EDUCATIONAL OUTREACH IN THE ARTS: A
STUDY OF THE LINK UP MUSIC EDUCATION PROGRAM

A Thesis
Presented to
The Graduate Faculty of The University of Akron
In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Master of Arts Administration

Courtney M. Gazda
May 2017
EDUCATIONAL OUTREACH IN THE ARTS: A
STUDY OF THE LINK UP MUSIC EDUCATION PROGRAM

Courtney M. Gazda

Thesis

Approved:  Accepted:

Advisor  Interim School Director
Dr. Elisa Gargarella  Dr. J. Thomas Dukes

Committee Member  Interim Dean of the College
Dr. Ramona Ortega-Liston  Dr. John Green

Committee Member  Dean of the Graduate School
Mr. Johnathan Willis  Dr. Chand Midha

Date
ABSTRACT

Research has long supported the benefits of the arts, specifically to students in grades k-12. Although arts programs have been decreasing over the last decade, nonprofit organizations have created strong programs that enrich students in the arts and create opportunities for collaborations with the community. The Weill Institute of Music at Carnegie Hall developed the Link Up music education outreach program to provide a beneficial means of music education in collaboration with partner host organizations and schools and has proven to be highly effective.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

To my advisor, Dr. Elisa Gargarella, and my committee members Jonathon Willis and Dr. Ramona Ortega-Liston, thank you for your hard work, time, and energy helping me along the way through this thesis process. Thank you to my mentor, Professor Kara Stewart, for your inspiring passion for the arts and research. I also extend my gratitude to the Akron Symphony Orchestra for their willingness to provide supporting data and information for this research project. Finally, a special thank you to Chris, my friends, and family for your endless support and encouragement.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF TABLES</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES</td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Link-Up Program</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basis of Study</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statement of Purpose</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. LITERATURE REVIEW</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The State of Arts Education Programs</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Why Arts Matter</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational Outreach and Audience Engagement</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Role of Nonprofit Organizations</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. METHODOLOGY</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Design of Study</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Interview</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. DATA ANALYSIS</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metis Associates Study</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Akron Symphony Orchestra</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Google Forms Link-Up Survey</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Findings

V. CONCLUSION

Limitations and Implications

Final Thoughts

BIBLIOGRAPHY

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A. LINK UP EVALUATION

APPENDIX B. METIS ASSOCIATES LINK UP DATA

APPENDIX C. GOOGLE FORMS LINK UP SURVEY
## LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>Link Up Materials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>Google Forms Survey Data</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Location Map</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Mars Listening Map</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Uneven Arts Education Opportunities Nationwide</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Arts are part of a well-rounded education for K-12 students</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Early Childhood Arts Education Improves Vocabulary, Communication, And Memory in Young Children</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Task Descriptions</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Findings-Implementation Study</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Musical Notation and Listening Task Data</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Confidence in Teaching Link-Up Elements</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Rank of Importance in Teaching</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER I
INTRODUCTION

*Link Up Program*

Link Up is a music education outreach program developed by world renowned Carnegie Hall’s Weill Music Institute in New York City, New York. The program is unique in that it is a collaboration between Carnegie Hall’s Weill Music Institute, a host organization, and participatory schools which are recruited by the host (Carnegie Hall). The outreach program, for elementary students in grades three through five, includes a new curriculum each school year developed by the Weill Music Institute. The curriculum includes a student book and an accompanying teacher guide and are titled with themes such as *Orchestra Sings!* and *Orchestra Rocks!* (Carnegie Hall). New curriculums are developed based on feedback evaluations from the host organization, which are mandatory in order to remain a participant in the program. The evaluations completed by the host organization are based on the feedback from their respective participatory school teachers as well as their point of view of the positive and negative aspects of that particular curriculum. This process helps to ensure that the curriculum is constantly aiming to strengthen methods for the musical enrichment of students.

While it is an option for individual schools to apply to participate in Link Up without a host, the program most commonly occurs as a collaboration through a nonprofit host organization. The host is typically an orchestral nonprofit with a mission and core
values incorporating music education for young adolescents. The host being of orchestral background is due to the nature of the culminating Link Up performance which includes the students of the participating schools performing with a professional orchestra. During the culminating performance, students perform a fixed set of rehearsed songs with the professional orchestra which is important because the students are learning hands-on skills by participating in the making of music with professional orchestra musicians rather than merely watching. This is especially critical for students whose schools have reduced their music programs and budgets for field trips that may have previously included opportunities to gain familiarity with a live performance.

As of the 2016-2017 school year, there are 92 host organizations participating in Link Up with their respective partnering schools (Carnegie Hall). The current participating nations are Brazil, Canada, Japan, Kenya, Spain, and the United States of America which has the highest participation rate. Below is a geographical map that illustrates all of the host locations (see figure 1.1).
Carnegie Hall’s Weill Music Institute provides the Link Up materials to participating host organizations and participating schools at zero cost (Carnegie Hall). This is important because it means that neither the organization nor the schools need to decline the opportunity to participate in the music outreach program due to budget restrictions. Carnegie Hall provides the music books and teaching guides, but also offers additional benefits with free unlimited access to online resources, guidelines, and support. The host site will be responsible for the recruitment process of participatory schools, which are researched from the host organization in their corresponding school districts as well as the surrounding areas\textsuperscript{1}. The host organization determines which schools, and how many, they would like to have participate and directly recruit those schools. The host

\textsuperscript{1} For example, The Akron Symphony Orchestra in Akron, Ohio, recruits participatory schools in the Akron Public School System as well as the surrounding areas such as Mogadore, Tallmadge, and Cuyahoga Falls (Matherson).
also ensures that each school’s students acquires a recorder. Many students will already have a recorder, but in instances in which the schools do not have recorders or cannot afford them, the host organization will need to provide them. Should the nonprofit organization also not have the ability to supplement the recorders, the nonprofit can apply for foundation grants and donor sponsorships separate from Carnegie Hall in order to supply recorders. The following table (Table 1.0) of information was acquired from the Carnegie Hall Link Up website page to show the exact breakdown of what is included in the Link Up package from Carnegie Hall as well as what will be expected from the host organization.
Table 1.0 Link Up Materials (Carnegie Hall).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Carnegie Hall provides at no cost:</strong></th>
<th><strong>Your site provides/arranges:</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Link Up curriculum guide for each teacher with accompanying CD and DVD</td>
<td>Culminating interactive concert(s) featuring an orchestra, conductor, and participating Link Up students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Link Up workbook for each student</td>
<td>Recruitment of local teachers and students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional development resources and webinar for lead teachers and orchestra administrators</td>
<td>Professional development workshop(s) and direct support for participating local teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orchestral scores and parts for most pieces, concert script, and concert visuals</td>
<td>Soprano recorders for all participants, as needed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access to Carnegie Hall's online resources including additional lessons and classroom resources</td>
<td>Program-related needs, both artistic and administrative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carnegie Hall brand guidelines, fundraising templates, and public relations resources</td>
<td>Ongoing communication with Carnegie Hall regarding program implementation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ongoing support and consultation regarding professional development for teachers, program implementation, and media/publicity planning</td>
<td>Feedback evaluations with teachers of Link Up</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The host organization is also responsible for developing a group of lead teachers that will be the liaison to all other teachers in the participating bracket for additional support and resources. The lead teachers are chosen based on interest, participation in training, and ability to provide assistance to other teachers with the Link Up materials. The number of lead teachers is dependent upon the total number of participating schools, the size of each of the schools, and the interest and ability of teachers to perform extra duties as the lead teacher. As a lead teacher, the main duty is to communicate information from the host to their schools as requested and also to be available for questions.

The Link Up curriculum is designed for elementary students in grades three through five to learn the foundations of music such as notes, rhythms, composition, and improvisation along with lessons learning techniques for singing and playing an instrument in the classroom. The curriculum was developed in such a way that it can be incorporated into another classroom curriculum or can be used as the sole curriculum. Whether it is used as supplemental material or the sole curriculum is based on the needs of the schools. There are enrichment activities included throughout the curriculum such as listening maps\(^2\), composition, and body percussion. For example, the Orchestra Rocks Link Up curriculum book includes a listening map lesson using the “Mars” movement of Gustav Holst’s famous composition *The Planets*. Figure 1.2, featured below, is an example of a listening map in word form with the objective being focused on the layering of instruments in a piece of music. The brightly colored pages are visually simple and very clear to understand. In this listening map example, students are learning about the

\(^2\) Listening maps consist of pictures, graphs, shapes, words, and lines that are created as one listens to a piece of music simultaneously (Kerchner p. 92).
rhythm and melody layers using the categories of instruments, tempo, and dynamics.

Students use the Word Wall to fill in the boxes which incorporates practice with musical terms, reading, and writing.

![“Mars” Listening Map](image)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Layer 1: Repetitive Rhythm</th>
<th>Layer 2: Melody</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Instruments</strong></td>
<td><strong>Instruments</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tempo</strong></td>
<td><strong>Tempo</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dynamics</strong></td>
<td><strong>Dynamics</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Word Wall**

- fast
- slow
- crescendo
- diminuendo
- legato
- marcato
- staccato
- sforzando
- solo
- tutti

---

Figure 1.2 Mars Listening Map (Levy and Mannoia p. 37).
Many of the activities throughout the Link Up lessons incorporate the three main learning styles (visual, kinesthetic, and auditory). The visuals hold the consistent theme of primary colors and clear instructions, the kinesthetic activities often include body percussion such as clapping, and the auditory learning is incorporated through the compact discs that accompany the music books. The addition of a cross-curricular lessons is also frequent throughout the Link Up series, such as that of “Mars” from Holst’s The Planets which incorporates the psychology behind the planet. Although the planets themselves are not the focus of the piece, there is still the opportunity to incorporate the basic concepts of the planets. Another cross-curriculum aspect is that the vocal lessons frequently include Latin language which enhances the development of linguistics.

A unique element of the Link Up program is the responsibility of the host organization to have their professional musicians learn the original orchestral scores to perform with the students and conduct rehearsals as needed for their musicians. The culminating concert for the particular set of participators will bring together all students and teachers involved in that particular area in combination with their host organization for a concert. The professional orchestra performs on stage, and the students perform with the orchestra from their seats. This not only exposes the students to a professional orchestra, but also provides an enriching opportunity to share the music they have learned with these professional musicians rather than merely watching.

In addition to the above duties, the host will also be responsible for conducting one or more Professional Development Workshops to instruct and inform the participating schools’ teachers. This will ensure that all participators are effectively teaching using the Link Up guides and learning the culminating performance. The Professional
Development Workshops will ideally occur at the beginning of the school year with at least one follow-up meeting mid-year to rehearse concert details with the teachers. Much like the hands-on experience of the students at the culmination concert, the teachers are actively engaged during the workshop by participating in the activities in the book. A lead teacher and the host organization may provide additional information from Carnegie Hall, such as a PowerPoint presentation, and will ask teachers to complete evaluations about the workshop along with what is and is not working in the classroom (see feedback evaluation form in Appendix A). As a participant, especially in regards to the host organization, it is critical to provide the feedback requested by Carnegie Hall in as much detail as possible. In addition to the development workshop feedback forms, which are geared towards the teacher experiences in their classrooms, the host must complete a detailed feedback evaluation form for Carnegie Hall following the interactive culminating performance. It is essential that the organization communicate how successful the program was and why, or the same information if it was not successful. This assists Carnegie Hall to adjust the Link Up curriculum, teaching guides, and resources, which in turn will then strengthen the relationship between the participating schools and the host orchestra.

Basis of Study

I learned of the Link Up music education program during my internship with the Akron Symphony Orchestra in Akron, Ohio. I have had the opportunity to experience the program with the Akron Symphony Orchestra being the host organization for the Akron area participating schools. Throughout the course of the 2016-2017 school year, I
observed two Professional Development Workshops, studied the curriculum guides, and researched the progression of the program from the beginning of the school year to the culminating concert on March 21, 2017. I felt strongly about the program for various reasons; 1) The materials are provided free of charge by Carnegie Hall, 2) the curriculum is adapted based on feedback which is helpful to adapt to the needs of music teachers, and 3) the program adds an element of community building between the participation in the workshops, the support groups, online resources, and culminating concert. While my first-hand personal and professional experience with Link Up is with the Akron Symphony Orchestra in Akron, Ohio, I had the desire to include multiple locations in my survey participant pool in order to gather an unbiased and greater look at the program.

Statement of Purpose

The purpose of this research is to determine the effectiveness of the Link Up music education program as a beneficial means of educational outreach and audience engagement. The hypothesis is that student participants of the Link Up program are better able to express their creativity and strengthen their development in music education through the curriculum and live performances with the host organization; and that teacher participants are better able to teach music through the supplemental curriculum and professional development workshops; and that parents of student participants will become more engaged in the arts community through their students' involvement in Link Up. The Link Up program, developed by Carnegie Hall, provides a strong foundation educational outreach and presents a case for sustaining interest in music education for both nonprofit organizations and in elementary schools.
As arts programs in the public school sector decline, arts nonprofits are beginning to emerge as dominant roles in the fostering of programs and participation in the arts.

With this trend of nonprofits implementing programs for arts education outreach, there is hope that arts programs can and will be sustained, remain important, and continue enrich the lives of children in public schools. While it may seem simple for an arts nonprofit organization to develop an arts outreach program, whether supplemental or extracurricular, it is in fact increasingly more challenging to implement programs that focus on what is needed in accordance with State Standards and the rules and laws of public schools while still trying to create an environment that encourages students to enjoy the arts and explore their creativity. The hope is to research and discover the most effective methods that nonprofits can implement in conjunction with public schools to achieve a sustainable arts education.

In addition to researching effective forms of nonprofit outreach, another area of focus is the ongoing matter of how to engage audiences. In the case of the relationship between nonprofit organizations and public schools, potential audience includes students, teachers, community members, the audience of the nonprofit, and the family members of each of the aforementioned categories. Unfortunately, for both nonprofit organizations and schools, there is a false notion that once the educational outreach program is in existence, the program itself is merely enough. The issue with this idea is the absence of focused engagement which can very likely lead these groups of potential audiences to disregard the positive impact of the value that the arts can offer once the programs are participated in. Focused research on both nonprofit outreach and engagement are necessary to sustain the arts.
CHAPTER II
LITERATURE REVIEW

The State of Arts Education Programs

In her thesis titled *The Art of Giving: An Analysis of Arts Organizations, Their Outreach Programs, and How They Are Funded*, Irene Tai addresses the issue that arts programs in public schools are rapidly declining (6). There is a prominent problem faced by arts educators in the public school sector. The situations may vary from district to district, but commonly schools claim two reasons: 1) The arts are not considered a part of common core and 2) longer have the ability to include the arts in the fiscal budget. Schools continue to eliminate budgets and resources for arts programs despite there being heavy research on the benefits of the arts for developing children.

A 2010 analysis conducted by Robert Sabol indicated evidence that the No Child Left Behind Act may have played a role in this decline in arts education due to the emphasis on common core subjects3. As a result of surveying over 3,000 visual art teachers, Sabol concluded that although the work load of teachers was generally not negatively impacted, the overall depth of arts education was negatively impacted. From this study, 84% of arts educator respondents stated there were zero benefits from No Child Left Behind and 73% felt that it actually harmed arts education. A similar study

---

3 As cited from the Common Core Standards Initiative, common core subjects are defined as “what K–12 students should know in English language arts and mathematics at the end of each grade.”
conducted by Diane Ravitch titled *The Death and Life of the Great American School System* further researched the impact of No Child Left Behind on the cultural sector, including music, art, dance, and theater. Her research maintained focus on how the No Child Left Behind Act shifted the educational focus from a well-rounded curriculum that included the arts into a push for testing and aptitude scores (18). As stated by Ravitch on page 18 of her study, “What once was an effort to improve the quality of education turned into an accounting strategy: measure, then punish or reward.” This implied that teachers were no longer being judged based on the merit of their ability to educate. Instead, the education system shifted into new extremist criteria that forced quality educators to focus more on test scores than on value. This began to place teachers under a scope in which the sole objective must be to achieve and maintain high scores in reading and math. While the idea for increasing reading and math scores is actually a positive goal, it unfortunately drew importance from other subject areas.

Americans for the Arts, a nonprofit organization dedicated to arts research and advocacy, developed a study in 2012 regarding the availability of arts programs in elementary and secondary schools in the United States. As displayed on the graph, dance and drama have the lowest accessibility with only 3% and 4% availability respectively. Music and visual art seemingly have the highest rate of availability; however, the text box underneath the graph states an interesting point that although music and visual arts have the highest availability there are still approximately 1.3 million students without access to music and visual art.

---

*The Death and Life of the Great American School System* by Diane Ravitch is a detailed report that provides data regarding the overall decline of arts education in the public school sector.
The decrease of arts education availability is at an even greater rate for at-risk areas which includes urban, impoverished, and diverse communities (Americans for the Arts). These areas already had fewer resources and smaller fiscal budgets to begin with and had an even greater rate of having fewer arts education programs. With so many school districts decreasing their arts education and cultural programs, a change must be made in order to protect these programs in the future. If public schools are struggling to keep the arts a priority, nonprofit organizations have an opportunity to relieve the budgets of these schools by implementing arts outreach programs.

Rather than merely accepting this new age in which there is a significant lack of support for arts education, it can instead be viewed as an opportunity for different forms of arts education. If change is not occurring through the education system, nonprofit
organizations have opportunities to implement outreach programs in schools to strengthen their arts environment. Nonprofit arts organizations carry out their philanthropic missions by serving a purpose to humanity and can immerse the arts into the schools.

*Why Arts Matter*

While the availability of arts education is decreasing (see Figure 2.1 above), another study conducted by Americans for the Arts shows that the majority of Americans still agree that the arts should be a part of a well-rounded education (see Figure 2.2).

![Pie chart showing arts education opinions](chart.png)

Figure 2.2. Arts are part of a well-rounded education for K-12 students (Americans for the Arts).

The study was not broken down by the individual reasons for why the arts should be considered a part of education, but the positive effects of arts education has been
researched in separate studies. Figure 2.3, for example, shows the benefits of music to the development of vocabulary, communication, and memory in young children.

Figure 2.3. Early Childhood Arts Education Improves Vocabulary, Communication, and Memory in Young Children.

While this study researched the effects of music on young children prior to beginning school, it is certainly an indication of the development of children. Incorporating the arts is a natural occurrence for young children with the incorporation of basic concepts such as rhythm in learning the alphabet, reciting nursery rhymes, and finger painting. These
activities contribute to development and carry on from very young age to the time children begin school.

The Perpich Center for Arts and Outreach School\textsuperscript{5} developed a report examining the proven benefits in overall development through the areas of academics, cognitive maturation, and social development. The report quotes M. Seaman stating, “Research finds that students who experience arts integrated curricula meet or significantly exceed state and district standardized test averages, even in schools with high populations of at-risk students. In addition, a notable study finds that arts integration programs do not lower test scores, suggesting there is no negative impact on academic achievement in core subjects from an arts-integrated curriculum.” Therefore, the conclusions are drawn that there is only a positive impact that results from arts education.

Another case attesting the benefits of arts education is the increased successful implementation of STEAM (Science, Technology, Engineering, Arts, and Mathematics) in specialized schools across the country as well as worldwide. The STEAM Journal quotes 2008 National Teacher Winner Michael Geisen as stating:

Most people tend to simply equate creativity with a particular art form. If you can draw, you're creative. Or if you're musical, then you're creative. But it’s much more broad than that…the best scientists are highly creative. The best mathematicians are extremely creative. (Henricksen 2)

\textsuperscript{5} The Perpich Center for Arts Education is a research-based professional development school located in Minnesota with the mission to “provide all Minnesota students the opportunity to develop and integrate their artistic and academic abilities to their highest potential. We do this by teaching in and through the arts.” (Perpich Center for Arts Education)
Geisen explained that there are many areas that are related to the arts even if they do not directly seem to be. He added that scientists and engineers, for example, need to draw diagrams in order to illustrate their ideas (Henricksen 3). Math utilizes the arts with even the simplest of forms; illustrated word problems. Math is also a large aspect of music in respect to counting rhythms. The amount of research on STEAM effectiveness is limited due to it being a more recent endeavor, but the research that does exist undeniably proves how important the arts are. These specialized programs and schools are emerging and so long as the research continues to prove the importance of the arts, it will hopefully continue to grow.

With the research of STEAM as a strong example, the arts are a tool that can be applied across many subject areas in some capacity. Common core subjects hold high value, but when the arts become neglected, education becomes unbalanced for students. The common core subjects and arts can return to an integrated balance rather than a choice of one or the other. In order to create change, arts nonprofit organizations have the ability to develop plans for outreach and engagement rather than accepting that arts education is dwindling.

**Educational Outreach and Audience Engagement**

Both outreach and engagement are important pieces of the arts community. While outreach and engagement are similar, the two terms should not be used interchangeably as they so often are. Despite common beliefs that they are the same, the act of providing outreach programs and the act of engaging the community are indeed different. Doug Borwick offers an excellent distinction between the two in the article titled *Engaging*
Matters, stating that “outreach is for the community, while engagement is with the community.” Both outreach and engagement are of equal importance and should be viewed as two halves of a whole; without both pieces, the whole piece cannot be complete or successful. First, outreach and engagement will be observed separately, followed by how the two fit together for an effective impact on the arts.

The Oxford Dictionary defines the term outreach as “the extent or length of reaching out.” In regards to the arts, outreach is a common activity of nonprofit organizations. Outreach can be community based, meaning that the nonprofit creates programs that are for the community and can also be education based, meaning that the programs are in an educational setting. Due to the nature of the research being presented, the term outreach will be used in the context of education and engagement will be used to refer to the audience members of the community.

Educational outreach involves organizations developing programs that either provide a service the school does not have the ability to provide or to supplement current education. For example, Link Up is an outreach program that provides an opportunity to supplement music education in elementary schools. Additional forms of outreach organizations can implement include teacher residencies and third party involvement such as a nonprofit. An organization may choose to develop a supplemental Residency program that would include a Teaching Artist, whether it be an employee of the organization or an independent contractor hired by the organization, to teach a special

---

6 A Residency or Teaching Artist Program consists of a guest teacher spending a fixed time under a contract in a classroom. The artist can be working as an independent contractor or more commonly an employee of a nonprofit organization. Many nonprofit organizations create residencies based on priced levels with higher pricing providing a longer and more in depth program.
class in the school before, during, or after classes. Students will receive concentrated information and typically participate in a different type of classroom experience than the normal day. Utilizing the nonprofit organization as a form of outreach could include replacing a current program while remaining in line with the state standards or incorporating a program into the school’s current lessons. As Doug Borwick was previously quoted, outreach is for the community which is education in this particular context. These examples of outreach programs have the sole objective of benefiting the students of the schools that choose to participate. The outreach can be extra-curricular, supplemental, or both, but all of these are aimed to benefit students and create services for learning.

Before reviewing community engagement, audience development must first be examined as it is the umbrella for engagement. A well-defined description of audience development was provided by Audience Development Specialist Shoshana Fanizza and reads:

Audience Development is the building of relationships with your existing and potential audiences through the use of specific audience relations programs in order for them to become more involved with your organization and/or art form. Audience Development uses the 4 C’s: Community, Connections, Collaborations, and Caring.

Developing an audience within an organization is a process that involves the idea of the “4 C’s” as mentioned above. Attendance at performances, ticket sales, and donations are examples of methods to measure effectiveness of audience development, but before the process of development can even occur the relationships must first be built with the community. This is done through the process of engagement. Engagement, as Doug Borwick noted, means with the community. Community engagement is an exceptionally
important precursor to audience development and both are a constantly evolving area of study in the arts due in large part to the advancements of technology. In order to develop a sustaining audience, engagement must occur. To engage, relationships must be built. This is the point in which outreach and engagement collaborate; with a strong outreach program, organizations have an opportunity to build relationships with community members, also referred to as constituents, whether it is showcasing the success of the outreach program or inviting the community to attend an event for the program. The point in which constituents experience the effects of outreach programs is the point in which there is an opportunity to engage.

Outreach and engagement, as reviewed, should be viewed as separate parts of a whole. Outreach can be viewed as for and engagement can be viewed as with (Borwick). Both are vital portions of audience development and if successful will contribute to the sustainability of an organization’s constituency.

The Role of Nonprofit Organizations

The research of outreach and engagement are both valuable, but it is also important to consider the benefits to the nonprofit organizations becoming involved in such activities. Strong outreach and engagement can lead to elements to such as financial stability, increased audience, and connections with community members which all contribute to the sustainability of an organization.

John Clammer, author of Art and the Arts of Sustainability addresses two main aspects of sustainability of a nonprofit organization; the first being sustainability of the organization itself, and the second being a broader scale in which sustainability is viewed
as the whole of humanity which involves experiencing something arts or cultural every single day (65). The first aspect is the more obvious and also one that most nonprofit organizations, arts in particular, struggle with. Sustainability in an arts organization is challenging for many reasons including the current state of struggling salaries in homes, lack of funding for arts in public school systems, and people choosing to either invest money in corporate stocks or other non-cultural activities. Regardless of the reason, the facts remain that many arts and cultural nonprofit organizations greatly struggle to survive in a corporate-driven environment with constricted household budgets. Yet, without these organizations, arts and culture will inevitably cease to exist and therefore strategic plans must be developed to create a basis for sustainability.
CHAPTER III
METHODOLOGY

Design of Study

Data to support the Link Up program was acquired in three forms, with two forms representing secondary data and one form representing supporting primary data. Secondary data was acquired through Carnegie Hall, the originator of Link Up, and through the Akron Symphony Orchestra. The Akron Symphony Orchestra is a host organization of Link Up in the researcher’s local region of Akron, Ohio. Carnegie Hall contracted a professional assessment organization called Metis Associates to conduct a multi-year study on the Link Up program in the school years of 2012-2013 and 2013-2014 (Carnegie Hall). The following excerpt displaying specific questions was extracted directly from page 1 of the Metis Associates report:

In fall 2012, Carnegie Hall contracted Metis Associates to conduct a multi-year evaluation of Link Up, their long-standing program and elementary school music literacy curriculum that introduces students to music fundamentals, orchestral knowledge, basic recorder playing, and ensemble-related skills. The first year of the evaluation (2012–2013) focused on: developing appropriate instruments to measure outcomes of the program for participating students; piloting those tools in a set of NYC public schools; collecting preliminary data on student achievement; looking at teacher implementation of Link Up at five pilot schools; and developing a framework for a multi-year evaluation. During this second year of the evaluation, 2013–2014, Metis’s work built upon activities begun in Year 1 and expanded to nine national sites. Evaluation activities focused on examining implementation more broadly and collecting additional preliminary outcome data.
Specifically, in 2013-2014, the study’s overarching goals were to: 1) gather in-depth data on current implementation at national case-study sites; 2) finalize a comprehensive music skills assessment; 3) collect preliminary longitudinal data on students’ achievement; and 4) develop a design for disseminating the music skills assessment to all national orchestras. Data were collected on both a national and international basis (surveys of participating teachers and orchestra administrators), as well as and on a case study basis at nine schools selected from across the country (including data from classroom observations, teacher and orchestra administrator interviews, and assessments of students’ music skills).

The evaluation was comprised of two major components—a program implementation study and an outcome study.

The evaluation activities noted in Metis Associates’ reports were developed as a set of seven main tasks. These tasks, according to Carnegie Hall, are shown in figure 3.1 below.
### Task Descriptions

The table below provides a description of the assessment subtasks that together comprise the Link Up Music Skills Assessment.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tasks</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Task 1:</strong> Performance&lt;br&gt;Students perform excerpts of the curriculum repertoire. Student performance is evaluated on nine music skills indicators using an accompanying scoring rubric.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Task 2:</strong> Student Self- and Peer-Assessments&lt;br&gt;Students self-assess their performances and assess their peers’ performances.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Task 3:</strong> Music Notation&lt;br&gt;Students independently identify basic music symbols and notes.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Task 4:</strong> Instrument Identification (Visual)&lt;br&gt;Using a set of photos, students identify instruments, place them in instrument families, and describe in their own words what makes the instruments unique.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**Figure 3.1.** Task Descriptions (Carnegie Hall).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tasks</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Task 5:</strong></td>
<td><strong>Instrument Identification (Audio)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Using audio samples, students identify the instrument heard and the instrument families to which they belong.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Task 6:</strong></td>
<td><strong>Listening (Music Elements)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Using audio samples, students differentiate between contrasting rhythms, tempos, and pitches.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Task 7:</strong></td>
<td><strong>Composition</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Students choose one of four provided characters or create their own, then compose up to four measures of music to represent their character.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The implementation phase conducted by Metis Associates consisted of the observation of “23 Link Up lessons across nine schools. (1)” The outcome phase consisted of the study of Musical Notation where N=557, Listening Tasks where N=574, Instrument Identification-Visual where N=313, and Instrument Identification-Audio where N=299. The full report can be found in Appendix B.

As a part of the Akron Symphony Orchestra study, there are approximately 90 teachers and 2,379 students participating in the program in the Akron region including the cities of Akron, Cuyahoga Falls, Munroe Falls, Northfield, Norton, Peninsula, Stow, and Tallmadge. Approximately 92% of the participating schools in the Akron region are Title I, meaning that they are a low-income demographic (U.S. Department of Education). The Akron Symphony Orchestra, as the host organization, is responsible for presenting multiple Professional Development Workshops that each conclude with a feedback evaluation form from the attending teacher participants. The evaluations include three sections of scaled questions, meaning a ranking of strongly disagree to strongly agree, and a series of open-ended questions for teachers to describe what is working, what is not working, and what they would like to experience more of at the next Professional Development Workshop. The beginning of the evaluation focuses on the preparedness for the Link Up concert including how the teachers feel about the music being performed and the series of events being rehearsed. The second section addresses how confident teachers feel with the Link Up curriculum in regards to preparing students to play the recorder, teaching students the instruments in the orchestra, and teaching the

---

According to the U.S. Department of Education, students in schools that qualify for Title I are eligible to receive assistance for expenses such as school supplies and free or reduced lunches.
creative extension activities in the Link Up books. The third section involves the teachers’ ranking of importance for seeing a live orchestra, playing recorder, reading music, and applying musical skills in creative projects. The open-ended questions ask teachers what the most successful Link Up activities were, what the symphony can do to improve the program for next year, and what they would change about the teacher and student guides.

*Personal Interview*

A personal interview with Orzella Matherson supplemented the study. Matherson is the Director of Education at the Akron Symphony Orchestra and is the point of contact for the teachers participating in Link Up. Matherson detailed the process of the feedback evaluations and how they help both the Akron Symphony Orchestra and Carnegie Hall to strengthen the experience of Link Up. The feedback evaluations are distributed to each teacher who attends the Professional Development Workshops and are collected prior to their departure from the workshop. The feedback evaluations are then inputted into an Excel spreadsheet for analysis. The data is broken down first by the number of those who answered each response option and then broken down into a percentage. This provides a clear visual for the data set. The open-ended questions are then typed individually and taken into consideration for the next workshop or school year.
CHAPTER IV
DATA ANALYSIS

*Metis Associates Study*

The overall findings of the Metis Associates study of the Link Up program are that the program is both highly successful and efficient. The first phase tested was called the Implementation Study, which can be viewed in a portion from the Metis Associates study in Figure 4.1 below. The Implementation Study focused on the stakeholders, teacher participants, orchestra partners, and instruction. The feedback was positive and the new Music Skills Assessment was viewed as being highly valuable to Link Up and music instruction.

![Figure 4.1. Findings-Implementation Study (Metis Associates).](image-url)
The report also noted that both teachers and partner orchestras held their collaborations in high regard. The teachers had appreciation for the Professional Development opportunities with the partner orchestras and felt it added a level of community building.

The second phase of testing was the Outcome Study which measured the progress of students’ learning before and after experiencing Link Up. The first set of data was a size of N=557 and was focused on Musical Notation. Figure 4.1 shows a 12% increase in music note learning and a 13% increase in music symbols (Metis 2). The Listening Task portion sample is N=574 and again shows increases across all tested areas. Pitch increased by 5%, Tempo increased by 4%, and Rhythm had an increase of 3%.

According to Metis Associates, the asterisks are especially noteworthy as they represent a “statistically significant improvement” rate (2).
Also among the Outcome Study by Metis Associates was evidence that the Link Up program “promotes a high level of student engagement (3).” Supporting this was personal comments from teachers stating “The curriculum helps with classroom engagement. Some of the kids that don’t like to sing will get into Link Up more (3).” The comments from the partner orchestras had supporting comments as well that were geared towards their visibility in the community. An orchestra administrator commented, “Link Up has increased our visibility and opened the door to donations and sponsorship opportunities that didn’t exist before. (3)”

This enhances connections with the community and also establishes opportunities to reach out to new donors or sponsors.

_Akron Symphony Orchestra_

The first data set to observe was secondary data in collaboration with the Akron Symphony Orchestra. The Akron Symphony Orchestra is a host organization of Link Up in Akron, Ohio, and the sample includes 41 teacher participants. The confidence in teaching the Link Up elements is important as it relates to how well the curriculum is designed. In the data below, teachers were asked to rate their level of confidence on a scale from 1-4 with 1 being strongly disagree in confidence and 4 being strongly agree in confidence. The data set was then re-grouped by the researcher for a sharper depiction of the numbers. Upon analyzing the data 4.1 below, the highest rate of confidence lays with teaching the instruments within the orchestra at 85% agreeance and the lowest rate of confidence is in teaching the creative extension activities throughout the curriculum at 35% agreeance. While 35% is the lowest number, only 8% of teachers answered with
disagree. Teachers feel confident, based on the data set, in teaching their students how to play the recorder and teach the instruments of the orchestra and feel neutral about their confidence to teach the creative extension activities that are incorporated throughout the Link Up curriculum.

Figure 4.3. Confidence in Teaching Link Up Elements (Akron Symphony Orchestra).
The second data set was also comprised of secondary data and in collaboration with the Akron Symphony Orchestra. The same sample of 41 teacher participants were asked to rank the importance of seeing a live orchestra, playing the recorder, reading music, and applying musical skills in creative projects. Figure 4.2, featured below, was analyzed in the same format, meaning the scale shifting from 1-4 to the regrouping of agree, neutral, and disagree with the statements. Seeing a live orchestra has an overwhelming positive rank with 90% of teachers answering that they feel it is the most important element of the Link Up program. The other three elements, after balancing the three categories, are generally ranked as being of the same importance. Applying musical skills in creative projects had a 5% rate of disagreeing, which aligns with the previous data displaying the creative activities as being the least confident element of teaching Link Up. This data set is important because if Link Up is not aligning with the needs of the teacher participants it will not be successful. Learning what the strongest and weakest qualities are from the teacher participant perspective assists the Akron Symphony Orchestra to know what to accomplish during the Professional Development Workshops and also helps Carnegie Hall to determine how to adapt the curriculums to include the feedback of teachers.
Figure 4.4. Rank of Importance in Teaching (Akron Symphony Orchestra).

**Google Forms Link Up Survey**

Utilizing the Akron Symphony Orchestra secondary data, the researcher developed a survey to further add dimension to the results. A survey was created using a system called Google Forms, which is a component of Google Drive on Gmail. The survey was
designed to be 100% anonymous, meaning that no respondents would be identified in any way in order to eliminate a bias which would lead to a higher rate of error. Seven participants currently teaching the Link Up program voluntarily responded to the Google Forms survey which was distributed in the Carnegie Hall Link Up Facebook Group. In order to keep the data sets consistent, the data set was again re-grouped from a 1-5 Likert Scale to a 1-3 scale with 1 being disagree and 3 being agree. The table below (Table 4.0) displays a high rate of agreeance that the Link Up curriculum is successful to help students learn music and provide an enriching environment and is also successful in helping to relieve budgets for teachers. The connecting factor in all data sets, including this set, is the creative extensions. Again, the creative extensions did not receive negative feedback, but continue to be a neutral element in the Link Up curriculum. There is also a small discrepancy in this data set, as seen in the Disagree column. In previous data sets, there were zero or miniscule numbers of questions containing a Disagree answer, while in this data set there are multiple questions. Overall, the data in the Google Forms Link Up Survey aligns with previous data. Through all three data sets, performing with a live orchestra is of high importance. The full Google Forms Link Up Survey can be found in Appendix C.
Table 4.0. Google Forms Survey Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>QUESTION</th>
<th>AGREE</th>
<th>NEUTRAL</th>
<th>DISAGREE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Link Up curriculum helps my students learn</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The cross-curricular elements enrich students’ learning</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My students enjoy performing the Link Up music</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My students are able to express their creativity in the Link Up activities</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The online resources provided by Carnegie Hall help to teach Link Up</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The social media support group helps me feel connected to the community</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Link Up is successful in the classroom</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The free materials help to relieve the budget at my school</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The free materials help with lesson planning</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The parents/guardians of the students attend the Link Up concerts</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The parents/guardians of the students provide positive feedback about</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Link Up</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Findings

The data presented in all data sets is consistent with the researcher’s hypotheses that the Link Up outreach program is an effective tool for music education. Specifically, the program supports the learning of music fundamentals, benefits students with the opportunity to perform with a professional orchestra, and creates a base for community building from the collaborations between the school and the partner orchestra. The Metis Associates case study provided clear evidence of these findings and the findings were further supported by the secondary data from the Akron Symphony Orchestra and Google Forms Link Up Survey.

The unexpected data exists in two areas; 1.) There is low confidence and feeling of importance with the Creative Extension Activities and 2.) Although valued, the community relationship building is relatively low outside of the immediate participants of
the Link Up program. Based on the research presented, the reasoning for a low confidence and importance rate in regards to the Creative Extension Activities is unclear. The researcher’s direct observations of the program with the Akron Symphony Orchestra suggest the low rates are more commonly associated with a decrease in allotted time for each music class rather than the Link Up curriculum books not presenting information clearly. In other words, if the classes were longer, the teachers would have the ability to spend more time to engage themselves and their students in these activities. There is indeed a correlation between the confidence and ranking of importance with the Creative Extension Activities. The community building also appeared at low or inconsistent rates based on the data sets. The Metis Associates study showed a positive rating of parent involvement and a feeling of community if it were in regards to the Link Up program directly. The secondary data Akron Symphony Orchestra and Google Forms Survey, however, was inconsistent with data regarding to parent involvement and engagement. The Metis Associates data indicates that the Link Up program encourages community building and engagement, but the secondary data from the Akron Symphony Orchestra and Google Forms Survey did not translate the same results. The data sets, however, did present clear evidence that the online resources such as the Carnegie Hall Facebook Group, Professional Development Workshops, and live performances with a professional orchestra all contribute to engagement and community building.
CHAPTER V
CONCLUSION

Limitations and Implications

The limitations of the research involve not having feedback from the students or parents/guardians participating in the Link Up program. This feedback would provide dimension to the previously analyzed data acquired from the Akron Symphony Orchestra as well as the supporting data analyzed from the researcher’s survey. The limitations also include the sample size in comparison to the total base of Link Up participants. The sample size for the region of Akron, Ohio is approximately 41 of 90 participants and the researcher’s sample for the supporting survey is seven participants. Reasons for the sample size limitation includes absent teachers at the Professional Development Workshops which is where the teacher evaluation is distributed as well as the shortage of time to take the feedback evaluation and surveys. Another limitation is repetition of data results, as the study was completed during the 2016-2017 school year. Future research will be compared over a period of time in order to observe the data over a period of time for accuracy.

The data in the charts and tables above display a resilient foundation for music education. The program is highly successful in teaching students to play the recorder, read music, and experience a live performance with professional orchestra musicians. The data suggests that the creative extension portion of the curriculum is consistently the
area that teachers feel the least confident and also rank of the lowest importance. However, the percentage was still neutral rather than poor for these numbers which indicates that it is still of some importance to most participants. The question of Link Up being a beneficial means of music education has been answered with positive results that show success. The research and data do imply, however, that the Link Up program is not yet a strong focus of engagement. The program has the potential to further audience engagement, however, with the increased participation from parents/guardians and the relationship to the host organization. Individual comments from survey participants indicated that most parents/guardians always attend the Link Up concert, but only a few attend the performances of the host organization. With further research, the percentage of parents/guardians that attend the Link Up concerts may increase with audience development strategies incorporated into the Link Up curriculum.

Final Thoughts

There is clear evidence that the Link Up program is a beneficial means of educational outreach in music education. My personal connection to the Akron Symphony Orchestra has provided me with the opportunity to interact with teachers in Akron, Ohio who are teaching the program and attending the Professional Development Workshops. In addition, my observance of the Carnegie Hall Link Up Facebook Group has proven it is a strong source of community building. While the nature of my study regarding engagement was focused on the students and their parents/guardians, I learned that the teachers work hard to connect with one another across cities, states, and countries. Therefore, while it is true that there is not a strong enough data set to support
parent/guardian engagement, it can be implied that the community building between teachers is successful engagement. The Facebook group enhances diversity and is a resilient base of support. In the future, I would like to continue the study to include survey data from other locations and acquire primary feedback from students and their parents/guardians. I would also like to compare and contrast the data I have analyzed to the data from Carnegie Hall in order to strengthen interpretation of data results. In addition, I would gather data from a longer period of time in order to compare to previous years and decrease discrepancies. The Link Up program is effective to teach music education grades three through five and helps participants to succeed by providing materials free of charge and constantly working to adapt the program to the feedback of teachers and the host organization to make the program as successful as possible.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


Americans for the Arts. "The Experts' Guide to Marketing the Arts"


APPENDICES
APPENDIX A
LINK UP EVALUATION

THE ORCHESTRA ROCKS
PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT EVALUATION

Please rate the following activities from today’s workshop on their HELPFULNESS in preparing you to teach the Link Up curriculum (circle one for each prompt):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Not helpful at all</th>
<th>Extremely Helpful</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Singing/Learning Link Up songs</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overview of the curriculum</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concert Repertoire Explorations</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative Extension Preview</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

How CONFIDENT do you feel in teaching the following elements? (circle one for each prompt):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Not confident at all</th>
<th>Extremely confident</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preparing students to play recorder</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The instruments of the orchestra</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative Extensions</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please rank the following elements of the Link Up program according to HOW IMPORTANT they are to you and your philosophy of music. (circle one for each prompt):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nice, but not important</th>
<th>Extremely important</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Seeing a live orchestra</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Playing recorder</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading music</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applying musical skills in creative projects</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Please answer the following questions with a few short sentences:
Which activities from Link Up do you anticipate will be most successful in your classroom?

What would you like to see more of next year?
APPENDIX B

METIS ASSOCIATES LINK UP DATA

In fall 2012, Carnegie Hall contracted Metis Associates to conduct a multi-year evaluation of Link Up, their long-standing program and elementary school music literacy curriculum that introduces students to music fundamentals, orchestral knowledge, basic recorder playing, and ensemble-related skills. The first year of the evaluation (2012–2013) focused on: developing appropriate instruments to measure outcomes of the program for participating students; piloting those tools in a set of NYC public schools; collecting preliminary data on student achievement; looking at teacher implementation of Link Up at five pilot schools, and developing a framework for a multi-year evaluation. During this second year of the evaluation, 2013–2014, Metis's work built upon activities begun in Year 1 and expanded to nine national sites. Evaluation activities focused on examining implementation more broadly and collecting additional preliminary outcome data.

Specifically, in 2013-2014, the study’s overarching goals were to: 1) gather in-depth data on current implementation at national case study sites; 2) finalize a comprehensive music skills assessment; 3) collect preliminary longitudinal data on students’ achievement; and 4) develop a design for disseminating the music skills assessment to all national orchestras. Data were collected on both a national and international basis (surveys of participating teachers and orchestra administrators), as well as on a case study basis at nine schools selected from across the country (including data from classroom observations, teacher and orchestra administrator interviews, and assessments of students’ music skills).

The evaluation was comprised of two major components—a program implementation study and an outcome study.

FINDINGS – IMPLEMENTATION STUDY

The implementation study gathered data from instructional strategies used, general foci of lessons, and the intensity of fellow and student interactions. The outcome study used data from the locally developed Music Skills Assessment tasks. This summary provides the key takeaways from this two-tiered study.

Stakeholders believe overall program quality to be very high.

- The vast majority of surveyed teachers and orchestra administrators report that the curriculum is very effective in the classroom and easy to implement.
- Stakeholders are highly complimentary of Link Up staff in addressing their needs, concerns, and in providing general support around implementation.
- In order to maximize the effectiveness of the program, teachers request basic recorder parts that are more accessible to beginning students.

The newly developed Music Skills Assessment is highly valued.

- The assessment is comprised of eight discrete music skill tasks, produced during two years of research and piloting.
- Case study teachers and orchestra administrators expressed excitement with the quality and usefulness of the draft Music Skills Assessment.
- Stakeholders report that the data will be extremely useful in informing their instruction; they further note the critical nature of being able to demonstrate the growth of students in a climate of increased accountability.
Program observations indicate that teachers focus on repertoire rehearsal and essential music skills, while allowing opportunities for class discussions and higher order questioning.

- Results emanating from observations of nine case study schools around the country are closely aligned with data gathered in NYC sites last year. Teachers spend the majority of their time focusing on repertoire rehearsal and building students' instrumental and singing skills.
- However, they also spend some time on music theory and make strong common core connections.
- Little or no instructional time is spent on composition or improvisation.

**Instructional Strategies Observed**

- Class discussion
- Writing assignment
- Open-ended/highest questioning
- Lecture/notes taking
- Research
- Peer response/strategies
- Literature connections
- Math connections
- History connections
- Use of visual/auditory clips
- Project/SK/SM/MT board

Total of 23 lessons observed across nine schools

**Providing differentiated professional development opportunities would improve instruction and benefit student learning**

- Orchestra administrators and teachers requested support in the development of a second tier to the introductory training provided annually by the partnering orchestras.
- Experienced teachers need advanced trainings that dive deeper into instructional content, methods, and best practices in order to positively impact their instructional practice.
- Case study data revealed that orchestras and schools benefit from meaningful collaboration regarding their implementation of Link Up and decisions about modifications to the curriculum and concert repertoire. They also benefit by sharing best implementation practices.

**Teachers have growing interest in having access to additional resources and best practices**

- Teachers and Orchestra Administrators believe that the resources provided by Link Up have greatly supported their implementation of the curriculum, overall music instruction, and student learning.
- Teachers continue to request additional resources associated with reading music notation, recorder techniques, incorporating creative extensions, making connections with Common Core State Standards, and incorporating movement in their instruction.

**metis associates**

*making a meaningful difference*
FINDINGS – OUTCOME STUDY

Quantitative and qualitative data collected through the evaluation addressed the impact of the program on students’ music skills and classroom-specific student outcomes, such as engagement. The study also examined the impact of the program on the visibility of school music programs and the partnering orchestras.

**Link Up students demonstrate statistically significant growth in various musical skills**

- Baseline music assessment achievement data were collected from nine national case study schools.
- The locally developed music assessment captured student achievement in four key music domains that include: performance, music literacy, orchestral knowledge, understanding of basic elements of music, and composition, using eight separate assessment tasks.
- Two of the eight tasks were administered over two time periods, as a pretest (winter) and posttest (spring), to capture growth over the course of Link Up implementation.
- The findings indicated that students made statistically significant improvement in their music literacy across five sub-areas measured by these tasks, including identification of music symbols and notes, and understanding of rhythm, tempo, and pitch (top two graphs).
- Three other Music Skills Assessment tasks that are directly aligned with the curriculum were completed near the end of Link Up implementation, including: performance, instrument identification (visual), and instrument identification (auditory).
- On two other tasks that assess Instrument Identification skills (visual and auditory), students were more likely to identify the instrument family than the instrument’s name (bottom two graphs).
- For the Performance Task, (graphs not shown) students performed excerpts from the curriculum, completed a self-assessment, were assessed by their peers, and then were provided with a second opportunity to perform excerpts. Analyses of these data demonstrated that the self-assessment and peer feedback process had a positive impact on students, as students made statistically significant improvements on their second tries in various performance indicators, including: posture, use of breath, use of pitch, and rhythmic accuracy.
High student engagement among most notable impacts of Link Up

- Survey and classroom observations showed that Link Up promotes a high level of student engagement. During observations of a set of national case-study schools, student engagement was among the indicators rated most highly.

Link Up raises visibility of partner orchestras and school music programs

- When asked about the wider impact of the program, orchestra administrators and teachers felt strongly that the program, especially the culminating concerts, has raised community interest and reached individuals, specifically parents and sponsors, with whom they did not previously communicate. These factors all contribute strongly to the success of the programs at partnering sites.

“The curriculum helps with classroom engagement. Some of the kids that don’t like to sing will get into Link Up more.”

- Teacher

“Link Up “has increased our visibility and opened the door to donations and sponsorship opportunities that didn’t exist before.”

- Orchestra Administrator

Next Steps/Looking Forward:

- Disseminate the Music Skills Assessment widely in order to inform teachers’ instruction and to provide outcome data for orchestras to share with funders.
- Consider making the music literacy listening task more challenging for students.
- Consider offering differentiated levels of training beyond Year 1 training, as returning teachers need opportunities to delve more deeply into materials in order to deepen their learning and continue to grow in their instruction.
- Consider including composition as an instructional unit in the Link Up curricula (using Task 8 from the Music Skills Assessment).
- Promote increased collaboration between schools and orchestras in order to more closely align repertoire and curricula with teachers’ existing scope and sequence in music and other academic coursework to maximize impact on student learning.
- Use data from the Music Skills Assessment to gather additional and more robust information about Link Up’s impact on student learning.
APPENDIX C
GOOGLE FORMS LINK UP SURVEY

**Link Up Survey**

Welcome! You are invited to participate in a thesis research project being conducted by Courtney Gazda, a current Graduate student in the Department of Arts Administration at The University of Akron.

The purpose of this research is to determine the effectiveness of the Link Up music education program as a beneficial means of educational outreach and community engagement. The hypothesis is that student participants of the Link Up program are better able to express their creativity and strengthen their development in music education through the curriculum and live performances with the Akron Symphony Orchestra; and that teacher participants are better able to teach music through the supplemental curriculum and host-led professional development workshops; and that parents of student participants will become more engaged in the arts community through their students' involvement in Link Up.

The data for this study is 100% anonymous, meaning no responses or data will be connected with an individual.
Participation in this study is completely voluntary with no compensation or gifts to be offered and refusal to participate or withdraw from the study at any time will involve no penalty.

The data collected will support the completion of this thesis and also has the hope that it can contribute to the data collected by Carnegie Hall to further support and strengthen the Link Up program.

This survey will take approximately 5-10 minutes to complete. For any questions, please contact the researcher, Courtney Gazda, at cmg156@zips.uakron.edu or by phone (440) 570-5725. This portion serves as consent for participation.

**STUDENT EXPERIENCES**

Please select one number for the following questions indicating your answer on a scale of 1-5, with 1 being strongly DISAGREE and 5 being strongly AGREE.

The specialized Link Up curriculum helps my students to learn rhythm.

\[
\begin{array}{ccccc}
1 & 2 & 3 & 4 & 5 \\
\text{(Strongly Disagree)} & & & & \text{(Strongly Agree)} \\
\end{array}
\]

The specialized Link Up curriculum helps my students to learn to read music notes.

\[
\begin{array}{ccccc}
1 & 2 & 3 & 4 & 5 \\
\text{(Strongly Disagree)} & & & & \text{(Strongly Agree)} \\
\end{array}
\]

The specialized Link Up curriculum helps my students to play the recorder.

\[
\begin{array}{ccccc}
1 & 2 & 3 & 4 & 5 \\
\text{(Strongly Disagree)} & & & & \text{(Strongly Agree)} \\
\end{array}
\]
The cross-curricular elements such as Latin language enrich my students' learning.

| 1 (Strongly Disagree) | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 (Strongly Agree) |

The hands-on activities in the Link Up curriculum are fun for my students.

| 1 (Strongly Disagree) | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 (Strongly Agree) |

My students enjoy performing the Link Up music.

| 1 (Strongly Disagree) | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 (Strongly Agree) |

My students are able to express their creativity through the Link Up curriculum activities.

| 1 (Strongly Disagree) | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 (Strongly Agree) |

My students receive average or better grades in music.

| 1 (Strongly Disagree) | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 (Strongly Agree) |

My students receive average or better grades in core subjects (reading and math).

| 1 (Strongly Disagree) | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 (Strongly Agree) |

TEACHING LINK UP

Please select one number for the following questions indicating your answer on a scale of 1-5, with 1 being strongly DISAGREE and 5 being strongly AGREE.

The online resources offered by Carnegie Hall strengthen my ability to teach music.

| 1 (Strongly Disagree) | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 (Strongly Agree) |
The Link Up online resources, including social media pages, allow me to feel connected to the Link Up community.

1  2  3  4  5  
(Strongly Disagree) (Strongly Agree)

The Link Up curriculum is successful in my classroom.

1  2  3  4  5  
(Strongly Disagree) (Strongly Agree)

The free materials and curriculum provided by the Link Up program help relieve the music budget at my school.

1  2  3  4  5  
(Strongly Disagree) (Strongly Agree)

The free materials and curriculum provided by the Link Up program help with my lesson planning.

1  2  3  4  5  
(Strongly Disagree) (Strongly Agree)

PARENT ENGAGEMENT

Please select one number for the following questions indicating your answer on a scale of 1-5, with 1 being strongly DISAGREE and 5 being strongly AGREE.

The parents/guardians of my students are involved in the Link Up program.

1  2  3  4  5  
(Strongly Disagree) (Strongly Agree)

The parents/guardians of my students volunteer at Link Up concerts.

1  2  3  4  5  
(Strongly Disagree) (Strongly Agree)
The parents/guardians of my students attend concerts of the host orchestra.

   1  2  3  4  5
(Straightly Disagree)                             (Strongly Agree)

The parents/guardians of my students have provided positive feedback about the Link Up music program.

   1  2  3  4  5
(Straightly Disagree)                             (Strongly Agree)

**SHORT ANSWER**

What are the strongest and weakest elements of the Link Up program for your instruction?

What do you think are the favorite aspects of your students?

If you are participating with a host organization, does this collaboration enrich engagement? (Type N/A if not applicable)

If you are participating with a host orchestra, do you attend performances outside of Link Up of that orchestra?

What is the extent of parent/guardian involvement? Do they attend Link Up performances? Do they attend performances of the host orchestra?
Please compare and contrast the Link Up curriculum to your prior music curriculum to the best of your ability.

What is your overall feedback of Link Up whether positive or negative? What would you change?

DEMOGRAPHICS

In what city and state is your school located?
Type of school district:
What is the average household income in your area?