BEETHOVEN'S INFLUENCE ON SCHUBERT'S SONG LITERATURE

A Thesis Presented for the
Degree of Master of Arts

by

Robert H. Kuhlman, B. Sc. in Educ.

OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY

THE OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY

1945

Approved by:

[Signature]
ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The writer wishes to express grateful appreciation to Mr. Louis H. Diercks, Professor of Vocal Music, for the inspiration, valuable suggestions, and constructive criticisms which have made possible the preparation and completion of this thesis.

R. H. K.
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>IV</td>
<td>Analyses</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>An den Mond</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gesänge des Harfners</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Wer sich der Einsamkeit Ergiebt</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Wer nie sein Brod mit Thranen ass</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nachstuck</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Emma</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Todes-musik</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Erlafsee</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Am Strom</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>An die Leyer</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>An Mignon</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kennst du das Land?</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTRODUCTION

Many passages of Schubert's songs seem to bear a marked resemblance to passages from Beethoven scores. In a study of the songs of Schubert, one finds instances where the accompaniments of the songs are quite similar in pattern, mood, and harmonic treatment to the Beethoven Sonata Opus 27, Number 2, which is popularly known as the "Moonlight Sonata."

It is this similarity of the Schubert songs to the "Moonlight Sonata" which prompted this investigation. Other instances of similarity in the compositions of the two men may be found, but the tremendous productivity of both writers makes a comprehensive analysis of all their scores extremely difficult. Neither has the writer discovered in their compositions other instances where the similarity of treatment of ideas is so strikingly alike.

Consequently this study has been limited to a discussion of the Beethoven Sonata Opus 27, Number 2, with its resemblance to, and influence on the eleven songs of Schubert which are chosen for their notable similarity in musical ideas and treatment.

This thesis involves a study of the place of Schubert in music history, a study of the social aspects of Schubert's life (from as near a contemporary viewpoint as possible), and an analysis of the scores in question, all of which seem to have a direct bearing on the probable influence of Beethoven on the song literature of Schubert.
CHAPTER I

SCHUBERT - HIS MUSIC

He bade poetry sound and music speak, not as mistress and maid, but as sisters the two embraced above Schubert's heart.

- Grillparzer's Sketch for an Epitaph for Schubert

Franz Schubert is first representative of the romantic school which succeeded Beethoven. He was active in every field of musical art, but was at his best in the writing of the song or Lied. Schumann once declared that was the one field in which truly notable progress had been made since Beethoven. Thus Schubert stands in a peculiar place in musical history - the connecting link between the classic school of Haydn, Mozart and Beethoven, from which school he received his training, and the romantic school of Schumann, Mendelssohn, and Chopin, which school Schubert established.

Schubert's life was one of frequent hardships; disappointments, and poverty. His early, cheerless training was obtained in the Imperial Convict School for educating choristers for the imperial court chapel.

---

2 Ibid., p. 575.
3 Ibid., p. 575.

In this and subsequent chapters, when using facts with which a person well read in music history will be acquainted, I have seldom thought it necessary to cite authority. If the reader is not already
There his schooling was carried on according to the most strict and classical lines. Sir Geo. Grove, in his biography of Schubert, informs us that there was participation in an orchestra which daily practiced the symphonies of Haydn, Mozart, Krommer, Kozeluch, Weber, Cherubini, and Beethoven. The Lied or Song form in which Schubert attained his greatest degree of artistry was non-existent. The coldness and poverty in which he lived certainly did little to advance his powers to write the charming, warm, and romantic Lied. Yet, despite these adverse conditions, he became the monumental figure in song composition. He was a born romanticist.

(cont. from preceding page)
apprised of them, any authoritative music history will substantiate them.


5 The term "romanticism" particularly in its connection with Schubert, is excellently explained by Mason in his article "Franz Schubert, Romanticist."

It (Romanticism) is a term describing a kind of music the chief concern of which is with special expression, with particular, isolated effects. In classical music emotion is general, pervasive, unparticularized, and sensuous effect is kept everywhere subordinate to the entire scheme of design. Salient, individually conspicuous elements, whether sensuous or emotional, are rare....Romanticism seeks more striking features, even if they are less satisfactorily interfused. Sensuously, for example, romanticism, as practiced by the composers after Beethoven, meant increasing interest in charming effects of color, gained largely either by lavish use of chromatic harmony or by ingenious mixtures of different tone qualities or timbers....Emotionally, it meant concern with lyrical rather than epical ranges of feeling, emphasis on each special feeling in its unique quality rather than on harmony of all. Structurally, its results were negative rather than positive; it meant here, a reversion to simple types of design, a loss of the complexity of organization that had been Beethoven's supreme glory, and a substitution for it of the song forms of Schubert. Behind all these changes...stood the desire for increased specialization
The general public, from time immemorial has been loath to accept anything new in the field of art. Schubert, as a romanticist and innovator, was ignored during his lifetime by critics and public alike. The few who did take notice were most unsympathetic and at times vicious in their criticisms of the man and his music. Only a few great musicians and poets of his day were appreciative of the value of his work. Even Goethe, the first German poet to revive the cultivation of the lied, and whose writings Schubert used as subjects for some of the world's most beautiful music, ignored him.6

Beethoven was one of the few leading figures of the day who came to appreciate the value of Schubert's compositions, and even that recognition came late in Beethoven's life. Whether Schubert was personally acquainted with Beethoven during his lifetime is questionable (see Chapter III). But in any event, Beethoven, like so many others, paid little attention to him.

Beethoven lived a lonely and suspicious life, surrounded by a little group of attentive, worshiping men, and naturally could have known very little about Schubert's works, or given them any praise

(cont. from preceding page)
of expression. Romanticism is thus in essence merely the modern tendency to specialize, to individuate, in the sphere of art.

6

During the rich song years of 1815 and 1816, friends persuaded Schubert to send Goethe, with an appropriate dedication, some forty odd settings of his poetry he had already made - the "Erlking" among them. Goethe, who was in the habit of receiving poems and compositions from young and unknown people did not even bother to reply.
which would have brought them into favor with the public.

Schubert probably had no idea that he was treading new paths or exploring the way between classicism or romanticism - there was as yet no romantic school with which he could identify himself. He was merely writing from an impulse to create music that motivated his entire life. Certainly, the romantic school had already arisen in literature under the inspiration of Wadenrocker and E.T.A. Hoffmann, and later Goethe, but Hoffmann, who was one of the leading figures in the rise of Romanticism in poetry, wrote music in the classic style similar to Mozart.  

Schubert naturally followed in the footsteps of the romantic school of poetry because these romantic poets (Goethe especially) had taken roots in the lied which had fallen in the class of the common people, and had touched it with their genius. It was into this class of common people or the Bourgeoisess that Schubert was born and spent his life. Mozart and Beethoven were not interested in this type of literature as a basis for musical creation, neither was the song for single voice and piano especially favored by these composers. Schubert, however, stemmed from a different class, and found in this literature a natural media for his talents.

It is perfectly natural that the departure from classicism should have developed, not in a spectacular form such as the symphony, but in the intimate lied. Nothing could be more personal than the lied,  

---

in which the two personalities of the singer and accompanist are fused. Here the accompanist is raised to an equal rank with the singer, and is equally as important as an interpretative artist. The pianist is no longer a slave to the wishes of a singer, but an interpreter of a score intimately connected with the vocal melody. The piano score contains the color and motifs which are interwoven with the melodic line.

The famous baritone, Johann Vogel, and Schubert were the first pair to interpret vocal music in this sense. This break from tradition could have only come from a singer who was not the conventional operatic singer of the day. During Schubert's time all Vienna was enraptured with the operatic school exemplified by Rossini, where all emphasis was placed on pyrotechnical display of vocal techniques, and interest in the beauty of the voice for itself alone as in the celebrated school of "bel canto." Vogel was a dramatic baritone whose vocal beauty lay in his declamatory and expressive powers rather than in sensuous beauty or vocal displays. Vogel, realizing the importance of a new approach to the singing of these songs in a new media, wrote,

Nothing else has so openly revealed the lack of a practical method of singing as Schubert's songs. How else could...these products of a musical second sight, have failed to create a tremendous impression throughout the musical world? How many would otherwise not have realized perhaps, for the first time, what is meant by speech: poetry in tones, words in harmony, thought garbed in music?  

---

Schubert took new interest in the romantic literature because he was essentially a man of sentiment. His songs are the outpourings of such a nature - a preference for short compositions, a love for frequent changes from major to minor in one brief composition; his aimless existence in the beer garden world of Vienna; his devotion to daydream and reverie; and his indolence and fondness for beer which resulted in the sponginess of physique which gave him the nickname of "Schwammerl" - all indicate a man of vivid emotions, temperament and sentiment. This background was responsible for the "type of solo song which, while tuneful and musically delightful, yet seizes characteristically the meaning and flavour of the poem and expresses these aptly."

Schubert is essentially a lyric genius, and great development therefore foreign to his nature. In his writing we find none of the great technical workings of Beethoven who could take one dry subject, and by force of labor and concentration turn it into a composition of great scope and beauty, nor do we find the technical perfection and delicacy to be found in the writings of Mozart. Schubert's works are more like the outpourings of a gifted dreamer who is carried along irresistably by the current of his thoughts, while Beethoven reworked and moulded his idea until it was without a flaw. Schubert was mastered by a musical thought - Beethoven labored until he had mastered his thought.

---

Although this thesis is primarily concerned with Schubert's songs, a short reference to his instrumental compositions is necessary to better understand his connection with Beethoven's instrumental work.

Perhaps his greatest instrumental compositions are the Unfinished Symphony (No. 8), the D. Minor, and G. Major String Quartets, the String Quintet and the E. Major Symphony (No. 7). These compositions are the product of the mature Schubert, but in these, as in any of his songs, early or late, one finds the same lyric quality that permeates his compositions. Here again is found the personal, individualistic flavor of musical expression. As the songs of the classic writings bear a great similarity to symphonic writing, so do the symphonies and other orchestral writings of Schubert greatly resemble elaborated songs.

Previously mentioned was the transition from major to minor keys which Schubert used so fluently. A study of his writings will indicate the change is spontaneous and for color effects, while a study of the classicist's songs indicate no emotional colorings, all key relationships being resultant of a planned and designed composition. For a common example, compare the lovely "Serenade" of Schubert to the love impassioned, yet formal "An die ferne Geliebte" of Beethoven.

Most themes of Schubert's quartets and symphonies are essentially songs. In fact several quartets and quintets ("The Trout Quintet," op. 114 and "Death and the Maiden Quartet," No. 14,) have one of his songs as their basic theme.
This writing of chamber music on his song themes may well indicate a sense of frustration in Schubert. He was trying to prove to himself that he was a composer of worth. Song writers were never, perhaps, considered on equal footing with writers of larger forms. Schubert probably underestimated his own value and the value of his songs.

It will be seen, then, that in Schubert's greatness is also to be found his inherent weakness - the lack of material necessary to adequately complete an instrumental composition. Even, broad instrumental movements are founded on a substructure of song tunes. Schubert would be inspired with a beautiful melody, but after that was stated as a theme, there was no way for him to progress. His method was either to write another theme (usually as lyric as the first) or repeat the original melody with changes of accompaniments. For every one idea of development, there are pages of repetition. Dvorak, who was a most staunch and important defender of Schubert, suggests the omission of all repeats in his symphonies.10

His true greatness, then, lies in the development of the song, and the song-cycle which was original with him. Here was a long form of composition in which he was completely the master and in which he could write one lyric subject after another with no fear of deadly repetition. Although all the songs in his great cycle "Der Winterriesen" all bespeak the same coldness and melancholic grandeur, each song is a complete entity in itself, and the variety of poetic text completely

waylays any monotony, yet there is a continuity which binds them into a unified whole.

Musically, then, Schubert was an innovator and outcast during the era in which he lived. The very elements of his genius which have since resulted in his being placed on an equal musical footing with Beethoven, at that time caused him to be completely disregarded. To Schubert the one block in his path must have seemed to be Beethoven. In the Convict School Beethoven's Symphonies were studied as examples of successful music of a living composer. The public and critics accepted Beethoven and his music - even his songs, which to Beethoven were of minor importance, were revered by the public, while Schubert's songs, which were his most important works, were unaccepted, and the few times they were sung were attacked viciously by the critics (see Chapter II).

The major figure in the contemporary field at that time was Beethoven who was standing as an established composer, whose style of composition blocked Schubert's works at every turn from gaining popularity.
CHAPTER II

SCHUMANN - HIS LIFE

Most biographers and writers have pointed out that Schubert's writing was greatly influenced by Beethoven, but few writers have given concrete examples. Leichtentritt, in an article on Schubert's early operas, cites a few examples of similarity between Schubert's operatic passages and those of Beethoven, but none of the writers investigated have given concrete examples of the influence of Beethoven on any of Schubert's songs.

In a careful analysis of the available published Schubert songs, many passages seem to bear more than a coincidental likeness to the Beethoven Sonata Opus 27, number 2.

Before presenting any examples of the analysis of these songs, it seems wise to go back to contemporary critics of Schubert to study any social contacts and parallelisms in the lives of the two men which might influence Schubert's turning to Beethoven's works.¹

In making a review of periodical publications, it is interesting and important to note the complete lack of space devoted to Schubert. In periodicals published previous to 1880, there is practically no material available, while Pooles Index to Periodical Literature² lists

¹ Any reader who may not be interested in this background material may turn to Chapter IV.
only three articles written about Schubert prior to that time.

One article is very illuminating in its general tone, for instead of critically discussing his works, the article is mainly devoted to defending Schubert against adverse criticisms of the day. The essay was written in 1869 by Capes, an important critic of that period for the Fortnightly Review of Literature.3

Capes concedes that Schubert was strongly influenced by Beethoven but defends him by stating that the "worshipper" (Schubert) never lost his individuality of style in composition.4

Surprisingly enough, Capes' praise was mainly for Schubert's instrumental writings and scant praise for his song literature, which is in direct opposition to the general high regard for his songs which the world has since established. Concerning these songs, Capes writes,

> The majority of his works are unsaleable. His songs, in all their marvelous variety, are often nothing less than one unceasing rhythm of pathos and complaint.

This attitude was no doubt due to the fact that at that time only a very small portion of Schubert's songs had attracted attention, and those few which did were songs of heavy, sorrowful character. As Schubert himself wrote in his diary, "My songs spring from sorrow:

4 Schubert's longer compositions are deficient in unity and development. They abound in beauties of every kind, and the orchestral treatment is as delicate, as rich, and as appropriate as original. And moreover, whatever were the influences of Beethoven upon Schubert, who was his enthusiastic worshipper, the individuality of the worshipper was never for an instant obscured or injured.
only those which are the product of pain please the world."5

Few of the songs which now stand at the pinnacle of German Lieder were published at that time (1869). None of the important songs appeared in print before 1821, and as late as 1882, when Grove was writing the first adequate biography of Schubert to appear in print, a greater portion of his song literature was still in manuscript form.

To understand why Schubert was so grossly neglected, it is necessary to reconstruct a few of the conditions in which Schubert was living and writing. Most of Schubert's later biographers offer the explanation that Schubert was preceded and surrounded by musicians who were of such public prominence that Schubert could not hope to attract attention.6

Schubert was overshadowed by Rossini and Beethoven. He was young, modest, and unknown, and musicians did not hesitate to slight a symphony which they would have felt bound to study had it borne the name of Mozart or Beethoven.7

In addition, there was no great figure competent or enthusiastic enough to introduce Schubert's works to the musical world. Few, if any, from the Schubertian circle had any influence or connection with the aristocratic class as had Beethoven. When Schubert finally made

5 Capes, op. cit., p. 199.

6 Blame for neglect cannot be squarely placed on either public or publishers. Unlike Mozart and Beethoven, he was not a great virtuoso who could at once command public attention. He lacked the polish and finesse of the former and the strong indomitable will of the latter. Bernstein, Martin. Introduction to Music, p. 236.

7 Antonin Dvorak, op. cit., p. 343.
brief contact with the Esterhazy family in 1818, as a music teacher for the young countesses, his status in the household relegated him to the communes or servants' and retainers' quarters.

His very type of music, and the inferiority complex he retained all his life were constantly against the possibility of his succeeding. This lack of any unusual showing in the musical world resulted in the marked lack of any attention by the press which was as influential to the success of a musician then as it is today. The Vienna papers, so far as they took any notice of Schubert during his lifetime were generous enough in their praises, but Berlin and Leipzig took much longer to accept the innovator. This attitude was probably due to neglect, ignorance and clannishness. Even Beethoven had raged against "Du Leipziger Ochsen," who resented any innovation.

To the English speaking world, the songs were extremely foreign. In 1833, at one of the German Soirées given by the music publisher, Wessel, in London, William Gardines tells of hearing songs of Schubert (sic) a new author.

His "Erkönig" sung by Madam Schroeder certainly was a most terrific thing of its kind. The alarming intonation of the vocalist, and the awful thunder which the pianist put into the bass had a dramatic effect purely German.8

Fétis, in 1830, published a book of "Curiosités Historiques de la Musique," an article on "The actual state of music in Germany." The Greatest "Curiosity" about this article is the fact that

Schubert's name is nowhere mentioned and the only young composers referred to are Wolfram (1778-1830) and Mendelssohn. 9

The importance of this tragic neglect by the press is clearly emphasized in a letter of Schober to Schubert in 1824:

If only you could procure for yourself a few alarm drums in the shape of critics who would constantly without end talk about you in all the papers, it would probably work. I know some quite insignificant people who in such a manner have become famous and popular: why, then, should not you resort to it, who merits it in the highest degree? 10

Besides this complete overshadowing by other composers, there is another probable reason for his being so neglected by the public which most biographers overlook, or fail to mention.

The general circumstances of Schubert's life are well known and are similarly stated by all biographers - his poverty and precarious living conditions, and his bohemian, hand to mouth existence with his friends in Vienna. To later biographers this made him no less a musician or composer, and perhaps contributed to his greatness in depths of understanding. However to an early critic this placed an entirely different light on the popularity of Schubert. The opinion of a great many people seems to be reflected by a writer in an article in the "Edinburgh Review" of 1833. 11 This article was written as a criticism of Grove's long and enthusiastic biography of Schubert which was written for the first edition of Grove's Dictionary.

---

9 Ibid., p. 468.
10 Ibid., p. 468.
To the English speaking world, Grove had become the one champion and apostle of Schubert's music. His biographical account in his "Dictionary of Music and Musicians" was the first competent work on Schubert produced in English.

This article evoked a storm of criticism which was led with the loudest blast by a reviewer in The Edinburgh Review who greatly resented the enthusiastic and disproportionate space given Schubert in comparison with the space accorded Chopin and Liszt. The critic, whose name is not given, does not base his judgment on the musical products of Schubert, but rather on his carefree Bohemian existence, or of belonging to the bourgeoisie. He says that, "in the interest of true musical criticism" he thinks it desirable for readers not to share Grove's enthusiasm.

The article is entitled "Schubert, Chopin and Liszt" but at the outset the writer makes it clear that "juxtaposition of the three names here is suggested by recent publications of biographies and other literary notices, and not because of any supposed analogies in their genius or character."

Concerning Grove's article, the critic first takes issue with its length, claiming disproportionate prominence was given to Schubert, particularly in comparison to Chopin, "who is by far the greater artist."

The reviewer continues with the accusation that Grove was carried away by his own dusting off of early, unknown Schubert manuscripts, that he gives Schubert exaggerated value, and his opinion will lower the finest standards of music.
About Schubert himself, the author continues.

Schubert comes before us as almost the typical example of the self-taught genius, with the reservation, however, that he did not teach himself enough....In regards to his ideas about art, he seems to have had as nearly as possible none whatever.

The greatest criticism, however, is not about Schubert's music, but about his personal and social habits.

The entire article, while claiming to suggest extreme and thorough dislike of Schubert's song literature, is in reality a revolt against his personal life, which has led to a prejudiced evaluation of any of Schubert's compositions.

The critic makes one small concession by acknowledging that Schubert had sufficient constructive power to handle successfully the simple and limited form of song writing. But also informs us that "except in country parishes, people are now tired of Schubert's songs."

The critic, in addition, questions Schubert's moral relations with women of the servant class, and suggests even more openly at abnormal sexual relationships between the men commonly known as the "Schubertiads." If this was the prevailing attitude of people towards Schubert at this time, and it seems to have been so, the question naturally arises as to whether Schubert was neglected because of the complete overshadowing of Beethoven, Mozart, Haydn, Rossini, etc., as later biographers like to believe, or whether the important class distinctions of the day and the actual life in which
Schubert indulged kept his work from being accepted by critics and the public. Indeed, the latter seems to be much more the case, because the critic concludes,

That there is something radically wanting in Schubert's art is a conclusion to which we must almost desire to come.

In defense of the criticism leveled at Schubert by his early reviewers and critics, one need only to turn to his later biographers to find his life pictured in directly opposite and glowing tones of praise. Leichtentritt in his Music History and Ideas writes concerning Schubert,

Schubert moved all his life in the charming social life of the well-to-do-Viennese middle class.12

Contrast that with the critic of the Edinburgh Review who says that Schubert pigged together with his friends, who were born to the lowest class!

In an interesting and amusing article, "Schubert and the Eternal Feminine," Martens adds to the battle for the propriety of Schubert by stating that too many biographers prefer to bow in uncritical romantic adoration before the portrait of the stout, full-fleshed and full-blooded little man with prominent lips, who loved win and women as well as song.13

Perhaps now we can come to a sane and sensible evaluation of Schubert and his works. First let us consider the most derogatory article about Schubert – that in the Edinburgh Review. Here the critic was primarily not evaluating Schubert's songs, but judging

12 Hugo Leichtentritt, Music History and Ideas, p.
the man himself in the light of his own personal moralistic (and quite
idealistic) code. Contrast the life of the conservative and class-
conscious Scot in the late Nineteenth Century and the life of the
Middle Class Viennese during the early part of the century — how
totally unlike and at opposite poles they are! Here prudishness and
all the proprieties of the Victorian Age were making a last-ditch
stand against the greatness of Schubert. It was impossible for the
Victorian Age, or for that matter any country other than Germany, to
understand and appreciate the truly romantic German School which
Schubert in music and Heine in poetry so fully developed.

Is it any wonder that the English critic Wessel, on first hearing
of the work, refers to the "Erlking" as the most "terrific thing of
its kind" and "having a dramatic effect purely German?" Here then
lies one of the important keys to the neglect and unpopularity of
Schubert's works. The Viennese aristocracy and ruling class, who
played such an important role in the advancement of Beethoven's,
Mozart's, and Rossini's works, ignored Schubert. He was of the
bourgeois class and wrote songs set to poems which concerned them-
selves with the simple, more rustic and emotionally romantic life.
This life could only be understood and fully enjoyed by that class of
Viennese themselves. To the outside world the "effect was purely
German" and was incomprehensible to them. The universality of art,
music and literature was then a thing of the future, as was the
development and appreciation of the romantic school.
This bourgeois mode of living in which Schubert indulged would naturally be completely foreign to the natures of the critics of the day.

In France and England, Schubert was also ignored. In the French papers, Schubert was never mentioned before his death, and the close of his life was only mentioned by a solitary line in "Petis Revue Musicale."14

Schubert's music was not of the colorful dramatic type of Mozart and Rossini, whose brilliant stage works could be transported to any country with mounting success. His greatest vocal music was suitable only for recital purposes, and consequently was not presented to the public with the brilliance and fanfare of an operatic performance. The songs had to be translated into another language, either French, English, or Italian, since the singers of the day sang either in their native tongue or in Italian.

Even today with expert translators and many revisions, how many Schubert songs lose their color, power, and mood when translated into English? These are songs in which the music and text are inseparable, and the early translations into French or Italian were hopelessly inadequate and frequently lost the mood and context of the original poem entirely.

Another, and perhaps the most important consideration in the failure of Schubert's songs to gain importance, were performances of the

---

singers who were obviously incapable of singing the songs intelligently or adequately. To project a song with any semblance of adequacy, a vocalist must first understand every line and phrase of both the music and text, and must believe in the music he is singing. From the early reports of the critics, few English, French or Italian singers could have possibly understood or appreciated these songs which are so truly German and romantic in their scope. Even the German singers themselves, trained along the traditional classic lines, were incapable of coping with the new medium. Is it any wonder that the "Erlking" failed to impress a London audience when Madam Schroeder sang with "alarming intonation?"

In this connection, we find one Schubertiad, who, instead of helping Schubert undermine his own reputation by indulging with him in his carefree life, actually greatly advanced the cause of Schubert's music in Germany. That person was Michael Vogel, one of the greatest dramatic baritones of his time. He was at first apathetic to Schubert's songs, but nevertheless studied them assiduously, and soon became one of the most enthusiastic promoters of his music.

Vogel was one of the few prominent and influential men who showed interest and sympathy concerning Schubert's music. Had it not been for Vogel, and his truly effective and sympathetic performances of the songs, the neglect of Schubert would have been still more complete. However, Vogel himself was not above making improvements in Schubert's manuscript which has resulted in no little confusion in later published scores.
It seems quite natural for the songs to fail to succeed when the singers of the day had little or no conception of the style of composition, and whose training was along such a completely different style of singing that alone fitted them for singing in the bel canto style. Schubert had captured an effect which all writers previous to that time had missed - an effect that is an essential principal of song writing - that of determining what feature of a song should be present at all times. The bel canto school was not interested in the mood or dramatic text of a song. There the interest in the vocal line lay merely as a show piece or setting for the voice.

Publishers and performers alike wanted nothing to do with so young and unrecognized a composer. When his compositions were brought to the attention of publishers, they were often confused with the writing of a Dresden musician of the same name. This Franz Schubert of Dresden was a Saxan Court Musician; and in this position was more influential and well known than the poor Schubert of Vienna. This Dresden Schubert's one small claim to fame remains in a short stude L'Abeille (The Bee). When a manuscript of "Der Erlkonig" was sent to Breitkopf and Hartel with the hope of publication, they in turn wrote to Schubert of Dresden to ask him what to do with this "wild stuff." The Dresden composer was infuriated and answered that he had never composed "Der Erlkonig" but would do his utmost to discover who was guilty of misusing his good name for such a patchwork.15

Socially then, Schubert belonged to the class of people who were not accepted by the influential and ruling class of Vienna of that period, and neither was his class considered at all important.

Without the support of the moneyed class, Schubert could not hope to gain recognition as a composer. This social barrier in turn resulted in Schubert's indulging in a life which was at times crude and vulgar, and which thoroughly shocked the critics and public a few years later.

This ruling class, from which Schubert's only hope of financial success or fame could come, had accepted Beethoven and held him in high esteem. Here again stood the man who represented everything Schubert desired - fame, financial security, and equal footing with the musically important figures of the time, overshadowing and obscuring Schubert.
CHAPTER III

SCHUBERT AND BEETHOVEN

Whether Schubert and Beethoven were friends during their lifetime, or whether Schubert was unknown to Beethoven except for a brief period during his last illness is a battle that has been fought long and hard by critics and biographers, and still seems to be raging. An investigation into this relationship is important in determining the probable influence of Beethoven on these songs of Schubert which so literally follow the Opus 64 Sonata.

Both lived in Vienna where St. Stephens Cathedral was the focal point of life, and it seems impossible that the two men would not have encountered each other at every turn. Yet there is hardly mention of their having met. Although the two men lived within the same city walls, they lived in two different worlds. For the explanation of this unusual situation, it is necessary to understand the city of Vienna in the early nineteenth century.

Vienna at that period was a gay cheerful city, little disturbed by the terrors of the Revolution which shook the rest of Europe. On one hand there was the aristocracy who devoted much time to pursuit of the arts, particularly music. To this class the great trinity of music, Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven, had given their great compositions. This aristocracy cultivated music, maintained their own orchestras, and at times developed into extremely competent and thoroughly schooled musicians themselves. This class, with their
money and power lived in a world to themselves and had little time or interest for the man who wrote songs of nature and the simple elements of life. In at least a hundred songs of Schubert's, he has represented the life of water in river, lake, or sea, as no one else has represented it. These compositions held little interest to the men of wealth and power.

Instead, Schubert belonged to the townsfolk or bourgeois class who delighted in drinking and merry making in taverns, and who lived a carefree, financially unsure existence. Schubert was constantly surrounded by such a group - Moritz Von Schwind, Kupelwieser, Spann, etc. - who were very gay when money was available, and when cash was lacking, which was far more often the case, starved together.

Schindler relates how Schubert, on one occasion, is supposed to have visited Beethoven; but when Beethoven offered a suggestion for a minor change in scoring, Schubert fled from the house in embarrassment. 1

In Nohl's article he quotes Joseph Huttenbrenner, one of Schubert's personal friends, as saying that Schubert told him by word of mouth that he had not met Beethoven at all on this occasion but had handed his music to a servant. 2

Kreissle, who wrote the first Schubert biography, states that Schindler presented Beethoven with a collection of Schubert's lieder.

---

2 Ibid., p. 557
Beethoven was at that time tortured with illness that ended fatally. At that time Beethoven knew only five songs of Schubert's and was astonished at the quality of the songs set before him. Beethoven then prophesied that "Schubert would yet make a great noise in the world" and regretted "that he had not made his acquaintance at an earlier date."  

Spann also is credited with quoting Schubert as saying "I am sorry that Beethoven was so unapproachable and that I never spoke to him."  

In direct contrast to this is the statement of Ferdinand Schubert, Franz's brother, who said, "He often met Beethoven, whom he revered, and who often expressed his great appreciation for his songs, though the fact does not justify his being called, as he so often has been called, a Beethoven pupil."  

This statement in itself seems to be a defense of opinion of the day that Schubert was merely a follower of Beethoven and of no great musical importance. 

Whether Beethoven and Schubert were actually acquainted is not nearly as important as the influence Beethoven's music had upon Schubert's creative efforts. It is certain that Schubert, who was twenty-seven years younger than Beethoven, held him in great esteem.

---

3 Ibid., p. 557.
4 Ibid., p. 560
5 Ibid., p. 557.
In his early days at the convic, Schubert became familiar with Beethoven's first symphonies and developed an enthusiasm which lasted his entire lifetime. When Schubert was seventeen he pawned his books to obtain the price of admission to a performance of "Fidelio." This operatic performance evidently inspired Schubert greatly, because it was soon after that he wrote his first opera "Des Teufels Lustschloss." Leichtentritt, in writing "Schubert's Early Operas," states that the first act duet is dominated in tone by the beginning of Beethoven's "Fidelio." The beginning of the second act has definitely been inspired by the introduction to the second "Fidelio" act. The famous duet in the second act was without a doubt the model for Schubert's duet "Hab ich dich wieder Seliger Traum." This is followed by a three-part canon in imitation of the Fidelio canon.\textsuperscript{6} (In defense of this rather adolescent work, one could ask, what other great master could have produced a competent and mature operatic work at the age of seventeen?)

These obvious similarities cannot be disregarded where the final reckoning of the source of some of Schubert's musical ideas are concerned.

Another striking example is the beginning of the development section of the C. Major Symphony which strongly suggests Beethoven's Hymn of Joy.

\textsuperscript{6} Leichtentritt, "Schubert's Early Operas." \textit{Musical Quarterly, op. cit.}, p. 622.
As has been noted in Chapter I, the greatness of Schubert lay in his lyric genius, so is it any wonder that one of the most lyric and melodious of Beethoven's beautiful sonatas for the piano should not have attracted Schubert as few others would do. It is by far the most popular with the layman today, who are attracted to it because of its beautiful melodic line and lyric, romantic qualities. This obvious color of the composition has gained for it the universal name of "Moonlight." Would it not be logical for Schubert to find in this sonata the basis for the following songs, all of which are essentially romantic in character? The mood of Sonata 67 fits the basic mood of any one of the poems of the songs or sections of the poems which have been set to the arpeggio figure. There was no need to copy the literal melody; Schubert found melodies as spontaneous outpourings. But in the basic color and mood, the bass figures, accompaniments, and chord progression - there Schubert could find the exact needs for his music.
CHAPTER IV
ANALYSES

Herein will be presented examples of Schubert songs which seem to derive from the Beethoven Sonata Opus 27, Number 2.

AN DEN MOND

This song contains the most striking examples of the similarity of Schubert’s scores to that of the Beethoven Sonata Opus 27, Number 2. Is it a coincidence that this song should be entitled "To the Moon," while the sonata to which it has many similarities has been named "Moonlight Sonata?"

"An den Mond" was written in 1815, one of Schubert’s most productive years in song composition. The poem which inspired the song is a lush, romantic, and sorrowful poem by Hoolty. Here is an excellent example of the lack of discretion on Schubert’s part to choose worthy poetry for his creative efforts.

In viewing the two compositions, one notices immediately the similarity of structure, time signatures, and rhythmic patterns. "An den Mond" is in 12/8 time with a structure and mood that indicates a slow andante tempo. The Sonata Opus 27 is in 4/4 time and is marked adagio. The Beethoven score is built on a three note arpeggio pattern in a triplet figure that for all practical purposes makes it 12/8.
The arpeggio which runs throughout the sonata also is used in a very great portion of the song which gives the two an identical flow and feeling. This arpeggio pattern is found in both scores in the treble, in a range centering around middle C, while the bass has open octave movement in both scores. These octave passages usually occur with every second arpeggio.

Harmonically, the first striking factor is the use of the bII chord or Neapolitan, which is recurrently found in both compositions. The Neapolitan has always been one of the outstandingly recognizable features of the "Moonlight Sonata," and it is equally prominent in "An den Mond."

The following example clearly shows the use of the bII by both composers.
AN DEN MOND

(Example I)
AN DEN MOND

(Example II)
In these two illustrations notice the similarity of arpeggio patterns, and the use of the BII on the heavy beat of the measure. Another striking feature is the melodic pattern of the sonata which is repeated identically in the Schubert score, but has been transferred to the tenor line.

Beethoven  \( C - A^\# - B \)

Schubert  \( C^b - A^\# - B^b \)

This sequence occurs twice in the Schubert score - in measure eight and nine, and in measure thirty-three and thirty-four.
In this sequence the arpeggio figure and the rhythmic patterns are similar. Here we find an identical progression in the bass with both scores resolving identically.
This passage of the Schubert song again employs the same arpeggio pattern, but is another inversion. Here a truly amazing progression is identical:

$$1\frac{1}{2} - 1 - 1\frac{1}{2} - \frac{1}{2} - 2 \text{ steps}$$

This progression is found in both the Schubert and Beethoven scores.
AN DEN MOND

(Example V)

This example is found at the close of the song. Here again the arpeggio pattern is consistent throughout. Notice the similarity of resolution with the identical bass progression.

In the Schubert score we find the 7th of the V7 chord in the soprano, while Beethoven uses the tone in the alto and resolves it to the soprano.
The "Moonlight Sonata" was published in 1802 while "An den Mond" was not written until 1815. Previous to that year Schubert had already expressed his extreme admiration for Beethoven, and was beginning to despair of having his own works accepted by the public. That was the year Schober advised him to get a "press agent" (see Chapter II).

Is it not more than coincidence that a song with the title "An den Mond" be so similar, and even identical in certain passages to the "moonlight Sonata," which had already firmly implanted itself in the public's favor?
GESANDE DES HARNERS

Wer sich der Einsamkeit ergiebt

This first of the Harper's Songs contains other striking examples of evidence that Schubert was most definitely and directly influenced by the Beethoven Sonata Opus 27, Number 2. Here, in contrast to "An den Mond" we find a poem which is truly worthy of Schubert's talents. The poem is an excerpt from Goethe's "Wilhelm Meister." The song was written in 1816, or during the most productive time of Schubert's life. He had just broken away from the unhappy life in his father's school and had taken up residence with Schober.

The similarity of composition is not apparent at the beginning of the song. In this section the poet speaks of the unrequited lover. Then the poet turns introspective and likens the lover to himself. Immediately the accompanying figure assumes a softer, more mellow quality, and falls into the familiar arpeggio figure.

Here the tempo and mood are still more nearly like the "Moonlight" than in "An den Mond." Both scores are in 4/4 time and marked adagio. The first measure in which the accompaniment employs this figure reminds one at once of the sonata.
WER SICH DER EINSAMKEIT ERGIEBT

(Example I)

In this illustration the arpeggio pattern is very similar. This passage in the song is repeated several times in different keys, and each succeeding time the bass is written in octaves, which makes it even more similar to the sonata than the illustration used. This excerpt is used because this is the first time the figure occurs, even though the single bass notation is used.

This example is extremely interesting when notice is taken of the contrary motion so similarly employed by both composers.
Beethoven uses the figure as a play between the bass and the soprano. Schubert has inverted the figure and employs the bass and the tenor. However, the voices are far enough apart to give an almost identical feeling to the two scores when played with the embellishing notes.
This second illustration from the first Harper's song is not quite as literal in its arpeggio accompaniment. The second arpeggio of each group of two is inverted. The base figure is still in octaves as in the sonata score, while the bass figure appears with every second arpeggio group.

Despite the inversion of the arpeggio figure the feeling of the score does not change, and gives essentially the same effect found
in the Beethoven score. Note again the persistent use of the Neapolitan, and the chromatic sharpening of the leading tone to form the cadence in both instances. The use of the Neapolitan along with the other striking similarities again indicates a definite use by Schubert of the ideas, or similar ideas, set forth by Beethoven.
Here at the close of each composition, we find the familiar broken chord pattern - the bass again being built on essentially the same patterns. Notice the striking similarity of the descending arpeggio pattern leading to the final cadence to the tonic chord in the bass.
"Wer nie sein Brod mit Thranen ass" is the second of the Harpers Songs using as a text an excerpt from Goethe's Wilhelm Meister. This score was also written during the productive song year of 1816. Again this song is in 4/4 time, marked "adagio," both features of which are found in the "Moonlight Sonata." Through most of the score the arpeggio pattern is used which runs through the entire sonata. Again the figure is employed mainly in the octave immediately above middle C, while the bass appears in open octaves.

This excerpt given above is a most striking example of the use of the Neapolitan (bII), which resolves in a similar fashion as the Neapolitan in the Sonata.
Nachtstück, written in 1819, is a setting of the poem by Mayerhofer, one of the Schubertiads. The poem is overly romantic, typical of the type of literature written by a second-rate romantic German poet. The song opens with a scoring quite unlike the Sonata. This first section is a description of a Harper wandering through a wooded glen. The moon then breaks through the mist and the Harper begins to sing his praises of the moonlit night. At this point Schubert abruptly changes to an arpeggio pattern which is a variation.
of the pattern found in the Sonata - (this time the second arpeggio being inverted) - but the feeling and mood created are essentially the same. Both scores are in 4/4 time and marked "adagio." The bass figure appears in octaves on the first and third beats to the measure. The illustration given employs the same accompanying figure with a downward skip of a third in the bass which contributes to the song being in the same mood and feeling of the sonata.
"Emma" is set to a poignantly beautiful poem by Schiller. In it the poet compares his love to a pure celestial light which will perish like all things earthly should his love not be returned. Here again is a poem similar in mood to the mood associated with the "Moonlight Sonata." The accompaniment is chordal until the final section of the song where the poet speaks of his celestial love, where the accompaniment changes into the familiar arpeggio figure, occurring in the same range as the figure in the sonata.
As an illustration we have cited the closing measures of the
song showing this typical accompaniment and the final descending
resolution, which to all practical purposes is the same as that found
in the final passage of the sonata.
"Todes-musik" is a setting of a long, passionate poem by Schober. The accompaniment is quite varied, with the middle section employing the same accompanying figure found in the "Moonlight Sonata." This section of the poem relates how heavenly, ethereal music will cause all pain to lightly and softly vanish. How natural that in a section of this mood Schubert should again turn to the discussed pattern of accompaniment. Here Schubert uses a simple device often used by Beethoven in this particular sonata - that of lowering the third (used in the lowest note of the three-note pattern) to resolve into a minor key.
In this section of "Todes-musik," Schubert again uses the same device he used in "Gesange des Harfnes." These devices are essentially the same as the example given here from the Sonata Opus 27 No. 2. This time the melodic lines are again found in the bass and tenor as in "Gesange des Harfners" but instead of the melodic lines being inverted, they are in similar motion to the lines of the sonata.
Here again Schubert has turned his talents to a poem written by his friend Mayerhofer. This poem is even more unworthy of Schubert's genius than the "Nachtstück" which was previously discussed. The middle section of the poem turns to praise the "freshening breezes, soft with kisses," and Schubert again returns to the figures used by Beethoven in the sonata. The accompaniment employs the familiar broken chord pattern in the same register as it is used by Beethoven. The bass again appears as a single note or octave, occurring with
every second arpeggic figure. The example used illustrates these
two distinctive features and also shows Schubert's use of the
simple device which is so often used by Beethoven in this Sonata -
that of placing the third of the chord in the tenor and chromatically
lowering it on the first beat of a measure to make a definite
transition into the relative minor key.
"Am Strom" is the third example of a song set to lyrics by Mayerhofer. Here is found a short romantic poem in which one's soul is compared to a lovely streamlet, and tells how one's life follows the course of the stream. Again a lush romantic idea has influenced Schubert to use the pattern set up by Beethoven in the "Moonlight Sonata." This time the song is in 3/4 time instead of 4/4, but the essential mood of the pattern is in no way destroyed. The arpeggio figure and general mood run throughout a greater part of the song. The excerpt cited illustrates the similarity of these patterns to the Beethoven score and also shows the identical resolution so often employed by both composers.
"An die Leyer" (from Bruchmann's Anacreon) is a narrative poem which resulted in Schubert's employing a varied accompaniment for the setting of the poem. The story concerns a singer accompanying himself on a lyre, trying to sing songs indicating a triumph in battle, but the lyre refuses to respond to songs other than those of love. When the song changes to passages of love, the accompaniment employs the devices used by Beethoven in the sonata. The song is in 4/4 time, with the arpeggio pattern in a slow triplet which is also used in the
the Beethoven score. The arpeggio pattern is in the same register as in the sonata, and the bass employs a single note or octave figure. The final resolution of the song is the same as the resolution used by Beethoven - the arpeggio figure descending to the bass with the final chord in a low register of the piano.

AN MIGNON

"An Mignon" employs a slightly different arpeggio pattern than that used in the Sonata Opus 27 No. 2. Here every second figure is inverted (descending rather than ascending). The poem is romantic, in the same character as the previous songs discussed using this style of composition. The arpeggio pattern is in approximately the same register as it is used in the sonata, with the bass again occurring in single note or octave patterns.

KENNST DU DAS LAND?

"Kennst du das Land" is a setting of the familiar poem which was also set by Beethoven, and which is particularly famous as set in the opera "Mignon" by Thomas. The section of the poem reading "from azure skies soft breezes gently lave" has influenced Schubert to use the arpeggio pattern. The pattern is in the same register as used by Beethoven. The bass again appears as a single note or octave pattern. The general effect is the same as created by the "Moonlight Sonata."
CHAPTER V

CONCLUSION

From this study of the life and songs of Franz Schubert, we may infer that Schubert held Beethoven in high esteem, which resulted in a marked effect on the vocal music of Schubert.

As a musician, Schubert was ignored and ridiculed during his day. The great contemporary writer of the time was Beethoven, who was accepted and praised by critics and the public, and who represented everything Schubert aspired to be as a musician.

Socially, Schubert was relegated to a class of people who were not accepted by the aristocracy or moneyed classes of Vienna. Beethoven was accepted by this class, which resulted in his music being performed by the leading artists of the day, of his achieving financial security, and of his gaining fame and the plaudits of the public. Schubert was denied fame and financial security, largely we are led to believe, because of the social strata in which he lived.

Schubert was also defeated as a scholar among musicians. His writings were spontaneous and based on lyric melodies which were perfect counterparts for the poems he was setting. He was not the working musical scholar in the sense Beethoven was, and felt this difference, along with the social difference so keenly that he was ashamed to work with, or even meet, Beethoven when the opportunity presented itself.

- 56 -
Would not this sense of frustration as a musician and as a man lead one to an avid study of the successes of other men? We are not necessarily hinting that any absolute, conscious plagiarism has been employed by Schubert, but we dare infer that Schubert had been a close student of Beethoven's music, and was influenced by the same patterns that influenced Beethoven.

Granted, the arpeggio pattern, which was one of the basic figures studied, is a classical figure and is not alone limited to the works presented here. But nowhere in a survey of song writers following Schubert has the writer found such a consistant use of this figure to describe so definite a mood. Neither has the writer been able to discover such striking similarities of harmonic treatment of this figure, the frequent use of the arpeggio pattern in the same range, the use of the Neapolitan which is recurrently found in both the Schubert and Beethoven score, the similar treatment of resolutions - in fact so similar treatment of ideas that upon hearing excerpts of both writers played, it is difficult at times to distinguish between the works of the two composers.

Posterity has agreed that Schubert is capable of standing alone as a great composer. But as Schubert surveyed himself as a young and insecure man, it is quite likely and logical that he was impressed by Beethoven, the great patriarch of music, and turned to this genius for musical inspiration, as did many a lesser light in the field of music.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


Felber, Rudolf. "Schumann's Place in German Song," The Musical Quarterly, XXVI, 1940.


"Modern Melodists." The Catholic World, XIV, 1876-1877.


BIBLIOGRAPHY (cont.)


Tovey, Donald F. Essays in Musical Analysis. V. Vocal Music London: Oxford University Press, 1937.