THE OHIO CAMPAIGNS OF BILLY SUNDAY

WITH SPECIAL EMPHASIS UPON THE

1913 COLUMBUS REVIVAL

A Thesis

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements
for the Degree Master of Arts

by

Donald Elden Pitzer, B.A.

The Ohio State University
1962

Approved by

[Signature]

Francis C. Weidenburger

Adviser

Department of History
Acknowledgement

I wish to express sincere gratitude for the kind, helpful guidance and criticism with which my adviser, Dr. Francis P. Heisenburger, directed this thesis to its conclusion. To the considerate staff of the Ohio Historical Society library, I am indebted for assistance in the use of the excellent collection of Ohio newspapers, the chief source materials used. Without the dedicated efforts of my wife and mother, who patiently transformed my scribbling into the original typed draft, the thesis would not have reached its final form.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Baseball Evangelist</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ohio Hears Sunday - A Survey.</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preparations For The Columbus Campaign</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Into The Highways And Hedges.</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inside The Tabernacle</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessing The Columbus Results.</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendices</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Introduction

Sufficient justification is easily obtainable for the considerable attention which has been given to the illustrious evangelistic career of William Ashley ("Billy") Sunday. Preaching mostly before the era of the loud speaker, he is given credit for speaking before audiences totalling one hundred million. During nearly forty years of evangelism, Sunday held three hundred revivals and saw about a million people "hit the sawdust trail" to confess their faith in Jesus Christ as Savior. Even more important than the impressive statistical facts concerning his efforts are the ideas which he broadcasted and the widely varied public reaction to them. The former national league baseball hero was, himself, sincere, spectacular and, at the same time, controversial by the nature of his unique dramatic and gymnastic attack upon sin and by his practical call for righteous living. The peak years of his ministry, from 1913 to 1921, witnessed a prodigious outout of newspaper and periodical material concerned with this man who was assaulting the largest cities in the nation with his highly organized procedure for mass evangelism. His stereotyped sermons had the effect of influencing the thinking of Americans from the Atlantic to the Pacific upon similar religious topics including the broader implications of amusements and temperance. Seen in a larger context, Sunday's career brought both to a climax and to a culmination what constituted the third great awakening.

The first biographies of Sunday appeared in 1913 and 1914, written by Theodore T. Frankenberg and Elijah P. Brown, respectively. In 1936
another, by William T. Ellis, appeared which included a reprint of
Sunday's own short "Autobiography" which had earlier appeared in The
Ladies Home Journal. Not until 1955 with the publication of William
J. McLoughlin, Billy Sunday Was His Real Name, was a truly scholarly
life and interpretation of Sunday's ministry forthcoming. In 1958,
Bernard A. Weisberger, They Gathered At the River, devoted a perceptive
chapter to the Sunday era as did William McLoughlin, Modern Revivalism
in 1959. The most recent work, Lee Thomas, The Billy Sunday Story, is
a less critical narrative of Sunday's life published in 1961.

The purpose of this study is to survey the several campaigns held
by Sunday in Ohio and to assess their place in his total career. More
specifically, the most outstanding of these revivals, that of Columbus
in 1912-1913, is investigated in greater detail to point up not only
its significance, but also to discover in what respects it did or did
not represent the usual aspects of a Billy Sunday Campaign. Material
for this has been gathered from the above mentioned books, pertinent
periodical articles, and accounts of the Ohio revival meetings as
recorded in local current newspapers.
Chapter I
The Baseball Evangelist

William Ashley ("Billy") Sunday was born on November 19, 1862, in a two-room log cabin about one mile south of Ames, Iowa.¹ At the time of Sunday's birth, his father, William, was already a volunteer in the Union cause as a private in Company E of the 23rd Regiment of the Iowa Infantry. The absent father was destined never to see his son since pneumonia claimed his life on December 22, 1862, at Camp Patterson, Missouri.² His death left the care of his three small children - Albert, age four; Edward, age two; and William - and his small farm to his widow. For six years the family was held together by a government pension and some assistance from Mrs. Sunday's nearby parents, the Coreys.

Finally the widow married a man named Heizer and bore him two children before he disappeared during a severe depression in 1874.³ Little Billy had openly confessed his dislike for Heizer and was undoubtedly provided for in much better fashion when his mother permitted him to move to his grandfather's much larger and more adequate home.⁴ When

---

1. Although several reference works place his birth date as November 19, 1863, the most reliable evidence points to the earlier date. Sunday made it plain that he was born four months after his father left for military service. A certified copy of the military record of Sunday's father as reproduced in Elijah P. Brown, The Real Billy Sunday, p. 32, sets the date of his registration as August 22, and that of his death as December 22, 1862. This would thereby overrule the later date as Sunday's birth. Also see the discussion by Frederick T. Parsons, Dictionary of American Biography (New York, 1946), XXI, 679.


abandoned by Heizer, the widow moved her entire brood to her parents' farm as a last resort. Although Billy had been small at birth and was sickly for his first three years, an herb remedy prescribed by an old French doctor produced the desired effect. Soon after he was sent to live with his grandparents, he became busily engaged in helping his grandfather with the activities of the farm.

Sunday's grandfather, Martin Corey, who had come to Iowa in 1848, was by this time a man of some importance at Ames where he was known as "Squire" Corey. Both the "Squire's" and his wife's fathers had fought in the American Revolution, and the Squire was the second cousin and childhood playmate of Ulysses S. Grant. At Ames he had donated part of his land to help found the Iowa Agricultural College which became Iowa State College. It was on his remaining acres that he built the sawmill, graminmill and sugarcane mill so familiar to young Billy's boyhood days. The Corey farm provided many rustic experiences for the fatherless children. The boys soon learned to cut wood, build fences, care for the horses and milk the cows. That both poverty and toil lent their lessons to his early years was undoubtedly a factor in Billy's being able to identify himself with the working class American spirit to which he successfully appealed in his later ministry. He often spoke of his humble beginnings with obvious nostalgia saying, "I am a hayseed of the hayseeds, and the malodors of the barnyard are on me yet, and it beats Pinaud and Colgate, too. I have greased my hair with goose grease.

5. McLoughlin, Billy Sunday, 1, 2.
and blacked my boots with stove blacking," and "I have crept and crawled out from the university of poverty and hard knocks, and have taken postgraduate courses."

While living with his grandfather - his grandmother having died when Sunday was three or four years old - Billy received his first formal education at a typical "three R's" country district school. Later he attended one of the grade schools in Ames during the winter months. Meanwhile the widow's tragedies were multiplying. Her son, Albert, was kicked in the head by a horse and injured so seriously that he had to be committed to a home for the feeble minded where he died in 1893. Even before she had taken up residence with her parents, she had lost her daughter, Elizabeth Heizer, who was burned to death when her clothes caught fire while she was tending a bonfire. Therefore, by 1874 only Edward, Billy, and Leroy (her son by Heizer) remained to her. At this juncture she made a paramount decision for the lives of her two oldest boys. Whether the cause was a demand of the runaway Heizer or was completely based upon financial straits is indefinable, but the much harassed widow in 1874 chose to place Edward and Billy in the Soldiers' Orphans' Home at Glenwood, Iowa. In his short autobiography, Sunday later recalled with much emotion the scene of leaving his mother and the events enroute to the orphanage. There was not enough money to pay the boys' entire fare to Glenwood, but they were put aboard the train at Ames in any case. Upon reaching Council Bluffs, the shivering travelers entered a hotel and asked the lady there if they

6. Ellis, op. cit., 21, 22.
8. Ibid.
might have something to eat. After repeating the story behind their needs, the boys received both their breakfast and lunch from the lady who herself had lost her husband in the Civil War. The train going to Glenwood was to leave that afternoon, but the boys had no ticket for that twenty mile segment of the journey. However, they strolled over to the Burlington freight yards and, in their play, boarded the cabooses of a freight train headed for Glenwood. The train began to move out of the yards and soon the conductor came asking for tickets. Once again the boys reiterated their mournful tale and produced their letter of introduction to the orphanage superintendent. The conductor understandingly allowed the boys the passage they needed to the Orphans' Home at Glenwood.9 After a stay of about one and one-half years, Edward and Billy were transferred to the Orphans' Home at Davenport, Iowa, since the one at Glenwood was being discontinued. There the youngsters were given schooling equal to that of the grammar school level and also religious instruction which was primarily memorization work. The efforts of the institution to impart spiritual truth to its charges reaped but little fruit in the immediate life of Billy Sunday as he was better known then for his physical agility and aptness at self-defense than for his piety. In later years, however, this early instruction and memorization of scripture not only partially effected his conversion, but also influenced his uncompromising position as to the infallibility of the Bible in his evangelistic career. Even though there were boys older than he at the Glenwood Home, Billy was

soon known as the fastest in a footrace. This ability was to earn him fame as a big-league baseball player. A strict merit system was enforced at the Davenport Home and such regimentation did much to produce a disciplined life in its inmates. Billy learned to do many tasks, and to do them well. He testified in his autobiography that "we were detailed to one job for a short period, and then changed to another job. What I learned there opened the door in after years that had brought me where I am - I was taught to do my best."  

The years spent at the Soldiers' Orphans' Home were undoubtedly beneficial to the two Sunday boys, possibly giving them much more by way of education and physical care than could have been provided by their widowed mother. However, boys were not allowed to remain at the Home beyond the age of sixteen. This meant that Edward, to whom Billy had become greatly attached if not wholly dependent upon, would have to leave in 1876. Billy decided that he would not remain at the Home without his brother and consequently accompanied him back to the only other home they knew, that of their grandfather, "Squire" Gerey. Neither boy remained long on the farm, however. Edward soon was employed by a neighboring farmer with whom he stayed for several years before returning to serve as a carpenter and watchman at the Davenport Home. The fourteen year old Billy, contrariwise, might have stayed on with his grandfather had it not been for the quick-temper of each and his own sensitiveness. The episode which caused his exodus occurred when he and his half-brother, Leroy, pulled the rings out of the end of a yolk  

10. Ibid., 467.
in a sort of tug-of-war battle. It happened that the "Squire" was at that moment waiting very impatiently to have the boys finish hitching the horses for his trip to town. The delay over their foolishness brought an oath of disapproval from their grandfather which Billy said "cut me to the heart." Immediately the lad went to a neighbor, borrowed a horse, and rode to the county seat, Nevada, to search for a job. Thus he began to make his own way in the world. His first job was that of bellhop and janitor "in a little fourth-rate hotel" there in Nevada, Iowa. He reportedly slept behind the counter at night and received only his board and lodging as remuneration. After eight months, this job came to an abrupt end, however, when Billy was given a twenty-four hour "vacation" to visit his grandfather and stayed two days instead. Fortunately, Billy learned the following day that Colonel John Scott, former lieutenant-governor of Iowa, was advertising for a stable boy. By the use of some of the floor scrubbing skills he had acquired at the Orphans' Home, Billy impressed Mrs. Scott and got the job. This proved to be a most acceptable position for the young Sunday. Especially was this true as the Scotts not only took Billy into their home, but eventually into their hearts as well. They made it possible for him to attend four years of classes at the Nevada High School. For the last two years of this period he not only did chores for the Scotts, but also served as school janitor. He received eight dollars a month plus room and board from the Scotts, while the janitor job paid for his books.

11. Ibid., 468.
The strenuous manner in which Sunday approached his later work possibly
was not out of proportion to this early schedule. He milked and "did
the chores" for the Scotts while having to rise "at two a.m. during
the winter months and start the fires" in the fourteen stoves at the
school building. These fires had to be kept burning during the day, and
after classes Billy had to sweep the building and "dust every seat."
Little wonder that he later recalled, "many times I would fall asleep
over my books."\(^4\)

It was during this period that Sunday's fleetness of foot brought
him to public attention. The annual Fourth of July celebrations at
Ames brought folks from the surrounding area to witness the footraces
and other events. One year Billy entered the "free-for-all" foot race
of one hundred yards in which the first prize was three dollars. Although
he was the only boy entered and was pitted against "a professor from Iowa
State College" who had regular track shoes and uniform, Billy won by a
slight margin and the prize money was his. He rounded out the day's
activities by catching the greased pig and adding another dollar to his
fortune.\(^5\) The fire brigade of Marshalltown, Iowa, had heard of Sunday's
speed and was in need of such a member to aid them in their fire-fight-
ing tournament. At that time, belonging to a fire brigade was a
desirable distinction, and therefore Billy accepted the offer to
participate even though it meant that he would have to miss the graduation
ceremonies of Nevada High School.\(^6\) To supplement his newly acquired

\(^4\) Ellis, op. cit., 471.
\(^5\) Ibid., 475.
part-time employment on the fire brigade, Sunday took a position in a Marshalltown furniture store for three dollars a week. When the store sold coffins, Sunday was selected to make their delivery and drive the hearse—a job which he sorely disliked. Besides these activities he was also able to devote time to another growing interest, baseball. This was not a new pastime for Billy since he had early liked to "practice throwing the ball in the air great distances from me, then run and catch the ball." He had also gotten some experience as the only country boy on the local Ames team on which several of the teachers at the Iowa State College played. But his real opportunity came when, due to the growing recognition of his speed on the bases, he secured a place on the Marshalltown nine. This team fared so well that all other clubs in the area succumbed before their attack. In 1883 their prowess was challenged by the Des Moines team to decide the state championship. Five hundred dollars and all of the gate receipts were to go to the winners. The Marshalltown fellows had little trouble in downing their Des Moines rivals by a lopsided fifteen to six score, with Billy adding eight put-outs and six runs to the effort. With such laurels to their credit, not only the team in general, but also Billy Sunday in particular gained some measure of fame. It was amid such a baseball climate in Marshalltown that Adrian "Cap" Anson, the famous manager and first baseman of the old Chicago White Stockings team, returned there to his hometown to visit his father. "Cap's" aunt, who had seen Billy's splendid

17. *Ellis, op. cit.*, 472.
performance in the State Championship game, spoke to her nephew very convincingly of this base-stealing, hard-throwing youngster. Anson interviewed the potential big-leaguer, but did not invite him to a try out at Chicago until the following spring when he sent Billy a telegram to that effect. Having nearly nothing to lose by abandoning his meager furniture store employment, and no doubt with youthful eagerness for adventure, Sunday accepted the offer. He arrived in Chicago appearing as the country bumpkin that he was with but one dollar in his pocket. He might have been razed from the team immediately had he not proven his phenomenal speed on the morning of his arrival. "Cap" Anson suggested that Sunday race their fastest man, Fred Pfeffer, to demonstrate his relative speed. Running barefooted against his well equipped opponent, Sunday finished with a fifteen foot advantage which won for him the hearts of his future teammates. In the batting department, however, he was not so successful. He struck out the first thirteen times he was up to bat when the season opened. This was the beginning of a National League career which was to last from 1883 to 1891. For the first five years he stayed with Chicago and helped them win the championship in three of those. It was while he was with the White Stockings in 1887 that he reached his highest batting average, .359. His lifetime professional average is calculated at

Throughout his baseball career his value rested upon his fielding and base-running abilities. He was among the first in America to run the hundred yard dash in ten seconds flat and the first to round the bases from a standing start in fourteen seconds. It was said that "pitchers 'pitched out' when Sunday was on the base lines, and unless the pitch was perfect and the catcher's throw low and true, there wasn't a chance to catch the deer-footed runner. And this was in the day of Ewing, Bennett and Ganzel, than whom better catchers never lived." In 1886 he is reported to have fielded .914 and hit .242. In order to prove Sunday's superiority of speed in the baseball world, Anson proposed a race between Sunday and "Arlie" Latham of the St. Louis team who was considered the fastest man of all the other teams. The race was scheduled for a Sunday afternoon after the finish of the season. In the meantime Billy was converted and therefore strongly protested to holding the race on Sunday. However, Anson retorted, "I've backed you for a thousand dollars in this race, and so have a lot of my friends. There's about seventy-five thousand dollars up on it. I'm not much on religion, but I don't believe that God wants you to start out with him [sic] by throwing down your friends on a contract that you took before you went with him." Much

25. Ibid.
ill-at-ease in conscience Sunday ran the race, won, and returned to Chicago to go before the session of the Presbyterian Church to confess his misdemeanor. "When they heard all about it they let me off," Sunday reported later, but, in any case, he had won undisputed title to the speed crown of baseball.\(^{27}\) In his last season with Pittsburgh in 1890, Sunday set a record of ninety-six stolen bases in one hundred and sixteen games. Not until Ty Cobb stole ninety-eight bases in one hundred and fifty games was his season total eclipsed.\(^{28}\)

From the outset of his career with the White Sox, Sunday was a trusted member of the team. Anson evidenced this by quickly giving him the responsibility for caring for the team's finances and handling its railroad reservations. Billy later stated that he "was never shy a dollar."\(^{29}\) On the social level, Sunday was occasionally found with his teammates at a favorite saloon. Whether it was due to his early religious instruction or some other cause, is conjectural, but the young player was not at ease when attempting to drown his unhappiness in alcohol. Furthermore, he kept contemplating his own future, and feared that it might hold for him the degraded life of the slums, including only booze and panhandling, which he observed to have been the end of some former baseball has-beens. It was with such troublesome thoughts in his mind that he continued to follow his baseball friends to their places of revelry as they reassured him that "you're a good

\(^{27}\) Ibid.
\(^{28}\) Homer Rodsheaver, Twenty Years With Billy Sunday (Nashville, 1936), 89-90.
\(^{29}\) Ellis, op. cit., 479.
manager and you'll make good use of your money." 30 After one such Sunday afternoon of drinking his fill with other team members, Billy and his friends sat down to rest on the curb stone at the corner of State and Van Buren streets in Chicago. One of the most decisive moments in Sunday's life was about to occur. From across the street Sunday soon heard the notes of gospel hymns coming to him from the "horns, flutes and slide trombones" of a small musical group from the nearby Pacific Garden Mission. In recalling this scene in his sermons later, Billy would say that some of these songs were those "that I used to hear my mother sing back in the log cabin in Iowa, and back in the old church where I used to go to Sunday school." 31 When Harry Monroe, one of the men in the mission group, stepped forward and invited the ballplayers to attend the evening service, Billy Sunday made the decision which set in motion the process which was to lift him from the position of a half-drunk, unregenerate ballplayer sitting on a curb stone, to the responsible plane of an internationally known evangelist proclaiming the gospel of salvation through Jesus Christ to hundreds of thousands. In rising to accept Monroe's invitation, Sunday later reported telling his friends, "I'm through. We've come to the parting of the ways." He further explained that "some of them laughed and some of them mocked me; one of them gave me encouragement; others never said a word." 32 At any rate, the die was cast. Never again would

30. Thomas, op. cit., 39.
32. Ibid.
he drink with the gang, and soon his doubts concerning the general

course of his future would disappear.

His actual conversion, however, did not take place until some
time after his initial visit to the Pacific Garden Mission. Although
no one seems to know exactly when or how, about one year before the
1886 incident in Van Buren Street, Sunday had become acquainted with
and quite interested in a certain Helen A. Thompson, daughter of a
Scotch Presbyterian dairyman and ice cream manufacturer. Miss Thompson's
younger brother, William, Jr., who was an avid baseball fan holding
Billy Sunday as one of his idols, later credited himself as providing
the go-between which made easier the friendship between the well-to-do
manufacturer's daughter and the socially inferior baseball player of
whom her father openly disapproved. 33 Conversely, through the efforts
of Sunday, William Thompson secured the position of mascot with the
Chicago Team for several years. 34 Helen Thompson, known better as
"Ma" Sunday later, was a devout young lady who, being converted at the
age of fourteen, became an active member of the Christian Endeavor Society
at the Jefferson Park Presbyterian Church. 35 Billy and Helen (Nell)
had but little in common to perpetuate their further courtship until
the former surrendered his life to Jesus Christ and actually had an
experience of spiritual regeneration in 1886. This occurred at the

33. Theodore T. Frankenberg, Spectacular Career of Rev. Billy
Sunday (Columbus, Ohio, 1913), 75.
34. Ibid., 76.
35. McLaughlin, Billy Sunday, 6.
Pacific Garden Mission where Mrs. Clark, wife of Colonel George Clark the founder of the mission, had repeatedly encouraged him to forsake his sins. Finally, Billy could resist no longer and, in his words, "I went on my knees and staggered out of sin into the arms of the Savior." Although this immediately improved his status with Nell and even her father, Sunday recalled that "for three nights after my acceptance of Christ as Savior I never slept a wink. I was afraid of the horse laugh the boys would give me when I showed up for practice Wednesday morning." To his amazement when he went to the ball park, every member of the team respected the step he had taken. Mike Kelly, whom Sunday praised as a player who could play any position, was the first to meet him. Sunday’s recollection of Mike’s greeting was, "Billy, I’m proud of you. Religion ain’t my long suit, and I haven’t been to Mass for so long I have forgotten how the priest looks. But I won’t knock you, boy. And if anyone knocks you, I will knock them sic." Billy reported further, "Up rushed Pop Anson, the captain, to shake my hand. Then the entire team — Clarkson, Flint, Williamson, Core, Burns, Jimmy McCormick, Dalrymple, and the rest of the boys — all glad-handed me and patted me on the back. There wasn’t a fellow of that gang that knocked me." Sunday never gave this group cause to regret their faith in his Christian profession. He immediately manifested the sincerity with which he had approached his conversion. He became a model athlete. Drinking, smoking, playing cards, and attending theaters

36. Ibid., 47-48.
37. Ibid.
were dropped from his life. He refused to play baseball on Sunday, a decision which would have undoubtedly cost a less valuable player his position. On road trips with the team he used his free time to give talks on "Earnestness in Christian Life" at local Y.M.C.A.'s and occasionally in churches to young men, some of whom were eager to listen to a big league baseball star regardless of the topic under discussion.  

In the meantime, when the team was playing at home, and during the off-season when he had a job as a fireman on the Chicago and North Western Railway, Sunday was doing his utmost to win the heart of Nell Thompson and her father's consent for her hand. Although Sunday's mother had been a Methodist, Billy was consistently drawn to the Jefferson Park Presbyterian services attended by Nell and her family. It was this church with which he ultimately affiliated, but the arbitrary quality of his decision with respect to his denominational ties was interestingly revealed in a statement made in the 1913 Columbus campaign. Here he said, "She [Nell] was a Presbyterian, so I am a Presbyterian. Had she been a Catholic, I would have been a Catholic - because I was hot on the trail of Nell."  

Thus Sunday became a Presbyterian and was soon both an elder and superintendent of the Sunday School. In 1903, he was ordained by the Chicago Presbytery. It took Sunday two years after his conversion and church membership to persuade Helen's father of the

38. Bernard A. Weisberger, They Gathered At The River (Boston, 1958), 244.
40. Ellis, op. cit., 437.
desirability of a baseball player marrying his daughter. But the event was brought to fruition on September 5, 1888.\textsuperscript{41}

The marriage did not halt the baseball career of the young star, but 1887 was the last season that he played for his beloved Chicago White Sox. In 1888 he was transferred to the Pittsburgh team. The young lady whom he had taken as his wife had enjoyed formal educational privileges beyond his own, having attended business college after high school. Therefore during the winter of 1887-88, Billy decided to bolster his training by a few courses at Northwestern. By an agreement whereby he coached the college baseball team, he was permitted to enroll as a special student at Evanston Academy which was operated as a preparatory school by the university. Billy most appreciated his course in rhetoric during that winter. During the off season of 1888-89 Sunday began taking Bible study courses at the Chicago Y.M.C.A., but refused a permanent job there. However, the impression began to grow within him that he "was definitely called to enter Christian work." The next winter he did the same - combining Y.M.C.A. work with Bible study without pay. By this time he had signed a three-year contract with Philadelphia and had become a top-notch ball player.\textsuperscript{42} However, the compulsion to enter Christian work was so strong within him that he asked the Philadelphia management if he might be released from his new contract. He was refused. Sunday then "made it a matter of most earnest prayer and even went so far as to make a proposition, saying,

\textsuperscript{41} Ibid., 686.
\textsuperscript{42} McLoughlin, \textit{Billy Sunday}, 8.
'Lord if I don't get my release by March twenty-fifth, I will take that as assurance you want me to continue to play ball: if I get it before that date I will accept that as evidence you want me to quit playing ball and go into Christian work.'

Before this time there had been a movement by many of the old National League players to withdraw from their teams and to form what they called the Brotherhood Association, later the American League. Just before the beginning of spring in 1891, when Sunday was fervently praying the above prayer, this Brotherhood was breaking up, consequently flooding the National League with job-hunting players. It is felt that partially due to this influx of players, the Philadelphia club allowed Sunday his release on March 17, eight days before his "proposition" with the Lord was to expire. The solving of one problem, however, raised another. Hearing of his release from Philadelphia, the Cincinnati management rushed an offer of $500 a month for the 1891 season. This, in the face of the $83.33 a month he would receive at the Chicago Y.M.C.A. as secretary of the religious department, loomed almost too luring. This development added perplexity to frustration since he had both a wife and a one-year old daughter, Helen, to support. Nevertheless, upon the advice of his wife, Sunday stood firm in the "proposition" in which he had covenanted to enter Christian work should God see to his release from Philadelphia by March 25. In such a manner, the rising baseball star became a near-forgotten Chicago Y.M.C.A. worker distributing tracts.

43. Ellis, op. cit., 501.
44. Brown, op. cit., 71.
in saloons, giving talks on street corners, securing speakers for association meetings, leading prayer meetings, and assisting the wayword and destitute to find both jobs and salvation. Sunday's zeal was noted by the staff there. He sacrificed his own lunch to save money and had his old clothes remade and dyed to give the impression of being new.\textsuperscript{45}

Sunday enjoyed the work in which he was engaged, and by 1893 his salary had climbed to $1,500 a year, except that the current depression often caused it to be far in arrears. It was at this juncture that Sunday's first opportunity to be directly connected with evangelistic campaigns occurred. The well-known evangelist, Dr. J. Wilbur Chapman, was holding revival meetings throughout the country together with his singer and hymn writer Peter Bilhorn. Bilhorn and Sunday had become friends and it was through him that Sunday was introduced to Chapman. The evangelist was quite impressed by the diligent efforts of Billy in the slums of Chicago and, needing an advance assistant for his own evangelistic organization, proposed that Sunday become that advance man at $40 a week.\textsuperscript{46}

With the various Y.M.C.A. and church group talks he had given in various cities while on the baseball circuit plus the three year internship at the Chicago Y.M.C.A. as preparatory practical Christian training, Sunday now launched into the wider horizons of Midwest evangelism. To be sure, he was only the advance man, but in this

\textsuperscript{45} McLoughlin, \textit{Billy Sunday}, 8.
\textsuperscript{46} Ibid., 9.
capacity he preceded Chapman to the designated town, superintended
the erection of the tent or rental of a hall, organized a choir, ushers,
and prayer meetings, arranged for publicity and sometimes preached
at several services himself before the meetings commenced. All of
these functions were excellent training for his later evangelistic
career.47 After the popular Chapman - the most widely acclaimed evangelist
since Dwight L. Moody - would complete the scheduled revival, Sunday
would remain to hold auxiliary meetings in adjacent churches. Chapman's
organized revivals were patterned after those initiated successfully
by Moody and his music director, Ira Sankey, and Sunday was destined
to carry the procedure to its early twentieth century climax.

For nearly three years Sunday was content as Chapman's advance
agent and might never have aspired to his own evangelistic career but
for Chapman's retiring from that work temporarily in December, 1895, to
accept the pastorate at Bethany Church in Philadelphia.48 It was a
dark Christmas for Billy, Nell and their two children. Chapman had
retired without previous notice. Sunday thought of returning to base-
ball to bolster the family income.49 He prayed. Several times before
when Chapman had no revivals scheduled, Billy had assisted Milan B.
Williams and Charles Alexander with Midwest revivals, but that offered
no steady income or outlet for Christian service.50 After several days
of indecision, Sunday received a letter from Garner, Iowa, stating that

47 Brown, op. cit., 74.
48 William G. McLoughlin, Jr., Modern Revivalism Charles Grandison
Finney to Billy Graham (New York, 1959), 405. Hereinafter cited as
McLoughlin, Modern Revivalism.
49 Thomas, op. cit., 72.
50 McLoughlin, Modern Revivalism, 405.
the local Presbyterians, Baptists and Methodists were uniting for a city-
wide revival in which they would like him as their evangelist. Con-
sidering this an answer to prayer, the Sundays answered "yes" immediately
and Billy Sunday's independent evangelistic career was born.\footnote{51} Without
Sunday's knowledge, Chapman had recommended his advance man to the
Garner pastors as their evangelist. The meetings in this town of
1,300 began on January 3, 1896. The bulk of Sunday's preaching style
was borrowed from the dignified, scholarly Chapman and other men, such
as Williams, whose ministry he had admired. With no formal theological
training and little but poverty, hard work and baseball success to
appeal to, it is little wonder that Billy did not seek Presbyterian
ordination at that time. But it should be noted that the story of his
conversion from the ranks of the sinful baseball crowd and the sharp con-
trast made by this experience in his own life appealed most readily to
those of the evangelical tradition. As his revivalist career matured,
there grew a reciprocal embellishment of each of his endeavors - base-
ball and evangelism - by the other. He soon learned to use his
natural advantages to promote his own popularity and thereby the cause
of Christ which he represented. He came to substitute the slang and
vernacular of the working class, with which he was intimately familiar,
for the more conventionally dignified language of the pulpit which he at
first attempted. The transition in his style was readily noticeable.
Evangelist M. B. Williams had once said "I come in and rip things to
pieces, then I let Billy preach and he smooths things over." Billy
himself said that "In one of my first sermons I had sentences as long

\footnote{51} Thomas, \textit{op. cit.}, 73.
as your arm. If a Greek professor tried to pronounce some of the words, his jaws would squeak for a week." But he was too practical to continue in this vain when he determined that his sermon "fell like a dud. It didn't kill." He said that "I knew something was wrong, so I took out the old Gospel gun and loaded her up with rock salt, ipecac, barbed wire, carpet tacks, and rough on rats, I lowered the hindsight and blazed away, and the gang's been ducking and the devil's been hunting his hole ever since."52 Particularly after 1900 he came to employ short, pungent sentences and hard Anglo-Saxon words linked with his unique form of illustrative platform gymnastics. 53

At the time he accepted the meeting at Garner, Sunday had only eight sermons at his disposal. Seven of these were outlines given him by Chapman and the eighth was his own personal testimony. Therefore, Billy could speak only from Sunday to Sunday before running out of material and moving on to his next engagement. 54 He continued this pattern of one-week meetings for some time. After the call to Garner, where the choir numbered twenty and his collection on the last day amounted to $68, Sunday never again needed to wonder what his next job was to be because he never again lacked an invitation to preach. 55 The only difficulty was in deciding which engagements to accept and which to reject. Realizing that his evangelistic career was flourishing, Sunday began scouting for new and better material for a greater volume of

52. Rodeheaver, op. cit., 98.
sermons. Dr. Glenn Frank, later president of the University of Wisconsin, and Elijah P. Brown both collected material and prepared outlines for the busy revivalist. Sunday paid the latter a regular salary for his assistance during a several year period. In later years, Billy secured more authoritative facts and statistics for illustrative purposes from lawyers, surgeons, and college professors whom he numbered among his friends. He added to these sources a reading of the sermons of Beecher, Talmage, and Spurgeon, Moody, Mills, and Jones. Eventually his reserve of sermons numbered over 100 - he preached nearly that number in Columbus in 1912-13.

From the Opera House meeting in Garner where nearly 100 were reported to have been converted Sunday went to Sigourney, Iowa for his second one-week revival. This call had come before he had even arrived in Garner. In Sigourney a local newspaper reported that Sunday "had larger audiences than any minister that ever visited our city." This type of immediate success which greeted his ministry was indicative of his long-range career. In this early meeting he made use of decision cards for converts to sign in the manner employed by Chapman, and also perpetuated the practice of receiving as his only remuneration the free-will offerings collected for him on the last day of the services. But Sunday never adopted the practice of using inquiry rooms for new converts after his services as had Moody and Chapman. His first attempt at evangelism became an extended tour. "I went to five towns, one

56. Rodeheaver, loc. cit.
57. Weisberger, op. cit., 245.
58. McLoughlin, Billy Sunday, 11.
59. quoted in McLoughlin, Billy Sunday, 12.
after another, before I went home," Sunday reported.

The years between 1896 and 1900 found Sunday holding meetings in towns of under two thousand population mostly in his old home state of Iowa. In one of these at Hawkeye, Iowa, he initiated the practice of using a tent to meet the need for an adequately large meeting house for the crowds. He was his own custodian. As a result of his summer tent meetings Sunday was able gradually to accept offers to larger towns where more current and sensational newspaper coverage did much to advertise his meetings. The practice of holding tent meetings in the summer and opera house and church indoor revivals in the winter became Billy's established pattern until one of his tents fell during an early winter snow storm at Salida, Colorado in 1905. This incident heralded the necessary use of roughly constructed tabernacles to serve the purpose of massive assembly halls which were otherwise unavailable. The first time he is reported to have had the assistance of a singer was in the 1898 Oneida, Illinois revival. By 1900 he had gained enough self confidence and sermon material to extend his meetings to as long as four weeks without losing his audiences. In the same year he secured the services of Fred Fisher, cousin to Chapman's singer, Peter Bilhorn, as his gospel singer. Fisher was virtually untrained in music but could sing the familiar songs of the Ira Sankey era and

60. Ellis, op. cit., 502.
63. Brown, loc. cit.
lead the revival choir. Sunday paid him out of his own receipts—a testimony to his growing popularity and income. By this time, Sunday's wife, Nell, was also making a significant contribution to the reviv-alist's career by managing the business details, correspondence, and finances for which Billy had neither the time nor aptitude. It was not long until Nell was known as "Ma" wherever Billy preached as she followed him to act not only as business manager, but also as a leader of local prayer meetings, Bible classes, women’s meetings, and song services. The Sunday's four children were left at home with their grandparents during these excursions.

Until 1904 Mrs. Sunday and Fred Fisher were Billy's only assistants. By that year his engagements had become so demanding that he hired Rev. I. E. Honeywell as his advance man to take care of the arrangements before his arrival—the job he had once fulfilled for Chapman. To care for the tabernacles that he was now using, he also secured the services of Fred Seibert, former cowboy and part-time evangelist.

During the first ten years of his ministry (1896-1906), Sunday conducted 100 separate campaigns, 90 per cent of which were in cities of less than 10,000 population. In thirty of these campaigns, where figures are available, an average of 20 per cent of the population of these cities were converted. The trend in his career was to reach continually larger cities until the New York Campaign of 1917. As

64. McLoughlin, Billy Sunday, 15.
might be expected, partly because of the limitation in the number to whom he could speak in the days before the loudspeaker, the number of converts increased with the population of the cities, but decreased in relation to the total population, on a percentage basis.

With the new century had come many new methods and developments in the Sunday evangelistic organization. Some of these began to draw criticism from local clergy where he was to hold meetings. He had begun to make certain demands upon the ministers in order to assure the success of the revivals. He withdrew his former policy of having ministers fill their own pulpits on Sunday mornings and required the lifting of preaching services in all cooperating churches during the united evangelistic effort. Sunday's attempts at Chapmanlike dignity were melting away as he increasingly gave himself to slang and attacks upon the lethargy of the local church members and clergy, under which some of them chafed. In the eyes of some, he was beginning to emphasize the entertainment aspect of the meetings disproportionately to its more sober soul saving mission. In 1904 a local newspaper headline read "EVANGELIST DOES GREAT VAUDEVILLE STUNTS IN TABERNACLE PULPIT." Such advertisement was repulsive to certain conservative churches. Others admired his aggressive tactics against sin and pointed to the undeniable host of converts and new church members secured by Sunday's efforts. One of the most significant advances in Sunday policy was his requirement that each city he visit should erect a specially designed

tabernacle to house the meetings in lieu of any other such building. This was not a new idea since Moody, Sam Jones and M. B. Williams had been known to use them on occasion. Sunday's first tabernacle with a seating capacity of 1,000 at a cost of $750 was at Perry, Iowa in 1901. This functional, unpainted, wooden structure was in every way the grandparent of his later, greatly enlarged buildings. Finding the wooden floor too noisy, Sunday had it covered with sawdust shavings to deaden the sound, thereby creating one of the most persistent memories of his career - the sawdust trail.  

It should be noted, though, that the phrase "hitting the sawdust trail" was not coined until a later revival at Bellingham, Washington. It seems that local lumberjacks applied this saying to those going down the sawdust aisles to shake Sunday's hand in comparison with the wood-chip trails leading through the wooded mountainside which led to camp. For a lumberjack to "hit the trail" meant safety when lost in the forest, and the phrase became universally adopted as an integral part of Sunday's revivals.  

After the 1905 tent incident at Salida, Sunday insisted upon the erection of tabernacles for his meetings. One of the deterrents to the tabernacle feature was the expense which it added to a Sunday revival. The larger the town, the larger the tabernacle, and consequently, the larger the cost. This resulted in greater emphasis during the campaigns upon the offerings given to defray expenses. By 1904, in his Keokuk revival, Sunday required the ministers to raise $2,000 in pledges in advance to

---

68. McLoughlin, Billy Sunday, 19.  
69. William A. Sunday, Burning Truths from Billy's Bat (Philadelphia, 1914), 49.
assure the solvency of the endeavor. Although this was another point of criticism by those who did not fully understand the mechanics of the Sunday organization, it became a regular practice and in "99 per cent of all Sunday's campaigns, the expenses were raised from the collections, and none of the guaranteed pledges had to be made good." With revivals in larger towns also came larger last-Sunday offerings for Billy. From 1896 to 1902 these ranged from $33 to $1,536, but from 1902 to 1906 they averaged more than $2,000 per campaign. With local pastors receiving only $600 to $800 per year, an understandable friction arose in some cases. Sunday made it a practice to pay one-third of his assistants' salaries out of his own offering, the rest being considered part of the campaign expenses.

While Sunday was moving from small to larger cities, he was also developing his own style of preaching to a remarkable degree. By using the same sermons over and over he had developed their rhetorical flare and emotional appeal to the utmost. By knowing them by memory, he could give himself over to a vigorous physical demonstration of his points for emphasis and to hold attention. He became a veritable actor at times, and he knew it. He made extensive use of dialogue to illustrate Bible stories and to cause his audience to live with him the scenes from scripture. The bases of Sunday's preaching were fundamental and simple - the universality of sin and the power and availability of salvation through Christ's sacrifice - but he wrapped this message in the concomitants of patriotism, love of home and family, sense of humor, challenge, and religiosity which he knew would appeal to the

70. Ibid., 21-22.
masses. For many, this process of putting sacred things on the level of street corner conversation became repulsive. In 1914 The Nation, though clearly stating its faith in Sunday's sincerity, said "the point is that he makes of religion a huge sensation and a blazing vulgarity." "He speaks of the most sacred things in the language of the saloon, the race-track, and the gutter." "He claps Jehovah familiarly on the back."71 Such remonstrances came as severely from sections of the church as from secular sources. In 1917 Bishop Joseph Berry of the Methodist Episcopal Church, speaking at that denomination's eighty-first conference in Atlantic City warned that an excessive number of the young men of that church were mimicking the style and methods of Billy Sunday to the deterioration of their preparation for responsible pastorates. "We are on the verge of surrendering our responsibility to the roaming evangelist," he said. Further, "Any system which supplants the church building with tent or tabernacle is a danger to the church, as is the leadership of grotesque, flamboyant, sensational, itinerant evangelists. The peril of the business is that the dependence we place on the evangelist may discount the work of our own ministers," was his final appeal. Dr. Stephen S. Wise, leader in Reform Judaism charged that "Billy Sundayism was a disease and that it offered no real cure for the spiritual problems of mankind." Rev. Hamilton Schuyler, on the other hand, accused Sunday of rank commercialism and called the "free-will offering for him "polite blackmail."72 While such

criticisms, whether real or imagined, were abroad, others accepted
Sunday and his revivalism as a national phenomenon and made efforts to
explain it. One such was Dr. Joseph Collins of the Neurological
Institute of New York who made a thorough analysis of revivalism and
of Billy. He noted the complicated organization of the revivals and
its "very modern effort to offset the neurotic worry that is bred of
a mixture of sin and fear with a strong dose of cheerfulness and robust
commonplacenens." Outstanding features of Sunday's personality, he
said, were not only fearlessness and a keen understanding of the
human mind and man's motive of desire, but also infantilism, boastfulness,
and emotional instability. The conclusion? Sunday was pronounced a
genius. Other comment denounced the very process of producing a
revival by deliberate, organized means when the renowned ones before
1850 were spontaneous manifestations of the working of God's Holy
Spirit. Such an article in 1915 assessed the results of such commercial
revivalism as rather confused. Positively, it stated, religion is made
the dominant topic of speech and thought, people are awakened spiritually
and many are truly changed by conversion, and Bible study thrives.
Negatively, it produces irreverence in the churches, many backsliders,
and intolerance for Unitarians and Christian Science. After the 1913
Columbus campaign, a rather widely publicized attack by Dr. Washington

73. "Billy Sunday Analyzed by a Psychologist," Current Opinion,
LXIII (December, 1917), 504.
Monthly, CXV (May, 1915), 587.
Gladden occurred. His particular arguments will be discussed in the chapter on the results of that revival.

Because of the message and methods of Billy Sunday, either deep affection or outright repugnance was aroused in those with whom he dealt. If the liquor industry, owners and operators of all sorts of outright sinful establishments, and, for one reason or another, sectors of the Christian church opposed him, millions of others took Sunday and his cause to their heart. Perhaps this was the most audible group. In 1914, The American Magazine conducted a survey asking its readers to vote on "Who is the greatest man in the U.S." The result placed Sunday in eighth place, tied with Andrew Carnegie and Judge Benjamin Lindsay.  

A poll of the religious press by The Literary Digest in 1915 contacted 127 church journalists to ascertain their general editorial opinion. Of that number, 56 favored Sunday, 43 gave him qualified support, and 28 were opposed to him. Of the 53 Baptists, Methodists and Presbyterians, all gave their support except two Baptists, but it was concluded that "Lutherans seem to be stoutly against Mr. Sunday." As to Episcopalians, they were "either inalterably opposed to the man, or disapprove of his preaching and manner, while giving him the credit for good intentions." Roman Catholic editors were quoted as conceding "that Mr. Sunday is trying to save souls," but that he was "only an ardent layman who pleads for a better life," which "system is hopelessly inadequate to Catholics."  

newspaper feelings by *Current Opinion* in the same year was lopsidedly in favor of Sunday. These included not only the cities of Iowa and Illinois, but also Pittsburgh, Chicago, Philadelphia and New York. In 1914 William Jennings Bryan, then Secretary of State, was very clear in his support for Billy Sunday. He attempted to vindicate Billy's methods before critical clergymen by stating that "the preacher who finds fault with Sunday should, before complaining, be sure he can offer in support of his kind of preaching a longer list of names of persons who have been converted." In one of his famous outbursts of oratory he said, "Every agency for evil, every manipulation of the man-traps, every conspirator against the purity of youth or the virtue of manhood or womanhood - all these will instinctively protest against Sunday's entrance into town. Is that not enough to assure the well-meaning man on which side of the scales his influence should be cast?" Bryan's strict conservatism concerning the verbal inspiration of the Bible and, therefore, his literal interpretation of it helps to explain his deep attachment to Sunday's message. Sunday, himself, was anything but ignorant as to his critics and their criticism, whether from the liquor interests or from the church. From the pulpit he would often defend his use of the vernacular, his free-will offering as remuneration and his methods in general. The proof of his persuasive powers was the undeniable overflow crowds which constantly followed his

---

78. "'Billy' Sunday Sympathetically Interpreted," *Current Opinion*, LVI (May, 1914), 370.
ministry. From 1896 to 1935 he preached to an estimated aggregate total of one hundred million persons and saw one million of that number hit the "sawdust trail." 79

As we have seen, Sunday experienced both immediate and continued success in evangelistic work. The trend towards holding meetings in ever larger cities continued after 1906 although Billy harbored a fear that it might be impossible to awaken the religious sensitivity of such massive communities in which there would be a considerable turnover in the audience from night to night. In the small towns, those with less than 2,500 people, which made up over half of his itinerary before 1906, he could seat most of the local population in his tent or tabernacle in any one service and thereby direct their thinking personally. The larger city would not provide this advantage. By 1910, however, Billy had ventured into Boulder, Colorado, and Youngstown, Ohio, the latter with just over 79,000 population at the time. 80 Further, his ministry had by then taken him as far afield as Spokane, Washington. Success, measured in general cooperation of local churches, ability to raise the funds to meet expenses by offerings, the number of converts, and the memorial offering for the evangelist was not abated. Toledo, with its 170,090 people, presented the first formidable challenge to Sunday. He stated later that he had approached it with some

79. McLaughlin, Modern Revivalism, 415.
80. "Billy Sunday In Big Cities," The Literary Digest, XLVIII (April 14, 1914), 761.
81. Weisberger, op. cit., 246.
82. "Census By Election Board Gives Population 170,090," Toledo Blade, April 5, 1911.
trepidation, but the six week effort proved a record breaker as to number of converts, 7,324, and his own gift offering, $15,423.58.83 If Toledo was a stepping stone, the 1913 Columbus, Ohio campaign was a springboard, the success of which catapulted Sunday into the most spectacular ten years of his career. Other larger cities looked on to witness whether the ex-baseball player could convincingly raise the religious temperature of a true metropolis. After seven strenuous weeks, the answer seemed obvious to most when virtually all of his previous records were broken and persons numbering nearly ten percent of the 181,511 Columbus population had hit the sawdust trail. 84 With this victory behind him, Sunday was much more confident and prepared to assault the largest cities of the nation, particularly in the East, which in turn had waited for such a triumph before satisfying their conservative skepticism that he was the man they wanted. 85 Consequently, he now began to receive invitations which took him to Pittsburgh in 1914, Philadelphia in 1915, Baltimore, Kansas City, and Detroit in 1916, Boston, Buffalo, New York City, and Los Angeles in 1917, and to Washington, D.C. and Chicago in 1918. By the beginning of the 1920's he had been heard in all of the major cities of the United States, and "Billy Sunday" was a byword in homes across the continent. In the estimation of Homer Rodeheaver, who for the last

83. "Gift to Sunday Totals $15,423.50; Conversions over 7,300," Toledo Blade, May 22, 1911, 1.
84. "Billy Sunday in Big Cities," The Literary Digest, XLVIII (April 4, 1914), 761.
85. Weisberger, op. cit., 47.
twenty years of Sunday's career was director of music of the party
and second only to the evangelist himself, the 1915 Philadelphia revival
marked the apex of the Sunday era.\textsuperscript{86} Ellis concurred in this judgement
even though converts compared only 41,724 to 98,264 with the New York
City campaign in the spring of 1917.\textsuperscript{87} Numerous reasons might be given
for the relative failure of the New York City revival, but the clergy
were prone to measure success in terms of new church members. By this
criterion, Dr. Daniel Martin, pastor of the Fort Washington Presbyterian
Church in New York reported that his survey of 273 decision cards signed
at the revival revealed that 17\textsubscript{\frac{1}{4}} were already regularly attending church
members and only 17 (about 7 per cent) were completely unchurched. He
concluded that "if Billy Sunday succeeded in reaching and awakening
to a 'new life' any of the 'booze fighters,' gamblers, and other bad
characters that he so often exhorted, they signed no card that passed
through my hands."\textsuperscript{88} This suggests another aspect of Sunday's appeal
which, in most cases, was solidly to the middle and even upper classes
rather than to the lower, as might have been expected.

Statistical indications of success are often misleading, and the
deeper results as measured in the long range impact for good or evil
are much more evasive of examination. Furthermore, certainly the total
effect upon the lives of the 593,004 who came forward to shake Sunday's
hand, and the other millions who sat under his dramatic barrage against

\textsuperscript{86} Rodeheaver, \textit{op. cit.}, \textit{ibid}.
\textsuperscript{87} Ellis, \textit{op. cit., 5}.
\textsuperscript{88} "Disappointing Results of the Billy Sunday Campaign in New
sin during his twenty major campaigns between 1913 and 1921 is
unascertainable. Possibly it is enough to register that Sunday's
stereotyped messages were heard both in the village and the metropolis
as the nation shared the common experience of revivalism.

With the early 1920's, a definite decline in the revivalistic
pattern as a means to salvation set in throughout the nation and be-
came evident in Sunday's career. The united efforts of churches in
such movements gave way to Christian education, Christian nurture, and
the Progressive Movement with a social gospel emphasis as the means
to raise the moral level of the community and spread the message of
the gospel. The unpainted tabernacle and its homely atmosphere of
gospel songs and an emotional appeal of hell fire preaching increasingly
lost its appeal for the middle class American. The luster of the
cottage prayer meeting, the shop and school service, and the business
women's noon Bible class, all used widely by the Sunday organization,
were becoming fond memories of a generation which had seen revivalism
at its peak during the 1910's. Sunday's last great campaign was held
in Cincinnati in 1921, in which about 15,000 were converted. 90 From
this date Sunday's engagements can be traced to ever smaller towns
and ever shorter meetings. After assaulting the largest cities, this
was the only logical trend. Besides, Sunday was sixty years old in 1922.
Although he had taken strict care of his health, Billy could not hope
to continue a pace which had sustained the ten week revival in New

89. McLoughlin, Modern Revivalism, 415.
90. Ibid., 416, 452.
York City and the eight week one in Cincinnati, but he kept six-week appointments until 1930. After this time he limited his appearances to one or two week services held mostly in single churches. By this time he had amass a considerable sum, estimated by some to have been in the millions, from the offerings given him at each campaign. Although he openly gave a conspicuous part of this to charity, the fact that he had become wealthy from evangelism was a much used criticism by his foes. Nevertheless, Sunday never forsook the work to which he felt called.

Two heart attacks, one in 1933, the other in May, 1935, seriously weakened the body which he had used so vigorously, but he continued to accept invitations to preach. His last sermon was preached at a small church in Mishawaka, Indiana, on October 27, 1935. On November 6, 1935, at the Chicago home of William Thompson, his brother-in-law, Sunday became the victim of angina pectoris at seventy-two years of age.

With the passing of Billy was the passing of an era which he had represented. Although he had received an honorary Doctor of Divinity degree from Westminster College in 1912, he scorned education which substituted reason for faith, and preferred to attack the apathy of the clergy rather than to unite with it. His sermons on "Booze" and "Amusements" had struck hard at evils whether petty or gross as he

91. See Ellis, op. cit., 517-519 for a valuable schedule of Sunday's meetings after 1910.
94. Ibid., 23.
viewed them. Some felt him to have been the greatest single force in
effecting Prohibition. He was unyielding in his position against
the theory of Evolution, Christian Science and Unitarianism. His
appeal included strains of love for country, home, and school. His
attack ranged from the clergy to the drunkard and from the prostitute
to the politician. All of this was enwrapped in his own unique
presentation - dramatic, sensational, gymnastic, and sincere - which
to appreciate fully one must certainly have witnessed. In essence,
his message was simple, "With Christ you are saved, without him you are lost." Perhaps Sunday's most fitting epitaph is that
inscribed upon his tombstone, "I have fought a good fight, I have
finished my course, I have kept the faith."
Chapter II
Ohio Hears Sunday - A Survey

Between the years 1910 and 1930, Billy Sunday held thirteen extended campaigns in Ohio. Nine of this number took place from 1910 to 1913. Several factors combined to make these early campaigns crucial to the advance of Sunday's evangelistic career. Prior to this time Sunday had demonstrated his ability to hold successful revivals primarily in Iowa and Illinois. He was, at this point, attempting to broaden the scope of his ministry. Failures in these Ohio ventures which, along with several Pennsylvania campaigns, were his first attempts to bring his revivals to more eastern attention, could have possibly impeded, if not completely prevented, his later success. Consequently, his triumphs in Ohio during this development stage of his career served to advertise, particularly to the skeptical in the East, that he could appeal to cities in which he was less-well known than in Iowa and Illinois. Even more significant, perhaps, was the fact that in the Buckeye State he was meeting successfully the challenge of larger cities. Toledo was the largest city to have heard his message when he went there in 1911, and Sunday was singularly pleased when it responded so well to his six-week plea for righteous living. The major test of his prowess, however, came in the seven-week Columbus revival of 1912-1913. If failure here could have been disastrous, success helped to verify the validity of his fame gained in smaller towns, demonstrated the maturity
of his organizational structure, and heralded the first of his twenty most successful campaigns.¹

During the years 1914 to 1920 when he was holding some of his greatest revivals, Sunday's tabernacles were not seen in Ohio. When he returned, it was to Cincinnati in 1921. That this campaign was a successor to the Columbus one is shown in that it was the last of Sunday's twenty most successful revivals.² Thus, the famous evangelist had begun and finished the climatic years of his ministry in Ohio. A Dayton campaign followed close behind that of Cincinnati, in 1922. Then a gap of six years separated this revival from the two final ones

---

1. McLoughlin, Modern Revivalism, 415-16.
2. Ibid.

Billy Sunday's Twenty Most Successful Revivals:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Trail-hitters</th>
<th>Free-will Offering</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Columbus, Ohio</td>
<td>1912-13</td>
<td>18,137</td>
<td>$20,929.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wilkes-Barre, Pa.</td>
<td>1913</td>
<td>16,584</td>
<td>23,527.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pittsburgh, Pa.</td>
<td>1914</td>
<td>25,797</td>
<td>$6,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scranton, Pa.</td>
<td>1914</td>
<td>16,999</td>
<td>22,398.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philadelphia, Pa.</td>
<td>1915</td>
<td>41,724</td>
<td>53,266.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paterson, N. J.</td>
<td>1915</td>
<td>18,200</td>
<td>29,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Omaha, Nebraska</td>
<td>1915</td>
<td>17,500</td>
<td>30,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Syracuse, N. Y.</td>
<td>1915</td>
<td>21,155</td>
<td>28,124.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trenton, N. J.</td>
<td>1916</td>
<td>19,640</td>
<td>32,358.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baltimore, Md.</td>
<td>1916</td>
<td>23,085</td>
<td>40,780.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kansas City, Mo.</td>
<td>1916</td>
<td>25,646</td>
<td>32,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Detroit, Michigan</td>
<td>1916</td>
<td>27,109</td>
<td>46,102.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boston, Mass.</td>
<td>1916-17</td>
<td>64,184</td>
<td>53,585.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buffalo, N. Y.</td>
<td>1917</td>
<td>38,853</td>
<td>42,204.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York, N. Y.</td>
<td>1917</td>
<td>98,264</td>
<td>120,490.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Los Angeles, Calif.</td>
<td>1917</td>
<td>13,824</td>
<td>18,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Washington, D. C.</td>
<td>1918</td>
<td>16,838</td>
<td>16,332.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chicago, Illinois</td>
<td>1918</td>
<td>49,165</td>
<td>56,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norfolk, Virginia</td>
<td>1920</td>
<td>20,000</td>
<td>33,119.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cincinnati, Ohio</td>
<td>1921</td>
<td>25,000</td>
<td>38,588.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Totals                  | 598,004      | $756,795.32   |
of Sunday in Ohio in 1928 and 1929. The last, in Elyria, came in the last full year which he devoted to extended evangelistic meetings.

It will be the intention in the remaining pages of this chapter to set down in some detail the facts surrounding each of the Ohio campaigns.

Youngstown

(January 8 to February 20, 1910)

The first time a Sunday tabernacle was to appear in Ohio was in January 1910, in Youngstown. According to a report by a Rev. Henderson, one of the cooperating ministers of that city, efforts had been going on for a year and a half to get Sunday there. The first Sunday's staff for this meeting included Adrian P. Gill as advance man, Homer Rodeheaver, chorister, Rev. John K. Linden, assistant evangelist, and Fred Seibert, tabernacle custodian. The tabernacle here, which was dedicated on January 2, in a service attended by about 6,000, had a capacity of approximately 7,000. This first interest in the meetings was indicative of the crowds that were to seek to hear Billy during his six weeks in Youngstown. A choir, reported to have a membership of 600, was

recruited. 7 Soon the tabernacle could not hold the would-be hearers. The characteristics of Sunday's later revivals were in full evidence even at this first Ohio campaign. Special meetings for men and women only were held, delegations from shops in the area were conspicuous, and the typical cheering and applause were heard as converts walked down the sawdust aisles to shake Billy's hand. Probably the largest delegation to attend was the 1,200-strong group which came from Sharon, Pennsylvania on January 21, where he had held a revival in 1908. 8 On February 13, several hundred I.O.O.F. members were present, cheering as fellow members hit the sawdust trail. 9 In customary fashion, Sunday appealed here to prominent persons who were numbered among the converts. These included county recorder Edward Westwood and some deputy sheriffs. 10 After the meetings closed on February 20, the converts were totaled at 5,915, with 877 of these going forward the last day. 11 The free-will offering for Billy amounted to about $12,000. 12 An interesting aspect of the follow-up of the revival was

10. Ibid.
12. Ibid.
witnessed here as nearly all of the sponsoring churches began nightly evangelistic services of their own when Billy left, to carry on the spirit and work generated by the larger effort. One week after Sunday's exodus, a union church meeting was held, in which hope was expressed of ridding the city of liquor. Plans were laid for the founding of a federation of churches which would carry on united evangelistic work, strive for better Sunday observance, and promote a county option campaign two years hence. That this effort at unified church action was at least partially successful, was attested by the article published in the Youngstown Vindicator the day after Sunday's death in 1935. This cited two principal permanent results of the 1910 revival; it "brought together the groups which later organized the federation of churches" which was still active, and started the movement which resulted in the new building for both the Y.M.C.A. and Y.W.C.A. This same article pointed out that the political campaign which was in progress during the revival caused some politicians to use their attendance and "trail hitting" at the meetings for political popularity ends. An editorial on the same day noted that when Billy came, the town was running "'wide open' and many of the churches were more inclined toward propriety and respectability than toward a religion which made men do uncomfortable things. Someone with Mr. Sunday's

13. Ibid.
spirit and vehemence was needed to bring home to them the fact that religion is not intended for the Sabbath only, but that it is something to be lived, no matter what the cost . . . ." But further it was stated that in time most communities had rejected Sunday's methods - "he had done his work, but the time for his hippodroming was over." 16

Portsmouth

(January 1 to February 12, 1911)

Although much smaller, Portsmouth, with a population of only 23,481 as compared to the Youngstown's 79,066, held a large and certainly as significant a revival in 1911. 17 The tabernacle there was built to seat about 6,500, with 500 more for the choir, but 8,000 could squeeze in by using the standing room. Customary signs reading "Get Right With God," "Portsmouth For Christ," and "Saved For Service" were displayed at the front of the building. 18 The Scioto County Evangelistic Association, headed by Rev. Robertson, pastor of the Second Presbyterian Church, was the sponsoring and directing agency for the meetings which got under way on Sunday, January 1. 19 To show their approval of Sunday's preaching on divorce, cards, dancing, the theater, and Sunday sports, fourteen supporting pastors had a signed

17. See Appendix I for populations of Ohio cities in which revivals were held.
statement published in the Portsmouth Blade on January 14. 20 The Blade made headlines of the revival at each publication in noticeable contrast to the Youngstown Vindicator which seldom, if ever, allowed Sunday space on the front page. Attendance was high at Portsmouth, and delegations practically took control of the services at times. At the men only service on Sunday afternoon, January 15, about 200 Modern Woodmen of America and 150 Sciotoville men, plus the city police, led by the mayor and chief of police, were present. 21 Preceded by two brass bands, on Wednesday evening, January 18, one thousand Shelby shoeworkers attended as the crowds began to overflow the tabernacle. 22 By January 24, the mass patriotic and emotional climax of the revival was reached as 1,000 from Ironton, plus the employees of the Excelsior shoe factory, led by the River City Band with an American flag waving, marched to the tabernacle. Said the Blade, "with the flambeaux torched of politics, it would have beaten to a frazzel the greatest campaigns ever recorded in history." Upon reaching the building, the band proceeded to the platform and continued its renditions. 23 Probably the most important event of the revival in terms of Billy's future evangelistic career took place on Monday,

January 30, when, together with thousands from Portsmouth who traveled on mass with him by train, he made a trip to Columbus to speak before the Anti-saloon Convention. The occasion attracted much attention and possibly set in motion the movement which effected the Columbus revival two years later. The last day of the crusade saw overflow crowds and the final convert tally at 5,224. Special offerings the last Sunday had netted Billy $10,305.74, according to the Blade. A later report placed it at $12,554.00. Sunday’s party here had been made up of A. P. Gill, advance man; Rev. I. E. Honeywell, assistant evangelist; B. D. Ackley, pianist; Homer Rodsheaver, music director; Miss Anna McLaren, soloist; and Miss Frances Miller, Bible teacher.

Lima

(February 19 to April 2, 1911)

One week after closing the Portsmouth revival, Sunday arrived in the completely different atmosphere of Lima. In Portsmouth, where Judge A. Z. Blair of Adams County was chairman of the local Billy Sunday Evangelistic Company, he had had the support of all the clergy, except one, along with an adequate number of businessmen and other

25. Frankenberg, op. cit., 141.
27. "Billy Sunday In Big Cities," The Literary Digest, XLVIII (April 4, 1914), 761.
laymembers. In Lima, the day before the revival was to open, Rev. H. C. Schleuter wrote a paper on "Evangelistic Ministers" which was printed in the Lima Times-Democrat. In attacking Billy's methods he said that evangelism "is more than going from one city to another, to deliver a dozen sermons, create a sensation, set in judgement and condemn the sins of Sodom, . . . take up the collection, and say 'good bye,' and leave the 'cleaning up' to the ministers of the town." The same newspaper commented that "Billy Sunday enters into the work here without the avowed support of any of the representative citizens of Lima outside the gentlemen of the cloth, and a band of faithful, praying, women, who thus far have borne the burden of the preparatory work alone." The principal arguments against Sunday, even by laymen, seemed to be his methods and an insinuation of graft. The news report further asserted that "Billy Sunday comes to Lima the most bitterly maligned and cruelly slandered man that ever entered the city upon any mission." On the other side of the ledger, Sunday could count on the backing of the churches and the local Y.M.C.A. as his primary assets. As evidence of this, nearly every pastor in Lima was on hand to greet his arrival.

Notwithstanding the apparent conflict, the tabernacle on Pierce Street, built to seat about 6,000, accommodated nearly 15,000 people

during the three services on the first Sunday, February 19. By the
next Wednesday, in a news release, the affiliated churches affirmed
their faith in Sunday and defended him and themselves against local
critics. They said in part, "Current reports have been set going about
the individual opinions of several of the pastors to show that at heart
they do not endorse Mr. Sunday, but by some sort of coercion or
subservence, they are in the campaign merely as onlookers. All this and
such stuff . . . we brand as untrue in fact, and sinister in purpose." 

Youth night, on February 24, witnessed the usual enthusiasm of
school yells and several selections given by the Lima High School
orchestra. Meetings were held by members of the Sunday team in numerous
city factories and shops. Soon, from this and other sources, came the
usual harvest of delegations. On Tuesday evening, February 28, about
7,500 jammed into the tabernacle, including a delegation of 1,400
business girls and 1,200 to 1,500 who had traveled via the interurban
from Bellefontaine, Van Wert, and Findlay. Sunday's first call for
converts did not come until March 2, when he had won a convincing
victory over his critics by the practical proof of huge audiences.
On that evening, he used a customary sermon for his first appeal for
converts, "The Three Groups," as he addressed a crowd including about

32. "Auspicious Opening to Revival Season," The Lima Times-
Democrat, February 22, 1911, 4.
33. "Pastors of Affiliated Churches Issue Statement," The Lima
Times-Democrat, February 22, 1911, 4.
34. "Rev. Sunday and Party," The Lima Times-Democrat, February
28, 1911, 2.
35. "Fourteen Hundred Girls and Women Marched to Tabernacle,"
The Lima Times-Democrat, March 1, 1911, 1.
500 locomotive men - sixty-six of the audience "hit the trail." 36

By Sunday, March 5, there remained no more need for proof of
Billy's ultimate success in Lima as 30,000 - approximately equal to
Lima's total population - attended five Sunday-sponsored meetings, and
the convert total stood at 952. 37 Even businessmen's meetings were
being held once a week at noon with evidence of real interest by the
middle of March. 38 An event which became a sort of trade mark or peak
of Sunday meetings, the Sunday School parade, was held on Saturday
afternoon, March 18, during the Lima crusade. No less than twenty-four
Sunday Schools were represented, including 5,000 children, led by
Keller's juvenile band while marching to the tabernacle. 39 Rev.

Honeywell, B. D. Ackley, Homer Rodeheaver, Fred Selbert, Frances Miller,
Grace Saxe, Anna McLaren, along with Billy and "Ma" Sunday made up the
party of workers. 40 For their efforts they could count 5,659 converts
and an offering for Billy of $11,313.20. 41 Most of the cooperating
churches began their own revival services to extend for two weeks after
Sunday left. After a week, the Lima Times-Democrat reported that all
of the churches of Lima had gained new members from the revival -

36. "Main Track Is Open For All Sick of Sin," The Lima Times-
Democrat, March 3, 1911, 1.
37. "Five Great Meetings Were Held Yesterday," The Lima
Times-Democrat, March 3, 1911, 1.
38. "Attendance Grows Daily," The Lima Times-Democrat, March 17,
1911, 2.
39. "The Sunday School Rally," The Lima Times-Democrat, March 20,
1911, 4.
40. Frankenberg, op. cit., 145.
41. "Six Weeks Campaign Passes Into History," The Lima Times-
Democrat, April 3, 1911, 1. The offering was later revised to
$8,000, as indicated by "Billy Sunday In Big Cities," The Literary
Digest, XLVIII (April 4, 1914), 761.
actually meaning that every church in town had been indicated by someone who had signed a decision card. Nevertheless, at least 1,238 persons were certified as having been received into church membership by April 9. 42 "It can be stated that Rev. Sunday came up to all advance notices . . . he more than vindicated those who were responsible for his coming" was the same newspaper's benediction upon the six week's effort. 43

It remains yet to note that a committee of Columbus ministers, including Rev. John W. Day, came to Lima as early as March 16, in an attempt to schedule a future revival in their city, 44 and, further, that William Jennings Bryan was in Lima after speaking at Ohio Northern University on March 30. He held an hour and a half private conference with Sunday and attended the afternoon tabernacle meeting on March 31. 45

Toledo

(April 9 to May 22, 1911)

Only a week's interval separated the Lima and the Toledo campaigns. Although Mayor Brand Whitlock of Toledo later accused Sunday of being brought to town by the same group of naive religious reformers and local business interests and their political henchmen, which had brought Sam P. Jones to Toledo to fight Golden Rule Jones, the general tenor of the Toledo setting for the revival was infinitely more optimistic than it

44. "Columbus Divines," The Lima Times-Democrat, March 20, 1911, 6.
45. "Hon. William Jennings Bryan At Tabernacle This Afternoon," The Lima Times-Democrat, March 31, 1911, 2.
had been in Lima. Whitlock's charge that the purpose of Sunday's invitation to Toledo was "to divert attention from the illegal and greedy practices of some of the sponsors by pointing out a smaller evil," may have been true, at least in part, but seemed to have little effect upon the outcome of the campaign.\textsuperscript{46} This was the largest city in which Sunday had undertaken a revival. Just before he arrived, the population was cited as 170,090.\textsuperscript{47} A total of fifty-eight churches banned together to sponsor the meetings and the tabernacle built to seat 10,000, located on Spielbusch Avenue in old Armory Park, was the largest yet to be used by Sunday.\textsuperscript{48} A. P. Gill acted as advance man and was evidently quite successful, as by April 4, five days before the revival opened, 250 cottage prayer meetings were reported in progress. These were to continue on a three-morning-a-week basis throughout the six weeks.\textsuperscript{49} Lutheran churches generally never participated in Sunday's

\textsuperscript{46} Quoted in McLaughlin, Modern Revivalism, 414.

\textsuperscript{47} "Census By Election Board Gives Population 170,090," Toledo Blade, April 5, 1911, 1.

\textsuperscript{48} "Facts on Sunday Meetings," Toledo Blade, April 8, 1911, 1.

"Everything In Readiness For Opening of Billy Sunday Campaign Tomorrow," Toledo Blade, April 8, 1911, 13; gives the breakdown of participating churches as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Methodist</th>
<th>20</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baptists</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congregationalist</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presbyterian</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Brethren</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reformed</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christian</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evangelical Association</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Presbyterian</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{49} "Where the Cottage Prayer Meetings Will Be Held Tuesday," Toledo Blade, April 4, 1911, 11.
campaigns. Here, twenty-two of them passed a resolution declaring his methods to be "sensational, theatrical, irreverent, and a violation not only of true piety but also of true refinement . . ." to justify their remaining aloof. 50

The three services on the first Sunday, April 9, brought 30,000 to the tabernacle and a reported $3,389.86 into the collection pans, much effort having been made to raise $10,000 and erase all expenses on the opening day. 51 Attendance from the first was consistently high. Youth night brought about 3,000 students marching to the building from the Y.M.C.A. on April 14, to swell the crowd to 11,000. 52 April 19, a delegation of about 2,000 local working girls marched to the tabernacle. 53 The first call for converts came with almost 13,000 present on Friday, April 21. The 138 who responded set a record for the number to come forward on one of Sunday's first appeals. 54 The Sunday party, including Rodeheaver, Ackley, Rev. Honeywell, Grace Saxe, Frances Miller, Anna McLaren, Fred Seibert, Mr. and Mrs. A. P. Gill, and Rae Muirhead, were busily engaged in shop and prayer meetings which reaped dividends in large attendance. 55

50. "Lutherans Hit Sunday," Toledo Blade, April 7, 1911, 10.
52. "Youth King of All, Rules Tabernacle," Toledo Blade, April 15, 1911, 1.
54. "Record Reply When Sunday Cries 'Repent,'" Toledo Blade, April 22, 1911, 1.
55. "Everything In Readiness For Opening of Billy Sunday Campaign Tomorrow," Toledo Blade, April 8, 1911, 13.
The peak attendance for any single service here was reached as almost 15,000 women packed the tabernacle on Thursday evening, April 11, to hear Billy's sermon to women only.\(^{56}\) On April 23, it was estimated that 20,000 were turned away from the services of the day, with overflow crowds being given services at Memorial Hall.\(^{57}\) "Cap" Anson happened to be giving his vaudeville routine at the Toledo Arcade theater during Sunday's meetings and the two visited together for some time on May 3.\(^{58}\) Sunday and Anson remained close friends from earlier baseball days and seemed to enjoy chatting when their paths crossed.

As the Toledo revival closed it was obvious that the records established elsewhere as to the most converts and largest offering to the evangelist had been topped. Five hundred and thirty-nine walked down the sawdust trail on the last Sunday, and it was estimated that 806,500 had been the aggregate total attendance at the tabernacle during the six weeks.\(^{59}\) The official count of converts by the secretary of the evangelical committee, P. W. Williams, eventually stood at 7,391.\(^{60}\) Sunday broke one of his rules at the end of the meetings and held an additional service on the Monday following the technical close of the revival on Sunday, May 21, thus extending the campaign

\(^{56}\) "Sit In Sawdust to Hear Sunday," Toledo Blade, April 12, 1911, 1.

\(^{57}\) "Sunday, Faint, Calls Army to the Trail," Toledo Blade, April 24, 1911, 1.

\(^{58}\) "Sunday Is Ready For Army of Sin," Toledo Blade, May 3, 1911, 1.

\(^{59}\) "Gift to Sunday Totals $15,423.50; Conversions over 7,300," Toledo Blade, May 22, 1911, 1.

\(^{60}\) "Rich Churches After Converts," Toledo Blade, June 5, 1911, 3.
by one day. The final draft given to Sunday for his work amounted to $15,539.10. Upon leaving the city, Sunday confessed

I feared when I came to Toledo that it would not be possible to create that deep spiritual conviction that is necessary for the success of a campaign and which I had been told could be better secured in a small town than in the city with its constantly changing audiences. But Toledo has proven that the large city can be won.

If this experience in Toledo did, indeed, prove to Sunday "that the large city can be won" it would be difficult to overestimate the self-assurance which he gained there and its effects upon his later big-city career. Further immediate results of the campaign took the form of men's and women's personal workers leagues and Bible classes, as well as many new church members. Many churches held special services during the week after the campaign, and one even went so far as to plan a tabernacle in which folks not used to church might still be reached.

One report said that "hundreds of new members were received and added to the church memberships" by the last of May. One church emphasized the fact that most of its new members had not even signed cards at the revival. Commenting on the effects of the Toledo revival as late as September, 1912, Dr. E. O. Crist, District Superintendent of the Methodist Episcopal Church of The Toledo District, and Dr. Ernest

62. "Gift to Sunday Totals $15,423.50; Conversions over 7,300," Toledo Blade, May 22, 1911, 1.
63. Ibid.
64. "Converts Won By Sunday Flock to Toledo Churches," Toledo Blade, May 29, 1911, 1.
Bourner Allen of the First Congregational Church of Toledo, said that it added numerically to the churches, enlivened the spiritual life of churches as evidenced by better attended prayer meetings, helped to unify the Toledo churches, produced greater efforts to personal work and evangelism, showed a reasonable depth of experience in its converts as seen by few backsliders, and caused no reaction or evil. These men further testified that Sunday had proved to be "... a faithful, earnest, and sincere preacher of the Word of God." 65 Two years after the revival, Rev. Allen, writing in the Congregationalist, again summarized the effects of the effort. The impetus toward Bible study, he said, was still evidenced by thirty-five neighborhood Bible classes with over 300 attending. The men's personal work league was still sharing in evangelistic meetings. Bible study work was also still prominent in the Y.M.C.A. and church programs. He stated, too, that the 189 new members taken into his church were as loyal as any of the 1,500 taken in before by him under ordinary conditions. Finally, he observed that his own church finances were helped rather than hindered by the offering given to Sunday.

Springfield
(September 24 to November 5, 1911)

After the Toledo revival, Sunday held one in Erie, Pennsylvania,

65. Some Truths Concerning the Billy Sunday Campaigns (Columbus, Ohio, September, 1912). This is a leaflet published by the Columbus Evangelistic Association to advertise the 1912-13 Columbus campaign.
during May and June and then took his usual summer vacation before traveling to Springfield, Ohio, for his next six-week crusade. With less than 50,000 inhabitants, Springfield was considerably smaller than Toledo and Youngstown, but the results here actually rivaled the former and surpassed the latter. The tabernacle to house the services in Springfield was erected at the corner of Limestone and Pleasant Streets, and on the last evening of the meetings was made to serve almost 12,000 people. As the meetings opened on Sunday, September 24, an estimated 25,000 persons were there to hear Billy’s three messages while about 2,000 could not gain entrance at the evening service.

O. F. Hypes, one of the heads of the association which invited Sunday to Springfield, introduced him at the first session. A few of Sunday’s remarks showed that his coming here was not without its critics. To political charges he answered, "They say I am brought here to work in the interests of a political party . . . . I say that when they say such a thing they are liars, and they knew they were liars when they said it." As to his finances he states "Some men are said to have gone about the streets here saying that I wouldn’t come without a guarantee of $10,000. They are liars . . . !" "There is no man in the world whose affairs are more open to scrutiny than mine." The roster

67. "Sunday Waves Farewell to the City of Homes," The Springfield Times, November 10, 1911, 1.
70. Ibid.
of the Sunday staff here is difficult to obtain in its entirety, but Rodeheaver was here and also, for the first time, Rev. L. K. Peacock, having succeeded Rev. Honeywell as Sunday's assistant evangelist. 71

By the second Sunday of the revival, men's meetings were held each Sunday afternoon, with the October 8 one involving about 8,000 men. Delegations were common here as well, with 600 employees of the American Seeding Company attending October 6. 72 The most spectacular affair of the campaign was the Sunday School parade on Saturday, October 21. B. B. McIntire was appointed as Grand Marshall, and the schools were to be arranged in four groupings according to a preliminary report. The Sunday party was to lead, followed by about seventy-five cars carrying small children. Twenty-nine city Sunday Schools led by a band were included in the second section. Then, noticeable for racial connotations, were the five "all colored Sunday Schools," finally followed by another thirteen Sunday Schools from out of town. 73

As the meetings closed, a record breaking 700 responded to the altar call in the last meeting. In the freewill offering for Billy, it was reported that W. A. Martin, Republican candidate for mayor, had given $25. The ushers called out the donations and contributors' names as they gave. 74 The total offering for Sunday came to $13,975, and

71. Frankenberg, op. cit., 146.
72. "Great Interest Manifested In the 'Billy' Sunday Meetings," The Springfield Times, October 13, 1911, 1.
73. "'Billy' Sunday Expressions," The Springfield Times, October 20, 1911, 2.
the converts numbered 6,804, according to the Springfield Times.  

These results ranked it very well among the Ohio and other Sunday efforts. About a week after the crusade, the local newspaper reminisced that "those who fought against his coming here hung their heads in shame, and many of them were converted. The good results of the meetings can never be told, as the city has taken a new lease on life."  

Two years later, James S. Webb, who had observed the entire period said that "the good work he did here still continues and the live members of our churches, Sunday schools and brotherhoods are Sunday converts."  

Canton  
(December 31, 1911 to February 11, 1912)  

Sunday spent November and most of December, 1911, in a revival at Wichita, Kansas, before returning to Ohio to open the Canton campaign on December 31. A. P. Gill was the advance representative here where a choir of 700 was recruited, second in number only to Toledo's 900 voices. The entire staff here included Rodeheaver, Ackley, Seibert, and Misses Miller, McLaren, and Saxe. By December 29, one hundred and seventy-five districts in the area were holding as many

76. "Sunday Waves Farewell to the City of Homes," The Springfield Times, November 10, 1911, 1.  
77. Frankenberg, op. cit., 146.  
79. Frankenberg, op. cit., 147.
prayer services in preparation for the revival. During the dedication of the tabernacle, built to seat about 7,500, Rev. L. G. Batman of Youngstown testified optimistically that "the results of the campaign in Youngstown are lasting. After Sunday goes your churches will be filled and they will have so much money that they will enlarge and build new buildings and increase the salaries of their pastors." Who could fail to join such a scheme?

By the first Tuesday evening of the meetings, the crowds were overflowing the tabernacle, and by the end of the week an aggregate of approximately 70,000 had heard the evangelist and contributed $1,600 to the general expense fund. The second week saw the revival under full steam with special meetings for working girls and high school students, union prayer services and the influx of huge delegations to witness the spectacle. On Thursday evening of that week, with the sermon "The Three Groups," came the first call for converts. Unlike most other revivals where the names, addresses, and church preferences

---

83. "Attendance At Tabernacle Has Totalled 70,000," The Canton News-Democrat, January 7, 1912, 2.
85. "91 Respond to First Call to Hit the Saw-Dust Trail," The Canton News-Democrat, January 12, 1912, 1.
of converts were kept as private information for only the respective pastors to see, a full list of this information was published in the January 12, Canton News-Democrat. 86 By Sunday, January 14, a reported $7,169.06 had been raised to fully cover the revival expenses. 87 That afternoon nearly 8,000 men squeezed into the tabernacle for the men only service, while about 2,000 others were turned away. 88 While here, Sunday held one of his few late night services. This was at the Stark Rolling Mills on January 19, from 11:00 to 11:30 P.M. where 500 men gathered between shifts, as the company allowed its men to get off one half hour early to attend the meeting and those of the 11:30 shift came in early. 89 On January 25, 1,800 Masons headed by the mayor of Canton, A. R. Turnbull, attended the service. 90 A height of patriotic fervor, seldom reached in a Sunday meeting, was experienced in Canton on the anniversary of former President McKinley's birthday, Monday, January 29. Customarily, Billy never held Monday services, but on this occasion he threw the tabernacle open to 8,000 in a patriotic rally in memory of the former president. Many patriotic organizations came en masse and heard Billy’s oratorical eulogy of the assassinated

leader. That the revival stirred political as well as religious sentiments is clearly discernible.

As the series of services entered their final weeks, a railroad delegation from the Baltimore and Ohio, the Wheeling and Lake Erie and Pennsylvania lines numbered 2,000. Also, 14,000 women fought to be admitted to the all women service. By the last day of the meetings, it was reported that "nearly every man, woman and child in Canton has attended one or more of his meetings . . . ." At forty-eight of the services, the tabernacle had been filled and the aggregate total attendance stood at 434,000. Furthermore, $12,184.46 had been raised by offerings, subscriptions and sale of the tabernacle lumber, to pay for operational expenses. From this amount, one-half of Sunday's workers' salaries was to be paid. On the last day, 747 converts were secured and the total for the six weeks was estimated between 5,627 and 5,654. The offering for Billy amounted to $12,652.31. Upon leaving, Sunday remarked, "Coming to Canton I found a city congealed spiritually - head clear but heart sluggish, conscience dying morally - but she responded to the call of God magnificently."

91. "Life of McKinley An Inspiration For All to Seek Higher Level," The Canton News-Democrat, January 30, 1912, 1.
95. "Canton Gives Billy Sunday $12,652.31; 5,627 is the Total Number of Converts," The Canton News-Democrat, February 12, 1912, 1. For the higher estimate see Frankenberg, loc. cit.
96. Ibid.
"The success of this work depends upon the ministers and churches - not upon me," was his characteristic benediction to all revivals. "You might as well blame the doctor because the baby died six months after it was born as to blame me or my part of the work if some are not faithful and drift back," was his rebuttal in advance to any who might later point to backsliders as evidence of his failure. 97 As the party left, Ackley was given a stick pin, Miss Miller, a ring with two sapphires and a diamond, and various others were given both jewelry and money from appreciative local groups. 98 One week after the close of the revival, 1,500 had reportedly joined Canton churches. 99 At the end of the second week some churches were still sponsoring special meetings of their own and at least 508 more new members were added. 100 Two weeks after the party left, Harry Monroe, who had been responsible for inviting Sunday to the Pacific Garden Mission, arrived and spoke to a meeting of the Men's Personal Workers' League. 101 This became a generally-used follow up technique. As late as March 3, three hundred and seven new members were just entering into church fellowship. 102 A year later, Rev. P. H. Welshimer, pastor of Canton's First Christian

101. Ibid.
Church, testified that attendance at prayer meeting and church services in general had greatly increased since the revival. East Liverpool
(September 15 to October 27, 1912)

The only other 1912 campaign which Sunday held in Ohio occurred in the smallest of the cities he was to visit here. East Liverpool had about 20,387 inhabitants. Mr. and Mrs. Gill, Rev. Peacock, Ackley, Seibert, and Misses Miller, McLaren, and Saxe were on hand to evangelize the city. J. H. Speice also had been added to the team by this time as architect in charge of erection of the tabernacle. The newest member of the party was Major Cole, a noted Chicago evangelist. Professor Hugh Laughlin substituted for Rodeheaver during this revival when the latter was taken ill. After five years of service with the Sunday party, A. P. Gill temporarily retired from his advance representative post during this campaign.

Reports said that local clergy and businessmen had been working for two years to attract Sunday to East Liverpool. At least

103. Some Truths Concerning the Billy Sunday Campaigns (Columbus, Ohio, September, 1912).
104. "Billy Sunday In Big Cities," The Literary Digest, XLVIII (April 4, 1914), 761.
106. Frankenberg, op. cit., 150.
twenty-four churches cooperated in the revival effort. Over 2,500 cottage prayer meetings were held in the community, and about 3,500 attended a prayer meeting in the tabernacle on September 11. Five thousand witnessed the dedication on the 14th. 109 About 600 were secured to sing in the choir, and the completed tabernacle could accommodate about 7,000 persons. 110 Twenty-one thousand came out to see Billy on the first Sunday, September 15. 111 On Youth Night, September 18, nearly 1,600 school youngsters marched to the tabernacle. 112 The first call for converts came on Thursday, September 26, which was somewhat earlier than in most Sunday revivals. 113 One of the highlights of the six weeks was the usual Sunday school parade on Saturday, October 12. 114 Delegations representing railroad workers and potters were conspicuous additions to the various crowds at the tabernacle.

On Potter's Night, October 16, hundreds of potters were present, headed by the Salvation Army Band. 115 Among the prominent citizens to walk

110. "5,000 Attend Dedication of Sunday Tabernacle," Wellsville Daily Union, September 14, 1912, 1.
112. "1,500 Young People Take Stand and March to the Tabernacle," Wellsville Daily Union, September 19, 1912, 1.
114. "Sabbath School Parade Saturday," Wellsville Daily Union, October 10, 1912, 1. No extended report of this event was later given.
down the sawdust trail as converts was the mayor of the nearby town of Wellsville, H. W. Moore.

As the meetings closed, 6,444 conversions were tallied, and Sunday was given 812,654.94 as a thank offering. With 1,155 hitting the trail the last day, the Wellsville Daily Union commented that "never in the history of the Ohio Valley has there been such a Christian awakening." For its size, East Liverpool had definitely shown a considerable response to Sunday's message; it had totaled more converts than any other Ohio campaign except Springfield and Toledo. Immediately following the revival, the pastors at Wellsville united in a week of union services in City Hall which was filled to capacity on Tuesday, October 29. The two nearby Methodist Episcopal Churches alone realized eighty-five new members by November 3.

Columbus

(December 29, 1912 to February 16, 1913)

Since this campaign is analyzed at some length in the following chapters, suffice it to mention here that this was the greatest of the Ohio campaigns, rivaled only by that of Cincinnati in 1921. Its remarkable place in Sunday's career gives it particular importance.

Steubenville
(September 14 to October 26, 1913)

Due to the success of the Columbus revival seven months before, Sunday came to Steubenville at a high point of popularity. For about three years his services had been sought here. He was given consistently, wide coverage in the newspaper, amounting to several pages per issue at times, to include his copyrighted sermons. The tabernacle built for him on 8th Street would seat about 8,000, and 18,500 greeted him there in three services the first Sunday. With him were "Ma" Sunday, Rev. Peacock, Rodsheaver, Spiece, Seibert, Misses Miller and Saxe, Mrs. William Asher, who had joined them at the Columbus revival, and the returned A. P. Gill. Rev. J. Walter Liggitt was chairman of the sponsoring W. A. Sunday Evangelical Association. Cottage prayer meetings were held in 105 districts with an estimated 4,361 attending before the meetings opened. Factory meetings were also used freely as a means to evangelize the community. Therefore, as the revival progressed, the usual delegation influx occurred. On Railway Night, October 5, workers from numerous nearby villages flocked to the tabernacle. The Sunday, October 12,

120. "Great Evangelist In Three Mighty Sermons Attacks The Devil's Forces," The Steubenville Weekly Gazette, September 18, 1913, 1.

121. Ibid.


124. "Railroaders From this Section Crowd Tabernacle," The Steubenville Weekly Gazette, October 9, 1913, 1.
services were so convincingly well attended, with 10,000 at the men only service, as to cause the Steubenville Weekly Gazette to comment, "Such a day has perhaps no parallel in the history of Steubenville . . . ." More summarily, it called the revival "far and away . . . the greatest religious awakening ever experienced in Jefferson County and its immediate environs." 125

As in previous revivals, the Sunday School parade attracted much attention here. Including about 10,000 in all, the parade took nearly an hour to pass a given spot. Even a downpour did not halt the enthusiastic marchers. Mayor George W. McLeish led, followed by policemen and firemen, the Patton's band, fifty ushers, the Sunday party and ministerial association, floats, and the marching Sunday School representatives. Banners and flags added to the gala affair. 126 Rodeheaver noted that there was hardly a day, either here or in East Liverpool, when the platform was not covered with gifts of dishes and various kinds of pottery made by local pottery workers. He felt that "Mr. and Mrs. Sunday must have received enough . . . pottery from East Liverpool and Steubenville, Ohio to furnish their home, and maybe two or three others." 127

As the meetings closed, converts were said to have been 7,872 in number, 1,159 the last Sunday, and Billy's offering to have totalled

125. "Over 400 Hit the Trail on Saturday and Sunday," The Steubenville Weekly Gazette, October 16, 1913, 1.
$11,345.79. D. J. Sinclair and his wife alone donated $600 to Sunday. Aggregate attendance ran to about 471,800. These were gratifying results in a town just over 20,000 in population. As an afterthought, the local newspaper recorded that "opposition was veritably swept away until leading citizens that included lawyers, physicians, businessmen, high officials, and society people were veritably swept into the kingdom." While there, Sunday had placed much emphasis upon temperance, and during his "Booze" sermon to men only, he had gotten 10,000 of them to stand to register their disapproval of the liquor traffic.

As a follow up to that expression, Harry Monroe arrived in Steubenville and held a huge "dry" meeting at the National Theater on Sunday afternoon, November 31. This effort was not in vain since, in the December 5 balloting, Steubenville went dry by a 166 majority out of a total of 4,676 votes. Two years before, a wet majority of 1,493 had ruled the election, but now about fifty saloons were to be abandoned within thirty days. Celebrations by many local folk, including factory workers, were held in which they sang "De Brewer's Big Bosses Can't Run Over Us" and rang the church bells to punctuate the dry victory. Sunday, upon

---

128. "7,872 Converts Hit Trail, $11,345.79 is Given to Mr. Sunday," The Steubenville Weekly Gazette, October 30, 1913, 1.
129. "Do Not Forsake Christ Because There Are Hypocrites In Church," The Steubenville Weekly Gazette, October 30, 1913, 1.
learning the news, telegraphed "God bless old Steubenville. That is
glorious news, there is consternation in hell. There is shouting in
heaven..." 132 Steubenville newspaperman, Chalmer C. White,
answering a Current Opinion poll of newspaper feelings on Billy Sunday,
two years later stated that "At the recent state elections this county
went dry by 3,000 majority, showing that the Billy Sunday influence
lasts." "Better clothes and better furnished homes have followed the
revival." 133

Cincinnati
(March 6 to May 1, 1921)

After an absence from Ohio of nearly eight years, during which
time he was holding his greatest campaigns, Sunday reappeared at
Cincinnati in 1921 for the last of his twenty most successful revivals.
Beginning March 6, this was to be the most lengthy of his Ohio efforts,
eight weeks. With him, he brought a staff which had been changed over
the years. Fred Rapp was now advance man, 134 Albert L. Peterson,
custodian and physical trainer for Sunday, 135 and Miss Florence Kinney,
Bible teacher, along with the more familiar Rodeheaver, Mrs. William
Asher, and Grace Saxe. 136 A majority of the Protestant churches

132. "Dry Forces Win Notable Victory In Beal Law Election on
     Friday," The Steubenville Herald, December 11, 1913, 4.
133. "What Newspapers See in the Work of Evangelist 'Billy'
134. "Sunday's Choir," Cincinnati Post, March 5, 1921, 1.
135. "Keeping Sunday In Fighting Trim," Cincinnati Post,
     March 11, 1921, 2.
except for all Episcopalian, Lutheran and Unitarian groups cooperated in bringing Sunday to Cincinnati. The tabernacle which was built for the revival at 12th Street and Central Avenue originally seated 7,500. 137 After two weeks, the structure, obviously too small to accommodate the crowds, was enlarged eighteen feet on each side, thereby bringing its seating capacity to 10,000 and its total cost to $39,000. 138 Above each day’s headlines of the Cincinnati Post appeared quotations from Sunday throughout the campaign, and much space was used to print his copyrighted sermons. This newspaper also noticeably endeavored to increase its circulation by an appeal through its extremely adequate coverage of the revival. It is worthy of note that Sunday’s name also was used in a large Caloric Pipeless Furnace advertisement here as he gave this produce his full endorsement because of its performance in his tabernacles. 139

On the opening day, 21,000 attended and 7,000 responded by waving their handkerchiefs when Billy called for a "Chautauqua salute to God." 140 On March 11, Sunday spoke to 1,000 businessmen at Exchange Hall, Chamber of Commerce, and managed to hug Mayor John Galvin while there. 141 The first call for converts came on March 17. On that evening George Ohnstein, president of the Truthseeker’s Society and an avowed agnostic,

137. "Sunday’s Choir," Cincinnati Post, March 5, 1921, 1.
139. Cincinnati Post, April 14, 1921, 12. This is the only such Sunday-endorsed product noticed in this study of the Ohio campaigns.
141. "Sunday 'Loving,'" Cincinnati Post, March 11, 1921, 1.
hit the trail, stating later that he did it to follow the truth, but
was actually more of a spectator than a convert. 142 By the third week
of the meetings, the Post printed public comments about Sunday. In
these he was criticised for always asking for things in prayers, for
supposedly being too pro-Republican and too critical of former President
Wilson in his sermons, and for his use of the slang "darn" and "darned"
which, as substitutes for actual swear words, were said to be degrading
to the language of the youth. 143 During the fourth week, 200 to 500
working girls were given daily lunches for ten cents at the Church of
the Covenant, along with a short message by one of the Sunday team.
By the end of that week, offerings totaled $10,003 and, with expenses
well in hand, collections for this purpose were stopped. 145 Although
the former children's meeting and men only and women only services
were still in use during this campaign, the former color, enthusiasm
and number of delegations had obviously declined. The Post gave no
attention whatever to delegations which, years before, had been headline
news at other cities. However, if old practices were waning, some new
ones were waxing. One such development was that of the 2,000 voice
choir recording several songs on four records in mid-April. 146

142. "For and Against," Cincinnati Post, March 18, 1921, 2.
143. "What Post Readers Think of Billy Sunday," Cincinnati
Post, March 23, 1921, 2.
144. "Girls Hear Sunday Aide and Get Luncheon For Dime,"
Cincinnati Post, March 28, 1921, 2.
145. "Sunday Is 'Over,'" Cincinnati Post, April 4, 1921.
146. "Hymns 'Canned,'" Cincinnati Post, April 19, 1921, 2.
By the eighth week, Sunday had proven both his stamina and his ability to draw ever increasing audiences. One report said, "The tabernacle is crowded as never before. The platform is so jammed that even the reporters are crowded out of their accustomed places."

"Religion has never been such an attraction in Cincinnati." 147 It was during this last week that the sponsoring Citizens' Revival Committee began personal solicitation of businessmen in hopes of raising $35,000 for the evangelist. 148 As an inducement for folks to write checks for the offering for him, Sunday, by this time, had produced checks with his picture on them to be passed out at the tabernacle. 149 Beyond this, the Revival Committee, headed by R. A. Colter, released a four paragraph appeal to the press for an impressive offering for the evangelist and included an address to which mail-in offerings should be sent. 150

Such overt solicitation had not been seen before in the Ohio campaigns. That it was effective, however, could not have been questioned as Sunday left Cincinnati with a check for $30,562.50, and gifts still coming in. This was the largest amount contributed by any Ohio city, but in the matter of converts, it fell short of the Columbus total. Between 14,000 and 15,000 trail hittlers were recorded here while Columbus had boasted just over 18,000 in only seven weeks. 151 Not nearly so

---

149. "Sunday Checks Are to be Souvenirs," Cincinnati Post, April 29, 1921, 2.
150. "Revival Committee Makes Appeal," Cincinnati Post, April 30, 1921, 2.
much display was made of the number of converts in Cincinnati as had been the practice in the earlier revivals, but undoubtedly Sunday felt amply rewarded for his 104 sermons. Some felt that part of the keen edge of Sunday's messages, or at least a measure of his ability to move great numbers down the sawdust trail, had been dulled by the recent passage of the Prohibition Amendment. Approximately 40,000 attended the four services on the last day, and 2,200 of that number hit the trail. The total audience for the eight weeks came to between 500,000 and 750,000.\textsuperscript{152} After his departure, a meeting of the Methodist Ministers' Association agreed unanimously that Sunday's campaign "was a religious boon to Cincinnati and that the ultimate results depend upon 'follow up' activity."\textsuperscript{153} No display was made in the newspaper as to the reception of new church members after the revival, as had been the custom in previous ones, but Miss Bennett, a member of the Sunday party, remained for some time to give guidance to the newly organized Bible classes, and a men's Billy Sunday club was also undertaken to perpetuate the revival efforts. Rev. David McKinney, vice-chairman of the Citizens' Revival Committee, added his final benediction that "Sunday more than fulfilled all our hopes."\textsuperscript{154}

Dayton

(October 29 to December 17, 1922)

A year and a half after the Cincinnati campaign, Sunday began

\textsuperscript{152} "Sunday Is Showered by Checks and Coin By Enthusiasts," The Cincinnati Enquirer, May 2, 1921, 6.
\textsuperscript{153} "Sunday Is Boon," Cincinnati Post, May 2, 1921, 2.
\textsuperscript{154} "Sunday Survey," Cincinnati Post, May 2, 1921, 2.
his seven-week crusade in Dayton. For this revival he had the aid of Mrs. Sunday, Mrs. William Asher, Miss Kinney, Fred Rapp, Albert Peterson, Homer Rodeheaver, and Robert Matthews, the last as his private secretary and pianist. 155 Upon his arrival, Billy was greeted by a large and enthusiastic crowd headed by a welcoming committee composed of Mayor Frank B. Hale, Rev. E. L. Shuey, president of the Dayton Council of Churches, and Rev. F. A. Shults, president of the Dayton Ministerial Association. 156 The tabernacle in Conservatory Park was built to seat 7,000. Both a parking lot for automobiles, at 25¢ each and maintained by a Sunday school class, and a nursery for small children were provided near the building. 157 Twenty thousand people came out to the first three services on Sunday and heard Billy score the proposed wet amendment. This theme made the Monday headlines as one newspaper devoted nearly three pages to the evangelist’s sermons. 158 Soon a huge advertisement for Bibles was being used to capitalize on Sunday’s work. 159 Thursday morning, November 2, Sunday took time to speak to War Veterans at the National Military Home. 160 Other members of the staff were busy with union prayer services and local club meetings. 161 By the third night after the appeal for converts,

157. See both "Salient Points In Sunday Meeting," The Dayton Journal, October 29, 1922, 8; and "These Pictures Show You How Tabernacle Looks," The Dayton Journal, October 31, 1922, 7.
159. See The Dayton Journal, November 8, 1922, 3.
160. "War Veterans To Hear Sunday," The Dayton Journal, November 2, 1922, 1.
161. "22 Meetings To be Held in All Parts of the City," The Dayton Journal, November 3, 1922, 4.
Sunday had shaken the hands of 590 trail hitters, and by November 12, another 850 were added to the group. Six hundred and twenty-five of this last number were men from the Sunday afternoon all men service. As the third week got under way, the program of community evangelism had expanded to include businesswomen's meetings, shop meetings, and school services, as well as the regular ones in the tabernacle. Attendance was consistently good, with some nights, such as November 21, with 9,000, showing exceptional interest. Only mild publicity was given during the campaign to special delegations, which included the Odd Fellows and Rebekah Lodges and a group from Troy on November 23. By that same evening, the offering brought the total receipts to an amount exceeding the expenses, thereby erasing the revival debt. One week before the close of the meetings, on Sunday, December 10, envelopes and checks were distributed at the tabernacle to prepare folks for the next Sunday thank offering for Billy. This allowed the collection of offerings at any time during the last week, although formally, they were taken only the last Sunday. When the Sunday party

167. "Collections for Billy Sunday to be Accepted Now," The Dayton Journal, December 11, 1922, 1.
left on December 18, the evangelist was given a check in the amount of $18,651.32 for his seven weeks of work. In the four services held on the last day, about 31,000 managed to hear the sermons, and 1,033 were converted.168 The lack of emphasis upon the number of converts could be seen in the fact that one newspaper did not even mention the grand total, although another set it at 19,306.169 With the close of the revival came the laconic appraisal, "It will be of lasting value," from J. H. Jewett, chairman of the Sunday Campaign Committee which had been the sponsoring agency.

East Liverpool

(November 4 to December 16, 1928)

Sunday's second extended absence from Ohio occurred in the six years which separated the Dayton and the second East Liverpool revivals. The reasons for his return to East Liverpool and to none of the other early revival cities in Ohio may rest upon the outstanding response, for its size, which he received there in 1912, or on the lack of invitations for repeated meetings in the other towns. In any case, he was wholeheartedly welcomed back to East Liverpool. Billy reached his sixty-fifth year while here. A new tabernacle was constructed upon the very site at Second and Washington Streets, where the former one

had stood. On the opening Sunday, 12,000 to 13,000 were present to hear the three sermons. There was, however, a noticeable change in the target of the vehement attack of the evangelist from earlier days. Instead of assailing sins per se, he was now personifying sins, mal-practices, or organizations in terms of those whom he asserted were promoting them. He came to East Liverpool just having spent two weeks in "... political barnstorming in five states ..." Thus, Sunday, November 4, found him attacking Governor "Al" Smith as he "appealed to his hearers to 'forget party lines' and support Herbert Hoover ... ."

The title of his evening sermon, "Crooks, Corkscrews, Bootleggers, and Wet Politicians – They Shall Not Pass Even to the White House," showed Sunday as eager to protect the 18th Amendment as he had been earlier in promoting victorious dry elections. The political and anti-liquor leanings of his message had not fundamentally changed. The local East Liverpool Review also noted "... his body as agile as it was two decades ago and his mental alert on a parity with the best of his past standards ... ." 172

With this campaign came a partial return of the delegation, band, and generally enthusiastic approach to the services, possibly indicating that the spirit of the towns, rather than some inherent quality of the Sunday party or revival, at least partially controlled

this aspect of the crusades. At any rate, the songs, yells, and band of the local high school students rang within the tabernacle on November 9 and December 6, and 200 youth hit the trail on the latter date. 173 Besides this, denomination nights were held during the second week to bolster the delegation aspect. 174 For the only time noted during his Ohio efforts, Sunday was forced to be absent from the tabernacle because of illness. A victim of the flu, he did not preach at all on Friday, December 14, two days before the close of the meetings. Charles "Dutch" Zellers, district superintendent of the Anti-Saloon League of Ohio, gave a short address in Billy's absence that evening. 175 In bringing the revival to a successful close, Sunday had the assistance of his staff which included Rodeheaver, Peterson, Matthews, Willis Locke, now custodian, and Florence Kinney. 176 Yet, as the statistics showed, the evangelist's final offering was only $6,321.88 as compared to over $12,000 in 1912; and the 6,444 converts a decade before loomed very large before the 1922 estimate "that more than 1,000 persons 'hit the sawdust trail.'" 177 There could be little doubt that the era of great revivalistic appeal had passed its summit.

Elyria
(January 13 to February 24, 1929)

Sunday's last extended series of services in Ohio was his six-
week stay in Elyria in 1929. Unlike some of the spectacular and widely
acclaimed Sunday appearances in Ohio, the Elyria campaign was a much
subdued event with the support of only seven churches. However, the
force and effects of Sunday's pungent character and message should
not be underestimated, even at this late stage of his career. Sunday's
own view as to the noticeable lull which had set in following his
early 1920 revivals and the current setting, was that "The pendulum
is swinging back from the post-war blight on religious interest, to
a period of intense interest in things religious." The tabernacle,
at West and Sixth Streets, seated about 4,500, and was dedicated in
a service at which the vice president of Muskingum College, Dr. Hugh
A. Kelly, delivered the main address. Once the meetings were under
way, Sunday evidenced his continually uncompromising position on the
infallibility of the scriptures as he wittily said, "I never contradict
the Bible; why, if the Bible said that Jonah had swallowed the whale,
I would expect to see Jonah with his waist-band let out." Whether

178. "Tabernacle Dedication Services This Evening," The Elyria
Chronicle-Telegram, January 3, 1929, 1. The churches sponsoring the
campaign were the Methodist, Church of Christ, United Presbyterian,
Baptist, Second Congregational, Evangelical and Pilgrim Community.
179. "Billy Sunday and Wife Arrive," The Elyria Chronicle-
Telegram, January 12, 1929, 1.
180. "Story of Jonah Basis for Fiery Sermon By Sunday," The
Elyria Chronicle-Telegram, January 17, 1929, 1.
such outbursts were still palatable to his audiences is uncertain, but the attendance at Elyria grew as the revival went on. On the second Sunday, over 12,000 came to hear the famous evangelist. Part of what he told them was that if offerings the next week did not bring the total to the equal of current expenses, the revival would be shortened from six to five weeks. He affirmed that in thirty years of preaching he had never failed to meet expenses and did not intend to set a precedent at Elyria. Over thirty cottage prayer services, plus a union meeting was scheduled for Friday morning, January 18, as a typical effort to add to the revival spirit. 181

Regardless of other circumstances, there were notable events during the campaign. With over 4,000 present, including delegations from nearby Medina, and two local churches, Sunday gave his first call for converts on January 23, with 1544 responding. 182 On January 25, a highlight, reminiscent of earlier days, occurred as hundreds of students from Elyria High School, accompanied by their band which played on the platform, attended the evening service, giving their school yells and cheers. 183 On the third Sunday, Mayor Hewitt of Elyria, was on hand to welcome all out-of-town delegations. Two thousand went forward to

181. "Prayer Meetings For Friday Morning at Ten O'Clock," The Elyria Chronicle-Telegram, January 17, 1929, 2.
rededicate themselves to Christian service in the morning service that day, and 5,000 crowded inside the tabernacle to hear Billy in the evening. 184 Behind such joyous scenes, however, there seems to have been considerable opposition to the campaign. On February 10, Sunday openly stated that there was more opposition in Elyria than in any other city during his ministry. He said, "The devil has a lot of tricks, and it looks as though he has used them all in Elyria." 185 Though the crowds were not overflowing, they remained steadily near 4,000, many coming from out of town. Delegations from Cleveland and Toledo were present as 5,000 attended at the tabernacle on February 19. 186 Outside engagements played an increased role during this revival, as Sunday traveled to not only Cleveland, but also to Lorain, Ashland, Wellington, and even as far as Erie, Pennsylvania to hold special services. 187 At the Cleveland meeting, Sunday spoke to 1,200 at a Chamber of Commerce luncheon in Hotel Winton. His topic was vice, political corruption and sin in general, which he said he had noted in Cleveland newspaper accounts. 188

187. "9,109,41 I Given to Sunday For Efforts Here," The Elyria Chronicle-Telegram, February 25, 1929, 1.
188. "Fiery Evangelist Often Battled Devil In Ohio," Cleveland Plain Dealer, November 7, 1935, 1. Sunday also spoke in Cleveland on two other occasions, but refused an offer to hold a revival there in 1915 because of the lack of unanimous ministerial support. One of his appearances, February 23, 1926, was before 15,000 in Public Hall. The other was in October, 1930, at the Euclid Baptist Church, where
As the Elyria meetings closed, Sunday was rewarded with $9,109.41 for his eighty-two messages. An aggregate total of 250,000 had visited the tabernacle and 3,500 of that number had confessed Christ by shaking Sunday's hand.\(^{189}\) Sunday's thundering attacks upon sin would not be heard again in the Buckeye State, except in occasional services held in various cities, the last of which was in Columbus, July 8, 1935, as the next to the last engagement before his death.\(^{190}\)

\(^{189}\) "$9,109.41 Given To Sunday For Efforts Here," The Elyria Chronicle-Telegram, February 25, 1929, 1.

\(^{190}\) "Billy Sunday Fought Devil, Saved 18,333 Here In 1911," The Columbus Citizen, November 7, 1935, 2. Also see Ellis, op. cit., 519.
Chapter III
Preparations For The Columbus Campaign

For nearly two years after Sunday's January 30, 1911, one-day appearance at Columbus at the Anti-Saloon League convention, attempts were made to bring him back for an extended revival. It was easily comprehensible that such a campaign in the capital city of one of the most politically important states in the nation would have particular significance. Sunday's acceptance of the invitation, and thereby the challenge, of this, the initial metropolis in which he was to be heard, and his ultimate success there was a turning point in his career. He could then, with greater confidence go on to the largest cities of the nation in the following decade.

To handle the involved arrangements for the coming meeting the Columbus Evangelistic Association, with headquarters in the Railway Y.M.C.A. on Goodale Street, was formed. The following were members of this association in the indicated capacities:

Rev. John H. Day, pastor of the First Presbyterian Church, president.
Judge David F. Pugh and R. C. Wilkin, vice presidents;
Z. C. White, treasurer.
E. Dow Bancroft, secretary of the Railway Y.M.C.A.,
Secretary.
Rev. Alfred R. Isaac, pastor of the Tenth Avenue Baptist Church, chairman of cottage prayer meeting committee.
Dr. C. S. Means, chairman of lodging and transportation committee.
Rev. Homer Alexander, chairman of music committee.
Rev. J. J. Tisdall, pastor of the Wilson Avenue Church of Christ, chairman of publicity committee.
Rev. T. H. Campbell, pastor of the King Avenue Methodist Episcopal Church, chairman of tabernacle committee.
Colonel Worthington Kautzman, head usher.  
Mrs. James Nesbitt, chairman of nursery committee.  
W. F. Taylor, chairman of chairs and decoration committee.  
General Committee composed of three laymen from each participating church.  

This group, along with the Sunday party, demonstrated the massive organizational structure so strategic to the success of Sunday's large city revivals. Throughout the seven weeks of meetings and for weeks preceding, their names were interwoven with the accounts of its proceedings. Even as early as December 12, Dr. Means had been house hunting for a suitable place for the Sunday staff to stay. Billy preferred a furnished house, but none to fit the purpose was located.  

Finally ten rooms in the Dennison Hotel at Dennison and Buttles Avenues were secured and became Sunday's headquarters while in town.  

One of the largest tasks before the opening of the campaign was the erection of the 10,000 seat tabernacle. As early as November 17, sixty-three men, many of them clergymen, stood "on the piles of lumber on the site of the Billy Sunday tabernacle, . . . sang hymns and prayed for the success of the local Sunday campaign."

1. "Sunday Is Cause Of Arguments In All Of Columbus," Columbus Dispatch, December 15, 1912, 2.  
Actual construction was begun on Tuesday, December 3, under the direction of Sunday's own architect and building engineer, Joseph H. Spiece. By this time, fifty-five churches had decided to support the revival and consequently, among the 100 on hand to help were many pastors and laymen besides "13 union carpenters." Three days later, with fifty experienced carpenters and forty-five ministers on the job, the exterior of the tabernacle was virtually completed. As the building neared completion, places were provided to seat between 10,000 and 12,000, while another thousand could easily stand inside. The choir stage alone would accommodate almost 2,000. Several strings of lights were placed in front of the building not only to light the way, but to attract attention as Spiece said "I'll make it look as attractive in the front as a nickleodeon if I can." Inside, about three miles of wiring was used to make effective 600 incandescent lights "the equivalent [in candle-power] of more than eighty of the cluster light standards that are used to illuminate the central part of the city." To heat the vast structure, fourteen furnaces were installed. Twenty-one six-foot-wide doors provided entrance and

exit facilities on three sides of the building. Two hundred wooden supporting posts provided objects to decorate with part of the 6,000 yards of red, white and blue bunting with which the tabernacle was finally decked. The Decoration Committee, after repeated appeals for volunteer help, completed the task, including a huge "Columbus For Christ" banner over the center of the platform and several smaller ones along its sides. Sunday's platform here was set eight feet from the choir loft and was twenty feet long and eight feet wide, twice the size of any of his previous ones. A report said it would "be covered with Brussels carpet and in front will be draped with red, white and blue bunting drawn in rosettes." Nor was a most important aspect of the tabernacle furnishings neglected as "sawdust by the wagonload has been hauled to the tabernacle and thrown on the ground and in the aisles." Since Sunday spoke unaided by the later modern loudspeakers, the testimony that the tabernacle "... acoustic properties are splendid, permitting those who sit in the farthest corners of the building to hear splendidly . . .," set forth a paramount consideration.

Thought was also given to those who would become faint or ill as the throngs assaulted the building and, therefore, a room equipped with

cots and a nurse was provided below the choir stage to accommodate them. A nursery to care for babies was set up in the Railway Y.M.C.A. since, as one of the Sunday party put it, "If there’s anything that grates on Billy’s nerves while he’s preaching it’s a squawking babe." The tabernacle itself was divided into 150 sections to provide better reservation markings for delegations and to facilitate the taking of the offering and seating of the audience by the 150 ushers which were present at nearly every service. Two hundred and fifty ushers in all were recruited.

All of these preparations, however, did not progress without complications. After several days’ work on the tabernacle, architect Speice received a two and one half inch gash on his head by a timber dropped from the building. A doctor reported that the blow could have resulted in death had it been more direct. But Speice remained at his post and was even struck on the shoulder by another board the same day. More serious to the opening of the revival was a charge by Columbus Fire Chief Charles J. Lauer "... that the tabernacle is a dangerous fire trap." Columbus Evangelistic Association chairman, Rev. Day, answered that the charge was "grossly misleading" and that "A number of the committee had tried for experiment to start a fire in the sawdust which covers the ground in the tabernacle and that had found it

15. "Babies Barred From Sunday’s Tabernacle; Ladies Hats Off! Billy Quick To Bawl You Out," The Columbus Citizen, December 19, 1912, 2.
15. "Maze Of Bunting, Flags And Banners To Greet Crowds At Sunday’s Tabernacle," The Columbus Citizen, December 2, 1912, 1.
difficult for the reason that the sawdust would not burn." Further, he asserted that the tabernacle "... can be emptied in a remarkably short time by the numerous exits."18 City building inspector, A. Joseph Dauben, and state inspector of factories and workshops, Thomas P. Kearns, looked at the structure and gave their tentative approval as long as it violated no building regulations. Oddly enough, the same question as to whether an evangelistic tabernacle came under the general legal heading of "assembly hall" was at that time put before State Attorney General Hogan, by Cleveland City Solicitor, E. K. Wilcox. According to the state building code, all assembly halls seating over 1000 had to be fireproof, but churches were exempt. Therefore Hogan's decision in the Cleveland case would apply as well to Sunday's Columbus building which was definitely not fireproof. The fate of the opening of the meetings rested in the balance until Hogan's December 23 decision that the Cleveland tabernacle "... was erected solely as a place of worship."19 The Evangelistic Association could breathe a sigh of relief.

A more transient controversy arose as the Columbus Federation of Labor passed a resolution on December 23 branding the revival as "unfair" for hiring non-union electrical firms and non-union sheet metal workers for the tabernacle construction. The Federation also ousted the

carpenter's organization for remaining on the job, refusing to obey an order to strike when the non-union electrical workers arrived. The unions had objected initially when volunteer labor was used, but Speice agreed that all employed labor would be union men. To reconcile this promise with the later hiring of non-union workers Speice stated that the furnace and electrical work had been contracted with firms which were then responsible for sending the non-union workers. The whole question was finally smothered by the onrush of the revival fervor and heard of no more in the press.

As advance representative in Columbus, Rev. Peacock, arriving about a month before the revival opened, made numerous appearances to generate interest in, and support for, the revival. His itinerary for Thursday December 5 alone called for a meeting with the executive committee of the Columbus Evangelistic Association, a luncheon with business men at the Railroad Y.M.C.A., and an evening meeting with all of the pastors of the cooperating churches and the Central Y.M.C.A. executive committee. He said "... that he was not 'knocking' local ministers not supporting Sunday and declared that neither himself nor Sunday held any grudge against ministers who held views different from their own." But this did not impede him in the least when asserting, "None of the dirty dogs ... who slander Sunday, can get a thing on

him ..." and further to the ministers, "If you have a yellow streak, it will show up in three days."22 Speaking in the Mayflower Congregational Church, on December 4, he scathingly charged that those fighting Sunday "... belong to the Damnable element which includes brewers, distillers, saloonkeeper, bartenders, thieves, liars, and penitentiary convicts," which left little room for dissenting clergy. He also called the Liberal Advocate, a Columbus weekly, the "... dirtiest sheet this side of hell."23

By December 18, the sixty churches which would participate actively in the crusade had been secured.24 These represented fourteen denominations. All of the local Methodist Episcopal Churches except the Reeb Avenue, and all of the Congregational Churches except three (Dr. Washington Gladden's First Congregational, the Eastwood Congregational, and the South Congregational) cooperated. All of the other principal churches in the city were participating, except the Sullivan Avenue Friends Church and those which generally held aloof from all Sunday meetings, the Lutheran, Episcopal and Roman Catholic churches.25 The

24. "Sixty Churches To Co-operate In Sunday Meetings," Columbus Dispatch, December 25, 1912, 3. Several references are made in the newspapers of the sixty one sponsoring churches, but no mention was made as to the last to give its support. The sixty appear, along with their pastors, in Appendix II.
25. Ibid.
sixty sponsoring churches made special efforts to clear their schedules by Christmas in order to leave the entire seven weeks of the revival open. All planned to retain their weekly Sunday School hour, but in some cases this meant the necessity of moving it up one-half hour in order to allow members to attend the 10:30 tabernacle service. 26

From all indications the churches decided whether to give their support to the revival by congregational vote or executive action with only slight coercion on the part of the Evangelical Association.

Prodigious efforts were made to stir latent religious zeal by cottage and union prayer meetings before Sunday arrived. The city was divided into 230 districts, each to have its own prayer meetings. 27

On December 10, nearly three weeks before the revival opened, 110 prayer meetings were held, reporting about 1100 in attendance. 28 By the first day of the revival, seven evenings had been devoted to between 110 and 175 such prayer services. After the campaign began, these were held rather consistently two times a week at 10 A.M. In addition to cottage prayer meetings, large union ones were held in the various sponsoring churches. Such efforts were conducted on the three Wednesday evenings preceding the revival. On December 18, seven churches participated. 29 Although general feeling among the

29. "Church Events Being Rushed To Get Ready For Big Revival," The Columbus Citizen, December 18, 1912, 1.
churches was that special revival emphasis services should be lifted during the busy Christmas week, word came from Sunday that they should not neglect the prayer meetings. Consequently, cottage prayer services were held on two evenings and union ones in seven churches on a third, Christmas night.\textsuperscript{30} There was also a noticeable movement toward unity among the cooperating churches as many of the pastors traded pulpits on December 8, to create a unified revival spirit.\textsuperscript{31} The Sunday before the campaign was launched, a large rally was staged at the Southern Theatre to further prepare the city for Sunday's entrance. At this meeting, attended by about 1,000, L. H. Allison of Dayton, who was a Sunday convert from ten years before in Chicago, gave his testimony, and William R. Kay, who had just been converted in the revival Sunday was ending in McKeesport, Pennsylvania that very day, gave the enthusiastic main address.\textsuperscript{32}

In last minute preparations before the dedication of the tabernacle, Rev. A. E. Isaac, of the Tenth Avenue Baptist Church, donated a discarded pulpit to the cause saying, "It's a good heavy one . . . and I believe it will stand all the knocking which Mr. Sunday wants to give it. I've pounded a little on it myself and I know it will stand the knocks."\textsuperscript{33} A new idea, called a "convert hole," used first at McKeesport, was installed in Sunday's Columbus platform as well. It consisted of a small trapdoor beside the pulpit leading down three steps to a lower

\textsuperscript{30} "7 Prayer Meets For Billy Sunday Christmas Night," The Columbus Citizen, December 24, 1912, 3.
\textsuperscript{31} "About 2300 Prayer Meetings Next Tuesday," The Columbus Citizen, December 7, 1912, 5.
\textsuperscript{32} "Says Sunday Put New Life In City," The Columbus Citizen, December 23, 1912, 7.
\textsuperscript{33} "Dedicate Tabernacle Thursday, Karb And Bassell Welcomers," The Columbus Citizen, December 24, 1912, 7.
level where he could more comfortably sit or stand to shake convert's hands. By special arrangement, the Rail-Light Streetcar Company was gotten to extend its switch on Park Street to permit the storage of cars which would better be able to accommodate the flood of people in later weeks. Tin pans were hung at regular intervals at the end of seat rows in the tabernacle to serve as collection trays and special fire prevention measures were invoked. After a last-minute inspection by Fire Chief Lauer, he ordered four elevated seats to be installed in the building, two on the sides and two in the rear, upon which firemen could sit at each service and keep watch upon the entire auditorium, including the fourteen heating units. The Columbus Citizen commented quizzically that unless these men were dismissed during Sunday's message to women only, in which only Sunday was allowed, "the ears of the four men on duty will burn and their faces will flush as Mr. Sunday preaches. The evangelist admits that he blushes himself at his own words during this meeting." They were, however, dismissed when the service was held. More seriously, by December 22, the Columbus Evangelistic Association had solicited enough local businessmen to raise a $25,000 "guarantee fund" to assure payment of general expenses should any financial deficiencies arise in the

34. "Put 'Convert Hole' in Billy's Stage," The Columbus Citizen, December 26, 1912, 1.
offerings. None of this fund was ultimately needed. The same newspaper account stated that the Evangelistic Association was to pay one-half of the salary of the Sunday party as part of the expenses of the campaign. Individual churches were to continue to receive their own offerings by use of separate envelopes at the tabernacle each Sunday morning. 37

The dedication of the tabernacle was made a gala affair the evening after Christmas. On the program were some of the leading ministers of Columbus. The secretary of the Chamber of Commerce, John Y. Bassell, extended a formal welcome to the Sunday party, as did City Solicitor, Stuart R. Bolin, in the absence of Columbus Mayor George Karb. Karb, who had been scheduled to give a greeting, curiously was "called out of town" that morning, but his intentions were only too obvious. 38

Sunday later commented, "I see Mayor Karb isn't taking any hand in our meetings, well, no matter. Whether he was elected by the whiskey ring or by the drys, I look for him to do the right thing by our meetings." 39

Before the revival closed, Karb had both attended the services and spoken from the platform, as we shall see. The featured speaker at the dedication ceremonies was Rev. Ernest B. Allen, pastor of the Washington Avenue Congregational Church in Toledo. The burden of his message was, therefore, a eulogy of Sunday and an enumeration of

37. "To Win 20,000 Sunday Hopes," The Ohio State Journal, December 22, 1912, 1.
38. "Karb Won't Give Greetings At Tabernacle," The Columbus Citizen, December 26, 1912, 1.
the positive effects of the Toledo crusade. Four thousand were on
hand to witness the initial service in the huge building. 40

With the tabernacle duly consecrated for its seven-week task and
the stage fully set for Sunday's arrival, no publicly announced criticism
of the revival was discernable, except that voiced by the Columbus
Federation of Labor. However, Billy Sunday and his methods were a topic
for widespread conversation and debate. In noting the controversy,
the Columbus Dispatch posed the question as to whether he was "... a
sensationalist who resorts to the tricks of the charlatan to make
money flow from people's pockets and who harangues his audience in the
language of the gutter to gain notoriety?" Or was he "The greatest
modern evangelist who makes his appeal with the power of the apostles
of the Bible..." 41 Rev. John W. Atkinson of the Neil Avenue
Methodist Episcopal Church, who was a pastor in Portsmouth during the
Sunday campaign there, in addressing a meeting of Columbus Methodist
ministers said that 3,500 had joined the churches following that
revival and stated, "I say unhesitatingly that Billy Sunday is either
what he pretends to be or he is the most consummate hypocrite the
world has ever known." "He stands today as the greatest religious
leader in the world," was his estimation. 42 Results from the
McKeesport revival, which immediately preceded that of Columbus, were

40. "Bolin and Bassell Predict Big Things Here For Sunday,"
The Columbus Citizen, December 27, 1912, 5.
41. "Sunday Is Cause Of Arguments In All Of Columbus," Columbus
Dispatch, December 15, 1912, 1.
42. "Says Sunday Is Sincere Or Big Hypocrite," The Columbus
Citizen, November 18, 1912, 2.
given much space in the Columbus newspapers. Comments on Sunday and his work there ranged from "slangy fanatic," "the man's crazy," and "the greatest fakir of the age," to "the greatest moral awakener in our history," "his magnetism is wonderful," and "the good he has done can not be estimated." 43 When interviewed in his Winona Lake home on the eve of his journey to Columbus, Sunday himself had the following to say about the ensuing campaign:

... if half the things they say about me were true Chief Carter of Columbus would be justified in having a squad of bluecoats nab me at the station tomorrow evening and throw me into jail for the balance of my life. Did you ever ask yourself why the forces of evil attack me so viciously? It's my way of fighting sin they don't like. The world's full of well-trained fellows who spar well and do some fancy footwork but who lack the punch that produces the sleeper. If I was [big] of the wishy-washy kind the opposition wouldn't give me a second thought now, would they?

When the people of Columbus have attended our meetings for a while they'll find out that the other side has been fooling 'em and then they'll be sore at themselves for having been such chumps to believe the pernicious statements and the deliberate lies that have been circulated about me.

In Columbus I'll fight sin uncompromisingly whether I find it in the churches or outside of them, but rest assured, I'll never bawl out the individual; even if I know a lot of things about a fellow I'd die before I'd name him and his sins in public.

Columbus is the largest city I've ever accepted a call

to. Other larger cities have wanted me but I've never accepted. ... whether the city is large or small it takes the same amount of steam on my part.

Columbus will come all right, even though the opposition does seem stronger. If the people aren't hankering for religion it'll be the first place I've struck where they wouldn't listen.

— "Sunday Comes late Today," The Columbus Citizen, December 28, 1912, 1.
Chapter IV
Into The Highways And Hedges

By the time of his Columbus campaign, Sunday had gained a wide knowledge of the organizational structure of revivalism from his seventeen year career. Therefore, he had with him in Columbus a sizable staff, not only to serve in the tabernacle, but also to reach the community via all sorts of meetings. Each member of the Sunday party had particular skills which made him a valuable part of the total revival machine. Rev. L. K. Peacock, a United Presbyterian, who joined the Sunday party at the time of the 1911 Springfield revival, acted as general manager and assistant evangelist. Homer A. Rodeheaver, a native of Hocking County, Ohio, who had joined the Sunday party only three years before, was already an indispensable part of the revival personnel. By his genial personality, he endeared himself to audiences everywhere in his role as music director as he asked delegations for their favorite songs and generally made everyone feel welcome in the tabernacle. Rody, as he was affectionately known, was affiliated with the Methodist Episcopal Church. Serving as pianist and Sunday's private secretary at Columbus was B. D. Ackley. A Methodist Protestant, Ackley was one of the more long-term members of the staff. Joseph W. Speice, as we have seen, had the responsibility of erecting the tabernacle. By the time of the Columbus campaign, Fred Seibert had been filling the tabernacle custodian position on the team for several years. W. Henry Collison, who had come to Sunday's staff only in the fall of 1912, came with him to Columbus as a soloist. The women,
who were of considerable assistance in the Columbus revival were
Misses Anna McLaren, Frances E. Miller, Grace Saxe, and the indomitable
"Ma" Sunday. Anna McLaren, born in Scotland, had been a soloist for
Sunday for four years. Miss Miller, a member of the group for nine
years, had attended Moody Bible Institute and was an ordained
Congregational minister. Her work was mostly concerned with the
giving of Bible instruction at business women's meetings. Grace Saxe
was also a Bible teacher, much of her effort going into the 3 P.M.
mass Bible classes in the tabernacle. She had been with Sunday for
two years, after a missionary career in Egypt and a term of service
with the Torrey-Alexander evangelistic party in the British Isles.

As the meetings began, Sunday felt more help was needed when Major
Cole, who was to have been one of the assistants, was detained in
Chicago. We finally secured the services of Rev. and Mrs. William
Asher who had previously traveled with evangelist Dr. Chapman for
seven years. By February 6, "Uncle Jimmie" Johnson, a familiar assistant
evangelist to Sunday from Philadelphia, arrived to help with the factory
meetings. In the closing days of the revival, Major Cole, the
Chicago evangelist, finally arrived to lend his assistance. When fully
assembled, the group amounted to the largest team which Sunday had
ever used.

This highly efficient staff set a staggering pace in activities

---

1. "Party Belongs To Six Churches," The Columbus Citizen, January 4, 1913, 15. See also The Columbus Citizen, January 30, 1913, passim.
2. "Urges Railroad Men To Accept God For Their Boss," The Columbus Citizen, February 6, 1913, 2.
to reach the churched and unchurched of Columbus, wherever they were to be found. By January 18, during the third week of the revival, a report stated that, in addition to thirty-seven regular tabernacle services, thirty-nine factory meetings and ten business women's rallies as well as numerous high school Bible classes and union prayer meetings had been held. The total number of services held outside the tabernacle to that date was calculated at sixty-three. The day before the campaign closed, another summary noted a total of twelve special women's services held by members of the Sunday party in churches throughout the city. It added to this eleven meetings at the Ohio Penitentiary and nineteen business women's rallies but declined to estimate the exact number of shop, high school, union prayer, morning cottage, and society and women's club meetings, which were innumerable.

The ladies of the party devoted most of their efforts to the services for business women, including all types of downtown working girls. By December 31, a new committee, in charge of revival work among these business women, was formed as part of the Columbus Evangelistic Association. The services for business women were held several days each week at the Wesley Chapel where the girls were given

---

3. "Sunday Campaign in Brief to Date," The Columbus Citizen, January 18, 1913, p. 3. For an account of one week of the Sunday party itinerary see Appendix III.
free lunches by various Ladies' Aid societies and short Bible discourses by women of the Sunday party. The ultimate purpose of these meetings was to organize permanent Bible classes. This was accomplished after the close of the revival as three classes were formed - the Central, to meet Tuesday at Wesley Chapel; the North Side to meet at the Third Avenue Methodist Church; and the Late Hour, to meet at the Y.W.C.A. Over 1200 were on hand in late February to organize the Central class, as great interest continued after Sunday had left.

The high point in the revival for these working girls was undoubtedly on January 8, when, after two huge concurrent rallies at the Central Presbyterian Church and at Wesley Chapel, they marched 2,000-strong to the tabernacle for the evening service.

The other major thrust at community evangelism was in the form of factory meetings. These were conducted, usually at the lunch hour, during the entire seven weeks of the revival, and encompassed nearly every shop of any notable size in the city. Response to these meetings was generally extensive, and the unified spirit which they generated became evident at the tabernacle as delegations from the various places of employment came pouring in and took their reserved seats. Out of these factory services and men's meetings at the

---

10. See Appendix III for a partial listing of the factories visited.
tabernacle came the Men's Personal Workers' League which was active both during and after the revival. Other services, held in local schools, brought the large delegations of young people out on Youth Night and, from time to time, on other evenings. The general united effort of the revival by the participating churches was carried on primarily by morning cottage prayer meetings about twice a week and occasional union prayer services, numbering as many as thirteen on one day.

Sunday, himself, carried on many activities in and around Columbus, in addition to his preaching ninety-three times in the tabernacle. Hardly had he arrived in the city, when he demonstrated familiarity with local businessmen and public officials. Although Mayor Karb had obviously avoided appearing at the tabernacle dedication service, when he and Billy met at a reception for Sunday at the Y.M.C.A., a day or two after the campaign opened, they "... grabbed each other's hands, like old friends reunited, ..." Karb said he would attend the revival and added, "This is the best town in the world ... and we want Billy Sunday to have the biggest and best meetings here he has ever held anywhere." During their first week in Columbus, the Sundays visited Mayor Karb in his office, inspected the offices of the local newspapers, and met with officials.

13. "Mayor Says He Intends To Hear 'Billy' Sunday," The Columbus Citizen, January 1, 1913, 5.
of the Ohio Penitentiary. It had been the contention of some in Columbus that the facts that the state legislature would be in session and a new governor would be inaugurated during the Sunday campaign would seriously detract from the revival's effects, but Billy used these as assets rather than liabilities. Upon the invitation of the North Side Chamber of Commerce, he rode in the inaugural parade on January 13, as James M. Cox succeeded Judson Harmon as governor of Ohio. Riding with the Columbus civic and business organizations, Billy was cheered by the crowds as he passed. A report said he stood on the seat of his carriage and bowed to recognize the throng's applause, and when he passed the incoming governor's reviewing stand, shouted, "Hello, Governor," to which Cox nodded and smiled. At the formal dinner that evening, held at the Ohio Club, in honor of the new governor, Sunday asked the blessing upon the meal. Later, at the reception at the State House, Billy shook hands with Cox, congratulated him on his new office and possibly invited him to the revival. That he would not attend the Inaugural Ball was previously settled by a statement at the tabernacle that he would "like to see the inauguration of some governor or president that

17. "Cox Shook Over 10,000 Hands During Inaugural Functions," The Columbus Citizen, January 14, 1913, 9.
can take office without an inaugural ball . . . ." Nevertheless, he had gotten an inestimable amount of advertisement for himself and the Columbus revival by making himself a conspicuous part of such a momentous occasion in the political life of Ohio.

A statement by Billy that, "I'd like to see Ohio's new administration start with prayer" and further volunteering his services, won him the opportunity. As the legislature assumed its duties on January 15, Sunday was there to give the invocation. Thirteen members of the House of Representatives from Cuyahoga County refused to take their seats until after Sunday had finished, but later were said to have apologized, saying that in Cleveland some evangelists had attacked public officers and that they had supposed Billy would do the same. By his close association with the inauguration of Governor Cox and his appearance before the initial session of the legislature, Sunday apparently erased whatever obstacles these two events might have presented to the success of the revival. He had inadvertently linked the revival, which he characterized, with the prevailing business, civic, and political sentiment.

The same day that he prayed before the Ohio House of Representatives, he spoke at the Ohio Penitentiary, as became his weekly practice, lunched with and addressed 150 prominent businessmen at the Ohio Club,

---

19. Ibid.
and spoke at afternoon and evening audiences at the tabernacle.

His earlier intimation of fatigue at a January 2 speaking engagement at the Broad Street Presbyterian Church did not seem to have affected his later heavy schedule. On February 7, he was in the office of Governor Cox, inviting him to the revival. A promise gotten at that time was fulfilled when Cox attended the tabernacle meeting on Saturday evening, February 15. The audience stood and greeted the governor with the strains of "America" as he arrived.

Although Sunday was reputed to be one reaching the unchurched lower class, he conducted a conspicuous endeavor to reach the upper class as well. In most cases this meant that he had to go to the homes where elite society people would gather, for most of these people would never come to the humble, wooden tabernacle. In Columbus, this ministry to the well-to-do reached large proportions. On January 9, Billy met with an estimated two hundred club and society women in the home of Mrs. Thomas E. Powell. He advised them in well-organized and grammatically correct sentences— which he could employ, when needed,

22. "Sunday Prays He Won't Break Down in Revival Here," The Columbus Citizen, January 2, 1913, 1. There he prayed in part... our voice is hoarse, we feel the strain of this campaign after having held only three days of services, our health is not the best, and we pray to Thee for more strength with which to battle down the forces of sin and hell in Columbus.
as well as the familiar slang of the tabernacle sermons - that they
must do God’s will to reach heaven, not just be familiar with good
etiquette and the arts. 25 Probably the largest of these meetings
was one for Ohio State University faculty wives, ladies of the
executive synodical committee of the local presbytery, and members
of the College Club, held in the home of Mrs. William Oxley Thompson,
wife of the Ohio State University president. Two hundred and fifty
were reported there on January 29. 26 However, in a women’s meeting
at the First Presbyterian Church on February 11, 700 heard Sunday’s
rebuke for their failure to attend the tabernacle meetings. 27 On
another occasion, what seems to have been a mixed group of about 200
met at the home of Judge Duncan for a private session with the
evangelist, where a "carpet trail" evidently appealed more than the
"sawdust trail" of the tabernacle. 28 Other members of the Sunday
party also took part in bi-weekly meetings with society girls in this
total effort. 29

Sunday also busied himself with local shop appearances when he
could spare the time. At one of these, at the Panhandle shops of the

25. "Billy Advises Society Women to Save Souls," The Columbus
Citizen, January 9, 1913, 3.
Citizen, January 30, 1913, 1.
27. "Scores Women For Not Aiding Revival," The Columbus
Citizen, February 11, 1913, 1.
28. "Urges Railroad Men to Choose God for Their Boss," The
Columbus Citizen, February 6, 1913, 1.
29. "Sunday Worker Moves Society Girls to Tears," The Columbus
Citizen, January 17, 1913, 1.
Pennsylvania Railroad, he told 1,500 employees that "God wants men who will work, not loafers ...." A newspaper also noted that "Efficiency in service was one of the points Sunday emphasized."30 Such timely admonition, though, undoubtedly added to the suspicion of some that more efficiency among the workers was the chief purpose for the employer's sponsoring such a rally.

Racial questions were interestingly evident during the Sunday revival. Just before it opened, the chairman of the Evangelistic Association, Rev. Mr. Day, was reported as having said that the Negroes of the city should hold their own revival and as having offered $300 of the Association's funds towards such a campaign. Before his arrival, however, Sunday had vetoed such action, saying that colored folks would be accepted on an equal basis with whites at the main tabernacle.31 Curiously enough, though, colored men were segregated into a section to themselves when arriving at the tabernacle among a delegation of 3,800 men from the Jeffrey Manufacturing Company on January 30.32 Even more significantly, whether due to a feeling of racial discrimination at the tabernacle or a desire to have the famous evangelist to themselves, Columbus Negroes invited Sunday to address a late evening colored meeting at the Second Baptist Church on Friday,

30. "Urges Railroad Man to Choose God for Their Boss," The Columbus Citizen, February 6, 1913, 1.
31. "Billy Sunday Here Today; Chorus 1,700," The Ohio State Journal, December 28, 1912, 1.
February 7. After having spoken to 10,000 at the regular service that evening, Billy rushed to his hotel, had a rub down, changed his clothes and proceeded to the colored church where over 1,000 had awaited his arrival since 6:30 P.M. In what was the most emotionally charged meeting of his seven-week stay in Columbus, Sunday preached from 10:30 to midnight. "Sunday's audience whooped with delight at his mimicry of a crapshooter when he rolled a set of imaginary 'bones,' snapped his fingers, [and] mumbled 'seben-come-leben,'" reported the Columbus Citizen. Billy said, "Folks, I'm glad I came here this evening. I believe I've got new religion myself tonight." Shouts of "Amen" and "Hallelujah" greeted this statement, as the evangelist balanced himself on the railing of the rostrum. Seventy-nine "hit the trail," as Sunday's ability to reach all sectors of society successfully was further demonstrated. 33

Much of the expected significance and enthusiasm of the Sunday School Parade in Columbus was cancelled as the day set for the event, February 1, dawned bitterly cold with "... a biting northwest wind." The estimated 8,000 which did brave the zero weather to march from the State House to the tabernacle for the Saturday afternoon service were nearly frozen upon arrival. Although he had been conspicuously present in the inaugural parade, Sunday - and all of his staff - remained in the warm shelter of the Dennison Hotel during the Sunday School

Parade. The reason for this, Billy explained, was his exhaustion from the three Friday services and a slight cold. The parade itself was led by Chief of Police Carter on a white horse and T. R. Davison on a brown mount. Fifteen policemen, Chief Marshall J. C. Speaks and his staff, a band furnished by the Columbus Federation of Musicians, the Old Guard drum corp and representatives from the Sunday schools of the participating churches, followed. Banners and American flags were flown en route, but "Most of the instruments were frozen with the cold and the band made no attempt to play during the parade." 34

Sunday kept two important out-of-town engagements during the revival in Columbus. The first of these was at Marysville on Tuesday, February 4. The purpose of this mission was to address a rally in the largest improvised auditorium available, in the Wildi Evaporated Milk Company building, but upon the action of Mayor McIntire, the day was declared a holiday. Business came to a standstill; schools, offices, and factories closed; and nearly the whole town resorted to the railway station to greet their famous guest as factory whistles blew, fire and school bells rang, and the Marysville brass band provided the music. American flags were waved as Billy arrived, as though he were a statesman rather than an evangelist. Even Company E of the State Militia was mustered out in parade dress for the affair. After speaking to about 3,000 at the Wildi plant, Sunday was escorted back to Columbus on a special train amid such company as Police Chief Carter, Assistant

34. "Thousands In Sunday Parade Despite Cold," The Columbus Citizen, February 1, 1913, 1.
secretary of the Columbus Chamber of Commerce, F. H. Hysell, state
dairy and food commissioner, S. E. Strode, and Professor Oscar Erf of
Ohio State University. 35 His success in stirring towns to the utmost
and of assembling about him some of the most prominent citizens where
he held meetings during his most popular years must remain unquestioned.

The other such meeting was that held in Gray Chapel on the campus
of the Ohio Wesleyan University at Delaware, the morning of February 12.
At that service, Sunday spoke to approximately 1,800 students. Since
this was the Alma Mater of Homer Rodeheaver, he was greeted with special
enthusiasm on this occasion. 36 The Ohio Wesleyan appearance compares
with those held locally by Sunday and other members of the party at the
Ohio State University. These were principally two in number. The
first, to 2,000 students in the Ohio State University gymnasium, was
in the afternoon of one of Sunday's most taxing days, when he spoke
to 37,000 people at four services, January 31. 37 The second, Friday
afternoon, February 14, brought forth eighty-five converts, among
whom were Roger Steffan, editor of the Ohio State Lantern, and Forrest
King, president of the freshman class, according to a local news
release. 38 The general popularity of the revival was evidenced by

35. "Marysville Surrenders Town to Billy," The Columbus Citizen,
February 5, 1913, 1.
36. "Expect Record Crowd to Hear Sunday Tonight, Talks at O.W.U.,”
The Columbus Citizen, February 12, 1913, 1.
37. "Sunday's Record Revival Day," The Columbus Citizen,
February 1, 1913, 5.
38. "Sunday Will Smash all Revival Records In Whirlwind Close,"
The Columbus Citizen, February 15, 1913, 1, 2.
the huge university student delegations which were often present at
the tabernacle.

As has been shown, the effort and influence of the revival
extended considerably beyond the confines of the tabernacle, itself,
but it now remains to investigate the central focus of activity inside
that arena as well.
Chapter V

Inside The Tabernacle

The magnitude of the extra-tabernacle meetings was eclipsed only by the efforts within the structure itself. Most of the first day records established in Sunday's previous revivals were felled in his three initial services in Columbus. Thirty thousand was the calculated attendance on the opening day, December 29. Ushers reported that 1,000 were turned away at the morning service and 3,000 at the evening meeting. "No religious gathering of any sort in the city of Columbus has been so well organized, so fully articulate," was one comment, adding that these were the largest groups ever to gather under one roof in Columbus. If the first day exceeded previous attendance records, its meager $1,342.20 offering was only about one-half of that received on Sunday's first day at Toledo. This relative meagerness of the offerings was apparent for some weeks and brought pungent remarks from the evangelist at times. Although Billy would not give his first call for converts until January 10, Luther Sykes went forward after the afternoon service, took Sunday's hand, and said "I surrender," thereby becoming the first convert of the revival. The evangelist did not wait to explode his customary oratorical bombs, but "... cut loose with his characteristic slang expressions ..." the first day.

1. "Billy Sunday Opens Bombardment of Sin Before 30,000 People," The Columbus Citizen, December 30, 1912, l.
2. "Billy Sunday Preaches to 3 Great Crowds," The Ohio State Journal, December 30, 1912, l.
Gesticulating, standing upon the chair on his lofty platform, marching back and forth, waving both arms, clapping his hands, and balancing himself on one toe as he hung over the edge of his platform, Billy amazed all who heard him. ... Such antics at a religious meeting and by a preacher of the gospel had seldom been seen in Columbus.  

Losing no time in displaying his beliefs on this opening Sunday, Billy denounced divorce, cigarettes, Unitarians, sinning church members, and the doctrine of the Universal Fatherhood of God and Brotherhood of Man. The last, which he termed "infernal lies" became one of Washington Gladden's chief contentions with the evangelist.  

Before the meetings opened, local newspapers printed "rules" to be enforced in the tabernacle by Sunday's demand. These were primarily to keep all disturbance, especially during the sermon, to a minimum. On the first day, Sunday showed his aversion to noise by saying "Coughing is nine-tenths sympathetic, ... Cut out coughing. Soak your feet over night and you'll be all right."  

Two of Sunday's principal methods for filling the tabernacle, specially designated nights at which services representative delegations were encouraged to attend and special men-only and women-only services, were used profusely in Columbus. The first and most vigorously enthusiastic such evening was Youth Night, January 7. Although it was a rainy evening, delegations from about a dozen educational

---


4. Ibid.


institutions, including Ohio State University, Capital University, Starling-Ohio Medical College, Bliss Business College, and local high schools were present. Abandoning all sober religious worship precedents, and "Amid the applause of those already seated and the waving of vari-colored banners, the delegations marched into the tabernacle . . ." to give their school yells and songs. That day the Columbus Citizen had warned, "Don't get frightened if you enter Billy Sunday's tabernacle Tuesday night and think you've made a mistake and gotten into a football game." The results were as predicted as "Delegations vied with each other as to the volume and length of their yells." The 1,200 from Ohio State University sang their "Wahoo" song, "Carmen Ohio," and gave their whistling "sky rocket" yell. That Sunday fully enjoyed the proceedings was evidenced by a questionable yell given by 125 Westerville High School students - "one zipa, two zipa, three zipa-sam, Westerville High School don't give a ___!" - which reportedly "... caused the evangelist to nearly double up with laughter." That the students liked Sunday was shown by a cheer for him,

What's the matter with Sunday?
He's all right.
Who's all right? -- Billy.
Who said so? -- Everybody.
Who's everybody? -- Bliss. 9

7. "Expect 2,000 Working Girls At Big Rally," The Columbus Citizen, January 8, 1913, 1.
9. "Expect 2,000 Working Girls At Big Rally," The Columbus Citizen, January 8, 1913, 1.
There was little need for the 1,700 voice revival choir on such an occasion. Sunday spoke to the assemblage in a manner characteristic of many of his sermons. His topical approach, in which he presented a mass of statistical or illustrative material, rather than an expository one, in which primarily Biblical discussion would prevail, often caused his presentations to have much more of the quality of lectures than sermons. The Ohio State Journal's comment about the Yough Night sermon was that "last night's effort was not in any real sense, a sermon, and the evangelist took no text for it."10

On January 10, a delegation of between 500 and 1,000 Sunday followers from Springfield came to hear Sunday's sermon, "The Moral Leper." The brass band leading the group lined up in front of the platform and played "Onward Christian Soldiers" while "People stood on seats and waved their hands and 'kerchiefs . . . ."11 Senator O. F. Hypes, chairman of the 1911 Springfield revival effort, testified to the permanent good effects of the campaign there.12 Another out-of-town delegation of about 150 from Washington Court House, Ohio, was present that same evening.13

Sunday's first call for converts came after his "The Three Groups" sermon on January 10, nearly two weeks after the revival opened. When over 400 came forward as converts and those rededicating themselves to

---

Christian service, "... a record that has never before been equalled in his entire evangelistic career" was established. Three hundred and six supposedly actually signed decision cards that night. As Rodeheaver later explained, "... the character of the discourses used at the outset of a campaign differed much from those used later. Those preached the first week or ten days were calculated to attract attention, arouse discussion, and draw people to the tabernacle." The actual service for the first call was an arbitrary decision of Billy alone, he explained. But, "After the trail-hitting began, the sermons ... were a constant drive to achieve conviction in the hearts of his [Sunday's] hearers and persuade them to take the forward step expressing conversion." This was the point to which January 10 brought the Columbus revival, after which the tenor of sermons was noticeably more evangelistic in nature.

Sunday afternoon, January 12, was the first of seven services devoted to men only, at the tabernacle. On that day, 12,000 men jammed into the building to hear the sermon on the terrors of venereal disease, "When Chickens Come Home To Roost," while 15,000 were said to have been turned away. "Never before in the history of Columbus had so many men gathered beneath one roof," commented The Columbus Citizen. "A number of men climbed upon the roof and listened to the sermon through the ventilators." About 700 went forward, 526 signed cards, and "... some wept, others smiled and still others shouted."*

14. "Over 400 Hit Sunday Trail at First Call," The Columbus Citizen, January 11, 1913, 1.
15. Rodeheaver, Twenty Years With Billy Sunday, 26.
While the men's meeting was in progress, three services for women only were held about the city at which members of the Sunday party spoke. The following Sunday, January 19, Billy gave the story of his conversion and of the degeneration of the old Chicago White Sox team to 20,000 men - "one third of the men of Columbus" - at two services. The sermon was titled "The Devil's Boomerang Up-To-Date." This was the first time Sunday had given this sermon twice at two men's meetings in the same revival. In these services 422 converts were secured including a member of the State legislature, John R. King. Also notable, was that the total offerings to date had reached $13,849.25, enough for Sunday to discontinue regular offerings for the general expenses of the campaign, except on Sundays. About $17,000 was needed to cover the expenses. On Sunday, January 26, Billy again held two services for men only, twice preaching his famous "Booze" sermon. This time 20,500 men came out to hear him speak of the "... vile, dirty, filthy, mandering, spewing, tottering, blar-eyed, hog-jowled, bloated-faced, thin-lipped, stinking, rotten, vermin-covered drunkard."

Mayor Karb headed a delegation of 200 city officials at the previous Saturday evening service. While there, Sunday reportedly told Karb, "I've got you on my prayer list," Karb responding, "Go to it."

17. Ibid.
18. "Billy Sunday Swings Into His Fourth Week With New Record; 20,000 Men Hear Big Sermon," The Columbus Citizen, January 20, 1913, 1, 2.
At the next men's service at the tabernacle, Sunday afternoon February 2, "196 men... filed into the mourner's benches at the close without emotion." Among the more notable of these converts were medical doctors, C. M. Clouse and H. H. Latham, former deputy clerk of courts in Franklin County, Joseph Lott, and an umpire for the Texas baseball league who tore up a $300 a month contract because it required him to umpire on Sunday, William Brunga. The meager number of converts in comparison to former men's services helped spark the challenge from Sunday, "You know why some of you are not coming down and shaking my hand and promising to be a better Christian? You're not man enough. I throw it into your faces, you're not man enough."20 Sunday frequently employed such challenges to motivate folks down the sawdust aisles. The final men's service was held on the last Sunday of the revival, while the women had two meetings of their own at Memorial Hall and Wesley Chapel.

Women's Day, held on Friday, January 31, was the most largely attended and most strenuous day for Sunday during the seven-week Columbus campaign. Some women arrived at the tabernacle as early as 5 A.M., awakening Fred Seibert to seek admittance. When the doors were opened at 10:30, the building was completely filled in one half hour with hundreds more fighting to get in. Although only two services had been scheduled, the first to begin at 2 P.M., when

20. "Plan To Greet New Converts This Evening," The Columbus Citizen, February 3, 1913, 2.
Sunday heard of the packed tabernacle he rushed there to greet his anxious auditors. At the close of his one and one half hour delivery of the sermon, "Is It Well With Thee," as many women waited outside to be admitted as had just witnessed the sermon. Women were lined on Goodale Street from High to Park Streets. Not wishing to disappoint so many faithful followers, Billy decided to speak to the second throng as soon as they could be seated. Chaos, in which police and ushers were stuck with hat pins, all sorts of articles were lost or stolen, and even the nursery had to call for police to quell a "riot" of 125 babies and their mothers, resulted as the crowd within the tabernacle and the one without attempted to trade places. About 1:50 P.M., Sunday began addressing the second audience, having seen that policemen and firemen were again removed from the confidential service. Between the afternoon and evening women's services, (admittance to the latter being by ticket only for the benefit of working girls) Sunday spoke to 2,000 Ohio State University students in the university gymnasium. In the evening, Sunday preached the same sermon for the third time and established a record as nearly 40,000 people heard him on a single day. He later confessed that this was his most strenuous day in evangelism to date and that he would desire no such experience again. Most important

22. "Women Riot: 30,000 Crowded in Tabernacle," The Ohio State Journal, February 1, 1913, l.
for his career, he was demonstrating his ability to attract the crowds of a large city.

The Friday afternoon service on January 17, was devoted to the honor of mothers as "Silver-haired and feeble women comprised the major portion of the audience . . . ." About fifty automobiles brought the older women to the meeting where the platform was nearly covered with flowers. During this service, Governor Cox's mother was brought to the platform and was applauded avidly. The next afternoon was considered Children's Day. Both Sunday and Radeheaver used quite imaginative demonstrations and sleight-of-hand tricks to illustrate moral truths to their young audience. Also, at this service a "Sunbeam Chorus," composed of nearly 2,000 children, was organized to sing in place of the regular adult choir that evening.

Colorful, as well as large, delegations were often at the tabernacle, especially when evening services were designated by their manes. On Pythian Night, January 14, over 2,000 Knights of Pythias were reported to have marched into the tabernacle led by the Fourth Regiment band. However, "Less than a dozen of those wearing the yellow K. of P. badge hit the trail . . . ." Saturday evening, January 18, was considered

---

24. "Hold's Moses's Mother As Ideal For Women; Mothers Hear Sunday," The Columbus Citizen, January 17, 1913, 1.
27. "Billy Tries Electric Chair, Talks At Club And Prays For Solons," The Columbus Citizen, January 15, 1913, 1.
Railroaders' Night. Three thousand five hundred railroaders, 2,000 of whom worked at the Panhandle shops, were present that evening. Patriotic and military overtones were apparent as the "Old Guard" drum corp, composed of Civil War veterans, led the railroaders to the tabernacle and, upon Sunday's invitation, "... played several thrilling war pieces" on the platform. Rodeheaver had even instructed the "Sunbeam Chorus," which sang that evening, to hold up red, white and blue bunting at the proper moment to form a hugh American flag. 28 Such patriotic spirit reached its peak on Veterans' Night, January 21, as about 159 veterans from the Mexican, Civil and Spanish-American Wars were present and Rodeheaver rendered "Yankee Doodle," "Dixie," and "The Star Spangled Banner," on his trombone. He unfurled a small American flag as the audience stood during the last number. 29 It must be conceded, though, that patriotic and religious fervor were ingeniously interwoven, since, as Sunday gave the invitation,

Arising from their seats with almost one accord, forming into line, the color-bearer leading with the American flag dangling from its eagle-topped standard, and marching with the military carriage that characterized their steps half a century ago, 72 silver-haired and stoop-shouldered veterans of the Civil War trooped down Billy Sunday's sawdust trail . . . .

At this the audience cheered. Old animosities were forgotten as

N. J. Kidwell, a Confederate veteran who was reported to have been a

28. "Billy Sunday Swings Into His Fourth Week With New Record; 2,000 Men Hear Big Sermon." The Columbus Citizen, January 20, 1913, 1.
29. "War Veterans Take The Trail In Tabernacle." The Ohio State Journal, January 22, 1913, 1.
private in Barnett's brigade of Pickett's division, went forward and sat beside "those against whom he had struggled fifty years ago at the battle of Gettysburg . . ." on the mourner's bench. That same evening, 2,000 Columbus Hilliken's with two brass bands, and at least seven other delegations were on hand to add to the noise, if not the worship of the service.  

Several other delegations were outstanding during the revival. Four hundred members of the Franklin Bar Association attended on January 22, thirty-eight of them hitting the trail. Their visit brought to the fore one of the interesting parts of the song services before Sunday's sermons. Often, when delegations were asked their favorite song by Rodeheaver, they would answer with a song title in some way denoting their type of employment. When Rodeheaver asked the lawyers their favorite song, remarking that he was glad to see the lawyers "as nobody saw them in church very often," they replied with the song "The King's Business," the first line of which is "I am a stranger here in a foreign land."  

31 On other occasions during the revival the Troy Laundry employees requested "Whiter Than Snow," those from the Standard Oil Company, "Let The Lower Lights Be Burning," and certain legislators, "The Fight Is On."  

32 A delegation of 200 deaf

30. "Colours Flying 72 Vets Storm Sawdust Trail," The Columbus Citizen, January 22, 1913, 1, 2.
inmates from the State School for the Blind and Deaf heard Sunday via the effort of four interpreters on February 5. On January 25, about 200 who had become acquainted with Sunday at Toledo in 1911 attended in a delegation. The last Saturday evening of the revival, 4,000 Columbus Masons were at the tabernacle. On behalf of that group, Mayor Karb went to the platform and presented Sunday with a handsome mahogany clock equipped with chimes. Karb said, "I want to compliment Mr. Sunday and all of his co-workers. They have done their work satisfactorily and well . . . ." He had definitely revised his former assessment of Sunday during the course of the seven weeks, but never could the evangelist persuade him to walk down the sawdust aisle and shake his hand as a convert.

Contrariwise, Police Chief Charles E. Carter became the most publicized convert of the revival. Carter had attended the meetings faithfully, but not until Thursday evening January 23, did he yield to Sunday's plea, "Come on, Chief," and make his way to the platform. Thunderous applause and shouts of "Hallelujah" and "Amen" greeted his decision. Billy ran from the platform to meet him, brought him up onto it, stilled the choir, and had him make a statement. "I have always lived the life written within myself," said Carter. "I know that there is a power here beyond man, and taking Mr. Sunday's word

33. "Urges R. R. Men to Choose God For Their Boss," The Columbus Citizen, February 6, 1913, 1.
34. "City Officials Don't Answer Sunday Pleas," The Ohio State Journal, January 26, 1913, 1.
35. "Mayor Fussed For First Time Known," The Ohio State Journal, February 16, 1913, 1.
that there is salvation in Jesus Christ, I am ready to accept him.

Carter and Robert Young, the latter proprietor of the Dennison Hotel and also a revival convert on February 11, were two of the most publicly active converts after the campaign ended. Carter joined the Methodist Episcopal Church and he and Young assumed the leadership of weekly, Sunday afternoon men's meetings to preserve the Sunday atmosphere. The Chief began to pursue a rather effective anti-liquor crusade, and also made public appearances, speaking in churches as far afield as Washington Court House.

If Sunday found one difficulty in Columbus, it was in getting ushers and choir members to go into the audience and persuade folks to come forward during the altar call. He often admonished "You Choir people, get out and do personal work . . . ." "You Columbus personal workers are about the deadest bunch I ever saw. You look like a bunch of hot air merchants." Never did Sunday see the amount of personal contact he wished. As he summed up the results of the revival when

36. "Billy Sunday, In Soothing Sermon Brands Dance And Cards Worse Than Saloon," The Columbus Citizen, January 24, 1913, 1.
38. "Carter And Young To Hold Mens' Meetings," The Ohio State Journal, March 10, 1913, 5.
41. "Sawdust Trail Hit By 66 On Sunday's Call," The Ohio State Journal, January 12, 1913, 1.
he left, he added that, "The only place where Columbus is lame is in personal work. I saw that she was not going to do much in this direction; that's why I gave the call for converts a little bit earlier than customary, and then shut off the personal workers after a few meetings. And, thank God, I haven't needed them, either - so eager have people been to accept Jesus."43

While in Columbus, Sunday gave full vent to his characteristic doctrines, idiosyncrasies, oratorical flares, and gymnastic deliveries. Of his own call to the ministry he said, "I believe I was just as truly called of God as was Paul or the disciples." "We've got the same commission to keep this world in a state of revival that the disciples had."44 "I believe that God calls me to do now what he called Martin Luther to do in his day and generation" was Sunday's estimation of his mission.45 To defend his use of everyday language in the pulpit, he persisted that "If Jesus Christ lived today he [sic] would preach in the vernacular, just like I am preaching to you . . . . He would say to you sinners, come across, old man, before the devil's got you cinched."46 For a defense of his much criticized thank offerings,

44. "Sunday Gives Mother, Also Home, Tribute," The Ohio State Journal, January 3, 1913, 1.
45. "Evangelist Hurls Defiance At all Revival Knockers," The Columbus Citizen, January 1, 1913, 1.
46. "Sunday Pleas Explained To Deaf; 14 Yield," The Ohio State Journal, February 6, 1913, 2.
Sunday presented extensive statistics showing that, to convert one person, American churches were spending from $75 in Atlanta, Georgia to $620 in Indianapolis, Indiana, while "what I'm paid for my work makes it about $2 a soul." 47 Sunday was just as quick to denounce Christian Science as "tommyrot" and "poppy-cock" as he was to vindicate his own cause. 48 "Away with your lying, stinking, hell-born Unitarian doctrine that Christ was not the son of God," he demanded. "Jesus Christ was either the son of God or he was the illegitimate son of a Jewish harlot, for he was born out of wedlock. He was either the son of God or he [sic] was a bastard." 49 "The old bastard theory of evolution," as Sunday called it, and also Spiritualism, came under his denunciation. "If there ever was evolution, why don't we evolve now," he would ask and then assert, "You can develop the species, but you can't change them." 50 "If modern scholarship means to deny the everlasting word of God, then to hell with it," Billy flatly commanded. 51 Columbus clergymen were not immune to his attack. "The trouble with Columbus is that she has a lot of mutts here who are professing to be preachers, and who are preaching a lot of tommyrot. I tell you they don't know what the Bible truth is," was

47. "Says He'll Turn City Inside Out and Give Devil Race For Money," The Columbus Citizen, January 4, 1913, 1.
49. "Men Converts At Afternoon Meet are 526," The Ohio State Journal, January 13, 1913, 3.
51. "Evangelist Surls Defiance At all Revival Knockers," The Columbus Citizen, January 1, 1913, 1.
his charge. In his famous "Amusement" sermon, preached in Columbus twice on January 24, Sunday affirmed that dancing was not an innocent amusement, but "simply a hugging match set to music" which "caused the downfall of more girls than anything else." At the same time, he called the theater "one of the rottenest institutions this side of hell" and said that there was as much difference between a game of checkers and a game of cards "... as between heaven and hell."  

One example, from the January 14 afternoon service, will suffice to illustrate the measure to which any disturbance during his sermons irritated Sunday. His first cause for distress that day was coughing in the audience, at which he "would pause and show his displeasure." Next, when some babies cried, he announced the existence of the nursery where babies should be left. Soon, when several people squirmed and looked up at the ventilators, he ordered the vents closed. This caused the building to become so intensely warm that a man fainted and had to be carried out and revived. At this Billy "closed his Bible and threatened to quit preaching," but finally reconsidered and continued.  

Although the difficulty of speaking to a large group without the aid of more modern devices must be realized, Sunday's idiosyncrasies were apparent.

---

52. "Billy In Sizzling Sermon, Says Columbus Has 'Yellow' Streak," The Columbus Citizen, February 5, 1913, 5.
53. "Billy's Burning Shots on Dance, Cards and Theater," The Columbus Citizen, January 24, 1913, 2.
The Columbus Citizen noted Sunday's dramatical and rapid-fire delivery thus:

At one time he was Julius Caesar, holding his hands to his head, crying 'the die is cast' and leaping into an imaginary rubicon. The next instant he stood with arms folded and in sotto voce proclaimed that he had 'come to bury Caesar, not to praise him,' a la Mark Antony. Again, he proclaimed Cleopatra as the flat-nosed enchantress of all those amenable to licentiousness, and pressing his nose flat upon his face, stalked up and down the pulpit until the 'kids' in the front rows screamed with laughter.

In further comment on Billy's platform antics, it was said that:

When he hobbled and hopped across the stage with arms outspread, wheeled in rapid gyrations, poised himself on one toe, and then swung around time after time in illustration of the old style country dance, Sunday's hearers roared with delight.

... he jumped upon his chair, sat on the back and bowed an imaginary violin ... .

Holding his arms as if 'hugging' a girl in a dance, Sunday waltzed across the platform, ...

Perhaps the most interesting observation had to do with the manner in which Sunday shook the hands of those hitting the trail:

Sunday's most favorite position is to give one full-length swing backward, using his left leg as a pivot for his body, then suddenly throw his body forward in a horizontal position, extending his right hand downward to the uplifted hands of the converts. The next moment Sunday will race to the other end of his platform and, as like as not, drop flat down on the carpet, reach far over the edge and shake a convert's hand. Suddenly he will jump up and run back again to the other end of the platform and drop on his knees and shake hands. Again he will jerk open the trap door in his platform, which preachers call his 'convert hole,' and from this position, sitting on the edge, will shake hands a few minutes.

55. "Sunday In Stirring Plea to Doubters of Bible's Divinity Brings 197 Down the Trail," The Columbus Citizen, February 5, 1913, 2.
57. "Billy Sunday's Never Quit When He Shakes Hands With Converts," The Columbus Citizen, January 24, 1913, 7.
One corp of newsmen even took the effort to count the gestures and actions of the constantly moving evangelist in a one hour and ten minute sermon. In that time, he pounded the pulpit 326 times, waved his handkerchief 68 times, sat in his chair 6 times, stamped his foot 24 times, and made 2,000 gestures with his hands, among other noted movements.\(^5\) The Billy Sunday technique was certainly a unique manifestation of pulpit oratory and gymnastics.

Since Sunday’s custom was to leave all Mondays free for rest, during the Columbus campaign he used three of these to retreat to his house at Winona Lake, Indiana, for a short rest, returning for the Tuesday evening service. It was on these occasions, that Rev. Peacock preached three of the ninety-six sermons of the revival, on Tuesday afternoons. The considerably smaller crowds which Peacock attracted for those services testified to Sunday’s personal magnetism.\(^6\) Sunday did break his rule on Monday as a rest day once during the campaign. On February 10, he held a special, informal rally for high school students in which music and school yells were emphasized.\(^7\)

If Sunday needed any proof that he was being successful in Columbus, he had it by February 7. By that date, the revival, which was to last seven weeks, had not as yet completed its sixth week, but

---

had already exceeded all Sunday's previous records for total converts by reaching 10,169. During the last week, there were over 500 converts every night as the campaign approached its climax, the last Sunday, February 16. On that day, Sunday spoke at five services - at the Ohio Penitentiary, Memorial Hall, and three at the tabernacle. Twelve thousand jammed the tabernacle at those three services and another 4,000 heard him at Memorial Hall.

Sunday's remarkable efforts in closing the campaign were greeted with a record breaking 2,139 estimated converts on the last day and a check of appreciation for $21,000. Sunday had given his most extensive evangelistic effort to date to Columbus and the city had thanked and paid him well - the results were yet to calculate.

62. "Billy Plans to Close Campaign With Rush; Converts 3, A. Captain," The Columbus Citizen, February 14, 1913, 1.
64. "Sunday Revival in Brief," The Columbus Citizen, February 17, 1913, 1.
Chapter VI
Assessing The Columbus Results

Virtually all of the numerous statistical records of Sunday's campaigns, which were displayed profusely in the press as cities competed everywhere he held revivals, were smaller than those of the Columbus meetings. Columbus was not only the largest city to have had a Sunday revival up to this time, but also could boast the longest and most expensive campaign with the largest tabernacle and choir, and the greatest evidence of revival enthusiasm as demonstrated by the largest aggregate attendance, number of converts, thank offering for the evangelist, and number of new members for its churches. A more dubious honor was that one of the most publicized religious controversies to date resulted from the revival.

The Columbus Citizen summarized the immediate statistical results thus:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total converts</td>
<td>18,333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Converts on last day</td>
<td>2,189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total attendance</td>
<td>825,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average per meeting</td>
<td>8,593</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nursery children</td>
<td>1,884</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total meetings in tabernacle</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Times Sunday preached in tabernacle</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Offering for Billy</td>
<td>$21,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collected for expenses</td>
<td>$19,187.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collected for charity</td>
<td>$2,381.55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collected for women of Sunday party</td>
<td>$1,115.55</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. "Sunday Revival In Brief," The Columbus Citizen, February 17, 1913, 1. All such attendance and conversion statistics in Sunday's revivals must be realized as approximate rather than completely accurate since rarely did the sponsoring association publicize the official figures. For instance, "Revival, Notable In World History, Closes,"
One-tenth of the Columbus population had hit the sawdust trail.

According to an auditing report by Charles E. Bristol and H. H. Harrington, the expenses of the campaign totaled $18,395.40 of which $18,214.87 represented the cost of building and operating the tabernacle and $1,794.77 the half of the salary of the men of the Sunday party to be paid by the Columbus Evangelistic Association. Another report placed half of the men's salaries at $3,219.77, with the women of the team to be paid out of separate offerings from the special women's meetings.

In any case, the amount raised by free will offerings more than covered all expenses. One resume of offerings, including those for general expenses, the evangelist, charity, and women assistants, showed a grand total of $44,497.10. Perhaps this figure best represents the total cost of the revival.

A considerable amount of planning went into the gathering of the special offering on the last Sunday for the evangelist. In each of the services on the Sunday before the meetings closed, an appeal was

---

The Ohio State Journal, February 17, 1913, 1, set the Columbus figures at 18,149 total converts with 2,231 the last day, the offering for Sunday at $20,795.62 (although The Columbus Citizen published a picture of the $21,000 check given to Sunday, see The Columbus Citizen, February 17, 1913, 1) and the aggregate total attendance at between 750,000 and 1,000,000.


3. "117 Hit Trail; Chief Carter Joins Church," The Ohio State Journal, January 24, 1913, 1.

made by three ministers (Day, Campbell and Palmer respectively) for a sizable offering in appreciation of Sunday's efforts the next Sunday. 5 Ministers of the city set $20,000 as the goal for the thank offering. 6 A committee of 150 businessmen was set up to accept offerings during the last week and to act as offering-taking tellers in place of the regular ushers at the last Sunday services. 7 During the taking of the collection on February 16, Rev. Mr. Day presided, asking for $500 gifts first, then diminishing the amount until the pans were passed for the one to five dollar gifts. 8 As those in the audience volunteered their offerings, the 150 tellers, who were equipped with blank checks for those not having theirs with them, called out their names and amounts to the platform. A Billy Sunday bank, with Evangelistic Association treasurer Z. L. White in charge, was put into operation beneath the platform at the tabernacle to cash all checks. 9 The bulk of the offering, $10,432.11, came at the morning service, which was customary in Sunday revivals. 10

Most of the funds were raised by small contributions, but there were

8. "Big Fund For Sunday Was Raised By The Multitude Contributing Their Mites," The Columbus Citizen, February 17, 1913, 2.
some large single ones - J. E. Purvis gave $500 to be the largest, Foster Copeland $300,\textsuperscript{11} and J. E. Burk, $250.\textsuperscript{12} It was further reported that the mechanism for the gathering of this offering of appreciation "... was entirely in the hands of local people and, with the exception of a few minutes at one of the services, all of it was made when the evangelist was not present."\textsuperscript{13}

On February 22, it was reported by W. J. Zuck, who had kept the records of all the cottage prayer meetings for the Evangelistic Association, that at least 2,500 such services had been held, with about 27,500 in attendance.\textsuperscript{14} In more than twenty-five of the sixty churches which participated in the Sunday campaign, individual revivals were begun the week after February 16 to use the religious fervor generated in the tabernacle and cottage prayer services to best advantage.\textsuperscript{15} Most of these revivals were carried on for two weeks after Sunday left.\textsuperscript{16} They were designed not only to win new converts via the carpet trail, but also to welcome tabernacle converts into church fellowship and experiences. The Columbus

\textsuperscript{11} "Big Fund For Sunday Was Raised By The Multitude Contributing Their Hites," The Columbus Citizen, February 17, 1913, 2.
\textsuperscript{12} "Columbus Breaks All Records In Amount Given Evangelist," The Ohio State Journal, February 17, 1913, 2.
\textsuperscript{13} "Revival Notable In World's History, Closes," The Ohio State Journal, February 17, 1913, 1.
\textsuperscript{14} "Over 27,500 People Attend Prayer Meets In Revival," The Columbus Citizen, February 22, 1913, 3.
\textsuperscript{15} "New Converts Swell Crowds At Revivals," The Columbus Citizen, February 18, 1913, 1.
\textsuperscript{16} "Sunday Church Announcements," The Ohio State Journal, February 22, 1913, 1.
Evangelistic Association meticulously distributed all decision cards signed at the tabernacle to the pastors of the churches indicated thereon. In this way it was reported that every church in Columbus, whether it participated in the revival or not, Protestant or Catholic, white or colored, and including even Christian Scientist, Unitarian and Universalist groups received cards of prospective new members. About twenty such cards went to Washington Gladden's church. About 1,000 gave no church preference and almost that many more indicated out-of-town churches to which their cards were sent. The greatest number of cards went to the Methodist churches, the West Park Avenue Methodist Episcopal one getting the largest single number of cards, 400. Nearly 200 cards went to Catholic churches in the area.

The influx of new members into the Columbus churches was very rewarding and received wide coverage in the press. Although a few new members were received at special Monday night meetings during the revival, the first overwhelming reception occurred on the first Sunday after Billy had left, February 23. With at least twenty-eight churches holding reception, and many baptismal services, it was calculated that 6,000 new members (or one-third of the total number of Sunday converts) had been extended church fellowship on that day. The Methodist Episcopal churches alone received 3,800, the Presbyterian, 606, the Disciples of Christ, 414, and the Baptists,

17. "Got Converts From Coast To Coast; Every Church Benefits," The Columbus Citizen, February 18, 1913, 9.
At the nearby village of Powell, with a 250 population, sixty-one new church members were realized. The Ohio State Journal termed February 23, "The greatest day in the history of Columbus churches in points of attendance, acquisition of members and general religious enthusiasm." The churches could hardly accommodate the throngs which sought admittance. The Third Avenue Methodist Episcopal Church held the record for new members by this time with 420.

On the next Sunday, March 2, another 2,700 new church members were reported and another 500 on Easter Sunday, March 9, which brought the total reaped by the churches of Columbus to about 10,000. In June 1913, an article placed the figure of additions to church membership at only 8,000, but it also numbered the converts at only 12,000 instead of just over 13,000 as was reported at the close of the campaign.

Immediate appraisal of the seven week campaign and its results were generally optimistic. Just before the close, Sunday said, "Absolutely no comparison can be made on the success already evident in our Columbus campaign and the results in other cities during my

19. "Over 6,000 New Members Go Into Churches," The Columbus Citizen, February 24, 1913, 1.
20. "Churches Get Converts, Due To Big Revival," The Ohio State Journal, February 24, 1913, 1.
23. "Over 500 More New Converts Join Local Churches Sunday," The Columbus Citizen, March 10, 1913, 1. For a detailed listing of the reported converts in the respective Columbus churches see Appendix IV.
entire evangelistic experience. Other cities are simply not in it with Columbus. I believe this to be the greatest revival the United States ever has witnessed. "Never have I seen another campaign that has affected all classes of people as has this one." 25 Billy further asserted that the Columbus revival had attracted more attention than had any other in the past twenty-five years. In one day inquires had come to him from California, Washington, Texas and Florida seeking his services as his Columbus activities were heralded by the press. 26 Editorially, The Ohio State Journal, commented that, "No man ever brought to the masses the alternative of right and wrong, of decency and disgrace, of purity and vice, as did Mr. Sunday in proclaiming his doctrines." The chief result it conceived as "a stronger moral sense in this community than there ever was before; and now the pressing question is, how to preserve it, how to make it vital in civic, religious, and business life." 27 The Columbus Citizen, in an effort to secure current opinions as to Sunday and the campaign, collected pertinent comments from Governor Cox, Mayor Karb, and Ohio State University President William Oxley Thompson, among other folks. The governor explained the achievement of the revival spirit and converts in terms of Billy's knowledge of mass psychology, and

27. Editorial, "Results Of Sundays' Meetings," The Ohio State Journal, February 17, 1913, 4.
his energy, saying "He knows the inwardness of the masses, their trials, difficulties and impulses." Karb assumed that "... the result could not be other than to improve conditions." Dr. Thompson's statement was somewhat more perceptive, "My observation is that Mr. Sunday has stirred the entire city and surrounding communities to an active interest in religion." "He has said many things from which good people dissent. Nevertheless, he has hammered away in his own style at the fundamental questions of sin and salvation in a way that has aroused consciences of multitudes." "I rejoice in all the good he has done. ..." Fire Chief Laurer, who had objected to the lack of a fire-proof tabernacle, reported "I believe the Billy Sunday revival meetings have done some good in Columbus." A comment from organized labor, as given by Lon Rowe, president of the Columbus Federation of Labor, evaded the true issue. "It remains to be seen what effect Billy Sunday revivals will have in Columbus. The street car boys who have handled the crowds deserve to share in the profits realized by the company from these meetings," was all he would say.28

By March 17, Rev. Dr. Hugh Black of Union Theological Seminary in New York was in Columbus and, speaking at the Broad Street Presbyterian Church, asked why such revivals cannot become country and world wide. "We naturally decline into a moral and physical degeneracy ...," he warned, in a pessimistic view of the future of religious fervor in...
Columbus. The Westerville Anti-Saloon League paper, The New Republic gave an interesting if not biased view of the effects of the revival upon liquor interests in the city during the revival.

Old King Booze received a solar-plexus punch. Saloons were sadly neglected. Every afternoon and evening during the meeting the places down-town most frequented, usually, were all but deserted. One day, in one of the most popular cafes of this city, a place usually filled up at the noon hour, a man counted just five men there — two of them being in charge of the place. One man was drinking at the bar. Two others were standing away from the bar and were discussing Billy Sunday.30

In June, 1913, The Missionary Review published an article which gave a completely favorable assessment of Sunday and the Columbus revival. In speaking of "the Pentecost in Ohio," it noted particularly the wide range of society reached by Sunday and asserted, "There has been a large increase in Bible classes and in the number of Christian workers." Also, "So many employees of the large manufacturing plants in Columbus were converted that industrial life in the city has become completely transformed." In reference to Sunday's "Booze" message, the article stated that, "The saloons have lost trade, the keepers of vicious pleasure resorts grumble over the lack of customers, and even the so-called respectable amusement places which cater to the idle and frivolous-minded, are not patronized as they were before the revival."31

30. Quoted in "Billy Sunday's Greatest Campaign," The Literary Digest, XLVI (March 15, 1913), 576.
31. "Evangelism As A Means To Reform: Some Results Of Sunday's Campaign In Columbus And Erie," The Missionary Review, XXVI (June 1913), 436.
recorded that "... all up-town stores ..." closed on Saturday evenings in deference to Sunday's plea that such action would increase attendance at church on Sunday mornings. Further, numerous businessmen had "... voluntarily increased the wages of their help, particularly the women ..." because of Sunday's remarks about a living wage. Chief Carter's efforts at more strict law enforcement were, by then, a noticeable result of the revival and "Saloons and drinking places admit a very considerable decrease in business, not only during the campaign, but since its conclusion."^{32}

For the most part, press comment and the available statistics indicated that the Sunday revival was a wholesome stimulant to the religious and moral climate of the city. However, evidence of opposition to Sunday's doctrines and methods which had remained dormant during the campaign, began to show signs of life after he left, resulting finally in a thoroughgoing controversy. The primary dissension concerning the doctrines so rigidly proclaimed by Sunday occurred in conjunction with the report of a study committee on amusements to the Columbus Council of Churches on Monday, February 17. In its report on the condition of local dance halls and theaters, which it had been studying for several months, the committee asserted that twenty-three of the forty-six dance halls were in first class condition, indorsing their use as wholesome, and that only two theaters interjected "... cheap burlesque acts between

---

32. Frankenberg, op. cit., 170, 171.
films . . ." thereby making them unfit. By its own statements that
"As a committee we all believe in theaters, motion pictures and
dancing," and consider dancing lessons as "... an education to
boys and girls that is of immense value as a preparation for social
life," the committee placed itself as diametrically opposed to the
views expressed during the revival by Sunday. As if this were not a
great enough blow to Sunday's position, the committee said there
was evidence that, "The motion picture shows in the downtown
district have done a phenomenal business during the two months . . ."
due to overflow crowds from the revival resorting to nearby theaters
for entertainment. 34

Although the Council of Churches took no official action upon
the report, its publication in the Columbus newspapers the day after
Sunday had left, caused a sizable stir among the pastors who had
sponsored the revival. The pastors' chief concern was that many
folks would undoubtedly assume that the Council, as a whole, of
which some of them were members, had denounced the evangelist's
 teachings about amusements. Only too significantly, the meeting
at which the report was given was presided over by the renowned
Congregationalist, Dr. Washington Gladden, who had refused, along
with his First Congregational Church, to participate in the Sunday
campaign. This added to the conviction of most of the pastors and

33. "Report Sunday Responsible For Big Crowds At Movies," The Columbus Citizen, February 18, 1913, 5.
34. "Revival Announced Help To Theaters," The Ohio State Journal, February 18, 1913, 3.
churches which had participated that the Council, led by Dr. Gladden, was attempting to berate the revival. On Wednesday evening February 19, the members of the First Baptist Church met and unanimously adopted a resolution disapproving the committee's report. By February 20, the pastors of the sponsoring churches announced their intentions of meeting to express unitedly their disfavor with the recent report and to reaffirm their commitment to Sunday's teachings. On the same day, the press printed a long statement by Dr. Gladden in which he was trying to clarify the situation and reconcile the antagonism. Although he pointed out that the study had been in preparation for several months, and particularly that the date of its presentation in February had been fixed as far back as November, that the Council had taken no action upon the report, and that the statements about increased theater attendance were only the "... statement of fact," the pastors were not deterred from holding their meeting. Gladden stated frankly that the ministers certainly had the right to meet and express their own opinions upon amusements, but his primary concern seemed to be that "... they will not hold the Council itself responsible for opinions which it neither expressed nor endorsed." 35

Under the chairmanship of Rev. Mr. Day, all of the pastors of the sponsoring churches met on the evening of February 20. Since some of them were members of the Council who had attended the meeting at which the disliked report had been given while others were

non-members, certain divisions in their ranks were evident. The non-members queried why the others had not denounced the report at the meeting as soon as it was given, while the members suggested that the pro-Sunday pastors should all become active in the Council in order to control its activities, or else all become detached from it completely. Rev. Mr. Luther Freeman reaffirmed the factualness of the report, but Rev. Mr. Eason held that, "We know they [the theaters] did not do a more thriving business during those seven weeks than before or since, even if the committee says they did."^36 By the use of directive parliamentary procedures, Rev. Mr. Day was eventually able to steer the group away from a resolution denouncing the Council of Churches and into ones indorsing Sunday's stand "... on moral questions ..." and rejecting theater attendance, card playing, and dancing as unacceptable Christian practices.\(^37\) This, obviously, fulfilled their primary objective, to free themselves from any stigma that they had renounced Sunday and his teachings as soon as he had left by the indorsement of the untimely amusement committee's report. Gladden's reply to the action of the sponsoring pastors' resolutions was a welcome to become active members in the Council whose purposes he said were to keep the churches informed on social and moral conditions and local philanthropic work. He generously stated that, "The executive committee will give them [the pro-Sunday ministers] large place in all the working committees;
they may take over all our investigation into their own hands."\textsuperscript{38}

There is no evidence that such a happy solution occurred. There is evidence, however, that the prediction of one of the participating pastors that there would result a growing division between the evangelistic and the non-evangelistic churches did take place.\textsuperscript{39}

This continuing conflict, set in an ever widening framework, became known as the Gladden-Sunday controversy.\textsuperscript{40}

Although Gladden remained not only aloof, but also silent during Sunday's Columbus campaign and made attempts to promote unity among supporting and non-supporting churches through the Council of Churches immediately following the revival, there was no doubt as to his own personal contempt for Billy's doctrines and methods. He would have undoubtedly maintained his silence indefinitely, though, had it not been that, as one of the leading clergy of the nation and one of the foremost proponents of the Social Gospel, his judgement concerning Sunday and the effects of his efforts in Columbus began to be avidly sought, especially by those in cities considering a Sunday revival. After three months of such questioning, Gladden finally gave a first public airing of his views upon Sunday in the May issue of The Congregationalist. Upon four counts, the Columbus pastor assaulted the evangelist, after noting that any opposition was slow to speak

\textsuperscript{38} "Come In And Work, Dr. Gladden Urges," The Ohio State Journal, February 23, 1913, 1.
\textsuperscript{39} "Ministers Aroused By Dancing Report," The Ohio State Journal, February 21, 1913, 1.
\textsuperscript{40} See the Discussion in Frankenberg, op. cit., 159-174.
because of Sunday's multitude of followers who had been indoctrinated, with the view "... that any man who ventures to question his [Sunday's] methods is a liar, an atheist and a destroyer of men's souls - going to hell himself and leading thither all who follow him." Gladden's first charge, of intolerance and violence, grew out of Sunday's attack, his first day in Columbus, upon the doctrine of the Fatherhood of God and the Brotherhood of Man as "... the worst rot that ever was dug out of hell ..." and further that "... every minister who preaches it is a liar." Since this doctrine was the supporting pillar of Gladden's social gospel emphasis, he admitted that "... I could not, without forfeiting my self respect, have attended those services until those words had been withdrawn and humbly apologized for."

Since Gladden also adhered to the theory of evolution, he viewed Sunday as intolerant concerning it. More generally, he said "Every man whose opinions differ from those of Mr. Sunday is a liar; every day he mounts the judgment seat of the universe and sends men by the scores to the right hand and to the left - mostly to the left."

As to Sunday's doctrine, he termed it "... the most hopeless form of medieval substitutionism," particularly pointing to his literalness in interpreting the Bible. "Salvation is a matter of contract; hell is a literal pit of fire and brimstone; the Bible is verbally infallible; every man who teaches the Higher Criticism is a liar," Gladden wrote protestingly. His last two reasons for refusing to support Billy were his assertions that the latter was devoid of true Christian spirit and resorted to commercialism in his offerings of appreciation
in the various cities. Patience, kindness, sympathy, and thoughtfulness, he said, were lacking from Billy's character. 41 (Since Gladden attended none of the Columbus meetings, he failed to see Sunday, on January 16, retain a poorly clad seven-year-old Mound Street Mission lad long enough in the convert line to tell him to come to the Dennison Hotel the next day, where Billy saw that he received a new outfitting of clothes.) 42 As to commercialization, Gladden charged, "It is notorious that he [Sunday] is making himself rich in this business of evangelism." As to the free-will offering itself, he said that an organized campaign lasting four weeks was behind it. One Columbus pastor, he reported as saying, "It is ridiculous, to call it a free-will offering." In addition to the appeal for a sizable offering because of Sunday's efforts, Gladden noted the prominent inter-city competition to raise the highest amount. He commented that it was as yet too early to assess the results fully, but could not help but be cognizant of the many converts and new church members of which he wished the churches to make the most, but he also hoped, "... that many of these men and women, under the wise care of the pastors, will forget a good deal of what they have learned from Mr. Sunday and will become intelligent, sweet-tempered, fair-minded and earnest Christians." Finally, he regretted the "atmosphere" created by the Sunday revival as producing, "the lowering of men's sentiments of reverence, the

42. "Hold's Mother As Ideal For Women; Mothers Hear Sunday," The Columbus Citizen, January 17, 1913, 1.
blunting of their finer sensibilities, the stimulation of their uncharitableness and censoriousness, the commercializing of their ideas of Christian service and reward, and the blinding of their intellects by an immoral theology." In summary, Gladden added, "He would be dark-minded who did not see the good and rejoice in it. But he is a blind leader of the blind who cannot discern such evil and shun it."\footnote{3}

Few of these criticisms were new, but coming as the first major opposition of Sunday by one of the leading clergy of the nation, they carried special weight and provoked a tremendous response from the Sunday supporters. The ensuing controversy, which correctly should be termed the Gladden-Sunday followers controversy, since Sunday himself refused to take any public part whatever in it, was aired in both secular and church publications.\footnote{4} Once again the cooperating pastors in the Columbus campaign met, this time to repudiate the statements in the Gladden article. They again affirmed their faith in Sunday and his message.\footnote{5} The schism between those for and those opposed to Sunday was wide, with the issues involved clearly drawn. For weeks the conflict raged in various parts of the nation, but with Columbus as the focal point. After a thorough presentation of both sides of the controversy in the press, the array finally abated by the fall of 1913, but such disagreement could not but have left

\footnote{4} Frankenberg, op. cit., 162.
\footnote{5} Ibid., 168, 189.
scars of deep bitterness to testify, along with the undeniable good
done by the campaign, that Sunday had stirred Columbus to its
religious foundations.

The magnitude of the Columbus campaign in the career of Billy
Sunday must be assessed in its proper order as the first of his twenty
most successful campaigns. That it broke the records of all of his
previous revivals is rather easily estimable, but, of the far reaching
results and repercussions in the lives of men and of churches, possibly
it was best said by Rev. Mr. Campbell, "what he has done, God alone
will know at the judgment day." 46

46. "Convert List Of Day Nears One Thousand," The Ohio State
Journal, February 10, 1913, 2.
Conclusions

The Ohio campaigns of Billy Sunday derive significance from the fact that these successes were crucial in the enlarging evangelistic career of the evangelist, as well as from being the most spectacular demonstrations of early twentieth century revivalism in the state. The first nine revivals held by Sunday in Ohio, from 1910 to 1913, were virtually the first he had held beyond the borders of his home states of Illinois and Iowa. Success in these meetings, in one of the most politically important states, was critically important in bringing him to the attention of the nation, and particularly the more conservative East. The Ohio campaigns, to a degree beyond all preceding ones, demonstrated Sunday's ability to appeal effectively to larger cities, of up to nearly 200,000, with his unique call for practical religion. Although each of the successes in the early Ohio campaigns was important to the image he was creating of efforts in the state, those in Toledo and Columbus were by far the paramount ones. Each in its turn was the largest city yet to be confronted with a Sunday revival, and each as it brought success also generated increased popularity for the evangelist. The revival in the capital city broke virtually all of the previous records set in Sunday's total of over one hundred revivals. Such a campaign, the greatest he ever held in the state, was undoubtedly the principal factor which brought to him the opportunity to hold evangelistic services in the largest cities of the United States in the following five years.
If the early Ohio campaigns were indicative of Sunday's rise to popularity, the later ones were demonstrative of his retreat from that zenith. The Columbus campaign of 1912-1913 had been the first of his twenty most successful revivals; the Cincinnati meetings, in 1921 had been the last. He had opened and closed the most outstanding years of his ministry in Ohio. From that point onward the smaller towns, fewer converts and lessened enthusiasm which were evident in his Ohio campaigns reflected the general decline of his career as well as of the fervor of revivalism in the Buckeye state. While in Ohio, however, whether early or late in his career, Sunday gave full vent to his personal and ministerial characteristics, expressions, and idiosyncrasies which made him uniquely Billy Sunday. By preaching all of his most famous sermons during the Ohio campaigns, he stimulated the two customary reactions to his ministry, those of devotedly enthusiastic supporters and pungently caustic critics. Judging from the converts and new church members evident, particularly during the early revivals, the wholesome results of Sunday's Ohio campaigns were commensurate with the best he achieved elsewhere, while the less desirable and less fruitful effects of some of his largest revivals seem to have been avoided in Ohio. Undoubtedly, the Sunday revivals received a hearing in Ohio in excess of any held within the state before or since. Furthermore, not only was Ohio stirred by a practical religious awakening, but the evangelist was given the critical success in a nationally prominent state which presented the opportunity for him to bring his career to its full expression in the largest cities in the United States.
APPENDIX
Appendix I

Statistics Of The Ohio Campaigns

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Converts</th>
<th>Offering</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Youngstown</td>
<td>Jan. 10 - Feb. 20, 1910</td>
<td>79,066</td>
<td>5,915</td>
<td>$12,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portsmouth</td>
<td>Jan. 1 - Feb. 12, 1911</td>
<td>23,481</td>
<td>5,224</td>
<td>$10,305.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lima</td>
<td>Feb. 19 - April 2, 1911</td>
<td>30,508</td>
<td>5,659</td>
<td>$11,313.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toledo</td>
<td>April 9 - May 22, 1911</td>
<td>17,009</td>
<td>7,391</td>
<td>$15,539.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Springfield</td>
<td>Sept. 24 - Nov. 5, 1911</td>
<td>46,921</td>
<td>6,804</td>
<td>$13,975.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canton</td>
<td>Dec. 31, 1911 - Feb. 11, 1912</td>
<td>50,217</td>
<td>5,627</td>
<td>$12,652.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Liverpool</td>
<td>Sept. 15 - Oct. 27, 1912</td>
<td>20,387</td>
<td>6,494</td>
<td>$12,654.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Columbus</td>
<td>Dec. 29, 1912-Feb. 16, 1913</td>
<td>181,511</td>
<td>18,333</td>
<td>$21,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steubenville</td>
<td>Sept. 14 - Oct. 26, 1913</td>
<td>22,391</td>
<td>7,872</td>
<td>$11,315.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cincinnati</td>
<td>Mar. 6 - May 1, 1921</td>
<td>401,247</td>
<td>14,000</td>
<td>$30,562.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dayton</td>
<td>Oct. 29 - Dec. 17, 1922</td>
<td>152,559</td>
<td>10,306</td>
<td>$18,651.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Liverpool</td>
<td>Nov. 4 - Dec. 16, 1928</td>
<td>21,411</td>
<td>1,000</td>
<td>$6,321.88</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. Taken from "Billy Sunday In Big Cities," The Literary Digest, XLVIII (April 4, 1914), 761; "Census By Election Board Gives Population 170,090," Toledo Blade, April 5, 1911, 1; and the 1920 and 1930 United States census reports as published in the World Almanac (N.Y., 1921 and 1931).

2. These figures, many of which differ among the sources, were taken from the current newspapers of the various cities.
Appendix II

Participating Churches And Pastors In The Columbus Campaign

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Church</th>
<th>Pastor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baptist:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First</td>
<td>T. F. Chambers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memorial</td>
<td>James Hall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russell Street</td>
<td>W. G. Stevenson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tenth Avenue</td>
<td>A. E. Isaac</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brethren:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brethren</td>
<td>H. E. Epply</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christian:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First</td>
<td>John Halfaker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Church of Christ:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broad Street</td>
<td>George P. Rutledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chicago Avenue</td>
<td>C. A. Klieburger</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South</td>
<td>R. F. Strickler</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wilson Avenue</td>
<td>J. J. Tisdall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congregational:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mayflower</td>
<td>T. Derrick</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North</td>
<td>W. E. Bovey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plymouth</td>
<td>W. A. Warren</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Washington Avenue</td>
<td>R. Thomas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evangelical:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emmanuel</td>
<td>E. F. George</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friends:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Highland Avenue</td>
<td>William Kirby</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methodist Episcopal:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broad Street</td>
<td>H. W. Kellogg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Como Avenue</td>
<td>S. A. McNeilan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First</td>
<td>Luther Freeman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German</td>
<td>C. E. Ploch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gift Street</td>
<td>W. H. Miller</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glenwood</td>
<td>P. E. White</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grace</td>
<td>Howard Wright</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indianola</td>
<td>Charles E. Chandler</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>King Avenue</td>
<td>T. H. Campbell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madison Avenue</td>
<td>Otto Giesen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morgan Memorial</td>
<td>J. A. Currier</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mt. Vernon</td>
<td>John F. Grimes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neil Avenue</td>
<td>J. W. Atkinson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North</td>
<td>James H. Eason</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

154
Appendix II (continued)

Methodist Episcopal:
Oakwood
Shepard
South High Street
Third Avenue
Third Street
Thurman Avenue
Wesley Chapel
West Park Avenue

Methodist Protestant:
First
Grace

Presbyterian:
Broad Street
Central
First
Hoge Memorial
Nelson Memorial
Northminster
St. Clair Avenue
Welsh
West Broad Street
West Second Avenue

Reformed:
Reformed

United Brethren:
Avondale Avenue
Grace
St. Clair Avenue
Washington Avenue

United Evangelical:
Miller Avenue
St. Pauls
Wesley Avenue

United Presbyterian:
First
Neil Avenue

J. T. Keenan
Rev. Graham
N. D. Creamer
Thomas W. Locke
A. R. Connell
J. A. Shirer
W. E. Fetch
P. H. Chappelear
H. F. Gould
E. D. Beck
S. S. Palmer
J. T. Britan
John W. Day
J. H. Hatfield
(pastorate vacant)
William Hindman
(pastorate vacant)
John R. Johns
W. A. Perrins
Joseph G. Grabiel
Melvin E. Beck
A. J. Wagner
J. H. Harris
W. E. Reibel
J. G. Spears
L. M. Boyer
N. D. Shults
H. V. Summers
J. A. Speer
J. G. King

"Taken from, "Sixty Churches To Co-Operate In Sunday Meetings,"
Columbus Dispatch, December 25, 1912, 3."
Appendix III

Schedule of Columbus Revival Activities For Week Of
January 28 Thru February 2, 1913

Tuesday, January 28

Afternoon - Service at Tabernacle, Rev. Mr. Peacock.

7 P.M. - Service at Tabernacle, Rev. Mr. Sunday. Seats reserved for
3,000 Modern Woodmen of the World who are to march to
the tabernacle with brass band.

Wednesday, January 29

9 A.M. - Service at the Ohio Penitentiary, Rev. Mr. Sunday.

11:50 A.M. - Shop Meetings:

Gwynn Milling Company, Rev. William Asher and
W. H. Collison.
Columbus Chair Works, Rev. J. J. Tisdall
Oak Street Car Barns, Rev. Peacock and Homer Rodeheaver.
Perma Drug Company and Miller Printing Company,
Mrs. William Asher.
Hocking Valley Shops, to be decided.

11:30 A.M. to 1 P.M. - Business Women's Rally at Wesley Chapel,
Miss Frances Miller.

2 P.M. - Service at Tabernacle, Rev. Mr. Sunday.

7:30 P.M. - Service at Tabernacle, Rev. Mr. Sunday.

Thursday, January 30

10 A.M. - Meeting with Ohio State University Faculty at the home
of President William Oxley Thompson, Rev. Mr. Sunday.

11:15 A.M. - Meeting for Students of Bliss Business College,
Mrs. William Asher.

11:50 A.M. - Shop Meetings:

Kilbourne and Jacobs Plant, Rev. S. S. Palmer.
Columbus Iron and Steel Works, Rev. H. L. Bremner.
American Cash Register Company, Rev. W. A. Warren.
Appendix III (continued)

Thursday, January 30

West Broad Street Car Barns, Rev. Mr. Peacock and Homer Rodeheaver.
Panhandle Shops, to be decided.
Wolfe Shoe Company, Mrs. William Asher.

11:30 A.M. to 1 P.M. - Business Women's Rally at Wesley Chapel.

2 P.M. - Service at Tabernacle, Rev. Mr. Sunday.

7:30 P.M. - Service at Tabernacle, Rev. Mr. Sunday.

Friday, January 31

11:50 A.M. - Shop Meetings:

Smith Shoe Company, Rev. Mr. Peacock and Homer Rodeheaver,
Columbus Carriage and Harness Company and
Johnson Manufacturing Company, combined,
Columbus Aspetic Furniture Company, Rev. Chambers.
M. C. Lilley Company, Mrs. William Asher.
Panhandle Freight House, to be decided.

11:30 A.M. to 1 P.M. - Business Women's Rally at Wesley Chapel.

2 and 7 P.M. - Women Only Services at Tabernacle, Rev. Mr. Sunday.
(Actually, a record-breaking three women only services were held on this day.)

4 P.M. - Meeting of Ohio State University Students at the
University Gymnasium, Rev. Mr. Sunday.

7 P.M. - Men Only Service at Memorial Hall, Rev. Mr. Peacock.

Saturday, February 1

12 noon - Sunday School Parade.

2 P.M. - Service at Tabernacle, Rev. Mr. Sunday.

7 P.M. - Service at Tabernacle, Rev. Mr. Sunday.
Appendix III (continued)

Sunday, February 2

10:30 A.M. - Service at Tabernacle, Rev. Mr. Sunday.

2 P.M. - Men Only Service at Tabernacle, Rev. Mr. Sunday.

2 P.M. - Women Only Service at Memorial Hall, Miss Frances Miller.

7 P.M. - Service at Tabernacle, Rev. Mr. Sunday.

*Taken from, "Here's Program of Sunday Meetings," The Columbus Citizen, January 28, 1913, 1.
Appendix IV

Sunday Converts Received By The Columbus Churches*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Church</th>
<th>Before Feb. 23</th>
<th>Feb. 23</th>
<th>Mar. 2</th>
<th>Mar. 9</th>
<th>Mar. 23</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baptist</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tenth Avenue</td>
<td>42</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First</td>
<td>52</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russell Street</td>
<td>200</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memorial</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Church Of Christ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Fourth Avenue</td>
<td>132</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broad Street</td>
<td>70</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South</td>
<td>117</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fourth Avenue</td>
<td></td>
<td>38</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Side</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>23</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wilson Avenue</td>
<td>167</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chicago Avenue</td>
<td>60</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congregational:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plymouth</td>
<td>77</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North</td>
<td>121</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mayflower</td>
<td>21</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Washington Avenue</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evangelical:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emmanuel</td>
<td>40</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Paul United</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wesley Avenue</td>
<td>30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methodist Episcopal:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glenwood</td>
<td>231</td>
<td>131</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>362</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakwood</td>
<td>174</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>King Avenue</td>
<td>365</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>40</td>
<td></td>
<td>530</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Park Avenue</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>24</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>431</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third Avenue</td>
<td>470</td>
<td>65</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>540</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wesley Chapel</td>
<td>197</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>34</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grace</td>
<td>169</td>
<td>70</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>339</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indianola</td>
<td>200</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neil Avenue</td>
<td>230</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gift</td>
<td>254</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summit Avenue</td>
<td>150</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mt. Vernon Avenue</td>
<td>318</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broad Street</td>
<td>83</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First</td>
<td>154</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South High Street</td>
<td>174</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

159
Appendix IV (continued)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Church</th>
<th>Before Feb. 23</th>
<th>Feb. 23</th>
<th>Mar. 2</th>
<th>Mar. 9</th>
<th>Mar. 23</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Methodist Episcopal:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Como Avenue</td>
<td>128</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linden</td>
<td>98</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morgan Memorial</td>
<td>90</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South High Street</td>
<td>172</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thurman Avenue</td>
<td>157</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madison Avenue</td>
<td>55</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third Street</td>
<td>64</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shepard</td>
<td>152</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methodist Protestant:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First</td>
<td>116</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grace</td>
<td>116</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presbyterian:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Second Avenue</td>
<td>114</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broad Street</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nelson Memorial</td>
<td>81</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hoge Memorial</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>47</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Broad Street</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>121</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First</td>
<td>110</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northminster</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Brethren:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fifth Avenue</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Clair Avenue</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avondale Avenue</td>
<td>76</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Presbyterian:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neil Avenue</td>
<td>42</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reformed Church</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Taken from the following:

"Churches Continue To Grow In Membership," The Ohio State Journal, March 10, 1913, 2.
"Churches Get Converts, Due To Big Revival," The Ohio State Journal, February 21, 1913, 1, 3.
"Gains Continue in Churches Of City," The Ohio State Journal, March 3, 1913, 2.
"New Members Received Sunday," The Columbus Citizen, February 24, 1913, 1.
"Over 500 More New Converts Join Local Churches Sunday," The Columbus Citizen, March 10, 1913, 4."
Appendix V

Characteristic Prayer Given By Billy Sunday At Columbus*

Oh, Jesus, isn't this a great spectacle? This must make you smile, Jesus. I know it does me. And devil, this sight must make you growl. I can hear you saying, 'What's Bill Sunday doing up there? Look at that crowd of 10,000 people standing because they're sorry they broke any of God's commandments. We've got to get busy or we'll lose thousands. Come on all you devils, get out of hell and up there to Columbus. Get out I say.' And Jesus, I'll bet all those devils are trembling when they look up here, and I'll bet all the angels in heaven are rejoicing and shouting with joy. I can see mothers and fathers up there saying, 'Get back, Moses, get back Solomon, get back David, you haven't got any children down there. Let me look and see if my boy or girl is in that audience. Yes, there she is down in section 27; yes, there is my boy over by post 14; thank God for that.' And, oh Jesus, if any preacher here tonight has got cold feet, help him to stiffen up, give him a backbone so he can fight for you. And, Jesus, bless these preachers, thank them for deepening the spirit here tonight. Bless all the newspaper boys who are giving us such wonderful reports. Bless all in their offices that we met the other day - all of the clerks, stenographers, printers, pressmen, and from the men that own the papers down to the boys that sell the papers on the street. And, Jesus, bless this choir, bless the ushers, bless Chief Carter, Mayor Korb, Governor Harmon and the incoming Governor Jimmie Cox; help the state officials, Jesus. And bless this old state and this city and may we have a rousing time here, especially with the students and teachers next Thursday night. Guide us and keep us for your sake, Jesus, amen, amen, amen, and amen. Good night.

*Taken from, "Billy, In Prayer, Says Devil Growls When 10,000 Confess Their Wrongs," The Columbus Citizen, January 6, 1913, 2.
Bibliography

Biographies and General Histories


Periodicals

Allen, Ernest B. "Toledo Two Years After." The Congregationalist and Christian World, XCIII (April 24, 1913), 566.

"Billy Sunday Analyzed by a Psychologist." Current Opinion, LXIII (December, 1917), 404.

"Billy Sunday Assailed By Leaders Of Three Denominations." Current Opinion, LXII (May, 1917), 341.

"Billy Sunday In Big Cities." The Literary Digest, XL (April 14, 1914), 761.

"'Billy' Sunday Sympathetically Interpreted." Current Opinion, LVI (May, 1914), 369-70.
"Billy Sunday's Greatest Campaign." The Literary Digest, XLVI (March 15, 1913), 576.


"Evangelism As A Means To Reform: Some Results of Sunday's Campaigns In Columbus and Erie." The Missionary Review, XXVI (June, 1913), 433-441.


"Pole of the Religious Press on Billy Sunday." The Literary Digest, L (June 12, 1915), 1,404.

"Religion With A Punch." The Nation, XCVIII (March 19, 1914), 287.


Newspapers

The Canton News-Democrat, December 28, 1911 through March 4, 1912.

The Cincinnati Enquirer, May 2, 1921.

Cincinnati Post, March 5 through May 2, 1921.

Cleveland Plain Dealer, November 7, 1935.

The Columbus Citizen, November 13, 1912 through March 10, 1913.

Columbus Dispatch, December 15 through December 27, 1912.

Dayton Daily News, December 18, 1922.
Dayton Journal, October 15 through December 18, 1922.
East Liverpool Review, November 5 through December 17, 1928.
The Elyria Chronicle-Telegram, January 3 through February 25, 1929.
The Lima Times-Democrat, February 18 through April 10, 1911.
The Ohio State Journal, December 11, 1912 through March 18, 1913.
Portsmouth Blade, January 4 through February 15, 1911.
The Salem News, September 16, 1912.
The Springfield Times, September 29 through November 10, 1911.
The Steubenville Herald, December 11, 1913.
The Steubenville Weekly Gazette, September 18 through December 1, 1913.
Toledo Blade, April 4 through May 29, 1911.
Wellsville Daily Union, September 12 through November 4, 1912.
The Youngstown Vindicator, January 3 through February 28, 1910.

Special Publications
Some Truths Concerning The Billy Sunday Campaigns. Columbus, Ohio:
The Columbus Evangelistic Association, September, 1912.

Monographs
Carnegie, Dale. Five Minute Biographies. New York: Greenberg
Sunday, William A. Burning Truths From Billy's Hat. Philadelphia:

Reference Works
Persons, Frederick T. Dictionary of American Biography. New York:
Charle~n Scribner's Sons, 1946, XXI, 679.