SITE AND SANCTUARY IN HOLOCAUST MEMORIAL COMPOSITIONS
BY KRZYSZTOF PENDERECKI AND RUTH FAZAL

Katherine L. Hubley

A Thesis
Submitted to the Graduate College of Bowling Green
State University in partial fulfillment of
the requirements for the degree of

MASTER OF MUSIC

August 2009

Committee:
Robert Fallon, Advisor
Mary Natvig
ABSTRACT

Robert Fallon, Advisor

This interdisciplinary thesis seeks to show how musical Holocaust memorial works that contain theatrical elements in the text and musical score fulfill a social psychological need and provide opportunities for collective cathartic experience for the listener. The study draws on the academic fields of aesthetics, musicology, German history, theater and performance studies, Jewish and Christian religious studies, psychological trauma theory, and literature and the environment studies.

I focus on two contrasting compositions, Dies Irae by Krzysztof Penderecki and Oratorio Terezin by Ruth Fazal. Through textual and musical analysis, I illustrate how the experience of hearing performances of these works is analogous to a current therapeutic approach for working through the effects of mass trauma.
I dedicate this thesis to my dear father and friend,

Dr. Charles Emerson Hubley,

who taught me how to write.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to thank my committee, Dr. Robert Fallon and Dr. Mary Natvig, for generously providing their support and guidance, sharing their time and knowledge, and offering their bottomless patience during the process of writing this thesis.
Because this thesis concerns how the Holocaust influenced people’s lives, I am compelled to write about how the Holocaust played a role in my own life. I am a female gentile who grew up mostly in Canada and the United States in the 1960s, immersed with television screenings of documentaries of the events of World War II (The Rise and Fall of the Third Reich, for example) and assigned readings of The Diary of Anne Frank and Victor Frankl’s Man’s Search for Meaning. My best friend in public school was Jewish, as were many of my father’s scientific colleagues. One of his colleagues, as a boy, had escaped the Nazis on his bicycle with his violin tucked under his arm, following his mother’s instruction as she boarded a train behind him. My second violin teacher, whose sister advised him to abandon his studies, took the last train available to Jews out of Vienna. There are so many stories. Those I heard and documentary images I saw during formative years may have partially drawn me to the difficult subject of the Holocaust.

However, as one who has not lost family members under horrific circumstances, nor has been in the presence of such familial memories, it is impossible for me to personally understand the impact of the Holocaust.

One significant early event in my life related to a place of loss was a childhood visit in 1962 to the site of the Battle at Gettysburg, notably the bloodiest battle of the Civil War. I recall naively running and stomping on the soft grassy fields with my siblings, and later, at the visitor’s center, watching a reenactment of
Abraham Lincoln delivering his famous Gettysburg Address (Nov. 19, 1863) at the dedication of the Cemetery. The president said,

We are met on a great battle-field of that war. We have come to dedicate a portion of that field, as a final resting place for those who gave their lives … but, in a larger sense we can not dedicate – we can not consecrate – we can not hallow – this ground. The brave men, living and dead, who struggled here, have consecrated it, far above our poor power to add or detract. The world will little note, nor long remember what we say here, but it can never forget what they did here.¹

Lincoln eloquently expresses the concept of people themselves consecrating sites where they suffered. For the purpose of this thesis I adopt this concept with respect to the function of musical Holocaust memorial works. The memorials do not in and of themselves create sacred space. The victims of the concentration camps created the sacred space through their human sacrifice and suffering. The memorials serve as markers, collectively and publicly, reminding us of human sacrifices.²

The placing of memorial stones or steles on sites where significant events have occurred has been part of Jewish tradition since God made His covenant to Jacob: “Jacob took the stone that he had put under his head [as a pillow for sleeping] and set it up as a pillar and poured oil on the top of it. He named the site Bethel.”³

² In 2006, Lincoln historian Gabor Boritt wrote that Lincoln, in spite of having attended funerals, was probably unaware of the religious referent to the Christian and Jewish “rite of sanctifying a piece of earth for the burial of the dead…only after imbibing the atmosphere at the cemetery, the uncovered heads, prayer, and hymns, did he add, in a moment’s inspiration, ‘under God.’ It was natural that Lincoln’s speech “carried rhythms of the Bible…the music of the ancient Hebrew and Greek turned in King James’ English…[as] this was the language he was raised on.” Gabor Boritt, The Gettysburg Gospel: the Lincoln Speech that Nobody Knows (New York: Simon and Schuster, 2006), 120.
³ Genesis 28:19.
The land, Bethel, later named Israel, promised by God is fundamental to the Jewish people and their religion. Throughout history, the Jewish people have been in exile in diasporas around the world and although there were painful ideological divisions about the Zionist movement and the reformation of Israel from 1946 to 1949, the concept of place still remains a Jewish theme that also runs throughout the musical works discussed herein.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER 1. APPROACHING MUSICAL HOLOCAUST MEMORIALS</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Outline......................................................</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Musicological Scholarship................................</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany since World War II..................................</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historians, Artists, and Holocaust Memorials.............</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roles of Memory.............................................</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trauma Theory................................................</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theater as Therapy.........................................</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Composers Respond to World War II..........................</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Place in Judaism............................................</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 2. DIES IRAE BY KRZYSZTOF PENDERECKI ...........</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background...................................................</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History of Auschwitz........................................</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Text..........................................................</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Musical Analysis.............................................</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 3. ORATORIO TEREZIN BY RUTH FAZAL...............</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background...................................................</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History of Terezin..........................................</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Text..........................................................</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Musical Analysis.............................................</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EPILOGUE.....................................................</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>............................................................</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF MUSICAL EXAMPLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example</th>
<th>Piece</th>
<th>Movement</th>
<th>page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Example 1</td>
<td>K. Penderecki, <em>Dies Irae</em>, “Lamentatio”</td>
<td>m. 12</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Example 2</td>
<td>K. Penderecki, <em>Dies Irae</em>, “Apocalypsis”</td>
<td>m. 39</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Example 3</td>
<td>R. Fazal, <em>Oratorio Terezin</em>, “O God, Do Not Keep Silent” (No.4)</td>
<td>mm. 1–6</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Example 4</td>
<td>R. Fazal, <em>Oratorio Terezin</em>, “I Remember” (No. 2)</td>
<td>mm. 1-7</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Example 5</td>
<td>R. Fazal, <em>Oratorio Terezin</em>, “Introduction”</td>
<td>mm. 13-18</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Example 6</td>
<td>R. Fazal, <em>Dies Irae</em>, “God Is a Refuge for Us” (No. 8)</td>
<td>mm. 16-21</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Example 7</td>
<td>R. Fazal, <em>Dies Irae</em>, “Terezin 1” (No. 3)</td>
<td>mm. 1-3</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Example 8</td>
<td>R. Fazal, <em>Dies Irae</em>, “Finale: See Your Salvation Comes” (No. 32)</td>
<td>mm. 45-51</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1. APPROACHING MUSICAL HOLOCAUST MEMORIALS

In this thesis I discuss two musical Holocaust memorials that were premiered at the sites about which they are composed, or performed nearby soon afterward. These musical works participate in an ongoing reconciliation with the trauma of World War II and the Holocaust in particular. I have chosen to study two stylistically distinct works, one by Krzysztof Penderecki (b. 1933), and the other by Ruth Fazal (b. ca. 1950) that nonetheless share the following:

1. Texts from poetry and biblical scriptures that are woven together to create a narrative, or plot.
2. Linguistic, instrumental, or musical cultural tropes.
3. Allusions and tone-painting underpinning the text.
4. Metaphoric or concrete references to place and time.
5. Dramatic elements divided into formal divisions such as prologue, episodes, and exode; mimesis of imaginary or real life action; character delineation; and the presence of a chorus or allusions to a choral role.

Outline

This chapter includes discussions on the current scholarship of musical Holocaust memorial works, German and non-German responses to World War II German war crimes, and the roles and responsibilities of historians and artists in the wake of the Holocaust or Shoah\(^1\) and collective traumatic events in general. I discuss aesthetic ideology (its relationship to the art and role of Holocaust memorials), roles of memory in memorial works, contemporary trauma theory (its roots in Greek tragedy and its parallels to performance reception), theater as therapy (its Aristotelian roots and its

---

\(^1\) Throughout the thesis I will use Holocaust and Shoah interchangeably. The word Holocaust, derived from the ancient Greek word *holokauston*, meaning a sacrifice completely burned by fire, now refers to the systematic murdering of European Jewry and millions of others between 1933 and 1945. The Hebrew word *Shoah* translates as “catastrophe,” and denotes the catastrophic destruction of European Jews during World War II.
elements that comprise musical Holocaust memorials), and the significance of “place” in Judaism.

Chapters Two and Three, respectively, comprise textual, musical and interdisciplinary analyses of Dies Irae by Krzysztof Penderecki (1967), and Oratorio Terezin (2003) by Ruth Fazal. I examine the compositions for their dramatic evocations of particular places (Auschwitz or Terezin), traumatic re-enactment, and discuss how these dramatic evocations provide possibilities for cathartic experience for the audience, thereby fulfilling a collective psychological need. The Epilogue offers my conclusions and closing remarks. Academic fields I draw upon in this study include aesthetics, musicology, German history, theater and performance studies, literature and the environment studies, Jewish and Christian religious studies, and psychological trauma theory.

Musicological Scholarship

Recent scholarship has revealed an interest in compositions about mass traumatic events such as the Holocaust, Hiroshima, and the 9/11 terrorist attacks. Much of the Holocaust research focuses on the complex sociological, psychological, and political roles of music composed or performed by inmates in the ghettos and concentration camps. Examples of these studies include Joza Karas’s Music in Terezin, 1941–1945, Gila Flam’s Singing for Survival: Songs of the Lodz Ghetto, 1940–1945, Fania Fenelon and Marcelle Routier’s The Musicians of Auschwitz, Shirli Gilbert’s Music In the Holocaust: Confronting Life in the Nazi Ghettos and Camps, and Moshe Hoche’s Voices From the Dark: Music in the Ghettos and Camps of Poland.

Another branch of study focuses on post-war Holocaust memorial compositions. For example, Amy Wlodarski’s 2005 Ph.D. dissertation, “The Sounds of Memory: German Musical Presentations of the Holocaust, 1945–1965,” deals extensively with the role of memory in the creation and reception of three German Holocaust musical memorial compositions written during the twenty years following the end of the war. It serves as a model for further research on Holocaust memorial works and memorial compositions in general. In her introduction, Wlodarski describes a range of musicological research currently being pursued and cites a need for more scholarship in several areas of Holocaust studies, specifically the music composed and performed in less-examined concentration camps and representations of the Holocaust in music.

Similarly, there remains a lacuna in the significance of place combined with scholarship on the psychological need of such musical Holocaust representations. With this thesis I propose that the two musical Holocaust memorials discussed here facilitate cathartic and/or transformational experiences from and for the listener. These two large choral and orchestral semi-sacred works invite the audience into specific concentration camp sites to memorialize the monumental human sacrifice. The works contain multiple theatrical elements (see introductory list in this chapter) which create multi-dimensional representations that evoke place and re-enact trauma.


Germany since World War II

Ever since the first Nazi perpetrators were tried in Nuremburg on November 21, 1945 for systematically murdering more than six million innocent people during World War II, Germans collectively have been coming to terms with the atrocities of their recent past.\(^5\) During the twelve Nuremburg trials, which took place from 1945 through 1949, details about Holocaust crimes against humanity became public through journals, photographic images, film footage, and individual testimonials from witnesses, victims, survivors, perpetrators, and collaborators. Over ten years elapsed before the trial and execution of Otto Adolph Eichmann in Jerusalem from 1960 to 1962.\(^6\) The 1964–65 Frankfurt Trials of twenty-one Auschwitz guards and personnel confronted the German public, called the “perpetrating generation, with details of Nazi genocide published almost daily as the trials were closely watched and widely reported.”\(^7\) Germans reeled from the knowledge of the brutality that had infected their nation; it was a blow to German identity, an unprecedented shock to the world. Although Germans have been criticized for allegedly being unable to mourn, historian Gene Ray contends that for Germans, “Working through Auschwitz and mourning its victims is a slow, ongoing process that takes place across generations and on many levels.”\(^8\)

Historians, Artists, and Holocaust Memorials

Sifting through the shocking testimonials, visual images, and numerous documents searching for facts, historians have had the task of renegotiating twentieth-century

---

\(^5\) The Nazis’ victims included millions of Jews, Slavs, Roma and Sinti Gypsies, Communists, homosexuals, the homeless and disabled, alcoholics, unemployed, and anyone perceived as a threat to the Third Reich.

\(^6\) Otto Adolph Eichmann was instrumental in organizing the transport of Jews from Ghettos to concentration camps. By the end of the war he had had several promotions in the paramilitary Nazi Party as a member of the SS and was the Extermination Administrator in Dachau Concentration Camp. After escaping Germany he was finally captured in Argentina in 1960 and hanged June 1, 1962 in Jerusalem.

\(^7\) Ray, \textit{From Auschwitz}, 45–46.

\(^8\) Ray, \textit{From Auschwitz}, 46.
German history. They seek to make sense of events leading up to the war, gain deeper understanding of their broader political and humanitarian contexts, and propose theories as to why history so unraveled. According to Holocaust historian Saul Friedlander, challenges facing a Holocaust historian include being objective, oversimplifying the past, and “overcom[ing] the dichotomy between the unfathomable abstraction of the millions of dead and the tragedy of individual life and death in the time of extermination.” Speaking to the emotional challenge this research presents, Friedlander wrote:

The major difficulty of historians of the Shoah, when confronted with the echoes of the traumatic past, is to keep some measure of balance between the emotions recurrently breaking through the “protective shield.” In fact the numbing or distancing effect of intellectual work on the Shoah is unavoidable and necessary; the recurrence of strong emotional impact is also often unforeseeable and necessary.

For example, historians’ work on behalf of Holocaust museums gives them opportunities to seek this balance. Holocaust archives and museums all over the world exist to educate people about a past that historians agree should never be forgotten or denied. Sites such as the European Jewish ghettos in Prague, Terezin, and Warsaw, and concentration and death camps in Auschwitz-Birkenau, Bergen Belsen, and Dachau now exist as museums that serve as memorials based on historical scholarship. In part, the museums seek to represent the history of the victims’ collective and individual

---

10 Ibid.
11 From 1933 to 1936 Nazi concentration camps (*Konzentrationslager*) were used largely for political prisoners. From 1936 to 1942 non-political prisoners were also sent there and used as forced labor. 1942-45 saw the worst conditions in the camps: death, disease, starvation, crowded and unhygienic conditions. Death camps were not labor camps but systematic killing centers which were part of Hitler’s Final Solution. Auschwitz, established in 1940, contained the death camp Birkenau (Auschwitz II), as well as Buna (Auschwitz III), the I.G. Farben labor camp, and other additional camps.
fates. At the Auschwitz-Birkenau Museum visitors are confronted with displays of items once belonging to the millions who perished there. If one chooses to visit such a site, one can expect to be overwhelmed by powerful exhibits that testify to atrocious crimes.

Like historians, artists seeking understanding and meaning in traumatic events create works to memorialize them. While both historian and artist are motivated by a strong sense of responsibility to bear witness to such human atrocities, the challenge for the artist is to embed emotional truth in combination with the facts of an event into an aesthetic framework.

Theodor Adorno, perhaps the most influential twentieth-century philosopher of music and ethics, saw the Nazi party “annihilate many artists and intellectuals … [and] put every cultural activity into the service of the totalitarian set-up.” In 1949 he wrote, “To write poetry after Auschwitz is barbaric” and criticized Schoenberg’s A Survivor from Warsaw, Op. 46 (1947) for dealing with the subject too directly. But seventeen years later, in 1966, he amended his view writing, “Perennial suffering has as much right to expression as one who is tortured has to scream; thus it may have been wrong (to have claimed) that after Auschwitz no more poems may be written.” Some of his final words on the subject of creating art after genocide supported art’s role: “However feeble and indicted art is, it remains one of the last points of imaginable resistance to barbarism.” Adorno also said that art would never be the same after the Holocaust.

---

14 At the Auschwitz-Birkenau Museum there are displays of thousands of combs, eyeglass, shoes, hair, gold fillings, and other items formerly belonging to victims.
16 Gene Ray, From Auschwitz, 66. Adorno’s “perennial suffering” refers to Holocaust survivors and those who remain under what he called “social barbarism with the knowledge of culture’s failure.”
17 Ray, From Auschwitz, 130.
Thus he encouraged artists and others to maintain a “scrupulous respect for the victims and their memory.”

As Adorno came to realize, people often sought to make sense of extraordinary circumstances by making art. There are many such examples created by inmates in concentration camps during World War II. Post-war Holocaust survivors have themselves been actively involved in the instigation and jurisdiction of artistic Holocaust memorials. For example, in 1957–58 an association of survivors calling itself the “Comité international d’Auschwitz” held a juried competition for an Auschwitz Memorial. The contest, whose jury was chaired by British sculptor Henry Moore, drew in proposals from 426 artists from thirty-six countries who took on the challenge of representing the unspeakable emotional truth of the Shoah.

Roles of Memory

In researching their work, artists rely on the work of historians, photographic and filmic representations, and the memories of survivors. Historian Shirli Gilbert describes issues that arise when drawing on testimonials:

In their retrospective testimonies [Holocaust] victims ... necessarily emphasized some events while consciously or unconsciously misrepresenting or omitting others. Their attempts to talk about traumatic events long after they occurred also often meant that problems associated with conveying memory were magnified. In addition, the complex process of re-adaptation to society in the post-war period inevitably affected their constructions of events: potential factors that informed their narratives included guilt about survival; shame for acts committed that may have been essential to survival but which in hindsight violated the ethics of “civilized” existence; or a trauma so severe that crucial aspects of experience could not be recalled ... The crucial point here is an awareness

---

18 Ibid.
19 The winning memorial was to be located at the Auschwitz-Birkenau camp between the crematoria and “the end of the rails, the final station for most of the victims.” Although there were finalists, the competition was paralyzed by political and ideological differences leading to indecision. Moore withdrew himself from the final stage of the competition. Murwaska-Muthesius, Oskar Hansen and the Auschwitz “Counter-memorial,” <http://www.artmargins.com/content/feature.murwaska.html> (accessed April 29, 2009).
that testimony cannot be taken at face value, but should be approached – as any other historical source – with care and discretion.\textsuperscript{20}

The artist is responsible for safe-guarding such testimonials and reframing them into aesthetic contexts. Traumatic memories, which I later discuss in more detail, are stored somatically and resurface variably. Emotions associated with these memories are as varied in the manner they reveal themselves as the people who experienced them. In spite of this plurality, these emotions can be characterized. They are often repetitive, unravel belatedly, and sequence non-chronologically as in dreams. The expression of these emotions transcends the scope of historical narrative and extend them into the domain of the artist. In particular, musical composition is an ideal medium for memorials of the Shoah due to music’s range of possibility. A composer may choose to sequence events to simulate the non-chronological, dream-like unraveling of a fragmented memory or create a chronological narrative to reveal an underlying truth.

\textbf{Trauma Theory}

Artists have long shown an interest in the effects of “overwhelming stress on body, mind, and soul of victims [of trauma].”\textsuperscript{21} Greek tragic theater (from its earliest incarnations in the Dionysian festivals to the plays of Aeschylus, Sophocles, and Euripides) was an early method for working through the trauma of guilt, combat, horror, betrayal, and traumatic death.\textsuperscript{22} In his \textit{Poetics} and \textit{Politics}, Aristotle (384-322 B.C. E.) defines tragedy and other theatrical terms, describes six elements he sees as integral in writing successful tragedies, and analyzes the psychological relationship between audience and actors. Aristotle explains that while an individual audience member

\textsuperscript{20} Shirli Gilbert, \textit{Music}, 17.
\textsuperscript{22} Ibid.
witnesses the mimesis (reenactment of an action in life or imagination) in dramatic tragedy, he/she experiences the pathos of emotions of pity and fear, which culminates in a cathartic experience for that individual. Merriam-Webster dictionary defines catharsis as a “purification or purgation of the emotions (as pity and fear) primarily through art, that brings about spiritual renewal or release from tension.”²³

Trauma has been dealt with in different ways in different ages. Citizens of the Middle Ages blamed individual sinners or massive groups for traumatic events. Those perceived guilty were tortured or murdered to drive out alleged demons. More fortunate sinners were exorcized of their demons during religious rituals. In the eighteenth century exorcism became part of the secular domain with German physician Franz Anton Mesmer’s (1734-1815) discovery of animal magnetism (or mesmerism). In 1842 Scottish neurosurgeon James Braid (1795-1860) further developed Mesmer’s ideas into the technique of hypnosis. French neurologist Jean-Martin Charcot (1825–1893) brought mental and emotional aberrations into the medical domain in the mid-nineteenth century. Hysteria, an invention of Charcot, was regarded as a specific medical ailment. Two of his students, Pierre Janet (1858-1947) and Sigmund Freud (1856-1939), furthered his work on hysteria, purporting the ailment to be the result of psychic trauma.

In the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries Sigmund Freud wrote his theories on trauma in his works Remembering, Repeating and Working-Through (1914), Mourning and Melancholia (1917), and Beyond the Pleasure Principle (1920).²⁴ In these works Freud wrote about the need for “working through” trauma, “a psychical work which allows the subject to accept certain repressed elements and free himself from the

---
grip of mechanisms of [compulsive] repetition.”

Freud also acknowledged something crucial in his early works: words had to be linked to feelings in order for them to be experienced and their affects to become conscious.

Freud’s early studies and theoretical writings, based largely on childhood trauma, were the forerunners for later discoveries about types of memory and trauma.

The study of trauma and memory flourished again as a result of World Wars I and II after which many soldiers returned “shell-shocked.” But even in the 1970s the neurosis which resulted from war trauma was still thought to be a weakness on the soldier’s part. The problems that were found in the returning POWs from Vietnam caused industrial nations to acknowledge the psychological effects of violence. In 1968 psychiatrist Henry Krystal published *Massive Psychic Trauma* on the psychological effects of trauma on the victims of Hiroshima and Nazi concentration camps. After liberation from the camps, Holocaust survivors experienced what Krystal’s colleague William G. Niederland described as “magic expectations,” and feelings of triumph and elation at the hope of finding lost family and community members. There is a period (years to decades) of psychological normalcy after which belated mourning takes place and psychological symptoms appear. We now know this collection of symptoms as *Post Traumatic Stress Disorder*. In 1980 the diagnosis of “Post-traumatic Stress Disorder” (PTSD) was entered into the *Psychiatric Diagnostic and Statistic Manual*. Five years later the International Society for Traumatic Stress Studies was formed to provide a forum for sharing research on trauma in the United States and around the world. After World War II ended enormous activity was spent on Nazi criminal trials and the task of

---


26 Bloom, *Creating Sanctuary*, 58.

27 Terms used during the twentieth century to describe traumatic stress have included psychic trauma neurosis, shell shock, battle fatigue, and survivor’s syndrome. From Bloom, *Creating Sanctuary*, 17.

28 Bloom, *Creating Sanctuary*, 17.

punishing the Nazi perpetrators. Perhaps due to the normal belated mourning after mass trauma, attention was not given to concentration camp survivors, who were more apt to bury their traumatic memories with the dead than talk about them.

From the ancient Greeks to the present day, many specialists have contributed to the burgeoning field of trauma therapy. They have established a widely accepted symptomology and various methods for treatment of post-traumatic stress disorders.

In *Principles of Trauma Therapy: A Guide to Symptoms, Evaluation, and Treatment* (2006), co-authors J. Briere and Catherine Scott describe a therapeutic approach to trauma which is a culmination of the trauma studies to date. I base my discussion of music largely on the above and Krystal’s books. Trauma, which may include torture, confinement, extreme physical deprivation, fear of death or watching the death of others, and mass-trauma from a totalitarian society, can result in PTS responses such as depression, dissociation, hyper-vigilance, and anxiety.\(^\text{30}\)

Briere and Scott discuss re-experiencing the trauma in the form of flashbacks, nightmares, and other intrusive memories, echoing Freud’s early theory of compulsive repetition. Intrusive memories resulting from extended periods of abusive situations such as concentration camp experiences require what Freud called “working through,” which has now evolved into therapeutic methods directed at the victims of trauma.

Contemporary trauma theory presupposes that two types of memory exist, the implicit and the explicit. Implicit memory comprises primarily somatic senses, while explicit memory comprises narrative involving words. In contemporary trauma theory, negative implicit memories are transformed into explicit memories through Briere and Scott’s five-stage therapeutic process. The five stages are as follows:

1. Exposure to a traumatic memory
2. Activation of responses to exposure to a memory

3. Recognition of disparity between the past and present
4. Counter-conditioning reframing the negative experience using positive elements
5. Desensitization/resolution\textsuperscript{31}

During the first step, exposure, the intensity of the memory must not overwhelm the trauma subject. Consequently, the therapist mediates the session so that memories are exposed gradually, or else the trauma subject may emotionally “shut down.” The intensity is mediated so that it remains in the middle of what psychologists refer to as the “therapeutic window.” In the second stage the memory triggers or activates an emotional response. The subject then perceives a difference between the present situation and what he/she is feeling about the past. For example, the emotion activated by a memory may be fear, even though in the present there is no impending threat or danger; the subject notices the therapist willingly listening to his/her memory and responding sympathetically to his/her emotions. In the absence of danger the traumatic memory is re-framed in the present with the positive safe relational association with a therapist, thereby creating a counter-balance to the past negative association. Examples of positive associations in therapy can be sympathy, compassion, understanding, and other productive responses to the person’s expression of specific negative emotions. At this stage the traumatic memory transforms from an implicit into an explicit memory, one that can now be put into a narrative by the subject. This same process can trigger a cathartic release of emotions which encourages the process of transforming implicit traumatic memories into explicit ones. Many studies have shown that once traumatic memories become explicit, and are expressed to a compassionate person or people, repetitive symptoms such as overwhelming recurring thoughts and nightmares cease, and patients are able to move on with their lives. Similarly, in the grieving process, persons can only move beyond their grief if they have expressed the

\textsuperscript{31} Briere and Scott, \textit{Principles of Trauma}, 126–140.
story of their grief in words to a witness. Musical Holocaust memorials help mourn those who have died and help Holocaust survivors (who, after an interval of time, suffered post traumatic pathologies) move through their grieving.

**Theater as Therapy**

In tragic plays based on fictional or non-fictional stories of war, loss, and death, audiences journey through stages not unlike those in Briere and Scott’s therapeutic model. The audience is exposed to difficult subject matter or traumatic memories in a manner that arouses responses often in the form of the Aristotelian emotions of sympathy, pity, and fear. The aesthetic framework of the theatrical artwork creates a therapeutic window, allowing the audience to assimilate but not be overwhelmed by the subject manner. At first the audience feels empathy in the form of sympathy, and subsequently the self-reflective emotion of fear — fear of this tragic possibility for themselves. As the tragic plot unfolds toward a resolution, fear turns to pity as the audience recognizes the disparity between themselves and “the other” — the character(s) in the play. The audience also recognizes the disparity between the temporality of what is happening in stage-time and what is happening in real-time. This disparity between what is other and past and what is self and present can combine with emotional participation to create relief or catharsis for the audience.

Two points that correspond to Briere and Scott’s fourth stage of counter-conditioning are the reframing of a tragic story using aesthetic elements and the moment of recognition that the audience is in no immediate danger. I argue that collective desensitization and resolution occur through the live theatrical experience shared with other audience members who collectively bear witness to traumatic stories.

---

32 Brier and Scott, *Principles of Trauma*, 126.
While any musical performance has by nature numerous parallels to theater, my study aims to demonstrate how musical Holocaust memorials share parallels with theater and how these parallels make them the ideal medium for such memorial works. In both works, the idea of place is analogous to the theatrical idea of setting, thereby exposing the audience to traumatic memories.

Composers Respond to World War II

In the context of a collaborative 1966 cantata, *Judische Chronik*, Hans Werner Henze asserted that,

[We] remembered how too often in the past artists had kept their own counsel, and how disastrous their silence had often been in the Third Reich. We all believed that any kind of warning would be preferable to the kind of non-political evasiveness that indicates only indifference and insensitivity.33

Other composers shared Henze’s sentiments. Since the Second World War, composers have written many politically-charged works in response to the threats of fascism. Although a comprehensive survey of Holocaust memorial music is beyond the scope this current study, the following list of composers and works written in response to the Holocaust suggests the size and weight of this musical sub-genre: Arnold Schoenberg’s *A Survivor From Warsaw* (1947); Boris Blacher, Karl Hartmann, Hans Werner Henze, Rudolf Wagner-Regeny, and Jens Gerlach’s *Judische Chronik* (1960-61); Dmitri Shostakovich’s Symphony No. 13 (1962); Gunther Kochan’s *Die Asche von Birkenau* (1965); Luigi Nono’s *Ricorda cosa ti hanno fatto ad Auschwitz* (1965) (Remember What They Did to You in Auschwitz); William Schuman’s Symphony No. 9 or *Le fosse ardentine* (1968); Oskar Morawetz, *From the Diary of Anne Frank: Oratorio for Voice and Orchestra* (1970); Francis Schwartz’s *Caligula* (1975); Steve Reich’s *Different Trains* (1988);

Srul Irving Glick’s *We are Children Just the Same* (1999); Burton Beerman’s *Tikvah* (2004); and Osvaldo Golijov’s *Tekyah* (2005).

**Place in Judaism**

A body of scholarly work has emerged and is emerging about people and their personal and collective relationships to their environment. The Association for the Study of Literature and Environment (ASLE), founded in 1992, is a professional organization “interested in the natural world and its meanings and representations in language and culture.” Studies concerning the Jews’ historical and present identification with their environment are included in this body of work. In his book, *The Land*, Jewish scholar and theologian Walter Brueggemann discusses in great depth the Jews’ historical connection to the land promised to Jacob, to Isaac, Abraham, and Moses and how this connection still affects Jews today. The Bible states:

> For the Lord your God is bringing you into a good land, a land of brooks of water, of fountains and springs, flowing forth in valleys and hills, a land of wheat and barley, of vines and fig tress and pomegranates, a land of olive trees and honey, a land in which you will eat bread without scarcity in which you will lack nothing, a land whose stones are iron, and out of whose hills you can dig copper. And you shall eat and be full, and you shall bless the Lord your god for the good land he has given you.

Brueggemann sums up this history: “Israel’s experience is of being in and belonging to a land never fully given, never quite secured.” Using Brueggemann’s terminology, Jewish history, ancient to modern, has been one of landed-ness and landlessness.

---


35 Since spring 2009 ASLE has published a scholarly quarterly journal, *Interdisciplinary Studies in Literature and Environment* in conjunction with Oxford University Press.

36 Deuteronomy 8:7-10.

Brueggemann explains that by landed-ness he refers both to the “earthly turf where people can be safe and secure, where [identity] and well-being are enjoyed without pressure of coercion,” and a symbolic “[expression] of the wholeness of joy and well-being characterized by social coherence and personal ease in prosperity, security, and freedom.” In contrast, landlessness suggests lack of wholeness. It hints at feeling exposed and helpless, precarious and vulnerable, cast out without resources and in chaos, utterly “displaced and alienated from the place which gave identity and security.” The larger discussion of place, fundamental to Jewish culture, does not exclude modern society. Indeed Brueggemann begins his book saying, “The sense of being lost, displaced, and homeless is pervasive in contemporary culture.” In my research, I found concrete and symbolic references to place in both Dies Irae and Oratorio Terezin that intersect with trauma and identity.

---

38 Ibid., 2.
39 Ibid., 8.
40 Ibid., 1.
Krzysztof Penderecki (b. 1933) composed his highly dramatic 24-minute long oratorio, *Dies Irae*, seven years after writing his powerful and acclaimed *Threnody to the Victims of Hiroshima*. In *Threnody* he explores multiple layering of sounds, atonal harmonies, and extremes in dynamics and pitch. Written during what scholar Ray Robinson has called Penderecki’s first style period (1956-62), *Threnody* contains then-innovative notation, an astonishing range of sounds, and fifty-three separate string parts. Another earlier work he drew upon was his 1963 radio play, *Brigade of Death*, an electronic score based on the mass murders of Lwów, Poland. Composed during his second style period (1962-1974), where Penderecki experiments with the breadth of vocal sonorities as he had previously with instruments, *Dies Irae* remains one of his most important choral works.

**Background**

Henryk Gorecki was the first composer that the Polish government approached in the 1960s to write a large-scale work for the unveiling of a cenotaph at the former extermination camp, Auschwitz-Birkenau. After years of laboring over the composition (which probably became *In Memorium*) and only months before the unveiling, Gorecki found himself unable to complete the work, admitting, “It frightens me and is compellingly attractive at the same time…. I would love to be able to write it.” His having lost family members during the Holocaust (at Auschwitz and other death

---

41 *Threnody to the Victims of Hiroshima*, originally titled 8’37”, written in 1960, was scored for 53 strings.  
43 In July 1941, during Nazi occupation of the city of Lwów, forty-five university professors along with their families and guests were massacred as part of an ongoing organized plan to murder all Lwów’s civilian population.  
camps) may have made it too difficult for Gorecki to complete the composition. At Gorecki’s suggestion, Penderecki was approached for the commission.

Penderecki’s oratorio *Dies Irae*, for three solo voices (soprano, tenor, and bass), mixed chorus, and an orchestra without clarinets or upper strings, was written in January and February of 1967. It was first performed by the Kraków Philharmonic and Choir on April 6 of the same year. The performance took place at Auschwitz, at the unveiling of the International Monument to the Victims of Fascism at Auschwitz-Birkenau. It was performed in nearby Kraków a week later.

As a youth growing up in Poland not far from Auschwitz, Penderecki was in the eye of a turbulent political storm, experiencing national fear and strife under dictatorships, German occupation, and communism. As Robinson has written, “The atrocities of Auschwitz took place in his own back yard.” The Germans invaded Poland in 1939 when young Penderecki was six years old. Describing Penderecki’s boyhood, musicologist Wolfram Schwinger wrote: “From a window in their house [in Dbica], hidden behind curtains, he could not help watching the Jews being herded and taken away.” Robinson asserted that the composer’s geographic proximity to these events “could not help but influence his compositional output and shape his highly-charged, intensely emotional scores.” The composer described his *Dies Irae* as a “powerful and highly dramatic musical invocation of the horror, pain, and inhuman depravity that the Nazi’s inflicted on their victims.” My analysis illustrates the presence of musical and extra-musical theatrical elements in the oratorio that provide the listener with a therapeutic opportunity for grieving and overcoming horrific losses.

---

47 Robinson, 1.
History of Auschwitz

Before the Nazis invaded Poland in early September 1939, Oświęcim was a regular Polish town with a population of around 14,000 of which over fifty percent was Jewish. Since the early sixteenth century a Jewish settlement had been part of Oświęcim, originally founded around 1275. In 1636 the reigning Polish king granted the Jews equal rights to own property and use the synagogue and town cemetery. In March and April of 1941 the Jewish population living in Oświęcim (by then renamed Auschwitz by the Germans) were deported to various Polish ghettos. Under the orders of Heinrich Himmler, the place that was once home to a thriving Jewish community became the largest World War II concentration camp complex for the Nazi’s systematic annihilation of an estimated one and a half million innocent men, women, and children, sixty to eighty percent of whom were Jewish.49 By June 1942 the Auschwitz complex, which took up twenty-five square miles (forty square kilometers) and consisted of more than three hundred buildings, comprised the three major camps of Auschwitz I (the main camp), Stammlager, Auschwitz II (extermination camp), Birkenau, Auschwitz III (slave labor work camp), Monowitz, and numerous sub-camps. At its peak in 1944 it consisted of forty camps and sub-camps. At first the camp’s inmates were mostly Poles but eventually nine out of every ten of its prisoners were Jewish.

Mass transports of Jews to Auschwitz began in 1942. Many Jews first transported to the camp thought they were being relocated. Upon arrival, those who had survived the seven to ten day journey in crowded cattle cars without food, water, or toilets went through a selection process where the SS doctors and officers decided whether or not they were fit for slave labor. If not they were eventually directed to a place they were told was a bathing area. In actuality these were gas chambers, where prisoners were

---

49 Himmler chose the Auschwitz location because it was “favorable in terms of transport and [the] area [could] be easily isolated and camouflaged,” in “Memorial and Museum: Auschwitz-Birkenau,” <http://en.auschwitz.org.pl/m/> (accessed April 29, 2009).
killed with Zyklon-B poison gas. There were three crematoria and seven gas chambers in the camp complex. While there were temporary family camps for gypsies and Jews from Terezin, another part of the initial selection process for most transports was separation according to sex. In 2002 scholar Anna Reading wrote of Jewish writer Elie Weisel’s experience arriving in the camp: “Once Jews of Sighet leave the transport on arrival at Auschwitz the men and women are separated. It is the last time Elie Wiesel sees his mother and sisters, and after this his world becomes almost entirely male.”

Prisoners existed on little food and slept in wooden bunks in barracks designed as horse stables, with little ventilation, or insulation. Only a few of the several hundred original buildings remain on the site as the SS set fire to many of them trying to conceal their crimes. For visitors today, Auschwitz teeters somewhere between its past and its future, death and life, sorrow and hope, with museums containing remnants of thousands of human lives sacrificed.

Text

While Penderecki’s Polish and Roman Catholic identities strongly influence his works, it is his texts in Dies Irae, all of which are translated into Latin by Tytus Gorski (except for verses from the classical Greek tragedy The Eumenides), that supercede religious or nationalistic identification in order to address a broader history. The juxtaposition of Latin with Greek, and scripture with secular poetry spanning more than two thousand years, emphasizes the common antiquity of Jewish and Christian traditions. This suggests the continuum of civilization and consequently the profound


magnitude of the loss that this work memorializes. According to musicologist Wolfram Schwinger, Penderecki’s “intention was to explain the subject of Auschwitz in its larger symbolic force, beyond the confines of any concentration camp.” While the texts for Dies Irae “come from epochs apart, [Penderecki] sensed in the compilation such complete unity that they might have been expressly written on the theme of Auschwitz.” The poetic combination, ultimately presented in Latin and Greek, forms a unified narrative, which is part of its theatrical appeal and psychological success.

Instead of the traditional Requiem texts, Penderecki chose biblical passages from Revelations, I Corinthians, Psalms and contemporary Polish and French lyric poems of Władysław Broniewski (1897-1962), Tadeusz Różewicz (b. 1921), Louis Aragon (1897-1982), and Paul Valéry (1871-1945), as well as excerpts from Aeschylus’s (525-456 B.C.E) The Eumenides. All but Valéry had personal associations with war and/or political activism. The composer interweaves passages from their works with great care and ingenuity to form a transformative narrative within the three attacca movements: I. Lamentatio, II. Apocalypsis, and III. Apotheosis.

“Lamentatio’s” heading, “The sorrows of death compassed me,” is from Psalm 16, a thanksgiving psalm for healing. The psalmist is calling on God for help in the present as

---

52 Penderecki’s early devotion to Roman Catholicism and his university studies in the classical antiquities of art, literature, and philosophy provided him an intimate familiarity with biblical scriptures and classical Greek tragedies.
54 Schwinger, Krzysztof Penderecki, 215.
55 Of the two Polish poets whose poetry comprises texts of Penderecki’s Dies Irae, Władysław Broniewski was the revolutionist. He was a communist and soldier, who fought in the Polish-Bolshevik War (1920-21). In contrast, poet, playwright, and novelist, Tadeusz Różewicz, is not a political writer in spite of having served as a soldier in the Polish underground army during World War II. He lost his brother, Janusz, to Gestapo executors in 1944. Paul Valéry, the elder of the two French poets by twenty-six years and the last of the French symbolists, had neither direct connection to the wars nor any interest in politics. The younger French surrealist poet and novelist, Louis Aragon, was a communist who wrote for the underground press Les Editions de Minuit and remained underground during the German occupation of France. Having lived through the Persian invasion of Greece, the Greek playwright Aeschylus was greatly influenced by the subjects of morality, politics, and war. As soldiers in the Greek Delian League, he and his brother, Cynegeirus, fought and defeated the Persians in the Battle of Marathon in 490 B. C. E.
“God has answered his cry for help in the past.”56 The heading provides the audience with an initial biblical association that acts as an intercessor for the graphic portrayals that follow. The biblical association also places audience members in a sacred space from which to launch their listening experience and their own grieving process.

The poetic texts in the first movement, Aragon’s poem Auschwitz, Różewicz’s poem Warkocz (“A Pigtail”), and Broniewski’s graphic but empowering poem Ciala (“Bodies”), expose the audience to the shackles of death, the central theme of Auschwitz. The scene of the Auschwitz crematoria is set in the first three lines of Broniewski’s poem:

Bodies of children
From crematories
Will fly
High above history
Bodies of boys,
Bodies of girls
In crowns of thorns
Will flock together.
Bodies of men
From field-graveyards
Will march to conquer,
Will be free.

The listener is exposed to the starkest images of events in the concentration camp of Auschwitz throughout “Lamentatio” in the secular poetry of Broniewski (mm. 7-14, 26-30, and 41-46), Aragon (mm. 31-40), and Różewicz (mm. 47-52). Broniewski informs the audience who the murdered victims of Auschwitz are in “Bodies” in the following textual fragments: “Bodies of children from crematoriums … bodies of boys … bodies of girls … bodies of men … bodies from camps … bodies from murdered cities … bodies with halters … bodies with wounds.” Exposure to these images corresponds to the first stage of Briere and Scott’s therapeutic approach to working through trauma.

The audience is transported to a place where death has occurred and in particular a concentration camp by using “crematorium,” a word that since the war has not only been associated with postmortem burial practices but with World War II extermination camps as well.

Furthermore, through the remaining poetic text the audience is informed of two ideas, first the innocence of the victim. Różiewicz’s poem, “Pigtail,” describes a “small braid, a pigtail with a ribbon pulled in a classroom by naughty boys,” which could have been the hair of an innocent girl too young to be guilty of anything. The second idea in the remaining text of “Lamentatio,” Aragon’s poem “Auschwitz” (mm. 31-40), reveals Penderecki’s religious location. It compares Christ’s ordeals to those of the victims of Auschwitz stating that “Even Christ did not follow such a path of doom … the utmost hunger and the limits of strength. He never knew that racking discord between a human soul and an inhuman world.” This text not only places the composer (who chose the text) as a Christian but also provides the audience with a marker with which to measure the horror experienced by the memorialized murdered victims.

The second movement, “Apocalypsis” bears the heading “And the pains of hell gat upon me.” from Psalm 116. Here, Penderecki positions the listener more specifically in a place comparable to hell, using imagery from scriptures and classical Greek tragedy. These familiar metaphorical narratives that preceded World War II mediate the intensity of “Lamentatio’s” portrayal of Auschwitz. Penderecki chose biblical passages from Psalm 116, Revelations 2, 6, 7, 11, 12, 13, and 19, and poetry from Aeschylus’s tragedy The Eumenides.” The text appears to metaphorically recall what has been and to suggest what will be revealed about events and political players in World War II, the Nazi’s rise to power in Germany, Nazi war crimes, their victims, trials, and

---

57 Apocalypse, from the Greek word ἀπόκαλύψις, refers to prophetic Hebrew and Christian literature (Revelations) commonly written in veiled symbolism and inspired by visions.
punishments. The mediating function of the second movement’s text correlates with Briere and Scott’s therapeutic model which prescribes remaining within the therapeutic window of exposure.\textsuperscript{58} While some might see the second movement’s text enhancing understanding of the crimes that occurred, thereby intensifying the memories triggered by it, I assert that the mythical text of \textit{The Eumenides} and the historical and scriptural texts from the Bible provide a distance from the actual events, so that exposure to the original trauma stays within the therapeutic window.

In this movement Penderecki includes intermittent references to the “furies,” the supernatural ministers of justice from the underworld in \textit{The Eumenides} (mm. 5, 17, and 51).\textsuperscript{59} The Furies metaphorically listen to the angry cries of dead victims of concentration camps. They act as intercessors between the victims and God, who ultimately would judge their perpetrators.\textsuperscript{60} In their role as intercessors, the Furies can possibly be seen as filling the role of the listening therapist in Briere and Scott’s therapeutic approach. Their text provides the audience with an expansive visual image of three spatial planes: the underworld, the earth, and the heavens.

There are several passages from Revelations and \textit{The Eumenides} that are clearly metaphorical references to Hitler or the system of government that voted him into office.\textsuperscript{61} He is portrayed as a manifestation of evil itself coming to earth in Revelations 12:9: “And the great dragon was cast out, that old serpent, called the Devil, and Satan, which deceiveth the whole world: he was cast out into the earth.”\textsuperscript{62} Similar references

\textsuperscript{58} Briere and Scott, \textit{Principles of Trauma Therapy}, 126.
\textsuperscript{59} “Song of the Furies: binding brain and blighting blood in its stringless melody.” Penderecki uses this text in the second movement of \textit{Dies Irae}, “Apocalypsis.”
\textsuperscript{60} In Greek and Roman mythology the Furies (or Erinyes) are supernatural female “ministers of justice,” whose chief role is to punish sinners on earth. They live in the underworld and also perceived as embodying the anger of the dead.
\textsuperscript{61} The seven early Christian communities, which may refer to Hitler’s government, included Ephesus, Smyrna, Pergamum, Thyatira, Sardis, Philadelphia, and Leodicea. In Revelations 13, John’s vision continues with descriptions of a first and second beast and the signs by which it deceives the inhabitants of earth. From \textit{The Green Bible} NRSV (San Francisco: Harper One, 2008), 1212.
\textsuperscript{62} Penderecki, “Apocalypsis,” \textit{Dies Irae}, mm. 9–11.
to a “beast,” which appear to represent Hitler, appear in the second movement text in passages from Revelations 13:1 (mm. 1): “Count the number of the beast, for it is the number of a man … a beast with seven heads [and] ten horns … and upon his heads the name of blasphemy,” and Revelations 13:4 (mm. 20-26):

And all the world wondered after the beast. And they worshipped the dragon which gave power unto the beast, and they worshipped the beast, saying: who is like unto the beast? Who is able to make war with him? … and there was given unto him a mouth speaking great things and blasphemies: and power was given unto him to continue forty and two months.

Penderecki’s textual choices for “Apocalypsis,” which Penderecki sees as “a vision of annihilation,” suggest a chronological narrative coinciding with events of and persons involved in the war.63 There are metaphorical references to imprisonment, trials, and tribulations in Revelations 2:10 correlating with the treatment of Hitler’s victims:

Fear none of those things which thou shalt suffer: behold, the devil [Hitler] shall cast some of you into prison, that ye may be tried; and ye shall have tribulations [hard labor and physical and psychological abuse] ten days; be thou faithful unto death, and I will give thee a crown of life. He that overcometh shall not be hurt of the second death. (“Apocalypsis,” mm. 40-45)

Also, The Eumenides, verse 328, “the beast doomed to the fire” (m. 51), may refer to Hitler’s fate. Furthermore, Penderecki could be alluding to the allies’ defeat of German forces when he quotes Revelations 19:19–20: “I saw the beast, and the kings of the earth, and their armies [allies], gathered together to make war against him that sat on the horse (Hitler), and against his army (Nazi regime). And the beast was taken, and with him the false prophet … These both were cast alive into a lake of fire burning with brimstone.” (mm. 66-74) Both the stark images in “Lamentatio” and the chronological narrative presented in “Apocalypsis” directly and indirectly expose the listener to events of World War II. This exposure could activate memories in the listener, in keeping with step two of Briere and Scott’s therapeutic model. Furthermore, “reframing” of actual events from World War II emphasizes the temporal disparity

63 Wolfram Schwinger, Krzysztof Penderecki, 215.
between the events on stage and audience’s circumstances in real time (temporally and spatially removed from the drama on stage) in keeping with step three of the therapeutic model.

“Apotheosis” (completion), which has the scriptural heading “Death is swallowed up in victory,” has the shortest text.\textsuperscript{64} It appears to grapple with the complexity of collective post-war feelings of helplessness, confusion, and despair. This movement corresponds to both stage four, positive reconditioning, and stage five, “resolution,” of Briere and Scott’s method of working through trauma. The following verses from Corinthians 1:15, Revelations 21:1, and Valéry’s *Le Cimetière marin* reframe the Holocaust in the context of biblical revelations of earthly and spiritual restoration. They also reframe it in the light of the profoundly strong human spirit, in particular that of the Jewish people — their spirit to find hope, “to live,” and carry on with their lives:

“And I saw a new heaven and a new earth” (m. 1), “Death is swallowed up in victory. O death, where is thy sting? O grave, where is thy victory?” (mm. 2-10, and 15-14) and “The wind rises...let us try to live!” (m. 12)

**Musical Analysis**

The human voice has been a documented part of spiritual practices since the ancient Greeks. Many religions encourage spoken or sung chanting, melismatic singing, responsorial declamation, and vocalized praying as a direct way to connect with their God or gods. Congregational singing is an important collective ritual in Christianity, as is melismatic cantorial singing in Judaism.

In Penderecki’s *Dies Irae* the combination of chorus and recitation-like spoken passages recalls musical practices in synagogues and churches, the locus of spiritual practice for both Christians and Jews. Penderecki underlines *Dies Irae*’s text by varying texture and

\textsuperscript{64} Apotheosis, from the Greek word *apótheôsis* meaning completion, refers to deification or glorification.
timbre. Multiple divisions of choir voices and swelling note clusters simulate the sound of a human multitude. Extreme dynamic contrasts, widespread chromaticism, quarter-tone and micro-tone intervals, glissandi, and tone clusters express human anguish while extra-musical additions such as chains, gun shots, and sirens provide non-human sounds evocative of life in ghettos or the Auschwitz concentration camp. Familiar religious tropes are found in the composer’s use of chimes, repeated litanies, and melismatic or responsorial settings of the text. The text is also declaimed by singing, sprechstimme, and whispering, Penderecki’s vocal techniques echoing those of Schoenberg in Pierrot Lunaire. Penderecki’s use of whispering recalls the emotional states of worry and hyper-vigilance, both characteristic of trauma. He uses spatial compositional techniques such as extreme pitch range within a short period of time or in simultaneously expressed choir voices. In the context of Auschwitz, these extreme ranges seem to evoke images of a multitude of people, long journeys, and possibly the immense physical size of Auschwitz itself.

Without being programmatic, Penderecki’s score is full of what Wolfram Schwinger describes as a “richly articulate, aggressive spectra of noise and timbre.”65 The first movement, “Lamentatio,” opens in a mysterioso character, with bass voices on B-flat two octaves below middle C, humming in pianissimo. The basses swell to forte then return to pianissimo, abstractly suggesting darkness and desolation. The celli and basses enter in m. 3 playing an ascending chromatic line starting on E two octaves below middle C. The solo soprano joins in m. 6 on a haunting sustained A above middle C. Schwinger writes that the soprano line “emerges …wordlessly, from the gloomy depths.”66 Eventually the soprano crescendos into a vocal cry of anguish as it intones the last syllable of the second sung word of the poem, “Corpura Parvulorum” (the bodies of children) in m. 7.

65 Wolfram Schwinger, Krzysztof Penderecki, 215.
66 Ibid., 215.
above a low, chromatically descending bass line. At m. 9, after the poem’s first line is vocalized, soprano and alto choir sections, each of which is divided into six parts, take up the words, staggering entries on pitches F, G, G-sharp, A, B-flat, and B above middle C. The twelve entries of the choir’s six-note chromatic cluster give the spatial and aural impression of a multitude, perhaps even suggesting a multitude of bodies.

In mm. 9 and 10 soprano and alto voices vocalize in ranges similar to those of the young boys and girls referred to in the poem “Bodies.” Sporadically the twelve parts of the sopranos and altos chromatically change tones by ascending or descending, giving shape and sound to the bodies referred to in the first line of the poem. The sporadic entrances could also portray the restlessness of the bodies. In m. 10 a crescendo in the choir from pianissimo to fortissimo simulates the sound of human screams such as would probably have been heard from the gas chambers at Birkenau. In mm. 11 and 12, labeled quasi una litania, tenors and basses chant the words “corporum parvulorum” (the bodies of the little ones), which Schwinger writes, “recur throughout the work like a motto.”

This sprechstimme rendition, shown in Example 1, recalls the comforting sounds of ritualized chanting, in which a congregation responds to a Jewish rabbi or Christian priest’s recited petitions. The motto also functions as a unifying mnemonic device, with which the audience is left at the end of the work.

67 Ibid.
Example 1: K. Penderecki, *Dies Irae, “Lamentatio”* m. 12

Penderecki’s recurring use of staggered entrances of six or twelve choral parts may allude not only to a multitude but also to (an acoustical simulation of) being in a sacred space (a place of safety) participating along with a large congregation in a responsorial recitation. In the context of the poetry, Penderecki’s separation of upper soprano and alto voices from lower tenor and bass voices may indicate the separation of men and women enforced in most of Auschwitz.

At the *più mosso* (mm. 33-41) in “Lamentatio,” the solo soprano line evokes rage, perhaps at the human injustices, by crescendoing from *piano* to *fortissimo* through a disjunct three-octave melodic line in an *accelerando* culminating on a high C, singing:

> The utmost hunger, fatigue, pain and torment.  
> Even Christ did not follow such a path of doom.  
> He never knew that racking discord  
> Between human soul and inhuman world.

The male voices’ litany continues (m. 41, 44-45) until the soprano sings another expressive vocal line to the poem “Pigtail.”

As mentioned in the earlier discussion of text, the first movement corresponds to step one of Briere and Scott’s therapeutic process, exposure. From the beginning the
listener is exposed to the setting of desolation and anguish, musically portrayed by the basses vocalizing a crescendo from pianissimo to forte back to pianissimo (mm. 1-2). In m. 7 the listener is exposed to the image of the “bodies of children from crematoriums” as the solo soprano intones the first eerie declamation of the words of the poem “Bodies.” The staggering vocal entrances of the multiple layering of voices in the declamation of the text aurally paint imagery of the grimmest realities of the Auschwitz concentration camps and trigger emotional memories in the listener.

Movement Two, “Apocalypsis,” opens in forte with a twenty-four part choir (SATB sections each divided into six parts) declaring: “Let him, who has wisdom, tell the number of beasts, for it is the number of a man” (m.1). Throughout the oratorio Penderecki creates sound spectra that recall specific emotions. An example of this is in m. 5. The chorus, a capella, shouts its lines in fortississimo: “Song of the Furies, binding brain and blighting blood in its stringless melody.” The thunderous spoken declaration is like an angry war cry from the depths. Schwinger describes Penderecki’s prescription for the declamation of the Furies as “wild choral speech.” It is also prescribed for the chorus’s rendition of “Satan, which deceiveth the whole world” (mm. 9-13).

The following two examples show how Penderecki uses multiple divisions in the choir to create a theatrical sense of space and multitude and an aural three dimensionality in the music. First, the choir, divided into twelve parts in m. 25, declaims the text about the dragon, which was given “a mouth speaking great things and blasphemies.” Second, as shown in Example 2 (m. 39), the twenty-four choir parts enter individually, coming from opposite ends of the pitch spectrum and acoustically different physical locations on stage, evoking a sense of both magnitude and multitude as they declaim: “After this I beheld, lo, a great multitude, which no man could number,

---

68 Schwinger, Penderecki, 215.
of all nations, and kindreds, and people, and tongues." As seen earlier, the choir divisions also allude to a vertical sense of physical spaces such as the depths of the underworld up to the heavens. Subsequently, in m. 40, the bass solo quietly emerges singing the following apocalyptic verses largely without accompaniment:

> Fear none of those things which thou shalt suffer. Satan will
> Cast some of you into prison and put you to the test, and
> You will suffer oppression for ten days. Be faithful unto your death, and
> I will give you the wreath of life …
> Whoever wins, will not be stricken by death again. (mm. 40-45)

Example 2: K. Penderecki, *Dies Irae*, "Apocalypsis" m. 39

At m. 66 the *sprechstimme* declamation of the Revelations text below starts out in *piano*, crescendos to *forte* in m. 68 then to *fortissimo* by the dramatic climax in m. 70. The choir’s rendition of the prescribed dynamics combined with the siren evokes the image of armies, perhaps representing the allies marching in to liberate the camp. The chimes
may symbolize freedom for the surviving inmates, the end of their time of horror in the camp.

And I saw the beast, and the kings of the earth with their armies assembled for the fight with the man who was riding a horse, and with his soldiers. And the beast was captured, and so was the false prophet ... They were both thrown alive into a lake of fire flaming with sulfur: and others were killed by the sword emerging from the rider’s mouth And all the birds glutted on their dead bodies (63-69).

“Apotheosis,” the final and shortest movement in Dies Irae, shows Auschwitz-Birkenau as transformed into a place where “death is swallowed up in victory.” It opens with the choir singing on a unison D, “And I saw a new sky and a new earth” (m. 1). The tenor then sings the word Et on D below middle C, followed by the soprano singing D a ninth above middle C, followed by the bass who drops an octave. This has the effect of going from the earth to the sky, hence creating a visual and aural space which accentuates the meaning of the text. The stability of this image contrasts with the restless chromatic motions in the first two movements.

In this movement, Penderecki creates an image of male, female, and children uniting after being separated, in heaven for those who have perished, and on earth for those who have survived, by having the bass, tenor, and soprano solo voices sing together for the first and only time during the oratorio. Schwinger sees their proclamations of the word “Victoria” as an expression of hope. In m. 12 over a static cluster on the piano, the chorus syllabically declaims the optimistic words from Valery’s poem Le cimetière marin: “The wind rises ... let us try to live.” Schwinger describes the penultimate choral “victory,” “which began all radiance on a unison A, sticks in its collective throat and collapses glissando into silence.” The oratorio ends by reminding the audience of what has passed. Over a held E, two octaves below middle C in the strings, the tenors and

---

70 Schwinger, Penderecki, 216.
71 Ibid., 217.
basses in *piano* state the litany theme from the first movement, the motto “Corpora parvularum” (m. 22).

According to Briere and Scott, a crucial step in the therapeutic process is for the [listener] to realize the past [that has been reenacted on stage] is gone and there is no reason to be afraid in the present. In the absence of fear, “Apotheosis” brings resolution through its combination of positive texts and dramatic musical score. In its entirety, the oratorio provides an arena for transforming silent implicit memories into spoken implicit ones.

Although Penderecki claimed he “had no wish to set a story or scenario to music,” I suggest that the first movement sets the scene of Auschwitz-Birkenau. The texts of the second and third movements, albeit symbolic and euphemistic, carry a sequential narrative. They are rich in theatricality, elements in the score evoke extreme emotional states of terror, anguish, and pain, and the large vertical stratification of voices within the choir paints images of expansive aural and physical spaces. The sound spectra in Penderecki’s score can activate traumatic memories or emotional states in the audience over the length of a performance.

Penderecki’s *Dies Irae* reframes preconceived and accepted images of Auschwitz-Birkenau concentration camp into classical Greek tragedian and biblical contexts. The oratorio evokes visual and aural images of Auschwitz by combining poetry, mnemonic devices, and specific compositional techniques. All of the above help *Dies Irae* memorialize these shattered pages of Poland’s past and provide an opportunity for collective cathartic experience in the present.

---

72 Ibid., 214.
Ruth Fazal (b. ca. 1950), a native of England, studied piano and violin from an early age. She pursued her violin and composition studies at Dartington College of Arts and the Guildhall School of Music in London, with subsequent violin studies in Paris on a French Government Scholarship. As a professional violinist and Canadian resident since 1975, Fazal is an active chamber musician, and concertmaster of several orchestras in the Toronto environs. In addition, she is an accomplished pianist, Protestant singer-songwriter, and since 2002 a burgeoning composer. In 2005 Fazal invited me to participate (as a violinist) in performances of her work *Oratorio Terezin* in Toronto, Canada. At the end of the performance I witnessed a tidal wave of appreciation surge from the audience, which included a hundred Holocaust survivors some of whom had lived in Terezin. I felt drawn to investigate her work in the context of other Holocaust memorial compositions and of Terezin’s cultural legacy of music and art.

Although entirely different in length and style, Fazal’s *Oratorio Terezin* shares several textual and theatrical elements with Penderecki’s *Dies Irae*. Like *Dies Irae*, Fazal’s oratorio text is derived from scripture and poetry, in particular the poetry of children who lived at Terezin. Combined, the poetry and scripture create a narrative, which is an intrinsic element of tragic theater. Fazal’s use of characterization (Prophet, God, Voice of Suffering, Adult chorus, Children’s chorus) is analogous to Penderecki’s use of choral ranges and timbres that delineate genders and age (adults, children) in *Dies Irae*. Fazal’s use of baritone (Prophet), tenor (God), and soprano (Voice of Suffering) are akin to Penderecki’s similar use of soprano, tenor, and bass soloists in *Dies Irae*. Fazal’s delegation of parts of the chorus playing particular roles (to illustrate the child, adult, sex, and collective perspectives) is also reminiscent of Penderecki’s choral roles in *Dies Irae*. Fazal’s orchestral score, by far the more harmonically traditional of the two
memorial works discussed in this thesis, is richly encoded with Jewish musical markings, such as Hebrew-like folk melodies and instrumentation.73

Fazal’s work embodies Bruggemann’s concept of place in relationship to Jewish culture. Textually, dramatic tension is created by concrete poetic references to and descriptions of Terezin’s displaced residents’ former and present environments, their landedness and landlessness. The biblical yearnings for a homeland and descriptions of God as a secure place resonate within the content of the children’s poetry. Musically, the score underpins the text with the following elements: musical character that calls on emotions connected with trauma; music that re-enacts the harsh existence in Terezin; extra-musical sounds that place the composition in wartime; and characteristic Jewish markers that serve to reinforce cultural identity.

*Oratorio Terezin’s* use of programmatic writing or tone-painting enhances the understanding of the narrative, adds to the drama of the work, and lends the audience an accessibility which may largely account for its appeal and broad success.

**Background**

In 1998 Fazal was given a copy of *I Never Saw Another Butterfly*, a collection of children’s poetry and artwork created in Terezin Concentration Camp during World War II. Artists in Theresienstadt were paid with bread to teach art classes to children inmates. One of the artists was Bauhaus-trained Friedl Dicker-Brandeis.74 She secretly used the art lessons as therapy for the traumatized children to help them cope with the horrors of daily life in the camp. She told the children stories and had them draw

---

73 See musical analysis section below.
74 Friedl Dicker-Brandeis was born in Vienna, later immigrated to Prague and became a Czech citizen. Apart from life as a portrait and landscape painter she was an anti-Fascist activist, a Communist, and secularist. She came to Theresienstadt in December 1942, was deported to Auschwitz on October 6 1944, and died in Birkenau. During her time at Theresienstadt she lived in a small space under a staircase and would accept no payment for her teaching. She didn’t paint while a resident but saved all paper and materials for the children. In “Forward” by Chaim Potok in the 1993 edition of *I Never Saw Another Butterfly*. 
pictures and write poetry. American Jewish author Chaim Potok described the artistic activities of the children: “They drew [and wrote about] their concealed inner worlds, their tortured emotions, which Dicker-Brandeis was then able to enter into and try to heal. She helped restore a balance to the trembling consciousness of terrified children.”

The poetry and artwork miraculously survived the war. A collection of this art and poetry was first published in 1959 as *I Never Saw Another Butterfly* for the State Jewish Museum in Prague.

A year after reading *I Never Saw Another Butterfly*, Fazal felt she had to write a “love song of hope in the midst of darkness,” to memorialize the “children’s naïveté and hope, beautiful in contrast to the awful suffering [of the Holocaust].” At the time Fazal felt compelled to write her oratorio, she spoke of herself as an experienced songwriter as well as accomplished professional violinist and concertmaster. In 2007 she stated in a *BBC Music Magazine* interview, “I’m not a composer.” Although she studied composition and in 2002 premiered her first large composition, *The Seven Last Words of Christ*, a concerto for spoken voice and violin with orchestra, she still didn’t see herself as a working composer. In contrast to Penderecki, a composer by profession throughout his life, Fazal came to composing large-scale works later in her career. Asked in a recent interview whether she still feels that way, she says she now sees herself as a composer, “commissioned by God, [whose] main role is to be a ‘listener’ and then a

---

76 Subsequent revised editions of *I Never Saw Another Butterfly* have been published in 1978 and 1993 by Artia for Schocken Books. The 1993 edition contains a forward, epilogue, and afterward by Chaim Potok, Jiri Weil, and Vaclav Havel respectively. The same book has inspired numerous other composers to set its poems: composers Ellwood Derr (soprano, saxophone, piano), Michael Karmon (soprano, piano), Cantor Charles Davidson (children’s choir, piano), Srul Irving Glick (contralto, piano), and Lori Laitman (soprano, clarinet) wrote song cycles based on and titled *I Never Saw Another Butterfly*; Franz Waxman composed *Song of Terezin*, an oratorio for chorus and children’s choir, based on poetry from *I Never Saw Another Butterfly*.
78 Ruth Fazal, Interview by author, July 20, 2008, E-mail.
communicator’.”\textsuperscript{79} In the same interview Fazal explained that her purpose in composing Oratorio Terezin was to try to answer troubling questions that arose from her encounter with the book I Never Saw Another Butterfly, and her visits to Prague, Terezin, and Auschwitz. The most important of her questions were, “Where was God in all this terrible suffering?” and, “Will [we] reconsider the goodness of God?”\textsuperscript{80}

Fazal’s personal involvement with each performance of Oratorio Terezin’s journey to stages in Toronto (November 1 and 2, 2003), Bratislava (March 10, 2004), Vienna (March 11, 2004), Brno (March 14, 2004), Prague (March 16, 2004), Tel Aviv (May 5, 2005), Jerusalem (May 6, 2005), Karmiel (May 7, 2005), and New York (February 7, 2007) reveals her depth of feeling for the children’s circumstances at Terezin and points to her broader socio-political mission to stop the oppression of children everywhere in the world.

As a songwriter, Fazal could have written a number of songs to the poetic texts of Terezin but chose instead to compose a large-scale narrative work of the scope of a Bach passion or Handel oratorio. In her own words, “Once I realized that in order to weave the Hebrew scriptures around the poems, I was looking at other voices [apart from the children] including an adult response in the form of an adult choir. Then I began to realize that piano accompaniment would not suffice.”\textsuperscript{81}

Another example of Fazal’s broad vision of the piece is her insistence on an educational component for every group that performs the work. As an extension of the proscenium arch, the educational aspect can be seen as another dimension of the theatricality of the work. Fazal feels “the educational aspect is hugely important, especially for the children, as they tend to really enter into the heart of it.”\textsuperscript{82}

\textsuperscript{79} Ruth Fazal, Interview by the author.
\textsuperscript{80} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{81} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{82} Ibid.
children’s choir and optionally the adult choir and orchestral musicians are given the opportunity to attend Holocaust education sessions. In 2007 Francisco M. Nunez, artistic director of the Young People’s Chorus of New York City, commented on the young choir members’ experience:

This was amazing. They brought a survivor in and talked to the children. He told them, I was your age when this was happening, and they understood and identified. The children’s questions were so amazing, so sophisticated for kids their age. A lot of the children in this chorus are Jewish and they had particularly poignant and pointed questions because they are familiar with the subject. The children are stirred by what they learn and want to know more. The Jewish children feel pride in having done this piece. The non-Jewish children feel very good about being part of this. Kids who are Muslims, Evangelical Christians, atheists are together on stage for this, and they feel it.83

History of Terezin

In October 1941, two years after the Third Reich dismembered Czechoslovakia, the Nazis created a Jewish ghetto called Theresienstadt from Terezin, a pre-existing town of 3,700 inhabitants.84 Originally built as a fortress in 1780 and situated an hour northwest of Prague, it comprised thick walls, moats, a large gray barracks, drab homes, and a grid of narrow streets. The Jewish ghetto was a Nazi construct, the brainstorm of Heinrich Himmler (1905-1945), a top ranking German official.85 Himmler envisioned Theresienstadt as a “model ghetto,” “a town inhabited by Jews and governed by them in which every manner of work [was] to be done,”86 that would show Red Cross officials how well the Nazis treated displaced Jews, hence concealing the genocide of

---

84 In 1780 Hapsburg emperor Joseph II ordered a walled garrison town to be built, named Terezin after his mother Maria Theresa. The town, designed by Italian military engineers, is enclosed by twelve ramparts in the shape of a star. Terezin eventually became home to civilians, however soldiers still comprised half of its population.
85 Heinrich Himmler was the head of the Schutzstaffel (SS), who oversaw the operations of the police, the Gestapo, and all concentration and death camps.
86 Hana Volavkova, ed., I Never Saw Another Butterfly, xiv.
the “Final Solution.” The town would house high-profile Jewry such as former World War I soldiers, doctors, diplomats, and engineers, artists such as composers, writers, singers, artists, conductors, actors, some elderly, and thousands of children.

To prepare for the one official combined visit of the Danish Red Cross and International Red Cross on June 23, 1944, the town underwent the “beautifying campaign”; all was freshly painted, stores and cafés were stocked with goods and food, new furnishings were placed in formerly shabby apartments of prominent Jews, new street signs were erected, schools and cultural events were staged, and gardens planted. Part of the charade was to disguise overcrowded and unhygienic conditions. Between May 16 and May 18, 1944, 7,503 people were deported from Terezin to Auschwitz to “alleviate crowding,” and a fake bathroom facility was built with a line of non-functional wash basins, taps, and water spouts. A Nazi propaganda film was shot in Terezin following the visit, which boasted that “Theresienstadt was a gift ‘the Führer has given the Jews’ to prepare them for life in Palestine.”

In reality, the former fortress was a concentration camp and temporary way station for Jews who were later deported to Auschwitz. Despite the hardships, there existed more freedom than in other concentration camps, allowing for a cultural life which produced theater works and both popular and classical music. We can see Terezin as a constructed performance (for the Red Cross and inter-national officials), a stage or a façade, itself. Of the 15,000 children who passed through Terezin, only 100 survived.

**Text**

Fazal’s work is a ninety-minute, five-part numbered oratorio for a full orchestra, full chorus representing adult residents of Terezin ghetto, a children’s choir representing the children, a tenor as the Voice of God, a baritone as the Voice of the Prophet, and a

---

87 Ibid.
soprano as the Voice of Suffering. Echoing Benjamin Britten’s technique of mixing liturgy with poetry in his 1962 War Requiem, and Penderecki’s creation of a textual collage of poetry and scripture in his 1967 Dies Irae, Oratorio Terezin creates a narrative combining Hebrew scriptures with poetry written by the children imprisoned at Terezin.

Of the collection of children’s poems written in Terezin between 1942 and 1944, Fazal chose ones she immediately responded to and that spoke of various aspects of the children’s responses to their environment and experiences in the camp. Scriptures occurred to her as she read the poems. Just as Penderecki’s Catholic background informed his choice of scriptures in Dies Irae, Fazal’s biblical knowledge informed her choice of texts. Though the two texts were written thousands of years apart, Fazal reasons that they meshed to form a dialogue because of the timelessness of the scriptures. The children’s poems in Fazal’s work expose the listener to the physical and emotional trauma of living in Terezin.

Part One exposes the audience to the conditions in Terezin, the first step in Briere and Scott’s therapeutic approach to trauma work. From the beginning of the oratorio, the poems transport the listener to a place of despair, thereby positioning him/her to experience the disconnect between the horror of Terezin and security of home. The emotional tension resulting from this disconnect necessitates catharsis. The melismatic wordless Voice of Suffering is the first voice heard in the Introduction. God’s voice, in response to the initial sound of suffering, is heard in No. 2, “I Remember,” reminding the Jewish people of his love and the covenant he has with them. These first two numbers set the tone for the somber, meditative quality of the text. Similar to the furies’ role in Dies Irae, God may be seen as the listening therapist in Oratorio Terezin.

88 Ruth Fazal, Interview by the author.
In keeping with Briere and Scott’s stage of exposure, the next four musical numbers describe places where physical and emotional sufferings intersect in Terezin. “Terezin 1,” “O God, Do Not Keep Silent” (Psalm 83), “Terezin II,” and “I Am Shut In” (Psalm 56) are sung by alternating children and adult choirs. In “Terezin 1,” the combined choirs speak of their trauma, declaiming: “We’ve suffered enough, here in this clot of grief and shame.” In “Terezin 2,” they describe the foul surroundings they are forced to endure there: “That bit of filth in dirty walls, and all around barbed wire.” In Psalm 83 (No. 4) the full choir cries out to God to be neither silent nor still under the circumstances. This dialogue, in the composer’s own words, “from the human heart to God’s heart,” continues in No. 6 with references to the passage of time, trauma, and imprisonment. The adult choir laments: “I am shut in so I cannot escape, my eyes grow dim through sorrow.” The movement closes with Psalms 64 and 94 (No. 8), where Adult and Children’s Choirs declaim that God is their “place” of refuge and plead with him to be the “God of vengeance” who will avenge the wicked to rescue them from this place of horror.

Another child’s perspective is presented in No. 7, “It All Depends On How You Look At It,” where references to place and space are plentiful and unmistakable: “Terezin, the street, [and] a square kilometer of earth.” The phrase “Cut off from the world that’s free” is characteristic of what Brueggemann describes as landlessness, a dominant theme in Terezin.

Terezin is full of beauty.
It’s in your eyes now clear
And through the street
The tramp of many marching feet I hear.
In the ghetto at Terezin,
It looks that way to me,
Is a square kilometer of earth,
Cut off from the world that’s free.
Death after all,
Claims everyone,
You see it everywhere.
It catches up with even those
Who wear their noses in their air.
The whole wide world is ruled
With a certain justice, so
That helps perhaps to sweeten
The poor man’s
Pain and woe.

Four poems and scriptures that comprise Part Two of the oratorio point to place and identity: “The Butterfly,” “Homesick,” “Home,” and “I am a Jew,” plus passages from Hosea 11, and Song of Solomon 2. Some children keenly observe any scrap of beauty in the ghetto around them while others compare life in Terezin to the life they remember in their former homes. “The Butterfly,” printed below, is a poignant example of how, through nature, a young man perceived and understood what was on the inside of Terezin and what he was missing on the outside. The expressive poem by twenty-one-year-old Pavel Friedman contains imagery that suggests the tragic interior of his experience in the Terezin courtyard and a hyper-sensitive relationship to his present environment.

The last, the very last,
So richly, brightly,
Dazzingly yellow.
Perhaps if the sun’s tears would sing
Against a white stone....
Such, such a yellow
Is carried lightly way up high.
It went away I’m sure
Because it wished to kiss the world goodbye.
For seven weeks I’ve lived here.
Penned up inside this ghetto
But I have found what I love here.
The dandelions call to me
And the white chestnut
Branches in the court.
Only, I never saw another butterfly.
That Butterfly was the last one.
Butterflies don’t live here,
In the ghetto.
“Homesick” (No. 10), written anonymously in 1943, and “Home” (No. 11) written by Franta Bass, resonate with the themes of the landlessness found in Terezin ghetto and the landedness found in thoughts of home. The ghetto is described as “A place of evil and fear ... where bit by bit it’s horror to live.” “Home” (No. 11), however, provides the antithesis of the ghetto with the specificity of geographical direction, declaiming, “I look to the southeast ... I look toward my home ... The city where I was born. City, O my city, I will gladly return to you.”

The defiant poem, “I am a Jew” (No. 13), can be seen as an element of Briere and Scott’s counter-conditioning, where the author chooses life over death. Written by Franta Bass in Terezin when she was between 12 and 14 years old, it exemplifies the indomitable spirit of the Jewish people, the pride and indestructibility of a nation. In its final lines the child proclaims, “Even though I am suppressed, I will always come back to life.” This text echoes the very core of Jewish identity, which is to choose life and a safe place in which to live it. The poem is flanked by Nos. 12 and 14, comprising scriptures of Hosea and Solomon that also contain positive references to the love between father and son, and a groom and his bride, respectively. These represent the love between God and Israel and are familiar metaphors to the Jewish people.

Related to the therapeutic process, Henry Krystal wrote that in therapy, “the [therapist] has to participate in the mourning in order for the [trauma victim] to mourn” so he/she can work through his/her grief.89 For mass trauma victims, sharing grief through collective witness of a mimesis of their tragedy reframed safely on a stage, invites cathartic experience. During performances of the oratorio the mourning expressed by the prophets and God is felt by the audience. In the final words in Part Two, God proclaims his love and loyalty to Israel, saying, “How can I give you up, oh Ephraim? How can I hand you over, O Israel?” Also, at the beginning of Part Three, Old

---

Testament Prophet Jeremiah comments on the victims’ emotional sadness: “A voice from the bare heights is heard: the plaintive weeping of Israel’s children.” This is followed by the Voice of Suffering, which embodies the suffering of the Jewish people and of God. Through Jeremiah, God responds, encouraging Israel to call to him. In this section, the prophet Isaiah, religious leader of Israel, also mourns, crying out:

> For the hurt of my poor people, I am hurt. I mourn, and dismay has taken hold of me. Is there no balm in Gilead? Why then has the health of my poor people not been restored? O that my head were a spring of water, and my eyes a fountain of tears, so that I might weep day and night for the slain of my poor people.

This public expression of mourning, in both its biblical and contemporary theatrical Oratorio Terezin settings, is necessary for catharsis and psychological recuperation to take place. Martin Wangh, former Chairman of the Provisional Committee for the Medical Rehabilitation of Victims of Man-Made Disasters (NYC), states that at a time of mourning Jews traditionally sat for a period of time with the mourner (“sitting sheva”); similarly, Catholics held large wakes to “help sustain each other in the face of tragedy.” The ritual of mourning in the public space of a theater functions similarly to the aforementioned traditional rituals of mourning. Just as there are expectations for participants in traditional settings of mourning (sheva, wakes, and funerals) there is a set of unvaried expectations for audiences in the collective space of theatrical settings.

Later in Part Three, there are additional references to the passage of time in both the scriptures and the children’s poetry such as the futility of wasted time and the possibility of a better time in the future. These references emphasize the emotional darkness of the inmates’ lives in Terezin. In between two of the three children’s poems, the full choir laments in words ascribed to Jeremiah from Lamentations 5:20-22: “Why

---

90 Ruth Fazal, Interview by the author.
91 Gilead is a mountainous region northeast of the Dead Sea well-known for its medicinal herbal balms.
92 Jeremiah 8:19 – 9:1.
93 Krystal, Massive Psychic Trauma, 275.
have you forgotten us completely? Why have you forsaken us these many days?
Restore us to Yourself, O Lord, that we may be restored.” They ask God, after all this
time has passed, why has he still not done something to help them? Implied here is,
why has he left them in this wilderness — between landlessness and landedness?
“The Night in the Ghetto” (No. 21), opens with the line: “Another day has gone for
keeps into the bottomless pit of time,” and ends with “darkness is too kind to weary
eyes which all day long have had to watch [the horrors].” “This Old House” (No. 23),
describes a former home, an old deserted house, which now “stands in silence [that]
used to be so nice [but] now it is deserted, rotting in silence. What a waste of houses, a
waste of hours.”

“The Garden” (No. 19) exemplifies the intersection of trauma, time, and place. It
draws an image of a little boy walking along a narrow path bordered with rose
blossoms. “When the blossom comes to bloom,” it says “that little boy will be no more.”
The specificity of the place (the narrow path) and the paradox between the blooming of
the blossom and the expiration of the boy emphasizes the trauma in and to which the
children of Terezin are both participants and witnesses.

Part Four is the decisive turning point towards “action” and positive “reframing” in
the oratorio. It marks a transformation from wasted hours and desolation to God taking
charge and rescuing his people. This positive action correlates to Brier and Scott’s stage
four of counter-conditioning the traumatic memory. Part Four contains two numbers,
Nos. 24 and 25, “See, I Am Laying in Zion a Stone,” sung by God, and “Who Has
Believed What We Have Heard?” sung by the prophet and both choirs. No. 24 is God’s
response to his people upon hearing the extent of their suffering in Terezin and their
(and the prophet’s) anger at being forgotten. In it God expresses anger, rather than
sorrow, answering the cries of his people with: “I am laying in Zion a stone... And
whoever believes in him (God) will not be put to shame.” In No. 25 the Prophet Isaiah
announces that there will be healing for his people through a “suffering servant” who will take on their burdens. The prophet, children’s choir, and adult choir alternate in a dialogue using the text of Isaiah 53.94

The use of the Isaiah text including the phrase “suffering servant” can be problematic if Christians see this as a reference to Christ. Historically, there has been concern over the danger of the Christianization of the Holocaust.95 In 1984, fifteen Carmelite nuns established a convent in a building adjacent to Auschwitz.96 Fazal, whose composition responds to the poetry of Jewish children in Terezin ghetto, however, specifically chose scriptures from the Old Testament (Torah) for biblical portions of her texts. As her oratorio is filled with Jewish markers, it seems clear that her composition is an empathetic musical response to Jewry. Fazal asks for reconsideration of God, not redemption through Christ.97

Part Five corresponds with Briere and Scott’s final stage of resolution. Its four children’s poems exhibit resilience and hope in spite of the surroundings. As in so many of the children’s poems, the inspiration and hope comes from the nature that is within their Terezin environment: a butterfly, a blooming tree, or the “shrieking” blue sky. In the three final poetic texts the children are inspired by birds, symbols of joyfulness and freedom, which was lacking for Terezin prisoners. For example in “Birdsong 1” (No. 28) the text reads, “A blackbird sings upon a bush to greet the dawn after night.” The children sing,

Hey, try to open your heart up to beauty. Go to the woods someday and weave a wreath of memory there. Then if the tears obscure your way you’ll know how wonderful it is to be alive.

94 The prophetic book of Isaiah is from where most Haftarot (prophetic readings chanted in synagogues during Sabbath, high holidays and other religious days) are taken. Included in Isaiah’s prophecies is the belief that Israel would survive a calamity wrought on them by God for their sins and ultimately become purified and peaceful.
96 Ibid.
97 Ruth Fazal, Interview by the author.
The penultimate number in the oratorio, “On a Sunny Evening,” sung by both choirs, is equally uplifting and hopeful, leading to God’s final words of vindication, redemption, and salvation. The choirs sing, “The world’s abloom and seems to smile. I want to fly, but where, how high? If in barbed wire things can bloom why couldn’t I? I will not die!”

In the poems in Part Five, the children also show a mature knowledge of the necessity of grieving in the face of such trauma and loss. In both “Tears” (No. 26) and “Birdsong 1” (No. 28) the children acknowledge that tears of grief are a positive sign that one is still alive. In “Tears” both adult and children’s choirs proclaim, “And thereafter come tears. Without them there is no life.” (Alena Synkova, “Tears”)

The remaining texts from Isaiah 61 and 62 promise vindication and reward. In “For Zion’s Sake” (No. 30) the Prophet sings: “I will not keep silent. I will not rest until [Zion or Jerusalem’s] vindication shines out like the dawn and her salvation like a burning torch.” The oratorio closes with the Voice of God declaiming: “See, your salvation comes, His reward is with him, and His recompense before Him. You shall be called ‘the Holy People, the Redeemed of the Lord’ and you shall be called Sought out, a City not Forsaken.” This can be interpreted not only symbolically but in the earthly return to a safe place and the formation of Israel.

**Musical Analysis**

*Oratorio Terezin* comprises thirty-two numbers (including the introduction) in five parts that are performed in two acts. Its scale, consistent with the English oratorio tradition, equals that of a nineteenth- or twentieth-century three-act opera or full-length dramatic play. The work’s length permits a descriptive drama to unfold and be transformed through space and time. The oratorio’s musical score engages and adds to the powerful narrative of the text through its suggestive instrumentation, vaguely
familiar melodies idiomatic of Semitic orientalism, re-enactment of live action, musical foreshadowing, extra-musical sounds, and musical characterization of vocal parts.

The oratorio’s primary melodic settings are modal,\textsuperscript{98} with some use of major and harmonic minor scales. Harmonies are tonal but often employ open fifths and fourths. Complex tonal chords mark transitions, endings, and mood changes. In a recent interview, Fazal admitted that she purposely avoided listening to traditional Jewish folk or sacred music before or during the time she composed the oratorio. Not being Jewish she preferred that her response to the poems have a personal quality to it “rather than try to express [herself] through another people’s language.”\textsuperscript{99} The listener, however, is immediately struck by the similarities of the melodic lines in the oratorio to vocal lines in Jewish folk and sacred tradition.

In 1929 Abraham Z. Idelsohn wrote, “Jewish music is the song of Judaism through the lips of the Jew. It is the tonal expression of Jewish life and development over a period of more than two thousand years.”\textsuperscript{100} I have synthesized from Idelsohn’s book, \textit{Jewish Music: Its Historical Development}, the following list of seven characteristics of Semitic-oriental song:

1. Melodies often use one or more of sixteen modes used in various Middle Eastern cultures. 
2. Ornamentation is pervasively used on both long and short notes. 
3. Different meters are combined to create an arrhythmic quality. 
4. Melodic range of folk-tunes is usually tetrachordal or pentachordal. 
5. Improvisation is prominent. 
6. Harmony is absent or based on unison, fourths, fifths, and seconds. 
7. Melodies consist of short phrases.\textsuperscript{101}

All of these Jewish folk characteristics appear in \textit{Oratorio Terezin} and may contribute to a Jewish audience fundamentally identifying with the music as part of its own

\textsuperscript{98} Fazal uses a variety of modes. The most frequent is Dorian, transposed to numerous pitches. She also frequently uses the natural minor (Aeolian).
\textsuperscript{99} Ruth Fazal, Interview by the author.
\textsuperscript{101} Idelsohn, \textit{Jewish Music}, 24-34.
culture. Example No. 3, “O God, Do Not Keep Silent,” combines duple and triple rhythms within a homophonically rendered choral melody, producing an arrhythmic quality found in the Jewish folk genre. It also shows a small melodic pitch range, and short phrases.

Example 3. R. Fazal, *Oratorio Terezin*, “O God, Do Not Keep Silent” (No. 4), mm. 1–6

In most melodic sections of Fazal’s music for the children’s poetry, the pitch range does not exceed a minor sixth. Fazal’s harmonic choices also parallel those of Jewish folk music as she often uses harmonies that include perfect intervals of fifths, fourths, and octaves. Dissonances such as major and minor seconds are employed to emphasize dissonant themes and emotions inferred by the text.

Key signatures other than C major are rarely indicated, which gives Fazal the ability to move freely between modes and keys. In No. 19, in F major, the composer creates the dramatic effect by descending from the pitch C to C-flat in mm. 21-22. The mood transforms from children singing in F major about a playful young boy walking along a lovely garden path to the realization, using the implied tritone of F to C-flat, that “the little boy will be no more.” This dramatic harmonic underpinning also serves as a transition to the next scene, or musical number, “Hark the Cry,” where the Prophet Jeremiah deeply and angrily mourns.

Although historically Jewish music was primarily vocal due to its intimate association with words, there are temple orchestras mentioned in the Old Testament
and certain instruments have survived in modified forms through the ages. The Jewish people would have brought these instruments with them throughout their historical sojourns. Therefore certain instruments signify part of their longstanding transportable cultural identity. Fazal may have made use of these modernized instruments in Oratorio Terezin having come across references to Jewish instruments and their purposes in her study of the Old Testament.

The shofar, heard at the beginning of the oratorio, is the only instrument that remained in the temple, the Jewish place of worship, during the Middle Ages and is still used in the synagogue today primarily during Rosh Hoshana and Yom Kippur. Made from a curved ram’s horn or mountain goat’s horn, its purpose has changed over the years. To Fazal the shofar “represents many things: it is a call to attention, a call to repentance, and it brings the uniqueness of the Jewish expression to the piece from the very outset, which is the only time it is heard [in the piece].” Those families with Jewish practices who were listening to a performance of Oratorio Terezin would, at the very least, associate the shofar with the synagogue and its association with the Jewish High Holidays.

Other biblical instruments are used in modernized versions in Oratorio Terezin. For example, the chatzotzera or Egyptian trumpet, was used for signaling in both secular and sacred situations. The nevel, or large harp, was used for emotional soothing. Wind instruments such as the halil (pipe), the uggav, (flute), and alamoth, (double flute), which were used for processions, became the modern clarinet, flute, and oboe. The tof (small drum) was used as rhythm keeper, while the metziltayim (cymbal) was the only percussive instrument used in the temple.

---

102 Ibid., 18.
103 Ruth Fazal, Interview by the author.
104 Ibid.
Much as the dramatic use of recurring leitmotivs in opera represent a particular character, a place, or an idea, Fazal uses groups of instruments and timbre dramatically to accompany specific characters in the oratorio. Strings, in a recitative style, are used to accompany the Voice of God sung by the tenor as shown in Example 4.

2. I Remember

Example 4: R. Fazal, *Oratorio Terezin, “I Remember”* (No. 2) mm. 1-7

A fuller orchestra, including strings, in a more dramatic style (than in God’s recitative string accompaniment) is used to accompany the Voice of the Prophet, the intercessor between God and his people. The Voice of Suffering, representing the pain and despair of both the Jewish people and God, is always rendered without words, melismatically by a high soprano. Melismatic vocalization, which is reminiscent of sacred cantorial singing, places the audience within the context of the synagogue. Example No. 5 exemplifies melismatic singing by the Voice of Suffering.
Example 5: R. Fazal, *Oratorio Terezin*, “Introduction” mm. 13-18

The Children’s Choir numbers typically are sparsely orchestrated and rendered syllabically with staccato articulation. For example, in “Terezin II” (No. 5) the accompaniment consists of single flute, oboe, horn, and strings. Later, in m. 30, when the adult sopranos join forces with the children, the orchestration is denser with added winds, harp, and percussion. The disembodied Voice of Suffering melismatically sings both above the voices of the women and alongside them, expressing their pain as they lament: “Like a mother with an ailing child loves him with an aching mother’s love.” (mm. 46-50) “The Butterfly” (No. 9), which is composed for a child’s solo voice, is particularly poignant as it emphasizes the intersection between the traumatic abuses of children in Terezin (and other places where such atrocities occur).

Of particular musical and dramatic significance is the final number in Part One, “God Is a Refuge for Us” (No. 8). The 122-measure piece is essentially a lament in the midst of the Holocaust, which begins in *mezzopiano* with a haunting melodic theme of grief played by a solo viola. The theme, shown in Example 6 (mm. 16-23), repeated throughout the orchestra, gradually becomes stronger and more forceful as it is joined
by single vocalists, the winds, percussion, and in m. 41 by both choirs demanding to know “How Long?” In m. 49 a more urgent theme, sung in *forte* ("O God, you God of vengeance, shine forth [and] give to the proud what they deserve"), begins to accompany the lament. When both themes reach *fortissimo* the well-known Lutheran Chorale, “A Mighty Fortress is Our God,” is played in the brass in a different key, resulting in a cacophony of sound. The chorale represents Christians who worshipped in the churches in Germany during the Holocaust, deaf to the desperate plight and calls of their Jewish neighbors.\(^{106}\) The fact that Martin Luther who wrote the chorale between 1527 and 1529 was famously anti-Semitic may be part of the reason Fazal chose this German chorale to illustrate her point. The cacophony of this collision of themes describes a place of utter confusion and discord in Europe during World War II. It creates a disturbing tableau of outstretched arms pleading in vain for aid in all directions.

Example 6: R. Fazal, *Oratorio Terezin*, “God Is a Refuge for Us” (No. 8) mm. 17-24

Fazal uses the klezmer musical style in “I Am a Jew” (No. 13), which places Terezin’s prisoners in an Eastern European context. Out of its highly rhythmic accompaniment emerges a high pitched “scream” played by the E-flat clarinet, which to Fazal, “was the

\(^{106}\) Ruth Fazal, Interview by the author.
instrument that could somehow communicate this [the] best.” 107 Directly after this scream is a section which, to Fazal, “represents the journey from Terezin to Auschwitz (which, for many, was their final journey). There is a side-drum ‘gunshot’ sound representing pistol shots from World War II.” 108

Train transports to Terezin and from Terezin to Auschwitz are dramatically included in the oratorio. As horrible as the concentration and extermination camps were, the trains were what Brueggemann describes as a wilderness situated between landlessness and landedness. The trip in the train cattle cars used for the transport of Jews and others was one of darkness and fear. No one knew where they were going, if they would return, or how long the trip was going to be. The train transport to Terezin is depicted in “Terezin I” (No. 3) by a repeated four-note chromatic sixteenth-note pattern in the strings to mimic the sound of trains traveling along track. The train’s whistle or horn is depicted by two horns playing a tritone to the rhythm shown in Example No. 7.

---

107 Ruth Fazal, Interview by the author.
108 Ibid.
Twice in Part Two, God sings to his people, a highly memorable lyrical love song to the texts of the Song of Solomon (2:10-12 and 2:13-14). Like the litany theme in *Dies Irae*, it functions as a mnemonic device recalling God’s love for his people. It corresponds to Briere and Scott’s counter-conditioning stage as the song reframes the reality of Terezin with something positive, God’s love.

The 156-measure long finale of the work, “See, Your Salvation Comes” (No. 32) functions as Briere and Scott’s final stage, “resolution.” It opens with God’s remarks from Isaiah 62:12: “See, your salvation comes.” The Voice of Suffering joins the Voice of God for his final texted bars starting in a low pitch range in m. 36. The Voice of Suffering gradually ascends to a higher place and would be heard throughout the finale if it were not for the children’s voices. Children first join in m. 44 vocalizing on the syllable “Ah” the simple joyful melody in Example No. 8.

Example 8: R. Fazal, *Oratorio Terezín*, “Finale: See Your Salvation Comes” (No. 32)

mm. 45-51

At first the strings are in a melismatic motion with the Voice of Suffering until, it seems, they have heard the children’s simple song. Eventually the orchestra is playing and the adult choir is singing rhythmically with the children. When one can no longer hear the voice of suffering it has indeed joined the children and the rest of the ensemble. The final seven bars render a fragment of the children’s joyful motif in augmentation for a
triumphant sounding ending in *fortississimo*. I had an informal conversation with soprano Teresa Maria Gomez during a rehearsal break in November, 2005. She described her profound emotional experience singing *The Voice of Suffering*, particularly in the finale where the children overwhelmed and obliterated her suffering voice with their voices of hope and joy. Fazal ingeniously uses the metaphor of the children’s voices overtaking the Voice of Suffering to transform the horrific landscape of the Holocaust, thus bringing the oratorio to a triumphant finish.

Like *Dies Irae*, Fazal’s oratorio may transport the listener through the stages of Briere and Scott’s therapeutic approach to working through trauma. The emotionally direct children’s poetry in dialogue with supporting scriptures exposes the listener to the harsh life in Terezin. These texts and musical score are particularly charged with imagery that could activate traumatic memories in listeners susceptible to flashbacks (or other forms of traumatic memory). The more hopeful poems combine with the positive turn of events in the narrative (God’s promise to rescue and reward his people) to counter-condition and reframe the original trauma.

Part Five corresponds with Briere and Scott’s fourth stage, resolution. As discussed earlier, the listener’s recognition of the disparity between the negative past and the positive present invites catharsis. Listening to a performance of Fazal’s work may help those who are working through traumatic memories to transform their implicit memories of the Holocaust into explicit ones. All Holocaust survivors who have spoken to Fazal after performances of *Oratorio Terezin* have reported transformational experiences that have helped them move through the pain that lived in their memories for so many years.109 Recently, a documentary called “I Will Not Die” by Marion Rice-Oxley, based on Fazal’s journey with *Oratorio Terezin*, was premiered at the Jewish Film

---

109 Ruth Fazal, Interview by the author.
Festival in Toronto. I have not had access to it yet. However, the film promises more insight into the oratorio’s significance to Holocaust survivors.
Not all music is healing and music does not heal all. It would be presumptuous to say otherwise. However, there is a large body of scholarship that speaks to music’s curative powers and therapeutic use.110 Through the centuries, music has been used to aid the healing of the emotionally afflicted. The Greek mathematician Pythagoras (ca. 580-490 B. C. E.) considered “the lyre [harp] suitable for purifying [people’s] souls of irrational passions.”111 Jewish physician Ibn ‘Aquin (d. 1226) wrote in his work *tibb al-Nufus* (*Hygiene of the Souls*):

> In the case of melancholy … [when the sick person] cannot see things as they are and is afraid of things of which he has no reason to be afraid, this is a bad disease. He can cure it by listening to the performance of instrumentalists and to the singing of poems accompanied by these five instruments: *kinnorium* and *nevalim* (lyres), *man’ ammim* (perhaps mena’ne’im, rattles), *mezalselim* (cymbals), and ‘*uggavime* (wind instruments).112

Similarly, in 1614 Spanish physician Rodericus a Castro wrote that “Throughout Spain, whenever anyone falls seriously ill [mania, melancholia], it is usual to summon musicians.”113

*Dies Irae* and *Oratorio Terezin* are part of a twentieth and twenty-first century genre of musical Holocaust memorial works spanning from 1947 to the present that harness such powers attributed to music. Addressing the subject of Holocaust memorials, in 1993 Israeli and Jewish author Aharon Appelfeld said that there is a need to “bring [the Holocaust] down into the human realm … not to simplify, attenuate, or sweeten the

---


112 Horden, ed., *Music as Medicine*, 73.

113 Ibid., 23-24.
horror, but to attempt to make the events speak through the individual and in his language, to rescue the suffering from huge numbers ... to give the tortured person back his human form, which was snatched away from him.” 114 Both Penderecki and Fazal have reconstructed emotional complexities of the Holocaust bringing them to a comprehensive level for listeners.” Using poetry written in or about the Holocaust, familiar scriptures, Jewish cultural tropes, and fundamental themes such as the importance of land, the works attempt to speak through the listener’s language.

My interest is how these compositions (and others in this genre) may fulfill a therapeutic psychological need for those who have suffered the effects of mass trauma, specifically in the Holocaust. Through musical and textual analyses, I have sought to show how hearing performances of these works may be analogous to Briere and Scott’s therapeutic method for working through trauma and help transform implicit traumatic memories into explicit ones.

Penderecki’s Dies Irae and Ruth Fazal’s Oratorio Terezin expose audiences to the horrors of daily life in two specific Nazi concentration camps, Auschwitz-Birkenau, and Terezin. Both works contain chronological textual narratives and musical scores. These narratives metaphorically or directly relate events and the treatment of European prisoners during World War II. The compositions use texts from poetry, scriptures, and Greek tragedy (in the case of Dies Irae) to reframe and thus counter-condition the traumatic events. Both narratives have transformative endings that overcome the enemy and reward the prisoners with “a new heaven and a new earth.” 115 Finally both works contain highly theatrical declamation of the texts and dramatic musical scores.

Based on its elements I have analyzed, I suggest that Dies Irae is a highly effective Holocaust Memorial work with therapeutic potential. In the case of Oratorio Terezin,

114 Amy Lynn Wlodarski, “The Sounds of Memory,” 263.
115 Corinthians 1:15.
several Holocaust survivors, after hearing performances, asked Fazal, “How could you know?” In addition, the Jewish audiences in Europe, Israel, and North America have embraced Fazal and her composition. She said she “feel[s] the deep honor of carrying something that touches their hearts so deeply.” To measure the exact psychological and physiological effectiveness of musical Holocaust memorial works would, however, require qualitative and quantitative research beyond the scope of this thesis.

Also beyond the scope of this thesis is an in-depth examination of Jewish-Christian relations since World War II. However, it is significant that these two powerful works were composed from Christian perspectives. Although the majority of those who were imprisoned and perished at Auschwitz were Jewish, there were many Christian Poles, Roman Catholics, communists, and disabled, as well as Roma and Sinti gypsies, homosexuals, and others. Penderecki dedicated the work to all who were murdered at Auschwitz, not specifically Jews, while Fazal dedicated her work to the victims of the Holocaust. Since Fazal used a Lutheran Chorale to point out the absence of Christian compassion towards the plight of the Jews in Germany during the war years, I also see her work as part of an ongoing process of reconciliation of Christians with Jews.

While these musical Holocaust memorial works may help individuals transform painful implicit memories into discharged explicit ones, they also transform individual memories into public ones, so that we may never forget what happened to more than six million innocent people during World War II.

---

116 Ruth Fazal, Interview by the author.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Primary Sources


———. *Oratorio Terezin*. Teresa Gomez, soprano; Huw Priday, tenor; Daniel Lichti, Baritone; Aria Umezawa, Emily Taub (Terezin 1), Teresa Mahon (Terezin 2), Jakie Young (the Butterfly), child soloists; New Streams Symphony Orchestra and Children’s Choir, Mixed choir; Kirk Trevor, conductor; Tributary Music 2003. SOCAN. TMCD04.

———. Interview by author, 20 July 2008, E-mail.


———. *Dies Irae* for Soli, Chorus, and Orchestra. Stephania Woytowicz, Soprano; Wieslaw Ochman, tenor; Bernard Ladysz, bass; Krakow Philharmonic Symphony Orchestra and Chorus, Henryk Czyz, conductor; Philips 839/701 LY.

Literature


Dear Potential Participants: July 9, 2008

As you may know, I am a graduate student at Bowling Green State University pursuing a Masters degree in musicology. I am presently working on my masters thesis, “Site and Sanctuary in Four Holocaust Memorial Compositions: Penderecki’s Dies Irae, Reich’s Different Trains, Beerman’s Tikvah, and Fazal’s Oratorio Terezin.” The study investigates the psychological role of Holocaust memorial compositions, and the dramatic elements which contribute to each composition’s success. The results of this study will highlight the musical works’ shared characteristics, the importance of this type of composition, and encourage more commissions, creation, and performances of musical works of this nature.

Through interviews, I will gather information from the composers, performers, and spectators concerning the above works. This letter is an invitation to participate in this study. Should you volunteer to participate my intention is that your experience be entirely positive. Your feedback will contribute to my thesis and to this growing field of study.

I hope to conduct one interview with each of you to ask a limited number of questions (in person, via phone, or email) about your compositional process if you are a composer, performing experience if you have performed the work, or listening experience if you are a spectator. With your consent, I’d like to tape the in-person and/or phone interviews for confirmation of content.

The interview process would take up to a maximum of two hours. If at any time and for any reason you feel uncomfortable, you may refuse to continue the interview. There are no consequences to withdrawing from the study. Information collected from spectators and performers will be referred to anonymously in the thesis unless you, the participant, choose otherwise. The interviews will remain confidential and be seen or heard only by my academic advisor, Robert Fallon, and/or myself. Information from composers will be attributed to them in the thesis. If quoted from the interviews I will confirm with you to make sure the statements are correct before submitting a draft. I
will retain the interview materials for the remainder of my academic career for my own academic use. I will safeguard and store the interview recordings, transcriptions of the interview recordings, and written interview responses to written interview questions, in one file in a lockable filing cabinet, in my personal study in my home. I will notify you if I decide to dispose of these interview materials.

At any time during or after the process you may feel free to ask me questions that concern this study and you may request a copy of the interview or the results. Should you agree to participate by signing your name to this consent form, we will both retain a copy of it for our records. If you should have further questions about this study please contact me by phone or email at (419) 874-9272 or khubley@bgsu.edu, or, my thesis advisor, Robert Fallon, at (419) 372-2933 or robertf@bgsu.edu. If you have any questions or concerns about rights as a research participant you may contact the Chair of Bowling Green State University’s Human Subjects Review Board at (419) 372-7716 or hsrb@bgsu.edu.

I, _______________________, on the date of __________, hereby state that I have read the above document, consent to participate in the proposed study, and agree to the conditions presented therein.

I DO____DO NOT___ (check one) consent to having my interview audio taped.

Thank you very much for considering participating in this study.

Sincerely,
Katherine Hubley