SUBTITLED VS. DUBBED ANIME: VIEWER PERCEPTION OF JAPANESE CULTURE

Thesis
Submitted to
The College of Arts and Sciences of the
UNIVERSITY OF DAYTON

In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for
The Degree of
Master of Arts in Communication

By
Joanna Sarkis Abdallah

UNIVERSITY OF DAYTON
Dayton, Ohio
May 2018
SUBTITLED VS. DUBBED ANIME: VIEWER PERCEPTION OF JAPANESE CULTURE

Name: Abdallah, Joanna Sarkis

APPROVED BY:

________________________________________
Samuel P. Wallace, Ph.D.
Committee Chair
Professor

________________________________________
Jason Combs, Ph.D.
Committee Member
Lecturer

________________________________________
Joseph Valenzano III, Ph.D.
Committee Member
Associate Professor; Chair of Department of Communication
ABSTRACT

SUBTITLED VS. DUBBED ANIME: VIEWER PERCEPTION OF JAPANESE CULTURE

Name: Abdallah, Joanna Sarkis
University of Dayton

Advisor: Dr. Samuel P. Wallace

Anime, a Japanese form of animation and film, has been globally popular for a period of time. This medium may have allowed cross-cultural learning among viewers through its Japanese cultural context. This study explores if there are indeed any cultural learning effects from consuming either subtitled or dubbed anime, the two common forms of audiovisual translation. Participants (n = 63) were students sampled from a Midwestern university and randomly assigned to three groups: control group, subtitled anime viewers’ group, and dubbed anime viewers’ group. Control group participants did not watch any anime, while the other groups watched one episode of anime with respect to the group they were assigned to. All participants completed the same survey, which was in the form of a knowledge test about Japanese culture. This study used a one-way analysis of variance to compare group differences in their average scores on the survey test. Analyses showed difference in cultural learning between subtitled anime viewers and anime non-viewers, with viewers scoring higher on the test. There are clear inferences that consuming a form of translated foreign media may enhance cross-cultural
learning between different peoples. This study argues that globalized foreign media must be given more attention due to its pedagogical importance in terms of cultural communication and learning.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT ..................................................................................................................................................... iii

LIST OF TABLES ................................................................................................................................................ vi

INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................................................... 1

LITERATURE REVIEW ................................................................................................................................. 3

METHOD ...................................................................................................................................................... 14

RESULTS .................................................................................................................................................... 19

DISCUSSION .............................................................................................................................................. 22

CONCLUSION ............................................................................................................................................ 28

REFERENCES ............................................................................................................................................. 31

APPENDIX A Japanese Culture Survey ....................................................................................................... 33
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: One-Way Analysis of Variance for the three groups on their test score means. 19
Table 2: Tukey HSD Multiple Comparisons between groups. ................................. 20
Table 3: Tukey HSD group comparison. ........................................................................ 21
Table 4: Descriptive results of test scores among the three groups. ............................. 21
A common debatable decision in watching a foreign TV or film product is the choice of whether to watch a subtitled or dubbed version. However, one may question the difference between both types of the translated product. Does it make a difference whether the video is subtitled or dubbed? Is understanding the narrative merely the purpose of watching a film or TV series? What happens to a medium embedded with culturally significant topics and issues when it is translated to a different language for a different audience?

This paper explores the audiovisual medium of anime, an originally Japanese form of animation and filmmaking. Animation has been based on manga, an equivalent to Japanese comic books, in which it highlights issues in Japan’s society and also reflects various cultural references (Ito, 2005). Anime’s popularity is widespread on an international level, occupying 60% of the television animation broadcast (Nakamura, 2006). While in the United States, anime has an annual revenue of $4 billion (O’Hagan, 2006). However, the exporting of anime to other countries could not have been possible without the translation of the product in both subtitled and dubbed versions because they are only produced in Japanese. Thus, the globalization of anime and the loss of its full Japanese content due to translation have caused a problem in defining anime as a Japanese product. Some have also stated that anime has a universal look rather than a
Japanese one. Unfortunately, there is no clear evidence on whether the visual aspects of the characters, the narrative, or the translation of anime are reasons for it to have a universal face.

The aim of this research is to show whether viewers of subtitled or dubbed anime recognize, more effectively, the cultural cues embedded through a knowledge test of Japanese culture. Since anime encompasses more than just a narrative for the purpose of entertainment, it immerses the narrative in a Japanese frame. Therefore, test scores will be used to detect whether viewers learn about Japanese culture when exposed to the two alternatives of translated anime.
LITERATURE REVIEW

This section of the paper will begin by explaining the previous theoretical model used to administer research in similar topics. After having laid out a previous theory used for this field of research, this paper will present an overview of past research conducted on the topic of anime and provide the current context in which anime lies culturally and as an audiovisual product globally. There is little research conducted on anime, particularly on the auditory/translational factors that shape the perception of anime and its origin. Thus, this literature review will try to provide connections between different research conducted on anime and also identify the gaps in previous findings.

Scene-and-Frame Semantics

Scene-and-frame semantics. The scene-and-frame semantics model developed by Fillmore (1977) suggests a unique way of understanding communication and human regulation of language and messages. This model first divides a message into scenes: familiar and personal experience regarding objects and human interaction (Fillmore, 1977.) The second entity, frames, is a description, or an embodiment, of the given scene through linguistic tools (Fillmore, 1977.) Additionally, Fillmore (1976) argues that the frame concept can aid research on understanding communication and comprehension processes. An important point of this theory is that scenes (experience) and frames
(description) activate each other (Fillmore, 1977.) Fillmore (1977) provides an example of this theory by explaining the verb write and its different scene-and-frame analysis in Japanese and English. While in both languages it means leaving a trace on a surface, in English it activates a more specific scene into a language frame. This means that, in English, the verb write is associated with writing a letter; however, the Japanese verb kaku has a more general frame to it in that the verb can also mean having done a sketch (Fillmore, 1977).

In another context, this theory has been used for translation studies as well. Caffrey (2008) used scene-and-frame semantics in audiovisual translation as a framework to understand how the images (scenes) produced by the translator, upon having a hand on the original text, differ from the final translation (frames) given by the translation (Caffrey, 2008). This research studied how the translation of subtitles, in accordance to visual non-verbal cues, may affect the viewer’s overall frame of the anime product. Caffrey’s (2008) concern is the reproduction of anime with sole reliance on the translator’s predisposed scenes and their interaction into formulating a new frame that matches the translator’s world rather than the author’s. However, one can still categorize this use of the theory as applying to linguistics and not communication as a whole. Caffrey still relied on applying the model on the translation of texts rather than trying to understand greater communication media.

Consequently, this study will use a knowledge test to answer the question in mind about the consumption of anime and viewer perception. Unlike Colm Caffrey’s (2008) study, this research is looking for any cross-culture educational effects on the viewer. While scene-and-frame semantics is a linguistic theory, this study uses the knowledge
test as a new form to detect learning effects from watching anime. Thus, the test has not been used previously in any other studies.

**Anime Popularity**

Before moving to the primary subject, an overview of anime and its current status should be laid out as a primary context for the rest of the research. To begin with, anime is a form of Japanese animation (Lu, 2008), which comes in different genres and is shown in the form of movies and television series (Hodges, 2003). However, the anime genre didn’t catch the population’s attention until the 1960’s (Lu, 2009). According to Nakamura (2006), anime occupy 60% of the TV animation broadcast internationally. Also, anime accounts for a reported sale worth US $4 billion a year in the US (O’Hagan, 2006). Japanese animation is frequently mistaken for being a children’s animation; however, anime does have an adult market (O’Hagan, 2006). A major source of influence on the production of anime is manga, in other words, Japanese comics (Fusanosuke, 2003). The process in which anime was transported to audiences other than the Japanese audience started with “fansubbing” (Hodges, 2003). Fans of anime in the United States would produce subtitles for unpopular anime, which are not commercially distributed and translated by a company (Hodges, 2003). Fansubbing causes a challenge for the commercial market in a way that pressures the commercial companies to distribute the products that are gaining popularity. Fansubbers, then, became an active force in the anime market, and did not rely on companies to import the foreign shows they are interested (Hodges, 2003). However, reflecting on that, fansubbers are in a way playing a role reproducing the original Japanese context of the anime with amateur translation. On
the other hand, González (2007) states that fansubbing can potentially cause a movement in the media marketplace, contributing to the globalization of anime. Consequently, fans in the United States have immersed themselves in the Japanese popular culture, referring to themselves as ‘anime otaku’ (Newitz, 1994). While otaku in Japan is used as an insult, fans outside of Japan have already appropriated the term to fit a new world (Newitz, 1994). This poses a question regarding the final product that the fansubbers are distributing to other fans: If they have appropriated a Japanese insult, will their translation of the Japanese product also be appropriated?

Anime and Culture

There is an ongoing debate on the content and appearance of anime. Several studies have looked into this area in quite similar and dissimilar ways. Iwabuchi (2002) argues that Japan has prided itself with the globalization of its unique nationalist product anime. However, Iwabuchi (2002) claims that anime is rather ‘culturally odorless’ in that it shows a universal face to the world by having characters with physical characteristics that are unidentifiable as being Japanese. Lu (2009) reinforced Iwabuchi’s assessment of viewer perception of anime characters’ different races by presenting samples of anime characters’ portraits to a largely Caucasian sample. Results showed that most viewers had a perception of the character’s racial identity that were different than those intended by the anime producers. Lu (2009) concludes, according to her study, the ‘ethnical bleaching’ of the physical attributes of anime characters may have aided the internationalization of anime. By ethnical bleaching, she meant that characters have non-
Asian hair colors and features that are closer to Western representation (Cooper-Chen, 2012; Lu, 2008).

In addition, Denison (2010) identifies the multi-cultural aspects present in anime: from Victorian English to European Culture. Lu (2008) also did argue that what audiences are consuming from anime is not specifically one culture, but a mixture of cultures in one medium. An instance of this would be the global success of Pokémon: the producers actually focused on giving the animation a universal appeal to capture the attention of American children’s (Lu, 2008). Thus, Iwabuchi (2000) is critical of Japan’s false pride in an audiovisual product that does not look Japanese. Another factor that makes anime a transcultural product, as Denison (2010) points out, is the reproduction of anime to promote globalization at the hand of both international fans and American industries. For example, Disney has reproduced films made by Studio Ghibli, a renowned Japanese creative anime company, by translating and dubbing the text (Denison, 2010). The case is similar with anime TV shows that have also been redubbed by American industries for broadcasting (Denison, 2010). Consequently, even though anime production is based in Japan, it is also being taken over and reproduced by American industries, which control and release the world’s most imported and globalized audiovisual products.

Hodges (2003) discusses an example of the reproduction of the anime Rurouni Kenshin, which presents significant themes on national historical issues. However, by translating the anime, the reproducer’s goal is to communicate more generalizable themes for an international audience; this erases the specific national references to past incidents and traditions (Hodges, 2003). Iwabuchi (2002) finds a problem in this ‘culturally
odorless’ globalization of Japanese anime since he argues that there is no evidence of clear ‘Japanese-ness’ in these productions.

Ito (2005) and Lu (2009) would present an oppositional argument about the absence of any Japanese-ness in the making of anime. To begin with, as mentioned before, anime is largely based on manga. As Ito (2005) lays out, manga exists in the context of culture and language; manga is a mirror of the Japanese society and its reality. Manga was not invented recently, as it has been historically present in Japan (Ito, 2005). In 1847, manga became an influence on Japanese politics due to the journalistic nature that it acquired. It was one of the factors that allowed advancement in the freedom of speech: it is an outlet of expression for Japanese artists regarding what is currently happening in their society (Ito, 2005). Therefore, anime is only a reproduction of the manga itself into an audiovisual form. Inevitably, an audiovisual medium will have adjustments and changes; however, the themes and cultural references that Ito (2005) mentions will still be there. Although Lu (2008; 2009) argues that anime does have universal appeal regarding its visual components, such as characters’ physical appearance, she does mention that Japanese anime producers have shown “Occidentalism” in some instances (Lu, 2008). Occidentalism occurs when negatively depicted Western characters are overpowered and defeated by Asian characters (Lu, 2008). Thus, Lu’s (2008) argument is that Japan is building its national pride within these occidental scenarios that are present in anime. This adds to the general argument that ‘Japanese-ness’ does exist in anime, and like manga, doesn’t exist in a vacuum.

Another view on Occidentalism is that it allows a positive image: anime’s transcultural nature has allowed its greater popularity (Denison, 2004). Manion’s (2005)
thesis on anime and interest in Japanese culture, argued that students who are taking a
course in Japanese are actually enrolled as part of their enthusiasm to understand
Japanese popular culture; i.e, anime. Newitz (1994) restates Manion’s (2005) conclusion
from the interviews she conducted with anime fans in the United States. Anime fans
mainly showed interest in Japan and in discovering its culture due to unmentioned
factors, but anime was one of them (Newitz, 1994). To add, Newitz (1994) believes that
anime is an expression of ideology, in other words, culture. Cooper-Chen (2012) quotes
that anime fans in Singapore have overcome language and culture barriers: they will still
embrace the ‘kawaii’ culture. Therefore, one can argue on one hand that anime can
actually contain a piece of Japanese culture and oppose Iwabuchi’s (2002) perspective on

Anime and Audiovisual Translation

Translating an audiovisual text is quite different than translating an essay or
writing. According to Remael (2010), an audiovisual text has four main components in its
sign system. The first component is audio-verbal signs: the words that are uttered. The
second is audio-nonverbal signs: the various sounds that are present. The third one is
visual-verbal signs: the writings on the screen. The last one is the visual non-verbal signs
that are comprised of all the visual signs and actions on the screen. However, these
components do not work independently: they are highly dependent on each other’s
contexts and cues (Remael, 2010). Thus, an audiovisual text provides a complex medium
for translators to work with and transpose. Moreover, audiovisual translation has two
major forms: either subtitling or dubbing (Remael, 2010). By definition, subtitling is the
process of transposing the “audio-verbal signs” into a maximum of two lines, situated at the middle-bottom of the screen (Pettit, 2004). Subtitling then does not interfere completely with the original audiovisual text: only a written visual component is added (Cintas, 2010). Cintas (2010) mentions the challenges of producing subtitles: one must take into consideration the speed in which the viewer can read and perceive the audiovisual components that are present. On the other hand, dubbing undergoes a different process than subtitling. According to Cintas and Orero (2010), dubbing is when the original soundtrack of the audiovisual text is replaced with a reproduced and translated soundtrack while it is still synchronized with the actor’s lip movements. In other words, the translated soundtrack is made for another target audience from another culture (Cintas & Orero, 2010). Unlike subtitling, dubbing makes the characters in the audiovisual text seem as if they are originally speaking the translated audio (Cintas & Orero, 2010).

Some scholars draw our attention to different challenges and questions that result from using audiovisual translation. In her analysis, Pettit (2004) realizes that genre affects the way the image is translated in subtitled and dubbed versions. Pettit (2004) finds a distinction between the subtitled and dubbed versions of the same movie: subtitles usually have a more literal translation of the spoken word, while the dubbed audio is referring to visual information. Also, Pettit (2004) analyzes an example where subtitles, unlike dubbing, use language that reflects the context of the genre; this, thus, complements the image and narrative’s characteristics. In some cases, the dubbing of the dialogue causes its neutralization: the audiovisual text loses its original context (Pettit, 2004). In Italy, dubbed comedies are criticized by audiences, and realize that the
translation of the jokes from the original language to Italian will not always work (Chiaro, 2006). Chiaro (2006) indicates that finding equivalent terms for a word in another language may not mean the same thing and can alter its context in a culture.

As established previously, anime does contain cultural references and contexts to some extent. However, the globalization of anime required its translation into different languages. The translators’ challenge will be how to maintain the cultural aspects of anime that are embedded in its audiovisual text. To begin with, since anime started off as a niche genre in the United States, the fans stimulated its popularity by creating “fansubs” for the original show (Hodges, 2003). Denison (2010) points out the risks of increasing reproduction of anime with fansubs: if amateur translators are altering the content that is reproduced, then it would be hard to recognize the origin of anime and where it is made. On another note, dubbing, as a process of audiovisual translation, imitates the effect that Denison previously stated. Cintas and Orero (2010) argue that dubbing holds the power of neutralizing and censoring the film, thus, partially transforming the audiovisual text into a new one that does not match the original. Audiences who watch dubbed films and shows do not have the chance to compare the original dialogue with the dubbed one; the true meaning could be obscured from them (Cintas & Orero, 2010). González (2007) agrees and provides an example of the previous statement in the realm of anime. By dubbing anime, producers are Americanizing Japanese names and effacing Japanese cultural references to fit the targeted audience: Americans (González, 2007). The viewers of the dubbed anime, however, could still identify that the characteristics of anime differed from cartoons that are produced by Americans (González, 2007). Dudley (2012) states that manga and anime are made for entertainment and not education. As a result,
the content is translated with little regard to what effects it might yield on a comprehensive and cultural level. Dudley (2012) concludes that if the cultural items of anime and manga are not maintained, the representation of Japanese culture will be false.

When it comes to anime fans’ preference for subtitled or dubbed anime, Manion (2005) found that the majority of anime fans in her sample prefer subtitling. In that way, fans are looking for a more original form the Japanese product (Manion, 2005). Hodges (2003) also argues that serious anime fans tend to prefer the subtitled version: the text becomes part of the appeal. By watching the subtitled version, the anime fans are showing interest in the foreign culture that is embedded within the anime and understand that they are not the original targeted audience (Hodges, 2003).

Research Question

After providing an overview on anime and its current standing, many issues and ambiguities come into question. Authors have discussed the issue of identifying anime’s origin due to its universal and global look; however, they have not mentioned other factors. In addition, previous research concerning the translation of anime and its effect on the final product has rarely been conducted. Colm Caffrey (2008) conducted research to find whether subtitles juxtaposed with visual non-verbal cues in anime are enough to convey the cultural references. Caffrey’s (2008) sample only consisted of Japanese-learning and non-Japanese speaking subjects. Nevertheless, Caffrey’s theoretical framework was that of a linguistic and translation perspective. Another study that is similar to this research is Manion’s (2005): the author wanted to find whether manga and anime serve to promote interest in Japanese culture to their consumers. Unfortunately, her
research was based on a questionnaire and a discussion of the results. The subjects did not receive any treatment, but only indicated their opinions and preferences according to their history with anime.

The research question that emerges from this literature and due to gaps in previous research in this field is: how does watching subtitled or dubbed anime have an effect on the viewer’s perception of anime’s Japanese cultural cues? From a communication perspective, this research aims to find whether the types of audiovisual translation mediate messages differently. Also, this research questions aims to add importance to generally exploring communication of cultural ideas and behavior through media.

**Hypotheses**

\(H_1\): There will be a difference in the test score means between those who do not watch anime and those who watch subtitled anime.

\(H_2\): There will be a difference in test score means between those who do not watch anime and those who watched dubbed anime.

\(H_3\): There will be a difference in the test score means between those who watch subtitled anime and those who watch a dubbed anime.
METHOD

To understand the possible educational effects of subtitling or dubbing media, I have used the anime videos as the medium. The anime chosen for this experiment is "Gamers!", which is a romantic comedy anime in a middle school setting. For this study, viewers were only exposed to the first episode of the first season. The first episode used is 23 minutes and 14 seconds long. This anime was specifically chosen since it does not explicitly state what some Japanese cultural beliefs and behaviors are. This anime depicts a slice of life of children in middle school whereby the characters engage in day-to-day conversations and events. The purpose of using this anime is to detect whether the characters of this anime operate in a Japanese cultural context, from communication to geographical settings. Thus, the videos are intended to be framed as less educational in order for the viewers to watch the episode for entertainment purposes.

Subjects

Subjects were students enrolled in undergraduate communication courses at a medium size private Midwestern university. The participants ranged from first year students to seniors. As some of the students were enrolled in the Introduction to Communication course, there were majors from all over the university. A total of 63 students took part in the study. Even though the study used a convenience sample of
available students, the total number of students \((n = 63)\) were randomly assigned to three
groups. The first group served as the control group whereby participants only completed
the survey questions. The second group watched an episode of the subtitled anime, while
the third group watched an episode of the dubbed anime. Then, both groups completed
the same survey that was administered to the first group.

Procedure

In order to carry out the experiment, the subjects were provided with instructions
for the next step by their instructors. After randomly being assigned to each of the three
groups, the instructors provided a link specific to each one’s respective group. Those who
were assigned to the first group received a link to the survey questions and were
prompted to complete the survey. The survey was created on Google Forms in the form
of a quiz whereby points are given for each correct answer. Unlike the first group, the
second group received a different link: the survey contained the first episode of *Gamers!*
with English subtitles. After the video, the same survey questions given to the first group
were listed below. In the third group, participants received another link: the survey
contained the first episode of *Gamers!* dubbed in English. The video was followed by the
same survey questions provided to the first group and the second group. In the second
and third group, the participants were prompted to answer the questions after watching
the video. In all groups, responses were not required for each question in order to submit
the survey. Students were given extra credit for their class for completing the survey.

Measure

After the subjects were assigned to their groups, they were given the same survey
questions to complete under the conditions that were previously discussed. The survey
questions are provided in Appendix A. The survey was constructed in the form of a knowledge test of Japanese culture. In order to construct this measure, I conducted an interview with Karen Yamamoto, a Japanese resident. As a person who lives and works in Japan, she described daily behaviors of Japanese people: from greetings, to meetings, to cultural celebrations and traditions (K. Yamamoto, personal communication, November 24, 2017). Hence, the questions were derived from those observations of everyday life in Japan. Since the chosen anime is based on a genre whereby characters are seen in a school setting with day-to-day interactions with colleagues, the questions were made to match the setting as well. The survey included 25 multiple-choice questions: receiving a score of 25 signifies a perfect score on the knowledge test. The assumption made by this study was the higher the score, the more the subject knows about Japanese culture. Therefore, the scores will help in identifying the difference between the groups and their learning or knowledge of Japanese culture. It is also assumed that prior knowledge of Japanese culture will be present, but it will be normally distributed throughout the subject pool.

Overall, the questions were created not only to test participants’ knowledge about Japanese culture, but also anime’s cultural context of interactions and settings and its matching to the reality of Japanese cultural cues. To provide more context for the questions that were constructed, some of the items will be categorically described for their specific testing purpose. First, items 1, 2, 8, 10, and 17 (see Appendix A) cover Japanese cultural behaviors. These behaviors include non-verbal communication during different greeting situations, recreational activities, and preferred method of transportation. For instance, if a person encounters a friend or an elder, a respectful way
to greet is by bowing to them (K. Yamamoto, personal communication, November 24, 2017). Another scenario is when entering someone’s household: it is common for one to take off their own shoes before entering (K. Yamamoto, November 24, 2017).

In the second set of items, including items 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 12, 14, 15, and 25, the testing focus is more on the use of Japanese language. Items 3 through 7 highlight the use of language when addressing another person. In Japanese culture, respect is stressed on and indicated through the choice of words. Yamamoto (2017) stated that a person indicates most respect when they address another person by their last name and the proper honorific. An honorific is a title added to one’s name to indicate rank. In Japanese, honorifics are added after one’s first or last name to indicate rank based on age or on social status with reference to the oneself (K. Yamamoto, personal communication, November 24, 2017). Honorifics are frequently used as part of an interaction between individuals in Japan. Some items serve as vocabulary questions whereby a participant demonstrates learning of Japanese words. These items test for any learning from a linguistic perspective.

Items 13, 18, 19, and 20 cover topics regarding the setting of houses and places in Japan. A traditional Japanese house has wooden flooring with wooden sliding doors in the interior (K. Yamamoto, personal communication, November 24, 2017). Other settings include spiritual places: shrines being the most common in Japan. Not to mention, Japanese festivals have their own setting where one can find food and game kiosks (K. Yamamoto, November 24, 2017). Thus, those questions to test on whether one knows the settings of places in Japan. Items 9, 11, 12, and 22 are related to the previous set of items, but they focus on specific objects used in Japan. The questions in this set contained a
definition question of the word *bento*, which traditionally, in Japan, is a home-made packed meal (K. Yamamoto, November 24, 2017). Other traditional items mentioned in the two other questions are: the *kimono* as a formal outfit and chopsticks as the utensils traditionally used for eating.

The last set of items, 16, 21, 23, and 24, dealt with Japanese cultural beliefs and values. Japanese people value their history and culture, part of that is having immense respect for the elderly. Another cultural value is that women retain a conservative lifestyle (K. Yamamoto, November 24, 2017). Therefore, the questions in this set of items serve to detect any knowledge or learning about Japan’s cultural values and beliefs.
RESULTS

Hypothesis 1 predicted that there will be a significant difference in test score means between those who do not watch anime and those who watch a subtitled anime. A one-way ANOVA was used to compare the test scores means of the groups. A significant difference was found among the groups (\(F(2, 60) = 6.82, p < .05\)) (see Table 1). To determine how the groups differed on their score means, Tukey’s HSD was used. The post-hoc test analysis (see Table 2) revealed that those who watched subtitled anime scored higher (\(M = 16, SD = 2.43\)) than those who did not watch any anime (\(M = 12.58, SD = 3.01\)) (see Table 3). Thus, Hypothesis 1 was supported.

Table 1: One-Way Analysis of Variance for the three groups on their test score means.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Between Groups</td>
<td>130.603</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>65.301</td>
<td>6.823</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within Groups</td>
<td>574.254</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>9.571</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>704.857</td>
<td>62</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- a. Dependent Variable: Score of participants on the Japanese culture survey.
- b. Factors: Control group, Subtitled anime exposure group, Dubbed anime exposure group

Hypothesis 2 predicted that there will be a difference in test score means between
those who do not watch anime and those who watch dubbed anime. Participants who watched dubbed anime \((M = 14.63, SD = 3.76)\) were not significantly different from those who did not watch anime \((M = 12.58, SD = 3.01)\). Hypothesis 2 was not supported.

Hypothesis 3 predicted that there will be a difference in test score means between participants who watched subtitled anime and those who watched dubbed anime. Participants who watched subtitled anime \((M = 16, SD = 2.43)\) were not significantly different from participants who watched dubbed anime \((M = 14.63, SD = 3.76)\). Hypothesis 3 was not supported.

Table 2: Tukey HSD Multiple Comparisons between groups.

Multiple Comparisons
Dependent Variable: Score on Survey
Tukey HSD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(I) Groups</th>
<th>(J) Groups</th>
<th>Mean Difference (I-J)</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>Subtitled Anime Group</td>
<td>-3.41667*</td>
<td>.93666</td>
<td>.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dubbed Anime Group</td>
<td>-2.04825</td>
<td>.95001</td>
<td>.087</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subtitled Anime Group</td>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>3.41667*</td>
<td>.93666</td>
<td>.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dubbed Anime Group</td>
<td>1.36842</td>
<td>.99110</td>
<td>.357</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dubbed Anime Group</td>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>2.04825</td>
<td>.95001</td>
<td>.087</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Subtitled Anime Group</td>
<td>-1.36842</td>
<td>.99110</td>
<td>.357</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Multiple Comparisons
Dependent Variable: Score on Survey
Tukey HSD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(I) Groups</th>
<th>(J) Groups</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Lower Bound</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>Subtitled Anime Group</td>
<td>-5.6677</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dubbed Anime Group</td>
<td>-4.3313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subtitled Anime Group</td>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>1.1657</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dubbed Anime Group</td>
<td>-1.0134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dubbed Anime Group</td>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>-.2348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Subtitled Anime Group</td>
<td>-3.7502</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*. The mean difference is significant at the 0.05 level.
Table 3: Tukey HSD group comparison.

*Score on Survey*

Tukey HSD\(^{a,b}\)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Groups</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>12.5833</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dubbed Anime Group</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>14.6316</td>
<td>14.6316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subtitled Anime Group</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>16.0000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig.</td>
<td></td>
<td>.091</td>
<td>.334</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Means for groups in homogeneous subsets are displayed.

b. The group sizes are unequal. The harmonic mean of the group sizes is used. Type I error levels are not guaranteed.

Table 4: Descriptive results of test scores among the three groups.

*Descriptives*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score on Survey</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>12.5833</td>
<td>3.00603</td>
<td>.61360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subtitled Anime Group</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>16.0000</td>
<td>2.42791</td>
<td>.54290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dubbed Anime Group</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>14.6316</td>
<td>3.75959</td>
<td>.86251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>14.2857</td>
<td>3.37174</td>
<td>.42480</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Model</td>
<td></td>
<td>Fixed Effects</td>
<td>3.09369</td>
<td>.38977</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Random Effects</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.02501</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DISCUSSION

Discussion of Results

The main purpose of this study was to determine differences in learning about Japanese culture depending on the translated medium that is seen by viewers. The test scores were the determining factor of any potential differences between those who do not watch anime, those who watch subtitled anime, and those who watch dubbed anime. The findings of this study will be discussed in relation to the previously proposed hypotheses.

The first hypothesis predicted a difference between those who did not watch anime and those who watched subtitled anime in their knowledge of Japanese culture in the experiment. Results suggest that the two groups differed on their knowledge of Japanese culture, with subtitled anime viewers scoring higher. This result seems to align with the literature that highlights the power of subtitles retaining the cultural context of the original film. Pettit’s (2004) statement that language used in subtitles retains more of the context of the genre may explain the higher scores on the cultural test in the subtitled anime group. In this sense, the subtitles may have retained a Japanese cultural context of the anime. Another implication is that although watching a subtitled anime shows one’s interest in Japanese culture (Hodges, 2003), it may also indicate that subtitled anime is a learning medium. The subtitled anime may not only be displaying cues of the foreign culture, but also may be inducing learning about this culture. This challenges Dudley’s
argument that the purpose of production of anime is for entertainment, but not education.

In the second proposed hypothesis, differences between participants who did not watch anime and those who watched the dubbed anime in the experiment in their knowledge of Japanese culture were tested for. Although the descriptive results show a mean difference, the analysis of variance did not indicate any significant difference between those who did not watch anime and those who watched dubbed anime prior to answering the survey. According to Cintas and Orero’s (2010) argument, dubbing may neutralize a film’s original context while some translations may lead to different meanings and alter its context in the international audience’s culture (Chiaro, 2006). Also, González (2007) states that dubbing Japanese anime Americanizes the cultural context. Therefore, the results may have been affected by the neutralizing effect of dubbing, indicating less knowledge of Japanese culture.

The third hypothesis predicted differences in test scores between subtitled anime viewers and dubbed anime viewers. While the literature mentioned dissimilarities between dub and subtitle translation in retaining cultural context in a foreign film, this study could not highlight those differences. As previously mentioned, subtitling retains the cultural context of the original text while dubbing can neutralize the context and recreate it (Cintas & Orero, 2010). The previous statement cannot be supported by the findings of this research. Referring back to González (2007), the author states that while the cultural context of anime may be Americanized, viewers recognize that the visual animation is not originally American. Not to mention, anime fans prefer subtitled anime since they seek a product that resembles the original one more (Manion, 2005). Hence,
Manion’s (2005) and González’s (2007) statements indicate that viewers do not completely dismiss the Japanese context in dubbed anime in comparison with subtitled anime. The results may suggest that the viewers of both subtitled and dubbed anime could both be showing similar learning effects.

After laying out the overall test score mean differences, one can take a closer look at the item responses in reference to the item analysis provided previously. In particular, this discussion focuses on the frequently missed questions in each group of this experiment. Frequently missed questions are operationally defined as questions with a less than 50% correct response rate. In the control group, where participants only answered the survey questions, the following items were frequently missed: 4, 5, 6, 10, 12, 13, 14, 17, 20, 22, 24. However, the group of participants who watched a subtitled anime prior to answering the survey only missed these items: 4, 5, 10, 12, 20, 22. Finally, in the group where participants watched a dubbed anime prior to answering the questions frequently missed these items: 4, 5, 6, 9, 10, 12, 13, 20, 23. Items 4, 5, 6, 12, and 14 belong to the category of Japanese linguistic knowledge. Other sets of items were: 10 and 17 on cultural behaviors, 13 and 20 on Japanese settings and places, 9 and 22 on cultural objects, and 23 and 24 on cultural beliefs and values.

As demonstrated, in the control group, participants missed 5 out of 9 items that tested for language learning. Subjects in the subtitled anime group missed only 3 items, while those in the dubbed anime group missed 4 items for the same category. In the cultural behaviors category, both subtitled and dubbed anime groups missed only one item out of 5, item 10, while the control group missed 2 items. Meanwhile, in the category of Japanese settings and places, both the control group and the dubbed anime
group missed 2 items out of 4, items 13 and 20, while the subtitled anime group only frequently missed item 20. All three groups frequently missed one item that tested for knowledge on cultural objects. The final category of frequently missed questions is the one testing on Japanese cultural beliefs and values. The control group and the dubbed anime group missed one item out of 4 items, while the subtitled anime group missed none. Subsequently, the subtitled group did better than the other two groups in the linguistics category of questions as well as perfecting more questions about cultural beliefs and values. However, the three groups had similar items that were frequently missed as well.

**Limitations**

After observing the previous results, one may reflect on the limitations of this study given its conditions. First, the subjects used for this study was based on convenience sampling, which does not represent any larger population. In addition, the procedure of having one episode of anime to watch may not be adequate to determine learning effects on viewers. While this may be an issue, participants may also previously know some information about Japanese culture. To add, the learning effects suggested in the results after watching the episode may be immediate, but not long-term. Also, some items that were frequently missed by all three groups may suggest that the questions’ or answers’ wording may need to be reconsidered. Consequently, we cannot really draw a definite connection between the experiment and the results. In terms of experiment design, since the surveys were administered online at the participants’ convenience, they may have sought answers to the test questions online. There is also the possibility of participants skipping over the anime episode, only to complete the survey alone. In terms
of data analysis, running t-tests for each hypothesis is more scientifically correct to the predictions made. The differences predicted compare two groups out of the three at a time, but t-tests for the three hypotheses would have increased the chance of Type I error.

In a future replication of this study, I would first choose a larger sample. The sample size may demonstrate further differences or similarities between the groups used for this experiment. The experimental groups would remain the same: control group, subtitled anime viewers’ group, and dubbed anime viewers’ group. Instead of watching only one episode of an anime, subtitled anime and dubbed anime groups will watch one season of an anime. A twelve-episode season would be the target number of episodes per season for this experiment. To ensure that participants have watched the anime, daily screenings, over the course of twelve days, at a given location will be provided for each subtitled and dubbed anime groups. However, both groups’ screenings will be at separate times. After watching the full season, the participants of all three groups will be provided with the knowledge test survey on Japanese culture. Some of the questions in this survey will be revised to provide further explanation on some items. In particular, I would focus on clarifying what honorifics are as well as changing some of the answer choices to eliminate ambiguity. In addition, the survey questions will be adjusted to calculate the reliability and validity of this measure.

However, some points can be made to suggest future research in this field. Although the results have only signified a difference between those who do not watch anime and those who watch subtitled anime, we may replicate and enhance this study to explore more differences. The literature suggests differences in translation processes of subtitled and dubbed films as well as their end products. While this study consists of
certain limitations, future research could try to specifically debunk any differences between the two translated media and their effect on learning about culture. This study may show effective results when conducted over time, using several episodes instead of just one. Pre-tests and post-tests may also help identify differences in learning from foreign media.
CONCLUSION

With the increasing popularity of some globalized foreign films (i.e. anime) among our society, it is worth studying what is being communicated in those films and how foreign language and culture is reflected in translation. Cultural communication has not been studied enough in different perspectives, but it should be given attention from a foreign media perspective. While this is a pilot study that explores the pedagogical perspective of foreign media, the findings suggest that there may be a benefit to consuming foreign media to learn about other cultures. Therefore, we can assume that educators may already be using these films as a tool to educate students about foreign cultures. However, as our world becomes more globalized, it is essential to recognize the effects on the communication of different cultures through globalized and translated media products.

In addition, the newer generation has been born into a more globalized world due to social media. This globalization has allowed the sharing of media from different cultures. Thus, foreign media may have a certain target audience, but it is reaching out to audiences from around the world. The emergence of Netflix and other media businesses with streaming services have cast a shadow over the national television. This has opened up more opportunities to viewers to explore international media and productions.
Therefore, foreign media in this day and time may be more accessible than options such as study-abroad programs.

Education has focused on intercultural and cross-cultural learning through online classrooms or study-abroad programs. These two options, however, are not always accessible to all college students. If offered, international students may want to adapt to the culture of the university instead of projecting theirs in order to fit in. In the case of a study abroad program, some students are not able to afford the expenses or are not competent enough to be selected. Thus, in both cases, not all students are learning enough about other cultures. While diversity may be a term that is emphasized by many universities as part of their mission, educational tools need to be adjusted to deliver this mission.

This study has been conducted to create a starting point for other researchers and educators to further look into the matter. Although the findings may be specific to a very small population, they still demonstrated a difference between students in their knowledge of another culture. All entertainment media, from series to films and documentaries, are included as part of this educational investigation. On another note, studies may also look into the inaccuracies of cultural representations. In either exploration, there is an educational benefit from conducting studies on culture in media.

Education is an evolving entity that requires evaluation and renovation to accommodate the needs of each generation. The evolution of education may create challenges to educators and researchers. However, elements existing outside of the traditional classroom could help in delivering ideas more creatively. With a generation
that is more attracted to technological visuals, media, such as anime, could become the next step to cross-cultural education.
REFERENCES


APPENDIX A

Japanese Culture Survey

1. When entering a Japanese household, it is normal to:
   a. Enter directly
   b. Take your shoes off before entering
   c. Do not make direct eye contact with the host
   d. Ask permission to enter

2. If greeting a Japanese elder, it is most respectful to:
   a. Say “Konnichiwa”
   b. Bow
   c. Wave hello
   d. Shake hands

3. When addressing a Japanese person whom you have just met, you address them by:
   a. First name
   b. Last name
   c. Last name and the proper honorific
   d. Using no name other than “sir” or “madam”

4. When addressing a Japanese friend, you address them by:
   a. First name
   b. First and the proper honorific
   c. Last name and the proper honorific

5. When addressing a Japanese person who is a senior colleague at work or school, you use the honorific:
   a. –san
   b. –kun
   c. –senpai
   d. Honorable

6. When addressing a Japanese person who is esteemed/higher in rank, you use the honorific:
   a. –senpai
   b. –sama
   c. –san
   d. Honorable

7. A Japanese person may be offended if you call them by their:
   a. First name only
   b. Last name only
   c. First name and last name
   d. A nickname

8. When you encounter a person whom you know, it is most respectful to:
   a. Wave at them
   b. Bow to them
   c. Kneel to them
   d. Shake hands

9. What is a Bento?
   a. Box
   b. Home-made packed meal
   c. A type of Japanese food
d. A type of travel bag

10. A common stress-relieving activity in Japan is:
   a. Walking
   b. Eating
   c. Visiting a hot spring resort
   d. Swimming

11. For formal events, what do Japanese women wear?
   a. Dress
   b. Suit
   c. Sari
   d. Kimono

12. When transforming casual speech into formal speech, the word _______ is usually added:
   a. Arigato
   b. Kawaii
   c. Gozaimasu
   d. Sensei

13. A spiritual place that is commonly found in Japan:
   a. Church
   b. Shrine
   c. Mosque
   d. Garden

14. What is the Japanese word for “cute”?
   a. Hai
   b. Sugoi
   c. Konnichiwa
   d. Kawaii

15. Before eating a meal, a Japanese person would say:
   a. Nothing
   b. Bon appetit
   c. Itadakimasu
   d. Gochisousama

16. Japanese culture places a lot of importance and respect towards:
   a. Adults
   b. Colleagues
   c. The Elderly
   d. Bosses

17. Japanese people mostly tend to use _______ as a form of transportation:
   a. Cars
   b. Busses
   c. Trains
   d. Motorcycles

18. A traditional Japanese house would have:
   a. A door with a knob
   b. Wooden sliding doors
   c. Glass doors
   d. Paper doors

19. A traditional Japanese house would have:
   a. Wooden flooring
   b. Carpet flooring
   c. Ceramic flooring
   d. Glass flooring

20. At Japanese festivals, it is common to see:
   a. Food trucks
   b. Performers
   c. Food and Game kiosks
   d. Carnival rides
21. Japanese people value and refer to ________ in their art and literature:
   a. Western culture
   b. Japanese cultural myths, legends, and history
   c. The United States
   d. Other Asian cultures

22. To eat food, Japanese people use:
   a. Forks
   b. Spoons
   c. Chopsticks
   d. All of the above

23. In Japan, women are more __________ than American women:
   a. Conservative
   b. Independent
   c. Passive
   d. Aggressive

24. An Otaku person is a person who has:
   a. An obsession
   b. A manga collection
   c. A cosplay collection
   d. A lazy person

25. The word otaku in Japan is __________:
   a. Seen as a compliment
   b. Considered a derogatory term
   c. Not really used
   d. Refers to a dragon