Assessing the Needs of Human Trafficking Awareness, Services, and Barriers to Access in Central Ohio

Thesis

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree Master of Social Work in the Graduate School of The Ohio State University

By

Trisha N. Smouse, B.A.

Graduate Program in Social Work

The Ohio State University

2010

Thesis Examination Committee:

Assistant Professor, Dr. Joseph Guada, Adviser

Assistant Professor, Dr. Sharvari Karandikar-Chheda
Human trafficking, a form of modern day slavery, is alive, well and thriving around the world. In fact, human trafficking is the fastest growing international criminal industry and it is happening in the Central Ohio community. There has been no research regarding the level of human trafficking awareness among service providers in Central Ohio, nor the existence of services for victims of human trafficking in the area. Thus, an exploratory study was conducted to identify Central Ohio’s current levels of awareness and capacity to serve trafficked persons.

This paper will discuss the definition, nature, and scope of human trafficking around the world, in Ohio, and in Central Ohio. Data collection consisted of a survey comprised of both open and closed-ended questions. The survey was comprised of several sections: agency demographics, human trafficking awareness, services to trafficked persons, barriers to service provision and access, and collaborative efforts. These were examined in an effort to identify education and service gaps in order to increase awareness, service capacity, and effectiveness to victims of human trafficking. Survey design is consistent with an existing IRB approved survey and the scrutiny of The Ohio Attorney General’s Trafficking In Person’s Study Commission (TIPSC) and the Central Ohio Rescue and Restore Coalition (CORRC). The survey was intended to answer the study’s research questions: (1) What is the level of human trafficking awareness amongst service
providers in the Central Ohio area; (2) What services currently exist for trafficked victims; (3) According to service providers, what are the barriers to providing services to trafficking victims; and (4) What assistance or support do service providers need to effectively serve trafficking victims?

The sample size was 90, which included agencies that offer the services needed by victims of human trafficking. Sampling strategies used in the study included: availability, snowballing, and purposive sampling. A broad spectrum of potential agency representatives from organizations offering a variety of services was represented in the sampling frame.

Overall the study found that while the majority (62%) of service providers is aware that human trafficking is a problem in Central Ohio, there is a need for training regarding identification, needs of trafficking persons, and response protocols. Furthermore, the TIPSC, Research and Analysis Sub-Committee estimated 1,861 foreign born persons and domestic youth were trafficked over the course of a year in Ohio. Nonetheless, only 111 identified human trafficking cases are being served by service providers statewide. Similar findings were identified for Central Ohio. Likewise, despite the prevalence of human trafficking in Central Ohio, services for victims are greatly lacking. Especially interesting is that of 45 agency representatives, only 22% of organizations have knowingly encountered trafficked persons and only 18% are currently providing services to victims of human trafficking. The study further discovered that there is only one service provider targeting services to minor victims of human trafficking as opposed to
four agencies targeting adult victims in Central Ohio. Since so few anti-trafficking specific agencies exist in Central Ohio, barriers to service for both the provider and client were examined.

In addition, the study found that there are many obstacles for both service providers and trafficked persons in Central Ohio. Interestingly, aside from the lack of funding and resources; barriers for both service providers and clients centered on knowledge attainment. Trafficked persons often present complex and challenging needs, thus the need for services may arise with short notice. Given the vast array of needs presented by victims of human trafficking in Central Ohio, collaborative efforts are necessary to adequately provide immediate and effective needed services.

This needs assessment only begins to systematically explore levels of human trafficking awareness, service availability, and barriers of service provision in Central Ohio for trafficked persons. Through this needs assessment, gaps have been identified concerning current human trafficking awareness and services and recommendations have been made for Central Ohio.
Acknowledgements

This project would not have been possible without the support of many individuals. I would like to thank my advisor, Dr. Joseph Guada, for believing in my work and my abilities, as well as the other member of my committee: Dr. Sharvari Karandikar-Chheda for her continued support and knowledge of the issue. This gratitude is also extended to Dr. Tom Gregoire for cheering me on each step of the way. I would also like to thank my supervisor, Michelle Hannan, for having confidence in me and encouraging me to pursue the thesis option; it truly has been a rewarding experience. A special thanks to The Salvation Army Social Service staff for their support and faith in my abilities. Thanks to my fellow abolitionists for their passion. Moreover, I would like to express deep gratitude to my dear friends Marla Yoder and Amanda Hershberger for motivating me to finish the project by spending late nights with me in the library and encouraging me to ‘just type until it is done’. Big thanks to my family for their prayer and support. Lastly, I would like to thank my mom, whose unconditional love and support inspired me to use my gifts of compassion, mercy, and sensitivity to help others in need.
Vita

June 13, 1979 .............................................. Born Columbus, Ohio

June 1997 .................................................. High School Diploma, Mechanicsburg High

   School

March 1998 .............................................. REACH, Jerusalem, Israel

June 2004 .................................................. A.S., Business Management, Columbus

   State Community College

July 2005 .................................................. Dresden, Germany Study Abroad

June 2006 .................................................. B.A., International Studies, The Ohio State

   University

August 2006 ............................................. Missionary Internship, Thailand

December 2008 ....................................... Central Ohio Rescue and Restore Coalition

January 2009 .......................................... Social Work Internship, The Salvation Army

   of Central Ohio

August 2009 ............................................. Krakow, Poland Study Abroad

October 2009 ........................................... Anti-Human Trafficking Program Manager,

   The Salvation Army of Central Ohio

October 2009 ........................................... Ohio Attorney General’s Trafficking in

   Persons Study Commission
Fields of Study

Major Field: Social Work
Table of Contents

Abstract ........................................................................................................................................... ii
Acknowledgements..................................................................................................................... v
Vita................................................................................................................................................ vi
List of Tables............................................................................................................................... x
List of Figures.............................................................................................................................. xi
Chapter 1: Problem Statement......................................................................................................... 1
  Introduction ............................................................................................................................... 1
  Statement of the Problem ....................................................................................................... 3
  Purpose of the Study .............................................................................................................. 5
  Research Questions .............................................................................................................. 6
  Significance for Social Work ............................................................................................... 6
  Limitations of the Study ...................................................................................................... 7
Chapter 2: Literature Review .......................................................................................................... 9
  Human Trafficking Defined .................................................................................................. 9
  Human Trafficking Legislation ......................................................................................... 9
  International Scope of Human Trafficking .................................................................. 10
  Understanding Human Trafficking in Ohio ................................................................. 12
  Prevalence of Human Trafficking in Ohio .................................................................... 17
  Human Trafficking in Central Ohio ............................................................................... 18
Chapter 3: Methodology .............................................................................................................. 23
  Sample ............................................................................................................................... 24
  Research Design ............................................................................................................... 25
  Data Collection ................................................................................................................ 26
    Measurement/Instrumentation ..................................................................................... 26
    Detailed Study Procedures ......................................................................................... 30
    Internal Validity ........................................................................................................ 31
  Data Analysis ................................................................................................................... 31
Chapter 4: Findings....................................................................................................................... 34
  Sample Characteristics ..................................................................................................... 34
  Participant Responses to Survey Questions ................................................................. 37
Level of Human Trafficking Awareness amongst Service Providers in the Central Ohio Area ................................................................. 40
Existing Service for Victims of Human Trafficking in Central Ohio .......... 46
Barriers to Service Provision for Trafficked Persons ............................. 48
Needed Assistance to Provide Effective Services to Human Trafficking Victims...... 50
Chapter 5: Discussion and Implications ................................................... 57
Level of Human Trafficking Awareness amongst Service Providers in the Central Ohio Area ................................................................. 57
Identifying Victims of Human Trafficking in Central Ohio ..................... 58
Recognizing the Trafficker as a Means of Identifying Victims of Human Trafficking 60
Existing Services for Victims of Human Trafficking in Central Ohio .......... 61
Increasing Capacity with Existing Services ............................................. 62
Varying Needs of Victims Based on Characteristics .............................. 64
Types of Trafficking and Specific Needs of Potential Clients .................... 67
Amount of Services Needed across Type of Victim .................................. 68
Barriers to Service Provision for Trafficked Persons ............................. 68
Needed Assistance to Provide Effective Services to Human Trafficking Victims...... 69
Limitations ................................................................................................ 70
Recommendations .................................................................................... 71
Future Research ..................................................................................... 74
Implications for Social Work .................................................................... 76
References ............................................................................................... 78
Appendix A: Recruitment Letter .............................................................. 87
Appendix B: Consent for Participation in Research ................................. 89
Appendix C: Survey Questions .................................................................. 91
List of Tables

Table 1: Response Rate per Survey Sub-Section .......................................................... 39
Table 2: Survey Sub-Sections Designed to Answer Study Questions ......................... 40
Table 3: Barriers to Service Provision ........................................................................... 50
Table 4: Agencies’ Needs to Provide and Improve Services .................................. 52/53
Table 5: Key Findings ................................................................................................. 56
Table 6: Recommendations ......................................................................................... 74
List of Figures

Figure 1: Factors Contributing to Human Trafficking in Ohio ........................................... 14
Figure 2: Type of Agency ......................................................................................................... 35
Figure 3: Agency Size ............................................................................................................. 36
Figure 4: Agency Target Population ........................................................................................ 37
Figure 5: Perception of Human Trafficking ............................................................................ 42
Figure 6: Collaborative Partners ............................................................................................ 55
Chapter 1: Problem Statement

Introduction

A form of modern-day slavery, trafficking in persons is a multibillion-dollar business and is the fastest growing criminal industry worldwide. It is tied with arms dealing as the second largest criminal act; only behind drug trafficking (Hodge & Lietz, 2007; Hughes, 2000; Mameli, 2002; Ryf, 2002; Shrik & Webber, 2004; Vayrynen, 2003). “Unlike the trade in drugs and weapons, those who traffic in humans can sell and resell their ‘commodity’ forcing each victim to suffer repeatedly” (International Association of Chiefs of Police, 2007, p. 1). In 2008, the United Nations Global Initiative to Fight Human Trafficking estimated that annual profits from trafficked, forced labor are around $31.6 billion (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 2009). This is especially troubling, given that the average cost of a human slave around the world is $90 (Free the Slaves, 2010).

Human trafficking is slavery. The definition is the same as always: forced into sex or labor for someone else’s profit. As defined in the Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000, the legal definition of a severe form of trafficking in persons is: a) sex trafficking in which a commercial sex act is induced by force, fraud, or coercion, or in which the person induced to perform such an act has not attained 18 years of age; or b) the recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for labor or
services, through the use of force, fraud or coercion for the purpose of subjection to involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage, or slavery (Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act, 2000). Twenty-seven million people are enslaved around the world (International Labor Organization, 2006); with 100-300 thousand children in the U.S. alone (Estes & Weiner, 2001). Ohio is a human trafficking hub. Almost 2,000 people are trafficked in Ohio today (Williamson et al., 2010), but Ohio is one of seven states, in which trafficking in persons is not a standalone felony offense. “Human trafficking is a high-profit and relatively low-risk business with ample supply and growing demand…even where human trafficking is criminalized, most of the investigations do not result in convictions of traffickers” (Makisaka & Marc, 2009, p. 1).

According to Michelle Hannan, Director of Professional and Community Services at The Salvation Army and Manager of the Central Ohio Rescue and Restore Coalition, Columbus was selected in 2007 by the United States Department of Health and Human Services National Rescue and Restore Campaign as a city in need of an anti-human trafficking coalition (M. Hannan, personal communication, December 3, 2009). The prevalence of human trafficking in Central Ohio is evidenced in the existence of the Central Ohio Rescue and Restore Coalition and the caseload of The Salvation Army’s Anti-Human Trafficking Case Management Program. Nonetheless, the focus of this study is not on the prevalence of human trafficking in Central Ohio. Rather it is aimed at determining the ability to adequately meet the needs of identified trafficking victims.

The present study is concerned with levels of human trafficking, especially in addressing education concerning the identification of trafficked persons and the response protocols for responding to known cases. The researcher is also interested in
understanding whether or not there are enough service providers in Central Ohio equipped to meet the specific needs of human trafficking victims. Moreover, the study is intended to determine the types of barriers present for both the service provider and the client. Lastly, the study is designed to address the need for multi-disciplinary collaboration in order to effectively meet the needs of trafficked persons in Central Ohio.

Statement of the Problem

Slavery in Central Ohio? Human trafficking, a form of modern day slavery, is alive, well and thriving around the world. It is estimated that four to twenty-seven million people are enslaved worldwide (International Labor Organization, 2006). Each year, 14,500 to 17,500 individuals are trafficked into the United States from other countries (United States Department of State Trafficking in Persons Report, 2008). For example, eighty percent are women and 50% are minors; and the average age of entry into prostitution is 11 to 13, which is a substantial part of the human trafficking problem (Shared Hope International, 2008). In fact, human trafficking is the fastest growing international criminal industry, and it is happening right here in Ohio. The Ohio Attorney General Trafficking in Persons Study Commission, Research and Analysis Sub-Committee conservatively estimates that at least 6,316 individuals are at risk of human trafficking, 1,861 of which are believed to be trafficked into the sex or labor trade in Ohio (Williamson et al., 2010).

In 2007, The United States Department of Health and Human Services selected Central Ohio as a site for a Rescue and Restore Coalition, recognizing the key risk factors for human trafficking which will be discussed in this study. Furthermore, since 2007, the Central Ohio Rescue and Restore Coalition has worked to increase awareness about
human trafficking and increase the community's capacity to respond to it. Through public awareness work and the launch of a human trafficking hotline, The Salvation Army has identified and served 35 victims of human trafficking. Research suggests that many more trafficked persons remain unidentified and unserved in the Central Ohio community.

Per this author’s professional experience in working with trafficked persons, it is evident that the services being offered in the Central Ohio area to this population are inadequate. Law enforcement, healthcare professionals, and service providers working with victims of human trafficking acknowledged several challenges and limitations to effectively meeting the needs of victims (Central Ohio Rescue and Restore Coalition Members, personal communication, 2009). Some of the challenges identified by members of the Central Ohio Rescue and Restore Coalition (CORRC) include: difficulty recognizing victims, safety concerns, inadequate services, and a lack of understanding of human trafficking by first responders, the general community, and service providers (Central Ohio Rescue and Restore Coalition Members, personal communication, 2009). The coalition is concerned about the lack of and gaps in services to trafficked persons in Central Ohio (Central Ohio Rescue and Restore Coalition Members, personal communication, 2009). Based on the survey findings, recommendations for future research and practice will be made to service providers, funders, legislators, educators, and other local change makers in order to increase efforts to effectively serve victims of human trafficking in Central Ohio.
Purpose of the Study

The main purpose of the study is a needs assessment regarding human trafficking. This study will assess the level of human trafficking awareness, service availability, and barriers of service provision through the use of a survey distributed via a secure online tool to those agencies providing needed services, such as healthcare, legal services, shelter to victims of human trafficking.

The needs assessment will have three major aims. The first aim is to determine the awareness of human trafficking in the Central Ohio community. The study seeks to gather data about this knowledge in order to determine the education needs of service providers in the Central Ohio area. There were two previous attempts to investigate knowledge about Central Ohio. One study was aimed at law enforcement agencies and the other, a general assessment, was locally done. However, the first did not target service providers, which this study does. And the second one was done before local coalitions were formed and may not have covered areas of awareness that this study attempts to do. Additionally, this study will provide a baseline for determining the change in knowledge needed so that providers are adequately trained to meet the needs of victims.

The second aim is to identify the availability of services to victims of human trafficking in order to increase Central Ohio’s capacity to serve this population. This will be ascertained by compiling a list of organizations offering needed services to trafficked persons. The list will include both services specific to human trafficking and existing services adapted for the population through training based on best practices. By establishing a network of existing services available to victims, the study will identify the current capacity and gaps in services.
The third aim is to compile and determine the general impediments of offering services for victims of human trafficking with the intention of promoting inter-agency collaboration. Barriers to service will be explored at the client and provider levels. The study aims to discover the overall needs of providers so that these organizations can effectively serve trafficking victims.

Multiple participants were asked to participate in this study, including department and agency heads, program managers and directors, and practitioners. It is important to include as many types of participants as possible so as to capture a broad understanding of human trafficking awareness and services in Ohio. As previously noted, survey findings offer a rich source of information to provide recommendations for future research and recommendations for increased awareness and services in Central Ohio.

**Research Questions**

This study will assess the following research questions:

- What is the level of human trafficking awareness amongst service providers in the Central Ohio area?
- What services currently exist for trafficking victims?
- According to service providers, what are the barriers to providing services to trafficking victims?
- What assistance or support do service providers need to effectively serve trafficking victims?

**Significance for Social Work**

Modern day slavery contradicts the core values of the Social Work code of Ethics: service, social justice, dignity and worth of a person, importance of human relationships,
and integrity (National Association of Social Workers, 2008). The injustice of human trafficking strips individuals of their worth and dignity and includes violence, exploitation, abuse, discrimination, and neglect. Social workers have a responsibility to advocate on behalf of the vulnerable and oppressed, to defend the value and dignity of the person.

Further, this study is important to the field of social work because “social workers are people who care about people, who want to make things better, who want to relieve suffering, who want their work to make a difference” (National Association of Social Workers, 2009). Building the capacity to serve trafficked persons will afford better services to this population. The core value of competence mandates that social workers engage with current research for practice efficacy. Social workers represent hope and freedom to those who suffer injustice by making significant contributions to the fight against injustice.

Limitations of the Study

Although human trafficking is the second largest and fastest growing criminal industry in the world (Hodge & Lietz, 2007; Hughes, 2000; Mameli, 2002; Polaris Project, 2009; Ryf, 2002; Shrik & Webber, 2004; United States Department of Health and Human Services, 2009; Vayrynen, 2003) it is a relatively new area of research and service provision. The unavailability of research limits the knowledge of the specific needs of trafficked persons. This also means that the level of research is at a basic exploratory level.

Additionally, the relative newness of the topic impacts such things as operationalization and specification of the concepts involved. Due to the lack of specific
anti-trafficking programs in Central Ohio, it is difficult to select potential service
providers for the sample. Thus, the study includes a wide range of service providers
including those that may have a limited potential of interacting with communities and
individuals impacted by human trafficking. Furthermore, due to the indiscriminate nature
of human trafficking, it is difficult to generalize the data across all communities and
individuals vulnerable to this contemporary form of human exploitation.
Chapter 2: Literature Review

*Human Trafficking Defined*

Human trafficking is the exploitation of men, women, and children for commercial sex or labor purposes. Labor trafficking includes, but is not limited to, domestic servitude, sweat shops, factories, begging, agricultural work, mining, brick kilns, and military conscription. Prostitution, pornography, stripping, lap-dancing, live sex-shows, child brides and mail order brides are some forms of sexual trafficking (Logan, Walker, & Hunt, 2009; Newton, Mulcahy, & Martin, 2008). According to The United States Government, a “severe form of trafficking in persons” is:

(a) sex trafficking in which a commercial sex act is induced by force, fraud, or coercion, or in which the person induced to perform such an act has not attained 18 years of age; or

(b) the recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for labor or services, through the use of force, fraud, or coercion for the purpose of subjection to involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage, or slavery (Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act, 2000).

*Human Trafficking Legislation*

The Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) defines and criminalizes human trafficking in the United States. The purpose of the law is to develop the federal government’s ability to provide protection, prevention, and prosecution in regard to
human trafficking. The law defines three aspects of human trafficking: the criminal acts, the means by which trafficking takes place, and the purpose, which is the commercial exploitation of human beings. In Ohio, a specification exists that provides the capacity to enhance the charges against those involved in a pattern of sex trafficking. This enhancement is limited because it excludes labor trafficking, does not make human trafficking a standalone crime, and requires a pattern of trafficking. Moreover, unlike the TVPA, it does not identify the several criminal acts that can be prosecuted under this law. Some criminal acts included in the TVPA include: recruitment, harboring, transportation, and provision/obtaining. This is important to mention, because while many components of human trafficking may be prosecuted under current Ohio Revised Codes statutes, such as compelling prostitution, kidnapping, rape, etc, this is not discussed in Ohio law anywhere. Sometimes, these acts are perpetrated by one individual. In larger trafficking rings, you may see more division of labor, where different individuals are responsible for different activities.

According to Bouche & Wittmer (2009), those U.S. States, which have passed anti-human trafficking legislation brings serious charges against traffickers. The lack of enforceable regulation allows human trafficking to flourish in Ohio. Based on an informal survey of county prosecutors, the Trafficking in Persons Study Commission, Legislation Sub-Committee, found that the Ohio specification, HB280, has not been applied (Sikora, et al., 2010).

*International Scope of Human Trafficking*

Accurate figures are impossible to come by due to the illegal and illicit nature of trafficking; therefore, a wide range of estimates exist on the scope of the problem. The
International Labor Organization (ILO), the United Nations agency charged with addressing labor standards, employment, and social protection issues estimates that there are 12.3 million people in forced labor, bonded labor, forced child labor, and sexual servitude at any given time; other estimates range from 4 million to 27 million (International Labor Office, 2006). That is more than twice that of the Trans-Atlantic Slave Trade at its height (Lovejoy, 1989). About 600,000 to 800,000 men, women, and children are trafficked across international borders annually. Of those transnational victims, approximately 80 percent are women and girls and up to 50 percent are minors. Furthermore, approximately 14,500 to 17,500 individuals are trafficked into the US from other countries (United States Department of State Trafficking in Persons Report, 2008).

Additionally, children who are most in need of social support, such as runaways, and homeless persons are most likely to become victimized through trafficking. One study indicated that 100,000 to 300,000 children are at high risk of commercial sexual exploitation each year (Estes & Weiner, 2001). For example, one out of every three teens on the street will be lured into a trafficking situation within 48 hours of leaving home (National Runaway Switchboard, 2009). According to the National Runaway Switchboard, based on information gathered in 2008, there are between 1,600,000 and 2,800,000 runaway and/or homeless youth in the United States everyday (National Runaway Switchboard, 2009). Another study found evidence that 90% of runaway children become involved in the commercial sex industry (Shared Hope International, 2008). In the United States, the average age of recruitment into prostitution or the commercial sex industry is between 11 and 13 years old (Shared Hope International, 2008). A survey conducted in 1995 and 1996 revealed that about 650,000 American
teenagers had prostituted at least once (ABC News, 2006). Additionally, the study noted that 4% of 1,300 students interviewed admitted to exchanging sex for money or drugs (ABC News, 2006). Of those, 75% of prostituted commercially exploited girls are under pimp control (Shared Hope International, 2008). Children trafficked by pimps may be found at escort and massage services, private dancing, sports and recreational events, conventions, and tourist destinations, as well as nontraditional locations (US Department of Justice Child Exploitation and Obscenity Section, 2008). Moreover, 77% of all adult women who are prostituted in Ohio entered into the commercial sex industry as minors (Williamson, 2009).

Understanding Human Trafficking in Ohio

Human trafficking is a concern in many communities and among many populations in the United States. Unlike the Trans-Atlantic Slave Trade, which was primarily the enslavement of Africans, modern-day slavery does not discriminate. Dr. Celia Williamson, founder of Second Chance, an organization serving minors of trafficking in Toledo, Ohio and Ohio lead researcher in the field, says that the only factor consistent among victims of human trafficking is vulnerability (C. Williamson, personal communication, July 2009). Victims of human trafficking include persons from all races, socioeconomic statuses, cultures, genders, and ages (Sanborn, Sheridan, and Leventhal, 2006; The Salvation Army, 2010; Williamson, 2010). Further, “trafficking networks are not limited to urban localities, as traffickers also seek the seclusion of rural and remote areas to operate undetected” (International Association of Chiefs of Police, 2007, p. 1).

Figure 1 shows some factors that contribute to human trafficking in Ohio. This figure illustrates the expansiveness of the issue of human trafficking; contributing factors
are individual, familial, and societal. Additionally, these factors can be categorized into
two categories: push and pull. Pull factors are those circumstances that pull individuals
toward a situation. The hope for better opportunities, escape of oppression, and high
demand are all pull factors when considering the problem of human trafficking.
Conversely, push factors are those conditions that push persons away from a situation.
Push factors may include: poverty, natural disaster, corruption and violence, economic
instability, lack of rights, and civil conflict. It is important to note that push and pull
factors alone do not contribute to human trafficking, but combinations of factors coupled
with violence and threats increase risk of exploitation (Polaris Project, 2009). The range
of contributing factors reiterates the expansiveness of the issue; human trafficking does
not discriminate based on demographic characteristics or situational circumstances, all
persons are vulnerable to modern day slavery.
Factors Contributing to Human Trafficking in Ohio

Figure 1: Factors Contributing to Human Trafficking in Ohio

The state of Ohio is fertile ground for human traffickers for many reasons. It has more than 110 universities and international corporations. The Ohio State University has the 7th largest body of international students in the country. Large immigrant populations including Hispanics, Asians and Somalis have grown exponentially (Davis, 2006). From 2000 to 2007, foreign born populations have increased 23.6% (Migration Policy Institute, 2008). It is important to note that human trafficking is not something that was brought to America by immigrant populations, rather these populations are at greater risk because of language barriers, lack of understanding of the law and individual rights (M. Hannan, personal communication, June 2009). Furthermore, diverse populations make it easier for traffickers to hide victims in plain sight because in multi-ethnic communities,
immigrants, often the targets of human trafficking, are likely to go unnoticed (Silver, 2008).

Despite the lack of a statewide human trafficking reporting system, the Ohio Attorney General Trafficking in Persons Study Commission, Research and Analysis Sub-Committee identified the prevalence of human trafficking in Ohio through the use of newspaper articles, literature searches and investigations of governmental and non-governmental reporting models used across the United States. The committee then adopted models to identify those at-risk of being trafficked in Ohio based on pull factors outlined by research (Clawson, Layne, & Small, 2006; Estes & Weiner, 2001). The Research and Analysis Sub-Committee study specifically looked at three main pull factors: (1) the presence of markets for human trafficking, (2) demands for sexual and labor services in neighboring states, and (3) the presence of sizable populations of foreign born individuals (Williamson, et al., 2010).

According to the Report on the Prevalence of Human Trafficking in Ohio, there are 6,316 persons at-risk for both labor and sex trafficking, of which 1,861 of which are estimated to be trafficked into the labor or sex trade in Ohio (Williamson, et al., 2010). Further, the study concludes that Toledo is number one, per capita, in the country for the number of traffickers produced and victims recruited into the sex trade (Williamson et al., 2010). Finally, Ohio has an extensive highway system including Interstates 70, 71 and 75 making it easy for traffickers to transport victims throughout the state and across the country. Moreover, Ohio’s proximity to Canada is another identified factor (Davis, 2006).
Indeed, Ohio is the fifth leading state in human trafficking (Erb & de Boer, 2006) serving as a transit, destination, and source state (Williamson et al., 2010). Both labor and sex trafficking are present within the state. According to the national human trafficking hotline operated by Polaris Project, between December 2007 and June 2009 Ohio received 183 calls, ranking number seven in the nation. Human trafficking types reported included: 58% sex trafficking, 26% labor trafficking, 3% sex and labor, 2.5% international marriage brokers, and 10.5% other (K. Davis, personal communication, August 5, 2009).

Another factor is the great demand for sexual and labor services in Ohio with few enforceable regulations. “Ohio currently has 130 migrant labor camps that employ numerous individuals, because of this market, among others such as restaurants, the textile industry, landscaping, and small factories, Ohio attracts many foreign born immigrant groups looking for work, both undocumented and documented” (Williamson et al., 2010, p12). Likewise, Ohio is ranked fifth in the United States with the largest number of strip clubs (Synder, 2007). Other sex markets include massage parlors, nail salons, and acupuncture clinics operating as fronts for prostitution (K. Davis, personal communication, August 12, 2009). The presence of many transient male residents, due to Ohio’s large military base and the high number of truck stops, further contribute to the demand for such industries (Davis, 2006). These activities thrive without the existence of strong legislation to combat human trafficking in Ohio.

Davis (2006) also states that the existence of organized Russian and Chinese crime networks and other organized crime syndicates contribute to the problem of human trafficking in Ohio. Some ethnic trafficking rings identified by Ohio coalitions include:
Latino and Chinese restaurants, Asian massage parlors, Russian hospitality services, homeless American men, and American and foreign national child peddling crews.

Additional exploitation opportunities for human traffickers include high rates of poverty and homelessness (Bales, & Soodalter, 2009; Davis 2006; Kristof & WuDunn, 2009; The Salvation Army, 2010). Moreover, according to the United States Department of State Trafficking in Persons Report (2009), people are more vulnerable to falling prey to human traffickers as a result of the global economic downturn. “Economic pressure, especially in the global economic crisis, makes more people susceptible to the false promises of traffickers, Secretary of State Hillary Clinton said in releasing the 2009 Trafficking in Persons (TIP) report” (Radio Free Asia, 2009, para. 2). Traffickers prey on vulnerable persons and situations. Thus, the Ohio economic situation plays an important role in the prevalence of human trafficking in the state. More specifically, when the economy in Ohio is downward sloping, persons become more desperate and fall subject to those who are willing to exploit others for profit.

**Prevalence of Human Trafficking in Ohio**

Since there is no current system in place to count the number of human trafficking cases in Ohio, the following is a compilation of data from organizations working with victims in Ohio. Through a variety of sources, statewide statistics are examined to better show the scope of the insidious crime in Ohio. Law enforcement, specifically FBI has identified 60 child victims in/from Toledo since 2006 (K. Davis, personal communication, August 12, 2009). Newspapers reported that Toledo and Columbus are high recruitment zones with 15 cases of human trafficking being identified by the media between the years of 2003 and 2006 (Wilson & Dalton, 2007). It is difficult to determine
if these cases were duplicated due to the lack of information reported by FBI concerning the Toledo cases. Other cases, not reported by Wilson and Dalton’s study, but, identified by law enforcement included: a 14 year old from Akron, another 14 year old from Columbus, eighteen arrests of adults in Lima and Toledo and five state raids on seven Mexican restaurants in Mentor, Ohio resulting in 67 arrests (K. Davis, personal communication, August 5, 2009).

Social service agencies in Ohio reported that since 2008 End Slavery Cincinnati Rescue & Restore Coalition has served 16 trafficking clients (J. Donohue-Donah, personal communication, August 5, 2009). Since July 2008, Central Ohio Rescue & Restore Coalition provided services to 35 unduplicated trafficking victims (The Salvation Army Anti-Human Trafficking Database, 2010). Second Chance in Toledo, which works with victims of sex trafficking and prostituted women, currently has 60 total adults and teen human trafficking victims on open caseloads (C. Williamson, personal communication, August 5, 2009). This totals 111 human trafficking cases in Ohio being served by service providers in approximately the past 12 months. It is important to note that this only includes those persons seeking services. As a Lucas County Juvenile Court judge stated, “there are three to ten victims for every one identified” (Wilson & Dalton, 2007, p. 16).

*Human Trafficking in Central Ohio*

Since July 2008 The Salvation Army of Central Ohio (TSA) has provided services to 35 unduplicated trafficking victims. Of those trafficked clients served by TSA, 58% were US citizens compared to 36% foreign nationals and 6% unknown. Additionally, females made up 76% of those served by the Anti-Human Trafficking program. Fifty-
eight percent of those served were victims of sex trafficking, 33% labor, 9% both, and
3% unknown (TSA Database, 2010). While TSA has served 35 individuals, research
(Huckleberry House, 2008; National Runaway Switchboard, 2008) suggests that many
more trafficked persons remain unidentified and unserved in the Central Ohio
community.

In 2008, 790 calls were made to the National Runaway Hotline from Central Ohio
area codes 614/740/937 (National Runaway Switchboard, 2008). In addition to the
National hotline calls, the local Central Ohio hotline, received 16 calls since 2009.
Moreover, a Central Ohio runaway youth shelter served 1407 youth in 2007; 600 were
girls living on the street (Huckleberry House, 2008). Given that the majority of homeless
youth are victimized by sexual exploitation, a large percentage of these girls were likely
lured into pimp control and then prostituted. Prostitution of adult women is also common
in Central Ohio. In 2007/2008, Central Ohio law enforcement filed 3,575 prostitution
charges (P. Herbert, personal communication, August 2, 2009). While human trafficking
is not synonymous with adult prostitution, most women enter into prostitution between
the ages of 11 and 13 (Shared Hope International, 2008). This is important for two
reasons. First, these adult women were most likely victims of human trafficking because
they were enticed into sex work as children and were never rescued from these
circumstances. Second, once victimized, these women were stripped of many
opportunities and choices usually afforded to persons their age. Although prostitution
tends to involve females, research shows adolescent and adult males are also coerced into
sex trafficking activity (McNamara, 2010; St. Blaise, 2010). Additionally, many of the
risk factors identified in the state of Ohio are present in Central Ohio; such as
universities, ethnic communities, extensive highway systems, and high rates of homelessness and poverty.

Specifically, human trafficking victims often present complex and challenging needs once they are removed from the trafficking situation. Traffickers typically use methods of force, such as beatings, rapes and food deprivation to keep victims enslaved. In addition, victims are often forced to witness violence and endure threats of harm to themselves and their loved ones to ensure their compliance. Victims of sex trafficking endure the added trauma of being forced to have sex with customers, sometimes up to 30 per night. In addition to Post Traumatic Stress Disorder and other psychological problems, trafficking victims may present with drug/alcohol addiction, bodily injuries, traumatic brain injury, sexually transmitted and other communicable diseases (Farley et al., 2003; Shared Hope International, 2008; United States Department of Health and Human Services, 2000; Zimmerman et al, 2006). Given the extensive needs of this community, there is a critical gap in knowledge and services that behooves service providers, law enforcement, and the Central Ohio community to respond in a more knowledgeable and effective way. Trafficked persons experience prolonged trauma resulting in an increased risk of suffering from physical and psychological distress (Jordan & International Labor Organization, 2002; The Salvation Army, 2010; United States Council of Catholic Bishops, 2009). “After recue, their problems continue as they are confronted with difficulties, practically, socially and emotionally, hence the rehabilitation process needs to take into account many complex problems” (Jordan & International Labor Organization, 2002, p.iii).
Despite the prevalence and severity of human trafficking in Central Ohio, services for victims are greatly lacking. For example, only The Salvation Army provides case management services to adult victims and Gracehaven House to minors. Through advocacy, support, and services, case management services are critical to helping trafficked persons escape slavery and begin to rebuild their lives. According to research (Aron, Zweig, & Newmark, 2006; Caliber, 2007; Clawson & Dutch, 2006; Council of Europe, 2008), case management provides benefits not only to the victim, but also to the stakeholders involved. It is imperative to increase service capacity for trafficked persons to ensure needed services and adequate supports are provided to enhance the recovery process for the victim of this traumatic crime.

Moreover, a study conducted in 2007 (Wilson & Dalton) found that Central Ohio lacked in awareness, resources, staff, services, and collaboration, which may have resulted in fewer trafficked persons being identified and served than exist in the area. Another study conducted by the Central Ohio Rescue and Restore Coalition and the Ohio Attorney General’s Office in 2009, further revealed similar findings for law enforcement personnel in regards to lack of awareness, especially concerning identification and response protocols. Low levels of human trafficking awareness coupled with the lack of existing tools for identification and response, victims are most likely overlooked, resulting in a discrepancy between the number of existing trafficked persons and the amount served by providers in Central Ohio.

The results of the study will provide a current understanding of the level of awareness among Central Ohio service providers concerning human trafficking. Providers must be knowledgeable about common indicators of human trafficking in order
to identify and service victims. Similarly, the results will assist in allocating resources and prioritizing services in the Central Ohio community. For example, a needs assessment is often a first step in effectively assisting victims, in a cost effective manner (Soriano, 1995). Moreover, the results will provide information required for funding of needed services and in-service trainings. Additionally, results will provide empirical data for the Central Ohio area. Likewise, results will identify providers already providing services for trafficked persons, which in turn can provide a framework for future support to such organizations. Identifying the existing network of service providers helping victims of human trafficking affords the ability to determine the current capacity and gaps in services in Central Ohio in order to better serve trafficked persons.
Chapter 3: Methodology

The study is exploratory in nature because of the lack of basic information regarding the service needs of victims and/or the knowledge of the social problem amongst potential service providers located in the Central Ohio area. Data collection consisted of a survey composed of open and close-ended questions. Additionally, the study analyzes the community’s ability to meet the needs of trafficked persons by comparing identified needs of victims and the availability of needed services. The study identifies a minimum network of services that should be available in every community to help victims of trafficking escape traffickers and restore their lives. Additionally, by identifying the existing services, the study will identify gaps in services to trafficked persons. Moreover, the study examines methods of bridging those gaps based on participant responses to service provision barriers and collaboration.

To reiterate, the study’s research questions are:

❖ What is the level of human trafficking awareness amongst service providers in the Central Ohio area?

❖ What services currently exist for trafficking victims?

❖ According to service providers, what are the barriers to providing services to trafficking victims?
What assistance or support do service providers need to effectively serve trafficking victims?

Sample

A combination of availability, snowballing, and purposive sampling strategies were used to obtain the sample. Through anti-trafficking specific service groups, such as the Central Ohio Rescue and Restore Coalition (CORRC) and/or the Ohio Attorney General’s Trafficking in Persons Study Commission (TIPSC), the researcher selected the sample group using purposive sampling. Purposive sampling is the selection of participants based on the purpose of the study (Rubin & Babbie, 2008). These agencies were selected because of their existing services to victims of human trafficking.

Twenty members of the Ohio Attorney General’s Trafficking in Persons Study Commission serving the Central Ohio community were invited to participate in the survey. For the purpose of this study, Central Ohio is defined as Franklin County and contiguous counties. Additionally, 45 agencies were recruited because of an existing partnership between their agency and the Central Ohio Rescue and Restore Coalition. Using this sampling method, 65 Central Ohio agencies were invited to participate in the study; 20 from TIPSC and 45 from CORRC. Another 25 Central Ohio agency representatives were recruited through the Firstlink Directory, which identifies agencies offering services needed by trafficked persons. Some types of agencies include: refugee/immigrant agencies, homeless shelters, children service organizations, legal offices, medical offices, social service agencies, etc. Furthermore, recruitment also included word-of-mouth or snowballing in an attempt to locate other service providers in Central Ohio.
The sample also included 18 statewide agencies not specific to the Central Ohio area since these agencies provide services in Central Ohio. It is important to include these agencies in the study because of the level of involvement of statewide agencies in the fight against human trafficking on both the local and statewide level. For example, since Ohio does not currently have legislation making human trafficking a standalone crime, it is imperative to have FBI and ICE agents provide services to trafficked persons in Central Ohio. Furthermore, victims of human trafficking have similar needs as domestic violence victims. Thus, Ohio Domestic Violence Network is a crucial partner in providing needed services to this population. This is especially true in regard to housing needs because of the lack of secure housing resources for trafficked persons. Of the 18 Ohio state agencies included in the sample, the researcher confirmed that the information provided by these subjects was specific to the Central Ohio area.

Research Design

Upon selection and consent of the organizations, agency representatives were asked to participate in a 45 minute online survey. The survey was a needs assessment of human trafficking in Central Ohio outlining several categories, such as: awareness, services, barriers and collaboration. The recruitment letter was electronically mailed one week prior to the survey launch to potential subjects explaining the purpose and importance of the survey. Participants were provided with a description of the research project and the address to the online questionnaire to access the survey. The survey was sent out both by the researcher and the Ohio Attorney General’s Office in order to elicit a greater response rate. The number of Central Ohio agencies invited to participate totaled 90.
The survey window was open for one month. One week after the first e-mail, a second e-mail followed to encourage subjects to complete the online survey. Individual consent was obtained via the website prior to beginning the survey; in order to access the questionnaire participants had to agree to participate in the study. The advantage of an online survey is that it was available on any computer with internet capabilities and at anytime during the open window time.

The survey was e-mailed to a total of 90 service providers in Central Ohio offering services needed by victims of human trafficking as identified by research (Aron, Zweig, & Newark, 2006; Caliber, 2007; Clawson & Dutch, 2007; Clawson, Small, Go, & Myles, 2003; Office of Justice Assistance, 2008). According to Clawson et al. (2003), the greatest needs of trafficking victims include: housing, medical, advocacy, legal services, transportation, outreach, food, info/referral, mental health, service coordination, employment, and protection. Hence, potential sites included agencies that offer the above mentioned services. To reiterate, the sampling frame included a broad spectrum of potential agency representatives from organizations offering a variety of services.

Data Collection

Measurement/Instrumentation

Agency representatives were asked to participate in a 45 minute online needs assessment survey. Due to the little research conducted on the issue of human trafficking awareness and capacity to serve, few surveys exist to measure this. This study’s main data collection instrument was adapted from the Needs Assessment for Service Providers and Trafficking Victims scale (Clawson, Small, Go, and Myles, 2003) and Baseline Survey of Human Trafficking in Wisconsin (Office of Justice Assistance, 2008). These
surveys were selected because both instruments underwent rigorous internal and external review in order to increase understandability, transparency, and appropriateness. Moreover, the Central Ohio Rescue and Restore Coalition Pre/Post test was incorporated into the survey to gage levels of human trafficking in Central Ohio. The survey, including demographic questions, consisted of multiple-choice, true and false items, and open ended questions and resulted in a total of 61 items.

Prior to its launch, members of the Central Ohio Rescue and Restore Coalition and the Ohio Attorney General’s Trafficking in Persons Study Commission, Victim Service Committee had an opportunity to provide feedback on the questions in order to ensure relevancy of the items being asked. Comments and suggestions from the coalition and committee were incorporated into the survey. Thus, question items were modified to better reflect the issues and needs of Central Ohio service providers. For example, when asking participants the multiple-choice question, “In general, what services have human trafficking victims needed?” the list of choices was taken from a list of needed services identified by the Ohio Attorney General’s Trafficking in Persons Study Commission and the Central Ohio Rescue and Restore Coalition.

The original scales included several sub-sections, which were used in this study. The sub-sections included: Demographic Information, Human Trafficking Awareness, Service Provision, Barriers to Service, and Collaborative Efforts. Each category consisted of five to 30 questions, both closed and open-ended. The sub-categories helped to clarify for both subjects and researchers important sub-topics regarding awareness and needs of victims of human trafficking.
The first set of questions focused on basic demographic information about the organization in order to decrease the probability of duplication of results. Additionally, items requesting information regarding types of services offered by the agency were included. This section consisted of nine questions; four open-ended questions and five multiple-choice questions. For example, some open-ended questions included: “What is your job title?” and “What target populations does your agency serve?” An example of a multiple-choice question was: “What type of agency do you represent?” with a selection of 15 choices to check off, with the option to select more than one.

The next section addressed the agency's level of human trafficking awareness. These items focused on the amount of human trafficking knowledge possessed by each respondent. The items included a set of true and false questions originally used by the Central Ohio Rescue and Restore Coalition in a pre/post human trafficking awareness test. This test is used prior to and at the conclusion of the Human Trafficking 101 training offered by CORRC in order to assess the increase in knowledge as a result of the training. For example, “To be considered a victim of human trafficking one must be transported across state or country borders?” and, “Human trafficking and smuggling humans are considered to be different?” and, “For a person to be convicted of sex/labor trafficking they must use physical force/brutality against their victim?”

In addition to the eight true and false questions, the human trafficking awareness section included 4 multi-choice questions; for a total of 12 questions. An example of a multiple-choice question is: “In your opinion, how serious of a problem is human trafficking in the community that you serve?” participants could choose from a list of Likert scale options ranging from not a problem to a very serious problem.
Questions about the actual services, both general and trafficking specific, provided by the participant’s organization followed. This portion was composed of 30 items four of which were open-ended. The remaining 26 questions were multiple-choice questions; with three of those asking for further specification based on the original response to the previous item. For example, participants were asked: “What types of human trafficking services does your agency offer?” Participants were also asked, “Has your agency encountered a case involving human trafficking victims (that is, provided direct services and/or consultation)?” An example of an open-ended question in this section was “In what ways are the needs of human trafficking victims different and/or similar to other victims of crime? (List similarities/differences in: length of services, presence of support networks, level of isolation, level of fear, level of trust, ability to communicate with service providers, types of services, etc).”

Subsequently, participants were asked questions that focused on barriers to providing services to victims of human trafficking. This sub-section was composed of six questions; four of which were multi-choice and two open-ended. For example, participants were given a list of multiple choice responses from which they could chose when answering “What are the most critical barriers/challenges you face in providing services to victims of human trafficking?” and “Based on what you know about victims of human trafficking, what are the reasons some human trafficking victims DO NOT seek out services?” Agency representatives were also asked two open-ended questions: “What does your organization need to help you do a better job in providing services to victims of human trafficking?” and “Based on your experiences, what assistance would other agencies need to improve the service(s) they provide to trafficking victims?”
The final sub-section of the survey focused on collaborative activities. This section consisted of four multiple-choice and two open-ended questions. An example of a multiple-choice question was: “Other than sending and receiving referrals, what agencies or individuals do you collaborate with?”

*Detailed Study Procedures*

The consent materials contained a statement of the purpose of the research project, procedures for participating, time required for participation, investigator contact info, and a statement that participation is voluntary. The study used an online consent process (with a click to agree to participate). The online site included SSL Encryption to ensure the confidentiality of responses. The data was de-identified, so that information identifying subjects or agencies was removed when analyzing the results. Additionally, the data collected during the survey was kept confidential, only viewed by the researchers, and only reported in aggregate form.

Involvement in this research study was voluntary and participants were informed that they could withdraw from participation at any time during the process. The risks related to this study were minimal. The questions were broad in nature and were not intended to elicit sensitive information, and participants could choose how much and what information they wanted to share. Likewise, no personal information was gathered about the subjects. The study was reviewed and received IRB approval through The OSU Behavioral & Social Sciences Institutional Review Board.

The online survey began by briefly outlining the purpose of the study and the importance of completing the survey. The overview was followed by statements of confidentiality and voluntary participation, reiterating the importance of the study. Then
participants were provided with an opportunity to consent to the study by checking a box, which directed them to the study survey.

**Internal Validity**

As previously stated the study survey is based on the previous work of Clawson et al., (2003) and Office of Justice Assistance (2008), which gathered similar information in other areas of the US. While neither scale tested for psychometric properties, such as internal validity, construct validity, and test-retest reliability; both were designed to have at least face validity. The Needs Assessment for Service Providers and Trafficking Victims Scale (Clawson, Small, Go, & Myles, 2003) was piloted with five service providers. A computerized pilot survey was tested for skip patterns, recording, and storing data. Once this pilot survey was completed, revisions were made to the instrument. Additionally, the pilot survey was tested for clarity, item wording, and appropriateness of response categories. This feedback was used to revise the scale for use by Caliber’s Institutional Review Board (IRB). Once reviewed and approved by the IRB the instrument was submitted and approved by the Office of Management and Budget (Clawson, Small, Go, & Myles, 2003). The Human Trafficking Baseline Survey (Silver, 2008) underwent a similar process. This survey was pilot-tested and internally reviewed by the Human Trafficking Committee and the OJA Public Relations Specialist. It was evaluated to determine clarity and appropriateness of used language (Silver, 2008).

**Data Analysis**

Data analysis included simple summation of information as well as basic analyses for frequencies, measures of central tendency and dispersion. Survey results were automatically compiled by Survey Gizmo
and exported to Microsoft Excel 2007 for analysis. The results were divided into two main areas: human trafficking awareness in Central Ohio and the capacity to effectively serve victims in the area.

The analysis of service capacity is a multi-faceted approach. First, it is imperative to determine the demographic makeup of the victims in order to provide effective services. Thus, the researcher ascertained information regarding the population of trafficked persons in Central Ohio. Second the needs of trafficked persons were analyzed by revealing frequency distributions for those needs reported by clients to agencies serving clients. The reported needs of trafficked persons were compared to the types of services being provided in the community, both internally and externally in order to determine gaps in services. Further, information regarding the average length of services and ability to serve were analyzed by measures of central tendency. Establishing the existence of services for trafficking victims were analyzed by revealing frequency distributions for those services provided by agencies. Both internal and external services offered were also examined. Additionally, the types of services offered to clients were summed. Lastly, discovering patterns around barriers, collaborative activities and perceived agency needs to provide services enabled the researcher to deduce the assistance and support needed to effectively serve trafficking victims. Collectively, this information revealed the capacity to serve trafficked persons in Central Ohio.

In an effort to determine the level of human trafficking awareness in Central Ohio, averages were calculated in regards to the perception of the problem locally. The study also calculated the percentage of persons with correct answers to the eight true and
false questions surrounding the issue of human trafficking. Another method for
analyzing awareness of modern day slavery in Central Ohio is through the number of
anti-human trafficking events attended by agencies, requests for training, materials, and
increased involvement in anti-human trafficking activities.
Chapter 4: Findings

Sample Characteristics

The survey was distributed to 90 Central Ohio agencies offering services congruent with research-identified needs of trafficked persons. Of those 90, 56 agencies completed the survey for a response rate of approximately 62%.

The study participants represent a wide variety of agencies serving Central Ohio, including health care providers, social service agencies, domestic violence services, sexual assault services, refugee/immigrant services, law enforcement agencies, legal assistance providers, etc. Figure 2 is a depiction of the different types of agencies represented in the study. There is overlap because more than one characteristic was designated to describe some agencies. The other category consisted of a variety of organization types, such as housing, media, and specialized services.

As illustrated in Figure 2, there is little representation from those serving ethnic minority communities. Only 7.14% of study participants provide refugee/immigrant services and migrant worker/labor rights services. Additionally, only 5.36% offer interpreting services. Likewise, of the three law enforcement agencies represented in this graph, only one solely serves Central Ohio; the other two are Federal agencies serving the entirety of Ohio. It is also important to note that approximately 16% of respondents are
targeting children and youth services and another 18% are targeting victims of crime and domestic violence.

**Figure 2: Type of Agency**

Furthermore, the average length of time of employment for those agency representatives who participated in the study was 3.8 years, with a standard deviation of 5.4. This suggests that the majority of staff who contributed to the study were new and may not accurately represent the organization’s levels of awareness or service provisions. Inexperience among participants may play a role in identifying human trafficking awareness and services because respondents are unaware of clients served prior to involvement with the agency.

Moreover, as seen in Figure 3 the majority of respondents are from large organizations, with more than 30 people working for the organization. The lack of
communication/information-sharing in large organizations may result in a lack of awareness regarding services rendered by other departments. For example, The Salvation Army of Central Ohio offers services in six main program areas in several counties. However, as an employee in the food pantry, the caseworker may not be aware of services offered in other departments, such as the Anti-Human Trafficking Program or housing programs. Further, the lack of respondent experience may affect their awareness concerning agency contact with trafficked persons. First, client confidentiality prohibits co-workers from discussing case information. Second, the signs of human trafficking are not easily distinguishable without further assessment due to the clandestine nature of human trafficking (A. Allen, personal communication, January 14, 2010). “While any one of these signs (trauma, fatigue, injuries, poor care, withdrawn behavior and communication) might not constitute a situation of trafficking, they can serve as indicators to alert you to the possibility of this crime” (International Association of Chiefs of Police, 2007, p. 5).

![Agency Size (N=56)](image)

**Figure 3: Agency Size**
Figure 4 illustrates the target populations of the agencies that participated in the study. As noted in the figure the contributing organizations serve a diverse range of populations, with only 6% of agencies offering trafficking specific services. The largest area represented are children/adolescents (15%) and other (15%). The other category is made up of specific populations, such as those individuals with mental health illnesses, substance abuse issues, HIV, etc.

![Agency Target Population (N=48)](image)

**Figure 4: Agency Target Population**

**Participant Responses to Survey Questions**

Despite an overall study response rate of 56 participants, there were marked differences in response rates across the sub-sections of the survey. Of the 56 participants,
51 completed the demographic and human trafficking awareness sections of the online survey, for a response rate of 91.07%.

The response rate for the sub-section regarding services to victims of human trafficking was substantially lower than anticipated. That is, only 8.93% or 5 respondents completed this section. This may be a result of the organization of the survey. In an effort to accurately represent the demographic characteristics of victim of human trafficking, as well as types and lengths of services needed by trafficked person, the service section was created using a filter based on responses to a series of questions. These items were regarding agency cases involving individuals engaged in activities that may be considered human trafficking such as: “has your agency encountered a case(s) involving slavery/human trafficking victims (that is, provided direct service and/or consultation)?” If the respondents answered “no” or “not sure” to any of these items, he/she was directed to the next sub-section of the survey, and was not asked the remaining questions in this section. Thus, the low response rate indicates that few respondents viewed themselves as providing specific services to victims of human trafficking.

The next sub-section focused on barriers to service provision for both agencies and victims of human trafficking in Central Ohio. Forty respondents (71.43%) completed this section. And finally, the last sub-section, collaboration, had a response rate of 55.36%, 31 participants answered the six questions addressing efforts of collaboration in order to effectively serve trafficked persons.
These are the study questions.

What is the level of human trafficking awareness amongst service providers in the Central Ohio area?

What services currently exist for trafficking victims?

According to service providers, what are the barriers to providing services to trafficking victims?

What assistance or support do service providers need to effectively serve trafficking victims?

The study’s questions are addressed by a variety of sub-sections. Therefore, Table 2 provides an overview of the sub-sections designed to answer each research question.
Table 2: Survey Sub-Sections Designed to Answer Study Questions

**Level of Human Trafficking Awareness amongst Service Providers in Central Ohio**

The study’s first question addresses the level of human trafficking awareness amongst service providers in Central Ohio. The study found that while human trafficking awareness is increasing, there is still an overwhelming lack of education concerning identification, needs of trafficked persons, and response protocols. Because this is the first ever assessment of levels of human trafficking awareness in Central Ohio, there are no previous studies with which to compare the results of this study. Thus, the findings regarding increases in knowledge are tentative.

However, a recent survey aimed at identifying the training needs and law enforcement agencies’ level of awareness on the topic of human trafficking can be used
as a comparison. This was conducted by Central Ohio Rescue and Restore Coalition in coordination with the Ohio Attorney General’s Office in August of 2009. The goal of the survey was to better prioritize efforts to support law enforcement efforts to prevent and combat human trafficking. Given the responses, law enforcement agencies expressed a need for training, indicating they are both unaware of the problem in their communities and how to recognize signs of a victim of sex and/or labor trafficking and/or a human trafficking business or entity. Additionally, law enforcement said that they do not understand the effects of human trafficking nor do they know how to link victims to local social service providers. Furthermore, the study revealed that law enforcement personnel do not understand the criminal justice system procedure pertaining to human trafficking, and are unfamiliar with both Ohio and Federal laws.

Another study providing insight of the baseline levels of human trafficking awareness for the Central Ohio area is “Human Trafficking in Ohio: Markets, Responses, and Considerations’ (Wilson & Dalton, 2007). In the study the authors state, “lack of awareness, coupled with lack of resources, lack of local and federal law enforcement collaboration, lack of dedicated staff or a dedicated unit to handle trafficking cases, and lack of systematic community service provider partnerships, leads to handling potential human trafficking victims as offenders, which may partly lead to the lack of identified human trafficking cases in the jurisdiction” (Wilson & Dalton, 2007, pp. 41-42). One must take into consideration that this study was completed prior to the formation of the Central Ohio Rescue and Restore Coalition, the local response network to human trafficking in Central Ohio. Additionally, since this study, The Salvation Army of Central Ohio has developed an Anti-Human Trafficking Department offering comprehensive case
management to adult victims of human trafficking and Gracehaven House serving minor victims.

Nonetheless, this study was able to assess perceptions of the seriousness of the problem, which were calculated by percentage, which is a part of gauging human trafficking awareness. Figure 5 depicts a high level of awareness; 43% of all respondents indicated that human trafficking in Central Ohio is a serious problem and another 19% specified very serious. However, it is important to note that 20% of participants expressed that they “don’t know” whether or not human trafficking is a problem in Central Ohio. Additionally, 2% of respondents reported that human trafficking was not a problem in their community. As evidenced by research, there are more people enslaved today than at the height of the Trans-Atlantic Slave Trade (Lovejoy, 1989); however only 52.94% were aware that more people are enslaved today because of the hidden nature of modern day slavery. This shows that providers’ awareness of human trafficking is basic, especially in regards to the scope of the problem.

**Perception of Human Trafficking**  
**(N=51)**

![Perception of Human Trafficking](image)

*Figure 5: Perception of Human Trafficking*
Another method for analyzing awareness of modern day slavery in Central Ohio is through the number of human trafficking events attended by agencies. Of the 31 respondents who answered this question, 27 have attended at least one event since 2000. The study also revealed that nearly half (24 of 50) of the participants are currently participating in anti-human trafficking activities and another nine are planning to engage. There were no responses indicating that agencies neither were currently engaged or planning to participate in activities. This suggests an elevated level of awareness toward human trafficking in the Central Ohio area. Seventeen answered with “other” but no specifications were designated, thus no conclusive findings can be based on that response. This means that agencies were involved with something to do with human trafficking, but not a specific event. Thus, the response does suggest that agencies are doing other things to increase their awareness of modern day slavery or engagement with human trafficking.

Lastly, levels of human trafficking awareness can be measured by the amount of requests by agencies about training, materials, and increased involvement. Results demonstrated that most study participants are interested in receiving a variety of materials and trainings. Thirty-four respondents (61%) are interested in activities on human trafficking. Of those 34 agency representatives, 88% want to receive training and/or training materials. Furthermore, 22 respondents (64.71%) are interested in being part of a network of service providers assisting trafficking victims and eleven (32.35%) sought to be part of a working group with law enforcement. Moreover, 97% of participants expressed interest in being informed of upcoming workshops, lectures, symposia, and
conferences on human trafficking. An increase in awareness concerning human trafficking can be ascertained.

The study question was further addressed in the examination of a lack of education around identification, needs of trafficked persons and response protocols. First, the researcher explored the idea of educational needs concerning victim identification. The study found that 96% of participants (N=50) are aware that human trafficking can take many forms and victims may fall in multiple categories. Likewise, 82.35% of providers (N=51) understand that human trafficking does not require movement across National or International borders. Moreover, 78.43% of respondents (N=51) noted that human trafficking is not only an International issue and 68.63% (N=51) agree that victims are not only immigrants from other countries.

Conversely, only 56.86% (N=51) recognize the differences between smuggling and human trafficking. “Knowing how to differentiate between the two is important…because persons involved solely in smuggling are not eligible for the special immigration relief and services authorized by the TVPA” (The Salvation Army, 2010, p. 51). Smuggling is the illegal transport of persons across international borders, usually for work (The Salvation Army, 2010).

While 73.17% of respondents realize that physical force is not necessary for a person to be convicted of sex or labor trafficking; only 41 providers answered this question. This suggests that the additional ten participants did not know how to respond. With those ten providers added to the “I don’t know” responses, only 58.82% were informed that physical brutality is not a necessary component of human trafficking.
Moreover, the need for education regarding the needs of trafficked persons was examined. The results found that service providers reported that trafficking victims have multiple and wide-ranging service needs. The greatest identified needs, in order of prevalence, (N=5) were education, counseling, employment, interpretation, material assistance, housing placement (emergency and long-term), case-management, drug treatment, childcare, victim compensation, protection, emergency response, mental health, transportation, medical, legal, and 24 hour response.

The study further examined needs of trafficking victims as compared to other victims of crime. The findings (N=4) showed that while victims of human trafficking have similarities among other victims of crime, trafficked persons have unique experiences, thus needs, which should be considered when providing specific services to this population. The following depicts respondent opinions regarding the similarities and differences between needs of human trafficking victims and other victims of crime. Subjects acknowledge similarities regarding inaccessibility to care, history of physical and/or sexual abuse, neglect, and psychological issues, such as self-blame, culpability and fear. Some differences include: longer histories and increased levels of abuse and neglect, and lengths of services, language barriers, and trust issues. One participant said “because of the unique trauma experienced by victims of human trafficking, length of service may be much longer, and existing services, such as shelters, may not be appropriate.” This is important because it notes that unique services, including longer service periods and increased sensitivity, may be required because of prolonged and amplified traumatization.
Given that a small number of respondents answered these questions, the answer to the study questions needs to be further explored in other sections of the survey. In sub-section three of the survey: Barriers to Service Provision, providers were asked to identify barriers to providing services to trafficked persons. In response to this question, respondents (N=32) identified among other things a lack of knowledge about the services trafficking victims need.

The study question was further tested in section three, Barriers to Service Provision, in order to determine training needs around response protocols. Approximately 35% of service providers (N=32) expressed that the lack of organizational policies and procedures prohibited them from offering services to trafficked persons in Central Ohio. Furthermore, in the Collaboration Section of the survey, 9.5% of agency respondents (N=21) identified a need for developing appropriate protocols and coordinating effective first response protocols. As a whole; despite an increased level of awareness, there is a lack of education concerning victim identification, needs of trafficked persons, and response protocols.

**Existing Service for Victims of Human Trafficking in Central Ohio**

The second study question proposed by the researcher addressed the lack of service providers offering anti-trafficking specific services in Central Ohio. The survey found, in the Service to Trafficked Persons section, that of the 45 agency representatives, only 22% of organizations have knowingly encountered trafficked persons and only 18% are currently providing services to victims of human trafficking.

The study further examined the types of services being offered to victims of human trafficking to determine specificity of services. Subject participation on this
section of the survey significantly dropped after these questions. As previously noted, many of the study participants had not knowingly provided direct services to victims of human trafficking. Thus, this decline in respondents was expected as the questions became more exclusive to anti-trafficking specific services.

Nonetheless, the prevalence of services for trafficking victims was further analyzed by asking subjects about the types of services being offered internally and externally by each respondent. In order to standardize responses, participants were provided a definition for each type of general service. According to the survey, prevention includes information and awareness raising campaigns, health and other specific prevention measures. Basic Assistance was defined as low threshold services: social assistance and inclusion, vocational guidance and training/work insertion, local community work, and specific return and reintegration measures. Lastly, the training of key-players, measures aimed at the organizational structure, self-evaluation, networking and research were included in the professional development category. Participants were asked to select the type(s) of services being offered by their agency to trafficked persons: prevention, basic assistance, and professional development. Only ten participants responded to the question concerning types of services being offered in Central Ohio. Several providers offer services in more than one category of service provision, thus totals do not equal 100% or ten. Of the respondents, 80% provide direct assistance, 30% prevention, and 20% professional development.

In response to anti-trafficking specific services to victims in Central Ohio, the response rate decreased to five respondents. Consequently the survey results may not provide an accurate representation of services available to victims of human trafficking in
Central Ohio. The survey results showed that there is only one service provider targeting services to minor victims of human trafficking while there are four agencies targeting adult victims in Central Ohio.

The decrease in respondents coupled with the study results evidence that there are not enough service providers in Central Ohio equipped to meet the specific needs of human trafficking victims. With each question the number of participants decreased; 10 agencies encountered victims, 8 organizations served trafficked persons, and only 5 offered anti-trafficking specific services in Central Ohio.

The study question aimed at addressing existing services to trafficked persons was further tested by comparing the identified needs of trafficked persons to those services being offered by agencies to determine gaps in services for victims of human trafficking in Central Ohio. According to the findings (N=5), the most needed services with the fewest resources available are (in no particular order): 24 hour response line, spiritual services, legal advocacy, public benefits, residential programs, transportation, drug treatment, self-help groups, case management, emergency housing, material assistance, interpretation, and employment services.

**Barriers to Service Provision for Trafficked Persons**

Respondents identified key barriers to their ability to provide services to trafficked persons, as well as victims’ ability to access services. As noted below, there are many obstacles for both service providers and trafficked persons in Central Ohio. The key barriers identified by respondents (N=32) are listed in order of prevalence: lack of funding/resources (56%), not knowing how to identify victims (47%), lack of knowledge about the services trafficking victims need (44%), lack of information/training
about human trafficking (44%), lack of organizational policies or procedures (34%), and inadequate staffing (28%).

On the other hand, agency representatives were asked to report barriers for clients to access services based on field experience. Respondents (N=32) identified lack of knowledge about available services as the greatest barriers to receiving services. In order of most common responses, the following were acknowledged barriers: lack of knowledge of available services (100%), lack of community awareness about the issue of human trafficking (100%), lack of knowledge of victim’s rights (100%), lack of support (97%), shame/embarrassment (97%), language barriers (94%), safety concerns (94%), location/transportation (91%), and lack of trust in the system (91%). As exemplified in the findings, victims of human trafficking in Central Ohio face many barriers to accessing services. Thus, based on the survey findings, there are two types of service barriers in providing assistance to trafficked persons in Central Ohio; provider and client based obstacles are present.
Barriers to Service Provision for Trafficked Persons

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Service Providers</th>
<th>Client</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Lack of funding/resources</td>
<td>• Lack of community awareness about the issue of human</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Inability to identify victims</td>
<td>trafficking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Lack of knowledge about the services trafficking</td>
<td>• Lack of knowledge of victim’s rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>victims need</td>
<td>• Lack of support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Lack of information/training about human trafficking</td>
<td>• Shame/embarrassment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Lack of organizational policies/procedures</td>
<td>• Language barriers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Inadequate staffing</td>
<td>• Safety concerns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Location/Transportation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Lack of trust in the system</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3: Barriers to Service Provision for Trafficked Persons

Needed Assistance to Provide Effective Services to Human Trafficking Victims

Given the needs of trafficked persons coupled with the barriers to services the study is focused on whether agencies collaborate with other providers. To determine the need for multi-disciplinary collaborative efforts in effectively serving trafficked persons in Central Ohio two questions were asked.

First, according to respondents (N=21) organizational needs were outlined in order to provide successful services to victims of human trafficking in Central Ohio. Table 4 reflects the responses of the needs among agency representatives to alleviate obstacles to service provision. When asked about the needs of service providers to better help trafficked persons, the researcher identified some common themes apparent. Approximately, 52% or respondents requested increased education and training. Through increased education and awareness, service providers will be able to identify victims of
human trafficking and understand their needs which will afford better services.

Additionally, with education to victims, clients will become aware of their rights, as well as, available services in the community. Moreover, 29% stated the need for greater awareness, while 19% asked for more funding and resources.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question 1: What does your organization need to help you do a better job in providing services to victims of human trafficking? (N=21)</th>
<th>Question 2: Based on your experiences, what assistance would other agencies need to improve the service(s) they provide to trafficking victims? (N=21)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Internal training and coordination</strong></td>
<td>I haven't had that much experience outside of my office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I would like to work public awareness into our programming, especially since we are a community organization that serves a neighborhood that is recognized for its chronic poverty.</td>
<td>More training on cultural and victim issues. More staffing to address problem and more coordination between agencies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Awareness, money, patience.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More awareness in student body of immediate actions they can take.</td>
<td>I don't have enough knowledge on trafficking victims' needs or current services provided to respond to this question.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information on how to identify potential victims who present for treatment.</td>
<td>To be aware and alert that it is happening closer than they realize.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organize a team to raise awareness about the issue.</td>
<td>Financial, trafficking being defined as a higher priority than it currently is.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Awareness is a big start. Information!</td>
<td>Funds for training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coordination of law enforcement awareness of human trafficking and prosecution of human trafficking. Public awareness for reporting suspected human trafficking.</td>
<td>Technical assistance training from Salvation Army and Gracehaven House to address the aforementioned needs in the earlier question. We need to address one of the roots of human trafficking in relation to oppression centering on power.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Funds for training</td>
<td>More education, knowledge of needs of trafficked victims and who they really are.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Send me to more trainings by CORCC/other organizations on how to provide culturally sensitive advocacy services to survivors of human trafficking, how to coordinate an effective first response to survivors of human trafficking, and how to develop appropriate services and protocols.</td>
<td>Most agencies need training on recognition and how to meet the unique needs of trafficking victims.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>We are not aware of the issue or how it impacts the lives of Deaf people in America. Any information about this would be helpful.</td>
<td>More knowledge and training on victims’ rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning about role this state agency can play to support efforts</td>
<td>Trainings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safer location and building</td>
<td>More awareness.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greater funding so that we can open our shelter and hire the necessary staff.</td>
<td>Identification and letting the victim know they will be safe and hopefully not deported. Even though efforts are great on spreading the work of what human trafficking is, I still feel a lot of people do not fully understand and thus are not willing to self-identify.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More training on how to define and assist trafficked individuals</td>
<td>HT 101 training, trauma informed services training, cultural competency training, access to best practices and resources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More time spent in the community in order to recognize human trafficking victims.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training. How to spot it.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More training on this topic.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educate on what human trafficking is so people could help identify potential victims.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Funding for case management staffing, access to residential treatment, access to trafficking/trauma-informed counseling, legal services for clients.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4: Agencies’ Needs to Provide and Improve Services
Similar to the trends identified in barrier alleviation, Table 4 shows that agency representatives noted some ideas that may be helpful in providing services to victims of human trafficking. Forty-eight percent of participants requested training on the issue of human trafficking, as well as ways to recognize victims and respond to situations. Moreover, 24% of respondents commented that greater resources and funding would be helpful in providing services. Ten percent also noted the need for coordination between social services agencies and law enforcement to overcome barriers and provide effective services to trafficked persons.

In addition, in the sub-section regarding services to trafficked persons, the results (N=5) showed that most respondents find that with their existing resources coupled with the help of other service providers, adequately meet the needs of trafficking victims. Two reported having difficulty meeting the needs of trafficked persons and one said they were able to meet some needs but not others.

The ability to adequately meet the needs of trafficked persons through stabilization among the five Central Ohio organizations providing specific services to this population was accomplished through a variety of services. The respondents were asked to report the percentages of individuals stabilized through agency programs. These percentages are summed in the following findings. According to the survey findings, stabilization was achieved through safe housing (55%), permanent resident status (23%), employment/education (5%) and other methods (17%). The stabilization methods used demonstrate the need for multi-disciplinary collaboration. For example, without the contribution of lawyers, clients would not be able to attain permanent resident status. Similarly, education is not possible devoid of teachers, tutors, and other educators.
This multi-discipline approach was further explored by asking respondents about any collaborative efforts occurring across service providers. A list of agencies/organizations and the proportion of respondents reporting collaborating with such entities for the purpose of better serving trafficking victims are shown in Figure 6. The primary collaborative partners among respondents (N=18) are advocacy organizations (67%), followed by faith communities (61%) and social workers (56%).

![Collaborative Partners](image)

**Figure 6: Collaborative Partners**

Based on the key findings depicted in Table 5, recommendations concerning future research and practice can be made in order to adequately and effectively meet the unique needs of trafficked persons. With increased knowledge comes increased responsibility; understanding the scope of the problem of human trafficking requires
action. As denoted in the study, human trafficking awareness has increased, but service providers are in need of training in order to increase capacity to serve trafficked persons. Additionally, the survey identified only five service agencies in Central Ohio currently providing services to trafficked persons, exposing a large gap in services. Moreover, the study found that barriers to service provision exist for both the service provider and the client. Lastly, the study indicated the need for multi-disciplinary collaboration is essential for effectively serving trafficked persons in Central Ohio.

Table 5: Key Findings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>While human trafficking awareness is increasing, there is still an overwhelming lack of education concerning identification, needs of trafficked persons, and response protocols.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There are not enough service providers in Ohio equipped to meet the specific needs of human trafficking victims.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There are two types of barriers: provider and client based.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is a need for multi-disciplinary collaboration in order to effectively meet the needs of trafficked persons in Ohio.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 5: Discussion and Implications

To reiterate, the main purpose of this study was to assess the levels of human trafficking awareness, service availability, and barriers to service provision in the Central Ohio region. The needs assessment only begins to systematically explore the purposes of the study. Through this study, gaps have been identified concerning human trafficking awareness and services. The results will enable Central Ohio communities to better prioritize efforts to better serve victims of human trafficking.

Level of Human Trafficking Awareness amongst Service Providers in Central Ohio

The study’s findings provide information about the current level of awareness among a sample of Central Ohio service providers. There were two prior similar studies, as previously noted in the Literature Review. One study (Wilson & Dalton, 2007) found that there was little knowledge of human trafficking in Central Ohio in regards to awareness, resources, collaboration, staff and systematic community service provider partnerships. The second study (Central Ohio Rescue and Restore Coalition & Ohio Attorney General, 2009) aimed at law enforcement awareness, discovered that law enforcement personnel are unaware of human trafficking, as well as how to recognize or respond to the problem. Based on this study’s findings, it appears that there was an increase in awareness as compared to what those studies found.
It was determined that while the majority (62%) of service providers is aware that human trafficking is a problem in Central Ohio, there is a need for training regarding identification, needs of trafficked persons, and response protocols. This is evidenced in the human trafficking awareness, barriers, and collaboration sections of the survey. Of particular note is that 20% of participants stated that they didn’t know whether or not human trafficking is a problem in Central Ohio. This is an indication of the lack of awareness about the issue of human trafficking. Additionally, 2% of respondents reported that human trafficking was not a problem in their community. Human trafficking is a growing problem and research (Huckleberry House, 2008, National Runaway Switchboard, 2008; The Salvation Army Database 2010, Williamson, 2010) suggests that many victims of this insidious crime reside in Central Ohio. Thus, service providers need to be aware of its existence in order to fight the injustice and bring about recovery and support in Central Ohio communities. Turning a blind eye (as a result of ignorance and silence) to the problem only encourages this type of vicious behavior. It is imperative to recognize that children, men, and women are being exploited by means of force, fraud and coercion in Central Ohio in order to put an end to this horrific crime. In addition, the results demonstrate the need for training concerning the magnitude of the problem. Until funders and providers view the enormity of human trafficking in Central Ohio, there will continue to be a lack of funding and resources, including a lack of anti-trafficking specific service providers in the community.

**Identifying Victims of Human Trafficking in Central Ohio**

A little over a half of the respondents recognize the differences between smuggling and human trafficking. This indicates a need for additional training regarding
such differences. “Smuggling is a criminal activity whereby persons illegally transport 
others across international borders for work or other reasons” (The Salvation Army, 
2010, p. 51). Numerous individuals agree to be smuggled into a country, often paying a 
fee. However, once these persons are held against their will and the use of force, fraud, 
and/or coercion is present to retain them for the purpose of exploitative sexual or labor 
services, they become victims of human trafficking (The Salvation Army, 2010).

On the other hand, the majority of participants are aware that human trafficking 
can take many forms and victims may fall in multiple categories. Likewise, the majority 
of providers (N=51) understand that human trafficking does not require movement across 
National or International borders. This is important for identifying domestic trafficking 
victims. “It is critical to note that any individual can be trafficked; victims of trafficking 
are not always undocumented immigrants. They may be immigrants here legally, on work 
or student visas for instance, or they may be U.S. citizens. U.S. Citizens who are 
recruited and enslaved within the United States are considered trafficking victims” 
(International Association of Chiefs of Police, 2007, p.5). For example, a victim can 
grow up on the East side of Columbus, never move, and be trafficked on the East side of 
Columbus. These victims are often overlooked because of the lack of movement, thus 
the participants’ understanding of this is critical in identifying domestic victims of human 
trafficking.

While 73.17% of respondents realize that physical force is not necessary for a 
person to be convicted of sex or labor trafficking; only 41 providers answered this 
question. This suggests that the additional ten participants did not know how to respond. 
With those ten providers added to the “I don’t know” responses, only 58.82% were
informed that physical brutality is not a necessary component of human trafficking. This is crucial for identifying victims of human trafficking because many service providers may overlook a person if there are no signs of physical abuse, when in fact; this is not a necessary component of human trafficking. As outlined in the TVPA (2000), the three key elements of human trafficking are force, fraud, and coercion. These are methods used by persons to exert power and control over victims. While force is the most powerful and obvious method to control and exploit trafficking victims (The Salvation Army, 2010), fraud and coercion are also utilized through deception, false promises, and emotional manipulation. To reiterate, it is not necessary to have all three elements to be considered a human trafficking case, only one must be present. Therefore, in order to successfully identify victims of human trafficking, service providers must be trained to recognize fraud and coercion as well.

These findings are important for two reasons. First, understanding that human trafficking takes many forms, at times even, including human smuggling will enable providers to better identify persons being exploited for labor or sexual purposes (International Association of Chiefs of Police, 2007). Second, it will help providers to effectively serve trafficked persons individually rather than using a universal protocol (Clawson & Dutch, 2007; Zimmerman & Watts, 2003). Each trafficking situation is unique and should be treated on an individual basis.

Recognizing the Trafficker as a Means of Identifying Victims of Human Trafficking

Given the clandestine nature of human trafficking, it is important to provide education on the nature of the trafficker. In American entertainment, pimps can be viewed as role models and heroes, but the reality is that pimps are traffickers; 51% of
participants understand that the terms are synonymous. Traffickers use a variety of control tactics, including physical abuse, isolation, sexual abuse, financial control, emotional abuse, dynamics, and intimidation tactics. Nonetheless, victims “cope by instilling an emotional dependence (on the trafficker), which effectively prevents a victim from leaving the situation” (The Salvation Army, 2010, p. 56). Moreover, traffickers coach victims to tell fake stories in order to protect themselves from legal ramifications. As a result of the rehearsed stories, many victims go undiscovered. However education about the nature of the trafficker may provide further insight into suspicious activity resulting in the identification of hidden, frightened, and dissociative victims. Furthermore, by identifying traffickers more victims may be discovered because most traffickers have more than one victim under their control.

Existing Services for Victims of Human Trafficking in Central Ohio

The survey results were inconclusive when examining current services for victims of human trafficking in Central Ohio because of the low response rate for this section of the study. This low response rate may be due, in part, to the design of the online survey instrument. As mentioned above, the service provision section was only open to service providers with direct experience consciously working with victims of human trafficking. Thus, only five agencies reported providing specific anti-human trafficking services to trafficked persons. The findings demonstrate that there are vast service gaps for providers in Central Ohio. Five organizations cannot fill the dearth of services needed to effectively serve trafficked persons in the Central Ohio area. According to Clawson, Small, Go, & Myles (2003), “trafficking victims’ case take longer than domestic violence victims’ cases; one trafficking case is about as much work at 20 domestic violence cases”
That is, with only five organizations providing assistance to trafficked persons in the Central Ohio area, there is clearly a large gap in service opportunities for victims. According to the Ohio Attorney General’s Human Trafficking Study Commission Report there are approximately 1,800 victims identified as residing in Ohio (Williamson, et.al, 2010). Further, since 2008, 35 victims have been served in the Central Ohio area alone.

Thus, given the small number of agencies responding to the needs of trafficked persons in the Central Ohio area, the majority of victims are not being helped to start a process of recovery and support. It is imperative to increase service capacity for trafficked persons to ensure needed services and to ensure that adequate supports are provided to enhance the recovery process for victims of this traumatic crime.

*Increasing Capacity with Existing Services*

The study shows that only 7.14% of respondents provide services specific to ethnic communities in Central Ohio. This is an important finding given that immigrant communities are at great risk of being trafficked (Davis, 2006; Silver, 2008; The Salvation Army, 2010; Williamson, 2010). Concurrently, the study revealed that only 5.36% of survey participants offer interpreting services, which are essential when serving foreign victims as well as members of many immigrant groups (M. Hannan, personal communication, January 9, 2010). The provision of human trafficking training to organizations currently serving ethnic communities in Central Ohio may increase capacity to serve trafficked persons.

Additionally, the study demonstrates that there is only one trafficking-specific minor service provider in Central Ohio. Nonetheless, agencies reported that their agency worked with children and youth (16%). While not a large percentage of providers, this
demonstrates the potential for expanding such services with necessary human trafficking training. Thus, more agencies could play an integral role in providing needed services to minor victims of human trafficking in Central Ohio. According to Mary Richie, a member of the Kentucky Rescue and Restore Coalition, although it would be ideal to have specific providers with a primary focus on human trafficking, targeted training to other agencies can help fill present service gaps (M. Richie, personal communication, June 21, 2009). Agencies that provide services for adult victims of human trafficking understand that these adults entered the sex industry as a minor (U.S. Department of Justice Child Exploitation and Obscenity Section, 2008). Service providers can learn from this and place a higher priority on youth focused prevention, which can eliminate the need for assistance when children progress into adulthood. Additionally, prevention measures are the most cost effective. Education about the dangers of trafficking ideally generates enough awareness that keeps youth away from situations that result in trafficking, thus eradicating the need for later spending on basic needs, housing, education, job training, and counseling. Moreover, both adults and children are funneled into the criminal and juvenile justice systems, costing the local and state government resources. Rather, if offered restorative services, these victims can be offered an opportunity to contribute to society.

Similarly, this study found that 18% of respondents were from organizations offering services to victims of crime and domestic violence. Such agencies can also be trained to serve trafficked persons in Central Ohio communities. This would potentially double the capacity to serve trafficked persons from 18% to nearly 36%. Research (Clawson, Small, Go, & Myles, 2003; The Salvation Army, 2010) indicates that while
many differences exist, victims of human trafficking and domestic violence have several similarities. Therefore, the transition to include services to trafficked persons for domestic violence agencies may be easier than among other service providers.

By comparing provided assistance with needed services, disparities are revealed. The identified gaps enable Central Ohio communities to determine the capacity to serve trafficked persons. As noted in the study and research (Clawson, 2007; Silver 2008; The Salvation Army, 2010), the needs of trafficked persons are diverse and wide-spread. Thus, incorporating existing service providers is an effective method for increasing capacity to adequately address the diverse needs of trafficked persons.

**Varying Needs of Victims Based on Characteristics**

Client needs vary based on trafficking situations and client demographics. This is important for identifying the needs of trafficked persons and providing effective training to service providers. One study question focused on potential needs for such training. By examining varying needs of victims of human trafficking based on characteristics, service providers will be able to both identify and adequately meet individual needs.

For instance, minors have different needs than adults. According to Dr. Jeff Barrows, founder of Gracehaven House, an organization founded to provide shelter and rehabilitation to girls under the age of 18 who have been victims of commercial sexual exploitation, minors have a greater need for residential programming since children are unable to live independently (J. Barrows, personal communication, March 13, 2010). Furthermore, minors may need educational services in order to attain a High School Diploma, whereas adult victims may have a greater need for vocational training and job placement services (M. Hannan, personal communication, March 13, 2010).
Likewise, country of origin can have a major impact as to what kinds of services are needed by clients. The study identified the percentages of U.S. citizens (83%) served by Central Ohio agencies as compared to foreign nationals (17%). Therefore, service providers will need to be equipped to provide services appropriate for U.S. citizens. For example, U.S. citizens may need help in attaining a driver’s license or birth certificate rather than immigration legal documents. Moreover, domestic victims may need assistance in accessing public benefits, such as food stamps or Medicaid as compared to refugee benefits for foreigners (M. Hannan, personal communication, April 12, 2010).

Moreover, some ethnic groups refuse treatment that includes Western medicine or therapy and would rather receive treatment through other means that replicate services in their home countries. Understanding these differences are critical in providing effective services to trafficked persons.

The study also provides insight into the types of services that may be most needed in Central Ohio when working with foreign victims of human trafficking. For example, while respondents reported that the majority of clients have legal permanent residency or a T-Visa indicating legal status in the United States, 50.33% of victims are in need of legal representation. Hence, foreign nationals will most likely be in need of legal services, interpretation, translation, and access to refugee benefits. Foreigners may also benefit from services concerning legal rights and cultural education. Additionally, foreign national victims are in need of legal services to attain legal status in the United States and documentation (M. Hannan, personal communication, April 12, 2010).

Another demographic attribute that alters the services needed by a victim of human trafficking is gender. Males and females have distinctive mindsets, motivations,
and unique needs. Therefore, services specific to male victims of human trafficking differ from females. Moreover, because of past abuses, service providers of the opposite sex often trigger one another, which may delay client restoration if gender specific treatment is not considered (M. Hannan, personal communication, May 2, 2010).

Additionally, demographic characteristics may determine the mode of stabilization used for an individual. The study found that the most common means of stabilization was safe housing (55%); which is expected since safe housing is an immediate need and is central to providing restorative services to trafficked persons in Central Ohio (Clawson, 2007; The Salvation Army, 2010). Furthermore, the study found that the majority of clients served by Central Ohio providers have been adult, domestic victims. This population is more likely to have rent and employment history, as well as identification enabling them to be stabilized more easily and quickly through housing placement, as opposed to foreign victims stripped of all identification.

Likewise, respondents reported that stabilization is attained by permanent resident status for 23% of clients served, which is imperative for foreign victims to remain in the country (A. Allen, personal communication, April 28) and is therefore a logical means of stabilization. Additionally, subjects reported “other” (17%) and employment/education (5%) as ways to achieve stabilization. Respondents did not specify approaches to stabilization under “other”. However based on identified needs and services from previous questions, it is assumed that organizations used services such as material assistance, advocacy, and life skill training. A low response rate selecting stabilization through employment/education was anticipated given that the majority of victims have a previous criminal history (because of their activities when involved with human
trafficking) making it difficult to employ. Moreover, locating employment for foreign victims can be difficult given language and cultural barriers coupled with lack of proper paper work and societal prejudices. Thus, because victims of human trafficking are from all ethnic and cultural backgrounds and present with varying needs that require individualized attention and service planning, providers must be equipped to offer a myriad of services for a variety of populations.

Types of Trafficking and Specific Needs of Potential Clients

The type of trafficking situation alters the kinds of services needed by clients, too. The study identified the percentages of clients served in Central Ohio by type of trafficking situation. According to the survey respondents, sex trafficking is the most common type of human trafficking in Central Ohio. Of the clients served by respondents, 48.2% were sex trafficking victims, 28% were labor trafficking victims, and 3% were trafficked for both labor and sex purposes. While all victims experience acts of violence, the types of abuse can vary across situations. For example some victims experience psychological abuse, whereas others encounter physical abuse and others are sexually abused. Clawson (2008) found that sex trafficking victims were in the greatest need for legal, medical, and information/referral services, whereas, labor trafficking victims identified advocacy and medical services as the greatest needs. Additionally, sex trafficking victims suffer different health and mental health consequences than labor trafficking victims. According to Aron, Zweig, & Newmark (2006), when interviewed immediately after a rescue, “sex trafficking victims needed gynecological care and often treatment” (p.12), this may be less the case for labor trafficking victims. Thus, based on
this study’s results it is clear that there is a need for a wide spectrum of services given the various types of human trafficking that potential clients have experienced.

**Amount of Services Needed across Types of Victim**

Lengths of services for victims of human trafficking also vary based on demographic attributes and types of human trafficking (Clawson, 2007; The Salvation Army, 2010). This study found that the overwhelming majority of respondents indicated “don’t know” to the question “What is the average length of service provided to victims of human trafficking?” This could be due to several factors. First, it could be that respondents have not dealt with any or with very few victims of human trafficking. Second, the response suggests a general lack of knowledge around the issue, especially given that services to trafficked persons are relatively new in the Central Ohio community. Therefore, representatives may be unsure as to how long clients need services.

**Barriers to Service Provision for Trafficked Persons**

In determining the barriers to service for trafficked persons, the researcher examined barriers both for service providers and clients. As theorized, lack of funding and resources were the greatest barriers for service providers. Additionally, lack of knowledge of services and basic human trafficking information were identified barriers to service. “Shared Hope International (2002) found misidentification of the victims to be the primary barrier to the rescue and response... (this) causes a chain reaction of negative outcomes (p.5).” The article further states that only awareness and education coupled with appropriate treatment and approach can remedy this misidentification (Shared Hope International, 2002). Therefore, by educating service providers about the realities of
human trafficking and providing them with a matrix of available services, barriers may be reduced.

Conversely, this study did not indicate lack of staffing because only 28% identified this as a barrier to service provision. The survey identified the greatest client barriers as lack of knowledge about available services, victims’ rights, and community awareness about the issue of human trafficking. These identified barriers support the idea that there is a lack of service providers in Central Ohio offering trafficking specific services. Once there are more service providers in the Central Ohio area, future research could test if barriers continued to exist. Likewise, it is possible that, fear of deportation and of traffickers, as well as shame, and cultural issues contribute to this situation.

**Needed Assistance to Provide Effective Services to Human Trafficking Victims**

The above mentioned barriers to service provision will play a significant role in determining the assistance needed to effectively serve trafficked persons. More than half of this study’s respondents indicated the lack of funding and resources as the greatest barrier to providing services to trafficked persons. Therefore, increased funding and resources for agencies and clients is one type of needed support. Another recognized barrier is the lack of organizational policy and procedure around encountering victims of human trafficking. Thus, creation and implementation of such procedures and policies are needed to provide adequate services to trafficked persons.

Lastly, increased coordination is required to assist persons who have been exploited for sexual or labor purposes because of the complex needs demonstrated by this population (Aron, Zweig, & Newmark, 2006; Caliber, 2007; Clawson, 2008; The Salvation Army, 2010). While not directly found in the survey results, many services
being provided to victims of human trafficking are cross disciplinary in nature. For example, there is a need for a case manager, lawyer, and law enforcement personnel to pursue legal matters. The study discovered a need for collaborative partners in effectively serving trafficked persons in Central Ohio.

Limitations

There are several limitations of the study. First, as previously discussed, a combination of sampling methods was used including availability sampling. Moreover, snowballing was utilized, which is subject to biases, such as the researcher’s ability to network, and the lack of definite knowledge concerning the service provider population. Furthermore, snowball sampling does not necessarily represent accurate representation of all service providers who might have contact with victims of human trafficking (Rubin & Babbie, 2008).

An additional limitation is the construction of the survey by the researcher. The lack of research and psychometrically created survey instruments affords more chance for researcher error in developing the tool. A more rigorously psychometrically tested instrument would have provided more accurate information about sample respondents, provided clearer guidelines for responding, and shed greater insight into the needs and services of Central Ohio providers with regard to human trafficking. Specifically, the service subsection of the survey was designed only for subjects presently offering services to trafficked persons. Thus, results are very limited and may result in an inaccurate representation of services available to victims of human trafficking in Central Ohio and identified needs of trafficked persons.
The type of study, an exploratory study, is also a limitation. According to Rubin & Babbie (2008), “the chief shortcoming of exploratory studies is that they seldom provide satisfactory answers to research questions. They can only hint at the answers and give insight into the research methods that could provide definitive answers” (p. 137). In other words, the study provides recommendations, areas for future research, and information concerning awareness of human trafficking and services to trafficked persons. However, it does not provide concrete action steps to increase human trafficking awareness, decrease barriers to service, and increase collaboration among service providers.

Lastly, the researcher’s personal experience in working with victims of human trafficking biased the study. Although the questionnaire was adapted from other sources, it was changed to reflect the needs of Central Ohio based on the researcher’s field experience. Moreover, the discussion, recommendation, and areas for future research sections of this paper reflect the examiners personal familiarity of the issues and needs of service providers in the community. To minimize researcher bias, a quantitative study was conducted. Nonetheless, anecdotal information and practice wisdom from service providers are useful resources in informing what kinds of questions and surveys should be included (Clawson, Small, Go, & Myles, 2003; Silver, 2008).

**Recommendations**

As the study demonstrates there is a need for increased levels of awareness and service provision for persons impacted by human trafficking in the Central Ohio area. Table 6 illustrates the researcher’s recommendations based on the study findings. First, it is suggested for those agencies currently providing services to victims of human
trafficking to create an advanced training program for other providers in the community interested in serving this population. Such training needs to include several components, such as: human trafficking “basics” and the red flags of human trafficking. Providers must be knowledgeable about common indicators of human trafficking in order to identify and service victims. According to the International Association of Chiefs of Police (2007), “in situations of possible human trafficking, victim identification can be one of the most challenging tasks for law enforcement” (p.5). Further, once identified, it is imperative to equip service providers with the knowledge to assess and assist trafficked persons. Therefore, the trainings need to incorporate information on conducting comprehensive assessments of victims, accessing help, and knowledge of existing response and service protocols. Moreover, the importance of collaboration and existence of a service matrix in order to meet the complex needs of victims should be discussed in the training. The trainings should be offered to service providers in order to increase identification and service capacity, as well as to, ensure effective services.

Parallel to training, it is recommended that communities develop a response protocol, service matrix, and standards for practice. These tools will enable providers to monitor the availability and effectiveness of service. A response protocol outlines steps of service provision from the point of discovery through the implementation of a service plan, which would include a multi-disciplinary team. An existing service matrix will further increase the ability to meet the needs of trafficked persons more quickly. Due to the diversity of potential trafficking situations, Central Ohio agencies should take steps to prepare a wide range of service provisions given the numerous and various needs that survivors often present with. Additionally, because of the nature of human trafficking, the
need for services may arise with short notice, thus having immediate services available for trafficking victims are critical. Moreover, it is critical to determine the number of trafficked persons in Central Ohio in order to increase capacity and effectiveness, while securing funding and community support. Thus, it is recommended that a human trafficking database be created in order to count the number of victims of human trafficking who are identified and served in the Central Ohio community.

Third, funding for safe, therapeutic, trauma-informed services for survivors of sex and labor trafficking and direct client assistance funds (for rent assistance in supportive housing centers and counseling sessions) are crucial in meeting the complex needs of survivors. However, with limited funding streams, it is important to note the most-effective, least-expensive type of anti-trafficking specific service; anti-trafficking specific case management services. According to research (Aron, Zweig, & Newmark, 2006; Caliber, 2007; Clawson & Dutch, 2006; Council of Europe, 2008), case management provides benefits not only to the victim, but also to the stakeholders involved. Furthermore, the primary objective of a case management program is to assist trafficked persons in stabilization and restoration (Clawson & Dutch, 2007; The Salvation Army, 2010). Case management programs provide personal support and assistance in accessing human trafficking related services. According to the United States Council of Catholic Bishops (2009), “service needs of survivors of trafficking are best met through a multi-disciplinary approach, coordinated by the client’s case manager” (p.4). Therefore, it is imperative for the anti-trafficking case management program to be effectively linked with a multi-disciplinary team trained to provide specific services to victims of human trafficking. The goal of case management programs is to offer freedom from abuse and
exploitation while offering restoration to the victims through enhanced dignity and positive view of self (The Salvation Army, 2010). An increase in funding and resources will enable service providers to better advertise services and have comprehensive and consistent services available for clients.

Table 6: Recommendations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recommendations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Advanced Training</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Human trafficking basics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Red flags of human trafficking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Identification characteristics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Strategies for assessing and assisting victims</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Equip Providers with Needed Tools</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Response protocol</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Service matrix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Practice standards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Create human trafficking database in order to better count victims</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Funding/Resources</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Safe, therapeutic, trauma-informed services for survivors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Case management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Direct client assistance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Future Research

Through this study, it has been made evident that allocating resources to organizations providing services to trafficked persons needs greater prioritization in Central Ohio. However, due to the lack of respondents in the service sub-section of the survey, it is difficult to determine which types of services are of greatest need. Thus,
future research will need to have a larger sample of respondents, including both service providers and survivors of human trafficking, in order to better determine needed services and existing services. Such information can assist communities to identify the current capacity and gaps in services and is invaluable for determining the appropriate allocation of future funding.

Moreover, future research regarding such services will help to clarify what types of trafficking situations exist and demographic characteristics exist, and what kinds of services are needed in Central Ohio. As previously noted, it is important to understand that trafficked persons come from a variety of situations, with different socio-economic statues, histories, states of physical health and mental health, and cultures. However, over time trends begin to emerge among population subgroups within victims of human trafficking in Central Ohio. For that reason, future research needs to focus on specific subgroups and circumstances known to exist across those victimized by human trafficking. Additionally, it would provide greater insight into service prioritization by these subgroups of trafficked persons. Future research about such subgroups is critical in developing successful program models specific to certain populations in Central Ohio at risk for human trafficking.

Another area of future research centers on the issue of barriers to service for both the service provider and the client. Given that most agency representatives who completed the barriers section of the survey have not provided trafficking specific services, further exploration of barriers identified by trafficking service providers would provide greater insight into the mindset of the victim. Moreover, the results may offer understanding regarding many agencies’ apprehension to providing services to this
population. Additionally, the survey participants should be expanded to include survivors of trafficking in order to better represent the barriers of service provision based on their personal experiences.

Lastly, future research should focus on methods of stabilization for victims. Such research would afford awareness of interventions that are effective means of restoration and enhanced dignity. This study only briefly touches on means of stabilization for trafficked persons. However, future research exploring thriving stabilization techniques would positively impact service utilization in Central Ohio.

Implications for Social Work

This study provides a framework from which social workers can be prepared to make informed decisions and bring freedom to the oppressed in Central Ohio. Human trafficking is happening in Central Ohio and it cannot be ignored. Reporting suspected cases of slavery in the community to trained responders is a first step in helping vulnerable populations. Violence, exploitation, abuse, discrimination and neglect are all factors of human trafficking. The injustice of this crime strips individuals of their worth and dignity. Social workers are charged with fighting injustice and advocating on behalf of vulnerable persons by representing hope and freedom to those served.

Further, the research indicates that while there are factors that make some populations more vulnerable to human trafficking, it is a crime that transcends all boundaries, affecting all persons. Thus, it is important for social workers in the field to provide equal access to care for all populations. The study also indicates the importance of a multi-disciplinary approach to fighting human trafficking, as well as, providing effective services to trafficked persons in Central Ohio.
Moreover, social work professionals must continually advocate for freedom and justice by increasing awareness, developing prevention strategies, passing strong legislation, and conducting research. Human trafficking is an offense to the core values of social work and must be curbed. Social workers need to establish a plan of community organizing and development to help reduce some of the systemic problems relating to injustice and oppression through substantive research and analysis of human rights issues and assess their impact on human trafficking situations.
References


Local residents provide management, muscle, recruits for national operation.
Toledo Blade (A1).

Estes, R. J., & Weiner, N. A. (2001). The commercial sexual exploitation of children in
Retrieved September 13, 2009 from
http://www.sp2.upenn.edu/restes/CSEC_Files/Exec_Sum_020220.pdf

U.S., Canada and Mexico. Retrieved May 2, 2009, from
http://www.hawaii.edu/hivandaids/Commercial%20Sexual%20Exploitation%20of

Farley et al. (2003). Prostitution, trafficking, and traumatic stress. Prostitution and
trafficking in nine countries: An update on violence and posttraumatic stress


163-174.


Appendix A: Recruitment Letter

College of Social Work  
Stillman Hall  
1947 College Rd.  
Columbus, OH 43210-1162  
Phone (614) 292-6288  
Fax (614) 292-6940  
January 21, 2010

Dear Service Provider,

As part of a research project, supervised by Dr. Joe Guada of The Ohio State University, I am conducting a study entitled, “Assessing the needs of human trafficking awareness, services and barriers to access in Ohio.” This research is being conducted as a pilot study and will be used as partial fulfillment of the graduate studies program in the College of Social Work at The Ohio State University.

This study will assess the following research questions:

- What is the level of human trafficking awareness in Ohio?
- What services currently exist for trafficking victims?
- According to service providers, what are the barriers to providing services to trafficking victims?
- What assistance or support do service providers need to effectively serve trafficking victims?

Multiple participants are being asked to participate in this study, including department and agency heads, program managers and directors, and practitioners. We believe that it is important to include as many types of participants as possible so as to capture a broad understanding human trafficking awareness and services in Ohio.

Your participation is voluntary, you can refuse to participate or withdraw at any time without penalty or repercussion to you.

The survey is online. The online site will include SSL Encryption to ensure the confidentiality of your responses. The survey can be accessed at: http://www.surveygizmo.com/s/197719/human-trafficking-in-central-ohio.
The survey will take approximately forty-five minutes to complete. However, the survey has been set up to allow respondents to save their progress and return to the survey later. You will need to supply an email address to save your progress. A unique link will be emailed to you that will allow you to return to your survey where you left off.

We appreciate your willingness to consider participating in this needs assessment. If you have any questions about the evaluation, please feel free to contact one of us at the following contact information.

Sincerely,

Dr. Joe Guada  
The Ohio State University  
College of Social Work  
1947 College Rd  
Columbus, OH 43210  
Guada.1@osu.edu  
614.247.8967

Trisha Smouse  
The Ohio State University  
College of Social Work  
1947 College Rd  
Columbus, OH 43210  
Smouse.3@buckeyemail.osu.edu  
937.207.3914
Appendix B: Consent for Participation in Research

As part of my Social Work Master’s Thesis at The Ohio State University, I am conducting a study entitled, “Assessing the needs of human trafficking awareness, services and barriers to access in Central Ohio.” The purpose of this research is to determine the needs of the Central Ohio community concerning awareness of human trafficking, as well as, availability and impediments to services for victims of human trafficking in order to better prioritize and improve services. This study will assess this information through the use of surveys. I anticipate that this survey will take approximately 60 minutes to complete. The aim of this survey is to identify community needs and agencies’ level of awareness and services on the topic of human trafficking. Your participation is voluntary, you can refuse to participate or withdraw at any time without penalty or repercussion and your answers will be kept completely confidential. Provisions for protecting the data will be afforded by privately reviewing the collected surveys and reporting only in aggregate. Feedback from you and other service providers who have worked with trafficking victims is extremely important. The results of this study will be used to better prioritize and improve services for victims and to support service providers in their work with trafficked persons. If you have any questions or concerns you can contact Joe Guada at 614.247.8967, guada.1@osu.edu or Trisha Smouse at 937.207.3914, smouse.3@buckeyemail.osu.edu.

I,_______________________________, give consent to Trisha Smouse to provide
(Department or Agency Head)

information about _____________________. I understand that I will be assigned a
number ______________, which will be utilized on all documents in lieu of my name or
(Organization)

name of organization and only non-identifying information will be used in the final report. I understand that The Ohio State University is involved in the research and is, therefore, responsible for monitoring research.
☐ This information was verbally translated to me in my language of choice, and I have received a copy of this for my own records.

______________________________________________ ______________________
(Department or Agency Head Signature)    (Date)

______________________________________________  ______________________
(Witness Signature)   (Date)
Appendix C: Survey Questions

Human Trafficking In Central Ohio

The main purpose of the study is a needs assessment regarding human trafficking. This study will assess the level of human trafficking awareness, service availability, and barriers of service provision to better prioritize and improve services to those impacted by human trafficking. The results from this survey will help to identify existing services to victims of human trafficking in Central Ohio and identify gaps in services.

Your participation is voluntary, you can refuse to participate or withdraw at any time without penalty or repercussion and your answers will be kept completely confidential. All your information is anonymous and will be complied to help further our research about human trafficking.

The researchers will assure the following in order to protect confidentiality of the information you provide. Only Dr. Joe Guada and Trisha Smouse will have access to information that could identify individuals. Your responses to these questions will be reported only in aggregate and will never identify you as an individual. Your participation in this evaluation is completely voluntary. You may decline to participate in the study or withdraw your participation from the study at any time without consequences or penalties. The survey will take approximately forty-five minutes to complete.

Thank you for your interest in our study.

If you have any questions during or after the study, please contact us: Dr. Joe Guada at 614.247.8967 or guada.1@osu.edu or Trisha Smouse at 937.207.3914 or smouse.3@buckeyemail.osu.edu.

Please check the box below if you would like to continue with this survey.

☐ I willingly consent to taking this survey.

Thank you for participating in our survey. Your feedback is important.
Section 1: Demographic Information

The following questions focus on basic demographic information about your organization. Please answer the following questions as completely as possible.

1. What is your job title?

2. What is the name of your agency?

3. How many years have you worked at this agency?

4. What type of agency do you represent? (please check all that apply)

   - Refugee/Immigrant Services and/or Advocacy
   - Domestic Violence Services and/or Advocacy
   - Sexual Assault Services and/or Advocacy
   - Health Care Provider
   - Community Based Organization
   - Ethnic Community-based Organization
   - Religious Organization
   - Social Service Agency
   - Immigration Legal Assistance Provider
   - Interpreter Services
   - Migrant Worker/Labor Rights
   - Homeless Shelter
   - Children Services Organization
   - Youth Organization
   - Crime Victims Services
   - Other (please specify)

5. How many people work for your agency? (please check one answer only)

   - 1-5
   - 6-10
   - 11-30
   - 31+

6. What areas of the state do you serve?

   - Statewide
   - Multiple counties
   - Single county
   - City/Town
   - Community

6a. If not statewide, please list counties/communities that you serve
7 How do you inform the community of your programs and/or services? (please check all that apply)

- Media Advertising
- Informational Poster/Brochures
- Word-of-mouth
- Local 211
- Outreach in community events
- No information/outreach activities
- Other (please specify)

8 What languages do your agency staff speak? (please check all that apply)

- English
- Spanish
- Chinese
- Russian
- Vietnamese
- Somali
- Other (please specify)

9 What target populations does your agency serve?
Section 2: Human Trafficking Awareness

This section addresses your agency's level of human trafficking awareness.

1In your opinion, how serious of a problem is human trafficking in the community that you serve?

- Not a Problem
- Not So Serious
- Serious
- Very Serious
- Don't Know

2In your opinion, are the following individuals’ victims of human trafficking? Select Yes, No, or Not Enough Information

An under-aged girl forced into prostitution
A factory worker laboring in unsafe conditions
An agricultural worker earning slave wages
A prostitute working off her debt to her pimp
A domestic helper forced to work 14-hour days
A foreign worker smuggled into the country
An individual traded by a family member for goods or services

3Since 2000, have you participated (either attended or presented) in any of the following? (please check all that apply)

- Training on Human Trafficking
- Conference/Symposium on Human Trafficking
- Outreach event focused on Human Trafficking
- Anything else related to Human Trafficking (please describe)

4Does your agency currently provide services for victims of human trafficking or participate in anti-human trafficking activities/initiatives?

- Yes - provide services
- Yes - participate in anti-human trafficking activities/initiatives
- No - but we're planning to provide services in the future
- No - but we're planning to engage in anti-human trafficking activities in the future
- No - we have no plans in this area
- Other (please specify)
5Are you interested in the following? (please check all that apply)

- To receive training/training materials in identifying and assisting Human Trafficking Victims
- To become part of a service provider network assisting Human Trafficking Victims
- To be informed of upcoming workshops, lectures, symposia and/or conferences on Human Trafficking
- To be part of a Service Provider - Law Enforcement Working Group
Section 3: Services to Trafficked Persons

This section addresses questions about the actual services your organization provides to victims of human trafficking.

1 What types of human trafficking services does your agency offer?

- Prevention (information and awareness raising campaigns, health and other specific prevention measures)
- Basic Assistance (low threshold services, social assistance and inclusion, vocational guidance and training/work insertion, local community work, specific return and reintegration measures)
- Professional Development (training of key-players, measures aimed at the organizational structure, self-evaluation, networking and research)

2 Has your agency encountered a case(s) involving individuals who have engaged in the following activities? Please answer Yes or No.

- Commercial sex act(s) induced by force, fraud or coercion, if the individual is 18 or older
  - Yes
  - No

- Commercial sex act(s) where the individual is under 18 years old
  - Yes
  - No

- Any form of labor, work, or service that can be classified as involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage or slavery and was induced through the use of force, fraud or coercion
  - Yes
  - No

3 Has your agency encountered a case(s) involving human trafficking victims (that is, provided direct service and/or consultation)?

- Yes
- No (go to section Barriers to Provide Services)
- Not sure (go to section Barriers to Provide Services)

4 If yes, approximately how many cases involving human trafficking victims has your agency handled since 2000?

- 1
- 2-5
- 6-10
- 11+
- Not sure
5 Approximately how many total cases has your agency handled since 2000?

- 1
- 2-5
- 6-10
- 11+
- Not sure

6 What percentage of your clients identify as:

- Females
- Males

7 What percentage of your clients are:

- Sex
- Labor
- Both

8 Do you primarily work with victims of human trafficking who are: (please check all that apply - specify age at the time client entered the system)

- Adults: specify age range
- Children: specify age range

9 What percentage of your clients are:

Adults
Children

10 What percentage of your clients are:

US Citizens
Foreign Nationals

11 What percentage of your foreign clients are:

Immigrants (please identify status)
Permanent resident
T visa
Refugee (status; legal vs. personal classification)
Other (please specify)

12 Which countries do your human trafficking victims represent?

13 What languages are spoken by most of your human trafficking victims?
14 Are interpreters available for human trafficking victims?

- Yes, for all languages
- Yes, for some languages (specify)
- No

15 In what ways are the needs of human trafficking victims different and/or similar to other victims of crime? (list similarities/differences in: length of service, presence of support networks, level of isolation, level of fear, level of trust, ability to communicate with service providers, types of services, etc)

16 In what ways are the problems of human trafficking victims different and/or similar to other victims of crime? (list similarities/differences in: length of service, presence of support networks, level of isolation, level of fear, level of trust, ability to communicate with service providers, types of services, etc)

17 In general, what services have human trafficking victims needed? (please check all that apply)

- 24 Hour Response Line
- Emergency Response
- Case Management
- Emergency Housing
- Housing Placement
- Material Assistance (Food, Clothing)
- Interpretation Translation
- Counseling
- Employment Services
- Education
- Spiritual Services
- Legal Advocacy
- Public Benefits
- Medical Care
- Residential Program
- Advocacy
- Transportation
- Outreach
- Info/Referral
- Mental Health
- Protection
- Crisis Intervention
- Victim's Compensation
- Life Skills
- Child Care
- Drug Treatment
18 What services has your organization been able to provide human trafficking victims internally? (please check all that apply)

- Self-help groups
- Other (please specify)

- 24 Hour Response Line
- Emergency Response
- Case Management
- Emergency Housing
- Housing Placement
- Material Assistance (Food, Clothing)
- Interpretation Translation
- Counseling
- Employment Services
- Education
- Spiritual Services
- Legal Advocacy
- Public Benefits
- Medical Care
- Residential Program
- Advocacy
- Transportation
- Outreach
- Info/Referral
- Mental Health
- Protection
- Crisis Intervention
- Victim's Compensation
- Life Skills
- Child Care
- Drug Treatment
- Self-help groups
- Other (please specify)

19 Which services, if any, has your agency referred out to other service providers? (please check all that apply)

- 24 Hour Response Line
- Emergency Response
- Case Management
- Emergency Housing
- Housing Placement
- Material Assistance (Food, Clothing)
- Interpretation Translation
- Counseling
0 Employment Services
0 Education
0 Spiritual Services
0 Legal Advocacy
0 Public Benefits
0 Medical Care
0 Residential Program
0 Advocacy
0 Transportation
0 Outreach
0 Info/Referral
0 Mental Health
0 Protection
0 Crisis Intervention
0 Victim's Compensation
0 Life Skills
0 Child Care
0 Drug Treatment
0 Self-help groups
0 Other (please specify)

20 What is the name of the referred agency?

Name:
Contact Person:
E-mail Address:

Name:
Contact Person:
E-mail Address:

21 What is the average length of the service your agency provides to human trafficking victims?

0 Less than 1 week
0 One week to 1 month
0 More than 1 month up to 3 months
0 More than 3 months up to 6 months
0 More than 6 months up to 12 months
0 More than 12 months
0 Don't know

22 For those services that your organization does provide to its human trafficking victims, do you think you are:

0 More than adequately meeting those needs
Adequately meeting those needs
Meeting some needs but not others
Having difficulty meeting needs

23 What is the number of staff (including the Director) who work with trafficking victims?

- Full-time
- Part-time
- Volunteer

24 Do you have formal procedures/protocols in place for how to serve/treat human trafficking victims?

- Yes (please describe the procedures/protocols.)
- No (skip to question 27)

25 Do you think the procedures/protocols are useful?

- Not useful
- Not So useful
- Useful
- Very useful
- Don't know

26 Do you think procedures/protocols are necessary? (please explain)

- Yes
- No

27 Do you charge human trafficking victims a fee for your services?

- Yes
- No

28 Do you have a recording system for the services you provide to human trafficking victims?

- Yes (please explain the system)
- No (please explain why not)

29 What is most likely to happen to the human trafficking victims you serve? (please check all that apply - specify percentage of cases for each category)

- Deported: % of cases
- Permanent resident status: % of cases
Employment: % of cases
Don't know: % of cases
Other: % of cases

How do the human trafficking victims learn about your agency? (please check all that apply)

- Referrals - For those services, with which agencies have you primarily worked?
- Brochures or other written materials in other offices
- Community outreach
- Informational letter
- Newspaper ads
- Radio announcements
- TV announcements
- Walk-in
- "Word of mouth"
- Other (please specify)
Section 4: Barriers to Service Provision to Trafficked Persons

The questions in the following section focuses on barriers to providing services to victims of human trafficking.

1. What are the most critical barriers/challenges you face in providing services victims of human trafficking? (please check all that apply)

- Coordinating with Federal agencies
- Feelings of no support and isolation by service providers
- Lack of adequate funding
- Lack of adequate resources
- Lack of adequate training
- Lack of formal rules/regulations
- Lack of in-house procedures
- Lack of knowledge about victims' rights
- Language concerns
- Safety concerns
- Other (please specify)

2. Based on what you know about victims of human trafficking, what are the reasons some human trafficking victims DO NOT seek out services? (please check all that apply)

- Fear of deportation/legal status
- Fear of retaliation to self and/or family
- Lack of social support (i.e., isolated)
- Feelings of shame or embarrassment
- Lack of knowledge about available services
- Lack of knowledge about victims' rights
- Lack of trust of the system
- Language differences
- Not able to identify self as a victim
- Other (please specify)

3. In your opinion, what barriers exist for your agency in providing services to human trafficking victims? (please check all that apply)

- Lack of support/coordination with federal agencies
- Lack of support/coordination with other Central Ohio service providers/Law Enforcement agencies
- Lack of funding/resources
- Lack of knowledge about the services trafficking victims need
- Lack of training/information about human trafficking
- Lack of organizational policy or procedures for addressing the needs of trafficked victims
4. What barriers do you feel exist in Central Ohio for human trafficking victims seeking services? (please check all that apply)

- Language barriers
- Issues of safety
- Victim's legal status
- Inadequate staffing
- Knowing where or how to local victims
- Don't know/unsure
- Other (please specify)

5. What does your organization need to help you do a better job in providing services to victims of human trafficking?

6. Based on your experiences, what assistance would other agencies need to improve the service(s) they provide to trafficking victims?
Section 5: Collaboration

This section addresses collaborative activities.

1 Other than sending and receiving referrals, what agencies or individuals do you collaborate with? (please check all that apply)

○ Advocacy groups
○ Business and private sector
○ Clergy working outside of faith community
○ Community of attorneys or correction
○ Community of leaders
○ Consulate
○ Court-appointed special advocates
○ Department of Justice (DOJ)
○ District attorney/Prosecution
○ Domestic violence agencies
○ Educational institutions
○ Faith community
○ Family crisis centers
○ Health services
○ Homeless shelters
○ Hospitals/Emergency medical
○ Housing services
○ Local government (mayor's office)
○ Media Advertising
○ Mental health services
○ Police department
○ Probation
○ Public defender's office
○ Sexual assault coordinators
○ Social workers
○ Substance abuse agencies
○ U.S. Attorney's Office
○ Victim’s assistance agencies
○ Victims advocate
○ Witness protection program
○ Other (please specify)

2 Are these organizations primarily: (please mark all that apply)

○ International
○ National
○ Federal
○ Statewide
○ Local government
For the organizations indicated above, please describe the primary purpose of your collaboration:

- Providing training and technical assistance
- Receiving training and technical assistance
- Sharing information
- Sharing resources (e.g., financial, material, building space)
- Sharing staff
- Other (please specify)

Additional comments/questions

Can you refer us to other agencies or individuals we should contact for this study?

- Yes
- No

If yes, can you provide contact information? (please list as many as possible)

Agency:
Contact person:
Telephone number:

Agency:
Contact person:
Telephone number:

Agency:
Contact person:
Telephone number: