AN ANALYSIS OF THE CSET SUGGESTED
APPROACH TO TEACHING MUSIC

A Thesis
Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements
for the Degree Master of Arts

by
Lynette Larry Flick, P. M.s.
The Ohio State University
1967

Approved by

[Signature]
Advisor
School of Music
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The writer wishes to express grateful appreciation to Dr. Wayne Ramsey for his guidance and advice, and to Miss Mary Tolbert and Dr. Erwin Schneider for their assistance during preparation of this study.
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter I. Introduction, Problem, and Procedures</strong></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purpose</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assumptions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delimitations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procedures</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organization</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter II. The Orff Schulwerk Approach</strong></td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philosophy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Origin and Development of Schulwerk</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of Schulwerk: Music for Children</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concepts of Music Teaching Which Underlie Orff Schulwerk</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter III. The Developmental Approach of James Mirell</strong></td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philosophy of Music and Music Education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approach to Music Education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concepts of Music Teaching</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter IV. Comparison of the Orff Schulwerk and the Developmental Approach</strong></td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orff Schulwerk</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developmental Approach</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter V. Summary and Conclusions</strong></td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theoretical Bases</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approach to Music Learning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Types of Music Literature</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bibliography</strong></td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION, PROGRAM, AND PROCEDURES

Introduction

Music educators in Europe and America during the last decade have become interested in what is commonly referred to as the "Orff approach" for teaching music to young children. The approach bears the name of Carl Orff, the celebrated German composer, and is organized into a series of books entitled Das Schulwerk -- Musik Fur Kinder. While the approach is commonly referred to as the "Orff approach" or simply "Schulwerk," Orff acknowledges that many other people have worked with him in the development of this work.¹

Das Schulwerk -- Musik Fur Kinder is a series of guide or source books, written in German, which Orff and one of his students, Osmil Krätden, formulated to guide teachers in the use of this approach. The title, literally translated, means "schoolwork--music for children," and is a graded program of music education for young children. The Orff Schulwerk approach embodies the philosophy and concepts of music teaching which Orff and his colleagues have developed during their experiences with adults and children.

Originally, the procedures and materials incorporated in the Schulwerk approach were conceived as a means for developing in adults an awareness of rhythm through music and bodily movement. The approach was similar to that of Jacques Baron de la Borroze which was called Eurythmics. The emphases of Orff’s approach are: (1) rhythm -- the use of rhythms which arise from patterns of speech and bodily movement, (2) melody -- the use of melodies whose tonal range gradually becomes less restricted, (3) the use of instruments which are patterned after Indonesian models, (4) the use of modal tonalities and the pentatonic scale, and (5) improvisation which employs the techniques of bordun and ostinati as accompanying voices for melodies. The style which embodies the above elements is uniquely Orff’s and is described as primitivism by musicologists.

During the decade since Doreen Hall and Arnold Walter made the English version of the Schulwerk books titled Schulwerk: Music for Children, American music educators have become interested in this approach. Procedures and materials of the approach have been recently publicized in this country through the increasing number of workshops and demonstrations which have been presented. Reports of pilot programs to introduce Orff’s concepts to American children appear in newspapers, magazines, and professional journals.

In many school systems, the Orff Schulwerk approach has been introduced by teachers who were students at the Oberlin

---

2Tbid.

Conservatory of music and spent their junior year of college at
the Mozarteum Academy in Salzburg, Austria. Since the Mozarteum
is the center for training of teachers in the use of the Griff
approach, the Oberlin students had the opportunity to gain first-
hand experience with this approach. While a student at the
Mozarteum, this writer became interested in the Schulwerk approach,
attended classes in the use of this approach, and participated in
the International Griff Institute which is held annually in
Salzburg.

The widespread popularity of the Griff approach in this
country is apparently due, in part, to the way the composer employs
rhythm, improvisation, pentatonic and modal tonalities rather than
functional harmonies (in eighteenth century style), and primitive-
sounding instruments. These emphases seem to have made the
Schulwerk approach unusual and appealing to American music
educators.

Problem

As a result of publicity which the Griff procedures and
materials have received, teachers have been stimulated to try
techniques of this approach. Despite this publicity and
exploration, there is little evidence that American music educators
have made much careful study of the approach.

In any field of knowledge there is the temptation to grasp
new ideas without careful consideration of the principles involved.
Allan Britton has cautioned against climbing aboard any intellectual bandwagon which happens to be nearby, and trusting it to arrive at destinations appropriate for music education, or, worse, adopting its destinations as our own without careful enough scrutiny of the intellectual properties involved.\(^1\)

In the early history of music education in this country such a situation occurred. Lowell Masco promoted a teaching method which he had adapted from what he thought was a system of Pestalozzi. However, the source he consulted was itself a perversion of Pestalozzi’s ideas, and his method did not prove valid.\(^5\) Since the use of Orff procedures and materials is gaining popularity, it is probable that many interpretations will be made.

Two causes for this apparent lack of objective study may be identified. First, Orff has written very few articles, which are available in English translations, about the Schulwerk approach, and he has not clearly stated the philosophy and concepts of music teaching which underlie it. Since a comprehensive interpretation of the Schulwerk approach is not available, workshops, articles in periodicals, and the English version of the books have been the primary sources of information about the approach. Another factor is that this approach originated about twenty-five years ago for use in German public schools. Since the philosophy and concepts of music teaching which underlie this approach were conceived in a European culture, a comparison of these concepts and those which underlie an


\(^5\)Ibid., p. 206.
American approach is pertinent. A study of the concepts of music teaching which underlie this approach would help provide music teachers with a basis for evaluation of this method.

Purpose of the Study

In view of the need for objective study of the Schulwerk approach, the purpose of this study is to identify the concepts of music teaching which underlie it and to compare these concepts with ideas which have been influential upon music education in America.

Several means through which to make comparison of the concepts which underlie each of the two approaches to teaching music are possible. One means of comparison would be to ascertain from other fields of knowledge the sources of ideas which Orff has used, and to compare these with sources of ideas which underlie music education in this country. A second possibility would be to study the music series books which have been widely used in America, and to determine from them the philosophical ideas and teaching procedures which have been a basis of music teaching in American schools. Comparison could then be made in terms of ideas and procedures of the Schulwerk approach which are similar to and which are different from those which have been advocated by music educators in America. A third possibility would be to investigate the research literature on music education in America. The principles and procedures of the Orff approach could then be compared in terms of their relationship to the theories which have been investigated. A fourth possibility would be to study the literature of music education in America and to determine the philosophical ideas and teaching procedures which seem to be
dominant. Comparison of these principles and those of the Orff approach could then be made.

In order to delimit the wide scope of possibilities and provide focus for this work, the decision was made to study the writings of James Mursell. There is little question that his ideas as integrated in his "developmental approach" have probably had profound influence upon the teaching of music in America. This is not to say that his have been the only influential ideas, nor that all schools base their music programs upon his ideas, but rather that these have been a dominant influence. In this study, the concepts which seem to underlie Orff's approach to music education will be compared in terms of the concepts of music education which have been set forth by James Mursell.

Assumptions

Orff has written several articles about the Schulwerk approach, but neither in these nor the books of musical examples is there any concise statement of the concepts of music which underlie this method. For the purposes of this study, it is assumed that the concepts of music teaching which underlie the Schulwerk approach can be derived from the ideas of music and education which Orff has expressed in various lectures, articles, and writings, as well as from study of the Schulwerk: Music for Children books.

Reasons for use of the English adaptation as an authoritative source are as follows: (1) Arnold Walter has been a long-time colleague of Orff, and was associated with Leo Kestenberg when
Kostenberg introduced Schulwerk into German public schools.\(^6\)

(2) Doreen Hall studied with Gunild Keetman for fourteen months at the Mozarteum Academy in Salzburg, Austria,\(^7\) and (3) Hall and Walter prepared the first foreign version of the German edition. Since Orff acknowledges this English adaptation,\(^8\) it is assumed that authoritative generalization about the philosophy and concepts which underlie the Schulwerk approach can be made from study of this adaptation.

In American music education, one finds that ideas of many persons have been influential. However, review of the literature reveals that the philosophy and psychology of music teaching as set forth in the writings of James Mursell have been a dominant influence upon the concepts of music teaching in American schools. In this study it is therefore assumed that certain fundamental concepts of music teaching can be derived from the writings of Mursell.

Four reasons could be proposed to support the choice of Mursell's ideas: (1) he has been the most prolific writer in the field of music education, (2) his writings reflect both philosophical and psychological points of view, (3) his writings have had a profound influence upon the teaching of music in this country, and (4) he is the only person who has attempted to set


\(^7\)Doreen Hall, "Orff Schulwerk," Reprint from Royal Conservatory Monthly Bulletin, (September, 1955).

forth a complete logical interpretation of music education in the United States.

Delimitations

Since the first version of the Schulwerk was printed in 1955, the method has been continually evolving and expanding. Orff considers the Schulwerk approach as being in a state of constant change. Specially trained teachers who work with this method are continually adapting the materials and using them in different ways depending upon the needs of students. 9

In view of the above considerations, three limitations of the scope of this study are implied:

1. The Schulwerk approach is continually growing and expanding; therefore, an attempt has been made to consider only the most recent literature about this approach.

2. The English versions of the Schulwerk books, Music for Children adapted by Doreen Hall and Arnold Walter, were studied. These texts, rather than the German books, are most widely used in the United States.

3. As stated earlier in this chapter, James Murnell’s ideas have not been the sole influence upon music education in America. However, since he has been the most prolific writer in the field of music education, his ideas will be considered as a dominant influence.

 Procedures

In order to achieve the purposes of this thesis the following procedures were used:

1. Study and analysis of the current literature relevant to the Orff approach was made. Primary source material consulted was printed versions of two speeches which Orff delivered in Canada and England,\textsuperscript{10} \textit{}\textsuperscript{11} the documented biography of the composer by Andreas Liesl,\textsuperscript{12} and the compositions by Orff which are found in the English version of \textit{Schulwerk: Music for Children}.\textsuperscript{13}

2. In like manner, the writings of James Marsilius relevant to his developmental approach were studied and analyzed.

3. The theoretical factors which seem to be the basis of each approach were determined and were formulated as underlying principles.

4. The principles thus formulated were compared in terms of similarities and differences of emphasis, philosophical ideas, and teaching procedures.

\textsuperscript{10}Ibid.
\textsuperscript{11}Orff/trans. Marrey, op. cit.
\textsuperscript{13}Orff and Keetman, \textit{op. cit.}. 
Organization

The organization of the remainder of the study will be as follows:

Chapter 2 -- "The Orff Schulwerk Approach." In this chapter a descriptive analysis of the origin and development of this approach, and statement of the concepts of music teaching which seem to be the basis of it will be given.

Chapter 3 -- "The Developmental Approach of James Mursell." Mursell's philosophy of music and music education, and the concepts of music teaching which seem to be the basis of the approach will be discussed.

Chapter 4 -- "Comparison of the Orff Schulwerk with the Developmental Approach." The two approaches will be compared in terms of similarities and differences between the concepts which seem to underlie them.
CHAPTER II

THE ORFF SCHULWERK APPROACH

Introduction

The focal point of this chapter is Music for Children, the English version of Das Schulwerk. First, a general statement of Carl Orff's philosophy of music which is embodied in the Schulwerk approach is presented. Second, information concerning the origin and development of the method is presented. Third, an analysis of Schulwerk: Music for Children is made in terms of the music learning activities included in the document. Fourth, concepts of instruction in music derived from study of this work and Orff's writings are outlined.

Philosophy

The theories about music and music-making which have guided the composition of Orff's major stage and orchestral works underlie the Schulwerk approach to teaching music. The basis of this philosophy is Orff's concern, "not with musical, but with spiritual exposition."1 His works express a philosophy of the world and mankind which is "at the end of an era culture reverts to earlier forms."2 In these earlier forms, music-making is not

1 Liess, op. cit., p.31.
2 Ibid.

-14-
formalized according to rational and artistic considerations, but is characterised by simplicity, naturalness, and an elemental quality. In his concern with finding the essential musical experience, the core of music which, stripped of its Historical associations remains the same at all times, Orff has developed the Schulwerk approach which is an attempt to approach music-making at its origin.

Origin and Development of Schulwerk

The Schulwerk approach was conceived to develop in physical education teachers an understanding of rhythm through combining bodily movement and education to music.\(^3\) The impetus for this type of training came from the Youth Movement which was prominent throughout Germany during the 1920's. Emphases of this movement were upon physical activity, sports, gymnastics, and dance. At this time the ideas of Jacques Dalcroze and Mary Wigman were influential. Dalcroze, the Swiss educator and composer, evolved the concept of coordinating music and bodily movement for expressive purposes; Mary Wigman created a new style of expressive dance.

Orff and Dorothee Guenther, stimulated by these influences, founded the Guenther school for music and dance. The purpose of this school was to develop in pupils an understanding of rhythm. Gymnastics, music, and dance were presented and developed as a unity. However, since Orff was a composer, it was possible to place a great amount of emphasis upon music.

In this program, dancers were encouraged to improvise instrumental accompaniments for their dances. Easy-to-play instruments - drums of all types and sizes, ten-toms, timpani, cymbals, and claves - were used. As the need for a melodic ensemble was felt, existing instruments such as guitar, lute, viola da gamba, glockenspiels, bells of definite pitch, the spinet, portative organ, and newly created instruments were added to the ensemble.

Orff was inspired to create these new instruments after seeing Indonesian models. He conceived instruments which would have wooden and metal bars and be voiced in soprano, alto, tenor, and bass ranges. In cooperation with Karl Moezler, Orff copied these instruments and created his own models. After seeing a family of recorders in a Berlin museum, Orff had copies made and added them to the ensemble.

The resulting combination of instruments did not correspond to any existing orchestral ensemble, consequently, no music was available. New music had to be created, and the instruments themselves and the nature of the dances suggested the type of music.

Guided by his theory that spontaneous musical expression will result from exercises designed to lead students to acquire a well-developed technique of improvisation, Orff, in 1930, composed a book of rhythmic and melodic exercises which would provide this training. This book was simplified to become part of the first version of Schulwerk books which was completed in 1935.

---

By this time, the Guenterschule dance group with its accompanying instrumental ensemble (orchestra) had become well-known. Dorthea Guenther and Maja Lex, through their foreign tours, took the ideas of Schulwerk to many foreign countries. A unique aspect of this group was that members of the troupe exchanged places as dancers and musicians during performances. Some of the music for these dances was composed by Gunild Keetman, one of Orff’s students.

As the troupe toured Europe, the ideas of expressive dance accompanied by an instrumental ensemble rapidly became popular. Educators who saw these performances conceived that these activities might be adapted for use with children. They felt that the primitive style conveyed through simple-to-play instruments, and the combination of music and bodily movement would be appealing to children. Prominent German music educators -- Arnold Walter, Leo Kestenberg, and Eberhard Freussner -- requested that Orff adopt the Schulwerk approach for children so it could be introduced into Berlin schools. The plans for introducing this approach into the public schools were delayed, however, because the political power which then dominated Germany considered the ideas of this approach unassirable. After the Guenterschule was bombed in 1943, Orff Schulwerk was forgotten for many years.

The revival of interest in the Orff approach came in 1968 when a recording of the Guenterschule instrumental group was found. Once again, educators became interested in the possibility of adapting and simplifying the scores so this type of music could be performed by children.

The stimulus which started the revision was a request from Annemarie Schunbeck, director of the Schools Section of the
Bayrischer Rundfunk, who, in 1946, proposed that a series on Orff Schulwerk be broadcast. Carl Orff, Osvald Koetser, and Rudolph Kirnberger supervised the performance of children on these broadcasts. At the conclusion of each program, children in the listening audience were encouraged to turn rhythmic verses into songs, to create instrumental accompaniments for them, and submit them for judging. The compositions received were of such good quality that producers were convinced the programs had been understood. The present German version of Schulwerk is the revision which Orff wrote for use in these broadcasts.

Since publication of the revised German version of the Schulwerk books in 1955, many foreign adaptations of the materials have been made. The first of these adaptations was the English version by Hall and Walter titled Orff Schulwerk: Music for Children. In this adaptation many of Orff's original compositions have been retained but texts have been translated into English. Several American folksongs have been substituted for indigenous German folksongs, and a volume of arrangements of nursery rhyme songs, and a teacher's manual have been added.

Study and analysis of Music for Children reveals a sequence of learning activities in which the Schulwerk approach to music education can be developed. In the following discussion of the Schulwerk approach, an overview of the general nature of the method is presented; following this, a detailed analysis of the sequence of learning activities is given.
Analysis of Schulwerk: Music for Children

The arrangement of activities in Music for Children is such that children proceed gradually from rhythmic speech activities to learning songs employing at first two, then three tones, and the pentatonic scale, modes (aeolian, dorian, and phrygian, as well as traditional major), and functional harmonies. Concurrent with learning these songs, children play them on melodic percussion instruments, create accompaniments for them, and improvise their own melodies within this limited tonal framework. Creative movement is combined with music-making as children create their own bodily movements to express music they have created, or create music to accompany bodily movement.

The compositions which Orff has arranged for children have the following style characteristics:

1. The melodies are diatonic, not chromatic.

2. The texture is not contrapuntal, but rather is linearly conceived with each instrument playing an independent ostinato figure. The musical effect is of short phrases of melody surrounded by counterpoints.

3. Harmony is not employed functionally in the sense of the eighteenth century classical style, but as the result of interaction of independent melodic lines. In this sense, harmony is important as tonal color rather than as structural organization.

Volume I -- Pentatonic

The first volume of Music for Children contains examples of types of exercises through which children may gain a background of

experiences with tonal and rhythmic patterns. The first songs are melodically simple, employing only tones of the falling minor third (sol-mi). The songs are short, at first only one four-measure phrase in length, and melodic and rhythmic structure is simple.

Use of the body as an instrument.--Rhythmical body movements are used as accompaniment for each song; clapping and floor stamping emphasize the beats and introduce contrasting rhythmic patterns. It is intended that the rhythm of these bodily movements be played on percussion instruments, and that the implied tone color of the movements be considered. For example, heavy-sounding instruments (cymbals, timpani) will be played on accented pulses, while light-sounding instruments (higher-pitched drums) emphasize the beats. Melodic accompaniments to songs are introduced through the melodic ostinato using the tones 3-5-7 which are played on xylophone or metallophone. In Orff's terminology, an ostinato is a rhythmic or melodic motive which is repeated.

Accompaniment.--In this section rhythmic and melodic accompaniments are combined. A drone (tones of an open fourth or fifth sounded simultaneously) of 3 and 5 is sustained on the xylophone while a rhythmic ostinato of stamping and clapping provides a contrasting rhythm to the song. Accompaniments for the songs, which are still based on the falling minor third, become more involved as the rhythmic ostinato is played on percussion instruments, and the range of the melodic ostinato is expanded to include the tones 4-6-8 and 7.

As another tone 4 is added to 3 and 5, the melodic range of the songs is increased. The texture of the instrumental ensemble
becomes more involved with the combination of a sustained open fifth drone, melodic ostinato using tones $c, d, e, g, a$, and contrasting rhythmic accompaniment into five-part accompaniments.

Songs based on the pentatonic scale.--The next songs are composed of the tones $c, d, e, g, a$, a pentatonic scale having no half steps. Songs are now four phrases long, but individual phrases are short, two to four measures in length. Dynamics and tempo markings are precisely indicated. Although more rhythmic figures, especially sixteenth notes and syncopations are introduced in the instrumental parts, rhythmic patterns of the song melodies are simple, consisting of eighth, quarter, and half notes.

Ensemble playing.--In the section on ensemble playing, melodies are given for which accompaniments are to be created, and possible combinations and interchanges of vocal and instrumental parts are given. The first compositions are based on the five-tone ($c, d, e, g, a$) pattern, are in simple duple and triple meter, and employ simple rhythmic figures (quarters, eighths, and halves). Later the rhythmic patterns become more complex.

Voice and instruments are combined in several ways:

1. the melodies sung and played simultaneously,
2. the melody sung with instrumental accompaniment,
3. the melody divided between instrumental parts, sung or played by a soloist, group, or an alternation of the two, or
4. sections of the compositions used antiphonally between instrumental groups. These antiphonal compositions serve as preparation for the introduction of vocal canons which follows.
In the section on rondos, several themes and examples of improvisations which could be used as middle sections are written out. It is intended that after children have learned these model compositions, they will create their own rondos.

Speech exercises.--The next section contains speech rhymes. These exercises are provided as experiences for development of children's awareness of rhythmic patterns and tonal color. Vibrant, dynamic speech which conveys the inherent qualities of the words, the metrical pattern, and the tone color of the vowels is emphasized. Division of children’s voices according to light and dark tone color, contrast of solo and chorus sections, and emphasis upon dynamics, phrasing, and legato and staccato effects makes the rhymes more dramatic. These speech patterns are then developed into speech canons.

Melodic and rhythmical ostinati.--The examples of rhythmical ostinati are learned by rote and then used by children in their own compositions. Simple rhythmical patterns are clapped (using the hollow and flat of the hand for variety of tone color), and later, stamping, patschen (knee clapping) and finger snapping are incorporated into the ostinati. As children acquire a vocabulary of these rhythmic patterns which have been learned by rote, they make new combinations of these patterns as accompaniments to melodies improvised by the teacher, speech patterns, canons, and songs. These patterns are then transferred to instruments with heavy-sounding instruments emphasizing the accented beats, and lighter instruments playing unaccented beats.
Melodic ostinati played on instruments are learned in the same way. However, before the ostinati are played, the physical movements involved are prepared by patechen exercises. Children can incorporate these ostinati into accompaniments to songs they have learned or created themselves.

**Echo clapping and playing.**--Studies in improvisation are intended to begin simultaneously with the learning of speech patterns. Echo-clapping in which the children imitate the patterns given by the teacher begins with two measure phrases using \( \text{\textit{j} j} \); later phrases are six, eight, and sixteen measures in length and involve rhythmic patterns which require more discrimination.

Echo-playing exercises follow in which the children repeat phrases which the teacher has played. At first the tones 2, 3, and 4 are used; others are added gradually until the five-tone pentatonic scale containing only whole step intervals has evolved.

**Rhythmic and melodic canons.**--After children have had experiences with echo clapping of rhythms, rhythmic canons are introduced. These canons are to be learned in their entirety and comprehended as a whole, rather than laboriously worked out by sections.

Melodic canons are first sung, then played. At first these canons employ the tones 4, 3, and 2, and contain simple note values, but successive examples become rhythmically and melodically more complex.

**Rhythmic and melodic phrase building.**--In rhythmic phrase building the teacher claps or drums a two- or four-measure thesis of a phrase and students improvise the antitheses. Although the
first phrases are short, as students are able to comprehend these phrases, longer examples (six, eight, and sixteen bars) are introduced.

Melodic phrase building activities begin with short phrases composed of the tones G, A, and B. As pupils progress, the range and length of these phrases increases gradually.

The example phrases suggested in the Music for Children books are combined with the student’s improvisations into a traditional structure, the rondo. Rhythmic rondos are first composed of bodily movements, clapping, stamping, patstchen. The rhythm of these movements is then transferred to percussion instruments. Melodic rondos are developed in the same sequence.

Additional improvisatory activities are suggested -- the rhythm of names, rhymes, or children’s play calls can be clapped, transferred to percussion instruments, and the words sung on two, then three tones. Simple borduns, preludes, and postludes to be played on tonal instruments may be invented to accompany these melodies.

Volume II -- Major Bordun

In Volume II the tonal medium encompasses six tones, C, D, E, F, G, and A. The songs are of the same type as those in Volume I -- melody over ostinati with repetitive rhythmic and melodic figures. The accompanying ostinati and borduns employ six-tone patterns, and the interval of the major third occurs frequently in these accompaniments.

7 Ibid., Vol. II: Major Bordun (1960).
Volume III -- Major Triads

In Volume III, parallel triads and broken chords are introduced. The major tonic, minor supertonic, and minor submediant chords appear in the xylophone ostinati. This use of triads produces a linear rather than vertical harmonic effect. These same triads as broken chords are played on the guitar or lute. In addition to songs in simple duple and triple meter, songs in 5/4 meter are introduced.

Volume IV -- Minor Bordun

Volume IV contains songs which are based on aeolian, then dorian and phrygian modes. Minor triads in parallel motion are used in the accompanying ostinati and borduns. The following triad progressions are introduced: I-III, I-VI, I-VI-III, I-III-VI-VII, and I-II-VI-VII.

Volume V -- Major Triads

In Volume V, triads on all degrees of the scale are used in parallel motion, and incorporated into accompaniments. The full range of the major scale is employed in these songs. Melodies are given for which accompaniments can be created, as are accompanying borduns and ostinati from which melodies may be evolved.

Concepts of Music Teaching Which Underlie Orff Schulwerk

As one studies, analyzes, and uses Music for Children, certain dominant ideas emerge which might be identified as premises which

---

underlie this method. These concepts are not specifically identified as such by Orff himself, yet in the speeches which he delivered at the Orff Institutes in Toronto, Canada, in 1962, in England and at the Mozarteum in 1963, and in other writings, certain ideas appear dominant. Each concept has been formulated as a statement and is stated below; each premise is followed by information to support its validity.

A basic task of this thesis has been to identify the concepts of music teaching which appear to underlie Music for Children. In the section which follows, each concept has been formulated as a statement, and is followed by information to support its validity.

1.---"Schulwerk concerns itself with the primary forces and forms of music."\(^{11}\)

Orff has developed a program of music education which is based upon the concept of elementary music. He interprets the word "elementary" to mean: primitive, treating the elements and first principles of the art.\(^{12}\) In the context of his work, the word "primitive" means: the beginning of music; music which existed at the earliest stage of development of the art.

His major stage works are characterized by this quality of primitivism which is achieved by use of primitive-sounding instruments and rhythm -- incessant repetition of short rhythmic motives over long stretches of a single harmony. Elementary music which is also

---

\(^{11}\)Orff/trans. Murray, op. cit., p. 212.

characterized by this primitivism has these other aspects:
(1) music does not exist alone, but is a unity with dance, movement,
and speech, (2) it is created by individuals in ensemble situations,
and one takes part in musical activity not merely as a listener,
but as a participant, (3) the forms in which it is conveyed are
unsophisticated, small, sequential forms such as rondo and ostinato,
(4) it can be understood by everyone, and is suitable for the
child.\footnote{Orff, trans. Murray, op. cit., p. 214.}

The aim of the first volume of \textit{Music for Children} is to

\footnote{Tbid.}

\footnote{Orff and Kretzman, op. cit., Vol. I, Preface.}

teach, as in a primer, a vocabulary so basic, that it underlies

\footnote{Tbid.}

all genuine understanding of the art.\footnote{Tbid.}

2.---"Elementary music develops powers in children that
cannot otherwise come to fruition."

\footnote{Tbid.}

It is Orff's belief that "elementary music" in the primary

\footnote{Tbid.}

school is fundamental to all subjects because it stimulates

\footnote{Tbid.}

imagination and awakens the child's emotions\footnote{Tbid.}

through its focus

\footnote{Tbid.}
on authentic folklore, legend, and indigenous children's rhymes

\footnote{Tbid.}

and songs. At the primary school age the child is receptive, and

\footnote{Tbid.}
at this time "opportunities for emotional development which contain

\footnote{Tbid.}

experiences of the ability to feel and the power to control the

\footnote{Tbid.}

expression of that feeling are necessary.\footnote{Tbid.}
"Elementary music" with its emphasis upon stimulating the child's imagination and developing intellectual and kinesthetic awareness of rhythm, melody, dynamics, intensity, timbre, and form, stimulates powers in children which if left undeveloped, can never be regained.

3. "Spontaneous musical expression will result from exercises designed to lead students to acquire a well-developed technique of improvisation."

During his work at the Guentherschule, Orff conceived the idea of developing in students the ability to improvise their own accompaniments to movement. He postulated that exercises for developing the technique of improvisation "should lead the students to a spontaneous personal musical expression" and based his work upon this belief. The first edition of the Schulwerk books contained a series of these exercises for percussion, recorders, and tonal percussion instruments. The procedures were successful because, after learning the techniques of improvisation, the dancers at the Guentherschule were able to create their own musical improvisations.

When the revised version of the Schulwerk approach was introduced over the radio in 1950, children responded favorably with improvisations they had created. These improvisations were based upon examples which children had learned from the broadcast.

19 Ibid.
20 Ibid., p. 212.
In this situation, also, the learning of exercises did stimulate original compositions.

Included in Schulfwerk: Music for Children, is a graded collection of compositions intended to give children a background for creation of their own compositions. The musical materials are organized in a sequence, and the focus is upon developing the student's ability to improvise. These activities -- echo-clapping, and rhythmic and melodic phrase building -- have been explained earlier in this section. As these activities in improvisation are accomplished, and as the songs and instrumental pieces are learned, children are to be encouraged to develop their own improvisations in the style of these examples. Thus, as the child acquires a vocabulary of tonal and rhythmic patterns, and is encouraged to use them in his own way, Orff believes the child will develop his ability to improvise.

4.--"Effective teaching material is written from the child's point of view."21

Music for Children is intended for young children of primary school age.22 The teaching materials are based upon nursery rhymes, fairy tales, and indigenous children's songs and rhymes. Orff has emphasized these subjects because he believes that the spiritual home of the child is in the world of fantasy.23 The first activities presented utilize the child's speaking voice in speech exercises. The addition of rhythmic ostinati and other simple yet

---

21Lies, op. cit., p. 58.
23Lies, op. cit., p. 61
dramatic effects heightens the meaning of these verses.

When bodily movements are introduced, they are approached from the child’s basic bodily movements of walking, running, skipping, galloping, et cetera. Later these movements are combined into dance patterns.

The child’s training in melody begins with the tones of a falling minor third (sol-mi). This beginning is based upon the tendency of children to use these tones spontaneously in their play songs. Volume I of Music for Children is entirely pentatonic. Orff says “the pentatonic scale represents the deepest layer of folksong and corresponds to the mentality of children.” Because the pentatonic scale has no semitones, it establishes no tonal tendencies, hence no functional harmonies. In this tonality the child is free to create and combine melodies as he wishes.

The instruments Orff has invented are suitable for children because they are percussion instruments and do not require the precise coordination and muscular discrimination of common band and orchestral instruments. They are therefore easy to learn and easy to play.

5. “A child, if introduced to a restricted medium will find his own mode of expression.”

In order to encourage children to create original compositions and to attempt to eliminate the temptation to merely copy already existing music, Orff has limited the complexity of musical materials


which are to be presented to children. He believes this restricted medium makes it possible for a child to find his own mode of expression.\textsuperscript{26}

The elements of music -- melody, rhythm, harmony, form, dynamics, and tone color -- are all present in his compositions, no matter how limited the tonal and rhythmic aspects may be. The first compositions are structurally simple; rhythm and melody are separated, and the first compositions are purely rhythmical. This emphasis upon simple rhythmic patterns continues until the falling minor third interval evolves from a strong rhythmic feeling. Gradually these rhythmic and tonal patterns become more complex. The first volume, however, is based only upon the pentatonic scale which has evolved a note at a time.

Because this scale contains no half-step intervals, children can improvise freely without the possibility of producing a discord. Orff believes that since children are less familiar with the restricted pentatonic tonality than with the major or minor, there will be less danger of their imitating other kinds of music.\textsuperscript{27} Later, the modal tonalities are introduced. Orchestrations which Orff has arranged are unique because in these he has maintained this idea of a restricted medium. The accompaniment figures are short, repeated or sequential figures -- bords, ostinati and drone basses. Later parallel major and minor triads are introduced. Children then incorporate these musical ideas into their own compositions.

\textsuperscript{26}Ibid.

\textsuperscript{27}Orff and Keetman, \textit{op. cit.}, Vol. I, Preface.
All compositions are to be played from memory so that maximum freedom to concentrate on the music is guaranteed. However, notation is not to be disregarded, and should be introduced from the very beginning with speech patterns.26

The realization of the child's improvisations on specially designed instruments is an important aspect of this approach. Through the introduction of mallet-played instruments, both tonal and non-tonal, Orff has created a unique, primitive-sounding ensemble and has introduced new possibilities of instrumental tone colors.

Thus, by introducing children to restricted tonal media and easy-to-play instruments which are different from the traditional, Orff believes children will find their own mode of expression.

Summary

Orff Schulwerk: Music for Children is an organized program of music education for children. The composer emphasizes that these books are source materials which contain sample compositions and are to serve as guidebooks for teachers. The order of presentation is suggested, but need not be followed exactly. Teachers are encouraged to choose exercises which will be of most benefit to students, and the amount of time spent on any type of activity will vary according to the needs of students.

The activities begin with speech patterns, singing, ensemble playing, and improvisation. The first emphasis is upon rhythm—the rhythm of speech and of normal bodily movements (walking, running, skipping, leaping, clapping). Melodic patterns based on the falling minor third evolve from a strong rhythmic feeling.

26Ibid.
As children are guided in music-making activities, they progress from the most elementary songs and improvisations on two or three notes to pentatonic, modal tonalities, and simple harmonies. The traditional system of harmony based on the major scale is not imposed upon learners. From the first musical experiences, Orff ignores the common tonal relationships through his use of a pentatonic scale. Possible tonalities -- modal (ecclesiastical) as well as common major and minor -- are presented so that children do not form the rigid thought that there exists only one valid system of harmony. From their earliest experience with music, children become aware of the materials of composition and of the variety of ways these materials can be organized into melodies, ostinati, chords, and simple forms such as two-part forms, canons, and rondos. Out of their first-hand experiences with music, they develop their own way of organizing these materials. They are awakened to the unity of music and bodily movement, and therefore are prepared to appreciate all types of music -- folk, symphonic, primitive, and contemporary.

The musical examples in Music for Children are indigenous folk songs and Orff's compositions. In the English adaptation, many of his compositions have been retained, but American folk song material has been substituted for many German songs. From study of this work, five concepts of music teaching were identified.
CHAPTER III

THE DEVELOPMENTAL APPROACH OF JAMES MURSELL

Introduction

In this chapter the focal point is James MurSELL's developmental approach to music teaching. The philosophical and theoretical bases of this approach, and concepts of music teaching which seem to underlie it will be presented.

Philosophy of Music and Music Education

The philosophy of music which is the apparent basis for MurSELL's philosophy of music education and consequent approach to teaching music is the outgrowth of his belief that "music exists to serve human values and to glorify human life." Since he views music in this perspective, there is an emphasis upon developing a deeper understanding of the expressive quality of music, rather than upon mere acquisition of knowledge about music or technical proficiency. The latter are not to be disregarded, but are avenues through which this deeper understanding of the expressive quality of music can be gained.

Music, he believes, can be said to exist for the service of mankind because it is the outgrowth of human experience and is the expression of human emotion. It is the expression of personal

---

temperaments, and the outgrowth of social and historical conditions and most certainly of the contemporary civilization. In music, man has found it possible to crystallize "his attitude toward and insights into life with certain unique perfection and appropriateness."\(^2\) Music provides a unique medium through which an individual may be brought into intimate possession of his ancestral and cultural wealth, and may be taught to enjoy and use this cultural wealth as his own.\(^3\)

The essence of music, he believes, is the tonal and rhythmic pattern which projects a way of feeling.\(^4\) The expressive elements through which the emotional and expressive values of music are conveyed are the "shapes, qualities, colors, arrangements, refinements, nuances, subtleties, and interweavings of tonal and rhythmic patterns."\(^5\) Response to the expressive values of music which are conveyed through tonal and rhythmic patterns is the essence of response to music.

Mursell has defined ultimate musical responsiveness as "organic, perceptual, and emotional responsiveness to tone itself."\(^6\) He cites findings of several experimental studies to support his claim that the original and basic responsiveness to music is simply

\(^2\)Ibid., p. 61.
\(^3\)Ibid., p. 56.
\(^5\)Ibid.
\(^6\)Ibid., p. 30.
to a body of musical tone in which rhythm and melody are undifferentiated, and not fundamentally a response to melody or rhythm as separate elements.\(^7\)

Mursell has incorporated his philosophy of music into a purpose of music education. This purpose is "to develop a person's responses to beauty and expressiveness of music itself,"\(^8\) and "to help people find what music can do for them as a means of better living and fuller growth."\(^9\) Mursell thus identifies a two-fold purpose of music education; properly directed experience with music can be of value in terms of its effect upon the musical as well as the social and personal development of the individual.

Musical development.--The process of musical development involves increasing a person's responsiveness and sensitivity to tonal and rhythmic patterns of music, enabling him to realize his musical potential, and developing his musicality. Musicality is the ability to perceive, think, image, and respond emotionally to tonal and rhythmic design in music.\(^10\) Growth in musical responsiveness is inseparably connected with growth in skill and in knowledge about music.\(^11\) Skill and knowledge about music cannot be regarded as independent in themselves; they are agents in bringing

\(^7\) Ibid., p. 26.


\(^9\) Mursell, Education for Musical Growth, p. 18.

\(^10\) Ibid., p. 6.

\(^11\) Ibid., p. 48.
the learner to a better, clearer, and more general understanding of what he has sensed and felt.\textsuperscript{12}

Social and personal development.--The value of music to human life is a primary reason for its existence.\textsuperscript{13} It is therefore appropriate that Mursell's statement of purpose of music education should acknowledge this function of music. His opinion about the social nature of music is based upon the belief that music, which is essentially a social art, creates social patterns of diverse kinds, and is realized properly only in a social situation. For example, the performance of and listening to music is usually a social act of communication; the message of the composer is interpreted for the listener by the performer.\textsuperscript{14} Since musical activities usually take place in group situations, and since musical response involves the intellect and emotion, Mursell considers music-making as a uniquely valuable activity to occupy leisure time and meet the social and personal problems of people.\textsuperscript{15}

He has incorporated the musical and social-personal values which can be gained from experience with music into the five aims of music education. These are to bring persons enjoyment, satisfaction from successful achievement, disciplinary experiences of working to achieve a desirable goal, social relationships, and widening cultural horizons. In the paragraphs which follow, his thoughts related to each of these aims are summarized:

\textsuperscript{12}\textit{Ibid.}, p. 273.
\textsuperscript{13}\textit{Ibid.}, \textit{Human Values in Music Education}, p. 8.
\textsuperscript{14}\textit{Ibid.}, p. 64.
\textsuperscript{15}\textit{Ibid.}, p. 73.
The first task of music educators is to bring people a means of pleasure, something they can enjoy here, now, and throughout their lives.\textsuperscript{16} Unless persons enjoy their work with music, no musical growth can take place. This musical growth takes place as a person moves from an enjoyment merely of tones to a realization of thematic content, tonal color, and harmonic progressions.\textsuperscript{17}

Successful achievement in musical experience is important if people are to be stimulated to continue musical activities.\textsuperscript{18} This, however, does not mean that achievement should be made possible by removal of all difficulties inherent in the work. It is virtually impossible to determine the problems each learner will have because different people do not find the same task equally difficult, and the difficulty of the task is affected by the order of the series.\textsuperscript{19}

Musical activities from which persons benefit most are those which they feel are directed toward realization of genuine, significant, and desirable musical goals.\textsuperscript{20} The desire to attain these goals, and the pursuit of them builds discipline within a person.\textsuperscript{21}

Situations in which individuals engage in music-making activities for the purpose of achieving genuine musical goals result

\textsuperscript{17}Ibid., Education for Musical Growth, p. 43.
\textsuperscript{18}Ibid., p. 45.
\textsuperscript{19}Ibid., p. 173.
\textsuperscript{20}Ibid., Music Education: Principles and Programs, p. 54.
\textsuperscript{21}Ibid., p. 60.
in wholesome social relationships. A democratic social situation in which the leader helps the group act together is desirable. In such a situation each person is encouraged to make a contribution toward achievement of the musical goals toward which the group is striving.

Marsell defines culture as "the sum total of knowledge, skill, insight, attitude, and ways of feeling and doing which has been created by the mind of man." Through music he believes that an individual may experience the vast cultural wealth which he has inherited, and may be able to enjoy it as his own. Music conveys the emotional meanings of human living and experience, and is the personal expression of some group of people. It must always be considered in these terms, for only then will people become conscious of the universality of human feelings and the expression of these feelings through the medium of music. When understood in the context of human experience, music takes on a deeper meaning that can be realized through a purely theoretical approach to the art.

Approach to Music Education

Marsell believed the central emphasis of musical experience to be the emotional and expressive aspects of music. His approach then focused upon the process of musical development in which the

---

22 Ibid.
23 Ibid., p. 61.
24 Marsell, Human Values in Music Education, p. 56.
25 Ibid.
26 Marsell, Music Education: Principles and Programs, p. 67.
pupil is guided towards an increasingly better "perception of, and responsiveness and sensitivity to, the tonal and rhythmic pattern which is the essence of music." This approach is commonly referred to as a "developmental approach" to music education.

The developmental approach is established on the theory that the mind operates by growth and through real experiences. This approach is in contradiction to another approach in which the learning materials of music are arranged in a simple-to-complex order. Since the research literature provides no authentic proof of the validity of the claim that tasks can be arranged in a logical order from simple to complex, the developmental approach gives no credence to this idea.

However, adherents of the simple-to-complex dogma have proposed that tasks can be arranged in a logical order of increasing complexity. Marsell cites several reasons why this dogma cannot be considered true. First, determining the order of difficulty of tasks is an extremely subtle and difficult problem. Second, it must be assumed that there is a fixed order of difficulty on any set of tasks, if one can discover it. There is, in the vast research literature on learning, really no authentic proof of the validity of the claim that tasks can be arranged in order from simple to complex.

Third, it is assumed that there is an order of difficulty which is

28 Marsell and Glenn, op. cit., p. 56.
29 Marsell, *Education for Musical Growth*, p. 16.
the same for all learners.\textsuperscript{31} Fourth, the simple-to-complex dogma involves over-organization of educational content and results in making the materials so exceedingly simple that the musical interest is lost, and with it, all educational value.\textsuperscript{32} Rather than trying to arrange tasks in order from simple to complex, Mursell advocates finding a reasonable and feasible sequence in which tasks can be undertaken.\textsuperscript{33}

In view of the above problems encountered in attempting to arrange an order of tasks according to increasing complexity, Mursell suggests that (1) teachers find a reasonable and feasible sequence in which tasks can be undertaken, (2) provision be made for different levels of achievement in music, and (3) each learner be challenged without causing him to feel defeated.\textsuperscript{34} In Mursell's opinion this is preferable to overwhelming the child with complex experiences which are beyond his understanding. Evidence from experiments\textsuperscript{35} supports an approach in which the learners have meaningful experiences with the material and do not merely progress systematically through a simple-to-complex sequence of activities. All musical activities, experiences, undertakings, and learnings are thought of and planned as episodes in a process of musical growth,

\textsuperscript{31}Mursell, \textit{Education for Musical Growth}, p. 173.

\textsuperscript{32}Mursell and Glenn, op. cit., p. 57.

\textsuperscript{33}Ibid., p. 356.

\textsuperscript{34}Mursell, \textit{Music Education: Principles and Programs}, p. 52.

\textsuperscript{35}Mursell and Glenn, op. cit., p. 56.
and center on the development of responsiveness to the emotional and expressive values of music.

Mursell believes that if a person’s emotional, perceptual, and imaginal responses are directed to the content of the music itself, and not only to the extraneous aspects of the music, his responsiveness to music will become more discriminating. The type of literature which he would use in developing musical responsiveness is described below:

It must be our aim to interest the child in the best type of art music. This by no means precludes an approach by way of folk music, insofar as we may find such an approach desirable. We do not agree with the tendency in some quarters to make folk music a fetish.\(^{36}\)

Folk songs are the foundation of art music; and they often have a freshness, power, and direct sincerity of feeling which make them admirable material. But we cannot go backwards in social evolution. We cannot recapture the social meaning of music by a sort of regression to primitive conditions. What we must do is to have art music serve modern men, in the stresses and strains of civilized living, with the uplifting power which folk music had for his ancestors. We must bring music to the child in such a way that he shall become both able and anxious to fit it into the social patterns of his life.\(^{37}\)

Musical growth is the process in which "the learner’s response to music becomes more differentiated and subtle, more precise, more discriminating, wider, deeper, and his musical understanding more generalized and specific."\(^{38}\) In this process, vague meanings become clarified through purposive experiences in the following areas: singing, playing instruments, rhythm, listening, creating,

\(^{36}\) Mursell and Glenn, op. cit., p. 324.

\(^{37}\) Mursell, Human Values in Music Education, p. 71.

\(^{38}\) Ibid.
and music reading. In the paragraphs which follow, Marsell's ideas related to each area of musical growth are summarized.

Singing.--Marsell considers that the primary musical experience should be experience of song, first and foremost, for its emotional value as a means of emotional experience, expression, and release. Marsell states that "singing is a universal and personal experience, and is therefore one musical activity in which each person can participate throughout his lifetime. Through singing experiences the learner becomes conscious of the phrase-wise, "tunewise" flow of melodic lines rather than the note-by-note progression which instruments emphasize. The expressive power of music and text combined is also more evident."

The atmosphere of the situation in which singing is done should be one of freedom, in which all children are encouraged to participate. With regard to the choice of song materials, he maintains that "singing should always be integrated with genuine and vital interests and meaningful concerns, and should be a cultural and developmental experience, not simply a self-contained music lesson. Within this framework, the following types of songs are suggested:

1. Many simple unison songs of good musical quality.
2. Unison and part songs from many areas of human experience, such as, patriotism, work, home life, outdoors, and many others.

Marsell, Human Values in Music Education, p. 38.


3. Songs from radio and television.
4. Folk-song types from people in many different geographical areas.
5. Songs which encourage social interchange, such as "Swing Low, Sweet Chariot," and question-response songs.
7. Any songs which because of the musical interest and expressiveness inherent in them the teacher feels they are suitable for the children.

Types of songs to be avoided are songs especially constructed for instructional purposes and those too emotionally mature or musically advanced for students.\textsuperscript{42}

Instruments.--In Mursell's opinion, the motivation for using instruments should be the use of instruments for the sake of broad and many-sided musical growth, not the development of special techniques. Children should be able to examine and experiment with the instruments and play familiar tunes on them.\textsuperscript{43} The child's experience with instruments must be an experience in creating beautiful, appealing, significant musical effects.\textsuperscript{44} When used in this way, musical instruments contribute to musical growth.

Musical instruments can help learners grasp and understand music more adequately and more precisely, and many people enjoy this study.\textsuperscript{45} The instruments chosen need not be the standard

\textsuperscript{42}Mursell, \textit{Music Education: Principles and Programs}, pp. 208-211.
\textsuperscript{43}Mursell, \textit{Education for Musical Growth}, p. 276.
\textsuperscript{44}Mursell, \textit{Human Values in Music Education}, p. 41.
\textsuperscript{45}Mursell, \textit{Music Education: Principles and Programs}, p. 227.
band and orchestral instruments. Rattles, gongs, drums, whistles, clapping, and knee-slap-ping are crude, simple instruments which have been used for centuries for making musical sounds, and can contribute to musical growth. Certain basic characteristics of all instruments make them desirable agents in musical growth.

1. "Musical instruments make music precise and definite through their acoustical characteristics." On an instrument, one is limited to certain specific sounds and cannot slide around pitches so easily as with the voice. He is forced by the nature of the instrument to think of individual notes. In addition, rhythm is made more clear-cut and definite due to the necessity of attack and release on the instrument. The tone color becomes more evident, and harmony is given prominence when autotune, piano, and organ are used. Therefore, experiences with instruments contribute to musical growth because they call attention to aspects of the music which are not emphasized by voice alone.

2. Instrumental experience offers, in addition to musical values, personal and social values. Since instruments offer a means of participation which is alternative to the voice, many children who do not like to sing may participate on instruments. Playing even simple instruments presents an interesting challenge to the learner and gives a measure of success at achievement. Mursall proposes extensive instrumental experience for all children, despite one drawback which he acknowledges. In order to master a standard instrument, many years of study are necessary. His solution to the problem is the use of simple, easy-to-play instruments. Melodic instruments such as bells and marimbas, flutes (melody and song flutes), percussion instruments (drums, rattles,

---

66 Ibid., p. 230.
67 Ibid., p. 231.
68 Ibid., p. 233.
69 Ibid., p. 236.
gongs, and others), and harmony instruments (autoharp, piano, organ) provide resources for learning more about music through instrumental experience, yet do not present the technical problems encountered on standard instruments. Children can then experiment in deciding which instruments are most appropriate for the tone color effect they wish to have with certain pieces of music.

Mursell deplores use of instrumental literature which is composed for the sake of illustrating or drilling on a technical point. The music literature chosen should be a direct emotional expression of the composer or group of people.

Rhythm: "The true foundation of rhythm is a feeling of bodily movement." Experimental studies show that the child is interested in sensing and experiencing music in terms of his own bodily movements. Students of aesthetics and of the psychology of music agree that:

actual grasp of, and feeling for, music as design in tone is . . . necessarily dependent upon movement consciousness. The rise and fall of pitch, a sequence of harmonies, melodic phrases, and rhythm are apprehended in terms of movement.

Especially with regard to rhythm, we feel the rhythmic demand of music as requiring a certain pattern of movement.

50 Ibid., p. 238.
51 Mursell, Human Values in Music Education, p. 60.
52 Ibid., p. 21.
54 Mursell, Human Values in Music Education, p. 92.
55 Ibid.
Mursell has defined rhythm as "an expressive pattern of accent, duration, and pause." 56 Rhythm, then, is in its essence, expressive rather than mathematical. He suggests three avenues through which children can be led to grasp the expressive essence of rhythm: (1) through large, free-flowing, coordinated bodily movements, (2) rhythm instruments, and (3) rhythm symbols. 57 Of these three avenues the most essential is experience of free expressive bodily movements. Extensive research supports this relationship between rhythm and movement. 58

Mursell regards the Dalcroze Eurythmics system for teaching rhythm as the most complete realization in terms of educational method of the "psychological principles of rhythmic apprehension." 59 Experience with non-formalized bodily response to music, although it often ends when the child leaves the primary school classroom, should be continued through high school and college. 60 The Eurythmics approach, although it begins simply, leads students to higher levels of experience. Music educators are urged to study this system and make it adaptable to the classroom situation. 61

A second means for developing a grasp of rhythm is through the use of rhythm instruments. These include rhythm sticks, drums, wooden blocks, triangles, tambourines, and many others. Playing an

56 Mursell, Music Education: Principles and Programs, p. 238.
57 Ibid., pp. 265-275.
58 Ibid., p. 266.
60 Mursell, op. cit., p. 269.
61 Ibid., p. 272.
instrument requires that a person's response to rhythm be sharpened, for when these instruments are played, the rhythmic pattern of the music is underlined or italicized. 62

After children have sensed and felt rhythm, symbols for rhythm can be introduced. The purpose of these symbols is to "give names or labels to what one has already sensed or felt, and to lead to a better, clearer, more general understanding of what has been sensed and felt." 63

Marsell regards a grasp of rhythm as important for several reasons: (1) it gives life and expressiveness to musical performance, (2) adds to the pleasure of listening, (3) aids in overcoming technical difficulties, (4) facilitates reading of music and (5) is one of the best and most natural starting points for making up or composing music. 64

Listening.---Marsell has identified several types of listening experiences in which the expressive quality of the music is emphasized. If, during such listening experiences, the learners' attention is directed toward a deeper conception of the music itself, and if on repeated experience with the music they gain deeper insights into the expressive quality of the music, he believes their musical sensitivity will be developed.

Although listening to music should be a vital part of every musical activity, it is important to plan listening activities in

62 Ibid., p. 273.
63 Ibid., p. 275.
64 Ibid., pp. 294-297.
which a wide variety of styles, periods, and difficulty of music are studied. Such experiences enable children and older people to discover all types of music, and to realize for themselves their capacities for enjoyment of music.65

The types of listening emphasized by Marshall have been described briefly below.

1. Normative listening—The word "normative" refers to the way things ought to be done. Normative listening involves listening to music with increased insight and discrimination. This type of approach pervades all music listening.66

2. Interpretive listening—This means making children aware of the expressive context of the music—the non-musical or literary interpretation of a piece of music, the story interpretation which draws listeners' attention to the piece of music, dramatizing songs, or discussing the implication of the title.

3. Exploratory listening—The purpose of this type of listening is to stimulate curiosity and interest of children in a wide variety of different kinds of music.67

4. Analytical—Analytical listening centers on content, form and structure of music. Each time music is heard, children become better able to notice tempo, dynamics, rise and fall of melody, instrumentation, tone color, harmony, and rhythmic content.

5. Inner listening—A person who is capable of listening to music in his "mind's ear" is able to recreate a phrase or entire song in his mind. This type of listening focuses attention upon the music itself, not the externals of it.68

6. Receptive listening—When an individual engages in receptive listening, he receives for himself the

65 Ibid., p. 296.
66 Ibid., p. 296.
67 Ibid., p. 297.
68 Ibid., p. 297.
message of music. Lessons planned for the music classes can make students aware of this type of listening, but they should be encouraged to engage in listening to music for their own enjoyment outside of the classroom.  

Creating.--Marsell considers creative responses in terms of two general categories: (1) creative response from which comes something new, and (2) the creation of new music. In the first sense, grasping a new insight, realizing a higher level of achievement, or discovering an ability is a creative experience because the learner has discovered something new. This type of creativity is, in his opinion, wider and more expressive than the creation of new music. However, in a program of music education in which the creative spirit pervades and directs all the activities, the composition of original music will be a natural outcome. In its essence, creation of music is re-combination of familiar elements in a new way, but such activity must always be regarded as experience in expressing feeling in tone, rather than piecing melodies together. 

Many types of activities can stimulate the creation of new music, composing a poem and desiring to set it to music, adding a verse to a song which has been learned, writing a descant to a familiar song, or creating a song story. Since the use of poetry as a starting point for children's composition is so

69 ibid.
70 ibid., p. 342.
71 ibid., p. 343.
72 Marsell, Human Values in Music Education, p. 50.
73 ibid., p. 43.
frequently used, Mursell has stated what he believes are the
guidelines for this type of composition. First, the poem itself
must project simple, authentic, emotional and aesthetic values.
Jingles will not serve the purpose because children must feel the
appeal and charm of the poem and seek to express it in music.74

He rejects the idea that children are musically naive and
cannot create music until a specific time when they should have a
set of tonal patterns built up in their minds. The Pillsbury
studies show that the:

music making of children contains, in embryo form, a
surprising number of compositional techniques of mature
composers—rhythmic variation, sequential progression,
adaptation of rhythmic progressions to several forms and
vice versa, recurrent refrains, and primitive rondo forms,
and transfer of rhythms from one instrument to another,
and so forth.75

Music reading.—Music reading begins when a gesture,
picture, or notational symbol calls a person’s attention to an
aspect of the music which needs to be noticed.76 However, before
music reading begins, a child’s musical responsiveness should have
undergone considerable development.77 Progressively, as music-
reading ability grows, a fuller, clearer, and better understanding
of the music will be promoted.78 Learning to read music brings
about a deeper and more satisfying response to music if reading

75Ibid., p. 205.
76Mursell, Music Education: Principles and Programs, p. 149.
77Mursell, Education for Musical Growth, p. 56.
78Mursell, Music Education: Principles and Programs, p. 135.
is taught with an emphasis upon learning to understand the music itself, not just the symbols as a study in themselves.

The six avenues of musical growth which have been previously discussed are commonly referred to as the "six-fold approach" to music education. One of the fundamental aspects of this approach is the emphasis upon the learner's discovery of the concept which is being developed.

Concepts of Music Teaching

Marsell has written extensively about the developmental approach to teaching music. As one studies his writings, several dominant concepts emerge. In the section which follows, each concept has been formulated and is followed by information to support its validity.

1. "Musical development is entirely possible for all normal people."79

Response to music is almost universal because all races and kinds of people have created and enjoyed music, even though their perception of the tonal and rhythmic patterns may not be highly developed. Almost everyone responds in some way to music which he hears, however, the degree of response varies according to the individual. The person who lacks this responsiveness to music is exceptional.80

A large body of evidence from experimental studies confirms that the impact of musical tone has certain physical and mental effects upon human beings. When a person is subjected to musical

---

79Marsell, Education for Musical Growth, p. 9.
80Ibid., p. 8.
tone in an experimental situation, certain physiological changes are almost certain to occur. Increases in blood pressure, changes in the chemical constitution of the blood, and increased gastric peristalsis are only a few of the changes which indicate that an imperative change in the emotional condition of the individual has taken place.

Many examples of the psychological effect of musical tone could be given -- the rousing effect of stimulating band music upon weary troops, the use of music to increase the emotional impact of a movie scene, and the function of music in ceremonials of all kinds.

There is reason to believe that children's primary response to music is first to musical tone, not to rhythm or melody. Studies of kindergarten children have determined that children of this age are more preoccupied with the tonal content and appeal of music than with melody or rhythm as separate aspects. The ultimate responsiveness, then, of unsophisticated and untrained people is to musical tone. This however, is a very general response to music. Since most person's musical sensitivity is not developed to its fullest capacity, it is important that opportunity be provided for development of response to tonal and rhythmic design in music.

---

81 Ibid., p. 28.
82 Ibid., p. 29.
83 Ibid., p. 30.
84 Ibid., p. 8.
2. "The learner of music should always be treated as a person who has a natural impulse to be musical, to seek a clearer, deeper, and more varied musical responsiveness."  

The musical impulse, an inborn tendency to respond to music, is present in infancy. However, depending upon circumstances and environmental stimulation this responsiveness can become more differentiated or can be frustrated. One of the most important factors in a person's musical development is his "will to be musical." Unless this is present, there is little possibility that his response to music will develop.  

Musical response of untrained and unsophisticated persons is to the impact of musical tones; melody and rhythm are not comprehended as separate entities. There is ample evidence from experiments to substantiate the statement that "children always respond to melody as a living totality, not a structure built out of notes." The organic unity of melody is experienced as an entire, unified, flowing curve, with beginning, end, points of emphasis and subordination, and periods of rapid and retarded motion. Rhythm is responded to as an expressive pattern of stress, release, duration, and pause, rather than as an absolutely regular grouping of beats.  

—Richard, p. 66.  
—Richard.  
—Marsell and Glenn, Psychology of Music, p. 33.  
—Marsell, Education for Musical Growth, p. 41.  
—Richard.  
—Richard, p. 43.
3. "A cyclical sequence in which concepts occur again and again in many varied and musical settings ... and their meanings must be progressively clarified through a variety of experiences ..." suggests the way to bring about musical growth.

Mursell has suggested that the means of carrying out this cyclical sequence in learning experiences is through a developmental approach to teaching. This means:

... giving the pupil a grasp of the inner, living essence of what is to be learned at the beginning of the learning experience and guiding the experience so that his grasp of it improves as he seeks to understand the external aspects of the experience.

For example, before beginning the study of musical notation, the learner should have had many varied experiences with music, and should have created it himself. Musical learning then becomes a process of evolution rather than of accumulation. The musical activities and learnings are centered on the development of musical responsiveness, and are agents in bringing about musical growth.

There is no prescribed controlling sequence in which the musical material is to be studied. Mursell feels that such an order "cramps, distorts, and carpenters music together to illustrate the topic." Children grow musically by a continuously developing responsiveness to the expressive quality of music. Thus, there

92Mursell, Music Education: Principles and Programs, p. 364.
93Mursell, Education for Musical Growth, p. 4.
94Ibid., p. 62.
95Ibid.
is no grade-wise order in which achievements are to be reached, but one thing which should happen in all grades is the deepening and broadening of musical responsiveness.

4. The development of musical responsiveness manifests itself in five directions: as growth in musical awareness, in musical initiative, in musical discrimination, in musical insight, and musical skill.95

The above stated avenues of musical growth are inseparable and continually affect each other because they are five aspects of the process of becoming musical. As a person grows in musical responsiveness, he manifests a deeper awareness, a more stimulated initiative, an ability to make finer discriminations, deeper musical insights, and more highly developed skills.96 Conversely, as he grows in each of these aspects, his musical responsiveness increases.

Each avenue of musical growth is given below and is followed by a brief explanation which will clarify the meaning.

Musical awareness. --Musical awareness involves a consciousness of the place of music in human life, a realization that music is an expression of human experience and emotion, and a consciousness of the constituent elements of music.97

Musical initiative. --Musical initiative is the ability to think and act independently in music. It involves a desire to do

95 Ibid., p. 125.
96 Ibid.
97 Ibid., pp. 127-130.
things with music, an ability to make appropriate decisions about what can be done, and having the knowledge necessary to carry out these desires. 98

Musical discrimination.--Musical discrimination is sensitivity to musical meanings which are conveyed by compositions themselves, and by performances either by oneself or by others. 99

Musical insight.--Musical insight is the ability to identify and understand tonal and rhythmic organization of music (melodic patterns, harmonic progressions, rhythmic patterns, tonality) in terms of their intrinsic logic and expressive values. 100

Musical skill.--Musical skill is the ability to convey the desired musical effect by means of the intended medium of expression. In this context, musical skill does not mean only technical dexterity, but the ability to project the musical meaning of a composition. 101

Summary

In this chapter the focus has been upon the "developmental approach" to music education which was conceived by James Mursell. Fundamental to this approach is Mursell's belief that music education has value in terms of its effect upon both the musical and social-personal development of an individual. The basic emphasis of this approach is upon the process of musical growth in which a person's

98Ibid., pp. 126-126.
99Ibid., pp. 172-174.
100Ibid., pp. 192-194.
101Ibid., pp. 219-220.
response to music becomes continually more precise and subtle, wider and deeper.

Mursell has identified the six areas of musical growth as follows: singing, playing instruments, rhythmic activities, listening, creating, and music reading.

Although he refutes the idea that material can be arranged in a simple-to-complex order, he believes that a reasonable and feasible order of presentation of material can be determined.

Four concepts which seem to underlie his approach to music education are:

1. Musical development is entirely possible for all normal people.

2. The learner of music should always be treated as a person who has a natural impulse to be musical, to seek a clearer, deeper, and more varied musical responsiveness.

3. A cyclical sequence in which concepts occur again in many varied and musical settings . . . and their meanings must be progressively clarified through a variety of experiences . . . is the way to bring about musical growth.

4. The development of musical responsiveness manifests itself in five directions: as growth in musical awareness, musical initiative, in musical discrimination, in musical insight, and musical skill.
CHAPTER IV

COMPARISON OF THE ORFF SCHULWERK AND THE DEVELOPMENTAL APPROACH

Introduction

In the preceding chapters, the aims and concepts of music teaching which are assumed to underlie the Orff Schulwerk approach and Mursell’s developmental approach were formulated. The purpose of this chapter is to present a comparative analysis of the two approaches. To accomplish this the concepts developed are restated together with a discussion of their similarities and differences.

Orff Schulwerk Approach

The basic emphasis of the Carl Orff approach to music teaching is upon development of a child’s ability to improvise. The Schulwerk: Music for Children books contain musical examples in which vocal and instrumental music, dance, bodily movement, and poetry are integrated. Orff intends for these examples to serve as models which will stimulate children to create their own improvisations. Although Orff has not further identified other specific areas of musical experience, singing, dance, expressive bodily movement, poetry, playing instruments, creating music, ear training, listening, and eventually music reading are involved in improvisation.

-59-
Analysis of the literature about the Orff Schulwerk approach has revealed concepts which seem to be the basis of the approach. In the discussion which follows, these concepts will be used as the framework for comparison.

1. Schulwerk concerns itself with the primary forces and forms of music.

Both Orff and Mursell have identified what each feels are fundamental experiences with music. Orff refers to "primary forces and forms of music", while Mursell speaks of responsiveness to the tonal and rhythmic pattern which is the essence of music, and to the emotional and expressive values of music. The basic difference between the two approaches is evident when Orff's phrase "primary forces and forms of music" is interpreted.

Orff considers "primary" to mean "primitive, treating the first (earliest) principles of the art of music". Therefore, musical examples in Schulwerk: Music for Children are composed in primitive style in which the rhythmic element is dominant, and are to be played on primitive-sounding instruments. Orff uses the term "elementary music" to refer to music composed in primitive style and which also has these other aspects: (1) elementary music is a unity with dance, movement, and speech, (2) it is created in ensemble situations, and (3) employs unsophisticated, small, sequential forms. Although Mursell has referred to the tonal and rhythmic pattern which is the essence of music, he does not stress the use of primitive-sounding music, and does not consider primitive music preferable to other types.

Another difference between the two approaches is evident in the way each writer interprets "elementary music". Mursell's reference to
"elementary music" is to the development of responsiveness in children of elementary school age to the tonal and rhythmic pattern and emotional and expressive values of music. Orff interprets "elementary music" to be the elements of musical experience as he has identified them.

In the broad sense that both Orff and Mursell consider "elementary music" to be concerned with the development of response to the elements of musical experience as each has interpreted them, some similarity between the approaches is evident.

2. -- Elementary music develops powers in children which otherwise will not come to fruition.

Both Orff and Mursell consider musical growth to be a vital phase of a person's development because it develops aesthetic sensitivity. However, while Orff emphasizes elementary music as a subject fundamental to all other subjects, no such emphasis was found in Mursell's writings.

A concept important in the Orff approach is that if young children's imagination, intellect, and kinesthetic awareness are deprived of stimulation, these sensitivities will not be developed. Although Mursell has stated that musical development is possible for all normal human beings, he apparently sets no limits upon the age at which such awareness can be developed.

The "powers" which Orff believes elementary music develops are imagination, intellect, kinesthetic awareness, the ability to sense, feel, and control the expression of that feeling. Mursell has not identified such specific powers, but writes of development in two areas -- musical and social-personal development. He has explained musical
development as "increasing a person's responsiveness and sensitivity to tonal and rhythmic patterns of music, enabling him to realize his musical potential, and develop his ability to perceive, think, image, and respond emotionally to tonal and rhythmic design in music". Social-personal development involves bringing persons enjoyment, satisfaction from personal achievement, disciplinary experiences, social relationships, and widening cultural horizons as a result of participation in musical activities. An emphasis which seems to be dominant in Mursell's writing but not in Orff's is the inclusion of the area of social-personal development.

In his explanation of elementary music, Orff has identified what he considers to be the scope of musical participation for young children. Mursell apparently is writing of musical experience for a person of any age who is studying music and participating in musical activities.

3.--Spontaneous musical expression will result from exercises designed to lead students to acquire a well-developed technique of improvisation.

Orff has composed the musical examples in Schulwerk: Music for Children for the purpose of providing children with a background of musical ideas intended to serve as stimuli for their improvisations. The compositions have been arranged in what Orff considers to be a graded sequence in order of complexity. In contrast, a concept which underlies the developmental approach is that musical growth is a process of gaining a deeper, broader, more precise understanding of the expressive values of music. Mursell proposes that there is a reasonable and feasible, rather than a logical order of learning.
experiences, and that all students do not necessarily follow the same sequence of learning activities.

Another difference of emphasis between the two approaches is that Orff specifically designates improvisation to be a creation of music, dance, verse, or movement pattern, and emphasizes that improvisations in these media are fundamental musical experiences. In a more broad sense, Marsell considers development of new understanding as well as creation of new music to be a creative activity and an outcome of increased musical insight.

4. Effective teaching material is written from the child's point of view.

Orff believes that elementary, tonally restricted, primitive music is suitable for children. Reasons which he has cited to support his view are that (1) the pentatonic melodies represent the deepest layer of folk-song and correspond to the mental development of children, and (2) the point at which to approach music-making with musically naive children is with the music which originated when mankind was first experimenting with music-making. Marsell, on the other hand, favors the use of art music and judiciously-chosen folk music which the teacher feels will have meaning for children, rather than including only compositions children have written, or folk songs. He does not emphasize use of speech exercises and melodies which are tonally restricted.

Both writers agree upon the use of instruments, however, with regard to the type of instruments, a striking difference of opinion is evident. While Marsell approves rhythm band or so-called "toy instruments for children", Orff deplores their use and stresses the
inclusion of specially-designed and constructed instruments which have been carefully voiced so that a balanced ensemble sound can be produced.

5.-A child, if introduced to a restricted medium, will find his own mode of expression.

Based upon the writings of both men, one could generalize that a similarity between the two approaches is the idea that children should find their own way of responding to music. The evident difference is the type of response each writer emphasizes. As Orff employs the word "expression", he means improvisation whether vocal or instrumental music, poetry, dance, or bodily movement as the vehicle of expression. He stresses the importance of limiting the musical materials so the child can find his own mode of expression.

In contrast, Marsell considers the person's discovery of his own way of responding to music to be more important than development of his ability to improvise; however, Marsell acknowledges that improvisation may be what Orff refers to as a "mode of expression" for some people. Marsell considers grasp of a new insight, realization of a higher level of achievement, discovery of an ability, as well as creation of new music, to be valid expressions of musical understanding.

The Developmental Approach

In the section which follows, the Schulwerk and developmental approaches will be compared in terms of specific areas of musical experience. For purposes of organization, Marsell's areas of musical growth are used. Marsell has identified six areas of musical growth, and explains that through guided experience with them, a person's musical
discrimination becomes wider, deeper, and more precise and subtle. These six activities are singing, playing instruments, rhythmic activities, creating music, listening activities, and music reading.

Experience in singing. --In both the Schulwerk and developmental approaches, singing is an important musical experience. Although no extensive discussion of singing was found in literature about the Schulwerk approach, one need only glance through the books of exercises to see that singing is important. A special use of the voice in Orff Schulwerk is dramatized, rhythmic chanting of rhymes, sayings and proverbs as a basic learning experience. Mursell considers singing a primary and essential musical experience for children, but places no emphasis upon speech exercises.

Experience with instruments. --Orff and Mursell seem to be in agreement upon the importance of using easy-to-play instruments. The types of instruments to be used in both approaches are the same -- flutes with whistle-like mouthpieces, percussion instruments, melody instruments which are played by being struck, and harmony instruments. However, there are differences between the specific instruments employed and the emphasis given to the playing of instruments. Mursell favors the use of rhythm band, homemade, and other "toy" instruments such as songflutes, rhythm sticks, cymbals, triangles, gongs, bells, and, in addition, autoharps and piano.

The instrumental ensemble which Orff has developed consists of many more instruments of each type, especially in the melodic percussion group. Each instrument has been carefully chosen with regard to tone quality and range so that a balanced ensemble sound can be created. The Orff instrumental ensemble is composed of melodic percussion instruments --
soprano, alto-tenor, and bass xylophones, metallophones, and glockenspiels; percussion instruments -- timpani, hand drums and tambourines of various sizes and pitches, bongos, snares, triangles, maracas, wrist bells, rattles; recorders -- soprano, alto, tenor, and bass; harmony instruments -- guitars, portative organs, and spinets, but never piano. These instruments are not toys, but are especially constructed instruments of good tone quality which are, nonetheless, easy to play.

There seems to be a difference in the emphasis which each writer places upon experience with instruments. Marsell conceives the use of easy-to-play instruments as a means of directing the learner's attention to different aspects of the music -- a harmonic progression, a rhythmic pattern, a melodic or harmonic line -- thus sharpening his awareness of the music. In the Schulwerk approach, a strong emphasis is placed upon experience with instruments. These instruments are one of the media through which improvisations are communicated; the other media are voice and bodily movements. Orff's instrumental ensemble can be said to function as an orchestra because it consists of instruments which are not toys, and is arranged according to range of pitch and tone color of the instruments.

Experience with rhythm. -- The style of compositions and order of arrangement of them in Schulwerk: Music for Children indicates that Orff considers the rhythmic element of music to be of prime importance. In his opinion, the strongest response of young or musically unsophisticated children is to rhythm. Throughout the Schulwerk approach an emphasis is placed upon developing children's rhythmic response. Speech exercises, the use of percussion instruments, and
expressive bodily movement are three ways in which children's
attention is directed to this element of music.

Marsell does not agree that the response of unsophisticated
musicians or very young children is to rhythm alone. He believes
that this response is to a body of musical tone which rhythm
and melody are undifferentiated. Therefore, Marsell does not
stress the beginning with speech or rhythmical exercises, but
rather with music itself. This seems to be a basic difference
between the two approaches.

Similarities between the approaches can be identified. Both
men advocate the use of percussion instruments to emphasize
rhythmic pattern; however, the specific instruments to be used are
different. The value of a strong feeling of rhythm as a motivation
for musical composition is likewise a point of agreement.

Marsell and Orff acknowledge the importance of comprehension
of rhythm in terms of bodily movement. The Dalcroze Eurhythmics
method has been an influence upon the ideas of both men; Orff based
much of his approach upon the ideas of Dalcroze, and Marsell
advocates the incorporation of Eurhythmics techniques into music
teaching.

An emphasis of the Orff approach which is not evident in Marsell's
is the combination of musical and physical improvisations. Bodily
movements are to be improvised to express musical compositions, and
vice versa. In Music for Children very little explanation of
expressive bodily movement is given, hence, one might perceive a
distorted idea of what these experiences can be. However, at the Orff
Schulwerk Institute in Salzburg, Austria, one participates and learns
first-hand how Orff has incorporated expressive bodily movement into this approach. Phrases, sections of compositions, and entire compositions are interpreted in bodily movement.

Experience in listening.—Mursell has written comprehensively about the value of music listening to an individual's musical growth. He has identified several kinds of listening experiences which can be considered as falling into two general categories. The first are those experiences through which a person develops a continually deeper awareness of the music he performs and hears performed by someone else. The second are listening experiences in which a person becomes familiar with music literature that he might not otherwise hear.

Orff does not elaborate on music listening. However, listening experiences are inherent in his improvisation activities. As children participate in creation of ensemble improvisations, they must listen intently to the music in order to make their contribution. Although no suggestions were found for use of recorded literature with students, there is no evidence that Orff would disapprove of such experiences. In fact, he has said that experience with musical activities of Schulwerk prepares a child to understand and appreciate all types of music from any period.

The main difference in the two approaches with regard to music listening is that Mursell has developed a more comprehensive statement of the aims of such experiences and the type of literature to be used, whereas Orff has developed a program of experiences in improvisation. Through these activities the children's attention is focused upon listening to music which is being created and performed.
Experience in creating music.--An important difference between
the Schulwerk and developmental approaches is the emphasis placed
upon development of a child's ability to create new music, and upon
the way such an ability can be developed.

Mursell places no particular emphasis upon the development
of a child's ability to create new music. He believes that
discovery of new insights into music one performs or hears performed
is one type of creative response, and that creation of music and
extemporization will be natural outcomes of a program of musical
experiences in which students are encouraged to discover new
insights into music.

Creation of new music, or improvisations, is an important
emphasis of the Schulwerk approach. Orff is interested in making
it possible for a child to find modes of expression of his own
without merely imitating the examples of other kinds of music.
A major emphasis of the Schulwerk approach is upon developing a
child's ability to improvise. Orff believes that a beginning with
limited tonal possibilities makes it possible for almost any person,
no matter how little musical experience he has had, to participate
in creation of music. The books of musical examples have been
written to provide a graded collection of compositions which Orff
believes will give children musical experiences and prepare them
to create their own compositions.

Nowhere in Orff's writings was it found that any specified
length of time should be spent on one type of exercise, nor that
all students should study every example of every book. Rather,
the study chapters consist of self-contained series of graded exercises from which the needed examples are to be chosen. It must be constantly kept in mind that the "Studies in Rhythm and Melody" are the most fundamental of all the exercises.¹

In the Schulwerk approach, improvisation activity can be continued indefinitely, even though one begins study of a standard instrument.

Two emphases which seem to be unique to Orff's approach are:

(1) the use of a pentatonic scale in beginning improvisation experiences, and (2) the primitive musical style. Since children learn musical examples in this idiom, they learn to improvise in this style. Simple formal structures, such as sequential progressions, rondo forms, verse and refrains, and canons are the framework for many of the improvisations.

Mursell, in his discussions of music literature, discourages a return to primitive musical conditions unless such music is made meaningful for the learners. Orff, however, has found this approach through primitive-sounding music to be successful in developing children's and adults' ability to improvise.

Experience in music reading.--There seems to be no basic disagreement between the two approaches in the importance placed upon experience with musical notation.

Both writers consider experience in music-making to be a prerequisite to learning the symbolic representation of music, and feel that notation (pictures, gestures, or symbols) can be introduced as soon as the teacher feels students have had experiences which will make the use of notation meaningful. The emphasis of the Schulwerk approach is upon ear training. Although all compositions

are to be performed from memory, notation is not to be disregarded. It is to be introduced from the very beginning so children can notate rhythmic and melodic ideas which occur to them. Marsell does not place so much emphasis upon improvisation or upon performance from memory. He considers music reading skills important and advocates development of these skills along with a progressively clearer, fuller, and better understanding of music.
CHAPTER V

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

Summary

In Chapter One, which is the introduction to this study, a statement of the problem to be investigated was made and procedures for implementing the study were outlined.

The stated purpose of this study was to identify the concepts of music teaching which underlie the Orff Schulwerk approach and to compare these concepts with those of music education in America as set forth by James Mursell.

Carl Orff's Schulwerk approach is the focal point of Chapter Two. This approach was analyzed in terms of the theoretical points of view which underlie it, the origin and development of the approach, and the musical experiences which are included. Concepts of music teaching which seem to underlie the approach were formulated and explained.

The developmental approach as conceived by James Mursell is the topic of Chapter Three. His philosophy of music, of music education, and consequent approach to music teaching were discussed. Concepts of music teaching which seem to underlie this approach were identified and explained.

-72-
Chapter Four contains discussion of similarities and differences between these approaches. The points of comparison were: (1) concepts of music teaching, and (2) areas of musical experience.

Conclusions

In order to carry out this study, it was necessary to determine the concepts which underlie the Orff Schulwerk and Mursell developmental approaches to teaching music. The ideas upon which the Orff Schulwerk seems to be based are stated below:

1. Schulwerk concerns itself with the primary forces and forms of music.
2. Elementary music develops powers in children which otherwise will not come to fruition.
3. Spontaneous musical expression will result from exercises designed to lead students to acquire a well-developed technique of improvisation.
4. Effective teaching material is written from the child's point of view.
5. A child, if introduced to a restricted medium, will find his own mode of expression.

The concepts which seem to be dominant in Mursell's developmental approach are:

1. Musical development is entirely possible for all normal people.
2. The learner of music should always be treated as a person who has a natural impulse to be musical, to seek a clearer, deeper, broader, and more varied musical responsiveness.
3. A cyclical sequence in which concepts occur again and again in many varied and musical settings and their meanings must be progressively clarified through a variety of experiences is the way to bring about musical growth.

4. The development of musical responsiveness manifests itself in five directions, as growth in musical awareness, musical initiative, musical discrimination, musical insight, and musical skill.

After the concepts of each approach had been determined, the similarities and differences between the approaches were compared in terms of emphases and areas of musical experience. It was found that concepts which seem to be the basis of the Orff approach are unique to Schulwerk, therefore, it was difficult to relate each concept specifically to the concepts which seem to underlie Mursell's approach. However, within the frame of reference of each concept, similarities and differences were evident. For purposes of summarization, the similarities and differences between the two approaches can be grouped according to (a) theoretical bases, (b) approach to music learning, and (c) types of music literature utilised.

Theoretical Bases

General philosophical considerations which seem to be common to both the Orff Schulwerk approach and the developmental approach of Mursell are: (1) music is a means of emotional expression, (2) music is a medium for the transmission of culture, (3) participation in musical activities has value in terms of its effect upon the musical and social-personal development of
children, (4) development of musical understanding is possible for normal children, and (5) development of the child's understanding of music is a desirable objective.

In addition to the above general philosophical considerations, specific ideas mentioned by one or both writers were found. These ideas are discussed in the paragraphs which follow.

Elementary music.—A dominant idea in Orff's philosophy of music is that essential musical experience can be identified. This core of music is what exists when all historical associations have been stripped away and only the essence of music remains. Orff believes that "elementary music" embodies this essential musical experience. Within the framework of the Orff Schulwerk approach, the concept of "elementary music" has a unique character. As Orff interprets this concept, it is essentially primitive music, and as such emphasizes what he considers to be the elemental or first principles of the art.

Mursell makes no reference to "elementary music" in the sense in which Orff uses the concept. In Mursell's terminology, "elementary music" refers generally to music which is taught in the elementary school. In order to understand the Schulwerk approach, one must first understand the concept of elementary music as Orff has interpreted it.

Recapitulation theory.—In the introduction to Volume I of the Music for Children texts, Walter has written:

... his guiding principle, his leitmotif is that the growth of music must be re-enacted in a growing human being; that a child must be led through the various stages (from the most primitive to the more complex) which man traversed before music reached the level on which we find it now.\(^1\)

According to this principle, learners profit from beginning study of music at the point of its origin, supposedly with rhythm, and need to experience the development of the musical scale from the falling minor third to the major scale. This principle seems to be similar to a theory which Marsell has referred to as the "Recapitulation Theory". Marsell gives no credence to this theory. In his words:

It is now well-recognized that there is no evidence of an individual's mental growth being determined by racial development. Above all, human individuals are not held to any rigid, predetermined sequence of mental growth, as they would be if they recapitulated the alleged racial sequence.²

It is difficult to know whether Orff regards this theory as an underlying concept of his Schulwerk approach, because no mention of it was found in primary source material which was studied. If this concept does, in fact, underlie this approach, another difference between the philosophies of Orff and Marsell is evident.

Basic response to music.—A basic difference can be identified between Orff and Marsell with regard to the musical response each feels is most basic. Orff considers rhythm to be the most striking and most basic element of music. Marsell, however, believed that the response of musically unsophisticated persons is first and foremost to the body of musical tone, not to rhythm of melody as separate elements. As an individual pursues repeated experiences with music, he becomes aware that the rhythmic and melodic elements of this body of sound can be differentiated.

²Marsell, Education for Musical Growth, p. 58.
Forms of music.--There seems to be no difference of opinion between the ideas of Marsell and Orff with regard to the forms in which the musical expressions of untrained and unsophisticated musicians are conveyed. Orff believes that elementary music is conveyed in small, sequential forms such as rondo and ostinato. Marsell cites the Pillsbury studies in which the experimenters found that expressive music-making of very young children contained, in embryo form, the compositional techniques of rhythmic variation, sequential progression, recurrent refrains, primitive rondo forms, varying instrumentation, and so forth.

Unity of music and movement.--Both writers are agreed upon the unity of music and bodily movement. This concept is embodied in Orff's explanation of elementary music, and Marsell supports this unity on the basis of the opinions of psychologists and students of aesthetics who say that actual grasp of music is dependent upon movement consciousness.

Approach to Music Learning

A fundamental difference between the Schulwerk and developmental approaches is the emphasis of each. The emphasis in turn affects the way in which musical understanding is to be developed. The philosophical concept of elementary music as Orff has defined it is the basis of the Schulwerk approach. Consequent musical activities have been conceived as the way in which Orff believes children can experience the core of music itself. He refers to this as the "essential musical experience". A primary emphasis of this approach seems to be upon the development of a child's ability to improvise as a means for developing his understanding of music. The Schulwerk approach
as found in the books Music for Children is a graded series of exercises and compositions which have been written to serve as models for children's own improvisations.

The beginning emphasis is upon rhythm, and in all compositions which follow, the rhythmic element predominates. Melodies are arranged in order of the number of tones involved. The progression is from songs employing two, three, and four tones, to those using the entire scale. The direction of this approach seems to be from experience with the primary forces and forms of music in tonally restricted contexts to an understanding of these forces and forms in contexts which are continually less restricted. Such an organization of materials appears to follow a simple-to-complex sequence.

In contrast, Marsell did not place much importance upon developing the ability to improvise. His emphasis was upon musical growth, a process of becoming continually more aware of the expressive values of music. Therefore, the progression of learning experiences he established was from a vague understanding to a continually more differentiated, subtle, precise, discriminating, wider, and deeper response to music. A basic concept seems to be that the direction of musical understanding is from general comprehension to understanding of specifics, whereas the direction of the Orff approach seems to be from specific to general, and possibly, from simple to complex.

Marsell disagreed with the idea that experiences can be arranged in a simple-to-complex sequence. His argument is, briefly, that all learners do not find the same task equally difficult, hence, will not need to begin at the same place, nor to progress in the same
order. Although a logical sequence is not possible, for any group of learners a reasonable and feasible sequence can be determined.

If the progression of learning experiences in Orff's approach is from simple to complex, and if one accepts Mursell's argument against the feasibility of this approach, such a sequence of learning experiences cannot, in Mursell's opinion, be defended.

Types of Music Literature

In the books which Mursell has written about the developmental approach, he constructed the ideological framework of this approach, and suggested the type of music literature which should be used. Although elaborate, organized lists of musical examples are not given, Mursell leaves little doubt in the reader's mind about the types of music literature he considers most worthwhile. The use of music which is a genuine and heartfelt expression of the feelings of a person or group of people (art or folk music) is preferable to compositions which have been written to illustrate a technical aspect of music. In his opinion, these "pedagogical songs" have little or no musical value, hence, no educational value. Folk song literature should not be made a fetish of, or used exclusively. Rather, carefully chosen folk song literature which will have meaning for the child should be included.

No suggestions for use of music literature of different periods was found in Orff's writings, however, this does not mean that he believes such music should be excluded from the child's experience. In his opinion, experience with the Schulwerk approach
prepares children to appreciate all types of music -- folk, symphonic, primitive, and contemporary.

Although Orff favors the use of folk music (especially indigenous children's songs), it is difficult to know which of the melodies in *Music for Children* are folk songs, and which have been composed and arranged in the style of Orff's major works. Melodies and orchestrations which were written or arranged by Doreen Hall are acknowledged, but sources for the majority of other compositions are not given. The authenticity of song texts, but not of the melodies is acknowledged. One wonders whether the melodies are indigenous and the orchestrations composed, or whether the melodies have been composed by Orff, Keetman, and Hall for the purpose of illustrating the technical aspects of music which are to be learned.

The use of primitive-sounding music is another difference between the two approaches. Although Marsell approves the judicious use of folk music, his words, "we cannot recapture the social meaning of music by a sort of regression to primitive conditions" indicate a point of disagreement between his and the Orff approach.

The use of rhymes and proverbs as speech exercises in the Schulwerk approach seems to be unique. Marsell mentions the use of chants which children create spontaneously, but has not incorporated use of such chants into his approach to teaching music.

In summary, it may be stated that seven major emphases of the Schulwerk approach seem to be unique. These are: (1) developing a

---

child's ability to improvise, (2) continued improvisation activity even after music reading skills have been developed, (3) a graded series of musical exercises composed to familiarize children with the possible forms of musical expression, (4) use of indigenous children's songs and folksongs which have been arranged in a primitive style, (5) use of specially-designed primitive-sounding instruments, (6) beginning study of music with an emphasis upon rhythm, and adding the melodic element a tone at a time, and (7) developing a feeling for rhythm and the expressive quality of music through a special emphasis upon bodily movement.

If one considers these emphases of the Schulwerk approach in terms of Marsell's concepts, several differences of opinion are evident. First, Marsell does not consider the development of a child's ability to improvise a major objective in a program of music education. Improvisation or extemporization is an aspect of musical growth, but is not considered by Marsell to be a prerequisite or fundamental musical experience. Second, he does not believe that musical examples can be arranged in a sequential order. Such a sequence or graded order will not be appropriate for all learners because all children do not need to begin music study with the same experiences. A fundamental concept of his approach is, rather, that a more thorough understanding of music is developed when the learner proceeds from a vague understanding to knowledge of specifics. He does not accept the idea that learning proceeds from knowledge of specifics (sol-mi) to general understanding (major scale).
Another emphasis of Marsell's approach is upon the use of art music and carefully chosen folk song literature. Little importance is placed upon the use of indigenous children's songs or upon the almost exclusive use of folksongs. Marsell considers an overemphasis on primitive music to be a regression to primitive conditions, and does not approve such an approach.

The process of musical growth as Marsell has developed it is based upon the idea that fundamental musical responsiveness is to a body of musical tone, not to rhythm as a separate element. This is also related to his concept that musical awareness develops from a general comprehension to understanding of specific elements. Therefore, Orff's concepts that rhythmic response is the most basic response, and that musical awareness develops from specifics to a general understanding are not in agreement with Marsell's concepts.

Briefly, the Orff Schulwerk approach was created as a way in which Orff believes children's understanding of music will be deepened through the development of their ability to improvise. This approach has grown out of his first-hand experience with adults and children. The emphases of this approach are unique because they are an outgrowth of Orff's philosophy that the learner develops his own principles of musical organization as he participates in music-making activities.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Articles


---


---


---


---


---


---


---


---

Books


---


---


---


---


*Other Sources*


Flach, Lotte. Lectures and demonstrations, Orff Institute, Mozarteum Academy, Salzburg, June-July, 1962.

Hall, Doreen. Lectures and demonstrations, Orff Institute, Mozarteum Academy, Salzburg, June-July, 1962.

Keetman, Gunild. Lectures and demonstrations, Orff Institute, Mozarteum Academy, Salzburg, June-July, 1962.

Mathey, Polixene. Lectures and demonstrations, Orff Institute, Mozarteum Academy, Salzburg, June-July, 1962.

Orff, Carl. Lectures and demonstrations, Orff Institute, Mozarteum Academy, Salzburg, June-July, 1962.

*———.* *The Schulwerk,* Angel Records, B. C. Angel 356501. Four sides, twelve inch, 33-1/3 r.p.m.