“TEMPORALITIES OF TIMELESSNESS” IN STRAVINSKY’S NEOCLASSICAL APOTHEOSES

Jonathan Shold

A Thesis

Submitted to the Graduate College of Bowling Green State University in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of MASTER OF MUSIC

August 2011

Committee:

Marcus Zagorski, Advisor

Eftychia Papanikolaou
ABSTRACT

Marcus Zagorski, Advisor

The various musical meanings of the polysemous term “apotheosis” have received scattered and uneven attention in musicological discourse. Although some historical instances of musical “apotheosis” have generated a fair amount of research, at least one application of the term has generated only little scholarship: the climactic “apotheosis” in the nineteenth-century ballet, and the surviving legacy of this concept in the music of twentieth-century composer Igor Stravinsky (1882-1971). This thesis investigates the concept of “apotheosis” in the finales of five of Stravinsky’s neoclassical compositions: Apollo (1928), Le baiser de la fée (1928), Symphony of Psalms (1930), Scènes de ballet (1944), and Orpheus (1948). Although only three of these finales are explicitly entitled “Apothésose” in the score, the musical restraint generally exhibited in these finales will be shown to form the basis for a modern theoretical conception of the “timeless musical apotheosis” in Stravinsky’s music.

Chapter 1 investigates conceptions of “apotheosis” in the symphonic poems of Franz Liszt and the ballets of Pyotr Il’yich Tchaikovsky as potential historical models for Stravinsky’s own conception of “apotheosis.” Chapter 2 explores the antithetical model of a “temporality of timelessness,” a paradoxical frame of reference in which the passage of varying rates of time is juxtaposed with the cessation of time to create a dense temporal web; it is then suggested how such a curious “temporality” might be signified in a passage of music. Chapter 3 applies the historical and theoretical concepts of the previous chapters to Stravinsky’s music; it is argued that the reception history of these works has led to a conception of the “timeless musical apotheosis” that ultimately has little immediately in common with Stravinsky’s own understanding of “apotheosis.”
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank the musicology faculty at BGSU for sharing with me their time and professional insights, both inside and outside of the classroom. Special thanks go to the members of my committee, both of whom were instrumental in helping me to navigate the various stages of researching and writing this thesis. Their keen insights and encouragement helped me to learn much more about this topic than I could have done on my own.

I would especially like to thank my parents and the rest of my family, whose ongoing prayers and loving support were absolutely indispensable to the completion of this thesis as well as this degree.

Thanks go to my friends in the BGSU Fellowship of Christian Graduate Students, who have been such a great blessing to me over the past two years.

Finally, I would like to thank Dr. Jonathan Saylor at Wheaton College for kindling my interest in Stravinsky and for introducing me to most of the compositions that I came to explore in this thesis.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION: WHAT’S IN A NAME? MUSICAL SECTIONS ENTITLED “APOTHEOSIS” ................................................................. 1

CHAPTER 1: NINETEEN-CENTURY MUSICAL APOTHEOSES ................. 6

  “Apotheosis” in Liszt’s Symphonic Poems ............................................. 6

  “Apotheosis” in Tchaikovsky’s Ballets ....................................................... 12

CHAPTER 2: “TEMPORALITIES OF TIMELESSNESS” IN MUSIC ............ 19

CHAPTER 3: STRAVINSKY’S NEOCLASSICAL “APOTHEOSES” .............. 37

  Apollo (1928) ......................................................................................... 37

  Le baiser de la fée (1928) ....................................................................... 50

  Symphony of Psalms (1930) .................................................................. 61

  Scènes de ballet (1944) ......................................................................... 70

  Orpheus (1948) .................................................................................... 81

CONCLUSION: ENGRAFTED BRANCHES OF APOTHEOSIS .................... 89

BIBLIOGRAPHY ......................................................................................... 92
## LIST OF MUSICAL EXAMPLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Examples</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Liszt, <em>Die Ideale</em>: motive in mm. 112-117</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Tchaikovsky, <em>The Sleeping Beauty</em>: “Apothéconom,” melody from mm. 9-30</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Wagner, <em>Das Rheingold</em>: Prelude, concert-pitch reduction of mm. 25-36</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Tchaikovsky, <em>The Nutcracker</em>: “Apothéconom,” reduction of mm. 3-4</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Tchaikovsky, <em>The Nutcracker</em>: “Apothéconom,” melody in mm. 3-18</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Stravinsky, <em>Apollo</em>: “Apothéconom,” rehearsals 100-101 in full score</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Stravinsky, <em>Apollo</em>: Prologue, melody from mm. 19-24</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Stravinsky, <em>Le baiser de la fée</em>: “Lullaby in the Storm,” “Lullaby” melody in mm. 26-33</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 Stravinsky, <em>Le baiser de la fée</em>: “Lullaby in the Land of Eternity,” melody in mm. 56-79</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 Stravinsky, <em>Le baiser de la fée</em>: “Lullaby in the Land of Eternity,” reduction of last 7 measures</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6 Stravinsky, <em>Symphony of Psalms</em>: Movement III, full score of last 8 measures</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7 Stravinsky, <em>Symphony of Psalms</em>: Movement III, full score of mm. 161-168</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8 Stravinsky, <em>Scènes de ballet</em>: motive from mm. 8-10</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9 Stravinsky, <em>Scènes de ballet</em>: “Danses: Corps de Ballet,” melody in mm. 1-8</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.10 Stravinsky, <em>Scènes de ballet</em>: “Apothéconom,” concert-pitch reduction of mm. 4-5</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.11 Stravinsky, <em>Scènes de ballet</em>: “Apothéconom,” full score of mm. 18-22</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.12 Stravinsky, <em>Orpheus</em>: harp melody in mm. 1-2</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.13 Stravinsky, <em>Orpheus</em>: “Apothéconom,” mm. 5-16, horn fugue and harp melody</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTRODUCTION: WHAT’S IN A NAME? MUSICAL SECTIONS ENTITLED “APOTHEOSIS”

Why investigate the title of a movement of music? To what extent, if at all, do the words that the composer writes at the top of the score affect how a piece of music is perceived? A movement title might suggest such information about the music as its tempo (that is, the “movement” of the music),\(^1\) meter, form, instrumentation, overall character, or function, to name a few basics. When music is given a specific title, this title may create for the listener expectations as to what the music might sound like, expectations which may or may not have been intended by the composer, and which may or may not be fulfilled to the satisfaction of the listener.

Behind every movement title is a history, and in the case of many titles, these histories have been thoroughly traced and documented by music historians. One such name that has received relatively little attention in musicological discourse, however, is the curious title “Apotheosis” (French “Apothèose”). Unlike a title such as “Sarabande,” for example, which was given to thousands of compositions over the course of a few hundred years, the term “apotheosis” is a comparatively rare title for a piece or movement of music. Furthermore, because the term has appeared in a variety of seemingly unconnected musical contexts throughout history, no one set of codified musical parameters has developed to capture the spirit of the word as it has been used in Western music.

The reason why the term “apotheosis” has appeared in various musical contexts is at least partially clarified through an investigation of the definition of “apotheosis” itself. “Apotheosis” comes from the Greek apo- (“off”) and theos (“god”) and is defined, in its most literal form, as

“the action of ranking, or fact of being ranked, among the gods; transformation into a god, deification; divine status.” Explicit in this first definition is the concept of deity, and when used in this sense of the word, “apotheosis” has historically been used to refer specifically to the “deification” or “making a god out of” a human being. Although this first definition is the most literal sense of the term, its specific application to human beings makes it a conceptual subset of a “loose[r] usage” of the word, in which “apotheosis” refers more generally to “ascension to glory, departure or release from earthly life; resurrection”; in this case, the transcendence of an individual to glory does not necessarily also entail the process of deification. Finally, “apotheosis” may refer in a third sense to “the deification, glorification, or exaltation of a principle, practice, etc.; a deified ideal”—this sense of the term differs from the previous ones in that it refers more exclusively to the glorification of an idea and not a person.²

Implicit in all of these definitions is a sense of culmination, a sense that the subject of exaltation is being exalted out of a more mundane previous state of existence. When the term is used as the title of a movement or section of music, then, it is perhaps unsurprising that apotheoses often occur at the end of a composition, and thus often serve a similar function as a “finale.” Because the definition of “apotheosis” is more complex than that of “finale” (Italian for “final” or “last”), however, one might expect that a musical “apotheosis” would connote a greater deal of musical or philosophical complexity than a mere “finale.” If “finale” is a more general title for a final movement, then “apotheosis” would logically be a specific type of finale, most likely one which somehow entails the deification, exaltation, or transcendence of a human or abstract concept. Such a broad definition of “apotheosis,” however, naturally raises questions about how an “apotheosis” differs from an ordinary climax or finale. Furthermore, the concept of

² The Oxford English Dictionary, 2nd ed., s.v. “Apotheosis.” References to general historical usage have been derived from the specific instances of historical usage provided for each definition.
“apotheosis” is problematized in music by the abstract nature of the sonic medium. Unlike in the visual arts, for example, where the skyward apotheosis of an individual can be suggested directly via representational depiction, apotheosis in the musical arts would seemingly have to rely on some type of extra-musical code or understanding in order to convey that the music somehow entails the concept of apotheosis.

In light of the various definitions of “apotheosis” and the abstract nature of musical expression, the difficulties of providing an all-encompassing musical definition of this polysemous and somewhat nebulous term are readily admitted. Nonetheless, it seems a bit surprising that, in contrast to the existence of a general subject entry for “finale” in the leading English-language encyclopedia of music, a comparable general entry for the term “apotheosis” is much harder (if not impossible) to come by. The word “apotheosis” (or French “apothéose”), as will be shown, is invoked frequently in the literature of at least three different Western musical traditions from the Baroque to the present; the meaning of the term in several cases, however, has yet to be fully explored.

The purpose of the present study will not be to seek to create a unifying narrative that relates the various musical uses of the term “apotheosis” throughout Western history. Not only would such a study require the investigation of countless documents from various countries across a time span of over at least three hundred years, but it would also run the danger of

---

3 Instances of apotheosis can be found throughout the history of Western art. In the Baroque era, for example, depicting the skyward apotheosis of a monarch or aristocrat could have served as an artistic means of glorifying that individual. For two Baroque instances of apotheosis in the visual arts, see Peter Paul Rubens’s painting *The Apotheosis of Henri IV and the Proclamation of the Regency of Marie de Medici* (1621-5), or Giambattista Tiepolo’s fresco *Apotheosis of the Pisani Family* (1761-2).

4 The excellent entry for “Apothéose” (by Davitt Moroney and Julie Anne Sadie) in *Grove Music Online* focuses solely on the Baroque instrumental genre of the same name, with particular emphasis on Couperin’s apotheoses of 1724-25 (http://oxfordmusiconline.com). More generalized entries for “apotheosis” (or foreign-language translations of this term) are not obviously present in the leading French-, German-, or Italian-language encyclopedias of music.
oversimplifying the characteristics of individual instances of the term in favor of reaching sweeping and generalized conclusions. Although this study will include a survey chapter on some of the historical musical instances of the term “apotheosis” (with especial focus on Franz Liszt and Pyotr Il’yich Tchaikovsky), this general overview is included only as a means of illuminating various historical instances of musical apotheosis that would have been available to serve as models for the neoclassical “apotheoses” of Igor Stravinsky. The majority of this thesis will thus investigate how Stravinsky’s concept of apotheosis aligns with and diverges from these historical models in five neoclassical instances of apotheosis: the finales of Apollo (1928), Le baiser de la fée (1928), Symphony of Psalms (1930), Scènes de ballet (1944), and Orpheus (1948).

If one of the goals of this thesis is to understand the historical underpinnings of how Stravinsky’s concept of “apotheosis” arose and developed, this aim will play one part in a broader goal: that a historically based understanding of Stravinsky’s apotheoses might inform and enrich an appreciation of these captivating works in the twenty-first century. It is now 83 years after the premiere of the first of these works and 63 years after the premiere of the most recent, and how we hear these works today necessarily differs from how they would have been perceived in the mid-twentieth century. Although unearthing the original history of these apotheoses can help us to better appreciate them today, it would be historically simplistic and impoverishing to insist that an appreciation of this music be limited to the contexts of the works’ geneses. Audiences today have access to over half-a-century’s worth of context, research, and knowledge beyond that available to Stravinsky’s original audiences; to ignore these resources in an antiquated spirit of historical “authenticity” (which, as Richard Taruskin once suggested, is
often quite inauthentic)⁵ is to deprive ourselves of understanding how these works continue to interest listeners in the twenty-first century.

To this end, the five neoclassical apotheoses included in this thesis will not be investigated solely from a “historical” framework. Rather, analysis of these pieces will also incorporate theoretical concepts derived from an increasingly popular area in musicology: the study of how music suggests the passage of time. As will be demonstrated, a salient feature of Stravinsky’s apotheoses is the quiet restraint they exhibit; to modern ears, this subtle music may evoke a sense of “timelessness,” a perception which has led one scholar to refer to “Stravinsky’s typical timeless style of musical apotheosis.”⁶ To understand exactly how it is that this perception is created, the concept of musical timelessness will be approached through the antithetical model of what will be referred to in this thesis as a “temporality of timelessness,” a paradoxical frame of reference in which varying rates of time are knitted together to form an organic temporal Gestalt. This theory of musical timelessness will then be applied to Stravinsky’s “apotheoses” alongside the investigation of these finales from a historical framework. A brief conclusion will examine the ways in which our modern understanding of Stravinsky’s “timeless musical apotheoses” simultaneously extends and diverges from what the concept of “apotheosis” would have signified for Stravinsky.

CHAPTER 1: NINETEENTH-CENTURY MUSICAL APOTHEOSES

“Apotheosis” in Liszt’s Symphonic Poems

In considering the nineteenth-century trends of musical “apotheosis” that could have served as models of “apotheosis” for Stravinsky, one important repertoire to address is the bombastic orchestral “apotheoses” that conclude a number of the symphonic poems of Franz Liszt (1811-1886). Of Liszt’s 13 symphonic poems, 12 were composed in Weimar, where Liszt lived during the period from 1848 to 1861 while working at the court as music director. Given the fact that Liszt had spent the previous two decades as a successful virtuosic concert pianist, his decision to tie himself to a small court might seem curious.\(^1\) According to Alan Walker, Liszt’s move to this court can be explained in part by the composer’s likely attraction to Weimar as a “small yet important cultural centre that could boast a century’s unbroken association with the arts.”\(^2\) Along with such figures as Goethe, Weimar had been home to Friedrich Schiller (1759-1805), an artist whose poetry would eventually serve as the basis for the concluding “Apothéose” of Liszt’s symphonic poem Die Ideale (1857).

The philosophical underpinnings of the “Apothéose” in Die Ideale may be better understood following a brief overview of Schiller’s philosophy. The importance of Schiller’s ideas were explained by the philosopher Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel (1770-1831), who viewed Schiller as having successfully surpassed the element of pessimism present in the philosophical dualism of Immanuel Kant (1724-1804). Hegel described this element of Kant’s philosophy as follows in his 1817 Encyclopedia of the Philosophical Sciences: “Objectivity of thought, in Kant’s sense, is again to a certain sense subjective. Thoughts, according to Kant, although universal and necessary categories, are only our thoughts—separated by an impassable

---


\(^2\) Ibid.
According to Hegel’s understanding of Kant, the nature of human knowledge was limited by the inherent gap that exists between das Ding an sich (“the thing in itself”) and the derivative manifestation of das Ding an sich in the realm of human thought or perception. In contrast to Kant, however, Hegel believed that das Ding an sich was not philosophically isolated from the human understanding of it: “But the true objectivity of thinking means that the thoughts, far from being merely ours, must at the same time be the real essence of the things, and of whatever is an object to us.”

Hegel ultimately credits Schiller for having traversed this Kantian gulf. As Hegel had stated in his Lectures on Aesthetics, “Schiller must be paid the great tribute . . . of having broken through Kantian subjectivity . . . and of having dared to move beyond it, grasping unity and reconciliation” as the properties characterizing the nature of human understanding. Thus, if Kant was resigned to the existence of a gap between “reality” and human thinking, then Schiller was more optimistic regarding the ability to bridge this gap.

Despite this philosophical optimism, Schiller was by no means ignorant when it came to the reality of the flawed human condition. Schiller’s awareness of this condition is revealed through his view on aesthetics and art, the autonomous purity of which he believed could help to ameliorate the condition of the real world. Dahlstrom captures the essence of Schiller’s “aesthetic holism” in his exploration of Schiller’s views on the role of art in society and history; for Schiller, “the aesthetic realm is an independent world of semblances (‘ornamentation and play’) which, precisely by displaying the ideal harmony of the whole in contrast to the

---

4 Ibid.
divisiveness of the real world, holds the key to the transformation of the latter.”6 Schiller, fully aware of the problems in society, thus believed that these problems could be addressed through a utopian striving for unity with the untainted sphere of civilizing art.7

Along with many other intellectuals in the nineteenth century, Liszt was an artist with whom Schiller’s utopian aesthetic holism found an audience. Schiller’s philosophy is arguably felt most strongly in Liszt’s symphonic poem Die Ideale; not only was the work’s program derived from Schiller’s poetry, but the work was also composed for a celebration in which Schiller was to be venerated.8 As Vera Micznik notes, Liszt had been planning on composing a symphonic work based on Schiller’s 1796 poem “Die Ideale” at least as early as 11 October 1856, with the intention that the work should be performed at the unveiling of a statue of Schiller the following year.9

Interestingly, the poetic content of “Die Ideale” is not as idealistic or utopian as Schiller’s title might suggest. Instead, the atmosphere of the poem continually slides from optimistic hope down into pessimistic disillusion, and it concludes with a neutral compromise between these two extremes.10 Despite the ambivalent nature of the poem’s ending, however, Liszt saw to it that the program for his symphonic poem contained the idealistic conclusion that Schiller’s poem lacked. Liszt forged his program by taking various fragments of Schiller’s poem and rearranging them into three groupings which he inserted into the score: Aufschwung (commonly translated as

6 Ibid., 88.
7 Schiller’s philosophy regarding striving for “unity and reconciliation” through art is evidenced perhaps most notably in his 1785 poem “An die Freude,” the utopian contents of which were immortalized through Beethoven’s setting of the text in the choral finale of his Ninth Symphony (1824).
8 Although the primary purpose of the festival was to celebrate the hundredth anniversary on 3 September 1857 of the birth of Carl August (who had been the Grand Duke of Saxe, Weimar, and Eisenach), the celebration also entailed the unveiling of statues of Schiller, Goethe, and Wieland. See Vera Micznik, “The Absolute Limitations of Programme Music: The Case of Liszt’s ‘Die Ideale,’” Music & Letters 80, no. 2 (1999): 221.
9 Ibid., 222.
10 Ibid., 223.
“aspirations”), Enttäuschung (“disillusion”), and Beschäftigung (“activity”). The program for the final section of the work, however, was written by Liszt himself and given the title “Apothéose”: “Our life’s highest goal is the firm adhesion to, and thus the ceaseless reaffirmation of, the ideal. It was in this sense that I took the liberty to supplement Schiller’s poem by adding the jubilant confirmatory resumption of the motif heard earlier in the first part as a closing apotheosis.” The utopian nature of Liszt’s text thus provides an ending in the spirit of what Hegel had described as Schiller’s newfound “unity and reconciliation.”

In order to create a musical version of this philosophy of unity and reconciliation, Liszt used several techniques in the “Apothéose” that have come to be known in contemporary musicological and theoretical discourse simply as “apotheosis.” The technique of “apotheosis” was first suggested by theorist Edward T. Cone in 1968, who defined it as “a special kind of recapitulation that reveals unexpected harmonic richness and textural excitement in a theme previously presented with a deliberately restricted harmonization and a relatively drab accompaniment.” From a technical point of view, Cone’s concept of apotheosis can be applied to Die Ideale because the “Apothéose” does witness the return of an earlier theme presented with a more active accompaniment, a fact which was also indicated by Liszt (see Example 1.1).

---

11 Ibid.
12 It is not immediately clear why Liszt chose the title of “Apothéose” for this final section of Die Ideale. It is possible that the title could be connected to Berlioz’s use of the term “Apothéose” as the final march for his Grande symphonie funèbre et triomphale (1840), although further research is necessary to either confirm or disprove this possibility. For a brief account of this work, see Richard Taruskin, The Oxford History of Western Music, 5 vols. (New York: Oxford University Press, 2010), 3.319.
14 Edward T. Cone, Musical Form and Musical Performance (New York: W.W. Norton, 1968), 84. Although Cone primarily identified “apotheosis” with the music of Chopin, he nonetheless saw apotheosis in Chopin as a musical forerunner to the process of thematic transformation in the music of Liszt and Wagner.
15 This motive first appears over a tonic triad sustained in whole notes. When the motive returns in the “Apothéose,” the texture is made more rhythmically active by the additional presence of arpeggiated sixteenth-note triplets in the violins.
If Cone’s definition of apotheosis focused on the technical processes of thematic transformation, a definition provided by Leonard B. Meyer in 1989 came closer to capturing the overall jubilant effect of Liszt’s “apotheoses.” For Meyer, an apotheosis entailed a “powerful statement of majestic affirmation”:

Such climaxes constitute a new source of unity. For by literally overwhelming the listener, their force and magnitude make prior unrealized implications, diversity of materials, contrasts of expression, and even gaucheries of technique irrelevant. Unity is established, so to speak, by the transcendence of the sublime—a kind of statistical, rather than syntactic, subsumption.16

For Meyer, this technique of “overwhelming” unification is not necessarily synonymous with what he calls “motivic unity” (although the two types may very well coincide, as in Die Ideale); the power of Meyer’s apotheosis would be enough to create a unity apart from motivic unity. As Alexander Rehding has noted, this type of apotheosis “is not a subtle rhetorical device; it persuades the listener by sheer force” and “does not permit objections.”17

Why is it that Liszt felt compelled to create this type of musical/philosophical unity at the end of Die Ideale? According to Micznik, “apotheosis” for Liszt was primarily a musically stylistic device rather than a programmatic device. As Micznik notes, “although Liszt tries to offer programmatic justification [for his apotheoses], it is obvious that he favours ending pieces with a bombastic display of a last thematic transformation in a full texture . . . It is, then, for the musical logic that Liszt modifies the programme, and not the other way round.”18 Although the

---

ambiguous ending of Schiller’s poem might have invited a comparable introspective musical ending in *Die Ideale*, Liszt rejects such an ending in favor of a more glorious conclusion, the overwhelming force of which serves as its own authoritative justification.

The bombastic finale of *Die Ideale* is a typical example of a trend in Liszt’s music that Reeves Shulstad refers to as the “stirringly clangorous orchestral apotheos[i]s.” Although this type of triumphant finale represents one nineteenth-century concept of “apotheosis,” it is unlikely that Stravinsky would have looked to such a finale as a model for his own music. In reflecting on the orchestral music of Liszt, an aging Stravinsky did not attempt to disguise his distaste for the composer’s style:

> The tone-poems [of Liszt] survive only by constantly renewed neglect, and the *Dante* Symphony is absolute Hell . . . The most astute critic and truest prophet of Liszt’s purely orchestral music is that unhonoured genius of the radio era who branded *The Lone Ranger* with *Les Préludes* (and vice versa). *Les Préludes*, by the way is the only one of the poems, together with the brief and quiet *Orpheus*, that I can get all the way through. It is also the only one in which galumphing rhythms, nagging sequences, turgid developments, lifeless pauses, and bombastic triumphs fuse into a winning piece.

Although Stravinsky managed to express a degree of tolerance for *Les Préludes* (a work with an ending comparable to that of *Die Ideale*), this tolerance would seem to have arisen in spite of the bombastic triumph of its “apotheosis,” and not because of it. Thus, Liszt’s bombastic “apotheoses” would appear to have been an unlikely source of inspiration for Stravinsky.

---


“Apotheosis” in Tchaikovsky’s Ballets

If Stravinsky would have been largely unimpressed by the “bombastic triumphs” of Liszt’s orchestral apotheoses, a more probable source of inspiration for Stravinsky’s concept of “apotheosis” is found in the realm of the nineteenth-century ballet. Richard Taruskin briefly refers to this balletic concept of “apotheosis” in conjunction with his description of the ballet à grand spectacle, which he defines as “a ballet that mixed a strong plot line with a wealth of exotic divertissement and ‘apotheoses,’ spectacular climaxes that summoned a huge and brilliantly costumed corps de ballet onstage.”

Taruskin’s parenthetical definition is reflective of the typical contextual usage of “apotheosis” in ballet literature, in which the term is usually invoked in conjunction with a particularly climactic scene in a ballet (often the finale). Despite the fact that “apotheosis” has apparently become a standard vocabulary word in ballet literature, little (if any) research seems to exist that offers a deeper explanation of specifically what a balletic apotheosis entailed, or how it was that this term came to be associated with such a climax. Furthermore, because literature on ballet that is written primarily from a dance or choreographic perspective may not place a great deal of emphasis on musical analysis, references to “apotheosis” in such literature generally focus more on the choreography or scenery in a balletic finale instead of on the score. Yet, the general absence of any specifically musical accounts of balletic apotheosis is in itself informative: because the music of a balletic apotheosis is generally not given any special treatment simply because it is the music for an apotheosis, it would seem that the concept of the balletic apotheosis was historically more a function of the

21 Taruskin, The Oxford History of Western Music, 4.144.
22 After having consulting the major English-, French-, German-, and Italian-language music encyclopedias, as well as numerous ballet-specific dictionaries and encyclopedias, I have yet to come across a methodical definition or history of the term “apotheosis/apothéose” insofar as it relates to ballet.
choreography, scenery, or scenario of a finale, and that the “apotheosis” was not originally a function of the music.

The assumption that the balletic apotheosis was not directly a function of music would seem to be supported by the hegemony that dance had historically exerted over music in the realm of nineteenth-century ballet. This hegemony was suggested by Tchaikovsky later on in his life; reflecting on his experiences in composing ballet music, Tchaikovsky had been initially unaware of the fact that “the balletmaster fixes the number of bars in each pas, or that the rhythm, the tempo and everything is strictly assigned in advance.”

Because the music in a nineteenth-century ballet was unequivocally subservient to the demands of the dance, it is highly unlikely that the servant of dance—music—would have developed any specialized vocabulary of its own in the realm of ballet. Rather, it would seem that the concept of the balletic “apotheosis”—however it came to be known as such—would have initially been solely a function of the revered art of dance. In the rare occasions that the term “apotheosis” did become attached to the music of a balletic finale, it would appear that this association could only have arisen because of the music’s incidental connection to a choreographic apotheosis, and not through any inherent features of the music itself.

Historically, any such lasting connections between the term “apotheosis” and the music that accompanied a choreographic apotheosis appear to have arisen infrequently and seemingly incidentally. The two most notable incidents of such connections are found in Tchaikovsky’s ballets *The Sleeping Beauty* (1889) and *The Nutcracker* (1892), the finales of which are explicitly labeled “Apothése” in the score. As suggested, it seems probable that Tchaikovsky’s choice of title for the final numbers of both ballets simply reflected the fact that this music was intended to be played during the final choreographic apotheosis. Stated differently, it would

---

seem that the term “Apothéose” would not have denoted any intrinsic or specialized musical characteristics for Tchaikovsky (as did the term “Sarabande,” for example, the title for the slow, triple-metered music of the antepenultimate number in *The Sleeping Beauty*), but perhaps only mirrored the technical name of the choreographic action that the music was to accompany.\(^{24}\) Given the relative paucity of information available on the concept of the nineteenth-century balletic apotheosis, however, the present study will not attempt to delve further into what the term “Apothéose” may or may not have meant for Tchaikovsky. Rather, the focus at present will be to investigate how the balletic apotheosis as a whole in *The Sleeping Beauty* might have been perceived by Stravinsky in the 1920s, some thirty years after the ballet’s premiere.

One of the most salient features of the balletic apotheosis of *The Sleeping Beauty* was the evocation of the French court at Versailles. This aspect of the apotheosis seems to have been planned by ballet director Ivan Vsevolozhsky from the ballet’s conception; as Vsevolozhsky had written to Tchaikovsky in May 1888 with the proposition for the new ballet,

> I thought I would write a libretto to Perrault’s *La Belle au bois dormant*. I want to do the mise en scène in Louis XIV style. Here one could bring musical fantasy into play and compose melodies in the spirit of Lully, Bach, Rameau, etc., etc. There absolutely must be a quadrille of all Perrault’s tales in the last act. It should have Puss in Boots, Tom Thumb, Cinderella, Bluebeard, and others.\(^{25}\)

In the final scenario, Versailles would become the setting for the entire third act of *The Sleeping Beauty*; according to Jennifer Homans, the scenario of *The Sleeping Beauty* begins

\(^{24}\) This idea is supported by the lack of any immediate musical similarities between these two apotheoses. The finales of *The Sleeping Beauty* and *The Nutcracker* differ in mode (minor and major, respectively), meter (duple and triple), overall character (majestic and fanciful), and whether or not the “Apothéose” concludes with previously introduced melodic material (earlier material is only found in the “Apothéose” of *The Nutcracker*). The only immediate musical similarities are the presence in both finales of concluding repeated *fortissimo* chords, a common nineteenth-century closing gesture which merely marks the apotheoses as a type of finale.

in the sixteenth century with the birth of a princess who is cursed by an evil fairy and
condemned to death upon her coming of age. The good (Lilac) fairy, however, softens the
sentence and when the princess pricks her finger on a spindle the entire French court falls
into a deep sleep, only to be awakened one hundred years later to the glorious reign of the
Sun King.26

This final setting in Versailles was evoked most directly through the scenery of the final act;
according to the reviewer D.D. Korovyakov, “the last act takes place on an esplanade, the décor
behind it recreates a completely accurate large Versailles palace, with terraces, a fountain, a
carousel, grand pieces d’eau and other luxurious effects of King Louis.”27 In this scenery, Louis
XIV was presented in the guise of Apollo, a depiction inspired by the fact that Louis XIV had
danced the role of Apollo in 1653 in Le Ballet de la nuit.28 As Wiley notes, Petipa’s sketches for
the scenery of the finale included the depiction of “‘Apollo, as the Sun King Louis XIV. Fairies
with long trains, as drawn on the ceilings of Versailles.’ ‘When [Apollo] personifies the sun, he
has a cock on his shoulder and is crowned with rays of sunlight. Four white horses draw his
chariot on which the signs of the zodiac are represented.’”29 If this scenery had been present
through the entire third act, however, a special reference to Versailles comes specifically in
Tchaikovsky’s music for the apotheosis scene. For the “Apothéose,” Tchaikovsky created a
homophonic setting of the old French folksong “Vive Henri Quatre” (see Example 1.2),30 the
lyrics of which glorified King Henri IV of France (r. 1589-1610). Although the minor mode of
this dance-like melody may suggest a sense of melancholy, the sixteenth-note-triplet fanfares in

27 Quoted in Scholl, From Petipa to Balanchine, 28.
28 Ibid., 27. Because Apollo seems to have been historically connected with Parnassus and the concept of
“apotheosis,” it is conceivable that Louis XIV’s association with Apollo through Le Ballet de la nuit
might somehow be connected to the birth of the balletic concept of “apotheosis.” Further research is
necessary to either confirm or disprove this point of speculation.
30 See ibid., 150. It is not entirely clear whose idea it was to incorporate “Vive Henri IV” in the
“Apothéose.” As Wiley notes, the idea may have been suggested by Vsevolozhsky, but it is also possible
that its usage was Tchaikovsky’s idea, especially since the melody was included in a French songbook
that the composer owned (292 n.18).
the brass suggest the majesty of the French court as signified through the melody and depicted onstage.  

![Example 1.2. The Sleeping Beauty: “Apothéose,” melody from mm. 9-30 (excerpted from Tschaikovsky Foundation, 1950)]

Although Versailles has clearly been uprooted from history and transplanted into realm of fantasy in *The Sleeping Beauty*, the choice of setting for the final act of the ballet is significant nonetheless. As Francis Maes suggests, *The Sleeping Beauty* “reflected his [Vsevolozhsky’s] artistic vision in the glorification of seventeenth-century French court culture, the Versailles of Louis XIV, the heyday of absolute monarchy. It was an expression of Vsevolozhsky’s aestheticism and at the same time tailored to the taste of the Russian court and the higher ranks of the aristocracy.” Versailles as an icon of the aristocracy was not merely an idiosyncratic expression of francophilia on the part of Vsevolozhsky. At a broader level, Tim Scholl reflects that “the ballet of the French court of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries came to represent a golden age of ballet in late nineteenth-century Russia, and provided a source of imitation, inspiration and innovation for those associated with the imperial ballet and the Ballets Russes for nearly four decades.” This point certainly rings true for Stravinsky, the composer whose association with the Ballets Russes would eventually bring him international fame.

In fact, the image of Versailles in *The Sleeping Beauty* seems to have been at least one of the features that would eventually attract Stravinsky to Tchaikovsky’s work. In 1921, Stravinsky

---

31 Incidentally, because the melody of “Vive Henri IV” makes it first appearance in the “Apothéose,” this finale is not an example of Cone’s theoretical concept of “apotheosis,” which entails the final decoration of an earlier theme.


33 Scholl, *From Petipa to Balanchine*, 27.
would play an important role in Sergei Diaghilev’s revival of *The Sleeping Beauty* in London; Tchaikovsky had made several cuts in the orchestral score after the ballet’s premiere in 1889, and Stravinsky was to reorchestrate these passages from the piano score.\(^3^4\) While working on the reorchestration, Stravinsky wrote to Diaghilev and expressed his great admiration for Tchaikovsky’s music in general and *The Sleeping Beauty* in particular:

> It gives me great happiness to know that you are producing that masterpiece *The Sleeping Beauty* by our great and beloved Tchaikovsky. It makes me doubly happy. In the first place, it is a personal joy, for this work appears to me as the most authentic expression of that period in our Russian life which we call the “Petersburg Period” […]

> And how characteristic were his predilections in the music of the past and of his own day! He worshipped Mozart, Couperin, Glinka, Bizet: that leaves us [in no] doubt of the quality of his taste […]

> The convincing example of Chaikovsky’s great creative power is beyond all doubt the ballet of *The Sleeping Beauty*. This cultured man, with his knowledge of folksong and of old French music, had no need to engage in archaeological research in order to present the age of Louis XIV; he recreated the character of the period by his musical language, preferring involuntary but living anachronisms to conscious and laboured pasticcio: a virtue that appertains only to great creative minds.\(^3^5\)

Although Stravinsky does not mention any specific scenes in *The Sleeping Beauty*, he would likely have been particularly intrigued by the ballet’s apotheosis and its fantastic evocation of the court of Versailles. As Charles M. Joseph suggests, “Stravinsky valued civility and protocol. He would have immediately identified with the dignity and clearly defined hierarchy of Versailles.”\(^3^6\) Significantly, this attraction to the court at Versailles would be exhibited in full

---


\(^3^5\) Open letter to Serge Diaghilev reprinted from *The Times* of 18 October 1921, quoted in Eric Walter White, *Stravinsky: The Composer and his Works*, 2\(^{nd}\) ed. (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1979), 573-574. In this same letter, Stravinsky praises Tchaikovsky’s use of melody by contrasting it with the mechanic melodies of “the Germans,” who “manufactured and manufactured music with themes and Leitmotive which they substituted for melodies” (573). Because such thematic development had played an important part in the apotheoses of Liszt’s orchestral music, Stravinsky’s letter reinforces the unlikelihood of the possibility that Stravinsky’s concept of “apotheosis” was based on that of Liszt’s.

force in Stravinsky’s ballet *Apollo* (1928), the first work for which Stravinsky would use the title “Apothéose” for the finale.

By this point, a historical framework has been established that connects Stravinsky at least loosely to the “Apothéose” of *The Sleeping Beauty*. An investigation of Stravinsky’s apotheoses will be postponed momentarily, however, in favor of examining several theories of musical time and timelessness that will help to inform a twenty-first-century understanding of these apotheoses.
CHAPTER 2: “TEMPORALITIES OF TIMELESSNESS” IN MUSIC

What, then, is time? If no one asks me, I know; but, if I want to explain it to a questioner, I do not know.¹ — St. Augustine

With the Lord a day is like a thousand years, and a thousand years are like a day.
— Second Epistle of Peter, 3:8

Now some 1,600 years after the time of St. Augustine, the passage of time continues to occupy the minds of philosophers, theologians, and laymen alike. This fact is attested to in the sphere of musicology by an ever-growing body of literature on music and time. Over the past several decades, musicologists, ethnomusicologists, and theorists have demonstrated an increasing interest in the various ways in which time is manifested in music, a trend which has produced a rich and diverse body of research on the subject. One important avenue has been the investigation of how a culture’s fundamental beliefs about time are reflected in its music, and how music can be used actively or passively to challenge those paradigms or to re-engage them anew.² Another significant approach is rooted in music cognition and seeks to understand how the various temporal features of musical logic and syntax (tempo, meter, or “real time” formal proportional durations, for instance) are perceived and processed by the brain.³ Both these approaches and others have yielded an increased understanding of the complex ways in which music and time interrelate.

² A fundamental example of this type of research is Judith Becker’s “Time and Tune in Java”; Becker suggests a correlation between Javanese calendar cycles and cyclic formal structures in Javanese gamelan (see The Imagination of Reality: Essays in Southeast Asian Coherence Systems, ed. A.L. Becker and Aram A. Yengoyan [Norwood, NJ: Ablex, 1979], 197-210). A notable example in recent historical musicological research is Karol Berger’s Bach’s Cycle, Mozart’s Arrow: An Essay on the Origins of Musical Modernity; Berger explores how different attitudes towards time in the Baroque and Classical eras were reflected in the formal structures of the music of these periods (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007).
Another particularly fruitful avenue for approaching the manifestation of time in music is suggested by semiotician Raymond Monelle. As Monelle notes, “language and music are temporal signs, of course, but the time within which they are structured is not necessarily connected to the time they mean.”

For Monelle, a theoretical analysis that solely focuses on “the time within which music is structured” (that is, the mechanics of its syntactical rhythmic features) may encourage us to “forget that music can also signify time. There is a temporality of the signified, as well as a temporality of the signifier.”

Although the syntactic temporal dimensions of a piece of music are unquestionably worthy of study in and of themselves, these same time-bound phenomena can also come to signify a concept of time which is not directly tied to the musical syntax itself.

Of the various temporalities that might be signified by music, the possibility of a particularly interesting one is raised by Monelle’s suggestion that “music, then, can subsist in time without taking time; the temporal signified may be a seamless present, even though the musical expression is full of events.”

Although Monelle does not dwell on this point, one wonders what it might mean for music to “not take time”? Is it possible for the “temporality of the signified” or the “time [music] mean[s]” to be a temporality in which time stands still? Phrased differently, can music evoke what will be referred to in this thesis as a “temporality of timelessness,” a seemingly oxymoronic term for a referential frame in which the passage of time is juxtaposed with the cessation of time?

Before considering how timelessness might be signified in music, it is first necessary to consider the complex nature of this “timelessness” or “eternity” that is being signified. For the

---

5 Ibid.
6 Ibid., 88.
sake of argument, “eternity” might be assumed to mean a frame of reference that is not limited by the parameters of time, one which is simultaneously “timeless” and one in which time is limitless. The problems inherent in this description as a working definition of eternity are clear, however, when one realizes that this definition relies on seemingly contradictory conceptions of another idea—time—which is highly complex in and of itself. As Thomas Reiner notes in his study of musical time, given that “it is impossible to give a once-and-for-all definition of time, one is confronted with the fact that the signified, or more precisely the set of signifieds, of the term time is to some extent open.”\(^7\) If the term “time” can signify numerous complex and overlapping concepts depending on its usage, it is unsurprising that a concept which invokes the concept of infinite time would be even less well-understood. Needless to say, the purpose at present is not to attempt to fashion a metaphysical theory of a concept that has been the subject of philosophical debated for millennia. Rather, the current purpose will be to explore how a select few ideas on “timelessness” in music can inform an understanding of the same concept in several of Igor Stravinsky’s neoclassical “apotheoses.”\(^8\)

If it is difficult (if not impossible) to completely fathom an actual frame of reference characterized by “timelessness,” it is a bit more manageable to approach the concept as depicted and interpreted by composers and musicologists. A perceptive passage by theologian Jeremy S. Begbie illuminates the concept of timelessness as it generally appears in musicological discourse:

---


\(^8\) One such concept of temporal stasis in music was proposed by theorist Jonathan D. Kramer, who used the phrase “vertical time” to refer to music in which “a single present [is] stretched out into an enormous duration, a potentially infinite ‘now’ that nonetheless feels like an instant” (55). Kramer used this term to describe “compositions . . . that are temporally undifferentiated in their entirety. They lack phrases (just as they lack progression, goal direction, movement, and contrasting rates of motion).” (55). Because “vertical time” was primarily descriptive of the extreme repetition of minimalism, it will not be used as a primary theory to approach the more traditional music of Stravinsky. See Kramer’s *The Time of Music: New Meanings, New Temporalities, New Listening Strategies* (New York: Schirmer Books, 1988).
The word “stasis” is often used rather loosely to describe music of extreme stillness or repose. And the word “timelessness” is often yoked to it, along with “eternity.” But it is important to be a little more precise. Total stasis, is, of course, impossible to achieve, whether in music or anywhere else . . . Talk of stasis can only be shorthand for various degrees of approximation to the cessation of change and motion—in the music and/or in our perception of it.9

Begbie correctly asserts that complete stasis or timelessness is impossible in music, but this impossibility does not stop critics or musicologists from using these terms to describe certain passages of music. When a piece of music is described as being “timeless,” “eternal,” or “static,” these adjectives are necessarily used metaphorically; their usage merely suggests that some element of the music evokes thoughts, feelings, or mental images that may serve for the listener as interpretants of the unfathomable concept of eternity.

One particularly vivid image that attempts to approximate the nature of eternity is provided by Daniel Albright, who speculates about the problem of narrative in the temporal vacuum of heaven:

Like many visions of heaven, my vision represented a struggle to imagine the ways in which eternity alters the human perceptual field. What kind of event can take place in a condition of total achronicity? What kind of spatial placement can exist in a condition of total ubiquity? . . . [T]he notion of nunc stans, or Standing Now, the eternal present of scholastic philosophy, tends to derange and vitiate all the normal means of narrative and drama.10

Albright’s conceptual solution to the conundrum of achronic narrative in eternity is unique in that it does not solely focus on the shop-worn idea of eternity as being “static” or “timeless,” but rather synthesizes the ideas of complete stasis and complete motion into a Gestalt whole:

A heavenly mind, an intellect that comprehends past, present, and future all at once, will understand the figure of my life as a simultaneous growth and decay, a blooming withering, in which I am at once baby, corpse, and everything in between, with a thousand versions of my limbs sprouting from my trunk, in every conceivable position that their range of motion allows. Imagine the fast-motion photography of the Reggio-

Glass film *Koyaanisqatsi* (1982), in which automobiles leave whizz-traces of their passage through the air, speeded up still further, until all motion attenuates into a ghostly stasis, sips, curlicues of pedestrians and vehicles washed over the buildings of a city, buildings themselves translucent from their not-yet-having-been, from their being-no-more: that would be a heaven’s-eye view of earth.

Heaven, then, is the limit point of the convergence of the temporal and the spatial . . . Heaven is attained, in art, by an absolute refusal to distinguish *nacheinander* [one after the other] from *nebeneinander* [next to each other]: where the juxtapositive and the sequential are one, there we have an intuition of a life disencumbered from the usual fictions of space and time.\(^\text{11}\)

Albright’s description of *Koyaanisqatsi* is particularly enlightening because it suggests that “timelessness” or “stasis” need not result from the absence of time or motion, but that they can also result from an extremely dense condensation of time and motion. It is not that time stands still in films such as *Koyaanisqatsi*; rather, such a high degree of “time saturation” is achieved that the human brain is not cognitively capable of processing individual events as individual events, and instead can only process these temporally compacted events as a single static blur.

Although Albright applies his ideas to Gertrude Stein’s nonsensical libretto for Virgil Thomson’s 1929 opera *Four Saints in Three Acts*, elements of Albright’s ideas can also be applied to more “traditional” pieces of music and the theories used to describe them, theories which will be developed and applied later in this thesis. One such theoretical paradigm for approaching the concept of timelessness in music is provided by Edward A. Lippman in his investigation of progressive temporality in music. Lippman suggests that

The feeling that music is progressing or moving forward in time is doubtless one of the most fundamental characteristics of musical experience; yet it manifests such a remarkable range of variation in its prominence and its quality that at times it seems to be absent altogether. [In some works] we may find a series or succession of audible events, to be sure, but often very little feeling of temporal progress or flow.\(^\text{12}\)

---

\(^\text{11}\) Ibid.

One type of motion that Lippman identifies is that which he labels “sheer continuity” or “succession in itself,” which is “composed of continuity plus some degree of inertia or insistence.” In Lippman’s “sheer continuity,” the music must necessarily continue forward in time, for time, the medium through which music exists, cannot stand still. However, the lack of syntactic logic in the music (a lack of thematic development or driving harmonic progression, for instance) conveys a sense of temporal stasis, even as the music continues forward in “real time.” In this sense, “sheer continuity” entails a juxtaposition of perceived stasis and forward flow, making it a more traditional musical manifestation of Albright’s vision of heaven.

Admittedly, the concept of juxtaposed stasis and flow is sufficiently vague to elicit a variety of interpretations in music. In his assessment of timelessness in the music of John Tavener, for instance, Begbie suggests that a “sense of changelessness and motionlessness is sometimes heightened indirectly through juxtaposing such music alongside strongly contrasting sections.” Begbie’s statement implies a diachronic juxtaposition of musical stasis and flow, one in which the “motionlessness” of a section of music is enhanced by either directly preceding or being followed by a more active section. By contrast, musical stasis and flow might also be juxtaposed in a synchronic manner, one in which a single passage of music simultaneously exhibits signs of musical motion and inertia. It is this synchronic juxtaposition of varying rates of musical motion that will be demonstrated to be a feature of “sheer continuity,” and will ultimately be adapted for application to the repertory of Stravinsky’s neoclassical apotheoses.

---

13 Ibid.
14 The term “heaven” is not used in a religious sense in Albright’s writing; rather, it is used as a general term for a paradoxical frame of reference in which the absence of time is juxtaposed with the passage of time.
15 Begbie, *Theology, Music and Time*, 139.
One piece of music that Lippman uses to exemplify "sheer continuity" is the Prelude to Wagner’s Rheingold. Lippman briefly addresses the temporal progress in the piece by suggesting that

The Prelude of Das Rheingold adds at most an increasing motion to continuity, but at first no feeling of intention or increasing intensity; what we have primarily is a fusion of passage and constancy [emphasis added]—a compound that seems simply to reveal in tone the fundamental quality of consciousness.16

The continuity in the Prelude is achieved through the sustaining of an E-flat major triad for almost five minutes through the process of polyphonic textural stratification. First, a perfect-fifth drone (E-flat and B-flat) is introduced in the basses and bassoon; and next enters a single horn with an ascending arpeggiated “Naturmotif” (a theme using only the notes in the overtone series) in E-flat major. This horn melody is then taken up in turn by all eight horns, whose overlapping entrances in stretto produce an E-flat major chord characterized by the fusion of tonal stasis and individual melodic motion (see Example 2.1). The sense of textural stratification in the horns is

Example 2.1. Das Rheingold: Prelude, concert-pitch reduction of mm. 25-36 (excerpted from Eulenburg, 2002)

enhanced by an increasing rhythmic/durational stratification as the Prelude continues. At the most complex point in the Prelude, the music entails various E-flat-centric scales and arpeggios in 16th notes in the strings and low winds, fragments of arpeggios in primarily dotted-quarter notes in the woodwinds, the 8-part polyphony in the horns proceeding in dotted-half notes, all moving over the unchanging perfect-fifth drone in the basses and low brass. Thus, while the tonal center of the Prelude never wanders from E flat, the static harmony is complemented by the incessant motion of the various instruments at various speeds.17

Although Lippman’s brief account of the “sheer continuity” in the Prelude is limited to the music, the “continuity” of the Prelude is enhanced with an understanding of how the temporal progress of the music simultaneously informs and is informed by the drama onstage. The curtain of Das Rheingold opens to reveal the bottom of the Rhine river, a location which is crucial in establishing the Prelude’s temporal setting of the beginning of the world. Just as water is the fountainhead of biological life (or of “fundamental quality of consciousness,” as Lippman suggests), so does the greenish twilight of the jagged, craggy riverbed suggest the primordial temporal setting of the Prelude. The Rhinemaidens have not entered the stage, and the Rhinegold has not yet been stolen by Alberich, whose theft and curse on love sets in motion the complex plot of the Ring. The time frame of the Prelude is thus the part of eternity that comes before the beginning of time-bound history.

Beyond the indirect association of water with the beginnings of biological life, the setting in the river suggests the timelessness of the scene in a more direct way. The concept of a moving river represents a unique juxtaposition of flow and stasis; when viewed as a literary image, a river may evoke a “sense of unceasing or relentless movement, or of timelessness and

17 This point is corroborated by Reiner, who suggests that in the Prelude to Das Rheingold “the lack of harmonic contrast is well compensated for” with timbral, dynamic, and rhythmic interest. See Reiner, Semiotics of Musical Time, 133.
permanence.”\textsuperscript{18} Although the water in a river ever flows with the current from its source towards the sea, the geographical location and contours of the river remain essentially static over time. A similar juxtaposition is present in the music that Wagner writes for the Rhine in the Prelude; although the various strata of the music are in constant motion, the tonal center of E flat remains constant for the duration of the Prelude. Thus, insofar as the music of the Prelude can be understood to be a musical depiction of the river, also encoded in the music is the same sense of simultaneous temporal stasis and flow that the image of a river suggests.

One more musical example will suggest how the simultaneous flow and stasis of “sheer continuity” might be adapted to describe a repertoire more historically relevant to Stravinsky’s neoclassical apotheoses: the “Apothéose” (the final scene of Act II) of Tchaikovsky’s ballet \textit{The Nutcracker} (1892). Similar to the Prelude of \textit{Das Rheingold}, the “Apothéose” of \textit{The Nutcracker} is characterized by a relatively high degree of harmonic stasis. The harmony is dominated by the tonic chord (B flat) with an added sixth scale degree, a harmony which is only occasionally interrupted by brief appearances of the dominant (see harmonic analysis in Example 2.3). Also similar to \textit{Das Rheingold}, Tchaikovsky’s “Apothéose” features a degree of textural and rhythmic stratification (see Example 2.2). A sense of constancy is provided by the violins and violas, whose tremolos continue uninterrupted until the last few bars of the scene. In another stratum, the arpeggiated ostinati in contrary motion in the harp and celeste repeat every beat, although the shimmering effect of the rapid sixteenth notes is one of near stasis. A sense of slower motion is provided by a layer comprised of the cello, bass, and bassoon, whose rising and falling ostinato repeats only once every six beats. In all three of these layers, the only changes that are made are

\textsuperscript{18} The Oxford English Dictionary, 3\textsuperscript{rd} ed., online version, s.v. “River.”
Example 2.2. The Nutcracker: “Apothéose,” reduction of mm. 3-4 (excerpted from Dover, 2004)

slight shifts in voice-leading to accommodate the occasional appearance of the dominant harmony.

A fourth layer of the texture is the melody in the upper woodwinds (see Example 2.3). Although the durations of the pitches in the melody are similar to those in the bass ostinato, a sense of completion in the melody only occurs every 16 measures, when the melody completes a “cycle” through the implication of a perfect authentic cadence (by ending directly on the tonic). These cadences are given a sense of localized finality by the occurrence of an imperfect authentic cadence halfway through each cycle (with the melody coming to rest on the third scale degree, or by arriving at the tonic only by means of the third scale degree). Three complete cycles of the melody occur before the music reaches its true end, 23 bars of a fortissimo tonic B-flat triad.

Example 2.3. The Nutcracker: “Apothéose,” melody in mm. 3-18 (excerpted from Dover, 2004)
Although the unified whole created by various cyclical textural strata in the “Apothéose” gives the music a certain element of stasis and flow, it must be admitted that Tchaikovsky’s “Apothéose” does not convey “timelessness” in the same way as does the “sheer continuity” of Das Rheingold. The balanced parallel period structure of Tchaikovsky’s melody, for example, gives the “Apothéose” a “logicality or necessity in the sequence of musical events or phrases,” which Lippman describes as lacking in the Wagner example. If the syntax of the music itself is not immediately suggestive of “timelessness,” however, this perception becomes stronger when the music is considered in tandem with the scenario of the ballet. If the first act of The Nutcracker entails a narrative sequence of events that unfolds “in time” (the arrival of guests on Christmas Eve; Clara receiving a nutcracker and becoming upset when it is broken; the fantastic battle between the nutcracker and the mice), the second act entails a plotless, non-developmental succession of divertissements that occur in a distinct temporal realm. Act II is set entirely in the dreamlike fantasy land of “Confiturembourg” (the Kingdom of Sweets; Candyland), the ostensibly eternal nature of which is suggested by its distinct lack of drama and by the fact that the characters never depart from it to return to the “real” world. Significantly, the introduction of “Confiturembourg” at the beginning of the second act is accompanied musically by the same expansive panorama-like theme and accompaniment that Tchaikovsky later reuses in the “Apothéose” to end the ballet. If this melody first appears with the characters’ entrance into “Confiturembourg,” then its one and only reappearance in the “Apothéose” serves as a musical reminder or signifier of “Confiturembourg” and its timeless setting.

19 Lippman, “Progressive Temporality in Music,” 121.

20 The accompaniment for this melody exhibits an even greater degree of stratification at the beginning of the second act than at the end. In addition to layers present in the “Apothéose,” the introduction of this melody in the beginning of the second act entails rapid ascending scales in the woodwinds and repeated notes shifted off the beat in the horns, both of which are hallmarks of Tchaikovsky’s orchestral writing.
The timeless temporal settings of Wagner’s Prelude and Tchaikovsky’s “Apothèose” are thus both accompanied by music entailing a certain degree of “sheer continuity,” a quality which simultaneously superimposes elements of stasis and forward motion. This synthesis represents a paradox only insofar as one subscribes to a view in which musical time only ever progresses forward in a linear fashion. As Susanne Langer suggested in 1953, “life is always a dense fabric of concurrent tensions, and as each of them is a measure of time, the measurements themselves do not coincide . . . When one is taken as parameter, others become ‘irrational,’ out of logical focus, ineffable.” Langer’s writing thus reflects a certain intuitive approach to time; according to Langer, time cannot be analyzed by isolating its various apparent constituent elements, for to do so is to disintegrate the qualities which characterize the complex whole.

Although Langer’s theories on the indivisibility of temporal experience were written after the period in which the Stravinsky pieces to be considered were composed (between 1927 and 1948), Langer’s writing is strongly rooted in a theory that was highly popular in the early twentieth century and that also came to create an indirect foundation for Stravinsky’s theories on musical time. This concept, *durée* (“duration,” or “real time”), was theorized by the French philosopher Henri Bergson (1859-1941) in his book *Time and Free Will* (1889), and in some sense might be seen as a philosophical ancestor of the various theories of musical time considered thus far. For Bergson, *durée* represented an organic temporal continuity of human consciousness; according to Bergson,

> Pure duration [*la durée toute pure*] is the form which the succession of our conscious states assumes when our ego lets itself live, when it refrains from separating its present state from its former states. For this purpose it need not be entirely absorbed in the passing sensation or idea; for then, on the contrary, it would no longer *endure*. Nor need

---

21 Susanne K. Langer, *Feeling and Form: A Theory of Art* (New York: Charles Scribner’s Sons, 1953), 113. Langer’s argument is summarized succinctly by Alan Mardsen, who notes that “music can be static on one level and simultaneously moving on another, and passages of different ‘times’ can occur simultaneously with or without co-ordination.” See Mardsen, *Representing Musical Time*, 2.
it forget its former states: it is enough that, in recalling these states, it does not set them alongside its actual state as one point alongside another, but forms both the past and the present states into an organic whole, as happens when we recall the notes of a tune, melting, so to speak, into one another.²²

As described by Suzanne Guerlac, durée is characterized by “an act of temporal synthesis performed by, or as, consciousness.”²³ Durée thus represents an immediate philosophical model for Langer’s “dense fabric of concurrent tensions”; its sustained duration is predicated upon the indivisibility of its numerous interweaving strands.

For Bergson, one key element of durée was its purely temporal nature, devoid of any traces of “spatialization.” Bergson believed that time and space were mutually exclusive entities, but that the abstract nature of time made it difficult for humans to think about or discuss time without relying on spatial metaphors, metaphors which inherently tainted time’s true nature.²⁴ Durée was Bergson’s answer to this problem. As Guerlac notes, “duration implies a mode of temporal synthesis that is different from the linear narrative development of past-present-future. It involves a temporal synthesis of memory that knits temporal dimensions together, as in a melody.”²⁵ Instead of comparing different temporal events by decontextualizing them and placing them next to each other on a “mental timeline” (that is, a spatial framework), Bergson advocates for more of a Gestalt understanding of an individual’s experience as a unified whole.

In durée, then, the linear progression of time is replaced with the saturation of time, which occurs as otherwise disparate temporal experiences are spun together centripetally to form an organic Gestalt of consciousness.

---

²⁵ Guerlac, Thinking in Time, 66.
Although Bergson had theorized *durée* as a philosophy of human consciousness, it is not difficult to imagine how the ideal nature of his theories could be extrapolated for application to the concept of timelessness or eternity. Given Bergson’s belief in the human inability to think about time in non-spatialized terms, *durée* as Bergson had conceived it ostensibly represents a utopian vision of consciousness, one that cannot be entirely achieved by anyone trapped in a “time-bound” frame of reference. By extension, Albright’s idea of a heavenly consciousness might represent one example of an ideal manifestation of *durée*. Although Albright’s suggestion of the heavenly convergence of time and space diverges from Bergson’s insistence on the separation of the two, both Albright and Bergson suggest an idea of human consciousness which is not mediated by a linear passage of time. In both *durée* and Albright’s heaven, there is no distinction between past, present, and future; all time runs fluidly together as a sense of timelessness is created through dense temporal saturation.

For his work on the philosophy of human consciousness, begun in 1889 and further developed over the next several decades, Bergson was awarded the Nobel Prize in literature in 1927 “in recognition of his rich and vitalizing ideas and the brilliant skill with which they had been presented.” The fact that Bergson was awarded such a distinguished prize suggests the intellectual weight of his philosophy, the gravitational effects of which would eventually be seen in the realm of the arts. Stravinsky was among those who would eventually engage with Bergson’s philosophy. Beyond the fact that Bergson’s ideas on time had formed part of the general intellectual *Zeitgeist* of the early twentieth century, Stravinsky is known to have had at least a second-hand exposure to the philosophies of Bergson through his friend Pierre Souvtchinsky (1892-1985). In his exposition of his theory on musical time in the *Poetics of*
Music (a written version of his 1939 Harvard Lecture Series), Stravinsky admits to having borrowed his ideas on time from Souvtchinsky.\textsuperscript{27} The most immediate source of Stravinsky’s borrowing was likely Souvtchinsky’s essay “La notion du temps et la musique” (\textit{Revue musicale}, 1939); as Richard Taruskin observes, this source relied heavily upon the philosophy of Bergson.\textsuperscript{28} Despite the fact that Souvtchinsky’s essay was not written until 1939, it seems probable that Stravinsky had been at least indirectly exposed to Bergson’s ideas via Souvtchinsky even earlier. Taruskin notes that Souvtchinsky and Stravinsky had become friends in Berlin by 1922,\textsuperscript{29} and an article written by Souvtchinsky for the journal \textit{Melos} in 1917 already betrayed an understanding and embracing of Bergson’s ideas.\textsuperscript{30} It does not seem unreasonable to assume, therefore, that Stravinsky may have been at least indirectly exposed to Bergson through Souvtchinsky at some point in the 1920s, perhaps even before he had begun work on his ballet \textit{Apollo} (to be discussed later) in 1927.

A somewhat watered-down version of Bergson’s \textit{durée} appears in Stravinsky’s philosophy of musical time in his \textit{Poetics of Music}. According to Stravinsky, musical time was comprised of two separate elements: “psychological time” and “ontological time” (which was loosely based on \textit{durée}). Stravinsky describes psychological time by asserting that

\begin{quote}
\textit{It does not seem unreasonable to assume, therefore, that Stravinsky may have been at least indirectly exposed to Bergson through Souvtchinsky at some point in the 1920s, perhaps even before he had begun work on his ballet \textit{Apollo} (to be discussed later) in 1927.}
\end{quote}

\begin{quote}
\textit{A somewhat watered-down version of Bergson’s \textit{durée} appears in Stravinsky’s philosophy of musical time in his \textit{Poetics of Music}. According to Stravinsky, musical time was comprised of two separate elements: “psychological time” and “ontological time” (which was loosely based on \textit{durée}). Stravinsky describes psychological time by asserting that time passes at a rate which varies according to the inner dispositions of the subject and to the events that come to affect his consciousness. Expectation, boredom, anguish, pleasure and pain, contemplation—all of these thus come to appear as different categories in the midst of which our life unfolds, and each of these determines a special psychological process, a particular tempo.}\textsuperscript{31}
\end{quote}

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{29} Ibid., 1126.
\textsuperscript{30} Ibid., 1125.
\textsuperscript{31} Stravinsky, \textit{Poetics of Music}, 30.
\end{flushright}
By contrast, however, “these variations in psychological time are perceptible only as they are related to the primary sensation—whether conscious or unconscious—of real time, ontological time.” Whereas psychological time “proceed[s] by contrast . . ., [m]usic that is based on ontological time is generally dominated by the principle of similarity.” In contrast to the instability of psychological time, music that “evolves parallel to the process of ontological time . . . induc[es] in the mind of the listener a feeling of euphoria and, so to speak, of ‘dynamic calm.’”

Stravinsky attempts a synthesis of the dichotomized types of time in order to form “musical time”:

What gives the concept of musical time its special stamp is that this concept is born and develops as well outside of the categories of psychological time as it does simultaneously with them. All music, whether it submits to the normal flow of time, or whether it dissociates itself therefrom, establishes a particular relationship, a sort of counterpoint between the passing of time, the music’s own duration, and the material and technical means through which the music is made manifest.

The synthesis is only a partial one, however, as Stravinsky ultimately asserts his preference for the concept of similarity over that of variety. Although Stravinsky acknowledges the legitimacy of psychological time in music, the ultimate hegemony which similarity exerts over contrast is captured in Stravinsky’s belief that “variety is valid only as a means of attaining similarity.”

The salient features of Stravinsky’s theory of musical time are illuminated by Reiner in his semiotic analysis of Stravinsky’s writing. As Reiner notes, ontological time served for Stravinsky to provide both “a frame of reference” and a sense of “rhythmic regularity,” a regularity which Reiner suggests “reflects the common-sense notion that time always and

---

32 Ibid., 30-31.
33 Ibid.
34 Ibid., 32.
inevitably passes at a constant rate.”36 Stated another way, “Stravinsky is interested in an even
temporal scale with which the subjective and irregular psychological time can be compared.”37
Although Stravinsky did not seem to share Bergson’s desire of avoiding the spatialization of
time, ontological time was still related to *durée* in that both were claimed to be a pure form of
time characterized by unity, similarity, and continuity.

The musical qualities of passages characterized by ontological time can be approached
through Reiner’s suggestion that

> it can be argued that music based on ontological time tends to have a certain effect on
> listeners, and that this is more important to Stravinsky than an actual awareness of
> ontological time. Stravinsky may be interested to induce a feeling of euphoria and
dynamic calm, rather than to give rise to a listener’s consciousness of ontological time.38

Reiner restricts his discussion of Stravinsky’s ontological time to a semiotic analysis of the
composer’s prose only, however, and does not venture to suggest any compositions that might
embody this type of time. This parameter of Reiner’s analysis is perhaps the result of his keen
awareness that “although Stravinsky associates the feeling of euphoria and dynamic calm with
music based on ontological time, this does not allow for the conclusion that a listener’s feeling of
euphoria and dynamic calm constitutes an experience of ontological or musical time.”39

Although it is not the goal of this study to find “calm” or “euphoric” passages in Stravinsky’s
music and label them as manifestations of ontological time, it just so happens that these
adjectives often succeed in describing the restrained effect of the “apotheoses” in Stravinsky’s
neoclassical period. Thus, interesting parallels can be seen to exist between Stravinsky’s
apotheoses (passages for which Stravinsky occasionally expressed a particular fondness) and the
concept of ontological time, Stravinsky’s preferred element of musical time. In the chapter that

36 Ibid., 137.
37 Ibid., 138.
38 Ibid., 143.
39 Ibid., 143-144.
follows, the goal of this study will be to investigate how the aforementioned theories relating to “timelessness” can inform an understanding of the quiet restraint present in five of Stravinsky’s neoclassical “apotheoses.”
CHAPTER 3: STRAVINSKY’S NEOCLASSICAL “APOTHEOSES”

Apollo (1928)

This investigation of “timeless apotheoses” in Stravinsky’s neoclassical period begins with the ballet *Apollon Musagète* (1928), also known as *Apollo*, the first instance in which Stravinsky uses the term “Apothéose” as the title for the finale of a composition. The work was premiered on 27 April 1928 at the Library of Congress in Washington, D.C., following Stravinsky’s commission for the ballet from the Elizabeth Sprague Coolidge Foundation in 1927.¹ Although Stravinsky’s commission specified that the ballet should include no more than six dancers and should not exceed one half-hour in length, Stravinsky was allowed to select the subject of the ballet, for which he fashioned a scenario centering on the Greek mythological figures of Apollo and the muses.² Stravinsky’s scenario begins with the title character’s birth on the Greek island of Delos. After the young Apollo plays his lyre, three muses appear, and Apollo gives to each of them a gift: to the muse Calliope, the gift of poetry; to Polyhymnia, mime; and to Terpsichore, dance. Each muse dances in turn after receiving her gift, and Terpsichore is selected to dance a pas de deux with Apollo. After another dance, Apollo and the three muses ascend to their future home on Mount Parnassus during the “Apothéose.”³

The title of “Apothéose” for the final scene of *Apollo* is fitting for a variety of reasons. From a semantic point of view, the final scene is aptly named because the end of the scenario entails an example of the literal definition of “apotheosis,” which is “deification.” As Mount

---

¹ Although the work was first performed in America with choreography by Adolph Bolm, a second version of the ballet was soon created for the Ballets Russes in Europe with choreography by George Balanchine. This “European” version of the work was premiered on 12 June 1928 at the Théâtre Sarah-Bernhardt in Paris. See White, *Stravinsky: The Composer and his Works*, 345.
² See ibid., 340.
Parnassus was held to be the sacred home of Apollo and the muses in Greek mythology, the ascension to Parnassus in the ballet becomes symbolic of Apollo’s deification, or apotheosis. Thus, the title of “Apothéose” serves as a literal reflection of the drama onstage at the end of the ballet. From a historical point of view, this label additionally suggests a historical connection to the concluding “Apothéose” of Tchaikovsky’s Nutcracker, a work for which Stravinsky had expressed great admiration while working on its revival with Diaghilev in 1921. Interestingly, this connection is perhaps felt most strongly in Apollo’s various references to Versailles, a focus which the ballet shares with the Sleeping Beauty. Despite the Greek façade of the ballet’s scenario, Apollo was ultimately an example of French-inspired neoclassicism; as Stravinsky had suggested, “Apollo is a tribute to the French seventeenth century . . . The chariot, the three horses, and the sun disc (the Coda) were the emblem of le roi soleil.” If the chariot and horses were emblematic of Louis XIV as symbolized by the figure Apollo, these elements of Apollo’s decor also suggested a more immediate connection to Tchaikovsky’s Sleeping Beauty, the

---

5 The concept of Parnassus was famously invoked in the title of Johann Fux’s counterpoint treatise Gradus ad Parnassum (1725); the implication in the title is that the Apollonian study of strict counterpoint will lead to perfection. Mount Parnassus also played an important symbolic role in the instrumental genre of the “apotheose” in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. Such an “apotheose” incorporated a programmatic element in honor of “a dead musician, usually Lully. In an apotheose the favoured dead are welcomed by Apollo (representing Louis XIV) on to Mount Parnassus.” In addition to its use of Mount Parnassus as a symbolic place of deification, the Baroque “apotheose” is particularly interesting because of its connection with the foremost monarch and musician associated with Versailles; this connection would imaginably have intrigued Stravinsky, had he known of the genre. Although it is conceivable that Stravinsky would have known about the Baroque “apotheose” (perhaps through Couperin’s renowned “apotheoses” of 1724-25), this connection has not been proven. See The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians, s.v. “Apotheose” (by Davitt Moroney and Julie Anne Sadie), http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com (accessed March 11, 2011).
6 Igor Stravinsky and Robert Craft, Dialogues (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982 [1961]), 34. For an insightful historical account of the various references that Stravinsky makes to the court of Versailles in Apollo, see Joseph, Stravinsky and Balanchine, 94-123.
7 The chariot and horses in Apollo were part of the background scenery, a photograph of which is reproduced in Schouvaloff, The Art of Ballets Russes, 106.
backdrop for the “Apothéose” of which had similarly depicted Apollo’s chariot drawn by horses.  

If the title of “Apothéose” for the finale of Apollo suggests a historical connection to Tchaikovsky’s ballets, Stravinsky’s “Apothéose” also diverges from the more general balletic conception of the “apotheosis” as exhibited in these same works. At the end of The Sleeping Beauty, for instance, the inclusion of various fairy-tale characters who otherwise have nothing to do with the plot makes the finale an example of the nineteenth-century balletic apotheosis, which Taruskin had defined as a “spectacular climax . . . that summoned a huge and brilliantly costumed corps de ballet onstage.” Although the deification of the title character in Apollo represents a type of climax, the ascension of the ballet’s four dancers does not produce the same spectacular or brilliant effect in this climax as might have been achieved by a large corps de ballet.

If the “Apothéose” in Apollo deviates from the nineteenth-century trend of the grand balletic apotheosis, this divergence was necessitated in part by the fact that Stravinsky’s commission had limited him to incorporating no more than six dancers in the ballet. According to Joseph, this parameter was necessitated by the small stage of the original performance venue in the Library of Congress; with dimensions of only thirty feet wide by twenty feet deep and containing no wings, the stage would have been spatially unable to accommodate any additional dancers. Because Joseph refers to evidence in the unpublished Coolidge files to suggest that Stravinsky had originally wanted to include more than six dancers, Stravinsky’s divergence from

---

8 The connection between The Sleeping Beauty and Apollo is suggested, among other scholars, by Tim Scholl, in From Petipa to Balanchine, 32.
9 Taruskin, The Oxford History of Western Music, 4:144.
the nineteenth-century tradition of using a large corps de ballet in the apotheosis seems to have
been prompted by matters of spatial necessity and, ultimately, of contractual obligation.

As Stravinsky’s choice of number of dancers was limited by the small size of the stage,
so also was his choice of orchestral ensemble limited by the small size of the orchestra pit.
Although the music is scored for a six-part chamber string orchestra, Joseph observes that
Stravinsky’s sketches had originally included parts for harp and piano, parts which were
excluded as soon as the composer realized that there would not be enough room for these large
instruments in the pit.11 Stravinsky nonetheless used his available materials to create the best
possible end product; limited to a small dancing troupe and a small orchestra, he sought to
achieve a restrained and understated effect in the music which would complement the limited
performing forces. Stravinsky later offered an *ex post facto* aesthetic account of this restraint by
referring to the work as a “ballet blanc” in which “the absence of many-coloured effects and of
all superfluities produced a wonderful freshness.”12 Musically speaking, the consonant
harmonies and softer dynamic levels create a sense of intimacy which is well suited for the
chamber orchestra which performs it, and for the small group of dancers which it accompanies.13
The delicate music of *Apollo* is thus an excellent example of Stravinsky the craftsman fashioning
an aesthetic solution to address the quotidian demands of a commission.

The delicacy of *Apollo* is arguably perceived most acutely in the “Apothéeose,” where the
subtly shaded music stands in stark relief to the divine glory of the ascension that it depicts. In
fact, the overall musical effect of the “Apothéeose” is perhaps best described as the antithesis of

11 Ibid., 49-50.
13 Significantly, these musical and choreographic restraints were retained even after Stravinsky took
*Apollo* to Europe and had it performed in larger performance venues. As Joseph notes, a subsequent
attempt to increase the size of the string orchestra by conductor Otto Klemperer disrupted for Stravinsky
the delicate sonic-visual balance between orchestral and dancing forces, a balance that was restored only
when the orchestra was reduced back to its original size. See Joseph, *Stravinsky Inside Out*, 50.
Meyer’s theoretical conception of “apotheosis,” which entailed a “powerful statement of majestic affirmation” which “literally overwhelm[s] the listener” with its “force and magnitude.”14 While the etherized daze of Stravinsky’s “anti-apotheosis” might be understood in a variety of ways, one particularly striking feature of the “Apothéose” is the way in which it suggests the passage of time (or lack thereof). In his passing suggestion that “time has detached itself from the characters”15 at the end of Apollo, for instance, Joseph seems to indicate that the temporality which is signified by the music may be seen as a temporality of “timelessness.” Admittedly, Joseph’s description of the temporal features of the “Apothéose” is likely informed in part by the setting of the scene: Apollo’s eternal home on Mount Parnassus. The signified temporality of timelessness in this scene may also be approached musically, however, with the theories of musical timelessness which were explored in the previous chapter.

If a sense of “timelessness” is indeed created through the music, what are some of the salient musical features of the “Apothéose” that create this perception? Perhaps the most striking feature of the “Apothéose” that contributes to a sense of timelessness is the complex stratification of its polyphonic texture, a trait which had characterized the “sheer continuity” of the Prelude of Das Rheingold. Beginning in the last six measures of the “Apothéose” (one measure before rehearsal 101; see Example 3.1), the music consists of four layers of superimposed ostinato figures.16 The lowest layer is an arpeggiated ostinato figure in the bass that initially repeats itself every four beats; the second layer is an arpeggiated ostinato figure in the second cello that initially repeats itself every six beats; the third layer is an ostinato in the

---

14 Meyer, Style and Music, 204.
15 Joseph, Stravinsky and Balanchine, 196-197. Joseph uses this description of the end of Apollo also to describe the end of Stravinsky’s ballet Orpheus (1948), a work which will be examined later in this thesis.
16 For an excellent theoretical treatment of rhythmic stratification in Apollo and other works by Stravinsky, see Gretchen Grace Horlacher, “Superimposed Strata in the Music of Igor Stravinsky” (PhD diss., Yale University, 1990).
Example 3.1. Apollo: “Apothéose,” rehearsals 100-101 in full score (Boosey and Hawkes, revised 1947 version)
second violin and viola that initially repeats itself every four beats; and the fourth layer in the first violin and first cello is derived from a melody introduced just before Apollo’s birth in the Prologue of the ballet (see Example 3.2)—the fragmented melody now serves as a memory of Apollo’s birth as he becomes deified on Parnassus.  

Example 3.2. Apollo: Prologue, melody from mm. 19-24 (excerpted from Boosey & Hawkes, revised 1947 version)

Although the “Apothéose” exhibits a degree of textural stratification, this characteristic alone is not sufficient to classify this passage as an example of Lippman’s “sheer continuity”—such stratification exists in most polyphonic music, after all, not all of which exhibits the “fusion of passage and constancy” of “sheer continuity.” What makes the texture in the last six measures of the “Apothéose” truly noteworthy, however, is the way in which Stravinsky gradually augments the rhythmic durations in each layer to create a meticulously notated morendo, an effect which is of particular importance in signifying the “timeless” temporality of the music. Monelle, for example, describes the effect of morendo as “indicating temporal arrest and a shift from structure to genre”—that is, it indicates a definite shift towards a signified temporality in

---

17 This concept of the return of the opening melody as a memory from the start of the ballet is derived from Taruskin’s passing reference to the same occurrence at the end of Le baiser de la fée, to be discussed in the next chapter. See Taruskin, Stravinsky and the Russian Traditions, 2.1611.

18 Monelle, The Sense of Music, 136-137. For Monelle, “structure” or “progressive temporality” refers to the musical logic that propels the music forward. By contrast, “genre” or “lyric temporality” refers to the more expressive elements of the music which, while aesthetically necessary to make the music interesting, are not as essential to the logical “progress” of the music. Both elements were traditionally necessary for a compelling piece of music or literature. As Monelle notes, “without [‘genre’], a novel would resemble those plot synopses that one finds in opera programs, clear, matter-of-fact, uncompelling and unreadable. Without [‘structure’], the element of structure, one has a belle lettre or set of [dramatically static] vignettes” (117).
which “time may pass, but it passes carelessly.” Morendo may also be understood as having approximately the opposite effect of accelerando, which Lippman suggests “produces an . . . insistent sense of a propulsion, of a hurtling forward, that cannot be halted or obstructed.”

Although accelerando occurs in the reverse direction in the “Apothéose,” the absolute value of its undeniable temporal force remains the same. The dying music may signify a shift towards a temporality in which time “passes carelessly,” but the inescapable gravity of the shift itself is evidenced as the music grinds slowly yet resolutely to a halt on the final piano B-minor triad.

Although the morendo is a fairly common musical technique, its connection to the concept of “temporal arrest” is particularly strong in the “Apothéose,” where the morendo also doubles as an agent of textural stratification. If the morendo at the end of Apollo creates the sense that the music as a whole is slowing down, this overall effect is actually the cumulative effect of each of the four individual layers undergoing gradual rhythmic augmentation at different rates and at different times. The fragmented melody from the Prologue is the first to begin to be lengthened; the next layer to undergo augmentation is the ostinato in the second cello (the durations of which are lengthened from quarter notes, to half notes, to whole notes, to double-whole notes); the third layer to undergo augmentation is the ostinato in the bass (the durations of which are progressively lengthened in essentially the same pattern as in the previous layer, although not at the same time); and the last layer to be augmented is the ostinato in the second violin and viola. Thus, in addition to serving as a general signifier of temporal arrest in the

---

19 Ibid., 117.
22 It should be mentioned that the rhythmic lengthening of the melody from the Prologue is not truly rhythmic augmentation. In rhythmic augmentation, the duration of each note is lengthened, but the proportions between the durations of the notes remain the same. This process does not occur, however, with the fragment of the melody from the Prologue. The duration of the first three notes of the motive always remains constant, but each time the fragment is repeated, the final note of the figure is sustained for one quarter note longer than it had been sustained the previous time.
“Apothéose,” the built-in *morendo* also staggers the rates at which the individual lines slow down and thereby increases the overall sense of textural stratification.

Significantly, it is this stratification that creates in the “Apothéose” a degree of synchronic juxtaposition of stasis and motion, a characteristic which has been demonstrated to be a possible factor in the creation of “sheer continuity.” As in the E-flat-centric Prelude to *Das Rheingold*, for example, a sense of harmonic stasis in the “Apothéose” results from the B-minor-centric tonality (with the added pitches G, F natural, and occasionally A). As Joseph notes of the “Apothéose,” “because the pitch materials employed are limited, often oscillating between two or three notes, the motion seems all the more static, providing a resignation to the music. There is a circular feeling of timelessness to it all, as the music moves in a loop, creating a beguiling sense of stasis.”23 At the same time, however, Joseph also acknowledges that the music is not monolithically stationary. In referring to the repetition of the highest layer of the texture (containing the fragmented melody from the Prologue), for example, Joseph also suggests that “each iteration of the by now familiar motive occurs at a different and aurally unpredictable point in the passage’s overall pacing. It is this unpredictability, this waiting to hear when the motive might reoccur, that holds our attention by heightening our expectation, thereby creating a sense of drive.”24 Joseph’s nuanced account of the “Apothéose” thus suggests a conceptual connection with the synchronic temporal juxtapositions of Lippman’s “sheer continuity” or with Langer’s “dense fabric of concurrent tensions”; the shifting textural alignment propels the music

24 Ibid., 118. Joseph’s account of simultaneous stasis and drive in the music corroborates an earlier concept regarding the “Apothéose” made by Horlacher, who notes that “while repetition is inherent in a structure built upon superimposed ostinati, we have demonstrated consistently that there is much variation created by the resultant combinations of these strata” (Horlacher, “Superimposed Strata in the Music of Igor Stravinsky,” 170).
expectantly forward, the *morendo* drags the music disjointedly backward, all while the limited harmonic material keeps the music from moving much of anywhere at all.

Because the “sheer continuity” of the “Apothéose” suggests a concept of timelessness in which various types of time are synthesized, this music could be described as signifying a “temporality of timelessness,” an oxymoronic term for the juxtaposition of the existence of time (temporality) with the apparent lack of time (timelessness). Furthermore, the fact that the music’s complex texture also incorporates the melody from the Prologue may additionally suggest one possible solution to Albright’s conundrum of how narrative can be depicted in an “achronic” temporality. Because it is presented just before Apollo’s birth in the Prologue, the melody in Example 3.1 can be seen as a type of musical symbol or signifier of Apollo’s birth. The fact that this musical symbol is interwoven in the dense texture accompanying Apollo’s deification thus represents a temporal synthesis which, to borrow Bergson’s language, “forms both the past and the present states into an organic whole.”

Like Albright’s vision of heaven in which dense temporal saturation melts the image of a human as “baby, corpse, and everything in between” into a *Gestalt* whole, Apollo’s earthly experiences are knitted together musically as the memory of his birth is gently swaddled in the dense musical/temporal fabric of his apotheosis.

If a sense of “timelessness” in the “Apothéose” can be at least partially understood by analyzing the specific musical materials employed, another important factor to consider is the overall emotive affect of the music. One such account is provided by White:

The *Apotheosis*, in which Apollo leads the Muses to Parnassus, reverts to the tranquil mood of the introduction in the Prologue. The spacious theme [from the Prologue] reappears in D major; and there is a six bar musical coda in which four different ostinato

---


26 Albright, *Untwisting the Serpent*, 312.
figures of varying lengths are gradually augmented, until the stream of the music broadens out into a delta of great serenity and calm.\textsuperscript{27}

White’s use of the terms “tranquil” and “a great delta of serenity and calm” reflect the sentiment of Stravinsky’s tempo marking “Largo e tranquillo,” a marking which itself suggests a casual (if not direct) connection with the feelings of “dynamic calm” and “euphoria” which Stravinsky would later associate with the concept of “ontological time.”\textsuperscript{28} While White’s imagery of a peacefully flowing river may capture one possible impression of the music, however, the “Apothéose” also seems to be tinged with a degree of resignation or desolation because of its quiet ending with a morendo in the minor mode. This sense of resignation is additionally enhanced by the relatively short duration of the end of the “Apothéose”; if Stravinsky’s tempo marking of “quarter note = 54” is strictly followed, the final six measures of the music (where the superimposition of ostinati begins) last for only around 53 seconds. Although the music’s textural complexity might suggest the temporal complexity of eternity, there nonetheless exists a marked disjuncture between the limited duration of this passage and the timeless temporality which it signifies, a disjuncture which ironically injects the calmness with a sense of disquietude.

That the music exudes an oxymoronic sense of unsettling serenity would likely have been supported by Stravinsky, who once commented on what he perceived to be the tragic nature of Apollo:

\begin{quote}
But if a truly tragic note is sounded anywhere in my music, that note is in Apollo. Apollo’s birth is tragic, I think, and so is his ascent to Parnassus, and the Apotheosis is every bit as tragic as Phèdre’s line when she learns of the love of Hippolyte and Aricie—“\textit{Tous les jours se levaient clairs et sereins pour eux}” [“Every day rose clear and calm for
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{27} White, \textit{Stravinsky: The Composer and his Works}, 344.
\textsuperscript{28} As noted in the previous chapter, Stravinsky’s explanation in \textit{Poetics} of “ontological time” (which represented a second-hand understanding and adaptation of Bergson’s \textit{durée}) is sufficiently diffuse to discourage any serious attempts at identifying specific passages in Stravinsky’s music as musical manifestations of “ontological time.”
them”—though, of course, Racine and myself were both absolutely heartless people, and cold, cold.29

Why is the occasion of Apollo’s deification a cause for lament? Robert Craft (quoting Robert Garis) speculates as to a possible meaning of Stravinsky’s words by suggesting that “the ending of Apollo is tragic. When Apollo and the Muses leave, they leave us behind in our mortality.”30

If, as Craft suggests, the audience might be seen as being distanced from Apollo’s transcendence in the “Apotéose,” how might the sense of timelessness in the music contribute to this distancing? Insight into this point is found in Barbara R. Barry’s assessment of time when viewed from the framework of the Enlightenment principles of reason and logic, principles with which the neoclassical Apollo is often associated. For all of its positive attributes, Barry suggests that reasoning ability also brings about an “awareness of its [own] limitations; limitations in the face of cosmic forces, nature, infinities of space and time; limitations to counter human unreason like war and opportunism; limitations of loneliness; and more than all of these, consciousness of mortality and the inevitability of death.”31 In this sense, Stravinsky does not seek a philosophical unity with Apollo’s transcendence in the vein of a utopian Lisztian apotheosis, an apotheosis which entailed the striving for a unity which can never be achieved. Rather, perhaps Stravinsky suggests that mythical Apollo’s glorious experience of ascension can be fully known by the deity

29 Stravinsky and Craft, Dialogues, 34.
31 Barbara R. Barry, Musical Time: The Sense of Order, Harmonologia Series 5 (Stuyvesant, NY: Pendragon Press, 1990), 249. Barry provides this description in conjunction with her analysis of “the dialectic of musical time.” Barry divides musical time into what she describes as an Apollonian “structured time” and a Dionysian “transcendent time,” a dialectic which bears an uncanny resemblance to Stravinsky’s theory of “ontological time” and “psychological time” as discussed in the previous chapter.
alone, and the reserved musical depiction of this ascent quietly encourages the audience to forgo any dreams of glimpsing Parnassus.32

Diverging from previous musical traditions of spectacular or bombastic apotheoses, Stravinsky’s “calm,” timeless music at the end of Apollo becomes a distancing effect in a section of music which qualifies as an “apotheosis” perhaps only in the strictest sense of the term. By diverging from these trends, however, Stravinsky’s reinterpretation of “apotheosis” began to infuse the term with new and original significations of detachment and timelessness as it related to his own compositions. These patterns would be continued in the finale of Stravinsky’s next musical composition, Le baiser de la fée.

Le baiser de la fée (1928)

On 27 November, 1928, exactly seven months after the first performance of Apollo, Stravinsky premiered a new ballet entitled Le baiser de la fée at the Paris Opera House. Given the chronological proximity of these two ballets, it is perhaps unsurprising that Tchaikovsky’s Sleeping Beauty had served as a type of model for Stravinsky in both Apollo and Le baiser de la fée. If in Apollo Stravinsky had drawn on Tchaikovsky’s glorification of Versailles in The Sleeping Beauty and incorporated it into his own neoclassical style, then in Le baiser de la fée Stravinsky sought to emulate Tchaikovsky’s musical style itself.\(^{33}\) Stravinsky had in fact dedicated the work to Tchaikovsky and included the following inscription in the score: “As my object was to commemorate the work of Tchaikovsky, this subject seemed to me to be particularly appropriate as an allegory, the Muse having similarly branded Tchaikovsky with her fatal kiss.”\(^{34}\) As a tribute to Tchaikovsky, Stravinsky incorporated a large amount of his music in the score; as Taruskin notes, its “outright imitation”\(^{35}\) of The Sleeping Beauty made Le baiser de la fée an example of “sheer pastiche.”\(^{36}\)

Despite the differences in musical style between Apollo and Le baiser de la fée, a degree of aesthetic commonality exists between the two ballets in their final apotheoses. Although the finale of Le baiser de la fée is entitled “Lullaby in the Land of Eternity” or “Epilogue” instead of “Apothéose,” this difference in nomenclature may be disregarded in light of the numerous musical and narrative similarities between this ending and the ending of Apollo. Such similarities between these two endings had been acknowledged by Stravinsky’s contemporaries as soon as the second ballet had been premiered; in a letter in which he describes the premiere of Le baiser

\(^{33}\) For a detailed description of the similarities between Le baiser de la fée and Tchaikovsky’s The Sleeping Beauty, see Taruskin, *Stravinsky and the Russian Traditions*, 2.1610-1618.

\(^{34}\) Quoted in Jordan, *Stravinsky Dances*, 221.


\(^{36}\) Ibid., 1616.
de la fée to Serge Lifar, for instance, Diaghilev made a passing reference to the ballet’s final scene as “the coda in the style of Apollo.” \textsuperscript{37} In modern scholarship, Jordan has similarly referred to the “quiet theatrical ending” of \textit{Le baiser de la fée} as an example of “music in Stravinsky’s typical timeless style of musical apotheosis,” \textsuperscript{38} a description which ties the end of \textit{Le baiser de la fée} to the “timeless” ending of \textit{Apollo}.

Stravinsky’s creation of what Jordan sees as a “timeless apotheosis” at the end of \textit{Le baiser de la fée} relies in part on the scenario for the ballet. As a basis for the plot, Stravinsky had turned to the fifteen-chapter fairy tale “The Ice Maiden” (1861) by Danish author Hans Christian Andersen (1805-1875), whose writing had previously formed the basis of the libretto for Stravinsky’s opera \textit{The Nightingale} (1914). \textsuperscript{39} In “The Ice Maiden,” a Swiss boy named Rudy is journeying through the snowy wilderness with his mother, when she falls into a crevasse and dies. Rudy is eventually rescued by two hunters, but not before he is visited by the Ice Maiden who kisses the child to mark him as her own. Rudy grows up and falls in love with a young woman named Babette, and the evening before their wedding the two row out to an island in the middle of a nearby lake. When the boat breaks loose from its moorings and drifts away, Rudy swims after it; the jealous Ice Maiden meets him in the water, however, gives him a kiss of death, and reclaims his corpse as her own. \textsuperscript{40} The ending of Andersen’s story focuses solely on the continuation of Babette’s earthly life and her struggles to understand her fiancé’s tragic death. Babette is ultimately able to find peace in Rudy’s passing, however, because of an enlightening vision in which she is reassured of God’s wisdom. Derived from Babette’s epiphany is the following moral that Andersen uses to conclude “The Ice Maiden”: “There is a rosy hue in

\textsuperscript{37} Quoted in White, \textit{Stravinsky: The Composer and his Works}, 353.
\textsuperscript{38} Jordan, \textit{Stravinsky Dances}, 222.
\textsuperscript{39} See White, \textit{Stravinsky: The Composer and his Works}, 230.
\textsuperscript{40} See ibid., 348.
every heart, where the thought dwells, that: ‘God always gives us that which is best for us!’ but it is not always revealed to us, as it once happened to Babette in her dream.”\footnote{Hans Christian Andersen, \textit{The Ice Maiden: And Other Tales}, trans. Fanny Fuller (Philadelphia: F. Leypoldt, 1863), 136.} Andersen thus puts an optimistic spin on an otherwise tragic story: although Babette still must live without her beloved Rudy, she is spared from hopelessness by her faith in the omniscience of God.

Although Stravinsky’s scenario for \textit{Le baiser de la fée} retains a few of the key structural elements in Andersen’s plot, Stravinsky believed that he was “retaining only the skeleton of the story”\footnote{Letter to Alexander Benois, 12 August 1928, quoted in Taruskin, \textit{Stravinsky and the Russian Traditions}, 2.1611.} in the ballet’s scenario, and that “no hint of Andersen ha[d] survived”\footnote{Letter to Gabriel Paîchadze, 26 October 1928, quoted in ibid.} in the final score. In Stravinsky’s scenario, a young child is forcibly separated from his mother during a storm by the “Fairy,” who marks the child with a kiss before leaving him alone to be found by the villagers. The young man grows up and becomes engaged, but before the wedding the Fairy returns, disguised as the man’s fiancée, and bewitches him. Having rendered him powerless to escape, the Fairy takes the young man away to her dwelling in the “Land of Eternity,” where she kisses him again to reclaim him as her own.

Given that Stravinsky’s purpose in writing \textit{Le baiser de la fée} was to create an homage to Tchaikovsky, a composer whose final two ballets epitomized the fantasy-laden genre of the \textit{ballet-féerie}, it is not surprising that Stravinsky chose to omit Andersen’s moralizing ending which centers solely on the fiancée’s grief-laden earthly existence. In choosing to focus instead on the young man’s transcendence to eternity, however, Stravinsky makes some notable changes to the dwelling of the Ice Maiden as depicted by Andersen. In his fairy tale, Andersen had described the Ice Maiden’s dwelling as follows:
Not unlike water, which after long journeying, has been compressed into blocks of green glass, the glaciers lie here, so that one huge mass of ice is heaped on the other. The rushing stream roars below and melts snow and ice; within, hollow caverns and mighty clefts open, this is a wonderful palace of ice, and in it dwells the Ice Maiden, the Queen of the glaciers.44

According to Andersen’s description, the Ice Maiden’s palace is a product of nature; although the Ice Maiden herself is a supernatural fairy, she dwells on earth in an icy palace wrought by the rugged forces of nature. In forging the scenario for Le baiser de la fée, however, Stravinsky replaces Andersen’s watery and cavernous glacial palace in the written scenario with a dwelling simply entitled the “Land of Eternity”;45 the emphasis that Stravinsky places on the eternal nature of the Fairy’s dwelling surpasses any similar emphasis in Andersen’s original. According to Stravinsky’s synopsis,

[At the end of the Pas de Deux, the young man] falls under [the Fairy’s] spell and she takes him away to the land of eternity. There she gives him her kiss again, this time on the sole of his foot. [During the “Lullaby in the Land of Eternity”] The Fairy’s sprites gather in slow movements along the length of the stage, representing the infinite space of the heavens. The Fairy and the young man appear on a ridge. She kisses him once more, to the sound of her lullaby.46

With the focus shifted off of the (presumably) grieving fiancée and onto the young man in eternity, the overall effect of this ending is similar to Tchaikovsky’s The Nutcracker and what Taruskin describes as Clara’s “final transport to Confiturembourg (Candyland) from which—but this could be scary!—no return is made to round things off.”47 By altering the plot and temporal setting at the end of Andersen’s fairy tale, Stravinsky thus creates an ending in Le baiser de la fée which is more appropriate for a ballet-féerie.

44 Andersen, The Ice Maiden, 18-19.
45 Although the ballet’s written scenario omits any mention of snow or ice, Andersen’s setting of “The Ice Maiden” in the snowy Swiss Alps seems to have been retained in Alexander Benois’s scenery for the premiere of Stravinsky’s ballet. As Diaghilev noted, the final scene of the ballet for the premiere was set among the Swiss mountains and glaciers. See White, Stravinsky: The Composer and his Works, 353.
47 Taruskin, The Oxford History of Western Music, 4.144.
If the transcendence of the main character(s) to a realm outside of time connects *Le baiser de la fée* to Tchaikovsky’s apotheoses, it also connects the ballet to Stravinsky’s *Apollo*, in which Apollo and the muses ascend to an eternal existence on Parnassus. The apotheoses of these two ballets are additionally connected musically, in that the transcendence of the main characters is accompanied by what Jordan had referred to as a “quiet theatrical ending.” If the understated and intimate nature of *Apollo*’s “Apolthéose” can be seen in part as Stravinsky’s aesthetic solution to the practical limits of the small stage and orchestra pit in the Library of Congress, however, this same pragmatism is not a factor in the final scene of *Le baiser de la fée*. The latter work’s premiere in the spacious Paris Opera House enabled Stravinsky to score the work for a full-sized orchestra and to include a large corps de ballet onstage as necessary at various points in the ballet. Admittedly, Stravinsky did take advantage of the corps de ballet during the “Lullaby in the Land of Eternity” by calling for not only the “young man” and the Fairy, but also a host of the Fairy’s sprites. The number of dancing forces in the last scene is not matched musically, however, by what could have been a scoring for full orchestra, if Stravinsky had so desired. Instead, this scene is scored only for strings, flutes, and solo horn (all at a piano dynamic level), an ensemble whose size represents only a slight expansion from the six-part string orchestra in *Apollo*. Despite the greater orchestral forces available to him in *Le baiser de la fée*, then, Stravinsky intentionally chose to limit the scoring of the ballet’s ending, a choice which creates a similar contemplative and understated atmosphere as in the “Apolthéose” of *Apollo*.

In addition to the sparse instrumentation, Stravinsky employs some of the same musical techniques from the end of *Apollo* to create a sense of timelessness at the end of *Le baiser de la fée*. One such technique is the use of the same melodic material in the same instrument (flute) to

---

both begin and end the ballet. For this material, Stravinsky had borrowed a melody from Tchaikovsky’s song “Lullaby in the Storm” (Op. 54/10).\textsuperscript{49} In \textit{Le baiser de la fée}, this “Lullaby” melody is initially introduced in the first scene, also entitled “Lullaby in the Storm” (see example 3.3). As Richard Taruskin notes, the use of the same melodic material to open and close the ballet “attains a symbolic status. In \textit{Le baiser de la fée} the effect is more nearly that of a conventional \textit{Erinnerung} [memory], the ‘Lullaby in the Storm’ being so intimately bound up with the plot. (Indeed, the choice of the song may actually have determined the choice of subject.)”\textsuperscript{50} Insofar as it represents a memory of the start of the ballet, the effect of the return of the “Lullaby” melody in the “Lullaby in the Land of Eternity” can be approached effectively with Bergson’s concept of memory. For Bergson, memory was necessarily founded in the concept of \textit{durée}, which, as Richard Bilsker notes, does not allow the spatialization of time by “putting the mental states in somebody’s life ‘side by side in some ideal space.’”\textsuperscript{51} Guerlac notes that “memory,” for Bergson, “does not act like a slide projector, which displays past moments in distinct isolation from one another. It is cinematic. It performs an operation of temporal synthesis.”\textsuperscript{52} In the case of \textit{Le baiser de la fée} (as in the end of \textit{Apollo}), such an “operation of


\textsuperscript{50} Ibid., 2,1611.


\textsuperscript{52} Guerlac, \textit{Thinking in Time}, 68.
temporal synthesis” is performed as the memory of the little boy in the storm is superimposed upon the young man’s consciousness and newfound temporal existence in eternity.

Although the reappearance of the opening melodic material in the final scene serves as a memory of the start of the ballet, the temporal dimensions of the “Lullaby” melody do not remain unaffected by the change in the temporal setting of the scenario from time-bound earth to the “Land of Eternity.” In addition to now appearing in the major mode, the opening melody also returns in rhythmic augmentation, with the durational value of each individual pitch tripled from its original length (see Example 3.4). The process is not the same as the gradual rhythmic augmentation at the end of *Apollo*, however, which might be viewed simply as a meticulous way of notating a *ritardando*; rather, this consistent rhythmic augmentation is the same process that Baroque composers occasionally applied at the end of a fugue by doubling the durations of the notes of the fugue subject.\(^\text{53}\) If such augmentation created a sense of “dignity” and “impressiveness”\(^\text{54}\) when applied to the end of a fugue, however, the overall effect of the augmentation is a bit different at the end of *Le baiser de la fée*. In this case, the temporal expansion of the melody serves as a subtle parallel of the expansion of the ballet’s temporal setting from time into eternity.


Interestingly, Bergson had used the idea of melody as a metaphor for *durée* by conceiving of the individual notes of a melody as flowing into each other to create an organic whole. In the “Land of Eternity,” however, not even melody is independently capable of encompassing the dense complexity of lived experience that constitutes *durée*. Although the augmented “Lullaby” melody perhaps does not proceed so slowly as to be unidentifiable as the melody from the beginning of the ballet (especially since the melody is performed with its original durations just before the curtain rises on the fourth scene), its high degree of augmentation nonetheless weakens the ability of the individual notes to function as a perceptually coherent melodic whole. Instead, the expanded melody fades into the background and becomes a single layer in the ethereal stratified musical texture.

The existence of several texturally discrete musical layers is another salient feature of the “Lullaby in the Land of Eternity” that links it to the apotheoses of *Apollo* or *The Nutcracker*. The augmented melody represents the second slowest-moving strata, moving in dotted-half notes and with one “cycle” of the “Lullaby” melody lasting for 24 bars (in ¾ time) in its first and only full appearance. The motion of this borrowed melody is complemented by a newly-composed meandering countermelody in the horn, which progresses in similar durational values. The “slowest” or most constant layer consists of a tonic A-flat drone in the celli and basses, which is introduced at rehearsal 223 and sustained without interruption or rearticulation for the final 50 measures of the ballet. Finally, a more quickly moving layer is found in the rhythmic ostinato of the upper strings, whose pattern of three descending quarter notes (often by leap) repeats every measure. These four distinct textural layers give the music a sense of moving at different

---

56 The general intervallic content that is imposed on this rhythmic ostinato may be derived from material in measures 304 and following of movement III of Tchaikovsky’s Sixth Symphony (see Taruskin,
speeds, even as the music hovers constantly over the tonal center of A flat. The overall effect is similar to that achieved at the end of Apollo, music in which the juxtaposition of limited harmonic motion with varying rates of melodic motion was suggested as a possible exemplification of Lippman’s “sheer continuity.”

As the scene progresses, the amount of motion in the individual layers of the texture decreases. The countermelody in the horn drops out of the texture at rehearsal 227, at which time the augmented melody in the flutes also comes to rest on the final E flat which is sustained until the end of the ballet; from this point on the only motion comes from the descending three-note ostinati in the upper strings. Eventually this layer also becomes static, in this instance through the same type of “built-in” morendo that occurs at the end of Apollo. The quarter-note ostinato figure in the upper strings is first doubled in length and then tripled in length for the final iteration of the pattern (see Example 3.5). As in Apollo, the technique produces the same effect of a “pulling backward” or of “indicating temporal arrest” as suggested by Lippman and Monelle (respectively). If time had already begun to slow down with the return of the “Lullaby” melody

Example 3.5. Le baiser de la fée: “Lullaby in the Land of Eternity,” reduction of last 7 measures (excerpted from Boosey & Hawkes, revised 1952 version)

Stravinsky and the Russian Traditions, 2.1613), although the pitch content in Stravinsky’s ostinato eventually diverges from Tchaikovsky’s original.

The tonic drone and the diatonic melody in the flutes always support A flat as the tonal center, even though brief chromatic inflections in the ostinato in the upper strings occasionally add an element of tonal instability.

in rhythmic augmentation, the built-in *morendo* at the end of the ballet represents one final signifier of this temporal cessation.

Admittedly, the effect of this *morendo* is less pronounced than the same process at the end of *Apollo*. Whereas the process of gradual rhythmic augmentation in *Apollo* begins almost immediately in all four ostinati, the corresponding augmentation at the end of *Le baiser de la fée* occurs in only one level of the texture, and begins only after this ostinato has been presented in its original durational value almost fifty times. If one compares the endings of the two ballets beginning at the point where the final ostinati begin (one measure before rehearsal 101 in *Apollo* and at rehearsal 223 in *Le baiser de la fée*), it is clear that the process of gradual rhythmic augmentation of ostinati occupies a much greater proportion of the ending to *Apollo* than it does in *Le baiser de la fée*. Perhaps to avoid overusing the technique employed to such striking effect at the end of *Apollo*, Stravinsky’s brief use of the built-in *morendo* at the end of *Le baiser de la fée* is more of a nod to the “Apothéose” of the previous ballet, rather than the primary musical signifier of “temporal arrest.”

As has been demonstrated, the techniques used to create a sense of “timelessness” in the “Lullaby in the Land of Eternity” are comparable to the techniques used to the same effect in the “Apothéose” of *Apollo*. Regarding the scenarios, both scenes entail the transcendence of the main characters to a realm beyond time. Musically, both scenes are scored for a small orchestra at a soft dynamic level; both scores entail a degree of textural stratification in which the varying motion of individual lines is juxtaposed with the relative harmonic constancy of the whole, creating a sense of simultaneous stasis and flow; both scores entail the return of melodic material

---

60 From a narrative point of view, this transcendence to the “Land of Eternity” is reminiscent of the transcendence to Versailles in Tchaikovsky’s *Sleeping Beauty*, a work which had served as a stylistic model for Stravinsky in composing *Le baiser de la fée*. 
that serves as a memory or signifier of the start of the ballet; and both scores create a sense of “temporal arrest” in the final measures through the use of gradual rhythmic augmentation, or “built-in” *morendo*. If the musical techniques used are comparable to those in *Apollo*, then the overall emotive effect of the music is also arguably comparable to the calm, “tragic” detachment in *Apollo*. White, for one, describes the “Lullaby in the Land of Eternity” as “a refrigerated musical coda that depicts the fairy’s everlasting dwelling-place in all its glacial chill.”61 While perhaps partially informed by the original icy setting for this scene, White’s description implies that the music itself is characterized by a certain coldness or calm detachment of character. Although Stravinsky chose to rework Andersen’s ending to focus on the young man in eternity, the “dynamic calm” of the music used to depict his apotheosis suggests that the “Land of Eternity,” like Apollo’s Parnassus, is a distant setting not to be sought with optimistic enthusiasm.

In Stravinsky’s ballet *Le baiser de la fée*, the “apotheosis” retains the same element of fantasy that had characterized the apotheoses of Tchaikovsky’s final ballets-féerie, while simultaneously incorporating an element of introverted “timelessness” from *Apollo*. While Stravinsky’s next major composition was neither a ballet nor based in fantasy, the next chapter will demonstrate how the “apotheosis” finale of the *Symphony of Psalms* nonetheless creates a similar sense of calm, detached timelessness as that found in *Apollo* and *Le baiser de la fée*.

Symphony of Psalms (1930)

One year after the premiere of Le baiser de la fée, Stravinsky received a commission from the Boston Symphony Orchestra to compose a symphonic work in honor of the orchestra’s fiftieth anniversary in 1930. Given a great deal of liberty regarding both the form and content of the work, Stravinsky decided to compose a choral setting of several psalms from the Bible, a project which had apparently been on his mind for some time. Although the musical and narrative parameters of an orchestral-choral setting of Biblical text might seem to have little in common with the parameters of a ballet-féerie, the Symphony of Psalms is in fact related to Stravinsky’s previous two ballets in a variety of ways. Comparable to the endings of Apollo and Le baiser de la fée, the finale of the Symphony of Psalms entails a metaphorical transcendence to a land beyond time and space, a transcendence from which the audience is distanced by means of a “timeless” musical apotheosis.

As in the end of Le baiser de la fée, the existence of an “apotheosis” in the Symphony of Psalms is not reflected directly in the heading of the work’s finale. Instead of “Apothéose,” the finale of the work is given a more utilitarian title: “Molto meno mosso, quarter note = 72 rigorosamente.” Justification for considering this finale an example of “apotheosis,” however, is found in a rich description of the musical passage in Stravinsky’s Dialogues:

I decided to end the work with this music [the “slow-tempo” introduction setting of the text “Laudate Dominum”] also, as an apotheosis of the sort that had become a pattern in my music since the epithalamium at the end of Les Noces. The allegro in Psalm 150 was inspired by a vision of Elijah’s chariot climbing in the Heavens; never before had I written anything quite so literal as the triplets for horns and piano to suggest the horses and chariot. The final hymn of praise must be thought of as issuing from the skies, and agitation is followed by “the calm of praise”—but such statements embarrass me.

---

62 The world premiere of the work was conducted on 13 December 1930 by Ernest Ansermet in Brussels; the American premiere was conducted in Boston on 19 December 1930 by Serge Koussevitsky. See White, Stravinsky: The Composer and his Works, 359-360.
63 See ibid., 360.
64 Stravinsky and Craft, Dialogues, 46.
Stravinsky’s account of the final movement of the *Symphony of Psalms* is insightful in that it suggests the occurrence of two different types of apotheosis in the music. The first and most literal instance is suggested by Stravinsky’s description of his vision of Elijah’s chariot ascending into heaven. Although the Biblical character of Elijah was not apotheosized in the literal sense of “becoming a god,”65 Stravinsky’s prose description of his transcendence and ascension into the Biblical heaven is programmatically comparable to the mythological ascension of Apollo to Parnassus in *Apollo* or of the young man into the fairy-tale “Land of Eternity” in *Le baiser de la fée*. While Stravinsky uses the story of Elijah’s ascension (which is arguably an example of an apotheosis) as an analogy for the whirlwind-like music in the middle of the third movement, it is noteworthy that Stravinsky’s explicit use of the term “apotheosis” does not occur in conjunction with this agitated music. Instead, he reserves the term “apotheosis” for describing the music at the end of the movement, a passage which he refers to as the “the calm of praise”; according to Stravinsky, it is this “final hymn” that represents the work’s true apotheosis.

As in the previous works discussed, the musical portrayal of a calm transcendence in the finale of the *Symphony of Psalms* is partly informed by the work’s “extra-musical” narrative, which is conveyed through the sung text. At a glance, the Biblical texts that Stravinsky chooses form a narrative that begins with an outcry of desperation (Psalm 39:12-13 in movement I), progresses to the relief of deliverance (Psalm 40:1-4 in movement II), and concludes with exhortations of praise (all of Psalm 150 in movement III). Several differences in narrative style exist between Psalms 39 and 40, however, and Psalm 150, the psalm which is set in the third movement and apotheosis. Significantly, the texts that Stravinsky sets from Psalms 39 and 40 are

---

65 The Biblical account of Elijah’s ascent into heaven is given in the second chapter of the book of 2 Kings.
both written in the first person and employ earth-bound temporal perspectives. In imploring the Lord to “look away from me, that I may rejoice again before I depart and am no more” (Ps. 39:13), for example, the psalmist King David assumes an earthly temporal frame of reference as he looks ahead to his eventual physical death. An earthly temporal frame of reference is similarly implied when David describes how “I waited patiently for the Lord” (40:1) and how “He lifted me out of the slimy pit” (40:2). In this instance, the psalmist assumes the time frame of an individual who has already been rescued from tribulation and is now reflecting on the past. In contrast with these passages, however, Psalm 150 is not told in the first person and does not assume any definite time frame. Rather, an anonymous speaker in Psalm 150 delivers thirteen variations on the command to “praise the Lord”; these disembodied exhortations of praise are devoid of phrases that suggest the passage of time. In the context of Stravinsky’s arrangement of these three psalmic texts, the shift away from explicitly earth-bound references of time and space in the narration of Psalm 150 lends the text a certain ambiguous, timeless ethereality not immediately present in Psalms 39 or 40.66

The sense of disembodiment that is achieved at the end of the textual narrative is also reflected in the passage of music that Stravinsky refers to as an “apotheosis” (see Example 3.6). First introduced at the beginning of the third movement, this passage consists of a brief setting of the text “Alleluia, Laudate Dominum” and culminates in an expansive C major chord. Although the chord spans over five octaves and is scored for full orchestra and choir, the potential power of the sonority is kept in check by the homogeneous piano dynamic level throughout the ensemble. With its impressive restraint, this short section is the conclusion of what White

66 Although a sense of timelessness or ethereality may not be the point of this psalm from a theological perspective, this seems to become one of its literary features in Stravinsky’s musical setting of this religious text.
Example 3.6. *Symphony of Psalms*: Movement III, full score of last 8 measures (Boosey and Hawkes, 1948 rev. ed.)
suggests is “one of the most striking passages in all Stravinsky’s music”\(^\text{67}\) (see Example 3.7), a passage which itself is musically comparable to Stravinsky’s previous apotheoses.

The striking effect of this passage is partially a result of the complex textural stratification exhibited in the music, a stratification which diverges from and aligns with the stratification in *Apollo* and *Le baiser de la fée* in various ways. The polyphonic textures of the previous apotheoses had been primarily polyrhythmic in nature, with different layers moving at different rates. By contrast, the polyphony at the end of the *Symphony of Psalms* is more homorhythmic in nature; although the music consists of several independent superimposed ostinati, most voices in the texture move at the same time and at the same rate. Furthermore, although the polyrhythmic endings of *Apollo* and *Le baiser de la fée* exhibit textural stratification, they are not harmonically dense; even when chromatic pitches are employed, rarely more than three or four pitch classes are ever sounded simultaneously. By contrast, the ending of *Symphony of Psalms* is characterized by a greater harmonic density; an average chord in example 3.7, for example, contains around six simultaneously sounded pitch classes, with as many as eight sounded on the third beat of rehearsal 22. Because the dissonance is primarily diatonic in nature, however, the tonality remains relatively consistently centered on E flat, a tonal “stability” which was loosely characteristic of the previous apotheoses discussed.

As in the previous two apotheoses, the stable tonality which results from the stratified texture is not entirely characterized by “stasis.” This idea is corroborated by Horlacher, who sees “development” at the end of the *Symphony of Psalms* as “a product of the changing vertical coincidences created by the strata”; thus, development occurs in the context of music

\(^{67}\) White, *Stravinsky: The Composer and his Works*, 365.
Example 3.7. *Symphony of Psalms*: Movement III, full score of mm. 161-168 (Boosey and Hawkes, 1948 rev. ed.)
characterized by “a steady time signature where the strata are not in a fixed alignment.” To highlight one instance of the complexity of these superimposed strata, Horlacher examines the relationship between the ostinato in the sopranos and the ostinato in the harp and piano in the first five measures of rehearsal 22 (see Example 3.7). Because the ostinato in the harp and piano is four beats in length as compared to the three-beat ostinato of the sopranos, the beginnings of these two ostinati will only coincide in a “cycle” every 12 beats. Stravinsky alters the pattern of the soprano ostinato on the very beat that would have seen the coinciding of the two ostinati, however, and thus avoids an exact repetition of the previous four measures. Similar to the previous two apotheoses, then, the end of the Symphony of Psalms becomes a type of sonic kaleidoscope in which the “stasis” of the ostinati is countered by the unpredictable shifts in textural alignment and their resultant mesmerizing harmonies.

Because of its complex textural stratification, the apotheosis in the Symphony of Psalms might be seen as exhibiting the synchronic juxtaposition of stasis and motion that had contributed to a sense of “timelessness” in Lippman’s “sheer continuity.” At the same time, however, the finale of the Symphony of Psalms lacks some of the more overt symbols of timeless consciousness as evidenced in Stravinsky’s previous two apotheoses. First, melodic material from the first movement (the start of the spiritual journey) does not reappear in the dense closing texture as a musical memory or symbol of temporal synthesis. Additionally, Stravinsky does not incorporate the process of gradual rhythmic augmentation in the ending of the Symphony of Psalms, a gesture which had been a signifier of “temporal arrest” in the apotheoses of Apollo and

---

69 Ibid., 174.
70 This metaphor is derived from Richard Taruskin’s poignant description of the omnibus chord progression (found in Tchaikovsky’s ballets) as a “harmonic pinwheel” (Taruskin, *The Oxford History of Western Music*, 4.146).
Le baiser de la fée. Despite the absence of this specialized signifier of temporal arrest, what Begbie describes as an “approximation to the cessation of change and motion . . . in the music and/or in our perception of it”71 is nonetheless effected through the slow tempo of the apotheosis.72 Indeed, the tempo at rehearsal 22 is the slowest tempo in the entire composition,73 and its slowness is exaggerated by the fact that it follows the faster section which Stravinsky had described in terms of Elijah’s whirlwind ascent to heaven (rehearsal numbers 13-20). In addition to the synchronic juxtaposition of stasis and flow in the stratified texture, then, a sense of timelessness is also created in the apotheosis through the diachronic juxtaposition of the agitation of “Elijah’s ascent” and the grave tempo of the “calm of praise.”

Similar to the previous apotheoses, Stravinsky’s account of the calm nature of this music suggests a connection to his concept of ontological time. More significantly, however, the calmness of the music has also been interpreted by numerous critics and scholars as a quality that serves to distance the audience from the spiritual journey that unfolds through the text and music. Ernest Ansermet, for instance, had suggested this alienation in his assessment of the role of Stravinsky’s faith in the Symphony of Psalms:

As Stravinsky, in response to some form of inner compulsion, does not make of his music an act of self-expression, his religious music can reveal only a kind of “made-up” religiosity. The Symphony of Psalms, for instance, expresses the religiosity of others—of the imaginary choir of which the actual singing choir is an analogon: but it must be agreed that the expression of this religiosity is itself absolutely authentic.74

71 Begbie, Theology, Music and Time, 139.
72 Begbie similarly identifies “music of a very slow tempo” as a characteristic of “timelessness” in the music of Tavener (ibid.).
73 At a glance, the metronome marking for this section (quarter note = 72) might suggest a moderate tempo. A more transparent metronome marking for this section, however, would be “half note = 36”; this marking would more directly reflect the slowness of the basic half-note pulse in the 3/2 meter. At no other point in the score does the basic pulse proceed at such a slow rate.
In commenting on Ansermet, White similarly observes that “the Symphony of Psalms represents a projection of Stravinsky’s own faith through the imagined faith of an anonymous congregation.” Both authors thus imply the existence of a gulf between Stravinsky’s expression of religious faith and his artistic depiction of the spiritual journey in the Symphony of Psalms.

If a chasm exists between the topic of religious transcendence and its artistic depiction in the Symphony of Psalms, it seems that this alienation is effected at least in part through the work’s temporal properties. As Paul Griffiths notes, the Symphony of Psalms is characterized by a “double perspective—of a choir moving forward through time, and of a view of that choir from a time outside their time.” For the choir, this spiritual journey culminates with praising God in the context of a timeless apotheosis, a section of music whose complex texture signifies an equally complex and dense temporality. This intricate temporal web, however, is not directly shared by the audience; although it witnesses the choir’s transcendence to a timeless temporality, the audience is simultaneously distanced from this transcendence by the eerie serenity of the music. As in his previous two ballets, Stravinsky distances the audience from eternity through the creation of a calm, timeless apotheosis, a musical technique which supersedes its historical balletic roots in the finale of the Symphony of Psalms.

---

75 Ibid., 366. As White notes, Stravinsky had rejoined the Russian Orthodox Church in 1926 after a hiatus beginning in 1910. See ibid., 89.
Scènes de ballet (1944)

After composing Apollo in 1928, Stravinsky would not return to the use of the title “Apothéose” until sixteen years later. This next “Apothéose,” however, would differ both dramatically and musically from Stravinsky’s previous use of the term. The new composition was Scènes de ballet (1944), a fifteen-minute ballet commissioned in 1944 by Billy Rose (1899-1966), a song-writer and producer of Broadway musicals. The ballet was premiered in 1944 in Rose’s The Seven Lively Arts, a Broadway revue that also featured comedian Bert Lahr, jazz clarinetist Benny Goodman, Cole Porter songs sung by Beatrice Lillie, paintings by Salvador Dalí (displayed in the lounge), showgirls, a singing chorus, as well as the orchestra and corps de ballet necessary for Stravinsky’s ballet.77 Rose’s initial plan was that his revue should include an abridged version of the second act of Adolphe Adam’s ballet Giselle (1841). Because of a disagreement with the primary dancer, however, Rose was instead compelled to commission a new score for the ballet portion of his revue, and Stravinsky was eventually approached to compose the score. Although the ballet would not be Giselle itself, the scenario for the new ballet was nonetheless to be loosely fashioned after the second act of Adam’s work,78 a ballet which entails the transformation of the title character into a fairy and culminates in the eventual return of her spirit into the grave.79

---


79 At the end of the first act of Giselle, the peasant girl Giselle had killed herself out of despair from her unrequited love for the disguised prince Albrecht. In the second act, Giselle is transformed into a
Despite the fact that the scenario of Scènes is loosely rooted in that of Giselle, Giselle’s various apparitional changes should not be given too much weight in understanding the narrative element in the “Apothéose” of Scènes.\textsuperscript{80} Stravinsky even went so far as to suggest that Scènes lacked a definite narrative program entirely; as Jordan observes, the program notes for the concert version of the ballet contained Stravinsky’s assertion that “this music is patterned after the forms of the classical dance free of any given literary or dramatic argument. The parts follow each other as in a sonata or a symphony, in contrasts or similarities.”\textsuperscript{81} In contrast to the relatively well-defined narratives of Stravinsky’s previous apotheoses, then, the scenario in the “Apothéose” of Scènes is perhaps best approached via White’s necessarily vague account of the “anonymous protagonists danc[ing] their way through to some sort of final transformation.”\textsuperscript{82}

Although the end of Scènes differs from Stravinsky’s earlier apotheoses in terms of narrative clarity, the music at the end of Scènes aligns at least initially with the technical processes and overall calm demeanor of the previous apotheoses. These similarities are evidenced most clearly in the first half of the “Apothéose” (from rehearsal 119 to 123), in which a previously introduced melody is supported by a tranquil texture. In this case, the top textural layer consists of an expanded version of a shorter motive that was first introduced at the start of the ballet (see Example 3.8). This highly syncopated motive returns in the penultimate scene of the ballet (“Danses: Corps de Ballet”; see Example 3.9) in the form of the expanded melody that nocturnal sprite known as a “wili”; although the task of the Siren-like wilis is to lure men to their deaths through dance, Giselle uses her magic powers to save her beloved Albrecht from the other wicked fairies. The ballet ends as the rising sun causes the now-nocturnal Giselle to return to her grave. For an English translation of the scenario for Giselle, see Marian Smith, \textit{Ballet and Opera in the Age of Giselle} (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2000), 227-238.

\textsuperscript{80} That the scenario of Scènes is only loosely based on the scenario of Giselle is suggested by Walsh, who aptly labels Scènes as “a ballet about a ballet about a girl who turns into a fairy” (Walsh, \textit{Stravinsky: The Second Exile}, 161).
\textsuperscript{81} Quoted in Jordan, \textit{Stravinsky Dances}, 266.
\textsuperscript{82} White, \textit{Stravinsky: The Composer and his Works}, 421.
is also set in the beginning of the “Apothéose” (see Example 3.10). Although Stravinsky retains

![Example 3.8. Scènes de ballet: motive from mm. 8-10 (excerpted from Boosey & Hawkes, 1945)](image)

the melody from “Danses” in the “Apothéose,” he does not retain the same rhythmically active texture that had supported the melody in “Danses”; instead, the lively energy from the previous movement is sedated by the relaxed motion of the melody’s new textural setting. Whereas the melody in “Danses” had been accompanied by a pizzicato arpeggiated bass line, for example, the lowest layer in the “Apothéose” consists more simply of sustained arco chords in the low strings.

---

83 Ibid., 424.
A sense of sedation also results from what White describes as the “shimmering radiance”\(^\text{84}\) of the violins and trumpet, the tremolos of which are a prime example of musical motion so rapid that it is perceived only as a static sonic blur.\(^\text{85}\)

Although this calm setting of a previously introduced melody might suggest a link to the serene “timelessness” of Stravinsky’s previous apotheoses, the relative textural simplicity of this passage in *Scènes* arguably makes it a weaker example of the languid yet complex temporality of “sheer continuity.”\(^\text{86}\) The divergence from this sense of timelessness is further evidenced because the serenity of this music is not sustained until the end of the “Apothéose”; rather, the relative sense of motionlessness is soon abandoned in favor of a more triumphant ending. The beginnings of this shift are seen as early as the seventh measure of the “Apothéose,” at which point a more homorhythmic texture is subtly introduced as the whole notes in the lower strings are exchanged for quarter notes (articulated on the off-beat, as in the rest of the parts). The shift is further solidified in measure 11, at which point the full orchestra enters with *fortissimo* block chords that shatter the lacy texture from the start of the “Apothéose.” As if to lessen this shock, the orchestra immediately falls to a *subito mezzo-forte* before rising to a *fortissimo* level again two beats later (a process which is repeated two more times to reinforce this dynamic transition). The bombastic triumph of the scene is confirmed as the full orchestra grows to a *fff* level and

\(^{84}\) Ibid.

\(^{85}\) Although the greater serenity in the “Apothéose” is primarily a factor of the change toward a more relaxed accompanimental texture, a slight change in tempo from the start of the previous movement (from “eighth note = 108” in “Danses” to “eighth note = 100” in the “Apothéose”) also contributes to the sense of serenity at the start of the “Apothéose.”

\(^{86}\) In previous chapters, the timelessness of “sheer continuity” was associated with complex polyphony that seemed to suggest the simultaneous passage and cessation of time. Although “sheer continuity” could certainly be evidenced in other types of musical textures, the relatively simple texture of this passage does not necessarily warrant labeling it as an example of this unique temporality.
Example 3.11. *Scènes de ballet*: “Apothèose,” rehearsal 127 (mm. 18-22) (Boosey & Hawkes, 1945)
beyond on the final C major chord (with an added B natural) to end the ballet (see Example 3.11).  

From a technical point of view, this bombastic ending is similar to the earlier restrained apotheoses in that it provides a degree of thematic unity to the ballet. The syncopated motive in Example 3.8 is spread out over the final eleven measures of Scènes; each pitch is reiterated several times as the highest voices in the rhythmically syncopated texture gradually make the melodic ascent of the minor third from A to C. This thematic unity is arguably overshadowed, however, by the forceful Lisztian ending that marks a divergence from the detached musical apotheoses of Stravinsky’s earlier neoclassical works. The musical force at the end of Scènes is accounted for poetically by White, who describes the closing off-beat block chords as “gather[ing] in strength like cumulus clouds at sunset.” Curiously, however, White ultimately concludes that “the work ends in the same kind of transcendental splendour as The Wedding and Apollo Musagetes.” Although the beginning of the “Apothéose” is certainly reminiscent of the “delta of great serenity and calm” that White attributes to the end of Apollo, there seem to be few immediate musical similarities between the quiet “timelessness” of Apollo and the resounding triumph at the end of the “Apothéose” in Scènes. In fact, the end of Scènes is unique among the apotheoses considered thus far in that it alone fits Meyer’s theoretical concept of “apotheosis” as a unifying technique which “literally overwhelms the listener” through its “force

---

87 Jordan addresses the temporality of this passage through her suggestion that “pedal notes or chords as well as ostinatos create a static effect over a period of time, likewise melodic lines oscillating around a centre . . . The jubilant ending of the piece on the chord of C major is effective through reiteration rather than as expected culmination or resolution. In another sense then, the ballet is frozen in time” (Jordan, Stravinsky Dances, 276). Because the “timelessness” in this passage results from the repetition of the homorhythmic block chords, however, the musical “stasis” of this “Apothéose” is not immediately comparable to the processes of “sheer continuity” as were explored in conjunction with the greater textural complexity of Stravinsky’s previous apotheoses.

88 White, Stravinsky: The Composer and his Works, 424.

89 Ibid., 344.
and magnitude.”

Thus, from a musical point of view, the immediacy of the triumph that it conveys sets the bombastic conclusion of Scènes apart from the detachment of the apotheoses of Apollo, Le baiser de la fée, or the Symphony of Psalms.

The musical triumph at the end of Scènes was accounted for in non-musical terms by Stravinsky himself, who related later on in life that

I envisaged, for the finale, a stage full of groups twirling and mounting “delirando.” . . . I like the Apotheosis best of all and, especially, the voicing of the chords in the introduction to it, with the repetition of the upper line in canon and in different harmonic contexts. The Apotheosis was composed on the day of the liberation of Paris. I remember that I interrupted my work every few minutes to listen to the radio reports. I think my jubilation is in the music.

According to Stravinsky, it would seem that the Dionysian delirium of the “Apothéose” represented at some level his musical reaction to learning of the liberation of Paris. While this explanation might be viewed with suspicion as an ex post facto attempt to posit the exuberant “Apothéose” as a musical monument of this historic event, it does seem that the liberation of Paris would have been a cause for personal joy or relief for Stravinsky; Walsh relates that Stravinsky had been following the war carefully, in part because his son Soulima was in Paris, and Stravinsky was anxious about his safety. Furthermore, there is evidence to suggest that Stravinsky’s learning of the liberation in August 1944 did in fact coincide with a definite compositional decision to alter the overall character of the finale. Walsh relates that Stravinsky had originally planned to compose a simpler ending to Scènes; one might speculate that, had Stravinsky not been “influenced” by learning of this monumental event, the last eleven measures of the “Apothéose” would have more closely resembled the restrained, “timeless” endings of

---

90 Meyer, Style and Music, 204.
91 Stravinsky and Craft, Dialogues, 50. In this case, the forceful musical conclusion and the use of a large corps de ballet link the “Apothéose,” at least casually, to the tradition of apotheosis in nineteenth-century ballet.
92 See Walsh, Stravinsky: The Second Exile, 160.
Apollo, Le baiser de la fée, and Symphony of Psalms. Instead, Stravinsky’s forceful ending to Scènes would seem to come closer to realizing his own version of die Ideale, one in which Schiller’s vision of universal brotherhood assumes the form of the composer’s expressed solidarity with the Parisians and their freedom at the hands of the Allied forces.

In short, there is little reason to disbelieve Stravinsky’s historical justification for the bombastic conclusion of this “Apothéose.” This point has not shielded the finale, however, from criticism on an aesthetic level. Walsh, for one, suggests that the music in the final version of the “Apothéose” ultimately inflates from the simple “finale” of the original outline into a peroration as extended as, and a great deal more grandiose than, the equivalent ending of the Symphony of Psalms or The Fairy’s Kiss, and it culminates in a sequence of uncouth fortissimo chords that can only be understood as a response, so to speak outside the frame of the work, to events that have not concerned it, still do not concern it, and in some way betray its innocence.

One might wonder why the fortissimo ending of Scènes should “betray the innocence” of Scènes? It is unlikely that Walsh refers here to the belief that art exists in a sphere unaffected by world events and human interpretations of those events, including interpretations of events by people not directly involved in them. A more likely interpretation could be that, for Walsh, it is as if Stravinsky had forsaken the detached and controlled musical endings from his earlier neoclassical days (such as in Le baiser de la fée or the Symphony of Psalms), preferring instead to amuse himself with an ending that revived the emotional excesses of Romanticism. From this point of view, then, it is not that the listener is distanced from the detached musical depiction of

---

93 See ibid., 161. Unfortunately, Walsh does not describe further the original sketches for the “Apothéose.” Access to these sketches would be necessary for further investigation into how the original version of the “Apothéose” would have compared to the apotheoses of the previous works discussed. White notes that, at least as late as 1966, Stravinsky’s collection of manuscripts included “an envelope containing thirty pages of pencil sketches [for Scènes]; undated and unsigned” (White, Stravinsky: The Composer and his Works, 615). These sketches may now possibly be located in the Sacher Stiftung in Switzerland, but this point needs to be verified. See Jordan, “Scènes de ballet: Ashton and Stravinsky Modernism,” 66, n.20.

94 Walsh, Stravinsky: The Second Exile, 161.
“apotheosis” in Scènes; rather, the historically informed listener perhaps remains “unconvinced” by the use of Romantic bombast to end an otherwise restrained composition. Such ambivalence regarding the effectiveness of the “Apothéose” seems to have been a common trope throughout the history of the ballet. To give one example, French composer Robert Siohan had criticized the work through his assertion that “the score is so perfectly suited to the bombastic style of this type of show business.”\(^9^5\) Although such views may also reflect a degree of cultural elitism regarding the ballet’s premiere in a Broadway revue, Walsh nonetheless seems justified in his historical observation that Scènes was “the Stravinsky score most often accused of vulgarity,” a score which various critics would agree was “weakened by material slightly below the composer’s best.”\(^9^6\)

While it is true that the final measures of Scènes break with Stravinsky’s neoclassical trend of quiet and restrained endings, it is not difficult to imagine what Stravinsky’s reply to such criticisms might have entailed. In an innocent and nonchalant defense of The Rake’s Progress in 1953, for example, Stravinsky redirects the energy of the criticism leveled at him back towards his critics: “I never understand what exactly are the critics complaining about when criticizing my music . . . The critics, if sincere, are usually disappointed at not finding in my music what they are looking for.”\(^9^7\) Stravinsky thus questions the credibility of his detractors by emphasizing what he views as an inherent right of the composer: the right to compose music that need not conform to outsiders’ expectations, even those expectations that arise from patterns established in the composer’s earlier works.

\(^9^7\) Quoted in Joseph, Stravinsky Inside Out, 8.
Setting Stravinsky’s appeals to aesthetic relativism temporarily aside, what is to be made of the fact that the “Apothéose” in Scènes seems to diverge from the apotheoses (either explicitly labeled or implied) of Stravinsky’s earlier works? It has already been suggested that the bombastic conclusion of the ballet was indeed informed by the political context of its composition. The mere question of why Stravinsky composed a loud ending, however, is not as critical as understanding what this ending reveals about two different conceptions of “apotheosis”: Stravinsky’s own conception of “apotheosis,” and the modern theoretical conception of the “timeless musical apotheosis” in his music. From a historical point of view, the ending of Scènes suggests that what Stravinsky did not unilaterally associate “apotheosis” with was a soft, restrained ending. Although the end of Scènes is connected to Stravinsky’s other “Apotéoses” in terms of its thematic unity, perhaps the most important element for understanding what “apotheosis” did mean for Stravinsky is the numerous allusions that the composer makes to nineteenth-century ballet throughout Scènes as a whole. These various narrative and musical connections between Scènes and nineteenth-century ballets are indicators of Stravinsky’s concern for aligning himself with tradition, even while writing for a Broadway revue. Perhaps the bombastic ending of Scènes served for Stravinsky as a critique of the ballet’s popular venue, even as the composer sought to validate his music via thematic unity in the “Apotéose,” the very title of which implied a connection to the golden age of ballet.98

From a theoretical point of view, the loud ending of this finale suggests that reception history has created a false impression of what “apotheosis” entails in Stravinsky’s music. For Stravinsky, the idea of “apotheosis” ultimately served to connect his music to musical traditions of the past, a point which is seemingly overlooked in the modern understanding of the “timeless

---

98 The loud ending of Scènes could also serve as a nod to nineteenth-century ballet and their apotheoses, many of which would have ended with some type of forceful musical conclusion.
apotheosis” in Stravinsky’s music. Furthermore, this conception of the “timeless apotheosis” is not even internally consistent within itself. Unlike the previous apotheoses, which were set in eternity and thus invited an interpretation of the restrained music as evoking what has been referred to as the paradoxical “temporality of timelessness,” *Scènes* is not as easily described in these same eternal terms. With its abstract narrative and forceful music, the ending of *Scènes* does not seem to signify the antithetical “temporality of timelessness” to the same extent as the previous apotheoses. The fact that the “timeless apotheosis” has become more a function of theory than of history was first evidenced in the finales of *Le baiser de la fée* and *Symphony of Psalms*, finales which were suggested to be examples of “timeless apotheoses” despite not bearing the label “Apothéose.” If this theoretical concept of timelessness can be applied to finales not entitled “Apothéose,” it is perhaps unsurprising that this theory cannot necessarily be applied to a finale simply because it bears this title. The conclusion of *Scènes* ultimately suggests that the theoretical concept of the “timeless apotheosis” diverges from the historical concept of “apotheosis” from which its name is derived.

---

99 This is not necessarily to claim that what has been referred to in this thesis as the “temporality of timelessness” can only be signified by quiet music, or by music that entails an extra-musical program related to the concept of eternity.
If Stravinsky ultimately diverged from the trend of composing a restrained, detached setting of an apothecosis with a well-defined dramatic scenario in Scènes, he would resume the trend in his ballet Orpheus (1948), the last work in the composer’s neoclassical period to contain a finale explicitly entitled “Apothéose.” The ballet was premiered at the Ballet Society in New York on 28 April 1948 (20 years and one day after the premiere of Apollo) following the commission from impresario Lincoln Kirstein, who was eager for Stravinsky to compose a Greek “sequel” to Apollo.\(^{100}\) The story of Orpheus thus provided a logical narrative continuation of Stravinsky’s Apollo; while Apollo tells the story of Apollo’s birth and apotheosis, Orpheus tells the well-known myth of Apollo’s son Orpheus in the underworld. In Stravinsky’s retelling of the myth, the standard beginning of the story is omitted, which traditionally entails the interruption of the wedding-day celebration by a messenger informing Orpheus of the death of Eurydice, his new bride. Instead, the scenario presupposes this information and begins with the indication that “Orpheus weeps for Eurydice. He stands motionless, with his back to the audience.”\(^{101}\) After Orpheus descends to the underworld, charms the keeper of the underworld with his music, dances blindfolded with Eurydice, and loses her again after removing his blindfold, Orpheus is attacked and dismembered by the Bacchantes. In the third and final scene, entitled “Apothéose d’Orphée,” the written scenario indicates that “Apollo appears. He wrests the lyre from Orpheus

\(^{100}\) For a more detailed account of the commission for Orpheus, see Joseph, Stravinsky and Balanchine, 185.

\(^{101}\) Igor Stravinsky, Orpheus (New York: Boosey & Hawkes, 1948), 1. The beginning of this scenario is comparable to the beginning of the scenario of Gluck’s Orfeo ed Euridice (1762), which also presupposes the death of Eurydice. Significantly, Balanchine (the choreographer of Stravinsky’s Orpheus) had staged a ballet version of Gluck’s opera in New York in 1936, a connection which perhaps accounts for the presupposition of Eurydice’s death at the start of Stravinsky’s Orpheus. See Craft, The Moment of Existence, 292.
and raises his song heavenwards.” Orpheus thus concludes with the bleak yet abstract apotheosis of the title character, as the murdered Orpheus undergoes a transcendent apotheosis only in the sense that the immortalization of his spirit is suggested through the ascension of his lyre and the glorification of his music.103

While Stravinsky’s setting the Orpheus myth may have represented a logical continuation of the narrative from Apollo, the choice of subject must have also represented a somewhat bold move for the composer. Stravinsky’s decision to write a composition on this popular Greek myth placed him in a long line of composers who had treated the subject in musical form—Monteverdi (1607), Gluck (1762), Liszt (1854), and Offenbach (1858), to name a few—and Stravinsky would have been aware of the burden associated with this tradition.104 Highly conscious of his status as a leading composer of contemporary music, Stravinsky would have been attracted to the prospect of composing a musical setting of Orpheus as a means of inviting a comparison between himself and these renowned composers of the past.105

Although the restrained diatonic “simplicity” of some of Stravinsky’s earlier neoclassical compositions had been met with confusion by listeners expecting another Le Sacre du printemps,

---

102 Ibid., 57. Walsh notes that the “Apothéose” was choreographed with “Orpheus’s severed head sing[ing] on and Apollo present[ing] the singer’s lyre to heaven”; see Walsh, Stravinsky: The Second Exile, 195-196.
103 As Joseph notes, Stravinsky and Balanchine had based the libretto for the ballet primarily on the legend of Orpheus as told in the Metamorphoses by the Roman poet Ovid. The ballet’s libretto diverges from Ovid’s account, however, regarding the end of myth; among other minor points, while Ovid relates that Apollo reunites the deceased Orpheus with his Eurydice, Eurydice is tragically omitted from Stravinsky’s libretto. Perhaps comparable to the ending of Le baiser de la fée, then, the end of Orpheus leaves unanswered questions regarding the fate of secondary characters. For a further account of the creation of the libretto for Orpheus, see Joseph, Stravinsky and Balanchine, 195-196.
104 White observes that Stravinsky had been studying the music of Monteverdi during the composition of Orpheus (see White, Stravinsky: The Composer and his Works, 441). In reflecting on his compositional process, however, Stravinsky seemed eager to distance himself from any “influences” in the work, and asserted that “Monteverdi is not a presence in the end movements.” See Igor Stravinsky, Themes and Conclusions (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982 [1966]), 53.
the understatement of Orpheus seems to have been taken in greater stride by some of the critics.

One poignant 1950 review by the British dance critic A.V. Coton (1906-1969) offers keen insight into the ballet’s temporal-spatial properties; as Coton suggested, “the Time is eternity and the Place is everywhere that Man inhabits, in this dreadful and simple statement of the classic myth; sometimes the movement is so simple that only the most exquisite performers can keep the shape of the incidents inside the frameworks of both the music and the stage-space.”

Coton’s account of the temporality of Orpheus is particularly descriptive of the “Apothóose,” where there exists a notable disjuncture between the limited magnitude of the various performing forces and the infinite dimensions of the eternal temporality which those forces are used to signify.

According to the ballet’s written scenario, the choreographic focus of the “Apothóose” does not center on a corps de ballet, but instead centers simply on the individual of Apollo in the act of guiding Orpheus’s spirit into heaven. The choreographic restrictions of the “Apothóose” are also complemented musically by the sparse instrumentation of the score. Although the work as a whole calls for a sizeable orchestra, Stravinsky scores the majority of the “Apothóose” for only two horns, muted trumpet, harp, and two solo violins, none of which ever exceed a mezzo-forte dynamic level. From at least a modern perspective, then, these elements of the “Apothóose”

---

would seem to contribute to the current perception of the subtle restraint that is often associated with the concept of the “timeless apotheosis” in Stravinsky’s music.  

Beyond the contemplative soft dynamics of the small orchestra, a sense of timelessness is evoked more directly at the end of *Orpheus* through the musical materials employed within these parameters. One specific musical element that contributes to the sense of temporal cessation in the “Apolhése” is the Phrygian scales in the harp, scales which Joseph suggests are “a marvel of stasis, capturing not only the music’s eternalness but also the ancient power of the myth it seeks to evoke.” Significantly, these scales were first heard at the start of the ballet in what Joseph describes as “motionlessly descending” form (see Example 3.12). Now presented in the “Apolhése” in what might well be termed “motionlessly ascending” guise, the rising Phrygian scales create an experiential bond between the memory of Orpheus’s descent into Hades and the present reality of his spirit floating skywards (see Example 3.13).

Example 3.12. *Orpheus*: harp melody in mm. 1-2 (excerpted from Boosey & Hawkes, 1948)

If this musical memory from the start of the ballet creates a sense of “stasis” in the “Apolhése,” this temporal effect is complemented synchronically by a fugue-like passage for

---

107 As was suggested in the previous section, subtleties in orchestration and dynamic levels would not have been at the core of Stravinsky’s concept of “apotheosis,” as the “Apolhése” in *Scènes* ended with full orchestra at a ***fff*** dynamic level.

108 Ibid., 207.

109 Ibid.

110 Unlike in Stravinsky’s previous apotheoses, this musical “memory” does not undergo any process akin to rhythmic augmentation, and the metronome markings for both the first scene and the “Apolhése” (“Lento sostenuto,” quarter note = 69) are exactly identical. If the repetitive scales in the harp contribute to a sense of “stasis,” they would seem to do so not by suggesting a time that has been slowed down, but rather by signifying a time which is incessant in its passage.
two horns which creates a sense of forward drive (see Example 3.13).\footnote{Previously in the ballet, the horn(s) had generally played an accompanimental role, and any writing for multiple horns was almost exclusively homorhythmic, so the switch to a polyphonic texture for the horns as melody instruments in the “Apotéose” is all the more striking.} The “fugue” begins in a somewhat traditional way, with the first horn presenting the fugal subject and the second horn entering three bars later with the fugal answer a fifth lower (albeit with several chromatically altered pitches); the internal logic of this contrapuntal imitation lends the fugue a sense of self-propelled energy. The imitation does not continue in such a strict fashion indefinitely, however,
and after three measures the second horn breaks away from the fugal exposition, creating a freer style of counterpoint between the two voices. The two voices’ engagement in this dynamic “pas de deux” of strict imitation and freer counterpoint lends the music an alternating sense of measured progress and unhurried wandering over time.

When the dynamism of the self-propelled horn fugue is considered together with the stasis of the harp scales, the resultant polyphonic texture exhibits a multi-directional temporal motion which is characteristic of the synchronic “fusion of passage and constancy”112 of Lippman’s “sheer continuity” or of what has been referred to in this thesis as a “temporality of timelessness.” The overall effect of this complex motion is intimated in passing by Balanchine, who recalled collaborating with Stravinsky on the “Apothéose” at the composer’s California home: “Stravinsky said, ‘I’ll write the end [of Orpheus] first; I sometimes have an appetite to write the end first.’ And that’s what he did, with the two horns—it’s a beautiful thing, sad, hair flowing. We couldn’t have a river on stage, but it suggests something like that.”113 Balanchine’s perhaps inconsequential reference to a river brings to mind the same temporal concepts as were explored in regard to Lippman’s “sheer continuity” and the musical imagery at the start of Das Rheingold; just as the literary image of a river superimposes the concept of “unceasing or relentless movement” with “timelessness and permanence,”114 so time flows ever onward in the “Apothéose,” even as Orpheus’s song wafts heavenward in seemingly frozen motion.

Although the superimposition of the “static” harp scales and the “dynamic” horn fugue superficially suggests the temporal features characteristic of “sheer continuity,” the complex relationship between these two musical entities warrants a closer look at this passage. Instead of

---

113 Jonathan Cott, Portrait of Mr. B (New York: Viking, 1984), 144, quoted in Joseph, Stravinsky and Balanchine, 193.
simply layering the Phrygian scales and fugue simultaneously in the texture, the horn fugue is
twice interrupted by a more texturally active harp solo which is layered on top of the simple yet
incessant Phrygian scales (see Example 3.13, two mm. before rehearsal 146). The effect is
described poignantly by Stravinsky as related by Nicolas Nabokov:

Then, coming to a passage in the Epilogue where a harp solo interrupts the slow progress
of the fugue, he [Stravinsky] would stop and say, “here, you see, I cut off the fugue with
a pair of scissors.” . . . “I introduced this short harp phrase, like two bars of an
accompaniment. Then the horns go on with their fugue as if nothing had happened. I
repeat it at regular intervals, here and here again. . . . You can eliminate these harp-solo
interruptions, paste the parts of the fugue together, and it will be one whole piece.” I
[Nabokov] asked him why he introduced the harp solo. “What was the point of cutting up
the fugue this way?”

He smiled maliciously, as if he were letting me in on one of his private secrets.
“But did you hear?” He turned the pages to the middle of the score. “It is a reminder of
this—the Song of Orpheus.” And he added thoughtfully: “Here in the Epilogue it sounds
like a kind of . . . compulsion, like something unable to stop . . . Orpheus is dead, the
song is gone, but the accompaniment goes on.”

As Stravinsky implies, this musical memory, in the “Apothéose,” of Orpheus in the
underworld is not incorporated in a way that creates a seamless musical texture, as was done
with the melodic “memories” in the finales of Apollo or Le baiser de la fée. Instead, the
diachronic manner in which Stravinsky integrates this musical memory into the texture—by
plunging it into the middle of the horn fugue—creates a disturbing ripple on the music’s glassy
surface. If Walsh is correct in describing the horn fugue in general as “strange and austerely
beautiful,” its musical dissection is a central contributing factor to its cold isolation.

---

115 Nicolas Nabokov, Old Friends and New Music (Boston: Little, Brown, 1951), 203-204, quoted in
Joseph, Stravinsky and Balanchine, 208.
116 Stravinsky’s suggestion that this accompanimental harp solo serves as a memory of Orpheus in the
underworld would rely in part on the audience’s ability to recognize this music after having heard it
earlier in the ballet. Although the disjunct motion of this passage in the “Apothéose” is vaguely
reminiscent of some of the disjunct passages for harp in Orpheus’s earlier “Air de danse” (which is set in
the underworld), the exact musical material itself in the “Apothéose” does not seem to have appeared
anywhere else in the score.
117 Walsh, Stravinsky: The Second Exile, 196.
This musical fragmentation and emotional detachment at the end of *Orpheus* may be understood in part in terms of the general tragedy of the ballet’s scenario. The apotheosis of Orpheus is not the same graceful affair as the apotheosis of Apollo, an apotheosis which was only partially tinged with melancholy. Whereas Apollo’s deification was the culmination of a ballet whose elegance bordered on the bland, Orpheus’s apotheosis is the culmination of a rugged story entailing twice the loss of love, thwarted hopes, and physical dismemberment. Although the soft dynamics may superficially convey a sense of calm, the fragmentation of the intricate musical texture subtly reflects the tumultuous and uninviting journey that has led to Orpheus’s disembodied transcendence into eternity. These qualities are reflected musically through what Walsh describes as the “severely hieratic tone” of the “Apothéose,” a tone which “lends the action a mysterious, repressed quality—the character of a liturgy enacted beyond the iconostasis.”\(^{118}\) The audience may witness the transcendence of Orpheus, but it does so only from behind the holy curtain of eternity, a thick temporal partition which shields the audience from an unfathomable apotheosis into a timeless existence.

CONCLUSION: ENGRAFTED BRANCHES OF APOTHEOSIS

This thesis has investigated the finales of five different compositions from Stravinsky’s neoclassical period, all of which are related to one of several interrelated concepts of “apotheosis.” 1 As was shown, only three of these finales (Apollo, Scènes, and Orpheus) are apotheoses “proper” in the sense that the term “Apothéose” actually appears in the score. By contrast, Le baiser de la fée and the Symphony of Psalms (the finales for neither of which are entitled “Apothéose”) were included in this study as exemplifications of “timeless musical apotheoses,” a modern-day concept which was likely inspired by the musical restraint and the narrative transcendence to eternity that characterize the “Apothéoses” of Apollo and Orpheus. A primary assertion of this thesis was that exactly how “timelessness” is signified in these “timeless musical apotheoses” has not been well understood. It was for this reason that this thesis developed and applied to Stravinsky’s apotheoses the idea of the “temporality of timelessness,” an antithetical model in which the passage and cessation of time are synthesized; it was suggested that this juxtaposition of temporal stasis and flow was loosely analogous to the synchronic juxtaposition of musical stasis and flow in Stravinsky’s “apotheoses.”

Although this lens of “timelessness” provides a fresh way of viewing the temporal properties of Stravinsky’s apotheoses, there can be little question that the concept of the “timeless musical apotheosis” (and, by implication, the “temporality of timelessness”) is primarily a reflection of how modern theorists perceive “timelessness” to be manifested in music. The reason why the idea of “timelessness” has become attached to the concept of

---

1 In addition to the apotheoses of Liszt and Tchaikovsky, the Baroque instrumental genre of the “apothéose” represents another strand of “apotheosis” that may have played a role in Stravinsky’s conception of “apotheosis.” Given the fact that the most famous specimens of this genre were compositions by Couperin, a composer with connections to Versailles, Stravinsky would likely have been intrigued by this genre and its associations with this quintessential icon of the aristocracy. Additional research is necessary to investigate whether Stravinsky would have known of these compositions, and whether or not they may have informed his own conception of “apotheosis.”
“apotheosis” is likely located in the grandiose definition of the latter word; because “apotheosis” literally means “deification,” and because divine beings are sometimes thought of as existing outside of time, it may be natural to assume that the process of “apotheosis” would entail some type of transcendence into eternity. Such a perception is reinforced in Stravinsky’s music, because the scenarios in two of his “Apothéoses” (Apollo and Orpheus) do entail the transcendence of characters to a place beyond time. Furthermore, because the soft yet texturally complex music in these two “Apothéoses” is particularly intriguing, describing this contemplative music with an adjective such as “timeless” not only relates the music to the drama onstage, but also provides a poetic way of accounting for the captivating intricacies of the music.

At a glance, this modern theoretical “timeless musical apotheosis” would seem to be given a grain of historical foundation in a short passage from Stravinsky’s Dialogues, in which the composer refers to the calm musical finale of the Symphony of Psalms as “an apotheosis of the sort that had become a pattern in my music since the epithalamium at the end of Les Noces.”

Because it was suggested that Stravinsky had primarily inherited the concept of “apotheosis” from Tchaikovsky, for whom the term likely had little intrinsic musical significance, a hasty reading of this passage might suggest that, at least by the publication of Dialogues in 1961, Stravinsky had come to view “apotheosis” as a word suitable for describing musical qualities. Furthermore, it might be surmised that because the Symphony of Psalms was not a ballet, “apotheosis” for Stravinsky apparently became at least partially detached from its original balletic moorings. Stravinsky’s brief reference to “apotheosis” in this passage, however, must be seen in the broader context of his music and memoirs. Beyond this single reference in Dialogues, Stravinsky gives seemingly little other indication in his memoirs that his own conception of “apotheosis” would have been primarily a function of music; if a specifically musical conception

---

2 Stravinsky and Craft, Dialogues, 46.
of “apotheosis” had been important for Stravinsky, it seems probable that he would have devoted a greater part of his various memoirs to this concept. Furthermore, the simple fact remains that Stravinsky only wrote the term “Apothéose” in his music on three occasions, always in the context of ballet, and that little else connects all three “Apothéoses” musically besides the principle of thematic unity and the composer’s general preoccupation with engaging with musical traditions of the past. To the extent that the term did interest Stravinsky, “apotheosis” was probably neither purely musical nor completely separate from the realm of ballet, and the composer’s primary reason for using the term “Apothéose” was likely to suggest a link between his own compositions and past musical traditions, with especial focus on nineteenth-century ballet.

Because the concept of the “timeless musical apotheosis” may not be easily applied to a finale simply because it is entitled “Apothéose,” and because this concept has been cultivated and applied to finales which do not bear this title, it is evident the “timeless musical apotheosis” is not necessarily a direct outgrowth of Stravinsky’s historical concept of “apotheosis.” Rather, theories of musical affect and “timelessness” have been grafted into this historical tradition by modern theorists. If the reception history of Stravinsky’s finales has not accurately reflected the composer’s understanding of “apotheosis,” however, such historicism has not necessarily been the aim of modern theorists. Although the “timeless musical apotheosis” cannot be unambiguously associated with one master concept of “apotheosis,” it is hoped that this exploration of the paradoxical “temporality of timelessness” will foster further research into both the “timeless musical apotheosis” and the repertoire of “apotheoses” in which this theoretical branch has blossomed.

3 Although the paradoxical model of the “temporality of timelessness” was not directly applied to the bombastic conclusion of Scènes, this is not to suggest that this model could not be somehow adapted to argue that this “Apothéose” might signify some degree of “timelessness.”
BIBLIOGRAPHY


