the years by encouraging self-expression, finding emotional release, seeking powerful expressions from stories or socializing with others. Art adds life to our years allowing us to be alive as long as we are alive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>It gives older adults a place in which to deal with some of the normal losses of aging and to not only express the loss but to gain identity in a time of loosing identities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>It honors older adults as the keepers and preservers of cultures and traditions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>I began to think about responses to your questionnaire by considering the shared characteristics of older adults and the variation among the members of this cohort. People who are now 65 and older have lived through turbulent times. Their personal histories intersect with and constitute the history of much of 20th century. They lived through the Great Depression, the rise of trade unions, the suppression and genocidal mania of Nazism, World War II, the atomic bomb, the fear of Communism manifested in the Cold War, the Korean War and the Vietnam War, the dismantling of the Soviets, and now an era in which technology at once empowers us and makes us vulnerable as never before. The history of these events are not just something the older adults read about. They are the events, which shaped their lives and those of their families. Could older adults give artistic form to these memories? Well, not as in the traditional history paintings but by means they can invent, such as using clippings, old letters and family photographs. And not just pasting them down but giving them artistic form and emotional power.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Research documents physical and mental effects of arts/creativity on healthy aging -- older adults can thus maintain independent living longer and put less strain and social and medical services.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>Early schooling experiences of today's older adults emphasized only a limited...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
number of the intelligences. Adult arts education can enable the development of neglected intelligences.

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>Adult arts education is useful in enhancing mental health, efficacy, and growth.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>Arts Education for Adults has a vital role in keeping Adults (particularly older adults) alive, active and interested in themselves, their environment, and the optimum ways of preserving and enriching quality of thought and feeling in all the various facets and modes of that relationship.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td>As our life span continues to lengthen, more of our population are living beyond retirement, and have time to explore interests or second careers. These quests often involve schooling, and thus make adult arts education a stronger part of the curriculum. We are an institution with an increasing population of mature (40+) students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.</td>
<td>When retired with plenty of time, the arts provide for the enjoyment of the creative expression of others via art books, art videotapes, museum visits, art/craft workshops, and art oriented lectures and art tours.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20.</td>
<td>Art helps create intellectual habits, skills and aesthetic judgments in creative expressions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21.</td>
<td>All human beings communicate in a variety of ways throughout their lives. The arts provide an excellent mode of such communication and offer a wide variety of a ways to do so.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22.</td>
<td>Participating in the arts will help older adults at all stages of cognitive function maintain their cognitive vitality for as long as possible.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23.</td>
<td>Therapy and wellness -- Adult arts education can be used to meet therapeutic and rehabilitation goals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24.</td>
<td>For frail older adults there is a therapeutic benefit to being involved in the arts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25.</td>
<td>Being encouraged to express themselves through the arts can help adults deal with difficult topics such as death and dying and losses of all kinds.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26.</td>
<td>Arts connect older adults with new roles, goals and values.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27.</td>
<td>Adult arts education provides an opportunity for new skills development and perhaps, new career direction.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28.</td>
<td>The arts encourage explorations within self-directed movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29.</td>
<td>Arts connect older adults with &quot;unfinished business&quot; of earlier ages.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30.</td>
<td>Arts connect the generations. Arts are generative and can provide older adults a way of giving back.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31.</td>
<td>Adult arts education can provide a forum for the transmission of culture and history from one generation to the next.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32.</td>
<td>Adult arts education can be used for facilitating and enhancing intergenerational programming.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33.</td>
<td>Develop capacity of parents/grandparents to reinforce arts learning of young people.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34.</td>
<td>Arts education should be that and not exclusively for older adults.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35.</td>
<td>Adult arts education can be a mechanism that promotes aesthetic art enhancements to the community and society.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36.</td>
<td>Arts connect people which is the best way to involve older adults in the arts--through people and as a connection to people. Emphasize the process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37.</td>
<td>Arts keep us in touch with our humanity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38.</td>
<td>Arts connect across racial, ethnic, religious, socio-economic lines.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39.</td>
<td>The arts connect people to social cultures by teaching them about themselves and about each other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40.</td>
<td>The people we now call older adults lived their personal lives against the backdrop of</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
a turbulent era. (Perhaps that has always been the case to a greater or lesser degree.) I believe we can reach people by tapping into what lies deep within them and helping them to give it artistic form.

41. Deepen involvement of adult consumers in arts organizations
42. Foster creative, meaningful leisure
43. There is a need for all adult people of all adult ages to access to art learning opportunities, both as part of institutional, for-credit programs or through independent, non-credit, community-based programs.
44. You can "teach an old dog new tricks." The arts, unlike verbal languages, can be taken up and mastered at any age.
45. The arts connect learning with visual images within the real world around us
46. The arts provide us with communication patterns as well as individual interpretation within visual, kinetic and sensory patterns
47. Art is important in celebrating national events by creating images of flag, sounds of patriotic movement, thespian re-creations of events, etc.
48. Art is an important environmental expression in Architecture of buildings or landscape architecture created from flora and fauna.

What action could be taken to involve older adults in the arts? (67 ideas)

1. Use research documenting physical, mental, and other benefits of arts participation as the basis of development of incentives to participate
2. Stress the value of life experiences as rich source material for creative expression
3. Earlier performance times (i.e., 7:00 pm curtains instead of 8:00 pm curtain)
4. Federal, State, and local arts funding agencies as well as private foundations should be encouraged to create, implement, and evaluate funding initiatives that support arts education programs for older adults.
5. Provide ways and means of enabling adults and older people to start off, continue and expand learning, making and appraising activities of Art Education for Adults.
6. The range of artistic background, sensitivity, and skill within a group of older adults is likely to be considerable. Their teachers need to understand how to bring out whatever lies dormant within and to introduce techniques and materials that are appropriate to the learner's capacities and to the idea and affect the person is trying to express. Focusing on the aspirations of the learner and helping her to achieve her goal is not an easy way to teach but it is the essence of the experience.
7. Arts education organizations and institutions should work with older adult advocacy groups to bring public attention to the importance of arts education to older adults.
8. Policy should be developed at the local, regional, and national levels that affirm the importance of arts education as a life-long learning process. Such policy should specifically mention the importance of the arts to older adults.
9. Cost is an issue as folks are often on fixed incomes.
10. Use schools and all other educating institutions (community colleges, further vocational colleges, universities, liberal arts colleges, conservatoria, music and drama schools and so on) as centres of excellence in the provision of such ways and means, centres and resources, on a 24/7 (twenty four hours a day, seven days a week) basis. Pay for the provision of such resources from a mixed economy of local taxes, business input and fees from contributors.
11. Carry Art Education for Adults into all parts of the community by employing "Arts Educators in residence" at Educating institutions, sports clubs, churches, theatres,
museums and art galleries, in shopping malls, in community centers, hospital and health centers, retirement villages and senior citizens homes, and all other possible locations, operating under the specific brief of "selling" the joys, excitements and practical benefits of engaging in Art Education for Adults for all members of the community and getting them to commit to it.

12. Development of arts and healing programs by health care institutions

13. Health professionals' education needs to be expanded so that members of the "team" (including MDs, nurses, therapists etc) understand the therapeutic benefits of their patients participating in the arts so that they "put in a good word" and encourage participation. Sometimes, older adults will listen to a health professional when they won't listen to anyone else.

14. Set up a research programme, in company with some Higher and tertiary educating institutions, to explore ways in which the ideas, policies, programmes and practices of Art Education for Adults might be explored, articulated, developed, provided and evaluated with a view to their improvement and expansion, and as part of this programme establish ways and means of facilitating exchanges of Arts Educators in residence, publications and artefacts of all kinds, and of personnel (teachers and learners), both within the country and also overseas.

15. Professional arts education oriented associations, such as the National Art Education Association, should promote a life long learning orientation to the arts with specific mention made of older adults.

16. Arts Education programs in higher education should include courses that prepare arts educators to create, implement, and evaluate programs for adult learners

17. Development of community partnerships between schools and organizations that serve older adults for the purpose of creating, implementing, and evaluating inter-generational arts education programs.

18. Start building a program of partnerships for learning, teaching and practising in Art Education for Adults, between the widest possible range of public and private agencies and institutions - business, industry and commerce, governments (local, state and federal), banks and financial houses of all kinds, Veterans Organisations, the Defense and Armed Forces, Ethnic Community Organisations and Clubs (especially Rotary, Lions, Buffaloes and Alumni organisations, etc.), with the aim of jointly funding, sponsoring and providing not only Arts Educators in residence but also the building or conversion of older buildings and facilities, into places where Art Education For Adults can be provided and practiced. Use the idea and motto of "Decent Corporate Citizenship".

19. Partnerships between arts organizations and adult education venues -- senior centers, community education, university extension, Elderhostel

20. NAEA needs to look at how it can reach out more effectively to community-based art education, which includes adult opportunities as well as those for young people.

21. We should encourage some rigorous research programs that evaluate the benefits of the arts for older adults so that funding in this area would increase, jobs would be created and awareness could be increased on many different levels.

22. I don't know much about programs where arts professionals receive their training but I would assume that we need to insert/develop strong curricula materials concerning older adults and the therapeutic role of the arts so they become experts and want to pursue professional opportunities in the field.

23. Make a special point of reaching the whole range of previously unreached learners - of offering Art Education for Adults to those people, groupsand communities which
are deprived, disadvantaged, and at the margins of society - especially, the poor, the unemployed, ethnic minorities, rural dwellers and those suffering under physical, emotional or mental handicaps or disadvantages of any kind.

24. Co-operate with Higher and tertiary educating institutions (HTEIs) and their Alumni organisations, to make it possible for them to offer a range of learning activities, both on- and off-campus, in short or longer term programs of either an award-bearing or a non-award-bearing kind, to potential students of all kinds and from all kinds of backgrounds and locations, to take their Art Education for Adults activities as part of a self-designed and self-selected course of study (with appropriate advice, guidance and counseling available for access when necessary), that will enable them eventually to get a degree or other qualification that might interest them as a means of expanding their own personal growth, help them start up a new career or diversify in an existing one, and make them more active participants in the community and in its social and political institutions.

25. Set up a series of conferences, local, regional, national and international, on a regular basis, in which the ideas, initiatives, policies and practices of Art Education for adults might be articulated, discussed, evaluated, developed and then delivered in Art Education for adults institutions, locally, nationally and world-wide.

26. Partnerships should be developed between arts education organizations and institutions and interest groups serving older adults for the purpose of advocating for arts programs for older adults.

27. Support older artists and arts administrators.

28. More frail older adults will become more involved in the arts if staff in long term care organizations were trained to provide arts programs.

29. Arts Administration Education programs in higher education should include courses that prepare arts administrators to create, implement, and evaluate programs for adult learners.

30. Having an elder who IS involved speak to a group and show some of her/his works might do it for a few.

31. We have found that mature (40+) students have a very strong influence on students entering college from high school. The mature students often are more serious, dedicated, and work harder. This pushes the younger students into doing the same thing to make sure they will earn their desired grades.

32. Such organizations as Elder Quest also involve mature adults in arts activities, ranging from museum tours to courses in painting, sculpture, and the other visual arts. They often also include music, drama, etc. as well.

33. As we are beginning a museum here, we are also involving many people in serving as docents for the gallery for different exhibits.

34. Barriers to participation in the arts need to be addressed. They include the fear of failure and the fear of entering "new social" spaces. Parents can be introduced to unfamiliar arts experiences via their children through school and community programs and older and retired adults could be initiated through College Alumni and Club events as well as senior and nursing home programs.

35. More could be done to make the arts part of the civic space of cities and towns. Another barrier to arts participation is that it is often perceived "outside" the normal scope of community life. This includes more public arts and more arts in public places.

36. Give Seniors vouchers and better discounts to attend the arts.

37. We certainly need more funding that would help promote older adult's participation.
<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>SRO /grandparent's living theatre</strong> is a good example.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38.</td>
<td>As the MFA in Boston does, hold young professional and other jazz events at arts venues to attract new members and viewers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39.</td>
<td>Get a &quot;pro-arts&quot; mayor or governor. Nothing like civic pride to make older adults feel the arts belong to them.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40.</td>
<td>Invite well known Arts Educators in residence and Art Education for Adults academics, professionals and practitioners from inter-state and overseas to visit individual Art Education for Adults locations and institutions, giving prestige lectures, leading seminars, conducting Workshops, building programmes of professional development for all Art Education for Adults people and Arts Educators in residence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41.</td>
<td>Although we use the term &quot;older adults&quot; as though they are a homogeneous group I believe that time has increased the variation among them. For example, some are already deeply involved in the arts. They visit galleries and museums collect art, attend lectures, read about art, enjoy traveling with Sister Wendy, etc. Others may have come to the erroneous conclusion early in life that they have no talent for art. I believe that the capacity for artistic expression in some context and form is universal. As with all learners we start with where he or she is and build upon it.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42.</td>
<td>Although many older adults are full of &quot;get-up-and-go&quot; some are confined to their home, their retirement community, or to a nursing home. Art learning and activities need to be made accessible to them by means such as on-site classes and transporting them to museums, lectures and artists' studios.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43.</td>
<td>Effective marketing of adult learning opportunities by arts organizations and other arts learning venues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44.</td>
<td>Support of public TV and radio broadcasting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45.</td>
<td>Educate the public about the arts in their communities. Newspapers can play a big role in this regard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46.</td>
<td>Participating arts activities to stimulate civic dialogue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47.</td>
<td>Attend to transportation and accommodation issues (logistical barriers) -- Transportation and access to programming is vital to participation in arts programs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48.</td>
<td>Address financial barriers to participation - for example, Iowa's ICARD discount program for low-income groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49.</td>
<td>The problem with non-credit, community-based programs are that they are not monitored for quality. They tend to often be popularity-driven, which is not necessarily bad, but may limit what new options might be offered.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50.</td>
<td>Exhibitions of the artwork of friends may inspire the observer s to try their hand at creating art.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51.</td>
<td>We need to create more of a life span approach so older adults believe that it is ok to participate without necessarily being very good. In other words, they need to be made to feel that learning something new is not only ok --but good.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52.</td>
<td>Have them create a small mural of the story of their lives showing where they lived, their life's work, family, travels, favorite foods, clothes, cars, etc. This could be done with photographs and/or by drawing and painting. This is very personal and very involving and they can show the result -- their mural -- to their family members and friends. Etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53.</td>
<td>When one can reach elders, then inviting them to see an exhibition, or a film, or hear a lecture might be a possible &quot;in&quot; to inspire interest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54.</td>
<td>Demonstrations involving art media and aesthetic ideas/concepts/approaches are a means of getting people interested and motivated.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
55. Art games, jigsaw puzzles of art masterpieces may inspire people to try to do their own artwork--create their own paintings, etc.

56. Encouragement of adult arts learning as part of religious activities

57. Life review and reminiscence activities are an important part of involving elders in activities.

58. Working together on art projects develops friendships and understanding of various points of view concerning art expression and design.

59. Intergenerational programs enable older Americans to serve as mentors to younger folks strengthen communities and gives elders sense of values.

60. Focus on intergenerational programming

61. It can provide opportunities for mentoring and volunteering and thus meaning in the second half of life.

62. Recognize that older adults are not a homogenous group and target actions tailored to a wide variety of income levels, educational attainment, cultural backgrounds, health conditions, and previous exposure to the arts.

63. Observing the art of other countries and cultures develops an understanding of the many peoples of the world, as well as the history of various peoples/countries of the world.

64. I am really not sure, as I don't see ways in which folks are even being enticed into considering involvement in the arts for themselves. How do you reach out to elders who don't join groups or otherwise try to get involved? A challenge...

65. Coming in via the "back door" has possibilities...not even mentioning "art" or "arts" and doing some programming that brings folks together and suddenly some will say "hey, this is interesting," or whatever…and perhaps a 2nd round can hook them into some involvement.

66. Explanations of what creative art involves may encourage some to try to do art (Art involves thinking, feeling, and perceptions expressed in a personal manner).

67. In life we more or less do what we want to do in our free country, so try any activity that will get a person to "want to make art".

The results of Round I were used to construct the 115-item questionnaire for Round II.

For Round II the stakeholders revisited the ideas of Round I and in addition, clarified each idea, if need be, and listed strengths and weaknesses. The majority of the group listed strengths and weaknesses for all the responses. At this point, the participants were narrowing down the ideas and identifying connections among the ideas that became popular themes. The themes that came out of Round II include: (1) Role of the arts: Cultural heritage; Intergenerational relationships; Lifelong learning; Meaning making; Multiple intelligences/learning styles; Quality of life/well-being; Relationships – Cultural, Interpersonal; Self-expression; and (2) Advocacy; Funding and policy;
Collaboration and partnerships; Higher Education/Professional education and training; Incentives and barriers to participation; Intergenerational programming; Research; and Marketing and Audience Development. With Round II, the stakeholders had identified key areas of interest and started to narrow down the long list of 115 ideas by eliminating or combining ideas. They also started to redefine the above themes, which had them starting to form consensus on the ideas.

By Round III, the ideas were down to a 76-item questionnaire with the following themes: *Arts in Healing/Art Therapy* (4 ideas); *Defining Adults, Older Adults* (3 ideas); *Higher Education/Professional Organizations* (12 ideas); *Intergenerational* (3 ideas); *Marketing* (4 ideas); *Participation* (9 ideas); *Partnerships* (4 ideas); *Programs* (5 ideas); *Public Policy* (4 ideas); and the *Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning* (28 ideas):

**Arts in Healing/Art Therapy**

1. Therapy and wellness -- Adult arts education can be used to meet therapeutic and rehabilitation goals.
2. Life review and reminiscence activities are an important part of involving elders in activities.
3. Development of arts and healing programs by health care institutions.
4. Health professionals' education needs to be expanded so that members of the "team" (including MDs, nurses, therapists etc) understand the therapeutic benefits of their patients participating in the arts so that they "put in a good word" and encourage participation. Sometimes, older adults will listen to a health professional when they won't listen to anyone else.

**Defining Adults, Older Adult Art Education**

#1. Adult learners: who are they? Ages! Abilities! This needs to be addressed--acknowledging diversity is very critical in working with adults! (50 adults vs. 50 4th graders: more diversity in adult group than in youth of 9-10 year age groups).

#2. Recognize that "older adults" are not a homogenous group and target actions tailored to a wide variety of income levels, educational attainment, cultural backgrounds, health conditions, and previous exposure to the arts.

#3. The range of artistic background, sensitivity, and skill within a group of older adults is likely to be considerable. Their teachers need to understand how to bring out whatever lies dormant within and to introduce techniques and materials that are appropriate to the learner's capacities and to the idea and affect the person is trying
to express. Focusing on the aspirations of the learner and helping them to achieve her goal is not an easy way to teach but it is the essence of the experience.

**Higher Education/ Professional Organizations**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Need a database or databases (web-based?) of programs/organizations at the local, regional, and national level to share innovative ideas and foster partnerships.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Arts Education programs in higher education should include courses that prepare arts educators to create, implement, and evaluate programs for adult learners.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Arts Administration Education programs in higher education should include courses that prepare arts administrators to create, implement, and evaluate programs for adult learners.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Set up a series of conferences, local, regional, national and international, on a regular basis, in which the ideas, initiatives, policies and practices of Art Education for adults might be articulated, discussed, evaluated, developed and then delivered in Art Education for adults institutions, locally, nationally and world-wide.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>NAEA needs to look at how it can reach out more effectively to community-based art education, which includes adult opportunities as well as those for young people.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Professional arts education oriented associations, such as the National Art Education Association, should promote a life long learning orientation to the arts with specific mention made of older adults.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>We should encourage some rigorous research programs that evaluate the benefits of the arts for older adults so that funding in this area would increase, jobs would be created and awareness could be increased on many different levels.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Arts education organizations and institutions should work with older adult advocacy groups to bring public attention to the importance of arts education to older adults.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Use schools and all other educating institutions (community colleges, further vocational colleges, universities, liberal arts colleges, conservatoria, music and drama schools and so on) as centres of excellence in the provision of such ways and means, centres and resources, on a 24/7 (twenty four hours a day, seven days a week) basis. Pay for the provision of such resources from a mixed economy of local taxes, business input and fees from contributors.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Set up a research programme, in company with some Higher and tertiary educating institutions, to explore ways in which the ideas, policies, programmes and practices of Art Education for Adults might be explored, articulated, developed, provided and evaluated with a view to their improvement and expansion, and as part of this programme establish ways and means of facilitating exchanges of Arts Educators in residence, publications and artifacts of all kinds, and of personnel (teachers and learners), both within the country and also overseas.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Invite well known Arts Educators in residence and Art Education for Adults academics, professionals and practitioners from inter-state and overseas to visit individual Art Education for Adults locations and institutions, giving prestige lectures, leading seminars, conducting Workshops, building programmes of professional development for all Art Education for Adults people and Arts Educators in residence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Co-operate with Higher and tertiary educating institutions (HTEIs) and their Alumni organisations, to make it possible for them to offer a range of learning activities, both on- and off-campus, in short or longer term programs of either an award-bearing or a non-award-bearing kind, to potential students of all kinds and</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

105
from all kinds of backgrounds and locations, to take their Art Education for Adults activities as part of a self-designed and self-selected course of study (with appropriate advice, guidance and counseling available for access when necessary), that will enable them eventually to get a degree or other qualification that might interest them as a means of expanding their own personal growth, help them start up a new career or diversify in an existing one, and make them more active participants in the community and in its social and political institutions.

**Intergenerational**

1. Arts connect the generations. Arts are generative and can provide older adults a way of giving back.
2. Adult arts education can be used for facilitating and enhancing intergenerational programming.
3. Intergenerational programs enable older Americans to serve as mentors (or volunteers) to younger folks – strengthen communities and gives elders [adults] sense of values.

**Marketing**

1. Start national ad campaign to encourage people to watch less television and participate more in local arts opportunities...
2. Effective marketing of adult learning opportunities by arts organizations and other arts learning venues
3. Support of public TV and radio broadcasting
4. Educate the public about the arts in their communities. Newspapers can play a big role in this regard.

**Participation – Incentives & Barriers**

1. Use research documenting physical, mental, and other benefits of arts participation as the basis of development of incentives to participate.
2. Make a special point of reaching the whole range of previously un-reached learners - of offering Art Education for Adults to those people, groups and communities which are deprived, disadvantaged, and at the margins of society - especially, the poor, the unemployed, ethnic minorities, rural dwellers and those suffering under physical, emotional or mental handicaps or disadvantages of any kind.
3. Although many older adults are full of "get-up-and-go" some are confined to their home, their retirement community, or to a nursing home. Art learning and activities need to be made accessible to them by means such as on-site classes and transporting them to museums, lectures and artists' studios.
4. More could be done to make the arts part of the civic space of cities and towns. Another barrier to arts participation is that it is often perceived "outside" the normal scope of community life. This includes more public arts and more arts in public places.
5. Address financial barriers to participation - for example, Iowa's ICARD discount program for low-income groups – Cost is an issue.
6. Attend to transportation and accommodation issues (logistical barriers) -- Transportation and access to programming is vital to participation in arts programs.
7. Barriers to participation in the arts need to be addressed. They include the fear of failure and the fear of entering "new social" spaces. Parents can be introduced to unfamiliar arts experiences via their children through school and community programs and older and retired adults could be initiated through College Alumni and Club events as well as senior and nursing home programs.

8. Time is also an adult variable. Retirees may have more – but not necessarily.

9. Earlier performance times (i.e., 7:00 pm curtains instead of 8:00 pm curtain)

**Partnerships**

1. Development of community partnerships between schools and organizations that serve older adults for the purpose of creating, implementing, and evaluating inter-generational arts education programs…

2. Start building a program of partnerships for learning, teaching and practising in Art Education for Adults, between the widest possible range of public and private agencies and institutions - business, industry and commerce, governments (local, state and federal), banks and financial houses of all kinds, Veterans Organisations, the Defense and Armed Forces, Ethnic Community Organisations and Clubs (especially Rotary, Lions, Buffaloes and Alumni organisations, etc.), with the aim of jointly funding, sponsoring and providing not only Arts Educators in residence but also the building or conversion of older buildings and facilities, into places where Art Education For Adults can be provided and practiced. Use the idea and motto of "Decent Corporate Citizenship".

3. Partnerships should be developed between arts organizations, arts education organizations and institutions and interest groups serving older adults – and adult education venues – senior centers, community education, university extension, Elderhostel -- for the purpose of advocating for arts programs for older adults.

4. Carry Art Education for Adults into all parts of the community by employing "Arts Educators in residence" (AER) at Educating institutions, sports clubs, churches, theatres, museums and art galleries, in shopping malls, in community centers, hospital and health centers, retirement villages and senior citizens homes, and all other possible locations, operating under the specific brief of "selling" the joys, excitements and practical benefits of engaging in Art Education for Adults for all members of the community and getting them to commit to it.

**Programs/Examples**

1. Create display space at an indoor mall

2. Read aloud from new literary works on the radio

3. Having an elder who IS involved speak to a group and show some of her/his works might do it for a few.

4. Coming in via the "back door" has possibilities...not even mentioning "art" or "arts" and doing some programming that brings folks together and suddenly some will say "hey, this is interesting," or whatever...and perhaps a 2nd round can hook them into some involvement.

5. Museum outreach programs should be developed with a focus on senior populations.
Public Policy – Funding for Adult Art Education

1. Policy should be developed at the local, regional, and national levels that affirm the importance of arts education as a life-long learning process. Such policy should specifically mention the importance of the arts to older adults.

2. Federal, State, and local arts funding agencies as well as private foundations should be encouraged to create, implement, and evaluate funding initiatives that support arts education programs for older adults.

3. Support older artists and arts administrators.

4. Get a "pro-arts" mayor or governor. Nothing like civic pride to make older adults feel the arts belong to them.

The Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning

1. Provide ways and means of enabling adults and older people (AOP) to start off, continue and expand learning, making and appraising activities of Art Education for Adults.

2. Encouragement of adult arts learning as part of religious activities.

3. Many if not most of the statements about the role of arts education are true across the life span, not just for older adults. Although targeted marketing is important to widen participation, it should be done within the 'big picture' context of the life-span continuum.

4. Reading all of these ideas, it occurs to me that there are multiple definitions for what we consider art.” Why have humans made art throughout our existence? Judgments of quality or aesthetic value seem inextricably linked to economic value in contemporary society. Or is art about something in the human spirit that must be expressed? Answers to these questions would seem to me to provide the framework within which arts education is provided.

5. Regardless of whether this is an "aging society," adult arts education is part of the continuum of lifelong learning and development.

6. Art adds life to the years by encouraging self-expression, finding emotional release, seeking powerful expressions from stories or socializing with others. Art adds life to our years allowing us to be alive as long as we are alive.

7. It supports the idea of self-expression as a need throughout life -- particularly in the second half of life.

8. Involvement in art/craft activities provide a means for creative expression, exploration of various materials and concepts, development of one's perception and art knowledge, the expression of one's feelings, and development of aesthetic taste and avoid being bored! It gives them a goal, something to do.

9. Arts education can help older adults develop new methods of expression or "voice" with which to engage in meaning making and integration of life experiences.

10. In our diverse society, arts can serve as a bridge over the chasm of cultural misunderstanding and appreciation. Helps us better appreciate our shared heritage. Reminds us that we’ve been through challenging times before and not only survived them, but found meaning in them.

11. It gives older adults a place in which to deal with some of the normal losses of aging and to not only express the loss but to gain identity in a time of loosening identities.
<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Research documents physical and mental effects of arts/creativity on healthy aging -- older adults can thus maintain independent living longer and put less strain and social and medical services.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Early schooling experiences of today's older adults emphasized only a limited number of the intelligences. Adult arts education can enable the development of neglected intelligences.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Adult arts education is useful in enhancing adult mental health, efficacy, and growth.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>Arts Education for Adults has a vital role in keeping adults alive, active and interested in themselves, their environment, and the optimum ways of preserving and enriching quality of thought and feeling in all the various facets and modes of that relationship.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>As our life span continues to lengthen, more of our population are living longer, and have time to explore interests or second careers. These quests often involve schooling, and thus make adult arts education a stronger part of the curriculum. We are an institution with an increasing population of mature (40+) students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>The arts provide adults with opportunities for enjoyment of the creative expression of others via art books, art videotapes, museum visits, art/craft workshops, and art oriented lectures and art tours.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td>Art helps create intellectual habits, skills and aesthetic judgments in creative expressions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.</td>
<td>All human beings communicate in a variety of ways throughout their lives. The arts provide an excellent mode of such communication and offer a wide variety of ways to do so.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20.</td>
<td>Adult arts education provides an opportunity for new skills development and perhaps, new career direction.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21.</td>
<td>We need to create more of a life span approach so older adults believe that it is ok to participate without necessarily being very good. In other words, they need to be made to feel that learning something new is not only ok --but good.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22.</td>
<td>Arts connect adults with &quot;unfinished business&quot; of earlier life stages &amp; ages.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23.</td>
<td>Adult arts education can be a mechanism that promotes aesthetic art enhancements to the community (and society).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24.</td>
<td>Arts can help to connect people across racial, ethnic, religious, socio-economic lines.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25.</td>
<td>The arts connect people to social cultures by teaching them about themselves and about each other.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26.</td>
<td>There is a need for all adults of all ages to access to art learning opportunities, both as part of institutional, for-credit programs or through independent, non-credit, community-based programs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27.</td>
<td>(You can &quot;teach an old dog new tricks.&quot;) The arts, unlike verbal languages, can be taken up and mastered at any age.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28.</td>
<td>Considering the second section: would it be possible to be indirect (subversive)? What I have in mind is if older adults are not attracted to become involved with the arts, why not have the arts go to them...be part of everything they are...which I would guess is often already the case. So those wanting to fund and support older adult arts education, could support where it already is – libraries, museums, adult day care centers, senior and community centers, retirement homes, learning in retirement institutes, colleges and universities, community colleges, theaters, concert halls, and on and on.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Round III provided the group an opportunity to examine the changes from Round II. Thus, the stakeholders are once again reviewed and discussed the ideas that have progressed through Rounds I, II, and now III. Participants were asked to add any additional rationale or ideas, but at this point there were only confirmations added to the strengths of the ideas (i.e. Great idea!; Important to the field! etc.). By Round III, the group had exhausted their responses with clarifications, if any, and strengths and weaknesses of the ideas and were ready to proceed with the Voting Ballot (see verbatim responses of Round III in Appendix G: Round III Responses – Questionnaire 3: Final Responses). After Round III was completed, each participant filled out the Voting Sheet. The Voting sheet asked group members to pick only the top five ideas out of the 76 ideas that are critical to moving the issue of adult arts education to the forefront. The participants rated their answers using a voting scale of 1 through 5 with the higher the number, the greater the importance, the more promising the idea. The final top five votes and the analysis of the responses are outlined in Chapter Four.

Field Outcome

From Round I to the Final Voting, the participants felt the instrument presented opportunities to raise issues, as well as highlight strengths and weaknesses to get one’s point across. The instrument proved reliable and it was an organized 5-month period. From the responses, I was able to obtain the frequency distribution and share the collective responses, rates, and comments from each round, which did lead to achieving stability in the responses. Through this process I was able identify an overview of the group’s attitudes, beliefs, knowledge of this issue, and their objectives and goals in serving the needs of adults and the role of the arts in an aging society.
In this case, the Delphi offered an opportunity to find out what was on the
stakeholders’ minds and what they think and how they feel about this issue. The
participants’ identity was protected and treated with respect. They had been given full
information on the study prior to participation and have followed my progress on the final
completion. The results reflect the research and practice I found to-date that have
impacted my work and the guiding research questions that formed the conceptual
structure of the entire inquiry. These include: (1) Building on current educational
literature concerning general adult and art education relevant to this study and identify
key relationships with the data; (2) Identifying the importance of the values associated
specifically with education and human development in and through the arts; (3) The
policy implications of lifelong learning in adult education and its link to the concept of
lifelong learning in arts education; (4) How the policy perspectives of aging and adult
education connect with adult arts education and how this supports the argument that adult
art education merits a place on the national arts policy agenda; And, (5) why the Delphi
technique was appropriate for generating images of the future in adult lifelong learning in
the arts. The stakeholders became my partners in my investigation by: Offering insight
into the format and process, as well as connecting with the literature of the arts field and
forecasting how we can further involve adults in the arts; Identifying key themes and
movements within the field to increase creative fulfillment in our communities and
individuals; and Providing a framework to lead research into practice into policy.
CHAPTER 4
DATA ANALYSIS

In this chapter I will lay out the 16 stakeholders' anonymous views, their individual opinions, and the consensus of the group on the role the arts play in adult arts education and what action should be taken to move the issue of adult arts education – a lifelong learning for all ages – message forward.

Voting Responses

It should be noted that due to the small sample size of my study – even though it fits within the Delphi literature recommended minimum and maximum (10 to 30, respectively) respondents (Murry and Hammons, 1995; Brockhoff, 1983; Delbecq et al, 1975; and Brooks, 1979) – I am limited in showing the statistical significance of my study because I have less than 30 respondents [total 16] who completed all four rounds. What I can show is (1) the TOP FIVE ideas based on frequency. The frequency is the breakdown of ranks given to an idea, based on the rank-order of 5 to 1, with 5 points as most important and 1 point being the least most important; and (2) the consensus of KEY THEMES due to the high volume of votes which highlight the high or low interest of this theme. Through the Delphi method, the stakeholders “creat[ed] the universe of possibilities” with the initial 115-ideas generated in Round 1, and “then through [the Delphi]…interactive process develop[ed] consensus about priorities” (Lindeman, 1981,
The themes became the route to tailor and interpret this research so it could become a readable form and then utilized as "information" or as "policy recommendation" (Linstone and Turoff, 1975, p. 20). As mentioned, the votes were based on a rank-order response from each participant. Each participant had a total of 15 -- 5 ranks to distribute: 5, 4, 3, 2, 1, and since there were 16 total respondents, 80 was the total possible votes for any theme. The second section highlights the data collection and data analysis used in this research. The themes were outcomes of the three rounds and from the coded data "major concepts and constructs" were formed and created the "storyline" for this qualitative study (Holloway, 1997, p. 80-82). Thus, the theme section discusses the breakdown of the high and middle themes of interest. They are listed to show the total ideas suggested, the breakdown of the frequency scores and their relationship to the literature and movements within the arts field, identifying the key themes recommended by the stakeholders. The themes serve as the starting point for further identification and discussion of the importance of these issues in the effort to move adult arts education forward. First, we will look at the overall top five ideas.

(1) TOP VOTES: The following are the top five votes based on the frequency of ranks stakeholders assigned out of the total Round III 76 ideas: 35

---

35 See Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses for the breakdown of each participants top five votes. See Appendix K: Final Votes of Stakeholders (based on Role).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>F=7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Idea #2. (THEME: Defining Adults, Older Adults) Recognize that “older adults” are not a homogenous group and target actions tailored to a wide variety of income levels, educational attainment, cultural backgrounds, health conditions, and previous exposure to the arts.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>F=4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Idea #1. (THEME: Public Policy) Policy should be developed at the local, regional, and national levels that affirm the importance of arts education as a life-long learning process. Such policy should specifically mention the importance of the arts to older adults.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>F=4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Idea #4. (THEME: Higher Education/Professional Development, Organizations) Set up a series of conferences, local, regional, national and international, on a regular basis, in which the ideas, initiatives, policies and practices of Art Education for adults might be articulated, discussed, evaluated, developed and then delivered in Art Education for adults institutions, locally, nationally and world-wide.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>F=4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Idea #2. (THEME: Higher Education/Professional Development, Organs.) Arts Education programs in higher education should include courses that prepare arts educators to create, implement, and evaluate programs for adult learners.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>F=4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>#2. (THEME: Partnerships) Start building a program of partnerships for learning, teaching and practising in Art Education for Adults, between the widest possible range of public and private agencies and institutions - business, industry and commerce, governments (local, state and federal), banks and financial houses of all kinds, Veterans Organisations, the Defense and Armed Forces, Ethnic Community Organisations and Clubs (especially Rotary, Lions, Buffaloes and Alumni organisations, etc.), with the aim of jointly funding, sponsoring and providing not only Arts Educators in residence but also the building or conversion of older buildings and facilities, into places where Art Education For Adults can be provided and practiced. Use the idea and motto of &quot;Decent Corporate Citizenship&quot;.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\[ f = \text{Frequency; number of ranks this idea received.} \]

Now let us take a look individually at the top five votes and discuss why they were most important, as well as the outcomes of strengths and weaknesses of each from the stakeholders’ discussions within Rounds I, II, and III.
(1) TOP VOTES based on High Frequency. The numbers identified under each idea show the ranks received for this idea as one of the top five (5) most important ideas.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1st Most Promising Idea</th>
<th>Idea #2. (THEME: Defining Adults, Older Adults) Recognize that “older adults” are not a homogenous group and target actions tailored to a wide variety of income levels, educational attainment, cultural backgrounds, health conditions, and previous exposure to the arts.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7 ranks for this idea:  5, 5, 3, 3, 3, 2, 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Why is this idea so important? According to seven votes from the stakeholders, it is important because:

- It is very important if arts education for older adults is going to ‘make it’ and receive the respect it should get. It needs to be based in sound theory.

- Population diversity will continue to increase (on many levels—ethnicity, culture, income, etc.) and the large numbers of older adults in the population in the coming decade cannot be treated as a monolithic group in arts education planning and development.

- Given the broad demographic shifts and increased diversity in all aspects of our society, older adults should be viewed as an equally diverse population. Also given the recognition of an increasing wide array of learning styles, it is important to build such flexibility into our understanding of arts education, as well.

- This idea should and must undergrid all partnerships, policies, and programs that will be developed in the next decade. While the world of cultural production is rapidly consolidating, such consolidation can only survive if providers of products and services can identify and serve niche markets. Yes, older adults are not a homogenous group, especially as the %'s of healthy, active seniors increases. Those who remember this will succeed in an increasingly privatized system of cultural production.

- Many approaches needed to reach diverse group

---

36 Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
This idea gets at the importance of recognizing the cultural diversity inherent in older adults as well as in American society generally. This idea is foundational to who we are as a nation.

I was conflicted here – I did not put down the idea about funding more research in the area of adult art education – although I do think that would help us to sell funding agencies on the importance of the arts. I finally decided on an idea that involved designing art programs specifically for older adults -- taking into consideration their particular needs, interests and learning styles. Unless we have a good 'product' we don't have much more to offer than those terrible crafts programs one often encounters in senior centers and long-term care facilities. Creating quality art programs which are designed for the adult learner (in all his/her diversity) is critical!

At what level – local, state, and/or national – does action need to be taken to have the most impact?37

It should help define programs (educational) and then should guide the actual practice. Funding decisions at all 3 levels should be influenced by this and on an individual (local) level – success will depend on it.

Local impact will vary due to the demographics of any given area. The national and state levels can foster awareness and disseminate policy and information for targeting arts education.

I believe that the education mantra of President Bush and others of “reaching all kids” will increasingly become viewed as reaching “all learners.” If so, the issue of socio-economic, ethnic, racial and learning style diversity will become an important subject for all involved in arts education and programming.

This issue will have significant impacts at all levels and in all settings.

Essential concept in all of education, health care, social policy, etc. – the national debate related to growing older population

Given changing demographics within the US and the growing importance of multicultural orientations to education, this idea will be very important

If we hope to encourage and expand art education for older adults, then we must provide quality programs based on a thorough understanding of the needs, capabilities and interests of that population.
Throughout Rounds I, II and III the main focus for this idea was to recognize the various ways to define “adults”. Other views shared on this issue include the following:

- As mentioned above, older adults are more than a homogeneous group. We need to explore effective ways of niche marketing in the arts for them as well.

- Another part of the broader framework has to do with the ways in which older adults are perceived and valued in contemporary society. Older adult arts education can be marginalized/isolated in senior centers and nursing homes. It should be integrated across society. What will be the impact of the population of older adults reaching “critical mass”?

- Although we use the term “older adults” as though they are a homogeneous group I believe that time has increased the variation among them. For example, some are already deeply involved in the arts. They visit galleries and museums collect art, attend lectures, read about art, enjoy traveling with Sister Wendy, etc. Others may have come to the erroneous conclusion early in life that they have no talent for art. I believe that the capacity for artistic expression in some context and form is universal. (This is my experience! Even those with entrenched idea that they are not artistic can achieve satisfying results with encouragement.)

- As with all learners we start with where he or she is and build upon it.

The strengths for this idea are the following:

- We need to plan for the baby boomers and how they will age as well

- Critically important in any marketing effort

- Yes, art is an individual thing and teaching art to people should be individualized as much as possible. You may take one subject but everyone may view it differently according to their background. That is why teaching is so much fun. Well, one of the reasons!

- Necessary starting point

- Very important not to consider older adults a homogeneous group, not only in terms of arts participation, but also educational attainment, income, cultural background, etc.

---

37 Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
38 Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses Defining Adults, Older Adults Idea #2.
39 Ibid.
One weakness for this idea felt there is a need to focus on inspiring baby boomers, as they will age as much as they fight the idea.\textsuperscript{40}

\begin{center}
\begin{tabular}{|l|l|}
\hline
2\textsuperscript{nd} Most Promising Idea & Idea \#1. (THEME: Public Policy) Policy should be developed at the local, regional, and national levels that affirm the importance of arts education as a life-long learning process. Such policy should specifically mention the importance of the arts to older adults. \\
\hline
\textbf{4 ranks for this idea: 5, 5, 5, 4} \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
\end{center}

Why is this idea so promising?\textsuperscript{41}

- \textit{It is very important. Given that policy guides action it is only when such policy is in place will we see a significant growth in public programs that affirm the arts as a part of life long learning.}

- \textit{At the heart of it all.}

- \textit{Policy should be developed at local, regional, and national levels that affirm the importance of art’s education as life-long learning, etc. This idea is very important -- not all schools require art now but a few more are beginning to each year -- let alone seeing need for art for adults! Have to establish policy.}

- \textit{Policy attention is often necessary for an issue to receive public recognition and discussion. Policy development need not mean extensive funding, but it can place an issue on radar screens.}

At what level – local, state, and/or national – does action need to be taken to have the most impact?\textsuperscript{42}

- \textit{Very likely given that policy – at any level -- will guide action}

- \textit{Depends on those we elect to leadership positions.}

- \textit{It has to start on the local level to get support at state and then national level.}

\textsuperscript{40} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses Defining Adults, Older Adults Idea \#2.
\textsuperscript{41} Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
\textsuperscript{42} Ibid.
Likelihood is hard to gauge. But, it seems to me, adult arts education now has a unique policy window to gain attention. All arts policy has become arts education policy. And most arts education policy is workforce development policy. Add to this the inexorable aging of America. Given these conditions, if adult arts education can't get some public attention over the next decade, it never will.

Strengths for this idea include supporting with data and using this statement of action to move forward. A couple of weaknesses: Should it not be specifically for older adults but for all human beings regardless of age? We do not want to give the impression that children should wait until they are older to have art experiences. And, another thought is Older adult education has ‘taken off’ in the last 20 years without public policy or public funding. Is public policy and funding a blessing or a curse? Or will sound policy action curb this?\textsuperscript{43}

\begin{table}[h]
\centering
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline
2\textsuperscript{nd} Most Promising Idea & Idea #4. (THEME: Higher Education/Professional Organizations) Set up a series of conferences, local, regional, national and international, on a regular basis, in which the ideas, initiatives, policies and practices of Art Education for adults might be articulated, discussed, evaluated, developed and then delivered in Art Education for adults institutions, locally, nationally and world-wide. \\
\hline
\hline
4 ranks for this idea: 5, 4, 3, 2 & \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
\end{table}

Why is this idea important?\textsuperscript{44}

- NAEA has set up a LifeLong Learning affiliate among its membership and sponsors conferences/publications, etc. GOOD IDEAS need to be refined, articulated, discussed, evaluated, developed and then delivered to Artists and Art Educations sponsors locally, nationally and world-wide...Marketing and Distribution of GOOD IDEAS is the opportunity for the 21st Century.

- There is the old debate about which comes first, marketing or organizing of local, regional, national and international art conferences (was the chicken or egg most

\textsuperscript{43} Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
\textsuperscript{44} Ibid.
important). Once the marketing scheme is in place, then the defining,
articulating, discussion, evaluation and development of conference packages need
to be developed. National and International conference packages will be the most
important in the 21st Century.

- It can set things in motion and give support and direction to the development of a
nation-wide program.

- VIP NAEA is behind in expanding beyond K-12 concerns alone.

At what level – local, state, and/or national – does action need to be taken to have the
most impact?45

- Partnerships among artists, art educators and art sponsors will DEFINE our 21st
Century programs. Art History, Art Criticism, Art Aesthetics and Art Production
issues need to be defined, articulated, discussed, evaluated, developed and then
delivered.

- Partnership Development between NAEA, 2002 Cultral Olympiad will be as
important in GREECE, ITALY & CHINA as they are in the 2002
Olympic/Paralympic hosted in Salt Lake City, Utah. The host site will change.
The need for appropriate ART BASED content to market at these events will not
change.

- If it is carried out its effect will be powerful.

- It must attend to this OR fall behind!

Notes from Round I, II, III46 indicate the concern for the professional art education
organization National Art Education Association (NAEA) to address adults and a focus
on lifelong learning for all ages. Though this idea voted high, there was discussion on
feasibility. A few expressed concern that this idea is over-ambitious. Though, as one
stakeholder points out, The LifeLong Learning Affiliate meets at the NAEA national
convention every year when research and policies, etc are presented and discussed. I do
not know that they have a national publication, relying on the NAEA publications

45 Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
46 Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses Higher Education/Professional Organizations Idea #4.

120
wherein they may submit articles for publication. Another points to the current lack of support within NAEA for this group and said the affiliate may have to shut down. There was also concern expressed over whether or not incorporating DBAE is that a good thing or not? One participant said, As stated, we have to assume that 'art education' means DBAE (aka NAEA stance). Need a DBAE statement of LLL! Whereas, another feels that DBAE should not be used. Obviously, there is a window of opportunity to take the wealth of experience of NAEA members and information gathered in this study to curb the growing lack of support and concern with current NAEA handling to help shape future direction and collective action.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2nd Most Promising Idea</th>
<th>Idea #2. (THEME: Higher Education/Professional Organizations) Arts Education programs in higher education should include courses that prepare arts educators to create, implement, and evaluate programs for adult learners.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4 ranks for this idea: 4, 3, 2, 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Why is this idea important to the field?

- Critical to prepare future art teachers re: leaders to teach learning & teaching

- This idea is significant to preparing people to work with children and youth in such a way so that they can learn to appreciate the arts as a part of life long learning.

- Very important. Such training will be needed to effectively stimulate and satisfy demand for adult arts education. Also, in an environment where there will surely be plenty of "providers" of adult arts education with little or no training to do so, university training can help to set and maintain standards of quality in arts education.

---

47 Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
48 Ibid.
49 Ibid.
50 Ibid.
Unless this happens, the impact will be very short-term.

At what level – local, state, and/or national – does action need to be taken to have the most impact?51

- As more are thus educated pressure will build!

- Teaching children and youth to appreciate the arts as integral to lifelong learning will significantly influence their participation in arts after formal schooling as well as their appreciation of policy that supports life long participation in the arts.

- It will mostly have impacts in university settings, but gradually will lead to improvements in program quality at national, state, and local levels.

- If implemented the impact will be huge and health status will increase. However, I think the likelihood of it happening isn't good.

Discussion from Round I, II, and III include the following clarifications that several felt were important. 1) We need to insert/develop strong curricula materials concerning older adults and the therapeutic role of the arts so they become experts and want to pursue professional opportunities in the field; and 2) University courses should be developed to train activity personnel who work with seniors in quality art education practices.

Strengths for this idea are that52:

- Aging should be part of college education as well (in general)

- This is a needed initiative

- Yes, they should, but many are now concerned with making art an academic subject wherein the study of art history seem to be the predominant aspect. Making art has now taking a backseat in the field. For me this is a sad state of affairs for art education.

51 Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
52 Appendix G: Round III Responses-Q3 Responses Higher Education/Professional Organizations Idea #2.
One weakness expressed was that *Yes, I would think so but most teachers on the college level in the fine arts see themselves as "artists" and not teachers or as educators. In fact, the feeling seems to be that those who can't do art, they teach and they seem to look down on those in art education.* Another participant agreed this may be true for some.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2\textsuperscript{nd} Most Promising Idea</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>#2. (Partnerships) Start building a program of partnerships for learning, teaching and practising in Art Education for Adults, between the widest possible range of public and private agencies and institutions - business, industry and commerce, governments (local, state and federal), banks and financial houses of all kinds, Veterans Organisations, the Defense and Armed Forces, Ethnic Community Organisations and Clubs (especially Rotary, Lions, Buffaloes and Alumni organisations, etc.), with the aim of jointly funding, sponsoring and providing not only Arts Educators in residence but also the building or conversion of older buildings and facilities, into places where Art Education For Adults can be provided and practiced. Use the idea and motto of &quot;Decent Corporate Citizenship&quot;.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4 ranks for this idea: 3, 2, 2, 1

The following reasons were given for this idea’s importance\textsuperscript{54}:

- *A very innovative idea – creating partnerships to fund AER [Art Education for Adults] to work with older adults and to create art centers! I really liked the idea of developing Artist in Residence programs – paying art educators to go into senior centers, churches, art centers, etc., etc., and develop classes for older adults. This seems to be a simple idea that could begin on a very modest, grassroots level. Retired art educators could plug in, as well as art teachers who might be free during the summer for such a program.*

- *Very important after we have won them over -- as to the importance of art expression -- The range within a group of older adults is considerable -- teachers need to understand how to bring creative expression out, help them achieve their goals and art works.*

\textsuperscript{53} Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
\textsuperscript{54} Ibid.
• Very critical unless Congress gives more money to cultural arts and education...

• Collaboration has increasingly become a theme in many areas of education, not only to extend and share scarce resources but also to bring together the viewpoints of many stakeholders and reduce the fragmented efforts of groups working in isolation. Both the economic and holistic aspects of this issue should continue to be important in the future.

At what level – local, state, and/or national – does action need to be taken to have the most impact?55

• All three levels must find creative ways to leverage their resources and have a stronger collective voice, so partnerships should remain necessary.

• My opinion is that it’s already there for graphic arts learning – persons in their 40s. Many work-force re-entry people are seeking education in this area by taking adult continuing education classes in computer graphics.

• If you have excellent teachers, the adult students will be extremely supportive of the program of adult art expression and expression from the cradle to the grave.

• This kind of programs could work at a very grassroots level – starting small and then building a foundation for broader programming.

Discussion of Rounds I, II, and III centered on the following strengths – this idea’s emphasis on partnerships and the opportunities for this to happen in urban communities.

Weaknesses under this idea include the segregation of elders and It sounds great but I’m afraid it’s a “pie in the sky” – has any group tried to do this?56

Overall, the participants felt the Delphi instrument presented opportunities to raise issues, as well as highlight strengths and weaknesses to get one’s point across. The participants did not have a hard time coming to only five votes as consensus was reached previously in Round III, highlighting key interests of this group. Though the list of ideas was extensive, reducing the ideas was needed to get consensus and to pinpoint specific

55 Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
routes. The remaining ideas received a frequency of middle importance, (3), and of less importance (2) and (1) ranks. The breakdown is the following:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items Ranked By Frequency</th>
<th>Ranks</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Frequency of 3 = Middle Interest Category</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#3. (Partnerships) Partnerships should be developed between arts organizations, arts education organizations and institutions and interest groups serving older adults – and adult education venues – senior centers, community education, university extension, Elderhostel – for the purpose of advocating for arts programs for older adults.</td>
<td>5 3 2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#2. (Public Policy) Federal, State, and local arts funding agencies as well as private foundations should be encouraged to create, implement, and evaluate funding initiatives that support arts education programs for older adults.</td>
<td>5 4 1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#26. (Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning) There is a need for all adults of all ages to access to art learning opportunities, both as part of institutional, for-credit programs or through independent, non-credit, &amp;/or community-based programs.</td>
<td>5 1 1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#10. (Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning) In our diverse society, arts can serve as a bridge over the chasm of cultural misunderstanding and appreciation. Helps us better appreciate our shared heritage. Reminds us that we’ve been through challenging times before and not only survived them, but found meaning in them.</td>
<td>3 2 1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Frequency of 2 and below = Low Interest Overall</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#3. (Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning) Many if not most of the statements about the role of arts education are true across the life span, not just for older adults. Although targeted marketing is important to widen participation, it should be done within the ‘big picture’ context of the life-span continuum.</td>
<td>5 4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#5. (Higher Education/Professional Development, Organs.) NAEA needs to look at how it can reach out more effectively to community-based art education, which includes adult opportunities as well as those for young people.</td>
<td>5 4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#2. (Arts in Healing/Art Therapy) Life review and reminiscence activities are an important part of involving elders in activities.</td>
<td>4 4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#6. (Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning) Art adds life to the years by encouraging self-expression, finding emotional release, seeking powerful expressions from stories or socializing with others. Art adds life to our years allowing us to be alive as long as we are alive.</td>
<td>5 3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

56 Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses Partnerships Idea #2.
| #4. (Participation: Incentives & Barriers) More could be done to make the arts part of the civic space of cities and towns. Another barrier to arts participation is that it is often perceived "outside" the normal scope of community life. This includes more public arts and more arts in public places. | 4 | 4 | 2 |
| #3. (Defining Adults, Older Adults) The range of artistic background, sensitivity, and skill within a group of older adults is likely to be considerable. Their teachers need to understand how to bring out whatever lies dormant within and to introduce techniques and materials that are appropriate to the learner's capacities and to the idea and affect the person is trying to express. Focusing on the variety of aspirations among learners and helping them to achieve his/her goal is not an easy way to teach but it is the essence of the experience. | 5 | 2 | 2 |
| #3. (Higher Education/Professional Development, Orgs.) Arts Administration Education programs in higher education should include courses that prepare arts administrators to create, implement, and evaluate programs for adult learners. | 4 | 3 | 2 |
| #1. (Higher Education/Professional Development, Orgs.) Need a database or databases (web-based?) of programs/organizations at the local, regional, and national level to share innovative ideas and foster partnerships. | 5 | 1 | 2 |
| #7. (Higher Education/Professional Development, Orgs.) We should encourage some rigorous research programs that evaluate the benefits of the arts for older adults so that funding in this area would increase, jobs would be created and awareness could be increased on many different levels. | 4 | 1 | 2 |
| #7. (Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning) It supports the idea of self-expression as a need throughout life -- particularly in the second half of life. | 3 | 1 | 2 |
| #19. (Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning) All human beings communicate in a variety of ways throughout their lives. The arts provide an excellent mode of such communication and offer a wide variety of ways to do so. | 2 | 1 | 2 |
| #5. (Participation: Incentives & Barriers) Address financial barriers to participation -- for example, Iowa's ICARD discount program for low-income groups -- Cost is an issue. | 2 | 1 | 2 |
| #16. (Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning) As our life span continues to lengthen, more of our population are living longer, and have time to explore interests or second careers. These quests often involve schooling, and thus make adult arts education a stronger part of the curriculum. We are a society with an increasing population of mature (40+) students. | 5 | 1 | 1 |
| #1. (Partnerships) Development of community partnerships between schools and organizations that serve older adults for the purpose of creating, implementing, and evaluating inter-generational arts education programs... | 5 | 1 | 1 |
#8. (Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning) Involvement in art/craft activities provide a means for creative expression, exploration of various materials and concepts, development of one's perception and art knowledge, the expression of one's feelings, and development of aesthetic taste and avoid being bored! It gives them a goal, something to do.

#3. (Participation: Incentives & Barriers) Although many older adults are full of "get-up-and-go" some are confined to their home, their retirement community, or to a nursing home. Art learning and activities need to be made accessible to them by means such as on-site classes and transporting them to museums, lectures and artists' studios.

#21. (Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning) We need to create more of a life span approach so older adults believe that it is ok to participate without necessarily being very good. In other words, they need to be made to feel that learning something new is not only ok --but good.

#10. (Higher Education/Professional Development, Organs.) Set up a research programme, in company with some Higher and tertiary educating institutions, to explore ways in which the ideas, policies, programmes and practices of Art Education for Adults might be explored, articulated, developed, provided and evaluated with a view to their improvement and expansion, and as part of this programme establish ways and means of facilitating exchanges of Arts Educators in residence, publications and artifacts of all kinds, and of personnel (teachers and learners), both within the country and also overseas.

#2. (Marketing) Effective marketing of adult learning opportunities by arts organizations and other arts learning venues

#1. (Arts in Healing/Art Therapy) Therapy and wellness -- Adult arts education can be used to meet therapeutic and rehabilitation goals.

#5. (Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning) Regardless of whether this is an "aging society," adult arts education is part of the continuum of lifelong learning and development.

#23. (Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning) Adult arts education can be a mechanism that promotes aesthetic art enhancements to the community (and society).

#28. (Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning) Would it be possible to be indirect (subversive)? What I have in mind is if older adults are not attracted to become involved with the arts, why not have the arts go to them... be part of everything they are... which I would guess is often already the case. So those wanting to fund and support older adult arts education, could support where it already is - libraries, museums, adult day care centers, senior and community centers, retirement homes, learning in retirement institutes, colleges and universities, community colleges, theaters, concert halls, and on and on.

#7. (Participation: Incentives & Barriers) Barriers to participation
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NonVotes</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>#1. (Arts Role, Arts Education, Arts Learning) Provide ways and means of enabling adults and older people (AOP) to start off, continue and expand learning, making and appraising activities of Art Education for Adults.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#2. (Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning) Encouragement of adult arts learning as part of religious activities.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#4. (Arts Role, Arts Education, Arts Learning) Reading all of these ideas, it occurs to me that there are multiple definitions for what we consider “art.” Why have humans made art throughout our existence? Judgments of quality or aesthetic value seem inextricably linked to economic value in contemporary society. Or is art about something in the human spirit that must be expressed? Answers to these questions would seem to me to provide the framework within which arts education is provided.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#11. (Arts Role, Arts Education, Arts Learning) It gives older adults a place in which to deal with some of the normal losses of aging and to not only express the loss but to gain identity in a time of loosening identities.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#12. (Arts Role, Arts Education, Arts Learning) Research documents physical and mental effects of arts/creativity on healthy aging -- older adults can thus maintain independent living longer and put less strain on social and medical services.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#13. (Arts Role, Arts Education, Arts Learning) Early schooling experiences of today's older adults emphasized only a limited</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Statement</td>
<td>Score</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#14.</td>
<td>(Arts Role, Arts Education, Arts Learning) Adult arts education can enable the development of neglected intelligences.</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#15.</td>
<td>(Arts Role, Arts Education, Arts Learning) Arts Education for Adults has a vital role in keeping adults alive, active and interested in themselves, their environment, and the optimum ways of preserving and enriching quality of thought and feeling in all the various facets and modes of that relationship.</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#17.</td>
<td>(Arts Role, Arts Education, Arts Learning) The arts provide adults with opportunities for enjoyment of the creative expression of others via art books, art videotapes, museum visits, art/craft workshops, and art oriented lectures and art tours.</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#18.</td>
<td>(Arts Role, Arts Education, Arts Learning) Art helps create intellectual habits, skills and aesthetic judgments in creative expressions.</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#20.</td>
<td>(Arts Role, Arts Education, Arts Learning) Adult arts education provides an opportunity for new skills development and perhaps, new career direction.</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#24.</td>
<td>(Arts Role, Arts Education, Arts Learning) Arts can help to connect people across racial, ethnic, religious, socio-economic lines.</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#25.</td>
<td>(Arts Role, Arts Education, Arts Learning) The arts connect people to social cultures by teaching them about themselves and about each other.</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#27.</td>
<td>(Arts Role, Arts Education, Arts Learning) The arts, unlike verbal languages, can be taken up and mastered at any age.</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#3.</td>
<td>(Arts in Healing/ Art Therapy) Development of arts and healing programs by health care institutions.</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#1.</td>
<td>(Defining Adults, Older Adults) Adult learners: who are they? Ages! Abilities! This needs to be addressed – acknowledging diversity is very critical in working with adults! (50 adults vs. 50 4th graders: more diversity in adult group than in youth of 9-10 year age groups).</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#6.</td>
<td>(Higher Education/ Professional Organizations) Professional arts education oriented associations, such as the National Art Education Association, should promote a life long learning orientation to the arts with specific mention made of older adults.</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#8.</td>
<td>(Higher Education/ Professional Organizations) Arts education organizations and institutions should work with older adult advocacy groups to bring public attention to the importance of arts education to older adults.</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#9.</td>
<td>(Higher Education/ Professional Organizations) Use schools and all other educating institutions (community colleges, further vocational colleges, universities, liberal arts colleges, conservatorias, music and drama schools and so on) as centres of excellence in the provision of such ways and means, centres and</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
resources, on a 24/7 (twenty four hours a day, seven days a week) basis. Pay for the provision of such resources from a mixed economy of local taxes, business input and fees from contributors.

| #2. (Intergenerational) Adult arts education can be used for facilitating and enhancing intergenerational programming. | 0 | 0 |
| #3. (Intergenerational) Intergenerational programs enable older Americans to serve as mentors (or volunteers) to younger folks – strengthen communities and gives elders sense of values. | 0 | 0 |
| #1. (Marketing) Start national ad campaign to encourage people to watch less television and participate more in local arts opportunities... | 0 | 0 |
| #3. (Marketing) Support of public TV and radio broadcasting | 0 | 0 |
| #4. (Marketing) Educate the public about the arts in their communities. Newspapers can play a big role in this regard. | 0 | 0 |
| #1. (Participation: Incentives & Barriers) Use research documenting physical, mental, and other benefits of arts participation as the basis of development of incentives to participate. | 0 | 0 |
| #6. (Participation: Incentives & Barriers) Attend to transportation and accommodation issues (logistical barriers) -- Transportation and access to programming is vital to participation in arts programs. | 0 | 0 |
| #8. (Participation: Incentives & Barriers) Time is also an adult variable. Retirees may have more – but not necessarily. | 0 | 0 |
| #9. (Participation: Incentives & Barriers) Earlier performance times (i.e., 7:00 pm curtains instead of 8:00 pm curtain) | 0 | 0 |
| #4. (Partnerships) Carry Art Education for Adults into all parts of the community by employing "Arts Educators in residence" (AER) at Educating institutions, sports clubs, churches, theatres, museums and art galleries, in shopping malls, in community centers, hospital and health centers, retirement villages and senior citizens homes, and all other possible locations, operating under the specific brief of "selling" the joys, excitements and practical benefits of engaging in Art Education for Adults for all members of the community and getting them to commit to it. | 0 | 0 |
| #1. (Programs) Create display space at an indoor mall | 0 | 0 |
| #2. (Programs) Read aloud from new literary works on the radio | 0 | 0 |
| #3. (Programs) Having an elder who IS involved speak to a group and show some of her/his works might do it for a few. | 0 | 0 |
| #4. (Programs) Coming in via the "back door" has possibilities...not even mentioning "art" or "arts" and doing some programming that brings folks together and suddenly some will say "hey, this is interesting," or whatever…and perhaps a 2nd round can hook them into some involvement. | 0 | 0 |
| #5. (Programs) Museum outreach programs should be developed with a focus on senior populations. | 0 | 0 |
| #3. (Public Policy) Support older artists and arts administrators. | 0 | 0 |
Now the bulk of this analysis will deal with the results of the main discussion areas: 
Themes, for this Delphi group.

(2) Key Themes based on Frequency -- # of Ranks for Themes. As mentioned above, the frequency ranks highlight the high, middle, or low interest of an idea. The votes were based upon rank-order points assigned to five ideas each participant choose as most to least promising. For the purposes of further discussion of the results, specifically the themes, the upper categories are made up of the high number of ranks received under this theme. The key Theme ranks breakdown the following way:

![Key Theme Percentages](image)

Figure 4.1: Key Theme Percentages

The Role of the Arts, Arts Education, and Art Learning (30%), Higher Education (21.25%), Defining Adults, Older Adults (11.25%), Partnerships (10%), and Public Policy (10%) themes are the high (4 and above) and middle (3 or higher) interest ranking themes. Thus, they represent the high interest, or areas of importance for the stakeholders. The remaining themes, Participation (8.75%), Arts in Healing/Art Therapy
(5%), Intergenerational (2.5%), and Marketing (1.25%) received low frequency (2 or below) rankings and are briefly discussed. Programs (program development and implementation and examples of creating successful programs) were discussed by the group, however, these ideas did not receive any ranks (0%). Thus, they are included in the appendix, but not the voting analysis. The lack of votes was an interesting outcome since the literature in adult arts education is overwhelmingly focused on program development. This indicates that in order to incorporate and improve adult arts education opportunities, support and involvement needs to take precedence. This is a positive result – policy and administration is a must for any movement in the field to gain support for adult arts education role.

How do these areas of interest address adult arts education? What are the routes to take this issue forward? The following outlines the responses to these questions and the path to creating a stronger role of the arts in a lifelong learning society. Note, the stakeholder responses are highlighted in *italics*.

**Breakdown of Key Themes by # of Respondents and Ranks**

Though the two top ideas ranked by this group came out of the themes of Defining Adults, Older Adults and Public Policy, the overall points and focus was on the theme highlighting the *value* of the arts, **The Role of the Arts, Arts Education, and Art Learning**, to encourage adult lifelong learning in the arts. Based on the participants’ responses, **30%** of the votes, 24 out of 80 possible votes, reflected the higher importance of the role, the value and contribution of the arts, art education, and art learning for adults, older adults.
Figure 4.2: Arts Role, Arts Education and Arts Learning

Participants often referred to the value of the arts as key to adult arts education gaining support. This was not a big surprise, considering the majority of stakeholders represented the arts field. However, the higher ranks (i.e. 5, 4) came from gerontologists and adult educators, who often connected the value, role of the arts in relation to the important research and growing focus on creativity in aging policy. Beyond the therapeutic benefits and continuing the argument of the value of art, using creativity in this manner has been valuable for successful aging (Fisher and Specht, 1999; Mariske and Willis, 1998; Landau and Maoz, 1978; Grams, 1987; Smith and Andersson, 1989; Simonton, 1990; Smith and van der Meer, 1990; Vaillant and Vaillant, 1990). These creative lifelong learning opportunities allow adults to be intellectually challenged, but in a failure-free environment so adults can age with integrity. The stakeholders also highlighted the contributions to a healthy lifestyle, well being that adult arts programs provide. Per the stakeholders, Arts learning and education is slowly addressing this issue as it relates to both policy and practice.\textsuperscript{57} And …if advocacy groups such as the AARP see this as an

\textsuperscript{57} Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
issue to be addressed, the issue will be part of the national dialogue on ensuring the vitality and mental, physical, and spiritual/physical fitness of older adults. It is an investment in our society.

The following ideas under this theme received ranks:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning Ideas Based on Frequency</th>
<th>Ranks</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>M</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>#9. Arts education can help older adults develop new methods of expression or &quot;voice&quot; with which to engage in meaning making and integration of life experiences.</td>
<td>4 4 3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#26. There is a need for all adults of all ages to access to art learning opportunities, both as part of institutional, for-credit programs or through independent, non-credit, &amp;/or community-based programs.</td>
<td>5 1 1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#10. In our diverse society, arts can serve as a bridge over the chasm of cultural misunderstanding and appreciation. Helps us better appreciate our shared heritage. Reminds us that we’ve been through challenging times before and not only survived them, but found meaning in them.</td>
<td>3 2 1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#3. Many if not most of the statements about the role of arts education are true across the life span, not just for older adults. Although targeted marketing is important to widen participation, it should be done within the ‘big picture’ context of the life-span continuum.</td>
<td>5 4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#6. Art adds life to the years by encouraging self-expression, finding emotional release, seeking powerful expressions from stories or socializing with others. Art adds life to our years allowing us to be alive as long as we are alive.</td>
<td>5 3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#19. All human beings communicate in a variety of ways throughout their lives. The arts provide an excellent mode of such communication and offer a wide variety of ways to do so.</td>
<td>2 1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#16. As our life span continues to lengthen, more of our population are living longer, and have time to explore interests or second careers. These quests often involve schooling, and thus make adult arts education a stronger part of the curriculum. We are a society with an increasing population of mature (40+) students.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#8. Involvement in art/craft activities provide a means for creative expression, exploration of various materials and concepts, development of one's perception and art knowledge, the expression of one's feelings, and development of aesthetic taste and avoid being bored! It gives them a goal, something to do.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#7. It supports the idea of self-expression as a need throughout life -- particularly in the second half of life.</td>
<td>3 1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

58 Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
#21. We need to create more of a life span approach so older adults believe that it is ok to participate without necessarily being very good. In other words, they need to be made to feel that learning something new is not only ok -- but good.

#5. Regardless of whether this is an "aging society," adult arts education is part of the continuum of lifelong learning and development.

#23. Adult arts education can be a mechanism that promotes aesthetic art enhancements to the community (and society).

#28. Would it be possible to be indirect (subversive)? What I have in mind is if older adults are not attracted to become involved with the arts, why not have the arts go to them... be part of everything they are... which I would guess is often already the case. So those wanting to fund and support older adult arts education, could support where it already is -- libraries, museums, adult day care centers, senior and community centers, retirement homes, learning in retirement institutes, colleges and universities, community colleges, theaters, concert halls, and on and on.

#22. Arts connect adults with "unfinished business" of earlier life stages & ages.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Non Votes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

| #1. Provide ways and means of enabling adults and older people (AOP) to start off, continue and expand learning, making and appraising activities of Art Education for Adults. | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| #2. (Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning) Encouragement of adult arts learning as part of religious activities. | 0 | 0 | 0.0 |
| #4. Reading all of these ideas, it occurs to me that there are multiple definitions for what we consider "art." Why have humans made art throughout our existence? Judgments of quality or aesthetic value seem inextricably linked to economic value in contemporary society. Or is art about something in the human spirit that must be expressed? Answers to these questions would seem to me to provide the framework within which arts education is provided. | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| #11. It gives older adults a place in which to deal with some of the normal losses of aging and to not only express the loss but to gain identity in a time of loosening identities. | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| #12. Research documents physical and mental effects of arts/creativity on healthy aging -- older adults can thus maintain independent living longer and put less strain on social and medical services. | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| #13. Early schooling experiences of today's older adults emphasized only a limited number of the intelligences. Adult arts education can enable the development of neglected intelligences. | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| #14. Adult arts education is useful in enhancing adult mental health, efficacy, and growth. | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| #15. Arts Education for Adults has a vital role in keeping adults alive, active and interested in themselves, their environment, and the optimum ways of preserving and enriching quality of thought and feeling in all the various facets and modes of that relationship. | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| #17. The arts provide adults with opportunities for enjoyment of the | 0 | 0 | 0 |
creative expression of others via art books, art videotapes, museum visits, art/craft workshops, and art oriented lectures and art tours.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>#18. Art helps create intellectual habits, skills and aesthetic judgments in creative expressions.</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>#20. Adult arts education provides an opportunity for new skills development and perhaps, new career direction.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>#24. Arts can help to connect people across racial, ethnic, religious, socio-economic lines.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>#25. The arts connect people to social cultures by teaching them about themselves and about each other.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>#27. The arts, unlike verbal languages, can be taken up and mastered at any age.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: f = Frequency; M = Mean; Pts = Total Points

From the outset this theme, The Role of the Arts, Arts Education, and Art Learning, had the most ideas and overall discussion of all the themes presented. It became an all-encompassing theme that included arts role in art education and art learning. Due to the volume of ideas, a couple of sub-themes came out of the discussion. These sub-themes highlighted the quality of life aspect of the arts including: lifelong learning opportunities—such as community education, activities, workforce development and expression (self- and cultural). The sub-themes are outlined below.

**LIFELONG LEARNING**

The majority of the respondents felt strongly that in order to move this issue forward we must readdress our arts focus to the ‘lifespan’ of individuals... *Many if not most of the statements about the role of arts education are true across the life span, not just for older adults.*59 This is vital to the development in the arts knowledge and skills of our whole population, not just the educated few. *Arts should be a part of life, not a sometime thing.*60

---

59 Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
60 Ibid.
As the issue of adult lifelong learning continues to be on the agenda, it needs to become an arts education priority. "Although the PCAH [President's Committee on the Arts and Humanities, 1997] report stresses the importance of cultural education, its recommendation focuses entirely on educating youth for the future and does not mention [older] adult education" (Kerka, 1997, p. 1). Older adult arts programs can serve the communities of this nation with a societal benefit that has the capability to produce positive results across the board: economic, cultural, ecological, spiritual, and of course, educational. When healthy communities are discussed the arts are included. The arts can provide valuable life and work skills through self-discipline, interpersonal proficiency, interpretation, and creative problem solving (Volkmann, 1999). With the changing needs of adults, the arts should be part of the social change to address better educated, financially sound adults with more leisure time on their hands. According to Goldman (1966), the importance of the arts’ role in an aging society is that the arts not only “promote[s] the general welfare of art in our society, but also more importantly for us as educators, they will help individuals to satisfy their hopes of enjoying art and enriching their lives aesthetically” (p. 67).

And Regardless of whether this is an aging society, adult arts education is part of the continuum of lifelong learning and development.⁶¹ This raises some questions among the group. _Is it the same (arts education is the same across the lifespan) or different (adults and older adults have special gifts, requirements, etc.)?⁶² Does this ‘trickle down’ (or up!) principle apply (i.e. that you strengthen and improve adult arts education

---

⁶¹ Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
by strengthening and improving arts education)?

This goes back to the traditional view that if we teach them young, they will continue to enjoy the arts throughout their lifespan. How do we then address the Baby Boomer generation that did not follow that model? The more we can conclude old issues, unload old concerns, and resolve old issues, the more we are able to move forward to new concerns.

For one stakeholder it is Critical [to note] who will support the arts in all K-12 school curriculum NOT the current senior folks! But 40+ and new seniors who have had a chance to learn the arts recently can impact a schools curriculum. In an ideal world, all ages would have access to educational, social, professional, etc. opportunities to cater to, develop, and participate in the arts regardless of their age, gender, ethnicity, socio-economic status, etc. Art would be present everywhere and for everyone. But that is not the case and even in 2002, we are just finally getting the “arts” included in primary education in K-12. How can we possibly expect to have a policy for adults? The hope is that with a lifelong learning approach, we are starting young in identifying and introducing the multiple benefits and rewards of the arts in hope it is carried on throughout one’s life-span. Moody (2000) sees this as the way to build awareness and appreciation for adults and older adults with “Widespread participation in the arts is possible only if children are encouraged to develop those roots of imaginative play that arise from stimulating sensory experience” (p. 424). Yet, according to the stakeholders, There is a need for adults of all ages to have

---

64 Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
65 Ibid.
access to art learning opportunities.\textsuperscript{66} Yes, let us not limit opportunities to learn at whatever age.\textsuperscript{67}

There is a call for the arts to stress its role as a ‘lifelong process’. \textit{Those who have not experienced the arts need to get involved. Since design choices are such an important aspect of everyone’s life, the arts have always been important throughout one’s life. However, many people do not recognized this as an aspect of life—even some who are artists!}\textsuperscript{68} Another response to the idea #5 [‘Adult arts education is part of the continuum of lifelong learning and development’] is related to \textit{Howard Gardner’s work with Project Zero indicates that there are at least nine IQ types. Five of these involve adult art education activities for lifelong learning and development.}\textsuperscript{69} Project Zero (1989, 2000), as mentioned in Chapter Two, is a series of studies on the development, psychology and philosophy of art, addressing: project-based curricula; relating classroom instruction to life outside the classroom; applying technology; assessments integral to curriculum; and cultural and community involvement in schools. Project Zero identifies the relationship between cognition and artistic expression and society’s influence in students’ ability for “free, abstract expression”.

\textit{Arts learning is a lifelong pursuit and it is Very important that arts education be connected, not isolated by age levels.}\textsuperscript{70} It was expressed that \textit{Arts and those engaging

\textsuperscript{67} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{68} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, The Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Art Learning #16.
\textsuperscript{69} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, The Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Art Learning #5.
\textsuperscript{70} Ibid.
with them are both ageless!\textsuperscript{71} Although targeted marketing is important with increasing diversity, it must be balanced within this life-span, big picture context or arts education efforts will become fragmented and isolated. And not just a "life-span" context but an "arts-span" context—across all of the arts, not just the ones that get the most attention and funding.\textsuperscript{72} But does this argument then ...fall into the category of 'the arts need justification' or practical purpose – a dangerous area.\textsuperscript{73} It is important to note that Adult arts education is not necessarily part of growing old but it should be since we all are concerned with art/design whether we know it or not. We are using art/design sensitivity whenever we select one thing in preference to another such as clothes, cars, furniture, and even sometimes our food.\textsuperscript{74} Adults are influenced by the visual culture around them that they come in contact with in multiple ways, in multiple levels in their daily lives.

With such diverse adult learners', the stakeholders feel the key is to address their needs. \textit{As in all learning experiences, the curriculum must be attuned to the learner(s)}.\textsuperscript{75} Yes, most of the basic principles of quality art education teaching apply, but principles of adult education and gerontology should also be incorporated.\textsuperscript{76} In adult learning there is some stress on the importance of emotion and its link to learning. The most common trait is one learns when one feels secure, comfortable, and is enjoying oneself. When an adult is able to establish relationships and/or a bond with an art style or actual work,

\textsuperscript{71} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, The Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Art Learning #5.
\textsuperscript{72} Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
\textsuperscript{73} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, The Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Art Learning #5.
\textsuperscript{74} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{75} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, The Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Art Learning #3.
\textsuperscript{76} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, The Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Art Learning #3.
learning is more effective and positive. By building a personal connection, learners can reconstruct their knowledge base and search for new underlying meaning. The aesthetic experience offers the same thrill of discovery whether a novice or an expert (Chambers, 1989; Kauppinen, 1990) and helps create opportunities to work through life’s challenges. The arts offer “ways of creating satisfying and life-enhancing possibilities for ourselves to create a pattern of preferred life options” (Aspin, 1999, p. 8). Individuals learn in different ways, and interpret information through their personal knowledge, experiences, and beliefs. This is how adults personalize the experience, whether museum, opera, or amateur choir at church. It is dictated by their individual needs. Allowing opportunities to address their needs, such as aiding adult novices who are unable to identify the challenges offered by works of art, there is a greater chance that a ‘transfer’ will occur. In order for a transfer to take place, the learner must be able to retrieve his or her knowledge base when searching for new knowledge, perceive information to be conducive to the maintenance or enhancement of self, and have the desire to learn (Koroscik, 1997b; Nichols, 1984).

Several ideas speak to the focus of policy on retirement options in relation to the arts. The term ‘retirement’ is going through a change as older adults are ‘transitioning’ versus retiring. “Older workers are situated in a dynamic pattern of periods of active employment, disengagement from the workplace, and reentry into the same or a new career” (Stein, 2000). Some are taking new, full-time jobs or switching to part-time employment; some are moving to college towns and campus-based retirement [learning]
communities; and some are exploring online learning, voluntary simplicity, spiritual practices and so on. With the life-span approach of the arts, we are speak[ing] to importance of learning in retirement options. The drastic economic, cultural, technological, and demographic changes are contributing to the growth in interest in the notions of a learning society and older adults. Retirement means for many, a breathing space to indulge in one’s put-off wishes..."I want to learn to draw landscapes" is one... Yet, the aged are not fully utilized. How can we further position community-based arts programs to answer the multiple calls for learning – educational and recreational?

The learning and workforce trends relate directly with the new sense of purpose for successful aging – health, longevity, and quality of life. Tuijnman and van der Kamp (1992) look to such trends as a call for the role of public policy to promote lifelong learning and a framework that includes informal opportunities. Research into successful, quality programs, collaborations with adult educators, and re-prioritizing adult arts education will surely have a powerful, beneficial impact on adult learners.

At what level is support gained for the ‘successful aging’ approach: nationally, statewide, or locally? Again, because of the health model of aging and the growth in retirement communities, more adults will have the opportunity to come ‘on board’ – so I

---

77 Manheimer, R. (2000), Executive Director of the North Carolina Center for Creative Retirement, University of North Carolina, Asheville, looks at a current movement in retirement communities partnering with colleges – residential communities located on campuses and incorporating free education as a residential benefit.


believe [support] is very likely, especially at the local level.\textsuperscript{80} Even if the improvements in partnerships, policies, and training cited [throughout our discussions], there will still need to be venues through which to deliver adult arts education. Formal/institutional and independent/community-based are both necessary, especially given the diversity of the older adult population.\textsuperscript{81} Thus, \textit{Impacts will be greatest at local level}\textsuperscript{82} and the leadership needs to come from the key national organizations and implementation of adult learning theories in higher education programs.

The arts sector needs to accept the importance of our role in the involvement of programs provided at the local, community level in informal settings to increase public awareness of the arts and educational benefit for older adults. The more inclusive definition of the arts given recently by American Assembly (1997), National Endowment for the Arts (Toward Civilization: A Report on Arts Education, 1988, and American Canvas 1997), and the call for more research into informal, amateur and avocational programs is a huge step in the right direction for adult arts education. The contemporary definition of lifelong learning, 'learning is taken a stand for the total experience of social life' (Titmus, 1989; Fryer, 1996; Griffen 1999) connects with this new genre of arts education, situating 'students with the everyday concerns and experiences of community life' (Green, 1999).

\textbf{EXPRESSION}

Expression, self- and cultural expression was another sub-theme under the Role of the Arts, Arts Education, and Art Learning. For the majority, the opportunity of

\textsuperscript{80} Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
\textsuperscript{81} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{82} Ibid.
‘expression’ in the arts does add years to life and life to years.\textsuperscript{83} Specifically, Art adds life to years by encouraging self-expression, finding emotional release, etc. allows us to be alive as long as we are alive.\textsuperscript{84} One has to find motivation and a reason to live. You have got to find a GLORY or a Hallelujah Chorus in the soul of you...Listen to the music of Handell or view the work of van Gogh...You can feel energy in them.\textsuperscript{85} We all search for ways to communicate. The arts provide additional means to convey feelings, knowledge, and concepts.\textsuperscript{86}

Why participate in the arts? You might not live “longer” if you are involved with art, but your life will be ‘richer’.\textsuperscript{87} Participating in the arts is central as we move from a disease model of aging to a health model of aging.\textsuperscript{88} Others argue that such statements are a bit precious and are unsubstantiated claim[s].\textsuperscript{89} Lest we not forget, Self-expression is needed through one’s life. I think no more or less important in early, middle, or later years.\textsuperscript{90} Possibly such claims are even too reliant on emotion?\textsuperscript{91} And is this Limit[s]ing] arts education to self-expression?\textsuperscript{92} Can we find a more inclusive term for the art experience?\textsuperscript{93} Yet, This is somewhat therapeutic approach, and we are not just talking about arts and crafts.\textsuperscript{94} All aspects of creative art

\textsuperscript{83} Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
\textsuperscript{84} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{85} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, The Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Art Learning #6.
\textsuperscript{86} Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
\textsuperscript{87} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, The Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Art Learning #6.
\textsuperscript{88} Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
\textsuperscript{89} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, The Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Art Learning #6.
\textsuperscript{90} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, The Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Art Learning #7.
\textsuperscript{91} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, The Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Art Learning #6.
\textsuperscript{92} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, The Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Art Learning #7.
\textsuperscript{93} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{94} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, The Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Art Learning #7.
are self-expressive and we need to express our thoughts and feelings for good mental health. However, very few people do this via creative art work but they do it mostly via choosing things based upon their ideas and feelings about what is good and bad.95

What we do know is that art contributes to adult education through the following: developing perceptual ability; the ability to explore mediums of expression; awareness of the nature of artistic activity; critique of cultural value systems; and the ability to engage in the creative process (Kerka, 1997, p. 1). Through the study of art and aesthetics, adults gain creative skills, critical thinking, and visual and cultural awareness. By creating art, individuals gain an understanding of the visual world and how those images convey truths that both explain and question humanity. Abbs (1996) "refers more comprehensively to a sensuous mode of intellectual organization that cognizes and make active meaning, the senses making sense of the world"(Abbs, 1996, p. 65). Thus, the experience of art is a positive influence on one’s personal and, social life.

The stakeholders’ agree:

- Arts education gives older adults an opportunity to express their own aesthetic sensibilities, putting into concrete form what they deem to be beautiful and important.96

- As adults mature, self-acknowledgement becomes more focused & critical for individual mental health (“What’s really important for me?”). There are lots of citations of this.97

- Self-discovery is the most important part of life.98

• It is the quest of individuals, educational programs, institutions, communities, nations, cultures, etc. Finding and sustaining a self discovered theme is a wonderful quest. What we do often defines who we are. Art Programs have tremendous potential in the area of self discovery and creative expression as individuals and institutions try to establish and maintain their identities.  

• Arts education can help older adults develop new methods of expression or “voice” with which to engage in meaning making and integration of life experiences.  

Specific works that relate to self-expression mentioned by the stakeholders include:

Erickson and others argue developmental tasks that can require decades of effort. It is in the second half of life that things make sense. It is argued that life makes no sense from day to day; but, only when it is reviewed in retrospect -- does it make sense and provide a pattern for someone. Arts education can help older adults develop new methods of expression or "voice" with which to engage in meaning making and integration of life experiences...As the population ages, Erik Erikson’s concept of generativity should become more important and the arts are a critical vehicle for the integration processes involved. Erickson is often referred to in adult education and aging literature as he highlights the positive potentials of aging in his eight stages of psychological development; virtues of hope, will, competence, fidelity, love, care, and wisdom -- specifically challenging age-old myths: wisdom and integrity versus ignorance and despair; open-mindedness versus rigid, closed thinking; and entertaining of new ideas.

99 ibid.
100 ibid.
versus opinionated, self-righteousness (Carlsen, 1988, pp. 227-250). For this to become a reality, the stakeholders felt the arts field to be concerned with ‘selling’ the importance of creating art and convincing the older adult that this will make him/her have a more of acting, meaningful life.\textsuperscript{103} Involvement in art provides creative expression therapy, exploration of various art concepts/media, development of one’s perceptions, allows expression of one’s feelings, patterning of aesthetic and criticism, review of the patterned works, aesthetics and criticism of other art/learners.\textsuperscript{104} We must let people know what arts can do for them – all these things should sell the idea of importance of art expression.\textsuperscript{105} Arts education [bringing] beauty into the lives of (adults) who have leisure time to spend with works of art.\textsuperscript{106} The arts role in helping citizens find meaning and give expression is one of the core public purposes the arts serve, particularly in a democratic society. That the arts do more than entertain and offer myriad ways that young and older citizens alike may engage making sense of the present, understanding the past and envisioning the future, is becoming better understood as part of life-long learning.\textsuperscript{107} And we need to be building on what already exists…Art educators carry some responsibility for arts funding always being cut – they allow (and insist) on being separate. Becoming integrated means giving up a bit of independence but gaining broader acceptance.\textsuperscript{108} Concerning policy, It may be an uphill battle, but we

\textsuperscript{102} Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
\textsuperscript{103} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{104} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{105} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{106} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{107} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, The Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Art Learning
\textsuperscript{108} Ibid.
have to come far from where we began. We need to keep moving forward.\textsuperscript{109} There is no denying that the Arts connect adults with new roles, goals, and values’ and ‘...may open up a whole new world for them.’\textsuperscript{110} And for older adults [the arts] provide an opportunity to share perspectives from their unique vantage point.\textsuperscript{111}

Beyond self-expression, the arts can be a bridge\textsuperscript{112} for cultural expression, specifically promoting cultural diversity. Through the arts, ‘...appreciation of diverse cultures and pride of heritage as well as acceptance of others is possible.’\textsuperscript{113} And If successful [policy is set], the arts are bridges to worldwide acceptance and peaceful coexistence. This is a powerful tool for worldwide acceptance.\textsuperscript{114} Thus, we need to think more broadly and incorporate the influences within our arts learning. How can we better facilitate arts experiences if we are unaware of adult learning and the needs of an aging society in a diverse culture? This is echoed strongly in the current debates in art education on the relationship with culture and art education.

The common mission for older adult arts education programs is to promote learning and creativity in a relaxed and social environment where ‘all levels’ are welcome. Whether the classes, workshops, etc. are primarily to experience the arts or to produce extrinsic benefits to the arts, participation and enjoyment of the arts affects the individual and the society and the quality of life of our communities. This is echoed in American Assembly’s (1997) view:

\textsuperscript{109} Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
\textsuperscript{110} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, The Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Art Learning #19.
\textsuperscript{111} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{112} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{113} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{114} Ibid.
As technology and globalization become more important in the 21st century, a number of factors contribute to the growing importance of creativity and innovation, the arts and culture, to our national life (p. 3)…Art and culture improve the quality of life within our communities…the arts and culture can play a part in economic revitalization and in the health and integrity of neighborhoods (p. 15)…An education in the arts…helps people develop their own innate creativity and imagination while fostering a deeper awareness of others…Fundamental to creating a civil society, the study of arts and culture initiate a life of good cultural citizenship (p. 25).

The arts serving as the bridge ‘over the chasm of cultural misunderstanding and appreciation’ [honor] older adults as the keepers and preservers of cultures and traditions; Arts education provides elders with opportunities to pass on their wisdom.\textsuperscript{115}

In our “youth-oriented” culture, we often forget the tremendous role seasoned artists and practitioners can play in illuminating our cultural traditions and in passing them along to other generations. It also shows that age has its own beauty and depth.\textsuperscript{116}

For some respondents, using arts as a bridge “Broadens focus on arts education” and “strengthens diversity through the arts”.\textsuperscript{117} An example is ‘the cultural Olympiad of the 2002 Winter Games’: Ice sculpture, music, dance, visual arts, etc. tell the cultural and historical stories of mankind from all nations & cultures.\textsuperscript{118} Others found weaknesses in the above strengths. There is not a shared heritage in a culturally diverse

\textsuperscript{115} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, The Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Art Learning #10.
\textsuperscript{116} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{117} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, The Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Art Learning #10.
\textsuperscript{118} Ibid.
community; and isn’t this Grandstanding! But culturally and currently okay; and is this …art history and the art of various cultures here. Noting the history of art of various cultures with whom people may identify may be a means of interesting some older people in art." And again, the focus for all: Shouldn’t all generations be encouraged to do this? Adult workshops, programs or classes in arts education broaden perspectives and make new discoveries to deal with life changes. Society as a whole benefits when individuals become knowledgeable and desire to use that knowledge, affecting positive change in their lives, now or later. Cultural expression looks beyond the effect on individuals to the larger impact on society. And by changing individuals and their views of people from diverse backgrounds and cultures will have a powerful effect on society. The arts provide “ways in which individuals, societies, and cultures look at themselves, consider their origins, and project their visions for the future…affirm their cultural identities and understand their origins and histories...clarify and reflect on their attitudes, beliefs and values...[and] of others...and value the contribution of the arts to their lives, their communities and the societies in which they live…” (Aspin, 2001). At least we need to attempt to encourage this…not fight it. Strong community and society are essential. Adult arts education as a ‘mechanism’ for this – building community – received support: The role of the arts Addresses social and community needs for individuals able and skilled in making knowledgeable aesthetic choices on behalf of their

---

119 Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
120 Ibid.
121 Ibid.
122 Ibid.
123 Ibid.
Absolutely! The design of our parks, cities, buildings, streets, clothes, cars, and everything has to do with art, the beautiful and how things look. They all have color, arrangement, function, etc. Cultural expressions such as murals, landscapes, and sculptures are wonderful community and social enhancements. Thus, “Understanding of aesthetics and comprehension of form and composition can be related to anything within the visual arts, landscapes, architecture, cityscapes and can take place in a range of social, cultural, educational and religious milieus” (Aspin, 1999, p. 20).

In relation to policy, After the events of September 11th, the arts role in making sense of our world is understood in a new light, witness the major network all responded jointly to the tragedy through a live arts broadcast. As time passes, the arts (and arts education) now move into a more participatory phase. Arts education and opportunities for arts learning are thus vital in meeting this need. Referring back to Goldman (1966), the importance of the arts’ role in an aging society is crucial to promote the general welfare of art in our society, and to “help individuals to satisfy their hopes of enjoying art and enriching their lives aesthetically” (p. 67).

---

125 Ibid.
126 Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
Higher Education and Professional Organization's roles were second, with 21.25%.

Figure 4.3: Higher Education/Professional Organizations

The twelve ideas overall called for inclusion of adult learning in art certification programs; professional organizations focusing on adult opportunities beyond current work; establishing support for research; etc; as well as the need to incorporate opportunities for all ages. The twelve ideas ranks for this theme are below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Higher Education/Professional Organizations</th>
<th>Ranks</th>
<th>ƒ</th>
<th>M</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>#2. Arts Education programs in higher education should include courses that prepare arts educators to create, implement, and evaluate programs for adult learners.</td>
<td>4 3 2 2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#4. Set up a series of conferences, local, regional, national and international, on a regular basis, in which the ideas, initiatives, policies and practices of Art Education for adults might be articulated, discussed, evaluated, developed and then delivered in Art Education for adults institutions, locally, nationally and world-wide.</td>
<td>5 4 3 2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#5. NAEA needs to look at how it can reach out more</td>
<td>5 4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
effectively to community-based art education, which includes adult opportunities as well as those for young people.

| #3. Arts Administration Education programs in higher education should include courses that prepare arts administrators to create, implement, and evaluate programs for adult learners. | 4 | 3 | 2 | 3.5 |
| #1. Need a database or databases (web-based?) of programs/organizations at the local, regional, and national level to share innovative ideas and foster partnerships. | 5 | 1 | 2 | 3.0 |
| #7. We should encourage some rigorous research programs that evaluate the benefits of the arts for older adults so that funding in this area would increase, jobs would be created and awareness could be increased on many different levels. | 4 | 1 | 2 | 2.5 |
| #10. Set up a research programme, in company with some Higher and tertiary educating institutions, to explore ways in which the ideas, policies, programmes and practices of Art Education for Adults might be explored, articulated, developed, provided and evaluated with a view to their improvement and expansion, and as part of this programme establish ways and means of facilitating exchanges of Arts Educators in residence, publications and artifacts of all kinds, and of personnel (teachers and learners), both within the country and also overseas. | 3 | | 1 | 3.0 |
| #6. Professional arts education oriented associations, such as the National Art Education Association, should promote a life long learning orientation to the arts with specific mention made of older adults. | | | | |
| #8. Arts education organizations and institutions should work with older adult advocacy groups to bring public attention to the importance of arts education to older adults. | | | | |
| #9. Use schools and all other educating institutions (community colleges, further vocational colleges, universities, liberal arts colleges, conservatoria, music and drama schools and soon) as centres of excellence in the provision of such ways and means, centres and resources, on a 24/7 (twenty four hours a day, seven days a week) basis. Pay for the provision of such resources from a mixed economy of local taxes, business input and fees from contributors. | | | | |

Note: f = Frequency; M = Mean; Pts = Total Points
The stakeholders included higher education and professional organizations under this theme due to their status as leading research, practice and policy in the field. Most of the suggested ideas looked to leadership roles within the field to implement changes, and both of these related to education, whether it is training and/or professional development, and/or as curriculum development for graduate education programs. Three main discussions were going on throughout the rounds: 1) Focus on the National Art Education Association’s role; 2) Education of arts administrators and arts educators; and 3) Research focus. The breakdown of the respondents thoughts on these sub-themes are discussed below.

1) Focus on the National Art Education Association’s role:

With the NAEA as the national voice for art education, why is there no outward support, or standard for adult art education? Why are community-based programs (community arts focus) not fully included or accepted as important venues for reaching multiple, diverse audiences with quality art education programs? Why are we not encouraging more art education programs to include adult learning theories in their certification programs? Why is NAEA not leading the pack in dealing with the numerous, valuable adult education programs possibilities and current programs going on in our communities? Is there a misconception that the LLL group only serves “older adults” versus lifelong learning for all ages? These are questions echoed within the group’s rounds’ discussions – NAEA is the logical choice for advocating adult art
learning. The *NAEA needs to support research and training for art educators who work with older adults, giving more time at conferences for LLL presentations.*

As mentioned in Chapter Two, the Lifelong Learning Special Interest Group of the National Art Education Association began as a topic group in the mid-1970s and in 1990, became an affiliate. According to their Constitution, the purposes of the LLL group include:

- To promote the study, research, and teaching of concepts and issues pertinent to the development of lifelong learning in the visual arts;
- To widen the practice of art education to include development of quality visual art programs for adults of all ages, but with the mature population over 50 years in age of priority concern;
- To examine cultural policy and services as they are presently provided by government and the public sector;
- To offer resources, guidance, and alternatives to those wishing assistance in developing or expanding adult art education;
- To develop alternate employment opportunities for art educators to become involved within the community as teachers and administrators of adult visual arts programs;
- To seek certification or licensing of visual arts instructors working with mature students based on the highest standards of the field;

---

127 Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
128 Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, Higher Education/Professional Organizations #5.
- To act as liaison among local, state, and national arts agencies, assuring that related artistic disciplines will be coordinated in their involvement with the adult population; and

- To develop a core of retired and semi-retired individuals who will lobby for the development of well-supported school arts and for community visual arts programs (NAEA LLL Constitution, 2000-1, p. 4).

This affiliation has certainly provided a wealth of research and information in lifelong learning, as well as a very sound, strong framework to lead this issue. However, without the full support and recognition of its role in higher education, this special interest group is currently struggling with current and future members to continue its focus and leadership role in adult art education. At the most recent NAEA conference, March 2002, concern was expressed on the Lifelong Learning (LLL) affiliate – the affiliate may fold under the umbrella of Higher Education, which has its pros and cons, depending on the focus. It could be an ideal situation and based on the respondents’ views of higher education’s role in pushing this issue forward, it is quite a coincidence that a union of possibility has presented itself. Why has the LLL affiliate been recently challenged with membership and focus? According to one respondent:

*The Lifelong Learning Affiliate has been struggling for the last few years to get more members and to find new educators willing to take on leadership roles. We are now at the point of disbanding, precisely because this has not happened. Most people who have been leaders in LLL are now retired. Others are occupied with their work in other areas and have managed to ‘squeeze’ in LLL as a small part of their big picture. One solution would be to develop the area of*
Community Art Education as an affiliate, and this would include programming for older adults. I hope that NAEA will develop a greater focus on this important area, publishing papers on this topic, providing more time slots at national conventions for presentations, and establishing funding for research. If we don’t become advocates for our own art programs for older adults, how can we expect others to advocate for us?¹²⁹

Some respondents feel that the advocacy role has been solely up to the NAEA’s LLL group... I think the NAEA is relying on the Life Long Learning Affiliate to do this. With many public schools, especially in the large cities doing away with art and the art supervisors, we are lucky to have art classes for K-12.¹³⁰ The latter statement has been very much a factor in the non-policy movement for this issue. Often art educators ‘fear’ showcasing the value of community arts, fearing that it will be ‘in-replace-of’ versus ‘in addition’ to K-12 programs. It is important that we show evidence for value of building on our K-12 programs, arts in the schools – showing the impact for all ages and involvement of the community; quality of life. Also, connecting to the recent focus on creativity in workforce development also offers an opportunity to raise issues concerning adult arts education. “Investment in the arts may be among the most innovative workforce development tools at the disposal of state governments” (NGA, 2001, p. 2). Encouragement of lifelong education -- multiple community learning opportunities –is in support of meeting the high demands of need in our workforce. Such opportunities offer a “broad strategy of inclusion” of education and career development to unskilled, less-educated individuals to compete and improve themselves (Leiken, 2002, p. 1). This

¹²⁹ Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
human capital approach provides “dual benefits, open[s] careers in the creative industries for some...while enhancing the overall workforce preparedness of others” (NGA, 2002, p. 4).

One overriding question stemmed from this discussion: why is NAEA not taking a stronger leadership role and/or at least following the lead, involving itself with the organizations that I mentioned previously in the background arts policy discussion in Chapter Two, including: National Council on Aging (NCOA); the National Endowment for the Arts (NEA); and the American Society of Aging Lifetime Renewal Network’s Center on Creative Aging (CCA). The NAEA LLL Affiliate has been in existence since 1976 and has set the pace in art education, specifically in recognition of the need for research on adult art education.

These organizations have paved the way for future action in adult arts education, yet most of the field are unaware of the adults and older adults focus and precedent goals. Again, the goals need to be implemented and shared at the state and local level for true grassroots action.

Specifically, the NCOA (2000) outlines the following goals for adult lifelong learning and the arts:

- Through its continued support of the National Endowment for the Arts, Congress should encourage and recognize the value of work by older artists as well as the importance of outreach to older audiences -- NEA should encourage programs that help older Americans discover artistic skills in retirement.

---

150 Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, Higher Education/Professional Organizations #5. 158
- Area Agencies on Aging and private service providers should encourage planning for lifelong learning programs and new opportunities for older persons in education, recreation, the arts, and aging.

- Federal support for library services to older persons should be strengthened, recognizing that they need not only technology, but also innovative programs that encourage learning and self-expression.

- Encourage grant support of foundations and corporations, including federal support, to museums and performing arts groups to attract and teach older audiences.

Current NEA initiatives\textsuperscript{131} related to older adults include: \textit{Arts in Healthcare} – leadership grants to train arts administratos and artists, who are working in healthcare, as consultants; and \textit{Lifelong Learning and Older Adults} – 1) creation of National Database; and 2) involvement in the International Year of the Older Person (organized by the Administration of Aging to look at ways that government agencies may work collaboratively to meet the needs of America’s aging population).

The most recent organization to become the current ‘think tank’ for research and policy and technical assistance for older adult programs is CCA, again, the Center on Creative Aging (associated with the American Society on Aging Lifetime Renewal Network). For the CCA: “The experience of aging is a profound process marked by meaning and purpose. The arts [are a]…powerful way to engage elders in a creative and healing process of self-expression and life review, enabling them to create works that honor their life history and transmit their legacy“ (CAA, 2000). CAA lists six objectives:
1. To advocate for quality arts programs as being essential to the well being of older adults.

2. To evaluate arts and aging programs and to identify and promote best practices.

3. To distill the lessons of model programs in order to create technical assistance materials and training programs for others to use.

4. To support the replication of best practice models through existing or new arts and aging coalitions throughout the country.

5. To serve as a Secretariat for such programs providing vehicles for the exchange of information and resources.

6. To support research and policy toward developing the field (CAA, 2000).

Such organizations can be potential future partners with NAEA in establishing standards for adult art education. The question is now up to the organizations. Are they leaders in art education beyond K-12 education? Are they prepared to meet the changing demographics and build upon lifelong learning for all ages?

2) Education of arts administrators and arts educators:

Some pertinent thoughts on this sub-theme point to the importance of providing future educators and administrators with the essential tools to meet our growing diverse, aging society:

- Such training will be needed to effectively stimulate and satisfy demand for adult arts education. Also, in an environment where there will surely be plenty of "providers" of adult arts education with little or no training to do so.

---

121 (Then) NEA Chairman Bill Ivey letter to The Honorable Charles E. Grassley, Chiarman, Special Committee on Aging. January 19, 2000.

160
university training can help to set and maintain standards of quality in arts education.\textsuperscript{132}

- Given that most learning about the arts will take place beyond the school years, it is essential that arts administrators be prepared to implement arts education programs in a variety of community based settings.\textsuperscript{133}

- Arts administration (and teacher training) programs in higher education should include courses that prepare them to create, implement, and evaluate programs for adult learners...having higher education involved in such training might help equalize the quality and understanding of the tools and skills needed in addressing the problem.\textsuperscript{134}

- We need to insert/develop strong curricula materials concerning older adults and the therapeutic role of the arts so they become experts and want to pursue professional opportunities in the field.\textsuperscript{135}

The majority of respondents felt there is a major inadequacy of preparation for future teachers and administrators in understanding the value of education to older persons, which is supported by the literature (Adkins, G., 1981; Courtenay, 1989; Hoffman, Greenberg and Fitzner 1980; Hoffman, 1992; Fitzner and Rugh, 1998; Michael, 1998; Markus, 1979). Since the start of the NAEA’s Lifelong Learning Special Interest Group in the 70’s, the need for proper training has been an issue and there has been a call to field prior to the 90s recognition of our rapidly aging society and the need to evolve art(s) education teachers, administrators preparation curriculum that is echoed throughout the

\textsuperscript{132} Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
\textsuperscript{133} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{134} Ibid.
literature in aging, adult education, too. “Poorly trained persons with low-level arts
knowledge or those lacking experience in working with older persons [adults in general]
can neither effectively communicate with students nor foster the attitudes or work habits
needed to develop strong creative visual arts learning” (Hoffman, 1999, p. 55). Many
arts educators become teachers/ facilitors in community-based settings and they lack
adult learning skills. We need to include such training in curriculums and by doing this,
“…we might start to see a break through in improving what these programs offer, and
how those working in such settings might become part of our NAEA [and/or other
programs, graduate programs, arts/ aging leadership organizations] service family…”
(Greenberg, 2000-1, p. 20). Beyond just reaching out to the adult population, such
programs need to have quality practice to back them up – sound art(s) education/
administration. Training at the grassroots level will expand the awareness and advocacy
of the results, rewards of providing quality art educational practices and models to adults
(Jones, 2000-1; Barret, 1996; Greenberg, 1987; Greenberg, 1985; Hoffman, 1992;
Jefferson, 2000-1).

As noted by the framework and references throughout this study, the multitude of
research available can easily support a building curriculum and guide the field to
implement quality adult and older adult programs. Of course, we need to continue to
connect with current movements in the arts field and interdisciplinary fields. However,
by studying positive aging models, arts educators, administrators, etc. we can face biases,
stereotypes, negative attitudes, relationships and our culture to be more effective in
servicing creative aging (which also helps the instructor understand his/her own aging)

155 Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, Higher Education/Professional Organizations #2.
162
(Carlsen, 1991). Why are we not reaching out to the diverse groups “to improve the quality of teaching across the age ranges” (Greenberg, 2000-1, p. 23)? What makes the issue so timely now? Possibly it is the rise in grassroots programs and the fact that we cannot deny the population figures.

The scope of art education is being changed by the life style of our times. The forces that are changing it are societal, and the people of our nation may be more aware of what is happening than are our professionals. Certainly they are minimally recognized in the mainstream of art education. However, arts and education are inseparably joined in current social practices in the daily fare of our homes, offices, playgrounds, and political institutions. (Kuhn, 1979)

It is important for arts educators and arts administrators to understand and address the policies that shape the society in which we live and draw connections. Only then, through such mobilization can adult arts education come into focus. And the forces are in place – media, policy – for improving quality of life and the numerous routes, ways the arts are embedded in our daily lives. Will we act on it?

2) Research focus: Quality research and opportunities for sharing research were two key points discussed under this sub-theme.

If studies are funded and rigorously completed, the impact of this will be the greatest and the longest. It will also be critical for the field to continue to evolve. However, the others need to come first... Yet, Unless NAEA will support a new research publication or someone knows of another publisher going for this type of

\[136\] Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
For excellent scholarship is a prerequisite for solid policy research and, ultimately, social change. We should encourage some rigorous research programs that evaluate the benefits of the arts for older adults so that funding in this area would increase, jobs would be created and awareness could be increased on many different levels... Research will have a significant impact at all levels: increased programming, effective policy, and increased financial support. This is obviously the route that the Center on Creative Aging (ASA organization) has taken, as mentioned above.

Some stakeholders' challenges facing a Research focus include:

- The issue is that 'arts for older adults' is too vague a statement. Terminology has to be defined these days. Which older adults are defined here? Recent retirees, seniors in accommodation housing or in day-care?' To which another person responded: “Why not many or all of this group? Young-old, middle-old, Old-Old, etc?

- Interesting but not sure research always drives program development?” Specifically, “I believe that a research study, which is rigorous might have to turn its back on outcomes that do not lend themselves to quantification. The requirements of research should not guide the learning experience the program provides.

- That would be great but who is getting out the research that has already been done in this area? I'm afraid that most practicing art teachers could care less about art education after public school, K-12.

---

137 Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
138 Foundation Center's Philanthropy News Digest (e-mail newsletter). (May 21, 2002). Vartan Gregorian, President, Carnegie Corporation of New York, announcing the 2002 Carnegie Scholars.
139 Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
140 Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, Higher Education/Professional Organizations #7.
This last challenge highlights two challenges of the on-going discussion of lifelong learning in the arts: 1) the continuous battle of arts funding for K-12 education – how can we possibly think ‘beyond’ when we are struggling in the schools? And, 2) the traditional focus of lifelong learning to build future audiences: “getting bodies in the seats”. So are we to ignore the number of adult participants? According to Harris surveys (1975 and 1980), “older Americans are participating at a greater rate in all artistic endeavors surveyed…four-fifths of people over 65 believed in 1980 that art and cultural activities are as important for a community to have as libraries, schools, pools and recreational activities…” (Ventura-Merkel, 1984, p. iii-iv). It is evident that numbers are already on the rise (for informal arts versus audience development) from current NEA reports mentioned in the introduction (Peterson, 1996). Unfilled leisure hours lead to a lack of challenge and productivity, whereas many adults desire involvement, the arts offer programs to meet the needs of different people and their desire for aesthetic experiences. We need to collectively set our standards to address in addition to K-12 education, opportunities within our communities for adults, highlighting lifelong learning opportunities within the arts for all. Wyszomirkski (2001) notes “The free flow of information, ideas, and analysis is essential to the creation of knowledge in any field, perhaps especially in a field that is both inter-disciplinary and striving to span theory, concept, and application” (p. 7).

Another idea that was included into the research sub-theme is the focus on establishing a central database of resources on adult art education. This is something mentioned previously that is being taken on by the Center on Creative Aging in partnership with the National Endowment for the Arts to identify older adult programs –
building on a database of oral history adult projects. The art education field has not officially addressed such an idea; supporting the definite two-track approach that I have found in my research: we are not bridge-building with other fields. Possibly it refers back to be connected solely to ‘quality’ art education programs? One respondent felt this was very important:

*A clearinghouse of these programs provides a place to begin looking. Also, it provides a place for researchers to begin. This was the model used with the arts programs for at-risk youth. First Presidents Committee on the Arts and the Humanities/NALAA published “Coming Up Taller.” This brought greater awareness of these programs and more funding as well. The book was followed up with a web site (www.cominguptaller.org). This was followed up with a detailed research study on the efficacy of arts programs for at-risk youth (U.S. Department of Justice, National Endowment for the Arts, the cities of Atlanta/San Antonio/Portland, and Americans for the Arts).*  

Why take this route? Why focus on higher education and professional organizations for leadership positions on this issue? "Policy is only as good as the information and research that underlies it. If we want to ensure that arts and culture are bolstered by informed policy-making, we must have comprehensive and credible data to make our case convincingly" (Urice, 2001). Research on this issue will add to the personal and social value of the arts in serving the aged by contributing to current movements of: I) Arts’ need to incorporate social and education redistribution in strategic plans to create a more just and equitable society; and II) Arts role in supporting

---

141 Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
local initiatives in community development by recognizing the needs, as well as providing opportunities, for older adults.

*Quality research results in better programming, as there is better understanding of what makes an effective program (funding, partnerships, program logistics, etc.). It also can give an area of study greater validity. Results in increased funding, as advocates have a potent tool. Also necessary for effective policy development. Right now this concept looks great and there's lots of empirical evidence that it works. Quality data and information is needed to develop and evaluate public policy. The research is also helpful in bringing "outside" partners into this endeavor (e.g., AARP). Research will have a significant impact at all levels: increased programming, effective policy, and increased financial support.*

This is echoed loud and clear in the adult arts education literature I have researched.

Hoffman (1999) describes this concept well:

Individuals who are going to work with older persons and the arts must be provided with information concerning the sociological, biological, and psychological aspects of aging; the nature of the creative act, of the arts, and of aesthetics; the potential for the creative behavior of the elderly [adults in general]; as well as the organization development, and evaluation of arts programs presented to them before entering the field. (p. 56)

---

142 Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
A close race for third included 11.25% for identifying, recognizing the adult population, specifically the theme of **Defining adults and older adults**. The stakeholders discuss the challenges of such a diverse population, as well as the need to for those serving adults to recognize.

![Defining Adults, Older Adults](image)

**Figure 4.4: Defining Adults, Older Adults**

Though only three (3) ideas were expressed under this theme, it was highly important on addressing adult arts education. Without knowing “who” is to be served and how the field defines adult learners how can we proceed to serve them? The three (3) ideas shared throughout all three rounds are outlined below. Two ideas received votes and interestingly, though few ideas, this theme included the highest scoring individual idea:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Defining Adults, Older Adults Ideas based on Frequency</th>
<th>Ranks</th>
<th>$f$</th>
<th>$M$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>#2. Recognize that “older adults” are not a homogenous group and target actions tailored to a wide variety of income levels, educational attainment, cultural backgrounds, health conditions, and previous exposure to the arts.</td>
<td>5 5 3 3 2 1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
#3. The range of artistic background, sensitivity, and skill within a group of older adults is likely to be considerable. Their teachers need to understand how to bring out whatever lies dormant within and to introduce techniques and materials that are appropriate to the learner's capacities and to the idea and affect the person is trying to express. Focusing on the variety of aspirations among learners and helping them to achieve his/her goal is not an easy way to teach but it is the essence of the experience.

#1. Adult learners: who are they? Ages! Abilities! This needs to be addressed – acknowledging diversity is very critical in working with adults! (50 adults vs. 50 4th graders: more diversity in adult group than in youth of 9-10 year age groups).

Note: f= Frequency; M=Mean; Pts=Total Points

So how do we define adults? This has been a question I have been dealing with since the start of my professional career as an adult art educator. For this study, the participants had to define adults as a group, and this was a challenge. Though there were limits for my own research to relate to aging policy, forecasting for adult arts education to become inherent in lifelong learning for ‘all’ ages, one is thinking in terms of ‘opening up’ versus defining what an adult is. Yet, to validate my own research, my targeted group was closely related to aging policy’s own definition and recognition of classifications of persons of later years to follow young-old ages 55-74; Elderly, ages 75-84; and very old to include ages 85+ (Neugarten, 1982). For my stakeholders there was no definition of older adults so they would not be inhibited. One gets numerous responses when talking about older adults, let alone older adult arts education. What I have found and the route I chose to follow is in relating to aging policy – reverting to ‘retirement age’ and/or Social Security benefits. Yet, with such a transition in both of those standards of yesterday, how do we define persons of later years?

Instead of coming to a ‘clear definition’ of adults and older adults, the stakeholders placed the importance on realizing the diversity of our changing demographics and awareness of the multiple definitions of adults and older adults to
serve as guidelines. The importance of this theme is to recognize older adults as a 'non-homogenous' group. The focus is on accepting and highlighting that different learners have different needs. In today's world, adults find themselves faced with the challenges of an ever-changing economy, stress, and the constant need to make sense out of their everyday life and the world around them. "Older Americans also are healthier than ever before. However, there are still millions of older adults who live with chronic illnesses and must rely upon family, friends and public support systems to help them manage their everyday lives."¹⁴³ We need to stress the importance to understand the aging process and inclusiveness: we are all aging with diverse needs. Education in and through the arts offers outlets for transformation.

Reponses for these ideas not only focused on defining adults, older adults, but the role of the teacher, the facilitator, and/or program planner to be skilled in adult learning theories. It is their role to bring creative expression out, help them achieve their goals and art works.¹⁴⁴ Facilitators/ instructors need to provide a positive social context for planning good programs. Key ingredients include broad participation, an open atmosphere, enhancement of well-being of participants, community-building, negotiating multiple voices, and creating an on-going evaluation (Woodmansee, 1994). The key is to develop ways of sharing information both for the adults who need structure and guidance to find meaning in the subject matter and for those who do not. It is about involving the learning as a process: a search for meaning and a continuation of the commitment to learn. The arts offer self-fulfillment, self-actualization. Each adult brings a new addition and layer of meaning, thus further consolidating existing ideas and information. Such

interpretation, whether at a museum or community recreation center, offers the opportunity for voluntary and self-motivated learning, creating a more welcoming place for adults. By providing openness and creative endeavors, the arts can help adults to age effectively and creatively. With adults, learning is a personal journey…it is an active engagement of the learner (Mayer, 1996; Butler, 1971). Adult arts education programs have the capability to contribute to adult learning at different stages of life – enhancing the process of learning that is a continuation throughout life. An understanding and recognition of the diverse, multiple levels of adulthood is important in defining any audience. Adult learners often participate in avocational programs for two main reasons: personal development and social engagement. It is an educational and/or social experience or activity that is based on improvement (possibly) and learning new things. Cross’s (1981) CAL model is a positive approach in dealing with adult learners:

- Capitalize on the experience of the participants;
- Challenge participants to move to increasingly advanced stages of personal development;
- Allow participants a choice in the availability and organization of the learning programs; and adapt to the age limitations of the participants.

For adults, the arts bring greater fulfillment and purpose to age; aging.

The consensus on this theme directly relates to the current push in aging policy for embracing a ‘society-whole’ approach, which does not take away from one age group, but develops into a society that recognizes, addresses, and serves all ages. It is important to point out those serving the public, that aging does not mean one stops learning or stops

144 Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
contributing to society or stops living a satisfying life. And we are all aging one way or the other – it may not be an issue now, but inevitably it will be. Aesthetic experiences through the arts help to clarify and express the challenges of our everyday life, our personal world and society as a whole.

**10%** voted for **Public Policy** issues.

![Bar chart](image)

**Figure 4.5:** Public Policy – Funding for Adult Arts Education

There was a strong need identified for the arts field to look beyond K-12 opportunities and include adults when addressing lifelong learning – we need to serve *all* ages. The group recognized the need to change policy in order for more adult programs to be developed and incorporated into practice. As expected, there was discussion on adult arts education not taking away from K-12 opportunities, but seen as an addition to the learning spectrum. Policy issues reflected the need for adult arts education to become more involved in the quality of life debate and to change overall views and highlight the need to fund arts activities for older adults. Examples were given at the local level, which also supports the literature and arts policy movement/focus on local grassroots development of this issue. *Funding sources such as state grassroots art grants can be*
utilized to support art programs for older adults\textsuperscript{145} \textendash \textellipsis \textmd{local groups may want to get involved…}\textsuperscript{146}

Public Policy had four ideas overall, with two ideas receiving ranks of high and middle importance:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Public Policy Ideas</th>
<th>Ranks</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>M</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>#1. Policy should be developed at the local, regional, and national levels that affirm the importance of arts education as a life-long learning process. Such policy should specifically mention the importance of the arts to older adults.</td>
<td>5 5 5 4</td>
<td>4 4.8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#2. Federal, State, and local arts funding agencies as well as private foundations should be encouraged to create, implement, and evaluate funding initiatives that support arts education programs for older adults.</td>
<td>5 4 1</td>
<td>3 3.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#3. Support older artists and arts administrators</td>
<td>0 0 0</td>
<td>0 0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#4. Get a &quot;pro-arts&quot; mayor or governor. Nothing like civic pride to make older adults feel the arts belong to them.</td>
<td>1 1</td>
<td>1 1.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: \( f = \text{Frequency}; \ M = \text{Mean}; \ Pts = \text{Total Points} \)

Funding was the main policy concern because it is a clear and concise statement of arts education policy goals and action items and why this is important for older adults.\textsuperscript{147} Goals 2000: Educate America Act listed the importance of the arts for adults to ‘live and work in a global community’ (NAEA, 1994). This is another admirable, yet broad goal. Beyond highlighting ‘adults’, no further action has been taken. \textit{We must encourage funding too support programs and research or we will never attract professionals into the field.}\textsuperscript{148} Pankratz (1995) also supports the need for funding by outlining two necessary research areas in aging and arts policy: 1) policy mechanism and funding systems of local arts agencies in the area of arts and aging programs; and 2) support for arts and aging activities that is provided by the Aging Network (p. 180).

\textsuperscript{145} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, Public Policy – Funding for Adult Arts Education #2.
\textsuperscript{146} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{147} Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
Through this exploratory study of the issues, these questions stress the need to address why we have not responded to adult arts education and the lack of infrastructure, which Pankratz also notes. This is a direct link to the ‘lack of’ policy in adult education policy for serious older adult educational programs. “There has never been sufficient pressure from older people, educators, elected officials, or agency staff to design, support, and implement policy for this area” (Peterson and Masunaga, 1998, p. 57). Respondents agree. *Funders should, and certainly have been encouraged to create and support these programs. Advocates, practitioners, and theorists have not had the tools to make much more than an impassioned case.*\(^\text{149}\) And the support is there to back it up.

Compelling evidence exists to demonstrate how federal funding for the arts combined with private sector and other public sector [support]has had a profound impact upon the health, education, and economy of our nation. Business leaders are taking the opportunity to build upon the strong networks and partnerships, the broad access and cultural diversity, and the economic stimuli and social problem-solving abilities created by the arts to nurture further growth at the local level. The arts enrich the lives of all Americans because they speak to our economic, intellectual, and spiritual well-being. (Jordan, 1997)

With the current evidence and growing interest in the multi-purposes of the arts there is more opportunity for research funds. Due to more interest and more funding possibilities, “…educators who are interested in working with older adults but were restricted by financial considerations would be able to initiate quality programs.”\(^\text{150}\)

---

\(^{148}\) Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.

\(^{149}\) Ibid.

\(^{150}\) Ibid.
Another participant went on to say, *First and foremost, older adults vote!* If lack of arts learning opportunities are perceived as a problem for older adults, and this is viewed as a policy issue involving both the public and private sector, I believe action will be taken to create a more unified policy position, particularly if lobbying groups such as the AARP become involved.\textsuperscript{151}

For policy to take affect, Pankratz, Blancato, and others in the literature encourage an inter-generational and well-being focus as the range of social issues widens. This cross-discipline track is echoed in the stakeholders comments. *Policy attention is often necessary for an issue to receive public recognition and discussion.* Policy development need not mean extensive funding, but it can place an issue on radar screens. Likelihood is hard to gauge...adult arts education now has a unique policy window to gain attention. *All arts policy has become arts education policy...most arts education policy is workforce development policy.* Add to this the inexorable aging of America. Given these conditions, if adult arts education can’t get some public attention over the next decade, it never will.\textsuperscript{152} This stakeholder’s statement restates the call of my research and puts into perspective the opportunity at hand. The collaborative effort approach ‘forecasted’ in the 70s by Mankin (on adult education) still has relevance today:

The overall goal is to create a system that is flexible, accessible and does not force us to make tradeoffs between diversity and specialization, idealism and pragmatism, the humanities and the sciences, the theoretical and practical, liberal education and career education, and work, leisure and citizenship...to attempt a grand integration of all these, utilizing the best of our abilities to invent,

\textsuperscript{151} Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
experiment with and revise the socio-technological designs necessary to achieve this dynamic end...to provide satisfying and fulfilling life experiences for all citizens may depend on how successful our efforts in this direction ultimately are. (p. 52)

There is a common base of values shared among arts education, arts policy, and adult education. Formulating policy recommendations on key aspects of older adult learning, Cross and Hilton (1983) call for interagency communication and cooperation to keep alive public awareness. On the whole, policy is needed to establish structures that:

- insure broad-based input of adult learning goals and policy recommendations;
- assess adult learning trends, resources and needs;
- use adult learning as a vehicle for fostering economic revitalization of the state;
- assess benefits from supporting adult learning;
- increase rates of participation in learning – promoting informal opportunities; and,
- create networks to help local programs, agencies, etc. start programs (Fisher and Wolf, 1998; Cross and Hilton, 1983).

The necessary steps for policy action for adult education policy geared toward a lifelong learning society have been set in stone for quite some time, dating back to the 70s. These steps are: i) establish a comprehensive and coordinated pluralist service commanding ample public resources; ii) relate its functions to such national social concerns as an

---

152 Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
active manpower policy and the quality of life; iii) integrate the formal (academic) and occupational training sector with regular education as part and parcel of a recurrent education system; and iv) initiate extraordinary measures to identify and satisfy the unmet educational needs, disadvantaged persons (OECD, 1977, p. 80-1).

The relationship – the inter-disciplinary approach is evident. The stage is set for adult arts education in the current events and issues surrounding adults living longer, healthier, better lives. Successful aging is the tract used to create firm policy to meet social and educational needs of an aging, productive society (Pankratz, 1990; and Fisher and Wolf, 1998; Kurland, 1976).

**Partnerships** followed closely behind with 10%.

![Partnerships Chart](image)

Figure 4.6: Partnerships

For this group, partnerships were not strictly defined and encompassed collaborations, networks, alliances, etc. In researching partnerships in the arts there are three general types (Lafferty and Fillicko, 2000):

1. Two or more cultural institutions collaborate on creative projects;
2. Two or more cultural organizations share ‘non-creative’ resources, such as technical support, facilities, administrative staff, and so forth; and

3. Arts and cultural organizations and arts school programs partner with organizations outside of the arts and cultural arena (p. 2).

The latter case is the overwhelming focus for the stakeholders under this theme. The broadening of definitions of the arts also demands partnerships with community agencies, hospitals and health systems, businesses, governments, philanthropy, grass roots organizations and other partners to achieve goals. Another trend has been partnerships between foundations and public arts agencies, “Through such partnerships, foundations engaged in direct policy action working with public cultural agencies along policy lines that had been well-articulated and legitimated within the arts community” (Wyszomirski, 2001, p. 2). Foundations involvement is on the rise and may be a route for adult arts education.

A number of participants stress the need to collaborate and get involved with aging agencies, national, state, and local adult programs (i.e. Elderhostel). Partnerships should be developed between arts organizations, arts education organizations and institutions and interest groups serving older adults – and adult education venues – senior centers, community education, university extension, Elderhostel – for the purpose of advocating for arts programs for older adults.153

Partnerships, in general, are a hot topic in the nonprofit sector, often responsible for the creation of many adult arts programs (i.e. NCOA, NEA, etc). A successful partnership in lifelong learning is the alliance of museums and libraries, under the

153 Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
Institute of Museums and Libraries guidance. They highlight the importance of adult learning and forming ‘learning networks’ to highlight all ages and meet the challenges:

The bold vision for the future must be a new kind of network, an infrastructure or system of complementary resources, tools connections that serve the varied paths of today’s learners...we can best extend the learning process through innovative collaborations...support[ing] the concept of community as a learning campus.

(IMLS, 2001, p. 8, 10).

The stakeholders agree. *Collaboration has increasingly become a theme in many areas of education, not only to extend and share scarce resources but also to bring together the viewpoints of many stakeholders and reduce the fragmented efforts of groups working in isolation. Both the economic and holistic aspects of this issue could continue to be important in the future.*

According to several of the stakeholders, there is *Never enough to go around so partnerships are essential financially. But arts can and should cross boundaries (age, gender, racial, ethnic, socio-economic).* Also, *Partnerships can insure demographic needs pre-requisite for funding resources.* The group identified the need for the arts to embrace such opportunities, and also to make initial contact and explore the unlimited ways to partner. Out of four (4) ideas, three received a ranking, with one receiving a high interest:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Partnership Ideas</th>
<th>Ranks</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>M</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>#2. Start building a program of partnerships for learning, teaching and practising in Art Education for Adults, between the widest possible range</td>
<td>3 2 2 1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

154 Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
155 Ibid.
156 Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, Partnerships #3.
of public and private agencies and institutions - business, industry and commerce, governments (local, state and federal), banks and financial houses of all kinds, Veterans Organisations, the Defense and Armed Forces, Ethnic Community Organisations and Clubs (especially Rotary, Lions, Buffaloes and Alumni organisations, etc.), with the aim of jointly funding, sponsoring and providing not only Arts Educators in residence but also the building or conversion of older buildings and facilities, into places where Art Education For Adults can be provided and practiced. Use the idea and motto of "Decent Corporate Citizenship".

#3. Partnerships should be developed between arts organizations, arts education organizations and institutions and interest groups serving older adults – and adult education venues – senior centers, community education, university extension, Elderhostel – for the purpose of advocating for arts programs for older adults.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#3</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Total Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#1. Development of community partnerships between schools and organizations that serve older adults for the purpose of creating, implementing, and evaluating inter-generational arts education programs...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#1</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Total Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#4. Carry Art Education for Adults into all parts of the community by employing "Arts Educators in residence" (AER) at Educating institutions, sports clubs, churches, theatres, museums and art galleries, in shopping malls, in community centers, hospital and health centers, retirement villages and senior citizens homes, and all other possible locations, operating under the specific brief of "selling" the joys, excitement and practical benefits of engaging in Art Education for Adults for all members of the community and getting them to commit to it.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#4</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Total Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: \( f = \) Frequency; \( M = \) Mean; \( Pts = \) Total Points

For any partnership to be successful, Partnering entities have to see benefits and then support fully.\(^{157}\) Jacobs (1999), Sgroi (1998), and Boris and Steuerle (1999) agree that successful partnerships must include:

1) Equal partners with different contributions (i.e. complementary traits, resources, qualities, etc.);

2) Respect and trust all partners involved;

3) Selection of partners is due to common goals, shared vision/ beliefs, needs to meet challenges together versus alone; and

4) Overall involvement, synergy between all partners involved.
Several authors forecast ‘successful arts groups of the future’ will build active partnerships with numerous ‘types’ of organizations (government, businesses, school systems, etc.) and such partnerships will come about due to mutual interests and social responsibility (Hiller, 2001, p. 49).

In any social-cultural model\textsuperscript{158} for aging, the arts fit in whether it is for activity, social, cognitive, functional or health purposes. \textit{We must build partnerships which reach out to other organizations, etc., which serve older adults. This huge \textit{[Aging]} network is already in place and art education needs to utilize it.}\textsuperscript{159} Bastings (1994), Durr et al (1992), and Shuldiner (1992) agree that as the focus on community development grows, it is important that the arts community partner with the Aging Network and become active as community resources for the aged. The need to partner with the Aging Network – key aging organizations – was the obvious crucial step in pushing this issue forward for the stakeholders. \textit{I believe that art educators much reach out to the Aging Network, tapping into their resources and convincing them of the importance of the arts to their constituents...Many senior center directors provide matching funds for grassroots arts grants because they have seen how much their participants have benefited from past programs.}\textsuperscript{160} This approach is supported in literature. The arts need to be involved with the interventions “in public policy, in professional practice and everyday lives – that will enhance the quality of aging process and ensure that the majority of older people will be a

\textsuperscript{157} Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
\textsuperscript{158} Center on Aging and Aged, Indiana University, social-cultural model for aging well: www.indiana.edu/~caa/Awmdweb.htm. Part of the Global Ageing Initiative (Professor Barbara Hawkins), collaboration of researchers and teachers of ageing worldwide to research, investigate and teach concerning the world population ageing phenomena.
\textsuperscript{159} Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
\textsuperscript{160} Ibid.
resource, not a burden, either to themselves or society” (Riley and Riley, 1989, p. 9). The stakeholders’ beliefs in the importance of partnerships, in general, are shared below:

*Partnerships will be key to progress in arts education at all levels. Adult arts education has only scratched the surface of building partnerships....adult arts education has so many opportunities for building partnerships...find[ing] points of contact and overlap with organizations in all sorts of institutions – senior centers, community education, etc., as well as health organizations.*

*Partnerships are an effective strategy in reaching a particular group. They can bring together a range of expertise and provide greater access to the audience in question. This results in the arts community providing greater and more comprehensive service (i.e. more effective service). This can also bring greater legitimacy and political clout with funders and policy makers...[i.e.] using AARP as an example, they are a top lobby entity. To have them carrying the banner of arts education is very potent.*

Over and over, the consensus is that *encouragement and support from national organizations ranging from NAEA and Americans for the Arts and Elderhostel... is needed to set the example – provide the leadership -- at the local level.*

---

161 Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
162 Ibid.
163 Ibid.
are the way to go – as in all things, working together often accomplishes more than trying to do it on one's own.\textsuperscript{164}

According to the American Assembly (1997), partnerships are the main ingredient for political attention and policy action on arts policy issues. The arts should join forces to establish applications to broader public purposes. "Technological, social and political changes have had far-reaching implications for the way government, business and nonprofit organizations fulfill their missions and work together. These changes have led...communit[ies] to redefine..." how to better achieve public purposes through cross-sector collaborations (NGA, 2002). Congress' recent demands have enhanced state involvement in partnerships where priority is given to projects for underserved populations. The strategies used in partnerships for older adults expand on current partnerships and avenues for involving the general public with the arts.\textsuperscript{165}

\textsuperscript{164} Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
\textsuperscript{165} Including: quality and integration of technology; attaching emotional ties to community; reinforcing the need for an emotional, personal appeal; appealing to community needs by providing a 'service'; educating community on our 'role' w/in the community; offering an alternative avenue for individuals to receive the opportunity for success; learning in a fun, open atmosphere; building self-esteem and enhance self-possibility; and, bringing community members together in an open forum; dialogue opportunity. The possibilities are endless.
The remaining votes related to access and increasing involvement. Participation received **8.75%** of the votes.

![Participation: Incentives & Barriers](image)

**Figure 4.7: Participation: Incentives & Barriers**

For the stakeholders of this group, the key ideas under this theme dealt with accessibility, inclusion and community: reaching the ‘underserved’, the disenfranchised’. Many of the ideas focused on tailoring programs and opportunities to alleviate common barriers for adults, older adults and to offer incentives to increase their participation. They are calling for ...leaving no one out... *We must do this to bring everyone along or else.* The focus is to serve numerous needs of adults and older adults, whether healthy or frail. *People, young and old, with [or without] disabilities can create art and enjoy art others have created.* It is *Good to appeal to diverse segments* — ...to maintain and grow audiences.

There were multiple ranks for this category, which had a total of nine (9) ideas identified. There were no frequency rankings above two (2). Thus, this theme was of

---

166 Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
167 Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, Participation: Incentives & Barriers #3.
168 Ibid.
lower interest (at this stage) for this Delphi study. It is certainly of high interest in
planning adult programs, adult art education opportunities, but of lesser value in pushing
this issue forward. The rankings are below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participation Ideas</th>
<th>Ranks</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>M</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>#4. More could be done to make the arts part of the civic space of cities and towns. Another barrier to arts participation is that it is often perceived &quot;outside&quot; the normal scope of community life. This includes more public arts and more arts in public places.</td>
<td>4 4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#5. Address financial barriers to participation – for example, Iowa’s ICARD discount program for low-income groups – Cost is an issue.</td>
<td>2 1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#3. Although many older adults are full of &quot;get-up-and-go&quot; some are confined to their home, their retirement community, or to a nursing home. Art learning and activities need to be made accessible to them by means such as on-site classes and transporting them to museums, lectures and artists' studios.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#7. Barriers to participation in the arts need to be addressed. They include the fear of failure and the fear of entering &quot;new social&quot; spaces. Parents can be introduced to unfamiliar arts experiences via their children through school and community programs and older and retired adults could be initiated through College Alumni and Club events as well as senior and nursing home programs.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#2. Make a special point of reaching the whole range of previously un-reached learners - of offering Art Education for Adults to those people, groups and communities which are deprived, disadvantaged, and at the margins of society - especially, the poor, the unemployed, ethnic minorities, rural dwellers and those suffering under physical, emotional or mental handicaps or disadvantages of any kind.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#1. Use research documenting physical, mental, and other benefits of arts participation as the basis of development of incentives to participate.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#6. Attend to transportation and accommodation issues (logistical barriers) – Transportation and access to programming is vital to participation in arts programs.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#8. Time is also an adult variable. Retirees may have more – but not necessarily.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#9. Earlier performance times (i.e., 7:00 pm curtains instead of 8:00 pm curtain)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: f= Frequency; M=Mean; Pts=Total Points

What has been of interest to me over the years is how older adults are commonly used in
reference to ‘accessibility’ issues – NEA and NASSA both ‘house’ older adults and the
arts under ADA accessibility issues, often referred to as frail and unhealthy, versus
underserved and/or disenfranchised. Is this a fair picture? "Older adults" does not mean just infirm senior people...\textsuperscript{170} Are the majority of older adults the arts are serving frail and unhealthy? Even though we know that close to 90\% of older adults are well!\textsuperscript{171}

Why are they only taking one view? What is the rationale for doing this? Is it tradition passed on – holding on to the old aging stigma?

The access discussion also covered transportation, early curtain times, readable prints/ signage, ADA compliances, and financial barriers. \textit{Studying barriers to participation is critical to developing effective policy and programs.}\textsuperscript{172} Financial and time-scheduling barriers are a common discussion point in planning most events and are commonly referred to in the literature on community education for older adults (Courtenay, 1990; Fisher and Wolf, 1998). A couple of examples of a positive approach to addressing financial concerns were shared with the group.\textsuperscript{173}

1. Iowa’s ICARD discount program for low-income families, groups, individuals.

The ICARD program links human service agencies with arts organizations to improve arts access for low-income and minority populations. Human service agencies issue a membership card to qualified families or individuals; the card is used for free or significantly reduced admission to arts events or classes sponsored by participating local arts organizations (http://www.cultureplan.org/graphics/plan/plantheplan.pdf).

2. Georgia’s Grassroots Art Program provides funding for programming for low-income groups such as senior center participants (monies allocated to each county).

Other comments the group shared on addressing barriers to participate include:

\textsuperscript{170} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, Participation: Incentives & Barriers #3.
\textsuperscript{171} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, Participation: Incentives & Barriers #7.
\textsuperscript{172} Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
Economics are always an issue in educational participation, as research consistently shows higher education and income levels associated with higher participation in adult education.\textsuperscript{174}

You must make adult art classes affordable. If they can’t afford it all the theory and practice in the world will go by the way side and never be tried or used.\textsuperscript{175}

It [all] sounds very nice but who is going to pay for this? Most poor do not look upon education as important and many are school drop-outs. That is why they are poor. So now you think they are going to want to go to adult art classes? School and education for most of these folks is a ‘no-no’.\textsuperscript{176}

Economic factors preclude participation in the good arts learning opportunities. Same old/same old!\textsuperscript{177}

Give seniors vouchers and better discounts to attend the arts.\textsuperscript{178}

Cost is an issue as folks are often on fixed incomes.\textsuperscript{179}

Cost prohibition should be addressed so economic diversity; particularly of older adults is not a factor.\textsuperscript{180}

According to a recent study, The Aging States Project, by the Administration on Aging (2002), “the range of barriers identified…focused more heavily on the individual (lifestyle issues, inadequate transportation, and lack of consumer awareness” under access, participation.

How does the arts field in general discuss, depict participation issues? The field in general is looking to adapt cultural participation to include multiple levels of participation and several foundations and researchers are leading the charge, specifically, Wallace-Reader’s Digest Funds, PEW Foundation, RAND Institute, etc. RAND has

\textsuperscript{173} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, Participation: Incentives & Barriers #5.
\textsuperscript{174} Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
\textsuperscript{175} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{176} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, Participation: Incentives & Barriers #2.
\textsuperscript{177} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{178} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, Participation: Incentives & Barriers #5.
\textsuperscript{179} Ibid.
developed a conceptual framework that "can be put to use in determining specific strategies to increase awareness at arts events and to deepen the experience of those already attending". Thus, going beyond "attending" and "audience development", and incorporating personal meaning, "doing, making, contributing..." (Yoshitomi, 2000, p. 3). Such an approach builds on the leisure and visitor behaviors of the early nineties. This readaptive approach has opened a whole new 'view' to cultural participation and adult arts education is now being incorporated; included in the framework. An example of the importance of RAND and Wallace-Reader's Digest cultural participation work is close to home. In April 2001, the Ohio Arts Council (OAC) set out to implement the State Arts Partnership for Cultural Participation Initiative (START) grant from the Wallace-Reader's Digest Funds. Wallace Funds launched this new initiative to enable 'state arts agencies to establish and expand program standards and practices that increase participation in, and support for, the arts'. START Initiative supports 13 state arts agencies' efforts to develop new, more effective guidelines, programs and funding practices aimed at encouraging broader public participation in the arts.

For this grant, (according to C. Farnbauch, OAC Community Development Director, 2002) "the OAC has partnered with highly-respected regional arts and cultural organizations to implement research data that will help our diverse constituency strengthen programming that challenges and expands the current values, attitudes and perceptions of the average adult citizen about the role of the arts in everyday life". The key is that we are recognizing and addressing the importance of the informal, avocational

---

180 Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, Participation: Incentives & Barriers #5.
188
arts in our communities and the multiple ways the arts contribute to the well-being of Ohio citizens through lifelong learning opportunities.

Two partner sites, the Cleveland Partnership for Arts & Culture (CPAC) and the Greater Columbus Arts Council are addressing lifelong learning for all ages within their current projects. CPAC has identified lifelong education in and through the arts as a way to reach their adult population. Their education goal is to have a system of lifelong learning opportunities that engage all area residents in the practice, appreciation, and participatory experience of arts and culture. To reach this goal, CPAC (2000) highlights several ways, which include:

- Showcasing works of arts and culture in nontraditional places (i.e. factories, malls);
- Expanding the number of artist residency programs to reach more of the region's adults;
- Expanding the offering of reduced-costs tickets to arts and cultural programs and services;
- Providing arts and cultural programs and services in venues where people spend a majority of their time i.e. work, school, etc.; and
- Linking arts and cultural programs and services with the region's libraries.

The Greater Columbus Arts Council (GCAC) has set out to identify those lifelong learning arts opportunities within Franklin County, Ohio, that are serving the public and are “in addition” to the K-12 arts programs. GCAC has hired a consultant to conduct an 18-month assessment of arts education offerings in Central Ohio. Evaluation methods will include surveys and focus groups (with faith-based and immigrant cultural groups on arts education programs, highlighting adult opportunities). GCAC is currently working
with local stakeholders to clarify the community’s priorities on education-based arts services. This research will provide a picture of the ways the informal, avocational arts are a part of Central Ohio and identify ways such programs broaden public interest in the arts.

These are brief examples of how lifelong learning in the arts involvement in our communities is becoming more prominent within the arts field. Numerous foundations, beyond Wallace-Reader’s Digest Funds (i.e. PEW) and recent research (i.e. RAND studies, *Increasing Cultural Participation* (2001)) are focusing on improving adult cultural participation in the arts. For the OAC, addressing lifelong learning opportunities is crucial to meet the needs and desires of our diverse adult population. Other communities are doing the same – a recent Chicago study by the Chicago Center for Arts Policy, “The Informal Arts: Finding Cohesion, Capacity and Other Cultural Benefits in Unexpected Places” are taking on community arts and their valuable role, as well as policy recommendations for the field. This is very exciting, and as current research results are shared, it can only highlight the valuable role of community arts education\(^\text{181}\) in expanding the importance of lifelong education, learning for all ages.

\(^{181}\) One example of the possible venues to help in increasing community participation; adult arts education, includes faith-based institutions. This stakeholder’s idea came from the Role of the Arts, Arts Education, and Art Learning and did not get any ranking, but it did include discussion on lifelong learning and the opportunities within communities growing in this area as *An area of great potential development.*\(^\text{181}\) This idea takes the above idea one step further to a specific community source for adult programs. Faith-based institutions have gained a great deal of exposure with the current White House agenda and are becoming a prime partner with social services. For this group, this idea has potential due to the already established community resource of faith-based institutions, as well as the current programs many are aware of that offer wonderful programs, opportunities within their communities.\(^\text{181}\) This has become evident for one state arts agency, Ohio Arts Council, who is a leader in addressing this idea -- opportunity to increase participation and last year, reached an audience of 1300+, with over 50% including older adults. Future research report will discuss the community participation further (forthcoming 2002-3).
For the stakeholders, the importance was in being proactive and aware of numerous situational needs as well as recognition of diverse audiences and awareness of situational barriers and incentives.

**Arts in Healing/Art Therapy** received 5% of the votes.

![Bar Chart: Arts in Healing/Art Therapy]

**Figure 4.8: Arts in Healing/Art Therapy**

For the stakeholders, the connection between arts in healing and art therapy is the direct relationship to successful aging: the therapeutic benefits of the arts. Four ideas were suggested in the rounds with three ranked. The ranks for this theme include:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Arts in Healing/Art Therapy Ideas</th>
<th>Ranks</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>M</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>#2. Life review and reminiscence activities are an important part of involving elders in activities.</td>
<td>4 4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#1. Therapy and wellness -- Adult arts education can be used to meet therapeutic and rehabilitation goals.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#4. Health professionals’ education needs to be expanded so that members of the “team” (including MDs, nurses, therapists etc) understand the therapeutic benefits of their patients participating in the arts so that they “put in a good word” and encourage participation. Sometimes, older adults will listen to a health professional when they won’t listen to anyone else.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#3. Development of arts and healing programs by health care institutions.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note: f = Frequency; M = Mean; Pts = Total Points*
For arts education, there is not the connection with art therapy that there used to be. Is art therapy an art education? Why is only art therapy included in the Older Americans Act? This on-going debate was evident in the rounds’ discussions. Is Art learning as therapy for physical well being? Or is it a ‘form’ of arts education? Is this the role of arts education? Some agree that it could be one of many roles. Art therapy used to be an important aspect of art education. What happened? You never hear art educators discuss this aspect anymore. Is it because art therapy has become quite an area of study on its own? Most of the discussion follows under arts in healing versus traditional art therapy and highlights arts and medical partnerships. The stakeholders refer to these partnerships as supplements to, rather than replacements for traditional art therapy. Such a discussion dates back to the 1970s with the Society for the Arts in Healthcare: “a national service organization dedicated to fostering the role of the arts in healing” (AFTA, 1998).

There was also discussion of formal and informal programs and the difference between in and through the arts, which directly relates to my own research. Definitions of the ‘types’ of arts programs is important within this category, as well as having a team approach – art educator and therapist, and/or other health interdisciplinary team members. Key older adult programs (i.e. museum education) under this theme involve life review and reminiscence opportunities that connect with therapy. Reminiscence programs can encourage a person to use familiar memories of the past to help them to focus their thoughts to adapt to their present – creating personal meaning. Such a

---

182 Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, Arts in Healing/Art Therapy #4.
183 Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, Arts in Healing/Art Therapy #1.
184 Ibid.
program works with people's memories of their lives in a therapeutic way. In a museum context [as well as in a classroom setting], objects, images, sounds, related smells, and textures are used to open the door of the past to people's memories, both good and bad. According to the stakeholders, such programs allow ...older adults an opportunity to reflect upon their life experiences and then to share this with others, and they Stress the value of life experiences as rich source material for creative expression.\textsuperscript{185} The programs highlight the opportunity for older adults to share their 'voice': Most people like to tell about their lives and where they have been, what they have done... – life review is extremely important and should be trained in its techniques\textsuperscript{186}. Thus, providing context for art activities and learning.\textsuperscript{187} By integrating past experiences, as well as work through past hardships, the arts can help adults search for meaning in their everyday lives, helping them find their place in the present.

The stakeholders discussed quality art education versus "activities". Some participants called for arts education to be more diverse in programming "to provide opportunities for exploration.\textsuperscript{188} Others disagreed, acquainting 'busy activities' as a negative in comparison to arts learning, noting Art therapy is not art education! – which received the following responses: True, but one can still absorb art as part of therapy and Art making by its very nature is therapeutic.\textsuperscript{189} Involvement in art provides creative expression therapy, exploration of various art concepts/media, development of one's perceptions, allows expression of one's feelings, patterning of aesthetic and criticism,
review of the patterned works, aesthetics and criticism of other art/learners.\textsuperscript{190} Another participant felt that if such an activity is presented, then a key ingredient is that Activities need to solicit responses. Classical music (Strauss or Verdi) and classical art (van Gogh, Monet) stir the soul and invite a response\textsuperscript{191}, thus, the experience becomes valuable and enhances the individual. This is often a debate when reviewing literature on adult arts education. There are multiple reasons adults take classes (informal and/or nonformal classes). For some, the arts provide physiological benefits, “such as decrease in blood pressure, lowered anxiety and fear and elevated mood” (AFTA, 1998).

The stakeholders are calling for more collaboration and recognition of what we [arts education, administrators and arts therapists] can do together and how we can further connect with the health-care industry. The challenge and opportunity for improving the ways we share resources and address our rapidly aging society is upon us. Building relationships with healthcare was expressed in two ideas suggested – focusing on education and training of professionals, as well as partnering with arts organizations. The respondents felt that if such training is presented in ‘a sound curriculum and with professional art instruction’ it would succeed.\textsuperscript{192} This is often the formula used in successful adult programs, as mentioned above under the Higher Education/ Professional Organization theme.

As the growing interest and need for ‘healing’ continues in our communities, collaborations with the healthcare field should become a more important ingredient to highlight and move forward the arts education issue. \textit{Art has a healing effect on humans.}

\textsuperscript{190} Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
\textsuperscript{191} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, Arts in Healing/Art Therapy #1.
\textsuperscript{192} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, Arts in Healing/Art Therapy #4.
Based upon the increasing numbers and occurrences of social & individual maladies, the healing arts and therapeutic art-based activities are needed more in the 21st Century than ever before.\textsuperscript{193} The focus on the theme Arts in Healing/Art Therapy is also directly tied to the current medical shift in the growing awareness, and acceptance of wellness and alternative methods of healing, related mostly to preventative care, but also regular care. This connection will only grow stronger and more relevant as the focus on holistic approaches to health gain exposure and interest. And Everyone should understand the therapeutic aspect of creative art expression and support it...\textsuperscript{194}

Due to September 11, 2001, there has been a surge of arts in healing programs and a growing need to discuss what these programs entail. One example is the Americans for the Arts newsletter and weekly email notices of arts in healing programs available on-line. Such discussion has spurred the need to address arts in healing and art therapy and their direct connection to arts education.

\textsuperscript{193} Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
\textsuperscript{194} Appendix G: Round III Responses-Q3 Responses, Arts in Healing/Art Therapy #4.
Intergenerational (2.5%) and Marketing (1.25%) rounded out the votes.

![Intergenerational Chart]

Figure 4.9: Intergenerational

Intergenerational programming is gaining attention from aging policy and arts education. These programs offer an opportunity to share resources, versus fighting for funds. They are a way to share the knowledge and life experiences as well as the meaning of aging. Such programs are crucial in re-framing our definition older adults, as well as addressing the drastic demographic changes in our society.

Out of the total three (3) ideas suggested, only one received ranks:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Intergenerational Ideas</th>
<th>Ranks</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>M</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>#1. Arts connect the generations. Arts are generative and can provide older adults a way of giving back.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#2. Adult arts education can be used for facilitating and enhancing intergenerational programming.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#3. Intergenerational programs enable older Americans to serve as mentors (or volunteers) to younger folks – strengthen communities and gives elders sense of values.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note: f= Frequency; M=Mean; Pts=Total Points*

It is important to mention this theme due to the growth and development of intergenerational arts programs over the past several years. Often intergenerational programs are centered on involvement of high school students and older adults. The key
is to involve both generations and create mutual benefits for all participants. Some examples from the literature include:\textsuperscript{195}

\textbf{Elder's Wisdom, Children's Song: Community Celebration of Place -- Arts & Culture program}: With the assistance of a troubadour, school children listen to oral histories of local elders in rural and urban Minnesota communities, and create songs, recitations, and art based on the personal stories. The program culminates in a community-wide celebration honoring the elders that is recorded on audio and videotape. The program will be replicated in other communities over the next two years in preparation for the "Minnesota Celebration of Community" during the Year 2000, including a statewide conference planned by a partnership led by the University of Minnesota Extension Service. Contact person is Janet Hively, University of Minnesota Extension Service, St. Paul, MN.\textsuperscript{196}

\textbf{Building Bridges}: A collaborative program which provides opportunities for children and seniors to interact and which targets the frail and home bound elderly. Through the program’s three components – education, friendship, and caring – children learn from and develop positive images of the elderly and help older adults achieve a sense of fulfillment. In consideration of the needs of the elderly and the children, a variety of appropriate activities occur, such as “Building Bridges Fair,” letter and art delivered to seniors, visits to nursing homes, tutorial assistance for children, interviewing, storytelling, reading, and dancing. Promotional materials, including a calendar, have been developed. Nina Chen, University Extension, University of Missouri, Columbus, MO.

Out of the three ideas generated, two are highlighted due to the discussion during the rounds. Several respondents recognize this large trend in older adult education this decade and the need for the arts to capitalize on the opportunities to serve diverse age groups. Such cross-generational programs help generational understanding.\textsuperscript{197} For the 21\textsuperscript{st} Century, An age-integrated society allows for the creation of a mosaic incorporating the best in difference across generations.\textsuperscript{198} Other ideas focus on the multigenerational interaction and mentoring capabilities of intergenerational programming (i.e. adult


\textsuperscript{196} Ibid.

\textsuperscript{197} Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, Intergenerational #1.
museum volunteers train student volunteers) by: *Develop[ing] capacity of parents/grandparents to reinforce arts learning of young people.*\(^{199}\) Also, older adults can benefit from ‘giving back’: *...older adults can be looked up to by the younger people and therefore gain in confidence.*\(^{200}\) Such ideas are echoed in the literature (Dickson, 1999; Davis and Ferdman, 1993; Kauppien, 1987; and Zaki and Zaki, 1982) focusing on the mutual benefits and how intergenerational partnerships *foster a willingness to cross disciplinary and cultural boundaries to solve problems.*\(^{201}\) LaPorte (1997) specifically notes that “Most research emphasizes the social and psychological benefits of bring generations together...[to] participate in oral history projects, art, music, fitness, and other activities with elders” (p. 1).

This area of interest will only continue to grow and develop as we try to encourage dialogue and interaction between generations. *We cannot overstate the shortsightedness in ignoring the social challenges presented by an aging society. The same can be said if we continue to promote an age-segregated society.*\(^{202}\) Wasserstein (1999) sees the arts as the vehicle to define a generation as well as pass on to the next generation(s): “It seems to me on a very grassroots level, the future of survival of the arts in this country may have something to do with the artists, playwrights, and dancers opening their worlds to the next generation.”


\(^{199}\) Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, Intergenerational #2.

\(^{200}\) Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, Intergenerational #3.


There have been several conferences and initiatives that have focused on this theme in relation to older adult populations, such as:\footnote{203}{Into the 21st Century: Intergenerational programming [On-line] available at http://www.reeusda.gov/4h/ip/intergenerational.htm.}

**International Year of Older Persons, Theme: A Society For All Ages (October 1998)**

By resolution of the United Nations which encourages States, the United Nations system and other actors to take advantage of the Year to increase awareness of the challenge of the demographic aging of societies, the individual and social needs of older persons, their contributions to society, and the need for a change in attitude towards older persons.

Generations United (Alison Frantz, Washington, DC): A national coalition on intergenerational policy, programs and issues. GU provides a forum for those working with children, youth, and the elderly to explore areas of common ground while celebrating the richness of each generation. It publishes a quarterly newsletter, *Together*; a directory of state and local intergenerational coalitions and contacts; and has been designated a national clearinghouse for intergenerational Learn and Serve programs. Currently, the organization has four main thrusts: (1) education, training and technical assistance; (2) public policy and awareness; (3) publications; and (4) the Special Grandparents and Other Relatives Raising Children Project.

The Intergenerational Arts & Education Program (IAEP), GENERATIONS TOGETHER at the University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh, PA 15260: uses the skills of the community's senior master artists in schools and other community settings. The IAEP links artists age 50 and older with teachers or community project supervisors to plan and develop art experiences that develop intergenerational relationships as well as understanding of the artistic process. Artists, representing a variety of visual, literary, and performing arts, work with children and youth in public and private schools and other community settings.\footnote{204}{http://www.gt.pitt.edu/IAEP.htm.}

Also, resource kits have become popular methods to share the success of intergenerational programs. One example is the following multimedia resource key offered by the National Museum of American Art in Washington, DC (1996):

Latin Art & Culture: From the Series "America Past and Present." The video program, "Latino Voices: Artists and Community," features the work of seven contemporary Latino artists living in the United States. Through personal narrative, these artists touch on a range of experiences. The artists talk about the nature of family nurturing and intergenerational relationships; the importance of spontaneity and creativity; the reliance on narrative storytelling and listening skills; the influence
of cultural identity, political realities, and human nature; and the importance of integrating everyday objects and experiences into a strong expression of self.

In addition, an international theme is listed as important under International Association of Gerontology (IAG) Research Agenda on Ageing for the 21st Century for “identification of knowledge gaps and research needed in order to elaborate sound public policy on aging has been a major activity for the IAG.”205 This is an opportunity for the arts. *Art education can connect people, spaces, and communities.*206 Thus, again, respondents call for the need to understand adult learning theories and multi-generational opportunities as our adult population increases.207

For **Marketing (1.25%)**, there were four good ideas shared in the area, however, the group felt that unless there is financial, policy support and there is recognition of the

![Marketing Graph](image)

Figure 4.10: Marketing

importance of adult arts education, the following ideas will be based on situational support. Many respondents considered marketing as an after-thought; the majority of

---

206 Appendix G: The Voting Ballot Responses- Voting Responses (3pts), Intergenerational #1.
207 Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, Intergenerational #3.
conversations focused on policy and implementation of the issue of adult arts education before focusing on marketing. Only one idea received a ranking:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Marketing Ideas</th>
<th>Ranks</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>M</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>#2. Effective marketing of adult learning opportunities by arts organizations and other arts learning venues</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#1. Start national ad campaign to encourage people to watch less television and participate more in local arts opportunities…</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#3. Support of public TV and radio broadcasting</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#4. Educate the public about the arts in their communities. Newspapers can play a big role in this regard.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: f = Frequency; M = Mean; Pts = Total Points

Marketing is also another outlet for creating partnerships – whether that means sharing resources among several arts organizations and/or introducing new programs and projects of mutual interests. Effective marketing allows artists, art educators and art sponsors to find appropriate art partnership programs locally, nationally and world-wide... Events like the 2002 Cultural Olympiad is Salt Lake City are examples of the need for art partnerships to market their artist, art education and art sponsorship offerings. The Administration on Aging (2002) refers to marketing (public education materials, media, and social marketing), after funding and staffing, to be the most important program need for promoting healthy well-being; aging.

The group, again, turns to professional organizations to take a leadership role in gaining attention – ‘to sell the idea’, the value of adult art(s) education. There will be more national and world-wide events in the 21st Century that will need to be carefully developed and marketed by organizations like NAEA LLL Affiliate [National Art Education Association Lifelong Learning Affiliate], etc. Community adult arts

208 Appendix I: The Voting Ballot Responses.
209 Ibid.
programs need to use "marketing strategies that promote the advantages of involvement in educational programs. Testimonies by satisfied participants...may motivate...potential participant[s]. Such publicity also extends to the entire community the value of education for older adults" (Courtenay, 1990, p. 43).

Defining the target market is a key tactic in marketing: *who* [they are] *targeting is also critical; and "we need to target market, especially for the baby boomers as they age.*210 There are multiple avenues for arts organizations to take in marketing their adult programs. In general, "The arts community must invent new ways to attract audiences, apply new technologies, and manage the growth and funding..." (Hiller, 2001, p. 46).

Another critical point referencing the 'generality' of what adults mean: *Often classes are offered to 'adults'...Too general a statement. Who are these adults the organization is targeting.*211 Or, as the literature notes, do they turn to others to define the target market? "...Marketing to older adults is a booming industry...vocabularies that transfigure the life course into market segments and consumer profiles" (Katz, 2001-2, p. 29). Again, collaborations, building of bridges between fields becomes an asset (Katz, 2001-2) "...increasingly more marketing research uses gerontological thinking and proclaims an alliance with it" (p. 30). And the need to provide and market quality programs starts with education: *Do these organizations employ instructors skilled & experience with teaching adult learners?*212 OR are they relying on anti-aging views to promote their programs?

This is another issue that will emerge, without proper training in adult learning and aging

---

210 Appendix G: Round III Responses- Q3 Responses, Marketing #2.
211 Ibid.
212 Ibid.

202
The discussion of the above themes outlines the stakeholders' rounds and their direct thoughts on the issue of adult arts education and how to move it forward. This study's framework and the stakeholders views have relied on 1) interrelating the personal and social development of adults across the lifespan, 2) the influences of social, cultural, and economic environments, and 3) identification of the role of policy in shaping the arts opportunities and outcomes for an aging population in adult education, art education, and educational gerontology. Again, the common themes echo the call to encourage productive, secure, and healthy aging for all in and through the arts in lifelong education.
CHAPTER 5

Summary, Conclusion and Recommendations

SUMMARY

The purpose of this study was to identify the role of the arts in adult lifelong learning and the actions that should be taken to capture the aging adult society. This Delphi study forecasted the role of lifelong learning in the arts in an effort to inform arts policy, arts education and administrative practice based on the view and opinions of national stakeholders. This study is a form of communications policy, in that it starts by evaluating the ‘picture’ of older adult arts education. This study did not look to one viewpoint, or one individual to come to the right answer. This study was a roundtable discussion for sixteen national stakeholders addressing the issue of how we can better serve our aging population through the arts.

The usefulness of this study, in part, is embedded in the process of a round table discussion to highlight the concerns of adult arts education. The large number of responses from the stakeholders, 115 overall, indicates that many welcomed the opportunity to share ideas and expand on this issue. Older adult arts education is a concern for the field, and an area projected for growth in the future. The question is whether or not we will be ready.
To ensure inter-rater reliability, the responses of the stakeholders were coded, defined, and conceptualized within boundaries of the recognized areas of interest to move this issue forward (i.e. Arts’ Role, Art Therapy, Higher Education, etc.). Singularly, the responses have little meaning. However, together, they create the frame, the meaning within this Delphi context of an understanding of the arts and an aging population, and aging within our society.

This research builds on the valuable work to-date on this subject and the framework of community arts. We need to look beyond conventional means in serving adults. We need to arm future arts educators and administrators with the tools to serve adult audiences, the proverbial lifelong learners. As researchers and policy makers in aging proceed in developing complex, multifaceted, and coordinated sets of objectives that provide a qualitative program for many types of persons of later years, the arts need to be involved. Older adults and their needs are one of the key initiatives that federal and state governments must address through evaluation and research of the participants and programs serving them. Thus, the arts need to take a proactive role in facilitating and informing their role in serving all of society.

This study provides a framework of the current status of older adult arts education and its relation to current and future movements in arts and aging policy. In order to move this issue forward this research sought involvement from key stakeholders in the fields contributing to the store of knowledge, including arts education, arts policy, adult education, and gerontology. What is important to take away from this research are the results of the stakeholders’ interaction which define the priorities for future actions and future policy in adult arts education.
CONCLUSIONS

Within the community development movement of the arts, small to medium-sized organizations have become a focus of research and interest – many older adult programs are housed and offered in such local, community-based settings. As researchers start to “inventory” these programs and foundations begin to research cultural participation to improve our communities, it would be ideal to have a policy stance on adult arts education. Adult cultural participation has become a focus for multiple national foundations, as well as local arts organizations, and current research is affecting ‘practices’ at the local and state level. Yet, arts educators and administrators are seldom at the table, nor advising, or in partnership with adult educators and gerontologists in addressing and impacting older adults in communities. In order to be involved, we need to share in the dialogue at multiple levels and address the demographic revolution in aging.

One cannot miss the signs – whether a newspaper, TV special, magazine article (ranging from specific research to everyday popular articles) – of how adult community programs enhance individuals and community well-being.\textsuperscript{213} This is an exciting time of reshaping our later years. Arts education needs to be involved in that process. How we can age better, holistically is being reviewed from multiple points of view. We cannot ignore the fine examples of those aging gracefully that highlight the role of creativity and arts involvement in lifelong education opportunities. For art educators and

\textsuperscript{213} Brief examples from one quick day’s review: O magazine - “Quiet: Grown-ups at play” by K. Weissman (November 2001); Health magazine has written several articles on the importance of staying active, involvement in creative programs. Looking locally, Harden (2002, June 2) Columbus Dispatch, “Dreams fulfilled: In midst of careers, some people turn to art classes for creative satisfaction.” Gettleman (2000, August 14) Columbus Dispatch, “Old standbys: Hollywood’s ‘grays’ defy culture
administrators, it is important to stress our most important asset, the value that the arts bring to adults' lives. A set of standards for lifelong education in the arts should be developed. This is key to addressing the 21st century learners and understanding the multiple needs of diverse adult learners throughout the lifespan.

We know that funding for the arts has a solid impact on several levels. The arts contribute to education, social services, health and the economy within our nation. We need to further partnerships and networks across these areas in order to enhance the benefits of the arts at the community level. As funding increases for preventive health services (improving health and health care in local communities), there is another opportunity for the arts to be involved by providing therapeutic benefits – whether through social engagement or educational – to those facing chronic diseases and/or disabilities. Through the arts, aging individuals can have access to social and educational opportunities. We should engage in networking with health care and arts therapy. We should include discussion of the arts and workforce education beyond high school ages.

Effective strategies are needed today to address the growing challenges and opportunities demographic changes will present. Based on the respondents’ rankings, the following top five recommendations (listed in italics below) capitalize on the current "window of opportunity" for moving the issue of adult arts education forward:

- Recognition of Adult Learners
  Recognize that "older adults" are not a homogenous group and target actions tailored to a wide variety of income levels, educational attainment, cultural backgrounds, health conditions, and previous exposure to the arts.

  It is important that our field, in general, recognize the wide-range of diversity in our growing adult population, and that we arm our future educators and
administrators with an understanding of the multi-demographics of this group. And as stated over and over again, arts education needs to take an active, leadership role in highlighting the value and the role the arts play in our communities' adult populations.

- Higher Education Curriculum

*Arts Education programs in higher education should include courses that prepare arts educators to create, implement, and evaluate programs for adult learners.*

This recommendation is key to addressing and serving our adult population. With the current movement and rising focus on cultural participation and healthy communities, our curricula need to echo the need in the field. As the national agenda looks to "alternate routes" of teacher certification, like Americorps, the Troops to Teachers programs and/or Teach for America, higher education needs to strengthen their current teacher certification curricula to address the changing multi-demographics of our nation. The challenges will only increase for the arts and community arts organizations to increase their potential as active players in community life. We know that older adult arts opportunities offer inquiry, intervention and transformation programs for individuals and for communities. The engagement between the arts and the community continues to be on the rise. We need to address the training of future arts teachers and administrators of the need to increase our lifelong learning focus throughout one's lifespan.

- Leadership Roles

*Set up a series of conferences, local, regional, national and international, on a regular basis, in which the ideas, initiatives, policies and practices of Art Education for adults might be articulated, discussed, evaluated, developed and then delivered in...adults institutions, locally, nationally and world-wide.*

We need to provide outlets for the sharing of information and authentic stories. There are wonderful adult arts education program development sources, as well as solid literature on this subject. However, it has not been brought together, nor presented in an on-going open forum. Whether in research forums or conferences, arts education needs to take the leadership role in educating and training programs for our aging adult population.

- Public Policy

*Policy should be developed at the local, regional, and national levels that affirm the importance of arts education as a life-long learning process. Such policy should specifically mention [address] the importance of the arts to older adults.*

On a whole, we need to readdress our arts policy to enhance lifelong learning for all ages. Older adults are just one group. This study promotes the need to recognize this one group, as well as recognition and support of the overarching goal of a lifelong learning for all ages policy. We know that funding for the arts has a solid impact on growth at the local, state, and federal level. The issue of an
aging society is not going away. Nor is the arts policy focus on the contribution of community arts to meet the educational, social and economic needs of our communities and our nation. This issue will continue to gain momentum and as current research results are shared and other organizations join in training professionals nationwide, such actions will increase the chances for funding streams in community older adults arts programs, as well as heighten the focus of lifelong learning for all ages.

- **Partnerships/Collaborations**
  
  *Specifically, start building a program of partnerships for learning, teaching and practicing in Art Education for Adults, between the widest possible range of public and private agencies and institutions - business, industry and commerce, governments (local, state and federal), banks and financial houses of all kinds, Veterans Organizations, the Defense and Armed Forces, Ethnic Community Organizations and Clubs (especially Rotary, Lions, Buffaloes and Alumni organizations, etc.), with the aim of jointly funding, sponsoring and providing not only Arts Educators in residence but also the building or conversion of older buildings and facilities, into places where Art Education For Adults can be provided and practiced. Use the idea and motto of "Decent Corporate Citizenship".*

This study has provided key partnerships to model and their leadership in addressing older adult arts education. We need to further identify community networks to serve and enhance adult arts education opportunities. Partnerships, collaborations, networks, etc. are key to the movement for lifelong learning in the arts.

With growing political and social forces gearing up for future action on older adults, forecasting the role of the arts provides insight on how to involve the arts at local, state, and federal levels. The arts add to the agendas for enhancing our individual and community lives. The arts contribute to the search for productive lives in older adulthood. This research outlined the emerging themes on this issue and challenges the field to address older adults arts education. The aim of this research was to suggest how we can address older adults and provide lifelong learning arts opportunities. It also highlights the need to focus on aging as a society-wide phenomenon, not just something for older adults. Adult arts education is just one avenue. Arts educators and administrators need be involved in this movement and at the table as research and
practice moves forward on further identifying the role of the arts in our individual and community life.

RECOMMENDATIONS

This research was exploratory in nature and serves to elucidate areas of interest in adult arts education. There are multiple avenues to be examined in adult arts education. The following are recommendations that have resulted due to this research.

- Arts education needs to broaden its definition of lifelong learning. We are not just promoting future audiences, but future participants at multiple levels. We need to focus on all ages. We must recognize the diverse needs of diverse adult learners, as well as the numerous venues where we encounter community arts education offerings. The quality of offerings is based on our acceptance and embracing of the value of community arts programs and education.

- There is a need for an update on the resources and literature available on this issue. There are valuable resources that are unavailable or unknown. Creation of a guidebook for the literature is ideal. Most of the literature reviews are in need of updating and utilizing a multi-disciplinary approach.

- There is a definite need to highlight quality programs that provide training for older adults arts educators and administrators.

- There needs to be a certification for adult art education.

- There is a need to create and promote higher education curriculum models for certification students addressing adult learning themes and older adults arts education program models.

- There is a need to network and share valuable data that correlates arts education and gerontology. There is a disconnect currently between arts educators and gerontologists. Both are talking about this issue, but often not together. Bridge-building between these two fields is crucial at this stage.

- There is a need to connect with workforce education. With the adult education focus on workforce development through partnerships and collaborations with the arts, arts education seems a natural and progressive step. There are several recent reports that highlight the impact for K-12, but they do not address adults and older adults.

- There is a need for research on the long-term affects of involvement in arts education informal, community programs. How has it transformed or impacted
lives? We need hard empirical data on adult art education programs.

- There is a need for research on community based adult models versus the children models we use for adult programs in the field.

- There is a need to identify community development and arts funders that have interest in this area, as well as to highlight key funders that support aging issues but have not been approached by the arts.

- There is a need to provide authentic stories about lifelong learning in the arts and promote at the grassroots level. There are some wonderful examples in the literature, but often they are not made available to future educators and administrators. Again, this highlights the need to provide key resources in accessible forms, whether it be databases or publications.

- There is a need to be more involved in community movements on aging, including connections with government departments and partnerships in research. We need to get involved to share the value of the arts for our aging population. Often it is one individual’s interest and work that keeps such programs alive. If we take a multi-disciplinary approach, there are more options for sharing, networking, and raising support and awareness of the arts’ benefits.

This study has provided insight into the field and stakeholders’ views on adult arts education. The above recommendations provide guidance and a path that build upon current arts and cultural policy and aging policy. We must consider the role and function of arts education in relation to our current adult population trends that affect the relationship between the arts community and the general public.
LIST OF REFERENCES


Crews, D. (forthcoming), title undetermined. Anthropology Department, The Ohio State University.


Faure, E. et al. (1972). *Learning to be; The world of education today and tomorrow.* Paris: UNESCO.


NCOA. (1981, February 1-3). *Policy symposium on the arts, the humanities and older Americans*. Mini-conference for the 1981 White House Conference on Aging,
Sponsored by National Endowment for the Humanities and the National Endowment for the Arts, Philadelphia, PA.


President's Committee on the Arts and Humanities. (1992). *The value of the arts.* Washington, DC: PCAH.

President's Committee on the Arts and Humanities. (1997). *Creative America.* Washington, DC: PCAH.


229
Series Title: Higher Education Policy, No. 44. NY: Adult, Career, and Vocational Education Clearinghouse.


Yoshitomi, J. (2000). *New fundamentals and practices to increase cultural participation and develop new audiences*. Author.

APPENDIX A: DELPHI ROUNDS TIMELINE
START
Pre Letter invitation from Hutchens & myself
Include:
- Study abstract & Delphi intro
- Study model
- Consent form
- Return envelope

October 8;10

Initial email w/Delphi Questionnaire 1
Include:
- Hutchens email (3 days prior?)
- Study abstract & Delphi intro
- Study model
- Consent forms?

October 28

Delphi 1 & 2
- Delphi Q1 returned by November 10
- Q2 sent

November 20

Delphi 2 & 3
- Delphi Q2 returned by December 10
- Q3 sent

January 7

Delphi 3 & Final Voting Results
- Q3 returned
- Voting Results sent

January 25; February 8

Follow-ups to return Q1 w/email 11/08; 11/13

Follow-ups to return Q2 w/email 12/11

Follow-ups to return Q3 w/email 2/2

FINISH
Final Voting Results
- Voting Results returned
- Final Votes shared with group
- Data collection completed
- Data Analysis started
APPENDIX B: ADVISOR’S PRE-NOTICE LETTER
October 8, 2001

Address

Dear ____________:

A few days from now you will receive via service mail a request to participate in an important research project being conducted by one of my Art Education doctoral candidates, Sue Anne Lafferty.

The research project concerns the role of the arts in the every day life of adults and how the arts community might further address our aging society. I am writing in advance to alert you to the study and ask for your participation. This study is an important one that will help agencies, programs, etc. at the local, state and national levels to understand policy connections to involve the arts in quality of life issues addressing our aging society.

Thank you for your time and consideration. It is only with the generous help of people like you that our research can be successful.

Sincerely,

James W. Hutchens
Professor and Chair
APPENDIX C: INVITATION LETTER; PACKET: INTRODUCTION TO STUDY, CONSENT FORM, AND GEOGRAPHIC AND PROFESSIONAL ROLE FORM
October 10, 2001

Dear ------:

Due to your expertise in _________, a fellow colleague has recommended that you become a participant in my dissertation study on older adults and the arts: *Adult Arts Education, A Delphi Study Forecasting the Role of the Arts in a Lifelong Learning Society*. I have included a one-page rationale on my study and the research method for a brief introduction to the issue. Upon receipt of your consent form to participate, an in-depth packet with the initial questionnaire will be sent to you.

This Delphi process will involve three rounds of questionnaires – each round lasting two to three weeks. After each round, all participants will receive anonymous responses from the group, and have an opportunity to expand on each idea. The final and third questionnaire will be a rating of the ideas expressed by the group to identify general consensus of the group on the five top key issues of older adults and the arts. Each round will be sent via e-mail, with a choice of returning the questionnaire by e-mail or mail. Again, all of your responses will be shared anonymously from each round. Upon receipt of the initial round, a number will be assigned to each participant and will appear on all of the data collected. There will be no matching of names of participants with the data they provide.

Each round should not take more than 20 to 30 minutes to complete, depending on how involved you would like to be. For the total process, it is estimated that completion, with full results, will be in three months. I have chosen you due to your interests, involvement in the arts, adult education and/or gerontology. Thus, I believe you will find value in the process and in providing your view to impact future policy.

I have attached three items: 1) *Rationale for Study & Delphi Method*; 2) *Official Consent Form*; and 3) *Geographic Region & Professional Role Form* -- please return the consent form and the region & professional form back to me as soon as possible in the enclosed stamp-addressed envelope.

I look forward to your input and participation. If you have any questions, feel free to contact me at (614) 783-8163 or by e-mail, lafferty.16@osu.edu.

Thank you in advance for your cooperation,

Sue Anne Lafferty
PhD Candidate, Art Education Department

P.S. Upon completion of this study, each participant will receive a small token of appreciation.
Adult Arts Education: A Delphi Study Forecasting the Role of the Arts in a Lifelong Learning Society

As the aging population continues to affect the leisure learning market, this Delphi forecasting study, will provide insight into arts initiatives for an aging society. The anonymous Delphi -- a qualitative forecasting method that is a structured group process that outlines the pros and cons of an issue, with the goal of identifying priorities of personal values and social goals -- will be sent to 30 stakeholders in arts policy, arts education policy, and gerontology, who have been chosen due to experience in their field, literature review, and recommendation by their peers. The data collected from this group will provide insight into the characteristics and identify, if any, future predictions of local, state, and national initiatives of adult arts education. As we enter the twenty-first century, we are engaged in a wide-ranging process of redefining the character of the arts’ common purpose. The door is open for the arts to become an important ingredient in the public purpose by involving the many adult learners of the twenty-first century. In order to take advantage of this opportunity, lifelong learning in the arts beyond K-12 education must be redefined.

Delphi Method

The normal process of the Delphi Method includes four phases:

1) Exploration of subject;
2) Identification of group views on this issue agreements & disagreements;
3) Exploration and evaluation of disagreements; and
4) Analysis of all information and evaluations fed back to group for further consideration.

The main goal of the process is to keep the original study's objective of gaining the most reliable ‘general agreement’ of the group of experts. As the Delphi forecasting tool is an open-ended framework that facilitates the negotiations of realities, it is hoped that this process of inquiry, the data can be conceptualized into the right model to inform the field and decision-making.

For the final questionnaire, participants will use the Nominal Group Technique “voting”. Each participant identifies the top 5 ideas and assigns points (5-1: 5 being most promising, best idea to 1 being least). Votes are returned to me, tallied, and results are reported (rank order of ideas based on total number of points received showing the number of people who voted for each, etc). Thus, using this method, it is possible to develop a theoretical framework based on experts' vision, multiple perspectives, and comprehensive insight to address lifelong learning in the arts: to identify alternative ways of viewing the situation at hand that may arise in developing new policy.

For further information contact:
Sue Anne Lafferty, PhD Candidate
Art Education Department, The Ohio State University
PO Box 141436
Columbus, OH 43214
Telephone: 614.783-8163 and 614.451.8733 (ph/fax)
lafferty.16@osu.edu

240
October 10, 2001

Protocol Number #_________

CONSENT FOR PARTICIPATION IN RESEARCH

I consent to participating in research entitled: *Adult Arts Education: A Delphi Study Forecasting the Role of the Arts in a Lifelong Learning Society*

Sue Anne Lafferty, Co-Investigator, has explained the purpose of the study, the procedures to be followed, and the expected duration of my participation. Possible benefits of the study have been described, as have alternative procedures, if such procedures are applicable and available.

I acknowledge that I have had the opportunity to obtain additional information regarding the study and that any questions I have raised have been answered to my full satisfaction. Furthermore, I understand that I am free to withdraw consent at any time and to discontinue participation in the study without prejudice to me.

Finally, I acknowledge that I have read and fully understand the consent form. I sign it freely and voluntarily. A copy has been given to me.

Date__________________  Signed__________________________

E-mail____________________

Signed_____________________
(Principal and/or Co-Investigator)  *A signed and dated copy was returned to each participant

Please return with the Geographic Region & Professional Role Form in the enclosed envelope to:
Sue Anne Lafferty, PhD Candidate
Art Education Department, The Ohio State University
PO Box 141436
Columbus, OH 43214

241
Geographic and Professional Role Form

Subject #

Please place an X on the line in front of the response(s) that best describes how you perceive yourself.

Professional Role

___ Arts Administrator, Community Development, Education
___ Arts Administrator, Business, Service
___ Arts Educator
___ Arts Philanthropist, Funder
___ Consultant
___ Gerontologist
___ Foundation -- Program Manager, Director
___ Adult Educator
___ Older Adult
___ Other

Geographic Region

___ Mountain (Arizona, Colorado, Idaho, Montana, Nevada, New Mexico, Utah, Wyoming)
___ Pacific (Alaska, California, Hawaii, Oregon, Washington)
___ New England (Connecticut, Maine, Massachusetts, New Hampshire, Rhode Island, Vermont)
___ Middle Atlantic (New Jersey, New York, Pennsylvania)
___ South Atlantic (Delaware, District of Columbia, Florida, Georgia, Maryland, North Carolina, South Carolina Virginia, West Virginia)
___ West South Central (Arkansas, Louisiana, Oklahoma, Texas)
___ East South Central (Alabama, Kentucky, Mississippi, Tennessee)
___ East North Central (Illinois, Indiana, Michigan, Ohio, Wisconsin)
___ West North Central (Iowa, Kansas, Minnesota, Missouri, Nebraska, North Dakota, South Dakota)

Please return with your consent form in the enclosed envelope to:

Sue Anne Lafferty, PhD Candidate
Art Education Department, The Ohio State University
PO Box 141436
Columbus, OH 43214
APPENDIX D: DESCRIPTION OF STAKEHOLDERS ROLES
AND GEOGRAPHIC REGION
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REGION</th>
<th>Arts Administrator, Community, Development, Education</th>
<th>Arts Administrator, Business, Service</th>
<th>Arts Educator</th>
<th>Geriatrics</th>
<th>Foundation Program Manager, Director</th>
<th>Adult Educator</th>
<th>Older Adult, Retired</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mountain</td>
<td></td>
<td>00043a</td>
<td>00039</td>
<td>00050</td>
<td>00055</td>
<td>00043b</td>
<td></td>
<td>00043b Arts Philanthropist, Funder, Consultant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pacific</td>
<td>00036</td>
<td>00044</td>
<td>00042</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New England</td>
<td>00038</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle Atlantic</td>
<td>00056</td>
<td>00040</td>
<td>00046</td>
<td></td>
<td>00046</td>
<td>00040b</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Atlantic</td>
<td>00037</td>
<td>00035</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>00035b</td>
<td>00035b</td>
<td></td>
<td>00035b – Artist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West South Central</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East South Central</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East North Central</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>00051</td>
<td>00052</td>
<td></td>
<td>00053</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West North Central</td>
<td></td>
<td>00034</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX E: DELPHI PILOT OUTCOMES
DELPHI PILOT OUTCOMES

Cognitive:
- Arts education reinforces the idea that one is never too old to try something new.
- Helps to keep adults brains active – with is critical in their maintaining their memory and functionality.
- The arts serve as a connection to the higher power of creativity.
- Use of Arts to stimulate cognitive processes in older adults to maintain and/or revitalize memory and other brain function.
- The arts are a powerful tool for keeping older adults active and mentally alert.
- The arts allow adults to be actively engaged in a learning process.
- Learning is a skill that needs to be maintained, arts programs can be one way to aid in this process.

Marketing/Audience Development:
- Find new ways to publicize and encourage them to join classes in music, art, crafts, dance, etc. -- some of the teachers will be found within their own groups.
- Expand marketing and publicity of arts programs. Advertise in publications frequently read by older adults. Post marketing collateral in locations older adults frequent. Be sure assisted-living facilities receive information about arts programs so they can distribute the information to residents.
- Even though all such activities are advertised…some are canceled for lack of sign-up.
- Residences for older adults should post arts events in the community and offer bus transportation to those who are interested in attending.
- Theaters and museums could offer package deals to older adult residences that enable discounted tickets as well as group transportation to the event. (They probably already do this)

Participation: Incentives & Barriers:
- Older adults have a responsibility to keep the arts alive; must be made aware of this responsibility.
- You must first overcome feelings of inferiority, a feeling of "I can't" because of age and/or little training in the arts.
- Remember that many older adults on a fixed income do not have money or transportation, especially at night, to concerts, museums, etc.
- Senior-friendly modes of transportation should be offered or coordinated by the arts provider.
- Need to offer a wide variety of multi-disciplinary classes for older adults in “senior-friendly” locations. (senior centers, senior daycare facilities, libraries)

Programs:
Main Themes include:
1. Access/Technology
   - Set up computer classes geared to older adults with older teachers who will proceed slowly.
   - Universities and community arts programs could also incorporate distance learning in their arts education classes, enabling those recovering from illness or who are chronically ill to participate. Market these programs to long-term care and assisted living facilities.

2. Intergenerational
   - Additional programming linking older adults to school children (in an art-based setting)
• Relationships with young people could be fostered through a mentoring program of adults who have experiences in the arts such as one on one mentoring in art, music, dance, and writing.
• Guest lectures by Seniors in schools.
• Debates by Seniors and high school students on the merits of individual artists or schools of art, or authors, etc.
• Offer a program to students to go to senior homes and introduce art to them…
• Initiatives to encourage more young adults to become involved in arts education for mature adults.

iii. Models/Examples
• Local arts agencies produce more concerts and exhibitions that showcase the artistic talents of seniors.
• Feature different artists’ work at older adult residences. Display various pieces and ask the artist to come in to speak to the residents.
• Use high-quality programs for older adults from across the country as models or case studies.
• Older adult communities could form “Art clubs” much like book clubs – where each member studies the work of a particular genre or artist on his/her own time and then the group gathers to offer interpretations in a fun, social setting.
• Tuition vouchers
• Joint classes for Seniors and children (How about Grandparent/Grandchild art classes or beginning tap dancing or music appreciation?)
• More colleges and universities should make free tuition available for older adults. (Arkansas does, but few know about it.)
• Initiatives to provide supplies in retirement communities
• Audio Books for the sight impaired with discussion groups coordinated by the library
• Music appreciation lectures to dove-tail with the local orchestras offerings
• Exhibits featuring older adults who are already legitimate artists (there are MANY photographers in their 70’s and 80’s – recent article in Esquire).
• Offer on-site hands-on arts activities – painting, ceramics, drawing and music courses – at assisted living residences (or at least advertise these classes to older adults).
• Multi-generational projects that allow seniors to “tell their story”

iv. Program Development
• Define ways to reach older adults through libraries, churches, Great Decisions programs, gourmet cooking classes, investment clubs, etc.
• Already might offer this: college/summer programs for the elderly in art appreciation or something similar…they might take a course if they new it was elderly only.
• Foster stronger respect for the variety of programming needed to serve the diverse age range of older adults.
• The great majority (see Lamdin, p. 78) prefer libraries, churches, social clubs and hospital learning centers over senior citizen centers.
• Incorporate arts programming into elder care.
• Role models for the arts education – how to learn/listen
• Offer music appreciation and art history courses at older adult facilities.
• Education for the general public regarding benefits of arts education to elders
• Lifelong learning programs should become a standard part of course offerings at universities, enabling older adults to learn in a comfortable environment with students of all ages. These programs are probably a welcome alternative to auditing undergraduate courses, usually tailored to 20-year-old students.
Hands-on seminars for the aged by artists in the community
Make opportunities to learn about and experience the arts.
Communities, with awareness and training, can offer more to older adults by designing courses in Adult Ed and Community colleges that speak directly to this population; and then marketing those programs so Seniors are aware of them.
Also, remember that many retirees will not admit that they are older adults, and they despise the term "senior citizens," but they do need new interests.
Construction of Arts Education Centers (perhaps specifically for older adults)
Individual programs tailored for specific groups (economic/educational/interests)
Development of arts education programming in community centers. Adults could serve as tutors with younger generations.
Remember that older adults may seem to learn more slowly, but we simply learn in different ways (Wisdom?)
Book Clubs and discussions with a mixed population but involving Seniors in the planning and leadership.
Not all age at the same rate, so don't stereotype us. Need to devise different approaches for differing groups.
Initiatives to provide instruction in retirement communities

Professional Development:
Future teachers – older adults teach under children

Public Policy:
More support for the arts – political/financial
Incorporate arts education into quality of life debate.
Better quality of life – understand visual culture
Initiatives to encourage artistic expression by the aged (particularly expressing issues pertinent to the aged)
Need to change funders views about their role in funding arts activities for older adults.
Offer incentives (i.e. more money) to publicly-funded arts organizations that pay particular attention to attracting an older adult population.
Scholarship money

Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning (Values):
Promote senior artists as role models.
Appreciation of the arts improves quality of life (for every age--not only older adults).
Promote social interaction to decrease depression in older adults through adult arts educational programs.
The arts are diverse and allow adult learners to select the type of art that is appealing to them.
Arts activities give older adults a purpose and something to look forward to.
Older adults can become involved in the arts through volunteer activities (docents, guides, ticket takers, etc.), as well as participating creatively.
Multi-generational projects that allow seniors to "tell their story".
The arts are a readily available resource that people working with adults can utilize without major resource allocations.
Arts education helps to keep older adults actively involved in their communities.
In this modern age of technology, when books are being replaced by computer screens it seems even more important to focus on the arts.

248
APPENDIX F: FINAL TOP FIVE VOTES
**Final Top 5 Votes** The following are the top five votes based on the frequency of ranks stakeholders assigned out of the total Round III 76 ideas:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Most Promising Idea</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Ranks for this idea</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1st</td>
<td><strong>Idea #2. (THEME: Defining Adults, Older Adults)</strong> Recognize that “older adults” are not a homogenous group and target actions tailored to a wide variety of income levels, educational attainment, cultural backgrounds, health conditions, and previous exposure to the arts.</td>
<td>5, 5, 3, 3, 3, 2, 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2nd</td>
<td><strong>Idea #1. (THEME: Public Policy)</strong> Policy should be developed at the local, regional, and national levels that affirm the importance of arts education as a life-long learning process. Such policy should specifically mention the importance of the arts to older adults.</td>
<td>5, 5, 5, 4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2nd</td>
<td><strong>Idea #4. (THEME: Higher Education/Professional Development, Organs.)</strong> Set up a series of conferences, local, regional, national and international, on a regular basis, in which the ideas, initiatives, policies and practices of Art Education for adults might be articulated, discussed, evaluated, developed and then delivered in Art Education for adults institutions, locally, nationally and world-wide.</td>
<td>5, 4, 3, 2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2nd</td>
<td><strong>Idea #2. (THEME: Higher Education/Professional Development, Organs.)</strong> Arts Education programs in higher education should include courses that prepare arts educators to create, implement, and evaluate programs for adult learners.</td>
<td>4, 3, 2, 2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2nd</td>
<td><strong>#2. (Partnerships) Start building a program of partnerships for learning, teaching and practising in Art Education for Adults, between the widest possible range of public and private agencies and institutions - business, industry and commerce, governments (local, state and federal), banks and financial houses of all kinds, Veterans Organisations, the Defense and Armed Forces, Ethnic Community Organisations and Clubs (especially Rotary, Lions, Buffaloes and Alumni organisations, etc.), with the aim of jointly funding, sponsoring and providing not only Arts Educators in residence but also the building or conversion of older buildings and facilities, into places where Art Education For Adults can be provided and practiced. Use the idea and motto of &quot;Decent Corporate Citizenship&quot;.</strong></td>
<td>3, 2, 2, 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX G: ROUND III RESPONSES – QUESTIONNAIRE 3
FINAL RESPONSES
Defining Adults, Older Adult Art Education

#1. Adult learners: who are they? Ages! Abilities! This needs to be addressed – acknowledging diversity is very critical in working with adults! (50 adults vs. 50 4th graders: more diversity in adult group than in youth of 9-10 year age groups).
Clarification if any:
- 00035 Yes!
Strengths:
- 00043 More varied adult backgrounds permit a greater variety of expression.
Weaknesses:
- 00043 In such a diverse adult group, it may be more difficult to stimulate, motivate to ‘create’ art work that is personal and meaningful.

#2. Recognize that “older adults” are not a homogenous group and target actions tailored to a wide variety of income levels, educational attainment, cultural backgrounds, health conditions, and previous exposure to the arts
Clarification, if any:
- As mentioned above, older adults are more than a homogeneous group. We need to explore effective ways of niche marketing in the arts for them as well.
- Another part of the broader framework has to do with the ways in which older adults are perceived and valued in contemporary society. Older adult arts education can be marginalized/isolated in senior centers and nursing homes. It should be integrated across society. What will be the impact of the population of older adults reaching “critical mass”?
- Although we use the term "older adults" as though they are a homogeneous group I believe that time has increased the variation among them. For example, some are already deeply involved in the arts. They visit galleries and museums collect art, attend lectures, read about art, enjoy traveling with Sister Wendy, etc. Others may have come to the erroneous conclusion early in life that they have no talent for art. I believe that the capacity for artistic expression in some context and form is universal.* As with all learners we start with where he or she is and build upon it.
- 00035 This is my experience! Even those with entrenched idea that they are not artistic can achieve satisfying results with encouragement.
Strengths:
- And that we need to plan for the baby boomers and how they will age as well
- Critically important in any marketing effort
- Yes, art is an individual thing and teaching art to people should be individualized as much as possible. You may take one subject but everyone may view it differently according to their background. That is why teaching is so much fun. Well, one of the reasons!
- 00046 Important!
- Necessary starting point
- *Very important not to consider older adults a homogeneous group, not only in terms of arts participation, but also educational attainment, income, cultural background, etc.
- 00035 VERY TRUE!
- 00046 Very important!
Right!
*00040 All excellent!

Weaknesses:
- *00040 Missing: How to inspire boomers re: they will age as much as they fight the idea!
- *00043 Do not let that deter you as the teacher but view it as being more exciting.
- *00046 How can we develop and then offer an organized course to teach art to adults – offering to all adults!

#3. The range of artistic background, sensitivity, and skill within a group of older adults is likely to be considerable. Their teachers need to understand how to bring out whatever lies dormant within and to introduce techniques and materials that are appropriate to the learner’s capacities and to the idea and affect the person is trying to express. Focusing on the (*00042 add “variety”) aspirations of the learner (*00042 add “among learners”) and helping them to achieve her/him goal is not an easy way to teach but it is the essence of the experience.

Clarification, if any:
- Older adults are individual and should not be thought of as a group that is alike or similar. By the time you are an older adult, you really are unique since no two people have the same experiences in life. So work with individuals and listen to them. Don’t tell them but listen to them and go with what they are telling you into some sort of motivation that is just for them.
*00043 I also think this is true in teaching 4th graders or at any age level.

Strengths:
- Good points
- Learner focused
- Addresses that teaching adults with diverse backgrounds is difficult to do well
- Learner centeredness an important approach in adult education
*00035 Yes!
*00043 We need to call this “meeting the needs of the student” – all teachers should take into consideration the students/students they are teaching
- *00040 Yes!

Weaknesses:
- This is very individualized *00040 That’s okay! *00043 Why is that a weakness?
- That is the only way to go if you want them to do personal and creative art work. Why do you say "her"? There are men who are retired and can do art work too!
*00042 Right on!
*00040 Could use he/she *00042 his is the response for “him” – let’s use “them”

The Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning

#1. Provide ways and means of enabling adults and older people (AOP) to start off, continue and expand learning, making and appraising activities of Art Education for Adults.

Clarification, if any:
- Community art centers should be encouraged to hire teachers who can design quality programs for senior adults. *00035…that include opportunities for older adults to learn and to teach (through their art)
• *00043 Here is where the art teacher must be sensitive to the learning and very knowledgeable of the field of art and quite creative in the approach to teaching.

Strengths:
• Excellent re: learning about art as well as doing

Weaknesses:
• Vague *00042 Why is this vague??
• This is usually done in rest homes and retirement facilities for older adults. An art specialist/teacher is needed here who can motivate, inspire, and get the older people involved in creating art. Far too often from what I have seen is a copy crafts approach such as making a quilt design just like some one else's. Bad, Bad!
• *00040 We must educate administrators about this problem!
• *00043 It's difficult to find teachers who can teach adults – or rest homes are not willing to pay for excellent teachers!

#2. Encouragement of adult arts learning as part of religious activities

Clarification, if any:
• Churches could become supporters of art programming for elders within their church communities. *00035 That is where large groups of older adults come to learn, socialize and worship – an excellent environment for art programming.
• *00040 Questionable – leave religion out!
• *00042 Change “religious” to community – for example, “in civic organizations, churches, etc.”

Strengths:
• An area of great potential development
• As a devote and active evangelical – I have helped arts learning in this way in my parish. Iconography/art history/symbolism, etc. can be a good beginning before visits of adults to art museums, and shrine arts
• Arts and religion much more strongly connected early in human history than they are now – brings us back full circle! Ties into the current spirituality movement.
• Yes, so much of art was commissioned by the church
• *00043 Art teachers may use this strong connection as a means of stimulation/motivation. Here is an interest that all have, so may be as adults in this group, who have a common element!

Weaknesses:
• *00040 Go beyond churches – synagogues, mosques
• *00042 I think we have to tread carefully. Muslims and Jews do not use representational art in their places of worship.
• *00043 What if atheists? As some ACLU folks seem to be when they pushed God out of schools, etc.

#3. Many if not most of the statements about the role of arts education are true across the life span, not just for older adults. Although targeted marketing is important to widen participation, it should be done within the ‘big picture’ context of the life-span continuum.

Clarification, if any:
• There is definitely a conflict between arts education and adult (or older adult) arts education. Is it the same (arts education is the same across the lifespan) or different (adults and older adults have special gifts, requirements, etc.)? Does this “trickle down” (or up!) principle apply (i.e. that you strengthen and improve adult arts education by strengthening and improving arts education)? *00042 This statement is not clear to me??

Strengths:
• *00035 Yes, most of the basic principles of quality art education teaching apply, but principles of adult education and gerontology should also be incorporated.
• *00040 Yes!
• *00042 As in all learning experiences, the curriculum must be attuned to the learner(s).
• *00043 The principles of design (harmony, unity, balance) etc. are applicable whenever art is created at any age!

Weaknesses:
• *00043 No weakness here -- art is for all people -- cradle to the grave!

#4. Reading all of these ideas, it occurs to me that there are multiple definitions for what we consider “art.” Why have humans made art throughout our existence? Judgments of quality or aesthetic value seem inextricably linked to economic value in contemporary society. Or is art about something in the human spirit that must be expressed? Answers to these questions would seem to me to provide the framework within which arts education is provided.

Clarification, if any:
• *00042 He who pays the piper calls the tune. When the Catholic church was wealthy and powerful, they employed the best artists. When the royalty, mobility and wealthy commoners could afford to hire artists the artist painted what they were paid to paint...
• *00043 My definition of art is the same for any age, but involves thinking, feelings, perceptions in a creative and harmonious way in its part of the person creating art. Economics come into play for adults who can afford to purchase objects of high aesthetic qualities.

Strengths:
• *00035 For many frail elders, art is not about making a beautiful object, but about process and self-expression.

Weaknesses:

#5. Regardless of whether this is an "aging society," adult arts education is part of the continuum of lifelong learning and development

Clarification, if any:
• Arts education should be a part, etc
• Arts learning is a lifelong pursuit
• Very important that arts education be connected, not isolated by age level
  *00035 Good!
  *00046 Yes -- very important!

Strengths:
• Good point
• Emphasis on adult arts education
• Positive attitude! Arts and those engaging with them are both ageless!
• Agreed
• Central Idea
  *00040 Above good!
  *00043 The above strengths are Right on!
• Comprehensive statement but negates demographic prognosis input to our nations population @ 2003 *00043 No -- this applies to all people of the world. We are all human beings!
• Howard Gardner’s work with Project Zero indicates that there are at least 9 IQ types. Five of these involve adult art education activities for lifelong learning & development.

255
Weaknesses:
- Too general, it needs to acknowledge 2003 demographics projections! But can fall into the category of “the arts need external justification” or practical purpose – a dangerous area! *00043 We may study the arts of various cultures but that does not mean art is different for the underserved who makes art. It still involves thinking, feeling, perception, skill, harmony, regardless of the culture – some cultures put guidelines and rules on their art expression.
- Adult arts education is not necessarily part of growing old but it should be since we all are concerned with art/design whether we know it or not. We are using art/design sensitivity whenever we select one thing in preference to another such as clothes, cars, furniture, and even sometimes our food. *00040 Important! *00043 Very true!

#6. Art adds life to the years by encouraging self-expression, finding emotional release, seeking powerful expressions from stories or socializing with others. Art adds life to our years allowing us to be alive as long as we are alive.
Clarification, if any:
- Justification
  *00035 Right on! This has been my experience in 10 years of teaching older adults!
  *00042 You might not live “longer” if you are involved with art, but your life will be “richer”
Strengths:
- Yes, as formulated by the Gerontological Society of America
- Addresses aging persons
- Very true—if you are able to get people to start doing art and not be afraid and understanding what it involves.
- You have got to find motivation and a reason to live. You have got to find a GLORY or a Hallelujah Chorus in the soul of you…Listen to the music of Handell or view the work of van Gogh… You can feel energy in them.

Weaknesses:
- A bit precious
- Unsubstantiated claim
- Emotional reliance?
  *00040 Remove the above weaknesses – Need to work educating administrators about this missing link
  *00043 Whoever stated the above weaknesses does not really understand what art involves and has not really expressed him or her if they tried to do art. Art work is like saying what you think, feel, perceive – expressed in the work.

#7. It supports the idea of self-expression as a need throughout life — particularly in the second half of life.
Clarification, if any:
- Delete “particularly, etc” and use “from birth to death” or “from womb to tomb”
  *00035 Yes! *00040 “from womb to tomb” is my term for it *00043 I agree!
- Delete “particularly….” *00040 Yes! *00043 I agree!
- Arts education gives older adults an opportunity to express their own aesthetic sensibilities, putting into concrete form what they deem to be beautiful* and important.
  *00043 Change “beautiful” to “meaningful, harmonious”
Strengths:
- Excellent, needs to be emphasized *00035 Yes! *00043 I agree!

256
As adults mature, self-acknowledgement becomes more focused & critical for individual mental health (“What’s really important for me?”) There are lots of citations of this.

Self-discovery is the most important part of life. Erickson and others argue DEVELOPMENTAL TASKS that can require decades of effort. It is in the second half of life that things make sense. *(00043 I can’t agree with that!)* It is argued that life makes no sense from day to day; but, only when it is reviewed in retrospect does it make sense and provide a pattern for someone.

Weaknesses:

- Limits arts education to self-expression  
  *(00042 Can we find a more inclusive term for the art experience?)*  
  *(00043 Isn’t it the expression of the artist? Therefore, self-expression? Both arts education and self-expression involve knowing a bit of art history, aesthetics, and being able to talk about all of these in relation to a creative work of art & self-expression!)*  
  *(00044 Self-expression is a* needed*thing through one’s life. I think no more or less important in early, middle, or later years. *00040 True! *00042 Take out “a” and “thing”)*  
- Assumptions of “seniority” i.e. all “society” is aging...so does this issue refer to 40+, 50+, 60+ (*00040 and 110+*)-- what “aged” group is being addressed? And why for which age group?  
  *(00042 Retirement age – whatever that is in individuals. *00043 All ages!)*  
- All aspects of creative art are self-expressive and we need to express our thoughts and feelings for good mental health. However, very few people do this via creative art work but they do it mostly via choosing things based upon their ideas and feelings about what is good and bad.  
  *(00043 I agree!)*

#8. Involvement in art/craft activities provide a means for creative expression, exploration of various materials and concepts, development of one’s perception and art knowledge, the expression of one’s feelings, and development of aesthetic taste and avoid being bored! It gives them a goal, something to do.*

Clarification, if any:

- Remove “the” before expression...last part: It OFFERS a goal...something VALUABLE* to do  
  *(00035 Right! Meaningful... *00040 Yes! Make changes!)*  
  *(00043 Why? Leave as is.)*  
- *(00042 This phrase “something to do” trivializes the experience – Remove it)*  
- *(00043 This is great!)*

Strengths:

- Central Idea  
  *(00044 Retirement means for many, a breathing space to indulge in one’s put-off wishes...“I want to learn to draw landscapes” is one...)*  
- Yes, art activities can accomplish all of these goals.

Weaknesses:

- Emphasis on self-expression  
  *(00042 The term used above is “creative” not “self”)*  
  *(00043 No that is part of making art. Do not take the individual out of the art. All great artists express themselves.)*  
- This is somewhat therapeutic approach, and we are not just talking about arts and crafts  
  *(00043 All creative acts are somewhat therapeutic – make you feel good.)*  
- Hello!! Most of our next generation of seniors are going to be more intelligent and better educated than the last generation of seniors.
*00040 Who says? Baloney! Why demean age this way?
*00043 You mean have more knowledge? That may be so...

#9. Arts education can help older adults develop new methods of expression or "voice" with which to engage in meaning making and integration of life experiences*
Clarification, if any:
- Arts education brings beauty into the lives of elders* who have leisure time to spend with works of art.
- *00035 Yes! Art can facilitate life review
- *00040 Use "people" not elders!
Strengths:
- Well-put
- Agreed
- Acknowledges many adults in later years need to ‘give’/’share’/’help’
- Visual arts require the older adult to make aesthetic decisions regarding color, form, figures, background, etc. These are formative in the early sessions and summative in the final stages of the art education project. *00043 Adults must make aesthetic decisions all their lives in selecting clothing, furniture, cars, etc.
Weaknesses:
- “Meaning making” unclear in this short statement
- Right, but many will need much help/encouragement in the beginning. *00043 True, and so do some school children!

#10. In our diverse society, arts can serve as a bridge over the chasm of cultural misunderstanding and appreciation. Helps us better appreciate our shared heritage. Reminds us that we’ve been through challenging times before and not only survived them, but found meaning in them.
Clarification, if any:
- Justification for arts education but vague, re: adult learning  *00043 Why? Can do this at any age and it helps to understand other cultures
- It honors older adults as the keepers and preservers of cultures and traditions.
- Arts education provides elders with opportunities to pass on their wisdom.
  *00035 Important!
  *00043 Art does this at any age
Strengths:
- Good point
- In our “youth-oriented” culture, we often forget the tremendous role seasoned artists and practitioners can play in illumining our cultural traditions and in passing them along to other generations. It also shows that age has its own beauty and depth.
- How important
- Yes! *****
- Yes, if they are able to express their culture and traditions visually. *00043 If not visually, it is not visual art we are teaching!
- Nicely put
- Broadens focus on arts education
- Totally agree
- Agreed, strengthens diversity through the arts
- Address “current” fear issues for all Americans
The cultural Olympiad is a wonderful part of the 2002 Winter Games. Ice sculpture, music, dance, visual arts, etc. tell the cultural and historical stories of mankind from all NATIONS & CULTURES. *00043 Great!

Weaknesses:
- N/A – there is not a shared heritage in a culturally diverse community *00043 So what? We can appreciate each other’s culture
- Grandstanding! But culturally and currently okay.
- This sounds as if you are talking about art history and the art of various cultures here. Noting the history of art of various cultures with whom people may identify may be a means of interesting some older people in art. *00040 Yes! *00043 Right on!
- Shouldn’t all generations be encouraged to do this? *00040 Yes! *00042 Yes, but we are focusing on older adults here. *00043 True.
- N/A
- Explain how art can help them do this! *00043 The appreciation of art elements and principles!

#11. It gives older adults a place in which to deal with some of the normal losses of aging and to not only express the loss but to gain identity in a time of loosening identities.
Clarification, if any:
- As well as positive aspects of living *00043 Right! There are some gains to aging!
- Justification
- Being encouraged to express themselves through the arts can help adults deal with difficult topics such as death and dying and losses of all kinds. *00043 Right – also true for children.
- This idea suggest that aging needs to be defined here – this survey – is it just about older/old people? What is an aging society? *00043 From the time we are born we start aging! You cannot deny that!
- Justification

Strengths:
- Yes, arts are an excellent vehicle for * loss *00042 Enter “dealing with”
- Yes, I think art can do this. Some can find out what they can do and then take a new "lease of life". *00043 Right!
- Such an outlet has been there for many cultures in the past; still important now
- Central Idea
- Yes, agree & justification
- Absolutely! We need to talk via our art work about our feelings. The arts are wonderful for that aspect. *00043 Right!
- *00035 Yes! Art can be a vehicle for reminiscence, which often involve some grief work!

Weaknesses:
- Education or therapy? *00040 Can be both or either! *00042 They are not mutually exclusive. *00043 Both are involved in creative art expression – read Lowenfield!
- Cannot only view aging in a loss context *00040 True! *00043 Right – it is also gaining in some areas – give one perception

#12. Research documents physical and mental effects of arts/creativity on healthy aging -- older adults can thus maintain independent living longer and put less strain on social and medical services.
Clarification, if any:
- Equates participation in the arts with longer life – unsubstantiated

259
*00040 add “the possibility of a longer life”
*00043 Maybe we should say “happier” life

- Remove “older” – who is older? Ugh – medicalized view of adults who are aging – once maturation is reached all people age
*00040 But some are always “older” than others
*00043 It starts when we are born

- “Less strain on social and”
- Arts education can be a stimulating learning experience for elders, (*00040 add here “possibly”) helping them to maintain mental clarity. *00035 Yes! *00042 I hope this is true, but is it substantiated?

Strengths:
- A good point on societal benefits of arts education for older adults
- We need to develop more data in this area *00035 I agree – I have not found much scientific evidence – mostly observational data
- Busy people usually more content, but which kind of arts & crafts activities are you discussing. May of the research papers of NAELA’s issues group on Life Long Learning have been on the poor learning factors in Seniors, adults arts and crafts activities
*00040 And poor quality of…
*00042 Unclear if “factors” relate to people or is the program lacking?
*00043 True
- Yes, it may make people mentally more alert. Great!

Weaknesses:
- This would need to be substantiated *00043 I agree
- Activities provided don’t automatically translate as learning opportunities *00043 Need good teachers to teach
- I do not think research documents will inspire older people to make art. They need inspiration and most research studies that I have seen are informative but not inspirational for a non-art person. *00043 I agree. Its difficult to make such statements unless you know what type of art activities was given.

#13. Early schooling experiences of today’s older adults emphasized only a limited number of the intelligences. Adult arts education can enable the development of neglected intelligences.
Clarification, if any:
- Okay, with edit out of “older” *00040 agree – take out “older” *00043 Agree!

Strengths:
- Interesting
- Mention of multiple intelligence
- We are talking about multiple learning styles
- Good point
- Multiple intelligences is only a theory, but a powerful one with intuitive appeal that can help in reaching those not reached by traditional schooling
- Yes, that now everyone seems to believe in multiple intelligences. *00043 I think so

Weaknesses:
- Unsubstantiated claim *00043 When did Gardner come out with multiple intelligences?
- Needs to be proven
- I don’t like the idea of neglected intelligences *00043 I don’t either but they were (here?)

260
• "Intelligences" needs further explanation to those unfamiliar with Gardner’s work
• Controversy over whether there is empirical evidence supporting the theory of multiple intelligences

#14. Adult arts education is useful in enhancing adult mental health, efficacy, and growth.
Clarification, if any:
• Justification
Strengths:
• Central Idea
• Yes, I believe this is true. I have observed this in many of my students.
Weaknesses:
• Vague
• Unsubstantiated claim *00043 Isn’t there research on this?
• What is efficacy? *00040 Look it up!
• What about “learning” – what kind of “mental health, efficacy, and growth”? *00043
  I tend to agree
• *00035 I agree with all of the above weaknesses!

#15. Arts Education for Adults has a vital role in keeping adults alive, active and interested
in themselves, their environment, and the optimum ways of preserving and enriching
quality of thought and feeling in all the various facets and modes of that relationship.
Clarification, if any:
Strengths:
• Fits under quality of life
• Central Idea
• Good statement *00035 Yes!
• I think so, but I am sure there are other ways also. Older people need to be actively
  involved in something. I always seem to have a project that I am very involved
  with... Now, it is my collection of former public school students' art work that is
  being shown in art exhibitions. I am also doing a presentation concerning the
  collection at the NAEA Convention at Miami Beach in March. Now, I wonder how I
  became that old without realizing it! 81 years old. So, I'm speaking from experience
  here.
  *00043 The next exhibition is Sunday, January 6th... hope many of my many former
  students come...
Weaknesses:
• Vague

#16. As our life span continues to lengthen, more of our population are living longer, and
have time to explore interests or second careers. These quests often involve schooling, and
thus make adult arts education a stronger part of the curriculum. We are an institution*
with an increasing population of mature (40+) students. *00040 change to “a society”
Clarification, if any:
• We are a society with an increasing population of mature (50+) students... I noticed
  elsewhere that 40+ was used... we’ll soon be calling 15 year olds elders... let's not get
  to be so foolish – 50+ is enough of a starter *00035 I agree! *00043 But about 65
  retirement age?
• At my higher education institution – this is true. *00043 Yes, more older adults are
  enrolled in college classe
Strengths:
Speaks to importance of learning in retirement options
Good, Central Idea  *00035 I agree!
Those who have not experienced the arts need to get involved. Since design choices are such an important aspect of everyone's life, the arts have always been important throughout one's life. However, many people do not recognize this as an aspect of life—even some who are artists! I have seen how some artists live with no regard for anything but their painting not realizing that everything they touch involves design/art. I feel sorry for them.  *00043 So true

Weaknesses:
- Who is “we”? Many higher education institutions?  *00043 Yes!

#17. [Changed question from “When retired with plenty of time...”] The arts provide adults with opportunities for enjoyment of the creative expression of others via art books, art videotapes, museum visits, art/craft workshops, and art oriented lectures and art tours.
Clarification, if any:
- We do need to consider getting folks involved well before retirement...this is where our education has failed us...we are so busy testing folks as they go through school that it becomes the way to feel “educated” and aesthetics get lost...how can we expect people to grasp this once retired...awful!
  *00042 This is a situation that is restricting the education of the young. Older adults have been spared this experience.
  *00043 Lot of truth here
Strengths:
- Acknowledges that art learning can take a variety of forms and strategies  *00035 Yes!
- Yes, very true. Most all tours for senior citizens involve art museums.
Weaknesses:
- Equates retirement with plenty of time – unsubstantiated
  *00042 I agree with the statement. Older adults usually have more options when allocating time then those who work, are raising children, holding a job, etc.
  *00043 In my case it is true/substantiated
- Very visual arts oriented  *00043 Well, that’s where we are!
- A dominant weakness of many items is that they are stereotypical and refer to older adults
- “Plenty” – better word = “more”  *00043 Maybe more! Definitely not plenty.

#18. Art helps create intellectual habits, skills and aesthetic judgments in creative expressions.
Clarification, if any:
- What defines a creative expression? Does cake decorating or selecting the new living room décor colors fit in?
  *00040 Could!
  *00042 Yes – but there are higher levels of creativity than these.
  *00043 Yes, you are using art criteria if you are concerned about how it looks!
  *00043 In everything (objects) than man makes in our home & dress
Strengths:
- Central Idea
- Agree – but ‘learning’ needs to be added  *00043 I agree!
- Yes, the more we work with shapes and colors, the more sensitive we become.
Art is the perfect learning activity. It has a historical context. It has an activity or creative context. It creates critical response from others. It allows self-expressions valued by the artist and defined as aesthetics.

*00035 Good point!
*00043 And it develops visual sensitivity concerning everything in life

Weaknesses:

#19. All human beings communicate in a variety of ways throughout their lives. The arts provide an excellent mode of such communication and offer a wide variety of ways to do so. Clarification, if any:
- Justification
- Arts connect adults with new roles, goals, and values.

Strengths:
- Central Idea
- And across the generations
- Yes, the arts may open up a whole new world for them.
- Central Idea
- Good statement as justification
- Yes, they certainly do. We talk through our visual expressions. *00035 And for older adults they provide an opportunity to share perspectives from their unique vantage point!
- Verbal communication and debate are overrated. Expressions created by voice, gesture, hand, color, movement/dance, etc. are also valid ways of creative community (not VERBAL ‘only’).
- *00043 All the strengths are Right on!

Weaknesses:
- *00043 Define “the arts” – music, drama, dance, visual art…

#20. Adult arts education provides an opportunity for new skills development and perhaps, new career direction. Clarification, if any:

Strengths:
- Good to connect to career development
- Agree
- Central Idea
- Okay. Reflects awareness of adults of younger ages career imputes
- Yes, look at Grandma Moses for example *00043 True

Weaknesses:

#21. We need to create more of a life span approach so older adults believe that it is ok to participate without necessarily being very good. In other words, they need to be made to feel that learning something new is not only ok —but good. Clarification, if any:

Right -- But what is good in art these days? You see everything. Art is not what it used to be--facility at realistic drawing or painting.
*00040 So what? Art has many “faces”
*00043 Correct

Strengths:
- Good point
- Lifelong learning * through the arts

263
#22. Arts connect adults with "unfinished business" of earlier life stages & ages.

Clarification, if any:
- Arts "can" connect, etc. *00035 Yes!

Strengths:
- Nice point *00043 I’ve had several of my retired students take up painting after being retired. They seem to continue where they left off in school.
- Yes, you can resolve* psychosocial issues *00042 Perhaps “deal with” is a better term than “resolve”; “resolution” cannot always be achieved.
- Central Idea
- Good point **
- Many times this is true and if this occurs, I hope the person is encouraged to explore this area of his/her life.

Weaknesses:
- Unclear?

#23. Adult arts education can be a mechanism that promotes aesthetic art enhancements to the community (and society).

Clarification, if any:
- Remove “and society” – it is implied! *00040 Agree!

Strengths:
- Central Idea
- Addresses social and community needs for individuals able and skilled in making knowledgeable aesthetic choices on behalf of their communities *00043 Very true
- Absolutely! The design of our parks, cities, buildings, streets, clothes, cars, and everything has to do with art, the beautiful and how things look. They all have color, arrangement, function, etc. *00035 Yes! *00043 Now, they call this visual art – John Hicks!
- Cultural expressions such as MURALS, LANDSCAPES, and SCULPTURES are wonderful community and social enhancements.

Weaknesses:
- Vague *00043 How so?? Explain…

#24. Arts can help to connect people across racial, ethnic, religious, socio-economic lines.

Clarification, if any:
- *00035 And generational lines
- *00042 There are several aspects to this statement. I can imagine an arts program that brings people from various groups together. I can also see how studying Pre-Columbian art, African art, Eskimo art, etc. can help with relating to other cultures.

Strengths:
- Multi-dimensional
Central Idea
Yes. By seeing the art work of others, we begin to get an understanding of that particular person. Very important if we are all going to get along and respect each other.
Creative genius knows no boundaries. The 2002 cultural Olympiad provides ART from the human condition. It includes all of us.

Weaknesses:
- Vague – depends on how arts programs are designed *00043 Very true – students need help in this connection
- If done correctly.* Art can also divide and be elitist *00040 Unclear?
  *00043 Then it is not correctly done!
- Not always. Use of the arts can do this – but not all art* does this *00043 Not all art teachers do this!
- *00040 Oops – a possible burden?

#25. The arts connect people to social cultures by teaching them about themselves and about each other.
Clarification, if any:
*00043 Again, the teacher needs to teach for this! One of his or her objectives!

Strengths:
- Central Idea
- Addresses learning – or at least teaching
- Yes, we need to understand and appreciate the beliefs and feelings of others.

Weaknesses:
- Vague *00040 Explain??

#26. There is a need for all* adults of all ages to* access to art learning opportunities, both as part of institutional, for-credit programs or through independent, non-credit, community-based programs.
Clarification, if any:
*00043 Yes! *00043 I agree
- Add “have in between “to access”
- *00040 Remove “all” and put “to have”
- *00042 Remove “all” and put “to have”
- *00043 Remove “all” and put “to have”
- *00046 Remove “all” and put “to have”

Strengths:
- Describes a range of options
- Agree
- Central Idea
- Yes, let us not limit opportunities to learn at whatever age. *00040 Yes! *00043 Right on!

Weaknesses:

#27. (You can "teach an old dog new tricks.)" The arts, unlike verbal languages, can be taken up and mastered at any age.
Clarification, if any:
- Remove first sentence, then “the arts, unlike verbal language, can be mastered at different levels at any age” *00035 Yes! *00040 Agree! *00043 All right

Strengths:
- Good point
- Agrees with my concern above about it* “being too late” for the arts in one’s life *00040 enter “never”
- Good data to support this *00043 Grandma Moses, etc.
- Yes, I believe art is simply another means of expression like writing, talking, moving, etc.
- Verbal communication is so over-rated in terms of a learning outcome. Art offers visual arts, sculpture, dance, theatre, etc. as learning outcomes. They go beyond VERBAL ONLY.

Weaknesses:
- Comparison based on unsubstantiated claim *00043 Really??
- N/A
- “Unlike verbal languages” *not true. Adult immigrants can learn the new language – it’s just slower *00043 But it is easier as a child!

#28. Considering the second section: would it be possible to be indirect (subversive)? What I have in mind is if older adults are not attracted to become involved with the arts, why not have the arts go to them…be part of everything they are…which I would guess is often already the case. So those wanting to fund and support older adult arts education, could support where it already is – libraries, museums, adult day care centers, senior and community centers, retirement homes, learning in retirement institutes, colleges and universities, community colleges, theaters, concert halls, and on and on.
Clarification, if any:
- Strengths:
  - *00043 True – have opportunities available
- Weaknesses:

Arts in Healing/Art Therapy

#1. Therapy and wellness – Adult arts education can be used to meet therapeutic and rehabilitation goals.
Clarification, if any:
- Is this the role of arts education?
  *00040 It can be one role of many
  *00043 It’s just an aspect of making art
- What are the similarities and difference between arts education and arts therapy?
- Art therapy is not art education!
  *00040 True – but one can still absorb art as part of therapy
  *00043 Unfortunately they have become completed separated since Lowenfield
- *00042 Yes, but this is “not” central

Strengths:
- A good point
- Yes, I agree – Central idea *00035 Art making by its very nature is therapeutic!
- Yes, art therapy used to be an important aspect of art education. What happened? You never hear art educators discuss this aspect anymore. Is it because art therapy has become quite an area of study on its own?
Activities need to solicit responses. Classical music (Strauss or Verdi) and classical art (van Gogh, Monet) stir the soul and invite a response. *00043 But it is best when the person expresses her or himself in the arts.

Weaknesses:
- Needs more detail
- Does arts education mean learning or just “busy activities”?
  *00040 Yes “arts education mean learning” and NEVER “busy activities”
  *00043 It should be meaningful to the student. If it is just busy activity, then there is something wrong with the instructor.

#2. Life review and reminiscence activities are an important part of involving elders in activities.
Clarification, if any:
- Art therapy – not art education necessarily
- Arts education gives older adults an opportunity to reflect upon their life experiences and then to share this with others.
  *00035 Yes!
  *00043 True, if so inclined
- Stress the value of life experiences as rich source material for creative expression.
  *00035 Yes!
- *00040 Art?
- *00042 It can provide context for art activities and learning

Strengths:
- Yes, staff should be trained in these areas
  *00043 Right
- Yes, most people like to tell about their lives and where they have been, what they have done.

Weaknesses:
- I do not think noting life experiences to an older adult will get them started.
  However, after they are involved in creating art work, then these would be very good topics to use—but not in the beginning.
  *00040 Yes.
  *00043 I agree! It’s not the place to start.

#3. Development of arts and healing programs by health care institutions
Clarification, if any:
- Is this arts education?
  *00040 Why not? One aspect!
  *00043 Can be – it’s how it is carried out
- Idea: Ask every local arts group to bring their work once a year to the area hospital
  *00042 Okay but art educators should develop the programs and provide instruction
  *00043 Why? Most doctors are not trained in art therapy? You need people trained in art therapy.

Strengths:
- A good focal point for strategies
- This would be great – connect the two ideas
- Linking professions is a good idea at this point in time. Art therapy should inform us art educators interested in adult learning issues.
  *00035 Yes!
- This is where arts therapy comes in, I believe. Of course, I think all art expression involves a bit of the aspects of art therapy.
  *00035 Yes!
  *00042 There can be symbiosis between art and therapy.
  *00043 I agree – we are getting our feelings and ideas ‘out there’

Weaknesses:
- Research? Art learning is not art therapy --- per se *00040 True! *00043 Right!

#4. Health professionals’ education needs to be expanded so that members of the "team" (including MDs, nurses, therapists etc) understand the therapeutic benefits of their patients participating in the arts so that they "put in a good word" and encourage participation. Sometimes, older adults will listen to a health professional when they won't listen to anyone else.
Clarification, if any:
- Is this arts education?
  *00040 In this special setting it can be!
  *00042 Yes, if it is a sound curriculum and professional art instruction.
  *00043 An aspect of art expression

Strengths:
- Interesting
- Yes, the MD who brings a poem to a patient visit!
- Very good. Everyone should understand the therapeutic aspect of creative art expression and support it. We need a Public Relations Person for art education.
  *00035 Good Idea!
  *00043 Right on!
- *00043 Right!

Weaknesses:
- Art learning as therapy for physical* well-being
  *00040 Why not?
  *00043 Include beyond physical: mental/emotional/psychological?

Higher Education/ Professional Organizations

#1. Need a database or databases (web-based?) of programs/organizations at the local, regional, and national level to share innovative ideas and foster partnerships.
Clarification, if any: *00040 Should be helpful but requires special training!

Strengths:
- *00043 Need good communication – Right on!

Weaknesses:

#2. Arts Education programs in higher education should include courses that prepare arts educators to create, implement, and evaluate programs for adult learners
Clarification, if any: *00040 Yes!

- We need to insert/develop strong curricula materials concerning older adults and the therapeutic role of the arts so they become experts and want to pursue professional opportunities in the field. *00035 Yes! *00040 Yes! *00043 A few of my students have gone into art therapy
- University courses should be developed to train activity personnel who work with seniors in quality art education practices. *00035 Yes! *00040 Yes! *00043 Right but some aspects are appropriate for all levels.

Strengths:
- Aging* should be part of college education as well
  *00040 enter “education”
  *00042 explain?
  *00043 Not sure about this?
- Needed initiative
- Absolutely right on!
- Yes, they should, but many are now concerned with making art an academic subject wherein the study of art history seem to be the predominant aspect. Making art has now taking a backseat in the field. For me this is a sad state of affairs for art ed.

Weaknesses:
- Yes, I would think so but most teachers on the college level in the fine arts see themselves as "artists" and not teachers or as educators. In fact, the feeling seems to be that those who can't do art, they teach and they seem to look down on those in art education. *00040 True for some.

#3. Arts Administration Education programs in higher education should include courses that prepare arts administrators to create, implement, and evaluate programs for adult learners.
Clarification, if any:  *00040 Yes!
Strengths:
- Good point *00035 Yes!
- Agree
- Agreed
- Yes. I would think that most arts administration people would have been art teachers sometime in their lives where this would have been taught. *00043 I agree!
- Excellent. Absolutely needed. However, evaluation standards need to be agreed upon.

Weaknesses:

#4. Set up a series of conferences, local, regional, national and international, on a regular basis, in which the ideas, initiatives, policies and practices of Art Education for adults might be articulated, discussed, evaluated, developed and then delivered in Art Education for adults institutions, locally, nationally and world-wide.
Clarification, if any:  *00040 Yes!
Strengths:
- Maybe over-ambitious
- The LifeLong Learning Affiliate meets at the NAEA national convention every year when research and policies, etc are presented and discussed. I do not know that they have a national publication, relying on the NAEA publications wherein they may submit articles for publication.
  *00035 There is very little support for LLL within NAEA and the affiliate may have to shut down.
  *00043 I think this should and could be an outgrowth of the present national organization, NAEA + art therapy + administration

Weaknesses:
- As stated, we have to assume that ‘art education’ means DBAE (aka NAEA stance). Need a DBAE statement of LLL!
  *00040 NO WAY! Baloney – Don’t use DBAE!
  *00043 On no – not DBAE – that separates all aspects of the arts as it is now received –we need interaction!

#5. NAEA needs to look at how it can reach out more effectively to community-based art education, which includes adult opportunities as well as those for young people.
Clarification, if any:
- This says exactly what NAEA -- LLL Issues group advocates.
- That would be great but I think the NAEA is relying on the Life Long Learning Affiliate to do this. With many public schools, especially in the large cities doing away with art and the art supervisors, we are lucky to have art classes for K-12.
- NAEA needs to support research and training for art educators who work with older adults, giving more time at conferences for LLL presentations.
  *00040 Yes!
  *00043 NAEA is not publicly funded – would have to have grants to make this a reality.
  *00035 Yes to all of the above!

Strengths:
- Good point
- Focus on community arts *00043 I do not know of any examples of this...

Weaknesses:

#6. Professional arts education oriented associations, such as the National Art Education Association, should promote a life long learning orientation to the arts with specific mention made of older adults.

Clarification, if any:

Strengths:
- Good strategies
- Should partner with groups such as the AARP
  *00035 Good idea!
  *00043 Good idea!
- Yes, and they do with their Life Long Learning Affiliate Group.
  *00040 But interest is Low!
  *00043 Right

Weaknesses:
- Who are the older adults? Seniors, adults in mid-life, etc?
  *00040 All! Close to or beyond references
  *00043 Can be at any age after high school

#7. We should encourage some rigorous research programs that evaluate the benefits of the arts for older adults so that funding in this area would increase, jobs would be created and awareness could be increased on many different levels.

Clarification, if any:

- Any researcher wanting to fund such a study might find a problem. The issue is that ‘arts for older adults’ is too vague a statement. Terminology has to be defined these days. Which older adults are defined here? Recent retirees, seniors in accommodation housing or in day-care? *00040 Why not many or all of this group? Young old, Middle Old, Old Old?

Strengths:
- Interesting but not sure research always drives program development
- Focus on research
- Would address some concerns about overly broad claims of benefits of arts education mentioned in part I (roles) *00043 May be we need research here...
- Agreed, we need research ammunition for funds and programs *00035 Yes! *00043 Right!

Weaknesses:
That would be great but who is getting out the research that has already been done in this area? I’m afraid that most practicing art teachers could care less about art education after public school, K-12.

*0040 We need to reach them!
*0043 I think that is correct. Teaching K-12 is a tremendous job!

*0040 Stop segregating – let’s integrate!
*0042 I believe that a research study, which is rigorous, might have to turn its back on outcomes that do not lend themselves to quantification. The requirements of research should not guide the learning experience the program provides.

#8. Arts education organizations and institutions should work with older adult advocacy groups to bring public attention to the importance of arts education to older adults.

Clarification, if any:

Strengths:

- Good strategy *0035 Yes!
- Excellent statement
- Yes, I think the National Art Education Association tries to do this. They do have a group oriented to life long learning in the arts. It seems difficult to get the word out to society in general. *0040 Interest in LLL is down!
- *0043 The attitude of many adults is that art really doesn’t matter. A side issue – talk to people on the street and see what they say, think about the importance of art.

Weaknesses:

#9. Use schools and all other educating institutions (community colleges, further vocational colleges, universities, liberal arts colleges, conservatoria, music and drama schools and so on) as centres of excellence in the provision of such ways and means, centres and resources, on a 24/7 (twenty four hours a day, seven days a week) basis. Pay for the provision of such resources from a mixed economy of local taxes, business input and fees from contributors.

Clarification, if any:

- I would approve of all sources except the government unless you are going to have such government funding in all areas of learning *0043 I’d be interested in responses of all these institutions to this unless you give much money

Strengths:

- Worth exploring
- Central Idea
- Political agenda statement – good issue!

Weaknesses:

#10. Set up a research programme, in company with some Higher and tertiary educating institutions, to explore ways in which the ideas, policies, programmes and practices of Art Education for Adults might be explored, articulated, developed, provided and evaluated with a view to their improvement and expansion, and as part of this programme establish ways and means of facilitating exchanges of Arts Educators in residence, publications and artifacts of all kinds, and of personnel (teachers and learners), both within the country and also overseas.

Clarification, if any:

- The SRAE of the NAEA tries to do this to some extent. I do not think the research of the past is being explained and promoted by any group to the extent that it should be. I would think that our national art education organization would or should do this. *0040 Yes!
Strengths:

- Focus on research & policy
- A good research agenda for NAEA to undertake
  *00035 Yes!
  *00043 I agree. Seems as if nobody is aware of research that has been done in the past – why?
Weaknesses:

#11. Invite well known Arts Educators in residence and Art Education for Adults academics, professionals and practitioners from inter-state and overseas to visit individual Art Education for Adults locations and institutions, giving prestige lectures, leading seminars, conducting Workshops, building programmes of professional development for all Art Education for Adults people and Arts Educators in residence.
Clarification, if any:

- *00043 Who is going to pay for this?

Strengths:

- Good idea
- Sounds wonderful, whenever your Art Education for Adults materializes. *00035 Yes!

Weaknesses:

- How should/could this be funded? *00043 You can do anything if it is funded!

#12. Co-operate with Higher and tertiary educating institutions (HTEIs) and their Alumni organisations, to make it possible for them to offer a range of learning activities, both on- and off-campus, in short or longer term programs of either an award-bearing or a non-award-bearing kind, to potential students of all kinds and from all kinds of backgrounds and locations, to take their Art Education for Adults activities as part of a self-designed and self-selected course of study (with appropriate advice, guidance and counseling available for access when necessary), that will enable them eventually to get a degree or other qualification that might interest them as a means of expanding their own personal growth, help them start up a new career or diversify in an existing one, and make them more active participants in the community and in its social and political institutions.
Clarification, if any:

- Too grossly across board – separate social impact from personal influences. Seems to address collaborations & acknowledgment of importance.
- Not sure how much emphasis on degree programs needed
- Many universities already offer such courses for older adults. I know that the University of Cincinnati does and so does Miami. We receive a catalogue of such courses a couple times a year. *00043 Of course, there are fees!

Strengths:

- Collaboration efforts with existing adult services, alumni!
  *00040 Yes!

Weaknesses:

**Intergenerational**

#1. Arts connect the generations. Arts are generative and can provide older adults a way of giving back*.
Clarification, if any:
• Giving back what? Need clarification, please!
• This is 2 issue statements – separate
• *00040 Take out “giving back” and insert: “becoming sensitive & involved with new ideas generated by younger adults

Strengths:
• Cross-generational point is good  *00035 Helps generational understanding!
• Connects to Erickson’s model
• Good
• True, younger family members usually are intrigued by the expressions of older members of the family, especially if they are into genealogy.
  *00043 After the older family members are deceased, the younger ones always say “I wish I had asked Dad and Mom about that”

Weaknesses:

#2. **Adult arts education can be used for facilitating and enhancing intergenerational programming.**

Clarification, if any:
• Develop capacity of parents/grandparents to reinforce arts learning of young people*.
  *00040 add “and vice versa”

Strengths:
• True
• Multigenerational
• Builds bonds among the generations  *00035 Yes!
• Excellent
• Yes

Weaknesses:
• Training is necessary to do this effectively  *00043 Right!
• *00040 Not a one-way path

#3. **Intergenerational programs enable older Americans to serve as mentors (or volunteers) to younger folks – strengthen communities and gives elders sense of values.**

Clarification, if any:
• Yet to see any site contexts except religious * summer camps that foster this options
• *00040 Not a one-way path

Strengths:
• Yes, the older people can be looked up to by the younger people and therefore gain in confidence  *00040 and vice versa
• Yes, I know several who volunteer at the art museum  *00043 And like it!
• *00035 Yes, agree with above two strengths!

Weaknesses

**Marketing**

#1. **Start national ad campaign to encourage people to watch less television and participate more in local arts opportunities...**

Clarification, if any:
• *00042 Delete “watch less television” – Substantiates be ‘selective’ in their choice of television. Some programs support the ideas dealt with here.

Strengths:
- *00040 Yes!
- *00043 Advertising and PR are important

Weaknesses:

#2. Effective marketing of adult learning opportunities by arts organizations and other arts learning venues

Clarification, if any:

Strengths:
- Good point
- Yes, we need to target market, especially for the baby boomers as they age
- The term marketing is critically important – who are they targeting is also critical.
  *00035 Yes!
- Yes, you have to sell the idea that’s why art people need lesson in public relations/advertising. *00043 Right!

Weaknesses:
- Often classes are offered to “adults”. Too general a statement. Who are these adults the organization is targeting. Do these organizations employ instructors skilled & experience with teaching adult learners?
  *00040 Good points!
  *00043 They should to be successful…

#3. Support of public TV and radio broadcasting

Clarification, if any:

- More detail needed
- Marketing programs -- Who writes copy and who delivers media message (a local identifiable adult person (50+) would be great!)

Strengths:
- Very important

Weaknesses:
- *00043 Get someone connected to the TV station on your committee. They can advise on the best approach

#4. Educate the public about the arts in their communities. Newspapers can play a big role in this regard.

Clarification, if any:

- Idea: Devote a page of every national newspaper to poetry (aging baby boomers read the local paper more frequently than any other group) *00042 Too ambitious for now…
- Of course: Local arts education people usually too busy to locate these contacts – unless their institutions accept these efforts as out-reach or media publication efforts (critical issue in higher education)
  *00035 I recently participated in a forum sponsored by the local council on aging & the UGA Gerontology Center – focus on creativity in retirement & they had much+ press coverage.

Strengths:
- Right again. When I taught in a large high school with a weekly paper, I saw to it that there was an article in the paper every week. *00043 Yes, I did and we had to add on art teacher because so many students signed up for art classes. That was only one thing I did!

Weaknesses:
Not sure how this is a targeted strategy

Participation – Incentives & Barriers

#1. Use research documenting physical, mental, and other benefits of arts participation as the basis of development of incentives to participate.
Clarification, if any:
- Arts marketing needs to make diverse appeals to diverse audiences; people need to see a benefit to their participation *00043 Yes!
- *00042 Is there a substantial body of relevant research available for this purpose?
- *00043 When you say arts, I assume you are including music, choral groups, theater/drama, dance, as well as visual arts – be clear here.

Strengths:
- Good point
- Focus on research *00035 Yes! *00043 And the results of arts participation
- Good

Weaknesses:
- There is not a lot here
- Needs to acknowledge ‘learning efforts’ in general
- *00040 Weaknesses need to be explained??

#2. Make a special point of reaching the whole range of previously un-reached learners - of offering Art Education for Adults to those people, groups and communities which are deprived, disadvantaged, and at the margins of society - especially, the poor, the unemployed, ethnic minorities, rural dwellers and those suffering under physical, emotional or mental handicaps or disadvantages of any kind.
Clarification, if any:  *00040 Yes!

Strengths:
- Focus on underserved *00035 Yes! *00043 Great!
- The disenfranchised! *00043 Great!

Weaknesses:
- Too wishful! Economic factors preclude participation in the good arts learning opportunities. Same old/same old!
- It sounds very nice but who is going to pay for this? Most poor do not look upon education as important and many are school dropouts. That is why they are poor. So now you think they are going to want to go to adult art classes? School and education for most of these folks is a "no-no".
- *00040 Terrible attitude – very negative! Not necessarily true -- this idea truly has some possibilities!
- *00043 True according to surveys

#3. Although many older adults are full of "get-up-and-go" some are confined to their home, their retirement community, or to a nursing home. Art learning and activities need to be made accessible to them by means such as on-site classes and transporting them to museums, lectures and artists' studios.
Clarification, if any:
• “Older adults” does not mean just infirm senior people... Art learning for the infirm & confined is art therapy – not arts education!
  *00035 Can be both!
  *00040 So what? They overlap!
  *00042 I disagree. People, young and old, with disabilities can create art and enjoy art others have created.
  • In my experience, the only place where there are art lesson/experience opportunities are the rest homes. We live across the street from one! *00043 True.

Strengths:
• Good to appeal to diverse segments  *00035 Yes!  *00043 Very good psychologically for them if you can get them to become involved.
• Through the continuum of care

Weaknesses:

#4. More could be done to make the arts part of the civic space of cities and towns.
Another barrier to arts participation is that it is often perceived "outside" the normal scope of community life. This includes more public arts and more arts in public places.
Clariﬁcation, if any:
• Yes! But if voting or $$ commitment most middle-aged people ($$ conscious because they are often ‘sandwiched’ between kids in college and aged relatives costs – they are $ conservative! Civically active people do not want their $$ spent on un-essentials.
  Most consider the arts unessential!
  *00040 Our task: Change such attitudes!
  *00043 I’m afraid this is the way it is!
• *00043 Idea is right on!

Strengths:
• Good initiative
• Yes!
• Yes, and an explanation that art/design involves practically all of life from the clothes we wear to where we live, etc.

Weaknesses:

#5. Address financial barriers to participation - for example, Iowa's ICARD discount program for low-income groups – Cost is an issue.
Clariﬁcation, if any:
• The ICARD program links human service agencies with arts organizations to improve arts access for low-income and minority populations. Human service agencies issue a membership card to qualiﬁed families or individuals; the card is used for free or signiﬁcantly reduced admission to arts events or classes sponsored by participating local arts organizations (http://www.cultureplan.org/graphics/plan/theplan.pdf)
  *00042 A great program!
  *00035 Georgia’s Grassroots Art Program provides funding for programming for low income groups such as senior center participants
  • Give Seniors vouchers and better discounts to attend the arts.  *00043 Good idea
• Cost is an issue as folks are often on fixed incomes.
• Lower costs $$$ helps…
• Help them get there, too?
• Well, that would be up to the institutions who provide arts courses. Will they give free tuition?
• *00040 Great!
• *00043 Right On – Cost is an issue!

Strengths:

• Good strategy *00035
• Promotes economic analysis of the issue
• Very Good!
• Agreed – the NEA had some programs like this
• Actions: Economics of adult persons is critical – can you do anything to assess this variable? Costs?
• Maybe some retired art educators would be willing to help other older adults have art experiences?* You need to get a group to sponsor them, like a religious group or the ACLU--Ha! *00040 Yes!
• Yes, yes, yes!
• *00042 You need to find sponsor groups with goals that mesh, at least partially, with an art-for-older-adults program.

Weaknesses:

• Cost is almost always an issue in the arts-especially performing arts
  Cost prohibition should be addressed so economic diversity; particularly of older adults is not a factor *00040 True! *00043 This is a real problem

#6. Attend to transportation and accommodation issues (logistical barriers) --
Transportation and access to programming is vital to participation in arts programs.
Clarification, if any:

• Idea: Offer free transportation and admission to arts programs for those over 70* that are willing to volunteer 10 hours or more a week in a studio or museum *00040 Yes!
  *00042 Change to “60+”
• In this section – suggestions? Barriers as my current research project w/Dr. Hubbard seems to indicate -- are economic. My interpretation is that this economic barrier is defined by earlier education options as with public community based options that have been available.
• *00043 Try everything – who knows what will work? Nobody! It will vary with the location, situation...

Strengths:

• Good point *00035
• Right

Weaknesses:

#7. Barriers to participation in the arts need to be addressed. They include the fear of failure and the fear of entering "new social" spaces. Parents can be introduced to unfamiliar arts experiences via their children through school and community programs and older and retired adults could be initiated through College Alumni and Club events as well as senior and nursing home programs.
Clarification, if any: *00040 Reminder – 90% of older adults are well!

Strengths:

• Interesting strategies
• Yes, try it. I think you should still need a class motivation, which will inspire and take away any fears. *00035 Me too! *00040 Yes! *00043 Right

Weaknesses:

#8. Time is also an adult variable. Retirees may have more – but not necessarily.
Clarification, if any:
Strengths:
Weaknesses:

#9. Earlier performance times (i.e., 7:00 pm curtains instead of 8:00 pm curtain)
Clarification, if any:
- Not sure about time constraint reference?
- I don't understand this. What does the time of day have to do with creatively expression one's self?
  *00042 Obviously the reference is to performing arts not the visual arts.
  *00043 Or unless they always go to bed early?
Strengths:
- A good, practical point
- Good point re: performing arts *00035 Yes! *00040 Yes!
Weaknesses:
- UNREALISTIC FOR CAPTURING THOSE IN THE WORKWORLD. That's why many organizations have matinees. Too expensive to run at night, except in places with larger older populations.
- And transportation when possible

Partnerships

#1. Development of community partnerships between schools and organizations that serve older adults for the purpose of creating, implementing, and evaluating inter-generational arts education programs...
Clarification, if any:
- Idea: Start "Project Art" that encourages seniors to teach art to young people *00043 I thought we were trying to teach the seniors! If they already do art, what is all this about??
Strengths:
- Well-put *00035 Agree!
- Train people to do this
Weaknesses:
- "Intergenerational" – does this mean youth studying with adults? Rethink intent and reword perhaps
- I think our laws will have to be changed if we are to have public schools be concerned with education beyond K-12. If we do this in the arts, then every other field will want to do it. Who is going to implement this? Most art teachers are swamped with the current in-school art program. *00043 At least I always was in trying to make art an integral aspect of school life for all students

#2. Start building a program of partnerships for learning, teaching and practising in Art Education for Adults, between the widest possible range of public and private agencies and institutions - business, industry and commerce, governments (local, state and federal), banks and financial houses of all kinds, Veterans Organisations, the Defense and Armed Forces, Ethnic Community Organisations and Clubs (especially Rotary, Lions, Buffaloes and Alumni organisations, etc.), with the aim of jointly funding, sponsoring and providing not only Arts Educators in residence but also the building or conversion of older buildings and facilities, into places where Art Education For Adults can be provided and practiced. Use the idea and motto of "Decent Corporate Citizenship".
Clarification, if any:
*00040 But be careful re: segregation of elders!
*00042 I think we should strive for more than just "decent"
*00043 I think you need somebody like Bill Gates in every community to do this!

Strengths:
- Emphasis on partnerships  *00035 Yes!
- Agree
- Excellent idea – especially for urban communities!

Weaknesses:
- Not sure about the last point
- It sounds great but I’m afraid it’s a “pie in the sky”. Has any group tried to do this?

#3. Partnerships should be developed between arts organizations, arts education organizations and institutions and interest groups serving older adults – and adult education venues – senior centers, community education, university extension, Elderhostel – for the purpose of advocating* for arts programs for older adults.

Clarification, if any:
- As long as what is meant & included by arts learning can be mutually agreed upon
- Idea: Add public galleries and greenhouses to senior centers  *00043 Good idea!
- Partnerships can insure demographic needs pre-requisite for funding resources
- *00042 Change “advocating” to “establishing”

Strengths:
- Good strategy
- Yes, excellent
- That would be great.
- Emphasis on partnerships
- Now this seems more realistic to me. Going where the older people are, taking art to them.  *00043 Right!
- *00035 Above strengths good!
- *00040 Yes!

Weaknesses:

#4. Carry Art Education for Adults into all parts of the community by employing "Arts Educators in residence" (AER) at Educating institutions, sports clubs, churches, theatres, museums and art galleries, in shopping malls, in community centers, hospital and health centers, retirement villages and senior citizens homes, and all other possible locations, operating under the specific brief of "selling" the joys, excitement and practical benefits of engaging in Art Education for Adults for all members of the community and getting them to commit to it.

Clarification, if any:  *00035 I love this idea!  *00040 Good!!

Strengths:
- Good strategies  *00043 Are there enough art educators to do this all over the US? And who is going to pay them?
- Community arts focus
- Worth exploring… Don’t forget to showcase older residents and members themselves
- “In residence” is a great idea for retired art educators
- Great idea!
- This would be great if you can get these various groups to fund such programs.  *00043 Money again!

Weaknesses:
• The item is unclear

Programs/Examples

#1. Create display space at an indoor mall
Clarification, if any: *00040 Who checks quality?
Strengths:
• Great – take art to the people. Perhaps you need an art educator there to explain and
tell about the exhibit
Weaknesses

#2. Read aloud from new literary works on the radio
Clarification, if any:
• *00043 Not visual art! I’d keep it to visual art.
Strengths:
Weaknesses:

#3. Having an elder who IS involved speak to a group and show some of her/his works
might do it for a few.
Clarification, if any:
• Yes, but I think they need classes in art education as well as being an artist before
trying to administrate
• *00035 The “art Matinee” program sponsored by UGA Gerontology Center & Council
in Aging did exactly this!
• *00040 Agree!
Strengths:
• Focus on advocacy
• Create elder role models and living treasures *00043 Older adults can identify with
another older adult -- good
• Why not? -- Every little bit might encourage a few to try it. *00043 Right!
Weaknesses:
• Vague

#4. Coming in via the "back door" has possibilities...not even mentioning "art" or "arts"
and doing some programming that brings folks together and suddenly some will say "hey,
this is interesting," or whatever...and perhaps a 2nd round can hook them into some
involvement.
Clarification, if any:
• Explain a bit more about what is meant by “back door”
Strengths:
• Good point
• Right. You have to be a good salesman. *00043 True, try everything.
• *00040 Great!
Weaknesses:
• Vague

#5. Museum outreach programs should be developed with a focus on senior populations.
Clarification, if any:
• *00035 Can take art to senior facilities as well as bring older adults into museums.

280
Public Policy – Funding for Adult Art Education

#1. Policy should be developed at the local, regional, and national levels that affirm the importance of arts education as a life-long learning process. Such policy should specifically mention the importance of the arts to older adults.

Clarification, if any:
- Older adult education has ‘taken off’ in the last 20 years without public policy or public funding. Is public policy and funding a blessing or a curse?* 00040 If done well!
- *00043 Keep the life long learning in there!!

Strengths:
- Good but we need data
- Central Idea
- Excellent statement of action needed  00035 Yes!
- *00040 Important!

Weaknesses:
- Well, I don’t think I would make it specifically for older adults but for all human beings regardless of age. We do not want to give the impression that children should wait until they are older to have art experiences. 00040 Yes!

#2. Federal, State, and local arts funding agencies as well as private foundations should be encouraged to create, implement, and evaluate funding initiatives that support arts education programs for older adults.

Clarification, if any:
- Funding sources such as state grassroots art grants can be utilized to support art programs for older adults. 00043 We need all the support we can get!

Strengths:
- True, well-stated
- Excellent  00035 Yes!

Weaknesses:
- We need to give them the information to do this regarding the benefits
- I do not know what the federal and state governments should be involved in funding art education for older adults. However, local groups may want to get involved but not the government. 00043 I agree.
- *00043 When the government funds something, they usually want to control and govern it…be careful here.

#3. Support older artists and arts administrators.

Clarification, if any:
- Not clear what support means
- Too often artists leave the career pipeline because the costs of doing business outweigh the benefits. Older artists can’t risk working without benefits and arts administrators are being asked to stay underpaid in positions that may have grown in responsibilities, but not in salaries.

Strengths:
- Develop a resource directory of who they are!
Weaknesses:
- Vague
- No! Exclusionary unless these are also advocates can agree
- Why would we want to do that? The artists and arts admin. people already are doing art and know its value. *00040 Explain?

#4. Get a "pro-arts" mayor or governor. Nothing like civic pride to make older adults feel the arts belong to them.
Clarification, if any:
- Include political parties – some have policies for education and for the arts.

Strengths:
- Yes, yes, yes

Weaknesses:
- Under-developed strategy
  *00040 But not impossible!!!
  *00043 Try everything!
APPENDIX H: THEMES OF IMPORTANCE
Themes in Order of Importance: Rank % & # of Respondents Votes

Key Theme Percentages

- Arts Role
- Higher Education
- Defining Adults
- Partnerships
- Public Policy
- Participation
- Arts in Healing
- Intergenerational
- Marketing

The Role of the Arts, Arts Education, and Art Learning (30%)
24 out 80 votes

Higher Education (21.25%)
17 out 80 votes

Defining Adults, Older Adults (11.25%)
9 out 80 votes

Partnerships (10%)
8 out 80 votes

Public Policy (10%)
8 out 80 votes

Participation (8.75%)
7 out 80 votes

Arts in Healing/Art Therapy (5%)
4 out 80 votes

Intergenerational (2.5%)
2 out 80 votes

Marketing (1.25%)
1 out 80 votes

Programs (0%)
0 out 80 votes
APPENDIX I: THE VOTING BALLOT RESPONSES
VOTING BALLOT RESPONSES PER STAKEHOLDER

Round IV: The Voting Ballot

From: 00034
To: Sue Anne Lafferty <lafferty.16@osu.edu>
Date: Tue, 08 Jan 2002 14:34:56 +1100

Subject: Re: Adult Arts Education: Round IV Voting Sheet

Dear Sue Anne

Many thanks for your kind message and let me wish you a happy, productive and successful new year.

I've read through your third round material but regret I seem to be unable to access your voting form - can't get it to be saved, not even when I try just opening it. So this will have to wait, I'm afraid.

However, I've read through all the other material and am cheered by most of what I read. Two notes of reservation, however: (1) I do hope most strongly that the views of NAEA will NOT be taken self-evidently to refer to DBAE. This is a highly controversial proposition and one about which there is still a deal controversy, certainly overseas, anyway. So I feel it would be better to leave any such suggestion to one side for the moment, at any rate. (b) I've read through a number of comments on the "Weaknesses" side that really make me rather irritated. Both in our country, in the UK and evidently also in yours, we always seem to get responses of a kind that in Australia would be called "the whingers" - those people who can say nothing but: "unclear, vague, weak, pie in the sky, we've heard this all before, a wish list. the disadvantaged are not going to do this ...." and so on and on. My response to such comments has always been: would you please say precisely why and in what respects you think this idea/proposal/policy etc. is weak, vague, incapable of being realized, excessively utopian and so on, and in what such criticisms really consist? And perhaps you could then also go on and give me your clear, detailed and positive ideas for consideration under this heading and from what theoretical perspective you are offering them?" That generally has the effect of either shutting people up (in many such cases a consummation devoutly to be wished) or in pressing them to come up with sound and well thought out ideas of their own - always a helpful move and a good step forward. Sorry to be a bit liverish about this - but I've had too many such responses in my life not to want to groan when I see them coming forward in response to your enquiries too.... You too ..... 

I do hope this will give you enough to go on and help you start to bring your enquiries to a conclusion. Take all the above as a vote of support for what you have produced so far.

I'm also forwarding you an invitation to the annual SCUTREA (Standing Conference on University Teaching and Research in the Education of Adults) which you might like to consider attending (it could be a useful forum for trying out some of your ideas on a lively and supportive audience). I send you best wishes and warm regards

286
Round IV: The Voting Ballot

From: 00035
To: Sue Anne Lafferty <lafferty.16@osu.edu>
Date: January 18, 2002
Subject: Re: Adult Arts Education: Round IV Voting Sheet

Idea # 5: From Professional Development/Academy section -- NAEA
I would give this idea (5) points – the most promising idea.

Which comes first – the chicken or the egg? …Improving the state of adult (older adult) art education is gaining much more support from NAEA. The Lifelong Learning Affiliate has been struggling for the last few years to get more members and to find new educators willing to take on leadership roles. We are now at the point of disbanding, precisely because this has not happened. Most people who have been leaders in LLL are now retired. Others are occupied with their work in other areas and have managed to ‘squeeze’ in LLL as a small part of their big picture. One solution would be to develop the area of Community Art Education as an affiliate, and this would include programming for older adults. I hope that NAEA will develop a greater focus on this important area, publishing papers on this topic, providing more time slots at national conventions for presentations, and establishing funding for research. If we don’t become advocates for our own art programs for older adults, how can we expect others to advocate for us?

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   Until NAEA itself begins to support community-based art education programs for adults and to advocate for these on a national level – we can’t expect others to do this for us… NAEA must become a spokesman for quality adult art programs!

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   With NAEA interest in advocacy, there could be funding initiatives and more research done!

Idea # 2: From Public Policy: Federal, State & local arts funding agencies…
I would give this idea (4) points – the next promising idea.

Funding! I realize that without money to support good teachers, classes based on sound educational principles, and quality materials – we will be unable to accomplish much of anything.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   Very! We must encourage funding to support programs & research or we will never attract professionals into the field.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   Tremendous! With more funding and educators who are interested in working with older adults but were restricted by financial considerations would be able to initiate quality programs.

Idea #2: Partnerships – Artist-in Residence
I would give this idea (3) points.

I really liked the idea of developing Artist in Residence programs – paying art educators to go into senior centers, churches, art centers, etc., etc., and develop classes for older adults. This seems to be a simple idea that could begin on a very modest, grassroots level. Retired art educators could plug in, as well as art teachers who might be free during the summer for such a program.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   A very innovative idea – creating partnerships to fund AER to work with older adults and to create art centers!

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   This kind of programs could work at a very grassroots level – starting small and then building a foundation for broader programming.

Idea #3: Partnerships – Aging Network
   I would give this idea (2) points.

I believe that art educators much reach out to the aging network, tapping into their resources and convincing them of the importance of the arts to their constituents. In my own work, I have developed a real support group for arts programs. Many senior center directors provide matching funds for grassroots arts grants because they have seen how much their participants have benefited from past programs. I was asked to teach an art class at a downtown church last winter, and this proved to be a great avenue for reaching their older church members. Partnerships are the way to go – as in all things, working together often accomplishes more than trying to do it on one’s own.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   We must build partnerships which reach out to other organizations, etc. which serve older adults. This huge network is already in place and art education needs to utilize it!

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   When professionals in the aging network become interested in bringing the arts into their programs --- then we will see a huge growth in art programming!

Idea #2: Defining Older Adult, Adult Art Education
   I would give this idea (1) point.

I was conflicted here – I did not put down the idea about funding more research in the area of adult art education – although I do think that would help us to sell funding agencies on the importance of the arts. I finally decided on an idea that involved designing art programs specifically for older adults -- taking into consideration their particular needs, interests and learning styles. Unless we have a good ‘product’ we don’t have much more to offer than those terrible craftsy programs one often encounters in senior centers and long-term care facilities.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Creating quality art programs which are designed for the adult learner (in all his/her diversity) is critical!

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?

If we hope to encourage and expand art education for older adults, then we must provide quality programs based on a thorough understanding of the needs, capabilities and interests of that population.
From: 00036
To: Sue Anne Lafferty <lafferty.16@osu.edu>
Date: Fri, 25 Jan 2002 11:22:41 -0800

Subject: Re: Adult Arts Education: Round IV Voting Sheet

Sue Anne, See below for my completed Round IV. I am looking forward to reading the results of your study.

Idea #1: Policy should be developed at the local, regional, and national levels
I would give this idea (5) points - the most promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   Very important. Given that policy guides action it is only when such policy is in place will we see a significant growth in public programs that affirm the arts as a part of life long learning.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   Very likely given that policy will guide action

Idea #3: Arts Administration Programs in higher education
I would give this idea (4) points - the next promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   With public policy supporting the arts within a life long learning process it becomes very important to have people available to implement policy. Given that most learning about the arts will take place beyond the school years, it is essential that arts administrators be prepared to implement arts education programs in a variety of community based settings.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   This issue has the potential to have significant impact given the wealth of cultural organizations and institutions that exist in the US.

Idea #2: Arts Education programs in higher education
I would give this idea (3) points.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   This idea is significant to preparing people to work with children and youth in such a way so that they can learn to appreciate the arts as a part of life long learning.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   Teaching children and youth to appreciate the arts as integral to lifelong learning will significantly influence their participation in arts after formal schooling as well as their appreciation of policy that supports life long participation in the arts.
Idea #2: Recognize that "older adults..."

I would give this idea (2) points.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   This idea gets at the importance of recognizing the cultural diversity inherent in older adults as well as in American society generally. This idea is foundational to who we are as a nation.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   Given changing demographics within the US and the growing importance of multicultural orientations to education, this idea will be very important.

Idea #4: Health professionals' education

I would give this idea (1) point.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   Health care is known to be vitally important to the American public. Public policy is not keeping up with American values, attitudes, and beliefs related to health care. Concurrently, alternative forms of treatment are emerging that are also valued by the American public. Participation in the arts shows promise in this regard. Professionals able to respond to this desire on the part of the American public will be influential. The need to prepare such professionals is vitally important.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   Given current attention directed to health care, my opinion is that this issue will have an impact.
Round IV: The Voting Ballot

From: 00037
To: "Sue Anne Lafferty" <lafferty.16@osu.edu>
Date: Tue, 12 Feb 2002 09:49:33 -0500

Subject: Re: Adult Arts Education: Round IV Voting Sheet

Idea #1: Higher Education/Academy – Training Professional Organizations/Development
Need a database or databases (web-based?) of programs/organizations at the local, regional, and national level to share innovative ideas and foster partnerships.

I would give this idea (5) points – the most promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Both theorists and practitioners are familiar with the concepts. What would immediately propel the movement forward is more visibility and greater awareness of what’s being done. It’s likely there is a lot of programming; it’s just not networked or coordinated.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
Many professionals would like to develop these programs, but need to see who else is doing them and how. A Clearinghouse of these programs provides a place to begin looking. Also, it provides a place for researchers to begin. This was the model used with the arts programs for at-risk youth. First Presidents Committee on the Arts and the Humanities/NALAA published “Coming Up Taller.” This brought greater awareness of these programs and more funding as well. The book was followed up with a web site (www.cominguptaller.org). This was followed up with a detailed research study on the efficacy of arts programs for at-risk youth (U.S. Department of Justice, National Endowment for the Arts, the cities of Atlanta/San Antonio/Portland, and Americans for the Arts).

Idea #7: Higher Education/Academy – Training Professional Organizations/Development
We should encourage some rigorous research programs that evaluate the benefits of the arts for older adults so that funding in this area would increase, jobs would be created and awareness could be increased on many different levels.

I would give this idea (4) points – the next promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Better programming, professional development, policy, and advocacy. This very easily could receive 5 points, but one needs to begin with a knowledge base of what exists. So, #7 is ranked second.
Quality research results in better programming, as there is a better understanding of what makes an effective program (funding, partnerships, program logistics, etc.). It also can give an area of study greater validity. Results in increased funding, as advocates have a potent tool. Also necessary for effective policy development. Right now this concept looks great and there’s lots of empirical evidence that it works. Quality data and information is needed to develop and evaluate public policy. The research is also helpful in bringing “outside” partners into this endeavor (e.g., AARP).
2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
Research will have a significant impact at all levels: increased programming, effective policy, and increased financial support.

Idea #3: Partnerships
Partnerships should be developed between arts organizations, arts education organizations and institutions and interest groups serving older adults – and adult education venues – senior centers, community education, university extension, Elderhostel -- for the purpose of advocating for arts programs for older adults.
I would give this idea (3) points.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Partnerships are an effective strategy in reaching a particular group. They can bring together a range of expertise and provide greater access to the audience in question. This results in the arts community providing greater and more comprehensive service (i.e., more effective service). This can also bring greater legitimacy and political clout with funders and policy makers. Again using AARP as an example, they are a top lobby entity. To have them carrying the banner of arts education is very potent.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
More effective programs at all levels.

Clarification, if any:
Develop capacity of parents/grandparents to reinforce arts learning of young people.

Strengths:
True
Multigenerational
Builds bonds among the generations
Excellent
Yes

Weaknesses:
Training is necessary to do this effectively

Idea #7: Participation – Incentives & Barriers
Barriers to participation in the arts need to be addressed. They include the fear of failure and the fear of entering "new social" spaces. Parents can be introduced to unfamiliar arts experiences via their children through school and community programs and older and retired adults could be initiated through College Alumni and Club events as well as senior and nursing home programs.
I would give this idea (2) points.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Studying barriers to participation is critical in developing effective policy and programs. Transportation, curtain times, size of print at an exhibition are all easily addressed.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
This will be good for arts organizations as they try to maintain and grow audiences.
Participation – Incentives & Barriers

Clarification, if any:
As long as what is meant & included by arts learning can be mutually agreed upon
Idea: Add public galleries and greenhouses to senior centers
Partnerships can insure demographic needs pre-requisite for funding resources
Strengths:
Good strategy
Yes, excellent
That would be great.
Emphasis on partnerships
Now this seems more realistic to me. Going where the older people are, taking art to them.
Weaknesses:

Idea #2: Public Policy
Federal, State, and local arts funding agencies as well as private foundations should be encouraged to create, implement, and evaluate funding initiatives that support arts education programs for older adults.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade? Once all of the above is done, this will take care of itself. It's really more of an outcome, but I thought it important not to omit. Funders should, and certainly have been encourage to create and support these programs. Advocates, practitioners, and theorists haven't had the tools to make much more than an impassioned case.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level? Should have impact at all levels.

Clarification, if any:
Funding sources such as state grassroots art grants can be utilized to support art programs for older adults.
Strengths:
True, well-stated
Excellent
Weaknesses:
We need to give them the information to do this regarding the benefits
I do not know what the federal and state governments should be involved in funding art education for older adults. However, local groups may want to get involved but not the government.
Round IV: The Voting Ballot

From: 00038
To: Sue Anne Lafferty lafferty.16@osu.edu
Date: Thu, 14 Mar 2002 15:13:11 -0500

Idea #2: Public Policy/Funding
Federal, State, and local arts funding agencies as well as private foundations should be encouraged to create, implement, and evaluate funding initiatives that support arts education programs for older adults.

I would give this idea (5) points – the most promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   This is a clear and concise statement of arts education policy goals and action items and why this is important for older adults.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   Two reasons: First and foremost, older adults vote! If lack of arts learning opportunities are perceived as a problem for older adults, and this is viewed as a policy issue involving both the public and private sector, I believe action will be taken to create a more unified policy position, particularly if lobbying groups such as the AARP become involved.

Idea #9: Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning
Arts education can help older adults develop new methods of expression or “voice” with which to engage in making meaning and integration of life experiences.

I would give this idea (4) points – the next promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   The arts role in helping citizens find meaning and give expression is one of the core public purposes the arts serve, particularly in a democratic society. That the arts do more than entertain and offer myriad ways that young and older citizens alike may engage making sense of the present, understanding the past and envisioning the future, is becoming better understood as part of life-long learning.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   After the events of September 11th, the arts role in making sense of our world is understood in a new light, witness the major network all responded jointly to the tragedy through a live arts broadcast. As time passes, the arts (and arts education) now move into a more participatory phase. Arts education and opportunities for arts learning are thus vital in meeting this need.

Idea #2: Defining Adults, Older Adults
Recognize that older adults are not a homogeneous group and target actions to a wide variety of... etc.

I would give this idea (3) points.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Given the broad demographic shifts and increased diversity in all aspects of our society, older adults should be viewed as an equally diverse population. Also given the recognition of an increasing wide array of learning styles, it is important to build such flexibility into our understanding of arts education, as well.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
I believe that the education mantra of President Bush and others of “reaching all kids” will increasingly become viewed as reaching “all learners.” If so, the issue of socio-economic, ethnic, racial and learning style diversity will become an important subject for all involved in arts education and programming.

Idea #5: Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning
Regardless of whether this is an aging society, adult arts education is part of the continuum of lifelong learning and development.
I would give this idea (2) points.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Learning is a lifelong process. Arts learning and education is slowly addressing this issue as it relates to both policy and practice.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
Again, if advocacy groups such as the AARP see this as an issue to be addressed, the issue will be part of the national dialogue on ensuring the vitality and mental, physical, and spiritual/physical fitness of older adults.

Idea #1: Higher Education/Academy—Training Professional Organizations/Development
Arts administration (and teacher training) programs in higher education should include courses that prepare them to create, implement, and evaluate programs for adult learners.
I would give this idea (1) point.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
As audiences age, arts organizations need ways to engage new generations who may not have the exact same interests and tastes as their elders. As studies such as Rand and the NEA’s SPPA suggest, it is crucial for arts and cultural organizations to constantly and honestly reassess and recreate their offerings to better meet audience needs.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
I don’t believe this will be as important for national, state or local policy makers as it will be for institutions on all those levels, particularly the state level, as national organizations have a wider following and local organization often are closer to their constituent base. Statewide organization often compete for the same dollars and the same potential audiences members, therefore, it is imperative for them and their staffs to have the needed training to keep their organizations vital. Also, having higher education involved in such training might help equalize the quality and understanding of the tools and skills needed in addressing the problem.
Round IV: The Voting Ballot

From: 00039
To: Sue Anne Lafferty <lafferty.16@osu.edu>
Date: Mon, 28 Jan 2002 10:12:27 -0700

Subject: Re: Adult Arts Education: Round IV Voting Sheet

Sue Anne-
Best Wishes with the DELPHI ROUND III information.

Postscript: Is it possible to base our LifeLong Learning publication upon your information & process. We typically publish a LLL proceedings at each professional conference. Your study has STATE-OF-THE-ART information that would benefit our NAEA-LLL membership attending the Miami conference.

Idea #4: Higher Education/Academy-Training Professional Organizations/Development
I would give this idea (5) points the most promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   a. NAEA has set up a LifeLong Learning affiliate among its membership and sponsors conferences/publications, etc.
   b. GOOD IDEAS need to be refined, articulated, discussed, evaluated, developed and then delivered to Artists and Art Educations sponsors locally, nationally and world-wide.
   c. Marketing and Distribution of GOOD IDEAS is the opportunity for the 21st Century.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   a. Partnerships among artists, art educators and art sponsors will DEFINE our 21st Century programs. Art History, Art Criticism, Art Aesthetics and Art Production issues need to be defined, articulated, discussed, evaluated, developed and then delivered.

Idea #4: Higher Education/Academy-Training Professional Organizations/Development
I would give this idea (4) points.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   a. There is the old debate about which comes first, marketing or organizing of local, regional, national and international art conferences (was the chicken or egg most important).
   b. Once the marketing scheme is in place, then the defining, articulating, discussion, evaluation and development of conference packages need to be developed.
   c. National and International conference packages will be the most important in the 21st Century.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   a. Partnership Development between NAEA, 2002 Cultural Olympiad will be as important in GREECE, ITALY & CHINA as they are in the 2002 Olympic/Paralympic hosted in Salt Lake City, Utah. The host site will change. The need for appropriate ART BASED content to market at these events will not change.
Idea #2: Effective Marketing

I would give this idea (3) points the next promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   a. Effective Marketing allows artists, Art Educators and Art Sponsors to find appropriate ART PARTNERSHIPS to market their artist, art education and art sponsorship offerings.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   a. Events like the 2002 Cultural Olympiad is Salt Lake City are examples of the need for ART PARTNERSHIPS to market their artist, art education and art sponsorship offerings.
   b. There will be more national and world-wide events in the 21st Century that will need to be carefully developed and marketed by organizations like NAEA: LifeLong Learning Affiliate, etc.

Idea #1: Arts in Healing/Art Therapy

I would give this idea (2) points.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   a. Howard Gardner's work with Project Zero identifies at least 5 IQ types that are directly or indirectly involved with ART HISTOY, AESTHETICS, PRODUCTION, CRITICISM, ETC. The potential of Arts in Healing/Art Therapy is well documented in clinical wellness centers. Erickson and others argue that DEVELOPMENTAL TAKS require decades of effort. There is no such thing as YOUTH ART or ADULT ART or SENIOR CITIZEN ART. There is only art that is prospective for the new artist/learner and retrospective for the already involved artist/learner.
   b. Involvement in art provides creative expression therapy, exploration of various art concepts/media, development of one's perceptions, allows expression of one's feelings, patterning of aesthetic and criticism, review of the patterned works, aesthetics and criticism of other art/learners.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   a. Art has a healing effect on humans. Based upon the increasing numbers and occurrences of SOCIAL & INDIVIDUAL MALADIES, the Healing Arts and Therapeutic Art-Based Activities are needed more in the 21st Century than ever before.

Idea #7: Role of the Arts, Art Education, and Arts Learning

I would give this idea (1) point.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   a. In the circle of life it is difficult to decide if a CONCEPT begins at a fixed point or ends. Either way, SELF DISCOVERY is the most important event of life. It is the quest of individuals, educational programs, institutions, communities, nations, cultures, etc. Finding and sustaining a SELF DISCOVERED theme is a wonderful quest.
   b. Work of Developmental Psychologists such as Howard Gardner and Erickson indicate that it requires decades of effort to identify and sustain IQ and DEVELOPMENTAL TASKS that define who we are.
2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?

a. What we do often defines WHO we are. Art Programs have tremendous potential in the area of SELF DISCOVERY & CREATIVE EXPRESSION as individuals and institutions try to establish and maintain their identities.

b. Involvement in art provides creative expression therapy, exploration of various art concepts/media, development of one's perceptions, allows expression of one's feelings, patterning of aesthetic and criticism, review of the patterned works, aesthetics and criticism of other art/learners.
Round IV: The Voting Ballot

From: 00040
Date: Thursday, January 24, 2001

Subject: Re: Adult Arts Education: Round IV Voting Sheet

Idea #1: Public Policy – Funding for Adult Art Education
I would give this idea (5) points – the most promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   At the heart of it all.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   Depends on those we elect to leadership positions.

Idea #2: Higher Education/Academy-Training Professional Organizations/Development
I would give this idea (4) points – the next most promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   Critical to prepare future art teachers re leaders to teach learning & teaching

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   As more are thus educated pressure will build!

Idea #3: Higher Education/Academy-Training Professional Organizations/Development
I would give this idea (3) points –

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   Critical re: sharing ideas beyond local concerns

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   As ideas fan out many will jump on board

Idea #4: Higher Education/Academy-Training Professional Organizations/Development
I would give this idea (2) points –

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   VIP NAEA is behind in expanding beyond K-12 concerns alone

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   It must attend to this OR fall behind!

Idea #2: Participation and Incentives
I would give this idea (1) point

300
1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade? It calls for inclusion – leaving no one out

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   We must do this to bring everyone along or else
Round IV: The Voting Ballot

From: 00042
Date: Saturday, January 26, 2001

Subject: Re: Adult Arts Education: Round IV Voting Sheet

Idea #3: Defining Adults, Older Adult Art Education
I would give this idea (5) points – the most promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   Very. It deals with individual differences among learners, the need for teachers to be
   providing learning experience that are attuned to the personalities and levels of skills in the
   students

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local
   level?
   It is not an “issue” but deals with the characteristics of the population to be served.

Idea #3: Participation – Barriers & Incentives
I would give this idea (4) points – the next most promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   It deals with providing access to sites in which learning takes place.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local
   level?
   If the logistics of bringing the target population to the sites where learning can take place are
   not in place, nothing can succeed.

Idea #4: Higher Education/Academy-Training Professional Organizations/Development
I would give this idea (3) points –

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   It can set things in motion and give support and direction to the development of a nation-wide
   program.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local
   level?
   If it is carried out its effect will be powerful.

Idea #2: Partnerships
I would give this idea (2) points –

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   Community support and the availability of funds are essential in launching large-scale
   progress.
2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level? The success of this approach is likely to inspire many communities to adopt it.

Idea #10: The Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning
I would give this idea (1) point

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade? It looks beyond the effect on individuals to the larger impact on society.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level? The impact could not be easily observed. However, changing individuals and their views of people from diverse backgrounds and cultures will have a powerful effect on society.
Here I felt one's philosophy and belief are first in importance and then developing a means of carrying this out with real people!

Idea #1: Public Policy – Funding for Adult Art Education
I would give this idea (5) points – the most promising idea.

Policy should be developed at local, regional, and national levels that affirm the importance of art's education as life-long learning, etc.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Very – not all schools require art now but a few more are beginning to each year – let alone seeing need for art for adults! Have to establish policy.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
It has to start on the local level to get support at state and then national level.

Idea #8: The Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning
I would give this idea (4) points – the next most promising idea.

Involvement in arts/crafts provide a means for creative expression of ...materials and concepts, developing one's perception – art...expression of feelings and aesthetic taste and avoids being bored, etc.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
We must let people know what arts can do for them – all these things should sell the idea of importance of art expression.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
People should be told what arts can do for them -- you do this often there is a local, state, national policy that supports it.

Idea #6: The Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning
I would give this idea (3) points –

Art adds life to years by encouraging self-expression, finding emotional release, etc. allows us to be alive as long as we are alive.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Again, we are selling the importance of art expression – what it can do for every person.
2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
Like no. 4, it will take time to get this across, get people to really try it. I would think it would have impact. #3 & #4 are both concerned with “selling” the importance of creating art and convincing the older adult that this will make him/her have a more of acting, meaningful life.

Idea #3: Defining Adults, Older Adult Art Education
I would give this idea (2) points –

The range within a group of older adults is considerable -- teachers need to understand how to bring creative expression out, help them achieve their goals and art works.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Very important after we have wont them over -- as to the importance of art expression in #3 & #4.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
If you have excellent teachers, the adult students will be extremely supportive of the program of adult art expression and expression from the cradle to the grave.

Idea #5: Participation: Incentives & Barriers
I would give this idea (1) point

Addresses financial barriers to participation.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
You must make adult art classes affordable. If they can’t afford it all the theory and practice in the world will go by the way side and never be tried or used.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
This depends upon how good a sales person you are who is trying to implement the program.

Several other items I feel are important: #15, page 8: The Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning #24, page 11 The Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning #28, page 12 The Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning #4, page 14 Higher Education/Academy/Prof’l Orgn #1, page 19 Participation: Incentives & Barriers #2, page 22 Partnerships
Round IV: The Voting Ballot

From: 00044
To: "lafferty.16@osu.edu" <lafferty.16@osu.edu>
Date: Sat, 26 Jan 2002 12:39:44 -0800

Subject: Re: Adult Arts Education: Round IV Voting Sheet

Idea # 3: Partnerships
I would give this idea (5) points – the most promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Very important. Partnerships will be key to progress in arts education at all levels. Adult arts education has only scratched the surface of building partnerships. This is odd, I think, because adult arts education has so many opportunities for building partnerships, because it can find points of contact and overlap with organizations in all sorts of institutions—senior centers, community education, etc., as well as health organizations.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
Strong likelihood. I think most partnerships will take place at the local level, but with encouragement and support from national organizations ranging from NAEA and Americans for the Arts to AARP and ElderHostel.

Idea # 1: Public Policy – Funding for Adult Art Education
I would give this idea (4) points – the next promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Policy attention is often necessary for an issue to receive public recognition and discussion. Policy development need not mean extensive funding, but it can place an issue on radar screens.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
Likelihood is hard to gauge. But, it seems to me, adult arts education now has a unique policy window to gain attention. All arts policy has become arts education policy. And most arts education policy is workforce development policy. Add to this the inexorable aging of America. Given these conditions, if adult arts education can't get some public attention over the next decade, it never will.

Idea # 2: Defining Adults, Older Adult Art Education
I would give this idea (3) points.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
This idea should and must undergrid all partnerships, policies, and programs that will be developed in the next decade. While the world of cultural production is rapidly consolidating, such consolidation can only survive if providers of products and services can identify and serve niche markets. Yes, older adults are not a homogenous group, especially as the %'s of
healthy, active seniors increases. Those who remember this will succeed in an increasingly privatized system of cultural production.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   This issue will have significant impacts at all levels and in all settings.

**Idea #2: Higher Education/Academy – Training Professional Organizations/Development**

I would give this idea (2) points.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   Very important. Such training will be needed to effectively stimulate and satisfy demand for adult arts education. Also, in an environment where there will surely be plenty of “providers” of adult arts education with little or no training to do so, university training can help to set and maintain standards of quality in arts education.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   It will mostly have impacts in university settings, but gradually will lead to improvements in program quality at national, state, and local levels.

**Idea #26: The Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning**

I would give this idea (1) point.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   Even if the improvements in partnerships, policies, and training cited above, there will still need to be venues through which to deliver adult arts education. Formal/institutional and independent/community-based are both necessary, especially given the diversity of the older adult population.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   Impacts will be greatest at local level.

I was a bit unclear on the numbering scheme. Hope the above makes sense. If not, let me know. Good luck on the project as you proceed.
From: 00046
Date: Thursday, January 24, 2002

Subject: Re: Adult Arts Education: Round IV Voting Sheet

Idea #26: The Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning

I would give this idea (5) points – the most promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   Critical who will support the arts in all K-12 school curriculum NOT the current senior folks!
   But 40+ and new seniors who have had a chance to learn the arts recently can impact a
   schools curriculum.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local
   level?
   In my locality, an Eastern large city, our public schools are in big trouble. Privatization is
   becoming a larger option for more families, even lower income ones: Private schools are
   more flexible than large public school systems.

Idea #5: Higher Education/Academy – Training Professional Organizations/Development

I would give this idea (4) points – the next most promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   There is no other well connected and solvent organizations, as large as NAEA that can speak
   for adult art learning advocacy!!

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local
   level?
   If you are in this research, you care! We must all care enough to keep LLL going strong in
   NAEA.

Idea #10: Higher Education/Academy – Training Professional Organizations/Development

I would give this idea (3) points –

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   Unless NAEA will support a new research publication or someone knows of another
   publisher going for this type of anthology???

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local
   level?
   Could have if someone of us has connections to the White House. What are the causes of the
   1st and 2nd ladies? Afghan ladies crafts? How many adult art learners do these women know?
   National issue themes? How many of those learners have chooses to use? Exhibited yet?
   Yes!! (Note to Sue Anne: Would you like to get this going?)

Idea #2: Partnerships

I would give this idea (2) points –
1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Very critical unless Congress gives more money to cultural arts and education --

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
My opinion is that its already there for graphic arts learning – persons in their 40s. Many work-force re-entry people are seeking education in this area by taking adult continuing education classes in computer graphics.

Idea #4: Public Policy – Funding for Adult Art Education
I would give this idea (1) point

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Perhaps the only way to fund programs in adult learning schools and community centers in smaller towns.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
Could work well if the mayor or governor’s advisors on this include art educators committed to lifelong learning in the arts.
Round IV: The Voting Ballot

From: 00048
Date: Wednesday, January 30, 2002

Subject: Re: Adult Arts Education: Round IV Voting Sheet

Idea #1: Partnerships

I would give this idea (5) points – the most promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Never enough to go around so partnerships are essential financially. But arts can and should cross boundaries (age, gender, racial, ethnic, socio-economic).

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
Partnering entities have to see benefits and then support fully.

Idea #4: Participation

I would give this idea (4) points – the next most promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Public art helps to connect us was well as realize that arts are essential to our quality of life.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
Potential is enormous but public art can also be devisive (sp?).

Idea #2: Defining Adults, Older Adult Art Education

I would give this idea (3) points –

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Many approaches needed to reach diverse group

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
Essential concept in all of education, health care, social policy, etc. – the national debate related to growing older population

Idea #28: The Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning

I would give this idea (2) points –

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Building on what already exists is practical.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
Art educators carry some responsibility for arts funding always being cut – they allow (and insist) on being separate. Becoming integrated means giving up a bit of independence but gaining broader acceptance.

Idea #1: Intergenerational
I would give this idea (1) point

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Large trend in older adult education this decade

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
Separating generations (and resources) leads to hoarding resources and arguments about generational equity – a fight where everyone loses.
Round IV: The Voting Ballot

From: 00050
Date: Thursday, February 7, 2002

Subject: Re: Adult Arts Education: Round IV Voting Sheet

Idea #3: The Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning
I would give this idea (5) points – the most promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   This is vital to the development in the arts knowledge and skills of our whole population, not just the educated few. Arts should be a part of life, not a sometime thing.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   It is becoming more prevalent than it was, but it is slow. As we educate children more, they will continue to work in the arts as they mature.

Idea #2: Arts in Healing/Art Therapy
I would give this idea (4) points – the next most promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   Very important – arts education should be diverse enough to provide opportunities for exploration

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   About 50% – the four areas of painting, drawing, sculpture, and printmaking will always take precedence.

Idea #10: The Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning
I would give this idea (3) points –

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   Critical to appreciation of diverse cultures and of pride of heritage as well as acceptance of others

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   If successful, the arts are bridges to worldwide acceptance and peaceful co-existence. This is a powerful tool for worldwide acceptance

Idea #19: The Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning
I would give this idea (2) points –

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   We all search for ways to communicate. The arts provide additional means to convey feelings, knowledge, and concepts.
2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   It may be an uphill battle, but we have to come far from where we began. We need to keep moving forward.

Idea#22: The Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning
   I would give this idea (1) point

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   The more we can conclude old issues, unload old concerns, and resolve old issues the more we are able to move forward to new concerns.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   This won’t be easy, which is why it is the last choice. As humans, we tend to hold on to old grudges, hurts and prejudices. It is easier to do this than to forgive, or to admit we might have been wrong. Art is the best way to bring emotions out, and to resolve them in safe ways, so it is worthwhile to keep trying to bring about a change.
Round IV: The Voting Ballot

From: 00051
Date: Thursday, January 24, 2002

Subject: Re: Adult Arts Education: Round IV Voting Sheet

Idea #16 & #5: The Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning
I would give this idea (5) points – the most promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Lifelong learning and education are critical.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
Don't know....

Idea #4: Participation: Incentives & Barriers
I would give this idea (4) points – the next most promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Extremely – art education can provide the forum for sense of community

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
Pretty good I would think

Idea #1: Intergenerational
I would give this idea (3) points –

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Again – Art education can connect people, spaces, and communities

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
Good

Idea #23: The Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning
I would give this idea (2) points –

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Strong community and society are essential

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
Very good

Idea#26: The Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning
I would give this idea (1) point

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade? 
   Very important

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level? 
   Given the economic situation – don’t know?
Round IV: The Voting Ballot

From: 00052
Date: Thursday, January 24, 2002

Subject: Re: Adult Arts Education: Round IV Voting Sheet

Idea #2: Defining Adults, Older Adult Art Education
I would give this idea (5) points – the most promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
It is very important if arts education for older adults is going to ‘make it’ and receive the respect it should get. It needs to be based in sound theory.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
It should help define programs (educational) and then should guide the actual practice. Funding decisions at all 3 levels should be influenced by this and on an individual (local) level – success will depend on it.

Idea #9: The Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning
I would give this idea (4) points – the next most promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
It is central as we move from a disease model of aging to a health model of aging.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
Major impact at all 3 levels will be determined by funding decisions. Since it is based in such strong theory it is very likely to have an impact.

Idea #21: The Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning
I would give this idea (3) points –

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Crucial – if older adults do not feel comfortable, learning and ‘doing’ then the whole concept falls apart and the chances for true healthy living diminish.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
Again, because of the health model of aging and the growth in retirement communities, more adults will have the opportunity to come ‘on board’ – so I believe it is very likely, especially at the local level.

Idea #2: Higher Education/Academy – Training Professional Organizations/Development
I would give this idea (2) points –

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Unless this happens, the impact will be very short-term.

316
2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   If implemented the impact will be huge and health status will increase. However, I think the likelihood of it happening isn’t good.

Idea #7: Higher Education/Academy – Training Professional Organizations/Development
   I would give this idea (1) point

   1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
      Crucial – the key to it all

   2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
      If studies are funded and rigorously completed, the impact of this will be the greatest and the longest. It will also be critical for the field to continue to evolve. However, the others need to come first --

Thank you for the opportunity to participate!
Round IV: The Voting Ballot

FROM: 00053
To: Sue Anne Lafferty <lafferty.16@osu.edu>
Date: Thu, 24 Jan 2002 15:24:19 -0500

Subject: Re: Adult Arts Education: Round IV Voting Sheet

NOTE: The idea numbers were not unique, that is, they were repeated within each theme/idea section, so I put the whole text in to be clear about which one I meant.

Idea #2: Defining Adults, Older Adult Arts Education
Recognize that "older adults" are not a homogenous group and target actions tailored to a wide variety of income levels, educational attainment, cultural backgrounds, health conditions, and previous exposure to the arts (#3 in "Defining Adults, Older Adult Arts Education" is closely related to this)

I would give this idea (5) points – the most promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Population diversity will continue to increase (on many levels—ethnictiy, culture, income, etc.) and the large numbers of older adults in the population in the coming decade cannot be treated as a monolithic group in arts education planning and development.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
Local impact will vary due to the demographics of any given area. The national and state levels can foster awareness and disseminate policy and information for targeting arts education.

Idea #3: Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Arts Learning
Many if not most of the statements about the role of arts education are true across the life span, not just for older adults. Although targeted marketing is important to widen participation, it should be done within the 'big picture' context of the life-span continuum. (Idea #5 from "Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Arts Learning" is closely related)

I would give this idea (4) points – the next promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Although targeted marketing is important with increasing diversity, it must be balanced within this life-span, big picture context or arts education efforts will become fragmented and isolated. And not just a "life-span" context but an "arts-span" context—across all of the arts, not just the ones that get the most attention and funding.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?

Idea #9: Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Arts Learning
Arts education can help older adults develop new methods of expression or "voice" with which to engage in meaning making and integration of life experiences (# 11 and #22 from “Role of the
Arts, Arts Education, Arts Learning” and #2 from “Arts in Healing/Art Therapy” are closely related)

I would give this idea (3) points.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
As the population ages, Erik Erikson’s concept of generativity should become more important and the arts are a critical vehicle for the integration processes involved.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?

Idea #5: Participation: Incentives and Barriers
Address financial barriers to participation - for example, Iowa’s ICARD discount program for low-income groups – Cost is an issue. (from “”)

I would give this idea (2) points.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Economics are always an issue in educational participation, as research consistently shows higher education and income levels associated with higher participation in adult education.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?

Idea #2: Partnerships
Start building a program of partnerships for learning, teaching and practising in Art Education for Adults, between the widest possible range of public and private agencies and institutions - business, industry and commerce, governments (local, state and federal), banks and financial houses of all kinds, Veterans Organisations, the Defense and Armed Forces, Ethnic Community Organisations and Clubs (especially Rotary, Lions, Buffaloes and Alumni organisations, etc.), with the aim of jointly funding, sponsoring and providing not only Arts Educators in residence but also the building or conversion of older buildings and facilities, into places where Art Education For Adults can be provided and practiced. Use the idea and motto of "Decent Corporate Citizenship".

I would give this idea (1) point.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
Collaboration has increasingly become a theme in many areas of education, not only to extend and share scarce resources but also to bring together the viewpoints of many stakeholders and reduce the fragmented efforts of groups working in isolation. Both the economic and holistic aspects of this issue should continue to be important in the future.

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
All three levels must find creative ways to leverage their resources and have a stronger collective voice, so partnerships should remain necessary.
Round IV: The Voting Ballot

From: 00056
To: lafferty.16@osu.edu
Date: Mon, 11 Feb 2002 09:12:34 -0500

Subject: Re: Adult Arts Education: Round IV Voting Sheet

Idea #6: The Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning
I would give this idea (5) points – the most promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   Yes, very, art does add years to life and life to years

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?

Idea #2: Arts in Healing/Art Therapy
I would give this idea (4) points – the next promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   Life review is extremely important and all should be trained in its techniques

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   On the local level it could have impact.

Idea #7: The Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning
I would give this idea (3) points.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   Yes, self expression is extremely important

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   Could impact all three

Idea #10: The Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning
I would give this idea (2) points.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   Arts can be a bridge

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   Could impact all three.
Idea #19: The Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning
I would give this idea (1) point.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?
   Important.
2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
   Could be significant.

NOTE: I FOUND THIS EXERCISE DIFFICULT AND SOMEWHAT ARBITRARY.
APPENDIX J: DESCRIPTION OF VOTING BALLOT BY ROLE – RANKS AND THEMES
### Description of Voting Ballot Responses by Role -- Ranks and Themes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>THEMES</th>
<th>Arts Administrator, Community Development, Education</th>
<th>Arts Administrator, Business, Service</th>
<th>Arts Educator</th>
<th>Gerontologist</th>
<th>Adult Educator</th>
<th>Older Adult, Retired</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Arts Role -- Art Education's Value</td>
<td>000056 (5)</td>
<td>000044 (1)</td>
<td>000046 (5)</td>
<td>000050 (5)</td>
<td>000046b</td>
<td>000043b</td>
<td>000043b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(30%) #1</td>
<td>000038 (4)</td>
<td>000043 (4)</td>
<td>000045 (3)</td>
<td>000051 (5)</td>
<td>000048 (2)</td>
<td>000053 (4)</td>
<td>000053 (3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>000056 (3)</td>
<td>000039b</td>
<td>000052 (4)</td>
<td>000052 (3)</td>
<td>000046b</td>
<td>000053 (3)</td>
<td>000053 (3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>000038 (2)</td>
<td>000039b</td>
<td>000052 (3)</td>
<td>000050 (3)</td>
<td>000048 (2)</td>
<td>000053 (3)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>000056 (2)</td>
<td>000039 (1)</td>
<td></td>
<td>000051 (2)</td>
<td>000046b</td>
<td>000053 (3)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>000056 (1)</td>
<td>000050 (1)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>000046b</td>
<td>000053 (3)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Higher Education/ Professional Organization</td>
<td>000037 (5)</td>
<td>000044 (2)</td>
<td>000035 (5)</td>
<td>000039 (5)</td>
<td>000035b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(21.25%) #2</td>
<td>000036 (4)</td>
<td></td>
<td>000039b</td>
<td>000039 (4)</td>
<td>000046b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>000037 (4)</td>
<td></td>
<td>000040 (4)</td>
<td>000052 (2)</td>
<td>000046b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>000036 (3)</td>
<td></td>
<td>000040 (4)</td>
<td></td>
<td>000046b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>000038 (1)</td>
<td></td>
<td>000040 (3)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>000035b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Defining Adults, Older Adults (target population)</td>
<td>000038 (3)</td>
<td>000044 (3)</td>
<td>000042 (5)</td>
<td>000052 (5)</td>
<td>000035 (5)</td>
<td>000043 (3)</td>
<td>000043b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(11.25%) #3</td>
<td>000036 (2)</td>
<td></td>
<td>000043 (2)</td>
<td>000052 (2)</td>
<td>000035 (5)</td>
<td>000043 (3)</td>
<td>000043b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>000035 (1)</td>
<td></td>
<td>000035 (5)</td>
<td>000043 (3)</td>
<td>000043b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>000035 (5)</td>
<td>000043 (3)</td>
<td>000043b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>000035 (5)</td>
<td>000043 (3)</td>
<td>000043b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>000035 (5)</td>
<td>000043 (3)</td>
<td>000043b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Policy</td>
<td>000036 (5)</td>
<td>000044 (4)</td>
<td>000040 (5)</td>
<td>000035b</td>
<td>000046b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(10%) #4</td>
<td>000038 (5)</td>
<td></td>
<td>000043 (5)</td>
<td>000046b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>000037 (1)</td>
<td></td>
<td>000035 (4)</td>
<td>000046b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partnerships</td>
<td>000037 (3)</td>
<td>000044 (5)</td>
<td>000035 (3)</td>
<td>000048 (5)</td>
<td>000035b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(10%) #5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>000035 (2)</td>
<td>000048 (5)</td>
<td>000035b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>000042 (2)</td>
<td>000048 (5)</td>
<td>000035b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>000046 (2)</td>
<td>000048 (5)</td>
<td>000035b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
<td>000035b</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

323
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participation: Incentives &amp; Barriers (8.75%) #6</th>
<th>00037 (2)</th>
<th>00042 (4)</th>
<th>00040 (1)</th>
<th>00043 (1)</th>
<th>00051 (4)</th>
<th>00048 (4)</th>
<th>00040b</th>
<th>00043b</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Arts in Healing/Art Therapy (5%) #7</td>
<td>00056 (4)</td>
<td>00039 b</td>
<td>00050 (4)</td>
<td>00056</td>
<td>00039 (2)</td>
<td>00051 (3)</td>
<td>00048 (1)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intergenerational (2.50%) #8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing/Audience Development (1.25%) #9</td>
<td></td>
<td>00039b</td>
<td>00039 (3)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Programs (0%) #10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*NOTE: Respondent #’s with (b) after them reference respondents that listed secondary professional roles and are marked to show breakdown participants that listed secondary roles for themselves – ranks only counted under primary role*
APPENDIX K: FINAL VOTES OF STAKEHOLDERS (Based on Role)
## Final Votes of Stakeholders (Based on Roles)

### IDEA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>00034: Arts Educator</th>
<th>Declined to list “votes”</th>
<th>Top Five Votes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5 points for <em>most promising</em> vote, 4 points to the next promising vote, and 3, 2, and 1 point(s) to the third, fourth, and fifth-best ideas.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>LP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00035: Arts Education; Adult Educator; Older Adult – Retired; Other: Artist</td>
<td>Idea #5: Higher Education/Professional Organizations</td>
<td>LP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Idea #2: Public Policy – Funding for Adult Art Education</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Idea #2: Partnerships – Artist-in Residence</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Idea #3: Partnerships – Aging Network</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Idea #2: Defining Adults, Older Adults</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00036: Arts Administration Educator</td>
<td>Idea #1: Public Policy – Funding for Adult Arts Education</td>
<td>LP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Idea #3: Higher Education/Professional Organizations</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Idea #2: Higher Education/Professional Organizations</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Idea #2: Defining Adults, Older Adults</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Idea #4: Arts in Healing/Art Therapy</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00037: Arts Administrator, Community Development, Education</td>
<td>00038: Arts Administrator, Community Development, Education</td>
<td>00039: Gerontologist; Arts Educator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #1: Higher Education/Professional Organizations</td>
<td>Idea #7: Higher Education/Professional Organizations</td>
<td>Idea #1: Higher Education/Professional Organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #7: Higher Education/Professional Organizations</td>
<td>Idea #3: Partnerships</td>
<td>Idea #7: Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Art Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #3: Partnerships</td>
<td>Idea #7: Participation – Incentives &amp; Barriers</td>
<td>Idea #2: Defining Adults, Older Adults</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #2: Public Policy – Funding for Adult Arts Education</td>
<td>Idea #9: Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Art Learning</td>
<td>Idea #5 Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Art Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Idea #2: Public Policy/Funding</td>
<td>Idea #1: Higher Education/Professional Organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LP</th>
<th>MP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

327
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Idea #3: Defining Adults, Older Adults</th>
<th>LP</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Idea #3: Participation – Barriers &amp; Incentives</td>
<td>MP</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #4: Higher Education/Academy-Training Professional Organizations/Development</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #2: Partnerships</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #10: Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #1: Public Policy – Funding for Adult Art Education</td>
<td>LP</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #8: Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning</td>
<td>MP</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #6: Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #3: Defining Adults, Older Adults</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #5: Participation: Incentives &amp; Barriers</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #3: Partnerships</td>
<td>LP</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #1: Public Policy – Funding for Adult Art Education</td>
<td>MP</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #2: Defining Adults, Older Adults</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #2: Higher Education/Professional Organizations</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #26: Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #26: Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning</td>
<td>LP</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #5: Higher Education/Professional Organizations</td>
<td>MP</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #10: Higher Education/Professional Organizations</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #2: Partnerships</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #4: Public Policy – Funding for Adult Art Education</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #1: Partnerships</td>
<td>LP</td>
<td>MP</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #4: Participation: Incentives &amp; Barriers</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #2: Defining Adults, Older Adults</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #28: Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #1: Intergenerational</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Idea #3: Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning</th>
<th>LP</th>
<th>MP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Idea #2: Arts in Healing/Art Therapy</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #10: Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #19: Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #22: Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Idea #16: Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning</th>
<th>LP</th>
<th>MP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Idea #4: Participation: Incentives &amp; Barriers</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #1: Intergenerational</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #23: Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #26: Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Idea #2: Defining Adults, Older Adults</th>
<th>LP</th>
<th>MP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Idea #9: Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #21: Role of the Arts, Art Education, Arts Learning</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #2: Higher Education/Professional Organizations</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #7: Higher Education/Professional Organizations</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0003: Other – Research; Adult Educator; Arts Participant</td>
<td>LP</td>
<td>MP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #2: Defining Adults, Older Adults</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #3: Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Arts Learning</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #9: Role of the Arts, Arts Education, Arts Learning</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #5: Participation: Incentives and Barriers</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #2: Partnerships</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>0003: Other – Research; Adult Educator</th>
<th>LP</th>
<th>MP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Declined to participate in final voting round</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #6: Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #2: Arts in Healing/Art Therapy</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #7: Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #10: Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idea #19: Role of the Arts, Art Education, Art Learning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#Respondents</td>
<td>Ranks</td>
<td>Theme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Arts role. Arts Education, Arts Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Arts role. Arts Education, Arts Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Arts role. Arts Education, Arts Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Arts role. Arts Education, Arts Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Arts role. Arts Education, Arts Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>24</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Higher Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Higher Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Higher Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Higher Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Higher Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>17</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Public Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Public Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Public Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>8</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Defining Adults, Older Adults</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Defining Adults, Older Adults</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Defining Adults, Older Adults</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Defining Adults, Older Adults</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>9</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Partnerships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Partnerships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Partnerships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Partnerships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>8</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>7</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Arts in Healing/Art Therapy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Arts in Healing/Art Therapy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>----------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Arts in Healing/Art Therapy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Intergenerational</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Intergenerational</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Marketing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ATTACHMENT A: DELPHI PILOT CORRECTIONS
DELPHI Pilot corrections for Final DELPHI

Due to the outcome of the pilot for this study and my follow-up readings, I reframed the following formats: 1) initial contact, and 2) items of my questionnaires: Have a formal letter sent from my advisor, Dr. Hutchens, announcing the study and asking for their participation via post mail, at least a week prior my own formal letter invitation*. This will then be followed by an email, which includes Round I (See layout in Attachment B: Initial Format of Questionnaires: Rounds I, II, III, and IV. *Include the Geographic and Professional Role assessment with the initial contact. Throughout the pilot, each questionnaire had the same three directive questions atop it. I would like to reformat it to press the participants to redefine the issues towards future impact, focusing on the role of the arts and future action. Thus, narrowing it down to two questions. (See Attachment B for complete view of reformatting):

Delphi pilot, Rounds I, II, III:
- In an aging society, what role does adult arts education play?
- What role do the arts play in older adult lifelong learning?
- What action could be taken to involve older adults in the arts?

Change to:

Delphi Final, Rounds I, II, III:
- In an aging society, what role does adult arts education play? and
- What action could be taken to involve older adults in the arts?

Delphi Final Voting Round to include:
- How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade? and
- What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?

My thought after the pilot was that these changes would fine tune the instrument, and be more specific. Initially, some pilot participants felt having three questions was misleading or too broad. By starting out with the role and action questions, this leads to a natural progression of the issues of importance and impact through the three rounds. It will also force the group to narrow the field with each round, especially prior to voting. The reformatted version offers a more direct approach.
ATTACHMENT B: INITIAL FORAM OF QUESTIONNAIRES
ROUNDS I, II, III, and IV
Round 1: Questionnaire 1

Date: Sun, 28 Oct 2001 09:22:21 -0500
To: ____
From: Sue Anne Lafferty <lafferty.16@osu.edu>
Subject: Adult Arts Education: Round 1: Questionnaire

Hello! I hope this finds you well. I would like to thank you for becoming a participant in my study. I appreciated your kind note and support for my research. It has been a lonely journey in a heavily K-12 focused department. The recent encouragement expressed by participants in this study has been quite rewarding!

As stated in the introductory material you received with your invitation to participate, this process will involve 3 rounds of questionnaires, with a final third questionnaire leading to a rating of the ideas expressed by the group. All of your responses will be shared anonymously each round. To respond to the below questionnaire:

1. Touch “Reply” command on your computer, enter your response, and touch “Send” upon completion

   If need be, there are additional ways to respond to this questionnaire:

2. Print this message and return it with your answers through COD service mail:
   PO Box 141436, Columbus, OH 43214 or
3. Print this message and return with your answers via fax: (614) 688-4483, OSU Art Education Department

I look forward to your input and participation. Please let me know throughout the process of any concerns, problems with attachments, and/or questions you may have. Again, thank you in advance for your valuable contributions & enjoy this process! Regards, Sue Anne

[QUESTIONNAIRE STARTS HERE]

DELPHI Questionnaire 1

The purpose of this questionnaire is to elicit your input, ideas on exploring the issue of involvement of older adults and the arts.

In an aging society, what role does adult arts education play?

AND/OR

What action could be taken to involve older adults in the arts?

Please brainstorm as many ideas as possible for dealing with the above issues. List each idea in a brief, concise manner and email your responses to me. Please keep each idea to one brief sentence or phrase and do not try to justify at this stage. Your ideas will be anonymously included in the follow-up questionnaire. There is no limit maximum or minimum of ideas.

Idea #1:

Idea #2:
Idea #3:

Idea #4:

Idea #5:

Idea #6:

Idea #7:

Idea #8:

Idea #9:

Idea #10:

Etc.

To Send your results, touch “Reply” command on your computer, enter your responses, and touch “Send” upon completion.

Thanks!

Contact Information:
Sue Anne Lafferty, PhD Candidate
Art Education Department, The Ohio State University
PO Box 141436, Columbus, OH 43214
Telephone: 614.783.8163
E-mail: lafferty.16@osu.edu
Round II: Questionnaire 2

Date: Tue, 20 Nov 2001 16:13:26 -0500
To: home
From: Sue Anne Lafferty <lafferty.16@osu.edu>
Subject: Adult Arts Education: Round II Questionnaire

Hello. It is that time again...Delphi Round II. Thank you for your wonderful insight, ideas in Round I, and for keeping on schedule! Please do not let this list of ideas overwhelm you. It is a long list. Round II involves identification and clarification (if need be) of initial brainstorming ideas and the first step in identifying key themes, ideas that will most likely lead the group to consensus in the remaining round.

Due to this being a holiday week, I have extended the return deadline to December 10. Hopefully this will accommodate your busy schedule.

Please let me know if you have any questions.

Take care,
Sue Anne

**DELPHI Questionnaire 2**

This questionnaire's purpose is to report all the ideas generated in Round I/Questionnaire 1 and to solicit new ideas, if any, for dealing with the issue of involvement of older adults and the arts.

*In an aging society, what role does adult arts education play? (48 ideas)*
*What action could be taken to involve older adults in the arts? (67 ideas)*

Please review the list. You can clarify an idea -- ask a question of someone else's idea, or add, change an idea. It is up to you how you decide to review -- all of the ideas, only key points you want to address, etc. Naturally, some ideas will land in the "parking lot" of ideas, as is common in most focus groups. Other ideas will be incorporated to others, or stand alone. Thus, use the following format:

i.e. **Clarification, if any:** Please clarify question or add additional points, if need be, to your ideas & others

- **Strengths:** List strengths & weaknesses of any, all generated ideas
- **Weaknesses:**

There are a few duplicates in the list -- note combinations or redirect if desire. Please include any new ideas at the bottom of the questionnaire and comment on their strengths & weaknesses, too. Your ideas will be anonymously included in the next and final round.

To respond to the below questionnaire:

1. Touch "Reply" command on your computer, enter your response, and touch "Send" upon completion
**Note, I have also attached the questionnaire as a word document** -- some may prefer to respond in that format. Please respond into the document, save, and send attachment via e-mail.

If need be, there are additional ways to respond to this questionnaire:

- **Print this message and return it with your answers through COD service mail:**
  PO Box 141436, Columbus, OH 43214 or
- **Print this message and return with your answers via fax:** (614) 688-4483, OSU Art Education Department

(Questionnaire 2 Starts Here)

**Round 1 IDEAS:**

*In an aging society, what role does adult arts Education play?*

1. Clarification, if any:
   Ø Strengths:
   Ø Weaknesses:

2. Clarification, if any:
   Ø Strengths:
   Ø Weaknesses:

3. Clarification, if any:
   Ø Strengths:
   Ø Weaknesses:

4. Clarification, if any:
   Ø Strengths:
   Ø Weaknesses:

5. Clarification, if any:
   Ø Strengths:
   Ø Weaknesses:

6. Clarification, if any:
   Ø Strengths:
   Ø Weaknesses:

New Ideas, if any:

340
Again, please include any new ideas here and comment on their strengths & weaknesses, too. All ideas will be anonymously included in the next and final round.

#1:
§ Strengths:
§ Weaknesses:

#2:
§ Strengths:
§ Weaknesses:

#3:
§ Strengths:
§ Weaknesses:

#4:
§ Strengths:
§ Weaknesses:

#5:
§ Strengths:
§ Weaknesses:

PLEASE RETURN PRIOR TO DECEMBER 10TH!
Round III Questionnaire 3 and Round IV

Delivered-To: orb-lafferty.16@osu.edu
X-Sender: lafferty.16@pop.service.ohio-state.edu
X-Mailer: QUALCOMM Windows Eudora Version 5.1
Date: Mon, 07 Jan 2002 16:29:19 -0500
To: as72@nyu.edu
From: Sue Anne Lafferty <lafferty.16@osu.edu>
Subject: Adult Arts Education: Round III Questionnaire & Round IV Voting
Cc: lafferty.16@osu.edu

Hello there. By now you should have received a hard copy of Round III & IV by service mail. Just in case you prefer to send back via e-mail, attached find the final round of my Delphi study: Round III: Questionnaire 3; and Round IV: The Voting Sheet. Again, if you have any additional, final thoughts, or responses to the ideas, please add them to Round III. Otherwise, proceed to Round IV: Voting Ballot. Instructions are included on each form. Please let me know if you have any questions or if unable to open the documents. Please use the return method that is more convenient for you -- e-mail or mail and return by January 25.

Your time and input is greatly appreciated -- Best,
Sue Anne

(Round III: Questionnaire 3 Starts Here)

**DELPHI Questionnaire 3**
This questionnaire’s purpose is to report ideas and the overriding themes generated in Round I & II/Questionnaire I & 2. Please review the list and if need be, further refine responses, clarifying where desired and by listing strengths and weaknesses associated with them.

i.e. **Clarification, if any:** Please clarify, if need be, your ideas & others

    - **Strengths:** List strengths & weaknesses of all generated ideas
    - **Weaknesses:**

Again, all ideas will be anonymously included in this final report. If there are no changes, and/or additions, please proceed to the Voting Ballot.

**ROUND II THEMES/IDEAS... (See Appendix F for Final Layout for Q3).**
*What action could be taken to involve older adults in the arts?*
*In an aging society, what role does adult arts Education play?*
Round IV: Final Voting Round

Round IV: The Voting Ballot
The purpose of this ballot is to gain votes for the five best ideas based on the anonymous responses generated from Round I, II & III that deal with this issue of adult arts education. Please identify the top five ideas with the higher the number, the greater the importance or likelihood of impact: Assign a rank of 5 points to the most promising idea, 4 points to the next most promising, and 3, 2, and 1 point(s) to the third, fourth, and fifth-best ideas. For each of the top five ideas, answer the following two questions:

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade? and
2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?

Please Rank Only Five Ideas.

Idea # _____:
I would give this idea (5) points – the most promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?

Idea # _____:
I would give this idea (4) points – the next promising idea.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?

Idea # _____:
I would give this idea (3) points.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?
Round IV: The Voting Ballot, page two.

Idea #1:

I would give this idea (2) points.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?

Idea #2:

I would give this idea (1) point.

1. How important is this issue to arts education during the next decade?

2. What is the likelihood that this issue will have an impact on the national, state, or local level?

Thank You

For your valuable time and contributions — upon receipt of Round III and your final Voting Ballot, I will forward a token of my appreciation.