MUSIC

IN THE CATHOLIC ELEMENTARY SCHOOLS

OF LORAIN COUNTY, OHIO:

A COMPARATIVE STUDY

A Thesis

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements
for the Degree Master of Arts

by

Jerome D. Catalano, B.S.

The Ohio State University
1977

Approved by

[Signature]

Adviser
Department of Music
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The author wishes to express thanks to those people who helped in the realization of this paper: Sister Catherine Nolan, HM, Lorain County Regional Superintendent of Catholic Education, for her approval of the study; the principals of the Catholic elementary schools of Lorain County, Ohio for their prompt and conscientious responses to the study questionnaire; student members of the Lorain Catholic High School Band for their help with the preparation and mailing of the study questionnaire; and finally, David Meeker, Ph.D., my advisor, for his patient and long-suffering assistance, particularly with the structure and mechanics of the paper.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS** ........................................... 11

**Chapter**

I. INTRODUCTION .................................................. 1  
   The school system  
   Methodology

II. THE STUDY SCHOOLS ........................................... 7

III. THE COMPARISON ............................................... 14  
    Ohio Minimum Standards  
    MENC Recommendations

IV. RECOMMENDATIONS ............................................. 29  
    Comments  
    Suggestions for Further Study

APPENDIX A ....................................................... 35

APPENDIX B ....................................................... 36

APPENDIX C ....................................................... 38

**BIBLIOGRAPHY** ................................................ 41
CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

The purpose of this study is to apply the Music standards of the State of Ohio Department of Education and the recommendations of the Music Educators National Conference (MENC) to the Catholic elementary schools of Lorain County, Ohio.

This study was inspired by observations made by the author during four years' service as a music teacher and department head at Lorain Catholic High School. The first observation was that the results of course pre-tests indicated that ninth grade students enrolling in the music appreciation course show a marked lack of fundamental knowledge about music. Secondly, most ninth-grade students enrolling in the freshman choir do not know how to read music, do not understand the very basic musical concepts of pitch, timbre, duration, and loudness, are unable to sing pieces written in two parts, and exhibit little knowledge of the fundamentals of correct singing. The third observation was that of students enrolling in the high school band, those from three parish elementary schools exhibit playing skills, musical understanding, and motivation of a far greater level of development than those students from all other Catholic elementary schools.
Fourthly, it was observed that the instrumental music consultant for the Diocese of Cleveland makes contact with the high school instrumental music teacher approximately once per year and apparently is not given the time to adequately investigate the quality of the music programs in the Catholic elementary schools of Lorain County. The fifth and final observation was that the Cleveland Diocesan Catholic Schools are facing some rather severe financial problems and some school administrators tend to downplay the importance of music education and the arts in general in times of austerity. These observations have led the author to conclude that a study of this sort is needed as a starting point in the development of a uniformly high-quality music education program for the Catholic schools of the county. A comprehensive study would include the investigation of curricula, physical facilities, equipment and instructional materials, music personnel qualifications, and student outcomes. The present study is meant as a beginning and will deal only with course offerings and staffing.

The School System

The Cleveland Diocesan School System is comprised of Ashland, Cuyahoga, Geauga, Lake, Lorain, Medina, Summit, and Wayne counties—3414 square miles. The system has 179 elementary schools and 29 high schools with a total
enrollment of 85,479 students. These schools are of two types: (1) those which are affiliated with a parish or a religious order, and (2) those which are called "Diocesan" schools. Authority and responsibility for the operation of parish schools lies first with the principal and ultimately with the pastor who may consult with a parish council. In the case of the Diocesan schools, the chief administrator (usually the principal) carries the responsibility and authority perhaps with advice from an "education commission" made up of parents and interested persons selected from the community. All of these administrators are guided by a Regional Board of Catholic Education and a Regional Superintendent who are in turn responsible to the Diocesan Board of Education and the Diocesan Superintendent. The Diocesan Superintendent is appointed by the Bishop through his Secretary of Education. Besides these administrators, there are advisory, supervisory, and consultant personnel operating at both the regional and diocesan levels.

Financial support of the schools is primarily a local concern with aid from the Diocese available to those schools in poverty situations such as the inner city schools. Funding comes from tuitions, donations, endowments, and various fund-raising activities such as bingo,

raffles, booster organizations, etc.

There are seventeen parish-affiliated elementary schools and two diocesan high schools located in Lorain County. These schools operate under the auspices of the Lorain County Board of Catholic Education and the Lorain County Regional Superintendent. There is one curriculum consultant at the Lorain County Regional level, but no music supervisory personnel. At the Diocesan level there is one instrumental music consultant.

Methodology

Essentially this study has three parts: (1) the finding and compiling of the pertinent state standards and MENC recommendations, (2) the collecting of course offering and music staffing information from each of the schools in the county, and (3) the comparing of the data with the standards and recommendations.

Two sources were used for course offering and staffing standards and recommendations: (1) Minimum Standards for Ohio Elementary Schools, a publication of the Ohio Department of Education; and (2) The School Music Program: Description and Standards, a publication of the MENC. Minimum Standards contains standards for all phases of elementary school operation, a fact which necessitated a search for those standards which apply to Music Education. From this group of music education standards and from the MENC recommendations, those which apply to music course
offerings and staffing were isolated for use in this study. The minimum standards for the state of Ohio and the recommendations of the MENC were chosen because these two sets of guidelines represent the limits of the spectrum of possible music program development. The state standards give the statutory minimums while the MENC recommendations give the ideal but are not in any way to be construed as binding. Most school systems will have music programs which fall somewhere in between the minimum and the ideal.

Data on the music offerings and teachers of the study schools was sought by way of a questionnaire mailed to the principals of the Catholic elementary schools in Lorain County.\(^1\) The form was short in order to enhance the probability of a good percentage return while providing for the acquisition of all of the information essential to the study. In spite of this effort, only ten responses were received and a second mailing augmented with telephone and personal interviews of the non-respondants was necessitated. Sufficient data on all seventeen schools was eventually accumulated to permit the inclusion of all of the schools in this study. The data was then compiled and tabulated for use in the comparison phase of the report, Chapters II and III.

It was decided that a general, county-wide evaluation

\(^1\)See Appendix A for a list of the study schools and Appendix B for a copy of the questionnaire.
without identifying individual buildings and principals would give a clear picture to the regional administration of the kinds of improvements needed while avoiding some of the pit-falls of a building-by-building evaluation. Criticism, no matter how scholarly, well-intentioned, and constructive, is somehow easier to deal with by those being critiqued when it comes from persons whose job it is to perform such critiques rather than from persons who seem to be self-appointed. This report, then, will focus the attention of the regional administration on needed improvements in the music programs of the Catholic elementary schools of the county.
CHAPTER II

THE STUDY SCHOOLS

The following information about the music programs in the Catholic elementary schools of Lorain County, Ohio was obtained by questionnaire and personal interview during the 1976-77 school year. The schools are not identified by name in the body of this report, but a complete alphabetical listing of the schools surveyed can be found in Appendix A. The data on course offerings and music program staffing at these schools is repeated in table form in Appendix C.

School #1 has an enrollment of 100 students in grades one through eight. General music is taught to all grades for sixty minutes per week. A music specialist teaches 75 percent of this class time and the classroom teachers follow up the specialist for the other 25 percent of the class time. Vocal music is offered to grades five through eight once per week for 45 minutes, however the person who teaches vocal music is not certified to teach music by the state of Ohio. This school has no instrumental music program of any kind. The principal indicated on the comments portion of the questionnaire that she is not satisfied with the music program as it
is presently constituted, but offered no further comments about possible remedies.

School # 2 has an enrollment of 250 students in grades one through eight. All grades are taught general music by the classroom teachers. Time allocations follow the suggestions for time allocations found in the appendix of *Minimum Standards*, i.e., sixty minutes per week for grades one and two, seventy minutes per week for grade three, eighty minutes per week for grades four, five, and six, and ninety minutes per week for grades seven and eight. There is no vocal music program but a band instrument program is available for interested students in grades five through eight. This program is taught by a certified teacher of music who meets fifth graders twice per week for thirty and 45 minutes, and sixth, seventh, and eighth graders twice a week for 45 and sixty minutes. Instruction on string instruments is not offered. Although expressing dissatisfaction with the existing music program, the principal of this school offered no comments concerning possible means of improving the situation.

School # 3 has a music program which offers ninety minutes a week of general music instruction to all of its 178 students, but does not have a vocal music or an instrumental music program. General music is taught
exclusively by the classroom teachers. The principal did not respond to the question regarding her satisfaction with the music program as it exists at present.

School # 4 is the largest of the seventeen schools, and it is attended by 560 students. General music is taught to all grades by the classroom teachers according to the suggested time allocations in the appendix of *Minimum Standards* (see school # 2 above). The vocal music program consists of one thirty-minute meeting per week and is offered to students in grades five through eight. The vocal music teacher is certified in music. There is no instrumental music program in this school, but the principal indicated that she is satisfied with the present arrangement.

School # 5 has a general music program and a band instrument program but does not have either a vocal music program or a string instrument program. General music follows the same outline as in school # 4 above. Band is available for grades five through eight twice a week for a total of 60 minutes, and is taught by a certified music teacher. The principal indicated that she is not satisfied with the music program she is able to offer to her 336 students.

School # 6 offers a full 100 minutes per week of general music instruction to all students, but has no other music programs. The classroom teachers are responsible for all music instruction given to the school's 219
students. This principal is also dissatisfied with the music program in her school.

School # 7 has a music specialist who teaches all of the general music classes, again according to the suggested time allocations given in Minimum Standards. The 211 students in this school are offered no other music programs. Also again, the principal is not satisfied with the music program.

School # 8 also offers general music to all grades according to the suggested schedule in Minimum Standards. The classroom teachers handle all of the general music instruction for the school's 206 students. Although there is no vocal music program, there is a band instrument program for grades five through eight and a string instrument program for grades four through eight taught by a certified music teacher. These instrument classes meet twice a week for a total of sixty minutes. The principal would like to see a vocal music program come into existence.

School # 9, which has an enrollment of 274, provides general music instruction for all grades, and vocal and instrumental (band) music for grades five through eight. The classroom teachers are scheduled to teach twenty minutes of general music per week and there is no music specialist. The vocal music instructor(s) is not certified in music but meets her class three times a week for a total of ninety minutes. Band instrument instruction takes place
twice a week for a total of sixty minutes and is performed by a certified music teacher. This principal is satisfied with her school's music program.

School # 10 has an enrollment of 197 students in grades one through eight. There is no vocal music program and no instrumental music program, but general music is taught by the classroom teachers according to the time outline suggested in Minimum Standards. The principal is not satisfied with this arrangement.

School # 11 follows the same arrangement for general music as school # 10 above and also offers band and orchestra instrument instruction twice a week to interested students in grades five through eight. These classes meet for a total of sixty minutes per week with a certified music teacher. This music program is adequate according to the school's principal.

School # 12 also follows the suggested time allocations found in Minimum Standards for general music classes. The classroom teachers at all grade levels conduct these classes. Vocal music is available for grades five through eight once weekly for a total of thirty minutes and is taught by an interested teacher who is not certified in music. Band instrument instruction is provided for interested fifth through eighth graders by a certified music teacher. These classes meet twice weekly also for a total of sixty minutes. This principal is satisfied with the music
program as it currently exists in her school.

School # 13 has the most comprehensive music program of any of the seventeen schools. This program includes general music, vocal music, and instrumental music instruction on both band and orchestra instruments. The suggested time allocations from Minimum Standards are followed by the classroom teachers who teach general music at all grade levels. The vocal music teacher, who meets her groups twice weekly for a total of sixty minutes, is not a certified teacher of music. Vocal music is offered to students in grades five through eight. Band and string instrument classes are taught by a certified teacher of music who meets his classes twice per week for a total of sixty minutes. Band instrument class begins with the fifth grade and string class begins with the fourth grade. This principal is also satisfied with her music program.

School #14 offers general music to all grades on the same basis as schools ten through thirteen above. Vocal music and band are offered to grades five through eight twice weekly totaling sixty minutes. The instrumental music teacher is certified in music but the vocal music teacher is not. This program is not satisfactory for the school's 244 students, according to the principal.

School # 15 has 500 students in grades one through eight. Each grade receives sixty minutes a week of general
music instruction, taught by the classroom teachers. Vocal music is offered to grades five through eight three times a week for a total of ninety minutes, but the teacher is not certified to teach music. The instrumental music teacher, who is certified in music, teaches band instrument classes to fifth, sixth, seventh, and eighth graders once a week for thirty minutes. This program does not satisfy the principal.

School #16 offers a program identical to that offered by school #15 above except that general music is taught for ninety minutes per week rather than for sixty. This principal is also dissatisfied with the music program in her school. Enrollment is 510 students.

School #17 has a music specialist who covers half of the general music class time and assists the classroom teachers in preparing for the other half of the scheduled class time. Time allocations are those suggested by the aforementioned table found in the appendix of Minimum Standards. Although there is no vocal music program, instrumental music instruction on band instruments is available for interested members of the fifth through eighth grades. These classes meet with a certified teacher of music twice a week for a total of sixty minutes. The principal indicated that she is satisfied with this program.
CHAPTER III

THE COMPARISON

Ohio Minimum Standards

Minimum Standards contains a statement of the standards as they apply to statutory requirements, organization and administration, curriculum and instruction, pupil services, staff personnel, instructional materials and equipment, school and community relations, evaluation and research, and physical facilities, and a section of interpretation pertaining to the aforementioned standards. Also included is an appendix which contains a "suggested weekly time allocation" table.

The standards themselves are somewhat vague and general, and are short enough to be quoted here almost in their entirety. Those standards which apply to music offerings and staffing are as follows:

Standard EDb-401-01
A) Each elementary school shall comply with the Revised Code of the State of Ohio.... Significant... are the following:

...33313.60--Course of Study--"Each school shall have a graded course of study that has been prescribed by... the proper authority... subject to the approval of the State Board of Education. This shall include the study of the following subjects:

(6) The fine arts, including music.
Standard EDb-401-02
Organization and Administration

(G) Based on a minimum five-hour school day

... the total instructional time allo-
cation per week shall be:

four fifths -- language arts, mathematics,
social studies, science, health, citizen-
ship, related directed study and self-
help; optional foreign language.

one fifth -- directed physical education,
music, art, special activities and
optional applied arts.

Standard EDb-401-03
Curriculum and Instruction

(B) Each school system shall develop current
courses of study for the curricular con-
tent required by, but not limited to, The
Revised Code of Ohio, section 3313.60.

Standard EDb-401-05. Staff Personnel, makes no
specific reference to teachers of any subject area, but
rather it states that teachers must "hold a valid cer-
tificate as defined in The Revised Code of Ohio." This
standard also states that "staff members shall be selected
and assigned on the basis of professional preparation,
personal qualification, and interest in teaching elemen-
tary school children."\(^2\)

It would seem that is these standards are taken at
face value, all that is required of elementary schools in
Ohio with regard to the teaching of music is that music be

\(^1\) Minimum Standards for Ohio Elementary Schools, State
of Ohio, Department of Education (Columbus, 1970), pp. 3,
4. and 6.

\(^2\) Ibid., p. 15.
a part of the curriculum, that it be taught for some frac-
tion of one-fifth of the school day, and that it be taught
by a certified teacher. Thus, all seventeen of the schools
in this study seem to be in compliance with these standards.
All of the schools have regularly scheduled music classes
of some kind and these classes are taught by persons who
do have some sort of Ohio teaching certificate. However,
the interpretive section of the standards provides a some-
what more detailed description of what is expected of Ohio's
elementary schools.

According to the introductory essay to the interpre-
tive section, the interpretations are presented "as a guide
for teachers, supervisors, administrators, boards of edu-
cation, and others who implement the Minimum Standards for
the Elementary Schools of Ohio. The objective was to
clarify the intent of the standards through description of
practiced and activities employed by school districts in
compliance."¹ The interpretations offer guides at two
levels, Level I is the minimum level of compliance. Level
II "suggests directions for development beyond the minimum
standards."²

Minimum Standards suggests that the reader refer to
The Ohio Revised Code for the interpretation of Standard

¹Minimum Standards for Ohio Elementary Schools, p. 19.
²Ibid.
EDb-401-01, Statutory Requirements.

The interpretation of Standard EDb-401-02, Organization and Administration, relates the standard to a specific number of minutes per week, and suggests more flexibility in the weekly routine than seems to be indicated in the standard itself. At Level I the text reads: "The weekly schedule provides for a minimum of 300 minutes for directed physical education, music, art and special activities."\(^1\) At Level II it states:

Although the weekly time allocation assures the fulfillment of the time requirements for each of the subject areas, . . . time is used daily in a flexible way determined by the needs of the teacher-learning situation. As the school day is planned to accommodate the nature of the learning task, the use of large and small blocks of time replaces the division of the day into periods of equal length.\(^2\)

An even more detailed division of the school week is contained in the "Suggested Weekly Time Allocation" located in the appendix of Minimum Standards. This table suggests the following number of minutes per week of music at the various grade levels:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade Level</th>
<th>Minutes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grades 1 &amp; 2</td>
<td>60 Minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 3</td>
<td>70 Minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grades 4, 5, 6</td>
<td>80 Minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grades 7 &amp; 8</td>
<td>90 Minutes (band, orchestra or chorus can be substituted for general music)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As is indicated by its separation from the main body of

---

\(^1\)Minimum Standards for Ohio Elementary Schools, p. 24.

\(^2\)Ibid.
Minimum Standards, this table is offered only as a suggestion and is not binding in any way.

All of the schools in this study have scheduled time for general music for all grades. Eleven schools follow the "suggested weekly time allocation" exactly. Two schools fall below the suggested time allocation for some grades while meeting the standard for other grades. Two schools exceed the suggested allocations for some grades while just equalling it for other grades. One school exceeds the suggested allocations for all grades, and one school falls short of the standard for all grades.

Standard EDB-401-03, Curriculum and Instruction, is interpreted with a much more detailed presentation which provides a philosophy, a program, two levels of availability of equipment and instructional materials and facilities, and two levels of staff qualifications and assignments. The indicated program specifies a general music program for all students in grades one through eight and an instrumental and vocal music performance program in grades four through eight. General educational objectives and areas of instruction are listed for each program.

With regard to staff personnel, level I requires "academic staff reinforced through inservice study"\(^1\), an apparent indication that the classroom teacher is to be responsible for music instruction. At level II, music specialists in

\(^1\)Minimum Standards for Ohio Elementary Schools, p.74.
general, vocal, and instrumental music, and a music supervisor are called for.

All schools have scheduled time for general music for grades one through eight.

Seven schools offer a vocal music experience to students in grades five through eight, thus fulfilling the state requirements for those grades. However, none of the schools offers such experience to students in grade four as specified in the interpretation of this standard. Ten schools report no vocal music program at all and thus are below the level of compliance indicated.

None of the schools offers band to students in grade four as specified. However twelve schools offer band to students in grades five through eight. Five schools report no band program at all. Three schools offer string orchestra to students in grades four through eight. Fourteen schools report no orchestra or string instrument program at all. The interpretation of this standard calls for "instrumental music" for grades four through eight, but does not specify that this must include both band and orchestra instruments.

Three schools report that general music is taught by a music specialist. In school number one, the specialist teaches 75 per cent of the general music class time each week and works with the classroom teachers in preparing the other 25 per cent of the class time. In school number seventeen, 50 per cent of the general music class time is
taught by the specialist who guides the classroom teachers in preparation of the other half of the class time. These two schools are somewhere in between level I and level II of compliance. In school number seven the specialist teaches all of the general music class time. This school is at level II of compliance. In the other fourteen schools, general music is taught by the classroom teachers. These schools are at level I of compliance. Of the seven schools reporting vocal music offerings, none has a certified vocal music teacher. Thus all are at level I of compliance. The twelve schools with band and/or orchestra programs share four teachers, all of whom are certified teachers of music. These schools are at level II of compliance for instrumental music.

General Conclusions

None of the seventeen schools is in complete compliance with all of the state minimum standards as outlined in the interpretive section of Minimum Standards. However, six schools come very close, lacking only the vocal and instrumental music experience for fourth grade students. One school falls short only in that it lacks an instrumental music program. Six schools lack only the vocal music offering. The other four schools lack both the vocal and instrumental music programs.

Comparison of Existing Programs to MENC Recommendations

In contrast to the vagueness of the Ohio minimum
standards, the MENC recommendations are somewhat specific. These recommendations are contained in Part 2 of *The School Music Program*, and like the interpretive section of *Minimum Standards*, they are offered at two levels of development: a "basic program" and a "quality program." The introductory remarks to Part 2 express the belief and hope that some school districts would to beyond the quality program level in seeking excellence in their music programs. The MENC recommendations are for entire school districts rather than for the individual grade level groupings (elementary, secondary). Some of the suggested programs apply to all grade levels including adult education programs, and some apply either to elementary (K-6) schools, to junior high (7-9) or middle (5-8) schools, or to high schools. This study will use those standards which apply either to all grade levels or to elementary schools and junior high or middle schools.

*The School Music Program* lists fourteen standards for curriculum. Those which apply to grades K-8 are quoted below. Following the statement of each of the applicable standards is an evaluation of the programs in the study schools to which the standard pertains.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Basic Program</th>
<th>Quality Program</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. General Music is offered daily to each student in grades K-6.</td>
<td>General Music is offered daily to each student in grades K-6.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instruction on band and orchestra</td>
<td>Instruction on band and orchestra</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
instruments is offered beginning in grade 4 or grade 5. Instruments, guitar, and keyboard instruments is offered beginning in grade 4 or grade 5.

Exploratory instrumental classes are offered beginning not later than grade 3.

Choral experiences are offered beginning in grade 5.

One school offers general music daily to all students in grades one through six, satisfying the conditions for both the basic program and the quality program. Three schools offer band and orchestra instrument instruction beginning in grade four or grade five--qualifying as a basic program in that area. Nine schools offer instruction on band instruments only, beginning in the fifth grade. Seven schools offer choral experiences beginning in the fifth grade, thus placing themselves at the quality program level for vocal music.

**Basic Program**
2. Beginning and intermediate class instruction is available in the junior high or middle school to any student desiring such instruction

**Quality Program**
Beginning, intermediate, and advanced instruction on most instruments and voice is available in the... junior high or middle school to any student desiring such instruction.

None of the schools offers this type of instruction.

**Basic Program**
3. At least one organization-emphasis or

**Quality Program**
At least two types of organization-emphasis
A description-emphasis course is offered at each grade level in the junior high or middle school.

An additional organization-emphasis course is offered for each 300 students above 300 in the school.

None of the schools offers any such courses.

**Basic Program**

4. Mixed chorus is offered in the junior high or middle school.

**Quality Program**

At least two choral ensembles are offered in the junior high or middle school. An additional choral ensemble is offered for each 300 students above 600 in the school.

Six schools meet this standard at the quality program level by offering vocal music in grades five through eight.

**Basic Program**

6. Band or wind ensemble is offered in the junior high or middle school.

**Quality Program**

At least two bands or wind ensembles are offered in the junior high or middle school. An additional band or wind ensemble is offered for each 300 students above 600 in the school. These groups are differentiated by the experience, ability, or degree of interest of the members.

Twelve schools offer band to students in grades five through eight. All twelve schools have two groups--beginning band and advanced band--thus meeting the
recommendation for a quality program.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Basic Program</th>
<th>Quality Program</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7. Orchestra or string orchestra is offered in the junior high or middle school.</td>
<td>Full orchestra is offered in the junior high or middle school. An additional orchestra ensemble is offered for each 300 students above 300 in the school.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Three schools offer orchestra to students in grades four through eight. These schools have programs at the basic program level.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Basic Program</th>
<th>Quality Program</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8. Experience in small ensembles is available in the junior high or middle school to any student desiring such experience.</td>
<td>Regular participation in a program of small ensembles during school time is available in the junior high or middle school to any student desiring such experience.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

None of the schools offers small ensemble experience.

Additional standards dealing with course content are listed but are not applicable to this study.

The general comments preceding the actual list of recommendations for staff state that the MENC believes that "...inclusion in music can best be provided by music specialists, though the specialist may be greatly assisted by the classroom teacher who creates an atmosphere favorable to music, and especially by the classroom teacher who carries on music activities between visits by the specialist."

Three schools have music specialists. One of these specialists teaches all of the general music in her school.

---

while the other two work with the classroom teachers in providing music instruction.

There are sixteen standards for staff. Those which pertain to this study specify that the music teaching staff should be sufficient to provide the class instruction, course offerings, and performing groups specified in the curriculum standards with the following meeting frequencies:

Basic Program

vocal music twice weekly in groups of comparable age, vocal maturity, and experience;

elementary school beginning and intermediate instrumental classes twice weekly;

junior high or middle school beginning and intermediate instrumental classes three times per week.

Quality Program

daily junior high or middle school vocal experiences;

elementary school instrumental classes three times per week;

daily junior high or middle school instrumental classes.

None of the schools has a certified vocal music instructor, but the six schools which offer vocal music have on their staffs an interested person or persons who teaches the vocal music offerings. Twelve schools share four certified instrumental music instructors.

The standards for staff also specify teacher-pupil ratios of 1:420 for grades K-3 and 1:270 for grades four and over in a basic program, and ratios of 1:225 and 1:175 in a quality program. These are district-wide standards
but the Lorain County Catholic grade schools are not near
the recommended ratios for a basic program, even in a
purely statistical sense. In other words, even if one
ignores the fact that all schools do not have equal access
to music instructors, and simply divides the number of
students by the number of persons (certified in music or
not) who specialize in some area of music instruction, the
schools in Lorian County do not meet these standards for
student-teacher ratios.

Other standards which deal with class size, teacher loads,
supervisory personnel, special education, and teacher
professional leave are listed in *The School Music Program*
but are beyond the scope of this inquiry.

The MENC recommendations for scheduling are quite
precise. The applicable ones are quoted below and are
followed, as before, by an evaluation of the data in light
of the given standards.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Basic Program</th>
<th>Quality Program</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Each child, K-3, has music experiences in school daily for a total of not less than 100 minutes per week.</td>
<td>Each child, K-3, has music experiences in school daily for a total of not less than 150 minutes per week.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

One school is at the basic program level. All others
are below the basic program level at this grade level.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Basic Program</th>
<th>Quality Program</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Each child in grades 4-6 has music experiences in school daily for a total of not less than 150 minutes per week.</td>
<td>Each child in grades 4-6 has music experiences in school daily for a total of not less than 200 minutes per week.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
All schools are below the standards for a basic program at this grade level.

**Basic Program**
3. Instrumental classes in the elementary school meet at least twice weekly for a total of not less than 60 minutes.

**Quality Program**
Instrumental classes in the elementary school meet at least three times per week for a total of not less than 90 minutes.

Nine schools meet the basic program standard, but three other schools which have instrumental music programs fall short of the standard.

**Basic Program**
4. Each student enrolled in organization-emphasis or description-emphasis courses in grades 7-9 has music experiences at least twice weekly for a total of not less than 100 minutes.

**Quality Program**
Each student enrolled in organization-emphasis or description-emphasis courses in grades 7-9 has music experiences at least three times per week for a total of not less than 150 minutes.

None of the schools even offers such courses.

**Basic Program**
5. Choral and instrumental performance-emphasis classes in the junior high or middle school meet at least twice weekly for a total of not less than 100 minutes.

**Quality Program**
Choral and instrumental performance-emphasis classes in the junior high or middle school meet daily for a total of not less than 200 minutes per week.

One school is at the basic program level for instrumental music in grades six, seven, and eight but falls short in grade five. None of the other schools is up to the basic program standard for instrumental music, and none of the seventeen schools meets the recommendations for vocal music.
General Observations

While some of the schools offer most of the programs suggested by the MENC standards, staffing and class time and frequency are below the standards in most cases.
CHAPTER IV
RECOMMENDATIONS

Given the financial state of affairs existing in many school systems today--particularly in the small Catholic parish grade school--recommendations for improving any program often are accepted or rejected on the basis of the monetary outlay required rather than on the basis of educational efficacy. An overly-zealous music educator might be tempted to suggest bringing all schools up to the MENC "quality program" standards, thinking that what it best for the students is worth any price, and ignoring the individual characteristics of the given school or school system which might make some of the standards inapplicable. What must be done, however, is to attempt to tread that thin line between fiscal irresponsibility on the one hand and educational irresponsibility on the other. The suggestions which follow are framed with this in mind.

The first step in improving the music programs in the Catholic grade schools of Lorain County would involve no increase in operating costs for the individual schools. Class schedules should be rearranged gradually so that at first all schools are scheduling general music according to the "suggested weekly time allocations" found in Minimum
Standards, and eventually all schools are scheduling general music according to the "basic program" standards of the MENC. This means that, in time, general music K-3 in all schools would meet daily for 100 minutes per week, 4-6 would meet daily for 150 minutes per week, and 7-8 would meet twice per week for a total of 100 minutes.

Most of the schools in this study are too small, or cannot afford to hire a music specialist. Perhaps several schools could share the expense of an itinerant music specialist, however. At the very least, principals and pastors should exercise judicious hiring practices to insure that there will be a sufficient number of teachers on the staff who have strong music minors to cover all of the general music classes at least on a part-time basis. This last proposal should not increase the cost of the music program.

Upgrading the instrumental and vocal music programs in these schools is going to require a substantial financial outlay. However, the greatest part of the cost can be passed on to the students in the form of a modest music fee. The twelve schools which have instrumental music programs are operating those programs in this fashion already and with a fair amount of success. Three of the programs are well established and the other nine are relatively young---one or two years old---but enrollment figures are good enough to completely cover the salaries of the four teachers involved. By sharing teachers and charging for teachers' services, all
of the schools in the county can have a band program for grades five through eight, and the larger schools could probably support both a band program and a string orchestra program. At the beginning these groups should meet twice per week for a total of sixty minutes; but as enrollments, and therefore funding, increase, this should be changed to three meetings per week or more.

The vocal music offerings in those schools reporting them are taught by a classroom teacher who happens to have an interest and some talent in music or who has a music minor but is not certified in that area. All of the schools should adopt this procedure for providing vocal music, eventually using only teachers who have additional certification in music. An alternative procedure would be a program organized along the same lines as the instrumental music program. Also, the high school vocal music positions are both part-time assignments and these two teachers could be utilized to some extent, perhaps.

In the cases of both the instrumental and the vocal music programs, materials can be purchased with state aid funds to a certain degree. Some equipment and large instruments can be borrowed or "inherited" from the two high schools. As the programs grow, it is possible that sufficient funds will be generated to allow the purchase of capital items. In addition, the larger schools can sponsor parent organizations to raise funds for capital items.
If all of these recommendations are followed, the result will be a well-balanced music program at each school which will cost the parish little or nothing in addition to the normal operating costs of the school. General music is the most important part of the comprehensive music program in the view of this author and the general music programs suggested here will eventually reach the level of the MENC's "basic program" standards. The instrumental and vocal music programs, which are elective and serve only a portion of the student body, will be at a level which is at or above the state minimum standards or the interpretations thereof. Every child enrolled in a Catholic grade school in Lorain County would participate in a general music class for a significant amount of time each week and would have the opportunity to participate in instrumental and vocal music activities at the middle school or junior high level.

Comments

While the recommendations contained in this report have been conceived with an eye to minimizing the financial outlay required of the schools, a somewhat strong commitment to music education is required of the principals, pastors, and teachers in order to implement these recommendations effectively. Many of the principals who responded to the author's questionnaire indicated by their
expressed dissatisfaction with the music programs in their schools and by their additional comments that they are willing to make such a commitment. Some of the principals indicated a willingness to cooperate with any effort to improve their programs. Others alluded to balky pastors or poor financial situations or to lack of expertise on their own part with regard to music. Some suggested that the diocese ought to do something, either directly by hiring itinerant music teachers, or indirectly by way of advice and consultation on a regular basis. These comments indicated a positive attitude toward music on the part of many of the grade school administrators. The Diocesan Education Office can help to influence those who do not have such a positive attitude and at the same time provide for continuity and on-going improvement in the music education programs in Lorain County schools by expanding one of the part time high school music positions to include the responsibilities of a county music supervisor on a released-time basis. This would involve an outlay for the Diocese of perhaps $4000 to $6000 dollars per year for the Supervisor's released-time away from the high school.

Suggestions for Further Study

This study was an attempt to determine the quality of the design of the music programs in the Catholic grade
schools of Lorain County. Further study is necessary to determine the quality of this design at the high school level and to determine whether the programs are realizing their objectives in terms of student outcomes. Certainly, a music testing program ought to be a routine part of the evaluation process at all of the schools. In addition there is room for an evaluation of the facilities, equipment, and materials provided for the music programs.
APPENDIX A

THE CATHOLIC ELEMENTARY SCHOOLS OF LORAIN COUNTY, OHIO

Holy Trinity School, Avon
Nativity BVM School, Lorain
St. Anthony of Padua School, Lorain
St. John School, Lorain
St. Joseph School, Amherst
St. Joseph School, Avon Lake
St. Jude School, Elyria
St. Ladislaus, Cyril and Methodius School, Lorain
St. Mary (Immaculate Conception) School, Avon
St. Mary School, Elyria
St. Mary School, Lorain
St. Nicholas Byzantine School, Lorain
St. Peter School, Lorain
St. Peter School, North Ridgeville
St. Stanislaus School, Lorain
St. Thomas the Apostle School, Sheffield Lake
St. Vincent de Paul School, Elyria Township
APPENDIX B

QUESTIONNAIRE

1. NAME OF SCHOOL___________________________________________

2. TOTAL ENROLLMENT____________ IN GRADES__________________

3. PLEASE INDICATE BELOW THE NUMBER OF MINUTES PER WEEK
   ALLOTTED FOR GENERAL MUSIC IN EACH GRADE. IF THE TIME
   ALLOTTED IS THE SAME FOR ALL GRADES, WRITE THE NUMBER
   OF MINUTES HERE:__________.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GRADE</th>
<th>NUMBER OF MINUTES PER WEEK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>K</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. GENERAL MUSIC IS TAUGHT BY: (CHECK ONE)
   ____ MUSIC SPECIALIST (GO TO QUESTION NUMBER 5)
   ____ CLASSROOM TEACHERS (GO TO QUESTION NUMBER 8)
   ____ BOTH (GO TO QUESTION NUMBER 6)

5. IS THE MUSIC SPECIALIST CERTIFIED IN MUSIC? ______
   (SKIP TO QUESTION NUMBER 8)

6. WHAT PERCENTAGE OF THE GENERAL MUSIC INSTRUCTION TIME
   IS TAUGHT BY THE MUSIC SPECIALIST? ______% 

7. DOES THE MUSIC SPECIALIST WORK WITH THE CLASSROOM
   TEACHERS IN THE PREPARATION OF THEIR MUSIC LESSONS?
   ____________________

8. WHAT GENERAL MUSIC TEXT SERIES IS USED? ________________

9. VOCAL MUSIC (CHOIR, CHORAL) IS OFFERED TO (CHECK
   APPLICABLE GRADES AND INDICATE THE NUMBER OF MEETINGS
   AND AMOUNT OF TIME IN THE APPROPRIATE BLANKS)
   ___5th GRADE AND MEETS____ TIMES A WEEK FOR____ MIN. EACH
   ___6th GRADE AND MEETS____ TIMES A WEEK FOR____ MIN. EACH
   ___7th GRADE AND MEETS____ TIMES A WEEK FOR____ MIN. EACH
   ___8th GRADE AND MEETS____ TIMES A WEEK FOR____ MIN. EACH
   __________________

   __________________
10. IS THE VOCAL MUSIC INSTRUCTOR CERTIFIED IN MUSIC?

11. INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC (BAND) IS OFFERED TO (CHECK AND FILL IN AS FOR QUESTION NUMBER 9 ABOVE)
   _4th GRADE AND MEETS_ TIMES A WK FOR__ MIN. EACH
   _5th GRADE AND MEETS_ TIMES A WK FOR__ MIN. EACH
   _6th GRADE AND MEETS_ TIMES A WK FOR__ MIN. EACH
   _7th GRADE AND MEETS_ TIMES A WK FOR__ MIN. EACH
   _8th GRADE AND MEETS_ TIMES A WK FOR__ MIN. EACH

12. IS THE BAND INSTRUCTOR CERTIFIED IN MUSIC? __________

13. ORCHESTRA (STRINGS) IS OFFERED TO (CHECK AND FILL IN AS FOR QUESTIONS NUMBERS 9 AND 11 ABOVE)
   _4th GRD AND MEETS_ TIMES A WK FOR__ MIN. EACH TIME
   _5th GRD AND MEETS_ TIMES A WK FOR__ MIN. EACH TIME
   _6th GRD AND MEETS_ TIMES A WK FOR__ MIN. EACH TIME
   _7th GRD AND MEETS_ TIMES A WK FOR__ MIN. EACH TIME
   _8th GRD AND MEETS_ TIMES A WK FOR__ MIN. EACH TIME

14. IS THE ORCHESTRA INSTRUCTOR CERTIFIED IN MUSIC? ______

15. ARE YOU (THE PRINCIPAL) SATISFIED WITH THE MUSIC PROGRAM IN YOUR SCHOOL AS IT IS PRESENTLY CONSTITUTED?
   YES ___ NO EXPLAIN ____________________________________________
   __________________________________________________________
   __________________________________________________________

16. ADDITIONAL COMMENTS: ______________________________________
   __________________________________________________________
   __________________________________________________________
   __________________________________________________________
   __________________________________________________________
   __________________________________________________________

DATE ________________________________________________
SIGNATURE ________________________________
## APPENDIX C

### TABLE OF QUESTIONNAIRE RESPONSES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCHOOL</th>
<th>ENROLLMENT</th>
<th>GENERAL MUSIC MIN/WK IN EACH GRADE</th>
<th>SPECIALIST?</th>
<th>% TIME</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 yes</td>
<td>75</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>60 60 70 80 80 80 90 90 no</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>178</td>
<td>90 90 90 90 90 90 90 90 no</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>560</td>
<td>60 60 70 80 80 80 90 90 no</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>336</td>
<td>60 60 70 80 80 80 90 90 no</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>219</td>
<td>100 min/wk in all grades no</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>211</td>
<td>60 60 70 80 80 80 90 90 yes</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>206</td>
<td>60 60 70 80 80 80 90 90 no</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>274</td>
<td>20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 no</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>197</td>
<td>60 60 70 80 80 80 90 90 no</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>232</td>
<td>60 60 70 80 80 80 90 90 no</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>385</td>
<td>60 60 70 80 80 80 90 90 no</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>453</td>
<td>60 60 70 80 80 80 90 90 no</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>244</td>
<td>60 60 70 80 80 80 90 90 no</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>60 60 70 80 80 80 90 90 no</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>510</td>
<td>90 90 90 90 90 90 90 90 no</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>60 60 70 80 80 80 90 90 yes</td>
<td>50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCHOOL</td>
<td>VOCAL MUSIC MEETINGS PER WEEK/TIME</td>
<td>CERT. TEACH?</td>
<td>PRIN. SATISFIED?</td>
<td>ADDITIONAL COMMENTS?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1/45 1/45 1/45 1/45 1/45</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>no</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>no</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>no</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>no</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>no</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>3/30 3/30 3/30 3/30 3/30</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>no</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>no</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>1/30 1/30 1/30 1/30 1/30</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>no</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>2/30 2/30 2/30 2/30 2/30</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>no</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>2/30 2/30 2/30 2/30 2/30</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>3/30 3/30 3/30 3/30 3/30</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>no</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>2/30 2/30 2/30 2/30 2/30</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>no</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCHOOL</td>
<td>BAND</td>
<td>ORCHESTRA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MEETING PER WK/TIME</td>
<td>TEACH</td>
<td>MEETINGS PER WK/TIME</td>
<td>TEACH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5 6 7 8</td>
<td>CERT?</td>
<td>4 5 6 7 8</td>
<td>CERT?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2/30 2/45 2/45 2/45</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>-45 -60 -60 -60</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>1/30 1/30 1/30 1/30</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>2/30 2/30 2/30 2/30</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>2/30 2/30 2/30 2/30</td>
<td>yes 2/30 2/30 2/30 2/30 2/30 yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>2/30 2/30 2/30 2/30</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>2/30 2/30 2/30 2/30</td>
<td>yes 2/30 2/30 2/30 2/30 2/30 yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>2/30 2/30 2/30 2/30</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>2/30 2/30 2/30 2/30</td>
<td>yes 2/30 2/30 2/30 2/30 2/30 yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>2/30 2/30 2/30 2/30</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>1/30 1/30 1/30 1/30</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>1/30 1/30 1/30 1/30</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>2/30 2/30 2/30 2/30</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
BIBLIOGRAPHY

