This thesis seeks to study the process by which local actors in Kosovo take the international norm of human trafficking and apply it to their unique experience of trafficking. I construct a framework drawn from literature on anti-trafficking policy, global governance and hidden populations to lay a ground work by which to understand the process of interpreting norms and the difficulties in making claims about trafficking victims. I explore how Kosovo developed their anti-trafficking policy and the role that the international community played in its construction. However, that policy must then be interpreted by local actors and therein can lay discrepancies. Those discrepancies are then reflected in implementation and subsequent retooling of anti-trafficking policy. The effects of those discrepancies can then hinder the effectiveness of the policy.
INTERNATIONAL ANTI-TRAFFICKING NORMS IN KOSOVO:
HOW LOCAL ACTORS IMPLEMENT GLOBAL EXPECTATIONS

A Thesis
Submitted to the
Faculty of Miami University
In partial fulfillment of
the requirements for the degree of
Masters of Arts
Department of Geography
by
Nicollette Staton
Miami University
Oxford, Ohio
2014

Advisor ______________________
(Carl Dahlman)

Reader ______________________
(Marcia England)

Reader ______________________
(David Prytherch)
Table of Contents

Table of Contents ................................................................. ii

1.0 Introduction ........................................................................ 1
  1.1 Aim of Study ................................................................. 1
  1.2 Research Questions ....................................................... 4
    1.2.1 Interpreting Anti-Trafficking Norms ......................... 5
    1.2.2 Policy and Implementation of Anti-trafficking Activities 5
    1.2.3 Effectiveness of Kosovo’s Anti-trafficking Policy .......... 6
  1.3 Site Selection ................................................................. 6
  1.4 Conclusion ..................................................................... 7

2.0 Literature .......................................................................... 8
  2.1 Anti-Trafficking Policy ..................................................... 8
  2.2 Global Governance ......................................................... 9
    2.2.1 Spatial Dependence of Anti-trafficking Policy .......... 10
    2.2.2 Global Governance in Kosovo .................................. 11
  2.3 Studying Hidden/Vulnerable Populations ......................... 11
  2.4 Conclusion .................................................................... 16

3.0 Methods .......................................................................... 17
  3.1 Documentary Analysis .................................................... 17
  3.2 Semi-Structured Interviews .............................................. 18
  3.3 Descriptive Statistics ....................................................... 19
  3.4 Field Work Activities ...................................................... 19
  3.5 Conclusion .................................................................... 22

4.0 Results and Analysis ......................................................... 24
  4.1 Defining Human Trafficking ............................................. 24
    4.1.1 Official Definition .................................................... 25
    4.1.2 Official Statistics .................................................... 26
    4.1.3 International Involvement ........................................ 27
    4.1.4 International Evaluation of Anti-Trafficking Work .... 30
    4.1.5 Lindstrom Application ............................................. 32
  4.2 Local Interpretation of Human Trafficking ......................... 35
    4.2.1 Domestic Problem .................................................... 36
    4.2.2 Sex Trafficking ....................................................... 37
    4.2.3 Women ................................................................ 37
    4.2.4 Ethnicity ............................................................... 38
  4.3 Impact on Policy and Implementation ............................... 38
    4.3.1 Domestic Problem .................................................... 38
    4.3.2 Sex Trafficking of Women ....................................... 40
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3</td>
<td>Kosovar Albanians</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Effectiveness of RKS Anti-Trafficking Policy</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.1</td>
<td>Limited Capacity</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.2</td>
<td>Identification System</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.3</td>
<td>Prosecution</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.4</td>
<td>Reintegration</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.5</td>
<td>Traditional Society</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.6</td>
<td>Ethnic Minorities</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>Conclusion of Results and Analysis</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>New Questions</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.1</td>
<td>Incorporation of other actors</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.2</td>
<td>Interviews in minority regions of Kosovo</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>References</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix A</td>
<td></td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix B</td>
<td></td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 1.0 Introduction

When the NATO troops ousted the Serbian forces in 1999, the international community flooded into to assess what had truly taken place and begin efforts to rebuild Kosovo. What they found was an array of human wrongs committed during the war and for the first time an identification of human trafficking as an issue plaguing not only former Yugoslavia, but more specifically Kosovo. Prior to international involvement, human trafficking had not been viewed by locals as a problem in Kosovo and the international community is often blamed for the appearance of epidemic (Smith & Smith 2010). The opening of Kosovo to the international community came at the same time that both academics and policy makers were beginning to call for a universal definition of human trafficking to better coordinate responses from country to country. The international community, namely the UN, was also beginning its first state building efforts and Kosovo quickly became a laboratory of sorts for internationals seeking to shape the infancy of a potential new state (Novotna 2010). Numerous international actors flooded into Kosovo to offer aid in various, yet sometimes competing, capacities.

It was this influx of so many actors seeking to address the same problem that led to the question of how do local actors interpret and apply the concept of human trafficking and how does that affect their anti-trafficking policy and implementation? Each of these actors could potentially have a different interpretation of what constitutes human trafficking even though there is a singular international definition. The actors also have differing missions and capacities to deal with human trafficking, which could shape how they approach policy. This study seeks to show, how the disconnect between the definition and the interpretation limit Kosovo from effectively addressing human trafficking.

Slavery is currently outlawed in every country of the world, yet the estimated number of slaves in the world today surpasses the number of those traded during the entirety of the Atlantic Slave Trade (UN.GIFT). Modern day slavery, more often referred to as human trafficking, encompasses a range of forced services: prostitution; sexual exploitation; forced labor; slavery and; organ removal. The issue of human trafficking is not reserved to either the developed or developing world but is a worldwide issue plaguing every type of government and economy. 161 countries are reported to be affected by human trafficking as either a source, transit or destination country (UN.GIFT 2013). With a vast array of different countries affected by human
trafficking, it begins to call into question whose responsibility it is to combat this injustice. To combat human trafficking, there is first a need for reliable numbers and an understanding of where human trafficking is taking place. At present it is believed by the United Nations (UN) that there are between 20 to 30 million victims entrenched in the trafficking industry but because it is a hidden population, the UN is unable to produce a more accurate estimate of the magnitude of human trafficking. The reliability of data has consequently become one of the main issues in making knowledge claims about human trafficking and constructing anti-trafficking policy (Tyldum 2010). Another issue in anti-trafficking efforts is the responsibility for combatting human trafficking and competing jurisdictions. Since an estimated 600,000 to 800,000 trafficked persons are moved across international borders each year, actors at several scales, with varying approaches on how to address human trafficking, are engaged in anti-trafficking efforts (UN.GIFT 2013). This has led to the previously established research question.

As concerns in human trafficking grew in the 1990s, academics and policy makers struggled to reach a consensus regarding the definition of human trafficking and what constituted a human trafficking victim. Acknowledging that one definition was integral for the international community to move forward, the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime established the Protocol to Prevent Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons (UNODC). Policy makers sought to ensure that several key areas were addressed in the definition. First, the definition condemned taking part in any step of trafficking, ranging from recruitment to delivery. It also outlined the specific purposes by which a person could be trafficked. Though women and children are often the focus of exploitation, policy makers acknowledged that the definition need to include all people and should not be specifically focused on this group (Jones 2012). Most importantly, it defined that the means must demonstrate use of force or coercion (among other means) against the victims for the purpose of exploiting them to be considered human trafficking (Davidson 2010, Van Liempt 2011). Since 2000, the majority of the international community, states, Non-governmental Organizations (NGOs), Intergovernmental Organizations (IGOs) and other actors have accepted the UN definition. Such as the International Organization for Migration, and the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe. Adopting this definition is important for membership to both the UN and the EU. States with a high degree of dependence on international organizations, like Kosovo, have been pressured to adopt this definition.
The definitional framework provides an important starting point for the study of human trafficking and anti-trafficking policy. As the table shows (Figure 1), there are three main aspects of the definition for an act to be considered human trafficking. First, the act must be characterized as one or more acts of the process of human trafficking: recruitment, transport, transfer, harboring, and/or receipt of persons. Second, the means by which this act was conducted must demonstrate the use of: threat or force; coercion; abduction; fraud; deception; abuse of power or vulnerability; or giving payments or benefits. Lastly, it is required that the acts or means be done for the purpose of exploitation in one of the following manners: prostitution; sexual exploitation; forced labor; slavery; removal of organs; or other types of exploitation. Even though a clear international norm has been established regarding human trafficking, the actual implementation of norms, especially in the case of human trafficking, is more problematic. Weak states, such as Kosovo, have limited capacity by which to implement this norm. Limited capacity coupled with cultural and political stigma surrounding human trafficking may begin to explain why human trafficking is so difficult to combat.

![Figure 1 UN Definition of Human Trafficking (UNDOC)](image)

Currently, anti-trafficking activities are primarily the response of governments. Like all international norms, the implementation of anti-trafficking policy needs to respond to the local experience of the issue. However, the effectiveness of implementation continues to be evaluated by the international community which has a specific expectation of what constitutes an
“effective” response. Anti-trafficking responses are evaluated based on: if the country adopts the international definition for human trafficking, effective allocates agencies and resources to create an anti-trafficking response and implements anti trafficking activities that target both traffickers and victims. The most notable evaluation is the US Trafficking in Persons Report (US TIP Report) which is conducted by US Department of State yearly on each country (US TIP 2013).

1.1 Aim of Study

The aim of this study is to provide a recent and small scale evaluation of how human trafficking is being addressed in Kosovo. The current academic literature regarding human trafficking in Kosovo was written several years ago and discusses Kosovo in terms of the Balkan region, with little specific attention to the local scale. During the research period of these articles, Kosovo had not yet declared independence and was under interim supervision by the UN. Since 2008, the Republic of Kosovo has been responsible for combating human trafficking within its borders, though this is not accomplished without assistance from the international community.

My research focuses on the entirety of anti-trafficking policy creation beginning with the deployment of United Nations Mission in Kosovo (UNMIK) in 1999 until the summer of 2013, concentrating on how a weak quasi-state government understands and implements the international definition of human trafficking.

1.2 Research Questions

Drawing on the established literature on human trafficking and previous case studies in the region, this study will seek to answer:

How do anti-trafficking actors in Kosovo interpret and apply the concept of human trafficking and how does that affect their anti-trafficking policy and implementation?

The following sub questions help to answer in greater details the process Kosovo underwent in defining human trafficking, interpreting that definition, and implementing and anti-trafficking policy. The sub questions will seek to draw a connection between the grey literature and real world application of anti-trafficking policy through the use of methods that focus mainly on documentary analysis and interviews. To answer these questions I conducted field work in the Pristhina, the capital city of the newly independent Kosovo. My research sought to understand how various anti-trafficking efforts in Kosovo were dealing with the transnational issue of human trafficking, in a state still recovering from the effects of war and ethnic cleansing. While
on site during the summer of 2013, I primarily conducted interviews with anti-trafficking actors and collected documents generated by those actors to understand the creation and implementation of anti-trafficking policy in Kosovo. I also made use of official statistics to understand who is being counted as a victim of trafficking and spatial trends.

1.2.1 Interpreting Anti-Trafficking Norms

How do anti-trafficking actors in Kosovo interpret international human trafficking norms?

This question connects with the literature which often notes that although there is now a widely accepted singular definition for human trafficking; the definition is still up for interpretation by local actors. It also seeks to analyze the potential disconnect between acceptance of the international definition and the on the ground application of anti-trafficking policy in Kosovo. I will first establish how human trafficking is defined by anti-trafficking actors in Kosovo, and analyze what role international actors and norms had in the creation of Kosovo’s definition. I will then examine the reality of anti-trafficking efforts through the use of historical statistic. In conjunction with documentary analysis and field interviews with anti-trafficking actors, I conclude with the practical definition that Kosovo has derived from the international norm.

1.2.2 Policy and Implementation of Anti-Trafficking Activities

How do Kosovo’s knowledge claims about the state of human trafficking affect policy formation and implementation?

Drawing on the results of the previous questions, this question will analyze how the interpretation of the issue of human trafficking, presumably different from the international definition, impacts both policy creation and the subsequent on the ground implementation. I will utilize official statistics, documentary analysis and interviews with anti-trafficking efforts to discuss the successes and failures of the anti-trafficking network in combatting human trafficking in Kosovo and how those success and failures shed light on the understanding of human trafficking.
1.2.3 Effectiveness of Kosovo’s Anti-trafficking Policy

What effects has Kosovo’s limited capacity had on the success of anti-trafficking policy? This question seeks to synthesis both the theoretical framework and methods selected for the study to make an evaluation on the effectiveness of Kosovo’s anti-trafficking policy. While also providing an explanation for the disconnect between Kosovo’s vision for anti-trafficking work and the reality of anti-trafficking efforts.

1.3 Site Selection

Kosovo presents a unique situation in which to study any policy creation process, especially anti-trafficking policy, since Kosovo is one of the few countries to be specifically administered by the international community for a period of its history. Also, since declaring independence in 2008, the recently formed state is still actively seeks to gain UN recognition from the entire international community. The lack of official recognition has left Kosovo with weak sovereign capacity on the world stage and forced a continued reliance on the international community. This reliance coupled with Kosovo’s desire to gain membership to the European Union has produced an open multi-scalar policy process.

The Balkans are an important and interesting region for the study of human trafficking for several reasons. First, human trafficking was not as pervasive in this region before the fall of communist regimes, which brought a breakdown in the society and economy while opening borders and a painful transition to capitalism (Brunoskis & Surettes 2010). As a result, there was an increase in poverty and an increase in organized crime within states with weak governments that could not provide for their citizens. Second, the wars in former Yugoslavia added to the both the opportunity for traffickers in the chaos that resulted and demand for trafficking victims, specifically sex trafficking victims for use by armed forces (Brunoskis & Surettes 2010). Women were frequently trafficked by enemy forces and also for use by international actors that came as a result of the UN peacekeeping activities (Smith & Smith 2010). Third, the Balkans are a gateway between the East and West, with many trafficking routes running through this region for transportation of over 100,000 people throughout all of Europe (Friman & Reich 2007). Fourth, the states have weak governments and are unable to effectively control their borders which allows for easy access into these countries. Specifically, this region’s proximity to the European
Union (EU) eases entry, and once in the EU, traffickers can move people with little restriction (Brunoskis & Surtees 2010, Surtees 2008, Bilgen 2012).

In recent years, the US State Department identified Kosovo as a source, transit, and destination state for human trafficking. Most of the victims identified in Kosovo come from within Kosovo or from neighboring Balkan countries such as Albania, Moldova, and Serbia (Friman & Reich 2007). In the past decade there have been between 100 and 200 court cases tried in Kosovo, where each case could encompass multiple traffickers and victims (Surtees 2008). An estimated 80% of trafficking victims in Kosovo are women and girls that were trafficked for sexual exploitation (Surtees 2008). They are most often trafficked by someone they know or have willingly made contact with the purpose of potential employment. There is an increasing trend towards traffickers preying upon pre-established social networks and the use of women traffickers. The lack of employment and increased restrictions to immigration has resulted in an increase in people willingly entering into a situation of human smuggling which can turn into a case of human trafficking (Friman & Reich 2007). Although the Kosovar government and international actors in Kosovo are making efforts to combat human trafficking, the US State Department still claims that human trafficking is a large problem in Kosovo.

1.4 Conclusion

Though research has previously been conducted on human trafficking in Kosovo, most often it was included in a broader study of the Balkans or as an example to support a claim about the region (Friman & Reich 2007, Lindstrom 2006, Surtees 2008). Kosovo does provide an interesting site in which to research human trafficking because there are many actors operating at different scales of influence working to address the issue. Most of the literature regarding on human trafficking trends Kosovo was written prior to independence and includes Kosovo as a part of Serbia (Lindstrom 2006, Friman & Reich 2007). Now that Kosovo has its own established government, there are more overlapping levels of influence that conceptualize and address human trafficking in different ways. Lazcko acknowledges that the smaller the scope the greater the ability is to generalize the findings (Lazcko 2010). Therefore, since trends in human trafficking vary greatly just between the states that constitute the Balkans (Friman & Reich), a state level analysis will allow for a deeper understanding of the interactions between the different stakeholders and a greater ability to generalize findings.
Chapter 2.0 Theoretical Framework and Concepts

Even though a universal definition of human trafficking has been accepted by most states and organizations, anti-trafficking policy implementation is approached in various ways by different actors. My research will seek to understand how actors in Kosovo conceptualize the transnational issue of human trafficking and how that affects their anti-trafficking policy and implementation. This chapter summarizes several key literatures, each attending to first three sub-questions; anti-trafficking, global governance, and hidden population literature. Anti-trafficking literature outlines the current approaches that academics believe anti-trafficking policy is constructed by. The global governance literature provides an overview of how an international norm is translated by local actors, and more specifically in the context of human trafficking and weak states. Concluding with literature on hidden populations that explains the bias in hidden population research.

2.1 Anti-Trafficking Policy

With the near universal acceptance of the Palermo Protocol, there are no longer definitional discrepancies regarding the act of human trafficking. However, the definition leaves room for interpretation and it is in that interpretation and subsequent operationalization that the new discrepancies begin to appear. I will utilize Lindstrom’s framework to analyze how actors conceptualize transnational responses to human trafficking; operating under the basic assumption that how an actor understands human trafficking will have a direct impact on their anti-trafficking work. Several other authors have used slight variations of this framework (Marinova & James 2012, Edwards 2008) however Lindstrom’s case study for application of the framework was based on the Balkans; therefore it is better suited for analyzing actors in Kosovo then other proposed frameworks. She identifies four different approaches to human trafficking: migration; law enforcement; human rights and; economic.

The migration approach views human trafficking as an issue of irregular or forced migration that should be addressed through border control and increased restrictions to legal migration (i.e. visas) (Lindstrom 2006, Marinova & James 2012, Edwards 2008, Avdan 2012). This approach is focused on the issue of migration and mobility and is more concerned with the legality of the migration instead of the rights of trafficking victims. The law enforcement approach focuses on the criminal nature of trafficking and often uses the same techniques to approach trafficking as they do organized crime or drug trafficking. With a focus on the crime of
trafficking, women being sexually exploited are often viewed as prostitutes and punished for the illegal activity (Lindstrom 2006, Marinova & James 2012, Edwards 2008). The law enforcement approach, like the migration approach, is motivated by the illegality of migration and prostitution, not the protection of victims’ rights. In other words, prostitution is viewed in this approach as an illicit activity instead of an act of enslavement. The human rights approach perceives human trafficking as a violation of human rights and seeks to restore those rights and educate potential victims about the risks of trafficking (Lindstrom 2006, Marinova & James 2012, Edwards 2008). The human rights approach does not deal with the question of migration but is solely focused on protection of victims’ rights and the prevention of trafficking. Lastly, the economic approach shares the same view as the human rights approach, except that this approach is more concerned with addressing the socioeconomic problems that are often thought to cause human trafficking (Lindstrom 2006). The economic approach is focused on protection and prevention through economic development of the source country, based on the assumption that increased economic opportunity will decrease the need for people to turn to activities that could result in being trafficked.

These four approaches overlap in many areas but provided differing avenues from which to understand and combat human trafficking. The approach that an actor uses in understanding human trafficking has direct implications for their anti-trafficking efforts and, more specifically, for whom they define as a victim of human trafficking. As their understanding of the problem expands beyond individual causes to describe wider trends, actors increasingly base their knowledge claims on statistical accounts of human trafficking. However, since each actor defines victims slightly differently, the statistics that they produce will be biased to their definition of trafficking victims, which has the ability to over or underestimate the true magnitude of the problem.

2.2 Transnational Policies and Global Governance

As the world has become increasingly globalized and many issues facing the world today go beyond borders and singular government, the need for global governance of transnational issue is increasing. Though global governance is most often pursuing problems that have been defined by international organizations, states remain the “dominant actors in the international system” and remain the key enforcers of international norms (Stone 2008). Global governance deals with three main policy realms: trans-boundary problems (e.g. human trafficking); common
property problems (e.g. sea rights); or simultaneous problems (a domestic problem that two states are experiencing) (Stone 2008). International policies or norms addressing these issues are constructed utilizing the following policy cycle:

1. Problem definition and agenda setting
2. Formal decision making
3. Policy implementation
4. Monitoring and evaluation (Stone 2008)

Once the policy is created at the international level Phelps and Wood (2004) argue that the original intent of the policy gets lost in translation as they are modified to translate to the local arena. Policy translation struggles to apply concepts that are developed in one context but are applied at a new scale or place (Phelps & Wood 2004, Van Kersbejen & Verbeck 2007, Prince 2012). This top down approach is especially prevalent in the Balkan region in the weak post conflict states where there is enormous pressure for intervening authorities, namely the European Union (Fagan 2012).

2.2.1 Spatial Dependence of Anti-trafficking Policies

Since human trafficking is inherently spatial and transnational, it entails relationships between source, transit and destination countries regardless of whether the political authorities in place cooperate with each other. Subsequently “policies enacted in one country are influenced by policy choices in other countries,” anti-trafficking policies are always spatially dependent on each other. Policy decisions made in a destination state require the source and transit states to make policy decisions that curb source and transit activities respectfully for the destination state to see much success (Cho et. Al 2011). According to Cho, Dreher, and Neumayer (2011), anti-trafficking policy’s spatial dependence results from “pressures, externalities, learning, and emulation.” Destination countries typically lead the discussion and the creation of anti-trafficking policy as they experience the largest negative impacts of the human trafficking network. Countries then enact policies that create externalities, or effects that were not foreseen in the policy creation, for neighboring countries and those involved in the same human trafficking networks. The United States and Western Europe (largely destination countries) are leading in policy creation and “laggard” countries tend to look to these countries for how to create their policy. However, when predominately origin or transit countries adopt policies or
model their response from destination countries, they are creating plans that adequately deal with the unique human trafficking experience of that specific country (Cho et al. 2011).

2.2.2 Global Governance in Kosovo

Kosovo can easily be classified as a laggard country because of its weak capacity and dependence on the international community. In addition it has even greater level of difficulty to overcome because it has extremely limited governing capacity in regards to transnational issues since many states still do not recognize Kosovo’s sovereignty. Though Kosovo has been building capacity since the declaration of independence in 2008, the government still does not have full international recognition and receives substantial aid and assistance from the EU to prop up its institutions both politically and financially (Fagan 2010). European Union involvement is believed by some to “perpetuate state weakness” as it creates a reliance on international organizations (Fagan 2010). However in the case of Kosovo, some reliance is necessary as Kosovo does not have the capacity to enter into officially recognized diplomatic exchanges. The European Union, among other organizations, often plays a large role in addressing transnational issues and interactions between Kosovo and other states. However, Kosovo’s inability to facilitate transnational cooperation on its own leaves the Republic of Kosovo (RKS) and therefore Kosovo’s capacity in the international area still relatively weak. This can be seen specifically in the realm of anti-trafficking policy since Kosovo is not recognized by many of the states that international victims often originate from (i.e. Ukraine and Moldova) and consequently has added issues in collaboration about policy. These issues perpetuate Kosovo as a laggard country since their anti-trafficking policy is not constructed in tandem with source, transit and origin countries. Instead policy is highly influenced by Western Europe (OSCE) and the United States (US TIP) which most likely have a vastly different expectation about human trafficking than Kosovo.

2.3 Studying Hidden/Vulnerable Populations

One of the most dominant discourses in human trafficking literature is limitations of statistical data and, consequently, the methods to collect and analyze it also. Since human trafficking victims are both a vulnerable and hidden population, there are several limitations in obtaining representative data. Due to the illicit nature of human trafficking it is difficult to obtain reliable and nonbiased research. There is always bias present that can be attributed to the ways in which data is obtained, who obtained it, and for what purpose. The victims often do not self-
identity because it could negatively impact them to identify with their trafficking past, therefore it is difficult to identify who is a victim. There is also bias in what stage of trafficking the research is conducted: prior to being trafficked; while being trafficked; or after being trafficked (Tyldum 2010). Nearly all research is conducted with victims after they have left trafficking, and consequently have sought out some form of assistance. Therefore, the research is skewed to the experience of a subpopulation of victims that receive assistance, which is most likely not representative of the entire population’s experience. Lastly, even though the majority of actors dealing with human trafficking utilize the definition of human trafficking set by the UN, the definition can still be interpreted and applied in different ways. This effects how the actor identifies and classifies someone as a trafficking victim, which affects the data that is collected (Tyldum 2010, Brunovski & Surtees 2010)

A related issue is that human trafficking victims are a vulnerable population that requires many ethical considerations when deciding on methods of research (Beck & Britto 2006). The methods used must minimize potential negative social and psychological effects a victim can experience by participating in research. Due to the recognized pervading condition of fear that enables human trafficking, it is difficult to obtain participants because of concern that their participation may have negative repercussion if society or their former trafficker found out. This has led to research being conducted on victims that are in assistance programs because researchers can gain access through the gatekeepers of that organization. This has resulted in only a subpopulation of trafficking victims, those that took part in rehabilitation programs, to be studied (Feldman et al. 2003). The limitations to conducting representative studies of the human trafficking population have led to five main methods that are utilized in making estimations about the magnitude of the population.

*Subpopulations of Trafficking Victims*

The most concrete data available on human trafficking stems from cases that have been recorded by law enforcement or organizations dedicated to rehabilitation. This is a very specific subpopulation of trafficking victims (Figure 2) and cannot be regarded as representative for the overall population. This method only has the ability to make claims about victims that have been rescued from human trafficking and is not useful in studying victims while they are being trafficked, it also over represents factors that would lead a person to seek help.
One of the positive aspects of this method is that the data obtained is grounded in the fact that the person has been formally recognized as a trafficking victim. However, it can only be reliably used for establishing a minimum for the amount of victims because it is a representative sample. The information collected on this subpopulation is not useful for making estimates in regards to the entire population of trafficking victims. It also experiences a large bias related to effectiveness of the law enforcement and prevalence of trafficking victim rehabilitation organizations (Kelly and Reagan, 2000; Brunovskis and Tyldum, 2005).

**Trafficking Victims as a Subpopulation**

Another approach to studying trafficking victims are in contexts in which these victims would constitute a subpopulation within a greater population such returned migrant workers or prostitution arenas (Figure 2). This approach to study would require survey data obtained from returned migrants and would need to distinguish between those respondents that were victims of trafficking from those that were not. Obtaining this information helps to establish potential factors that differentiate between successful migration and those that are at risk of being trafficked. Monitoring prostitution arenas and migrant workers helps to provide statistics on the victims and also to better understand the geography of trafficking activities. A study of
subpopulation is often supplemented by a combination of data from NGOs, law enforcement and interviews with the victims (after their exit from the industry as it is difficult to obtain while they are still involved) (Brunovskis and Tyldum, 2005).

Secondary Data Sources: Key Informant Sampling

Key informant sampling (Deaux and Callaghan, 1985) consults with respondents that are considered to be knowledgeable and reliable about the subject population. In the case of human trafficking this would gather information from NGOs and law enforcement officials. The method of using key informants is considered to be useful in studying human trafficking behavior because they would be less likely to over exaggerate or underreport certain behaviors that may be considered more or less socially acceptable by the victims. However, the informants have the potential to be prejudiced based on their personal or professional feelings towards the population they are reporting on and it is likely that they are not interacting with a randomly selected sample, which would not provide a fair representation of the entire population (Brunovskis and Tyldum, 2005).

Hidden Population Estimation: Capture-Recapture Method

The capture-recapture method (Jensen and Pearson, 2002) was originally established in the field of biology to make estimates on animal populations but has been recently applied on studying specific populations of humans. The capture-recapture method is characterized by obtaining a sample of a population, marking it and releasing it. Then capturing a second group and measuring the amount of samples in the second the group that were captured in the first. This is then used to extrapolate to the larger population based on how many were recaptured. Such a method is regarded to be reliable in the field of biology for studying animal population, however it brings in an ethical and moral debate when applied to humans (especially those in vulnerable situations). It has previously been applied to some studies involving hidden populations, including women in street prostitution (a subpopulation of human trafficking) (Brunovskis and Tyldum, 2004).
**Hidden Population Estimation: Snowball Recruitment Method**

Snowball recruitment (Goodman 1961) is based on the concept that current study subjects will recruit the future subjects for the study. This method is practical for studying victims of trafficking since it was originally created in the field of sociology specifically for studying hidden population in humans, as opposed to extrapolating from another field as the previous method did. The snowball recruitment method has proven to be useful as it provides the researchers with an inside connection to more subjects once establishing their initial connection, however this method has a bias since it is not a random sample and therefore most likely not representative of the whole population. The method relies on social connections between the victims, and consequentially does not reach victims that do not have established connections. This pitfall does provide an advantage as the researcher can focus specifically on the social networks within the population, which relates to victim’s social and economic context (Erikson 1979, Brunovskis and Tyldum, 2004). Respondent-driven sampling can build off the snowball recruitment method with a statistical analysis model that compensates for the study not collecting data in a random method.

Methodological issues in studying human trafficking are at the forefront of discourse within the current academic literature. Since human trafficking research has only been conducted extensively in the past two decades, a consensus on methods has not been reached and there is still great debate about the usefulness of both qualitative and quantitative methods. Many authors have acknowledged different issues involved obtaining representative data (Tyldum 2010, Tyldum & Brunovskis 2005, Brunovskis & Surtees 2010, Pijl et al. 2011) and much of the research done on human trafficking has been centered on overcoming methodological issues rather than studying human trafficking itself. This has resulted in different proposed and utilized methods in research human trafficking. However, it is commonly held that a mixed methods approach is necessary due to the multifaceted nature of the problem and the inherent bias in quantitative methods (Brunovskis 2005). Quantitative methods are regarded as extremely biased and not a true representation of the trafficking population since it is difficult if not impossible to conduct quantitative research that is representative of the entire population of trafficking victims. Regardless of the reliability of data, policy is often constructed on the perceived magnitude of trafficked people. A misrepresentation, either too high or too low, can result in anti-trafficking approaches that are inappropriate to deal with reality of human trafficking. Recognizing that
trafficking victims cannot be easily or accurately described by a number, qualitative methods are used to gain a more holistic understanding and provide more context for the quantitative data. Qualitative methods are often used to better understand and explain the causes of trafficking, the experience of victims, and how anti-trafficking policy is being constructed and administered. Due to the different topics of human trafficking inquiry each method addresses, a mixed method approach provides more avenues to gaining an understanding of human trafficking (Danailova-Trainor & Laczko 2010).

2.4 Conclusion

Human trafficking, global governance and hidden population literature form together to be form a framework that best address the research question. The human trafficking serves to build a base ground for how the issue has previously been studied by other academics and how best to approach it. More specifically, the literature provides four approaches by which to understand how local actors typical respond through anti-trafficking policy. The global governance literature built upon the human trafficking literature to focus on how international norms are interpreted in local arenas; with specific attention to global governance in human trafficking and weak states. Concluding with a discussion of the biases present in data and research regarding hidden populations to provide a lens by which to understand knowledge claims made by local actors.
Chapter 3.0 Methods

The research focusing predominately on methodological challenges has created extensive discussion of appropriate methods for the study of human trafficking. The precedent set by previous research lead to the decision to address the research question and sub questions with both qualitative (documentary analysis and interviews) and quantitative (descriptive statistics and mapping) methods will be utilized in an effort to gain the most complete understanding of human trafficking and anti-trafficking policy in Kosovo. These methods were selected based on precedent from the literature and also with consideration of the time, resources, and access I had for to conducting research. This chapter will discuss what methods were selected, how they were utilized in the course of research and why they are appropriate for answering the research questions.

3.1 Documentary Analysis

Documentary analysis of primary and secondary sources is one of the main methods used to answer how anti-trafficking actors operate in Kosovo. Documentary analysis is necessary and useful in answering my questions as it helps to understand the institutional memory of anti-trafficking work. Since anti-trafficking work in Kosovo was non-existent prior to international intervention in Kosovo in 1999, the work that has been done is well documented by both the government of RKS and international actors. Documentary analysis was conducted on institutional literature from the various actors: international laws and policy; Kosovo law and policy; and mission statements and reports from organizations. These documents were collected from a combination of internet websites for actors, while conducting in person interviews, and in lieu of an interview in some cases. Within human trafficking research, other non-trafficking specific models are often employed, such as documentary analysis of secondary data (Icduygu & Toktas. 2002). Documentary analysis of resources produced by expert organizations and governments are useful as these actors have more resources, time and access to produce data and evaluation of trafficking. (Mogalakwe & Monageng). Documentary analysis was used to analyze the official anti-trafficking policy and framework of Kosovo, and that of actors that produce their own information. In reviewing the literature, I will be seeking to understand several key items

- How is human trafficking officially defined?
- What is the anti-trafficking response?
• What (if any) is the role of each actor in anti-trafficking work?
• Is quantitative data being produced and what biases there may be in the data?

3.2 Semi-Structured Interviews

To supplement the institutional literature, I conducted interviews with six anti-trafficking actors in Kosovo involved in different parts of the anti-trafficking network (prevention, protection, prosecution) and different scales (international, regional, state, local); United Nation Development Programme (UNDP), International Organization for Migration (IOM), Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE), Ministry of Labor and Social Welfare (Department of Social Welfare), Kosovo Police, and the Center for Protection of Women and Children (CPWC, NGO Shelter). The interviews were conducted at either the interviewees place of work or at a local café. The interviews discussed topics such as how the actor defines human trafficking, how their anti-trafficking policies are applied, and how data is produced. I conducted semi-structured interviews to obtain consistent information from each actor (Appendix A) but to allow for flexibility to discuss different topics depending on the focus of each actors role in anti-trafficking. During these interviews I also requested access to any quantitative data produced by the actor. For each level I interviewed the following actors:

• Local Actors – Kosovo Police
• State Level – Ministry of Labor and Social Welfare
• Regional - OSCE
• International - UNDP, IOM
• Non-governmental Organizations (NGO) - CPWC

Interviews were established initially through emailing recruitment letters (Appendix B) to actors identified through Internet research as involved in anti-trafficking work or those identified through referrals by contacts. Though the main language of Kosovo is Albanian (and Serbian as the other official language), many people speak English or have some level of ability, especially in the international community. Due to this, and my lack of knowledge of Albanian, I distributed my recruitment letter in English. If my contact indicated that they did not have strong (or any) English skills, I then sent the letter in Albanian and contacted my translator for any further help.
with correspondence. My research subject consent letter was also translated into Albanian to and a translator was subsequently used for some interviews.

3.3 Official Statistics

Due to the constraints of this study and the already difficult nature of obtaining statistics on human trafficking, I relied on official statistics produced by anti-trafficking actors. The official statistics are used as an indicator of how anti-trafficking actors understand, estimate, and make claims about the problem of human trafficking in Kosovo. The statistics are held by the Kosovo Police, which gave me access to the basic production of statistics. These statistics will also be used in the mapping component to spatially represent the historical data held by the Kosovo Police. The statistics have inherent limitations, but as Tyldum (2010) concluded in his article, the statistics can be taken for what they are and analyzed as a form of knowledge claim that guides policy formation. These statistics only include victims that were brought out of trafficking and recorded by the Kosovo Police. This can be viewed as a subgroup of the trafficking population, those that have been identified and helped by the police. The statistics were not gathered using a static technique because the definition and standard operating procedures for dealing with victims changed throughout the period of data collection. However, outside of these limitations, the data is still useful for gaining a small picture of the spatial and historical changes in those victims identified by the police (Kelly & Reagan 2000, Brunovskis & Tyldum 2005).

I also obtained official statistics from Center for Protection of Women and Children but due to the nature of production of statistics, the subset of statistics kept by the organization were already represented in the official statistics from the Kosovo Police. I asked for a statistics kept during each of my interviews, and every interview (including CPWC) informed me that the Kosovo Police are the only actor that keeps the official statistics. Since all of the actors are in coordination with one another they simply use the statistics kept by the police.

3.4 Field Work Activities

My field work began on June 11, 2013 upon arrival in Pristhina, Kosovo. The first step I took was to meet with an informal contact I had made prior to arriving in Kosovo and who would serve as my translator for written documents and interviews. She translated my recruitment letter and consent form to Albanian so that I would be able to contact and provide information to potential interviewees that are not native English speakers nor have strong English capabilities.
However, due to the international presence in Kosovo many people working with policy have some level English capabilities which aided in my ability to correspond with no previous knowledge of Albanian. During my field work time in Kosovo, I was working in conjunction with a study abroad program from Miami University that was partnered with a local news agency in Pristhina, KosovaLive. I worked mostly within the news room of KosovaLive and participated in events held from the university program. This partnership, along with a previously established network of contacts made by the program and former researcher’s aided me in construction of my contact list.

I established contacts through three different types of avenues: professional contacts; casual contacts; and cold “calling” (emailing potential contacts based off of information obtained from websites). Professional contacts were made in two modes, one being through interactions with professionals that were at news room for meetings with either the newspaper or the university program and second, referrals from professional contacts made during interviews or email correspondence. Informal contacts were made through social relationships outside of designated research atmosphere, most often at cafes while talking with people about my research. People that I met as informal contacts either did anti-trafficking work themselves or knew of a colleague/friend that did anti-trafficking work in Kosovo and provided me with his/her contact information. Lastly, I established some of my contacts through cold “calling” which targeted actors I believed to be involved with anti-trafficking work in Kosovo and sending them my recruitment letter.

Prior to building my network of contacts, I identified all main categories of actors involved in human trafficking and anti-trafficking work in Kosovo, to determine who would be beneficial to my research. I identified the following list of people and organizations involved in the both the trafficking policy and anti-trafficking efforts including; law enforcement officials, border control, RKS Government, international actors, regional actors, local actors, NGOs, and shelters.

From this list, contacts were chosen based upon the following criteria; relevance to my research question, time, clearance, and feasibility to contact. Research was limited to actors that were accessible within the capital city of Pristhina for the sake of time and ability to have a translator present. This eliminated speaking with border control, and shelters and NGOs outside of Pristhina.
Since the culture in Kosovo is very hospitable and people value the opinions of their friends, I began by creating a network of contacts. Under the assumption I would have the most success contacting actors with recommendation of a friend or co-worker. I also began to identify the contact information for actors. When meeting new people, native or foreign, the question of what I was doing in Kosovo often arose, and with the description of my work, many people were able to recommend people they knew that were working with anti-trafficking. There were some contacts that I made that were not directly involved in with anti-trafficking work but able to provide me with further contacts. I was also referred by interviewees to other potential interview subjects. Through this process, I was able to establish six full length interviews with key individuals working for stakeholders in Kosovo.

**Kosovo Police – Local/ RKS government**  
Arben Paçarizi, director of the Directorate for Investigation of Trafficking at Kosovo Police. I made contact with Mr. Paçarizi through a professional contact at KosovaLive that had connections to the Kosovo Police. The interview was conducted in his office at an office building for the Kosovo Police. Paçarizi is the director of the only anti-trafficking agency that has the capability and responsibility to identify human trafficking victims. With his expertise, he was able to speak on behalf of the on-the-ground application of Kosovo’s anti-trafficking policy. He also provided me with the official trafficking statistic for Kosovo. Interview conducted July 3, 2013.

**United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) - International**  
Chris Decker, Programme Coordinator for the Governance Programme at UNDP Kosovo. I established contact with him through a cold-call email to the UNDP email address. We met at a café across the street from the UNDP office. The UNDP serves in a monitoring and evaluation role for the anti-trafficking mechanism in Kosovo. Interview conducted July 4, 2013.

**International Organization for Migration (IOM) - International**  
Roberto Cancel, project developer for human trafficking division of IOM in Kosovo. I established contact with Cancel through several professional meetings with people involved in the international community in Kosovo. The IOM was previously the organization in charge of
repatriation of foreign victims, and also implementing projects. Although their project has since ended, Cancel was formerly on the team and spoke IOM’s past activities in regard to anti-trafficking work. Interview conducted July 17, 2013.

Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE) - Regional
Valentina Bejtullahu Turjaka, Anti-Trafficking Officer and National Program Officer of Human Rights. I established contact with Bejtullahu Turjaka through a casual contact I met that worked in a different department of OSCE. We met at a café within the OSCE office building in Pristina. OSCE was one of the first organizations to get involved in anti-trafficking work in Kosovo and has been helping in organizing, coordination, sharing and advising the direct assistance group and overseeing Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs). Interview conducted July 16, 2013.

Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare (MLSW) – State/RKS government
Adile Shaqiri-Basha, High Officer for anti-trafficking issues inside the Ministry of Social Welfare. I received her contact information through another interviewee. The Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare is a member of the interministral working group and works mainly in policy production. This interview was conducted at the office of Adile in an RKS office building with the aide of an interpreter. Interview conducted July 16, 2013.

Center for Protection of Women and Children (CPWC) - NGO
Naime Sherifi, Director of the Center for Protection of Women and Children. This contact was established through an informal contact that previously worked with human trafficking victims. Sherifi, is the director of an NGO that provides aftercare assistance to women and children who are the victims of human trafficking or domestic abuse. This interview conducted at Sherifi’s office in Pristina, Kosovo. Interview conducted July 4, 2013

3.5 Conclusion
The mixed methods approach selected for this study aims to provide a holistic view of the current understanding of human trafficking by the local actors in Kosovo. The utilization of documentary analysis, semi-structured interviews, official statistics and mapping provides both
empirical data on how human trafficking is being quantified and anecdotal evidence that explains the more completed understanding behind the data.
4.0 Result and Analysis

In this section, I will answer this study’s three sub-questions through analyzing the grey literature, stakeholder interviews and official statistics obtained during my fieldwork. First, I will discuss the history of human trafficking and anti-trafficking work in Kosovo through recent regime changes to provide historical and political context to the issue. I will then discuss how the Republic of Kosovo defines human trafficking, how this definition has come to be and how international norms/international community shaped this definition. I will then outline the narrow response demonstrated by the actors and what affect this has on anti-trafficking policy. Concluding with an analysis of how effective anti-trafficking activities are in Kosovo and what hinders them from greater effectiveness.

4.1 Defining Human Trafficking in Kosovo

Unlike the initial hypothesis that there was minimal collaboration between various anti-trafficking actors in Kosovo, research found that there is a highly structuralized response to THB in Kosovo. This structure has led to a uniform response and places actors dealing with various stages of anti-trafficking work: prevention; protection; and prosecution; in coordination with each other. The path to a consolidated national response to THB began in 2002 in Kosovo with the establishment of the Office of Good Governance (OGG) through the Office of the Prime Minister to deal with human rights issue. THB fell under this jurisdiction and was addressed primarily through this office until 2008. During the period of the OGG, the first National Action to Fight Trafficking of Human Beings in Kosovo was created in 2005 (and lasted until 2007). This also led to the creation of the position of National Coordinator to Fighting Trafficking in Human Beings, which was fulfilled by the director of OGG.

However, Kosovo’s anti-trafficking response was not streamlined until 2008 with the declaration of independence which allowed Kosovo clear sovereign authority over its internal affairs. Concurrently, the prime minister expressed a desire to have anti-trafficking efforts consolidated, leading to the establishment of the National Anti-Trafficking Coordinator (NATC) and the creation of the second national action plan, the National Strategy and Action Plan Against Trafficking in Human Beings (2008-2011). Within this action plan, a collaborative structure for anti-trafficking response was created. This framework coordinated the efforts of various actors, and designates different levels of efforts: strategic level; operational level; and advisory body. The strategic level is characterized by three main parts: the NATC; Secretariat;
and Inter-Ministerial Working Group (IMWG). The NATC is fulfilled by the Deputy Minister of Internal Affairs and has the responsibility to coordinate the efforts of anti-trafficking actors in Kosovo and to ensure the implementation of the current Action Plan. The Secretariat monitors and evaluates the Action Plan and provides support to the NATC. The IMWG is comprised of the NATC (who chairs the group), and reps from the Ministry of Education, Science, and Technology, the Ministry of Justice, Ministry of Culture, Youth, Sport and Non-Residential Affairs, the Ministry of Labor and Social Welfare, Ministry of Health, and Representatives of NGOs. The operational level is comprised of 3 main fields (and 1 subsidiary): Prevention; Protection; Prosecution; and Protection of children. Each of these fields has specific ministerial staff, NGOs and other relevant actors (i.e. Kosovo Police, judges, prosecutors) who carry out the field’s mission and serve a specific role both in the implementation of the strategy and combating THB. Lastly, there is an advisory body comprised of domestic and international organizations that oversee the work of the IMWG, providing guidance and ensuring compliance with international norms and standards. Though local Kosovar actors have played a role throughout the entirety of construction of anti-trafficking policy, the international community has had a considerable involvement and continues to today.

4.1.1 Official Definition

Within its National Strategy and Action Plan against Trafficking in Human Beings (NAP), RKS defines human trafficking as:

The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of person, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person for the purpose of exploitation. (RKS)

The definition is verbatim the definition outlined by the UN which was set forth in UN Palermo Protocol. The adoption of the UN definition comes as no surprise since the Palermo Protocol is one of twenty documents cited within the list of international legal documents outlined as the legal basis for the development of legislation in the NAP. These twenty documents in conjunction with thirty-four RKS legal documents regulating different aspects of trafficking in human beings (THB), govern the anti-trafficking response in Kosovo. It should be noted
however, that the legal instruments of Kosovo were all put in place under the supervision of the international community.

The international definition is officially adopted by anti-trafficking actors in Kosovo. Though not every actor was contacted during this study, Kosovo has a highly structuralized anti-trafficking network that includes every anti-trafficking actor of considerable size. Thus it can be safely assumed that, by association, the organizations in the network accept the same definition. Every actor contacted through interviews cited the UN definition as the official definition used by their organization. The seemingly universal acceptance of a singular definition, not only within Kosovo but by the majority of anti-trafficking work throughout the world, has both positive and negative aspects.

A singular definition is useful in unifying government responses to human trafficking. Prior to this, human trafficking was a more abstract term that was left to the discretion of each actor. There was no definitional coherence between countries, or even actors within a country, in some cases. Consequently it was difficult to compare with any certainty human trafficking discussions and statistics between agencies and countries. With the introduction of the Palermo Protocol, and the subsequent adoption by virtually all countries and actors involved with human trafficking, there can be greater assurance that the discussion of human trafficking and statistics produced on human trafficking now have a greater reliability for comparison.

4.1.2 Official Statistics

As demonstrated in the literature, quantitative information regarding human trafficking is inherently very flawed and inevitably is not representative of the true nature of the problem, since enumeration of victims of trafficking is impossible. However, as long as the issue and biases of the statistics are taken into account, statistics on human trafficking still have an ability to tell a part of the story. The problems in data collection outlined in the previous section apply to the official statistics produced on human trafficking in Kosovo. The official statistics have an additional limitation that must be kept in mind, as these statistics are only a reflection of people identified by the acting police force at the time. This is a case as outlined by Brunovskis and Tyldum (2005) of statistics being produced on a subpopulation of human trafficking victims. The statistics are only accounting for victims that were identified by the police, which can be assumed to not be the entirety of the trafficking victim population in Kosovo. However, with this
in mind that statistics still provided insight to the human trafficking problem and inevitably will inform how policy is created.

The Kosovo Police, along with other various agencies, have kept centralized statistics in regards to the identified victims within Kosovo (figure 3).

<p>| Victims identified in Kosovo by nationality 2001-2013 |
|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kosovo</th>
<th>Moldova</th>
<th>Albania</th>
<th>Romania</th>
<th>Ukraine</th>
<th>Bulgaria</th>
<th>Serbia</th>
<th>Russia</th>
<th>Macedonia</th>
<th>Poland</th>
<th>Other</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>254</td>
<td>231</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>735</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 3 Human Trafficking Victims Identified in Kosovo by Nationality 2001 - 2013 (Kosovo Police)

The statistics demonstrate a clear trend in an overall decrease in victims identified in Kosovo from 2001 to 2013. The stats also show a steady increase in Kosovar victims, coupled with a decrease in international victims over time. As demonstrated in the raw statistics international victims were mostly identified from Moldova, Romania and Ukraine and have experience a sharp decrease.

4.1.3 International involvement

The international supervision of Kosovo (1999-2008) coincided with an increased focus by the international community on human trafficking. Less than two years after the UN took control of the territory of Kosovo, the Palermo Protocol set forth an official international definition detailing what was considered human trafficking. Moving forward with a singular definition, combating human trafficking sprang onto the global stage as one of the hot topics and consequently anti-trafficking efforts received a lot of time, energy, and resources. Countries, specifically in Europe without EU membership, are driven to effectively deal with all forms of organized crime, including but not limited to human trafficking, as it is at the forefront of
expectations for not only UN and EU membership but is also important in obtaining international financial aid and trade agreements. Due to these external pressures, anti-trafficking policy is more heavily influenced from expectations from the top down as opposed to the reality of the problem on the ground.

**UN Role**

The role of the United Nations in creating anti-trafficking policy in Kosovo is more directly visible compared to other countries in the region. Kosovo presents a unique situation as it still does not have complete sovereign control over its territory, and the United Nations through United Nations Mission in Kosovo (UNMIK) served as the main source of government for a portion of Kosovo’s anti-trafficking efforts (Decker 2013). Unlike most countries, the UN was helping to build Kosovo as an independent state while international trafficking policy was being constructed. The increased international concern with human trafficking spurred by the UN led Kosovo to focus on human trafficking as well. Even though statistics in Kosovo point to a diminished number of victims and human trafficking as an acute problem within Kosovo, it has received a lot of attention both politically and financially, domestically and internationally. It has been argued that human trafficking would not have such an emphasis in Kosovo and the Balkan region if it was not for the international community’s priorities. With the UN being at the helm of Kosovo before independence the UN has had considerable influence over policy within Kosovo (Decker 2013).

**EU Role**

Similarly to the UN, the EU has played a very strong advisory role within Kosovo since independence. Upon independence UNMIK passed off the advisory role of Kosovo’s state building process to the EU through European Union Rule of Law Mission in Kosovo EULEX. EULEX was specifically charged with reestablishing effective law within Kosovo and prosecuting crime committed during the war. Aside from the EU’s direct policy influence through EULEX, the prospect of EU membership looms over every state in the region, and Kosovo especially so. However, since Kosovo is a newly independent state still in the process of constructing its domestic and foreign policy, it has a unique opportunity to construct policy in
complete coherence with EU standards. Presumably this will ease the process of EU accession when Kosovo reaches that point (Decker 2013).

**OSCE Role**

OSCE played an important role in anti-trafficking efforts while Kosovo was under UNMIK authority. The majority of early efforts to conduct anti-trafficking responses were executed by OSCE along with IOM. OSCE officials drafted not only the anti-trafficking policy but Kosovo laws were themselves were created by foreigners working in international organizations such as OSCE (Decker 2013). OSCE was at the forefront of human trafficking work in Kosovo in the 2000s. OSCE drafted both the law and anti-trafficking policy (Decker 2013 and Bejthulla Turjaka 2013), and it is clearly in the language used throughout the National Action Plan. The term National Action Plan itself is the same wording that OSCE uses across all of the countries that it does work in. The mark of OSCE involvement is also seen in referring to human trafficking as trafficking in human beings (THB), while the other international organizations use the term human trafficking. Though OSCE has diminished since 2008 to an advisory role within the anti-trafficking response and is discussing removing its anti-trafficking work altogether, the legacies of OSCE are obvious within the work.

**US State Department**

The US Trafficking in Persons report (TIP report) is an annual evaluation conducted by the US State Department of the anti-trafficking efforts of a country and their perceived magnitude of success in combatting human trafficking (US Department of State). The report categorizes the countries into four tiers of compliance; Tier 1, Tier 2, Tier 2 Watch List (WL), and Tier 3. If a country receives a Tier 3 ranking, the United States reserves the right to withhold non-humanitarian aid to the country and may directly oppose the country’s request for financial aid from international institutions in which the US is a member state (i.e. International Monetary Fund and the World Bank) (US Department of State). Though these are the only official repercussions of a poor ranking by the TIP report, it is regarded by the anti-trafficking community as the de facto judgment of success or failure in combatting human trafficking.

During the duration of the research period, summer 2013, the 2013 US TIP report was released generating much discussion about the document by anti-trafficking officials.
trafficking efforts in Kosovo appear to place considerable weight in an evaluation and recommendations the US Department of State makes in this document. The NATC finds this document to be an objective view of the state of human trafficking in Kosovo and welcomed the recommendations for their improvement (Ministry of Internal Affairs 2012). Many anti-trafficking actors interviewed for this study reference the US TIP report in discussing Kosovo’s anti-trafficking work (Paçarizi 2013, Shaqiri-Basha 2013, Bejtullahu Turjaka 2013, Cancel 2013).

Both anti-trafficking documents produced by Kosovo and anti-trafficking actors cite the international definition set forth in the Palermo Protocol as the definition that Kosovo uses to define human trafficking. The role of the international community was also clearly present in the anti-trafficking response structure in which international members have direct seats, the work done for the anti-trafficking policy in the National Action Plan, and the discussion in interviews.

### 4.1.4 International Evaluation of Anti-trafficking Work

While Kosovo seems to understand human trafficking as Kosovar Albanian women being trafficked internally for purpose of sexual exploitation, it is still important to consider what conclusion the international community has made about the issue of trafficking in Kosovo. The international understanding of the problem is especially important since the opinion of the international community is so respected by the actors and influential in policy construction. The US TIP reports from 2001 to 2013 were used to understand how the international community, especially the United States, evaluated human trafficking in Kosovo each year. The US TIP report was selected to review the international opinion for two main reasons. First, actors in Kosovo discussed or referenced the US TIP report in each interview as an evaluation of anti-trafficking work in Kosovo. Second, US TIP report is produced each year, in a similar manner by the same intuition, ensuring better reliability in comparison between each year. The US is also a more objective actor in the region than the UN and EU since it does not have any direct administrative responsibilities. Also apart from classification of a country in compliance with the US standards for combatting trafficking, the report reviews both anti-trafficking activities and the state of human trafficking. While the US TIP report, like any report, has its flaws and biases, it still serves as a fairly objective view. The US TIP report concludes that Kosovo is a country that serves as a source, transit area, and destination for human trafficking which is an interpretation not often discussed amongst local actors.
Kosovo as a source country

According to several interviews, Kosovo has not always been a source country; prior to 2004 there was no classification of Kosovo in the US TIP. The official statistics of Kosovo show very few Kosovar victims were identified prior to 2004 as well, which supports the claim that Kosovo was not originally a source country. But since the 2004 US TIP reports both the statistics and reports demonstrate that Kosovo is a source country for human trafficking victims, as domestic victims have continued to increase. Though most of the supply of Kosovar victims stays within Kosovo, the report cites that they are trafficked around Europe but no concrete destinations or numbers are cited to uphold this claim (US TIP 2011, 2012, 2013).

Kosovo as a transit country

Kosovo has been classified consistently in the reports as a country of transit for trafficking victims. The classification of transit is difficult to prove with statistics or victim testimonies since victims are rarely discovered or correctly identified during the transit stage of trafficking. Due to this difficulty, transit countries are classified based on known transit routes for migration and other illicit activity. Since Kosovo is situated in a gateway region between Asia and Europe, it is in the prime area for transit networks. Kosovo was also an easy state to past through prior to 2013 because of weak border control and Kosovo had no visa requirements for foreigners entering the country (Paçarizi 2013, Decker 2013).

Kosovo as a destination country

Lastly, Kosovo is also classified as a destination country for trafficking victims. This claim was to validated by informants because trafficking victims have consistently been identified within Kosovo during the duration of the production of reports by the US. The nature of Kosovo as a destination has shifted slightly from being overwhelming a destination for foreign victims, to a destination for internally trafficked victims.

Other Forms of Trafficking

The on major discrepancy between the evaluations of trafficking in Kosovo by the actors versus the US TIP report is a concern for other forms of trafficking taking place. Throughout the
reports forms of trafficking identified as a potential problem in Kosovo are; sexual exploitation, forced servitude, forced labor, forced begging and organ trafficking. Recently human trafficking in Kosovo has been defined as only sex trafficking and forced begging, while the other forms made a historic appearance. During interviews sex trafficking was mentioned by everyone, whereas organ trafficking was mentioned once and forced begging was mentioned once. According to Paçarizi many potential cases of forced begging have been investigated and the requirements of trafficking were not able to be proved. Street begging in general is very prevalent in the cities of Kosovo but different definitions of forced begging between the Republic of Kosovo and the US could explain the continued focus on forced begging by the US while Kosovo is not classifying the cases as human trafficking.

4.1.4 Lindstrom application

As was outlined in the literature review, the Lindstrom framework for understanding transnational response to human trafficking in the Balkans displays four ways in which actors typically conceptualize human trafficking: migration; law enforcement; human rights and economic. This framework and previous work in the Balkans influenced the hypothesis that there was not a coordinated effort between anti-trafficking actors in Kosovo (Lindstrom 2008). However, in the over seven years since Lindstrom’s study and there have been many developments in anti-trafficking policy in Kosovo. Since Kosovo independence in 2008, the anti-trafficking efforts have been consolidated and highly structuralized, with nearly every anti-trafficking falling within the Organization Structure of Coordinating, Monitoring and Implementing Mechanisms against Trafficking in Human Beings in Kosovo. The structure and official collaboration between the various actors has led to a singular Kosovo response to human trafficking. Though each actor serves a different role in combatting human trafficking, they can be viewed more as a part of one machine as opposed to several machines working individually. Even though, there is a singular response in Kosovo, Lindstrom’s approaches to anti-trafficking policy are still present in anti-trafficking efforts. Instead of actors operating by varying definitions, it was found that the disconnect arouse between what was officially stated by the anti-trafficking structure, the reality of what was being implemented, and the vision that the actors had for effectively combatting trafficking.
Official Approach

The official approach to anti-trafficking policy in Kosovo is defined within the NAP and is consistently cited by anti-trafficking actors as their governing document. Within the NAP, it specifically states that “this strategy employ human rights-based approach, namely it promotes and protects human rights” (NAP). It outlines the specific human rights principles from the UN Declaration of Human Rights that were taken into consideration when constructing the NAP. The plan states a focus to protect the victims’ rights throughout the process of identification, protection, prosecution and integration. Though the efforts are done with this in mind, this is more a philosophical approach that is difficult to implement because this approach does not have a direct solution that can be implemented, such as tightening borders or brothel searches. The NAP and the actors involved have demonstrated an increased focus on protection of rights through the creation of Standard Operating Procedures, Minimum Standards of Care for Victims of Trafficking, and dedication to prevention campaigns.

The human rights approach presents two main problems, it does not have a direct translation into a clear anti-trafficking response such as the other approaches do and if a person has been trafficked their human rights were already violated (Paçarizi 2013). This approach appears to be primarily focused on protecting human rights after trafficking has already been committed which is not truly addressing the problem of human trafficking but merely seeking to mitigate its effects. For these reasons, a human rights based approach serves as an official and philosophical approach to addressing human trafficking. However, the real world application of the anti-trafficking policy in Kosovo more closely resembles a law enforcement approach.

Approach in Application

While the human rights based approach is clearly set as the official view held by the NAP, the approach in application aligns more closely with a law enforcement approach. As is outlined in the NAP and as plays out on the ground, the Kosovo Police are the only actor that has the ability to identify a person as a victim of trafficking (Paçarizi 2013). Thus, they serve as the main mechanism to address human trafficking, both in identifying trafficking victims and traffickers. The law enforcement approach in Kosovo unfortunately runs into the problem of convincing both the prosecutor and judge that a given case is an instance of trafficking.
Only having one identifying agency serves as both a strength and weakness for the anti-trafficking efforts. With only agency identifying victims, greater confidence can placed in the statistics that a uniform definition was applied in victim identification. However this also serves as weakness, since the definition being applied may be missing true victims of trafficking because the Kosovo Police framework for understanding trafficking is not aligned with the true nature of the issue. Though law enforcement is the main response, this response it is not necessarily out of desire but the reality of capacity of the newly independent state. Kosovo is tackling a very difficult transnational problem that well established states are still struggling to adequately address, while also going through the process of state building. It became clear throughout interviews, however, that the actors do not see law enforcement as the main way to address human trafficking instead they frequently identified socioeconomic development as the best way to truly combat the root cause of human trafficking (Decker 2013, Shaqiri- Basha 2013, Sherifi 2013, Bejtullahu Turkaja 2013).

*Visionary Approach*

The other approaches are focused on dealing with or protecting those that have already been trafficked, and as the police expressed, “we have already failed at combatting trafficking if a person is trafficked” (Paçarizi 2013). Actors see human trafficking as a symptom and not the root problem, which they cite as extreme poverty and lack of economic opportunity. This view point is based on the assumption that if the trafficked person had another option for gainful employment they would not have chosen the path that led to trafficking. Consequently there is a consensus among actors that economic growth in Kosovo and the creation of jobs is the only solution that can truly prevent human trafficking. No amount of education or programs will convince people to not enter into risky situations when they are left with no other option. But if the economy was stronger, potential victims would not turn to risky behavior that often leads to trafficking (Sherifi 2013). However, addressing the economy in Kosovo is outside of the capacity of the working group and a far more difficult problem to address. Consequently the law enforcement approach is applied as it is within the capacity of the actors within the working group.
4.2 Local Interpretation of Human Trafficking

Even though actors in Kosovo adhere to a singular and limited definition of human trafficking, the definition leaves room for interpretation and it is in that interpretation that differences begin to appear between the official definition and implementation. The anti-trafficking responses and statistics produced both domestically and internationally help to illustrate how human trafficking is actually understood by the actors beyond the definition on paper. To gauge how the magnitude and scope of human trafficking is understood in Kosovo, I reviewed the official statistics produced by Kosovo, how trafficking was discussed by actors in interviews, and the US TIP report by the US Department of State.

The statistics above coupled with the how interviewees discuss anti-trafficking efforts begins to show a very select interpretation of the definition of human trafficking. Trends in human trafficking have shifted from predominately international trafficking victims to almost exclusively domestic victims. Concurrently, though the international definition specified in Palermo Protocol encompasses various forms of human trafficking: sex trafficking; labor trafficking; organ trafficking; sex trafficking is the only form of exploitation discussed in Kosovo. Along with these narrowing of the interpretation of human trafficking, both the stats and interviews refer to victims as solely women and girls. The last narrowing comes at ethnicity, though not explicitly defined in the official statistics, but discussed by the interviewees as trafficking of Kosovar Albanians but not any of the minorities.
4.2.1 Domestic Problem

![Trends in Domestic v. International Victims](image)

Figure 4 Changes in the frequency of domestic trafficking victims compared to international trafficking victims. Produced from statistics provided by Kosovo Police

All actors that participated in interviews identified the issue in Kosovo as mainly a problem of internal trafficking from rural to urban areas in Kosovo. This same transition from international victims to domestic victims was discussed within the US TIP report and upheld by the official statistics produced by the Kosovo Police (figure 4). Overall since 2001 there has been a consistent decrease in the reported number of international victims, while the reported number of victims from Kosovo has steadily increased. Victims from Kosovo went from being virtually non-existent to annually comprising the majority of reported trafficking victims since 2007. Though a causal relationship is difficult to prove in regards to human trafficking, there are a few things that could explain the change in supply of trafficking victims. First, assuming that a decrease in victims discovered indicates a decrease in victims overall, then the supply of trafficking victims has decreased over time in Kosovo. Since the presence of the international community after 1999 is largely held as one of the causes for a surge in trafficking in Kosovo (Smith & Smith 2010). It would thus suggest that with the declining presence of foreigners the demand would decrease as well and consequently supply would decrease as the statistics appear to demonstrate. Second, trafficking has become risker for traffickers in Kosovo. Prior to 2001,
there was little ability to capture and prosecute traffickers. However, over the past decade the capacity to deal with trafficking has increased and laws have become stricter, making it more difficult for traffickers. It is believed by anti-trafficking actors and the US TIP report that trafficking has become more clandestine has and not actually decreased. Internal trafficking of victims is more difficult to identify since it does not require the traffickers to cross international borders. Lastly the continued economic hardship in Kosovo, especially for women, has increased the level of internal migration to the urban centers in search of employment opportunities. These situations bring women into risker situations and may make them more susceptible to trafficking techniques.

4.2.2 Sex Trafficking

Though human trafficking is an umbrella term that encompasses sex trafficking, forced labor, slavery, removal of organs and other types of exploitation, in Kosovo human trafficking is viewed as almost exclusively an issue of sex trafficking. The official statistics made available by the Kosovo Police do not contain a breakdown of the purpose the trafficking victim was being used; however, human trafficking was either explicitly or implicitly discussed as an issue of sex trafficking with little or no reference to other forms of trafficking. Paçarizi, the director of the human trafficking unit of the police, stated that sex trafficking comprises 99% of the cases of human trafficking in Kosovo, with only 1% of cases dealing with forced labor or begging. Bejtullahu Turjaka, working with OSCE cited a similar statistic that 98% of victims were cases of sex trafficking. While the four remaining interviews did not explicitly state that human trafficking is almost solely sex trafficking, the interviews discussed human trafficking in reference to sex trafficking as opposed to other forms of trafficking (Cancel, Decker, Shaqiri-Basha, Sherifi 2013). Sex trafficking is also openly stated in the National Action Plan as the main form of exploitation in Kosovo.

4.2.3 Women

Since human trafficking is largely viewed as a sex trafficking issue in Kosovo it is not surprising that trafficking victims are almost exclusively women. Sex trafficking internationally is also viewed as overwhelming women being trafficked for sexual purposes. During every interview conducted, the interview referenced victims using feminine words such as women, she, her (Bejtullahu Turjaka, Paçarizi, Cancel, Decker, Shaqiri-Basha, Sherifi 2013). The gendered biased language in discussing the victims is not present in the official document regarding human
trafficking, but the National Action Plan does specifically cite women and children as the groups most vulnerable to being trafficked (NAP).

4.2.4 Ethnicity

Not only has trafficking been defined as internal sex trafficking of Kosovar women, but victims of domestic trafficking are thought to be only Kosovar Albanians (Paçarizi 2013, Bejtullahu Turjaka 2013, Cancel 2013, Decker 2013, Shaqiri-Basha 2013, Sherifi 2013). Even though Kosovo is considered to be a multi-ethnic state comprised of Albanians, Serbians, Bosniaks, Goranis, Roma, Turks, Ashkali, and Egyptians, only Kosovar Albanians are identified as victims of trafficking (NAP 2011). While Kosovar Albanians make up 92% of the population, and statistically are more likely to fall victim to human trafficking, it is widely held that minorities are more vulnerable to being trafficked (Edwards 2008, van Liempt 2011). The apparent lack of trafficking of minorities in Kosovo is troubling due to the current ethnic tensions and dark past between ethnic groups. Nevertheless, the understanding of the problem of trafficking is based off of statistics of victims identified by the police. Therefore, an omission from the statistics means and stakeholders may not grasp the full reality of trafficking in Kosovo.

4.3 Impact on Policy and Implementation

The problem of human trafficking in Kosovo has come to be understood as internal trafficking of Kosovar Albanian women for the purpose of sexual exploitation. The narrow understanding of the problem in Kosovo has had clear implications in the construction of anti-trafficking policy and the subsequent implementation. As was outlined in the previous section, I will evaluate the impact each part of this understanding: domestic; sex trafficking; women; and ethnicity; has had on anti-trafficking policy. The interpretation does not just impact the statistics that are produced or how the actors understand human trafficking but the interpretation begins to impact subsequent formation of policy regarding human trafficking. Through analysis of the National Action Plan and interviews, the interpretation can be seen in construction and interpretation of policy.

4.3.1 Domestic Problem

Defining human trafficking in Kosovo as a domestic issue removes the transnational nature of the problem. This removes the need to address Kosovo as a transit area for human trafficking victims and allows anti-trafficking actors to solely to solely be focus on source and
destination issues. The focus on addressing only source and destination problems is noticeable in the emphasis or lack thereof in certain areas of the anti-trafficking policy.

First, there is a lack of emphasis in the NAP on areas that would be more important for transit countries or countries that are destinations for international victims. There is not a strong focus on cooperation between neighboring states. The anti-trafficking policy does outline increased regional cooperation as a goal, but a very small amount is budgeted for this undertaking (€77,000 in 2011). There is also no mention of training, or allocation of resources to border control. If there was a greater concern for international victims being trafficked into Kosovo, it could reasonably be assumed that border control would receive a greater emphasis within the NAP (NAP 2011).

Instead, policy has been focused on activities that address Kosovo as a source and destination. In terms of anti-trafficking policy, the prevention portion of the policy is solely dedicated to educating the population about human trafficking in hope of diminishing the amount of people trafficked. The prevention section constitutes one fourth of the action plan and accounts for approximately 325,000 Euros of the budget (NAP). There is a considerable focus on prevention in Kosovo and it is hailed by local actors, international actors and the US TIP report as one of the policies areas in which Kosovo excels (Decker 2013, Cancel 2013, US TIP 2013).

Since most of Kosovo’s source problem transfers into its destination problem as the identified victims are being moved domestically; Kosovo has an added incentive to decrease the magnitude of the source since theoretically it would decrease the destinations problems as well.

Nearly all of the remainder of the action plan is focused on actions that combat the destination nature of Kosovo: protection; investigation; and prosecution. Investigation and prosecution are not explicitly impacted by the domestic understanding of the problem. The main area that is impacted is protection of victims and specifically shelters and rehabilitation programs. Since international victims are repatriated back to their home country, domestic victims benefit the most from activities involving aftercare and rehabilitation. Over €2.2 million was budgeted for shelters and rehabilitation. There has also been a distinct trend that as domestic victims of trafficking increase over time, the availability of shelters has also increased from only two shelters in 2003 (US TIP) to eight shelters by 2013 (KSC), with plans to build a new shelter (USTIP, KSC, NAP).
4.3.2 Sex Trafficking of Women

The focus on sex trafficking of women has affected similar areas as viewing the problem as solely domestic, such as the emphasis on protection and rehabilitation of victims. There are three main areas that illustrate how Kosovo has operationalized the definition of human trafficking as solely sex trafficking of women: awareness campaigns; police response; and rehabilitation.

The one aspect of anti-trafficking work that Kosovo is consistently commended for is the magnitude of anti-trafficking awareness campaigns (US TIP Report 2013). However, human trafficking awareness campaigns have predominately been targeted at young women about the risks of sex trafficking or at providing awareness of how to recognize the signs of sex trafficking victims. In 2011, Kosovo launched an anti-trafficking and domestic violence help line, which has seen increased utilization and tips that have led to the ultimate discovering of victims. The close relationship between domestic violence and anti-trafficking work again signals the view of the problem as sex trafficking of women, as men are rarely viewed as victims of domestic abuse.

The special officers trained on how to combat human trafficking, were also trained with a focus on recognizing on sex trafficking. The majority of this training was conducted by US organizations, a country which also has an overwhelming focus on sex trafficking though labor trafficking is arguable just as large of a problem (Paçarizi 2013). The police also focus on conducting raids in night clubs and similar establishments for the presence of sex work. There is also a reliance on tips from the hotline which are primarily concerned with potential sex trafficking victims (Sherifi 2013).

As previously discussed, the only form of rehabilitation available is in the domestic abuse/trafficking victims shelters for women. This response to rehabilitation of victims is not equipped to serve male victims of human trafficking as all shelters are female only. The response also does not provide support to victims of other forms of trafficking such as labor/forced begging, though admittedly Kosovo has seen little to no official cases of these forms of trafficking.

4.3.3 Kosovar Albanians

The impact of characterizing trafficking victims as almost solely Kosovar Albanians has had no formal impact on the creation of policy but effects can be seen in the implementation
phase. When discussion of internal trafficking in Kosovo arises it is most often referenced as trafficking of Kosovar Albanian women from rural to urban areas for the purpose of sexual exploitation. Kosovo’s minority groups do not appear in the official statistics collected by the Kosovo Police. This is surprising since minorities historically stand a greater chance of being trafficked. Yet in the context of ethnic relations in Kosovo, the absence of these metrics reveals a further obstacle to combating human trafficking. It must always be kept at the forefront of discussion of human trafficking statistics that these numbers are for identified victims not all victims. The statistics in Kosovo specifically account only for victims that have been positively identified by the Kosovo Police and Prosecutor as victims of human trafficking (Decker 2013). The Kosovo Police are the only body with the authority to identify a person as a victim of trafficking, which could explain the omission of minorities in the data. First, this means the minority victims must trust and recognize the authority of the Kosovo Police, which is simply not the case especially with the Serbian minority population. Within Serbian enclaves, Kosovo Police authority is often not recognized and certainly not respected. The minority victim may also face social stigma within their community for going to the Kosovo Police (Cancel 2013).

The Serbian run institutions within the enclaves also present an issue as they are not recognized by Kosovo and consequently documents produced by these intuitions may not be recognized by the Kosovo Police. “For example a medical certificate from a Serbian run hospital would not necessarily be recognized by the Kosovo police. So they didn’t have proof they were a victim” (Cancel 2013). The majority run shelters also pose a problem as they may not appear welcoming to minority trafficking victims. Though it is clear in the SOP that there is no discrimination against victims because of nationality or ethnicity, the victim still may not feel safe being in a shelter run by people who do not speak their language and have little no experience dealing with unique situation of minority victims.

There are several obstacles to minority victims being rightfully identified and there appears to be little discussion or work to rectify this situation. However Cancel indicated that while the current National Coordinator, Sasha Rasic (ethnically Serbian himself), expressed interest in addressing this issue, funding and other priorities shifted the attention away from addressing the exclusion of minority victims (Cancel).
4.4 Effectiveness of RKS Anti-Trafficking Policy

Though there is little debate that Kosovo has constructed a well-engineered anti-trafficking policy (US TIP Report), Kosovo still receives a consistent tier two ranking by the US’s evaluation and local actors believe there is still room for improvement. The discrepancy between a well formed policy and adequate implementation begs the question of how effective is Kosovo’s anti-trafficking policy? One major theme that arose from all the interviews conducted was lament of the fact that Kosovo’s anti-trafficking work could be more effective (Paçarizi, Decker, Cancel, Sherifi, Bejtullahu Turjaka 2013). Interviewees identified many areas that could use improvement in regards to policy however six concerns were raised in interviews: limited capacity, identification, prosecution, reintegration, traditional society, and ethnic minorities.

4.4.1 Limited Capacity

“Part of the issue with Kosovo is of course the political situation” (Cancel 2013). Not only is Kosovo unable to enter into effective regional cooperation, there are issues domestically as well. The inability to enter into international dialogue is especially detrimental to addressing international victims and Kosovo as a transit country. The longest border of Kosovo is shared with Serbia, where there is little to no agreement in regards to border control. The lack of cohesion at the border lends to a more favorable and less risky environment for traffickers to cross into Kosovo (Cancel 2013). Kosovo’s capacity was also hindered by the lack of visa regime until July 2013, this allowed foreigners to easily enter and stay with in Kosovo (Paçarizi 2013, Decker 2013). Capacity is also limited in terms of the investigation techniques used by the police. Investigators are trained specifically to look for sex trafficking and have little knowledge of how to identify other forms of trafficking (Paçarizi 2013, Decker 2013).

4.4.2 Identification System

The current structure of anti-trafficking activities places the Kosovo Police as the only identifying mechanism for human trafficking victims. An interview with Ministry Sociale and IOM confirmed that “only the police deal with identification” (Shaqiri-Basha 2013). The “identification referral system needs to be broader, involve centers of social work, and have some mechanism for community based organizations to be involved” (Cancel 2013). Currently there is little power for other anti-trafficking actors or the population to play a role in identifying trafficking victims. Even once victims are identified by the police to be trafficking victims, the police still must convince the prosecutor and judge that the victim was trafficked (Paçarizi 2013).
The process of identification creates a funnel where there are a great number of victims in Kosovo than are being identified by anti-trafficking. But Anti-trafficking actors are identifying more victims than are being recognized by police. And worse yet the police are identifying more victims than are being acknowledged in the judicial branch, which determines the official count of victims.

4.4.3 Prosecution

Paçarizi (Kosovo Police), Sherifi (PVPT NGO Shelter), Decker (UNDP), and Bejtullahu Turjaka (Ministry Sociale) all identified coordination between the prosecutor and the judge as one of the greatest obstacles to successful anti-trafficking work. “The prosecutor is the supervisor of the investigation. If the prosecutor is not satisfied with the justification he will not send it to the trial judge” (Paçarizi 2013). The situation is worsened by the fact that prosecutors “are afraid to deal with these trafficking cases because it is a very lucrative business” and they “don’t have the capacity to properly classify cases” (Bejtullahu Turjaka 2013). “Prosecutors and judges still need further training in order to increase the capacity of how to prosecute human trafficking” (Bejtullahu Turjaka 2013). Even if a case is identified as human trafficking in judiciary process, “there is a lot of corruption within the judicial system, they are threatened and for that reason cases of human trafficking sometimes they just end or sometimes the victim is criminalized” (Bejtullahu Turjaka 2013). For those cases that are ultimately found to be instances of human trafficking, the judge does not “give adequate punishment to traffickers” (Sherifi 2013) and “sentences for human trafficking are some of the lowest in the region” in Kosovo (Bejtullahu Turjaka 2013). Though UNDP representative agreed with conclusion that prosecution is ineffective in Kosovo, he shared that “EULEX is starting to do a fair amount of work in trying to get judges, prosecutors and police to work more closely together… because right now they don’t get along” (Decker 2013).

4.4.4 Reintegration

In conjunction with prosecution, reintegration was most often cited as a main hindrance to the success of anti-trafficking work. “The main problem is reintegration of the victims of trafficking because with this we need money and support from the government, it is very important and very expensive” (Sherifi 2013). Many anti-trafficking actors (Sherifi 2013, Shaqiri-Basha 2013, Paçarizi 2013) are seeing victims that “are re-victimized because after they get out of the shelter nothing else is offered for them to do” (Sherifi 2013). Bejtullahu Turjaka
state that “reintegration is very much need because of the patriarchal society”, which places a stigma upon trafficking victims (2013). “It is a problem to send them back to their families because of the bad reputation they gain in the community after being trafficked” (Sherifi 2013). Reintegration is also a struggle because of the lack of economic opportunity in Kosovo and especially for women. When “women don’t have the opportunity to make their own livelihood then they have to return to circumstances that put them at risk for trafficking” (Cancel 2013). Victims also do not receive any compensation from “money that (traffickers) gain through process of trafficking”, so they exit that shelters with no means, little chance for employment and often into the same community the trafficking occurred in (Bejtullahu Turjaka 2013).

4.4.5 Traditional Society

Both reintegration and initial trafficking are viewed to be heavily impacted by the traditional patriarchal societal norms. Human trafficking is viewed as a “taboo issue that is in disgust” with Kosovo (Shaqiri-Basha 2013). “(Kosovo) used to be very patriarchal and (it) still is very patriarchal. I think the moral expectation is the highest priority for girls and society. For example if you had just two relationships you are not considered the right person for marriage” (Shaqiri-Basha 2013). Women do not have an equal opportunity for employment within Kosovo and though not legally discriminated against, are not afforded the same “rights” within the community. When “women don’t have the opportunity to make their own livelihood then they have to turn to circumstances that put them as risk for trafficking” (Cancel 2013). Women also experience “low education, and especially low professional education”, which limits their ability to compete for employment (Shaqiri-Basha 2013). “Victims are often also victims of domestic violence” (Cancel 2013). “Women get re-victimized after going through the system because they go back to the same communities that caused them to get victimized in the first place” (Cancel 2013). Victims of trafficking are being sent back to the communities and families that often contributed to the abuse and discrimination that lead to their trafficking. But now they will face an even greater stigma for being a victim of trafficking (Sherifi 2013).

4.4.6 Ethnic Minorities

“Minority communities do not feel comfortable going to the majority run shelters” and often “face language issues and social stigma” due to ethnic discrimination, especially Serbs, in Kosovo (Cancel 2013). Not only are minority victims facing stigma from society, “just being seen going to Kosovo police could create stigma that then they have to face when they return to
their (ethnic) communities” (Cancel 2013). Even if an ethnic minority victim seeks help from the Kosovo Police, the only actor with the power to identify victims, the potential victim will most likely not be identified correctly. Ethnic minorities, specifically Serbian minorities, use parallel institutions and “a medical certificate from a Serbian run hospital would not necessarily be recognized by the Kosovo police, so they don’t have proof they were a victim” (Cancel 2013). Misidentification and perceived inability to effectively shelter minority victims severely impedes Kosovo’s ability to protect all victims of trafficking.

4.5 Conclusion of Results and Analysis

In analyzing the results of research conducted on the anti-trafficking work in Kosovo, this chapter has served to both answer the three sub questions and lay the ground for concluding the overarching research question. Beginning by providing an understanding of the official definition of human trafficking accepted by RKS, which reviewed the establishment of Kosovo’s anti-trafficking structure and how international involvement has impacted the understanding of anti-trafficking work. After establishing the singular definition utilized by anti-trafficking actors, how definition is interpreted and pragmatically implemented was analyzed. Which lead to the conclusion that human trafficking in Kosovo is mainly understood as domestic sex trafficking of Kosovar Albanian women. It was then examined how this narrow understanding of the umbrella term of human trafficking has narrowed the creation and the implementation of anti-trafficking policy in Kosovo to the exclusion of many victims and an overall evaluation of the effectiveness.
5.0 Conclusion

This research studies how local actors in Kosovo have interpreted the international norm established on human trafficking. Thought the actors have created a highly structuralized and centralized response and policy, there are still discrepancies between the recognized definition, interpretation and implementation.

The definition of human trafficking has been conclusively yet malleably defined as a universally accepted international norm. However, as this norm is manifested through local actors it is reinterpreted and rearticulated to the context of each country attempting to combat human trafficking. While international definitions of human trafficking are fairly stable, it is during this interpretation phase that anti-trafficking actors conceptualize the problem to reflect both their interpretation and operationalization of anti-trafficking responses. In the case of Kosovo this conceptualization has taken a narrow understanding of the problem and that may or may not be the reality of Kosovo’s experience with human trafficking. The definition of human trafficking encompasses several forms of exploitation yet actors in Kosovo discuss human trafficking as almost exclusively an issue of sex trafficking of Kosovar Albanian women from rural to urban areas. It is then written implicitly into both policy and anti-trafficking response that Kosovo experiences human trafficking in that manner.

The process by which actors have localized the international norm of human trafficking situates easily within the literary framework established for this research. The official anti-trafficking response of Kosovo is clearly impacted and directly influenced by international involvement and it is arguably that involvement that has caused such a focus on anti-trafficking efforts (Stone 2008). Though Kosovo has a clearly defined anti-trafficking policy that has been created by local actors, there is still considerable involvement from the international community and desire to operate according to expectations set mainly by large destinations countries (i.e. US and EU countries) (Fagan 2010, Cho, Dreher & Neumayer 2011). Kosovo’s reliance on international involvement is only compound by being a weak state with limited diplomatic ability but the necessity to enter into dialogue with other states. This has potentially shaded Kosovo’s focus on domestic trafficking since it is within their full sovereign capacity (Fagan 2010).

Academic literature regarding anti-trafficking in the Balkans has had little focus on Kosovo and the attention Kosovo has been given was exclusively prior to independence
(Lindstrom 2006). The main basis for the Lindstrom’s framework was that actors were addressing human trafficking independently and potentially conflicting manners depending on the actors mission and understanding of human trafficking. However, Kosovo’s highly structuralized response to human trafficking has alleviated discrepancy between actors’ response but the approaches to addressing human trafficking were still present in the efforts of anti-trafficking work. Instead of discrepancy between actors, there is now a discrepancy between the official approach, visionary approach and approach in application as discussed in the results. This calls into questions a reframing and now understanding of Lindstrom’s framework as Balkan countries centralize their efforts to combat human trafficking.

The hidden nature of human trafficking increases the difficult in obtaining true representative data to make definitive claims about. As established in the literature research on hidden populations use results in one of the previously outlined methods, it became clear very quickly that knowledge claims about the nature of human trafficking in Kosovo were produced on a subpopulation of trafficking victims (Kelly & Reagan 2000, Brunovski and Tyldum 2005). While this is a valuable method and easiest qualitatively study human trafficking, it is dangerous to generalize the entire population by this subpopulation. Assuming that information regarding the subpopulation of known, and acknowledged trafficking victims is representative of the greater population of people being trafficked in Kosovo is an impossible leap to make. The narrow discussion of the nature of human trafficking in Kosovo can be attributed to doing just that though, making a claim and subsequent policy off of an experience with the subpopulation not the true population.

This research has a great value to add to not only academic literature, but the anti-trafficking policy community, and especially the anti-trafficking efforts in Kosovo. The study provides a small scale evaluation of one state’s response to human trafficking. Since, Kosovo was undergoing state building as anti-trafficking policy was being constructed; it provided a context to study a clear genesis of their anti-trafficking policy unlike more established countries. It also provides a study that utilizes the inherent biases in the data to analyze the interpretation, which demonstrates that data can still be of importance even though it will never be representative of the true nature. For the policy community, the study warns of how the narrowing through interpretation may lead to ineffective and biased response to anti-trafficking.
Specifically in Kosovo it brings to question if the narrowing is because of the reality of the problem or due to limited capacity and culture biases.

As anti-trafficking efforts move forward in Kosovo, actors should seek to investigate the potential of all forms of trafficking. Though the international community has called specific attention to the issues of organ trafficking and forced labor, especially in regards to forced child begging, little has been done to actively continue to search for these forms of trafficking. Kosovo should also continue to adopt new forms of investigation traffickers easily adapt to avoid detection and effect investigation measures in the early 2000s may no longer be investigating where trafficking is taking place. Anti-trafficking actors need to also search for a way to engage minorities communities and ensure that either trafficking is not taking place in these area or begin to provide services effectively in these regions. But, all of these needs will only address the symptoms of human trafficking and not address the actual issue which lies in the high unemployment rates and lack of opportunities for specifically for women. Kosovo needs to address these greater structural issues to begin to create an atmosphere that will no longer facilitate a supply of trafficking victims.

5.2 New Questions

Since both Kosovo and anti-trafficking work is continuing to grow and change each day there is still much research to be done in this realm. This study raised many questions regarding both the validity of data and the interpretation of Kosovo.

5.2.1 Incorporation of other actors

In the design of this study scope and resources necessitated the exclusion of some key actors within the process of both human trafficking and anti-trafficking work. Both traffickers and trafficking victims are underutilized in research regarding human trafficking, though these populations are both vulnerable and difficult to reach, they have the ability to provide voices and experiences to numbers on a piece of paper. Research with traffickers would provide insight into how anti-trafficking policy has or has not impacted the ways in which they conduct trafficking. Traffickers would be able to speak of the assumptions made about the change in the industry due to the implementation of anti-trafficking policy. Similarly, trafficking victims would be able to speak to how anti-trafficking policy impacted them and has attempted to help them. Interviews or other qualitative methods of research conducted with traffickers and victims provide insight to
the experiences of the two main groups that anti-trafficking policy is constructed to address (Beck & Britto 2006).

5.2.2 Interviews in minority regions of Kosovo

As was expressed by the data, human trafficking victims in Kosovo are majority Albanian females that are being trafficked from rural regions to urban regions. However, the statistics produced on human trafficking in Kosovo are actually produced on a subpopulation of the true population, women who have been identified by the police (Burnvoski & Tyldum 2005). An absence of data, should not be translated to an absence of problem. With the long standing ethnic tension within Kosovo and the documented mutual distrust, it calls into question if there are also Kosovar Serbian victims within Kosovo that may be escaping identification. Anecdotal evidence suggests that the mechanism in place may not be recognizing trafficking victims identified by Serbian doctors and officials within the enclaves. Also, since the Kosovo police are the only identifying apparatus, and the Serbian enclaves do not recognize Kosovo’s independence or the jurisdiction of the police, Serbian victims may not seek out the police for aide (Cancel 2013). Subsequently, evidence of trafficking victims of Kosovar Serbian decent would disprove that human trafficking is only being experience by Kosovar Albanians. It would also demonstrate the rather knowingly or unknowingly actors in Kosovo were producing policy based on an experience with a specific subpopulation of victims.
References:


Interviews:


Appendix A

Interview Questions

Date:

Interviewee Name:

Organization/Affiliation with anti-trafficking work:

How does your agency define human trafficking?

What existing laws or protocols influence your definition (UN, Kosovo Law, EU)?

What type of work do you do to prevent human trafficking?

How do you identify persons perpetrating human trafficking and those involved in human trafficking?

When you find someone you believe to be a person involved in human trafficking what is the protocol?

Once finding a person involved in human trafficking what happens after they are brought out (i.e. jail, rehabilitation, back into society)?

Do you work with any other people or organizations in addressing human trafficking?

Do you produce any statistics about human trafficking?

How are those produced?
Appendix B

Recruitment Letter

Dear______________:

My name is Nicollette Staton and I am a Master’s student at Miami University conducting research for my thesis in Kosovo this summer. I do not speak Albanian but I am working on learning and have a translator to aid in correspondence. If you prefer to correspond in Albanian please let me know in your response. My research is interested in local anti-trafficking efforts and how estimates about human trafficking victims are made.

Due to your involvement in anti-trafficking work, I would like to invite you to participate in my research on human trafficking. Participation would involve an interview conducted in person for approximately an hour about the anti-trafficking work that you and the organization that you represent do in Kosovo. If you are unable to conduct the interview in English, I would like to have a translator present to aid in the interview process. Participation is completely voluntary and at any point during the interview you may decline to answer a question or terminate the interview. You will not be asked any questions that would expose you to any greater harm than is already experienced in your daily work with human trafficking. The interview will ask questions about how your organization defines human trafficking, what anti-trafficking work you do, what other organizations you partner with and what type of quantitative data you keep on human trafficking. A full list of questions will be available prior to the interview if so desired. If you or the organization you represent wishes to remain anonymous, your name/organization will not be attributed to the information provided in the interview. If you participate in this study I will provide a copy of my research findings upon completion. The information obtained from this interview will be compiled into an article that may be published and may be presented at a conference.

If you have further questions about the study please contact Nicollette Staton at 049380042 or through email to statonnm@miamioh.edu. You may also contact my faculty advisor, Dr. Carl Dahlman through email: dahlmac@miamioh.edu or if you have questions about your rights as a research participant, please call the Office of Advancement of Research and Scholarship at 1-513-529-3600 or email: humansubjects@miamioh.edu.

Thank you for consideration to participate in my research, I look forward to hearing from you.
Letër rekrutimi

I/e dashur __________________:

Unë quhem Nicollete Staton, nga universiteti Miami University dhe jam në Kosovë për të bërë hulumtime në lidhje me temën e diplomës për studimet Master. Unë nuk e flas gjuhën shqipe, por po përpqem të mësoj dhe gjithashtu kam një përkthyes që do të më ndihmojë në bashkëbisedimet e mia. Nëse preferon t'i komunikoni me mua në gjuhën shqipe, ju lutem të ma bëni të ditur. Hulumtimet e mia janë me interes në përprjeqjet lokale kundër trafikimit dhe si bëhen vlerësimet në lidhje me viktimat e trafikimit njerëzor.

Për shkak të përfshirjes suaj në punën kundër trafimit njerëzor, unë do të doja t’ju floj që të marmi pjesë në hulumtimet e mia mbi trafikimin njerëzor. Pjesëmarrja do të përfshijë një intervistë përfaqërisht një orë në lidhje me punën që ju ose organizata juaj në Kosovë të bëni në lidhje me trafikimin njerëzor. Nëse nuk mund ta bëni intervistën në gjuhën angleze, unë do të doja të kisha të pranishëm përkthyesin për të ndihmuar në procesin e intervistës. Pjesëmarrja është plotësisht në baza vullnetare dhe ju në çdo kohë mund të refuzoni përgjigjen e ndonjë pyetje ose ta përfundoni intervistën.

Juve nuk do t’ju bëhet asnjë pyetje që do të mund t’ju ekspozojë para ndonjë rreziku më të madh se sa ju ballafaqoheni çdo ditë gjersa punoni me trafikimin njerëzor. Nëse ju apo organizata juaj doni të mbeteni anonim, atëherë as ju e as organizata juaj nuk do të ngarkohet me informacionin e dhënë gjatë intervistës. Nëse ju bëheni pjesë e këtij studimi, atëherë pas përfundimit unë do të sigurojë një kopje të hulumtimit tim. Informacioni i mbledhur gjatë kësaj interviste do të përpirohet në një artikull që mund të publikohet dhe mund të prezantohet në një konferencë.

Nëse keni pyetje tjera në lidhje me këtë studim, ju lutem më kontaktoni në: Nicollette Staton (Numri i telefonit do të shtohet sapo të merret) ose përmes email adresës në: statonnm@miamioh.edu. Gjithashtu ju mund të kontaktoni këshilltarin tim të fakultetit, Dr. Carl Dahlman përmes emailit: dahlmac@miamioh.edu ose nëse keni pyetje tjera në lidhje me të drejtat e juaja si pjesëmarrës në hulumtim, ju lutem kontaktoni Zyrën për Avancimin e Hulumtimeve dhe Bursave në 1-513-529-3600 ose në email adresën: humansubject@miamioh.edu.

Ju faleminderit që do të konsideroni pjesëmarrjen tuaj në hulumtimin tim. Në pritje për të dëgjuar prej jush.